Multi-Stakeholder Collaboration for the Provision of Public Open Space (Case of Taman Indonesia Kaya, Semarang)

W O S J Aswad¹ and M Damayanti²

¹Magister of Urban and Regional Planning Study Program, Faculty of Engineering, Diponegoro University, Semarang, Indonesia
²Department Urban dan Regional Planning, Faculty of Engineering, Diponegoro University, Semarang, Indonesia

Corresponding e-mail: Email: sittijurianti@gmail.com, maya.damayanti@gmail.com

Abstract. Budget constraints are a common problem in Indonesian cities to provide attractive and attractive public open space. There is a need for cooperation between all parties, not only the government but also the private sector and society. These conditions encourage the Semarang City government to increase stakeholder collaboration in the provision of public green open space, one of which is in the development of Taman Indonesia Kaya. The purpose of this study is to examine the model of the collaboration process, the involvement and role of each stakeholder and the sustainability of collaboration. This study uses descriptive qualitative methods, data collection using observations and interviews on each stakeholder element, namely government, private and public. The results show that the collaboration process model starts from face to face dialogue, trust building, commitment to the process, shared understanding between stakeholders until the realization of attractive and attractive public green open space development. However, the sustainability of collaboration is a big challenge going forward. The structure of cooperation is not yet supported by clear institutional design, so that government courage and innovation are needed to determine the form of structural governance in collaborative management of public green open space. Collaboration should be carried out over the long term and use a networked administrative organization model so that the network that is built is in an administrative entity. The model is expected to create efficiency management and support the sustainability of collaboration.

Keywords: public open space, stakeholder, collaboration

1. Introduction

Public green open space is one of the basic needs of urban society amid increasing development intensity and population density. Public open spaces in the form of parks or recreation areas are said to be important factors to make cities livable, pleasant and attractive to their citizens [1]. The purpose of the existence of public space is not only related to public welfare and the improvement of visual environment, but also becomes a key in improving public image [2]. Some fundamental problems that often occur in the provision of public green open space are limited land in the city center, limited allocation of government funding to the capacity of human resources and government organizations [3]. Therefore, management of public open space should be carried out with other stakeholder elements through a collaborative governance strategy.
Collaborative governance is a governing arrangement where one or more public agencies directly engage non-state stakeholders in a collective decision-making process that is formal, consensus-oriented, and deliberative and that aims to make or implement public policy or manage public programs or assets [4]. The Collaborative Governance Model consists of several stages, namely Starting Conditions, Facilitative Leadership, Institutional Design and Collaborative Processes [4]. The collaborative process model describes collaboration as a developmental stage namely Face to face dialogue, Trust Building, Commitment to process and Share Understanding. The need for collaboration arises from the interdependence that exists between stakeholders. Stakeholders are individuals, groups or organizations that have interests, are involved, or are influenced (positively or negatively) by development activities or programs [5]. There are three main stakeholders who interact with each other and carry out their respective functions, namely the state or government, the private sector or the business world and society [5].

Realizing the importance of cooperation in development, the Semarang City Government began to involve various parties, especially the private sector, to participate in the provision of urban facilities including the provision of public green open spaces for Taman Indonesia Kaya. The construction of this park is the result of collaboration with Bakti Budaya Djarum Foundation which is part of the company's social responsibility program (CSR). Taman Indonesia Kaya is a public Green Open Space built by the Semarang city government without using a regional budget with a total development budget of approximately 6 billion Rupiah. Aside from collaborating with the Djarum foundation, the Semarang City government also involves other private elements who also go through CSR programs, namely the Central Java Bank and PP Property. Besides that, Djarum Foundation in the Development of the Park also involved elements of the community, namely Semarang artists and ornamental plant farmers. The development of Taman Indonesia Kaya is one of the efforts of the Semarang City Government to improve the quality and image of the city through public open space facilities. This park is one of the public open spaces in the center of Semarang with an area of 9,520 m². Taman Indonesia Kaya is administratively located in the village of Mugassari, South Semarang District.

![Figure 1. Taman Indonesia Kaya location.](image)

Collaboration emerged as a response to the dynamics of the need for public service provision that is increasingly complex, and low resources owned by the government. Research by Wai et al. [6] in Mandalay City, Myanmar found that the collaboration of various stakeholders was instrumental in
creating quality public open space where the roles and influences of stakeholders were divided into different levels. In addition, research related to multi-stakeholder collaboration by Hidayani and Warsono [7] found that the form of public green space development partnerships in the city of Semarang is usually in the form of BTO (Build, Transfer, Operate), where partnerships between agencies run automatically adjusted to the main tasks and functions of each agency. Such cooperation generally only involves one private sector element and government agency.

Based on this research, it is known that the collaboration between stakeholders has an important role in the development of public green open space. In addition, it can be seen that the role of stakeholders is at different levels of influence and importance. However, one of the most important things in a cooperation that is sustainable, cooperation should not only be done at the planning or development stage but also at the management stage. There are several important elements that can be used as criteria for success or ensure the sustainability of a collaboration in collaborative governance, one of which is a networked structure. Networked structure is a link between one element and other elements and collectively reflect elements of the role performed (DeSeve, 2007; [8]). Networked structure is divided into three forms, namely self-governance, lead organization and network administrative organization. The self-governance model is characterized by a structure where there are no administrative entities. however, each stakeholder participates in the network, and management is carried out by all the stakeholders involved. The lead organization model is characterized by administrative entities as network members or service providers. Meanwhile the administrative network model is marked by the existence of an explicit administrative entity, which was formed to manage the network, not as a "service provider" (service provider) and given a special budget [9].

Therefore, this research is expected to further examine how the collaboration process and the role of each stakeholder involved and also the potential for sustainable collaboration in managing public green open space can be seen from the networked structure formed. The challenge of managing public facilities collaboratively is to ensure that every stakeholder involved can continue to contribute to the network as a solution to the limitations of the budget and human resources of the local government. If it can be done on an ongoing basis, collaboration between stakeholders can be a basic concept to achieve development goals and encourage improvement in the quality of life of the community.

2. Research Methods

This study uses a qualitative research approach. Qualitative research uses a natural setting with the intention of interpreting phenomena that occur and is carried out by involving various existing methods [10]. The use of a qualitative approach in this study is to be able to describe dynamically developing phenomena so that multi-stakeholder collaboration in the development & management of Taman Indonesia Kaya can be explained in depth.

Data collection techniques used in this study include primary and secondary data collection. Primary data obtained through interviews, field observations and documentation studies while secondary data obtained from certain agencies or sources in the form of statistics, literature, and other documents containing information that can support the preparation of this research. Interviews in this study were conducted on the parties involved in the development and management of Taman Indonesia Kaya, namely the Semarang City Government, the private sector and community elements who are representatives of the community.

The analysis technique in this study uses descriptive techniques, descriptive method is a method in examining the status of human groups, an object, a set of conditions, a system of thought, or a class of events in the present. Descriptive qualitative research methods are used because researchers want to describe or describe facts or circumstances or symptoms that appear related to stakeholder collaboration in the development and management of Taman Indonesia Kaya.

Taman Indonesia Kaya is one of the parks that was built with a large budget and involved many stakeholders so that this research became a case study to look more closely at multi-stakeholder collaboration in providing public green open space in the city of Semarang. The park is equipped with new facilities and attractions that can attract the public including: open performance art stage,
Panda Lima park, dancing fountain, mural gate and other park elements. The facilities at Taman Indonesia Kaya can be seen in Figure 2:

![Figure 2. Taman Indonesia Kaya facilities.](image)

3. Findings and Discussion

3.1. Collaboration Process of the Taman Indonesia Kaya Development

The development of Taman Indonesia Kaya can be realized because of the collaboration between the Djarum Foundation and the Semarang City Government through CSR programs. Overall for the development of Taman Indonesia Kaya, Djarum Foundation allocated a budget of 6 billion Rupiah. This amount does not include the cleanliness and park safety budget. The development process of Taman Indonesia Kaya starts from the stage of exploratory cooperation, the signing of the MoU, the realization of park development, management and handover from the Djarum Foundation to the Semarang City Government. The development phase of Taman Indonesia Kaya can be seen in figure 3.

![Figure 3. Development and management stage of Taman Indonesia Kaya.](image)

Starting Condition of the construction of the Taman Indonesia Kaya began in 2016 when the Semarang City Government took the initiative to build a city park that was equipped with various interesting facilities and attractions so that it became a place for community recreation and improved the quality of the city. Behind the plan, the government is aware of the problem of budget constraints so that it tries to establish communication with the private sector that can help through CSR programs. Djarum Foundation is a non-profit organization of one of the companies that often runs CSR programs in Indonesia, especially in Central Java Province, thus encouraging the government through regional heads to conduct intense communication and ultimately produce a partnership for the construction of public open spaces in the city of Semarang.
The collaboration process begins when the government communicating with the Djarum Foundation to create a trust building for cooperation. The commitment of the cooperation continues on the signing of a memorandum of understanding (MoU) between Djarum Foundation and the Semarang City Government then groundbreaking the construction of the Taman Indonesia Kaya in November 2017.

Djarum Foundation is committed to introducing Indonesian culture to the community so that the development of Taman Indonesia Kaya is dedicated to the world of performing arts. This concept is realized through the construction of an open stage and amphitheater, a mural gate, a Pandawa Lima park and so on. A form of dedication to the art world is also shown by involving artists by building a mural gate which is the work of five young artists in Semarang. Meanwhile, the Semarang City Government through the regional budget also built a dancing fountain with a total budget of 3.8 Billion Rupiah, built a pedestrian or sidewalk around the park and a street vendor arrangement that also worked together through the CSR of Central Java Bank.

Taman Indonesia Kaya Park was completed and inaugurated to the public in October 2018. Based on a memorandum of understanding, 3 months after construction (until January 2019), the management of Taman Indonesia is still the responsibility of Djarum Foundation. Management includes maintenance of facilities and park security. For a workforce consisting of cleaning and security officers, Djarum cooperates with PT.Amazon outsourcing services. After being built and managed, in April 2019 the Taman Indonesia Kaya was granted to the Semarang City Government. However, the high enthusiasm of the community and the need for facilities maintenance budget, Djarum took the initiative to extend the contribution of the entertainment stage / amphitheater along with its complementary facilities for the next 2 years. The Semarang City government is responsible for the maintenance and security of the park where the field workers come from the same outsourcing services. The extension of Djarum's contribution was once again contained in a new memorandum of understanding agreement.

“Actually the management has been handed over to the government, but Djarum still wants to take care of the stage facilities because the maintenance costs are quite large and djarum still wants to use it for staging events so there is a new memorandum of understanding for the next 2 years” (Semarang City Government)

Based on the process, the development of Taman Indonesia Kaya leads to a BOT (Build Operate Transfer) scheme where the private sector receives a concession from the public sector (Semarang City Government) to build facilities that continue to be managed until it is submitted to the Government. However, because the construction of this park is a response or corporate social responsibility so that the expected benefits are not to increase financial profits, but rather to expect value creation that is more than just compliance and minimizing damage, companies can create "positive social values" such as social investments that innovative, stakeholder consultation, policy dialogue, and building civil institutions both themselves and with other companies [11]. The model of the collaborative process in the development of the Taman Indonesia Kaya can be described in Figure 4.
In the collaborative process of developing Taman Indonesia Kaya, communication between stakeholders is carried out through face to face dialogue, starting with individual communication, namely between the head of the region and representatives of the private sector, and continues in a discussion forum.

"Initially there was a direct communication from the Mayor of Semarang to our side, after intense communication finally it was agreed to have cooperation. It also happens that our factory is located in Central Java, so there is no harm in us helping, let alone for the benefit of the community" (Djarum Foundation)

Communication produces trust building and commitment from each stakeholder to conduct cooperation as outlined in the signing of a memorandum of understanding on the development of the Taman Indonesia Kaya. The role of regional heads in developing communication with other parties and direct way to government agencies to encourage the development of Taman Indonesia Kaya shows the presence of Facilitative Leadership in stakeholder collaboration. Complementary communication and cooperation between stakeholders are the basis for the realization of the Development of Taman Indonesia Kaya which is equipped with adequate facilities and a place for community recreation.

From the existing process, one of the weaknesses in the collaborative model is institutional design, the private sector is only a recipient of concessions with a short-term cooperation deadline of 2 years. Institutional design refers to basic protocols or basic rules for collaboration, which are very important for the procedural legitimacy of the collaboration process [4]. The use of deadlines, can arbitrarily limit the scope of the discussion. Deadlines can reduce the nature of ongoing collaboration, inadvertently reducing incentives for long-term cooperation [12]. The challenge going forward is the sustainability of collaboration, not only at the development stage but also at the management stage.

Figure 4. Model of collaboration process in the Taman Indonesia Kaya development refer to collaborative governance model Ansel and Gash [4].
After the contract is over the government must develop a new strategy to continue to manage the public green open space collaboratively so as not to burden the regional budget.

3.2. Stakeholder Collaboration in Sustainability of Taman Indonesia Kaya Management

In the Development and management of Taman Indonesia Kaya also involved other stakeholders consisting of government, private sector and community. Other private sectors are also involved, namely the Bank of Central Java and PP Property (Persero). In addition, the community was also involved, such as ornamental plant farmers and Semarang artists. For the government elements, collaboration of several Regional Apparatus Organizations occurred in accordance with their main duties and functions, among others: Departement of Housing and Residential areas, Public Workers Service, the Environmental Service, the Communication and Informatics Transportation Services and the Trade Service.

![Figure 5. Stakeholder elements involved in the development and management of the Taman Indonesia Kaya.](image)

Stakeholders involved in the development and management of Taman Indonesia Kaya carry out functions based on their main duties and functions. For the private sector involvement, the Bank of Central Java and PP Property also use CSR programs. Meanwhile, the community (society) consisting of artists and plant farmers was involved by Djarum Foundation in the process of developing the park while the government agencies worked in accordance with the duties and functions of each agency and according to the direction of the regional head during coordination. The following is the role of each stakeholder in the development and management of Taman Indonesia Kaya.

Table 1. The role of stakeholders involved in the development and management of Taman Indonesia Kaya

| Stakeholder | Role |
|-------------|------|
| **State**   |      |
| Department of Housing and Settlements of Semarang City | The Department of Housing and Settlements is a government agency that is directly appointed as manager of Taman Indonesia Kaya. After the handover from Djarum Foundation, The Department of Housing and Settlements also collaborated with outsourcing PT. Amazon to provide cleaning and security officers. |
| Public Works | The public works department is responsible for the construction and management of the sidewalk outside the park. Responsibility for sidewalks |
| Service | The 1st International Conference on Urban Design and Planning |
|---------|----------------------------------------------------------|
|         | IOP Conf. Series: Earth and Environmental Science 409 (2020) 012053 |
|         | doi:10.1088/1755-1315/409/1/012053 |
| Environmental Service | The environmental service is responsible for cleaning management, namely by transporting waste. The environmental department prepares a garbage container to collect the garbage inside the park, then this garbage will be transported twice a day using trucks. |
| Department Transportation, Communication and Informatics | The Department of Transportation, Communication and Informatics is responsible for the arrangement of parking around the park. Taman Indonesia Kaya does not have special parking, so on ordinary days parking still uses the land in front of Senior High School 1 Semarang and behind the governor's office. During big events, parking is directed around the park and the Tri Lomba Juang sports arena parking area. The Department of Transportation, Communication and Informatics also provides wifi that can be accessed free of charge in the park area. |
| Trade Service | The Trade Service is responsible for structuring street vendors who previously were irregularly located around Taman Indonesia Kaya. The trade service in cooperation with the Bank of Central Java through the CSR Program to build a special shelter located on Jl. Pandanaran II. The Trade Office is actively conducting socialization so that traders are willing to be relocated. |
| Privat Sector | |
| Djarum Fondation | Djarum foundation is one of the main stakeholders in the construction of the Taman Indonesia Kaya. Through its CSR program, Djarum foundation allocates a budget of 6 billion rupiah to develop and reorganize Taman Indonesia Kaya. Djarum foundation also carries out management for 3 months after the construction of the park in October 2018. |
| Bank Jateng | Bank Jateng cooperates with the Semarang City Trade Office through a CSR program to build a merchant shelter worth 799 Million Rupiahs. |
| PP Property | PP Properti through its CSR program also contributes to the provision of park facilities by providing ready-to-drink water taps. Maintenance of these facilities is also the responsibility of PP Property for two years after construction. |
| Society | |
| Semarang Artists | In the development of Taman Indonesia Kaya, the Djarum Foundation also invited Semarang artists to build a mural gate. Djarum foundation also provides the opportunity for Semarang artists to use park facilities for performing arts and culture. |
| Crop Growers | Plant farmers were involved in crop management during the construction of Taman Indonesia Kaya |

Based on the Table 1 it is known that each stakeholder has a different role according to the main tasks and functions of each agency. Some stakeholders contribute in supporting the provision of park...
facilities, while other stakeholders contribute to the management and control of the park. An overview of the facilities built and managed by each stakeholder can be seen in the figure 6:

![Figure 6. Facilities built and provided by each stakeholder.](image-url)

Coordination and communication between stakeholders are one important factor in the sustainability of the management of Taman Indonesia Kaya. The pattern or form of coordination can be seen in the networked structure that exists between one stakeholder and other stakeholders. In collaborative governance, networks must be organic with the network structure involved ie there is no hierarchy of power, domination, and monopoly. So that all parties have equal rights, obligations, responsibilities, authority, and opportunities for accessibility in achieving common goals.

Referring to the modes of network governance Milward and Provan [9] the network structure formed in the collaboration of Taman Indonesia Kaya management leads to a combination of self-governanceself-governance models and network administrative organizations.

![Figure 7. Networked structure in Taman Indonesia Kaya management collaboration.](image-url)
If seen based on three main elements, namely the private sector, state and society are included in the model of self-governance because the elements involved are not encompassed in an administrative entity, however all stakeholders participating in the network and management are carried out by all the stakeholders involved. On the other hand, the involvement and cooperation of several regional government organizations in the government element reflects the network administrative organization model. This is marked by the existence of a strict administrative entity, which was formed to manage the network based on the main tasks and functions of each. In addition, each stakeholder has different linkages and strengths of relations.

According to Milward and Provan [9] the problem of the self-governance model is that the cooperation carried out is inefficient because communication must be established more intensively. In the management of Taman Indonesia Kaya, the roles and responsibilities as well as the strength of the relationships between each stakeholder are different. The Department of Housing and Settlement Area as the manager of the park has a strong relationship with other agencies including the Djarum Foundation, while the private sector has no connection and each of them carries out direct coordination to the relevant government agencies. In practice, coordination between stakeholders is done individually so as to facilitate communication in problem solving.

"Usually if there is a problem in the park, we communicate with the Djarum via telephone or via WhatsApp, as well as with other agencies, each of whom has handled it, so that those who communicate are those people" (Semarang City Government)

Meanwhile in the network administrative organization model the problem is the hierarchy of perceptions, operating costs and complex administration. However, if cooperation can be carried out in administrative entities, the obvious advantage is the creation of efficiency management, the strategic involvement of members and the continued collaboration of Milward and Provan [9]. Cooperation between elements of the state, private sector and society has not yet reflected the network administrative organization. As explained in the previous analysis, stakeholders involved in the development and management of Taman Indonesia Kaya have challenges related to institutional design and the duration of cooperation so that there is no structural entity, which can lead to unsustainable collaboration.

4. Conclusion

Based on studies conducted, it is known that collaboration is motivated by the need for public open space and budget constraints owned by the government. In the collaboration process, communication between stakeholders is carried out through face to face dialogue, which starts with communication between the regional head and representatives of the private sector to produce trust building and commitment from each stakeholder to collaborate. In addition, facilitative leadership is also a key factor in the stakeholder collaboration process of developing Taman Indonesia Kaya.

Based on the identification results referring to the classification of Sumarto [5], the stakeholder element in the development and management of Taman Indonesia Kaya consists of the government (State) namely the Department of Housing and Settlements of Semarang City, Public Works Service, Environmental Service, Department of Transportation, Communication and Informatics, Trade Service. The private sector consists of Djarum Foundation, the Bank of Central Java PP Property and the public (society) consisting of Semarang Artists and Crop Growers. The government element is responsible in accordance with the duties and functions of each agency while the private element plays a role in accordance with the responsibilities of the program undertaken. Meanwhile, community involvement in building parks is the initiation of Djarum Foundation so that Taman Indonesia Kaya becomes a place for the expression of art community.

Multi-stakeholder collaboration in the Development of Taman Indonesia Kaya succeeded in realizing attractive public green space in the city of Semarang. However, the form of cooperation that is not accompanied by a clear institutional design resulted in the continued collaboration becoming a major challenge. Institutional design refers to basic protocols or ground rules for collaboration, which are very important for the procedural legitimacy of the collaboration process [4]. In addition, short
deadlines for cooperation can reduce the nature of ongoing collaboration, inadvertently reducing incentives for long-term cooperation [12]. Based on Milward and Provan's [9] modes of network governance, the network of stakeholder cooperation in managing Taman Indonesia Kaya leads to a model of self-governance, namely the absence of administrative entities so that communication between stakeholders can be an obstacle in the sustainability of collaboration.

Cooperation between state, private sector and society elements in the management of Taman Indonesia Kaya does not yet reflect the network administrative organization. The most fundamental challenge to the government going forward is to determine the form of structural governance that is appropriate for the sustainability of cooperation in the management of public green space. Collaboration must be carried out long term with clear agreements relating to the roles and responsibilities of each stakeholder. The government can use the administrative organization network model, namely the existence of strict administrative entities so that it will create efficiency management and ongoing collaboration [9].

References
[1] Chiesura A 2004 The Role of Urban Parks for The Sustainable City *Landsc. Urban Plan.* 68 129–38 [crossref]
[2] Carr S, Stephen C, Francis M, Rivlin L G and Stone A M 1992 *Public Space* (Cambridge University Press)
[3] Nugroho R 2014 *Public Policy* (Jakarta: Penerbit PT. Elex Media Komputindo)
[4] Ansell C and Gash A 2007 Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice *J. Public Adm. Res. Theory* 18 543–71 [crossref]
[5] Sumarto S S 2003 *Inovasi, Partisipasi dan Good Governance: 20 Prakarsa Inovatif dan Partisipatif di Indonesia* (Yayasan Obor Indonesia)
[6] Wai A T P, Nitivattananon V and Kim S M 2018 Multi-Stakeholder and Multi-Benefit Approaches for Enhanced Utilization of Public Open Spaces in Mandalay City, Myanmar *Sustain. Cities Soc.* 37 323–35 [crossref]
[7] Hidayani H and Warsono H 2017 Analisis Kemitraan dalam Pengembangan Ruang Terbuka Hijau (RTH) di Kota Semarang *J. Public Policy Manag. Rev.* 6 389–402
[8] Sudarmo 2011 *Isu-isu Administrasi Publik dalam Perpektif Governance* (Surakarta: Smart Media)
[9] Milward H B and Provan K G 2006 *A Manager’s Guide to Choosing and Using Collaborative Networks* vol 8 (IBM Center for the Business of Government Washington, DC)
[10] Denzin N K and Lincoln Y S 2003 *Handbook of Qualitative Research* (Thousand Oaks : Sage Publications)
[11] Bhatt R M 2002 Corporate Social Responsibility and Natural Disaster Reduction: Local Overview of Gujarat *Disaster Mitig. Institute, Ahmedabad* (67 pp)
[12] Freeman J 1997 Collaborative Governance in The Administrative State *UCLA L. Rev.* 45 1