What constitutes a palliative care need in people with serious illnesses across Africa? A mixed-methods systematic review of the concept and evidence

Oladayo A Afolabi1,2, Kennedy Nkhoma1, Matthew Maddocks1 and Richard Harding1

Abstract

Background: Clarity on what constitutes a palliative care need is essential to ensure that health systems and clinical services deliver an appropriate response within Universal Health Coverage.

Aim: To synthesise primary evidence from Africa for palliative care needs among patients and families with serious illness.

Design: We conducted a mixed methods systematic review with sequential synthesis design. The protocol was registered with PROSPERO (CRD42019136606) and included studies were quality assessed using Mixed Method Appraisal Tool.

Data sources: Six global literature databases and Three Africa-specific databases were searched up to October 2020 for terms related to palliative care, serious illnesses and Africa. Palliative care need was defined as multidimensional problems, symptoms, distress and concerns which can benefit from palliative care.

Results: Of 7810 papers screened, 159 papers met eligibility criteria. Palliative care needs were mostly described amongst patients with HIV/AIDS (n = 99 studies) or cancer (n = 59), from East (n = 72) and Southern (n = 89) Africa. Context-specific palliative care needs included managing pregnancy and breastfeeding, preventing infection transmission (physical); health literacy needs, worry about medical bills (psychological); isolation and stigma, overwhelmed families needing a break, struggling to pay children’s school fees and selling assets (social and practical needs); and rites associated with cultural and religious beliefs (spiritual).

Conclusions: Palliative care assessment and care must reflect the context-driven specific needs of patients and families in Africa, in line with the novel framework. Health literacy is a crucial need in this context that must be met to ensure that the benefits of palliative care can be achieved at the patient-level.

Keywords
Palliative care, needs assessment, Africa, terminally ill

What is already known about this topic?

- People with serious illness in low-and-middle-income countries constitute 80% of the population with palliative care needs globally.
- The construct of ‘total pain’ which underpins palliative care evolved in high-income western societies with social welfare provision.
- Universal Health Coverage states that access to healthcare (including palliative care) should not put people out of pocket.

1 Cicely Saunders Institute of Palliative Care, Policy and Rehabilitation, Florence Nightingale Faculty of Nursing, Midwifery and Palliative Care, King’s College London, London, UK
2 Department of Nursing Science, University of Maiduguri, Maiduguri, Nigeria

Corresponding author:
Oladayo A Afolabi, Cicely Saunders Institute of Palliative Care, Policy and Rehabilitation, Florence Nightingale Faculty of Nursing, Midwifery and Palliative Care, King’s College London, Bessemar Road, Denmark Hill, London WC2R 2LS, UK.
Email: oladayo.afolabi@kcl.ac.uk
Background

Palliative care improves patient-reported outcomes, patient and caregiver satisfaction and quality of life, and can be effective and cost-effective in low- and middle-income countries. Palliative care is an essential health service within Universal Health Coverage.

The term ‘need’ has been conceptualised differently across research disciplines (sociology, philosophy, economics and health). Within healthcare, needs are defined at two levels, individual healthcare needs and community/population healthcare needs. While population-level needs help to guide the allocation of resources and designing of services, individual-level needs are the primary targets of different health interventions and provide insights which are useful in developing and refining practice.

Three core conceptualisations of needs inform population-level palliative care needs assessment. Maslow’s hierarchy of needs conceptualises human needs at the individual level as universal and essential triggers for innate human motivation; Bradshaw conceptualised needs at the individual, service provision and population-level depending on how and by whom the need for social services is defined; while Steven and Raftery’s definition of healthcare need as the ‘capacity to benefit’ from something has been majorly applied in service provision. The understanding of individual-level needs within palliative care is underpinned by the holistic and multidimensional approach to the patient and family’s suffering as a result of their unmet physical, psychological, social and spiritual needs. This is reflected in the WHO’s palliative care definition.

Palliative care interventions must be person-centred and targeted at patients’ specific needs. Palliative care and its underpinning concepts of ‘total pain’ and ‘holistic care’ were shaped by early development and adoption in high-income countries with welfare states, cost-protective healthcare services and developed public health systems. Achievement of palliative care goals within Universal Health Coverage strategy requires an understanding of how palliative care needs in low- and middle-income countries may differ from high-income countries within the framework of physical, psychological, social and spiritual domains. This demands clear articulation of what constitute palliative care needs of patients within different cultural and socioeconomic contexts.

Within Africa lie 40% of the world’s countries classified as low or middle income by the World Bank (the highest percentage from any continent), with a population of 1.3 billion people. This review aimed to synthesise the evidence of what constitutes the palliative care needs of patients with serious illness and their families in Africa.

Methods

The study’s objectives were to: (1) map and synthesise the evidence on needs of people with serious illness and their families in Africa; (2) critically appraise this evidence on needs in Africa based on the WHO’s definition of palliative care.

Design and registration

This mixed-methods systematic review was conducted using sequential synthesis design. The design involved a framework synthesis of qualitative data after which the emergent framework was used to analyse the quantitative data. This involved both aggregative and configurative approach to interpret and understand the evidence in order to clarify the concept. This was reported following the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) statement and Enhancing Transparency in Reporting the Synthesis of Qualitative
Studies conducted in any African country.
- Population: Adults (≥15 years old) and their family carers (anyone ≥15 years involved in providing care for the patient with a familial relationship with them.)
- Studies at any phase of a serious illness defined as chronic conditions which demonstrate palliative care needs, constitute underlying and contributory causes of mortality and account for hospitalisation in the year before death. These included cancers, dementia, organ failure (heart, lung, renal and liver) and other diseases (such as HIV, stroke and neurological diseases)
- Only empirical studies
- Studies reporting palliative care needs, (i.e. individual-level problems, symptoms, distress and concerns in the physical, psychological, social and spiritual domains of life which have the capacity to benefit from palliative care as defined by the WHO)22

Exclusion criteria
- Studies in African Americans or African immigrants outside of Africa
- Multinational studies involving countries outside of Africa unless data is appropriately disaggregated
- Studies in children or individuals ≤15 years old and their family carers
- Children family carers for adult patients
- Acute infectious diseases
- Epidemiological studies that only focused on a statistical projection or estimation of the prevalence of certain serious illnesses as proxies for describing palliative care need
- Designs:
  - RCTs
  - Case studies
  - Validation studies of measurement tools
- Studies not focusing on palliative care needs, for example studies only reporting clinical profile or medical management of serious illness, survival analysis, surgical pathways for cancer and general perception
- Editorials, opinions and Commentaries

Table 1. Inclusion and exclusion criteria.

| Inclusion criteria | Exclusion criteria |
|--------------------|--------------------|
| Studies conducted in any African country. | Studies in African Americans or African immigrants outside of Africa |
| Population: Adults (≥15 years old) and their family carers (anyone ≥15 years involved in providing care for the patient with a familial relationship with them.) | Multinational studies involving countries outside of Africa unless data is appropriately disaggregated |
| Studies at any phase of a serious illness defined as chronic conditions which demonstrate palliative care needs, constitute underlying and contributory causes of mortality and account for hospitalisation in the year before death. These included cancers, dementia, organ failure (heart, lung, renal and liver) and other diseases (such as HIV, stroke and neurological diseases) | Studies in children or individuals ≤15 years old and their family carers |
| Only empirical studies | Children family carers for adult patients |
| Studies reporting palliative care needs, (i.e. individual-level problems, symptoms, distress and concerns in the physical, psychological, social and spiritual domains of life which have the capacity to benefit from palliative care as defined by the WHO)22 | Acute infectious diseases |

Search strategy

Search terms for the main concepts of the review question ([Palliative care OR related terms] AND [Serious illnesses OR Related terms] AND [Africa OR related terms]) (Supplemental File 2) were used. Subject-headings and keywords were searched in nine electronic bibliographic databases (MEDLINE, EMBASE, PsycINFO, Global Health, SCOPUS, CINAHL and three databases focused on Africa-Africabib.org, Catalogue of the African studies centre at the University of Leiden and African Journal online- from inception to 16 October 2020. References of included studies were hand-searched for additional studies that met inclusion criteria.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria

We adopted the WHO’s definition that palliative care is applicable early in the course of illness and, in conjunction with other therapies that are intended to prolong life. Therefore, we included studies at all phases of the selected illnesses. This was considered practical as it was difficult to precisely identify the phase of illness from majority of the studies. To identify life-threatening illnesses for this study, we adopted the definition of serious illnesses which has been widely used in global advocacy.23 Serious illnesses were defined as chronic conditions which demonstrate palliative care needs, and cause mortality and/or hospitalisation in the year before death. These included cancers, dementia, organ failure (heart, lung, renal and liver) and other diseases (such as HIV, stroke and neurological diseases).24,25

A preliminary search revealed that the term ‘palliative care needs’ was seldom used within the literature from Africa. Rather terms such as multidimensional distress or problems, symptom distress or burden, palliative care problems and physical and psychosocial symptoms or concerns were used to describe individual-level needs amenable to palliative care. Therefore, we defined palliative care needs as individual-level problems, symptoms, distress and concerns in the physical, psychological, social and spiritual domains of life which have the capacity to benefit from a palliative care intervention. In order to avoid losing studies which addressed this definition of palliative care needs but which did not use the term, the concept of need was not used in our search terms. However, we applied it in the selection of studies for inclusion (criteria are detailed Table 1). Studies in English and French languages were included. Randomised controlled trial designs were excluded as they are designed and conducted under tightly controlled conditions and specifications; thus, they may not adequately reflect the individual-level palliative care needs of the patients.

Study selection

All search results were exported to Endnote version X9 where de-duplication was conducted, and references were managed by the first reviewer (OA). Titles and abstracts of all articles were also screened by OA to ascertain their relevance and whether the inclusion or exclusion criteria were met. A second reviewer (KN) double-checked all included articles. Any article for which
inclusion was unclear was also discussed with KN and if necessary adjudicated by third reviewers (MM and RH).

Data extraction
OA extracted relevant data into a common table: author and year of study, study design, aim, setting and country of the study, diagnoses, domains of needs reported in line with the WHO definition, themes on domains of needs and factors reported to be related to or associated with palliative care needs. Data extraction was reviewed by KN, MM and RH.

Quality assessment
OA and KN appraised study quality using Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool (MMAT) which has two screening questions and other criteria to rigorously appraise different study designs within five methodological domain: (1) qualitative studies; (2) randomised controlled quantitative studies; (3) non-randomised quantitative studies; (4) observational descriptive quantitative studies; and (5) an additional set of criteria for mixed methods research studies. For mixed methods studies, study components were first assessed separately as above, followed by the additional mixed-methods quality criteria. Thus, for studies that fulfilled the first four methodological domains, the total obtainable appraisal score was 6 while for the mixed method, the total obtainable score was 13.

Analysis and synthesis
We conducted narrative synthesis using framework synthesis approach. We summarised the evidence based on countries where the research was conducted and the population. The synthesis was conducted in three stages.

First, best-fit framework synthesis was used to appraise the qualitative data. The method provides a means to test, reinforce and build on existing models and frameworks. This involved a combination of deductively coding against apriori themes from the identified model and inductively coding new themes to identify areas not currently addressed in the current model. The widely used WHO definition of palliative care and guide for the implementation of palliative care within primary healthcare was adopted as the apriori framework for the synthesis using deductive analysis. The definition highlights that patients and family caregivers are the unit of care in palliative care. It also stated the problems benefitting from palliative care (i.e. palliative care needs) in patients (physical, psychological, social and spiritual) and family carers (psychological, social and spiritual).

OA and KN iteratively coded data on palliative care needs through secondary thematic synthesis. In some instances, we semantically interpreted palliative care needs from the author explanations and participant quotes in the studies’ result, and arranged the themes together into overarching themes using existing domains. Where applicable, new themes were inductively generated while testing the fit of the coded domains of palliative care needs to the WHO definition. MM and RH verified the data analysis.

Secondly, the new framework generated from our synthesis was then used to appraise all included quantitative and qualitative studies for reporting of palliative care need. We used truth tables to identify and aggregate the presence or absence of the domains of palliative care needs within the different studies guided by the new framework. Truth tables are a form of matrix in which all possible combinations of conditions (e.g. participant and intervention characteristics) are cross-tabulated against each study. We then assigned binary format (yes or no) when a domain of need is present or absent within a study respectively.

Lastly, we created a cross-tabulation matrix to understand the relationships across different domains of palliative care needs and the factors associated with and related to palliative care needs as reported in the studies. We grouped the associated factors based on Person-Health-Environment-Treatment framework. Person refers to factors related to the patient or the family which are the units of care. Health refers to the factors related to the changes in health status, the markers of illness or disease condition; and factors internal and external to the patients and families which affect them were coded under environment. Treatment-related factors were factors which address the care being given to the patients and how this was done.

Results
Included studies
The electronic database searches yielded 6164 results after deduplication. Of these, we reviewed the full text of 479 articles and identified additional 14 papers through searching reference lists. One hundred and fifty-nine papers met the eligibility criteria for the synthesis. The articles included n = 103 (65%) quantitative, n = 48 (30%) qualitative and n = 8 (5%) mixed methods studies. The PRISMA flow chart details the stages of inclusion and exclusion (Figure 1). Details of all included studies are presented in the Supplementary File 1.

Quality appraisal
Majority of the articles met most of the quality criteria (Supplemental File 1). Majority of the single design studies met between 4 and 6 criteria with a median score of 5 (range 2–6). Most of the qualitative studies (n = 29) did
not meet the criteria on reflexivity, that is whether appropriate consideration was given to how the findings relate to the researcher’s influence. Only $n = 14$ quantitative studies fully met the criteria on whether the sample used was representative of the population. For the $n = 8$ mixed methods articles, the majority of the quality criteria were met except for the criteria on whether appropriate considerations were given to the limitations associated with the integration of the findings such as the divergence of qualitative and quantitative data in triangulation design. We retained all studies in the analysis.

### Context

The included studies ($n = 159$) were from 22 African countries (Figure 2). The majority of the studies were conducted in countries in Southern ($n = 89$) and East Africa ($n = 72$), with very few studies from Central ($n = 1$), West ($n = 18$) and North African countries ($n = 6$) meeting inclusion in this review.

The number of studies based on diagnosis is shown in Figure 3. The majority of studies reported on patients with HIV/AIDS ($n = 75$), cancer ($n = 38$); $n = 25$ studies had aggregated data on HIV/AIDS and/or cancer and other terminal illnesses (including liver failure, liver cirrhosis, renal failure, heart failure, cardiomyopathies, Kaposi sarcoma, motor neuron disease, stroke, tuberculosis, peripheral neuropathy, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD), SLE, MS, Korsakoff’s syndrome, cardiomyopathy, subarachnoid haemorrhage, anal fissure, paraplegia and other unspecified terminal illness), heart failure ($n = 4$), end-stage renal failure ($n = 5$) and $n = 12$ studies with
aggregated data-focused entirely on other serious illnesses (including Parkinson’s disease, tuberculosis, chronic liver diseases, COPD and other unspecified terminal illness).

A total of $N = 119$ (74.8%) studies were conducted with patients only, 20 (12.6%) studies with families only, 13 (8.2%) with both patients and family caregivers, while 7 (4.4%) included health care workers or volunteer caregivers (but data for patients and/or family carers were not adequately disaggregated for our analysis).

Domains of palliative care need reported

In addition to the domains within the WHO definition, our inductive analysis shows contexts-specific subthemes resulting in a new Africa-specific framework for domains of palliative care needs and the specific needs reported under each domain (Table 2).

Figure 3 shows the distribution of the domains of palliative care needs reported across all included studies. Needs in the physical domain ($n = 121$ studies) and psychological domain ($n = 120$ studies) were the most commonly reported. Information needs were only explored and reported in about a third of the included studies.2,16,31–38,42–45,47,48,50–52,54–56,58–61,63,64,66,68,71–78,80–87,89–104

The Africa-specific framework of palliative care needs

Both common and distinct needs were identified for patient and families.

Physical domain. Physical needs were reported by both patients and families. Physical needs in patients were highlighted in terms of pain and other physical symptoms and functional limitations in activities of daily living accompanying the illnesses. The need for nutritional support36,41–46 was also highlighted as cachexia and emaciation from the disease process are influenced by financial burden and food insecurity which compromises nutritional intake. An interesting aspect of physical need highlighted from a study is the need for reproductive care.40,42,44,49,54–56 Participants wanted to know how to conceive, deliver, breastfeed and take care of their babies even while they are suffering from a serious illness.

Family caregivers were developing physical symptoms such as fatigue, exhaustion, insomnia, backache, back pain, chest pain and shoulder pain45,58–61 due to their caring activities. They often neglected their physical symptoms45,58,60,62 while prioritising the patients’ symptoms, thus leading to worsening of their physical ailments. Due to poor communication from healthcare professionals about the contagious nature of the illness their sick relatives and the family caregivers’ caring disposition, family caregivers became infected by the patient’s disease as necessary precautions were not being taken.62–65

Psychological domain

Emotional needs. Most papers reported the psychological domain of needs; patients highlighted patterns of psychological symptoms such as worries, depression and anxiety.31,32,34,35,38–41,56,63,66,67 Psychological problems related to internalised stigma which are associated with communicable diseases and their perceived causes were also reported. Participants with HIV/AIDS felt isolated because others considered their sickness a result of their past bad lifestyle. The studies reported that people living with serious illness and their families felt devalued and lost dignity as they were being avoided when trying to borrow money, and as they become a financial burden on others. This further complicates the psychological burden of living with a serious illness. While suffering from these, participants highlighted the lack of emotional support from Healthcare professionals in the hospitals.39,40,66,72,73 Also, worries, anxieties and depression interact with other issues such as financial problems, uncertainties from lack of information and guilt from seeing disease as a punishment.33,35,36,38,41,47,50–52,54,56,66,68,69

In families, pervasive patterns of burnout and exhaustion45,61 psychological symptoms (such as anxiety, worries),36,55,59,61,63 and helplessness and hopelessness59,63,72,75–77 were reported. Some studies found that family caregivers experienced vicarious humiliation and shame54,48,59,61,78,79 from the role reversals that take place as children care for parents or elderly parents caring for their adult children. This is also due to the stigma associated with the patient’s illness. A pattern
of uncontrolled anticipatory grieving\cite{32,60,61} and feeling unprepared for impending death\cite{56,59,76,80} was also reported as family caregivers whose lives have become all about caring for the patient look forward to future uncertainties and the inevitable impending loss without support.

**Information needs.** Information needs were considered important to separate as a theme under the psychological domain of need, as themes were coded showing the influence of cultural and spiritual schemas of illness causation\cite{31,33,86} on the attitudes of participants to their signs and symptoms and healthcare-seeking.\cite{33,47,53} This led to complications which increased intensity of need. Also evident from the studies was a pervasiveness of mystery around serious illness due to lack of information which unnecessarily heightens worries, feelings of uncertainty, feelings of guilt and shame and lack of trust in the healthcare professionals.\cite{37,58,78} Participants highlighted themes around poor communication and lack of clear information from Healthcare professionals in which important information about the illness was left unsaid.\cite{40,43,55,71,81} Results also highlighted the participants’ need to know concerning disease causation, signs and symptoms to expect, self-care, disease progression and prognosis and available options of care.\cite{34,35,38,43,51,54–56,68,71,73,81}

The studies also reported information needs demonstrated by family members. While some family members embraced the secrecy and lack of disclosure around the illness affecting their loved one,\cite{56,63,75,76} others voiced their apprehension and anger about the silence of the healthcare professionals and the patient, the reluctance to talk about disease and prognosis and the lack of engagement in decision making regarding care.\cite{76,80,86} They expressed their need to know the disease causation and disease course\cite{24,86} and how to protect self from...
Table 2. The framework of palliative care needs including added domains.

| Patient | Families |
|---------|----------|
| **Physical needs** | **Physical symptoms/physical health suffering as a result of providing physical care**<sup>58</sup>: fatigue, exhaustion<sup>35</sup>, sleeplessness<sup>59</sup>, back pain, chest and shoulder pain<sup>61</sup>, neglecting own self and personal symptoms<sup>45,58,60,62</sup>, protection from communicable infections<sup>62–65</sup> |
| Pain and other Physical Symptoms<sup>31–41</sup> | Burnout<sup>45,61</sup> |
| Nutritional Support<sup>36,41–46</sup> | Psychological symptoms (Anxiety, worries)<sup>36,55,59,61,63</sup> |
| Functional limitations (Inability to conduct activities of daily living)<sup>33–44,44,44,47–49</sup> | Emotional rollercoaster of Vulnerability, Helplessness, hopelessness and hope<sup>59,63,72,75–77</sup> |
| Wounds and wound odours<sup>33,44</sup> | Vicarious humiliation and shame<sup>35,48,59,61,78,79</sup> |
| Libido problems and sexual needs<sup>31,35,50–53</sup> | Uncontrolled anticipatory griefing<sup>52,60,61</sup> |
| Reproduction (Pregnancy and breastfeeding)<sup>40,51,44,49,54–56</sup> | Not feeling prepared for impending death<sup>59,56,76,80</sup> |
| Cognitive and behavioural problems<sup>57</sup> | Need for ongoing motivation<sup>56</sup> |
| Physical symptoms/physical health suffering as a result of providing physical care<sup>58</sup>: fatigue, exhaustion, sleeplessness, back pain, chest and shoulder pain<sup>61</sup>, neglecting own self and personal symptoms<sup>45,58,60,62</sup>, protection from communicable infections<sup>62–65</sup> | Coping through silence and denial<sup>76</sup> |
| Psychological needs | Struggling to provide emotional support when also in need of emotional support<sup>59</sup> |
| Emotional needs | Information needs |
| Psychological symptoms (depression, anxiety, internalised stigma)<sup>31,32,35,38–41,50,56,63,66,67</sup> | Poor communication from healthcare professionals<sup>40,43,55,71,81</sup> |
| Linger ing fear of death and Struggling to survive<sup>41,43,53,62</sup> | Lack of clear information in care coordination<sup>44,82</sup> |
| Worry (about the future, about prolonged illness and emaciation, about finances and affordability of medical bills)<sup>35,36,38,42,54,56,68,69</sup> | Need to know disease causation and signs and symptoms to expect<sup>34,35,38,50,55,56,68,71,73,81</sup> |
| Body image and Self-esteem problems<sup>41,50,51,62,70</sup> | Need to know how to care for self<sup>45,43,54,73</sup> |
| Dignity, loss of independence, loss of control<sup>36,37,41,43,48,49,53,56,69</sup> | Need to know what next and disease course<sup>55,71</sup> |
| Failed coping (acceptance with hopelessness), denial<sup>31,33,36,40,40,49,54,71</sup> | Need to know what treatment and support options are available<sup>30,31,55,81</sup> |
| Somatised symptoms – depression and anxiety as sleeplessness<sup>57</sup> | Fear that palliative care will hasten their death<sup>52</sup> |
| Poor emotional support in hospital<sup>39,40,66,72,73</sup> | Associating causation to witchcraft<sup>31,33,55,68,74,81</sup> |
| Anticipatory grieving<sup>36,66,70,74</sup> | Delayed care seeking due to ignorance<sup>33,47,53</sup> |
| Information needs | Things left unsaid in breaking the news of disease<sup>71</sup> |
| Poor communication from healthcare professionals<sup>40,43,55,71,81</sup> | Support groups as sources of information<sup>77</sup> |
| Lack of clear information in care coordination<sup>44,82</sup> | Shielding self from information load<sup>35,83</sup> |
| Need to know disease causation and signs and symptoms to expect<sup>34,35,38,50,55,56,68,71,73,81</sup> | |
| Need to know how to care for self<sup>45,43,54,73</sup> | |
| Need to know what next and disease course<sup>55,71</sup> | |
| Need to know what treatment and support options are available<sup>30,31,55,81</sup> | |
| Fear that palliative care will hasten their death<sup>52</sup> | |
| Associating causation to witchcraft<sup>31,33,55,68,74,81</sup> | |
| Delayed care seeking due to ignorance<sup>33,47,53</sup> | |
| Things left unsaid in breaking the news of disease<sup>71</sup> | |
| Support groups as sources of information<sup>77</sup> | |
| Shielding self from information load<sup>35,83</sup> | |
| Social needs | **Social needs** |
| Relationship needs | **Social needs** |
| Isolation and loneliness<sup>33,40,41,44,50,51,53,56,66,74,77</sup> | Restricted social network<sup>60,79</sup> |
| Deteriorating social and family networks<sup>49,56,66,67,69,77</sup> | Restricted social participation<sup>59,61,76</sup> |
| Discrimination and stigma due to illness cause (promiscuity based or mysterious)<sup>35,40,51,53,62,67,77</sup> | Coping with complex family dynamics and Disintegrating extended family<sup>45,59</sup> |
| Cultural interpretations of problems<sup>45</sup> | Homecare is isolating<sup>35,45,59,61,63,67,76</sup> |
| Libido problems, Sexual needs and intimacy<sup>35,50,51,52,67</sup> | Stigma<sup>45,76,78</sup> |
| Fear of disclosure<sup>52,53,56,71</sup> | Managing role reversals<sup>45,79,86</sup> |
| Strain on relationship with family and friends<sup>31,48,49,52,54</sup> | Caregiving strengthening family relationship<sup>60</sup> |
| Gender-specific impacts on women (exacerbated domestic violence)<sup>37</sup> | |
Patient

**Practical support needs**
- Inability to fulfil social roles
- Decreasing support systems
- Need for support with shopping
- Practical support with care when bedridden
- Planning for children after their own death
- Relief/Respite from and support in caring
- Feeling overwhelmed and Needing a break
- Taking time off school and work
- Practical support in providing personal care where culturally inappropriate
- Managing fragmented care coordination
- Clinical supplies for care
- Financial needs
- Inability to earn income or unemployment
- Paying medical bills
- Cost of medications
- Securing transportation to appointments
- Paying children’s school fee
- Selling Assets
- Food insecurity and struggles
- Borrowing to pay for treatment
- Housing inconvenient for home-based care
- Becoming a financial burden
- Spiritual needs
- Finding meaning and spiritual purpose of illness
- Not feeling at peace
- Questioning God and anger at God
- Associating causation to witchcraft
- Guilt in reconciling causation, for example associating cancer as a punishment for sin
- Finding hope, using faith and Praying
- Cultural and Religious values and rites
- Dying without lineage propagation
- Dying without attaining life goals

Families

- Relief/Respite from and support in caring
- Feeling overwhelmed and Needing a break
- Taking time off school and work
- Practical support in providing personal care where culturally inappropriate
- Restricted ambitions
- Managing fragmented care coordination
- Clinical supplies for care
- Taking time off work and school
- Loss of income and assets
- Cost of medications
- Lack of enough finances to care for sick relative and family
- Loss of financial support of sick child
- Taking on patient’s financial responsibility, for example Paying orphaned children’s school fee
- Seeking to make sense of the disease
- Cultural beliefs with spiritual implications, for example Feeling cursed due to taboos around performing culturally inappropriate care
- Vicarious suffering
- Uncertainty life, purpose and future
- Consulting witchdoctor
- Religious perpetuation of stigma
- Elderly carers feeling cursed as their children die before them
- Finding meaning in caregiving

Contacting communicable infection. Studies also show that family caregivers voiced their anger at the lack of information from Healthcare professionals which make them appear foolish in their caring choices. Two studies reported the struggles of family members with providing care they are not trained to do for their patients at home. Another area of information need emphasised in one study is the need for information on initiating and managing end of life discussions with sick relative. The social domain comprised of three separate themes: relationship needs, financial needs and practical support needs.

**Relationship needs.** Isolation and loneliness were the most reported social needs across all conditions. Participants described facing their illness or caring for their family members alone with little support available. Many of the studies also reported that many problems had cultural interpretations which enhances the proliferation of stigma thus limiting social networks and support for individuals. However, participants in some studies reported having their families as a strong source of social and emotional support while others highlighted the support from religious affiliations which helped to inspire hope. As patients become increasingly incapacitated by their conditions, they become unable to fulfill their normal roles and this creates tension as individuals struggle with role reversals, loss of control and loss of independence. Participants also reported problems with libido, meeting partner’s sexual and intimacy needs and how these threaten their relationships and lead to sexual violence. A pattern of deteriorating social networks and social participation was shown in some of the studies reviewed. Patients highlighted having to deal with illness alone as families now live farther away. Family members...
Financial needs. Studies reported the challenges patients and families face in paying already highly subsidised medical bills, balancing cost of medication with feeding while facing daily struggles with food insecurity. The problem of access which is already widespread due to limited services is further compounded by the financial burden of securing transportation to appointments. As reported in the studies, shame and loss of agency accompanies becoming a financial burden on others and borrowing to pay for treatment. The propagation of poverty which occurs as assets are being sold and money meant for care for sick relative are inadequate for home-based care and need for housing for patients who cannot afford rent any longer because of the financial burden of illness. Additionally, studies highlighted some other unique financial challenges which family caregivers face such as taking time off work and school to provide care. This often means loss of income for the individual and further contribute to lack of enough finances to care for sick relative. One study highlighted the need for support with clinical supplies to enable them to safely care for their loved ones at home.

Practical support needs. As reported in the studies, social needs in families often overlap with the need for practical support in providing care for the patients. Family caregivers highlighted the isolating nature of homecare. They detailed how they usually take time off work, school and other social activities and end up with restricted social networks, restricted social participation and hindered personal ambitions. These underscore the need for often unavailable respite, break or support in caring for their sick family members. This meant family caregivers try to manage feeling overburdened and overwhelmed. In line with this, family members highlighted the extra burden on their limited finances and social participation caused by having to coordinate care for the sick patient within fragmented health systems. Another study highlighted the uncomfortable and culturally inappropriate necessity of personal care in some circumstances such as providing personal care for a sick parent of the opposite sex.

Spiritual domain. Themes from studies reviewed highlighted the struggles of patients and family caregivers in finding the meaning and spiritual purpose of the illness. This often leads to questioning and feelings of guilt in reconciling causation, for example associating cancer as a punishment for sin. Studies reported the underlying belief in spiritual causes of illness which propagates the association of causation to witchcraft. Such association may lead to spiritual distress and influence whether individuals feel at peace or not as they try to reconcile who they have offended to deserve their illness.

The studies highlighted the intertwined perception of spirituality and religion in Africa. The use of religion as a coping mechanism from spiritual distress was also reported in some studies. Patients described finding hope, using faith and praying to resolve worries and anxieties. The importance of religious values and rites and existential distress around dying without having a child for lineage propagation were also reported.

Family members highlighted the spiritual implications of cultural beliefs which aggravates spiritual distress. For example, families describe the taboos around seeing their parents nakedness and touching their parents’ perineal areas and cultural inappropriateness of the care which makes them feel cursed. One study described how their religion that is meant to be a source of support in their difficult times sometimes become a source of perpetuating of stigma. This leaves them feeling disoriented with the religion in which they seek solace and aggravates spiritual distress.

Factors associated with palliative care needs. Based on our synthesis of the quantitative studies, Table 3 shows the different factors associated with or related to palliative care needs. Also, most studies have assessed the factors related to physical and psychological burden and overall quality of life impacts of serious illness. Also, the table reveals sparse evidence on factors associated with or related to palliative care needs in the information sub-domain (psychological) \( (n = 3) \), financial sub-domain (social) \( (n = 5) \) and spiritual domains \( (n = 9) \). Details of the direction of relation are presented in Supplementary File 1.

Discussion

This review provides strong evidence and conceptual clarity for the palliative care needs of people with serious illness and their family members in Africa. The new framework elaborates the domains of the WHO definition using evidence from Africa and across serious illnesses. Our framework included subthemes of emotional and information needs under psychological domain; and financial, relationships and practical support needs under social domain to reflect the evidence.

The results suggest that financial constraints, poor health literacy, poor communication from healthcare...
Table 3. Cross-tabulation matrix of factors associated with palliative care needs.

|illing and Quality of Life | Overall wellbeing | Information | Emotional | Financial | Social | Spiritual | Physical | Psychological |
|---------------------------|-------------------|-------------|-----------|-----------|--------|-----------|----------|-------------|
| Person (Patient and family) | BMI105, 108 | Gender34,109–111 | Age34, 106,112 | Avoidant coping style120 | Diagnosis123,125 | Poor physical function19,107,108,114 | Disease progression39,125 | Disease markers39,131,132 | Disease progression125 | Disease markers107,111 | Disease progression125 | Disease (Ca vs non Ca)125,134 | Disease markers125,134 | Depression129 |
| Health and Illness | Disease markers108,124,125 | Poor physical function34,97,114 | Disease progression107,130,132 | Disease markers155,116,118,128,129 | Disease progression102,110,112,129 | Disease progression102,110,112,129 | Disease markers118,131,132 | Disease markers118,131,132 | Disease markers118,131,132 | Disease markers118,131,132 | Disease markers118,131,132 | Disease markers118,131,132 | Disease markers118,131,132 | Disease markers118,131,132 |
| Environment | Alcohol dependence128 | Experience of internalised stigma128 | Unemployment status128 | Larger family size140 | Availability of Social Welfare141,143 | Low income140 | Lack of insurance coverage140 | Alcohol dependence114,124 | Smoking127 | Experience of internalised stigma124 | Educational level115,118,125,142 | Disclosure of diagnosis124 | Poor social support112 | Financial difficulties100,115,137 | Unemployment128 | Experience of recent violence116 | Experience of stigma120,124,143 | Marital status113,130 | Availability of social welfare113,130 | Religiosity113,131,133,134 | Malnutrition125 | Low income140 | Interpersonal relationships143 | Level of education125 | Experience of stigma143 | Availability of social welfare144,145 | Religiosity113,131,134 |
| Treatment | Treatment type51 | Cost of care62 | Lack of explanation about the cause of pain34 | Time under care57,145,146 | Treatment type112,147 | Place of care (home vs facility)58,147 | Treatment type51,146 | Treatment type118,147 | Time on treatment99 | Place of care (home vs facility)98 | Time under care98 | Treatment type [TB medication]51,138 | Cost of care62 | Medication non-adherence134 | Previous hospital admission123 | Place of care (home vs facility)144 | Caregiver Burden: Dying at home120 |
workers and cultural and spiritual worldviews of patients with serious illnesses and their families are major drivers of palliative care needs. This reflects the wider context-defined socioeconomic and cultural realities faced by them. Thus, in order to provide palliative care which meets patients’ and families’ physical, psychological, social and spiritual needs within universal health coverage, it is imperative to assess and address palliative care needs using this framework. Therefore, palliative care delivery in these settings must involve a wider systemic approach which focuses on underlying contextual dynamics driving needs.

A previous review classified palliative care problems of patients with HIV based on whether they are from low, middle or high income countries. They found no evidence for psychological, wellbeing, spiritual, emotional and information or tangible support domains of palliative care problems in HIV patients in inpatient settings from low- and middle-income countries. This undermines the importance of these non-physical domains in the provision of palliative care that is person-centered and not disease-focused for patients on admission. This has also propagated the overemphasis on indicators related to management of physical symptoms such as morphine access in understanding palliative care needs at a population level. Our study does not differentiate inpatient and outpatient settings; nevertheless, our findings underscore the necessity of a clear overarching framework to ensure palliative care needs of patients with serious illnesses from low- and middle-income countries are not neglected whether they are in hospital or in the community. Simm’s study also highlighted information need about support resources available within the community. In addition to this, our study demonstrated information needs arising from low health literacy and the need to know and demystify the cause and course of serious illnesses which often cause psychosocial and spiritual distress for patients and families.

Another study established commonalities in palliative care-related problems across selected serious illnesses. Their findings also highlighted the need for intensifying the measurement and reporting of spiritual and social palliative care-related problems. This agrees with the finding of our study that reporting of physical and psychological needs was higher than other domains (Figure 3). This highlights gaps in evidence of needs in social and spiritual domains. Within the context of low and middle income countries, socioeconomic, cultural and religious factors often interact with the experience of illness to influence palliative care needs in these domains. The non-medical nature of social and spiritual needs mean the meeting of these needs are ignored or assigned to already overburdened families within resource-poor healthcare settings with inadequate social welfare protection. Nevertheless, to provide quality palliative care within universal healthcare coverage, essential package recommendations must not give less importance to these domains.

Furthermore, palliative care needs must be understood within the unique local cultural contexts to improve palliative care delivery for the patients and families across Africa. This is because Africa is a vast continent with extensive cultural diversity. Thus, palliative care providers must be culturally competent to consider the role of the unique worldview of patients and families in the understanding of their illness, their palliative care needs, how these are being communicated and how to meet needs in a person-centred manner.

Our review identified gaps in evidence of the palliative care needs in other serious illnesses apart from HIV/AIDS and cancer (Figure 3). Some previous reviews of palliative care needs have focused only on cancer patients or HIV patients as against the range of illnesses covered in our study. Although palliative care advanced in Africa in the context of the HIV/AIDS epidemic and pain management in cancer patients, recent projections of global mortality and global palliative care needs by 2060 have shown that non-communicable diseases such as cancer, lung diseases, cerebrovascular disease, liver diseases, dementia and non- ischemic heart diseases will drive the need for palliative care. This changing and emerging trend warrant a broader understanding of palliative care problems and needs in other serious illnesses in this context as espoused in this framework. Nevertheless, outside of HIV and cancer, referrals to palliative care continues to be very low in Africa.

Tools for identifying patients with palliative care needs were developed in high-income countries and shown to be largely inaccurate. In many African cultures, there is also an inherent aversion for prognosticating on which many of these tools are based on. This means many patients who need palliative care are not identified on time and live with unnecessary suffering. A recent study has proposed the use of tools based on the anticipation of palliative care needs as alternatives for the identification of patients who need palliative care within primary healthcare. Our finding provides comprehensive evidence for the development of such tools for improving palliative care referrals for patient with serious illnesses in Africa.

Furthermore, palliative care is not only person-centred but also family-focused care. Family caregivers play essential roles in supporting patients and weak health systems in Africa. To our knowledge, this is the first review to articulate the unique yet often hidden multidimensional palliative care needs of family caregivers of patients with serious illnesses in Africa. We have shown that family caregivers of patients with serious illnesses have physical, psychological, social and spiritual needs as well (Table 2). Yet, these are often ignored as the focus rest on the
patients. For instance, in defining palliative care problems, the current WHO guide for integrating palliative care and symptom relief into primary healthcare stated that ‘these problems include physical, psychological, social and spiritual suffering of patients and psychological, social and spiritual suffering of family members.’ This disregarded physical needs in families as important considerations for palliative care service planners, implementers and managers. Our findings show that physical needs in families must not be neglected as the burden of caregiving roles impact family-caregivers’ health. This is even more critical in low-and-middle income countries where poorly supported and overwhelmed family members lack the time and resources to seek care for their own physical symptoms. This necessitates adequate consideration of the palliative care needs of the family caregivers to ensure their unique needs are addressed. This will also impact on the health and wellbeing of the patient.

**Strengths and limitations**

This study reviewed a large body of work providing in-depth understanding of palliative care need in the African context and was conducted by a group of authors with contextual knowledge, using an international framework to guide analysis. Some factors may limit the interpretation of our findings. First, analysing a concept should not be limited to its use in research alone but wider use outside research and practice. Our search strategy was designed to capture all the relevant papers that addressed an area of need relevant to palliative care. Although we conducted a comprehensive and broad search of the literature, some papers may have been missed considering the nature of the concept of need. Second, Health literacy is a critical factor in patients’ understanding of their needs and in building the self-efficacy to seek care that addresses their needs. Coding the reporting of information needs was challenging as some studies did not necessarily report this domain separately but reported for example that patients believed that the cause of the disease was witchcraft.

Third, for the geographic mapping, some studies span more than one African country with data not usually disaggregated by country. To deal with this in the mapping of the studies, the studies were counted as one for each of the countries in which the study was conducted. Fourth, our review focused on adult patients and our Africa-specific framework of palliative care needs may not apply in paediatric patients. We also excluded children who are family caregivers of adult patients with serious illness from this review. The burden of caregiving sometimes falls on young children in Africa as stigma leads to declining social networks especially in the context of HIV/AIDS.

**Conclusions**

Our review presents strong evidence and conceptual clarity for the specific palliative care needs of people with serious illness and their families in Africa. The comprehensive overarching framework developed elaborates on the domains of palliative care needs highlighted in the WHO definition using evidence from Africa and across different serious illnesses. We identified critical gaps in evidence of palliative care needs in west, central and North Africa, in serious illnesses other than HIV/AIDS and Cancer and in family caregivers.

Thus, to achieve the outcomes improvement and cost-saving effects of palliative care within Universal Health Coverage in Africa, it is imperative to address total care needs in line with the African evidence-based framework identified in this review. Based on contextual factors driving palliative care needs, health literacy is a specific and crucial need that must be met to ensure that the benefits of palliative care can be achieved at the patient-level. The WHO must review and update the recommendations for planners and implementers of palliative care within primary healthcare to ensure families have access to adequate support for their palliative care needs. The framework should also inform clinical multidimensional needs assessment of patients with serious illnesses in Africa in a way that encompasses context-driven needs. The recommendations in the essential package for palliative care within universal health coverage must be updated to put equal emphasis on the social and spiritual needs as physical and psychological needs in this context. Therefore, there is need to develop and test palliative care service models which build on this framework to broaden comprehensive palliative care delivery across serious illnesses in Africa.

**Acknowledgements**

We acknowledge the efforts of our colleagues who assisted in ensuring the success of this work: Emeka Chukwusa (PhD) used his geospatial software skills to design the map in Figure 2 based on our data and Mary Abboah-Offei helped to read through and edit the final draft.

**Author contributions**

All authors made substantial contributions to conceptualisation, design, search, data extraction, synthesis, interpreting the results, writing and revision of the manuscript. All authors approved the version for publication.

**Declaration of conflicting interests**

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.
Funding
The author(s) disclosed receipt of the following financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article: OA is funded by the King’s International Postgraduate Research Scholarship from King’s College London. MM is funded by an NIHR Career Development Fellowship (CDF-2017-10-009) and the NIHR Applied Research Collaboration South London (NIHR ARC South London) at King’s College Hospital NHS Foundation Trust.

ORCID iDs
Oladayo A Afolabi https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7420-2957
Matthew Maddock https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0189-0952
Richard Harding https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9653-8689

Data management and sharing
All data have been shared in supplementary files.

Supplemental material
Supplemental material for this article is available online.

References
1. Kavalieratos D, Corbelli J, Zhang D, et al. Association between palliative care and patient and caregiver outcomes: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *JAMA* 2016; 316(20): 2104–2114.
2. Omoyeni NE, Soyannwo OA, Aikomo OO, et al. Home-based palliative care for adult cancer patients in Ibadan—a three year review. *Eacancermedicalscience* 2014; 8: 490.
3. Zimmermann C, Riechelmann R, Krzyzanowska M, et al. Effectiveness of specialized palliative care: a systematic review. *JAMA* 2008; 299(14): 1698–1709.
4. Reid EA, Kovalerchik O, Jubydayik K, et al. Is palliative care cost-effective in low-income and middle-income countries? A mixed-methods systematic review. *BMJ Support Palliat Care* 2019; 9: 120–129.
5. World Health Assembly. 67.19 Strengthening of palliative care as a component of comprehensive care throughout the life course. Geneva: World Health Organization, 2014.
6. Wright J, Williams R and Wilkinson JR. Development and importance of health needs assessment. *BMJ* 1998; 316(7140): 1310–1313.
7. Higginson IJ, Hart S, Koffman J, et al. Needs assessments in palliative care: an appraisal of definitions and approaches used. *J Pain Symptom Manage* 2007; 33(5): 500–505.
8. Maslow AH. A theory of human motivation. *Psychol Rev* 1943; 50(4): 370.
9. Bradshaw J. Taxonomy of social need. *New Soc* 1972; 30: 640–643.
10. Stevens A, Raftery J and Mant J. The epidemiological approach to health care needs assessment. In: *Health Care Needs Assessment*. Birmingham, UK: University of Birmingham, 2010.
11. Clark D. Total pain: the work of Cicely Saunders and the hospice movement. *Am Pain Soc Bull* 2000; 10(4): 13–15.
12. Sepulveda C, Marlin A, Yoshida T, et al. Palliative care: the World Health Organization’s global perspective. *J Pain Symptom Manage* 2002; 24(2): 91–96.
13. Maher D and Hemming L. Understanding patient and family: holistic assessment in palliative care. *Br J Community Nurs* 2005; 10(7): 318–322.
14. Saunders C. Dying they live: St. Christopher’s hospice. In: Feifel H (ed.) *New meanings of death*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1977, pp.153–179.
15. Saunders C. The philosophy of terminal care. In: Saunders C and Sykes N (eds) *The management of terminal malignant disease*. 2nd ed. London: Edward Arnold, 1984, pp.232–241.
16. Jameson C. The palliative care needs of patients with stage 3 and 4 HIV infection. *Indian J Palliat Care* 2008; 14(1): 1–6.
17. Clark D, Wright M, Hunt J, et al. Hospice and palliative care development in Africa: a multi-method review of services and experiences. *J Pain Symptom Manage* 2007; 33(6): 698–710.
18. Hong QN, Pluye P, Bujold M, et al. Convergent and sequential synthesis designs: implications for conducting and reporting systematic reviews of qualitative and quantitative evidence. *Syst Rev* 2017; 6(1): 61.
19. Carroll C, Booth A, Leaviss J, et al. “Best fit” framework synthesis: refining the method. *BMCMedResMethodol* 2013; 13(1): 37.
20. Gough D, Thomas J and Oliver S. Clarifying differences between review designs and methods. *Syst Rev* 2012; 1(1): 28.
21. Moher D, Shamseer L, Clarke M, et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015 statement. *Syst Rev* 2015; 4(1): 1.
22. Tong A, Flemming K, McInnes E, et al. Enhancing transparency in reporting the synthesis of qualitative research: ENTREQ. *BMCMedResMethodol* 2012; 12(1): 181.
23. Morin L, Aubry R, Feroa L, et al. Estimating the need for palliative care at the population level: a cross-national study in 12 countries. *Palliat Med* 2017; 31(6): 526–536.
24. Etkind S, Bone A, Gomes B, et al. How many people will need palliative care in 2040? Past trends, future projections and implications for services. *BMCMed* 2017; 15(1): 102.
25. Murtagh FE, Bausewein C, Verne J, et al. How many people need palliative care? A study developing and comparing methods for population-based estimates. *Palliat Med* 2014; 28(1): 49–58.
26. Pace R, Pluye P, Bartlett G, et al. Testing the reliability and efficiency of the pilot Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool (MMAT) for systematic mixed studies review. *Int J Nurs Stud* 2012; 49(1): 47–53.
27. World Health Organization. Integrating palliative care and symptom relief into primary health care: a WHO guide for health-care planners, implementers and managers. Geneva: World Health Organization, 2018.
28. Braun V and Clarke V. Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qual Res Psychol* 2006; 3(2): 77–101.
29. Pope C, Mays N and Popay J. Synthesising qualitative and quantitative health evidence: a guide to methods. UK: McGraw-Hill Education, 2007.
30. Fawcett J. The “what” of theory development. *NLM Pub* 1978(15–1708): 17–33.
31. Bates MJ, Chitani A and Dreyer G. Palliative care needs of patients living with end-stage kidney disease not treated
with renal replacement therapy: an exploratory qualitative study from Blantyre, Malawi. Afr J Prim Health Care Fam Med 2017; 9(1): e1–e6.
32. Herce ME, Elmore SN, Kalanga N, et al. Assessing and responding to palliative care needs in rural sub-Saharan Africa: results from a model intervention and situation analysis in Malawi. PloS One 2014; 9(10): e110457.
33. Mabena N and Moodley P. Spiritual meanings of illness in patients with cervical cancer. S Afr J Psychol 2012; 42(3): 301–311.
34. Dekker AM, Amon JJ, Le Roux KW, et al. “What is killing me most”: chronic pain and the need for palliative care in the Eastern Cape, South Africa. J Pain Palliat Care Pharmacotherapy 2012; 26(4): 334–340.
35. Mshana G, Dotchin CL and Walker RW. ‘We call it the shaking illness’: perceptions and experiences of Parkinson’s disease in rural northern Tanzania. BMC Public Health 2011; 11(1): 219.
36. Sepulveda C, Habiymbere V, Amandua J, et al. Quality of care at the end of life in Africa. BMJ 2003; 327(7408): 209–213.
37. Grant E, Murray SA,Grant A, et al. A good death in rural Kenya? Listening to Meru patients and their families talk about care needs at the end of life. J Palliat Care 2003; 19(3): 159–167.
38. Agbokey F, Kudzawu E, Dzodzomenyo M, et al. Knowledge and health seeking behaviour of breast cancer patients in Ghana. Int J Breast Cancer. 2019; 2019: 5239840.
39. Murray SA, Grant E, Grant A, et al. Dying from cancer in developed and developing countries: lessons from two qualitative interview studies of patients and their carers. BMJ 2003; 326(7385): 368–371.
40. Selman L, Simms V, Penfold S, et al. ‘My dreams are shuttered down and it hurts lots’ – a qualitative study of palliative care needs and their management by HIV outpatient services in Kenya and Uganda. BMC Palliat Care 2013; 12(1): 35.
41. Jansen van Rensburg JIM, Maree JE and van Belmont C. Quality of life from the perspective of the palliative care patient in a resource-poor community in South Africa. Palliat Support Care 2013; 11(1): 21–28.
42. Copeland T. Self-managing HIV/AIDS: cultural competence and health among women in Nairobi, Kenya. Anthropol Med 2018; 25(2): 176–190.
43. Namukwaya E, Grant L, Downing J, et al. Improving care for people with heart failure in Uganda: serial in-depth interviews with patients’ and their health care professionals. BMC Res Notes 2017; 10(1): 184.
44. Mkwinda E and Lekalakala-Mokgele E. Palliative care needs in Malawi: care received by people living with HIV. Curationis 2016; 39(1): 1664.
45. Lindsey E, Hirschfeld M and Tlou S. Home-based care in Botswana: experiences of older women and young girls. Health Care Women Int 2003; 24(6): 486–501.
46. Uwimana J and Struthers P. Met and unmet palliative care needs of people living with HIV/AIDS in Rwanda. Sahara J 2007; 4(1): 575–585.
47. Bonsu AB and Ncama BP. Recognizing and appraising symptoms of breast cancer as a reason for delayed presentation in Ghanaian women: a qualitative study. PLoS One 2019; 14(1): e0208773.
48. Philips PL and Lazenby M. The emotional and spiritual well-being of hospice patients in Botswana and sources of distress for their caregivers. J Palliat Med 2013; 16(11): 1438–1445.
49. Small LF. Quality-of-life experiences from the perspective of patients receiving haemodialysis for chronic renal failure. Health SA Gesondheid 2010; 15(1): 1–7.
50. Jones R, Muyinda H, Nyakoojo G, et al. Does pulmonary rehabilitation alter patients’ experiences of living with chronic respiratory disease? A qualitative study. Int J COPD 2018; 13: 2375–2385.
51. Tannor EK, Archer E, Kapembwa K, et al. Quality of life in patients on chronic dialysis in South Africa: a comparative mixed methods study. BMC Nephrol 2017; 18(1): 1–9.
52. Mkwanazi NB, Rochat TJ and Bland RM. Living with HIV, disclosure patterns and partnerships a decade after the introduction of HIV programmes in rural South Africa. AIDS Care 2015; 27: 65–72.
53. Kuteesa MO, Seeley J, Cumming RG, et al. Older people living with HIV in Uganda: understanding their experience and needs. Afr J AIDS Res 2012; 11(4): 295–305.
54. Kimani KN, Murray SA and Grant L. Multidimensional needs of patients living and dying with heart failure in Kenya: a serial interview study. BMC Palliat Care 2018; 17(1): 28.
55. Selman L, Higginson II, Agupio G, et al. Meeting information needs of patients with incurable progressive disease and their families in South Africa and Uganda: multicentre qualitative study. BMJ 2009; 338(7703): 1127–1131.
56. Iwelumor J, Airhihenbuwa CO, Okoror TA, et al. Family systems and HIV/AIDS in South Africa. Int Q Community Health Educ 2006; 27(4): 321–335.
57. Andersen L, Kagee A, O’Cleirigh C, et al. Understanding the experience and manifestation of depression in people living with HIV/AIDS in South Africa. AIDS Care 2015; 27(1): 59–62.
58. Oyebigle YO and Brysiewicz P. Exploring caregiver burden experienced by family caregivers of patients with End-Stage Renal Disease in Nigeria. Int J Afr Nurs Sci 2017; 7: 136–143.
59. Streid J, Harding R, Agupio G, et al. Stressors and resources of caregivers of patients with incurable progressive illness in sub-Saharan Africa. Qual Health Res 2014; 24(3): 317–328.
60. Oyebigle YO and Brysiewicz P. Family caregiver’s experiences of providing care to patients with End-Stage Renal Disease in South-West Nigeria. J Clin Nurs 2017; 26(17–18): 2624–2632.
61. Sengonzi R. The plight of older persons as caregivers to people infected/affected by HIV/AIDS: evidence from Uganda. J Cross Cult Gerontol 2007; 22(4): 339–353.
62. Too W, Watson M, Harding R, et al. Living with AIDS in Uganda: a qualitative study of patients’ and families’ experiences following referral to hospice Palliative care in other conditions. BMC Palliat Care 2015; 14(1): 67.
63. Ndaba-Mbata RD and Selolwile ES. Home-based care of the terminally ill in Botswana: knowledge and perceptions. Int Nurs Rev 2000; 47(4): 218–223.
64. Ngoma T. Palliative care in Tanzania: a needs assessment study of family caregivers in urban setting. Tanzan J Health Res 2005; 7(2): 104–106.
65. Mkandawire P, Arku G, Atari O, et al. “My House Is the Hospital”: housing and Health and Wellbeing among Persons Living with HIV/AIDS in Northern Malawi. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2015; 26(4): 1246–1264.

66. Kebede W and Kebede K. Psychosocial experiences and needs of women diagnosed with cervical cancer in Ethiopia. *Int Soc Work* 2017; 60(6): 1632–1646.

67. Mkandawire-Valhmu L, Kendall N, Dressel A, et al. Women’s work at end of life: the intersecting gendered vulnerabilities of patients and caregivers in rural Malawi. *Glob Public Health* 2020; 15(7): 1062–1072.

68. Bates MJ, Mphwatiwa T, Ardrey J, et al. Household concepts of wellbeing and the contribution of palliative care in the context of advanced cancer: a Photovoice study from Blantyre, Malawi. *PLoS One* 2018; 13(8): e0202490.

69. Ohemeng FNA and Tonah S. “I Want to Go Gently”: how AIDS patients in Ghana envisage their deaths. *Omega* 2017; 75(4): 395–410.

70. Gonzaga MA. Listening to the voices: an exploratory study of the experiences of women diagnosed and living with breast cancer in Uganda. *Pan Afr Med J* 2013; 16.

71. Maree JE, Langley G and Nqubezelo L. Not a nice experience, not at all: underprivileged women’s experiences of being confronted with cervical cancer. *Palliat Support Care* 2015; 13(2): 239–247.

72. Lofandjola JM, Sumaili EK, Mairiaux P, et al. Perceptions and types of support coming from families caring for patients suffering from advanced illness in Kinshasa, Democratic Republic of Congo. *Ann Palliat Med* 2017; 6(Suppl 1): S39–S46.

73. Marie Modeste RR and Majeko SJ. Sources and types of support on information on self-care symptom management strategies for HIV and AIDS. *Curationis* 2014; 37(1): 127.

74. Mtalane LJ, Uys LR and Preston-Whyte EM. The experience of terminal illness among Zulu speaking patients and their families. *Int J Nurs Stud* 1993; 30(2): 143–155.

75. Makoe M. Ambiguous diagnosis, futile treatments and temporary recovery: meanings of medical treatment among HIV/AIDS family caregivers providing care without ARVs. *Sahara J* 2011; 8(4): 187–196.

76. Demmer C. Caring for a loved one with AIDS: a South African perspective. *J Loss Trauma* 2006; 11(5): 439–455.

77. Uys LR. Evaluation of the Integrated Community-Based Home Care model. *Curationis* 2001; 24(3): 75–82.

78. Makhele MF and Mulaudzi FM. The experiences of Batswana families regarding hospice care of AIDS patients in the Bophirima district, North West province, South Africa. *Sahara J* 2012; 9(2): 104–112.

79. Githaiga JN. Culture, role conflict and caregiver stress: the lived experiences of family cancer caregivers in Nairobi. *J Health Psychol* 2017; 22(12): 1591–1602.

80. Combrink MJW and Maree JE. The transition from palliation with anticancer treatment to palliation without anticancer treatment: the experiences of South African patients and their families. *J Hosp Palliat Nurs* 2016; 18(5): 421–428.

81. Namukwaya E, Murray SA, Downing J, et al. ‘I think my body has become addicted to those tablets’. Chronic heart failure patients’ understanding of and beliefs about their illness and its treatment: a qualitative longitudinal study from Uganda. *PLoS One* 2017; 12(9): e0182876.

82. Reid EA, Gudina EK, Ayers N, et al. Caring for life-limiting illness in Ethiopia: a mixed-methods assessment of outpatient palliative care needs. *J Palliat Med* 2018; 21(5): 622–630.

83. Agom DA, Neill S, Allen S, et al. Construction of meanings during life-limiting illnesses and its impacts on palliative care: ethnographic study in an African context. *Psycho-Oncology* 2019; 28(11): 2201–2209.

84. Nyawira Githaiga JN and Swartz L. Socio-cultural contexts of end-of-life conversations and decisions: bereaved family cancer caregivers’ retrospective co-constructions. *BMC Palliat Care* 2017; 17: 1–8.

85. Mkwindia E, Lekalakala-Mokgele E and Sengane M. Needs of primary caregivers relating to care given to HIV/AIDS patients and support from palliative care nurses in Malawi: perspectives of HIV and AIDS across populations. *Afr J Phys Health Educ Recreat Dance* 2015; 21(Suppl. 2): 123–135.

86. Githaiga JN. When ‘chemo is failing’. . . ‘the illness is indigeneous’. Therapeutic pluralism and reclaiming agency: family cancer caregivers’ experiences in Nairobi. *J East Afr Stud* 2017; 11(2): 310–328.

87. Grant L, Brown J, Leng M, et al. Palliative care making a difference in rural Uganda, Kenya and Malawi: three rapid evaluation field studies. *BMC Palliat Care* 2011; 10(1): 8.

88. Kusi G, Boamah Mensah AB, Boamah Mensah K, et al. Caregiving motivations and experiences among family caregivers of patients living with advanced breast cancer in Ghana. *PLoS One* 2020; 15(3): e0229683.

89. Gwyther L, Heap M and London L. Access to palliative care in HIV services in Cape Town. *AIDS Care* 2018; 30: 11–15.

90. Ndiok A and Ncama B. Assessment of palliative care needs of patients/families living with cancer in a developing country. *Scand J Caring Sci* 2018; 32(3): 1215–1226.

91. Nkhoma K, Ahmed A, Ali Z, et al. Does being on TB treatment predict a higher burden of problems and concerns among HIV outpatients in Kenya? a cross-sectional self-report study. *AIDS Care* 2018; 30(Suppl. 2): 28–32.

92. Shen MJ, Prigerson HG, Ratshikana-Moloko M, et al. Illness understanding and end-of-life care communication and preferences for patients with advanced cancer in South Africa. *J Glob Oncol* 2018; 2018(4).

93. Bates M and Mijoya A. A review of patients with advanced cervical cancer presenting to palliative care services at Queen Elizabeth Central Hospital in Blantyre, Malawi. *Malawi Med J* 2015; 27(3): 93–95.

94. Lifson AR, Workneh S, Hailemichael A, et al. Perceived social support among HIV patients newly enrolled in care in rural Ethiopia. *AIDS Care* 2015; 27(11): 1382–1386.

95. Harding R, Powell RA, Namisango E, et al. Palliative care-related self-report problems among cancer patients in East Africa: a two-country study. *Support Care Cancer* 2014; 22(12): 3185–3192.

96. Morwe KG, Klu EK and Tugli AK. The plight of HIV and AIDS care givers in Thohoyandou in South Africa. *J Hum Ecol* 2013; 44(3): 281–286.

97. Simms V, Gikaara N, Munene G, et al. Multidimensional patient-reported problems within two weeks of HIV diagnosis in East Africa: a multicentre observational study. *PLoS One* 2013; 8(2): e57203.
98. Harding R, Selman L, Agupio G, et al. Intensity and correlates of multidimensional problems in HIV patients receiving integrated palliative care in sub-Saharan Africa. *Sex Transm Infect* 2012; 88(8): 607–611.

99. Pearson CR, Micek MA, Pfeiffer J, et al. One year after ART initiation: psychosocial factors associated with stigma among HIV-positive Mozambicans. *AIDS Behav* 2009; 13(6): 1189–1196.

100. Emanuel RH, Emanuel GA, Reitschuler EB, et al. Challenges faced by informal caregivers of hospice patients in Uganda. *J Palliat Med* 2008; 11(5): 746–753.

101. Ahmed MA, Baashar TM and Ahmed ME. Evaluation of palliative management of advanced breast cancer in Khartoum, Sudan. *Saudi Med J* 2005; 26(7): 1142–1144.

102. Keogh P, Allen S, Almedal C, et al. The social impact of HIV infection on women in Kigali, Rwanda: a prospective study. *Soc Sci Med* 1994; 38(8): 1047–1053.

103. Seeley J, Kajura E, Bachengana C, et al. The extended family and support for people with AIDS in a rural population in south west Uganda: a safety net with holes? *AIDS Care* 1993; 5(1): 117–122.

104. Kizza IB and Mulliira JK. Determinants of quality of life among family caregivers of adult cancer patients in a resource-limited setting. *Support Care Cancer* 2020; 28(3): 1295–1304.

105. Fink D, Oladele D, Etomi O, et al. Musculoskeletal symptoms and non-prescribed treatments are common in an urban African population of people living with HIV. *Rheumatol Int* 2019; 39(2): 285–291.

106. Evans D, Takuba S, Rassool M, et al. Prevalence of peripheral neuropathy in antiretroviral therapy naïve HIV-positive patients and the impact on treatment outcomes-a retrospective study from a large urban cohort in Johannesburg, South Africa. *J Neurovirol* 2012; 18(3): 162–171.

107. Lazenby M, Sebego M, Swart NC, et al. Symptom burden and functional dependencies among cancer patients in Botswana suggest a need for palliative care nursing. *Cancer Nurs* 2016; 39(1): E29–E38.

108. Farrant L, Gwyther L, Dinat N, et al. Maintaining wellbeing for South Africans receiving ART: the burden of pain and symptoms is greater with longer ART exposure. *S Afr Med J* 2014; 104(2): 119–123.

109. Namisango E, Powell RA, Atuahaire L, et al. Is symptom burden associated with treatment status and disease stage among adult HIV outpatients in East Africa? *J Palliat Med* 2014; 17(3): 304–312.

110. Harding R, Selman L, Agupio G, et al. Prevalence, burden, and correlates of physical and psychological symptoms among HIV palliative care patients in Sub-Saharan Africa: an international multicenter study. *J Pain Symptom Manage* 2012; 44(1): 1–9.

111. Ahlam A, Hind M, Haddou Rahou B, et al. Quality of life of Moroccan patients on the palliative phase of advanced cancer. *BMC Res Notes* 2019; 12(1): 351.

112. Beck SL and Falkson G. Prevalence and management of cancer pain in South Africa. *Pain* 2001; 94(1): 75–84.

113. Shearer K, Evans D, Xhosa B, et al. Low prevalence of depressive symptoms among stable patients on antiretroviral therapy in Johannesburg, South Africa. *PLoS One* 2018; 13(9): e0203797.
129. Mugusi S, Ngaimisi E, Janabi M, et al. Neuropsychiatric manifestations among HIV-1 infected African patients receiving efavirenz-based cART with or without tuberculosis treatment containing rifampicin. Eur J Clin Pharmacol 2018; 74(11): 1405–1415.

130. Ndetei D, Musymui C, Tele A, et al. Psychological well-being and social functioning across the cancer stages: implications for palliative care. J Soc Work End Life Palliat Care 2018; 14(2–3): 194–208.

131. Peltzer K. Spirituality and religion in antiretroviral therapy (art) in KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa: a longitudinal study. J Psychol Afr 2011; 21(3): 361–369.

132. Peltzer K and Ramlagan S. Perceived stigma among patients receiving antiretroviral therapy: a prospective study in KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa. AIDS Care 2011; 23(1): 60–68.

133. Peltzer K. Social grants for people living with HIV and on antiretroviral therapy in KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa. Sahara J 2012; 9(1): 6–14.

134. Selman LE, Higginson IJ, Agupio G, et al. Quality of life among patients receiving palliative care in South Africa and Uganda: a multi-centred study. Health Qual Life Outcomes 2011; 9: 21.

135. Tesfaye M, Kaestel P, Olsen MF, et al. Food insecurity, mental health and quality of life among people living with HIV commencing antiretroviral treatment in Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. Health Qual Life Outcomes 2016; 14(1): 1–8.

136. Harding R, Selman L, Ali Z, et al. Wellbeing among sub-Saharan African patients with advanced HIV and/or cancer: an international multi-centred comparison study of two outcome measures. Health Qual Life Outcomes 2014; 12(1): 80.

137. Fatiregun OA, Olagunju AT, Erinfolami AR, et al. Relationship between anxiety disorders and domains of health related quality of life among Nigerians with breast cancer. Breast 2017; 31: 150–156.

138. Collins K and Harding R. Improving HIV management in sub-Saharan Africa: how much palliative care is needed? AIDS Care 2007; 19(10): 1304–1306.

139. Olijiah VO, Baiyewu O and Sheikh TL. Depression under-diagnosis and the effects on quality of life in outpatients with HIV at a Nigerian university teaching hospital. Afr J AIDS Res 2011; 10(3): 247–254.

140. Voss JG, Sukati NA, Seboni NM, et al. Symptom burden of fatigue in men and women living with HIV/AIDS in Southern Africa. J Assoc Nurses AIDS Care 2007; 18(4): 22–31.

141. Maluccio JA, Palermo T, Kadiyala S, et al. Improving health-related quality of life among people living with HIV: results from an impact evaluation of a food assistance program in Uganda. PloS One 2015; 10(8): e0135879.

142. Wouters E, Masquiller C and le Roux Booyens F. The importance of the family: a longitudinal study of the predictors of depression in HIV patients in South Africa. AIDS Behav 2016; 20(8): 1591–1602.

143. Wingood GM, Reddy P, Peterson SH, et al. HIV Stigma and mental health status among women living with HIV in the Western Cape, South Africa. S Afr J Sci 2008; 104(5–6): 237–240.

144. Kabore I, Bloem J, Etheredge G, et al. The effect of community-based support services on clinical efficacy and health-related quality of life in HIV/AIDS patients in resource-limited settings in sub-Saharan Africa. AIDS Patient Care STDs 2010; 24(9): 581–594.

145. Fox MP, McCoy K, Larson BA, et al. Improvements in physical wellbeing over the first two years on antiretroviral therapy in western Kenya. AIDS Care 2010; 22(2): 137–145.

146. Rosen S, Larson B, Brennan A, et al. Economic outcomes of patients receiving antiretroviral therapy for HIV/AIDS in South Africa are sustained through three years on treatment. PloS One 2010; 5(9): 1–11.

147. Patel R, Kassaye S, Gore-Felton C, et al. Quality of life, psychosocial health, and antiretroviral therapy among HIV-positive women in Zimbabwe. AIDS Care 2009; 21(12): 1517–1527.

148. Ratshikana-Moloko M, Ayeni O, Tsitsi JM, et al. Spiritual care, pain reduction, and preferred place of death among advanced cancer patients in Soweto, South Africa. J Pain Symptom Manage 2020; 60: 37–47.

149. Nel A and Kagae A. The relationship between depression, anxiety and medication adherence among patients receiving antiretroviral treatment in South Africa. AIDS Care 2013; 25(8): 948–955.

150. O’Neil DS, Prigerson HG, Mmoledi K, et al. Informal caregiver challenges for advanced cancer patients during End-of-Life care in Johannesburg, South Africa and distinctions based on place of death. J Pain Symptom Manage 2018; 56(1): 98–106.

151. Simms VM, Higginson I and Harding R. What palliative care-related problems do patients experience at HIV diagnosis? A systematic review of the evidence. J Pain Symptom Manage 2011; 42(5): 734–753.

152. Knaul FM, Farmer PE, Krakauer EL, et al. Alleviating the access abyss in palliative care and pain relief—an imperative of universal health coverage: the Lancet Commission report. Lancet 2018; 391(10128): 1391–1454.

153. Moens K, Higginson IJ, Harding R, et al. Are there differences in the prevalence of palliative care-related problems in people living with advanced cancer and eight non-cancer conditions? A systematic review. J Pain Symptom Manage 2014; 48(4): 660–677.

154. Brown EA, Bekker HL, Davison SN, et al. Supportive care: communication strategies to improve cultural competence in shared decision making. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2016; 11(10): 1902–1908.

155. Hanratty B, Holland P, Jacoby A, et al. Review article: financial stress and strain associated with terminal cancer—a review of the evidence. Palliat Med 2007; 21(7): 595–607.

156. Bousso RS, Poles K, Serafin TDS, et al. Religious beliefs, illness and death: family’s perspectives in illness experience. Rev Esc Enferm USP 2011; 45(2): 397–403.

157. Moghadam N, Coxon H, Nabarro S, et al. Unmet care needs in people living with advanced cancer: a systematic review. Support Care Cancer 2016; 24(8): 3609–3622.

158. Busolo DS and Woodgate RL. Using a supportive care framework to understand and improve palliative care among cancer patients in Africa. Palliat Support Care 2016; 14(3): 284–301.
159. Harding R, Selman L, Powell RA, et al. Research into palliative care in sub-Saharan Africa. *Lancet Oncol* 2013; 14(4): e183–e188.

160. Sleeman KE, de Brito M, Etkind S, et al. The escalating global burden of serious health-related suffering: projections to 2060 by world regions, age groups, and health conditions. *Lancet Glob Heal* 2019; 7(7): e883–e892.

161. Agom DA, Onyeka TC, Iheanacho PN, et al. Barriers to the provision and utilization of palliative care in Africa: a rapid scoping review. *Indian J Palliat Care* 2021; 27(1): 3.

162. ElMokhallalati Y, Bradley SH, Chapman E, et al. Identification of patients with potential palliative care needs: a systematic review of screening tools in primary care. *Palliat Med* 2020; 34(8): 989–1005.

163. Ayane GN and Kadimo K. Truth-telling about terminal illness prognosis in the African context: a review. *J Commun Healthc* 2020; 13(4): 335–343.

164. Nwodoh CO, Okoronkwo IL, Nwaneri AC, et al. Terminally ill patients’ perception on healthcare providers’ communication of prognostic information: a qualitative study from Nigeria, West Africa. *Cogent Med* 2018; 5(1): 1457232.

165. Kamal AH, Kirkland KB, Meier DE, et al. A person-centered, registry-based learning health system for palliative care: a path to coproducing better outcomes, experience, value, and science. *J Palliat Med* 2018; 21(S2): S61–S67.

166. Xu XY, Leung AYM and Chau PH. Health literacy, self-efficacy, and associated factors among patients with diabetes. *Health Lit Res Pract* 2018; 2(2): e67–e77.

167. Robson E, Ansell N, Huber US, et al. Young caregivers in the context of the HIV/AIDS pandemic in sub-Saharan Africa. *Popul Space Place* 2006; 12(2): 93–111.

168. Ogunmefun C and Schatz E. Caregivers’ sacrifices: the opportunity costs of adult morbidity and mortality for female pensioners in rural South Africa. *Dev South Afr* 2009; 26(1): 95–109.