Effective Optimization of Antibody Affinity by Phage Display Integrated with High-Throughput DNA Synthesis and Sequencing Technologies

Dongmei Hu1, Siyi Hu1, Wen Wan1, Man Xu1, Ruikai Du1, Wei Zhao1, Xiaolian Gao1,2, Jing Liu1, Haiyan Liu1*, Jiong Hong1*

1 School of Life Sciences, University of Science and Technology of China, Hefei, Anhui, China, 2 Department of Biology and Biochemistry, University of Houston, Houston, Texas, United States of America

* hjiong@ustc.edu.cn (JH); hyliu@ustc.edu.cn (HYL)

Abstract

Phage display technology has been widely used for antibody affinity maturation for decades. The limited library sequence diversity together with excessive redundancy and labour-consuming procedure for candidate identification are two major obstacles to widespread adoption of this technology. We hereby describe a novel library generation and screening approach to address the problems. The approach started with the targeted diversification of multiple complementarity determining regions (CDRs) of a humanized anti-ErbB2 antibody, HuA21, with a small perturbation mutagenesis strategy. A combination of three degenerate codons, NWG, NWC, and NSG, were chosen for amino acid saturation mutagenesis without introducing cysteine and stop residues. In total, 7,749 degenerate oligonucleotides were synthesized on two microchips and released to construct five single-chain antibody fragment (scFv) gene libraries with $4 \times 10^6$ DNA sequences. Deep sequencing of the unselected and selected phage libraries using the Illumina platform allowed for an in-depth evaluation of the enrichment landscapes in CDR sequences and amino acid substitutions. Potent candidates were identified according to their high frequencies using NGS analysis, by-passing the need for the primary screening of target-binding clones. Furthermore, a subsequent library by recombination of the 10 most abundant variants from four CDRs was constructed and screened, and a mutant with 158-fold increased affinity ($K_d = 25.5$ pM) was obtained. These results suggest the potential application of the developed methodology for optimizing the binding properties of other antibodies and biomolecules.

Introduction

Monoclonal antibodies are extremely useful for the clinical diagnosis and treatment of human diseases. Many valuable antibodies have been discovered using hybridoma technology from immunized mice or, more recently, using in vitro display technologies from large naïve or
synthetic libraries in phage, yeast and other systems [1]. Notably, the display technologies allow for the identification of antibodies that exceed the diversity present in nature and the limitation of immune tolerance. For the successful development of therapeutic antibodies, achieving high affinity toward the antigen of interest is critical for increasing efficacy, reducing dosages and easing side effects. Other properties, such as specificity, stability and immunogenicity potential, should also be optimized.

Numerous protein engineering approaches have been used for antibody affinity maturation, and in vitro display methods are widely implemented because highly complicated libraries can be generated and screened by panning or cell sorting [2]. For antibody gene diversification, random mutagenesis can be introduced into the variable domains of heavy and light chains through error-prone PCR or mutator bacterial strains [3–5]. More often, selected mutagenesis targeting only the complementarity determining region (CDR) loops is advantageous because it does not cause disruptive mutations in the framework regions. However, saturation mutagenesis, which can generate all combinations of twenty natural amino acids in beyond eight positions, typically requires a library of > 1 x 10^12 diverse sequences, making it impractical for the current display systems. Novel strategies to improve CDR diversification efficiency have been reported, such as hot-spot mutagenesis [6], look-through mutagenesis [7], simultaneous mutagenesis [8], and small perturbation mutagenesis (SPM) which was recently developed by our group [9]. In addition, the structures of antibody-antigen complexes indicate that the majority, if not all, of the six CDRs may contribute to antigen-binding in most cases [10]. Thus, in vitro antibody engineering to increase affinity often requires the optimization of multiple CDRs to obtain additive or synergistic effects. In many cases, improving the antibody affinity to the picomolar or femtomolar range was achieved through a stepwise approach using CDR walking [11], chain shuffling [12], or mutation recombination [8,13].

Library diversity and quality are particularly important for the isolation of high affinity antibodies. Traditional methods of constructing mutagenic antibody libraries rely on gene assembly from a few degenerate oligonucleotides through conventional, solid-phase DNA synthesis. More recently, a variety of commercial microarrays that can simultaneously synthesize a massive number of non-degenerate oligonucleotides have been successfully used for cost-efficient gene assembly [14–16] as well as library construction for nucleic acids [17], peptides [18], or antibodies [19]. However, using current microarray-based techniques for the synthesis of a large number of different degenerate oligonucleotides remains challenging. Previously, we demonstrated the capacity of a programmable microfluidic microchip to produce hundreds of degenerate oligonucleotides that are suitable for antibody library construction [9]. In general, the microchip contains nearly four thousand independent reaction chambers, and each chamber can be assigned to synthesize one degenerate oligonucleotide. Using this approach, highly uniform single-chain variable fragment (scFv) phage libraries were generated for an anti-ErbB2 chimeric antibody, ChA21, via the SPM strategy, which led to the isolation of a variant with 19-fold higher affinity.

One challenge associated with phage display technology is the identification of potential candidates after the panning process. Traditionally, this step is achieved by randomly picking phage clones for target-binding screening and Sanger sequencing analysis. This method may not necessarily lead to the isolation of highly potent variants because it is time-consuming and often relies on the development of robust screening assays. In only a few years, next-generation sequencing (NGS) technologies have been adapted for many aspects of biological research and clinical applications. The Illumina platform is widely used for deep sequencing immunoglobulin genes or libraries to support the discovery of new antibodies due to its relatively low error rate and cost [19–22]. Specifically, for improving antibody affinity by phage display, the ability...
of Illumina sequencing to gain vast sequence data allows for a comprehensive analysis of the diversity and abundance of library clones, as well as monitoring the parameters during selection.

In this work, our goal was to develop a rational approach to facilitate antibody affinity maturation by integrating in vitro phage display with high-throughput DNA synthesis and sequencing technologies. The model system used to test the approach was a humanized anti-ErbB2 antibody, HuA21, which was generated from ChA21 by CDR grafting technology [23]. Candidate positions from several CDRs were chosen based on antibody database analyses. Mutations were introduced randomly at three candidate positions of each targeted CDR using the SPM strategy [9]. Then, scFv gene libraries were assembled with pool of microchip-synthesized degenerate oligonucleotides. After panning and amplification by phage display, the NGS was used to analyze the unselected and selected phage libraries to explore the enrichment landscape of CDR sequences and amino acid substitutions. The effectiveness of the conventional target-binding screening approach and the NGS approach for the identification of potent CDR variants were compared. This approach is broadly applicable for the binding affinity optimization of antibodies and other proteins.

Materials and Methods

Database analysis and CDR diversification

The HuA21 scFv gene has been submitted to the GenBank databases under accession number KP749832. The six CDR loops were determined using the Kabat or Chothia definition scheme. Assigning CDRs to canonical classes and the calculation of amino acid frequencies (F\textsubscript{obs}) were performed using the Absys antibody database, as described previously [9]. Then, candidate residues were selected for CDR diversification based on the following criteria: in general, any position of the target antibody with a certain amino acid in high frequency (e.g., typically F\textsubscript{obs} > 90%) was considered conservative and was excluded from randomization. However, if the residue in the target antibody was different from the most frequent amino acid in the database, this position was also selected for randomization. The selection of candidate residues was also guided by available information, including crystal structure analysis of the ChA21-ErbB2 complex [24] and alanine-scanning mutagenesis studies [25,26]. In general, if a CDR loop region was spatially distant from the antibody-antigen binding site, it was considered unimportant. For example, the entire L2 loop residues and several C-terminal residues of the L1, H2 and H3 loops were excluded from randomization.

Oligonucleotide library design and microchip synthesis

One SPM library was designed to randomly diversify three candidate positions of the targeted CDR region. For each position, saturation mutagenesis was introduced using three degenerate codons NWG, NWC and NSG; where N = A, T, G, or C; W = A or T; and S = G or C. Degenerate oligonucleotides were designed to contain the diversified CDR regions and overlapping regions to ensure PCR primer binding. The mixture of oligonucleotides was synthesized on 4k microfluidic PicoArray microchips (LC Sciences, USA). Each degenerate oligonucleotide was assigned for synthesis in one reaction chamber of the microchip under optimal conditions, as reported previously [16].

Construction of mutant scFv libraries

The HuA21 scFv gene was cloned into the phagemid vector pCANTAB-5E (Amersham) at the SfI and NotI restriction sites, as reported previously [27]. The diversified CDR fragment was amplified in a 50 µl reaction solution containing 10 ng OligoMix as template, 25 pmol 5’ and 3’
overlapping primers, and 1 μl Pfu polymerase (NEB) for 15 cycles at 95°C, 40–46°C, and 72°C for 30 sec each. The PCR products were purified using QIAEXII Gel Extraction Kit (Qiagen). The corresponding N- or C-terminal gene fragments were amplified in a 50 μl reaction solution containing 10 ng wild-type plasmid and 25 pmol frame-specific primers for 20 cycles at 95°C, 50°C, and 72°C for 30 sec each. Then, the scFv gene library was amplified by overlapping extension (OE)-PCR in a 10 x 50 μl reaction solution through the fusion of total 100 ng of three fragments in equal molar amount and 25 pmol vector-cloning primers for 30 cycles at 95°C for 30 sec, 60°C for 30 sec, and 72°C for 1 min. The amplified products were gel purified, digested with Sfi I and Not I, and subcloned into pCANTAB-5E. The plasmid library was transformed into *Escherichia coli* TG1 cells by electroporation. All primer sequences for library construction are provided in S1 Table.

Sample preparation and Illumina sequencing

Phagemid vector was extracted from the electrooporated or phage-infected TG1 cells using a QIAprep Miniprep kit (Qiagen). A first PCR was performed to amplify the CDR library fragment with 70-bp length in a 50 μl reaction solution containing 50 ng phagemid DNA as template, 15 pmol frame-specific primers, and 1 μl Pfu polymerase for 20 cycles at 95°C, 52.5°C and 68°C for 30 sec each. The gel purified PCR products from individual CDRs were mixed in equal amount for deep sequencing analysis by an external service provider (Shanghai Sangon Biotech, China). Addition of 3’ A overhangs and ligation of adaptors containing unique index sequences were accomplished using a TruSeq DNA sample preparation kit v2. A second PCR (5 cycles) was performed to amplify the final products with specific adaptor primers. The bar-coded samples were sequenced on the Illumina HiSeq 2000 sequencer with 2 x 100 bp paired-end reads according to manufacturer’s instructions. All primer and adaptor sequences for Illumina sequencing are provided in S1 Table.

Analysis of the sequencing data

Run quality was monitored following the standard Illumina procedure described by the service provider. Estimation of the error rate was performed using a control DNA that was sequenced in parallel to the samples. The sequencing reads were assigned to a raw data pool based on a unique 6-bp barcode identifier and generated as a FASTQ file. The raw data were cleaned up by generally following the quality filtration protocol, as described previously [28]. In brief, read pairs for which either read had an average Phred quality score of less than 30 (99.9% accuracy) were discarded. The remaining read pairs were merged into a single sequence and aligned to the HuA21 scFv gene. A sequence was assigned to the corresponding CDR library only if it was a perfect match or there was a single nucleotide mismatch (allowing for substitution, deletion or insertion) in the 5’ and 3’ overlapping regions. Sequences with at least two mismatched nucleotides were discarded, as they tended to contain obvious errors during sample preparation or Illumina sequencing. The overlapping regions were trimmed, and the remaining DNA sequences were extracted into an Excel file. Then, the DNA sequences in each individual CDR library were aligned to determine the occurrence of each sequence and generate a list of unique DNA variants and their frequencies. The frequency for a given variant (v) in each CDR (x) was determined using the following equation: \( F_{v,x} = \frac{\text{read}_{v,x}}{\Sigma \text{reads}, x} \). Only variants with accurate in-frame reading were chosen to compute amino acid frequencies at all CDR positions. The frequency at the \( i^\text{th} \) position bearing the \( j^\text{th} \) amino acid in each CDR (x) was determined using the following equation: \( F_{i,j,x} = \frac{\text{read}_{v,x}}{\Sigma \text{reads}, x} \).
Production and purification of recombinant antigen

The extracellular domain (ECD) of ErbB2 in fusion to an enterokinase cleavage peptide and a human IgG1 Fc fragment was subcloned into the mammalian expression vector pSectag 2A (Invitrogen). The recombinant dimeric ErbB2 ECD-Fc fusion protein was transiently expressed in Expi293 cells using the Expifectamine reagent (Invitrogen), purified on Protein A affinity column (GE Healthcare), and then biotinylated (denoted Bio-ECD) using the EZ-Link NHS-PEG4-Biotin labeling kit (Pierce). To prepare recombinant ErbB2 ECD, the fusion protein was incubated with bovine enterokinase (Novoprotein) and passed through Protein A to remove the cleaved Fc fragment.

Phage panning

The rescue and selection of recombinant scFv phage libraries were performed according to the manufacturer’s protocol. TG1 cells were grown in 2 x YT-AG medium to an OD 600 nm = 0.3–0.5, then infected with M13 helper phage (4 x 10^10 pfu) and resuspended in 2 x YT-AK medium. After overnight cultivation at 30°C, phages were purified by double precipitation with 20% PEG-8000/2.5 M NaCl, resuspended in 2 x YT medium, and titrated by re-infecting TG1 cells. In panning round 1, phages (10^13 cfu) from each library were incubated with 0.2, 1 or 5 nM Bio-ECD antigen in 1 ml PBS/0.1% Tween-20 containing 3% non-fat milk for 1 h at room temperature. The phages were captured by incubation with 50 μl M280 streptavidin magnetic beads (Invitrogen) for 15 min. Non-specific phages were eliminated by ten washes with PBS/0.1% Tween-20, followed by five washes with PBS for 5 min each. Bound phages were eluted with 0.1 M glycine (pH 2.2), neutralized with 2 M Tris-base and re-infected into log-phase TG1 cells. In panning round 2, phages (10^12 cfu) were used against 0.2 and 1 nM antigen. In panning round 3, phages (10^12 cfu) were used against 0.04 and 0.2 nM antigen. For the combinatorial libraries, phages (10^12 cfu) were used against 0.1, 0.01 and 0.001 nM antigen in panning rounds 1, 2 and 3, respectively. Washing time was increased to 10 min each.

Phage ELISA

Two maxisorp plates (Nunc) were separately coated with ErbB2 ECD (0.1 μg/ml) and rabbit anti-HuA21 scFv polyclonal antibodies (1 μg/ml) overnight at 4°C. The plates were blocked with 3% non-fat milk in PBST for 1 h. Various amounts of phage supernatants were added to the plates and incubated for 1 h. The bound phages were reacted with 1:2000 diluted mouse anti-M13 antibody (Amersham) and goat anti-mouse IgG/HRP (Pierce) for 1 h each. Color development was performed using the OPD substrate and stopped with 1 M sulfuric acid for the measurement of absorbance at 490 nm. The ratio of binding signals was calculated from two plates coated with ECD versus antibodies. Positive phage clones were identified as having a ratio greater than two times the ratio of the wild-type HuA21 phage.

ScFv-Fc expression and screening ELISA

The scFv mutant genes in the phagemid vector were digested with SfiI/NotI and subcloned into pSectag2A for expression as scFv-Fc fusion antibodies, as described previously [9]. Recombinant plasmids were transfected in Expi293, and conditioned medium was harvested after 72 h. Screening ELISAs were performed to determine the binding EC50s, as described previously [26]. The scFv-fc mutants were purified using Protein A affinity column and Superdex G200 size-exclusion chromatography (GE Healthcare) to remove aggregated antibodies.
Surface plasmon resonance

Kinetic constants were determined by surface plasmon resonance using a Biacore 3000 instrument (GE healthcare) at a controlled temperature of 25°C. The Bio-ECD was diluted to 1 μg/ml in PBS and directly immobilized on a SA sensor chip at approximately 300 resonance units (RU). Antibodies were diluted to 10 μg/ml in PBS, flowed over the chip at a rate of 30 μl/min with 3 min stabilization intervals and then allowed to dissociate for 15 min. Regeneration was performed with a single injection of 50 mM NaOH for 1 min. Each sensogram was run in triplicate. Data analysis was performed using BIA kinetic evaluation software.

Results

Library construction using microchip-synthesized oligonucleotides

The overall scheme to diversify the HuA21 CDR loops using the SPM strategy is illustrated in Fig 1. According to the criteria, forty candidate positions from the L1, L3, H1, H2, and H3 CDRs were selected for randomization. As summarized in Table 1, the five SPM libraries consisted of 287 sub-libraries that could be further expanded into 7,749 degenerate oligonucleotides. The use of three degenerate codons, NWG, NWC and NSG, led to the translation of nineteen different amino acids with the least distribution variation and codon redundancy. Theoretically, all of the libraries were composed of 4.0 x 10⁶ DNA variants and 2.0 x 10⁶ peptide mutants. The final set of CDR oligonucleotide libraries with lengths between 59–68 bases was synthesized on two microchips and used to assemble the scFv gene libraries (Fig 1). Typically, 10⁹–10¹⁰ TG1 transformants were obtained for the construction of individual libraries. To estimate overall library quality, we randomly selected a few transformed clones from each library for Sanger sequencing. Sixty-five percent of positive mutant clones (n = 121) contained the functional, full-length scFv genes with no frameshift mutations. Most of the non-functional clones were due to nucleotide deletions (31%) or insertions (4%).

Library characterization by NGS

Before selection, the scFv phage libraries were further evaluated by Illumina sequencing. An overview of the NGS results is summarized in Table 2. Overall, 13.9 million raw sequences passed the quality filtration steps. The five CDR libraries contained 10.3 million functional sequences (74.4%) with expected lengths, allowing for accurate in-frame reading, and 7.9 million correct sequences (57.0%) perfectly matching to our CDR diversification strategy and degenerate codon design. At the DNA level, the libraries consisted of 5.82 million variants, 3.92 million of which were single copy. In addition, there were 3.37 million functional variants and 1.69 million correct variants. At the protein level, the libraries contained 2.08 million functional peptides and 1.05 million correct peptides. In summary, 42% of the theoretical DNA diversity and 52% of the theoretical peptide diversity were observed in the sequenced libraries.

A detailed analysis of NGS data identified unique characteristics regarding library sequence diversity and redundancy. From the individual CDRs, 59–85% of the observed CDR variants occurred only one time, 14–30% had 2–10 copies, while less than 0.9% had above 10 copies. The map of CDR sequence abundances revealed an overall power-law distribution in which the log₁₀ counts of total variants of a specific copy number was inversely correlated to the number of copies with differential linear slopes (Fig 2A). These results indicate that the sequences in the L3, H1, H2 and H3 libraries were represented more uniformly than the L1 library. In addition, the map of CDR sequence lengths revealed that 49–74% of total variants were of the correct length, other variants with frameshift mutations mainly occurred due to one nucleotide deletions (19–32%) or insertions (3–5%), and sequences containing two or more
Fig 1. Overall scheme of the HuA21 affinity maturation process by phage display. (A) Candidate residues from the L1, L3, H1, H2 and H3 CDRs were targeted for diversification. (B) NWG, NWC and NSG degenerate codons were used for amino acid saturation mutagenesis. (C) Degenerate oligonucleotides containing CDR mutations were synthesized on microchips. (D) Mutant CDR libraries were amplified from the mixture of released oligonucleotides. (E) Mutant scFv gene libraries were assembled by OE-PCR and transformed into TG1. (F) Recombinant phages were amplified with helper phages, captured on antigen-coated magnetic beads, and recovered by re-infecting TG1. (G) Phage ELISA was used to isolate antigen-binding clones. (H) Positive clones were submitted for Sanger sequencing. (I) Pool of mutant CDR libraries was sequenced on the Illumina HiSeq 2000 platform. (J) NGS data was analyzed after quality filtration. (K) ScFv-Fc mutants were expressed in Expi293 cells to determine binding EC50s.

Table 1. Statistics of the SPM libraries for CDR diversification.

| CDR Residues | Length (aa) | Candidate positions | Sub-libraries | Degenerate oligonucleotides | DNA variants (x 10^6) | Peptide mutants (x 10^6) |
|--------------|-------------|---------------------|--------------|----------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| L1 KSSQTLLYSNNQKNYLA | 17 | 8 | 56 | 1512 | 0.78 | 0.38 |
| L3 QQYSNYPWT | 9 | 8 | 56 | 1512 | 0.78 | 0.38 |
| H1 GYSFTGYFIN | 10 | 8 | 56 | 1512 | 0.78 | 0.38 |
| H2 HISSSYATSTYNQKFKN | 17 | 9 | 84 | 2268 | 1.34 | 0.58 |
| H3 SGNYEEYAMDY | 11 | 7 | 35 | 945 | 0.49 | 0.24 |
| **Total** | **40** | **287** | **7749** | | **4.0** | **2.0** |

a: Underlined resides are selected as candidate positions.
b: The number of sub-libraries was calculated using the following formula: C^3/n, where n is the number of candidate positions in each CDR.
Nucleotide changes were present at a much lower abundance (Fig 2B). We speculate that these undesired mutations were introduced mainly due to errors in the microchip-synthesized oligonucleotides.
The high-quality of the NGS data also provided the opportunity to calculate the amino acid frequencies within the five CDRs. The data were well organized into a comprehensive amino acid composition map. The real distribution of amino acid frequencies in the unselected libraries showed no significant deviation from the expected distribution at all diversified positions (Fig 3). Indeed, a very small fraction of amino acid mutations that should not appear in the theoretical libraries was observed. For example, the substitution to cysteine and stop codons was found at all diversified positions with an average frequency of 0.12% and 0.22%, respectively. In addition, approximately 2–7% of mutations were displayed in four conservative positions that should contain only wild-type amino acids.

Library selection and target-binding screening

To enrich potent mutants with higher affinity, the scFv phage libraries were separately submitted to three rounds of panning against the biotinylated antigen. This procedure was performed with stepwise increasing stringency by reducing the input phage amount and antigen concentration. To demonstrate the efficiency of the selection process, a typical experiment result for the L1 library is shown in S2 Table. Overall, $10^{12}–10^{13}$ input phages were used, and $10^5–10^6$ output phages were recovered in each selection round. For quality control purpose, phage ELISA revealed that the percentage of positive phages increased gradually from below 5% before selection to over 95% after the last selection round.

Candidate identification using a traditional target-binding screening approach was performed first. From each library after selection, more than fifty positive clones were randomly selected for Sanger sequencing. All of the H3 library clones contained the wild-type scFv genes. Thus, a number of functional mutants from the L1, L3, H1 and H2 libraries were chosen to express the scFv-Fc fusion antibodies. Several scFv-Fc mutants expressed at much lower levels in Expi293 cells compared to HuA21. Thus, only scFv-Fc mutants with normal or high expression

---

**Fig 3. Amino acid composition at different CDR positions.** (A) Map of the theoretical amino acid composition using NWG, NWC and NSG degenerate codons according to the SPM strategy. (B) Map of the observed amino acid composition from 10.3 million functional sequences in the unselected libraries. Forty diversified positions and four non-diversified positions are shown. Z represents a stop codon.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0129125.g003
levels were submitted for ELISA screening analysis. We calculated the binding EC50 of each mutant to assess the apparent binding affinity. Of the fifty-five mutants, the EC50 of 50 mutants was decreased compared to HuA21, suggesting that more than 90% of mutants displayed improved affinity (S3 table). The average affinity enhancement was 3.29, 2.00, 1.88 and 1.65-fold for mutants from the L1, L3, H1 and H2 libraries, respectively (Fig 4A).

Sequence evolution analysis after selection by NGS

After selection, the scFv phage libraries were evaluated by Illumina sequencing. The overall NGS results are shown in Table 2. Of the 4.52 million total qualified sequences obtained from the five CDRs, 4.47 million sequences (99.1%) were functional and 3.66 million sequences (80.9%) were correct. However, only 1.34 x 10^5 CDR variants were observed, indicating that the selection remarkably reduced the library diversity. Among these CDR variants, 1.24 x 10^5 were functional variants (92.1%) and 6.08 x 10^4 were correct variants (45.3%), but only 1.8 x 10^4 variants were present as a single copy. Accordingly, these variants can be translated into 8.74 x 10^4 functional peptides and 5.39 x 10^4 correct peptides. These results suggest that the selection efficiently removed the majority of non-functional sequences at both the DNA and protein levels.

Comparison of sequence abundances before and after selection revealed that a subset of CDR sequences was enriched at high frequencies (Fig 5). Several hundreds of CDR variants were identified in over 1000 copies, which accounted for >60% of all sequences in the selected L1, L3, H1 and H2 libraries. In addition, the top 10 most frequent peptide mutants were present in 4.2 x 10^3–1.1 x 10^6 copies (S4 Table). These mutants accounted for 37.2%, 27.3%, 71.6% and 45.3% of all sequences in the selected L1, L3, H1 and H2 libraries, respectively. In the selected L1 library, a sequence with a stop codon was abnormally enriched. The stop codon should be introduced due to errors from degenerate oligonucleotide synthesis on microchips and the followed amplification. The enrichment was possible due to that the recombinant phages with this sequence may bind to the antigen non-specifically or support the E.coli hosts to grow faster than other phages. It is surprising that the H3 library displayed a distinct
sequence enrichment pattern. The parent H3 gene from the library construction was dramatically enriched after selection, and it accounted for 95.8% of all sequences. Several different DNA variants encoding the parent H3 peptide were also highly enriched, suggesting that the wild-type residues were strongly preferred in the H3 loop.

Amino acid enrichment analysis based on NGS data

The large collection of the NGS data enabled us to explore the amino acid preferences after selection. For each CDR, we calculated the frequencies of twenty amino acids and stop codons in the selected libraries. We referred to the base 2 logarithm of the ratio of the frequencies of a single substitution in the selected versus unselected libraries as the "enrichment value" (EV), as described previously [29]. The heat-map representing the EVs for all substitutions illustrated the complexity of mutational tolerance and preference for different CDR positions (Fig 6). In the

Fig 5. Frequency distribution of CDR sequences. Data analysis was performed for five individual CDRs from 13.9 and 4.5 million qualified sequences in the unselected (BS) and selected (AS) libraries, respectively. Total counts of all variants representing that particular frequency group were calculated.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0129125.g005

Fig 6. Heat-map of amino acid enrichment values. The EVs of all single amino acid substitutions were calculated from 10.3 and 4.5 functional sequences in the unselected and selected libraries, respectively. Rows represent forty diversified positions from the five CDRs. Columns represent the amino acids listed in single-letter code, where Z represents a stop codon. The wild-type CDR residues in HuA21 are labeled.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0129125.g006
L1, L3, H1 and H2 libraries, a small number of the diversified positions (7/33) were favorable for synonymous substitutions (EV >0.4) that retained the wild-type residues, indicating these positions are generally intolerant to mutation. Further analysis of the non-synonymous substitutions revealed that 448 substitutions were deleterious (EV <-1) and 132 substitutions were neutral (-1 < EV < 1). These substitutions should have negative or little effect on binding. In addition, 62 substitutions were moderately enriched (1 < EV < 3), and 18 substitutions were significantly enriched (EV > 3). These enriched substitutions can be reasonably regarded as beneficial mutations. However, in the H3 library, all of the diversified positions were extremely favorable for synonymous substitutions, while most of the non-synonymous substitutions were heavily deleterious.

A detailed analysis of the amino acid substitution profiles discovered more features related to sequence-function relationships. In general, this type of information cannot be captured using traditional Sanger sequencing, which only examines a few clones. As expected, substitution to cysteine, which can lead to inappropriate disulfide bond formation, was always deleterious. Additionally, substitution to stop codons was strongly deleterious. Remarkable convergence of mutation was observed in certain positions. For example, the H1 Asn35 was exclusively mutated to His in 36.4% of library sequences after selection. The L1 Lys30 mutation to three aromatic amino acids was also greatly beneficial. However, several positions allowed for different mutational preferences. The mutation of L3 Trp96 and the H2 His50 to a variety of amino acids with short side chains was beneficial. In addition, the co-enrichment of certain amino acids in particular positions may occur between these positions, indicating synergistic effects. For example, in many highly abundant mutants, the L1 Leu27C -> Glu substitution strictly accompanied the Lys30 -> Tyr or Trp substitution.

Candidate identification by NGS approach

Next, we explored whether the NGS data could be used as an alternative approach for candidate identification. It was assumed that variants of better than average affinity should be enriched with high abundance during selection, and thus, they should be sequenced more often. In a simple test, we selected the top 10 most frequent CDR mutants from each library to determine their binding EC50s by screening ELISA. In summary, all forty scFv-Fc mutants were expressed in normal or high levels, and a very large proportion of them (39/40) displayed decreased EC50s compared to HuA21. The average affinity enhancement was 3.70, 2.50, 1.94 and 1.84-fold from the L1, L3, H1 and H2 libraries, respectively (Fig 4B and S4 Table). The best mutant, which displayed 7.2-fold enhanced affinity, was achieved in the L1 library. Furthermore, almost half of the highly abundant mutants (17/40) were missed in target-binding screening. It is clear that the affinity gains associated with the NGS approach were somewhat better than those achieved using the target-binding screening approach. However, a majority of the target-binding identified mutants (52/55) were identified in the top 100 most frequently observed mutants from the NGS data. These data suggest that the NGS approach is likely more efficient than the traditional approach for isolating higher affinity mutants using our experimental conditions. This example demonstrates that candidate identification can be retrieved through the NGS analysis of selected libraries without upfront screening of randomly picked clones.

Generation and screening of combinatorial libraries

Two sets of combinatorial scFv phage libraries were generated and screened to explore the synergistic or additive potential of different CDRs. As the selection of the H3 library did not result in any beneficial mutants, only the identified mutants from the L1, L3, H1 and H2 libraries
were chosen for mutational recombination. Affinity-enhancing CDR mutants identified through the target-binding screening method together with the wild-type CDR sequences were recombined to construct a first library with $4.5 \times 10^4$ theoretical diversity. Similarly, the top 10 most frequent CDR mutants identified through the NGS method were also recombined to construct a second library with $1.46 \times 10^4$ theoretical diversity. Two libraries were separately submitted to three rounds of panning using identically more stringent conditions by decreasing the antigen concentration and increasing the washing time. As expected, this process yielded a large number of clones with strong binding signals in phage ELISA. Several highly enriched scFv mutants from the second library were observed by Sanger sequencing of randomly picked clones. These scFv-Fc mutants were expressed and purified, and their antigen-binding kinetics were determined by surface plasmon resonance (Table 3). The affinity equilibrium constant ($K_d$) of these mutants was in the range of 25.5 to 295 pM. The most optimal variant displayed 158-fold improved affinity compared to HuA21. In this variant, the measured affinity is in good agreement with that apparent synergistic effect observed between different CDRs. Remarkably, the association ($K_{on}$) and dissociation ($K_{off}$) constants were both improved in all mutants. These results suggest that the NGS data were generally applicable for the construction of a small combinatorial library compassing multiple CDRs to significantly improve antibody affinity.

Discussion

Phage or cell display systems are widely used for engineering antibodies with high affinity by stepwise optimization through interrogating and recombining beneficial mutations from multiple CDRs [7,8,11–13]. Here, we described a rational stepwise strategy for the effective optimization of HuA21 to obtain low picomolar affinities by phage display. In brief, the approach started with the construction of multiple SPM libraries to diversify antibody CDRs using massively microchip-synthesized degenerate oligonucleotides. Subsequently, Illumina sequencing was used to compare the unselected and selected scFv libraries to identify beneficial variants. Last, candidate mutations from several CDRs were recombined to generate a small size phage library that was further selected to isolate mutants with greatly improved affinity.

The method described in this study can improve the efficiency of CDR diversification. Many mutagenesis strategies have been applied in antibody affinity maturation, ranging from random mutagenesis across the complete gene sequence to targeted mutagenesis where the whole or hotspot positions in the CDR loops are diversified [2]. Typically, small CDR regions with less than 6–8 aa can be targeted for saturation mutagenesis. However, for longer CDRs, this process becomes impractical due to the limitation in the phage library sizes ($10^9$–$10^{12}$) that may be generated and surveyed with confidence. Furthermore, numerous studies have revealed that in most cases, amino acid substitutions in a few specific positions (typically no more than three or four) in the targeted CDR are sufficient to significantly improve affinity. Here, Table 3. Binding kinetics of the combinatorial library mutants.

| Clone name | $K_{on}$ ($\times 10^5$ M$^{-1}$s$^{-1}$) | $K_{off}$ ($\times 10^5$ s$^{-1}$) | $K_d$ ($\times 10^{12}$M) | Fold increase |
|------------|----------------------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------|
| HuA21 (wt) | 0.65                                   | 26.2                            | 4030                     | 1            |
| D10        | 1.07                                   | 3.16                            | 295                      | 13.6         |
| E9         | 1.16                                   | 1.47                            | 126                      | 31.8         |
| F11        | 1.46                                   | 1.47                            | 101                      | 40.0         |
| G1         | 1.24                                   | 2.46                            | 198                      | 20.3         |
| H2         | 1.49                                   | 0.38                            | 25.5                     | 158          |

Table 3. Binding kinetics of the combinatorial library mutants.

`doj:10.1371/journal.pone.0129125.t003`
according to our SPM strategy, the systematic mutations were introduced into up to three random candidate positions for CDR randomization. Unlike saturation mutagenesis, the relatively small SPM library (10^6 – 10^8) has the capacity to diversify the whole CDR region with 15–20 aa.

For purposes of generating antibody libraries, the uses of degenerate codons greatly reduce the number of oligonucleotides necessary to introduce the selected mutations. Normally, degenerate codons, such as NNS or NNK, are used to produce all combinations of twenty amino acids for CDR randomization. However, the introduction of unpaired cysteine residues is particularly problematic due to its tendency to form aberrant disulfide bonds [30]. The stop codons should also be avoided due to their disruptive role in antibody function. Theoretically, a degenerate oligonucleotide containing three NNS codons will result in 18% of sequences that contain stop or cysteine residues. To avoid this problem, we demonstrated that a combination of NWG, NWC and NSG codons can be used to diversify a single position into nineteen different amino acids. This approach improved library quality, as supported by NGS data indicating that less than 0.4% in-frame sequences contained stop or cysteine residues. In addition, the use of three degenerate codons can remarkably reduce library redundancy. Ideally, a library with three diversified positions only produces 13824 (24^3) nucleotide sequences. However, it would produce 32768 (32^3) nucleotide sequences using the NNS codon. The NGS data clearly reveal that SPM libraries with three degenerate codons display uniformly distributed amino acids that cannot be achieved with the NNS codon.

The microchip-synthesized oligonucleotides are qualified for CDR library construction. Previously, we have demonstrated that the microfluidic microchip was capable of simultaneously producing hundreds of degenerate oligonucleotides suitable for the construction of antibody libraries [9]. Theoretically, this type microchip is composed of four thousand reaction chambers, and each of them can be programmed to synthesize a different degenerate oligonucleotide. Here, we present a rational protocol using two successive PCR steps to generate multiple scFv gene libraries from a mixture of several thousands of microchip-synthesized degenerate oligonucleotides. Library characterization by Sanger sequencing or NGS approaches confirmed that the library quality was acceptable in all aspects of sequence accuracy, diversity and redundancy. Analysis of the non-functional variants at the DNA and protein levels revealed that they contained many more nucleotide deletions than insertions. This result is consistent with the fact that the most common type of error in microchip DNA synthesis is base deletion, which produces a small fraction of imperfect oligonucleotides [15,31]. Although the current data are not sufficiently accurate to reduce the errors generated during the oligonucleotide synthesis or PCR cloning steps, we believe that library quality can be further improved using the oligonucleotides after post-synthesis purification approaches.

The enriched sequences in the NGS data represent mutants with improved affinity. In recent years, NGS technologies have been successfully employed to accelerate or simplify the process of discovering new antibodies. In particular, the Illumina platform that can generate millions of high-quality reads per run, and it has excellent capacity for assisting the identification of antibody candidates [19,21,22]. In this study, focusing on the most frequent variants after selection is a very simple method to identify beneficial candidates with improved affinity based on the assumption that higher affinity variants tend to enrich more rapidly during the phage panning. As expected, many affinity-enhancing mutants with high frequencies were identified that were missed in phage ELISA and clone picking. However, some particular mutants may help E. coli hosts grow faster or phages display pIII-antibody fusion more efficiently, which occurs frequently in phage display [32]. These variants could appear in high frequencies in libraries but display no affinity enhancement. As demonstrated here, the number of this type of variant was very small. Therefore, the NGS approach should be more efficient for
identifying beneficial variants with less time and labor than classical target-binding screening with ELISA.

The high frequency mutants obtained through NGS were consistent with antibody structure and function analyses. Analysis of the amino acid enrichment values revealed that a number of distinct CDR positions were permissive to mutation in various degrees, while others were generally intolerant to mutation. Interestingly, we found that certain positions allowed for distinct mutations, arguing that each position has a unique mutational preference. These data are consistent with the ChA21-ErbB2 complex crystal structure showing that positions where very little variation is tolerated are either supporting the core loop conformation or making essential contacts to the antigen in the binding interface [24]. Furthermore, nine diversified positions with aromatic amino acids from several CDRs are always conserved to retain the starting residues. Actually, the mutation of any of these amino acids to an alanine decreased the binding affinity of ChA21 by at least 10-fold [25]. These data indicate that tyrosine is predominant in many antibodies as a critical CDR residue for contact with antigens [33,34]. Taken together, the enrichment landscapes provide a route forward to obtain extremely high affinity variants by combining individually small beneficial mutations that may not be detectable using the conventional approach.

The NGS approach also provides useful information for combinatorial CDR library design. High-throughput sequencing is a powerful tool for the extensive analysis of protein sequence-function relationships [28,29]. Antibody mutants with significantly enhanced affinities were obtained from the combinatorial CDR library in which the beneficial variants were selected based on high frequency, similar to the library based on target-binding screening. Thus, the affinity-driven selection of antibody libraries can be combined with high-throughput sequencing to assess potentially beneficial mutations and synergistic effects.

Supporting Information

S1 Table. List of primers and adaptor sequences. (DOCX)
S2 Table. Parameters and results in selection of the CDR-L1 library. (DOCX)
S3 Table. Analysis of target-binding mutants in the selected libraries. (DOCX)
S4 Table. Analysis of 10 top frequent mutants in the selected libraries. (DOCX)

Acknowledgments

We gratefully thank Dr. Bo Ding (University of Science and Technology of China) for help with using the Absys antibody database, Dr. Yulu Zhang (LC Sciences, USA) for technical assistance in design and synthesis of library oligonucleotides, and Dr. Hao Ma (University of Science and Technology of China) for valuable advice on computer programming for NGS data analysis.

Author Contributions

Conceived and designed the experiments: SYH HYL JH JL XLG. Performed the experiments: DMH WW MX RKD SYH. Analyzed the data: DMH WW MX RKD SYH WZ. Contributed
reagents/materials/analysis tools: DMH WW MX RKD SYH WZ. Wrote the paper: SYH JH DMH WW HYL.

References
1. Bradbury AR, Sidhu S, Dubel S, McCafferty J. Beyond natural antibodies: the power of in vitro display technologies. Nat Biotechnol. 2011; 29: 245–254. doi: 10.1038/nbt.1791 PMID: 21390033
2. Wark KL, Hudson PJ. Latest technologies for the enhancement of antibody affinity. Adv Drug Deliv Rev. 2006; 58: 657–670. PMID: 16828920
3. Martineau P. Error-prone polymerase chain reaction for modification of scFvs. Methods Mol Biol. 2002; 178: 287–294. PMID: 11968498
4. Low NM, Holliger P, Winter G. Mimicking somatic hypermutation: Affinity maturation of antibodies displayed on bacteriophage using a bacterial mutator strain. J Mol Biol. 1996; 260: 359–368. PMID: 8757799
5. Irving RA, Kortt AA, Hudson PJ. Affinity maturation of recombinant antibodies using E-coli mutator cells. Immunotechnology. 1996; 2: 127–143. PMID: 9373321
6. Chowdhury PS, Pastan I. Improving antibody affinity by mimicking somatic hypermutation in vitro. Nat Biotechnol. 1999; 17: 568–572. PMID: 10385321
7. Rajpal A, Beyaz N, Haber L, Cappuccilli G, Yee H, Bhatt RR, et al. A general method for greatly improving the affinity of antibodies by using combinatorial libraries. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2005; 102: 8466–8471. PMID: 19939870
8. Laffly E, Pelat T, Cedrone F, Blesa S, Bedouelle H, Thullier P. Improvement of an antibody neutralizing the anthrax toxin by simultaneous mutagenesis of its six hypervariable loops. J Mol Biol. 2008; 378: 1094–1103. doi: 10.1016/j.jmb.2008.03.045 PMID: 19423488
9. Wu H, Beuerlein G, Nie Y, Smith H, Lee BA, Hensler M, et al. Stepwise in vitro affinity maturation of Vitaxin, an alphav beta3-specific humanized mAb. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 1998; 95: 6037–6042. PMID: 9600913
10. Zhou X, Cai S, Hong A, You Q, Yu P, Sheng N, et al. Microfluidic PicoArray synthesis of oligodeoxynucleotides and simultaneous assembling of multiple DNA sequences. Nucleic Acids Res. 2004; 32: 5409–5417. PMID: 15477391
11. Cleary MA, Kilian K, Wang YQ, Bradshaw J, Cavet G, Ge W, et al. Production of complex nucleic acid libraries using highly parallel in situ oligonucleotide synthesis. Nat Methods. 2004; 1: 241–248. PMID: 15782200
12. Larman HB, Zhao Z, Laserson U, Li MZ, Ciccia A, Gakidis MA, et al. Autoantigen discovery with a synthetic human peptidome. Nat Biotechnol. 2011; 29: 535–541. doi: 10.1038/nbt.1856 PMID: 21602805
13. Larman HB, Xu GJ, Pavlova NN, Elledge SJ. Construction of a rationally designed antibody platform for sequencing-assisted selection. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2012; 109: 18523–18528. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1215549109 PMID: 23064642
14. Georgiou G, Ippolito GC, Beausang J, Busse CE, Wardemann H, Quake SR. The promise and challenge of high-throughput sequencing of the antibody repertoire. Nat Biotechnol. 2014; 32: 158–168. doi: 10.1038/nbt.2762 PMID: 24441474
21. Ravn U, Didelot G, Venet S, Ng KT, Gueneau F, Rousseau F, et al. Deep sequencing of phage display libraries to support antibody discovery. Methods. 2013; 60: 99–110. doi:10.1016/j.ymeth.2013.03.001 PMID: 23500657

22. Ravn U, Gueneau F, Baerlocher L, Osteras M, Desmurs M, Malinge P, et al. By-passing in vitro screening—next generation sequencing technologies applied to antibody display and in silico candidate selection. Nucleic Acids Res. 2010; 38: e193. doi: 10.1093/nar/gkq789 PMID: 20846958

23. Jones PT, Dear PH, Foote J, Neuberger MS, Winter G. Replacing the Complementarity-Determining Regions in a Human-Antibody with Those from a Mouse. Nature. 1986; 321: 522–525. PMID: 3713831

24. Zhou HH, Zha Z, Liu Y, Zhang HT, Zhu JJ, Hu SY, et al. Structural Insights into the Down-regulation of Overexpressed p185(her2/neu) Protein of Transformed Cells by the Antibody chA21. J Biol Chem. 2011; 286: 31676–31683. doi: 10.1074/jbc.M111.235184 PMID: 21680730

25. Chang L, Zhou C, Xu M, Liu J. Interactions between anti-ErbB2 antibody A21 and the ErbB2 extracellular domain provide a basis for improving A21 affinity. J Comput Aided Mol Des. 2010; 24: 37–47. doi: 10.1007/s10822-009-9312-1 PMID: 20012671

26. Hu S, Zhu Z, Li L, Chang L, Li W, Cheng L, et al. Epitope mapping and structural analysis of an anti-ErbB2 antibody A21: Molecular basis for tumor inhibitory mechanism. Proteins. 2008; 70: 938–949. PMID: 17847085

27. Cheng LS, Liu AP, Yang JH, Dong YQ, Li LW, Wang J, et al. Construction, expression and characterization of the engineered antibody against tumor surface antigen, p185(c-erbB-2). Cell Res. 2003; 13: 35–48. PMID: 12643348

28. Fowler DM, Araya CL, Fleishman SJ, Kellogg EH, Stephany JJ, Baker D, et al. High-resolution mapping of protein sequence-function relationships. Nat Methods. 2010; 7: 741–746. doi: 10.1038/nmeth.1492 PMID: 20711194

29. Whitehead TA, Chevalier A, Song Y, Dreyfus C, Fleishman SJ, De Mattos C, et al. Optimization of affinity, specificity and function of designed influenza inhibitors using deep sequencing. Nat Biotechnol. 2012; 30: 543–548. doi: 10.1038/nbt.2214 PMID: 22634563

30. Ge X, Mazor Y, Hunicke-Smith SP, Ellington AD, Georgiou G. Rapid Construction and Characterization of Synthetic Antibody Libraries Without DNA Amplification. Biotechnol Bioeng. 2010; 106: 347–357. doi: 10.1002/bit.22712 PMID: 20196660

31. Tian J, Gong H, Sheng N, Zhou X, Gulari E, Gao X, et al. Accurate multiplex gene synthesis from programmable DNA microchips. Nature. 2004; 432: 1050–1054. PMID: 15616567

32. Derda R, Tang SK, Li SC, Ng S, Matochko W, Jafari MR. Diversity of phage-displayed libraries of peptides during panning and amplification. Molecules. 2011; 16: 1776–1803. doi: 10.3390/molecules16021776 PMID: 21339712

33. Gonzalez-Munoz A, Yokota E, O’Shea D, Minton K, Strain M, Voussen K, et al. Tailored amino acid diversity for the evolution of antibody affinity. MAbs. 2012; 4: 664–672. doi: 10.4161/mabs.21728 PMID: 22926024

34. Fellouse FA, Wiesmann C, Sidhu SS. Synthetic antibodies from a four-amino-acid code: a dominant role for tyrosine in antigen recognition. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2004; 101: 12467–12472. PMID: 15306681