National and International Approaches to Combat Cultural Heritage Trafficking in Post-2011 Egypt

Randa Alaa El-Din Fouad

Abstract

Cultural heritage trafficking is globally recognized as an international threat and an obstacle against revealing the secrets of humanity’s history. Today, the illicit trafficking of cultural property is reaching its highest levels, particularly in the MENA region, compelling the international community to increase its efforts to protect the region’s cultural heritage from looting, pillage, demolition, illegal transfer and illicit trafficking.

With reference to Egypt, the Egyptian authorities have lately multiplied their efforts, particularly after the 2011 and 2013 revolutions, on the national and international levels aiming to foil the illicit trafficking of cultural property, thus demonstrating its long-term commitment to the protection of the nation’s heritage. This article mainly aims to highlight the concerted governmental efforts to protect and safeguard the Egyptian cultural heritage from illicit trafficking. It also demonstrates the recently adopted governmental approaches to combat all aspects of trafficking in cultural property. Additionally, it sheds the light on the deep need for further national and international cooperation to tackle cultural heritage trafficking, looting and smuggling issues.

Keywords

illicit trafficking, cultural property, looting, illegal excavations, smuggling, national efforts, international cooperation.

Introduction

Looking at art and antiquities is globally known since prehistory till nowadays wars or in conflict zones, whether to indicate victory over the defeated, to obtain spoils of war or to generate money through their illegal trade. It is increasingly linked with money laundering, funding terrorism and organized crime. Moreover, it has been identified by the INTERPOL (International Criminal Police Organization) as a serious transnational crime affecting all regions around the world. Indeed, cultural heritage trafficking has grown widely among the basic concepts of supply and demand. The increasing demand for cultural artifacts has resulted in the development of a wealthy art and antiquities market with an international dimension. In effect, wealthy countries with high demand of cultural artifacts are of short supply of cultural heritage, i.e., UK, USA, Switzerland, Japan, Sweden and France, while the supply side of art and antiquities market represents the poorer countries, i.e., Egypt, Iraq, Cambodia and Mexico. As a transnational crime, illicit antiquities trade goes from “source” countries to “market” countries, where artifacts are displayed at museums or owned as private collections, through passing by “transit” countries.

1  Noah Charney, “A History of Transnational Traffic in Stolen and Looted Art and Antiquities,” in Histories of Transnational Crime, ed. Gerben Bruinsma (London: Springer, 2015), 103-146.
2  Marc-André Renold, “The Legal and Illegal Trade in Cultural Property to and throughout Europe: Facts, Find and Legal Analysis,” (paper presented at the Capacity-Building Conference: Engaging the European Art Market in the Fight Against Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property, Paris, 20-21 March, 2010), http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/IMG/Chance_to_Improve_101-09_November_2010.pdf [Accessed on 23 September 2019].
3  UNESCO, “Fighting the Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property,” http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/images/630X300/Illlegal_People/Toolkit_01.pdf [Accessed on 23 June 2019].
4  INTERPOL, “Protecting Cultural Heritage Through Interagency Cooperation,” https://www.interpol.int/News-and-Events/News-2019/Protecting-cultural-heritage-through-interagency-cooperation [Accessed on 23 September 2019].
5  Alessandro Chechi, The Settlement of International Cultural Heritage Disputes (London: Oxford University Press, 2014), 275.
6  Mohamed Rashed, “The Museums of Egypt after the 2011 Revolution,” Museum International 67, no. 1-4 (June 2016): 126.
sites all over Egypt after the revolutions of both 2011 and 2013. For instance, the Dahshour community, in early April 2013, organized an event that aimed to raise the local awareness about environmental issues in the area. Several schools from Dahshour participated in the event, organizing a garbage collection rally through the villages, the lake, and the surrounding necropolis, planting trees and performing animation activities with their parents.15 - Other campaigns, provided with professionals from the heritage and museum sectors, were introduced to monitor heritage sites and museums especially during the times of conflicts such as the campaign led by Monica Hanna in 2013 known as “Egypt’s Heritage Task Force”.16 - Several campaigns were triggered after the Egyptian revolutions of 2011 and 2013 to combat the hard attacks and the deliberate destruction of the historical buildings all over the country. The renowned campaign of “Save Cairo”, launched by Cairo Library in 2018, mainly focused on the demolition and negligence activities of heritage buildings in historic Cairo and to obtain governmental decisions to halt the demolition procedures especially in the area of Al-Dar El Almah, which contains about 65 ancient Islamic and mediaval buildings and severely suffered from the savagery that was ruining its old alleyways.17 - Following the constant attempts to save and restore Egypt’s lost architectural heritage, Cairo Library kicked off “Welad El-Balad Campaign” which aimed to raise people’s awareness of maintaining the nation’s lost identity represented in its architecture that is facing continuous negligence and lack of restoration, before being completely destroyed and replaced with similarly designed buildings. The campaign included hosting the Middle East’s first regional conference on the role of media in the protection of cultural heritage and its form which was attended by several prominent Middle Eastern figures and other world heritage conservation activists including the director of programs at the ICOM.18

The Egyptian Parliament, in April 2018, approved the government-drafted law that amends some provisions of Law No. 117 of 1983, as amended by law no. 3 of 2010, “Protection of Antiquities Laws” to combat the illicit trade in antiquities.19 This updated legislation gives the SCA the responsibility to remove violations found at archaeological sites and set regulations for the activities on these sites with the assistance of the police, only as a safeguarding agency, while executing the council’s decisions. According to article 42 of the drafted law, whoever steals, possesses, hides and collects antiquity for the purpose of smuggling or is involved in such action shall be punished with 25 years of imprisonment and a fine not less than LE 50,000 and not more than LE 250,000. The penalty of smuggling of illicit antiquities can extend to life imprisonment and a fine of LE 100,000 to 500,000. The punishment of stealing or affixing in the robbery of a genuine artifact or piece of a monument or deliberately disfiguring artifacts or monuments is 15 years imprisonment and a fine of LE 50,000 to 100,000. The writing of graffiti or affixing of billposters and billboards to walls of monuments leads to detention from 6 to 12 months or a fine of LE 150,000. Additionally, article 30 of the drafted law indicates that the SCA is the only authority responsible for carrying out restoration and preservation work for all Egyptian monuments, archaeological sites and historical edifices. Correspondingly, the minister of culture will have the authority to assign any scientific mission to execute such work but under the complete supervision of the SCA.20

Egyptian buildings of architectural value and historical importance are protected by law No. 117/1983, amended by law no. 3 of 2010, law No 176/1961 and law No. 144/2006.21 The number of heritage buildings in Egypt is estimated at 6,500 with 11,673 heritage buildings in Cairo Governorate. The ambitious legal jargon of the aforementioned laws led indirectly to the demolition of the heritage and historic buildings. Accordingly, around 75% of these buildings were lost and demolished between 2011 and 2014.22 The Egyptian Parliament discussed the approval of the amendments of some of the provisions of law No. 144/2006 to frame a better classification for heritage buildings, regulate the demolition of non-dilapidated buildings and control the establishments and the preservation standards of architectural heritage.23 - Workshops, including lectures and workshops, were organized by different NGOs seeking to raise the local community’s awareness of the importance of protecting and preserving cultural heritage. The most recent of which is the workshop held by the EHRF (Egyptian Heritage Rescue Foundation) in cooperation with the CULTNAT (Center for Documentation of Cultural and Natural Heritage) and the Children Library of Bibliotheca Alexandrina in June 2019. The workshop especially focused on introducing collection documentation as a significant tool to preserve and protect cultural heritage during times of crises.24

International Approaches

- Recent events, particularly in the MENA region, probed an international considerable dialogue concerning the protection of cultural heritage during the time of civil unrest, armed conflicts and natural and other human-made disasters.25 Hence, the international communities such as the UNESCO and other actors developed international conventions and national laws and legislations to fight the post-conflict and clandestine trafficking of antiquities. UNESCO continues to rely on the input and expertise of its principal partners in this field, namely the WCO (World Customs Organization), UNIDROIT, INTERPOL, UNODC, and ICOM.26 - UNESCO, with the assistance of its partner ICOM, sent a group of experts to Cairo from 21 to 25 March 2011. The special mission’s objectives were to assess the needs of the museum sector and to establish contact with the Egyptian authorities in order to continue the work on the protection of Egyptian cultural heritage.27 - From 3 to 13 May 2011, two experts were sent by UNESCO, including a representative from the INTERPOL, to assess the security measures taken in Egypt to protect the Egyptian museums and the cultural heritage sites up and down the country. The experts provided advice on how to enhance the Egyptian security measures to better protect the museums from being looted and sites from being illegally excavated in order to minimize the risks of illicit trafficking of Egyptian cultural property. This mission was an opportunity to collect information on the missing or stolen cultural objects during the revolution and onwards and they were eventually included in the INTERPOL Works of Art Database.28 - UNESCO, with co-funding from the Federal Office for Culture of Switzerland, implemented, in November 2013, a series of capacity-building training courses and awareness-raising activities to focus on preventive actions on the fight against illicit trafficking of cultural property in Egypt. Primarily, these projects aim to provide Egyptian heritage professionals with skills and knowledge to respond rapidly and effectively when addressing cases of illicit trafficking. An outcome of these comprehensive projects is the participation of the newly UNESCO trained Egyptian heritage rescue team who intervened rapidly at the Museum of Islamic Art, on 30 January 2014, after its bombing.29 - The fulfillment of the previously mentioned training courses and awareness-raising campaigns was complemented by the educational program started by UNESCO in partnership with the Ministry of Education. This program targets the local communities and youth who will be invited to get involved in safeguarding Egypt’s heritage and to be aware of the damages resulted from the looting of cultural heritage and thus its devastate impacts on the Egyptian identity.30 - The establishment of the EHRF, in 2013, with the objective of promoting and safeguarding Egyptian and regional cultural heritage. The foundation aims to offer courses relevant to Disaster Risk Preparedness and First Aid to Cultural Heritage (FAH) in cooperation with ICOMROM and Aahir regional center at Sharjah, which helped in translating the courses’ materials into Arabic.31
The Swiss-funded project “Museum disaster preparedness and risk mitigation in the event of man-made disaster or conflict” was developed from 15-30 December 2013 and attended by 21 curators from different museums all over Egypt. The course aimed to develop strategies and security management systems and emergency preparedness measures to prevent the illegal trade in cultural heritage, and the organization of the museum of cultural heritage and the prevention of looting or any other kind of risk during political instability, civil unrest and conflict. 32

A workshop was held from 31 March to 2 April 2014 in Cairo and organized by the UNESCO office in Cairo and UNESCO headquarters in Paris. The workshop particularly emphasized on the need for further training of national professionnels, 33 in the fight against illicit trafficking of cultural property and how to improve cooperation with international organizations as well. Moreover, it focused on maintaining and strengthening contact and cooperation between different stakeholders on national and international levels. It is worthy to mention that this workshop was the triggering point of a wider series of unprecedented projects led by UNESCO within the framework of global efforts to protect Egypt’s unique cultural heritage, aimed at building the capacities of Egyptian heritage professionals through a range of targeted legal and operational training workshops, and awareness-raising activities. 34

Marking the 10th anniversary of archaeologists’ day, the Ministry of Antiquities opened the temporary exhibit entitled, “Repatriated Objects: 2014-2015” at the Egyptian Museum in Tahrir Square. The exhibition celebrated the repatriation of about 500 Egyptian artifacts from eight foreign countries between 2014 and 2015. 35

In cooperation with the Ministry of Antiquities and the Ministry of Culture with the support of the government of Sharjah, UAE and the U.S. Secretary State, a two-week specialist workshop on “Building National Capacities for Managing Risks to Cultural Heritage in Case of Emergency” was launched in Cairo, Egypt, on 29 January 2015. The workshop was organized by ICCROM with Arab regional center in Sharjah, UNESCO office in Cairo and the ALECSO (Arab League Educational Cultural and Scientific Organization). It was mainly based on understanding the national and international legislation and its implementation to protect cultural heritage during crises and times of conflict.

A two-day conference, held in Cairo in May 2015, focused on the protection of cultural heritage and ratifying an agreement concerning the establishment of an international advisory committee on the means of protecting monuments from looting.

Three recommendations were issued under the title “Cairo Declaration” to combat cultural racketeering and to decrease the purchasing of stolen antiquities. This conference was attended by UNESCO and ten Arab countries including Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Libya, Sudan, Lebanon, Saudi Arabia, the United Arab Emirates, Kuwait and Oman. Thus, UNESCO announced the triggering of its campaign: “4/Unite4Heritage” from the Museum of Islamic Art, coinciding with the start of the cultural heritage conference. The campaign aims to build an alternative to violent extremist narratives, based upon the ideals of cultural diversity, tolerance and understanding.

In the light of UNESCO partners’ international support, an Egyptian-European conference was held on cultural heritage protection and prevention of cultural heritage stolen goods trafficking. The conference took place at the French Institute in Cairo from 8 to 9 March 2016. Representatives from heritage and museums’ sectors attended the conference to discuss and share good practices to curb smuggling and illicit trafficking of cultural property.

The Egyptian Ministry of Antiquities and the assistance of UNESCO held an exhibition on seized antiques on Egyptian ports at the Egyptian Museum in Tahrir square from 24 October to 15 December 2016. Around 300 rare objects, chosen from thousands of artifacts that were seized in previous years, were displayed within the proceedings of the exhibition. Principally, the exhibition highlighted the efforts carried out by the Egyptian Ministry of Antiquities and all its units that are present at the air, land and seaports of Egypt, to protect Egyptian and world cultural heritage and prevent its smuggling out of Egypt. These efforts included examination, inspection and confiscation of objects, as well as following up on cases of seized objects, starting with the moment the objects were seized at the Egyptian ports, through their handling over to customs storerooms and specialized prosecutions, and up until their deposit in the Ministry of Antiquities storages. 36

The U.S. government, in December 2016, signed for the first time a bilateral agreement with the Egyptian government to thwart illicit trafficking of cultural property. 37 In its action plan under the auspices of the HSI (Homeland Security Investigations) office in Cairo, which covers Egypt, Libya, Chad, Sudan, South Sudan and Eritrea. The HSI is authorized to investigate a wide range of crimes that threaten U.S. national security including drug smuggling, financial crimes, child exploitation and primarily antiquities crimes and trafficking of cultural property. 38

The Egyptian authorities succeeded in repatriating some artifacts, originated in Saqqara, on the e-catalogue of the French auction house Milton in 2016. After expert examination and sending several memoranda to the auction house concerning the restitution of the artifacts, they were proved to be stolen and were eventually returned to Egypt. 39

The Egyptian Minister of Foreign affairs, Sameh Shoukry, was invited in September 2017 to participate in the ministerial conference of the Ancient Civilizations Forum on the sidelines of the 72nd session of the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA 72) in New York. The main conference focused on the ratification an agreement concerning the fight illicit trafficking in cultural property, particularly in the regions suffering from political instability and armed conflicts including Egypt, Syria, Iraq and Libya. 40

In cooperation with the INTERPOL and UNESCO regional office in Beirut officers from the MENA region, including Egypt, attended the training session which aimed to inform the participants about the identification and handling of cultural objects and dedicated tools and instruments, developed by the WCO, INTERPOL, ICOM and other international partners. Moreover, it emphasized the necessity to build the proper capacities needed for safeguarding the cultural heritage from looting. 

The Egyptian authorities repatriated eight Egyptian artifacts, dating back to the first millennium B.C, after they have been illegally exported to Switzerland in 2010. The investigations revealed that these objects were smuggled through an organized network that was used to transfer Egyptian objects to the United Kingdom, transiting in France. In October 2017, the Egyptian authorities were referred after negotiating with the French government concerning their restitution. 41

The DDAD regional office in Cairo held a three-day COSMENIA Heritage Cluster conference from 7 to 9 May 2018. Leading experts from the fields of heritage, history, museology, archaeology and geology around the MENA region attended the conference to discuss the best means to protect cultural heritage in times of armed conflicts and how technology can help to identify, analyze, document and keep elements of cultural heritage safe for future generations. 42

In July 2018, the Egyptian authorities repatriated nearly 1,000 antiquities that were smuggled to Switzerland, UAE, Italy, USA, Belgium, Mexico and Austria. Most recently, the Italian Antiquities and Tourism Police informed the Egyptian embassy in Rome on 14 March that they had seized in Naples 23,700 artifacts, including 118 ancient Egyptian items that ultimately went on display at the Egyptian Museum.

Israel was elected, as the first Arab country since 2013, to chair the UNESCO subsidiary committee of the 1970 convention for countering the illicit trafficking of cultural property for the period from May 2018 till May 2019. The unanimous election reflects the appreciation of the convention’s member states of the latest efforts exercised by Egypt to prevent the illicit trafficking of cultural property and to repatriate its stolen antiques. 43

Trainees from the U.S. Department of HIS, the FBI (Federal Bureau of Investigations), and Interpol Task Force at the U.S. Department of State joined Egyptian officials from the Ministry of Antiquities, Egyptian Customs, Tourism
Police, and other agencies organized the first WCO Middle East and North Africa (MENA) Train-the-Trainer Session for Customs officers on the prevention of illicit trafficking of cultural objects, which was held from 18 to 21 September 2017. Customs agencies, in September 2018, to attend a week-long workshop organized by the U. S. embassy in Cairo. The workshop discussed how the two countries can cooperate more effectively to protect cultural property, investigate cases of illegally exported antiquities and prevent the illicit trade of Egyptian and American antiquities.49 50

- The Egyptian Ministry of Antiquities announced the recovery of a tablet carved with the cartouche of king Amenhotep I. It is not exactly identified when the tablet was illegally smuggled, however, it was previously displayed at the Karnak open-air museum and later found in an unnamed London auction house. The Egyptian Ministry of Antiquities, the Egyptian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Egyptian Embassy in London and the British authorities cooperated closely and succeeded in repatriating the tablet in January 2019.49 50

- The illegally trafficked gilded coffin of Nedjemankh, a high-ranking ancient Egyptian priest, was returned to the Egyptian authorities on 25 September 2019 at a repatriation ceremony in New York, after two years of being obtained by the Metropolitan museum of art. Originally, the coffin was stolen from its burial tomb at El-Minya during the 2011 revolution then it passed through UNE, shipped to Germany and transported later to France. The coffin was sold to the Metropolitan museum in 2017, for a fee of $4 million, using fake import papers and forged 1971 Egyptian export license. It is believed that the coffin will be permanently displayed at the Grand Egyptian Museum in 2020. 50 The Egyptian Minister of Foreign Affairs, Sameh Shoukry, indicated that the coffin was repatriated in the light of the 2016 joint agreement between Egypt and the U.S. regarding the protection of the Egyptian antiquities.

Key Actions and Recommendations

- A national network of stakeholders should be established to coordinate efforts for the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural properties in Egypt. Government authorities, representatives from international organizations as well as art markets and auction houses should accede to police and customs officers, lawyers, museum directors and UNESCO experts to review challenges, identify actions and share good practices to combat cultural heritage smuggling. Moreover, experts, researchers, universities’ professors and students should get involved in the research and documentation process of the cultural assets which is essential for the protection of cultural property.

- National inventories of cultural properties, notably for the movable objects, should be regularly updated in order to combat the traffic of cultural objects as they help individuals, organizations and authorities, such as police or customs officers, identify objects at risk and prevent them from being illegally sold or exported. Furthermore, the use of an international digital database of stolen cultural goods is another crucial requirement to identify the stolen objects, track them, prevent their transaction and finally their restitution.

- National legislations should include a clearer definition for cultural property and its state of ownership since the absence of these provisions may result in losing the right to repatriate the trafficked cultural goods. Consequently, the security level around museums and heritage sites should be increased and the export control regulations should be enhanced in the source countries, i.e., Egypt. Transit countries should formulate rigorous standards to increase export control. With regard to the destination countries, cooperation on antiques’ repatriation, market monitoring, firm trade regulations and effective import controls are highly required to thwart and eliminate illicit trafficking of cultural heritage.51

- National conferences, seminars and capacity building workshops should be convened on the protection of cultural heritage to strengthen capacities for the fight against illicit trafficking of cultural heritage property. These practices should emphasize fundamentally on the implementation of the “UNESCO 1970 Convention for the fight against illicit trafficking of cultural property” and offer the participants the opportunity to acquire knowledge about the benefits of ratification of the 1995 “UNIDROIT Convention on Stolen or Illegally Exported Cultural Objects”, with the objective of ensuring that all those involved in countering illicit trafficking in cultural objects adopt a consistent and harmonized approach, and coordinate their actions.

- Further integrated partnerships between governmental and non-governmental organizations (NGOs), such as EHRF, Tadamon, Rawi, Megawra, Athar Lanka, etc., should be enhanced in order to develop new strategies on research, development and innovation to meet the needs and challenges of illicit cultural heritage trafficking. Such organizations play vital roles in safeguarding cultural heritage property through the involvement of the local communities in the protection of their cultural heritage and reinforcing their sense of belonging. Local residents can be also engaged in the documentation process of the archaeological and historical sites, whom they are living next to, so they can assist in locating the sites and be aware of the importance of its protection as well. For instance, police and authorities on 25 September 2019 at a repatriation ceremony in New York, after two years of being obtained by the Metropolitan museum of art. Originally, the coffin was stolen from its burial tomb at El-Minya during the 2011 revolution then it passed through UNE, shipped to Germany and transported later to France. The coffin was sold to the Metropolitan museum in 2017, for a fee of $4 million, using fake import papers and forged 1971 Egyptian export license. It is believed that the coffin will be permanently displayed at the Grand Egyptian Museum in 2020. 50 The Egyptian Minister of Foreign Affairs, Sameh Shoukry, indicated that the coffin was repatriated in the light of the 2016 joint agreement between Egypt and the U.S. regarding the protection of the Egyptian antiquities.

- The importance of exploring cooperation and coordination opportunities among the relevant international and regional organizations such as UNESCO, ICOM, WCO, INTERPOL, UNES (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime) is needed to provide customs’ officers with wide and flexible range of activities. In this regard, capacity building workshops and training programs should be held to increase the preventive measures recommended by the 1970 UNESCO Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property to combat all aspects of smuggling of cultural heritage goods.

- The deep need for the Egyptian government to sign supplemental bilateral and multilateral agreements with foreign countries, for mutual assistance in criminal, concerning the repatriation of looted Egyptian antiquities. Moreover, the process of exchanging information and ongoing investigations related to the illicit trafficking of cultural property should be enhanced on an international dimension. Subsequently, cooperation channels should be conducted between the Egyptian authorities, the NGO’s and the community for restrictions on antiques smuggling and illegal trade.

- The importance of exploring cooperation and coordination opportunities among the relevant international and regional organizations such as UNESCO, INTERPOL, UNIDROIT, ICOMOS, ICCROM, WCO and other foreign institutions and organizations, with permanent base in Egypt, to develop the proper mechanism to counter the hazardous impacts of illicit trafficking of cultural property in the MENA region, and specifically Egypt.

47. U.S. Mission Egypt, “U.S. and Egypt Collaborate on Cultural Property Protection,” U.S. Embassy in Egypt, September 26, 2018, https://eg.embassy.gov/eg/usa-egypt-collaboration-on-cultural-property-protection [Accessed on 20 May 2019].
48. Olde Tower, “Ancient Egyptian Artifacts Returned After Being Smuggled to London Auction House,” CNN, January 9, 2019, https://www.cnn.com/2019/01/09/ancient-egyptian-artifacts-returned-after-being-smuggled-to-london/index.html [Accessed on 27 June 2019].
49. Peter Sokelny, “After New York Visit, Louvre Returns Coffin of Ancient Egyptian Priest Goes Home,” https://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-egypt-coffin/after-new-york-visit-louvre-returns-coffin-of-ancient-egyptian-priest-goes-home-idUSKBN1WA35K [Accessed on 26 September 2019].
50. Mira Nagdy, “US Returned Looted 2,100-Year-Old Coffin of nedjemankh to Egypt,” https://www.egyptindependent.com/us-returns-back-to-egypt-2 100-year-old-nedjemankh-coffin [Accessed on 26 September 2019].
51. UNESCO, “Fighting the Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property,”
52. Jokilehto J., “World Heritage and Community Engagement,” paper presented at the Nordic World Heritage Conference in Rauma, Living in World Heritage and Community Involvement, Finland, 11-14 September 2017, http://lettere.uniroma2.it/sites/default/files/Jokilehto_paper_on_five Cs%20of%20the%20WHC%20community%20and%20synergies%20of%20ICH.pdf [Accessed on 23 August 2019].
Conclusions

Apparently, combating the destruction of cultural heritage and illicit trafficking of cultural property has become a priority for the Egyptian government, particularly after the revolutions of 2011 and 2013. Thus, national and international efforts endeavored to increase the protection of the Egyptian cultural property from illicit trafficking not only for their economic values but also for their significant influence on the world’s cultural diversity which can be potentially devastating in case of their loss.

The recent Egyptian governmental efforts indicate an assertive international movement to thwart the smuggling of cultural goods and to recover the stolen artifacts. However, in view of what has been mentioned so far, it is noticeable that the Egyptian authorities paid great attention to fight against the threat of illicit trafficking of cultural property on the international levels rather than local ones. While national cooperation constitutes one of the most effective means for protecting the country’s cultural heritage property, several local challenges still impede the implementation of a sustainable national strategy for combating the illicit trafficking of cultural goods.

In this regard, preventive measures and systematic practices to respond to this transnational crime should be discussed in coordination with relevant national agencies, international organizations, private sector and educational institutions. Moreover, national approaches appear to require further efforts, measures and development which cannot be fulfilled without the agreement and the support of the public, with a change in their common mind-set, on considering illegal trade of cultural property as a serious crime.

Bibliography

- ARCE. “Behind the Scenes: The Repatriation of Stolen Objects,” http://archive.arce.org/news/170 [Accessed on 8 May 2019].
- Charney, Noah. “A History of Transnational Trafficking in Stolen and Looted Art and Antiquities,” in Histories of Transnational Crime, edited by Gerben Brunssum, 103-146. London: Springer, 2015.
- Chechi, Alessandro. The Settlement of International Cultural Heritage Disputes. London: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- DAAD. “Cultural Heritage Cluster Conference.” https://www.daad.org/en/about-us/commiss/cultural-heritage-cluster/cultural-heritage-cluster-conference/ [Accessed on 14 July 2019].
- Dábrowska, Karen, “Egyptian Architect Baffles to Preserve Cairo’s Heritage.” The Arab Weekly, January 14, 2018. https://thearabweekly.com/egyptian-architect-baffles-preserves-cairo%e2%80%99s-heritage/ [Accessed on 23 August 2019].
- Dryan, Nad. “Reviving Nation’s Demolishing Heritage: A Campaign Seeking to Save Fading Architectural Identity.” Daily News Egypt, March 13, 2018. https://dailynewsEgypt.com/2018/03/15/reviving-nations-demolishing-heritage-campaign-seeking-save-fading-architectural-identity/ [Accessed on 1 June 2019].
- Egypt Today Staff. “FM Urges Combating Illicit Trafficking in Cultural Property.” Egypt Today, September 22, 2017. https://www.egypttoday.com/Article/2/24031/PM-urges-combating-illicit-trafficking-in-cultural-property [Accessed on 23 May 2019].
- Forrest, Craig. International Law and the Protection of Cultural Heritage. London: Routledge, 2012.
- Gamil, Marina. “New Law Intensifies Penalties for Antiquity-Related Crimes.” Egypt Today, April 24, 2018. https://www.egypttoday.com/Article/2/48513/New-law-intensifies-penalties-for-antiquity-related-crimes [Accessed on 24 June 2019].
- Hauser-Schüblen, Brigitta and Lyndol Prott. Cultural Property and Contested Ownership: The Trafficking of Artifacts and the Quest for Restoration. London: Routledge, 2017. https://www.egypttoday.com/Article/2/46951/New-law-intensifies-penalties-for-antiquity-related-crimes [Accessed on 24 June 2019].
- SCA. “Law No. 117 of 1983 As Amended by Law No. 3 of 2010: Promulgating the Antiquities Protection Law.” http://www.egypttoday.com/Article/2/58168/10-draft-laws-expected-to-pass-during-parliament%e2%80%99s-fourth-session [Accessed on 14 June 2019].
- SCA. “Egyptian Archaeologist Returns 2,100-Year-Old Coffin of Nedjemankh from Italy.” Reuters, July 4, 2018. https://www.egypttoday.com/Article/2/58168/10-draft-laws-expected-to-pass-during-parliament%e2%80%99s-fourth-session [Accessed on 25 May 2019].
- US Returned Looted 2,100-Year-Old Coffin of Nedjemankh to Egypt.” http://www.egyptindependent.com/egyptian-architect-battles-to-preserve-cairo%e2%80%99s-heritage [Accessed on 25 May 2019].
- SCA. “Law No. 117 of 1983 As Amended by Law No. 3 of 2010: Promulgating the Antiquities Protection Law.” http://www.egypttoday.com/Article/2/58168/10-draft-laws-expected-to-pass-during-parliament%e2%80%99s-fourth-session [Accessed on 14 June 2019].
- Forrest, Craig. International Law and the Protection of Cultural Heritage. London: Routledge, 2012.
- Marc Andre Renold. “The Legal and Illegal Trade in Cultural Property to and throughout Europe: Facts, Findings and Legal Analysis.” Paper presented at the Capacity-Building Conference: Engaging the European Art Market in the Fight Against Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property, Paris, 20-21 March, 2018. http://unooscc.org/new-leaflet/IMMEDIATE-19/. [Accessed on 23 August 2019].
- Osman, Khalid “Heritage Conservation Management in Egypt: A Review to the Current and the Proposed Situation to Amend it.” Ain Shams Engineering Journal 9, no. 4 (December 2016): 2907-2916.
- Pauwels, Annelies. “Ilas and Illicit Trafficking to Cultural Property: Funding Terrorism through Art.” Freedom from Fear Magazine, August 1, 2016. https://www.unlibrary.org/human-rights-and-refugees/ilsas-and-illicit-trafficking-in-cultural-property-funding-terrorism-through-art/1df038e-en [Accessed on 23 September 2019].
- Rashid, Mohamed. “The Museums of Egypt after the 2011 Revolution.” Museum International 67, no. 1-4 (June 2016): 125-131.
- Reda, Lobna. “10 Draft Laws Expected to Pass During Parliament’s Fourth Session.” Egypt Today, September 26, 2018. http://www.egypttoday.com/Article/2/50160/10-draft-laws-expected-to-pass-during-parliament%e2%80%99s-fourth-session [Accessed on 14 June 2019].
- Romey, Kristin. “U.S., Egypt Sign Agreement to Thwart Trade in Illicit Antiquities.” National Geographic, December 2, 2016. https://news.nationalgeographic.com/2016/12/antiquities-egypt-agreement-repatriation-mummy-artifacts/ [Accessed on 5 May 2019].
- Salem, Mostafa. “Egypt Pushes to Recover Lost Antiquities in Italy.” Reuters, July 4, 2018. https://www.egypttoday.com/Article/2/58168/10-draft-laws-expected-to-pass-during-parliament%e2%80%99s-fourth-session [Accessed on 25 May 2019].
- SCA. “Law No. 117 of 1983 As Amended by Law No. 3 of 2010: Promulgating the Antiquities Protection Law.” http://www.egypttoday.com/Article/2/58168/10-draft-laws-expected-to-pass-during-parliament%e2%80%99s-fourth-session [Accessed on 14 June 2019].
National and International Approaches to Combat Cultural Heritage Trafficking in Post-2011 Egypt

-Szekely, Peter. “After New York Visit, Looted Coffin of Ancient Egyptian Priest Goes Home.” https://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-egypt-coffin/after-new-york-visit-looted-coffin-of-ancient-egyptian-priest-goes-home-idUSKBN1WA35K [Accessed on 26 September 2019].

-Tassie, Geoffrey, De Trafford, Aloisa and Joris Wetering. Egypt’s Heritage in Times of Conflict and Crises. In The Management of Egypt’s Cultural Heritage, Vol. 2, edited by Fekri Hassan et al., 14–17. London: ECHI and Golden House Publications, 2015.

-Taylor, Chloë. “Ancient Egyptian Artefact Returned after Being Smuggled to London Auction House.” CNBC, January 9, 2019. https://www.cnbc.com/2019/01/09/ancient-egyptian-artefact-returned-after-being-smuggled-to-london.html [Accessed on 27 June 2019].

-Thomas, Suzie. “Egyptian Museum in Cairo-Theft and Recoveries in 2011.” Trafficking Culture. 21 August, 2012. https://traffickingculture.org/case-studies/egyptian-museum-cairo-thefts-and-recoveries-in-2011/ [Accessed on 7 June 2019].

-U.S. Mission Egypt. “U.S. and Egypt Collaborate on Cultural Property Protection.” U.S. Embassy in Egypt, September 26, 2018. https://eg.usembassy.gov/us-and-egypt-collaborate-on-cultural-property-protection/ [Accessed on 20 May 2019].

-UNDP. “The Value of Cultural Heritage.” http://www.eg.undp.org/content/egypt/en/home/ourwork/sustainable-development/successstories/Sample_Success_Story_21.html [Accessed on 3 June 2019].

-UNESCO. “#Unite4Heritage at the 38th UNESCO General Conference.” http://www.unesco.org/new/en/generic-conference-38th/unite4heritage/ [Accessed on 25 May 2019].

-UNESCO. “Arab States: Training Activities.” http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/capacity-building/arab-states/egypt-2014/ [Accessed on 24 April 2019].

-UNESCO. “Capacity-Building Training Courses and Awareness-Raising Activities on the Fight Against Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property in Egypt.” http://www.unesco.org/new/index.php?id=61838 [Accessed on 3 May 2019].

-UNESCO. “Fighting the Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property.” http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/movable/pdf/Toolkit_01.pdf [Accessed on 29 June 2019].

-UNESCO. “Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property in Egypt.” http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/emergency-actions/egypt/ [Accessed on 29 June 2019].

-UNESCO. “Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property.” http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/movable/pdf/Toolkit_01.pdf [Accessed on 29 June 2019].

-UNESCO. “Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property.” http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/capacity-building/arab-states/egypt-2016/ [Accessed on 4 April 2019].

-UNESCO. “The Exhibition on Seized Antiquities at Egyptian Ports, in Tahrir, Egypt.” http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/meetings/conferences-and-exhibitions/ [Accessed on 30 May 2019].

-UNESCO. “Museum Disaster Preparedness and Risk Mitigation in the Event of Disaster or Conflict Course (15-30 December 2013).” http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/museums/museum-projects/museum-disaster-preparedness-and-risk-mitigation-in-the-event-of-disaster-or-conflict-course-15-30-december-2013/ [Accessed on 29 June 2019].

-UNESCO. “New UNESCO Tools to Fight the Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Property.” March 15, 2019. http://www.wcoomd.org/en/media/newsroom/2019/march/new-unesco-tools-to-fight-the-illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property.aspx [Accessed on 7 April 2019].

-UNESCO. “The 43rd Session of the World Heritage Committee, Baku, 1 July 2019.” https://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/43com/