Visualization of the flat electronic band in twisted bilayer graphene near the magic angle twist

M. Iqbal Bakti Utama, Roland J. Koch, Kyunghoon Lee, Nicolas Leconte, Hongyuan Li, Sihan Zhao, Lili Jiang, Jiayi Zhu, Kenji Watanabe, Takashi Taniguchi, Paul D. Ashby, Alexander Weber-Bargioni, Alex Zettl, Chris Jozwiak, Jeil Jung, Eli Rotenberg, Aaron Bostwick and Feng Wang

Bilayer graphene has been predicted to host a moiré miniband with flat dispersion if the layers are stacked at specific twist angles known as the ‘magic angles’. Recently, twisted bilayer graphene (tBLG) with a magic angle twist was reported to exhibit a correlated insulating state and superconductivity, where the presence of the flat miniband in the system is thought to be essential for the emergence of these ordered phases in the transport measurements. Although tunneling spectroscopy and electronic compressibility measurements in tBLG have found a van Hove singularity that is consistent with the presence of the flat miniband, a direct observation of the flat dispersion in the momentum space of such a moiré miniband in tBLG is still lacking. Here, we report the visualization of this flat moiré miniband by using angle-resolved photoemission spectroscopy with nanoscale resolution. The high spatial resolution of this technique enabled the measurement of the local electronic structure of the tBLG. The measurements demonstrate the existence of the flat moiré band near the charge neutrality for tBLG close to the magic angle at room temperature.

An implication of an electronic band with flat momentum-space dispersion is the singularity in the density of states, leading to atomic-like discretization of the energy levels reminiscent of the Landau levels in the quantum Hall regime. If the Fermi level ($E_F$) of the material is tuned to lie at these singularities, the system can prefer to reduce the total electronic ground state energy via an energy gap opening that triggers the emergence of exotic quantum phase transitions. Thus, efforts to engineer flat bands around $E_F$ are an active research focus where major advances are being made in various lattice systems, including in the moiré superlattices with gapless and gapped Dirac Hamiltonians.

Graphitic systems are among the families of materials that can host flat electronic bands, with reports of high densities of states near van Hove singularities at high binding energies and reduction of band dispersion in rhombohedral multilayers near charge neutrality. More recently, tBLG has emerged as a promising system due to its excellent tunability: in the degree of interlayer hybridization with twist angle and in the possibility of using in situ electrostatic gating for adjusting $E_F$ to occupy the flat moiré minibands or to achieve commensurate filling. The quenching of quasiparticle kinetic energy following the reduced miniband bandwidth at the magic angle is conducive to the emergence of interaction-driven phase transitions. Partial filling of the flat miniband in tBLG has resulted in the observation of correlated insulator, superconductivity and orbital magnetism. Richer physics may also arise by accounting for the sample environment, such as the ferromagnetism in magic angle tBLG with alignment to the hexagonal boron nitride (hBN) substrate.

Here, we visualize the weak dispersion of the flat moiré miniband in tBLG near the magic angle twist with angle-resolved photoemission spectroscopy with nanoscale resolution (nanoARPES). ARPES provides a unique capability to resolve the $k$-space dispersion of the flat band. The high spatial resolution of nanoARPES enabled by the capillary focusing (~1 µm beam spot size, see Methods) is beneficial to counteract local structural inhomogeneity within the sample. The flat band is present even at room temperature near $E_F$ around the original K points of the constituent graphene monolayers.

Figure 1a shows the configuration of the sample. The sample was fabricated via a tear-and-stack method for controlled twist angle combined with stack inversion (see Methods). This method allows production of uncapped tBLG on a flat hBN flake to minimize surface roughness (also see Supplementary Fig. 3b) and thus achieve improved momentum resolution during the photoemission spectroscopy. Figure 1b is an optical image of such a graphene sample on hBN, where the borders of the isolated monolayers and the tBLG region are indicated as determined from atomic force microscopy (AFM) in Fig. 1c. Scanning photoemission microscopy (SPM; Fig. 1d,e) that maps the real space distribution of generated photoelectrons from the valence band of graphene and hBN confirms the sample configuration. The intensity of the signal arising from graphene correlates with the layer number: the middle region has a stronger signal than the two sandwiching regions, matching the expected location of the monolayer and tBLG segments as demarcated in Fig. 1b. Similarly, the reduction of the hBN signal also correlates qualitatively with the attenuation from the different graphene thickness at each segment.
Fig. 1 | tBLG near magic angle twist on hBN substrate. a–c, Schematic illustration of the tBLG/hBN/doped Si sample (a), bright field optical micrograph (b) and AFM image of the sample (c). The boundary of each segment is indicated as follows: blue, lower graphene monolayer; red, upper graphene monolayer; purple: tBLG area. d, e, SPEM image generated from real space mapping of the valence band spectra and integrating the signal of hBN (d) and the signal of graphene (e). A larger area scan covering the entire hBN flake is given as the inset in d. The approximate intensity corresponding to monolayer and tBLG is marked in the colour scale of e. The flat band in tBLG is indicated with a purple arrow.

Figure 1f,g shows the ARPES spectra collected from the lower graphene monolayer and the tBLG from locations as indicated in Fig. 1c. The monolayer spectrum shows the typical linear band dispersion characteristic for graphene and the sample is approximately charge neutral as the Dirac point is situated close to the Fermi level. Faint Dirac cone replicas are also seen surrounding the primary cone. The formation of these replicas is a result of the superlattice periodicity between hBN and graphene (further details are discussed in Supplementary Fig. 4). On the other hand, the spectrum from the tBLG area shows a sharp feature near the Fermi level corresponding to the flat electronic band. Subsequent discussion will be focused on the tBLG data (microscopy in Fig. 2 and nanoARPES in Fig. 3) that are collected from this location.

It is important to fabricate the twist angle of the tBLG close to the first magic angle (~1°) as previous ARPES measurements on tBLG with other much smaller26 or larger19,27 twist angles did not observe any flat band signatures. Also, the twist angle in tBLG is sensitive to disorder, strain and temperature treatment that may alter the local twist angle from the intended design. To confirm the local twist angle at tBLG sites where the flat band was observed in nanoARPES, we performed microwave impedance microscopy (MIM) imaging after completing the nanoARPES measurements (Fig. 2, also see Supplementary Fig. 3).

The MIM was measured exactly at the location where we observed the flat band from nanoARPES as shown in Figs. 1g and 3. This method, combined with the fact that MIM was done after nanoARPES, ensured that the twist angle that we determined represented the actual sample condition during the nanoARPES measurement. Inhomogeneity of the sample at other locations elsewhere is not an issue for our experiment. Likewise, the fabrication details and processing before the nanoARPES measurement (for example, the absence of top hBN and pre-nanoARPES annealing) are not relevant in the MIM imaging.

The imaginary part of the complex microwave response (MIM-Im) in general increases monotonically as a function of the local sample conductivity23. Therefore, MIM-Im serves as a viable means to probe the moiré superlattice as an alternative to topographic imaging (Supplementary Fig. 2) and to conductive AFM mode while not requiring grounding electrodes. Figure 2a shows the real space MIM-Im map of the tBLG location with the flat band feature. The MIM-Im signal presents a periodic modulation with sixfold rotational symmetry from the moiré pattern, a result of the misalignment of the constituent graphene monolayers. From the fast Fourier transform of the image (Fig. 2b), we can deduce an averaged real-space periodicity of 14.7 ± 0.4 nm, corresponding to a graphene/graphene twist angle of θ = (0.96 ± 0.03)°. Such periodicity can also be well-resolved directly in the line profile of the signal (Fig. 2c,d).

Figure 3 shows the photoemission spectra of the tBLG around the K points of the original Brillouin zone (BZ) from the constituent monolayers. The flat electronic bands are present near E_F as also visualized experimentally along the various momentum cuts of the spectra in Fig. 3c–f. Here, the cutting geometries are shown as the inset in each panel following the schematic in Fig. 3a, where we also show the construction of the mini Brillouin zone (mBZ, in purple) of the tBLG from the original monolayer graphene BZs (red and blue). At the Fermi surface, the signal from the flat band is distributed around two intensity centres (Fig. 3b, top left). These distributions may originate from the states near the K point of the constituent upper and lower monolayer graphene, where the
features from the lower monolayer appear to be dimmer due to photoelectron attenuation.

Previous calculation of the band structure in magic angle tBLG predicted that the flat band feature should exist across the whole of the mBZ of the tBLG (ref. 3). In agreement with the calculations, our nanoARPES measurement shows that the flat band subtends the entire area of the mBZ. This can be seen in Fig. 3b (top row), where the flat band feature at the Fermi surface covers the entire area of the mBZ (the mBZ size is shown as the purple hexagon in the insets of Fig. 3b for comparison). The flat band subtends a width of ~0.1 Å−1 along kx, which is around twice as large as the k − γ − K width of the mBZ of ~0.06 Å−1. The wide momentum extent of the flat band is consistent with the strong real space localization of carriers occupying these states. Such extendedness of the flat band states, along with the small outgoing branches away from the K points, can also be reproduced in the ab initio-informed tight-binding simulation of the spectral function (Fig. 3b, top right). We have also eliminated the possibilities that the flat band in our tBLG originates from surface roughness (Supplementary Fig. 3), van Hove singularity around the hybridization gap (Supplementary Fig. 5), the bottom of the dispersing band (Supplementary Fig. 6), detector response issue and states from the graphene/hBN interface (Supplementary Fig. 7).

At higher binding energies, the equal energy cuts and the band dispersions also show the emergence of multiple Dirac cones. This observation indicates the hybridization of the Dirac cones of the two monolayers due to a strong interlayer coupling of the constituent monolayers, as is expected for small twist angles and the periodic repetition of the moiré mBZ. This is different from ‘decoupled’ bilayer graphene at large twist angles, where the band dispersion can be approximated by the two non-perturbed bands of the individual monolayers. Moreover, the periodic potential from the tBLG moiré superlattice is responsible for the avoided gaps that further split the bands19. Such emergence of extra bands away from the Fermi level has also been observed in other tBLG on non-hBN substrates19,27, although in our sample the hybridized bands formed at lower binding energies due to the smaller twist angle.

Using the same choice of axes as for Fig. 3c,e, we performed a simulation of the spectral function and the results are shown in Fig. 3g,h (see Methods and the Supplementary Information for details). The simulated spectrum can reproduce qualitatively the salient features of the ARPES band dispersion, including the flat band at EF and the emergence of multiple Dirac cones.

We compare the uniqueness of our flat band observation in tBLG relative to that in other graphitic systems in the following. Some of the previously observed flat state near the top of the valence band is based on multilayered rhombohedral stacking12,15,17, in which the massive character of the state is explained by a model where the band edge dispersion decreases with increasing layer number. Several other studies11,13,16 are based on epitaxial graphene on SiC(0001), where the degree of the band flatness is derived not from symmetry considerations but from the special environment of the substrate or doping coverage, thus creating a particular...
combination of hopping parameters and field gradient strength of the interface. Meanwhile, the flat band in tBLG arises from symmetry considerations due to the moiré potential from the twisting. The flat band in tBLG occurs only when the bilayer is twisted to magic angle (compare with Supplementary Fig. 5 for $\theta = 3.5^\circ$). No uniform stacking order in bilayer graphene (for example AB or AA stacking) will give rise to a flat band. Such moiré physics is absent in the flat band of graphitic systems in previous studies. In particular, the moiré physics in magic angle tBLG has enabled the striking observations of novel correlated insulator states and superconductivity that are attributed to the emerging flat band and it has been the most active research topic in current condensed matter physics.

Although detailed scanning tunnelling microscopy measurements have been performed on magic angle tBLG (refs. 6–8), quasiparticle interference is only available for large angle tBLG (ref. 23). A direct visualization of the flat band dispersion in a moiré superlattice using nanoARPES, such as that presented in our work, would therefore be beneficial for a more quantitative understanding of the moiré physics in magic angle tBLG. It is thus also of interest to perform detailed nanoARPES studies on other moiré superlattice-induced flat bands in related van der Waals heterostructure systems, including their behaviour at different filling factors with in situ electrostatic gating 18,24.

**Online content**

Any methods, additional references, Nature Research reporting summaries, source data, extended data, supplementary information, acknowledgements, peer review information; details of author contributions and competing interests; and statements of data and code availability are available at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41567-020-0974-x.

Received: 28 October 2019; Accepted: 19 June 2020; Published online: 27 July 2020
References

1. Bistritzer, R. & MacDonald, A. H. Moiré bands in twisted double-layer graphene. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 108, 12233–12237 (2011).

2. Suárez Morell, E., Correa, J. D., Vargas, P., Pacheco, M. & Barticevic, Z. Flat bands in slightly twisted bilayer graphene: tight-binding calculations. Phys. Rev. B 82, 121407 (2010).

3. Cao, Y. et al. Correlated insulator behaviour at half-filling in magic-angle graphene superlattices. Nature 556, 80–84 (2018).

4. Bistritzer, R. & MacDonald, A. H. Moiré bands in twisted double-layer graphene. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 108, 12233–12237 (2011).

5. Choi, Y. et al. Electronic correlations in twisted bilayer graphene near the magic angle. Nat. Phys. 6, 109–113 (2010).

6. Teruel, S. et al. Electrostatic potential effects and flat bands in twisted bilayer graphene. Phys. Rev. B 98, 205407 (2018).

7. Lai, K. et al. Nanoscale electronic inhomogeneity in In2Se3 nanoribbons resolved by nanospot angle-resolved photoemission spectroscopy. Nano Lett. 17, 1564–1568 (2017).

8. Peng, H. et al. Substrate doping effect and unusually large angle van hove singularity evolution in twisted bi- and multilayer graphene. Sci. Rep. 6, 245421 (2018).

9. Marchenko, D. et al. Extremely flat band in bilayer graphene. Nature 573, 91–95 (2019).

10. Kerelsky, A. et al. Maximized electron interactions at the magic angle in twisted bilayer graphene. Nature 572, 95–100 (2019).

11. Xie, Y. et al. Spectroscopic signatures of many-body correlations in magic-angle twisted bilayer graphene. Nature 572, 101–105 (2019).

12. Tomarken, S. L. et al. Extended van hove singularity and superconducting instability in doped graphene. Phys. Rev. Lett. 104, 136803 (2010).

13. Pierucci, D. et al. Evidence for flat bands near the fermi level in epitaxial rhombohedral multilayer graphene. ACS Nano 9, 5432–5439 (2015).

14. Sharpe, A. L. et al. Emergent ferromagnetism near three-quarters filling in twisted bilayer graphene. Phys. Rev. Lett. 124, 166601 (2020).

15. Wang, E. et al. Gaps induced by inversion symmetry breaking and second-generation dirac cones in graphene/hexagonal boron nitride. Nat. Phys. 12, 1111–1115 (2016).

16. Bultinck, N., Chatterjee, S. & Zaletel, M. P. Mechanism for anomalous half ferromagnetism in twisted bilayer graphene. Phys. Rev. Lett. 124, 166601 (2020).

17. Sharpe, A. L. et al. Emergent ferromagnetism near three-quarters filling in twisted bilayer graphene. Science 365, 605–608 (2019).

Publisher’s note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.
© The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Limited 2020
Methods

Fabrication and structural characterization. We followed the tear-and-stack fabrication method to control the twist angle\(^{35}\). The step-by-step process is illustrated in Supplementary Fig. 1. We exfoliated a monolayer graphene and a 20 nm thick hBN flake on a Si substrate with 285 nm thick SiO\(_2\) film. We then used a stamp with polypropylene carbonate (PPC) coating. All pick-up processes were performed at 45 °C. We first picked up the hBN with the stamp and used the flake to pick part of the monolayer graphene. The substrate, mounted on a rotation stage, was then rotated by an angle of ~1.1°. The remaining monolayer segment was then picked up to overlap with the monolayer already on the hBN, producing a tBLG. The PPC film was peeled from the stamp and transferred onto a clean highly doped Si substrate. Finally, the sample was annealed in vacuum at 250 °C for 3 h to remove the PPC film.

NanoARPES measurement. The sample was transported to the Microscopic and Electronic Structure Observatory (MAESTRO) at the Advanced Light Source where it was inserted in the nanoARPES UHV endstation with a base pressure lower than 5 x 10\(^{-11}\) mbar. The sample was annealed at 150 °C for 24 h prior to the measurement in order to desorb adsorbates. The nanoARPES measurement was performed with capillary focusing using a photon energy of 95 eV (except for Supplementary Fig. 4c–d which was measured at 147 eV) and a beam spot size of approximately 1 μm. The data were collected using a hemispherical Scienta R4000 electron analyser. The net energy resolution of the nanoARPES data was around 34 meV. All measurements were carried out at room temperature.

Scanning probe microscopy. After completing the nanoARPES measurement, the sample was collected and MIM measurement was performed at ambient conditions without re-annealing to preserve the twist angle and the sample condition. The MIM characterization was carried out with a modified Asylum MFP-3D AFM with commercial ScanWave electronics and coaxially shielded probes (PrimeNano Inc).\(^{34}\). A microwave frequency of 2.9 GHz was sent to the tip followed by the collection of the reflected signals. The MIM signal was measured concurrently with the topographic imaging. The MIM measurement was conducted in contact mode with sub-10 nm lateral resolution. Additional AFM imaging to measure the topography was also performed with Asylum Cypher VRS and Park NX-10 instruments.

Spectral function simulation. The unfolded band structure of tBLG was calculated using a tight-binding model informed from ab initio density functional theory calculations for the atomic and electronic structures. A twist angle of 0.97° containing a total of 14,288 atoms in the supercell was used in the simulation. The atomic structure calculation included the relaxation effects through LAMMPS containing a total of 14,288 atoms in the supercell was used in the simulation. The calculated using a tight-binding model informed from ab initio density functional Spectral function simulation.

References

32. Kim, K. et al. van der Waals heterostructures with high accuracy rotational alignment. *Nano Lett.*, 16, 1989–1995 (2016).
33. Cao, Y. et al. Superlattice-induced insulating states and valley-protected orbits in twisted bilayer graphene. *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 117, 116804 (2016).
34. Plimpton, S. Fast parallel algorithms for short-range molecular dynamics. *J. Comp. Phys.*, 117, 1–19 (1995).
35. L. Leconte, N., An, J. J., Javvaji, J. & Jung, J. Relaxation effects in twisted bilayer graphene: a multiscale approach. Preprint at https://arxiv.org/abs/1910.12805 (2019).
36. V. Ku, W., Berlijn, T. & Lee, C.-C. Unfolding first-principles band structures. *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 104, 216401 (2010).
37. Jung, J. & MacDonald, A. H. Accurate tight-binding models for the Fermi level in energy space.
38. Wen, M., Carr, S., Fang, S., Kaxiras, E. & Tadmor, E. Dihedral-angle-corrected registry-dependent interlayer potential for multilayer graphene structures.
39. Jung, J. & MacDonald, A. H. Accurate tight-binding models for the Fermi level in energy space.
40. Ku, W., Berlijn, T. & Lee, C.-C. Unfolding first-principles band structures.