Forecasting Iran national health expenditures: General model and conceptual framework

Mahmood Kazemian, Zhaleh Abdi, Mohammad Meskarpour-Amiri

Abstract:
BACKGROUND: Forecasting the future trend of health expenditures is an important step toward sustainable financing of health-care systems. This study aims to develop a conceptual framework for forecasting Iran health spending growth.

MATERIALS AND METHODS: At first, we concentrated on the general model and conceptual framework of health expenditure projection by reference to a broad literature review and smart classifications of the origins of health spending and indicators. At the second step, we developed a time series modeling for econometric estimation and forecasting national health expenditure without restrictive assumptions except for current laws and regulatory environment. In the third step, we tested the accuracy of model by forecasting Iran real per capita health expenditures (2017–2025).

RESULTS: The results of the literature review represented a distinct classification of the origins of health spending and indicators, applicable to any health system and health spending projection model. Furthermore, the model of expenditure forecasting shows the power of certainty of no spurious estimation, assessment of the normal state of a health system, and test of the accuracy of forecasting results. The projection by the Iranian health system database showed that the real per capita health spending will grow 43 percent till 2025 in the absence of any unforeseen disturbance in the future.

CONCLUSIONS: The presented model provides estimates that are compatible with actual trends of health spending and can be applied to forecast health expenditure in the near future. The forecasted image of Iran’s health spending growth implies that health authorities need to concentrate more on the growth rate of the health budget and its fiscal space in the near future.

Keywords: Forecasting, health expenditures, health-care financing

Introduction

Evidence suggests that the planned and targeted growth of health expenditure improves human capital and raises the productivity of human resources along with the quality of life and social welfare.[1,2] Forecasting the future trend of health expenditures is an important step toward sustainable financing of health-care systems.[1] Unsustainable financing arises from the challenging issues in the unexpected rise of health expenditure and lack of control over it, along with increasing interests of the public in unrestricted access to quality health services in the countries.[3,4] In recent decades, developing countries experienced the rapid growth of health expenditures which may root from their reforms and attentions to improve the quality of public health care. However, the unplanned growth of health expenditures can create financial crisis in health care as well as rising poverty and catastrophic health expenditures.[5,6] In this study, Iran has been considered an example that has many features in common with developing countries with unsustainable financing while pursuing the

How to cite this article: Kazemian M, Abdi Z, Meskarpour-Amiri M. Forecasting Iran national health expenditures: General model and conceptual framework. J Edu Health Promot 2022;11:87.
programs to increase access to public health services. The World Bank report on National Health Accounts shows that health expenditure in Iran has risen 4.9 times in nominal values over the past decade, per capita, and the share of total health expenditure (THE) in Iran’s Gross National Production has increased from 5.3% in 2002 to 7.1% in 2014. Furthermore, in these years, in Iran, the price index of health services, which is always above the Consumer Price Index (CPI) for all goods and services, has doubled. The statistics of the Iranian Central Bank shows that the price index of health goods and services has grown in an instable and unbalanced state. In 2015 and 2016, the inflation rates of health goods and services were 23.8% and 16.7%, respectively, while the inflation rates of CPI in these years were 11.9% and 9%, respectively. Instability of financial resources as well as inadequate health financing sources has always considered as the challenging issues for policymakers in Iran. Scholars believe that with the current trend of growing health expenditure, the Iranian health system will face serious problems to provide sustainable and adequate funding sources for health services in the future.

There is a complex set of effective factors that make health financing failure worse in the future, including aging, urbanization, changes in the disease pattern, the growing expectations of health-care users, and the growth of health technologies. These issues have made the policymakers seeking the models to understand the future path of health expenditure and identify reform effects to control future pressure from health expenditure rising. This concern has drawn policymakers’ attention to try to forecast the health expenditure. Forecasting by the models representing the current trend of health expenditure is a prerequisite for controlling and managing health-care costs as well as planning the future path of health expenditure.

This study aimed to introduce a general model of health expenditure estimation and a universal conceptual framework for its projection accompanied with a presentation concerning Iran national health expenditures estimates during 2017–2025.

Materials and Methods

Study design and setting
This study presents a general time series model to estimate the national health spending and forecast the future path of health spending, using a universal conceptual framework applicable to all health systems. The study design and setting were according to the following steps:

Identification of the total health expenditure determinants
This study identified the determinants of THE, using a broad review of literature in scientific databases including Scopus, PubMed, and Web of Science. This review presented a detailed and comprehensive identification of the variables influencing health expenditure in the long run with reliable sources of forecasting. The search strategy was including the combinations of the following keywords: cost, charge, spending, expenditure, health, health care, health services, factors, effective services, affecting, determinants, predictors, and forecasts. Literature review identified 19 indicators affecting THE growth [Table 1], which are the well-known ones in the considered articles. These indicators provided the opportunity to examine the impacts of a wide range of variables in the forecasting model of health expenditure.

Selection of regression models for forecasting total health expenditure
This study takes advantage of vector autoregressive regression (VAR) and ordinary least squares (OLS) regression models to develop a general forecasting model, using time series data for all variables in the database. The estimation processes were carried out by first-differenced variables to avoid nonstationary data, which is a common problem in time series regressions. The differenced variables were examined on the Dickey–Fuller unit-root test to ensure no spurious estimates. During estimation processes, the determinants of changes in per capita health expenditure were examined for inclusion, using the stepwise method to reach the final regressions with statistically significant variables in the estimation results. The models were also examined for the autocorrelation problem, using the LM and Durbin–Watson tests in Stata14 software (StataCorp. 2015, College Station, Texas, USA). These models and estimation processes were viewed as consistent with the expected results of forecasting, using relevant databases in a health system.

Checking the accuracy of projections
The estimation results of the VAR and OLS models were examined for accuracy, using them before forecasting. This process required applying the data from the years 1971–2011 in the two models to provide forecasts for the years 2012–2016 and comparing these forecasts with the actual values in those years. Then, the model with the estimation results that had the least root of mean squared error (RMSE) was selected to forecast values of the future years, 2017–2025.

Study participants and sampling
In the literature review, 578 articles were identified by advance search at three main databases including Scopus, PubMed, and Web of Science. The search was done without any limitation at publish time and location of articles. Among 578 initial articles, 317 articles were excluded due to the duplication in the databases. Finally, 36 articles had inclusion criteria and were considered
for content analysis. The inclusion criteria were the originality of the researches and the identification of the determinants of THE at the national level. Therefore, articles that had focused on out-of-pocket payments, private health expenditure, and costs of illnesses had not been considered. At the second part of the study, the THE of the Islamic Republic of Iran was the subject of the study which was completely considered without any sampling.

**Data collection tool and technique**

This study developed a database for the determinants of health expenditures in Iran health system. This database consists of 24 variables within 46 years, 1971–2016. We collected these data by direct refer to Iran’s National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), Iranian Statistical Center, Central Bank, and other public sector organizations. The database is available in the NIHR. Creating such a database can be viewed as another step in the project of health expenditure forecasting in developed and developing countries, regarding the need for updating forecasts in the future.

**Ethical consideration**

This study was supported by I.R. Iran’s NIHR (approved no: 241/M/96105). The Ethics Committee of the Iranian NIHR approved this study (approved no: IR.TUMS.NIHR.REC.1396.31).

### Results

**Current trend of real per capita health expenditure**

Understanding the time path of real per capita health spending is crucial before examining further changes over time. This issue is shown in Figure 1 by a time trend quadratic polynomial function. In this figure, the real per capita health expenditure for the Iranian database at constant price indices of 2016 has an ordinary shape over the long run, indicating an increase of more than six-fold, from 2 to 12.3 million Iranian Rial in the years from 1971 to 2016. In this trend model, the estimates exclude the impacts of inflation and population growth from the growth figures. Hence, the result can be consistent with an ordinary path of growth forecasting.

**Estimation of vector autoregressive regression and ordinary least squares models and accuracy of their projections**

Table 2 shows the estimation results of the two regression models for the growth of real per capita health expenditure in the period 1971–2011. The estimations with the Iranian database showed that the VAR model provided the results, which are accounting for 70%
Kazemian, et al.: Forecasting Iran national health expenditures

of changes in the growth of real per capita health expenditure, on average. In this model, in addition to the lagged value of the dependent variable, there are four other explanatory variables with statistically significant coefficients. On the other hand, the estimation of the OLS model gave rise to the results, which are accounting for 85.8% of changes in the growth of real per capita health expenditure on average. In this model, in addition to the lagged value of the dependent variable, there are 11 explanatory variables with statistically significant coefficients. At first glance, both models are qualified to be used for forecast estimation.

Having the results of estimates of the above two models and the outcomes for the years 1991–2011, we compare the forecasts of these two models for the growth of real per capita health expenditure for the years 2012–2016. This comparison, shown in Table 3, indicates that the RMSE in absolute value in the VAR model is less than the RMSE in the OLS model. Furthermore, the annual deviations of the forecasts from the real values in the VAR model are between 0.2% and 14.9%, and the same forecast deviations in the OLS model are between −42.3% and −24.3%. These results indicate that the VAR model with lower RMSE and lower forecast deviations is the more reliable model for forecasting the growth of real per capita health expenditure in the future, the years 2017–2025.

Forecast results of real per capita health expenditures in 2017–2025

Using the estimates of the VAR model in the years 1971–2016, the future trend of real per capita health expenditure for the years 2017–2025 has been forecasted. Table 4 shows the forecast results of the VAR model. The forecasts do not take into account any likely shock or instability in the coming years. In the above forecasts, the recommended forecast error in the years 2017–2025 is about ±10%. Table 4 also shows the lower and upper forecast estimates of real per capita health spending.

**Discussion**

Health authorities need to develop their knowledge about the trend of the health expenditure and the details of the origins of health spending and indicators that explain the growth of health services and expenses to forecast and control the upward spending trend of these
services in the future. The projection of national health expenditures (NHEs) based on a time series database can provide the proposed sources for health-care planners and policymakers. This study has provided a general model for projection of the future path of NHE, with a conceptual framework concerning the determinants of health spending and indicators. This result arose from an in-depth understanding of the literature in the field and a smart classification of sources of health spending and indicators. Furthermore, the general models and variables, defined with accurate specifications, are adapted to any database for a health system. The estimation method presents the three stages of searching the trend of the dependent variable with general characteristics over time, reviewing the initial forecasts of alternative estimation models to compare precision measurements, and displaying the forecast results. The VAR and OLS regression models have variables with no problem of spurious estimation results. The above characteristics of the model of health spending projection were examined in detail with a presentation concerning estimates with the Iranian health system database. This model can also be employed to forecast health spending with any database in developed and developing countries.

The results for Iran imply that in 9 years in the future, beginning from 2017, the real per capita health spending will grow at the average annual rate of 4.78% and a total of 43% in 2017–2025, disregarding any unexpected disturbance in the future. Adding the past 10 years’ average growth rate of population, equal to 1.4%, the average growth rate of NHE in real terms will be 6.18% annually and a total of 55.62% in 9 years in the future. The average inflation rate of health expenditure from the past 10 years was 12%. Adding this inflation rate to the above real growth rates implies that we should expect much higher growth rates of per capita and total NHE in nominal terms in the future. This result makes households spending on health services much worse when the budget constraint of the government limits the annual growth of the health budget in the future. This image of health spending in the coming years implies that health authorities need to concentrate on the growth rate of the health budget and simultaneously on health spending of the public with the lowest rise.

The results of this study compared with the recently published report of the Central Bank of Iran (CBI)[46] on health-care overview and forecast in Iran. The figures in the CBI report are the overall values in the nominal

---

**Table 3: Comparison of the deviation of the forecast values from the actual values in 2012-2016**

| Model     | Year | The growth of real per capita health expenditure | Real per capita health expenditure | Error of forecasting | RMSE  |
|-----------|------|-------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------|-------|
|           |      | Predicted (IR) | Actual (IR) | Absolute error (IR) | Relative error (%) |
| VAR model | 2012 | -0.004564     | -0.130462  | 1,739,258           | 14.5              |
|           | 2013 | -0.065589     | -0.105678  | 2,106,754           | 19.6              |
|           | 2014 | -0.055519     | 0.127705   | 21,394              | 0.2               |
|           | 2015 | 0.096217      | -0.044414  | 1,727,193           | 14.9              |
|           | 2016 | -0.044252     | 0.069989   | 328,190             | 2.6               |
| Mean      |      | -0.014742     | -0.016572  | 1,184,558           | 10.4              |
| OLS model | 2012 | 0.0241229     | -0.130462  | 2,135,567           | 17.8              |
|           | 2013 | -0.0558925    | -0.105678  | 2,614,255           | 24.3              |
|           | 2014 | -0.1780581    | 0.127705   | -1,136,076          | -9.4              |
|           | 2015 | -0.1447664    | -0.044414  | -2,187,389          | -18.9             |
|           | 2016 | -0.2389027    | 0.069989   | -5,240,846          | -42.3             |
| Mean      |      | -0.118699348  | -0.016572  | -762,898            | -5.7              |

**Table 4: Real per capita health expenditures with the Iranian database in the years 2017-2025**

| Year | The growth of real per capita health expenditure (%) | Real per capita health expenditure (IR) | Estimation CI |
|------|-----------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|---------------|
|      | Predicted                                           | Actual                                 | Lower limit (IR) | Upper limit (IR) |
| 2017 | 6.33                                                | 13,171,179                             | 11,854,061      | 14,488,297       |
| 2018 | 4.59                                                | 13,775,962                             | 12,398,366      | 15,153,558       |
| 2019 | 4.52                                                | 14,399,081                             | 12,959,173      | 15,838,989       |
| 2020 | 4.53                                                | 15,051,726                             | 13,546,553      | 16,556,898       |
| 2021 | 4.56                                                | 15,738,333                             | 14,164,499      | 17,312,166       |
| 2022 | 4.59                                                | 16,461,191                             | 14,815,072      | 18,107,310       |
| 2023 | 4.62                                                | 17,221,855                             | 15,499,669      | 18,944,040       |
| 2024 | 4.64                                                | 18,021,558                             | 16,219,398      | 19,823,709       |
| 2025 | 4.66                                                | 18,861,277                             | 16,975,149      | 20,747,404       |

IR=Iranian Rial, CI=Confidence interval
The presented forecasts of the THE growth are based on the assumption of the continuation in the current situation and the absence of any unexpected economic, social, and political shocks. Any uncommon impact on Iran health-care market (such as war and epidemic) will lead to deviation of THE from the predicted values. Therefore, maintaining the existing trend should be considered in the use of results. It should be suggest for the future studies to consider the effect of COVID-19 outbreak - which was not predicted at the time running this study- on THE growth rate. Furthermore, it is recommended for future studies to expand our forecasts by focusing on the error correction modes.

Conclusions

The presented model provides estimates that are compatible with actual trends of health spending and can be applied to forecast health expenditure growth in the near future. The forecasted image of Iran’s health spending growth implies that health authorities need to concentrate more on the growth rate of the health budget and its fiscal space in the near future.

Acknowledgment and ethical moral code
This study was supported by I.R. Iran’s NIHR, and the Ethics Committee of the NIHR approved this study (approved no: IR.TUMS.NIHR.REC.1396.31). We would like to dedicate our great thanks to all managers and staffs of NIHR for their kind participation and companionship.

Financial support and sponsorship
This study was supported financially by I.R. Iran’s National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) (approved no: 241/M/96105).

Conflicts of interest
There are no conflicts of interest.

References

1. Murthy VN, Okunade AA. The core determinants of health expenditure in the African context: Some econometric evidence for policy. Health Policy 2009;91:57-62.
2. Bahadori M, Raadabadi M, Teymourzadeh E, Yaghoubi M. Confirmatory factor analysis of the Herzberg job motivation model for workers in the military health organizations of Iran. J Mil Med 2015;17:65-71.
3. Rezaei S, Fallah R, Kazemi Karyani A, Daroudi R, Zandiyan H, Hajizadeh M. Determinants of healthcare expenditures in Iran: Evidence from a time series analysis. Med J Islam Repub Iran 2016;30:313.
4. Younsi M, Chakroun M, Nafaa A. Robust analysis of the determinants of healthcare expenditure growth: Evidence from panel data for low-, middle-and high-income countries. Int J Health Plan Manag 2016;31:580-601.
5. Abolhassania M, Hasani S, Bastani P, Ramezanian M, Kazemian M. Determinants of catastrophic health expenditure in Iran. Iran J Public Health 2013;42:155-60.
6. Aryankheal A, Etemadi M, Mohseni M, Azami-Aghdash S, Nakhaei M. Catastrophic health expenditure in Iran: A review article. Iran J Public Health 2018;47:166-77.

7. Total Health Care Expenditures. World Bank; Washington, D.C. 2017. Available from: http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SH.XPD.PCAP?locations=IR.

8. Consumer Price Index. Central Bank of Islamic Republic of Iran; Tehran, 2017. Available from: www.cbi.ir/section/1378.aspx.

9. Vosough Moghadam A, Damari B, Alikhani S, Salarizadeh M, Rostamigooran N, Delavari A, et al. Health in the 5th 5-years development plan of Iran: Main challenges, general policies and strategies. Iran J Public Health 2013;42:42-9.

10. Zare H, Trujillo AJ, Driessen J, Ghasemi M, Gallego G. Health inequalities and development plans in Iran; an analysis of the past three decades (1984-2010). Int J Equity Health 2014;13:42.

11. Heshmati B, Joulaei H. Iran's health-care system in transition. Lancet 2016;387:29-30.

12. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG, Group P. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: The PRISMA statement. PLoS medicine 2009;6:e1000097.

13. Prieto DC, Lago-Peñas S. Decomposing the determinants of health care expenditure: The case of Spain. Eur J Health Econ 2012;13:19-27.

14. Cantarero D, Lago-Peñas S. The determinants of health care expenditure: A reexamination. Appl Econ Lett 2010;17:723-6.

15. Herwartz H, Theilen B. The determinants of health-care expenditure: New results from semiparametric estimation. Health Econ 2010;19:964-78.

16. Ang JB. The determinants of health care expenditure in Australia. Appl Econ Lett 2010;17:639-44.

17. Bose S. Determinants of per capita state-level health expenditures in the United States: A spatial panel analysis. J Reg Anal Policy 2015;45:93-107.

18. Colombier C. Drivers of health-care expenditure: What Role Does Baumol’s Cost Disease Play? Soc Sci 2017; 98:1603-1621. [doi: 10.1111/ssqu.12384].

19. Khan HN, Razali RB, Shafie AB. Modeling determinants of health expenditures in Malaysia: Evidence from time series analysis. Front Pharmacol 2016;7:69.

20. Li J, Zhao M, Jiang K. Empirical Analysis of the Determinants of Health Care Expenditure in China Based on Co-Integration and Error-Correction Model. 2009 IEEE International Conference on Grey Systems and Intelligent Services (GSIS 2009).

21. Murthy VN, Okunade AA. Determinants of US health expenditure: Evidence from autoregressive distributed lag (ARDL) approach to cointegration. Econ Model 2016;59:67-73.

22. Nghiem SH, Connelly LB. Convergence and determinants of health expenditures in OECD countries. Health Econ Rev 2017;7:29.

23. Samadi A, Homai Rad E. Determinants of Healthcare Expenditure in Economic Cooperation Organization (ECO) Countries: Evidence from Panel Cointegration Tests. Int J Health Policy Manag 2013;1:63-8.

24. Thornton JA, Beilfuss SN. New evidence on factors affecting the level and growth of US health care spending. Appl Econ Lett 2016;23:15-8.

25. Wang ZJ. The determinants of health expenditures: Evidence from US state-level data. Appl Econ 2009;41:429-35.

26. Wu PC, Liu SY, Pan SC. Nonlinear relationship between health care expenditure and its determinants: A panel smooth transition regression model. Empirica 2014;41:713-29.

27. Chaabouni S, Abednnadher C. The determinants of health expenditures in Tunisia: An ARDL bounds testing approach. Int J Inf Syst Serv Sect 2014;6:60-72.

28. Herwartz H, Theilen B. The determinants of health care expenditure: Testing pooling restrictions in small samples. Health Econ 2003;12:113-24.

29. Hitiris T, Posnett J. The determinants and effects of health expenditure in developed countries. J Health Econ 1992;11:173-81.

30. López-Casasnovas G, Saez M. A multilevel analysis on the determinants of regional health care expenditure: A note. Eur J Health Econ 2007;8:59-65.

31. Okunade AA, Karakus MC, Okeke C. Determinants of health expenditure growth of the OECD countries: Jackknife resampling plan estimates. Health Care Manag Sci 2004;7:173-83.

32. Thornton J, Rice J. Determinants of healthcare spending: A state level analysis. Appl Econ 2008;40:2873-89.

33. Mosca I. Decentralization as a determinant of health care expenditure: Empirical analysis for OECD countries. Appl Econ Lett 2007;14:511-5.

34. Rezaei S, Fallah R, Moradi K, Delavari S, Moradi SD, Matin BK. Macro determinants of Iranian provincial healthcare expenditures from 2006 to 2013: Evidence from panel data. Electron Physician 2015;7:1584-9.

35. Barros PP. The black box of health care expenditure growth determinants. Health Econ 1998;7:533-44.

36. Bilgel F, Tran KC. The determinants of Canadian provincial health expenditures: Evidence from a dynamic panel. Appl Econ 2013;45:201-12.

37. Gbesemete KP, Gerdthum UG. Determinants of health-care expenditure in Africa – A cross-sectional study. World Dev 1992;20:303-8.

38. Hansen P, King A. The determinants of health care expenditure: A cointegration approach. J Health Econ 1996;15:127-37.

39. Hartwig J. What drives health care expenditure? – Baumol’s model of ‘unbalanced growth’ revisited. J Health Econ 2008;27:603-23.

40. Hartwig J, Sturm JE. Robust determinants of health care expenditure growth. Appl Econ 2014;46:4455-74.

41. Murthy VN, Ketenci N. Is technology still a major driver of health care expenditure: Evidence from cointegration analysis with multiple structural breaks. Int J Health Econ Manag 2017;17:29-50.

42. Okunad AA, Murthy VN. Technology as a ‘major driver’ of health care cost: A cointegration analysis of the Newhouse conjecture. J Health Econ 2002;21:147-59.

43. You X, Okunade AA. Income and technology as drivers of Australian healthcare expenditures. Health Econ 2017;26:853-62.

44. Pijalovic V. Key drivers of changes in health expenditure. Actual Probl Health Econ 2013;45:201-12.

45. Rezaei S, Fallah R, Moradi K, Delavari S, Moradi SD, Matin BK. Macro determinants of Iranian provincial healthcare expenditures from 2006 to 2013: Evidence from panel data. Electron Physician 2015;7:1584-9.

46. Barros PP. The black box of health care expenditure growth determinants. Health Econ 1998;7:533-44.

47. Bilgel F, Tran KC. The determinants of Canadian provincial health expenditures: Evidence from a dynamic panel. Appl Econ 2013;45:201-12.

48. Gbesemete KP, Gerdthum UG. Determinants of health-care expenditure in Africa – A cross-sectional study. World Dev 1992;20:303-8.

49. Hansen P, King A. The determinants of health care expenditure: A cointegration approach. J Health Econ 1996;15:127-37.

50. Hartwig J. What drives health care expenditure? – Baumol’s model of ‘unbalanced growth’ revisited. J Health Econ 2008;27:603-23.

51. Hartwig J, Sturm JE. Robust determinants of health care expenditure growth. Appl Econ 2014;46:4455-74.

52. Murthy VN, Ketenci N. Is technology still a major driver of health care expenditure: Evidence from cointegration analysis with multiple structural breaks. Int J Health Econ Manag 2017;17:29-50.

53. Okunad AA, Murthy VN. Technology as a ‘major driver’ of health care cost: A cointegration analysis of the Newhouse conjecture. J Health Econ 2002;21:147-59.

54. You X, Okunade AA. Income and technology as drivers of Australian healthcare expenditures. Health Econ 2017;26:853-62.

55. Pijalovic V. Key drivers of changes in health expenditure. Actual Probl Health Econ 2013;45:201-12.

56. BMI: Iran Healthcare Overview, Forecast. Financial Tribune; 2016. https://financialtribune.com/node/33291. [Last accessed on 2019 May 05].

57. Ramezanian M, Haghdoost AA, Mehrholassani MH, Abolhassaje L, Dehvahieh R, Najafi B, et al. Forecasting health expenditures in Iran using the ARIMA model (2016-2020). Med J Islam Repub Iran 2019;33:25.

58. Keehan SP, Poisal JA, Cuckler GA, Sisko AM, Smith SD, Madison AJ, et al. National health expenditure projections, 2015-25: Economy, prices, and aging expected to shape spending and enrollment. Health Aff (Millwood) 2016;35:1522-31.