Biosorption of Bromo-based Dyes from Wastewater Using Low-Cost Adsorbents: A Review

Ebenezer Olujimi Dada¹, Ilesanmi Ademola Ojo¹,²
Abass Olanrewaju Alade¹,²,³*, Tinuade Jolaade Afolabi¹,²
Monsurat Omolola Jimoh¹ and Monsuru Olatunji Dauda¹,²

¹Department of Chemical Engineering, Ladoke Akintola University of Technology Ogbomoso (LAUTECH), Nigeria.
²Bioenvironmental, Water and Engineering Research Group (BWERG), Ladoke Akintola University of Technology Ogbomoso, Nigeria.
³Science and Engineering Research Group (SEARG), Ladoke Akintola University of Technology Ogbomoso, Nigeria.

Authors’ contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. Authors EOD and AOA designed the study. Author IAO wrote the first draft of the manuscript. Author TJA managed the analyses of the study. Authors MOJ and MOD managed the literature searches. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/JSRR/2020/v26i830294

Editor(s):
(1) Dr. Farzaneh Mohamadpour, University of Sistan and Baluchestan, Iran.

Reviewers:
(1) Moon Wei Chek, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Malaysia.
(2) Raptopoulou Christina, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece.
Complete Peer review History: http://www.sdiarticle4.com/review-history/61883

Received 25 July 2020
Accepted 29 September 2020
Published 30 September 2020

Review Article

ABSTRACT

The dyes in the effluents discharged into water bodies, aimlessly, are displeasing aesthetically and pose hazards to aquatic communities. The use of adsorption process has been adopted for effective treatment of wastewater containing dyes. The removal of Bromophenol blue (BPB), Bromocresol green (BCG), Bromocresol purple (BCP), and Bromothymol blue (BTB) dyes (a family of triarylmethane dyes) through adsorption process using several cheaply available non-conventional agricultural-waste based adsorbents was reviewed in this report. The gaps in the treatment trend further indicate the prospect of adapting various lignocellulose and other biogenic materials for the removal of Bromo-based dyes from wastewater.

*Corresponding author: E-mail: aoalade@lautech.edu.ng;
1. INTRODUCTION

The contamination of natural waters has become one of the greatest problems confronting the ecosystem in Nigeria. Effluents released from various dye-using industries are harmful to the ecosystem, and subsequently, the need to remove dye from the water [1]. The textile industry contributes about 22% of the total volume of industrial wastewater generated in Nigeria [2]. The release of dyes and other pollutants into water bodies by industries is undesirable and poses serious environmental challenges to the entire ecosystem. This is due to the toxic, mutagenic, and carcinogenic nature of dyes [3]. Coloured wastewater discharged into streams reduces light penetration hence photosynthetic activity is inhibited [4].

The development of a cost-effective and environmentally safe mechanism to remove the dye and other contaminants has been a challenging exercise for the general populace. With the increasingly stringent laws on the industrial discharge of wastewater, it has become imperative to treat wastewater [5]. Biosorption method is considered as a very effective as well as an efficient method of treating industrial waste effluents. It offers significant advantages such as low-cost, availability, profitability, easy operation, and high efficiency [6].

Several techniques (adsorption, Ion exchange, Membrane filtration, and others) are currently being used for pollutants removal from wastewater containing dyes and other contaminants. However, an environmentally friendly method, the biosorption process has proved to be very efficient at removing dyes from effluents [7]. Activated carbon, because of its large surface area, microporous structure and high adsorption capacity is currently the most widely used adsorbent [8]. However, due to the high cost, its usage has been limited in the large-scale treatment of wastewater. Therefore, efforts are on the rise to improve on the existing mechanisms to increase the efficiency of the process. This entails researching into the use of agricultural wastes (biomass) for the preparation of adsorbents (biosorbent) especially for the removal of dyes, as well as other pollutants in the wastewater. The agricultural wastes that have been investigated among others include Posidonia oceanica (L.) fibre [9], Orange and Banana Peels [10], Peanut Hull [11], Pumpkin Seed Hull [12], Citrus lanatus Rind [13], Broad Bean Peel [14], Oil Palm Fiber: Activated Carbon [14], Oil Palm Trunk Fiber [14], Almond Shell [15], Leaf Powder [16], Rice Husk [17], Sawdust [17], Garlic Peel [18], Pine Apple Stem [19], Rice Bran and Wheat Bran [20], Papaya Seeds [21] and Sugarcane Bagasse Fly Ash [22]. Chicken feathers [23], Pomelo Citrus Grandis Peel [24] and groundnut shell [25] are biosorbents used for the removal of other contaminants in wastewater.

In the present review, an attempt has been made to enumerate in general, how biosorption has been utilized in the removal of dyes and other contaminants from wastewater, and specifically how various biosorbents have been utilized in the removal of Bromophenol blue (BPB), Bromocresol green (BCG), Bromocresol purple (BCP), and Bromothymol blue (BTB). The future of biosorption with respect to how productivity and efficiency can be increased with the advances in modern technology is also discussed.

2. DYES

A dye is a coloured material applied on a substrate using either dyeing, printing, surface coating process, and so on. The production and application of dyes constitute one of the oldest arts in nature. Dyes can be described as water-soluble and water-dispersible organic compounds with the ability to be adsorbed into the substrate while distorting and disrupting the crystal structure of the substrate [26]. Dyes can be categorised as anionic (direct, acid, and reactive dyes), cationic (basic dyes) and non-ionic (disperse dyes) [27,28].

2.1 Challenges of Dye in the Environment

An effluent (dye-containing wastewater) from textile industries is considered as one of the most harmful effluents with adverse effects on the ecosystem. Report from various previous works pointed out that some classes of dye, especially azo dyes and their derivatives, may be carcinogenic and/or mutagenic [29]. It is almost impossible to remove these classes of dyes from the environment because of the highly stable nature of their compounds.

2.2 Triarylmethane Dyes

Triarylmethane dyes are chemical (organic) compounds that are formed from
triaryl]methane. BPB, BCP, BCG and BTB are examples of triaryl]methane dyes with hydroxyl groups at the para positions of at least two aryl groups. As dyes, these compounds have intense colours.

BPB is used as a pH indicator, a colour marker, and a dye. It is an acid-base indicator whose useful range lies between pH 3.0 and 4.6. It changes from yellow at pH 3.0 to blue at pH 4.6. BPB has a characteristic green-red colour [30]. The chemical formula is \( \text{C}_{10}\text{H}_{10}\text{BrO}_{3}\text{S} \) and has a molar mass of 669.96 g mol\(^{-1}\). It has a melting point of 273°C (523°F; 546 K), the boiling point of 279°C, and stable for two years at room temperature. It has a maximum wavelength of 206, 283 and 424 nm; a typical structure of BPB is shown in Fig. 1a. [31].

BCG is also used as a pH indicator as well as a growth medium for microorganisms. The most common use of BCG is for measuring serum albumin concentration within mammalian blood samples in possible cases of kidney failure and liver disease [32]. In aqueous solution, BCG will ionize to give the monoanionic form (yellow), that further deprotonates at higher pH to give the di-anionic form (blue), which is stabilized by resonance. The structure of BCG is shown in Fig. 1b.

BCP or 5', 5''-dibromo-o-cresolsulfophthalein, is a pH indicator that exhibits colour yellow below pH 5.2, and violet above pH 6.8. In microbiology, it is used for staining dead cells based on their acidity, and for the isolation and assaying of lactic acid bacteria. The structure of BCP changes with pH and results in a shift in the equilibrium between two different structures that have different colours (Fig. 1c). In near-neutral or alkaline solution, the chemical has a sulfonate structure that gives the solution a purple colour. As the pH decreases, it converts to a sulfone (cyclic sulfonic ester) that imparts a yellow colouration to the solution [33].

BTB is mostly utilised in applications where neutral pH is required. It is often used to detect and calibrate the presence of carbonic acid in a liquid. The peak absorption of a protonated form of BTB is at 427 nm, this indicates it can transmit yellow light in acidic solutions, and the deprotonated form has its peak absorption at 602 nm which indicates the transmission of blue light in more basic solutions. Highly acidic BTB is magenta in colour [34]. The presence of one moderate electron-withdrawing group (bromine atom) and two moderate donating groups (alkyl substituents, as shown in Fig. 1d) are responsible for BTB's active indication range from a pH of 6.0-7.6. BTB is slightly soluble in oil but soluble in water, ether, and aqueous solutions of alkalis. It is less soluble in nonpolar solvents such as benzene, toluene, and xylene, and certainly not soluble in petroleum ether [35]. BTB has been used for observing photosynthetic activities, or as a respiratory indicator (turns yellow as CO\(_2\) is added). BTB is used in obstetrics for detecting premature rupture of membranes [35].

2.3 Current Treatment Technologies for Dye Removal

Dyes are chemically stable, hence difficult to biodegrade [37]. The methods reported treating effluents that contain dyes are discussed under the following subheadings.

2.3.1 Biological treatments

Biological treatment, which is one of the most commonly used techniques in the treatment of dye-containing wastewater can be aerobic, anaerobic or a combination of both. The aerobic process involves the breaking down of the organic compounds (dyes) in the wastewater by the enzymes secreted by bacteria present in the wastewater [38]. The process is relatively inexpensive, as well as having low running costs [39]. However, total removal or degradation of pollutants may not be possible as some of these organic compounds (dyes) of synthetic nature have a very complex chemical structure that is not easily broken down or degraded [40]. Other factors responsible for this ineffective colour degradation are high concentration of pollutants, dyestuff concentration, initial pH and temperature of the effluent. The main drawbacks of the biological treatment are low biodegradability of the dyes, less flexibility in design and operation, larger land area requirement and longer times required for decolourisation – fermentation processes, thereby making it incapable of removing dyes from effluent continuously in liquid state fermentations. All these contribute to not making this process efficient in wastewater treatment.
2.3.2 Chemical treatments

Chemical treatments include coagulation or flocculation, combined precipitation flocculation with Fe(II)/Ca(OH)$_2$, electro flotation, electrocoagulation, irradiation and advanced oxidative process [41,42]. In these types of treatments, there is the possibility of formation of intermediate product which constitutes a secondary pollution problem leading to excessive chemical use. Although these methods have proven to be very effective for the treatment of water contaminated with pollutants, they are highly exorbitant and commercially cumbersome. High electrical energy demand and consumption of chemical reagents are common problems associated with this type of treatment [43]. In most cases, the final products from these processes are concentrated sludge produced in large quantities, this further compounds pollution phenomenon [44].

2.3.3 Physical treatments

Physical treatments include membrane-filtration processes and adsorption techniques. Filtration technologies include microfiltration, ultrafiltration, nanofiltration, and reverse osmosis.
Microfiltration is rarely used for wastewater treatment due to its large pore size [45]. The main disadvantages of this method are high working pressures, vast energy consumption, high-cost spare-parts i.e. membrane and a relatively short membrane life, these disadvantages inhibit efficient delivery of service for this method for removal of pollutants from wastewater [46]. Reverse osmosis is an effective decolouring and desalting process against the most diverse range of dye wastes and has successfully been employed for recycling, however, it is very costly [47].

2.3.4 Advanced oxidation process (AOP)

The advanced oxidation process is designed to remove organic and some inorganic materials in wastewater by oxidation through reactions with hydroxyl radicals (OH). However, the relatively high capital, operating and maintenance costs of this sophisticated process are some of its disadvantages [42].

2.4 Methods of Dye Removal

There is no single standard methodology/treatment procedure used for all types of wastes. However, some of the major techniques used for wastewater treatment are enumerated in Table 1 [48,49].

2.5 Agricultural Waste Materials Used as Low-Cost Adsorbents-Biosorbents

Biological materials used to accumulate and concentrate dyes from aqueous solution are termed as bio adsorbents. Some of the proven efficient adsorbent materials are peanut hull, orange and banana peels, pumpkin seed hull and *Posidonia oceanica* (L.) fibre [50]. The major disadvantage in these biomaterials is its non-selective to target and non-target contaminants. Unlike the conventional ion exchange, the process is selective to the ions it needs to adsorb. Bio adsorption is a novel approach and is considered to be relatively superior to other techniques because of its low cost, simplicity of design, high efficiency, and ability to separate wide dyes [50].

The use of the various microbial, plant and animal biomass as biosorbent has received substantial attention from various researchers, due to the wide availability of biomass materials, cost-effectiveness and cheap availability of the biosorbents. This phenomenon is set to provide new opportunities for pollution control, element recovery and recycling process [50]. Some biomasses come as waste material from fermentation industries or as renewables. In either case, the costs of biomass raw materials are extremely low. The use of microorganisms as biosorbents for dyes also offers a potential alternative to other adsorbents [51]. The cell wall of microorganisms, which consists essentially of various organic compounds such as chitin, lipids, amino acids and other cellular components, can provide a means for the passive uptake of dyes [52].

Various forms of biomass such as macroalgae (seaweeds), plant materials (leaves, bark and sawdust), animal materials (hair, crustaceans) have also been studied. All were regarded as wastes that could be converted into a useful commodity for the production of biosorbents [53]. Availability is a major factor to be considered in selecting the biomass to be used [54]. Biomasses that come from industrial wastes already have various microorganisms in large amounts naturally, with such organisms being well suited for quick cultivation or propagation biosorption purposes [55].

Seaweeds are naturally conditioned for biosorption because their macroscopic structures offer a suitable basis for the production of biosorbent particles suitable for sorption process applications. Some chemical components of yeast cells may be used as ion exchangers with the rapidly reversible binding of cations. The strong biosorbent characteristic of some types of microbial biomass with respect to dyes depends on the function of the chemical composition of such microbial cells. The biomass may be dead while all cells are metabolically inactive [55].

2.6 Other Adsorbents

2.6.1 Activated Carbon (AC)

Activated Carbon (AC) is a black, amorphous solid containing a major portion of fixed carbon content and other materials such as ash, water vapour and volatile matters in a smaller percentage. These components have been subjected to chemical processes aimed at increasing its porosity. Activated carbon is one the best effective sorbents used in removing dyes and heavy metals from a wide range of industrial wastewater, contaminated groundwater and landfill leachate [56]. Dyes adsorption onto activated carbon is greatly influenced by the
chemical and physical properties of the activated carbon [57]. AC is available in different forms such as powdered, granulated, fibrous, spherical, and cloth forms. Powdered activated carbon has a very fine particle size of about 44μm, which enhances faster adsorption. The granulated activated carbon has granules of 0.6 to 4.0mm in size. Fibrous activated carbon fibre has a large surface area and contains a higher percentage of larger pores [58,59,60].

2.6.2 Siliceous materials
Silica-based adsorbents cover a wide range of applications. The choice of these materials for use is due to its high porosity, large inner surface area, and the high adsorption properties of the available materials [61].

2.6.3 Natural zeolites
Natural zeolites are environmentally and economically friendly hydrated alumina silicate materials with excellent ion exchange and sorption properties. Zeolites are cheap, exhibit excellent selectivity for different cations at low temperatures, compact in size and allow simple and cheap maintenance in the full-scale applications [62].

2.6.4 Clay
Clay is a naturally occurring material which is made up of fine-grained minerals, which might be plastic in nature at appropriate water contents and thereafter hardens when dried or burnt [63]. Bentonite is the most common and effective type of clay used for water treatment. It is a clay mineral consisting mostly of montmorillonite. Other clay minerals found in it are beidellite, kaolinite, saponite, hectorite and nontronite [63].

2.7 The Removal of BPB, BCG, BCP and BTB from Wastewater
The excellent ability and economic promise of adsorbents prepared from biomass and waste materials that exhibited high sorption properties for the removal of BPB, BCG, BCP and BTB from wastewater, in comparison with other adsorbents are summarized in Tables 2-5. This review has made a tremendous effort to highlight the maximum adsorption capacities isotherm, kinetic, thermodynamic data including optimal adsorption parameters of agricultural waste, industrial solid waste and nanoparticle-loaded based activated carbons for the removal of BPB (Table 2).

2.7.1 Activated charcoal
Adsorption of dyes from aqueous media on activated charcoal was carried out by Iqbal & Ashiq [64]. It was observed from the work that adsorption of all the dyes on activated charcoal is inversely proportional to the pH and temperature. The adsorptive removal of BCG from aqueous solution using activated carbon prepared from rice husk was investigated by Onu et al. [65]. The result indicated that an increase in contact time, adsorbent dosage and temperature increased the percent uptake of the BCG dye. Maximum percentage adsorption of about 93% was obtained. Langmuir isotherm models best described the equilibrium data of the adsorption process. Pseudo-second-order kinetic model best correlates the kinetics of the experimental data. The work showed that activated carbon prepared from rice husk can be used in adsorptive removal of BCG dye from solution and that the adsorption process was spontaneous and exothermic.

2.7.2 Mesoporous MgO nanoparticles
The removal of BPB dye using mesoporous MgO nanoparticles was investigated by Ahmed & Abou-Gamr, [66]. The results of the work showed that adsorption equilibrium data fitted well to the Langmuir and Freundlich isotherms. The adsorption isotherms indicated that the adsorption capacity is 40 mg.g⁻¹ for BPB. The adsorption process follows the pseudo-second-order rate equation. The enthalpy change for BPB dye was 7.3kJ mol⁻¹. The process is endothermic and spontaneous. The work shows the ability of MgO Nanorods as an efficient and excellent adsorbent for the removal of two anionic dyes due to the higher point of zero charge of MgO [66].

2.7.3 Sorel’s cement nanoparticles
Sorel’s cement nanoparticles prepared via sol-gel method was used for the removal of BPB from their aqueous solutions by Ahmed et al. [67]. The effects of contact time, adsorbent dosage, initial dye concentration and temperature on removal efficiency were investigated. Adsorption data showed better fitting to the Freundlich isotherm equation. Langmuir model represented the results with lower but acceptable correlation coefficients implying surface heterogeneity. The maximum adsorption was 4.88 mg/g. The adsorption of BPB followed the pseudo-first-order kinetics.
Removal of the dye proceeded endothermic with $\Delta H$ of 7.8 kJ/mol. Obtained results indicate that Sorel's cement represents an efficient adsorbent for removal of BPB from aqueous solution.

### 2.7.4 α-chitin nanoparticles

The adsorption of BPB by α-chitin nanoparticles (CNP) using unique nanoparticles of 650 nm was studied by Rameshthangam et al. [68]. The results showed that the adsorption process increased with increase in the concentration of CNP, contact time and temperature. The adsorption process decreased with an increase in the initial dye concentration. It obeys Langmuir isotherm and pseudo-second-order kinetics more effectively. The isotherm and kinetic models confirmed that CNP could be used as a suitable adsorbent material for the removal of dyestuff from effluents.

### 2.7.5 Magnetic Fe₃O₄/MIL-88A nanocomposite

Huajiao et al. [69] stated in a study that Metal-organic frameworks are considered as good materials for the adsorption of many environmental pollutants. The results of the study showed that the magnetic Fe₃O₄/MIL-88A composite maintained a hexagonal rod-like structure and has good magnetic responsibility for separation. The maximum saturation magnetization was 49.8 emu g⁻¹. The maximum adsorption capacity of Fe₃O₄/MIL-88A composite for BPB was 167.2 mg/g and could maintain 94% of the initial adsorption amount after five cycles. The pseudo-second-order kinetics and Langmuir isotherm models mostly fitted to the adsorption for BPB suggesting that chemisorption is the rate-limiting step for this monomolecular-layer adsorption.

Ghosh & Biswas, [70] investigated the use of Labeo beta fish scale as an adsorbent for BPB removal. The scales showed good BPB removal performance at pH 4.8. The kinetic data acquired at that pH fits well both with the pseudo-second-order and the Weber-Morris kinetic equations. The data of adsorption equilibriums were best described by the Freundlich model. Thermodynamics shows that the BPB adsorption by the fish scale is spontaneous ($\Delta \text{G}^\circ = -$21.49 kJ. mol⁻¹ and $\Delta \text{S}^\circ = + 27.75 \text{ J.mol}^{-1}\text{K}^{-1}$). The BPB adsorption by the tested fish scale has taken place with the electrostatic mechanism.

### 2.7.6 Raw maize cob

Abubakar & Ibrahim, [31] studied the adsorption of BPB onto raw maize cob from aqueous solution. Results showed that BPB percentage was 96.53%, with equilibrium time within 125 minutes. The removal efficiency was found to increase with increasing initial dye concentration from 10 mg/l to 100 mg/l be high at lower pH. Also, an increase in the dosage of the adsorbent leads to an increase in the adsorption capacity for BPB. The adsorption process was found to fit closely to the Pseudo second-order model. The adsorption was feasible and spontaneous. The result indicated that raw maize cob could be used as an adsorbent for the removal of the tested dyes.

| Processes          | Method                                      | Advantages                                   | Disadvantages               |
|--------------------|---------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Fenton reagents    | Oxidation reaction using mainly H₂O₂:Fe(II) | Effective decolourization of dyes            | Sludge generation           |
| Ozonation          | Oxidation reaction using ozone gas          | Gaseous state: no alteration of volume       | Short half-life             |
| Photochemical      | Oxidation reaction using H₂O-UV             | No sludge generation                         | Formation of by-products    |
| NaCl               | Oxidation reaction using Cl⁻ to attack the amino group | Initial and acceleration of azo bond cleavage | Release of aromatic amines  |
| Electrochemical destruction | Oxidation reaction using electricity | Non-hazardous compounds                       | The high cost of electricity |
| Activated carbon   | Dye removal by adsorption                   | Good removal of a wide variety of dyes       | Regeneration difficulties   |
| Membrane filtration | Physical separation                   | Removal of all dye types                     | Production of sludge        |
| Ion exchange       | Ion exchange resin                         | Regeneration: no adsorbent loss               | Not effective for all dyes  |
| Electrokinetic coagulation | Addition of ferrous sulphate and ferric chloride | Economically feasible                        | High sludge production      |

Table 1. Methods for dyes removal [48,49]
| S/N | Adsorption                              | Adsorption capacity, $q_{\text{max}}$ (mg/g) | Isotherm study | Kinetic study | Thermodynamic study | pH  | Initial dye Conc. (mg/l) | Equilibrium time (min) | Dosage of Adsorbent (g/L) | References |
|-----|----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|----------------|---------------|---------------------|-----|-------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------------|-------------|
| 1   | Certain Fungi (Dried biomasses)        | 526                                        | Langmuir       | PSO           | -                   | 2.0 | 800                     | 5hrs                  | 1.0                      | [71]        |
| 2   | Rhizopus Stolonifer Biomass            | 1111                                       | Langmuir       | PSO           | Exothermic          | 2.0 | 600                     |                       |                          | [72]        |
| 3   | Activated charcoal                    | 9.0 x $10^{-3}$                            | Langmuir       | Exothermic    | 5.0                 | 6.7 ppm               | 30                     | 0.01                    | [64]        |
| 4   | Fungus Aspergillus Flavus             | -3.58                                      | Langmuir       | Exothermic    | 8.0                 | 600                     | 30                     | 0.6                     | [73]        |
| 5   | Mild Steel in Acidic Medium           | 47.5                                       | Langmuir       | PFO           | endothermic         | 7.0 | 50                      | 30                    | 1.0                      | [74]        |
| 6   | ZnO assisted photocatalysis            | 4.88                                       | Freundlich     | PFO           | endothermic         | 8.3 | 25.14                   | 90                    | 0.2                      | [65]        |
| 7   | Supported ionic liquids               | 22.72                                      | Langmuir       | PFO           | endothermic         | 6.0 | 15                      | 15                    | 2.0                      | [66]        |
| 8   | Sorel’s cement nanoparticles           | 11.8991                                   | Langmuir       | PFO           | endothermic         | 5.0 | 20                      | 24                    | 0.25                     | [30]        |
| 9   | a-chitin nanoparticles                | 1029                                       | Langmuir       | PSO           | endothermic         | 44.0 | 120                     |                       |                          | [77]        |
| 10  | Gelidium Cartilagineum Powder         | 40                                         | Langmuir       | PSO           | endothermic         | 8.3 | 28                      | 90                    | 0.1                      | [66]        |
| 11  | Mesoporous MgO nanoparticles          | 14.493                                     | Langmuir and Freundlich | PSO | endothermic | 2.0 | 100                     | 60                    | 1.0                      | [78]        |
| 12  | Acid Activated Clay                   | 0.318                                      | Temkin         | PSO           | Exothermic          | 100 | 60                      | 125                   | 1.5                      | [31]        |
| 13  | Raw Maize Cob                         | 9.5                                        | Langmuir       | Exothermic    | 5.0                 | 60                      | 60                     | 0.1                     | [69]        |
| 14  | Magnetic Chitosan-Graphene Oxide      | 167.2                                      | Langmuir       | PSO           | Endothermic         | 300 | 60                      |                       | 0.1                      | [69]        |

Table 2. Maximum adsorption capacities of agricultural, industrial solid and nanoparticle-loaded based activated carbons for BPB
| S/N | Adsorption                  | Adsorption capacity, $q_{\text{max}}$ (mg/g) | Isotherm study | Kinetic study | Thermodynamic study | pH | Initial dye Conc. (mg/l) | Equilibrium time (min) | Dosage of Adsorbent (g/L) | References |
|-----|----------------------------|---------------------------------------------|----------------|---------------|---------------------|----|------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------|
| 17  | Labeo beta Fish Scale      | 7.39                                        | Freundlich     | PSO           | Exothermic          | 4.8| 16.0                   | 45                     | 4.0                      | [70]        |
| 18  | Modified exuviae of Hermetia illucens larvae | 571                                         | Langmuir       | PFO           | Exothermic          | 4.0| 200                   | 20                     | 0.2                      | [80]        |

Key: PFO – Pseudo first order  
PSO – Pseudo second order
Laboratory investigations of the potential use of dried biomasses of *Rhizopus stolonifer*, *Fusarium* sp., *Geotrichum* sp., and *Aspergillus fumigatus* as biosorbents for the removal of bromophenol blue dye from aqueous solutions were conducted by Kang et al. [71]. Kinetics studies indicated that the BPB dye uptake processes could be well described by the pseudo-second-order model. The fungal biomasses exhibited the highest dye biosorption at pH 2.0. The Langmuir adsorption model appears to fit the dye biosorption better than the Freundlich model, with maximum dye uptake capacities ranging from 526 to 1111 mg/g, depending on the biomass used.

### 2.7.7 *Rhizopus stolonifer* biomass

The removal of BPB dye, from aqueous solutions, by biosorption on non-living biomass of *Rhizopus stolonifer* was investigated in a batch system by Kim et al. [72]. Pre-treatment of the biomass with NaOH was found to be the most effective means to enhance the biosorption of BPB. The fungal biomass exhibited the highest dye sorption capacity at pH 2 and the uptake process followed the pseudo-second-order model. The adsorption capacity of the biomass increased as the initial dye concentration increased, and the maximum uptake value was estimated at 1111 mg/g according to Langmuir adsorption isotherm. The high efficiency of biosorption and elution, low biomass damage, and stability of over prolonged operation time make the process an economical effective alternative technique for dye pollution monitoring.

### 2.7.8 Modified exuviae of *Hermetia illucens* larvae

Pablo et al. [80] developed biosorbent from the exuviae of *Hermetia illucens* (Linnaeus) larvae and used it to remove organic anionic dyes from an aqueous medium. The maximum adsorbed amount was 571 mg g\(^{-1}\) according to Langmuir’s model. The adsorption process was evaluated as exothermic and spontaneous. The process was classified as physical adsorption. The prepared biosorbent was tested in five consecutive adsorption cycles achieving 99% dye removal at each stage. These results suggest that the prepared biosorbent had potential applications in the treatment of effluents from textile industries.

### 2.7.9 UV- Radiation with ZnO as Catalyst

The adsorption of BPB dye solution on the metal oxide semiconductors studied by Mashkour, [75] was found favourable by the Langmuir approach. The photocatalytic decolourization follows pseudo-first-order kinetics at low initial dye concentration. The initial decolourization rate could be fitted to the empirical Langmuir-Hinshelwood equation up to 15 mg/L, i.e. the decolourization rate of the BPB dye solution. According to the Langmuir-Hinshelwood kinetic model, it is concluded that ZnO acts as a better photocatalyst to degrade the BPB dye solution under the optimum physicochemical conditions.

### 2.7.10 Mild steel in acidic medium

The compounds BPB studied as inhibitors slowed the acid corrosion of steel to some extent being physically adsorbed on the metal surface [74]. The inhibition efficiency increases with increase in inhibitor concentration and decreases with increase in temperature. The values of \(q_{ads}\) obtained at 303K and 313K are all negative indicating that the inhibitors are strongly adsorbed on the steel surface and the adsorption process is spontaneous. Inhibition of steel corrosion by BPB obeyed Langmuir adsorption isotherm. The synergistic effect between BPB and KBr can be explained by the fact that the addition of the KBr component stabilized the adsorption of the inhibitor dyes on the steel surface. This stabilization may be caused by the interaction between the dyes and Br\(^{-}\) ions. Thus, the interaction enhances the inhibition efficiency to a considerable extent due to the increase of the surface coverage in the presence of bromide ions.

### 2.7.11 Gelidium cartilagineum powder

Raju & Satyanandam, [30] reported in an extensive study of adsorption of *Gelidium cartilagineum* powder unto BPB dye that the equilibrium agitation time for BPB biosorption was 25 minutes. The percentage biosorption of BPB dye decreased with increase in biosorbent size from 53 μm (56%) to 152μm (38%). Percentage biosorption of BPB dye from the aqueous solution increases significantly with an increase from pH2 (53%) to pH6 (74%). The optimum biosorption dosage was 25 g/L. The maximum uptake capacity of 11.8991 mg/g was obtained at 308 K. Entire total system followed Langmuir Isotherm and Langergren First order Kinetics. Thermodynamics revealed that the system is endothermic, spontaneous and irreversible. *Gelidium cartilagineum* powder is an effective and efficient biosorbent and is capable of removing BPB dye.
2.7.12 Novel supported ionic liquids

New adsorption materials, supported ionic liquids, have been successfully applied for dyes separation by Hang et al. [76]. Studies showed that the kinetic data were well described by the pseudo-second-order kinetic model. Moreover, the isotherm experiments revealed that the Langmuir model yielded better fitting than the Freundlich model for BPB adsorption. The calculated thermodynamic parameters indicated that the adsorption of BPB was spontaneous and endothermic. This study is expected to help expand the type of supported ionic liquids and their application in the treatment of dyes pollution.

2.7.13 Fungus aspergillus flavus

Aspergillus flavus was employed for biodegradation of BPB by Singh & Singh, [73]. Potato Dextrose Agar medium was used to investigate the biodegradation of dye compounds by fungus. The fungus showed positive results for the degradation/ decolourization of textile dyes. Degradation of dyes was evaluated by the change in the original colour and visual disappearance of colour from the fungus treated Petri plates. Degradation and decolourization of dye were observed by the presence of colour in the fungal mycelium. The addition of BPB in the culture medium adversely affected the growth of Aspergillus flavus when compared to their respective controls.

2.7.14 Silica-based aerogels

The silica-based aerogels and xerogels studied by Durães et al. [77] exhibit mesoporous structures with high surface area and tailored levels of hydrophobicity/hydrophilicity. The xerogel with intermediate wetting behaviour shows good removal efficiency and pseudo-second-order adsorption kinetics. Hydrophobic interactions characterized the adsorption process while the monolayer formation was the rate-limiting step. Aerogels were used as adsorbents for several phenolic compounds. The hydrophobic adsorbents show higher performances for the adsorbate with higher partition coefficient octanol/water, with favourable isotherms. Hydrophobic interactions play an important role in the adsorption process.

2.7.15 Activated biosorbent phragmites Karka

Parhi et al. [81] investigated the removal of BCG dye from aqueous solution using activated biosorbent Phragmites karka. The BCG adsorption efficiency was increased from 16.05 to 84.2% with an increase in acidity of the solution and maximized at pH 5 of solution. A maximum loading capacity of 392.3 mg/g was obtained at ambient condition. Kinetics study showed that BCG adsorption well fit the pseudo-second-order model than the pseudo-first-order kinetic model. The positive value of, ΔH° 2.49 kJ/mol obtained by thermodynamic study reveals the endothermic nature of adsorption and ΔS° 24.87 J.K mol⁻¹ showed the increase in degrees of freedom of BCG during adsorption. Equilibrium data showed the best fit with Freundlich isotherm and revealed that the adsorption is chemisorption.

2.7.16 Ziziphus nummularia

Ziziphus nummularia was used to remove BCG by Shokrollahi et al. [82]. Ziziphus nummularia is a plant commonly found in agricultural fields, readily available and inexpensive adsorbent. Langmuir, Freundlich, Temkin, and Dubinin-Radushkevich isotherm models were used to interpret the adsorption isothermal data. The adsorption process is dependent on pH and temperature and follows a pseudo-second-order kinetics model. The values of ΔH, ΔS, and ΔG showed that the adsorbent employed has considerable potential as an adsorbent for the removal of dyes.

2.7.17 Chitosan poly (methacrylate) composites

Chitosan poly (methacrylate) composites were prepared and applied for adsorption of BCG from aqueous solutions by Liu et al. [83]. The adsorption isotherm was well described by the Freundlich model, and the maximum adsorption capacity was 39.84μg mg⁻¹ by shaking for 40 min at pH 2.0. BCG adsorption kinetics followed a pseudo-second-order kinetic model, indicating that adsorption was the rate-limiting step. The negative values of Gibbs free energy change showed that adsorption was a spontaneous process. The positive values of entropy and enthalpy change indicated that the adsorption of BCG was endothermic. The value of the adsorption percentage was greater than 97% after three times of recycling test and this confirmed that Chitosan poly composites have a great capability for the adsorption of BCG in solutions.
2.7.18 **Bryophyllum pinnatum Kurz stem powder**

Adsorption of Methylene Blue, BCG and Methyl Red were performed in batches on *Bryophyllum pinnatum Kurz* stem powder (BPP) and Activated Carbon *Bryophyllum pinnatum* (ACBP) by Kindala et al. [84]. Adsorption capacities of the two adsorbents were compared to that of commercial activated carbon (CAC) and were evaluated as a function of pH and the dose of the adsorbent. Freundlich and Langmuir isotherms models were used to test the equilibrium data which were best represented with maximum monolayer adsorptions capacities of 255.754 (pH 11.15), 253.807 (pH 3.35) and 195.313 mg.g\(^{-1}\) (pH 3.25) for MB, MR and BCG respectively on ACBP. On CAC their capacities were respectively 176.367 (pH 11.15), 342.466 (pH 3.35) and 108.342 mg.g\(^{-1}\) (pH 3.25) for MB, MR and BCG. On BPP the adsorption capacities were respectively 61.013 (pH 11.15), 165.289 (pH 3.35) and 51.733 mg.g\(^{-1}\) (pH 3.25) for MB, MR and BG. The results show that ACBP has an excellent adsorption capacity compared with the values of BPP and CAC. The results obtained with Langmuir and Freundlich isotherm models provided the best correlation constant. The adsorption kinetics was found to follow a pseudo-second-order kinetic model with the correlation coefficient close to unity.

2.7.19 **Chitin nanofibers**

Chitin nanofibers as a valuable natural material to remove BCG dye was investigated by Rezaei et al. [85]. The results showed that colour adsorption was pH-dependent. The optimum pH value was and the optimum adsorption was 92.75% at the concentration of 0.4 mgL\(^{-1}\). The optimum adsorbent dosage was 1.5 g A contact time of 10 minutes at 25°C was considered as the best for these two parameters, which indicates the short duration of this treatment.

2.7.20 **Almond husk**

Bhanuprakash & Belagali, [86] investigated the adsorption behaviour of almond husk concerning crystal violet, BCG, Pararosaniline and Victoria blue. The adsorbent used proved to be effective, with total removal of all dyes above 90%. The removal of Bromocresol green was 97.5%, Crystal violet 96.9%, Pararosaniline 95.6% and Victoria blue 95%. Isotherm model of Langmuir, Freundlich and Dubinin-Radushkevich were considered favourable.

2.7.21 **Acid treated activated charcoal**

Activated charcoal was prepared from pine tree cones and was treated with 5M HNO\(_3\) and HCl solutions. The acid-treated charcoals were used for the adsorption of cobalt ions from aqueous solution and then utilized for the decolourization of BCG dye in an aqueous medium by Khan et al. [87]. The adsorption study revealed that acid-treated charcoals adsorbed 9.063 mg/g of cobalt within 2 hrs. The decolourization study was carried out using UV/Vis spectrophotometry and the results revealed that acid-treated charcoals decolourised 16.85% of the dye while Cobalt-acid-treated charcoals decolourised about 40.5% of the dye within 12 hrs.

2.7.22 **Raw bentonite clay and activated carbon from *Acheilia Nilotica***

Abdulganiyu & Ibrahim, [88] investigated the adsorption of BCP onto raw bentonite clay and activated carbon from *Vachellia nilotica* using batch adsorption process. The pseudo-second-order kinetic exhibits the best fit with a correlated coefficient (R\(^2\)) close to 1. Experimental values 7.197 mg/g and 5.169 mg/g for Raw Bentonite Clay and activated carbon from *Vachellia nilotica* are closer to the estimated values 7.246 mg/g and 5.263 mg/g. The negative values of change in Gibbs free energy indicated a spontaneous process. Positive values of enthalpy confirm the endothermic character of the adsorption process. Lower ΔH values of 11.01 and 11.98kJ/mol for adsorption of dye onto raw bentonite clay and activated carbon respectively, suggests that the adsorption is physical in nature. New bentonite carbon composite was prepared and characterized by Shalabi et al. [89]. The adsorbent dose was 20 gL\(^{-1}\). The equilibrium between the adsorbate and adsorbent was practically achieved in 90 minutes at pH 1.0. Adsorption kinetics followed a pseudo-second-order rate expression and equilibrium adsorption data of BTB dye on bentonite carbon composite was best represented by the Langmuir isotherm.
Table 3. Maximum adsorption capacities of agricultural, industrial solid and nanoparticle-loaded based activated carbons for Bromocresol green (BCG)

| S/N | Adsorption Adsorption capacity, $q_{\text{max}}$ (mg/g) | Isotherm study | Kinetic study | Thermodynamic study | pH | Initial dye Conc. (mg/l) | Equilibrium time (min) | Dosage of Adsorbent (g/L) | References |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------|----------------|---------------|---------------------|----|------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|------------|
| 1   | Ziziphus nummularia                               | 6.25           | Freundlich    | PSO                 | 2.0 | 50                     | 8                      | 0.4                     | [82]       |
| 2   | Bryophyllum pinnatum Kurz stem powder              | 51.7330        | Langmuir and Freundlich | PSO  | 3.25 | 50                     | 8                      | 0.4                     | [84]       |
| 3   | Extractive Spectrophotometric Determination         | 4.0            | 5.0           |                     |     |                        |                        |                         | [90]       |
| 4   | Almond husk                                        | 97.50%         | Langmuir      |                     | 7.0 | 300                    | 1.0                    |                         | [86]       |
| 5   | Activated Biosorbent Phragmites Karka Composites   | 392.30         | Freundlich    | PSO                 | 0.5 | 50                     | 300                    | 1.0                     | [81]       |
| 6   | Chitosan Poly (methacrylate)                       | 39.84          | Freundlich    | PSO                 | 2.0 | 40                     | 0.1                    |                         | [83]       |
| 7   | Activated carbon                                  | 0.0209         | Langmuir      |                     | 5.5 | 30                     | 0.1                    |                         | [91]       |
| 8   | Chitin Nanofibers                                  | 18.02          | Langmuir      |                     | 6.0 | 10                     | 1.5                    |                         | [85]       |
| 9   | Acid-treated activated charcoal                    | 9.063          | Langmuir      |                     | 4.0 | 120                    | 0.030                  |                         | [87]       |
| 10  | Modified Agricultural Waste                        | 0.0439         | Langmuir      | PSO                 | 2.5 | 50                     | 60                     | 2.5                     | [82]       |

Key: PFO- Pseudo first order and PSO- Pseudo second order
Table 4. Maximum adsorption capacities of agricultural, industrial solid and nanoparticle-loaded based activated carbons for Bromocresol purple (BCP)

| S/N | Adsorption | Adsorption capacity, $q_{\text{max}}$ (mg/g) | Isotherm study | Kinetic study | Thermodynamic study | pH | Initial dye Conc. (mg/l) | Equilibrium time (min) | Dosage of Adsorbent (g/L) | References |
|-----|------------|---------------------------------------------|----------------|---------------|---------------------|----|--------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|------------|
| 1   | Silver Nano Particle Bentonite Carbon Composite Material Photolysis, Acetone/UV and H$_2$O$_2$/UV and Several Photochemical Processes Raw Bentonite Clay and Activated Carbon | 0.0708, 7.246 | Langmuir, Langmuir | PFO, PSO | exothermic, endothermic | 2.0, 3.0 | 20, 25 | 40, 120 | 60, 45 | 30, 2.5 | [92], [93], [94], [95], [88] |

Key: PFO- Pseudo First Order
PSO- Pseudo Second Order
| S/N | Adsorption                          | Adsorption capacity, $q_{\text{max}}$ (mg/g) | Isotherm study | Kinetic study | Thermodynamic study | pH | Initial dye Conc. (mg/l) | Equilibrium time (min) | Dosage of Adsorbent (g/L) | References |
|-----|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|----------------|---------------|---------------------|----|-------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|------------|
| 1   | Mild Steel in Acidic Medium        | -3.58                                       | Langmuir       | exothermic    |                     | 7  | 0.05%                   | 7 days                 |                         | [74]       |
| 2   | Soil Borne Fungi                   | 52.699                                      | Freundlich     | PSO           | endothermic         | 7  | 0.05%                   | 8 days                 | 4                       | [96]       |
| 3   | Sawdust Treated by Polyaniline     | 52.699                                      | Freundlich     | PSO           | endothermic         | 7  | 0.05%                   | 8 days                 | 4                       | [97]       |
| 4   | Bentonite Carbon Composite         | 0.546                                       | Langmuir       | PSO           | exothermic          | 1  | 10                      | 90                     | 20                      | [89]       |
| 5   | Anodic oxidation                   | 0.546                                       | Temkin         | PSO           | exothermic          | 4  | 100                     | 100                    | 1.5                     | [98]       |
| 6   | Raw Maize Cob                      | 0.546                                       | Temkin         | PSO           | exothermic          | 4  | 100                     | 110                    | 1.5                     | [31]       |
| 7   | Modified Cellulose Fibres          | 0.546                                       | Temkin         | PSO           | exothermic          | 4  | 100                     | 120                    | 0.1                     | [99]       |
| 8   | Latvian Sphagnum Peat Moss         | 13.947                                      | Langmuir       | PSO           | exothermic          | 7.5| 150                     | 120                    | 0.5                     | [100]      |

Key: PFO- Pseudo first order and PSO- Pseudo second order
2.7.23 Bentonite carbon composite material

El-Dars et al. [93] investigated the adsorption of Bromocresol purple, and methylene blue dyes onto bentonite carbon composite. The results show that the optimum conditions for removal of BCP, and MB dyes were 30 and 40 g/L respectively. It was further shown that the equilibrium between the adsorbate and the adsorbent was practically achieved in 60 min for both BCP and MB dyes. The results verified that adsorption kinetics followed a pseudo-second-order. Experimental data were best fitted in Langmuir isotherm.

2.7.24 Photochemical processes

Photochemical processes have been widely used in water decontamination process coupled or not with Ultraviolet light. In an extensive investigation, Bousnoubra et al. [95] studied the ability of some photochemical processes in the absence of light (Fenton) and in its presence (photo-Fenton) to remove BCP from aqueous solution. The results showed that the optimal value of pH was 3.0. The most favourable ratio of H$_2$O$_2$ to iron was 10:1 for the oxidation state of iron II. Photo-Fenton process at 254 nm is more efficient than that used at 365 nm and Fenton. The efficiency of the processes studied decreases in the following order: Photo-Fenton 254 nm>Fenton>photolysis 254 nm. In general, photo-Fenton appeared suitable for the degradation of the dye since they reinforce the production of radicals OH. These investigations showed that these processes might be used for the treatment of wastewater in industrial scale.

2.7.25 Photolysis, acetone / UV and H$_2$O$_2$/UV

Djebar et al. [94] tested some photochemical processes to decolourize two dyes, taken in mono and binary systems in an aqueous homogeneous medium. Both substrates were treated separately by direct UV photolysis at 254 nm. The experimental results indicated that the methyl green decolourization rate was 66% for a reaction time of 30 minutes. BCP process was 25% for the same reaction time. Total decolourization was obtained for BCP and MG when both substrates were treated by either acetonel/UV or by H$_2$O$_2$/UV. Meanwhile, the treatment of the mixture became rather complicated compared to the separated dyes. Decolourization process decreased as the concentration of the solution became high. Under these conditions, the solution was not permeable to UV radiations. Thus, among these processes, acetonel/UV was the best system in comparison to the direct UV photolysis and H$_2$O$_2$/UV. Additionally, the decolourization process due to direct UV photolysis, Acetone/UV, and H$_2$O$_2$/UV was correctly described by pseudo-zero-order and by pseudo-first-order models for each dye taken separately. In the mixture, the latter model remained almost unchanged.

2.7.26 Silver nanoparticle, ferrous sulfate and hydrogen peroxide

Photo-degradation technique offers good potential to remove the colour from wastewater. These methods were employed for the removal of Carminic acid and BCP by Sawsan, [92]. Comparison between the removal of dyes by hydrogen peroxide, ferrous sulphate and silver nanoparticle was studied in sunlight effect. The results showed that decolourization of investigated mordant dyes was feasible to be decolourized by Fe$^{2+}$ process, silver nanoparticles and H$_2$O$_2$. Decolourization efficiency of the investigated dyes by Fe$^{2+}$ was better than that of the adsorption process. The techniques were very useful and cost-effective for better removal of dyes.

2.7.27 Sawdust treated by polyaniline

Sawdust and sawdust/polyaniline composite have been tested for the removal of BTB dye from aqueous solutions using batch adsorption technique by Taghried & Abeer, [97]. The adsorption capacity of BTB dye on natural and modified sawdust was analyzed at a pH of 3–4, the contact time of 4min, the temperature of 30°C and initial concentration of 100 mg/L. The results revealed that sawdust coated polyaniline adsorbent has high efficiency to remove BTB dye from the aqueous solution. The percentage removal was 99% as compared with sawdust-coated polyaniline. The adsorption process was spontaneous, endothermic and increased randomness. Freundlich isotherm fit much better than the Langmuir isotherm and obeyed the pseudo-second-order model.

2.7.28 Latvian sphagnum peat moss

The removal of BTB from aqueous solution using Latvian sphagnum peat moss was investigated by Said Hassan et al. [100]. Latvian sphagnum peat moss is a hydrophilic and biodegradable natural adsorbent. The adsorption equilibrium isotherms, thermodynamics, and kinetics were
studied. BTB showed two removal maxima in acidic (pH 2.5) and almost neutral (pH 7.5) media. Percentage removals at this pH were 80.8 and 88.2%, respectively, while the equilibrium contact time was 120 minutes. The Langmuir and Freundlich models were used to interpret the equilibrium isotherms. The adsorption kinetics showed a more preferred correlation to the pseudo-second-order plot.

2.7.29 Modified cellulose fibres

The in-situ pH-sensitive cellulose fibres were prepared by anchoring BTB molecules on a cationic cellulose fibre through adsorption in an extensive study by Wang et al. [99]. The maximum adsorption capacity was 38 mg/g for 1000 mg/L of BTB / NaOH solution and a dosage of 100 mg for 120 minutes. BTB adsorption on the modified cellulose fibres took after pseudo-second-order kinetics and Freundlich isotherms. The in-situ pH-sensitive cellulose fibres showed a different colour for each pH value from 4 to 8. At the same time, the BTB remained during the pH response, which confirmed that the BTB was hooked firmly on the cationic cellulose fibre. Following this study, a new mechanism for designing a pH-sensitive fibre which may be used in evaluating the freshness of finished product without being polluted has been outlined.

2.7.30 Anodic oxidation on boron-doped diamond electrode

The Anodic Oxidation of BTB on a Boron Doped Diamond anode was studied by Maamara & Bellakhala, [98]. Optimal conditions were fixed at an applied current density of 60 mA cm², pH of 3 and treatment time of 60 minutes. Maximum discoloration yielded 99% and total discoloration was observed after 360 minutes, as well as an abatement of 67% of the COD and 59% of the TOC initial value. When applied to effluent containing BTB dye, the colour intensity decreased the COD and the TOC removal reached 94%, 59%, and 52% respectively after 360 minutes. 0.7kWh (g COD)⁻¹ and 0.91kWh (g COD)⁻¹ were respectively found after 360. The results ensure the effectiveness of the AO treatment using BDD anode, considering it as a promising environmentally friendly technology for the remediation of wastewaters containing BTB dye.

2.7.31 Soil-borne fungi

Jeniffer & Kavitha, [96] analyzed four different soil samples containing leaf litter for potential microbes for the decolourization of dyes. Decolourization of dyes was investigated in the Potato Dextrose Agar medium, with a fixed amount of dye solution (0.5%) in each case being used in the culture medium. Decolourization of dyes was seen and evaluated by the change in the original colour and visual disappearance of colour from the conditioned Petri plates. Optimisation of the physicochemical parameters like carbon source, temperature, and pH was undertaken for the decolourization process by replacing one parameter at a time. Four isolates showed dye decolourization and one isolate was found to be laccase producing organism. The study confirmed the potential of the above isolates in the decolourization of dyes such as MB and BTB and opened scope for future analysis of their performance in the treatment of textile effluent.

2.8 A Critical Assessment of Biosorption Research

Many studies on biosorption had been undertaken, however, emerging challenges in the field have continued to subject researchers to renewed efforts aimed at finding more efficient biosorbents with less cost of production. Biosorption has been identified as a better option in removing dyes from industrial effluents. However, it also has disadvantages such as early saturation of biomass, little biological control over the characteristics of the biosorbents. Further investigation with the aid of modern scientific mechanisms such as process control and modelling will ultimately assist in improving on the present scale of operation for an enhanced process. Most of the existing biosorption studies are targeted at single dye uptake systems while multi dyes sorption systems appear rarely. This may be further investigated. Improvement of immobilization of biomaterials as well as standardizing the parameters involved in the biosorption process and physicochemical conditions including reuse and recycling remain some of the way forward in this instance. The interaction between adsorbate and the adsorbent should be studied to establish the relationships and roles of functional groups in the dye adsorption process.

3. CONCLUSION

Increased production and use of dyes especially in the textile industry has largely contributed to increased environmental pollution. This review
evaluates different agricultural wastes (biosorbents), activated carbon, non-conventional low-cost materials, nanomaterial, composites and Nanocomposites as low-cost adsorbents for removal of BPB, BCG, BCP and BTB from wastewater. These biosorbents have shown considerable adsorption capacity, viable and effective for the removal of BPB, BCG, BCP and BTB from wastewater, hence, biosorption has been established as an effective, cheap, simple and readily available method of removing pollutants especially dyes. However, the majority of the examined works focused on single dye biosorption systems. However, most of the industrial effluents contain more than a single dye thus, it is essential to evaluate the performance of biosorbents in multi dyes solutions. Very little information is available on multi dyes biosorption in binary, ternary, and quaternary systems.

This development, therefore, calls for an approach that will involve the biosorption process using binary, ternary and quaternary based mechanisms. The future development of biosorption requires thorough scientific research and investigation in modelling, regeneration and immobilization of biosorbents and treatment of industrial effluents in order to meet the provision envisaged. It is thus recommended that pilot-scale laboratory experiments of such process be designed and carried out and then up-scaled for industrial application. Besides, in as much as there is more than one class of pollutant in wastewater, effort must be made to modify the biosorbents to be able to remove more than one particular class of pollutants (besides dyes) from wastewater.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. Emenike PC, Omole DO, Ngene BU, Tenebe IT. Potentiality of agricultural adsorbent for the sequestering of metal ions. Glo. J. Environ. Sci. Man. 2016;2(4): 411-442.
2. Inengite AK, Abasi CY, Johnny DB. Equilibrium studies of methylene blue dye sorption by dried water hyacinth shoot. Env. and Nat Res. Research. 2014;4(4): 120-129.
3. Swelam AA, Awad MB, Salem AM. Kinetics study on the removal of Cu(II) from aqueous solution using raw and modified pumpkin seed hulls-low cost biosorbents. Int J of Env. 2015;4(1):38-50.
4. Itodo AU, Oketunde FK. Activated Carbon: Spent, regenerated and reuse for synthetic dyestuff effluent decolourization. Int. J. Env. Mon Pro. 2017;4(4):29-37.
5. Adgeoke KA, Bello OS. Dye sequestration using agricultural wastes as adsorbents. Wat. Res and Industry. 2015;12:8-24.
6. Rajasulochana P, Preethy V. Comparison on efficiency of various techniques in treatment of waste and sewage water – A comprehensive review. Res-Eff Tech. 2016;2(4):175-184.
7. Rehman A, Ilyas S, Sultan S. Decolourization and degradation ofazo Dye, Synozol Red HF6BN, by Pleurotus ostreatus. Afr. J Biotech. 2012;11(88): 15422-15429.
8. Ramesh K, Rajappa A, Nandhakumar V. Adsorption of methylene blue onto microwave assisted zinc chloride activated carbon prepared from delonix Regia pods - isotherm and thermodynamic studies. R J Chem. Sc. 2014;4(7):36-42.
9. Ncibi MC, Mohjoub B, Ouhaibk K. Valorisation of Posidonia oceanica leaf sheaths in removing synthetic dye from aqueous media using dynamic column system. Int. J Env Waste Mgt. 2014;4:1-22.
10. Mane R, Bhusari VN. Removal of colour (dyes) from textile effluent by adsorption using orange and banana peel. Int J Eng Res App. 2012;2(3):1997-2004.
11. Massoudi FM, Etorki A. The use of peanut hull for the adsorption of colour from aqueous dye solutions and dye textile effluent. Orient. J Ch. 2011;27(3):875-884.
12. Hameed BH, Foo KY, Njoku VO. Microwave-assisted preparation of pumpkin seed hull activated carbon and its application for the adsorptive removal of 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid. The Chem Eng J. 2013;215-216:383–388.
13. Ramesh PT, Bharath KS. Fixed-bed column studies on biosorption of crystal violet from aqueous solution by Citrullus lanatus rind and Cyperus rotundus. App Wat Sc. 2013;3(4):673-687.
14. Hameed B, El-Khaiary M. Sorption Kinetics and Isotherm Studies of a Cationic Dye.
Using Agricultural Waste: Broad Bean Peels. J Hazard. Mat. 2013;154(1):639-648.

15. Tanaydin MK, Goksu A. Adsorption of hazardous crystal violet dye by almond shells and determination of optimum process conditions by Taguchi method. Des Wat Treatment. 2017;88:189-199.

16. Ponnuusami V, Seshadri V, Srivastava SN. Guava (Psidium guajava) leaf powder: Novel adsorbent for removal of methylene blue from aqueous solutions. J Hazard Mat. 2008;152(1):276-286.

17. Malik P. Use of Activated carbons prepared from sawdust and rice-husk for adsorption of acid dyes: A case study of acid yellow 36. Dyes and Pigments. 2003; 56(3):239-249.

18. Hameed BA, Ahmad AA. Batch adsorption of methylene blue from aqueous solution by garlic peel, an agricultural waste biomass. J Hazard. Mat. 2009;164(2):870-875.

19. Hameed BH. Evaluation of papaya seeds as a novel non-conventional low-cost adsorbent for removal of methylene blue. J Hazard. Mat. 2009;162(2-3):939-944.

20. Wang XS, Chen JP. Biosorption of Congo Red from Aqueous Solution using Wheat Bran and Rice Bran: Batch Studies. Sep. Sci. Tech. 2009;44(6):1452-1466.

21. Divya TD, Bhavani M, Sridevi V, Snehalatha P, Lohita M. Biosorption of Methylene Blue Dye from Aqueous Solution using Papaya Peel. Int. J Inno Res Sci Eng Tech. 2013;2(8):2319-2753.

22. Farinas CS, Freitas JV. Sugarcane Bagasse Fly Ash as a No-Cost Adsorbent for Removal of Phenolic Inhibitors and Improvement of Biomass Saccharification. ACS Sustainable Chem. Eng. 2017;5(12):11727–11736.

23. Moon WC, Palaniandy P. A review on interesting properties of chicken feather as low-cost adsorbent. Int J Integrated Eng. 2019;11(2):136-146.

24. Xiao-Lan Y, Yong H. Optimal ranges of variables for an effective adsorption of lead(II) by the agricultural waste pomelo (Citrus grandis) peels using Doehlert designs. Open Access. 2018;729.

25. Bayuo J, Pelig-Ba KB, Abukari MA. Adsorptive removal of chromium(VI) from aqueous solution unto groundnut shell. App. Wat Sci. 2019;9(107):987-998.

26. Mawla G. Different types of dyes with chemical structure. Department of Textile Engineering: Daffodil International University; 2010.

27. Shindy HA. Basics in colours, dyes and pigments chemistry: A review. Che. Int. 2016;2(1):29-36.

28. Benkhaya S, El Harfi S, El Harfi A. Classifications, properties and applications of textile dyes: A review. Appl. J. Environ. Eng. Sci. 2017;3(3):311-320.

29. Farah MD, Gisele AR, Elisa RA, Juliano CC, Maria VB, Danielle PD Textile Dyes: Dyeing Process and Environmental Impact. InTech Open Access; 2013.

30. Abubakar SI, Ibrahim BM. Adsorption of bromophenol blue and bromothymol blue dyes onto raw maize cob. Bayero J Pure App Sc. 2018;11(1):273-281.

31. Solairaj D, Palanivel R, Srinivasan P. Adsorption of Methylene Blue, Bromophenol Blue and Coomassie Brilliant Blue by α-Chitin Nanoparticles. J Adv Res. 2015;27(1):1-11.

32. Fernández E, Alonso SG, Gonzalez BL, Gago MD, Vaktangova NB, Moreira VG. Overestimation of albumin measured by bromocresol green vs bromocresol purple method: influence of acute-phase globulins. Lab. Med. 2018;49(6):49-67.

33. Hirayama S, Ueno T, Sugihara M, Miida T. The bromocresol green assay, but not the modified bromocresol purple assay, overestimates the serum albumin concentration in nephrotic syndrome through reaction with α2-macroglobulin. Annals Clinic. Biochem. 2015;53(1):97-105.

34. Harbowy M. How does pH paperwork? Counter Culture Labs. 2017;1-7.

35. Jin Y, Xu X, Wang M, Li C, Zhao Y, Hou H. Single-cell pH imaging and detection for pH profiling and label-free rapid identification of cancer-cells. Sci Rep. 2017;7(1):1-17.

36. Akram ME-D, Sameh MH, Ahmed AS. Application of bromocresol green and bromothymol blue for the extractive spectrophotometric determination of anti-hypertensive drugs. J App. Pharm Sc. 2015;5(7):122-129.

37. Komolafe CA, Agboola BS, Adejumo OD, Areola JB. Modern conventional water treatment technologies and challenges for optimal utilization in Nigeria. Landmark...
38. Van-Loosdrecht MCM, Nielsen PH, Lopez-Vazquez CM, Brdjanovic D. Experimental methods in wastewater treatment. IWA Publishing, pg. 350, ISBN 9781780404745 (Hardback) 9781780404752 (eBook); 2016.

39. Maulin PS, Borasiya H. Industrial wastewater treatment. Journal of Applied Microbiology and Biochemistry. 2017;1(1):1-5.

40. Vigneswaran S, Ngo HH, Visvanathan C, Sundaravadivel M. Conventional Water Treatment Technologies. (E. o. Systems, Ed.) Wastewater Recycle, Reuse, and Reclamation. 2015;2(1):1-7.

41. Sahu O, Mazumdar B, Chaudhari PK. Treatment of wastewater by electrocoagulation: a review. Environ Sci Pollut Res. 2014;(21):2397–2413. Available: https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-013-2208-6

42. Lum PT, Foo KY, Zakaria NA, Palaniandy P. Ash based nanocomposites for photocatalytic degradation of textile dye pollutants: A review. Mat Chem Phy. 2020; (241)122405.

43. Baraniak BM, Walerianczyk E. Flocculation encyclopaedia of food sciences and nutrition 2nd Ed 2003;2531-2535

44. Wahid ZA, Mohd Rawi SN, Nasrullah M, Wahidatul AZ. Pretreatment of reactive dye from textile wastewater by coagulation technology. Int. Res J Eng Tech. 2016; 3(12):56-72.

45. Biswanath B, Uma SP, Tarun KB. Bioremediation and detoxification technology for treatment of dye(s) from textile effluent. Tex. Wastewater Treat. 2016;75-92.

46. Yusoff MS, Mohammadizaroun M. Review on Landfill Leachate and Wastewater Treatment Using Physical-Chemical Techniques: Their Performance and Limitations. Int J Current Life Sc. 2014; 4(12):12068-12074.

47. Dineshkumar M, Sivalingam A, Kannadasan T. Analysis on removal of dyes from textile effluent. Elixir Int J Chem Eng. 2015;(79):30501-30507

48. Cheremisinoff NP. Handbook of water and wastewater treatment technologies (1st Edition ed.). Elsevier Butterworth-Heinemann; 2001.

49. Aadil A, Shahzad M, Kashif S, Muhammad M, Rabia A, Saba A. Comparative study of adsorptive removal of congo red and brilliant green dyes from water using peanut shell. Middle-East J Sci Res. 2012; 11(6):828-832.

50. Dada EO, Ojo IA, Alade AO, Afolabi TJ, Amuda OS Jameel AT Biosorption of Bromophenol Blue from Aqueous Solution Using Flamboyant (Delonix regia)Pod. Chem. Sci Int J 2020;29(5):32-50.

51. Sunil K, Gunasekar V, Ponnumsami V. Removal of methylene blue from aqueous Effluent using fixed bed of groundnut SHELL Powder. J Chem. 2013:1-5. Available:https://doi.org/10.1155/2013/259819

52. Rahulkumar M, Tonmoy G, Chetan P, Anupama S, Kaumeeel C, Imran P, et al. Biosorption of methylene blue by de-oiled algal biomass: equilibrium, kinetics and artificial neural network modelling. Discipline of Salt & Marine Chemicals, CSIR - Central Salt & Marine Chemicals Research Institute. 2013;1:1-13. Available:https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0109545

53. Akram H, Ali M, Hassan R, Wassim R, Houssein A. Biosorption of methylene blue from wastewater using Lebanese cymbopogon citratus (Citronnelle). European Sci J. 2015;11(21):1857–1881.

54. Rhoda HG. Kinetic studies of methylene blue adsorption on to activated carbon prepared from plantain pod (Musa paradisiac). British J App Sci Tech. 2016; 15(3):1-14.

55. Boya V, Regine HS. Biosorption: A solution to pollution? Int Microbiol. 2000;3:17–24.

56. Ahmaruzzaman MD. Adsorption of Phenolic compounds on low-cost adsorbents: A Review. Adv Colloid Interface Sci. 2008;143(1-2):48-67.

57. Carolin F, Ponnusamy SK, Saravanan A, Naushad M. Efficient techniques for the removal of toxic heavy metals from aquatic environment: A Review. J Env Chem Eng. 2017;5(3):5-29.

58. Bansal RC, Goyal M. Activated carbon adsorption from solutions. In: Bansal RC, Goyal M., Eds., Activated Carbon Adsorption, CRC Press, Boca Raton, 2005;145-196. Available:http://dx.doi.org/10.1201/9781420028812.ch3
69. Asfaram A, Ghaedi M, Hajati S, Bazrafshan A. Simultaneous ultrasound-assisted ternary adsorption of dyes onto copper-doped zinc sulfide nanoparticles loaded on activated carbon: Optimization by response surface methodology. Spectro. Act. Part A Mol Biomol Spectro. 2015;145:203-212.

70. Shengbo G, Zhenling L, Yuzo F, Wanxi P. Characteristics of activated carbon remove sulfur particles against smog Saudi J Biol Sci. 2017;24(6):1370–1374.

71. Curdts B, Pfitsch C, Pasel C, Helmich M, Baten D, Atakan B. Novel silica-based adsorbents with activated carbon structure. Sci Direct. 2015;210:202-205.

72. Karmen M, Nataša ZL, Mario S, Anamarija F. Natural zeolites in water treatment – How Effective is Their Use. Golden Access J. 2013;77:87.

73. Bello OS, Adeyemo AA, Adeoye IO. Adsorption of dyes from aqueous solution on activated carbon: A review. Appl Water Sci. 2017;7:543–568.

74. Iqbal MJ, Ashiq MN. Adsorption of dyes from aqueous solutions on activated charcoal. J Hazard Mat. 2007;57:57–66.

75. Onu CE, Oguanobi NC, Okonkwo CO, Nnamdi BJ. Application of modified agricultural waste in the adsorption of bromocresol green dye. Asian J Chem Sci. 2020;7(1):15-24.

76. Ahmed MA, Abou-Gamr ZM. Mesoporous MgO nanoparticles as a potential sorbent for removal of fast orange and bromophenol blue dyes. Nanotechnol. Env. Eng. 2016;1:1-10.

77. Ahmed M, Amin M, El-Gamal S. Removal of methyl orange and bromophenol blue dyes from aqueous solution using Sorel’s cement nanoparticles. J Env Chem Eng. 2015;3:1702–1712.

78. Rameshthangam P, Solairaj D, Srinivasan P. Adsorption of Methylene Blue, Bromophenol Blue and Coomassie Brilliant Blue by α-Chitin Nanoparticles. J Adv Research. 2015;3(3):1-13.

79. Huajiao Q, Liangliang L, Aiping X, Yumin H, Yi L. Preparation of Magnetic Fe3O4/ML-88A Nanocomposite and Its Adsorption Properties for Bromophenol Blue Dye in Aqueous Solution. Nanomaterials. 2019;9(51):1-14.

80. Ghosh UC, Biswas K. Adsorption behaviour of Bromophenol blue from the aqueous solution on Labeo bata fish scale, a bio-waste material. Int J Chem Tech. 2019;26:321-329.

81. Kang ML, Mohamed B, Youssef Z, Beom SK, Choe I. A comparative study on biosorption characteristics of certain fungi for bromophenol blue dye. App Biochem Biotech. 2006;134:51-60.

82. Kim CS, Lee KM, Blaghen M, Zeroual Y, Kim BS. Biosorption of bromophenol blue from aqueous solutions by rhizopus stolonifer biomass. Water, Air, Soil Pollution. 2006;177:135–146.

83. Singh L, Singh VP. Biodegradation of Textile Dyes, Bromophenol Blue and Congored by Fungus Aspergillus Flavus. Environ. We Int. J. Sci. Tech. 2010;5:235-242.

84. Ebenso EE, Onen AI, Maitera ON, Joseph J. Corrosion inhibition potential and adsorption behaviour of bromophenol blue and thymol blue dyes on mild steel in acidic medium. Int J of Electrochem. 2001;6:2884-2897.

85. Mashkour MS. Decolourisation of bromophenol blue dye under UV-Radiation with ZnO as Catalyst. Iraqi Nat J Chem. 2012;46:189-198.

86. Hang S, Jiabing L, Shun Y, Litao W, Weixia Z, Jing X. Adsorption of bromophenol blue from aqueous samples by novel supported ionic liquids. Research Article. 2013;230-238.

87. Durães L, Portugal A, Valente AJ, Gando-Ferreira L, Quina MJ, Marques J. et al. Silica-based aerogels as adsorbents for phenol-derivative compounds. Colloids and Surfaces A: Physicochem Eng Aspects. 2015;480:260–269.

88. Okoye CC, Okey-Onyesolu CF, Chime DC, Achike CC. Adsorptive removal of bromophenol blue dye from aqueous solution using activated carbon. Int J Sci Research Mgt. 2018;6(3):1-15.

89. Kashif G, Saima S, Faiza A, Intiaz A, Adnan K, Nouman K. et al. Highly efficient removal of acid red-17 and bromophenol blue dyes from industrial wastewater using graphene oxide functionalized magnetic chitosan composite. Mat Sci. Polymer Composites. 2018;39(9):3317-3328.

90. Pablo RD, Thayannah MD, Lóbo AP, Tokumoto MS, Raiido MD, Ivon PL. Removal of bromophenol blue anionic dye from water using a modified exuviae of Hermetia Illucens larvae as biosorbent. Environ Monit Assess. 2020;192:197.
81. Parhi PK, Murmu BM, Behera SS, Das S, Mohapatra RK, Bindhani BK. Extensive investigation on the study for the adsorption of Bromocresol Green (BCG) dye using activated Phragmites karka. Indian J Chem Tech. 2018;25:409-420.

82. Shokrollahi A, Alizadeh A, Malekhosseini Z, Ranjbar M. Removal of bromocresol green from aqueous solution via adsorption on Ziziphus nummularia as a new, natural, and low-cost adsorbent: Kinetic and Thermodynamic Study of Removal Process. J Chem Eng Data. 2011;56: 3738-3746.

83. Liu D, Yuan J, Li J, Zhang G. Preparation of Chitosan Poly(methacrylate) Composites for Adsorption of Bromocresol Green. American Chem Soc Omega. 2019; 4:12680–12686.

84. Kindala TJ, Kayembe SJ, Kifuani KA, Ilinga LB, Taba KM. Removal of methylene blue, bromocresol green and methyl red dyes from aqueous solutions by adsorption using Bryophyllum pinnatum Kurz stem powder and its activated carbon. Congo Sci. 2015;3(2): 67-74.

85. Rezaei H, Shahbazi A, Salmalian E. Removal of bromocresol green from aqueous solutions using chitin nanofibers. Env Resources Research. 2019;7(2):79-86.

86. Bhanuprakash M, Belagali SL. Study of Adsorption Phenomena by Using Almond Husk for Removal of Aqueous Dyes. Current World Env. 2017;12(1):80-88.

87. Khan I, Rahman NU, Ali A, Saeed K. Adsorption of cobalt on activated charcoal and its utilization for decolourization of bromocresol green dye. Bulgarian Chem Comm. 2019;51(4):488–493.

88. Abdulganiyu AR, Ibrahim MB. Kinetics and thermodynamics studies for the removal of bromocresol purple using raw bentonite clay and activated carbon from vachellia nilotica pod as adsorbents. Bayero J Pure App Sci. 2018;11(1):17-26.

89. Shalabi M, Abdelwahhab MZ, Farag HA, Ibrahim HM, El-Dars FM. Preparation, characterization of bentonite carbon composite and design. J Multidisciplinary Eng Sci Tech. (JMEST). 2016;3(1):3758–3765.

90. Akram M. El-Didamony, Sameh M. Hafeez Ismail IA. Extractive Spectrophotometric Method for the Determination of Some Antipsychotic Drugs Using Eriochrome Black T. J App Pharm Sci. 2015;5(06):026-033.

91. Jodłowski GS, Orzechowska-Zięba A, Wójcik M. Biosorbents for waste water cleaning from coloring agents. IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science. 2019;1:11.

92. Sawsan MA. Comparison between three methods to removal of carminic acid and bromocresol purple from wastewater via used silver nanoparticle, ferrous Sulfate and Hydrogen Peroxide. Int J Adv Research Chem Sci. 2014;1(9):30-37.

93. El-Dars FM, Ibrahim HM, Farag HA, Abdelwahhab MZ, Shalabi M Using bentonite carbon composite material for adsorption of bromocresol purple and methylene blue. Int J Sci Eng Research. 2015;6(10):188-187.

94. Djebbar K, Bousnoubra I, Abdessemed A, Sehili T. Decolourization of methyl green and bromocresol purple in mono and binary systems by photochemical processes: direct UV photolysis, Acetone/UV and H2O2/UV. A comparative study. Desalination Wat Treatment. 2016; 1-16.

95. Bousnoubra I, Sehili T, Djebbar K. Treatment of Bromocresol Purple Dye by Several Photochemical Processes in Aqueous Medium: A comparative study. Der Pharma Chem. 2017;9(5):13-17.

96. Jeniffer SD, Kavitha J. Isolation and optimization of soil borne fungi to decolourize bromothymol blue and methylene blue [Jeniffer Sylvia D]. Int J Adv Research. 2015;3(4):894-903.

97. Taghried AS, Abeer EA. Adsorption of Bromothymol Blue dye from Aqueous Solutions using Sawdust treated by polyaniline. Research J Pharma Biol Chem Sci. 2016;7(6):591-604.

98. Maamara M, Bellakhala N. Treatment of a Tunisian textile effluent containing Bromothymol Blue dye using anodic oxidation on Boron Doped Diamond electrode. J Tunisian Chem Soc. 2017;19: 32-42.

99. Wang L, Cao L, Liang T, Zhang X, Liu W, Zhan X, et al. In-Situ pH-Sensitive Fibers via the Anchoring of Bromothymol Blue on Cellulose Grafted with Hydroxypropyl triethylamine Groups via Adsorption. Polymers J. 2018;10(709):1-13.
100. Said Hassan L, Balsam K A–R, Fawzi SK. Thermodynamic Assessment, Kinetic and Adsorptive–removal of Bromothymol Blue Isotherm Modeling. Current Green Che. as Acidic–dye Probe from Water Solution 2019;6(1):1-9. Using Latvian Sphagnum Peat Moss:

© 2020 Dada et al.; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history:
The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
http://www.sdiarticle4.com/review-history/61883