Maternal and neonatal services in Ethiopia: measuring and improving quality
Maureen E Canavan,a Marie A Brault,a Dawit Tatek,b Daniel Burssa,b Ayele Teshome,b Erika Linnanderb & Elizabeth H Bradleya

Introduction
Maternal mortality remains high in most low- and middle-income countries, and poor quality of intrapartum care limits further progress. Pregnancy- or childbirth-related complications lead to more than 380 preventable deaths of women per day in these countries. Researchers have underscored the importance of improving the quality of labour and delivery care for continued reduction in preventable maternal and neonatal deaths.

Reliable and valid evaluation of quality of intrapartum care is paramount for addressing high maternal and neonatal mortality rates in low- and middle-income countries; yet progress has been slow. Recent efforts to develop and validate instruments for use in sub-Saharan Africa are encouraging, but experience integrating such tools into routine practice is limited. Studies of the quality of maternal and neonatal care in low- and middle-income countries largely focus on evaluating the quality of a single intervention rather than multiple aspects of intrapartum care, and often in one hospital at a single point in time, thus limiting the generalizability of the findings. Furthermore, few studies have reported on quality measurement efforts embedded in broader national and international quality improvement strategies; this limits their impact globally.

We sought to develop and test a method of measuring the quality of maternal and neonatal care that could be embedded in a larger national performance management initiative. We undertook the study in Ethiopia, where facility-based births are increasing, and where the country has invested in hospital quality improvement since 2003. Although we were unable to measure patient outcomes, we examined both processes of care and the capacity of facilities to provide quality-of-care processes, with a focus on elements of intrapartum care.

Local setting
In 2014, as part of national hospital reform efforts, the Ethiopian Federal Ministry of Health identified the quality of hospital-based labour and delivery care as key priorities for improvement. The medical services directorate of the health ministry convened a committee of ministry staff and international partners to create a tool and a protocol for conducting site visits and collecting data on intrapartum care quality. We piloted and evaluated the tool and assessment process in the 18 hospitals within the Ethiopia Alliance for Hospital Quality Improvement. The alliance is a national quality collaborative initiative, in which the approximately 140 government hospitals are each assigned to a cluster with one lead hospital to work on prioritized hospital quality issues. Lead hospital status is therefore an indicator of generally better performance and special responsibility to promote and coordinate quality improvement efforts within a hospital cluster. In the first 18-month cycle, the priority quality target was adherence to the national guidelines for reforming hospital management. The second 18-month cycle focused on improving patient satisfaction, and the third cycle focused on improving hospital labour and delivery care.

Components of the hospital performance management framework in Ethiopia have previously been described in detail. The assessment tool and process of evaluation was
integrated into existing mechanisms within the 18 lead hospitals, with the potential for scale-up to all government hospitals. Here, we report the experience of implementing the tool in these hospitals.

Approach

A longitudinal study was conducted in all the 18 lead hospitals. They represented hospitals from the five most populous regions of Ethiopia. Baseline data from 2015 showed that on average (mean values), these hospitals had 136 inpatient beds (standard deviation, SD: 71 beds), provided 113 937 (SD: 68 431) outpatient visits and 7091 (SD: 4492) inpatient admissions annually, and had 2893 (SD: 1835) deliveries. Hospitals were staffed by an average of 24 (SD: 11) physicians (including 3 surgeons) and 131 (SD: 42) nurses.

We developed the assessment tool (available from the corresponding author) from the Ethiopian National maternal and newborn care service guidelines (Bursa D, Ethiopian Ministry of Health, unpublished data, February 2015) and the World Health Organization's Service availability and readiness assessment tool. The tool focused on areas of anticipated gaps and health ministry priorities, based on previous performance indicator reports from key national hospitals. It included a total of 110 items within nine domains. In four domains (antenatal care facility assessment; emergency obstetric care services; caesarean section care; and case management of postpartum haemorrhage and eclampsia) researchers checked for the presence or absence of specific items in the medical records (e.g. medication prescriptions, nursing care plans, progress notes and discharge notes). In the remaining five domains (basic infrastructure; paediatric care; laboratory services; accessibility of guidelines and auditing efforts; and infection protection and patient safety), researchers completed the instrument using data from direct observations (e.g. for the presence or absence of infrastructure elements, and services and tools in emergency obstetric wards).

Data were collected by staff from the medical services directorate of the Ethiopian Federal Ministry of Health and regional health bureaus, the Clinton Health Access Initiative (Addis Ababa, Ethiopia) and Yale University (New Haven, United States of America). The data collectors were trained to conduct observations and medical record reviews by trainers selected by the health ministry. The training was conducted in Addis Ababa over a period of 1 week.

Two or three data collectors made a 3-day site visit to each lead hospital. At visits, one researcher focused on the review of medical records (requiring about 1.5 days per hospital), while at least two other researchers conducted observations, which lasted 1.5 days, for a total sample of 24 days of observation in the 18 hospitals. In each hospital, 19 medical records were chosen using systematic random sampling from the last 12 months of birth records for a total sample of 342 records.

Baseline data were collected in June and July 2015 and follow-up data were collected in February and March 2016. We calculated overall quality scores (items met divided by total items in the instrument) as well as domain-specific scores for the different subgroups of services, at baseline and follow-up within each domain. We computed paired t-tests to determine the statistical significance of changes in the overall and domain-specific mean quality scores.

Between baseline and follow-up, the Ethiopia Alliance for Hospital Quality provided training on labour and delivery services for staff at the lead hospitals. Most of the training took place on site and included: refresher training on comprehensive emergency obstetric care for physicians and midwives; maternity services auditing (a new tool developed by the central team); management, analysis and use of data by quality improvements teams, hospital senior management and department heads; medical equipment management for biomedical staff; and customer service training for staff from all disciplines. The trainers were experts selected from the health ministry, Yale University and other partners and government agencies. The average training period was 3 days.

Relevant changes

At baseline the overall mean quality score across the 18 hospitals was 65.6 (SD: 10.5) out of a possible 110 (Table 1). We found a significant improvement in quality scores from baseline to follow-up in eight of the nine domains (P < 0.05 to < 0.001). The overall summary score increased to 91.2 (SD: 12.4) out of 110 after the training intervention (P < 0.001; Table 1).

Lessons learnt

We found that the measurement method (direct observation and medical record reviews) was generally successful, requiring a total of 3 days and two or three trained surveyors per hospital visit (Box 1). The process produced data sensitive enough to detect changes made during less than a year of quality improvement efforts. With 110 items relevant to processes of intrapartum care and facility capacity to implement such processes, the instrument provided a feasible approach to identify gaps and opportunities for improvement. We documented statistically significant improvements in almost all domains of quality at these 18 hospitals. The findings are encouraging for future quality measurement efforts in low- and middle-income countries, although the instrument would benefit from additional testing and validation. The tool and data described here represent an approach that has been embedded in Ethiopia’s hospital performance management initiative and the Ethiopia Alliance for Hospital Quality, which may enhance the sustained focus on quality of maternal and neonatal care.

The process met several key challenges. First, due to constraints of staffing, cost and time, we were unable to measure patient outcomes and had to depend on a combination of direct observation and chart reviews to obtain data. Often charts were incomplete, which was noted; more complete medical records would facilitate more precise quality measurement efforts. Second, the process required substantial financial and time investments and we could only accomplish the site visits for 18 hospitals. However, we found that having lead hospitals demonstrate the feasibility of the instrument helped promote its wider acceptance, as other hospitals seek to achieve the national recognition given to the lead hospitals. Third, clinical observations may have overestimated the use of quality processes, given that people may alter their behaviour when they know they are being observed. Additionally, it is possible that our chart reviews may have overestimated the use of quality processes, if incomplete records were more common when quality of care
Lessons from the field

Maternal and neonatal services in Ethiopia
Maureen E Canavan et al.

was worse. Our measure was therefore interpreted as an upper limit on quality processes. Nevertheless, the methods still produced useful data on changes over time. Last, we learnt that embedding such measurement in national hospital performance management efforts can help raise the visibility of such efforts, sustain needed resources for data collection and analysis, and prompt hospitals to make changes. The linking of performance, as measured by this process, to financial rewards for top performing and most improved hospitals was reported to have motivated hospitals to understand and improve their quality data. The process also helped to highlight clear gaps on which to focus future national quality improvement efforts by the medical services directorate and health ministry.

Competing interests: None declared.

Table 1. Change in scores on quality of maternal and neonatal services measures from baseline to follow-up among 18 lead hospitals in Ethiopia, 2015–2016

| Domains of maternal and neonatal services | No. of items per domain | Baseline\(^a\) | Follow-up\(^a\) | P-value\(^b\) |
|------------------------------------------|-------------------------|---------------|----------------|-------------|
|                                          |                         | Mean quality score (SD) | % of items met\(^c\) | Mean quality score (SD) | % of items met\(^c\) |
| Basic infrastructure score               | 8                       | 5.5 (1.1)    | 68.8           | 6.7 (1.1)    | 83.4         | 0.043        |
| Antenatal care facility assessment       | 9                       | 6.6 (1.6)    | 73.6           | 8.1 (0.7)    | 89.8         | 0.010        |
| Emergency obstetric care                 | 33                      | 21.8 (4.0)   | 66.0           | 28.1 (5.3)   | 85.1         | <0.001       |
| Caesarean section delivery               | 16                      | 10.3 (2.2)   | 64.6           | 12.1 (2.8)   | 75.9         | 0.064        |
| Case management of postpartum haemorrhage and eclampsia | 10                      | 6.5 (1.6)    | 65.4           | 7.8 (1.3)    | 77.7         | 0.013        |
| Paediatric care                          | 12                      | 6.3 (2.7)    | 52.8           | 10.2 (2.1)   | 84.8         | <0.001       |
| Laboratory service                       | 5                       | 3.7 (1.0)    | 73.4           | 4.4 (0.7)    | 88.0         | 0.014        |
| Guidelines and auditing                  | 7                       | 3.7 (1.9)    | 53.1           | 4.9 (1.8)    | 69.4         | 0.044        |
| Infection protection and patient safety  | 10                      | 6.2 (2.1)    | 62.2           | 8.9 (1.5)    | 89.4         | <0.001       |
| Total maternal and neonatal service score | 110                     | 65.6 (10.5)  | 59.6           | 91.2 (12.4)  | 82.9         | <0.001       |

SD: standard deviation.

\(^{a}\) Baseline data were collected in June and July 2015; follow-up data in February and March 2016. There were no missing data from any items, domains or hospitals. Between baseline and follow-up, staff from the Ethiopia Hospital Alliance for Quality provided hospital-based training on labour and delivery services. Domain-specific quality scores for each hospital are number of items met divided by number of items in domain. Mean quality scores for each domain are the total hospital quality scores divided by 18 to obtain mean quality scores.

\(^{b}\) t-tests.

\(^{c}\) Percentages of items met in the domain are mean score of hospitals divided by number of items.

Notes: Lead hospitals were those selected by the Ethiopian Federal Ministry of Health based on their high performance relative to the Ethiopian Hospital reform implementation guidelines standards in Addis Ababa and the five most populous regions of Ethiopia (Afar, Amhara, Oromia, Tigray and the Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples Region).

Box 1. Summary of main lessons learnt

- The tool and process for assessing quality of intrapartum care in hospitals in Ethiopia was feasible to implement, requiring 3-day site visits by two or three data collectors.
- The process produced data sensitive enough to detect significant changes made during less than 1 year of national quality improvement efforts by the Ethiopia Hospital Alliance for Quality.
- Informed by the World Health Organization’s service availability and readiness assessment instrument, the tool provided a feasible approach to identify gaps and opportunities for improvements in quality.

ملخص

خدمات الأمهات وحديثي الولادة في إثيوبيا: قياس الجودة النوعية وتحسينها.

العوامل مثل مراقبة الأمراض ووفيات الأمهات وحديثي الولادة مرتفع في البلدان المتوسطة الدخل، بالإضافة إلى ضعف الجودة النوعية للرعاية أثناء الولادة والتي تشكل عائقًا أمام إحراز المزيد من التقدم.

لقد قمنا بتطوير وتطبيق طريقة لقياس الجودة النوعية وتحسينها في 18 مستشفى في إثيوبيا، بالإضافة إلى ضعف الجودة النوعية للرعاية أثناء الولادة والتي تشكل عائقًا أمام إحراز المزيد من التقدم.

لقد استثمرت إثيوبيا في تحسين الجودة النوعية في مستشفيات المحلية على مدى أكثر من عقد من الزمان، وتم دمج هذه المعلومات المحلية في تحسين الجودة النوعية للمستشفيات على مدار أكثر من عقد من الزمان، وتم دمج هذه

Bull World Health Organ 2017;95:473–477 | doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.2471/BLT.16.178806 475
埃塞俄比亚孕产妇及新生儿服务：质量衡量与改进

此方法已在埃塞俄比亚医院集群内部推进并协调质量改进工作。通过拜访 18 家医院并提供区域质量改进培训，该方法能够提供监测为期 8 个月的国家医院质量改进工作中所取得的重大变化的数据。通过其它重复性研究，此方法在其它中低收入国家可能会有使用价值。

问题 由于分娩护理质量较差，阻碍进一步发展，导致中低收入国家的孕产妇及新生儿死亡率仍然居高不下。方法 我们制定并测试了一个衡量孕产妇及新生儿护理质量的方法，该方法可被纳入大型国家绩效管理举措中。该方法采用直接观察与医疗记录审查对九大分娩护理领域的质量进行评分。我们通过拜访 18 家医院并提供区域质量改进培训，该方法能够提供监测为期 8 个月的国家医院质量改进工作中所取得的重大变化的数据。通过其它重复性研究，此方法在其它中低收入国家可能会有使用价值。
Resumen

Servicios maternos y neonatales en Etiopía: cálculo y mejora de la calidad

La mortalidad materna y neonatal sigue siendo alta en países con ingresos bajos y medios, siendo la escasa calidad de atención durante el parto un impedimento para hacer progresos.

Enfoque
Se desarrolló y probó un método de cálculo de la calidad de la atención materna y neonatal que podría aplicarse en una gran iniciativa nacional de gestión del rendimiento. La herramienta utilizó observaciones directas y revisiones de historiales médicos para puntuar la calidad en nueve dominios de atención durante el parto. La herramienta se piloto y evaluó en visitas a los 18 hospitales más importantes con responsabilidad para fomentar y coordinar esfuerzos de mejora de la calidad de un conglomerado de hospitales en Etiopía. Entre las primeras evaluaciones y las de seguimiento, el personal de una colaboración nacional de calidad proporcionó formación hospitalaria sobre el parto.

Marco regional
Etiopía ha invertido en mejoras de la calidad de los hospitales durante más de una década y esta herramienta se ha utilizado en otros países con ingresos bajos y medios.

Situación
La mortalidad materna y neonatal sigue siendo alta en países con ingresos bajos y medios, siendo la escasa calidad de atención durante el parto un impedimento para hacer progresos.

Métodos
La herramienta fue probada en 18 hospitales en Etiopía. En el primer periodo (junio-julio de 2015) se evaluaron 18 hospitales seleccionados, y de agosto a diciembre de 2015 se evaluaron otros 18 hospitales seleccionados.

Resultados
Los resultados mostraron mejoras significativas en la calidad de atención durante el parto en los hospitales evaluados. Las intervenciones incluyeron la implementación de protocolos de atención, la formación de profesionales y la mejora de la capacidad de coordinación de servicios.

Conclusión
La herramienta desarrollada y probada en Etiopía ofrece una nueva manera de evaluar y mejorar la calidad de atención durante el parto en países con ingresos bajos y medios.