WHERE TO FIND HABITABLE “EARTHS” IN CIRCUMBINARY SYSTEMS

HUI-GEN LIU, HUI ZHANG, AND JI-LIN ZHOU
School of Astronomy and Space Science & Key Laboratory of Modern Astronomy and Astrophysics in Ministry of Education, Nanjing University, Nanjing 210093, China; huigen@nju.edu.cn
Received 2013 February 3; accepted 2013 March 10; published 2013 April 9

ABSTRACT

Six P-type planets have been found thus far around five binary systems, i.e., Kepler-16b, 34b, 35b, 38b, and 47b and c, which are all Neptune- or Jupiter-like planets. The stability of planets and the habitable zones are influenced by the gravitational and radiative perturbations of binary companions. In this Letter, we check the stability of an additional habitable Earth-mass planet in each system. Based on our simulations in 10 Myr, a habitable “Earth” is hardly stable in Kepler-16, while a stable “Earth” in Kepler-47 close to the boundaries of the habitable zone is possible. In contrast, Kepler-34, 35, and 38 seem to have high probabilities of being able to tolerate a stable “Earth” in their habitable zones. The affects of transit time variations are quite small due to the small mass of an undetected “Earth,” except that of Kepler-16b. With a time precision of $10^{-3}$ day ($\sim$88 s), an “Earth” in the coronational resonance with Kepler-16b can be detected in three years, while habitable “Earths” in the Kepler-34 and 38 systems can be detected in 10 yr. Habitable “Earths” in Kepler-35 and 47 are not likely to be detected in 10 yr under this precision.

Key word: stars: individual (Kepler-16A(B), Kepler-34A(B), Kepler-35A(B), Kepler-38A(B), Kepler-47A(B))
Online-only material: color figures

1. INTRODUCTION

Searches for Earth-like exoplanets, especially the Kepler mission, make great contributions to our knowledge about terrestrial planets. To date, about 66 Earth-like ($< 10 M_\oplus$) planets have been confirmed\(^1\) and more than 1100 candidates with radii $R_p < 2 R_\oplus$ have been detected.\(^2\) Considering these Earth-like planets with minimum masses $<10 M_\oplus$, only a few of them have a moderate equilibrium temperature and are considered to be habitable planets (Kopparapu et al. 2013), e.g., HD40307 g (Tuomi et al. 2012) and GJ667C c (Delfosse et al. 2012). Meanwhile, 11 candidates with radii $< 2 R_\oplus$ are in the habitable zone (Gaidos 2013). Habitable Earth-like planets are likely to stay in more compact multi-planet systems. For example, HD40307 contains six planets and GJ667C has at least two planets.

Planets in the habitable zone (hereafter HZ) must have a moderate temperature to maintain liquid water on the surface and have a possibility of sustaining life (Kasting et al. 1993; Jones et al. 2001). The temperature of a planet is usually considered via several conditions (Gaidos 2013), e.g., planetary albedo, orbital eccentricity and obliquity (Williams & Pollard 2003), components of the planetary atmosphere (Pierrehumbert et al. 2011), etc. In single star systems, the HZ is fixed due to the stable flux of the host star in main sequences. However, the HZ in binary systems is different due to the radiative perturbation of the binary companion. Eggl et al. (2012) provided an analytic method to estimate the HZs for S-type planetary orbits, and pointed out that HZs are strongly affected by the eccentricity of the binary. Kane & Hinkel (2013) studied HZs for P-type planetary orbits, which would oscillate with time due to the different orbital phases of the binary stars. The stabilities of planets in binary systems are also different from those in single star systems (Holman & Wiegert 1999). Considering a multi-planet system, planets with equal masses are stable in single star systems if their separations exceed a critical value $\sim$7–10 Hill radii (Chambers et al. 1996; Zhou et al. 2007). Adding the perturbation of a binary companion, the stabilities of planets around the binary are queried.

In this Letter, we focus on the five circumbinary systems: Kepler-16 (Doyle et al. 2011), 34, 35, (Welsh et al. 2012), 38 (Orosz et al. 2012b), and 47 (Orosz et al. 2012a). All six planets detected are Jupiter-like or Neptune-like planets (see Table 1), which probably have a thick atmosphere and may not form a solid surface; thus they are not suitable for life. As noted by Gong et al. (2013), the formation of habitable Earth-like planets in circumbinary systems is possible. Here we assume that an additional “Earth” formed in these systems, and we estimate the tolerant regions where the “Earths” are stable and habitable. We also simulate the transit time variations (hereafter TTVs) of the existing planets with and without an additional “Earth.” The differences between these two TTVs may help us to predict the existence of an undetected “Earth” through further observations (Agol et al. 2005; Lithwick et al. 2012).

2. ADDITION-“EARTH” MODEL

Researchers usually estimate the boundaries of HZ via the maximum greenhouse effects provided by a CO$_2$ atmosphere and via runaway greenhouse effect (i.e., loss of water; Kasting et al. 1993; Underwood et al. 2003). As Kopparapu et al. (2013) pointed out most recently, the stellar fluxes (with unit $1368$ W m$^{-2}$) at the boundaries of the HZ are

\[
S_{\text{in}} = S_{\text{eff} \oplus} + aT_s + bT_s^2 + cT_s^3 + dT_s^4, \quad (1)
\]

\[
S_{\text{out}} = S_{\text{eff} \oplus} + aT_s + bT_s^2 + cT_s^3 + dT_s^4, \quad (2)
\]

where $T_s = T_{\text{eff}} - 5780$ K and the values of $S_{\text{eff} \oplus}$, $a$, $b$, $c$, and $d$ are listed in Kopparapu et al. (2013, see Table 3 therein).
In single star systems, $T_{\text{eff}}$ is the effective temperature of the star. In binary systems, the equivalent $T_{\text{eff}}$ of the binary are calculated by Wien’s displacement law after combining the stellar spectral radiiances of binary stars (see Section 3.2 in Kane & Hinkel 2013).

The equilibrium temperature of a planet $T_p$ is determined in two steps. (1) Estimate the combined flux on the planet $S$ by $S = S_1 + S_2$, where $S_i = \sigma(1 - \alpha_i)R_i^2T_{\text{eff},i}^4$, $(i = 1, 2)$, where $\sigma$ is the Boltzmann constant, $\alpha$ is the albedo of the planets, $R_i$ is the radius of star $i$, $r_i$ is the distance between the planet and star $i$, and $T_{\text{eff},i}$ is the effective temperature of star $i$. (2) Estimate the $T_p$ of the planet by energy equilibrium: $\pi r_p^2 \times S = 4\pi \sigma r_p^2 T_p^4$. Therefore, we obtain

$$T_p = (S/4\sigma)^{1/4}. \tag{3}$$

Substituting Equations (1) and (2) into Equation (3), we get the temperatures at the HZ boundary, $T_{\text{in}}$ and $T_{\text{out}}$. Note that $T_{\text{in}}$ and $T_{\text{out}}$ are independent of albedo $\alpha$, but the location of the HZ depends on $\alpha$ in the expression of $S_1$ and $S_2$.

The configurations of the five observed circumbinary systems are listed in Table 1 according to observations. We simulate 100 cases for each system. In each case, we put an additional “Earth” with a mass $= 1 M_\oplus$ and let the “Earth” evolve under the gravities of both binaries and the existing planets. All these “Earths” are put in circular orbits with an inclination $= 1^\circ$ initially; the phase angles of the “Earths” are chosen randomly. The initial locations of these “Earths” in each system are interpreted in Section 3. Using the MERCURY package for N-body simulations (Chambers 1999), we estimate their stabilities and habitats based on our simulations. Due to the variation of $T_p$, only those “Earths” with $T_p(t) \in [T_{\text{out}}, T_{\text{in}}]$ are considered habitable in this work.

### Table 1

| Stellar and Planetary Characters in the Five Binary Systems | Kepler-16 | Kepler-34 | Kepler-35 | Kepler-38 | Kepler-47* |
|-----------------------------------------------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| **Star A** | **Mass ($M_\odot$)** | 0.6897 | 1.0479 | 0.8877 | 0.949 | 1.043 |
| | **Radius ($R_\odot$)** | 0.6489 | 1.1618 | 1.0284 | 1.757 | 0.964 |
| | **Temperature (K)** | 4450 | 5913 | 5606 | 5623 | 5636 |
| **Star B** | **Mass ($M_\odot$)** | 0.20255 | 1.0208 | 0.8094 | 0.249 | 0.362 |
| | **Radius ($R_\odot$)** | 0.22623 | 1.0927 | 0.7861 | 0.2724 | 0.3506 |
| | **Temperature (K)** | 2800 | 5867 | 5202 | 3315 | 3357 |
| **Binary parameters** | **Semimajor axis (AU)** | 0.22431 | 0.2288 | 0.17617 | 0.1469 | 0.0836 |
| | **Period (days)** | 41.079220 | 27.7958103 | 20.733667 | 18.79537 | 7.44837695 |
| | **Eccentricity** | 0.15944 | 0.52 | 0.1421 | 0.1032 | 0.0234 |
| | **$T_{\text{eff}}$ (K)$^b$** | 4307.8 | 5892.0 | 5435.5 | 5496.7 | 5520.5 |

**Notes.**

$^a$ Data are from Doyle et al. (2011), Welsh et al. (2012), and Orosz et al. (2012a, 2012b), respectively.

$^b$ $T_{\text{eff}}$ is the effective temperature of the binary system.

$^c$ $T_p$ is the equilibrium temperature of planet with albedo $\alpha = 0$.

### 3. RESULTS IN FIVE SYSTEMS

#### 3.1. Kepler-16

The equivalent temperature of binaries in the Kepler-16 system is $T_{\text{eff}} = 4307.8$ K, and the HZ with temperatures [200.2 K, 271.6 K] (Figure 1(a)) is located from 0.4 to 0.75 AU approximately. The locations of HZ boundaries change little with time because of the small contribution to the combined flux from the much cooler companion star. Note that the locations of HZ boundaries here are averaged by different azimuths. According to Quarles et al. (2012), “Earths” inside 0.66 AU ($\sim$222 K) are unstable in the system. The initial locations of our 100 “Earths” are chosen between [173 K, 222 K] randomly.

The red/blue circles represent the initial locations of unstable/stable “Earths” during our simulations (the same notations are used in all figures hereafter). After 10 Myr evolution, more than 90% of “Earths” are ejected mainly due to the perturbations of Kepler-16b, and only seven “Earths” survive outside the HZ. The orbits of other detected giant planets are also allowed to evolve under the gravities of planets and stars in our simulations. However, due to the large mass of Kepler-16b, if the “Earth” is stable, the orbits of the presently observed planets are nearly unchanged. The same is true for other systems in Section 3. Finally, we obtain a null “Earth” in the HZ of the Kepler-16 system. As shown in Figure 1(b), we find two stable regions: $r \sim 0.72$ and 0.95 AU. The inner two are in the corotational resonance with Kepler-16b. Averaged by the time, their mean $T_p \approx 207.5$ and 207.4 K, with variations about 19.7 and 16.2 K. Therefore, these two “Earths” could be in the HZ only by considering some other different atmosphere models.

We set the albedo $\alpha = 0$ in Figure 1. If we change the albedo to $\alpha = 0.3$, comparable with the Earth, and a higher
value of 0.5 to model metal-rich planets with a smooth surface, the equilibrium temperature of planets $T_p$ respectively becomes 0.915 and 0.841 times of that with $\alpha = 0$. The two planets in the same orbit with Kepler-16b will obtain a lower $T_p \sim 189.8$ K for $\alpha = 0.3$ and $T_p \sim 174.5$ K for $\alpha = 0.5$, which no longer seems likely to be habitable.

### 3.2. Kepler-34

The $T_{\text{eff}}$ of Kepler-34 binary is 5892 K, and an “Earth” with $T_p$ in [214.2 K, 282.9 K] is habitable (Figure 2(a)). The HZ is about 1.6–2.8 AU according to the fitting curve of $T_p$ in Figure 2(b) (hereafter the same). The HZ boundaries vary with time more obviously than others because of the large eccentricity of binary stars and their similar $T_{\text{eff}}$. However, the variation of the inner HZ boundary is still very small (<0.02 AU) since the HZ is far away from the binary compared with the separation of binaries. The initial locations of our 100 “Earths” are chosen between [173 K, 570 K] randomly.

The green filled circles represent the initial locations of stable habitable “Earths” (hereafter the same). Comparing with Kepler-16, the HZ in Kepler-34 is more stable for an additional “Earth.” As shown in Figure 2(a), 74 “Earths” far away from Kepler-34b easily survive after 10 Myr, including 32 (75%) of the initial habitable “Earths” that remained in the HZ throughout that time. Figure 2(b) shows the locations of the 74 stable “Earths” and their $T_p$. The $T_p(r)$ is similar to that in single star systems as a power law: $T_p = 359.1 \text{ K} (r/1 \text{ AU})^{-1/2}$. We find a stable boundary of about 1.5 AU, outside which “Earths” are stable. The mean distance of the outer HZ boundary is about 2.8 AU. Thus, the Kepler-34 system is likely to tolerant a habitable “Earth” between 1.6 and 2.8 AU when $\alpha = 0$. Due to the perturbation of Kepler-34b, “Earths” close to it have larger variations of $T_p$.

Changing the albedo $\alpha$ to 0.3 and 0.5, the location of the HZ changes to an inner region, and thus the outer boundary of HZ becomes 2.34 AU for $\alpha = 0.3$ and 1.98 AU for $\alpha = 0.5$. Overlapping with the stable boundary >1.5 AU, we conclude that the tolerant region of habitable Earths in the Kepler-34 system becomes: 1.6–2.34 AU with $\alpha = 0.3$ and between 1.6 and 1.98 AU with $\alpha = 0.5$ (see Table 2).

### 3.3. Kepler-35

The equivalent temperature of binaries in Kepler-35 is $T_{\text{eff}} = 5435.5$ K, and the HZ is from 1.2 to 2.0 AU with temperature [210.0 K, 278.9 K] (Figures 2(c) and (d)). Both the separation and eccentricity of the binary orbit are smaller than that of Kepler-34; therefore, the HZ boundaries are less influenced (<0.01 AU) by the motion of binaries with time. The same effect occurs in Kepler-38 and 47, in which the HZ boundaries are nearly circular. The initial 100 “Earths” are chosen between [173 K, 520 K] randomly.

Figure 2(c) indicates that 15 “Earths” in the inner region are unstable while the other 85 “Earths” outside still orbit the binary stars after 10 Myr, including 36 (~90%) of the initial habitable “Earths” that remained in the HZ. The $T_p$ of the 85 stable “Earths” are shown in Figure 2(d), well fitted by a power law $T_p = 298.8 \text{ K} (r/1 \text{ AU})^{-1/2}$. We find that the tolerant region of a stable habitable “Earth” with $\alpha = 0$ in the Kepler-35 system is about 1.2–2.0 AU and the variations of $T_p$ of “Earths” in the HZ are all less than 8 K.

Taking $\alpha = 0.3$ and 0.5, the location of the HZ will move to an inner region, i.e., 1.0–1.67 AU for $\alpha = 0.3$ and 0.85–1.41 AU for $\alpha = 0.5$. Because the smaller HZ overlaps with part of the unstable region, a smaller fraction of the surviving “Earths” remain in the HZ in comparison with $\alpha = 0$ (see Table 2).

### 3.4. Kepler-38

With a radius of $0.3964R_J$, a mass of $\sim0.078M_J$ for Kepler-38b is estimated by the density of Neptune in our simulations. The equivalent temperature of binaries is $T_{\text{eff}} = 5496.7$ K, and the HZ boundary is [210.5 K, 279.4 K], about 1.6–2.9 AU (Figures 2(e) and (f)). Here the initial 100 “Earths” are chosen randomly from 1.2 to 4.3 AU with temperatures between [173 K, 350 K].

Due to the tight binary orbit, the large distance between “Earths” and the small Kepler-38b “Earths” in this system are...
Figure 2. “Earths” in Kepler-34, 35, 38, and 47 are represented in panels (a), (c), (e), and (g), respectively: The green filled circles represent stable habitable “Earths,” while the red/blue circles stand for unstable/stable “Earths” outside the HZ after 10 Myr. The green and red dotted lines are the boundaries of the HZ and the initial locations of the 100 “Earths,” respectively. The equilibrium temperature $T_p$ and the location $r$ of stable “Earths” in Kepler-34, 35, 38, and 47 are shown in panels (b), (d), (f), and (h), respectively. The error bars show the largest and smallest values of $T_p$ and $r$.

(A color version of this figure is available in the online journal.)
Figure 3. Differences of (a) transit times ($dT_{tr}$) and (b) TTV($dTTV$) of detected planets with and without the perturbation of an additional “Earth.” Because of the stronger perturbation between “Earth” and Kepler-16b in 1:1 orbital resonance, $dT_{tr}$ and $dTTV$ of Kepler-16b are obviously larger than other four systems, and can be detected in three years.

(A color version of this figure is available in the online journal.)

Table 2

|                  | Kepler-16 | Kepler-34 | Kepler-35 | Kepler-38 | Kepler-47 |
|------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| Stable “Earth”   | 7         | 74        | 85        | 100       | 66        |
| Stable “Earth” in HZ | ≤2        | 32        | 36        | 38        | 7         |
| Stable region (AU)| >0.66     | >1.5      | >1        | >1.1      | 0.4–0.8, >1.2 |
| Tolerant region (AU) |          |           |           |           |           |
| $\alpha = 0$    | ~0.72     | 1.6–2.8   | 1.2–2.0   | 1.6–2.9   | 1.2–1.6   |
| $\alpha = 0.3$  | Null      | 1.6–2.34  | 1.0–1.67  | 1.34–2.43 | 0.75–0.8, 1.2–1.34 |
| $\alpha = 0.5$  | Null      | 1.6–1.98  | 0.85–1.41 | 1.13–2.05 | 0.64–0.8   |
| $dT_{tr}$ (K)$^a$| <20       | ≤12       | <8        | <10       | <30       |
| $dT_{tr}$ (days)$^b$| 1         | $2 \times 10^{-2}$ | $2 \times 10^{-3}$ | $10^{-2}$ | $3 \times 10^{-4}$ |
| $dTTV$ (days)$^c$| 0.1       | $10^{-2}$ | $10^{-3}$ | $3 \times 10^{-3}$ | $10^{-4}$ |

Notes.

$^a$ Variation of $T_p$ with albedo $\alpha = 0$.

$^b$ Difference between transit times $T_{tr}$ in 10 yr.

$^c$ Differences between TTVs in 10 yr.

all stable after 10 Myr (Figure 2(e)). Finally, 38 (>90%) of the initial habitable “Earths” remain in the HZ. Figure 2(f) shows the fitting curve $T_p = 359.7 \, \text{K} \left( r/1 \, \text{AU} \right)^{-1/2}$ and indicates that the boundary of the HZ is from 1.6 to 2.9 AU with $\alpha = 0$. The mean variations of $T_p$ of Earth in the HZ are all less than 10 K.

The HZ becomes 1.34–2.43 AU for $\alpha = 0.3$ and 1.13–2.05 AU for $\alpha = 0.5$. Since all 100 “Earths” in the Kepler-38 system are stable, most “Earths” in the HZ are initially still habitable due to our simulations while changing the albedo to 0.3 or 0.5 (see Table 2).

3.5. Kepler-47

Using the density of Neptune, we estimate the masses of Kepler-47b and c as 0.0248$M_J$ and 0.0933$M_J$, respectively. Their eccentricities are only limited as <0.035 and <0.411, respectively. We choose a mean value for each planet, i.e., 0.035/2 ~ 0.017 for 47b and 0.411/2 ~ 0.205 for 47c in our simulations. The equivalent temperature of binaries is $T_{eff} = 5501.5 \, \text{K}$, and the HZ boundary becomes [210.6 K, 279.4 K], about 0.9–1.6 AU (Figures 2(g) and (h)). The initial 100 “Earths” are chosen randomly between [173 K, 550 K], about 0.2–2.6 AU.

After 10 Myr evolution, only 66 “Earths” survive and 7 of them are habitable, as shown in Figure 2(g). Since Kepler-47c is located in the HZ with eccentricity 0.2, it sweeps out a region of 0.8–1.2 AU, as shown in Figure 2(h). Similar to the Kepler-16 system, Kepler-47c also captures an “Earth” in the 1:1 orbital resonance with a large eccentricity ~0.65;
Therefore, this “Earth” has a quite large variation of $T_p$ ($\sim 220$ K) and is not habitable. Only “Earths” from 1.2 AU to 1.6 AU survive as habitable “Earths.” Due to the perturbation of Kepler-47c, these habitable Earths have a large $dT_p \sim 20$ K. Inside the inner boundary of the HZ, there are 14 stable “Earths,” with an even larger $dT_p > 30$ K due to the perturbations of both Kepler-47b and c.

If the albedo $\alpha = 0.3$, the HZ extends from 0.75 to 1.34 AU, and there will be two tolerant regions for a stable habitable “Earth”: 0.75–0.8 AU and 1.2–1.34 AU. With $\alpha = 0.5$, the HZ becomes 0.64–1.13 AU, and the tolerant region becomes 0.64–0.8 AU (see Table 2).

4. TTVs VIA THE ADDITIONAL “EARTH”

Because all the “Earths” have an inclination $= 1^\circ$, we cannot observe their transits. To determine the existence of stable “Earths” in the HZ, we can calculate the transit time ($T_t$) and TTVs of the existing planet in each system, which can be observed by follow-up studies. We calculate two $T_t$ values with and without an additional “Earth” in each system, and check their differences $dT_t$. The initial conditions used here are according to our results in Section 3. The “Earths” labeled as “sample” in Figures 1 and 2 are chosen as the sample cases. The initial conditions of both binary stars and planets in this section are the same with the configurations in the sample cases at the end of simulations (time $= 10$ Myr) in Section 3.

Figure 3 shows the differences of both transit time ($dT_t$) and TTVs ($dTTV$) in 4000 days in each system. Note that we only show the transits of the larger binary star A in each system. For the Kepler-47 system, only the transits of 47b are considered because the period of 47c is so long that few transit events can be observed. In Figure 3(a), all systems have increasing variations of $dT_t$. In Kepler-16, the “Earth” is in the corotational resonance with Kepler-16b, and the interaction between these two planets is strong. Therefore, the $dT_t$ is more obvious than the other four systems. The $dT_t$ of Kepler-16b can achieve $\sim 10^{-2}$ day in 3 yr and $\sim 1$ day in 10 yr. The other four systems have small variations due to the limited perturbation of the additional “Earth”: $dT_t < 10^{-3}$ day in 3 yr and $dT_t < 10^{-2}$ day in 10 yr. We can sort these five systems by $dT_t$: Kepler-16b > Kepler-34b > Kepler-38b > Kepler-35b > Kepler-47b. Figure 3(b) also shows the calculation of the TTV of the existing planets. Similar to $dT_t$, the strong interaction between Kepler-16b and co-orbit “Earth” results in a larger $dTTV \sim 0.1$ day. The other four systems have small $dTTV < 10^{-2}$ day.

5. CONCLUSIONS

With the motivation of finding additional “Earths” in the HZs of Kepler-16, 34, 35, 38, and 47, we simulated 100 cases in each system and show the stability and habitability of these “Earths” (see Section 3). After 10 Myr of evolution, most “Earths” are unstable in Kepler-16 and we do not find any habitable “Earths.” However, two “Earths” in the corotational resonance with Kepler-16b survived near the outer HZ boundary when the albedo $\alpha = 0$. In Kepler-47, due to the perturbation of Kepler-47c, only eight “Earths” from 1.2 to 1.6 AU survive and are habitable. In Kepler-34, 35, and 38, “Earths” in the HZ are stable and most “Earths” in the HZ initially can remain in the HZ. The tolerant region of an additional habitable “Earth” in each system is shown in Table 2.

Different albedos ($\alpha = 0.3$ and 0.5) of the “Earth” make the conclusions a little different. Comparing with $\alpha = 0$, “Earths” absorb less flux and have a lower $T_p$, i.e., the HZ migrates to a closer and narrower region. In the Kepler-16 system, we still do not obtain any habitable “Earths” with $\alpha = 0.3$ or 0.5. Kepler-34, 35, and 38 systems have fewer habitable “Earths” that survived and the outer boundaries of the tolerant regions shrink. Overlapping the HZ with the unstable region in Kepler-47, there are two tolerant regions for a habitable “Earth” in Kepler-47 when we set $\alpha = 0.3$, as shown in Table 2.

Comparing the $T_t$ with and without the perturbation of the additional “Earth,” we show that an “Earth” in the same orbit with Kepler-16b can influence the $T_t$ of Kepler-16b obviously, with $dT_t \sim 1$ day and $dTTV \sim 0.1$ day in 10 yr. Meanwhile, $dT_t$ and $dTTV$ due to the perturbation of the habitable “Earth” in other systems are relatively small. With the precision of $10^{-3}$ day $\sim 88$ s, we can identify the $dTTV$ of Kepler-16b in three years. After 10 yr of observations, the $dTTV$ of Kepler-34b and 38b can be detected, while the $dTTV$ of Kepler-35b and 47b are too small to be detected.

The work is supported by National Basic Research Program of China (2013CB834900) and National Natural Science Foundations of China (Nos. 10833001, 10925313, 11003010).

REFERENCES

Agol, E., Steffen, J., Sari, R., & Clarkson, W. 2005, MNRAS, 359, 567
Chambers, J. E. 1999, MNRAS, 304, 793
Chambers, J. E., Wetherill, G. W., & Boss, A. P. 1996, Icar, 119, 261
Delfosse, X., Bonfils, X., Forveille, T., et al. 2012, arXiv:1202.2467
Doyle, L. R., Carter, J. A., Fabrycky, D. C., et al. 2011, Sci, 333, 1602
Eggl, S., Pilat-Lohinger, E., Georgakarakos, V., et al. 2012, ApJ, 752, 74
Gaidos, E. 2013, arXiv:1301.2384
Gong, Y.-X., Zhou, J.-L., & Xie, J.-W. 2013, ApJL, 763, L8
Holman, M. J., & Wiegert, P. A. 1999, AJ, 117, 621
Jones, B. W., Siple, P. N., & Chambers, J. E. 2001, A&A, 366, 254
Kane, S. R., & Hinkel, N. R. 2013, ApJ, 762, 7
Kasting, J. F., Whitmire, D. P., & Reynolds, R. T. 1993, Icar, 101, 108
Kopparapu, R. K., Ramirez, R., Kasting, J. F., et al. 2013, ApJ, 765, 131
Lithwick, Y., Xie, J.-W., & Wu, Y. 2012, ApJ, 761, 122
Orosz, J. A., Welsh, W. F., Carter, J. A., et al. 2012a, Sci, 337, 1511
Orosz, J. A., Welsh, W. F., Carter, J. A., et al. 2012b, ApJ, 758, 87
Pierrehumbert, R. T., Abbot, D., Voigt, A., & Koll, D. 2011, AREPS, 39, 417
Quarles, B., Musielak, Z. E., & Cuntz, M. 2012, ApJ, 750, 14
Tuomi, M., Anglada-Escude, G., Gerlach, E., et al. 2012, A&A, 549, 48
Underwood, D. R., Jones, B. W., & Sleep, P. N. 2003, IJAsB, 2, 289
Welsh, W. F., Orosz, J. A., Carter, J. A., et al. 2012, Natur, 481, 475
Williams, D. M., & Pollard, D. 2003, IJAsB, 2, 1
Zhou, J. L., Lin, D. N. C., & Sun, Y. S. 2007, ApJ, 666, 423