A Study of the Combined Effects of Physical Activity and Air Pollution on Mortality in Elderly Urban Residents: The Danish Diet, Cancer, and Health Cohort

Zorana Jovanovic Andersen,1,2 Audrey de Nazelle,3 Michelle Ann Mendez,4 Judith Garcia-Aymerich,5,6,7 Ole Hertel,8 Anne Tjønneland,2 Kim Overvad,9,10 Ole Raaschou-Nielsen,2 and Mark J. Nieuwenhuijsen5,6,7

1Center for Epidemiology and Screening, Department of Public Health, University of Copenhagen, Copenhagen, Denmark; 2Danish Cancer Research Center, Danish Cancer Society, Copenhagen, Denmark; 3Centre for Environmental Policy, Imperial College London, London, United Kingdom; 4Department of Nutrition, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Chapel Hill, North Carolina, USA; 5Center for Research in Environmental Epidemiology (CREAL), Barcelona, Spain; 6Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona, Spain; 7CIBER Epidemiología y Salud Pública (CIBERESP), Barcelona, Spain; 8Department of Environmental Science, Aarhus University, Roskilde, Denmark; 9Section for Epidemiology, Department of Public Health, Aarhus University, Aarhus, Denmark; 10Department of Cardiology, Aalborg University Hospital, Aalborg, Denmark

BACKGROUND: Physical activity reduces, whereas exposure to air pollution increases, the risk of premature mortality. Physical activity amplifies respiratory uptake and deposition of air pollutants in the lung, which may augment acute harmful effects of air pollution during exercise.

OBJECTIVES: We aimed to examine whether benefits of physical activity on mortality are moderated by long-term exposure to high air pollution levels in an urban setting.

METHODS: A total of 52,061 subjects (50–65 years of age) from the Danish Diet, Cancer, and Health cohort, living in Aarhus and Copenhagen, reported data on physical activity in 1993–1997 and were followed until 2010. High exposure to air pollution was defined as the upper 25th percentile of modeled nitrogen dioxide (NO2) levels at residential addresses. We associated participation in sports, cycling, gardening, and walking with total and cause-specific mortality by Cox regression, and introduced NO2 as an interaction term.

RESULTS: In total, 5,534 subjects died: 2.864 from cancer, 1,285 from cardiovascular disease, 354 from respiratory disease, and 122 from diabetes. Significant inverse associations of participation in sports, cycling, and gardening with total, cardiovascular, and diabetes mortality were not modified by NO2. Reductions in respiratory mortality associated with cycling and gardening were more pronounced among participants with moderate/low NO2 [hazard ratio (HR) = 0.55; 95% CI: 0.42, 0.72 and 0.55; 95% CI: 0.41, 0.73, respectively] than with high NO2 exposure [HR = 0.77; 95% CI: 0.54, 1.11 and HR = 0.81; 95% CI: 0.55, 1.18, p-interaction = 0.09 and 0.02, respectively].

CONCLUSIONS: In general, exposure to high levels of traffic-related air pollution did not modify associations, indicating beneficial effects of physical activity on mortality. These novel findings require replication in other study populations.

Introduction

Regular physical activity has many health benefits including reduced all-cause mortality along with a reduced risk of cardiovascular disease, cancer, and diabetes (Johnsen et al. 2013; Samitz et al. 2011; Schnohr et al. 2006; Woodcock et al. 2011). Exposure to air pollution may adversely affect human health by triggering or exacerbating respiratory and cardiovascular conditions, certain cancers, and possibly diabetes, leading to premature mortality (Beelen et al. 2014a; Hoek et al. 2013; Raaschou-Nielsen et al. 2012, 2013).

Declining rates of physical activity (Brownson et al. 2005) have given rise to population-level health initiatives including promotion of active transport in cities, encouraging a shift from car use to cycling and walking (de Nazelle et al. 2011). These initiatives are also highly relevant as a solution to other urban challenges such as traffic congestion, air pollution, and greenhouse-gas emission problems in major cities. One of the major challenges to active transport initiatives and other efforts to promote exercise is the trade-off between the health benefits of increased physical activity and potential harms due to amplified exposure to air pollution during exercise. These harms include higher minute ventilation and deposition of air pollutants in the lung due to higher minute ventilation and increased physical activity and air pollution on mortality in elderly urban residents: the Danish Diet, Cancer, and Health cohort. Environ Health Perspect 123:557–563; http://dx.doi.org/10.1289/ehp.1408698

Address correspondence to Z.J. Andersen, Center for Epidemiology and Screening, Department of Public Health, University of Copenhagen, Øster Farimagsgade 5, Copenhagen K 1014, Denmark. Telephone: 45 35 32 76 69. E-mail: Zorana.Andersen@sund.ku.dk

Supplemental Material is available online (http://dx.doi.org/10.1289/ehp.1408698).

This work is part of the European project Transportation Air pollution and Physical Activity in European Cities (TAPAS): an integrated health risk assessment programme of climate change and urban policies, which has partners in Barcelona, Basel, Copenhagen, Paris, Prague, and Warsaw, and is funded by the Coca-Cola Foundation, AGAUR (Agència de Gestió d’Ajuts Universitaris i de Recerca), and CREAL. The authors declare they have no actual or potential competing financial interests.

Received: 15 May 2014; Accepted: 26 January 2015; Advance Publication: 27 January 2015; Final Publication: 1 June 2015.
whether long-term exposure to air pollution modifies beneficial health effects of physical activity on mortality. In a large prospective urban cohort, we studied whether reductions in mortality linked to regular outdoor leisure-time and transport-related physical activity in terms of doing sports, cycling, gardening, and walking (Johnsen et al. 2013) were modified by long-term exposure to high levels of air pollution at residence.

Materials and Methods

Design and study population. This study was based on the Danish Diet, Cancer, and Health cohort, described in detail elsewhere (Tjonneland et al. 2007). In brief, the cohort consists of 57,053 men (48%) and women (52%) born in Denmark, 50–64 years of age, living in Copenhagen or Aarhus, with no previous cancer diagnosis at the time of enrollment (1993–1997). The participants completed an extensive questionnaire on diet, smoking, alcohol consumption, education, occupation, physical activity, history of diseases and medication, and other health-related items, and provided blood samples, blood pressure, and height and weight measurements at enrollment. Relevant Danish ethical committees and data protection agencies approved the study, and written informed consent was provided by all participants.

Mortality definition. Each cohort member was followed up in the Danish Register of Causes of Death (Helweg-Larsen 2011) until 31 December 2009, using a unique personal identification number. On the basis of the underlying cause of death, we defined total mortality as all mortality from natural causes [International Classification of Diseases, 10th Revision (ICD-10) codes A00–R99], cancer mortality (C00–C97), cardiovascular mortality (100–199), respiratory mortality (J00–J99), and diabetes mortality (E10–E14). We extracted the date of emigration or disappearance and the addresses of all cohort members from the Central Population Registry (Pedersen 2011) using their personal identification numbers.

Physical activity. Physical activity was assessed by a self-administered, interviewer-checked questionnaire in which leisure time and transport-related (e.g., to and from work, shopping) physical activity was reported as hours per week spent on sports, cycling, gardening, walking, housework (cleaning, shopping), and “do-it-yourself” activities (e.g., house repair). Data were collected separately for winter and summer of the previous year, and the two values were averaged, so that being active implies at least half an hour spent on a specific activity per week. The physical activity questions have been validated in two studies that found high correlation between self-reported physical activity estimates with the accelerometer measurements of total metabolic equivalent in 182 subjects (Cust et al. 2008) and with combined heart rate and movement sensing measurements in 1,941 subjects (InterAct Consortium et al. 2012). We focused in this study on sports, cycling, and gardening, which were previously associated with lower mortality in the same cohort (Johnsen et al. 2013), and additionally walking at least half an hour per week, which is relevant as an outdoor physical activity pertinent to exposure to air pollution. A previous analysis of data from the cohort indicated that accounting for the amount of physical activity did not substantially alter associations with mortality when activity was dichotomized as any participation versus none (Johnsen et al. 2013). Therefore, our main analyses focused on the estimated effect of participation (yes/no) in sports, cycling, gardening, and walking on mortality, whereas associations with the amount of cycling (categorized as does not cycle, 0.5–4 hr/week, or > 4 hr/week) were estimated in sensitivity analyses.

Air pollution exposure. The outdoor concentration of nitrogen dioxide (NO$_2$) was calculated at the residential addresses of each cohort member with the Danish AirGIS dispersion modeling system (http://www.dmu.dk/en/air/models/airgis/). AirGIS is based on a geographical information system (GIS) and provides estimates of traffic-related air pollution with high temporal (1-year averages) and spatial (address-level) resolution. AirGIS is a validated model: High correlation was found between AirGIS estimated and measured NO$_2$ values (Raaschou-Nielsen et al. 2000), which has been used in a number of studies (Andersen et al. 2012b, 2012c; Raaschou-Nielsen et al. 2011, 2012, 2013) and is described in more detail in the Supplemental Material, “AirGIS Human Exposure Modelling System.” We used the mean of annual concentrations of NO$_2$ at residential addresses of each cohort participant since 1971 until the end of follow-up as a proxy of average exposure to traffic-related air pollution during exercise. We defined an indicator variable of high versus moderate/low NO$_2$ exposure separated by the 75th percentile of exposure range in the cohort (≥ vs. < 19.0 μg m$^{-3}$).

Statistical methods. We used Cox proportional hazards regression with age as the underlying time scale to simultaneously estimate associations between mortality and participation in sports, cycling, gardening, and walking, with separate models used to estimate associations of the four activities with total, cancer, cardiovascular, respiratory, and diabetes mortality, respectively. The follow-up started on the date of enrollment into the cohort (1993–1997) until the date of death, emigration, or 31 December 2009, whichever came first. We fit a crude model adjusted for age (underlying time scale), each of the four domains of physical activity, NO$_2$, sex, and year of enrollment into cohort. In addition we fit a fully adjusted model that also included occupational physical activity (sedentary work, standing work, manual work, heavy manual work, or no occupation), smoking status (never, previous, current), lifetime smoking intensity (spline), smoking duration (years), environmental tobacco smoke (indicator of exposure to smoke in the home and/or at work for at least 4 hr/day), alcohol intake (indicator and spline for intensity, grams/day), educational level (< 8, 8–10, or > 10 years of education), fruit and vegetable intake (grams/day), fat intake (grams/day), occupational risk (indicator of a year or longer in an occupation with potential exposure to smoke, particles, fumes or chemicals: mining, rubber industry, tannery, chemical industry, wood-processing industry, metal processing, foundry, steel-rolling mill, shipyard, glass industry, graphics industry, building industry, truck, bus, or taxi driver, manufacture of asbestos or asbestos cement, asbestos insulation, cement article industry, china and pottery industry, painter, welder, hairdresser, auto mechanic), and mean income in the municipality of residence at enrollment (spline). We checked the proportional hazards assumption for all categorical variables by testing for a non-zero slope in a generalized linear regression of the scaled Schoenfeld residuals on functions of time (testt$\neq$ testt command in StataCorp, College Station, TX, USA). We detected violation of proportional hazards assumption by marital status (single, married, divorced, widow/widower) and therefore stratified the model by this variable. Significance level < 0.05 was considered as statistically significant result in all analyses. An additional model was fit in which potentially mediating variables [body mass index (BMI; continuous, kilograms per meter squared), self-reported diagnosis or medication for hypertension and hypercholesterolemia] were added to the full model. Effect modification of associations between the four physical activities (yes/no) and mortality from different causes by exposure to NO$_2$ (moderate/high or low) was evaluated by introducing an interaction term into the model, and tested using likelihood ratio tests. Additionally, for cycling, we tested whether there was an interaction between intensity of cycling (> 4 hr/week, 0.5–4 hr/week, does not cycle) and NO$_2$ levels, to examine whether there is a dose–response relationship with different levels of NO$_2$ [very high, ≥ 23.9 μg m$^{-3}$ (90th percentile of exposure range); moderate, 15.1–23.9 μg m$^{-3}$; low, < 15.1 μg m$^{-3}$ (50th percentile of exposure range)]. We also conducted sensitivity
analyses using 1-year mean of NO$_2$ at the residential address at enrollment (1993–1997, corresponding to the time period for the self-reported physical activity data) as an alternative proxy of exposure to air pollution. Finally, we conducted two sensitivity analyses on total and respiratory mortality: $a$) with high exposure to air pollution defined as NO$_2$ levels above the 90th percentile (23.9 μg/m$^3$) of exposure range; and $b$) in a cohort subset consisting of 13,948 subjects living in inner Copenhagen (municipalities of Copenhagen and Frederiksberg)—the most urban part of the cohort, with the highest levels of cycling and air pollution (75th percentile of NO$_2$ distribution = 24 μg/m$^3$). Results are presented as hazard ratios (HRs) with 95% confidence intervals (CIs), estimated with stcox in Stata 11.2.

Results
Of 57,053 cohort members, 571 were excluded due to cancer diagnosis before baseline, 2 due to uncertain date of cancer diagnosis, 960 for whom an address history was not available for at least 80% of the time between 1971 and recruitment date in the Central Population Registry or their address between 1971 and recruitment date in the Danish Diet, Cancer, and Health cohort.

Study participants were followed for a mean of 13 years, resulting in 677,760 person-years, during which 5,534 (10.6%) died of these, 2,864 (50.6%) died from cancer, 1,285 (23.2%) from cardiovascular disease, 354 (6.4%) from respiratory disease, and 122 (2.2%) from diabetes. Among survivors, 960 for whom an address history was not available for at least 80% of the time between 1971 and recruitment date in the Danish Diet, Cancer, and Health cohort.

Table 1. Characteristics of 52,061 participants in the Danish Diet, Cancer, and Health cohort.

| Baseline cohort covariates | Total ($n = 52,061$) | Deceased ($n = 5,534$) |
|---------------------------|---------------------|------------------------|
| Age at cohort entry (years) | 56.6 ± 4.3 | 58.5 ± 4.4 |
| Males | 24,734 (47.5) | 3,292 (59.5) |
| Participating in sports | 28,274 (54.3) | 2,189 (39.5) |
| Cycling | 35,385 (68.0) | 3,275 (59.2) |
| Gardening | 38,261 (73.5) | 3,612 (65.5) |
| Walking | 48,436 (93.0) | 5,060 (81.4) |
| Time/week$^b$ participating in sports (hr) | 2.4 ± 2.3 | 2.5 ± 2.4 |
| Time/week$^b$ cycling (hr) | 3.2 ± 3.4 | 3.4 ± 3.6 |
| Time/week$^b$ gardening (hr) | 3.0 ± 3.2 | 3.7 ± 3.9 |
| Time/week$^b$ walking (hr) | 4.4 ± 4.6 | 5.1 ± 5.6 |
| Sedentary work | 18,711 (35.9) | 1,560 (28.2) |
| Standing work | 8,988 (17.3) | 857 (15.5) |
| Manual work | 10,506 (20.2) | 954 (17.2) |
| Heavy manual work | 2,405 (4.6) | 279 (5.0) |
| Unemployed | 11,451 (22.0) | 1,884 (34.0) |
| Never smoked | 18,766 (36.0) | 1,021 (18.4) |
| Previously smoked | 14,354 (27.6) | 1,249 (22.6) |
| Currently smoke | 18,941 (36.4) | 3,264 (59.0) |
| Smoking intensity in ever smokers (g/day) | 16.2 ± 10.1 | 18.8 ± 10.3 |
| Smoking duration in ever smokers (years) | 29.6 ± 12.1 | 35.4 ± 10.9 |
| Exposed to environmental tobacco smoke | 33,323 (64.0) | 4,304 (77.8) |
| Consume alcohol | 50,897 (97.8) | 5,293 (95.6) |
| Alcohol use in consumers (g/day) | 20.9 ± 21.8 | 27.1 ± 29.9 |
| BMI | 26.0 ± 4.0 | 26.5 ± 4.6 |
| < 8 years of education | 17,064 (32.8) | 2,349 (42.2) |
| ≥ 10 years of education | 24,066 (46.2) | 2,274 (41.1) |
| ≥ 15 years of education | 10,931 (21.0) | 911 (16.5) |
| Fruit and vegetable intake (g/day) | 350.3 ± 202.7 | 313.3 ± 203.0 |
| Fat intake (g/day) | 76.0 ± 22.0 | 79.3 ± 29.3 |
| Single | 3,067 (5.9) | 363 (6.6) |
| Married | 37,454 (71.9) | 3,614 (65.3) |
| Divorced | 8,683 (16.7) | 1,144 (20.7) |
| Widow/widower | 2,857 (5.5) | 413 (7.5) |
| Risk occupation$^c$ | 17,254 (33.1) | 2,312 (41.8) |
| Hypertension | 7,671 (15.3) | 388 (35.3) |
| Hypercholesterolemia | 3,120 (6.2) | 173 (3.3) |
| NO$_2$ | 18.9 ± 5.2 | 17.9 ± 5.7 |
| Upper 25th percentile (NO$_2$ > 19.0 μg/m$^3$) | 13,016 (25.0) | 1,806 (32.6) |

Values are n(%) or mean ± SD.

$^a$Total natural mortality, excluding external cause of death.

$^b$For those who participate in physical activity.

$^c$Worked ≥ 1 year in an industry with exposure to smoke, particles, fumes, or chemicals (see “Methods and Materials”).

Table 2. Participation ($n$ [%]) in physical activity by cause-specific mortality for 52,061 participants in the Danish Diet, Cancer, and Health cohort.

| Physical activity | Total cohort ($n = 52,061$) | Cancer mortality ($n = 2,864$) | Cardiovascular mortality ($n = 1,285$) | Respiratory mortality ($n = 354$) | Diabetes mortality ($n = 122$) |
|-------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Participating in sports | 28,274 (54.3) | 1,226 (42.8) | 486 (37.8) | 99 (28.0) | 23 (18.8) |
| Cycling | 35,385 (68.0) | 1,801 (62.9) | 736 (57.3) | 169 (47.7) | 57 (46.7) |
| Gardening | 38,261 (73.5) | 1,987 (69.4) | 843 (65.6) | 184 (52.0) | 54 (44.3) |
| Walking | 48,436 (93.0) | 2,649 (92.5) | 1,162 (80.4) | 303 (87.3) | 107 (87.7) |
borderline significant associations for cycling (p-value for interaction 0.09) on respiratory mortality (Table 3). The inverse associations of cycling and gardening with respiratory mortality were stronger among subjects with moderate/low NO2 exposure (HR = 0.55; 95% CI: 0.42, 0.72 and HR = 0.55; 95% CI: 0.41, 0.73, respectively) than among those with high NO2 exposure (HR = 0.77; 95% CI: 0.54, 1.11 and HR = 0.81; 95% CI: 0.55, 1.18, respectively). Comparable and slightly attenuated effect estimates were observed for all physical activities with a 1-year mean level of NO2 at the cohort baseline (data not shown). There was no significant interaction between cycling intensity and NO2 when considering the dose–response relationship between increasing levels of cycling intensity and NO2 levels, categorized as low, moderate, or high (see Supplemental Material, Table S1). Furthermore, sensitivity analyses showed no effect modification of associations between total and respiratory mortality with any physical activity when exposure to NO2 was dichotomized at the 90th percentile (23.9 μg/m³) (see Supplemental Material, Table S2), or in the subset of cohort living in inner Copenhagen (see Supplemental Material, Table S3).

Discussion

Estimates suggesting that leisure-time participation in sports, cycling, and gardening was associated with lower mortality were not significantly modified by exposure to NO2 in an urban setting, for total, cancer, cardiovascular, and diabetes mortality. Estimated benefits of cycling and gardening on respiratory mortality were moderately attenuated among those with high levels of NO2 exposure compared with moderate or low exposure.

Our finding of significant reductions in total natural and cause-specific mortality related to physical activity confirm existing evidence (Samitz et al. 2011; Woodcock et al. 2011) including Danish data (Johnsen et al. 2013; Schnohr et al. 2006). Estimated benefits of cycling, including cycling to and from work and shopping, were weaker than expected, due to participation in sports, but were significant, and comparable to the limited evidence. Benefits of cycling estimated in the present analysis were slightly weaker than those earlier reported for cycling to work on all-cause mortality in another cohort in Denmark (relative risk = 0.72; 95% CI: 0.57, 0.91) (Andersen et al. 2000) and comparable to cycling to work in Chinese women on overall mortality [HR = 0.79; 95% CI: 0.61, 1.01 and HR = 0.66; 95% CI: 0.40, 1.07, for 0.1–3.4 and ≥ 3.5 MET (metabolic equivalent)-hr/day, respectively, compared with no cycling] (Matthews et al. 2007). Estimated inverse effects of gardening on mortality were noteworthy, because they are similar in magnitude to those of cycling, whereas weak inverse associations were detected between walking and respiratory mortality only.

Adverse effects of chronic exposure to air pollution on total natural and cardiovascular mortality are well supported (Hock et al. 2013), and positive associations were also evident in this Danish cohort, where air pollution levels are relatively low (Beelen et al. 2014a, 2014b; Raaschou-Nielsen et al. 2012, 2013). Long-term exposure to air pollution was also associated with diabetes mortality in this cohort (Raaschou-Nielsen et al. 2013), but not with respiratory mortality, in agreement with the recent meta-analyses of 16 European cohorts, including a subset of the cohort in the present analyses (Dimakopoulou et al. 2014). On the other hand, associations of air pollution with incidence of chronic respiratory disease—asthma and COPD (chronic obstructive pulmonary disease)—have been also found in this cohort (Andersen et al. 2011, 2012a).

Our results—that long-term benefits of physical activity of all major types of mortality were not moderated by exposure to high levels of NO2—are novel. This may imply that acute stress and damage to the cardiovascular system induced by short-term exposure to air pollution during exercise, in terms of vascular impairment, arterial stiffness, and reduced blood flow, as shown in earlier studies (Lundbæk et al. 2009; Lund and Caviston 2008; Shah et al. 2008), seem to be transient and reversible and do not abate long-term benefits of physical activity on mortality. Our results may furthermore be explained by the short duration of the physical activities, with mean of 2–3 hr/week for most activities (Table 1); this implies that extra inhaled dose of air pollution during physical activity, which is a function of increased inhalation and duration, is only a small fraction of total inhaled dose of air pollution (Rojas-Rueda et al. 2011), and is therefore not sufficient to increase the risk of premature mortality. Our results are furthermore in line with a study finding significantly lower levels of physical activity on days with poor air quality among respiratory disease patients, but not in cardiovascular patients, who do not seem immediately bothered by air pollution to change their outdoor physical activity habits (Balluz et al. 2008; Wells et al. 2012). Our study thus may imply that effects of long-term exposure to NO2 and physical activity on overall and cardiovascular mortality are independent of each other, with benefits of outdoor physical activity not being reduced by exposure to NO2.

Inverse associations of cycling and gardening with respiratory mortality were closer to the null among subjects with high NO2 exposure (0.77; 95% CI: 0.54, 1.11). Studies (Caviston 2008; Shah et al. 2008), seem to be transient and reversible and do not abate long-term benefits of physical activity on mortality. Our results may furthermore be explained by the short duration of the physical activities, with mean of 2–3 hr/week for most activities (Table 1); this implies that extra inhaled dose of air pollution during physical activity, which is a function of increased inhalation and duration, is only a small fraction of total inhaled dose of air pollution (Rojas-Rueda et al. 2011), and is therefore not sufficient to increase the risk of premature mortality. Our results are furthermore in line with a study finding significantly lower levels of physical activity on days with poor air quality among respiratory disease patients, but not in cardiovascular patients, who do not seem immediately bothered by air pollution to change their outdoor physical activity habits (Balluz et al. 2008; Wells et al. 2012). Our study thus may imply that effects of long-term exposure to NO2 and physical activity on overall and cardiovascular mortality are independent of each other, with benefits of outdoor physical activity not being reduced by exposure to NO2. Inverse associations of cycling and gardening with respiratory mortality were closer to the null among subjects with high NO2 exposure (0.77; 95% CI: 0.54, 1.11). Studies (Caviston 2008; Shah et al. 2008), seem to be transient and reversible and do not abate long-term benefits of physical activity on mortality. Our results may furthermore be explained by the short duration of the physical activities, with mean of 2–3 hr/week for most activities (Table 1); this implies that extra inhaled dose of air pollution during physical activity, which is a function of increased inhalation and duration, is only a small fraction of total inhaled dose of air pollution (Rojas-Rueda et al. 2011), and is therefore not sufficient to increase the risk of premature mortality. Our results are furthermore in line with a study finding significantly lower levels of physical activity on days with poor air quality among respiratory disease patients, but not in cardiovascular patients, who do not seem immediately bothered by air pollution to change their outdoor physical activity habits (Balluz et al. 2008; Wells et al. 2012). Our study thus may imply that effects of long-term exposure to NO2 and physical activity on overall and cardiovascular mortality are independent of each other, with benefits of outdoor physical activity not being reduced by exposure to NO2.
Physical activity, air pollution, and mortality

In summary, our findings suggest that outdoor physical activity in areas with high air pollution may moderate, but not reverse, the benefits of physical activity on respiratory mortality: Adverse effects of the additional pollutants inhaled over time do not outweigh the benefits of physical activity. Our results, however, need to be reproduced, because of both the small number of people dying from respiratory causes and the sensitivity of these results to the definition of NO₂ and subcohorts. Furthermore, because of the relatively small number of people dying from respiratory causes (6% in this cohort), and assuming that our results are true, reductions in health benefits related to physical activity in areas with high air pollution are rather marginal.

Strengths of our study include a large prospective cohort, with well-defined and validated information on physical activity and air pollution exposure, both of which have been linked to mortality (Johnsen et al. 2013; Raaschou-Nielsen et al. 2012, 2013). We furthermore benefited from the state-of-the-art information on individual exposure to NO₂ with high spatial (address-specific) and temporal (annual mean) resolution, assessed over 35 years. Another strength of this cohort is the very high prevalence of cycling (68%), both leisure and utilitarian (e.g., to work, shopping); this provided the data for evaluation of an interaction of air pollution with this type of physical activity, in contrast to existing studies on cycling to work (Andersen et al. 2000; Matthews et al. 2007; Rojas-Rueda et al. 2011, 2012). Furthermore, this is the first cohort study to evaluate individual-level benefits of physical activity in an urban cohort while also considering individual exposure to air pollution. A study of short-term effects of air pollution on mortality in Hong Kong, which has several-fold higher levels of air pollution than in Copenhagen, found that those who exercised regularly had reduced susceptibility to acute effects of air pollution and lower mortality than those who did not exercise (Wong et al. 2007). Our study provides a novel approach in contrast to existing health impact assessment studies. Our study estimated benefits versus risks of increased physical activity, typically by evaluating active travel policies targeted to shift commuters from car use to cycling, on a population level, based on derivation of risk estimates from different studies and hypothetical scenarios (Andersen et al. 2000; de Hartog et al. 2010; Rojas-Rueda et al. 2011, 2012, 2013).

A weakness of our study is the use of NO₂ levels at residence as a proxy of average air pollution levels encountered during physical activity. This assumption works well for gardening, which typically occurs at the residence (the exact location of air pollution modeling) but less well for cycling and walking. Given that this cohort consists of older subjects 50–65 years of age at baseline, many of whom retired before study recruitment or during study follow-up, it is reasonable to assume that most of their time walking and cycling had taken place in close proximity to their residence, which may be well represented by air pollution levels at residence. The higher exposure misclassification is expected for cycling than for gardening. Cycling levels were the same for subjects residing in areas with low/moderate and high air pollution levels, 68%. Gardening was more common in subjects living in areas with low/moderate air pollution (79%) than in those living in areas with high air pollution (58%), because rates of house ownership are higher in the suburbs than in the inner city, where pollution is highest. Furthermore, we did not have information on cycling, walking, and exercising habits of cohort participants, and possible behavioral adjustment by those living in areas of high air pollution levels to avoid the most polluted areas, which may bias results.

Similarly, participating in sports is a poor proxy of outdoor activity because we do not have information on the type of sports activity or whether it took place outdoors (running), or indoors (e.g., gym, badminton, swimming). Thus, lack of findings of interaction with air pollution and participation in sports may be attributable to exposure misclassification. Many cohort members retired during the study follow-up, implying the possibility of misclassification of exposure over time, if retirement led to considerable changes in cycling after enrollment. Most hiking trips (over 65%) in Denmark are undertaken for leisure activities, shopping, and doing errands, with a minority for transport to and from work (Danish Technical University 2013). Cycling decreases with age in Denmark, but only marginally, by about 10–15% from 50–59 to 60–69 years, due to retirement/decrease in share of cycling trips to work (Vithen 2013).

Another weakness is a lack of data on particulate matter (PM), which was available for only half of the cohort participants living in Copenhagen (Beelen et al. 2014a) and only for 2010, and was therefore not used here. However, NO₂ and nitrogen oxides were found to correlate strongly with PM in Denmark, with Spearman correlation coefficient of 0.70 for PM₁₀ (PM with diameter ≤ 10 μm) and 0.93 for ultrafine fraction of PM (Hertel et al. 2001; Ketzel et al. 2003), implying that similar results for PM would be expected. Furthermore, we have shown earlier that PM₁₀ originates largely from long-range transport in Denmark, resulting in smaller spatial variation than ultrafine PM and NO₂ (Andersen et al. 2007), which originate mainly from traffic. Traffic is the main focus of this study, reflecting air pollution...
exposure during exercise or commute. Still, NO2 serves as a proxy for all traffic-related pollutants, including elemental carbon, nitric oxide, carbon monoxide, ultrafine PM, noise, and possibly road dust.

Another weakness is that DCH cohort participants are likely healthier than the general Danish population, because they are better educated and had higher income than nonparticipants (Tjønneland et al. 2007). Finally, air pollution levels are relatively low in Copenhagen and Aarhus, and these findings need to be reproduced in sites with higher air pollution levels.

Our results are in agreement with a growing number of health impact assessment studies that evaluate the net effects of physical activity in the urban environment with the detrimental effects of air pollution on human health. Our findings suggest that beneficial effects of physical activity on mortality in an urban area with relatively low levels of air pollution are not moderated in subjects residing in areas with the highest levels of air pollution. Estimated benefits of cycling and gardening on respiratory mortality were marginally reduced, but not annulled, for those living in areas with high NO2 levels, but these novel results need confirmation. Overall, the long-term benefits of physical activity in terms of reduced mortality outweigh the risk associated with enhanced exposure to air pollution during physical activity.

References

Andersen ZJ, Bønnelykke K, Hvidberg M, Jensen SS, Ketzel M, Loft S, et al. 2012a. Long-term exposure to air pollution during exercise or commute. Thorax 67:85–92.

Andersen ZJ, Hoffmann B, et al. 2014a. Effects of long-term exposure to air pollution on natural-cancer mortality: an analysis of 22 European cohorts within the multicentre ESCAPE project. J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol 24:177–225.

Beelen R, de Groen TL, et al. 2013. Traffic pollution: a cohort study. Diabetes Care 36:995–999.

Borseth E, Ketzel M, et al. 2012. Long-term exposure to traffic-related air pollution: a cohort study. J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol 23:564–572.

Chimenti L, Morici G, Paterno A, Bonanno A, Vultaggio M, Merlo A, et al. 2008. Influence of exercise, walking, and cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

de Hartog J, Boogaard H, Nijland H, Hoek G. 2010. Do the health benefits of cycling outweigh the risks? Environ Health Perspect 118:1099–1106.

de Hartog J, Boogaard H, Nijland H, Hoek G. 2010. Do the health benefits of cycling outweigh the risks? Environ Health Perspect 118:1099–1106.

de Hartog J, Boogaard H, Nijland H, Hoek G. 2010. Do the health benefits of cycling outweigh the risks? Environ Health Perspect 118:1099–1106.

Diabetes incidence and long-term exposure to air pollution: a cohort study. Diabetes Care 35:92–98.

Dimakopoulou K, Samoli E, Beelen R, Stafoggia M, Raaschou-Nielsen O, Sørensen M, Ketzel M, etc. 2012. Traffic air pollution and mortality: a meta-analysis. J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol 22:636–646.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.

Droge WA, Wenzel V, et al. 2007. Influence of exercise, walking, cycling, and overall nonexercise physical activity on mortality in Chinese women. Am J Epidemiol 169:1343–1350.
Rundell KW, Slee JB, Caviston R, Hollenbach AM. 2008. Decreased lung function after inhalation of ultrafine and fine particulate matter during exercise is related to decreased total nitrate in exhaled breath condensate. Inhal Toxicol 20:1–9.

Samitz G, Egger M, Zwahlen M. 2011. Domains of physical activity and all-cause mortality: systematic review and dose–response meta-analysis of cohort studies. Int J Epidemiol 40:1382–1400.

Schnohr P, Lange P, Scharling H, Jensen JS. 2006. Long-term physical activity in leisure time and mortality from coronary heart disease, stroke, respiratory diseases, and cancer. The Copenhagen City Heart Study. Eur J Cardiovasc Prev Rehabil 12:173–179.

Shah AP, Pietropaoli AP, Frasier LM, Speers DM, Chalupa DC, Delehanty JM, et al. 2008. Effect of inhaled carbon ultrafine particles on reactive hyperemia in healthy human subjects. Environ Health Perspect 116:375–380; doi:10.1289/ehp.10323.

Strak M, Boogaard H, Mielke K, Oldenwening M, Zuurbier M, Brunekreef B, et al. 2010. Respiratory health effects of ultrafine and fine particle exposure in cyclists. Occup Environ Med 67:118–124.

Strak M, Boogaard H, Mielke K, Oldenwening M, Zuurbier M, Brunekreef B, et al. 2010. Respiratory health effects of ultrafine and fine particle exposure in cyclists. Occup Environ Med 67:118–124.

Vithen C. 2013. Cykling i Danmark—hvor står vi? Tal og statistik [in Danish]. Vejdirektoratet. Available: http://www.trm.dk/~media/Files/Publication/2013/Cykelstrategi%202013/Charlotte%20Vithen.pdf [accessed 20 January 2015].

Wells EM, Dearborn DG, Jackson LW. 2012. Activity change in response to bad air quality, National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey, 2007–2010. PLoS One 7:e50526; doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0050526.

Wong CM, Ou CQ, Thach TQ, Chau YK, Chan KP, Ho SY, et al. 2007. Does regular exercise protect against air pollution-associated mortality? Prev Med 44:386–392.

Woodcock J, Franco OH, Orsini N, Roberts I. 2011. Non-vigorous physical activity and all-cause mortality: systematic review and meta-analysis of cohort studies. Int J Epidemiol 40:121–138.

Woodcock J, Tainio M, Cheshire J, O’Brien O, Goodman A. 2014. Health effects of the London bicycle sharing system: health impact modelling study. BMJ 348:g425; doi:10.1136/bmj.g425.

Zhang JJ, McCreanor JE, Cullinan P, Chung KF, Ohman-Strickland P, Han IK, et al. 2009. Health effects of real-world exposure to diesel exhaust in persons with asthma. Res Rep Health Eff Inst 138:5–109.