Quantiferon®-TB gold in-tube is not useful for diagnosing active tuberculosis in HIV/AIDS patients with severe immunodeficiency: Results from Brazil

Klautau GB1,2, Bammann RH1, Ferreira NVS1, Afiune JB1, Burattini MN1 and Rodrigues DS1,4

1 Federal University of São Paulo (Universidade Federal de São Paulo, Brazil – UNIFESP), Brazil
2 Emílio Ribas Institute of Infectious Diseases (Instituto de Infectologia Emílio Ribas – IIER), São Paulo, Brazil
3 Holy House of Mercy Brotherhood of São Paulo (Irmandade da Santa Casa de Misericórdia de São Paulo – ISCMSP), Brazil
4 Clement Ferreira Institute (Instituto Clemente Ferreira – ICF), São Paulo, Brazil

Abstract

Purpose: To assess interferon gamma release assay (IGRA) and tuberculin skin test (TST) performances in the diagnosis of active tuberculosis (TB) in adults with HIV/AIDS with different degrees of immunodeficiency.

Methods: Cross-sectional study conducted with 90 HIV/TB-coinfected adults, São Paulo, Brazil. TB diagnosis was established based on the presence of positive sputum smear, culture, or anatomic-pathological examination. The participants responded to a questionnaire and were submitted to physical examination, chest x-ray (CRX), serum CD4+ and CD8+ T cell count, TST, and IGRA (QuantiFERON®-TB Gold In Tube, Cellestis, Carnegie, Australia).

Results: Characteristics of 90 HIV/TB-coinfected individuals: male (60.0%), white (54.4%), single (57.3%), and average age 39 (±10.8) years with pulmonary TB (45.6%), and average CD4+ T-cell count (198.92 cells/mm3). TST was positive in 25.56%, and IGRA was positive in 65.56%. IGRA performance was better when compared to TST (p<0.001) and was able to diagnose TB with 93.75% probability when CD4+ ≥ 187 cells/mm³; TST showed similar efficacy when CD4+ ≥ 500 cells/mm³.

Conclusion: IGRA exhibited better performance for TB disease diagnosis in HIV-infected individuals with severe immunodeficiency when compared to TST. Nevertheless, both tests may exhibit false-negative results in this type of population. Despite the fact that IGRA has better performance than TST in the diagnosis of active TB in patients with HIV/AIDS, the practical utilization of the method seems to be limited and should be considered only for patients with CD4+ ≥ 187 cells/mm³.

Keywords: Quantiferon-TB Gold In-Tube; Purified Protein Derivative (PPD); Mycobacterium tuberculosis; HIV; Number of CD4

Introduction

Tuberculosis (TB) is a severe public health concern in Brazil and worldwide [1]. TB is the main cause of death in individuals with acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS), as well as one of the most frequent opportunistic infections [2,3]. The criteria for establishing the diagnosis of TB do not differ between individuals infected or not by the human immunodeficiency virus (HIV); however, in patients with immunodeficiency, the isolation of Mycobacterium tuberculosis is particularly relevant to rule out a large number of differential diagnoses. In this context, novel diagnostic tests are warranted [2–4].

Until 2001, the tuberculin skin test (TST) was the only available test to assess individuals with latent TB infection (LTBI). This test is also used in the diagnosis of active TB, particularly for the extrapulmonary forms of the disease. In addition, assays involving the detection of interferon-gamma (IFN-γ) have been increasingly used in recent years as IFN-γ plays a significant role in the T cell-mediated immune response to M. tuberculosis [4]. The interferon-gamma release assay (IGRA) is a test based on the secretion of IFN-γ by circulating T cells following in vivo stimulation with specific antigens. IGRA has shown promising results for the diagnosis of LTBI as well as active TB [4-6]; however, its role in patients coinfected with TB and HIV has not yet been thoroughly established [3,5,7,8].

In regard to LTBI, the main advantage of IGRA is its higher specificity in comparison with TST. In addition, IGRA requires only a single visit from tested individuals [4-10]. However, in regard to active TB, 10 to 25% of patients do not exhibit positive reactions to TST or IGRA, mostly corresponding to individuals with immunodeficiency, recent infection, or young children [11].

The aim of the present study was to assess the performance of TST and IGRA in the diagnosis of active TB in adults with HIV/AIDS with different degrees of immunodeficiency.

In Brazil, the IGRA is not yet available for routine use in the health care system and the test approved for use is the Quantiferon®-TB gold in-tube. The cost was also considered for the choice of this method, besides the ease of performing the test.

Study Population and Methods

This cross-sectional study included 90 individuals from both genders, who were older than 18 years and were treated at three healthcare institutions in the city of São Paulo: Instituto de Infectologia Emílio Ribas – (IIER), Instituto Clemente Ferreira – ICF, and...
Irmandade da Santa Casa de Misericórdia de São Paulo (ISCMSP). This study was approved by the respective institutional research ethics committees. The participants were selected from March 2012 to April 2013. To be included in the study, all subjects had to exhibit infection by HIV and diagnosis of active TB; the patients were either treatment-naive or had started treatment less than 15 days earlier. Diagnosis of pulmonary or extrapulmonary TB was based on a positive sputum smear and/or culture or anatomic-pathological results compatible with TB according to the standards formulated by the Brazilian Health Ministry [12].

After receiving an explanation of the aim and procedures of the present study and signing an informed consent form, the participants completed a questionnaire to collect clinical and epidemiological information and were then subjected to the following tests: simple chest x-ray (CXR), serum CD4+ and CD8+ T cell counts, HIV viral load (to assess the immune status relative to the HIV infection), TST, and IGRA - QuantiFERON®-TB Gold In Tube (QFT-GIT), Cellestis, Carnegie, Australia.

TST was performed using the Mantoux technique [13]. Disposable plastic syringes and 27G needles were used to administer 0.1 ml of purified protein derivative (PPD-RT 23) equivalent to 2 tuberculin units (2TU) per intradermal route on the middle third of the anterior surface of the left forearm. Reading was performed 48-96 hours later by identifying the extension of induration by palpation and measuring its maximum transverse diameter in millimeters using rulers provided by the National Health Foundation. Positive reactions were classified as PPD5 when the diameter of induration was equal to or greater than 5 mm and as PPD10 when it was equal to or greater than 10 mm. All TSTs were applied by professionals previously trained for the purpose of standardization to ensure a minimum intra- and inter-examiner agreement of 80% and to minimize variations associated with application or measurement. IGRA was performed according to the manufacturer's instructions (QuantiFERON®-TB Gold In-Tube, Cellestis, Carnegie, Australia). Blood samples of 3 ml were collected by trained technicians and placed in a set of three test tubes labeled by HIV and diagnosis of active TB; the patients were either treatment-naive or had started treatment less than 15 days earlier. Diagnosis of pulmonary or extrapulmonary TB was based on a positive sputum smear and/or culture or anatomic-pathological results compatible with TB according to the standards formulated by the Brazilian Health Ministry [12]. After receiving an explanation of the aim and procedures of the present study and signing an informed consent form, the participants completed a questionnaire to collect clinical and epidemiological information and were then subjected to the following tests: simple chest x-ray (CXR), serum CD4+ and CD8+ T cell counts, HIV viral load (to assess the immune status relative to the HIV infection), TST, and IGRA - QuantiFERON®-TB Gold In Tube (QFT-GIT), Cellestis, Carnegie, Australia. Only 23 volunteers (25.56%) tested positive to TST with the cutoff point of 5 mm, while only 15 volunteers (16.67%) tested positive to TST with the cutoff point of 10 mm. IGRA was positive in 59 participants (65.56%).

In the present sample of individuals coinfected by HIV and TB, there was a low average CD4+ T cell count (198.92 cells/mm³), and that for CD8+ T cells was 529.58 cells/mm³, corresponding to an average CD4/CD8 ratio of 0.36%. The average HIV viral load log_{10} was 4.41.

To improve the performance of TST and IGRA, taking into consideration the degree of immunosuppression of the present sample of coinfected (HIV/TB) individuals, we sought to correlate various cutoff points for the CD4+ T cell count with positive responses to TB diagnostic tests (IGRA, PPD5, and PPD10) (Figure 1).

Table 1: Distribution of frequencies and of the respective percentages of clinical forms of TB in 90 HIV/TB coinfected individuals.

| Variable                  | Group               | Frequency (n) | Percentage (%) |
|---------------------------|---------------------|---------------|----------------|
| Clinical Forms            | Pulmonary           | 41            | 45.56          |
|                           | Extrapulmonary      | 23            | 25.56          |
|                           | Disseminated        | 19            | 21.11          |
|                           | Combination of forms* | 7             | 7.78           |

*Combination of forms: pulmonary + ganglionic or pulmonary + pleural.

Figure 1: Cutoff points for the CD4+ T cell count to maximize (probability of 93.75%) the diagnostic performance of PPD5 (left), PPD10 (central), and IGRA (right). The vertical line indicates the cutoff point of the CD4+ T cell count that maximized the diagnostic performance of the tests.

Our analysis showed that IGRA could diagnose TB with a

Results

In the total sample comprising 90 individuals with HIV and active TB, 60.0% were male, 54.4% were white, 57.3% were single, and the average age was 39 (± 10.8) years. In compliance with the Brazilian immunization program, most volunteers (88.9%) had been given BCG vaccination in childhood.
and Quantiferon-TB Gold IT for diagnosis of LTBI did not find any [28]. A study conducted in Ethiopia with healthy students using TST within the first two years after its application in adult populations than 10 years had elapsed since vaccination in all cases. According to and because all volunteers were older than 18 years of age and more of the present study because this vaccine is applied at birth in Brazil 64 to 87% in previous studies on TB disease [11,27].

be 98.1% and 68.1%, respectively. However, the sensitivity of IGRA is immunocompetent individuals vaccinated with BCG was reported to tuberculosis, by several species of mycobacteria, such as environmental forms mostly composed of individuals with severe immunodeficiency, which favor the occurrence of extrapulmonary and disseminated TB [21,22].

The specificity of TST is low because PPD includes antigens shared with IGRA demonstrated a greater concentration of data in the area corresponding to the lowest values for both variables, as shown in Figure 2.

The correlation between these two variables, although not strong, proved to be significant (correlation coefficient of 0.447; p<0.001) using Spearman’s test.

Discussion

The classical signs and symptoms of TB were a frequent finding in the present sample of individuals with HIV infection, thus indicating the significance of this infection in this type of patient [14,15].

Although pulmonary TB was the most frequently identified form in the present sample, it is worth noticing that the rates of extrapulmonary and disseminated TB were higher than those previously reported in the literature for individuals not infected by HIV [16-20]. This is probably due to the fact that the population investigated in the present study was mostly composed of individuals with severe immunodeficiency, which favors the occurrence of extrapulmonary and disseminated TB [21,22].

The specificity of TST is low because PPD includes antigens shared by several species of mycobacteria, such as environmental forms M. tuberculosis, and M. bovis (BCG) [23,24].

In previous studies, the diagnostic specificity of IGRA and TST in immunocompetent individuals vaccinated with BCG was reported to be 98.1% and 68.1%, respectively. However, the sensitivity of IGRA is difficult to establish [25,26], as this result has been shown to vary from 64 to 87% in previous studies on TB disease [11,27].

We believe that BCG vaccination did not influence the results of the present study because this vaccine is applied at birth in Brazil and because all volunteers were older than 18 years of age and more than 10 years had elapsed since vaccination in all cases. According to some studies, BCG vaccination may influence the response to TST within the first two years after its application in adult populations [28]. A study conducted in Ethiopia with healthy students using TST and Quantiferon-TB Gold IT for diagnosis of LTBI did not find any influence of BCG vaccination on the TST results [29].

Another issue is whether TST affects the results of QuantiFERON-TB Gold IT; studies suggest that especially when IGRA is performed after TST (from seven days up to three months), the interferon–γ levels may increase, particularly in individuals who tested positive to TST [30-32].

In the present study, TST resulted in a positive response in only (25.56%) of the volunteers with active TB compared to 65.56% when using IGRA. We believe that the low sensitivity of both methods was due to the severe immunodeficiency exhibited by the investigated sample (average CD4+ T cell count of 198.92 cells/mm³). This situation not withstanding, the performance of IGRA was superior in comparison to TST (p<0.001).

Due to the difficulties associated with interpreting TST results in patients with HIV/AIDS and various degrees of immunodeficiency, IGRA may represent a relevant contribution to the diagnosis of LTBI and TB disease in this type of patients, especially in cases with (false) negative results by TST [33]. Factors that could potentially influence the IGRA results in individuals with active TB, leading to indeterminate or false-negative results, include old age, low lymphocyte count, malnutrition (inhibition of the specific immune response) [34], HLA genotype, high C-reactive protein (CRP) values, and coinfection by HIV [35-37].

Previous studies have shown that both TST and IGRA can exhibit false-negative results in individuals with severe immunodeficiency. However, the performance of IGRA seems superior compared to TST, and this test may therefore be considered an auxiliary tool for the diagnosis of active TB in individuals with AIDS.

The cutoff point of TB Ag-Nil suggested by the test manufacturer for the diagnosis of LTBI is 0.35 IU/ml. However, this value may not be accurate in immunodeficient individuals with LTBI or active TB. In this regard, it is worth noting that IGRA has been recently approved for the differential diagnosis of active TB.

In patients with LTBI or active TB, peripheral blood lymphocytes are capable of recognizing TB antigens and producing cytokines (IFN-γ). Accordingly, QuantiFERON-TB Gold IT measures the T cell production of IFN-γ following stimulation with peptide antigens from mycobacterial proteins (ESAT 6, CFP 10, and TB 7, 7 (p4)). Therefore, responsiveness to IGRA depends on the number and function of T cells, which were both severely affected in the participants in the present study. These results suggest that different cutoff points should be established for the differential diagnosis of active TB in immunodeficient individuals with low CD4+ T cell counts. In fact, the ideal approach would be to assess these responses in clinical studies conducted at areas with high and low TB prevalence rates [36,37]. In the present study, the TB Ag-Nil values were lower among individuals with the lowest CD4+ T cell counts, and these subjects were liable to present false-negatives results when this count was less than 187 cells/mm³. Because TST exhibited false-negative results with CD4+ T cell counts lower than 473 cells/mm³, the performance of IGRA was comparatively better in the investigated population. However, further studies are needed to establish the precise contribution of IGRA to the diagnosis of TB disease in individuals with HIV infection.

Conclusions

IGRA exhibited better performance for TB disease diagnosis in HIV-infected individuals with severe immunodeficiency when compared to TST. Nevertheless, both tests may exhibit false-negative results in this type of population. Despite the fact that IGRA has better performance than TST in the diagnosis of active TB in patients with HIV/AIDS, the
practical utilization of the method seems to be limited and should be considered only for patients with CD4+ T ≥ 187 cells/mm³.

Acknowledgments
Sources of funding
The authors thank the São Paulo Research Foundation (Fundação Amparo à Pesquisa do Estado de São Paulo - FAPESP) Process no. 2011/05805-1 (Regular Research Project) and the National Council for Scientific and Technological Development (Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico - CNPq) Process no. 141705/2011-6 for the financial support. FAPESP and CNPq have an interest in the publication of the research. FAPESP, financial support. CNPq, scholarship for doctoral researcher Giselle Klautau.

The authors thank the Immunology Laboratory of Prof. Dr. Reinaldo Solomão - UNIFESP for technical support.

Conflict of Interest
On behalf of all authors, the corresponding author states that there is no conflict of interest.

References
1. World Health Organization (2013) Global Tuberculosis Report 2013. World Health Organization 1-306.
2. Zumla A, Raviglione M, Hafner R, von Reyn CF (2013) Tuberculosis. N Engl J Med 368: 745-755.
3. Corbett EL, MacPherson P (2013) Tuberculosis screening in high human immunodeficiency virus prevalence settings: turning promise into reality. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 17: 1126-1138.
4. McNerney R, Mauerer M, Abubakar I, Marais B, McHugh TD, et al. (2012) Interferon-gamma diagnostics and biomarkers: needs, challenges, recent advances, and opportunities. J Infect Dis 205 Suppl 2: S147-158.
5. Mazurek GH, Jereb J, Vernons A, LoBue P, Goldberg S, et al. (2010) Updated guidelines for using Interferon Gamma Release Assays to detect Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection - United States, 2010. MMWR Recomm Rep 59: 1-25.
6. World Health Organization (2011) Use of tuberculosis interferon-gamma release assays (IGRAs) in low- and middle-income countries: policy statement. World Health Organization 1-70.
7. Cattamanchi A, Smith R, Steinberg KR, Metcalfe JZ, Date A, et al. (2011) Interferon-gamma release assays for the diagnosis of latent tuberculosis infection in HIV-infected individuals: a systematic review and meta-analysis. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 56: 230-238.
8. Santin T, Muñoz L, Rigau D (2012) Interferon-γ release assays for the diagnosis of tuberculosis and tuberculosis infection in HIV-infected adults: a systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS One 7: e32482.
9. Pai M, Zwerling A, Menezes D (2008) Systematic review: T-cell-based assays for the diagnosis of latent tuberculosis infection: an update. Ann Intern Med 149: 1774-1781.
10. González-Salazar F, Vargas-Villarreal J, Ganciulano-Martinez FJ, Rivera G, Moreno-Treviño MG, et al. (2011) Snapshot of QuantiFERON TB gold testing in Northern Mexico. Tuberculosis (Edinb) 91 Suppl 1: S34-37.
11. Dheda K, van Zyl Smit R, Badri M, Pai M (2009) T-cell interferon-gamma release assays for the rapid immunodiagnosis of tuberculosis: clinical utility in high-burden vs. low-burden settings. Curr Opin Pulm Med 15: 188-200.
12. Conde MB, Melo FA, Marques AM, Cardoso NC, Pinheiro VG, et al. (2009) III Brazilian Thoracic Association Guidelines on tuberculosis. J Bras Pneumol 35: 1018-1048.
13. Pennie RA (1995) Mantoux tests. Performing, interpreting, and acting upon them. Can Fam Physician 41: 1025-1029.
14. Getahun H, Kittikraisik W, Heilig CM, Corbett EL, Ayles H, et al. (2011) Development of a standardized screening rule for tuberculosis in people living with HIV in resource-constrained settings: individual participant data meta-analysis of observational studies. PLoS Med 8: e1000391.
15. Bates M, O’Grady J, Mwaba P, Chilukuti L, Myezje J, et al. (2012) Evaluation of the burden of unsuspected pulmonary tuberculosis and co-morbidity with non-communicable diseases in sputum producing adult inpatients. PLoS One 7: e40774.
16. Lawn SD, Zumla AI (2011) Tuberculosis. Lancet 378: 57-72.
17. von Reyn CF, Kimombo S, Mei L, Arbeit RD, Maro I, et al. (2011) Disseminated tuberculosis in human immunodeficiency virus infection: ineffective immunity, polyclonal disease and high mortality. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 15: 1087-1092.
18. Mudenda V, Lucas S, Shibemba A, O’Grady J, Bates M, et al. (2012) Tuberculosis and tuberculosis/HIV/AIDS-associated mortality in Africa: the urgent need to expand and invest in routine and research autopies. J Infect Dis 205 Suppl 2: S340-346.
19. Mei L, Matee M, Herof T, Bakari M, Horsburgh CR, et al. (2005) High rates of clinical and subclinical tuberculosis among HIV-infected ambulatory subjects in Tanzania. Clin Infect Dis 40: 1500-1507.
20. Cain KP, McCarthy KD, Heilig CM, Monkkongee P, Tasaneeyapan T, et al. (2010) An algorithm for tuberculosis screening and diagnosis in people with HIV. N Engl J Med 362: 707-716.
21. Klautau GB, Kuschneroff TM (2005) Clinical forms and outcome of tuberculosis in HIV-infected patients in a tertiary hospital in São Paulo - Brazil. Braz J Infect Dis 9: 464-478.
22. Caws M, Thrailites G, Dunstan S, Hawn TR, Lan NT, et al. (2008) The influence of host and bacterial genotype on the development of disseminated disease with Mycobacterium tuberculosis. PLoS Pathog 4: e1000034.
23. Huebner R, Schein MF, Bass JB Jr (1993) The tuberculin skin test. Clin Infect Dis 17: 968-975.
24. Andersen P, Munk ME, Pollack JM, Doherty TM (2000) Specific immune-based diagnosis of tuberculosis. Lancet 356: 1099-1104.
25. Diel R, Goletti D, Ferrara G, Bothamley G, Cirillo D, et al. (2011) Interferon-γ release assays for the diagnosis of latent Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Eur Respir J 37: 88-99.
26. Palazzio, Spensieri F, Massari M, Fedele G, Frasca L, et al. (2008) Use of whole-blood samples in in-house bulk and single-antigen-specific gamma interferon assays for surveillance of Mycobacterium tuberculosis infections. Clin Vaccine Immunol 15: 327-333.
27. Balcells ME, Pérez CM, Chanquejo L, Lasso M, Villanueva M, et al. (2008) A comparative study of two different methods for the detection of latent tuberculosis in HIV-positive individuals in Chile. Int J Infect Dis 12: 645-652.
28. Joos TJ, Miller WC, Murdoch DM (2006) Tuberculin reactivity in bacille Calmette-Guérin vaccinated populations: a compilation of international data. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 10: 883-891.
29. Dagnew AF, Hussein J, Abebe M, Zewdie M, Milhet A, et al. (2012) Diagnosis of latent tuberculosis infection in healthy young adults in a country with high tuberculosis burden and BCG vaccination at birth. BMC Res Notes 5: 415.
30. van Zyl-Smit RN, Zwerling A, Dheda K, Pai M (2009) Within-subject variability of interferon-gamma assay results for tuberculosis and boosting effect of tuberculin skin testing: a systematic review. PLoS One 4: e8517.
31. van Zyl-Smit RN, Pai M, Pedrah K, Meldau R, Kieck J, et al. (2009) Within-subject variability and boosting of T-cell interferon-gamma responses after tuberculin skin testing. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 180: 49-58.
32. Sauzullo I, Massetti AP, Mengoni F, Rossi R, Lichtner M, et al. (2011) Influence of previous tuberculin skin test on serial IFN-γ release assays. Tuberculosis (Edinb) 91: 322-328.
33. Denkinger CM, Dheda K, Pai M (2011) Guidelines on interferon-γ release assays for tuberculosis infection: concordance, discordance or confusion? Clin Microbiol Infect 17: 806-814.
34. Kobashy Y, Sugiu T, MourI K, Obase Y, Miyashita N, et al. (2009) Indeterminate results of QuantiFERON TB-2G test performed in routine clinical practice. Eur Respir J 33: 812-815.
35. Hang NT, Lien LT, Cobayashi N, Shimbo T, Sakurada S, et al. (2011) Analysis of factors lowering sensitivity of interferon-γ release assay for tuberculosis. PLoS One 6: e23806.
36. Kim EY, Park MS, Kim YS, Kim SK, Chang J, et al. (2011) Risk factors for false-negative results with the QuantiFERON-TB Gold in-tube assay in non-HIV-infected patients with culture-confirmed tuberculosis. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis 70: 324-339.
37. Banfield S, Pascoe E, Thambiran A, Siafarikas A, Burgher D (2012) Factors associated with the performance of a blood-based interferon-γ release assay in diagnosing tuberculosis. PLoS One 7: e38556.