Occurrence and Antibiotic Susceptibility of *Listeria* Species Isolated from Ready-to-eat Mixed Vegetable Salad Sold in Fast Food Eateries in Port Harcourt

Onoriode C. Eruteya

1Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Science, University of Port Harcourt, Nigeria.

Author’s contribution

The sole author designed, analysed, interpreted and prepared the manuscript.

ABSTRACT

**Aims:** The study aim to evaluate the occurrence and antibiotic susceptibility of *Listeria* species in ready-to-eat (RTE) mixed vegetable salad sold in selected fast food eateries in Port Harcourt.

**Study Design:** This work was based on a completely randomized design with two replications and the average values calculated for mean comparison.

**Place and Duration of Study:** The study was done in Food and Industrial Microbiology Laboratory, Department of Microbiology, University of Port Harcourt, Nigeria, between June and December, 2018.

**Methodology:** The study evaluated the occurrence and antibiotic susceptibility of *Listeria* species isolated from 100 samples of ready-to-eat (RTE) mixed vegetable salad sold in selected fast food eateries in Port Harcourt, using standard procedures involving Fraser broth, polymycin? acriflavin lithium chloride ceftazidime aesculin mannitol (PALCAM) agar, Mueller Hinton agar and multiple antibiotic disc.

**Results:** Of the 100 samples examined, 14% were positive for *Listeria* species. The *Listeria* isolates were identified on the basis of their physiological and biochemical characteristics as *L. innocua* (56.52%), *L. welshimeri* (34.78%) *L. grayi* (8.70%). The antibiotic susceptibility results reveal varying resistance against gentamicin (8.69%), augmentin (66.67%), amoxicillin (58.33%), erythromycin (25.00%), tetracycline (45.83%), cotrimoxazole (37.50%), chloramphenicol (41.67%) and cloxacillin (62.50%).
Conclusion: Although no *L. monocytogenes* was detected in the samples examined, the presence of *L. innocua* often reported as masking *L. monocytogenes* in growth media is a source of concern to public health experts and a potential threat to consumers.

**Keywords:** Antibiotic resistance; eatery; Listeria; public health; vegetable salad.

1. **INTRODUCTION**

Ready-to-eat (RTE) mixed vegetable salad which is now a major part of our daily meal in Nigeria and sold in fast food eateries is a mixture of fresh vegetables (carrot, cabbage, cucumber, green pepper, and lettuce), pre-packed baked beans and cream milk. The consumption of vegetable salad in Nigeria and other parts of the world has greatly increased based on the requirements of nutrients, vitamin A, iron, calcium, proteins, fats, minerals and the medical benefits of its constituents [1,2,3,4,5,6].

Although the consumption of fresh and minimally processed vegetables is considered healthy, outbreaks related to the contamination of these products are frequently reported since they are not subjected to treatments that considerably reduce microbiological hazards [7]. Vegetables can be contaminated from different environmental sources, such as soil, water, insects, air, birds, animal or equipment during cultivation, harvesting, processing, transport and marketing [6,8,9]. A large number of pathogenic microorganisms including *Listeria monocytogenes*, *Salmonella*, *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Bacillus anthracis*, *Mycobacterium* spp., *Brucella* spp., *Yersinia enteroltyica*, *Clostridium perfringens*, *Klebsiella* spp. and *Mycobacterium para-tuberculosis* have been reported to be associated with contamination of vegetables [6]. Generally vegetables have $10^3$ to $10^5$ microorganisms/cm$^3$ or $10^4$ to $10^7$ microorganisms/g [6].

*Listeria monocytogenes* is a ubiquitous bacterium that can be found in faeces, sewage, untreated irrigation water or surface water, dust, soil and fertilizer used on farm sand in decaying plant matter, making the presence of this bacterium in vegetables a continual risk [10,11,12,13,14].

*Listeria monocytogenes* is naturally susceptible to a range of antibiotics that act on Gram-positive bacteria [15]. With the bacterium having a remarkable ability to develop resistance to every antibiotic, it can be anticipated that even bacterial species such as *Listeria*, which were considered to be susceptible to ampicillin, aminoglycosides, tetracycline, macolides, vancomycin, carbencillin, cephaloridine, chloramphenicol, erythromycin, furazolidone, mvmillin, neomycin, novobiocin, oleandomycin, ticarcillin, azlocillin and less susceptible to chlortetracycline, oxytetracycline, tetracycline, gentamycin, kanamycin, nitrofurantoin, penicillin G, streptomycin, will evolve towards multi-resistance [16,17,18]. According to Gómez et al. [19], most strains of *L. monocytogenes* show natural resistance to current fluoroquinolones and cephalosporins, and especially those of the third and fourth generations, such as cefotaxime and ceftazime, and to fosfomycin, oxacillin and lincosamides.

This study therefore, aim to evaluate the occurrence and antibiotic susceptibility of *Listeria* species isolated from ready-to-eat mixed vegetable salad in selected fast food eateries in Port Harcourt, Nigeria.

2. **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

2.1 Sample Collection

A total of 100 ready-to-eat mixed vegetable salad samples without dressing were purchased from 10 fast food eateries in Port Harcourt metropolis and immediately transferred to the Microbiology Laboratory, University of Port Harcourt. The *Listeria monocytogenes* PCM 2191 serovar 01/2 which served as positive control was obtained from the Polish Collection of Microorganisms, Poland.

2.2 Isolation of *Listeria* Species

The techniques recommended by the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) [20] and the Health Products and Food Methods of the Government of Canada [21] were employed using Fraser broth (Oxoid, England) and Polymixin acriflavine lithium chloride ceftazidime aesculin mannotyl agar (PALCAM) (Oxoid, England).
2.2.1 Primary selective enrichment

Twenty-five grams of each sample was transferred to a stomacher bag containing 225 ml of sterile half-strength Fraser broth. The mixture was homogenized using a stomacher (Lab-Blender, Seward Medical, London) at high speed (state speed) for 1-2 min. The test portion was incubated at 30°C for 24 h.

2.2.2 Secondary selective enrichment

Full strength Fraser broth with full concentration of supplement was employed. From the pre-enrichment culture (half-strength Fraser broth), 0.1 ml was transferred into 10 ml of full-strength Fraser broth and was incubated at 35°C for 24-48 h.

2.2.3 Isolation

From the culture obtained in Fraser broth showing evidence of darkening due to aesculin hydrolysis by Listeria spp., 0.1 ml was transferred onto duplicate PALCAM plates. After spreading, plates were incubated at 37°C for 24-48 h. The plates were examined for the presence of characteristic colonies presumed to be Listeria sp 1-2 mm greyish-green colonies with a black sunken centre and a black halo on a cherry-red background, following aesculin hydrolysis and mannitol fermentation. Typical colonies were selected randomly from a pair of PALCAM plates for confirmation and subsequent identification.

2.3 Biochemical Test

Colonies suspected to be Listeria were transferred onto trypticase soy agar (Becton, Dickinson & Company, France) with 0.6% yeast extract (LAB M, UK) and incubated at 37°C for 18 to 24 h, before being subjected to the following standard biochemical tests: Gram staining, catalase reaction, oxidase reaction, beta haemolysis on sheep blood agar and carbohydrate fermentation using mannitol, rhamnose and xylose as described by Janzten et al. [22] and Jemmi and Stephan [23].

2.4 Antibiotic Sensitivity

Antibiotic resistance was assessed by the disk diffusion assay according to CLSI guidelines using the breakpoints of Staphylococcus species resistance since no resistance criteria exist for Listeria susceptibility testing in the CLSI guidelines [24,25,26]. Antibiotics disk containing the following antibiotics: Tetracycline (30 µg), amoxicillin (20 µg), augmentin (20 µg), gentamycin (10 µg), erythromycin (15 µg), cloxacillin (5 µg), chloramphenicol (30 µg) and cotrimoxazole (20 µg) were employed (Abtek biological, UK). From an overnight culture in brain heart infusion broth, a 10^8 cell/ml (0.5 MacFarland turbidity standards) bacterial culture was prepared in sterile saline, from which 0.1 ml was inoculated onto Mueller Hinton agar. Thereafter, antibiotic discs were aseptically placed on the surface of the agar and plates incubated at 37°C for 24 h. Zone of inhibition was measured in millimeter (using what instrument).

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The microbiological quality of partially processed vegetables as found in pre-packed mixed vegetable salads should be of great concern since freshly-cut vegetables are reported to be vehicle for the transmission of food-borne pathogens.

In this study, Listeria species were targeted and detected in mixed ready-to-eat (RTE) vegetable salad samples purchased from 5 of the 10 fast food eateries with the percentage occurrence ranging from 6.67 to 25.00% (Table 1). Of the 100 samples analyzed, Listeria species were isolated from fourteen (14%) samples. The presence of Listeria species in these RTE vegetable salads is a pointer to the fact that the vegetables were not poorly processed since a number of authors have reported the presence of Listeria in vegetables and mixed pre-packed vegetable salad globally [10,14,27,28,29,30,31].

The Listeria species were identified on the basis of the morphological and biochemical characteristics as L. innocua 13 (56.52%), L. welshimeri 8 (34.78%) and L. gray 2 (8.70%) (Table 2). No Listeria monocytogenes was detected in the samples examined. Ajayeb et al. [30] have reported low incidence of Listeria monocytogenes in RTE vegetable in traditional markets in South-Western Nigeria while Lin et al. [32] detected L. monocytogenes in 1 of 63 vegetable salads served in 31 food service facilities in Brazil. The inability to detect L. monocytogenes may not also be unconnected with the presence of raw carrot, which has been reported as bactericidal to L. monocytogenes [33], in the homogenate overnight in the primary enrichment broth coupled with the high percentage of L. innocua known to produce inhibitory bacteriocin against L. monocytogenes in growth media [34].
Table 1. Percentage occurrence of *Listeria* species from the selected fast food eateries

| Eateries code | No. of samples examined | No. of positive samples | % occurrence |
|---------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|--------------|
| DSAR          | 12                      | 3                       | 25.00        |
| DSCB          | 7                       | 0                       | 0.00         |
| SMCB          | 20                      | 4                       | 20.00        |
| GNNR          | 14                      | 3                       | 21.43        |
| GNWL          | 5                       | 0                       | 0.00         |
| GNUT          | 6                       | 1                       | 6.67         |
| EMUP          | 17                      | 3                       | 21.43        |
| GNRL          | 6                       | 0                       | 0.00         |
| PTRK          | 5                       | 0                       | 0.00         |
| DSRK          | 8                       | 0                       | 0.00         |
| Total         | 100                     | 14                      |              |

Table 2. Physiological and biochemical characteristics of *Listeria* species

| Listeria   | Number | Gram reaction/shape | Catalase | Oxidase | Nitrite reduced to nitrate | Haemolysis | Xylose | Rhamnose | Mannitol |
|------------|--------|---------------------|----------|---------|---------------------------|------------|--------|----------|----------|
| *Listeria monocytogenes* PCM 2191 serovar 01/2 | 1      | +ve/rod             | +        | -       | +                         | +          |        |          |          |
| L. grayi   | 2      | +ve/rod             | +        | -       | -                         | -          | -      | -        | +        |
| L. welshimeri | 8    | +ve/rod             | +        | -       | -                         | +          | V      |          |          |
| L. innocua | 13     | +ve/rod             | +        | -       | -                         | -          | -      | -        | +        |

The results of the antibiotic sensitivity (Table 3) showed a high resistance to augmentin (66.67%) followed by cloxacinil (62.50%) and amoxicillin (58.33%). The least resistance was obtained for gentamycin (8.33%). The antimicrobial resistance profile reveals that majority of the *Listeria* spp. were resistant to at least an antibiotic. The multiple-antibiotic resistance observed in the non-pathogenic strains poses a threat of transferring same to other bacteria or *L. monocytogenes*. A number of authors have reported varying levels of resistance of *Listeria* spp. from different sources to tetracycline, gentamycin, chloramphenicol, augmentin, cotrimoxazole and erythromycin [35,36,37,38,39,40,41,42,43]. Specifically, the susceptibility of *Listeria* spp. from salad vegetables and vegetable salad sold in Zaria, Nigeria to chloramphenicol (42.86%) and erythromycin (64.29%) are comparable to the results of this study [44]; but not in agreement with the 71.43% and 75.00% reported by Ieren et al. [44] and Bryne et al. [14] against tetracycline respectively. The susceptibility of *Listeria* spp. isolated from vegetable items sold by local and super shops in

Table 3. Distribution of the antibiotic susceptibility of the 23 isolated *Listeria* and *Listeria monocytogenes* PCM 2191 serovar 01/2 to common antibiotics

| Antibiotic     | Resistance | Intermediate | Sensitive |
|----------------|------------|--------------|-----------|
| Amoxicillin    | 14 (58.33%)| 4 (16.67%)   | 6 (25.00%)|
| Augmentin      | 16 (66.67%)| 3 (12.50%)   | 5 (20.83%)|
| Chloramphenicol| 10 (41.67%)| 5 (20.83%)   | 9 (37.50%)|
| Cloxacillin    | 15 (62.50%)| 3 (12.50%)   | 6 (25.00%)|
| Co-trimoxazole | 9 (37.50%) | 8 (33.33%)   | 7 (29.17%)|
| Erythromycin   | 6 (25.00%) | 3 (12.50%)   | 15 (62.50%)|
| Gentamycin     | 2 (8.33%)  | 3 (12.50%)   | 19 (79.17%)|
| Tetracycline   | 11 (45.83%)| 8 (33.33%)   | 5 (20.83%)|
Dhaka city to gentamycin (75.00%) is also comparable to the findings of this study and consistent with the high and often 100% sensitivity of Listeria isolates to gentamycin [39,43,45]. The range of antibiotics to which resistance was observed in the study is of a great concern since antibiotics such as erythromycin, tetracycline and chloramphenicol were previously effective in the treatment of listeriosis [16].

4. CONCLUSION

This study has demonstrated the presence of Listeria species in ready-to-eat mixed vegetable salad from selected fast food eateries in Port Harcourt. Though L. monocytogenes, the potential human pathogen was not detected; the high presence of L. innocua is a cause for concern since it produces a bacteriocin against L. monocytogenes in growth media. An increased antibiotic resistant was demonstrated in line with worldwide pattern indicating a potential public health risk. It seems an impossible task protecting food samples from such defilement?, but with proper handling and processing, the challenge can be practically controlled to a very large extent.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author is grateful to the polish collection of microorganisms, Poland for providing the L Monocytogenes pcm 2191 serovar 01/2 and the technical staff, Department of Microbiology, University of Port Harcourt for their assistance.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Author has declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. Tambekar DH, Mundhada RH. Bacteriological quality of salad vegetables sold in Amravati City (India). J Biol Sci. 2006;6(1):28-30.
2. Udo S, Iniobong A, Umo A, Ekpo M. Potential human pathogens (Bacteria) and their antibiogram in ready-to-eat salads sold in Calabar, South-South, Nigeria. Internet J Trop Med. 2009;5(2):1.
3. Abdullahi IO, Abdulkareem S. Bacteriological quality of some ready-to-eat vegetables as retailed and consumed in Sabon-Gari, Zaria, Nigeria. Bayero J Pure Appl Sci. 2010;3(1):173–175.
4. Adeshina GO, Jibo SD, Agu VE. Antibacterial susceptibility pattern of pathogenic bacteria isolates from vegetable salad sold in Restaurants in Zaria, Nigeria. J Microbiol Res. 2012;2(2):5-11.
5. Najafi MBH, Bahreini M. Microbiological quality of mixed fresh-cut vegetable salads and mixed ready-to-eat fresh herbs in Mashhad, Iran. International Conference on Nutrition and Food Sciences IPCBEE, IACSIT Press, Singapore. 2012;39.
6. Kabir A, Das AK, Kabir MS. Incidence of antibiotic resistant pathogenic bacteria in vegetable items sold by local and super shops in Dhaka city. Stamford J. Microbiol. 2014;4(1):13-18.
7. De Roever C. Microbiological safety evaluations and recommendation on fresh produce. Food Contr. 1998;9(6):321-47.
8. Abah MI, Peters O, Kolo K. Bacterial contaminants of salad vegetables in Abuja Municipal Area Council, Nigeria. Malay J Microbiol. 2011;7(2):111-114.
9. Swagato NJ, Parvin N, Ahsan S, Kabir MS. Incidence of multiple pathogenic bacteria in green chilli and cabbage in Dhaka city. Int. Food Res. J. 2015;22(4):1681-1686.
10. Monge R, Arias-Echandi ML. Presence of Listeria monocytogenes in fresh salad vegetables. Rev Biomed. 1999;10:29-31.
11. Donnelly CW. Listeria monocytogenes: A continuing challenge. Nutr Rev. 2001;59(6):183–194.
12. Harris LJ, Faber JN, Beuchat LR, Parish ME, Suslow TB, Garret EH, et al. Outbreaks associated with fresh produce: Incidence, growth and survival of pathogens in fresh and fresh cut produce. Comprehensive Rev Food Sci Food Safety. 2003;2(s1):115–119.
13. Ikeh MAC, Obi SKC, Ezeasor DN, Ezeonu IM, Moneke AN. Incidence and pathogenicity profile of Listeria sp. isolated from food and environmental samples inNsukka, Nigeria. Afr J Biotechnol. 2010;9(30):4776-4782.
14. Byrne VDV, Hoferb E, Vallim DC, Almeida RCC. Occurrence and antimicrobial resistance patterns of Listeria.
isolated from catfish fillets and processing environment. Lett Appl Microbiol. 2010;50(6):626–632. DOI: 10.1111/j.1472-765X.2010.02843.x

26. CLSI (Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute). Methods for antimicrobial dilutions and disk for susceptibilities tests of infrequently isolated or fastidious bacteria; approved guideline. M45A2, vol. 30, no. 18. Replaces M45A. 2012;26(49). 2nd Ed.; 2012.

27. Farber J, Peterkin P. Listeria monocytogenes, a food borne pathogen. Microbiol. Rev. 1991;55(3):476-511.

28. Pingulkar K, Kamat A, Bongirwar D. Microbiological quality of fresh leafy vegetables, salad components and ready-to-eat salads: An evidence of inhibition of Listeria monocytogenes in tomatoes. Int J Food Sci Nutr. 2001;52(1):15-23. DOI: 10.1080/09637480020027219

29. Little CL, Taylor FC, Sagoo SK, Gillespie IA, Grant K, McLauchlin J. Prevalence and level of Listeria monocytogenes and other Listeria species in retail pre-packaged mixed vegetable salads in the UK. Food Microbiol. 2007;24(7-8):711-7. DOI: 10.1016/j.fm.2007.03.009

30. Ajayeoba TA, Atanda OO, Obadina AO, Bankole MO, Adelowo OO. The incidence and distribution of Listeria monocytogenes in ready-to-eat vegetables in South-Western Nigeria. Food Sci Nutri. 2015;4(1):59-66. DOI: 10.1002/fsn3.263

31. Sagoo SK, Little CL, Mitchell RT. Microbiological quality of open ready-to-eat salad vegetables: Effectiveness of food hygiene training of management. J Food Prot. 2003;66(9):1581-6. DOI: 10.4315/0362-028x-66.9.1581

32. Lin C, Fernando SY, Wei C. Occurrence of Listeria monocytogenes, Salmonella spp., Escherichia coli and E. coli O157:H7 in vegetable salads. Food Contr. 1996;7(3):135-140. DOI: 10.1016/0956-7135(96)00019-9

33. Beuchat LR, Brackett RE. Inhibitory effect of raw carrots on Listeria monocytogenes. Appl Environ Microbiol. 1990;56(6):1734-1742.

34. Carvalheira A, Eusébio C, Silva J, Gibbs P, Teixeira P. Influence of Listeria innocua on the growth of Listeria monocytogenes. Food Contr. 2010;21(11):1492-1496. DOI: 10.1016/j.foodcont.2010.04.021

35. David OM, Odeyemi AT. Antibiotic pattern of environmental isolates of Listeria
monocytogenes from Ado-Ekiti, Nigeria. Afr J Biotechnol. 2007;6(18):2135-2139. DOI: 10.5897/AJB2007.000-2332

36. Lyon SA, Berrang ME, Fedorka-Cray PJ, Fletcher DL, Meinersmann RJ. Antimicrobial resistance of Listeria monocytogenes isolated from a poultry further processing plant. Foodborne Path Dis. 2008;5(3):253–259. DOI: 10.1089/fpd.2007.0070

37. Umeh SI, Okpokwasili GSC. Occurrence and antimicrobial profile of Listeria monocytogenes in fresh faeces of livestock animals. Nig J Microbiol. 2009;23:1869-1875.

38. Pesavento G, Ducci B, Nieri D, Comodo N, Lo Nostro A. Prevalence and antibiotic susceptibility of Listeria spp. isolated from raw meat and retail foods. Food Contr. 2010;21(5):708–713. DOI: 10.1016/j.foodcont.2009.10.012

39. Indrawattana N, Nibaddhasobon T, Sookrung N, Chongsa-nguan M, Tungtrongchitr A, Makino S, et al. Prevalence of Listeria monocytogenes in raw meats marketed in Bangkok and characterization of the isolates by phenotypic and molecular methods. J Health Pop Nutr. 2011;29(1):26-38. Available: https://dx.doi.org/10.3329%2Fjhpn.v29i1.7565

40. Rahimi E, Yazdi F, Farzinezhadizadeh H. Prevalence and antimicrobial resistance of Listeria species isolated from different types of raw meat in Iran. J Food Prot. 2012;75(12):2223-2227. DOI: 10.4315/0362-028X.JFP-11-565

41. Wieczorek K, Dmowska K, Osek J. Prevalence, characterization and antimicrobial resistance of Listeria monocytogenes isolates from bovine hides and carcasses. Appl Environ Microbiol. 2012;78(6):2043-2045. DOI: 10.1128/AEM.07156-11

42. Enurah LU, Aboaba OO, Nwachukwu SCU, Nwosuh CI. Antibiotic resistant profiles of food (fresh raw milk) and environmental (abattoir effluents) isolates of Listeria monocytogenes from the six zones of Nigeria. Afr J Microbiol Res. 2013;7(34):4373-4378. DOI: 10.5897/AJMR12.1900

43. Iren II, Bello M, Kwaga JKP. Occurrence and antibiotic resistance profile of Listeria monocytogenes in salad vegetables and vegetable salads sold in Zaria, Nigeria. Afr J Food Sci. 2013;7(9):335-338.

44. Safdar A, Armstrong D. Antimicrobial activities against 84 Listeria monocytogenes isolated from patients with systemic listeriosis at a comprehensive cancer center (1955–1997). J Clin Microbiol. 2003;41(1):483–485.