The growth of *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* as influenced by high CO₂ and low O₂ in flue gas from a silicomanganese smelter

Leiv M. Mortensen · Hans R. Gislerød

Received: 29 November 2013 / Revised and accepted: 2 June 2014 / Published online: 15 June 2014 © The Author(s) 2014. This article is published with open access at Springerlink.com

Abstract The aim of this study was to find an inexpensive and environmentally friendly CO₂ source for growing the hydrogen-producing microalgae *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. The effect of different flue gas concentrations from a silicomanganese smelter on the growth of these algae at a photon flux density of 200 μmol photons m⁻² s⁻¹ applied 24 h day⁻¹ was studied. First, the algae were grown in a laboratory at 1.2, 6.8 and 17.1 % (v/v) pure CO₂ gas mixed with fresh air. After 5 days of growth, the dry biomass per litre algal culture was slightly higher (17 %) at 6.8 % CO₂ as compared to at 1.2 % CO₂. A further increase to 17.1 % CO₂ decreased the biomass by about 40 %. Then, the flue gas from a silicomanganese smelter was used as a CO₂ source for growing the algae. The flue gas was characterized by a high CO₂ concentration (about 17 % v/v), low oxygen concentration (about 4 %), about 100 ppm NOₓ and 1 ppm SO₂. The culture medium bubbled with undiluted flue gas contained about 490 mg L⁻¹ dissolved CO₂ and 4.0 mg L⁻¹ dissolved O₂, while the lowest flue gas concentration contained about 280 mg L⁻¹ CO₂ and 7.1 mg L⁻¹ O₂. Undiluted flue gas (17.4 % CO₂) decreased the biomass of the algae by about 40 % as compared with 4.8 % pure CO₂ gas or flue gas diluted to a concentration of 6.3 % CO₂. Flue gas diluted to give 10.0 % CO₂ gave less reduction in the growth of the algae (22 %). It was concluded that the high CO₂ concentration itself caused the growth reduction and not the air pollutants, and the very low O₂ concentrations in the growth medium could not counteract this negative effect.

Keywords Biomass · Microalgae · Nitrogen oxides · Oxygen concentration (O₂)

Introduction

Hydrogen is recognised as a promising future energy alternative because it produces no carbon dioxide that contributes to the greenhouse effect when combusted (IPCC 2013). Today, conventional hydrogen production is energy-intensive, and more environmentally friendly production by means of biological processes is therefore of great interest (Jo et al. 2006; Skjånes et al. 2007). The single-cell green alga *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* is known to produce hydrogen when starved of sulfur under anaerobic conditions (Melis et al. 2000; Nguyen et al. 2011; Geier et al. 2012). Hydrogen is released through the action of a hydrogenase enzyme that receives the energy from electrons from the breakdown of starch or splitting of water in photosystem II. Before the anaerobic hydrogen-producing stage, the microalgae are grown under aerobic conditions: sunlight with CO₂ and nutrients. Today’s atmospheric CO₂ concentration of around 400 ppm strongly limits the algae growth, and additional CO₂ should be supplied throughout the production phase (Geier et al. 2012). It has also been found that *C. reinhardtii* grown at high CO₂ concentrations subsequently produces more hydrogen than when grown at low CO₂ levels (Geier et al. 2012). In order for the production to be environmentally friendly, waste CO₂ from industrial flue gas should be used, which also contributes to cleaning the emissions. Several studies have investigated the effect of flue gases on the growth of microalgae (Douskova et al. 2009; Kastánek et al. 2010; Borkenstein et al. 2011; Lara-Gil et al. 2014). Depending on the species and the content of different pollutants in the flue gas, the growth varied greatly compared with using pure CO₂ gas. Although *C. reinhardtii* has been subjected to extensive investigation, the effect of flue gas seems to have been little studied in this species. Bark (2012) showed that *C. reinhardtii* could be grown in simulated flue gas at a concentration of 15 % CO₂/100 ppm NO; however, the growth was better at
lower CO₂ concentrations. A CO₂ concentration of 4.5 % was found to be optimal for the growth when the effect of concentrations between 1 and 6 % was studied in C. reinhardtii (Daria Markina, unpublished results). In order to maximise the conversion of solar energy to biomass, it is important to search for an industrial emission that stimulates growth to the same extent as pure CO₂. Since extensive cleaning devices have been installed during recent years, the emissions from a silicomanganese smelter in Norway are recognised as being very clean (www.eramet.no). Highly efficient combustion processes produce emission gas containing up to 20 % CO₂ accompanied by O₂ in concentrations down to 1 %. Such high CO₂ concentrations are rarely obtained in industrial emissions. The combination of high CO₂ and low O₂ concentrations is of particular interest for plant production, since combination of high CO₂ and low O₂ decreases photorespiration and increases photosynthesis in C₃ plants as well as in microalgae (Ramazanov and Cardenas 1992; Kliphuis et al. 2011). In studies of the effect of CO₂ concentration on the growth of microalgae, CO₂ gas is usually mixed with air, causing dilution of the O₂ content. If 20 % CO₂ is added to the air, the resulting O₂ concentration would be around 17 %, while the emission from the silicomanganese smelter in our study could reach 20 % CO₂ combined with 1 % O₂. Our study therefore focused on the effect of the CO₂ concentration and air pollutants in the flue gas as well as on the O₂ concentration. The study was a combination of laboratory experiments with pure CO₂ gas mixed with fresh air and experiments with flue gas at the site of the silicomanganese smelter. Since previous results have shown that concentrations above 1 % CO₂ increase the growth of this alga, around 1 % CO₂ was chosen to be the lowest concentration in this study (Markina, unpublished results).

Materials and methods

Chlamydomonas reinhardtii strain SAG 34.89 from Georg-August-Universität Göttingen (Germany) obtained from the NIVA culture collection, Norway, was used in the experiments. The algae were stored on Petri dishes covered with TAP medium 1.5 % agar (Gorman and Levine 1965). The algae were grown in tap water-based high-salt Sueoka medium (Sueoka 1960). Sodium bicarbonate was used at 10 mM in order to buffer the culture medium since pH otherwise would become very low due to ammonium uptake by C. reinhardtii. The addition of bicarbonate typically increased pH of the culture medium by 0.6 units. The microalgae were grown in 1.0-L clear plastic bottles (80 mm inner and 82 mm outer diameter) filled with 0.85 L of growing medium (filled to 17 cm). Twelve bottles were placed in a row adjacent to each other. The light was supplied from one side by four cool white fluorescent tubes (Osram L36W/840) placed about 10 cm in front of the bottles. A photon flux density (PFD) of 200±10 µmol photons m⁻² s⁻¹ was given 24 h day⁻¹ and was measured by a LI-COR Model LI-250 instrument with a quantum sensor (400–700 nm). The CO₂ concentration was measured using a Vaisala CO₂ transmitter (type GMT221, range 0–5 %) or a Vaisala GMP instrument with a sensor in the range 0–20 %. The CO₂ concentration was recorded once in an hour. The temperature was measured by copper-constantan thermocouples and was recorded hourly using a Campbell AM25T multiplexer.

The different CO₂ concentrations with pure CO₂ gas were established by mixing food grade CO₂ with fresh air. The CO₂ gas flow was determined by capillaries with defined resistances. The gas pressure was defined by the height of a water column. In this way, a very accurate CO₂ flow could be added to a constant rate of fresh air produced by air pumps (Resun ACO-001, ACO-004). The different gas mixtures were bubbled through 0.3-cm-inner diameter plastic tubes to the bottom of the bottles at a rate of approximately 100 L h⁻¹. All treatments in all experiments included three parallel bottles with 0.85 L culture. The initial algae concentration was 0.2 g dry weight L⁻¹ medium in the different experiments. For practical reasons, the start culture had been stored in darkness at 5 °C; however, this seemed not to reduce the activity of the microalgae since no lag period was observed at start of the experiments.

Laboratory experiments

C. reinhardtii was grown in pure CO₂ gas mixed with fresh air to give three CO₂ concentrations (1.2±0.4, 6.8±1.0 and 17.1 ±2.4 %). The experiment lasted 6 days and the temperature was 23.8±1.5 °C. In order to see if an acclimation to high CO₂ concentrations (6.5±0.3 and 16.2±0.7 %) took place, the algae were grown in another experiment for 6 days before dilution of the cultures and continuation of the experiment for another 5 days. In this experiment, the turbidity (FTU) was measured by a Hanna instrument (HI 93703). The measurements were carried out in the range 0–50 FTU (the linear phase) by diluting the algal culture if necessary. The temperature in this experiment was 22.0±1.7 °C. The variation in the temperatures was due to no cooling devices in the algal growing room.

Experiment with flue gas from a silicomanganese smelter

An experimental set-up was established in a silicomanganese smelter (Eramet Norway Kvinesdal; www.eramet.no). The melting furnaces are run on electricity, and the flue gas from the furnaces is cleaned in order remove polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) and mercury before emission as cleaned flue gases through the chimney. In 2012, the emissions from the furnaces amounted to 208,000 t of CO₂, 88.5 t of NOₓ,
(95 % NO), 4.12 t of SO₂ and 2.68 kg of Hg (www.norskeutslipp.no; Eramet Norway Kvinnesdal AS). Flue gas from the chimney was sucked by pumps (Resun ACO-008A) with a capacity of 6.9 m³ h⁻¹ through two 100-L plastic tubs in series for condensation of the water vapour. Then, the flue gas was diluted by mixing with fresh air in order to establish two CO₂ concentrations in addition to the CO₂ concentration in the undiluted flue gas. The mean concentrations throughout the 4-day experimental period were 6.3±1.0, 10.0±1.6 and 17.4±2.9 % in the three flue gas treatments. This corresponded to mean O₂ concentrations of around 15, 11 and 4 %, respectively. The corresponding NOₓ concentrations were 36±6, 58±10 and 102±13 ppm, the SO₂ concentrations were 0.4±0.0, 0.6±0.1 and 0.8±0.1 ppm, at the different flue gas concentrations, respectively. The measured CO concentration was <5 ppm in the undiluted flue gas. The pollutants were measured using Dräger gas detection tubes (Accuro, Dräger Safety, Germany). The concentration of Hg was not measured during the experiment, but it has been reported to vary between 1 and 5 μg m⁻³ and can be calculated from the yearly emission data (www.norskeutslipp.no). In addition to the different flue gas treatments, a control treatment was established with pure CO₂ gas at a concentration of 4.8±0.8 %. The O₂ concentration in the algae culture was measured using an Odeon OPTOD sensor for dissolved oxygen. Light was provided by fluorescent tubes as described above. The mean temperature during the experimental period was 28.7±0.5 °C, a temperature that was the result of the hot environment in a room adjacent to that of the melting furnaces.

In the laboratory experiment, the dry weight of the cells was measured by filtering 0.3–2.0 ml of algal culture through 0.7-μm-pore size, 25-mm-diameter Whatman GF/F glass microfiber filters to collect the biomass. The filters with the algae were washed with 20 mL distilled water to remove adhering salts and then were dried at 104 °C for 4 h. The dry weight was calculated by subtracting the dry weight of the clean filter from the dry weight of the filter with algae. In the experiment at the smelter site, the dry weight was measured by vacuum filtering 10 or 20 mL of culture through a 90-mm filter (Whatman GF/B) and by drying it in an oven for 4 h at 100 °C. No pore size of this filter was given; however, all algal cells remained on the filter since no colouration of the filtered water was observed. The number of cells and cell diameter were counted using a cell counter (Multisizer 4 Coulter Counter, Beckman Coulter). Since the algae were not grown aseptically, it was useful to study the cell size distribution in order to identify if other microorganisms were present in the cultures.

The data were analysed using the SAS ANOVA procedure (SAS Institute, Inc., USA) based on the bottles as replicates (n=3).

**Results**

**Laboratory experiments**

In the first experiment, the dry biomass of the algae (g L⁻¹) was increased by 17 % when the CO₂ concentration was increased from 1.2 to 6.8 %, while a further increase to 17.2 % CO₂ decreased it by around 40 % (Table 1). The dry weight and diameter per cell were unaffected by the CO₂ concentration. The pH at end of the experiment decreased from 7.2 to 6.4 when the CO₂ concentration was increased from the lowest to the highest level. In the second experiment, the turbidity increased in the two treatments (6.5 and 16.2 % CO₂) over 6 days of growth without any lag phase (Fig. 2).

**Dissolved CO₂ in the growth medium**

For algae growth, the concentration of dissolved CO₂ in the nutrient medium is important and not the concentration of CO₂ in the air bubbled into the culture. Recently, the dissolved CO₂ in the growth medium was measured with the same algal growing system as used in the present study (Mortensen and Gislerød 2014). Based on these data, a regression analysis was done (Fig. 1). The results showed a progressive increase in the dissolved CO₂ concentration from about 100 to about 500 mg L⁻¹ with increasing CO₂ concentration from about 1 % up to about 24 %. The regression equation (order 2) was found to be \( y = 83.4 + 35.5x - 0.70x^2 \) \((r^2=0.973)\). Parallel to this increase, the pH decreased from 7.6 to about 6.5. The measurements were done at 23 °C. The dissolved CO₂ as measured at 7.0 % CO₂ was found to be about the same in the temperature range 23–33 °C.

![Fig. 1](https://example.com)  
**Fig. 1** The effect of CO₂ concentration on dissolved CO₂ in the growth medium \((n=3, \text{SE})\)

© Springer
After 6 days, the cultures were diluted and the cultures continued to grow at about the same rate as before dilution. No significant acclimation to high CO₂ seemed to take place. The growth rate was significantly higher at 6.5 % compared to 16.2 % CO₂. In this experiment, the dry weight was only measured after 6 days (1.03±0.11 and 0.47 g L\(^{-1}\) at 6.5 and 16.2 % CO₂, respectively).

**Flue gas experiment**

Undiluted flue gas (17.4 % CO₂/102 ppm NO\(_x\)) decreased the dry biomass (g L\(^{-1}\)) of the microalgae after 4 days of growth by about 40 % as compared with 4.8 % pure CO₂ gas or flue gas diluted to a concentration of 6.3 % CO₂/36 ppm NO\(_x\) (Table 2). Flue gas diluted to give 10.0 % CO₂/58 ppm NO\(_x\) gave less reduction in the growth of the algae (22 %). The cell diameter was the same in all treatments (Table 2) as well as the dry weight per cell (results not presented). The experiment was repeated with two of the treatments, undiluted flue gas and 4.8 % pure CO₂ gas. After 4 days, the biomass concentration was 1.11±0.07 g L\(^{-1}\) (n=3, ±SE) in the flue gas treatment and 1.87±0.03 g L\(^{-1}\) (n=3, ±SE) in pure CO₂ gas treatment. This was the same decrease in growth (about 40 %, p<0.001) by undiluted flue gas as in the first experiment. Increasing the flue gas concentration from 6.5 to 17.4 % CO₂ decreased the O₂ concentration in the culture from 7.4 to 4.0 mg L\(^{-1}\).

**Discussion**

It appeared that the biomass production of *C. reinhardtii* was significantly decreased (about 40 %) when grown in undiluted flue gas at about 17 % CO₂ as compared with pure CO₂ gas at a concentration of about 5 % or flue gas with a CO₂ concentration of 6.5 %.
CO2 stress that inhibited the efficiency of photosystem II arose at high CO2 concentrations. In the present experiment avoided a strong acidification that would otherwise have less, the use of a bicarbonate buffer in the present study small effect on the growth of microalgae cultures. Neverthe-
moderate decrease in pH caused by flue gases probably has a might explain the growth reduction at high CO2. Although F
values and significance levels are given

>0.05; *p<0.05; **p<0.01; ***p<0.001

centration of 6 %. In the present study, flue gas with a concentration of 10 % CO2 decreased the biomass by about 20 %. This is quite similar to the 20–25 % biomass reduction in the same strain recently found with flue gas from waste combustion at a concentration of 11.4 % CO2 (Mortensen and Gislerød 2014). Also, Bark (2012) found that 20 % CO2 was too high to give optimal growth of this species.

Similar results have been obtained with Scenedesmus dimorphus, where 20 % CO2 significantly reduced biomass production as compared to 2 and 10 % CO2 (Jiang et al. 2013). Chlorella pyrenoidosa could tolerate concentration up to 50 % CO2; however, the growth was the best at 10 % (Tang et al. 2011). Several microalgae species have shown good tolerance to concentrations up to approximately 20 % and even up to 100 % (van den Hende et al. 2012). In the present experiment, CO2 stress that inhibited the efficiency of photosystem II might explain the growth reduction at high CO2. Although the pH of the culture was slightly lower at the highest flue gas concentration, this did not seem to be the reason for the reduced growth, since the pH still was within an optimal range of this species (Bark 2012). Olaizola (2003) concluded that a moderate decrease in pH caused by flue gases probably has a small effect on the growth of microalgae cultures. Nevertheless, the use of a bicarbonate buffer in the present study avoided a strong acidification that would otherwise have arisen at high CO2 concentrations. In the present experiment with flue gas, the NOx level reached about 100 ppm and the SO2 level 1 ppm in combination with 17 % CO2. Such concentrations, however, seem seldom to affect the growth of microalgae (Brown 1996; Olaizola 2003; Hende et al. 2012; Farrelly et al. 2013; Jiang et al. 2013).

Kliphuis et al. (2011) found a 20 % increase in growth rate in Chlorella reinhardtii when air with 21 % O2 was replaced by N2 (0 % O2) when mixed with 2 % CO2. This effect was attributed to the reduction in the oxygenase activity of Rubisco, resulting into decreased photosynthesis and increased growth. However, Vance and Spalding (2005) who studied the same species over a range of CO2 concentrations (0.005–5 %) at 2 and 20 % O2 found no discernable effect of the O2 concentration on growth. The effect on growth was related to the CO2 concentration alone. Unfortunately, the results with the present flue gas were in accordance with the conclusions of Vance and Spalding (2005) and not Kliphuis et al. (2011). The very low O2 concentration (down to about 1 %) in the flue gas from the siliconmanganese smelter resulting into dissolved O2 values in the algae culture down to about 4 mg L−1 seemed therefore not to be of any particular benefit. In addition, the very high CO2 concentration (up to 20 %) resulting into dissolved CO2 values of up to 490 mg L−1 in algal culture caused a negative effect on growth. Based on the results from the present experiments, it can be concluded that flue gas containing up to about 6 % CO2 would be optimal for the production of the present C. reinhardtii strain. However, the special properties of the flue gas from the siliconmanganese smelters seemed not to provide an advantage over other flue gas sources.

Acknowledgments The authors thank Eramet Norway Kvinnsdal, Håvard Midtgaard and staff for an excellent cooperation and also thank Ms. Silje Evensdatter Roksi for her technical assistance. This work was done as a part of the project ‘Use of solar energy for CO2 capture, algae cultivation and hydrogen production’ headed by Stig Borgvang, Bioforsk, Norway, and was financed by the Research Council of Norway.

Open Access This article is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License which permits any use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author(s) and the source are credited.
References

Bark M (2012) Cultivation of eleven different species of freshwater microalgae using simulated flue gas mimicking effluents from paper mills as carbon source. Master’s Thesis, Chalmers University of Technology, Gothenburg, 97 p

Borkenstein CG, Knobiehner J, Fruhthirth H, Schagert M (2011) Cultivation of Chlorella emersonii with flue gas derived from cement plant. J Appl Phycol 23:131–135

Brown LM (1996) Uptake of carbon dioxide from flue gas by microalgae. Energy Conv Manag 37:1363–1367

Douskova I, Doucou D, Livansky K, Machat J, Novak P, Umysova D, Zachleder V, Vitova M (2009) Simultaneous flue gas bioremediation and reduction of microalgal biomass production costs. Appl Microbiol Biot 82:179–185

Farrelly DJ, Everard CD, Fagan CC, McDonnell KP (2013) Carbon sequestration and the role of biological carbon mitigation: a review. Ren Sust Energy Rev 21:712–727

Geier SC, Huyer S, Praebst K, Husmann M, Walter C, Buchholz R (2012) Outdoor cultivation of Chlamydomonas reinhardtii for photobiological hydrogen production. J Appl Phycol 24:319–327

Gorman DS, Levine RP (1965) Cytochrome f and plastocyanin: their sequence in the photosynthetic electron transport chain of Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 54:1665–1669

IPCC (2013) Climate change 2013: the physical science basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change [Stocker, T. F., D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S. K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P. M. Midgley (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, www.climatechange2013.org

Jiang Y, Zhang W, Wang J, Chen Y, Shen S, Liu T (2013) Utilization of simulated flue gas for cultivation of Scenedesmus dimorphus. Bioresour Tech 128:359–364

Jo HJ, Lee DS, Park JM (2006) Modeling and optimization of photosynthetic hydrogen gas production by green alga Chlamydomonas reinhardtii in sulphur-deprived circumstance. Biotechnol Prog 22:431–437

Kastanek F, Sabata S, Solcová O, Maláterová Y, Kastanek P, Brányiková I, Kutan K, Zachleder V (2010) In-field experimental verification of cultivation of microalgae Chlorella sp. using flue gas from cogeneration unit as a source of carbon dioxide. Waste Manag Res 28:961–966

Kliphus AMJ, Martens DE, Janssen M, Wijffels RH (2011) Effect of O₂:CO₂ ratio on the primary metabolism of Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Biotechnol Bioeng 108:2390–2402

Lara-Gil JA, Alvarez MM, Pacheco A (2014) Toxicity of flue gas components from cement plants in microalgae mitigation systems. J Appl Phycol 26:357–368

Melis A, Zhang L, Forestier M, Ghiradi M, Sebert M (2000) Sustained photobiological hydrogen gas production upon reversible inactivation of oxygen evolution in the green algae Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Plant Physiol 122:127–136

Mortensen LM, Gisselrod HR (2014) The effect on growth of Chlamydomonas reinhardtii of flue gas from a power plant based on waste combustion. AMB Express (in press)

Nguyen AV, Toepel J, Burgess S, Uhmeer A, Bilfernez O, Doebbe A, Hankamer B, Nixon P, Wobbe L, Kruse O (2011). Time-course global expression profiles of Chlamydomonas reinhardtii during photo-biological H₂ production. PLoS One 6(12):e29364

Olazola M (2003) Microalgal removal of CO₂ from flue gases: changing in medium pH and flue gas composition do not appear to affect the photochemical yield of microalgal cultures. Biotech Bioprocess Eng 8:360–367

Ramazanov Z, Cardenas J (1992) Involvement of photospiration and glycolate pathway in carbonic anhydrase induction and inorganic carbon concentration in Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Physiol Plant 84:502–508

Skjænes K, Lindblad P, Muller J (2007) BioCO₂—a multidisciplinary, biological approach using solar energy to capture CO₂ while producing H₂ and high value products. Biomol Eng 24:405–413

Sueoka N (1960) Mitotic replication of deoxyribonucleic acid in Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 46:83–91

Tang D, Han W, Li P, Miao X, Zhong J (2011) CO₂ biofixation and fatty acid composition of Scenedesmus obliquus and Chlorella pyrenoidosa in response to different CO₂ levels. Biore Tech 102:3071–3076

van den Hende S, Vervaeren H, Boon N (2012) Flue gas compounds and microalgae: (bio-)chemical interactions leading to biotechnological opportunities. Biotechnol Adv 30:1405–1424

Vance P, Spalding MH (2005) Growth, photosynthesis, and gene expression in Chlamydomonas over a range of CO₂ concentrations and CO₂/O₂ ratios: CO₂ regulates multiple acclimation states. Can J Bot 83:796–809