Abstracts

Articles

Treaty Interpretation and Constitutional Transformation: Informal Change in International Organizations
Julian Arato 289

This Article presents an argument about the constitutional transformation of international organizations through the judicial interpretation of their constituent instruments. The organizations at issue are public institutions, established by international agreement and charged with the exercise of transnational governmental power. They are, on one view, essentially treaty-based organizations that derive authority from the consent of the Parties. At the same time, these organizations must be understood as constitutional bodies, constituted with substantial delegated powers and varying degrees of independence vis-à-vis their constituent Member States. Some have developed the capacity to evolve over time, informally and autonomously. I argue that the judicial organs of certain organizations have transformed their material constitutions by engaging in particularly liberal approaches to the interpretation of their constituent instruments.

The analysis focuses on one particular technique of interpretation: the doctrine of interpretation on basis of the subsequent practice of the States Parties. I trace the use of this doctrine by three judicial bodies: the World Trade Organization Appellate Body, the International Court of Justice (ICJ), and the European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR). The first organ represents a control, implementing a strict approach to subsequent practice. By contrast, I suggest that the ICJ and ECtHR have each adopted radically expansive approaches to subsequent practice, with the effect of transforming the powers and autonomy of the organizations to which they belong.

Interpretation Catalysts and Executive Branch Legal Decisionmaking
Rebecca Ingber 359

Recent years have seen much speculation over executive branch legal interpretation and internal decisionmaking, particularly in matters of national security and international law. Debate persists over how and why the executive arrives at
particular understandings of its legal constraints, the extent to which the positions taken by one presidential administration may bind the next, and, indeed, the extent to which the President is constrained by law at all. Current scholarship focuses on rational, political, and structural arguments to explain executive actions and legal positioning, but it has yet to take account of the diverse ways in which legal questions arise for the executive branch, which have a significant effect on executive decisionmaking.

This Article adds necessary texture to these debates by identifying and exploring the role of distinct triggers for legal interpretation—which this Article terms “interpretation catalysts”—in driving and shaping executive branch decisionmaking, particularly at the intersection of national security and international law. Interpretation catalysts impel the executive to consider, crystallize and potentially assert a legal interpretation of its obligations under domestic or international law on a particular matter, and they can both impede and facilitate change within the executive. Examples of interpretation catalysts include such diverse triggering events as decisions regarding whether to use force against an armed group; lawsuits filed against the U.S. government; obligatory reports to human rights treaty bodies; and even the act of speechmaking. Each of these unique catalysts triggers a distinct process for legal decisionmaking within the executive, and is instrumental in framing the task at hand, shaping the process engaged to arrive at the substantive decision, establishing the relative influence of the actors who will decide the matter, and informing the contextual pressures and interests that may bear on the decision—thus shaping the ultimate substantive position itself. These distinct mechanisms for decisionmaking each carry their own individual pressures and biases. By laying bare the interpretation catalyst phenomenon, this Article demonstrates potential avenues for actors within and external to the executive branch to predict, to explain, and to affect executive decisionmaking. This Article will explore the effect of interpretation catalysts on executive legal interpretation, and address some of the implications of this phenomenon for scholars, private actors, courts, and executive branch officials.

The Judicial Role in New Democracies: A Strategic Account of Comparative Citation

Johanna Kalb

The United States Supreme Court has come under fire in recent years for its occasional references to foreign and international law. Critics suggest that the practice is undemocratic, displacing democratically developed norms for those of the international community. This Article challenges this critique via reference to the comparative citation practice of successful judiciaries in new democracies around the world. When institutional failures and international pressures threaten the democratic accountability of elected institutions, as they do in most countries in political transition, jurists may strategically use foreign and international law as a tool of “diagonal accountability” to mediate between domestic and international actors in ways that build the legitimacy of national political institutions and create space for democratic deliberations to occur. Thus, contrary to the dominant critique, this Article suggests that when democratic legitimacy is challenged, comparative citation can be part of the solution, rather than part of the problem. Moreover, given the important work that comparative citation can do in transitional regimes, labeling it as undemocratic can itself undermine institutional legitimacy, particularly in new or weak democracies.
As violence in Mexico has escalated in recent years, many have argued that its metaphorical drug "war" is starting to look more like a de jure armed conflict. This Note maintains that, although a new approach is desperately needed, the proverbial "war" on drugs should be limited to metaphors, and the criminal law framework should be retained. This Note rejects reclassifying the confrontation between Mexico and the drug cartels as a non-international armed conflict (NIAC) under the laws of war because: (1) it fails to meet the criteria of a NIAC set forth by the relevant legal instruments and judicial decisions; and (2) the potential consequences of an armed conflict designation in terms of the lawful use of deadly force, prolonged detention, and unfettered prosecution powers would further exacerbate the problems that Mexico is facing. Instead, Mexico continues to confront a criminal problem, albeit one of extraordinary proportions. The Note concludes by providing a set of recommendations focused on empowering law enforcement, reforming Mexico's institutions, and strengthening the rule of law.
Visiting Lecturers in Law

Daniel Kevel, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (full term)  
Alvin Kriss Kleierw, M.A., Ph.D., John Thomas Smith Professor of Law and Professor of Economics

Harold Hongiu Koh, A.B., J.D., Martin R. Flack ’55 Professor of International Law

Anthony Townsend Kronman, J.D., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law

Douglas Kysar, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean and Joseph M. Field ’35 Professor of Law

Mark LaFreniere, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

John H. Langbein, LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law and Legal History

Josie Levin, Ph.D., M.F.A., Visiting Associate Professor of Law (spring term)

Vair Liislik, Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law

Carol L. Luehr, M.S.W., J.D., Clinical Emeritus Professor of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Jonathan R. Macey, A.B., J.D., Sum Nava Professor of Corporate Law, Corporate Finance, and Securities Law

Lehi M. Mirescu Pensa Madanu, Lic. en Derecho (J.D.), Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (full term)

Chibbi Mallat, LLM., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Oscar M. Ruebhausen Distinguished Senior Fellow (full term)

Joseph C. Manning, A.M., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (full term)

David Marcus, B.A., J.D., Maurice R. Greenberg Visiting Professor of Law

Daniel Markovitz, D.Phil., J.D., Guido Calabresi Professor of Law

Jeri Louis Mathew, LL.B., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law (full term)

Braxton McKee, M.D., Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (full term)

Tracy L. Moore, B.S., J.D., Wulam Hale Hamilton Professor of Law

Noah Minning, B.A., J.D., Lecturer in the Practice of Law and Legal Writing

Jeffrey A. Meyer, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law

Alan Miller, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Kathleen B. Overby, J.D., Ed.D., Associate Dean

Nicholas Parrillo, M.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law

Jean Koh Peters, A.B., J.D., Sol Goldman Clinical Professor of Law and Supervising Attorney

Theonas Pogge, Dipl. in Soziologie, Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Robert C. Post, J.D., Ph.D., Dean and Sal & Lillian Goldman Professor of Law

J.L. Pottinger, Jr., A.B., J.D., Nathan Bokley Baker Clinical Professor of Law and Supervising Attorney

Caitie Priest, J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law

George L. Priest, B.A., J.D., Edward J. Phelps Professor of Law and Economics and Kaufman Distinguished Research Scholar in Law, Economics, and Entrepreneurship

Asa Rangappa, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean

William Michael Reisman, B.A., J.S.D., Myron S. McDougall Professor of International Law

Judith Renkut, B.A., J.D., Arthur Liman Professor of Law

Roberta Romano, M.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law

Carol M. Rose, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor Emeritus of Law and Organizational and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Susan Rose-Ackerman, B.A., J.D., Henry R. Luce Professor of Jurisprudence (Law School and Department of Political Science)

Ted Rubenfield, A.B., J.D., Robert R. Slaughter Professor of Law

Jennifer Rah Rurig, M.Sc., Ph.D., Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

William M. Sage, M.D., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)

Peter H. Schuck, M.A., J.D., LL.M., Simeon E. Baldwin Professor Emeritus and Professor (Adjunct) of Law (full term)

Vicki Soschitz, B.A., J.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Law and Social Sciences

Alan Schwartz, B.S., LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law

Ian Shapiro, Ph.D., J.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Scott J. Shapiro, J.D., Ph.D., Charles F. Soulewod Professor of Law and Professor of Philosophy

Robert J. Shiller, S.M., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Reva Siegel, M.Phil., J.D., Nicholas S. E. Katsenbach Professor of Law

Norman I. Silver, M.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law

James J. Silk, M.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law

John G. Simon, L.L.B., L.L.D., Augustus E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law

Richard Squint, M.B.A., J.D., Florence Regosz Visiting Professor of Law

Stephanie M. Stern, B.A., J.D., Irving S. Rubinoff Visiting Associate Professor of Law (full term)

Richard B. Stewart, M.A., L.L.B., Visiting Professor of Law (full term)

Kate Sich, M.P.P., J.D., Lafayette S. Foster Professor of Law

Alex Stone Sweat, M.A., Ph.D., Leiner Professor of International Law, Politics, and International Studies

Mike K. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Tian R. Tyler, M.A., Ph.D., Macklin Fleming Professor of Law and Professor of Psychology

Patrick Weil, M.B.A., Ph.D., Maurice R. Greenberg Visiting Professor of Law (full term)

James Q. Whitman, J.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Comparative and Foreign Law

Abraham L. Witekgein, J.D., Ph.D., Florence Regosz Visiting Professor of Law

Lucius Wildhaber, L.L.M., J.S.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Gruber Global Constitutionalism Fellow (full term)

Ralph Earl Winter, Jr., M.A., L.L.B., Professor (Adjunct) of Law

Michael J. Wistawe, B.A., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor of Law

John Fabian Witt, J.D., Ph.D., Allen H. Duff Class of 1960 Professor of Law

Stephen Wizner, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Gideon Yaffe, A.B., Ph.D., Professor of Law and Professor of Philosophy

Howard V. Zinnas, B.A., M.D., Professor of Psychiatry and Clinical Professor (Adjunct) of Law

Lecturers in Law

Emily Bazelo, B.A., J.D.

Cynthia Carr, J.D., J.L.M.

Adam S. Cohen, A.B., J.D.

Linda Greenhouse, B.A., M.S.L., Joseph Goldstein Lecturer in Law

Adam Gregg, M.Phil., J.D.

Lucas Gutengen, A.B., J.D.

Janus P. Horvitz, M.A., J.D.

Margot E. Kazemian, B.A., J.D.

Hope M. Mount, B.A., J.D.

Christina M. Mulligan, B.A., J.D.

James E. Poar, M.A., D.D.

Nina Rabas, B.A., J.D.

Sia M. Saakov, M.A., J.D.

Daniel Wade, M.S., J.D.

Visiting Lecturers in Law

Josh Abrahams, A.B., J.D.

Guillermo Aguilar-Alvarez, Lic. en Derecho (J.D.)

Richard Baxter, M.A., J.D., John R. Ruben/Sullivan & Cromwell Visiting Lecturer in Accounting

H.E. Stein Beck, B.A., J.D.
Stephen B. Bright, B.A., J.D., Harvey Kent Visiting Lecturer in Law
Jennifer Gerarda Brown, A.B., J.D.
Hersz Cohen, B.A., J.D.
Timothy C. Collins, B.A., M.B.A.
Victoria A. Cundiff, B.A., J.D.
Brian T. Daly, M.A., J.D.
Karl (Tom) Dannenhauer, M.A., J.D., Robina Foundation Visiting Human Rights Fellow
Eugene R. Fidell, B.A., LL.B., Florence Rogatz Visiting Lecturer in Law
Gregory Fleming, B.A., J.D.
Lawrence J. Fox, B.A., J.D., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law
Gregory Gonsalves, B.S.
Benjamin W. Heineman, Jr., B.Litt, J.D.
Frank Iacobucci, LL.B., LL.M., Gruber Global Constitutionalism Fellow
Aaron Korman, M.Sc., J.D.
Barbara Marcus, M.S., Ph.D.
Charles Nathan, B.A., J.D.
Andrew J. Pecora, B.A., J.D.
Erik S. Robinson, M.B.A., J.D.
Charles A. Rothfeld, A.B., J.D.
David A. Schultz, M.A., J.D.
Michael S. Solender, B.A., J.D.
Laurence T. Solovin, J.D., LL.M.
Solovy H. Stein, A.B., J.D.
David J. Stott, B.A., J.D.
Christof R.A. Swaak, Ph.D.
William B. Taylor, B.A., LL.B.
Stefan R. Underhill, B.A., J.D.
John M. Walker, Jr., B.A., J.D.
David M. Zornow, B.A., J.D.

† On leave of absence, fall term, 2012-2013.
‡ On leave of absence, spring term, 2013.
THE YALE JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 38, Number 2, Summer 2013

ADVISORY BOARD

ROBERT B. AHDIEH
Professor,
Emory Law School

OONA A. HATHAWAY
Professor,
Yale Law School

NICHOLAS ROSTOW
Professor, National Defense
University, Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 7

LEA BRILMAYER
Professor,
Yale Law School

MELANIE KHANNA
Senior Donor Relations Officer,
United Nations Human
Rights Council

STEPHEN RUCKMAN
Special Appointee, Executive Division
Maryland Attorney General’s Office,
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 32

AMY CHUA
Professor,
Yale Law School

MITCHEL LASSEY
Professor,
Cornell University Law School

JAMES J. SILK
Professor,
Yale Law School

MIRJAN DAMASKA
Professor,
Yale Law School

JANET KOVEN LEVIT
Dean,
University of Tulsa College of Law

ALEC STONE SWEET
Professor,
Yale Law School

LAURA DICKINSON
Professor, Sandra Day O’Connor
College of Law,
Arizona State University

GRETA S. MILLIGAN
Associate,
Covington & Burling LLP
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 33

PATRICIA WALD
Judge, D.C. Circuit
Court of Appeals (Retired)

OWEN M. FISS
Professor,
Yale Law School

ROBERT C. POST
Dean,
Yale Law School

JOHN D. WATSON, JR.
Partner,
Latham & Watkins LLP
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 9

PAUL GEWIRTS
Professor,
Yale Law School

W. MICHAEL REISMAN
Professor,
Yale Law School

JAMES Q. WHITMAN
Professor,
Yale Law School

SUSAN ROSE-ACKERMAN
Professor,
Yale Law School
THE YALE JOURNAL
OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 38, Number 2, Summer 2013

Editors-in-Chief
GISELLE BARCIA
TRAVIS PANTIN

Executive Editors
JASMEET KAUR AHUJA
JANE S. JIANG

Executive Features Editors
HANNAH BRENNAN
KRISTIN ZAICHKIN

Managing Editors
LINDSEY V. COLINTS
SAMIR DEGER-SEN
AVERY WHITE

Articles Editors
I. DEBORAH FRANCOIS
ADAM GOLDENBERG
KATE HADLEY
CHRISTINA KONINGSOR
JOHN LEWIS
CHRISTOPHER NASON
WILL SMILEY
JACOB VICTOR

Features Editors
SHOUVIK BHATTACHARYA
AMANDA ELBÖGEN
BENJAMIN F. FARKAS
CARLTON FORBES
ABIGAIL GRABER
ALISA SHEIKHTMAN
JOSHUA SILVERSTEIN
CANEL TROUILLOT
EILEEN ZELEK

Development Editor
CANEL TROUILLOT

Submissions Editors
PIOTR BRZEZINSKI
GRACE KIM
SHENG LI
MINDY LU
SARAH MILLINGS
ALBERT NAH
FREYA PITTS
MICHAEL SHIH
ROMAIN ZAMOUR

Production Editor
STEPHEN DONNELLY

Senior Editors
JUSTIN ACCOMANDO†
EDWINA CLARKE
JANIS FOO
FARSHAD GHODOOSI
TAYLOR HEDRICK
JULIE HUNTER
DAVID MONIR
Tiffany NG
SALLY PEI

Submissions Editors
CLARE RYAN
JAMES SHIH
JONATHAN N. SOLEIMANI
CAMERON A. VAN SANT

Editors
SELIN AKKAN
ARIELA ANHALT
JENNÉ AYERS
MATTHEW BLUMENTHAL
MEGAN BRODWER
JOHN CALHOUN
CIAKLES DAMERON†
ALLISON DAY†
RACHEL DEMPSEY
ANNA DIAKUN
ALEX DJERASSI
AMANDA EL-DAKHIKINI
MONIKA EHHRMAN
MATTHEW EIENSEN†
LESLIE ESBRook†

Editors
NICOLE J. FEARAIN
JURGEN GOOSSENS
BEN GRAHAM
NOAH GREENFIELD
JORDAN C. HIRSCCH
ARNALDUR HIARTSON
WILLIAM KALEMA
ALLANA KEMBABAZI†
DAVID KIM
SAMUEL KLEINEt
PHILLIP KOTLABA
ROBERT NIGHTINGALE
TEMIDAYO ODUSOlu
DAYO OLOPADE
PETER PICH†

Editors
DAVID RANCE†
MARA REVKIN
LAUREN SALAMON
REEMA SHAH
ANDREW SHIPLEY
JENNIFER SKENE†
NORA STAPPERT
BRIAN SWEENEY
TINA THOMAS
LILIAN TIMMERMANN
BRIANNA VAN KAN
JULIE VEROFF
GUIDO WAISBERG
JOHN C. WEI
MENG JIA YANG

† Source Coordinator
