The Loyalty Model of Foreign Tourists Consuming Traditional Balinese Food

I Gusti Ayu Dewi Hendriyani\(^a\), Made Budiarsa\(^b\), Made Antara\(^b\), Nyoman Sudiarta\(^b\)

\(^a\)Doctoral Programme, University of Udayana and Bali Tourism Polytechnic, Indonesia
\(^b\)University of Udayana, Bali, Indonesia

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** The purpose of this study is to analyze the effect of meal experience of foreign tourists on satisfaction and loyalty when consuming traditional food in Bali. The choice of traditional Balinese food is traditional food using Balinese spices called Base Genep with the main course category. The purpose of this study also explores the meal experience of tourists consuming traditional food in tourist destinations is expected to provide satisfaction and can lead to loyalty to the destination itself in relation with The Island of Bali as a world tourist destination offers many choices of traditional food for tourists, especially foreign tourists.

**Design/methodology/approach:** This study uses quantitative analysis, structural equation model (SEM-AMOS) which is followed by the interpretation of the research results to answer 3 hypotheses. In building a loyalty model for foreign tourists consumed traditional food in Bali, confirms the concept of meal experience with five dimensions are food quality, service quality, atmosphere, cleanliness and hygiene, and price, which is combined with the Triangle Concept of Indonesian Gastronomy with a storytelling dimension, including from previous research on local culinary in a tourist destination. This study involved 332 respondents using accidental sampling techniques through four culinary tourism activities in Bali namely festival, food tour, cooking class, and homestay, at five locations in Bali province namely Denpasar City, Badung, Gianyar, Bangli, and Buleleng Regency.

**Findings:** The meal experience of foreign tourists consuming traditional Balinese food has a significant effect on tourist satisfaction and also tourist loyalty. And the satisfaction of foreign tourists consuming traditional Balinese food has a positive and significant effect on the loyalty of foreign tourists. The highest direct effect on the effect of meal experience is foreign tourist's satisfaction, then the influence between foreign tourist's satisfaction on foreign tourist's loyalty, and finally the influence between-meal experience and foreign tourist's loyalty. The study finding a new loyalty model for foreign tourists consuming traditional food in Bali destinations with a storytelling indicator as a novelty. The results of this study will provide theoretical implications in enriching consumer behavior theory and product development concepts, as well as further research in the future.

**Research limitations/implications:** The study is due to the respondent only foreign tourists not including domestic tourists, the findings cannot be generalized to the whole population of tourists visiting Bali. Future research can survey tourists domestic and in different areas in Bali to have wider coverage. Meanwhile, the practical implications for culinary stakeholders in Bali are in improving the quality of the tourist's meal experience and in developing culinary tourism in Bali as a whole.

**Keywords:** Traditional Food, Meal Experience, Storytelling, Satisfaction, Loyalty
I. Introduction

Tourism phenomenon in recent years where global tourists are not only looking for and getting new experiences but are also involved in making better changes in social, cultural, and economic life, as well as the environment in a sustainable manner. The practical implementation of the desire of tourists to experience during their tour, in Bali destinations, is also evident in the many interests of tourists, especially foreign tourists, for special interest tourism activities. Special interest tourism is a type of tourism that has a special purpose, such as adventure tourism, spiritual tourism, or culinary tourism. Culinary tourism has become one of the important attractions in tourist destinations in the world today. The influence of food in tourism can increase the attraction and competitiveness of a tourist destination and its potential in the image of a country.

Tourists are known to be very selective in consuming the right local food when visiting tourist destinations, especially foreign tourists. Research on tourists' traditional food choices by Mak et al. (2010) in China; Chao (2010) in Taiwan; and Amuquandoh and Adjie (2013) in Ghana found that different cultural backgrounds are an important indicator of food choices by tourists. In the Global Report on Food Tourism (UNWTO; 2012), it is explained that many things attract tourists to visit a culinary-based cultural tourism destination. The greatest motivation for tourists is visiting culinary activities such as food festivals (79%), food tours (63%), and cooking classes (62%). In the context of Bali, the interest of tourists, especially foreign tourists to try local traditional foods, can be seen in several culinary tourism activities, namely festivals, cooking classes, food tours, and at homestays in Tourism Village.

The meal experience of tourists on local cuisine in tourist destinations can influence the loyalty of tourists in the future. Many researchers have done the consumer loyalty model for consuming food in restaurants (Ha and Jang, 2010; Hyun, 2010; Zhong and Moon, 2020). For tourist destinations, the experience of eating by tourists consuming traditional food while on vacation has been developed and the quality continues to be improved. Several models of tourist loyalty consuming traditional food in tourist destinations by several researchers, namely Wijaya et al. (2014); Akdag et al. (2018); and Zhang et al. (2019) used the meal experience attribute, a concept developed by Cousins et al. (2002) namely product quality, service quality, atmosphere, cleanliness and hygiene, and price.

In previous research, the five dimensions in a tourist's meal experience attribute according to the concept of Cousins et al. (2002) when it is related to satisfaction and loyalty, some have a significant effect and some are not significantly affected. Meanwhile, Mossberg and Eide (2017) examined the importance of storytelling for consumers to improve the quality of the meal experience. In Indonesia, since 2016 the Triangle Concept of Indonesian Gastronomy has been developed by the Indonesian Gastronomy Academy (AGI) which has three elements, namely food, culture, and history. The practice of storytelling is mostly carried out in 4 culinary tourism activities in Bali because traditional Balinese food has an interesting philosophy to share with tourists. So that the phenomenon of storytelling traditional food in Bali will affect the meal experience of tourists.

Bali as one of the world's tourism destinations has the opportunity to serve Balinese culinary delights to tourists. Research on traditional Balinese food has been carried out by several researchers (Nariani, 2019; Ardika, 2018; Sukerti, 2016; Putri et al., 2016; Yusa and Suter, 2013, Hendrayana, 2011, Margi et al., 2013; and Sirtha, 1998). Traditional Balinese food can be interpreted as food that is processed and made by the Balinese from generation to generation by using a combination of local spices that have a specific taste and aroma that other regions do not have (Ardika, 2018; Hendrayana, 2011). Traditional Balinese food when served to tourists underwent several adaptations and modifications. The development of traditional Balinese food undergoes adaptation in processing and serving, hygiene is emphasized and is shown to be more concern to tourists, especially in the tourism industry. The challenge of developing local Balinese
traditional food so that it can be more popular than international food needs strategic planning by relevant stakeholders, especially the provincial government of Bali.

Research on the loyalty model of foreign tourists consuming traditional Balinese food, seen from the meal experience and satisfaction of foreign tourists to Bali destinations on the new label as a gastronomic destination needs to be studied. Research related to the loyalty of tourists consuming food at tourist destinations by including a new dimension, namely storytelling, no one has researched, especially for the consumption of traditional food, on culinary tourism activities in the tourist destinations. In Bali tourist destinations, traditional food is in great demand by tourists while on vacation in Bali, especially in 4 culinary tourism activities, namely festivals, cooking classes, food tours, and homestays in tourist villages that are widely developed in Indonesia and also in Bali. So that empirically and theoretically the research of meal experience of foreign tourists consuming Traditional Balinese Food becomes urgent to do.

Based on the background description above, the problem formulations in this study are 1). How does the meal experience affect the satisfaction of foreign tourists consuming Traditional Balinese Food? 2). How does the meal experience affect the loyalty of foreign tourists consuming Traditional Balinese Food? 3). How does satisfaction affect the loyalty of foreign tourists consuming Traditional Balinese Food? Based on the formulated subject matter, the general objectives of this study are 1). To analyze the effect of meal experience on the satisfaction of foreign tourists consuming Traditional Balinese Food, 2). To analyze the effect of meal experience on the loyalty of foreign tourists consuming Traditional Balinese Food, 3). To analyze the effect of the satisfaction on the loyalty of foreign tourists consuming Traditional Balinese Food.

This research is aimed at contributing theoretically and practically to the development of Bali destinations, especially in the culinary field, to be able to achieve higher quality and sustainable tourist destinations in the future. The academic benefits expected from this research are to contribute to enriching and complementing the theory of consumer behavior, the satisfaction, and loyalty of tourists in tourist destinations. This research will also contribute to the concept of product development, especially the meal experience of tourists with the novelty found in this study, namely the addition of dimensions and storytelling indicators. And of course, the findings of a model of tourist loyalty to traditional food in tourist destinations will be a reference for further research. This research is expected to contribute academically and inspire further researchers on other tourist destinations in Indonesia and the world. While the practical benefits that are expected in this study are to provide input to stakeholders in the culinary field in tourist destinations as the implementation of the loyalty model of tourists consuming traditional food, and improving the quality of the tourist's meal experience while on vacation in tourist destinations.

II. Literature Review

Research on meal experience has been carried out by several researchers, especially on local food in tourist destinations. Research on tourists' meal experiences at tourist destinations was studied by AB Karim and Chi (2013), Bjork and Raisanen (2014), Wijaya et al. (2014), Mossberg and Eide (2017), Bukharov and Berezka (2018), Akdag et al. (2018), Gregorash (2018), Clemente et al. (2019), and Zhang et al. (2019). Tourists' meal experience satisfaction at tourist destinations will affect consumer loyalty to come back and recommend it to others (AB Karim and Chi, 2013; Bjork and Raisanen, 2014; Wijaya et al., 2014; Akdag et al., 2018; Clemente et al., 2019; and Zhang et al., 2019). The main indicators in meal experience, namely food quality, service quality, and atmosphere have a significant influence in building the construct of tourist meal experiences (AB Karim and Chi, 2013; Wijaya et al., 2014; Akdag et al., 2018; and Zhang et al., 2019). Meanwhile,
the price indicator in Akdag et al. (2018), has less significant influence than the three main indicators of tourist experience but in Zhong and Moon (2020) it has a significant effect. And indicators of cleanliness and hygiene in Chao (2010); and Wijaya et al. (2014) has a significant influence on the meal experience of tourists. Previous research, 5 important indicators will build the construct of the tourist experience of eating in tourist destinations, namely food quality, service quality, atmosphere, cleanliness and hygiene, price, which are by the concept of Cousins et al. (2002). It's just that when tourists choose traditional food, additional indicators will be needed as part of the meal experience. In the findings of Mossberg and Eide (2017); and Gregorash (2018), the storytelling indicator is an important finding in building the meal experience of tourists in tourist destinations. The storytelling indicator will be included as an additional indicator in this study. The difference from previous research with this research is that there is a combination of the meal experience variable indicators in the above study according to the concept of meal experience Cousins et al. (2002) with the concept of the Triangle Indonesia Gastronomy (AGI, 2016), with a dimension of storytelling as part of local value. The findings in this study are expected to confirm the loyalty model of foreign tourists consuming traditional Balinese food by adding a storytelling dimension which is a novelty in this study including the loyalty model that will be produced.

Research on traditional Balinese food by many researchers found that traditional Balinese food contributes to the development of culinary tourism in Bali. The summary of many studies that in general the existence of traditional Balinese food is believed to be able to make an important contribution to the development of culinary tourism as special interest tourism in Bali. The meal experience for tourists is very important to pay attention to so that it can be a good memorable experience to get tourist loyalty to Bali destinations as a whole. Things that still need to be improved are aspects of cleanliness, the physical environment of the restaurant, price, food taste, and innovation in the meal experience. This will be an important point that must be improved in the development of culinary tourism in Bali, especially in traditional Balinese food. This research will be different from previous Balinese traditional food research, namely analyzing the meal experience, satisfaction, and loyalty of foreign tourists to traditional Balinese food through festival tourism activities, cooking classes, food tours, and homestays in Bali. This study will provide recommendations for the quality of the meal experience in developing culinary tourism in Bali using quantitative analysis. Previous analyzes of culinary in Bali have not yet discussed the dimensions of the meal experience associated with foreign tourists' satisfaction and loyalty. So it is hoped that this research will produce novelty in finding a model for the loyalty of foreign tourists to consume traditional Balinese food, especially in adding the dimension of storytelling in the variable meal experience.

This study uses the theory of consumer behavior as a grand theory in which it discusses the experience, satisfaction, and loyalty of tourists as part of a marketing study. Consumer behavior is assumed to be the main theory because it can cover the whole formulation of problems related to consumer decisions about a product or service, in this case, is Balinese Traditional Food. This theory will also be supported by the concept of product development which is closely related to the meal experience of tourists.

The main concept in this study is the concept of the meal experience, satisfaction, and tourist loyalty according to Zhang et al., 2019; Wijaya et al., 2014, Hyun, 2010; and Cousins et al., 2002 for the five dimensions of meal experience and according to Gregorash, 2019, Mossberg and Eide, 2017 and AGI, 2016 for one additional dimension in meal experience as a novelty in this study. Researchers try to do a combination of meal experience models according to the concept of Cousins et al. (2002), namely food quality, service quality, atmosphere, price, and cleanliness with the Triangle Concept of Indonesia Gastronomy from AGI (2016) with Food-Culture-History where there is storytelling between culture with the history of traditional food in Indonesia. The consideration in choosing this dimension is felt to
The data analysis stage in this study begins with measurements to test the variables based on the indicators. In this research design, there are three latent variables, which means that indicators are needed to measure these latent variables. The three latent variables (1) meal experience (2) tourist satisfaction, and (3) tourist loyalty to destinations (destination loyalty) through consumption of traditional Balinese food. In summary, the stages of research data analysis consist of several main stages, namely: (1) formulation of research problems, (2) concept development, (3) selection of analysis tools, (4) designing research instruments, (5) data collection, (6) tabulating and analyzing research data, (7) concluding the results of the analysis and interpretation, (8) discussing the research results, and (9) preparing a research report.

This research is located in Bali Province in one municipality and four districts, namely Denpasar City, Badung Regency, Gianyar Regency, Bangli Regency, and Buleleng Regency. The selection of these five locations is under the locations of the four most culinary activities in Bali, namely Festival, Cooking Class, Food Tour, and Homestay in the tourism village. Respondents of this research are foreign tourists who are and have consumed traditional Balinese food through festivals, cooking classes, food tours and homestay in the tourist village while on vacation in Bali. This research was conducted in a period of six months, namely November 2019 to May 2020.

Types of data are quantitative data and qualitative data by the title of the study, primary data sources directly from respondents through filling out research
questionnaires and interviews, while secondary data is data obtained through competent tourism institutions such as governments, associations, and industries that will complement primary data. The population of this study refers to the number of foreign tourist visits to Bali in 2019 of 6.3 million people. While the number of samples using the Slovin formula yields 400 people, and if you multiply 10 times the number of indicators, namely 33, the maximum result is 330 people. The construct in this study consisted of 3 variables, 6 dimensions, and 33 indicators, namely meal experience (X), Satisfaction (Y1) with 5 indicators, and loyalty (Y2) with 4 indicators. The ME (X) variable consists of 6 dimensions, namely food quality (X1) with 5 indicators, service quality (X2) with 5 indicators, atmosphere (X3) with 5 indicators, hygiene & sanitation (X4) with 3 indicators, price (X5) with 3 indicators, storytelling (X6) with 3 indicators.

The results of the instrument validity test in this study on 30 respondents generally gave quite good results because all the values of corrected item-total correlation were greater than 0.3, namely 0.537 to 0.879 so that all research instruments could be declared valid to qualify statistically as a research instrument. While the results of the instrument reliability test generally give good results because all of the Cronbach alpha (α) coefficients are greater than 0.70, namely 0.752 to 0.934 on the indicators in the variables and 0.825 to 0.942 on the variable dimensions of meal experience, which means that the instrument factor in this research can be declared reliable and qualifies statistically as a research instrument.

This research procedure uses closed and open surveys. Meanwhile, data analysis used quantitative method analysis SEM-AMOS (Structural Equation Modelling-Analysis of Moment Structure) to answer 3 research problems. Model testing with SEM AMOS consists of several stages, namely defining constructs, developing measurement models, testing measurement models, assessing structural model specifications, and validating structural models. Formulations to determine the degree of fit of a model with empirical data, namely Chi-Square, Goodness of Fit Index (GFI), Adjusted Goodness of Fit Index (AGFI), Root Mean Square Error of Approximation (RMSEA), Non-Normed Fit Index or Tucker Lewis Index (TLI), and Normed Fit Index (NFI).

IV. Results and Discussion

The characteristics of the respondents were seen based on: 1). Gender: female (176 people / 53%) and male (156 people / 47%), 2). Age group: highest at 30-49 years old (140 people / 42%), age> = 50 years (136 people / 41%) and <18-29 years (56 people / 17%), 3). Continental origin: Europe (136 people / 41%) from the UK, France, Germany, the Netherlands, Switzerland and Poland, the Asian continent (96 people / 29%) from Malaysia, Singapore, and Thailand, the Australian continent (88 people / 27%), the Americas (8 people / 2%), and the African continent (4 people / 1%), 4) Employment status: employees (188 people / 57%), managers (56 people / 17%), entrepreneurs (48 people / 14%), housewives and students (@ 20 people / 6%), 5). Frequency of visits: three times (140 people / 42%), first time (92/28%), second time (72 people / 22%) and frequency of third visits (28 people / 8%). Meanwhile, when viewed from the motivation of tourists, namely cultural exploration (148 people / 45%), getting experience of eating and activities together (@ 60 people / 18%).

The 4 culinary tourism activities, the largest number were at homestays in Tourism Village (73 people), continued at culinary or cultural festivals (60 people), than on food tour activities (50 people), and finally at cooking class activities (17 people). Of the total 332 respondents who filled out the research questionnaire, there were 200 people (60, 24%) who participated in four culinary tourism activities in Bali while 132 people (39.76%) stated that they consumed traditional Balinese food in hotels, restaurants/stalls, and traditional markets. So most of the respondents in this study participated in four culinary tourism activities in Bali, although it does not rule out that there are traditional Balinese food providers in other places.
Distribution of research in 5 locations in Bali, the highest was in Gianyar Regency (90 people), followed by Badung Regency (76 people), Denpasar City (67 people), Buleleng Regency (56 people) and the smallest was Bangli Regency (43 people). Empirical facts in the field are that in the Gianyar district, four traditional Balinese food activities such as festivals, cooking classes, food tours, and homestays in the Tourism Village are widely available and in demand by tourists, especially foreign tourists. The determination of Ubud Gianyar as a prototype for evaluating gastronomic destinations in Indonesia by UNWTO in 2018 and 2019 is appropriate and needs to be improved. So that from a total of 332 respondents in this study, the highest culinary tourism activity was in the homestay and the highest research location was in the Gianyar district.

The presentation of the results and discussion in this analysis uses quantitative analysis with SEM AMOS structural models. The stages in this section consist of 6 parts, namely: 1.) Description of the average value and standard deviation, 2.) Assumptions in the structural model analysis of SEM AMOS which consists of 5 assumptions (sample size, minimum data interval, meet the linearity assumption, meet the distribution normality assumptions, and assuming the absence of outliers), 3.) Test the feasibility of the SEM AMOS theoretical model, 4.) Hypothesis testing, 5.) Analysis of the influence between research variables, 6.) Comparison with the loyalty model of previous studies.

A. The results of the description of the average value and standard deviation:

1) The dimensions of food quality (X1) show that the indicators of the portion and temperature of food get a good assessment from the respondents while the taste, presentation, and food ingredients get adequate ratings, 2) The dimension of service quality (X2) that the indicators of communication, waiting time, and empathy received good ratings from the respondents, while indicators of fast and precise service and menu appearance received adequate ratings, 3) The atmosphere dimension (X3) that all indicators of this dimension get a good rating from tourists except for lighting, 4) Price dimension (X4) that all indicators of this dimension get good ratings from tourists except for service value, 5) Cleanliness and Hygiene (X5) dimensions that all indicators of this dimension get a good rating from tourists except the appearance of waiter/service providers, 6) The storytelling dimension shows that all indicators from the ST dimension get sufficient ratings from tourists, 7) Variable satisfaction (Y1) that all indicators of the SAT variable get a very good rating from tourists, and 8) The loyalty variable (Y2) is that all indicators of the LOY variable get good ratings from tourists.

B. The assumptions of the SEM AMOS structural model analysis:

1) The sample size of 332 respondents was considered sufficient and met the requirements, 2) Minimum interval data, namely ordinal data that is transformed into interval data using the Successive Interval (MSI) method, 3) Fulfilling the linearity assumption, that is, this assumption requires all relationships in the model to be linear, with linear regression of all exogenous (independent) total dimension scores on endogenous (dependent) dimensions. The assumption of linearity has been fulfilled because the significance value of all linearity test results in this study is smaller than 0.05, 4) Fulfilling the distribution normality assumption means that the data analyzed on each latent variable is expected to spread normally, however, if the sample size is large, namely 332, this assumption is not too critical, the basis is the central limit theorem, that is, if the sample size is large then the statistic of the sample will approach the normal distribution even though the population is taken not normally distributed. And from the results of the normality test of this research, it can be seen that the data has met the normality assumption in its distribution, 5) The assumption that there are no outliers is seen based on the minimum and maximum values that
are still in the predetermined range of 1 to 5 ordinal scales and have been overcome by transforming ordinal data into interval results (MSI). From the data analyzed in this study, it can be concluded that it does not contain outlier observational data.

C. Test the feasibility of the SEM AMOS theoretical model.

It has been able to produce a model that meets the overall goodness of fit criteria. The results of the confirmatory factor analysis that have met the suitability criteria for this model indicate that the researchers’ assumptions regarding the suitability of the measurement model under study have been supported by overall field observation data. Of the several criteria for measuring a fit model, namely RMSEA, GFI, AGFI, TLI, and CFI, all of them indicate that the model can be said to be fit. So that the model of tourist loyalty to traditional Balinese food can be seen in Figure 1 below:

The results of the confirmatory factor analysis as seen in Table 1 below:

![Model of the confirmatory factor analysis by SEM-AMOS](image)

**Figure 1.** Model of the confirmatory factor analysis by SEM-AMOS

| No. | The goodness of Fit Index | Cut off Value | Result | Goodness of Fit |
|-----|---------------------------|---------------|--------|----------------|
| 1   | X²- Chi-Square            | Expected small| 537,945| Moderate Fit   |
| 2   | Significance Probability  | ≥ 0.05        | 0.051  | Fit            |
| 3   | RMSEA                     | ≤ 0.08        | 0.018  | Fit            |
| 4   | GFI                       | ≥ 0.90        | 0.912  | Fit            |
| 5   | AGFI                      | ≥ 0.90        | 0.899  | Fit            |
| 6   | CMIN/DF                   | ≤ 3.00        | 1.107  | Fit            |
| 7   | TLI                       | ≥ 0.95        | 0.990  | Fit            |
| 8   | CFI                       | ≥ 0.95        | 0.991  | Fit            |

**Table 1.** The Goodness of Fit Measures for the Overall Model Fit (N=332)
D. Hypothesis Testing.

SEM AMOS structural model analysis is an analysis that is carried out based on hypothetical or theoretical principles that will be matched with empirical data. The principle of hypothesis testing is based on model assumptions, namely assumptions related to models and assumptions related to parameter estimation and hypothesis testing. So after all the assumptions in the model can be fulfilled, then hypothesis testing will be carried out by looking at the following data

In Table 2, the relationship between meal experience (X) and tourist satisfaction (Y1) is the first hypothesis, then the relationship between tourist satisfaction variables (Y1) and tourist loyalty is the third hypothesis, and finally the relationship between meal experience (X) variables and tourist loyalty (Y2) as the second hypothesis in this study. From the primary data processing in this model, the research hypothesis can be answered as follows:

**Hypothesis 1.** Meal experience (X) has a positive and significant effect on the satisfaction of foreign tourists (Y1) consuming traditional Balinese food.

The estimated parameter for testing the effect of meal experience (X1) on foreign tourists on foreign tourists' satisfaction (Y1) is shown by the CR (critical ratio) value of 5.097 and with a probability of 0.009. Both values meet the requirements for H1 acceptance, namely a CR value greater than 1.96 and a probability smaller than 0.05. Thus, it can be concluded that the meal experience (X) of foreign tourists has a significant effect on tourist satisfaction (Y1).

The theoretical relationship between the two variables has been supported by empirical data. The meal experience of foreign tourists on traditional Balinese food is seen from the six dimensions that make it up, namely food quality, service quality, atmosphere, cleanliness and health, price and storytelling which give an impact on overall tourist satisfaction. There are ten names of traditional Balinese food with the main food category that is often consumed by tourists while on vacation in Bali. The highest dimensions of a tourist's meal experience are product quality, service quality, atmosphere, and price. Meanwhile, the dimensions of cleanliness and health as well as storytelling need to be improved, even though overall it has a positive impact on tourist satisfaction.

These results are consistent with previous studies conducted by Zhang et al. (20019), Wijaya et al. (2017), and AB Karim and Chi (2013) on traditional food in tourist destinations. The meal experience of tourists has a significant and positive effect on tourist satisfaction. This means that the higher the quality of the tourist's meal experience when consuming traditional food in a destination, the tourists' satisfaction with their meal experience will increase. These findings strengthen the consistency of consumer behavior theory, especially in the experience of the purchasing decision-making process. The model of consumer decision making will be influenced by external influences, namely marketing activities, and consumer social life, while consumer experience is influenced by initial information and affects the psychological condition of consumers. In the end, consumer behavior will change when consumers feel satisfaction. When connected with the findings in this study, a quality tourist meal experience will affect tourist satisfaction.

**Hypothesis 2.** Meal experience (X) has a positive and significant effect on the loyalty of foreign tourists (Y2) consuming traditional Balinese food.

The estimation parameter for testing the effect of meal experience (X) on foreign tourists has an

| Correlations | Estimate | SE | CR  | P       | Decision                      |
|--------------|----------|----|-----|---------|-------------------------------|
| Y1 <-- X     | .740     | .145| 5.097| ***     | Significant at (CR> 1.96, and P <0.05) |
| Y2 <-- Y1    | .666     | .066| 10.129| ***     | Significant at (CR> 1.96, and P <0.05) |
| Y2 <-- X     | .311     | .120| 2.600| .009    | Significant at (CR> 1.96, and P <0.05) |
effect on tourist loyalty (Y2) showing a CR (critical ratio) value of 2.600 and with a probability of 0.009. These two values have met the requirements for H2 acceptance, namely the CR value greater than 1.96 and the probability smaller than 0.05. Thus it can be concluded that the meal experience (X1) of foreign tourists has a significant effect on tourist loyalty (Y2).

The theoretical relationship between the two variables has been supported by empirical data so that the relationship that occurs is significant. The meal experience of foreign tourists towards traditional Balinese food can make tourists try the food and come back to Bali again. Ten names of traditional Balinese food that are often consumed by tourists, including Nasi Campur Bali, Babi Guling, and Sate Lilit, are easy to remember by tourists through culinary activities, namely food festivals, cooking classes, taking food tours and staying at homestays. The existence of philosophy as well as local traditions that support the story behind the local food can make a meal experience for tourists as a memorable experience. The foreign tourist meal experience toward Balinese traditional food can make tourists loyal to Bali destinations in the future.

These results are consistent with previous studies conducted by Zhang et al. (2019), Wijaya et al. (2017), and AB Karim and Chi (2013) on traditional food in tourist destinations. The meal experience of tourists has a significant and positive influence on tourist loyalty to local food, including loyalty to tourist destinations as a whole. This means that the higher the quality of the tourist's meal experience, the higher the intention of tourists to try traditional food again, and recommend it to others. These findings reinforce the consistency of consumer behavior theory, consumer satisfaction with the experience in the purchase decision-making process, and the intention to come back. In this study, the good quality of the tourist's meal experience will lead to the intention of returning tourists in the future.

**Hypothesis 3.** The satisfaction of foreign tourists has a positive and significant effect on the loyalty of foreign tourists consuming traditional Balinese food.

The estimation parameter for testing the effect of tourist satisfaction (Y1) has an effect on tourist loyalty (Y2) showing the CR (critical ratio) value of 10.129 and with a probability of 0.009. The two values have met the requirements for acceptance of H3, namely the CR value greater than 1.96 and the probability smaller than 0.05. Thus it can be concluded that tourist satisfaction (Y1) has a significant effect on tourist loyalty (Y2).

The theoretical relationship between the two variables has been supported by empirical data so that the relationship that occurs is significant. The satisfaction of foreign tourists with the meal experience of traditional Balinese food is based on the results of interviews with seven tourists that they like to try Balinese food while learning the unique Balinese culture. Tourist satisfaction is not only in food products, but the service, atmosphere and stories behind Balinese food that are closely related to culture such as how to eat and the process of making the foods. The satisfaction of the tourist's meal experience is one reason for foreign tourists to be able to return to Bali in the future and create loyalty.

These results are consistent with previous studies conducted by Zhang et al. (2019), Wijaya et al. (2017), and AB Karim and Chi (2013) on traditional food in tourist destinations. Tourist satisfaction in consuming food at tourist destinations has a significant and positive effect on tourist loyalty to local food, including loyalty to tourist destinations as a whole. This means that the higher the quality of tourists' satisfaction with the meal experience when consuming traditional food in a destination, the higher the intention of tourists to try the traditional food again, and to recommend it to others. This finding strengthens the consistency of consumer behavior theory, and product development, especially the buying behavior of tourists towards traditional Balinese food products because they feel satisfied so that it will increase the loyalty of tourists to visit again in the future.
E. Analysis of the influence between research variables.

The results of the analysis are about direct effects, indirect effects, and total effects. Total Effects of each variable on the loyalty model of foreign tourists consuming traditional Balinese food on four culinary activities in Bali can be analyzed in detail for each effect as the following: The biggest direct effect is the direct effect between-meal experience (X) on foreign tourists' satisfaction (Y1) with a regression weight of 0.740 then the direct effect between-meal experience (X) and foreign tourists' loyalty (Y2) with a regression weight of 0.311 and finally the direct effect between foreign tourists' satisfaction (Y1) on foreign tourists' loyalty (Y2) with a regression weight of 0.666. The indirect effect is only on meal experience (X) with foreign tourists' loyalty (Y2) having a regression weight of 0.493. The highest total effect is meal experience (X) with the loyalty of foreign tourists (Y2) having a regression weight of 0.804, followed by meal Experience (X) with tourist satisfaction (Y1) has a regression weight of 0.740, and finally the effect of total tourist satisfaction (Y1) on tourist loyalty (Y2) with the smallest regression weight of 0.666. It can be concluded that the effect of the largest direct variable is a between-meal experience (X) on foreign tourists' satisfaction (Y1) with a regression weight of 0.740, the indirect effect of meal experience (X) with foreign tourist loyalty (Y2) has a regression weight of 0.493 and the highest total effect. There is a meal experience (X) with foreign tourist loyalty (Y2) that has a regression weight of 0.804. It can be interpreted that all variables have a significant and positive influence on the hypothesis in this study. So that the results of the formulation of all problems to answer the hypothesis in this study are: 1). Meal experience has a direct, positive, and significant effect on the satisfaction of foreign tourists who consume traditional Balinese food, 2). Meal experience has a positive and significant indirect effect on the loyalty of foreign tourists who consume traditional Balinese food, 3). The satisfaction of foreign tourists has a positive and significant effect on the loyalty of foreign tourists to traditional Balinese food.

F. Comparison with the loyalty model of previous studies.

The loyalty model generated in this finding is compared with the 3 findings of the tourist loyalty model of tourist destinations by previous researchers (Zhang et al., 2019, Wijaya et al., 2014 and AB Karim and Chi, 2013) has several differences. The findings of the loyalty model by Zhang et al., 2019 when compared with the tourist loyalty model in this study, the similarities are found in indicators of food quality, service quality, and atmosphere which are indicators of meal experience, which will affect tourist satisfaction and loyalty. Whereas the difference in research according to Zhang et al., 2019 emphasizes the authenticity of local food in China, whereas in the loyalty model this study emphasizes the need to consider cleanliness and hygiene indicators, price and storytelling as complementary indicators in the tourist experience of traditional food in tourist destinations Bali. In this study, we have combined the concept of the meal experience from Cousins et al., 2002, and the Triangle Concept of Indonesian Gastronomy (AGI, 2016). Different emphases and approaches as the findings of this study when compared with the findings of Zhang et al., 2019 are new findings in this study.

The findings of the tourist loyalty model by Wijaya et al., 2014 when compared with the research findings of Wijaya et al., 2014 with the tourist loyalty model in this study have several similarities and differences. The similarities and differences are that the research locations are both in Indonesia, namely in Surabaya-East Java and in Bali. In Wijaya et al., 2014 using indicators of the meal experience of tourists, namely food quality, service quality, atmosphere, and cleanliness, while in this study the traveler's meal experience was added with price indicators and storytelling. While the experience outcomes of the two findings of this study are both to achieve satisfaction and
repetitive behavioral intentions of tourists.

And a comparison of the findings of AB Karim and Chi, 2013 with the results in this study that indicators in culinary quality variables such as food quality and variety, atmosphere, and service quality have similarities with the meal experience indicators in this study. Additional indicators in this study are cleanliness, price, and storytelling. In AB Karim and Chi, 2013, there is an addition of a food image variable that will affect the satisfaction of tourists' meal experiences, including the intention to repeat behavior by tourists. Whereas in this study only focuses on the meal experience of tourists which is associated with satisfaction and loyalty variables. In this case, it is the satisfaction and loyalty of foreign tourists to consume traditional Balinese food.

This study produces a tourist loyalty model of foreign tourists who consumed traditional Balinese food (see Figure 2). The results of the model test confirm that the loyalty of foreign tourists to consume traditional Balinese food has a direct effect on the satisfaction variable and has an indirect effect on the loyalty variable. The position of the findings of this study, in comparison with the findings of previous studies, can be explained as follows: From the comparison of the influence in this study with three other studies, it has some similarities and differences.

The similarity in the four studies above is to find the influence between tourist eating experiences on tourist satisfaction and loyalty. In the findings of Zhang et al., 2019 meal experience was added with the authenticity variable, while the findings of Wijaya et al., 2014 pre, during and post-dining in meal experience were influenced by internal and external factors and in AB Karim and Chi, 2013 meal experience was added with the food image variable. What these four studies have in common is that the latent variable meal affects the independent variables of satisfaction and loyalty from tourists. So that the results of the formulation of the three research problems can be explained as follows: (1) Meal experience has a positive and significant effect on tourist satisfaction, (2) Meal experience has a positive and significant effect on tourist loyalty, (3) Tourist satisfaction has a positive and significant effect on loyalty, traveler.

The fundamental difference in the findings of this study with the results of previous studies, namely the findings of Zhang et al. (2019), the findings of Wijaya et al. (2014), and the findings of AB Karim and Chi (2013) are the dimensions and indicators of the tourist meal experience. But what is new in this study and differentiates it from previous research is the dimension of storytelling obtained from the concept of AGI (2016). So it can be concluded that the model produced in this study is a new loyalty model specifically applied to the subject of foreign tourists consuming traditional food in Bali tourist destinations.

Based on the research objectives, the conclusions in this study are loyalty models for foreign tourists with a variable meal experience in this tourist loyalty model, influenced by 6 dimensions, namely food quality, service quality, atmosphere, cleanliness & hygiene, price, and storytelling. The variable meal experience of tourists in this study will directly influence the tourist satisfaction variable and also the tourist loyalty variable. Then the satisfaction of tourists consuming traditional Balinese food will affect tourist loyalty. The results of the comparison of the loyalty model of foreign tourists with previous research have several differences. Whereas in this study, one of the new variables that form meal

Figure 2. The tourist loyalty model of foreign tourists consuming traditional Balinese food
experience is storytelling which can be used as a novelty in this study. Meal experience of foreign tourists consuming traditional Balinese food has a significant effect on tourist satisfaction and also tourist loyalty. And the satisfaction of foreign tourists consuming traditional Balinese food has a positive and significant effect on the loyalty of foreign tourists. Results from the biggest direct influence on the effect of meal experience on foreign tourists' satisfaction, then the influence between foreign tourists' satisfaction on foreign tourists' loyalty, and finally the influence between-meal experience and foreign tourists' loyalty.

V. Limitations and Recommendations for Future Research

This study had some implications and limitations that should be pointed out. The theoretical implication results of this study will enrich the theory of tourist behavior, especially in the development of food products with the concept of consumer meal experiences and for the practical implication benefits of this research are as input for culinary stakeholders to improving the quality of the meal experience, the satisfaction and loyalty of tourists to Bali, and as a reference for the government in making policies related to local culinary development.

Even though this study involved a large sample, namely 332 respondents, the selection of respondents was purposive, namely only foreign tourists not including domestic tourists so it has limitations, namely not being able to generalize. On the other hand, respondents who were involved in this study were not specifically engaged in four culinary activities in Bali so that it could lead to bias towards the measurement of research indicators. The testing of the loyalty model in this study has extracted some of the results of the research questionnaire that were incompletely filled, resulting in the initial target number of total respondents. The research time is a very short period (6 months), it is not enough to get respondents who have holidays during the low season, and the high season which requires a minimum of a year, and the COVID 19 pandemic since March 2020 when the research period is taking place. The dominant respondents in this study are from Europe, causing the results of this study to be not representative, which can be used as a reference for generalizing the factors that motivate tourists to consume local traditional food while on vacation in Bali.

Based on the conclusions of the research results above, the suggestions to be conveyed for stakeholders in the culinary field in Bali, especially the government, the results of this research can be continued by making standardization of traditional Balinese food that can be consistently promoted through digital media so that they are better known by tourists before they visit Bali destinations. The provincial government of Bali is also advised to make regulations and programs to regulate the development of culinary tourism in Bali, especially traditional Balinese food. The condition of the COVID 19 pandemic requires culinary providers to follow the new era health protocol order so that hygiene and health problems can be handled properly, including other indicators as findings in this study to be regulated so that their quality can be improved.

The findings of the tourist loyalty model for traditional food by tourists can be used as a reference in other research. Subsequent research can apply the tourist loyalty model of consuming traditional food to other tourist destinations, and future studies should differentiate between foreign tourists and domestic tourists because in COVID 19 pandemic, the domestic tourist market will be more promising than foreign tourists. The next research also should be suggested to be able to distribute questionnaires to respondents at airports and ports because it is the final moment for tourists when they return to their country, and as a continuation of this research needs to examine the effectiveness of digital promotion of traditional food in a destination using the storytelling variable.
References

Akademi Gastronomi Indonesia (AGI). (2016). *Triangle Concept of Indonesian Gastronomy*. Jakarta.

Akdag, G., Guler, O., Dalgic, A., Benli, S., & Cakici, A. C. (2018). Do Tourists' Gastronomic Experiences Differ Within The Same Geographical Region? A Comparative Study of Two Mediterranean Destination. *British Food Journal*, 120(1), 158-171.

Amaquandoh, F. E., & Adjei, R. A. (2013). Traditional Food Preferences of Tourists in Ghana. *British Food Journal*, 115(7), 987-1002. DOI: 10.1108/BFJ-11-2010-0197

Ardika, I. W., Suter, I. K., Wardi, I. N., Wiguna, I. G. N. T., Yusa, N. M., & Kurniawan, P. W. (2018). Kuliner Bali dalam Naskah Lontar Masyarakat Bali. *Swasta Nusas*, 2-3.

Bjork, P., & Raisanen, H. K. (2014). Culinary Gastronomic Tourism - a search for Local Food Experience. *Nutrition & Food Science*, 44(4), 294-309.

Bukharov, I., & Berezka, S. M. (2018). The Role of Tourist Gastronomy Experiences in Regional Tourism in Russia. *Worldwide Hospitality and Tourism Themes*, 10, 449-457. DOI: 10.1108/WHATTT-03-2018-0019. Coropus ID: 158530217

Chao, S. C. (2010). Exploration of local food selections in Lukang, Taiwan: Application of The Means-end Chain Theory (Doctor of Philosophy Dissertation). Texas Tech University, Texas.

Clemente, E. D., Mogollon, J. M. H., & Cerro, A. M. C. (2019). Food-based Experiences as Antecedents of Destination Loyalty. *British Food Journal*, 121(7), 1495-1507.

Cousins, J., Foskett, D., & Gillespie, C. (2002). *Food and Beverage Management*. Pearson Education Limited. England. Second Edition. 14-15.

Ha, J., & Jang, S. (2010). Effects of Service Quality and Food Quality: The Moderating role of atmospherics in an ethnic restaurant segment. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 29(3), 520-529.

Hendrayana, M. (2011). Strategi Pengembangan Makanan Tradisional Bali pada Hotel di Kawasan Samur (Tesis). Universitas Udayana. 16-17.

Hyun, S. S. (2010). *Predictors of Relationship Quality and Loyalty in the Chain Restaurant Industry*. Cornell Hospitality Quarterly.

Gregorash, B. J. (2018). Understanding Authenticity Within Gastronomic Experiences, Authenticity, and Tourism. *Tourism Science Series*, 24, 145-163.

Karim, A. B., & Qing, C. (2013). *Investigating The Structural Relationship Between Food Image, Food Satisfaction, Culinary Quality, and Behavioral Intentions: The Case of Malaysia*. International Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Administration. Taylor and Francis Group, LLC.

Mak, A. H. N., Lumbera, M., & Eves, A. (2011). *Globalization and Food Consumption in Tourism*. Annals of Tourism Research, (in press).

Margi, I. K., Ariani, R. P., Widiatini, N. M. A., & Suriani, N. M. (2013). Identifikasi Potensi Wisata Kuliner Berbasis Bahan Baku Lokal di Kabupaten Buleleng, Bali. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Humaniora*, 2(2).

Mossberg, L. (2008). Extraordinary Experiences Through Storytelling. *Scandinavian Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*, 8(3), 195-210. DOI: 10.1080/1502250802532443

Nadra, N. M., & Muni, N. G. S. (2016). Kuliner Bali Pelayan dan Tantangan. *Media Bina Ilmiah*, 10(3).

Narissan, K. (2019). *Persepsi Wisatawan Terhadap Pengembangan Kuliner Lokal Bali di Ubud Kabupaten Gianyar* (Disertasi) Universitas Udayana.

Okunas, B., Okunas, F., & McKercher, B. (2007). Incorporating Local and International Cuisines in The Marketing of Tourism Destinations: The Cases of Hongkong and Turkey. *Tourism Management*, 28(1), 253-261. DOI: 10.1016/j.tourman.2005.12.020

Pemerintah Daerah Provinsi Bali. (2012). *Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Bali Nomor 2 Tahun 2012 tentang Kepariwisataan Budaya Bali*. Pemerintah Daerah Provinsi Bali. (2012). *Peraturan Gubernur Bali Nomor 99 Tahun 2018 tentang Pemasaran dan Pemanfaatan Produk Pertanian, Perikanan dan Industri Lokal Bali*. Pamer.

Pliner, P., & Sahvy, S. J. (2006). Food Neophobia in Humans. In R. Shepherd and M. Raats(Eds.), *The Psychology of Food Choice* (pp. 75-92). Oxfordshire: CAB.

Pitanatri, P. D. S. (2016). Inovasi dalam Kompetisi: Usaha Kuliner Lokal Menciptakan Keunggulan Kompetitif di Ubud. *Jurnal Master Pariwisata (JUMPMA)*, 3(1), 1-14.

Pitanatri, P. D. S., & Putra, I. N. D. (2016). *Wisata Kuliner: Atribut Baru Destinasi Ubud*. Jagat Press. Bekerjasama dengan Program Studi Magister Kajian Pariwisata Universitas Udayana, Denpasar.

Putra, I. N. D., Raka, A. A. G., Yanthi, P. S., Aryanti, N. N. S., & Pitanatri, P. D. S. (2018). *Wisata Gastronomi Ubud-Gianyar*. Dinas Kabupaten Gianyar.

Putra, I. N. D. (2014). Empat Srikandi Kuliner Bali: Peran Perempuan Dalam Pembangunan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan. *Jurnal Master Pariwisata (Journal Master in Tourism Studies)*, 1(1), 65-94.

Putri, I. A. T. E., Sulistiyawati, A. S., Suarka, F. M., & Ariani, N. M. (2013). Pengembangan Makanan Khas Bali sebagai Wisata Kuliner (Culinary Tourism) Di Desa Sebatu Kecamatan Tegallalang Gianyar. *Udajana Mengabdi*, 12(1), 10-12.

Raajpoot, N. A. (2002). *TANGSERV*. *Journal of Foodservice Business Research*, 5(2), 109-127. Doi: 10.1300/J369v05n02_08

Ryan, C. (2002). *The Tourist Experience: A New Introduction*. Second Edition, New York: Cassell.

Wijaya, S. (2014). *Culinary Tourism in Indonesia: The Dining Experiences of International Visitors* (Dissertation). Victoria University, Australia.

Medina, V. M. J., & Cruz, F. G. S. (2019). Gastronomic...
Experiences of Foreign Tourists in Developing Countries.
*Heliyon*, 5, 1-8.

Sirtha, N. (1998). *Aspek Budaya Makanan Tradisional Bali dalam menunjang Program Pariwisata Dalam Dinamika Kebudayaan*. Denpasar. Lembaga Penelitian Universitas Udayana Denpasar.

Sukerti, N. W., Marsiti, C. I., & Suriyani, N. M. (2016). *Inventarisasi Makanan Tradisional Buleleng sebagai Upaya Pelestarian Seni Kuliner Bali*. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Humaniora*, 5(1).

UNWTO. (2012). *Global Report on Food Tourism*. Madrid. United Nation World Tourism Organization Press, l(4), 68.

Wijaya, S. (2014). *Encounters with Local Food: The Culinary Experiences of International Visitors in Indonesia* (Doctor Philosophy Dissertation). College of Business, Victoria University, Melbourne, Australia. pp. 73-86.

Yusa, N. M., & Suter, I. K. (2013). *Kajian Pangan Tradisional Bali dalam Rangka Pengembangan Menjadi Produk Unggulan di Kabupaten Gianyar*. Hibah Unggulan Perguruan Tinggi Universitas Udayana.

Zang, T., Chen, J., & Hu, B. (2019). Authenticity, Quality, and Loyalty: Local Food and Sustainable Tourism Experience. *The Special Issue Sustainable Food and Wine Tourism*. *Sustainability* 2019, 11(12), 34-37.

Zhong, Y., & Moon, H. C. (2020). What Drives Customer Satisfaction, Loyalty, and Happiness in Fast-Food Restaurants in China? Perceived Price, Service Quality, Food Quality, Physical Environment Quality, and The Moderating Role of Gender. *Foods*, 9(4), 460. DOI:10.3390/foods9040