Reframing aging during COVID-19: Familial role-based framing of older adults linked to decreased ageism

Reuben Ng PhD1,2 | Nicole Indran BSocSci (Hons)1

1Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy, National University of Singapore, Singapore
2Lloyd’s Register Foundation Institute for the Public Understanding of Risk, National University of Singapore, Singapore

Correspondence
Reuben Ng, Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy, National University of Singapore, Singapore.
Email: spprng@nus.edu.sg

Funding information
Lloyd’s Register Foundation, Grant/Award Number: IPUR-FY2019-RES-03-NG;
Social Science Research Council, Grant/Award Number: MOE2018-SSHR-004

Abstract
Background: Contributions of older adults amid the COVID-19 pandemic have been eclipsed by discourse positioning them as an at-risk population. We assess whether age-based framing (e.g., senior citizen) is associated with more negative stereotyping in the media compared to familial role-based framing (e.g., grandparent) across 8 months, from a baseline period (October 2019–December 2019) to the onset of the pandemic (January 2020–May 2020).

Methods: Leveraging a 12-billion-word news media database—with over 30 million news articles from over 7000 websites—we identified the most common synonyms for age-based framing (e.g., senior citizen) and familial role-based framing (e.g., grandparent). For each framing category, we compiled the most frequently used descriptors every month, amassing 488,907 descriptors in total. All descriptors were rated from 1 (very negative) to 5 (very positive) to determine a Cumulative Aging Narrative Score (CANS) for age-based and familial role-based framing.

Results: Age-based framing of older adults increased negative stereotyping in the media by seven times compared to familial role-based framing during COVID-19. The percentage of positive topics for age-based framing was significantly lower during COVID-19 (35%) than before (61%). Conversely, the percentage of positive topics for familial role-based framing was higher during the pandemic (91%) than before (70%).

Conclusion: This is one of the first empirical studies on whether framing older adults based on age or role is linked to more negative stereotypes during COVID-19. We argue for a more role-centered approach in framing older adults so that their contributions are acknowledged and valued by society.

KEYWORDS
age stereotypes, ageism, aging narratives, psychomics, quantitative social science, reframing aging, text as data
INTRODUCTION

The growing recognition of the heterogeneity of the older population has been attended by recent calls to reframe aging. However, since the outbreak of COVID-19, older persons have been singled out as its highest risk group. This has in turn given rise to a recurring and undesirable depiction of COVID-19 as an “old person problem.” That the pandemic could potentially derail ongoing global efforts to combat ageism is thus regrettable. So pervasive is the belief in the propensity of the virus to infect the older demographic that it has inspired new lexicon; “senior deleter,” “elder repeller,” and “boomer remover” are some of the terms that have been bandied about to describe the virus. Besides being deemed a burden for ostensibly draining societal resources, older people have also been dismissed as expendable by virtue of their advanced age. COVID-19-related deaths of older adults have even been treated by some politicians with sheer nonchalance. The need to reframe aging is more pressing now than ever. Accordingly, our study compares role-based framing with age-based framing of older adults before and during the pandemic.

Older adults perform a variety of roles in society, a major one being the familial role. We focus specifically on framing them by their roles as grandparents. This is one of the first studies comparing the implications of adopting age-based and familial role-based terms. While critical attention has been paid to the connotations of age-specific terms used to refer to older adults, research on role-based terms remains scant. We contribute to this nascent area of research by comparing media narratives of age and familial role-based narratives of aging. This study spans an 8-month period from October 2019 to May 2020.

We first compare how age-based terms and familial role-based terms differ in how they link to societal sentiments toward older persons. We hypothesize that age-based framing will be associated with more negative sentiments toward older adults than role-based framing (Hypothesis 1). Next, to gain insight into the differing media portrayals for age-based and familial role-based framing, we compare the topics associated with these terms. We hypothesize that familial role-based framing is linked to more positive topics during the pandemic than age-based framing (Hypothesis 2).

Key points

- Framing older adults based on their age (e.g., senior citizen) compared to their familial roles (e.g., grandparent) increased negative age stereotyping by seven times during COVID-19.
- Framing older people by their familial roles foregrounds their important contributions. Meanwhile, framing them by their age highlights their vulnerability to COVID-19.
- The media should adopt a more role-centric approach in framing older people so that their contributions are acknowledged and valued by society.

Why does this paper matter?

Ageism is linked to poorer health and costs the U.S. healthcare system $63 billion per year. Negative age stereotypes have been perpetuated by the media since the onset of COVID-19. This is one of the first studies which tests a strategy to reframe aging by focusing on the invaluable roles performed by older adults rather than their age.

METHODS

Dataset

The News on the Web Corpus is the largest global dataset containing more than 7000 web-based newspapers and over 30 million articles. This is a dynamic corpus with 300,000 new articles added each month. Cultivation theory suggests that the large representation of online media accurately reflects societal portrayals of aging, making the corpus appropriate for studying age and familial role-based narratives of aging. This study spans an 8-month period from October 2019 to May 2020.

Measurement of age-based and familial role-based framing

Similar to previous studies for age-based framing, we shortlisted the most common synonyms of “older adult”: elder(s), elderly, senior(s), old(er) adult(s), old people, old age, senior citizen(s), (the) aged, nursing home resident. For familial role-based framing, the following terms were compiled: grandparent, grandparents, grandfather, grandmother, grandpa, grandma, granddad, granny.
Collocates—descriptors that co-occurred most frequently with each synonym—were generated according to the list of synonyms every month from October 2019 to May 2020. To observe the representation of older adults before COVID-19, October 2019 (2 months before the virus was first reported in December 2019) was used as the baseline period. The endpoint was determined by the availability of data at the time of analysis. Descriptors were extracted using a well-established methodology\textsuperscript{12–14} of frequency, lexical proximity, context-screening, and semantic bonding (Supplementary Text S1). The process generated 488,907 collocates of age-based and familial role-based terms.

To assess Hypothesis 1, each collocate (descriptor) was rated from 1 (very negative) to 5 (very positive) by two raters. This is a validated method\textsuperscript{15} used in past corpus-based analyses\textsuperscript{6,12–14,16–20} Very negative collocates were rated 1 (e.g., abuse, molest), neutral collocates were rated 3 (e.g., wheel, journey), and very positive collocates were rated 5 (e.g., venerable, amazing). The inter-rater reliability using Cronbach’s alpha was 0.972 (95% CI: 0.946, 0.986) for the scoring method. For every synonym per month, we calculated a mean score which was then weighted (by the number of times the synonym appeared in that month) to determine a Cumulative Aging Narrative Score (CANS) for age-based and familial role-based framing, respectively, per month.

Analytic strategy

Hypothesis 1 was assessed by analyzing the age-based and familial role-based trends from October 2019 to May 2020, and by determining whether the respective slopes differed significantly. To assess Hypothesis 2, Latent Dirichlet Allocation (LDA)—a natural language processing method for topic modeling—was conducted on the age-based and familial role-based collocates before and during COVID-19. Subsequently, a two-way mixed ANOVA was conducted with framing (age-based vs. familial role-based) as the between factor, and the two time periods (before vs. during COVID-19) as the within factor. Analyses were conducted using Python 3.7 and OriginPro 2019b.

RESULTS

Hypothesis 1: Age-based terms describing older adults are associated with more negative stereotyping compared to role-based terms across the pandemic

As hypothesized, age-based framing from October 2019 to May 2020 was associated with more negativity as shown by a significant trend ($\beta = -0.023$, $p = 0.00148$),
compared to the trend for familial role-based framing which did not reach significance ($\beta = -0.00343, p = 0.532$). The difference between both slopes was statistically significant ($F (1, 12) = 11.260, p = 0.00572$), supporting Hypothesis 1 (Figure 1). For familial role-based framing, the intercept was 3.21 ($p < 0.0001; 95\% CI: 3.18, 3.23$). This indicates that familial role-based stereotypes of older adults were positive during the baseline period before COVID-19 in October 2019, with a 0.0034-unit increase per month, increasing by 0.7% over 8 months, although the trend was nonsignificant. In contrast, the trend for age-based framing was statistically significant and linked to a 4.84% decreasing trend (0.023-unit per month) over 8 months, which reflects negative stereotyping of older adults in the news media. Age-based framing increased negative age stereotyping by seven times (4.84%/0.7%) compared to familial role-based framing.

| TABLE 1 | Narratives of Age-based and Familial Role-based Framing of Older Adults before and during COVID-19. Age-based narratives in the news media grew more negative during the pandemic, centering almost entirely on older adults as a vulnerable and at-risk population. Conversely, familial role-based narratives in the media became more positive, focusing largely on a renewed sense of appreciation for grandparents. |
| --- | --- |
| **Before COVID-19 (October 2019–December 2019)** | **During COVID-19 (January 2020–May 2020)** |
| Narratives of age-based framing | • Frailty (39%)  
• Privileges for older adults (22%)  
• Social support (18%)  
• Leadership (11%)  
• Pension and welfare programs (10%)  
| • Vulnerability to COVID-19 (65%)  
• Social isolation (13%)  
• Personal protective measures (12%)  
• Celebratory events (10%) |
| Narratives of familial role-based framing | • Intergenerational contact (39%)  
• Crime (30%)  
• Affection (21%)  
• Historical events (10%)  
| • Yearning for intergenerational contact (40%)  
• Veneration (20%)  
• Exemplary workers (12%)  
• Lessons imparted by grandparents (10%)  
• Expressions of affection (9%)  
• Pandemic-induced restrictions (9%) |

**FIGURE 2** Percentage of positive/neutral topics for age-based versus familial role-based framing before and during COVID-19 in the news media. There was a significant interaction between framing (age-based and familial role-based) and stereotypic content before (October 2019–December 2019) and during (January 2020–May 2020) the COVID-19 pandemic. The percentage of positive/neutral topics associated with age-based framing was lower during COVID-19 (35%) than before (61%). Conversely, the percentage of positive/neutral topics associated with familial role-based framing was higher during the pandemic (91%) than before (70%).
Hypothesis 2: Role-based framing, compared to age-based framing, is linked to more positive topics in the news media over two time periods (before vs. during COVID-19)

Topics were generated for age-based and familial role-based terms before and during COVID-19 (Table 1). Before the pandemic, age-based topics were rather varied, featuring matters regarding the aging population, politics, and discounts for older adults. Age-based narratives grew decidedly more negative during the pandemic, with 65% of the narratives centered on older adults as a vulnerable population. Meanwhile, familial role-based narratives before and during the pandemic were not too dissimilar, although the narratives became more positive during COVID-19. Before COVID-19, topics ran the gamut from crime to affection. During the pandemic, familial role-based topics focused on a yearning for intergenerational contact (40%) as well as a renewed sense of appreciation for grandparents for the lessons they impart (10%), the affection they provide (9%), and their occupational contributions (12%) (see Supplementary Text S1 for complete details).

There was a significant interaction between framing (age-based vs. familial role-based) and stereotypic content before (October 2019–December 2019) and during (January 2020–May 2020) the pandemic ($F(1, 18) = 6.081, p = 0.024, \eta^2 = 0.253$). The percentage of positive/neutral topics for age-based framing was higher before COVID-19 (61%) than during COVID-19 (35%). Conversely, the percentage of positive/neutral topics for familial role-based framing was higher during the pandemic (91%) than before (70%). These results (Figure 2) support Hypothesis 2.

DISCUSSION

This is one of the first known studies which tests a strategy to reframe aging by focusing on the invaluable roles performed by older adults rather than their age. Through operationalizing a CANS as a measure of age stereotypes in the media, we found that age-based framing was linked to more negative media portrayals of older adults during COVID-19, while familial role-based framing was linked to more positive portrayals. Since the outbreak, older adults have been framed continually in public discourse as a monolithic group of frail, helpless, and vulnerable individuals.\textsuperscript{3,21} This was evident in our findings, where age-based narratives during the pandemic revolved predominantly around older adults’ susceptibility to the virus. Such age-based framing has lent itself to the “othering” of this community\textsuperscript{22}—a process of differentiation through which a boundary is drawn between the old and young.

In contrast, familial role-based framing was associated with less negative stereotypes in the media. This means that when age is not made a focal point, negative portrayals of older adults become less visible. Past studies have shown that reframing notions of aging may mitigate implicit bias against older people.\textsuperscript{1} Thus, more emphasis should be placed on the roles undertaken by older adults. The reality is that older adults are often net providers—rather than recipients—of help and care.\textsuperscript{23,24} They have assumed roles before the outbreak and have continued to do so during this period despite public directives inhibiting their mobility.\textsuperscript{21}

As illustrated in the familial role-based narratives, older adults are integral to the workforce. During the pandemic, older people have remained a sizable segment of the essential workforce, both as healthcare professionals and retail staff.\textsuperscript{4} In the United States, among workers aged 60 and above, nearly a third have been designated as essential, equivalent to the proportion of younger age groups. Our results also reflect greater appreciation for the affection and wisdom offered by grandparents who play an increasingly pivotal role in childcare globally. In 2017, about nine million grandparents comprised the “Grandparent Army” in the United Kingdom, with almost three million serving as regular care providers.\textsuperscript{25} Meanwhile, roughly 2.5 million grandparents are fully responsible for their grandchildren in the United States.\textsuperscript{26} Notwithstanding disruptions to social care arrangements and the potential increase in exposure to the virus, grandparents have continued to fulfill their caregiving responsibilities.\textsuperscript{4}

Although this study focuses specifically on the familial roles of older adults, it is certainly not to imply that age-based framing should be substituted with familial role-based framing, especially as not all older adults are grandparents. Rather, the point is that news outlets and society need to be mindful of the diversity of roles older people play. Additionally, we acknowledge that age-based framing was utilized throughout this study. The issue is ultimately not so much with age-based framing as it is with the negative connotations evoked by old age. Given that the use of age as a proxy for social categorization serves practical purposes, our recommendation is not to avoid age-based framing, but to instead employ a more role-centered approach in discussions involving older persons. This will help counteract the negativity associated with old age. The manner in which the older cohort is discursively constructed will have a ripple effect on society in general, affecting not only older adults whose long-term health is on the line,\textsuperscript{27–29} but also younger people whose attitudes toward aging will inform their future self-concepts and health outcomes.\textsuperscript{7} Messages
promulgated by media outlets throughout this crisis—and after—should feature more optimistic representations of older adults such that their contributions are not eclipsed by existing narratives of vulnerability. This will aid in dislodging negative stereotypes about older people who constitute a trove of knowledge and experience ready to be mined.6

This study has limitations. We recognize that a role-centric approach may perpetuate the idea that older adults are valuable only if they engage in productive activities.26 However, an emphasis on roles may undermine the notion that older adults are non-contributing members of society while reminding society of their enormous potential. Ultimately, our findings reveal that older adults are viewed more positively when framed by their familial roles. Future studies could explore other measurement approaches30–41 and framing strategies that may be adopted to describe this group.

Even as COVID-19 has put ageism on stark display, it has also invoked a sense of appreciation for older family members. As the perils of the pandemic continue to sweep the globe, intergenerational solidarity is of utmost importance. This study finds that framing older adults by roles rather than age may encourage greater appreciation for this cohort.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST
The authors declare no conflicts of interests.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS
Reuben Ng designed the study, developed the methodology, analyzed the data, and wrote the paper. Nicole Indran co-wrote the paper.

SPONSORS’ ROLE
The funders had no role in study design, data collection, analysis, writing, and decision to publish.

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT
Data are publicly available at https://www.english-corpora.org

ORCID
Reuben Ng https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1186-0570
Nicole Indran https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3095-2988

REFERENCES
1. Busso DS, Volmert A, Kendall-Taylor N. Reframing aging: effect of a short-term framing intervention on implicit measures of age bias. J Gerontol B Psychol Sci Soc Sci. 2019;74(4):559–564. doi:10.1093/geronb/gby080
2. Monahan C, Macdonald J, Lytle A, Apriceno M, Levy SR. COVID-19 and ageism: how positive and negative responses impact older adults and society. Am Psychol. 2020;75(7):887-896. doi:10.1037/amp0000699
3. Ayalon L, Chasteen A, Diehl M, et al. Aging in times of the COVID-19 pandemic: avoiding ageism and fostering intergenerational solidarity. J Gerontol B Psychol Sci Soc Sci. 2020;76:e49-e52. doi:10.1093/geronb/gbaa051
4. Morrow-Howell N, Gonzales E. Recovering from coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19): resisting ageism and recommitting to a productive aging perspective. Public Policy Aging Rep. 2020;30(4):133-137. doi:10.1093/ppar/praa021
5. Lichtenstein B. From “coffin dodger” to “boomer remover”: outbreaks of ageism in three countries with divergent approaches to coronavirus control. J Gerontol B Psychol Sci Soc Sci. 2020;76:e206-e212. doi:10.1093/geronb/gbaa102
6. Ng R. Societal age stereotypes in the U.S. and U.K. from a media database of 1.1 billion words. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2021;18(16):8822. doi:10.3390/ijerph18168822
7. Kessler E-M, Bowen CE. COVID ageism as a public mental health concern. Lancet Healthy Longev. 2020;1(1):e12. doi: 10.1016/S2666-7568(20)30002-7
8. Barbuto CA, Feezel JD. The language of aging in different age groups. Gerontologist. 1987;27(4):527-531. doi:10.1093/geront/27.4.527
9. Covey HC. Historical terminology used to represent older people. Gerontologist. 1988;28(3):291-297. doi:10.1093/geront/28.3.291
10. Davies M. The new 4.3 billion word NOW corpus, with 4–5 million words of data added every day. 2017.
11. Gerbner G, Gross L, Morgan M, Signorielli N, Shanahan J. Growing up with television: cultivation processes. Media Effects: Advances in Theory and Research. LEA’s Communication Series. 2nd ed. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers; 2002:43-67.
12. Ng R, Chow TYJ. Aging narratives over 210 years (1810-2019). J Gerontol B Psychol Sci Soc Sci. 2021;76:1799-1807. doi:10.1093/geronb/gbaa222
13. Ng R, Allore HG, Trentalange M, Monin JK, Levy BR. Increasing negativity of age stereotypes across 200 years: evidence from a database of 400 million words. PLoS One. 2015;10(2):e0117086. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0117086
14. Ng R, Indran N. Role-based framing of older adults linked to decreased ageism over 210 years: evidence from a 600-million-word historical corpus. Gerontologist. 2021;gnab108. doi: 10.1093/geront/gnab108
15. Levy B, Langer E. Aging free from negative stereotypes: successful memory in China and among the American deaf. J Pers Soc Psychol. 1994;66:989-997. doi:10.1037/0022-3514.66.6.989
16. Ng R, Indran N. Societal perceptions of caregivers linked to culture across 20 countries: evidence from a 10-billion-word database. PLoS One. 2021;16(7):e0251161. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0251161
17. Ng R, Chow TYJ, Yang W. News media narratives of Covid-19 across 20 countries: early global convergence and later regional divergence. PLoS One. 2021;16(9):e0256358. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0256358
18. Ng R. Cloud Computing in Singapore: Key Drivers and Recommendations for a Smart Nation. Politics Gov. 2018;6(4):39-47. doi:10.17645/pag.v6i4.1757
19. Ng R, Chow TYJ, Yang W. Culture linked to increasing ageism during Covid-19: evidence from a 10-billion-word corpus across
20 countries. *J Gerontol B Psychol Sci Soc Sci*. 2021;76:1808-1816. doi:10.1093/geronb/gbab057

20. Ng R, Lim WJ. Ageism linked to culture, not demographics: evidence from an 8-billion-word corpus across 20 countries. *J Gerontol B Psychol Sci Soc Sci*. 2020;gbaa181. doi: 10.1093/geronb/gbaa181

21. Vervaecke D, Meisner BA. Caremongering and assumptions of need: the spread of compassionate ageism during COVID-19. *Gerontologist*. 2021;61:159-165. doi:10.1093/geront/gbab057

22. Newsham TMK, Schuster AM, Guest MA, Nikzad-Terhune K, Rowles GD. College students’ perceptions of “old people” compared to “grandparents”. *Educ Gerontol*. 2020;47:63-71. doi:10.1080/03601277.2020.1856918

23. Carriero D, Peccatori FA, Boniolo G. COVID-19: a plea to protect the older population. *Int J Equity Health*. 2020;19(1):72. doi:10.1186/s12939-020-01193-5

24. Previtali F, Allen L, Varlamova M. Not only virus spread: the diffusion of ageism during the outbreak of COVID-19. *J Aging Soc Policy*. 2020;32:1-9. doi:10.1080/08959420.2020.1772002

25. Buchanan A, Rotkirch A. Twenty-first century grandparents: global perspectives on changing roles and consequences. *Contemp Soc Sci*. 2018;13(2):131-144. doi:10.1080/21582041.2018.1467034

26. Xu Y, Wu Q, Jedwab M, Levkoff SE. Understanding the relationships between parenting stress and mental health with grandparent kinship caregivers’ risky parenting behaviors in the time of COVID-19. *J Fam Violence*. 2020. doi:10.1007/s10896-020-00228-3

27. Levy B. Stereotype embodiment. *Curr Dir Psychol Sci*. 2009;18(6):332-336.

28. Ng R, Allore HG, Monin JK, Levy BR. Retirement as meaningful: positive retirement stereotypes associated with longevity. *J Soc Issues*. 2016;72(1):69-85. doi:10.1111/josi.12156

29. Ng R, Allore HG, Levy BR. Self-acceptance and interdependence promote longevity: evidence from a 20-year prospective cohort study. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2020;17(16):5980. doi:10.3390/ijerph17165980

30. Ng R, Lim SQ, Saw SY, Tan KB. 40-year projections of disability and social isolation of older adults for long-range policy planning in Singapore. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2020;17(14):4950. doi:10.3390/ijerph17144950

31. Ng R, Tan KB. Implementing an individual-centric discharge process across Singapore public hospitals. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2021;18(16):8700. doi:10.3390/ijerph18168700

32. Ng R. Anti-Asian sentiments during COVID-19 across 20 countries: analysis of a 12-billion-word news media database. *J Med Internet Res*. 2021.

33. Sima LC, Ng R, Elimelech M. Modeling risk categories to predict the longitudinal prevalence of childhood diarrhea in Indonesia. *Am J Trop Med Hyg*. 2013;89(5):884-891. doi: 10.4269/ajtmh.12-0540

34. Ng R, Rayner S. Integrating psychometric and cultural theory approaches to formulate an alternative measure of risk perception. *Innovation*. 2010;23(2):85-100. doi:10.1080/13511610.2010.512439

35. Ng R, Douglas, Mary. *The Encyclopedia of Cross-Cultural Psychology*. John Wiley and Sons, Inc.; 2013:439-440. doi:10.1002/9781118339893.wbecp176

36. Ng R. Cultural theory. *The Encyclopedia of Cross-Cultural Psychology*. John Wiley and Sons, Inc.; 2013:333-335. doi:10.1002/9781118339893.wbecp135

37. Ng R. Cultural intelligence. *The Encyclopedia of Cross-Cultural Psychology*. John Wiley and Sons, Inc.; 2013:300-301. doi:10.1002/9781118339893.wbecp123

38. Ng R, Indran N. Societal narratives on caregivers in Asia. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2021;18(21):11241. doi:10.3390/ijerph182111241

40. Ng R, Tan YW. Diversity of COVID-19 news media coverage across 17 countries: the influence of cultural values, government stringency and pandemic severity. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2021;18(22):11768. doi:10.3390/ijerph182211768

41. Ng R, Chow TYJ, Yang W. The impact of aging policy on societal age stereotypes and ageism. *The Gerontologist*. 2021. doi:10.1093/geront/gnab151

**SUPPORTING INFORMATION**

Additional supporting information may be found in the online version of the article at the publisher’s website.

**Supplementary Text S1.** Supplementary methodology and results.

**How to cite this article:** Ng R, Indran N. Reframing aging during COVID-19: Familial role-based framing of older adults linked to decreased ageism. *J Am Geriatr Soc*. 2022;70(1):60-66. doi:10.1111/jgs.17532