Far-infrared optical excitations in multiferroic TbMnO$_3$

M. Schmidt$^1$, Ch. Kant$^1$, T. Rudolf$^1$, F. Mayr$^1$, A.A. Mukhin$^2$, A.M. Balbashov$^3$, J. Deisenhofer$^1$, and A. Loidl$^1$

$^1$ Experimental Physics V, Center for Electronic Correlations and Magnetism, University of Augsburg, D-86135 Augsburg, Germany
$^2$ General Physics Institute of the Russian Academy of Sciences, 119991 Moscow, Russia
$^3$ Moscow Power Engineering Institute, 105835 Moscow, Russia

May 19, 2009

Abstract. We provide a detailed study of the reflectivity of multiferroic TbMnO$_3$ for wave numbers from 40 cm$^{-1}$ to 1000 cm$^{-1}$ and temperatures 5 K $< T < 300$ K. Excitations are studied for polarization directions $\mathbf{E} \parallel \mathbf{a}$, the polarization where electromagnons are observed, and for $\mathbf{E} \parallel \mathbf{c}$, the direction of the spontaneous polarization in this material. The temperature dependencies of eigenfrequencies, damping constants and polar strengths of all modes are studied and analyzed. For $\mathbf{E} \parallel \mathbf{a}$ and below the spiral ordering temperature of about 27 K we observe a transfer of optical weight from phonon excitations to electromagnons, which mainly involves low-frequency phonons. For $\mathbf{E} \parallel \mathbf{c}$ an unusual increase of the total polar strength and hence of the dielectric constant is observed indicating significant transfer of dynamic charge probably within manganese-oxygen bonds on decreasing temperatures.

PACS. 63.20.kk Phonon interactions with other quasiparticles – 63.20.-e Phonons in crystal lattices – 75.47.Lx Manganites – 78.30.-j Infrared and Raman spectra

1 Introduction

The discovery of spin-driven ferroelectricity in some rare earth manganites [1] has revived the field of multiferroics enormously [2]. In these systems the onset of ferroelectricity is directly coupled to the static non-collinear spin order [5, 6]. Concerning the dynamics of multiferroics, the idea of hybridization between spin waves and optical phonons in magnetoelectrics has been put forth long ago by Smolenskii and Chupis [8], and indeed, ample experimental evidence for the occurrence of electromagnons in the rare earth manganites has been provided recently [9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14]. The origin and the underlying mechanisms of these magnetoelectric excitations have been debated vividly [15], however, recent studies [17, 18] support the scenario that magnons in spin-driven ferroelectrics can gain optical weight via the coupling to phonons and, hence, can be observed directly in far-infrared (FIR) and THz spectroscopy. A strong correlation of electromagnons and phonons has been already reported for the case of GdMnO$_3$ as function of temperature and magnetic field [19].

TbMnO$_3$ is the far most studied multiferroic manganite and crystallizes in an orthorhombically distorted perovskite structure (space group $Pbnm$). It reveals magnetic phase transitions into an antiferromagnetic (AFM) collinear spin structure at $T_N = 42$ K and subsequently in a structure with helical spin order and spontaneous ferroelectric (FE) polarization at $T_{FE} = 27$ K [1]. In the low temperature structure the spins reveal helicoidal order with a propagation vector along the crystallographic b direction and the spin spiral plane lying within the bc plane [20]. In this case the FE polarization is expected to be along the c direction [21, 22] in agreement with experiment [11]. In TbMnO$_3$ electromagnons have been observed at wave numbers close to 20 cm$^{-1}$ [9, 17, 18] and 60 cm$^{-1}$ [17], which exactly matches spin wave dispersion energies as determined in neutron scattering experiments [22].

For the low-energy electromagnon the optical eigenfrequency corresponds to the new magnetic Bragg point at $(0,0.28,1)$ and the magnetoelectric excitation at 60 cm$^{-1}$ matches the magnon energy at the magnetic-zone boundary [17, 22]. Recently it has been argued that this range of electromagnons strongly overlaps with a continuum band of two-magnon absorption [15]. It seems, however, that the two-magnon scattering is too weak to explain the experimentally observed electromagnon intensities [17]. For the low frequency mode, it has been clearly documented in optical experiments using THz spectroscopy that the observed electromagnon eigenfrequencies correspond to spin waves, as AFM resonance absorptions have been detected using different excitation geometries in the same frequency range [18]. In TbMnO$_3$ it also became clear that the electromagnons only appear for $\mathbf{E} \parallel \mathbf{a}$ and are strictly tied to the lattice. Furthermore it has been shown that Heisenberg coupling is very important [17] and that the dynamical magnetoelectric effect as proposed by Katsura, Na
gaosa and Balatsky can play no dominant role in TbMnO$_3$ [21].

The aim of this work is to investigate the temperature dependence of all infrared active phonon modes in TbMnO$_3$ in order to reveal the coupling of phonons and spin waves and to analyze the transfer of optical spectral weight at the onset of the spiral-spin order.

2 Experimental details

The investigated single crystals have previously been used for studies in the THz frequency range [9,18]. The samples were characterized by x-ray, magnetic, thermodynamic and dielectric measurements and exhibited good agreement with published results [11,24]. The optical experiments were carried out using Bruker Fourier transform spectrometers IFS 113v and IFS 66v/S equipped with a He-flow cryostat for wave numbers from 40 cm$^{-1}$ to 32,000 cm$^{-1}$ and for temperatures from 5 K to room temperature. The measurements were performed for light polarized parallel to the crystallographic c axis (E $\parallel$ c), the direction of the FE polarization, and for E $\parallel$ a, the polarization where electromagnons are observable.

The reflectivity spectra obtained at 6 K and 295 K for E $\parallel$ a and E $\parallel$ c are shown in Fig. 1(a) and Fig. 1(b), respectively. The reflectivity has been fitted with RefFIT [25], using a sum of Lorentzian oscillators with eigenfrequency, damping and dielectric strength as relevant fitting parameters [26].

The eigenfrequencies correspond to the transverse optical phonon modes and the longitudinal mode frequencies have to be calculated via the Lyddane-Sachs-Teller relation. From the dielectric strength the effective ionic plasma frequencies can be determined, which allows some conclusions concerning the effective dynamic charges involved in specific modes [27].

For clarity in some cases we also show the frequency dependence of the dielectric loss. The complex dielectric constant has been derived from the reflectivity spectra by means of Kramers-Kronig transformation with a constant high-frequency extrapolation towards low frequencies and a smooth $\omega^2$ high-frequency extrapolation.

The inset of Fig. 1 shows the reflectivity of TbMnO$_3$ with E $\parallel$ a at room temperature as measured up to 32,000 cm$^{-1}$ ($\approx 4$ eV). The hump close to 16,000 cm$^{-1}$ probably corresponds to dipole forbidden onsite transitions within the $d$ multiplet of the manganese ions [28]. The charge transfer gap appears close to 24,000 cm$^{-1}$, corresponding to 3 eV. The analysis of these electronic transitions will not be subject of this work. In the present work the high-energy reflectivity is merely used to determine the electronic dielectric constant $\epsilon_\infty$ with high accuracy.

3 Experimental results and discussion

In the orthorhombic perovskite structure of TbMnO$_3$ (space group Pbnm) one expects a total of 25 IR active modes, namely 9 B$_{3u}$ for E $\parallel$ a, 9 B$_{2u}$ modes for E $\parallel$ b and 7 B$_{1u}$ modes for E $\parallel$ c. However, when fitting the reflectivity spectra we used 14 modes to describe the spectra for E $\parallel$ a and 19 modes for E $\parallel$ c. The corresponding fits describe the data nicely and are shown in Fig. 1.

To identify the main IR active modes we plot the optical conductivity in Fig. 2(a) (E $\parallel$ a) and Fig. 2(b) (E $\parallel$ c) for temperatures at 6 K (solid lines) and 295 K (dashed lines). In these figures we assigned the modes with the largest optical spectral weight to the expected modes B$_{3u}(i)$ ($i = 1, ..., 9$) and B$_{1u}(j)$ ($j = 1, ..., 7$) for the $Pbnm$ symmetry. The additional weak modes which are visible are thought to originate from phonon modes allowed for light polarized along one of the other crystallographic axis due to polarization leakage or a slight misorientation of the sample.

The weak excitations labeled M$_1$ and M$_2$ which appear only for E $\parallel$ a are related with the appearance of multiferroicity in this system and, hence, we will now first focus on the FIR spectra for this polarization direction.

The overall temperature dependence of the FIR spectrum for E $\parallel$ a is illustrated in a contour plot of the dielectric loss $\epsilon''$ as a function of temperature and wave number (see Fig. 3). In this representation all phonon modes are visible, but no abrupt anomalies at the phase transition temperatures can be detected. At the temperature $T_{RE} = 7$ K magnetic ordering of the Tb ions takes place.

![Fig. 1.](image-url)
The effects of the magnetic and ferroelectric phase transitions on the FIR spectra become evident when zooming into the low-frequency region between 50 and 150 cm\(^{-1}\), which is shown in Fig. 4.

The excitations \(M_1\) and \(M_2\) appearing close to 60 and 140 cm\(^{-1}\), respectively, emerge and gain optical weight only below about 40 K (see Fig. 4(b)), although some diffuse bands seem to persist to higher temperatures. For \(M_2\) this behavior is documented in the inset of Fig. 4(a). Therefore, these modes are associated with the onset of magnetic ordering at \(T_N = 42\) K. In contrast, all phonon modes and here especially \(B_{3u}(1)\) show finite optical weight up to room temperature. Recently, the excitation \(M_1\) has been identified as an electromagnon, i.e. an electric-dipole active excitation of a single zone boundary magnon [17]. Note that several electric-dipole active electromagnons and magnetic-dipole active antiferromagnetic resonances have been observed by Pimenov et al. in the frequency region below 25 cm\(^{-1}\) in TbMnO\(_3\) using THz spectroscopy [9,18].

To date the nature and origin of \(M_2\) remain unsettled. It has been argued that this excitation is due to a two-magnon process \((M_1+M_1)\) with an energy corresponding to the upper cut-off of the magnon density of states [15]. Recently, this scenario has been discarded in favor of an isotropic Heisenberg-coupling mechanism between non-collinear spins which allows to explain that electromagnons occur only for \(E \parallel a\) [17]. A further possibility is an excitation of the crystal-field split ground state of the 4\(f\) electrons of the Tb ions. However, the relation to the experimentally observed temperature dependence and to the magnetic ordering of the Mn ions is not in favor of such an interpretation. When looking at the temperature evolution of the lowest-lying phonon \(B_{3u}(1)\) close to 120 cm\(^{-1}\), one recognizes that upon entering into the ferroelectric phase below \(T_{FE} = 27\) K the phonon shifts and loses intensity (see Fig. 4(a) and (b)) in agreement with reference [15]. It is this mode which reportedly transfers optical weight to the electromagnons in GdMnO\(_3\) [14]. Turning again to Fig. 4 it seems that both \(B_{3u}(1)\) and \(M_2\) shift to slightly higher frequencies below \(T_{FE}\), but the difference \(\Delta \omega = \omega_{M_2} - \omega_{B_{3u}(1)} \approx 20\) cm\(^{-1}\) remains almost constant and in agreement with the direct excitation energy of the low-energy electromagnon and antiferromagnetic resonances at 20 cm\(^{-1}\) [18,9]. Thus, we suggest to consider the possibility that \(M_2\) could arise from a one-magnon + one-phonon process (1M1P). Multimagnon plus phonon processes have been described in detail in antiferromagnetic Cu and Ni oxides [51], however, only excitations of even numbers of magnons will yield considerable spectral weight and conserve the total spin. If 1M1P excitations should be realized in TbMnO\(_3\), spin-orbit coupling and antisymmetric Dzyaloshinsky-Moriya-like spin coupling ought to contribute to the effective spin-dependent electric-dipole moment.

For a more quantitative analysis of the phonon modes we analyzed all spectra utilizing a 3-parameter fit as outlined above. Table 1 shows eigenfrequencies \(\omega_f\) for both polarization directions at room temperature and also indicates the experimentally observed dipole strengths \(\Delta \epsilon\) and calculated effective ionic plasma frequencies \(\Omega\), which directly provide a measure of the effective dynamic charge involved in a given mode. The effective ionic plasma frequency of all modes, which characterizes the ionicity of the bonds, amounts to approximately 1100 cm\(^{-1}\). It has
to be compared with the effective ionic plasma frequency $\Omega = 2100$ cm$^{-1}$, which results from a model assuming ideal ionic bonds (see e.g. Ref. 21). Let us now turn to the polarization $E \parallel a$, the polarization in which the electromagnons show up. Figure 5 documents the temperature dependence of eigenfrequency $\omega$, damping constant $\gamma$ and dielectric strength $\Delta \epsilon$ of phonon modes $B_{3u}(i)$ with $i = 1, 2, 4$.

Looking now at mode $B_{3u}(1)$ which seems to be most strongly coupled to spin excitations we find the following temperature dependence: Coming from room temperature its eigenfrequency (Fig. 5(a)) reveals the usual hardening due to anharmonicity and starts to saturate below $100$ K. We tentatively ascribe this temperature scale to the Curie-Weiss temperature of the manganese subsystem, because in spinel systems spin-phonon coupling effects became evident below the corresponding Curie-Weiss temperatures [32,33]. Moreover the temperature scale of $100$ K agrees well with the Curie-Weiss temperature of $\text{LaMnO}_3$ [38], but on further cooling and passing the magnetic phase transitions the eigenfrequency suddenly increases further. Experimentally, it seems that the increase starts already below the first antiferromagnetic phase transition where collinear spin order is established and further increases when passing the phase transition into a ferroelectric ground state and helical spin order. In total, this increase due to the onset of AFM order amounts to $3\%$ indicating strong spin-phonon coupling. The damping (Fig. 5(b)) continuously decreases without significant traces of the magnetic and ferroelectric phase transitions. Finally, the most striking effects show up in the temperature dependence of the dielectric strength (Fig. 5(c)). Starting from room temperature, the strength slightly increases but significantly decreases below the onset of AFM and FE order. The decrease below $T_N$ amounts to more than $50\%$. It is clear that this effect does not result from the change in the eigenfrequency, but must be directly related to severe changes of the ionic plasma frequency which directly is related to the effective charges involved in the specific phonon mode.

Further representative examples for the temperature dependencies of phonon excitations are shown in Fig. 5 documenting the temperature dependencies of the fitting parameters for $B_{3u}(2)$ (Fig. 5(d)-(f)) and $B_{3u}(4)$ (Fig. 5(g)-(i)). $B_{3u}(2)$ exhibits a temperature dependence of the eigenfrequency which is close to what is expected for a purely anharmonic behavior. However, the damping reveals a slight increase below $100$ K. The dielectric strength decreases further.

### Table 1. Phonon eigenfrequencies $\omega_0$, ionic plasma frequencies $\Omega$ and dipolar strengths $\Delta \epsilon$ of all 7 $B_{1u}$ and 9 $B_{3u}$ modes in $\text{TbMnO}_3$ at room temperature.

#### $B_{1u}$ 7 Phonons

| Mode | $\omega_0$ [cm$^{-1}$] | $\Omega$ [cm$^{-1}$] | $\Delta \epsilon$ |
|------|------------------------|----------------------|------------------|
| 1    | 169.5                  | 301.7                | 3.19             |
| 2    | 186.7                  | 233.5                | 1.54             |
| 3    | 335.4                  | 176.5                | 0.35             |
| 4    | 377.7                  | 395.1                | 1.09             |
| 5    | 384.9                  | 705.4                | 3.44             |
| 6    | 580.4                  | 589.0                | 0.99             |
| 7    | 644.4                  | 168.4                | 0.07             |
| $\Sigma$ | | | 10.67 |

#### $B_{3u}$ 9 Phonons

| Mode | $\omega_0$ [cm$^{-1}$] | $\Omega$ [cm$^{-1}$] | $\Delta \epsilon$ |
|------|------------------------|----------------------|------------------|
| 1    | 113.7                  | 60.7                 | 0.28             |
| 2    | 186.7                  | 319.9                | 2.94             |
| 3    | 225.0                  | 494.9                | 4.84             |
| 4    | 307.0                  | 145.6                | 0.22             |
| 5    | 327.4                  | 257.1                | 0.62             |
| 6    | 401.8                  | 467.4                | 1.35             |
| 7    | 466.5                  | 569.0                | 1.49             |
| 8    | 513.9                  | 76.8                 | 0.02             |
| 9    | 567.7                  | 550.1                | 0.94             |
| $\Sigma$ | | | 1135 | 12.7 |
Excitations in multiferroic TbMnO$_3$ below 100 K and starts to increase again below the onset of AFM order. In contrast, mode B$_{3u}(4)$ decreases in eigenfrequency below 100 K (Fig. 5(g)), a rather "normal" anharmonic temperature dependence of the damping constant (Fig. 5(h)) and on cooling from room temperature an unexpected and large increase of the polar strength up to 100 K (Fig. 5(i)). From this figure it becomes clear that there is no common behavior, but instead eigenfrequencies, damping constants and polar strengths are different for each mode. A specific phonon mode involves specific bonds of neighboring ions which obviously are differently influenced by magnetic exchange as well as magnetoelectric interactions.

Similar observations can also be made for phonon excitations for E $\parallel$ c. Representative examples are documented in Fig. 6 where the left frames show the relevant fitting parameters of mode B$_{3u}(1)$ (Figs. 6(a)-(c)) and the right frames those of mode B$_{1u}(2)$ (Figs. 6(d)-(f)). Here, on decreasing temperature, both eigenfrequencies reveal a decrease below 100 K, but the observed dipolar strengths of these two modes behave drastically different: on cooling we determined an increase of mode B$_{3u}(1)$ (Fig. 6(c)), but a decrease for mode B$_{1u}(2)$ (Fig. 6(f)). The effects amount in both cases to more than 10% and seem not to be directly related to the AFM or FE phase transitions. They start at about 100 K, clearly above the appearance of any magnetic or polar order.
Finally, we discuss the total strength of all polar active modes as documented in Table 1 in order to determine the overall temperature dependence of the dielectric constants along the crystallographic a and c directions. Here, we summed over all modes. The temperature dependence of the total polar strength is shown in Fig. 7. For E || a the polar strength slightly increases and considerably drops below the AFM and FE transition. This behavior provides experimental evidence that optical weight is transferred from the phonon excitations to the electromagnons at lower wave numbers, which have not been treated explicitly in the present work. It seems clear that the growing intensity of the electromagnons just compensates for the loss of dipolar strength of the phonon modes. A closer inspection of the temperature dependencies of all 9 B3u modes documents that this transfer of optical weight at the onset of non-collinear spin order mainly results from mode B3u(1) (Δε = −0.25; see Fig. 5c)) and mode B3u(3) (Δε = −0.25; not shown). It is interesting to note, that in clear contradiction to this behavior, phonon mode B3u(2) gains strength at low temperatures (Δε = 0.2; see Fig. 5f). It would be highly interesting to find out, if in the latter case the transferred optical strength comes from spin waves via magnetoelectric interactions.

To document the fact that the temperature dependence of the dielectric constant in TbMnO3 for E || a mainly results from the modes B3u(1) and B3u(3), the sum of the dipolar strength of these two modes is indicated in Fig. 7 by the red dashed line and has been shifted by an offset to agree with the total dipolar strength of all modes at room temperature. This representation nicely demonstrates that these two modes lose intensity below the onset of spiral spin order.

Most eigenfrequencies for E || a reveal rather normal anharmonic behavior, with a smooth increase of the order of 1 or 2 cm$^{-1}$ on cooling. Significant spin-phonon coupling below the onset of magnetic order only becomes apparent for mode B3u(1), as documented in Fig. 4(a). An unexpected temperature dependence of the transverse optical modes has been deduced for modes B3u(i) with i = 6, 7, 8: In all cases the eigenfrequencies pass through a maximum roughly located at 100 K and decrease on further cooling. This decrease amounts to 2 cm$^{-1}$ for B3u(6) and approximately 1 cm$^{-1}$ for modes B3u(7) and B3u(8) (not shown).

As shown in Fig. 7 for E || c the total polar strength of all phonons and concomitantly the dielectric constant shows a significant increase towards low temperatures and saturates below 100 K. No significant anomalies are observed on passing the magnetic phase transitions. The increase of polar weight for T > 100 K mainly results from mode B1u(1) (Δε = 1.5; see Fig. 6c). This is indicated by the dash-dotted line which indicates the dielectric strength of this mode and has been shifted to coincide with the sum over all dipolar strengths for this direction at room temperature.

The almost constant total weight at low temperatures (Fig. 7) corresponds to the absence of transfer of optical weight to spin excitations. Indeed, electromagnons in multiferroic rare earth manganites only appear with polarization E || a.

For E || c, most eigenfrequencies exhibit rather canonical anharmonic behavior, with the exception of modes B1u(1) and B1u(2) (see Figs. 6a and d)). For these modes the eigenfrequencies pass through maxima at enhanced temperatures and decrease on further cooling. No anomalies show up at the magnetic transitions.

The total dielectric constant is the sum of all Δε plus the electronic contribution. We determined the electronic dielectric constant ε∞ from fits to the reflectivity as function of temperature up to 4,000 cm$^{-1}$ independently for both directions. We found no significant temperature dependence and arrived at estimates for ε∞ as 5.4 for E || a and 5.5 for E || c.

This gives estimates of the dielectric constants of 18.7 for E || a and 18.6 for E || c at low temperatures. One should have in mind that the dielectric constant for E || a does not include the contribution of the electromagnon. For E || a this result seems to be compatible with published values of measurements at lower frequencies: Kimura [11] and Pimenov [9] reported a dielectric constant ε = 24 as measured at audio or GHz frequencies respectively. If we assume that most of the weight from the 120 cm$^{-1}$ phonon excitation is transferred to the 60 cm$^{-1}$ electromagnon (see e.g. Ref. [17]), according to Fig. 6 we can estimate the contribution of the electromagnon to the low-frequency di-
electric constant to be of the order of 2 and there seems reasonable agreement between our high-frequency and the low-frequency results. For $E \parallel c$, Kimura reported values of 29 [1] or 23.5 [24], both values are considerably enhanced compared to our result.

4 Summary

Using FIR spectroscopy we studied in detail the phonon excitations for $E \parallel a$ and $E \parallel c$ and their coupling to the magnetic degrees of freedom of multiferroic TbMnO$_3$. The main results can be summarized as follows:

i) All nine $B_{3u}$ modes expected for $E \parallel a$ and the seven $B_{1u}$ modes expected for $E \parallel c$ were assigned and listed in Table 1. Almost all phonon modes reveal anomalies in their eigenfrequencies, damping constants orionic strengths. Most of these anomalies appear at the magnetic and FE phase transitions indicating magnetoelectric coupling effects. However, in some cases anomalies appear at significantly higher temperatures of about 100 K and may be linked to the Curie-Weiss temperature by spin-phonon coupling similarly to other systems with magnetic frustration [27,33]. The effects in the eigenfrequencies are of the order of 1 to 2 cm$^{-1}$ in agreement with observations in other multiferroics [39,40].

ii) The difference in frequency $\Delta \omega = \omega_{M2} - \omega_{B_{3u}(1)} \approx 20$ cm$^{-1}$ between the lowest phonon $B_{3u}(1)$ and the mode $M_2$, which emerges in the magnetically ordered phase, is almost constant with temperature and corresponds to the energy scale of the low-energy electromagnons and anti-ferromagnetic resonances. This may be an indication of a one-(electro)magnon + one phonon process.

iii) There is no apparent phonon softening close to the ferroelectric phase transition, an observation which is compatible with the assumption that ferroelectric order is driven by the onset of helical spin order and the ferroelectricity is of improper type.

iv) There is transfer of spectral weight of phonons with $E \parallel a$ to electromagnon excitations, i.e. spin waves which gain polar weight through strong magnetoelectric coupling (see Fig. 4b). In total this transfer of dielectric strength corresponds to a decrease of the dielectric constant just below the phonon frequencies of approximately 0.5 (see Fig. 7).

v) Unexpectedly, we observed a significant increase of the dielectric constant for $E \parallel c$ which results from an increase of the effective ionic plasma frequency on cooling. This observation could be a characteristic scenario for spin-driven ferroelectrics. While in displacive ferroelectrics polar order is established by a continuous softening of a transverse optical phonon mode with a concomitant increase of the static dielectric constant, it seems that in the spin-driven improper ferroelectrics an increase of the dielectric constant follows from an increase of dynamical charges indicating charge transfer processes. Recent density functional theory [41,42] and first principal calculations [43] stress the importance of conventional polar atomic displacements, but also demonstrate the importance of purely electronic contributions to the polarization, which results from a spin-orbit interaction modifying the hybridization of electronic orbitals [5].

We acknowledge fruitful discussions with A. Pimenov and Th. Kopp.

This research was supported by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG) via the Collaborative Research Center, SFB484 (Augsburg)

References

1. T. Kimura, T. Goto, H. Shintani, K. Ishizaka, T. Arima, Y. Tokura, Nature 426, 6962, 55 (2003)
2. M. Fiebig, J. Phys. D: Appl. Phys. 38(8), R123 (2005)
3. S.W. Cheong, M. Mostovoy, Nat. Mater. 6(1), 13 (2007)
4. R. Ramesh, N.A. Spaldin, Nat. Mater. 6(1), 21 (2007)
5. H. Katsura, N. Nagaosa, A. Balatsky, Phys. Rev. Lett. 95(5), 057205 (2005)
6. M. Mostovoy, Phys. Rev. Lett. 96(6), 067601 (2006)
7. I. Sergienko, E. Dagotto, Phys. Rev. B 73(9), 094434 (2006)
8. G.A. Smolenskii, I.E. Chupis, Sov. Phys. Usp. 25, 475 (1982)
9. A. Pimenov, A. Mukhin, V. Ivanov, V. Travkin, A. Balbashov, A. Loidl, Nature Physics 2(2), 97 (2006)
10. A.B. Sushkov, R.V. Aguilar, S.W. Cheong, H.D. Drew, Phys. Rev. Lett. 98(2), 027202 (2007)
11. R.V. Aguilar, A.B. Sushkov, C.L. Zhang, Y.J. Choi, S.W. Cheong, H.D. Drew, Phys. Rev. B 76(6), 060404 (2007)
12. A. Pimenov, A. Loidl, A.A. Mukhin, V.D. Travkin, V.Y. Ivanov, A.M. Balbashov, Phys. Rev. B 77(1), 014438 (2008)
13. A.B. Sushkov, M. Mostovoy, R.V. Aguilar, S.W. Cheong, H.D. Drew, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter 20(43), 434210 (2008)
14. A. Pimenov, A.M. Shuvaev, A.A. Mukhin, A. Loidl, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter 20(43), 434209 (2008)
15. Y. Takahashi, N. Kida, Y. Yamashiki, J. Fujioka, T. Aritna, R. Shimano, S. Miyahara, M. Machiko, M. Furukawa, Y. Tokura, Phys. Rev. Lett. 101(18), 187201 (2008)
16. N. Kida, Y. Yamashki, R. Shimano, T. Aritna, Y. Tokura, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. 77(12), 123704 (2008)
17. R.V. Aguilar, M. Mostovoy, A.B. Sushkov, C.L. Zhang, Y.J. Choi, S.W. Cheong, H.D. Drew, Phys. Rev. Lett. 102(4), 047203 (2009)
18. A. Pimenov, A. Shuvaev, A.A. Mukhin, A. Loidl, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter 21(34), 344209 (2008)
19. A. Pimenov, T. Rudolf, F. Mayr, A. Loidl, A.A. Mukhin, A.M. Balbashov, Phys. Rev. Lett. 102(10), 107203 (2009)
20. M. Kenzelmann, A. Harris, S. Jonas, C. Broholm, J. Schefer, S. Kim, C. Zhang, S. Cheong, O. Vajk, J. Lynn, Phys. Rev. Lett. 95(8), 087206 (2005)
21. H. Katsura, A.V. Balatsky, N. Nagaosa, Phys. Rev. Lett. 98(2), 027203 (2007)
22. D. Senff, P. Link, K. Hradil, A. Hiess, L.P. Regnault, Y. Sidis, N. Aliouane, D.N. Argyriou, M. Braden, Phys. Rev. Lett. 98(13), 137206 (2007)
23. D. Senff, N. Aliouane, D.N. Argyriou, A. Hiess, L.P. Regnault, P. Link, K. Hradil, Y. Sidis, M. Braden, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter 20(43), 434212 (2008)
Note that the excitation $M_1$ was not included in the fit routine, because it is very close to the experimental low-frequency limit and a band-fourier-filter was used to smoothen the interference fringes superimposed on the spectra due to multiple reflections in the sample.