Advanced Satellite-Based Frequency Transfer at the $10^{-16}$ Level

Miho Fujieda®, Sung-Hoon Yang, Tadahiro Gotoh, Sang-Wook Hwang, Hidekazu Hachisu, Huidong Kim, Young Kyu Lee, Ryo Tabuchi, Tetsuya Ido, Won-Kyu Lee, Myoung-Sun Heo, Chang Yong Park, Dai-Hyuk Yu, and Gérard Petit

Abstract—Advanced satellite-based frequency transfers by two-way carrier-phase (TWCP) and integer precise point positioning have been performed between the National Institute of Information and Communications Technology and Korea Research Institute of Standards and Science. We confirm that the disagreement between them is less than $1 \times 10^{-16}$ at an averaging time of several days. In addition, an overseas frequency ratio measurement of Sr and Yb optical lattice clocks was directly performed by TWCP. We achieved an uncertainty at the mid-$10^{-16}$ level after a total measurement time of 12 h. The frequency ratio was consistent with the recently reported values within the uncertainty.

Index Terms—Clocks, frequency measurement, phase measurement.

I. INTRODUCTION

SATellite-BASED time and frequency transfers are in demand for long-distance links and typically utilize pseudorange measurements using a code phase of a signal modulated by a pseudorandom noise (PN) sequence. Increasing the chip rate of the PN sequence improves the measurement precision, although it occupies a wider frequency bandwidth at the same time. This has limited the measurement precision of two-way satellite time and frequency transfer (TWSTFT) to an insufficient level for the comparison of advanced optical clocks. To improve the precision, the National Institute of Information and Communications Technology (NICT) has developed a two-way carrier-phase (TWCP) satellite frequency transfer technique [1]. It achieves sub-picosecond-level precision, which is three orders of magnitude better than that of TWSTFT [2]. On the other hand, the precise point positioning (PPP) technique utilizing code and carrier phases has been used by GPS time and frequency transfer (hereafter called GPS transfer) and contributes to the International Atomic Time computation [3], [4]. The measurement precision is improved by two orders of magnitude to a few tens of picoseconds by the application of the carrier phase in the GPS transfer. However, solving the phase ambiguity may introduce random errors in GPS transfer results. To overcome this limitation, the integer PPP (IPPP) technique has been developed [5]. It has been applied to GPS transfer and recently demonstrated a $1 \times 10^{-16}$ frequency transfer accuracy [6]. Thus, these advanced satellite-based frequency transfer techniques such as TWCP and IPPP have the potential to enable optical clock comparisons in a long baseline. Aiming at the evaluation and comparison of their techniques, NICT and about 1100 km apart the Korea Research Institute of Standards and Science (KRISS) established the TWCP link in December 2016. In this paper, we describe the frequency transfer techniques in Section II and introduce the comparison between the two techniques in Section III. In Section IV, the frequency ratio measurement of Sr and Yb optical lattice clocks by TWCP is demonstrated.

II. FREQUENCY TRANSFER TECHNIQUES AND SETUPS

NICT and KRISS have performed TWCP and GPS transfer on a regular basis. Here, we introduce the TWCP and IPPP techniques briefly. Then their measurement setups at NICT and KRISS are shown.

A. TWCP

By two-way signal exchange, the delay terms in the propagation path are almost canceled in TWCP. When we determine a pseudorange from the carrier phase of the transmitted signal from an earth station A at an earth station B, however, we have to remove two terms: the Doppler effects caused by the satellite motion and the phase noise introduced by the onboard oscillator in the frequency conversion from uplink to downlink frequencies because most communication satellites do not carry an atomic clock. It was shown in [2] that the mathematical cancelation by using four carrier phases of the four signals from A to A, from A to B, from B to A, and from B to B is effective in removing them. In addition, the ionosphere delay is not canceled either because the uplink and downlink frequencies are different. Therefore, we utilize an ionosphere map and compute the delays using the total electron contents over the earth stations. Since the carrier phase is continuously tracked and accumulated in TWCP measurements without any phase discontinuity, the result basically keeps the continuity as long as the measurement continues.
Fig. 1. Schematics of the earth stations at (a) NICT and (b) KRISS. BPF: bandpass filter, amp.: amplifier, and A/D: analog-to-digital converter. (c) Spectrum of the reception signals for TWCP and TWSTFT.

(a) NICT (b) KRISS

Fig. 1(a) and (b) shows schematics of the earth stations at NICT and KRISS, respectively. We use an arbitrary waveform generator for the signal generation and an analog-to-digital (A/D) sampler for carrier-phase detection. The TWCP signal has a frequency bandwidth of 200 kHz. The code phase of 128 k chips per second is detected, as well as the carrier phase, and it helps the signal tracking. The frequency conversion is carried out by commercial frequency up- and downconverters from 70 MHz to uplink and downlink frequencies of 14 and 11 GHz, respectively. The reference signals of 10 MHz are provided to the frequency converters to maintain the carrier-phase coherence. At NICT, a dedicated earth station is used for the TWCP measurement. On the other hand, at KRISS, the TWCP and conventional TWSTFT measurements share one earth station. The two signals for the TWCP and TWSTFT are combined and divided at 70 MHz by a signal combiner and divider, respectively. Fig. 1(c) shows the reception spectrum where the same center frequency was used by the TWCP signal and the TWSTFT signal with a frequency bandwidth of 2.5 MHz. We did not observe any interference between them caused by sharing the same frequency bandwidth. We started continuous TWCP measurement alongside TWSTFT in December 2016 using a geostationary satellite named Eutelsat 172A. For the ionosphere delay correction between NICT and KRISS, we use a global ionosphere map produced by the Center for Orbit Determination in Europe [7]. The typical amplitude of the ionosphere delay is about 10 ps.

B. IPPP

In IPPP, as in classical PPP, the user's clock is determined from dual frequency GPS phase measurements using satellite clock products generated by analysis of a global network. For IPPP, the satellite products generated by the GRG analysis center [8] are designed so that the user can determine the phase ambiguities for each satellite pass and the two frequencies as integers $N1/N2$. This is done in a two-step procedure with the CNES GINS software, first determining the wide lane ambiguity $N_w = N2 - N1$ and then determining, e.g., $N1$, see details in [6] and [8]. Clock differences are then continuous as long as there is no discontinuity in the set of integer ambiguities for all satellite passes.

As shown in [6], the above treatment is performed on a station by station basis, independently for each day, and the continuity between successive daily batches is then to be established. By design, discontinuities between batches should be an integer number of the so-called narrow lane wavelength $\lambda_N (~350$ ps) and it is simpler to determine these discontinuities when forming the difference of two station clocks, i.e., a time link. Indeed, when the instability of the two compared clocks is sufficiently low, the extrapolation noise from batch to batch is much lower than $\lambda_N$ and it is easy to determine the discontinuities as an integer number of $\lambda_N$. This extrapolation technique was used for the IPPP solution between UTC(NICT) and UTC(KRIS) which are both based on H-masers. Note that such discontinuities must also be determined when all satellite ambiguities are reset within a daily batch, e.g., by a short data gap.

The GPS receivers used at NICT and KRISS are Septentrio PolaRx 4 and Ashtech Z12T connected to the reference signals from UTC(NICT) and UTC(KRIS), respectively.

III. COMPARISON BETWEEN TWCP AND IPPP

We compared the measurement results obtained by PPP, IPPP, and TWCP for two periods: (1) from MJD 57772 to MJD 57784 and (2) from MJD 57851 to MJD 57883. Here, PPP is computed with NRCan PPP software using 15 day batches and IGS final products. The TWCP measurements were continuously carried out without any downtime. The measurement rates of PPP, IPPP, and TWCP are 300, 30, and 1 s, respectively. Fig. 2(a) shows the time difference between UTC(NICT) and UTC(KRIS) for period (2). The TWCP result has been roughly aligned to the GPS results by inserting an arbitrary offset. Fig. 2(b) shows the differences of IPPP-TWCP, PPP-TWCP, and IPPP-PPP. A time jump can be observed around 6 h on MJD 57861. It is clear that the TWCP result caused it because the signal-to-noise ratio at the KRISS station suddenly decreased by 8 dB due to heavy rain, and a phase excursion of 0.2 ns occurred in the TWCP result. The PPP result also shows a deviation around 8 h on MJD 57861 and this seems independent of that by TWCP. In addition, a small jump can be seen at MJD 57856. It was found that the GPS receiver at NICT caused a reset of all ambiguities at that time. While IPPP found an exact integer number of cycles to go through the reset, PPP could not. Difference between two methods should not have a frequency offset, which can be caused by a disagreement between them. We estimated it by a first-order fitting in Fig. 2(b). In Table I, “disagreement” shows the absolute values of the gradients of IPPP-TWCP and PPP-TWCP. While the difference of PPP-TWCP indicates a clear gradient at the $10^{-16}$ level, that of IPPP-TWCP is almost flat. IPPP and TWCP show consistency.
at the $10^{-17}$ level. Fig. 3 shows the modified Allan deviation of UTC(NICT)-UTC(KRIS) for period (2). All techniques are limited by the stability of the time scales at some averaging times: at or below 20,000 s and larger for TWCP, around 0.5 day and larger for IPPP, and around 1 day and larger for PPP. On the other hand, the differences of IPPP-TWCP and PPP-TWCP are free from the limitation. While the curve of IPPP-TWCP is decreasing and reaches $10^{-17}$ level after 500,000 s, that of PPP-TWCP becomes flat. For period (1), similar stabilities are achieved of $5.5 \times 10^{-17}$ at 250,000 s for IPPP-TWCP and $1.7 \times 10^{-16}$ at 250,000 s for PPP-TWCP. By the comparisons among PPP, IPPP, and TWCP, it proved that TWCP, as well as IPPP, has superior long-term stability. Until now, unless the signal-to-noise ratio decreases suddenly owing to the weather conditions, the measurement has successfully continued and phase continuity can be preserved in the TWCP results.

IV. Yb/Sr Frequency Ratio Measurement by TWCP

A. Measurement Setup

NICT and KRISS operate a $^{87}$Sr optical lattice clock [9], [10] and a $^{171}$Yb optical lattice clock [11]. The frequency ratio was measured by TWCP through microwave references. The optical clocks were continuously operated for around 4 h per day over 3 days during February 1, 2017 to February 3, 2017. We performed two local measurements and one TWCP measurement at the same time. The frequencies of the optical clocks were measured with reference to the microwave references by using an optical frequency comb at each site. The systematic frequency shifts of the optical clock were corrected including the gravitational redshift. TWCP evaluates the frequency difference between the microwave references of both sites. At NICT and KRISS, a free-running hydrogen maser, HM(NICT), and UTC(KRIS) with frequency $f_{HM(NICT)}$ and $f_{UTC(KRIS)}$, respectively, were used as the microwave references. These signals were provided to the earth stations for TWCP. By obtaining fractional frequencies $Yb$ and $Sr$ against each result of previous absolute frequency measurements $f_{Yb}$ and $f_{Sr}$ [11], [10] on the basis of $f_{UTC(KRIS)}$ and $f_{HM(NICT)}$, the frequency ratio of the two optical clock transitions $Yb/Sr$ is measured as

$$\frac{v_{Yb}}{v_{Sr}} = \frac{Yb}{Sr} \cdot \frac{f_{Yb}}{f_{Sr}} \cdot \frac{f_{HM(NICT)}}{f_{UTC(KRIS)}} \cdot \frac{f_{UTC(KRIS)}}{f_{HM(NICT)}} \cdot \frac{f_{Yb}}{f_{Yb}} \cdot \frac{f_{Yb}}{Yb}$$

B. Data Analysis

The data acquisition rates of the two local measurements and one TWCP measurement were 1 point per every second. First, we extracted the data where both optical clocks were simultaneously operated. Fig. 4(a) depicts their Allan deviations measured on February 1. The HM(NICT) signal
then calculated in Fig. 4(a) display similar values around 30 s, we averaged deviation of \( f \). The underlying cause of the measurement carried out on February 1. (b) Frequency difference of \( \nu_{Yb}/\nu_{Sr} \) for 3 days. (c) Allan deviation by treating the whole data of \( \nu_{Yb}/\nu_{Sr} \) as one continuous measurement, its fitting curve and the Allan deviation of \( f_{HM(NICT)/UTC(KRIS)} \) measured from February 1 to February 3. (d) Frequency ratio \( R \) reported so far.

was transferred by an unfixed coaxial cable to the Sr clock at this measurement, which caused an unwanted fluctuation and instability at around 100 s. Since the stabilities shown in Fig. 4(a) display similar values around 30 s, we averaged three frequency ratios over 30 s, aligned the time stamps, and then calculated \( \nu_{Yb}/\nu_{Sr} \) following (1). The computed difference relative to \( \nu_{Yb}/\nu_{Sr} \) is depicted in Fig. 4(b). The Allan deviation was calculated from the whole data for 3 days as one continuous measurement, as shown in Fig. 4(c) by a red line, where the fitting curve of \( 9.4 \times 10^{-13} \times t^{-0.72} \) is also depicted by a blue line. The underlying cause of the \( t^{-0.72} \) slope is not known; however, there are some evidences in our analysis that show its presence throughout the dead-times of Fig. 4(b). Table II summarizes the daily mean values. As for the daily statistical uncertainty, it was computed using the fitting curve of the Allan deviation for the measurement period. Weighting the daily mean values by the reciprocals of the square of daily statistical uncertainty, we concluded the weighted frequency difference of \( 5.2 \times 10^{-16} \) for the 3-day measurement. Table III shows the uncertainty budget. The total statistical uncertainty was determined from the weighted uncertainty: \( (1/9.7^2) + (1/9.1^2) + (1/9.6^2))^{-0.5} \times 10^{-16} \). In Fig. 4(c), the Allan deviation of \( f_{HM(NICT)/UTC(KRIS)} \) measured by TWCP for 3 days is depicted by the green line, which meets the fitting curve at \( 5 \times 10^{-16} \) around 40000 s. This implies that the total statistical uncertainty was estimated appropriately. It is also noted that when we use total Allan deviation, we get the similar result of the daily statistical uncertainty \( (1.01 \times 10^{-15} \), \( 0.95 \times 10^{-15} \), and \( 1.01 \times 10^{-15} \), which confirms the appropriateness of the uncertainty estimation. The systematic uncertainty for TWCP was \( 1 \times 10^{-16} \) from the disagreement with IPPP. On the other hand, the Sr and Yb lattice clocks have systematic uncertainties of \( 0.5 \times 10^{-16} \) and \( 1.2 \times 10^{-16} \), respectively. The uncertainties of the differential gravitational redshift between both clocks is \( 0.4 \times 10^{-16} \). We achieved a total uncertainty of \( 5.8 \times 10^{-16} \). Thus, the consistency of the previous absolute frequencies reported by NICT and KRISS \( [10] \), \( [11] \) was confirmed by \( \nu_{Yb}/\nu_{Sr} = 1 \pm 5.8 \times 10^{-16} \). We concluded the frequency ratio, \( R \), as

\[
R = \nu_{Yb}/\nu_{Sr} = 1.207, 507, 039, 343, 337, 90(70).
\]

The recently reported values are shown in Fig. 4(d) \( [12] \), \( [13] \). We confirm that our result is consistent with them within the uncertainty.

**V. CONCLUSION**

We evaluated measurement results achieved by the advanced satellite-based frequency techniques of PPP, IPPP, and TWCP in the NICT-KRISS link. While the disagreement of PPP-TWCP remains at the \( 10^{-16} \) level, that of IPPP-TWCP reaches the \( 10^{-17} \) level at over \( 5 \times 10^3 \) s average time.
The overseas frequency ratio measurement of Sr and Yb optical lattice clocks was directly performed by TWCP. We performed a dead-time-free and simultaneous measurement for about 12 h and confirmed that the achieved frequency ratio is consistent with those shown in other reports within a total uncertainty at the mid-10^{-16} level. In conclusion, not only optical fiber links but also advanced satellite-based frequency links are applicable to optical clock comparisons. The satellite-based techniques have the potential to realize uncertainty at the 10^{-17} level when optical clocks are continuously operated for a week or more.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors would like to thank H. Takiguchi from JAXA, Tokyo, Japan, for his technical support in PPP. The use of the GINS software from the CNES and of the GPSPPP software from the NRCan is gratefully acknowledged.

REFERENCES

[1] M. Fujieda et al., “NICT-KRIS TWCP link: Evaluation and application,” in Proc. Joint Conf. Eur. Freq. Time Forum IEEE Int. Freq. Control Symp., Jul. 2017, pp. 7–9.
[2] M. Fujieda, D. Piester, T. Gotoh, J. Becker, M. Aida, and A. Bauch, “Carrier-phase two-way satellite frequency transfer over a very long baseline” Metrologia, vol. 51, no. 3, pp. 253–262, 2014.
[3] K. M. Larson and J. Levine, “Carrier-phase time transfer,” IEEE Trans. Ultrason., Ferroelectr., Freq. Control, vol. 46, no. 4, pp. 1001–1012, Jul. 1999.
[4] G. Petit and Z. Jiang, “Precise point positioning for TAI computation,” in Proc. IEEE Int. Freq. Control Symp. 21st Eur. Freq. Time Forum, May/Jun. 2007, pp. 395–398.
[5] D. Laurichesse and F. Mercier, “Integer ambiguity resolution on undifferenced GPS phase measurements and its application to PPP” in Proc. 20th Int. Techn. Meeting Satellite Division (ION GNSS), Sep. 2007, pp. 839–848.
[6] G. Petit, A. Kanji, S. Loyer, J. Delporte, F. Mercier, and F. Perosanz, “1×10^{-16} frequency transfer by GPS PPP with integer ambiguity resolution,” Metrologia, vol. 52, no. 2, pp. 301–309, 2015.
[7] Global Ionosphere Maps Produced by the Center of the Orbit Determination (CODE). [Online]. Available: ftp://ftp.aiub.unibe.ch/CODE/.
[8] S. Loyer, F. Perosanz, F. Mercier, H. Capdeville, and J.-C. Marty, “Zero-difference GPS ambiguity resolution at CNES–CLS IGS analysis center,” J. Geodesy, vol. 86, no. 11, pp. 991–1003, 2012.
[9] H. Hachisu, G. Petit, and T. Ido, “Absolute frequency measurement with uncertainty below 1×10^{-15} using international atomic time,” Appl. Phys. B, vol. 123, no. 1, p. 34, 2017.
[10] H. Hachisu, G. Petit, F. Nakagawa, Y. Hanado, and T. Ido, “SI-traceable measurement of an optical frequency at the low 10^{-16} level without a local primary standard,” Opt. Exp., vol. 25, no. 8, pp. 8511–8523, 2017.
[11] H. Kim et al., “Improved absolute frequency measurement of the ^{171}Yb optical lattice clock towards a candidate for the redefinition of the second,” Jpn. J. Appl. Phys., vol. 56, no. 10, p. 050302, 2017.
[12] N. Nemitz et al., “Frequency ratio of Yb and Sr clocks with 5×10^{-17} uncertainty at 150 seconds averaging time,” Nature Photon., vol. 10, no. 4, p. 258, 2016.
[13] J. Grotti et al., “Geodesy and metrology with a transportable optical clock,” Nature Phys., to be published. [Online]. Available: https://www.nature.com/articles/s41567-017-0042-3, doi: 10.1038/s41567-017-0042-3.

Miho Fujieda received the Ph.D. degree in physics from Kyoto University, Kyoto, Japan, in 2000. Her current research interests include time and frequency transfer via optical fibers and satellite link.

Sung-Hoon Yang was born in Seoul, South Korea, in 1961. He received the M.S. and Ph. D. degrees in electronic engineering from Chungnam National University, Daejeon, South Korea, in 1997 and 2012, respectively. He has been with the Center for Time and Frequency Metrology, Korea Research Institute of Standards and Science, Daejeon, since 1984. He was involved in the development of primary Cs atomic clock and standard time keeping. His current research interests include time transfer using satellites.

Tadahiro Gotoh received the Ph.D. degree in engineering from the University of Electro-Communications, Tokyo, Japan, in 2014. He joined the National Institute of Information and Communications Technology, Tokyo, in 1985. His current research interests include time and frequency transfer and precise orbit determination.

Huidong Kim, photograph and biography not available at the time of publication.

Young Kyu Lee was born in Chonbuk, South Korea, in 1970. He received the M.S. and Ph.D. degrees in information and communications engineering from the Gwangju Institute of Science and Technology, Gwangju, South Korea, in 1997 and 2002, respectively. Since 2002, he has been with the Time and Frequency Group, Korea Research Institute of Standards and Science, Daejeon, South Korea. Since he participated in the Satellite Application Laboratory, he has been engaged in the research and development work field in precise time comparison via satellites and time distribution using ground waves.

Ryo Tabuchi received the M.E. degree from the Okayama University of Science, Okayama, Japan, in 2002. Since 2002, he has been with the National Institute of Information and Communications Technology, Tokyo, Japan.

Hidekazu Hachisu received the Ph.D. degree in applied physics from the University of Tokyo, Tokyo, Japan, in 2006. Since 2010, he has been with the National Institute of Information and Communications Technology, Tokyo, where he has been involved in the research and development of an optical frequency standard with neutral strontium atoms.

Tetsuya Ido received the Doctor degree of technology in applied physics from the University of Tokyo, Tokyo, Japan, in 1998. From 1998 to 2002, he was a Post-Doctoral Fellow with Japan Science and Technology Agency, Kawasaki, Japan, where he was involved in laser cooling and precision spectroscopy of neutral strontium atoms. From 2002 to 2006, he was with JILA, Boulder, CO, USA, where he was involved in continued research on precision spectroscopy of neutral strontium. Since 2006, he has been with National Institute of Information and Communications Technology, Tokyo, Japan. He is currently involved in time and frequency metrology including optical clocks and timescales.
Won-Kyu Lee was born in South Korea in 1971. He received the Ph.D. degree in physics from Seoul National University, Seoul, South Korea, in 2002. Since 2002, he has been with the Korea Research Institute of Standards and Science, Daejeon, South Korea. His current research interests include optical frequency standards, laser frequency stabilization, laser spectroscopy, and high-precision measurements using laser technology. Dr. Lee is a member of the IEEE Instrumentation and Measurement Society, and a fellow member of the Korean Physical Society and the Optical Society of Korea.

Myoung-Sun Heo received the B.Sc. and Ph.D. degrees in physics from Seoul National University, Seoul, South Korea, in 2000 and 2007, respectively. He was a Post-Doctoral Associate with the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA, USA, from 2010 to 2012, where he worked on ultracold atoms and molecules. Since 2013, he has been with the Korea Research Institute of Standards and Science, Daejeon, South Korea. His current research interests include microwave and optical frequency standards and long-distance fiber optical frequency dissemination. Dr. Heo is a member of the Korean Physical Society.

Chang Yong Park was born in South Korea in 1970. He received the Ph.D. degree in physics from Korea University, Seoul, South Korea, in 2002. Since 2003, he has been with the Korea Research Institute of Standards and Science, Daejeon, South Korea. His current research interests include optical frequency standards, laser frequency stabilization, laser spectroscopy, and high-precision measurements using laser technology. Dr. Park is a member of the Korean Physical Society and the Optical Society of South Korea.

Dai-Hyuk Yu was born in Daegu, South Korea, in 1969. He received the Ph.D. degree in physics from Seoul National University, Seoul, South Korea, in 2000. In 2002, he joined the Time and Frequency Group, Korea Research Institute of Standards and Science, Daejeon, South Korea, as a Senior Researcher, where he has been the Head of the Center for Time and Frequency since 2013. His current research interests include fountain frequency standard, optical frequency standards, and high-precision measurements using laser technology. Dr. Yu is a member of the Korean Physical Society and the Optical Society of South Korea.

Gérard Petit graduated as an engineer from Ecole Polytechnique, Palaiseau, France, in 1979, and from the Ecole Nationale des Sciences Géographiques, Champs-sur-Marne, France, in 1981. He received the Ph.D. degree in astronomy from Paris Observatory, Paris, France, in 1994. After working in the field of geodesy at the French National Geographic Institute, Saint-Mandé, France, until 1990, he joined the International Bureau of Weights and Measures, Sèvres, France, where he is currently a Principal Research Physicist with the Time Department. He has authored over 50 papers in peer-reviewed journals or books and received the 2010 European Frequency and Time Award. His research interests include all aspects of the elaboration and usage of timescales, especially time and frequency transfer techniques using GNSS, relativistic treatment for time and frequency applications and the use of frequency standards in generating International Atomic Time.