Filamentary TaO$_x$/HfO$_2$ ReRAM Devices for Neural Networks Training with Analog In-Memory Computing

Tommaso Stecconi,* Roberto Guido, Luca Berchialla, Antonio La Porta, Jonas Weiss, Youri Popoff, Mattia Halter, Marilyne Sousa, Folkert Horst, Diana Dávila, Ute Drechsler, Regina Dittmann, Bert Jan Offrein, and Valeria Bragaglia

The in-memory computing paradigm aims at overcoming the intrinsic inefficiencies of Von-Neumann computers by reducing the data-transport per arithmetic operation. Crossbar arrays of multilevel memristive devices enable efficient calculations of matrix-vector-multiplications, an operation extensively called on in artificial intelligence (AI) tasks. Resistive random-access memories (ReRAMs) are promising candidate devices for such applications. However, they generally exhibit large stochasticity and device-to-device variability. The integration of a sub-stoichiometric metal-oxide within the ReRAM stack can improve the resistive switching graduality and stochasticity. To this purpose, a conductive TaO$_x$ layer is developed and stacked on HfO$_2$ between TiN electrodes, to create a complementary metal-oxide-semiconductor-compatible ReRAM structure. This device shows accumulative conductance updates in both directions, as required for training neural networks. Moreover, by reducing the TaO$_x$ thickness and by increasing its resistivity, the device resistive states increase, as required for reduced power consumption. An electric field-driven TaO$_x$ oxidation/reduction is responsible for the ReRAM switching. To demonstrate the potential of the optimized TaO$_x$/HfO$_2$ devices, the training of a fully-connected neural network on the Modified National Institute of Standards and Technology database dataset is simulated and benchmarked against a full precision digital implementation.

1. Introduction

The volume of data created by modern society grows rapidly, driven by the increase of digitalization across a wide range of business and consumer applications.[1,2] Artificial Intelligence (AI) exploits large datasets to learn how to solve a broad variety of tasks such as text/image recognition, data clustering, equity pricing, and many others.[3] However, computers based on the Von-Neumann architecture are inefficient in the execution of modern AI workloads, and the required power becomes unsustainable due to the growing volume of data involved.

The bottleneck for performance derives from the memory wall. The bandwidth of processors has grown faster than the memory one, with the difference between them diverging exponentially.[4] The energetic inefficiency originates to a large extent from energy-hungry accessing of off-chip memory.[5] With the end of Moore’s law approaching[6] and the rise of AI, the quest for alternative computing paradigms has intensified.

In-memory computing has emerged as a promising hardware architecture for data-centric applications. It consists of memory cells interconnected in a specific design to locally execute logic or arithmetical operations.[7] The crossbar array is an example of an in-memory computing architecture that raised a strong interest in the electron devices community. In this architecture, the memory elements are positioned at the crosspoint between bitlines and wordlines,[8] as depicted in Figure 1a. When a vector of read voltages ($V$) is applied on the array elements, the currents ($I$) establishing at

DOI: 10.1002/aelm.202200448
the bitlines are proportional to the array elements' conductances ($G$), resulting in a matrix-vector multiplication (MVM), as dictated by Ohm's and Kirchoff's law.\[9,10\]

In-memory computing with crossbar arrays shifts the computing paradigm, from digital implementation, conventionally given by blocks of digital adders,\[11\] to the analog domain. This can be particularly beneficial for the inference and training of artificial neural networks (ANNs), as the synaptic operations can be directly mapped into the crossbar array functionality. Since the algorithms developed for inference and training of ANNs extensively use MVM operations,\[3\] the performance and efficiency advantage of analog signal processing in crossbar arrays is based on a more favorable scaling of the computing effort with increasing number of neurons involved, and correspondingly reduced memory access.

First the demonstrators of learning tasks were realized with passive arrays\[12\] (Figure 1a). Nevertheless, energy efficient and accurate programming of the single cells is limited in passive arrays by the current "sneakpaths", especially for large arrays. By integrating a series transistor, defining 1-transistor 1-resistor (1T1R) array cells (Figure 1b), ANNs with larger arrays can be implemented to perform more complex character/image recognition tasks.\[13,14\]

Crosspoint devices must provide a tunable $G$ for ANNs training. Memristors are electrical elements recently developed,\[15\] providing pinched current-voltage ($I$–$V$) hysteretic characteristics.\[16,17\] This property reflects into a tunable $G$ upon electrical stimuli, where the addressed $G$ remains over time, representing a multilevel non-volatile memory.

Among a wide range of available memristor technologies, the two-terminal phase change memory (PCM) and resistive random-access memory (ReRAM) have raised vivid interest. Both can be integrated in dense arrays, are scalable, support fast write/read operations, multi-level cell (MLC) programming, low-power operations, have high-endurance, and are CMOS compatible.\[14,18–20\] PCMs are characterized by $G$ updates with accumulative behavior only in the direction of lower resistances,\[21\] making them well-suited for ANNs inference applications. For the training of neural networks, where, instead, granular monotonic $G$ updates are required in both directions,\[22\] ReRAM-based synapses are potentially more suited.\[13\]

1.1. From the Metal–Insulator–Metal to the Oxide Bilayer ReRAM

The conventional ReRAM structure is a metal–insulator–metal (MIM) stack, typically a transition metal oxide (TMO) encapsulated between an inert electrode (IE)\[21\] and a reactive one (RE). In this technology, the application of a sufficiently large electric field generates anion ($O^{2-}$) migration, forming a conductive filament of oxygen vacancies ($V_o$) in the Kröger–Vink notation.\[24,25\] This process is known as the forming. The subsequent resistive switching operations are determined by the modulation of the $V_o$ density profile in the TMO.\[23\]

The selection of the electrodes and TMO materials is of fundamental importance for these processes as they determine the energy of formation of the oxygen vacancies.\[26\] This directly

---

**Figure 1.** a,b) Circuit schematics of a passive and of a 1T1R crossbar array, respectively. c) Reset process, involving the depletion of $V_o$ from a filament region next to a TMO/electrode interface. At $V = V_{\text{reset}}$, the voltage divider on the depleted region increases as long as its equivalent resistance $R_{\text{switch}}$ dynamically increases, resulting in an abrupt reset. d) Set process, determined by the growth of the $V_o$ density in the formerly depleted filament region. The device resistance drops abruptly, until the voltage divider on the ESR becomes relevant.
 impacts the electrical performances of the device, such as the forming voltage, the on/off ratio and the writing reliability.[27] Moreover, the electrodes’ oxygen affinity, the electrodes’ work functions (WFs) and the voltage polarity of the forming process can influence the switching polarity.[28] 

In filamentary MIM devices, the switching process in the direction of higher resistances, the reset, is generally a gradual process, where the device resistance increases upon increasing the applied voltages.[29] Vice versa, the switching process in the direction of lower resistances, the set, is a self-accelerated[29] process, where the device resistance drops abruptly. The asymmetry between the set and the reset does not fit the requirements indicated for the training of memristor-based synapses.[22] However, in the next lines we explain how to improve the switching symmetry, by exploiting dedicated resistive regimes where the self-acceleration of the set is relaxed and the onset of the reset is accelerated.

We can assume the device to be represented by an equivalent circuit of two resistances in series, as depicted in Figure 1c.d. One resistance represents the switching region (Rswitch) of the device; the other one represents the passive equivalent series resistor (ESR) of the device, made of the electrodes’ contacts and a portion of the filament remaining unchanged upon switching, named filament “plug”. [30]

The acceleration of the reset occurs when Rswitch and ESR are comparable. In this case, while Rswitch increases, the voltage divider between Rswitch and ESR changes, with the voltage drop on Rswitch increasing and the voltage drop on ESR decreasing. This positive-feedback process ends when the voltage drop on Rswitch becomes negligible compared to the one on Rswitch. This phenomenon, described in Figure 1c, determines a sharp reset onset.

On the other hand, during the set, Rswitch decreases abruptly approaching the ESR value. When the voltage drop on Rswitch is more negligible compared to Rswitch, the decrease of Rswitch consequently reflects into an increase of the voltage drop on ESR and a decrease of the voltage drop on Rswitch. This phenomenon, described in Figure 1d, determines a gradual continuation of the set, after the initial abrupt onset.

The integration of a sub-stoichiometric oxide within the MIM-ReRAM stack, to create an oxide bilayer, can increase the ESR value, improving the symmetry between set and reset. In Hardtegen et al.[31] a HfO2-MIM ReRAM is compared to a TiOx/HfOx bilayer ReRAM. The forming generates a conductive filament across the whole bilayer. The portion of the filament in the TiOx gives an additional contribution to the ESR, compared to the other device. The increase of the ESR value enhances the mechanisms described in Figure 1c,d, leading to a more gradual set and a more abrupt reset.[31] By operating at intermediate resistive states, where the set acceleration is attenuated and the reset remains a gradual process, the bilayer shows bidirectional gradual resistive switching.[32] However, there is a trade-off against the available resistive window.

In Woo et al.[33] the improved switching symmetry and gradually observed in a TiOx/HfOx bilayer ReRAM are attributed to the different mobility of the Vs in the two metal-oxides, which allow to electrically modulate the width of the conductive filament in both directions, avoiding the formation of a highly resistive filament gap.

The presence of an additional metal-oxide in the device stack, making the ReRAM an oxide bilayer, can also improve the stability of the resistive states,[33] the endurance,[34] the reliability,[27,35] and the switching stochasticity,[27] by acting at the origin of the electronic-ionic mechanisms responsible for resistive switching.[34]

A potential disadvantage introduced by the oxide bilayer concept is the increase of the forming voltages, determined by the series of two insulating materials. To reduce this effect, while keeping the improved symmetry introduced by the bilayer concept, a conductive metal-oxide (CMO) can be stacked onto the insulating TMO. With this solution, the voltage applied during the forming mainly drops on the CMO. On the other hand, if the resistivity of the CMO is higher than the resistivity of a metallic electrode, the device ESR increases with a positive impact toward the suppression of the set self-acceleration, as modeled in Zhao et al.[37]

In Wu at al.[38] the graduality of the set in the CMO/TMO bilayer is explained by a different effect. The heat confinement determined by the low thermal conductivity of the CMO leads to the formation of multiple weak filaments in the TMO. Each weak filament partially contributes to the total switching of the device, resulting in a gradual process.

Differently from previous works where gradual bidirectional switching is observed in cells of HfO2-based bilayer devices with fixed stack materials [AlOx/HfO2 in Woo et al.,[33] TaOx/HfO2 in Yoo et al.,[35] and Kim et al.,[39] TiOx/HfO2 in Cuppers et al.[35,39], here we present a solution to further optimize the analog response of the device, toward an increased number of multilevel states and reduced power consumption. Through a material engineering work, we studied the impact of the electrodes’ work functions and of the conductive-metal-oxide’ thickness and resistivity on the electrical response of the device. This investigation led us to understand the origin of the anomalous analog set property and to optimize the device’ accumulative pulse response. We also verified the independence of the resistive states from the scaling of the cell area, to strengthen the hypothesis of filamentary-based switching.

By reactive sputtering, it is possible to deposit various sub-stoichiometric TaOx films,[40,41] corresponding to different resistivities. Such layers can be exploited to experimentally determine how different CMO resistivities impact the device switching properties.

First, we will describe the TaOx materials development and structural characterization. Then, we present and discuss the electrical characteristics of a device made of the TaOx/HfO2 bilayer, sandwiched between TiN electrodes, to create a CMOS-compatible ReRAM. A Ti/HfO2/TiN baseline device was fabricated to benchmark the upgraded switching properties exhibited by the oxide bilayer.[39] To investigate the impact of the electrodes’ WFs on the device switching properties, we fabricated a new oxide bilayer with a Pt bottom electrode (BE), instead of TiN. Guided by the observations collected from a step-by-step electrical characterization (forming, first set, first reset), we propose a microscopical interpretation of the resistive switching mechanisms, valid for both the oxide bilayers with a Pt BE and with a TiN BE.

To improve the device power consumption, reduce weight update noise and improve potentiation/depression symmetry, we optimized the TaOx material by tuning its thickness and resistivity. Finally, we extracted the analog device model best
fitting the optimized TaOₓ/HfO₂ ReRAM pulse response. Using this model, we simulated the training of a fully-connected neural network of analog devices on the modified National Institute of Standards and Technology database (MNIST) dataset.

2. Material Development

To find the sputtering conditions for depositing a conductive TaOₓ, we realized several TaOₓ films for structural characterization. All these films were deposited onto HfO₂/TiN substrates, to enforce the same growth conditions as in the ReRAM devices. The sputtering chamber conditions, such as power, duration, and (O₂, Ar) mixture stream were kept fixed in all the depositions (see “Experimental Section” for details). The chamber pressure was varied from 6–11 µbar, in steps of 1 µbar between samples.

Grazing incidence X-ray diffraction (GIXRD) characterization provides information about the structure and the stoichiometry of the deposited suboxides. The GIXRD profiles of the TaOₓ/HfO₂/TiN stacks, obtained by scanning at an incidence angle of 0.65°, are shown in Figure 2a. The peak at 42.5° is characteristic for the (200) TiN. The broad TaOₓ peaks are shaped by the superposition of multiple contributions: in the figure we indicated only the crystallographic peaks accounting for more than 30% of the intensity. Their deconvolution (reported in Figure S1, Supporting Information) reveals the coexistence of multiple stoichiometries of TaOₓ and the Ta metal, indicating that the grown material does not have a unique composition, but rather is a complex phase.

With increasing sputtering pressures, a clear change in the broad TaOₓ peak shape is identified, due to the change of the relative intensity of the contributing peaks: the oxidized components increase, at the expenses of the pure Ta one. These findings indicate that more oxygen is incorporated in the Ta lattice when sputtering at higher pressures.

We extracted the film thicknesses and densities from X-ray reflectivity (XRR) measurements (see Figure S3, Supporting Information, for details) and summarized their values in Figure 2b. The deposition rate is constant at ≈0.15 nm s⁻¹ for all the depositions, except for a chamber pressure of 11 µbar, where it falls to ≈0.03 nm s⁻¹. The fit of the XRR scans revealed the formation of a ≈2 nm thick TaOₓ interface layer at the boundary with the HfO₂, with lower density than the bulk TaOₓ. For increasing chamber pressures, the bulk TaOₓ density gradually decreases from 11.6 g cm⁻³ at 6 µbar, to 10.7 g cm⁻³ at 10 µbar, and 9.9 g cm⁻³ at 11 µbar.

The characterization of the films’ resistivity was performed by circular transmission line measurements (CTLM). We extracted the film thicknesses and densities from X-ray reflectivity (XRR) measurements (see Figure S3, Supporting Information, for details) and summarized their values in Figure 2b. The measured sheet resistances (Ω □⁻¹) are reported as function of the chamber pressure in Figure 2b. The deposition rate is constant at ≈0.15 nm s⁻¹ for all the depositions, except for a chamber pressure of 11 µbar, where it falls to ≈0.03 nm s⁻¹. The fit of the XRR scans revealed the formation of a ≈2 nm thick TaOₓ interface layer at the boundary with the HfO₂, with lower density than the bulk TaOₓ. For increasing chamber pressures, the bulk TaOₓ density gradually decreases from 11.6 g cm⁻³ at 6 µbar, to 10.7 g cm⁻³ at 10 µbar, and 9.9 g cm⁻³ at 11 µbar.

The characterization of the films’ resistivity was performed by circular transmission line measurements (CTLM). We extracted the film thicknesses and densities from X-ray reflectivity (XRR) measurements (see Figure S3, Supporting Information, for details) and summarized their values in Figure 2b. The measured sheet resistances (Ω □⁻¹) are reported as function of the chamber pressure in Figure 2b. The materials resistive window spans over more than one order of magnitude, from a few kΩ □⁻¹ up to values larger than 100 kΩ □⁻¹.

We converted the sheet resistances into resistivities (ρ) and report the values in Figure 2b. For the film deposited at 11 µbar...
it was not possible to quantify the resistivity, because the measured sheet resistance exceeded the tool maximum measurable limit of ≈10 GΩ.\[46\]

The characterization of the material stack was complemented by transmission electron microscopy (TEM) analysis of a pristine TiN/TaO\(_x\)/HfO\(_2\)/TiN ReRAM with a ≈20 nm thick TaO\(_x\) film deposited at 9 µbar.

Figure 3a shows the scanning-TEM (STEM) image of a device in bright field (BF) mode. The contrast is sufficient to identify a thin, dense, amorphous layer at the TaO\(_x\)/HfO\(_2\) interface. Its thickness is estimated to be ≈3 nm. Also, at the HfO\(_x\) bottom interface with TiN, a thin oxidized TiO\(_x\) film grows, where a thickness of ≈1.5 nm can be recognized. The oxidation of the TiN surface is attributed to the deposition of HfO\(_2\), which takes place in an O\(_2\) plasma atmosphere at 290 °C.\[46\]

Figure 3b shows the energy-dispersive spectroscopy (EDS) analysis performed by scanning from the bottom to the top TiN to study the composition across the full stack. This analysis confirms the presence of a more oxidized TaO\(_x\) phase below the crystalline TaO\(_x\) bulk, as the Ta counts in the material decrease, while the O\(_2\) counts keep constant. The pillar growth of the TiN is believed to be responsible for the projection of the TiN roughness to the morphology of the rest of the stack, causing an overlap of the Hf and Ta counts at the TaO\(_x\)/HfO\(_2\) interface, and of the Hf and Ti counts at the HfO\(_2\)/TiN interface. Moreover, interdiffusion cannot be excluded.

Please note that during the scanning TEM (STEM) acquisitions we could not acquire sufficiently high-resolution images to classify the crystallinity properties of the bulk TaO\(_x\). This limitation was caused by the small size of the grains identified (<6 nm, as reported in Figure S4, Supporting Information).

3. Electrical characterization

3.1. DC I–V Characteristics of the Oxide Bilayer ReRAM

In this section we present the DC I–V characteristics of a bilayer TiN/TaO\(_x\)/HfO\(_2\)/TiN ReRAM device. The thicknesses of the TaO\(_x\), HfO\(_2\), and TiN electrodes are ≈30, ≈6, and ≈20 nm, respectively. The resistivity of the TaO\(_x\) layer is \(\rho_{TaO_x} \approx 0.25\) Ω cm.

In parallel, we show the DC I–V characteristics of a baseline MIM stack, with the RE/TMO/IE structure, for comparison. Its structure is Ti/HfO\(_2\)/TiN, with a ≈10 nm thick Ti layer.

In Figure 4a,b we compare their DC I–V forming characteristics, obtained by applying a positive voltage sweep. They show substantial differences: at 2 V, a leakage current of 100 pA is measured in the bilayer device, while in the baseline structure it is as large as ≈800 nA, close to the critical values required for the onset of the forming (\(I_{forming} \approx 3\) µA). The forming voltage in the baseline device is ≈2.5 V, while in the bilayer configuration it can be as high as ≈5.5 V.

The higher pristine resistance of the bilayer structure can be explained by two main reasons. First, we know that even a pure Ta electrode would scavenge less O\(_2\) from the HfO\(_2\) layer, compared to a Ti one, due to their different oxygen affinities.\[27\] Moreover, it is likely that our conductive TaO\(_x\) has a poor scavenging effect on the HfO\(_2\) layer,\[47\] since it was already partially oxidized as deposited by the O\(_2\) plasma environment.

After the forming, the application of a negative voltage sweep generates opposite effects on the two ReRAM devices, as reported in Figure 4c,d: the baseline configuration shows a reset transition, the bilayer a set one.

The subsequent application of a positive voltage sweep resets the bilayer device back to higher resistances, while the same polarity sets the baseline device to lower resistances.

Another difference between them is about the onsets of the resistive switching mechanisms: while in the baseline most of the device conductance change occurs abruptly as soon as the physical conditions for switching are reached, in the bilayer it is a rather gradual process sustained by the increase of the applied voltages.

We repeated the same bipolar DC write/erase cycle five times on both samples. The corresponding I–V characteristics are displayed in Figure 4e,f. The baseline shows a certain variability of the \(V_{reset}\), which is attributed to the reset process stochasticity.\[48\] This is accompanied by a large variability of the programmed high resistive states (HRS). Contrarily, the bilayer
current curves almost overlap during cycling, resulting in an improved stability of the HRS.

Despite having improved the resistive switching graduality and stochasticity, the bilayer structure shows higher pristine resistances compared to the baseline stack, leading to a large increase of the $V_{\text{forming}}$ values. This effect hinders the device compatibility with the most advanced CMOS technologies. To address this point, future works will focus on the engineering of a sub-stoichiometric HfO$_x$ layer to reduce the $V_{\text{forming}}$, without compromising the analog and low-stochastic switching properties.

### 3.2. Interpretation of the Resistive Switching Mechanisms in the Oxide Bilayer ReRAM

In the filamentary ReRAM devices, the polarity of the resistive switching mechanisms depends, among other factors, on the WFs of the electrodes. Their role was investigated in the MIM structures made of an n-type TMO, encapsulated between a high and a low WF electrode. The high WF electrode/TMO interface can be modeled as a Schottky barrier, while the low WF electrode/TMO interface is a low-impedance Ohmic contact. In such a structure, after forming a conductive filament of $V_0$ across the HfO$_2$ layer, these defects can be either repelled from the TMO region next to the Schottky barrier, or accumulated there, depending on the applied voltage polarity. The local depletion of $V_0$ increases the device resistance, while their accumulation decreases it.

The WF asymmetry can also affect the on/off switching ratio and the reliability of the bipolar switching, with both properties degrading for low WF asymmetries.

To verify whether the WF asymmetry plays a role in the reverse switching polarity of our baseline and bilayer structures, we investigate this aspect in more detail. In the baseline device, there is a clear asymmetry between the Ti electrode ($WF_{\text{Ti}} \approx 4.33$ eV) and the TiN electrode ($WF_{\text{TiN}} \approx 4.7 - 4.9$ eV). For the bilayer device, we did not find in literature a reference WF value for our conductive TaO$_x$ layer. We found references for the Ta, whose WF can range from 4 to 4.8 eV, and for the Ta$_2$O$_5$ ($WF_{\text{TaO}_5} \approx 4.05$ eV). However, with such references we cannot claim with certainty the direction of the WF asymmetry in the bilayer stack, which would rather require dedicated measurements.

We decided to test our hypothesis with an alternative approach. We fabricated a bilayer device with a Pt BE, because Pt has the largest WF among metals ($WF_{\text{Pt}} \approx 5.65$ eV) and therefore mandatorily forces a WF asymmetry in the same direction as the one of the baseline. However, as displayed in Figure 5, the bilayer stack with the Pt BE shows the same switching polarity as the one of the TiN-BE bilayer device. We conclude that the reverse switching polarity between the bilayer and the baseline ReRAMs cannot be attributed to an inversion of the WF asymmetry.

As a next step, we will interpret the switching mechanisms based on the exhibited DC $I$–$V$ characteristics. In Figure 5, the forming, set, and reset operations are shown. For each process, we provide a tentative description of the microscopic mechanisms involved. As an example, Figure 5a shows the $I$–$V$ characteristics of the forming process and Figure 5b below depicts it at the nanoscale. The applied forming voltage generates a conductive filament of $V_0$ across the HfO$_2$ layer, by driving a migration of O$^2-$ anions toward the interface with the TaO$_x$. The abrupt increase of the current upon forming the filament...
induces a local high temperature increase, which, combined to Coulomb repulsion, make the O\(^{2-}\) diffuse radially.[29] A more oxidized region (TaO\(_{y>x}\)) is obtained, dominating the device resistance after forming. This is the post-forming resistance (R\(_{PF}\)), correspondent to the device HRS.

Now the device is formed and can be set to a low resistive state (LRS) upon the application of a negative voltage sweep, as shown in Figure 5c. We imposed a compliance of 100 \(\mu\)A to avoid that excessive currents could lead to very large resistance drops. In Figure 5d we depict the redox processes causing the decrease of the device resistance. Activated by the negative voltage applied, the O\(^{2-}\) formery diffused in the TaO\(_{y>x}\) region during the forming process migrate back to the HfO\(_2\) layer. Consequently, the volume of the O-rich TaO\(_y\) region shrinks, contributing to a decrease of the device resistance, while the \(V_s\) in the HfO\(_2\) filament recombine with the incoming O\(^{2-}\), contributing to an increase of the device resistance. Since we measure a drop of the total device resistance, among these two counteracting processes the reduction of the TaO\(_{y}\) dominates over the oxidation of the filament tip.

Subsequently, as shown in Figure 5e, upon the application of a positive voltage sweep, the device can reset to a HRS. In Figure 5f we describe the correspondent redox processes, where the O\(^{2-}\) migrating from the filament gap toward the TaO\(_{y}\) layer gradually oxidize it, while the filament gap gradually reduces, upon increasing voltage amplitudes. In this case, since we measure an increase of the device resistance, the dominant resistive switching process is given by the local oxidation of the TaO\(_{y}\).

Under these hypotheses, we conclude that after the forming process, the current bottleneck in the device is the TaO\(_{y}\) layer, both in the LRS and in the HRS, and not the filament in the HfO\(_2\).

The main difference observed between the Pt-BE and the TiN-BE bilayer devices is in the set mechanism, which is abrupt in the first case and gradual in the second. To explain this difference, we will first compare the voltage amplitudes required in the two samples to activate the set process and then we will discuss the role of the local electric field \((F)\) and temperature \((T)\) at the filament/TaO\(_{y}\) interface.

The bilayer stack with the Pt BE shows higher set voltages and higher R\(_{PF}\) values too compared to the TiN-BE one (R\(_{PF,Pt-BE}\) \(\approx\) 305 k\(\Omega\) and R\(_{PF,TiN-BE}\) \(\approx\) 99 k\(\Omega\), from Figures 5a and 4a; |V\(_{set,Pt-BE}\)| \(\approx\) 0.96 V and |V\(_{set,TiN-BE}\)| \(\approx\) 0.50 V, from Figures 5c and 4c). The requirement of higher voltages to activate the set mechanism when the devices are programmed in higher HRSs was already observed in MIM filamentary ReRAMs[29] and in bilayer structures too.[32] For the latter, it was also shown that the combination of higher HRSs and onset voltages makes the set process sharper.[12] In the next lines, we tentatively describe the physical origin for such phenomenon, based on the switching model derived for our bilayer structures.

While the set mechanism evolves (Figure 5d), the O-rich TaO\(_y\) region shrinks, but keeps the dominant contribution to the device resistance. Therefore, we can expect that most of the applied \(V_{set}\) will keep being distributed on the shrinking TaO\(_y\), hence leading to a local \(F\) enhancement. In parallel, the current increase leads to a \(T\) growth in the same TaO\(_y\) region, due to Joule heating. The \((F,T)\) enhancement promotes further O\(^{2-}\)-migration, which ultimately installs a positive \((F,T)\) feedback loop, resulting in an abrupt set process.[29]

A gradual set transition can be restored by relaxing the \((F,T)\) enhancement in the TaO\(_y\) region with the introduction of an external series resistor. Its effect is to reduce the power dissipated in the device during the circuit transients that follow the onset of the set process,[19] preventing the thermal runaway responsible for the abrupt switching.

The non-linearity of the HRS makes a 1 k\(\Omega\) series resistor sufficient for this purpose, without compromising the resistive

---

**Figure 5.** DC I–V characteristics of the TiN/TaO\(_y\)/HfO\(_2\)/Pt bilayer ReRAM, that is, the a) forming, c) first set, and e) first reset. Below, in b,d,f) the microscopical interpretation of these processes. g) The DC bipolar switching of the same bilayer stack, when a 1 k\(\Omega\) external series resistor is introduced. h) Resistive states extracted from (g).
switching window, as displayed in Figure 5g,h, where an on/off ratio of ≈ 1 order of magnitude is achieved by applying a maximum $V_{\text{stop}} = 1.4 \text{ V}$.

Differently from the filamentary-type devices, which generally show abrupt set mechanisms, the interface-type devices are characterized by a bidirectional gradual resistive switching, typically showing area-dependent resistive states. Therefore, to confirm the hypothesis of filamentary switching for our bilayer ReRAMs, we studied the area-dependency of their resistive states, including $(6 \mu \text{m})^2$, $(12 \mu \text{m})^2$, $(30 \mu \text{m})^2$, and $(60 \mu \text{m})^2$ devices in the statistics. For each area, we applied 10 bipolar voltage sweeps up to the stop values $-1.2 \text{ V}$ and $+1.6 \text{ V}$.

The median LRS and HRS were grouped in boxplot graphs and plotted against the device area, as shown in Figure 6. We observe that neither the HRS nor the LRS scale with the area. The fluctuations between the different cell areas can be attributed to the device-to-device variability and to the relatively small size of the collected statistics.

These results support the hypothesis that the switching mechanisms are filamentary based, even if they become gradual in both directions when a $1 \text{k}\Omega$ series resistor is introduced.

3.3. Impact of the $\text{TaO}_x$ Resistivity on the Switching Properties of the Oxide Bilayer ReRAM

To explore the role of the $\text{TaO}_x$ resistivity on the switching properties of the bilayer devices, we compare two ReRAM types fabricated using $\text{TaO}_x$ layers with resistivities of $\rho_{\text{TaO}_x} \approx 0.01 \Omega \text{ cm}$ and $\rho_{\text{TaO}_x} \approx 0.25 \Omega \text{ cm}$. In both cases, the $\text{TaO}_x$ film is ≈ 30 nm thick and the BE material is TiN.

In Figure 7a,b we compare their post-forming DC $I$–$V$ characteristics. Both devices similarly show low-stochastic, gradual bidirectional switching transitions, making the current curves almost overlapping over 20 subsequent cycles. Moreover, the switching processes require low voltages ($<1 \text{ V}$) to be activated.

The main difference between the two types of ReRAM is that only the device with the more resistive $\text{TaO}_x$ can reset to HRS values >10 $\text{k}\Omega$.

To validate this result from a statistical point of view, we measured 10 devices per each $\text{TaO}_x$ type, using the same stop voltages. In Figure 7c,d we compare the cumulative distributions
of their resistive states. Each device is represented by a pair of lines of the same color, one for the LRS and the other one for the HRS. The statistics confirms that the more resistive TaO$_x$ improves the HRS values beyond 10 k$\Omega$ and the on/off ratio too, which increases up to $\approx$ 10 orders of magnitude. However, the resistive states increase comes at the cost of a broader device-to-device variability (cumulative distributions more distanced), as well as a larger cycling variability (cumulative distributions more oblique).

The gradual resistive switching properties are enhanced at high bandwidth. In Figure 7e,f we compare the ReRAMs with different TaO$_x$ types by applying short programming pulses. In both cases the programming sequence consists in alternating 200 identical set and reset pulses. This sequence is iterated ten times to check the stability of the potentiation/depression characteristics. The duration and the amplitudes of the voltage pulses are selected to maximize the number of conductive states (NoS), which improves when G is updated in small steps, but covers a larger window too.

For the ReRAM with the low-resistive TaO$_x$, a pulse duration of 150 ns and pulse amplitudes of +1.25 V and −0.95 V were used for depression and potentiation, respectively. Instead, 400 ns pulses of amplitudes +1.30 V and −1.00 V were used for the ReRAM with the more resistive TaO$_x$.

The methodology used for determining the NoS is detailed in the Paragraph S6, Supporting Information. The device with the low-resistive TaO$_x$ layer has 13 and 9.5 average NoS for potentiation and depression, respectively. The other device has an average NoS of 9.5 and 11.2.

3.4. Impact of the TaO$_x$ Thickness on the Switching Properties of the Oxide Bilayer ReRAM

In previous studies, it was shown that in MIM ReRAMs with a RE/TMO/IE structure, the thickness of the RE affects the O$_2$ scavenging reactions at the interface with the TMO, impacting the device switching properties.[27,47,61,62] For RE thicknesses between 1 and 5 nm, the O$_2$ scavenging process is enhanced by greater thicknesses, causing a decrease of the forming voltages.[61,62] Instead, for REs thicker than 5 nm, the forming voltages stop decreasing, due to the saturation of the O$_2$ scavenging reactions.[61]

In this study, we fabricated three variations of TiN-BE bilayer devices, where we changed the TaO$_x$ thickness to understand its impact on the device switching properties. The thickness variations are $\approx$ 20, $\approx$ 50, and $\approx$ 60 nm of the highly resistive TaO$_x$ material ($\rho_{TaO_x} = 0.25$ $\Omega$ cm).

Figure 8d shows that for increasing TaO$_x$ thicknesses, the forming voltages do not decrease. Therefore, we conclude that the O$_2$ scavenging processes at the TaO$_x$/HfO$_2$ interface have similarly saturated in all the examined samples.

In Figure 8a–c, we compare their post-forming DC I–V characteristics. The 20 nm thick TaO$_x$ device exhibits gradual bidirectional resistive switching transitions, similarly to the one with a 30 nm thick TaO$_x$ layer, shown in Figure 7b. Vice versa, the device with the 50 nm thick TaO$_x$ displays an abrupt set transition, and the one with the 60 nm thick TaO$_x$ shows multiple abrupt set transitions. Moreover, we can highlight that the HRS values tend to decrease for increasing TaO$_x$ thicknesses.
To understand the origin of this latter trend, we first correlate the distributions of the HRSs to the $R_{pf}$ values, plotting them all against the TaO$_x$ thickness, as displayed in Figure 8e. We clearly observe that also the $R_{pf}$ values decrease for increasing TaO$_x$ thicknesses, indicating that the trend originates from the forming process itself.

To understand why thicker TaO$_x$ layers result into lower $R_{pf}$ values, we include in the discussion some additional considerations concerning the thermal properties of the TaO$_x$ layer and their impact on the forming process.

The thermal coefficient of a conductive TaO$_x$ film depends on its resistivity. Since our TaO$_x$ material is characterized by the resistivity $\rho_{TaO} \approx 0.25 \, \Omega \, \text{cm}$, we can assume a low thermal coefficient $\leq 1 \, \text{W m}^{-1} \text{K}^{-1}$. For this reason, in our devices, the TaO$_x$ acts as heat confinement layer.

The impact of this effect on the forming process becomes clear if we resume the nanoscale model depicted in Figure 5a. When the filament begins to form, the heat confinement effect induces high $T$ at the TaO$_x$/filament interface, promoting the ion mobility. This favors the O$^{2-}$ migration from the HfO$_2$ to the TaO$_x$ layer, enhancing the generation of conductive V$_x$ in the HfO$_2$ layer.

The high conductivity of the TaO$_x$ layer makes the voltage drop insufficient to sustain the vertical drift of the O$^{2-}$ in the TaO$_x$ layer too. Instead, the high $T$ generated upon forming the filament favors the lateral diffusion of the O$^{2-}$ in the TaO$_x$ layer.

Thicker thicknesses of the TaO$_x$ layer further enhance the heat confinement effect, due to the increasing distance between the hot TaO$_x$/filament interface and the thermally conductive TiN-TE. With higher $T$, the thermal diffusion is promoted, extending the highly oxidized TaO$_{x\text{ox}}$ region depicted in Figure 5b more laterally than vertically.

Since the device resistance is measured vertically, the formation of the filament and its lateral diffusion maintain a low $R_{pf}$ value. The enhanced heat confinement effect can also explain the origin of the sharper set mechanisms observed in the bilayer devices with thicker TaO$_x$ layers. The set process was modeled in Figure 5c as a redox reaction, where the reduction of the O-rich TaO$_{x\text{ox}}$ region dominates the device resistance change, over the oxidation of the filament tip. During this process, the evolution of the $T$ at the TaO$_x$/filament interface is critical for the switchinggraduality, as already discussed.

We conclude that the abrupt set transitions observed in the devices with 50 and 60 nm thick TaO$_x$ layers are driven by an enhanced heat confinement effect, overcoming the typical switchinggraduality observed in the devices with thinner TaO$_x$ layers.

A particular case is the ReRAM with the 60 nm thick TaO$_x$, characterized by multi-step abrupt set transitions, as displayed in the magnified corner of Figure 8c. This phenomenon could be attributed to the formation of multiple filaments, as explained by Wu et al.

### 3.5. The Oxide Bilayer ReRAM with the Optimal TaO$_x$

#### Material–Pulsed Characterization

The comparison between ReRAMs with different TaO$_x$ resistivities and thicknesses indicated that thicker and more resistive TaO$_x$ layers improve the device resistances and the gradual bidirectional switching properties, without degrading the forming voltages, nor the set and reset stop voltages.

In particular, the devices with a 20 nm thick TaO$_x$ layer and $\rho_{TaO} \approx 0.25 \, \Omega \, \text{cm}$ show high $R_{pf}$ values of $\approx 100 \, \text{k} \Omega$. However, we observed in Figure 8e that the DC operations degrade the HRS values by a factor $\approx 3 \times$ compared to the departing $R_{pf}$ values, due to the strong electrical stress induced by the first DC set voltage sweep.

To prevent it, we rather apply sub-µs programming pulses directly after the forming process is over. Figure 9a shows the potentiation/depression curves obtained from the application of 200 pulses of amplitudes $V_+ = -0.95 \, \text{V}$ and $V_- = +1.25 \, \text{V}$ per each duration and interval 250 ns. The sequence was iterated three times to check the states' stability over cycling.

While the potentiation trace is almost analog, the depression shows an initial abrupt jump, where the device resets close to the departing high resistances.

To get more balanced potentiation/depression characteristics, we reduced the amplitude of the reset pulses down to $V_- = +1.10 \, \text{V}$ and we shifted the operational regime of the device toward higher conductances. In Figure 9b we show ten subsequent potentiation/depression curves obtained using the modified pulse scheme with more balanced amplitudes for set and reset. The $G$ trace spans between 60 and 240 µS, defining a $G_{max}/G_{min}$ ratio $\approx 4$, and it nicely mimics a biological analog synapse, as displayed in Figure 9c.

---

**Figure 9.** Pulsed characterization of the bilayer ReRAMs with TiN BE, 20 nm thick TaO$_x$, and $\rho_{TaO} \approx 0.25 \, \Omega \, \text{cm}$. a,b) Potentiation/depression characteristics, obtained in two different conductive regimes and using different pulse shapes. c) Magnified potentiation and depression trace.
We can estimate the relative NoS as detailed in y Paragraph S6, Supporting Information. We get an average NoS of 14.5 and 21.3 for potentiation and depression, respectively.

4. Training Simulation of a Fully Connected Network of Analog Devices

In the long term, our goal is to exploit filamentary memristors to compute ANNs and other AI workloads. To validate our bilayer devices, we use the publicly accessible “IBM aihwkit”,[42] which allows to simulate our devices in real world applications. This simulation framework provides different device models, of which the “PowStepDevice” is the most suitable for the oxide bilayer, and which can be extracted from the measured potentiation/depression traces of Figure 9b. It provides a pulse-to-conductance response following a power-law. The model follows a series of update rules as shown in the following equations:

\[
\omega_i = \frac{w_{\text{max}} - w_{ij}}{w_{\text{max}} - w_{\text{min}}} \quad (1)
\]

\[
\Delta w_{\text{up}} = d w_{\text{min}} (1 + \beta) (\omega_i)^{y (1 - \beta)} \quad (2)
\]

\[
\Delta w_{\text{dn}} = -d w_{\text{min}} (1 - \beta) (1 - \omega_i)^{y (1 - \beta)} \quad (3)
\]

where \(w_{ij}\) is the weight to be updated, \(w_{\text{min}}\) (\(w_{\text{max}}\)) the lower (upper) bounds, \(d\)\(_{\text{min}}\) the linear update parameter, \(\beta\) its skew between the up/down directions, \(y\) the exponential update parameter and \(\beta_{\text{pow}}\) its skew between the up/down directions.

The individual measurement traces were averaged and then normalized to \((-1, +1)\). We employed a lmfit-based algorithm[66] to automatically fit our measurements to the aihwkit “PowStepDevice” model. The fit is depicted in Figure 10a.

As a test-vehicle for our real world validation, we selected the character recognition task on the MNIST dataset.[67] As an architecture, we selected a fully-connected four layer network with a 784 node input layer, two hidden layers with 200 and 64 nodes, respectively, and the output-layer with ten nodes. We trained the same architecture with the analog device model and, as a benchmark, using 32-bit floating point arithmetic.

The simulation keeps into account the measured cycle-to-cycle variability, but not the device-to-device variability yet.

Figure 10b shows a comparison between the training convergences of the analog and of the digital model, with a cross-entropy objective function.[68] The digital model converges faster to lower losses and shows a better accuracy (96%) compared to the one of the analog model (82%). This ≈15% drop in accuracy is not unexpected, since the analog device model itself already contains non-idealities in the weight update symmetry, linearity and minimum step size.[22]

To fully exploit the analog devices’ potential, it will be crucial to modify the standard training algorithms, based on stochastic gradient descent (SGD), taking into account the specific non-ideal properties of our analog devices. As an example, the Tiki-Taka algorithm[69] can achieve excellent accuracies even with non-symmetric devices.[69] Training simulations based on this algorithm will be presented in future works.

5. Conclusion

In this work we designed, fabricated, and optimized a CMOS-compatible electrical synapse for in-memory computing applications.

The integration of a conductive TaO\(_x\) within the ReRAM stack, which creates a TaO\(_x\)/HfO\(_2\) bilayer, improves the resistive switching stochasticity compared to a baseline ReRAM Ti/HfO\(_2\).

The new devices, despite having a filamentary-based physics, show anomalous but excellent gradual bidirectional resistive switching properties. Moreover, they can be programmed with fast (<200 ns) and low voltage (<1.5 V) pulses to cover an analog conductive window with a maximum-to-minimum ratio >4.

We found that thinner and more resistive TaO\(_x\) layers improve the device power consumption during its operations and the number of multilevel states.

To explain the peculiar resistive switching properties of our devices, in particular the reversed polarity compared to the baseline ReRAMs, we propose a microscopical interpretation of the forming, set and reset operations. We account for a localized O\(_2\)-exchange at the interface between the HfO\(_2\) and the TaO\(_x\). The redox reactions in the TaO\(_x\) layer are responsible for the device resistive switching.

![Figure 10](image-url) a) “PowStepDevice” fit of the ReRAM potentiation/depression characteristics, using lmfit. b) Training convergence of the MNIST dataset using the analog device model and the 32-bit floating point arithmetic. Their exponential decays are fitted with a red and a blue line, respectively.
To validate the performances in real world applications, we simulated the handwritten character recognition task with the MNIST dataset, using the IBM analog hardware acceleration kit (aihwkit). We found an accuracy drop compared to the benchmark model of only ≈15%, using SGD and backpropagation. More disruptive training algorithms such as Tikci-Taka[69] are expected to further compensate for the asymmetric properties of our devices and yield a performance comparable to the benchmark simulation.

Future work will focus on product-level integration of the bilayer ReRAM into the CMOS stack to better control the forming process. This solution is expected to reduce the current overshoots during resistive switching,[70] leading to higher resistance values and hence further reduced power consumptions.

Nonetheless, our TaOx/HfO2-based ReRAM already represents an attractive and flexible memory element for large-scale integration, considering its excellent granular switching properties and CMOS compatibility.

6. Experimental Section

Fabrication: The presented ReRAM devices were vertical, sharing a common bottom contact of n-doped Si. The 20 nm thick Pt BE was deposited by evaporation at room temperature; the 20 nm thick TiN BE was deposited by plasma-enhanced atomic layer deposition (PE-ALD) at 300 °C using a tetrakis-(dimethylamino)titanium (TDMAT) precursor and (N2, H2) plasma. The 6 nm thick HfO2 layer was deposited by PE-ALD at 290 °C using a tetrakis-(ethylmethylamino)hafnium (TEMAH) precursor and O2 plasma. In the bilayer devices, the controlled sputtering parameters for the deposition of the TaOx films were: DC power = 50 W; (O2, Ar) stream ratio = (1 sccm, 40 sccm); deposition time = 200 s to grow a ≈30 nm thick film. The TaOx thickness variations were realized by linearly changing the sputtering duration.

STEM and EDS were used to check the ≈20 nm thickness, XRR for the ≈50 nm one, and SEM for the ≈60 nm ones (see Figures S8 and S9, Supporting Information).

In the baseline, the 10 nm thick Ti capping of the HfO2 was DC sputtered. The 20 nm thick TiN TE was deposited by RF sputtering of a TiN target in a mixed (Ar, N2) plasma. A 50 nm W layer was sputtered on top. The sputtering of the W/TiN/TaOx (W/TiN/Ti in the baseline) proceeded without vacuum breaking between the deposition of the different layers, to avoid uncontrolled oxidation at the reactive interfaces. The patterning of the device geometry was performed through inductively coupled plasma etching of the W/TiN/TaOx (W/TiN/Ti in the baseline) stack, using a mixed CHF3 and SF6 plasma, which stopped at the HfO2 layer. A passivation layer of 100 nm thick SiN was grown by plasma-enhanced chemical vapor deposition (PECVD). The via to access the device TE was etched with a mixed CHF3 and O2 plasma by reactive-ion etching (RIE). 100 nm of W were sputtered and then RIE etched to define the device pads.

The described process flow avoids any lift-off steps, which could not be performed in foundries.

Structural Characterization: The X-ray characterization, which included the GIXRD and XRR scans, was performed using a Bruker D8 Discover diffractometer, equipped with a rotating anode generator. The lamella preparation for the TEM analysis was conducted with the FEI Helios NanoLab 450S focused ion beam. The TEM analysis was carried out with a double spherical aberration corrected JEOL ARM200F operated at 200 kV. The EDS scans were performed using a liquid-nitrogen-free silicon drift detector.

Electrical Characterization: The CTLM characterization of the TaOx layers and the DC characterization of the bilayer ReRAM with Pt BE were performed with a B1500 parameter analyzer. The DC characterization of the baseline and the bilayer with TiN BE was performed with an Agilent 4155C parameter analyzer.

To simulate DC conditions, the quasi-static measurements were performed by dividing the applied voltage sweeps into 100 equal steps, lasting 100 ms each. The read of the device resistive state was done by performing a voltage sweep up to ±250 mV and extracting the resistance at ±200 mV.

External series resistors were introduced by mounting an SMD resistor in series to the probe tip biasing the device pads. All the bilayer devices were formed with a 10 kΩ external series resistor, to reduce the power dissipated through them during the transients following the resistive switching and limit the steady state current.

The pulsed characterization was performed using a NI PXIe-5451 arbitrary waveform generator to source the generated pulses to the device TE, and an oscilloscope NI PXIe-5164 to read the current signal flowing through the device BE. The pulsed read scheme consisted of alternating a positive and a negative pulse with amplitudes of ±200 mV and a duration of 10 µs, to cancel out any eventual measurement offset.

Supporting Information

Supporting Information is available from the Wiley Online Library or from the author.

Acknowledgements

The authors acknowledge the Binnig and Rohrer Nanotechnology Center (BRNC) at IBM Research Europe - Zürich. The authors would like to thank Malte Rasch and Tayfun Golmen for technical discussions. The authors thank Linda Rudin for proofreading the manuscript. The authors acknowledge the insightful discussions with Jean Fompeyrine during the initial phase of the project. This work was funded by the European Union within the H2020 “MANIC” (grant ID: 861153), “MeM-Scales” (grant ID: 871371), “NExoRiC” (grant ID: 871330), “NEBULA” (grant ID: 871658) and “PlasmoniAC” (grant ID: 871391) projects.

Conflict of Interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Data Availability Statement

The data that support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

Keywords

analog memory, artificial synapses, HfO2, resistive random-access memory, TaOx

Received: May 18, 2022
Published online: July 10, 2022

[1] R. L. Villars, C. W. Olofson, M. Eastwood, Big data: what it is and why you should care, White Paper, IDC, MA, USA 2011.
[61] A. Kindsmuller, A. Schonhals, S. Menzel, R. Dittmann, R. Waser, D. J. Wouters, in NVMTS 2018- Non-Volatile Memory Technology Symposium 2018, IEEE, Piscataway, NJ 2019.

[62] Z. Fang, X. P. Wang, J. Sohn, B. B. Weng, Z. P. Zhang, Z. X. Chen, Y. Z. Tang, G. Q. Lo, J. Provine, S. S. Wong, H. S. Wong, D. L. Kwong, IEEE Electron Device Lett. 2014, 35, 912.

[63] C. D. Landon, R. H. Wilke, M. T. Brumbach, G. L. Brennecka, M. Blea-Kirby, J. F. Ihlefeld, M. J. Marinella, T. E. Beechem, Appl. Phys. Lett. 2015, 107, 02.

[64] D. C. Sekar, B. Bateman, U. Raghuram, S. Bowyer, Y. Bai, M. Calarrudo, P. Swab, J. Wu, S. Nguyen, N. Mishra, R. Meyer, M. Kellam, B. Haukness, C. Chevallier, H. Wu, H. Qian, F. Kreupl, G. Bronner, in Technical Digest - International Electron Devices Meeting (IEDM), IEEE, Piscataway, NJ 2015.

[65] D. B. Strukov, F. Alibart, R. Stanley Williams, Appl. Phys. A: Mater. Sci. Process. 2012, 107, 509.

[66] P. Virtanen, R. Gommers, T. E. Oliphant, M. Haberland, T. Reddy, D. Cournapeau, E. Burovski, P. Peterson, W. Weckesser, J. Bright, S. J. van der Walt, M. Brett, J. Wilson, K. J. Millman, N. Mayorov, A. R. J. Nelson, E. Jones, R. Kern, E. Larson, C. J. Carey, I. Polat, Y. Feng, E. W. Moore, J. VanderPlas, D. Laxalde, J. Perktold, R. Cimrman, I. Henriksen, E. A. Quintero, C. R. Harris, et al., Nat. Methods 2020, 17, 261.

[67] Y. LeCun, L. Bottou, Y. Bengio, P. Haffner, Proc. IEEE 1998, 86, 2278.

[68] Z. I. Botev, D. P. Kroese, R. Y. Rubinstein, P. L’Ecuyer, Handbook of Statistics, Vol. 31, Elsevier, New York 2013, pp. 35–59.

[69] T. Gokmen, W. Haensch, Front. Neurosci. 2020, 14, 103.

[70] S. Ambrogio, V. Milo, Z. Q. Wang, S. Balatti, D. Ielmini, IEEE Electron Device Lett. 2016, 37, 1268.