Systematic review of suicide in economic recession

Mayowa Oyesanya, Javier Lopez-Morinigo, Rina Dutta

**Mayowa Oyesanya**, Department of Psychological Medicine, King’s College London School of Medicine, King’s College London, London SE5 9RJ, United Kingdom

**Javier Lopez-Morinigo**, Department of Psychosis Studies, Institute of Psychiatry, King’s College London, London SE5 9RJ, United Kingdom

**Rina Dutta**, Department of Psychological Medicine, Institute of Psychiatry, King’s College London, London SE5 9RJ, United Kingdom

**Author contributions:** All authors have contributed to this paper and approved the final manuscript; the statistical methods of this study were reviewed by all authors from King’s College London.

**Conflict-of-interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

**Data sharing:** No additional data are available other than the articles cited in this review.

**Open-Access:** This article is an open-access article which was selected by an in-house editor and fully peer-reviewed by external reviewers. It is distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, remix, adapt, build upon this work non-commercially, and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited and the use is non-commercial. See: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

**Correspondence to:** Mayowa Oyesanya, BSc (Hons), Department of Psychological Medicine, King’s College London School of Medicine, King’s College London, Cutcombe Road, London SE5 9RJ, United Kingdom. mayowa.oyesanya@kcl.ac.uk

Telephone: +44-207-8480120
Fax: +44-207-8485408

**Received:** September 30, 2014
**Peer-review started:** October 9, 2014
**First decision:** November 14, 2014
**Revised:** March 17, 2015
**Accepted:** April 1, 2015
**Article in press:** April 7, 2015
**Published online:** June 22, 2015

**Abstract**

**AIM:** To provide a systematic update of the evidence concerning the relationship between economic recession and suicide.

**METHODS:** A keyword search of Ovid Medline, Embase, Embase Classic, PsycINFO and PsycARTICLES was performed to identify studies that had investigated the association between economic recession and suicide.

**RESULTS:** Thirty-eight studies met predetermined selection criteria and 31 of them found a positive association between economic recession and increased suicide rates. Two studies reported a negative association, two articles failed to find such an association, and three studies were inconclusive.

**CONCLUSION:** Economic recession periods appear to increase overall suicide rates, although further research is warranted in this area, particularly in low income countries.

**Key words:** Economic recession; Suicide; Unemployment; Time series; Systematic review

© The Author(s) 2015. Published by Baishideng Publishing Group Inc. All rights reserved.

**Core tip:** This review provides evidence for an association between economic recession and suicide at the ecological level. There is also evidence that the most recent recession is associated with an increase in suicide rates in high income countries such as Europe and North America. Methodological issues somewhat limit the comparability of some of the studies. High income countries were overrepresented in included studies, meaning that future studies in this area should focus their analyses on low and middle income countries wherever possible. More individual level analyses are also required in order to identify causal associations between economic recession and suicide.

Oyesanya M, Lopez-Morinigo J, Dutta R. Systematic review of suicide in economic recession. *World J Psychiatr* 2015; 5(2): 243-254
INTRODUCTION

In the aftermath of the deepest recession since the 1930s, which resulted in a global economic downturn and a subsequent loss of an estimated 30 million jobs worldwide[1], it is worth revisiting the academic literature on the public health effects of economic recession. Of particular interest is the effect of economic recession on suicide rates, as increased suicide rates can be understood as a manifestation of psychosocial stress in populations, which may increase in periods of recession. This area was a topic of interest for academics even in the preceding two centuries[2,3] and suicide has become an increasing public and global health problem, with a 60% increase in global suicide rates over the last 45 years[4].

An economic recession can be described as a sustained reduction in economic productivity which is often measured through indicators such as gross domestic product (GDP) and unemployment rates. An economic recession can also be placed within an economic (or business) cycle in which there are cyclical upturns and downturns in the performance of an economy; with economic recessions representing cyclical downturns[5]. Thus, the National Bureau of Economic Research in America defines economic recessions as “contractions that occur within an economic cycle”[6]. Suicide rate changes in relation to the economic cycle can be described as pro-cyclical if the rate increases as an economy experiences a cyclical upturn, or counter-cyclical if the rate increases during a cyclical downturn in the performance of an economy[5].

Previous studies have either reviewed the literature that has been published within a year[7], or have systematically examined all the literature published in the last few decades[8-10], or have analysed specific major recessions[11]. In this review we aim to critically examine the literature focused on the relationship between completed suicide rates and economic recession. Thus, this review adds to previous studies by also including literature published in the last few years, with a focus on the effects of the most recent economic recession, which commenced in 2007 and is known as The “Great Recession”.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The “Ovid SP” database search interface was used to search for articles published over the period from January 1992 to March 2014 pertaining to our research topic in the following databases: Ovid Medline (R), PsychINFO, Embase Classic, Embase and PsychARTICLES. The search strategy used the following keywords including cross-referencing: (econom*, financ*, cris*, cycl*, recessio*, depressio*, trend*decline, stagnation, contraction*, downturn*) and (suici*, mortality, mental health).

The search was limited to English language papers only. In addition, the world- wide web, google scholar and citation tracking were used to identify papers in the “grey” literature outside the above official databases.

The following inclusion criteria were applied to the abstracts or the full article as appropriate: (1) Studies published in peer-reviewed journals; (2) Only studies focused on the association between economic recession and suicide “completions” were included, i.e., studies reporting on suicide attempts were not considered; (3) Economic indicators such as unemployment rate and GDP had to be reported in order to define a recession period or to act as a proxy for an economic recession; and (4) All age groups were considered.

Exclusion criteria were: (1) Qualitative studies, i.e., with no quantitative data at all; and (2) Studies based solely on cities/neighbourhoods and not including national data or trends.

RESULTS

The literature search initially yielded 3086 references of which 93 were identified for full text review. Of these 93 studies, 38 were included in this review (Figure 1). Specifically, 31 studies found a positive association between economic recession and increased suicide rates following the onset of recession. Two studies reported a clear overall negative association between economic recession and suicide (i.e., economic recession appearing to be a protective factor for suicide at the ecological level), two studies did not find an association and three studies were inconclusive in their findings (Tables 1 and 2). Tables 3 and 4 provide a short critique of every included study.

Positive association studies

Of the studies finding a positive association between economic recession and suicide, 29 were time-series studies (Table 1) and two were cohort studies[12,13]. Five of the positive association studies only used descriptive statistics to clarify the relationship between economic recession and suicide[14-18]. The remaining positive association studies generally utilised regression or correlation analyses (or both) to investigate this association. A subset of the positive association studies used similar study designs where regression analyses were performed on panel data[19-25]. In these studies, national and regional unemployment rates were used to proxy economic cycles consisting of recessions and booms. A few studies also used statistical techniques which provided estimates of excess mortality attributable to recession[23,24,26-28]. Most of the positive association studies were conducted in...
European countries with the exception of one study conducted in Mexico\textsuperscript{[36]}.  

**DISCUSSION**  
This systematic review appears to show an association between economic recession and increased suicide rates. However, several methodological limitations must be considered when interpreting these results.

**Methodological issues**  
The designs of the included studies varied widely, particularly the way in which economic recession was defined. This heterogeneity in study design and exposure measures limited comparisons across the studies. The main methodological difference concerning statistics across the selected studies was whether regression or correlation analyses were performed rather than only performing descriptive analyses on time-series data. There were also studies investigating the interaction between economic recession and suicide over multiple economic cycles which did not allow us to draw conclusions from specific recession periods within the study periods that were investigated\textsuperscript{[12,19,20,22,29,36,39,40,42-49]}. These studies used regression analyses to analyse the impact of these economic cycles on suicide rates. Thus, domestic product or national and regional unemployment rates, were used as recession indicators where cyclical variations in unemployment rates or GDP represented booms (periods of high economic productivity) and recession periods. These studies were therefore difficult to compare with those using pre-defined...
Suicide rates significantly associated with increases in the rate of change of economic indicators. A decrease in gross state product per capita was associated with a 0.5% decrease in total state suicide rates and a 0.45% decrease in male suicide rates. However, total suicide rates were positively associated with increases in state unemployment rates and negatively associated with increases in state average real earnings. Regression analysis on state unemployment rates and gross state product per capita in the United States showed that suicide rates increased for three months after the recession onset, but decreased after that. Regression analysis on gross state product per capita and unemployment rates in the United States and Japan showed a positive correlation between unemployment rates and suicide rates in Japan. A one percent increase in gross state product per capita was associated with a 0.45% decrease in total state suicide rates and a 0.55% decrease for male suicide rates. A one standard deviation increase in GDP decreased the risk of suicide by 22.7%. A one standard deviation increase in GDP decreased the risk of suicide by 22.7%. A one standard deviation increase in GDP decreased the risk of suicide by 22.7%. A one standard deviation increase in GDP decreased the risk of suicide by 22.7%.
No excess hazard of suicide mortality attributable to unemployment

Between 2009 and 2010, there was a statistically significant positive association between increases in unemployment rates and increases in suicide rate (2009: r = 0.042; P < 0.001; 2010: r = 0.068; P < 0.001). In regression models, increases in suicide rate as percentage change in suicide rate post-recession (1997-2002) in men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) and women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.10-1.45) significantly increased with increases in unemployment rate.

In the Cox regression analysis, unemployment and debt as percentage of GDP were significantly positively correlated with suicide rates in both the employed and unemployed (P < 0.001 for both). In the employed, the association was stronger for men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) than for women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.04-1.54). In the unemployed, the association was stronger for men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) than for women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.04-1.54). In the Cox regression analysis, unemployment and debt as percentage of GDP were significantly positively correlated with suicide rates in both the employed and unemployed (P < 0.001 for both). In the employed, the association was stronger for men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) than for women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.04-1.54). In the unemployed, the association was stronger for men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) than for women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.04-1.54).

In regression models, increases in suicide rate as percentage change in suicide rate post-recession (1997-2002) in men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) and women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.10-1.45) significantly increased with increases in unemployment rate (P < 0.001 for both). In the Cox regression analysis, unemployment and debt as percentage of GDP were significantly positively correlated with suicide rates in both the employed and unemployed (P < 0.001 for both). In the employed, the association was stronger for men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) than for women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.04-1.54). In the unemployed, the association was stronger for men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) than for women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.04-1.54). In the Cox regression analysis, unemployment and debt as percentage of GDP were significantly positively correlated with suicide rates in both the employed and unemployed (P < 0.001 for both). In the employed, the association was stronger for men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) than for women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.04-1.54). In the unemployed, the association was stronger for men (Hazard ratio = 1.43, 95%CI: 1.31-1.56) than for women (Hazard ratio = 1.26, 95%CI: 1.04-1.54).
reduces the effects of contextual differences that states or regions in a panel may have. This means that panel studies using fixed effects regression have the advantage of assessing the relationship between economic recession and suicide across many samples within a panel whilst also controlling for the effects exerted by unselected variables. Other studies, which did not use panel data, attempted to reduce the effect of omitted variable bias by including variables that were anticipated to exert a confounding effect in regression models.

While a number of time-series analyses did not include potential confounders (such as alcohol consumption, divorce rates, public health expenditure or female labour force participation) in regression models, they attempted to make adjustments for trends within studied nation states that may have obscured the relationship between economic recession and suicide. Three of these analyses, attempted to adjust for autocorrelation within time series data; with seasonal variations in suicide rates being a manifestation of such autocorrelation. Studies using the aforementioned techniques to reduce the effects of omitted variable bias are less likely to have their

Table 2 Negative Association Studies and studies with inconclusive results

| Ref. | Country studied | Study design | Suicide data source | Recession period | Economic indicators | Findings |
|------|-----------------|--------------|---------------------|------------------|---------------------|----------|
| Hintikka et al. | Finland | Time series Study | Causes of death statistics reported by Statistics Finland in 1996 | 1990–1995 | Unemployment Rate and Gross Domestic Product | Female and Male Suicide rates positively associated with increases in GDP ($P < 0.05$) |
| Rancans et al. | Latvia | Time series study | Statistical Yearbooks of the Medical Statistics Bureau of the Latvian Ministry of Health and the Demographic Yearbooks of the Latvian Central Statistical Bureau | 1990–1994 | Gross Domestic Product and Unemployment rates | Rapid increase in suicide rates after 1989 reaching a maximum in 1993 (42.5 per 100000) |
| Neumayer | Germany | Panel study using regression analyses | The German Federal Statistical Office | Not specified | Unemployment rates for initial analysis and gross domestic product for sensitivity analysis | A decrease in suicides for every percentage point increase in unemployment rate in males (0.98% decrease $P < 0.1$) and females (1.9% decrease $P < 0.05$) |
| Gonzalez et al. | Mexico | Panel study using regression analysis | Administrative records of death certificates | Not specified | State Gross Domestic Product Per Capita Gross Domestic Product | Sensitivity analysis found that decreases in suicide rates were not associated with recession |
| Mackenbach et al. | 25 European countries in Western and Eastern Europe | Time series study with regression analysis | International Mortality Data Base of the National Center for Health Statistics of the Centers for Disease Control | Not Specified | Changes in gross domestic product were not significantly associated with overall suicide rates across all countries in men and women |
| Saurina et al. | England and its sub-regions | Panel study using conditional and hierarchical mixed regression modelling | United Kingdom Office for National Statistics | 2008–2010 | Unemployment Rates | The increase in suicides between 2008 and 2010 was not statistically significant |
| Laanani et al. | Austria, Finland, France, Germany, the Netherlands, Spain, Sweden and the United Kingdom | Panel Study using regression analysis | Eurostat mortality database | 2008–2010 | Unemployment Rates | A positive significant association between unemployment and suicide in three countries: Netherlands, United Kingdom and France was found |

NS: Non-significant; RR: Rate ratio; GDP: Gross domestic product.
Table 3  Critique of Positive Association Studies

| Ref. | Description |
|------|-------------|
| Yang et al[45] | This study uses aggregated population data and only investigates contemporaneous and very short term lagged effects of economic variables on suicide rates. This study supports the evidence of other studies based in the United States that economic recession can exert a short term impact on suicide rates; although the utility of this study in identifying causal associations is questionable. |
| Lester et al[43] | No individual level evidence included in this study. Suicide rates by age category were not computed |
| Gavriloova[59] | Mortality data quality is questionable as is cause of death coding. Suicide data could have been inaccurately coded leading to underestimates of suicide mortality. No individual level evidence was included and only descriptive statistical analysis was performed |
| Ruhm[10] | No individual level data was included in the study. No information on suicide rates by gender was provided. The inclusion of 4 yr lags for unemployment lags, whilst an improvement on similar published studies only provides a short term insight into the interaction between fluctuations in unemployment and suicide rates |
| Brainerd[21] | Gross national product per capita and employment rates used in the study are likely to be underestimated. These means that regression estimates are more likely to identity regressors as not exerting an effect on suicide rates. The panel used in this study is biased by missing or incomplete data for a number of included countries. No individual-level data was included in the study. |
| Lester[20] | Spatial analyses of suicide rates within states were not performed, thus providing no insight into any clustering of suicide mortality within states. Age specific suicide rates were not included although a breakdown of suicide mortality by ethnicity was. No individual level data was included in the study. |
| Kim et al[24] | Mortality data was derived from death certificates which may not be fully accurate. The use of aggregated population data limits the ability to make causal inferences about the interaction between economic recession and suicide. An age breakdown of suicide rates was not provided |
| Gertham[42] | Unlike most other included studies, a large individual level dataset was collected using a prospective cohort study design. Numerous sensitivity analyses were performed to address potential flaws with the initial study design. However, the decrease in the male mortality rates is concentrated in the first few years of the study period meaning there may be an variable that has not been accounted for in the study that is causing this effect |
| Khang et al[51] | Concerns have been raised by this study about the quality of cause of death coding in South Korea which may have affected the accuracy of data in this study. Total suicides may have been underreported due to a miscoding of such deaths as being unintentional - as a result of stigma. Only descriptive analyses of suicide data were performed, meaning any omitted variable bias has not been corrected for |
| Tapia Granados[54] | This study benefits from analysing the impact of a number of economic cycles on suicide mortality over a long period of time. Data on suicide mortality and economic indicators were taken from a range of official statistical sources, to provide data for the century studied in the study. This study does not explore the effect of mediating factors which relate economic recession to suicide. By studying aggregated population data rather than individual level data, this study only provides evidence for an association between recession and suicide |
| Granados[34] | The study design used is very similar to the design used in Ruhm (2000) and the finding that suicide rates increase during recessions is consistent with Ruhm’s study. This study also expands on Ruhm’s work by providing sex specific mortality rates. However like Ruhm’s study, only short term effects of recession on suicide rates are explored; and the use of panel data can exacerbate attenuation bias resulting from underestimates of suicide mortality in official data. As with all ecological studies, the ability to make causal inferences between recession and suicide is impaired by a lack of individual level data |
| Berk et al[50] | Seasonality in suicide rates was not adjusted for in this study. No individual level data was included in this study either. Lagged effects of changes in included economic indicator were not computed |
| Granados[44] | Correlation and regression analyses were both performed in this study to elucidate the relationship between recession and suicide. The time series data in this study has also been detrended to make it more suitable for regression analysis. As the author suggests, the study would have been strengthened if a panel study design had been used as the association between economic recession and suicide could be tested across many sub-regions in Japan |
| Altinanahatar et al[49] | This study is notable for using auto regressive distributed lags which allow for the exploration of long run relationships between variables. This study’s focus on Turkey is also notable as it is a middle income rather than a high income country and high income countries form the majority of countries studied by the literature. This study however does not study suicides according to age and gender and no individual level data has been included |
| Chang et al[40] | This study provides one of the first analyses of the effects of the 1998 Asian financial crisis on the main countries in the region who were affected. Of concern is the potential difference in the accuracy of suicide coding practices across studied countries as well as the completeness of suicide data. State specific effects such as political unrest (e.g., in Hong Kong) were not fully controlled for in this study |
| Tapia Granados et al[44] | Regression analyses of the interaction between the depression and overall mortality were performed but not for suicide rates specifically. Only descriptive statistics were used to describe the interaction between suicide rates and the depression. A breakdown of suicide rates by age or gender was not provided |
| Stuckler et al[27] | Of note in this study is the analysis of the effect of social protection spending on the interaction between unemployment and suicide that this study performed. Using unemployment as a proxy for economic conditions, the effects of both smaller and larger increases in unemployment on suicide rates was tested as well. Other included studies tended to not perform the aforementioned analyses. This study only analysed the short term effects of recession and as with many of the included studies, this study was analysing the impact of recession on populations rather than individuals |
| Wu et al[41] | The authors of this study opted to detrend time series data in order to make it more suitable for regression analysis. The risk of omitted variable bias was well mitigated with the inclusion a range of potential confounders. The authors state that the results should be approached with caution due to data limitations, but these limitations were not specified |
| Ceccherini-Nelli et al[46] | Variations in suicide documentation across the four countries studied may vary which complicates comparisons made between these countries. The co-integration analyses performed in this study allow for the analysis of the long term interactions between economic variables proxying economic conditions and suicide rates; which is a major strength of this study. These analyses however only test for associations rather than causality |
results distorted by such a bias compared to those selected studies using only descriptive statistics\cite{14-18,35}.

**Differences in the use of economic indicators**

The use of different economic indicators in the included studies to proxy or define the occurrence of an economic recession may have affected the results. For instance, using GDP, which is one of the main economic indicators used to demarcate a recession period, might be to some extent distant from the experience of people living through recessions. Also, this is a measure which provides no insight into how wealth is distributed within countries. For instance, a country experiencing a recession in which there is a moderate contraction in GDP, could be more severely affected than another country that had a more equal distribution of wealth but a more severe contraction in GDP.

However, unemployment rates may be an insensitive indicator of recession as demonstrated by one of the selected studies\cite{40}. The negative association found between economic recession and suicide in this analysis (with unemployment rates as an economic indicator) was not supported by a further sensitivity analysis performed within the study using GDP growth as an indicator\cite{40}. Hence, this may indicate that certain markers are less effective indicators of economic conditions.

Unemployment rates also tend to be a lagging indicator of recession, so using unemployment rates alone may cause a different period of time to be specified as a recession period, rather than the actual recession period as defined by conventional GDP measures. Alternatively, studies including multiple economic indicators could more accurately proxy and define economic recession. In one study\cite{12}, only half of the economic indicators used were associated with changes in suicide rates. Therefore, it could be speculated that if only one indicator was used in this
The effects of economic recession on suicide rates are multi-level; so its onset influences both the macro-socioeconomic and micro-socioeconomic environment of nation states. For instance, nearly all of the included studies investigated the impact of economic recession on the macro-socioeconomic environment, apart from the two studies that were performed at the individual level. Generally, national unemployment rates and GDP acted as the main signifiers of the macro-socioeconomic environment within included studies (See “economic indicators used” column in Tables 1 and 2). As a major signifier of the macro-socioeconomic environment and a modifier of suicide rates, unemployment is arguably the main mediating factor that must be considered\(^{51-57}\). Another key factor may be indebtedness, which is related to unemployment since those who have become unemployed may take out loans to compensate for their loss of earnings\(^{58}\). Indebtedness has also been independently associated with suicide in certain studies\(^{59,60}\), although this particular association may have been distorted due to the retrospective design of these studies. However, the interaction between recession, the macro-socioeconomic and micro-socioeconomic environments, may not have been sufficiently examined. For example, many of the studies in this review have explored the relationship between unemployment or GDP and aggregated suicide rates. However, these studies have not investigated the interaction between recession, individual level behaviours and the individual level environment—as signified by divorce rates, family structure, substance misuse and many other factors. This gap in the literature seems to be due to the lack of multi-level analyses in this area. These studies are indeed needed to gain a more in-depth understanding of the mediating factors at the individual level and the interactions between themselves.

In addition, the interaction between mediating factors at the individual level and the macro-socioeconomic environment-as signified by divorce rates, family structure, substance misuse and many other factors. This gap in the literature seems to be due to the lack of multi-level analyses in this area. These studies are indeed needed to gain a more in-depth understanding of the mediating factors at the individual level and the interactions between themselves.
Mitigating the impact of economic recession on suicide

The role of unemployment and indebtedness in linking economic recession with suicide rates would provide some support for increased government spending on social protection (e.g., unemployment benefits, healthcare and debt relief programmes) to act as a counterbalance against the increased financial stress which tends to occur in unemployed and heavily indebted populations during recessions. For example, one of the included studies identified a link between increased per capita spending on active labour market programmes[11] (which attempt to increase employment) and a reduction in suicide rates. This study also argued that the reason underlying suicide rates decreased in Sweden and Finland in the 1990s, when both countries suffered from economic recession, was their robust social protection programmes as well as active labour market programmes which assisted the unemployed in finding work. Such programmes may also explain why there was a clear overall negative association between economic recession and suicide in a study based in Finland[27].

Periods of economic recession may also highlight deficiencies in mental health services which may be put under extra strain during these periods. This could provide an opportunity to invest and improve mental health services, although this may be challenging in an environment where fiscal policies focused on reducing the overall size of the budget for health services are implemented. In other words, mental health services may face stiff competition for a declining pool of resources.

Social protection may potentially act as a buffer against the negative socioeconomic effects of recession. Therefore, developing social protection interventions would require a better understanding of the groups who are likely to be more exposed to the negative effects of an economic recession. For example, if increased unemployment was clearly demonstrated to mediate the relationship between economic recession and suicide rather than indebtedness, active return-to-work schemes may play a more relevant role in social protection spending than debt relief programmes.

Evidence for the effects of the great recession on suicide rates

Twelve studies investigated the impact of the Great Recession on suicide rates[17,23-27,30,31,36,41]. Ten studies[17,23-27,36-33] found evidence for an association between the recession and suicide rates, one study did not replicate such an association[31] and another study reported mixed results[38]. Europe and the United States were unsurprisingly the focus of this research effort and overall there does seem to be compelling country-level and international evidence from the studies included in this review that the Great Recession has had a significant impact on suicide rates in multiple countries. However, the findings from some studies have received different interpretations. For instance, the preliminary analysis of European suicide data by Stuckler et al[23] has been criticised for drawing premature spurious conclusions[61,62]. The results of Barr et al’s study from England[39] have been partially contradicted by another study on suicide trends in England after the Great Recession[41], which failed to find a statistically significant association between the onset of recession and suicide rates. These criticisms do not undermine the weight of the evidence in this area. Rather, they operate as a reminder that research in this area is highly complex and that the ecological study designs favoured by most of the included studies do not permit causal associations to be made.

In the light of this review, there are grounds to consider an association between economic recessions and increased suicide rates. However, various methodological differences between the study designs suggest caution in interpreting this finding. Moreover, the association between economic recession and suicide rates at a population level (as investigated by most of the included studies) provides little insight into the impact of economic recession on assessing suicide risk at an individual level. Since these studies have mostly been carried out in high and middle income Western and South-East Asian countries, future research in low income countries is needed, the recent 2007 recession period providing a good opportunity to conduct these studies. Also, multiple economic indicators should be used in order to better understand the underpinning of such a complex association. Overall, economic recession appears to lead to major socioeconomic changes at national levels which also may have an impact on suicide rates. In particular, these findings should become a focus of concern for researchers and policymakers in order to develop and implement specific suicide prevention strategies over these high-risk periods.

COMMENTS

Background

There exists a large body of literature that has investigated the relationship between economic recession and suicide across many different countries and time periods. Such studies have often proposed a sociological or economic framework for understanding how economic recession can influence suicide rates. In the years 2007 and 2008, the “Great Recession” occurred which was an economic recession of global proportions and was the most severe of its kind since the Great Depression of the 1930s. In light of this most recent recession, this review article seeks to provide a systematic update of the
research in this area as well as a more in-depth analysis of the strengths and limitations of individual articles.

Research frontiers

The current research hotspot is the synthesis of the academic literature concerning the interaction between the most recent recession of 2007 and suicide rates. This is an expanding area of inquiry. Future research frontiers will most likely include research into the interaction between economic recession and suicide in low and middle income countries, and individual level research into this interaction rather than population level. If more individual level analyses of the relationship between recession and suicide are produced, then future reviews will most likely focus on synthesising the results from these studies. If the heterogeneity across these studies is not an issue and these studies use similar designs and methodologies, it is at least conceivable that meta-analyses of individual level studies will be conducted; thus providing high level evidence of the individual experience of economic recession on suicide risk.

Innovations and breakthroughs

This review provides an up-to-date qualitative synthesis of the most recent published literature relating to the most recent recession as well as literature investigating past recessions. It is hoped that this will allow readers to compare the evidence from previous recessions to evidence pertaining to the most recent recession. The review is focused entirely upon suicide rather than on mental health or mortality more generally. A short critique of all included studies has been provided which highlight notable strengths and limitations as well as providing general insights. Issues concerning the measurement and definition of recession, the methodological issues that arise from this, and sources of bias are discussed in depth in this review. This review discusses the included studies in terms of broad study design categories whose relevance is explained. Crucially, this review surpasses previous reviews which have not taken account of the most recent evidence.

Applications

This review can be used to acquire a basic grounding in the research literature relating to the relationship between economic recession and suicide in the past few decades. It can also be used as a guide to specific published articles in this area as a short synopsis and critique is provided for each included study.

Terminology

Proprietary variance in suicide mortality refers to increases in suicide mortality as an economy grows. Countercyclical variance reflects an increase in suicide rate when economic recession occurs. Gross Domestic Product refers to the total market value of goods and services produced by a nation state or region. The consumer price index measures the change in value of a specified group or “basket” of goods commonly purchased by consumers. The “Great Recession” refers to the most recent global recession that began in 2007. Active labour market programmes are government programmes which attempt to actively intervene in labour markets to assist the unemployed in finding and acquiring work.

Peer-review

This is a very nice manuscript. There is a thoughtful review of the literature and a balanced overview of the conclusions. It might be useful to have a few short line of critique on each of the 11 individual articles as well.

REFERENCES

1. World Bank. World Bank: Global Monitoring Report 2009. A Developmental Emergency. Washington DC, 2009
2. Morselli H. Suicide: An essay on comparative moral statistics (originally published 1881). New York: D.Appleton and Company; 1882
3. Durkheim E. Suicide (originally published 1897). London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd; 1952
4. World Health Organisation. Suicide Prevention (SUPRE) 2014. Available from: http://www.who.int/mental_health/prevention/suicide/suicideprevent/en/
5. Burns A, Mitchell W. Measuring business cycles. New York: 1946
6. National Bureau For Economic Research. US Business Cycle Expansions and Contractions. 2010
7. Uutela A. Economic crisis and mental health. Curr Opin Psychiatry 2010; 23: 127-130 [PMID: 20087188 DOI: 10.1097/YCO.0b013e32833d6e57]
8. Goldmann-Meller SJ, Saxton KB, Catalano RC. Economic Contractions and Mental Health: A review of the evidence, 1990-2009. Int J Ment Health 2010; 39: 6-31 [DOI: 10.2753/IMH0020-7411390201]
9. Falagas ME, Vouloumanou EK, Mavros MN, Karageorgopoulos DE. Economic crises and mortality: a review of the literature. Int J Clin Pract 2009; 63: 1128-1135 [PMID: 19624782 DOI: 10.1111/j.1742-1241.2009.02124.x]
10. Catalano R, Goldman-Meller S, Saxton K, Margerison-Zilkc C, Subbaraman M, LeWinn K, Anderson E. The health effects of economic decline. Ann Rev Public Health 2011; 32: 431-450 [PMID: 21054175 DOI: 10.1146/annurev-publichealth-031210-10146]
11. Stuckler D, Basu S, Subercke McKee M. The health implications of financial crisis: a review of the evidence. Ulster Med J 2009; 78: 142-145 [PMID: 19907678]
12. Gertham UG, Johannesson M. Business cycles and mortality: results from Swedish microdata. Soc Sci Med 2005; 60: 205-218 [PMID: 15482879 DOI: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2004.05.004]
13. Garmy AM, Vägerö D. Unemployment and suicide during and after a deep recession: a longitudinal study of 3.4 million Swedish men and women. Am J Public Health 2013; 103: 1031-1038 [PMID: 23597379 DOI: 10.2105/AJPH.2013.301210]
14. Chang SS, Gunnell D, Sterne JA, Lu TH, Cheng AT. Was the economic crisis 1997-1998 responsible for rising suicide rates in East/Southeast Asia? A time-trend analysis for Japan, Hong Kong, South Korea, Taiwan, Singapore and Thailand. Soc Sci Med 2009; 68: 1322-1331 [PMID: 19206361 DOI: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2009.01.010]
15. Khang YH, Lynch JW, Kaplan GA. Impact of economic crisis on cause-specific mortality in South Korea. Int J Epidemiol 2005; 34: 1291-1301 [PMID: 16358946 DOI: 10.1093/ijep/edj1224]
16. Gavrilova NS. The response of violent mortality to economic crisis in Russia Population. Rev Pol Rev 2000; 19: 397-415 [DOI: 10.1023/A:1010621601409]
17. Stuckler D, Basu S, Subercke McKee M, Coutts A, McKee M. Effects of the 2008 recession on health: a first look at European data. Lancet 2011; 378: 124-125 [PMID: 21742166 DOI: 10.1016/S0140-6736(11)6079-9]
18. Tapia Granados JA, Diez Roux AV. Life and death during the Great Depression. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 2009; 106: 17290-17295 [PMID: 19805076 DOI: 10.1073/pnas.0906491106]
19. Rahman CJ. Are Recessions Good for Your Health? Quarterly J Econ 2000; 115: 617-50 [DOI: 10.1111/0033550654872]
20. Granados JT. Recessions and Mortality in Spain, 1980-1997. Eur J Population 2005; 21: 393-422 [DOI: 10.1007/s10680-005-4767-9]
21. Brainerd E. Economic reform and mortality in the former Soviet Union: a study of the suicide epidemic in the 1990s. Eur J Eton Rev 2001; 45: 1007-19 [DOI: 10.1016/S0144-2921(01)00108-8]
22. Stuckler D, Basu S, Subercke McKee M, Coutts A. The public health effect of economic crises and alternative policy responses in Europe: an empirical analysis. Lancet 2009; 374: 315-323 [PMID: 19589588 DOI: 10.1016/S0140-6736(09)61124-7]
23. Barr B, Taylor-Robinson D, Scott-Samuel A, McKee M, Stuckler D. Suicides associated with the 2008-10 economic recession in England: time trend analysis. BMJ 2012; 345: e5142 [PMID: 22893569 DOI: 10.1136/bmj.e5142]
24. Reeves A, Stuckler D, McKee M, Gunnell D, Chang SS, Basu S. Increase in state suicide rates in the USA during economic recession. Lancet 2012; 380: 1813-1814 [PMID: 23141814 DOI: 10.1016/S0140-6736(12)61910-2]
25. Phillips JA, Nugent CN. Suicide and the Great Recession of 2007-2009: the role of economic factors in the 50 U.S. states. Soc Sci Med 2014; 116: 22-31 [PMID: 24973571 DOI: 10.1016/j.soscimed.2014.06.015]
26. Reeves A, McKee M, Stuckler D. Economic suicides in the Great Recession in Europe and North America. Br J Psychiatry 2014; 205: 246-247 [PMID: 24925987 DOI: 10.1192/bjp.bp.114.144766]
27. Chang SS, Stuckler D, Yip P, Gunnell D. Impact of 2008 global economic crisis on suicide: time trend study in 54 countries. BMJ 2013; 347: f5239 [PMID: 24046155 DOI: 10.1136/bmj.f5239]
28. Kim H, Song YJ, Yi JJ, Chung WJ, Nam CM. Changes in mortality after the recent economic crisis in South Korea. Ann Epidemiol 2004; 14: 482-486 [PMID: 15246334 DOI: 10.1016/j.annepidem.2003.09.018]
29. Granados JA. Macroeconomic fluctuations and mortality in postwar Japan. Demography 2008; 45: 323-343 [PMID: 18613484 DOI: 10.1353/dem.0.0165]
30 Chan CH, Caine ED, You S, Fu KW, Chang SS, Yip PS. Suicide rates among working-age adults in South Korea before and after the 2008 economic crisis. J Epidemiol Community Health 2014; 68: 246-252 [PMID: 24248990 DOI: 10.1136/jech.2013-202759]
31 Lopez Bernal JA, Gasparriani A, Artundo CM, McKee M. The effect of the late 2000s financial crisis on suicides in Spain: an interrupted time-series analysis. Eur J Public Health 2013; 23: 732-736 [PMID: 23804080 DOI: 10.1093/eurpub/cko083]
32 Madianos MG, Alexiou T. Suicide, unemployment and other socioeconomic factors: evidence from the economic crisis in Greece. Eur J Psychiatri 2014; 28: 39-49 [DOI: 10.4321/ s0221-61322014000100004]
33 Pomplii M, Vichi M, Innanomari M, Lester D, Yang B, De Leo D, Girardin P. Suicide in Italy during a time of economic recession: some recent data related to age and gender based on a nationwide register study. Health Soc Care Community 2014; 22: 361-367 [PMID: 24313850 DOI: 10.1111/hsc.12086]
34 Rockett I, Kapusta ND, Bhandari R. Suicide misclassification in an international context: revisitation and update. Suicidol Online 2011; 2: 48-61
35 Rancans E, Salander Renberg E, Jacobsson L. Major demographic, social and economic factors associated to suicide rates in Latvia 1980-1998. Acta Psychiatric Scand 2001; 103: 275-281 [PMID: 11328241 DOI: 10.3109/00015030100007.x]
36 Gonzalez F, Quast T. Mortality and business cycles by level of development: evidence from Mexico. Soc Sci Med 2010; 71: 2066-2073 [PMID: 21074307 DOI: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2010.09.047]
37 Hintikka J, Saarinen PI, Viinamaki H. Suicide mortality in Finland during an economic cycle, 1985-1995. Scand J Public Health 1999; 27: 85-88 [PMID: 10421714 DOI: 10.1177/1403494899027000601]
38 Laanani M, Ghosn W, Jouglu E, Rey G. Impact of unemployment variations on suicide mortality in Western European countries (2000-2010). J Epidemiol Community Health 2013; 69: 103-109 [PMID: 23842889 DOI: 10.1136/jech-2013-203624]
39 Mackenbach JP, Looman CW. Changing patterns of mortality in 25 European countries and their economic and political correlates, 1955-1989. Int J Public Health 2013; 58: 811-823 [PMID: 24061593 DOI: 10.1007/s00038-013-0509-7]
40 Neumayer E. Recessionary lower (some) mortality rates: evidence from Germany. Soc Sci Med 2004; 58: 1037-1047 [PMID: 14723900 DOI: 10.1016/S0277-9536(03)00274-6]
41 Saurina C, Bragulat B, Saez M, Lopez-Casasnovas G. A conditional model for estimating the increase in suicides associated with the 2008-2010 economic recession in England. J Epidemiol Community Health 2013; 67: 779-787 [PMID: 23794615 DOI: 10.1136/jech-2013-202645]
42 Lester BY. Learnings from Durkheim and beyond: the economy and suicide. Suicide Life Threat Behav 2001; 31: 15-31 [PMID: 11326766 DOI: 10.1521/sult.31.1.15.21306]
43 Luo F, Florence CS, Quispe-Agnoli M, Ouyang L, Crosby AE. Impact of business cycles on US suicide rates, 1928-2007. Am J Public Health 2011; 101: 1139-1146 [PMID: 21493938 DOI: 10.2105/ AJPHP.2010.300010]
44 Tapia Granados JA. Increasing mortality during the expansions of the US economy, 1900-1996. Int J Epidemiol 2005; 34: 1194-1202 [PMID: 16051652 DOI: 10.1093/ije/dyi141]
45 Yang B. The Economy and Suicide: A Time-Series Study of the U.S.A. Am J Econ Soc Sci 1992, 51: 87-99 [DOI: 10.1111.1356-7150.1992. th02512.x]
46 Wu WC, Cheng HP. Symmetric mortality and asymmetric suicide cycles. Soc Sci Med 2010; 70: 1974-1981 [PMID: 20378221 DOI: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2010.01.052]
47 Lester D, Motoshashi Y, Yang B. The impact of the economy on suicide and homicide rates in Japan and the United States. Int J Soc Psychiatry 1992; 38: 314-317 [PMID: 1493961 DOI: 10.1177/00207 6400203800411]
48 Ceccherini-Nelli A, Priebe S. Economic factors and suicide rates: associations over time in four countries. Soc Psychiatry Psychiatr Epidemiol 2011; 46: 975-982 [PMID: 20652218 DOI: 10.1007/ s00127-010-0275-2]
