Cytotoxic T (Tc) cells mediate target cell lysis by two independent pathways, one involving exocytosis of preformed granules, the other requiring ligation of Fas ligand on the effector cell with the Fas receptor on target cells (1–7). Both processes lead to target cell apoptosis and lysis (7) by intracellular mechanisms which are still poorly understood. Perforin, gzmA, and gzmB have been implicated in Fas-independent nucleolytic and cytolytic processes exerted by cytotoxic T (Tc) cells, but the underlying mechanism(s) remains unclear. In this study, we compare the potential of Tc and natural killer (NK) cells of mice deficient in both proteases to Fas-independent Tc/NK cell–mediated target cell lysis. Despite the fact that exocytosis of preformed cytolytic granules seems to follow distinct pathways. Whereas gzmB in-

In Vitro- and Ex Vivo-derived Cytolytic Leukocytes from Granzyme A × B Double Knockout Mice Are Defective in Granule-mediated Apoptosis but not Lysis of Target Cells

By Markus M. Simon,* Michael Hausmann,* Thao Tran,* Klaus Ebnet,* Jürg Tschopp,† Ron ThaHla,§ and Arno Müllbacher§

Summary

Granzyme (gzm) A and gzmB have been implicated in Fas-independent nucleolytic and cytolytic processes exerted by cytotoxic T (Tc) cells, but the underlying mechanism(s) remains unclear. In this study, we compare the potential of Tc and natural killer (NK) cells of mice deficient in both proteases to Fas-independent nucleolytic and cytolysis (7) by intracellular mechanisms which are still poorly understood. Perforin, gzmA, and gzmB have been implicated as main contributors to membrane and/or nuclear disintegration of target cells by the secretory pathway (7). Membrane damage of target cells, as measured by 51Cr-release, is mainly accounted for by perforin, which itself is capable of causing target cell cytolyis (7–9). However, gzmA and B have been shown to cause DNA fragmentation and apoptotic morphology of target cells, but only in the presence of perforin (10–12).

Controversy still remains as to the distinct contribution of each of the two proteases to Fas-independent Tc/NK cell-mediated DNA fragmentation of target cells and to what extent they affect perforin-mediated target cell lysis. gzmA and B seem to be able to cross the target cell membrane (7, 13) via a still undefined process, but their nucleolytic activities seem to follow distinct pathways. Whereas gzmB induces early DNA fragmentation by cleaving multiple cysteine proteases of the caspase cascade, including FLICE (14) and CPP32 (15–17), the nucleolytic activity of gzmA seems to be delayed and independent of caspases (12, 18, 19). Although indirect evidence suggested that Tc cell–mediated target cell lysis correlates with the expression of gzmA and/or B (11, 20, 21), no reduction of Fas-independent cytolytic activity was observed with Tc cell populations from the mutant strains induced 51Cr-release in target cells at levels and with kinetics similar to those of normal mice. This contrasts with their capacity to induce apoptotic nuclear damage in target cells. In gzmA × B−/− mice, Tc/NK-mediated target cell DNA fragmentation was not observed, even after extended incubation periods (10 h), but was normal in gzmA-deficient and only impaired in gzmB-deficient mice in short-term (2–4 h), but not long-term (4–10 h), nucleolytic assays. This suggests that gzmA and B are critical for Tc/NK granule-mediated nucleolysis, with gzmB being the main contributor, while target cell lysis is due solely to perforin and independent of both proteases.

Materials and Methods

Mice. Strains and Genetic Analysis. gzmA × gzmB−/−ko mice (gzmA × B−/−) were generated by crossing gzmA−/− (22) with gzmB−/− (18) mice and by subsequent intercrossing of heterozygous F1 animals. C57BL/6 (B6), BALB/c (B/c), gzmA−/−, gzmB−/−, and two strains of perforin deficient mice, perforin−/− (B6 background; reference 2) and perforin−/− (129 × B6 background; reference 24), were maintained at the Max-Planck Institut and the John Curtin School of Medical Research under pathogen-free conditions. No differences were found in any of the ex-
performed by incubating in vitro–derived Tc cells (5 × 10^6) at a ratio of 2:1 for 5–6 d. Restimulation for secondary MLC was pretreated with 10 μg/ml Con A in medium for 24 h (Con A–SN, supernatant). The generation of influenza-immune Tc cells was previously described (22). For detection of influenza virus–immune Tc cells, EL4 cells were pretreated with 10 μg/ml Con A in medium for 24 h (Con A–SN, supernatant). The genomic DNA was subjected to amplification by PCR and analyzed as previously described (22).

All mutant and normal B6 mice (male and female) were analyzed for their gzmA, gzmB, and perforin genotypes (Fig. 1) before experimentation.

Target Cells. P815 (H-2^d), EL4.F15 (EL4), (H-2^d), L1210.3 (H-2^d), and L1210.Fas (EL4 transfected with Fas cDNA, H-2^d; reference 1), TA-3 (H-2^d), A1.1 (H-2^d), and YAC-1 (H-2^d) were maintained in culture as has been previously described (22, 25).

For detection of influenza virus–immune Tc cells, EL4 cells were pretreated with 10 μg/ml synthetic peptide (ASNENMETM) derived from the nucleoprotein of A/influenza virus specific for D^b (NPP; reference 26) as has been previously described (25).

Generation of Tc and NK Cells In Vivo and In Vitro. To generate allosreactive Tc cells in vitro, H-2^d responder splenocytes from mutant and B6 mice (10^6/ml) were cultivated together with irradiated (3,000 rad) stimulator splenocytes from B/c mice (10^6/ml) at a ratio of 2:1 for 5–6 d. Estimation for secondary MLC was performed by incubating in vitro–derived Tc cells (5 × 10^6/ml) with stimulator (2.5 × 10^6/ml) in medium supplemented with supernatant (10% final solution) from rat spleen desensitized with 5 μg/ml Con A in medium for 24 h (Con A–SN, supplemented with 20 μg/ml α-methyl-d-mannoside; Sigma Chemical Co., Munich, Germany).

To generate primary in vivo allosreactive Tc cells, mice were injected intraperitoneally with 10^6 PFU of recombinant vaccinia virus encoding the MHC class I heavy chain gene K^b, as has been previously described (27). Effector splenocytes were used as ex vivo allosreactive Tc cells 6 d after immunization.

The generation of influenza-immune Tc cells has been previously described (28). In brief, B6 mice were immunized intravenously with 10^6 hemagglutinating units of influenza virus A/W SN (H1N1). The cytolytic potential of their spleen cells was tested at day 6 after infection on NPP–modified or control EL4 target cells.

In vivo NK effector cells were splenocytes from mice injected intraperitoneally with either 100 μg poly I:C 20 h (29) or intraperitoneally with either 10^9 PFU Semliki forest virus (SFV) 2 d earlier. Effector cells were phenotyped as described (30).

Cytotoxicity Assays. All cytotoxicity assays were performed in cell culture medium, in which FC5 was replaced by BSA (2 mg/ml). The 51Cr-release assay was performed for 2–10 h, as previously described (22). The 51Cr-release assay was performed essentially as previously described (31), with some modifications (22). Target cells (2 × 10^4) were labeled with 10 μCi [125I]-deoxyuridine ([125I]U; Amersham Corp., Arlington Heights, IL) in 400 μl in polystyrol tubes for 3 h. Effector cells were mixed with 2 × 10^4 labeled target cells in triplicates at the indicated effector/target ratio (e/t) in 200 μl 1% DMEM, complemented with 12 mM Hepes and 2 mg/ml BSA. The plates were centrifuged at 500 rpm for 5 min and incubated for 1 h. After centrifugation (1,200 rpm, 10 min) 100 μl of supernatant was removed and 100 μl of lysate buffer (10 mM Tris/HCl, pH 7.5, 1 mM EDTA, 0.4% Triton−X-100) was added. After 10 min of incubation at room temperature, the plates were centrifuged (1,200 rpm, 10 min). 100 μl of supernatant was collected and released radioactivity was measured. In some experiments, 3 mM EGTA plus 4.5 mM MgCl2 (EGTA-MgCl2) was added to the assay to exclusively assess Fas-based cytotoxicity (32).

Results

Role of gzmA, gzmB, and Perforin in Target Cell Lysis. In vitro–derived H-2^d-reactive Tc cells from gzmA+/−, gzmB+/−, gzmA×B+/−, and B6 mice were tested for their ability to induce 51Cr-release in various target cell populations in 2–10-h cytotoxicity assays. Representative experiments are shown in Fig. 2, A–E. Tc cells from all gzmK mice, including gzmA×B+/−, expressed cytolytic activities with kinetics and levels comparable to those seen with B6 Tc, when tested on either L1210.3, L1210.Fas, A1.1, or TA3 lymphoma target cells (Fig. 2, A–D, top panels) and P815 mastocytoma targets (data not shown). In addition, Tc cells from gzmA+/−, gzmB+/−, and B6 also lysed L1210.Fas target cells in the presence of EGTA-M g^2− to the same extent, when tested at 10 h, indicating the involvement of the Fas pathway (1). Tc cells from perforin−/− mice did not express any cytolytic activity on the respective target cells with the exception that 51Cr-release was observed with L1210.Fas target cells in a 10-h assay, which was reduced in the presence of EGTA-M g^2−. As slight variations in lytic activity of gzmA×B+/− Tc cells occurred between individual sets of experiments, we tested...
the cytolytic activity of alloreactive Tc cell populations from eight (four male, four female) individual gzmA × B−/− mice and compared them with B6 alloreactive Tc cells in a primary and secondary MLC (Fig. 2, only shown for male mice). No differences in lytic activity could be discerned. Similar results were obtained with in vivo–derived H-2d reactive splenocytes from two individual mice of B6, gzmA−/−, gzmB−/−, gzmA × B−/−, and perforin−/− strains (Fig. 3). This was true for both target cells, L1210.3 and L1210.Fas, with the exception of one gzmA × B−/− mouse, which showed reduced cytolytic activity on both target cells. However, in vivo–generated alloreactive Tc cells from perforin−/− mice lysed L1210.Fas (Fig. 3) and P815 (data not shown) targets at levels comparable to those from B6 and gzm−/− mice. Lysis in the presence of EGTA-Mg2+ was only marginally reduced. The phenotype of the in vitro- and ex vivo–derived cytolytic cells from all mutant and B6 mice was CD4−CD8+ and no cytolytic activity was observed on H-2–matched EL4 target cells (data not shown). The differences observed in the cytolytic activity of in vitro- versus ex vivo–derived alloreactive Tc cells from perforin−/− mice may reflect differential regulation of Fas ligand and Fas expression during ex vivo induction and in vitro culture.

To determine if ex vivo–derived virus-specific Tc cells possess cytolytic phenotypes similar to those of in vitro- or ex vivo–derived alloreactive Tc cells, we tested ex vivo–derived influenza virus A/W SN–immune Tc cell for 51Cr-release of NPP-modified EL4 target cells (Fig. 4). Effector populations of all three infected gzm mutant mouse strains, but not perforin−/− mice, showed specific cytolytic activities in 2- and 4-h assays, at levels and with kinetics comparable to those of B6 mice. No 51Cr-release was seen with any of the Tc populations on untreated EL4 cells (data not shown).

To assess the cytolytic activities of ex vivo–derived NK cell populations of mutant and B6 mice, recipients were treated with either poly I:C (29) or SFV (30). Splenocytes were tested for lytic activity on 51Cr-labeled YAC-1 target cells. Similar levels of cytolytic activity were observed with effector cell populations from gzmA−/−, gzmB−/−, gzmA × B−/−, and B6 mice, when assayed between 2 and 4 h (Fig. 5, top). The occasional reduction in the activity of NK cells from gzm single or double ko mice as compared to B6
mice to induce $^{51}$Cr-release was neither significant nor reproducible in three additional experiments (data not shown). As shown in previous studies (2), marginal or no NK cell-mediated lytic activity was obtained with splenocytes from perforin $^{-/-}$ mice.

Role of granzymes A, B, and Perforin in Target Cell DNA Fragmentation. In vitro-derived H-2$^d$-reactive Tc cells from granzyme A $^{-/-}$ and B6 mice were indistinguishable in their ability to induce DNA fragmentation in L1210.3, L1210.Fas, A1.1, and TA3 target cells when tested between 2 and 8 h of incubation (Fig. 2, bottom panels). In contrast, Tc cells from granzyme B $^{-/-}$ mice were defective in their nucleolytic potential on the same targets in short term assays, i.e., between 2 and 4 h. However, after incubation of 6–8 h, this defect was either partially (L1210.3, 6 h) or completely (L1210.Fas, 6 h; A1.1, 6 h; TA3, 8 h) abrogated. Most importantly, the absence of nucleolytic activity was more pronounced in Tc cells from granzyme A $\times$ B $^{-/-}$ mice as compared to granzyme B $^{-/-}$ mice and only marginal nuclear damage was seen in long-term assays with granzyme A $\times$ B $^{-/-}$ Tc cells. Although granzyme A $\times$ B $^{-/-}$ Tc cells occasionally induced some DNA fragmentation in L1210.Fas and P815 target cells (data not shown), the level of nucleolytic activity was always lower than that seen with granzyme B $^{-/-}$ Tc cells. Marginal or no nucleolytic activity was seen with Tc cells from perforin $^{-/-}$ mice. No $^{129}$I-release in H-2$^d$-matched control EL4 cells was seen with any of the five Tc cell populations (data not shown). The analysis of the specific nucleolytic potential of ex vivo-derived influenza virus-immune Tc cell populations revealed that in a 2-h assay, perforin $^{-/-}$, and granzyme A $\times$ B $^{-/-}$ mice were defective, whereas Tc cell populations from granzyme A $^{-/-}$, granzyme B $^{-/-}$, and B6 mice each induced significant and similar amounts of $^{129}$I-release in NPP-modified EL4 target cells (Fig. 4, bottom) at high e/t ratio. Interestingly, in 4-h assays similar levels of DNA fragmentation were obtained on NPP-modified EL4 target cells with Tc cells from all mice tested, including granzyme A $\times$ B $^{-/-}$ and perforin $^{-/-}$. Since EL4 cells express Fas (data not shown), Fas-dependent nucleolytic activities of ex vivo-derived influenza virus immune Tc cells may contribute to DNA fragmentation of target cells at later stages of the assay.

When tested for their nucleolytic activity on YAC-1 target cells in 2- and 4-h assays, ex vivo-derived NK cells from perforin $^{-/-}$ and granzyme A $\times$ B $^{-/-}$ mice were defective and caused, if any, only marginal DNA fragmentation. In contrast, NK cells from granzyme A $^{-/-}$ and granzyme B $^{-/-}$ mice expressed nucleolytic activities which were already apparent in 2-h assays and increased in 4-h assays, comparable with those of B6 mice.

Discussion

The results of this study show that perforin-mediated target cell lysis by in vitro- and ex vivo-derived Tc and NK cells is independent of granzyme A and B, but that DNA fragmentation induced by this pathway may involve both enzymes. granzyme B appears to be the main effector molecule acting early during leukocyte-mediated apoptosis, whereas granzyme A nucleolytic activity acts with delayed kinetics that may complement or substitute for a granzyme B deficiency.

The data obtained with granzyme A $^{-/-}$ and granzyme B $^{-/-}$ single ko and granzyme A $\times$ B $^{-/-}$ double ko mice clarify previous conflicting results regarding the role of the two enzymes in Tc/NK cell-induced $^{51}$Cr-release from target cells. The fact that a noncytotoxic rat basophilic leukemia mast cell tumor line, transfected with perforin cDNA, only conferred optimal cytolytic activity upon coexpression of granzyme A and B, was taken as evidence for a synergistic role of the two enzymes in perforin-mediated target cell death (11). On the other hand, the recent findings that Tc/NK cell-induced $^{51}$Cr-release was not altered in granzyme A $^{-/-}$ or granzyme B $^{-/-}$ single ko mice (18, 22, 23) suggested that neither of the two proteases alone is critical for perforin-induced target cell membrane damage. The present demonstration that in vitro- and ex vivo-derived Tc and NK cell populations from granzyme A $\times$ B $^{-/-}$ mice induced lysis in various target cells, at levels and with kinetics similar to those of single mutant or B6 mice, un-
equivocally demonstrates that the cytolytic pathway leading to $^{51}$Cr-release is independent of gzmA and gzmB. However, the participation of other, as yet undefined proteases in perforin-mediated lysis cannot be ruled out. At present, there is no obvious explanation for the discrepancy between the results presented here and a previous report demonstrating a role for gzmB in NK- but not Tc- or LAK-cell-mediated $^{51}$Cr-release (33). It is particularly confounding that comparable ex vivo-derived NK cell populations (poly I:C) and target cells (YAC-1) were used in both studies.

Several recent reports have already provided evidence for the involvement of gzms in perforin-initiated nuclear damage (10–12), the absence of early DNA fragmentation in gzmA and B (34, 35) and because gzmA is not critical during early events of DNA fragmentation (22, 23). The evidence suggests that the biological functions of gzmA and B are not merely redundant. This was deduced from the distinct substrate specificities of gzmA and B (34, 35) and because gzmA is not critical during early stages of this pathway could not be excluded. This is also supported by the recent demonstration that inhibitors of caspases, in particular CPP32, prevent the expression of early gzmB-based but not late gzmA-based nucleolytic activity by Tc cells (19). This study provides definitive evidence for such an interpretation and presents additional information in that in vitro- and ex vivo-derived gzmA×B$^{-/-}$ Tc/NK cells are distinct from those of gzmB$^{-/-}$ mice in their perforin-based nucleolytic activity. Impairment of nucleolytic activity of gzmA×B$^{-/-}$ Tc/NK cells was shown in short-term and, in most cases, also in long-term assays.

In contrast to cytolytic and nucleolytic activities observed with in vitro-generated Tc cells from B6 and mutant mice, data obtained with ex vivo-derived influenza immune Tc cells were variable. This may be due to the distinct genotypes of gzmA$^{-/-}$ (B6; reference 22) versus gzmB$^{-/-}$ (129×B6; reference 18) and gzmA×B$^{-/-}$ (129×B6) mice. It is well established that genes outside the MHC play a crucial role in the recovery from ectromelia, a natural viral pathogen, and from influenza infection (reference 36 and Simon, M.M., and A. Müllbacher, unpublished data). Thus, the various responses to the pathogens by non-MHC genes may influence the kinetics of NK/Tc cell development in gzmA$^{-/-}$ and gzmB$^{-/-}$ mice, thereby making the actual role of gzms in cytolysis/nucleolysis to alleviate this problem we are currently breeding the gzmB$^{-/-}$ gene locus onto the B6 background. This will provide us with the ability to reveal the biological roles of gzmA, gzmB, and perforin not only in target cell cytolysis/nucleolysis, but also in immunopathology and in the control of infections.

We would like to thank Ian Haidl for reading the manuscript and for valuable suggestions. We also thank the laboratory of R. Zinkernagel (Zürich, Switzerland) for the generous gift of perforin (B6) ko mice and T. Ley (St. Louis, MO) for providing the gzmB ko mouse.

This work was supported in part by a grant from the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft, Si 214/7-1.

Address correspondence to Dr. Markus M. Simon, Max-Planck-Institut für Immunobiologie, Stübeweg 51, D-79108 Freiburg, Germany. Phone: 49-761-5108-533; FAX: 49-761-5108-529; E-mail: simon@immunbiol.mpg.de. Klaus Ebnet’s present address is Institut für Zellbiologie, ZMBE, D-48149 Münster, Germany.

Received for publication 13 August 1997 and in revised form 22 September 1997.

References

1. Rouvier, R., M.-F. Luciani, and P. Golstein. 1993. Fas involvement in Ca$^{2+}$-independent T cell-mediated cytoxicity. J. Exp. Med. 177:195–200.
2. Kägi, D., B. Ledermann, K. Bürki, P. Seiler, B. Odermatt, K.J. Olsen, E.R. Podack, R.M. Zinkernagel, and H. Henkart. 1994. Cytotoxicity mediated by T cells and natural killer cells is greatly impaired in perforin-deficient mice. J. Exp. Med. 177:195–200.
3. Kägi, D., F. Vignaux, B. Ledermann, K. Bürki, V. Depaepe, S. Nagata, H. Hengartner, and P. Golstein. 1994. Fas and perforin pathways as major mechanisms of T cell-mediated cytoxicity. Science (Wash. D.C.). 265:528–530.
4. Lowin, B., M. Hähne, C. Mattmann, and J. Tschopp. 1994. Cytolytic T-cell cytoxicity is mediated through perforin and Fas lytic pathways. Nature (Lond.). 370:650–652.
5. Walsh, C.M., M. Matloubian, C.-C. Liu, R. Ueda, C.G. Kurahara, J.L. Christensen, M.T.F. Huang, J.D.E. Young, R. Ahmed, and W.R. Clark. 1994. Immune function in mice lacking the perforin gene. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 91:10854–10858.
6. Kojima, H., N. Shimohara, S. Hanaoka, Y. Someya-Shirata, Y. Takagaki, H. Ohnoa, T. Saito, T. Katayama, H. Yagita, K. Okumura, et al. 1994. Two distinct pathways of specific killing revealed by perforin mutant cytotoxic T lymphocytes. Immunity. 1:357–364.
7. Henkart, P.A. 1994. Cytolytic activity of purified cytoplasmic granules from cytotoxic rat large granular lymphocyte tumors. J. Exp. Med. 160:75–93.
15. Darmon, A.J., D.W. Nicholson, and R.C. Bleackley. 1995. Proteolytic activation of the cell death protease Yama/CPP32 by cytotoxic T-cell-derived granzyme B. Nature (Lond.). 377:446–448.

16. Qian, L.T., M. Tewari, K. O'Rourke, V. Dixit, S.J. Snipas, G.G. Poirier, C. Ray, D.J. Pickup, and G.S. Salvesen. 1996. In vitro activation of the cell death protease Yama/CPP32 by granzyme B. J. Exp. Med. 185:803–815.

17. Fernandes-Alnemri, T., R.C. Armstrong, J. Krebs, S.M. Srinivasula, L. Wang, F. Bullrich, L.C. Fritz, J.A. Trapani, K.J. Tomasselli, G. Litwack, and E.S. Alnemri. 1996. In vitro activation of Cpp32 and Mch3 by Mch4, a novel human apoptotic cysteine protease containing two FADD-like domains. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 93:1972–1976.

18. Heusel, J.W., L. Wesselschmidt, S. Shresta, J.H. R ussell, and T.J. Ley. 1994. Cytotoxic lymphocytes require granzyme B for the rapid induction of DNA fragmentation and apoptosis in allogeneic target cells. Cell. 76:977–987.

19. Anel, A., S. Gamon, M.A. Alava, A.M. Schmitt-V erhulst, A. Pineiro, and J. Naval. 1997. Inhibition of Cpp32-like proteases prevents granzyme B- and Fas- induced apoptosis by CTL clones. J. of Immunol. 158:1999–2006.

20. Shiver, J.W., L. Su, and P.A. Henkart. 1992. Cytotoxicity with target DNA breakdown by rat basophilic leukemia cells expressing both cytolyisin and granzyme A. Cell. 71:315–322.

21. Aken, J.L., R.S. Garner, P.Y. Musy, M.A. Brooks, P.C. Turner, R.W. Moyer, G. MCapadden, and R.C. Bleackley. 1996. Differential inhibition of the Fas- and granule-mediated cytolyisin pathways by the orthopoxvirus cytokine response modifier A/SPI-2 and SPI-1 protein. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 93:9108–9113.