Graphical Review

A tale of two gases: NO and H₂S, foes or friends for life? ☆

Gopi K. Kolluru a, Xinggui Shen a, Christopher G. Kevil a,b,c,*

a Department of Pathology, LSU Health-Shreveport, USA
b Department of Molecular and Cellular Physiology, LSU Health-Shreveport, USA
c Department of Cell Biology and Anatomy, LSU Health-Shreveport, USA

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Article history:
Received 8 May 2013
Accepted 9 May 2013

Keywords:
Thiol
Redox biology
Cardiovascular disease
Vascular biology
Chemistry

A B S T R A C T

Nitric oxide (NO) and hydrogen sulfide (H₂S) have emerged as dominant redox regulators of numerous aspects of cellular and physiological functions within several organ systems including cardiovascular, immune and neurological tissues. Recent studies have begun to reveal that these two gaseous molecules may have redundant or overlapping pathophysiological functions often involving similar molecular targets. However, it remains less clear when and how NO and H₂S may interact under biological and disease processes. In this graphical review, we discuss the current understanding of NO and H₂S interactions and how they may functionally influence each other and what this may mean for biology and mechanisms of disease.

© 2013 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

Contents

Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 313
NO-H₂S signaling ...................................................................................................................... 314
Posttranslational modifications .............................................................................................. 315
Novel molecules from NO-H₂S interaction ............................................................................. 316
Conclusion ............................................................................................................................... 317
Acknowledgments .................................................................................................................. 317
References ............................................................................................................................... 317

Introduction

Nitric oxide (NO) has been extensively studied over the last three decades for its role in vascular functions and as a signaling molecule [2]. Nobel winning works from the trio Furchgott, Murad and Ignarro has placed NO as a central endothelial-derived relaxing factor (EDRF) and a key regulator of cardiovascular pathophysiological responses. However, the role of this gaseous molecule is being re-evaluated with the appreciation of a new gasotransmitter hydrogen sulfide (H₂S) that also serves many important regulatory roles in physiological systems. Like NO, H₂S was once thought to simply be a toxic gas but it is now believed to be an important redox-signaling molecule. A decade of studies on H₂S biology have elucidated its role in regulation of vascular homeostasis, neurological function, cytoprotection, anti-inflammatory, revascularization and therapeutic angiogenesis; along with modulation of cell survival responses, which is similar to many physiological roles of NO.

Production of either molecule occurs through enzymatic and non-enzymatic pathways. Fig. 1 illustrates H₂S formation via the transulfuration pathway involving CBS and CSE along with cysteine catabolism via MST. It is also possible that H₂S may be obtained through reductive chemistry on thiosulfate, thiocystine and other molecules. Similarly, NO formation predominantly occurs through nitric oxide synthases (NOS’s); however, it is increasingly apparent that non-enzymatic generation of NO via various nitrite/nitrate reduction mechanisms also critically regulates bioavailability. The physiological functions of NO [2–4] and

☆This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike License, which permits non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

*Corresponding author at: Department of Pathology, LSU Health-Shreveport, USA. Tel./fax: +1 318 675 4694.
E-mail address: ckevil@lsuhsc.edu (C.G. Kevil).
H2S [5–7] have been extensively studied and reviewed in the literature. However, the interrelation of NO–H2S and their subsequent biochemical interactions are complex and currently unclear. While some studies have shown that NO/H2S positively affect each other’s production and function [8–10]; other studies report contrarian, if not directly opposite findings [11–13]. Thus, significant ambiguity remains regarding NO–H2S chemical interactions and subsequent biological effects. This graphical review discusses the latest understanding of the relationship between these two gaseous signaling molecules and their roles in regulating several biological functions along with important future directions for research.

**NO–H2S signaling**

To date, only a small number of reports suggest that NO–H2S molecules may influence each other in their production and pathophysiological functions [5,14]. Studies demonstrate a common signaling pathway where NO–H2S crosstalk mediates their effects on vascular functions such as vasodilation, vascular remodeling (migration and proliferation) and angiogenesis [10,14–16]. Recent studies demonstrate H2S mediated upregulation of NO and vice-versa in regulating angiogenesis and attenuation of ischemia reperfusion (I/R) injury [14,15,17,18]. Fig. 2 illustrates that pro-angiogenic and I/R injury protection of H2S and its donors may occur through induction of VEGF/VEGFR2 signaling and its downstream effectors such as PI3K/Akt/eNOS in the vascular endothelial cells [8,10,19,20]. Moreover, H2S has been reported to prevent eNOS degradation and induce eNOS phosphorylation with subsequent NO production via PI3K/Akt activity [21,22] and p38 MAPK pathways [23]. H2S therapy can also preserve mitochondrial function and modulate cardioprotection through attenuation of oxidative stress via VEGF/Akt/eNOS/NO/cGMP pathway [8]. Reciprocally, pharmacological donors of NO can up-regulate substrate bioavailability for and expression of the H2S synthesis enzyme cystathionine gamma lyase (CGL/CSE) resulting in H2S production eliciting vasodilatory effects [14,24–26]. However, it has been reported that use of an NO donor can inhibit CBS expression counteracting what has been shown for CGL [13]. Finally, studies have shown that H2S has opposing effects on NOS/NO
metabolism in that H$_2$S can down regulate expression or inhibit activity of eNOS and subsequent NO production involving altered L-arginine/BH4, increased HO-1/CO and other unknown mechanisms [11,12,27,28].

Hydrogen sulfide also potently regulates cellular redox balance necessary for cytoprotection and inhibition of oxidative stress (Fig. 3). Studies have shown that exogenous H$_2$S stimulates Nrf2 activation leading to increased anti-oxidant defense responses [29,30]. Moreover, H$_2$S therapy has been reported to blunt NOX1 expression and activity thus alleviating oxidative stress [31]. H$_2$S exerts anti-inflammatory protection of organs exposed to I/R injury through an eNOS/NO and p38 MAPK dependent mechanism. Importantly, this protective effect of H$_2$S is not evident in eNOS$^{-/-}$ mice [32]. Similar observations are found upon inhibition of eNOS and subsequent NO production attenuating H$_2$S-mediated vascular responses including vasorelaxation and angiogenesis [17]. These observations indicate that H$_2$S can mediate its effects through a NO dependent pathway. Likewise, chemical inhibition of CSE inhibits NO-mediated vascular functions, suggesting its interdependency on H$_2$S [17]. However, our group has found that H$_2$S therapy is beneficial for ischemic vascular remodeling in eNOS$^{-/-}$ mice involving alternative non-enzymatic generation of NO via xanthine oxidase (XO) mediated nitrite reduction that increases tissue VEGF, cGMP production and angiogenesis activity under ischemic conditions [15].

The role of NO as a potent vasodilator through activation of soluble guanylate cyclase (sGC) and subsequent cGMP production is well established [33]. Likewise, H$_2$S can exhibit vasodilatory effects indirectly by delaying cGMP degeneration through PDE5 inhibition [34]. However, H$_2$S may also trigger dose-dependent vasoconstriction or dilatory effects depending on type of the vessel and the animal species examined. This conditional response toward H$_2$S is mediated though chemical modification of potassium channel protein thiols [5,35,36] or due to nitrosothiol formed as a result of NO/H$_2$S interaction [36]. Studies with specific knockouts of NOS or CSE further substantiate the vasodilatory effect of NO/H$_2$S [37,38]. Moreover, a concept is emerging whereby H$_2$S induces NO-mediated cGMP production by Ca$^{2+}$ release that may also contribute to vasodilation [19]. In contrast, chemical inhibition of CSE attenuates NO mediated cGMP formation, vasodilation and angiogenesis [17]. Together, these reports suggest an important role for H$_2$S in NO mediated vascular effects. Nevertheless, it appears that NO–H$_2$S and their enzymatic pathways may be mutually interactive and influence various biological functions. Additional studies are desperately needed to understand this complex relationship that has significant potential to advance our understanding of redox regulation of vascular reactivity.

**Posttranslational modifications**

Protein posttranslational modifications (PTMs) play significant roles in affecting not only the structure and interaction of proteins, but also regulating physiological functions through activation of various signaling pathways [39–41]. Fig. 4 shows that thiol residues of proteins may undergo different PTM through reactions with various biochemicals (e.g. H$_2$S/HS$^-$, NO or GSH) thereby affecting protein function. Active Cys residues at enzymes sites with low pKa can exist predominantly as thiolate anions (S$^-$) that are strong nucleophiles and interact with ROS species to generate sulfenic acid (SOH) (panel 4A), which can readily react with HS$^-$ or H$_2$S to form a persulfide bond [42]. NO also participates in modulating signaling function in a similar way through protein thiol S-nitrosation. This predominantly occurs due to NO radical (or other RNS species) oxidation of protein free thiol (RSH) with a nitrosyl group at the cysteine to form S-nitrosothiol [43]. This modified S-nitrosothiol may be much less reactive than the original thiol group resulting in reduced reactivity of cysteine. Thus, H$_2$S mediates protein modifications through persulfidation (also known as ‘sulphydration’), similar to nitrosation by NO.

H$_2$S modifies Cys residues of the proteins where the sulfhydril group of cysteine is converted to an –SSH group (panel 4B). This modified cysteine residue is highly reactive and increases the catalytic activity of targeted proteins. For instance, Glyceraldehyde 3-phosphate dehydrogenase (GAPDH), a glycolytic enzyme can be modified both by S-nitrosylation and S-sulfhydration at Cys-150 [40]. While, NO inhibits catalytic activity of GAPDH, H$_2$S increases it. Interestingly, other enzymes such as protein tyrosine phosphatases (PTP) are also regulated by NO and H$_2$S through protein modifications. NO modifies PTP-1B by S-nitrosation at cysteine 215 residue, which prevents inactivation by H$_2$O$_2$ induced irreversible oxidation [44]. It has been reported that H$_2$S typically

---

**Fig. 3.** NO and H$_2$S redox regulations and cytoprotection: (1) Reactive oxygen species are collectively formed from hydrogen peroxide (H$_2$O$_2$), peroxynitrite (ONOO$^-$) and superoxide radical (‘O$_2^-$’). Superoxide radical is formed from the mitochondrial complexes and uncoupling of eNOS, which further reacts with NO to form peroxynitrite. Nitrite/NO regulates NOX that upregulates H$_2$O$_2$ thereby contributing to ROS. (2) Both H$_2$S and nitrite/NO are involved in cytoprotection by inhibiting mitochondrial complexes I and IV and the intermediary component cytochrome C that generate ROS. (3) H$_2$S regulate Nrf2 directly and via cGMP variant 8-SH-cGMP to reduce ROS production. Nrf2 also induces HO-1 mediated inhibition of ROS.
activates target proteins through sulfhydration of cysteine; however, with PTP1B Cys persulfidation formation inactivates the enzyme in a reversible manner contributing to ER stress response effects on PTP enzyme function. Importantly, PTP1B persulfidation also occurs on cysteine 215, which is preferentially reversed by thioredoxin/thioredoxin reductase versus other intracellular reduction pathways highlighting the thiol persulfidation (sulfhydration) may act in a sensitive manner to control cellular physiology [45]. Together, these recent studies suggest that persulfidation may be more prevalent than nitrosylation and possibly equivalent to phosphorylation in regulating various biological functions; however, comprehensive studies examining thiol modification states are necessary in order to understand the magnitude and degree of various thiol PTM [40,45-47]. It is intriguing that both NO and H2S can target the same reactive Cys residues of a given protein that diversely impacts catalytic activity and function of the protein revealing complex regulatory mechanisms that are not fully understood. Additionally, it is also unclear what role post-translational thiol modification by glutathione plays in modulating nitrosation versus persulfidation in an ever-evolving paradigm of redox signaling. It is clear that more work is needed to better understand when these various PTM’s form, the prevalence of them in biological systems, and their functional effects under physiological and pathological conditions.

**Novel molecules from NO–H2S interaction**

Both NO and H2S are chemically reactive gaseous molecules that are generated and distributed across various tissues. The nucleophilic properties of H2S and metabolites and electrophilic characteristics of NO metabolites suggest a possible cross talk between metabolite products of these two gaseous molecules forming new intermediates (Fig. 5). Although, it is important to understand that direct reaction between H2S and NO is chemically unfavorable thus opening the possibility of ionic metabolite interactions. Early observations from Kimura and co-workers suggested that H2S and NO serve a coordinated relationship in regulating the vascular tone [48]. Later, Whiteman and colleagues reported potential antioxidant effects of H2S through its interaction with peroxynitrite (ONOO−)
[49]. A follow up study from this group further suggested that NO and H₂S may react to form a novel nitrosothiol that has not been further characterized [50,51]. However, more recent studies have demonstrated that NO/H₂S metabolites can react forming novel chemical products that could uniquely influence biochemical and physiological responses [52–56].

NO can react with oxygen radicals to form secondary reactive nitrogen species such as N₂O₃ or ONOO⁻, as well as S-nitrosation reactions with protein and small molecular weight thiols resulting in S-nitrosothiols (RSNO) affecting numerous redox dependent processes. NO oxidation products such as nitrite, nitrate, N₂O₃, nitrosothiols and other NO metabolites such as electrophilic-nitrated fatty acids can react with H₂S. While it is most likely that a direct interaction between H₂S and NO occurs; HS⁻ may react with either oxidized form of NO, NO²⁻ or nitrosating species (formed through reaction with NO²⁻, O₂⁻ and ONOO⁻) or SNO/ GSNO to form novel molecules like nitrosothiol, sulfanyl nitrite (HS (O)NO or HSNO₂) or nitroxyl (HNO) with less clear physiological implications. Importantly H₂S, at therapeutic concentrations (low to mid micromolar) inhibit cytotoxic effects of peroxynitrite possibly through formation sulfanyl nitrite, a precursor that may also form HNO. This novel product of H₂S and NO has the potential to release NO while simultaneously neutralizing pro-apoptotic and oxidative effects of peroxynitrite [55].

H₂S by itself may react with RSNO to form thionitrous acid (HONO) [27,51]. Intracellular formation of HSNO, under physiological conditions is still debatable. However, its production through NO [57], cytochrome c [58] and heme containing enzymes [59] has been reported. HSNO has been shown in vitro to diffuse intracellularly and facilitate transnitrosation of proteins such as hemoglobin. HSNO can be metabolized to generate NO and other NO species like HNO that has presumably longer half-life and may have physiological roles in oxygen delivery and cardioprotection [53].

Nitroxyl (HNO), a protonated form of NO, is highly reactive to nucleophiles such as thiols. Recent studies demonstrate that HNO can have distinct physiological functions such as vasodilation and cardioprotection especially at low concentrations [20,60]. The effects of HNO in cardioprotection may also occur through cGMP [61]. On the contrary, there are also reports suggesting that HNO can be neurotoxic, cause inflammation and arrhythmia, DNA oxidation and thiol loss at much higher concentrations than what would be considered a therapeutic dose [20,62,63]. These studies suggest careful use considering their significant toxicity at high concentrations. Extensive studies of these various reaction products between H₂S and NO require further experimentation to understand complex biochemical signaling mechanisms between these mediators for various biological functions.

Conclusion

It is evident from the literature that the two “gasotransmitters” NO and H₂S perform a variety of homeostatic physiological functions. Both of these molecules are implicated in signaling of many complex pathways under physiological and pathological conditions. Though there are few studies demonstrating NO–H₂S interplay, it is also unclear whether the kinetics of NO–H₂S reaction and formation of novel compounds may be biochemically significant compared to the presence and amount of other molecules (e.g. GSH). Considering the concentration dependent effects of NO and H₂S, careful attention to bioavailable levels of these molecules will be critical to determine the likelihood that various reactions or interactions may occur to influence molecular and cellular physiological responses. Moreover, it will also be important for studies focusing on NO–H₂S interactions to evolve from theoretical and test tube levels to cellular and pathophysiological models if we are to truly understand the relationship between NO and H₂S interactions. Given the novelty of this area, it is likely that new and exciting discoveries will be revealed detailing gaseous mediator regulation of redox biology.

Acknowledgments

This work was supported by NIH Grant HL113303 to C.G.K and by a fellowship from the Malcolm Feist Cardiovascular Research Endowment, LSU Health Sciences Center-Shreveport to G.K.K.

References

[1] N. Marsh, A. Marsh, A short history of nitroglycerine and nitric oxide in pharmacology and physiology, Clinical and Experimental Pharmacology and Physiology 27 (2000) 313–319.
[2] G.K. Kolluru, J.H. Siamwala, S. Chatterjee, eNOS phosphorylation in health and disease, Biochimie 92 (2010) 1186–1196.
[3] J.O. Lundberg, E. Weitzberg, M.T. Gladwin, The nitrate-nitrite-nitric oxide pathway in physiology and therapeutics, Nature Reviews Drug Discovery 7 (2008) 156–167.
[4] S. Moncada, R.M. Palmer, E.A. Higgs, Nitric oxide: physiology, pathophysiology, and pharmacology, Pharmacological Reviews 43 (1991) 109–142.
[5] L. Li, P. Rose, P.K. Moore, Hydrogen sulfide and cell signaling, Annual Review of Pharmacology and Toxicology 51 (2011) 169–187.
[6] C. Szabo, A. Papapetropoulos, Hydrogen sulphide and angiogenesis: mechanisms and applications, British Journal of Pharmacology 164 (2011) 853–865.
[7] R. Wang, Physiological implications of hydrogen sulfide: a whiff exploration that blossomed, Physiological Reviews 92 (2012) 791–896.
[8] K. Kondo, S. Bhushan, A.L. King, S.D. Prabhu, T. Hamid, S. Koenig, T. Murohara, B.L. Predmore, G. Gojon Sr, G. Gojon Jr, R. Wang, N. Karusula, C.K. Nicholson, J.W. Calvert, D.J. Lefer, H₂S protects against pressure overload-induced heart failure via upregulation of endothelial nitric oxide synthase, Circulation 127 (2013) 1116–1126.
[9] M.J. Wang, W.J. Cai, N. Li, Y.J. Ding, Y. Chen, Y.C. Zhu, The hydrogen sulfide donor NaHSSH promotes angiogenesis in a rat model of hind limb ischemia, Antioxidants and Redox Signaling 12 (2010) 1065–1077.
[10] W.J. Cai, M.J. Wang, P.K. Moore, H.M. Jiu, T. Yao, Y.C. Zhu, The novel proangiogenic effect of hydrogen sulfide is dependent on Akt phosphorylation, Cardiovascular Research 76 (2007) 29–40.
[11] S. Kubo, Y. Kurokawa, I. Doe, T. Masuko, F. Sekiguchi, A. Kawahata, Hydrogen sulfide inhibits activity of three isoforms of recombinant nitric oxide synthase, Toxicology 241 (2007) 92–97.
[12] X.H. Li, J.B. Du, D.F. Bu, Y.X. Tang, C.S. Tang, Sodium hydrosulfide alleviated pulmonary vascular structural remodeling induced by high pulmonary blood flow in rats, Acta Pharmacologica Sinica 27 (2006) 971–980.
[13] G.P. Prathapasinghe, Y.L. Siow, Z. Xu, K. O., Inhibition of cystathionine-beta-synthase activity during renal ischemia-reperfusion: role of pH and nitric oxide, American Journal of Physiology—Renal Physiology 295 (2008) F912–F922.
[14] Y.F. Wang, P. Mainali, C.S. Tang, L. Shi, C.Y. Zhang, H. Yan, X.Q. Liu, J.B. Du, Effects of nitric oxide and hydrogen sulfide on the relaxation of pulmonary arteries in rats, Chinese Medical Journal (England) 121 (2008) 420–423.
[15] S.C. Bir, G.K. Kolluru, P. McCarthy, X. Shen, S. Pardue, C.B. Pattillo, C.G. Kevel, Hydrogen sulfide stimulates ischemic vascular remodeling through nitric oxide synthase and nitrite reduction activity regulating hypoxia-inducible factor-1α and vascular endothelial growth factor-dependent angiogenesis, Journal of the American Heart Association (2012).
[16] Q. Gu, B. Wang, X.F. Zhang, Y.P. Ma, J.D. Liu, X.Z. Wang, Contribution of hydrogen sulfide and nitric oxide to exercise-induced attenuation of aortic remodeling and improvement of endothelial function in spontaneously hypertensive rats, Molecular and Cellular Biochemistry 375 (2013) 199–206.
[17] C. Coletta, A. Papapetropoulos, K. Erdelji, O. Gah, O. Modis, P. Panopoulos, A. Asimakopoulou, D. Gero, I. Sharina, E. Martin, C. Szabo, Hydrogen sulfide and nitric oxide are mutually dependent in the regulation of angiogenesis and endothelium-dependent vasorelaxation, Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of USA 109 (2012) 9161–9166.
[18] B.L. Predmore, K. Kondo, S. Bhushan, M.A. Zlatopolsky, A.L. King, J.P. Aragon, D.B. Grinsfelder, M.E. Condit, D.J. Lefer, The polysulfide diallyl trisulfide protects the ischemic myocardium by preservation of endogenous hydrogen sulfide and increasing nitric oxide bioavailability, American Journal of Physiology. Heart and Circulatory Physiology. 292 (2012) H4140–H4148.
[19] M. Kiča, S. Sugiyama, T. Yoshimoto, Y. Ogawa, Hydrogen sulfide increases nitric oxide production with calcium-dependent activation of endothelial nitric oxide synthase in endothelial cells, European Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences 48 (2013) 211–215.
[20] G.C. Yong, L.F. Hu, S. Wang, D. Huang, J.S. Bian, Hydrogen sulfide interacts with nitric oxide in the heart: possible involvement of nitroxy, Cardiovascular Research 88 (2010) 482–491.
