Slums’ Access to and Coverage of Primary Health Care Services: A Cross-Sectional Study in Shiraz, a Metropolis in Southern Iran

Hassan Joulaei1, Pharm D, MPH; Azad R Bhuiyan2, PhD, MD, MPH; Mehrab Sayadi3, MSc; Fariba Morady4, MD; Parvin Afsar Kazerooni5, MD

1HIV/AIDS Research Centre, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Shiraz, Iran;
2Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, Jackson State University, Mississippi, USA;
3Statistics and Information Technology Unit, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Shiraz, Iran;
4Shiraz Geriatric Research Center, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Shiraz, Iran;
5Control and Surveillance of Diseases Unit, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Shiraz, Iran

Correspondence:
Hassan Joulaei, Pharm D, MPH; HIV/AIDS Research Center, School of Medicine, Karimkhaneh-e-Zand Avenue, P.O. Box: 71345-1737, Shiraz, Iran
Tel: +98 917 7121762
Fax: +98 711 2305615
Email: Joulaei_h@yahoo.com
Received: 19 January 2013
Revised: 7 May 2013
Accepted: 22 May 2013

Abstract

Background: The United Nations has predicted that the population of slum dwellers will have grown from one billion people worldwide to 2 billion by 2030. This trend is also predictable in Iran. In the Iranian metropolis of Shiraz, more than 10% of the residents live in slum areas. There are several problems regarding the delivery of social services in these areas. The aim of this study was to evaluate slums dwellers’ access to and coverage of health care.

Methods: This cross-sectional face-to-face study included 380 household of slum dwellers via stratified random sampling. Demographics, accessibility of health services, coverage of health care, and route of receiving health services were recorded through interviews.

Results: Approximately, 21.6% of the households had no physical access to health centers. The coverage rate of family planning programs for safe methods was 51.4% (95% CI: 48.86-53.9%). Vaccination coverage among children under 5 years old was 98% (95% CI: 97-99%). Furthermore, 34% of pregnant women had not received standard health care due to a lack of access to health centers.

Conclusion: Limited access to health services along with inadequate knowledge of slum residents about health care facilities was the main barrier to the utilization of the health care in the slums.

Keywords ● Primary health care ● Health services accessibility ● Slums

Introduction

Slum residency is an informal residency on the outskirts or even in the inner parts of a town. Slums have the least welfare and public services, including health services. The phrase “slum” is sometimes used in developing countries in order to elucidate the miserable living conditions of the residents of such areas. The percentage of urban residents living in slums decreased from 47% to 37% in developing countries between 1990 and 2005. Currently, one billion people live in slums worldwide and the United Nations (UN) has predicted that this figure will have risen to 2 billion by 2030. This will aggravate the current situation because only a few of these governments already
have the financial resources to cope. For instance, Cairo receives 1000 new residents every week, which would definitely exacerbate job deficiency and housing supplies in the capital of Egypt. Urban decay and high rates of poverty, illiteracy, and unemployment along with inadequate hygienic water, insufficient access to sanitation and other infrastructure, and poor structural quality of housing are very important indicators of slums. Slums are usually deemed “breeding grounds” for such social problems as crime, drug addiction, alcoholism, high rates of mental diseases, and suicide. It is predictable that by 2030, approximately 1.7 billion of the expected 3.93 billion urban dwellers in low-income and middle-income countries will be doubled. In this regard, Jolene Skordis-Worrall and co-workers showed that the prevalence of self-reported morbidity in urban slum settings of India was 37.5%, which is higher than that of the regions with a well socioeconomic status. Also, in a panel study, researchers illustrated that urban slum prevalence exhibits a substantial impact on infant and child mortality across a large number of less-developed countries. In addition, in the slums of Nairobi and Kenya about 18% of the respondents reported being affected by HIV/AIDS. India has one of the largest urban populations in the world (28% of the total national population) and ranks among the top ten slum areas in the globe.

The development of slums in Iran started in 1961 following a new rule of interaction between farmers and feudal employers. At the time, big cities were obliged to host hundreds of thousands of migrants from rural areas. In spite of remarkable achievements in the development of deprived areas, including hygienic drinking water distribution system, primary health care, and social services in Iran, the country is still far off the target of narrowing the gap between these areas. For instance, the poverty levels, unemployment rates, and maternal and neonatal mortality rates in slums are higher than those in urban areas. High-risk behavior, such as intravenous drug use (IDU), in these areas compared to other areas renders their residents more susceptible to communicable diseases such as HIV, hepatitis B or C, and other sexually transmitted diseases (STIs). Moreover, the distribution of health resources is not equitable and the present arrangements are unable to ensure the provision of basic health care services to all citizens. In Shiraz, a metropolis in the south of Iran, more than 10% of the total population (about 1.7 million) lives in slums.

To the best of our knowledge, the present study is the first documented survey about the accessibility and coverage of primary health care services in Iranian slums. We conducted this study in order to evaluate the level of access to and coverage of primary health care services in the slum areas of Shiraz.

**Materials and Methods**

The present study was a cross-sectional study, conducted in Shiraz slums, in order to assess the access to and coverage of its residents to primary health care services and the status of common diseases among them. The study was carried out from October 2009 to July 2010 and included a sample population of the households residing in the slums. Considering that 50% of the population of these areas has access to primary health care (experts’ opinion), confidence level at 95%, and margin of error at 5%, the sample size was calculated to be 380 according to the following formula:

\[
\frac{Z^2}{2} \cdot \frac{p(1-p)}{d^2}
\]

The stratified cluster random sampling method was used in order to obtain a sample of 380 households. First, based on the municipality’s map, the marginal zones of Shiraz were specified and then, the sample number was determined based on the size of the population in each zone. According to their Zip Codes, the clusters were selected randomly and finally the participants were randomly drawn from all the households.

The sampling unit was the household. Each participant was visited by a group of professionals at his/her home separately, and data gathering forms were filled out under the supervision of the group members. Household women were selected as respondents in the study because they are properly informed of the health situation of the family and also are readily available. Any reported diseases by the respondents had to be confirmed by medical documents.

Non-Iranians were also excluded. The study protocol was approved by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) and the Research Ethics Committee of Shiraz University of Medical Sciences.

A structured data gathering form was used in order to obtain data from all the randomly selected participants by means of a face-to-face interview. The data gathering form was comprised of three parts: demographic data, including sex, age, and number of members in each household, accessibility of health services, and coverage of primary health care (such as children health care, family planning, maternal health care, common
communicable and non-communicable diseases, and Pap smear for detecting cervical cancer); route of receiving health services whether public or private; and sources of health information.

As was mentioned in the Introduction, high-risk behavior is high among slums' residents. Accordingly, the respondents' knowledge of HIV/AIDS was assessed with a questionnaire containing nine close-ended questions (similar to those reflected in national or local surveys in Iran). These questions covered the categories of the definition of HIV/AIDS, mode of transmission, and routes of prevention. The questionnaire was validated by expert opinion and was pre-tested among 35 respondents. After data analysis, Cronbach's $\alpha$ was calculated to assess the internal consistency of the knowledge questions ($\alpha=0.63$). The questions were answered using the options "Agree", "Disagree", and "I don't know". A total score for knowledge was obtained by adding the points given for each answer. For each correct answer one point, and for "I don't know" or any incorrect answer zero points were assigned. The sum makes up the total score, which ranged between 0 and 9. Scores $>4.5$ indicated acceptable knowledge and those $<4.5$ denoted poor knowledge.

Based on the definitions of the Iran's Ministry of Health and Higher Education, "excellent access" is less than a 10-minute walk to a health center; "acceptable access" is a 10 to 30-minute walk; and "inaccessibility" is more than a 30-minute walk.

Maternal care is defined as at least six visits during pregnancy and two visits after delivery by health centers. Child health care refers to regular well-child check-up according to the program of the Iran's Ministry of Health and Higher Education. Contraception coverage is defined as the number of women in reproductive age who use safe methods of contraception divided by the total number of women between 15-59 years old.

Vaccination coverage for children under 5 years is defined as an immunization schedule by which children under 5 years of age are protected against diphtheria, tetanus, pertussis, polio, measles, mumps, rubella, hepatitis B, and tuberculosis. Vaccination coverage in adults is defined as the coverage for diphtheria and tetanus vaccine among adults.

Two major communicable diseases rife among slum dwellers are leishmaniasis and HIV/AIDS. As a result, researchers have selected both of them to assess the accessibility of the population to their health care. In this study, non-communicable diseases (according to the National Surveillance Program for Diabetes and Hypertension) and accessibility to health care for these diseases were assessed.

Overall, 372 inhabitants responded to our survey (response rate=98%). The mean age of the participants was 29.6±7.4 (ranging from 19 to 54) years. The family size of the target population was 4.5±1.7. The average accessibility time was 17.6±6.2 minutes, and about 21.6% (80 families) of the households had no physical access to health centers. The coverage rate of family planning programs was 66.4% (95% CI: 61.6-71.19%), whereas about 15% of the respondents used natural methods such as withdrawal. Table 1 demonstrates the contraceptive prevalence rate of each method among the slums' dwellers compared with the rural and urban populations of the Fars Province.

Eighty-eight percent of children under 8 years of age were covered by public health services, and vaccination coverage for this age group was estimated to be 98% (95% CI: 97-99%). The vaccination coverage of men above 16 years old was 49%, while it was 78% for women of the same age. According to the participants' response, 7.2% (95% CI: 6.4-8%) and 10% (95% CI: 9.08-10.91%) of the slums' residents over 15 years were diabetic and hypertensive, respectively. Also, 18% of hypertensive individuals were not under health care coverage because of inaccessibility and 55% also referred to private health centers, irregularly. About 16.3% of the participants (95% CI: 14.91-17.68%) over 15 years old were smokers. Approximately, 51% of the respondents mentioned that they had at least one addicted family member, 10% of them being intravenous drug abusers.

About 8.5% of the households' members had been exposed to leishmaniasis; of which 35.7%
and 28.6% had referred to public and private health centers, respectively. Four (1.1%) respondents reported that they had one member infected by HIV. Approximately, 18.6% of the respondents had poor knowledge about the definition of HIV/AIDS and its routes of transmission and prevention. Our findings revealed that the most prevalent health information source in the slums was the radio and the least prevalent one was health care centers' staff.

**Discussion**

Health care services in slums and the health status of their residents have become a public health challenge in the current century. The Iranian metropolis of Shiraz has a good health care network in that it provides health care access to more than 85% of its whole population. Nevertheless, many dwellers of the slums of this city are deprived from basic health care services. It is clear that the current locations of the health care centers in the slums are not compatible with standard protocols. The problem is compounded by the fact that there is no reliable information and evidence on the exact health status of the residents of these regions. In this study, we found out that 21.6% of the slums were not covered by health care services; this rate is much higher than that in rural areas (less than 5%). Studies among slums in India and Africa have also pointed out that accessibility is a very important contributing factor in the utilization of health care services among slum dwellers. According to our study, the coverage of contraception in the rural and urban areas of Fars Province was roughly 66% and 63%, respectively, while this figure in the slums stood at 51%, which is significantly lower than the rate in the rural areas (P<0.001). Moreover, the contraceptive prevalence rates of all methods among married women of reproductive age (15-49) in Iran is 73%, as opposed to 66.4% in our study. Also in our study, 19.15% of the participants were on oral contraceptives, showing that this method was the most commonly used, while the least common one was intramuscular injection of Medroxyprogesterone Acetate (3.94%). Approximately, 28% of the women of reproductive age in our study were not using any method of contraception due to a lack of accessibility to public health centers.

Our findings demonstrated that 28% of the women had not registered and followed family planning programs. This could be due to difficult access to health care centers, which is compatible to other studies. According to evidence, female dwellers of slums have much higher fertility rates than their urban peers; moreover, in many regions of Asia and Africa, in the slums, fertility rates are similar to those of rural areas. The low coverage of family planning programs in the slums of Shiraz along with immigration from rural to urban areas has led to high rates of population growth and consequently increased incidence rates of antisocial and risky behaviors, addiction, STDs, and other psycho-socio-medical hazards. In our study, over 34% of the pregnant women were deprived from maternal and postpartum health care. These statistics, when juxtaposed against the total country rates (27.5% and 15.6% for maternal and postpartum care, respectively) are indeed disconcerting. There could be two explanations: lack of general health knowledge among the slums' women and poor accessibility to health care centers.

Based on the Iranian National Vaccination Program, all children below the age of 6 must be vaccinated against tuberculosis, diphtheria, tetanus, pertussis, hepatitis B, poliomyelitis, and measles. Be that as it may, the results of our study indicated that the rate of the complete coverage of the Iranian National Vaccination Program was 98% in the slums. Regarding the Urban Heart Survey in Tehran, vaccination coverage among children over the age of 13 years in six districts out of twenty-three was below 80%. The socioeconomic indicators of the survey showed

| Contraceptive Method | Suburban residents | Rural areas (20) | Urban areas (20) |
|---------------------|--------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Pill                | 71                 | 55948           | 243             |
| Condom              | 39                 | 25543           | 208             |
| Tuba ligation       | 43                 | 43773           | 191             |
| Vasectomy           | 6                  | 5623            | 57              |
| Injection           | 15                 | 10755           | 47              |
| IUD                 | 17                 | 9388            | 81              |
| Total of safe methods | 191            | 151030          | 827             |
| Natural methods     | 56                 | 17890           | 1084            |
| Total of methods    | 247                | 168920          | 1078            |
| Total of samples    | 372                | 228982          | 1323            |
that most of those mentioned districts had a low socioeconomic status. A comparison between the results of these two studies suggest that vaccination coverage in Shiraz’s slums is higher than Tehran's low socioeconomic areas. There is also a low frequency of hepatitis B vaccination among the youth (52%) in comparison with the coverage of rural areas (76.8%) (P<0.001). In addition, the overall health care coverage of the children of the slums was 83%, which is lower than that in the rural areas (98%).

Our findings showed a higher prevalence rate of adult smokers in these areas in comparison with the rate of the whole country (16.3% and 12.3%, respectively). Nonetheless, according to the World Health Organization (WHO), the average proportion of adult smokers in the Eastern Mediterranean region is 19%.

Although over 90% of patients with diabetes mellitus and/or hypertension have access to health care and utilize routine and programmed visits by family physicians in rural areas, this rate is less than 83% in the slums. One of the most important health issues in slums is the prevalence of communicable diseases. Higher incidence and prevalence rates of HIV/AIDS in these areas endorse this fact. A comparison of our respondents' knowledge about the transmission and prevention routes of HIV/AIDS with other studies indicated higher poor knowledge rates in our study population.

In two Nairobi slums, about 1% of the respondents reported being infected with HIV, whereas this figure in our study was less than 0.24%. However, this rate is also significantly higher than the rate of the total country (0.032%).

In a study among the slum population in Nairobi, the investigators concluded that the Integrated Management of Child Illnesses (IMCI) program must be free of charge to the urban residents in order to increase health care seeking and improve survival of children. In the urban and rural areas of Iran, health care services are free of charge for all people. It seems that the main problem in Iran is that these centers are not readily accessible to the residents.

Our findings showed that the radio (52%), followed by television (32%), was the main source of health information provision for the respondents. It was remarkable that health care centers’ staff were responsible for delivering health information of only 3% of the respondents. Establishing new health care centers in slum areas, augmenting the quality of medical services in health care centers, and elevating health knowledge among slum dwellers constitute three major strategies that should be adopted in order to combat this challenge.

Conclusion

Primary health care service is essential for all different social strata. However, access to and coverage of health care is dissimilar in the different areas of the Iranian province of Fars. Several factors are involved in the genesis of this problem. Low accessibility to and shortage of perfect coverage of primary health care in slums areas along with inadequate health knowledge of their residents deprive the majority of these slums' residents of good health.

Acknowledgement

The authors wish to thank all the families who participated in this study. We express our sincere gratitude to all the staff members of Shiraz Health Care Center for their kind cooperation. We also appreciate the Research Deputy Directorship of Shiraz University of Medical Sciences for its financial support.

Conflict of Interest: None declared.

References

1. Sclar ED, Northridge ME. Slums, slum dwellers, and health. Am J Public Health. 2003;93:1381. doi: 10.2105/AJPH.93.9.1381. PubMed PMID: 12948945. PubMed Central PMCID: PMC1447975.
2. Global Report on Human Settlements [Internet]. London: UN-HABITAT. 2007. [Cited 2013 April 2]. Available from: http://mirror.unhabitat.org/downloads/docs/GRHS2007.pdf
3. UNFPA official website [Internet]. Linking population, poverty and development. [Cited 2013 April 21]. Available from: http://www.unfpa.org/pds/urbanization.htm
4. Unger A, Riley LW. Slum health: from understanding to action. PLoS Med. 2007;4:1561-6. doi: 10.1371/journal.pmed.0040295. PubMed PMID: 17958462; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC2039756.
5. Gretchen Peters. A new push to clean up the world's slums [Internet]. The Christian Science Monitor. c2003 [Cited 2012 Dec 21]. Available from: http://www.csmonitor.com/2003/1120/p07s01-wogi.html
6. Felland LE, Lauer JR, Cunningham PJ. Suburban poverty and the health care safety net [Internet]. Center for Studying Health System Change. 2009 [Cited 2012 Oct 22]. Available from: http://www.hschange.com/CONTENT/1074/1074.pdf
7. Pithouse R. Politics in the Slum: A View from South Africa [Internet]. 2010 [Cited 2012 Nov
20]. Available from: http://nyc.indymedia.org/en/2010/09/112147.html
8 United Nations [Internet]. The Millennium Development Goals Report, 2007 [Cited 2013 Feb 25]. Available from: http://www.un.org/millenniumgoals/pdf/mdg2007.pdf
9 Sclar ED, Garau P, Carolini G. The 21st century health challenge of slums and cities. Lancet. 2005;365:901-3. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(05)70149-7. PubMed PMID: 15752535.
10 Skordis-Worrall J, Pace N, Bapat U, Das S, More NS, Joshi W, et al. Maternal and neonatal health expenditure in Mumbai slums (India): a cross sectional study. BMC Public Health. 2011;11:150. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-11-150. PubMed PMID: 21385404; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC3061914.
11 Jorgenson AK, Rice J. Urban Slum Growth and Human Health: A Panel Study of Infant and Child Mortality in Less-Developed Countries, 1990–2005. Journal of Poverty. 2010;14:382-402.
12 Kyobutungi C, Ezeh AC, Zulu E, Falkingham J. HIV/AIDS and the health of older people in the slums of Nairobi, Kenya: results from a cross sectional survey. BMC Public Health. 2009;9:153. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-9-153. PubMed PMID: 19473488; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC2694783.
13 Hazarika I. Women's reproductive health in slum populations in India: evidence from NFHS-3. J urban health. 2010;87:264-77. doi: 10.1007/s11524-009-9421-0. PubMed PMID: 20148311; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC2949783.
14 Bagheri M, Kahkesh F, Nikbakhesh B. Monitoring the Situation of Slum Dweller, Face of Urban Poverty the Case of Mallashieh-Iran. American Journal of Scientific Research. 2011;10:101-9.
15 Lotfi K. Textbook of The Sustainable City III Urban Regeneration and Sustainability. Southampton: WIT Press; 2004. Chapter 2, Planning, development and management : Slum development in Ahvaz with emphasis on the All-E-Saffi sector; p. 103.
16 Pouhe.2004.08.014. PubMed PMID: 15826888.
17 Asadi-Lari M, Farshad AA, Assaei SE, VaezMahdavi MR, Akbari ME, Ameri A, et al. Applying a basic development needs approach for sustainable and integrated community development in less-developed areas: report of ongoing Iranian experience. Public Health. 2005;119:474-82. doi: 10.1016/j.
the DIVIDEND Overcoming Pakistan’s Demographic challenges. Woodrow Wilson International Center for scholars (US); c2011 [cited 2012 Sep 2]. Available from: http://wilsoncenter.net/sites/default/files/ReapingtheDividendFINAL.pdf

28 Larkin EM, Frank JL, Knight KN, Frank SH. Health risk behaviors in a unique population-first ring suburban adolescents. J community Health. 2007;32:37-55. doi: 10.1007/s10900-006-9028-2. PubMed PMID: 17269312.

29 Khosravi A, Najafi F, Rahbar MR, Motlagh ME, Kabir MJ. Indicators of health in the Islamic Republic of Iran Broadcasting [Internet]. 2009 [cited 2012 Sep 20]. Available from: http://behdasht.gov.ir/uploads/291_1041_simayei-salamat.pdf. Persian.

30 Jain T, Garg S, Singh MM, Kaushik A, Batra S, Gupta VK, et al. Antepartum morbidities and health seeking behaviour among women in an urban slum of Delhi. J Indian Med Assoc. 2011;109:315-7. PubMed PMID: 22187764.

31 Rashidian A, Khosravi A, Khabiri R, Khodayari-Moez E, Elahi E, Arab M, et al. Islamic Republic of Iran’s Multiple Indicator Demographic and Health Survey (IrMIDHS) 2010 [Internet]. Tehran: Ministry of Health and Medical Education. 2012 [cited 2012 Oct 22]. Available from: http://nih.tums.ac.ir/Images/UserFiles/1/file/IrMIDHS%20summary%20findings%20presentation%20Rashidian.pdf. Persian.

32 Asadi-Lari M, Vaez Mahdavi MR. An overview on urban-HEART tehran experience [Internet]. c2011. Available from: http://www.who.int/kobe_centre/measuring/urbanheart/tehran_urbanheart_city_report.pdf

33 World Health Organization [Internet]. Regional Health Observatory. [cited 2012 Oct 13]. Available from: http://rho.emro.who.int/rhodata/?vid=2684

34 Feizzadeh A, Nedjat S, Asghari S, Keshtkar A, Heshmat R, Setayesh H, et al. Evidence-based approach to HIV/AIDS policy and research prioritization in the Islamic Republic of Iran. East Mediterr Health J. 2010;16:259-65. PubMed PMID: 20795438.

35 National AIDS Committee Secretariat, Ministry of Health and Medical Education [Internet]. Islamic Republic of Iran AIDS Progress Report on Monitoring of the United Nations General Assembly Special Session on HIV and AIDS. 2012 [Cited 2012 June 18]. Available from: http://www.unaids.org/en/dataanalysis/knowyourresponse/countryprogressreports/2012countries/IRIran%20AIDS%20Progress%20Report%202012%20English%20final1_1.pdf

36 Taffa N, Chepngeno G. Determinants of health care seeking for childhood illnesses in Nairobi slums. Trop Med Int Health. 2005;10:240-5. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-3156.2004.01381.x. PubMed PMID: 15730508.