Heritability and Clinical Determinants of Serum Indoxyl Sulfate and \( p \)-Cresyl Sulfate, Candidate Biomarkers of the Human Microbiome Enterotype

Liesbeth Viaene\(^1\), Lutgarde Thijs\(^2\), Yu Jin\(^2\), Yanping Liu\(^2\), Yumei Gu\(^2\), Björn Meijers\(^1\), Kathleen Claes\(^1\), Jan Staessen\(^2\), Pieter Evenepoel\(^1\)*

\(^1\) Department of Medicine, Division of Nephrology, Dialysis and Renal Transplantation, University Hospital Leuven, Leuven, Belgium, \(^2\) Studies Coordinating Centre, Division of Hypertension and Cardiovascular Rehabilitation, Department of Cardiovascular Diseases, University of Leuven, Leuven, Belgium, \(^3\) Department of Epidemiology, Maastricht University, Maastricht, Netherlands

Abstract

**Background:** Indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate are unique microbial co-metabolites. Both co-metabolites have been involved in the pathogenesis of accelerated cardiovascular disease and renal disease progression. Available evidence suggests that indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate may be considered candidate biomarkers of the human enterotype and may help to explain the link between diet and cardiovascular disease burden.

**Objective and Design:** Information on clinical determinants and heritability of indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate serum is non-existing. To clarify this issue, the authors determined serum levels of indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate in 773 individuals, recruited in the frame of the Flemish Study on Environment, Genes and Health Outcomes (FLEMENGHO study).

**Results:** Serum levels of indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate amounted to 3.1 (2.4–4.3) and 13.0 (7.4–21.5) \( \mu \)M, respectively. Regression analysis identified renal function, age and sex as independent determinants of both co-metabolites. Both serum indoxyl sulfate (\( h^2 = 0.17 \)) and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate (\( h^2 = 0.18 \)) concentrations showed moderate but significant heritability after adjustment for covariables, with significant genetic and environmental correlations for both co-metabolites.

**Limitations:** Family studies cannot provide conclusive evidence for a genetic contribution, as confounding by shared environmental effects can never be excluded.

**Conclusions:** The heritability of indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate is moderate. Besides genetic host factors and environmental factors, also renal function, sex and age influence the serum levels of these co-metabolites.

Introduction

The human intestinal tract is colonized by hundreds of trillions of microbes, which collectively possess hundreds of times as many genes as coded for by the human genome. The combined genetic potential of the endogenous flora is referred to as the ‘microbiome’ [1]. The dissimilarity in gut bacterial composition between individuals is huge [2]. Recent findings demonstrate that the variation in the microbiome of individuals is not continuous, but stratified [3], indicating that one’s individual gut flora are not a randomly composed set of bacteria but one of several possible well-balanced ecosystems. The microbiome can be classified into just three broad “enterotypes” dominated by three different genera: *Bacteroides*, *Prevotella* and *Ruminococcus* [3].

It is increasingly recognized that the microbiome may affect health and disease of the host, e.g. by modulating the immune system, by harvesting energy from the breakdown of otherwise difficult to digest plant glycans, by synthesizing vitamins, by metabolizing xenobiotics or by exposing the host to potentially toxic metabolites [4]. Metabolites derived from the microbial community are referred to as co-metabolites. This metabolic phenotype provides a readout of the metabolic state of an individual and is the product of genetic and environmental (diet, lifestyle, gut microbial activity) contributions under a particular set of conditions [5]. Indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate are the sulfate conjugates of indole and \( p \)-cresol, which are end-products of bacterial protein fermentation of respectively tryptophan and tyrosine in the colon.
population study. The current study addresses these issues.

In vitro and ex vivo data show that indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate may trigger or accelerate cardiovascular disease and progression of kidney failure [14–19]. Clinical observational studies also relate high levels of both metabolites with overall progression of kidney failure [14–19].

To our knowledge, information on the clinical determinants and heritability of indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate serum concentrations does not exist in an unbiased randomly recruited population study. The current study addresses these issues.

Subjects and Methods

Study population

From August 1985 until November 1990, a random sample of the households living in a geographically defined area of Northern Belgium was invited, with the goal of recruiting equal numbers of participants in each of six subgroups defined by sex and age (20–39, 40–59, and ≥60 years) that would go through repeated examination cycles. The study population included 2,310 subjects. The participation rate among the subjects contacted was 66.1%. The random subsample for the present analysis included 818 subjects invited for a follow-up examination. Our study sample included 112 unrelated subjects and 661 subjects from 80 complex pedigrees with a median size of 5 individuals (range: 2 to 38) and encompassing 1 (n = 18 pedigrees), 2 (n = 43) or 3 (n = 17) generations. In 44 of these participants we did not have serum available for analysis. In addition, indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate were below the detection limit in 1 and 23 subjects respectively. The analyses therefore included 773 subjects for indoxyl sulfate and 751 subjects for p-cresyl sulfate. The Ethics Committee of the University of Leuven approved the protocol of FLEMENGHO (Flemish Study on Environment, Genes and Health Outcomes). All subjects gave informed written consent.

Measurements

Subjects were fasted for at least 6 hours. Trained nurses measured blood pressure and anthropometric characteristics. They administered a questionnaire to collect information about each subject’s medical history, smoking and drinking habits, and intake of medications. Each participant’s office blood pressure was the average of five consecutive readings. Elevated blood pressure was a systolic blood pressure above 140 mmHg and/or 90 mmHg diastolic or use of antihypertensive drug treatment. Body mass index (BMI) was weight in kilograms divided by the square of height in metres. Myocardial infarctions, stroke, transient ischemic attack, coronary bypass surgery, percutaneous angioplasty and peripheral arterial disease were enclosed in the evaluation of cardiovascular complications. Blood glucose, total, HDL and LDL cholesterol, triglycerides, and serum creatinine were also measured in all subjects by routine laboratory methods. Glomerular filtration rate was estimated using the Cockcroft-Gault formula and the creatinine clearance was calculated form 24 hour urinary collections. Serum total indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate were measured using high-performance liquid chromatography, as previously described [26].

Statistical methods

Statistical analyses were performed using SAS software version 9.2 (SAS Institute, Cary, NC, USA). A p-value of less than 0.05 was considered to be statistically significant. Continuous data are presented as mean ± standard deviation and categorical data as frequencies and percentages. Comparison between subjects according to quartiles of indoxyl sulfate or p-cresyl sulfate concentrations was performed by the large sample Z-test for continuous variables and the χ²-test for categorical variables. For determining upper limits of both toxins, all participants (in specified age groups) with a measured creatinine clearance >90 ml/min were considered for analysis and the 95th percentile was calculated. We searched for possible determinants of indoxyl sulfate or p-cresyl sulfate concentrations by a stepwise regression procedure with p-values for independent variables to enter and to stay in the models set at 0.15. To describe determinants of indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate, a stepwise regression model not taking into account family relationship was used to select covariates. Then, a mixed model with family included as a random effect and the covariates selected in the previous step entered as fixed effects was used to calculate the parameter estimates. To estimate heritability and to calculate the genetic and environmental correlations, we used Statistical Analysis for Genetic Epidemiology software (S.A.G.E. 2009) package. The maximum likelihood method as implemented in the ASSOC procedure of S.A.G.E. was applied. We estimated heritability by assuming multivariate normality after a simultaneously estimated power transformation. ASSOC uses a multiple linear regression model, in which the residual variance is partitioned into the sum of an additive polygenic component, a sibling component, a marital effect and an individual-specific random component. Heritability (h²) was estimated as the polygenic component divided by the total residual variance. The proportion of the variance explained by shared environmental effects was estimated as the marital component divided by the total variance.

Results

Characteristics of the participants

Characteristics of the participants are summarized in Table 1 and 2. Half of them were men. Mean age was 51.1 years. 20% of the study population smoked. Body mass index was 26.5 kg/m². Mean blood pressure was within the normal range. The
Determinants of serum indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate concentrations

Current smokers had significantly lower levels of both indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate, as had current drinkers. Diabetic patients were more likely to have higher indoxyl sulfate concentrations. Higher concentrations of indoxyl sulfate were associated with increased body mass index, systolic blood pressure, serum triglycerides and lower renal function (Table S1 and S2 in File S1). After adjustment for age, only higher serum triglycerides and systolic blood pressure were associated with higher indoxyl sulfate levels (Table 1). Higher \( p \)-cresyl sulfate concentrations were only associated with lower renal function after age adjustment (Table 2). As shown in Table 3, indoxyl sulfate was 7.2\% (95\% confidence interval [CI]: 0.1\%, 14.8\%) higher in men compared to women, 8.4\% (CI: 1.5\%, 14.7\%) lower in smokers than in non-smokers and 7.5\% (CI: 1.2\%, 13.4\%) lower in drinkers than in non-drinkers. In addition, indoxyl sulfate increased with 4.7\% (CI: −13.7\%, 27.2\%) from 40 to 60 years, with 16.2\% (CI: −3.5\%, 39.8\%) from 60 to 80 years, with 8.2\% (CI: 5.9\%, 10.6\%) for each 10 \( \mu \)mol/L increase in serum creatinine and with 7.9\% (CI: 3.4\%, 12.5\%) for a doubling in triglycerides. \( p \)-Cresyl sulfate on the other hand was 24.3\% (CI: 4.4\%, 48.0\%) higher in men than in women, increased with 36.0\% (CI: −15.7\%, 119.9\%) from 40 to 60 years and with 94.9\% (CI: 30.7\%, 190.8\%) from 60 to 80 years, decreased with 6.4\% (CI: 1.3\%, 11.3\%) per 10 mmHg increase in systolic blood pressure and increased with 12.9\% (CI: 6.7\%, 19.5\%) for each 10 \( \mu \)mol/L increase in serum creatinine.

Heritability analysis

Indoxyl sulfate (\( h^2 = 0.16 \)) as well as \( p \)-cresyl sulfate (\( h^2 = 0.24 \)) concentrations showed significant heritability, even after full adjustment for covariables (\( p = 0.02 \)) (Table 4). For comparison, the sex- and age-adjusted heritability was 0.81 for body height and 0.53 for body weight. As shown in Table S3 in File S1, the intraclass familial correlation coefficients were significant for \( p \)-cresyl sulfate and indoxyl sulfate in parent-offspring pairs living together only (Table S3 in File S1). However, it should be of note that the intraclass familial correlation coefficients were similar (\( p > 0.05 \)) amongst pairs living together and pairs living apart.

**Discussion**

The present study aimed to evaluate clinical determinants and heritability of indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate serum concentrations in a randomly selected cohort of white European population.

Serum levels of indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate reflect the balance between generation and elimination. Indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate both originate uniquely from colonic microbial metabolism. Indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate are the sulfate conjugates of indole and \( p \)-cresol, which are end-products of bacterial protein fermentation of respectively tryptophan and tyrosine in the colon [6,7]. A “Western” diet, rich in protein and low in dietary fiber, is associated with an increased generation of these co-metabolites [6,10,28], whereas a “Mediterranean” diet, characterized by a high consumption of fruit and vegetables, a high consumption of complex carbohydrates, a moderate consumption of fish, and a high consumption of olive oil, suppresses the generation of indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate [13,29,30]. Elimination of these co-metabolites occurs mainly through proximal renal tubular secretion mediated by organic anion transporters (OATs). As changes in the structure or function of the microbiome were shown to contribute to the pathogenesis of various diseases, we aimed to study the determinants of the co-metabolites indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate, which may accelerate cardiovascular disease and progression of kidney failure, in the general population.

![Figure 1. Distribution of indoxyl sulfate and \( p \)-cresyl sulfate.](doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0079682.g001)
Regression analysis identified renal function, age and sex as independent determinants of serum levels of both co-metabolites. The dependence of the serum concentrations of indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate on renal function is expected as both co-metabolites are well-known uremic retention molecules [31]. Moreover, recent evidence indicates that uremia per se may profoundly alter the composition of the gut microbiome [32]. In line with the latter, we observed increased generation of p-cresyl sulfate along the progression of chronic kidney disease [33].

The association between the serum concentrations of indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate and age is remarkable and intriguing and confirms previous observations in chronic kidney disease patients [23]. These observations support the hypothesis that aging goes along with a trend towards the Bacteroides enterotype and thus more prominent proteolytic fermentation and essentially concur with data from previous “classical” microbiology studies [34,35]. Whether these changes are related to a reduced immune function or whether they are due to concomitant changes in nutrition, gastrointestinal tract physiology, comorbidity and use of medication with advancing age remains to be established.

**Table 1.** Baseline characteristics by quartiles of indoxyl sulfate.

| Characteristics                          | <2.39 (n = 197) | 2.39–3.149 (n = 192) | 3.150–4.275 (n = 192) | >4.275 (n = 192) | P      |
|-----------------------------------------|----------------|----------------------|-----------------------|------------------|--------|
| Characteristic n (%)                    |                |                      |                       |                  |        |
| Men                                     | 100 (50.8)     | 86 (44.8)            | 88 (45.8)             | 110 (57.3)       | 0.206  |
| Hypertension                            | 67 (33.8)      | 77 (40.1)            | 77 (40.1)             | 97 (50.1)        | 0.01   |
| Antihypertensive drug intake            | 33 (16.8)      | 43 (22.4)            | 51 (26.6)             | 68 (35.4)        | <0.0001|
| Diabetes mellitus                       | 4 (2.0)        | 6 (3.1)              | 5 (2.6)               | 12 (6.3)         | 0.044  |
| Current smokers                         | 55 (27.9)      | 44 (22.9)            | 32 (16.7)             | 26 (13.5)        | 0.0002 |
| Current drinkers                        | 156 (79.2)     | 127 (66.1)           | 118 (61.5)            | 132 (68.8)       | 0.014  |
| History of CV disease                   | 14 (7.1)       | 18 (9.4)             | 16 (8.3)              | 24 (12.5)        | 0.106  |
| Age-adjusted characteristics            |                |                      |                       |                  |        |
| Body mass index, kg/m²                  | 26.2(0.30)     | 26.5(0.31)           | 26.6(0.30)            | 26.8(0.31)       | 0.507  |
| Systolic blood pressure, mmHg           | 129.7(1.04)    | 127.7(1.04)          | 128.4(1.04)           | 132.0(1.05)      | 0.023  |
| Diastolic blood pressure, mmHg          | 80.1(0.64)     | 78.9(0.65)           | 79.6(0.65)            | 81.1(0.65)       | 0.104  |
| Serum cholesterol, mmol/L               | 5.2(0.066)     | 5.2(0.066)           | 5.2(0.066)            | 5.4(0.067)       | 0.170  |
| Triglycerides, mmol/L                   | 1.7(0.076)     | 1.8(0.076)           | 1.8(0.076)            | 2.2(0.077)       | <0.0001|
| Serum creatinine, μmol/L                | 82.4(1.11)     | 81.6(1.11)           | 82.8(1.11)            | 90.3(1.12)       | <0.0001|
| Measured creatinine clearance, ml/sec/1.73m² | 1.7(0.041)   | 1.7(0.041)           | 1.8(0.041)            | 1.7(0.041)       | 0.852  |
| Calculated creatinine clearance, ml/min/1.73m² | 93.6(1.63)  | 94.9(1.64)           | 94.5(1.64)            | 90.9(1.65)       | 0.304  |

P-value for trend across the quartiles is given. Values are mean (SD) or number of participants (%) as appropriate.
Serum concentrations of indoxyl sulfate and $p$-cresyl sulfate were also found to be higher in men. Although this finding may reflect differences in the composition of gut microbiota between men and women, available evidence argues against this explanation [3]. Gender differences in intestinal absorption, metabolism and/or renal clearances could also be involved, but supporting evidence, at least in humans, is lacking so far.

Smoking and alcohol consumption were associated with lower indoxyl sulfate levels and $p$-cresyl sulfate, although for the latter, the association was lost in multivariable analyses. The mechanisms underlying these associations are unclear.

### Table 2. Baseline characteristics by quartiles of $p$-cresyl sulfate.

| Characteristics | <7.36 (n = 188) | 7.36–13.02 (n = 188) | 13.03–21.43 (n = 187) | >21.43 (n = 188) | $P$ |
|-----------------|-----------------|---------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|------|
| **Characteristics n (%)** |                 |                     |                       |                 |      |
| Men             | 101 (53.7)      | 91 (48.4)           | 92 (49.2)             | 91 (48.4)       | 0.35 |
| Hypertension    | 72 (38.6)       | 61 (32.3)           | 84 (44.9)             | 89 (47.3)       | 0.08 |
| Antihypertensive drug intake | 40 (21.3) | 30 (16.0) | 56 (29.9) | 60 (31.9) | 0.0012 |
| Diabetes mellitus | 6 (3.2) | 2 (1.1) | 9 (4.8) | 7 (3.7) | 0.35 |
| Current smokers | 44 (23.4)       | 48 (25.5)           | 37 (19.8)             | 23 (12.2)       | 0.0029 |
| Current drinkers | 135 (71.8)     | 138 (73.4)          | 135 (72.2)            | 109 (58.0)      | 0.0048 |
| History of CV disease | 16 (8.5) | 17 (9.0) | 13 (7.0) | 25 (13.3) | 0.20 |

**Age-adjusted characteristics**

| Characteristics | n = 188 | n = 188 | n = 187 | n = 188 | $P$ |
|-----------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|------|
| Body mass index, kg/m$^2$ | 26.6 (0.31) | 26.5 (0.31) | 26.6 (0.31) | 26.3 (0.32) | 0.749 |
| Systolic blood pressure, mmHg | 131.0 (1.07) | 128.4 (1.07) | 128.7 (1.06) | 129.5 (1.09) | 0.317 |
| Diastolic blood pressure, mmHg | 80.4 (0.67) | 79.7 (0.66) | 80.2 (0.66) | 79.5 (0.68) | 0.775 |
| Serum cholesterol, mmol/L | 5.2 (0.068) | 5.2 (0.067) | 5.3 (0.067) | 5.3 (0.069) | 0.960 |
| Triglycerides, mmol/L | 1.9 (0.079) | 1.8 (0.078) | 1.8 (0.078) | 1.9 (0.080) | 0.877 |
| Serum creatinine, $\mu$mol/L | 82.9 (1.16) | 82.7 (1.15) | 83.6 (1.15) | 88.3 (1.18) | 0.0019 |
| Measured creatinine clearance, ml/min/1.73m$^2$ | 1.78 (0.041) | 1.71 (0.041) | 1.78 (0.041) | 1.63 (0.042) | 0.041 |
| Calculated creatinine clearance, ml/min/1.73m$^2$ | 96.7 (1.66) | 94.4 (1.65) | 94.1 (1.65) | 88.5 (1.68) | 0.0062 |

The $P$-value for trend across the quartiles is given. Values are mean±SD or number of participants (%) as appropriate.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0079682.t002

### Table 3. Determinants of indoxyl sulfate and $p$-cresyl sulfate.

| Parameter estimates | Log Indoxyl sulfate | Log $p$-Cresyl sulfate |
|---------------------|---------------------|------------------------|
| N                   | 773                 | 751                    |
| Variance explained by pedigree | 0.054 | 0.046 |
| Variance explained by fixed effects | 0.153 | 0.069 |

The P-value for trend across the quartiles is given. Values are mean±SD or number of participants (%) as appropriate.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0079682.t003

First a stepwise regression model not taking into account family relationships was used to select the covariables. Then, a mixed model with family included as a random effect and the covariables selected in the previous step entered as fixed effects was used to calculate parameter estimates. The following variables were offered to the stepwise regression model: sex, age (linear and squared term), systolic and diastolic blood pressure, history of cardiovascular disease, antihypertensive drug intake, current smoking and alcohol intake, body mass index, diabetes mellitus, serum total cholesterol, triglycerides, serum creatinine and calculated creatinine clearance.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0079682.t003

$P<0.05; \text{**}P<0.01; \text{***}P<0.001; \text{‡}P<0.0001.$
populations. For example, a genetically homogenous population despite an identical underlying biologic mechanism across certain population-specific characteristics may influence estimation. Secondly, it also needs to be emphasized that within this statistical context, heritability not only refers to shared genes but also may refer to shared environmental effects (diet and/or microbes being similar in different subjects living together) can never be excluded, as suggested by the significant correlation between parent-offspring pairs living together (Table S3 in File S1). Our finding are consistent with the observation that family members tend to have more similar microbiot [42] [43]. Interestingly, the long term diet determines the microbial enterotypes. The Bacteroides enterotype was positively associated with animal protein and saturated fats, whereas the Prevotella enterotype was associated with a predominantly plant-based nutrition with high carbohydrates and low meat and dairy consumption [44]. To further study the influence of diet on the generation of indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate, modulation of the human microbiome enterotype by diet is a logical next step.

The results of the present study must be interpreted within the context of its limitations and strengths. The cross-sectional design precludes conclusions regarding causality of determinants of serum indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate levels. This study is the first to implement an appropriate analysis of the heritability of the presented examined 2 co-metabolites. Heritability analyzes the relative contributions of differences in genetic and non-genetic factors to the phenotypic variance in a population. The ASSOC method uses a multiple linear regression model, in which the residual variance is partitioned into the sum of an additive polygenic effect, a sibling effect, a marital effect and an individual-specific effect. Heritability, according to this method, is estimated as the polygenic component divided by the total variance. The heritability (h²) of the serum indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate levels in fully adjusted models was 17% and 18% respectively. These estimates of heritability are modest. For comparison, the total phenotypic correlation between body height and weight was 0.41. Second, it also needs to be emphasized that heritability is a population and situation-specific parameter. Certain population-specific characteristics may influence estimates of heritability obtained by variance component analysis, despite an identical underlying biologic mechanism across populations. For example, a genetically homogenous population will produce a lower estimate than a genetically heterogeneous population, while a population with a greater diversity of environmental factors will often produce a lower heritability than will one with a more homogeneous environment. The present study sample was recruited from a geographically defined area in northern Belgium. Thus, the genetic heterogeneity in our sample was probably lower than in more homogeneous environments. Thirdly, family studies can not provide conclusive evidence for a genetic contribution, as confounding by shared environmental effects (diet and/or microbes being similar in subjects living together) can never be excluded, as suggested by the significant correlation between parent-offspring pairs living together (Table S3 in File S1). Our finding are consistent with the observation that family members tend to have more similar microbiot [42] [43]. Interestingly, the long term diet determines the microbial enterotypes. The Bacteroides enterotype was positively associated with animal protein and saturated fats, whereas the Prevotella enterotype was associated with a predominantly plant-based nutrition with high carbohydrates and low meat and dairy consumption [44]. To further study the influence of diet on the generation of indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate, modulation of the human microbiome enterotype by diet is a logical next step.

The results of the present study must be interpreted within the context of its limitations and strengths. The cross-sectional design precludes conclusions regarding causality of determinants of serum indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate levels. The ASSOC procedure of SAGE is a validated statistical tool to estimate the heritability of a certain parameter in a population. No conclusive findings can be drawn for the individual person within the population. Extrapolation to other, geographically distinct populations also warrants caution. It also should be emphasized that within this statistical context, heritability not exclusively refers to shared genes but also may refer to shared environmental factors. Third, data on dietary intake were unfortunately lacking in the present cohort. As such, we cannot define to what extent diet modifies serum levels of PCS and IndS. Of note, recent data from a cross-sectional study in a cohort of healthy individuals and CKD patients (n = 195), revealed an inverse association between serum indoxyl sulfate levels and dietary fiber intake, independent of renal function [44]. We envisage that data from the heritability analysis together with these preliminary dietary data will foster epidemiological studies in nutritionally well-characterized cohorts as well as dietary intervention studies.

In summary, using a targeted approach, we demonstrated that the co-metabolites indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate exhibit moderate heritability. Besides genetic host factors and environ-

### Table 4. Heritability of indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate.

|                  | Unadjusted | Age-adjusted | Fully adjusted |
|------------------|------------|--------------|---------------|
|                  | h²         | p            | h²            | p            | h²            | p            |
| Indoxyl sulfate  | 0.20 ± 0.085 | 0.011         | 0.20 ± 0.084 | 0.010         | 0.16 ± 0.080 | 0.023         |
| p-Cresyl sulfate | 0.22 ± 0.085 | 0.005         | 0.23 ± 0.087 | 0.004         | 0.24 ± 0.119 | 0.024         |

Values are proportions ± standard error. Indoxyl sulfate and p-cresyl sulfate were log-transformed.

h², heritability.

1Adjusted for sex, age (linear and squared term), triglycerides, current smoking status, measured creatinine clearance and history of cardiovascular complications.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0079682.t004
mental factors, also renal function, sex and age influence the serum levels of these co-metabolites. Indoxyl sulfate and β-cresyl sulfate may be considered candidate biomarkers of the human microbiome enterotype and may help to explain the link between diet and cardiovascular disease burden. Additional studies are required to confirm these co-metabolites as biomarkers of the human Bacteroides enterotype. Whether indoxyl sulfate and β-cresyl sulfate can predict cardiovascular risk in the general population above and beyond traditional risk factors also requires further research.

References

1. Ley RE, Peterson DA, Gordon JI (2006) Ecological and evolutionary forces shaping microbial diversity in the human intestine. Cell 124: 837–848.
2. Gophna U, Zellmer K, Gophna S, Doolittle WF, Veldhuyzen van Zanten SJ (2006) Differences between tissue-associated intestinal microflora of patients with Crohn's disease and ulcerative colitis. J Clin Microbiol 44: 4136–4141.
3. Arumugam M, Raes J, Pelletier E, Le PD, Yamada T, et al. (2011) Enterotypes of the human gut microbiome. Nature 473: 174–180.
4. Turnbaugh PJ, Ley RE, Hamady M, Fraser-Liggett CM, Knight R, et al. (2007) The human microbiome project. Nature 449: 804–810.
5. Holmes E, Wilson ID, Nicholson JK (2008) Metabolic phenotyping in health and disease. Cell 134: 714–717.
6. Smith E, Macfarlane G (1996) Enumeration of human colonic bacteria and their availability and retention time on dissimilatory aromatic acid metabolism. J Appl Bact 81: 280–302.
7. Curtiss RC, Mettler M, Ettlinger L (1976) Study of the intestinal tyrosine metabolism using stable isotopes and gas chromatography-mass spectrometry. J Chromatogr 126: 369–380.
8. Wilkof SR, Anfara DV, Laut J, Schultz PG, Lesley SA, et al. (2009) Metabolomics analysis reveals large effects of gut microflora on mammalian blood metabolites. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 106: 3968–3973.
9. Aronov PA, Lao FJ, Plummer NS, Quan Z, Holmes S, et al. (2011) Colonic contribution to uremic solutes. J Am Soc Nephrol 22: 1769–1776.
10. Geypens B, Claus D, Everepoel P, Hele M, Maes B, et al. (1997) Influence of dietary protein supplements on the formation of bacterial metabolites in the colon. Gut 41: 70–76.
11. Francois IE, Lescroart O, Veraverbeke WS, Marzorati M, Possemiers S, et al. (2012) Effects of a wheat bran extract containing arabinoxylan oligosaccharides on gastrointestinal health parameters in healthy adult volunteers: a double-blind, randomised, placebo-controlled, cross-over trial. Br J Nutr 108: 2229–2242.
12. Windy K, de Preter, V, Lout J, Schuit FG, Herman J, et al. (2012) Modulation of protein fermentation does not affect fecal water content: a randomized cross-over study in healthy subjects. PLoS One 7: e52307.
13. Birken A, Mair J, Philipps J, Jones G, O'Dea K (1996) Resistant starch lowers fecal concentrations of ammonia and phenols in humans. Am J Clin Nutr 63: 766–772.
14. VC, Shivanna S, Martorell J, Balcells M, Bosch I, et al. (2013) Uremic serum p-cresol and indoxyl sulfate inhibit endothelial proliferation and wound repair. Am J Nephrol 39: 551–557.
15. Wang CP, Lu LF, Yu TH, Hung WC, Chiu CA, et al. (2010) Serum levels of total p-cresylsulphate are associated with angiographic coronary atherosclerosis severity in stable angina patients with early stage of renal failure. Atherosclerosis 213: 579–583.
16. 2011) Uremic serum sulfate can predict cardiovascular risk in the general population above and beyond traditional risk factors also requires further research. Supporting Information

File S1 File S1 contains 3 supplemental tables. (DOCX)

Author Contributions

Conceived and designed the experiments: JS PE. Performed the experiments: LV. Analyzed the data: LT LV. Contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools: VJ YP. YG LT. Wrote the paper: LV LT BM KC JS PE.