An exceptional fossil skull from South America and the origins of the archosauriform radiation

Felipe L. Pinheiro1, Marco A. G. França2, Marcel B. Lacerda3, Richard J. Butler4 & Cesar L. Schultz3

Birds, dinosaurs, crocodilians, pterosaurs and their close relatives form the highly diverse clade Archosauriformes. Archosauriforms have a deep evolutionary history, originating in the late Permian, prior to the end-Permian mass extinction, and radiating in the Triassic to dominate Mesozoic ecosystems. However, the origins of this clade and its extraordinarily successful body plan remain obscure. Here, we describe an exceptionally preserved fossil skull from the Lower Triassic of Brazil, representing a new species, Teyujagua paradoxa, transitional in morphology between archosauriforms and more primitive reptiles. This skull reveals for the first time the mosaic assembly of key features of the archosauriform skull, including the antorbital and mandibular fenestrae, serrated teeth, and closed lower temporal bar. Phylogenetic analysis recovers Teyujagua as the sister taxon to Archosauriformes, and is congruent with a two-phase model of early archosauriform evolution, in response to two mass extinctions occurring at the end of the Guadalupian and the Permian.

Results
Systematic palaeontology. Diapsida Osborn, 1903 sensu Laurin, 1991
Sauria McCartney, 1802 sensu Gauthier et al. 1988
Archosauromorpha Huene, 1946 sensu Gauthier et al. 1988
Teyujagua paradoxa gen. et sp. nov.

Etymology. Genus named after Teyú Yaguá, one of the seven legendary beasts in the mythology of the Guarani ethnic group, who occupied a large territory of central east South America, including the type locality

1Laboratório de Paleobiologia, Universidade Federal do Pampa, São Gabriel, Brazil. 2Laboratório de Paleontologia e Evolução de Petrolina, Universidade Federal do Vale do São Francisco, Petrolina, Brazil. 3Laboratório de Paleontologia de Vertebrados, Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, Brazil. 4School of Geography, Earth & Environmental Sciences, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to F.L.P. (email: felipepinheiro@unipampa.edu.br)

Received: 18 December 2015
Accepted: 22 February 2016
Published: 11 March 2016
of the new species. Teyú Yagúa, literally meaning ‘fierce lizard’, is commonly represented as a dog-headed lizard. Species name derived from paradoxa, Greek meaning ‘paradoxical’, ‘unexpected’, owing to its unusual combination of plesiomorphic and derived characters.

Holotype. UNIPAMPA 653, an almost complete, well-preserved skull with associated cervical vertebrae.

Type locality and age. Exposure of the Sanga do Cabral Formation, Paraná Basin, São Francisco de Assis municipality, Rio Grande do Sul State, Southern Brazil (29°36’56”S, 55°03’10”W) (Fig. 1). An Induan to early Olenekian age (Lower Triassic) is inferred for the Sanga do Cabral Formation based on the presence of the para-reptile Procolophon trigoniceps, and comparisons with the coeval Lystrosaurus Assemblage Zone of the South African Karoo13–15. Teyujagua was found in close association with archosauromorph vertebrae, cranial and post-cranial remains of P. trigoniceps, temnospondyl amphibians and as-yet-unidentified tetrapod bones.

Diagnosis. Archosauromorph with the following unique character combination: confluent, dorsally positioned external nares; maxilla participating in orbital margin; antorbital fenestra absent; trapezoidal infratemporal fenestra with incomplete lower temporal bar; teeth serrated on distal margins; surangular bearing a lateral shelf; external mandibular fenestrae present and positioned beneath the orbits when the lower jaw is in occlusion (autapomorphic for Teyujagua).

Description. The 115 mm long skull is well preserved and almost complete, and is associated with four cervical vertebrae (Figs 2 and 3; Supplementary Fig. 1). The occipital and palatal regions and parts of the left side of the skull are still covered by the enclosing matrix, but were partially examined using computed tomography (CT) (Supplementary Fig. 2).

The snout is relatively broad and flattened, with dorsally positioned, confluent external nares. Dorsal confluent nares are an unusual condition that is often linked to aquatic or semi-aquatic habits, being present in many crocodyliforms, although they also occur in the terrestrial rhynchosaurs16, which are near relatives of early archosauriforms. The nasals contribute substantially to the skull table, followed by short and broad frontals, and parietals that bear a small pineal foramen. Although the loss of the pineal foramen has been identified as a synapomorphy of archosauriforms8, this structure is variably absent or present in the early archosauriform Proterosuchus fergusi12 and the close archosauriform relative Prolacerta broomi17. The prefrontals and sculptured postfrontals almost exclude the frontals from the dorsal orbital margin, whereas the maxilla participates in the anteroventral orbital margin. The orbits face anterolaterally, and were probably capable of at least limited binocular vision. The slender supratemporals are visible in dorsal view.

The premaxillae have well-developed, slender posterodorsal processes but lack anterodorsal processes, as a result of the confluent nares. An antorbital fossa/fenestra is absent from the maxillae (Fig. 3C). The jugals are triradiate, with main bodies ornamented with longitudinal ridges. The posterior jugal process tapers distally and does not reach the quadratojugal (Fig. 3B). The trapezoidal infratemporal openings were ventrally bordered by incomplete lower temporal bars, similar to the condition in non-archosauriform archosauromorphs such as Prolacerta, Protosaurus and Mesosuchus16,17. By contrast, the lower temporal bar is complete in nearly all archosauriforms, although this character is variable in Proterosuchus fergusi12.

On the lower jaw, the surangulars bear lateral shelves that match closely with the ventral margins of the posterior processes of the jugals. The external mandibular fenestra is present, unusually anteriorly positioned, and ventrally bordered by a slender ascending process of the angular. The posterior contacts of the dentaries with
the post-dentary bones cannot be identified. However, CT scans reveal that the dentary tooth row ends slightly anterior to the maxillary one (Supplementary Fig. 2).

Figure 2. *Teyujagua paradoxa* holotype (UNIPAMPA 653). Photographs and interpretative drawings in right lateral (A,B) and dorsal (C,D) views. Abbreviations: an, angular; dt, dentary; emf, external mandibular fenestra; fr, frontal; ju, jugal; la, lacrimal; mx, maxilla; na, nasal; pa, parietal; pmx, premaxilla; po, postorbital; pofr, postfrontal; prf, prefrontal; q, quadratojugal; qj, quadratojugal; rap, retroarticular process; sa, surangular; sq, squamosal; st, supratemporal. Artwork by J. Anderson.

Figure 3. Close ups of the skull of *Teyujagua paradoxa* (UNIPAMPA 653). (A), posterior left maxillary teeth, showing serrations; (B), posterior process of the left jugal; (C), rostrum.
Each premaxilla possesses four teeth and the maxilla had a maximum of 15. The teeth bear serrations on their distal margins only, as in proterosuchid archosauriforms, but differing from the condition in more derived archosauriforms in which serrations are usually present on both mesial and distal margins (Fig. 3A). Pronounced heterodonty is evident, with small premaxillary teeth followed by considerably larger anterior maxillary teeth. The teeth are labiolingually compressed, held in well-defined sockets, and not firmly associated with surrounding alveolar bone. Implementation therefore appears to be thecodont, rather than ankylothecodont as in many of the earliest archosauriforms.

Phylogeny. Our novel cladistic analysis recovered two most parsimonious trees with 872 steps (Supplementary Fig. 3). The strict consensus of these topologies (Fig. 4) positions Teyuagagua as the sister taxon of Archosauriformes, a position previously occupied by the Lower Triassic Prolacerta, Teyuagagua and the basal archosauriform Proterosuchus. (i) serrated teeth; (ii) external mandibular fenestra; (iii) closed lower temporal bar; (iv) antorbital fenestra. Prolacerta and Proterosuchus skulls redrawn from an artwork by M. Ezcurra. Not to scale.

**Figure 4.** Archosauromorphp phylogeny showing the recovered position of Teyuagagua. Top: strict consensus tree summarising phylogenetic results. Bottom: sequence of acquisition of archosauriform features among the archosauromorphs Prolacerta, Teyuagagua and the basal archosauriform Proterosuchus. (i) serrated teeth; (ii) external mandibular fenestra; (iii) closed lower temporal bar; (iv) antorbital fenestra. Prolacerta and Proterosuchus skulls redrawn from an artwork by M. Ezcurra. Not to scale.
less inclusive clade. As such, four recognised groups compose non-archosaurian Archosauriformes: Proterosuchidae, Erythrosuchidae, Euparkeriidae and the clade including Chanaresuchus + (Doswellia + Vancleavea).

Another analysis was performed including the poorly known Eorasaurus, which may be the oldest known archosauriform. The analysis recovered 14 most parsimonious trees with 873 steps. Most of the recovered topologies are similar to those recovered in the first phylogenetic analysis. The consensus tree differs in positioning Eorasaurus in an unresolved polytomy together with Koilamasuchus, Fugusuchus, erythrosuchid taxa, and a clade composed of Euparkeriidae + Proterochampsia + Archosauria (Supplementary Fig. 5). This provides additional support for the archosauriform affinities of Eorasaurus, and the existence of archosauriform ghost lineages extending into at least the middle Wuchiapingian.

**Discussion**

Teyujagua presents an unexpected combination of basal archosauromorph and typical archosauriform features. For example, Teyujagua resembles basal archosauromorphs in lacking an antorbital fenestra and retaining open lower temporal bars. However, Teyujagua possesses external mandibular fenestrae and serrated teeth, features previously considered unique to Archosauriformes. Comparisons between Procolophon trigoniceps and early archosauriforms demonstrate for the first time that these key anatomical features of Archosauriformes were acquired in a mosaic fashion. Serrated teeth and external mandibular fenestrae, important features underpinning the evolution of large, powerful hypercarnivores, were acquired before a closed lower temporal bar and the antorbital opening. Thus, key dietary adaptations emerged in the early history of the Archosauriformes before the onset of the major skull pneumatization that played an important role in the group’s later evolutionary history.

The oldest known unambiguous archosauriform is Archosaurus rossicus, from the uppermost Permian of Russia. However, the late Guadalupian to early Lopingian age of the possible archosauriform Eorasaurus suggests that the clade had a substantial evolutionary history before the end-Permian mass extinction. Although hampered by the scarcity of Permian archosauromorph remains, the results of our phylogenetic analysis are congruent with two major pulses of opportunistic radiation experienced by early archosauriforms and close relatives such as Teyujagua. The first of these would be a phylogenetic diversification during the Lopingian, coincident with the recovery from the end-Guadalupian mass extinction (Fig. 5), perhaps as disaster taxa filling empty niches of small piscivores and predators. The rarity of archosauriform body fossils in Permian strata suggests that the clade formed a minor component in latest Palaeozoic faunas, when terrestrial trophic chains had therapsids as the main higher-level predators. The end-Permian extinction disrupted these food chains, and during the faunal recovery the Archosauriformes underwent a major increase in abundance, size and species richness, becoming the main terrestrial predators, and later expanding to also dominate large herbivorous niches.

The ichnological record provides additional support for this two-phase radiation. The discovery of Teyujagua thus helps to clarify early archosauriform evolution, allowing a better understanding of how this clade rose to dominate Mesozoic faunas and shape the modern biota.

**Methods**

**Type horizon and locality.** The type locality of Teyujagua paradoxa is a known fossil site that has been thoroughly described by Da Rosa et al. The locality is informally known as Bica São Tomé and is situated about 10 km east of São Francisco de Assis municipality, Rio Grande do Sul State, Southern Brazil. Teyujagua was found in one of the five outcrops that compose the Bica São Tomé outcrop 5 of Da Rosa et al., informal name is restricted to the upper Katberg Formation. The Teyujagua holotype was found in a layer rich in calcareous concretions, about 5 m from the baseline of the outcrop. The fossil assemblage so far reported for the Bica São Tomé site is dominated by procolophonoid cranial and postcranial material, some of which is referable to Procolophon trigoniceps. Less commonly, the site has produced temnospondyl cranial and postcranial fragments, incomplete long bones attributable to Cynodontia and incomplete archosauromorph vertebral. Sanga do Cabral Formation fossils are typically found in association with the intraformational conglomerates, and, as a result, show signs of intense reworking and fragmentation. The holotype of Teyujagua paradoxa is the most complete vertebrate specimen collected in this sedimentary unit to date. An Induan to early Olenekian (Lower Triassic) age is inferred for the Sanga do Cabral Formation based on the presence of Procolophon trigoniceps, which is restricted to the upper Katberg Formation (Lystrosaurus Assemblage Zone) in the Karoo Basin of South Africa. Procolophon trigoniceps is the only taxon from the Sanga do Cabral Formation to provide biostatigraphic correlations with other Lower Triassic sedimentary units. Notably, in the South African Karoo Basin the oldest remains of Procolophon trigoniceps are found 116 m above the Permian-Triassic boundary.

**Phylogenetic analysis.** In order to test the phylogenetic position of Teyujagua, a novel data matrix was assembled including taxa and morphological characters from two previous studies that aimed to address the phylogeny of Archosauromorpha and that of basal archosauriforms outside Archosauria. In total, the dataset included 44 operational taxonomic units (OTUs) and 252 morphological characters (see the supplementary material for full details).

The analysis was performed using TNT version 1.1. Petrolausaurus was considered the outgroup taxon and all characters were treated with equal weight. Of the 252 characters, 205 are binary and 47 are multistate. The following 35 multistate characters were a priori considered as ordered: 18, 19, 20, 21, 26, 33, 39, 42, 43, 55, 62, 64, 65, 69, 74, 81, 103, 113, 118, 127, 144, 148, 149, 155, 159, 165, 167, 170, 173, 177, 193, 206, 218, 231, 238.
The analysis consisted of a heuristic search of 1000 replicates using random addition sequences followed by tree-bisection-reconnection (TBR) branch swapping, retaining ten trees per replicate, with branches not supported by at least one synapomorphy collapsed following the search. If some replications overflowed during the first round of analysis, a traditional search was again employed, this time using trees from RAM. Bremer and Bootstrap supports were obtained following the analysis28,29 (Supplementary Fig. 4).

References

1. Gauthier, J. A. Saurischian monophyly and the origin of birds. *Mem. Calif. Acad. Sci.* 8, 1–55 (1986).
2. Brusatte, S. L., Benton, M. J., Ruta, M. & Lloyd, G. T. Superiority, competition, and opportunism in the evolutionary radiation of dinosaurs. *Science* 321, 1485–1488 (2008).
3. Claessens, L. P. A. M., O’Connor, P. M. & Unwin, D. M. Respiratory evolution facilitated the origin of pterosaur flight and aerial gigantism. *PLoS ONE* 4, e4497 (2009).
4. Benson, R. B. J. & Choiniere, J. N. Rates of dinosaur limb evolution provide evidence for exceptional radiation in Mesozoic birds. *Proc. Roy. Soc. B* 280, 20131780 (2013).
5. Alfaro, M. E. et al. Nine exceptional radiations plus high turnover explain species diversity in jawed vertebrates. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 106, 13410–13414 (2009).
6. Jetz, W., Thomas, G. H., Joy, J. B., Hartmann K. & Mooers, A. O. The global diversity of birds in space and time. *Nature* 491, 444–448 (2012).
7. Benton, M. J., Tverdokhlebov, V. P. & Surkov, M. V. Ecosystem remodeling among vertebrates at the Permian–Triassic boundary in Russia. *Nature* 432, 97–100 (2004).
8. Nesbitt, S. J. The early evolution of archosaurs: relationships and the origin of major clades. *Bull. Am. Mus. Nat. Hist.* 352, 1–292 (2011).
9. Sookias, R. B., Butler, R. J. & Benson, R. B. J. Rise of dinosaurs reveals major body size transitions are driven by passive processes of trait evolution. *Proc. Roy. Soc. B* 279, 2180–2187 (2012).
10. Nesbitt, S. J., Desojo, J. B. & Irmis, R. B. Anatomy, Phylogeny and Palaeobiology of Early Archosaurs and their Kin (eds Nesbitt, S., Desojo, J. B. & Irmis, R. B.) Ch. 1, 1–8 (The Geological Society, London, 2013).
11. Ezcurra, M. D., Scheyer, T. M. & Butler, R. J. The origin and early evolution of Sauria: reassessing the Permian saurian fossil record and the timing of the crocodile-lizard divergence. *PLoS ONE* 9, e97828 (2014).
12. Ezcurra, M. D. & Butler, R. J. Taxonomy of the proterosuchid archosauriforms (Diapsida: Archosauriomorpha) from the earliest Triassic of South Africa, and implications for the early archosauriform radiation. *Palaeontol.* 58, 141–170 (2015).

**Figure 5.** Simplified temporally calibrated phylogeny of Archosauriformes and close relatives (*Archosauromorpha*). A substantial diversification of archosauriforms and close relatives occurred in the late Permian (Lopingian), following the end-Guadalupian mass extinction, with a second radiation immediately following the end-Permian crisis. Diversity curve from Sahney and Benton29.
An exceptional fossil skull from South America and the origins of the archosauriform radiation.

F. L. Pinheiro, M. A. G. F. and M. B. L. designed the project; F. L. P., M. A. G. F. and M. L. B. conducted the experiments; F. L. P., M. A. G. F., M. L. B. and R. J. B. wrote the manuscript. This work was partially funded by the Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (CNPq). R. J. B. was supported by a Marie Curie Career Integration Grant (PCIG14-GA-2013-630123).

13. Da Rosa, A. A. S. et al. Bica São Tomé, a new fossiliferous site for the Early Triassic of southern Brazil. Rev. Bras. Paleontol. 12, 67–76 (2009).
14. Cisneros J. & Schultz, C. L. Procolophon brasilienis n. sp., a new procolophonid reptile from the Lower Triassic of southern Brazil. Neues Jb. Geol. P. M. 2002, 641–648 (2002).
15. Dias-da-Silva, S., Modesto, S. P. & Schultz, C. L. New material of Procolophon (Parareptilia: Procolophonidae) from the Lower Triassic of Brazil, with remarks on the ages of the Sanga do Cabral and Buena Vista formations of South America. Can. J. Earth Sci. 43, 1685–1693 (2006).
16. Dilkes, D. W. The Early Triassic rhynchosaur Mesosuchus browni and the interrelationships of basal archosauromorph reptiles. Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B 353, 501–541 (1998).
17. Modesto, S. P. & Sues, H.-D. The skull of the Early Triassic archosauromorph reptile Prolacerta broomi and its phylogenetic significance. Zool. J. Linn. Soc. 140, 335–351 (2004).
18. Modesto, S. P. & Botha-Brink, J. Evidence of a second, large archosauriform reptile in the Lower Triassic Katberg Formation of South Africa. J. Vert. Paleontol. 28, 914–917 (2008).
19. Ezcurra, M. D., Butler, R. J. & Gower, D. J. in Anatomy, Phylogeny and Palaeobiology of Early Archosaurs and their Kin (eds Nesbitt, S., Desojo, J. B. & Irnis, R. B.) Ch. 2, 9–32 (The Geological Society, London, 2015).
20. Müller, J. Early loss and multiple return of the lower temporal arcade in diapsid reptiles. Naturwissenschaften 90, 473–476 (2003).
21. Witmer, L. M. The evolution of the antorbital cavity of archosaurs: a study in soft-tissue reconstruction in the fossil record with an analysis of the function of pneumaticity. Mem. Soc. Vert Paleontol. 3, 1–73 (1997).
22. Sahney, S. & Benton, M. J. Recovery from the most profound mass extinction of all time. Proc. Roy. Soc. B 275, 759–765 (2008).
23. Day, M. O. et al. When and how did the terrestrial mid-Permian mass extinction occur? Evidence from the tetrapod record of the Karoo Basin, South Africa. Proc. R. Soc. B 282, 20150834 (2015).
24. Botha, J. & Smith, R. M. H. Rapid vertebrate recrudescence in the Karoo Basin of South Africa following the end-Permian extinction. J. Afr. Earth Sci. 45, 502–514 (2006).
25. Bernardi, M., Klein, H., Petti, F. M. & Ezcurra, M. D. The origin and early radiation of archosauriforms: integrating the skeletal and footprint record. PLoS ONE 10, e0128449 (2015).
26. Ezcurra, M. D., Lecuona, A. & Martinelli, A. A new basal archosauriform diapsid from the Early Triassic of Argentina. J. Vert. Paleontol. 30, 1433–1450 (2010).
27. Goloboff, P., Farris, S. & Nixon, K. TNT, a free program for phylogenetic analysis. Cladistics 24, 1–8 (2008).
28. Bremer, K. Bremer branch support and tree stability. Cladistics 10, 295–304 (1994).
29. Felsenstein, J. Confidence limits on phylogenies: an approach using the bootstrap. Evolution 39, 783–791 (1985).
30. Strapasson, A., Pinheiro, F. L. & Soares, M. B. On a new stereospondylomorph temnospondyl from the Middle-Late Permian of Southern Brazil. Acta Palaeontol Pol. 60, 843–855.

Acknowledgements
We thank M. Benton, A. Martinelli and J. Cisneros for discussion, J. Anderson for drawings, C. Ernandes, C. Da Rosa, D. Oliveira, G. Ugalde and M. Marks for field assistance, G. Furtado for etymologic assistance, J. Bruno for advice on images, and S. Brusatte and two anonymous reviewers for helping improve an early version of the manuscript. This work was partially funded by the Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (CNPq). R.J.B was supported by a Marie Curie Career Integration Grant (PCIG14-GA-2013-630123).

Author Contributions
F.L.P. designed the project; F.L.P., M.A.G.F. and M.B.L. conducted the experiments; F.L.P., M.A.G.F., M.L.B., C.L.S. and R.J.B. analysed and interpreted the results; F.L.P., M.A.G.F., M.B.L. and R.J.B. wrote the manuscript.

Additional Information
Supplementary information accompanies this paper at http://www.nature.com/srep

Competing financial interests: The authors declare no competing financial interests.

How to cite this article: Pinheiro, F. L. et al. An exceptional fossil skull from South America and the origins of the archosauriform radiation. Sci. Rep. 6, 22817; doi: 10.1038/srep22817 (2016).

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article’s Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in the credit line; if the material is not included under the Creative Commons license, users will need to obtain permission from the license holder to reproduce the material. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/