Influence of Usage Alteration to the Spatial Occupancy of Urban Areas
Case Study: Street Vendors on A. P. Pettarani Street
Tamalate Sub-District, Makassar, Indonesia

Andi Lolo Sinrang AP*, Yichen Liu** and Junichiro Asano***

Abstract

One of the problems faced by Makassar city is that of street vendors who have become an informal commercial sector within the city. Street vendors are often considered as a cause of traffic congestion, decreased urban aesthetics, and as sidewalk occupations because of their location, physical appearance, and activity. This paper aims to examine the influence of their space utilization and explain the causes and effects of street vendors occupying public space on the sidewalk and roadside with a case study of Andi Pangeran Pettarani Street, Makassar. Their problem basically arises due to the absence of reference spatial products that specifically determine suitable locations for the activities of street vendors in urban areas. Space utilization, not based on location characteristics, leads to conflict, and is consequently regarded as an 'element out of place'.

The results of this study revealed several interesting findings. The study found that street vendors occupied sidewalks and roadsides to form business facilities which is an alternative to conventional job creation and a source of livelihood to the urban poor. Despite this, urban authorities still consider street vendors activity as an illegal and unproductive activity. By revealing the cause of street vendors occupying public space, recommendations are obtained as inputs that can be considered with government support, for the arrangement of street vendors with respect to their physical condition and location. In general, this study presents a strategy for creating a better space where street vendors can work without disturbing the surrounding space.

Keywords: Street vendors, occupancy, space utilization, public space

1. Introduction and aims of the study.

Dualistic is a condition that not only describes the physical appearance of a city, but also on the socio-cultural aspects of its society; the occurrence of two different conditions or traits (Sujarto, 1981). Like other major cities in Indonesia, Makassar city, the capital of South Sulawesi Indonesia, is also experiencing problems with dualistic conditions, for example the formal and informal sectors. Particularly around office buildings, education and residential residences, one

* Doctoral Student, Department of Architecture and Civil Engineering, Toyohashi University of Technology, Japan
** Assistant Professor, Department of Architecture and Civil Engineering, Toyohashi University of Technology, Japan
*** Professor, Department of Architecture and Civil Engineering, Toyohashi University of Technology, Japan
Email: andilolosinrang@gmail.com

(c) 2019 City Planning Institute of Japan
http://dx.doi.org/10.14398/urpr.6.64
of the problems that often arises in the dualistic conditions of informal activity is in the trade sector, where various types of street vending activity develop spontaneously and are generally unplanned.

The issue of street vendors raised in this study is focused on the public space occupation of sidewalks and roadsides by street vendors. The existence of street vendors can support formal activities at the site, but in fact, they tend to be marginalized both in terms of location and space, as well as their regulation / legal arrangement. To date, there has been no effort to anticipate and provide space for the location of street vendors. The available city spaces only focus on formal activities and functions and this condition causes street vendors to occupy places that are not provisioned for them, such as occupying a public space for their business activities. The occupation of public space generates positive and negative impacts on social dynamics in urban areas. As a positive impact, the existence of street vendors provides convenience to the community in obtaining low-cost goods and services in accordance with economic conditions. While for the negative side of public space occupied by street vendors, such action is a violation of public space users, and also street vendors are considered illegal if they determine their own business location, without first obtaining permission from the City Government in accordance with Regulation no. 10 in 1990, Mayor's Decree No. 20 of 2004 (Muchlas, 2016) and Decree of the Minister of Transportation no: KM 65 in 1993 on Supporting Facilities of Traffic and Road Transport activities also affirms in Art. 1 par. 7, that the sidewalks are specially designated for pedestrians (SK Menteri Perhubungan, 1993). Sidewalks and roads are regulated public spaces to facilitate walking and vehicle movement for everyone in the city, consequently, conflict occurs between street vendors and the Municipal Government.

The purpose of this study is to describe and explain the causes of the usage alteration of public spaces by street vendors trade on sidewalks and roadsides, whilst another objective of this study is to discuss the characteristics of trading patterns by street vendors in determining the place of business. The problem of street vendors is one of the priority issues in urban areas. Reasons for the presence of street vendors are various, which triggers conflict between street vendors and users of the sidewalk, as well as negatively affecting urban aesthetics. The handling of the street vendors problem in urban areas can still be said to be not aspirational and has not changed from the long established strategy since it is merely evictions for the sake of cleanliness, safety, and comfort of the city. Therefore, identification of street vendors activity as the basis of arrangement is needed, so that there can be harmony of formal activity spatial with informal activity spatial.

2. Literature review

Several previous studies in Indonesia and other countries discussed street vendors, case studies were also conducted in various countries such as Taiwan, China, Philippines and Thailand. Chen Ming-Shih, (2005), Elmar (2015), Xue & Huang (2015) compared the profiles of street entrepreneurs and policies to identify the links between street entrepreneurs and urban development and planning. Some articles report relocation failures, during the relocation process, and after placement of relocations in new locations. Permadi (2007), Wibono et al. (2010), Ismanidar et al. (2016) found that eviction and inappropriate relocation will result in street vendors selling back on sidewalks and roadsides. The phenomenon that causes such relocation
failures is the primary concern in implementing an effective relocation strategy. Zacharias (2001), Adianto (2005), Illus et al. (2017), Hidayat et al. (2010) identifies the convenience of the pedestrian environment on the sidewalk and its relationship with street vendors. Rachmawati Majid (2013) stated that there was a lack of space to accommodate the activities of street vendors in urban areas. Tinari (2004), Yandi (2008) stated that it is important that urban planning practices shift from 'general' strategies to more 'specific' and 'diverse' strategies that recognize the special situation of street hawkers in the city, requiring different treatment in the planning process according to the location and the merchandise.

However, the above study neglected the motivations of street vendors to occupy the sidewalk and roadside. Muchlas (2015) focuses on the implementation of rules and conflicts between street vendors and municipalities who have not been able to find solutions to produce policies for managing street vendors that are humane and, at the same time, effective. However, it was unable to provide an assessment of the actual influence of street vendors in the urban public space.

In response to these limitations, this study attempts to investigate the views of street vendors regarding the occupation of urban public spaces. The view on street vendors remains limited, this research is a small step towards understanding the phenomenon. By revealing the influencing factors, we will be able to produce a policy in accordance with the current location of street vendors.

3. Subject of Study

This study is expected to give insights leading to an understanding of street vendors in urban areas. Our discussion of street vending in Makassar, Indonesia, will focus on the micro spatial scope, which is the street vendors located on Andi Pangeran Pettarani Street as one of the main streets in Makassar city, South Sulawesi, which connects via several streets to commercial areas, social facilities, schools, universities and government offices, followed by shopping centers, several cafes and restaurants. With consideration that in this location the existence of street vendors as an urban informal sector has increased and the number of street vendors was quite large. Based on personal data collection conducted by the author, as shown in Figure 1, the location of street vendors along Pettarani Street Makassar are spread across several points where the position of street vendors is based on sub-districts, and where most trade merchandise appears along the
sidewalk. In the study area, formal activities seem to contrast with the activities of street vendors who occupy public space areas.

Tamalate sub-district neighborhood was selected as a research site for a few reasons. First, as shown in Table 1, there are 122 units divided into several points along the road and the largest number of street vendors are located in the Tamalate sub-district, with 63 units occupying sidewalks and road sides on a daily basis. Second, as a place, it is highly representative of many office and education areas along with mundane mixed-use neighborhoods that street vendors frequent. Third, like many neighborhoods throughout Makassar, the Pettarani Street, Tamalate sub-disdistrict character is being radically altered by a rapid gentrification process. This changing urban fabric via the globalization of urban space and the daily workings of vendors make it highly characteristic at the neighborhood level.

A survey suggests, based on observation by author (table 2), that 63 units of street vendors as the most conspicuous informal economic actors in the study area trade various types of traditional foods, mineral water, soft drinks, cigarettes, and snacks. Furthermore, the vendors are divided by type and generally operate almost 24 hours every day. The growth of this sector evolves, we surmise, from the perceived needs of consumers and indicated by the type of customers coming. The study is expected to raise societal awareness, identify the factors that contribute to this operation and to understand the challenges faced by the vendors. It may also have some contribution to the formulation of appropriate policies for preventing, reducing and controlling

| Location of Street Vendors (sub-district) | Utilization of Places | Units |
|-----------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------|
|                                        | Side road  | Sidewalk | Green lines |
| Panakukang sub-district                 | 1          | 43       | 1           | 45   |
| Rappocini sub-district                  | 1          | 7        | 6           | 14   |
| Tamalate sub-district                   | 10         | 45       | 8           | 63   |
| Total street vendors on AP. Pettarani street Tamalate sub-district | 122 |

Source: Based on observation (2017)

| Type of Street Vendors         | Utilization of Places | Number of street vendors |
|-------------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------------|
|                               | Side road  | Sidewalk | Green lines |
| Permanent street vendors      | ×          |          | ×           | 37    |
| Semi-permanent street vendors | ×          |          | ×           | 8     |
| Non-permanent street vendors  | ×          | ×        | ×           | 18    |
| Total street vendors on AP. Pettarani street Tamalate sub-district | 63 |

Notes:
- ○ Occupied location
- × Not Occupied

Source: Observation of author (2017)
the problem of street vendors. In addition, it will generate practical information that will inform policy makers so that they are able to understand the dynamics of street vending at least by considering the location of vendors.

4. Research methods

The approach used in this research is a qualitative approach with descriptive research type supported by grounded theory. Data and information are collected through interviews, observation, mapping and documentation. In-depth interview questions were compiled to obtain the required information, as the goal was to acquire the stories behind the people: where they come from, how long have they been trading in Makassar, owner's equity, reasons for site selection, types of customers, their motivations for starting business as street vendors and other open-ended questions that can help to obtain a more complete description. The physical condition of business facilities is also observed by measuring, sketching, and photographing. The research was also rather explorative, because not much is known about street vendors in Makassar.

As shown on Table 3 (data collection method), in August 2017, research was conducted among 63 street vendors working on the public space sidewalk and roadside in the Pettarani street neighborhood of Makassar over a period of nearly four weeks. Over the course of a month, intensive data collection was undertaken through spending hours each day observing and talking to street vendors while they worked. The 63 vendors are divided into groups by the type of operational hours and are classified as either permanent street vendors, semi-permanent street vendors or non-permanent street vendors occupying urban public spaces as a case of research (as shown in fig.2).

Fig. 2: Map of street vendors on A.P Pettarani street, Tamalate sub-district
Source: Based on observation and interpretation of authors

Individual interviews were carried out to determine their personal perception on (1) the factors that force people into becoming street vendors, (2) economic contribution of street vendors on the livelihoods of the urban low income group, (3) effects of street vendors on pedestrian mobility, traffic flow and environment, (4) the challenges faced by street vendors in the course of
conducting their business, and (5) suggestions on the possible solution for improving street vendor activities. The data collection phase is a scientific method to help identify the problems to be solved and is a systematic and standard procedure for obtaining the necessary data. There is always a connection between the data collection method and the research problem to be solved (Nazir.M, 1988: 211).

In March 2018, secondary data collection was conducted to find out the perception of pedestrians and consumers. Using observations, a questionnaire and interviews as research

| Category              | Methods                                      | Purpose/Contents                                                                 | Date         | Numbers of Object |
|-----------------------|----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|-------------------|
| Street Vendors        | Observation, Mapping and Documentation       | • The physical condition and situation of business facilities observed by measuring, sketching, and photographing. | Month : August Year : 2017 Duration : 1 weeks | 6 units          |
|                       | Questionnaire and Interview                   | • Divided into groups by the type of operational hours: permanent street vendors, semi-permanent street vendors and non-permanent street vendors. • Interview and questionnaire to obtain the required information stories behind the street vendors with the aim of obtaining information on the motivation of street vendors to occupy public space. | Month : August Year : 2017 Duration : 3 weeks | 63 units         |
| Pedestrians and Consumers | Observation, Questionnaire and Interview   | • Observing the user activity of the sidewalk. • Survey on consumers behaviors to gather information about experiences within the context of shopping activities on street vending. • Find out the perception of pedestrians and consumers on street vending which use sidewalk and roadside as business facilities. • The questions were categorized on frequency of shopping, eating and purchasing foods of vendors, physical and social environment, including the respondents’ gender, age, status and occupation. | Month : March Year : 2018 Duration : 4 weeks | 250 respondents  |

Source: author
methods. Sample determination for customer / pedestrian is conducted by observing the user activity of the sidewalk as shown in Table 4. The results of observations have been obtained, based on the 667 pedestrians that passed through the research areas. To obtain a representative of the subject from the customer / pedestrian, the sample selection in this study uses random sampling with the Slovin formula for determination with certain considerations. Therefore, the number of samples from the customer / pedestrian population in Pettarani street was determined to be 250 respondents. A survey on consumer behaviors was conducted to clarify the current state of shopping activities.

Table 4: Pedestrian volume observation (left side and right side)

| No. | Time               | Average number of pedestrians |
|-----|--------------------|------------------------------|
| 1   | 06.00 am - 10.00 am| 106                          |
| 2   | 10.00 am - 02.00 pm| 317                          |
| 3   | 02.00 pm - 18.00 pm| 244                          |
|     | Total in 12 hours (Effective hour) | 667                          |

Source: Based on observation (01 – 05 March, 2017)

For the analysis, results of the answers are collected and categorized for each group to identify the key factors of the problem for the drawing of conclusions. Information is considered valid if the verification gets the same or a similar answer from a number of informants with the same question and will be described in descriptive form. The dominant answers to each question will be known, so they can be used as data and concluded in accordance with the concept of the issues. The result will further prompt to the final goal, which is to propose a suitable recommendation to conduct the structuring of street vendors in these locations.

5. Types of street vendors

Street vending is one of the most visible activities in the informal economy. Sizes, forms, and distributions of street vendors will be briefly analyzed. Visual and descriptive data in this section were collected through the results of research. This analysis is conducted to examine the cause of the usage alteration of public spaces in accordance with the perception of street vendors based on type; permanent street vendors, semi-permanent street vendors and non-permanent street vendors. The results of data is then used to define the factors for the street vending investigation in the case studies.

5.1 Permanent street vendors

The word permanent means those street vendors using plastic tents and zinc as a roof, with supporting furniture such as tables and benches installed and arranged without having to be unloaded when the activities are completed, or reassembled when starting the activity, as well as an equipped kitchen to cook meals and that are living in that location; as shown in Figure 4. In the study area there are 37 street vendors with permanent business facilities, each offering different food and beverages. Their kiosks are lined up along the sidewalks, and the tents connect to each other between the individual street vendors. Roof and tent construction is composed of
wood or bamboo material depending on the ability of each street vendor to finance their business facilities. According to Mami, 50 years old, permanent street vendor business owners sell a variety of food and beverages, and that this facility was built about 20 years ago in 1997. As the first street vendors in this location the physical condition of his business is not much changed according to the needs of his activities and the width of the pavement he occupies (see fig. 5 layout). The roofs of plastic tents and zinc are generally triangular and some wear flat roofs that are tilted to drain rainwater, so the roof looks irregular. Plastic tents installed as cover overlap between each street vendors area, which closes the gap between tents with other street vendors.

Business facilities are 3-4 meters wide in accordance with the width of the drainage and sidewalk and have a length of approximately 4 meters. They use the floor of the sidewalk and use additional flooring made of wood and boards that are placed right above the drainage. The reason vendors occupy this location is because it is on a convenient transportation route from their home and provides easy access by employees who work near his business facilities (fig.6). Mami became a street entrepreneur to support members of his family. Street vending provides an earning opportunity and livelihoods to support dependent family members (Babere, 2013). The other vendors have the same arrangements, the physical component that is built is adjusted to the other street vendors located in the location. Another thing Mami expressed in the utilization of public space is because there are friends from the same area, the Jeneponto district, who act as coordinators of the group and provided information to trade in this place. Further, he did not mention as to whether there was government permission or not to occupy the location, but that
there is a retribution fee paid monthly for the costs of maintaining cleanliness. He mentioned that he does not know who comes to collect the retribution fees because different people each month come to collect it. These street vendors operate for almost 24 hours from 6 am to 1 am.

Electricity facilities are obtained by connecting from the building behind their business location by permission of the owner of the building, then the street vendors pay for the electricity to the building owner through the group coordinator. Clean water is obtained from a supplier of clean water and used to wash cooking equipment, cooking and as drinking water. Some street vendors also bring water from their homes to save costs. For sanitation, dirty water is disposed of in ditches located nearby their business. With such simple means, it appears dirty and slum like, in considerable contrast to the looks of the formal business facilities that are located along Pettarani street.

5.2 Semi-permanent Street vendors

Activities and business facilities have specific operational hours. Claim actions involve physically marking territories by placing objects that are business equipment such as pushcarts, tables, benches for dining space and roofs using plastic tents that form business facilities (fig.7). Once the operating hours ends, street vendors pack all the physical components and return to their home. Accordingly, the public space claimed as business facilities is surrendered and returned as a public space of the sidewalk.

From the characteristic temporary physical components of street vendors in the study area there are eight units of semi-permanent street vendors whose activity from the morning appears to gradually start at 08.30 until the end which is late in the afternoon at around 18.00. Types of
commodity served are traditional drinks like es teler, mixed ice, fruit ice and cooked foods like somays and batagor. The popularity of food and beverage types generates attractiveness in the study area, meaning that a lot of customers come to just relax and enjoy the food and drinks during the day.

They formed a group in front of an office building, which is lined up on the sidewalk. As shown in Figure 8 the business facilities are wider than permanent facilities because they follow the size of the drainage, green lines and sidewalks that are 4-5 meters with a building length of approximately 12 meters. They use the sidewalk as the floor with additional flooring made of wood and boards that are placed above the drainage, while electrical facilities are obtained by using generators as electric power, which is different to the permanent street vendors who get help from a building located behind their business facilities. Vendors bring clean water from their homes to save costs.

Fig. 8: Floor plan and cross section semi-permanent street vendors
Source: observation and interpretation of the author
Most street vendors who occupy public space come from the same region, and many of the spaces are close to their residences. Furthermore, they have adjusted the physical conditions of their business facilities to match those of the existing street vendors. This street vendor was one of the food stalls selling traditional food and ice in Pettarani street. The stalls in this area are popular among workers and students nearby. Space along the sidewalk was privatized by street vendors as shown in the Figure 9 which also shows the zones of vending spaces occupying public space where street vendors use the public open sided areas to place their pushcart and provide tables as a dining space. As a result, people could not use the sidewalk and the pedestrian ways were also narrowed or sometimes obstructed.

5.3 Non-permanent street vendors

Non-permanent street vendors refers to vendors who keep moving from place to place or are not settled in a single location and usually sell with easily portable merchandise or items that are easy to transport. These street vendors often have their activity on the roadside and sidewalk in a claimed business space, using transportation facilities such as pushcart and modified motorcycles as business facilities, where activities are marked by placing their pushcarts and motorcycles to form the business facilities as shown in Figure 10. Around 18 street vendors occupy the sidewalk and roadside in front of education activities, the types of commodities served are kid's toys, traditional food and beverages such as somays, bakso (meatballs), cimol, ice cendol and soft drink. Street vendors will pack up the merchandise and move to another location, once operational hours have ended. Roadsides that were occupied as business facilities have been surrendered and now can be re-used for vehicles.

Fig. 10: Informal sector non-permanent street vendors
Source: observation of the author

Behavior patterns of these street vendors in serving their customers has always included approaching potential consumers. This business facility makes it easy to move to another location if customers are scarce and does not require electricity and clean water facilities like those used by permanent and semi-permanent street vendors. Darmun, 50, an itinerant vendor has traded traditional food in the city like fried meatballs (bakso goreng) and somays using a modified motorcycle to form his business facilities since 2001. He described his decision to vend: "this location was chosen to trade because there are many students and drivers of public transportation (angkutan kota) in this location. There are probably other jobs that are better, but I don’t have a lot of education". Research on the informal sector suggest that individuals engage in these forms of livelihood when there are no other options, and that a lack of education severely limits ones access to more formal work, we would argue that for many of the vendors interviewed, their
involvement in this trade is likely related to the difficulty in finding a job in the formal sector (see in section 6: motivation to became street vendors).

Often itinerant vendors will park on the roadside or pavement to display their goods, undertaking activities that start from 11.00 and continue until 17.00. Vendors have a specific call or use a bell to let clients know they are passing, this enables the vendor to develop a relationship with regular customers. In some cases, vendors will even give their cell phone numbers to their customers so they can be reached to arrange a purchase. Moreover, many vendors who come to the city to trade do so out of absolute necessity; it is no longer possible to for them to make a living in their home regions, so migrants move to Makassar in order to generate income for themselves and their families. Upon arrival in the city, one recurring concern was that they had to trade their goods informally, because they could not afford a market stand, nor could they find out when stands were available for lease because this information is usually shared exclusively between community members.

5.4 Current condition of street vendors in pedestrian zones

The previous section described about the situation and physical condition of street vendors, and Table 5 shows the physical component of informal sector, where the location chosen by

| Description                                      | Permanent Street Vendors | Semi-permanent Street Vendors | Non-permanent Street Vendors |
|--------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Occupied                                         | Sidewalk                 | Sidewalk and Green line        | Side road                   |
| Floor                                            | Wooden board             | Wooden board                   | X                           |
| Wall                                             | Plywood with zinc        | X                              | X                           |
| Roof                                             | Plastic tent and zinc    | Plastic tent                   | X                           |
| Bedroom                                          | Wooden board             | X                              | X                           |
| Wide                                             | 2.8m                     | 4.9m                           | 1.5m                        |
| Length                                           | 4m                       | 10.8m                          | 1.5m                        |
| Kitchen                                          | ☒                        | ☒                              | X                           |
| Pushcart                                         | x                        | ☒                              | ☒                           |
| Table                                            | ☒                        | ☒                              | ☒                           |
| Chairs                                           | ☒                        | ☒                              | ☒                           |
| Bedroom                                          | ☒                        | ☒                              | ☒                           |
| Clean water utility                              | ☒                        | ☒                              | X                           |
| Electric utility                                 | ☒                        | ☒                              | ☒                           |
| Operational hour                                 | 06.00 am - 01.00 am      | 08.30 am - 06.00 pm            | 11.00 am - 05.00 pm         |
| Type of commodities                              | Coffe, instant noodle, cigarettes, snacks, mineral water, soft drinks, gas cylinders, gasoline, mobile phone voucher, traditional cake, processed food, traditional food etc | Es Teler (fruit cocktail), somay (steamed fish dumpling), fruit juice and fruit ice and batagor (fried bakso and tofu) | Toys seller, fruit juice, fried somay, fried pottato, fried meatballs and cimol |
| Average income monthly                           | (Rp) 3,508,108 ($250 USD) | (Rp) 3,887,500 ($277 USD)      | (Rp) 2,033,333 ($145 USD)   |

Notes: ☒ Available, x Not Available

Source: Based on observation, 2017
vendors is based on the types of commodities they sell and that share the same operating hours. Street vendors apply occupational measures in several ways by placing easy-to-move objects such as tables, benches, or carts to form a controlled space of activity as a private territory, and the business activity is built using permanent style tents such as a plastic roof with zinc.

These vendors formed a group in front of formal buildings, as shown on the Figure 2 position of street vendors. This data showed a wide range of incomes in this field of occupation. The vendors earned average income depends on what they sell, for instance, semi-permanent street vendors who sell snacks and drinks can often make a high profit.

6. **Influence of usage alteration to the spatial occupancy by street vendors**

6.1 Spatial identity of vendors

Analysis was conducted to describe the condition and location in accordance with the street vendors perception to be utilized as an activity place, and most street vendors claim that they felt comfortable occupying the sidewalk because there was enough space to place their merchandise. There are several factors influencing and encouraging street vendors to utilize the space for their activities at these locations, so as to provide a characteristic for them in choosing locations on the sidewalk and roadsides according to their level of influence. Their astuteness in seeing this opportunity has resulted in creativity to utilize the space there for undertaking their activities.

The center of activities becomes attractive for street vendors because there are potential consumers having high mobility which leads to the street vendors taking advantage to perform their activities there. Within the total of 63 interviews carried out, as shown in Table 6, there was a wide range of ages represented amongst the vendors, from under 30 to up to more than 50 years old. Most of the street vendors belong to the age group of 40-50 years and 30-40 years, people involved in the informal sector are generally included in the prime or productive age. It can be concluded that the informal sector can absorb this group of productive labor. The resulting financial responsibilities were often one of the reasons vendors explained to me for engaging in street vending. What is interesting, as more than half of the street vendors started working as street vendors between 5-15 years ago, is that almost all vendors began to trade after the financial crisis occurred in 1997 (new order regime). In addition, it appears that street vendors are a growing sector as 12.7% have been working in this sector for less than five years. The locations selected by street vendors are because they are migrants from the same region, 46.03% of the 63 participants comprised of rural to urban migrants and were from the Jeneponto district.

One vendor on Pettarani street said that the lowest income per month was Rp.1,500,000 ($107 USD) while the highest was to Rp.4,500,000 ($321 USD), or it can be said that their income average is around $10 USD per day. The income of street vendors depends on various factors such as the type of merchandise, place where they operate, working hours etc. The street vending option really impacts their life and improves their livelihood as well as representing the primary source of income for more than 90% of the interviewees. This finding supports the argument that vending really emerged as a viable livelihood when the financial crisis occurred. Most of street vendors claim that they felt comfortable trading at Pettarani street because the location of the trade is close to their residence. The distance of the location from their residence indicates that there is a relationship in the selection of business location.
### Table 6: Result of analysis street vendors

| Description                              | Characteristics of Street Vendors on A.P Pettarani street, Tamalate sub-district |
|------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Duration of vending as street vendors   | <5 years: 12.70% | 5-15 years: 60.32% | >15 years: 26.98% |
| Age of owners                           | <30 years old: 14.29% | 30 - 40 years old: 31.75% | 41 - 50 years old: 34.92% | >50 years old: 19.05% |
| Place of origin                          | Makassar: 41.27% | Jeneponto: 46.03% | Others region: 12.70% |
| Motivation (why to became street vendors) | Difficult to find job: 14.29% | Promising Income: 30.16% | Low initial capital: 17.46% | Flexibility in working: 6.35% | To support their family: 12.70% | To be self-employed: 19.05% |
| Monthly income in local currency/month  | < (Rp.) 2,000,000: 12.70% | (Rp.) 2,000,000 - 3,000,000 ($214 USD): 33.33% | (Rp.) 3,000,000 - 4,000,000 ($285 USD): 34.92% | > (Rp.) 4,000,000: 19.05% |
| Monthly expenditure in local currency   | < (Rp.) 1,000,000: 20.63% | (Rp.) 1,000,000 - 1,500,000 ($107 USD): 30.16% | (Rp.) 1,500,000 - 2,000,000 ($142 USD): 33.33% | > (Rp.) 2,000,000: 15.87% |
| Reason to choose location               | Accessibility: 15.87% | Availability of business facilities: 9.52% | Easy to access by employees: 30.16% | Similar immigrant area: 31.75% | Visibility: 12.70% |
| Distance of residence by trade location | <1 km: 25.40% | 1-2 km: 38.10% | 2-5 km: 20.63% | >5 km: 15.87% |

Source: authors
The objective of this study was to find out the driving factors that attract people to street vending and how traders make their choices on a trading location. Promising income, difficulty in finding a job, to be self-employed, flexibility in working, supporting family and low initial capital were among the major factors that push people into street vending. Also, Accessibility (convenient transportation route from their home), availability of business facilities (drainage, water and electrical), easy to access by employees who work around her business facilities, similar immigrant area and visibility were the major factors in the choice of location. This condition (Table 6) was prudently caught by street vendors as an opportunity to be the activity location, as well as utilizing the nearby space. The sector, therefore, needs to be planned to grow in a well-organized manner. Determining the location which is not based on location characteristics will eventually lead to various problems.

6.2. Urban social dynamics

There is no allocated space to accommodate street vendors, so the street vendors tend to occupy public spaces such as sidewalks and roadsides. Seeing this phenomenon, the government began to conduct evictions or clean up street vendors in this location, even if the informal sector has prospects for economic growth and employment creation, it is not allowed by law and has mainly been regarded as a nuisance by the authorities. However, the eviction strategy has never been a success because the street vendors keep returning to the original location due to unavailability of replacement locations for them.

Their presence in the public space is one of the activities that can be categorized as "activity support". The result of data on Figure 12 is to find out the relationship between consumers / pedestrian and the existence of street vendors activities in the area of Pettarani Street. Most of the
respondents (23.60%) said the proximity factor from the place of activity becomes the reason because the distance is relatively close, and that they do not spend their time in formal markets which are located quite far from their place of work. Another reason that is quite dominant is the prices offered by PKL are relatively cheap and the quality is not inferior compared to merchandise sold in formal shops. This confirms the reason some traders prefer selling on the sidewalk and roadside, because they still have customers buying from them.

For other respondents, however, 22.00% persist in their response of street vending and the informal sector as an aberration and a nuisance of pedestrian activity on sidewalk. On the other hand, 17.20% of respondents said that the informal sector helps reduce unemployment. However, in this study, the authors findings also included that street vendors are blamed for contributing to environmental problems (diagram spatial effects of vendors) 12.80% cause traffic congestion and 20% of respondents said vendors occupied public space. Street vendors are noted for erecting structures, which do not by any means conform either to building codes, or zoning regulations and give the appearance of a slum area in the city center. Street vending should not be dismissed but co-opted as one form of promoting socio-economic welfare. What is essential is to understand the needs, motivations and risks faced by the street vendors, with an intention to make street vending more functional, to the immediate, short-term, and long-term developmental needs and aspirations of the individual street vendors.

7. Conclusion

Within this paper, the complexities of strategies have examined and described the daily practices of street vendors within the study area. One of the key findings is that street vendors have been able to cater to customers from all income groups and their demands for cheap food, goods and services in proximity to major workplaces areas. Street vendors have exploded as a survival strategy, the presence of vendors in order to earn a living is often times the only way available to them as an income earning strategy and as an entrepreneurial strategy which includes the urban poor, rural-urban migrants, villagers that come from the peri-urban areas and the unemployed. Other groups reliant on informal vending, are groups living in the city who want to become self-employed.

Even though they are situated adjacent to formal shops, vendors easily became a part of the urban space in which they were working. The goods and items they sell are needed by many who live in the local community. Spatial observations revealed that vendors used traditional forms using plastic tents and zinc as a roof, with supporting furniture such as tables, benches, and pushcarts with parasols. Most of the street vendors earned incomes higher than the minimum wage for the local area, more than half of vendors earned more than the starting income for employees in the formal sector. They usually lived near their workplaces and the form of vending showed the relationship between income and spatial organization; higher-income vendors tended to be static, making high investments in strategic vending spaces.

The identity of vendors in this area was quite unique, additionally, there are key findings about the characteristics of trading patterns; street vendors try to make their business facilities shape the same as the others (groups) and have the same service time of the other vendors in the research area such as permanent, semi-permanent and non-permanent street vendors. On the other
hand, there are similar immigrants that help them trade in these locations, making it easy to access and occupy urban public spaces. This area has a high frequency in the movement of visitors and society, this condition provides hope for prospective visitors / buyers.

They also proved that these kinds of streets have a two-sided characteristic of simplicity and complexity. According to analysis, it could be concluded that Pettarani Street is an inclusive street because of street vending. Street vendors provide food and commodities at affordable prices. They cleverly identified this opportunity as a preferred location for their activities and took advantage of the space as a place of activity to sell their wares, which in turn causes the public spaces to switch functions into private spaces for street vendors because transactions can take place quickly and easily at an affordable price. Street traders, as one of the informal economy sectors, are related to the formal sector and the impact of this linkage will bring factors and characteristics of street vendors in the study sites.

With the explanation that the use of space by street vendors is based on known factors, it is expected to reduce the occurrence of space problems and unilateral use by street vendors in determining their business activities, especially on sidewalks and roadsides. This should be an input for public policy makers to be referenced before a city spatial policy is realized. One of the negative impacts is that street vending is a source of land use conflicts because vendors use spaces which have not been designed for trading; in other words, their business activity is illegal. However, based on the result perception from consumers and pedestrians, this study has also demonstrated the linkages between informal vendors and formal public life. Their strength and ability in contributing to their communities should also be considered in discussions concerning public space in cities. For street vendors in the streets, as they are there to earn a living, they know which places in the city are the most financially beneficial. In the end, street vending survives not merely because it is an important source of employment but because of the services it provides to the urban population.

7.2 Suggestion

Based on the observation, the existence of street vendors affects the physical and visual quality of buildings and sidewalk occupation. Sidewalks, as a public space, are now highly efficient and effective trading spaces for street vendors and the public, the addition of this activity should be able to accommodate various community activities, so it becomes an input for more complex planning and design. The most significant impact felt by street vendors is the frequent victims of eviction by the Municipal Police (Satpol PP) and the many losses felt by the street vendors, both material and non-material losses (Wibono, 2010: p.3), while the existence of street vendors which utilize public space sidewalks and roadsides is an impact of the formal sector activities in the vicinity. In designing or planning a physical space it is essential to accommodate the experiences of the space user and to identify possible events that may arise. In determining the activity space of street vendors, it should be based on factors and characteristics that influence the activities of street vendors in the area, by knowing the appropriate space and place of trade for the activity, the pattern of street vendors, the time of street vendors, and the type of commodities.
In addition, the government must consider the condition that street vending is relevant to the economic situation of today with high unemployment rates. Therefore, instead of treating street vendors as a nuisance, as illegal, as tax evaders, the government needs to revisit the law on street vending to accommodate the vendors. Society and street vendors believe that if the city government works with street vendors and establishes effective managerial mechanisms, the presence of temporary elements can energize the shopping streets and add to the fun of shopping. This can help build consensus on regulatory and enforcement issues and in turn help the government to address the actual needs of the vendors. However, the initiative of street vendors themselves is needed. For the future, local governments must improve the means of activities in the vicinity.

7.3 Further research

Street entrepreneurs make the city more inclusive and create a vibrant atmosphere and unique urban scape, whilst generating a sense of identity. The next study will shed light on the phenomenon and the role of street entrepreneurs in contemporary and prospective cities in developing countries. The aim will be to assess the magnitude of street vending in different countries and the composition of the vendors as well as establish a thorough understanding of how city governments interact and cooperate with informal economic activities. What positions and roles can the informal economy fulfill in an urban economy? What are the roles of street entrepreneurs in the urban context and urban development issues? It will clarify the up-to-date roles of street entrepreneurs in an urban context and an understanding of spatial intervention mechanisms adopted by street entrepreneurs will contribute to a better, more sustainable and integrative policy on street entrepreneur management.

Another possible topic for future research, also focusing on analyzing process of urbanization, is modernization and social change at urban local communities and spatial articulation as the determinant of social change. Spatial utilization shift and the development of infrastructure significantly affect spatial structure and spatial pattern changes. Development tendency of the existing spatial and land use is no longer determined based on productivity, but it is valued by the functions of space and land.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT) of Japan, which granted a scholarship for the author's study in Toyohashi University of Technology. We thank the Research Administration Center (RAC) of Toyohashi University of Technology, which provided language help and we express our gratitude to the street vendors for their kind responses to the hearing survey and for their cooperation in replying to the questionnaire survey.

Reference

1) Adianto, J., 2005. Meydian, S,. Trotoar : Arena Perebutan Ruang Warga Kota., Department Arsitektur, Universitas Pancasila, Jakarta. (In Indonesian)
2) Bhowmik, S. (2010). Street vendors in the global urban economy. New Delhi: Routledge.
3) Bhowmik, S. K. (2005). Street vendors in Asia: a review. Economic and Political Weekly,
2256-2264.
4) Brown B., Rammidi G. (2014) Manifestations of Service Culture Among Street Vendors in Botswana, European Scientific Journal August edition ISSN: 1857 – 7881, 79-98.
5) Canter, D., (1976), “The Psychology of Place”, Architectural Press, London.
6) Carmona, M., Tiesdell,S., Heath,T., and Oc,T., (2010), “public places public spaces: The dimensions of urban design”, Architectural press, UK.
7) Chamdany, Doddy. 2004. Kajian dan Arahan Pengembangan Ruang Publik Oleh Aktivitas PKL di Kawasan Stadion Mahanan Kota Surakarta. (In Indonesian). Thesis Not Published. Postgraduate Program Master of Regional and Urban Development.
8) Cohen, D. J. (1974) The People Who Get in the Way: Poverty and Development in Jakarta, Politics, 9:1-9. (reprinted in Bromley ed. 1985).
9) Cooper, M.C, Francis, C, (1998), “People Places: Design guidelines for urban open space”, John Wiley & Aons Inc. Toronto.
10) Cresswell, J., (2009), “Research design, qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches”, (3rd ed), Sage.
11) Elmar Hanewald, 2015. Motivation Of Street Entrepreneurs, A Multiple Case Study In Shenzhen, China,
12) Frick, D., (2007), “Spatial Synergy and Supportiveness of space”, Journal of Urban Design, 12:2, 261-274.
13) Hainsworth, Geoffrey B., Globalization and The Southeast Asian Economics Crisis : Indigenous Responses, Coping Strategies and Governance Reform in Southeast Asia, Institute of Asian Research, University of British Columbia, 2000.
14) Hart, Keith, Informal Income Opportunities and Urban Employment in Ghana, Journal of Modern African Studies, 1973.
15) Hennink, M., Hutter, I., & Bailey, A., 2011. Qualitative Research Methods. Los Angeles: Sage.
16) Hidayat, N., Choocharukul, K., And Kishi K., 2010. Investigating Structural Relationships Among Pedestrian Perception, Behavior, Traffic, And Level Of Service. Journal Of Japan Science And Technology Agency., Vol. 27 No.1, P.99-108. (In Indonesian)
17) Ismanidar, Amirullah, SaifuL., 2016 p.149., Persepsi Masyarakat Terhadap Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Kota Banda Aceh. (In Indonesian)
18) Muchlas M., Riskasari., 2016. Penertiban Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL) Menuju Makassar Kota Dunia, Jurusan Ilmu Administrasi Negara Fakultas Ilmu Sosial Dan Politik Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar. (In Indonesian)
19) Mc. Gee, T.G. And Y.M. Yeung, 1977. Hawkers In Southeast Asian Cities : Planning For The Bazaar Economy, International Development Research Centre, Ottawa, Canada.,
20) Moleong, Lexy J. 2001. Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif, Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya. (In Indonesian)
21) Keputusan Menteri Perhubungan No: KM 65 Tahun 1993. Tentang Fasilitas Pendukung Kegiatan Lalu Lintas Dan Angkutan Jalan. (In Indonesian)
22) Shirvani, 1985. The Urban Design Process, Van Nostrand Reinhold Company, New York.
23) Sugiyono.2006.Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif Dan R & D. Bandung:Alfabeta. (In
24) Sujarto, Djoko. 1998. Pengantar Planologi. Bandung. (In Indonesian)
25) Sun Z., Bell S, Scott I. (2016) How Does Street Vending Contribute to Walkability? A report on a study in Yuncheng, China. 7th AicE-Bs2016Edinburgh, UK, 27-30 July 2016 / E-BPJ, 1 (4), Pp. 203-213.
26) Tika Pabundu. 2005., Metode Penelitian Geografi. Jakarta:Pt Bumi Pustaka. (In Indonesian)
27) Xue, D., & Huang, G. (2015). Informality And The State’s Ambivalence In The Regulation Of Street Vending In Transforming Guangzhou, China. Geoforum, 62, 156-165.
28) Yatmo, Yandi Andri, 2008. Street Vendors As ‘Out Of Place’ Urban Elements, Department Of Architecture, University Of Indonesia, Journal Of Urban Design, Volume 13, No.3, Routledge, London & New York,
29) Zacharias, J.,2001. Pedestrian Behavior And Perception In Urban Walking Environment, Journal Of Planning Literature;