Relationship of Pb in House Dust and Ambient Air

Brian Gulson1,2* and Alan Taylor3
1Graduate School of the Environment, Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia
2Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO, Earth Science and Resource Engineering, Sydney, Australia
3Department of Psychology, Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia

Abstract

We evaluated the relationship of lead (Pb) using high precision Pb isotopes from ambient air particulates and dust fall accumulation in 59 residences in Sydney New South Wales Australia by the Petri Dish Dust method (PDD) to determine if the dust is a reliable indicator of exposure in cases where air Pb data may not be available. Over the period 1993-2002, Pb values in air samples were higher in winter whereas the Pb loadings for PDD values were slightly higher in spring and summer. These differences are probably the result of differences in sampling times of the air particulates (24-h) and PDD (~3 months). There was no seasonal or sub urb effect for the isotopic ratios. Both air and PDD samples showed a strong increase in 206Pb/204Pb over time. PDD data were predicted by the air data (p <0.001) and provide a useful adjunct in monitoring exposures.

Keywords: Dust particles; Sampling times; Exposures

Introduction

Exposure to house dust is the most important contributor to blood Pb (PbB) in young children [1-8]. The usual method of estimating exposure to dust is collection by vacuum cleaners [9,10] or surface wipes [9], summarized in US EPA [11]. These sampling methods have various limitations including lack of information about deposition rates, unless resampling over specific time periods is specifically undertaken. An alternative method makes use of collecting trays [12] or dishes [13-16] that monitor exposure for varying lengths of time. Material collected in these vessels is via airborne pathways and may derive from such sources as activities in the house (e.g., renovation, smoking), tracked in dust, and windblown through doors and windows. The exterior sources may be resuspended soil and dust which may contain a legacy of past leaded-gasoline use or leaded paint [17-19], a fact that is continuously misinterpreted by most people in the community (internationally) who think Pb is no longer an issue because Pb has been removed from gasoline and paint in many countries.

Ambient air has been monitored over decades mainly by environmental protection agencies and some researchers [11]. Although air Pb levels have decreased dramatically with cessation of the use of leaded gasoline in many countries (e.g., Thomas et al. [20]) the contribution of Pb in ambient air is still of importance in monitoring environmental exposures to the community and individuals in residences. For example, monitoring of Pb in Total Suspended Particulates (TSP) from High Volume (HV) air filters in Sydney by New South Wales Environment Protection Authority (EPA) showed the annual concentration decreasing from 0.75 µg/m³ in 1991 to <0.1 µg/m³ in 2000 [11], levels being so low for their laboratory methods that Pb measurements were discontinued from 2002. Nevertheless Pb has been monitored in Sydney PM₂.₅ particulates over decades by Cohen and colleagues at ANSTO [21,22] using sensitive ion beam methods.

In spite of rapid reductions in air Pb associated with removal of Pb from gasoline and use of Pb in paint, air Pb may still be an important contributor to PbB especially in children. For example, Brink et al. [23] found that Pb measured in the US EPA's National Air Toxics Assessment was a significant predictor of PbB ≥10 µg/dl in children. Using data from the National Health and Nutrition Examination Surveys (NHANES) III and 9908 and air Pb data in TSP from the US EPA, Richmond-Bryant et al. [24] concluded that a larger relative public health benefit among children may be derived from decreases in air Pb at low air Pb exposures. In a US study of 3 urban neighborhoods which measured 23 trace elements from 24-hour PM₂.₅ particulates in outdoor, indoor and personal samples, Adgate et al. [25] found that personal exposure is likely to be underestimated by outdoor central site monitors. Earlier, Tu and Knutson [26] concluded that a compliance with outdoor air quality standards did not ensure a satisfactory indoor situation.

Previous studies have usually evaluated associations between soil-exterior dust- house dust-paint and indoor air with personal monitors [27,28] but generally not exterior ambient air. Some of the studies evaluating the relationship of urban air to house dust include those of Angle and McIntire [29], Manton et al. [30], Laidlaw et al. [19], Rabinowitz et al. [31]. In this study we evaluated the association, using high precision Pb isotopes, between Pb in air collected from high volume air filters in Australia's largest city, Sydney, and house dust collected by the petri dish method to determine the usefulness of data from the petri dish method for other studies where air Pb data are unavailable. This is a follow-up to earlier papers which focused on Pb isotopic relationships on Sydney air [32,33] or elemental associations in PM₂.₅ particulates [33,34].

Methods

Air filters

Particulates collected on filters ('air filters') were obtained from an ongoing air quality monitoring program carried out by the NSW EPA.

Filters were analyzed from samples collected in Sydney's Central Business District (CBD) and from a nearby suburb (Rozelle), situated about 5 km west of the CBD. Air filters from Rozelle have been analyzed for Pb isotopic ratios monthly from January 1991 till May 1996, and several were also analyzed from 1987 to 1989 (total n=138). Those from the CBD have been analyzed on a monthly basis only from April 1994 with four additional samples from 1992 and 1993 (n=36). To evaluate differences over a wider area, filters from a number of other locations in Sydney were occasionally analyzed.

*Corresponding author: Brian L Gulson, Emeritus Professor, Graduate School of the Environment, Faculty of Science, Macquarie University, Sydney NSW 2109 Australia, Tel: 612-985-079-83; Fax: 612-985-079-72; E-mail: brian.gulson@mq.edu.au

Received October 29, 2014; Accepted November 14, 2014; Published November 17, 2014

Citation: Gulson B, Taylor A (2014) Relationship of Pb in House Dust and Ambient Air. Mod Chem appl 2: 141. doi:10.4172/2329-6798.1000141

Copyright: © 2014 Gulson B, et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Mod Chem appl
ISSN: 2329-6798 MCA, an open access journal

Volume 2 • Issue 4 • 1000141
A High Volume Air Sampler (HVAS) following Australian Standard AS 2724.3-1984 was used. Sampling was carried out continuously for 24 hours on a one-day-in-six cycle. Particles in the approximate size range 0.1 µm to 50 µm were collected. Rozelle samples were collected on a filter which was situated within the HVAS 1.13 m above ground level. The HVAS at Rozelle was located in a parkland setting several hundred meters from a major thoroughfare (>70,000 vehicles per day). The CBD HVAS was located 4m above ground on a street awning.

Preliminary measurements for 4 filters collected within 1 week showed small isotopic variations but which were not statistically significantly different (p 0.08-0.7 in 207Pb/206Pb ratios for 4 different time intervals) so that ongoing sampling was restricted to filters that were collected in the first week of each month.

A smaller number of samples (n=13 each) were measured for PM1.13 Teflon filters over the period 1998 to 2004 for 2 locations in Sydney: one from Mascot, a suburb close to the CBD and a high trafficked area, and the other, a relatively rural (background) setting at Richmond, 20km west of the CBD.

Personal air monitoring for a 24-hour period was undertaken within 12 houses in the inner Sydney suburbs. Although the air samples were collected by different methods and this would affect Pb values, it is not an issue for the Pb isotopic results. The methods for analysis of these filters are detailed in Chiaradia et al. [32], Cohen et al. [34] and Gulson et al. [14].

### House dust

The use and advantages of petri dishes to provide ongoing dust fall accumulation was described in earlier publications [14,16]. The PDD collections were usually for a period of about 3 months. The dishes were placed in at least 3 locations: kitchen, main living area, child’s bedroom. As early analyses showed only small differences between the different locations in a residence, thereafter the solution from each dish was combined for the appropriate time interval. Dust was collected from 56 houses with the number of collections ranging from 1 to 10 resulting in data for 261 dishes.

### Statistical analyses

The analyses were based on 130 air measurements collected between the 5/6/1993 and 23/1/2002 and 261 PDD measurements collected between 23/6/1993 and 18/12/2001. Additional air measurements were available before and after the above periods but these were omitted from analyses so as to maximize the time overlap between the air and PDD samples.

Initial mixed model analyses with each of the Pb isotopic measures as dependent variables included the following independent variables: source (air or PDD), suburb (seven nested under source = PDD and five nested under source = air), season, and time at which the sample was collected, the last coded as fractional number of years since the date the first sample in the analysis subset was collected (5/6/1993). The initial analyses also included a quadratic term for time (time^2) and interactions between source and time and time^2 respectively. The model also included a random factor referred as location which allowed for the correlation between observations obtained at a common collection point (e.g., the living room of a house).

### Results

#### Isotopic compositions

The data sets used in the statistical analyses are presented in Figures 1 to 3 and predicted isotopic results shown in Figures 4 to 6. Outputs of the results from the statistical analyses are given in the supplementary notes.

The dominant trend is a decrease in 208Pb/206Pb and 207Pb/206Pb ratios and a positive increase in 206Pb/204Pb ratios over time which is slightly sharper for air measurements than for PDD measurements. The steady increase in 208Pb/206Pb (or decrease in 207Pb/206Pb and 206Pb/204Pb) over time in both types of samples probably reflects the gradual phasing out of Pb from gasoline and increasing contributions of Pb from natural materials such as soils and industrial materials.
Initial analyses showed that while there was a curvilinear change in the measurements over time for each dependent variable, this did not vary with source, so only the main effect of time² was retained in the models the results of which are reported here. The interaction between linear time and source was significant, however, and was included in later models. Initial analyses also revealed three air observations the standardized residuals for which were near to 5. These data were excluded from subsequent analyses.

The general pattern of results was the same for each dependent variable (Supplementary material, which gives the ANOVA tables and the parameter estimates for the mixed model analyses). Suburb and season were non-significant (although slightly lower values of ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb and ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb were observed for autumn), while the main effect of time² and the interaction between source and time was significant. The proportion of variance of the dependent variables accounted for by all independent variables (calculated according to the method given by Snijders and Bosker, [35]) ranged from 0.53 to 0.59, while the unique variance accounted for by the source by time interaction ranged from 0.031 to 0.049.
The decreasing Pb concentrations over time (p 0.008) reflect the higher Pb contents in summer for the PDD may arise from conditions during this period compared with summer. On the other hand, the higher Pb values in the autumn-winter months are probably related to thermal inversions typical of the cold season or to drier air and mainly caused by coal consumption and fly ash after phasing out of leaded gasoline.

There are very few published isotopic data from Eastern Australia which would be relevant to compare with our analyses. Using a low volume sampler system powered by a diaphragm pump with a collection duration of from 1 to 3 months, Bollhöfer and Rosman [37,38] published data 2 samples in Sydney in March to May 1994 (2000) and 6 samples in 1994-95 and 6 in 1998 from Melbourne (2002). The sets of data from Bollhöfer and Rosman are encouragingly almost identical to our results for the same time periods even though the collection methods and laboratories were completely different [37]. The 1994 Sydney samples had $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{204}\text{Pb}$ ratios of 16.49 and 16.45 whereas those for Melbourne were slightly higher varying from 16.53 to 16.69 and in 1998 ranged from 16.8 to 17.3. Bollhöfer and Rosman [38] suggest that Pb isotopic ratios in Melbourne were slightly more radiogenic (e.g., higher $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{204}\text{Pb}$ ratio) during the summer compared with winter as we observed for summer-autumn but this is not clear from the data presented in their Table 1. Only one sample of gasoline from Western Australia was analyzed to evaluate the relationship between tetra-alkyl Pb and air in contrast to the numerous analyses for Sydney reported by Chiaradia et al. [32]. In the Sydney study, Chiaradia et al. [32] estimated that more than 90% of the Pb in HV air filters was derived from gasoline and gasoline Pb was also the primary source of surface soil and pavement dust.

Monthly sampling over a 15-month period (November 2010-January 2012) of dust deposition gauges placed in the rear yards of 5 houses in Sydney showed higher atmospheric Pb loadings in the summer/autumn with the lowest values in winter [15].

Dust from petri dishes in the houses described here over a 9-year time interval (1993-2002) showed higher Pb loadings in spring and summer compared with winter (Supplementary material). No difference between seasons for Pb loadings was observed by Laidlaw et al. [15], measured using the same petri dish method. In a longitudinal study in Sydney from 2001 to 2006 of 108 houses (1163 analyses) using PDD sampling over 6 monthly intervals, no seasonal effect for Pb loadings was observed [39]. The differences between our results and those of Laidlaw et al. [15] may arise from the different years of sampling and the limited number of 5 houses studied by Laidlaw et al. [15] compared with the 59 houses in our study.

Using vacuum cleaner dust from 82 houses in different Sydney suburbs, Chattopadhyay et al. [40] suggested that while air Pb levels decreased dramatically over decades, Pb concentrations in household dust remain unchanged due to accumulation of Pb from old paints and almost 80 years of leaded gasoline use [41,42].

### Conclusions

The tracking of isotopic data for the air filters and house dust indicates that house dust provides an alternative indicator of exposure especially where air monitoring is not possible. The absence of seasonal or suburban effects on the isotopic data indicates applicability of house dust measurements over a wide area; the Sydney Basin area sampled...
in our study encompasses some 40 by 40 km. PDD is a simple, non-invasive sampling method compared with personal air monitoring and provides an integrated picture of air-dust relationships over say 3-monthly periods. PDD provide isotopic information that can be used in other environmental studies such as monitoring with mosses and lichens and lake sediments.

In trying to evaluate sources of metals in the environment now that Pb has been removed from gasoline in most countries and the important role of leaded paint has been more strongly publicized, it is worth reiterating a comment by Professor Roy Harrison "instead of having a few dominant sources we are now subject to a large number of relatively weak sources and therefore the source signatures become very obscure in the atmospheric signal" [33].

Acknowledgement

We wish to thank: the NSW EPA for allowing access to their air monitoring data and filters; CSIRO, US National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences (NO1-ES-05292), and Macquarie University for partial funding of the research; Karen Mizon, Michael Korsch, Massimo Chiaradia, Matthew James, and Nicole Patterson for analytical support; Bill Jameson and the late Kathy Mahaffey for support and encouragement.

References

1. Buchet JP, Roels H, Lauerwys R, Braux P, Claeyx-Thoreau F, et al. (1980) Repeated surveillance of exposure to cadmium, manganese, and arsenic in school-age children living in rural, urban, and nonferrous smelter areas in Belgium. Environ Res 22: 95-108.
2. Chateney E, Sayre J, Couteur M (1980) Increased lead absorption in inner city children: where does the lead come from? Pediatrics 65: 226-231.
3. Duggan MJ, Insip MJ (1985) Childhood exposure to lead in surface dust and soil: a community health problem. Public Health Rev 13: 1-54.
4. Harrison RM (1979) Toxic metals in street and household dusts. Sci Total Environ 11: 89-97.
5. Lanphear BP, Matte TD, Rogers J, Clickner RP, Dietz B, et al. (1998) The contribution of lead-contaminated house dust and residential soil to children's blood lead levels. A pooled analysis of 12 epidemiologic studies. Environ Res 79: 51-68.
6. Laxen DPH, Lindsay F, Raab GM, Hunter R, Fell GS, et al. (1987) The variability of lead in dusts within homes of young children. Lead in the Home Environment. Thornton, I, Culbard, E. (Editors). Science Reviews Ltd., Northwood, England, pp. 113-125.
7. Mielke HW, LaDialwa MA, Gonzales C (2010) Lead (Pb) legacy from vehicle traffic in eight California urbanized areas: continuing influence of lead dust on children's health. Sci Total Environ 408: 3965-3975.
8. Thornton I, Davies DJ, Watt JM, Quinn MJ (1990) Lead exposure in young children from dust and soil in the United Kingdom. Environ Health Perspect 89: 55-60.
9. Clark S, Bornschein RL, Pan W, Menvrath W, Roda S (1995) An examination of the relationships between the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development floor lead loading clearance level for lead-based paint abatement, surface dust lead by a vacuum collection method and pediatric blood lead. Appl Occup Environ Hyg 10: 107-110.
10. Farfel MR, Lees PS, Rohde CA, Lim BS, Bannon D, et al. (1994) Comparison of a wipe and a vacuum collection method for the determination of lead in residential dusts. Environ Res 65: 291-301.
11. United States Environmental Protection Agency (2013) Office of Research and Development National Center for Environmental Assessment – RTP Division. Integrated Science Assessment for Lead. EPA/600/R-10/075F. Research Triangle Park, NC.
12. van Alphen M (1999) Atmospheric heavy metal deposition plumes adjacent to a primary lead-zinc smelter. Sci Total Environ 236: 119-134.
13. Bornschein RL, Succop P, Dietrich KN, Clark CS, Que Hee S, et al. (1985) The influence of social and environmental factors on dust lead, hand lead, and blood lead levels in young children. Environ Res 38: 108-118.
14. Gulson BL, Davis JJ, Mizon KJ, Korsch MJ, Bawden-Smith J (1995) Sources of soil and dust and the use of dust fallout as a sampling medium. Science Total Environ 166: 245-262.
15. Gulson B (2014) Comments on: Identification of lead sources in residential environments: Sydney Australia. By Laidlaw MAS, Zahran S, Pintigote N, Clague J, Devin G, Taylor MP, 2013. Environmental Pollution 184, 238-246. Environ Pollut 185: 372-373.
16. Wlodarczyk J, Jardin K, Robertson R, Aldrich R, Toneguzi R, et al. (1997) Measuring the amount of lead in indoor dust: long-term dust accumulation in petri dishes (a pilot study). NSW Public Health Bulletin 8: 92-93.
17. Laidlaw MAS, Filippelli GM (2008) Resuspension of urban soils as a persistent source of lead poisoning in children: a review and new directions. Appl Geochem 23: 2021-2039.
18. Laidlaw MAS, Zahran S, Mietie R, Taylor MP, Filippelli GM (2012) Resuspension of lead contaminated urban soil as a dominant source of atmospheric lead in Birmingham, Chicago, Detroit and Pittsburgh, USA. Atmos Environ 49: 302-310.
19. Zahran S, Laidlaw MA, McElmurry SP, Filippelli GM, Taylor M (2013) Linking source and effect: resuspended soil lead, air lead, and children's blood lead levels in Detroit, Michigan. Environ Sci Technol 47: 2839-2845.
20. Thomas VM, Socolow RH, Fanelli J, Spiro TG (1999) Effects of reducing lead in gasoline: An analysis of the international Experience. Environ Sci Technol 33: 3942-3948.
21. Cohen DD, Martin JW, Bailey GM, Crisp PT, Bryant E, et al. (1994) A twelve-month survey of lead in fine airborne particles in the major population areas of New South Wales. Clean Air 28: 79-88.
22. Australian Nuclear Science and Technology Organisation (ANSTO) (2013) Fine particle pollution: coastal NSW.
23. Brink LL, Talbott EO, Sharma RK, Marsh GM, Wu WC, et al. (2013) Do US ambient air lead levels have a significant impact on childhood blood lead levels: results of a national study. J Environ Public Health 2013: 278042.
24. Richmond-Bryant J, Menq G, Davis A, Cohen J, Lu SE, et al. (2014) The influence of declining air lead levels on blood lead-air lead slope factors in children. Environ Health Perspect 122: 754-760.
25. Adgate JL, Morgin SJ, Pratt GC, Zhang J. Field MP, et al. (2007) Relationships between personal, indoor, and outdoor exposures to trace elements in PM2.5. Sci Total Environ 386: 21-32.
26. Tu KW, Knutsen EO (1988) Indoor outdoor aerosol measurement for two residential buildings in New Jersey. Aerosol Science and Technology 9: 71-82.
27. Davies DJ, Thornton I, Watt JM, Culbard EB, Harvey PG, et al. (1990) Lead intake and blood lead in two-year-old U.K. urban children. Sci Total Environ 90: 13-29.
28. Succop P, Bornschein R, Brown K, Tseng CY (1998) An empirical comparison of lead exposure pathway models. Sci Total Environ 106 Suppl 6: 1577-1583.
29. Angle CR, Mcintyre MS (1979) Environmental lead and children: the Omaha study. J Toxicol Environ Health 5: 855-870.
30. Manton WJ, Angle CR, Krogstrand KL (2005) Origin of lead in the United States diet. Environ Sci Technol 39: 8995-9000.
31. Rabinowitz M, Leviton A, Bellinger D (1985) Home refinishing, lead paint, and infant blood lead levels. Am J Public Health 75: 403-404.
32. Chiaradia M, Gulson BL, James M, Jameson CW, Johnson D (1995) Identification of secondary lead sources in the air of an urban environment. Atmos Environ 39: 3511-3521.
33. Gulson B, Korsch M, Dickson B, Cohen D, Mizon K, et al. (2007) Comparison of lead isotopes with source apportionment models, including SOM, for air particulates. Sci Total Environ 381: 169-179.
34. Cohen DD, Gulson BL, Davies DJ, Stelcer E, Barton D, et al. (2005) Fine-particle Mn and other metals linked to the introduction of MMT into gasoline in Sydney, Australia: Results of a natural experiment. Atmos Environ 39: 6885-6896.
35. Snijders T, Bosker R (2012) Multilevel Analysis: An Introduction to Basic and Advanced Multilevel Modeling. London, Sage Publishers.
36. Liang F, Zhang G, Tan M, Yan C, Li X, et al. (2010) Lead in children's blood is mainly caused by coal-fired ash after phasing out of leaded gasoline in Shanghai. Environ Sci Technol 44: 4760-4765.
37. Bolthöfer A, Rosman KJR (2000) Isotopic source signatures for atmospheric lead: the Southern Hemisphere. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 64: 3251-3262.

Citation: Gulson B, Taylor A (2014) Relationship of Pb in House Dust and Ambient Air. Mod Chem appl 2: 141. doi:10.4172/2329-6798.1000141
38. Bollhöfer A, Rosman KJR (2002) The temporal stability of lead isotopic signatures at selected sites in the Southern and Northern Hemispheres. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 66: 1375-1386.

39. Gulson B, Mizon K, Taylor A, Korsch M, Davis JM, et al. (2014) Pathways of Pb and Mn observed in a 5-year longitudinal investigation in young children and environmental measures from an urban setting. Environ Poll 191: 38-49.

40. Chattopadhyay G, Lin KC, Feitz AJ (2003) Household dust metal levels in the Sydney metropolitan area. Environ Res 93: 301-307.

41. Clark CS, Bornschein R, Succop P, Roda S, Peace B (1991) Urban lead exposures of children in Cincinnati, Ohio. Chem. Speciation Bioavailability 3: 163-171.

42. Harney J, Trunov M, Grinshpun S, Willeke K, Choe K, et al. (2000) Release of lead-containing particles from a wall enclosure. AIHAJ 61: 743-752.