The effects of psychotherapy for depressed or posttraumatic stress disorder women with childhood sexual abuse history

Meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials

Jhih-Yuan Lu, BS; Tao-Hsin Tung, PhD; Sheng-Ang Shen, PhD; Chien Huang, PhD; Pei-Shih Chen, PhD

Abstract

Background: Depression and posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) are the most common mental disorders of women suffered from childhood sexual abuse histories. It has been widely recognized that depression and PTSD may decrease patients’ quality of life. The objective of this study is conducted to explore the effects of psychotherapy for depressed or PTSD women with childhood sexual abuse history.

Methods: We searched the PubMed and Cochrane Library from inception to June 30, 2019. The search strategy is (sexual assault OR sexual crime OR sexual abuse) AND (depression OR PTSD) AND (treatment OR intervention OR psychotherapy) with no restriction on language. Two authors independently selected the studies, assessed the quality of the included studies, and extracted data.

Results: Nine randomized control trials with 761 participants met the inclusion criteria. There were 340 participants in the psychotherapy group and 421 participants in the control group (usual treatment or waiting list). Compared to usual care, improvements were significantly greater in the psychotherapy group. The Beck depression inventory score for depression diagnosis of the psychotherapy group is lower from 4.27 to 8.96 (P < .05) than the control group. The client assessment protocols for PTSD, the diagnosis is also lower from 12.4 to 13.71 than the control group (P < .05).

Conclusion: The results suggested that psychotherapy is effective in reducing depressed or PTSD women with childhood sexual abuse. Further large-scale high-quality randomized controlled trials with long-term follow-up are warranted for confirming this finding.

Abbreviations: BDI = Beck depression inventory, CAPs = client assessment protocols, CI = confidence interval, CSA = childhood sexual abuse, Ham-D = Hamilton depression rating scale, MD = mean difference, PTSD = posttraumatic stress disorder.

Keywords: childhood sexual abuse, depression, meta-analysis, posttraumatic stress disorder, psychotherapy

1. Introduction

Mental disorders are significant public health problems and many studies confirm that have high prevalence globally.[1]

In females, the highest odds ratios are seen for PTSD (odds ratio = 7.25) in an Australia study.[14] Patient with PTSD and depression may be hard to do normal daily activities, increase fatigue, even feeling worthless or guilty, and thoughts on death or suicide. These symptoms are not a substantive disease, so it is critical public health problems and challenges to public health as highly prevalent worldwide. There is increasing evidence that early life experiences and exposures can have long-term effects on health that may manifest as disease later in life.
hard to position accurately, based on the above reasons, the difficulty of treatment increase is a serious problem for medical carriers. To improve the symptom of the CSA women who with PTSD and depression, using psychotherapy is the most common treatment. In recent years, there has been a growing interest in and commitment to the combination of psychotherapy and other mental disorder treatment in care settings.[15,16]

The aim of this systematic review and meta-analysis was to examine whether the effective of active psychotherapy would produce greater mental health gains than usual care for PTSD and depression women with sexual abuse histories. To the extent that CSA may contribute to these outcomes, some psychotherapy would offer a potential avenue for intervention to reduce the associated disease burden, in addition to the reduction in the burden of disease in women that could be avoided the negative effect on their quality of life.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Literature search and search strategy

We searched the PubMed and Cochrane Library from inception to June 30, 2019. The search strategy is (sexual assault OR sexual crime OR sexual abuse) AND (depression OR PTSD) AND (treatment OR intervention OR psychotherapy) with no restriction on language. Two authors independently selected the studies, assessed the quality of the included studies, and extracted data.

2.2. Study selection

Studies were included if they met the following inclusion criteria: the study design was a randomized controlled trial, the subjects were depression or PTSD women with CSA history, the experimental group received 4 psychotherapies: cognitive processing therapy, dialectical behavior therapy for PTSD (DBT-PTSD), interpersonal psychotherapy, and structured psychiatric intervention, and the control group received usual care and individual support, and mean difference (MD) and standard deviation were reported in the article. The full texts were checked carefully to see whether there was any potentially related information or not.

2.3. Data extraction

Rules for extracting and synthesizing data from selected studies were based PRISMA checklist. The following data were extracted from the included eligible studies through a data extraction form: 1st author, year of publication, country of publication, study period, assigned group, randomly assigned participants, types of any participants, intervention time, and methods used for assessing the severity of depression and PTSD. In addition, we used the Cochrane collaboration tool to assess the risk of bias of the included trials and evaluated the following 7 domains associated with bias of intervention: random sequence generation, allocation concealment, blinding of participants and personnel, blinding of outcome assessment, incomplete outcome data (Attrition bias: it refers to systematic differences between groups in withdrawals from a study lead to incomplete outcome data.

2.4. Ethical review

Due to the systematic review and meta-analysis design, the ethical approval was waived and not necessary in this study.

2.5. Statistical analysis

The Review Manager 5.3 (The Nordic Cochrane Centre, The Cochrane Collaboration, 2014) was used for meta-analysis. We presented the MD or standardized MD (SMD) with 95% confidence interval (CI) for continuous data. Because the baseline which assesses evidence-based complementary, because the severity of depression and PTSD are different, we used standardized data to adjust the different baseline.

Heterogeneity in meta-analysis refers to the variation in study outcomes between studies. In this study, we used Chi-squared and I^2 inconsistency statistics. I^2 statistic describes the percentage of variation across studies which is due to heterogeneity rather than chance.[17] To the observed other views of this meta-analysis, we used not only the overall but also the outcomes of the Beck depression inventory (BDI), the Clinician-Administered PTSD scale (client assessment protocols, CAPs), and Hamilton depression rating scale (Ham-D), these results used the same measure tools and do not had to adjust the baseline so they presented by MDs. Among of them, BDI had 4 trials, CAPs and Ham-D had 2 trials.

In this study, a P value of <.10 indicated significant heterogeneity. I^2 values of 0% to 24.9%, 25% to 49.9%, 50% to 74%, and 75% to 100% were considered as none, low, moderate, and high heterogeneity. A 95% CI for I^2 is constructed using the iterative noncentral Chi-squared distribution method.[18] In addition, we used the fixed-effect model when I^2 was <75% and would have used the random-effects model if I^2 had been 75% or more. For analyzing the continuous data, if the SD was not reported, we estimated SD by SMD and 95% CI.

3. Results

3.1. Literature search and studies characteristics

Figure 1 shows that the search process and how to selected studies for systematic review and meta-analysis (PRISMA) guidelines which we followed.[19] We acquired 731 studies from PubMed and Cochrane library, then removed 173 duplicates studies, after excluding nonrandomized controlled trials, systematic review, meta-analysis, and irrelevant results, the rest of it only 7 randomized controlled trials with 761 participants were included in this systematic review and meta-analysis.

The characteristics of the included trials are summarized in Table 1. These trials are published from 1997 to 2013, The sample size was from 10 to 248, with a total of 761 participants (421 participants in the usual care group and 340 participants in the group of psychotherapy treatment). There are 5 trials had a high risk of random sequence generation because they selected a specific sources of CSA, women with depression or PTSD like villages, limitations of the study include baseline differences in symptom severity between study groups that may limit comparability. Randomization was performed within blocks of two to four villages grouped on the basis of language and proximity, with the assumption that villages close to one another would be similar (Bass et al), department of Psychosomatic Medicine and Psychotherapy at the Central Institute for Mental Health (Bohus et al and Smith et al and Talbot et al) and medical center (Vitiol et al). All 7 trials were not double-blinded because
psychotherapists must know what psychotherapy treatment they do (Fig. 2).

It is worth noting that 1 trial had incomplete data (Attrition bias), the originally included participants were 405, but in 6 months after the end of treatment lost some participants, though it was not a large part of them, this study still not presented how many participants lost, that may cause some bias of attrition.\cite{20}

**Table 1**

Characteristics of included randomized controlled trials.

| Author          | Publication year | Country | Study period    | Assigned Group                                      | Randomly assigned participants (n) | Types of any participants                  | Intervention time |
|-----------------|------------------|---------|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------------|------------------|
| Bass et al\cite{20} | 2013             | UK      | 2011            | Control: individual support                          | 248                               | Women with CSA, PTSD, and depression      | 23 h             |
| Bohus et al\cite{21} | 2013             | Germany | 2007–2009       | Experimental: cognitive processing therapy          | 157                               | Women with CSA                            | 12 wks           |
| Echeburúa et al\cite{22} | 1997             | Spain   | Unclear         | Control: progressive relaxation training             | 38                                | Women with CSA and Depression             | 6 wks            |
| McDonagh et al\cite{22} | 2005             | USA     | Unclear         | Experimental: cognitive processing therapy          | 36                                | Women with CSA and PTSD                   | 14 wks           |
| Smith et al\cite{24} | 2012             | USA     | Unclear         | Control: Treatment as usual                         | 10                                | Women with CSA and PTSD and depression    | 10 wks           |
| Talbot et al\cite{25} | 2011             | UK      | 2004–2007       | Experimental: Interpersonal Psychotherapy           | 27                                | Women with CSA and depression             | 10 wks           |
| Vitriol et al\cite{1}  | 2009             | USA     | 2006            | Experimental: Interpersonal psychotherapy           | 37                                | Women with CSA and PTSD                   | 36 wks           |

CSA = childhood sexual abuse, DBT-PTSD = dialectical behavior therapy for posttraumatic stress disorder, PTSD = posttraumatic stress disorder.
3.2. Effects of psychotherapy intervention on CSA women with depression and PTSD

For the overall models, we organized data from the selected trials using fixed models because of low heterogeneity ($\chi^2 = 8.88$, $P = .18$, and $I^2 = 32\%$) (Fig. 3). The pooled SMD was 0.57 (95% CI 0.42–0.72). Then the test for overall effect presented ($Z = 7.59$, $P < .00001$), these data presented the change in score that measured PTSD and depression.

For the BDI models, the pooled MD was $-7.03$ (95% CI $-10.25$ to $-3.82$), test for overall effect presented ($Z = 4.29$, $P < .0001$; $\chi^2 = 0.87$, $P = .83$, and $I^2 = 0\%$) (Fig. 4). For the Caps models, the pooled MD was $-18.24$ (95% CI $-26.15$ to $-10.33$), test for overall effect presented ($Z = 4.52$, $P < .00001$; $\chi^2 = 10.24$, $P = .26$, and $I^2 = 20\%$) (Fig. 5). In addition, for the Ham-D models, the pooled MD was $-3.52$ (95% CI $-6.22$ to $-0.83$), test for overall effect presented ($Z = 2.56$, $P < .01$; $\chi^2 = 1.25$, $P = .26$, and $I^2 = 20\%$) (Fig. 6). All the above models were significant differences in the effect of psychotherapy and usual care.

Funnel plot shows the publication bias of meta-analysis, when the result of the funnel plot is symmetry, indicating no publication bias in this study (Fig. 7). In other words, there is public bias in this study if the funnel plot is asymmetry. According to the basic principle of funnel plot, the power may decrease if the included studies < 10 (Golden ratio), and some of these bias are come from the other reporting bias like selecting reporting and regional error. In our meta-analysis, indicating no publication bias and the reason why was funnel plot show symmetry.

4. Discussion

4.1. Clinical implications

To the best of our knowledge, this study is the 1st systematic review and meta-analysis to examine the effects of psychotherapy on depressed or PTSD women with CSA. Our study results supported psychotherapy is positive effectiveness for CSA women with PTSD and depression. Even if it is very developed now, mental disorders are still having lots of difficulties that we must to overcome and psychotherapy played an important role in it.
Along with the increase of CSA women with PTSD and depression, many researchers desire to find an effective treatment to cure these vulnerable groups. After we completed the systematic review and meta-analysis, we gained a positive outcome: psychotherapy is really effective for CSA women with PTSD and depression. The results indicate that with appropriate training and supervision, psychotherapeutic treatment can be successfully implemented and can have an effect in settings with few mental health professionals. This therapy holds promise as a community-based service for sexual-violence survivors in similar contexts and warrants confirmatory studies and scale-up evaluations.[20]

It is important that making a plan for these patients that have severe mental disorders by their past traumatic situations, such as the study we included in our meta-analysis mentioned, the intervention actively screens for patients’ experiences of childhood trauma and focuses on these experiences and patients’ current interpersonal difficulties, with the understanding that current difficulties may be repetitions of past traumatic situations.[26–28] It is also essential to continue to develop, implement, and validate interventions for this patient subgroup that can be delivered in public health settings. The above showed interpersonal psychotherapy, how to overcome depression and PTSD, and so as CBT, DBT-PTSD, and structured psychiatric intervention. Our study improved the importance of psychotherapy for CSA women with depression and PTSD. Despite the advantages for psychotherapy, there was substantial variation in depression outcomes. Multiple factors, independent and converging, may be implicated in suboptimal treatment outcomes. Research is needed to strengthen treatments for women with severe trauma histories and complex psychiatric conditions in community mental health care.[29] And we expected that patients’ relationships with immediate family and intimate partners would be less likely to improve during treatment than relationships with co-workers, friends, or extended family, unless patients received an interpersonally focused intervention that targeted close relationships.[30] It is difficult to develop effective treatment at a realistic level due to not only all of the psychotherapies we included are consuming manpower and money, but also psychotherapist should be trained for a long time.[31]

### 4.2. Clinical practice

The mental health burden of co-occurring major depression and CSA included higher risk of chronic and recurrent depression, comorbid PTSD, borderline personality disorder, suicidal behavior, and heightened shame.[32–34] Evidence-based studies indicated that a sexual abuse history significantly increases the likelihood of adult major depression and that more severe forms of abuse increase 3-fold the risk.[25] The complex clinical scenario observed among adults who have a childhood trauma experience has been viewed as a process of neurobiologic and psychologic vulnerability.[31]

This study showed that cognitive behavioral therapy reduced PTSD symptoms and combined depressive symptoms. The clearest empirical evidence of effectiveness in treating symptoms related to PTSD found for cognitive behavioral treatment.[35] Although it appears that cognitive behavioral therapy has a clinical positive impact on PTSD symptoms for some female CSA survivors, the relative higher dropout rate implied that a significant proportion of victim women were not willing to...
complete all courses of this treatment. Therapist differences could also be a factor in the dropout, so that therapist might be treated as a random variable to further draw across therapists in general.

In addition, interpersonal psychotherapy was also suggested in improving psychiatric symptoms and reducing shame among CSA women. Victim women who suffered sexually abused are more likely to experience difficulties maintaining stable intimate relationships, poor communication with intimate partners, and dissatisfied relationship dissatisfaction. They also faced an elevated risk of adult sexual assault, intimate partner violence, and intergenerational transmission of sexual abuse.

Interpersonal psychotherapy reduced the severity of depressive symptoms, PTSD symptoms, feelings of shame, and improved functioning within the family to a greater degree than usual care psychotherapy. Due to the high dropout rates that are typical in community mental health, it is noteworthy that treatment engagement and retention were stronger in interpersonal psychotherapy than in usual care.

4.3. Methodologic considerations

In this study, only 7 trials that we included less than the golden ratio of the funnel plot, so the power is the defect that we should to emphasize. A further limitation is that the compositions of usual care is different, it may cause some bias between the experimental group and control group in every trial. Our study is hard to maintain blind because psychotherapist must to know that which psychotherapy they did on patients. Another limitation is about attachment and alliance in the treatment, women who experience CSA tend to report more insecure patterns of attachment and more unstable. Thus, among depressed women with sexual abuse histories, insecure patterns of attachment may interfere with their ability to form a trusting alliance with their therapist and may contribute to the poorer treatment outcomes often seen among patients with insecure attachments.

5. Conclusion

In conclusion, our data suggested that psychotherapy is effective in CSA women with PTSD and depression as an intervention treatment. Both interpersonal psychotherapy and cognitive behavioral therapy were related to sustained symptom reduction. Further large-scale high-quality randomized controlled trials with long-term follow-up are warranted for confirming this finding.

Acknowledgment

The authors thank the Sunflower Statistical Consulting Company, Kaohsiung, Taiwan for statistical advice.

Author contributions

Conceptualization: Jhih-Yuan Lu, Sheng-Ang Shen, Tau-Hsin Tung
Data curation: Jhih-Yuan Lu, Pei-Shih Chen.
Formal analysis: Jhih-Yuan Lu, Tau-Hsin Tung.
Methodology: Chien Huang, Tau-Hsin Tung.
Resources: Sheng-Ang Shen, Tau-Hsin Tung.
Supervision: Ruiping Liu.

Writing – original draft: Jhih-Yuan Lu, Tau-Hsin Tung.
Writing – review and editing: Sheng-An Shen, Chien Huang, Pei-Shih Chen, Tau-Hsin Tung.

References

[1] Vitriol VG, Ballesteros ST, Florenzano RU, et al. Evaluation of an outpatient intervention for women with severe depression and a history of childhood trauma. Psychiatr Serv 2009;60:936–42.
[2] Ghio L, Gotelli S, Cervetti A, et al. Duration of untreated depression influences clinical outcomes and disability. J Affect Disord 2015;175: 224–8.
[3] Ghio L, Gotelli S, Marcenaro M, et al. Duration of untreated illness and outcomes in unipolar depression: a systematic review and meta-analysis. J Affect Disord 2014;152-154:43–51.
[4] Vaughan CA, Schell TL, Tanaukan T, et al. Prevalence of mental health problems among Iraq and Afghanistan veterans who have and have not received VA services. Psychiatr Serv 2014;65:833–5.
[5] Mata DA, Ramos MA, Bansal N, et al. Prevalence of depression and depressive symptoms among resident physicians: a systematic review and meta-analysis. JAMA 2013;310:2373–83.
[6] Sareen J. Posttraumatic stress disorder in adults: Impact, comorbidity, risk factors, and treatment. Can J Psychiatry 2014;59:460–7.
[7] Fekadu W, Mekonen T, Belete H, et al. Incidence of post-traumatic stress disorder after road traffic accident. Front Psychiatry 2019;10: 519.
[8] Beaghebole H, Mulder RT, Frampton CM, et al. Psychological distress and psychiatric disorder after natural disasters: systematic review and meta-analysis. Br J Psychiatry 2018;213:716–22.
[9] Pino F, Mena D, Russo PM. War trauma exposed refugees and posttraumatic stress disorder: the moderating role of trait resilience. J Psyhosom Res 2020;129:109905.
[10] Chivers-Wilson KA. Sexual assault and posttraumatic stress disorder: a review of the biological, psychological and sociological factors and treatments. Megill J Med 2006;9:111–8.
[11] Ullman SE, Filipas HH, Townsend SM, et al. Psychosocial correlates of PTSD symptom severity in sexual assault survivors. J Trauma Stress 2007;20:821–31.
[12] Leschen K, Miller W, Weissberg M, et al. Cognitive-behavioral therapy and psychodynamic psychotherapy: techniques, efficacy, and indications. Am J Psychother 2006;60:233–59.
[13] Steenert C, Munder T, Rabung S, et al. Psychodynamic therapy: as efficacious as other empirically supported treatments? A meta-analysis testing equivalence of outcomes. Am J Psychiatry 2017;174:943–53.
[14] Cutajar MC, Mullen PE, Ogloff JR, et al. Psychopathology in a large cohort of sexually abused children followed up to 43 years. Child Abuse Negl 2010:34:813–22.
[15] Albach F, Everaerd W. Posttraumatic stress symptoms in victims of childhood incest. Psychother Psychosom 1992;57:143–51.
[16] Amir M, Kaplan Z, Efroni R, et al. Suicide risk and coping styles in posttraumatic stress disorder patients. Psychother Psychosom 1999;68:76–81.
[17] Higgins JPT, Thompson SG, Deeks JJ, et al. Measuring inconsistency in meta-analyses. BMJ 2003;327:557–60.
[18] Hedges LV, Pigott TD. The power of statistical tests in meta-analysis. Psychol Methods 2001;6:203–17.
[19] Mohier D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. Int J Surg 2010;8:336–41.
[20] Bass JK, Annan J, McIvor Murray S, et al. Controlled trial of cognitive-behavioral therapy for Congolese survivors of sexual violence. N Engl J Med 2013;368:2182–91.
[21] Bohus M, Schmahl C, Fydrich T, et al. A research programme to evaluate DBT-PTSD, a modular treatment approach for complex PTSD after childhood abuse. Borderline Personal Disord Emot Dysregul 2019;4:67.
[22] Echeburúa E, de Corral P, Zubizarreta I, et al. Psychological treatment of chronic posttraumatic stress disorder in victims of sexual aggression. Behav Modif 1997;21:433–56.
[23] McDonagh A, Friedman M, McHugh G, et al. Randomized trial of cognitive-behavioral therapy for chronic posttraumatic stress disorder in adult female survivors of childhood sexual abuse. J Consult Clin Psychol 2005;73:515–24.
[24] Smith PN, Gamble SA, Cort NA, et al. Attachment and alliance in the treatment of depressed, sexually abused women. Depress Anxiety 2012;29:123–30.

[25] Talbot NL, Chaudron LH, Ward EA, et al. A randomized effectiveness trial of interpersonal psychotherapy for depressed women with sexual abuse histories. Psychiatrie Ser 2011;62:374–80.

[26] Ball SA, Rounsaville BJ, Tennen H, et al. Reliability of personality disorder symptoms and personality traits in substance dependent inpatients. J Abnorm Psychol 2001;110:341–52.

[27] Williams JWB, Gibbon M, First MB, et al. The structured clinical interview for DSM-III-R (SCID): II. Multisite test-retest reliability. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1992;49:630–6.

[28] Zanarini MC, Skodol AE, Bender D, et al. The collaborative longitudinal personality disorders study: reliability of Axis I and II diagnoses. J Personal Disord 2000;14:291–9.

[29] Brigham GS, Feaster DJ, Wakim PG, et al. Choosing a control group in effectiveness trials of behavioral drug abuse treatments. J Subst Abus Treat 2009;37:388–97.

[30] Gamble SA, Smith PN, Poleshuck EL, et al. Domain-specific social functioning improvements during treatment of depressed women with histories of childhood sexual abuse. J Affect Disord 2013;140:478–82.

[31] Blanchard EB, Hickling EJ, Devineni T, et al. A controlled evaluation of cognitive behavioral therapy for posttraumatic stress in motor vehicle accident survivors. Behav Res Ther 2003;41:79–96.

[32] Bebbington PE, Cooper C, Minot S, et al. Suicide attempts, gender, and sexual abuse: data from the 2000 British Psychiatric Morbidity Survey. Am J Psychiatry 2009;166:1135–40.

[33] DiLillo D. Interpersonal functioning among women reporting a history of childhood sexual abuse: empirical findings and methodological issues. Clin Psychol Rev 2001;21:553–76.

[34] Feiring C, Taska L. The persistence of shame following sexual abuse: a longitudinal look at risk and recovery. Child Maltreat 2005;10:337–49.

[35] Foix E, Street G. Women and traumatic events. J Clin Psychiatry 2002;63:1047–8.

[36] Lu W, Mueser KT, Rosenberg SD, et al. Correlates of adverse childhood experiences among adults with severe mood disorders. Psychiatr Ser 2008;59:1018–26.

[37] Brodsky BS, Mann JJ, Stanley B, et al. Familial transmission of suicidal behavior: factors mediating the relationship between childhood abuse and offspring suicide attempts. J Clin Psychiatry 2008;69:584–96.

[38] Cyranowski JM, Bookwala J, Feske U, et al. Adult attachment profiles, interpersonal difficulties, and response to interpersonal psychotherapy in women with recurrent major depression. J Soc Clin Psychol 2002;21:191–217.

[39] Diener MJ, Monroe JM. The relationship between adult attachment style and therapeutic alliance in individual psychotherapy: a meta-analytic review. Psychotherapy (Chic) 2011;48:237–48.