Entropy in the non-Fermi-liquid regime of the doped 2d Hubbard model

Connor Lenihan,1 Aaram J. Kim,1 Fedor Šimkovic IV,1,2,3 and Evgeny Kozik1,2

1Department of Physics, King’s College London, Strand, London WC2R 2LS, UK
2Centre de Physique Théorique, École Polytechnique, CNRS, Université Paris-Saclay, 91128 Palaiseau, France
3Collège de France, 11 place Marcelin Berthelot, 75005 Paris, France

We study thermodynamic properties of the doped Hubbard model on the square lattice in the regime of strong charge and spin fluctuations at low temperatures near the metal-to-insulator crossover and obtain results with controlled accuracy using the diagrammatic Monte Carlo method directly in the thermodynamic limit. The behavior of the entropy reveals a non-Fermi-liquid state at sufficiently high interactions near half-filling: a maximum in the entropy at non-zero doping develops as the coupling strength is increased, along with an inflection point, evidencing a metal to non-Fermi-liquid crossover. The heat capacity exhibits additional distinctive features of a non-Fermi-liquid state. Measurements of the entropy can therefore be used as a probe of the state of the system in quantum simulation experiments with ultracold atoms in optical lattices.

The 2d Hubbard model [1] is one of the foremost models of strongly interacting electrons, whose Hamiltonian is written as

\[ H = -t \sum_{\langle ij \rangle \sigma} (\hat{c}^\dagger_i \hat{c}_j + \text{H.c.}) + U \sum_i \hat{n}_{i \uparrow} \hat{n}_{i \downarrow} - \mu \sum_i \hat{n}_{i \sigma}. \]

(1)

Here, \( t \) is the nearest-neighbor hopping amplitude, \( U \) is the on-site Coulomb interaction, \( \mu \) is the chemical potential, \( \hat{c}_{i \sigma}^\dagger (\hat{c}_{i \sigma}) \) creates (annihilates) a fermion with the spin \( \sigma \) on the site \( i \), and \( \hat{n}_{i \sigma} = \hat{c}_{i \sigma}^\dagger \hat{c}_{i \sigma} \). In spite of its seeming simplicity, it is widely believed that the Hubbard model captures the rich phenomenology of cuprate high-\( T_c \) superconductors [2, 3]. Nonetheless, after decades of extensive studies, much of the intriguing physics harbored by the Hubbard model remains to be uncovered and definitively described [4].

Among different properties of a thermodynamic system, the entropy has a special place, capturing the temperature dependence of several local thermodynamic observables via Maxwell relations. It is also where quantum many-body physics meets information theory [5–9]. In previous studies, the entropy and some of the equations of state of the 2d Hubbard model have been computed by various state-of-the-art numerical algorithms, such as the determinant quantum Monte Carlo (DQMC) [10–13], dynamical cluster approximation (DCA) [14], numerical linked cluster expansion (NLCE) [15, 16], variational cluster approximation (VCA) [17], and finite-temperature Lanczos method (FTLM) [18]. These results have substantially advanced our understanding of thermodynamics of the 2d Hubbard model, having led to a quantitatively reliable picture at high temperatures.

A particular challenge has been the problem of how the metallic character in the 2d Hubbard model at low temperatures is destroyed by developing correlations [19–23]. It is central to understanding the role and nature of correlations that can potentially drive high-temperature superconductivity at appropriate dopings [2, 3, 19]. It has been recently demonstrated [22, 23] that the insulating behavior at half-filling (the average number of particles per lattice site \( n = 1 \)) emerges smoothly as \( U \) is increased starting from a metallic state due to extending antiferromagnetic (AFM) correlations, while the charge correlation function reveals a correlation hole [23]. Such a crossover is extended in parameter space, involving a transitional non-Fermi-liquid (NFL) state with a partially-gapped Fermi surface [22]. This picture has proven to be difficult to capture even qualitatively with finite-size methods due to the long-range nature of correlations [20, 22].

On the other hand, experiments with ultracold atoms in optical lattices [24–31] accurately realize the model [1] in a physical system and offer a route towards exploring its properties over regimes not accessible to theoretical methods. Recent experiments have approached the range of temperatures \( T \lesssim 0.25t \) of the metal-to-insulator crossover: they demonstrate development of long-range AFM correlations at \( T \sim 0.2t \) [24] and their disappearance with doping, while in situ measurements of the equation of state \( n(\mu, T) \) enable accurate determination of the entropy. However, reliable theoretical predictions for thermodynamics of the doped 2d Hubbard model in this regime are missing. Not only are controlled predictions crucial for validation of upcoming experiments, but also experimental determination of equations of state and, ultimately the phase diagram of the model [1], requires reliable thermometry, which in these isolated systems is only enabled by theoretical input.

Here we study the entropy and thermodynamics of the doped Hubbard model on the square lattice in the highly non-trivial correlated regime where the system experiences a crossover from metallic Fermi-liquid (FL) to non-Fermi-liquid (NFL) behavior in the presence of competing energy scales and strong correlations. We obtain results with controlled accuracy directly in the TDL by the diagrammatic Monte Carlo approach, in which the coefficients of the perturbative expansion for a particular
Computed the series coefficients for the pressure for a homogeneous system, and all-occupancy, where the gray shading marks the regime where \( \partial D/\partial T > 0 \), which contains the region marked by the green shading where the state of the system is of a NFL character, \( \partial s/\partial T > 0 \) and \( \partial s/\partial T = 0 \) for U = 4t.

Figure 1. Entropy as a function of (a) the chemical potential for various interaction strength at \( T = 0.2t \) [For \( U = 4t \) the figure shows that the gray shading marks the regime where \( \partial D/\partial T > 0 \), which contains the region marked by the green shading where the state of the system is of a NFL character, \( \partial s/\partial T > 0 \) and \( \partial s/\partial T = 0 \) for U = 4t]. (b) The temperature for various densities at the fixed interaction strength \( U = 4t \). (c) Color map of the entropy in n-U plane for the fixed temperature \( T = 0.2t \).

We obtain the entropy of the system using the formula:

\[ s = \frac{1}{T}(E_K + UD - \mu n + P) \]  

where \( E_K \) is the kinetic energy, \( D \) is the double occupancy, \( P \) is the negative grand potential density, equal to the pressure for a homogeneous system, and all extensive quantities are defined per lattice site. Having computed the series coefficients for \( E_K \), \( D \), \( n \), and \( P \), we evaluate these observables using the procedure developed in Ref. [35] and compute the entropy with Eq. (2) directly in the TDL without numerical integration or a fitting procedure.

Figure 1(a) shows the entropy as a function of chemical potential (shifted by the half-filling value \( U/2 \)) for a fixed temperature \( T = 0.2t \), which is within the range \( T \lesssim 0.25t \), where quasiparticle properties can be defined near half-filling [22] (and thus one can speak of FL and NFL states). This temperature has also become accessible in state-of-the-art experiments. The key observation is that \( s(\mu) \) changes its shape qualitatively as \( U \) is increased, which can be understood in the following way. Because of the particle-hole symmetry of the Hamiltonian, i.e. the symmetry of Fig. 1(a) w.r.t. reflection about the \( \mu = U/2 \) axis, and the requirement that \( s(\mu) \) is smooth, \( \partial s/\partial \mu = 0 \) at \( \mu = U/2 \). [By the Maxwell relation \( \partial s/\partial \mu = \partial n/\partial T \) it translates to the well-known fact that \( n = 1 \) at \( \mu = U/2 \) at any temperature.] Thus, the drift of the maximum of \( s(\mu) \) away from half-filling at \( U \) values above a certain threshold \( U_{ch} \) must be marked by the appearance of an inflection point at \( \mu_{ch}(U) \) close to half-filling, defined by \( \partial^2 s(\mu_{ch})/\partial \mu^2 = 0 \). By the Maxwell relation \( \partial^2 s/\partial \mu^2 = \partial \kappa/\partial T \), where \( \kappa = \partial n/\partial \mu \) is the compressibility, this inflection point first appears when \( \partial \kappa/\partial T \) at half-filling changes sign, signaling the crossover from metallic to insulating behavior: a half-filled metal is characterized by \( \partial \kappa/\partial T < 0 \), while an insulator features \( \partial \kappa/\partial T > 0 \) [23]. At \( T = 0.2t \), this crossover was found in Ref. [23] to happen at \( U_{ch} \approx 2.5t \), which shows in Fig. 1(a) by the maximum moving away from \( U = 2t \) between the curves for \( U = 2t \) and \( U = 3t \). As \( U \) is increased further above \( U_{ch} \), the inflection point at \( \mu_{ch}(U) \) moves away from half-filling, implying that the state of the system is of a NFL character in the growing range of dopings such that \( \mu > \mu_{ch}(U) \). The NFL regime for \( U = 4t \) is illustrated in Fig. 1(a) by the green shading.

The presence of the entropy maximum at \( \mu_{\text{max}} \) away from half-filling can be detected via \( \partial s/\partial \mu = \partial n/\partial T = 0 \).
in the equation of state \( n(\mu, T) \) for a given interaction strength. The \( n(\mu) \) curves for close enough temperatures must cross at the location of the maximum of \( s(\mu) \), as seen for \( U = 4t \) in Fig. 2. Figure 1(c) combines \( s(\mu) \) with the equation of state and shows the entropy map in the \( n-U \) plane for a fixed temperature \( T = 0.2t \). Along the trajectory \( \mu_{\text{max}}(U) \), the entropy value monotonically increases as a function of \( U \). Interestingly, the density value \( n^* \approx 0.88 \) of the entropy maximum at \( U = 4t \) is already close to the reported value \( \approx 0.85 \) of the t-J model [15]. Finally, Fig. 1(b), where \( s(T) \) is plotted at several densities, can be used for thermometry in experiments where a weakly-interacting gas of known entropy is loaded in the optical lattice adiabatically [36].

At a certain \( \mu_{\text{pot}}(U) \), the \( s(\mu) \) curves corresponding to different \( U \) values cross. By the Maxwell relation \( \partial s/\partial U = -\partial D/\partial T \), at this point the temperature dependence of the potential energy \( E_{\text{pot}} = UD \) changes sign: \( \partial D/\partial T > 0 \) in the vicinity of half-filling for \( \mu > \mu_{\text{pot}}(U) \), meaning that in this regime, double occupancy drops with cooling. At the same time, since \( \partial n/\partial T \) is negative for \( \mu > \mu_{\text{max}} \), this ensures the development of the local magnetic moment \( (s_{\text{ch}})^2 = (n-D)/2 \) upon cooling towards the quasi-antiferromagnet. Curiously, at half-filling and fixed \( T \), the local moment was found in Ref. [23] to start developing at a larger value of \( \mu > \mu_{\text{pot}}(U) \), which is consistent with our results. Earlier finite-size DQMC results at half-filling appear to capture the location of the peak and a broad maximum at high temperatures [10, 11]. It is interesting, however, that \( C_V(T) \) at half-filling also exhibits a small shoulder at \( T \approx 0.25t \), where according to Ref. [22] the single-particle gap first opens at the antinodal point of the Brillouin zone. The accelerated decrease of \( C_V(T) \) at temperatures immediately below \( T = 0.25t \) is consistent with the picture of the gap proliferating along the Fermi surface before the AFM correlations become appreciable at \( T \approx 0.2t \) and \( C_V(T) \) starts rising sharply.

Figure 2. Density as a function of the chemical potential \( \mu \) at different temperatures for \( U = 4t \). Inset shows the density as a function of \( \mu - U/2 \) for various \( U \) values at \( T = 0.2t \).

Figure 3. The kinetic (solid lines) and potential energy densities (dashed lines) plotted against density for various temperature at fixed \( U = 4t \).

\( T \lesssim 0.15t \) (we are not able to reliably evaluate \( C_V \) at temperatures lower than \( T = 0.15t \) at \( n = 1 \)). Such a maximum is generically due to extending AFM correlations and is also seen, e.g., at the Néel transition in 3d [26]. In 2d (where a phase transition at \( n = 1, T > 0 \) is forbidden), it can be viewed as a marker for the crossover to the quasi-AFM state with a large correlation length of more than 10 lattice sites, which is predicted in Ref. [23] to happen at \( T \sim 0.15t \) for \( U = 3t \), in consistency with our results.
the range of temperatures where $\partial \mathcal{E}_P/\partial T < 0$, in consistency with the increasing entropy with $U$, seen in the large doping regime in Fig. 1(a).

In conclusion, we have demonstrated by controlled calculations in the TDL that entropy and heat capacity contain ample information to characterize the state of the doped 2d Hubbard model, with respect to both its charge and spin properties, and observe the crossover from metallic to NFL behavior at low enough temperatures where quasiparticles become meaningful. This regime is already within reach of current experiments with ultracold atoms in optical lattices.

The maximum in $s(n)$ that appears at a non-zero doping is entirely due to correlations, and its emergence necessarily requires a NFL regime developing in the vicinity of half-filling. A sharp maximum of entropy is expected, e.g., above the critical end-point of the phase separation line, which was suggested to emerge at a lower $T$ in this regime of parameters [37–41]. By the condition $\partial^2 s/\partial \mu^2 = \partial \kappa/\partial T$, it could stem from the divergence of $\kappa$ on approach to the critical point. On the other hand, an entropy maximum corresponds to a high density of many-body states available for scattering, while thermodynamic observables become NFL-like only closer to half-filling than the location of the maximum. Thus, the entropy maximum could favor a Fermi surface instability, such as Cooper pairing, which could occur at a relatively high temperature in its vicinity. In fact, the maximum of the electronic entropy has been observed to correlate with the highest superconducting $T_c$ in cuprates [42–44].

Here we focused on the interaction range $U \lesssim 4t$, to which the metal-to-insulator crossover is confined at half-filling: at larger couplings cooling the system brings it directly in the insulating regime [22]. In this range of $U$, correlations are also strongly non-local, making the formulation in the TDL a major advantage of our method. Although our technique is unable to produce reliable results at larger $U$, it is seen from Fig. 1(a) that the entropy maximum drifts toward larger dopings and keeps rising with increasing $U$ at these temperatures. From the behavior of magnetic correlations with doping [45], we expect that this trend continues until about $U \sim 6t$, where the entropy likely reaches its absolute maximum. At $U \gtrsim 6t$, the competition of superfluid and magnetic (stripe) phases in the ground state for $n \gtrsim 0.8$ has been recently studied using advanced tensor network and quantum Monte Carlo methods [49–51], where it was found that the stripes wipe out superfluidity. The question remains, however, whether a high-temperature superfluid state could be realized in this system for $U \lesssim 6t$, while our findings suggest that the regime of $n \sim 0.85$ is a priori the best candidate.

This work was supported by EPSRC through the grant EP/P003052/1 and by the Simons Foundation as a part of the Simons Collaboration on the Many Electron Problem. We are grateful to the UK Materials and Molecular

Figure 4. (a) The heat capacity as a function of the temperature at densities between 0.62-1.0 per site for a fixed $U = 3t$. (b) The kinetic and (c) the potential energy contribution to the heat capacity as a function of temperatures.

As the system is doped, the AFM peak is dramatically suppressed already at $n \sim 0.935$ and completely disappears at $n \lesssim 0.86$ down to the lowest accessible temperatures. At large dopings, the $C_V(T)$ curve becomes essentially featureless, suggesting that it approaches its low-temperature $C_V(T) \propto T$ FL asymptote. However, at the specific density $n = 0.7$, which is well below the location of the entropy peak, and at which the system is expected to be a good FL at low enough $T$, we detect a sizeable bump in $C_V(T)$ at $T \approx 0.2t$, which appears to be robust w.r.t. various numerical differentiation schemes.

Splitting the specific heat into the kinetic ($\partial \mathcal{E}_K/\partial T$, Fig. 1(b)) and potential ($\partial \mathcal{E}_P/\partial T$, Fig. 1(c)) energy contributions 11, sheds light on the origin of the features of $C_V(T)$: The low temperature peak close to half-filling is entirely due to the potential energy, which is consistent with the metal-to-insulator crossover being driven by the Slater physics [17], whereas the increase of $C_V$ at higher temperatures is due to $\mathcal{E}_K$. As the system is doped, the AFM peak in $\mathcal{E}_P$ gradually disappears around densities where the entropy is maximal. Further doping extends
Modelling Hub for computational resources, which is partially funded by EPSRC (EP/P020194/1).
(2019). arXiv:1910.08931.