Oxidation-Reduction Potential and Growth of Clostridium perfringens and Pseudomonas fluorescens

L. B. TABATABAI AND H. W. WALKER
Department of Food Technology, Iowa State University, Ames, Iowa 50010

Received for publication 27 April 1970

A new apparatus was developed for measuring changes in $E_h$, pH, and cell numbers. With this apparatus, the relationships of these parameters were studied at initial $E_h$ levels of 200 and 40 mv (pH 7.0), by using Clostridium perfringens and Pseudomonas fluorescens. One of the strains of C. perfringens grew more luxuriantly at the higher $E_h$, in the presence of small quantities of oxygen, than at the lower one in the absence of oxygen. P. fluorescens could grow at a relatively low $E_h$ (40 mv, pH 7.0) in pure culture but not in the presence of C. perfringens under the same conditions.

A number of environmental factors affect the growth of bacteria; among these is the oxidation-reduction potential or $E_h$. This factor has acquired increased significance for the food microbiologist with the advent of the practice of packaging various meat products in evacuated, oxygen-impermeable films. According to Ingram (14), when meat is vacuum-packed in a relatively oxygen-impermeable membrane, the redox potential on the surface of the meat is reduced due to the respiration of the tissues; usually, sufficient oxygen remains to permit the growth of aerobic bacteria. Baran, Kraft, and Walker (2) observed growth of Clostridium perfringens in fresh ground beef in both vacuum and nonvacuum conditions; maximal growth, however, was obtained in the shortest period in samples packaged under vacuum.

Although various methods have been described in the literature for studying oxidation-reduction potentials (4, 7, 8, 11-13, 18, 26), none of these methods proved satisfactory for the purpose of measuring changes in $E_h$, pH, and numbers in pure or mixed bacterial cultures. Therefore, a new apparatus was developed to measure these parameters. In addition, this apparatus was used to study the relationships between these variables in bacterial cultures.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Apparatus. The apparatus for measuring $E_h$, pH, and bacterial numbers (Fig. 1) was constructed from a 500-ml, three-neck, roundbottom distilling flask with the bottom flattened. A screw-cap culture tube (15 cm long and 1.5 cm inside diameter) with the bottom removed and a Pyrex tube (ca. 7.5 cm long and 1.5 cm inside diameter) were constructed onto the flask to provide openings for the inoculation tube and the salt bridge. The salt bridge was constructed from a piece of soft glass tubing (1.5 cm inside diameter), heated, and drawn out to capillary size at a place approximately 8.0 cm from one end. The gas inlet tube was constructed from a Pyrex tube (ca. 18 cm long and 0.6 cm outside diameter) and pinched at the bottom to provide two smaller openings. The gas outlet tube was also constructed from a Pyrex tube (0.6 cm outside diameter) but was provided with two glass bulbs to serve as traps. The upper ends of these tubes were plugged with cotton to prevent contamination. The gas inlet tube of the electrode vessel was connected to a gas manifold (not shown) via: (i) latex rubber tubing (ca. 22 cm long); (ii) capillary glass tubing (5 cm long and 0.1 cm bore); and (iii) latex rubber tubing (5 cm long). Use of capillary tubing to connect the gas manifold to the electrode vessel helped maintain a constant bubbling rate. Fine adjustments of bubbling rate were accomplished by placing a screw clamp on the rubber tubing between the gas manifold and the capillary tubing.

Two flow meters connected at the upper ends to a "T" tube were used (sizes 10 and 11, Cole-Parmer Instrument and Equipment Co., Chicago, Ill.) for monitoring prepurified nitrogen alone or to provide mixtures of prepurified nitrogen and compressed air. The size 10 meter was connected to the compressed air tank, and the size 11 meter was connected to the prepurified nitrogen tank. A tube (ca. 7 cm long and 1.5 cm outside diameter) packed with cotton served as a filter and was placed between the gas manifold and the flow meters.

The $pH$ was measured with a general-purpose glass electrode (Corning 476022 or Beckman 42263) and a saturated calomel electrode (Corning 476002 or Beck-
sterilization by hypochlorite immersion across the system at 30 \( \pm \) 0.5 C and connected to the gas manifold. The flow rates of the gases were adjusted so that 120 ml/min registered on the flow meter. The medium was purged with pre-purified nitrogen until the \( E_b \) equilibrated; this usually required 72 hr. When a more positive \( E_b \) was desired, the prepurified nitrogen was mixed with compressed air adjusted to a flow rate of 0.2 to 0.5 ml/min. This gas mixture was bubbled through the medium until a stable \( E_b \) was maintained, usually after 48 to 72 hr.

**Measurement of oxygen.** Percentage of oxygen in the gas mixture was analyzed on a gas chromatograph (model 810, F & M Scientific Corp., Avondale, Pa.), as recommended by Lyle A. Douglas (personal communication). A sample of the gas mixture was removed with a 1-ml gas syringe (Precision Sampling Corp., Baton Rouge, La.) and applied to a molecular sieve column (Anasorb, 70/80 mesh, Analabs Inc., Hamden, Conn.). The column [6 ft by 0.25 inch (1.83 m by 0.63 cm)] was activated by heating at 400 C for 4 hr before use. A temperature of 70 C was maintained during gas analyses. The thermal conductivity detector was also maintained at a temperature of 70 C; the bridge current, at 150 ma; and the injection port, at room temperature. Helium served as the carrier gas and was adjusted to a flow rate of 46 ml/min. A standard curve was prepared by analyzing mixtures of gases containing known concentrations of oxygen in nitrogen. A straight-line relationship was obtained by plotting oxygen column height against percentage of oxygen in the gas mixture. From the oxygen column height and by using the standard curve, the percentage of oxygen in the air-nitrogen mixture was determined.

**Calculation of \( E_{at} \).** The formula adopted by Leistner and Mirna (19) was used to calculate \( E_{at} \): \( E_{at} = E + E_{ref} + 60.1 (pH \times -7.0) \). This formula describes the \( E_b \) of a system at pH 7.0 and 30 C. \( E \) is the measured potential; \( E_{ref} \) is the potential of the reference electrode versus the normal hydrogen electrode; 60.1 is equal to the term 2.303 \( RT/F \) at 30 C; and \( (pH \times -7.0) \) is the \( pH \) correction term. This formula permits comparison of data obtained from different experiments.

**Organisms and preparation of cultures.** Two strains of *C. perfringens* were used: Hobbs strain HR2 obtained from H. E. Hall and strain number 9 (type B) originally obtained from Paul Ellner. The clostridia were kept in Cooked Meat Medium (Difco Laboratories, Detroit, Mich.), supplemented with 3.8% reinforced clostridial medium (RCM; Consolidated Laboratories, Inc., Chicago Heights, Ill.). Stock cultures were kept at room temperature. To prepare a *C. perfringens* culture, 1 ml of a stock culture was transferred into a tube of Cooked Meat Medium previously steamed and cooled. The culture was incubated at 30 C for 16 hr.

*Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain F21 isolated in our laboratory from chicken (23) was kept in Trypticase
Soy Broth, transferred bimonthly, and kept at refrigeration temperatures. To prepare a culture, a loopful of the stock culture was transferred to a tube containing 10 ml of Tryptcase Soy Broth and incubated at 30 C for 48 hr.

Inoculation and enumeration. One or more vessels were inoculated with a mixture of C. perfringens and P. fluorescens to yield 10 cells/ml and 10^6 cells/ml, respectively. Two controls were included, one containing C. perfringens and the other containing P. fluorescens to yield numbers of cells per milliliter similar to those in the mixed culture.

C. perfringens was enumerated on the medium suggested by Angelotti et al. (1), except that sodium sulfadiazine and polymyxin B sulfate were omitted. Plates were incubated under a nitrogen atmosphere at 37 C for 24 hr in an anaerobic incubator (National Appliance Co., Portland, Ore.). P. fluorescens was enumerated on the agar suggested by King, Ward, and Raney (16). Spread plates were incubated at 30 C for 48 hr.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Establishment of a uniform $E_0$ value between flasks of broth within one experiment and between experiments performed at different times has always been a problem. Some workers have discarded flasks registering $E_0$ values falling outside the acceptable range; others have developed tedious, but accurate, methods for obtaining uniform $E_0$ values (7, 8, 26). In our experiments, uniform $E_0$ values were obtained only after soaking the flasks in 3 N HCl and rinsing with deionized water. Values differed by as much as 150 mv before soaking; after soaking, however, variations seldom exceeded 10 mv. Excessive variations in $E_0$ possibly were caused by adsorption of detergents on the glass surfaces.

The $E_0$ of Tryptcase Soy Broth after equilibration with purified nitrogen was 40 mv (pH 7.0); in the presence of 0.4 to 0.6% oxygen (by volume) in the gas mixture, the system equilibrated at 200 mv (pH 7.0). Addition of an inoculum to the broth caused a slight fluctuation, but the $E_0$ normally returned to its original value within a few hours.

Typical reproducible $E_0$, pH, and growth curves are plotted for C. perfringens HR2 in Figs. 2 and 3 and for P. fluorescens F21 in Figs. 4 and 5. Curves for C. perfringens number 9 (type B) were essentially the same as those for HR2 and are not shown. Maximum total counts for C. perfringens HR2 were little influenced by initial $E_0$ of the medium (Table 1; Fig. 2); on the other hand, total counts for C. perfringens number 9 (type B) were enhanced at the higher initial $E_0$ of 200 mv. Sufficient observations have not been made with various strains and types of C. perfringens to determine the extent to which such variations in reaction to the presence of oxygen may occur. C. perfringens is known to be aerotolerant (4, 9, 17) under certain conditions in blood and muscle tissues; it can survive hyperbaric oxygen treatment (15). No reference has been found in the literature, however, indicating that oxygen enhances growth. Observations on $E_0$, and growth (4, 17) have usually been limited to initiation of growth at certain $E_0$ levels. Limiting $E_0$ values for growth of C. perfringens have been reported to range from -125 to 287 mv (pH 7.0; Table 2). P. fluorescens mixed with C. perfringens at an initial ratio of 10^6 to 10 did not have a marked effect on the growth of C. perfringens at either initial $E_0$. At an initial $E_0$ of 200 mv, growth of C. perfringens with the subsequent rapid drop in $E_0$ during the first 24 hr had
little or no effect on *P. fluorescens*. *P. fluorescens* is classified as an aerobe (24; Bergey’s Manual, 7th ed.) and would theoretically require media of positive *Eh* values (12). Apparently, the low but constant oxygen tension supported the growth of *P. fluorescens* under adverse *Eh* conditions. This assumption is supported by the observation that growth of the pseudomonad was slow in pure culture and nonexistent in mixed culture with *C. perfringens* in the absence of oxygen (initial *Eh* of 40 mv; Fig. 5).

*Eh* curves for mixed cultures of the organisms were similar to those observed for *C. perfringens* in pure culture (Fig. 2, 3, 4, and 5). Differences were observed, however, after the minimal *Eh* had been attained; *Eh* values for *C. perfringens* in pure culture became more positive at a more rapid rate than those for the mixed culture (Fig. 2) in the presence of oxygen. In the absence of oxygen, the *Eh* curves for pure and mixed cultures were practically identical. In Fig. 2 and 3 a rapid decrease in *Eh* is evident, followed by a more or less sharply defined minimum. This minimum in *Eh* for cultures of *C. perfringens* has also been observed by others (20; M. C. B. Borromeo, M.S. Thesis, Iowa State University, 1969). Lepper and Martin (20) have suggested that the rapid drop in *Eh* coincides with the formation of hydrogen gas, one of the metabolic products of *C. perfringens*. They proposed that the low *Eh* measurement was the result of the activation of the platinum electrode in the presence of molecular hydrogen and that actually a hydrogen electrode was formed. On the other hand, Cannan, Cohen, and Clark (5) have found that hydrogen is produced only after low *Eh* values are achieved. Ferredoxin, which functions as an electron-mediating catalyst for hydrogen formation and utilization, has an *Em2* of ---417 mv (25); *Em2* is equal to the *Eh* at the midpoint of a symmetrical titration curve at *pH* 7 (6). Therefore, the low values of *Eh* in cultures of *C. perfringens* probably were not due to activation of the platinum electrode but due to low potential substances such as ferredoxin. In contrast to *C. perfringens*, the *Eh* curves for *P. fluorescens* leveled off at approximately 10 mv (*pH* 7.0) in the presence of oxygen and at ---40 mv (*pH* 7.0) in the absence of oxygen.

For both strains of *C. perfringens*, larger *pH* changes were observed when the initial *Eh* was 200 rather than 40 mv. Numbers of cells did not necessarily correlate with the extent of change in *pH* in the two systems. In the presence of oxygen (200 mv), the lowest *pH* was 6.2 with approxi-

![Fig. 4](https://example.com/fig4.jpg)  
**Fig. 4.** Effect of *C. perfringens* HR2 on growth of *P. fluorescens* F21 at an initial *Eh* of 200 mv and in the presence of 0.4 to 0.6% oxygen. Each point represents the average of three observations.

![Fig. 5](https://example.com/fig5.jpg)  
**Fig. 5.** Effect of *C. perfringens* HR2 on growth of *P. fluorescens* F21 at an initial *Eh* of 40 mv and in the absence of oxygen. Each point represents the average of three observations.

**Table 1.** Effect of initial *Eh* and oxygen on the growth of *Clostridium perfringens* and *Pseudomonas fluorescens*

| Organism              | *Eh* = 200 mv, O₂ present | *Eh* = 40 mv, O₂ absent |
|-----------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------|
|                       | Pure culture | Mixed culture | Pure culture | Mixed culture | Inoculum |
| *C. perfringens* HR2  | 1.5 × 10⁹   | 9.7 × 10⁹     | 1.0 × 10⁹   | 1.0 × 10⁹   | 20       |
| *C. perfringens* B no. 9 | 3.1 × 10⁹   | 2.0 × 10⁹     | 1.5 × 10⁶   | 3.0 × 10⁶   | 20       |
| *P. fluorescens* F21  | 3.8 × 10⁹   | 2.0 × 10⁹     | 2.0 × 10⁷   | 3.1 × 10⁶   | 10⁶      |

* Average of three observations.
GROWTH OF C. **PERFRINGENS AND P. FLUORESCENS**

| $E_h$ reported* (mv) | $E_h$ calculatedd (mv) | Cultural conditions | Reference |
|----------------------|------------------------|---------------------|-----------|
| 230 to 250           | 169 to 189             | Hartley’s trypsin digest broth; pH 6.0; 37 C | 4         |
| 200 to 250           | 237 to 287             | Peptone-agar broth; pH 7.6; 37 C | 22        |
| 194 to 238           | 194 to 250             | Tryptone-beef extract-glucose-NaCl, pH | 21        |
| 160                  | 123                    | 7.0-7.2; 37 C         |           |
| -125                 | -125 to -113           | Gelatin-yeast or peptone-meat extract; pH 6.4; 38 C | 10        |
|                      |                        | Tyrode’s peptone medium with vitamin C; pH 7.0-7.2; 37 C | 17        |

* Saturated calomel electrode used as reference electrode.

**Table 2. Limiting redox potentials for Clostridium perfringens**

E. **Smaller** 8 × 10^2 cells/ml. In the absence of oxygen, the lowest pH was 6.5 and the number of cells per milliliter was 2.5 × 10^6. Minimum values for $E_h$ and pH occurred at the same time in cultures of *C. perfringens*, after which only a slight rise was observed. Similar pH patterns were observed by Mead (21) for cultures of *C. perfringens*.

Observations on $E_h$, pH, and cell numbers have been highly reproducible with the apparatus and techniques described above. With this apparatus, the relationships of the two organisms differing widely in growth requirements were studied. These organisms were chosen because both occur to some extent in fresh meat products, the pseudomonads usually to a much greater extent than the *Clostridium*. Conditions for growth, except for temperature, would be similar to those found in air- and vacuum-packaged meats. The results showed that initial $E_h$ and dissolved oxygen content of the culture medium played an important role in the growth of the two organisms. One of the two strains of *C. perfringens* grew more luxuriantly in the presence of small quantities of oxygen. *P. fluorescens* could grow at a relatively low initial $E_h$ (40 mv) in pure culture but not in the presence of *C. perfringens* under the same conditions. At temperatures lower than 30 C which are used for storing meat products, the growth responses probably would be quite different, particularly since *C. perfringens* grows poorly or not at all below 15 C (3).

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

We express our sincere appreciation to Lowell D. Satterlee for his assistance with gas chromatography.

This investigation was supported by Public Health Service research grant FD 00106 from the Consumer Protection and Environmental Health Service.

**LITERATURE CITED**

1. Angelotti, R., H. E. Hall, M. J. Foter, and K. H. Lewis. 1962. Quantitation of *Clostridium perfringens* in foods. Appl. Microbiol. 18:193-199.
2. Baran, W. L., A. A. Kraft, and H. W. Walker. 1970. Effects of carbon dioxide and vacuum packaging on color and bacterial count of meat. J. Milk Food Technol. 33:77-82.
3. Barnes, E. M., J. E. Despaul, and M. Ingram. 1963. The behaviour of a food poisoning strain of *Clostridium welchii* in beef. J. Appl. Bacteriol. 26:415-427.
4. Barnes, E. M., and M. Ingram. 1956. The effect of redox potential on the growth of *Clostridium welchii* strains isolated from horse muscle. J. Appl. Bacteriol. 19:117-128.
5. Cannan, R. K., B. Cohen, and W. M. Clark. 1926. Studies on oxidation-reduction. X. Reduction potentials in cell suspensions. Pub. Health Rep. Suppl. 55.
6. Clark, W. M. 1960. Oxidation-reduction potentials of organic systems. The Williams & Wilkins Co., Baltimore.
7. Daniels, W. F., D. A. Parker, R. W. Johnson, and L. E. Schneider. 1966. Controlled pH and oxidation-reduction potential with a new glass tissue-culture fermentor. Biotechnol. Bioeng. 7:529-553.
8. Dobson, A., and J. J. Bullen. 1964. A method for the control of $E_h$ and pH during bacterial growth. J. Gen. Microbiol. 35:169-174.
9. Fredette, Y., C. Plante, and A. Roy. 1967. Numerical data concerning the sensitivity of anaerobic bacteria to oxygen. J. Bacteriol. 94:2012-2017.
10. Hanke, M. E., and J. H. Bailey. 1945. Oxidation-reduction potential requirements of *Cl. welchii* and other clostridia. Proc. Soc. Exp. Biol. Med. 59:163-166.
11. Hanke, M. E., and Y. J. Katz. 1943. An electrolytic method for controlling oxidation-reduction potential and its application in the study of anaerobiosis. Arch. Biochem. Biophys. 2:183-200.
12. Hewitt, L. F. 1950. Oxidation-reduction potentials in bacteriology and biochemistry, 6th ed. E. & S. Livingstone Ltd., Edinburgh.
13. Horn, G., and H. E. Jacob. 1966. Continuous recording of physico-chemical test values in micro-organism cultures, p. 761-768. In Proceedings of the International Congress on Antibiotics, 1964. Butterworth & Co., Ltd., London.
14. Ingram, M. 1962. Microbiological principles in prepackaging meats. J. Appl. Bacteriol. 26:259-281.
15. Kaye, D. 1967. Effect of hyperbaric oxygen on clostridia *in vitro* and *in vivo*. Proc. Soc. Exp. Biol. Med. 124:360-364.
16. King, E. O., M. K. Ward, and D. E. Raney. 1954. Two simple media for the demonstration of pyocyanine and fluorescein. J. Lab. Clin. Med. 44:301-307.
17. Kligler, I. J., and K. Guggenheim. 1938. The influence of vitamin C on the growth of anaerobes in the presence of air, with special reference to the relative significance of Eh and Os in the growth of anaerobes. J. Bacteriol. 38:141–156.
18. Knight, B. C. J. G. 1930. Oxidation-reduction studies in relation to bacterial growth. II. A method of poising the oxidation-reduction potential of bacteriological culture media. Biochem. J. 24:1075–1079.
19. Leistner, L., and A. Mirna. 1959. Das Redoxpotential von Pökelladen. Fleischwirtschaft 11:659–666.
20. Lepper, E., and C. J. Martin. 1930. The oxidation-reduction potential of cooked meat media following the inoculation of bacteria. Brit. J. Exp. Pathol. 11:140–145.
21. Mead, G. C. 1969. Combined effect of salt concentration and redox potential of the medium on the initiation of vegetative growth by Clostridium welchii. J. Appl. Bacteriol. 32:468–475.
22. Reed, G. B., and J. H. Orr. 1943. Cultivation of anaerobes and oxidation-reduction potentials. J. Bacteriol. 45:309–320.
23. Rey, C. R., A. A. Kraft, R. G. Seals, and E. W. Bird. 1969. Influence of temperature on some biochemical characteristics of Pseudomonas associated with spoilage of chicken. J. Food Sci. 34:279–283.
24. Rhodes, M. E. 1959. The characterization of Pseudomonas fluorescens. J. Gen. Microbiol. 21:221–263.
25. Valentine, R. C. 1964. Bacterial ferredoxin. Bacteriol. Rev. 28:497–517.
26. Williams, P. P. 1966. Dispensing apparatus for controlling Eh, pH, and volume of anaerobic bacterial and protozoal culture media. Appl. Microbiol. 14:1045–1046.