DEVELOPMENT OF DAIRY PROCESSING SYSTEMS IN URBAN AND PERI-URBAN AREA: THE CASE OF SMALL-SCALE PROCESSORS IN SOUTHERN BENIN.

Mohamed Cherifou Dine Aboudoulaye¹, Virgile Ahyi², Sevim Kaya¹.

¹. Department of Food Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, University of Gaziantep, 27000, Gaziantep, Turkey,
². Laboratory of Health Security, Expertise and Analysis, Regional Institute of Industrial Engineering, Biotechnologies and Applied Sciences, University IRGIB Africa, Cotonou, Benin.

Abstract

Milk and dairy products contain an important source of nutrients for human well-being. This dairy sector continuously subjected to economic and socio-structural changes plays an important role in Benin’s economy. Restructuring and implementation of appropriate conditions are two fundamental targets of dairy processing development policies, which will increase the level of production, ensure high quality of products and improve livelihood of local population. The main objective of this study was to determine the factors curbing the development of small-scale dairy processor units located in urban and suburban zones in southern Benin. Data were collected through individual interviews and group discussion based on structured questionnaire, which were designed to collect information relating to: socio-structural, processing capacity, packaging and preservation, marketing, supports and major constraints faced by dairy units. It was observed that processing units using fresh milk and powder milk have a daily capacity ranging between 21-50 L and 11-20 kg respectively. The most important dairy products are Yogurt, Wagashi and Deguè. None of dairy processors units performed the qualitative analysis (microbiological, chemical or nutrient content). Because of the packing and conservation default, the cheese is sold as soon as produced then they have no preservation methods applied, this could cause losing the quality of cheese. Lack of governmental regulations and difficulties to access loans are the main constraints restraining the business activities. The finding of study provided information that should be taken into account when implementing new policies to ensure an industrialization and sustainable development of this vital sub-sector.

Introduction:

Development of dairy processing systems takes place in different ways for various needs. The content of this development plan differs according to some characteristics (regulations, the level of development and the vision of the country) will be established. The common purpose of development plan of dairy processing systems is to archive a better processing standard in terms of food safety and consumer well-being.

Corresponding Author: Mohamed Cherifou Dine Aboudoulaye.
Address: Department of Food Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, University of Gaziantep, 27000, Gaziantep, Turkey. Email: dineaboudoulaye@gmail.com. Tel: +905415266487
Milk and dairy foods are one of the most important nutrients (energy, protein and fat) sources for human consumption. Referring to Durand et al. (2015), dairy sector involved in this study were the different stakeholders, whose dairy processing units. In Benin, it was determined that there were a few numbers of dairy industries. The large share of dairy market is controlled by the unorganised and informal small processors. According to Alkoiret et al., until 2009 there was only one mini dairy industry in Benin. This mini dairy created by the National Association of Ruminants' Farmers had been located in the district of Gogounou, Northern Benin. Its production has based on using raw milk collected locally in the commune and not on milk reconstituted from the imported milk powder (Alkoiret et al., 2009). Given that the development of small-scale industries is the necessary basis for the development of formal standardized food chain (Giagiacomo, 2003); implementation of development policies was indeed pertinent. From this standpoint, in recent years, the successive governments have undertaken a number of incentives to intensify milk production and processing. These actions mainly aimed the reorganization of milk collection by launching vast program or projects of construction and equipments of collection plants; and making them available to producers. For instance throughout the project PAFILAV (Projet d’Appui aux Filières Lait et Viande) the government built four other mini-dairy producers (Anonymous, 2017). Unfortunately, the investments made did not brightly succeed. Indeed, several problems mainly related to milk storing, its transportation to the collection points by farmers and the entire organization still need to be solved (Anonymous, 2017).

Milk in Benin is sold as raw through informal markets, and they are processed into various dairy products, this forms a relatively important socio-economic activity (Giagiacomo, 2003). Several studies have been carried out on the characterization of dairy herds in the Benin Northern. However, studies assessing the performance and competitiveness of the processing sub-sector in general and particularly in urban and peri-urban areas in Southern Benin practically do not exist. Therefore, this study was carried out to better understand the organization, management, operating mode and factors limiting the competitiveness of small-scale dairy processors.

Materials and Methods:--

Study Area
This study was conducted in five cities (Cotonou, Abomey-calavi, Allada, Tori, Ouidah) located in the Department of Littoral and Atlantique, Southern Benin. Cotonou is the economic capital of the country sheltering two thirds of the industries of the country. As for the other cities viz: Abomey-calavi, Tori, Ouidah, they are located in suburban area and constitute dormitory cities of which the majority of the population goes every day to work in Cotonou. Although these cities are far from being the important stronghold of dairy farming in Benin, they have been selected in this study because of their population estimated at over 2.2 million people (INSAE, 2015) constituting the important consumers’ market for dairy products. Beside, based on information received from livestock and agricultural service offices, these cities host some dairy cow keepers and a considerable number of small-scale dairy processors that faced essential problems notably the limited fresh or raw milk supplying.

Data collection
The retrospective interview survey based on questionnaires was used for data collection. Individual interviews and group focus discussions were used to gather information. Based on information received from livestock and agricultural service offices about forty small scale milk processors were identified. However, only twenty four processors have favourably accepted to take part in the present study. Dairy processing constitutes the main income sources and activities of all processors implicated in this study. Thus, questionnaires were administrated to twenty four players from July to September 2018. The questionnaires were designed into three sections and 27 questions:

1. Section 1 took into account stakeholder’s dairy processing systems social structural (gender, age, education, experience of processing, employment etc.)
2. Section 2 included the characteristics and performances of dairy processing systems units (type of the used raw milk, contract for raw milk supplying, duration of contact, characteristics of raw milk, processing capacity, packing and conservation of dairy products.)
3. Section 3 summarized the business management and competitiveness parts. In this section, marketing mode, final supports and major constraints faced by dairy processor units were reported in order to propose some approaches of solution to the current status of these dairy units.

Statistical analyses
All records from the field were computerized and statistically analysed with SPSS 20 for Windows. Descriptive statistics were performed for all variables. Frequencies were established for qualitative variables. Additionally, the narrative information collected from group discussion was used in order toanalyse further the subsector.
**Results and Discussion:**

**Structural Characteristics of dairy units**

The findings on the socio-structural characteristics of dairy units are given in the Table 1. The majority (83.3%) of the surveyed players was women. Regarding education, 83.33% of the interviewed did not complete education, 4.17% indicated they had completed a university degree. 91.67% of respondents were between 35-40 years old. Women play a leading role in the transmission of dairy know-how, be it milking, fermentation, skimming or churning; especially in Fulani households, where the marketing of milk and products (cheese) goes to women. Most of the respondents have been involved in the dairy processing business for less than five years. These dairy units employed 62.5 %, 50.0% and 25.0% of permanent, familial and seasonal employees. Leaning on the given results it was found dairy units exclusively employed familial labour either combined familial with seasonal or contractual worker.

**Table 1:** Socio-structural of the dairy units

| Parameters                     | Frequency | Percent (%) |
|-------------------------------|-----------|-------------|
| Gender                        |           |             |
| Male                          | 4         | 16.7        |
| Female                        | 20        | 83.3        |
| Experience in dairy processing|           |             |
| < 5 years                     | 14        | 58.3        |
| 5-10 years                    | 7         | 29.2        |
| 10-15 years                   | 3         | 12.5        |
| Employment                    |           |             |
| Familial                      | 12        | 50.0        |
| Permanent                     | 15        | 62.5        |
| Seasonal                      | 6         | 25.0        |

The Table 2 show the data related that milk is the major input of any dairy processing industry, the present study indicated that most 62.5% of the processors exclusively used the fresh cow’s milk, while the remainder used imported milk powder and their mixture as raw materials of production. The supplying of the raw materials is not mostly based on any contract form. However, 41.7% and 4.2% of units have a verbal and written agreement with raw milk suppliers. The supplying of raw materials is based on specific criteria defined according the characteristics of the milk. Indeed, 75% and 70.8% of supplying operation are performed using the milk colour and physical aspect as the main criteria. Some dairy units use the expiration date and percentage of dry matter when choosing the raw materials. According to the statement of stakeholders, milk with 26% of dry matter is better than the one with 28% for yogourt production. 79.2% of dairy processors have plastic can that is used to transport of the fresh milk to processing sites. Concerning the processing capacity, packing and conservation practices applied. 45.8% and 20.8% units processing fresh milk and powder milk have a daily capacity ranging between 21-50 L and 11-20 kg respectively. Fresh milk and imported milk powder are processed into various dairy products marketed and consumed. It is important to highlight that a small number of the interviewed dairy units used several criteria for characteristics and transportation of the raw milk at the same time compared to others that use only single criteria that leaded them to use more than one packaging system for their finished dairy products (Dégue and Yogourt), the details of which Table 2 takes into account. In this study, we found that Yogurt (45.8%) and Dégue (12.5%) are the most widely made forms of dairy products from imported milk powder. Dégue is a local dairy beverage made of boiled sorghum couscous mixed with Yogurt. Among the products resulting from the processing of fresh cow’s milk, the local Fulani cheese also known as Wagashi remains the most widespread and consumed (70.8%) in urban areas. The traditional processing, which is found in pastoral households, involves using the remaining milk after direct consumption as drinking milk to make some dairy products, particularly cheese (Fig 1), which is sometimes colored (Fig 2) using colored water with dried sorghum leaves to extend it shelf life (Sessou et al., 2013). This processing is mainly practiced by the women i.e. wives of breeders so as not to lose the milk (Dossou et al., 2006).

Dégue (Fig 3) and Yogurt (Fig 4) are usually packed in plastic sachet or bottle with variable volume. In contrary, the local cheese is not packed. This leads to their immediate sale or keeping them in whey or brine. As for, the produced Yogurt and Dégue, they are commonly conserved at low temperature conditions after cooling or freezing processes.
## Table 2: Processing capacity, packing and conservation of dairy products

| Parameters                                           | Frequency | Percent (%) |
|------------------------------------------------------|-----------|-------------|
| **Type of the used raw milk**                        |           |             |
| Fresh cow milk                                       | 15        | 62.5        |
| Imported milk powder                                 | 5         | 20.8        |
| Mixture: Fresh cow + imported milk                    | 4         | 16.7        |
| **Contract for raw milk supplying**                  |           |             |
| Yes/written                                          | 1         | 4.2         |
| Yes/verbal                                           | 10        | 41.7        |
| No                                                    | 13        | 54.2        |
| **Duration of contract**                             |           |             |
| Long term (> 10 years)                               | 1         | 4.2         |
| Undetermined                                         | 12        | 50.0        |
| Owned a farm                                         | 11        | 45.8        |
| **Characteristics of raw milk**                      |           |             |
| Colour of the fresh milk (White)                     | 18        | 75.0        |
| Physical aspect of the fresh milk                    | 17        | 70.8        |
| Acid taste                                           | 1         | 4.2         |
| Other (expiration date, % of dry matter: 26 or 28%)   | 5         | 20.8        |
| **Transportation of raw milk**                       |           |             |
| Tank containers of fresh milk                         | 1         | 4.2         |
| Plastic can of fresh milk                            | 19        | 79.2        |
| Bags of powder milk                                  | 9         | 37.5        |
| **Daily processing capacity**                        |           |             |
| Fresh cow milk (L)                                   |           |             |
| < 20                                                 | 6         | 25.0        |
| 21-50                                                | 11        | 45.8        |
| 51-100                                               | 2         | 8.3         |
| Imported powder milk (Kg)                            |           |             |
| < 10                                                 | 1         | 4.2         |
| 11-20                                                | 5         | 20.8        |
| > 21                                                  | 1         | 4.2         |
| **Dairy products**                                   |           |             |
| Wagashi cheese                                       | 17        | 70.8        |
| Yogurt                                               | 11        | 45.8        |
| Pasteurized milk                                     | 1         | 4.2         |
| Déguè                                                | 3         | 12.5        |
| **Packing of dairy products**                        |           |             |
| Plastic bottle (Yogurt and Déguè)                    | 12        | 50.0        |
| Plastic sachet (Yogurt and Déguè)                    | 8         | 33.3        |
| No packing (Wagashi cheese)                          | 17        | 70.8        |
| **Storage condition of dairy products**              |           |             |
| Cooling/freezing (Yogurt and Degue)                  | 11        | 45.8        |
| Salted water or whey (Cheese)                        | 15        | 62.5        |
| No storage (immediate selling)                       | 15        | 62.5        |

![Fig 1: Wagashi cheese](image1.png) ![Fig 2: Colored Wagashi cheese](image2.png)
Qualitative and microbiological analysis of dairy products

Information collected during individuals and group discussion revealed that none of dairy units perform the microbiological, chemical (nutrient content) and sensory analysis of their dairy products. In the absence of appropriate mechanisms to the increasing demand for food, there is danger of starvation. For instance, in 2017, more than 1.09 million people of Benin population were food insecure and 80000 were severely touched by vulnerable to nutrition insecurity (Anonymous, 2017). The supply of healthy and nutritious food is a crucial element of food security. Dairy products needs to be carefully analysed in order to ensure food safety for public consumption which will further leads to the products been sold outside of Benin. Because these analyses are necessary characteristics that could reassure consumers, then from that moment the regulation of this sector becomes indispensable. This goal can be archived through increased rate of production, suitable processing and preservation. As such, information and training sections should be organized for stakeholders in dairy processing to bring them to understand the importance of these analyses.

Business management and sustainable competitiveness of dairy units

Dairy units spend averagely 587.5 ± 79.1 F CFA\(^1\) or 2173.3 ± 151.3 F CFA to purchase one litre of fresh milk and 1 kg of milk powder respectively (Table 3).

| Production expenses (F CFA)                | Mean  | SD   | Min.  | Max.  |
|-------------------------------------------|-------|------|-------|-------|
| Fresh milk                                | 587.5 | 79.1 | 500   | 700   |
| Imported powder milk                      | 2173.3| 151.3| 2100  | 2560  |
| Other expenses (Sugar, Aroma, water,      | 49300 | 27287.73 | 18600 | 84900 |
|   electricity, woods etc.)                 |       |      |       |       |

| Mode of marketing or sale                | Frequency | Percent (%) |
|------------------------------------------|-----------|-------------|
| Shop or unit gate                         | 6         | 25.0        |
| Local market                             | 22        | 91.7        |
| Retailers                                | 14        | 58.3        |

The surveyed respondents stated that the price of fresh milk change according to the season. During rainy season, the price of is lower (usually 500 F CFA) than drought season, when the price reach 700 F CFA. These findings are consistent with the price reported by Dossou et al., (2012). The seasonal fluctuation of prices may due to the seasonal variation of fodder and feed resources in term of nutritional value and quantity for lactating cow in farms (Agossou et al., 2017). Indeed, evidence demonstrated that due to high nutritive value and abundance of feed during rainy season, lactating cow produce more milk than during drought season (Soule et al., 2017; Alkoiret et al., 2016). The processing costs averagely 49,300 FCFA per month. These expenses cover inputs costs including sugar, aroma, water, electricity and woods used during the process of production. The dairy products are directly sold either in local market (91.7%) or shop at the gate (25%). Nevertheless, for better marketing possibilities, 58.3% dairy units delivered their products to retailers, who send the dairy product to nearest local market for sale. At the market, 1 litre

\(^1\)Currency of Benin defined as: Franc de la Communauté Financière Africaine ($1 USD = 564.77 F CFA)
of Yogurt, pasteurized milk or Deguè use to be sold at 1000 F CFA. As for the unit price of cheese, it varies between 500 to 1000 FCFA depending on the size. At the farm or unit level the selling price of cheese to retailers varies from 350 to 800 F CFA.

The study indicated only 37.5% of respondents are provided with financial supports as loan (Table 4).

**Table 4**: Financial Supports

| Parameters                      | Frequency | Percent |
|---------------------------------|-----------|---------|
| Financial supports as loan      | Yes       | 9       | 37.5   |
|                                 | No        | 15      | 62.5   |
| Institution                     | Government| 2       | 8.3    |
|                                 | Private Financial institutions | 7     | 29.2   |
| Frequency of support            | Yearly    | 8       | 33.3   |
|                                 | Frequently| 1       | 4.2    |
| Sufficiency of support          | Yes       | 3       | 12.5   |
|                                 | No        | 6       | 25.0   |
| Importance of financials support| Increase of business capital | 5     | 20.8   |
|                                 | Improving of production level | 9     | 37.5   |
|                                 | Purchasing of new equipment | 4     | 16.7   |
|                                 | Purchasing of inputs | 8     | 33.3   |

These supports are mainly granted by private financial institutions. The surveyed respondents reported that these supports are not sufficient because of the high interest rate and the infrequency of the loan. Even though these are insufficient, the supports help to increase the investment capital, improvement of production, the purchasing of new equipment and inputs.

Local milk production faces a number of constraints that prevent its competitiveness. Concerning the major difficulties faced by dairy processors 24 people were asked and the answers agreeing are presented in the Table 5.

**Table 5**: Major constraints faced by dairy units

| Major constraints                          | Frequency | Percent |
|--------------------------------------------|-----------|---------|
| Lack of governmental supports              | 21        | 87.5    |
| Difficulties to access sufficient loans and high interest rate | 20         | 83.3    |
| Low price of dairy products                | 20        | 83.3    |
| High price inputs (sugar, aroma, etc.)     | 15        | 62.5    |
| Poor sales of dairy products               | 7         | 29.2    |
| Lack or irregular raw milk supplying       | 6         | 25.0    |
| Lack of investment capital                 | 1         | 4.2     |

Respondents reported the lack of governmental regulations, and difficulties to access loans which is the main constraints restraining the business activities. Besides these problems, producers complain about the low price of dairy products and high production cost. Indeed, the competition of imported milk which has many advantages over local milk: price, quality, availability, and popular use (Mas Aparisi et al., 2012) depresses the milk producers, this can lower down the capacity of local milk production henceforward could lead to the disappearance of this sector of activity.

In addition, there are some other problems which are irregular supply of raw fresh milk and the lack of investment capital. The lack of fresh cow milk may be due to a number of factors. These factors can be summarized as the low productivity of local breeds, inappropriate supplementary feeding of the dairy cattle, poor nutritive value of pastures and forages offered to the animals (Agossou et al., 2018). Therefore, milk policies need to be regulated as they have some critical roles to play in the restructuring sectors.
Conclusion:-
Milk and dairy foods are one of the most important nutrients (energy, protein and fat) sources for human consumption. Dairy sector involved different stakeholders whose dairy processing units. This study highlighted the structural organization, production practices and constraints limiting the good functioning of small-scale dairy processors in Southern Benin. Although, small scale milk processing is mostly traditional and irrelevant as the bulk of milk in Benin is sold raw through informal markets, the processing of milk, into various dairy products, has become a relatively important socio-economic activity. Therefore, the implementation of new development strategies to resolve the identified constraints of this sector would lead to a more powerful industrialization of the dairy sector, opening windows of livelihood opportunities.

Acknowledgements:-
The authors are grateful to dairy processors stakeholders for their participation. They are thankful to Agronomist Jerry Denagnon Agossou for his technical assistance.

References:-
1. Agossou, D.J., Dougba, T., Koluman, N. (2017): Recent Developments in Goat Farming and Perspectives for a Sustainable Production in Western Africa. Int.J.Env, Agri and Biotech., 2 (4): 2047-2051.
2. Agossou, D.J., Toukourou, Y., Koluman. N. (2018): Sustainable development of livestock and meat production in republic of Benin: strategies and perspectives. J. Anim. Health Prod., 6(1): 35-40.
3. Alkoiret, I.T., Gbangboche, A.B., Toukourou, Y., Toure, F.Z. (2016): Performances de croissance des bovins Borgou et N’Dama à la Ferme d’Élevage de l’Okpara au nord Bénin. J. Anim. Plant Sci., 29(3): 4638-4650.
4. Anonymous2017.https://afrique.latribune.fr/afrique-de-l-ouest/benin/2018-05-19/securite-alimentaire-et-nutrition-le-benin-renforce-son-plan-faim-zero-778993.html. Assessed on 17 November 2018.
5. Anonymous 2017. https://lanationbenin.info/index.php/societe-2-146-societe/14564-filieres-lait-et-viande-atchaourou-les-investissements-consentis-peinent-a-porter-leurs-fruits. Assessed on 14/09/2018.
6. Calatrava, J. and Sayadi, S. (2003): Milk production systems in rural development: the case of goat cheese making at the Eastern Alpujarras. In: Djemali M and Guellouz M (eds). Proceedings of the joint EAAP – CIHEAM – FAO Symposium on Prospects for a Sustainable Dairy Sector in the Mediterranean. Hammamet, Tunisia, October 26-28, 2000, pp. 34-42.
7. Dossou J., Hounzangbe-Adote S., Soule H. (2006): Production et transformation du lait frais en fromage peuhl au Benin. Version validée lors de l’atelier national du 14 juillet 2006.
8. Vissoh, D., Gbanbgoche, A., B., Padonou, E. (2015): The alpine goat’s milk production and cheese yield in Benin. Int. J. Curr. Res., 7(11): pp.22108-22112.
9. Giangiacomo R. (2003): An overview on technological trends and hygienic issues. In: Djemali M and Guellouz M (eds). Proceedings of the joint EAAP – CIHEAM – FAO Symposium on Prospects for a Sustainable Dairy Sector in the Mediterranean. Hammamet, Tunisia, October 26-28, 2000, pp. 381-391.
10. Ilaslan, M., Koc, A., Akcay, H., and Ergin Okan A. (2003): Changes in the livestock composition and milk production of Turkey in the last century. In: Djemali M and Guellouz M. (2000): Proceedings of the joint EAAP – CIHEAM – FAO Symposium on Prospects for a Sustainable Dairy Sector in the Mediterranean, Tunisia, Hammamet: October 26 – 28, pp. 5-13.
11. Kora S. (2005): Laït et fromage au Bénin. Faculté des sciences agronomiques, Bénin - Ingénieur agronome.
12. Mas Aparisi, A., Diallo, F., Balié, J. (2012): Analyse des incitations et pénalisations pour le lait au Mali. Série notes techniques, SPAAAA, FAO, Rome.
13. Sessou, P., Farougou, S., Azokpota, P., Youssao, I., Yéhouenou, B., Ahounou, S. and Sohounhloué, D., C., K. (2013): Endogenous methods for preservation of wagashi, a Beninese traditional cheese. Afr.j.Agr.Res. 8(31): pp. 4254-4261.
14. Soule H.A., Djénontin A.J.P., Kpera G.N., Mensah G.A. (2017): Dairy production of cows in Northern Benin. Bulletin de la Recherche Agronomique du Bénin., 18-25.
15. Institut National de la Statistique et de l’Analyse Economique. (2015): Que retenir des effectifs de population en 2013? (Report in French), RGPH4, 3 juin, p. 3.
16. Alkoiret I.T., Awouhouedjï D.Y.G., Akossou A.Y.J., Bosma R.H. (2009): Typology of cattle rearing system of Gogounou’s district in Northern Benin. Annal des Sci Agro (12): 77-98.