Concurrent with the global increase in obesity,1 numerous studies and reviews have been published concerning associations of overweight and obesity with mortality. Their findings have prompted considerable public health debate. There is ongoing discussion as to whether cutoff points for body-mass index (BMI) categories should differ across regions or racial or ethnic groups.1 Additionally, studies differ in their assessment of the relation between BMI and mortality. In particular, BMI in the overweight category (BMI 25–<30 kg/m²) is not consistently associated with increased risk of death. 

References

1 Feigin VL, Krishnamurthi RV, Parmar P, et al. Update on the global burden of ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke in 1990–2013: the GBD 2013 study. Neuroepidemiology 2015; 45: 161–76.

2 O’Donnell MJ, Xavier D, Liu L, et al. Risk factors for ischaemic and intracerebral haemorrhagic stroke in 22 countries (the INTERSTROKE study): a case-control study. Lancet 2010; 376: 112–23.

3 O’Donnell MJ, Chin SL, Ranganathan S, et al, on behalf of the INTERSTROKE investigators. Global and regional effects of potentially modifiable risk factors associated with acute stroke in 32 countries (INTERSTROKE): a case-control study. Lancet 2016; published online July 15. 10.1016/S0140-6736(16)30506-2.

4 GBD 2013 Risk Factors Collaborators. Global, regional, and national comparative risk assessment of 79 behavioural, environmental and occupational, and metabolic risks or clusters of risks in 188 countries, 1990–2013: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2013. Lancet 2015; 386: 228–32.

5 Johnson RK, Appel LJ, Brands M, et al. Dietary sugars intake and cardiovascular health: a scientific statement from the American Heart Association. Circulation 2009; 120: 1031–20.

6 Martineau F, Tyner E, Lorent T, Petticrew M, Lock K. Population-level interventions to reduce alcohol-related harm: an overview of systematic reviews. Prev Med 2013; 57: 278–96.

7 Asaria P, Chisholm D, Mathers C, Ezzati M, Beaglehole R. Chronic disease prevention: health effects and financial costs of strategies to reduce salt intake and control tobacco use. Lancet 2007; 370: 2044–53.

8 Wilson N. Salt tax could reduce population’s salt intake. BMJ 2004; 329: 918.

9 Briggs AD, Mytton OT, Kehlbacher A, Tiffinn R, Rayner M, Scarborough P. Overall and income specific effect on prevalence of overweight and obesity of 20% sugar sweetened drink tax in UK: econometric and comparative risk assessment modelling study. BMJ 2013; 347: f6189.

10 WHO. Reducing consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages to reduce the risk of unhealthy weight gain in adults. Biological, behavioural and contextual rationale. September, 2014. http://www.who.int/elema/bbe/ sbbs_adult_weight/en/ (accessed June 2, 2016).

11 Wagenaar AC, Tobler AL, Komro KA. Effects of alcohol tax and price policies on morbidity and mortality: a systematic review. Am J Public Health 2010; 100: 2270–78.

12 UN General Assembly. Resolution adopted by the General Assembly 66/2: political declaration of the high-level meeting of the general assembly on the prevention and control of non-communicable diseases. adopted September 19, 2011. Jan 24, 2012. http://www.who.int/nmh/ events/un_ncd_summit2011/en/ (accessed June 2, 2016).

13 Norving B, Davis SM, Feigin VL, et al. Stroke prevention worldwide—what could make it work? Neuroepidemiology 2015; 45: 215–20.

BMI and mortality: the limits of epidemiological evidence

Published Online July 13, 2016
http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(16)30506-7
See Articles page 776

Valery L Feigin, Rita Krishnamurthi National Institute for Stroke and Applied Neurosciences, School of Public Health and Psychosocial Studies, Faculty of Health and Environmental Sciences, University of Technology, Northcote, Auckland 0627, New Zealand valery.feigin@aut.ac.nz

We declare no competing interests.

1 Feigin VL, Krishnamurthi RV, Parmar P, et al. Update on the global burden of ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke in 1990–2013: the GBD 2013 study. Neuroepidemiology 2015; 45: 161–76.

2 O’Donnell MJ, Xavier D, Liu L, et al. Risk factors for ischaemic and intracerebral haemorrhagic stroke in 22 countries (the INTERSTROKE study): a case-control study. Lancet 2010; 376: 112–23.

3 O’Donnell MJ, Chin SL, Ranganathan S, et al, on behalf of the INTERSTROKE investigators. Global and regional effects of potentially modifiable risk factors associated with acute stroke in 32 countries (INTERSTROKE): a case-control study. Lancet 2016; published online July 15. 10.1016/S0140-6736(16)30506-2.

4 GBD 2013 Risk Factors Collaborators. Global, regional, and national comparative risk assessment of 79 behavioural, environmental and occupational, and metabolic risks or clusters of risks in 188 countries, 1990–2013: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2013. Lancet 2015; 386: 228–32.

5 Johnson RK, Appel LJ, Brands M, et al. Dietary sugars intake and cardiovascular health: a scientific statement from the American Heart Association. Circulation 2009; 120: 1031–20.

6 Martineau F, Tyner E, Lorent T, Petticrew M, Lock K. Population-level interventions to reduce alcohol-related harm: an overview of systematic reviews. Prev Med 2013; 57: 278–96.

7 Asaria P, Chisholm D, Mathers C, Ezzati M, Beaglehole R. Chronic disease prevention: health effects and financial costs of strategies to reduce salt intake and control tobacco use. Lancet 2007; 370: 2044–53.

8 Wilson N. Salt tax could reduce population’s salt intake. BMJ 2004; 329: 918.

9 Briggs AD, Mytton OT, Kehlbacher A, Tiffinn R, Rayner M, Scarborough P. Overall and income specific effect on prevalence of overweight and obesity of 20% sugar sweetened drink tax in UK: econometric and comparative risk assessment modelling study. BMJ 2013; 347: f6189.

10 WHO. Reducing consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages to reduce the risk of unhealthy weight gain in adults. Biological, behavioural and contextual rationale. September, 2014. http://www.who.int/elema/bbe/sbbs_adult_weight/en/ (accessed June 2, 2016).

11 Wagenaar AC, Tobler AL, Komro KA. Effects of alcohol tax and price policies on morbidity and mortality: a systematic review. Am J Public Health 2010; 100: 2270–78.

12 UN General Assembly. Resolution adopted by the General Assembly 66/2: political declaration of the high-level meeting of the general assembly on the prevention and control of non-communicable diseases. adopted September 19, 2011. Jan 24, 2012. http://www.who.int/nmh/events/un_ncd_summit2011/en/ (accessed June 2, 2016).

13 Norving B, Davis SM, Feigin VL, et al. Stroke prevention worldwide—what could make it work? Neuroepidemiology 2015; 45: 215–20.
with increased mortality. To improve precision, observational studies have been combined in pooled analyses and meta-analyses. Pooled analyses benefit from the use of harmonised methods but, unlike meta-analyses, are not generally based on systematic review.

In The Lancet, The Global BMI Mortality Collaboration presents results from the largest ever pooled dataset about the relation between BMI and mortality. Their data began with 239 studies, in 32 countries, with more than 10 million participants and about 1-6 million deaths. Prespecified analyses of never smokers without pre-existing chronic disease, excluding the first 5 years of follow-up, are presented for about 3-9 million participants and about 386 000 deaths occurring in 189 studies. This study is notable for the use of standardised methods to extract hazard ratios (HRs) for mortality across the studies and for extensive and valuable appendices that examine diverse subsets of the pooled data. The authors made efforts to address reverse causation and residual confounding. Results are broadly similar to other recent studies. For example, HRs were J-shaped, with increased risk of mortality for both low BMI and obesity (BMI ≥30 kg/m²). This study documents heterogeneity in the association between BMI and mortality across different continents and shows weaker associations in older populations, especially in those aged 70 years and older. For overweight adults (BMI 25–<30 kg/m²), HRs—adjusting for age and sex and excluding individuals with baseline chronic disease—ranged from 0-99 (95% CI 0-98–1-00) after adjustment for smoking to 1-11 (1-10–1-11) after exclusion of ever smokers and the first 5 years of follow-up. The elevated HR of 1-11 in overweight adults after exclusion of about 60% of the sample and about 75% of deaths is a key result of this pooled analysis.

Two major issues are raised by this important paper. The first is whether conclusions about the relation between BMI and mortality from analyses with extensive exclusions can be generalisable and unbiased. The second is what sort of public health guidance can be obtained from analyses that pool global data. Substantial research and conceptual questions remain for each of these issues. Samples of different distributions of environmental and person-specific factors (eg, disease history, diet, and physical activity) are difficult to address consistently in large pooling studies. Exclusion of ever smokers, deaths in the first 5 years of follow-up, and pre-existing chronic disease (where available) might further increase these differences. Extensive exclusions might also limit the generalisability of resulting health recommendations. Selection bias and early mortality exclusion, to control for potential bias from weight change due to occult disease leading to reverse causation, pose additional challenges for inference from pooling studies. For example, Monte Carlo simulation and analytical analyses of the association between BMI and mortality indicate that exclusion of 2 years or 5 years of early mortality does not necessarily reduce bias and can even increase bias of estimated HRs.

Challenges in deriving global public health recommendations are unlikely to be resolved by ever-larger datasets without further developments in study data and design. New study designs such as mendelian randomisation, new data elements such as weight histories, and increased attention to BMI over the life course might improve our understanding of the links between excess bodyweight and mortality. The present study compares data from four continents, pooling data across diverse racial and ethnic groups, and across countries with very different patterns of chronic disease management. Large studies of specific race and ethnic groups, such as that of Yi and colleagues of 12·8 million Koreans, can help to clarify recommendations for specific countries or demographic groups even if these studies cannot conclusively address the limits of observational studies. Despite the limitations of observational studies for causal inference of obesity and mortality, many crucial questions about BMI will continue to rely on
observational data. To date, few sufficiently sized randomised trials have been done to address whether weight-loss interventions reduce mortality or morbidity. One trial\(^{14}\) was ended after about 10 years of follow-up because no association between weight loss and cardiovascular events was found. Weight-loss interventions have only modest long-term effectiveness\(^{15}\) and generally target behaviours, such as diet and physical activity,\(^ {11}\) that can lead to change in BMI rather than directly targeting BMI itself. Therefore, clinical trials are limited in their capacity to address causal relations between BMI and mortality.

Important challenges remain in the effort to translate epidemiological evidence of excess bodyweight and mortality into effective guidelines and public health interventions. The Lancet, via the World Obesity Federation, and other coalitions such as the US National Collaborative on Childhood Obesity Research, are championing diverse approaches to this challenge including support for better measurement, systems models, and increased attention to the evaluation of obesity-related policies.

*David Berrigan, Richard P Troiano, Barry I Graubard*  
Division of Cancer Control and Population Sciences (DB, RPT) and Division of Cancer Epidemiology and Genetics (BIG), National Cancer Institute, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, MD 20892, USA  
berrigad@mail.nih.gov

We declare no competing interests. This Comment is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily represent the official views of the National Cancer Institute or the National Institutes of Health.

**Age of PISCES: stem-cell clinical trials in stroke**

Laboratory studies and limited clinical trials over the past two decades have shown feasibility and safety, and have revealed potential mechanisms of action of stem-cell therapy in ischaemic stroke. Despite consistent efficacy in animal studies, functional benefits after transplantation of stem cells remain to be shown unequivocally in stroke patients.\(^ {1} \) Translation of stem-cell therapy from the laboratory to the clinic has been approached with ample caution, in part due to the largely negative outcomes for several stroke therapeutics in human beings compared with those in animals. Negative results in clinical trials of stem-cell therapy for stroke could put regenerative medicine in this area in jeopardy, as for Parkinson’s disease when patients given transplanted fetal cells had controversial adverse events.\(^ {2} \)

Strict adherence to the preclinical findings when designing clinical trials might facilitate translation of outcomes with stem-cell therapy to the clinic.\(^ {2} \) To this end, laboratory studies support the concepts of neuroprotection for the acute phase of stroke and neuroregeneration via stem-cell therapy for the subacute and chronic stages.\(^ {4} \) Subcutaneous delivery of stem cells is designed to sequester early secondary cell death, for instance by suppressing oxidative stress, inflammation,