Bottled water quality and associated health outcomes: a systematic review and meta-analysis of 20 years of published data from China

Alasdair Cohen 1,2,*, Jingyi Cui 3, Qingyang Song 4, Qiwen Xia 3,4, Jiexuan Huang 3, Xinjia Yan 3,4, Yalu Guo 3, Yixin Sun 5, John M Colford Jr 1 and Isha Ray 2,4

1 Department of Population Health Sciences, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, 205 Duck Pond Dr Blacksburg, VA, 24061, United States of America
2 Berkeley Water Center, University of California, Berkeley, CA, United States of America
3 College of Letters and Science, University of California, Berkeley, CA, United States of America
4 Rausser College of Natural Resources, University of California, Berkeley, CA, United States of America
5 College of Engineering, University of California, Berkeley, CA, United States of America
6 School of Public Health, University of California, Berkeley, CA, United States of America
* Author to whom any correspondence should be addressed.
E-mail: alasdair.cohen@linacre.oxon.org

Keywords: bottled water, systematic review, drinking water, environmental health, China

Supplementary material for this article is available online

Abstract

Bottled water is a rapidly growing yet relatively understudied source of drinking water globally. In addition to concerns about the safety of bottled water, the adverse environmental health and social impacts associated with bottled water production, distribution, consumption, and reliance are considerable. Our objective was to comprehensively review, analyze, and synthesize ~20 years of publicly available data on bottled water quality and associated health outcomes in China. We conducted a systematic review and meta-analysis of publicly available studies of bottled water quality and associated health outcomes in China published between 1995 and early 2016 (in Chinese and English). We pre-specified and registered our study protocol, independently replicated key analyses, and followed standardized reporting guidelines. Our search identified 7059 potentially eligible records. Following screening, after full-text review of 476 publications, 216 (reporting results from 625 studies) met our eligibility criteria. Among many findings, 93.7% (SD = 10.1) of 24,585 samples tested for total coliforms (n = 241 studies), and 92.6% (SD = 12.7) of 7,261 samples tested for nitrites (n = 85 studies), were in compliance with China’s relevant bottled water standards. Of the studies reporting concentration data for lead (n = 8), arsenic (n = 5), cadmium (n = 3), and mercury (n = 3), median concentrations were within China’s standards for all but one study of cadmium. Only nine publications reported health outcome data, eight of which were outbreak investigations. Overall, we observed evidence of stable or increasing trends in the proportions of samples in compliance over the ~20 year period; after controlling for other variables via meta-regression, the association was significant for microbiological but not chemical outcomes (p = 0.017 and p = 0.115, respectively). Bottled water is typically marketed as being safe, yet in most countries it is less well-regulated than utility-supplied drinking water. Given the trend of increasing bottled water use in China and globally—and the associated environmental health impacts—we hope this work will help to inform policies and regulations for improving bottled water safety, while further highlighting the need for substantially expanding the provision of safe and affordable utility-supplied drinking water globally.
1. Background and justification

From the 1990s on, global consumption of bottled water has grown rapidly as it has expanded from markets primarily centered in high-income countries (HICs) to those in low- and middle-income countries (LMICs). The majority of the world’s bottled water is now consumed in LMICs [1]. Global growth in bottled water consumption is attributed to consumer demand—driven by perceptions that it is safe and convenient—and is fueled by widespread marketing [2]. Studies on consumer preferences in HICs find that perceived safety and convenience are the primary reasons for bottled water use [3, 4]. While utility-provided safe water access has expanded over the last few decades in most large LMICs, consumption of bottled water has increased far more rapidly [5].

Compared with water utilities that supply piped drinking water (municipal water), regulations for bottled water production in LMICs and HICs are typically less rigorous, and water quality testing and monitoring are required far less frequently. One of the few relatively extensive and publicly available studies on bottled water in the USA concluded that bottled water was not necessarily safer than tap water overall, and ~20% of the brands tested were contaminated at levels above California’s standards [6].

Beyond concerns about the safety of bottled water, the negative social and environmental health impacts associated with bottled water production, distribution, consumption, and reliance are considerable. Bottled water costs hundreds to thousands of times more per liter than treated piped water [2, 6], and the negative environmental impacts associated with single-use plastic bottle production and disposal have become a global concern [7]. Life cycle assessments of bottled water production, transportation, and associated waste help quantify the scope of adverse environmental impacts and demonstrate that contributions to greenhouse gas emissions are orders of magnitude higher than those associated with utility water supply [8, 9]. In recent years, multiple studies have found microplastic contamination to be nearly ubiquitous in surface waters, and frequently detected in bottled water samples as well [10, 11].

At this writing, we are aware of only two published bottled water focused systematic reviews. Williams et al. [12] conducted a relatively comprehensive review focused on fecal contamination in packaged and bottled water in LMICs; however, as the authors noted in their review, they did not include results from China due to the language barrier. The other systematic review focused only on fluoride concentrations in bottled water [13], but likewise did not review Chinese-language results. In addition, in a recently published non-systematic review [14] focused on emerging contaminants (including microplastics), as well as contamination attributed to the types of plastic used for water bottles, the authors did not appear to include results from Chinese-language publications. This is noteworthy when one considers that in 2013, China surpassed the USA to become the world’s largest market for bottled water by volume [15]. Furthermore, limited available data indicate that even in rural China more and more households are turning to bottled water (191 bottles) as their primary source of drinking water [16, 17].

Thus, there appears to be a substantial ‘China gap’ in the bottled water research literature. China’s population is large, its consumption of bottled water is increasing, and it has a relative wealth of publicly available data from published studies on bottled water quality—in contrast to the relatively limited bottled water focused research literature from the USA or Europe. To address this research gap, we conducted a systematic review and meta-analyses focused on bottled water contamination and associated health outcomes in China. The objective of this work was to synthesize publicly available data on bottled water contamination in China published over a period of approximately two decades, analyze data and trends, and attempt to shed light on the underlying causes of reported bottled water contamination.

2. Methods

We conducted a systematic review of published and publicly accessible studies on bottled water contamination and associated health outcomes in China. We registered our study protocol with the International Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews (PROSPERO, 2016:CRD42016048863, www.crd.york.ac.uk/prospero/display_record.php?ID=CRD42016048863) and on Open Science Framework (OSF; including our search terms, sets, code, and relevant Chinese/English translations: https://osf.io/yqbdy). All statistical analyses were conducted using Stata (v.15), and our primary analyses were independently replicated using R (v.4.0.3). This manuscript was prepared in accordance with the PRISMA reporting guidelines [18], and a completed checklist is provided in the last section of the supplementary material (SM).

2.1. Eligibility criteria

We wished to collect and analyze data from any study or investigation of bottled water quality in China. Studies were considered eligible if they measured, quantified, evaluated, assessed, or otherwise tested bottled water samples in China for microbiological and/or chemical contaminants (including heavy metals and radionuclides, but not microplastics), reported original analyses and results, were conducted during or after 1990, and were published between 1995 and early 2016. We did not limit our eligibility based on who evaluated the water quality (universities, government agencies, private companies, other) or based on the type of study design, use of comparison groups, controls, or specific water
sampling methods. For the purposes of this review, bottled water was defined as any type of packaged drinking water.

For our key outcome measures, we considered any microbiological contaminants with known links to health to be eligible (whether reported as presence/absence, percentage of samples meeting national/local standards, or mean or median concentrations), provided that such outcomes were directly assessed/measured. Studies based on qualitative descriptions of bottled water quality were not considered eligible. We used these same criteria for chemical contaminants with known or suspected links to health (organic, inorganic, radionuclieic, disinfection byproducts). Similarly, we considered any health outcomes with direct or hypothesized links to the consumption of bottled water to be eligible, provided the study also assessed at least one indicator of bottled water contamination. Additional details on our inclusion and exclusion criteria are provided in our PROSPERO protocol (2016:CRD42016048863).

2.2. Search strategy

To identify potentially eligible studies, we searched the primary Chinese-language databases, CNKI (www.cnki.net/) and Wanfang (http://librarian.wanfangdata.com.cn), as well as the online databases PubMed/MEDLINE, EMBASE, and Web of Science. We limited our searches to all records (English or Chinese) published from 1995 to April 2016, when the searches were conducted.

For CNKI, we searched titles and abstracts in six separate databases; for Wanfang we searched titles, keywords and abstracts in nine separate databases. For the Chinese-language databases we used three sets of search terms to identify all records related to: bottled water, microbiological contaminants, and/or chemical contaminants. For water contaminants (microbiological, chemical, etc) we included all parameters listed across China’s official Drinking Water Standards at the time of the search, as well as any additional parameters listed in drinking water standards of the World Health Organization and US Environmental Protection Agency.

For the databases PubMed/MEDLINE, EMBASE, and Web of Science, early piloting of our search terms and sets showed that there were very few records related to bottled water in China. Therefore, to ensure that we identified all potentially eligible records in these three databases, we used search sets and search terms for bottled water and China (all variants of the country name), and did not use search sets and terms to specify individual microbiological and chemical parameters. To ensure that we did not inadvertently overlook non-Chinese language records using the term ‘packaged water’ (rather than ‘bottled water’), a search for ‘packaged water’ and the variants of ‘China’ (e.g. ‘PR China’) was also conducted via a hand-search using Google Scholar.

All search sets and terms, as well as English translations of Chinese search terms, the search code used for database searches, as well as additional notes, are available online on OSF (at https://osf.io/yqbdy).

2.3. Record screening, data extraction, and derivation protocols

Three reviewers (XY, QX, QS) screened all available titles and abstracts to identify potentially eligible records for full-text review. For the initial record screening step, to avoid inadvertent bias from viewing author name/s, publication type, journal names, etc, only the record titles and abstracts were reviewed. Any records that, based on the content in the title and/or abstract, could have possibly discussed bottled water related analyses in China were retained. To assess inter-rater reliability and evaluate the potential need for full duplicate title/abstract screening, 100 records were selected at random and independently screened by all three reviewers (XY, QX, QS).

Five researchers (QS, QX, JC, PD, JT) reviewed all the potentially eligible full-text records to determine eligibility for data extraction. For each eligible study with extractable data, data was entered into a pre-specified data extraction template (using Google Sheets). To assess the accuracy of the data extraction, data from a random selection of ~10% of eligible full text records were extracted independently by pairs of reviewers. Following initial data review, to facilitate data cleaning three researchers (QS, QX, JC) reviewed the extracted data for all full-text records assessed to be eligible for inclusion. Given the number of parameters for which we sought to extract data, following these steps we conducted extensive quality control and data cleaning over a period of multiple years.

2.4. Data analyses

Assuming sufficient data was available, our pre-specified objective was to conduct meta-analyses for all primary contaminant classes as well as for specific contaminants, indicators of contamination, and testing methods. For our analyses of health outcomes, we anticipated that inter-study variability (resulting from differences in study designs, bottled water types, sample collection methods, analytic protocols, etc), as well as random error, would be best addressed by using meta-analysis with a random-effects based weighting. If the data structure permitted, we also pre-specified to conduct a meta-regression analysis (with random effects).

We pre-specified subgroup analyses in our protocol (and also as a means of evaluating expected heterogeneity, using standard methods such as the I-squared statistic). To assess studies by climatic region, we binned studies based on province into four categories [19]: cold and mild temperate, warm temperate, mild subtropical, and subtropical/tropical.
(see table S1 available online at stacks.iop.org/ERL/17/013003/mmedia).

We conducted meta-regression analyses to assess heterogeneity and potential confounders, using a generalized linear model with a logit link, binomial distribution, and cluster-robust standard errors (treating included eligible papers as clusters to adjust for outcomes from multiple sub-studies). For our meta-regression analyses, our outcome variable was the reported passing rate (expressed as a proportion) for all microbiological and chemical parameters for which we extracted data, and we analyzed the following covariates: the year of study publication, the study setting (rural, urban, other), the study setting climate, an indicator of provincial level economic consumption (low, medium, and high levels), the type/source of the bottled water (mineral, spring, purified, other), and the number of bottled water samples analyzed. Because many publications reported multiple results for the same parameters from different sub-studies, standard errors were adjusted to control for the clustered nature of the data.

2.5. Assessment of bias
We anticipated significant heterogeneity in study methods and reporting among those records eligible for data extraction. To assess risk of bias (ROB), we adapted approaches from previously published systematic reviews [20–22] and created a composite index based on six variables (assessing sampling methods and how study methods and protocols were reported), each of which was scored on a three-point scale (see table S2 for details). To assess potential publication bias, we used standard methods (Egger’s test, funnel plots).

3. Results

3.1. Search and screening results
Our search resulted in the identification of 7059 potentially eligible records (after duplicate removal) (figure 1). Through title and abstract screening, we identified 476 potentially eligible records. For the randomly selected sub-sample of 100 records the kappa statistic for three reviewers (XY, QX, QS) with two possible outcomes (yes, no) was 0.83 (z = 14.3, \(p < 0.001\)), indicating a very high degree of inter-rater agreement [23]; therefore, we did not conduct additional duplicate review for the title/abstract screening stage. Of the 476 records identified for full-text review, we were unable to find the full text for 39, and a further 221 were excluded for various reasons, as outlined in figure 1 (additional details in table S3).

3.2. Characteristics of eligible studies with extractable data
All 216 of the eligible records with extractable data were journal publications; 110 reported results for microbiological parameters only [24–133], 67 reported results for microbiological and chemical parameters [134–200], 30 reported results for chemical parameters only [201–230], and nine reported results for health outcomes and microbiological parameters [231–239].

As shown in table 1, of the publicly available records which were eligible for inclusion in our review, 84% (\(n = 182\)) were authored by employees from Chinese government agencies. Among these 182 records, 43% (\(n = 78\)) were published by authors from various Center for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) agencies, 29% (\(n = 53\)) by authors working at government Sanitation and Anti-Epidemic Stations, and 15% (\(n = 27\)) by authors from Institutes for Health Inspection. Sanitation and Anti-Epidemic Stations were the predecessors for today’s China CDC agencies, and Institutes for Health Inspection are affiliated with the China CDC, meaning the vast majority of studies that were eligible for inclusion in our review were conducted and published by authors from China CDC and affiliated agencies.

Across the 216 eligible papers, results from 625 studies were reported (i.e. multiple results reported for parameters based on the analysis of samples collected from different sources and locations). Most studies reported results for water quality parameters in terms of the ‘passing rate’; that is, the proportion of samples with test results that were in compliance with the relevant Chinese bottled water standards at the time of the study (the passing rate, ‘合格率’, is a commonly-used metric in China).

Of the papers that reported one or more microbiological outcomes (\(n = 186\)), only 10% (\(n = 18\)) provided specific concentrations (e.g. coliform forming units/100 ml). Of the papers that reported one or more chemical outcomes (\(n = 97\)), 28% (\(n = 27\)) reported results in terms of specific concentrations (e.g. \(\text{mg l}^{-1}\)). In addition to extracting reported data, in cases where sufficient data for passing rates and/or concentrations were reported, we also calculated concentrations and passing rates ourselves (equations for such calculations, along with notes describing where data were found, are embedded in the relevant cells in our Sm excel data file available online at stacks.iop.org/ERL/17/013003/mmedia). Summary tables for China’s primary bottled water, and drinking water, standards are provided in tables S4 and S5.

We extracted data on the location of the study by province (figure 2) and setting where study samples were collected: rural, urban or peri-urban, or a combination thereof (table 1). The majority
of studies—overall and by paper type (microbiological, chemical, microbiological and chemical, health outcomes)—were conducted in the relatively higher-income provinces along China’s coast (figure 3). We also sought to extract data on the brands of water tested, but this information was provided for only a few studies. Similarly, we attempted to extract data on the method(s) of bottled water treatment used, but only 16 eligible papers provided such information. A histogram of eligible papers by year of publication and paper type is provided in figure S1.

3.3. Microbiological outcomes
Studies that reported results for only microbiological parameters are summarized in table 2, and those that reported results for microbiological and chemical parameters are summarized in table 4. As shown in figure 4, for those studies reporting data for specific pathogens such as Salmonella, Shigella, and Staphylococcus, in almost all cases the samples were reported to be in compliance with China’s relevant bottled water standards at the time the studies were conducted (boxplots are shown in figure S2). However, for several indicators of microbiological

Figure 1. Study screening and selection flow chart.
contamination, such as total bacteria and total coliforms, many bottled water samples were assessed to exceed the relevant standards (i.e. were not in compliance).

Across microbiological parameters, most studies reported data for total bacteria and total coliforms. As shown in table 3, the mean passing rate from 297 studies of total bacteria was 71.1% (SD = 18.5), and 93.7% (SD = 10.1) for the 241 studies of total coliforms, and 88.9% (SD = 5.8) for the 17 studies of *P. aeruginosa* (see table S6 for unweighted data).

As shown in figure 5, looking at passing rate results by year of study publication, from the late 1990s to late 2000s the mean proportion of samples in compliance increased (improved) slightly for total bacteria. We did not observe evidence of strong temporal trends for total coliforms (publication-specific boxplots for both parameters in figures S3 and S4).

### 3.4. Chemical outcomes

Studies that reported results for chemical parameters are summarized in tables 4 and 5. Among chemical parameters analyzed, results for lead, arsenic, and nitrite were most commonly reported. Mean passing rates for most parameters were >95% (figure 6 and table 6) though this was not the case for nitrites (mean = 92.6%) or for disinfection byproducts (mean = 71.2%) (boxplots in figure S5 and unweighted data in table S7).

---

**Table 1.** Overview of eligible records with extractable data.

| Publication language | Microbiological and chemical only (n = 67) | Microbiological only (n = 110) | Chemical only (n = 30) | Health (n = 9) | Total (n = 216) |
|----------------------|------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------|---------------|---------------|
|                      | n | % | n | % | n | % | n | % | n | % |
| Chinese              | 67 | 100.0 | 110 | 100.0 | 26 | 86.7 | 7 | 77.8 | 210 | 97.2 |
| English              | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 4 | 13.3 | 2 | 22.2 | 6 | 2.8 |
| Primary author affiliations |                                |                               |                        |               |               |
| Government agencies | 57 | 85.1 | 97 | 88.2 | 21 | 70.0 | 7 | 77.8 | 182 | 84.3 |
| Universities        | 7 | 10.4 | 8 | 7.3 | 6 | 20.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 21 | 9.7 |
| Other (Gov. and Uni., companies) | 3 | 4.5 | 5 | 4.5 | 3 | 10.0 | 2 | 22.2 | 13 | 6.0 |
| Bottled water source |                                |                               |                        |               |               |
| Retail stores       | 12 | 21.1 | 28 | 30.4 | 19 | 76.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 59 | 32.2 |
| Schools and universities |                          |                               |                        |               |               |
| Bottled water factory | 24 | 42.1 | 32 | 34.8 | 4 | 16.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 60 | 32.8 |
| Retail and bottled water factory | 8 | 14.0 | 7 | 7.6 | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 15 | 8.2 |
| Other and multiple sources |                               |                               |                        |               |               |
| Bottled water type/s |                                |                               |                        |               |               |
| Mineral water (nfs) | 24 | 38.1 | 45 | 44.1 | 15 | 53.6 | 2 | 50.0 | 86 | 43.7 |
| Spring water        | 2 | 3.2 | 3 | 2.9 | 1 | 3.6 | 1 | 25.0 | 7 | 3.6 |
| Purified water (nfs) | 17 | 27.0 | 26 | 25.5 | 4 | 14.3 | 0 | 0.0 | 47 | 23.9 |
| Multiple (mixed sources) | 11 | 17.5 | 9 | 8.8 | 2 | 7.1 | 0 | 0.0 | 22 | 11.2 |
| Ambiguous specification |                               |                               |                        |               |               |
| Season/s study conducted |                               |                               |                        |               |               |
| Fall                | 2 | 5.9 | 6 | 12.5 | 0 | 0.0 | 1 | 11.1 | 9 | 9.2 |
| Winter              | 1 | 2.9 | 2 | 4.2 | 1 | 14.3 | 2 | 22.2 | 6 | 6.1 |
| Spring              | 3 | 8.8 | 7 | 14.6 | 1 | 14.3 | 4 | 44.4 | 15 | 15.3 |
| Summer              | 7 | 20.6 | 7 | 14.6 | 4 | 57.1 | 2 | 22.2 | 20 | 20.4 |
| Multiple            | 21 | 61.8 | 26 | 54.2 | 1 | 14.3 | 0 | 0.0 | 48 | 49.0 |
| Study location climate |                               |                               |                        |               |               |
| Cold/mild temperate | 11 | 16.4 | 18 | 16.8 | 3 | 10.7 | 1 | 11.1 | 33 | 15.6 |
| Warm temperate      | 17 | 25.4 | 31 | 29.0 | 11 | 39.3 | 1 | 11.1 | 60 | 28.4 |
| Mild subtropical    | 26 | 38.8 | 40 | 37.4 | 8 | 28.6 | 6 | 66.7 | 80 | 37.9 |
| Subtropical/tropical | 13 | 19.4 | 18 | 16.8 | 6 | 21.4 | 1 | 11.1 | 38 | 18.0 |
| Study setting       |                                |                               |                        |               |               |
| Rural               | 2 | 3.0 | 4 | 3.7 | 1 | 3.3 | 1 | 12.5 | 8 | 3.7 |
| Urban               | 30 | 44.8 | 68 | 62.4 | 19 | 63.3 | 7 | 87.5 | 124 | 57.9 |
| Mixed and other     | 35 | 52.2 | 37 | 33.9 | 10 | 33.3 | 0 | 0.0 | 82 | 38.3 |

Notes: Gov. = government; Uni. = university; BW = bottled water; nfs = not further specified.
Figure 2. Map of China with number of eligible publications with extractable data by province: all study types. Note: three publications (Wu Q 2009, Xu B 2001, and Zhang Z 2009) reported data from multiple provinces.

Figure 3. Eligible publications with extractable data by province: microbiological outcomes (a), microbiological and chemical outcomes (b), chemical (c), health outcomes (d). Note: three publications (Wu Q 2009, Xu B 2001, and Zhang Z 2009) reported data from multiple provinces.

Looking at the results from studies that measured nitrite and nitrate by year of study publication (figure 7), there is evidence of a positive trend over most of the time span covered in our review (i.e. studies reported higher average passing rates); the trend is more pronounced for nitrates than for nitrites (publication-specific boxplots in figures S6 and S7).

As discussed previously, relatively few studies reported results in terms of specific concentrations. Across the papers that did report specific concentrations for lead ($n = 8$), cadmium ($n = 3$), arsenic ($n = 5$), and mercury ($n = 3$), aside from one study reporting results for cadmium (Zhou 2016) median concentrations for these heavy metals were all in compliance with China’s national bottled
Table 2. Overview of eligible records with microbiological outcomes (n = 110).

| First author and Pub. year | Province        | Season            | Microbiological outcome/s                                      |
|-----------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|
| Cai Yitian 1996             | Hainan          | MD                | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                 |
| Chen Hanwen 2003            | Zhejiang        | Multiple          | Total bacteria                                                  |
| Chen Huixin 2002            | Shandong        | Multiple          | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                 |
| Chen Lu 2013                | Jiangsu         | Fall, Winter      | Pathogens (multiple/nfs), total bacteria, total coliforms       |
| Chen Shuhu 2014             | Henan           | MD                | Pseudomonas aeruginosa, multiple/aggregated organisms           |
| Chen Shuixian 2004          | Fujian          | Multiple          | P. aeruginosa                                                  |
| Chen Yijiang 2006           | Guizhou         | Fall              | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                 |
| Deng Meiqing 2009           | MD              | MD                | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                 |
| Duan Guilian 1997           | Shandong        | MD                | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                 |
| Duan Qiong 2015             | Sichuan         | MD                | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                 |
| Fan Xuexin 2003             | Henan           | Winter            | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                 |
| Fan Yi 2010                 | Chongqing       | Multiple          | Multiple/aggregated organisms                                   |
| Fan Zhenhua 2008            | Shanxi          | MD                | Total coliforms, total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs)       |
| Fang Ying 2004              | Hunan           | Multiple          | Total bacteria                                                  |
| Feng Baoling 1995           | Guangdong       | MD                | Total bacteria                                                  |
| Gao Zhixiang 2006           | Inner Mongolia  | Spring            | Total bacteria, multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms  |
| Gong Zhijun 2013            | Shandong        | MD                | Total bacteria, Staphylococcus aureus, Salmonella, Shigella, total coliforms |
| Gu Qian 2001                | Tianjin         | Summer            | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                 |
| He Changyun 2001            | Guangdong       | MD                | Total bacteria                                                  |
| He Lianhua 2003             | Guangdong       | MD                | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                 |
| He Yufang 2007              | Zhejiang        | MD                | Total coliforms, total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs)       |
| Huang Xia 2002              | Heilongjiang    | Multiple          | Total coliforms, pathogens (multiple/nfs), total bacteria       |
| Huang Xuezhen 2001          | Guangdong       | MD                | Total bacteria, total coliforms, pathogens (multiple/nfs)       |
| Jiang Yanwen 2008           | Guangdong       | MD                | Total coliforms, total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs)       |
| Jiang Haiyang 2015          | Guangdong       | MD                | Total coliforms, total bacteria, fecal indicator bacteria       |
| Jin Yi 2002                 | Zhejiang        | MD                | Multiple/aggregated organisms                                   |
| Ke Qin 1996                 | Xinjiang        | MD                | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                 |
| Li Fei 2013                 | Guangdong       | MD                | Enterococcus faecalis                                          |
| Li Fei 2014                 | Henan           | MD                | Multiple/aggregated organisms                                   |
| Li Hong 2002                | Fujian          | Multiple          | Total bacteria                                                  |
| Li Jie 2003                 | Fujian          | Multiple          | Multiple/aggregated organisms, pathogens (multiple/nfs), P. aeruginosa |
| Li Qunying 2001             | Shandong        | MD                | Total bacteria                                                  |

(Continued.)
| First author and Pub. year | Province | Season | Microbiological outcome/s |
|---------------------------|----------|--------|--------------------------|
| Li Xiaochun 2000          | Zhejiang | Multiple | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Li Xiugui 2001            | Guangxi  | Multiple | Total bacteria |
| Li Yan 2002               | Henan    | MD      | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Li Yi 2015                | Zhejiang | Multiple | P. aeruginosa, total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Lin Guanying 2000         | Fujian   | MD      | Total bacteria |
| Lin Jian 2001             | Fujian   | MD      | Total coliforms, total bacteria, multiple/aggregated organisms |
| Lin Xiangchun 2013        | Guangdong| Multiple | Multiple/aggregated organisms |
| Liu Cang 2014             | Zhejiang | Multiple | Total coliforms, P. aeruginosa, total bacteria |
| Liu Chengxiang 2009       | Jiangsu  | MD      | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Liu Jinghua 2001          | Tianjin  | Spring  | Total coliforms, total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs) |
| Liu Shiming 2014          | Hubei    | MD      | Multiple/aggregated organisms |
| Liu Shu 2001              | Jiangsu  | Fall    | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Liu Xiangjing 2005        | Sichuan  | MD      | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Liu Yucui 2004            | Shandong | MD      | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Liu Yinghang 2013         | Guangdong| Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Liu Yongui 1999           | Shandong | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Long Wenfang 2012         | Hainan   | MD      | Total bacteria, total coliforms, fecal indicator bacteria |
| Lu Juan 2004              | Jiangsu  | MD      | Total coliforms, total bacteria | P. aeruginosa |
| Lu Qian 1995              | Beijing  | Summer  | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Lun Lufang 2002           | Fujian   | Fall    | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Ma Qunfei 2000            | Fujian   | MD      | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Mu Zhenguo 2003           | Hebei    | Spring  | Total bacteria |
| Pan Huiming 2008          | Shanghai | Summer  | Total bacteria, fecal indicator bacteria, total coliforms |
| Pan Lizhen 2008           | Jiangsu  | MD      | Multiple/aggregated organisms |
| Qu Lianzhao 2015          | Guangdong| MD      | Multiple/aggregated organisms |
| Ren Cong 2005             | Shandong | MD      | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Ren Liju 2001             | Shandong | MD      | Multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms |
| Sao Peilan 1995           | Ningxia  | Multiple | Total coliforms, pathogens (multiple/nfs), total bacteria |
| Shao Kun 2011             | Shandong | MD      | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Shao Peilan 1997          | Ningxia  | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Shen Mingxia 2004         | Guizhou  | MD      | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Shen Qiuju 2004           | Shandong | MD      | Total bacteria |

(Continued.)
| First author and Pub. year | Province | Season | Microbiological outcome/s |
|---------------------------|----------|--------|---------------------------|
| Sheng Yunling 2014        | Shandong | Fall   | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Si Gaojung 2005           | Zhejiang | Spring | Total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs), total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Su Ping 2004              | Fujian   | Winter | Multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Sun Zhaigang 2001         | Tianjin  | Spring | Total bacteria, total coliforms, pathogens (multiple/nfs), total coliforms |
| Sun Xianlu 2009           | Henan    | Winter | Multiple Pathogens (multiple/nfs), total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Sun Kejiang 2001          | Tianjin  | Spring | Multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Su Ping 2003              | Liaoning | Winter | Total bacteria, total coliforms, pathogens (multiple/nfs) |
| Su Zhitai 2014            | Fujian   | Fall   | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Sun Kejiang 2001          | Tianjin  | Winter | Multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Su Zhitai 2014            | Fujian   | Fall   | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Sun Xianlu 2009           | Henan    | Winter | Multiple Pathogens (multiple/nfs), total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Wang Benli 2013           | Shandong | Summer | Multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Wang Fengyun 2004         | Shandong | Summer | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Wang Huijun 1998          | Zhejiang | Winter | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Wang Riwei 2012           | Shanxi   | Spring | Total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs), total coliforms |
| Wang Tianhui 2007         | Shanxi   | Winter | Multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Wang Xiaodong 2005        | Hubei    | Winter | Multiple Pathogens (multiple/nfs), total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Wang Yuqing 2014          | Tianjin  | Winter | Multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Wei Hongzhen 2014         | Guangxi  | Winter | S. aureus, Shigella, Salmonella, total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Wen Ping 2005             | Liaoning | Winter | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Wen Rui 2011              | Heilongjiang | Winter | Total bacteria, multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms |
| Xu Bin 2009               | Zhejiang | Winter | Total coliforms, total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs) |
| Xu Ke 2014                | Inner Mongolia | Winter | Total coliforms, total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Yan Yong 2002             | Shandong | Winter | Multiple/aggregated organisms, total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Yang Yue 1996             | Beijing  | Winter | Total bacteria, total coliforms |
| Yang Zhongyi 2004         | Zhejiang | Winter | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Zhao Yi 2003              | Liaoning | Winter | Total coliforms, total bacteria |

(Continued.)
| First author and Pub. year | Province       | Season | Microbiological outcome/s                                                                 |
|---------------------------|----------------|--------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Yu Chunhui 2002           | Shandong       | Spring | Multiple/aggregated organisms, *P. aeruginosa*, pathogens (multiple/nfs)                   |
| Zeng Aihua 2012           | Guangdong      | Multiple| Viral pathogens                                                                           |
| Zeng Changying 2003       | Sichuan        | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                                            |
| Zhang Jian 2004           | Guangdong      | Spring | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                            |
| Zhang Jianhua 2000        | Henan          | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                            |
| Zhang Lixin 2003          | Heilongjiang   | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                            |
| Zhang Weina 2015          | Heilongjiang   | Multiple| Multiple/aggregated organisms                                                              |
| Zhang Zhaoqiang 2004      | Hunan          | MD     | Multiple/aggregated organisms                                                              |
| Zhang Zhiyi 2009          | Multiple       | Summer | Protozoal pathogens (\(^\text{b}\)multiple = Liaoning and Tianjin)                        |
| Zhao Hong 2005            | Liaoning       | Multiple| Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                            |
| Zhao Hui 1996             | Gansu          | MD     | Pathogens (multiple/nfs)                                                                  |
| Zhao Yong 2008            | Liaoning       | Multiple| Total coliforms, total bacteria                                                            |
| Zhen Honghui 1999         | Guangxi        | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                                            |
| Zheng Yumei 2002          | Guizhou        | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                            |
| Zhou Shuangqiao 2002      | Liaoning       | MD     | Total bacteria                                                                            |

Notes: nfs = not further specified; MD = missing data.
Figure 4. Passing rate means and 95% confidence intervals (CI) for selected microbiological parameters.

Table 3. Summary statistics for reported passing rates for selected microbiological parameters.

| Parameter                        | Median | Mean  | SD of mean | Total studies | Total samples |
|----------------------------------|--------|-------|------------|---------------|---------------|
| Total bacteria                   | 75.3   | 71.1  | 18.5       | 297           | 28 109        |
| Total coliforms                  | 98.7   | 93.7  | 10.1       | 241           | 24 585        |
| Fecal indicator bacteria         | 100    | 96.5  | 8.2        | 6             | 543           |
| Pathogens (multiple/nfs)         | 100    | 97.4  | 8.7        | 76            | 4617          |
| P. aeruginosa                    | 91.4   | 88.9  | 5.8        | 17            | 4815          |
| Salmonella                       | 100    | 100   | 0          | 14            | 725           |
| Shigella                         | 100    | 100   | 0          | 14            | 725           |
| S. aureus                        | 100    | 99.9  | 0.5        | 14            | 725           |
| E. faecalis                      | 100    | 96.9  | 3.6        | 10            | 130           |
| Multiple/aggregated organisms    | 88.9   | 81.0  | 19.2       | 107           | 7077          |

Notes: nfs = not further specified. Statistics weighted by study sample sizes. Excludes results from eight publications reporting results from outbreak investigations.

As shown in figure 9, across these four case-control outbreak investigations, consumption of bottled water was significantly associated with an increase in the pooled odds of reported gastrointestinal illness (logged OR = 1.90, p < 0.001). However, because these investigations were conducted in response to disease outbreaks, and focused on student populations, the results are not generalizable to more typical situations and settings.

Funnel plot asymmetry indicated some evidence of potential publication bias (see figure S8). It is reasonable to assume that similar case-control studies with null findings may have been conducted over this time period, but were perhaps not submitted for publication. More broadly, the nature of these studies limits our ability to generalize beyond outbreak settings.

3.6. Meta-regression
As shown in table 8, results from meta-regression analyses indicated that, after controlling for other variables in the models, reported passing rates for microbiological and chemical outcomes were positively associated with the year of study publication,
though the association was only statistically significant for microbiological outcomes, and not for chemical outcomes ($p = 0.017$ and $p = 0.115$, respectively) (model-predicted passing rates for both outcomes in figures S9 and S10). Reported passing rates were significantly lower (i.e. worse) for studies conducted in rural regions compared with urban and other settings, for both microbiological and chemical outcomes ($p = 0.041$ and $p = 0.002$, respectively); however, relatively few studies ($n = 13$ and $n = 2$, respectively) were conducted in primarily rural settings (table S8).

4. Discussion

4.1. Results in context: climate and economic indicators
We observed some evidence of differences in mean passing rates for microbiological outcomes, but not for chemical outcomes, by climatic region (table 9 and figure S11). This observation of higher overall passing rates in warmer and wetter regions (i.e. more samples found to be in compliance compared with cold/mild and warm regions) is potentially at odds with previous drinking-water focused research which found higher overall prevalence of fecal indicator organisms in wetter and warmer conditions [240]; though this would likely depend, among other factors, on bottled water storage durations prior to testing (and we lacked the data needed to evaluate this potential association).

To evaluate the potential impacts of broader economic indicators and socioeconomic status by study setting, we used 2012 Household Consumption Expenditure data from China’s National Bureau of Statistics [241] as a comparative indicator of economic status by province. After sorting provinces into thirds based on this expenditure data, we observe that for microbiological outcomes the mean passing rate from studies conducted in provinces with lower annual consumption expenditures (RMB 8–15 × 10⁷) was significantly lower compared with the mean from provinces with higher (RMB > 20 × 10⁷) consumption expenditures (80.1% and 86.8%, respectively; ANOVA, using analytic weights based on sample size, Scheffe’s test, $p < 0.001$). No significant differences in passing rates by levels of consumption expenditures were observed for chemical outcome data (table S9). However, after controlling for other covariates in our meta-regression models (table 8), we did not observe any significant associations between these economic indicators and overall passing rates.

4.2. Results in context: bottled water characteristics
Compared with mineral, spring, and other types of bottled water, results from the meta-regression show that passing rates were higher for samples from ‘purified’ bottled water, and the associations were statistically significant for both microbiological and chemical outcomes ($p = 0.021$ and $p = 0.014$, respectively). However, bivariate analysis of passing rates and
Table 4. Overview of eligible records with microbiological and chemical outcomes ($n = 67$).

| First author and publication year | Province | Season | Microbiological outcome/s | Chemical outcome/s |
|-----------------------------------|----------|--------|---------------------------|--------------------|
| Ao Zhixiong 2003                  | Fujian   | Summer | Total bacteria            | Nitrite            |
| Cao Changhui 2006                 | Shandong | Summer | Total bacteria            | Nitrite            |
| Cui Xiangshu 2011                 | Jilin     | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms | Nitrate, fluoride, other heavy metals |
| Dou Caihong 2010                   | Liaoning | Multiple | Multiple/aggregated organisms | Multiple parameters |
| Gao Ruiyun 2011                    | Shandong | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs), multiple/aggregated organisms | Arsenic, lead, nitrate, other heavy metals, fluoride, trichloromethane (chloroform), cadmium |
| Ge Limin 2005                      | Liaoning | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria, Pathogens (multiple/nfs) | Nitrite, alkali/alkaline earth metals |
| Gong Yiyuan 2008                   | Sichuan  | Multiple | Total coliforms, total bacteria, Salmonella, *S. aureus*, Shigella | Nitrite, arsenic, chlorine (nfs), other heavy metals |
| He Wujun 2000                      | Jiangsu  | Multiple | Total coliforms, total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs) | Nitrite, lead, arsenic |
| Huang Yuanxin 1995                 | Guangxi  | Summer | Total coliforms, total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs) | Lead, arsenic, other heavy metals |
| Jiang Yonghong 2000                | Guangxi  | Multiple | Total bacteria | Nitrite, chlorine (nfs), lead, arsenic, other heavy metals, trichloromethane (chloroform), carbon tetrachloride |
| Kang Fengchun 2014                 | Shandong | Multiple | Total bacteria | Other |
| Li Caixian 2003                    | Guangdong| MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms | Nitrite, lead, volatile phenols, other heavy metals |
| Li Jing 2008                       | Liaoning | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms | Nitrite |
| Li Ruiying 1996                    | Shandong | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms, Salmonella, Shigella, *S. aureus* | Arsenic, lead, nitrate, nitrite, other heavy metals |
| Li Ruiying 2003                    | Shandong | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms | Nitrate |
| Liang Yongzhu 2003                 | Shandong | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms | Nitrite, lead, arsenic, other heavy metals |
| Lin Meiyun 2005                    | Fujian   | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms, pathogens (multiple/nfs), multiple/aggregated organisms | Multiple parameters |
| Lin Meiyun 2009                    | Fujian   | MD     | Multiple/aggregated organisms | Multiple parameters |
| Lin Shengqing 1996                 | Fujian   | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms | Nitrite |
| Lin Xiaohong 2010                  | Fujian   | Winter | Total bacteria, total coliforms | Nitrite, ammoniacal nitrogen |
| Lin Xijian 2003                    | Hunan    | Fall   | Total bacteria, total coliforms | Nitrate |
| Lin Yizhi 2011                     | Guangdong| Summer | Total coliforms, multiple/aggregated organisms | Chlorine (nfs) |

(Continued.)
| First author and publication year | Province      | Season | Microbiological outcome/s                                                                 | Chemical outcome/s                                                                 |
|----------------------------------|---------------|--------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Liu Maoqiang 2013               | Shandong      | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms, multiple/aggregated organisms                           | Nitrite, nitrate                                                                  |
| Liu Meiqin 2012                 | Shandong      | Multiple| Multiple/aggregated organisms                                                           | Nitrate, chlorine (nfs)                                                           |
| Liu Ruqing 2003                 | Guangdong     | Spring | Total bacteria                                                                            | Nitrate                                                                          |
| Liu Shaojun 2006                | Fujian        | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                          | Nitrate, nitrite, arsenic, lead, mercury, cadmium, chlorine (nfs), fluoride, other heavy metals |
| Liu Suyi 2003                   | Fujian        | Multiple| Total bacteria, total coliforms, fecal indicator bacteria, Pathogens (multiple/nfs)     | Lead, chlorine (nfs), nitrite                                                     |
| Liu Xuehua 2001                 | Shandong      | Spring | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                                           | Lead, arsenic, trichloromethane (chloroform), other heavy metals, carbon tetrachloride |
| Ma Liangcai 2000                | Jiangsu       | Multiple| Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                          | Nitrate                                                                          |
| Ma Qunfei 2001                  | Fujian        | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                                           | Nitrate                                                                          |
| Ma Qunfei 2002                  | Fujian        | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                                           | Other                                                                            |
| Mou Sheng 2001                  | Yunnan        | MD     | Multiple/aggregated organisms                                                             | Nitrate                                                                          |
| Niu Zhirui 2013                 | Shaanxi       | MD     | Total coliforms                                                                           | Lead, arsenic, cyanide, trichloromethane (chloroform), carbon tetrachloride, volatile phenols, other heavy metals |
| Peng Jingxian 2008              | Inner Mongolia| MD     | Total coliforms                                                                           | Lead, arsenic, cyanide, carbon tetrachloride, volatil e phenols, other heavy metals |
| Peng Shasha 2004                | Henan         | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria, Pathogens (multiple/nfs)                                 | Lead, arsenic, cyanide, carbon tetrachloride, chloroform (nfs), volatile phenols, other heavy metals |
| Sha Jihui 2007                  | Fujian        | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria                                                           | Nitrate                                                                          |
| Sun Liping 2009 A               | Inner Mongolia| MD     | Total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs)                                                  | Nitrate, arsenic, lead, other heavy metals                                        |
| Sun Yang 2001                   | Guangdong     | Multiple| Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                           | Lead, arsenic, cyanide, trichloromethane (chloroform), carbon tetrachloride, chlorine (nfs), volatil e phenols, nitrite, other heavy metals |
| Wang Dalilang 2013              | Sichuan       | Multiple| Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                           | Multiple parameters                                                               |
| Wang Guangxu 2009               | Liaoning      | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                           | Alkali/alkaline earth metals                                                      |
| Wang Liping 2000                | Jiangsu       | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                           | Nitrate, volatile phenols, cyanide                                               |
| Wang Lishen 2010                | Guangdong     | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                           | Lead, arsenic, mercury, various light metals, other heavy metals                  |
| Wang Mingzhu 1999               | Shandong      | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                           | Arsenic, nitrite, lead, other heavy metals                                       |
| Wang Shuyuan 2003               | Yunnan        | Multiple| Total bacteria, total coliforms                                                           | Arsenic, lead, other heavy metals                                               |
| Wang Xiaofeng 2007              | Jiangsu       | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs)                                 | Nitrate, chlorine (nfs)                                                           |
| First author and publication year | Province       | Season | Microbiological outcome/s                      | Chemical outcome/s                                      |
|----------------------------------|----------------|--------|-----------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------|
| Wang Yan 2002                   | Heilongjiang   | Summer | Total coliforms, total bacteria                | Lead, nitrate, arsenic, other heavy metals              |
| Wang Yumei 2011                 | Inner Mongolia | MD     | Total bacteria, S. aureus, total coliforms, Salmonella, Shigella | Volatile phenols, nitrite                               |
| Wang Zhengzi 2015               | Jilin          | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria                | Nitrater, lead                                          |
| Wu Hongmei 2003A                | Henan          | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms               | Arsenic, nitrate, nitrite, cyanide, fluoride, cadmium, lead, other heavy metals |
| Wu Hongmei 2003B                | Henan          | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms, pathogens     | Arsenic, lead, nitrite                                  |
| Wu Huigang 2002                 | Guangdong      | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms, pathogens    | Arsenic, mercury, lead, cyanide, volatile phenols, fluoride, nitrite, other heavy metals, chlorine (nfs), cadmium |
| Ying Liang 2007                 | Shanghai       | MD     | Total bacteria                                | Lead, carbon tetrachloride, trichloromethane (chloroform) |
| Yu Peng 2009                    | Shandong       | Summer | Total coliforms, total bacteria, Salmonella, Shigella, S. aureus | Arsenic, nitrite                                        |
| Yuan Ping 2011                  | Henan          | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms               | Nitrate, lead                                           |
| Zhang Guanfeng 2006             | Guangdong      | Spring | Total bacteria, pathogens (multiple/nfs)      | Nitrate, arsenic, carbon tetrachloride, trichloromethane (chloroform), lead, other heavy metals |
| Zhang Runsheng 2013             | Inner Mongolia | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms               | Arsenic, lead, other heavy metals                      |
| Zhang Weina 2012                | Henan          | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms               | Nitrater, lead, arsenic, other heavy metals            |
| Zhang Xiaodan 2013              | Shanghai       | Multiple | Total bacteria, total coliforms               | Other                                                   |
| Zhang Yongqing 2012             | Guangdong      | Multiple | P. aeruginosa                                 | Disinfectant byproducts                                 |
| Zhen Yin 2004                   | Jiangsu        | Fall   | Total bacteria, total coliforms               | Nitrater, chlorine (nfs)                                |
| Zheng Daikun 2002               | Chongqing      | MD     | Multiple/aggregated organisms                 | Nitrate, cyanide, alkali/alkaline earth metals         |
| Zheng Xiaoyan 1998              | Fujian         | Summer | Total bacteria, total coliforms, pathogens    | Nitrate                                                 |
| Zheng Xiaoyan 1999              | Fujian         | MD     | Total bacteria, multiple/aggregated organisms | Multiple parameters                                    |
| Zhou Lubin 2010                 | Fujian         | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria, Salmonella, S. aureus, Shigella | Lead, arsenic, nitrite                                  |
| Zhou Xiaohong 2011              | Zhejiang       | MD     | Total bacteria, total coliforms, pathogens    | Lead, arsenic, nitrite, other heavy metals              |
| Zhu Jiawen 2005                 | Jiangsu        | Multiple | Total bacteria                                | Chlorine (nfs), nitrite                                 |
| Zhu Xiaohui 2013                | Guangdong      | MD     | Total coliforms, total bacteria, fecal indicator bacteria | Various light metals, other heavy metals                |

Notes: nfs = not further specified; MD = missing data.
Table 5. Overview of eligible records with chemical and related outcomes (n = 30).

| First author and publication year | Province    | Season | Chemical and related outcome/s                                      |
|----------------------------------|-------------|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Chen Tao 2014                    | Beijing     | MD     | Radiation (alpha, beta, other)                                      |
| Gao Xue 2015                     | Hebei       | MD     | Organic chloride pesticides                                        |
| Guo Yicao 1999                   | Guangdong   | MD     | Radiation (alpha, beta, other)                                      |
| Huang Yeru 1999                  | Beijing     | MD     | Benzene, trichloromethane (chloroform)                              |
| Jing Yanyan 2015                 | Beijing     | Summer | Cyanide, lead, volatile phenols, ammoniacal nitrogen, nitrate, cadmium, fluoride, arsenic, mercury, other heavy metals |
| Lan Zhongzhou 2002               | Shandong    | MD     | Nitrite                                                             |
| Li Jian 2008                     | Jiangsu     | Multiple | Lead, other heavy metals, various light metals, alkali/alkaline earth metals, cadmium |
| Li Jun 2014                      | MD          | MD     | Organophosphate flame retardants                                    |
| Li Xu 2010                       | Guangdong   | MD     | Phenols                                                             |
| Liang Wei 2012                   | Jiangsu     | MD     | Disinfection byproducts                                             |
| Lin Guocan 2013                  | Fujian      | MD     | Radiation (alpha, beta, other)                                      |
| Lin Lixiong 2010                 | Guangdong   | MD     | Radiation (alpha, beta, other)                                      |
| Lin Yuna 2009                    | Guangdong   | MD     | Disinfection byproducts                                             |
| Lin Zhi 1995                     | Hainan      | MD     | Radiation (alpha, beta, other)                                      |
| Ma Wei 2004                      | Tianjin     | MD     | Fluoride                                                            |
| Song Chunmei 2012                | Jilin       | MD     | Nitrite                                                             |
| Sun Lili 2004                    | Guangdong   | MD     | Fluoride                                                            |
| Sun Liping 2009B                 | Inner Mongolia | MD | Other                                                                |
| Tong Jun 2009                    | Shanghai    | MD     | Disinfection byproducts                                             |
| Wang Hexing 2012                 | Shanghai    | Summer | Phenols                                                             |
| Wang Xiaoting 2015               | Shanxi      | MD     | Volatile organic compounds (VOCs), trichloromethane (chloroform), benzene |
| Wu Li 1998                       | Henan       | MD     | Radiation (alpha, beta, other)                                      |
| Wu Qian 2010                     | Multiple<sup>a</sup> | Winter | Perchlorate (*multiple* = Shandong, Liaoning, Shanghai, Henan, Beijing, Yunnan, Tianjin, Jiangxi, Sichuan, Shanxi, Guangdong) |
| Xu Hongyin 2015                  | Inner Mongolia | MD | Disinfection byproducts                                             |
| Xu Renji 2010                    | MD          | MD     | Alkal/alkaline earth metals                                        |
| Xu Zhengsheng 2012               | Anhui       | Summer | Benzene, trichloromethane (chloroform)                              |
| Zeng Zhiding 2011                | Fujian      | MD     | Arsenic, nitrite, other                                             |
| Zhang Shufang 2009               | Henan       | Summer | Disinfection byproducts                                             |
| Zhou You 2016                    | Chongqing   | MD     | Lead, cadmium, other heavy metals, arsenic, mercury                  |
| Zhuang Guidong 1997              | Shandong    | Spring | Nitrite                                                             |

Note: MD = missing data.

bottled water type did not indicate substantive differences in this regard (see table S10).

With regard to the size of the water bottles sampled, we did not observe any significant differences in mean passing rates for chemical outcomes and bottle size (table 10). However, for studies reporting microbiological outcomes based on samples from smaller water bottles (<2 l), the mean passing rate (72.1%) was more than 10% points lower than the mean passing rate (83.4%) from studies of larger water bottles (>10 l) (Analysis of variance [ANOVA], using analytic weights based on sample size, Scheffe’s test, p < 0.001 for comparison between small and large categories). These findings with regard to small versus large bottles and microbiological passing rates are somewhat at odds with previous research (outside of China) which found more evidence of microbiological contamination in larger water bottles [12]. Whereas 131 papers reported the size of the water bottles sampled in qualitative terms (e.g. ‘small’, ‘large’), only 21 papers reported the specific size of the bottles in number of liters. For those papers (n = 21), the data are suggestive of higher levels of microbiological contamination (i.e. lower passing rates) in larger bottles, but the differences between smaller bottles (<1 l) and large (>~19 l) was not significant (see figure S12). With regard to contamination and risks of exposure associated with the use of small- or large-sized bottles, most Chinese households who use large water bottles heat or boil the water before consuming it, a practice that would be expected to reduce pathogen exposure [22,24]; this is not typically the case with small, single-use, water bottles. That
Bottled water samples in compliance with China’s standards

Studies reporting chemical parameters & associated passing rates

| Parameter                        | Median | Mean  | SD of mean | Total studies | Total samples |
|----------------------------------|--------|-------|------------|---------------|---------------|
| Nitrite                          | 97.6   | 92.6  | 12.7       | 85            | 7261          |
| Nitrate                          | 97.3   | 95.3  | 8.6        | 30            | 2361          |
| Fluoride                         | 91.6   | 95.1  | 4          | 17            | 1589          |
| Cyanide                          | 100    | 99.8  | 1.3        | 13            | 1019          |
| Disinfection byproducts<sup>a</sup> | 57.9   | 71.2  | 17.9       | 23            | 973           |
| Mercury                          | 100    | 100   | 0          | 7             | 253           |
| Arsenic                          | 100    | 99.8  | 0.4        | 49            | 4525          |
| Carbon tetrachloride             | 99.6   | 99.3  | 0.7        | 7             | 1108          |
| Cadmium                          | 100    | 100   | 0          | 11            | 521           |
| Ammoniacal nitrogen              | 100    | 100   | 0.1        | 1             | 18            |
| Volatile phenols                 | 100    | 99.4  | 0.9        | 11            | 1236          |
| Chlorine (nfs)                   | 96.6   | 96.8  | 2.2        | 18            | 1828          |
| Phenols                          | 100    | 100   | 0          | 3             | 63            |
| Radiation (alpha, beta, other)   | 99.7   | 99.1  | 1.7        | 8             | 1292          |
| Lead                             | 100    | 99.4  | 1.1        | 52            | 4880          |
| Other heavy metals               | 100    | 99.5  | 1.1        | 122           | 8786          |
| Various light metals             | 100    | 100   | 0          | 9             | 338           |
| Trichloromethane (chloroform)    | 97.7   | 97.8  | 1.9        | 8             | 1197          |

Notes: nfs = not further specified. Statistics weighted by study sample sizes.
<sup>a</sup> Study authors reported aggregated results using this classification, with insufficient available data to extract ‘passing rate’ results for specific organisms or indicators.

Figure 6. Passing rate means and 95% confidence intervals (CI) for selected chemical parameters.

### Table 6. Summary statistics for reported passing rates for selected chemical parameters.

Note: Diamonds are weighted averages based on sample sizes from individual studies, lines show 95% CIs.

said, because larger bottles are not typically consumed immediately after being opened, consumption over a period of days or weeks could provide more time for organism growth if the bottled water was already contaminated when purchased, or became so after the bottle was opened. Overall then, we cannot draw clear conclusions from these data with respect to relationships between bottled water size and reported passing rates.

### 4.3. Methodological rigor and risk of bias analysis

Studies were assigned an ROB score based on six items (table S2) and were then divided into thirds and assigned to groups for low, medium, and high ROB
Figure 7. Samples in compliance for nitrate and nitrite by publication year.

Notes: Circle size is proportional to number of samples per study I Dashed lines mark revisions to China’s BW Standards in 1998 & 2003 I Jitter = 5
For improved visualization excludes Nitrite compliance rate = 7.8% from Lan et al. (2002)

Figure 8. Boxplots of reported concentrations by study for lead (a), cadmium (b), arsenic (c), and mercury (d), with references to China’s national maximum contaminant standards for bottled water (GB19298-2003) (red dashed lines) (additional details in table S4).
Table 7. Overview of eligible records with health and microbiological outcomes (n = 9).

| First author and publication year | Province | Season | Study type/design | Health outcome | Microbiological outcome/s |
|-----------------------------------|----------|--------|-------------------|----------------|---------------------------|
| Cohen Alasdair 2015               | Guangxi  | Summer | Observational/cross-sectional | Gastroenteritis (diarrhea) | Fecal indicator bacteria (thermotolerant coliforms) Total bacteria, pathogenic bacteria (nfs), total coliforms |
| Liu Li 2008                      | Jilin     | Summer | Outbreak/unclear   | Gastroenteritis | Total coliforms, norovirus, total bacteria |
| Shen Jichuan 2011                | Zhejiang  | Spring | Outbreak/case-control | Gastroenteritis | Total coliforms, norovirus, total bacteria |
| Song Jianqiang 2015              | Zhejiang  | Winter | Outbreak/unclear   | Gastroenteritis (norovirus) | Total bacteria, total coliforms, norovirus |
| Song Jie 2014                    | Hebei     | Spring | Outbreak/unclear   | Gastroenteritis (norovirus) | Total bacteria, norovirus |
| Wang Jie 2015                    | Zhejiang  | Winter | Outbreak/case-control | Gastroenteritis | Total coliforms, *Escherichia coli*, total bacteria |
| Wang Ruiping 2012                | Jiangxi   | Spring | Outbreak/case-control | Gastroenteritis | Enterovirus, total coliforms, calicivirus, adenovirus, total bacteria, astrovirus, rotavirus, norovirus, *E. coli*, pathogenic bacteria (nfs), total bacteria |
| Wu Wei 2014                      | Jiangxi   | Spring | Outbreak/case-control | Gastroenteritis | Total coliforms, total bacteria |
| Zhang Rensen 2012                | Fujian    | Fall   | Outbreak/unclear   | Gastroenteritis | Total coliforms, total bacteria |

Note: nfs = not further specified.

Outbreak investigations: Case-control studies of bottled water consumption & gastroenteritis

| Author, Year | Study Location | Sample Size | Logged OR (95% Cl) | Weight (%) |
|--------------|----------------|-------------|-------------------|------------|
| Wang, Ruiping 2012 | University | 205 | 1.41 (0.60, 2.22) | 36.03 |
| Wu, Wei 2014 | University | 210 | 2.04 (1.23, 2.84) | 36.70 |
| Wang, Jie 2015 | High School | 138 | 2.26 (1.84, 3.05) | 5.80 |
| Shen, Jichuan 2011 | Primary & Middle School | 440 | 2.51 (1.71, 3.71) | 5.48 |
| Overall (I-squared = 0.0%, p = 0.455) | | | 1.02 (1.39, 2.40) | 100.00 |

Note: Study weights are based on random effects analysis.

Figure 9. Forest plot—case-control studies of bottled water consumption and gastroenteritis.

Looking at passing rate trends by publication year, for studies assessed to have a higher ROB (i.e. a higher likelihood of methodological shortcomings or other limitations) the average reported passing rates were lower overall (i.e. worse) compared with studies assessed to have a medium or low ROB for microbiological and chemical outcomes (figures S14 and S15).

One of the components used to estimate ROB was study sample size. As shown in table 8 (and table S12), we did not observe significant differences in mean passing rates for microbiological outcomes based on the number of bottled water samples used in the underlying studies. However, for studies reporting chemicals outcomes based on relatively large sample sizes (i.e. ≥61 bottled water samples)
Table 8. Meta-regression results for proportion of microbiological and chemical samples in compliance.

| Variable                                         | Coef.       | SEa | p-value | Coef.       | SEa | p-value |
|--------------------------------------------------|-------------|-----|---------|-------------|-----|---------|
| Year of study publication                        | 0.042       | 0.018 | 0.017   | 0.062       | 0.039 | 0.115   |
| Study setting: rural (vs other)                   | -1.089      | 0.533 | 0.041   | -2.214      | 0.711 | 0.002   |
| Study setting: urban (vs other)                   | -0.173      | 0.171 | 0.311   | 0.201       | 0.375 | 0.592   |
| Climate: warm/temperate (vs cold)                 | 0.476       | 0.296 | 0.107   | 0.005       | 0.608 | 0.993   |
| Climate: mild/subtropical (vs cold)               | 0.472       | 0.286 | 0.099   | 1.264       | 0.550 | 0.022   |
| Climate: subtropical/tropical (vs cold)           | 0.742       | 0.341 | 0.030   | 1.054       | 1.049 | 0.315   |
| Mid-level economic status (vs lower)              | -0.098      | 0.258 | 0.311   | 0.201       | 0.375 | 0.538   |
| Higher-level economic status (vs other)           | 0.319       | 0.171 | 0.092   | 0.201       | 0.375 | 0.538   |
| BW type/source: mineral (vs other)                | -0.011      | 0.212 | 0.957   | 0.005       | 0.608 | 0.993   |
| BW type/source: spring (vs other)                 | 0.349       | 0.152 | 0.211   | 0.880       | 0.358 | 0.014   |
| Number of BW samples                              | -0.000      | 0.000 | 0.815   | 0.000       | 0.000 | 0.871   |
| Model: number of observations                     | 748         |      |         | 573         |      |         |
| Model: number of clusters (papers)               | 154         |      |         | 76          |      |         |

Note: Excludes results from eight publications reporting results from outbreak investigations; BW = bottled water.

*a Cluster-robust standard errors (to adjust for publications reporting results from multiple studies).

Table 9. Passing rates for microbiological and chemical outcomes by study climatic region.

| Climatic region      | Median | Mean  | SD    | Studies |
|----------------------|--------|-------|-------|---------|
| **Microbiological outcomes** |        |       |       |         |
| Cold/mild temper      | 81.0   | 78.9  | 21.8  | 117     |
| Warm temperate        | 81.2   | 78.8  | 20.4  | 201     |
| Mild subtropical      | 90.6   | 85.3  | 16.4  | 334     |
| Subtrop/tropical      | 99.0   | 90.2  | 15.1  | 143     |
| **Chemical outcomes** |        |       |       |         |
| Cold/mild temper      | 97.9   | 95.9  | 6.1   | 89      |
| Warm temperate        | 100    | 96.6  | 10.4  | 140     |
| Mild subtropical      | 100    | 97.5  | 5.3   | 209     |
| Subtrop/tropical      | 98.9   | 96.1  | 8.9   | 155     |

Notes: Means and standard deviations adjusted using sample size based weights. Excludes results from eight publications reporting results from outbreak investigations.

Table 10. Passing rates for microbiological and chemical outcomes by bottled water size.

| Bottled water size    | Median | Mean  | SD    | Studies |
|----------------------|--------|-------|-------|---------|
| **Microbiological outcomes** |        |       |       |         |
| Small (<2 l)          | 62.1   | 72.1  | 20.8  | 89      |
| Large (>10 l)         | 91.4   | 83.4  | 18.3  | 339     |
| Small and largea      | 95.7   | 88.1  | 14.2  | 99      |
| **Only total coliforms** |        |       |       |         |
| Small (<2 l)          | 83.0   | 80.9  | 18.2  | 35      |
| Large (>10 l)         | 95.2   | 94.3  | 7.3   | 106     |
| Small and large       | 98.7   | 98.1  | 2.7   | 23      |
| **Chemical outcomes** |        |       |       |         |
| Small (<2 l)          | 100    | 96.9  | 11.9  | 111     |
| Large (>10 l)         | 100    | 97.2  | 5.8   | 252     |
| Small and largea      | 99.6   | 96.8  | 5.3   | 31      |

Notes: Means and standard deviations adjusted using sample size based weights. Excludes results from eight publications reporting results from outbreak investigations.

*a Study authors reported combined results from analysis of small and large bottles.

the mean passing rate (91%) was significantly lower than for the smaller sample size categories (table S12; ANOVA with Scheffe's test, \( p < 0.05 \) for all three comparisons).

4.4. Author-provided hypotheses for observed contamination

The primary objectives of this review were to better understand the nature of bottled water
quality in China and to elucidate some of the reasons for observed contamination, with the larger goal of potentially identifying management or policy approaches that could prevent or mitigate contamination. Based on the nature of the available reported data, we cannot responsibly make inferences with regard to reasons for the microbiological and chemical contamination observed. However, in most cases the authors of the individual papers did provide hypothesized explanations for their findings. To examine some common themes across studies, we extracted and synthesized author-provided explanations for observed contaminations (these author-provided explanations should be treated as informed opinions rather than as evidence).

Explanations for observed microbiological contaminants are summarized in figure 10 by climatic region. The hypothesized reasons varied, but in all climatic zones most authors postulated that contamination was due to insufficiently sanitary bottled water production, insufficient source water treatment, insufficient sanitation of reused bottles (typically the large ~19 l bottles) and insufficient regulations or oversight. Slightly more authors of studies published in subtropical regions hypothesized that the source water was microbiologically contaminated, but this observation may be driven by other factors (e.g. more of China’s less economically developed provinces are situated in subtropical regions).

Looking at author-provided explanations for observed chemical contamination over levels of annual consumption expenditures (figure 11), we see that most authors mention the same reasons as those offered for microbiological outcomes. However, more authors hypothesized that contaminated source water was an important factor, particularly in provinces with higher indicators of economic development. The confluence of industrialization, economic production, and higher province-level household consumption expenditures might partially explain this association, but as with the would-be explanations associated with microbiological outcomes, other factors are likely relevant as well.

4.5. Study limitations

Findings from our review summarize only publicly available data from eligible published studies and are unlikely to be representative of the situation across China with respect to bottled water quality for the approximately 20 year period from 1995 to the beginning of 2016. In addition, because the majority of the reviewed papers came from relatively more economically developed provinces (figure 2), our findings are likely not representative of less-developed provinces in China. Only a few studies reported which brands of bottled water were tested, or provided information specific to the source-water location; therefore, we were unable to analyze results based on where bottled water was sourced geographically, or where production facilities were located. We tentatively assumed that in most cases the bottled water sampled was from companies that sourced and produced the bottled water within the province where the study was conducted, or within the region surrounding the province. However, some studies may have focused their testing efforts on nationally available brands (e.g. Nongfu, Wahaha) that are sold across China and that are produced in multiple regional bottled water facilities.

As noted above, most of the eligible studies with extractable data in our review did not provide specific average concentrations and associated measures of variance (e.g. mean and SD) when reporting the results of analyses of microbiological and chemical parameters. Rather, most studies presented results only in terms of the passing rate, and we assumed that study authors were making these determinations (i.e. the proportion of samples in compliance) based on the relevant bottled water standards at the time of sample collection and/or study publication. Consequently, we were not able to assess the degree to which samples were not in compliance (i.e. for non-compliant samples we could not discern whether they fell just below, or markedly below, the standards). The lack of specific concentration data also limited our ability to compare results to specific standards, or conduct many of the subgroup analyses we pre-specified in our protocol. Likewise, for our meta-regression analyses, we were unable to include some variables hypothesized to be relevant because relatively few studies reported such data.

The limited number of eligible health outcome studies, and the nature of the data reported, prevented meaningful interpretation of results with regard to health impacts associated with bottled water consumption. Relatedly, we were unable to adequately quantify the extent of potential publication bias generally—i.e. we do not know how many studies with results on bottled water contamination may not have been published due to the nature and direction of their findings.

Finally, in our protocol we pre-specified that we would use the Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development and Evaluation approach to assess and compare the degree of bias in eligible studies. However, because we found relatively few health-focused studies, and due in part to limitations based on the nature and extent of the available reported data, we chose to instead use an index-based approach for ROB.

More broadly, due to the extensive nature of this review it was beyond the scope of this paper to report
summary findings for all the microbiological and chemical parameters for which we extracted data. We encourage interested readers to consult the SM excel data file should they wish to view or analyze results for less-commonly-reported parameters or otherwise explore the data we extracted for this study (available online at stacks.iop.org/ERL/17/013003/mmedia).
5. Conclusions

Included in the United Nation’s 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development is Sustainable Development Goal 6.1: ‘By 2030, achieve universal and equitable access to safe and affordable drinking water for all’ [243]. Increasing consumption of bottled water and bottled water contamination are not issues unique to China, but China is unique in that, unlike most other countries, there exists a large body of published research on bottled water quality.

Overall, we observed that the vast majority of bottled water samples tested across the 625 reported studies from the 216 eligible publications for which we were able to extract data were in compliance with China’s relevant bottled water standards. Over the period from 2005 to 2015, we also observed evidence of relatively stable or increasing (positive) overall trends in the proportions of samples reported to be in compliance with relevant bottled water standards. After controlling for other variables via meta-regression analysis, however, these associations were only statistically significant for microbiological outcomes overall, and not for chemical outcomes. We found only nine eligible studies that reported on health outcomes associated with bottled water consumption. Overall, due to the nature of the underlying available data and associated limitations, as well as geographic variation in the number of eligible studies, our findings should not be considered as representative of the general situation in China with respect to bottled water quality over this period.

Increasing reliance on bottled water in China and in other LMICs may serve to further exacerbate disparities in safe water access both directly—via the potential consumption of contaminated bottled water—and indirectly, via its normalization as a primary form of drinking water access. This normalization of bottled water for everyday drinking may in turn undercut efforts to expand and improve public water supply [5]. Of course, there are settings in China and in other LMICs in which centralized drinking water treatment and piped distribution are not feasible. In many such settings in China, government-run mini-utilities provide filling stations where people pay for and collect treated drinking water in large 19l reusable bottles at costs much closer to those of piped drinking water than retail bottled water [244]. This type of kiosk-model for decentralized drinking water provision offers a relatively affordable and sustainable means of providing access to safe drinking water in regions with low population densities or challenging topography or hydrogeology. As noted in this review, one of the key challenges inherent in such an approach is ensuring sufficient disinfection of the reusable bottles between consumption and refill. In settings in China and other LMICs where centralized drinking water treatment and piped distribution is not feasible, efforts should be made to further expand well-regulated decentralized approaches for safe drinking water supply.

Across the world, bottled and packaged water is often accompanied by branding and marketing, promoting the notion that it is healthier and safer than alternative drinking water sources. In China, as well as in other LMICs and HICs, this trust may not always be warranted. The extent of, and impacts from, contaminated bottled water consumption remain poorly understood in both LMIC and HIC contexts—more research is needed on this issue. Given that bottled water will be part of the global waterscape for the foreseeable future, we hope that this work will stimulate more discussion and action on how to better regulate and improve bottled water production and quality. At the same time though, we hope this work will serve to further reinforce the need for LMICs—and HICs—to increase investments in the expansion and improvement of drinking water utilities as a far more equitable and sustainable pathway for providing reliable access to safe and affordable drinking water for all.

Data availability statement

All data that support the findings of this study are included within the article (and any supplementary files).

Acknowledgments

We are grateful to Li Hongxing at the National Center for Rural Water Supply Technical Guidance (Chinese Center for Disease Control and Prevention, Beijing) for his assistance with results interpretation, replication of primary statistical analyses, and suggestions on earlier drafts of this article. We thank Keith Gilles (UC Berkeley) for his steadfast support of this and other research projects. We also thank Pu Da and Jia Tang (UC Berkeley) for their assistance during one of the semesters of our multi-year work on this project, as well as Stefanie Ebeling and UC Berkeley’s Undergraduate Apprenticeship Research Program (URAP). Funding and support for this research was provided by URAP and by UC Berkeley’s College of Natural Resources (under Dean Gilles). These funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

Author contributions

A C designed the study, managed the data extraction, data cleaning, and quality assurance and control, conducted the statistical analyses, created the tables and figures, wrote the first draft of the manuscript, incorporated co-author feedback, and prepared the final manuscript and supplementary material files.
Q X, Q S, and X Y assisted with the search strategy design and piloting. J C, Q S, Q X, Y S, X Y, Y G, and J H conducted the search screening, full text identification, review, and data extraction. J C, Q S, and J H conducted extensive data cleaning, quality assurance, and control. J H created the map figures. J M C provided guidance on study design and contributed to results interpretation and the final manuscript. I R oversaw research assistant recruitment, provided guidance on study design, assisted with results interpretation, contributed to drafts, and helped write the final manuscript.

Conflict of interests

The authors declare they have no actual or potential competing financial interest.

References

[1] Rodwan J G 2017 Bottled water 2016: No. 1 & growing: US and international developments and statistics Bottled Water Reporter (International Bottled Water Association) pp 12–21
[2] Gleick P H 2010 Bottled and Sold: The Story behind Our Obsession with Bottled Water (Washington, DC: Island) p 211
[3] Doria M F 2006 Bottled water versus tap water: understanding consumers' preferences J. Water Health 4 271–6
[4] Szasa A 2007 Shopping Our Way to Safety: How We Changed from Protecting the Environment to Protecting Ourselves (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota) p 323
[5] Cohen A and Ray I 2018 The global risks of increasing synthetic pollution: the case of life-cycle greenhouse gas emissions of bottled water Environ. Res. Lett. 13 013003
[6] Szyjewski D, Goldbeck C, Humpf H-U and Fürst P 2018 Analysis of microplastics in water by micro-Raman spectroscopy: release of plastic particles from different packaging into mineral water Water Res. 129 154–62
[7] Williams A R, Bain R E S, Fisher M B, Cronk R, Kelly E R and Bartram J 2015 A systematic review and meta-analysis of fecal contamination and inadequate treatment of packaged water Plos One 10 e0140899
[8] Venturini C Q and Frazão P 2015 Fluoride concentration in bottled water: a systematic review Cadernos Saúde Coletiva 23 460–7
[9] Akhbarizadeh R, Dobaredaran S, Schmidt T C, Nabipour I and Spitz J 2020 Worldwide bottled water occurrence of emerging contaminants: a review of the recent scientific literature J. Hazard. Mater. 392 122271
[10] Rodwan J G 2014 Bottled water 2013: sustaining vitality: US and international developments and statistics Bottled Water Reporter (International Bottled Water Association) pp 12–22
[11] Cohen A, Zhang Q, Luo Q, Tao Y, Colford J M and Ray I 2017 Predictors of drinking water boiling and bottled water consumption in rural China: a hierarchical modeling approach Environ. Sci. Technol. 51 6945–56
[12] Cohen A et al 2020 Boiled or bottled: regional and seasonal exposures to drinking water contamination and household air pollution in rural China Environ. Health Perspect. 128 127002
[13] Moher D et al 2009 Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement the PRISMA statement Ann. Intern. Med. 151 264–9
[14] Ge Q, Bian J, Liao Y, Hao Z and Yin Y 2013 The climate regionalization in China for 1981–2010 Chin. Sci. Bull. 58 3088–99
[15] Cohen A and Colford J M 2017 Effects of boiling drinking water on diarrhea and pathogen-specific infections in low- and middle-income countries: a systematic review and meta-analysis Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg. 97 1562–77
[16] Landis J R and Koch G G 1977 The measurement of observer agreement for categorical data Biometrics 33 159–74
[17] Cohen A and Ray I 2018 The global risks of increasing synthetic pollution: the case of life-cycle greenhouse gas emissions of bottled water Environ. Res. Lett. 13 013003
[18] Wang Y 2014 Results of microbiological detection of drinking water in Xiqing District of Tianjin from 2010–2012 Occup. Health 30 60–61
[19] Yu C et al 2002 Hygienic investigation and evaluation of bottled and barreled drinking water in Rushan City Food Drugs 10 (Engl. transl.) pp 12–22
[20] Ren L and Yan X 2001 Microbiological investigation and analysis of bottled drinking natural mineral water Shandong Food Sci. Technol. 13 (Engl. transl.)
[21] Ren C 2005 Microbiological detection and analysis of barreled drinking water in Zibo City Occup. Health 21 1780 (Engl. transl.)
[22] He C, Gan R and Huang J 2001 Discussion on the hygienic status of bottled drinking water and countermeasures Chin. J. Health Insp. 8 175–7 (Engl. transl.)
[23] He Y, Qiu W and Hu W 2007 Sanitary quality of school drinking water in Xiangcheng District, Hangzhou Chin. School Health 28 522–3 (Engl. transl.)
[24] Feng B et al 1995 Hygienic bacteriology of drinking natural mineral water in a factory in Guangdong Chin. J. Hygiene Insp. 5 69–72 (Engl. transl.)
[25] Liu S et al 2014 Detection and control of microbial contamination of drinking water for teachers and students in Yuan’an County Chin. J. Disinfection 31 1128–9 (Engl. transl.)
[26] Reng Y 2009 Analysis of barreled drinking water testing results in Pizhou City in 2008 Occup. Health 25 193–4 (Engl. transl.)
[37] Liu J 2001 Microbiological detection and analysis of bottled mineral water and purified water J. Environm. Health 18 239 (Engl. transl.)

[38] Liu Y, Chen Z and Hou F 1999 Bacterial phase analysis of bottled drinking natural mineral water Chin. J. Food Hygiene 11 27–28 (Engl. transl.)

[39] Liu X et al 2005 2001–2003 detection of microbial contamination of some mineral water in Shichuan Province Occup. Health Injury 20 291–2 (Engl. transl.)

[40] Liu Y, Dong Q and Wang L 2004 Analysis of the results of food hygiene bacteriological testing in Shizhong District in 2003 Chin. Primary Health Care 18 67–68 (Engl. transl.)

[41] Wu X, Xu X and Cheng P 2007 Investigation of microbial contamination of barreled drinking water in Huzhou City during 5 years Med. Prev. Med. 2366+2377 (Engl. transl.)

[42] Zhou S et al 2002 Hygienic quality analysis of bottled (barreled) drinking water in Liaoqing Province Chin. Public Health 18 429 (Engl. transl.)

[43] Yao Y, Wei W and Tao L 2003 Investigation of microbial contamination of bottled drinking water Chin. Public Health 19 898 (Engl. transl.)

[44] Sun X 2009 2007 survey on the hygienic quality of barrel (bottle) drinking water in Zhumadian City China Med. Herald 6 132 (Engl. transl.)

[45] Sun K 2001 Analysis of bacteriological test results of purified drinking water and mineral water J. Environm. Health 18 377 (Engl. transl.)

[46] Gong Z et al 2013 Analysis of drinking water microbial contamination of students in Minhang District, Shanghai in 2012 Environm. Occup. Med. 30 924–7 (Engl. transl.)

[47] Zhang L, Chen Y and Yang Z 2003 Analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled water in Heilongjiang Province in 2002 Chin. Public Health Manage. 19 226–7 (Engl. transl.)

[48] Zhang J, Chen C and Yang J 2004 Sampling results of bottled water in Huizhou, Guangdong from 2002 to 2003 Guangxi Prev. Med. 10 27–28 (Engl. transl.)

[49] Zhang Z and Peng Q 2004 Analysis of the results of hygienic monitoring of barreled drinking water sold in Hunan Province from 2000 to 2004 Proc. Prev. Med. 11 983–4 (Engl. transl.)

[50] Zhang J, Liu Y and Li Y 2000 Analysis of the results of microbiological monitoring of mineral water and purified water in Zhengzhou over the past three years J. Environm. Health 17 20 (Engl. tranl.)

[51] Zhang W 2015 Problems and countermeasures in microbiological testing of barreled drinking water Res. Women's Health China Foreign Countries 39 236, 241 (Engl. transl.)

[52] Zhang Z et al 2009 Investigation of Giardia and Cryptosporidium in peripheral waters of Tianjin and Shenyang J. Environm. Health 26 52–54 (Engl. transl.)

[53] Zhang R et al 2002 Monitoring and analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled purified drinking water Occup. Health 18 51–52 (Engl. transl.)

[54] Xu K and Chen X 2008 Test results of microbiological indicators of commercially available bottled mineral water and purified water J. Environm. Health 21 211 (Engl. transl.)

[55] Xu B, Yang R and Shao J 2009 Analysis of the results of microbiological testing of purified water in Jiaojing District from 2004 to 2006 Zhejiang Prev. Med. 21 40, 42 (Engl. transl.)

[56] Xu J et al 2004 Detection and analysis of microorganisms in bottled drinking water in Ningbo Chin. J. Prev. Med. 5 51–52 (Engl. transl.)

[57] Wen T et al 2003 Current status analysis of microbial pollution in purified drinking water in Liaoqing Province Chin. Public Health Manage. 19 220–1 (Engl. transl.)

[58] Si G et al 2005 2001–2003 hygienic bacteriological investigation of bottled water in Hangzhou City Response to Public Health Emergencies Forum (Hangzhou: Zhejiang Science and Technology Association) 365–6 (Engl. transl.)

[59] Fang Y et al 2004 Hygienic quality analysis of barreled drinking water in Zhubzhou City Pract. Prev. Med. 11 984 (Engl. transl.)

[60] Zeng A, Jin X and Zhu J 2012 Detection and analysis of human calicivirus contamination in water bodies in Guangzhou Chin. Public Health 28 1641–3 (Engl. transl.)

[61] Zeng C and Zhang S 2003 Analysis of bacterial detection results in bottled water sold in Neijiang Med. Prev. Med. 10 27–28 (Engl. transl.)

[62] Li X and Zhou Z 2000 Bacteriological detection of pure drinking water, mineral water and spring water in Wenzhou City Zhejiang Prev. Med. 12 31–32 (Engl. transl.)

[63] Li Y et al 2002 Dynamic analysis of microbial contamination of barreled drinking water in Luoyang City Chin. J. Health Insp. 9 290–1 (Engl. transl.)

[64] Li Y, Zhang L and Hong C 2015 Investigation of microbial contamination of barreled drinking water in Wenzhou City Chin. J. Food Hygiene 27 32–35 (Engl. transl.)

[65] Li X et al 2001 Microbiological analysis of 183 bottles of purified drinking water Guangxi Prev. Med. 7 86–87 (Engl. transl.)

[66] Li H et al 2002 Observation on the secondary pollution of household drinking fountains Fujian Med. J. 24 89–90 (Engl. transl.)

[67] Li Q and Chen Z 2001 Dynamic analysis of bacterial colonies in bottled mineral water Occup. Health 17 47 (Engl. transl.)

[68] Li F 2014 Analysis of microbiological test results of 147 barreled drinking water in Hebi City Henan J. Prev. Med. 25 173+180 (Engl. transl.)

[69] Li F et al 2013 Contamination investigation of Streptococcus faecalis in mineral water and mountain spring water and ERIC–PCR typing of the main contaminated strains Microbial. Bull. 40 881–90 (Engl. transl.)

[70] Yang S et al 2005 Investigation of microbial contamination of bottled water in hospital during drinking period Chin. Tropical Med. 5 582–630 (Engl. transl.)

[71] Yang A, Bu F and Li Q 2003 The influence of the storage time of bottled mineral water on the total number of colonies J. Heze Med. College 15 21 (Engl. transl.)

[72] Yang Y 1996 Cause analysis of unqualified bottled mineral water Chin. J. Health Insp. 3 103–5 (Engl. transl.)

[73] Lin X and Hou Q 2013 Investigation on drinking water sanitation in schools and kindergartens in Pingshan New District, Shenzhen Seek. Med. Advice 11 327–8 (Engl. transl.)

[74] Lin J et al 2001 Analysis of microbial contamination of mineral water in Fujian Province Fujian Med. J. 23 103–4 (Engl. transl.)

[75] Lin G 2000 Analysis of the causes of unqualified bacterial counts in bottled mineral water, purified water, and purified water Fujian Tech. Superv. 35–6 (Engl. transl.)

[76] Lin L, Huang J and Zhong L 2002 Analysis of microbiological tracking monitoring results of bottled water drinking period Chin. J. Health Insp. 12 85 (Engl. transl.)

[77] Ke Q, Yang H and Lei P 1996 Investigation and analysis of bacillus of bottled drinking water J. Environm. Health 21 211 (Engl. transl.)

[78] Liu S, Yang Z and Zhang W 2001 Investigation on the hygienic status of 24 purified water plants in Nantong City J. Nantong Med. College 21 212–3 (Engl. transl.)

[79] Fan X 2003 Hygienic investigation of bottled drinking water in Anyang City Henan J. Prev. Med. 14 240–1 (Engl. transl.)

[80] Wu L, Zhou C and Huang X 2015 Analysis of the current situation of drinking water hygiene in schools and kindergartens in Pingshan New District, Shenzhen China Health Industry 40–41 (Engl. transl.)

[81] Duan G et al 1997 1995 Rizhao City beverage hygienic microbiological quality inspection Med. Prev. Med. 24 67+131 (Engl. transl.)
Duan Q and Zeng J 2015 Investigation and testing of drinking water quality for college students: taking Sichuan vocational and technical college as an example J. Sichuan Vocat. Tech. College 25 167–8 (Engl. transl.)

Jiang H et al 2015 Survey on the sanitation status of drinking water in a street school in Shenzhen Chin. Primary Health Care 29 107–9

Shen Q 2004 Analysis of the test results of drinking natural mineral water Occup. Health Emergency Rescue 22 211–2 (Engl. transl.)

Wen R 2011 Investigation and analysis of microbial quality of bottled water in Mu City J. Mudanjiang Univ. 20 120–122+131 (Engl. transl.)

Pan H 2008 Sampling inspection and supervision of the hygienic status of water produced and sold in Baoshan District Shanghai. Occup. Health 24 1304–5 (Engl. transl.)

Pang L, Zhu L and Zou W 2008 Survey of various barreled drinking water in Suzhou City from 2004 to 2008 Med. Animal Control 24 836–7 (Engl. transl.)

Yan Y, Gao W and Shen Z 2002 Analysis of microbiological monitoring results of four kinds of barreled drinking water Chin. J. Health Insp. 12 216–7 (Engl. transl.)

Mou Z 2003 Microbiological monitoring analysis and supervision and management countermeasures of bottled mineral water and purified water in Shijiazhuang market Med. Animal Control 19 735–6

Wang F and Yang M 2004 Detection of microbiological indicators of bottled mineral water and purified water sold in Linzi District Occup. Health 20 43–44 (Engl. transl.)

Wang H, Pang Z and Qi A 2010 Analysis of the results of microbial contamination of some barrels and bottled drinking water in Harbin from 2005 to 2008 Chin. Foreign Med. Res. 8 46

Wang R 2012 Investigation of microbiological indicators of direct drinking water by long-distance bus via drinking fountain J. Environm. Health 29 738 (Engl. transl.)

Wang X and Wei F 2005 Purification effect of the clean filling room of Wuhan barreled drinking water production enterprises J. Environm. Health 22 369–71 (Engl. transl.)

Wang B et al 2013 Hygienic analysis of drinking water quality in primary and secondary schools and kindergartens in Qingdao J. Environm. Hygiene 3 332–4

Wang T, Liu S and Hu D 2007 Sampling survey of bottled purified water in Taiyuan City J. Pract. Med. Tech. 14 4776–7 (Engl. transl.)

Wang H and Jiang X 1998 Bacteriological monitoring of purified drinking water and mineral water Chin. J. Health Insp. 8 44–45 (Engl. transl.)

Wang J and Zhang W 2002 Microbiological detection and analysis of barreled drinking water Healthl Emergency Rescue 20 197 (Engl. transl.)

Shen M, He Q and Xiang S 2004 Investigation and analysis of the test results of drinking natural mineral water and purified water in Guangxi Med. Animal Control 30 81–84 (Engl. transl.)

Shen M, He Q and Xiang S 2004 Investigation and analysis of the test results of drinking natural mineral water and purified water in Guangxi Med. Animal Control 30 81–84 (Engl. transl.)

Shen Q 2004 Analysis of the status quo of the sanitary quality of bottled drinking water in Fujian Province from 1998 to 2002 Strait Prev. Med. 9 86–7 (Engl. transl.)

Jin Y and Zou Z 2002 Analysis of sampling inspection of bottled drinking water in Jiaxing City from 2001 to 2002 Chin. J. Health Inspl. 9 360–1 (Engl. transl.)

Wang P and Zhao D 2005 Bacteriological detection and investigation of school bottled drinking mineral water J. Environm. Health 22 197 (Engl. transl.)

Lu J, Jin M and Mao Q 2004 Analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled water in Nantong City Occup. Health 20 56 (Engl. transl.)

Chen Y et al 2006 Analysis of results of hygiene monitoring of bottled drinking water in Guizhou Province from 2003 to 2005 Guizhou Med. 30 842–3 (Engl. transl.)

Chen Q, Lu Z and Yang Y 1995 Investigation of Pseudomonas aeruginosa contamination of bottled mineral water in Beijing Chin. J. Food Hygiene 7 38–39 (Engl. transl.)

Chen C, Ma Q and Jin L 2004 Investigation on the causes of Pseudomonas aeruginosa contamination of bottled natural mineral water Strait J. Prev. Med. 10 64–65 (Engl. transl.)

Chen H, Chen J and Jin L 2003 Investigation of secondary pollution in bottled water drinking Zhejiang Prev. Med. 15 30 (Engl. transl.)

Chen L, Zhu Z and Zhao J 2013 Investigation on the hygienic quality of bottled purified water in 64 schools in Kunshan City Occup. Health 29 1644–46 (Engl. transl.)

Wei H, Zhang Y and Liang X 2011–2013 results of food microbial contamination tests in Wuming County, Guangxi Occup. Health 30 2068–8 (Engl. transl.)

Ma Q 2000 Distribution of freshwater algae in drinking natural mineral water J. Environm. Health 17 277–9 (Engl. transl.)
[128] Zhong Y and Gao G 2004 Hygienic investigation of bottled drinking mineral water J. Environm. Health 21 61 (Engl. transl.)
[129] Gao Z, Wu L and Ma S 2006 Hygienic investigation of drinking purified water and mineral water for residents in Baotou City Occup. Health 22 610–1 (Engl. transl.)
[130] Huang S et al 2014 Simultaneous detection of Proteus aeruginosa and Pantoea agglomerans from commercially available bottled drinking water Chin. Foreign Med. 182–3 (Engl. transl.)
[131] Huang X 2001 Analysis of bacteriological monitoring results of purified drinking water and mineral water in Zhaoting City in 1999 Chin. J. Health Insp. 11 77 (Engl. transl.)
[132] Huang X, Sun G and Cheng Z 2002 Hygienic quality monitoring of bottled purified water in primary and secondary schools in Daqing City Chin. School Health 23 376–7 (Engl. transl.)
[133] Lin M and Luo D 2010 Monitoring and analysis of hygienic water conditions in Yan’an University J. Yan'an Univ. Nat. Sci. Ed. 32 101–4 (Engl. transl.)
[134] Liu S and Yuan D 2003 Longyan City bottled drinking water quality monitoring and analysis Chin. J. Health Insp. 47 376–7 (Engl. transl.)
[135] Liu X and Luo D 2010 Monitoring and analysis of drinking water quality in Yanbian Korean Autonomous Prefecture from 2005 to 2010 Med. J. Yanbian Univ. 34 300–1 (Engl. transl.)
[136] Li R et al 2011 Investigation on the detection of barreled drinking water in Dingtao County Chin. Health Ind. 42–43 (Engl. transl.)
[137] Zhang Y et al 2006 Hygienic quality analysis and management strategies of bottled drinking water in Zhejiang City Occup. Health 22 1856–7 (Engl. transl.)
[138] Cui X et al 2011 Analysis of drinking water test results in Longxi County Chinese Prev. Med. 7 203–5 (Engl. transl.)
[139] Wu H and Ye B 2003 Investigation and analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled drinking water from some drinking water vending machines in Pudong New Area, Shanghai J. Environ. Occup. Med. 24 611–3
[140] Zhang W et al 2012 Detection and analysis on commercial bottled drinking water hygiene of Zhengzhou city in 2009 Mod. Prev. Med. 39 3481–2
[141] Zhang X et al 2013 A cross-sectional survey on water quality and hygienic status of fresh-purified drinking water vending machines in Henan Province Chin. J. Med. Doctor 47 193–194+219 (Engl. transl.)
[142] Wu H, Li Y and Ye B 2003 Investigation and analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled drinking mineral water Mod. Prev. Med. 30 899 (Engl. transl.)
[143] Wu H, Xue Y and Han L 2003 Monitoring and analysis of bottled purified drinking water sold in Henan Province Chin. J. Health Insp. 13 486–7 (Engl. transl.)
[144] He W, Gao J and Gu Q 2000 Analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled purified water and its influencing factors Chin. J. Health Insp. 1 007 (Engl. transl.)
[145] Liu X and Wang H 2001 Investigation on the hygienic quality of bottled drinking water Chin. J. Med. Writing 8 1940–1 (Engl. transl.)
[146] Liu R et al 2003 Investigation on the hygienic quality of bottled drinking water in Guangzhou City Chin. J. Hygiene Insp. 13 81–82 (Engl. transl.)
[147] Liu S and Yuan D 2003 Longyan City bottled drinking water hygiene quality monitoring results Occup. Health 19 73–74 (Engl. transl.)
[148] Liu M, Li K and Jia H 2012 2005–2006 purified water quality monitoring and analysis Strait J. Prev. Med. 18 56–57 (Engl. transl.)
[149] Liu M, Li X and Wang R 2013 2010–2012 bottled drinking water quality inspection in Qulu Petrochemical area Prev. Med. Forum 19 685–6 (Engl. transl.)
[150] Wu H et al 2002 2001 investigation and analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled and barreled drinking water in Zhongshan City South China Prev. Med. 28 60–61 (Engl. transl.)
[151] Zhou X et al 2011 Hygienic quality analysis of bottled drinking water in Haiyan County Zhejiang Med. Educ. 10 42–44 (Engl. trans.)
[152] Zhou L, Huang T and Hu X 2010 Analysis of the results of monitoring the sanitary quality of bottled water in Quanzhou from 2007 to 2009 Strait J. Prev. Med. 16 99 (Engl. transl.)
[153] Sun L and Li H 2009 Analysis of the hygienic status of barreled drinking water in Hulinbuir from 2004 to 2008 Occup. Health 25 20 (Engl. transl.)
[154] Cui X et al 2011 Analysis of drinking water test results in Yanbian Korean Autonomous Prefecture from 2005 to 2010 Med. J. Yanbian Univ. 34 300–1 (Engl. transl.)
[155] Kang F 2014 Analysis of detection results of barreled drinking water in Pingxi County Chin. Health Ind. 42–43 (Engl. transl.)
[156] Zhang G et al 2006 Hygienic quality analysis and management strategies of bottled drinking water in Zhongshan City Occup. Health 22 1856–7 (Engl. transl.)
[157] Niu Z et al 2013 Investigation and analysis of drinking water quality in Yan’an University J. Yan'an Univ. Nat. Sci. Ed. 32 101–4 (Engl. transl.)
[158] Zhang W et al 2012 Analysis of Proteus aeruginosa and bromate pollution in mineral water J. Food Biotechnol. 31 1046–50 (Engl. transl.)
[159] Zhang R 2013 Investigation and analysis of the hygienic quality of barreled drinking water in a city in 2012 Disease Surveill. Control 7 203–5 (Engl. transl.)
[160] Peng J et al 2008 2006 investigation of the hygienic status of barreled drinking water in Baotou City Forum Prev. Med. 14 54–55 (Engl. transl.)
[161] Peng S 2004 Analysis of the hygienic quality of pure drinking water in Lingbao City Occup. Health 20 64–65 (Engl. transl.)
[162] Ao Z et al 2003 2002 Fujian Province bottled mineral water pure water test results analysis Strait J. Prev. Med. 9 59 (Engl. transl.)
[163] Cao C and Li Y 2006 Investigation and diagnostic analysis of the quality of bottled drinking water in Linxi City Occup. Health 22 848–9 (Engl. transl.)
[164] Zhi J and Wu Y 2005 Analysis of the hygienic quality of barreled purified drinking water in Wuixi City Jiujiang Health Care 2 25 (Engl. transl.)
[165] Li C et al 2003 Investigation on drinking situation and water quality of some bottled water users in Guangzhou South China Prev. Med. 29 48–49 (Engl. transl.)
[166] Li J et al 2008 Investigation on the hygienic quality of bottled water among residents of a college in Shenyang Chin. School Doctor 22 274–5 (Engl. transl.)
[167] Li R et al 1996 Hygienic investigation of bottled drinking natural mineral water in Shandong Province Prev. Med. Forum 2 244 (Engl. transl.)
[168] Li R and Yi 2003 Research on the application of hazard analysis critical control points in the production of bottled drinking natural mineral water Prev. Med. Literature Inf. 9 150–1 (Engl. transl.)
[169] Li X et al 2000 Analysis of the pollution of bottled purified drinking water in Guangxi Hubei J. Prev. Med. 11 42–3 (Engl. transl.)
[170] Yang Y, Zhang C and Lu Y 2001 1996–1999 Hygienic quality investigation of bottled purified drinking water in Guangzhou City Chin. J. Hygiene Insp. 11 195–6 (Engl. transl.)
[171] Lin S and Ma Q 1996 Microbiology of bottled natural mineral water Strait J. Prev. Med. 3 36–37 (Engl. transl.)
[172] Lin Y et al 2011 Hygienic status of drinking water in schools and kindergartens in Futian District, Shenzhen Occup. Health 27 1027–8 (Engl. transl.)
[173] Lin J et al 2003 Investigation and analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled mineral water in Liancheng County in 2008 Prev. Med. Forum 16 1028–9 (Engl. transl.)
[174] Lin L, Li M and Shen X 2003 Investigation and analysis of the hygienic quality of barreled drinking water in Changsha City Pract. Prev. Med. 10 985–6 (Engl. transl.)
manufacturers in Longyan City from 2002 to 2004. Prev. Med. Forum 11 105–6 (Engl. transl.)

[174] Lin M, Chen C X and You T 2009 Analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled (barreled) drinking water in Longyan City from 2006 to 2008. Chin. Sanitary Eng. 8 168–9 (Engl. transl.)

[175] Liang Y L, Zhang Y and Li L 2003 Investigation on the production and hygienic quality of barreled purified water in Weifang City Med. Animal Control 29 90 (Engl. transl.)

[176] Sha J S et al 2007 Analysis of results of sampling of bottled (barreled) drinking water in Fujian Province from 2004 to 2006. Strait J. Prev. Med. 2 (Engl. transl.)

[177] Sha J S et al 2006 Results of sampling of bottled drinking water in Fujian Province in 2004. J. Prev. Med. Inf. 22 219–220 (Engl. transl.)

[178] Mou S et al 2001 Investigation on the hygienic status of barreled drinking water in Kunming City. Chin. J. Health Insp. 8 14–16 (Engl. transl.)

[179] Wang D et al 2013 Analysis of monitoring results of barreled drinking water quality in Gaokuan City from 2008 to 2011. Strait J. Prev. Med. 19 70–71 (Engl. transl.)

[180] Wang G, Hou J and Jia S 2009 Analysis of the hygienic status of barreled drinking water in Dalian. Occup. Health 25 1187–8 (Engl. transl.)

[181] Wang L et al 2009 Random inspection and analysis of the hygienic quality of commercially available mineral water in Huiyin City. Jiangsu Health Care 2 061 (Engl. transl.)

[182] Wang L, Wang Y and Zhou T 2010 Detection of drinking water quality on campus. Dongguan Univ. Technol. 17 84–87 (Engl. transl.)

[183] Wang Y W, Gong Y and Zhang X 2002 Analysis and management measures for hygienic quality of bottled mineral water. Occup. Health 18 58–59 (Engl. transl.)

[184] Wang Y, Peng J and Yao Y 2011 Survey on the hygienic status of barreled drinking water in Baotou City in 2009. Chin. Public Health Manage. 27 43–44 (Engl. transl.)

[185] Wang M and Mou D 1999 Hygienic investigation and analysis of hygienic quality reasons for commercial bottled drinking water. Occup. Health 9 030 (Engl. transl.)

[186] Wang X 2007 Analysis of the hygienic quality of barreled drinking water in Wuxi City in 2005 and countermeasures. Occup. Health 23 287–8 (Engl. transl.)

[187] Wang Z 2015 Investigation on the drinking situation and water quality of some bottled water users in Shuangyang District, Changchun City Electron. J. Clin. Med. Literat. 2 7 141–2 (Engl. transl.)

[188] Wang S et al 2003 Investigation and analysis of the hygienic status of barreled drinking water production in Yuxi City J. Yuxi Normal Univ. 19 80–83 (Engl. transl.)

[189] Dou C 2010 Analysis of the hygienic status of barreled drinking water in Liaoyang from 2006 to 2008. Prev. Med. Inf. 26 157–8 (Engl. transl.)

[190] Ge L et al 2005 Analysis of the hygienic status of barrel (bottle) drinking water in Dalian from 2003 to 2004. Prev. Med. Forum 11 91–92 (Engl. transl.)

[191] Yuan P et al 2011 Dynamic survey on the hygienic quality of different brands of bottled water in Hengyang City Res. Trace Element. Health 28 35–37 (Engl. transl.)

[192] Gong Y et al 2008 Dynamic investigation on the hygienic quality of barreled drinking water in Chengdu area J. Sichuan Provincial Health Manage. Cadre College 27 10–12 (Engl. transl.)

[193] Zheng D et al 2002 Investigation on the hygienic status of barreled drinking water in Wanzhou District. Mod. Prev. Med. 29 779–81 (Engl. transl.)

[194] Zheng X 1998 Current status and improvement measures of bottled drinking water in our province. Fujian Tech. Superv. 22–24 (Engl. transl.)

[195] Zheng X 1999 The quality of bottled drinking water in our province is worrying. Fujian Tech. Superv. 35–36 (Engl. transl.)

[196] Zhen Y and Gu J 2004 Investigation and analysis of the hygienic quality of bottled purified drinking water in Nantong City J. Nantong Med. College 24 76–78 (Engl. transl.)

[197] Ma Q et al 2001 Investigation of Pseudomonas aeruginosa pollution in drinking natural mineral water. J. Environm. Health 18 157–9 (Engl. transl.)

[198] Ma Q et al 2002 Analysis of mold fungi from drinking natural mineral water. J. Environm. Health 19 522–4 (Engl. transl.)

[199] Ma J 2003 A preliminary study on the hygienic quality of bottled drinking water in Suzhou City J. Environm. Health 17 83–86 (Engl. transl.)

[200] Huang Y, Kong Z, Zeng C, Yang W and Yang J 1995 Sampling inspection results of the hygienic quality of bottled mineral water. Guangxi Prev. Med. 1 129–30 (Engl. transl.)

[201] Gao X et al 2015 Research on hexachlorocyclohexane and dichlorodiphenyltrichloroethane residues in domestic water. J. Food Saf. Qual. 6 987–91

[202] Li J, Yu N, Zhang B, Lin L, Li M, Hu M, Zhang X, Wei S and Yu H 2014 Occurrence of organophosphate flame retardants in drinking water from China. Water Res. 54 53–61

[203] Li X et al 2010 Simultaneous determination and assessment of 4-nonylphenol, bisphenol A and triclosan in tap water, bottled water and baby bottles. Environ. Int. 36 557–62

[204] Wu Q, Zhang T, Sun H and Kannan K 2010 Perchlorate in tap water, groundwater, surface waters, and bottled water from China and its association with other inorganic anions and with disinfection byproducts. Arch. Environm. Contam. Toxicol. 58 543–50

[205] Wang H X et al 2012 Screening and assessing the phenols in water environment of Shanghai city Fudan Xuebao (Yixueban) 39 231–7

[206] Xu R-J, Xing X-R, Zhou Q-F, Jiang G-B and Wei F-S 2010 Investigations on boron levels in drinking water sources in China. Environm. Monit. Assess. 165 15–25

[207] Lan Z, Hua S and Ding Y 2002 Investigation of nitrite pollution in natural mineral water Med. Animal Control 18 546 (Engl. transl.)

[208] Zhou X and Ye C 2016 Research on heavy metal detection and pollution index of bottled mineral water Sci. Fortune 8 472–3 (Engl. transl.)

[209] Sun L and Zhang J 2004 Determination and analysis of fluoride content in drinking water in Xinxing City. Guangdong Trace Element Sci. 11 67–69 (Engl. transl.)

[210] Sun L et al 2009 Potential hazards and prevention of high oxygen consumption drinking water in Hulanbiur City Occup. Health 25 2589–90 (Engl. transl.)

[211] Song C, Guo H and Du J 2012 Investigation and analysis of nitrates content in drinking water sold in Jinlin City J. Jilin Med. College 33 386–7 (Engl. transl.)

[212] Zhuang G, Li J and Li R 1997 Investigation of nitrate content in mineral water sold in Jilan from 1994 to 1996. Chin. Public Health 13 24 (Engl. transl.)

[213] Zhang S et al 2009 Investigation of bromate content in bottled drinking water Med. Prev. Med. 36 2149–51 (Engl. transl.)

[214] Xu Z, Cheng Y and Tang J 2012 Sampling analysis of VOCs in commercially available bottled water Anthai Agric. Sci. 40 5332–3 (Engl. transl.)

[215] Xu H et al 2015 Determination of bromate content in mineral water Heilongjiang Animal Sci. Veterinary Med. 12 289–90 (Engl. transl.)

[216] Jing Y et al 2015 Health risk assessment of water quality chemical pollution of rural drinking water safety project in Fergei County J. Environm. Hygiene 5 111–5 (Engl. transl.)

[217] Zeng Z and Chen C 2011 Analysis on the hygienic status of bottled (barrel) mineral water purified water in Quanzhou from 2009 to 2010. Prev. Med. Forum 17 764+872 (Engl. transl.)

[218] Li J and Zhang F 2008 Analysis of trace elements in bottled drinking water in Suzhou City Res. Trace Element. Health 25 69 (Engl. transl.)
[219] Lin G 2013 The total beta radioactivity level of mineral water in Fujian Province Chem. Eng. Equip. 237–8 (Engl. transl.)
[220] Lin Z 1995 Total alpha and total beta radioactivity levels in drinking natural mineral water in Hainan Province Hainan Med. 6 120 (Engl. transl.)
[221] Lin Y et al 2009 Content analysis of three disinfection by-products in bottled drinking water sold in Guangzhou Mod. Prev. Med. 36 326–7 (Engl. transl.)
[222] Lin L et al 2010 Investigation on the radioactivity level of drinking natural mineral water in Guangdong Province Chin. Radiol. Health 19 204–6 (Engl. transl.)
[223] Liang W et al 2012 Preliminary study on the detection of trace bromate in drinking water Res. Trace Element. Health 29 47–48 (Engl. transl.)
[224] Wu L, Wang J and Ding H 1998 Total alpha and total beta radioactivity levels in mineral water in Henan Province Henan J. Prev. Med. 9 19–20 (Engl. transl.)
[225] Wang X et al 2015 Research on comprehensive index of urban safety water supply-take Taiyuan as an example Environ. Sci. Manage. 40 26–30 (Engl. transl.)
[226] Tong J et al 2009 Discussion on the bromate ion in the water quality standard of bottled water Water Purif. Technol. 28 72–74 (Engl. transl.)
[227] Guo Y, Huang H J and Liu X 1999 Total alpha and total beta radioactivity levels of mineral water in Guangdong Province Chin. Radiol. Health 8 44–46 (Engl. transl.)
[228] Chen T et al 2014 Survey of total alpha and total beta radioactivity levels in drinking water in Beijing area Chin. Radiol. Health 23 344–5 (Engl. transl.)
[229] Ma W and Li W 2004 Investigation of fluoride content in bottled water J. Environm. Health 21 32 (Engl. transl.)
[230] Huang Y and Shi J 1999 Analysis of volatile organic compounds (VOCs) in drinking water Anal. Test. Technol. Instrum. 5 37–44 (Engl. transl.)
[231] Cohen A, Tao Y, Luo Q, Zhong G, Romm J, Colford J M and Ray J 2015 Microbiological evaluation of household drinking water treatment in rural China shows benefits of electric kettles: a cross-sectional study PLoS One 10 e0138451
[232] Shen J C et al 2011 A norovirus-borne outbreak caused by contaminated bottled spring water in a school, Zhejiang Province Zhonghua Liao Xing Bing Xue Za Zhi = Zhonghua Liuxingbingxue ZaZhi 32 800–3
[233] Wang R, Cheng H, Zong J, Yu P, Fu W, Yang F, Shi G and Zeng G 2012 An outbreak of acute gastroenteritis associated with contaminated bottled water in a university—Jiangxi, China, 2012 Western Pac. Surveill Response J. 3 20–24
[234] Liu L and Qin H 2008 Analysis of an unexplained incident of drinking mineral water Chin. Sanitary Eng. 7 80–81 (Engl. transl.)
[235] Wu W, Li H and Liu M 2014 Investigation of an outbreak of infectious diarrhea in a school caused by barred water pollution J. Nanchang Univ. (Medical Edition) 54 77–80 (Engl. transl.)
[236] Song J et al 2015 Investigation of an outbreak of norovirus acute gastroenteritis caused by drinking unclean bottled water Zhejiang Prev. Med. 27 1045–8 (Engl. transl.)
[237] Song J et al 2014 Investigation of an outbreak of acute gastroenteritis in a kindergarten caused by norovirus Med. Animal Control 30 1121–3 (Engl. transl.)
[238] Zhang R and Xie C 2012 Investigation on an outbreak of vomiting among kindergarten children Occup. Health 28 79–81 (Engl. transl.)
[239] Wang J et al 2015 Investigation on an outbreak of polynorovirus acute gastroenteritis caused by bottled water Chin. School Health 36 1107–9 (Engl. transl.)
[240] Kostyla C, Bain R, Cronk R and Bartram J 2015 Seasonal variation of fecal contamination in drinking water sources in developing countries: a systematic review Sci. Total Environ. 514 333–43
[241] NBS 2013 China Statistical Yearbook 2013, in 2–25 Household Consumption Expenditure by Region (2012) (Beijing: National Bureau of Statistics of China (NBS))
[242] WHO 2015 Technical Brief: Boil Water (Geneva: The World Health Organization)
[243] UN 2019 Sustainable Development Goals: 6—clean water & sanitation Goal 6: ensure access to water and sanitation for all
[244] Li H et al 2020 Intermittent water supply management, household adaptation, and drinking water quality: a comparative study in two Chinese provinces Water 12