Prospects for laser cooling TlF
L. R. Hunter, S. K. Peck, A. S. Greenspon, S. Saad Alam, and D. DeMille
Phys. Rev. A 85, 012511 — Published 17 January 2012
DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevA.85.012511
On the Prospects for Laser Cooling of TIF

L.R. Hunter, S.K. Peck, A.S. Greenspon, and S. Saad Alam

Physics Department, Amherst College, Amherst, Massachusetts 01002, USA

D. DeMille

Department of Physics, P.O. Box 208120, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut 06520, USA
(Dated: December 27, 2011)

We measure the upper state lifetime and two ratios of vibrational branching fractions $f_{\nu'\nu}$ on the $B^3\Pi_1(\nu') - X^1\Sigma^+(\nu)$ transition of TIF. We find the B state lifetime to be 99(9) ns. We also determine that the off-diagonal vibrational decays are highly suppressed: $f_{01}/f_{00} < 2 \times 10^{-4}$ and $f_{02}/f_{00} = 1.10(6)\%$, in excellent agreement with their predicted values of $f_{01}/f_{00} < 8 \times 10^{-4}$ and $f_{02}/f_{00} = 1.0(2)\%$ based on Franck-Condon factors calculated using Morse and RKR potentials.

The implications of these results for the possible laser cooling of TIF and fundamental symmetries experiments are discussed.

The laser cooling of molecules presents a daunting challenge with potentially rich rewards. Transverse cooling and collimation of a cold molecular beam can be accomplished by scattering a few hundred photons from each molecule, while over 10,000 photons must be scattered to bring a typical molecule in the beam to rest. It is difficult to find molecular cycling transitions that will allow so many absorption and decay cycles without significant loss to the myriad of rotational and vibrational states present in most molecular systems. In addition, successful laser cooling requires that the excited state be relatively short lived, such that it can complete many absorption/emission cycles before leaving the laser interaction region. Despite these challenges, transverse cooling has recently been achieved in strontium monofluoride [1, 2].

In the present paper we explore the possibility of laser cooling thallium monofluoride (TIF). High precision searches for the Schiff moment and the proton electric dipole moment (EDM) have been carried out in beams of TIF [3, 4]. These experiments are tests of both parity (P) and time-reversal (T) symmetries. TIF exhibits a large enhancement in its sensitivity to such violations due to the large internal electric field of the molecule and thallium’s large atomic number $Z = 81$ [5]. It also displays a remarkable insensitivity to systematic effects associated with external magnetic fields. The TIF experiments were largely limited by the relatively broad line widths associated with the molecules’ rapid transit time through the apparatus, and the modest thermal populations of the state of interest. Using cryogenic beams and laser cooling, it may be possible to overcome these limitations and TIF might again emerge as an interesting candidate for measuring symmetry violations in the nucleus.

The transition $X^1\Sigma^+(\nu = 0, J^P = 1^-) - B^3\Pi_1(\nu' = 0, J'^P = 1^+)$ (where $J^P$ denotes the rotational angular momentum and parity) of TIF is an interesting candidate for a cycling transition. As we argue here, it appears that this transition should be highly closed to other (unwanted) electronic, vibrational, and rotational decay paths. We begin with a discussion of electronic decay paths. The only other electronic decay transition from the $B^3\Pi_1$ state is to the $A^3\Pi_0^+$ state (and its as-yet-unobserved $3\Pi_0^-$ partner). The branching fraction for this transition should be very small, according to the following logic. First, the transition frequency $\omega_{BA}$ for the $B$ transition is much smaller than that for the $B-X$ transition ($\omega_{BX}/\omega_{BA} \approx 22$). Moreover, the electric dipole (E1) matrix element $d_{BA}$ should be several times smaller than $d_{BX}$. This can be seen as follows. Namely, both the $B$-$X$ and $B$-$A$ E1 transitions are forbidden: the former requires a change in the total spin $S$ and the latter a change in the projection $\Sigma$ of $S$ along the internuclear axis. Both transitions acquire a non-zero matrix element due to off-diagonal mixing with other electronic states, via the spin-orbit (SO) interaction. For the $B-X$ transition, this occurs primarily due to mixing of the nearby $6\sigma 6\pi C^1\Pi_1$ state into the $6\sigma 6\pi B^3\Pi_1$ state; the admixed $6\sigma 6\pi C^1\Pi_1 - (6\sigma)^2X^1\Sigma^+$ transition is essentially a $6\sigma - 6\pi$ transition and hence very strong. However, due to selection rules for SO mixing ($\Delta S = \pm 1, 0$; $\Delta \Sigma = \pm 1, 0$; $\Delta \Lambda = \pm 1, 0$, where $\Lambda$ is the projection of orbital angular momentum along the internuclear axis; and $\Delta \Omega = 0$, where $\Omega = \Lambda + \Sigma$) [6], it can be verified that the $B$-$A$ transition requires SO mixing with another orbital configuration (or a second-order mixing if only the lowest-lying configurations are considered). The nearest relevant level is likely the as-yet-unobserved $3\Sigma^+$ state, which can mix into both the $B$ state and the $3\Pi_0$ state; however, this admixture leads only to a weak perpendicular-band [7] ($6\pi - 6\sigma$) transition. Taking into account all possibilities, we crudely estimate $d_{BX}/d_{BA} \approx 3$. Finally, since the decay rate $\Gamma \propto d^2\omega^3$, we estimate that $\Gamma_{BX}/\Gamma_{BA} \approx 10^5$. As such, unwanted $B$-$A$ decays are unlikely to significantly limit the cooling process.

Selection rules limit the rotational states of $X^1\Sigma^+$ accessible to the decay from the $B^3\Pi_1(\nu = 0, J^P = 1^+)$ state. In the absence of hyperfine structure (HFS), this state can decay only to $X^1\Sigma^+(J^P = 1^-)$, leading to a closed cycling transition. HFS can complicate this picture in several ways, so we describe its effects in detail here. First, consider the HFS splittings in both states
of the transition. In the $X^1\Sigma^+$ state the HFS is very small ($\sim 100$ kHz) [3]. In the $B^3\Pi_1$ state, the HFS interaction can be estimated from a simple scaling law (HFS is roughly proportional to Z) combined with the observed HFS in the isoelectronic species AlF [8]. Based on this, HFS interaction with the Tl nucleus ($I_{\text{Tl}} = \frac{1}{2}$ for both $^{205}\text{Tl}$ and $^{203}\text{Tl}$) can be substantial, with estimated $B^3\Pi_1(v' = 0, J'^P = 1^+)$ state HFS interaction strength of order $A_{\text{Tl}} \sim 1$ GHz, while HFS associated with the $^{19}\text{F}$ nucleus ($I_F = \frac{1}{2}$) should be much smaller ($A_F \lesssim 1$ MHz). Hence we define the intermediate angular momentum $F = J + I_{\text{Tl}}$ and the total angular momentum $F = F_1 + I_F$. The $B^3\Pi_1(v' = 0, J'^P = 1^+)$ state should split into well-resolved levels with $F' = F'_1 \pm \frac{1}{2}$, each of which will consist of a pair of closely-spaced levels with $F'' = F'_1 \pm \frac{1}{2}$. Cycling should be achievable on the $X^1\Sigma^+(J^P = 1^-, F_1, F) - B^3\Pi_1(J'^P = 1^+, F'_1 = \frac{1}{2}, F')$ manifold of nearly-degenerate transitions. In principle, off-diagonal mixing of different rotational levels due to HFS could allow unwanted rotational transitions and hence branching out of this cycle via decay to other $X^1\Sigma^+(J''\nu)$ levels. The effect of such mixing can be estimated by noting that the sublevels involved in this cycle can mix with other rotational sublevels of higher $J$, only because of the weak HFS interaction of $^{19}\text{F}$. Hence the maximum branching fraction $f_{J',\nu' \rightarrow J''\nu}$ to unwanted higher rotational states can be estimated from second-order perturbation theory as $f_{J',\nu' \rightarrow J''\nu} \sim \left(A_F/B^P_0\right)^2 \leq 10^{-8}$, where $B^P_0$ is the rotational constant in the $B^3\Pi_1$ state. Thus, using this particular HFS transition should enable cooling with little rotational loss. Figure 1 schematically depicts the cycling transition in the presence of HFS.

Because no selection rules limit the various possible vibrational transitions, branching to unwanted vibrational levels is typically the most challenging problem in the laser cooling of a molecule [9]. We have numerically calculated Franck-Condon factors (FCF) for the low lying vibrational transitions under various assumptions and approximations, in an attempt to quantify the uncertainties in their values. In all cases, precise spectroscopic data, suitable for determining both the $B^3\Pi_1$ and $X^1\Sigma^+$ state potentials, is taken from Ref. [10]. In one approach, we used the full set of tabulated Dunham coefficients for both states, using standard routines for determining RKR potentials and their associated FCFs [11]. However, we believe there are two significant ambiguities in this approach. First, the difference in effective rotational constants between $e$ and $f$-parity levels in the $B^3\Pi_1$ state, due to $\Omega$-doubling, has a non-negligible effect on the FCFs at the precision of interest here; it is not clear whether this difference is physically meaningful in terms of its effect on the molecular potentials. Second, the data in Ref. [10] includes the Dunham coefficient $Y_{20}$ (second vibrationally anharmonic term) only for the $B^3\Pi_1$ state, while the Dunham expansion terminates at $Y_{20}$ for the $X^1\Sigma^+$ state; it is unclear whether this inherent asymmetry in treatment of the potentials can lead to errors in the FCFs, particularly for higher vibrational levels of the $X$ state. Hence, we evaluated FCFs for RKR potentials with rotational Dunham coefficients of both $e$ and $f$-parity levels, and both with and without inclusion of the $Y_{20}$ term for the $B$ state. Finally, in order to quantify possible errors in the FCFs due to the stated uncertainties in the spectroscopic data, we evaluated the FCFs using Morse potentials and the associated analytic form of the vibrational wavefunctions [12]. Here we used the Dunham coefficients $Y_{10}$ and $Y_{20}$ for the harmonic and anharmonic vibrational terms of the Morse potential; for the $X$ state we used the Dunham coefficient $Y_{01}$ as the effective rotational constant to determine the internuclear separation $r_e = 2.084438$ Å, while for the $B$ state we used $r'_e = 2.0740(5)$ Å as derived in Ref. [10] from a combined potential fit to both $e$- and $f$-parity levels. Within this model we calculated FCFs with all input parameters varied within their stated ranges of uncertainty.

We quote a total uncertainty range for our calculated FCFs that incorporates all values obtained from these various calculations. The resulting Franck-Condon factors are shown in Table I. The FCF matrix is highly diag-

![Figure 1](image-url)
| $v'v$ | 0  | 1  | 2  | 3  | 4  | 5  | >6  |
|------|----|----|----|----|----|----|-----|
| 0    | 0.989(2) | < 0.0008 | 0.011(2) | < 0.0003 | < 0.0002 | < 0.0003 | < 0.0002 |
| 1    | < 0.0004 | 0.949(6) | 0.016(8) | 0.031(7) | < 0.006 | < 0.011 | < 0.002 |
| 2    | 0.010(2) | 0.03(2) | 0.77(6) | 0.09(5) | 0.08(2) | 0.03(2) | < 0.006 |

TABLE I: Calculated Franck-Condon Factors for the $X^1\Sigma^+ \rightarrow B^3\Pi_1$ transition of TlF. The primed (unprimed) vibrational quantum numbers refer to the excited (ground) electronic level. As described in the text, the central values and the uncertainties have been chosen to accommodate the variations in the predictions from the different model potentials and the uncertainties in the spectroscopic parameters used as input to the models.

Tableau 1: Facteurs de Franck-Condon Calculés pour la Transition $X^1\Sigma^+ \rightarrow B^3\Pi_1$ du TlF. Les nombres quantiques primés (non primés) des états vibratoires se réfèrent à l’état électronique excité (basique). Comme décrit dans le texte, les valeurs centrales et les incertitudes ont été choisis pour accommoder les variations des prédictions des différents potentiels de modèle et des incertitudes dans les paramètres spectroscopiques utilisés en input aux modèles.

Tabelle 1: Berechnete Franck-Condon Faktoren für die $X^1\Sigma^+ \rightarrow B^3\Pi_1$ Übergang des TlF. Die primierten (nicht primierten) vibrationellen Quantenzahlen beziehen sich auf den angeregten (grundzustands-) elektronischen Niveau. Wie in den Texten beschrieben, wurden die mittleren Werte und die Unsicherheiten ausgewählt, um die Variationen in den Vorhersagen der verschiedenen Modellpotentiale und den Unsicherheiten in den spektroskopischen Parametern zu ermöglichen, die verwendet wurden als input zu den Modellen.

...
TABLE II: A comparison of our measured and predicted ratios of branching fractions from the $B^3\Pi_1$, $v' = 0$ state to the various vibrational states $v$ of the $X^1\Sigma^+$ level in TlF. The branching fraction is taken as proportional to the Franck-Condon factor times the cube of the decay energy for that branch.

| Branching ratio | Theory | Experiment |
|-----------------|--------|------------|
| $f_{01}/f_{00}$ | < 0.0008 | < 0.0002 |
| $f_{02}/f_{00}$ | 0.010(2) | 0.0110(6) |

The B state lifetime also plays a critical role in assessing possible laser cooling schemes. To measure the lifetime, we feed our photomultiplier output into a multichannel scalar (Stanford Research SR430). The instrument sorts the emitted photon counts into sequential 5 ns bins. We fit this data with three parameters describing an exponential decay plus a constant background. Care is taken to avoid photon pile-up problems at the beginning of the decay. We measure the lifetime on the Q-branch bandhead as well as on the isolated rotational lines R23, R33, R43 and P61. Each measurement is done using two different phototube/amplifier assemblies. As a further check, additional lifetime measurements are made by simply averaging the decay fluorescence on a digital 300 MHz oscilloscope for the Q-branch bandhead and the lines R13, R23 and R33. The statistical uncertainty in the lifetime associated with any individual fit (Figure 3) is typically less than a few percent. We observe some variations in the fit lifetimes with the detection and analysis system used and the selection of the time interval chosen for the fit. The majority of these variations appear to be associated with our inability to completely remove an electronics background associated with the firing of the laser Q switch. We have chosen to quote an uncertainty in our measured lifetime that encompasses all of the observed variations. Combining the results from all of our measurements we conclude that the excited state lifetime is 99 (9) ns. To the best of our knowledge, this is the first lifetime measurement of the B state of TlF.

Next we consider the implications of our results for laser cooling and slowing of a TlF beam, and what this would mean for future experiments using TlF in tests of fundamental symmetries. We discuss two possible scenarios: one which simply uses an improved molecular beam, and another in which the TlF molecules could be slowed and trapped for much longer coherence time. First, consider the possibility of using lasers to transversely cool and collimate a beam of TlF. Our results suggest that with a cooling laser tuned to the Q1 line $X(v = 0, J = 1, F_1, F) \rightarrow B(v' = 0, J' = 1, F'_1 = \frac{1}{2}, F')$ at 271.7 nm and a single repump laser, tuned to the analogous HFS component of the Q1 line but on the $X(v = 2) \rightarrow B(v' = 0)$ transition at 278.8 nm, one should be able to achieve over a thousand cycles on the cooling transition. This will be sufficient for transverse cooling and collimation of a cryogenic TlF beam [14]. Such a beam would have significantly increased occupation of the low rotational and vibrational levels of the molecule, as well as significantly lower forward velocity, compared to previous work with TlF beams. Based on typical brightness, velocity distribution, and internal temperature achieved with this type of molecular beam source [14], plus a typical transverse velocity capture range (corresponding to a transverse temperature $\sim$ 5 mK) and final transverse temperature $\lesssim 300 \mu$K of laser cooling [1], we estimate crudely that an EDM experiment conducted in such a collimated cryogenic beam might achieve approximately two orders of magnitude improvement over the present TlF limit. This would yield limits on the proton EDM and Schiff moments comparable to those that have been achieved in the Hg EDM experiment [15].

Dramatic improvement in interaction time could be achieved if the beam can be stopped and trapped. A TlF cryogenic beam would likely have a mean velocity of about $\bar{v} \approx 150$ m/s [14]. Approximately $N = \frac{m \lambda}{\hbar} \approx 23,000$ photon absorption/emission cycles are needed to stop these molecules. To achieve this large
number of cycles will likely require additional repump lasers to keep the molecules from accumulating in the $X(v=1, 3, 4 \text{ and/or } 5)$ levels. These levels can be repumped either through excitations to the $B(v'=0 \text{ or } 2)$ levels or the $A^3\Pi_{0^+}(v'=0)$ state (see Table III) [16].

We consider an example of how the $A^3\Pi_{0^+}(v'=0)$ state might be of use in the repumping process. Assume that the $B(v'=0) \rightarrow X(v=1)$ decay has branching fraction $f_{01} = 0.0008$. Direct repumping on the transition $X(v=1) \rightarrow B(v'=0)$ would require a high power laser (comparable to that used for the cycling laser) to ensure saturation. (This is because the Rabi frequency for this weak transition must be at least equal to the partial decay width; hence the value of the branching fraction cancels in the required laser power.) In addition, such direct repumping leads to a reduction of the photon scattering rate, since population is on average distributed among more non-radiating ground-state sublevels [2]. If instead, one were to repump via the $A^3\Pi_{0^+}(v'=0)$ state, the situation would be more favorable. Here, the laser power needed to ensure that the Rabi frequency exceeds the $B(v'=0) \rightarrow X(v=1)$ partial decay width is much smaller since the $X(v=1) \rightarrow A^3(v'=0)$ transition is much stronger; moreover, the photon scattering rate is not diminished by such a repumping path.

Hence, with a few additional lasers it is likely that the beam could be stopped using the radiative force from photon scattering. Further measurements of the vibrational branching fractions for decays from $B(v'=0)$ to $X(v=1, 3, 4 \text{ and/or } 5)$, at a level of sensitivity beyond what we were able to achieve, will be needed to evaluate exactly what lasers will be needed for such a task.

With knowledge of the excited state lifetime, we can estimate the length of the apparatus required to carry out radiative force slowing. For a two level system, optimized spontaneous cooling allows one photon cycle to be completed in every two lifetimes of the excited state. In our $X(J=1)$ level of the ground state, the existence of dark Zeeman states will cause the photon cycling rate to decrease by about a factor of three [2]. (The remixing of these dark states into the optical cycle can be accomplished by rapid switching of the slowing lasers' polarization [17] or by resonant microwave transfer via the $X(J=0)$ level [2].) We estimate the length of the slowing region then would need to be about $L \approx 3\left(\frac{\tau}{\text{ns}}\right) 2\tau N \approx 1$ m, which is a reasonable length for a molecular beam apparatus.

Alternatively, the additional lasers for repumping the $X(v=1, 3, 4 \text{ and/or } 5)$ levels might be avoidable if other techniques for beam deceleration such as stimulated slowing [18] or Stark deceleration [19] were employed to slow the beam. However, each of these would certainly introduce additional complications. Overall, it is difficult to estimate the possible improvement of sensitivity to T-odd effects with an approach like this, since it will depend on details such as efficiency of trap loading, lifetime in the trap, etc. Nominally, to achieve a factor of $\sim 100$ improvement in sensitivity would require trapping $\sim 10^9$ molecules with lifetime $\sim 1$ sec. This is similar to what has been achieved using Stark deceleration to load a storage ring of molecules, even without the additional advantage of laser cooling (albeit using species with parameters chosen to optimize the efficiency of slowing and trapping) [20]. Hence, we believe that such an approach may be viable and deserves further investigation.

In summary, the $X^3\Sigma^+ - B^3\Pi_1$ transition looks quite promising for the laser cooling of TIF. While the simultaneous operation of several narrowband ultraviolet lasers will be costly, present laser technology can provide adequate power at the required excitation frequencies. If the cooling is successful, this should open up the possibility of a new generation of fundamental symmetries experiments in TIF with significantly improved sensitivity.

We wish to thank Dr. D. Krause Jr., R. Cann and N. Page for technical assistance and T. Shimasaki for calculations of RKR FCFs. This work was supported by funds from Amherst College; the National Science Foundation under Grant Nos. PHY-0855465 and PHY-1068575; ARO; and AFOSR-MURI.

[1] E.S. Shuman, J.F. Barry and D. DeMille, Nature 467, 820 (2010).
[2] E.S. Shuman, J.F. Barry, D.R. Glenn and D. DeMille, Phys. Rev. Lett. 103, 223001 (2009).
[3] E.A. Hinds and P.G. H. Sandars, Phys. Rev. A21, 480 (1980).
[4] D. Cho, K. Sangster and E.A. Hinds, Phys. Rev. Lett. 63, 2559 (1989); D. Cho, K. Sangster and E.A. Hinds, Phys. Rev. A44, 2783 (1991).
[5] P.G.H. Sandars, Phys. Rev. Lett. 19, 1396 (1967).
TABLE III: The Franck-Condon Factors for the $X^1Σ^+ \rightarrow A^3Π_0^+$ transition of TlF calculated using Morse potentials derived from the spectroscopic parameters of Ref. [16]. The primed (unprimed) vibrational quantum numbers refer to the excited (ground) electronic level. The uncertainties in the last digits listed in parentheses reflect the uncertainties in the spectroscopic data used to determine the Morse potential and do not reflect any limitations associated with the Morse potential model.

| $\nu'$\$\nu$ | 0     | 1     | 2     | 3     | 4     | 5     |
|-----------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| 0         | 0.89(1)| 0.087(1)| 0.018(1)| 0.0024(3)| 0.0003(1)| 0.00004(1)|
| 1         | 0.11(1)| 0.75(2)| 0.10(1)| 0.036(1)| 0.005(1)| 0.0010(2)|
| 2         | 0.0003(1)| 0.15(1)| 0.71(2)| 0.075(6)| 0.051(3)| 0.007(1)|

[6] J.M. Brown and A. Carrington, Rotational Spectroscopy of Diatomic Molecules (Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, UK, 2003).
[7] G. Herzberg, Molecular Spectra and Molecular Structure: I. Spectra of Diatomic Molecules, 2nd Ed. (Van Nostrand, New York, 1950).
[8] J.M. Brown et al., Phys. Scr. 17, 55 (1978).
[9] M.D. DiRosa, Eur. Phys. J. D 31, 395 (2004).
[10] U. Wolf and E. Tiemann, Mol. Phys. 65, 359 (1988); and references therein.
[11] R.J. Le Roy, Level 8.0: A Computer Program for Solving the Radial Schrödinger Equation for Bound and Quasibound Levels, University of Waterloo Chemical Physics Research Report CP-663 (2007); see http://leroy.uwaterloo.ca/programs/.
[12] J.A. Castaneda, M.A. Hernandez and R. Jauregui, Phys. Rev. A78, 023809 (2008).
[13] U. Wolf and E. Tiemann, Chem. Phys. 119, 407 (1988).
[14] N.R. Hutzler et al., Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys., 2011, Advance Article 13, 18976 (2011); J.F. Barry, E.S. Shuman, and D. DeMille, Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys. 13, 18936 (2011).
[15] W.C. Griffith et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 102, 101601 (2009).
[16] K.P. Huber and G. Herzberg, Constants of Diatomic Molecules (Van Nostrand Reinhold, New York, 1979).
[17] D.J. Berkeland and M.G. Boshier, Phys. Rev. A65, 033413 (2002).
[18] M.A. Chieda and E.E. Eyler, [arXiv:1108.3543v1] (2011); J. Söding, R. Grimm, Yu. B. Ovchinnikov, Ph. Bouyer, and Ch. Salomon, Phys. Rev. Lett. 78, 1420 (1997).
[19] M.R. Tarbutt et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 92, 173002 (2004).
[20] P.C. Zieger et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 105, 173001 (2010).