RESEARCH PAPER

The role of Rubisco kinetics and pyrenoid morphology in shaping the CCM of haptophyte microalgae

Ana M.C. Heureux1,*,†, Jodi N. Young2, Spencer M. Whitney3, Maeve R. Eason-Hubbard1, Renee B.Y. Lee1,4, Robert E. Sharwood3 and Rosalind E.M. Rickaby1

1 University of Oxford, Department of Earth Sciences, South Parks Road, Oxford OX1 3AN, UK
2 University of Washington, School of Oceanography, Seattle, WA 98195, USA
3 ARC Centre of Excellence for Translational Photosynthesis, Research School of Biology, Australian National University, Canberra ACT 2601, Australia
4 University of Reading, School of Biological Sciences, Reading, Berkshire RG6 6U, UK

† Present address: University of Hawai‘i at Hilo, College of Agriculture, Forestry and Natural Resource Management, 200 W. Kawili St, Hilo, HI 96720, USA.
* Correspondence: aheureux@gmail.com

Received 25 January 2017; Editorial decision 2 May 2017; Accepted 15 May 2017

Editor: Howard Griffiths, University of Cambridge

Abstract

The haptophyte algae are a cosmopolitan group of primary producers that contribute significantly to the marine carbon cycle and play a major role in paleo-climate studies. Despite their global importance, little is known about carbon assimilation in haptophytes, in particular the kinetics of their Form 1D CO2-fixing enzyme, Rubisco. Here we examine Rubisco properties of three haptophytes with a range of pyrenoid morphologies (Pleurochrysis carterae, Tisochrysis lutea, and Pavlova lutheri) and the diatom Phaeodactylum tricornutum that exhibit contrasting sensitivities to the trade-offs between substrate affinity ($K_m$) and turnover rate ($k_{cat}$) for both CO2 and O2. The pyrenoid-containing T. lutea and P. carterae showed lower Rubisco content and carboxylation properties ($K_C$ and $k_{cat}$) comparable with those of Form 1D-containing non-green algae. In contrast, the pyrenoid-lacking P. lutheri produced Rubisco in 3-fold higher amounts, and displayed a Form 1B Rubisco $k_{cat}$–$K_C$ relationship and increased CO2/O2 specificity that, when modeled in the context of a C3 leaf, supported equivalent rates of photosynthesis to higher plant Rubisco. Correlation between the differing Rubisco properties and the occurrence and localization of pyrenoids with differing intracellular CO2:O2 microenvironments has probably influenced the divergent evolution of Form 1B and 1D Rubisco kinetics.

Key words: Algae, carbon-concentrating mechanisms, Haptophyta, pyrenoid, Rubisco.

Introduction

The CO2-fixing enzyme Rubisco (EC 4.1.1.39) evolved in the Archaean Eon when the atmosphere lacked O2 and CO2 was estimated to be 50-fold higher than current levels (Berner and Canfield, 1989; Berner, 2006; Tabita et al., 2008). With the evolution of O2-producing photosynthesis around the early Proterozoic (2.5 Gya), atmospheric O2 increased while the CO2 concentration declined (Canfield, 2005) (Fig. 1). The diminishing atmospheric CO2/O2 ratio negatively influenced Rubisco catalysis, as its photosynthetic CO2-fixing function is competitively inhibited by O2 to produce 2-phosphoglycolate (2-PG) (Tcherkez et al.,...
Recycling of 2-PG to 3-phosphoglycerate (3-PGA) by photorespiration consumes energy and loses fixed CO2. A further limitation to Rubisco function in the modern atmosphere is a low affinity for CO2 and a slow catalytic rate that necessitates high Rubisco concentrations to support adequate rates of photosynthesis (Reinfelder, 2011; Whitney et al., 2011; Long et al., 2015; Sharwood et al., 2016b).

The catalytic limitations of Rubisco are exacerbated in aquatic ecosystems due to restraints on aqueous CO2 availability because of slow rates of gas diffusion in water (~10000 times slower than in air) and reliance on mixing of the water column (Badger et al., 1998). In addition, increased partitioning of inorganic carbon to HCO3⁻ with higher pH in aquatic systems diminishes aqueous CO2 availability. There is evidence of catalytic adaptation by Rubisco in algae to the changing atmospheric CO2 and O2 conditions over geological time scales (Young et al., 2012). Recent work, however, showed that the characteristic faster CO2 fixation rates (kcat) and lower CO2 affinities (i.e. higher Kc for CO2; Ke) observed in Form 1A and Form 1B Rubisco [e.g. in Chlamydomonas with a pyrenoid-based CO2-concentrating mechanism (CCM)] (Badger et al., 1998; Ghannoum et al., 2005; Sharwood et al., 2016a) are not shared by diatom Form 1D Rubisco (Hanson, 2016; Young et al., 2016; see also Fig. 3A). This has led to calls for a more extensive analysis of Rubisco’s natural kinetic diversity so that we can fully understand the correlative interactions between specificity for CO2 as opposed to O2 (S_{CO2}), kcat, and Ke. The one-dimensional, linear correlations previously proposed (Tcherkez et al., 2006; Savir et al., 2010) may actually vary with photosynthetic taxa (Tcherkez, 2013, 2016; Hanson, 2016; Sharwood, 2017).

In photosynthetic organisms, the CCM arose multiple times in response to a declining atmospheric CO2:O2 ratio as a means to increase the CO2/O2 environment around Rubisco (Fig. 1). Data on the anatomical, biochemical, and genomic detail for CCMs in vascular plants with C4 and Crassulacean acid metabolism (CAM) physiologies are highly detailed (von Caemmerer and Furbank, 2016). The high CO2 environment reduces Rubisco oxygenation and the associated energy costs of photorespiration, allowing the plant to work with lower stomatal conductance and reduced amounts of Rubisco (Sage et al., 2012). These features allow more efficient use of water, nitrogen, and light, and permit these plants to survive in more arid and nutrient-limited environments (Sage, 2002; Ghannoum et al., 2005; Lara and Andreo, 2011; Long et al., 2015). The CCM in plants also allowed Form 1B Rubisco to evolve a higher kcat/Ke at the expense of a higher Ke (i.e. lower CO2 affinity) with little or no effect on Sc02 (Sharwood et al., 2016a, b). Curiously this kcat/Ke trade-off is not shared by Form 1D Rubisco from diatoms where relatively higher Ke values have been retained as a consequence of other environmental pressures (low nutrient and extracellular CO2 availability) that pose limitations to resource investment into Rubisco (Young et al., 2016). It is likely that resources other than CO2, such as nitrogen and light availability, have a strong influence on CCM evolution and regulation (Raven et al., 2008, 2012).

Understanding how microalgal Rubisco catalysis has differentially evolved remains limited by our understanding of the structural components and effectiveness of the CCM in microalgae. The last few years have seen significant advances in our understanding of CCM in the model freshwater green alga, Chlamydomonas reinhardtii (Engel et al., 2015; Wang et al., 2015; Yamano et al., 2015; Mackinder et al., 2016; Mangan et al., 2016; Wang et al., 2016). To what extent this knowledge is translatable to the CCM of the structurally differing and evolutionarily distinct marine microalgae (e.g. diatoms and haptophytes) remains unclear (Bedoshvili et al., 2009; Hopkinson et al., 2011, 2013). Currently a completed nuclear haptophyte genome is available for the Isochrysidale Emiliania huxleyi (Read et al., 2013) and a draft genome for the Prymnesiale Chrysochromulina tobin (Hovde et al., 2015). Although less understood, the CCMs of marine microalgae are...
known typically to employ a pyrenoid, Rubisco activase, carbonic anhydrase (CA), and inorganic carbon (C\textsubscript{i}) transporters to elevate CO\textsubscript{2} levels around Rubisco (Hopkinson \textit{et al.}, 2011; Reinfelder, 2011; Loganathan \textit{et al.}, 2016). The pyrenoid is a proteinaceous body that appears electron dense when examined by TEM and contains most, sometimes all, of the cellular Rubisco (Engel \textit{et al.}, 2015; Mackinder \textit{et al.}, 2016).

In \textit{C. reinhardtii}, HCO\textsubscript{3} transport occurs via thylakoids and C\textsubscript{i} transporters that work in association with pyrenoid CAs to elevate CO\textsubscript{2} around Rubisco (Karlsson \textit{et al.}, 1998; Trimborn \textit{et al.}, 2007; Lee \textit{et al.}, 2013; Wang \textit{et al.}, 2015; Yamano \textit{et al.}, 2015). Physiological and genetic evidence in model diatoms imply that HCO\textsubscript{3} is pumped into the chloroplast stroma and diffuses into the pyrenoid where it is converted to CO\textsubscript{2} by CA and inorganic carbon (C\textsubscript{i}) transporters (Kikutani \textit{et al.}, 2016). Recent identification of a thylakoid lumen-localized CA in \textit{P. tricornutum} further suggests that the pyrenoid-penetrating thylakoids probably provide an important CO\textsubscript{2} supply within the pyrenoids (Kikutani \textit{et al.}, 2016).

What remains unclear is how the pyrenoid structure influences CCM efficiency. In \textit{C. reinhardtii}, the pyrenoid contains a starch sheath (Moroney \textit{et al.}, 2011; Engel \textit{et al.}, 2015) while in diatoms it can comprise a lipid membrane (Bedoshvili \textit{et al.}, 2009), lack a delimiting structure (Bendif \textit{et al.}, 2011), vary in number and shape, and differ in the presence/structure of traversing thylakoids (Badger \textit{et al.}, 1998). To better understand the relationships between Rubisco kinetics, content, and pyrenoid biology in marine microalgae, we have expanded on our previous study of diatom Rubisco (Young \textit{et al.}, 2016) to include three marine haptophytes that contain bulging (\textit{Pleurochrysis carterae}), immersed [\textit{Tisochrysis lutea}, formerly \textit{Ircysis} sp. strain CS-177 (Bendif \textit{et al.}, 2013)], or no pyrenoid (\textit{Pavlova lutheri}) within their chloroplast and varying numbers and location of pyrenoid-traversing thylakoids (Fig. 2A).

### Materials and methods

#### Algae culturing

Cultures of the haptophytes \textit{P. lutheri} (CS-182), \textit{P. carterae} (CS-287), \textit{T. lutea} (CS-177; original strain name \textit{Isopycsis} sp. (Bendif \textit{et al.}, 2013)), and the diatom, \textit{Phaeodactyllum tricornutum} (CS-29) were obtained from the Australian National Algae Culture Collection CSIRO (https://www.csiro.au/en/Research/Collections/ANACC) and grown at 20°C in 0.2 μm filtered and autoclaved seawater containing f/2 (Guillard and Ryther, 1962) or GSe (\textit{P. carterae}, Blackburn \textit{et al.}, 2001) nutrients, vitamins, and trace metals. The cultures were...

**Fig. 2.** Microalgae pyrenoid and CCM composition. (A) TEM images were compiled from the literature to represent the range of pyrenoids presented in this. To represent a pyrenoid lacking Pavlovalae, we use Pavlova viridis from Bendif \textit{et al.} (2011) (Protist, 162, Bendif EM, Probert I, Hervé A, Biliard C, Goux D, Leelong C, Cadoret JP, Véron B. Integrative taxonomy of the Pavlovophyceae (Haptophyta): a reassessment, 2011; permission from Elsevier) as the TEM image clearly represents the lack of pyrenoid. **Pavlova lutheri** is visualized in the same study; however, the TEM image does not show the chloroplast (Ch) lacking a pyrenoid as clearly. TEM image of \textit{P. carterae} from Beech and Wetherbee (1988) (Journal of Applied Phycology, 26, 2014, 1617, Bendif EM, Probert I, Hervé A, Billard C, Allen AE, Mousta F, Montsant A, Eckert A, Kroth PG, Bowler C. Evolution and functional diversification of fructose bisphosphate aldolase genes in photosynthetic marine diatoms, Molecular Biology and Evolution 2012, 29, 367–279, by permission of Oxford University Press) show pyrenoids (Py) bulging toward the center of the cell, and the two species \textit{T. lutea} (Bendif \textit{et al.}, 2014) (Journal of Applied Phycology, Erratum to: On the description of \textit{Tisochrysis lutea} gen. nov. sp. nov. and \textit{ Isochrysis nuda} sp. nov. in the \textit{Isochrysidales}, and the transfer of \textit{Dicerartia} to the \textit{Pyromnesiales} (Haptophyta), 26, 2014, 1617, Bendif EM, Probert I, Schroeder DC, de Vargas C. With permission of Springer) and \textit{Pavlova viridis} in this. To represent a pyrenoid lacking Pavlovale, we use...
Pyrenoid morphology and CCM characterization.

Details of pyrenoid morphology and estimates of $C_i$ and CA pools for the microalgae were compiled from the literature (Manton and Peterfi, 1969; Billard and Gayral, 1972; Green, 1975; Green and Pienaar, 1977; Borowitzka and Volcani, 1978; Horii and Green, 1985; Badger et al., 1998; Bendif et al., 2011, 2013). A preliminary screen for putative δ-CA genes was carried out using PCR. δ-CA is a functional carbonic anhydrase, as demonstrated in vitro by Del Prete et al. (2014) and Lee et al. (2013). It is regulated by CO$_2$, and is thus important in inorganic carbon acquisition (Lane and Morel, 2000a).

Genomic DNA was extracted as described (Richlen and Barber, 2005) and candidate δ-CA genes were amplified by PCR using primers AFWd (5'-GGTGGCGGACGTCAGGTTGCACCTGG-3') and AREv (5'-CCGATGACCTGGCAGGTATGG-3') that were designed to be conserved C-terminal amino acid sequences VGETEYEHV and PITWQVDR, respectively. The ~370 bp DNA product amplified from P. carterae and Isochrysis galbana (for comparison with T. lutea) was sequenced by Source BioScience (Oxford, UK). Confirmation that the absence of δ-CA from our P. tricornutum (strain CCAP1055/1) monoclonal culture derived from a free-swimming cell in May 2003 (from strain CCMP632) was further supported by analysis for δ-CA homologs within the fully sequenced genome of P. tricornutum (Bowler et al., 2008) and its predicted protein products. Similarly, the absence of δ-CA was further confirmed by a search of the Pavlova sp. CCMP2436 (JGI) genome sequence.

A BLAST search of the genomes was carried out using the δ-CA protein sequence from Thalassiosira pseudonana (BAO52718) and Thalassiosira weissflogii (AAV39532), both centric diatoms, and Fragilariopsis cylindrus CCMP1102 (OEUI11320), a pennate diatom, as query sequences. The BLAST search yielded no hits. Together with our PCR, we concluded that there were no δ-CA homologs in this strain of P. tricornutum. A BLAST search was also carried out on the genome of Pavlova sp. CCMP2436 (JGI), an environmental isolate using the δ-CA protein sequence from T. pseudonana (BAO52718) and the haptophytes Emiliania huxleyi (ABG37067), I. galbana (EC146202, EC142695), and Chrysochromulina sp. CCMP291 (K0021563, K0028292). Although this genome is not fully curated and the culture has not been taxonomically described, the preliminary search yielded no hits.

Rubisco extraction and kinetic assessment

Algal cells were harvested via centrifugation (2000 g for 10 min) and the pelleted cells snap-frozen in liquid nitrogen and stored at ~80 °C until assay. The crude soluble cell extracts were obtained by rupturing the cells using a French press as described previously (Young et al., 2016). As detailed in the same study, Rubisco content was quantified using the Bradford assay against BSA. Rubisco catalytic parameters: maximum carboxylation rate ($V_{max}$) and half-saturation constants for CO$_2$ and O$_2$ ($K_C$ and $K_o$, respectively) were measured at 25 °C using $^{14}$CO$_2$ fixation assays employing crude extract that had been activated for 10–15 min at 25 °C with 10 mM MgCl$_2$ and 10 mM NaHCO$_3$. The CO$_2$ concentrations in the $^{14}$CO$_2$ assays were calculated using the Henderson–Hasselbalch equation and the parameters detailed in (Sharwood et al., 2016a). Measurements of $S_{CO_2}$ were made using Rubisco rapidly purified from ~1 g of pelleted algal cells as described (Young et al., 2016).

Simulating the influence of microalgae Rubisco on $C_3$ plant photosynthesis

The carboxylase activity-limited assimilation rates were simulated according to Farquhar et al. (1980) using the equation:

$$ A = \left( \frac{C_i - \frac{0.5K_c}{2}}{C_i + K(1+\frac{0.5}{K_o})} \right) B - R_b $$

assuming a CO$_2$ solubility in H$_2$O ($s_i$) of 0.0334M bar$^{-1}$, an O$_2$ of 267 μM, a Rubisco content ($B$) of 20 μmol catalytic sites m$^{-2}$, and an non-photorespiratory CO$_2$ assimilation rate ($R_b$) of 2 μmol m$^{-2}$ s$^{-1}$. Under higher chloroplast CO$_2$ pressures (C$_o$), the photosynthetic rate becomes light- (or electron transport rate, ETR-) limited and is modeled according to the equation:

$$ A = \left( \frac{C_i - \frac{0.5K_c}{2}}{4C_i + \frac{2K_o}{5}} \right) B - R_b $$

assuming an electron transport rate (J) of 150 μmol m$^{-2}$ s$^{-1}$.

Results and Discussion

The differing pyrenoid morphologies within the microalgae studied

A central objective of this study was to examine the correlations between pyrenoid morphology, evidence of a CCM, and the content and catalysis of Rubisco in microalgae. As summarized in Fig. 2A, T. lutea possesses a pyrenoid immersed in the center of the plastid with 1–2 thylakoids traversing the center of the pyrenoid (Bendif et al., 2013; Borowitzka and Volcani, 1978). In contrast, the pyrenoid in P. carterae bulges out from the plastid toward the center of the cell, with 5–6 continuous thylakoids traversing the plastid and pyrenoid (Manton and Peterfi, 1969; Beech and Wetherbee, 1988). Immersed versus bulging pyrenoids differ in the location within the cell, relative separation from the plastid (i.e. the presence of a lipid membrane has been suggested from TEM observations), and the connectivity to plastid thylakoids. A lipid membrane has been observed around the immersed/semi-immersed pyrenoids of two other members of the Isochrysidales—Chrysolita lamellosa (Billard and Gayral, 1972; Green and Parke, 1975) and Isochrysis galbana (Green and Pienaar, 1977). However, Bendif et al. (2013) did not detect a membrane around the pyrenoid of T. lutea nor has one been observed around pyrenoids of the bulging morphotype in any haptophyte species, including P. carterae. In the Pavlovophyceae, the pyrenoids are often bulging towards the exterior of the cell—albeit not in P. lutheri where no pyrenoid is apparent (Green, 1975; Burris, 1981; Bendif et al., 2011). Phaeodactylum tricornutum was included in this study and, like many members of the lineage, has pyrenoids that are fully immersed within the chloroplast with 1–2 pyrenoid-traversing thylakoids (Borowitzka and Volcani, 1978; Bedoshvili et al., 2009) (Fig. 2A).

Experimental evidence for a CCM

A key component of a CCM is the enzyme CA that catalyzes the rapid interconversion between CO$_2$ and HCO$_3^–$. In marine primary producers, the CA activity of a CCM is particularly beneficial for accessing CO$_2$ from the high oceanic
HCO$_3^-$ concentrations. The effects of two CA inhibitors, the membrane-permeable ethoxyzolamide (EZA) and the relatively impermeable acetazolamide (AZA), are commonly used to test for CCM activity (Okazaki et al., 1992). This is undertaken by examining the influence of EZA and AZA on the affinity of photosynthesis for plasma membrane-based inorganic carbon (C$_i$) (Okazaki et al., 1992; Badger et al., 1998) and light-stimulated CA activity (Burns and Beardall, 1987).

Using modern cell biology tools, there have been significant advances in understanding the CCM components in microalgae (Engel, 2015) which includes the discovery of novel CA isoforms and their intercellular localization (Jin et al., 2016; Kikutani et al., 2016). While a comparable detailed analysis of haptophyte CCM components is beyond the scope of this work, Fig. 2B summarizes the known CCM features in the microalgae studied here. EZA treatment reduces the affinity for C$_i$ in photosynthesis for the pyrenoid-containing I. galbana (as a proxy for T. lutea), P. tricornutum, and P. carterae species, with the external CA inhibitor AZA also affecting the C$_i$ affinity in P. carterae (Badger et al., 1998; Chen et al., 2006; Hopkinson et al., 2013). We note that other diatoms with fully immersed pyrenoids have been shown to be sensitive to AZA (Hopkinson et al., 2013). The influence of EZA or AZA on the photosynthetic carbon assimilation rate in P. lutheri, the species lacking a pyrenoid, remains untested. Similarly, the light-stimulated CA activity found in P. tricornutum and T. lutea has yet to be examined in P. carterae and P. lutheri (Fig. 2B). It is estimated that the CCMs associated with immersed pyrenoids can increase intracellular C$_i$ pools ~6-fold higher than that permissible by passive diffusion (Fig. 2B (Burns and Beardall, 1987; Colman and Rotatore, 1995; Badger et al., 1998).

The δ isofrom of CA (or TWCA1), whose expression in the diatom T. weissflogii is modulated by extracellular CO$_2$ levels (Morel et al., 1994; Lane and Morel, 2000a, b) and in marine dinoflagellates functions as an external CA (Lapointe et al., 2008), holds the potential as a key component of a CCM in microalgae. The catalytic activity and inhibition of δ-CA demonstrate the functionality of the CA in the diatom Thalassiosira pseudonana and the haptophyte Emiliania huxleyi (Soto et al., 2006; Lee et al., 2013; Del Prete et al., 2014). Using sequence homology searches, we were able to detect δ-CA homologs in genome data sets for P. carterae and T. lutea, but not in P. tricornutum or P. lutheri (using the Pavlovale sp. CCMP2436 genome as a proxy). Importantly the absence of detectable sequence homology does not disqualify these microalgae from producing δ-CA or alternative CA isoforms, especially considering that new CA s are still being discovered (Jin et al., 2016; Kitkanti et al., 2016). Indeed, a number of other CA types are expressed in P. tricornutum that include one localized in the pyrenoid (Tachibana et al., 2011), an extracellular CA (Hopkinson et al., 2013), and a θ-type CA located in the thylakoid lumen (Jin et al., 2016). Our BLAST search of the Pavlovale sp. CCMP2436 genome supports the absence of a δ-CA in P. lutheri; however, further investigation is required (e.g. whether P. lutheri contains other forms of CA). Overall, the existing evidence suggests that the presence of a pyrenoid coincides with the presence and activity of CA (Fig. 2B), consistent with their role in the microalgae CCM.

The carboxylation properties of haptophyte Rubisco

Form 1B Rubisco from organisms operating a CCM characteristically show higher rates of maximum carboxylation $k^c_{cat}$ and a reduction in CO$_2$ affinity (i.e. an increase in $K_C$) than the Rubisco from their non-CCM relatives. For example, the Rubisco from C$_4$ plants typically have a higher $k^c_{cat}$ and higher $K_C$ than C$_3$ plant Rubisco (Sage, 2002; Savir et al., 2010; Sharwood et al., 2016a, c; Tcherkez, 2016). As shown in Fig. 3A, the $K_C$ diversity among Form 1B vascular plant Rubisco spans a limited range in values relative to the Form 1D Rubisco from diatoms (Hanson, 2016; Young et al., 2016). Moreover, the relationship between $K_C$ and $k^c_{cat}$ at 25 °C for the Form 1D Rubisco differs from Form 1B Rubisco (Fig. 3A).

For comparison of different CCM effectiveness on Rubisco kinetics within organisms containing the 1D Rubisco, we examined the kinetics of the Form 1D Rubiscos from freshly lysed P. carterae, T. lutea, and P. lutheri cells. The Rubisco activity in the cellular extract was stable at 25 °C for at least 20 min following extraction (see Supplementary Fig. S1 at JXB online). The CO$_2$–Mg$^{2+}$ activation status of the extracted Rubisco varied between 50% and 60%, comparable with that seen in the cellular extract of diatoms (Young et al., 2016). To ensure full activation of all eight catalytic sites in each L$_3$S$_8$ molecule, the cellular extract was incubated for 10–15 min at 25 °C in buffer containing 10 mM MgCl$_2$ and 10 mM NaHCO$_3$ before assaying $k^c_{cat}$ under varying CO$_2$ concentrations by $^{14}$CO$_2$ fixation. By this approach, the values of $k^c_{cat}$ and $K_C$ extrapolated from fitting the data to the Michaelis–Menten equation were reproducible between replicate cellular preparations (Table 1).

Significant kinetic diversity at 25 °C was observed among each haptophyte Rubisco relative to P. tricornutum (model diatom species) and Nicotiana tabacum (tobacco, model plant Rubisco used in kinetic comparisons; Whitney et al., 2001; Sharwood et al., 2016a, b) (Table 1). The $K_C$ of P. carterae, P. tricornutum, and tobacco were similar and each ~50% higher than those of T. lutea and P. lutheri Rubisco. Comparable levels of variation in $K_C$ were also observed among the haptophyte Rubiscos (14.5–24.1 μM) that are notably lower and spanning a smaller range than the $K_C$ values of diatom Rubiscos (22–70 μM; Fig. 3A). This suggests haptophyte Rubisco may experience a lower CO$_2$ microenvironment relative to diatoms. This is probably the case for Rubisco in P. lutheri that lacks a pyrenoid (Burris, 1981; Bendif et al., 2011) and whose Rubisco has the lowest $K_C$ and highest $S_{CO2}$ (i.e. a greater selectivity for CO$_2$ over O$_2$; Table 1).

A correlative analysis of haptophyte Rubisco kinetics

A comparison of Rubisco kinetics of each haptophyte identified contrasting relationships when compared with the 25 °C properties of Form 1B and 1D L$_3$S$_8$ Rubisco from a range of eukaryotic phototrophs (Fig. 3A–E; data compiled in
Heureux et al.

3964

An examination of the \( K_C – k_{cat} \) relationship for 'green' Form 1B (vascular plants, CCM-positive green algae) and 'non-green' Form 1D (diatoms, haptophytes, and red algae) Rubisco suggests they follow differing trajectories (Fig. 3A). As suggested previously, this might arise from lineage-dependent variation in ribulose bisphosphate (RuBP) enolization energies and/or mechanistic differences in their multistep carboxylation chemistry (Tcherkez, 2013, 2016; Young et al., 2016).

With regard to haptophyte Rubisco, the \( K_C – k_{cat} \) relationship of \( P. lutheri \) and \( P. carterae \) appeared to align more closely with Form 1B Rubisco (Fig. 3A). Consequently, Table 1.

### Table 1. Rubisco kinetic parameters measured at 25 °C

| Species       | \( k_{cat}^{C} \) (s\(^{-1}\)) | \( K_C \) (\( \mu \)M) | \( K_O \) (\( \mu \)M) | \( S_{CO} \) (mol mol\(^{-1}\)) | \( k_{cat}^{21\%O_2} \) (\( \mu \)M) | \( k_{cat}^{O} \) (s\(^{-1}\)) | \( k_{cat}^{O}/K_O \) (mM\(^{-1}\) s\(^{-1}\)) | CE | \( k_{cat}^{C}/K_C \) (mM\(^{-1}\) s\(^{-1}\)) | \( k_{cat}^{C}/K_C^{21\%O_2} \) (mM\(^{-1}\) s\(^{-1}\)) |
|---------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------------|---|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| **Haptophytes** |                              |                       |                      |                               |                                   |                      |                                   |   |                                  |                                  |
| \( P. carterae \) | 3.3 ± 0.4                     | 17.7 ± 1.5            | 366 ± 60             | 102 ± 1                       | 30.6                              | 0.7                  | 1.8                               | 186 | 108                             |                                  |
| \( T. lutea \)   | 2.2 ± 0.1                     | 24.1 ± 0.5            | 800 ± 55             | 89 ± 1                        | 32.2                              | 0.8                  | 1.0                               | 91  | 68                              |                                  |
| \( P. lutheri \) | 2.5 ± 0.1                     | 14.5 ± 1.6            | 1146 ± 212           | 125 ± 2                       | 17.8                              | 1.6                  | 1.4                               | 172 | 140                             |                                  |
| **Diatom**a     |                              |                       |                      |                               |                                   |                      |                                   |   |                                  |                                  |
| \( P. tricornutum \) | 3.3 ± 0.5                    | 41.1 ± 1.3            | 664 ± 54             | 116 ± 2                       | 57.6                              | 0.5                  | 0.7                               | 80  | 55                              |                                  |
| \( C_3 \) planta  | 3.1 ± 0.3                     | 9.7 ± 0.1             | 283 ± 15             | 81 ± 1                        | 18.9                              | 1.1                  | 3.9                               | 319 | 164                             |                                  |

CE, carboxylation efficiency.

The rate of oxygenation (\( k_{cat}^{O} \)) was calculated using the equation \( k_{cat}^{O} = (k_{cat}^{C} \times K_O)/(K_C \times S_{CO}) \times K_C \) at 25 °C under ambient atmospheric \( O_2 \) levels; \( K_C^{21\%O_2} \) was calculated as \( K_C(1+\frac{[O_2]}{K_O}) \) assuming an \( O_2 \) solubility of 0.00126 mol (l bar\(^{-1}\)) and an atmospheric pressure of 1.013 bar resulting in an \([O_2]\) value of 267 \( \mu \)M in solution.

Values shown are average of measurements from \( n \geq 3 \) (±SD) biological repeat samples.

*a*Data from Young et al. (2016).

Supplementary Table S1). An examination of the \( K_C – k_{cat} \) relationship for ‘green’ Form 1B (vascular plants, CCM-positive green algae) and ‘non-green’ Form 1D (diatoms, haptophytes, and red algae) Rubisco suggests they follow differing trajectories (Fig. 3A). As suggested previously, this might arise from lineage-dependent variation in ribulose bisphosphate (RuBP) enolization energies and/or mechanistic differences in their multistep carboxylation chemistry (Tcherkez, 2013, 2016; Young et al., 2016).

With regard to haptophyte Rubisco, the \( K_C – k_{cat} \) relationship of \( P. lutheri \) and \( P. carterae \) Rubisco appeared to align more closely with Form 1B Rubisco (Fig. 3A). Consequently,
their carboxylation efficiencies under both anaerobic \((k_{\text{cat}}^{C}/K_{C})\) and ambient \(O_2 (k_{\text{cat}}^{C}/K_{C}^{21\%O_2})\) are higher than those of \(T. lutea\) Rubisco (Table 1) whose \(k_{C}^{O}/k_{\text{cat}}^{C}\) relationship closely aligns with red algae and diatom Form 1D Rubiscos (Fig. 3A), and lower carboxylation efficiency of \(P. tricornutum\) Rubisco (Table 1). These findings suggest that there may be differences in the CCM effectiveness between the bulging pyrenoids in \(P. carterae\) relative to the immersed pyrenoids of diatoms and \(T. lutea\). It also raises questions regarding how differences in the CCM and/or cellular metabolism in phytoplankton with immersed pyrenoids have led to the evolution of atypical Form 1D Rubisco kinetics.

Somewhat analogous to their differing \(k_{C}^{O}/k_{\text{cat}}^{C}\) relationships, both Form 1B and 1D enzymes showed differing linear correlations between \(K_{O}\) and \(k_{\text{cat}}^{O} (\text{Fig. 3B})\) but no identifiable correlations between their \(k_{\text{cat}}^{C}/k_{\text{cat}}^{O}\) (Fig. 3C) and \(K_{C}/K_{O}\) (Fig. 3D) relationships. This finding is consistent with increasing experimental evidence that changes in the carboxylation and oxygenation properties are not coupled in an obligatory manner (Savir et al., 2010; Whitney et al., 2011; Sharwood et al., 2016a; Sharwood, 2017). This unfastening of carboxylation and oxygenation has enabled significant Rubisco kinetic diversity to have evolved in nature, in particular with regard to \(CO_2/O_2\) selectivity \((S_{CO_2})\) whose correlative trade-off with \(k_{\text{cat}}^{C}\) follows a diffuse exponential relationship (Fig. 3E; Sharwood, 2017) rather than the linear response previously postulated (Tcherkez et al., 2006; Savir et al., 2010). Within the \(k_{\text{cat}}^{C}/S_{CO_2}\) relationship, the haptophyte Rubisco localizes in a region comparable with diatom Rubisco between the high \(S_{CO_2}\), low \(k_{\text{cat}}^{C}\) of Form 1D red algae Rubisco and the lower \(S_{CO_2}\), higher \(k_{\text{cat}}^{C}\) of Form 1B Rubisco (Fig. 3E).

**Interpreting the differing \(O_2\) sensitivities of haptophyte Rubisco**

While the CCMs of phototrophic organisms function to elevate the \(CO_2/O_2\) ratio around Rubisco through increased \(CO_2\) supply, it is unclear how the ratio is dependent on complementary mechanisms to lower \(O_2\). In many organisms employing a CCM, the \(O_2\)-generating components are located away from Rubisco. For example, the Rubisco-containing bundle sheath cell (BSC) chloroplasts in \(C_4\) plants within NADP-malic enzyme (NADP-ME) subtypes characteristically lack the \(O_2\)-evolving PSII complexes (Sage et al., 2014; von Caemmerer and Furbank, 2016). Similarly, the thylakoids traversing the pyrenoid of the red algae *Porphyridium cruentum* lack PSII (McKay and Gibbs, 1990), while in the dinoflagellate *Gonyaulax polyedra* during times of high carbon fixation the Rubisco is spatially relocated to pyrenoids near the cell center away from the \(O_2\)-evolving light-harvesting reactions (Nassoury et al., 2001). Similarly in cyanobacteria, the carboxysomes localize to the cell interior away from the PSII thylakoids lining the cell periphery (Liberton et al., 2011). These strategies for spatially separating \(O_2\) production away from Rubisco appear to be key components of the CCM. Unfortunately, measuring the \(O_2\) concentration in bundle sheath cell chloroplasts, cyanobacteria carboxysomes, or inside the pyrenoid of algae remains an insurmountable challenge.

As indicated above, the oxygenation properties of Rubisco show significant natural variation. Drawing correlations between their \(O_2\) sensitivity (i.e. \(K_{O}\)) and CCM efficiency is therefore quite challenging. An additional complexity is that the extent of \(O_2\) solubility is reduced by the highly proteinaceous matrix of pyrenoids, chloroplasts, and carboxysomes (Tcherkez, 2016) and by the increasing pressures experienced by microalgae down the water column. Interestingly the higher \(K_{O}\) of \(T. lutea, P. tricornutum,\) and \(P. lutheri\) Rubisco tend to limiting the influence of changing \(O_2\) concentrations on carboxylation efficiency relative to Rubisco from tobacco and *P. carterae* (Fig. 4). This implies that the variable \(O_2\) concentrations experienced by diatoms and haptophytes within the water column might have influenced their Rubisco kinetic evolution. Furthermore, pyrenoid morphology and ultrastructure may also have influenced the evolved oxygenase properties. For example, *P. lutheri* Rubisco exhibits a low affinity for \(O_2 (K_{O} \sim 1150 \mu M)\), implying that its Rubisco experiences higher \(O_2\) concentrations than the Rubisco from algae possessing immersed (e.g. \(T. lutea, P. tricornutum, K_{O} \sim 650–800 \mu M\)) or bulging (\(P. carterae, K_{O} \sim 366 \mu M\) pyrenoids (Table 1).

These observations could be interpreted to suggest that the pyrenoids, in particular those with a bulging morphology, might be lowering the \(O_2\) environment to augment the \(CO_2/O_2\) ratio around Rubisco. Possibly internally bulging pyrenoids may locate Rubisco closer to the reducing chemistry of the cytosol or the mitochondria and their respired \(CO_2\). Other mechanisms for altering pyrenoid \(CO_2/O_2\) include reducing thylakoid number within the pyrenoid, reducing the \(O_2\)-producing PSII activity (McKay and Gibbs, 1990), or employing pyrenoid tubules for diffusion (Engel et al., 2015). Challenging these hypotheses is the observed high \(K_{O}\) (~2000 \(\mu M\)), indicating an insensitivity to \(O_2\) for Rubisco...
from the pyrenoid-containing diatom *Thalassiosira weissflogii* (Young et al., 2016) and that multiple thylakoids traverse the pyrenoid of *P. carterae*, albeit with untested levels of PSII activity (Manton and Peterfi, 1969).

The influence of a CCM on the Rubisco requirement in haptophytes

A characteristic feature of the CCM in C4 plants is that it reduces the requirement for Rubisco, allowing for increased nitrogen use efficiency (Ghannoum et al., 2005). In diatoms, the Rubisco content was found to correlate with $K_C$, suggesting that the allocation of resources into the enzyme may depend on CCM efficiency (Young et al., 2016). For example, the low $K_C$ of Rubisco from *Phaeodactylum* and *Chaetoceros* diatom species correlated with increased investment in Rubisco content, while in *Thalassiosira* and *Skeletonema* species it was hypothesized that resources were instead allocated to the CCM rather than Rubisco to saturate the enzymes low CO$_2$ affinity (Young et al., 2016).

Among the three haptophyte species examined here, we identified a negative relationship between increasing CO$_2$ affinity (i.e. reducing $K_C$) and increasing Rubisco content (dashed line, Fig. 5). The trajectory of this relationship poorly correlated with the Rubisco content and $K_C$ of *P. tricornutum*. While it is known that Rubisco content in diatoms can be influenced by growth stage (Losh et al., 2013), our measurements comprised replicate algae samples from cultures growing under non-nutrient limiting conditions and resulted in reproducible measures of Rubisco content (Fig. 5). While future experiments are aimed at examining these properties from a wider range of microalgae species, it is apparent that in the pyrenoid-lacking *P. lutheri* cells there is ~3- to 4-fold higher investment of soluble cellular protein in Rubisco (Fig. 5). Likewise, the Rubisco content in hornworts also shows a comparable correlation with the presence/absence of pyrenoids (Hanson et al., 2002). Similarly, in C$_3$ plants, Rubisco comprises a larger resource investment [25–50% (w/w) total soluble protein] relative to C$_4$ plants where the CCM and higher $K_{cat}$ reduces the amount of Rubisco required [i.e. 8–15% (w/w) of the soluble cellular protein (Ghannoum et al., 2005; Sharwood et al., 2016a, c)].

How suited is phytoplankton Rubisco to supporting photosynthesis in C$_3$ plants?

Improving the catalytic efficiency of Rubisco is a key target for improving the rate of photosynthesis and growth in key C$_3$ crops such as rice and wheat (Long et al., 2015; Sharwood et al., 2016b). This has led to considerable interest in identifying whether the natural catalytic diversity of Rubisco can be exploited to deliver improvements in crop Rubisco performance. The faster Rubisco from *Synechococcus* PCC7942 (cyanobacteria) and the photosynthetic bacterium *Rhodospirillum rubrum* are not able to support faster C$_3$ plant growth, even under elevated CO$_2$, due to their low carboxylation efficiencies under ambient O$_2$ ($K_{cat}/K_{m}$) and their low $S_{CO2}$ (Sharwood, 2017). In comparison, the higher $K_{cat}/K_{m}$ and $S_{CO2}$ of the Form 1D Rubisco from *Griffithsia monilis* (filamentous red algae) would support faster rates of photosynthesis in C$_3$ crops with the potential to improve productivity by up to 30% (Long et al., 2015). Realizing this benefit is impeded by the incompatible assembly requirements of Form 1D Rubisco in plant chloroplasts (Whitney et al., 2001). Nevertheless, it is hoped solutions to improving crop Rubisco may be achieved through increased understanding of natural kinetic diversity among all Rubisco

![Fig. 5. Rubisco content is reduced in pyrenoid-containing phytoplankton. The Rubisco content (quantified by $^{14}$C/CABP binding and expressed as a percentage of the cellular soluble protein) in cells grown at 20 °C under saturating nutrients was higher (11.4 ± 1.2%) in the pyrenoid-lacking *P. lutheri* cells relative to that in *P. carterae* (3.0 ± 0.8%), *T. lutea* (3.5 ± 0.9%), and *P. tricornutum* (3.2 ± 0.6%).](image1)

![Fig. 6. The varying potential of phytoplankton Rubisco in a C$_3$ leaf. The influence of each Rubisco analyzed in Table 1 on CO$_2$ assimilation rates (A) at 25 °C in a C$_3$ leaf as a function of C$_3$ was modeled according to Farquhar et al. (1980) as described in the Materials and methods. For the tobacco Rubisco, the photosynthetic rate became light limited (indicated by 1°) at C$_3$ >320 μbar.](image2)
forms (Whitney et al., 2011; Sharwood, 2017). We therefore used the modeling approach of Farquhar et al. (1980) to simulate how each microalgae would influence C$_3$ photosynthesis under varying chloroplast CO$_2$ concentrations (C$_C$; Fig. 6). The low $k^{C}_C/K_C^{215/2}$ of T. lutea (and P. tricornutum) Rubisco (Table 1) impeded their simulated effect on C$_3$ photosynthesis at 25 °C. In contrast, the high $S_{CO_2}$ of P. lutheri Rubisco improved the simulated photosynthetic rates relative to tobacco Rubisco under low C$_C$ but not above 150 μbar of CO$_2$ due to its lower $k^{C}_C$ and $k^{C}_C/K_C^{215/2}$ (Table 1). This finding suggests that future kinetic surveys to identify microalgae Rubisco better suited to operating in C$_3$ plant chloroplasts might best focus on microalgae that lack a pyrenoid and a CCM.

Conclusions and future directions

Due to their importance at the base of the marine food chain, global biogeochemical cycling, and interpretation of paleo-chemical signals in marine sediments, it is essential that we better understand the diversity and function of the algae CCMs. In this pilot study, we provide preliminary evidence for correlations between Rubisco content, kinetics, and pyrenoid morphology within the chloroplast of different haptophytes and the diatom P. tricornutum. Recent work has highlighted the lack of knowledge on the components and variable efficiency of the CCM across environmentally important microalgae (Hanson, 2016; Hopkinson et al., 2016; Young et al., 2016). Previous models of the algal CCM relied on correlations with distant photosynthetic organisms and limited Rubisco kinetic data. Elucidating the diversity and biological relevance of CCMs in these species will provide the groundwork necessary for understanding primary production in the world’s oceans.

Our study provides evidence for the potential to use the binding affinities of Rubisco as a probe to gauge the intracellular CO$_2$:O$_2$ ratio around Rubisco and which might include an oxygen exclusion function by the pyrenoid. Future correlative analyses of Form 1D and Form 1B Rubisco kinetics from microalgae lacking pyrenoids and with differing pyrenoid morphologies are needed to yield a more robust functional understanding of the intrapyrenoid microenvironment and the natural diversity in carbon fixation in both terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems. Although challenging to measure, these Rubisco analyses are essential for understanding both (i) the different evolutionary histories of Form I Rubisco whose kinetics appear to have divergently evolved and (ii) the extent to which the competing carboxylation and oxygenation properties can be decoupled. Refining the existing assumptions about diversity and trends in photosynthetic evolution are paramount. Included in such endeavors are whether the non-canonical correlation between $K_C$ and $C^{15}_C$ is limited to Form 1D Rubisco from microalgae with immersed pyrenoids (Fig. 3A), if resource allocation to Rubisco is elevated in species with a less effective CCM (Fig. 5), and to what extent increases in $k^{C}_C/K_C^{215/2}$, $S_{CO_2}$, and $K_O$ (i.e. a reduced O$_2$ sensitivity) can be used as a proxy to gauge the effectiveness of microalgae CCMs.

Supplementary data

Supplementary data are available at JXB online.

Fig. S1. Measurement of Rubisco activation status and stability in vitro at 25 °C.

Table S1. Rubisco kinetics at 25 °C as shown in Fig. 3.

Acknowledgements

AMCH was funded through a Clarendon Scholarship, Oxford and ANU visiting scholar (CE140100015). Funding for JNY and SMW was provided through Australian Research Council Grant CE14010001. RES was funded through the ARC DECRA scheme (DE13010760) and REMR was funded through an ERC Starting Grant (SP2-GA-2008-20915).

References

Allen AE, Moustafa A, Montsant A, Eckert A, Kroth PG, Bowler C. 2012. Evolution and functional diversification of fructose bisphosphate aldolase genes in photosynthetic marine diatoms. Molecular Biology and Evolution 29, 367–279.

Badger MR, Andrews TJ, Whitney SM, Ludwig M, Yellowlees DC, Leggat W, Price GD. 1998. The diversity and coevolution of Rubisco, plastids, pyrenoids, and chloroplrost-based. Canadian Journal of Botany 76, 1052–1071.

Badger MR, Hanson D, Price GD. 2002. Evolution and diversity of CO$_2$ concentrating mechanisms in cyanobacteria. Functional Plant Biology 29, 161–173.

Bedoshvili YD, Popkova TP, Likhoshway YV. 2009. Chloroplast structure of diatoms of different classes. Cell and Tissue Biology 3, 297–310.

Beech PL, Wetherbee R. 1988. Observations on the flagellar apparatus and peripheral endoplasmic reticulum of the coccolithophorid Pleurochrysis carterae (Prymnesiophyceae). Phycologia 27, 142–158.

Bendif EM, Probert I, Hervé A, Billard C, Goux D, Lelong C, Cadoret JP, Véron B. 2011. Integrative taxonomy of the Pavlovophyceae (Haptophyta): a reassessment. Protist 162, 738–761.

Bendif EM, Probert I, Schroeder DC, de Vargas C. 2013. On the description of Tisochrysis lutea gen. nov. sp. nov. and Isochrysis nuda sp. nov. in the Isochrysidales, and the transfer of Dicrateria to the Prymnesiales (Haptophyta). Journal of Applied Phycology 25, 1763–1776.

Bendif EM, Probert I, Schroeder DC, de Vargas C. 2014. Erratum to: On the description of Tisochrysis lutea gen. nov. sp. nov. and Isochrysis nuda sp. nov. in the Isochrysidales, and the transfer of Dicrateria to the Prymnesiales (Haptophyta). Journal of Applied Phycology 26, 1617.

Berner RA. 2006. GEOCARBSULF: a combined model for Phanerozoic atmospheric CO$_2$ and CO$_2$-Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 70, 5653–5664.

Berner RA, Canfield DE. 1989. A new model for atmospheric oxygen over Phanerozoic time. American Journal of Science 289, 333–361.

Billard C, Gayral P. 1972. Two new species of Isochrysis with remarks on Isochrysis Tisochrysis lutea sp. nov. in the Isochrysidales, and the transfer of Dicrateria to the Prymnesiales (Haptophyta). Journal of Applied Phycology 14, 1763–1776.

Bedoshvili YD, Popkova TP, Likhoshway YV. 2009. Chloroplast structure of diatoms of different classes. Cell and Tissue Biology 3, 297–310.

Beech PL, Wetherbee R. 1988. Observations on the flagellar apparatus and peripheral endoplasmic reticulum of the coccolithophorid Pleurochrysis carterae (Prymnesiophyceae). Phycologia 27, 142–158.

Bendif EM, Probert I, Schroeder DC, de Vargas C. 2013. On the description of Tisochrysis lutea gen. nov. sp. nov. and Isochrysis nuda sp. nov. in the Isochrysidales, and the transfer of Dicrateria to the Prymnesiales (Haptophyta). Journal of Applied Phycology 25, 1763–1776.

Berner RA. 2006. GEOCARBSULF: a combined model for Phanerozoic atmospheric CO$_2$ and CO$_2$-Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 70, 5653–5664.

Berner RA, Canfield DE. 1989. A new model for atmospheric oxygen over Phanerozoic time. American Journal of Science 289, 333–361.

Billard C, Gayral P. 1972. Two new species of Isochrysis with remarks on the genus Ruttnera. British Phycological Journal 7, 289–297.

Blackburn SI, Bolch CJ, Haskard KA, Hallegraft GM. 2001. Reproductive compatibility among four global populations of the toxic dinoflagellate Gymnodinium catenatum (Dinophyceae). Phycologia 40, 78–87.

Boronwitzka MA, Volcani BE. 1978. The polymorphic diatom Phaeodactylum tricornutum: ultrastructure of its morphotypes. Journal of Phytoplankton 14, 10–21.

Bowler C, Allen AE, Badger JH, et al. 2008. The Phaeodactylum genome reveals the evolutionary history of diatom genomes. Nature 456, 239–244.

Burns BD, Beardall J. 1987. Utilization of inorganic carbon by marine microalgae. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 107, 75–86.

Burris JE. 1981. Effects of oxygen and inorganic carbon concentrations on the photosynthetic quotients of marine algae. Marine Biology 65, 215–219.
Canfield DE. 2005. The early history of atmospheric oxygen: homage to Robert M. Garrels. Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences 33, 1–15.

Chen X, Qiu CE, Shao JZ. 2006. Evidence for K+-dependent HCO3− utilization in the marine diatom Phaeodactylum tricornutum. Plant Physiology 141, 731–736.

Colman B, Rotatore C. 1995. Photosynthetic inorganic carbon uptake and accumulation in two marine diatoms. Plant, Cell and Environment 18, 919–924.

Del Prete S, Vullo D, De Luca V, Supuran CT, Capasso C. 2014. Biochemical characterization of the δ-carbonic anhydrase from the marine diatom Thalassiosira weissflogii. TewCA. Journal of Enzyme Inhibition and Medicinal Chemistry 29, 906–911.

Engel BD, Schaffer M, Kuhn Cuellar L, Villa E, Plitzko JM, Baumeister W. 2015. Native architecture of the Chlamydomonas chloroplast revealed by in situ cryo-electron tomography. eLife 4, e04889.

Farquhar GD, von Caemmerer S, Berry JA. 1980. A biochemical model of photosynthetic CO2 assimilation in leaves of C3 species. Planta 149, 79–90.

Ghannoum O, Evans JR, Chow WS, Andrews TJ, Conroy JP, von Caemmerer S. 2005. Faster Rubisco is the key to superior nitrogen-use efficiency in NADP-malic enzyme relative to NAD-malic enzyme C4 grasses. Plant Physiology 137, 638–650.

Green JC. 1975. The fine structure and taxonomy of the haptophycean flagellate Pavlova lutheri (Droop) comb. nov. Journal of the Marine Biological Association UK 55, 785–793.

Green JC, Parke M. 1975. New observations upon members of the genus Chrysothla Aanaard, with remarks upon their relationship within the Haptophyceae. Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom 50, 1125–1136.

Green JC, Pienaar RN. 1977. The taxonomy of the order Isochrysidales (Prymnesiophyceae) with special reference to the genera Isochrysis Parke, Dicrateria Parke and Imantonia Reynolds. Journal of the Marine Biological Association UK 57, 7–17.

Guillard RR, Ryther JH. 1962. Studies of marine planktonic diatoms. I. Cyclotella nana Hustedt, and Detonula confervacea (cleve) Gran. Canadian Journal of Microbiology 8, 229–239.

Hanson DT. 2016. Breaking the rules of Rubisco catalysis. Journal of Experimental Botany 67, 3180–3182.

Hanson D, Andrews TJ, Badger MR. 2002. Variability of the pyrenoid-Hanson D, Andrews TJ, Badger MR. 2016. Breaking the rules of Rubisco catalysis. Journal of Experimental Botany 67, 3180–3182.

Hopkinson BM, Dupont CL, Allen AE, Morel FMM. 2011. Efficiency of the CO2-concentrating mechanism of diatoms. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 108, 3830–3837.

Hopkinson BM, Dupont CL, Matsuda Y. 2016. The physiology and genetics of CO2-concentrating mechanisms in model diatoms. Current Opinion in Plant Biology 31, 51–57.

Hopkinson BM, Meille C, Shen C. 2013. Quantification of extracellular carbonic anhydrase activity in two marine diatoms and investigation of its role. Plant Physiology 162, 1142–1152.

Hori T, Green JC. 1985. The ultrastructure of mitosis in Isochrysis galbana Parke (Prymnesiophyceae). Protoplasma 125, 140–151.

Hovde BT, Deodato CR, Hunsperger HM, et al. 2015. Genome sequence and transcriptome analyses of Chrysochromulina tubin: metabolic tools for enhanced algal fitness in the prominent order Prymnesiales (Haptophyceae). PLoS Genetics 11, e1005469.

Jin S, Sun J, Wunder T, Tang D, Cousins AB, Sze SK, Mueller-Cajar O, Gao Y-G. 2016. Structural insights into the LCIB protein family reveals a new group of Mg-carbonic anhydrases. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 113, 14716–14721.

Karolsson J, Clarke AK, Chen ZY, Hugghins SY, Park YI, Husic HD, Moroney JV, Samuellson G. 1998. A novel alpha-type carbonic anhydrase associated with the thylakoid membrane in Chlamydomonas reinhardtii is required for growth at ambient CO2. EMBO Journal 17, 1208–1216.

Kikutani S, Nakajima K, Nagasato C, Tsuji Y, Miyatake A, Matsuda Y. 2016. Thylakoid luminal δ-carbonic anhydrase critical for growth and photosynthesis in the marine diatom Phaeodactylum tricornutum. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 98, 9829–9833.

Lane TW, Morel FM. 2000a. Regulation of carbonic anhydrase expression by zinc, cobalt, and carbon dioxide in the marine diatom Thalassiosira weissflogii. Plant Physiology 123, 345–362.

Lane TW, Morel FMM. 2000b. A biological function for cadmium in marine diatoms. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 97, 4627–4631.

Lapointe M, Mackenzie TD, Morse D. 2008. An external delta-carbonic anhydrase in a free-living marine dinoflagellate may circumvent diffusion-limited carbon acquisition. Plant Physiology 147, 1427–1436.

Lara MAV, Andreo CS. 2011. C. plants adaptation to high levels of CO2 and to drought environments. In: Shanker A, ed. Plants—mechanisms and adaptations. InTech, 415–428.

Lee RB, Smith JA, Rickaby RE. 2013. Cloning, expression and characterization of the δ-carbonic anhydrase of Thalassiosira weissflogii (Barillariiophyceae). Journal of Phycology 49, 170–177.

Liberton M, Austin JR 2nd, Berg RH, Pakrasi HB. 2011. Insights into the complex D-architecture of thylakoid membranes in unicellular cyanobacterium Cyanothece sp. ATCC 51142. Plant Signaling and Behavior 6, 566–569.

Liu H, Aris-Brosou S, Probert I, de Vargas C. 2010. A time line of the environmental genetics of the haptophytes. Molecular Biology and Evolution 27, 161–176.

Loganathan N, Tsai Y-CC, Mueller-Cajar O. 2016. Characterization of the heterooligomeric red-type rubisco activase from red algae. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 113, 14019–14024.

Long SP, Marshall-Colon A, Zhu XG. 2015. Meeting the global food demand of the future by engineering crop photosynthesis and yield potential. Cell 161, 56–66.

Losh JL, Young JN, Morel FM. 2013. Rubisco is a small fraction of total protein in marine phytoplankton. New Phytologist 198, 52–58.

Mackinder LCM, Meyer MT, Mettler-alltman T, Chen V, Madeline C. 2016. A repeat protein links Rubisco to form the eukaryotic carbon concentrating organelle. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 113, 5958–5963.

Mangan NM, Flamholz A, Hood RD, Milo R, Savage DF. 2016. pH determines the energetic efficiency of the cyanobacterial CO2 concentrating mechanism. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 113, E5364–E5362.

Manton I, Peterfi LS. 1969. Observations on the fine structure of coccoliths, scales and the protoplasm of a freshwater Coccolithophorid, Hymenomonas rosaeola Stein, with supplementary observations on the Protoplasm of Crisophacera caseae. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 172, 1–15.

Mckay RM, Gibbs SP. 1990. Phycocerythin is absent from the pyrenoid of Porphyridium cruentum: photosynthetic implications. Planta 180, 249–256.

Morel FMM, Reinfelder JR, Roberts SB, Chamberlain CP, Lee JG, Yee D. 1994. Zinc and carbon co-limitation of marine phytoplankton. Nature 369, 740–742.

Moritz M, Griffiths H. 2013. Origins and diversity of eukaryotic CO2-concentrating mechanisms: lessons for the future. Journal of Experimental Botany 64, 769–786.

Moroney JV, Ma Y, Frey WD, Fusilier KA, Pham TT, Simms TA, DiMarino RJ, Yang J, Mukherjee B. 2011. The carbonic anhydrase isoforms of Chlamydomonas reinhardtii: intracellular location, expression, and physiological roles. Photosynthesis Research 109, 133–149.

Nassoury N, Fritz L, Morse D. 2001. Circadian changes in ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase distribution inside individual chloroplasts can account for the rhythm in dinoflagellate carbon fixation. The Plant Cell 13, 923–934.

Okazaki M, Aruga S, Okamura Y. 1992. Role of carbonic anhydrase in photosynthesis of unicellular marine algae coccolithophorids (Haptophyta). Photosynthesis Research 34, 783–786.

Raven JA, Cockell CS, De La Rocha CL. 2008. The evolution of inorganic carbon concentrating mechanisms in photosynthesis. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 363, 2641–2650.

Raven JA, Giordano M, Beadall J, Maberly SC. 2012. Algal evolution in relation to atmospheric CO2: carboxylases, carbon-concentrating...
Rubisco kinetics and pyrenoid morphology shape the CCM of haptophyte microalgae

mechanisms and carbon oxidation cycles. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 367, 493–507.

Read BA, Kegel J, Klute MJ, et al. 2013. Pan genome of the phytoplankton Emiliania underpins its global distribution. Nature 499, 209–213.

Reinfelder JR. 2011. Carbon concentrating mechanisms in eukaryotic marine phytoplankton. Annual Review of Marine Science 3, 291–315.

Richlen M, Barber PH. 2005. A technique for the rapid extraction of microalgal DNA from single live and preserved cells. Molecular Ecology Notes 4, 688–691.

Sage RF. 2002. Variation in the $k_{4}$ of Rubisco in C_{3} and C_{4} plants and some implications for photosynthetic performance at high and low temperature. Journal of Experimental Botany 53, 609–620.

Sage RF, Khoshravesh R, Sage TL. 2014. From proto-Kranz to C_{4} Kranz: building the bridge to C_{4} photosynthesis. Journal of Experimental Botany 65, 3341–3356.

Sage RF, Sage TL, Kocacinar F. 2012. Photorespiration and the evolution of C_{4} photosynthesis. Annual Review of Plant Biology 63, 19–47.

Savir Y, Noor E, Milo R, Tlusty T. 2010. Cross-species analysis traces adaptation of Rubisco toward optimality in a low-dimensional landscape. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 107, 3475–3480.

Sharwood RE. 2017. Engineering chloroplasts to improve Rubisco catalysis: prospects for translating improvements into food and fiber crops. New Phytologist 213, 494–510.

Sharwood RE, Ghanoum O, Kapralov MV, Gunn LH, Whitney SM. 2016a. Temperature responses of Rubisco from Paniceae grasses provide opportunities for improving C_{4} photosynthesis. Nature Plants 2, 16186.

Sharwood RE, Ghanoum O, Whitney SM. 2016b. Prospects for improving CO_{2} fixation in C_{3}-crops through understanding C_{4}-Rubisco biogenesis and catalytic diversity. Current Opinion in Plant Biology 31, 135–142.

Sharwood RE, Sonawane BV, Ghanoum O, Whitney SM. 2016c. Improved analysis of CO_{2} and C_{3} photosynthesis via refined in vitro assays of their carbon fixation biochemistry. Journal of Experimental Botany 67, 3137–3148.

Soto AR, Zheng H, Shoemaker D, Rodriguez J, Read BA, Wahlund TM. 2006. Identification and preliminary characterization of two cDNAs encoding unique carbonic anhydrases from the marine alga Emiliania huxleyi. Applied and Environmental Microbiology 72, 5500–5511.

Tabita FR, Satagopan S, Hanson TE, Kreel NE, Scott SS. 2008. Distinct form I, II, III, and IV Rubisco proteins from the three kingdoms of life provide clues about Rubisco evolution and structure/function relationships. Journal of Experimental Botany 59, 1515–1524.

Tachibana M, Allen AE, Kikutani S, Endo Y, Bowler C, Matsuda Y. 2011. Localization of putative carbonic anhydrases in two marine diatoms, Phaeodactylum tricornutum and Thalassiosira pseudonana. Photosynthesis Research 109, 205–221.

Tcherkez G. 2013. Modelling the reaction mechanism of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase and consequences for kinetic parameters. Plant, Cell and Environment 36, 1586–1596.

Tcherkez G. 2016. The mechanism of Rubisco-catalysed oxygenation. Plant, Cell and Environment 39, 983–997.

Tcherkez GGB, Farquhar GD, Andrews TJ. 2006. Despite slow catalysis and confused substrate specificity, all ribulose bisphosphate carboxylases may be nearly perfectly optimized. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 103, 7246–7251.

Trimborn S, Langer G, Rost B. 2007. Effect of varying calcium concentrations and light intensities on calcification and photosynthesis in Emiliania huxleyi. Limnology Oceanography 52, 2285–2293.

von Caemmerer S, Furbank RT. 2016. Strategies for improving C_{4} photosynthesis. Current Opinion in Plant Biology 31, 125–134.

Wang L, Yamano T, Takane S, et al. 2016. Chloroplast-mediated regulation of CO_{2}-concentrating mechanism by Ca^{2+}-binding protein CAS in the green alga Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 113, 12586–12591.

Wang Y, Stessman DJ, Spalding MH. 2015. The CO_{2} concentrating mechanism and photosynthetic carbon assimilation in limiting CO_{2}; how Chlamydomonas works against the gradient. The Plant Journal 82, 429–448.

Whitney SM, Baldet P, Hudson GS, Andrews TJ. 2001. Form I Rubiscos from non-green algae are expressed abundantly but not assembled in tobacco chloroplasts. The Plant Journal 26, 535–547.

Whitney SM, Houtz RL, Alonso H. 2011. Advancing our understanding and capacity to engineer nature’s CO_{2}-sequestering enzyme, Rubisco. Plant Physiology 155, 27–35.

Yamano T, Sato E, Iguchi H, Fukuda Y, Fukuzawa H. 2015. Characterization of cooperative bicarbonate uptake into chloroplast stroma in the green alga Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 112, 7315–7320.

Yoon HS, Hackett JD, Pinto G, Bhattacharya D. 2002. The single, ancient origin of chromist plastids. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 99, 15507–15512.

Yoon S, Govind CK, Qiu H, Kim S-J, Dong J, Hinnebusch AG. 2004. Recruitment of the ArgR/Mcm1p repressor is stimulated by the activator Gcn4p: a self-checking activation mechanism. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 101, 11713–11718.

Young JN, Heureux AM, Sharwood RE, Rickaby RE, Morel FM, Whitney SM. 2016. Large variation in the Rubisco kinetics of diatoms reveals diversity among their carbon-concentrating mechanisms. Journal of Experimental Botany 67, 3445–3456.

Young JN, Rickaby RE, Kapralov MV, Filatov DA. 2012. Adaptive signals in algal Rubisco reveal a history of ancient atmospheric carbon dioxide. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 367, 483–492.