Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
Non-pharmaceutical interventions for the prevention of respiratory tract infections during Hajj pilgrimage

Samir Benkouitena,b, Philippe Brouqui a,b, Philippe Gautreta,b,*

a Aix Marseille Université, URMITE, UM63, CNRS 7278, IRD 198, Inserm 1095, 13005 Marseille, France
b Institut Hospitalo-Universitaire Méditerranée Infection, 13005 Marseille, France

Received 11 April 2014; received in revised form 10 June 2014; accepted 16 June 2014
Available online 24 June 2014

KEYWORDS
Hajj; Prevention and control; Respiratory tract infections

Summary Overcrowding during the yearly Hajj mass gatherings is associated with increased risk of spreading infectious diseases, particularly respiratory diseases. Non-pharmaceutical interventions (e.g., hand hygiene, wearing face masks, social distancing) are known to reduce the spread of respiratory viruses from person to person and are therefore recommended to pilgrims by public health agencies. The implementation of effective public health policies and recommendations involves evaluating the adherence to and effectiveness of these measures in the specific context of the Hajj. This review summarizes the evidence related to the effectiveness of non-pharmaceutical interventions in preventing the spread of respiratory infectious diseases during the Hajj. Overall, although hand hygiene compliance is high among pilgrims, face mask use and social distancing remain difficult challenges. Data about the effectiveness of these measures at the Hajj are limited, and results are contradictory, highlighting the need for future large-scale studies.
© 2014 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Annually, over two million Muslims from more than 180 countries gather in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (KSA) to perform the pilgrimage to Mecca, also known as the “Hajj”. The Hajj is the fifth pillar of Islam and is mandatory for all adult Muslims who are physically and financially capable at least once in their lifetime. The pilgrims usually stay in the KSA for up to 4 weeks. Upon arrival in Mecca, the holiest city in Islam, most Hajj pilgrims begin their visit by performing the “Umrah” (also known as the minor pilgrimage). The rituals of the Umrah can be undertaken at any time of the year and include the circumambulation of the Kaaba (Tawaf) in very crowded conditions (Fig. 1) and seven trips
(Sa’i) between two small mountains (Al-Safa and Al-Marwah) inside the Grand Mosque (Al-Masjid al Haram). The Hajj, which retraces the footsteps of the Prophet Mohammed over approximately one week, is performed from the 8th to the 13th of the last month of the lunar Islamic calendar, called “Dhul Hijja” (i.e., “the month of Hajj”). As part of the Hajj rituals, pilgrims travel to different sacred places located around the city of Mecca, including Mina, where they camp during the 5-day period of the Hajj in tents (Fig. 2) in close contact with others; the plain of Arafat for the culminating experience of the Hajj; and Muzdalifah. While not required as part of the Hajj, most pilgrims leave Mecca after a final circumambulation of the Kaaba (Tawaf al-Wada), traveling to the city of Medina to visit Islam’s second holiest site, the Mosque of the Prophet, which contains Muhammad’s tomb.

The presence of a large number of pilgrims from many parts of the world in congested and crowded areas, especially when performing the circumambulation of the Kaaba inside the Grand Mosque in Mecca and when using the pedestrian tunnels leading to the Jamarat bridge in Mina, where each pilgrim performs the ritual of “Jamarat” (stoning the columns symbolizing the Devil), greatly increases the risk of spreading infectious diseases [1], particularly respiratory diseases [2]. It was reported that the prevalence of respiratory symptoms among a cohort of French pilgrims during the 2012 Hajj was 90%, with cough (83%) and sore throat (78%) as the most commonly reported symptoms [3]. Similar high prevalences of respiratory symptoms were observed in both Iranian and Malaysian cohorts of pilgrims [4,5]. Respiratory diseases are by far the main reason for consultation among pilgrims attending primary health care centers during the Hajj [6]. In addition, respiratory diseases are major causes of hospital admission during the Hajj [7], with pneumonia being a leading cause of hospitalization in intensive care units [8]. In a recent study of Indonesian pilgrims, respiratory diseases were found to be the second most common cause of death, immediately after cardiovascular diseases [9]. Respiratory viruses, especially influenza virus, are the main cause of acute respiratory infection (ARI) during the Hajj [10–13]. High prevalences of rhinovirus [3] and Streptococcus pneumoniae [14] were found in pilgrims returning from the Hajj, highlighting the potential of pilgrims to spread these infections to their household contacts upon return to their countries of origin. However, although international outbreaks of Neisseria meningitides serogroup W135 occurred in 2001 and 2002 [15,16], no respiratory epidemics linked to the Hajj have been reported to date.

The transmission routes of the most common respiratory viral pathogens are diverse [17], including direct contact between an infected person and healthy individuals, indirect contact with contaminated surfaces, and droplet and airborne transmission at short range. Current evidence indicates that simple physical interventions would be useful for reducing the spread of respiratory viruses [18]. Consequently, in addition to vaccination, non-pharmaceutical interventions are recommended by various national and international public health agencies, including the Saudi Ministry of Health (MoH), the World Health Organization (WHO) and the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), to prevent the spread of infections during the pilgrimage or in the pilgrims’ home countries upon their return [19–21]. These measures include maintaining hand hygiene, particularly hand washing with soap and water and the use of hand sanitizer; using disposable tissues when coughing or sneezing and disposing of these tissues in a
| Hajj season | Study population | Compliance with preventive measures | Evaluation of the preventive effect | Study (year) | Ref. |
|------------|------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------|-----|
| 1999       | 1707 pilgrims at Mina, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (KSA) | Use of face mask: 24% Frequent hand washing: 67.2% Use of face mask: 33.2% | Not evaluated | Al-Shihry et al. (1999) [22] |
| 2002       | 1374 pilgrims at Mina, KSA | Use of face mask: 48.4% | Not evaluated | Al-Maghderi et al. (2002) [23] |
| 2002       | 447 Indonesian pilgrims | Use of face mask: 21.8% vs. 73.0% (RR = 3.36; 95% CI: 2.58–4.37; P-value = 0.000) URTI \(^a\) when comparing use vs. non use, respectively, of face mask | Zein (2002) [32] |
| 2003       | 1027 pilgrims registered at primary health care centres of Riyadh, KSA | Use of face mask (among all pilgrims): | Use of face mask (among male): | Al-Mudameigh et al. (2003) [25] Choudhry et al. (2006) [24] |
|            |                  | - Most of time: 33.1% - Sometimes: 20.4% | - Most of time: 42.5% - Sometimes: 21.2% |                  |
|            |                  | Use of face mask (among female): |                  |                  |
|            |                  | - Most of time: 7.6% - Sometimes: 18.4% |                  |                  |

\(^{a}\) URTI: Upper respiratory tract infection

Prevention of respiratory tract infections during Hajj pilgrimage
| Hajj season | Study population | Compliance with preventive measures | Evaluation of the preventive effect | Study (year) | Ref. |
|-------------|------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------|------|
| 2004        | 995 domestic pilgrims from Riyadh, KSA: | Use of face mask:  
- Among pilgrims with face mask HE and face masks: 81.3%  
- Among pilgrims with face mask HE only: 51.7%  
- Among pilgrims without face mask HE or face masks (no intervention): 33.6% | 81.3% vs. 33.6% (OR = 8.59; 95% CI: 5.93–12.44) ARI when comparing face mask HE + face masks vs. no intervention group, respectively  
51.7% vs. 33.6% (OR = 2.11; 95% CI: 1.56–2.86) ARI when comparing face mask HE + face masks vs. no intervention group, respectively | Abdin et al. (2005) | [27] |
| 2007        | 248 pilgrims attending 2 randomly selected hospitals (Mina al Tawarri and Mina El-Jesser) in Mina, KSA | Use of face mask:  
- Among all pilgrims: 12.1%  
- Among pilgrims who received health education (HE): 24.0%  
- Among pilgrims who do not received HE: 3.5%  
Hand washing (among all pilgrims):  
- Frequently: 31.5%  
- Infrequent or no: 68.5%  
Hand washing (among pilgrims who received HE):  
- Frequently: 58.7%  
- Infrequent or no: 41.3%  
Hand washing (among pilgrims who do not received HE):  
- Frequently: 11.8%  
- Infrequent or no: 88.2% | Not evaluated | Khamis et al. (2008) | [28] |
| 2008        | 528 French residents pilgrims consulting for vaccination at a clinic in Marseille, France | Use of face mask:  
- Use of face mask: 41.3% and 91.7%  
- Hand washing: 9.8% and 92.8% | Not evaluated | Gautret et al. (2009) | [26] |
| Year | Location | Participants | Use of Face Mask | Use of Hand Disinfectant | Use of Disposable Handkerchief | Social Distancing | Contact Avoidance | Use of Face Mask | Use of Hand Disinfectant | Use of Disposable Handkerchief | Hand Washing | Respiratory Illness
|------|----------|--------------|------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------|-------------------------|
| 2007 | 387 Malaysian pilgrims at transit center in Jeddah and Medina, KSA | | 72.9% | 2.8% and 98.1% | Not reported and 96.8% | 48.7% and 62.5% | 47% and 62.1% | 2.8% and 98.1% | 2.8% and 98.1% | 2.8% and 98.1% | 48.7% and 62.5% | 47% and 62.1% | 78.1% vs. 69.4% (OR = 1.57; 95% CI: 0.98–2.52; P-value = 0.060) ILI when comparing use vs. non use, respectively, of face mask |
| 2009 | 274 French residents pilgrims consulting for vaccination at a clinic in Marseille, France | | 79.6% | 40.9% | 38.7% | 48.7% and 62.5% | 47% and 62.1% | 79.6% | 40.9% | 38.7% | None of the preventive measures significantly affected the occurrence of respiratory symptoms |
| 2010 | 1507 pilgrims consulting for vaccination at Primary Health Care Centers of Riyadh, KSA | | 56.5% | 53.7% vs. 55.0% (RR = 1.17; 95% CI: 1.00–1.38; P-value = 0.045) URTI when comparing sometimes use vs. never use, respectively, of face mask | 77.4% | 69.7% | 60.0% (OR = 1.17; 95% CI: 0.98–2.52; P-value = 0.060) ILI when comparing use vs. non use, respectively, of face mask | 77.4% | 69.7% | 60.0% (OR = 1.17; 95% CI: 0.98–2.52; P-value = 0.060) ILI when comparing use vs. non use, respectively, of face mask |
| 2009 | 186 US residents pilgrims from Minnesota (recruited at a weekly clinic for Hajj travelers) and Michigan (recruited at multiple settings), USA | | 48.9% | 41.6% vs. 33.3% (OR = 1.42; 95% CI: 0.70–2.88; P-value = 0.21) respiratory illness when comparing practicing vs. non practicing, respectively, face mask | 45.5% | 90.3% | 9.7% | 48.9% | 41.6% vs. 33.3% (OR = 1.42; 95% CI: 0.70–2.88; P-value = 0.21) respiratory illness when comparing practicing vs. non practicing, respectively, face mask | 45.5% | 90.3% | 9.7% | 48.9% | 41.6% vs. 33.3% (OR = 1.42; 95% CI: 0.70–2.88; P-value = 0.21) respiratory illness when comparing practicing vs. non practicing, respectively, face mask |

(continued on next page)
| Hajj season | Study population | Compliance with preventive measures | Evaluation of the preventive effect | Study (year) | Ref. |
|-------------|------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------|------|
|             |                  | Cough etiquette: 46.2%              | practicing vs. non practicing, respectively, hand hygiene | 37.6% vs. 39.7% (OR = 0.92; 95% CI: 0.46–1.82; P-value = 0.47) respiratory illness when comparing practicing vs. non practicing, respectively, cough etiquette |             |      |
|             |                  | Social distancing: 34.4%            |                                      | 28.1% vs. 46.8% (OR = 0.44; 95% CI: 0.22–0.90; P-value = 0.02) respiratory illness when comparing practicing vs. non practicing, respectively, social distancing |             |      |
|             |                  | Contact avoidance: 24.2%            |                                      | 27.9% vs. 43.0% (OR = 0.51; 95% CI: 0.24–1.11; P-value = 0.06) respiratory illness when comparing practicing vs. non practicing, respectively, contact avoidance |             |      |
| 2009        | 432 pilgrims arriving at the King Abdulaziz International Airport in Jeddah, KSA | Use of face mask: 35.1% Knowledge of ways to avoid H1N1 infection: - Use of face mask: 44.7% - Frequent hand washing: 48.1% - Use of hand sanitizer: 28.5% - Covering own cough or sneeze: 20.6% - Avoiding crowds/public gatherings: 18.3% - Staying away from sick people: 28% | No significant effect of face mask use on overall prevalence of respiratory viruses | Memish et al. (2012) | [30] |
| 2012        | 137 French residents pilgrims consulting for vaccination at a clinic in Marseille, France | Use of face mask: - Frequently: 9.6% - Intermittently: 45.6% Hand washing (more frequently than usual): 40.3% | No significant effect of face mask use on overall prevalence of respiratory viruses when comparing increased vs. usual, respectively, hand washing | Benkouiten et al. (2013) | [3]  |
| Year | Description | Results | Authors and Year |
|------|-------------|---------|-----------------|
| 2009 | 186 US residents pilgrims (who had taken both the pre- (information) and post-travel surveys) from Minnesota (recruited at a weekly clinic for Hajj travelers) and Michigan (recruited at multiple settings), USA | - Use of hand sanitizer: 46.3%  
- Use of disposable handkerchief: 87.6%  
1.18–4.90; P-value = 0.014) ILI when comparing increased vs. usual, respectively, hand washing  
16.4% vs. 5.6% (OR = 3.28; 95% CI: 0.97–11.07; P-value = 0.045) prevalence of any respiratory viruses when comparing use vs. non use, respectively, of hand sanitizer | Not evaluated | Balaban et al. (2013) [36] |
| 2010 | 338 Iranian pilgrims from 2 caravans, one of which was the first to enter Mecca, and the other the first to enter Medina | - Use of face mask: 61.8%  
- Hand hygiene: 86.3%  
- Cough etiquette: 59.5%  
- Social distancing: 45.5%  
- Contact avoidance: 31.3%  
Among pilgrims who took only the post-travel survey:  
- Use of face mask: 65.5%  
- Hand hygiene: 86.2%  
- Cough etiquette: 65.5%  
- Social distancing: 17.2%  
- Contact avoidance: 31.0%  
Use of face mask:  
- In case group: 65.6%  
- In control group: 57.1%  
Room contact:  
- In case group: 28.1%  
- In control group: 17.5%  
The impact of face mask use on prevalence of respiratory tract infections (OR = 0.64; 95% CI: 0.23–1.78; P-value = 0.39)  
The impact of room contact on prevalence of respiratory tract infections (OR = 2.14; 95% CI: 0.68–6.70; P-value = 0.19) | Emamian et al. (2013) [35] |
| 2009, 2013 | Photo frames of pilgrims during the 5-day period of Hajj, KSA:  
- In 2009: 131 photo frames of 1607 pilgrims  
- In 2013: 171 photo frames of 1724 pilgrims | - Use of face mask:  
- In 2009: 8.4%  
- In 2013: 0.02%  
Not evaluated | Elachola et al. (2013) [34] |

(continued on next page)
waste basket; attempting as much as possible to avoid hand contact with the eyes, nose and mouth; avoiding direct contact with ill individuals; wearing masks, especially when in crowded places; and maintaining good personal hygiene, with the aim of interrupting or reducing the spread of infections from person to person.

The objective of this review is to summarize the evidence related to the effectiveness of non-pharmaceutical interventions in preventing the spread of respiratory infectious diseases during the Hajj.

2. Search strategy

On 1 January 2014, we searched the MEDLINE database (www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed) for articles published in English using the following search strategy:

#1: “hadj” OR “hajj” OR “mass gathering” OR “pilgrimage”;
#2: “respiratory” OR “infection” OR “infections” OR “infectious diseases”;
#3: #1 AND #2.

The search results were surveyed for methodological articles, and their titles and abstracts were then scanned. In addition, reference lists of relevant articles were hand searched for further references that could be considered for inclusion in this review. To be included, studies had to provide information on the actual use of non-pharmaceutical preventive measures by pilgrims during the Hajj or present data about the evaluation of the protective effect of these non-pharmaceutical preventive measures. Relevant review articles were included for useful background information.

3. Included studies

A total of 135 papers were found from the search, of which 122 were retrieved for full-text review and 13 met inclusion criteria. Four additional references were found through hand searches. Table 1 summarizes the relevant 17 papers included in this review.

4. Use of face masks

Major studies addressing the knowledge and practice of pilgrims concerning Hajj-related health problems have been conducted in the past by the Saudi Arabia Field Epidemiology Training program [22,23]. Large multinational samples of pilgrims were recruited while staying in Mina and interviewed using a self-administered questionnaire. As part of these studies, face mask use was reported by only 17.8% of the respondents during the 1998 Hajj season [22] compared to 24% and 33.2% in 1999 and 2002, respectively [22,23]. In a large cohort study of pilgrims reported during the pre-travel consultation, 53.6% of those who were followed up by telephone after the 2003 Hajj reported using face masks during the pilgrimage [24,25]. A survey of knowledge, attitude and practice was conducted in the city of Marseille among French pilgrims intending to
perform the 2008 Hajj who attended a pre-Hajj meningococcal vaccination campaign [26]. Of the respondents in this study, prior to travel, only 41.3% were aware that face masks could protect them from ARI, and 24.6% were aware that face masks could be used for community protection [26]. However, the willingness of pilgrims to wear face masks during the Hajj was high (91.7%) after the importance of their use was explained [26]. The effect of a health promotion intervention and the distribution of free face masks were evaluated in a study in 2004, showing a significant increase in face mask use among pilgrims who received both health promotion and free face masks (81.3%) compared to controls who did not receive health education or face masks (33.6%) [27]. In another study of patients attending Mina hospitals in 2007, pilgrims who received health education were also significantly more likely to wear face masks during the Hajj than those who did not [28]. However, the overall compliance with face mask use of pilgrims in this study was low (12.1%) [28]. These interventions have improved pilgrim compliance with face mask use during the Hajj; however, it was not stated in these studies whether pilgrims used their masks frequently or intermittently. The compliance with face mask use of French pilgrims who were recruited during their pre-travel consultation was investigated by telephone questionnaire as the pilgrims returned to France after the 2009 Hajj [29]. In this study, the percentage of pilgrims who self-reported using face masks during the pilgrimage was 79.6% [29]. In a large cross-sectional survey conducted before the 2009 Hajj, 35.1% of pilgrims arriving at the King Abdulaziz International airport in Jeddah reported wearing a face mask, and only 44.7% were aware of this measure as a way to prevent H1N1 infection [30]. A cohort study was conducted among pilgrims traveling from Riyadh with the intention to perform the Hajj in 2010. Pilgrims were recruited as they sought their required pre-Hajj meningococcal vaccination and followed up by telephone upon their return from the Hajj. In this study, 56.5% of pilgrims reported using face masks during the pilgrimage [31]. This result is comparable to that reported in another study conducted among French pilgrims during the 2012 Hajj by a medical doctor traveling with the pilgrims, in which 55.1% of pilgrims actually used face masks during the pilgrimage [3]. Other studies conducted among pilgrims from various countries [5,32,33] have shown variable results (Table 1). However, study designs and populations were highly variable from one study to another and did not allow for relevant comparisons. In an interesting recent study about face mask usage among pilgrims during the 5-day Hajj periods of 2009 and 2013, photos of the moving crowd taken from elevated areas revealed that significantly more pilgrims used face masks during the 2009 influenza A (H1N1) outbreak than during the 2013 MERS-CoV outbreak; however, compliance was low in both years [34]. It must be noted that in this study, face masks were provided as part of a welcome kit to each arriving pilgrim at the international airport in Jeddah.

The effectiveness of face mask use in preventing respiratory illness during the Hajj has been evaluated in various studies (Table 1). However, the results of these studies were contradictory. One study conducted among Indonesian pilgrims reported that pilgrims who did not use a face mask (that were provided to pilgrims by the Indonesian Hajj committee free of charge) during the Hajj had a threefold greater risk of acquiring an acute upper respiratory tract infection compared to those using face masks [32]. A significant reduction in respiratory symptoms was also observed in a Saudi [31] study, whereas several other studies reported no significant effect [5,29,33,35]. A second Saudi study showed a significant reduction in respiratory symptoms with face mask use, but only in the male or total sample and not in the female group [24,25]. Two other studies have addressed the impact of face mask use during the Hajj on the prevalence of both respiratory symptoms and viral pathogens using PCR assays from pilgrim nasal samples, and no significant effect was observed [30,3].

5. Hand hygiene

Compliance with hand hygiene practices was assessed during the 1999 Hajj season in a cross-sectional survey on a large multinational sample of pilgrims staying in Mina using a self-administered questionnaire [22]. Overall, 67.2% of respondents reported washing their hands frequently during the pilgrimage [22]. In a large prospective study of domestic pilgrims from Central Saudi Arabia, 90.3% and 45.5% reported, on their return from the 2010 Hajj, washing their hands more than 5 times per day and using hand sanitizer during the pilgrimage, respectively [31]. In another study of pilgrims attending two randomly selected Mina hospitals during the 2007 Hajj season, only 31.5% reported washing their hands frequently [28]. However, in this study, the pilgrims who received health education washed their hands significantly more frequently during the Hajj than those who did not [28]. A study assessing the compliance with protective measures among US pilgrims prior to and following travel to the 2009 Hajj reported that 67.2% of the respondents practiced hand hygiene during the pilgrimage [33]. However, in a second study conducted among the same cohort of US pilgrims with the aim of evaluating the possible effects of knowledge acquired from taking the pre-travel survey, the impact of the pre-travel survey as an effective means of health communication or education for pilgrims remained unclear [36]. A large cross-sectional survey conducted in 2009 among pilgrims arriving at the King Abdulaziz International airport in Jeddah showed that 48.1% and 28.5% of pilgrims were aware that frequent hand washing and use of hand sanitizer, respectively, could prevent H1N1 infection [30]. The proportions were even lower among French pilgrims intending to perform the 2008 Hajj, with less than 10% and 3% of participants being aware prior to travel of frequent hand washing and use of hand disinfectant, respectively, as precautions against respiratory infections [26]. However, this study revealed high levels of acceptance of these measures among participants (>90%) after their importance was explained [26]. Upon return from the 2009 Hajj, 69.7% and 77.4% of French pilgrims have self-reported increased hand washing and increased use of hand disinfectant, respectively, during the pilgrimage [29]. More recently, the compliance with hand hygiene among French pilgrims during the 2012 Hajj was also assessed by a medical doctor
traveling with them, and 40.3% and 46.3% of pilgrims actually washed their hands more than usual and used hand sanitizer, respectively, during the pilgrimage [3].

The effectiveness of hand hygiene practices in preventing respiratory illness during the Hajj has been evaluated in only a few studies (Table 1). A study conducted among US Hajj pilgrims during the 2009 Hajj confirmed that hand hygiene was associated with a reduced risk of respiratory illness [33]. By contrast, no positive effect of frequent hand washing or using hand sanitizer was observed among French pilgrims on the occurrence of respiratory symptoms during the 2009 Hajj [29] or on the prevalence of respiratory viruses as investigated by PCR assays on nasal swabs during the 2012 Hajj [3]. On the contrary, hand washing was significantly associated with symptoms of influenza-like illness and with a higher prevalence of respiratory viruses during the 2012 Hajj [3].

6. Cough etiquette and disposable handkerchief

In a large cross-sectional study from the KSA, pilgrims arriving at the King Abdulaziz International Airport in Jeddah for the 2009 Hajj were found to have low knowledge of cough etiquette as a way to prevent H1N1 infection (20.6%) [30]. In 2009, a study among US pilgrims showed that their compliance with cough etiquette was 46.2%, with, however, no significant beneficial effect on the prevalence of respiratory symptoms [33]. A second study, conducted among the same cohort of US pilgrims, found no impact of taking the pre-travel survey on compliance with cough etiquette during the Hajj [36]. In another study conducted among French pilgrims intending to perform the 2008 Hajj who attended a pre-Hajj meningococcal vaccination campaign, the knowledge prior to travel about disposable handkerchief use as a preventive measure against respiratory tract infections among the community was also very low (1.1%), but the willingness of pilgrims to use disposable handkerchiefs during the Hajj was excellent after the importance of their use was explained [26]. The use of disposable handkerchiefs among French pilgrims was 89.8% during the 2009 Hajj as self-reported by the pilgrims [29] and 87.6% during the 2012 Hajj as assessed by a medical doctor traveling with them [3]. However, the use of disposable handkerchiefs had no significant beneficial effect on the prevalence of either respiratory symptoms among pilgrims during the Hajj [29] or viral pathogens from their nasal samples, as recently reported [3].

7. Social distancing and contact avoidance

Only 28% and 18.3% of pilgrims arriving at the King Abdulaziz International Airport in Jeddah for the 2009 Hajj were aware of the usefulness of staying away from sick people and avoiding crowds/public gatherings, respectively, in preventing H1N1 infection [30]. In a study conducted among US pilgrims during the 2009 Hajj, the observance rates of social distancing and contact avoidance were 34.4% and 24.2%, respectively, with a significant beneficial effect on the occurrence of respiratory symptoms during the Hajj [33]. A second study, conducted among the same cohort of US pilgrims, found that pilgrims who took both pre- and post-travel surveys were more likely to report practicing social distancing during the Hajj (45.5%) than those who took only the post-travel survey (17.2%) [36]. However, the pre-travel survey had no impact on the observance of contact avoidance by pilgrims during the Hajj in this study (approximately 31% in both groups) [36]. French pilgrims intending to perform the 2008 Hajj showed more knowledge about social distancing and contact avoidance as preventive measures for self-protection against respiratory tract infections (about 50%) [26]; and the acceptability of these measures was approximately 62% after the importance of their observance was explained [26]. However, in a recent nested case-control study among Iranian pilgrims during the 2010 Hajj, the mean daily presence in holy places and direct contact with ill pilgrims in the same room appeared to have no effect on the incidence of respiratory tract infections [35].

8. Postponement of Hajj for at-risk populations

The 2009 Hajj took place during the influenza A/H1N1 pandemic. This coincidence led the Saudi Arabian Ministry of Health to organize, in 2009, a health experts’ meeting in Jeddah [37], with the participation of consultants from global public health agencies. This consultation resulted in several practical recommendations for reducing the pandemic’s effects during the Hajj [37,38]. Among several recommendations, one of the most challenging was to ask the population groups considered to be at high risk of complications from influenza (pregnant women, people with underlying comorbidities, people older than 65 years and children younger than 12 years) to voluntarily refrain from participating in the 2009 Hajj. An assessment of compliance with these recommendations among French pilgrims actually participating in the 2009 Hajj showed that at least one risk factor for complications from H1N1 virus infection was present in 49.5% of them [39]. In 2013, because of concerns over the Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) with the KSA identified as the epicenter of the outbreak, the WHO published the 2013 Hajj requirement [19] in which the Saudi Ministry of Health recommended that elderly people (older than 65 years); those with chronic diseases (such as heart disease, kidney disease, respiratory disease, and diabetes); and pilgrims with immune deficiency (congenital and acquired), malignant disease, and terminal illnesses, as well as pregnant women and children (younger than 12 years), not perform the Hajj and Umrah that year [19,20]. In a recent study, at least one of these risk factors was found in one out of two French pilgrims undertaking the 2013 Hajj season [40,41]. In another study of French pilgrims recruited during their pre-travel consultation before the 2013 Hajj season, it appears that two-thirds of the participants were aware of the MERS-CoV situation in Saudi Arabia, and one-third were aware of the Saudi recommendation for all individuals in these high-risk groups to postpone their participation in the 2013 Hajj; however, none of them decided to cancel their participation, even after this advice was given [41].
9. Discussion

Many non-pharmaceutical interventions are worth implementing on their own merit, even if the evidence for their effectiveness for preventing respiratory infectious diseases during the Hajj is sometimes weak and has rarely been studied in large populations. It is often difficult to assess the effect of one intervention independently from other interventions or other factors in infection control, such as environmental hygiene, crowding and education. Moreover, most studies used different clinical criteria for evaluating the prevalence of respiratory symptoms in pilgrims during the Hajj and were conducted in different settings, including hospitals and airports, with possible bias in the inclusion process. Additionally, some of these studies were performed among small numbers of pilgrims and cannot be extrapolated. Because compliance with these preventive measures appears to be highly variable from one study to another, studying heterogeneous populations of pilgrims in different settings as well as the use of different methods may limit the ability to identify effective measures. Future large-scale prospective intervention studies should be designed to accurately estimate the effectiveness of and adherence to each measure in preventing respiratory tract infections during the Hajj.

At this time, the improvement of face mask use among pilgrims is a major challenge. In fact, there appears to be a discrepancy between willingness, perceived compliance and actual compliance of pilgrims with respect to face mask use. While several studies showed that face mask use is highly accepted by pilgrims providing that educational intervention is implemented, such intervention is impractical in the context of the Hajj. Various reasons may partially explain the low compliance of face mask usage. First, the stifling heat (in Mecca during October, the average temperature is >38 °C during the day and >25 °C at night) makes conditions worse and the continuous wearing of masks more difficult to achieve, especially for elderly pilgrims. In addition, pilgrims must carry out the ritual washing (which involves washing the face with water) before each of the five obligatory prayers, forcing them to remove their masks several times per day. Finally, due to the overcrowded conditions in the tent camps where pilgrims spend most of their time during the 5-day period of the Hajj, they are encouraged to take minimal personal belongings with them in a small bag, making it much more difficult for them to transport a large number of disposable face masks. However, in addition to compliance, an important issue is whether masks are being worn correctly by the pilgrims. The effectiveness of face masks in preventing the transmission of influenza and ARIs is dependent on various factors, including setting and compliance. Thus, the role of face mask use has been advocated in a number of studies conducted in multiple settings, including health care facilities, household contacts of index case patients, and university residents. Although most studies have found that the use of masks was associated with a reduced risk of severe acute respiratory syndrome, none of the studies established a conclusive relationship between mask use and protection against influenza infection [42,43]. Moreover, metadata from these studies indicated that wearing surgical masks did not change the frequency of laboratory-confirmed influenza [44]. As the effectiveness of face masks is likely linked to early, consistent and correct usage, we continue to recommend their use, although available studies do not provide strong evidence for their effectiveness in the prevention of the viral respiratory infection known as “Hajj cough”. Some actions that may be taken to improve compliance with face mask use are the launch of recall campaigns during the Hajj to inform pilgrims of the importance of face mask and how to use it properly, and free mask distribution to pilgrims, particularly during their stay in Mina.

Despite their poor knowledge of the usefulness of hand hygiene in preventing respiratory infections, hand washing compliance of pilgrims during the Hajj is usually quite good. This finding is not surprising because in several cultures and religions, hand hygiene is not only an action aimed at body care. In Islam, the ritual purification takes the form of ablution (Wudu), which is, in most cases, repeated before the five daily obligatory prayers. Ablution consists of the methodical washing of the hands, mouth, nose, face, forearm, head, ears, and feet three times each with running water. The effectiveness of hand hygiene interventions varies depending on setting, context and compliance [49]. Several reviews of published work have been conducted to evaluate the effect of hand hygiene in preventing respiratory tract infections, especially in the health care setting [46–48]. Available evidence suggests that hand hygiene might help reduce the transmission of a range of important nosocomial pathogens [47] and acute respiratory tract infections [49]. However, hygienic hand disinfection has better efficacy than hand washing [47,49]. During their stay in Mina, pilgrims live in crowded tent camps where the water and sanitation that are available outside the tents are to be used collectively. Frequent hand washing outside the ritual context of ablution may be difficult in these conditions. Additionally, during a few days of the Hajj, when pilgrims are in the state of "Ihram" (a sacred state that pilgrims must enter to perform the pilgrimage), they are not allowed to use scented soap, and although unscented soap may be available, pilgrims most commonly wash their hands only with water. Alcohol-based hand rubs may be better than traditional hand washing, as they require less time, act more rapidly, and contribute to sustained improvement in compliance associated with decreased infection rates [47,49]. Therefore, as alcohol is permitted as a medicinal agent within Islam [50,51], the implementation of effective hand hygiene practices focusing on the regular use of alcohol-based hand rubs is recommended. Promotion of hand hygiene among pilgrims attending the Hajj should continue as a preventive measure against both respiratory and diarrheal diseases [52].

Both social distancing and contact avoidance may reduce the transmission of respiratory tract infections; however, these recommendations cannot be assiduously implemented in the context of the Hajj given the extremely high density to which pilgrims are exposed when performing the Hajj rituals. In particular, there is a very dense crowd when performing the Towaf in the Grand Mosque, with up to eight pilgrims per square meter near the Kaaba [53,54]. Moreover, pilgrims are accommodated in tents during the 5-day Hajj, living in close contact with others (some with up
to 50–100 people per tent) in the pilgrims’ camp in Mina outside the holy city of Mecca.

The recommendation for pilgrims in high-risk groups to postpone their plans to perform the Hajj and Umrah should be maintained, as postponement is an effective measure to protect these individuals from the risk of respiratory tract infections during the stay; however, we do not believe that this recommendation will be followed by pilgrims with the intention to perform the Hajj. In fact, the Hajj is the religious high point of a Muslim’s life and is usually performed once in a lifetime. Due to financial constraints, it is often planned years in advance. Therefore, particularly considering the advanced age of most pilgrims, it must be a very difficult decision for them to voluntarily cancel or postpone their plans to perform the Hajj.

Pending further rigorous scientific evidence on effectiveness, it is important for local, national and international health agencies and those providing health services and advice to pilgrims to work with communities using effective communication strategies, before and during the pilgrimage, to increase awareness of the health hazards during the Hajj. In the context of the Hajj, health risk perception is very likely influenced by cultural and religious beliefs. To be successful in this role, health agencies must work in partnership with community leaders, travel agents and imams by spreading awareness, especially through educational campaigns, among pilgrims about these measures and discouraging those at high risk from attending Hajj.

Respiratory diseases continue to be a major concern during the Hajj. It is expected that public health research projects developed through international collaboration will provide key information about the dynamics of infectious diseases spread during the Hajj and the implications for their global spread. Some large cohort studies on the risk of acquiring pathogens during the Hajj are ongoing among multinational samples of pilgrims. The roles of host (e.g., age, underlying chronic diseases, vaccination status) and environmental factors in pathogen transmission will also be addressed. Interventional studies assessing the effectiveness of non-pharmaceutical individual measures in preventing the spread of respiratory infectious diseases will be conducted. In particular, large randomized controlled trials on face mask use will be conducted among cohorts of pilgrims from several countries [44]. It is expected that the results of these studies will lead to the implementation of evidence-based recommendations on preventive measures such as face mask use, hand hygiene and other individual measures for pilgrims participating in the Hajj in the next years. Investigations exploring the link between communication and behavior will also be conducted to provide the evidence base for the adoption of effective approaches to improving communication with pilgrims and to better meet the needs of diverse communities.

The recently established Global Centre for Mass Gathering Medicine, in partnership and collaboration with other WHO collaborating centers and between states, international organizations and scientific centers, with the aim of sharing experience and knowledge through global health diplomacy will therefore play a central role in achieving these goals [55].

Thus, it is hoped that this review will help relevant authorities in providing recommendations for prevention of respiratory infectious diseases during the Hajj, particularly for prevention of MERS-CoV transmission [56].

Funding

None.

Conflict of interest

The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

Acknowledgments

None.

References

[1] Ahmed QA, Arabi YM, Memish ZA. Health risks at the Hajj. Lancet 2006;367(9515):1008–15.
[2] Alzeer AH. Respiratory tract infection during Hajj. Ann Thorac Med 2009;4(2):50–3.
[3] Benkouiten S, Charrel R, Belhouchat K, Drai T, Salez N, Nougairede A, et al. Circulation of respiratory viruses among pilgrims during the 2012 Hajj pilgrimage. Clin Infect Dis 2013;57(7):992–1000.
[4] Meysmie A, Ardakani HZ, Razavi SM, Doroodi T. Comparison of mortality and morbidity rates among Iranian pilgrims in Hajj 2004 and 2005. Saudi Med J 2006;27(7):1049–53.
[5] Deris ZZ, Hasan H, Sulaiman SA, Wahab MS, Naing NN, Othman NH. The prevalence of acute respiratory symptoms and role of protective measures among Malaysian Hajj pilgrims. J Travel Med 2010;17(2):32–8.
[6] Alzahrani AG, Choudhry AJ, Al Mazroa MA, Turkistani AH, Nouman GS, Memish ZA. Pattern of diseases among visitors to Mina health centers during the Hajj season, 1429 H (2008 G). J Infect Public Health 2012;5(1):22–34.
[7] Al-Ghamdi SM, Akbar HO, Qari YA, Fathaldin OA, Al-Rashed RS. Pattern of admission to hospitals during muslim pilgrimage (Hajj). Saudi Med J 2003;24(10):1073–9.
[8] Mandourah Y, Al-Radi A, Ocheltree AH, Ocheltree SR, Fowler RA. Clinical and temporal patterns of severe pneumonia causing critical illness during Hajj. BMC Infect Dis 2012;12:117.
[9] Pane M, Imari S, Alwi Q, Nyoman Kandun I, Cook AR, Samaan G. Causes of mortality for Indonesian Hajj Pilgrims: comparison between routine death certificate and verbal autopsy findings. PLoS One 2013;8(8):e73243.
[10] Balkhy HH, Memish ZA, Bafarque S, Almuneef MA. Influenza a common viral infection among Hajj pilgrims: time for routine surveillance and vaccination. J Travel Med 2004;11(2):82–6.
[11] Rashid H, Shafi S, Boooy R, El Bashir H, Ali K, Zambon M, et al. Influenza and respiratory syncytial virus infections in British Hajj pilgrims. Emerg Health Threats J 2008;1:1e2.
[12] Moattari A, Emami A, Moghadam M, Honarvar B. Influenza viral infections among the Iranian Hajj pilgrims returning to Shiraz, Fars province, Iran. Influenza Other Respir Viruses 2012;6(6):e77–9.
[13] Gautret P, Charrel R, Benkouiten S, Belhouchat K, Nougairede A, Drai T, et al. Lack of MERS coronavirus but prevalence of influenza virus in French pilgrims after 2013 Hajj. Emerg Infect Dis 2014;20(4):728–30.
Prevention of respiratory tract infections during Hajj pilgrimage

[14] Benkouiten S, Gautret P, Belhouchat K, Drai T, Salez N, Memish ZA, et al. Acquisition of Strepococcus pneumoniae carriage in pilgrims during the 2012 Hajj pilgrimage. Clin Infect Dis 2014;58(4):e106–9.

[15] Taha MK, Achtman M, Alonso JM, Greenwood B, Ramsay M, Fox A, et al. Serogroup W135 meningococcal disease in Hajj pilgrims. Lancet 2000;356(9248):2159.

[16] Abubaker I, Gautret P, Brunette GW, Blumberg L, Johnson D, Poumerol G, et al. Global perspectives for prevention of infectious diseases associated with mass gatherings. Lancet Infect Dis 2012;12(1):66–74.

[17] Pica N, Bouvier NM. Environmental factors affecting the transmission of respiratory viruses. Curr Opin Virol 2012;2(1):90–5.

[18] Jefferson T, Del Mar CB, Dooley L, Ferroni E, Al-Ansary LA, Bawazeer GA, et al. Physical interventions to interrupt or reduce the spread of respiratory viruses. Cochrane Database Syst Rev 2011;(7):CD006207.

[19] Health conditions for travellers to Saudi Arabia for the pilgrimage to Mecca (Hajj). Wkly Epidemiol Rec 2013;88(32):343–7.

[20] Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. Health regulations for travellers to KSA for Hajj. Available at: http://www.moh.gov.sa/en/HealthAwareness/Hajj/Pages/005.aspx [accessed 23.12.13.]

[21] Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. CDC health information for international travel 2012. The Yellow Book; 2012.

[22] Al-Shihry AM, Al-Khan AA. Pre-Hajj health-related advice, Makkah. Saudi Epidemiol Bull 1999;6:29–31.

[23] Al-Maghderi Y, Al-Joudi A, Choudhry AJ, Al-Rabeah AM, Al-Mudaimegh KS, Al-Naji A, et al. Hajj pilgrims knowledge about acute respiratory infections. Emerg Infect Dis 2009;15(11):1861–2.

[24] Al-Maghdery I, Al-Joudi A, Choudhry AJ, Al-Rabeah AM, Ibrahim M, Turkistani AM. Behavioral risk factors for diseases during Hajj 1422 H. Saudi Epidemiol Bull 2002;9(3):19–20.

[25] Choudhry AJ, Al-Mudaimegh KS, Turkistani AM, Al-Hamdani NA. Hajj-associated acute respiratory infection among Hajjis from Riyadh. East Mediterr Health J 2006;12(3–4):300–9.

[26] Al-Mudaimegh KS, Al-Naji A, Al-Enezi M, Choudhry AJ, Turkistani AM. Incidence of hajj-related acute respiratory infection among Hajjis from Riyadh, 1423 H (2003 G). Saudi Epidemiol Bull 2003;10:25–6.

[27] Gautret P, Soula G, Parola P, Brouqui P. Hajj pilgrims’ knowledge about acute respiratory infections. Emerg Infect Dis 2009;15(11):1861–2.

[28] Abdin EZ, Choudhry AJ, Al-Naji A. Effect of use of face mask on Hajj-related respiratory infection among Hajjis from Riyadh. A health promotion intervention study. Saudi Epidemiol Bull 2005;12:27–8.

[29] Khamis NK. Epidemiological pattern of diseases and risk behaviors of pilgrims attending mima hospitals, hajj 1427 h (2007 g). J Egypt Public Health Assoc 2008;83(1–2):15–33.

[30] Gautret P, Vu Hai V, Sani S, Doutchi M, Parola P, Brouqui P. Protective measures against acute respiratory symptoms in French pilgrims participating in the Hajj of 2009. J Travel Med 2011;18(1):53–5.

[31] Memish ZA, Assiri AM, Hussain R, Alomar I, Stephens G. Detection of respiratory viruses among pilgrims in Saudi Arabia during the time of a declared influenza A(H1N1) pandemic. J Travel Med 2012;19(1):15–21.

[32] Al-Jasser FS, Kabbash IA, Almazrooa MA, Memish ZA. Patterns of diseases and preventive measures among domestic hajjis from Central, Saudi Arabia. Saudi Med J 2012;33(8):879–86.

[33] Zein U. The role of using masks to reduce acute upper respiratory tract infection in pilgrims. Abstract No. 7. In: 4th Asia Pacific travel health conference, Shanghai, P.R. China; October 20–23 2002.

[34] Elachola H, Assiri AM, Memish ZA. Mass gathering-related mask use during 2009 pandemic influenza A (H1N1) and Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus. Int J Infect Dis 2013;(13):00356–61. pii: S1201–9712.

[35] Emamian MH, Hassani AM, Fateh M. Respiratory tract infections and its preventive measures among Hajj pilgrims, 2010: a nested case control study. Int J Prev Med 2013;4(9):1030–5.

[36] Balaban V, Stauffer W, Hammad A, Afgarshe M, Abd-Alla M, Ahmed Q, et al. Predictors of protective behaviors among American travelers to the 2009 Hajj. J Epidemiol Glob Health 2013;3(4):187–96.

[37] Memish ZA, McNabb SJ, Mahoney F, Alrabiah F, Marano N, Ahmed QA, et al. Establishment of public health security in Saudi Arabia for the 2009 Hajj. J Epidemiol Glob Health 2009;343:

[38] Ebrahim SM, Memish ZA, Uyeki TM, Khoja TA, Marano N, McNabb SJ. Public health. Pandemic H1N1 and the 2009 Hajj. Science 2009;326(5955):938–40.

[39] Gautret P, Parola P, Brouqui P. Risk factors for H1N1 influenza complications in 2009 Hajj pilgrims. Lancet 2010;375(9710):199–200.

[40] Gautret P, Benkouiten S, Saleheddine I, Parola P, Brouqui P. Preventive measures against MERS-CoV for Hajj pilgrims. Lancet Infect Dis 2013;13(10):S29–31.

[41] Gautret P, Benkouiten S, Saleheddine I, Belhouchat K, Drali T, Parola P, et al. Hajj pilgrims knowledge about Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus, August to September 2013. Euro Surveill 2013;18(41):20604.

[42] Cowling BJ, Zhou Y, Ip DK, Leung GM, Aiello AE. Face masks to prevent transmission of influenza virus: a systematic review. Epidemiol Infect 2010;138(4):449–56.

[43] Bin-Reza F, Lopez Chavarrias V, Nicoll A, Chamberland ME. The use of masks and respirators to prevent transmission of influenza: a systematic review of the scientific evidence. Influenza Other Respir Viruses 2012;6(4):257–67.

[44] Rashid H, Booy R, Heron L, Memish ZA, Nguyen-Van-Tam J, et al. Unmasking masks in Makkah: preventing influenza at Hajj. Clin Infect Dis 2012;54(1):151–3.

[45] Warren-Gash C, Fragaszy E, Hayward AC. Hand hygiene to reduce community transmission of influenza and acute respiratory tract infection: a systematic review. Influenza Other Respir Viruses 2013;7(5):738–49.

[46] Allegranzi B, Pittet D. Role of hand hygiene in healthcare-associated infection prevention. J Hosp Infect 2009;73(4):305–15.

[47] Kampf G, Löffer H, Gastmeier P. Hand hygiene for the prevention of nosocomial infections. Dtsch Arztebl Int 2009;106(40):649–55.

[48] Backman C, Zoutman DE, Marck PB. An integrative review of the current evidence on the relationship between hand hygiene interventions and the incidence of healthcare-associated infections. Am J Infect Control 2008;36(5):333–48.

[49] Kampf G, Kramer A. Epidemiologic background of hand hygiene and evaluation of the most important agents for scrubs and rubs. Clin Microbiol Rev 2004;17(4):863–93.

[50] Ahmed QA, Memish ZA, Allegranzi B, Pittet D. WHO Global Patient Safety Challenge. Muslim health-care workers and alcohol-based handrubs. Lancet 2006;367(9515):1025–7.

[51] Allegranzi B, Memish ZA, Donaldson L, Pittet D. World health organization global patient safety challenge task force on religious and cultural aspects of hand hygiene; world Alliance for patient safety. Religion and culture: potential undercurrents influencing hand hygiene among US travelers to the 2009 Hajj. J Travel Med 2012;19(3):163–8.
promotion in health care. Am J Infect Control 2009;37(1):28–34.

[52] Aiello AE, Coulborn RM, Perez V, Larson EL. Effect of hand hygiene on infectious disease risk in the community setting: a meta-analysis. Am J Public Health 2008;98(8):1372–81.

[53] Curtis S, Guy SJ, Zafar B, Manocha D. Virtual tawaf: a case study in simulating the behavior of dense, heterogeneous crowds. In: 1st IEEE workshop on modeling, simulation and visual analysis of large crowds; 2011.

[54] Zafar B. Analysis of the Mataf – Ramadan 1432 AH. Technical report. Saudi Arabia: Hajj Research Institute, Umm al-Qura University; 2011.

[55] Memish ZA, Al-Rabeeah AA. Public health management of mass gatherings: the Saudi Arabian experience with MERS-CoV. Bull World Health Organ 2013;91(12). 899–899A.

[56] Gautret P. Middle East Respiratory Syndrome (MERS) coronavirus. What travel health advice should be given to Hajj pilgrims? Travel Med Infect Dis 2013;11(5):263–5.