Editorial: Endothelial cells as innate immune cells

Yifan Lu1†, Yu Sun1†, Keman Xu1, Ying Shao2, Fatma Saaoud1, Nathaniel W. Snyder2, Ling Yang1†, Jun Yu2, Sheng Wu2, Wenhui Hu2, Jianxin Sun4, Hong Wang2 and Xiaofeng Yang1,2*

1Centers of Cardiovascular Research, Temple University Lewis Katz School of Medicine, Philadelphia, PA, United States, 2Metabolic Disease Research and Thrombosis Research Center, Department of Cardiovascular Sciences, Temple University Lewis Katz School of Medicine, Philadelphia, PA, United States, 3Department of Medical Genetics and Molecular Biochemistry, Temple University Lewis Katz School of Medicine, Philadelphia, PA, United States, 4Center for Translational Medicine, Department of Medicine, Sigmund Medical College, Thomas Jefferson University, Philadelphia, PA, United States

KEYWORDS
endothelial cells as immune cells, aorta as immune organ, secretome, vascular inflammation, trained immunity

Introduction

With the great effort and support from the authors and editorial team, our Research Topic entitled “Endothelial cells as innate immune cells” in Frontiers in Immunology, Molecular Innate Immunity Section has achieved a great success and have attracted so far 6,775 views and numerous submissions. Endothelial cells are the innermost cell type lined along vessels in all the organs and tissues through hosts, indicating their anatomic and physiological roles in regulating vascular tone, preventing blood components from leaking and maintaining vascular functions (1). The traditional concept emphasized that innate immune cells are non-T cells and non-B cells, which migrate from blood circulation to inflammatory/injury/tumor sites. Our new concept states that immune responses and inflammation and tumorigenesis are highly coordinated processes. Regardless of migration and structural cell types, any cell types can be defined as innate immune cells, which are capable in autonomously sensing danger/pathogen associated molecular patterns (DAMPs/PAMPs) and providing signaling supports to these processes via cell membrane proteins (for example, clusters of differentiation, CDs) and secretomes/cytokines/chemokines/growth factors (2, 3). The pathological roles of endothelial cells in participating in various inflammations and immune responses were reported (3). However, immunological characters of endothelial cells have been poorly characterized due to the fact that endothelial cells have not been recognized as innate immune cells in the field. To fill in this significant knowledge gap, ten years ago based on
more than ten major innate immune functional aspects that are shared by the prototypic innate immune cell type - macrophages and endothelial cells, we proposed a new concept that endothelial cells are innate immune cells (2, 4), which was further supported by our experimental data (5–13) analyses (Shao et al., 15). The Molecular Innate Immunity field is continuously evolving, and we greatly appreciate the Molecular Innate Immunity section editors gave us this opportunity to organize this Research Topic and work with other investigators to explore this important topic further. Here, we are excited to see nearly five publications collected in our topic since 2021 (Table 1).

Trained immunity is a novel mechanism for persistent hyperactivation and synergies between DAMPs/PAMPs

One of the significant progresses in the innate immunity field is the identification of innate immune memory or trained immunity (15–18). Ever since investigators found memory adaptive immune cells such as memory T cells and memory B cells, we have always been puzzled by two questions whether innate immune cells such as memory T cells and memory B cells, we have always been puzzled by two questions whether innate immune cells have memory functional status for challenged stimuli and whether innate immune cells have memory cell subtypes similar to that of adaptive immune cells. In response to danger/pathogen associated molecular patterns (DAMPs/PAMPs) and conditional DAMPs (19) derived from injury, lipid peroxidation (15), chronic kidney disease-related uremic toxins stimulation (20–22), hyperlipidemia, hyperglycemia (23), hyperhomocysteinemia (24–26), metabolic syndrome, hypertonse, cigarette smoke, bacterial infections, and virus infections, inflammations take place in vasculature (27). However, two significant questions remain whether vascular innate immune cell types including endothelial cells and vascular smooth muscle cells (VSMCs) have any innate immune memory function to remember risk factor challenges; and whether innate immune cells response differently to the second stimulation after exposed to the first stimulation. Benefit from immunological, metabolic and epigenetic research progresses, new innate immune memory function or trained immunity has been identified. The inflammatory microenvironment and DAMPs/PAMPs can keep aortic endothelial cells, VSMCs, monocytes, macrophages and other innate immune cells persistent hyperactivation and will develop exacerbated immunologic response to the second stimulation (trained immunity) (16, 28, Zhong et al.). For current understanding, trained immunity (15, 16, Zhong et al.) is formed via metabolic reprogramming (29) and epigenetic memory (10, 30, 31). All the cell types in aorta participate in this process including but not limited to endothelial cells, VSMCs (21, 32), monocytes, macrophages, neutrophils, T cells, CD4+ regulatory T cells (Treg) (33–37) (Ni et al.; Shao et al.; Xu et al., Zhang et al.) and B cells. In this editorial we will discuss the most recent research and novel insight in endothelial cells (Shao et al.), macrophages (Barhoumi et al.; Dominguez et al.; Dai et al.; Li et al.; Zhang et al.) and neutrophil (Domer et al.; Perez-Figueroa et al.; Rydzynska et al.), which may contribute to the formation of trained immunity in aorta.

It has been reported that endothelial cell is an innate immune cell and can upregulated three major metabolic pathways including glycolysis pathway, mevalonate pathway and acetyl-Co-A synthesis to build immunologic memory by stimulations of various DAMPs/PAMPs such as lysophosphatidylcholine (LPC) (17). Shao et al. paper further reported that the expressions of 1311 innate immune regulators are modulated in 21 human endothelial cell transcriptomic datasets by various DAMPs/PAMPs including Middle East Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus (COVID-19 homologous virus), lipopolysaccharide (LPS), LPC, shear stress, hyperlipidemia and oxidized low-density lipoprotein (oxLDL) (Shao et al.). In addition, another major cell type in the aortic wall, VSMCs can also undergo metabolic reprogramming to build this immunologic memory by oxidized low-density lipoprotein (oxLDL) stimulation (Schnack et al.). Last but not least, it was a well-documented concept that monocytes and macrophages as prototypic innate immune cell types can establish trained immunity (38). Recent

| Cell type/mouse model | Stimulation/condition | Finding | Reference |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|---------|-----------|
| Endothelial cell      | PAMPs/DAMPs           | Endothelial cells and VSMCs have novel trained immunity via 6 types of secretomes | PMID: 35320849 |
| Endothelial cell      | ox-LDL,TNFα, IL1b     | PHACTRI mediates endothelial inflammation | PMID: 35865527 |
| Endothelial cell      | LPS, Ang II, virus    | Uregulated RIG-I pathway mediates endothelial cell inflammatory response | PMID: 35619719 |
| Endothelial cell      | PAMPs/DAMPs           | Endothelial cells should be considered macrophage-like gatekeepers | PMID: 35837388 |
| Endothelial cell      | SARS-CoV-2            | Endothelial activation associated with COVID-19 is likely a result of inflammatory responses initiated by other cells | PMID: 35320849 |

TABLE 1 Summary for 5 highlighted studies in Frontiers in Immunology: 2022.
studies further confirmed that the macrophages can be polarized into pro-inflammatory macrophages (M1), anti-inflammatory macrophages (M2), tumor-associated macrophages, adipose tissue macrophages and many other macrophage subsets (Lai et al.) in different conditions (Zhang et al.). The LPS/interferon-γ or SARS-CoV-2 Coronavirus spike protein treatment can push pro-inflammatory macrophage (M1) formation and upregulate ATP-citrate lyase (ACLY), which is the key enzymes catalyzing metabolic reprogramming. The M1 macrophages then switch their metabolism from oxidative phosphorylation (OXPHOS) to glycolysis (Barhoumi et al.; Dominguez et al.). Finally, in a recent paper found after transcriptomic and epigenetic rewiring of granulopoiesis, the trained granulopoiesis promotes an anti-tumor immune phenotype in neutrophils (39). In the inflammatory conditions, the secretion of neutrophil extracellular traps can further stimulate neutrophils to amplify inflammatory response (Domer et al.; Perez-Figueroa et al.). All the evidences indicate that aorta can build the immunologic memory and amplify the immunologic responses in pathological conditions.

A new concept: Aorta may serve as an immune organ in pathologies

Because of the ability to provide a niche for immune cell maturation, differentiation, and activation, lymph nodes and spleen were defined as a peripheral immune organ (40). Current understanding in this field indicated that the aorta may have similar abilities to provide a microenvironment/niche for endothelial cell phenotype switch to mesenchymal cells (4, 16, 41), vascular smooth muscle cells (VSMCs) phenotype switch to macrophages (21, 42) and other five different plastic cell types (43), monocyte differentiation (26, 44, 45), macrophage differentiation (Zhang et al.; 46, 47), neutrophil activation (Domer et al.) as well as T cell and B cell differentiation (44, 48, 49). Based on the principle the same as immunologists previously defined lymph nodes and spleen as immune organs, in terms of function, the aorta can serve as an immune organ in pathological conditions. However, the key knowledge gaps are a) how immune cell differentiation, trans-differentiation, activation take place in aorta and what are the molecular mechanisms underlying the processes. A recent paper found the secretomes (18, 50) (Ni et al.) in aorta play a significant role in providing the microenvironment for immune cell maturation, differentiation and activation. In this paper, author found that approximately 53.7% out of 21,306 human protein-encoding genes are classified into six secretomes including canonical secretome (secretory proteins with signal peptide), caspase 1-GSDMD secretome, caspase 4-GSDMD secretome, exosome secretomes, Weibel–Palade bodies, and autophagy secretome. Those six types of secretomes were significantly modulated in the aorta of pathological condition, including aorta in atherosclerosis, chronic kidney disease, abdominal aortic aneurysm or endothelial cell treated with Middle East Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus, vascular smooth muscle cell treated with Angiotensin II (Lu et al.). This finding not only filled the knowledge gap by providing us a novel insight that aorta may serve as an immune organ and regulate the immunological response via six types of secretomes in pathological conditions, but also raise the potential targets for future therapeutic interventions for inflammation, cardiovascular disease and autoimmune disease.

In this editorial, we summarized five significant papers (Ellen et al.; Lu et al.; Stolarz et al.; Xu et al.) published on our Research Topic in Frontiers in Immunology, Molecular Innate Immunity Section to illustrate the most recent understanding on molecular innate immunity.

Author contributions

YL and YuS carried out literature collections, research analyses, and drafted the manuscript, KK, YSi, FS, NS, LY, JY, SW, WH, JS, and HW provided editing input. XY supervised and edited the manuscript. All authors listed have made a substantial, direct, and intellectual contribution to the work and approved it for publication.

Funding

This work was supported by the National Institutes of Health Grants to XY (HL132399-01A1; HL138749-01; and HL147565-01), HW (DK104116; DK113775; and HL131460)

Conflict of interest

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Publisher’s note

All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.
induce innate immune transdifferentiation of endothelial cells, resulting in a memory signature in endothelial cells. Mitochondrial ROS-mediated innate immune activation, but spare innate immune cytokines IL-35 and IL-10 block atherogenic lysophosphatidylcholine-induced, endothelial cell activation.

Mitochondrial reactive oxygen species mediate lysophosphatidylcholine-induced endothelial cell activation. Front Biosci (Landmark Ed) (2015) 20:345–62. doi:10.2741/1035282

Lu et al. 10.3389/fimmu.2021.103497

11. Li X, Fang P, Li Y, Kuo Y-M, Andrews AJ, Nanayakkara G, et al. Mitochondrial reactive oxygen species mediate lysophosphatidylcholine-induced endothelial cell activation. Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol (2014) 36(6):1090–100. doi:10.1161/ATVBAHA.113.306964

12. Li X, Shao Y, Sha X, Fang P, Kuo Y-M, Andrews AJ, et al. IL-35 (Interleukin-35) suppresses endothelial cell activation by inhibiting mitochondrial reactive oxygen species-mediated site-specific acetylation of H3K14 (Histone 3 lysine 14). Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol (2018) 38(3):599–609. doi:10.1161/ATVBAHA.117.310626

13. Li X, Fang P, Sun Y, Shao Y, Yang WY, Jiang X, et al. Anti-inflammatory cytokines IL-35 and IL-10 block atherogenic lysophosphatidylcholine-induced, mitochondrial ROS-mediated innate immune activation, but spare innate immune memory signature in endothelial cells. Redox Biol (2020) 28:101373. doi:10.1016/j.redox.2019.101373

14. Li X, Wang L, Fang P, Sun Y, Jiang X, Wang H, et al. Lysophosphatidylcholine induce innate immune transdifferentiation of endothelial cells, resulting in prolonged endothelial activation. J Biol Chem (2018) 293(28):11033–45. doi:10.1074/jbc.RA117.802752

15. Liu M, Wu N, Xu K, Saoud F, Vasiliopoulos E, Shao Y, et al. Organelle crosstalk regulators are regulated in diseases, tumors, and regulatory T cells: Novel classification of organelle crosstalk regulators. Front Cardiovasc Med (2021) 8:713170. doi:10.3389/fcvm.2021.713170

16. Shen H, Wu N, Nanayakkara G, Fu H, Yang Q, et al. Co-Signaling receptors regulate T-cell plasticity and immune tolerance. Front Biosci (Landmark Ed) (2019) 24:94–136. doi:10.2741/4710

17. Drummer Crh, Saoud F, Sun Y, Atar D, Xu K, Lu Y, et al. Hyperlipidemia may synergize with hypomethylation in establishing trained immunity and promoting inflammation in NAS and NAFLD. J Immunol Res (2021) 2021:392823. doi:10.1155/2021/392823

18. Drummer CT, Saoud F, Shao Y, Sun Y, Xu K, Lu Y, et al. Trained immunity and reactivity of macrophages and endothelial cells. Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol (2021) 41(3):1032–46. doi:10.1161/ATVBAHA.120.315452

19. Lu Y, Sun Y, Drummer C, Nanayakkara GK, Shao Y, Saoud F, et al. Increased acetylation of H3K14 in the genomic regions that encode trained immunity enzymes in trained immunity-conditional innate immune cells. J Immunol (2021) 24:101221. doi:10.1161/101221

20. Fagenston AM, Xu K, Saoud F, Nanayakkara G, Jhala NC, Lin L, et al. Liver ischemia reperfusion injury, enhanced by trained immunity, is attenuated in caspase 1/Caspase 11 double gene knockout mice. Pathogens (2020) 9(11):879. doi:10.3390/pathogens91100879

21. Wang X, Li YF, Nanayakkara G, Shao Y, Liang B, Cole L, et al. Lysophosphatidylcholine, as novel conditional danger mediators, induce epigenetic changes in endothelial cells. J Immunol (2017) 198(6):2702–12. doi:10.4049/jimmunol.1601908
39. Kalafati L, Kourtzelis I, Schulte-Schrepping J, Li X, Hatzioannou A, Grinenko T, et al. Innate immune training of granulopoiesis promotes anti-tumor activity. *Cell* (2020) 183(3):771–785 e12. doi: 10.1016/j.cell.2020.09.058

40. Grasso C, Pierie C, Mebius RE, Baarsen van LGM. Lymph node stromal cells: subsets and functions in health and disease. *Trends Immunol* (2021) 42 (10):920–36. doi: 10.1016/j.it.2021.08.009

41. Evrard SM, Lecce L, Michelis KC, Nomura-Kitabayashi A, Pandey G, Purushothaman K-R, et al. Endothelial to mesenchymal transition is common in atherosclerotic lesions and is associated with plaque instability. *Nat Commun* (2016) 7:11853. doi: 10.1038/ncomms11853

42. Shankman LS, Gomez D, Cherepanova OA, Salmon M, Alencar GF, Haskins RM, et al. KLF4-dependent phenotypic modulation of smooth muscle cells has a key role in atherosclerotic plaque pathogenesis. *Nat Med* (2015) 21 (6):628–37. doi: 10.1038/nm.3866

43. Yap C, Mieremet A, Vries CJM, Michu D, Waard V, et al. Six shades of vascular smooth muscle cells illuminated by KLF4 (Kruppel-like factor 4). *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol* (2021) 41(11):2693–707. doi: 10.1161/ATVBAHA.121.316600

44. Winkels H, Ehinger E, Vassallo M, Buscher K, Dinh HQ, Kobiyama K, et al. Atlas of the immune cell repertoire in mouse atherosclerosis defined by single-cell RNA-sequencing and mass cytometry. *Circ Res* (2018) 122(12):1675–88. doi: 10.1161/CIRCRESAHA.117.312513

45. Fang P, Li X, Dai J, Cole L, Camacho JA, Zhang Y, et al. Immune cell subset differentiation and tissue inflammation. *J Hematol Oncol* (2018) 11(1):97. doi: 10.1186/s13045-018-0637-x

46. Goldstein JL, Ho YK, Basu SK, Brown MS. Binding site on macrophages that mediates uptake and degradation of acetylated low density lipoprotein, producing massive cholesterol deposition. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U.S.A.* (1979) 76(1):333–7. doi: 10.1073/pnas.76.1.333

47. Gistera A, Hansson GK. The immunology of atherosclerosis. *Nat Rev Nephrol* (2017) 13(6):368–80. doi: 10.1038/nrneph.2017.51

48. Butcher MJ, Filipowicz AR, Waseem TC, McGary CM, Crow KJ, Magilnick N, et al. Atherosclerosis-driven Treg plasticity results in formation of a dysfunctional subset of plastic IFNgamma+ Th1/Threg. *Circ Res* (2016) 119 (11):1190–203. doi: 10.1161/CIRCRESAHA.116.309764

49. Stemme S, Faber B, Holm J, Wiklund O, Witztum JL, Hansson GK, et al. T lymphocytes from human atherosclerotic plaques recognize oxidized low density lipoprotein. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U.S.A.* (1995) 92(9):3893–7. doi: 10.1073/pnas.92.9.3893

50. Zhang R, Saredy J, Shao Y, Yao T, Liu L, Saaoud F, et al. End-stage renal disease is different from chronic kidney disease in upregulating ROS-modulated proinflammatory secretome in PBMCs - a novel multiple-hit model for disease progression. *Redox Biol* (2020) 34:101460. doi: 10.1016/j.redox.2020.101460