Childhood cognitive ability accounts for associations between cognitive ability and brain cortical thickness in old age

Citation for published version:
Karama, S, Bastin, ME, Murray, C, Royle, NA, Penke, L, Munoz-Maniega, S, Gow, AJ, Corley, J, Valdés Hernández, M, Lewis, JD, Rousseau, M-E, Lepage, C, Fonov, V, Collins, DL, Booth, T, Rioux, P, Sherif, T, Adalat, R, Starr, JM, Evans, AC, Wardlaw, JM & Deary, IJ 2014, 'Childhood cognitive ability accounts for associations between cognitive ability and brain cortical thickness in old age' Molecular Psychiatry, vol 19, no. 5, pp. 555-559. DOI: 10.1038/mp.2013.64

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):
10.1038/mp.2013.64

Link:
Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version:
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Published In:
Molecular Psychiatry

Publisher Rights Statement:
This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.

General rights
Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy
The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Childhood cognitive ability accounts for associations between cognitive ability and brain cortical thickness in old age

S Karama1,2, ME Bastin3,4,5, C Murray6, NA Royle3,4,5, L Penke4,5,6, S Muñoz Maniega3,4,5, AJ Gow4,6, J Corley6, MDelC Valdés Hernández3,4,5, JD Lewis1, M-E Rousseau1, C Lepage1, V Fonov1, DL Collins1, T Booth4,6, P Rioux1, T Sherif1, R Adalat1, JM Starr6,7, AC Evans1, JM Wardlaw3,4,5 and IJ Deary4,6

Associations between brain cortical tissue volume and cognitive function in old age are frequently interpreted as suggesting that preservation of cortical tissue is the foundation of successful cognitive aging. However, this association could also, in part, reflect a lifelong association between cognitive ability and cortical tissue. We analyzed data on 588 subjects from the Lothian Birth Cohort 1936 who had intelligence quotient (IQ) scores from the same cognitive test available at both 11 and 70 years of age as well as high-resolution brain magnetic resonance imaging data obtained at approximately 73 years of age. Cortical thickness was estimated at 81,924 sampling points across the cortex for each subject using an automated pipeline. Multiple regression was used to assess associations between cortical thickness and the IQ measures at 11 and 70 years. Childhood IQ accounted for more than two-thirds of the association between IQ at 70 years and cortical thickness measured at age 73 years. This warns against ascribing a causal interpretation to the association between cognitive ability and cortical tissue in old age based on assumptions about, and exclusive reference to, the aging process and any associated disease. Without early-life measures of cognitive ability, it would have been tempting to conclude that preservation of cortical thickness in old age is a foundation for successful cognitive aging when, instead, it is a lifelong association. This being said, results should not be construed as meaning that all studies on aging require direct measures of childhood IQ, but as suggesting that proxy measures of prior cognitive function can be useful to take into consideration.

Molecular Psychiatry advance online publication, 4 June 2013; doi:10.1038/mp.2013.64

Keywords: cognitive ability; cognitive aging; cortical thickness; intelligence; IQ

INTRODUCTION

Understanding human cognitive aging is one of the greatest scientific challenges to society today. A better understanding of why people age differently with respect to cognitive function requires research on the aging brain. Various structural and functional aspects of the brain have been associated with cognitive function at different stages in life, and prominent among these is cortical thickness. However, especially in old age, it is difficult to establish a clear causal connection between cortical thickness and cognitive function. It is certainly possible that retaining cortical thickness is a foundation for successful cognitive aging. Indeed, many researchers showing brain–cognitive ability associations in old age will offer this interpretation of their results. Nevertheless, there are other possibilities, including the major confound of a long-standing trait association between cognitive ability and cortical thickness across the lifespan.

One way to disambiguate these possibilities is to test the association between brain cortical thickness and cognitive ability in old age with either variable also available from a much younger age. Obviously, magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) data from youth is not available for elderly subjects. We therefore examined the association between cortical thickness and cognitive ability in a large sample of community-dwelling older people. This is the Lothian Birth Cohort 1936 (LBC1936), in whom data from the same well-validated Moray House Test (MHT) of general cognitive ability (intelligence) are available in both youth (~11 years) and older age (~70 years). In addition, because these subjects were all born in the same year and were MRI scanned at almost the same age (~73 years), the data does not suffer from the confounding effect that large differences in chronological age can have on the association between brain structure and cognitive ability.

To examine the hypothesis that the lifetime-stable trait of intelligence may be related to later life brain structure, we first tested for any cross-sectional association between cortical thickness and intelligence in old age. We then tested for associations between cortical thickness in old age and the same subject’s intelligence measured in youth. Next, we examined the cross-sectional association between cortical thickness and intelligence in old age after covarying for intelligence from youth. Any cross-sectional cortical thickness–intelligence association in old age remaining after adjusting for intelligence in youth would provide rarely available evidence for a contribution of...
cortical thickness to age-related cognitive changes. On the other hand, if the cross-sectional cortical thickness–intelligence association is substantially attenuated or disappears after adjusting for childhood intelligence, it could indicate that the brain–intelligence association in old age reflects a lifelong impact of cortical thickness on cognitive functions; intelligence in childhood influences neurodevelopmental processes, including into old age (reverse causation); or lifelong associations behind cortical thickness and intelligence are due to shared causes.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Sample
Participants were all born in 1936 and are members of the LBC1936. At approximately 11 years of age, participants were tested on the MHT No. 12 of general cognitive ability in the Scottish Mental Survey of 1947 (SMS1947). Recruitment and retesting, including on the MHT, of surviving members of the SMS1947 from the Edinburgh area began in 2004 (Wave One testing), with 1091 eventually comprising the final sample. Starting in 2007 (hereinafter referred to as Wave Two), 866 of these subjects were invited to have a detailed structural brain MRI scan.

From a total of 866 Wave Two participants, 732 consented to MRI scanning, with 666 undergoing structural brain imaging of high enough resolution for adequate cortical thickness estimates. Of these, five individuals were excluded because of a Mini-Mental State Examination score of less than 24 or a history of dementia. A further 39 subjects did not have an age-11 intelligence quotient (IQ) score or age-70 IQ score, and 2 more subjects were removed because their age-11 IQ was more than 3 standard deviations below their age-70 IQ (that is, their age-11 IQ was between 42 and 44 but their age-70 IQ was above 100), suggesting some form of error. From the remaining subjects, 32 failed visual quality control of the gray and white matter surfaces (see image processing section for further details), leaving a final sample size of 588 (280 females/308 males) with a mean age ± s.d. of 72 years and 8 months ± 8.8 months at the time of imaging (referred to as age 73 years). For this sample, the mean age of testing for age-11 IQ was 10 years and 11.2 months ± 3.3 months, whereas the mean age of testing for age-70 IQ was 69 years and 6.2 months ± 10 months.

Cognitive testing
The MHT is a reliable test of general cognitive ability comprising items aimed at assessing language comprehension, verbal and non-verbal reasoning, spatial ability and simple calculations. Here, age-adjusted MHT raw scores were used to derive IQ-type scores (mean = 100, s.d. = 15). MHT-derived IQ scores have high concurrent validity with ‘gold-standard’ tests of intelligence such as the Stanford-Binet in childhood and old age and Wechsler Adult Intelligence Scale–III in old age.

Whereas the MHT is sensitive to age decline, it is likely to be less subject to it than some memory function tests well known for their age sensitivity. Given this and the 3-year gap between MRI scanning at age 73 years and IQ testing at age 70 years, all analyses were replicated using a measure of memory function at age 73 years derived from known age-sensitive subtests of the third edition of the Wechsler Memory Scale (for further details, see section 1 of Supplementary Information).

MRI acquisition protocol
All MRI data were acquired using a GE Signa Horizon HDxt 1.5T clinical scanner (General Electric, Milwaukee, WI, USA) equipped with a self-shielding gradient set (33 mT m−1 maximum gradient strength) and manufacturer supplied eight-channel phased-array head coil. The examination comprised a high-resolution whole-brain T1-weighted (T1W) volume sequence acquired in the coronal plane; for full details of the complete LBC1936 MRI protocol, see Wardlaw et al. In brief, the T1W volume scan was acquired with a field of view of 256 × 256 mm², an acquisition matrix of 192 × 192 (zero-filled to 256 × 256) and 160 contiguous 1.3-mm thick slices giving a final voxel dimension of 1 × 1 × 1.3 mm³. The repetition, echo and inversion times were 10, 4 and 500 ms, respectively. To allow accurate measurement of the intracranial volume, slices were carefully placed to cover the complete intracranial contents from above the skull vertex to the upper cervical spine below the foramen magnum.

RESULTS

An extensive pattern of distributed, significant associations was observed between age-73 cortical thickness and age-70 IQ. There were significant associations in bilateral ventrolateral prefrontal areas, insular, cingulate and lateral occipital cortices as well as in regions of the temporal lobe including the planum temporale and parahippocampal gyri (Figure 1a; see Supplementary Figure 1A for results corrected for IQ range restriction). Recessing age-11 IQ against age-73 cortical thickness revealed a very similarly
distributed pattern of significant associations (Figure 1b; see Supplementary Figure 1B for results corrected for IQ range restriction). In keeping with previous reports,4,5 significant associations between cortical thickness and IQ were in the small to medium range of effect sizes, depending on the exact cortical location. The uncorrected Pearson correlation ranges were: 0.11–0.30 for age-11 IQ and 0.10–0.30 for age-70 IQ. However, the corrected (for range restriction) Pearson correlation ranges were: 0.15–0.40 for age-70 IQ and 0.15–0.41 for age-11 IQ. See Supplementary Table 1 for a list of significant correlations and their associated regions.

Repeating the analysis between age-73 cortical thickness and age-70 IQ with age-11 IQ as a covariate left no significant associations (Figure 1c). Within regions where there was an observed association between age-73 cortical thickness and age-70 IQ, a mean of 67.8% (mean value across the cortex) of this association was accounted for by age-11 IQ (Figure 2).

Findings for age-73 memory function mirrored those observed for age-70 IQ. Here too, repeating the analysis between age-73 cortical thickness and age-73 memory function after controlling for age-11 IQ left no significant associations. Further, within regions where there was an observed association between age-73 cortical thickness and age-73 memory function, a mean of 60.9% (mean value across the cortex) of this association was accounted for by age-11 IQ (see Supplementary Figures 2 and 3).

The patterns of age-70 and age-11 IQ associations with cortical thickness were similar, for both males and females, to those observed for the group as a whole. After accounting for multiple comparisons, associations were found to be significant only in males. Importantly, there were no significant ‘Gender by age-70 IQ’ or ‘Gender by age-11 IQ’ interactions anywhere on the cortex.

The Pearson correlation between MHT-derived IQ scores at age-11 and age-70 was 0.68 ($P<0.001$; the correlation between MHT-derived IQ scores at age-11 and memory function at age-73 was 0.51 ($P<0.001$)). In light of such a high correlation, it may appear unavoidable that these variables will produce similar cortical thickness maps. However, this is far from the case as such correlations indicate that there is substantial unshared variance between the variables. See section 3 of Supplementary Information for results of a simulation where normally distributed noise was added to age-70 IQ in order to generate a variable that correlates 0.68 with age-70 IQ. In contrast to age-11 IQ, the simulated variable showed no association with cortical thickness. Further, controlling for the simulated variable did not remove
atrophy, those with a thicker cortex may have more time until dementia is associated with widespread and progressive cortical thinning in old age.28 Indeed, as dementia is associated with widespread and progressive cortical atrophy,28 those with a thicker cortex may have more time until cortical thinning has progressed to such an extent that efficient cognitive processing becomes significantly attenuated.

There are plausible reasons for having age-11 IQ substantially accounting for the association between IQ and brain cortical thickness in old age:

First, there is the possibility of a lifetime association between the traits, partly via genetic factors. Given the heritability of cortical thickness,29 this would be compatible with results from recent genome-wide association studies, which show that genetic factors affecting intelligence in childhood also affect intelligence in old age.30 Thus, it is possible that genes influence initial cortical growth and its maintenance across life in areas relevant for cognitive ability differences. This would be in keeping with a previous report showing that children and adolescents with average IQ have a different cortical thickness developmental trajectory than those with high IQ.31 Less directly, it is also possible that genetic factors may be responsible for a lifetime confounding effect if the same genes affect both cortical thickness and cognitive ability via a third factor or set of factors.

Second, it could be speculated that the association between childhood IQ and cortical thickness in old age is present because individuals with high IQ tend to keep more intellectually and physically active throughout life than those with lower IQ. This form of reverse causation is compatible with findings of increases in local cortical gray matter volume and thickness secondary to the practice of given tasks31–34 and with the fact that people with a higher IQ tend to stay in school longer.35 Here too, however, a confounding effect is possible, potentially brought about by, for instance, environmental, including intrauterine, factors that influence both cortical thickness and IQ.

Finally, it is possible, of course, that different effects coexist and that there is a set of reciprocal, dynamic associations between cortical thickness and IQ. For example, greater cortical thickness may lead to greater IQ, which, in turn, may foster an increased propensity for stimulating activities and corollary cortical growth. Similarly, a higher IQ may be associated with healthier lifestyle choices and better understanding of and regard for health messages and the consequent avoidance of risk factors resulting in better maintenance of brain structure and, hence, cognition in old age. The end results of these types of dynamic feedback loops could be a developmental trajectory leading to a thicker cortex in old age for those having a higher IQ in childhood.

Our results do not apply to subjects with incipient dementia, in whom cortical loss is known to be accelerated. The MRI scans and measures of old age cognitive ability were acquired 3 years apart. Although this could result in changes in cognitive ability that are not accounted for, the availability of data from the same cognitive test across a gap of almost 60 years as well as the similarity of findings for age-73 memory function, estimated at the same age as scanning, greatly outweigh this concern; these data therefore provide a rare opportunity to examine changes in cognitive ability across most of the human lifespan. Further strengths of the study, all of which contributed to high statistical power and robust estimates of effects, include: a large sample of socioeconomically blinded quality-controlled imaging and cognitive assessment methods; and participants who were all scanned at the same age, thereby minimizing the confounding effect of chronological age differences.

Understanding associations between brain structure and cognitive function are crucial for addressing life course changes in cognitive ability. The present study demonstrates a long-standing association, accounting for what might otherwise have seemed like a compelling association within old age.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The authors declare no conflict of interest.
Acknowledgements
This research has been made possible by the use of computing resources provided by Compute/Calcul Canada. We thank the LBC1936 participants; Caroline Brett, Michelle Taylor and Caroline Cameron for data collection; the LBC1936 Study Secretary, Paula Davies; and the nurses, radiographers and other staff at the Wellcome Trust Clinical Research Facility, Edinburgh (http://www.wtctr.ed.ac.uk). This work was supported by a Research into Ageing programme grant (to I.J.D. and J.M.S.) and the Age UK-funded Disconnected Mind project (http://www.disconnectedmind.ed.ac.uk; to I.J.D., J.M.S. and J.M.W.). With additional funding from the UK Medical Research Council (to I.J.D., J.M.S., J.M.W. and M.E.B.). J.M.W. is supported by the Scottish Funding Council through the SINAPSE Collaboration (http://www.sinapse.ac.uk). S.K. is supported by the Fonds de la Recherche en Sante du Quebec. Imaging was performed at the Brain Research Imaging Centre, University of Edinburgh (http://www.bric.ed.ac.uk), a centre in the SINAPSE Collaboration. The work was undertaken within The University of Edinburgh Centre for Cognitive Ageing and Cognitive Epidemiology (http://www.ccace.ed.ac.uk), part of the cross council Lifelong Health within The University of Edinburgh Centre for Cognitive Ageing and Cognitive Epidemiology (http://www.ccace.ed.ac.uk), part of the cross council Lifelong Health and Wellbeing Initiative (G0700704/84698). Funding from the UK Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council, Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council, Economic and Social Research Council, and the Medical Research Council is gratefully acknowledged. We thank Paul Redmond for his technical assistance.

References
1 Deary IJ, Penke L, Johnson W. The neuroscience of human intelligence differences. Nat Rev Neurosci 2010; 11: 201-211.
2 Narr KL, Woods RP, Thompson PM, Szeszko P, Robinson D, Dimtcheva T et al. Relationships between IQ and regional cortical gray matter thickness in healthy adults. Cerebral Cortex 2007; 17: 2163-2171.
3 Karama S, Colom R, Johnson W, Deary IJ, Haier R, Weber DP et al. Cortical thickness correlates of specific cognitive performance accounted for by the general factor of intelligence in healthy children aged 6 to 18. Neuroimage 2011; 55: 1443-1453.
4 Karama S, Ad-Dabagh Y, Haier RJ, Deary IJ, Lyttelton OC, Lepege C et al. Positive association between cognitive ability and cortical thickness in a representative US sample of healthy 6 to 18 year-olds. Intelligence 2009; 37: 145-155.
5 Shaw P, Greenstein D, Lerch J, Clasen L, Lenroot RK, Gogtay N et al. Intellectual ability and cortical development in children and adolescents. Nature 2006; 440: 676-679.
6 Choi YY, Shamosh NA, Cho SH, DeYoung CG, Lee MJ, Lee JM et al. Multiple bases of human intelligence revealed by cortical thickness and neural activation. J Neurosci 2006; 28: 10323-10329.
7 Kaup AR, Mirzakhani H,Jeste DJ, Eyler LT. A review of the brain structure correlates of successful cognitive aging. J NeuropsychiatryClin Neurosci 2011; 23: 6-15.
8 Salthouse TA. Neuroanatomical substrates of age-related cognitive decline. Psychol Bull 2011; 137: 753-784.
9 Deary IJ, Gow AJ, Taylor MD, Corley J, Brett C, Wilson V et al. The Lothian Birth Cohort 1936: a study to examine influences on cognitive ageing from age 11 to age 70 and beyond. BMC Geriatr 2007; 7: 28.
10 Deary IJ, Gow AJ, Pattie A, Starr JM. The Lothian Birth Cohorts of 1921 and 1936. Int J Epidemiol 2012; 41: 1576-1584.
11 Wardlaw JM, Bastin ME, Valdes Hernandez MC, Maniega SM, Royle NA, Morris Z et al. Brain aging, cognition in youth and old age and vascular disease in the Lothian Birth Cohort 1936: rationale, design and methodology of the imaging protocol. Int J Stroke 2013; 6: 547-559.
12 Gow AJ, Johnson W, Pattie A, Brett CE, Roberts B, Starr JM et al. Stability and change in intelligence from age 11 to ages 70, 79, and 87: the Lothian Birth Cohorts of 1921 and 1936. Psychol Aging 2011; 26: 232-240.
13 Deary IJ, Whalley LJ, Starr JM. A Lifetime of Intelligence: Follow-up Studies of the Scottish Mental Surveys of 1932 and 1947. American Psychological Association: Washington, 2009.
14 Scottish Council for Research in Education. The Trend of Scottish Intelligence: A Comparison of the 1947 and 1932 Surveys of the Intelligence of Eleven-Year-Old Pupils. University of London Press Ltd: London, 1949.
15 Folstein MF, Folstein SE, McHugh PR. “Mini-mental state”. A practical method for grading the cognitive state of patients for the clinician. J Psychiatr Res 1975; 12: 189-198.
16 Deary IJ, Johnson W, Starr JM. Are processing speed tasks biomarkers of cognitive aging? Psychol Aging 2010; 25: 219-228.
17 Wechsler D. WMS-III (UK) Administration and Scoring Manual. 3rd edn (The Psychological Corporation: London, UK, 1998.
18 Frisoni GB, Redolfi A, Manset D, Rousseau ME, Toga A, Evans AC. Virtual imaging laboratories for marker discovery in neurodegenerative diseases. Nat Rev Neurosci 2011; 7: 429-438.
19 Genovese CR, Lazar NA, Nichols T. Thresholding of statistical maps in functional neuroimaging using the false discovery rate. Neuroimage 2002; 15: 870-878.
20 Wiberg M, Sundström A. A comparison of two approaches to correction of restriction of range in correlation analysis. Pract Assess Res Eval 2009; 14: 1-9.
21 Jung RE, Haier RJ. The Piaget-Frontal Integration Theory (P-FIT) of intelligence: Converging neuroimaging evidence. Behav Brain Sci 2007; 30: 135-154.
22 Nelson HE. National Adult Readability Test. NFER-Nelson: Windsor, UK, 1982.
23 Nelson HE, O’Connell A. The Revised National Adult Reading Test-Test Manual. NFER-Nelson: Windsor, UK, 1991.
24 McGumn B, Starr JM, Topfer JA, Pattie A, Whiteman MC, Lemmon HA et al. Pronunciation of irregular words is preserved in dementia, validating premorbid IQ estimation. Neurology 2006; 62: 1184-1186.
25 Bright P, Jaldow E, Kopelman MD. The National Adult Reading Test as a measure of premorbid intelligence: a comparison with estimates derived from demographic variables. J Int Neuropsychol Soc 2002; 8: 847-854.
26 Salat DH, Buchner RL, Snyder AZ, Greve DN, Desikan RS, Busa E et al. thinning of the cerebral cortex in aging. Cerebral Cortex 2004; 14: 721-730.
27 McGumn B, Deary IJ, Starr JM. Childhood cognitive ability and risk of late-onset Alzheimer and vascular dementia. Neurology 2008; 71: 1051-1056.
28 Archer HA, Kennedy J, Barnes J, Pepple T, Boys R, Randlesome K et al. Memory complaints and increased rates of brain atrophy: risk factors for mild cognitive impairment and Alzheimer’s disease. Int J Geriatr Psychiatry 2010; 25: 1119-1126.
29 Lenroot RK, Schnitt JE, Ordaz SJ, Wallace GL, Neale MC, Lerch JP et al. Differences in genetic and environmental influences on the human cerebral cortex associated with development during childhood and adolescence. Hum Brain Mapp 2009; 30: 163-174.
30 Deary IJ, Yang J, Davies G, Harris SE, Tenesa A, Liewald D et al. Genetic contributions to stability and change in intelligence from childhood to old age. Nature 2012; 482: 212-215.
31 Haier RJ, Karama S, Leyba L, Jung RE. MRI assessment of cortical thickness and functional activity changes in adolescent girls following three months of practice on a visual-spatial task. BMC Res Notes 2009; 2: 174.
32 Taubert M, Draganski B, Anwander A, Muller K, Horstmann A, Villringer A et al. Dynamic properties of human brain structure: learning-related changes in cortical areas and associated fiber connections. J Neurosci 2010; 30: 11670-11677.
33 Draganski B, Gaser C, Busch V, Schueier G, Bogdahn U, May A. Neurplasticity: changes in grey matter induced by training. Nature 2004; 427: 311-312.
34 Engvig A, Fjell AM, Westlye LT, Moberget T, Sundseth O, Larsen VA et al. Effects of memory training on cortical thickness in the elderly. Neuroimage 2010; 52: 1667-1676.
35 Johnson W, Deary U, Iacono WG. Genetic and Environmental Transitions Underlying Educational Attainment. Intelligence 2009; 37: 466-478.

Supplementary Information accompanies the paper on the Molecular Psychiatry website (http://www.nature.com/mp)