Internationalization or globalization of higher education

Habibolah Rezaei, Alireza Yousefi1, Bagher Larijani2, Reza Dehnavieh3, Nima Rezaei4, Peyman Adibi5

Abstract:
INTRODUCTION: Studies about globalization and internationalization demonstrate different attitudes in explaining these concepts. Since there is no consensus among Iranian specialists about these concepts, the purpose of this study is to explain the concepts of internationalization and globalization in Iran.

MATERIALS AND METHODS: This study is a systematic review done in the first half of 2016. To explain the concept of globalization and internationalization, articles in Scientific Information D atabase, Magiran database, and Google Scholar were searched with the keywords such as globalization, scientific exchange, international cooperation, curriculum exchange, student exchange, faculty exchange, multinational cooperation, transnational cooperation, and collaborative research. Articles, used in this study, were in Persian and were devoted to internationalization and globalization between 2001 and 2016. The criterion of discarding the articles was duplicity.

RESULTS: As many as 180 Persian articles were found on this topic. After discarding repetitive articles, 64 remained. Among those, 39 articles mentioned the differences between globalization and internationalization. Definitions of globalization were categorized in four categories, including globalization, globalizing, globalization of higher education, and globalizing of higher education. Definitions about internationalization were categorized in five categories such as internationalization, internationalization of higher education, internationalization of the curriculum, internationalization of curriculum studies, and internationalization of curriculum profession.

CONCLUSION: The spectrum of the globalization of higher education moves from dissonance and multipolarization to unification and single polarization of the world. One end of the spectrum, which is dissonance and multipolarization of the world, is interpreted as globalization. The other side of the spectrum, which is unification and single polarization of the world, is interpreted as globalizing. The definition of internationalization is the same as that of globalizing. In other words, it is possible to say that internalization is similar to globalizing but different from globalization.

Keywords:
Globalization, globalizing, internationalization, internationalization of curriculum, internationalization of curriculum profession, internationalization of curriculum studies, internationalization of higher education

Introduction

During these two decades, higher education has undergone an increasing pressure for rapid social, technical, economic, and political changes due to the internal and external postindustrial environment.[1] Gumport and Sporn state that the environmental pressure is so dynamic that it leads to basic changes and evolution in universities.[2] Two factors of evolution in higher education systems are globalization and internationalization.[3] Kubow and Crawford cite the antiquity of globalization to thousands of years before human’s history and they mention that the antiquity of globalization is as old as human civilization. Marcus Aurelius writes,

This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 License, which allows others to remix, tweak, and build upon the work non-commercially, as long as the author is credited and the new creations are licensed under the identical terms.

For reprints contact: reprints@medknow.com

How to cite this article: Rezaei H, Yousefi A, Larijani B, Dehnavieh R, Rezaei N, Adibi P. Internationalization or globalization of higher education. J Educ Health Promot 2018;7:8.
Globalization is a challenging word that possesses a large spectrum of positive and negative ideas and opinions about its definition. A review of the literature shows how studies about globalization and its dimension demonstrate different attitudes in explaining this concept. In the recent years, internationalization was one of the most important discussions in academia. Various definitions exist about internationalization. In management, internationalization means the development of operational processes of business including strategy, structure, and resources in international environments. However, in higher education, different definitions exist about internationalization. Each of them pays attention to one or some of the sides. The term “internationalization,” which often focuses on the international dimensions of higher education and postsecondary education, is interpreted and used by different stakeholders in different ways in different countries. The use and focus on definitions and studies that exist abroad, usually in Western countries with economic and political domination over many countries that try to apply this rule to other countries, cannot be of a great help in internationalizing the university in a country like Iran, which has a Muslim-dominated civilization with historical, national identity. Perhaps, the definition of internationalization was brought up by a foreign culture, which has set political and dominative goals and has put the errant path in front of the Iranian researchers. Finally, in the modernization era, the Iranian-Islamic cultural identity is often neglected to achieve scientific communication and develop easy accessibility to scientific resources, and even economic and political goals. For example, according to numerous research papers, the globalization era, considered to be the age of communication and the dissemination of goods, has made it possible for the Western countries and superpowers to spread the Western culture and influence on the minds of youths. Iranian experts have no reference to these concepts in their talks. Therefore, this study aims to explore the concept of the globalization and internationalization of higher education in Iran.

Materials and Methods

This systematic review was conducted in the first half of 2016. In this study, articles, including keywords such as internationalization, curriculum exchange, student exchange, faculty exchange, multinational cooperation, transnational cooperation, and cooperative research, were researched on databases such as SID, Magiran, and Google Scholar, to clarify the definition of internationalization and globalization. Manual search for use of articles, presented in conferences, was also carried out. The inclusion criteria include the period of publication, the language of articles, and appropriateness to the aim of the study. The articles in Persian, referring to internationalization and globalization published between 2001 and 2016, were also included in the study. The exclusion criterion was duplication. The determination levels of articles were laid as meta-analysis and systematic review articles in level 1, empirical articles in level 2, quasi-experimental articles in level 3, descriptive and analytical articles (comparative studies, correlation studies, and case studies) in level 4, and committee report or opinions or experiences of experts in level 5. The quality of articles was categorized, based on the suitability of introduction, methods, results, and discussions, into three categories – good quality, medium quality, and poor quality. A 21-point score was calculated with the attribution of one point each for appropriate introduction, express gap, express purpose of study, express design of study, describing the study population, samples, appropriate sampling method, the right tools, validity expression, reliability expression, appropriate methods of collecting data, appropriate methods of analysis, expression of moral considerations, expression of inclusion criteria, expression of exclusion criteria, expression of demographic findings, provision of suitable results for aim, accordance to the presented significant findings in the discussion, comparison of the results with other studies in the discussion, expression of suggestions, and expression of limitations. According to this scoring system, articles were distributed into three categories. Articles that scored <7 were of poor quality, articles scoring from 8 to 14 were tagged as medium quality, and the articles that scored 15–21 were of good quality.

Results

Following the methods, as many as 180 papers were found in Persian. Only 64 articles remained after the removal of duplicate articles. Out of these, only 39 articles included discussions on the definition of globalization, internationalization, and the differences between these two concepts. The specifications of these articles are shown in Table 1. The statistical precision, effect size, and appropriateness to aim in total articles were not presented. Hence, these indices were not compiled in Table 1.

As Table 1 shows, in these 19 articles, the design of the study is indeterminate, and so are the levels of these articles. This table also shows that these 19 articles have level four or five. In terms of quality, 27 articles fall into the poor quality bracket, and 6 each are of medium and good quality.

All definitions of globalization and internationalization are presented in Tables 2 and 3. The definition of globalization is expressed in Table 2 and of internationalization in Table 3.
Table 1: Articles entered into review

| Row | Author | Journal or congress | Year | Design and level of study | Study quality | Place of study | Study population | Description |
|-----|--------|---------------------|------|---------------------------|--------------|---------------|-----------------|-------------|
| 1   | Hossaynimoghadam | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Indeterminate-indeterminate | Poor | - | - | Describing globalization and internationalization, higher education trends, and alternative futures of university |
| 2   | Mahmoudi et al. | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Indeterminate-indeterminate | Poor | - | - | Describes internationalization, advantages, disadvantages, prerequisites, the current state of globalization and internationalization of Iran’s higher education, scientific solutions for internationalization, components of the transnational education |
| 3   | Koushkmehdi et al. | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Descriptive-4 | Good | Ferdowsi University | Faculty | Examines the role of virtual universities in achieving the development of cross-border higher education |
| 4   | Mohamadaminzade et al. | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Analytical-descriptive-4 | Poor | - | - | Factors and conditions of internationalization of higher education, barriers and bottlenecks of internationalization, component of internationalization of universities, curriculum role in the internationalization of higher education |
| 5   | Babadi et al. | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Analytical-4 | Poor | - | Expert and researcher in higher education | Definition of internationalization, need for internationalization, internationalization challenges, determinate position of institutions of Astan Quds Razavi |
| 6   | Fazeli | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Analytical-descriptive | Poor | - | Documents, books, and articles | Analysis and interpretation of various concepts of internationalization of curriculum in higher education and internationalization implications on the elements of the curriculum in higher education |
| 7   | Solaymani | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Review-analytical-4 | Poor | - | - | The effects of internationalization on identity |
Table 1: Contd...

| Row | Author            | Journal or congress                                      | Year | Design and level of study | Study quality | Place of study | Study population | Description                                                                 |
|-----|-------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|------|---------------------------|---------------|----------------|------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 8   | Poureskandari et al. | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Indeterminate-indeterminate | Poor          | -              | -                | Describing globalization and its dimensions, developments in the era of globalization, theories of globalization, describe the internationalization of curriculum and approaches, the need for internationalization of the curriculum |
| 9   | Khaleghkha et al.  | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Indeterminate-indeterminate | Poor          | -              | -                | Describing the role of educative science in the internationalization of higher education |
| 10  | Tamanaeifar et al. | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Indeterminate-indeterminate | Poor          | -              | -                | Describes the differences between internationalization and globalization of higher education, the internationalization of higher education objectives and prerequisites, reasons and benefits, opportunities and challenges, strategies for internationalization of higher education |
| 11  | Baniamerian et al. | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Review-1                  | Poor          | -              | -                | Conducted research and book Describing the concept of globalization and internationalization of higher education, describing cultural-religious identity and cultural status of Iran and Iranian-Islamic identity |
| 12  | Ebrahimi et al.   | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Descriptive-4             | Poor          | -              | -                | Describing the impact of globalization on higher education and appropriate curriculum in globalization of higher education, introduce models of globalization of higher education and necessary action for globalization of Iran higher education |
| 13  | Saylane et al.    | International congress of developing international higher education: opportunities and challenges | 2014 | Indeterminate-indeterminate | Poor          | -              | -                | Describes internationalization, the internationalization of higher education trends, the main factors underlying the cross-border higher education, mechanisms of internationalization of higher education |
| 14  | Fathivajargah et al. | Education journal                                     | 2012 | Qualitative-4             | Medium        | Tehran University, Sanati Sharif University, and Imam Khomeini University | Managers and Iranian faculties and foreign students studying in Iran | Determines necessity, conditions, facilities, and resources, obstacles and constraints, appropriate topics, opportunities, and strategies for internationalization |
| Row | Author                     | Journal or congress                          | Year | Design and level of study         | Study quality | Place of study | Study population                                      | Description                                                                 |
|-----|---------------------------|---------------------------------------------|------|-----------------------------------|---------------|---------------|------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 14  |                           |                                             |      |                                   |               |               |                                                      |                                                                            |
| 15  | Fathivajargh et al.       | Quarterly Journal of Research and Planning in Higher education | 2009 | Descriptive-4                     | Medium        | Shahid Beheshti University | Faculty | Identify barriers of internationalization of higher education curriculum |
| 16  | Zakersalehi et al.        | Journal of Iran Higher Education association | 2012 | Explorative-survey-4              | Medium        | -              | -                                                    | Expression of different experiences in the world, and different models in catching foreign students |
| 17  | Fathivajargh et al.       | Quarterly Journal of New Approaches in Educational administration | 2011 | Descriptive-survey-4              | Good          | Sanati Sharif, Shahid Beheshti, Tarbiat Modares, Tehran, and Payame Noor University | Faculty and Iranian and foreign students | Investigation of necessity, factors, conditions, resources, capabilities, limitations, opportunities, and strategies for the internationalization of curricula with distance learning approach |
| 18  | Fathivajargh et al.       | Interdisciplinary Studies in the Humanities | 2009 | Theoretical study-5               | Good          | -              | Documents and scientific resources                  | Specify the concept of internationalization of higher education, specify ICT and IT application in internationalization of higher education, evaluating Iran situation in terms of use of ICT in internationalization of higher education |
| 19  | Khosravinejad et al.      | Journal of Higher Education Curriculum Studies | 2011 | Descriptive-survey-4              | Good          | Azad University in Khuzestan province | Faculty | Examining barriers to internationalization of curriculum in Azad University in District 6 |
| 20  | Behjatiardakani et al.    | Curriculum Planning                         | 2012 | Comparative-analytical-5          | Poor          | -              | Print and electronic library resources associated with America, Canada, Australia, Japan | Describes approaches to the internationalization of curricula of higher education in different countries |
| 21  | Dibavajari                | Journal of Education Strategies             | 2009 | Indeterminate-interminate          | Poor          | -              | -                                                    | Conceptualized internationalization of curriculum |
| 22  | Bazargan et al.           | Quarterly Journal of Research and Planning in Higher Education | 2010 | Descriptive-analytical-4          | Medium        | Iran           | Governmental university                               | Investigation status of transnational education in Iran |
| 23  | Khorasan et al.           | Journal of Education Strategies             | 2012 | Descriptive-survey                | Medium        | Shahid Beheshti University | Faculty | Strategies for effective internationalization of universities and institutions of higher education |
| 24  | Khoshnoudifar et al.      | Journal of Technology of Education          | 2011 | Descriptive-survey                | Good          | Sharif University of Technology, Shahid Beheshti, Tarbiat Modares, Tehran, and Islamic Foreign professors and students | Faculty | Investigation of necessity, factors, conditions, resources, capabilities, limitations, opportunities, and appropriate strategies for the internationalization of curricula with distance learning approach |

Contd...
| Row | Author         | Journal or congress                                      | Year | Design and level of study | Study quality | Place of study            | Study population | Description                                                                 |
|-----|----------------|---------------------------------------------------------|------|---------------------------|---------------|---------------------------|------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 25  | Arefi et al.   | Journal of Management and Planning in Educational Systems | 2008 | Descriptive-survey-4      | Good          | Payame Noor University    | Governmental universities in Tehran | Identification of the effectiveness of the international communications of higher education in the curriculum |
| 26  | Shaebani       | Information Science                                     | 2005 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Describing globalization, its impact on the release of information and notification |
| 27  | Vaezi et al.   | Culture leaf                                            | 2010 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Describes the culture, the globalization of culture, and the globalization of higher education |
| 28  | Sharghi        | Monthly Cultural Engineering                           | 2009 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Describes globalization of higher education and the development of international scientific cooperation |
| 29  | Javedani       | Quarterly Journal of Research and Planning in Higher education | 2009 | Librarian study Content analysis Comparative study Meta-analysis | Poor          | -                         | -                | Describe the concept of globalization, internationalization, and investigation of Iran’s education system’s status in the global process of internationalization |
| 30  | Apili          | Globalization and Education Congress                    | 2005 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Describing globalization and global developments in education, performance evaluation, and challenges in education |
| 31  | Hakimzade      | Interdisciplinary Studies in the Humanities             | 2010 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Describing globalization and internationalization of higher education, necessity and strategy for internationalization, and describing interdisciplinary approaches and internationalization |
| 32  | Khodaverdi     | International Relations Research Quarterly              | 2012 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Describes globalization, components, and dimensions of globalization of higher education |
| 33  | Sajadi         | Journal of Education and Psychology, University of Shahid Chamran | 2003 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Descriptions and dimensions of globalization, the challenges of globalization for higher education |
| 34  | Garibabadi et al. | Political and Economic                                  | 2003 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Describes globalization and various approaches to globalization |
| 35  | Kazemi         | Management and Development Planning                    | 2003 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Describing globalization and its effects on the economy, culture, politics, and technology and describing the challenges of higher education in the third millennium |
| 36  | Shahidi        | Education Culture                                      | 2006 | Indeterminate             | Poor          | -                         | -                | Definition of globalization and describing globalization approaches |

Contd...
Table 1: Contd...

| Row | Author            | Journal or congress | Year | Design and level of study | Study quality | Place of study | Study population        | Description                                                                 |
|-----|-------------------|---------------------|------|---------------------------|---------------|----------------|------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 37  | Atashak et al.    | Curriculum Planning | 2013 | Descriptive-4             | Medium        |                | Curriculum experts      | Determines output of globalization on the curriculum and determines the mechanisms of globalization of higher education curriculum |
| 38  | Araste Rahyafat   |                     | 2008 | Indeterminate-ineeterminate| Poor          |                |                        | Describing globalization and its challenges                                |
| 39  | Ghasempourdehaghi | Journal of Cultural Research | 2011 | Qualitative-4             | Poor          |                | Education and sociology experts | Describing globalization and internationalization and its effects on higher education, internationalization of curriculum model approaches, and necessity of internationalization |

ICT=Information and communication technology, IT=Information Technology

Table 2: Definitions of globalization and globalizing

| Definition provider | Definition |
|---------------------|------------|
| 1 Philippe Legrain  | In general, it is not bad, but far from the good. It is the large supermarket that people have the right to choose the best. It is not American and global governance of commercial companies and cannot remove cultures. It is an opportunity for mutual enrichment rather than a process for removing poverty in the world |
| 2 Ajun Appadurai    | It is a kind of industrial revolution that is guided by information and communication. Migration, investment, culture, information, and communication are the main points of trust in that |
| 3 International Monetary Fund | It is a historical process and the achievement of human innovation and technological advancement |
| 4 Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy | It is the whole range of political, economic, and cultural trends and events |
| 5 Encarta Encyclopedia | It is the emergence of a global community that allows the economic, political, social, and cultural events in a part of the world to make rapid and important impact on the rest of the world. It is the result of the progress in communication, transportation, and information |
| 6 Sperling          | It is the dominant force that positively shapes multiple environments, in which we live. It creates interdependence, new forms of local reactions, and identity assertiveness |
| 7 Edward Ni Tat     | Refers to a process, in which, the free flow of ideas, people, goods, services, and capital is possible throughout the world |
| 8 Haroy             | It highlights the fact that people today are experiencing a life quite different from the past. The emergence and development of communication facilities spread the interaction among human societies and people, and revealed a new global system. A system where events, decisions, and activities from every corner of the world can make significant implications for other parts of the near and far |
| 9 Showit            | It describes the growth of international exchange and interdependence among countries, redefining of relations between the countries, and an international economic alternative instead of seeing the national economy |
| 10 Mcgrow           | The process of diffusion of goods and ideas and experiences to people around the world; for example, the spread of computers, satellites, and communication equipment such as mobile phones |
| 11 Pourskandari     | Establishment diversity and mutual relations between the government and the societies that led to the creation of the present global system, and the process, through which, events, decisions, and activities in one part of the world could have significant output for other individuals and communities in other parts of the globe |
| 12 Stowart          | A process due to transformation of new worlds such as the spread of communication networks, easier communication, more people in other parts of the world, the growth of technology in all dimensions, and more interconnectedness around the world |

Contd...
### Definition of Globalizing

| Row | Definition provider | Definition |
|-----|---------------------|------------|
| 13  | Clifford            | It is defined as a complex process that encompasses the global flow of people and goods, ideas and ideologies, perceptions, messages, capital, and technology |
| 14  | Gidenz              | Enhances social relations at the global level so that the local communities away from each other can be connected and local events are affected by events that occur far away and conversely |

### Definition of Globalization

| Row | Definition provider | Definition |
|-----|---------------------|------------|
| 1   | Marshal Mak Lohan   | It is a combination of economies and societies around the world. An economic integration, particularly through cross-border trade and financial flows, is its main feature |
| 2   | Tamlinson           | It should be considered in the territory of culture, which leads to remove region from culture. Culture dependency to local, regional, and specific land pickup |
| 3   | Halak               | Combination of free-trade goods and services along with the free movement of capital |
| 4   | Dim                 | The global expansion of trade in services as key economic, social, and cultural global market |
| 5   | Sowell              | It is not necessarily a two-way, mutual, agreement-based and understanding-based process. Countries that have a more powerful media and tools export their values and products |
| 6   | Delanti             | It is a continuing internationalization. It is overshadowing the national government by market, communication, and deterritorialization processes |
| 7   | Gacel               | It is not the willingness to respect the differences and borders, and undermine the foundations of many governments, and following homogeneity and homogenization |
| 8   | Pourskandari        | A project already designed by a hegemonic system to maintain an economic, political, and cultural domination over the world. It does this by deepening and expanding it to other countries |
| 9   | Trazraz             | It is a social process, in which, the constraints of geography on social and cultural relations disappear, and people are increasingly aware of the reduction of these restrictions |
| 10  | Solaymani           | It is an instantaneous and imposed issue, through which, arrogant powers impose their culture and politics on others. Advanced media and culture of dominant countries are offered to developing countries, humiliating, diminutive, and ignoring the individual ethnic identities, nationality, and religions of nations |
| 11  | Scott               | It is an inevitable and involuntary process. It is a concept, associated with capitalism and consumerism. It is a process used to reduce the presence and authority of governments or nations. It is a close collaboration and division of labor among countries with cheap labor and countries with new and advanced technologies |
| 12  | Showlt              | It is a means of Westernization or modernization, a means of a dynamic force, in which, the structures of modernism such as capitalism, industrialization, and bureaucracy dominate the world and destroy the local culture. It means deterritorialization or merged territories into a single territory. It is a means to disturb or remove spaces, areas, distances, and geographical boundaries. It means a kind of liberalization that is about the removal of trade barriers and capital controls. It is government-imposed movement among countries with an aim to create a world economy without borders |
| 13  | Ardakani            | Refers to a set of changes that not only change the areas of politics and economics, but also science, culture, and lifestyle |
| 14  | Knight              | The falling flow of technology, economy, knowledge, values, and ideas across borders that affected every country regardless of the history, traditions, culture and expectations |
| 15  | Mahmoudi            | It is a flow of thoughts, ideas, products, technology, and economics across geographic boundaries in different countries. It is not necessarily a two-way, mutual, agreement-based, and understanding-based process, and countries that have a more powerful media and tools export their values and products. It means unifying. Standardization in globalization is based on market values, more money, and more income. Competitiveness in globalization is in the area of production and profit. In globalization, computing is an alternative for market and industry responsiveness. In globalization, social obligations include individual actions and tools, economic competitiveness, efforts to increase growth and productivity, economic man, clash of civilizations, and economic freedoms |

*Contd...*
Table 2: Contd...

| Row | Definition provider | Definition |
|-----|---------------------|------------|
| 1   | Yang                | Beginning of globalization is in the early advent of modernism, Western imperialism, and modern technology. Globalization is driving the belief for the creation of a single market. A key priority of globalization is economics. Early form of globalization is conflict, confrontation, and exploitation. In globalization, economic benefits are considered unilateral. Globalization does not follow specific rules about the quality. Globalization is out of the actor’s control |
| 2   | Robertson           | Globalization means pressing the world and turning it into a single location |

Table 3: Definition that presented about internationalization

| Row | Definition provider | Definition |
|-----|---------------------|------------|
| 1   | Fathivajargah       | Internationalization means give and take or interaction among nations that have value and are ideologically laden. It refers to an issue with a transnational aspect. It is based on an agreement among two or more countries that together have a give-and-take situation; for example, the disposal of educational services for each other |
| 2   | Knight              | Internationalization is giving transnational aspect to a country, product, or personal thoughts |
| 3   | Ebrahimi            | Internationalization is a voluntary process, during which, the government and various institutions select and apply methods and specific programs to deal with the changing environment |
| 4   | Mahmoudi            | Internationalization is a mutual, reciprocal, preplanned process based on agreement, in which, activity, action, or certain crops are placed at the disposal of one or more countries. It is based on the economic, cultural, political, and educational exchange among nations. It means cooperation and partaking |
| 5   | Gacel               | Internationalization is the process of compensating the tendencies of globalization and supporting resistance against homogenization and eliminating nationalities |
| 6   | Wylie               | Internationalization refers to the relations among governments or nations that encourage understanding and respect among differences and traditions |
| 7   | Pourskandari        | Internationalization is an act of choice that converts challenges of globalization into opportunities |
| 8   | Hosaynimoghadam     | Internationalization requires acceptance of cultural diversity. In one hand, internationalization is a globalization broker and, on the other hand, it is a response to globalization |
| 9   | Roubin              | Internationalization is not a globalization identifier but it is one product and one factor of globalization |
| 10  | Hyoward             | Internationalization can be considered as the national voluntary response to globalization |
| 11  | Scott               | Internationalization changes the world of higher education and it is a discussion in the field of diplomacy and culture. Presence of governments or nations is definite in it. It reflects the world order resulted from governments and nations |

Contd...
Table 3: Contd...

| Row | Definition provider | Definition of internationalization of higher education |
|-----|---------------------|------------------------------------------------------|
| 1   | Bestrum             | Process of integration of international, intercultural, and global dimension to the objectives, performance, and implementation of higher education in a way that promote respect to cultural differences and different traditions |
| 2   | Poley               | TNE refers to a wide range of educational activities that usually include parts of international agreements and scientific communication, international projects and development programs, or international trade activities. Hence, the TNE describes features such as mobility of students and teachers, building institute or offer course and curriculum with name of an institution in another country and recognition of academic certificates and diplomas |
| 3   | Vignoli             | Transnational education phenomenon has implications beyond the borders of national higher education system and usually defined within the framework of formal or informal education categories in the host country |
| 4   | Lee                 | Transnational education is available in two forms: Collaboration of institutes in one country with an institute of a host country as a concession to establish a joint program and the issuance of joint certification for some programs or courses or other services from the host organization will be offered by another institute Independent offers without cooperation such as the establishment of a branch of an institution of higher education |
| 5   | Unesco              | Transnational education is all higher education programs or sets of courses or educational services, including distance learning, that are provided in the country of destination by an institution from the country of origin. Such programs may belong to the education system of the origin country or may also be independent from the national education system of both countries of origin and destination |
| 6   | Middlehurst         | Transnational higher education is a commodity to be exported across geographical boundaries, and, for which, there is an international demand and supply |
| 7   | Bazargan            | Transnational higher education is a set of educational programs and curricula (in person or in absentia) that is offered by an institution of the country of origin in the country of destination |
| 8   | Schorinan           | Internationalization is a process of anti-domination education that happens in the context of international science and practice (where communities from around the world become a subsystem of a larger and more comprehensive system). To integrate this process in all aspects of education and education system, a comprehensive and multifaceted plan of action is required |
| 9   | Tagart              | Internationalization is a theory that leads to two kinds of evolutions in the curricula of universities: one is the change in the programs to fit them incorporating the needs of students and involve students with different cultural backgrounds. The second change in the programs is aimed at preparing students to live and work in environments and organizations that are different from their houses and campuses |
| 10  | Rizoy               | Internationalization is a process that prepares communities to successfully participate in an increasingly global dependence. A process, which should encompass all forms of postsecondary education system |
| 11  | Fathivajargah       | Internationalization is an international identity given to activities such as three fundamental elements of education, research, and services in universities and higher education institutes Internationalization has given an international image to the curricula of universities through actions such as accepting foreign students, offering online courses in the international arena, joint courses with other universities in the world, and offering curricula in other countries by establishing branches. Internationalization is a mutual process, in which, students, teachers, and administrators from diverse social and cultural backgrounds exchange skills, knowledge, and experiences to increase the understanding and capacity to live and work effectively in the local and international communities Internationalization at home is where the systems of distance learning and virtual education programs are used to reach an international audience |
| 12  | Knight              | It is a strategy and selection policy that governments employ to facilitate proper operation of the processes of globalization Internationalization of higher education is an attempt to give an international image and face to universities Internationalization of higher education is said to set activities related to the development of international cooperation and communication that aims to provide an educational and research-oriented environment in universities that correlates to the vision and global progress Internationalization is a process of integration of international, intercultural, and global dimension into university objectives, functions, and services |
| 13  | Clition             | Internationalization of higher education is an attempt to give an international image and face to universities |
| 14  | Orbas               | International education is far from being just studying abroad because international education also includes social, political, and economic variables that impact higher education centers and the international community |
| 15  | Saylane             | Internationalization of higher education is said to set activities related to the development of international cooperation and communication that aims at providing educational and research-oriented environment in universities that correlates to the vision and global progress |
Table 3: Contd...

| Row | Definition provider | Definition of internationalization of higher education |
|-----|---------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|
| 16  | Anderson and Marasoa | Internationalization of higher education is about importing higher education, exporting education, distance education, and networking of higher education on an international scale |
| 17  | Payzavestin Ayzer   | Internationalization is a complex learning process that includes global dimension, background knowledge transfer, integrated technology, and an intercultural, interdisciplinary, and comparative knowledge structure |
| 18  | McCloughan           | Internationalization is the participation of students in making decisions and solving problems related to employment so that the knowledge gained from them is reflective of different cultures with respect to the students |
| 19  | Marc and Vandround   | Internationalization is a stable systematic effort, which aims at creating responsiveness among universities and institutions of higher education toward requirements and challenges of globalization in building connection with communities, economy, and labor market |
| 20  | Sowell               | Internationalization of higher education is based on the economic, cultural, political, and educational exchanges among nations |
| 21  | Elingbo              | Internationalization of higher education is the integration process among colleges or universities on an international scale |
| 22  | Kiang                | Internationalization is a means for the governments to respond to globalization. It is achieved through four approaches: activity approach (based on activities such as curriculum planning, teacher and student exchange, technical support, and international research), quality approach (emphasizes on the development of skills, knowledge, attitudes, and values in students, faculty, and staff of college), spirit approach (focuses on creating a supportive atmosphere for creating an intercultural and international perspective), process approach (emphasizes on the induction and integration of international and cross-cultural dimension in the processes of teaching, research, and service) |
| 23  | Berton and Lambret Kebk | Internationalization of higher education means conducting programs where students know and understand each other, acquire international and cross-cultural skills, and be sensitive toward the reality of global solidarity and global challenges. They prepare for the role of activists in the global arena to shape the world of tomorrow in such a way that the future will have nothing to say against us |
| 24  | Naderi               | Internationalization is said to set activities related to spreading international cooperation and scientific communication that aims to provide education and research facility in the university environment, which is the real way to connect and partner with the vision and global progress |
| 25  | Behjatiardakani      | Internationalization is related to the issues of learning and teaching, education, assessment, professional development, assessment, and quality of the graduates as well as understanding their cultural values. It can be performed directly within school program or through the graduation of skills including cultural literacy |
| 26  | Kytona               | Internationalization is not meant to create new courses but it focuses on education through curricula |
| 27  | Abiyeli              | Cross-border higher education means synergy and mutual empowerment regardless of national boundaries, away from arrogance and dictatorship, and rejecting the position of others |
| 28  | Mahmoudi             | Transnational education is a set of training programs and curricula (direct and indirect) that is offered in the country of destination by the institution of the country of origin |
|     |                     | The internationalization of higher education includes sharing scientific activities, innovation, understanding different cultures with the aim of improving lives, and the welfare of humanity |
|     |                     | The national and cultural identity for the internationalization of higher education is the key. In internationalization, standardization is based on common values such as a better life and environmental protection - competitiveness through innovation. There is a diversification of sources when it comes to taking advantage of charitable and nonprofit funds. It is responsive to the community. The action arena is where students from various scientific institutions in the national and international arena freely interact. Education is a public good for socialization and community service, in the national and global interests, as a feature of extensibility and a means to establish justice. A university is a public institution at the service of the world. Faculty is an agent of knowledge production, in search of the truth, along with the students. Students are knowledge actors, learners, and questioners - critical and creative - and future leaders of the society. Social obligations include social interaction, social cohesion, environmental protection, cultural diversity, human thoughts, dialogs among civilizations, and fundamental freedom. Teaching and learning approaches includes academic freedom, creative and critical thinking, dissent, emphasis on diversity, public goods, academic ethics and character, student-centric education, and research-based education |
| 29  | Altbach              | It is the process of integration of global and cross-cultural dimensions in higher education objectives, functions, and services. This process includes two international scopes including internationalization at home and abroad. Internationalization at home is usually the strategic design and approach that launches an international dimension in legal space of university. Internationalization in abroad is an effort on behalf of the higher educational institutions or offering their own actors of knowledge to the outside world |
| 30  | Dim                  | Internationalization is the participation of ideas and knowledge, and a way of doing the same thing in different countries |

Contd...
Internationalization or globalization of higher education

### Definition of internationalization of higher education

| Row | Definition provider | Definition |
|-----|---------------------|------------|
| 31  | Sarkararani         | Emphasis on internationalization, especially in higher education, is an active participation in educational programs, research activities, and studies of educational reform, the challenges, the opportunities, and the output of national and international developments in higher education all around the world. |
| 32  | Yang                | Prior cases of internationalization have happened since the time of Sophists and Confucius. The driving force behind internationalization is the expansion of human knowledge based on human values. The key priority of internationalization is human interest. The basic format of internationalization is coalition, sharing interests, and compassion. Internationalization has multifaceted benefits. Internationalization is the bilateral exchange of students and training programs. Internationalization is a clear mechanism for quality assurance. Internationalization is in control of the actors of knowledge. |
| 33  | Kaleghkhah          | Internationalization of education is one output of the global village. |

### Definition of internationalization of curriculum

| Row | Definition provider | Definition |
|-----|---------------------|------------|
| 1   | Barmer and Van di Vande | In the internationalization of curriculum, the curriculum has been set with an orientation in the content, to prepare students for professional/social practices in an international and multicultural arena, and is intended for both domestic and foreign students. |
| 2   | Shailer             | It is a process of curriculum development and change that aims to integrate the international aspect into formal and operational aspects of the curriculum. Formal aspects include objectives, course content, and educational materials while operational aspects include teaching-learning methods and evaluation. |
| 3   | Vacher              | International curriculum is a set of competencies and skills that the universities pass on to the next generation. These competencies and skills are international and cross-cultural. |
| 4   | Dibavajari          | Internationalization of the curriculum means the distribution of academic curricula beyond geographical borders and it includes commercialization of the curriculum and its products. Internationalization of the curriculum is meant to develop international knowledge, skills, and values in existing programs for training and international education in a university. The internationalization of the curriculum gives an international identity to courses and academic disciplines through education and extension of curricula beyond geographical boundaries and considers people from different countries as global citizens. Internationalization can be done in educational programs at the postgraduate, researcher, and faculty level. |
| 5   | Motlow State Community College | In fact, the most important pillar of international higher education systems is the international curriculum. This program uses effective approaches, methods, and strategies. Also, in the educational programs and courses, emphasis is put on analyzing different cultures and indigenous knowledge; it stresses on the education of language, culture, history, and the analysis of the characteristics of other nations and the growing global labor. |
| 6   | Fathivajargah       | Internationalization of the curriculum attempts to give an international image to higher education, organizations, and educational institutions. The purpose of an international curriculum is the training of graduates with an international and cross-cultural competence. Its content, while offering different perspectives about economic, political, environmental, and social subjects for students, comprises knowledge related to differences in professional performance among different cultures. Its content is derived from different cultural roots and is focused on a wide range of teaching, learning, and evaluation strategies, based on the needs and backgrounds of students. |
| 7   | Shailer             | Internationalization of the curriculum is a process of curriculum development and change that aims to integrate the international aspects into formal and operational aspects of the curriculum. Formal aspects include the objectives, course content, and training materials. The operational aspects include teaching, learning, and evaluation methods. It is designed for both domestic and foreign students. |
| 8   | OECD                | An international curriculum is a curriculum with an international orientation in content, with an aim to prepare students for social and professional practices, including multicultural and international contexts, designed for domestic and foreign students. |
| 9   | Ebrahimi            | Internationalization of the curriculum seeks to provide opportunities for both personal and professional development for all students around the world by looking at all the people in the world as global citizens. |
| 10  | Mohamadaminzade     | Internationalization of curriculum attempts to give an international image to the curricula of educational institutions. It can be noted with three perspectives: Internationalization of curriculum studies (the internationalization of research in the field of curricula) Provide an international feature to the content and methods of university curricula, and Internationalization of curriculum services such as expansion of branches. |

### Internationalization of curriculum studies

| Row | Definition provider | Definition |
|-----|---------------------|------------|
| 1   | Dibavajari          | Internationalization of curriculum studies does not mean finding new markets for intellectual products of the United States in other communities. It does not mean a uniform curriculum around the world. |

Contd...
From Table 2, it can be observed that definitions about globalization are categorized in four categories including globalization, globalizing, globalization of higher education, and globalizing of higher education. As you can see in Table 3, internationalization has been defined in five categories – internationalization, internationalization of higher education, internationalization of the curriculum, internationalization of curriculum studies, and internationalization of curriculum profession.

### Discussion

The aim of this study was to explore concepts including globalization and internationalization of higher education in Iran. The results of the study showed that 39 articles pay attention to globalization, internationalization, and their differences. As many as 31 definitions of globalization and 55 definitions of internationalization were found in these articles. The results of this study were placed in nine definition categories including globalization, globalizing, globalization of higher education, globalizing of higher education, internationalization, internationalization of higher education, internationalization of the curriculum, internationalization of curriculum studies, and internationalization of curriculum profession.

According to the definitions of globalization, globalization has four dimensions: economic, political, cultural, and scientific. There are two approaches to globalization. The first approach is named globalization. Globalization is already a project designed by the hegemonic system, through which it expands and deepens its economic, political, and cultural domination in other countries. This approach is about domination, colonialism, and the spread of the West. The first approach, with a commercial view, believes that, at a fundamental level, globalization is primarily a one-way economic and cultural communication, in which a dominant economy shapes the economy and culture of others according to its own. This approach tends to use globalization of higher education to become like McDonald (acceptance of American values). Based on the facts available, it is believed that the globalization of higher education is affected by the process of being McDonald. In the context of this definition of globalization, internationalization is a creative and deliberate action for copying the assumptions and dominant patterns. Governments, researchers, and educational institutions have a more independent role in knowledge production; they must reproduce and adapt their products to their own needs.

The second approach is named as globalizing. Globalizing is a result of new world developments such as the expansion of communication networks, the growth of technology in all aspects, and a more collaborative world. This approach is based on the ideas of humanist, emancipatory, international, and how human collective consciousness is formed. Globalizing is the result of the evolution of human social life and strengthening interactions among societies and cultures. In this framework, globalizing is a trend that creates interaction and interdependence among facts, opinions, and concepts. It is a way to increase interdependence.

Hence, the continuum of globalization can be considered from dissonance and multipolarization to unification and single polarization of the world. One end of the spectrum, which is the unification and single polarization of the world, is interpreted as globalization. And the other spectrum, which is dissonance and multipolarization of the world, is interpreted as globalizing.

According to the definition about internationalization, it can be stated that internationalization is a process based
on economic, cultural, scientific, and political transactions that are based on consensus among nations and in which, interactions take place among nations. This definition of internationalization is same as globalizing (globalizing is the second approach to globalization). Hence, it can be said that internationalization is globalizing but it is different from globalization. Therefore, if it is considered as a continuum for globalization, one end of the spectrum is globalization and another side is internationalization.

According to the definitions about internationalization of higher education, it can be paraphrased that internationalization of higher education is mutual exchanges, and a consensus-based, preplanned process, in three axillary, including teaching, research, and services in universities, colleges, and higher education institutions, whereas the internationalization of the curriculum means the distribution of the academic curriculum and its products beyond national borders and the development of international knowledge, skills, and values in the existing programs of institutes for training and international education. Internationalization of curriculum studies means the use of all the available capacity around the world to promote the curriculum discipline as a multicultural discipline that flows in different cultures and social backgrounds theoretically and practically. Internationalization of curriculum profession is the education of professionals who have the potential for work and consulting activities in multi- and cross-cultural environments. They have the required knowledge, skills, and values to do the work and activities of the curriculum in different cultural environments.

Articles used in this study mostly have an unknown level or a low level. The quality of most of the articles was inappropriate. Furthermore, it is necessary to examine the subject of an article with the appropriate methodological design. In general, according to the results, most definitions stated about these terms are not written by Iranian writers, but rather most are stated by foreign authors. For example, Sylanh’s and Naderi’s definitions of internationalization of higher education are the same as Knight’s definition. Since this study examines the Persian literature in this field, an examination of these concepts is required from the perspective of the Latin literature in future studies.

**Conclusion**

The higher education globalization spectrum moves from dissonance and multipolarization to unification and single polarization of the world. One end of the spectrum, which is the unification and single polarization of the world, is interpreted as globalizing. The other side of the spectrum, that is dissonance and multipolarization, is interpreted as globalizing. Internationalization of higher education is the mutual exchanges, and the consensus-based, preplanned process, in three axillary, including teaching, research, and services in universities, colleges, and higher education institutions. The definition of internationalization is the same as the definition of globalizing. In other words, it is possible to say that internationalization is globalizing but it is different from globalization.

**Financial support and sponsorship**

This article is extracted from a research project number 395564. We thank the deputy of education of the Ministry of Health and Medical Education and Vice chancellor for research of Isfahan University of medical science for supporting this project.

**Conflicts of interest**

There are no conflicts of interest.

**References**

1. Sabagian Z. Academic culture: A research framework in approaches and new visions in higher education. Tehran: Institute of Social and Cultural Studies; 2010.
2. Gumport PJ, Sporn B. International adaption: Demands for management reform and university administration. In: Smart JC, Tierney WG, editors. Higher Education: Handbook of Theory and Research. 14th ed. New York: Agathon Press; 1999.
3. Ghasempoor A, Liaghatdar M, Jafari E. An analysis on localization and internationalization of universities curriculum in the globalization era. Iran J Cult Res 2011;4:1-24.
4. Kubow PK, Crawford SH. Building global learning experiences: A case study of a Hungarian, Ukrainian, and American educational partnership. High Educ Eur 2001;16:77-85.
5. Hakimzadeh R. Globalization, internationalization of higher education and interdisciplinary curricula. Q J Interdiscip Stud Humanit 2010;2:1-17.
6. Calof JL, Beamish PW. Adapting to foreign markets: Explaining internationalization. Int Bus Rev 1995;4:115-31.
7. Delgado-Márquez BL, Hurtado-Torres NE, Bondar Y. Internationalization of higher education: Theoretical and empirical investigation of its influence on university institution rankings. Rev Univ Soc Conocimiento 2011;8:265-84.
8. Knight J. Internationalization remodelled: Definition approaches, and rationales. J Stud Int Educ 2004;8:5-31.
9. Baniamerian M, Javadipour M, Hakimzade R, Najafi A. [Iran's Religious- Cultural Identity in the Internationalization of Higher Education]. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 17-28.
10. Hosaynimoghadam M. [Globalization of Higher Education and Future of Universities in Iran: Survey Political Atmosphere]. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 33-55.
11. Mahmoudi A, Abedi A. [Challenges and Strategies for the Development of Transnational Education in Iran]. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 57-78.
12. Ebrahimی S, Mehdizade E, Ebrahimی S. Virtual Universities,
a Strategy for Achieving International Higher Education. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 80-92.

13. Mohamadaminzade L, Mohamadaminzade H. Curriculum and Its Role in the Internationalization of Higher Education. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 94-109.

14. Babadi A, Mahdavishakib A. Mission-Oriented University and Development of Transnational Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges” (Case: Higher Education Institutions of Astan Quds Razavi). 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 111-31.

15. Fazeli A. Curriculum Internationalization in Higher Education and Its Implications on the Curriculum Elements. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 132-41.

16. Soleimani E. Organizational Identity and Its Role in the Development of Cross-Border Higher Education. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 144-56.

17. Pourseskandari R, Najafi H. [The Theoretical Implications for Internationalization of Higher Education Curriculums in the Era of Globalization]. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 157-73.

18. Khaleghkhah A, Zahedbabolani A, Karimiyousefi H. [Educational Science and Its Role in the Internationalization of Higher Education]. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 1.

19. Tamanayifar M, Nourmohamadi M. Internationalization of Higher Education in Iran. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 2-16.

20. Baniameiran M, Javadipour M, Hakimzade R, Najafi A. Status of Cultural Identity in the Internationalization of Higher Education. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 17-29.

21. Ebrahimif F, Ghaderti M. Internationalization of Higher Education in Iran. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 45-66.

22. Saylane M, Saylane M. [Ahead Visions and Strategies of Transnational Higher Education in the World and the Implications for Iran]. 6th International Conference of Developing International Higher Education “Opportunities and Challenges”. Mashhad, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; 13-14 May, 2014. p. 87-99.

23. Fathi Vajargah K, Ebrahimimzade I, Farajolah M, Khoshnoudi Far M. Internationalization of curriculum in Iranian higher education system: Challenges and strategies. Educ J 2012;6:45-66.

24. Fathi Vajargah K, Zare A, Yamani M. A Study of the internationalization curriculum challenges (IOC) in universities and educational institutions from the viewpoint of faculty members at Shahid Beheshti university. QJ Res Plann High Educ 2010;15:63-82.

25. Zakersalehi G, Salehi Najafabadi M. Suggesting strategies to attract foreign students in Iran. Iranian of Higher Education 2012;4:65-92.