Air Pollution and Percent Emphysema Identified by Computed Tomography in the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis

Sara D. Adar,¹ Joel D. Kaufman,²,3,4 Ana V. Diez-Roux,¹ Eric A. Hoffman,⁵ Jennifer D’Souza,¹ Karen H. Stukovský,⁶ Stephen S. Rich,⁷ Jerome I. Rotter,⁶ Xiuging Guo,⁶ Leslie J. Raffel,⁷ Paul D. Sampson,¹⁰ Assaf P. Oron,¹¹ Trivellore Raghunathan,¹² and R. Graham Barr¹³,¹⁴

¹Department of Epidemiology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan, USA; ²Department of Environmental and Occupational Health Sciences, ³Department of Epidemiology, and ⁴Department of Medicine, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington, USA; ⁵Department of Radiology, University of Iowa, Iowa City, Iowa, USA; ⁶Department of Biostatistics, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington, USA; ⁷Center for Public Health Genomics, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, Virginia, USA; ⁸Institute for Translational Genomics and Population Sciences, Los Angeles Biomedical Research Institute at Harbor-UCLA Medical Center, Torrance, California, USA; ⁹Medical Genetics Institute, Cedars-Sinai Medical Center, Los Angeles, California, USA; ¹⁰Department of Statistics, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington, USA; ¹¹Core for Biomedical Studies, Seattle Children’s Research Institute, Seattle, Washington, USA; ¹²Department of Biostatistics, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan, USA; ¹³Department of Medicine, and ¹⁴Department of Epidemiology, Columbia University Medical Center, New York, New York, USA

BACKGROUND: Air pollution is linked to low lung function and to respiratory events, yet little is known of associations with lung structure.

OBJECTIVES: We examined associations of particulate matter (PM$_{2.5}$, PM$_{10}$) and nitrogen oxides (NOx) with percent emphysema-like lung on computed tomography (CT).

METHODS: The Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA) recruited participants (45–84 years of age) in six U.S. states. Percent emphysema was defined as lung regions < -910 Hounsfield Units on cardiac CT scans acquired following a highly standardized protocol. Spirometry was also conducted on a subset. Individual-level 1- and 20-year average air pollution exposures were estimated using spatiotemporal models that included cohort-specific measurements. Multivariable regression was conducted to adjust for traditional risk factors and study location.

RESULTS: Among 6,515 participants, we found evidence of an association between percent emphysema and long-term pollution concentrations in an analysis leveraging between-city exposure contrasts. Higher concentrations of PM$_{2.5}$ (5 μg/m$^3$) and NOx (25 ppb) over the previous year were associated with 0.6% (95% CI: 0.1, 1.2%) and 0.5% (95% CI: 0.1, 0.9%) higher average percent emphysema, respectively. However, after adjustment for study site the associations were –0.6% (95% CI: –1.5, 0.3%) for PM$_{2.5}$ and –0.5% (95% CI: –1.1, 0.02%) for NOx. Lower lung function measures (FEV$_1$ and FVC) were associated with higher PM$_{2.5}$ and NOx levels in 3,791 participants before and after adjustment for study site, though most associations were not statistically significant.

CONCLUSIONS: Associations between ambient air pollution and percentage of emphysema-like lung were inconclusive in this cross-sectional study, thus longitudinal analyses may better clarify these associations with percent emphysema.

CITATION: Adar SD, Kaufman JD, Diez-Roux AV, Hoffman EA, D’Souza J, Stukovský KH, Rich SS, Rotter JI, Guo X, Raffel LJ, Sampson PD, Oron AP, Raghunathan T, Barr RG. 2015. Air pollution and percent emphysema identified by computed tomography in the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis, Environ Health Perspect 123:144–151; http://dx.doi.org/10.1289/ehp.1307951

Introduction

Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) is one of the 10 most debilitating illnesses worldwide (Vos et al. 2012). In 2010, 329 million people were estimated to have COPD, with nearly 29,000 productive person-years lost each year. Recent estimates suggest that COPD is currently the world’s third leading cause of death and the fifth leading cause of years lived with disability (Lozano et al. 2013; Vos et al. 2012).

COPD is defined physiologically by airflow limitation that is not fully reversible (Celli et al. 2004; Vestbo et al. 2013). Pulmonary emphysema is defined anatomici ly by destruction of interalveolar septae and loss of lung tissue and overlaps only partially with COPD. Although smoking is a leading cause of emphysema (Hogg 2004), only weak associations have been documented between emphysema severity and pack-years of cigarette smoking in the general population and in COPD patients (Hogg et al. 1994; Powell et al. 2013). In addition, emphysema has been shown to develop in never-smokers (Auerbach et al. 1972). Thus, questions remain as to risk factors for the etiology of emphysema.

Exposures to airborne particulate matter (PM) in outdoor, indoor, and workplace air may contribute to the development of emphysema. Epidemiological studies have consistently linked short-term peaks of PM with respiratory outcomes including morbidity and mortality of individuals with COPD (Kelly and Fussell 2011). Greater long-term exposures to air pollution have also been associated with slowed lung growth in children (Avol et al. 2001; Gauderman et al. 2004; Rojas-Martinez et al. 2007) and more rapid decline in lung function in adults (Detels et al. 1991; Downs et al. 2007; Taskin et al. 1994). Studies have similarly shown that greater long-term levels of PM and traffic-related air pollution are associated with higher incident and prevalent COPD (Andersen et al. 2011; Chen et al. 2005; Karakatsani et al. 2003; Lindgren et al. 2009; Schikowski et al. 2005; Sunyer 2001). To our knowledge, however, there has been no direct assessment of the relationship of ambient air pollution to pulmonary emphysema in an epidemiologic study.

Address correspondence to S. Adar, Department of Epidemiology, University of Michigan, 1415 Washington Heights, Ann Arbor, MI 48109 USA. Telephone: (734) 615-9207. E-mail: sadar@umich.edu

Supplemental Material is available online (http://dx.doi.org/10.1289/ehp.1307951). We gratefully acknowledge the other Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA) investigators, institutions, staff, and participants (http://www.mesa-nhlbi.org).

This work was supported by contracts N01-CV-85159 through N01-CV-85169 from the National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute, National Institutes of Health (NHLBI/NIH). MESA and Air Pollution (MESA Air) is supported by a U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) STAR research assistance agreement, RD831697. MESA Family is supported by NHLBI grants and contracts R01HL071051, R01HL071205, R01HL071250, R01HL071252, R01HL071258, and R01HL071259. The MESA Lung studies are funded by NHLBI grants R01HL077612, RC1HL100543, and HL093081. Additional support was provided by U.S. EPA grants RD833741010 and K24 ES013195.

Although supported in part by the U.S. EPA, this work has not been formally reviewed by the U.S. EPA and the views in this document are solely those of the authors. The U.S. EPA does not endorse any products or commercial services mentioned.

R.G.B. receives funding from the Alpha-1 Foundation and royalties from UpToDate, and has received an unrestricted gift of a nutritional supplement for an NIH-funded clinical trial from Genestra Health. The funding sources did not influence the design, collection, analysis, interpretation of the data, or decision to publish this work. The other authors declare they have no actual or potential competing financial interests.

Received: 2 December 2013; Accepted: 9 October 2014; Advance Publication: 10 October 2014; Final Publication: 1 February 2015.
Computed tomography (CT) provides an opportunity to assess pulmonary emphysema and changes in lung structure in vivo even among those with normal lung function. (Sanders et al. 1988). Here we examine the associations between long-term exposure to airborne PM ≤ 2.5 and ≤ 10 μm in aerodynamic diameter (PM<sub>2.5</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>) and oxides of nitrogen (NO<sub>x</sub>; an indicator of traffic pollution) with emphysema-like lung on CT in a large, multi-ethnic cohort of adults. In secondary analyses, we also assessed associations with lung function.

Methods

Study sample. The Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA) recruited 6,814 white, black, Hispanic, and Chinese men and women in Baltimore, Maryland; Chicago, Illinois; Forsyth County, North Carolina; Los Angeles County, California; Northern Manhattan, New York; and St. Paul, Minnesota, between 2000 and 2002 (Bild et al. 2002). Participants, 45–84 years of age, were free of clinical cardiovascular disease at baseline. The MESA Air ancillary study recruited 257 additional participants from Rockland County, New York, and Los Angeles and Riverside Counties, California, in 2006–2007 using the same inclusion criteria (Kaufman et al. 2012). The MESA Family ancillary study recruited 1,542 additional black and Hispanic participants at all MESA centers in 2004–2007. Institutional review board approval and informed participant consent were obtained. Participants without consent for address geocoding and those without complete outcome, exposure, and key covariate data were excluded from statistical analysis.

Emphysema-like lung (percent emphysema). Two sequential axial scans were collected during each participant’s baseline visit using a highly standardized protocol following breath-holds at full inspiration (Carr et al. 2005). Cardiac scans were collected using a multidetector or electron-beam CT, depending on the technology available at each study site, and included approximately 70% of the lung volume from the carina to the lung bases. As described previously (Guo et al. 2002), percent emphysema was quantified by one of several blinded image analysts at a central reading center using the Pulmonary Analysis Software Suite (Guo et al. 2008), which was modified to read the lung fields of a cardiac CT. This measure of emphysema relies on image brightness, which can be used to differentiate tissue from air. Given past pathology research and the mild degree of emphysema in this population, we a priori defined percent emphysema as the number of voxels less than −910 Hounsfield Units (HU) divided by the total number of voxels in the lung field (Coxson et al. 1995; Gevenois et al. 1995). Sensitivity analyses explored a −950 HU threshold, which reflects more severe emphysema-like lung regions.

All measures were calibrated using the observed attenuation of air surrounding the body versus a theoretical attenuation of −1,000 HU. Scans with the largest air volume were selected unless there were image quality issues, in which case the higher-quality scan was selected (Hoffman et al. 2009). In a study of 119 participants, excellent agreement for percent emphysema was documented on replicate scans [intraclass correlation coefficient (ICC): 0.89–0.93 at follow-up exams and baseline exams, respectively]. Paired measurements from 10 individuals who were sequentially scanned using both multi-detector and electron beam CTs also demonstrated high correlation (r = 0.94) and very small mean differences (< 1%). Finally, validation of 24 individuals with cardiac CT and full lung scans using multi-detector scanners also demonstrated excellent agreement for percent emphysema (p = 0.93) (Hoffman et al. 2009).

Lung function. Between 2004 and 2007 spirometry was performed on a subset of MESA (n = 3,835) and MESA Family (n = 92) participants, and on all MESA Air participants (n = 257). Participants were randomly selected for spirometry in MESA if they had consented to genetic analysis and had baseline measures of endothelial function; Chinese Americans were also oversampled to ensure adequate sample size for stratified and adjusted analyses (Rodriguez et al. 2010). Spirometry was conducted in accordance with the American Thoracic Society/European Respiratory Society guidelines (Miller et al. 2005) using a dry-rolling seal spirometer (Occupational Marketing, Inc., Houston, TX), and all tests were read by one investigator (Hankinson et al. 2010). Replicate testing of 10% of study participants within 2 weeks of the same examination yielded an average inter- and intratechnician ICC for forced expiratory volume in 1 sec (FEV<sub>1</sub>) and forced vital capacity (FVC) of 0.99. Airflow limitation was defined as having an FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC and FEV<sub>1</sub> less than the lower limit of normal (LLN) with a sensitivity analysis definition of only the FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC ratio less than the LLN (Gläser et al. 2010). LLN were defined using reference equations from the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey III (Hankinson et al. 1999; Miller et al. 2005) with a 0.88 correction for Asians (Hankinson et al. 2010).

Participant characteristics. Participant health data were collected during each examination, including anthropometry measures such as height and weight as well as self-reported information on demographics, medical history, medication use, and smoking exposures (Bild et al. 2002). Urinary cotinine levels were also measured on participants with spirometry. Residential addresses were assigned geographic coordinates using ArcGIS v9.1 (ESRI, Redlands, CA) and the Dynamap 2000 street network (TeleAtlas, Boston, MA).

Exposure assignment. Long-term ambient air pollution concentrations were estimated for all participant addresses using residential history data and area-specific prediction models that incorporated time-varying trends and spatial effects using a large suite of spatial covariates detailed elsewhere (Cohen et al. 2009; Raghunathan et al. 2006; Sampson et al. 2011; Szpiro et al. 2010). Our main analyses used modeled-based estimates of average PM<sub>2.5</sub> and NO<sub>x</sub> concentrations at participants’ residences during the year before the baseline exam, which were estimated using intensive MESA-specific measurements as well as more spatially limited data from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency’s Air Quality System (AQS; http://www.epa.gov/ttn/airs/airsaqsl). Because these estimates were not available before 1999, we used these 1-year average exposure estimates as proxies of long-term exposures. We also estimated associations between outcomes and average PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> concentrations between 1980 and 2000 (referred to as 20-year average exposures) that were estimated in a prior MESA ancillary study using models constructed on AQS’s data for PM<sub>10</sub> and a PM<sub>2.5</sub>/PM<sub>10</sub> ratio (Raghunathan et al. 2006). These estimates had more temporal but less spatial information, so they were explored in secondary analyses. For sensitivity analyses we also obtained PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations at AQS monitoring stations and meteorological data from the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov) on the day before each clinical exam.

Data analysis. Multivariable regression modeling was performed with SÄS v9.2 (SAS Institute Inc., Cary, NC) to examine cross-sectional associations between percent emphysema and long-term exposures to air pollutants. Percent emphysema had a strongly skewed distribution, but because alternate distributions (e.g., the gamma distribution) generated results with similar directionality and significance to our main findings (data not shown), we modeled the outcome as an untransformed variable. Linear regression was used for FEV<sub>1</sub>, FVC, and the ratio of FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC, and logistic regression was used for airflow limitation (present versus absent). Modeling was performed with increasing levels of control for potential confounders defined at the time of the examination. All models were adjusted for continuous age and height (with a linear term for percent emphysema models and square terms for pulmonary function models), body mass index (with squared and cubic terms for percent
emphysema models and a linear term for pulmonary function models), and pollution as a linear term. Categorical variables in all models included sex, race/ethnicity (white, black, Chinese American, Hispanic), education (< high school, high school degree, some college without a degree, technical or associates degree, bachelors degree, advanced degree), birth location (United States, Puerto Rico, other country), smoking status (never, former, current), pack-years (0, > 0 to 10, > 10 to 20, > 20), cigarettes per day (0 to 5, 5 to < 10, 10 to < 20, > 20), and exposure to active or secondhand smoke (yes or no). Models for percent emphysema also included a categorical term for CT scanner (electron-beam, non-Siemens multidetector, Siemens multidetector) and an interaction between body weight (≤ 220 lb or > 220 lb) and CT scanner since the radiation was increased 25% for individuals > 220 lb. For our lung function and airflow limitation models, we also controlled for household size and MESA examination (2000–2002, 2004–2005, 2005–2007) and binary variables for hay fever, secondhand smoke exposures (ever or never) in childhood, the workplace, and at home as well as workplace exposures to dust, fumes, or vapors (ever or never). These data (i.e., hay fever, childhood and workplace exposures) were incomplete in the larger cohort; but sensitivity analyses indicated that adjustment did not influence associations between air pollution and percent emphysema. Associations between air pollutants and all outcomes were also robust to adjustment for 1-day average PM_{2.5} concentrations, temperature, and relatively humidity, personal wealth, neighborhood socioeconomic status, asthma before 45 years of age, family history of emphysema, cotinine, cigar and pipe smoking, medication use (i.e., anticholinergics, beta2-agonists, and inhaled steroids), so these covariates were not included in our models in the interest of parsimony. All analyses were controlled for metropolitan area as a fixed effect in the final model to explore potential confounding by study location, though this was expected to reduce power because between-center differences in pollutant levels were known to be large. Mixed models with random effects for site and generalized estimating equations with robust standard errors were also tested in sensitivity analysis but were not presented because they had similar conclusions with respect to direction, magnitude, and significance of the associations and are less able to reliably estimate between-site variability with only six study sites.

Modification of the associations by age (categorized by decade of age), race/ethnicity, sex, education, smoking status, and metropolitan area was also explored using interaction terms and global F-tests. Statistical significance was defined based on a p-value < 0.05. We furthermore tested the sensitivity of our results to restriction to nonmovers (> 10 years of residential stability).

Results

Of the 7,014 participants with percent emphysema assessments who consented to geocoding, 6,519 had complete 1-year average exposure and covariate information. Because 20-year estimates of PM_{10} and PM_{2.5} were available in the main MESA cohort only, we investigated these exposures among 4,813 participants. For lung function, we included 3,791 of the 4,182 participants who consented to geocoding based on complete 1-year average exposure and covariate information. Of those, 2,811 had 20-year exposure estimates. For detailed counts of individuals for each analysis, see Supplemental Material, Figure S1.

As shown in Table 1, there were roughly equal numbers of male and female participants with a mean age of 62 years at the time of CT scanning. Approximately 50% were former or current smokers, and 30% had smoked > 10 pack-years. The mean percent emphysema (–910 HU) was 20%. Average percent predicted was approximately 94% for FEV_{1} and 95% for FVC. Approximately 6% of the cohort had air flow limitation by either definition considered. Those included in the secondary analyses of the 20-year exposures were generally similar to those in the primary cohort (Table 1).

Table 1. Descriptive characteristics (mean ± SD or %) of study participants.

| Characteristic | Emphysema cohort | Lung function cohort |
|---------------|------------------|----------------------|
|               | 1-year estimate  | 20-year estimate     | 1-year estimate | 20-year estimate |
|               | (n = 6,515)      | (n = 4,813)          | (n = 3,791)     | (n = 2,811)     |
| Percent emphysema (%) ≤ 910 HU | 19.9 ± 13.4 | 20.5 ± 13.6 | 20.2 ± 13.3 | 20.7 ± 13.5 |
| Airflow limitation (%) | 5.7 | 5.6 | 5.9 | 5.9 |
| Percent predicted FEV_{1} | 93.9 ± 17.8 | 93.5 ± 18.1 | 93.8 ± 17.9 | 93.4 ± 18.2 |
| Percent predicted FVC | 96.5 ± 16.2 | 95.2 ± 16.3 | 95.4 ± 16.2 | 95.2 ± 16.3 |
| Percent predicted FEV_{1}/FVC | 98.5 ± 10.7 | 98.4 ± 10.9 | 98.4 ± 10.7 | 98.3 ± 10.9 |
| FEV_{1} (L) | 2.4 ± 0.7 | 2.4 ± 0.7 | 2.4 ± 0.7 | 2.4 ± 0.7 |
| FVC (L) | 3.2 ± 1.0 | 3.2 ± 1.0 | 3.2 ± 1.0 | 3.2 ± 1.0 |
| FEV_{1}/FVC (%) | 75.1 ± 8.5 | 75.0 ± 8.7 | 75.0 ± 8.5 | 74.9 ± 8.6 |
| Age (years) | 62 ± 10 | 62 ± 10 | 61 ± 10 | 62 ± 10 |
| Female (%) | 54 | 53 | 51 | 50 |
| Race/ethnicity (%) | | | | |
| White | 37 | 43 | 36 | 39 |
| Black | 28 | 30 | 24 | 28 |
| Chinese | 11 | 7 | 15 | 10 |
| Hispanic | 24 | 21 | 25 | 22 |
| Education (%) | | | | |
| Less than high school | 17 | 15 | 18 | 15 |
| High school | 18 | 19 | 17 | 19 |
| Higher education | 47 | 47 | 46 | 46 |
| Advanced degree | 18 | 19 | 19 | 20 |
| Any smoke exposure (%) | 48 | 50 | 46 | 49 |
| Smoking status (%) | | | | |
| Never | 51 | 49 | 48 | 46 |
| Former | 36 | 38 | 42 | 44 |
| Current | 13 | 13 | 10 | 10 |
| Pack-years of smoking (%) | | | | |
| ≤ 10 | 52 | 50 | 54 | 52 |
| > 10 and ≤ 20 | 19 | 19 | 16 | 15 |
| > 20 | 10 | 10 | 9 | 9 |
| Residential stability (years) | | | | |
| ≥ 10 | 69 | 75 | 68 | 75 |
| > 20 | 45 | 52 | 44 | 51 |
| Study site (%) | | | | |
| Winston-Salem, NC | 15 | 17 | 13 | 15 |
| New York, NY | 18 | 16 | 23 | 19 |
| Baltimore, MD | 14 | 16 | 11 | 14 |
| St. Paul, MN | 15 | 17 | 13 | 15 |
| Chicago, IL | 18 | 18 | 18 | 19 |
| Los Angeles, CA | 20 | 16 | 23 | 17 |
| Air pollution | | | | |
| PM_{2.5} (μg/m^3) | 16.3 ± 3.7 | 22.0 ± 5.0 | 14.2 ± 2.4 | 22.2 ± 5.0 |
| PM_{10} (μg/m^3) | NA | 34.3 ± 7.7 | NA | 34.7 ± 7.7 |
| NO_{2} (ppb) | 48.3 ± 25.2 | NA | 41.1 ± 21.1 | NA |

NA, not applicable.

aAir flow restriction defined as an FEV_{1}/FVC and FEV_{1} less than the lower limit of normal (LLN).
Long-term estimates of each air pollutant are presented in Table 1. Concentrations declined over time, such that the 20-year averages of PM$_{2.5}$ were consistently higher than the more recent 1-year average levels. Spatial contrasts in PM$_{2.5}$ were consistent over time, however, with the highest concentrations in Los Angeles and the lowest concentrations in St. Paul (Figure 1). PM$_{10}$ followed similar spatial patterns and was highly correlated with PM$_{2.5}$ in the overall data ($\rho$: 0.7–0.9) but weakly correlated after stratification by metropolitan area (average $\rho$: 0.1–0.3). NO$_x$ had lower correlations with PM$_{10}$ and PM$_{2.5}$ (overall $\rho$: 0.5–0.6; area-specific $\rho$: 0.1–0.3). Similar concentrations of PM$_{2.5}$ and NO$_x$ were found between the 1-year and 20-year cohorts except for New York and Los Angeles, where additional study subjects reduced the mean concentrations slightly and increased the overall variability (results not shown).

Table 2 presents relationships between percent emphysema with the different air pollutants and averaging times examined. Without adjustment for site, higher levels of all pollutants were associated with greater percent emphysema. For example, 5 μg/m$^3$ greater PM$_{2.5}$ and 25 ppb higher NO$_x$ concentrations over the year preceding the clinical visit were associated with 0.6 [$95\%$ confidence interval (CI): 0.1, 1.2%] and 0.5 ($95\%$ CI: 0.1, 0.9%) higher average percent emphysema. However, after adjustment for site the associations were –0.6% ($95\%$ CI: –1.5, 0.3%) for PM$_{2.5}$ and –0.5% ($95\%$ CI: –1.1, 0.02%) for NO$_x$.

Closer inspection of the data suggested that associations observed before adjustment for site were strongly influenced by statistically significantly lower mean percent emphysema in St. Paul (see Supplemental Material, Table S1), where air pollution levels were also lowest. The importance of between-city contrasts can be visualized in Figure 2, where the average percent emphysema for each city after controlling for other risk factors is plotted against the city-average 1-year PM$_{2.5}$ concentrations. In fact, positive associations between percent emphysema and pollution levels were not observed in models excluding St. Paul (results not shown) or for within-city contrasts in any of the study sites (Figure 3).

Decreased lung function was consistently observed with higher concentrations of PM$_{2.5}$ and NO$_x$ with and without adjustment for site, although many of the associations did not meet statistical significance (Table 3; see also Supplemental Material, Figure S2). The relationships of the greatest magnitude were between the 1-year average PM$_{2.5}$ concentrations and FVC with –54 mL (95% CI: –91, –18 mL) and –59 mL (95% CI: –91, –18 mL). The associations were scaled to 5 μg/m$^3$ for PM and 25 ppb for NO$_x$. Minimal control models were adjusted for age, race/ethnicity, and sex. Moderate control models added height, body mass index, education, household size, birth location, smoking, examination, scanner, and scanner by body size. Full control models incorporated site adjustment using a fixed effect.
function metrics and PM10 were positive but a significant association. Associations between all lung function metrics and PM10 were qualitatively robust (similar magnitude, direction, and significance) to using an alternate definition of airflow limitation and restricting to individuals who had not moved in the previous 10 years (results not shown).

In secondary analyses, we found limited evidence of effect modification of associations by personal characteristics (Figure 3). The most consistent findings across pollutants and outcomes were increasingly negative associations between air pollution and percent emphysema and increasingly positive associations between lung function measures and PM10, though these associations could not be distinguished from no association. Associations between all lung function metrics and PM10 were positive but with wide confidence intervals. No consistent associations were observed with the ratio of FEV1/FVC or airflow limitation.

In secondary analyses, we found limited evidence of effect modification of associations by personal characteristics (Figure 3). The most consistent findings across pollutants and outcomes were increasingly negative associations between air pollution and percent emphysema and increasingly positive associations between lung function measures and PM10, though these associations could not be distinguished from no association. Associations between all lung function metrics and PM10 were positive but with wide confidence intervals. No consistent associations were observed with the ratio of FEV1/FVC or airflow limitation.

In this large, multi-center study, we found a significant positive association between the ratio of PM2.5 and NOx. Suggestive but imprecise associations were observed with the ratio of PM2.5 and NOx. Significant positive associations were also demonstrated between percent emphysema and 1-year PM2.5 concentrations expressed as between-site (city average) and within-site (individual concentration–city average) gradients. In both panels, the bottom of the figure represents a frequency distribution of exposures. Abbreviations: B, Baltimore; C, Chicago; LA, Los Angeles; NY, New York; SP, St. Paul; WS, Winston-Salem. All models were adjusted for age, race/ethnicity, sex, height, body mass index, and hospitalizations with air pollution exposure (Bayer-Oglesby et al. 2006; Brauer et al. 2007; Dominici et al. 2006; Martins et al. 2002) as well as evidence of slowed lung growth among cohorts of children followed over time in several different countries (Gauderman et al. 2004; Horak et al. 2002; Mølter et al. 2013). The SAPALDIA study (Swiss Study on Air Pollution and Lung Diseases in Adults) similarly demonstrated slower age-related declines in FEV1, with larger reductions in pollution over time in approximately 10,000 Swiss adults (Downs et al. 2007), though no association was reported between NO2 and FEV1.

**Discussion**

In this large, multi-center study, we found weak evidence of an association between long-term exposures to air pollution and emphysema. Higher long-term PM2.5, PM10, and NO2 concentrations between study sites were associated with greater percent emphysema, though these findings were driven by differences between study sites and were not replicated for within-site exposure contrasts. Suggestive but imprecise associations were also identified between air pollution and lung function, with lower FEV1 and FVC observed among persons with higher long-term levels of PM2.5 and NO2.

This research is unique in its use of percent emphysema on CT scan to study associations between air pollution exposures and respiratory health in a large cohort. CT scans may be a valuable tool for air pollution epidemiology studies because they allow for quantification of early changes in lung structure, as opposed to lung function, which is assessed by traditional spirometry testing. This may lead to important contributions because a recent review of the associations between air pollution and COPD (Schikowski et al. 2014) discussed the limitations of existing studies in their ability to characterize subclinical phenotypes and progression of COPD. Although careful consideration must be made given the additional cost and radiation exposure to participants, albeit small, percent emphysema may also have clinical importance because it has been linked with increased risks of mortality in several, though not all, studies (Dawkins et al. 2003; Haruna et al. 2010; Johannessen et al. 2013; Martinez et al. 2006; Sverzellati et al. 2012).

Although little is known of air pollution’s impacts on emphysema, past research generally supports a link between the inhalation of ambient pollutants and adverse impacts on the pulmonary system (Kelly and Fussell 2011). Biologically, this is hypothesized to occur via several interconnected mechanisms including pulmonary oxidative stress and inflammation (Adar et al. 2007; Budinger et al. 2011; Hanno et al. 2010; Stringer and Kobzik 1998), alterations in airway ciliary activity (Calderón-Garcidueñas et al. 2001), as well as enhanced susceptibility to respiratory infections (Stern et al. 2013), which can ultimately lead to long-term damage to the lungs including loss of alveolar tissue (i.e., emphysema). Although the larger inhaled particles of tobacco smoke or ambient PM are deposited higher in the airways and likely result in a more classically bronchitic phenotype, PM2.5 deposits more heavily in the alveoli, likely resulting in more parenchymal rather than airway damage (U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 2009).

Consistent with the toxicological literature, epidemiology studies similarly show evidence of increased respiratory symptoms and hospitalizations with air pollution exposure (Bayer-Oglesby et al. 2006; Brauer et al. 2007; Dominici et al. 2006; Martins et al. 2002) as well as evidence of slowed lung growth among cohorts of children followed over time in several different countries (Gauderman et al. 2004; Horak et al. 2002; Mølter et al. 2013). The SAPALDIA study (Swiss Study on Air Pollution and Lung Diseases in Adults) similarly demonstrated slower age-related declines in FEV1, with larger reductions in pollution over time in approximately 10,000 Swiss adults (Downs et al. 2007), though no association was reported between NO2 and FEV1.

![Adjusted relationships between percent emphysema and 1-year PM2.5 concentrations expressed as between-site (city average) and within-site (individual concentration–city average) gradients](image-url)

Figure 2. Adjusted relationships between percent emphysema and 1-year PM2.5 concentrations expressed as between-site (city average) and within-site (individual concentration–city average) gradients. The left panel illustrates adjusted city mean emphysema vs. city average PM2.5 concentrations. This reflects the information provided by between-city contrasts. The right panel illustrates the continuous dose–response relationship (in red; 95% CI in dashed lines) between adjusted percent emphysema vs. within-city contrasts in exposures. In both panels, the bottom of the figure represents a frequency distribution of exposures. Abbreviations: B, Baltimore; C, Chicago; LA, Los Angeles; NY, New York; SP, St. Paul; WS, Winston-Salem. All models were adjusted for age, race/ethnicity, sex, height, body mass index, education, household size, birth location, smoking, examination, scanner, and multiple detector computed tomography scanner by body size.
Air pollution and emphysema by CT

20-year average long-term exposure to PM2.5 linked higher emphysema, and COPD even after control for cigarette smoking (Coggon and Newman 1998; Taylor 1998; Diaz-Guzman et al. 2012; Rodríguez et al. 2009). Although one analysis of approximately 400 German women further reported lower prevalent COPD with larger reductions in PM10 over time (Schikowski et al. 2010). Occupational settings have shown linkages between particulate exposures, emphysema, and COPD even after control for scanner technology results for percent emphysema were strongly inversely associated with age. Nevertheless, there remains the possibility of artifact of competing risks, because pneumonia and cardiovascular events were positively associated with air pollution (Pope et al. 2004).

In this study, we also found consistent evidence of inverse associations between air pollution and emphysema among the oldest participants (70–79 and ≥ 80 years) for both PM2.5 and NOx as well as weaker associations between pollution and lung function among the oldest participants. These unexpected findings can likely be explained by the unique population of MESA, which recruited older adults without clinical cardiovascular disease at baseline. Given that air pollution has also been linked to cardiovascular disease (Brook et al. 2010), our findings of increasingly negative associations with greater age may simply reflect the selection of older individuals in the study who are healthier and less susceptible to air pollution than the general population.

Within MESA, exposure and outcomes varied substantially between study sites, and these differences were especially influential in models for emphysema. As a result, our results for percent emphysema but not lung function were sensitive to adjustment for study site. Importantly, our results remained largely insensitive to control for personal-level socioeconomic status including education, household size, and a wealth index. Nevertheless, there remains the possibility for residual confounding by unmeasured factors. Regional differences may have played an important role: A detailed investigation of our findings suggests that our overall results for percent emphysema were strongly influenced by data from St. Paul, which had low levels of COPD and low levels of pollution. Interestingly, scanner technology limitations were positively associated with air pollution.

Table 3. Associations (95% CIs) between pollutants and lung function.

| Model | 1-year average | 20-year average |
|-------|----------------|-----------------|
|       | PM2.5 (n = 3,791) | NOx (n = 3,791) | PM2.5 (n = 2,811) | PM10 (n = 2,811) |
| Difference in mean FEV1 (mL) | | | |
| Minimal control (demographics) | −27 (−58, 4) | −22 (−40, −4) | −4 (−21, 13) | 13 (1, 24) |
| Moderate control (risk factors) | −24 (−54, 6) | −12 (−30, 7) | −15 (−31, 2) | 6 (−5, 18) |
| Full control (site adjusted) | −20 (−80, 41) | −4 (−33, 25) | −13 (−37, 11) | 1 (−30, 32) |
| Difference in mean FVC (mL) | | | |
| Minimal control (demographics) | −64 (−101, −26) | −20 (−42, 2) | −9 (−29, 12) | 12 (−2, 26) |
| Moderate control (risk factors) | −54 (−91, −18) | −9 (−31, 14) | −19 (−39, 0) | 6 (−8, 20) |
| Full control (site adjusted) | −59 (−132, 13) | −21 (−55, 14) | −6 (−35, 22) | 19 (−29, 45) |
| Odds of airflow limitation | | | |
| Minimal control (demographics) | 0.6 (0.0, 1.1) | −0.3 (−0.8, 0.0) | 0.1 (−0.2, 0.4) | 0.1 (−0.1, 0.3) |
| Moderate control (risk factors) | 0.4 (−0.2, 1.0) | −0.3 (−0.5, 0.0) | 0.0 (−0.3, 0.3) | 0.1 (−0.2, 0.3) |
| Full control (site adjusted) | 0.2 (−0.9, 1.3) | 0.3 (−0.3, 0.8) | −0.3 (−0.7, 0.2) | 0.3 (−0.6, 0.4) |

Table 3. Associations (95% CIs) between pollutants and lung function.

- Associations were scaled to 5 μg/m³ for PM and 25 ppb for NOx. Minimal control models included age, race/ethnicity, and sex. Moderate control models added height, body mass index, education, household size, birth location, smoking, examination, detailed smoke exposures, workplace exposures, and hay fever. Full control included site adjustment using a fixed effect.

Environmental Health Perspectives • VOLUME 123 | NUMBER 2 | February 2015
cannot explain these differences because the same scanner used in St. Paul was also used at another study site, and the differences in mean percent emphysema were found even after control for scanner. Although control for study site is likely warranted, even if only to properly estimate our standard errors, including such control reduced the exposure variability given the large contrasts in exposure between locations. Thus, there may be power issues in detecting differences within-city.

An additional possible weakness of this work is that percent emphysema was measured using cardiac scans, which do not include the lung apices and hence may have underestimated the degree of emphysema compared with a full-lung scan. However percent emphysema measurements on MESA cardiac scans have been previously validated against full-lung scans (Hoffman et al. 2009) and health outcomes (Barr et al. 2010, 2012). A major strength of this study was that we used a well-defined cohort with rich estimates of PM and traffic-related pollutants in outdoor air that capture both spatial and temporal trends. Individual-level 1-year average concentrations were derived using data from intensive monitoring campaigns in participants' communities and homes. These estimates were complemented by 20-year estimates, which inform us of long-term exposures over a participant's long-term residential history, although they have substantially less precision for fine-scale spatial variability. Generally consistent findings were observed for the 1-year and 20-year estimates. In addition, our results were robust among persons with long-term (> 10 years) residential stability.

In summary, this cross-sectional analysis of a large, multi-center, population-based cohort found some suggestive evidence to support the hypothesis that higher long-term air pollution exposure is associated with emphysema. Because results were dominated by contrasts between study sites, however, future work is required to confirm our findings.

References

Adar SD, Adamkiewicz G, Gold DR, Schwartz J, Coull BA, Suh H. 2007. Ambient and microenvironmental particles and exhaled nitric oxide before and after a group bus trip. Environ Health Perspect 115:503–512. doi:10.1289/ehp.9386.

Andersen ZJ, Hudiberg M, Jensen SS, Ketzel M, Loft S, Sørensen M, et al. 2011. Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and long-term exposure to traffic-related air pollution: a cohort study. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 183:455–461.

Auerbach O, Hammond EC, Garfinkel L, Benamte C. 1972. Relation between smoking and age to emphysema—whole-lung section study. New Engl J Med 286:853–857.

Avol EL, Gauderman WJ, Tan SM, London SJ, Peters JM. 2001. Respiratory effects of relocating to areas of differing air pollution levels. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 164:2067–2072.

Barr RG, Ahmed FS, Carr JJ, Hoffman EA, Jiang R, Kawut SM, et al. 2012. Subclinical atherosclerosis, airflow obstruction and emphysema: the MESA Lung Study. Eur Respir J 39:846–854.

Barr RG, Blümeke DA, Ahmed FS, Carr JJ, Enright PL, Hoffman EA, et al. 2010. Percent emphysema, airflow obstruction, and impaired left ventricular filling. New Engl J Med 362:217–227.

Bayer-Oglesby L, Schindler C, Hazenkamp-von Arx ME, Braun-Fahrlander C, Keidel D, Rapp R, et al. 2006. Living near main streets and respiratory symptoms in adults: the Swiss Cohort Study on Air Pollution and Lung Diseases in Adults. Am J Epidemiol 164:1190–1198.

Bild DE, Blümeke DA, Burke GL, Detrano R, Dziez Roux AV, Folson AM, et al. 2002. Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis: objectives and design. Am J Epidemiol 156:871–881.

Brauer M, Hoek G, Smit HA, de Jongste JC, Gerritsen J, Postma DS, et al. 2007. Air pollution and development of asthma, allergy and infections in a birth cohort. Eur Respir J 29:515–523.

Brook RD, Rajagopalan S, Pope CA III, Brook JR, Bhatnagar A, Dziez Roux AV, et al. 2010. Particulate matter air pollution and cardiovascular disease: an update to the scientific statement from the American Heart Association. Circulation 121(21):2331–2378.

Budinger GR, Engelman JL, Uriih D, Foiles N, Weiss I, Chiarella SE, et al. 2011. Particulate-matter-induced lung inflammation increases systemic levels of PAI-1 and activates coagulation through distinct mechanisms. PLoS One 6:e18525; doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0018525.

Calderón-Garcidueñas L, Valencia-Salazar G, Rodriguez-Aguilar A, Prohling TM, Garcia R, Osuna Y, et al. 2001. Ultrastructural nasal pathology in children chronically and sequentially exposed to air pollutants. Am J Respir Cell Mol Biol 24:132–138.

Carr JJ, Nelson JC, Wong ND, Mcginn-Gray M, Arad Y, Jacobs DR Jr, et al. 2005. Calculified coronary artery plaque measurement with cardiac CT in population-based studies: standardized protocol of Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA) and Coronary Artery Risk Development in Young Adults (CARDIA) study. Radiology 234:35–43.

Celli BR, MacNee W, Agusti A, Anzueto A, Babini B, Buist AS, et al. 2004. Standards for the diagnosis and treatment of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD): a summary of the ATS/ERS position paper. Eur Respir J 22:932–946.

Chen Y, Yang QY, Krebski D, Burnett RT, Shi YL, McGraill KM. 2005. The effect of coarse ambient particulate matter on first, second, and overall hospital admissions for respiratory disease among the elderly. Inhal Toxicol 17:649–655.

Coggon D, Newman Taylor A. 1998. Coal mining and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a review of the evidence. Thorax 53:396–407.

Cohen MA, Adar SD, Allen RW, Avol E, Curi CL, Gould T, et al. 2009. Approach to estimating participant pollutant exposures in the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis and Air Pollution (MESA Air). Environ Sci Technol 43:4687–4693.

Coxson HO, Mayo JR, Behzad H, Moore BJ, Verbrugt LM, Staples CA, et al. 1995. Measurement of lung expansion with computed-tomography and comparison with quantitative histology. J Appl Physiol Respir Environ Exerc Physiol 79:1525–1530.

Dawkins PA, Dowson LJ, Guest PJ, Stockley RA. 2003. Predictors of mortality in cM-antitrypsin deficiency. Thorax 58:1020–1026.

Detels R, Tashkin DP, Sayre JW, Rokaw SN, Massey FJ Jr, Coulson AH, et al. 1991. The UCLA population studies of CORD: X. A cohort study of changes in respiratory function associated with chronic exposure to SO2, NOx, and hydrocarbons. Am J Public Health 81:590–595.

Diaz-Guzman E, Aryal S, Mannino DM. 2012. Occupational chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: an update. Clin Chest Med 33:625–636.

Dominici F, Peng RD, Bell ML, Pham L, McDermott A, Zeger SL, et al. 2006. Fine particulate air pollution and hospital admission for cardiovascular and respiratory diseases. JAMA 295:1127–1134.

Downs SH, Schindler C, Liu LJ, Keidel D, Bayer-Oglesby L, Brutsche MH, et al. 2007. Reduced exposure to PM2.5 and attenuated age-related decline in lung function. New Engl J Med 357:2338–2347.

Gan QW, FitzGerald JM, Carlsten C, Sadatsafavi M, Brauer M. 2013. Associations of ambient air pollution with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease hospitalization and mortality. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 187:711–727.

Gauderman WJ, Avol E, Gilliland F, Vora H, Thomas D, Berhane K, et al. 2004. The effect of air pollution on lung development and functioning in children 18 years of age. New Engl J Med 351:1057–1067.

Gevenois PA, de Maertelaer V, De Vyust P, Zanen J, Yernault JC. 1995. Comparison of computed density and macroscopic morphometry in pulmonary emphysema. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 152:653–657.

Gläser S, Schäper C, Obst A, Iertmann T, Völzke H, Felix SB, et al. 2010. Impact of different definitions of airflow limitation on the prevalence of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in the general population. Respiration 80:292–300.

Green FHY, Brower PL, Valliyathan V, Attfield M. 1996. Coal mine dust exposure and type of pulmonary emphysema in coal workers. In: Advances in the Prevention of Occupational Respiratory Diseases, Vol. 1153 (Chiyotani K, Hosoda Y, Aizawa Y, eds). Amsterdam:Elsevier Science BV, 948–953.

Guo J, Fulld MK, Alford SK, Reinhardt JM, Hoffman EA. 2008. Pulmonary Analyses Software Suite 9.0: integrating quantitative measures of function with structural analyses. Available: http://www.lungworkshop.org/2008/proc2008/29-guo.pdf [accessed 12 January 2015].

Guo J, Reinhardt JM, Kitakoa H, Zhang L, Sonka M, McLennan G, et al. 2002. Integrated system for CT-based assessment of parenchymal lung disease. In: 2002 International Symposium on Biomedical Imaging, 871–874.

Hankinson JL, Kawut SM, Shahar E, Smith LJ, Stokovsky KH, Barr RG. 2010. Performance of American Thoracic Society-recommended spirometry reference values in a multietnic sample of adults: the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA) Lung Study. Chest 137:136–145.

Hankinson JL, Odencrantz JR, Fedan KB. 1999. Spirometric reference values from a sample of the general U.S. population. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 159:179–187.

Hoppo MS, Salonen RO, Häinen AI, Jalava PI, Pernainen AS, Dörmans JA, et al. 2010. Inflammation and tissue damage in mouse lung by single and repeated dosing of urban air coarse and fine particles collected from six European cities. Inhal Toxicol 22:402–416.

Haruna A, Muro S, Nakano Y, Obara T, Hoshino Y, Ogawa E, et al. 2008. CT scan findings of emphysema—whole-lung section study. New Engl J Med 360:1525–1530.
Air pollution and emphysema by CT

Miller MR, Hankinson J, Brusasco V, Burgos F, Casaburi R, Coates A, et al. 2005. Standardisation of spirometry. Eur Respir J 26:319–338.

Müller A, Agius RM, de Vocht F, Lindley S, Gerrard W, Lowe L, et al. 2013. Long term exposure to PM2.5 and NO2 in association with lung volume and airway resistance in the MAAS birth cohort. Environ Health Perspect 121:1222–1238. doi:10.1289/ehp.1205961.

Pope CA III, Hansen ML, Long RW, Nielsen KR, Eastough NL, Wilson WE, et al. 2004. Ambient particulate air pollution, heart rate variability, and blood markers of inflammation in a panel of elderly subjects. Environ Health Perspect 112:339–345.

Powell R, Davidson D, Divers J, Maniachaikul A, Carr JJ, Detrano R, et al. 2013. Genetic ancestry and the relationship of cigarette smoking to lung function and per cent emphysema in four race/ethnic groups: a cross-sectional study. Thorax 68:834–842.

Pujades-Rodríguez M, McKeever T, Lewis S, Whyatt D, Britton J, Venn A. 2009. Effect of traffic pollution on respiratory and allergic disease in adults: cross-sectional and longitudinal analyses. BMC Pulm Med 9:42. doi:10.1186/1471-2466-9-42.

Raghu N, T, Diez-Roux AV, Chan W. 2006. Predicting cumulative particulate matter exposure using space-time models and historical monitor data [Abstract]. Environ Health Perspect 114(suppl):S250.

Rodríguez J, Jiang R, Johnson WC, MacKenzie BA, Smith LJ, Barr RG. 2010. The association of pipe and cigar use with cotinine levels, lung function, and airflow obstruction: a cross-sectional study. Ann Intern Med 152:201–210.

Rojas-Martinez R, Perez-Padilla R, Olaz-Fernandez G, Mendoza-Alvarado L, Moreno-Macias H, Fortoul T, et al. 2007. Lung function growth in children with long-term exposure to air pollutants in Mexico City. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 176:377–384.

Sampson PD, Szpiro AA, Sheppard L, Lindstrom J, Kaufman JD. 2011. Pragmatic estimation of a spatio-temporal air quality model with irregular monitoring data. Atmos Environ 45(36):6593–6606.

Sander C, Nath PH, Bailey WC. 1988. Detection of emphysema with computed tomography. Correlation with pulmonary function tests and chest radiography. Invest Radiol 23:262–266.

Schikowski T, Sung I, Ranft U, Gehring U, Heimrich J, Wichmann HE, et al. 2005. Long-term air pollution exposure and living close to busy roads are associated with COPD in women. Respir Res 6(1):152. doi:10.1186/1465-9921-6-152.

Stern G, Latzin P, Röösl H, Fuchs O, Proietti E, Kuehni C, et al. 2013. A prospective study of the impact of air pollution on respiratory symptoms and infections in infants. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 187:1341–1348.

Stringer B, Kozliz K. 1998. Environmental particulate-mediated cytokine production in lung epithelial cells (A549): role of pre-existing inflammation and oxidant stress. J Toxicol Environ Health A 55:31–44.

Sunyer J. 2001. Urban air pollution and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a review. Eur Respir J 17:1024–1033.

Sverzellati N, Cademartiri F, Bravi F, Martini C, Gira FA, Maffei E, et al. 2012. Relationship and prognostic value of modified coronary artery calcium score, FEV1, and emphysema in lung cancer screening population: the Mild trial. Radiology 262:460–467.

Szpiro AA, Sampson PD, Sheppard L, Lumley T, Adar SD, Kaufman JD. 2010. Predicting intra-urban variation in air pollution concentrations with complex spatio-temporal dependencies. Environmetrics 21:606–631.

Tashkin DP, Detels R, Simmons M, Liu H, Coulson AH, Sayre J, et al. 1994. The UCLA population studies of chronic obstructive respiratory disease: XI. Impact of air pollution and smoking on annual change in forced expiratory volume in one second. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 149:1209–1217.

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency. 2009. Integrated Science Assessment for Particulate Matter (Final Report). EPA/600/R-08/139F. Research Triangle Park, NC:U.S. EPA.

Vestbo J, Hurd SS, Agusti AG, Jones PW, Vogelmeier C, Anzueto A, et al. 2013. Global strategy for the diagnosis, management, and prevention of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: GOLD executive summary. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 187:347–365.

Vos T, Flaxman AD, Naghavi M, Lozano R, Michaud C, Aboyans V, et al. 2013. Global and regional mortality from 289 diseases and injuries for 16 age groups in 1990 and 2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010. Lancet 380:2095–2128.

Vos T, Flaxman AD, Naghavi M, Lozano R, Michaud C, Aboyans V, et al. 2013. Years lived with disability (YLDs) for 1160 sequelae of 289 diseases and injuries 1990–2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010. Lancet 380:2163–2196.