Molecular dissection of maize seedling salt tolerance using a genome-wide association analysis method

Meijie Luo1, Yuxia Zhang1, Jingna Li1, Panpan Zhang1, Kuan Chen1, Wei Song1, Xiaqing Wang1, Jinxiao Yang1, Xiaoduo Lu2, Baishan Lu1, Yanxin Zhao1,* and Jiuran Zhao1,*

1Beijing Key Laboratory of Maize DNA Fingerprinting and Molecular Breeding, Maize Research Center, Beijing Academy of Agriculture and Forestry Sciences (BAAFS), Beijing, China
2Institute of Molecular Breeding for Maize, QuLiu Normal University, Jinan, China

Introduction

Soil salinization is a globally devastating environmental problem resulting from both natural and artificial processes, such as mineral weathering and irrigation. Salinity affects more than 800 million hectares of land, accounting for more than 6% of the world’s land area (Munns and Tester, 2008). Various types of ions are responsible for salination, including sodium, potassium, calcium, magnesium and chloride (Zhu, 2016). Sodium chloride (NaCl) is the most abundant salt in soil because of its high solubility and ubiquitous distribution (Munns and Tester, 2008). Soil salinity has many negative effects on plant growth and development, including inhibition of seed germination, reduced root growth, plant height and fruiting levels, which ultimately decreases crop yield and quality (Sandhu et al., 2020). More seriously, sensitive crops can be killed by even slight salinity in soils (Luo et al., 2019b). The bases of these phenomena have been dissected using molecular genetics analyses. Such analyses have shown that various physiological and metabolic functions in plants are impaired by osmotic, ionic and oxidative stresses under saline conditions (Muchate et al., 2016).

Because of the harmful effects of salinity stress on plant growth and crop yields, it is necessary to exploit the genetic basis of variability in salt tolerance to improve plants’ resistance to salt toxicity. Quantitative trait locus (QTL) mapping has revealed many genomic regions that affect important traits. In maize, QTL analyses of the germination rate, salt tolerance ranking, shoot fresh and dry weights, shoot K+/Na+ ratio and Na+ and K+ concentrations in shoots were conducted on seedlings of 161 F2,5 lines under hydroponic culture and saline field conditions. In total, 38 salt tolerance-related QTLs were detected on chromosomes 1, 3 and 5, with eight being major QTLs that individually explained more than 20% of the phenotypic variation (Cui et al., 2015). Using plant height in a saline field and a plant height-based salt tolerance index (plant height in a saline field/plant height in a normal field) as salt tolerance indicators, QTLs were detected in mature field-grown maize plants of 240 double-haploid lines. A major QTL, qSPH1, which was responsible for the two salt tolerance-related traits, was identified on chromosome 1 and explained 25.9%–31.2% of the phenotypic variation (Luo et al., 2017b). Some QTLs associated with salt tolerance have also been identified in other crops, such as rice (Zeng et al., 2021), wheat (Luo et al., 2021), soybean (Guan et al., 2014) and tomato (Frary et al., 2010). The results of those QTL mapping studies have provided insights into the genetic mechanisms of plant salt tolerance, which may be useful for breeding salt-tolerant crops.

Keywords: salt tolerance, genetic loci, association mapping, maize.

Summary

Salt stress is a major devastating abiotic factor that affects the yield and quality of maize. However, knowledge of the molecular mechanisms of the responses to salt stress in maize is limited. To elucidate the genetic basis of salt tolerance traits, a genome-wide association study was performed on 348 maize inbred lines under normal and salt stress conditions using 557 894 single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs). The phenotypic data for 27 traits revealed coefficients of variation of >25%. In total, 149 significant SNPs explaining 6.6%–11.2% of the phenotypic variation for each SNP were identified. Of the 104 identified quantitative trait loci (QTLs), 83 were related to salt tolerance and 21 to normal traits. Additionally, 13 QTLs were associated with two to five traits. Eleven and six QTLs controlling salt tolerance traits and normal root growth, respectively, co-localized with QTL intervals reported previously. Based on functional annotations, 13 candidate genes were predicted. Expression levels analysis of 12 candidate genes revealed that they were all responsive to salt stress. The CRISPR/Cas9 technology targeting three sites was applied in maize, and its editing efficiency reached 70%. By comparing the biomass of three CRISPR/Cas9 mutants of ZmCLCg and one ZmPMP3 EMS mutant with their wild-type plants under salt stress, the salt tolerance function of candidate genes ZmCLCg and ZmPMP3 were confirmed. Chloride content analysis revealed that ZmCLCg regulated chloride transport under sodium chloride stress. These results help to explain genetic variations in salt tolerance and provide novel loci for generating salt-tolerant maize lines.

Please cite this article as: Luo, M., Zhang, Y., Li, J., Zhang, P., Chen, K., Song, W., Wang, X., Yang, J., Lu, X., Lu, B., Zhao, Y. and Zhao, J. (2021) Molecular dissection of maize seedling salt tolerance using a genome-wide association analysis method. Plant Biotechnol J, https://doi.org/10.1111/pbi.13607

© 2021 The Authors. Plant Biotechnology Journal published by Society for Experimental Biology and The Association of Applied Biologists and John Wiley & Sons Ltd. This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited and is not used for commercial purposes.
A number of functional genes and transcriptional factors related to salt tolerance have been reported. Many of them are involved in ion homeostasis maintenance, osmotic protection, antioxidant regulation, hormonal regulation and Ca²⁺ signalling pathways (Muchate et al., 2016). For example, in the model plant Arabidopsis, the salt overly sensitive (SOS) signalling pathway (comprising SOST1, SOS2 and SOS3) involved in salt tolerance has been well characterized (Zhu, 2002; Zhu, 2016). In this pathway, SOS3 senses the Ca²⁺ signal elicited by ion stress, and then interacts with SOS2. The activated SOS2 phosphorylates the plasma membrane Na⁺/H⁺ antiporter SOS1, and the activated SOS1 extrudes Na⁺ from the cytosol (Zhu, 2016). In rice, the SKC1 gene, which encodes a high affinity K⁺ transporter (HKT), has been successfully isolated through map-based cloning. Overexpression of SKC1 was shown to reduce the Na⁺ content and increase the K⁺ content in the shoots of salt-stressed rice (Ren et al., 2005). In maize, ZmHKT1, which also encodes an HKT-type transporter, has been isolated from the major maize salt tolerance QTL, ZmNC1 (logarithm of odds, LOD = 12.51). A gene knock-out analysis verified that ZmHKT1 is important for Na⁺ homeostasis and salt tolerance in maize (Zhang et al., 2018). However, despite the dissection of numerous genetic loci, the molecular basis of salt tolerance in plants is still far from being completely understood.

A genome-wide association study (GWAS) is a powerful method to study genetic variations associated with complex traits at the genome-wide level (Huang et al., 2010; Luo et al., 2019b; Xie et al., 2019). This method takes into account the historical recombination found in broad panels of diverse germplasm and population-wide linkage disequilibrium (LD) among single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) and QTLs. Thus, a GWAS can circumvent the limiting low recombination rate of bi-parental populations to identify a wider range of genetic variations and provide complementary information (Lu et al., 2018). Recently, GWAS technology has been used to dissect multiple complex trait-related mechanisms in various plant species. In rice, a metabolic GWAS identified 36 candidate genes that modulate the levels of physiologically and nutritionally important metabolites (Chen et al., 2014). In soybean, a GWAS led to the identification of 11 candidate genes related to days to flowering, maturity and plant height (Zhang et al., 2015). Additionally, using a GWAS, the natural variation of ZmVPP1 encoding one vacuolar-type H⁺ pyrophosphatase was identified, which contributed significantly to drought tolerance of maize (Wang et al., 2016). Four stable QTLs were identified in maize, which played critical roles in controlling arsenic accumulation (Zhao et al., 2018).

Maize is an important cereal crop worldwide and is also moderately salt sensitive. In general, the germination and seedling phases of maize are more sensitive than other phases to salt stress (Luo et al., 2019a; Luo et al., 2017a). In previous studies, researchers have identified salt-stress-related QTLs such as qRLS1 (Luo et al., 2019a) and QFgr1 (Cui et al., 2015), and a few genes regulating ion transport and gene transcription, such as ZmHAK4 (Zhang et al., 2019), ZmHKT1 (Zhang et al., 2018), ZmPMP3 (Yu et al., 2012), ZmZIP72 (Yang et al., 2012), ZmMPK5 (Zhang et al., 2014), ZmKdP10 (Zhao et al., 2014), ZmSIMK1 (Gu et al., 2010), SAG4 (Luo et al., 2019b) and SAG6 (Luo et al., 2019b). However, the molecular mechanisms of salt tolerance in maize are poorly understood.

In the present study, a high-density SNP-based GWAS analysis was performed under normal and salt stress conditions to detect natural variations in alleles related to the salt stress response during the maize germination stage. The main purpose of this study was to investigate significant alleles and potential candidate genes associated with shoot and root traits related to salt tolerance. The findings of this study shed light on the molecular mechanisms associated with variations in salt tolerance among maize inbred lines and may assist in the development of molecular markers for the improvement of salt tolerance in maize.

**Results**

**Phenotypic variation analysis**

The maize diversity panel consisting of 348 accessions collected from the USA, China, and CIMMYT has been used for several GWAS analyses (Li et al., 2013; Liu et al., 2017; Yang et al., 2011b) (Table S1). In this study, phenotypic data for nine important growth-related traits (shoot length (SL), root length (RL), full length of seedling (FL), shoot fresh weight (SF), root fresh weight (RF), full fresh weight of seedling (FF), shoot dry weight (SD), root dry weight (RD) and full dry weight of seedling (FD)) were collected from the association population under normal and salt-stressed conditions. The salt tolerance indexes of these nine traits were calculated by dividing the values measured under salt stress conditions by the values measured under control conditions. The phenotypic frequencies of all 27 traits (nine traits under normal conditions and salt-stressed conditions, and the salt tolerance indexes of these traits) exhibited normal or near-normal distributions (Figure S1). The average values of SL, RL, SF, RF, FF, SD, RD and FD were 4.03 cm, 5.83 cm, 9.87 cm, 0.12 g, 0.18 g, 0.30 g, 0.018 g, 0.02 g and 0.04 g, respectively, under salt stress conditions, compared with 11.10 cm, 11.27 cm, 22.37 cm, 0.35 g, 0.33 g, 0.67 g, 0.04 g, 0.03 g and 0.07 g, respectively, under control conditions. The average values of the salt tolerance indexes (R) of the nine traits were as follows: SL (SLR = 0.38), RL (RLR = 0.57), FL (FLR = 0.47), SF (SFR = 0.36), RF (RFR = 0.56), FF (FFR = 0.46), SD (SDR = 0.46), RD (RDR = 0.64) and FD (FDR = 0.54). All 27 traits showed a wide range of phenotypic variation, and their coefficients of variation were all greater than 25%. The repeatability for all traits was high (74.31%–97.26%) (Table 1).

The phenotypes of three significantly salt tolerant (C17, CIMBL115 and GEMS37) and three significantly salt sensitive (CIMBL127, CIMBL157 and BY807) maize inbred lines were shown in Figure 1a. In general, the nine measured traits (SL, RL, SF, RF, FF, SD, RD and FD) were significantly lower (35.6%–63.7% decrease, P < 0.001) under salt treatment conditions than under control conditions. The SL, SF and SD showed greater decreases than RL, RF and RD in response to salt stress, consistent with previous reports (Luo et al., 2017a; Luo et al., 2018) (Figure 1b–e). The nine measured traits of seedlings were significantly and positively correlated with each other (P < 0.001) under salt stress and control conditions. As expected, the salt tolerance indexes of the nine traits were negatively correlated with the nine traits under control conditions. The correlation coefficients of the traits under the same conditions were relatively higher than the correlation coefficients of the traits between different conditions. Furthermore, the correlation coefficients between traits under salt and control conditions were the greatest in all correlation coefficients among traits under salt treatment, under control treatment and their salt tolerance indexes (Figure S2).
GWAS mapping

In total, more than 1.06 million high-quality SNPs were obtained from an RNA-seq project and the MaizeSNP50 BeadChip (Fu et al., 2013; Ganal et al., 2011). The SNPs were filtered with a minor allele frequency <0.05, and the remaining 557 894 SNPs were used for the association analysis. To determine the optimal model for the association analysis, three models (K, Q, Q + K) were compared using quantile–quantile plots (Figure S3). The Q model resulted in a greater control of false-negative errors, and the Q + K model was more reliable than the Q model. Moreover, by combining the two covariates of population structure (Q) and K, the Q + K method can effectively control type I errors (false positives) (Lu et al., 2018; Zhang et al., 2016).

Therefore, all subsequent GWAS analyses were performed using the Q + K model. Manhattan plots for all traits are shown in Figure S4. The quantile–quantile (QQ) plots for all traits were shown in Figure S5.

A total of 183 SNP-trait associations with $P < 1.79 \times 10^{-6}$ were identified (Table S2), and they involved 149 unique SNPs. According to the LD decay distance of this maize population, a 200-kb region (±100 kb) around each significant SNP was defined as a QT (Deng et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2019). The QTs with overlapping intervals for the same traits were merged. In this way, we identified 83 QTs related to salt stress and 21 QTs in the control, with an average of 4.6 and 3.0 loci for each trait, respectively (Table S3; Figure 2a–c). Briefly, 36 QTs (42 significant SNPs) were identified for the nine traits under salt treatment conditions, and the proportion of phenotypic variation ($R^2$) explained by each locus ranged from 6.9% to 11.2%, with a mean of 7.6%. In the control, 21 QTs (29 significant SNPs) were identified for seven traits, and the proportion of phenotypic variation explained by each locus ranged from 6.7%–9.7%, with an average of 7.6%. Based on the salt tolerance indexes of the nine traits, 47 QTs (78 significant SNPs) were identified, with $R^2$ values ranging from 6.6%–10.5% (average, 7.2%).

The co-localization of QTs identified from multiple traits was summarized (Figure 2; Table S4). Overall, 11 QT intervals were simultaneously detected by multiple salt-related traits (Figure 2a, b), while two QT intervals were simultaneously detected by multiple traits in the control (Figure 2a,c). The chromosomal distribution of salt-associated QTs revealed a hot spot on chromosome 5 (4.56–19.35 Mb) (Figure 2b). These QTs and the hot spot might play an important role in regulating salt tolerance in maize.

Candidate gene prediction and expression profiling

The physical positions of the 83 salt-related QTs from the maizeGDB database (www.maizegdb.org, B73 RefGen_v2) were searched to identify the genes present within these QT regions. A total of 420 genes were obtained. Based on their annotations in the maizeGDB, Gramene and TAIR databases, 16 genes were found to be involved in tolerance to salinity or water deficiency. By analysing the LD of significant SNPs associated with candidate genes, we found that three genes were outside the LD regions of their significant SNPs ($r^2 < 0.1$). Therefore, they were excluded from the candidate genes. The remaining 13 genes were considered as candidate genes (Table 2).
GRMZM2G477325, which encodes a plasma membrane protein 3 (PMP3) on chromosome 7, was within the QTL simultaneously detected by five salt-associated traits (CI7, CIMBL115 and GEMS37) and three significantly salt sensitive (CIMBL127, CIMBL157 and BY807) maize inbred lines. This gene is known to be involved in ion homeostasis in yeast mutant under salt stress (Fu et al., 2012). Another gene, GRMZM2G071119 (ZmCLCg), located on chromosome 2, encodes an unknown protein. However, its Arabidopsis ortholog is a voltage-gated chloride channel that participates in chloride transmembrane transport (Nguyen et al., 2016), indicating that it is a likely candidate gene for chloride transport in maize.

Four candidate genes (GRMZM2G102754, GRMZM2G176085, GRMZM2G027351 and GRMZM2G166049) located within the hot spot on chromosome 5 (4.56–19.35 Mb) (Figure 2b).
play roles in ethylene signal transduction (Zhang et al., 2017) and oxidative stress responses (Valério et al., 2004) under salt stress, respectively. GRMZM2G027351 and GRMZM2G166049 encode a calcium-dependent protein kinase 18 (cdpk18) (Mittal et al., 2017) and a btb/poz domain protein (mab17, math-btb17) (Juranič et al., 2012), respectively. The Arabidopsis ortholog of GRMZM2G166049 is involved in homeobox-leucine zipper transcription factor degradation (Lechner et al., 2011).

Four other candidate genes (GRMZM2G033230, GRMZM2G041636, GRMZM2G121570 and GRMZM2G028386) encode transcription factors and might be associated with salt tolerance through transcriptional regulation. The GRMZM2G033230 encodes a bZIP transcription factor 108 (bZIP108) (Yilmaz et al., 2009); the Arabidopsis ortholog of GRMZM2G041636 encodes a bHLH transcription factor (Guan et al., 2013); GRMZM2G121570 encodes MYB transcription factor 73 (myb73) (Xiao et al., 2017) and GRMZM2G028386 encodes AP2-EREBP transcription factor 137 (ereb137) (Yilmaz et al., 2009).

In addition, GRMZM2G136910 on chromosome 10 encodes an abscisic acid stress ripening 1 protein (aasr1), which was shown to improve maize kernel yield by regulating metabolic processes under water-limited conditions (Virlouvet et al., 2011). Another gene, GRMZM2G066024 on chromosome 8, encodes an aldolase (ald2) (Marocco et al., 2005), and its Arabidopsis ortholog responds to salt stress (Lu et al., 2012). GRMZM2G421857 on chromosome 4 encodes vacuolar proton pump 3 (vpp3) (Viereck et al., 1996).

The transcription levels of 12 candidate genes in root and shoot of maize inbred line Jing 724 at 0, 0.5, 1, 2, 4, 8, 12, 24, 48, 72, 120 and 168 h after salt treatment were obtained by RNA-seq (among the 13 candidate genes, GRMZM2G121570 was not

---

**Figure 2** Chromosomal distribution of quantitative trait loci (QTL) for maize traits under control and salt stress conditions. (a) Chromosomal distribution of salt tolerance-associated and growth-related QTLs in maize. QTLs are represented by black circles and circle size indicates significance of association. Red arrows show QTLs associated with multiple traits. (b) Chromosomal distribution of salt tolerance-associated QTLs in maize. QTLs are represented by red vertical lines. (c) Chromosomal distribution of normal growth-related QTLs in maize. QTLs are represented by red vertical lines.

© 2021 The Authors. *Plant Biotechnology Journal* published by Society for Experimental Biology and The Association of Applied Biologists and John Wiley & Sons Ltd., 1–15
| Traits | Peak SNP | Allele | Chr. | QTL interval (bp) | P value | Candidate gene | Position (bp) | Annotation |
|--------|-----------|--------|------|-------------------|---------|---------------|--------------|------------|
| PZE-101201482 | A/G | 1 | 252 259 061–252 459 061 | 5.65E-07 | 11.15 | GRMZM2G121570 | 252 320 123–252 322 173 | myb73, MYB transcription factor 73, regulation of transcription |
| chr1S_201957459 | C/T | 1 | 201 857 459–202 057 459 | 2.06E-09 | 10.51 | GRMZM2G028386 | 201 957 089–201 958 672 | ereb137, AP2-EREBP transcription factor 137 |
| chr2S_5846479 | C/T | 2 | 5 739 326–5 947 477 | 3.45E-07 | 7.86 | GRMZM2G071119 | 5 897 689–5 904 448 | --- |
| chr4S_235409430 | C/G | 4 | 235 299 568–235 509 431 | 6.17E-07 | 7.16 | GRMZM2G421857 | 235 439 768–235 449 150 | vpp3, vacuolar proton pump3 |
| chr5S_12267893 | C/T | 5 | 12 167 893–12 367 893 | 1.294E-06 | 6.73 | GRMZM2G1Q7254 | 12 267 646–12 273 705 | utf2, ethylene-insensitive protein 2 |
| chr5S_6438730 | G/C | 5 | 6 338 730–6 538 731 | 4.92E-07 | 7.40 | GRMZM2G176085 | 6 357 462–6 359 213 | --- |
| chr5S_4665179 | T/G | 5 | 4 565 179–4 765 179 | 9.07E-07 | 7.09 | GRMZM2G027351 | 4 651 173–4 655 150 | cdpk18, calcium-dependent protein kinase18 |
| chr5S_4665179 | T/G | 5 | 4 565 179–4 765 179 | 9.07E-07 | 7.09 | GRMZM2G166049 | 4 570 654–4 574 357 | mab17, math-btb17, btb/poz domain protein |
| chr7S_174840400 | G/T | 7 | 174 240 400–174 440 400 | 3.25E-07 | 7.89 | GRMZM2G041636 | 174 327 890–174 328 868 | --- |

© 2021 The Authors. Plant Biotechnology Journal published by Society for Experimental Biology and The Association of Applied Biologists and John Wiley & Sons Ltd., 1–15.
Table 2 Continued

| Trait | Peak SNP | Allele | Chr. | QTL interval (bp) | Annotation | Ortholog | Ortholog annotation |
|-------|----------|--------|------|-------------------|------------|-----------|---------------------|
| SPS   | chr7.S_168405013 | A/G | 7    | 168 304-168 505 013 | 9.99E-8 | GRMZM2G477325 | 168 401 590-168 505 013 |
|       |          |       |      |                   | 8.58       | SDS, membrane potential regulator 5. Plant Wide | |
|       |          |       |      |                   |            | SFS, FDS, | |
|       |          |       |      |                   |            | Gene Name: PMP3, encodes plasmamembrane proteolipid | |
|       |          |       |      |                   |            | FF9, involved in ion response to salt stress | |
|       |          |       |      |                   |            | FDR, aldolase AT2G36460 | Aldolase superfamily protein, | |
|       |          |       |      |                   |            | 10.0% and 11.4%, respectively. | |
| SLR   | chr10.S_8805555 | G/A | 10   | 8 705 555-8 849 948 | 3.57E-7 | GRMZM2G136910 | 8 849 948-8 850 555 |
|       |          |       |      |                   | 3.83       | SFS, FDS, | |
|       |          |       |      |                   |            | bZIP transcription factor 108 | AT3G51960, ATBZIP2, bZIP transcription factor, induced by salt stress and promoted salt tolerance under water deficit | |

Functional verification of candidate genes ZmCLCg and ZmPMP3

After culturing in control or saline water for 10 days, growth parameters of B104, B73, the significantly salt-tolerant maize inbred line GEMS37, and the significantly salt-sensitive maize inbred line CIMBL157 were compared (Figure 5a–e). The RL, RF, SL and SF of GEMS37, B104 and B73 were significantly higher than those of CIMBL157. The salt tolerance indexes of RL, RF, SL and SF in GEMS37 were 59.8%, 41.8%, 41.6% and 49.3%, respectively. In B104, they were 60.9%, 57.7%, 48.1% and 46.3%, respectively. In B73, they were 53%, 49.0%, 43.9% and 35.6%, respectively. In CIMBL157, they were 32.3%, 23.6%, 10.0% and 11.4%, respectively. The growth parameters under salt stress and the salt tolerance indexes of B104 and B73 were close to that of salt tolerant maize inbred line GEMS37 (Figure 5a–e). These results suggested that both B104 and B73 were salt tolerant maize inbred lines.

To validate the function of candidate gene ZmCLCg in salt tolerance, the maize inbred line B104 with ZmCLCg gene knock out was generated by CRISPR/Cas9 technology. The CRISPR/Cas9 vector used for ZmCLCg editing contains a synthetic polycistronic gene with three tandem tRNA-grRNA structures, which has the advantage of producing multiple mature grRNAs through endogenous tRNA-processing system (Xie et al., 2015) (Figure 4a). Three 20-bp sequences in the first, third and fourth exons of ZmCLCg were chosen as Cas9-grRNA cleavage sites (Figure 4a,b). PCR and sequencing analysis identified one mutant plant in the third exon (Mutation efficiency = 10%) and 7 mutant plants in the fourth exon (Mutation efficiency = 70%) among 10 independent T0 transgenic lines. These mutants were self-pollinated to obtain homozygous mutant maize plants. Three zmc1-g knock-out mutants and the wild type were used to investigate their biomass parameters under salt stress. The zmc1-g has single base insertion mutation at the target site of exon 4, the zmc1-g-2 has single base deletion at exon 3 and single base insertion at exon 4, and the zmc1-g-3 has 28-bp deletion mutation at the target site of exon 4 (Figure 4c). These mutations will lead to frame shift mutations in ZmCLCg gene. All three zmc1-g mutants showed a greater reduction in root length, root fresh weight, shoot length and shoot fresh weight compared with that of the wild type under 100 mM NaCl treatment (Figure 4d–h). These results suggested that ZmCLCg conferred salt tolerance in maize. Under 100 mM NaCl treatment, the chloride content in shoots of three zmc1-g mutants was significantly higher than that of wild type.
Six QTLs associated with root growth matched to previously under control conditions, 21 QTLs were identified across all of the analysis in this study. The QQ plot for SLS generated by three models we false-positive and false-negative associations than the K and Q models. Therefore, we used K as well as the Q model. The K model was more reliable. The significant SNPs of chr3_S_3201547 and chr3_S_3206938 for RD, which was identified from a recombinant inbred line population (Li et al., 2015). Two novel QTLs were detected by multiple traits (Table S4). Traits that shared the same QTLs were closely and significantly correlated with each other (r = 0.72–0.92), consistent with a previous study (Lu et al., 2018). Thus, the association analysis data appeared to be reliable. The novel QTLs for maize seedling growth identified in this study might enhance our understanding of the genetic basis for maize growth and development.

### Discussion

Maize is sensitive to salt stress, but is often planted on salt-contaminated land because most farmland is salinized. Therefore, elucidating the genetic architecture of salt tolerance in maize is instrumental for improving its salt tolerance. In this study, a GWAS analysis based on SNP markers was used to dissect the genetic basis of salt-related traits, including seedling length, fresh weight, dry weight and salt tolerance indexes. Multiple QTLs were identified for each trait, with some QTLs being simultaneously detected from several salt-related traits. Moreover, candidate genes involved in salt tolerance were predicted and analysed, which may serve as potential targets in studies on the molecular mechanisms underlying salt tolerance in maize.

All of the traits were seriously inhibited under salt stress (Figure 1), consistent with previous reports (Luo et al., 2019a; Luo et al., 2017a; Luo et al., 2018). The pairwise correlations among nine growth parameters in both salt-stressed and control conditions were significantly positive (r = 0.22–0.96), demonstrating strong genetic correlations among them. The salt tolerance indexes of some traits were weakly correlated with the growth parameters in control and salt stress conditions (Figure S2), indicating that different genetic mechanisms may control these traits.

In previous studies, GWAS analyses have successfully identified genomic regions associated with tolerance to various abiotic stresses (Zhang et al., 2013; Zhao et al., 2018). In the present study, the 2300-Mb whole maize genome was covered by 557 894 high-density SNPs, with an average interval of 4.1 kb between SNPs, allowing for fine-resolution QTL mapping. Population structure is a main limitation in GWAS studies because it induces false-positive associations. Several statistical methods were evaluated to reduce false positives (Lu et al., 2018; Zhang et al., 2016), and the results suggested that the Q + K mixed linear model had a greater ability to correct both false-positive and false-negative associations than the K and Q models. The QQ plot for SLS generated by three models we compared in this study (Figure S3). Consistent with previous studies (Lu et al., 2018; Zhang et al., 2016), results indicated that the Q as well as the Q + K model could better control the false-negative errors than the K model, and the Q + K model was more reliable than the Q model. Therefore, we used K + Q model for GWAS analysis in this study.

Through the association mapping of root and shoot traits under control conditions, 21 QTLs were identified across all of the chromosomes, and 16 of the QTLs were related to root growth. Six QTLs associated with root growth matched to previously reported QTL regions (Burton et al., 2014; Cai et al., 2012; Li et al., 2015). Four QTLs controlling root length (located in 45.42–45.62 Mb and 37.56–37.76 Mb regions on chromosome 1, 171.53–171.73 Mb region on chromosome 4, and 149.72–149.92 Mb region on chromosome 6) co-localized with qSolPhcen1, qARL21-1, qTRL14-1 and qARL26-1, respectively, which were identified from linkage populations in previous studies (Burton et al., 2014; Cai et al., 2012). Another QTL for RF, which was located at the 105.95–106.15-Mb region on chromosome 10, co-localized with qRDW110-1 for RF, which was identified from a BC4F3 maize population (Cai et al., 2012). A QTL localized in the 136.76–136.97 Mb region on chromosome 7 co-localized with qRDW77 for RD, which was identified from a recombinant inbred line population (Li et al., 2015). Four novel QTLs were detected by multiple traits (Table S4). Traits that shared the same QTLs were closely and significantly correlated with each other (r = 0.72–0.92), consistent with a previous study (Lu et al., 2018). Thus, the association analysis data appeared to be reliable. The novel QTLs for maize seedling growth identified in this study might enhance our understanding of the genetic basis for maize growth and development.

Only a few studies have tried to genetically map salt tolerance in maize (Cui et al., 2015; Luo et al., 2019a; Luo et al., 2019b; Luo et al., 2017b; Sandhu et al., 2020; Xie et al., 2019). The GWAS analysis in this study builds on the results of those studies and allowed us to identify salt tolerance-related SNP markers throughout the genome. Based on 18 traits, 83 QTLs distributed across all 10 maize chromosomes were significantly associated with salt tolerance. The proportion of phenotypic variation explained by individual significant SNPs was less than 11.2%, implying that salt tolerance is a complex minor-effect quantitative trait. Among the QTLs, 11 matched to those reported in previous studies (Cui et al., 2015; Luo et al., 2019b; Luo et al., 2019a; Luo et al., 2017b). For example, one QTL covering the region from 147.06 to 147.26 Mb on chromosome 1 was located within qSPH1 (Luo et al., 2017b), QSt1 (Cui et al., 2015), QTwc1 (Cui et al., 2015) and Q5kcs1 (Cui et al., 2015), which were detected in linkage analyses, implying that our results were reliable. The significant SNPs of chr3.S_3201547 and chr3.S_3206938 for survival rate identified by Luo et al. (2019b) had strong LD with the significant SNP of chr3.S_3208836 for root length under salt stress identified in this study (r² > 0.2). In addition, 11 QTLs were identified by multiple traits (Table S4), suggesting that they had pleiotropic effects on salt tolerance. As expected, traits that shared the same QTLs had significant positive correlations with one another (r = 0.426–0.962).

Within the 83 QTL regions, 420 genes were identified (Table S5), and 367 genes were assigned to 24 Eukaryotic Orthologous Groups (KOG) categories. The main KOG classifications were “Signal transduction mechanisms” (30.2%), “Post-translational modification, protein turnover, chaperones” (25.1%), “Transcription” (15.5%), “Carbohydrate transport and metabolism” (11.7%), and “Intracellular trafficking, secretion and vesicular transport” (11.4%) (Figure S7).

The most promising candidate genes were identified based on their functional annotations and their homologs as screening references. Finally, we identified 13 candidate genes located in 12 corresponding QTLs (Table 2). The phenotypic differences reached significant levels (P < 0.001 or 0.01) between the two alleles of each of the strongest trait-associated SNPs (Figure S8). The ZmPMP3 (GRMZM2G477325) was reported to regulate ion homeostasis in yeast mutant under salt stress (Fu et al., 2012). It was located within a QTL containing three leading SNPs (chr7.S_168404086, chr7.S_168404089 and chr7.S_168405013).
on chromosome 7 (Figure S8b), and this QTL was simultaneously identified by five traits (Table S4). The biomass of the zmmpmp3 mutant decreased significantly under 100 mM NaCl condition compared to its wild type, which verified that ZmPMP3 conferred maize salt tolerance (Figure 5). Another candidate gene, GRMZM2G071119 (ZmCLCg) was located in a QTL (5.74–5.95 Mb, chromosome 2) harbouring 11 peak SNPs (Figure S8a). The AT5G33280 encodes a voltage-gated chloride channel responsible for chloride transmembrane transport in Arabidopsis (Nguyen et al., 2016), and ZmCLCg is homologous to AT5G33280, indicating that it is a promising target gene for salt tolerance. Maize zmclcg knock-out mutants were generated using the CRISPR/Cas9 technology, and we found that the biomass of three zmclcg mutants were significantly lower than that of the wild type under salt stress, which confirmed the role of ZmCLCg in maize salt tolerance (Figure 4). Thus, these results verified the accuracy of our GWAS results and indicated that GWAS is an effective strategy to uncover DNA regions related to salt tolerance in maize.

Two genes encoding transcription factors, myb73 (GRMZM2G121570) and ereb137 (GRMZM2G028386), were located within two loci that explained more than 10% of phenotypic variation (Table 2). Moreover, these two regions were detected simultaneously by three traits (Table 2). The peak SNP of chr1.S_201957459 was located within GRMZM2G028386. Thus, these two transcription factors may play important roles in salt tolerance.

The hot spot on chromosome 5 contained four candidate genes: GRMZM2G102754, GRMZM2G176085, GRMZM2G027351 and GRMZM2G166049. GRMZM2G102754 is a homolog of Arabidopsis ethylene insensitive 2, which is involved in ethylene signal transduction and leaf senescence regulation under salt stress (Zhang et al., 2017). GRMZM2G102754 harboured the peak SNP of chr5.S_12267893. GRMZM2G176085 is a homolog of a peroxidase superfamily protein in Arabidopsis that responds to oxidative stress (Valério et al., 2004). Both col18 (GRMZM2G027351) and mab17 (GRMZM2G166049) were located in the same QTL interval identified by two traits, and encode proteins that may be involved in signal transduction and transcriptional regulation under salt stress conditions (Mittal et al., 2017).

bZIP108 (GRMZM2G033230) harboured the peak SNP of chr8.S_120609841, and its expression increased at all examined time points after salt treatment. Therefore, it is another likely candidate gene for salt tolerance. vpp3 (GRMZM2G421857) encodes a vacuolar proton pump and showed significantly increased transcript levels in root from 2–48 h post salt treatment. aasr1 (GRMZM2G136910) on chromosome 10 was adjacent to the peak SNPs chr10.S_880555 and chr10.S_8848948, and encodes a protein that protects maize kernel yield under

Figure 3 Transcript levels of candidate genes in shoots and roots of maize seedlings at different time points. (a) Fold changes in candidate genes’ transcript levels in shoots and roots of Jing724 seedlings at different time points compared with 0 h during salt treatment. Data represent means of fold changes from three biological replicates. (b and c) Transcript levels of ZmCLCg (b) and ZmPMP3 (c) in shoots of B73 seedlings at different time points. Data were shown as the mean ± SE of three independent experiments.
water deficiency conditions (Virlouvet et al., 2011). All these candidate genes may be involved in maize salt tolerance.

The transcript levels of 12 candidate genes fluctuated from 0.5–168 h after salt treatment and were up-regulated at certain time points (Figure 3), indicating that all these genes were responsive to salt stress in maize. Consistent with the results of Fu et al. (2012), the expression of ZmPMP3 showed a fluctuating trend, which was up-regulated at some time points and down regulated at some time points (Fu et al., 2012).

Overall, 13 candidate genes which may be related to maize salt tolerance were identified by GWAS mapping in this study. Two candidate genes of ZmCLCg and ZmPMP3 were selected for functional verification. The zmclcg mutants were obtained by target site editing with an efficient CRISPR/Cas9 vector carrying three tandemly arrayed tRNA-target-gRNA. Three zmclcg mutants were obtained, with one mutant had mutations in both exons 3 and exon 4. The biomass of three zmclcg mutants and one zmnpmp3 EMS mutant were compared with their wild-type plants under 100 mM NaCl treatment, respectively, and the results showed that the root length, root fresh weight, shoot length, shoot fresh weight of all mutants were significantly lower than that of the wild type, which verified the salt tolerance function of both ZmPMP3 and ZmCLCg. Chloride content analysis further indicated that ZmCLCg was associated with chloride transport in maize.

**Experimental procedures**

**Plant materials and treatments**

The association mapping panel consisted of 348 maize inbred lines, with 141 from tropical and subtropical zones and 126 from the temperate zone (Li et al., 2013; Liu et al., 2017; Yang et al., 2011b). The ZmCLCg knock-out maize lines were obtained by CRISPR/Cas9 technology. The EMS mutant of ZmPMP3 (Mut_Sample: EMS54-0a0498) was obtained from the maize EMS mutant library (http://www.elabcaas.cn/memd/). The ZmPMP3 gene (GenBank number: MW113229), ZmCLCg gene (GenBank number: MW113230) sequences of B73 maize inbred line and the ZmCLCg gene sequence of B104 (GenBank number: MW113231) maize inbred line had been submitted to GenBank database. Primers for PCR amplification of full length of the ZmCLCg gene are listed in the Table S6.

Maize seeds were sterilized with 1% v/v NaClO for 10 min, and then rinsed three times with sterile water. Subsequently, sterilized maize seeds were sown and hydroponically cultured in a maize seedling identifying apparatus (Chinese patent number: ZL2009201772825.0) placed in a greenhouse at 26 ± 1 °C and 60% relative humidity under a 12-h light/12-h dark (150–180 μmol m−2 s−1) photoperiod. Details of the apparatus’s operation are as follows: Maize seeds were fixed between two operation are as follows: Maize seeds were fixed between two

For the gene expression profile analysis, seeds of maize inbred line Jing724 or B73 were hydroponically cultured for 11 d. During this period, maize seedlings were hydroponically cultured in sterile water for the first 3 d, and then in Hoagland’s nutrient solution for another 8 d (Luo et al., 2018). On d 12, the culture solutions were replaced with Hoagland’s nutrient solution containing 100 mM NaCl (salt treatment). After salt treatment for 0, 0.5, 1, 2, 4, 8, 12, 24, 48, 72, 120 and 168 h, seedlings of Jing724 were harvested for transcriptome analyses. After salt treatment for 0, 1, 2, 4, 8, 12, 24, 48 and 72 h, shoots of B73 seedlings were harvested for quantitative real-time reverse-transcription PCR (qRT-PCR) analyses. Three biological replicates were analysed.

**Phenotypic data collection**

The SIs and RLs of maize seedlings were measured with a ruler. The fresh and dry weights of seedling shoots (SF and SD, respectively) and roots (RF and RD, respectively) were measured using an electronic analytical balance. For dry weight determination, fresh shoot and root samples were oven-dried at 80°C for 3 d and then weighed. Ten seedlings for each replicate and three biological replicates were analysed. After measurements, the salt tolerance index for each trait was calculated using the formula: salt tolerance index for each trait = measured value under salt stress/ measured value under normal condition. Phenotypic trait distributions, correlations and frequency distributions were determined using R version 3.4.4 (http://www.r-project.org/).

The chloride content was determined by ion chromatography. Shoot of seedlings were dried, grounded and was passed through 40-mesh sieve. Transfer 0.2 g sample into a 50 ml tube and add 10 ml solution containing 3.5 mM Na2CO3 and 1.0 mM NaHCO3. After digesting at 80 °C for 1 h, the digested solution was filtered through 0.45 μm membrane. Finally, the chloride content was determined using a Dionex ICS 600 ion chromatography (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Agawam, MA, USA) with a Dionex IonPac™ AS14 chromatographic column (Thermo Fisher Scientific). The solution containing 3.5 mM Na2CO3 and 1.0 mM NaHCO3 was used as eluent and the flow rate was 1.0 ml/min.

**Genome-wide association analysis**

More than 1.06 million high-quality SNPs obtained from an RNA-seq project (Fu et al., 2013) combined with the Illumina MaizeSNP50 BeadChip (Ganal et al., 2011) were used for the GWAS analysis. The SNP data can be downloaded from http://www.maizego.org/Resources.html. The mean values of the three biological replicates for each trait of the maize association population under control and salt stress conditions were used as the inputs for the GWAS. The GWAS analysis and statistical model comparison were implemented in TASSEL 5.2.44 software (https://tassel.bitbucket.io/). A P value of 1.79E-06 (1/number of markers with a minor allele frequency of ≥5%) was used to
determine significant associations. Manhattan and QQ plots were constructed using R version 3.4.4.

**Candidate genes analysis**

The reported maize B73 working gene list from the MaizeGDB database (http://www.maizegdb.org, RefGen_v2) was used to identify genes within each QTL. Genes were annotated according to the UniProtKB (https://www.uniprot.org/) and TAIR (https://www.arabidopsis.org/) databases. According to the LD of the association population, all genes and their annotations within 200 kb (100 kb up- and downstream) of significant loci were identified (Li et al., 2013; Liu et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2019). For functional classifications, all genes were used as queries in searches against the KOG (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/COG/)

© 2021 The Authors. Plant Biotechnology Journal published by Society for Experimental Biology and The Association of Applied Biologists and John Wiley & Sons Ltd., 1–15

---

**GWAS of maize seedling salt tolerance**

**Figure 4** Growth parameters and chloride content of ZmCLCg CRISPR/Cas9 knock-out mutants and their wild type (B104) under control and saline conditions. (a) Schematic illustration of the SpCas9 construct and three target sites (brown boxes). (b) Gene structure of ZmCLCg and the three target sites. (c) Sequences of target 2 and target 3 of ZmCLCg in wild type and three knock-out mutants. (d) Growth morphologies of the wild type B104 and three ZmCLCg knock-out maize lines after a 7-day exposure to saline and control treatment. Bar = 10 cm. (e–h) Root length (RL) (e), root fresh weight (RF) (f), shoot length (SL) (g) and shoot fresh weight (SF) (h) of the wild type and three knock-out mutants under control and saline conditions. (i) Chloride content in shoot. Data are shown as the mean ± SD of three independent experiments. The *P* values were calculated by a two-tailed Student’s *t* test.

The reported maize B73 working gene list from the MaizeGDB database (http://www.maizegdb.org, RefGen_v2) was used to identify genes within each QTL. Genes were annotated according to the UniProtKB (https://www.uniprot.org/) and TAIR (https://www.arabidopsis.org/) databases. According to the LD of the association population, all genes and their annotations within 200 kb (100 kb up- and downstream) of significant loci were identified (Li et al., 2013; Liu et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2019). For functional classifications, all genes were used as queries in searches against the KOG (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/COG/)
database. For candidate gene analysis, all genes were used as queries in searches against the MaizeGDB, Gramene (http://www.gramene.org/) and TAIR databases, and their functional annotations were confirmed. If the annotations showed that they were related to salt stress or water deficiency, then they were considered as candidate genes for salt tolerance.

Candidate gene expression profiles

The expression profiles of candidate genes were determined in a transcriptome analysis. The transcriptome library preparation and sequencing were performed by Annoroad Gene Technology Co., Ltd. (Beijing, China) (Yu et al., 2017). Total RNA was extracted from shoots and roots of maize seedlings using TRIZOL (Invitrogen, Carlsbad, CA), and the purity, integrity and concentration were checked by electrophoresis and the Bioanalyzer 2100 system (Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, CA). The transcriptome libraries were generated using the NEBNext® Ultra™ II Directional RNA Library Prep Kit for Illumina® (New England Biolabs, Ipswich, MA) according to manufacturer’s instructions. The quality and quantity of the libraries were controlled with the Bioanalyzer 2100 system (Agilent Technologies) and a CFX96 Real-Time PCR Detection System (Bio-Rad, Hercules, CA). The resulting libraries were sequenced using a HiSeq X ten instrument (Illumina, San Diego, CA). The raw sequences were cleaned by removing low-quality reads and reads containing adaptors. The cleaned reads were mapped to the maize reference genome (www.maizegdb.org) to obtain expression data for the identified genes. The sequencing data had been deposited in the Sequence Read Archive database (Accession number: PRJNA670840).

For qRT-PCR analysis, total RNA was extracted using TRIZOL reagent (Invitrogen, Carlsbad, CA), and then was reverse-transcribed using a PrimeScript™ II 1st strand cDNA Synthesis Kit (Takara Bio Inc., Shiga, Japan). qRT-PCR was performed using SYBR Premix Ex Taq™ II (Takara Bio Inc., Shiga, Japan). The

Figure 5 Growth parameters of ZmPMP3 EMS mutant and the wild type (B73) under control and saline conditions. (a) Gene structure of ZmPMP3 and the mutant site. (b) Sequencing chromatograms of ZmPMP3 in wild type and the EMS mutant covering the mutation site. (c) Growth morphologies of the wild-type B73 and the EMS mutant line after a 7-day exposure to saline and control treatment. Bar = 10 cm. (d–g) Root length (RL) (d), root fresh weight (RF) (e), shoot length (SL) (f) and shoot fresh weight (SF) (g) of wild type and the EMS mutant maize line under control and saline conditions. Data are shown as the mean ± SD of three independent experiments. The P values were calculated by a two-tailed Student’s t test.
amplification was carried out in a QuantStudio™ 6 Flex (ABI Life Technologies, Carlsbad, CA, USA) system. The ZmActn1 was used as the internal reference. The mRNA relative expression levels were analysed using the 2−ΔΔCt method (Luo et al., 2017b). Primers for qRT-PCR were listed in the Table S6.

Generation of *ZmCLCg* CRISPR/Cas9 knock-out maize lines

The pcambia2300-Spe vector containing the SpCas9n-pBE construct was used for plasmid construction (Wu et al., 2019). In the CRISPR/Cas9 vector, the sequences of U3 promoter, rRNA, esqRNA and the protein sequence of SpCas9 are according to previous reports (Cong et al., 2013; Xie et al., 2015). In addition, the coding sequence of SpCas9 was codon-optimized for high expression in maize and was synthesized by Nanjing Kingsley Biotechnology Co., Ltd. For CRISPR/Cas9 vector construction, the Cas9n-PmCDAl-UGI-t35s fragment in the SpCas9n-pBE construct was replaced with Cas9-t35s fragment using SnaBI and Ascl, and the 2Mubi1-Hpt-t35s fragment was replaced with the 2Mubi1-bar-135s fragment using Ascl and AvrII. The CRISPR/Cas9 vector also contains a synthetic polycistronic gene that harbours three tandemly assembled tRNA-target-gRNA (Xie et al., 2015). The three target sites located at the first, third and fourth exons of *ZmCLCg* were assembled with gRNA using Bsal. The resulting vector was transformed into the Agrobacterium tumefaciens strain EHA105 (Weidi Biotech, Shanghai, China). The Agrobacterium-mediated method was applied to transform immature embryos of maize inbred line B104. A total of 10 independent T0 transgenic plants were generated. The genomic fragments encompassing the target sites for each transgenic plant were sequenced by Sanger sequencing. No T0 plants with mutation at the target site of exon 1 were detected. One and seven T0 plant with mutation at the target site of exon 3 (Mutation efficiency = 10%) and exon 4 (Mutation efficiency = 70%) were identified, respectively. All T0 plants with mutation at the target sites were self-pollinated to get T1 progenies. PCR products covering the target sites of all T1 plants were sequenced to identify T1 plants with homozygous mutation in target sites. The confirmed homozygous mutant T1 plants and the wild-type plants were used for salt stress treatment and phenotypic determination. The primers for PCR amplification of target sites are listed in the Table S6.

Statistical analyses

Comparisons of phenotypic data and gene expression levels were conducted by unpaired two-tailed Student’s *t* tests. Student’s *t* tests and correlation analyses were conducted using the *t* test function in GraphPad Prism 5 software (http://www.graphpad.com), respectively. The means, standard deviations, coefficients of variation, kurtosis and skewness were calculated using the column statistics function in GraphPad Prism 5 software. Repeatability for each trait was determined using the R software (Luo et al., 2019). Repeatability was calculated with the formula: repeatability = σ^2r/(σ^2o + σ^2e), while σ^2r and σ^2e represent the genetic variance and the error variance, respectively.

Acknowledgements

We thank the research group of Jianbing Yan at Huazhong Agricultural University for SNP data and materials support. This work was supported by Beijing Municipal Natural Science Foundation (6204041), Youth Research Fund of Beijing Academy of Agriculture and Forestry Sciences (QNU202028), the Beijing Scholars Program (BSPO41), the Science and Technology Planning Project of Beijing (D161100005716002), the Innovative Team Construction Project of BAAFS (JNYT201603) and the National Key Research and Development Program of China (2016YFD0300106).

Conflict of interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Author contributions

Z.Y. (Yanxin Zhao), S.W. and Z.J. designed the experiment, conceived the project and supervised the study; L.M. conducted all the data analysis and wrote the manuscript; L.M., Z.Y. (Yunxia Zhang), L.J., Z.P. and C.K. performed the phenotyping; Y.J. performed the CRISPR/Cas9 editing; W.X., L.X. and L.B. analysed data. All authors reviewed the manuscript.

References

Burton, A.L., Johnson, J.M., Foerster, J.M., Hirsch, C.N., Buell, C.R., Hanlon, M.T., Kaeppler, S.M. et al. (2014) QTL mapping and phenotypic variation for root architectural traits in maize (*Zea mays* L.). *Theor. Appl. Genet.* 127, 2293–2311.

Cai, H., Chen, F., Mi, G., Zhang, F., Maurer, H.P., Liu, W., Ref, J.C. et al. (2012) Mapping QTLs for root system architecture of maize (*Zea mays* L.) in the field at different developmental stages. *Theor. Appl. Genet.* 125, 1313–1324.

Chen, W., Gao, Y., Xie, W., Gong, L., Lu, K., Wang, W., Li, Y. et al. (2014) Genome-wide association analyses provide genetic and biochemical insights into natural variation in rice metabolism. *Nat. Genet.* 46, 714–721.

Cong, L., Ran, F.A., Cox, D., Lin, S., Barretto, R., Habib, N., Hsu, P.D. et al. (2013) Multiplex genome engineering using CRISPR/Cas systems. *Science* 339, 819–823.

Cui, D., Wu, D., Somarathna, Y., Xu, C., Li, S., Li, P.; Zhang, H. et al. (2015) QTL mapping for salt tolerance based on SNP markers at the seedling stage in maize (*Zea mays* L.). *Euphytica* 203, 273–283.

Deng, M., Li, D.Q., Luo, J.Y., Xiao, Y.J., Liu, H.J., Pan, Q.C., Zhang, X.H. et al. (2017) The genetic architecture of amino acids dissection by association and linkage analysis in maize. *Plant Biotechnol. J.* 15, 1250–1263.

Frary, A., Göß, D., Keleş, D., Ökmen, B., Pinar, H., Şişa, H.O., Yemencioglu, A. et al. (2010) Salt tolerance in *Solanum pennelli*: antioxidant response and related QTL. *BMC Plant Biol.* 10, 58.

Fu, J., Cheng, Y., Linghu, J., Yang, X., Lin, K., Zhang, Z., Zhang, J. et al. (2013) RNA sequencing reveals the complex regulatory network in the maize kernel. *Nat. Commun.* 4, 2832.

Fu, J., Zhang, D.F., Lu, Y.H., Ying, S., Shi, Y.S., Song, Y.C., Li, Y. et al. (2012) Isolation and characterization of maize *PPM2* genes involved in salt stress tolerance. *PLoS ONE* 7, e31101.

Ganal, M.W., Durostewitz, G., Polley, A., Bérand, A., Buckler, E.S., Charcosset, A., Clarke, J.D. et al. (2011) A large maize (*Zea mays* L.) SNP genotyping array: development and germplasm genotyping, and genetic mapping to compare with the B73 reference genome. *PLoS ONE* 6, e28334.

Gu, L.K., Liu, Y.K., Zong, X.J., Liu, L.X., Li, D.P. and Li, D.Q. (2010) Overexpression of maize mitogen-activated protein kinase gene, *ZmSIMK1* in Arabidopsis increases tolerance to salt stress. *Mol. Biol. Rep.* 37, 4067–4073.

Guo, Q., Wu, J., Yue, X., Zhang, Y. and Zhu, J. (2013) A nuclear calcium-sensing pathway is critical for gene regulation and salt stress tolerance in *Arabidopsis*. *PLoS Gen.* 9, e1003755.

Guo, R., Chen, J., Jiang, J., Liu, G., Liu, Y., Tian, L., Yu, L. et al. (2014) Mapping and validation of a dominant salt tolerance gene in the cultivated soybean (*Glycine max*) variety Tiefeng 8. *Crop J.* 6, 358–365.
Huang, X., Wei, X., Sang, T., Zhao, Q., Feng, Q., Zhao, Y., Li, C. et al. (2018) Genome-wide association studies of 14 agronomic traits in rice landraces. *Nat. Genet.* 42, 961–967.

Juranić, M., Srilunchak, K., Krohn, N.G., Lejak-Levanić, D., Sprunk, S. and Dresselhaus, T. (2012) Germline-specific MATH-BTB substrate adaptor MAB1 regulates spindle length and nuclei identity in maize. *Plant Cell* 24, 4974–4991.

Lechner, E., Leonhardt, N., Eider, H., Parmentier, Y., Alloua, M., Jacquet, H., Leung, J. et al. (2011) MATH/BTB CRL3 receptors target the homeodomain-leucine zipper ATHB6 to modulate abscisic acid signaling. *Dev. Cell* 21, 116–121.

Li, H., Peng, Z., Yang, X., Wang, W., Fu, J., Wang, J., Han, Y. et al. (2013) Genome-wide association study dissects the genetic architecture of oil biosynthesis in maize kernels. *Nat. Genet.* 45, 43–50.

Li, P., Chen, F., Cai, H., Liu, J., Pan, Q., Liu, Z., Gu, R. et al. (2015) A genetic relationship between nitrogen use efficiency and seedling root traits in maize as revealed by QTL analysis. *J. Exp. Bot.* 66, 3175–3188.

Luo, M., Zhao, Y., Wang, Y., Shi, Z., Zhang, P., Zhang, Y., Song, W. et al. (2019a) Mapping of quantitative trait loci for seedling salt tolerance in maize. *Mol. Plant* 10, 414–426.

Luo, M., Xu, X., Zhang, M., Wang, C., Xu, Q., Feng, Y., Yang, X. et al. (2018) Genome-wide association study of seed dormancy and the genomic consequences of improvement footprints in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Front. Plant Sci.* 8, 2213.

Lu, W., Tang, X., Huo, Y., Xu, R., Qi, S., Huang, J., Zheng, C. et al. (2012) Identification and characterization of fructose 1,6-bisphosphate aldolase genes in *Arabidopsis* reveal a gene family with diverse responses to abiotic stresses. *Gene* 503, 65–74.

Luo, M.J., Zhang, Y.X., Chen, K., Kong, M.S., Song, W., Lu, B.S., Shi, Y.X. et al. (2019a) Mapping of quantitative trait loci for seedling salt tolerance in maize. *Mol. Breed.* 39, 64.

Luo, M., Zhao, Y., Song, W., Zhang, R., Lu, A., Li, C., Wang, X. et al. (2017a) Effect of saline stress on the physiology and growth of maize hybrids and their related inbred lines. *Mycidia* 62, M11.

Luo, M., Zhao, Y., Zhang, R., Xing, J., Duan, M., Li, J., Wang, N. et al. (2017b) Mapping of a major QTL for salt tolerance of mature field-grown maize plants based on SNP markers. *BMC Plant Biol.* 17, 140.

Luo, M., Zhao, Y., Wang, Y., Shi, Z., Zhang, P., Zhang, Y., Song, W. et al. (2018) Comparative proteomics of contrasting maize genotypes provides insights into salt-stress tolerance mechanisms. *J. Proteome Res.* 17, 141–153.

Luo, Q.L., Zheng, Q., Hu, P., Liu, L.Q., Yang, G.T., Li, H.W., Li, B. et al. (2021) Mapping QTL for agronomic traits under two levels of salt stress in a new constructed RIL wheat population. *Genome-wide association studies of 14 agronomic traits in rice landraces.*

Luo, X., Wang, B.C., Gao, S., Zhang, F., Terzaghi, W. and Dai, M.Q. (2019b) *Mapping of quantitative trait loci for seedling salt tolerance in maize.*

Munns, R. and Tester, M. (2008) *Mechanisms of salinity tolerance.* Plant Physiol. 157, 917–936.

Yang, W.L., Wang, H.W., Liu, S.X., Ferjan, A., Li, J.S., Yan, J.B. and Yang, X.H. (2016) Genetic variation in *ZmVRPI* contributes to drought tolerance in maize seedlings. *Nat. Genet.* 48, 1233–1241.

Xie, Q.X., Zhang, R.Y., Song, W., Han, L., Liu, X.L., Sun, X., Luo, M.J. et al. (2019) Dynamic plant height QTL revealed in maize through remote sensing phenotyping using a high-throughput unmanned aerial vehicle (UAV). *Sci. Rep.* 9, 3458.

Wang, Y., Xu, W., Wang, F.P., Zhao, S., Feng, F., Song, J.L., Zhang, C.W. et al. (2019) Increasing cyanosine base editing scope and efficiency with engineered Cas9-PmCDA1 fusions and the modified sgRNA in rice. *Front. Genet.* 10, 379.

Xiao, Q., Wang, Y., Du, J., Li, H., Wei, B., Wang, Y., Li, Y. et al. (2017) *ZmMYB14* is an important transcription factor involved in the regulation of the activity of the *ZmBTT* promoter in starch biosynthesis in maize. *FEBS J.* 284, 3079–3099.

Xie, K.B., Minkenberg, B. and Yang, Y.N. (2015) Boosting CRISPR/Cas9 multiplex editing capability with the endogenous rDNA-processing system. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 112, 3570–3575.

Xie, Y., Feng, Y., Chen, Q., Zhao, F., Zhou, S., Ding, Y., Song, X. et al. (2019) Genome-wide association analyses of salt tolerance QTLs with SNP markers in maize (*Zea mays* L.). *Genes Genom.* 41, 1135–1145.

Yang, S.H., Zhang, C.X., Piao, M.X., Zhao, Z.S., Yang, D.G., Li, W.J., Liu, W.G. et al. (2011a) Analysis on salt and alkaline tolerance of sixty-nine maize inbred lines at seedling stage. *Seed* 30, 1–6.

Yang, X., Gao, S., Xu, S., Zhang, Z., Prasanna, B.M., Li, L., Li, J. et al. (2011b) Characterization of a global germplasm collection and its potential utilization for analysis of complex quantitative traits in maize. *Mol. Breeding* 28, 511–526.

Yilmaz, A., Nishiyama Jr, M.Y., Fuentes, B.G., Souza, G.M., Janies, D., Gray, J. and Grotewold, E. (2009) GRASSIUS: a platform for comparative regulatory analysis of complex quantitative traits in maize. *Plant Physiol.* 149, 171–180.

Ying, S., Zhang, D.F., Fu, J., Shi, Y.S., Song, Y.C., Wang, T.Y. and Li, Y. (2012) Cloning and characterization of a maize bZIP transcription factor, *ZmbZIP72*, confers drought and salt tolerance in transgenic *Arabidopsis*. *Planta* 235, 253–266.

Yu, L., Ma, J., Niu, Z., Bai, X., Lei, W., Shao, X., Chen, N. et al. (2017) Tissue-specific transcriptome analysis reveals multiple responses to salt stress in *Populus euphratica* seedlings. *Genes* 8, 372.

Zeng, P., Zhu, P.W., Qian, L.F., Qian, X.M., Li, Y.X., Lin, Z.F., Dong, S.N. et al. (2021) Identification and fine mapping of *dGInR2*, a novel locus controlling rice seed germination under salt stress. *BMC Plant Biol.* 21, 36.

Zhang, D., Jiang, S., Pan, J., Kong, X., Zhou, Y., Liu, Y. and Li, D. (2014) The overexpression of a maize mitogen-activated protein kinase gene (*ZmMPK5*) confers salt stress tolerance and induces defense responses in tobacco. *BMC Biol.* 16, 558–570.

Zhang, F., Wang, L., Qi, B., Zhao, B., Ko, E.E., Riggin, N.D., Chin, K. et al. (2017) *EIN2* mediates direct regulation of histone acetylation in the ethylene response. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 114, 10274–10279.

Zhang, J., Song, Q., Cregan, P.B., Nelson, R.L., Wang, X., Wu, J. and Jiang, G.L. (2015) Genome-wide association study for flowering time, maturity dates and plant height in early maturing soybean (*Glycine max*) germplasm. *BMC Genom.* 16, 217.

Zhang, J., Song, Q., Cregan, P.B. and Jiang, G.L. (2016) Genome-wide association study, genomic prediction and marker-assisted selection for seed weight in soybean (*Glycine max*). *Theor. Appl. Genet.* 129, 117–130.

Zhang, M., Cao, Y., Wang, Z., Wang, Q.Z., Shi, J., Liang, X., Song, W. et al. (2018) A retrotransposon in an *HKT1* family sodium transporter causes
variation of leaf Na\(^{+}\) exclusion and salt tolerance in maize. *New Phytol.* 217, 1161–1176.

Zhang, M., Liang, X.Y., Wang, L.M., Cao, Y.B., Song, W.B., Shi, J.P., Lai, J.S. et al. (2019) A HAK family Na\(^{+}\) transporter confers natural variation of salt tolerance in maize. *Nat. Plants* 5, 1297–1308.

Zhang, X., Tang, B., Yu, F., Li, L., Wang, M., Xue, Y., Zhang, Z. et al. (2013) Identification of major QTL for waterlogging tolerance using genome-wide association and linkage mapping of maize seedlings. *Plant Mol. Biol. Rep.* 31, 594–606.

Supporting information

Additional supporting information may be found online in the Supporting Information section at the end of the article.

**Figure S1** Frequency distributions of all 27 traits collected from the maize association panel. SL: shoot length; RL: root length; FL: full length of seedling; SF: shoot fresh weight; RF: root fresh weight; FF: full fresh weight of seedling; SD: shoot dry weight; RD: root dry weight; FD: full dry weight of seedling. SL, RL, FL, SF, RF, FF, SD, RD and FD represent traits under normal conditions; SLS, RLS, FLS, SFS, RFS, FFS, SDS, RDS and FDS represent traits under salt stress condition; SLR, RLR, FLR, SFR, RFR, FFR, SDR, RDR and FDR represent salt tolerance indexes of traits.

**Figure S2** Pearson’s correlation coefficients (\(r\)) between 27 maize traits (nine each in the control and under salt stress conditions, and nine salt tolerance indexes). Correlation coefficients were calculated from mean values of three biological replicates for each trait of the maize association population. See Figure S1 caption for abbreviations.

**Figure S3** Quantile–quantile (QQ) plots of genome-wide association study (GWAS) results using different association models for maize shoot length trait under salt treatment conditions. Horizontal dashed red line represents significance threshold (1.79 \(\times\) 10\(^{-6}\)).

**Figure S4** Manhattan plots for all 27 maize traits using Q + K mixed linear model. See Figure S1 caption for abbreviations.

**Figure S5** QQ plots for all 27 maize traits using Q + K mixed linear model. See Figure S1 caption for abbreviations.

**Figure S6** Growth status and growth parameters of B104, B73, the significantly salt-tolerant maize inbred line GEMS37, and the significantly salt sensitive maize inbred line CIMBL157 after culturing in control or saline water for 10 days. (a) Growth status; (b) Root length; (c) Root fresh weight; (d) Shoot length; (e) Shoot fresh weight. Data are shown as the mean ± SE of three independent experiments. The \(P\) values were calculated by a two-tailed Student’s \(t\) test.

**Figure S7** KOG functional categories for maize genes within significant QTL regions

**Figure S8** Candidate regions associated with salt tolerance and phenotypic differences between two alleles of most significant trait-associated single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs). SNPs within candidate regions are highlighted in green. Peak SNPs are marked by arrows. (a–d), Candidate regions associated with RLS, SFS, RLS and RLS located on chromosome 2, 7, 7 and 10, respectively (left). Phenotypic differences in RLS, SFS, RLS and RLS between two alleles of peak SNPs (right). ***\(P<0.001\)

**Table S1** List of 348 maize lines used in this study

**Table S2** List of significant maize SNP-trait associations and detailed information identified by GWAS

**Table S3** Numbers of significant loci for measured maize traits

**Table S4** Summary of significant loci identified by multiple maize traits

**Table S5** List of all genes within significant maize loci and their positional and annotational information

**Table S6** Primers used in this study