Radiative Penguin Decays at the B Factories

V. E. Özcan
University College London, WC1E 6BT, United Kingdom

An overview of the measurements of $b \to s\gamma$, $b \to d\gamma$ and $b \to sl\ell$ penguin transitions at the B Factories is presented.

1. Introduction

The flavor-changing neutral current transitions $b \to s$ and $b \to d$ cannot proceed at the tree level in the Standard Model (SM). Radiative decays such as $B \to X_s\gamma$, $B \to X_d\gamma$ and $B \to X_s\ell\ell$ hence proceed primarily via one-loop diagrams known as penguin and box diagrams. Because of this, these processes are rare in the SM, with branching ratios on the order of $10^{-4}$ to $10^{-6}$. However, for the same reason, these channels are very sensitive to new physics beyond the SM.

In the past few years, the B Factory detectors, Belle at the KEKB collider at KEK, Japan and BABAR at the PEP-II collider at SLAC, U.S.A., have recorded a total of more than 0.9 ab$^{-1}$ of data, making it possible to study these decays extensively. Both experiments benefit from high-granularity electromagnetic calorimetry with excellent angular and energy resolution ($\sim 3\%$ for 1 GeV photons), silicon vertex detectors providing position resolution on the order of 100 $\mu$m along the beam axis and $K/\pi$ separation for momenta up to 3-4 GeV. Details of the detectors can be found in references [1].

The relevant theoretical framework for all the decays reviewed in this paper is the operator product expansion (OPE) [2], with which the heavy particles (the gauge bosons and the top quark in the SM) are integrated out to obtain an effective low-energy theory with five quarks. The long-distance contributions are captured in operator matrix elements, whereas the short-distance physics is described by the effective coupling constants, known as Wilson coefficients. Physics beyond the SM can manifest in new operators, or in vastly different values for the Wilson coefficients of the existing operators, compared to the SM predictions.

The OPE framework provides parton-level predictions, so the connection to the experimental observables require further non-perturbative corrections. Form factors, calculations of which introduce significant theoretical uncertainties, are needed to study exclusive final states ($B \to K^+\gamma$, $B \to K\ell\ell$, etc.). On the other hand, for inclusive decays, heavy-quark expansion (HQE) and quark-hadron duality keep non-perturbative corrections under control. This allows more direct interpretations of the measurements of the inclusive decay rates. However, exclusive decays, being experimentally cleaner, are observed earlier and measured with better precision. Ratios of exclusive-decay observables, in which the form-factor corrections partially or completely cancel, can also provide complimentary information to that obtained from inclusive decays.

2. $b \to s\gamma$

2.1. Exclusive $b \to s\gamma$

Since its first observation in the exclusive mode $B \to K^+(892)\gamma$ in 1993 [3], $b \to s\gamma$ has been the most extensively studied radiative penguin process. With the large data samples of the B Factories, many other exclusive modes have since become accessible and so far the branching fractions of nine charged and six neutral final states have been measured at $3\sigma$ or better significance (Fig. 1) [4]. For some of these modes, measurements of the charge asymmetry and the time-dependent $CP$ violation have also been done [5]; the results are so far consistent with the predictions from the SM.

It is worth highlighting a few of the most recent results. The evidence for the first baryonic final state, $B^+ \to p\bar{T}\gamma$, has been reported by the Belle collaboration in 2004 [6]. While this decay has currently the smallest branching fraction ($2.16^{+1.058}_{-0.53} \pm 0.20 \times 10^{-6}$) among all the $b \to s\gamma$ final states measured at $3\sigma$ or better significance, its penguin nature becomes apparent due to the stringent upper limit on the two-body decay $B^+ \to p\bar{T}$ [7].

More recently, the observation by the Belle Collaboration of $B^+ \to K^+_s(1270)\gamma$, the first radiative $B$-meson decay involving an axial-vector resonance, with an unexpectedly high branching fraction ($43 \pm 9 \pm 9 \times 10^{-6}$) has attracted some interest [8]. Inclusive measurements of four different $K\pi\pi\gamma$ final states by the BABAR Collaboration yield similarly high branching fractions [9]. With more statistics, the decays $B \to K^\pi\pi^0\gamma$ will permit the measurement of the photon polarization, which is almost completely left-handed in the SM [10].

Finally, the most recent development in the exclusive $b \to s\gamma$ front is the confirmation by BABAR of Belle’s earlier measurement of the $B \to K\eta\gamma$ decay [11]. Both charged and neutral modes are now es-
established at better than 5σ significance. Additionally, BABAR has also obtained the first upper limits on the decay $B \to K^{*+} \eta$. These upper limits (at 90% C.L.) and the new combined averages for the $K^{*+} \eta$ final states by the Heavy Flavor Averaging Group (HFAG) are given in Eq. 1:

$$
B(B^+ \to K^+ \eta \gamma) = (9.3 \pm 1.1) \times 10^{-6},
$$

$$
B(B^0 \to K^0 \eta \gamma) = (10.3^{+2.3}_{-2.1}) \times 10^{-6},
$$

$$
B(B^+ \to K^{*+} \eta \gamma) < 4.2 \times 10^{-6},
$$

$$
B(B^0 \to K^{0*} \eta \gamma) < 6.6 \times 10^{-6}.
$$

(1)

These measurements will be useful in reducing the systematic uncertainties in the inclusive measurements of $B \to X_s \gamma$, and in searches for higher-mass $K^*$ resonances. Moreover, it is possible to measure time-dependent $CP$ asymmetry in the neutral final states.

2.2. Inclusive $b \to s \gamma$

Inclusive measurement of the $B \to X_s \gamma$ total rate,\(^1\) where $X_s$ refers to any hadronic system with unit strangeness, gives one of the most widely quoted constraints on physics beyond the SM. Additionally, the shape of the photon energy spectrum, which is mostly insensitive to new physics, provides essential input for measuring Cabibbo-Kobayashi-Maskawa (CKM) matrix elements $V_{cb}$ and $V_{ub}$ from semileptonic $B$-meson decays. Therefore, this decay has been measured multiple times using independent techniques.

The current experimental world average reported by HFAG, $3.55 \pm 0.24^{+0.90}_{-1.00} \pm 0.03 \times 10^{-4}$, where the errors are combined statistical and systematic, systematic due to the shape function, and systematic due to the subtraction of $d\gamma$ contribution, incorporates five branching fraction measurements from CLEO, Belle and BABAR Collaborations [4]. All five measurements are in very good agreement with each other and with the SM prediction of $(3.61^{+0.37}_{-0.49}) \times 10^{-4}$, computed at the next-to-leading-log precision [13]. This remarkable agreement implies strong constraints on various models of new physics. For example, in type-II two-Higgs-doublet model, which represents a good approximation for gauge-mediated supersymmetric models with large $\tan \beta$, where the charged Higgs contribution dominates the chargino contribution, the current experimental value implies a minimum charged-Higgs-boson mass of 350 GeV [14].

The moments obtained from the photon energy spectra are consistent among the different measurements and with the HQE predictions based on inputs from the hadron-mass and lepton-energy spectra measured in $B \to X_c \ell \nu$ decays. A fit to all the available data from $B \to X_s \gamma$ and $B \to X_c \ell \nu$ decays has yielded precise values for the HQE parameters $m_b$ and $\mu_{\pi}^2$, as shown in Table I. Further details on the derivation of these parameters and the extraction of $|V_{cb}|$ and $|V_{ub}|$ can be found elsewhere in the FPCP conference proceedings [16].

\(^1\)Both within the theory community and among the experimentalists, the $B \to X_s \gamma$ total rate usually refers to the decay rate for photon energy above 1.6 GeV [12].
3. $b \to d\gamma$

Compared to $b \to s\gamma$, the amplitude for the process $b \to d\gamma$ is suppressed by the ratio of the CKM matrix elements $|V_{td}|/|V_{ts}|$. Therefore it is experimentally more difficult to observe than $b \to s\gamma$: the branching fractions for even the most prominent exclusive final states are expected to be on the order of $10^{-6}$. Furthermore, misidentified $b \to s\gamma$ decays add up to the other substantial backgrounds (mostly high-energy photons produced through $\pi^0/\eta \to \gamma\gamma$ decays or via initial-state radiation in $e^+e^- \to q\bar{q}$ continuum events, where $q = u, d, s, c$) that are common to the measurements of all the radiative penguin decays.

The search for $b \to d\gamma$ has been carried out by CLEO, BABAR and Belle collaborations in one charged ($B^+ \to \rho^+\gamma$) and three neutral ($B^0 \to \rho^0/\omega/\phi \gamma$) exclusive decays. It is customary to combine the charged and neutral $\rho$ and $\omega$ modes using isospin relations to obtain an average branching fraction defined by:

$$B(B \to (\rho/\omega)\gamma) = \frac{1}{2}[B(B^+ \to \rho^+\gamma) + \frac{T_{\rho^0}}{T_{\rho^+}} B(B^0 \to \rho^0\gamma) + B(B^0 \to \omega\gamma)],$$

where $T_{\rho^0}/T_{\rho^+}$ is the ratio of the $B$-meson lifetimes. The branching fractions for each mode from CLEO and BABAR and Belle are listed in Table II. For the $\rho$ and $\omega$ modes, center values are given for comparison, even in the absence of any significant significance. While Belle and BABAR results do not agree well with each other for the decay $B^0 \to \rho^0\gamma$, the clear signal in Belle measurement of this mode gives the first observation of the $b \to d\gamma$ process.

![Figure 2](image_url)

Figure 2 shows the beam-energy constrained mass $M_{bc} = \sqrt{(E_{beam}^*/c^2)^2 - |\vec{p}_B/c|^2}$, and the energy difference $\Delta E = E_B^* - E_{beam}^*$ distributions for the reconstructed $B$-meson candidates. Here, $\vec{p}_B$ and $E_B^*$ are the c.m. momentum and energy of the $B$ candidate, and $E_{beam}^*$ is the c.m. beam energy. The simultaneous fit to all three decay modes, assuming isospin symmetry\(^2\) yields the final result:

$$B(B \to (\rho/\omega)\gamma) = 1.32^{+0.34+0.10}_{-0.31-0.09}.\tag{2}$$

The most recent value of this ratio obtained from the $\Delta m_s$ measurement by the CDF Collaboration is about two standard deviations away from this result [20]. However, it can be argued that the non-penguin contribution to the charged decay mode $B^+ \to \rho^+\gamma$ is significant. If the fit is repeated only with the neutral mode, the new result becomes $|V_{td}|/|V_{ts}| = 0.16 \pm 0.02$.\tag{3}

4. $b \to s\ell\ell$

4.1. Inclusive $b \to s\ell\ell$

In addition to the photon penguin diagram of $b \to s\gamma$, at the lowest-order $b \to s\ell\ell$ process has contributions from two other diagrams in the SM: a weak penguin diagram, where the $Z$-boson replaces the photon and a $W$-box diagram. Because of these contributions, OPE for $b \to s\ell\ell$ has ten operators (not counting the operators that are suppressed by increasing orders of $1/m_W$). The investigation of $b \to s\ell\ell$ can identify the sign of the Wilson coefficient $C_7$ of the photon penguin operator, and can provide the values for the Wilson coefficients $C_9$ and $C_{10}$ of the vector and axial-vector electroweak operators.

The inclusive $b \to s\ell\ell$ rate has been measured by BABAR and Belle, using a sum-of-exclusive-states

---

\(^2\)It should be noted that the individual fit results are in marginal agreement with the isospin relation. From Monte Carlo pseudo-experiments assuming the isospin relation, the authors of the Belle paper find that the probability to observe a deviation equal to or larger than the measurement is 4.9%.
observed exclusive $b \to d\gamma$ decays, they are experimentally cleaner and it is possible to measure ratios and asymmetries in the rates, which can usually be predicted more reliably than the branching fractions.

Table III  

| $q^2$ range | $1 - 6 \text{ GeV}^2$ | $> 4m_{\mu}^2$ |
|-------------|-----------------|----------------|
| BABAR       | $1.8 \pm 0.9$   | $5.6 \pm 2.0$  |
| Belle       | $1.5 \pm 0.6$   | $4.1 \pm 1.1$  |
| Average     | $1.6 \pm 0.5$   | $4.5 \pm 1.0$  |
| SM          | $1.6 \pm 0.2$   | $4.4 \pm 0.7$  |
| $C_7 \to -C_7$ | $3.3 \pm 0.3$   | $8.8 \pm 1.0$  |

4.2. Exclusive $b \to s\ell\ell$  

Two exclusive $b \to s\ell\ell$ decays have been studied extensively at the $B$ Factories: $B \to K\ell\ell$ and $B \to K^*\ell\ell$, where $\ell = e, \mu$. While their branching fractions (Fig. 4) are comparable to the recently

Figure 3: The bound on the $(\bar{\rho}, \bar{\eta})$ plane from the fit to the ratio $B(B \to (\rho/\omega)\gamma)/B(B \to K^\ast \gamma)$ [19].

(semi-inclusive) method. (So far, unlike $b \to s\gamma$, there has not been any fully-inclusive measurements.) The BABAR measurement, based on 82 fb$^{-1}$ of data, reconstructs 10 hadronic final states, whereas the Belle measurement utilizes 140 fb$^{-1}$ of data and reconstructs 18 hadronic final states [21]. The results of these measurements, given as a function of the dilepton mass squared $q^2$, have been compared with the next-to-next-to-leading-log predictions for the two choices of the sign of $C_7$. As listed in Table III, the sign of $C_7$ is quite unlikely to be different from that in the SM [22].

Table III BABAR and Belle measurements for the inclusive branching fraction (in units of $10^{-6}$) of $B \to X_s\ell\ell$ in two ranges of the dilepton invariant mass squared. The weighted average is compared to the predictions in the SM and with reversed sign of $C_7$ [22].

Figure 4: Comparison of Belle [24] and BABAR measurements [25] of the $B \to K\ell\ell$ and $B \to K^*\ell\ell$ branching fractions with two predictions from the SM, using different form factor calculations [23]. (The plot is courtesy of J. Berryhill.)

Figure 5: Forward-backward asymmetry in $B \to K^*\ell\ell$ decays as measured by the Belle Collaboration in five bins of $q^2$ [26]. The fit result for negative $A_7$ solution (solid) is shown along with some alternative choices for the signs and values of the Wilson coefficients; $A_7$ positive case (dashed), $A_{10}$ positive case (dot-dashed), or both $A_7$ and $A_{10}$ positive case.

Of particular interest is the forward-backward asymmetry, $A_{FB}$, defined for the angle of the positively charged lepton with respect to the flight direction of the $B^0$ or $B^+$ meson in the dilepton rest frame. In $B \to K^*\ell\ell$ decay, the SM predicts a distinctive pattern for this quantity as a function of $q^2$, but the presence of new physics can alter its sign and magnitude dramatically. A fit to $A_{FB}$ can be used to extract the sign of $C_7$ and the values of $C_9$ and $C_{10}$.

Figure 5 shows the $A_{FB}$ measurement from the Belle Collaboration, in five bins of $q^2$. The plot also shows the projection of the fit that has been performed.

Note that $B \to K\ell\ell$ is currently the lowest-branching-fraction $B$ decay measured at better than $5\sigma$ significance.
by fixing the value of $A_7$ to its SM value of $-0.330$ and choosing $A_9/A_7$ and $A_{10}/A_7$ as fit parameters, where $A_i$ are the leading terms in $C_i$. Not shown is the alternative fit in which $A_7$ is set to its sign-flipped value. The results of both fits, as given in Table IV, are consistent with the SM predictions. New physics scenarios with positive $A_9 A_{10}$ are excluded at 98.2% confidence.

Table IV The ratios of the Wilson coefficients obtained from the fits to the Belle $A_{FB}$ shape in $B \rightarrow K^* \ell \ell$ decays [26]. Two independent fits have been performed, with the coefficient $A_7$ fixed to either its SM value (negative $A_7$) or fixed to its sign-flipped value. Also listed are the SM predictions for the measured ratios.

|            | SM value | fitted value with $A_7 = -0.33$ | fitted value with $A_7 = +0.33$ |
|------------|----------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| $A_9/A_7$  | -12.3    | $-15.3^{+5.4}_{-4.2} \pm 1.1$  | $-16.3^{+5.7}_{-6.8} \pm 1.4$  |
| $A_{10}/A_7$ | 12.8    | $10.3^{+5.2}_{-3.5} \pm 1.8$  | $11.1^{+6.0}_{-4.9} \pm 2.4$  |

Figure 6 shows the results of the same measurement from the BABAR Collaboration. Similar to the Belle results, the large asymmetry observed in the low-$q^2$ range disfavors new physics scenarios in which the sign of the product $C_9 C_{10}$ is flipped from its SM value. For the low-$q^2$ range, a lower limit on the asymmetry is obtained: $A_{FB} > 0.19\%$ at 95% C.L. It should be noted that the SM prediction for this range is slightly below this lower limit [25].

Figure 6: Forward-backward asymmetry in $B \rightarrow K^* \ell \ell$ decays as measured by the BABAR Collaboration in two bins of $q^2$ [25]. The arrow in the low-$q^2$ bin indicates the allowed region at 95% C.L. The SM prediction (solid) is shown, as are the predictions from $C_7$ sign-flipped (dotted), $C_9 C_{10}$ sign-flipped (dashed) and both $C_7$ and $C_9 C_{10}$ sign-flipped cases.

In addition to the $A_{FB}$, BABAR Collaboration has also measured the fraction of the longitudinal polarization, $F_L$, of $K^*$. $F_L$ is sensitive to left-handed currents with complex phases or to right-handed currents in the photon penguin amplitude. This measurement has the potential for determining the sign of $C_7$ independently; however, the current value is in agreement with both signs. With 1 ab$^{-1}$ of data, wrong-sign $C_7$ could be excluded.

For $B \rightarrow K \ell \ell$, the $A_{FB}$ prediction is zero for all $q^2$, both in the SM and many of its extensions. Measurements from both experiments are consistent with this prediction. In this decay, BABAR has also attempted to extract the fraction of (pseudo-)scalar contribution to the decay amplitude, however with the limited statistics the result is inconclusive. With more data, the developed technique will prove to be useful.

5. Conclusion

Radiative penguins have been one of the cornerstones of the search for new physics in the last decade. While the current measurements have not indicated deviations from the Standard Model, the data collected at the $B$ Factories have significantly improved the experimental precision, putting more and more stringent constraints on the physics beyond the SM. The Wilson coefficients are now experimental observables.

The developed techniques are highly scalable. The measurements summarized in this review utilize only one-fourth to one-half of the data that is already available. Both $B$ Factories continue running with increasing luminosities and the collected data is likely to be doubled before the end of their runs.

In addition to the direct role they play in the search for new physics, radiative penguins also provide highly-valueable auxiliary information. The heavy quark expansion parameters and the shape function derived from inclusive $b \rightarrow s \gamma$ has already been used to reduce the uncertainties in the extraction of $|V_{cb}|$ and $|V_{ub}|$. The measurement of the $b \rightarrow d \gamma$ penguin can be considered like the $\Delta m_s$ of $B$ Factories.

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank the organizers of the conference for an interesting and enjoyable conference, Asoka de Silva for his input on the typesetting of this document, and many colleagues from the BABAR Collaboration for very helpful suggestions during the preparation of the talk.

References

[1] BABAR Collaboration, B. Aubert et al., Nucl. Instrum. Methods A 479, 1 (2002); Belle Collabo-
ration, A. Abashian et al., Nucl. Instrum. Methods A 479, 117 (2002).
[2] T. Hurth, Rev. Mod. Phys. 75, 1159 (2003).
[3] CLEO Collaboration, R. Ammar et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 71, 674 (1993).
[4] E. Barberio et al., hep-ex/0603003; online update at http://www.slac.stanford.edu/xorg/hfag.
[5] Time-dependent CP violation measurements are covered in H. Kakuno’s talk “New Physics Searches at B Factories” at this conference.
[6] Belle Collaboration, K. Abe et al., “Observation of \( B^+ \to p\Lambda\gamma \)”, submitted to ICHEP 2004, Beijing, China, hep-ex/0409009.
[7] Belle Collaboration, M.-C. Chang et al., Phys. Rev. D 71, 072007 (2005).
[8] Belle Collaboration, Phys. Rev. Lett. 94, 111802 (2005) and references therein.
[9] \( \text{BABAR} \) Collaboration, B. Aubert et al., “Measurement of branching fractions and mass spectra of \( B \to K\pi\pi\gamma \)”, contributed to 2005 International Europhysics Conference on High Energy Physics, Lisboa, Portugal, hep-ex/0507031.
[10] M. Gronau et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 88, 051802 (2002); M. Gronau and D. Pirjol, Phys. Rev. D 66, 054008 (2002).
[11] Belle Collaboration, S. Nishida et al., Phys. Lett. B 610, 23 (2005); \( \text{BABAR} \) Collaboration, B. Aubert et al., hep-ex/0603054, submitted to Phys. Rev. Lett.
[12] A.J. Buras and M. Misiak, Acta. Phys. Polon. B33, 2597 (2002).
[13] T. Hurth et al., Nucl. Phys. B 704, 56 (2005).
[14] R. Faccini et al., “\( \text{BABAR} \) Physics Reach”, http://babar-hn.slac.stanford.edu:5090/hn/aux/rfaccini/physReach/2dhmodel.html.
[15] O. Buchmüller and H. Flächer, Phys. Rev. D 73, 073008 (2006).
[16] E. Barberio, “Inclusive semileptonic B decays”, contributed to Flavor Physics and CP Violation 2006 conference, hep-ex/0605098.
[17] Belle Collaboration, K. Abe et al., hep-ex/0506079, submitted to Phys. Rev. Lett.
[18] \( \text{BABAR} \) Collaboration, B. Aubert et al., Phys. Rev. D 72, 091103 (2005); Phys. Rev. Lett. 94, 011801 (2005).
[19] UTfit Collaboration, M. Bona et al., http://utfit.roma1.infn.it/btovg/ckm-btovg.html.
This fit makes use of recently improved Light-Cone-Sum-Rules calculations of P. Ball and R. Zwicky, JHEP 0604, 046 (2006).
[20] Talk by Guillelmo Gomez-Ceballos, “Update on CDF \( B_s \) Mixing”, at this conference.
[21] \( \text{BABAR} \) Collaboration, B. Aubert et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 93, 081802 (2004); Belle Collaboration, M. Iwasaki et al., Phys. Rev. D 72, 092005 (2005).
[22] P. Gambino, U. Haisch and M. Misiak, Phys. Rev. Lett. 94, 061803 (2005).
[23] A. Ali et al., Phys. Rev. D 66, 034002 (2002); M. Zhong, Y.L. Wu, and W.Y. Wang, Int. J. Mod. Phys. A 18, 1959 (2003).
[24] Belle Collaboration, K. Abe et al., “Measurement of the Differential \( q^2 \) Spectrum and Forward-Backward Asymmetry for \( B \to K^{(*)}\ell^+\ell^- \)”, contributed to Flavor Physics and CP Violation 2004 conference, Dauglu, Korea, hep-ex/0410006.
[25] \( \text{BABAR} \) Collaboration, B. Aubert et al., Phys. Rev. D 73, 092001 (2006).
[26] Belle Collaboration, A. Ishikata et al., hep-ex/0603018, submitted to Phys. Rev. Lett.