Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
Evaluation of SARS-CoV-2 Serum Level in Patients Vaccinated With Sinopharm/BBIBP-CorV With Kidney Transplantation

Maryam Rahbar\textsuperscript{a}, Reza Kazemib, Hanieh Salehc, Pouria Ghasemid, Mohammad Naghizadehd, Sanaz Dehghanie, Maryam Gholamnejada, Mahin Ahmadi Pishkuhif, and Seyed Mohammad Kazem Aghamira*\textsuperscript{a}\textsuperscript{a}

\textsuperscript{a}Urology Research Center, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran; \textsuperscript{b}Department of Urology, Al-Zahra Hospital, Isfahan University of Medical Sciences, Isfahan, Iran; \textsuperscript{c}School of Medicine, Isfahan University of Medical Sciences, Isfahan, Iran; \textsuperscript{d}Isfahan University of Medical Sciences, Isfahan, Iran; \textsuperscript{e}Organ Procurement Unit, Sina Hospital, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran; and \textsuperscript{f}Pars Advanced and Minimally Invasive Medical Manners Research Center, Pars Hospital, Iran University of Medical Science, Tehran, Iran

ABSTRACT

Background. Every year, a large number of people undergo kidney transplants because of various reasons leading to renal failure. These patients usually have low immunoglobulin levels due to the use of immunosuppressive drugs. In recent years, the COVID-19 pandemic has been a major global health risk. Patients who are immunocompromised or who have diabetes are especially at risk.

Methods. In this study, we enrolled 156 patients who had undergone kidney transplant and had received 2 doses of Sinopharm/BIBP-CorV. The serum antibody levels against COVID-19 spike glycoprotein (immunoglobulin [Ig] G and IgM) were measured using a sandwich enzyme-linked immunosorbsent assay kit to evaluate whether different immunosuppressive drugs could affect the body’s response to the said vaccine.

Results. We found that only patients receiving Rapamune had increased IgM secondary to COVID-19 vaccine. None of the immunosuppressive drugs in this study have shown a positive correlation with increased IgG levels. The only factor that showed a significant effect on both IgM and IgG was a positive history of COVID-19, which was correlated with increased levels of serum IgG/M.

Conclusions. Only patients treated with Rapamune showed an acute immune reaction to the vaccine in the form of positive serum IgM levels, and no rise of serum IgM antibody was observed in COVID-19-naive patients. Patients who had a previous history of COVID-19 infection showed an elevated serum IgM and IgG level, suggesting that vaccines in general and Sinopharm/BIBP-CorV in particular are not enough to ensure immunity against COVID-19 in transplant recipients. We recommend further studies using different types of vaccines and immunosuppressive drugs.
technically considered a foreign object by the body, inflammatory and immune response could be triggered by this alien tissue. Therefore, the use of various immunosuppressive drugs must be used to prevent acute rejection of such bonds [3–6].

Because kidney transplant recipients have a high risk of developing a severe form of the disease, SARS-CoV-2 vaccination is a must to prevent COVID-19 infection. As noted before, these patients are immunosuppressed and thus should be given priority for vaccination. However, the innate immune response by the body to the vaccine is somewhat subdued because of the said immunosuppressive drugs [7,8], making immunocompromised patients uniquely susceptible to COVID-19 infection, even if they have received prior vaccination. These patients are also at a higher risk of death and have poorer prognosis [9–11].

Studies have demonstrated that patients treated with costimulation blockade have lower immune responses after vaccination compared to other patients. Other risk factors for decreased immune response include the time since transplantation and lymphocyte-depleting induction therapy [12,13].

One way to strengthen the immune response in these patients is to use an additional dose of vaccination [14]. BIBP-CorV is an inactivated vaccine developed at Sinopharm’s Beijing Institute in China [15]. According to a study by Raham et al in February 2022, 2 doses of this vaccine can be up to 78.1% effective against Delta variant [16].

There have been many studies on mRNA vaccines and their effects on lowering immunoglobulin levels in transplanted kidneys [17–19], but few studies have been performed on inactivated COVID-19 vaccines. In addition, due to the serious need for immunosuppressive drugs by patients receiving kidney transplants and the consequent susceptibility of these individuals to various infections, our aim was to evaluate the immune response and coronavirus antibody production in kidney transplant recipients and to evaluate the factors associated with reduced immunogenicity. Because immunocompromised patients are at high risk for many different diseases, it is vital to study and evaluate the response to vaccines and whether different treatment options could affect such a response. Because of the difference in genetics among our patients and the type of vaccination received from other countries, the difference in the amount of antibodies produced using different immunosuppressive drugs was examined and analyzed for the first time.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The present study is a cross-sectional study performed from April 2021 to January 2022, approved by the Tehran University of Medical Sciences Committee of Ethics (IR.TUMS.SINAHOSPITAL.REC.1400.100). Of the 1152 patients who underwent kidney transplantation at Sina Hospital in Tehran, Iran, 156 patients agreed to participate in the study, signed a written informed consent, and returned for a visit a minimum of 2 weeks and a maximum of 6 weeks after the second dose of the vaccine [20]. All of the patients had received 2 doses of Sinopharm/BIBP-CorV. Information on comorbid conditions and the drugs used was collected in their medical records. Patient history was taken to determine the cause of their end-stage renal disease. Blood samples were measured for evaluation of anti-SARS-CoV-2 spike glycoprotein antibodies and immunoglobulin G or M (IgG, IgM) 2 weeks after vaccination. Patients were excluded from the study if there was no informed consent and if complete patient information was not available for analysis.

Five milliliters of blood were taken in the laboratory to test for SARS-CoV-2 spike glycoprotein antibody. To detect serum antibodies to the SARS-CoV-2 spike glycoprotein (IgM and IgG) levels, a sandwich enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (ELISA) kit (Pishtaz Teh, Tehran, Iran; lot numbers 99006 [IgM] and 99012 [IgG]) was used. To detect IgM, a volume of 100 μL of diluted serum (1:100) was applied to a 96-well microplate (coated with N protein). To detect IgG, the dilution factor was adjusted (1:20), and the cutoff value was changed (Optical density of the blank well + 0.15).

Statistical analysis was performed using IBM SPSS v24.0. Continuous variables are described as mean with standard deviation or median with respect to data distribution. The distribution of parameters was evaluated using the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test. The groups were analyzed using independent t test or Mann-Whitney U test. Classified variables were described as frequencies and percentages and analyzed by Fisher’s exact test. The 2 variables of antibody titer with other variables were tested by calculating Spearman coefficient. $P < .05$ was considered statistically significant for all analyses.

RESULTS

A total of 156 vaccinated patients were included in the study. The median age of patients was 50 years; 41 patients were over 60 years old. Among the patients, 67% were male and 33% were female. There were several reasons for kidney transplantation, of which hypertension was the most common (32%), followed by diabetes mellitus and urological complications, respectively. The median time between the patients’ transplant and our study was 8 years. Eighty-nine of the kidneys were taken from cadaver (57%) and 55 patients had a history of transplantation rejection and the need for a retransplant (35%). For 31% of patients, an increase in creatinine was reported after kidney transplantation. Regarding patients’ underlying disease, hypertension had the highest prevalence (53%), followed by diabetes (25%), cytomegalovirus infection (10%), and stroke (3%). Surprisingly, all of the drugs we studied were insignificantly correlated with serum IgG levels. However, the drug sirolimus (Rapamune) had a significant correlation with serum IgM levels, showing that this drug could increase the odds of the patient having positive serum IgM levels after COVID-19 vaccination (odds ratio [OR] = 4.00, $P = .043$). A positive history of COVID-19 was significantly correlated with a high antibody titer. It was significantly correlated with an increased probability of positive serum IgM (OR = 4.00, $P = .020$) and IgG (OR = 2.57, $P = .016$) titer (Tables 1, 2). With Sinopharm/BIBP-CorV efficacy being around 80% [21], most of our patients showed a lower antibody titer than expected. We also found the dosage of drugs to be of no consequence regarding whether the patient developed antibodies. As such, we chose not to include the data.

DISCUSSION

The COVID-19 pandemic is, at the time of the publication, ongoing worldwide. Because of the immunosuppressed situation of patients posttransplant, they are at a unique risk of...
different diseases. In the setting of the COVID-19 pandemic, these problems are multiplied and transplant recipients are at a very high risk of COVID-19. A very important piece of the COVID-19 immune response puzzle is the production of IgM and IgG antibodies. The levels of serum IgG and IgM are good indicators of vaccine efficacy and immunization [22–24]. These antibodies could also be used to assess previous or acute infections with COVID-19.

However, as stated before, immunosuppressed patients have subduced or even completely suppressed immunogenicity and have significantly lower levels of serum immunoglobulins after receiving one or even 2 doses of COVID-19 vaccination, irrespective to the type of vaccine used [25,26]. With Sinopharm/BIBP-CorV being around 80% effective, our patients showing a lower-than-expected titer of antibody was also expected. Our BIBP-CorV being around 80% effective, our patients showing IgM production in our patients was, unsurprisingly, a positive finding was isolated to IgM and finding was not the acute response unit of the immune system. This finding could not be applicable to IgG levels, meaning that sirolimus mostly suppresses the long-term immunogenicity and not the acute response unit of the immune system. This finding is in line with many other studies, showing that drugs such as tacrolimus [29], mycophenolate mofetil (CellCept) [30], azathioprine [31], and so on, are correlated with a negative seroconversion. The only factor that was found to affect both IgG and IgM production in our patients was, unsurprisingly, a positive history of previous COVID-19 infection. Due to the wide

### Table 1. Demographic and Clinical Characteristics Between Kidney Transplant IgM Antibody Statuses

| Baseline characteristics | Total n = 156 | Positive n = 12 (8%) | Negative n = 144 (92%) | P Value |
|--------------------------|--------------|----------------------|-------------------------|---------|
| Median age (IQR), y      | 50 (39, 60)  | 45 (38, 58)          | 51 (39, 60)             | .456    |
| Age ≥60 y, n (%)         | 2 (17)       | 2 (17)               | 2 (17)                  | .431    |
| Men, n (%)               | 105 (67)     | 9 (75)               | 96 (67)                 | .554    |
| Median BMI (IQR), kg/m²  | 26 (23, 29)  | 26 (25, 29)          | 26 (23, 29)             | .860    |
| Causes of KT, n (%)      |              |                      |                         |         |
| HBP                      | 50 (32)      | 2 (17)               | 48 (33)                 | .066    |
| DM/HBP                   | 17 (11)      | 4 (33)               | 13 (9)                  |         |
| Urology                  | 24 (15)      | 2 (17)               | 22 (15)                 |         |
| Other                    | 65 (42)      | 4 (33)               | 61 (42)                 |         |
| Median time after KT (IQR), y | 8 (4, 13) | 7 (4, 15)           | 8 (4, 13)               | .902    |
| Cadaver graft, n (%)     | 89 (57)      | 8 (67)               | 81 (56)                 | .484    |
| Retransplant, n (%)      | 16 (10)      | 1 (8)                | 15 (10)                 | .819    |
| Rejection transplantation, n (%) | 54 (35) | 5 (42)              | 49 (34)                 | .593    |
| Creatinine increasing, n (%) | 48 (31) | 4 (33)              | 44 (31)                 | .841    |
| Hypertension, n (%)      | 83 (53)      | 7 (58)               | 76 (53)                 | .711    |
| Cardiovascular disease, n (%) | 16 (10) | 0 (0)               | 16 (11)                 | .223    |
| Diabetes, n (%)          | 39 (25)      | 4 (33)               | 35 (24)                 | .488    |
| Stroke, n (%)            | 5 (3)        | 0 (0)                | 5 (3)                   | .999    |
| Kidney problem, n (%)    | 82 (53)      | 8 (67)               | 74 (51)                 | .309    |
| CMV infection, n (%)     | 15 (10)      | 2 (17)               | 13 (9)                  | .388    |
| Drug treatment           |              |                      |                         |         |
| CellCept (mycophenolate mofetil), n (%) | 101 (65) | 6 (50)              | 95 (66)                 | .266    |
| Tacrolimus, n (%)        | 63 (40)      | 3 (25)               | 60 (42)                 | .258    |
| Azathioprine, n (%)      | 21 (13)      | 1 (8)                | 20 (14)                 | .588    |
| Sirolimus (Rapamune), n (%) | 14 (9)   | 3 (25)               | 11 (8)                  | .043    |
| Prednisolone, n (%)      | 148 (95)     | 12 (100)             | 136 (94)                | .402    |
| Cyclosporine, n (%)      | 85 (55)      | 6 (50)               | 79 (55)                 | .745    |
| History of COVID-19, n (%) | 68 (44)  | 9 (75)               | 59 (41)                 | .020    |

P values were calculated based on Mann-Whitney U test, chi-square tests, Fisher’s exact test, or the Monte Carlo method.

BMI, body mass index; COVID-19, coronavirus disease 2019; CMV, cytomegalovirus; DM, diabetes mellitus; HBP, high blood pressure; Ig, immunoglobulin; IQR, interquartile range; KT, kidney transplant.

Bold value indicates demographic and clinical characteristics between kidney transplant IgM antibody statuses.
distribution of vaccines in recent months in Iran and the third dose of vaccination, there is a need to study the level of Ig with 3 doses of vaccine.

Limitations

The limitations of this study include the heterogeneity in Iranian genetics and the inaccuracy of the sandwich ELISA kits. If the results appear inconclusive, we suggest redoing the tests with more accurate ELISA kits. We did not have a baseline for patients’ serum antibody levels, and many could have contracted COVID-19 but not shown any significant symptoms necessary for diagnosis. These patients could show a heightened serum Ig level. This study began when the Delta variant was most prevalent. But by the end of 2021, with the spread of the new Omicron variant and the coincidence of the Omicron outbreak and this study, Ig level may be different with different variants of COVID-19. Another limitation in this study was the rather narrow focus on the vaccine used. We studied only the effect of Sinopharm/BIBP-CorV. In our patients, vaccine use according to the number of injected doses was Sinopharm (BIBP-CorV), Oxford-AstraZeneca (AZD1222), Sputnik V (Gam-COVID-Vac), Covexin (BBV152). It should be noted that the BIBP-CorV vaccine has been used more than twice as often as all other vaccines combined. Therefore, our study solely focused on Sinopharm/BIBP-CorV, though other vaccines may have higher or lower efficacy and immunogenicity.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Special thanks to the Urology Research Center at Tehran University of Medical Sciences.

REFERENCES

[1] Wang P, Nair MS, Liu J, Ik etani S, Luo Y, Guo Y, et al. Antibody resistance of SARS-CoV-2 variants B.1.351 and B.1.1. 7. Nature 2021;593:130–5.
[2] Gaebler C, Wang Z, Lorenzi JC, Muecksch F, Finkin S, Tokuyama M, et al. Evolution of antibody immunoity to SARS-CoV-2. Nature 2021;591:639–44.
[3] Pontrelli P, Grandaliano G, Van Kooten C. Kidney transplantation and innate immune. Front Immunol 2020;2711:603982.
Atamna A, et al. Antibody response to SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine series in solid organ transplant recipients. JAMA 2022;33:1.

Ouali N, et al. Immediate impact of induction treatment on postvaccination and reduce the severity of COVID-19. Lancet Healthy Longev 2021;8:289–298.

Sadighi N, Salahshour F. Factors predicting outcome in intensive care unit-admitted COVID-19 patients: using clinical, laboratory, and radiologic characteristics. Crit Care Res Pract 2021:1–7.

Nair V, Jandovitz N, Hirsch JS, Abate M, Satapathy SK, Roth N, et al. An early experience on the effect of solid organ transplant status on hospitalized COVID-19 patients. Am J Transplant 2021;21:2522–31.

Alhumaid S, Al Mutair A, Al Alawi Z, Al Salman K, Al Dosary N, Omar A, et al. Clinical features and prognostic factors of intensive and non-intensive 1014 COVID-19 patients: an experience cohort from Alahsa, Saudi Arabia. Eur J Med Res 2021;26:1–13.

Akhkoo A, Shaker E, Mehrabinejad M-M, Azadbakht J, Sadighi N, Salahshour F. Factors predicting outcome in intensive care unit-admitted COVID-19 patients: using clinical, laboratory, and radiologic characteristics. Crit Care Res Pract 2021:1–7.

Pourmand G, Enamjombeh B, Shabestari AN, Gooran S, Nandari F, Mehrsai A, et al. The predictive value of serum NGAL for the diagnosis of delayed graft function in kidney transplantation. Transl Res Urol 2021;3:182–90.

Cowen M, Chon WJ, Desai A, Andrews S, Bai Y, Veguilla V, et al. Impact of immunosuppression on recall immune responses to influenza vaccination in stable renal transplant recipients. Transplantation 2014;97:846.

Chavarot N, Ouedrani A, Leruez-Ville M, Vilain E, Machova J, et al. Insufficiency of vaccine-induced antibodies in patients with COVID-19. J Mol Med 2022;49:1.

Johansen KL. Initial effects of COVID-19 on patients with ESKD. J Am Soc Nephrol 2021;32:1444–53.

Prisco L, et al. Clinical characteristics and outcomes of COVID-19 vaccination in patients with kidney transplant recipients: a single-center study from Iran. J Epidemiol Glob Health 2021;11:389–96.

Pollard AJ. What does the efficacy of COVID-19 vaccination mean? A review of the challenges assessing the clinical efficacy of vaccines against SARS-CoV-2. Lancet Infect Dis 2021;21:e26–35.

Narouie B, Saatchi M. Short term and long term survival rate and risk factors of graft rejection after deceased donor kidney transplantation: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Transl Res Urol 2021;3:95–114.

Rahimzadeh H, Tamehri Zadeh SS, Khajavi A, Saatchi M, Reis LO, Guitynavard F, et al. The tsunami of COVID-19 infection among kidney transplant recipients: a single-center study from Iran. J Transplantation 2021;105:e105.

Sinha B, Parma A, DiZarro J, et al. Antibody response to 2-dose SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine series in solid organ transplant recipients. JAMA 2021;325:2204–6.

Rozen-Zvi B, Yahav D, Agur T, Zingerman B, Ben-Zvi H, Atamna A, et al. Antibody response to SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine among kidney transplant recipients: a prospective cohort study. Clin Microbiol Infect 2021;27:1173. e1–e4.

Grupper A, Rabiniwitz L, Schwartz D, Schwartz IF, Ben-Yehoyada M, Shashar M, et al. Reduced humoral response to mRNA SARS-CoV-2 BNT162b2 vaccine in kidney transplant recipients without prior exposure to the virus. Am J Transplant 2021;21:2719–26.

J-L Banga Ndzouboukou, Y-d Zhang, Lei Q, X-s Lin, Z-j Yao, Fu H, et al. Human IgM and IgG responses to an inactivated SARS-CoV-2 vaccine. Curr Med Sci 2021;41:1081–6.

Babaei E, Amirkafi A, Tehrani-Banahshami A, Soleimanvand-Azar N, Eshrahi B, Rampisheh Z, et al. Adverse effects following COVID-19 vaccination in Iran. BMC Infect Dis 2022;22:476.

Hodgson SH, Mansatta K, Mallett G, Harris V, Emary KR, Pollard AJ. What does efficacious COVID-19 vaccine mean? A review of the challenges assessing the clinical efficacy of vaccines against SARS-CoV-2. Lancet Infect Dis 2021;21:e26–35.

Bischof E, Siow RC, Zhavoronkov A, Kaeberlein M. The potential of rapalogs to enhance resilience against SARS-CoV-2 infection and reduce the severity of COVID-19. Lancet Longev 2021;2:e105–11.

Reischig T, Kacer M, Vlas T, Drenko P, Kielberger L, Machova J, et al. Insufficient response to mRNA SARS-CoV-2 vaccine and high incidence of severe COVID-19 in kidney transplant recipients during pandemic. Am J Transplant 2022;22:801–12.

Cook C, Patel NJ, D’Silva KM, Hsu TY-T, Dilorio M, Prisco L, et al. Clinical characteristics and outcomes of COVID-19 breakthrough infections among vaccinated patients with systemic autoimmune rheumatic diseases. Ann Rheum Dis 2022;81:289–91.

Alexander JL, Selinger CP, Powell N. Third doses of SARS-CoV-2 vaccines in immunosuppressed patients with inflammatory bowel disease. Lancet Gastroenterol Hepatol 2021;6:987–8.