Issues in sustainable supply chain’s futuristic technologies: a bibliometric and research trend analysis

Ivan Darma Wangsa1 · Iwan Vanany1 · Nurhadi Siswanto1

Received: 18 March 2021 / Accepted: 23 November 2021 / Published online: 21 January 2022
© The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2021

Abstract
This paper presents a systematic review and bibliometric analysis in sustainable supply chain’s futuristic technologies. The analysis involves 1596 articles published in the Scopus database from 1990 to 2020. The analysis examines the research outcomes by observing trends in journals, authorship, and keywords. The outcomes are visualized using VOSviewer to show the graphical network of co-authorship and the author’s keywords. The results show that this research area has been a growing trend since 2016 and by 2020. The Journal of Cleaner Production was a leading journal in this area between 2016 and 2020, followed by Sustainability (Switzerland). The content analysis led to a classification of the articles into four main categories and sub-categories. The strategic diagram is used to reveal the emerging research themes analysis during the last 5 years (2016–2020) and to present future research. The data trending or emerging shows that technologies such as the technology by using combustion energy, renewable energy, and electric vehicles have been developing substantially. The research hotspots of the sustainable supply chain include, i.e., life cycle assessment (LCA), green investment, and carbon tax. Finally, the analysis also shows the research gaps that point a direction for future research.

Keywords Future technologies · Sustainable supply chain · Bibliometric analysis

Introduction
Over the last decades, climate change has been a serious concern among leaders of countries, companies, universities, and organizations in various sectors. Global climate change can only be tackled if everyone takes action in protecting and maintaining the environment and its ecosystems. Carbon dioxide (CO2) emissions result from the burning process of fossil fuels. The higher the carbon content in the fossil fuels and the more inefficient the combustion process, the greater the quantities of CO2. This is not only from transportation activities but also logistics and supply chain (LSC) activities. Best practices are accomplished when organizations prioritize the environment by minimizing carbon emissions. Green and sustainable supply chain management can help companies achieve this and compete in the market (Amirbagheri et al. 2019). The global trend is now to optimize production and ordering size quantities by all parties in the supply chain system, which is often referred to as a joint economic lot-sizing problem (JELP).

Most of the supply chain models assume that the vendor and buyer have not considered carbon emissions. This research is motivated by the fact that the vendor and buyer can produce the emission into the air. Recently, researchers have investigated inventory management with the consideration of the environmental and carbon emission cost. A domestic and international supply chains consider the environmental impacts (Wahab et al., 2011), a single-level lot sizing (EOQ) under emission constraints and different carbon emission policies (Benjaafar et al., 2013) and a two-level supply chain model incorporating carbon emission tax and penalties to reduce emission amount (Jaber et al. 2013). Some of the studies consider the energy (Bazan et al. 2015a), the reverse logistic and...
emissions from the manufacturing, re-manufacturing, and transportation activities (Bazan et al. 2015b; 2017); carbon penalty and incentive on vendor–buyer inventory model (Wangsa 2017); the carbon emissions and the defective items (Tiwari et al., 2018a); stochastic demand, defective items, and carbon emissions cost (Jauhari 2018); defective items, errors in inspection, and service level constraint (Saga et al. 2019); studied a two-echelon inventory system by considering the GHG emissions, energy usage, and inefficient production (Marchi et al. 2019); a three-echelon inventory model considering emissions from the transportation, warehousing, and disposal activities (Daryanto et al. 2019); and the emissions impact of the production, transportation, and warehousing activities (Wangsa et al. 2020).

Futuristic technologies in Industry 4.0 era can prompt innovative thinking, increase competitive advantage, and the sustainability of an industrial system (Stock and Seliger 2016; Müller et al. 2018). The literature on Industry 4.0 technologies in the period surveyed shows that typical technologies include additive manufacturing, big data and analytics, blockchain, cloud, internet of things (IoT), artificial intelligence (AI), autonomous robots, augmented reality (AR), electric vehicles, radio frequency identification (RFID), and unmanned aerial vehicle or drone (Dalenogare et al. 2018; Bái and Sarkis 2017; Schulte and Ny 2018; Wan et al. 2015; Strandhagen et al. 2017; Murray and Chu 2015). Studies have also analyzed the use of big data analytics in the supply chain management (Tiwari et al. 2018b) and green technology strategy to reduce carbon emission (Lou et al. 2015; Helmrich et al. 2015; Datta 2017; Huang et al. 2020; Karim and Nakade 2020).

There are systematic literature review and bibliometric analysis on green supply chain and Industry 4.0 in the database, but these are done in silos; for example, the systematic review of Industry 4.0 areas (Cobo et al. 2018), analysis of supply chain management from social network perspective (Ye 2019), the classification of Industry 4.0 technologies and the impact on sustainability (Bái et al. 2020), green supply chain (Amirbagheri et al. 2019), green and sustainable logistics (Ren et al. 2020), the classification of sustainable manufacturing (Bhatt et al. 2020), service supply chain (Nagariya et al. 2020), and lean supply chain management (Garcia-Buendia et al. 2021). Some comprehensive analysis involves a Scopus database on the green supply chain (Fahimnia et al., 2015), while others added on with a Web of Science database (Madiatti et al. 2018; Gong et al. 2019). In terms of transportation, research outcomes have been clustered based on the carbon emissions of different modes of transportation (Tian et al. 2018), as well as based on the Life Cycle Cost Assessment of electric vehicles (Ayodele and Mustapa 2020). Although the abovementioned literature review provides a bibliometric analysis on green and sustainable supply chain, a comprehensive bibliometric analysis considering Industry 4.0 technologies remains absent.

The purpose of this paper is to provide a comprehensive bibliometric review on futuristic technologies and sustainable supply chain by using a VOSviewer involving a database of a 30-year period from 1990 to 2020. This paper uses VOSviewer software to graphically display bibliometric map results. VOSviewer software functionality is specially designed to easily interpret large maps (Van Eck and Waltma 2010). This software collects data and creates maps based on bibliometric co-authorship, citations, co-citation, and keywords co-occurrence (Merigó et al. 2018 and Wang et al. 2018c). The analysis reports the trends based on the number of articles, citations, authors, and keywords. The bibliometric tool undertook the content analysis (e.g., research method, research environment, Industry 4.0 technologies, and policies and regulations) and identified the major clusters of research. Likewise, a science mapping analysis based on keywords co-occurrence was carried out to evaluate and identify the main research themes addressed in this area and their evolution over time. The results provide insights into the current research interests and potential directions for future research.

The rest of the paper is organized as follows: the “Research design” section explains the methodology of the bibliometric analysis including how the data was collected and reviewed. The “Bibliometric analysis and visualization” section describes the bibliometric analysis and presents the network analysis using VOSviewer. Moreover, the “Content analysis” section presents a content analysis of sustainable supply chain and futuristic technology. The “Science mapping analysis” section presents the analysis of the science mapping of emerging research topics based on keywords from the strategic diagram. Current research gaps and future research are also discussed. The “Conclusion and directions for future research” section summarizes the results and discusses opportunities for future research.

**Research design**

A literature review is one of the most important elements of any research work as it maps and assesses relevant literature to identify the possible research gaps that would be helpful in further strengthening the body of knowledge (Tranfield et al. 2003). In this research, a six-step literature review to identify influential research, identify the latest research areas, and provide insights into current research interests and future research directions in those areas. In the sixth stage, we conducted a confirmation stage to fit the results of emerging and declining trends in sustainable logistics and supply chain research areas with open questionnaires and to
be confirmed by experts. Two experts in the field of the sustainable supply chain who have 10–22 years of experience were interviewed on this research. The research methodology adopted in this paper is shown in Fig. 1. The analysis was conducted on retrieved literature from the Scopus database on 16 August 2020. We focus on the Scopus database, as Scopus is the largest database of peer-reviewed research literature in the field of science, technology, medicine, social science, and the arts and humanities. It comprises 20,000 peer-reviewed journals including those published by Elsevier, Emerald, Inform, Taylor and Francis, Springer, and Inderscience (Fahimnia et al. 2015).

**Stage 1: Defining the search (rules)**

First, we define four topics or rules for data collection, namely logistics and supply chain; green, sustainability, and environment; technologies; and inventory control. For each topic, there are several keywords used as shown in Table 1.

**Stage 2: Initial search**

Using these keywords for each topic, we inputted the combination of keywords (Rule 1 AND Rule 2 AND Rule 3 AND Rule 4) in the search column and “Article title, Abstract, Keywords” search in the Scopus database. We searched with document type “All” (include articles, conference papers, books, chapters of book, review, letter, note, etc.), years of publication “All years” and access type “All” (include open access). The initial search attempts resulted in 4849 articles from 1965 to 2020. We tried to ensure that all aspects of technologies on sustainable inventory and green supply chain management were fully captured.

**Table 1** Rule, topic, and keywords

| Rule | Topic                        | Keywords                                                                 |
|------|------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1    | Logistics and supply chain   | “supply chain*” OR “supply-chain*” OR “logistic*” OR “freight*” OR “truck*” OR “vehicle*” OR “material handling” |
| 2    | Green, sustainability, and environment | “green” OR “sustain*” OR “environment*” OR “CO2” OR “emission*” OR “energy” OR “eco” OR “life cycle” OR “waste” OR “bio” |
| 3    | Technologies                  | “technolog*” OR “develop*” OR “innova*” OR “future” OR “digital*” OR “industry 4.0” OR “hybrid” OR “electric*” OR “smart” OR “drone” |
| 4    | Inventory control              | “inventory”                                                             |
**Stage 3: Second search**

Out of 4849 articles from the initial screening, many papers appeared in multiple categories, so we refined with document type “article” (excluding conference papers, books, chapters of book, review, letter, note, etc.), years of publication “1990–2020” and source type “journal” and language “English.” This sifted the articles and left a total of 2788 articles.

**Stage 4: Third search (last refinement)**

In the last refinement, we limited the search to the subject area “Engineering, Energy, Business, Management and Accounting, Computer Science, Decision Science, Economics, Econometrics and Finance, Mathematics” and we found a total of 1596 articles. Table 2 shows the summary stages 1 to 4.

### Bibliometric analysis and visualization

**Article growth and trend analysis**

The growth in the number of articles in the annual publication on sustainable inventory and green supply chain from 1990 to 2020 is illustrated in Fig. 2, which shows an exponential trend. The total number of articles published annually reached a peak of 189 in 2019. Even though the data was downloaded from the Scopus database in August 2020, the figure shows an increase in the next 4 months with a slope $y = 2.0804e^{0.1525x}$. By the end of 2020, it is projected that there will be 235 articles. It indicates that the interest in this research is growing and developing rapidly.

**Top 30 productive journals**

Table 3 shows the 30 journals that have published the largest numbers of papers from 1990 to 2020. We divided them into five periods, with the first period stretching from 1990 to 2000 and the last period from 2016 to 2020. The top five
leading journals identified are The Journal of Cleaner Production (118), International Journal of Production Economics (78), Transportation Research Part D: Transport and Environment (55), International Journal of Production Research (49), and Sustainability (Switzerland) (47), which together accounted for 45.54% of the total selected publications. Interestingly, the second-ranked journal, Sustainability (Switzerland), has published 41 papers during the last 5 years, which indicates the journal’s growing interests.

**Top 20 most cited articles**

Table 4 shows the twenty most frequently cited articles from 2010 to 2020. The number one cited publication was Benjaafar et al. (2013), which studies the effect of carbon emission policy, such as carbon emission tax, inflexible cap, the cap-and-trade on a single-level lot-sizing model (EOQ model), with 569 citations in seven years or 81.29 citations per year (C/Y). The second most cited publication was Pradhan and Lee (2010), which presents a landslide survey analysis in Malaysia, with 466 citations and a C/Y score is 46.60 (466 citations in 10 years). The third most cited article was Dekker et al. (2012), which presents a review of the contribution operations research to green logistics, focusing on design, planning, and control in a supply chain for transportation, inventory, and facility decisions, with 443 citations in eight years (55.38 C/Y scores).
| Rank | Authors’ name       | Year | The objective of the article                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Journal name                             | TC  | C/Y   |
|------|---------------------|------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------|-----|-------|
| 1    | Benjaafar et al    | 2013 | Analysis and modeling of the relationship between simple inventory decision variables and carbon emissions in sustainable supply chains                                                                                           | IEEE Trans. Autom. Sci. Eng             | 569 | 81.29 |
| 2    | Pradhan and Lee    | 2010 | Assessment of Malaysia’s susceptibility to landslides based on bivariate logistic regression models using frequency ratios and GIS and remote sensing data                                                                                | Environ. Model. Softw                   | 466 | 46.60 |
| 3    | Dekker et al       | 2012 | Reviewed of several papers which are studies related to greenhouse gas emissions, noise and accidents in logistics operations on aspects of economic, environmental, and social                                                                 | Eur J Oper Res                           | 443 | 55.38 |
| 4    | Graham-Rowe et al  | 2012 | A qualitative analysis was performed to capture consumer reactions, attitudes, affective, and behaviors towards electric vehicles that reflect the future consumers and reveal barriers to motivation for electric vehicle adoption                                           | Transp. Res. Part A Policy Pract       | 289 | 36.13 |
| 5    | Kennedy et al      | 2010 | Development of a methodology for determining greenhouse gas emissions from cities. This method clarifies important details such as explicit identification of power line losses, inclusion of emissions from air and sea transport, and consistent determination of waste emissions | Energy Policy                            | 244 | 24.40 |
| 6    | You and Wang       | 2011 | Developed an optimal design for the biomass-to-liquid (BTL) supply chain, taking into account total annual costs and greenhouse gas emissions throughout the life cycle                                                                 | Ind. Eng. Chem. Res                     | 244 | 27.11 |
| 7    | Psaraftis and Kontovas | 2013 | Provided a taxonomy and survey of speed models in maritime transportation that ship speed is a key determinant to both shipping economics and environmental                                                                                 | Transp. Res. Part C Emerg. Technol      | 235 | 33.57 |
| 8    | Jaber et al        | 2013 | Development of a two-stage supply chain mathematical model that takes into emissions trading. The aim of the developed model is to minimize the total cost by determined the optimal production rate taking into account emission limits, penalties for exceeding emission limits and the capital invested to increase emissions limit | Int J Prod Res                          | 226 | 32.29 |
| 9    | Bouchery et al     | 2012 | Proposed a multi-objective formulation of the EOQ model called the Sustainable Order Quantity (SOQ) model. The model considers a multi-echelon extension of the SOQ model                                                                 | Eur J Oper Res                           | 199 | 24.88 |
| 10   | Kenné et al        | 2012 | Developed a stochastic dynamic model to optimize the performance of a forward-reverse logistics network. The model considered a relationship between the market for releasing second-hand products and the market for “new” products                                      | Int J Prod Econ                         | 177 | 22.13 |
| 11   | Rakopoulous et al  | 2011 | Performed experimental tests in the laboratory of bus / truck turbo diesel engines to investigate the mechanism of nitrogen oxide (NO) formation, smoke, and combustion noise emissions during hot start of various alternative fuel mixtures | Appl. Energy                            | 164 | 18.22 |
| 12   | Yang et al         | 2015 | Assessing the CO2 footprint on a particular percentage of the concrete mixture and determining the impact of additional cement-based materials on reducing CO2 emissions during concrete production. CO2 emissions from concrete manufacturing were assessed using the ISO14040 series lifecycle method | J. Clean. Prod                           | 157 | 31.40 |
After examining the general results concerning the article growth and trend, top productive journals, and top 20 most cited articles, the next analysis is on the co-authorship, co-occurrence of keywords, countries, and citation based on organizations (journals). VOSviewer software illustrates the visualization of these outputs.

To be mapped in Fig. 3, the network of authors is determined with a threshold of minimum of three documents per author. The 1596 articles were contributed by 4135 authors and co-authors, which represents the collaboration cluster. Out of the five productive researchers, namely Jaber, M.Y., Wee, H.M., Zanoni, S., Zhang, Y., Li, Y., and Wang, X, as shown in Fig. 3, the leading author is Jaber M.Y. from Ryerson University, Canada. From the data in Table 4, although the article by Jaber et al. (2013) was not the most cited, Jaber M.Y. was the most prolific with 24 articles published, and he is also connected with Zanoni, S., Zavanella, L.E., El Saadany, A.M.A., Marchi, B., Khan, M., and Bazan, E. The second productive author is Wee, H.M. from Chung Yuan Christian University (CYCU), Taiwan, with 15 articles published, whose research studies were linked to Wangsa, I.D., Yang, P.C., Chung, C.J., Tiwari, S., Jaggi, C.K., and Sarkar, B. Other researchers were linked to one of these main researchers. As such, it could be said that Jaber, M.Y.,
Wee, H.M., Zanoni, S., Zhang, Y., Li, Y., and Wang, X. are the leading authors in this area.

**Author's keywords visualization analysis**

Keywords represent the characteristic or specific field of study documents are associated with in an information system. In the data, the keywords are divided into two types: the author and the index. The author keywords are created by authors in the journal system and the index keywords are generated by the Scopus database system. The most frequent author’s keywords in the selected articles and presented in clusters of circles are visualized in Fig. 4a. The network of keywords in this research has a threshold of a minimum of 10 occurrences. The data shows that the 1596 articles have 4449 different keywords. The size of the circles represents the network of keywords based on the total occurrences. The size of the circle in each cluster depicts the numbers of articles captured by the main keywords and the cluster is depicted in yellow, blue, green, red, and orange. Figure 4b presents a visual report of keywords that appear 10 times or more. The top five author’s keywords are “life cycle assessment” which appeared 68 times, “sustainability” 63 times, “reverse logistics” 54 times, “inventory control” 41 times, and “simulation” 41 times. Figure 4b reports the results of Fig. 4a. These clusters are commonly found in articles on green logistics, sustainable supply chain, and technologies on inventory management.

Fig. 3 Authors network visualization was based on total document

© Springer
Authors’ keywords were based on total occurrence: a authors’ keyword network visualization; b authors keywords map
Content analysis

The content analysis aims to confirm different classifications covered by Scopus, which generates five main classes: (1) type of research method; (2) type of nature (conditions); (3) type of technologies; and (4) type of policies and regulations.

Types of research method

Generally, the research method was classified into modeling, case study research, conceptual framework, empirical study, and literature review. Figure 5a shows the classification of the articles based on the research method categories and its shares. The figure shows that the modeling makes up 54.45% of the total articles (869 out of 1596), case studies 18.86% (301 out of 1596), conceptual framework 17.79%, empirical study 6.89%, and literature review 2.01%.

According to Kazemi et al. (2019), the modeling method can be highlighted into several subject solution methodologies. In this paper, the methodologies were analyzed and classified into the type of methods applied: (1) analytical or mathematical model; (2) simulation and metaheuristic approach. Figure 5b shows that the predominant model is the mathematical model, used in 593 articles (68.24%). Simulation and metaheuristic approach appeared only in 276 articles (31.76%). The classification of the analytical (mathematical) model into eight classes is shown in Fig. 5c. Out of all articles, 593 articles that used mathematical models include a wide variety of sub-categories, such as non-linear programming, linear programming, mixed-integer programming, fuzzy, dynamic programming, integer programming, Markov chain, and other optimizations. However, there are also several authors using simulation and metaheuristic approaches. In contrast to mathematical programming, this approach is simulated by models programmed using computer software to derive the problem solutions, which is a near-optimum compared to a mathematical optimization approach. This approach is also often used to solve problems dealing with uncertainty (Kazemi et al. 2019). The papers in the current review can be classified into 12 sub-categories: discrete-event simulation, genetic algorithm, agent-based simulation, simulated annealing, particle swarm optimization, artificial neural network, tabu search, machine learning,
differential evolution algorithm, harmony search, memetic algorithm, and others simulation, as shown in Fig. 5d.

In this part of the study, based on the classification results above obtained, from 869 modeling articles, we investigated further our results and classified become into (i) objective function, (ii) decision variable, and (iii) system characteristic. Figure 6 shows that the minimum cost is the dominant of the objective goal from articles 78.88%. Out of all articles, the objective of maximum profit and minimize emission are around 15.36% and 5.76% respectively. The variable of lot size (order quantity) is the highest keyword used by authors in the articles, there are 240 keywords. The second till ten variables are used by authors, i.e., price of product, route (vehicle routing cases), number of vehicles, number of deliveries, production volume, vehicle assignment, emission quantity, lead time, and re-order point as presented in Fig. 7. Figure 8 shows the specific parameter characteristic of the system developed by authors in the articles. The characteristics such as sustainability, reverse logistics, fuzzy, VMI contract, shortage, lead time, imperfect quality, deteriorating items, and consignment contracts are used by authors in the articles.

**Types of nature (conditions)**

The next process is to classify 1596 articles based on the environmental phenomena in the research shown in Fig. 9, which yielded four categories, namely deterministic, probabilistic, stochastic (uncertainty), and not defined. Based on the classification, stochastic (uncertainty) is predominant as it is found in 587 articles (36.78%), followed by probabilistic and deterministic found in 298 articles (18.67%) and 174 articles (10.90%) respectively.

**Types of Industry 4.0 technologies**

At this stage, we classified the research topics based on the technologies used. The combustion energy such as fossil fuels, coal, and fuel-related energy sources was used in 395 articles, which makes it the most discussed. The second most discussed type of energy (appeared in 121 articles) is
the renewable ones such as wind energy, biofuels, and solar energy.

Industry 4.0 technologies can be grouped into physical and digital technologies (Bai et al., 2020). In recent years, many physical and digital technologies were proposed to be incorporated into the logistics systems. Physical technologies can be defined as technologies related to hardware that can be operated by the operator. Physical technologies in this research consist of the case study, conceptual framework, and modeling. Several studies on physical technologies in manufacturing and logistics can be seen as additive manufacturing or 3D printing technology (Gibson et al. 2014; Ghadge et al. 2018; Ransikarbum et al. 2020; Boer et al. 2020), electric vehicles (EVs) technology (Taefi et al. 2016; Duarte et al. 2016; Schulte and Ny 2018), cargo bikes (Perboli et al. 2016), autonomous vehicles (Stogios et al. 2019; Gelareh et al. 2013), and unmanned aerial vehicles (drone) technology (Murray and Chu 2015; Morrar et al. 2017). However, these technologies can only be integrated into a certain business and its operation. Meanwhile, digital technologies are related to software and mainly refer to information and communication technologies. These technologies are mostly in applications, such as intelligent transportation system (Basbas and Bouhouras 2008), big data analysis (Strandhagen et al. 2017; Tiwari et al. 2018b), radio frequency identification (Cui et al. 2017; Oya et al. 2018; Guchhait et al. 2019; Usama and Ramish 2020; and Ullah and Sarkar 2020), IoT (Melo et al. 2019), blockchain technology (Cole et al. 2019; Dutta et al. 2020; and Manupati et al. 2020), and cloud computing platform (Subramanian...
et al. 2014). Figure 10 presents the category of keywords are related to Industry 4.0 technologies, such as electric vehicles (87 articles), RFID (55 articles), IoT (22 articles), autonomous vehicle (11 articles), 3D printing (7 articles), unmanned aerial vehicle or drone (6 articles), and hybrid technology (3 articles). The following are some definitions of these technologies that is currently developing as shown in Table 5.

**Types of policies and regulations**

At this stage, we grouped the 1596 selected articles with regard to policies and regulations. According to Tian et al. (2018), keywords used by the authors to identify the policies and regulations include “energy policy”; “transportation policy”; “sustainability policy”; “environmental policy”; and “economic policy”. Figure 11 shows the classification of policies and regulations based on the author’s keywords. A detailed description of the categories is as follows:

**Energy policy**

The energy policy was dominated by keywords related to fuels and renewable energies, such as natural gas, wind energy, solar energy, and biofuel. As shown in Fig. 11a, there are 103 out of 1596 articles (6.45%) mentioning energy policy keywords. Articles that discuss both energy and supply chain are Wangsa et al. (2018), Nouiri et al. (2020), Jauhari et al. (2020), and Marchi et al. (2019, 2020).

**Transportation policy**

There are proposals on the use of certain modes of transportation and logistics aiming at improving sustainability. On land, freight consolidation, last mile, and trucking appeared in 60.31% of the total articles; marine transportation in 28.31% of the total articles; train transportation in 8.31% of the total articles; air transportation in 1.85% of the total articles; and pipeline transportation in 1.23% of the total articles. The percentages are presented in Fig. 11b. Freight transportation, warehousing, and reverse logistics are three major outsourced logistics activities (Ameknassi et al. 2016). To reduce global warming in the transportation sector, an outsourcing strategy can be applied and compared to common logistics operations (Facanha and Horvath, 2005).

**Sustainability policy**

There are seven strategies/regulations in the sustainability policy category as shown in Fig. 11c. Keywords include “carbon tax”; “carbon cap”; “carbon cap-and-trade”; “carbon penalty”; “carbon penalty and incentive”; “green investment”; and “life cycle assessment”. The life cycle assessment (LCA) strategy was found in 53.69% of the total articles. Regulations such as carbon tax, carbon cap, and carbon cap-and-trade have been effective in reducing the carbon emissions in inventory models (Benjafaar et al. 2013). Benjafaar et al. (2013) defined several of these strategies, such as “carbon tax.” The carbon tax strategy is a strategy for companies or related entities that pay taxes on the amount of emissions generated in the carbon market system (carbon trading). In addition, an obligation to reduce/limit carbon emissions can be imposed on each market participant, which is known as the “carbon cap” strategy. In general, a carbon cap is applied in the form of allowances at the beginning of the period. At the end of the period, market participants must report their actual emissions to a spe-
### Table 5 Definition of the emerging of technologies

| Technology                                      | Definition                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Source                                      |
|-------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|
| 3D printing (additive manufacturing)           | A technology that creates 3D (three-dimensional) solid objects with additive or layered materials.                                                                                                       | Gibson et al. (2014)                        |
| Artificial intelligent                         | A field of computer science that focuses on the development of intelligent machines that function and react like humans.                                                                                     | ElMaraghy and Ravi (1992)                   |
| Augmented reality                              | Reality-based interactive displays using computer capabilities.                                                                                                                                             | Wan et al. (2015)                           |
| Autonomous robots (robotics)                   | Robots are used to imitate and support human activities. This robot is often used for things beyond human capabilities.                                                                                         | Wan et al. (2015)                           |
| Autonomous vehicle (self-driving car)          | The autonomous vehicle is a vehicle that is controlled by a computer system. Autonomous vehicles can reduce traffic congestion, air pollution and fuel consumption, as well as reduce accidents and improve driving safety. | Bezai et al. (2020) and Stogios et al. (2019) |
| Big data and analytics                         | Refers to strategies for analyzing large amounts or volumes of data. Traditional data processing analysis cannot reveal the insights and meaning of this vast amount of data. | Strandhagen et al. (2017)                   |
| Blockchain technology                          | A distributed database system that manages transaction data and is secured with a new cryptography and managed by a consensus mechanism.                                                                     | Cole et al. (2019)                          |
| Cloud computing system                         | Refers to information technology (IT) services provided and accessed by cloud computing providers.                                                                                                         | Wan et al. (2015)                           |
| Cobotic system                                 | Robots designed to physically interact with humans.                                                                                                                                                         | Moulières-Seban et al. (2017)               |
| Cybersecurity                                   | Security and prevention methods are used to prevent the theft of data and information.                                                                                                                      | Lu (2017)                                  |
| Electric vehicles                              | A vehicle that is fully driven on electric power, so it requires a battery to store the source of electrical energy.                                                                                           | Schulte and Ny (2018)                       |
| Global positioning system (GPS)                | An application is connected to the satellite and is used to transmit precise signals related to data of location, speed, and time.                                                                          | Strandhagen et al. (2017)                   |
| Internet of things (IoT)                       | Various sets of hardware working together through internet connectivity to improve industrial processes.                                                                                                     | Lu (2017)                                  |
| Mobile technology                               | Wireless communication technology.                                                                                                                                                                           | Lu (2017)                                  |
| Radio frequency identification (RFID)          | Wireless communication technology connected between an object (tag) and a tracker (reader) to determine the position and identify the object automatically and accurately.                                            | Strandhagen et al. (2017)                   |
| Sensors and actuators                           | Hardware that responds to physical stimuli (such as heat, sound, pressure, magnetism, or certain movements) and transmits data in the form of measurement results.                                             | Teucke et al. (2018)                        |
| Unmanned aerial vehicle (drone)                | Unmanned aerial (pilots) and often known as a drone.                                                                                                                                                        | Murray and Chu (2015)                       |
specific authority. Participants who exceed their upper limit can purchase additional quotas from participants whose quota is not used. These data show whether the emission is too high or not. The data will also be used as a basis for establishing emission limit values in the next period (Hindarto, et al., 2018). This strategy is called the “carbon-cap-and-trade,” a strategy that aims to limit carbon emissions to market participants. Thus, the “green investment” strategy can be interpreted as a strategy in which companies issue investments as a carbon compensation to reduce carbon emissions (Benjafar et al., 2013). The investments made are, for example, forestry, development of renewable energy and others. Some of the applications of green technologies in reducing carbon emissions can be seen in Lou et al. (2015), Helmrich et al. (2015), Datta (2017), Huang et al. (2020), and Karim and Nakade (2020).

Environmental policy

Topics in this category include 3R (reuse, recovery, and recycle), greenhouse gases (GHG) emissions, and waste elimination. Figure 11d shows discussions of this topic is dominated by GHG emissions (222 articles or 57.66%) in relation to supply chain and logistics management. Country-wise, research has been conducted to examine the practices in China (Li et al. 2016; Gao et al., 2020); the USA (Yang et al., 2016; Abolhasani and Frey, 2013); India (Baidya and Borken-Kleefeld, 2009); Brazil (Maes et al., 2019); Iran (Shahbazi et al., 2016), and Spain (Pérez-Martínez, 2012).

Economic policy

There are two policies: focusing on minimizing costs (Sardar and Sarkar, 2020; Sarkar and Giri, 2020; Lashgari et al., 2019) and maximizing profits (Cai et al., 2020).
Economic policy was covered in 399 articles (25% of total articles). Almost 47.87% was conducted by using mathematical modeling. The rest consists of simulation modeling, case studies, conceptual frameworks, empirical studies, and literature reviews with the percentage of 22.56%, 14.04%, 8.27%, 4.26%, and 3.00%, respectively (Fig. 11).

**Science mapping analysis**

As described above, the main objective of this research is to design the science mapping of the area of sustainable supply chain and technologies. Science mapping or bibliometric mapping is a spatial representation of the relationship between disciplines, subject areas, subject areas, and documents or authors (Small 1999). To visualize the scientific mapping, we first identify the research themes using keyword co-occurrence analysis (Callon et al. 1983). Identified research topics are categorized based on their centrality and density ranking on the strategic diagram (Callon et al. 1991). Centrality measures the degree of interaction of a network with other networks. On the other hand, density measures the internal force of the network. With both measures, a research field can be visualized as a series of research topics that are mapped on a two-dimensional strategic diagram and divided into four quadrants (Cobo et al. 2011):

a) The themes in the upper-right quadrant (quadrant 1: Q1) are well developed and important to the structure of the research field. They are known as the specialty *motor themes* due to their strong centrality and high density.

b) Themes in the upper-left quadrant (quadrant 2: Q2) have well-developed internal links but unimportant external links and are therefore of marginal importance to the field. These topics are very *specialized and peripheral*.

c) Lower-left lower quadrant (quadrant 3: Q3) subjects are poorly developed and marginal. The themes in this quadrant are of low density and low centrality and represent mainly *emerging or declining themes*.

d) The topics in the lower-right quadrant (quadrant 4: Q4) are important to a research field but are not being developed. This quadrant contains general and general basic topics.

**Research trend by themes**

In total, 1596 publications in the period 1990–2020, this analysis shows the research trends for the subject area. Generally, the subject area is divided into two themes in this study, namely the theme of the technology and the sustainable supply chain. Figures, 12, 13 and 14 show the growth trends of the top five keywords in the period 1990–2020 for each theme. These figures indicate the continuous increase in the number of publications per theme.

In Fig. 13, the milestone for the first period considers the first all-time high in terms of annual publications after a growth phase in 2009. The second period refers to the most recent maximum number of publications after a growth period of four consecutive years in 2014 and the third period to the historical maximum that the journal has reached in the year of 2016. The top 5 keywords on the theme of the sustainable supply chain are the combustion energy keywords such as fossil fuels, coal, and renewable energy (e.g., wind, biofuel, solar), electric vehicles, information technology, and RFID, respectively.

Moreover, Fig. 14 shows the annual distribution of publication based on keywords of the sustainable and environmental area. As can be seen in this figure, LCA is the most common keyword for this theme and is followed distantly by other keywords. In addition to green investment, carbon tax, carbon-cap-and-trade, and carbon cap are among the most common keywords find in studies employing the sustainable and environmental theme.

**Emerging research themes**

The second analysis focused on the design of the strategic diagram. Figure 15 shows a strategic diagram to analyze the most highlighted issues in this area throughout the period 1990–2020. Research topics in the strategy diagram are represented as spheres, and performance measures such as total link strength (TLS), occurrence (OCC), average publication year, logarithmic value of TLS (Log TLS), and logarithmic value of OCC (Log OCC). The themes detected in each period are analyzed considering these...
measures. Based on all the keywords shown in Fig. 15 with the Log TLS and Log OCC values for each keyword, the average Log TLS and Log OCC values obtained are 1.385 and 1.399, respectively, where those values are density and centrality.

Based on the results of the strategy diagram, this analysis focuses on the third quadrant (lower-left quadrant). To determine the keywords that are in the third quadrant, the TLS value of each keyword is lower than the average TLS and as well as the OCC value. The keywords in the third quadrant are divided into three sub-periods, namely Q3 declining (less than 2012), Q3 semi-emerging (2012–2015), and Q3 emerging theme (over 2015) as shown in Table 6. This table shows a total of 21 keywords in quadrant 3 and the results show that the emerging topics have 8 keywords or 38.10%, semi-emerging topics is 10 keywords or 47.62%, and declining topics is 3 keywords (14.29%).

Furthermore, Table 7 shows the performance indicators (average of publication year, Log TLS, and Log OCC) for each keyword. From the results of 8 emerging keywords, then grouped into three themes. This table shows 8 keywords that are divided into 3 thematic areas, among which are: SUSTAINABILITY-STRATEGY, TRANSPORTATION-TECHNOLOGY, and MODEL-OPTIMIZATION. Determining the classification of keywords in each theme is based on a thematic approach of interrelated keywords.

The theme SUSTAINABILITY-STRATEGY delves into carbon footprint, china, emission inventory, and sustainable development. The theme TRANSPORTATION-TECHNOLOGY deals with electric vehicles and energy consumption. Finally, the MODEL-OPTIMIZATION theme is mainly devoted to knowledge game theory and inventory routing problem.

The emerging themes were sent in advance and confirmed by well-known experts in the field who were willing to discuss in detail. We asked the experts four questions to validate the results of the study. The first question in the study is about identifying the emerging and declining trends in
sustainable logistics and supply chain research areas. The second question is related to keywords such as carbon footprint, China, emission inventory, and sustainable development, which is sufficient to fit into the theme of sustainability strategy. The third is about keywords that fit well with transportation and technology themes, such as electric vehicles and energy consumption. The last question pertains to keywords such as game theory and inventory routing issues that are sufficient to fit into the topic of modeling and optimization. The answers of the experts were as follows:

Expert 1

1. Yes, it is a good way to structure and investigate emerging and declining trends in Logistics and Supply Chain Management (LSCM).
2. No. The keywords are too broad. It is better to be more specific. For example, China Mining or China Automotive etc. and try to focus on specific industry. The same goes for sustainable development. For example, deforestation or air pollution is much focus and easier to get data etc.

3. Authors can also include sustainable urban transportation, mobility, renewable resources, green vehicles, powered transport, and others.
4. Try to include more such as industry 4.0, machine learning, data mining, adaptive algorithm and other Artificial Intelligent (AI) related terms. Authors can also include COVID-19 disruption if possible.

Expert 2

1. Yes, it is adequate but there could be other terms to consider such as green supply chain, global warming, green manufacturing, global warming, carbon trading.
2. Yes, it is adequate but China is not the only biggest polluter but there are others as well such as India etc. Other keywords to consider—green energy, green building.
3. Electric vehicles must be expanded to include commercial land vehicle. There is a trend to use electric aircraft, drone, and electric unmanned ships for transportation.

Fig. 15 Strategic diagram for the research theme (1990–2020)
### Table 6  The keywords at Q3 (emerging, semi-emerging, and declining)

| Keyword No | Keyword                          | TLS  | OCC  | Avg. pub. year | Log TLS | Log OCC | Q3 emerging (> 2015) | Q3 semi-emerging (2012–2015) | Q3 declining (< 2012) |
|------------|----------------------------------|------|------|----------------|---------|---------|---------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| 1          | Air pollution                    | 10   | 12   | 2012.000       | 1.000   | 1.079   | Q3 declining        |                              |                        |
| 2          | Air quality                      | 14   | 12   | 2014.583       | 1.146   | 1.079   | Q3 declining        |                              |                        |
| 3          | Biomass                          | 11   | 12   | 2014.750       | 1.041   | 1.079   | Q3 declining        |                              |                        |
| 4          | Carbon footprint                 | 22   | 21   | 2015.238       | 1.342   | 1.322   | Q3 Emerging         |                              |                         |
| 5          | China                            | 12   | 16   | 2016.000       | 1.079   | 1.204   | Q3 emerging         |                              |                         |
| 6          | Climate change                   | 13   | 13   | 2012.769       | 1.114   | 1.114   | Q3 semi-emerging    |                              |                         |
| 7          | Electric vehicles                | 23   | 25   | 2015.680       | 1.362   | 1.398   | Q3 emerging         |                              |                         |
| 8          | Emission inventory               | 5    | 17   | 2015.529       | 0.699   | 1.230   | Q3 emerging         |                              |                         |
| 9          | Energy consumption               | 17   | 15   | 2017.067       | 1.230   | 1.176   | Q3 emerging         |                              |                         |
| 10         | Game theory                      | 16   | 12   | 2017.750       | 1.204   | 1.079   | Q3 emerging         |                              |                         |
| 11         | Genetic algorithm                | 21   | 20   | 2012.750       | 1.322   | 1.301   | Q3 semi-emerging    |                              |                         |
| 12         | Inventory routing problem        | 15   | 17   | 2017.941       | 1.176   | 1.230   | Q3 emerging         |                              |                         |
| 13         | Manufacturing                    | 15   | 12   | 2010.250       | 1.176   | 1.079   | Q3 declining        |                              |                         |
| 14         | Production                       | 21   | 15   | 2014.000       | 1.322   | 1.176   | Q3 semi-emerging    |                              |                         |
| 15         | Production planning              | 13   | 16   | 2011.125       | 1.114   | 1.204   | Q3 declining        |                              |                         |
| 16         | Recycling                        | 16   | 15   | 2015.000       | 1.204   | 1.176   | Q3 semi-emerging    |                              |                         |
| 17         | Stochastic demand                | 11   | 13   | 2014.462       | 1.041   | 1.114   | Q3 semi-emerging    |                              |                         |
| 18         | Supply chain coordination        | 10   | 15   | 2014.333       | 1.000   | 1.176   | Q3 semi-emerging    |                              |                         |
| 19         | Sustainable development          | 7    | 14   | 2016.357       | 0.845   | 1.146   | Q3 emerging         |                              |                         |
| 20         | System dynamics                  | 20   | 13   | 2014.462       | 1.301   | 1.114   | Q3 semi-emerging    |                              |                         |
| 21         | Vendor-managed inventory         | 19   | 23   | 2012.478       | 1.279   | 1.362   | Q3 semi-emerging    |                              |                         |

*TLS*, total length strength; *OCC*, occurrences

### Table 7  The emerging topic

| Keyword No | Keyword                          | Avg. publication year | Log TLS | Log OCC | Quadrant         |
|------------|----------------------------------|-----------------------|---------|---------|-----------------|
| **A. SUSTAINABILITY-STRATEGY** |                                  |                       |         |         |                 |
| 1          | Carbon footprint                 | 2015.238              | 1.342   | 1.322   | Q3 emerging     |
| 2          | China                            | 2016.000              | 1.079   | 1.204   | Q3 emerging     |
| 3          | Emission inventory               | 2015.529              | 0.699   | 1.230   | Q3 emerging     |
| 4          | Sustainable development          | 2016.357              | 0.845   | 1.146   | Q3 emerging     |
| **B. TRANSPORTATION-TECHNOLOGY** |                                  |                       |         |         |                 |
| 1          | Electric vehicles                | 2015.680              | 1.362   | 1.398   | Q3 emerging     |
| 2          | Energy consumption               | 2017.067              | 1.230   | 1.176   | Q3 emerging     |
| **C. MODEL-OPTIMIZATION** |                                  |                       |         |         |                 |
| 1          | Game theory                      | 2017.750              | 1.204   | 1.079   | Q3 emerging     |
| 2          | Inventory routing problem        | 2017.941              | 1.176   | 1.230   | Q3 emerging     |
| No | Author (year) | Research objectives | Method | Technology | Sustainability aspect |
|----|---------------|---------------------|--------|------------|-----------------------|
| 1  | Rout et al. (2020) | Implementation of various regulatory policies (mainly CO₂ tax, CO₂ Cap-and-offset, cap-and-trade) to reduce emissions. This reduces the impact of CO₂ emissions by reducing emissions | Fuzzy | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy) | Carbon emission tax, and carbon cap-and-trade |
| 2  | Wangsa et al. (2020) | Finding minimum total cost by optimizing the decision variables (order quantity, emissions, safety factor, lead time, and number of shipments) | Non-linear programming | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy) | Carbon cap-and-trade |
| 3  | Zhen et al. (2020) | Proposing a non-linear mixed integer programming model, using fleets along routes (including the introduction of environmentally friendly technologies), travel speeds of all routes, timetables, between routes of each origin-destination and berth allocations to minimize the total cost | Mixed-integer programming | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy) | Green investment |
| 4  | Lu et al. (2020) | Method analysis identified the optimal equilibrium solution that maximizes the overall profits of manufacturers and retailers | Non-linear programming | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy) | Carbon emission tax, green investment |
| 5  | Manupati et al. (2020) | Developed a blockchain approach based on distributed ledger. Monitor supply chain performance and synchronize and optimize emissions and operating costs to achieve better supply chain results. As part of our carbon tax policy, a blockchain approach is proposed to various production allocation issues within the multi-echelon supply chain (MESC) | Mixed-integer programming | Blockchain technology | Carbon emission tax |
| 6  | Karim et al. (2020) | Optimized the production and green investment, and retailers decide on the best sourcing to maximize the profit in a single period | Non-linear programming | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy) | Carbon tax, green investment |
| No | Author (year)          | Research objectives                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Method                 | Technology                                                                                                           | Sustainability aspect                      |
|----|------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|
| 7  | Huang et al. (2020)    | The proposed model guides companies determine the optimal production, delivery, and green investment with the goal of minimizing costs under various CO$_2$ emission regulations                                           | Non-linear programming | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)      | Carbon emission tax, green investment      |
| 8  | Tang et al. (2020)     | Developed a three-tier dynamic game model to optimize the wholesale prices, carbon tax rates, and the percentage of sustainable investment shared by the government                                                      | Dynamic game optimization | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)      | Carbon emission tax                        |
| 9  | Yaghin and Sarlak (2019)| Considering a social purchase value, total profit (TP), delivery time, air pollution, water pollution, and energy consumption associated with boundaries are considered together in a multi-product system. A new fuzzy multi-objective optimization is modeled to capture inherent fuzziness in important data | Fuzzy                  | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)      | Carbon emission tax, green investment      |
| 10 | Shen et al. (2019)     | Determined the optimal production, delivery, ordering, and investment policies for buyers and sellers that maximize total profit per unit time, taking into account carbon tax policies                                        | Non-linear programming | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)      | Carbon emission tax, green investment      |
| 11 | Li et al. (2019)       | The paper optimizes green cold chain inventory routing models that minimize overall costs                                                                                                                        | Simulated annealing    | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)      | Carbon cap-and-trade                       |
| 12 | Hariga et al. (2019)   | Introducing a single vendor, single buyer supply chain under a VMCI contract to reduce carbon emissions and total cost                                                                                             | Non-linear programming | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)      | Carbon emission tax                        |
| 13 | Rani et al. (2019)     | Developed an eco-friendly supply chain model for defective items by considering recycling, reverse logistics, and remanufacturing while minimizing total cost                                                                 | Fuzzy                  | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)      | Carbon emission tax                        |
| No | Author (year) | Research objectives                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Method                          | Technology                                                                                                                                     | Sustainability aspect                        |
|----|---------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|
| 14 | Bai et al. (2019) | Investigated the effects of carbon emission policies (carbon cap-and-trade regulation and investment in green technologies are used) to reduce emissions and improve total profit on a supply chain with one manufacturer and two competing retailers for deteriorating products under VMI                                                                                           | Non-linear programming          | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)                | Carbon cap-and-trade, green investment        |
| 15 | Taheri-Moghadam et al. (2019) | Minimize the total cost of the entire network (production, transportation, warehousing/outsourcing, and investment), taking into account economic, environmental, social impact, and levels of customer service                                                                                                                                           | Discrete-event simulation      | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)                | Carbon emission tax, green investment          |
| 16 | Sarkar et al. (2018) | Maximize the total profit by incorporating multi-trade-credit policy, rework, shortages, and environmental impact simultaneously                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Non-linear programming          | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)                | Carbon emission tax                            |
| 17 | Fan et al. (2018) | Extended the traditional EOQ (economic order quantity) model to consider decisions on production inventory, carbon trading, and emission reduction investments in decentralized and centralized policies, reducing total supply chain costs and carbon emissions                                                                                           | Non-linear programming          | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)                | Carbon cap-and-trade                          |
| 18 | Wang et al. (2018a, b, c) | Developed a mixed integer non-linear programming model to maximize the profitability of a supply chain network consisting of raw material vendors, manufacturers, and distribution centers                                                                                                                                                                                      | Non-linear programming          | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)                | Carbon cap                                    |
| 19 | Wang et al. (2018a, b, c) | Constructed a low-carbon inventory routing problem (LCIRP) optimization model of refined oil distribution network with the minimum total costs as the objective function                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Genetic algorithm               | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy)                | Carbon emission tax                            |
| No | Author (year)    | Research objectives                                                                 | Method                        | Technology                              | Sustainability aspect                      |
|----|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------|
| 20 | Jung and Jeong (2018) | Investigated the effect of information sharing of inventory through the virtual warehouse by using a system dynamics-based simulation model | Discrete-event simulation     | Information technology                  | Carbon emission tax, green investment     |
| 21 | Dai et al. (2018)  | Formulated a mixed-integer nonlinear programming model to minimize the total costs by using hybrid genetic algorithm (HGA) and hybrid harmony search (HHS) | Genetic algorithm and harmony search | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy) | Carbon emission tax                        |
| 22 | Huang et al. (2018) | Considering economical losses and environmental issues, the model is developed to optimize pricing, inventory, and preservation decisions that maximize the individual profit under a decentralized supply chain | Non-linear programming        | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy) | Carbon emission tax                        |
| 23 | Zhang et al. (2017) | Finding a compromise between economic development and environmental protection, involving stakeholders, including local governments and firms which want to maximize its social interests and economic interests | Fuzzy                        | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy) | Carbon emission tax                        |
| 24 | Batarfi et al. (2017) | Investigated the impact of various return guidelines on the behavior of SC systems before and after adopting the dual-channel taking into account the refurbishment, collection and disposal processes | Non-linear programming        | E-commerce                              | Carbon emission tax                        |
| 25 | Qiu et al. (2017)   | Incorporating carbon emissions into production inventory and routing decisions      | Branch-and-bound optimization | Conventional transportation using several parameters such as fossil fuels, fuel consumption (combustion energy) | Carbon cap-and-trade                       |
4. Yes, it is sufficient but newer development such as big data, data analytics etc. need to be considered.

Contribution of previous research

Finally, this subsection presents a list of theoretical studies using sustainable supply chain and technology issues (Table 8). This list contains the characteristics and parameters which are most related to this field and suggests finding the theoretical gap in this research area. However, this list draws from a recent theoretical paper in the field which aims to conceptualize the field. In this analysis, we obtained 25 related studies for further analysis by making the parameters’ comparison. Table 8 lists the names of the authors, the title of the article, research method, and the variables used in each study.

Conclusion and directions for future research

This paper presents a bibliometric analysis of publications from 1990 until 2020 and insights into futuristic technologies issues in green supply chain management. The analysis shows that the leading journal is the Journal of Cleaner Production (JCP). The journal of Sustainability (Switzerland) has an increasing number of relevant articles, as shown in their publication in the last 5 years. This systematic review identifies technology that has an impact on the sustainability of the supply chain systems, both practically and theoretically. This study period is divided into three sub-periods (1990–2011, 2012–2015, and more than 2015) depending on the publications and the subject or thematic area.

The main contributions of this study are the identification of the research themes developed by the strategic diagram. According to the strategic diagram, three emerging themes are identified (i) sustainable supply chains and competitive strategy, (ii) technology adoption in transportation, and (iv) modeling and optimization. These themes are linked to futuristic technologies and a sustainable supply chain. Futuristic technologies in the supply chain systems include technology by using combustion energy and renewable energy, electric vehicles technology, and RFID. Sustainable supply chain theme includes, i.e., LCA, green investment, and carbon tax. The experts confirmed the emerging themes in the strategic diagram as a good representation of the topic. At present, the research topicality mainly includes the following topics: energy policy, transportation policy, sustainability policy, environmental policy, and economic policy.

The limitations of this review are attributed to the exclusion of the other document sources such as PubMed or Web of Science and limited classification schemes.

Acknowledgements The authors are grateful to the editor-in-chief who has given the opportunity for this manuscript to be reviewed and this manuscript has not been submitted to, nor is under review at, another journal or other publishing venue.

Author contribution Drafting the manuscript: I.D.W., I.V., and N.S.; methodology: I.V.; analyzing and interpreting the data: I.D.W., I.V., and N.S.; writing—review & editing: I.V. and N.S.; visualization: I.D.W.; supervision: I.V.; funding acquisition, n/a. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Availability of data and materials Not applicable.

Declarations

Ethics approval and consent to participate Not applicable.

Consent for publication Not applicable.

Competing interests The authors declare no competing interests.

References

Abolhasani S, Frey HC (2013) Engine and duty cycle variability in diesel construction equipment emissions. J Environ Eng 139(2):261–268
Ameknassi L, Ait-Kadi D, Rezg N (2016) Integration of logistics outsourcing decisions in a green supply chain design: a stochastic multi-objective multi-period multi-product programming model. Int J Prod Econ 182:165–184
Amirbagheri K, Nuñez-Carballosa A, Guitart-Tarrés L, Merigó JM (2019) Research on green supply chain: a bibliometric analysis. Clean Technol Environ Policy 21(1):3–22
Ayodele BV, Mustapa SI (2020) Life cycle cost assessment of electric vehicles: a review and bibliometric analysis. Sustainability 12(6):2387
Azevedo SG, Carvalho H, Duarte S, Cruz-Machado V (2012) Influence of green and lean upstream supply chain management practices on business sustainability. IEEE Trans Eng Manage 59(4):753–765
Bai C, Sarkis J (2017) Improving green flexibility through advanced manufacturing technology investment: modeling the decision process. Int J Prod Econ 188:86–104
Bai Q, Jin M, Xu X (2019) Effects of carbon emission reduction on supply chain coordination with vendor-managed deteriorating product inventory. Int J Prod Econ 208:83–99
Bai C, Dallasega P, Orzes G, & Sarkis J (2020) Industry 4.0 technologies assessment: a sustainability perspective. International Journal of Production Economics, 107776.
Baidya S, Borken-Kleefeld J (2009) Atmospheric emissions from road transportation in India. Energy Policy 37(10):3812–3822
Bashas S, Bouhouras E (2008) Evaluation of environmental impacts from the use of intelligent transportation systems in road freight transport. J Environ Prot Ecol 9(3):691–697
Batarfi R, Jabir MY, Alzazz SM (2017) A profit maximization for a reverse logistics dual-channel supply chain with a return policy. Comput Ind Eng 106:58–82
Bazan E, Jaber MY, Zanoni S (2015a) Supply chain models with greenhouse gases emissions, energy usage and different coordination decisions. Appl Math Model 39(17):5131–5151

Bazan E, Jaber MY, El Saadany AM (2015b) Carbon emissions and energy effects on manufacturing–remanufacturing inventory models. Comput Ind Eng 88:307–316

Bazan E, Jaber MY, Zanoni S (2017) Carbon emissions and energy effects on a two-level manufacturer-retailer closed-loop supply chain model with remanufacturing subject to different coordination mechanisms. Int J Prod Econ 183:394–408

Benjaafar S, Li Y, Daskin M (2013) Carbon footprint and the management of supply chains: insights from simple models. IEEE Trans Autom Sci Eng 10(1):99–116

Bezai NE, Medjdoub B, Al-Habaibeh A, Chalal ML, Fadi F (2020) Future cities and autonomous vehicles: analysis of the barriers to full adoption. In-press, Energy and Built Environment

Bhatt, Y., Ghuman, K., & Dhir, A. (2020). Sustainable manufacturing. Bibliometrics and content analysis. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 120988.

Boer JD, Lambrecht W, & Krikke H (2020) Additive manufacturing in military and humanitarian missions: advantages and challenges in the spare parts supply chain. J Clean Prod 257:120301

Bouchery Y, Ghaffari A, Jemai Z, Dallary Y (2012) Including sustainability criteria into inventory models. Eur J Oper Res 222(2):229–240

Cai J, Hu X, Jiang F, Zhou Q, Zhang X, Xuan L (2019) Optimal input quantity decisions considering commitment order contracts under yield uncertainty. Int J Prod Econ 216:398–412

Callon M, Courtial JP, Turner WA, Bauin S (1983) From translations to problematic networks: an introduction to co-word analysis. Soc Sci Inf 22(2):191–235

Callon M, Courtial JP, Laville F (1991) Co-word analysis as a tool for describing the network of interactions between basic and technological research: The case of polymer chemistry. Scientometrics 22(1):155–205

Clavreul J, Baumesteir H, Christensen TH, Danggaard A (2014) An environmental assessment system for environmental technologies. Environ Model Softw 60:18–30

Cobo MJ, López-Herrera AG, Herrera-Viedma E, Herrera R (2011) An approach for detecting, quantifying, and visualizing the evolution of a research field: a practical application to the fuzzy sets theory field. J Inf 5(1):146–166

Cobo MJ, Jürgens B, Herrero-Solana V, Martínez MA, Herrera-Viedma E (2018) Industry 4.0: a perspective based on bibliometric analysis. Procedia Compsci 139:364–371

Cole R, Stevenson M, Aitken J (2019) Blockchain technology: implications for operations and supply chain management. Supply Chain Manage Int J 24(4):469–483

Cui L, Deng J, Liu F, Zhang Y, Xu M (2017) Investigation of RFID investment in a single retailer two-supplier supply chain with random demand to decrease inventory inaccuracy. J Clean Prod 142:2028–2044

Dai Z, Aqlan F, Zheng X, Gao K (2018) A location-inventory supply chain network model using two heuristic algorithms for perishable products with fuzzy constraints. Comput Ind Eng 119:338–352

Dalenogare LS, Benitez GB, Ayala NF, Frank AG (2018) The expected contribution of Industry 4.0 technologies for industrial performance. Int J Prod Econ 204:383–394

Daryanto Y, Wee HM, Astanti RD (2019) Three-echelon supply chain model considering carbon emission and item deterioration. Transp Res Part E: Logist Transp Rev 122:368–383

Datta TK (2017) Effect of green technology investment on a production-inventory system with carbon tax. Adv Oper Res 2017

Dekker R, Bloemhof J, Mallidis I (2012) Operations Research for green logistics—an overview of aspects, issues, contributions and challenges. Eur J Oper Res 219(3):671–679

Duarte G, Rolim C, Baptista P (2016) How battery electric vehicles can contribute to sustainable urban logistics: a real-world application in Lisbon, Portugal. Sustain Energy Technol Assess 15:71–78

Dubarry M, Truchot C, Liaw BY, Gering K, Sazhin S, Jamison D, & Michelbacher C (2011) Evaluation of commercial lithium-ion cells based on composite positive electrode for plug-in hybrid electric vehicle applications. Part II. Degradation mechanism under 2 C cycle aging. J Power Sources 196(23):10336–10343

Dutta P, Choi TM, Somani S, & Butala R (2020) Blockchain technology in supply chain operations: applications, challenges and research opportunities. Transp Res Part E: Logist Transp Rev 142:102067

El Saadany AM, Jaber MY (2010) A production/remanufacturing inventory model with price and quality dependant return rate. Comput Ind Eng 58(3):352–362

ElMaraghy HA, Ravi T (1992) Modern tools for the design, modeling and evaluation of flexible manufacturing systems. Robot Comput Integr Manuf 9(4–5):335–340

Facanha C, Horvath A (2005) Environmental assessment of logistics outsourcing. J Manag Eng 21(1):27–37

Fahimnia B, Sarkis J, Davarzani H (2015) Green supply chain management: a review and bibliometric analysis. Int J Prod Econ 162:101–114

Fan Y, Wang M, Zhao L (2018) Production-inventory and emission reduction investment decision under carbon cap-and-trade policy. RAIRO-Operations Research 52(4–5):1043–1067

Gao C, Gao C, Song K, Xing Y, & Chen W (2020) Vehicle emissions inventory in high spatial–temporal resolution and emission reduction strategy in Harbin-Changchun Megalopolis. Process Saf Environ Protect

Garcia-Buendia N, Moyano-Fuentes J, Maqueira-Marin JM, Cobo MJ (2021) 22 Years of Lean Supply Chain Management: a science mapping-based bibliometric analysis. Int J Prod Res 59(6):1901–1921

Gelaréh S, Merzouki R, McGinley K, Murray R (2013) Scheduling of intelligent and autonomous vehicles under pairing/unpairing collaboration strategy in container terminals. Transp Res Part C: Emerging Technol 33:1–21

Ghadge A, Karantoni G, Chaudhuri A, & Srinivasan A (2018) Impact of additive manufacturing on aircraft supply chain performance. J Manuf Technol Manage

Gibson I, Rosen DW, Stucker B (2014) Additive manufacturing technologies, vol 17. Springer, New York

Gong R, Xue J, Zhao L, Zholtova O, Ji X, Xu Y (2019) A bibliometric analysis of green supply chain management based on the Web of Science (WOS) platform. Sustainability 11(12):3459

Graham-Rowe E, Gardner B, Abraham C, Skippon S, Dittmar H, Hutchins R, Stannard J (2012) Mainstream consumers driving plug-in battery-electric and plug-in hybrid electric cars: a qualitative analysis of responses and evaluations. Transp Res Part A: Policy Pract 46(1):140–153

Guchhait R, Pareek S, Sarkar B (2019) How does a radio frequency identification optimize the profit in an unreliable supply chain management? Mathematics 7(6):490

Hariga M, Babekian S, Bahroun Z (2019) Operational and environmental decisions for a two-stage supply chain under vendor managed consignment inventory partnership. Int J Prod Res 57(11):3642–3662

Helmrich MJR, Jans R, van den Heuvel W, Wagelmans AP (2015) The economic lot-sizing problem with an emission capacity constraint. Eur J Oper Res 241(1):50–62
Hindarto DE, Samsyanaegra A & Nathalia D (2018) #pasarkarbon: pengantar pasar karbon untuk pengendalian perubahan iklim. PMR Indonesia

Huang H, He Y, Li D (2018) Pricing and inventory decisions in the food supply chain with production disruption and controllable deterioration. J Clean Prod 180:280–296

Huang YS, Fang CC, & Lin YA (2020) Inventory management in supply chains with consideration of logistics, green investment and different carbon emissions policies. Compu Ind Eng 139:106207

Jaber MY, Glock CH, El Saadany AM (2013) Supply chain coordination with emissions reduction incentives. Int J Prod Res 51(1):69–82

Jauhari WA (2018) A collaborative inventory model for vendor–buyer system with stochastic demand, defective items and carbon emission cost. Int J Logist Syst Manage 29(2):241–269

Jauhari WA, Melinda ID, & Rosyidi CN (2020) Inventory-based optimization of a two-echelon fossil-fuelled energy storage system. Int Trans Electrical Energy Syst 30(3):e12256

Jung H, Jeong S (2018) The economic effect of virtual warehouse-based inventory information sharing for sustainable supplier management. Sustainability 10(5):1547

Karim R, & Nakade K (2020) Modelling a one retailer–one manufacturer supply chain system considering environmental sustainability and disruption. Int J Syst Sci: Operat Logist 1–24

Kazemi N, Modak NM, Govindan K (2019) A review of reverse logistics and closed loop supply chain management studies published in IJPR: a bibliometric and content analysis. Int J Prod Res 57(15–16):4937–4960

Kenné JP, Dejaz P, Gharbi A (2012) Production planning of a hybrid manufacturing–remanufacturing system under uncertainty within a closed-loop supply chain. Int J Prod Econ 135(1):81–93

Kennedy C, Steinberger J, Gasson B, Hansen Y, Hillman T, Havrânek M., ... & Mendez GV (2010) Methodology for inventorying greenhouse gas emissions from global cities. Energy Policy 38(9):4828–4837

Larnaudie V, Bule M, San KY, Vadlanvi PV, Mosby J, Elangovan S, Spatari S (2020) Life cycle environmental and cost evaluation of renewable diesel production. Fuel 279:118429. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fuel.2020.118429

Lashgari M, Sadjadi SJ, Sahihi M (2019) A multi-product, multi-period model to select supplier for deteriorating products while considering uncertainty as well as backorder. J Ind Eng Int 15(1):93–101

Li Y, Bao L, Li W, Deng H (2016) Inventory and policy reduction potential of greenhouse gas and pollutant emissions of road transportation industry in China. Sustainability 8(12):1218

Li L, Yang Y, Qin G (2019) Optimization of integrated inventory routing problem for cold chain logistics considering carbon footprint and carbon regulations. Sustainability 11(17):4628

Lou GX, Xia HY, Zhang JQ, Fan TJ (2015) Investment strategy of emission-reduction technology in a supply chain. Sustainability 7(8):10684–10708

Ly U (2017) Industry 4.0: a survey on technologies, applications and open research issues. J Ind Int Integr 6:1–10

Lu CJ, Lee TS, Gu M, Yang CT (2020) A multistage sustainable production–inventory model with carbon emission reduction and price-dependent demand under Stackelberg game. Appl Sci 10(14):4878

Maditati DR, Munim ZH, Schramm HJ, Kummer S (2018) A review of green supply chain management: from bibliometric analysis to a conceptual framework and future research directions. Resour Conserv Recyc 139:150–162

Maes ADS, Hoinski L, Meirelles TB, Carlson RC (2019) A methodology for high resolution vehicular emissions inventories in metropolitan areas: evaluating the effect of automotive technologies improvement. Transp Res Part d: Transp Environ 77:303–319

Manupati VK, Schoenherr T, Ramkumar M, Wagner SM, Pabba SK, Singh IR, R. (2020) A blockchain-based approach for a multi-echelon sustainable supply chain. Int J Prod Res 58(7):2222–2241

Marchi B, Zanoni S, Zavanella LE, Jaber MY (2019) Supply chain models with greenhouse gases emissions, energy usage, imperfect process under different coordination decisions. Int J Prod Econ 211:145–153

Marchi B, Zanoni S, Jaber MY (2020) Energy Implications of Lot Sizing Decisions in Refrigerated Warehouses. Energies 13(7):1739

Melo S, Macedo J, Baptista P (2019) Capacity-sharing in logistics solutions: a new pathway towards sustainability. Transp Policy 73:143–151

Merigo JM, Pedrycz W, Weber R, de la Sotta C (2018) Fifty years of information sciences: a bibliometric overview. Inf Sci 432:245–268

Morrar R, Arman H, & Moussa S (2017) The fourth industrial revolution (Industry 4.0): a social innovation perspective. Technol Innov Manag Rev 7(11):12–20

Moulières-Seban T, Bitonneau D, Salotti JM, Thibault JF, & Claverie B (2017) Human factors issues for the design of a robotic system. In Advances in human factors in robots and unmanned systems (pp. 375–385). Springer, Cham.

Müller JM, Kiel D, & Voigt KI (2018) What drives the implementation of Industry 4.0? The role of opportunities and challenges in the context of sustainability. Sustainability 10(1):247

Murray CC, Chu AG (2015) The flying sidekick traveling salesman problem: optimization of drone-assisted parcel delivery. Transp Res Part c: Emerging Technol 54:86–109

Nagariya R, Kumar D, & Kumar I (2020) Service supply chain: from bibliometric analysis to content analysis, current research trends and future research directions. Benchmarking: An International Journal

Notarnicola B, Tassielli G, Renzulli PA, Castellani V, Sala S (2017) Environmental impacts of food consumption in Europe. J Clean Prod 140:753–765

Nouri M, Bekrar A, Trentesaux D (2020) An energy-efficient scheduling and rescheduling method for production and logistics systems. Int J Prod Res 58(11):3263–3283

Oya GJR, Martin Clemente R, Hidalgo Fort E, Gonzalez Carvajal R, Manzano Chavero F (2018) Passive RFID-based inventory of traffic signs on roads and urban environments. Sensors 18(7):2385

Perboli G, Rosano M, & Gobbato L (2016) Decision support system for collaborative freight transportation management: a tool for mixing traditional and green logistics. Proceedings of the ILS.

Pérez-Martínez PJ (2012) Energy consumption and emissions from the road transport in Spain: a conceptual approach. Transport 27(4):383–396

Piccik Y, Cullinane S, Edwards J (2007) Assessing the external impacts of freight transport. In: McKinnon AC, Browne M, Whiting A (eds) Green Logistics, 2nd edn. Kogan Page, London, pp 31–50

Pradhan B, Lee S (2010) Landslide susceptibility assessment and factor effect analysis: backpropagation artificial neural networks and their comparison with frequency ratio and bivariate logistic regression modelling. Environ Model Softw 25(6):747–759

Psarafitis HN, Kontovas CA (2013) Speed models for energy-efficient maritime transportation: a taxonomy and survey. Transp Res Part c: Emerging Technol 26:331–351

Qiu Y, Qiao J, Pardalos PM (2017) A branch-and-price algorithm for production routing problems with carbon cap-and-trade. Omega 68:49–61

Rakopoulos CD, Dimaratos AM, Giakoumis EG, Rakopoulos DC (2011) Study of turbocharged diesel engine operation, pollutant emissions and combustion noise radiation during starting

© Springer
Wangsa ID, Tiwari S, Wee HM, & Reong S (2020) A sustainable vendor-buyer inventory system considering transportation, loading and unloading activities. J Clean Prod 271:122120

Yaghin RG, & Sarlak P (2019) Joint order allocation and transportation planning under uncertainty within a socially responsible supply chain. J Model Manage

Yang KH, Jung YB, Cho MS, Tae SH (2015) Effect of supplementary cementitious materials on reduction of CO2 emissions from concrete. J Clean Prod 103:774–783

Yang R, Ozer H, Al-Qadi IL (2016) Regional upstream life-cycle impacts of petroleum products in the United States. J Clean Prod 139:1138–1149

Ye Y (2019) A bibliometric analysis of supply chain management research from the perspective of social network. Sci Technol Libr 38(2):224–242

You F, Wang B (2011) Life cycle optimization of biomass-to-liquid supply chains with distributed–centralized processing networks. Ind Eng Chem Res 50(17):10102–10127

Zanoni S, Mazzoldi L, Jaber MY (2014) Vendor-managed inventory with consignment stock agreement for single vendor–single buyer under the emission-trading scheme. Int J Prod Res 52(1):20–31

Zhang L, Yang W, Yuan Y, Zhou R (2017) An integrated carbon policy-based interactive strategy for carbon reduction and economic development in a construction material supply chain. Sustainability 9(11):2107

Zhen L, Wu Y, Wang S, Laporte G (2020) Green technology adoption for fleet deployment in a shipping network. Transportation Research Part b: Methodological 139:388–410

Zhong RY, Xu C, Chen C, Huang GQ (2017) Big data analytics for physical internet-based intelligent manufacturing shop floors. Int J Prod Res 55(9):2610–2621

Publisher’s Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.