SUBDIFFERENTIABILITY SPACES AND NONSMOOTH ANALYSIS

BY A. D. IOFFE

We use the words “subdifferentiability space” as a collective name for classes of Banach spaces characterized by subdifferentiability properties of l.s.c. nonconvex functions defined on them. The classes were introduced by analogy with Asplund (differentiability) spaces [1], but the initial impulse came from nonsmooth analysis where one specific class had appeared quite naturally [2]. The purpose of the note is to introduce four classes of subdifferentiability spaces, describe their properties and the role of one of the classes in nonsmooth analysis.

1. All spaces are assumed Banach and the functions extended real-valued. For a function f on X we set

\[ \text{dom } f = \{ x \mid |f(x)| < \infty \}, \]
\[ U(f, z, \delta) = \{ x \in \text{dom } f \mid \|x - z\| < \delta, |f(x) - f(z)| < \delta \}, \]
\[ d^- f(z; h) = \liminf_{t \to 0} t^{-1}(f(z + th) - f(z)) \]
\[ (z \in \text{dom } f); B, B^* \text{ denote unit balls in } X, X^*. \]

DEFINITION 1. Let f be a function on X, \( \varepsilon > 0 \), and \( z \in \text{dom } f \). We denote by \( \varphi^- \varepsilon (z) \) the set of all \( x^* \in X^* \) such that

\[ \liminf_{\|h\| \to 0} \|h\|^{-1}(f(z + h) - f(z) - \langle x^*, h \rangle) \geq -\varepsilon, \]

and by \( \partial^- \varepsilon f(z) \) the set of all \( x^* \in X^* \) such that

\[ \langle x^*, h \rangle \leq d^- f(z; h) + \varepsilon \|h\|; \]

\( \varphi^- \varepsilon f(z) \) and \( \partial^- \varepsilon f(z) \) will be respectively called the Fréchet and the Dini \( \varepsilon \)-subdifferential of f at z.

If \( z \notin \text{dom } f \), we set \( \varphi^- \varepsilon f(z) = \partial^- \varepsilon f(z) = \emptyset. \)

DEFINITION 2. X is a subdifferentiability (weak subdifferentiability) space or S-space (WS-space) if for any \( \varepsilon > 0 \) every l.s.c. function f on X is Fréchet (Dini) \( \varepsilon \)-subdifferentiable on a dense subset of dom f.
Definition 3. $X$ is a trustworthy space or T-space if for any two l.s.c. functions $f_1, f_2$ on $X$, any $z \in \text{dom } f_1 \cap \text{dom } f_2$, any $\epsilon > 0$, $\delta > 0$ and any weak* neighborhood $V \subset X^*$ of zero,

$$\varphi^- (f_1 + f_2) \subseteq \bigcup_{z \in U(f_1, z, \delta)} (\varphi^- f_1(x_1) + \varphi^- f_2(x_2) + V).$$

Replacing $\varphi^-$ by $\partial^-$ in the inclusion, we obtain the definition of weak trustworthy spaces (WT-spaces) [2].

(Other definitions of "trustworthiness" postulating one or another embryonic form of calculus are also possible.)

2. The principal result will be stated below. In the statement we denote by $P$ the property "$X$ is a $P$-space"; $A$ means "Asplund", WA—"weak Asplund", and F-spaces (G-spaces) are characterized by the property: "there exists a Fréchet (locally Lipschitz and Gâteaux) differentiable bump function" (i.e. a function $g(x)$ such that $g(0) > 0$ and $g(x) < 0$ if $||x|| < 1$).

Theorem 1. The following implications are valid:

$$F \Rightarrow T \Rightarrow \Rightarrow A$$

Implications $F \Rightarrow G$, $S \Rightarrow WS$, $A \Rightarrow WA$ are trivial. Implication $S \Rightarrow A$ was actually proved by Ekeland and Lebourg [3]; a much simpler proof can be obtained from Kenderov’s characterization of Asplund spaces [4] which can be equivalently formulated in terms of Fréchet $\epsilon$-subdifferentials: $X$ is an Asplund space iff for any $\epsilon > 0$ every concave continuous function on $X$ is Fréchet $\epsilon$-subdifferentiable on a dense set.

The inclusions Theorem 1 actually announces are $F \Rightarrow T \Rightarrow S$, $G \Rightarrow WT \Rightarrow WS$ and $T \Rightarrow WT$, of which $F \Rightarrow T$ and $G \Rightarrow WT$ are the main. A detailed paper with proofs of Theorem 1 and Theorem 2 will appear in the Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences [5].

There are three questions that remain open: does WS imply WA, does $S$ (WS) imply $T$ (WT) and does $A$ imply $S$? All obviously related to long standing problems: whether any Banach space with a Gâteaux differentiable norm is a WA-space and whether any $A$-space has a Fréchet differentiable norm.

Theorem 2. If $X$ is an $S$-space (WS-space), then so are (a) $X \times \mathbb{R}^n$; (b) any closed subspace of $X$; (c) any quotient space $X/L$ (with closed $L$). In particular, any Banach space which is a continuous image of an $S$-space (WS-space) is an $S$-space (WS-space).

It is also possible to show that a closed subspace of a $T$-space (WT-space) is a $T$-space (WT-space), and that the property of being a $T$- or WT-space is an isomorphic property.

3. The specific class that naturally arises in nonsmooth analysis is the class of WT-spaces. To explain how it happens we have to consider an extended
version of approximate subdifferentials first introduced in [6]. The results of
this section are proved in [2].

We shall call a collection $\mathcal{L}$ of closed subspaces of $X$ admissible if it is a
directed set w.r.t. inclusion and every $x \in X$ belongs to some $L \in \mathcal{L}$. By $f_Q(x)$
we denote the restriction of $f$ to $Q \subset X$, i.e. the function coinciding with $f$
on $Q$ and equal to $\infty$ outside of $Q$.

**Definition 4.** Let $\mathcal{L}$ be an admissible collection of subspaces of $X$. The set

$$\partial \mathcal{L}_A f(z) = \bigcap_{\varepsilon > 0} \left( \bigcup_{x \in U(f,z,\delta)} \partial_{\varepsilon}^f x + L(z) \right)$$

(the bar denotes the weak* closure) is called the (broad) analytic approximate
$L$-subdifferential of $f$ at $z$.

(There are also “narrow” subdifferentials in [2] which we do not consider
here.)

**Theorem 3.** If $f$ is l.s.c., then $\partial \mathcal{L}_A f(z)$ is the same for all admissible families
$\mathcal{L}$ formed by WT-subspaces of $X$.

Thus the notation $\partial \mathcal{L}_A f(z)$ may be used and (since every finite-dimensional
space is a WT-space as follows from Theorem 1) $\partial \mathcal{L}_A f(z)$ coincides with the
“grande sous-différentielles approchées” introduced in [6], hence having the
whole set of analytic properties listed there.

The last theorem we are going to state describes the place of approximate
subdifferentials in nonsmooth analysis. Let us say that we are given a subdif-
fential on $X$ if for any l.s.c. function $f$ and any $x \in X$ a weak* closed (possibly
empty) set $\partial f(x)$ is defined in such a way that:

(a) $0 \in \partial f(x)$ if $f$ attains a local minimum at $x$;
(b) if $f$ is convex, then $\partial f(x)$ is the subdifferential in the sense of convex
analysis;
(c) $\partial (f + g)(x) \subseteq \partial f(x) + \partial g(x)$ if one of the functions is Lipschitz near $x$.

We shall say that $\partial$ is a u.s.c. subdifferential if, in addition, the set-valued
map $x \rightarrow \partial f(x)$ is u.s.c. (from the norm topology of $X$ into the weak* topology
of $X^*$) at every $x$ near which $f$ is Lipschitz. A well-known example of a u.s.c.
subdifferential is the generalized gradient of Clarke; $\partial_A$ is another example.

**Theorem 4.** Let $\partial$ be a u.s.c. subdifferential on $X$. Then $\partial_A f(x) \subseteq \partial f(x)$
whenever $f$ is Lipschitz near $x$.

Thus $\partial_A$ is the minimal subdifferential for Lipschitz functions. We note
in this connection that properties (a)–(c) are very natural for any “good”
subdifferential and the upper semicontinuity property is absolutely unavoid-
able in many situations.

We refer to [2] for further “geometric” approximate subdifferentials coincid-
ing with $\partial_A$ on Lipschitz functions and smaller than $\partial_A$ on all other functions
which have stronger minimality properties.

**References**

1. E. Asplund, *Fréchet differentiability of convex functions*, Acta Math. 121 (1968), 31–47.
2. A. D. Ioffe, *Approximate subdifferentials of nonconvex functions*, Cahier no. 8120, CEREMADE, Univ. Paris-Dauphine 1981, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. (to appear).

3. I. Ekeland and G. Lebourg, *Generic Fréchet differentiability and perturbed optimization problems in Banach spaces*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **224** (1976), 193–216.

4. P. S. Kenderov, *Monotone operators in Asplund spaces*, C. R. Acad. Bulgare Sci. **30** (1977), 963–964.

5. A. D. Ioffe, *On subdifferentiability spaces*, Ann. New York Acad. Sci. **410** (1983), 107–119.

6. **__, Sous-différentielles approchées de fonctions numériques**, C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris **292** (1981), 675–678.

Profsoyuznaya 85, Bldg. 1, Apt. 203 (17279) Moscow, USSR