The aim of this paper is to explore how adolescents are shown in imagery derived from apocryphal writings.¹ To set this in context, first, it discusses approaches to interpreting adolescence, at a brief survey of legal issues and at areas of responsibility; third, it turns to pictorial representation and reviews how adolescence is depicted in contexts other than apocryphal ones, both biblical and historical. Finally, it focuses on a selection of imagery related to the Virgin, Christ, and their family from apocryphal stories not included in the canonical texts.

Anthropologists have often analysed adolescence as a period of preparation for adulthood, seeing it in adult terms, yet a more recent trend is to focus on the agency of youth and to assess the cultural practice of youth apart from its adult framework.² In a related way, in terms of viewing images, one can focus on the agency of the young and attempt to understand an image from the perspective of the children and adolescents depicted. Yet how should the terms child and adolescent be defined or used and how should the identification of a child or an adolescent be undertaken? The terms are applied in a broad sense to refer to those people who have not reached maturity, yet when does this occur and what conditions identify it? How are such stages in life depicted? Is it possible to visually distinguish a child from an adolescent or an adult, or to differentiate an adolescent from an adult? It is only generally with datable portraiture that one can calculate the age of the child or adolescent depicted and, in most cases, one is left to rely on inferred information to establish age. When some identification of adolescence is achieved then the image can be interpreted through an understanding of the historical setting, with the aim of focusing on the standpoint of youth.

Contemporary definitions of childhood and adulthood differ, geographically and in a range of contexts, and similarly classifications of stages in life in Byzantium appear to have fluctuated and to have had various readings. Present day distinctions

I would like to thank Despoina Ariantzi for inviting me to present this paper and kindly giving me access to her research on adolescence.

¹ I am accepting the common use of Apocryphal as those Early Christian writings not accepted into the canon of New Testament texts as compiled mid fourth century. For a definition, see J. K. Elliott, The Apocryphal New Testament: a collection of apocryphal Christian literature in an English translation. Oxford 1993, xi–xiii.
² See, for instance, M. Bucholtz, Youth and Cultural Practice. Annual Review of Anthropology 31 (2002) 525–552, here 525.
between maturity and immaturity are altered in certain legal and moral contexts, as well as societal ones. Society is comfortable with this multifaceted view, though it is often discussed, and childhood or adolescence is not perceived as a defined entity. In Byzantium, there are a range of terms used for those between childhood and adulthood. There is a tendency to think that we should be able to make hard and fast distinctions in historical cultures and yet in them we see the same variable use of terminology, regulations and expectations. In present culture, adolescence is often associated with a period of adjustment, alienation or rebellion, but there is no justification in necessarily transferring such associations to a historical setting. Adolescence should perhaps be seen as a period of physical, cognitive and societal change with a recognition that humans continue changing in all these ways, though perhaps less rapidly, throughout their lives.

Byzantine religious and secular law epitomised the manifold interpretations of maturity in children. Boys and girls were deemed to gain religious maturity at the age of ten, although this was not applied consistently, and it was only at the age of twelve that they had to confess before taking communion, implying perhaps that before then they were not responsible for their actions, although there were several variances on this rule. Byzantine law followed Roman in determining that puberty began at the age of fourteen for boys and twelve for girls, and at this time they could marry. Not strictly adhered to, however, children could be betrothed and married younger than this and at the age of seven they were deemed responsible to approve a prospective marriage. They remained minors until the age of twenty-five, subject to the authority of a legal guardian, unless released by special appeal.

3 For recent analysis on the terminology and understanding of adolescence in Byzantium, see D. ARIANTZI, Terminologische und sozialhistorische Untersuchungen zur Adoleszenz in Byzanz (6.–11. Jahrhundert). Tel I. Theorien, Konzepte narrative Quellen. JÖB 31 (2013) 1–31, with a summary of terms 30–31.

4 See ARIANTZI, Adoleszenz 14–28.

5 On this, see E. PATLAGEAN, L’enfant et son avenir dans la famille byzantine (IVe-XIIe siècles). Annales de démographie historique (1973) 85–93, here 88 [= Structure sociale, famille, chrétienté à Byzance IVe-Xle siècle (Variorums Reprints) London 1981, Nr. X]; on communion, see Nikolas Grammatikos (ed. V. GRUMEL, Les regestes des actes du patriarchat de Constantinople [Le patriarcat byzantin; série 1, Vol. 1, part 3, Les régestes de 1043 à 1206]. Paris 1947, no. 995, paragraph 10).

6 Codex Justinianus V. IV. 24 (dated 530) (eds. P. KRUEGER – T. MOMMSEN, Corpus iuris civilis: Institutiones, Digesta, Codex Justinianus, Novellae. 3 vols. Berlin 1928); Prochiron IV. 3 (ed. E. H. FRESHFIELD, A Manual of Eastern Roman Law: The Procheiros Nomos, Published by the Emperor Basil I at Constantinople, between 867 and 879 A.D. Cambridge 1928); some texts, such as Ecloga II. 1 state the ages as fifteen and thirteen (ed. E. H. FRESHFIELD, A Manual of Roman Law: The Ecloga Published by the Emperors Leo III and Constantine V of Isauria at Constantinople AD 726. Cambridge 1926).

7 Ecloga 1. 1 and repeated in the Prochiron 1. 78; in: E. PATLAGEAN, L’entrée dans l’âge adulte à Byzance au XIIIe-XIVe siècles, in: L’Historicité de l’enfance et de la jeunesse. Paris 1986, 263–270, here 265; PATLAGEAN, L’enfant 87–89.

8 See PATLAGEAN, L’entrée 264–5; G. PRINZING, Observations on the Legal Status of Children and the Stages of Childhood in Byzantium, in: Becoming Byzantine. Children and Childhood in Byzantium,
Adolescence was a period in which much responsibility could be granted. Byzantine children often participated in work, either at home (particularly the girls), or in a family workshop or beyond the family arena.9 Frequently, young men and women took on obligations at an early age. However, boys from affluent families appear to have had, in certain contexts, an extended period of what we would call adolescence, during which they were educated, before they assumed full adult responsibility. This is less apparent in girls who often married young and apparently participated in adult life in terms of bearing children. But perhaps a period of cultural adolescence in Byzantium could be experienced by young mothers? Issues such as this are very hard to determine. However, imperial practice gives an indication of cultural attitudes, at least in court circles, to responsibility. Several emperors came to the throne when adolescent. Sixteen seems the most acceptable age for a boy to succeed, although sometimes with the assistance of an overbearing mother or adviser.10

To give examples of how imperial adolescents could have many commitments, John V was aged nine when he succeeded to the throne with regents and fifteen when he married.11 His first son, Andronikos IV, was born in 1348 when he was aged sixteen.12 Andronikos was then made co-emperor in 1355 aged seven and the next year he married Maria, the nine-year-old daughter of the tsar of Bulgaria, when John V himself was still only twenty-four.13

Having summarised some of the complications in defining adolescence, for the sake of clarification, one could argue that a biological approach is the least subjective and, although ages of puberty vary historically and geographically, that the term child should be used for those who are generally below the onset of puberty, that is twelve for girls and fourteen for boys (the Ancients and the Byzantines recognised that girls matured earlier than boys), and the term youth or adolescent for those beyond that age. However, the age of twelve in cultural terms for both boys and girls indicates a transition to increased responsibility and is perhaps a more judicious choice. Adolescence may be seen as continuing until the age of majority, twenty-

---

9 About working children in the framework of the family see D. ARIANTZI, Kinderarbeit in Byzanz im Rahmen der Familie auf Grund der hagiographischen Quellen vom 6. bis zum 11. Jahrhundert (Millennium-Studien 36). Berlin–Boston 2012, 41–47.
10 For further examples and references, see C. HENNESSY, Images of Children in Byzantium. Farnham – Burlington 2008, 25–6.
11 A. T. PAPADOPOULOS, Versuch einer Genealogie der Palaiologen, 1259–1453. Speyer 1938, no. 73.
12 PAPADOPOULOS, Versuch no. 81
13 On the date of Andronikos’ coronation, see A. LUTTRELL, John V’s Daughters: A Palaiologan Puzzle. DOP 40 (1986) 103–112, here 104.
five, but it is necessarily a flexible time period, with variations for boys and girls and children from different economic and cultural backgrounds.¹⁴

Turning to the pictorial depiction of adolescence, I would like to review three aspects; first, beauty and its relation to youth, second, Christ’ youth, and third, imperial offspring in their youth. I have looked at parts of this material before in the context of the depiction of children, perhaps justifiably as childhood and adolescence as discussed are challenging to delineate.¹⁵ However, a further appraisal is helpful in refining and defining aspects of adolescence and its connotations and, in relation to girls, my views have changed.¹⁶

However, before looking at the depiction of adolescence in more detail, it is useful to establish some principal tenets about the depiction of youth and age in Byzantium and to recognise that there are certain formulas. For instance, regarding the portrayal of individual prophets, apostles and saints, as is well-known, Byzantine artists tended to adhere to an iconographic tradition. These figures are usually shown consistently as old, young, or middle aged with uniform features. In Dionysius of Fourna’s eighteenth-century description of the appearance of the twelve apostles, the four evangelists and the seventy apostles, the main iconographic feature supplied is the absence or length of the beard, followed by the colour of the hair.¹⁷ Dionysius does not refer to age, but the presence of white hair and a long beard must indicate old age and the absence of a beard implies youth, as for the most part the men are not eunuchs.

There are numerous examples in various media, metalwork, ivories, panel paintings, mosaics, wall paintings and manuscripts in which the iconography is often very consistent, suggesting the practitioners shared iconographic and stylistic devices. This essay uses examples from several media but to give some continuity often returns to illuminations from an eleventh-century lectionary, Dionysiou, cod. gr. 587 m., which was probably made in Constantinople.¹⁸ In this manuscript, the apostles are shown at various ages and can be identified by comparisons with other examples. For instance, in the scene of the Washing of the Disciples’ Feet, Peter and Andrew are depicted advanced in years (Peter is next to Christ and Andrew

---

¹⁴ For Patlagean, boys from the ages of 14 to 25 were ‘jeunes gens’ (neoi), see PATALAGEAN, L’entrée 264.
¹⁵ Hennessy, Children 3, 6, 7, 11, 14, 35, 36–7, 38, 39, 42, 53, 62–3, 73, 91, 107, 180, 199, 210, 214 and also under specific topics.
¹⁶ See Hennessy, Children 68.
¹⁷ In translation, P. Hetherington, The Painter’s manual of Dionysius of Fourna: an English translation, with commentary, of cod. gr. 708 in the Saltykov-Shchedrin State Public Library, Leningrad. London 1974, 52–59. While this text is late in date, it indicates the traditions.
¹⁸ Kurt Weitzmann has argued that it was most likely made ca. 1059 in Constantinople and commissioned by Isaac Komnenos for the St John Stoudios monastery since it has several images relating to St. John the Baptist, whose head was held at the monastery at that time, although there is no proof of this; see K. Weitzmann, The Narrative and Liturgical Gospel Illustrations, in: Studies in Classical and Byzantine Manuscript Decoration, ed. H. Kessler. Chicago 1971, 247–270, here 269.
is nearby taking his sandal off), and John and Philip are typically young (John is at the far right and Philip just above him), beardless and boyish, even one might say adolescent (fig. 1). Judas is also shown as young, as for example in the same manuscript in the Betrayal scene.

Often a feature of youth is beauty. It is striking how many representations of male saints, and a few Old Testament figures also, are shown as consistently young and good looking (clearly a subjective assessment, but appearing fine featured and well-formed). It seems that there was a cultural affinity towards aesthetically pleasing males who had not yet assumed facial hair and a look of maturity, what

---

19 Treasures of Mount Athos: illuminated manuscripts. 1. The Protaton and the monasteries of Dionysiou, Koutloumousiou, Xeropotamou and Gregoriou. (Treasures of Mount Athos: Illuminated manuscripts 1) Athens 1974, fol. 52r, fig. 223, p. 439.

20 Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 1, fol. 104v, figs. 233 – 4, p. 440.
one might potentially call adolescence. The beardless face, smooth skin and short hair indicate youth. In literature, beauty is associated with closeness to God, and often it is also linked with youth. The martyrs Demetrios, George, Prokopios, Panteleimon, Sergios and Bakchos are all shown as young, perhaps to convey the idea that their lives were cut short for their love of Christ.²¹ Males served in the army from a young age, often from sixteen, so a youthful warrior saint is not necessarily incongruous. One could argue that these figures are aged between sixteen and twenty five, the age of maturity. To return to the lectionary, Dionysiou cod. gr. 587 m., in individual standing portraits of the saints, George is shown as young and elegant and Demetrios as very youthful (fig. 2).²² In the mid-twelfth-century church dedicated to Saint Panteleimon at Nerezi, several young male saints are exquisitely and attractively portrayed. The church was built in 1164 by a grandson of Alexios I Komnenos, named Alexios Komnenos Angelos. Panteleimon himself is positioned to the right of the apse and appears very young, delicate and sensitive, with pale skin, scarcely more

²¹ For George, see BHG I, 669y-691y; for Prokopios, BHG II, 1576 – 1584; for Panteleimon, BHG II, 1412z-1418c; for Sergios and Bakchos, BHG II, 1624 – 25; on male beauty in Byzantium, see M. Hatzaki, Beauty and the Male Body in Byzantium: Perceptions and Representations in Art and Text. New York 2009.
²² Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 1, fol. 151v, fig. 265, p. 444; fol. 123r, fig. 241, p. 441.
than a boy, not yet having reached manhood. It is apparent that beauty is associated with spiritual purity and with youth through texts. Pantelimon’s Vita draws attention to his youth and his great beauty. Also, Bishop Theodore of Edessa is described as elegant, with a comely body, cheeks ‘just blooming with down’, which show the beauty of his soul. It is this stage in life, verging on manhood but still in boyhood, that seems to be attractive.

This beauty has threatening aspects. There are many texts that warn against the presence of boys and young men in monasteries for fear of tempting the monks, indicating that child and adolescent boys were viewed as sexually attractive. This cautioning stems from early typika, such as Christodoulos’ foundation typikon for St. John on Patmos. Registering that boys and beardless young men as well as girls and young women were seen as sexually tempting, the question must arise whether the images of the young male saints depict a sexual element of attractiveness, perhaps to both men and women. As far as I know, there are no texts that describe such images as having sexual appeal, but then such references may have been taboo.

Other cases suggest an attraction towards youth, since certain religious figures are depicted as much younger than indicated in the main texts about them. For instance, Moses is often portrayed as a very young man, with a hairless face, youthful features and a general air of grace and loveliness. This occurs from the very earliest images in the catacombs and on sarcophagi. However, in other early instances he is shown as either young and bearded or as mature. Two thirteenth-century icons from Saint Catherine’s monastery in Sinai, showing Moses before the burning bush and receiving the tablets of the law, depict him as very youthful and, in the latter, in Doula Mouriki’s words, ‘as almost an ephebe’. In the first, untying his sandal before the burning bush, he has a smooth, serious face and short slightly untidy hair but an apparently strong body. In the second, reaching up to God to receive the tab-

23 See I. Sinkević, The Church of St. Panteleimon at Nerezi: architecture, programme, patronage. Wiesbaden 2000, fig. 69.
24 PG 115:448.
25 See BHG II, 1744, 14.11–15, 18.20–23; in A. Kazhdan – H. Maguire, Byzantine Hagiographical Texts as Sources on Art. DOP 44 (1991) 1–2.
26 F. R. Miklosich – I. Müller, Acta et diplomata graecae medii aevi sacra et profana collecta, vol. 6. Patmos. Vienna 1860–90, rep. 1968, 65; J. P. Thomas – A. C. Hero, Byzantine monastic foundation documents: A complete translation of the surviving founders’ typika and testaments (Dumbarton Oaks Studies 35). Washington, DC 2000, A10, 583.
27 On sexuality in hagiography, see Arianzti, Adoleszenz 20.
28 The earliest example may be in the synagogue at Dura Europas, see C. H. Kraeling, The Synagogue (The Excavations at Dura Europas. Final Report VIII). New Haven – London 1956, plate 76. For numerous examples of various types, see Lexikon der christlichen Ikonographie, vol. 3. Rome – Freiburg – Basel – Vienna 1971, 283.
29 D. Mouriki, A Pair of Early 13th-century Moses Icons at Sinai with the Scenes of the Burning Bush and the Receiving of the Law. Deltion 16 (1992) 171–184, here 178.
lets, his face is equally serious, but slightly more rounded, his body is entirely enveloped in his garment and he appears boyish. Other Old Testament figures traditionally represented as young and attractive are Daniel and Solomon.

A further figure who without textual basis is consistently shown as a youth is Prochoros, traditionally one of the deacons assigned to take care of the poor (Acts 6:5), and depicted as the scribe for John the Evangelist on Patmos. This tradition is associated with the Acts of John of Prochoros, an apocryphal text, and so perhaps should come later in the discussion but is placed here in the context of youthful male saints.³⁰ Kurt Weitzmann has suggested that the image was created for the Vita of John by Symeon Metaphrastes at the end of the tenth century.³¹ From the menologion it was incorporated into lectionaries and Gospel Books.³² In this and all pairings of John and Prochoros, John is shown as very old and Prochoros as a tender adolescent. An example from a menologion is in an eleventh- or twelfth-century manuscript, BL Add. Ms. 11870, where Prochoros sits at John’s feet inscribing the words received by John as the old man looks up to the hand of God.³³ An example from a lectionary, in which John and Prochoros appear in the first evangelist portrait, is in Dionysiou cod. gr. 587 m. (fig. 3).³⁴ Prochoros is seated on a red cushion on the left as he writes on a scroll. He wears a blue chiton and white himation with a purple sash. His hair is short, though longer in the back, and his youth is emphasised by a narrow neck and perhaps a touch of downy hair on his chin. In contrast, John, standing on the right and looking back and up to God’s hand is white haired, balding and bearded. An example from a Gospel Book is in the thirteenth-century, Dionysiou, cod. 4, where a very small Prochoros is seated humbly beneath John’s pointing hand, recording his words that are being inspired from on high. Prochoros is slight, with short brown hair and wears a long blue chiton and green himation.³⁵ On the facing page, they again appear together, similarly aged and youthful, in an initial on the opening page of John’s Gospel.³⁶ While clearly not exclusively found in monastic manuscripts, the pairing seems to be particularly popular in them. It perhaps serves to idealise the elderly and youthful male relationship that was forbidden in monasteries, but also shows the significant role of scribe held by an adolescent. In accordance with other young saints, Prochoros is attractively depicted with fine features and a graceful air.

³⁰ See ELLIOTT, Apocrypha 303, 347. The text is dated to the fifth or sixth century and recounts John’s miracles on Patmos.
³¹ K. WEITZMANN, The Constantinopolitan Lectionary, Morgan 639, in: Studies in art and literature for Belle da Costa Greene, ed. E. D. Miner. Princeton 1954, 358–73 and plates after 374, p. 373.
³² WEITZMANN, Morgan 639, p. 363.
³³ Fol. 197v, WEITZMANN, Morgan 639, fig. 292; also: http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/Viewer.aspx?ref=add_ms_11870_f197v.
³⁴ Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 1, fol. 1v, fig. 189, p. 435.
³⁵ Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 1, fol. 278v, fig. 25, p. 395.
³⁶ Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 1, fol. 279r, fig. 27, p. 396.
As with the male saints, texts often emphasise the beauty of females and this beauty is also associated with being young. In images, determining the age of the sanctified girls and women is often problematic. They tend to be portrayed with no signs of aging, perhaps just a certain maturity conveyed through the covering of their hair, but except in unusual cases, with an air of timelessness. Typical examples are the various female saints depicted on the west wall of the narthex at Hosios Loukas, probably datable to the eleventh century, which include Saints Anastasia, Thecla, Febronia, Eugenia, Agatha, Irene, Catherine, Barbara, Euphemia, Marina and Juliania, all relatively young and attractive with smooth skins and large eyes. Could these male and female examples suggest that there are certain conventions in depicting idealised beauty which perhaps can be defined as adolescence?
Turning to portrayals of Christ, the only canonical event that occurs in his adolescent years is when, at the age of twelve, he goes up to Jerusalem with his parents and teaches the doctors in the temple (Luke 2:41–50). The age of thirteen, in Judaism now linked with the Bar Mitzvah, was from the first or second century associated with the age of majority in respect to following the Torah. In this sense he is gaining moral responsibility. As mentioned, in Byzantine society twelve was, in some contexts, the age that children assumed moral accountability. Christ teaching in the temple is not a particularly widespread image. Perhaps the earliest extant example is in Paris, cod. gr. 510, a manuscript in which many of the Old Testament figures are shown as adolescent. A further early example is in Tokalı New Church in Göreme, Cappadocia, dated to about 960, in which the painting is damaged but Christ looks mature, having a substantial body and robust knees with no reference to adolescence. In this scene in Dionysiou, cod. gr. 587 m., a young Christ with short hair and round face, dressed in dark and mid-blue sits centrally on a curved marble bench like a synthonon and teaches four older men, two on each side. He is depicted with the puer senex features, with his hairline slightly receding to suggest a maturity beyond his years. A later example is in St Nicolaos Orphanos in Thessaloniki, dated to the fourteenth century, where the scene is shown in relation to the Akathistos Hymn. Christ is seated looking youthful, with a full head of short hair and delicate features.

Particularly from the eleventh century, this visual appreciation of youth extends to images of the adolescent Christ in the form known as Christ Emmanuel. For instance, in Dionysiou cod. gr. 587 m., a boy Christ is employed in an initial letter omicron. Dressed in a blue chiton and purple himation, he again has puer senex features but still seems very young, perhaps about aged ten (fig. 4). In another initial, the letter T at the beginning of the Gospel of Luke, he appears once more in the

37 Fol. 165r, L. BRUBAKER, Vision and meaning in ninth-century Byzantium: image as exegesis in the homilies of Gregory of Nazianzus. Cambridge 1999, fig. 21, 83–6; for further discussion, see E. ANTONOPOULOS, Παιδαριογέρων: ἡ ἀπεικόνιση τῆς πρώτης σοφίας, in: Les temps de l’histoire en vue d’une histoire de l’enfance et de la jeunesse. Athens 1998, 215–231, on the scene, 219 and on Paris cod. gr. 510, 225.
38 G. DE JERPHANION, Une nouvelle province de l’art byzantin: les églises rupestres de Cappadoce (Bibliothèque archéologique et historique 5–6). 5 vols. in 7 parts. Paris 1925–1942, vol. 2,1, 332–3; A. WHARTON EPSTEIN, Tokali Kilise: Tenth-century Metropolitan Art in Byzantine Cappadocia. Washington, DC 1986, figs. 66–7. Jerphanion points out that Christ looks adult and suggests this is because two scenes are confused, Luke 2:42 and John 7:10, the first when he goes to Jerusalem with his parents, the second when he goes as an adult; see JERPHANION, Églises rupestres 333, fn. 2.
39 Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 1, fol. 135r, fig. 252, p. 443; on the puer senex, see ANTONOPOULOS, Παιδαριογέρων.
40 Α. ΧΥΓΓΟΡΟΥΛΟΣ, Οι τοιχογραφίες του αγίου Νικολάου Ορφανού Θεσσαλονίκης. Athens 1964; figs. 101, 103. On the Akathistos hymn, see J. LAFONTAINE-DOSOGNE, Iconography of the cycle of the infancy of Christ, in: The Kariye Djamı, ed. P. Underwood. New York, 1966, 4 vols., vol. 4, 201, fn. 30.
41 Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 1, fol. 14v, fig. 200, p. 436.
same clothes.⁴² Other examples from about the same date are in the domes at Elmalı and Karanlık churches in Cappadocia, Göreme, dated probably to the mid-eleventh century.⁴³

Turning to representations of imperial youth, there are several portrait examples that show the sons of emperors in adolescence, such as the mosaic figure of Alexios, the eldest son of John II, on the southeast wall of the upper gallery at Hagia Sophia (fig. 5).⁴⁴ This mosaic, displaying budding manhood, was probably made in about 1122 when Alexios became co-emperor and was about sixteen and showing his first downy moustache. There are fewer examples of female imperial portraits. One that shows the extended family of Michael VIII’s half brother is an illuminated copy of a foundation typikon of the Convent of our Lady of Certain Hope, Ῥις Βεβαιας Ελπίδως. The manuscript, Oxford, Lincoln College, gr. 35, now in the Bodleian Library,

---

42 Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 1, fol. 116r, fig. 237, p. 441.
43 For Karanlık, also known as chapel 23, see JERPHANION, Églises rupestres vol. I.2, 393–430, pls. II, 96–110; M. RESTLE, Die byzantinische Wandmalerei in Kleinasien. 3 vols. Recklinghausen 1967, vol. I, 128–129, II, figs. 218–244; L. RODLEY, Cave monasteries of Byzantine Cappadocia. Cambridge 1985, 2010², 48–56; C. JOLIVET-LÉVY, Les églises byzantines de Cappadoce: le programme iconographique de l’abside et de ses abords. Paris 1991, 132–135. It is thought to have been decorated by the same workshop as the other so-called column churches, Elmalı and Çanklı; on Elmalı, see JERPHANION, Églises rupestres vol. I.2, 431–454, pls. II, 113–124; on Çanklı, see JERPHANION, Églises rupestres vol. I.2, 455–473, pls. II, 125–132; on dating and style, see A. EPSTEIN, The Fresco Decoration of the Column Churches, Göreme Valley, Cappadocia: A Consideration of Their Chronology and Their Models. CahArch 29 (1980–81) 27–45; A. WHARTON, Art of empire: painting and architecture of the Byzantine periphery: a comparative study of four provinces. University Park, PA – London 1988, 45–51.
44 For further examples of imperial youth and references, see HENNESSY, Children 143–178.
shows Euphrosyne, who is the great niece of Michael VIII and the daughter of the foundress as an adolescent. It has a series of portraits on twelve folios. In one, Euphrosyne is depicted with her mother, Theodora, and is shown shorter than Theodora, with a smaller, more youthful face, clearly not fully grown, yet not a child.

For the text, see H. Delehaye, Deux typica byzantins de l’époque des Paléologues. Brussels 1921; for comment and translation, see Thomas – Hero, Founders’ Typika, 1512–1578; for analysis and plates, see I. Spatharakis, The portrait in Byzantine illuminated manuscripts. Leiden 1976, 190–207, pls. 143–154; I. Hutter, Die Geschichte des Lincoln College Typikons. JÖB 45 (1995) 79–114; see also Cutler – P. Magdalino 1978, 179–198; Connor 2000, 107–108; C. Hennessy, The Lincoln College Typikon: The Influence of Church and Family, in: Under the Influence: The Concept of Influence and the Study of Illuminated Manuscripts, eds. J. Lowden and A. Bovey. Brepols 2008, 97–109.
Her reliance on her mother, and the direction she receives from her, is emphasised by the way Theodora grasps her wrist, as if leading her forward to present her to the Virgin, imaged on the facing page. It seems likely that the portrait was made when Euphrosyne was about fifteen or sixteen (she was born in 1285 or 1286), at the time the convent was first functional ca. 1300. A final image shows the assembled thirty or so nuns of the community, grouped together in rows one above the other (folio 12r). In the front row are five young nuns: although they are dressed similarly to their elders, they are clearly smaller and wear a different headdress. A further example of a series of illuminations showing adolescence and changes in life, is in Vatican, gr. 1851, which contains the partial text of a poem, describing a foreign princess coming to wed the son of the Byzantine emperor, and seven illuminations. In a scene showing the girl’s arrival, she appears at the top left in a simple gold dress with a red cloak around her shoulders and loose blonde hair hanging down her back, slender and shorter than the women who greet her (fig. 19 in Brubaker article). In the adjacent scene, she appears to be standing on a splendid red and gold platform or perhaps couch, being dressed by the women of the court in an elaborate gown of the same colours, and in the register below she wears a coronet in a formal frontal seated pose. In a further image, she is shown in a tent meeting the daughter of the emperor, who is slightly taller than her but who also has hair falling down her back in a black plait, implying that she also is young. The scene below shows them sitting together apparently talking. The bride’s youth however, is again suggested by her slightly smaller face and figure. The groom also, in an earlier miniature, is shown as youthful, standing by the side of his father, dressed in a similar loros, and although only half a head shorter than the emperor,
slight and fine featured with a long plait laying on each shoulder. This unusual manuscript, which has no real parallels, gives a nuanced picture of a boy and two girls involved in diplomatic alliances. However, these figures may well, according to our earlier definitions, be children and not adolescents. It has been argued that the boy might be one of the three figures: either Alexios II Komnenos who married in 1179, when he was aged ten and his bride nine; or Andronikos II Palaiologos who first married in 1272, when he was aged 14 and his bride 12; or Andronikos IV who married in 1356, when he was aged eight and his bride nine. Regardless of specific age, the illustrations show a distinct recognition of the individuals’ liminal place in life.

Having reviewed some reasonably well-known examples, it is apparent then that in representations of saints, both male and female, of certain Old Testament figures, of Christ and of members of the imperial family, youthfulness is distinctly portrayed, with qualities between childhood and maturity. The example of Prochoros showed how an apocryphal role was highly developed in imagery with an emphasis on adolescence. As seen in Prochoros, compared to illustrations of canonical texts, those of apocryphal ones perhaps have less rigid iconographical traditions and may convey lifelike portrayals that reflect cultural realities or suggest biological, spiritual and societal change in the transitions from childhood to adulthood.

This material is explored here through depictions of Christ and his family. Quite who is part of his family is a little complex. According to the Gospels of Mark and Matthew Christ was said to have had four brothers and some sisters: ‘Is not this the carpenter, the son of Mary, the brother of Jacob, and Joses, and of Juda, and Simon? And are not his sisters here with us?’ (Mark 6:3). ‘Jacob the Younger’ and Joses are also mentioned as the children of a Mary, who is commonly held to be the Virgin, present at the crucifixion (Mark 15:40). In both contexts Jacob is mentioned first, perhaps implying either that he is the eldest or his importance as a disciple, to be inferred from canonical texts (Galatians 1:19) as well as the Gospel of Thomas (logion 12). He was the first Bishop of Jerusalem. The men named as Jacob the

---

51 Fol. 7r.
52 For a brief summary of the arguments, see, C. Hennessy. The Vatican Epithalamion, in: A Companion to Byzantine Illustrated Manuscripts, ed. V. Tsamakda. Leiden 2017, 177–182.
53 Also Matthew 13: 55–6.
54 The Gospel of Thomas is a second-century text found at Nag Hammadi, Egypt. The logion reads: The disciples said to Jesus: We know that You will depart from us. Who is to be out leader? Jesus said to them, Wherever you are, you are to go to James the Righteous for whose sake heaven and earth came into being; THE NAG Hammadi LIBRARY in ENGLISH. Leiden 1977, 119; for the Coptic, see U.-K. Plisch, Das Thomasevangelium: Origininaltext mit Kommentar. Stuttgart 2007, 63.
55 Several recent books focus on James and his role in the early Church: P.-A. Bernheim, Jacques, frère de Jésus. Paris 1996; in English, James, Brother of Jesus (trans. J. Bowden). London 1997; most controversially, R. Eisenman, James, the brother of Jesus: the key to unlocking the secrets of early Christianity and the Dead Sea Scrolls. London 1998; J. Painter, Just James: the brother of Jesus in history and tradition. Minneapolis 1999.
Just and Jacob the son of Alphaeus are also conflated with Jacob the Less/Younger (Mathew 10:3, Mark 3:18, Luke 6:15). Who exactly were these siblings? In Byzantium, the common interpretation was that they were the sons of Joseph, born to him by a prior marriage, thus conserving Mary’s virginal state. There are three other main interpretations. Helvidius, in the fourth century, suggested the siblings were born to Joseph and Mary, which was refuted by Jerome who developed the theory of a line coming through Mary of Cleophas, the proposed daughter of Anna’s second marriage to Cleophas; thus they were cousins, not siblings, to Christ. A further branch to the family was added in the ninth century, which included James (Jacob) the Great and John the Evangelist as sons of Mary Salome and Zebedee, Mary Salome being the daughter of Salome (a man) who was Anna’s third husband.⁵⁶ In the west, these three interpretations are illustrated in several contexts.

In Byzantine illustrations of Christ’s Infancy, the six children of Joseph by his deceased wife, four sons and two daughters, are not depicted. Rather one, sometimes two and occasionally four brothers are included in various scenes. However, one, occasionally labelled Iakobos (Jacob/James), takes a more prominent role. Jacob’s role is partially derived from the Infancy Gospel of James (Jacob) a text probably originating in the second century, which only mentions two sons and no daughters, and in the narrative does not highlight Jacob.⁵⁷ The text was interpreted as being written by Jacob the brother of Jesus due to an addition at the end of the text, which states that it was written by him in Jerusalem (Infancy Gospel 25:1–3).⁵⁸ A further text, the Story

---

⁵⁶ Jerome, De perpetua virginitate B. Mariae, adversus Helvidium. PL XXIII, 183 – 206; for further references and detail, see M. Naydenova Slade – D. Park, The earliest Holy Kinship image, the Salomite controversy, and a little-known centre of learning in northern England in the twelfth century. Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes 71 (2008) 95 – 119, here 96.

⁵⁷ C. von Tischendorf, Evangelia apocrypha, adhibitis plurimis codicibus graecis et latinis maxim partem nunc primum consultis atque ineditorum copia insignibus. Leipzig 1853, 1–49; E. Amman, Le Protévangile de Jacques et ses remaniements latins. Paris 1910; M. R. James, The apocryphal New Testament: being the apocryphal gospels, acts, epistles, and apocalypses with other narratives and fragments newly translated by Montague Rhodes James. Oxford 1924, 38–49; E. Hennecke, New Testament Apocrypha, ed. W. Schneemelcher (English trans. R. McL. Wilson). London 1959, vol. 1, 370 – 388. For the most recent text and commentary, see R. F. Hock, The Infancy Gospels of James and Thomas: with introduction, notes, and original text featuring the New Scholars Version translation. Santa Rosa, CA 1997, used here for references. The earliest known manuscript is dated to the fourth century, Papyrus Bodmer V; on the manuscripts, see Hock Infancy Gospels 28 – 29; the original version probably dates to the late-second century, see Hock Infancy Gospels 11 – 12. For a discussion of the textual tradition, see Lafontaine-Dosogne, Iconographie de l’enfance de la Vierge dans l’empire byzantin et en Occident. Brussels, 1964, vol. 1, 13–23 with summary at 23; on Joseph’s sons, see Amman Protévangile 37 – 39, 52, 82, 131, 142, 208, 216 – 17; and Hock, Infancy Gospels 49, 63, 67, 77; also on dating and acceptance by the early church, see M. B. Cunningham, The Use of the Protoevangelion of James in Eighth-Century Homilies on the Mother of God, in The Cult of the Mother of God in Byzantium: Texts and Images, eds. L. Brubaker – M. J. Cunningham. Farnham – Burlington 2011, 163 – 7.

⁵⁸ Chapter 25: 1–3, ‘Now I, James, am the one who wrote this account at the time when an uproar arose in Jerusalem, at the death of Herod. I took myself off into the desert until the uproar in Jeru-
of Joseph the Carpenter, originated in Egypt, perhaps in the fifth century. Written in the voice of Christ, it refers to the four sons and two daughters (Carpenter 2). Here Jacob is the youngest, for ‘Now Justus and Simeon, the elder sons of Joseph, were married, and had families of their own. Both the daughters were likewise married, and lived in their own houses. So there remained in Joseph’s house, Judas and Jacob the Less, and my virgin mother’ (Carpenter 11). No age of the children is given but Joseph’s wife has only just died when the Virgin turns twelve, as ‘Now when righteous Joseph became a widower, my mother Mary, blessed, holy, and pure, was already twelve years old (Carpenter 3). In the Pseudo-Matthew, which was popular in the west and probably developed at the beginning of the seventh, eighth or even ninth century, there are also four sons, and two daughters (Pseudo-Matthew 42:1). The text was composed from the Infancy Gospel of James and the Infancy Gospel of Thomas in addition to some other influences. However, the Pseudo-Matthew was not a major source of iconography in Byzantium.

Perhaps the earliest representation of the brothers is on the sixth-century ivory front cover of the Etchmiadzin Gospels, in the scene of the Journey to Bethlehem. In this unusual image, Joseph is walking beside the donkey, clasped by the Virgin, while one son walks behind and another is on the far side of the donkey at the front. The brothers seem to be beardless, which might suggest they are youthful. The figure on the far side of the donkey, while described as a son by Lafontaine-Dosogne may be an angel. This tradition reappears in the Gospel of Pseudo-Matthew, which describes how when Joseph and Mary were going to Bethlehem (no sons mentioned), a beautiful boy in white raiment appeared, and interpreted a vision had by

salem died down. There I praised the Lord God, who gave me the wisdom to write this account’, Hock, Infancy Gospels 76–77; for a summary of views on who actually wrote the text, see Hock, Infancy Gospels 8–11.

59 Derived from the Infancy Gospel, Tischendorf, Evangelia 115–133; James, Apocryphal, 84–86; J. K. Elliott, The Apocryphal New Testament: a collection of apocryphal Christian literature in an English translation. Oxford 1993, 111–117; Lafontaine-Dosogne, Iconographie, vol. 1, 22; for the Arab text, see A. Battista – B. Bagatti, Edizione critica del testo arabo della Historia Iosephi Fabri Lignarii e ricerche sulla sua origine. Jerusalem 1978.

60 J. Gijsel – R. Bevers, Libri de Nativitate Mariae, Pseudo-Matthaei Evangelium Textus et Commentarius (Corpus Christianorum Series Apocryphorum 9 and 10), vol. 1. Turnhout 1997; 13; Elliott gives the eighth to ninth century date, which is more common, see Elliott, Apocryphal, 86. James is mentioned as the eldest, Et die quadam vocavit Ioseph ad se filium suum primogenitum Iacobum, etc.; ‘And on a certain day Joseph called to him his first-born son James…’. (Pseudo-Matthew 41–1), Tischendorf, Evangelia 103. In the ninth century, the Pseudo-Matthew text was used as a model for the Libellus de nativitate sanctae Mariae, Gijsel – Bevers, Libri de Nativitate 21.

61 T. Burke, De Infantia Iesu Evangelium Thomae Graece. (Corpus Christianorum Series Apocryphorum 17). Turnhout 2010.

62 Yerevan, Matenadaran 2374, in: W. F. Volbach, Elfenbeinarbeiten der Spätantike und des frühen Mittelalters. Mainz 1976, pl. 75, no. 142; L. A. Dournova, Armenian miniatures. London 1961, preface photograph.

63 J. Lafontaine-Dosogne, Iconography of the cycle 205, p. 57.
Mary and then ‘the angel ordered the beast to stand, for the time when she should bring forth was at hand’.\textsuperscript{64} The angel is pictured in a similar location and pose on the ivory on the Chair of Maximianus, a scene where there are no sons, and on an ivory panel in the Louvre, the angel strides forward holding a cross and leading the donkey (fig. 6).\textsuperscript{65} It is possible that the angel in this type of image is transposed into Jacob in later examples. A further early example where Jacob is shown is in the paintings at Castelseprio, which are probably dated to the ninth century and include apocryphal scenes.\textsuperscript{66} In the Journey to Bethlehem, a boy is in front of the donkey, now only partially visible, and so again his age is indeterminate, although he appears to be wearing a short tunic, something usually worn by servants, children, or youths. In a further ninth-century example, an enamel reliquary box, the \textit{Paschal Cross} in the Vatican, dated 817–24, one son is shown (fig. 7).\textsuperscript{67} He is unnamed, as are

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{64} Pseudo-Matthew 13:2. The Pseudo-Matthew text is later than the ivory, but compiles early sources.
\item \textsuperscript{65} The Maximianianus chair, illustrated in: C. R. Morey, Castelseprio and the Byzantine “Renaissance”. \textit{The Art Bulletin} 34 (1952) 173–201, fig. 29; the Louvre example, OA 11149, J. Durand, Byzance: L’art byzantine dans les collections publiques françaises. Paris 1992, cat. 24.
\item \textsuperscript{66} Bognetti et al 1948; the dating is controversial, ranging from the sixth to tenth centuries; for ninth century, see P. D. Levento, The Marian Theme of the Frescoes in S. Maria at Castelseprio. \textit{The Art Bulletin} 72 (1990) 393–413, here 393; for others, see K. Weitzmann, The fresco cycle of S. Maria di Castelseprio. Princeton 1951; Morey, Castelseprio, 189–201; M. Schapiro 1952, Book Review: Kurt Weitzmann, The Fresco Cycle of S. Maria di Castelseprio. \textit{The Art Bulletin} 44 (1952) 147–163; M. Schapiro, Notes on Castelseprio. \textit{The Art Bulletin} 39 (1957) 292–299.
\item \textsuperscript{67} C. R. Morey, The Inscription on the Enamed Cross of Paschal I. \textit{The Art Bulletin} 19 (1937) 595–6; A. Legner, Ornamenta ecclesiae: Kunst und Künstler der Romanik, Katalog zur Ausstellung des Schnütgen-Museums in der Josef-Haubrich-Kunsthalle. Cologne 1985, 82–84 with bibliography; R. P. Bergman, Splendor of the popes: treasures from the Sistine Chapel and the Vatican museums and library. Baltimore, MD 1989, 4, 6; C. Stiegmann – M. Wemhoff, Kunst und Kultur der Karolin-
all the figures on the box, and he appears to be a youth, shown as smaller than Joseph, since size is often used to distinguish stature, and with a beardless face, cropped hair and short tunic. The boy is placed in a position of servility or responsibility guiding the donkey. Moving to the early tenth century, in Cappadocia, in the Old Church at Tokali kilise, Jacob is depicted and named, simply as Iakobos, leading the donkey on the road to Bethlehem and also in the Flight to Egypt. The Flight to Egypt is not included in the Infancy Gospels, but none the less, Jacob has kept up his previous role. There are numerous other examples. In each, his adolescent stage is apparent, shown too tall to be a boy, but without facial hair and wearing the tunic of youth. No examples in Cappadocia, however, show more than one

68 Perhaps the earliest representation of Jacob in Cappadocia is in Ayvalı kilise in Güllü Dere, Çavuşin, which is dated to 913–920; see Restle, Wandmalerei no. 29, vol. 3, figs. 340–341; Gōreme Chapel 7, JERPHANION, Églises rupestres vol. 1.1, 271, 273–4; Restle, Wandmalerei vol. 1, 110–116, vol. 2, figs. 66, 86; on the iconography of the journey to Bethlehem, see JERPHANION, Églises rupestres vol. 1.1, 76 and on the flight to Egypt, vol. 1.1, 79; on the depiction of Jacob (James the Less) in the medieval and later periods, primarily in the west, see R. P. Bedford, St. James the Less: a study in Christian iconography. London 1911.

Fig. 7 Paschal Cross, Vatican (Source: Cecily Hennessy)
son. A son of Joseph also appears in manuscript illuminations, such as on the opening page of the Gospel of Mathew in Dionysiou cod. gr. 587 m, leading the donkey in the Flight to Egypt. He is on the right wearing a short chiton and high boots and walks in front leading the donkey and holding a staff on which hangs a knapsack over his left shoulder. Jacob is as tall as Joseph, who follows behind, but clearly youthful with short brown hair and beardless face. A further example is in another eleventh-century text, a menologion, on Athos, Esphigmenou, cod. gr. 14, in which there are several unusual scenes drawn from apocryphal texts. A beardless but fully grown son leads the horse/mule on the Flight to Egypt and Joseph follows behind with the Christ Child on his shoulders. In Paris cod. gr. 74, also eleventh century, a son in a full length garment leads the donkey on the Journey to Bethlehem, illustrating the Gospel of Luke, and also in a short tunic follows the donkey which is led by Joseph in the Flight to Egypt, illustrating the Gospel of Matthew. Although in several of these, Jacob is not named, his identity can perhaps be inferred from those others where he is named.

The reason for Jacob’s consistent inclusion in the iconography may be that he serves as a witness to the events, a feature that appears in other contexts where subsidiary figures act as witnesses, such as Anna’s servant in attendance at the Annunciation to Anna and a servant present at the Visitation. These figures do often seem young, as for instance, the young maid watching the Visitation in the bema at the sixth-century Basilica Eufrasiana, Poreč and a boy witnessing the Annunciation to Anna in the fourteenth-century mosaics at the former church of Our Saviour in the Chora, the Kariye Camii, Istanbul (fig. 8). Alternatively, Jacob’s presence may put a mantle of propriety over Joseph escorting the Virgin. Jacob does not appear in scenes of the Nativity or the Adoration, where other figures are also present, suggesting that his role is that of donkey hand or protector/witness when Joseph is alone with the Virgin. His presence also emphasises the age of the widowed Joseph (in

69 Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 1, fol. 133v, fig. 251, pp. 442–3.
70 Treasures of Mount Athos, illuminated manuscripts. 2. The Monasteries of Iveron, St. Panteleimon, Esphigmenou, and Chilandari. Athens 1975, fol. 384v, fig. 343, p. 370. Other scenes are connected with the Virgin’s youth. She is shown walking out from beneath a ciborion to be given to Joseph, Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 2, fol. 389r, fig. 350, p. 371; walking with Joseph (no sons) on the road to Bethlehem, Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 2, fol. 391r, fig. 353, p. 372 (the latter has beneath it Mary’s vision, associated with a homily by John of Damascus, not directly an apocryphal text). It has been suggested that this manuscript was from the Studios Monastery, Constantinople, see Treasures of Mount Athos, vol. 2, 361.
71 H. Omont, Évangiles avec Peintures Byzantines du XIe Siècle: Reproduction des 361 miniatures du Manuscrit grec 74 de la Bibliothèque nationale. Paris 1908, vol. 2, fol. 108, pl. 96, vol. 1, fol. 4v, pl. 7.
72 On this, see R. Deshman, Servants of the mother of God in Byzantine and medieval art. Word and Image 5 (1989) 33–70, here 50–52.
73 For Poreč, Deshman, Servants fig. 24; A. Terry – H. Maguire, Dynamic Splendor: The Wall Mosaics in the Cathedral of Eufrasius at Poreč. University Park, PA 2007, vol. 1, 102–104, 174, vol. 2, fig. 126; for Kariye Camii, Underwood, Kariye pls. 92–93, vol. 1, 64.
the Story of Joseph the Carpenter, he is described as ‘the pious old man’ and he is supposedly 90 years old at the time of Christ’s birth (Carpenter 4, 14).

In the Kariye Camii the sons of Joseph are depicted at several stages of life but also in different configurations, perhaps suggesting that various models were used for the programme. The first time one appears is in the scene where Joseph takes the Virgin to his home (fig. 9). Joseph and the son turn to look back at the Virgin, and the son is slighter and less tall than his father, short haired and beardless, clearly a youth. Then, in the Journey to Bethlehem a mature son leads the donkey, mature in that he has a short beard and wears a full-length chiton. Next, when Joseph and Mary are counted in the census, all four brothers crowd behind them, one mature and bearded, two youthful and one rather indistinct. In the return from Egypt, Jo-

---

74 Underwood, Kariye scene 97, pls. 143–145, vol. 1, 81–2.
75 Underwood, Kariye scene 100, pls. 155, 158, vol. 1, 86–8.
76 Underwood, Kariye scene 101, pls. 163, 165, vol. 1, 88–9.
Joseph carries the child on his shoulders and a son, clearly youthful and dressed in a short tunic, follows the donkey.\footnote{Underwood, Kariye scene 111, pls. 200, 202, vol. 1, 104 – 6.} When Christ is taken by his parents to Jerusalem at the age of twelve, he is accompanied by two of the brothers, one bearded and one beardless who wears a short tunic.\footnote{Underwood, Kariye scene 112, pls. 206, 208 – 9, vol. 1, 106 – 7.} Christ is dressed in a long gold garment, which has no reference to youth but rather to his importance or sanctity. However, he appears fresh faced and youthful.

A further representation of the four brothers is in the paintings in two illustrated Homilies of James Kokkinobaphos, Vatican, gr. 1162 and Paris, gr. 1208.\footnote{PG 127: 543 – 700; H. Omont, Miniatures des homélies sur la Vierge du moine Jacques. Paris 1927; C. Stornaiolo, Miniature delle omelie di Giacomo monaco (Cod. vatic. gr. 1162) e dell’Evangelario greco urbinato (Cod. vatic. urbin. gr. 2). Rome 1910; Anderson, The Illustrated Sermons of James the Monk: Their Dates, Order, and Place in the History of Byzantine Art. Viator 22 (1991) 69 – 106; Hutter – Canart, Das Marienhomiliar des Mönchs Jakobos von Kokkinobaphos: Codex vaticanus graecus 1162. 2 vols. Zurich 1991; Maguire, The icons of their bodies: saints and their images in Byzantium. Princeton, NJ 1996, 159 – 166, figs. 141 – 145; R. Nelson, Theoktistos and Associates in Twelfth-Century Constantinople: An Illustrated New Testament of A.D. 1133. The J. Paul Getty Museum Journal 53 (1987) 53 – 78, p. 76; K. Linardou, Reading two Byzantine illustrated books: the Kokkinobaphos manuscripts (Vaticanus graecus 1162 and Parisinus graecus 1208) and their illustration. University of Birmingham PhD thesis, 2004; on the text, see E. Jeffreys, The Sevastokratorissa Eirene as...}
scripts illustrate six homilies on major events in the Virgin’s life. Their date is normally given as between 1130 and the 1150s.⁸⁰ They depict rich details of the Virgin’s life (from her conception to the declaration of her innocence after her pregnancy is discovered), with evidence of then contemporary childhood and adolescence. It is often said that the illustrations derive from an illustrated Infancy Gospel, but no examples of such a manuscript survive and in fact the presence of four sons in several scenes would suggest that this is not the case. In the illustrations (not in the Homilies), it is the youngest son who takes up a key role. It is possible the images are related to the Story of Joseph the Carpenter and derive from an illustrated version of it. Yet, in the Carpenter text, the daughters are said to have left home, so their absence is justified, but two sons have left as well, and in the Kokkinobaphos manuscripts, four brothers are present in Joseph’s house.⁸¹ However, the Carpenter text does give Jacob a special role, that of a bereft child who is adopted by his new stepmother, Mary. The text says she ‘found James the Less in his father’s house, broken-hearted and sad on account of the loss of his mother, and she brought him up’ (Carpenter 4). The youngest child in the Homilies’ illustrations is interpreted as being Jacob the Less, though there is really no evidence for this. He is neither named in the text nor in the illustrations. In the scene where the Virgin first enters Joseph’s house, the two older sons look mature with beards, the third son looks what one might justifiably call an adolescent, beardless, a little shorter than his brothers and a little slimmer. The fourth son appears as a boy, significantly smaller with a small round head, a slightly receding hairline and an appearance similar to the puer senex features used for Christ (fig. 10).⁸² Throughout the illustrations in these manuscripts he remains a boy, distinguished from his brothers. He sometimes wears a similar long tunic, at other times a short one. This boyishness is perhaps because in many situations he is alone with the Virgin as a protector, and so his lack of sexual maturity needs emphasis, but the puer senex appearance gives him the appearance of wisdom. One could argue that he is about twelve and so on that cusp between childhood and adolescence.

Often it is said that the Virgin before her maturity is depicted as a small adult, but this is clearly far from accurate.⁸³ She is frequently shown at distinct stages of childhood and adolescence, as in the Kokkinobaphos manuscripts. For instance, she appears as a little girl in bed and again being tucked into her cot, when present-

---

⁸⁰ For a brief summary of the dating issues, see C. Hennessy, The Stepmum and the Servant: The Stepson and the Sacred Vessel, in Wonderful things: Byzantium through its art, eds. A. Eastmond – L. James. Farnham – Burlington 2013, 79 – 98, here 89 – 90.
⁸¹ Lafontaine-Dosogne points out how unique this is and an invention of the miniaturist, Lafontaine-Dosogne, Iconographie vol. 1, 180.
⁸² Paris gr. 1208, fol. 142v; Vatican gr. 1162, fol. 105v.
⁸³ For instance, ODB 1, 421 under ‘Childhood’.
ed to Zachariah in the temple and when installed on the altar. Interestingly when she says goodbye to her parents, she seems fully grown (fig. 11). But then when fed by the angel on the altar she is again a little girl (fig. 12). Zachariah decides that when she has reached the age of twelve, it is no longer proper for her to be in the temple, so Joseph is chosen as her betrothed. When she is given to Joseph, she is a child, but when shortly thereafter she leaves with Joseph through Jerusalem, she has become much more grown up, and when she enters his home and meets the sons, she is mature. The text of the homilies refers to her with various terms, aware of the delicate situation evoked by her reaching the age of twelve. For instance, in a speech made by Joseph after he has been chosen to betroth the Virgin,

Fig. 10 The Virgin enters Joseph’s house, Paris gr. 1208, fol. 142v (Source: Bibliothèque nationale)

84 For the cot scenes, Paris gr. 1208, fol. 52r; Vatican gr. 1162, fol. 38v; Paris gr. 1208, fol. 59r; Vatican gr. 1162 fol. 43r; Vatican gr. 1162, fol. 44r (this is not in the Paris manuscript); Paris gr. 1208, fol. 63v; Vatican gr. 1162, fol. 46v; for the altar scene, Paris gr. 1208, fol. 92v; Vatican gr. 1162, fol. 68v.
85 Paris gr. 1208, fol. Bis 100v; Vatican gr. 1162, fol. 74v.
86 Paris gr. 1208, fol. 103v; Vatican gr. 1162, fol. 76v.
87 For reception of Mary by Joseph, Paris gr. 1208 fol. 135r; Vatican gr. 100r; for Joseph and Mary leaving Jerusalem, Paris gr. 1208, 142r; Vatican 105r; for entering the house, Paris gr. 1208, fol. 142v, Vatican 105v. The age of the Virgin varies in certain texts, see LAFONTAINE-DOSOGNE, Iconographie vol. 1, 167.
he refers to her as ‘a young girl with a divine appearance’. When Joseph returns from his work and sees her pregnant, he is perplexed, but he still calls her ‘girl’ until he realises that indeed she is pregnant, when he addresses her as ‘woman’. In this image, she looks full grown in height (though not ostensibly pregnant). However, later she is referred to again as ‘girl’. As mentioned, many details in the images are not derived from the text and the phrasing may not be directly relevant to the pictorial representation.

The subtle recognition of adolescence may be attributable to patronage. Much recent reflection on the Kokkinobaphos manuscripts has lent towards the Sebastokratiorissa Eirene as the patroness of the manuscript. She was the widow of Andronikos (1108/9 – 1142), the second son of John II. However, the iconography may be related

---

88 Homily 4, Vatican, cod. gr. 1162, fol. 99v Paris, cod. gr 1208, fol. 134v, νεάνις αὐτῆς καὶ θείας μορφῆς ἐμφαίνουσα. I am indebted to Elizabeth Jeffreys for the use of her unpublished Greek transcript and translation of the texts.
89 Homily 6, Vatican, cod. gr. 1162, fol. 165r, Paris, cod. gr 1208, fol. 218v, ἀλλὰ θαρρῶ τῇ ἁκράτῳ τῆς παιδὸς καθαρσίτη; Homily 6, Vatican, cod. gr. 1162, fol. 170r, Paris, cod. gr 1208, fol. 225r, Δεύτερο λέγων ὑ γόνα.
90 Vatican, cod. gr. 1162, fol. 170r, Paris, cod. gr 1208, fol. 225r.
91 See Hennessy, Stepnum for more on this and full bibliography.
to Emperor Manuel I, the youngest of four sons, who ascended the throne in 1143 aged 25. If this were so, his youth in relation to his brothers might be emphasised. Manuel was twelve years younger than his eldest brother, Alexios (born 1106), and five years younger than the third son, Isaac (born 1113). The inclusion of an image of Christ Emmanuel, in the burning bush might reinforce this theory since Manuel had a particular interest in Christ Emmanuel and put the image on his coins.²

Returning to the Kariye Camii, there is also a well-developed sense of the Virgin’s coming of age. She appears in various scenes as a baby and small child, easily recognisable as she wears the familiar blue maphorion. She looks like a small girl when she takes her first seven steps at the age of six months, after which time she is not allowed to touch the ground until she is taken to the temple.³ She appears as a baby when carried by Joachim to be blessed by the priests on her first birthday and when

---

² Hendy does not reference the coins on pl. 12 as Emmanuel, but they appear to be so.
³ Underwood, Kariye scene 88, pls. 104–7, vol. 1, 68–9; Infancy Gospel (6:1).
cuddled by her parents in a scene called ‘the fondling of the Theotokos’ (fig. 13). She then appears as a little girl when at the age of three she is presented in the temple and fed by an angel and still as a little girl when Joseph is chosen to betroth her by the sprouting of his rod when she is aged twelve (Infancy Gospel 8:3; Carpenter 3). But suddenly then, in departing with Joseph to his house in the scene mentioned above, she has entered what one might term adolescence, since she is no longer a little girl, is taller while not full height and slight in body (fig. 9). So she is not fully mature when leaving for Joseph’s house, but when he departs, again with a son, to engage in some carpentry work, she has become mature, although according to the Infancy Gospel text this occurred only shortly after. According to the Story of Joseph the Carpenter, she conceives Christ at the point when ‘after the holy virgin had spent two years in his house her age was exactly fourteen years’ (Carpenter 4). And

Fig. 13 ‘The fondling of the Theotokos’ former Church of Our Saviour in the Chora, the Kariye Camii, Istanbul (Source: Cecily Hennessy)

94 Η κολακεία τῆς θεοτόκου; UNDERWOOD, Kariye vol. 1, 71.
95 UNDERWOOD, Kariye scenes 89, 90, 91, 92, 96, pls. 108–9, 114–5, 119–20, 122, 126–127, 138, 140, 142; vol. 1, 69–74, 79–80. The caressing of the Virgin is perhaps incorrectly placed here and should come after her first steps, when she is gathered up by her mother who declares she shall no longer walk on the ground, so that scene 90 follows scene 88. The Presentation in the Temple is the first of these scenes to feature not only in the Infancy Gospel (7:2), but also in the Pseudo-Matthew (4) and the Gospel of the Nativity of Mary (6). The Feeding by the Angel and the Virgin Entrusted to Joseph are also in all three, Infancy Gospel (81, 9:1–2), Pseudo-Matthew (6, 8), Gospel of the Nativity of Mary (7, 8).
96 UNDERWOOD, Kariye scene 97, pl. 97, pls. 143–4, vol. 1, 81–2. This scene is only in the Infancy Gospel (9:2) and Joseph the Carpenter (4).
97 UNDERWOOD, Kariye scene 99, pls. 148–9, vol. 1, 83–5; Infancy Gospel (9:11).
indeed she is mature in the census scene viewed before. These representations all seem to show a sensitive awareness of coming of age and the transitional phases in life. While the Virgin is dressed from the time of her babyhood in the same blue dress and veil, the nuanced distinctions to her size and facial features reveal a distinct recognition of the stages of maturation.

Finally, turning back to the Early Christian period in which the non-canonical texts developed that gave rise to these diverse images, it is intriguing to look at the portrayal of Christ and to consider to what extent his depiction was dependent on apocryphal texts. It was discussed how he appears youthful, as an adolescent or a ‘wise beyond his years’ boy, at the age of twelve teaching in Jerusalem, but in a broad range of Early Christian and Early Byzantine representations in other scenes, within the canonical events that occur during his maturity (that is after the age of 30), he appears beardless and with a youthful body, even in some contexts adolescent. Many examples exist prior to the sixth century in various media. On numerous sarcophagi, in many of which he is performing miracles, he has short curly hair, fine features and no sign of a beard, whereas all the mature characters such as Peter and Paul are bearded. An example is the sarcophagus of Marcus Claudianus, in the Museo nazionale delle Terme in Rome (fig. 14). Another striking example is the mo-

Fig. 14 Sarcophagus of Marcus Claudianus, in the Museo nazionale delle Terme in Rome, dated to 330–40, Museo nazionale delle Terme, Palazzo Massimo, Rome (Source: Cecily Hennessy)

98 UNDERWOOD, Kariye scene 101, pls. 159, 161, 163, vol. 1, 88–9, Luke (2:4–5), Infancy Gospel (17:1), Pseudo-Matthew (13).
99 Dated to 330–40, Museo nazionale delle Terme, Palazzo Massimo, Rome.
saic of the Baptism in the dome at the Arian baptistery in Ravenna, dated 500–530, where Christ appears as a fleshy youth with round shoulders and curving hips, wavy hair and beardless.\textsuperscript{100} This type of youthful portrayal has been discussed frequently, perhaps most persuasively by Thomas Mathews who argues that the likenesses are related to pagan gods such as Dionysius and Apollo, among other influences.\textsuperscript{101} The development of the iconography of Christ is beyond the scope of this essay, but it is possible that this type of youthful depiction was associated with a selection of texts that either mention Christ appearing ‘in the form of’ a boy or a child or he is described as a youth, as for example, ‘The saviour appeared in the form of a boy of twelve years’, (Acts of Peter and Andrew) and ‘I saw a beautiful youth covering her with this cloak’ (Acts of John 76).\textsuperscript{102} His youthful depiction is possibly explained by texts or, alternatively, the texts respond to images already prevalent. On the other hand, texts and images may reflect a cultural esteem for idealised youth and the visual appreciation of youthfulness in boys and girls in their transition towards adulthood.

Having looked at some of the problems of defining what adolescence was in Byzantium and having acknowledged that just in our culture it is not clear-cut, so it seems it was not then. Representations of youth, of girls and boys in the period between childhood and adulthood show subtle gradations between boy and man, girl and woman and appear to have been both customary and appreciated. In imagery of Christ’s family, his brothers and his mother, various portrayals also emphasise childhood and adolescence. In apocryphal iconography, the origin of the imagery is still not clear. This is a subject that could well be explored further as it seems that either various textual traditions are contributing to it or that the iconography seems to arise somewhat independently from texts and perhaps from more personalised issues associated with patronage or societal influences.

\textsuperscript{100} D. M. Deliyanis, Ravenna in Late Antiquity. New York 2010, figs. 61–2.
\textsuperscript{101} T. Mathews, The Clash of Gods: A Reinterpretation of Early Christian Art. Princeton 1993.
\textsuperscript{102} Elliott, Apocrypha 300, 332; on the Acts of Peter and Andrew, see Elliott, Apocrypha 241, 242–3; on the Acts of John, see Elliott, Apocrypha 303–310; for these and further examples, see D. Cartlidge – J. K. Elliott, Art and the Christian Apocrypha. London 2001, 58–9; for a summary of the various views, see Cartlidge, Art 53–61; also Mathews, Clash 139. Theories that the youthful appearance may have arisen in a Gnostic environment do not seem supported, and the Acts of John is no longer seen as a Gnostic text, see Elliott, Apocrypha 306–307; Cartlidge – Elliott, Art 60.