Expression Atlas update—an integrated database of gene and protein expression in humans, animals and plants

Robert Petryszak¹,*, Maria Keays¹, Y. Amy Tang¹, Nuno A. Fonseca¹, Elisabet Barrera¹, Tony Burdett¹, Anja Füllegrabe¹, Alfonso Muñoz-Pomer Fuentes¹, Simon Jupp¹, Satu Koskinen¹, Oliver Mannion¹, Laura Huerta¹, Karine Megy¹, Catherine Snow¹, Eleanor Williams¹, Mitra Barzine¹, Emma Hastings¹, Hendrik Weisser², James Wright², Pankaj Jaiswal³, Wolfgang Huber¹, Jyoti Choudhary², Helen E. Parkinson¹ and Alvis Brazma¹

¹European Molecular Biology Laboratory, European Bioinformatics Institute, EMBL-EBI, Hinxton, UK, ²Welcome Trust Sanger Institute, Hinxton, UK and ³Oregon State University, Corvallis, USA

Received September 04, 2015; Revised September 25, 2015; Accepted September 29, 2015

ABSTRACT

Expression Atlas (http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa) provides information about gene and protein expression in animal and plant samples of different cell types, organism parts, developmental stages, diseases and other conditions. It consists of selected microarray and RNA-sequencing studies from ArrayExpress, which have been manually curated, annotated with ontology terms, checked for high quality and processed using standardised analysis methods. Since the last update, Atlas has grown seven-fold (1572 studies as of August 2015), and incorporates baseline expression profiles of tissues from Human Protein Atlas, GTEx and FANTOM5, and of cancer cell lines from ENCODE, CCLE and Genentech projects. Plant studies constitute a quarter of Atlas data. For genes of interest, the user can view baseline expression in tissues, and differential expression for biologically meaningful pairwise comparisons—estimated using consistent methodology across all of Atlas. Our first proteomics study in human tissues is now displayed alongside transcriptomics data in the same tissues. Novel analyses and visualisations include: ‘enrichment’ in each differential comparison of GO terms, Reactome, Plant Reactome pathways and InterPro domains; hierarchical clustering (by baseline expression) of most variable genes and experimental conditions; and, for a given gene-condition, distribution of baseline expression across biological replicates.

INTRODUCTION

Expression Atlas (2) is a further development of its predecessor, Gene Expression Atlas (1) launched by the European Bioinformatics Institute (EMBL-EBI) in 2008, and continues its original remit as a value-added database for querying gene expression across tissues, cell types and cell lines under various biological conditions. These include developmental stages, physiological states, phenotypes and diseases, and covers nearly 30 organisms including metazoans and plants. Expression Atlas is developed with a view to accommodating data from multi-omics experiments; the first proteomics data set has been included in 2015.

High-quality microarray and RNA-sequencing (RNA-seq) data in Expression Atlas continue to come from ArrayExpress (3), which also includes data imported from NCBI’s Gene Expression Omnibus (GEO) (4). Expression is reported for both coding and non-coding transcripts. The sample attributes and experimental variables are carefully curated, systematized and mapped to the Experimental Factor Ontology (EFO (5)) for efficient search via ontology-driven query expansion, and to facilitate data integration with other resources.

Expression Atlas consists of two components—(i) a large baseline expression component (http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/baseline/experiments), reporting transcript abundance estimates for each gene in healthy or untreated tissues, cell types or cellular components from carefully selected large RNA-seq experiments and (ii) information about the changes

*To whom correspondence should be addressed. Tel: +44 0 1223 492 696; Fax: +44 0 1223 494 468; Email: rpetry@ebi.ac.uk

Present address: Robert Petryszak, Functional Genomics, European Bioinformatics Institute EMBL, Hinxton, Cambridge, CB10 1SD, UK.

© The Author(s) 2015. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of Nucleic Acids Research. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted reuse, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.
RESULTS

Data

At the time of writing, Expression Atlas contains highly curated data from 1572 studies (69239 assays), incorporating RNA-seq based baseline expression (http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/baseline/experiments, 36376 assays) in tissues from Human Protein Atlas (http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/experiments/E-MTAB-2836), GTEx (http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/experiments/E-MTAB-2919), FANTOM5 (10, http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/experiments/E-MTAB-3358), in cancer cell lines from ENCODE (9, http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/experiments/E-GEOD-26284), Cancer Cell Line Encyclopaedia (CCLE, 11, http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/experiments/E-MTAB-2706) and Genentech (12, http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/experiments/E-MTAB-2706) projects, as well as differential expression for manually curated comparisons (4287 as of August 2015). Table 1 shows the top 15 organisms in Atlas with the highest number of studies. Examples of plant data in Atlas include several studies of rice salt stress, for example Figure 4 shows rice auxin efflux (PIN) and auxin influx (AUX) gene family members participating in Auxin (IAA) transport pathway in a plant cell.

Annotations reported by expression studies may become defunct due to addition of new transcribed loci or dropping invalid entries in updated genomic references. To address this, Atlas release cycle is synchronised with that of Ensembl (21), Ensembl Genomes (22) (including Ensembl Plants) and the Gramene (23) databases, guaranteeing the latest gene annotations, microarray probe-set mappings and genomic references. For each new genome assembly, all RNA-seq data in Atlas in the corresponding organism are reprocessed to match the most current version of the reference genome. Recent examples of using Expression Atlas data for novel research include, for example, references (26–28).

Analysis

Since the last update, we have adopted TopHat2 (17) and HTSeq (15) for genome reference alignment and gene expression quantification respectively, for all RNA-seq experiments in Atlas. We have currently suspended reporting baseline expression for splice variants for several reasons—first, uncertainty about the reliability of the methods currently available (29), second, careful research has shown that for most genes in most conditions there is one dominant isoform expressed (20), and finally because of the high computational requirements.

Expression Atlas continues to analyse and report statistically significant differential gene expression in manually curated differential pairwise comparisons between two sets of biological replicates—the ‘reference’ (e.g. ‘healthy’ or ‘wild type’) set and a ‘test’ set (e.g. ‘diseased’ or ‘mutant’). The differential analysis is now performed using DESeq2 (18) with independent filtering (19). Since the last update we have also included parameterization of additional factors and blocking effects where possible, thus eliminating technical sources of variation and boosting statistical power in studies with heterogeneous sample sets. Consequently, we were able to load into Atlas 50 new studies, including clinical ones containing detailed patient histories.

Users now have more tools at their disposal to assess the accuracy of expression data reported by Atlas: (i) the number of biological replicates is now reported for a given baseline condition, or on either side of a differential comparison; (ii) for a given baseline condition, quantile normalization is used to make distributions of expressions in each
Figure 1. Baseline expression for human REG1B gene, corroborating high level of expression in pancreas across studies: FANTOM5, GTEx, Human Protein Atlas and a Proteomics study: a draft map of the human proteome, in http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/genes/ENSG00000172023. The unit used for reporting expression in RNA-seq studies is FPKM, and in the proteomics study—the ‘within sample abundance’. ‘NA’ means that the tissue was not assayed in a given study.

Figure 2. Top 10 Reactome pathways enriched in the set of genes differentially expressed in the comparison of ‘interferon gamma; ankylosing spondylitis’ versus ‘none; ankylosing spondylitis’ in http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/experiments/E-GEOD-11886. Two distinct groups of pathways with are visible, with thicker edges between the pathways corresponding to the greater number of shared genes, and the pathways with the highest enrichment effect size (odds-ratio) shown in red.
Table 1. Top 15 organisms in Atlas—by the number of studies

| Organism                                | Number of differential studies | Number of baseline studies |
|------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Mus musculus                            | 496                            | 10                        |
| Homo sapiens                            | 477                            | 8                         |
| Arabidopsis thaliana                    | 341                            | 1                         |
| Drosophila melanogaster                 | 63                             | 0                         |
| Rattus norvegicus                       | 57                             | 2                         |
| Saccharomyces cerevisiae                | 19                             | 0                         |
| Oryza sativa Japonica Group             | 16                             | 2                         |
| Caenorhabditis elegans                  | 11                             | 2                         |
| Gallus gallus                           | 9                              | 2                         |
| Zea mays                                | 9                              | 0                         |
| Sus scrofa                              | 7                              | 0                         |
| Danio rerio                             | 6                              | 0                         |
| Vitis vinifera                          | 5                              | 0                         |
| Bos taurus                              | 4                              | 2                         |
| Oryza sativa Indica Group               | 4                              | 0                         |
| Others                                  | 11                             | 8                         |

Figure 3. Variance of baseline expression across biological replicates in each tissue for rice gene GOS9: http://www.ebi.ac.uk/gxa/experiments/E-MTAB-2037?geneQuery = GOS9 (Please check the ‘Display variance’ radio button to see the box plots).
biological replicate the same—prior to averaging gene expression levels across biological replicates; (iii) for a given gene-condition, users can view a box plot of variability of baseline expression across biological replicates, providing them with an impression of how representative the reported median expression level is.

Expression Atlas remains committed to the stringent quality control of raw experimental data and design, reported in the previous update. Since then we have automated quality control of RNA-seq data, that involves exclusion of corrupted FASTQ files and those with an insufficient number of reads after filtering for poor quality and contamination. As in the case of microarray outlier array removal, removing poor quality data files may lead to the exclusion of affected differential comparisons, baseline conditions or even whole experiments from Atlas.

The proteomics data analysis methods are described in the Human Proteome Label Free Analysis section of the supporting material.

New user interface features

Expression Atlas search interface allows for querying one or more genes or proteins from a selected species. The user can also add search filters for sample attributes and experimental factors, taking full advantage of ontology-driven query expansion. For example, searching for disease lymphoma will return expression data from samples of not only lymphoma itself, but also from its subtypes and closely related diseases, e.g. Hodgkin’s lymphoma or acute myelogenic leukemia. Using the same interface, both baseline and differential components of Expression Atlas are queried by default. The Atlas interface displays search results from all tissues and all baseline studies making it possible to find...
patterns of expression across a wide variety of studies (Figure 1). We are working to extend this functionality to other types of experimental conditions for which Atlas has wealth of baseline expression data, e.g. cell lines, as well as to comparative views of expression, highlighting common tissue expression patterns for orthologues—across all available baseline data sets. The interface also showcases more detailed anatomical images, in which tissues with reported expression are highlighted. This now includes a separate brain diagram for human and mouse, as well as ‘whole plant’ and ‘flower parts’ diagrams for plant experiments.

Various novel analyses and visualisations have been implemented in Atlas. For example, the overlap between the set of differentially expressed genes in each Atlas comparison, and Reactome and Plant Reactome pathways, GO terms and InterPro domains is now assessed using Fisher’s test with multiple testing correction (16). The resulting pathways, terms or domains that are ‘enriched’ in a given comparison are shown in network-style visualisations, including the effect size (Figure 2). For each baseline study, a visualisation of hierarchical clustering between the 100 most variable genes and experimental conditions is also shown. Finally, for a given gene-condition, the user can view a box plot of variability of baseline expression across biological replicates (Figure 3).

Expression data from Atlas are now viewable as tracks on Ensembl, Ensembl Genomes and Gramene genome browsers. Baseline expression data from Atlas are also automatically included in Ensembl, Ensembl Genomes, Gramene Ensembl Plants, Reactome and Plant Reactome, via javascript-based widgets. The widgets are easily accessible (https://github.com/gxa/atlas/blob/master/web/src/main/javascript/heatmap/README.md) and can be integrated in any third-party site, provided the bioentity identifiers match those of the Atlas.

FUTURE DIRECTIONS
New RNA-seq studies
We plan to include in Atlas the latest data from ENCODE, GTEx version 5, Blueprint (http://dcc.blueprint-epigenome.eu/), NIH Epigenomic Roadmap (13) and HipSci (http://www.hipsci.org/).

Protein expression
A number of new proteomics studies will be loaded into Atlas in the near future.

On-the-fly gene set ‘enrichment’
Users will be able to perform on-the-fly overlap analysis between their provided set of genes and differentially expressed gene sets in each comparison in Atlas, resulting in a (sorted by effect size) list of comparisons in which the user provided gene set is ‘enriched’.

Gene co-expression
For a given gene within a single study, we will enable the user to find other genes of similar expression profile across experimental conditions or differential comparisons.

Expression of orthologues
We plan to make available baseline expression of orthologues in tissues.

Quantification of expression of exons and splice-variants
We plan to provide exon quantifications for all RNA-seq experiments. We will also re-visit the topic of splice-variant expression quantification by benchmarking several splice-variant expression quantification methods (namely, Kallisto and RSEM (14)), with the plan to bring splice-variant quantification back into Atlas once the computational and accuracy issues are resolved satisfactorily.

Analysis and visualisation of single-cell RNA-seq data
We plan to extend our analysis pipelines and visualisation methods to adequately annotate, quality control and visualise gene expression data from single-cell RNA-seq studies.

Handling of blocking effects in baseline Atlas
We plan to enable handling of additional factors or blocking effects for baseline expression in the near future.

Atlas data in R
We plan to make baseline expression data available for download as R objects. We will also create an R package in Bioconductor (24) for accessing all Atlas data.

We are always listening to the feedback from our users, and the future plans will be adjusted according to the user requirements.

SUPPLEMENTARY DATA
Supplementary Data are available at NAR Online.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
We would like to thank James Malone, Sirarat Sarntivijai, Drashti Vasant and Catherine Leroy for their assistance in enriching EFO in terms needed to describe samples studied in Atlas, Nikolay Kolesnikov, Ahmed Ali for their help with the ArrayExpress interface and assistance in submissions of new functional genomics studies to ArrayExpress, Adam Frankish, Jennifer Harrow and Barbara Uszcynska for their collaboration on splice variant expression quantification, Sebastien Passeat for his help on improving the Atlas user interface, Jana Eliasova for creating outstanding anatomical tissue visualisations for baseline Atlas, Marc Rosello for his help in handling sequencing submissions into ArrayExpress and European Nucleotide Archive, our colleagues in Ensembl Genomes for the development of novel visualisation of differential expression tracks from Atlas. We would also like to extend our thanks to Antonio Fabregat Mundo in Reactome, Justin Preece in Plant Reactome as well as our colleagues in Ensembl for incorporating Atlas tissue expression widget in their resources, to Samuel Fox and Matthew Geniza from Oregon State University for their help with plant data sets, and to...
Bernd Klaus from EMBL Statistics centre for his invaluable advice. We would also like to express gratitude to Ian Dunham, Jessica Vamathevan, Samiul Hassan, Nikiforos Karmanis, Miguel Pignatelli and Andrea Pierleoni and from the Centre for Therapeutic Target Validation project for their feedback and guidance on Atlas user interface and data.

FUNDING
European Molecular Biology Laboratory (EMBL) member states; National Science Foundation of USA grant to Gramene database [NSF IOS 1127112]; European Community’s FP7 EurocanPlatform [260791]; BBSC [BB/M018458/1]; CTTV; NHGRI, NHLBI; NIH Common Fund [U54-HG004028]; Wellcome Trust [WT098051]. Funding for open access charge: EMBL.

Conflict of interest statement. None declared.

REFERENCES
1. Kapushesky, M., Adamusiak, T., Burdett, T., Culhane, A., Farne, A., Filippov, A., Holloway, E., Klebanov, A., Kryvyckh, N., Kurbatova, N. et al. (2012) Gene Expression Atlas update—a value-added database of microarray and sequencing-based functional genomics experiments. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 40, D1077–D1081.
2. Petryszak, R., Burdett, T., Fiorelli, B., Fonseca, A. N., Gonzalez-Porta, M., Hasting, E., Huber, W., Jupp, S., Keays, M., Kryvyckh, N. et al. (2014) Expression Atlas update—a database of gene and transcript expression from microarray and sequencing-based functional genomics experiments. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 42, D926–D932.
3. Rustici, G., Kolesnikov, N., Brandizi, M., Burdett, T., Dylag, M., Emmam, I., Farne, A., Hasting, E., Ison, J., Keays, M. et al. (2013) ArrayExpress update—trends in database growth and links to data analysis tools. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 41, D987–D990.
4. Barrett, T., Wilhite, S.E., Ledoux, P., Evangelista, C., Kim, I.F., Tomashasky, M., Marshall, K.A., Phillips, K.H., Sherman, P.M., Hollok, M. et al. (2013) NCBI GEO: archive for functional genomics data sets–update. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 41, D991–D995.
5. Malone, J., Holloway, E., Adamusiak, T., Kapushesky, M., Zheng, J., Kolesnikov, N., Zhukova, A., Brahma, A. and Parkinsson, H. (2010) Modeling sample variables with an Experimental Factor Ontology. *Bioinformatics*, 26, 1112–1118.
6. Vizcaíno, J.A., Côté, R.G., Csordas, A., Díaz-A., Fabregat, A., Foster, P.M., Griss, J., Alpi, E., Birim, M., Contell, J. et al. (2011) The Proteomics Identifiers (PRIDE) database and associated tools: status in 2013. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 41, D1063–D1069.
7. Lonsdale, J., Thomas, J., Salvatore, M., Phillips, R., Lo, E., Shad, S., Hasz, R., Walters, G., Garcia, F., Young, N. et al. (2013) The Genotype-Tissue Expression (GTex) project. *Nat. Genet.*, 45, 580–585.
8. Uhlen, M., Fagerberg, L., Hallström, B. M., Lindskog, C., Oksvold, P., Mardinoglu, A., Sivertsson, A., Kampf, C., Šojstr ödt, E., Asplund, A. et al. (2015) Tissue-based map of the human proteome. *Science*, 347, doi:10.1126/science.1260419.
9. Shahab, A., Skancke, J., Suzuki, A. M., Takahashi, H., Tilgner, H., Trout, D., Walters, N., Wang, H., Wrobel, J., Yu, Y. et al. (2012) Landscape of transcription in human cells. *Nature*, 489, 101–108.
10. The FANTOM Consortium and the RIKEN PMI and CLST (DGT) (2014). A promoter-level mammalian expression atlas. *Nature*, 507, 462–470.
11. Djebari, S., Davis, C. A., Merkel, A., Dobin, A., Lassmann, T., Mortazavi, A., Tanzer, A., Lagarde, J., Lin, W., Schlesinger, F. et al. (2012) The Cancer Cell Line Encyclopedia enables predictive modelling of anticancer drug sensitivity. *Nature*, 483, 307–603.
12. Klijn, C., Duijnhof, S., Swarski, E. W., Hervy, P. M., Jiang, Z., Liu, H., Degenhardt, J., Mayba, O., Gnaud, F., Liu, J. et al. (2015) A comprehensive transcriptional portrait of human cancer cell lines. *Nat. Biotechnol.*, 33, 306–312.
13. Lister, R., Pelizzola, M., Kida, Y. S., Hawkins, R. D., Nery, J. R., Hon, G., Antosiewicz-Bourget, J., O’Malley, R., Castanon, R., Klugman, S. et al. (2011) Hotspots of aberrant epigenomic reprogramming in human induced pluripotent stem cells. *Nature*, 471, 68–73.
14. Dewey, C., Koll, N., Li, B. (2011) RSEM: accurate transcript quantification from RNA-Seq data with or without a reference genome. *BMC Bioinformatics*, 12, 323.
15. Anders, S., Pyl, P.T., and Huber, W. (2014) HTSeq — A Python framework to work with high-throughput sequencing data. *Bioinformatics*, 31, 166–169.
16. Varemo, L., Niens, J., and Nookaew, I. (2013) Enriching the gene set analysis of genome-wide data by incorporating directionality of gene expression and combining statistical hypotheses and methods. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 41, 4378–4391.
17. Kim, D., Pertea, G., Trapnell, C., Pimentel, H., Kelley, R., and Salzberg, S.L. (2013) TopHat2: accurate alignment of transcriptomes in the presence of insertions, deletions and gene fusions. *Genome Biol.*, 14, R36.
18. Love, M.I., Huber, W., and Anders, S. (2014) Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. *Genome Biol.*, 15, 550.
19. Bourgon, R., Gentleman, R., and Huber, W. (2010) Independent filtering increases detection power for high-throughput experiments. *PNAS*, 107, 9546–9551.
20. González-Porta, M., Frankish, A., Rung, J., Harrow, J. and Brazma, A. (2013). Transcription analysis of human tissues and cell lines reveals one dominant transcript per gene. *Genome Biol.*, 14, R70.
21. Cunningham, F., Amode, M. R., Barrett, D., Beal, K., Billis, K., Brent, S., Carvalho-Silva, D., Clapham, P., Coates, G., Fitzgerald, S. et al. (2015) Ensembl 2015. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 43, D662–D669.
22. Kersey, P.J., Lescot, M., Lipman, D.J., Lenz, I., Li, D., Oasis, S., Schlicke, S., Sonnhammer, E.L., Buetow, K.H., and Birney, E. (2010) Ensembl 2010. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 38, D611–D618.
23. Monaco, M.K., Stein, J., Natohi, S., Wells, S.I., Dharmawardhana, P., Kumari, S., Amarasinghe, V., Vouen, C., Thomas, J., Pretece, J. et al. (2013) Grumene 2013: comparative plant genomics resources. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 42, D1193–D1199.
24. Huber, W., Carey, V., Gentleman, R., Anders, S., Dagen, S., Carlson, M., Carvalho, B., Bravo, H., Davis, S., Gatto, L., Gericke, T. et al. (2015). Orchestrating high-throughput genomic analysis with Bioconductor. *Nat. Methods*, 12, 115–121.
25. Kim, M., Pinto, M.S., Getnet, D., Nijrugi, R.S., Manda, S.S., Chakravarti, R., Madugundu, A. S., Kellhar, D.S., Isserlin, R., Jain, S. et al. (2014) A draft map of the human proteome. *Nature*, 509, 575–581.
26. Navarini, A.A., Simpson, M.A., Weale, M., Knight, J., Carvalio, J., Reiniche, P., Burden, D.A., Layton, A., Barielle, V., Allen, M. et al. (2014) Genome-wide association study identifies three novel susceptibility loci for severe ACS vulgaris. *Nat. Communications*, 5, 4020.
27. Villar, D., Berthelot, C., Aldridge, S., Rayner, T.F., Lukk, M., Pignatelli, M., Park, T.J., Devalle, R., Erichsen, J.T., Jasinska, A.J. et al. (2015) Enhancer evolution across 20 mammalian species. *Cell*, 160, 554–66.
28. Wilson, G.A., Butcher, L. M., Foster, H.R., Feber, A., Roos, C., Walter, L., Goswzegz, G., Beck, S., and Bell, C.G. (2014) Human-specific epigenetic variation in the immunological leukotriene B4 Receptor (LTB4R/B1L) implicated in common inflammatory diseases. *Genome Med.*, 6, 19.
29. Hayer, K., Pizzaro, A., Lahens, N.L., Hogenesch, J.B. and Grant, G.R. (2015) Benchmark Analysis of Algorithms for Determining and Quantifying Full-length mRNA Splice Forms from RNA-Seq. *Bioinformatics*, doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/btv488.