The unequal impact of parenthood in academia

Aaron Clauset
@aaronclauset
Computer Science Dept. & BioFrontiers Institute
University of Colorado, Boulder
External Faculty, Santa Fe Institute

joint work with Allison C. Morgan, Samuel F. Way, Michael J. D. Hoefer, Daniel B. Larremore, & Mirta Galesic
Gendered publishing gap

1984

THE PRODUCTIVITY PUZZLE: PERSISTENCE AND CHANGE IN PATTERNS OF PUBLICATION OF MEN AND WOMEN SCIENTISTS

Jonathan R. Cole and Harriet Zuckerman

- 36 years ago!
- references 50 past studies showing women publish less than men
- claims pattern is stable back to 1920s
- matched-pair design of early career researchers (n=263 pairs)
- women cited equally paper-for-paper
- women just write fewer papers
- coins term "productivity puzzle"

Cole & Zuckerman, The productivity puzzle, in Advances in Motivation and Achievement. Women in Science (JAI Press, 1984)
Gendered publishing gap

In our data (U.S. faculty):

Note the y-axis scale difference between the fields.
Gendered publishing gap

40 years of work =
Gendered publishing gap

40 years of work = many explanations...

SEX DIFFERENCES IN RESEARCH PRODUCTIVITY: NEW EVIDENCE ABOUT AN OLD PUZZLE

Yu Xie
University of Michigan

Kimberlee A. Shauman
University of California, Davis

Research Article
Historical comparison of gender inequality in scientific careers across countries and disciplines

Published: 05 April 2017

Faculty Service Loads and Gender: Are Women Taking Care of the Academic Family?
Cassandra M. Guarino & Victor M. H. Borden

Research Specialization as a Missing Link

Emotional Labor in Academia: The Case of Professors
By MARCIA L. BELLAS

Publishing while female
Are women held to higher standards? Evidence from peer review.

Gender, Work Time, and Care Responsibilities Among Faculty
Joya Misra, Jennifer Hicks Lundquist, Abby Temple
First published: 30 May 2012 | https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1573-7861.2012.01319.x | Citations: 102
Gendered publishing gap

40 years of work = many explanations, but no answer

- institutional factors
- teaching and service work
- research specializations
- biases in peer review
- quality of writing
- career lengths
- parenthood

Why So Slow?
The Advancement of Women

Meta-Research: Task specialization across research careers

SEX DIFFERENCES IN RESEARCH PRODUCTIVITY: NEW EVIDENCE ABOUT AN OLD PUZZLE

Yu Xie
University of Michigan

Kimberlee A. Shauman
University of California, Davis

Research Reports

GENDER DIFFERENCES IN PRODUCTIVITY
Research Specialization as a Missing Link

Emotional Labor in Academia: The Case of Professors
By MARCIA L. BELLAS

Faculty Service Loads and Gender: Are Women Taking Care of the Academic Family?
Cassandra M. Guarino & Victor M. H. Borden

Published: 05 April 2017

Teaching load could put female scientists at career disadvantage
Male scientists in the United Kingdom report teaching less than their female counterparts, while women and minorities tend to feel disadvantaged in their careers.

Gender, Work Time, and Care Responsibilities Among Faculty
Joya Misra, Jennifer Hickes Lundquist, Abby Templ

First published: 30 May 2012 | https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1573-7861.2012.01319.x | Citations: 102

Publishing while female
Are women held to higher standards? Evidence from peer review.
40 years of work = many explanations, but no answer

- institutional factors
- teaching and service work
- research specializations
- biases in peer review
- quality of writing
- career lengths
- parenthood

Gendered publishing gap
Gendered publishing gap: parenthood

"Other countries have social safety nets. The U.S. has women."

The decline of women's research production during the coronavirus pandemic

Preprints analysis suggests a disproportionate impact on early career researchers.

COVID-19 and the gender gap in work hours

Caitlyn Collins, Liana Christin Landivar, Leah Ruppanner, William J. Scarborough

First published: 02 July 2020 | https://doi.org/10.1111/gwao.12506 | Citations: 20

Unequal effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on scientists

Kyle R. Myers, Wei Yang Tham, Yan Yin, Nina Cohodes, Jerry G. Thursby, Marie C. Thursby, Peter Schiffer, Joseph T. Walsh, Karim R. Lakhani & Dashun Wang

Nature Human Behaviour 4, 880–883 (2020) | Cite this article

Women in science are battling both Covid-19 and the patriarchy

The pandemic has worsened longstanding sexism and racist inequalities in science.

In the wake of COVID-19, academia needs new solutions to ensure gender equity

Jessica L. Malisch, Breanna N. Harris, Shanen M. Sherrer, Kristy A. Lewis, Stephanie L. Shepherd, Pumiti Witt C. McCarthy, Jessica L. Spott, Elizabeth P. Karam, Naima Moustaid-Moussa, Jessica McCormick Calero, Latha Ramalingam, Amelia E. Talley, Jacquelyn E. Cañas-Carrey, Karin Ardon-Dryer, Dana A. Weiser, Ximena E. Bernal, and Jennifer Delitto

Petersen (Nov. 2020)
**Study design**

**Combine information on** timing of parenthood and productivity over time and leave policies

**Survey (2017-18)**
- \( n = 3064 \) tenure track faculty [a 17.5% response rate]
- U.S. research intensive institutions (PhD-granting)
- Computer Science / Business / History

**Publications**
- 100,972 linked publications (books, papers)

**Institutions (\( n = 450 \))**
- prestige (ranking)
- parental leave policies (hand collected)

---

- This survey is about patterns in faculty hiring, advancement, and productivity in the North American academic system.
- It is currently open only for tenured or tenure-track faculty in business or history.
- The survey has 2 parts:
  - Part 1: Questions on sociodemographic characteristics (1-2 minutes)
  - Part 2: Questions on your experience as faculty (10-12 minutes)
- There is a $500 cash lottery for participants. The winner will be informed by email.
- Personally identifiable information will be kept confidential.
- This study is IRB approved.

The study "Understanding the Network Structure and Dynamics of the Academic Scientific Workforce" (CU IRB protocol no. 16-0441) is conducted by researchers from the University of Colorado at Boulder and the Santa Fe Institute. This study is supported by the NSF programs Science of Science & Innovation Policy, and the Science of Broadening Participation (SBE award 1633791).

Your participation is voluntary and you may stop at any time. Your answers will be used only in this study, except as required by law.
Basic statistics: parenthood

- **Academia is a family business**
  - most faculty 40+ have kids: 71% women, 82% men
  - 39% had first child before first faculty job
  - avg. age of first child: 33 (same for women and men)
    - compared with U.S. pop: 26 (women) vs. 31 (men)
  - parents not more/less likely at high/low prestige institutions
  - avg. num. of children: 1.8 (women) vs. 2.2 (men)
Causal inference setup

**Comparative interrupted time series (CITS)**
- matched-pair design [parent + non-parent]
- match on born same year + same discipline + same gender
- match on year of first child [survey vs. draw from $\Pr(\text{birth} \mid \text{age})$].
- plot publications per year -5 yrs before child → +10 yrs after child

![Diagram showing productivity before and after child's birth with effect size comparison between parents and non-parents.](image)
Productivity differences: CS

Women

Men

Average Annual Productivity

Time Relative to First Child’s Birth (Years)
Productivity differences: CS

**on average:**

- women’s pub. rate: negative shock [-17% CS, -24% Business, -48% History]
- men’s pub rate: generally no shock
- shock greatest in History (less collaboration), smallest in CS (more collaboration)
- CS shock: 17.6 fewer papers than fathers over 10 years = a 5 year productivity gap

* fathers in History experience a modest, statistically significant negative shock
Parental leave policies: work/life

Nearly 1/2 of women (45.9%) vs. 1/5 of men (20.6%) said:

• leave policies *somewhat* or *very important* in choosing current faculty job
• strong leave policies are under-used recruitment + retention tool

![Bar charts showing percentage of responses for Computer Science, Business, and History departments regarding parental leave policies.](image-url)

"Other countries have social safety nets. The U.S. has women."

Anne Helen Petersen, Nov 11, 2020 82 72
Only 64% of institutions had a paid parental leave policy!
Average length: 15 weeks (women) and 12 weeks (men)
Most did not specify if relief covered teaching, service, research, etc.
Differences are shrinking

- Gender neutral parental leave benefits more available since 2001
- Since 2000, (eligible) fathers use parental leave nearly 2x more (38.7% → 67.6%)
- But still much less than women (>90%)
- Productivity gap also narrowing (in all 3 fields)…

[Bar charts showing the comparison between women and men for different variables]
Differences are shrinking
Conclusions

• Parenthood ➔ vast majority [86-97%] of gender productivity gap
• Fathers do not systematically get a boost from parental leave
• Parental leave especially important to women (recruitment + retention)
• But important for all parents for work/life balance (80% of academics are parents! Fathers increasingly taking leave ➔ the gap is closing)
• Only 64% of institutions offer any paid leave 👎
• We. Can. Do. Better.

Caveats:
We didn’t ask about dual-career / relationship status.
Sample is current faculty only ➔ may select for those who experience smaller productivity penalties (survivor bias)
Productivity is a crude measure of scholarship contributions
The unequal impact of parenthood in academia

Allison C. Morgan1*, Samuel F. Way1, Michael J. D. Hoefer1, Daniel B. Larremore1,2, Mirta Galesic3, Aaron Clauset1,2,3*

Across academia, men and women tend to publish at unequal rates. Existing explanations include the potentially unequal impact of parenthood on scholarship, but a lack of appropriate data has prevented its clear assessment. Here, we quantify the impact of parenthood on scholarship using an extensive survey of the timing of parenthood events, longitudinal publication data, and perceptions of research expectations among 3064 tenure-track faculty at 450 Ph.D.-granting computer science, history, and business departments across the United States and Canada, along with data on institution-specific parental leave policies. Parenthood explains most of the gender productivity gap by lowering the average short-term productivity of mothers, even as parents tend to be slightly more productive on average than nonparents. However, the size of productivity penalty for mothers appears to have shrunk over time. Women report that paid parental leave and adequate childcare are important factors in their recruitment and retention. These results have broad implications for efforts to improve the inclusiveness of scholarship.
Fin

data & code: https://github.com/allisonmorgan/parenthood
Characteristic of parental leave policies

17% of early career faculty with children don’t know what their institution’s parental leave policy is!
Aside: Characteristic of parental leave policies

A faculty member who gives birth, or her spouse or Institute-registered domestic partner, if he/she is the child’s primary care giver, may take a one-quarter leave without loss of salary or benefits within one year of the arrival of the child. Similarly, an adoptive parent who is the primary care giver may take a one-quarter leave without loss of salary or benefits within one year of the arrival of the child.

The primary care giver is the parent responsible for the majority of the child care.

Where both parents are members of the faculty, only one may seek parental leave at a time. The parental leave may be split between the two, but may not exceed one quarter total for the two.

The faculty member(s) should discuss his or her leave plans with the Chief Academic Officer a minimum of three months before the proposed leave.

Eligibility
- Applies to employees eligible for full benefits
- Intended to provide paid time off after the birth of a baby. If medical conditions arise prior to the birth, parental leave may be taken before the birth
- Includes adoption (primary caregiver) for children under 7 years old not attending school full-time. Employee must certify that they are the primary caregiver
- Must be taken within 12 months from the birth of the baby
- Runs concurrent with the Family Medical Leave Act (FMLA)

b. The faculty member will receive pay at the rate of 95% of her or his annual base salary during that semester, unless the department or college chooses to supplement the salary above 95% (and any such supplementation must be applied consistently for all faculty members of that unit who take parental leave).