Improved Serious Illness Communication May Help Mitigate Racial Disparities in Care Among Black Americans with COVID-19

Lauren T. Starr, PhD, MBE, RN1, Nina R. O’Connor, MD, FAAHPM2, and Salimah H. Meghani, PhD, MBE, RN, FAAN1

1NewCourtland Center for Transitions and Health, University of Pennsylvania School of Nursing, Philadelphia, PA, USA; 2University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine, Philadelphia, PA, USA.

PERSPECTIVE

In response to decades of systemic racism, protests calling for equality are occurring across the United States. Black Americans want change. This is not surprising given so many Black Americans experience racial discrimination, including in healthcare encounters.1,2 Unfortunately, the COVID-19 pandemic has both revealed and exacerbated racial inequalities in health.3 Deterred by discrimination, myriad barriers, and clinician biases, Black Americans have been less likely than Whites to be referred for coronavirus testing3 and are more likely to postpone seeking care until illness is so advanced it requires hospitalization,4 contributing to health disparities in COVID-19 outcomes.5,6 Black Americans are dying from coronavirus at more than twice the rate of White Americans,7 with even greater disparities among persons of working age.8 Although Black Americans represent 13% of the population, they represent nearly 25% of COVID-related deaths.7 The age-adjusted COVID-19 death rate for Black Americans is 3.6 times that of Whites,9 underscoring evidence that social determinants are at the root of health disparities.6,10,11 Disparities in COVID mortality rates have been attributed to higher incidence of co-morbidities (e.g., heart disease, diabetes); socioeconomic factors such as population density, residential segregation, and a greater likelihood to work in service industry jobs that increase exposure to COVID-19; limited access to care; and clinician biases that affect how providers perceive and communicate with Black patients, possibly delaying coronavirus diagnosis and affecting treatment.5,10–13 Unfortunately, pandemics have historically amplified existing health inequities and disproportionately affected disadvantaged groups.8

In addition to enduring disparities in health outcomes, Black Americans experience poorer quality patient-clinician communication compared to Whites.14,15 This difference is problematic given effective communication is a cornerstone of patient-centered care and preference-consistent outcomes.16,17 Racism, discrimination, and feeling unheard in healthcare encounters contribute to racial disparities in health communication.14,18,19 Even when seriously ill, Black Americans are less likely than Whites to experience discussions with their healthcare providers about prognosis, personal goals, values, and end-of-life treatment preferences.20 In addition, lack of racial diversity resulting from relatively low numbers of Black clinicians can further contribute to poorer communication quality, information-giving, patient participation, and participatory shared decision-making for Black patients compared to Whites.15,21 In this paper, we argue that engaging palliative care early in patient care may help close racial gaps in coronavirus outcomes and that incorporating goals-of-care communication tools and training across settings and specialties may improve outcome disparities among Black Americans with COVID-19.

The pandemic has highlighted the importance of discussing care goals and providing goal-concordant care to vulnerable older adults and those with chronic or acute illnesses,22 including Black Americans at greater risk for poor COVID-19 outcomes.5 Discussing care goals is critical given the likelihood a COVID-19 vaccine may not be adopted by Black Americans as readily as members of other racial groups.23 Citing fear of safety and efficacy of the vaccine and concern that vaccine development is not taking the needs of Black Americans into account,2,23 half of Black adults report they do not plan to take the vaccine once one becomes available—even if it is free and scientists declare it safe.2 Palliative care consultations involving discussions about patient goals and values, which are recommended by the National Institute of Health when caring for persons with COVID-19,24 may help mitigate racial disparities associated with serious illnesses such as COVID-19. Researchers have found Black patients are as likely as White patients to engage in goals-of-care conversations when led by trained palliative care clinicians.20,25 Primary palliative care and hospital-based palliative care teams trained in serious illness communication support patient decision-making by providing
empathic communication and culturally sensitive information sharing. The palliative care approach, which emphasizes listening to patient values and goals and clarifying prognosis and care options in addition to meeting physical needs, benefits patients and families across races.

Studies of home-based palliative care and inpatient palliative care have demonstrated favorable outcomes for Black Americans with serious illness, including increased satisfaction, increased documentation of treatment preferences, and higher rates of home death and hospice referrals.20, 21 Recent research shows, for example, that seriously ill Black patients who had a goals-of-care consultation were 15 times more likely to choose hospice than demographically and clinically similar, propensity score–matched Black patients without a consultation.18 Evidence also shows seriously ill Black patients live longer when they receive palliative care consultation.20 These findings suggest palliative care’s approach to goals-of-care communication helps Black Americans clarify treatment preferences in light of personal goals.

As the pandemic has progressed, the field of palliative care has emerged as a leader in effective communication tailored to the needs of patients with COVID-19 and patients at risk for poor COVID-19 outcomes. Emphasizing patient health literacy and personal values and goals, palliative care clinicians have adapted goals-of-care communication to include language specific to symptom trajectories, treatment options, prognosis and risk assessment, advance care planning, and uncertainties associated with COVID-19—all in the context of individual patient needs.26–37 Ariadne Labs,26, 27 Vital Talk,28 Respecting Choices,29 the National Hospice and Palliative Care Organization,30 the Center to Advance Palliative Care,31, 32 and other organizations33–37 offer free conversation guides, tools, and video resources designed to help clinicians lead COVID-19 care goal discussions and advance care planning across settings and languages with patients and surrogate decision-makers (Table 1).

Fortunately, palliative care providers are not the only clinicians capable of leading meaningful care goal discussions. One way to increase serious illness communication during the COVID-19 pandemic is to involve all clinicians in inpatient and outpatient care goal discussions and advance care planning.40 By using serious illness communication tools tailored around the needs of persons at risk for poor COVID-19 outcomes, clinicians in primary and specialty care can lead these discussions across settings—including at home and in long-term care, nursing homes, dialysis centers, and other nonacute places of care before patients become severely ill.40–42 Engaging Black Americans and other racial/ethnic minorities in a tailored community-based communication intervention—for example, at churches or social service organizations where mistrust of healthcare systems may not be as strong a barrier—may increase prevalence of these discussions in minority communities before patients are hospitalized.43–46

| Organization | Resource | Description |
|--------------|----------|-------------|
| Ariadne Labs26, 27 | Serious Illness Care Program COVID-19 Response Toolkit | Free tools and communication guides for patients and clinicians in inpatient, outpatient, and long-term care settings to discuss goals, values, and care planning with patients at risk for or infected by COVID-19. |
| Vital Talk28 | COVID Ready Communication Playbook | A free compilation of scripts, guides, and tips for clinicians to reference when discussing numerous aspects of COVID-19 with patients and families; features video examples and collaborative resources. |
| Respecting Choices29 | Proactive Planning Conversations in the context of COVID-19 | Free conversation guides and videos for patients and clinicians to support advance care planning; features general scripts and scripts for scheduling, medical priorities, and treatment priorities. |
| National Hospice and Palliative Care Organization30 | COVID-19 Shared Decision-Making Tool | A free guide that helps patients determine COVID-19 risk level, what they’d want if they became seriously ill with COVID-19, and links to access free advance directive templates (by state) and access to The Five Wishes values assessment. |
| Center to Advance Palliative Care31 | COVID-19 Response Resource Hub: Goals of Care | A free conversation map that includes specific phrases to use when talking to patients with COVID-19 about goals of care; features multiple editable scripts for clinicians and video examples. |
| Center to Advance Palliative Care32 | COVID-19 Response Resource Hub: Advance Care Planning | A free conversation map that includes specific phrases to use when talking to patients with COVID-19 about values and future care planning; features multiple editable scripts for clinicians and video examples. |
| Institute for Healthcare Improvement, Cambia Health Foundation, And Ariadne Labs33–37 | PREPARE for your care | Free online tool that helps patients identify |
Although palliative care communication and related tools strive to place patients and families at the center of care, there is always a potential for clinician biases to influence care quality. In addition to better training clinicians in serious illness communication, particularly as it relates to COVID-19, health systems should provide clinicians with evidence-based racial and cultural sensitivity training, implicit and explicit bias training, and resources to help reduce the effects of clinician bias on patients and families.\textsuperscript{52, 55} Effective implicit bias training for clinicians has the potential to improve patient-provider interactions and communication,\textsuperscript{53} possibly improving clinical experiences and outcomes for Black Americans at risk of acquiring or dying from COVID-19.

Using existing tools ensures patients and caregivers are given a voice in each conversation, reduces communication differences, and helps overcome clinician discomfort with talking about illness or death. Tools that guide communication also ensure patients do the majority of the talking and promote clinician listening, resulting in extremely personal, individualized conversations. Use of these tools honors each patient’s personhood and helps clinicians avoid assumptions about a patient’s goals and values, helping to neutralize a clinician’s implicit or unconscious biases. Concerted research is needed to better understand the effectiveness of these tools in mitigating biases and reducing racial disparities in serious illness care, including the care of patients with COVID-19.

Clinicians should also initiate care goal discussions with patients at risk for poor COVID outcomes early in the illness trajectory\textsuperscript{54–59} and, for the most vulnerable patients including those in nursing homes or long-term care where COVID infection can spread rapidly, even before infection.\textsuperscript{26, 56} Given the unpredictable and sometimes swift nature of COVID-19, early discussion of risk and care preferences gives patients the opportunity to better protect themselves and think about what matters most to them should they become severely ill with COVID-19 before acute crises arise or they lose the ability to communicate. Early discussion helps patients, families, and clinicians work together as a team to make a plan should symptoms develop and worsen so that each patient has an opportunity to receive high quality care consistent with personal goals. Even if coronavirus symptoms do not require hospitalization, good COVID-19 communication and shared decision-making benefit patients by helping patients feel known, heard, informed, and more in control over healthcare decision-making.\textsuperscript{60–62}

In general, seriously ill patients across races have these conversations too close to death. Although disparities in the timing of goals-of-care conversations have not been studied among Black patients with COVID-19, the possibility of late discussions is particularly problematic for this population given their higher mortality rates. It is essential that palliative care consultations and goals-of-care discussions be of similar quality, equal accessibility, and delivered in a timely manner.

---

These discussions can also be conducted via telehealth technology, a platform patients and clinicians have rapidly adopted during the pandemic.\textsuperscript{47, 48} When patients, families, or surrogate decision-makers cannot be physically present to discuss treatment options with clinicians, telecommunication discussions help meet patient needs\textsuperscript{24} while restoring a sense of human connection in difficult social distancing circumstances.\textsuperscript{26} Although not a replacement for patient-provider conversations, online tools such as OurCareWishes.org, a free platform designed to guide patients and families through advance care planning, may also be used to help high-risk patients clarify goals and share preferences with providers\textsuperscript{38, 39} (Table 1).

As part of continuing education, health systems should provide clinicians with evidence-based communication tools adapted for COVID-19 and persons with serious illness\textsuperscript{26–37} and provide training that enables effective implementation across patient populations.\textsuperscript{50} Best practices for using communication guides to teach basic palliative care communication skills to interdisciplinary groups across primary and specialty care are freely available.\textsuperscript{36, 51}
to meet the needs of seriously ill patients across races.21, 55
Systematic early initiation of these conversations in outpatient
settings among patients at risk for poor COVID outcomes and
upon hospital admission may help reduce possible disparities
in communication timing, which can affect decision-making
and subsequent outcomes.35, 57, 58

Little is known about the quality of serious illness communica-
tion that Black Americans with COVID-19 receive. Re-
search is needed to understand if racial/ethnic communication
disparities affect COVID-19 outcomes—including quality of
life, quality of death, and mortality—and how palliative care
consultation and communication tools may help reduce out-
come disparities. To conduct rigorous research and mitigate
factors contributing to COVID-19 racial disparity outcomes,
healthcare systems and public health officials must work to
provide high-quality data related to race/ethnicity, serious
illness communication, and outcomes.5 Data linking use of
communication tools to racial outcomes in serious illness and
COVID care is especially needed. Failure to collect and use
such data limits clinicians’ ability to implement targeted clinical
interventions that may improve the care of vulnerable
Black Americans.

As subsequent waves of coronavirus infection hit the United States, mortality increases, and long-term effects of infection emerge, the COVID-19 pandemic will continue to disproportionately affect Black Americans and other racial/ethnic minorities.8, 9 As clinicians, it is our responsibility to identify solutions for racial inequities and work to improve outcomes for Black Americans, starting with understanding their personal care goals. Failure to engage Black Americans with COVID-19 and other serious illnesses in culturally sensitive conversations about personal values, prognosis, and care preferences may result in poorer quality care for Black Americans.63–65 All patients, regardless of race or ethnicity, should have the opportunity to meaningfully discuss what matters most to them. For Black Americans who already endure discrimination and disparities in serious illness and end-of-life care, these conversations are desperately needed.

Corresponding Author: Lauren T. Starr, PhD, MBE, RN; NewCourt-
land Center for Transitions and Health, University of Pennsylvania
School of Nursing, Philadelphia, PA, USA (e-mail: lstarr@nursing.
upenn.edu).

Funding LT Starr received support from the Ruth L. Kirschstein
National Research Service Award training program in Individualized
Care for At Risk Older Adults at the University of Pennsylvania,
National Institute of Nursing Research (T32NR003356) and Wash-
ington University in St. Louis Goldfarb School of Nursing. SH Mekhani
is supported in part by the National Institute of Nursing Research,
National Institutes of Health (R01NR017853).

Compliance with Ethical Standards:
Conflict of Interest: The authors declare that they do not have a
conflict of interest.

REFERENCES

1. Stepanikova I, Gates GR. Perceived Discrimination and Privilege in Health Care: The Role of Socioeconomic Status and Race. Am J Prev Med. 2017;52(1S1):S56–S94. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2016.09.024
2. Kaiser Family Foundation/The Undefeated. Race, Health, and COVID-19: The Views and Experiences of Black Americans, October 2020. Survey conducted August 20–September 14, 2020. Available at https://www.kff.org/racial-equity-and-health-policy/report/kff-the-undefeated-survey-on-race-and-health/
3. Lieberman-Cribbin W, Tuminiello S, Flores RM, Tafoli E. Disparities in COVID-19 Testing and Positivity in New York City. American Journal of Preventive Medicine. 2020;59(3):326–332. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.
amjepre.2020.06.005
4. Azar KMJ, Shen Z, Romanelli BJ, et al. Disparities in Outcomes Among COVID-19 Patients in A Large Health Care System In California. Health Aff (Millwood). 2020;39(7):1253–1262. https://doi.org/10.1377/hlthaff.2020.00598
5. Webb Hooper M, Nápoles AM, Pérez-Stable EJ. COVID-19 and Racial and Ethnic Disparities. JAMA. 2020;323(24):2466–2467. https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.8598
6. Kim EJ, Marrast L, Consigliaro J. COVID-19: Magnifying the Effect of Health Disparities. J Gen Intern Med. 2020;35(8):2441–2442. https://doi.
.org/10.1001/s11606-020-05881-4
7. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Health Disparities: Race and Hispanic Origin. Provisional Death Counts for Coronavirus Disease 2019
COVID-19. Updated July 22, 2020. Accessed August 30, 2020. https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/nvss/vsrr/covid19/health_disparities.htm
8. Ford T, Reber S, Reves RV. Race gaps in COVID-19 deaths are even
bigger than they appear. Brookings Institute. June 16, 2020. https://www.brookings.edu/blog/up-front/2020/06/16/race-gaps-in-covid-19-
deaths-are-even-bigger-than-they-appear. Accessed August 18, 2020.
9. Gross CP, Essien UR, Pasha S, Gross JR, Wang SY, Nunez-Smith M. Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Population-Level Covid-19 Mortality
published online ahead of print, 2020 Aug 4. J Gen Intern Med. 2020;1-
3. https://doi.org/10.1186/s11606-020-05681-w
10. Mein SA. COVID-19 and Health Disparities: the Reality of “the Great Equalizer”. J Gen Intern Med. 2020;35(8):2439-2440. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2020.11660-020-05880-5
11. Quinn SC, Kumar S, Freimuth VS, et al. Racial disparities in exposure, susceptibility, and access to health care in the US H1N1 influenza
demic. Am J Public Health. 2011;101(2):285-93. https://doi.org/10.
2105/AJPH.2009.188029.
12. Hall WJ, Chapman MV, Lee KM, et al. Implicit Racial/Ethnic Bias Among Health Care Professionals and Its Influence on Health Care Outcomes: A Systematic Review. Am J Public Health. 2015;105(12):e60- e76. https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2015.302804
13. Alcendor DJ. Racial Disparities-Associated COVID-19 Mortality among Minority Populations in the US. J Clin Med. 2020;9(5):E2442. Published
2020 Jul 30. https://doi.org/10.3390/jcm906E2442
14. Benkert R, Peters R, Clark R, Reves-Foster K. (2006). Effects of
Perceived Racism, Cultural Mistrust and Trust in Clinicians on Satisfac-
tion with Care. Journal of the National Medical Association. 98. 1532-40.
15. Shen MJ, Peterson EB, Costas-Muñiz R, et al. The Effects of Race and
Racial Concordance on Patient-Physician Communication: A Systematic
Review of the Literature. J Racial Ethn Health Disparities. 2018;5(1):117-
140. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40615-017-0350-4
16. Hudson C, Fortin M, Haggerty JL, Lambert M. Poitrás ME. Measuring
patients’ perceptions of patient-centered care: a systematic review of tools
for family medicine. Ann Fam Med. 2011;9(2):155-164. https://doi.
org/10.1370/afm.1226
17. McMillan SS, Kendall E, Sav A, et al. Patient-centered approaches to
health care: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials. Med Care
Res Rev. 2015;70(6):567–596. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077558714538518
18. Cuervas AG, O’Brien K, Saha S. African American experiences in
healthcare: ’I always feel like I’m getting skipped over’. Health Psychol.
2016;35(9):987-995. https://doi.org/10.1037/hea0000368
19. Hausmann LR, Hannon MJ, Kresevic DM, Hanusa BH, Kwoh CK, Ibrahim SA. Impact of perceived discrimination in healthcare on patient-provider communication. Med Care. 2011;49(7):626-633. https://doi.
org/10.1097/mlr.0b013e3182154b0e
20. Starr LT, Ulrich CM, Jumper P, Appel SM, O’Connor NR, Mekhani SH. Goals-of-Care Consultation Associated with Increased Hospice Enrollment
Among Propensity-Matched Cohorts of Seriously Ill African
61. Romo RD, Allison TA, Smith AK, Wallhagen MI. Sense of Control in End-of-Life Decision-Making. J Am Geriatr Soc. 2017;65(3):e70-e75. https://doi.org/10.1111/jgs.14711

62. Sanders JJ, Curtis JR, Tulsky JA. Achieving Goal-Concordant Care: A Conceptual Model and Approach to Measuring Serious Illness Communication and Its Impact. J Palliat Med. 2018;21(S2):S17-S27. https://doi.org/10.1089/jpm.2017.0459

63. Dying in America Improving Quality and Honoring Individual Preferences Near the End of Life. The Institute of Medicine; 2014.

64. Clark M, Person S, Gosline A, et al.: Racial and ethnic differences in advance care planning; results of a statewide population-based survey. J Palliat Med 2018;21:1078–1085.

65. Eneanya ND, Wenger JB, Waite K, et al.: Racial disparities in end-of-life communication and preferences among chronic kidney disease patients. Am J Nephrol 2016;44:46-53.

Publisher’s Note: Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.