Short communication

The m.3291T>C mt-tRNA$^{\text{Leu(UUR)}}$ mutation is definitely pathogenic and causes multisystem mitochondrial disease

John W. Yarham a, Emma L. Blakely a, Charlotte L. Alston a, Mark E. Roberts b, John Ealing b, Piyali Pal b, Douglass M. Turnbull a, Robert McFarland a, Robert W. Taylor a,b

a Wellcome Trust Centre for Mitochondrial Research, Institute for Ageing and Health, Newcastle University, Newcastle upon Tyne, United Kingdom
b Salford Royal NHS Foundation Trust, Greater Manchester Neuroscience Centre, Department of Neurology, Salford, Lanchester, M6 8HD, United Kingdom

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Article history:
Received 31 October 2012
Received in revised form 3 December 2012
Accepted 5 December 2012
Available online 27 December 2012

Keywords:
Mitochondrial DNA disease
Lipoma
mt-tRNA$^{\text{Leu(UUR)}}$
Evolutionary conservation
Single-fibre studies
Pathogenicity

A B S T R A C T

Mitochondrial tRNA point mutations are important causes of human disease, and have been associated with a diverse range of clinical phenotypes. Definitively proving the pathogenicity of any given mt-tRNA mutation requires combined molecular, genetic and functional studies. Subsequent evaluation of the mutation using a pathogenicity scoring system is often very helpful in concluding whether or not the mutation is causing disease. Despite several independent reports linking the m.3291T>C mutation to disease in humans, albeit in association with several different phenotypes, its pathogenicity remains controversial. A lack of conclusive functional evidence and an over-emphasis on the poor evolutionary conservation of the affected nucleotide have contributed to this controversy. Here we describe an adult patient who presented with deafness and lipomas and evidence of mitochondrial abnormalities in his muscle biopsy, who harbours the m.3291T>C mutation, providing conclusive evidence of pathogenicity through analysis of mutation segregation with cytochrome c oxidase (COX) deficiency in single muscle fibres, underlining the importance of performing functional studies when assessing pathogenicity.

© 2012 Elsevier B.V. Open access under CC BY license.

1. Introduction

Mitochondrial (mt-) tRNA point mutations account for ~50% of all pathogenic mtDNA mutations despite occupying <10% of the mitochondrial genome, emphasising their importance in human pathogenesis [1]. Point mutations in the mt-tRNAs have been linked to a host of mitochondrial disorders and disease phenotypes, with a commonly poor correlation to genotype. Although point mutations have been identified in each of the 22 mt-tRNAs, MTTLI – the gene encoding for the mt-tRNA$^{\text{Leu(UUR)}}$ – is a particularly well-known hotspot for pathogenic point mutations; most notably the m.3243A>G and m.3271T>C mutations which are linked to the mitochondrial encephalomyopathy with lactic acidosis and stroke-like episode (MELAS) syndrome [2–4].

A heteroplasmic m.3291T>C variant in the MTTLI gene has previously been reported on 4 separate occasions, in association with MELAS [2], isolated mild myopathy [5], dementia with hearing loss [6] and cerebellar ataxia with ophthalmoplegia, hearing loss and myopathy [7]. These reports provided strong evidence linking m.3291T>C to disease through genetic analysis and molecular investigations. Crucially however, all four reports lacked functional evidence of pathogenicity from either transmembranous hybrid or single muscle fibre studies. As a consequence of this lack of functional data, a recent publication questioned the description of m.3291T>C as ‘pathogenic’ [8]. The primary concern of this report was that the mutation affects a nucleotide position that exhibits poor conservation throughout evolution, and that only a slight change in the minimum free energy structure of mt-tRNA$^{\text{Leu(UUR)}}$ would be predicted. Here we describe another patient with the m.3291T>C mutation, who presented with bilateral sensorineural deafness, and through the study of his muscle biopsy, are able to confirm the pathogenicity of this mt-tRNA mutation.

2. Case report

A 55 year old male former bus driver with a history of deafness was referred to Neurology with a 4-year history of falls, speech disturbance and weight loss. His only medication was Gliclazide for diabetes mellitus that had been diagnosed two years previously. He had bilateral sensorineural deafness for 15 years prior to his neurological presentation for which no explanation had been given, but he was unaware of any family history of a similar disorder. He neither smoked nor drank alcohol. Examination revealed macroGLOSSIA (Fig. 1A) with associated dysarthria, bilateral hearing aids and bilateral pes cavus. He had a prominent dorsocervical fat pad (Fig. 1B) and a lipoma on his posterior right thigh with an otherwise thin habitus. Muscle bulk was reduced but without focal wasting or fasciculation. Tone was normal but there...
3. Materials and methods

3.1. Muscle histology and histochemistry

Standard histological (H&E, modified Comori trichrome staining) and histochemical (cytochrome c oxidase (COX), succinate dehydrogenase (SDH) and sequential COX/SDH) analyses of the patient's muscle biopsy were performed on fresh-frozen skeletal muscle sections (10 μm), according to established protocols [9].

3.2. Molecular genetic studies

Total DNA was extracted from the patient’s whole skeletal muscle and individual (COX-positive and COX-deficient) skeletal muscle fibres isolated by laser microcapture as described previously [10], as well as his asymptomatic sister’s blood and urine. Large-scale mtDNA rearrangements were excluded by long-range PCR [11] before sequencing of the entire mitochondrial genome was performed using an ABI 3130xl (Applied Biosystems) system essentially as described elsewhere [12,13].

3.3. Assessment of m.3291T>C mutation load by quantitative pyrosequencing

Assessment of mutation load in both whole tissue DNA and DNA lysates from individual skeletal muscle fibres was performed by quantitative pyrosequencing. Pyromark Assay Design Software v.2.0 (Qiagen) was used to design locus specific PCR and pyrosequencing primers, which amplified a 130 bp PCR product spanning the 3291 nucleotide using a biotinylated forward primer (nt 3224-3245): Bio-5’ GGTTTGGTAAGATGGCGAGC 3’ and a reverse primer (nt 3335-3330): 5’ GCCATTTAGAATGGTGACATGAGG 3’.

Pyrosequencing was achieved on the Pyromark Q24 platform according to the manufacturer’s protocol, employing a mutation-specific pyrosequencing primer (nt 3312-3293): 5’ GGTTATGTGT TT AAGAAGAC 3’. Pyromark Q24 software was used to quantify the m.3291T>C heteroplasmy levels by directly comparing the relevant peak heights of both wild type and mutant mtDNA at this site [14].

4. Results

4.1. Histology and histochemistry

Histological analyses including modified Comori trichrome (Fig. 2A) and H&E (Fig. 2B) staining revealed a myopathic picture consisting of dystrophic changes, marked fatty infiltrates and fibre replacement. Subsarcolemmal aggregates of mitochondria, typical of “ragged-red” fibres, were also observed, and confirmed by SDH reaction (Fig. 2C). The individual COX reaction showed evidence of COX-deficient fibres that were more clearly identified by the sequential COX/SDH reaction (Fig. 2D). Interestingly, some fibres appear to show only a partial deficiency, with different regions displaying normal COX activity.

4.2. Molecular genetic investigations

Large-scale rearrangements of the mtDNA genome were excluded through long-range PCR analysis. Sequencing of the whole mitochondrial genome identified a previously reported m.3291T>C mutation in the MTTL1 gene which was clearly heteroplasmic (Fig. 3A). Haplogroup analysis placed this patient into haplogroup K1b1a1, with which the m.3291T>C mutation has not been associated, whilst searching of the MitoMap (www.mitomap.org) and mtDB (www.mtdb.igp.uu.se/) databases, and a literature search using PubMed (www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed), confirmed that it is not a recognised polymorphic variant [15,16].

The m.3291T>C mutation was shown by pyrosequencing to be present at heteroplasmic levels in the patient’s skeletal muscle (39% mutation load), and at low levels in both blood (6% mutation load) and urine (6% mutation load) from his clinically-unaffected sister, suggestive of maternal transmission.

4.3. Single-fibre segregation studies of the m.3291T>C mutation

Single-fibre pyrosequencing was performed on individual COX-positive and COX-deficient fibres to investigate whether the m.3291T>C mutation segregated with respiratory chain deficiency.
Only completely COX-deficient and COX-positive fibres were selected, those exhibiting partial deficiency were excluded. The mutation was found at significantly higher levels in COX-deficient fibres (89.1 ± 9.9%, n = 18) compared to COX-positive fibres (51.1 ± 27.1%, n = 17), a statistically significant finding (P<0.001, two-tailed Student's t test) (Fig. 3B).

5. Discussion

Here we describe a patient who presented with neck and tongue lipomas and sensorineural deafness, in whom a previously reported m.3291T>C mutation in mt-tRNALeu(UUR) was identified. This heteroplasmic substitution has previously been linked to a number of disease presentations, but until now, there has been insufficient functional evidence to confirm its pathogenicity. The single-fibre data we have presented here confirms the pathogenicity of this mutation. This report also reaffirms the heterogeneity of the genotype: phenotype relationship of mt-tRNA point mutations, through the individual cytochrome c oxidase (COX) reaction (C) and the individual succinate dehydrogenase (SDH) reaction (D), whilst sequential COX/SDH histochemistry confirmed the identity of true COX-deficient fibres (D).

Fig. 2. Histological and histochemical analyses of the patient's skeletal muscle biopsy. Both modified Gomori trichrome (A) and joint haematoxylin and eosin (H&E) stain (B) of the patient's skeletal muscle showed a dystrophic biopsy with fatty infiltrate and sub-sarcolemmal accumulation of mitochondria. COX-deficient fibres were identified by the individual cytochrome c oxidase (COX) reaction (C) and the individual succinate dehydrogenase (SDH) reaction (D), whilst sequential COX/SDH histochemistry confirmed the identity of true COX-deficient fibres (D).

The heteroplasmic m.3291T>C mutation in the T-Loop of mt-tRNALeu(UUR) (Fig. 3C) was identified by whole mtDNA sequencing of skeletal muscle from the patient, whilst maternal transmission was suggested through the sequencing of blood and urine from his unaffected sister. This mutation has been associated with a variety of mitochondrial disorders in several unrelated patients [2,5–7], however these reports have yet to provide conclusive proof of pathogenicity through single-fibre or transmi tochondrial hybrid studies. This lack of supportive data raised doubts regarding the role of this mutation in causing disease and evidence based primarily on the conserved nature of the affected position has proved insufficient to allay these concerns [8].

As has been observed in a number of cases, including most notably m.8344A>G [20], pathogenicity is not dependent upon the conservation or otherwise of the affected base. Although a useful measure of pathogenicity, as indicated by the fact that over 90% of definitely pathogenic mt-tRNA point mutations affect well-conserved positions, an over-emphasis on evolutionary conservation, compounded by an inconsistent selection of species for comparison means that relying on evolutionary conservation to classify mt-tRNA point mutations as pathogenic is, in the absence of supporting functional evidence, flawed [21,22].

The data presented here confirms the role of the m.3291T>C mutation in mitochondrial pathogenesis based on the revised mt-tRNA point mutation pathogenicity scoring system [21]. The mutation has been reported on several occasions, is heteroplasmic, segregates with disease and has both histochemical and biochemical evidences of respiratory chain deficiency. The mutation only shows moderate contamination of the homogenate by the extensive fatty infiltrates observed in the biopsy.

The heteroplasmic m.3291T>C mutation in the T-Loop of mt-tRNALeu(UUR) (Fig. 3C) was identified by whole mtDNA sequencing of skeletal muscle from the patient, whilst maternal transmission was suggested through the sequencing of blood and urine from his unaffected sister. This mutation has been associated with a variety of mitochondrial disorders in several unrelated patients [2,5–7], however these reports have yet to provide conclusive proof of pathogenicity through single-fibre or transmi tochondrial hybrid studies. This lack of supportive data raised doubts regarding the role of this mutation in causing disease and evidence based primarily on the conserved nature of the affected position has proved insufficient to allay these concerns [8].

As has been observed in a number of cases, including most notably m.8344A>G [20], pathogenicity is not dependent upon the conservation or otherwise of the affected base. Although a useful measure of pathogenicity, as indicated by the fact that over 90% of definitely pathogenic mt-tRNA point mutations affect well-conserved positions, an over-emphasis on evolutionary conservation, compounded by an inconsistent selection of species for comparison means that relying on evolutionary conservation to classify mt-tRNA point mutations as pathogenic is, in the absence of supporting functional evidence, flawed [21,22].

The data presented here confirms the role of the m.3291T>C mutation in mitochondrial pathogenesis based on the revised mt-tRNA point mutation pathogenicity scoring system [21]. The mutation has been reported on several occasions, is heteroplasmic, segregates with disease and has both histochemical and biochemical evidences of respiratory chain deficiency. The mutation only shows moderate conservation (Fig. 3D) according to the consensus panel of species [22], but crucially, this report provides evidence from single-fibre studies that the mutation segregates with biochemical deficiency. Consequently, this mutation now scores 14 points according to the
revised scoring system, and can be classified as ‘definitely pathogenic’ [21].

This investigation has provided conclusive evidence that supports the pathogenic role of the previously reported m.3291T>C mutation in human mitochondrial disease. Functional studies are essential for confirming the pathogenicity of mt-tRNA point mutations, and although indicative, the evolutionary conservation of affected positions should not be over-valued.

Conflict of interest

The authors report no conflicts of interest.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the Wellcome Trust Centre for Mitochondrial Research (90691/9) and the UK NHS Specialist Commissioners which funds the “Rare Mitochondrial Disorders of Adults and Children” Diagnostic Service in Newcastle upon Tyne (http://www.mitochondrialhncg.nhs.uk). We are also grateful to the funding support from a Medical Research Council (UK) Centenary Early Career Award (JWY), MRC Centre for Translational Research in Neuromuscular Disease Mitochondrial Disease Patient Cohort (UK) (GO800674) (RWT and RM) and a HEFCE/DPhil Clinical Senior Lecturer Award (RM). We would also like to thank Mr Gavin Falkous for the excellent technical support.

References

[1] Ruiz-Pesini E, Lott MT, Procaccio V, Poole JC, Brandon MC, Mishmar D, et al. An enhanced MITOMAP with a global mtDNA mutational phylogeny. Nucleic Acids Res 2007;35:D823–8.
[2] Goto Y, Nonaka I, Horai S. A mutation in the transfer RNALeu(UUR) gene associated with the MELAS subgroup of mitochondrial encephalomyopathies. Nature 1990;348:651–3.
[3] Goto Y, Nonaka I, Horai S. A new mtDNA mutation associated with mitochondrial myopathy, encephalopathy, lactic-acidosis and stroke-like episodes (MELAS). Biochim Biophys Acta 1991;1097:238–40.
[4] Yarham JW, Elson JL, Blakely EL, McFarland R, Taylor RW. Mitochondrial tRNA mutations and disease. WIREs RNA 2010;1:304–24.
[5] Uziel G, Carrara F, Granata T, Lamantia E, Mora M, Zeviani M. Neuromuscular syndrome associated with the 3291T>C mutation of mitochondrial DNA: a second case. Neuromuscul Disord 2000;10:415–8.
[6] Salzano E, Giovagnoli AR, Morandi L, Maccagnano C, Lamantia E, Marchesi C, et al. Mitochondrial dementia: a sporadic case of progressive cognitive and behavioral decline with hearing loss due to the rare m.3291T>C MELAS mutation. J Neurol Sci 2011;300:165–8.
[7] Sunami Y, Sugaya K, Chihara N, Goto Y, Matsubara S. Variable phenotypes in a family with mitochondrial encephalomyopathy harboring a 3291T>C mutation in mitochondrial DNA. Neurol Sci 2011;32:851–4.

[8] Ding Y, Leng JH. Is mitochondrial tRNALeu(UUR) 3291T>C mutation pathogenic? Mitochondrial DNA 2012;23:323–6.

[9] Old SL, Johnson MA. Methods of microphotometric assay of succinate dehydrogenase and cytochrome-c oxidase activities for use on human skeletal muscle. Histochem J 1989;21:545–55.

[10] Greaves LC, Yu-Wai-Man P, Blakely EL, Krishnan KJ, Beadle NE, Kerin J, et al. Mitochondrial DNA defects and selective extraocular muscle involvement in CPEO. Invest Ophthalmol Vis Sci 2010;51:3340–46.

[11] Blakely EL, He L, Taylor RW, Chinnery PF, Lightowlers RN, Scharer AM, et al. Mitochondrial DNA deletion in “identical” twin brothers. J Med Genet 2004;41:e19.

[12] Taylor RW, Taylor GA, Durham SE, Turnbull DM. The determination of complete human mitochondrial DNA sequences in single cells: implications for the study of somatic mitochondrial DNA point mutations. Nucleic Acids Res 2001;29:e74.

[13] Taylor RW, Barron MJ, Borthwick GM, Gospel A, Chinnery PF, Samuels DC, et al. Mitochondrial DNA mutations in human colonic crypt stem cells. J Clin Invest 2003;112:1351–60.

[14] White HE, Durston VJ, Seller A, Fratter C, Harvey JF, Cross NCP. Accurate detection and quantitation of heteroplasmic mitochondrial point mutations by pyrosequencing. Genet Test 2005;9:190–9.

[15] Ingman M, Gyllensten U. mtDB: Human Mitochondrial Genome Database, a resource for population genetics and medical sciences. Nucleic Acids Res 2006;34: D749–51.

[16] Holme E, Larsson NG, Oldfors A, Tulinius M, Sahlin P, Stenman G. Multiple symmetrical lipomas with high-levels of mtDNA with the tRNAGlu A>G(8344) mutation as the only manifestation of disease in a carrier of myoclonus epilepsy and ragged-red fibers (MERRF) syndrome. Am J Hum Genet 1993;52:551–6.

[17] Kobayashi J, Nagao M, Miyamoto K, Matsubara S. MERRF syndrome presenting with multiple symmetric lipomatosis in a Japanese patient. Intern Med 2010;49: 479–81.

[18] Jones AP, Lewis CJ, Dilley P, Hide G, Ragbir M. Lipoma or liposarcoma? A cautionary case report. J Plast Reconstr Aesthet Surg 2012;65:e11–4.

[19] Suzuki Y, Tsukuda K, Taniyama M, Atsumi Y, Matsuoka K, Oka Y. Lipoma and sensory neuropathy in mitochondrial diabetes associated with tRNA mutation at position 3271. Diabetes Care 2002;25:407–8.

[20] Shoffner JM, Lott MT, Lezza AMS, Seibel P, Ballinger SW, Wallace DC. Myoclonic epilepsy and ragged-red fiber disease (MERRF) is associated with a mitochondrial DNA tRNAGlu mutation. Cell 1990;61:931–7.

[21] Yarham JW, Al-Dosary M, Blakely EL, Alston CI, Taylor RW, Elson JL, et al. A comparative analysis approach to determining the pathogenicity of mitochondrial tRNA mutations. Hum Mutat 2011;32:1319–25.

[22] Yarham JW, McFarland R, Taylor RW, Elson JL. A proposed consensus panel of organisms for determining evolutionary conservation of mt-tRNA point mutations. Mitochondrion 2012;12:533–8.