METACOMMENTARY IN ENGLISH VINGLISH MOVIE

Isti’anatul Hikmah; Mohammad Saddam Husein
Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa; Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa, ihikmah99@gmail.com; sadam.husein99@yahoo.co.id

Abstract
This study analyzed David Fischer’s utterances in English Vinglish movie using metacommentary. His utterances will be classified based on six types of metacommentary namely metacommentary type 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6. The aims of this study were describing types of metacommentary used by David Fischer and explaining reasons behind it. This study used qualitative method which was divided into three those were method of collecting data using simak method; method of analyzing data using descriptive analytic method; and method of presenting data analysis using informal method. Findings of this study showed that all six metacommentary types were found in David Fischer’s utterances. Metacommentary type one-marking code was used when his students started to use their native language, so it was a control for them to continue using English. Metacommentary type two-marking the sounds of language was used when his students pronounce English using their native language pronunciation, and it appeared in compliment because it aimed to appreciate and improve students’ self-confidence using English. Metacommentary type three-marking address term was used when his students have sufficient English skills, and it aimed to minimize negative effects of his utterances which he gave comments to his students. Metacommentary type four-gesture was used to clarify his utterances and to reduce bad effect of his utterances to his students. Metacommentary type five-comments on clothing, appearance was used to improve his students’ confidence. Metacommentary type six-irony contained implied meaning, and it was used to cover students’ weakness in English therefore students will not be hurt.

Keywords: English Vinglish; metacommentary; multicultural class

Introduction
Metacommentary is one of linguistics studies which is rarely studied in Indonesia. Rymes (2014) stated that metacommentary can
be used to provide responses to the use of a language. There are six responses namely metacommentary type 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6, and they are in the form of utterances except metacommentary type 4 because it relates to gestures. The responses are given by listener to speaker in a conversation. Metacommentary is often used to analyze multicultural situation such as in an international school or in a movie which has multicultural setting.

One of movies which has multicultural situation is Bollywood movie entitled English Vinglish. The multicultural situation can be seen at New York Language Center (NLC) scenes. Those scenes present multicultural people, Sashi from India, Laurent from France, Eva from Mexico, and Salman from Pakistan, who learn English at NLC. The process of their learning becomes interesting because they have different culture and mother tongue which means each person has uniqueness like the way they pronounce a word in English which is influenced by their mother tongue’s pronunciation. This situation can be seen on one of Eva’s scenes, minute 52.00, when Eva pronounce I, she should pronounce I into /aɪ/, but she pronounces I using Mexico’s pronunciation that is /aɪɜ/. The other interesting parts can be seen when their teacher, David Fischer, starts to teach them using English. Some of them uses their mother tongue to communicate due to their lack of vocabulary. When this situation appear, Fischer must remind them to use English, so they will try to find words to deliver their messages.

Utterances which are used by Fischer in reminding them to use English become data of this study, and they will be analyzed using metacommentary proposed by Rymes (2014). The data were taken from NLC scenes when Fischer teaches English to Sashi and her friends who have multicultural background. Fischer’s utterances were varied because of his students are multicultural. Fischer’s utterances in handling multicultural students might be used by other teachers who face similar situation. One example of his utterance was taken from NLC scene on minute of 52:13, ckckck English Please. His utterance was used to retell Eva that she must use English. Because of Fischer’s utterances, Eva tried to use English when she introduced herself.

Variety of Fisher’s utterances which were used in teaching multicultural students were influencing focus of this study. Therefore the focus of this study was finding types of metacommentary on Fischer’s utterances and discovering factors which influenced it. In
addition, all Fischer’s utterances at NLC became the data of this study, but there was limitation of the data relating to gesture. It will only analyzed Fischer’s gestures when Eva introduced herself at NLC class.

A brief analysis of this study are expected to provide theoretical and practical uses for readers. Theoretically, this study are expected to provide an explanation of the metacommentary in English Vinglish movie. Practically, the results of this study are expected to be used as example in Introduction to Linguistics class; and enrich existing study on metacommentary.

**Literature Review**

Main theory used in this study was metacommentary. It refers to giving comments about language as a new ordering principal for understanding heteroglossic communication (Rymes, 2014: 301). In other words, it is a tool used to classify types of utterances spoken by speakers in a conversation especially in multicultural situation. Rymes (2014) mentioned that there are six types of metacommentary:

- **metacommentary type 1**: marking code,
- **metacommentary type 2**: marking the sounds of language,
- **metacommentary type 3**: marking address terms,
- **metacommentary type 4**: gesture,
- **metacommentary type 5**: comments on clothing, appearance, dan
- **metacommentary type 6**: irony.

Metacommentary type 1: marking code is commentary which points the boundaries between language (Creese, Takhi, & Adrian, 2015: 272-273). It relates to the usage of code used by the speaker to interlocutor. The code is usually in the form of utterances, and it must be followed by interlocutor. For example in an English class, the teacher says to students, *please use English*. That utterance can be interpreted as asking students to use English.

Metacommentary type 2: marking sounds of language relates to comment on accent or pronunciation (Creese, Takhi, & Adrian, 2015: 273). Comments on accent or pronunciation relates to fluency or hesitancy of pronunciation. It usually appears because of hesitancy of pronunciation of a language.

Metacommentary type 3: marking address terms relates to the comment of what you can “call me” (Rymes, 2014: 309). It refers to label which is given to interlocutor. An example of labeling is when female speaker A calls on female friend B using *bee* word. It is used to call special friends like girlfriend or boyfriend.
Metacommentary type 4: gesture relates to gesture, eye gaze and body compartment (Rymes, 2014: 310). Gestures are nonverbal metacommentary because it occur using body parts. Speakers will use gestures if they are lazy to produce utterances or if the situation is not allowed them to speak.

Metacommentary type 5: comments on clothing, appearance relates to verbal commentary on nonverbal communicative displays (Rymes, 2014: 311). It can be categorized as response to clothes or anything worn by the interlocutor. Providing comments can be either good or bad comments.

Metacommentary type 6: irony refers to ironic metacommentary (Creese, Takhi, & Adrian, 2015: 281). It means uttering word to show speakers’ attitude referring to disrespect or quip. When speakers use irony to interlocutors, they want to send non-literal messages to interlocutors. One example of irony is your task is very simple. The sentence can be interpreted that the task is worse.

The theory of metacommentary above was supported by some previous studies. The first study was Rymes (2014) who studied the vocabulary used by multicultural societies based on metacommentary. The results of this study showed that the metacommentary can be used to find out the repertoire of every speaker with a different cultural background, and it can be used to minimize the occurrence of discrimination in in heteroglossic area. The second study was Creese, Takhi, and Blackledge (2015) who analyzed metacommentary in ethnography linguistics area. They studied metacommentary on several multicultural situations in several schools. The results of their study showed that each individual has its own uniqueness in delivering utterances to his interlocutors. The third study was Leonne-Pizzighella and Rymes (2017) who examined the differences of response expressed by each individual to their own language in university environment. The results of their study showed that each individual has different response to their own language.

Method

Method used in this study belonged to qualitative research. It is an approach for exploring and understanding the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social or human problem (Creswell, 2010: 3). This approach is used for social study which concerns to individual or community. Uncovering social problems of human problems become
the focus of this approach, therefore this approach was used in this study because the focus of this study was explaining types of metacommentary in multicultural area. Then qualitative approach in this study was divided into three parts namely method of data collection, method of data analysis, and method of presenting analysis data. Data collection method used in this study was simak method. Mahsun said that simak method means paying attention to the use of language without being involved in it (2012: 92). There is no researchers’ involvement in the use of language, so they only supervise it. Relating to this study, the data were collected by paying attention to Fischer’s utterances at NLC scenes using noted technique. Every Fischer’s utterance was noted in order to assist data analysis. Moreover, descriptive analytic method was used to analyze the data. They were analyzed and described based on metacommentary theory. Then method of presenting data analysis was informal method. Each part of data analysis was described using sentences.

Discussion

This part explained types of metacommentary found on Fischer’s utterances at NLC scenes, and influence factors which influenced it.

a. Types of Metacommentary on Fischer’s Utterances

There are six types of metacommentary found on Fischer’s utterances at NLC scenes in English Vinglish movie. The six types of metacommentary can be seen in the tables below:

| No | Metacommentary Type 1-Marking Code | Minute | Situation | Conversation |
|----|-----------------------------------|--------|-----------|-------------|
| 1  | Ckckck, English please...         | 52:00 to 52:13 | Eva is introducing herself at NLC class using English | Eva: ...I Eva... I...come...Mexico... I work like nanny. But a familiar Fischer: Ckckck, English please... |
| 2  | Ah..ckckck English                | 52:47 to 52:51 | Salman    | Salman: I Queens... |

Ckckck, English please... was Fischer’s response to Eva’s utterance because she used Mexico language in the middle of her introduction, so he asked Eva to use English.
| Time  | Speaker  | Event                                                                 | Response | Notes                                                                 |
|-------|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 53:26 | Khan     | Khan was introducing himself at NLC class using English              | Fischer: How lovely!                         |
|       |          |                                                                        | Salman: No...no...                           |
|       |          |                                                                        | I live on the Queens                         |
|       |          |                                                                        | Fischer: Oh ho ho...You live in Queens New   |
|       |          |                                                                        | York.                                          |
|       |          |                                                                        | Salman: Ok                                   |
|       |          |                                                                        | Fischer: What is your name?                  |
|       |          |                                                                        | Salman: Salman Khan I first from Lahore...   |
|       |          |                                                                        | second from Pakistan Drive taxi...           |
|       |          |                                                                        | New York cab                                  |
|       |          |                                                                        | But no Pakistani girl marry taxi driver...   |
|       |          |                                                                        | Lahore bulahwa                                |
|       |          |                                                                        | Fischer: ah...ckckck English please!          |

**ah...ckckck English please!** emerged because Salman Khan used Urdu language when he was introducing himself, so Fischer used that utterance as request to Salman to use English.

3 From India... 54:35 to 54:38 Sashi was introducing herself using English, and she mentioned her country, India.

| Time  | Speaker  | Event                                                                 | Response | Notes                                                                 |
|-------|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 54:35 | Sashi    | Sashi was introducing herself using English, and she mentioned her country, India. | Fischer: From India... | From India ... was a response given by Fischer to Sashi because Sashi mentioned her country, India, using *The India*. Article *the* should not be used before *India*. Fischer gave correction to her utterance, so that Sashi will not use article *the* to mention her country. |

**From India ...** was a response given by Fischer to Sashi because Sashi mentioned her country, India, using *The India*. Article *the* should not be used before *India*. Fischer gave correction to her utterance, so that Sashi will not use article *the* to mention her country.

| Time  | Speaker  | Event                                                                 | Response | Notes                                                                 |
|-------|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 54:41 | Sashi    | Sashi was introducing herself, and she mentioned her                 | Sashi: Yes sir... from the India...           |
|       |          |                                                                        | Fischer: No Shashi...not from 'the' India...  |
|       |          |                                                                        | Sashi: ha                                    |
|       |          |                                                                        | From India...                                 |
No Shashi...not from 'the' India... from India! was a follow-up response from Sashi's self-introduction. Fischer emphasized to Sashi that *India* did not need article *the* at the beginning. He used a word *no* to give strong comment which meant her utterance, *the India*, was wrong.

You may not...Ask again Shashi was a response given by Fischer to Sashi. It was done by Fischer because he wanted Sashi to repeat her question using correct question pattern. Fischer also emphasized by using phrases *may not* and *ask again*. Both of these phrases were used so that Sashi were able to identify format of polite request using *may*.

Shashi...you need to ask...'may I come in?' was a response given to Sashi by emphasizing order sentence, *you need to ask*, which gave information to Sashi that she needed to ask for permission; and by giving concrete example of asking permission, *may I come in?*, so that Sashi can copy his asking permission pattern.
Table 1 showed that metacommentary type 1 appeared six times, at 52:00 to 52:13 minutes, 52:47 to 53:26, 54:35 to 54:38, 54:41 to 54:45, 01:05:25 to 01:05:41, and 01:05:44 to 01:06:02. First datum was metacommentary type 1 which appeared because Eva used Mexico language at the middle of her self-introduction; consequently, Fischer as teacher needed to stop Eva’s utterance using *ckckck English please*....It was a reminder for Eva to use complete English in her self-introduction. Second datum appeared because Salman used Urdu language at the end of his self-introduction. Again, Fischer needed to remind Salman to use full English by saying *ah...ckckck English please*...Metacommentary type 1 which appeared on datum one and two was used by Fischer as reminder, so his students were consistent using full English on their self-introduction. Then metacommentary type 1 which appeared on datum three and four was in the form of correction, so Sashi will realize her mistake that was the use of article *the* for India was not appropriate. Meanwhile, metacommentary on datum five and six was in the form of suggestion. Fischer suggested the right form of asking permission using *may*. In addition, metacommentary type 1 happened for two reasons those were students did not use full English at the class, so Fischer as teacher needed to remind them; and students did not use correct form of English based on English grammar; hence, Fischer needed to give an example to his students.

Table 2. Metacommentary type 2—Marking the sounds of language

| No | Metacommentary Type 2—marking the sounds of language | Minute | Situation | Conversation |
|----|---------------------------------------------------|--------|-----------|--------------|
| 1  | Oh ho ho…You live in Queens New York             | 52: 46 | Fischer responded Salman self-introduction | Salman: I Queens…
Fischer: How lovely!
Salman: No…no…
I live on the Queens
Fischer: **Oh ho ho…You live in Queens New York.** |

*Oh ho ho…You live in Queens New York* was a response from Fischer given
to Salman after he explained that his name did not *Queens*, but it refers to his living place, *Queens New York*. Fischer’s utterance emphasized on the information provided by Salman; thus Fischer repeated Salman’s utterance, but by giving correction to the prepositions *on* and *in* used by Salman.

| No | Metacommentary Type 2-Marking address terms | Minute | Situation | Conversation |
|----|------------------------------------------|--------|-----------|-------------|
| 2  | No Rama... not like bowels!             | 59:24 to 59:30 | Fischer responded to Rama’s reaction on word *vowels* | Fischer: What are these called? Students: Vowels Rama: Just like bowels Fischer: *No Rama... not like bowels!*

*No Rama... not like bowels!* was a response given by Fischer to Rama because Rama equates the word *vowel* with *bowel*. In this case Fischer provided corrections to the utterances from Rama.

Table 2 showed that metacommentary type 2 appeared twice, namely at 52:46 to 53:00 minutes and 59:24 to 59:30. Metacommentary type 2 appeared as a form of emphasis on utterances spoken by students as in datum 1 which showed that Fischer repeated the word *Queens* because Salman who used Urdu is unclear in reciting the word *Queens*. Another explanation can be seen in datum 2 where Fischer repeated the word *bowels* uttered by Rama because the word *bowels* was different from the word *vowels*, so Fischer needed to emphasize to Rama that those two were different. Furthermore, metacommentary type 2 arose when the speaker, in this case Fischer, needed to remind the interlocutor, in this case was his students, that the words or utterances in which they pronounce the pronunciation are incorrect so that the speaker needs to make corrections on the utterances of the interlocutors.

Tabel 3. Metacommentary type 3-Marking address terms

| No | Metacommentary Type 3-marking address terms | Minute | Situation | Conversation |
|----|---------------------------------------------|--------|-----------|-------------|
| 1  | Eva my darling.....                         | 52:00 to 52:44 | Fischer responded to Eva self-introduction | Eva: ...I Eva... I...come...Mexico... I work like nanny. I work like nanny... to American family. I speak Spanish... the baby...speak Spanish. |
Table 3 showed that metacommentary type 3 appeared one time in minutes 52:00 to 52:44. Fischer’s utterance aimed to diminish regretful effect of commenting Eva’s speaking ability which was low. Metacommentary type 3 showed up because of Fischer’s utterance can hurt Eva’s feelings, so Fischer used *address terms* which were able to cover his harsh utterance.

**Eva my darling**... came after Eva introduce herself. Phrase *my darling* used by Fischer because Eva is a feminine woman. The use of phrase *my darling* used to minimize bad effect which may happen because of Fischer’s utterance which commenting Eva’s speaking ability.

Table 4. *Metacommentary type 4-gesture*

| No | Metacommentary Type 4- gesture |
|----|--------------------------------|
| 1  |                                |

Minute: 52: 12  
Situation: Eva introduced herself at NLC class using English, then she...
used Mexico language in the middle of her self-introduction. Gesture: Pointing pointer finger
Reason: gesture of pointing pointer finger was a strict prohibition instruction used by Fischer for Eva, so she will not use Mexico language.

Minute: 52: 13
Situation: Eva introduced herself at NLC class using English, then she used Mexico language in the middle of her self-introduction. Gesture: hands appointed half, and it pointed to Eva
Reason: It meant inviting Eva to use full English on her self-introduction
Minute: 52:36
Situation: Eva introduced herself at NLC class using ineloquent English
Gesture: Hands folded, mouth clenched, and eyes glared
Reason: It showed that Fischer tried to hold his anger because of Eva’s low English ability

Minute: 52:43
Situation: Eva finished her self-introduction at NLC class using full English, and she told to her classmates that she took English course because her boss wanted her to speak English when she was caring for baby
Gesture: Right hand laid in left chest, and body bent
Reason: Fischer’s gestures meant that he concerned about the future of child which are being cared by Eva especially on her language skills
The discussion of metacommentary type 4 deliberately limited to gesture used by Fischer to Eva’s self-introduction at NLC class. It was done due to the limited time when doing analysis. Furthermore, there were four gestures used by Fischer on Eva’s self-introduction, and it can be seen on table 4. They were employed to show non-verbal expression which was used to strengthen Fischer’s utterances. In this case, gestures were translated based on speakers’ culture, where speakers used them, or based on general understanding between speakers and interlocutors.

### Table 5 Metacommentary type 5- comments on clothing, appearance

| No | Metacommentary Type 5- comments on clothing, appearance | Minute | Situation | Conversation |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------|--------|-----------|--------------|
| 1  | the gentleman                                          | 53:48 to 53:56 | Fischer asked Laurent to introduce himself at NLC class | Fischer: Moving on... **the gentleman** from France
Laurent: Hello My name is Laurent...French... |
| 2  | the lady in the gorgeous Sari.                         | 54:32 to 54:36 | Fischer asked Sashi to introduce herself | Fischer: And now **the lady in the gorgeous sari**...
Fischer: Sit...
Sashi: Sit and talk? I Shashi...from the India |

**the gentleman** was used by Fischer because Laurent is physically handsome.

**the lady in the gorgeous sari**... was used by Fisher to compliment her beautiful *sari* (India traditional dress). He also used this utterance to improve Sashi’s self-confidence because she was late at her first class, and she looked nervous.

Metacommentary type 5-comments on clothing appearance appeared twice in minutes 53: 48 to 53:56 and 54:32 to 54:36. It emerged because of real physical appearance of interlocutor which was
handsome as seen on datum 1 on table 5; and because of real good clothing appearance as seen on datum 2, Sashi’s sari (traditional cloth of India). However, metacommentary type 5 was also used to improve self-confidence of interlocutor.

Tabel 6. Metacommentary type 6-Irony

| No | Metacommentary Type 6-Irony | Minute | Situation | Conversation |
|----|-----------------------------|--------|-----------|-------------|
| 1  | Let’s pray for the baby’s future. Shall we? | 52:00 to 52:44 | Fischer responded Eva’s self-introduction | Eva: ...I Eva... I...come...Mexico... I work like nanny. I work like nanny... to American family. I speak Spanish... the baby...speak Spanish. The baby mama so worry baby no speak English. She say to me...go...English class... I... go... English class! Fischer: Eva my darling... let’s pray for the baby’s future, shall we? |

Eva my darling...let’s pray for the baby’s future, shall we? was Fischer’s response to Eva’s self-introduction, and it was in the form of irony.

Metacommentary 6 type found on minute 52:00 to 52:44 when Eva finished her self-introduction. It can be categorized as irony because it contained other meaning except praying for baby’s future, but it was a satire for Eva because she had low English ability, and he worried about baby’s future in understanding English.

**Conclusion**

There are two conclusions of this study. First, there were six types of metacommentary found on Fischer’s utterances at NLC class namely metacommentary type 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6. Second, each types of metacommentary which was found Fischer’s utterances had different reason. Metacommentary type 1 appeared as reminder for interlocutors, so they will use correct English because they were
learning English. Metacommentary type 2 appeared as correction for interlocutors’ utterance; as a result, they must follow Fischer’s right utterance. Metacommentary type 3 as minimizer of bad effect which may happen because Fischer gave comment to Eva’s English ability. Metacommentary type 4 used as strengthener to support Fisher’s utterances; consequently, interlocutors knew that Fischer was serious. Metacommentary type 5 utilized as compliment for real good appearance or physical of interlocutors and as a support for interlocutors, so they will have confidence in using English. Metacommentary type 6 used as satire for interlocutors and as worry for baby who was raised by Eva.

References
Creese, Angela., Takhi, Jaspreet Kaur., & Blackledge, Adrian. 2015. Metacommentary in Linguistics Ethnography, in Julia Snell., Sara Shaw., & Fiona Copland (Eds), Linguistic Ethnography: Interdisciplinary Explorations (pp.266-283). UK: Palgrave Macmillan.
Creswell, John W. 2010. Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. London: Sage Publication Ltd.
Leone-Pizzighella, Andrea., and Rymes, Besty. (2017). Gathering everyday metacommentary: A methodology to counteract institutional erasure, language & communication, retrieved 20 Mei 2019 from http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.langcom.2017.02.001.
Mahsun. 2012. Metode Penelitian Bahasa: Tahapan strategi, metode, dan tekniknya. Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada.
Rymes, B. 2014. Marking communicative repertoire through metacommentary, in Adrian Blackedge & Angela Creese (Eds), Heteroglossia as Practice and Pedagogy (pp. 301-316). Dordrecht: Springer Science.