Comparing coverage of policy citations to scientific publications in Overton and Altmetric.com: Case study of Finnish research organizations in Social Science

Ashraf Maleki
University of Turku
ashraf.maleki@utu.fi
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8223-4833

Kim Holmberg
University of Turku
kim.j.holmberg@utu.fi
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4185-9298

Keywords: science policy, societal policy, cultural policy, research policy impact, Finland, Finnish research institutes, research impact

Implementation of academic publications in policy documents is considered as evidence of cultural and societal impact of science. This research compared the policy coverage of 18,996 Scopus publications authored by researchers affiliated to 18 Finnish universities and institutes in eight Social Science fields. Two sources of policy citations, namely Overton and Altmetric.com, are checked and compared for coverage and overlap. The overall results suggest that on average about 39% of publications were cited in Overton and 9% in Altmetric.com. There was on average about 5% overall overlap in the coverage of documents between the two sources. The proportion of unique policy citations in Overton (19%) were significantly higher than in Altmetric.com (0.6%). Finnish universities can get a more reliable report on the extent their publications have been cited by policy documents through combining the results from Overton and Altmetric.com. However, they can trust Overton for significantly better coverage of national Finnish and Swedish language policy documents.

How to cite: Maleki, A., & Holmberg, K. (2022). Comparing coverage of policy citations to scientific publications in Overton and Altmetric.com: Case study of Finnish research organizations in Social Science. Informaatietutkimus, 41(2–3), 92–96. https://doi.org/10.23978/inf.122592

This article is licensed under the terms of the CC BY-NC-SA 4.0 -license
Introduction

Some sources for tracking policy citations to academic publications have been developed in recent years. Altmetric.com have been the primary service to identify and collect policy citations to scientific publications, along with a number of other online sources. Overton, however, is a more recent service that is tracking only policy citations and is building a much broader coverage. Overton also tracks the reverse citations from scholarly publications to policy documents and policy-to-policy citations (Szomszor & Adie, 2022). Dimensions of Digital Science also includes policy citations along with the full-text of policy documents, but it only offers policy documents in English language from Altmetric.com. Altmetric.com and Overton are consequently the platforms with systematic tracking of policy citation sources that are being investigated in current research. This research will compare the coverage of and overlap between Altmetric.com and Overton policy citations.

Method

A total of 18,996 Scopus publications of all document types for 18 most prolific Finnish universities and institutes were selected in 8 social science fields based on the highly policy cited fields reported in Szomszor and Adie (2022). The DOIs of these publications were searched for on Altmetric.com explorer and Overton policy citations. For publications with both Altmetric.com and Overton citations, a webometric analysis of the URL was conducted to identify unique and shared policy citation sources at domain level of the URLs across the databases and then a manual checking of the shared URL domains was done to identify whether they refer to the same policy source, despite URL differences.

Findings

A total of 9,665 policy citations from Overton (8544, 88%) and Altmetric.com (1121, 12%) for a total of 10,751 publications were found. Of all publications in the study 4,202 (39.1%) and 984 (9.2%) publications showed at least one citation in Overton and Altmetric.com, respectively (Table 3).
Comparison of Policy citations in Overton and Altmetric.com

The policy citations to the scientific publications across chosen subject fields vary from 14% (vs. 3%) in Education to 31% (vs. 8%) in Development on Overton (vs. Altmetric). Tampere University showed policy uptake of between 15.1% (vs. 2.6%) in Education to 27% (vs. 8.7%) in Law.

Publications with overlapping policy citation across databases

University of Helsinki has the most publications with policy citations in both sources (4%, 226/2,045 publications). The overlap in policy documents in the data sources vary, as between 17% to 100% of policy citations in Overton could be found in Altmetric.com in institution-field level.

Table 3: Comparison of overlapping and unique policy citations in Overton and Altmetric.com across top institutes authoring with/along with Finnish affiliations - empty cells are not examined.

| Universities                                    | Count of Scopus publications | Count of publications with DOI | Count (%) with Overton Policy Citations | Count (%) with Altmetric.com Policy Citations | Documents with Policy citations in both sources | Unique publications with Altmetric.com policy citations | Unique publications with Overton policy citations |
|------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| Aalto University                               | 1161                        | 985                            | 224(23%)                               | 69(7%)                                     | 65/7%                                         | 0.4%                                          | 16%                                           |
| Abo Akademi University                        |                             |                                |                                        |                                            |                                               |                                                |                                                |
| Finnish Environment Institute                 | 260                         | 255                            | 149(58%)                               | 40(16%)                                    | 38(15%)                                       | 0.8%                                          | 44%                                           |
| Helsingin Yliopisto                            | 5421                        | 5045                           | 1,100(22%)                             | 253(5%)                                    | 226(4%)                                       | 0.5%                                          | 17%                                           |
| Helsinki University Hospital                  | 60                          | 60                             | 16(27%)                                | 3(5%)                                      | 2(3%)                                         | 1.7%                                          | 23%                                           |
| Itä-Suomen Yliopisto                          | 1830                        | 1654                           | 395(24%)                               | 109(7%)                                    | 102(6%)                                       | 0.4%                                          | 18%                                           |
| Kriminologian ja Oikeuspolitiikan Instituitti | 55                          | 54                             | 34(43%)                                | 7(13%)                                     | 5(9%)                                         | 3.7%                                          | 33%                                           |
| Lapin Yliopisto                                | 584                         | 517                            | 130(25%)                               | 22(4%)                                     | 20(4%)                                        | 0.4%                                          | 21%                                           |
| LUT University                                 | 330                         | 295                            | 36(12%)                                | 6(2%)                                      | 4(1%)                                         | 0.7%                                          | 11%                                           |
| National Institute for Health and Welfare     | 222                         | 222                            | 104(47%)                               | 32(14%)                                    | 30(14%)                                       | 0.9%                                          | 33%                                           |
| Natural Resources Institute Finland Luke       | 377                         | 369                            | 244(66%)                               | 53(14%)                                    | 52(14%)                                       | 0.3%                                          | 52%                                           |
Policy sources

When examining the top level domains, there were 625 unique policy sources in both databases combined. Fifty six URL sources for policy citations were tracked by both Overton and Altmetric.com. However, Overton had identified citations from 566 unique sources and Altmetric.com from only 30. Tables 1 and 2 indicate top ten domains with the highest coverage of the publications in the dataset. Table 1 shows that Overton has identified more policy citations from websites with a Finnish country-level domain and most of them are either not covered or only partially covered in the Altmetric.com database.

Table 1: Top ten policy source URL domains in Overton.

| URL Domains                                                       | Altmetric.com | Overton | Total |
|------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|---------|-------|
| julkaisut.valtioneuvosto.fi                                     | 5             | 914     | 919   |
| op.europa.eu                                                     | 163           | 663     | 826   |
| julkari.fi                                                       | 376           | 376     | 376   |
| dx.doi.org                                                       | 336           | 336     | 336   |
| jukuri.luke.fi                                                   | 276           | 276     | 276   |
| openknowledge.worldbank.org                                     | 32            | 209     | 241   |
| apo.org.au                                                      | 199           | 199     | 199   |
| ipbes.net                                                       | 174           | 174     | 174   |
| zenodo.org                                                      | 172           | 172     | 172   |
| unesdoc.unesco.org                                               | 3             | 167     | 170   |
Table 2: Top ten policy source URL domains in Altmetric.com.

| URL Domains        | Altmetric.com | Overton | Total |
|--------------------|---------------|---------|-------|
| op.europa.eu        | 163           | 663     | 826   |
| fao.org            | 163           | 148     | 311   |
| apps.who.int       | 114           | 123     | 237   |
| regjeringen.no     | 42            | 26      | 68    |
| publications.europa.eu | 40     | 37      | 77    |
| openknowledge.worldbank.org | 32 | 209 | 241 |
| oecd-ilibrary.org  | 26            | 26      | 52    |
| rijksoverheid.nl   | 25            | 34      | 59    |
| forskningsradet.no | 25            | 25      | 50    |
| africaportal.org   | 24            | 2       | 26    |

Discussion and Conclusion

This study investigated how Altmetric.com and Overton cover and which sources they used to identify policy citations to Scopus-indexed publications with at least one author affiliated to a Finnish research organization in selected fields in Social Sciences. Results show that despite the larger coverage of policy citations in Overton at institution and field level, Altmetric.com has a tiny but unique proportion of both documents cited and of policy citations that are not covered by Overton. In sum, the results indicated that combining results from both sources can provide the best reflection of policy citations, however, to get a national-account of policy implementations Overton outperforms Altmetric.com and provides a more promising citation coverage.

References

Szomszor, M., & Adie, E. (2022). Overton - A bibliometric database of policy document citations. *arXiv preprint*, arXiv:2201.07643. [https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2201.07643](https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2201.07643)