Phosphorus mineral evolution and prebiotic chemistry: From minerals to microbes

Craig R. Walton a,*, Oliver Shorttle a, Frances E. Jenner c, Helen M. Williams a, Joshua Golden d, Shaunna M. Morrison d, Robert T. Downs d, Aubrey Zerkle e, Robert M. Hazen f, Matthew Pasek g

a Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge, Downing Street, Cambridge CB2 3EQ, UK
b Institute of Astronomy, University of Cambridge, Madingley Road, Cambridge CB3 0HA, UK
c School of Environment, Earth and Ecosystem Sciences, The Open University, Walton Hall, Milton Keynes MK7 6AA, UK
d Department of Geosciences, University of Arizona, 1040 E. 4th Street, Tucson, AZ 85721, USA
e School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of St Andrews, Irvine Building, KY16 9AL, USA
f Geophysical Laboratory, Carnegie Institution for Science, 5251 Broad Branch Road, NW, Washington, DC 20015, USA
g School of Geoscience, University of South Florida, 4202 E Fowler Ave, Tampa, FL 33620, USA

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:
Prebiotic
Chemistry
Origin
Life
Early Earth
Geology
Minerals
Phosphorus
Phosphate
Meteorite

ABSTRACT

Phosphorus availability is considered a limiting factor in many scenarios for the origin of life. The concentration of P in environments of prebiotic interest will have been governed by the available mineral sources of P on the early Earth. A knowledge of early Earth P mineralogy and prevailing global and local environmental conditions is therefore needed to understand which scenarios for prebiotic chemistry are most plausible. Here, we review the plausible diversity of P-bearing phases at Earth’s surface during the emergence of life. We consider phases that were delivered by meteorites (exogenous phases), as well as those that developed solely as a result of Earth system processes (endogenous phases). We take into account the known formation conditions of individual phases, as well as the observed temporal distributions of P-bearing minerals found at Earth’s surface today. Our approach allows us to leverage what is known about changes in the Earth system in order to rule out the prebiotic relevance of many P-bearing phases. Meanwhile, we highlight a small number of phases that are of possible prebiotic relevance; specifically, exogenous schreibersite, merrillite, and apatite, and endogenous apatite, olivine, and glass. Prebiotic mineral-chemical scenarios can be formulated for each phase, with distinct requirements for the environmental and tectonic state of early Earth. We can therefore relate the plausibility of mineral-chemical scenarios to the nature of early Earth, bridging the fields of geoscience and prebiotic chemistry.

1. Introduction

Minerals are known to control the availability of non-volatile and bio-essential elements at Earth’s surface. Therefore, the role of minerals in prebiotic chemistry is a focal point of research into the origins of life. However, the mineralogical diversity of earliest Earth is not definitively known. This uncertainty is owed both to progressive change in the Earth system, which makes the present an imperfect guide to the past, and a progressively incomplete rock record of Earth history with increasing age. Hence, much is unknown about the planetary conditions under which terrestrial life first developed, for example the diversity of nutrient-bearing minerals (e.g., phosphorus – P) in Earth’s early crust and surface environments. Here, we review the plausible diversity of P-bearing phases at Earth’s surface during the emergence of life.

All organisms require the element P (atomic number 15) at a fundamental level in order to metabolise (adenosine triphosphate is the energy currency of life), compartmentalise (phospholipids build cell walls), and replicate (phosphate-diester linkages are the backbone of DNA; (Bowler et al., 2010; Fernández-García et al., 2017; Kamerlin et al., 2013; Westheimer, 1987). However, just as P is key for extant forms of life, the importance of this element for the chemistry of life’s origins is also clear. High P concentrations (typically as the oxidised species PO43–) are a vital constituent of many recent prebiotic reaction schemes (Islam and Powner, 2017; Liu et al., 2019; Pasek et al., 2017; Patel et al., 2015), allowing for efficient pH buffering to ensure clean reaction steps. Phosphorus is required in abundance to drive efficient
pre-enzymatic phosphorylation of organic compounds, without which it is challenging to access universal components of known biology e.g., nucleic acid.

Phosphorus can exist in the following principal redox states: $\text{P}^{3+}$, $\text{P}^5$, $\text{P}^{1+}$, $\text{P}^{3+}$, and $\text{P}^{5+}$ (Pasek et al., 2017). The geochemical behavior of each species is distinctly different, yet almost all $\text{P}$ at the Earth’s surface is present in an oxidised state ($\text{P}^{5+}$). Crustal $\text{P}^{5+}$ is hosted by the mineral apatite ($\text{Ca}_5[\text{PO}_4]_3(\text{OH,Cl,F})$) in most crustal rocks. The poor solubility of this phase at ambient surface conditions is widely considered to be a crucial challenge facing prebiotic reaction pathways that require high dissolved $\text{P}$ concentrations to function (Schwartz, 2006). This issue has spurred efforts to find either environmental conditions under which apatite is highly soluble (Burcar et al., 2016; Toner and Catling, 2020), or alternative mineral sources of $\text{P}$ that would have been abundant on early Earth (Pasek et al., 2017). The probability that any given $\text{P}$-bearing phase may have interacted with a specific prebiotic environment is dependent upon the nature of the early Earth and the abundance of a given prebiotic mineral at the time. However, Earth history is especially poorly constrained for the time period in which life is thought to have emerged. As such, even strong experimental evidence that a $\text{P}$-bearing mineral may be useful in prebiotic chemistry has little explanatory power without a firmer grasp on what was and was not geologically possible on early Earth.

Here, we review what is known about $\text{P}$ mineral diversity in modern and ancient terrestrial settings, as well as in exogenous materials that deliver $\text{P}$ to Earth’s surface. We focus on evaluating the formation conditions of each phase, in order to construct a time-series evolutionary history of $\text{P}$ mineralogy at Earth’s surface. We examine which phases are likely to have been available during the Prebiotic Era. By considering the environmental, tectonic, and geochemical pre-conditions that go along with each phase, we are able to exclude some phases from consideration entirely, as well as provide an assessment of prebiotic plausibility and utility in other cases.

In this context, it is important to define what is meant by ‘early’, and to provide context for the initial conditions of the Earth system, and their rate and direction of evolution towards the present. We generalize our thinking to conservatively describe the ‘early Earth’ as encompassing the first billion years of Earth history (4.5–3.5 Ga). The Hadean Eon refers to the point in Earth history (4 Ga) beyond which there is essentially no preserved and exposed rock-record available to study. The earliest putative evidence of life in the rock record, at $\sim 3.85$ Ga, is rapidly approaching this boundary (Dodd et al., 2017). It is therefore becoming increasingly likely that the origin of life occurred at some time during the Hadean Eon. The ‘Prebiotic Era’, then, refers to whatever portion of the Hadean Eon was dominated by wholly prebiotic chemistry, as opposed to any form of extant biochemistry. In this review, we refer most generally to the early Earth, as well as more specifically to the prebiotic Earth, when discussing implications of our work for the origin of life.

2. Phosphorus pathways in planetary precursors

We begin by tracing $\text{P}$ through those processes that formed Earth. Materials formed at each stage would have had the potential to interact with one another during the relevant timeframe for prebiotic chemistry (i.e., circa 4.53–4.0 Ga). For example, molecules native to asteroids might not form in situ in prebiotic terrestrial settings, but could have been transported to the early Earth’s surface during impact events. The evolution of $\text{P}$ cosmochemistry across Early Solar System history is illustrated in Fig. 1, concluding with the formation of Earth.

2.1. Nebula-phase materials

Details of $\text{P}$ cosmochemistry occurring in the Interstellar Medium (ISM) and in star-forming nebular gas clouds are currently scarce. Emission lines for the molecular species $\text{PO}$ and $\text{PN}$ have been observed in the ISM (Mininni et al., 2018). The ISM itself is depleted in $\text{P}$ relative to diffuse molecular clouds and star-forming regions – most probably due to $\text{P}$ freeze-out onto dust grains (Lebouteiller et al., 2005), although the chemical nature of this dust-bound $\text{P}$ is not yet properly constrained. Regardless, this expected reservoir is often suggested to act as a $\text{P}$ source during dust cloud collapse, star-formation, and the development of proto-planetary disks, with $\text{P}$ being released to the gas phase during heating associated with these processes (Lebouteiller et al., 2005). The vast majority of nebular $\text{P}$ is thus reprocessed during chemical partitioning into the disk, reducing the prebiotic relevance of pristine nebular $\text{P}$-bearing species.

2.2. Disk-phase materials

Gas phase chemistry in the disk is complex, varies significantly with temperature, and hence also varies with stellar distance and with time. The highest temperature at which $\text{P}$ will condense to form a solid phase is 1248 K (Lodders, 2003). At this temperature, reaction of nebular gas species with already-formed native iron (Fe; e.g., in dust) results in the near wholesale removal of $\text{P}$ from the gas-phase in around 10,000 years.
This process triggers schreibersite (Fe₃P) formation when P reached a critical concentration of ~1 wt% in the metal (Pasek, 2019a; Pirin et al., 2014). Schreibersite is often observed to be non-stoichiometric, with \( P < 1 \) atom per formula unit (Pasek, 2019a; Zanda et al., 1994). These Fe\( [P] \) phases comprise the oldest P-bearing minerals to form in the Solar System and provide a starting point for tracking how P mineralogy may have evolved over the next 4.5 billion years. Secondary reprocessing of disk materials then set the redox state and concentration of P in asteroids and planetesimals, which were subsequently accreted to form the Earth. These materials continue to be sampled and delivered to Earth today by meteorites, providing us with a constraint on the minerals that may also have been delivered to Earth during its Prebiotic Era.

3. Phosphorus mineral diversity in meteorites

Phosphide, both as a minor-components in Fe-metal and as individual mineral phases, dominates in enstatite chondrites, as well as carbonaceous and ordinary chondrites that did not experience significant aqueous or thermal metamorphism. However, given the sheer rarity of unaltered chondrites, we do not consider this reservoir separately in our compendium of meteorite P data (Table 1). Thermally metamorphosed and aqueously altered chondrite classes contain oxidised phosphate minerals – in particular merrillite and members of the ternary end-member OH/F/Cl-apatite series (Table 1). Oxidation was likely mediated by metasomatism following the mobilization of early condensed ices into fluids and vapours, which was either driven by early metamorphism and/or impact-heating events (McSween and Labotka, 1993; Zhang et al., 2016).

Phosphides also dominate in iron-rich reducing achondrites (Table 1), whereas phosphate minerals dominate in more oxidizing silicate-rich achondrites (Table 1). Primary phosphates may co-exist (Table 1), whereas phosphate minerals dominate in more oxidizing silicate-rich achondrites (Table 1). Primary phosphates may co-exist with phosphide phases in pallasite (‘stony-iron’) meteorites (Buseck, 1977). It has also been suggested that a phosphide-fluid reaction sequence explains the presence of phosphorylated carbon compounds in comets, e.g., Wild 2 (Brownlee et al., 2012) and in the organic-rich carbonaceous chondrites (CCs), e.g., Murchison (Graaf et al. De et al., 1995). All of the materials indicated in Table 1 and Fig. 1 have the potential to have interacted with Earth surface and therefore set in motion different pre-biogeochemical processes. However, in practice, this prebiotic potential is sensitive to the relative and absolute abundance of these phases, as well as the constraints imposed by inherently stochastic delivery during impact bombardment.

4. Modern exogenous fluxes

The flux of meteoritic minerals to Earth must have been greater in the past than it is today, with planetary bombardment being at its height during the Hadean Eon (4.5 to 4.0 Ga) and, most likely, during the overlapping Prebiotic Era (Marchi et al., 2014). Acknowledging this, we will now review and assess evidence pertaining to the composition of objects involved in Earth’s early impact history.

One means of evaluating the significance of exogenous P delivery (relative to endogenous weathering sources) is to quantify and extrapolate modern meteoritic fluxes to Earth. The data necessary to perform this analysis are given in Table 1, which lists the major meteorite classes, the reported diversity and relative abundance of P-bearing minerals found in each, and the relative abundances of these different meteorite classes in our collections. It should be noted that some of these classes have been argued to be under-represented compared to the fraction of material by mass that actually falls to Earth, because of preservation bias, e.g., a bias against preserving easily weathered iron or pallasite meteorites (Binz et al., 1993). Otherwise, however, we assume that the relative abundances of material present in collections is a reasonable proxy for the material flux to Earth now.

We systematically assembled available data regarding the number and mass abundance of meteorites of all major classes present in global collections (Table 1). We combined these data with estimates for the average P content of each class, as determined using data taken from Metbase (https://metbase.org). We exclude minerals produced exclusively during terrestrial weathering. Errors is propagated for both fall statistics and geochemical compositions. Literature reports were also used to constrain the mineralogy, and thereby speciation, of P within each meteorite class. However, owing to a general lack of quantitative data for this parameter, we are forced to use a simplified relative abundance classification scheme, namely: common (0.1), minor (0.01), rare (0.001), and very rare (0.0001). These are estimates, not measurements, and thus cannot be associated with error terms. However, we note that these approximations are likely to be reasonable upper bounds: the most likely deviation is that minor to very rare phases are relatively much rarer than we have assumed. We consider schreibersite as synonymous with primitive P-bearing metal in constructing our estimates of exogenous mineral flux.

Fig. 2 illustrates a ranked P mineral flux to Earth based on mean P content. Phosphorus delivered as schreibersite comprises the largest fraction of all exogenously delivered P minerals (45.1%), followed by the relatively insoluble phases merrillite (19.2%) and apatite (15.4%). The high mass fraction of schreibersite is due mainly to its presence in iron meteorites, which make up 50.4% by mass of known falls. The remaining 20% of exogenously delivered P is dominated by the more abundant phosphate minerals found in achondrites: sarcopside (\( (Fe^3+)\), Mn\( ^{2+}, Mg_2\)[PO\( _4 \)]\( _2 \)), johnsmaxellite (Na\( _3CaFe_3\)[PO\( _4 \)]\( _3 \)), graftonite (\( (Fe^{2+},Mn^{2+},Ca^{2+})_9\)[PO\( _4 \)]\( _2 \)), and stanfieldite (Ca\( _3Mg_2\)[PO\( _4 \)]\( _3 \)).

The estimated flux of all other P phases is relatively minor by comparison (3.8%), but is again dominated by phases found in iron – this time a more even split between oxidised and reduced P minerals, followed by a wealth of rare phases present in abundances much less than 1%. Overall, we estimate that the modern meteoritic P flux is evenly split phosphide and phosphate (45.9 vs 54.1% – Fig. 2). Phosphate delivery is

| Meteorite Class | P minerals (listed in order of decreasing abundance) | Fall statistics (mass %) | P content (ppm ± 2 s) |
|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|------------------------|
| Chondrites      |                                                     |                          |                        |
| Ordinary        | OH/F/Cl-apatite, merrillite, marcite, tuite, phosphoran-olivine | 37.8                     | 1100 ± 58              |
| Carbonaceous    | Schreibersite, OH/F/Cl-apatite, merrillite, marcite, perryite  | 4.4                      | 1280 ± 100             |
| Enstatite       | Schreibersite, perryite-nickel phosphide             | 0.5                      | 1260 ± 224             |
| Stony-iron      |                                                     |                          |                        |
| Irons           | Schreibersite, sunfieldite-grafonitite, sarcopside, johnsmaxellite, alabohalite, brunitite, merrillite-nickel phosphide-bassite-buchwaldite-chladinitie-chopinitie-morakoite-panethite-xenophyllite | 49.6                     | 2340 ± 391             |
| Mesoiderite     | Merrillite, schreibersite, farringtonite             | 1.2                      | 2805 ± 706             |
| Pallasite       | Schreibersite, sunfieldite-marclindite, merrillite-farringtonite, beringerite, phosphoran-olivine | 0.6                      | 4140 ± 6070            |
| Asteroidal achondrites |                                                      |                          |                        |
| HEDs            | Apatite, merrillite                                  | 2.7                      | 507 ± 67               |
| Auberite        | Schreibersite                                      | 2.4                      | 291 ± 2720             |
| Angrite         | Apatite, merrillite                                  | 0.003                    | 618 ± 146              |
| Primitive achondrites |                                              |                          |                        |
| Ureilite        | Schreibersite, CI-apatite, merrillite                | 0.01                     | 693 ± 292              |
| Lodranite       | Merrillite, schreibersite                            | 0.002                    | 1370 ± 1770            |
| Acapulcoite     | Schreibersite, merrillite                            | 0.004                    | 1370 ± 1770            |
| Winonite        | Schreibersite                                       | 0.0003                   | 1900 ± 1340            |

Note: Data compiled from Metbase (December 2019).
somewhat diverse (5 major phases), whereas phosphide delivery is overwhelmingly dominated by schreibersite. An important caveat for these results is the potentially changing nature of accreting impactor populations over time. For example, several recent models suggest that enstatite a/chondritic material contributed more substantially to early exogenous fluxes (Piani et al., 2020; Sikdar and Rai, 2020). Enstatite-like material is highly reducing and hence has schreibersite dominated P mineralogy (Table 1). Enstatite-dominated models of early accretion will therefore predict schreibersite-dominant early accretion fluxes, favoring exogenous delivery as a source of reduced P on early Earth. We lack errors on the modal abundance of P phases within each meteorite class. However, obtaining new estimates of mineral modes is unlikely to change our presented results by orders of magnitude. Nonetheless, the present values should not be taken as final estimates, especially for rarer species. Overall, given that merrillite, apatite, and schreibersite dominate within each meteorite class that has so far been observed, these phases must also have dominated specific P mineral fluxes to the Earth’s surface over time.

5. Phosphorus pathways during planetary evolution

5.1. Planet formation

Phosphorus availability at a planetary surface is dependent both on its concentration and redox speciation. An important initial question to resolve is therefore: what was the relative abundance of P in its different redox states at the Earth’s surface in the aftermath of its formation? The phosphorus content of the Earth cannot be assumed from cosmic abundances. Phosphorus is a moderately volatile element, with a condensation temperature of 1248 K (Lodders, 2003), and therefore may not have fully condensed at Earth’s heliocentric distance. Instead, the P content of the Bulk Silicate Earth (BSE) is estimated from its correlation with a non-volatile (refractory) element (e.g., Nd) in mantle-derived basalts (Mallmann and O’Neill, 2009; Palme and O’Neill, 2014). The P content of the BSE is depleted beyond the extent that volatility alone can explain (Fegley and Lewis, 1980; Palme and O’Neill, 2014; Schönbächler et al., 2010). This additional depletion occurs because P can exhibit siderophile behavior, causing it to partition into a planet’s iron-rich core (Righter et al., 2018; Righter et al., 2010). Although P’s chemistry means it is partially lost to Earth’s core (> 80% – Fig. 3), during mantle melting it behaves as an incompatible element and is concentrated into mantle melts. Consequently, most newly formed crust is P-enriched relative to the mantle (Figs. 1,3). Modern oceanic and continental crust together represent >30% of all P in the BSE (Fig. 3). This enrichment was likely established early, with early crustal P estimated at 100–1000 ppm in early Hadean crust vs. 87 ppm in BSE (Cox et al., 2018; Jenner et al., 2013; Keller and Schoene, 2012; O’Neill and Jenner, 2012; Palme and O’Neill, 2014). Overall, crustal P abundances would not have differed all that greatly from primitive planetary building blocks, such as chondritic meteorites (Palme and O’Neill, 2014). However, the oxidation state of early crustal P likely differed strongly from that of Earth’s accretionary building blocks.

At equilibrium, P partitioned into a metal phase speciates as reduced P\(_0\), as well as P\(^{1+}\) (Pirim et al., 2014), whilst P left in the silicate fraction is oxidised (P\(^{5+}\)). Experimental constraints on conditions relevant to an early terrestrial magma ocean highlight that even the most reducing conditions consistent with the observed end-stage chemistry of the upper mantle would still stabilise oxidised P\(^{3+}\) in silicate melts (Righter et al., 2018). However, we can expect reduced P will be found dissolved in native iron equilibrated with mantle silicates (Zanda et al., 1994). We can estimate the magnitude and redox speciation of P in modern solid Earth reservoirs by combining estimates of bulk reservoir P concentrations; phase abundances in the crust, upper mantle, transition zone (TZ), lower mantle, and core; and experimental constraints on P partitioning.

Fig. 2. Percentage of total (modern) exogeneous P flux represented by various mineral species. Also indicated is whether or not the mineral species occurred in terrestrial settings on the Hadean Earth. Red colored symbols indicate phosphate phases. Blue colored symbols indicate a phosphide phase. Error bars are 2 s. Data compiled from MetBase (December 2019). (For interpretation of the references to color in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)
behavior between metallic and silicate liquids/minerals (see Supplementary Information and Supplementary Table 1) (Broska and Petrík, 2008; Brunet and Chazot, 2001; Cox et al., 2018; Frost et al., 2004; Gale et al., 2013; Haggerty et al., 1994; Huang et al., 2013; Kaminsky, 2012; McDonough, 1995; Palme and O’Neill, 2014; Righter et al., 2010; Taylor and McLennan, 1995; Zhu et al., 2019).

Whilst P partitions strongly into native iron metal compared to silicates (Righter et al., 2010), low metal abundances nonetheless result in a silicate-dominated P reservoir throughout much of the BSE. We find that reduced (metal-bound, siderophile) P is largely absent in the BSE, first appearing as a minor reservoir (<0.01%) with the onset of native iron metal saturation below 250 km depth in the upper mantle, and only increasing to account for around 0.01% of lower mantle P and finally >99% of core P (Fig. 3). Based on these calculated low reduced P abundances and the rarity of upper mantle material exposed at Earth’s surface today (Hart et al., 1990), it is unclear that these deeply buried reduced P reservoirs could ever interact with surface environments. Overall, the endogenous mineral-hosted P available to prebiotic chemistry would have been left entirely in an oxidised redox state following planetary differentiation.

The key point for the early P cycle is that the thermodynamics of core and crustal formation do not produce scarcity in bulk P. Instead, scarcity is created in terms of reactive (reduced) P. This leads to planetary crusts that broadly lack reduced P species and instead contain only relatively ‘insoluble’ phosphate (P$_5^+$; Fig. 1). No phase is entirely insoluble, and even phosphate-containing minerals will contribute P to lakes, rivers, and the oceans. The relative abundance of these oxidised P-bearing phases at the surface of prebiotic Earth will have been controlled by the composition and geodynamics of the early crust.

5.2. Crustal evolution

The two most important P-hosting phases in Earth’s crust are fluoroapatite (Ca$_5$(PO$_4$)$_3$F) and olivine ([Fe,Mg]$_2$SiO$_4$) (Schwartz, 2006; Tollari et al., 2006; Toplis et al., 1994; Watson, 1980). Whilst phosphorus is moderately incompatible in olivine, apatite is highly soluble in typical mantle melts (Green and Watson, 1982; Watson, 1980; Watson et al., 2015). Phosphorus accumulation and Si-enrichment during extended fractionation crystallization will push melts towards apatite saturation (Watson, 1980). Apatite is therefore broadly absent in relatively Si-poor and P-poor rocks, e.g., large swathes of the upper mantle and oceanic crust (Brunet and Chazot, 2001; Haggerty et al., 1994), whilst most continental crustal rocks are apatite saturated (Watson, 1980). Apatite may contain >95% of all continental crustal P (Jahnke, 2012; Paytan and McLennan, 2007), and thus a large fraction of all crustal P (Fig. 3). This relationship between crustal composition and P mineralogy allows us to link the near-surface P mineralogy of the prebiotic Era to the compositional evolution.

The concept of non-uniformitarianism which has gained such traction in thinking about exogenous P fluxes to the early Earth may also be relevant for endogenous sources. At a global scale, crustal compositional evolution can broadly be described by two end-member scenarios (Fig. 4):

(A) A voluminous and broadly ultramafic-mafic (Si-poor) proto-crust (Dhuime et al., 2017; Dhuime et al., 2015; Hawkesworth and Jaupart, 2021), in which apatite is mostly absent and P is hosted mainly be olivine.

(B) Large volumes of relatively felsic (high Si) and apatite-dominated continental crust along with a more mafic (broadly apatite undersaturated) oceanic crust (Korenaga, 2018; Lipp et al., 2020; Rosas and Korenaga, 2018).

These are all strikingly different views of the Early Earth – and yet, all are currently permissible within the bounds of available constraints from rheological and thermal models as well as composition-age plots of crustal rocks. For example, fine-grained sediments, which formed during the weathering of crustal material across large surface areas, have been used as a proxy for crustal average composition (Rudnick and Gao, 2014). Depending on the chemical proxies one chooses to focus on, however, as well as the way that various possible biases are accounted for (e.g., chemical alteration of sediments), the same data can be
interpreted as reflecting a more mafic or similarly felsic upper continental crust in deep time (Greber et al., 2017; Greber and Dauphas, 2019; Tang et al., 2016). Non-chemical proxies, e.g., heat flow, and isotopic mass balance models provide alternative means to reconstruct the nature of early crust (Hawkesworth and Jaupart, 2021; McCoy-West et al., 2019), with recent work favoring large volumes of mafic crust (i.e., end-member Model A). Overall, early crustal chemistry is uncertain. However, within that uncertainty, there remains the distinct possibility that early crustal P reservoirs were not apatite-dominated.

Although apatite and silicate phases are the dominant P reservoirs in the modern crust, phosphorus mineralogy is highly diverse. Over 600 separate species in which P is a stoichiometric component are currently listed in the Mineral Evolution Database (MED; rruff.info/ima/). We can assess the interplay of tectonic, compositional, and crustal regimes in the context of early P mineral diversity by leveraging recent advances in the study of accessory mineralogy—specifically, the Mineral Evolution Database. This fine-scale heterogeneity of crustal P mineralogy is potentially important to consider in the case of prebiotic chemistry, as even globally rare phases may be locally abundant and therefore relevant to small-scale environmental processes leading up to the origin of life.

5.3. The mineral evolution database

Accessory P minerals are often difficult to model thermodynamically and also lack specific experimental and field investigation. Recently, however, large-scale datasets that specifically describe the accessory mineralogy of exposed crustal rocks have become available (e.g., the Mineral Evolution Database (MED; rruff.info/ima/), in association with mindat (https://www.mindat.org), combines spatial (locality) with temporal (age) data for individual mineral occurrences on Earth (Grosch and Hazen, 2015; Hazen, 2013; Hazen et al., 2008; Hystad et al., 2019; Morrison et al., 2018). For this study, we processed MED data for all of the P minerals so far used in prebiotic experiments, as well as additional instances of phosphates that might have been made under future scrutiny in this context.

Phosphorus Mineral Evolution Database (PMED) age data is sourced from the literature on specific mineral-locality occurrences listed on mindat.com and http://rruff.info/ima/. These ages can be of any kind—from isotopic to stratigraphic. Age data has been carefully filtered on the basis of paragenesis for this work i.e., high temperature primary vs low temperature secondary species. This provides greater certainty that meaningful age data is being interpreted in each case.

The temporal resolution of PMED declines in step with the rock record, terminating at 4 Ga. It is therefore challenging to obtain a representative dataset of occurrence over Earth history for each mineral. Compounding this problem, many of the phases of interest are short-lived under ‘ambient’ conditions; not surviving diagenesis, lithification, metamorphism, or weathering. It is especially challenging to compile accurate age distributions for these phases. Therefore, for those species that derive from more stable primary phases, the age relationships of parental minerals and suitable environmental conditions for their alteration have also been ascertained. This approach helps to extend the temporal range of known mineral localities where specific P-phases of interest could have formed.

5.4. Phosphorus mineral evolution

In this work, we have evaluated the paragenetic relationships and prebiotic plausibility of all phosphorus-bearing mineral species in PMED. Should the reader wish to check the details of a candidate mineral that is not discussed here, all of the information equivalent to that reported in this article is available online at med.com, mineralweb.com and handbookofmineralogy.com. 65 separate mineral species were targeted for detailed investigation, all of which are of some relevance to the question of early Earth phosphorus availability. This set contains either phases that have been previously used in ‘prebiotic’ chemistry, or that have formation conditions of some potential relevance to early Earth.

Table 2 presents compiled data on P mineral host lithology, oldest occurrence, number of occurrences, and conditions of formation for P-bearing phases of prebiotic interest. These data can be used to assess which mineral species plausibly existed in the Prebiotic Era, and then, of those species, which (if any) have any notable potential for driving prebiotic chemistry. We further classify those species according to the tectonic settings in which the environmental conditions needed for their formation occur. This nuance becomes important when considering that accessory phosphate mineralogy is diverse and will vary hugely between the different rock types that characterize different tectonic models. Doing so allows us to draw a link between the early geological state of prebiotic Earth and (mineralogical) aspects of origin of life scenarios. This link is crucial, since large scale tectonic processes will have behind a deeper imprint than minor environmental settings in the sparse geochemochemical evidence with which we are left to reconstruct prebiotic Earth.

A major subdivision can be made on the basis of crustal composition, given that stagnant and active tectonics result in the production of more mafic and more felsic rocks, respectively. A secondary division of active tectonic mode is then made. We therefore extend the compositional scenarios A (mafic) and B (felsic) given in Fig. 4, and discussed earlier, into the following tectonic categories: a primitive regime with stagnant lid tectonics and mafic crust (Fig. 5A), an evolved regime with vertical subduction tectonics and some felsic continental crust (Fig. 5B-1), where dense hydrated crustal material moves back into the mantle in downward-moving diapirs, and an alternative evolved regime, equivalent to the one operable on Earth today, of horizontal subduction-driven plate tectonics (Fig. 5B-2).

In Model B-1, early continental crust was generated via cyclic vertical sinking and melting of hydrated mafic crust (Johnson et al., 2017). In Model B2, continental crust is produced by the vertical passage of mafic rocks beneath an overriding plate of material i.e., slab subduction. Slab dehydration then results in high-pressure hydrous melting of overlying crust and arc mantle (Fig. 5B-2). Specifically, invoking material formed only in an e.g., subduction regime in a prebiotic model then requires the early Earth to have hosted such settings.
### Table 2
Phosphorus mineralogy of potential prebiotic relevance.

| Mineral name      | Formulae                  | Paragenesis     | Formation conditions and Lithologies                              | Geodynamic associations |
|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------|
| Pyrophosphate     | K₂CaP₂O₇                  | An              | Fire                                                               | /                       |
| Pyrocoprolite     | (Mg, K, Na)₃P₂O₇          | An              | Fire                                                               | /                       |
| Arnhemite         | (K, Na₂)₂Mg₂(P₂O₇)₅(H₂O)  | An              | Fire                                                               | /                       |
| Hydromannite      | Na₂Mg₃P₃O₁₀·12H₂O         | LTS (S)         | Polymetallic sulphide-ox                                            | /                       |
| Wooldridgeite     | Na₂Ca₃Cu₂(P₂O₇)₃·10H₂O    | LTS (S)         | Sediments + ore + ox                                               | /                       |
| Gengbachite       | KFe₃[(H₂PO₄)₄(HPO₄)₄·6H₂O  | LTS (An)        | Slag dumps                                                         | /                       |
| Haigerachite      | KFe₂⁺[(H₂PO₄)₄(HPO₄)₄·4H₂O | LTS (S)         | As-Pb-oxide                                                       | /                       |
| Struvite-(K)      | KMg₃(PO₄)₃·6H₂O           | LTS (S/LH)      | Dolostone, Pb-oxide                                                | /                       |
| Ludjibaite        | Cu₅(PO₄)₃(OH)₄            | LTS (S)         | Cu-ox                                                              | /                       |
| Cornetite         | Cu₃(PO₄)₃(OH)₃            | LTS (S)         | Cu-ox                                                              | /                       |
| Reichenbachite    | Cu₅(PO₄)₃(OH)₄            | LTS (S)         | Cu-ox                                                              | /                       |
| Hureaulite        | Mn₃⁺[(PO₄)₃(OH)]₃(PO₄)₃·4H₂O | HTS/LTS (S/LH) | Granite pegmatite + ox                                             | /                       |
| Libethinite       | Cu₅(PO₄)₃(OH)             | LTS (S)         | Cu-ox                                                              | /                       |
| Pseudomalachite   | Cu₅(PO₄)₃(OH)₄            | LTS              | Cu-ox                                                              | /                       |
| Turquoise         | Cu₅(PO₄)₃(OH)₄·4H₂O       | HTS/LTS (S)     |                                                                 /         |
| Kanonerekite      | Na₃Mg₃P₃O₁₀·12H₂O         | LTS (S/LH)      | Granite pegmatite + ox                                             | B1 / B2                 |
| Pyromorphite      | Pb₅(PO₄)₃Cl               | LTS/Volcanic Sublate | Pb-ox                                                              | /                       |
| Negevite          | NiP₂                      | HTS             | Ultra-reducing high-T metamorphism                                 | /                       |
| Zuktamurrite      | FeP₂                      | HTS             | Ultra-reducing high-T metamorphism                                 | /                       |
| Muraskoite        | FeP                       | HTS             | Ultra-reducing high-T metamorphism                                 | /                       |
| Halamishite       | NiP₂                      | HTS             | Ultra-reducing high-T metamorphism                                 | /                       |
| Transjordanite    | Ni₅P₃                     | HTS             | Ultra-reducing high-T metamorphism                                 | /                       |
| Cyclophosphate(s) | e.g., (Ni, Fe)₅P₃O₁₂      | HTS             | Ultra-reducing high-T metamorphism                                 | /                       |
| Canaphite         | Na₃Ca₃P₂O₇·4H₂O           | LTS (S/LH/A)    | Lake sediments                                                     | /                       |
| Variscite         | Al₅(PO₄)₃·2H₂O            | LTS (S/LH)      | Sedimentary/volcanic rocks, UAFW chemistry (AS)                     | /                       |
| Brushite          | Ca₅(PO₄)₃·2H₂O            | LTS (A)         | Clay-water interface, UAFW chemistry (AS)                          | /                       |
| Biphosphominate   | (NH₄)₅K₅(H₂PO₄)           | LTS             | Phosphate-rich rocks (AU).                                          | /                       |
| Archerite         | H₅K₅(PO₄)                | LTS             | Stalactites and wall rocks of caves                                 | /                       |
| Phosphominate     | (NH₄)₅(PO₄)OH             | LTS             | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                               | /                       |
| Mundrabillite     | (NH₄)₅Ca₅(PO₄)OH·H₂O      | LTS             | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                               | /                       |
| Swankoite         | (NH₄)₅Ca₅(PO₄)OH·H₂O      | LTS             | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                               | /                       |
| Dittmarite        | (NH₄)₅Mg₅(PO₄)·H₂O        | LTS             | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                               | /                       |
| Mineral          | Formula                  | Paragenetic Code | Additional Details                                                                 |
|------------------|--------------------------|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Stercorite       | (NH₄)Na₂(P₃O₁₀)·4H₂O    | LTS              | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                                                 |
| Bebierite        | Mg₂(PO₄)₆·3H₂O           | LTS              | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                                                 |
| Schertelrite     | (NH₄)₂Mg₂PO₄·3H₂O        | LTS              | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                                                 |
| Hannayite        | (NH₄)₂Mg₂(PO₄)₃·9H₂O     | LTS              | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                                                 |
| Niallite         | (NH₄)Mn₃(PO₄)·H₂O        | LTS              | Phosphate-rich rocks                                                                 |
| Lüneburgite      | Mg₃[Be₂(OH)₆(P₃O₁₀)]·6H₂O| LTS              | Evaporites + dolomitic marls (SD), UAFW chemistry (AS)                               |
| Childrenite      | Fe₃⁺Al[PO₄]₂(OH)·H₂O     | LTS              | Granite pegmatites (GR)                                                            |
| Wagnerite        | Mg₂(PO₄)F                | Primary/HTS      | Granite pegmatites (GR), metamorphic                                                |
| Hydroxylapaticite| Ca₃(PO₄)OH               | HTS/LTS          | Granite pegmatite (GR), serpentinite (SP)                                            |
| Triplite         | (Mn₂⁺,Fe₂⁺₂⁺)(PO₄)F      | Primary/HTS      | Granite pegmatites (GR)                                                            |
| Hydroxyliderite  | CaBe(PO₄)(OH)            | Primary/HTS      | Be-Granite pegmatite (GR)                                                           |
| Whitlockite      | Ca₃Mg₃(PO₄)₃(PO₄)₁₀     | HTS/LTS (S/LH)   | Granite pegmatites (GR), P-rich rocks                                               |
| Monetite         | Ca₂(PO₄)₂OH              | LTS (S/LH)       | Granite pegmatite + ox, UAFW chemistry                                               |
| Nahpoite         | Na₂(PO₄)OH               | LTS (S/LJ/A)     | Phosphatic Ironstone; alkaline magmatism (AK)                                       |
| Herderite        | CaBe(PO₄)F               | LTS (S/LH)       | Be-Granite pegmatite (GR)                                                           |
| Schreibersite    | (Fe, Ni)₂O₆              | Primary          | Reduced igneous rocks, impact-craters/sediments (VP)                               |
| Monazite-(La)    | La₄(PO₄)₂                | Primary/HTS      | Granite and gneiss (GR)                                                            |
| Dorfmanite       | Na₂(PO₄)(OH)·2H₂O        | HTS/LTS          | Alkaline magmatism (AK)                                                             |
| Xeneitite-(Y)    | Y(PO₄)                  | Primary/HTS      | AK, granites, gneiss, alpine veins (GR)                                              |
| Monazite-(Ce)    | Ce(PO₄)₃                | Primary/HTS/LTS (A) | Common igneous phase (GR)                                                          |
| Vivianite        | Fe₃⁺₂(PO₄)₂·8H₂O         | Primary/HTS/LTS (S/LJ/A) | Granite pegmatite (GR-P?), authigenic marine (AU)                                    |
| Chlorapatite     | Ca₅(PO₄)₃Cl             | Primary/HTS      | Igneous, metamorphic (GR, MA)                                                       |
| Wavellite        | Al₂(PO₄)(OH)·5H₂O        | LTS              | Metamorphic, hydrothermal veins                                                     |
| Newberryite      | Mg₂(PO₄)OH·3H₂O          | LTS              | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                                                 |
| Struvite         | (NH₄)₂Mg₂(PO₄)·6H₂O      | LTS              | UAFW chemistry (AS)                                                                 |
| Calcite          | CaCO₃                   | HTS/LTS          | Various                                                                              |
| Iron (oxy)oxides | (CO₃)₃⁺[Fe⁺²⁺Fe³⁺⁺(HO₄)ₓ][²⁺· | HTS/LTS          | Various                                                                              |
| Fluorapatite     | Ca₅(PO₄)F               | Primary/HTS/LTS (A) | Common igneous phase (GR, MA)                                                       |
| Feldspar         | KAl₃Si₃O₈ – NaAlSi₃O₈ – CaAl₂Si₂O₆ | Primary/HTS | Common igneous phase (GR, MA)                                                       |
| Garnet           | X₁Y₁(SiO₄)₃ (Fe, Mg, Mn, Ca; Al, Cr, Fe) | Primary/HTS | Common igneous phase (GR, MA, UM)                                                   |
| Olivine          | (Mg, Fe)₂SiO₄            | Primary          | Common igneous phase (MA, UM)                                                      |
| Pyroxene         | MgFe₂SiAl₂O₆             | Primary/HTS      | Common igneous phase (MA, UM)                                                      |
| Volcanic glass   | /                       | Primary          | Common igneous phase (GR, MA, UM)                                                   |

Color codes: **Unlikely**, Uncertain, Possible (rare), Possible (unreactive), Likely. General paragenetic codes: (A) – anthropogenic; HTS – high temperature secondary; LTS – low temperature secondary; LH – late hydrothermal; – ox – oxidative weathering; S – supergene. Setting-specific paragenetic codes: AS – alternative solvent. AK – alkali igneous; AU – authigenic; GR – granitoid igneous; MA-mafic igneous; SD – clastic sedimentary environment; SP- serpentinization; UM – ultramafic igneous; VP – vapor phase deposition and volcanic fumaroles. Age of oldest occurrence (for primary igneous minerals) along with further paragenetic details are given in File EA-2.
Those species whose environmental conditions of formation involve processes that are definitively known to have developed at some point after the Hadean Eon are filtered out (highlighted in red). For example, pseudomalachite forms only via oxidative weathering and hence can only have occurred since the Great Oxygenation Event (GOE), at ~2.45 Ga (Table 2). Despite this inherent limitation, pseudomalachite has been used as a mineral-phosphorylating agent in some prebiotic experiments (Costanzo et al., 2007). Whilst results from these projects still have relevance for highlighting potential chemical avenues of interest, they cannot provide outright solutions to the problem of concentrating P on early Earth given their use of materials that did not plausibly occur in the Hadean Eon.

We can rule out a number of other similar mineral species as prebiotically relevant based on their paragenetic associations (Table 2). Whilst ages of oldest occurrence are challenging to ascertain for secondary species, we can confidently identify these ages for primary igneous species. For example, minerals containing oxidised Fe$^{3+}$ as a stoichiometric component occur only after 2.45 Ga. This outcome adds confidence to any inferences about secondary species made solely on the basis of paragenetic mode.

The potential of each phase in Table 2 for driving prebiotic chemistry is dependent on its abundance, reactivity, and complementarity to a prebiotic chemical model i.e., reaction schemes that are proposed to have operated in hot springs, submarine vents, etc. Several species in Table 2 can be identified as extremely rare – with only a few occurrences present in the entirety of the database (highlighted in purple). These mineral species may simply occur under very unusual environmental circumstances, be prone to preservation bias, or some combination of the two. A key example is schreibersite which, being a phosphide mineral, will have suffered from oxidative weathering at the Earth’s surface since the GOE, whilst also require unusual reducing conditions for its formation. There are then those species which were both plausibly present in the Hadean and likely to have been abundant at the time, but which have thus far proven essentially completely unreactive for prebiotic chemistry, e.g., xenotime and monazite (Pasek et al., 2017). These highly insoluble and unreactive P minerals are highlighted in blue. Until new experiments prove otherwise, these species can be considered essentially irrelevant as mineral sources of prebiotic P. ‘Likely’ Prebiotic phases are highlighted in green and ‘uncertain’ phases in orange.

Many of the primary species highlighted here as of ‘uncertain’ prebiotic occurrence form in sagduction or subduction regimes (Fig. 5B-1/2). Triplite, hydroxylherderite, vivianite, whitlockite, and herderite are known to occur (as igneous phases) in granitic pegmatites, which result from extreme fractional crystallization and differentiation (Table 2). There is currently little evidence that granite pegmatites occur in the rock record beyond ~3 Ga (Sweetapple and Collins, 2002). Preservation bias of these relatively rare lithologies might be invoked to explain their absence in the early Archean rock record, yet it is also contentious.
whether or not the geodynamic conditions required to produce them could have prevailed much before this time. Pegmatites are found in I-A-type (igneous-derived) and S-type (sediment-derived) felsic magmatic suites.

For I-A-type pegmatites (igneous source materials), it would appear that the concentration of heat-producing and volatile elements due the recycling of continental crust is important for their formation, requiring an evolved geodynamic regime (Fig. SB-1/2). A key pre-requisite for S-type granite formation is melting of metasedimentary material, along with subsequent fractionation (enhanced by the presence of volatiles). This melting often occurs in subduction-related orogens (London, 2018). S-type granites are therefore most plausible given some form of tectonic cycling of volatiles from the surface to depth (Fig. SB-1/2). Hence, we can tie the presence or absence of pegmatitic mineral species on Early Earth to prevailing tectonic regimes. Pegmatitic species are unlikely to have occurred on an early Earth with stagnant lid tectonics (Fig. SA) – regardless of whether some low-volume felsic magmatism was ongoing.

Although several of the rare accessory phases of plausible prebiotic occurrence in Table 2 have been shown to have some unique/useful role in experimental work, there is no strong case that they were abundant on early Earth – limiting the plausibility of prebiotic scenarios that rely on such phases. This leaves several species which, on the basis of available evidence, are plausibly prebiotic, possibly abundant, and potentially soluble.

6. Phosphorus mineralogy and prebiotic P availability

6.1. Schreibersite

Schreibersite is a promising candidate for a prebiotic source of P owing to its high reactivity and solubility in natural waters of varied composition at ambient conditions (Bryant et al., 2013; Kee et al., 2013; Pasek, 2019b; Pasek et al., 2015; Pasek et al., 2013, 2007; Pasek and Lauretta, 2008), yet is very rare in the terrestrial rock record (Table 2). For schreibersite to be a primary igneous mineral on early Earth requires that magmas were forming under exceptionally reducing conditions (Brett and Sato, 1984) – far more reducing than any conditions found on the modern Earth. However, Earth’s upper mantle likely oxidised to near its modern state very rapidly (Trail et al., 2011; Williams et al., 2012; Yang et al., 2014), and (possible) reduced deep mantle P reservoirs are unlikely to have interacted with surface reservoirs.

It is conceivable that localized reducing zones of the upper mantle and crust could have occurred as ‘hold-overs’ from highly reducing conditions that prevailed during Earth’s formation, or were generated during reducing events, e.g., the impact of a large enstatite-type body (Benner et al., 2020). H₂-rich magmas generated from these reducing source materials may have migrated towards the surface and hence provided a flux of reducing material to the surface for up to several hundred million years (Bali et al., 2013; Rimmer and Shorttle, 2019). These putative reducing magmas may well have become saturated in reduced P minerals, or Fe²⁻P alloys. Similarly, such ultra-reducing localized settings may provide a plausible host environment for alternative phosphate phases, e.g., Table 2 (Britvin et al., 2015) and reduced P compounds, e.g., cyclophosphates (Britvin et al., 2020), which would otherwise appear to require the involvement of biology (Table 2). The plausibility of hydrothermal reduced-P-bearing systems is deserving of future study (Fig. 6).

Even more plausible is exogenous schreibersite delivery. Our review of meteoritic mineralogy strongly supports that this phase would have been among the most abundant P-bearing phases delivered to early Earth. However, unlike the other phases with strong prebiotic potential discussed in this review, schreibersite availability would have been stochastic. Direct delivery would only have been possible where impactor velocity and size permitted passage through the atmosphere and also avoided vaporization upon arrival at the surface. Indirect alternatives for exogenous reduced P delivery include settling of post-impact vapor condensates (Douglas et al., 2020; Mehta et al., 2018) and production of reduced P in-situ, in impact craters (Pasek, 2017). The plausibility of prebiotic chemistry utilising these various exogenous sources of P has yet to receive detailed attention (Fig. 6).

A key concern regarding the prebiotic utility of reduced-P-bearing phases is their solubility in aqueous solution. Direct surface-reactivity during schreibersite corrosion is known to actively phosphorylate organic compounds (Pasek et al., 2007). However, the dissolution rate and ultimate steady-state concentrations of reactive P in environments that may have interacted with reduced-P-bearing phases remain unknown. These constraints will be critical for evaluating the role that reduced-P-bearing phases may have played in prebiotic chemistry, which may have required up to molar concentrations to ensure effective pH buffering and selective forward reactions (Patel et al., 2015; Sutherland, 2015).

6.2. Apatite

The apatite ternary end-members stand out as the most abundant phosphate phases listed in PMED. The presence of these phases in preserved early felsic igneous rocks (Table 2) confirms the likelihood that apatite, principally as F-bearing fluorapatite (Watson, 1980), would have comprised at least some non-trivial fraction of the crustal P reservoir. Apatite has a very low solubility in the majority of solutions found at the Earth’s surface today (Brantley and Olsen, 2014). However, there are in fact several of ways to drastically increase apatite solubility. These mechanisms include site-specific chemical attack by cations, increased temperature, and physical weathering (Chairat et al., 2007; Harouiya et al., 2007). The most dramatic and universally relevant control on apatite solubility is pH (Pearce, 1988). Apatite dissolution rate and solubility product increase by orders of magnitude across both the temperature and pH scales, implying that aqueous environments of >20 °C and < pH 7 will readily dissolve out apatite during water-rock interactions (Chairat et al., 2007; Strachan, 2017).

Experiments have also revealed high sensitivity of fluorapatite stability to the dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC – in seawater, an equilibria between carbonic acid, bicarbonate ion and carbonate ion) content of aqueous fluid in equilibrium with a source of CO₂ (Jahnke, 1984). In experiments reported by (Pan and Darvall, 2016; Pan and Darvell, 2009), the solubility effect of CO₂ on apatite was detectable even at very low pH i.e., effectively zero carbonate ion in solution. The authors attributed this continued effect on apatite solubility to complexation of

![Figure 6](image-url)
Ca by bicarbonate (HCO$_3^-$) and carbonic acid in solution, whilst noting that the DIC effect is largest at high pH. Overall, the results of (Pan and Darvell, 2010, Pan and Darvell, 2009) imply that pCO$_2$ is a relevant factor in controlling apatite solubility regardless of pH. We therefore expect inorganic carbon to have played an important role in solubilising apatite across a wide range of geochemical environments (Kakegawa et al., 2002). Overall, experimental constraints suggest that apatite will be most useful as a prebiotic P source in end-member scenarios where both global surface temperatures and atmospheric pCO$_2$ are high.

Apatite is also among the most common exogenously delivered P-bearing phases (Fig. 2). Exogenous apatite does not obviously have a clear advantage over endogenous apatite for fueling high P availability during prebiotic chemistry (Table 3). A circumstance in which this situation would be reversed is given a putative mafic early crust (Fig. 5A; Fig. 6; Table 3), where endogenous silicate- and exogenous apatite-hosted P were both more available than the crustal apatite P reservoir. Especially in earliest Earth history, then, and potentially during the origin of life, it is possible that apatite may have only rarely occurred in the Earth’s crust. In its stead, silicate phases would have dominated the mass balance of available P in surface-exposed environments.

### 6.3. Silicate phases

Silicate phases, whilst previously considered as exotic and reactive potential candidates for supplying P to prebiotic chemistry (Holm, 2014), have received little attention in the context of experimental prebiotic chemistry. However, silicate-hosted P may have dominated the crustal P reservoir on an early Earth with little continental crust (Fig. 3-4). Crystalline mafic silicate phases (e.g., olivine, pyroxene) are generally slower to weather than apatite, mafic silicate glasses are comparatively rapidly broken down across a range of physiochemical conditions, and all of these phases weather rapidly at high temperatures (Priggiobbe et al., 2009). This perspective is important for the plausibility of origin scenarios that rely on high P concentrations in submarine or subaerial hydrothermal environments, where higher temperatures would serve to accelerate the dissolution of crystalline and glassy mafic silicate phases.

A challenge in this regard, though, is that such models typically rely upon iron-oxide formation as a critical part of the prebiotic chemical network (Barge et al., 2015). Such phases would act to scrub phosphate from solution and thereby potentially impose local limits on P availability. On the other hand, recent experimental work has shown that iron-redox chemistry may circumnavigate these issues: sorbed phosphate may be reduced and released as phosphite during hydrothermal alteration (Hersch et al., 2018) and/or prebiotic reactions involving P may take place on iron-oxide mineral surfaces directly (Wang et al., 2019) (Fig. 6; Table 3).

### 7. Conclusions and outlook

#### 7.1. Limited diversity of P minerals on early Earth

Despite the enormous diversity of P mineralogy observed today, mineral evolution indicates that very of these minerals would have been present on the early Earth, with even fewer being potentially important for prebiotic chemistry. Alongside silicate phases, in which P comprises a minor component, only apatite is of clear relevance as an endogenous source of P for prebiotic chemistry (Fig. 6; Table 3). Exogenous phases of importance are limited to merrillite, apatite, and schreibersite (Fig. 6; Table 3).

We rule out a number of phases as being prebiotically plausible, some of which have previously been used in prebiotic analogue experiments (e.g., pseudomalachite). This restricts the mineralogical parameter space available for origin of life scenarios. This allows us to identify the specific challenges or advantages of a given mineral-chemical scenario for prebiotic chemistry. These issues are unique to each phase (Table 3). That the environmental conditions needed to liberate P from each phase can differ so much suggests that distinct mineral-chemical-environmental scenarios for prebiotic chemistry may be formulated (Table 3; Fig. 6). This outcome is useful for reducing the parameter space of possible scenarios for prebiotic chemistry. Moreover, a specific plausibility can be conferred to each scenario based on the assumed distribution of mineral phases on early Earth. As such, a better understanding of early Earth geology, chemistry, and surface environment will serve to clarify progressively the prebiotic plausibility of these scenarios.

#### 7.2. Mineralogy and the probability landscape of prebiotic chemistry

The plausibility landscape for elevated aqueous P concentrations on the prebiotic Earth heavily depends on the assumptions we make about early P mineralogy. If specific rare minerals are invoked in a chemical model, then the probability of that scenario is inherently limited by the coincidence of geological processes and environmental conditions (e.g., rare pegmatite formation followed by overlapping meteorite impact). Conversely, models that use species of global distribution may have their probability mainly controlled by other factors, e.g., occurrence of hydrothermal systems which promote P-mineral dissolution.

Looking again at globally distributed phases, a broadly mafic early...
crust will confer a probabilistic advantage to models invoking mafic silicate phases, whereas a felsic early crust will favor the involvement of (f라도)apatite. We can therefore directly relate the probability of mineral-chemical scenarios to the tectonic and environmental state of early Earth, bridging the fields of geoscience and prebiotic chemistry. This review has highlighted the importance of understanding long-term changes in Earth’s accreted materials, crustal composition, and tectonic mode when reconstructing early available P mineralogy. Further constraints on early Earth P mineralogy will therefore help to discriminate between competing models of prebiotic chemistry.

Acknowledgments

Funding

This research was funded by NERC, grant number NE/L002507/1, UKRI. Sloan, Deep Carbon Observatory, Keck, Templeton, NASA Astrobiology Institute, and a private foundation are all acknowledged for their support. F.J acknowledges funding from the NERC ‘Deep Volatiles’ consortium grant (NE/M000427/1). H.W. acknowledges funding from the NERC ‘Mantle Volatiles’ consortium grant (NE/M000303/1) and from the ERC Consolidator Grant 306655 (‘Habitable Planet’). M.P. acknowledges funding from NASA Exobiology grant 80NSSC18K1288.

Author contributions

Conceptualization, C.-W., O.-S., F.-J., and R.H. methodology, C.W.; validation, C.W. and O.-S. formal analysis, C.W.; investigation, C.W.; resources, O.-S., H.W., and R.H.; data curation, C.W. and R.H.; writing—original draft preparation, C.W.; writing—review and editing, C.W., O.-S., A.D., M.P., R.H. All authors have read and agreed to the original draft preparation, C.W.; writing—review and editing, C.W.;—supervision, O.S., M.P., R.H.; project administration, O.S.; funding acquisition, C.W., O.-S., M.P., R.H. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Data and materials availability

All data needed to evaluate the conclusions in the paper are present in the paper.

Declaration of Competing Interest

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

Acknowledgments

Dr. Mahesh Anand, Dr. Paul Rimmer, and Dr. Sami Mikhail are thanked for encouragement and during the conception, researching and writing of this manuscript.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscl.2021.103806.

References

Bali, E., Audekat, A., Keppler, H., 2013. Water and hydrogen are immiscible in Earth’s mantle. Nature 495, 220. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature12008.
Barge, L.M., Cardoso, S.S.S., Cartwright, J.H.E., Cooper, G.J.T., Cronin, L., Wit, A.D., Postma, T.J., Grimm, J., Visscher, P., 2011. Evolution of the “water line” over the past 3 billion years. Geochim Cosmochim Act 75, 6450–6472. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2011.08.031.

Binzel, R.P., Xu, S., Bus, S.J., Krivovichev, S.V., Meier, M.R., Knezeck, P., Barker, E.S., 1993. Discovery of a Main-Belt Asteroid Resembling Ordinary Chondrite Meteorites. Science 262, 1541–1543. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.262.5139.1541.
Bowler, M.W., Clamp, M.J., Walito, J.P., Blackburn, G.M., 2010. Why did Nature select phosphorus on the early Earth? Geochim Cosmochim Ac 109, 909–90044–8. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2007.08.031.
Crawford, I.A., Kee, T.P., 2013. Hydrothermal modification of the Sikhote-Alin iron meteorite. Meteorit Planet Sci 48, 371–390. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1945-5100.2012.01339.x.
Dhuime, B., Wuestefeld, A., Hawkesworth, C.J., 2015. Emergence of modern continental crust at 3.5 billion years ago. Earth Planet Sci Lett 41, pp. 439–448. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2014.04.012.
Fegley, B., Lewis, J.S., 1980. Volatile Element Chemistry in the Solar Nebula Na, K, F, CI, Ne and Ar. Science 209, 529–531. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.5030031.
Greber, N.D., Dauphas, N., Bekker, A., Pätzold, M.P., Bindeman, I.N., Hofmann, A., 2017. Titanium isotopic evidence for felsic crust and plate tectonics 3.5 billion years ago. Science 357, 1217–1214. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aan0266.
Greber, N.D., Dauphas, N., Bekker, A., Pätzold, M.P., Bindeman, I.N., Hofmann, A., 2017. Titanium isotopic evidence for felsic crust and plate tectonics 3.5 billion years ago. Science 357, 1217–1214. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aan0266.
Green, T.H., Watson, E.B., 1982. Crystallization of apatite in natural magmas under high pressure, hydrothermal conditions, with particular reference to the ‘Organic’ rock series. Geol Mag 119, 79–96. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0016756800047695.
Harouiya, N., Chaïrat, C., K. Marchi, S., Bottke, W.F., Elkins-Tanton, L.T., Bierhaus, M., Wuennemann, K., Mallmann, G., Lodders, K., 2003. Solar system abundances and condensation temperatures of the elements. Astrophys. J. 588, 422–459. https://doi.org/10.1086/378114.

Marchi, S., Bottke, W.F., Elkins-Tanton, L.T., Bierhaus, M., Wuennemann, K., Morbidelli, A., Kring, D.A., 2014. Widespread mixing and burial of Earth’s Hadean crust by asteroid impacts. Earth Planet. Sc. Lett. 390, 571–582. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2014.01.026.

McCoy-West, A.J., Chowdhury, P., Burton, K.W., Soni, P., Nowell, M.G., Fitton, J.G., Kerr, A.C., Cawood, P.A., Williams, H.M., 2019. Extensive crustal extraction in Earth’s early history inferred from molybdenum isotopes. Nat. Geosci. 12, 946–951. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-018-0205-z.

Mcdonough, W.F., Sun, S.S., 1995. The composition of the Earth. Chem. Geol. 120, 223–253. https://doi.org/10.1016/0009-2541(94)00144-4.

McSween, H.Y., Labotka, T.C., 1993. Oxidation during metamorphism of the ordinary chondrites. Geochem. Cosmochim. Acta 57, 1105–1114. https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(93)90381-A.

Mehta, G., Perez, A., Thompson, M.A., 2019. Crusts to Exogenous Organic Delivery from Ablation, Dilution, and thermal Degradation. Life 8, 13. https://doi.org/10.3390/life8020013.

Mininni, C., Fontani, F., Rivilla, V.M., Beltran, M.T., Cozzi, P., Vasyunin, A., 2018. On the origin of phosphorus nitride in star-forming regions. Mon Notices Royal Astronomical Soc Lett 475, L39–L44. https://doi.org/10.1093/mnrasl/sly026.

Morrison, S.M., Runyon, S.E., Hazen, R.M., 2018. The Paleomineralogy of the Hadean Earth. Revited. Life 8, 54. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12583-017-0515-8.

O'Neill, H.S.C., Jenner, P.E., 2012. The pattern of trace-element distributions in ocean floor basaits. Nature 491, 698. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature11678.

Palme, H., O'Neill, H.S.C., 2014. Cosmochemical estimates of mantle composition. In: Treatise on Geochemistry. 2nd edition. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-444-53270-7.00021-0.

Pan, H.-B., Darwell, B.W., 2009. Calcium Phospholite Solubility: the need for Re-Evaluation. Cryst. Growth Des. 9, 639–645. https://doi.org/10.1021/cg801111v.

Pan, H., Darwell, B.W., 2010. Effect of Carbonate on Hydrosaprite Solubility. Cryst. Growth Des. 10, 845–850. https://doi.org/10.1021/cg101998r.

Pasek, M.A., 2017. Schreibersite on the early Earth: scenarios for prebiotic phosphorylation. Geosci. Front. 8, 329–335. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12303-016-0068-0.

Pasek, M.A., 2019a. Phosphorus volatility in the early Solar nebula. Icarus 317, 59–65. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2018.07.011.

Pasek, M.A., 2019b. A role for phosphorus redox in emerging and modern biochemistry. Chem. Rev. 119, 3696–3752. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.chemrev.9b00268.

Pasek, M.A., Lauretta, D., 2008. Extraterrestrial flux of potentially prebiotic C, N, and P to the early earth. Origins Life Evol B, 8, 51. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sibepol.2008.01.006.

Pasek, M.A., Dworkin, J.P., Lauretta, D.S., 2007. A radical pathway for organic phosphorylation during schreibersite corrosion with implications for the origin of life. Geochim Cosmochim Ac 71, 1721–1736. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2006.12.016.

Pasek, M.A., Hammel, J.W., Buick, R., Gull, M., Atlas, Z. 2013. Evidence for reactive reduced phosphorus species in the early Archean Ocean. Proc National Acad Sci 110, 10089–10094. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1309041110.

Pasek, M.A., Herschy, B., Kee, T.P., 2015. Phosphorus: a case for mineral-organic reactions in prebiotic chemistry. Origins Life Evol B 45, 207–218. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.oiçe.2015.01.040-240-y.

Pasek, M.A., Gull, M., Herschy, B., 2017. Phosphorylation on the early earth. Chem. Geol. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2017.11.003.

Paytan, A., McLaughlin, K., 2007. The Oceanic Phosphorus Cycle. Chem. Rev. 107, 563–576. https://doi.org/10.1021/cr0600313.

Pearce, E.I.F., 1988. On the Dissolution of Hydroxyapatite in Acid Solutions. J. Dent. Res. 67, 1056–1058. https://doi.org/10.1177/002203458806701008.

Pietrocola, L., Mazzechi, Y., Rigano, L., Thomasian, D., Marti, B., 2020. Earth’s water may have been inherited from material similar to enstatite chondrite meteorites. Sci New York N Y 369, 1100–1113. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aba1948.

Pino, M., Pasek, M.A., Sökolv, D.A., Sidorov, A.N., Gann, R.D., Orlando, T.M., 2014. Investigation of schreibersite and intrinsic oxidizing products from Sikhote-Alin, Seymchan, and Odessa meteorites and Fe3P and Fe2NiP synthetic surrogates. Geochim Cosmochim Ac 140, 259–274. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2014.05.027.

Pijpibej, V., Costa, G., Baciocchi, R., Hänchen, M., Mazzotti, M., 2009. The effect of CO2 and salinity on olivine dissolution kinetics at 120-C. Chem. Eng. Sci. 64, 3510–3515. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ces.2008.04.035.

Richert, K., Pando, K.M., Danielson, L., Lee, C.T., 2010. Partitioning of Mo, P and other siderophile elements (Cu, Ga, Sn, Ni, Co, Cr, V, and W) between metal and silicate melt as a function of temperature and silicate melt composition. Earth Planet Sci Lett 291, 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2009.12.018.

Richert, K., Pando, K., Humayum, M., Waiselmann, N., Yang, S., Boujibar, A., Danielison, L.R., 2018. Effect of pressure on organic activity in molybdenum-rich siderophile elements (Cu, Pd, Pt, P, Ga, Cu, Zn, and Pb) in Liquid Fe: Roles of Core Formation, late Sulfdile Matte, and late Veneer in Shaping Terrestrial Mantle Geochemistry. Geochim Cosmochim Ac. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2018.06.011.

Renne, P.R., Shottlere, O., Pande, S., Wetherbee, M.J., 2004. Life’s Building Blocks in Carbon- and Nitrogen-Rich Surface Hydrothermal Vents. Life 9, 12. https://doi.org/10.3390/life9010012.
Sikdar, J., Rai, V.K., 2020. Si-Mg isotopes in enstatite chondrites and accretion of reduced planetary bodies. Sci Rep-uk 10, 1273. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-57635-1.

Strachan, D., 2017. Glass dissolution as a function of pH and its implications for understanding mechanisms and future experiments ScienceDirect. Geochim. Cosmochim Acta 219, 111-123. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2017.09.008.

Sutherland, J.D., 2015. The Origin of Life—out of the Blue. Angewandte Chemie Int Ed 55, 104-121. https://doi.org/10.1002/anie.201506585.

Sweetapple, M.T., Collins, P.L.F., 2002. Genetic Framework for the Classification and distribution of Archean rare Metal Pegmatites in the North Pilbara Craton, Western Australia. Econ. Geol. 97, 873-895.

Tang, M., Chen, K., Rudnick, R.L., 2016. Archean upper crust transition from mafic to felsic marks the onset of plate tectonics. Science 351, 372-375. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aad5513.

Taylor, S.R., McLennan, S.M., 1995. The geochemical evolution of the continental crust. Rev. Geophys. 33, 241-265.

Tollari, N., Toplis, M.J., Barnes, S.-J., 2006. Predicting phosphate saturation in silicate magmas: an experimental study of the effects of melt composition and temperature. Geochim Cosmochim Ac 70, 1518–1536. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2005.11.024.

Toner, J.D., Catling, D.C., 2020. A carbonate-rich lake solution to the phosphate problem of the origin of life. Proc National Acad Sci 117, 883-888. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1916109117.

Toplis, M.J., Dingwell, D.B., Libourel, G., 1994. The effect of phosphorus on the iron redox ratio, viscosity, and density of an evolved ferro-basalt. Contrib Mineral Petr 117, 293-304. https://doi.org/10.1007/bf00301060.

Trail, D., Watson, E.B., Tailby, N.D., 2011. The oxidation state of Hadean magmas and implications for early Earth’s atmosphere. Nature 480, 79-82. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature10655.

Watson, E.B., 1980. Apatite and phosphorus in mantle source regions: an experimental study of apatite/melt equilibria at pressures to 25 kbar. Earth Planet Sc Lett 51, 322-335. https://doi.org/10.1016/0012-821x(80)90214-9.

Watson, E.B., Cherniak, D.J., Hofyros, M.E., 2015. Diffusion of phosphorus in olivine and molten basalt. Am. Mineral. 100, 2053-2065. https://doi.org/10.2138/am-2015-5416.

Westheimer, F.H., 1987. Why nature chose phosphates. Science 235, 1173-1178. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.2434996.

Williams, H.M., Wood, B.J., Wade, J., Frost, D.J., Tuff, J., 2012. Isotopic evidence for internal oxidation of the Earth’s mantle during accretion. Earth Planet Sc Lett 321, 54-63. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2011.12.030.

Yang, X., Gaillard, F., Scaillet, B., 2014. A relatively reduced Hadean continental crust and implications for the early atmosphere and crustal rheology. Earth Planet Sc Lett 393, 210-219. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2014.02.056.

Zanda, B., Bourot-Denise, M., Perron, C., Hewins, R.H., 1994. Origin and Metamorphic Redistribution of Silicon, Chromium, and Phosphorus in the Metal of Chondrites. Science 265, 1846-1849.

Zhang, A.-C., Li, Q.-L., Yurimoto, H., Sakamoto, N., Li, X.-H., Hu, S., Lin, Y.-T., Wang, R.-C., 2016. Young asteroidal fluid activity revealed by absolute age from apatite in carbonaceous chondrite. Nat. Commun. 7, 12844. https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms12844.

Zhu, F., Li, J., Liu, J., Dong, J., Liu, Z., 2019. Metallic iron limits silicate hydration in Earth’s transition zone. Proc National Acad Sci 116, 22526–22530. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1908716116.