Sarcoidosis is a multisystem disease that mainly affects the lung and lymph nodes via an unknown cause, characterised by a noncaseating epithelioid cell granuloma lesion (1). Although the aetiology of sarcoidosis still remains unclear, it is likely that both a genetic predisposition and environmental agents are involved in the pathogenesis of the disease. Among several potential genetic risk factors, the association of polymorphism of NOD2/CARD15 gene with a risk of sarcoidosis has been extensively evaluated with inconsistent results in recent decades.

The human nucleotide binding oligomerisation domain containing 2 (NOD2) gene, also named CARD15 or NOD2/CARD15, is located on chromosome 16q12, recognised as a major susceptibility gene for Crohn’s disease (CD) (2). This gene encodes a protein comprised of two caspase recruitment do-
mains (CARD) and six leucine-rich repeats (LRRs) (2). This protein is primarily expressed in peripheral leukocytes and plays a part in the inherent immune response through the recognition of the muramyl dipeptide (MDP) which is a component part of the bacterial cell wall (3).

Lots of studies have shown that Blau syndrome, thought to be an early-onset variant of sarcoidosis, is a rare genetic disorder caused by distinct mutations in the CARD15 gene. Meanwhile, recent advances have suggested the similarities in the pathogenesis characterised by an excessive immune response to unknown stimuli between sarcoidosis and CD (1, 4). Based on these findings, a significant body of work has been carried out regarding the associations of CD and Blau syndrome-related mutations with sarcoidosis, and novel potential sarcoidosis-associated mutations have also been discovered. Among NOD2/CARD15 genes involved in sarcoidosis, three CD-associated CARD15 mutations, R702W (rs2066844), G908R (rs2066845) and L1007fs (rs2066847) are most frequently studied. They cluster near the LRR, causing the immune response to MDP to be lowered (3).

However, the results from earlier studies have been inconsistent. Furthermore, many studies were of a small size and may be not sufficient to establish comprehensive conclusions. We performed this meta-analysis to further assess the associations between NOD2/CARD15 rs2066844, rs2066845, rs2066847, rs1861759 gene polymorphisms and the risk of sarcoidosis.

**Methods**

**Study selection**

This meta-analysis was conducted following the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-analysis (PRISMA) criteria (5). Two investigators (Xuping Chen, Zhenxing Zhou) independently searched Embase, PubMed, China National Knowledge Internet (CNKI) database and Wanfang database up until 8th October 2016. Agreements were attained through discussion or judged by a third author (Xiaodong Yang). All eligible papers were screened and their references were checked for any relevant studies. The search words used were as follows: ‘sarcoidosis’ or ‘sarcoidoses’ and ‘NOD2/CARD15’ or, ‘NOD2’ or ‘CARD15’ and ‘Allele’ or ‘variation’ or ‘Mutation’ or ‘polymorphism’. The language was not restricted. The inclusion criteria were as follows: (1) case-control designs on unrelated individuals; (2) evaluating the NOD2/CARD15 polymorphisms and sarcoidosis risk; (3) the controls in accordance with the Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (HWE); (4) odds ratios (OR) with 95% confidence intervals (95% CI) or enough data for their calculation were available; (5) In case of repeated or overlapping reports, only the one with most subjects was included. Exclusion criteria were as follows: (1) abstracts, reviews and studies with repeated data or without other essential information; (2) where allelic frequencies associated data could not be obtained; (3) sibling pairs or family-based research design.

**Quality assessment**

Two authors assessed the quality of included studies independently based on the Newcastle-Ottawa scale (NOS) (6), which evaluates the quality of observational studies according to the following three aspects: selection, comparability and exposure. The numbers of stars given for each aspect were cumulated to assess the study quality and studies which obtained 0-3 stars and 7-9 stars were rated as low and high quality, respectively.

**Date Extraction**

Data were extracted by two readers (Xuping Chen and Zhenxing Zhou) for each eligible study that included the necessary inclusion terms. Whenever there was a disagreement, a third author (Yi Zhang) evaluated these articles. For each individual report, information about the first author, year of publication, ethnicity, country, size of case and control, HWE, single-nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) and their genotype frequency data was collected.

**Statistical Method**

In this study, statistical analysis was calculated by STATA12.0 software and Revman5.3 software. For a measurement of the strength of associations between NOD2/CARD15 rs2066844, rs2066845, rs2066847, rs1861759 gene polymorphisms and sar-
coidosis susceptibility in allelic, dominant, recessive and additive model selectively, the OR and 95% CI were employed. A Z-test was performed to determine the significance of the pooled OR. Heterogeneity among studies was evaluated by a Q test and I² test ($I^2=100\%\times(Q_{df}/Q$). There was considered to be no significant heterogeneity among studies if $p>0.10$ and $I^2<50\%$ and then the fixed-effect model was chosen to test the OR; otherwise, the random effect model was used. Subgroup analysis was further assessed by ethnicity if possible. Publication bias was evaluated with several methods including funnel plots, Egger’s test and Begg’s test. As for the sensitivity analysis, a leave-one-out method was used to check the constancy of the results and to search for the source of heterogeneity if required. Statistically significant difference was considered if the P-value <0.05.

Results

Study characteristics

In all, 36 English studies and two Chinese studies conformed to the search strategy after an initial search of PubMed, Embase, CNKI and the Wanfang database. Eight relevant studies about the association of NOD2/CARD15 gene polymorphisms with risk of sarcoidosis were ultimately incorporated into the meta-analysis. The flow diagram of selecting studies was presented in Figure 1.

Six studies were identified to evaluate the SNP rs2066844 of NOD2/CARD15 and sarcoidosis (4, 7-11); five studies included data regarding SNP rs2066845 and rs2066847 (4, 7, 8, 11, 12) whilst three articles contained data about SNP rs1861759 (8, 9, 13). Among the eight articles, 2 were from

Fig. 1. The flow diagram of included and excluded studies
Germany, two from Denmark, whilst the others were from other countries (Greek, England, Italy, Japan etc.); the majority of the participants were Caucasians. Notably, since two studies (9, 12) used the same source of patients and controls, they contained information involving different SNPs and therefore they were taken as different studies. In case of double counting for the same SNPs in these two studies (9, 12), only data with the most subjects for each different SNP was chosen and calculated. The general features of all included studies are summarised in Table 1.

Assessment of study quality

To evaluate the quality of the included studies, the NOS scoring system was utilised. Three studies scored nine stars, another three scored eight stars, two studies scored seven stars whilst two also scored six stars (Table 1). No study was rated to be low quality.

Table 1. The baseline characteristics of eight studies included in this meta-analysis

| Nucleotide change | Amino acid change | First author | Year | Country | Ethnicity | NOS Score | HWE       | Total sample size | Allele distributions |
|-------------------|-------------------|--------------|------|---------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-------------------|----------------------|
| rs2066844         | 2104C>T           | R702W        |      |         |           |           |           |                   |                      |
|                   |                   | Gazouli      | 2006 | Greek   | Caucasian | 9         | Y         | 100 150 191 9 295 5 |
|                   |                   | H. SATO      | 2010 | England | Caucasian | 8         | Y         | 185 347 351 19 658 36 |
|                   |                   | Milman N     | 2007 | Danes   | Caucasian | 9         | Y         | 52 103 100 4 198 8  |
|                   |                   | Pabst S      | 2011 | Germany | Caucasian | 8         | Y         | 300 381 571 29 715 47 |
|                   |                   | Schurmann M  | 2003 | Germany | Caucasian | 7         | Y         | 127 265 235 19 505 25 |
|                   |                   | Zorzetto M   | 2005 | Italy   | Caucasian | 6         | Y         | 68 208 130 6 398 18 |
| rs2066845         | 2722G>C           | G908R        |      |         |           |           |           |                   |                      |
|                   |                   | Gazouli M    | 2006 | Greek   | Caucasian | 9         | Y         | 100 150 182 18 289 11 |
|                   |                   | H. SATO      | 2010 | England | Caucasian | 8         | Y         | 185 347 368 2 684 10 |
|                   |                   | Milman       | 2007 | Danes   | Caucasian | 9         | Y         | 53 103 104 2 204 2 |
|                   |                   | Schurmann M  | 2003 | Germany | Caucasian | 7         | Y         | 127 265 246 8 526 4 |
|                   |                   | Zorzetto M   | 2005 | Italy   | Caucasian | 6         | Y         | 68 208 133 3 409 7 |
| rs2066847         | 3020insC          | 1007fs       |      |         |           |           |           |                   |                      |
|                   |                   | Gazouli M    | 2006 | Greek   | Caucasian | 9         | Y         | 100 150 178 22 278 22 |
|                   |                   | H. SATO      | 2010 | England | Caucasian | 8         | Y         | 185 347 367 3 683 11 |
|                   |                   | Milman       | 2007 | Danes   | Caucasian | 9         | Y         | 53 103 104 2 202 4 |
|                   |                   | Schurmann M  | 2003 | Germany | Caucasian | 7         | Y         | 127 265 246 8 511 19 |
|                   |                   | Zorzetto M   | 2005 | Italy   | Caucasian | 6         | Y         | 68 208 135 1 406 10 |
| rs1861759         | 1761T>G           | R587R        |      |         |           |           |           |                   |                      |
|                   |                   | H. SATO      | 2010 | England | Caucasian | 8         | Y         | 185 347 222 148 439 255 |
|                   |                   | Akakoshi M   | 2008 | Japanese| Japanese  | 8         | Y         | 135 95 234 36 171 19 |
|                   |                   | Milman N     | 2007 | Danes   | Caucasian | 9         | Y         | 52 103 62 42 123 83 |

WT: wild-Type; insC: insertion C HWE: Hardy-Weinberg Equilibrium

Quantitative analysis

NOD2/CARD15 rs2066844 and susceptibility to sarcoidosis

Six studies assessed the association between the SNP rs2066844 C/T polymorphism and sarcoidosis. However, no significant association was identified in the total analysis in either an allelic, dominant or recessive model (OR=1.08, 95% CI=0.81-1.42, P=0.61 for T vs. C; OR=0.97, 95% CI=0.73-1.30, P=0.85 for CT + TT vs. CC; OR=2.89, 95% CI=0.78-10.71, P=0.11 for TT vs. CT + CC). No significant heterogeneity across the studies was discovered (Table 2). All these studies involved Caucasians, so we did not perform the subgroup analysis.

NOD2/CARD15 rs2066845 and susceptibility to sarcoidosis

Five studies with available genotype data evaluated the association between SNP rs2066845 G/C polymorphism and the risk of sarcoidosis. We found
that the C allele of rs2066845 was associated with an increased risk of sarcoidosis in the allelic model (C vs. G, OR=1.86, 95%CI: 1.14-3.04, P=0.01), under the fixed-effect model, considering a moderate heterogeneity across the studies (I^2=43%, P=0.13). Similar results under a dominant model (GC + CC vs. GG, OR=1.84, 95%CI: 1.11-3.05, P=0.02) and additive model (GC vs. GG, OR=1.79, 95%CI: 1.08-2.97, P=0.02) were also found, which means individuals carrying the “C” allele (GC or CC carriers) were more susceptible to sarcoidosis compared with the GG carriers (Figure 2). No subgroup analysis was performed because these studies only involved Caucasians.

**NOD2/CARD15 rs1861759 and susceptibility to sarcoidosis**

Five studies evaluated the association between SNP rs1861759 T/G polymorphism and the risk of sarcoidosis. We found no statistically significant association in the total analysis (OR=1.15, 95%CI:0.93-1.42, P=0.21 for G vs. T). Only an association in allelic model could be calculated with the limited data. No heterogeneity was revealed across the studies (Table 2).

**Sensitivity analysis**

For rs2066845, the sensitivity analysis was carried out by the change of effect model and leave-one-out method to check the stability of the results. The random effect model was carried out to test the OR. However, the opposite result (OR=1.79, 95%CI:0.65-1.55, P =0.99 for GC vs. GG) was obtained, which was contrary to the previous result. This sensitivity analysis showed the instability of the result of the association between rs2066845 and risk of sar-
**Fig. 2.** Forest plots of OR with 95% CI for the association between rs2066845 and risk of sarcoidosis with results both in overall and removing ‘H.sato 2010’ analysis in allelic model (a), dominant model (b), and additive model (c) independently.
NOD2/CARD15 and sarcoidosis susceptibility

It was assumed that this inconsistency was caused by the existence of heterogeneity ($I^2=43\%$, $P=0.13$). Thus, sensitivity analysis was further applied to search the source of heterogeneity by the leave-one-out method. Moreover, there was no significant influence on the heterogeneity between studies by sequentially removing each individual study except one published by H. Sato et al. 2010. After this, no heterogeneity was observed across the remaining studies ($p=0.64$, $I^2=0\%$) and more statistically significant differences were found in allelic, dominant and additive model respectively after removing this single study (OR: $2.54$, 95% CI: 1.46–4.39, $P=0.001$ for C vs. G; OR: $2.55$, 95% CI: 1.45–4.49, $P=0.001$ for GC + CC vs. GG; OR: $2.47$, 95% CI: 1.40–4.36, $P=0.002$ for GC vs. GG). The result after removing the study of Sato et al. 2010 was consistent with the previous result in the total analysis (Table 2) (Figure 2).

Statistically similar results for rs2066844, rs2066847, rs1861759 were obtained after sequentially removing each individual study, suggesting the stability of this meta-analysis for the three mutations.

Publication bias

No significant publication bias was detected either by Egger’s test or Begg’s test in allelic model (Table 2), as were the funnel plots for the associations between NOD2/CARD15 and sarcoidosis (figure not shown).

Discussion

The aetiology of sarcoidosis has been extensively studied but has so far remained unclear for more than 100 years. An increasing body of evidence suggested that various factors may contribute to the pathogenesis of sarcoidosis, such as microbe-rich environment, occupational exposure, seasonal factor and immune status (14). As well as this, the gene polymorphisms have also been reported to be strongly associated with the risk of sarcoidosis. Prior studies revealed that the gene polymorphisms of ANXA11, BTN2L, CCR2–64I and TNF-α might also be important risk factors (15–18). In addition, recent research have deeply explored the association of sarcoidosis risk with NOD2/CARD15 gene, especially the mutations associated with Blau syndrome and CD (2, 9). However, the outcomes from these studies have not been consistent. Thus, this meta-analysis was first carried out to extensively analyse the associations between NOD2/CARD15 gene polymorphisms and the risk of sarcoidosis.

A total of 2,517 people (968 cases and 1549 controls) in eight case-control studies were included in the present meta-analysis. The associations between NOD2/CARD15 rs2066845, rs2066844, rs2066847, rs1861759 SNPs and the risk of sarcoidosis were rated. Since all participants included were Caucasian, the results of this study only be applicable to this ethnicity.

No statistical associations were found between the rs2066844, rs2066847, rs1861759 polymorphisms and a susceptibility of sarcoidosis for our overall analysis using different genetic models. There was only slight modification after sequentially excluding an individual study. Furthermore, no publication bias was documented. These features indicated a stable and reliable results about the associations between the three mutations and sarcoidosis susceptibility. Therefore, the consequences above indicated that the rs2066844, rs2066847 and rs1861759 polymorphisms in the NOD2/CARD15 gene might not be a risk factor for sarcoidosis, especially in Caucasians.

For rs2066845, the results suggested that the individuals of Caucasians who carry the variant allele might be at an increased risk of developing sarcoidosis. There was moderate heterogeneity across the studies. The results of the sensitivity analysis revealed that the study of Sato et al. 2010 was found to be highly responsible for the emergence of heterogeneity among studies. Other data statistics were calculated after removing the single study, with results showing similar statistically significant results but without any heterogeneity among the remaining studies. Further sensitivity analysis also revealed a reliable and stable character. We then carried out a thorough analysis of this study whose result indicated no association of rs2066845 with a risk of sarcoidosis. This study met both our inclusion and exclusion criteria. The difference might be from regional difference, linkage disequilibrium, the variation in the technique used or other underlying factors. All in all, cautions are required when interpreting this result.

The were some limitations of this meta-analysis. Firstly, only eight articles were included due to
limited studies on the associations between NOD2/CARD15 polymorphisms and sarcoidosis risk, which most significantly limited the power of this study. Secondly, since the data included were primarily from Europeans, the outcomes might only be applicable to these ethnic groups. Thirdly, only one study from Asia was included, so caution must be taken when we make reference to this result. Finally, due to a lack of data on the clinical course, prognosis or other clinical variables of the original studies, further subgroup analysis was not able to be performed.

In conclusion, the meta-analysis revealed that NOD2/CARD15 rs2066845 polymorphism might be a risk factor contributing to sarcoidosis susceptibility, especially for Caucasians. Meanwhile, no significant association between the NOD2/CARD15 rs2066844, rs2066847, rs1861759 gene polymorphisms and risk of sarcoidosis were found. Despite this, larger case-control studies with appropriate design in diverse ethnicities are warranted to validate our results.

Acknowledgement

We thanks Dongze Li, MBBS, in Department of Emergency Medicine, West China Hospital, Sichuan University, Chengdu, Sichuan, China and Nan Chen, a Ph.D. student in West China Hospital, Sichuan University, Chengdu, P.R.China, in the writing of the report and the decision to submit the manuscript for publication.

References

1. Statement on sarcoidosis. Joint Statement of the American Thoracic Society (ATS), the European Respiratory Society (ERS) and the World Association of Sarcoidosis and Other Granulomatous Disorders (WASOG) adopted by the ATS Board of Directors and by the ERS Executive Committee, February 1999. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 1999; 160: 736-55.
2. Hugot JP, Chamaillard M, Zouali H, et al. Association of NOD2 leucine-rich repeat variants with susceptibility to Crohn's disease. Nature 2001; 411: 599-603.
3. Mann JK, Shen J, Park S. Enhancement of Muramyl Dipeptide-Dependent NOD2 activity by a self-derived peptide. J Cell Biochem 2016; 9999: 1-12.
4. Schurmann M, Valentyne R, Hampe J, et al. CARD15 gene mutations in sarcoidosis. Eur Respir J 2003; 22: 748-54.
5. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: The PRISMA statement. Int J Surg 2010; 8: 336-41.
6. Stang A. Critical evaluation of the Newcastle–Ottawa scale for the assessment of the quality of nonrandomized studies in meta-analyses. Eur J Epidemiol 2010; 25: 603-5.
7. Gazouli M, Koundourakis A, Ikonomopoulos J, et al. CARD15/ NOD2, CD14, and toll-like receptor 4 gene polymorphisms in Greek patients with sarcoidosis. Sarcoidosis Vasc Diffuse Lung Dis 2006; 23: 23-9.
8. Sato H, Williams HR, Spagnolo P, et al. CARD15/NOD2 polymorphisms are associated with severe pulmonary sarcoidosis. Eur Respir J 2010; 35: 324-30.
9. Milman N, Nielsen FC, Hviid TV, et al. Blau syndrome-associated mutations in exon 4 of the caspase activating recruitment domain 15 (CARD15) gene are not found in ethnic Danes with sarcoidosis. Clin Respir J 2007; 1: 74-9.
10. Pabst S, Golcievski M, Herms S, et al. Caspase recruitment domain 15 gene haplotypes in sarcoidosis. Tissue Antigens 2011; 77: 333-7.
11. Forretto I, Campo I, et al. NOD2/CARD15 gene polymorphisms in idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis. Sarcoidosis Vasc Diffuse Lung Dis 2005; 22: 180-5.
12. Milman N, Nielsen OH, Hviid TV, et al. CARD15 single nucleotide polymorphisms 8, 12 and 13 are not increased in ethnic Danes with sarcoidosis. Respiration 2007; 74: 76-9.
13. Akahoshi M, Ishihara M, Namba K, et al. Mutation screening of the CARD15 gene in sarcoidosis. Tissue Antigens 2008; 71: 564-7.
14. Eishi Y. Etiologic link between sarcoidosis and Propionibacterium acnes. Respir Investig 2013; 51: 56-68.
15. Zhou H, Diao M, Zhang M. The association between ANXA11 gene polymorphisms and sarcoidosis: a meta-analysis and systematic review. Sarcoidosis Vasc Diffuse Lung Dis 2016; 33: 102-11.
16. Liu Y, Wei J, Fan L, et al. BTNL2 gene polymorphism and sarcoidosis susceptibility: a meta-analysis. PLoS One 2015; 10: e0122639.
17. Petrek M, Drabek J, Kolek V, et al. CC chemokine receptor gene polymorphisms in Czech patients with pulmonary sarcoidosis. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2000; 162: 1000-3.
18. Medica I, Kastrin A, Mavor A, et al. Role of genetic polymorphisms in ACE and TNF-alpha gene in sarcoidosis: a meta-analysis. J Hum Genet 2007; 52: 836-47.