Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
Providing End-of-Life Care for Patients Dying of COVID-19 and Their Families in Isolated Death During the Pandemic in Japan

Mayumi Nishimura, MPH, DrPH; Mayumi Toyama, MD, MPH, PhD; Hiroko Mori, MPH, PhD; Makiko Sano, RNS, MHS; Haruki Imura, MD, MPH; Akira Kuriyama, MD, DrPH; and Takeo Nakayama, MD, PhD

BACKGROUND: Death resulting from COVID-19 in a hospital during the pandemic has meant death in isolation. Although many health care providers (HCPs) have struggled with end-of-life (EOL) care for these patients, the various strategies across hospitals are not well known.

RESEARCH QUESTION: What EOL care did HCPs give patients dying of COVID-19 and their families in hospitals during the COVID-19 pandemic? What were the key themes in care?

STUDY DESIGN AND METHODS: This qualitative study used individual, semistructured, internet, and face-to-face interviews. We recruited HCPs who provided EOL care to patients with COVID-19 dying in hospitals and their families. Purposive sampling was used through the academic networks at the School of Public Health, Kyoto University. Anonymized verbatim transcripts were analyzed thematically.

RESULTS: Fifteen doctors and 18 nurses from 23 hospitals in 13 regions across Japan participated; 16 participants (48%) were women, with an age range of 20 to 59 years (most were 30-39 years of age). Participants described 51 strategies, including providing physical and psychological-spiritual care, making connections, providing death care, and arranging care environments and bereavement care for patients and their families. Four themes emerged as prominent efforts in COVID-19 EOL care: maintaining relationships with isolated patients, connecting patients and families, sharing decision-making in isolation, and creating humanistic episodes.

INTERPRETATION: Proper application and awareness of the four themes may help HCPs to implement better EOL care. To compensate for limited memories resulting from isolation and rapid progression of the disease, communicating and creating humanistic episodes are emphasized. ICU diaries and the HCPs' arrangements based on cultural funerary procedures could be provided as grief care for the family and to build trust. EOL education and building partnerships among palliative care staff and nonmedical personnel on a regular basis may enhance the capacity to deliver the necessary support for EOL care.

CHEST 2023; 163(2):383-395

KEY WORDS: COVID-19; end-of-life care; good death; qualitative research

ABBREVIATIONS: EOL = end-of-life; HCP = health care provider; PPE = personal protective equipment

AFFILIATIONS: From the Department of Health Informatics (M. N., M. T., H. M., M. S., H. I., A. K., and T. N.), Graduate School of Medicine, School of Public Health, Kyoto University; the Department of Nursing (M. S.), School of Health Sciences, Bukkyo University; the Department of Infectious Diseases (H.I.), Rakuwakai Otowa Hospital, Kyoto, and the Section of Epidemiology (H. M.), Shizuoka Graduate University of Public Health, Shizuoka, Japan.

CORRESPONDENCE TO: Mayumi Nishimura, MPH, DrPH; email: nishimura.mayumi.45w@kyoto-u.jp

Copyright © 2022 American College of Chest Physicians. Published by Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chest.2022.10.009
Take-home Points

**Study Questions:** What end-of-life (EOL) care did health care providers (HCPs) give patients dying of COVID-19 and their families during the COVID-19 pandemic?

**Results:** The participants described 51 care strategies that emerged as prominent efforts in COVID-19 EOL care within four themes: maintaining relationships with isolated patients, connecting patients and families, sharing decision-making in isolation, and creating humanistic episodes.

**Interpretation:** To compensate for limited memory in isolation and rapid deterioration, ICU diaries and the HCP’s arrangements based on cultural funerary customs could be provided to communicate and to create humanistic episodes.

As of August 2022, 6.4 million people have died of COVID-19 worldwide; this number continues to grow, although the new confirmed number of deaths is declining.1,2 Providing end-of-life (EOL) care for patients with COVID-19 and their families is challenging.3,4 The tragedy of dying in isolation without saying goodbye to loved ones and foregoing a formal funeral process has received attention in the media and causes patients and bereaved families to feel abandonment, anger, guilt, and dehumanization.5 Death in isolation causes constant rumination, leading to severe psychological and emotional distress for patients and their families5 as well as for health care providers (HCPs).6-8

Traditionally, so-called good death studies have explored the concepts of ideal EOL care and death and have contributed to developing EOL care models, assessments, and guidelines.9-15 Recent systematic reviews have identified components of good death, such as the absence of physical pain and symptoms. Regarding the spiritual aspect of dying, good relationships with others, respected autonomy, a sense of life completion, and religious procedures and rituals are important.15,16 However, patients with COVID-19 often experience difficulty breathing, uncomfortable treatments, challenges in communication, extreme loneliness, no choice of location, and restrictions on cultural and religious rituals.5,17-19 From the perspective of good death studies, the process of dying of COVID-19 is far from a good death.

Although palliative care as part of physical management is indispensable, the strategies for spiritual EOL care for patients with COVID-19 and their families remain to be clarified.20 Treatment and EOL care for patients with COVID-19 also are performed under pressure, leading to HCP burnout.21,22 Although pandemics have occurred throughout human history, the details of how EOL care is provided in the globalized world should be described and discussed. Given this context, we aimed to describe what kinds of EOL care were provided in multiple hospitals and to clarify the meaning and purpose of the provided care from the perspective of HCPs. The key themes of EOL care during the pandemic may provide insights in relationship to previous good death studies.

**Study Design and Methods**

A qualitative descriptive study was used with an objective idealism view based on the recognition of varied shared experiences and the interactive-inseparable nature of human interaction to explore the experiences of HCPs in providing EOL care to patients with COVID-19 and their families.23-27 This study was conducted as part of the Providing End-of-Life Care for COVID-19 project exploring HCPs’ experiences with their patients facing death as a result of COVID-19. We report this study following the Consolidated Criteria for Reporting Qualitative Research guidelines.28

**Participants, Sampling, and Recruitment**

HCPs providing EOL care to patients with COVID-19 from March 2020 through December 2021 in Japan were included. The exclusion criteria were HCPs who had psychiatric problems such as depression or sleep disturbances or HCPs who might feel distressed when recalling their experiences. Using mailing lists from the School of Public Health at Kyoto University, we asked the graduate students and alumni to introduce potentially eligible participants from among their colleagues. We then performed purposive sampling, recruiting eligible participants based on occupation, sex, hospital size, and region.29 We sent e-mails to potential participants directing them to the website that provided an explanation of the research, and participants confirmed their intention to participate by clicking on an icon. Thirty participants had not met the interviewers before the study.

**Data Collection**

Personal, closed interviews were conducted using the Zoom online video platform (Zoom Video Communications, Inc.) by three female researchers (M. T., who holds an MD and a PhD; M. N., who is an occupational therapist and holds an MPH; and M. S., who is a nurse with experience working in the ICU and holds an MHS) who received training on qualitative research from senior researchers. We developed an interview guide based on two pilot interviews with HCPs who had experience with patient deaths resulting from COVID-19 (e-Table 1). The main questions were as follows: (1) What EOL care did you provide for patients with COVID-19 and their families? (2) How did you feel when providing this care? Thirty participants permitted face-to-face video recordings, and three
participants agreed to audio recordings. Field notes were made during and after the interviews. Data saturation was achieved when no new codes were found in the interviews.24,29

Data Analysis
All interviews were conducted in Japanese, were anonymized, and were transcribed verbatim. Inductive thematic analysis was used with semantic interpretation focusing on the meaning of care.30,31 Two independent researchers (M. T. and M. N.) coded the first 10 interviews. Through multiple discussions, they developed coding strategies; subsequently, M. N. continued coding and categorizing all transcriptions, and M. T. checked all labeling and quotations. Any disagreements were resolved through discussion with a third reviewer (H. M., a female academic researcher who holds a PhD).32 To enhance credibility, triangulation was performed by M. S., H. I. (a doctor and infectious diseases researcher working clinically with patients with COVID-19), and A. K. (a doctor and intensive care researcher working clinically with patients with COVID-19). We repeatedly refined the themes and referred to interview quotations to achieve a final consensus.32 Transcriptions were not returned to the participants, and the participants did not provide feedback on the findings. Most researchers of this study had medical backgrounds, which might have led to our empathic stances for HCPs throughout this study. Data were managed using NVivo (QSR International Pty Ltd.)

Ethical Considerations
Before beginning the interviews, the interviewers orally reconﬁrmed the agreement to participate and the participants’ right to withdraw at any time. The study was approved by the ethics committee of the Graduate School and Faculty of Medicine, Kyoto University (Identifier: R3027; July 12, 2021).

Results
Thirty-three individuals, including 16 women (48%), were enrolled from 23 hospitals in 13 regions across Japan, including Tokyo, Osaka, Hyogo, and Okinawa, which had massive numbers of cases of COVID-19 (Table 1). Of the 37 participants recruited, one did not participate because of time commitments and three did not respond to our e-mails. Finally, 33 individuals (89%) were interviewed for 50 min on average (SD, 10.6 min), and one was interviewed twice.

Because COVID-19-related deaths were considered a circumstance requiring strict infection control policies, the three actors—the patients, their families, and their HCPs—were “isolated” from one another despite their

### TABLE 1  | Participant and Hospital Characteristics

| Characteristic | No. | % |
|----------------|-----|----|
| Participant (n = 33) |     |    |
| Specialty |     |    |
| Medical doctor | 15 | 45 |
| Registered nurse | 18 | 55 |
| Sex |     |    |
| Female | 16 | 48 |
| Male | 17 | 52 |
| Age, y |     |    |
| ≥ 50 | 2 | 6 |
| 40-49 | 9 | 27 |
| 30-39 | 15 | 45 |
| 20-29 | 7 | 21 |
| Workplace |     |    |
| ICU | 9 | 27 |
| ED | 8 | 24 |
| High care unit | 3 | 9 |
| Specialized COVID-19 ward | 12 | 36 |
| Infection control team | 1 | 3 |
| Hospital (n = 23) |     |    |
| Region |     |    |
| Hokkaido | 1 | 4 |
| Yamagata | 1 | 4 |
| Chiba | 2 | 9 |
| Tokyo | 2 | 9 |
| Kyoto | 1 | 4 |
| Osaka | 2 | 9 |
| Nara | 3 | 13 |
| Wakayama | 1 | 4 |
| Hyogo | 4 | 17 |
| Okayama | 2 | 9 |
| Hiroshima | 1 | 4 |
| Fukuoka | 1 | 4 |
| Okinawa | 2 | 9 |
| No. of beds |     |    |
| ≥ 1,000 | 3 | 13 |
| 800-999 | 4 | 17 |
| 600-799 | 4 | 17 |
| 400-599 | 5 | 22 |
| 200-399 | 6 | 26 |
| < 200 | 1 | 4 |
| No. of available beds for patients with COVID-19 |     |    |
| ≥ 30 | 3 | 13 |
| 20-29 | 3 | 13 |
| 10-19 | 8 | 35 |

(Continued)
increasing need for contact. HCPs struggled to provide care and respond to specific needs related to death in isolation. Among the 51 care strategies that were used during this time (Fig 1), four themes emerged: maintaining relationships with isolated patients, connecting patients and families, sharing decision-making in isolation, and creating humanistic episodes. Although, some overlap occurred, the doctors tended to talk more about connecting patients and families and sharing decision-making in isolation, whereas the nurses tended to discuss maintaining relationships with isolated patients and creating humanistic episodes. Table 2 depicts the themes and narrative data. Quotations were translated by the authors with the help of a professional language editor.

**Maintaining Relationships With Isolated Patients**

Infection control measures such as wearing personal protective equipment (PPE) and limiting contact time interfered with HCPs in creation and maintenance of relationships with patients. Given the limited opportunities for contact, HCPs attempted to maintain relationships with isolated patients by addressing the patients’ loneliness, listening to them, talking to them, meeting their needs, and staying nearby when they died.

**Addressing Patients’ Loneliness:** HCPs recognized that patients felt loneliness and emptiness and wished to end the situation.

“He was alone without doing anything, just waiting to die. . . . He said he wanted to commit suicide because he knew that his condition was worsening day by day.” (participant 1, doctor)

HCPs tried to heal patients’ loneliness. For example, doctors listened to them, and nurses positively communicated with patients during daily care, such as eating (participant 19, nurse) or playing songs and opening the windows so patients could enjoy the scenery (participant 28, nurse). A hospital advocated that staff should wear PPE so they could visit the patients in a

---

**Figure 1 – Diagram showing end-of-life care provided to patients with COVID-19 and their families by health care providers in Japan, displayed in chronological order. HCP = health care provider; PPE = personal protective equipment.**
| Category | Quotation (Participant’s Identification, Specialty, Sex) |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| Theme: Maintaining relationships with isolated patients | Definition: Efforts to form and maintain relationships between patients with COVID-19 and HCPs |
| Subtheme: Addressing patient’s loneliness | “My biggest dilemma was that I wondered if there was anything else I could do for them. Hmmm . . . . The COVID-19 patient’s mental activity is functioning well, and I think their time until the end is valuable in itself. If the patient could value in it, the time spent there would be meaningful. It is not about prolonging life. [Did you find any meaning?] No, I did not find any.” (participant 14, doctor, male) |
| | “I tried not to make time for loneliness. It is not just about having the TV on. I tried taking the initiative in helping with meals. I talked to them as I could when I was helping them eat.” (participant 16, nurse, female) |
| | “When he wanted to see the scenery outside, I only helped him look out through the window.” (participant 28, nurse, female) |
| | “It is tough working in the red zone, but we set up a nurse staffing system to respond to patients immediately while still wearing PPE. We allocated nurses to be in charge and made efforts to increase the frequency of nurses’ visits to the rooms as much as possible.” (participant 29, nurse, female) |
| Subtheme: Talking to unresponsive patients | “He died on the night shift. We tried to stay by his side as much as possible, but we were very busy at that time, so when we could not, we asked a care worker to stay by his side for a while.” (participant 15, nurse, female) |
| Subtheme: Preventing death alone | “The pulse wave form looked like PEA. I prepared by wearing PPE, calling his wife and other nurses.” (participant 27, nurse, male) |
| | “Of course, just because the patient is already intubated does not mean I’m going to skip certain procedures. I talked to the patient: ‘How are you doing? I’m going to take a look at you.’ And I would explain what’s going on while talking to the patient.” (participant 26, doctor, female) |
| Theme: Connecting patients and families | Definition: Efforts to connect the patient with their family members under circumstances of separation |
| Subtheme: Messaging between patients and families | “Some people brought letters to the patients. Some people brought food that the patients could not eat, but they said, ‘Please let her eat this if she wants.’ I would take their gifts so that their feelings could be conveyed.” (participant 29, nurse, female) |
| | “I asked the patient and his family to talk to each other because it would be the last time that they could have a conversation. Even a casual conversation was enough. Then, we intubated the patient.” (participant 19, nurse, female) |
| | “It is like an ICU diary. Every day we take pictures of the patients, and the nurses on the day shift write a brief note of what happened today. The nurses on the day shift would take photographs of the patient every day and would keep a brief diary of what happened. The doctors and rehabilitation staff would sometimes add information. The social
TABLE 2  (Continued)

| Category | Quotation (Participant’s Identification, Specialty, Sex) |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| Subtheme: Indirectly connecting patients and families | worker would send this information to the family’s address. My patients’ families were pleased about that.” (participant 21, nurse, female) |
| Connecting the patient and family members synchronously | “The nurse in charge of the patient holds an electronic tablet device like this, saying, ‘Well, I will start now. Yes, Mrs. [redacted], can you see me? Mr. [redacted] cannot speak right now, but he is doing his best like this.’ Then, the family would reply, ‘Oh, Dad, you are doing your best.’ I would respond for him with something like, ‘Yes, I’m doing my best.’ Yeah.” (participant 11, nurse, male) |
| Moving the patient and family members closer to each other | “The patient was the only one in the room, so I extended the ambu bag forcibly and brought him over to us. I moved the patient’s bed to the glass door. The distance from the family was probably approximately 50 centimeters, right? I made it so that the family could see the patient up close.” (participant 7, nurse, male) |
| Subtheme: Directly connecting patients and families | “At that time, PPE was very limited, and we were treating patients while wearing garbage bags or something. However, there were a few sets of PPE, so when I said, ‘I want his family to visit with him when he is near death,’ everyone said, ‘Let’s do that.’ Only for patients who I thought may not be able to recover, I did [family] visits with PPE since last May or June [in 2019].” (participant 12, doctor, female) |
| Coordinating a family meeting under a high risk of infection | At present, all patients are released from isolation after 21 days from the onset of illness and are moved to the general ward. In that case, they are allowed to meet with their families in the same way as regular patients in the general ward.” (participant 22, doctor, male) |
| Subtheme: Combining multiple communication tools | “At that time [May 2019, when PPE was in short supply in Japan], the patient’s husband was already infected, so when he came down from the ward, he entered the ICU without any protective clothing. His daughter was not infected, so I had her go in there wearing full PPE. I had them meet the dying patient directly, and I removed the ventilator.” (participant 10, doctor, male) |
| Theme: shared decision-making in isolation | Definition: Efforts in sharing common care goals addressing the family’s and patient’s care preferences under isolation or separation and communication difficulties |
| Subtheme: Understanding the families’ distress | “I said to the family, ‘If this treatment doesn’t work anymore, I don’t think he will survive.’ Well, if I didn’t tell them, I don’t think they would be able to accept death suddenly. I tried to allow the family to prepare for death.” (participant 12, doctor, female) |
| Preparing the family for death | “Nurses are used to family communication and usually ask, ‘How are you doing? Are you okay?’ Additionally, since there can be harmful rumors, we asked the family if they had any problems.” (participant 11, nurse, male) |
| Addressing the family members’ distress without direct visitation | “Additionally, the nurses could see and talk with the families personally when we met with them on the tablets, so we asked them if they were well-rested. . . . or, ‘What did the doctor say about this? How was the explanation from the doctor?’” (participant 2, nurse, female) |
| Confirming families’ understanding of medical explanations | (Continued) |
TABLE 2  (Continued)

| Category                                                                 | Quotation (Participant’s Identification, Specialty, Sex)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Regular communication                                                    | “While on the videophone, the family can see how the patient’s body has been damaged. Some families accept the end-of-life care plan saying, ‘Yes, my father did his best.’” (participant 14, doctor, male)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Irregular communication                                                  | “I made it a rule to call the family at least twice a week. Additionally, if the patient’s condition suddenly changed or became critical, we would call.” (participant 20, doctor, male)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| Subtheme: Meticulous exploration of hidden preferences                    | “(The family) brought the patient’s laundry. Although they could not enter the patient’s room, nurses could meet the family at the nurse’s station, so I told them about the patient’s condition.” (participant 30, nurse, female)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Addressing the patient’s treatment preferences                           | “He indicated that he did not want to be reintubated. Since he clearly expressed this intention, I realized he have felt so hard during the treatment. So, he passed away without reintubation.” (participant 5, doctor, male)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Asking about the patient’s preferences                                   | “When the patients have no relatives, I called the public health nurse who knows the person before, and asked if he wanted to fully live longer or if they have ever had that kind of conversation.” (participant 26, doctor, female)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Consulting with multidisciplinary team                                   | “We created a system to have regular multidisciplinary conferences to discuss patients who have already been hospitalized for a long time or when we need to review the current treatment plan using the Jensen’s four-box model of clinical ethics.” (participant 10, doctor, male)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Subtheme: Conveying the HCPs’ compassionate care                         | “I wrote about the patient’s condition and what I thought about the patient today for the family members at home. I thought, well, writing this is meaningful. I wanted to tell the family that we are doing our best with our belief in the patient’s recovery.” (participant 21, nurse, female)                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Conveying the staff’s efforts to provide the best care for patients to families | “I said to the families that we can support [them] wearing gloves and a gown, so I encouraged them to visit the [dying] patients.” (participant 19, nurse, female)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Theme: Creating humanistic episodes                                      | **Definition:** Efforts to promote families’ emotional recovery by providing humanistic episodes during care                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| Subtheme: Promoting family involvement                                   | **Allowing the family to touch the patient or over the body bag using gloves** “We allowed families to touch the patient using gloves and masks in the yellow zone.” (participant 5, doctor, male)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|                                                                           | **Taking photographs with the patient** “I do not know if it was a good idea or not, but well, the body would be cremated soon, so I allowed them, if they wanted, to take a picture with him.” (Participant 12, doctor, female)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|                                                                           | **Placing memorabilia and letters into the patient’s body bag** “I put the letters, photos, and other things from the families into the body bags so that the deceased would not be lonely when the body was cremated.” (participant 19, nurse, female)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|                                                                           | **Dressing the patient with clothes chosen by the family** “The nurses cleaned the body and applied makeup to the patient. Yes. So they dressed the patient in clothes that family brought and she liked when she was alive, like the kind of cloth she has worn on festive occasions, because it is culture in this region.” (participant 5, doctor, male)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|                                                                           | **Creating mourning opportunities for families** “Since the deceased passed away from COVID-19, the funeral director would not touch the body at all. Therefore, we decided to set up a memorial service with the family at the hospital, like a small funeral, even though we could not hold one.” (participant 19, nurse, female)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
TABLE 2 (Continued)

| Category | Quotation (Participant’s Identification, Specialty, Sex) |
|----------|---------------------------------------------------------|
| Subtheme: Sharing patients’ EOL periods | “When I gave the ICU diary to the deceased patient’s family, they were truly grateful. The family said, ‘I can feel from the diary that my father is doing his best with treatment.’” (participant 25, nurse, female) |
| Subtheme: Helping families see the patients’ corpses | “Two or three nurses helped each family member into PPE. Then, we let them touch the patient, visit with the patient, and put the patient’s favorite things in the body bag. The family was very satisfied with this service and thanked me, saying, ‘I truly did not expect them to do this for me.’” (participant 11, nurse, male) |
| Arranging body bags to show the patient’s face to the family | “The nurses believed that the transparent body bag would give the family a sense of satisfaction because they could see the person. Then, after the patient was placed in the transparent body bag, a blanket was placed over the bag to make it look more natural.” (participant 20, doctor, female) |

EOL = end-of-life; HCP = health care provider; PEA = pulseless electrical activity; PPE = personal protective equipment.

Before (the COVID-19 pandemic), some families recorded the patient’s efforts in an ICU diary. For example, “When I gave the ICU diary to the deceased patient’s family, they were truly grateful. The family said, ‘I can feel from the diary that my father is doing his best with treatment.’” (participant 25, nurse, female)

Connecting Patients and Families: The HCPs believed that a patient dying in the absence of their family was abnormal. (participant 4, nurse) Both the frontline HCP staff and managers struggled with connecting patients with family members using innovative and traditional approaches, such as family visits and audio and video calls. Direct connection through family visits was preferred by the HCPs; however, the content of communication was valued despite the tools.

Messaging Between Patients and Families: The HCPs facilitated communication between patients and their families by bringing letters and gifts from families to patients and helping patients to have conversations with their families before intubation.

Connecting Patients and Families: The HCPs facilitated communication between patients and their families by bringing letters and gifts from families to patients and helping patients to have conversations with their families before intubation.

Talking to Unresponsive Patients: Most HCPs talked to patients during treatment, even when the patients were deeply sedated. Treating the patient as a person maintained the relationship between the patient and the HCP.

“I want to prevent patients from dying alone. Always.” (participant 11, nurse)

Preventing Death Alone: When a patient was dying, some HCPs called the family, whereas other HCPs stayed with the patient as much as they could or asked care workers to stay with the patient.

“Having a patient already intubated does not mean we cut corners in our communication. We asked the patient politely to let us see.” (participant 26, doctor)
**Directly Connecting Patients and Families:** From October through December 2021, as PPE availability stabilized and HCPs gained confidence in the preventive measures in place, more hospitals allowed brief family visits while wearing PPE. Some HCPs warmly encouraged families who hesitated to visit the patient for fear of infection.

“The family’s fear of infection before coming was big... However, we encouraged them to see the patient as much as they could. Regardless of COVID-19, I hope families visit [them] because it’s the completion of the patient’s life.” (participant 19, nurse)

**Combining Multiple Communication Tools:** One doctor arranged direct visits with the family wearing PPE and simultaneously connected other relatives via videoconferencing to enable them to say goodbye, as if the patient was surrounded by loved ones.

“When the patient was near death, only his daughter entered his room wearing PPE. Simultaneously, his son-in-law and grandchildren saw the patient from the hospital’s green zone, calling out, ‘Grandpa, Grandpa’ through a tablet... It was just like the end-of-life care we usually do.” (participant 12, doctor)

**Shared Decision-Making in Isolation**

The separation of the three actors made it difficult to share patients’ medical conditions and each other’s real intentions. HCPs particularly had to support the families in their decision-making and confirm patients’ wishes. HCPs worked to understand the families’ distress, helping them to understand the medical status, meticulously exploring patients’ hidden preferences, and conveying the HCPs’ compassionate care.

**Understanding the Families’ Distress:** The patients’ families had complex problems, including their own health concerns, stress resulting from being isolated at home, and guilt for having infected the patient. To build a trustworthy relationship, addressing the family’s distress was emphasized.

“We had to talk about the patient’s difficult conditions, but the family on the phone was suffering from COVID-19. Therefore, the coordinator listened to the family’s situation and contacted the public health center.” (participant 9, doctor)

**Helping Families Understand Patients’ Medical Status:** Videoconferencing and multiple communications from doctors were found to be beneficial in sharing information about care and patients’ critical conditions with families.

“Seeing the damage to the patient, the family agreed with our suggested care goals.” (participant 14, doctor)

**Meticulous Exploration of Hidden Preferences:** Some patients were forced by others to decline medical care or were hesitant to express their true preferences because of the shortage of hospital beds (participant 10, doctor). Additionally, some patients’ preferences differed from their HCPs’ assumptions.

“He was single, lived alone, experienced cancer, and did not call for medical attention after infection. However, his sister said that he wanted to live as he could. Our team’s assumption was at fault.” (participant 26, doctor)

When a patient’s preferences were difficult to determine despite efforts to gather information, the HCPs usually consulted with a multidisciplinary team, ethics committees, and community officers who knew the patient.

**Conveying HCPs’ Compassionate Care:** Some HCPs used ICU diaries to describe the patient’s condition to the family. The messages in these diaries conveyed the HCPs’ compassion, and this compassion promoted the family’s trust. Reading these diaries, the families realized that the patients had received all available treatment and care, which affected treatment decision-making.

“After we started writing (ICU diaries), the family’s distrust decreased. Families realized that the patients were being treated sufficiently, and there were many moments when the families smiled when reading them.” (participant 20, doctor)

**Creating Humanistic Episodes**

In Japanese culture, families partially join in cleaning, washing, and applying cosmetics to the corpse and spend 2 days in mourning ceremonies. Relatives visit to see the deceased and then eat or talk together, sharing memories. When patients with COVID-19 died, these processes were omitted. Funeral companies transported the corpse from the hospital to the crematorium within 24 h, and the family received cremated remains without seeing the face of the patient one last time. HCPs were concerned that the lack of memories after a patient’s death would affect the family’s grief process, and they attempted to create humanistic episodes.

**Promoting Family Involvement:** The HCPs tried to involve the family after death. For example, some HCPs allowed families to touch the patient’s body while wearing PPE or masks and plastic gloves. The HCPs also asked the families to bring items such as letters, pictures, and gifts to put in the body bag (participant 19, nurse).
Other HCPs dressed the dead patient in clothes chosen by the family.

“We dressed the dead patient in the karate uniform that the family had brought.” (participant 24, nurse)

**Sharing Patients’ EOL Periods:** The isolation of patients and the rapid progression of the illness limited the time families had to accept the patients’ deaths. Some families wanted to know not only medical information, but also how the patients were spending their time. Keeping an ICU diary for the patient and giving it to the family allowed them to share the patient’s last weeks.

“The families said that the ICU diary showed the patients’ great effort to respond to treatments, which touched them deeply.” (participant 25, nurse)

**Helping Families See the Patients’ Corpses:** National guidelines recommend that the dead body be placed in a plastic body bag; however, HCPs were concerned about the negative impact on families. Some hospitals used transparent body bags. To show the patient’s face better, HCPs taped the body bag’s zipper that ran over the patient’s face to the side and secured it

“I was astonished. Even for us, we thought, ‘Oh, patients are put in such bags.’ Families would feel sad, so we arranged the bag.” (participant 28, nurse)

**Discussion**

This study collected data on 51 practices of EOL care for patients with COVID-19 and their families from 33 HCPs at 23 hospitals nationwide. Four themes emerged as prominent features of EOL care resulting from the rapid progression of the disease and isolated deaths. The care practices and themes reported from various hospitals will help in considering specific ways to provide EOL care in a setting where families, patients, and medical personnel are separated from one another.

Previous studies on pandemics caused by the Ebola, H7N9 influenza, and severe acute respiratory syndrome viruses have recommended palliative care for patients with COVID-19. These recommendations include controlling symptoms, family visitation when possible, developing treatment plans that incorporate patient and family values, making memories, and connecting family support and are consistent with our themes. In this study, HCPs used the internet as a new approach, but strove to achieve the common components of better EOL care toward a good death.

From our narratives, the reported effort to “connect patients and families” was important not only because it enabled families to contact the patients, but also because it was the final opportunity to encourage their life completion. According to good death studies, “life completion” is the central concept of the spiritual domain of good death. Life completion consists of life review, life closure, forgiveness, acceptance, generativity, contributing to others, and spending time with family and relatives. Oriented life completion is meaningful not only for an individual, but also for the family, staff, and society. Connecting the patient and family is necessary because it is an indispensable opportunity; however, it is not sufficient for the achievement of life completion. In other studies, connecting families and postintubated patients using a videoconference system was considered controversial, and some studies reported that seeing intubated patients had a negative impact on families. In our study, however, HCPs who focused on the content of communication described connecting patients and family as positive. HCPs must recognize that tablets serve only as a communication tool. They can deepen the final communication between patients and their families by promoting a sense of life completion as in ordinary EOL care, such as by asking, “Could you tell me what she meant to you?”

The ICU diaries used in the four hospitals in this study were applied effectively to all four themes. The original role of the ICU diary was to compensate for patient memory loss in the ICU; it contained daily medical care, photographs, and encouraging messages from HCPs and family members. Schofield et al. noted that ICU diaries help families to cope with their emotions and problems and to interpret ICU experience as a humanistic episode. In this study, we highlighted the usability of ICU diaries after a patient’s death. While reading the diary, the family may perceive HCPs’ efforts to establish a relationship with the patient and the meticulous care as humanistic episodes, which may lead to the acceptance of the patient’s death. Although barriers to ICU diary writing exist, such as tight work shifts, a challenging writing environment, and a lack of guidance on how to write, digital technologies using mobile messenger applications, such as those used by participants 24 and 25, reduced this burden.

Japanese traditional funeral and ritual processes reaffirm relationships by allowing the family to spend time with the corpse and invite relatives to a social ceremony. HCPs recognized the seriousness of the loss of these processes, which prevented the family from interacting with the community. As some studies have indicated,
bereaved families of patients with COVID-19 experience a high risk of complicated grief, that is, ambiguous loss and disenfranchised grief.33,47,48 “Ambiguous loss” means that bereavement itself is unsubstantial, traumatic, and hidden for reasons such as prejudice.47,48 “Disenfranchised grief” refers to the experience of a loved one’s death not being publicly acknowledged or socially supported.47,49,50 By creating tangible and intangible humanistic episodes, families may recover from complicated grief. In this study, HCPs put letters from families in the body bag or dressed patients in clothes chosen by their families. In Brazil and the United States, patients’ belongings were returned to their families in decorated boxes, and silver key chains with the patient’s fingerprints were given as gifts to show the HCPs’ respect for their patients.8,51 As with other efforts, applying the meaning of normal care to alternative care may improve the satisfaction of the bereaved family and HCPs. Bereavement care was performed by volunteers and palliative care staff in Europe and the United States,52,53 whereas in this study, HCPs provided bereavement care while treating other patients. Japan has fewer hospices than other countries, and HCPs have limited EOL training opportunities.54,55 Furthermore, collaboration between religions and hospitals is limited.56 Such an environment may have increased the burden on HCPs.

This study has some limitations. We excluded HCPs who might feel distressed when recalling their experiences; their perspectives may have been more critical of these practices, or they may have had different care experiences from the present participants. Our interviews started in August 2021, when the number of COVID-19 deaths was the highest and occurred in hospitals.57 Currently, most deaths from COVID-19 occur in nursing homes,57 and the human resources and professional backgrounds of staff are different from those at the hospitals included in this study. The adaptation of the 51 strategies may be limited, especially with access to opioid use. Despite these limitations, the four identified themes may help HCPs who struggle with what they can do to support patients and their families facing death under isolated circumstances.

Interpretation
As patients with COVID-19 died in isolation, HCPs used existing and new tools to link the concepts of a good death with care practices. The four themes of maintaining relationships with patients, connecting patients and families, sharing decision-making in isolation, and creating humanistic episodes were particularly beneficial in coping with rapid disease progression and death in isolation. ICU diaries and HCPs’ creative arrangements based on cultural funerary procedures promoted caring for families’ grief and building trusted relationships. EOL training for HCPs and establishing an EOL care support system as a normal part of care are urgent issues in Japan.

Funding/Support
This study was funded by Kyoto University [grant 021515] as part of the Providing End-of-Life Care for COVID-19 project and with resources from the Data-oriented Area Studies Unit, Research Units for Exploring Future Horizons Phase II, and the Kyoto University Research Coordination Alliance [November 6, 2021].

Financial/Nonfinancial Disclosures
None declared.
Acknowledgments

Author contributions: M. N., M. T., and T. N. contributed to study concept and design. A. K., M. S., and H. I. contributed to participant recruitment. A. K., H. I., H. M., M. N., and M. T. contributed to interview design. M. N., M. S., and M. C. conducted interviews. M. N. and M. T. performed core data analysis. H. M. supervised data analysis, and all authors verified data analysis. M. N. drafted the manuscript. H. M., M. T., M. S., H. I., and A. K. critically revised the manuscript for important intellectual content. T. N. acquired funding. M. T. provided administrative support. T. N. provided general supervision. M. N. is the guarantor of the article and takes responsibility for the integrity of the work as a whole, from inception to the published article.

Role of sponsors: The funder had no role in the design, recruitment, interviews, analysis, interpretation, preparation of the manuscript, or decision to submit the manuscript for publication.

Other contributions: The authors thank all participants and members of the Department of Health Informatics for their cooperation in recruiting participants and coordinating and managing the interviews.

Additional information: The e-Table is available online under “Supplementary Data.”

References

1. Ritchie H, Mathieu E, Rodés-Guirao L, et al. Coronavirus pandemic (COVID-19). Published March 5, 2020. Our World In Data website. Accessed May 15, 2021. https://ourworldindata.org/coronavirus

2. Johns Hopkins University & Medicine Coronavirus Resource Center. Global map. Johns Hopkins University & Medicine Coronavirus Resource Center website. Accessed May 25, 2021. https://coronavirus.jhu.edu/map.html

3. Islam I, Nelson A, Longo M, Byrne A. Before the 2020 pandemic: an observational study exploring public knowledge, attitudes, plans, and preferences towards death and end of life care in Wales. BMC Palliat Care. 2021;20(1):116.

4. Azad TD, Al-Kawaz MN, Turnbull AE, Rivera-Lara L. Coronavirus disease 2019 policy restricting family presence may have delayed end-of-life decisions for critically ill patients. Crit Care Med. 2021;49(10):e1037-e1039.

5. Testoni I, Azzola C, Tribbia N, et al. The COVID-19 disappeared: from traumatic to ambiguous loss and the role of the internet for the bereaved in Italy. Front Psychiatry. 2021;1-11. 12(March 2020).

6. Onwuteaka-Philipsen BD, Pasman HRW, Korfage IJ, et al. Dying in times of the coronavirus: an online survey among healthcare professionals about end-of-life care for patients dying with and without COVID-19 (the CO-LIVE Study). Palliat Med. 2021;35(5):830-842.

7. Hanna JR, Rapa E, Dalton LJ, et al. Health and social care professionals’ experiences of providing end of life care during the COVID-19 pandemic: a qualitative study. Palliat Med. 2021;35(7):1249-1257.

8. Cook DJ, Takaoka A, Hoard N, et al. Clinician perspectives on caring for dying patients during he pandemic: a mixed-methods study. Ann Intern Med. 2021;174(4):19-21.

9. Cottrell L, Duggleby W. The good death: an integrative literature review. Palliat Support Care. 2016;14(6):686-712.

10. Meier EA, Gallegos IV, Montross-Thompson LP, Depp CA, Irwin SA, Jeste DV. Defining a good death (successful dying): literature review and a call for research and public dialogue HHS public access. Am J Geriatr Psychiatry. 2016;24(4):261-271.

11. Bovero A, Gottardo F, Botto R, Tosi C, Selvatico M, Torta R. Definition of a good death, attitudes toward death, and feelings of interconnectedness among people taking care of terminally ill patients with cancer: an exploratory study. Am J Hosp Palliat Med. 2020;37(5):343-349.

12. Hales S, Zimmermann C, Rodin G. Review: the quality of dying and death: a systematic review of measures. Palliat Med. 2010;24(2):127-144.

13. Steinhauser KE, Tulsky JA. Defining a ‘good’ death. In: Cherny N, Fallon M, Kaasa S, Porteny RK, Currow DC, eds. Oxford Textbook of Palliative Medicine. 5th ed. Oxford University Press; 2015: 77-83.

14. Selman L, Harding R, Gyssels M, Speck P, Higginson JJ. The measurement of spirituality in palliative care and the content of tools validated cross-culturally: a systematic review. J Pain Symptom Manage. 2011;41(4):728-755.

15. Kritkorian A, Maldonado C, Pastrana T. Patient’s perspectives on the notion of a good death: a systematic review of the literature. J Pain Symptom Manage. 2020;59(1):152-164.

16. Zaman M, Espinal-Arango S, Mohapatra A, Jadad AR. What would it take to die well? A systematic review of systematic reviews on the conditions for a good death. Lancet Heal Longev. 2021;2(9):e593-e600.

17. Janss DJA, Ekström M, Currow DC, et al. COVID-19: guidance on palliative care from a European Respiratory Society international task force. Eur Respir J. 2020;56(2020):2002583.

18. Olayaye AO, Hocaoglu M, Cripps RL, et al. The challenges of caring for people dying from COVID-19: a multinational, observational study (CovPall). J Pain Symptom Manage. 2021;62(3):460-470.

19. Strang P, Bergström J, Martinsson L, Lundström S. Dying from COVID-19: loneliness, end-of-life discussions, and support for patients and their families in nursing homes and hospitals. A national register study. J Pain Symptom Manage. 2020;60(4):e2-e15.

20. Connolly M, Bell M, Lawler F, Timmins F, Ryder M. Hospital-based palliative and end-of-life care in the COVID-19 pandemic: a scoping review. Ann J Hosp Palliat Med. 2021;39(9):1105-1120.

21. Kuriyama A, Shikino K, Moriya M, et al. Burnout, depression, anxiety, and insomnia of internists and primary care physicians during the COVID-19 pandemic in Japan: a cross-sectional survey. Asian J Psychiatr. 2022;68:102956.

22. Kuriyama A, Sakuraya M, Kinjo M, et al. Burnout and turnover intention in critical care professionals during the COVID-19 pandemic in Japan: a cross-sectional survey [published online ahead of print September 19, 2022]. Ann Am Thorac Soc. https://doi.org/10.1513/AnnalsATS.2022-01-0290C.

23. Creswell JW, Creswell JD. Philosophical worldviews. In: Creswell JW, Creswell JD, eds. Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. 5th ed. SAGE; 2020:25-29.

24. Patton MQ. Variety of Qualitative Inquiry Frameworks: Paradigmatic, Philosophical, and Theoretical Orientations. In: Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods. SAGE; 2014:85-168.

25. Morgan DL. Paradigms lost and pragmatism regained: methodological implications of combining qualitative and quantitative methods. J Mix Methods Res. 2007;1(1):48-76.

26. Willis DG, Sullivan-Bolyai S, Knaff K, Cohen MZ. Distinguishing features and similarities between descriptive phenomenological and qualitative description research. West J Nurs Res. 2016;38(9):1185-1204.

27. Lincoln YS, Guba EG. Naturalistic Inquiry. SAGE; 1985.

28. Tong A, Sainsbury P, Craig J. Consolidated criteria for reporting qualitative research (COREQ): a 32-item checklist for interviews and focus groups. Int J Qual Heal Care. 2007;19(6):349-357.

29. Malterud K, Siersma VD, Guassora AD. Sample size in qualitative interview studies: guided by information power. Qual Health Res. 2016;26(13):1753-1760.

30. Braun V, Clarke V. Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qual Res Psychol. 2006;3(2):77-101.

31. Sandelowski M. What’s in a name? Qualitative description revisited. Res Nurs Heal. 2010;33(1):77-84.

32. Nowell LS, Norris JM, White DE, Moules NJ. Thematic analysis: striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. Qual Health Res. 2021;31:77-93.

33. Creswell JW. A rubric for evaluating the trustworthiness criteria. Ann Am Thorac Soc. 2017;14(11):1733-1736.

34. Mayland CR, Harding AJE, Preston N, Payne S. Supporting adults bereaved through COVID-19: a rapid review of the impact of previous pandemics on grief...
and bereavement. J Pain Symptom Manage. 2020;60(2):e33-e39.

35. Etkind SN, Bone AE, Lovell N, et al. The role and response of palliative care and hospice services in epidemics and pandemics: a rapid review to inform practice during the COVID-19 pandemic. J Pain Symptom Manage. 2020;60(1):e31-e40.

36. Steinhauser KE, Clipp EC, McNeilly M, Christakis NA, McIntyre LM, Tulsky JA. In search of a good death: observations of patients, families, and providers. Ann Intern Med. 2000;132(10):825-832.

37. Vig EK, Pearlman RA. Good and bad dying from the perspective of terminally ill men. Arch Intern Med. 2004;164(9):977-981.

38. Hirai K, Miyashita M, Morita T, Sanjo M, Uchitomi Y. Good death in Japanese cancer care: a qualitative study. J Pain Symptom Manag. 2006;31(2):140-147.

39. Rietjens JAC, van der Heide A, Onwuteaka-Philipsen BD, van der Maas PJ, van der Wal G. Preferences of the Dutch general public for a good death and associations with attitudes towards end-of-life decision-making. Palliat Med. 2006;20(7):685-692.

40. Byock IR. The nature of suffering and the nature of opportunity at the end of life. Clin Geriatr Med. 1996;12(2):237-252.

41. Fusi-schmidhauser T, Preston NJ, Keller N. Conservative management of Covid-19 patients—emergency palliative care in action. J Pain Symptom Manag. 2020;60(1):e27-e30.

42. Chen C, Wittenberg E, Sullivan SS, Lorenz RA, Chang Y-P. The experiences of family members of ventilated COVID-19 patients in the intensive care unit: a qualitative study. Am J Hosp Palliat Med. 2021;38(7):869-876.

43. Brandao Barreto B, Luz M, Rios MNDO, do Amaral Lopes SAV, Gusmao-Flores D. The impact of intensive care unit diaries on patients’ and relatives’ outcomes: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Crit Care. 2019;23(1):1-10.

44. Brandao Barreto B, Luz M, do Amaral Lopes SAV, Rosa RG, Gusmao-Flores D. Exploring family members’ and health care professionals’ perceptions on ICU diaries: a systematic review and qualitative data synthesis. Crit Care Med. 2021;49(7):e707-e718.

45. Brandao Barreto B, Luz M, do Amaral Lopes SAV, Rosa RG, Gusmao-Flores D. Exploring family members’ and health care professionals’ perceptions on ICU diaries: a systematic review and qualitative data synthesis. Intensive Care Med. 2021;47(7):737-749.

46. Schofield R, Dibb B, Coles-Gale R, Jones C. The experience of relatives using intensive care diaries: a systematic review and qualitative data synthesis. Int J Nurs Stud. 2021;119:103927.

47. Matsuda Y, Takebayashi Y, Nakajima S, Ito M. Managing grief of bereaved families during the COVID-19 pandemic in Japan. Japan Front Psychiatry. 2021;12:637237.

48. Boss P. The trauma and complicated grief of ambiguous loss. Pastoral Psychol. 2010;59(2):137-145.

49. Doka KJ. Disenfranchised grief. Bereave Care. 1999;18(3):37-39.

50. Nakajima S. Grief and bereavement care for families during the COVID-19 pandemic. Japanese J Trauma Stress. 2020;18(2):176-186.

51. da Silva Cardoso Luiz T, Carvalho da Silva Filho O, Ventura TCC, Dresch V. Memory box: possibilities to support grief in the intensive care unit during the COVID-19 pandemic. Rev Bras Ter Intensiva. 2020;32(3):479-480.

52. Neville TH, Bear DK, Kao Y, et al. End-of-life care during the coronavirus disease 2019 pandemic: the 3 wishes program. Crit Care Explor. 2021;3(10):e549.

53. Frost M. How COVID-19 changed end-of-life care. ACP Hosp. 2022;(January). ACP Hospitalist website. 2022. Accessed October 2, 2022. https://acphospitalist.acponline.org/archives/2022/01/12/how-covid-19-changed-end-of-life-care.htm

54. Tatsuno I, Yamase H, Tado A, Fujita N. End-of-life care in the ICU, and recognition of the medical staffs. J Japan Acad Crit Care Nurs. 2014;10(3):23-33.

55. Michiko I, Akashi K. Learning needs of proficient nurses for nursing to dying patients at the critical care. J Japan Acad Crit Care Nurs. 2020;16:65-72.

56. Hiratsuka Y, Aoyama M, Kaneta T, et al. Impressions of interfaith chaplain’s activities among patients in a palliative care unit: a semi-structured interview-based qualitative study. Tohoku J Exp Med. 2020;251:91-96.

57. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. Covid19 cases in Japan. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare website. Accessed November 15, 2021. https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/covid-19/kokunainohasseijoukyou.html