DATA PAPER

VBORNET Gap Analysis: Sand Fly Vector Distribution Models Utilised to Identify Areas of Potential Species Distribution in Areas Lacking Records

Bulent Alten1, Veerle Versteirt2, Wim Van Bortel3, Herve Zeller3, William Wint4 and Neil Stewart Alexander4

1 Department of Biology, Hacettepe University, Ankara, Turkey
2 Avia-GIS, Zoersel, Belgium
3 European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control, Stockholm, Sweden
4 Environmental Research Group Oxford (ERGO), Department of Zoology, Oxford, OX1 3PS, UK
Corresponding author: Neil Stewart Alexander (neil.alexander@zoo.ox.ac.uk)

This is the first of a number of planned data papers presenting modelled vector distributions, the models in this paper were produced during the ECDC funded VBORNET project. This work continues under the VectorNet project now jointly funded by ECDC and EFSA. This data paper contains the sand fly model outputs produced as part of the VBORNET project. Further data papers will be published after sampling seasons when more field data will become available allowing further species to be modelled or validation and updates to existing models.

The data package described here includes those sand fly species first modelled in 2013 and 2014 as part of the VBORNET gap analysis work which aimed to identify areas of potential species distribution in areas lacking records. It comprises four species models together with suitability masks based on land class and environmental limits. The species included within this paper are *Phlebotomus ariasi*, *Phlebotomus papatasi*, *Phlebotomus perniciosus* and *Phlebotomus tobbi*.

The known distributions of these species within the project area (Europe, the Mediterranean Basin, North Africa, and Eurasia) are currently incomplete to a greater or lesser degree. The models are designed to fill the gaps with predicted distributions, to provide a) assistance in targeting surveys to collect distribution data for those areas with no field validated information, and b) a first indication of project wide distributions.

Keywords: VBORNET; Sand flies; species; distribution; habitat; Non-Linear Discriminant Analysis; Random Forest; Generalised Linear Modelling

Funding statement: This work was carried out under the VBORNET framework contract ECDC/09/018 funded by the European Centre for Disease prevention and Control (ECDC).

1. Overview

Introduction/Study Description

VBORNET [1] was an initiative of the European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control (ECDC), which ran from 2009 to 2014. The project established a European network of entomological and public health specialists in order to assist ECDC in its preparedness activities on vector-borne diseases (VBD). As part of this work a database collating validated records of key species distributions were commissioned. This data paper focusses on four sand fly species *Phlebotomus ariasi*, *Phlebotomus papatasi*, *Phlebotomus perniciosus* and *Phlebotomus tobbi* vectors of *Leishmaniasis*.

VectorNet [2] has continued this work and builds upon VBORNET by supporting the collection of data on vectors and pathogens in vectors, related to both animal and human health. VectorNet is a joint initiative of the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) and the European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control (ECDC), which started in May 2014.

Whilst VBORNET and VectorNet have made substantial progress collating European data on key vector species, the coverage is still incomplete. The 'Gap Analysis' work within these projects aims to identify those areas of likely species distribution within the project extent where there are no current data. These estimates produced by
spatial modelling techniques are intended to meet two objectives: firstly to help direct extensive VectorNet sampling efforts in the field; and secondly to provide first indications of the current likely extent and distribution of key vector species within continental Europe and its surrounding regions. It is hoped that publishing these models will aid the VectorNet network of experts to engage the wider research and professional community in the drive to expand and validate the VectorNet database. Readers are encouraged to contact the authors or visit the VectorNet website [2].

For each species probability of presence maps at the resolution of 1km were generated using a variety of well-established spatial modelling techniques available through the VECMAP system [3]. Both the input data and the resulting models were iteratively assessed by project experts and the best performing are included in this data package.

2. Context
Spatial coverage
Description: Continental Europe
Northern boundary: 71.8
Southern boundary: 33.5
Eastern boundary: 62.3
Western boundary: –11.2

Temporal coverage
Known presence up to (31/01/2013).

Species
Phlebotomus ariasi vector of Leismania infantum and phleboviruses.
Phlebotomus papatasi vector of Leismania major and phleboviruses.
Phlebotomus perniciosus vector of Leismania infantum and phleboviruses.
Phlebotomus tobbi vector of Leismania infantum, Leishmania donovani and phleboviruses.

3. Methods
For each of the species the following method was followed.

Steps
Identifying presence and absence training data
The reported distributions of each of the four sand fly species by VBORNET were used as the basis for species present training data for the analysis. Data reported from the VBORNET map published January 2013 were used for Phlebotomus perniciosus and Phlebotomus tobbi, and January 2014 for Phlebotomus ariasi and Phlebotomus papatasi. Maps of the recorded known distributions at that time are presented in Appendix 1 available within this data package. These reported distributions were recorded in VBORNET at a coarse NUTS 3 polygon scale. The data originates from a combination of both aggregated data contributed by the authors and listed contributors. As well as a literature review completed by the VBORNET vector group leaders. The full data set and sources are available to contributors of VBORNET and VectorNet.

Habitat suitability and environmental limits

The recorded distributions were too coarse to be utilised by the model framework. In addition, the selected modelling methods required information on both presence and absence to calibrate the modelling process. It was therefore necessary to identify areas of absence within NUTS 3 regions assigned as present. To do this a suitability mask at 1 km resolution was compiled by requesting experts within the network (see the Data Creators section) to identify primary, secondary and unsuitable land cover classes. For the phase two models (Ph. ariasi and Ph. papatasi) environmental limiting factors which are derived from remotely sensed imagery were also identified and used in the mask.

Environmental limits masks were created using altitude measures and temperature limits derived from the SRTM 100m Digital Elevation Model [4] and BIOCLIM [5] temperature layers respectively. Phlebotomus ariasi limits were set as the minimum altitude within a 1km square must be below 1700m. While the temperature limits were using the BIOCLIM Tmax layer between 15–32 degrees centigrade. For Ph. papatasi minimum altitude limits must be below 2000m and between 20–30 degrees centigrade using the BIOCLIM Tmax layer. Whilst these values are loosely based on laboratory findings (Personal communication with Ozge Erisoz Kasap – See Data contributors) the values were assessed visually and calibrated to account for differences between laboratory measurements of species behaviour and recorded remotely sensed values at coarse resolution.

The land cover masks were defined utilising the 100m Corine land cover dataset [6] and the 300m GLOBCOVER [7] product where no Corine data was available. Definitions of land class suitability for each species as defined by experts can be found in Tables 1 and 2.

Modelling procedure

A range of modelling techniques available in the VECMAP [3] system including Non Linear Discriminant Analysis [8], Logistic Regression [9] and Random Forests [10], using 10–25 repeated bootstraps per run, were used to provide a range of outputs for expert assessment.

The covariates offered to the modelling procedures were drawn from a standardised set of ecological parameters, and in particular a suite of Fourier processed MODIS satellite imagery [11] which provides a range of biologically interpretable variables related to levels and seasonality of temperature and vegetation related factors during the period 2000–2012. These are summarised in Table 3, and are all available to registered members of the VMerge/EDENext Data Website (www.vmergedata.com) [12].

Output layers

The suitability masked modelled outputs are produced in the form of probability maps at the pixel level with a resolution of 1 kilometre for each species. Quick view
| CORINE LABEL                                           | PHTO | PHPE | PHAR | PHPA |
|-------------------------------------------------------|------|------|------|------|
| Continuous urban fabric                              | 0    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Discontinuous urban fabric                           | 0    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Industrial or commercial units                        | 0    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Road and rail networks and associated land            | 0    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Port areas                                            | 0    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Airports                                              | 0    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Mineral extraction sites                              | 0    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Dump sites                                             | 0    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Construction sites                                    | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Green urban areas                                     | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Sport and leisure facilities                          | 0    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Non-irrigated arable land                             | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Permanently irrigated land                            | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Rice fields                                           | 1    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Vineyards                                             | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Fruit trees and berry plantations                     | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Olive groves                                          | 1    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Pastures                                              | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Annual crops associated with permanent crops          | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Complex cultivation patterns                          | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Land principally occupied by agriculture, with significant areas of natural vegetation | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Agro-forestry areas                                   | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Broad-leaved forest                                   | 1    | 1    | 1    | 0    |
| Coniferous forest                                     | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Mixed forest                                          | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Natural grasslands                                    | 1    | 0    | 0    | 1    |
| Moors and heathland                                   | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Sclerophyllous vegetation                             | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Transitional woodland shrub                           | 1    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Beaches, dunes, sands                                 | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Bare rocks                                            | 1    | 1    | 1    | 0    |
| Sparsely vegetated areas                              | 0    | 1    | 1    | 1    |
| Burnt areas                                           | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Glaciers and perpetual snow                           | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Inland marshes                                        | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Peat bogs                                             | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Salt marshes                                          | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Salines                                               | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Intertidal flats                                      | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Water courses                                         | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Water bodies                                          | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Coastal lagoons                                       | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Estuaries                                             | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |
| Sea and ocean                                         | 0    | 0    | 0    | 0    |

**Table 1**: Reclassed values defining the Corine [6]. suitability layers 1 = suitable and 0 = unsuitable. PHPE = *Phlebotomus perniciosus*, PHTO = *Phlebotomus tobbi*, PHAR = *Phlebotomus ariasi* and PHPA = *Phlebotomus papatasi*. 
Table 2: Reclassed values defining the Globcover [7], suitability layers 1 = suitable and 0 = unsuitable. PHPE = Phlebotomus perniciosus, PHTO = Phlebotomus tobbi, PHAR = Phlebotomus ariasi and PHPA = Phlebotomus papatasi.

for each vector species is available to view in Appendix 2 available within this data package.

**Sampling strategy**

Training sample point data for the model was extracted as follows:

- Random present points were created from any area within a NUTS 3 polygon recorded as present and where the suitability masked did not indicate unsuitability.
- Random absence points were selected areas from identified in the mask as unsuitable.

**Quality Control**

The model outputs were initially evaluated using the standard, and extensive, accuracy metrics (e.g. R-squared, AIC, Kappa, Confusion matrices) provided by the VECMAP [3] software. Providing the accuracy metrics indicated sufficient statistical reliability. The range of models were then sent to selected experts who were asked to choose from the selection provided. Experts included individuals listed in the Data Creator section of this paper.

In the first phase of modelling (*Ph. perniciosus* and *Ph. tobbi*) the best model selected by the experts was used as the final model for that species. During phase 2 of the modelling (*Ph. ariasi* and Ph. *Papatasi*), ensembles of the different model techniques were preferred to attempt to iron out any inherent bias within individual modelling methods. Naturally if a model was not approved by the network experts it was not included in the ensemble.

Ground truthing has yet to be completed on these models although fieldwork has been subsequently sponsored by the VectorNet project which will visit areas which have been modelled, but currently have no data available. So retrospective quality assessments should be completed in the future.
Table 3: Covariates offered to modelling procedures.

| Constraints |  |
|-------------|--|
| **Privacy**  | N/A. |
| **Ethics**   | N/A. |

4. Dataset description

Object name
https://dx.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.3426065

Data type
Processed data; Interpretation of data.

LST = Land Surface Temperature. NDVI Normalised Difference vegetation Index; EVI Enhanced Vegetation Index. DEM Digital Elevation. All files starting with ED18 are Fourier processed MODIS Satellite Imagery produced by the TALA research Group Oxford [11]. Files with Bioclim and Worldclim in filename derived from WORLDCLIM datasets [5]. GRUMP derived from population layers produced by [13]. JRC Accessibility downloaded from [14]. Length of growing Period derived from data provided by FAO, Rome. Available from www.vmerge.com [12]. All layers extracted and standardised by ERGO for EDENext (www.edenextdata.com) [15].
environmental limits used in the input suitability masks. While Bulent Alten’s extensive experience of research in the field of Phlebomines in and around Europe were extremely useful when assessing the maps and the success of the model outputs.

| Contributor | Affiliation |
|-------------|-------------|
| Alten, Bulent | Hacettepe University, Ankara, Turkey |
| Dikolli, Enkelejda | Institute of Public Health, Tirana, Albania |
| Falcuta, Elena | Cantacuzino Institute, Bucharest, Romania |
| Gunay, Filiz | Hacettepe University, Ankara, Turkey |
| Hendrickx, Guy | Avia-GIS, Belgium |
| Ilovic, Vladimir | University of Primorska, Koper, Slovenia |
| Karakus, Mehmet | Hacettepe University, Ankara, Turkey |
| Kasap, Ozge Ersoz | Hacettepe University, Ankara, Turkey |
| Kavur, Hakan | Cukurova University, Dept of Medical Parasitology, Adana, Turkey |
| Ognyan, Mikov | National Centre of Infectious and Parasitic Diseases, Parasitology and Tropical Medicine, Sofia, Bulgaria |
| Oguz, Gizem | Hacettepe University, Ankara, Turkey |
| Ozbel, Yusuf | Ege University Faculty of Medicine Department of Parasitology, Izmir, Turkey |
| Pajovic, Igor | University of Montenegro, Biotechnical Faculty, Montenegro |
| Petric, Dusan | Faculty of Agriculture, University of Novi Sad, Serbia |
| Saska, Aleksandra | Science and Research Center, Koper, Slovenia |
| Schaffner, Francis | Consultancy, France |
| Sousa, Carla A. | Instituto de Higiene e Medecina Tropical, Lisbon, Portugal |
| Zyguiene, Milda | Centre for Communicable diseases and AIDS, Vilnius, Lithuania |

**Language**

English.

**Programming language**

N/A.

**Licence**

The open licence under which the data has been deposited CC-BY.

**Accessibility criteria**

The data are distributed as GIS raster GeoTIFF formats. These formats are compatible with proprietary (ESRI ArcGIS) and open source Quantum GIS (QGIS) or R-project raster package. If the user has no suitable software already installed the authors suggest downloading the open source QGIS software free of charge from http://www.qgis.org to view these data.

A simple schematic of the data layers and directories found within this data package is shown below with descriptions where filenames are not self-explanatory:

- **Appendices** – Directory containing the appendices for this document.
  - ohd_VBNPhBD_AltenEtAl_Appendix1.pdf
  - ohd_VBNPhBD_AltenEtAl_Appendix2.pdf
- **Quickview** – Directory containing small JPEG files allowing the reader to view the data visually without specialist software.
  - appendix1mapsPHAR.jpg – VBORNET Status Phlebotomus ariasi
  - appendix1mapsPHPA.jpg – VBORNET Status Phlebotomus papatasi
  - appendix1mapsPHPE.jpg – VBORNET Status Phlebotomus perniciosus
  - appendix1mapsPHTO.jpg – VBORNET Status Phlebotomus tobbi
  - appendix2mapsPHAR.jpg – Model output Phlebotomus ariasi
  - appendix2mapsPHPA.jpg – Model output Phlebotomus papatasi
  - appendix2mapsPHPE.jpg – Model output Phlebotomus perniciosus
  - appendix2mapsPHTO.jpg – Model output Phlebotomus tobbi
- **Tiff** – Directory containing model output data for display and interrogation within GIS and geostatistical software.
  - pharMskense.tif – Model output Phlebotomus ariasi
  - phpaMskense.tif – Model output Phlebotomus papatasi
  - phpemodelMsk.tif – Model output Phlebotomus perniciosus
  - phtomodelMsk.tif – Model output Phlebotomus tobbi

*Only the tif files within this directory are listed. Other file formats of the same name within the directory are ancillary files that provide additional data to the GIS software and as a rule should be copied along with the TIFF file of the same name if you are moving the data between directories.

**Repository location**

https://dx.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.3426065

**Publication date**

If already known, the date the dataset was published in the repository (23/08/2016).
5. Reuse potential
These layers have been created in an attempt to identify probable areas of species distribution where there are currently no sample data. These maps therefore could be useful in identifying suitable areas for further sampling in an attempt to identify the true distribution of the species. The VectorNet project plans to utilise these datasets in such a way.

The covariates of the models are also mainly climate orientated. A possible avenue of further work therefore could be to use the models to assess the potential change in distribution after a shift in climate parameters.

Additional Files
The additional files for this article can be found as follows:

- Additional File 1: Appendix 1. VBORNET Reported Distributions 2013 & 2014. http://dx.doi.org/10.5334/ohd.26.s1
- Additional File 2: Appendix 2. VBORNET model output quick view. http://dx.doi.org/10.5334/ohd.26.s2

Acknowledgements
We are grateful to all VBORNET and VectorNet experts, for their contribution and in particular for fruitful discussions about vector distribution.

Competing Interests
The authors have no competing interests to declare.

References
1. VBORNET Website Available from: http://www.vbornet.eu/
2. VectorNet Website Available from: http://edc.europa.eu/en/healthtopics/vectors/VectorNet/Pages/VectorNet.aspx
3. Modelling Module in development for the VECMAP system. Produced by: Avia-GIS Zoersel Belgium; ERGO Ltd. Oxford, UK; MEDES, Toulouse, France for the European Space Agency.
4. Jarvis, A, Reuter, H I, Nelson, A and Guevara, E 2008 Hole-filled SRTM for the globe Version 4. Available from the CGIAR-CSI SRTM 90m Database (http://srtm.csi.cgiar.org).
5. Hijmans, R J, Cameron, S E, Parra, J L, Jones, P G and Jarvis, A 2005 Very high resolution interpolated climate surfaces for global land areas. International Journal of Climatology, 25: 1965–1978. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1002/joc.1276
6. Corine Land Cover 2006 Raster data: http://www.eea.europa.eu/data-and-maps/data/corine-land-cover-2006-raster-1.
7. Arino, O, Ramos Perez, J, Julio, J, Kalogirou, V, Bontemps, S, Defourny, P and van Bogaert, E 2012 Global Land Cover Map for 2009 (GlobCover 2009). © European Space Agency (ESA) & Université Catholique de Louvain (UCL). DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1594/PANGAEA.787668
8. Rogers, D J 2006 Models for vectors and vector-borne diseases. Advances in Parasitology, 62: 1–35. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/S0065-308X(05)62001-5
9. Lindsey, J K 2007 Applying Generalized Linear Models. Springer, New York.
10. Breiman, L 2001 Random Forests. Machine Learning, 45: 5–32. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1010933404324
11. Scharlemann, J P W, Benz, D, Hay, S I, Purse, B V, Tatem, A J, Wint, G R W and Rogers, D J 2008 Global data for ecology and epidemiology: a novel algorithm for temporal Fourier processing MODIS data. PLoS ONE, 3(1): e1408. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0001408
12. VMERGE Data Portal Website Available from http://www.vmergedata.com.
13. Center for International Earth Science Information Network (CIESIN)/Columbia University, International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), The World Bank and Centro Internacional de Agricultura Tropical (CIAT) 2011 Global Rural-Urban Mapping Project, Version 1 (GRUMPv1): Population Count Grid. Palisades, NY: NASA Socio-economic Data and Applications Center (SEDAC). Available from http://sedac.ciesin.columbia.edu/data/set/grump-v1-population-count (accessed 02/03/2016).
14. Nelson, A 2008 Estimated travel time to the nearest city of 50,000 or more people in year 2000. Global Environment Monitoring Unit – Joint Research Centre of the European Commission, Ispra Italy. Available from http://forobs.jrc.ec.europa.eu/products/gam/ (accessed 02/03/2016).
15. EDENext Data Portal Available from http://www.edenextdata.com.

How to cite this article: Alten, B, Versteirt, V, Bortel, W V, Zeller, H, Wint, W and Alexander, N S 2016 VBORNET Gap Analysis: Sand Fly Vector Distribution Models Utilised to Identify Areas of Potential Species Distribution in Areas Lacking Records. Open Health Data, 4: e5, DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.5334/ohd.26

Published: 19 December 2016

Copyright: © 2016 The Author(s). This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC-BY 4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited. See http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.