TOWARD THE CHIRAL LIMIT OF QCD:
Quenched and Dynamical Domain Wall Fermions

PING CHEN, NORMAN CHRIST, GEORGE FLEMING, ADRIAN KAELYER, CATALIN MALUREANU,
ROBERT MAWINNEY, GABRIELE SIEGERT, CHENGZHONG SUI, YURI ZHESTKOV

Department of Physics, Columbia University, New York, NY 10027

PAVLOS VRANAS

Physics Dept., University of Illinois, Urbana, IL 61801

A serious difficulty in conventional lattice field theory calculations is the coupling between the chiral and continuum limits. With both staggered and Wilson fermions, the chiral limit cannot be realized without first taking the limit of vanishing lattice spacing. In this talk, we report on extensive studies of the domain wall formulation of lattice fermions, which avoids this difficulty at the expense of requiring that fermion propagators be computed in five dimensions. A variety of results will be described for quenched and dynamical simulations at both zero and finite temperature. Conclusions about the benefits of this new method and some new practical and attractive method for large-scale numerical calculation. There has now been considerable exploratory numerical work suggesting that this method lives up to its promise for both the Schwinger model and quenched QCD and that fermion zero-modes with the desired properties are realized.

We will describe these issues in somewhat more detail in Section 2 below and then describe a series of calculations underway on the recently completed computers at Columbia (8,196-nodes 0.4Tflops) and the RIKEN Brookhaven Research Center (12,288-nodes, 0.6Tflops). These calculations are designed to i) establish the extent to which zero-mode effects can be seen in practical simulations with fifth-dimension extent \( L_s \approx 10 \) (Section 3), ii) study the chiral symmetry of quenched QCD with careful control over the effects of \( L_s \), examining both the hadron spectrum and the chiral condensate (Section 3 and iii) explore QCD thermodynamics using domain wall fermions both as a probe of the properties of the pure gauge theory and as a method to realize complete flavor symmetry in a lattice study of the full QCD phase transition. This final calculation represents the best-controlled approach yet available to examine the role of the axial anomaly in the full QCD, chiral phase transition.

2 Domain Wall Fermions

2.1 Formulation

Our formulation of domain wall fermions follows closely that proposed by Shamir and provides a practical and attractive method for large-scale numerical calculation. There has now been considerable exploratory numerical work suggesting that this method lives up to its promise for both the Schwinger model and quenched QCD and that fermion zero-modes with the desired properties are realized.

We will describe these issues in somewhat more detail in Section 2 below and then describe a series of calculations underway on the recently completed computers at Columbia (8,196-nodes 0.4Tflops) and the RIKEN Brookhaven Research Center (12,288-nodes, 0.6Tflops). These calculations are designed to i) establish the extent to which zero-mode effects can be seen in practical simulations with fifth-dimension extent \( L_s \approx 10 \) (Section 3), ii) study the chiral symmetry of quenched QCD with careful control over the effects of \( L_s \), examining both the hadron spectrum and the chiral condensate (Section 3 and iii) explore QCD thermodynamics using domain wall fermions both as a probe of the properties of the pure gauge theory and as a method to realize complete flavor symmetry in a lattice study of the full QCD phase transition. This final calculation represents the best-controlled approach yet available to examine the role of the axial anomaly in the full QCD, chiral phase transition.

2 Domain Wall Fermions

2.1 Formulation

Our formulation of domain wall fermions follows closely that proposed by Shamir and providing a practical and attractive method for large-scale numerical calculation. There has now been considerable exploratory numerical work suggesting that this method lives up to its promise for both the Schwinger model and quenched QCD and that fermion zero-modes with the desired properties are realized.

We will describe these issues in somewhat more detail in Section 2 below and then describe a series of calculations underway on the recently completed computers at Columbia (8,196-nodes 0.4Tflops) and the RIKEN Brookhaven Research Center (12,288-nodes, 0.6Tflops). These calculations are designed to i) establish the extent to which zero-mode effects can be seen in practical simulations with fifth-dimension extent \( L_s \approx 10 \) (Section 3), ii) study the chiral symmetry of quenched QCD with careful control over the effects of \( L_s \), examining both the hadron spectrum and the chiral condensate (Section 3 and iii) explore QCD thermodynamics using domain wall fermions both as a probe of the properties of the pure gauge theory and as a method to realize complete flavor symmetry in a lattice study of the full QCD phase transition. This final calculation represents the best-controlled approach yet available to examine the role of the axial anomaly in the full QCD, chiral phase transition.
the site from which the corresponding link extends in the positive $\mu^{th}$ direction. These link variables enter the Wilson gauge action in the usual way. The new features of the domain wall treatment appear in the fermion action. Here the fermion field, $\psi(n,s)$ is 4-spinor and 3-component color vector as usual but now depends on both the normal lattice coordinate $n$ and a new fifth coordinate $s$, lying in the range $0 \leq s \leq L_s - 1$. The action takes the form:

$$A_{\text{DW}} = \sum_{n,s,s',s''} \bar{\psi}(n,s)\{(D_W)_{n,n'}\delta_{s,s'} + m_0$$

$$+(D_5)_{s,s'}\delta_{n,n'}\}\psi(n',s')$$

(1)

Here $D_W$ is the usual Wilson Dirac operator:

$$(D_W)_{n,n'} = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\mu} \{(1 + \gamma^\mu)U(n)_{\mu}\delta_{n,n'} - \mu$$

$$+(1 - \gamma^\mu)U(n')_{\mu}\delta_{n,n'+\mu} - 2\delta_{n,n'}\},$$

$m_0$ the Wilson mass (but with an unconventional negative sign), and $D_5$ an additional fifth-dimension piece, diagonal in color:

$$(D_5)_{s,s'} = \frac{1}{2} \{(1 + \gamma^5)\delta_{s,s'-1} + (1 - \gamma^5)\delta_{s,s'+1} - 2$$

$$-m_f(1 - \gamma^5)\delta_{s,0}\delta_{s',L_s-1}$$

$$-m_f(1 + \gamma^5)\delta_{s,L_s-1}\delta_{s',0}\}.$$  

(3)

The combination of the boundaries at $s = 0$ and $s = L_s - 1$ and the negative Wilson mass, $-m_0$, allows unusual massless boundary states to form, localized on the $s = 0$ and $s = L_s - 1$ four-dimensional boundaries of the five-dimensional problem. The result is two types of states, decaying exponentially as one moves away from 0 or $L_s - 1$: massless, right-handed particles bound to the right-hand wall and massless, left-handed particles bound to the left-hand wall. The mixing between these two boundary states, given by the small overlap of the exponentially decreasing 5-dimensional wave functions, implies that these states will actually form a massive four-component fermion. They will become literally massless only in the limit of infinite separation between the walls, $L_s \to \infty$, a limit in which this exponentially small overlap vanishes.

The extra mass term with coefficient $m_f$ in Eq. [3] explicitly couples the right and left walls and gives these boundary states an additional mass proportional to $m_f$. This extra term provides an explicit mass which is easily adjusted in contrast to the overlap-induced mass whose dependence on $L_s$ is not so precisely known. We will attempt to choose $L_s$ and $m_f$ so that the effects of the mixing are much smaller than those of $m_f$, so the mass of the domain-wall states is explicitly proportional to $m_f$.

### 2.2 Chiral Symmetry

The domain wall fermion formulation described above should become a theory of massless fermions in the limit $L_s \to \infty$. This is easy to see in the free field case and can be argued to be true for the interacting theory as well.

Heuristically, we observe that if the gauge coupling is sufficiently small, the relevant gauge configurations will be smooth on the lattice scale and interact primarily with the low-energy, domain wall states in exactly the fashion of four-dimensional QCD. Of course, the extent to which this is actually true in a particular calculation for a specific value of $L_s$, must be studied numerically.

In the usual Wilson formulation of lattice fermions, the axial part of the underlying $SU(N_f) \times SU(N_f)$ flavor symmetry is strongly broken by the dimension-five, “Wilson term” added to make the doublers heavy. A chiral theory is expected to be found in the low energy portion of the theory provided the mass-related hopping parameter $\kappa$ is tuned to its critical value. However, in practice, the effects of this Wilson term have been so large as to obscure the character of the chiral phase transition and to serious impede the extraction of a variety of weak matrix elements whose efficient calculation requires the use of chiral symmetry.

The staggered fermion formulation preserves a single chiral symmetry, making the chiral phase transition much easier to simulate. However, this approach contains lattice artifacts which break the normal vector flavor symmetries making many quantities more difficult to interpret than in the Wilson formulation.

Both the Wilson and staggered formulations of lattice fermions are expected to show full, physical flavor symmetry only as the continuum limit is approached. In contrast, $N_f$ species of domain wall fermions, as formulated above, support a complete $SU(N_f) \times SU(N_f)$ flavor symmetry which becomes exact in the possibly much less demanding $L_s \to \infty$ limit.

### 2.3 Index Theorem on the Lattice

An important part of the relativistic quantum physics of fermions is the axial anomaly which is required for proper understanding of the $\pi^0 \to \gamma \gamma$ decay, the $\eta'$ mass and the order of the QCD phase transition. With both Wilson and staggered fermions, the symmetry generated by the anomalously non-conserved current is explicitly broken by order $a$ or order $a^2$ terms in the lattice fermion action. Thus, without a careful study of the limit of vanishing lattice spacing, $a \to 0$, one is unable to be certain whether a given anomalous effect results from a lattice artifact or will survive in the continuum limit.

Happily, this fundamental physical phenomena is also represented in a new and potentially more reliable
fashion by the domain wall fermion formulation. As developed by Narayanan and Neuberger, the domain wall formulation supports a variant of the Atiyah-Singer index theorem in the $L_s \to \infty$ limit, even for finite lattice spacing. In the continuum, this theorem relates the winding number of the gauge field background to the number of zero modes of the Dirac operator and provides the explicit mechanism for gauge field topology to effect the physics of quarks.

To understand the connection between gauge field topology and exact zero modes of the Dirac operator, for domain wall fermions one begins by viewing the five-dimensional fermion path integral in a fixed gauge background and for a fixed $L_s$ as representing both the determinant of $D_{DWF}$ and as a quantum mechanical expectation value of the transfer matrix $T_s$ for unit translation in the fifth dimension in the presence of the $s$-independent background gauge field:

$$Z(L_s) = \det \{ D_{DWF} \} = \langle 0 | T_s^L | 0 \rangle. \quad (4)$$

Here, the fermion state $|0\rangle$ is a particular four-dimensional fermionic state, determined by the boundary conditions with half of the available states filled. In the limit $L_s \to \infty$, the right-most factor of Eq. (4) projects onto the eigenstate of $T_s$ with the largest eigenvalue, $|0\rangle$. Thus, we can conclude that

$$\lim_{L_s \to \infty} \det \{ D_{DWF} \} \propto |\langle 0\rangle|^{-2} \quad (5)$$

The Dirac operator of our five dimensional formulation will then have exact zero modes whenever the states $|0\rangle$ and $|0\rangle'$ have a different number of occupied states (and are then, necessarily, orthogonal). This connection of exact Dirac zero modes with integers defined from the gauge fields is in close analogy to the continuum Atiyah-Singer theorem. In the continuum limit, such zero modes will correspond to topologically non-trivial gauge configurations. Furthermore, these zero modes should continue to exist as lattice corrections and quantum fluctuation are added.

In the next Section, we will examine the question of how large $L_s$ must be for these expected near-zero modes to be recognized.

3 Fermion Zero Modes

In order to investigate the degree to which expected fermion zero modes will actually be visible for finite $L_s$ and non-zero lattice spacing, we have looked for zero mode effects in the background of a discretized, instanton-like gauge field. We do this by evaluating the volume-averaged, chiral condensate as a function of the explicit quark mass, $m_f$. In the continuum, the chiral condensate is easily related to the spectrum of Dirac eigenvalues through the Banks-Casher formula:

$$\langle \bar{\psi}\psi \rangle = -m \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{\rho(\lambda, m) d\lambda}{\lambda^2 + m^2} \quad (6)$$

where $\rho(\lambda)$ is the density of Dirac eigenvalues corresponding to the gauge configuration or ensemble of configurations used to compute $\langle \bar{\psi}\psi \rangle$ and $m$ is the bare quark mass.

Eq. (6) implies that the presence of a zero mode, $\rho(\lambda) = Z\delta(\lambda) + ...$ implies a $Z/m$ divergence in $\langle \bar{\psi}\psi \rangle$ as $m$ approaches zero. Such zero-mode effects can be easily studied by computing $\langle \bar{\psi}\psi \rangle$ for a fixed gauge configuration, constructed to be close to a Belavin, Polyakov, Schwartz, Tyupkin instanton. Such a configuration will have an exact zero mode for the continuum Dirac operator. In Figure 1, we show $\langle \bar{\psi}\psi \rangle$ as a function of quark mass computed in this fixed, instanton-like background using the staggered Dirac operator. Instead of the desired $1/m_f$ divergence as $m_f \to 0$, one sees a weak inflection around $m_f \approx 10^{-2}$ suggesting that the lattice spacing has shifted the zero mode from zero to approximately this value. Even this weak signal essentially disappears if even 10% noise is superimposed on the original instanton-like background.

The behavior for the domain wall Dirac operator in this same background, shown in Figure 2, is dramatically different. There one sees the expected decrease in $\langle \bar{\psi}\psi \rangle$ as $m_f$ decreases, until $m_f \approx 2 \times 10^{-2}$, at which point a clear $1/m_f$ signal is seen, even for the curve corresponding to $L_s$ as small as 6. For finite $L_s$ this $1/m_f$ behavior is cut off and $\langle \bar{\psi}\psi \rangle$ becomes constant as $m_f$ falls below the residual mass introduced by direct mixing between the two overlapping domain wall states. As can be seen in the figure, this effect moves to much smaller $m$ as $L_s$ increases. Equally important, the appealing picture shown in Figure 2 changes very little as noise is superimposed on the instanton-like background solution.

Thus, it appears that the domain wall formulation will allow us to simulate fermions at fixed lattice spacing and not-too-large $L_s$ which show both the full $SU(2) \times SU(2)$ flavor/chiral symmetry and also the important connection between lattice topology and fermion zero-modes which underlies the physics of the axial anomaly.

4 QCD at Zero Temperature

4.1 Hadronic Spectrum

As our first test of these ideas we have carried out a series of careful, quenched calculations on small $8^4 \times 32$ lattices for a variety of values of $L_s$ and $m_f$. Using physical quark operators whose left- and right-handed components were obtained by evaluating the 5-dimensional fermion fields on the $s = 0$ and $s = L_s - 1$ hyperplanes,
we had little difficulty computing hadron masses following the usual methods. In Figure 3, we show the resulting \( \rho \) and nucleon masses, extrapolated to \( m_f = 0 \), as a function of \( L_s \). Although we have examined quite large domain wall separations, up to \( L_s = 48 \), it is clear from the figure, that we could have extracted accurate results from the smaller \( L_s = 10 \) or 16 calculations.

The corresponding \( L_s \) behavior of the pion mass is shown in Figure 4. In contrast to the case of the nucleon and the \( \rho \), we see significant dependence on \( L_s \), even at the largest values of \( L_s \). This contrast can be easily explained if we hypothesize that the largest effect of finite \( L_s \) is to give an additional \( L_s \)-dependent contribution to the quark mass. Such an effect will be much more visible for the very light pion than for the heavier \( \rho \) or nucleon. Using the observed \( m_f \) sensitivity (not shown here) of \( m_\rho \) and \( m_\pi \), one can conclude that the 100% change in \( m_\pi \) at \( m_f = 0 \) seen as \( L_s \) increases from 16 to 48, would amount to only a 4% effect on \( m_\rho \) at \( m_f = 0 \), an effect hidden by our errors. Of greater potential interest is the failure of \( m_\pi \) to vanish as \( L_s \to \infty \). While this may be a new feature of the quenched approximation made visible by the domain wall formalism, it is very likely a simple, finite-volume effect. This non-vanishing contribution to \( m_\pi \) is an appreciable fraction of \( m_\pi \) only for very small quark masses, \( m_f \approx 0.02 \). However, for such light quarks the product \( m_f \langle \psi \psi \rangle V = 0.02 \cdot 0.0019 \cdot 8^3 \times 32 = 0.7 \), a clear warning that the Goldstone phenomena will begin to be influenced by our finite \( 8^3 \times 32 \), space-time volume.
4.2 Chiral Condensate

Lacking the fermion determinant, the quenched approximation can potentially yield gauge configurations with small or vanishing Dirac eigenvalues. As was discussed in Section 3, such configurations could lead to an unphysical, $1/m$ divergence in the chiral condensate. However, such behavior could be easily suppressed by lattice artifacts for staggered fermions and may be reduced when “exceptional” configurations are discarded for Wilson fermions.

We have explicitly searched for such effects in a $\beta = 5.85$, quenched simulation and found them quite easily. Our results for a $8^3 \times 32$ lattice are shown in Figure 3. One sees a clearly $1/m$ divergence for small $m_f$. The $1/m_f$ coefficient is $3.8(3) \times 10^{-6}$. If this effect comes only from exact zero modes, whose number increases as $V^{1/2}$, we should expect this behavior to be less pronounced on larger volumes. In fact, a similar, $16^3 \times 32$ calculation also shows this $1/m_f$ behavior, but with a much smaller coefficient, $0.6(1) \times 10^{-6}$. Thus, while one should worry that conventional quenched chiral extrapolations do not allow for such behavior, this new effect may not be important for quenched calculations performed on large physical volumes.

5 QCD near $T_c$

Because of the importance of chiral symmetry for the QCD phase transition, one of the most interesting applications of domain wall fermions may be to studies of QCD thermodynamics.
Figure 6: The chiral condensate is plotted as a function of quark mass, computed using pure gauge configurations on a $16^3 \times 4$ lattice, just above the deconfining phase transition for $\beta = 5.71$. There is a new $1/m_f$ divergence visible for small mass as well as a non-zero constant piece in $\bar{\psi}\psi$. These appear to be new, volume-independent terms, first visible when domain wall fermions are used.

and 2.15, suggesting that we are seeing stable, 2-flavor behavior for $m_0 = 1.9$, although more study of this question is warranted.

Of special interest is the degree of chiral symmetry present on either side of this transition region. This is examined in Figure 8 where the limit $m_f \to 0$ is displayed using a series of full QCD calculation with quark masses $m_f = 0.06, 0.10, 0.14$ and 0.18. The domain wall formulation appears to have allowed a calculation, for the first time, in which a transition is seen between a phase with spontaneously broken chiral symmetry ($\beta = 5.20$) and one with what should be full, restored, $SU(2) \times SU(2)$ symmetry ($\beta = 5.45$). Calculations are now underway to study this system further, examining the properties of the QCD phase transition in greater detail for larger spatial volumes.

5.3 Anomalous Symmetry Breaking

As a final topic, we attempt to exploit the sensitivity of the domain wall fermion formulation to topological effects, and examine the degree of anomalous symmetry breaking slightly above the phase transition. The current results of this study are shown in Figure 9. We plot the difference of two screening masses, computed at $\beta = 5.40$, just above the transition region, evaluated on a $16^3 \times 4$ lattice, using $L_s = 16$ and $m_0 = 1.9$. Here we are subtracting the screening mass $m_5$, extracted from the exponential damping of correlation functions computed from the operator $(\bar{\psi}\tau\psi)(x)$, and $m_\pi$ computing using the operator $(i\bar{\psi}\gamma^5\psi)(x)$. The $2 \times 2$ matrices, $\tau$, are the usual Pauli, isospin generators.

Figure 7: The chiral condensate and Wilson line are plotted as a function of $\beta$. These values were obtained in a full QCD, $N_f = 2$, $m_f = 0.1$ calculation on an $8^3 \times 4$ lattice. Behavior characteristic of a phase transition with $\beta_c \approx 5.35$ is seen.

Figure 8: The chiral limit of the $\langle \bar{\psi}\psi \rangle$ in full, 2-flavor QCD for $L_s = 16$ and $m_0 = 1.9$. Shown are points below the transition, $\beta = 5.20$, $8^3 \times 4$ (squares) and points above the transition, $\beta = 5.45$, $8^3 \times 4$ (diamonds) and $16^3 \times 4$ (crosses).
Because the $\delta$ and $\pi$ correlation functions are related by the anomalous chiral symmetry, any difference between these two screening masses in the limit $m_f \to 0$, is an unambiguous measure of anomalous chiral symmetry breaking. Since these screening masses are both about 1 in lattice units, Figure 9 shows a small ($\approx 5\%$), but possibly significant effect. The present data, shown in the figure, give an intercept of 0.067(1.8) when fitted to the expected quadratic $m_f$ dependence. While we cannot be certain we have seen the sought-after evidence of anomalous symmetry breaking (the sort required to predict a second-order QCD phase transition), we can assert with confidence that the effect is quite small.

6 Conclusion

We have demonstrated that the domain wall formulation of lattice fermions can be used to study both zero temperature, quenched hadron spectroscopy and the QCD phase transition for both zero and two flavors. This new method appears to realize accurate chiral symmetry at fixed, non-zero lattice spacing, and does not require unreasonably large domain wall separation in the fifth dimension. This method offers a very promising new approach to the study of chiral symmetry using lattice methods.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported in part by the U.S. Department of Energy. One of us (G.S.) acknowledges the support of the Max Kade Foundation. We have benefited from discussions with a number of people included T. Blum, R. Edwards, R. Narayanan, H. Neuberger, and Y. Shamir.

References

1. D.B. Kaplan, Phys. Lett. B288 (1992) 342; Nucl. Phys. B30 (Proc. Suppl.) (1993) 597.
2. R. Narayanan, H. Neuberger, Phys. Lett. B302 (1993) 62; Phys. Rev. Lett. 71 (1993) 3251; Nucl. Phys. B412 (1994) 574; Nucl. Phys. B443 (1995) 305.
3. Y. Shamir, Nucl. Phys. B406 (1993) 90.
4. V. Furman, Y. Shamir, Nucl. Phys. B439 (1995) 54.
5. Alternative, promising methods have also been proposed. See H. Neuberger, Phys. Lett. B417 (1998) 141; H. Neuberger, Phys. Rev. D57 (1998) 5407; H. Neuberger, RU-98-03.
6. P.M. Vranas, Nucl. Phys. B53 (Proc. Suppl.) (1997) 278; P.M. Vranas, Phys. Rev. D57 (1998) 1415.
7. T. Blum and A. Soni, Phys. Rev. D56 (1997) 174; Phys. Rev. Lett. 79 (1997) 3595.
8. R. Narayanan, P. Vranas, Nucl. Phys. B506 (1997) 373.
9. R.G. Edwards, U.M. Heller and R. Narayanan, hep-lat/9801016.
10. Columbia lattice group contributions to the RIKEN-BNL workshop on Fermion Frontiers on Vector Lattice Gauge Theory held May 6-9, 1998, at the Brookhaven National Laboratory.
11. P. Chen, et al., CU-TP-906.
12. P. Chen, et al., Quenched QCD with domain wall fermions, CU-TP-915.
13. P. Chen, et al., The domain wall fermion chiral condensate in quenched QCD, CU-TP-916.
14. P. Chen, et al., CU-TP-914.
15. P. Chen, et al., The anomaly and topology in quenched QCD above $T_c$, CU-TP-913.
16. D. Chen, et al., CU-TP-911.
17. A. Kaehler, in preparation.
18. S. Chandrasekharan, D. Chen, N. Christ, W. Lee, R. Mawhinney and P. Vranas, CU-TO-902.
19. A. Kaehler, Nucl. Phys. B (Proc. Suppl.) 63A-C (1998) 823.