Comparison of two multiplex immunochromatographic assays for the rapid detection of major carbapenemases in Enterobacterales

Pierre Bogaerts*, Anne-Sophie Berger, Stéphanie Evrard and Te-Din Huang

Laboratory of Clinical Microbiology, National Reference Center for Monitoring Antimicrobial Resistance in Gram-Negative Bacteria, CHU UCL Namur, Yvoir, Belgium

*Corresponding author. E-mail: pierre.bogaerts@uclouvain.be

Received 1 October 2019; returned 16 December 2019; revised 24 January 2020; accepted 26 January 2020

Objectives: Two commercially available lateral flow immunochromatographic assays (ICAs) for detection of the major carbapenemases were prospectively assessed for the detection of carbapenemases in Enterobacterales: RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. (Coris BioConcept) and NG-Test CARBA 5 (NG Biotech).

Methods: These two assays were performed prospectively on consecutive Enterobacterales suspected of producing a carbapenemase that were referred to the Belgian National Reference Center for Monitoring Antimicrobial Resistance in Gram-Negative Bacteria between March and June 2018. The intensity of the band corresponding to a carbapenemase for each test was compared using ImageJ software.

Results: Of the 161 isolates tested, a carbapenemase was detected in 91 (60 OXA-48-like, 15 VIM, 9 KPC, 5 NDM, 1 IMP and 1 IMP + OXA-48); in the remaining 70, no carbapenemases were detected. For both tests, the results were 100% concordant with the results of the PCR-sequencing reference method. Two IMP producers were only detected by NG-Test CARBA 5 as IMP is not targeted by RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. The mean intensity of the OXA-48, VIM and NDM bands displayed by NG-Test CARBA 5 was 3 to 3.7 times higher than for RESIST-4 O.K.N.V., while the KPC band was on average 1.7 times more intense with RESIST-4 O.K.N.V.

Conclusions: RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. and NG-Test CARBA 5 are two efficient assays for identification of the major carbapenemases. NG-Test CARBA 5 offers the advantage of detecting IMP, which remains rare in Western countries.

Introduction

The worldwide spread of carbapenemase-producing Enterobacterales (CPE) represents a major public health concern. WHO recommendations for fighting CPE include the development of new accurate and rapid diagnostic tools.1

Several rapid diagnostic tools for CPE are currently available on the market, including colorimetric assays (RAPIDEC® CARBA NP, bioMérieux; β CARBA®, Bio-Rad; Neo-Rapid CARB Kit and Rapid CARB Blue Kit, Rosco Diagnostica), tests based on MS (MBT STAR-Carb Kit, Bruker Daltonik)2,3 or nucleic acid amplification assays.4 Recently, two multiplex immunochromatographic assays (ICAs) were also commercialized, providing direct results from clinical isolates or positive blood culture broth in a maximum of 15 min.5-10 RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. (Coris BioConcept, Gembloux, Belgium) is able to identify OXA-48-like, KPC, VIM and NDM carbapenemases,11 while NG-Test CARBA 5 (NG Biotech, Guipry, France) provides the additional identification of IMP carbapenemase.12 Here, we compared the performance of these two ICAs on 161 successive and non-duplicate CPE collected at the Belgian National Reference Center for Monitoring Antimicrobial Resistance in Gram-Negative Bacteria.

Materials and methods

Prospective analysis

From March to June 2018, all non-duplicate clinical isolates with decreased susceptibility to at least one carbapenem referred to the Belgian National Reference Center for identification of a carbapenemase were included. Carbapenemase resistance genes were sought in all tested strains by two in-house ISO 15189-certified multiplexed PCRs targeting blaOXA-48, blaNDM, blaKPC, blaVIM, and blaIMP,13 and the amplicons were sequenced for allele identification using external Sanger sequencing services (Macrogen, Seoul, Korea).

RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. and NG-Test CARBA 5

Both tests are lateral flow assays. RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. was developed by Coris BioConcept for the detection of OXA-48-like and KPC carbapenemases on
one cassette and NDM and VIM carbapenemases on a second cassette. Both cassettes are provided within the same package. NG-Test CARBA 5 is a product of NG Biotech and detects KPC, OXA-48-like, IMP, VIM and NDM carbapenemases on a single cassette. The strains were grown on trypticase soy agar supplemented with 5% sheep blood (Becton-Dickinson, Erembodegem, Belgium) for 16–24 h at 37°C and then used according to the ICA manufacturer’s recommendations. In brief, either a single colony or a few colonies were suspended in a few drops of a lysis buffer specific to each manufacturer. The specific number of drops defined by each manufacturer were then loaded on the sample pad of the cassette and the results were read after 15 min by two independent technicians. To compare the two assays, the intensity of each band corresponding to a carbapenemase was measured using the open-source ImageJ software (https://imagej.nih.gov/ij/) developed by the NIH (Bethesda, MD, USA). The software transformed each detected band into a peak representing the pixel count and the AUC expressed the intensity of the band.

Results

Prospective evaluation of the RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. assay and the NG-Test CARBA 5 assay

One hundred and sixty-one consecutive Enterobacterales isolates with a decreased susceptibility to at least one carbapenem were received from 49 different Belgian laboratories between March and June 2018. They included Klebsiella pneumoniae (n=73), Enterobacter cloacae (n=27), Escherichia coli (n=21), Citrobacter freundii (n=15), Klebsiella oxytoca (n=11), Klebsiella aerogenes (n=5), Enterobacter asburiae (n=3) and various other species (n=5). PCR and sequencing identified at least one carbapenemase in 91 isolates (56.5%) (Table S1, available as Supplementary data at JAC Online).

Both assays were able to detect all of the following carbapenemases: OXA-48-like [OXA-48 (n=59), OXA-244 (n=1)]; KPC-3 (n=9); NDM [NDM-1 (n=4), NDM-5 (n=1)] and VIM [VIM-1 (n=12), VIM-4 (n=3)]. As IMP was not targeted by RESIST-4 O.K.N.V., only NG-Test CARBA 5 was able to detect the IMP-8 expressed by two K. pneumoniae isolates, including one co-producing an additional OXA-48 (which was correctly detected by both tests).

The 70 non-carbapenemase-producing isolates did not yield any signal and thus were negative by RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. and NG-Test CARBA 5.

Hence both tests presented a sensitivity and specificity of 100% for detection of the claimed targets. However, the positive and negative predictive values for carbapenemase detection were 100% and 100%, respectively, for NG-Test CARBA 5 and 100% and 97.22%, respectively, for RESIST-4 O.K.N.V., which did not detect IMP-8 in two isolates.

Intensity of the signal

Representative examples of the results are shown in Figure S1. The intensity of each band, corresponding to the detection of a carbapenemase, was evaluated by calculating the AUC (converted number of coloured pixels) acquired using the ImageJ software (results not shown). For OXA-48, VIM and NDM, the signal appeared 2.2 to 3.2 times more intense with the NG-Test CARBA 5 test than with RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. (Table 1). This overall strengthened intensity of the signal provided improved comfort for visual reading. For the nine KPC producers, the signal was on average 1.7 times more intense with the RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. test (Table 1). The intensity of the signal could not be correlated to the specific type of carbapenemase.

Discussion

RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. and NG-Test CARBA 5 are two ICAs detecting the major carbapenemase families (OXA-48 like, KPC, VIM and NDM for both tests and additionally IMP for NG-Test CARBA 5). The RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. assay is designed on two separate cassettes, one for the detection of OXA-48 and KPC and the second for the detection of VIM and NDM. For NG-Test CARBA 5, the five carbapenemases are detectable within a single cassette. The visual reading and result interpretation was clear and straightforward for both tests. Overall, the performance of both tests achieved 100% sensitivity and specificity for detection of the carbapenemases targeted by each of the assays. Our study confirmed the recently published excellent performance of both tests for the detection of OXA-48, KPC, VIM and NDM (sensitivity >97.6%).

Most notably, all 92 carbapenemases from the 91 CPE isolates were detected by NG-Test CARBA 5 while RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. missed one IMP-8 carbapenemase produced by a K. pneumoniae isolate and did not detect IMP-8 in an IMP-8- and OXA-48-co-producing K. pneumoniae isolate.

In our view, the signal observed for OXA-48-like, VIM and NDM carbapenemases was more intense with NG-Test CARBA 5 than with RESIST-4 O.K.N.V., while the KPC signal was slightly more intense with RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. The objective measurements in our study supported the general subjective impression that VIM and NDM signals occasionally appeared weak for RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. In the current study, both tests allowed easy and clear interpretation of the presence or absence of a carbapenemase and could replace the use of PCR being performed on colonies in most routine laboratories. These tests are very convenient and should be used for the confirmation of the presence of a carbapenemase in association with selective chromogenic screening media, antimicrobial susceptibility testing and/or carbapenem (or chromogenic derivative) hydrolysis-based tests.

A quotation for each test was provided by the respective Belgian distributors to our laboratory as the National Reference

|          | RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. | NG-Test CARBA 5 | Signal ratio C5/R4 |
|----------|------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| OXA-48   | 309±105          | 1002±274        | 3.2                |
| KPC      | 574±211          | 344±175         | 0.6                |
| VIM      | 348±204          | 862±180         | 2.5                |
| NDM      | 126±118          | 381±36          | 2.2                |

C5, NG-Test CARBA 5; R4, RESIST-4 O.K.N.V.
Center. For one kit of 20 tests, the NG-Test CARBA 5 was priced at €569.31 (€28/test) and RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. at €361.18 (€18/test) with all taxes, administrative costs and transport included. Major price differences may nevertheless occur according to the type of laboratory, country, specific local offers, etc. In our reference centre, these ICAs are used first on each clinical strain presenting reduced susceptibility to carbapenems or growing on CPE selective medium. If the result is negative by ICA, the absence of a carbapenemase confirmation on isolates; the test was designed for the immunochromatographic detection of carbapenemase. All other authors: none to declare.

Supplementary data
Table S1 and Figure S1 are available as Supplementary data at JAC Online

References
1 WHO/IMI/EMP/2019/05. Second WHO Model List of Essential In Vitro Diagnostics. https://www.who.int/medical_devices/publications/Standalone_document_v8/part1.pdf?ua=1.
2 Aguirre-Quinieron A, Martinez-Martinez L. Non-molecular detection of carbapenemases in Enterobacteriaceae clinical isolates. J Infect Chemother 2017; 23: 1–11.
3 Tamma PD, Sinner PJ. Phenotypic detection of carbapenemase-producing organisms from clinical isolates. J Clin Microbiol 2018; 56: e01140–18.
4 Rood IGH, Li Q. Molecular detection of extended spectrum-β-lactamase- and carbapenemase-producing Enterobacteriaceae in a clinical setting. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis 2017; 89: 245–50.
5 Kolenda C, Benoit R, Carraio A et al. Evaluation of the new multiplex immunochromatographic O.K.N.V. K-Set assay for the rapid detection of OXA-48-like, KPC, NDM and VIM carbapenemases. J Clin Microbiol 2018; 56: e01247–18.
6 Boutal H, Vogel A, Bernabéu S et al. A multiplex lateral flow immunoassay for the rapid identification of NDM-, KPC-, IMP- and VIM-type and OXA-48-like carbapenemase-producing Enterobacteriaceae. J Antimicrob Chemother 2018; 73: 909–15.
7 Takissian J, Bonnin RA, Naas T et al. NG-Test CARBA 5 for rapid detection of carbapenemase-producing Enterobacteriales from positive blood cultures. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 2019; 63: e00828–18.
8 Giordano L, Fiori B, D’Inzeo T et al. Simplified testing method for direct detection of carbapenemase-producing organisms from positive blood cultures using the NG-Test CARBA 5 assay. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 2019; 63: e00550–19.
9 Riccobono E, Antonelli A, Pecile P et al. Evaluation of the KPC K-Set™ immunochromatographic assay for the rapid detection of KPC carbapenemase producers from positive blood cultures. J Antimicrob Chemother 2018; 73: 539–40.
10 Cointe A, Bonacorsi S, Truong J et al. Detection of carbapenemase-producing Enterobacteriaceae in positive blood culture using an immunochromatographic RESIST-4 O.K.N.V. assay. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 2018; 62: e01828–18.
11 Głębczyński Y, Evrard S, Huang TD et al. Evaluation of the RESIST-4 K-Set assay, a multiplex immunochromatographic assay for the rapid detection of OXA-48-like, KPC, VIM and NDM carbapenemases. J Antimicrob Chemother 2019; 74: 1284–7.
12 Hopkins KL, Meunier D, Naas T et al. Evaluation of the NG-Test CARBA 5 multiplex immunochromatographic assay for the detection of KPC, OXA-48-
like, NDM, VIM and IMP carbapenemases. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 2018; **73**: 3523–6.

13 Bogaerts P, Rezende de Castro R, de Mendonça R et al. Validation of carbapenemase and extended-spectrum β-lactamase multiplex endpoint PCR assays according to ISO 15189. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 2013; **68**: 1576–82.

14 Baeza LL, Pfennigwerth N, Greissl C et al. Comparison of five methods for detection of carbapenemases in Enterobacterales with proposal of a new algorithm. *Clin Microbiol Infect* 2019; **25**: e1286.e9–15.

15 Fauconnier C, Dodemont M, Depouhon A et al. Lateral flow immunochromatographic assay for rapid screening of faecal carriage of carbapenemase-producing Enterobacteriaceae. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 2019; **74**: 357–9.

16 Genc O, Aksu E. Chromogenic culture media or rapid immunochromatographic test; which is better for detecting *Klebsiella pneumoniae* that produce OXA-48 and can they be used in blood and urine specimens. *J Microbiol Methods* 2018; **148**: 169–73.