Burnout Syndrome among General Practitioners in A Tertiary Referral Center

Ayu H. Syarif, Hafidz N. Ichwan, Anita Meisita, Mururul Aisyi, Rahajeng Dewantari

1Department of General Practice, Indonesia National Cancer Center – Dharmais Cancer Hospital, Jakarta, Indonesia
2Department of Research and Development, Indonesia National Cancer Center – Dharmais Cancer Hospital, Jakarta, Indonesia
3Department of Psychiatry, Indonesia National Cancer Center – Dharmais Cancer Hospital, Jakarta, Indonesia

*Corresponding Author: ayuhutamisyarif5@gmail.com
Received 21 September 2019; Accepted 8 September 2020
DOI: 10.23886/ejki.8.11210.

Abstract

Many demanding jobs, such as medical professionals are the targets of burnout syndrome. Although burnout syndrome was frequently reported in many studies abroad, Indonesia lacks the relevant data specifically burnout syndrome in the hospital staff. This study aimed to determine burnout syndrome in a tertiary referral center and its associated factors. This was a cross-sectional study involving general practitioners who worked in a tertiary referral hospital. The questionnaire used the Maslach Burnout Inventory (MBI). This study was performed in a tertiary referral hospital in Jakarta, from March to April 2019. The data were analyzed using univariate and bivariate analysis and compared with the chi-square test or Fisher test. Results: The total participants were 31 doctors; 25 of them were female, while half of them worked in the hospital at under 30 years (n=16). Most of them were married (n=20) and had a shift in the clinical unit (n=23). The majority of them worked longer than others (n=24) and earned a lower level of monthly salary (n=19). As many as 12 physicians in this institution were detected to be burnout. Medical doctors who suffered from burnout are marked with female (n=10), young age (n=10), marriage (n=9), longer working hours (n=11), low salary (n=7), and less working experience (n=6). Bivariate analysis showed age significantly associate with burnout syndrome (P-value=0.010). Burnout syndrome was found among medical doctors in a tertiary referral center with age as the only significant associating factor.

Keywords: burnout syndrome, doctor, hospital

Kejadian Burnout Syndrome pada Dokter Umum di Sebuah Rumah Sakit Rujukan Tertier

Abstrak

Sindrom Burnout banyak ditemukan pada profesi tertentu seperti dokter. Meskipun demikian, data mengenai angka kejadian Sindrom Burnout belum banyak dilaporkan di Indonesia, khususnya pada profesi dokter umum yang bertugas di rumah sakit rujukan tertier. Penelitian ini dilakukan untuk menentukan kejadian dan faktor yang berpengaruh terhadap Sindrom Burnout pada dokter umum rumah sakit rujukan tertier. Studi potong lintang ini melibatkan 31 dokter umum sebagai responden penelitian. Studi ini dilakukan di sebuah rumah sakit rujukan tertier di Jakarta, pada bulan Maret-April 2019. Pengambilan data primer menggunakan kuesioner Maslach Burnout Inventory (MBI) untuk menentukan kejadian Sindrom Burnout. Data dianalisa dengan analisa univariat (data sosiodemografi) dan bivariat. Analisa bivariat dilakukan untuk melihat hubungan antara variabel karakteristik sosiodemografi terhadap kejadian Sindrom Burnout dengan menggunakan chi-square test atau fisher test. Hasil : Responden sebagian besar merupakan wanita (n=25), yang telah menikah (n=20), bekerja di unit pelayanan (n=23), bekerja lebih dari 60 jam (n=24), dan berpenghasilan di bawah 10 juta (n=19). Sebanyak 12 dokter umum mengalami Sindrom Burnout. Sindrom Burnout pada dokter umum ditandai dengan perempuan (n=10), usia yang lebih muda (n=10), telah menikah (n=9), jam kerja yang lebih lama (n=11), penghasilan yang lebih rendah (n=7), dan pengalaman kerja yang lebih sedikit (n=6). Analisis bivariat menunjukkan usia berhubungan secara signifikan terhadap kejadian Sindrom Burnout (P-value= 0,010). Sindrom burnout dialami oleh dokter umum yang bekerja di rumah sakit rujukan tertier. Usia merupakan satu-satunya faktor yang berhubungan dengan sindrom burnout.

Kata Kunci : sindrom burnout, dokter umum, rumah sakit.
Introduction
Burnout is firstly described by Maslach as various degrees of emotional exhaustion, depersonalization, and a low sense of personal accomplishment. It is also stated that burnout occurs as energy turns into exhaustion, involvement turns into cynicism, and efficacy turns into ineffectiveness. Burnout is also considerably hazardous for several occupations such as public employees, company workers, and health care providers.

Healthcare personnel is the most affected profession which suffers from chronic stress at work. The risk of getting burnout was affected by a combination of personal and organizational factors in the medical environment. Studies found that younger age, female, negative marital status, long working hours, and low job satisfaction are associated with burnout syndrome among physicians. Furthermore, the imbalance between work rewards and work efforts become the most significant predictive factors of burnout in oncology professionals.

Being exposed to burnout allows physicians to lower patient satisfaction and poor patient safety outcome as a result of more medical errors. Physically, medical doctors are gradually developing symptoms related to burnout, such as fatigue, irritable, even increasing the risk of the road accident. Psychologically, burnout created risk factors for mental health problems such as mood disorder, depression, and disruptive behavior. These are all ultimately contribute to the impairment of productivity.

The occurrence of burnout among health professions particularly general physicians was prevalent in many studies. Despite many research highlighting burnout in medical doctors around the world, there is no data regarding prevalence and risk factors of burnout among hospital doctors in Indonesia. Therefore, this study was performed to determine burnout prevalence and its correlated factors among hospital physicians in a tertiary referral center.

Methods
This cross-sectional study was performed at X Hospital in Jakarta. The participant were general practitioners who had on-call duty either in the ward or in the emergency room. Data was collected by a total sampling method, including 33 general practitioners. Out of these, only 31 physicians completed the Maslach Burnout Inventory Questionnaire, and two physicians were excluded due to incomplete responses. Data were collected over one month in August 2019.

As previously mentioned, primary data were collected by questionnaires. The questionnaire consisted of two sections; the first section is socio-demographical features such as sex, working unit, marital status, monthly salary, number of years in practice, and working hours per week. The second section is the MBI questionnaire, which constitutes three items; emotional exhaustion, personal achievement, and depersonalization. Each item is represented by a set of questions, e.g emotional exhaustion comprises of nine questions, personal achievement with five questions, and depersonalization with five questions. Each item is rated on multiple choices based on the frequency of occurrence as follows: never, few times in a year, once in a month, few times in a month, once in a week, few times in a week, and every day. The score of each option varies from 0 to 7. An individual is considered to have a burnout if they have high scores on either the EE (total score of 27 or higher) or DP (total score of 10 or higher) subscales.

The MBI score is categorized into low, moderate, and high burnout. In terms of emotional exhaustion (EE), low EE is defined if score 17 or less, whereas scoring 18-29 and over 30 is considered as moderate and high EE, respectively. The depersonalization domain acknowledges score at 5 or less as low, score 6-11 as moderate, and score 12 and greater as high. In contrast, on the personal accomplishment aspect, a score 33 or less is regarded as high burnout, score 34-39 as moderate burnout, and score more than 40 as low burnout. The study was approved by the ethical committee of Dharmais Cancer Hospital (No.100/KEPK/VI/2019). All participants provided informed consent. The physician who refuses to fill the questionnaire was excluded from this study.

Data was plotted into an excel form and was coded for its answer. The final coding was then analyzed statistically with Statistic Package for Social Service version 22. All socio-demographic variables and three dimensions of burnout were measured with descriptive analyses and compared to each other using the chi-squared or Fisher’s exact test as appropriate. P-value <0.05 was considered statistically significant.

Results
Respondents in this study were mainly women (Table 1). The number of married staff outnumbered
the unmarried ones (20 vs. 11). The majority of the general practitioners worked in the clinical units such as a ward, polyclinic, etc. (n=23) and for more than one year (n=15). More than half of the participants (n=19) earned a lower salary than their colleagues (n=12). Additionally, about three-fourth of the doctors worked in the hospital for more than sixty hours per week (n=24).

| Variable                        | Frequency |
|--------------------------------|-----------|
| Gender                         |           |
| Male                           | 6         |
| Female                         | 25        |
| Age                            |           |
| < 30 years                     | 16        |
| ≥ 30 years                     | 15        |
| Marital Status                 |           |
| Unmarried                      | 11        |
| Married                        | 20        |
| Working Unit                   |           |
| Management                     | 8         |
| Clinical Unit                  | 23        |
| Working Experience             |           |
| <6 months                      | 10        |
| 1-12 onths                     | 6         |
| >12 months                     | 15        |
| Working Hour                   |           |
| 1-60 hours                     | 7         |
| >60 hours                      | 24        |
| Salary                         |           |
| 1-20 million                   | 12        |
| <10 million                    | 19        |
| History of Mental Illness      |           |
| No                             | 31        |

Burnout was generally observed in doctors who were female (n=10), married (n=9), aged under 30 years (n=10), working in clinical units (n=9), had less working experience (n=6), had longer working hours (n=11), and had lower income (n=7). Nevertheless, a higher proportion of females (n=15), married doctors (n=11), clinical unit workers (n=14) did not experience burnout syndrome. Similarly, thirteen doctors were not classified as burnout despite having a longer shift. The majority of doctors did not indicate any burnout syndrome (table.3), especially doctors who were more senior (n=13), more experienced (n=11), and higher salary (n=14). As shown in table 3., among all variables, age was the only associated factor in burnout syndrome (P-value= 0.005, OR 10.8 CI 1.79-65.55).

The Table 4. shows the association between the variable and burnout domain. The working unit and working hours are significantly associated with the level of emotional exhaustion (P-value= 0.041 and 0.040, respectively). In the context of depersonalization, age was the only variable that defines level of depersonalization (p-value 0.010).
Table 3. Socio-demographical Factors Associated to Burnout Syndrome of General Practitioners of X Hospital

| Variable          | Burnout Yes | Burnout No | P-value  | OR       | 95% CI     |
|-------------------|-------------|------------|----------|----------|------------|
| Gender            |             |            |          |          |            |
| Male              | 2           | 4          |          |          |            |
| Female            | 10          | 15         | 1.000*   | 1.33     | 0.20-8.70  |
| Age               |             |            |          |          |            |
| ≥ 30 years        | 2           | 13         |          |          |            |
| < 30 years        | 10          | 6          | 0.005    | 10.8     | 1.79-65.55 |
| Marital Status    |             |            |          |          |            |
| Unmarried         | 3           | 8          |          |          |            |
| Married           | 9           | 11         | 0.452*   | 2.18     | 0.44-10.73 |
| Working Unit      |             |            |          |          |            |
| Management        | 3           | 5          |          |          |            |
| Clinical Unit     | 9           | 14         | 1.000*   | 1.07     | 0.20-5.63  |
| Working Experiences |        |            |          |          |            |
| >12 months        | 4           | 11         |          |          |            |
| 6-12 months       | 2           | 4          | 0.104*   | 1.38     | 0.18-10.65 |
| <6 months         | 6           | 4          | 0.760*   | 4.13     | 0.75-22.71 |
| Working Hours     |             |            |          |          |            |
| 40-60 hours       | 1           | 6          |          |          |            |
| >60 hours         | 11          | 13         | 0.201*   | 5.08     | 0.53-48.86 |
| Salary            |             |            |          |          |            |
| 10-20 million     | 5           | 14         |          |          |            |
| <10 million       | 7           | 5          | 0.130*   | 3.92     | 0.84-18.21 |

Fisher Test

Discussions
General practitioners have high rates of burnout. This study revealed that burnout syndrome is frequent among general practitioners. A similar result can be found in many previous reports. In UK, general physicians were acclaimed to suffer the most from burnout.11,12 Two studies13,14 from Ireland and Colombia detected burnout in 6.6% medical doctors, with approximately half of them having a higher level of emotional exhaustion. Another report by Adam15 et al. stated that about one-third of general practitioners showed a high level of emotional exhaustion and depersonalization.

Some factors are attributable to burnout occurrence. Current study revealed that married doctors tend to be burnout. This result was in parallel to the study of Mahfouz16 et al. which highlighted the correlation between marital status and burnout in terms of low personal accomplishment. Work-home conflicts such as raising a child and non-medical profession spouse were known to induce burnout in a married doctor.8 Although, other studies17,18 were still inconsistent with this finding.

Hospital physicians with higher weekly working hours and lower salaries are more likely to suffer from burnout. It is also worth mentioning that longer working hours is associated with higher emotional exhaustion. This might be due to the longer exposure of high-pressure jobs which is cognitively intensive and declining sleep quality.16 According to International Labor Organization17, an optimal working hour per week is 48 hours. Meanwhile, the Act of the Republic of Indonesia Number 13 Year 2003 concerning manpower, stated that the working hours allowance for Indonesia citizens is 40 hours per week.18 However, another regulation issued by the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration classifies health service professions as continuing employees.19 This means that doctors inevitably obligate to extra work hours and extra paid. Unfortunately, there is no regulation on the amounts of required hours per week for such medical doctors.

Salary has been the major concern for burnout doctors in this study as the majority earn less than ten million rupiahs monthly. Obviously, this basic
practitioners were underpaid despite adequate or even excessive working hours. Low income and low remuneration or compensation were considered as influential factors for decreased job satisfaction of many doctors in conjunction with lack of appreciation.

We found that within the same level of professional experience, general practitioners with the least working experience suffered the most from burnout. The possible explanation can be inadequacy in experience. Newcomers mostly have a certain period to adapt to new environment. Aras et al. also argued that more extended professional expertise leads to higher self-confidence and good problem-solving skill. These two traits yield higher personal accomplishment and the ability to avoid burnout.

Nevertheless, the aforementioned factors were not shown any significant association with burnout (p>0.05). Meanwhile, being younger doctors become the only predicting factor for developing burnout and more specifically, depersonalization (P-value=0.010). The risk of getting burnout in this population is 10.8 times higher than senior doctors (P-value 0.005, 95% CI 1.79-65.55). It was highlighted in the previous studies that the rise of age goes hand in hand with burnout risk reduction. It is also obvious that increasing age is related to the number of experiences and better problem-solving management as well as a coping mechanism towards work-related stressors.

Sex differences pointed out some importance in burnout. In general, women scored higher and showed a significant correlation with emotional exhaustion. This finding was previously interpreted

| Variable                  | Emotional Exhaustion | P-value | Depersonalization | P-value |
|---------------------------|----------------------|---------|-------------------|---------|
|                           | Low      | Moderate | High     |          | Low      | Moderate | High     |          |
| Gender                    |          |          |          |         |          |          |          |         |
| Male                      | 5        | 0        | 1        | 0.079*  | 1        | 3        | 2        | 0.453   |
| Female                    | 17       | 8        | 0        |          | 10       | 6        | 9        |          |
| Age                       |          |          |          |         |          |          |          |         |
| <30 years                 | 9        | 6        | 1        | 0.160*  | 2        | 5        | 9        | 0.010   |
| ≥ 30 years                | 13       | 2        | 0        |          | 9        | 4        | 2        |          |
| Marital Status            |          |          |          |         |          |          |          |         |
| Unmarried                 | 9        | 2        | 0        | 0.789*  | 5        | 2        | 4        | 0.579   |
| Married                   | 13       | 6        | 1        |          | 6        | 7        | 7        |          |
| Working Unit              |          |          |          |         |          |          |          |         |
| Management                | 15       | 7        | 1        | 0.041*  | 7        | 5        | 11       | 0.745   |
| Clinical Unit             | 7        | 1        | 0        |          | 4        | 4        | 0        |          |
| Working Experiences       |          |          |          |         |          |          |          |         |
| >12 months                | 11       | 3        | 1        |          | 7        | 3        | 5        |          |
| 6-12 months               | 5        | 1        | 0        | 0.745*  | 3        | 1        | 2        | 0.296   |
| <6 months                 | 6        | 4        | 0        |          | 1        | 5        | 4        |          |
| Working Hours             |          |          |          |         |          |          |          |         |
| 40-60 hours               | 16       | 8        | 0        |          | 6        | 8        | 10       | 0.123   |
| >60 hours                 | 6        | 0        | 1        | 0.040*  | 5        | 1        | 1        |          |
| Salary                    |          |          |          |         |          |          |          |         |
| 10-20 million             | 7        | 5        | 0        | 0.206   | 2        | 5        | 5        | 0.265   |
| <10 million               | 15       | 3        | 1        |          | 9        | 4        | 0        |          |

Table 4. Bivariate Analysis of the Relationship between Socio-demographical Factors and Burnout Domain among General Practitioners of X Hospital

salary is under 12.5 million per month, which is the minimum recommendation of the Indonesian Physicians Association (IDI) in 2013. This finding was previously reported by Jibril et al. in a large scale study on Indonesia’s general practitioners. The study found that as many as 94.47% general
as the earlier process of development of burnout. Women tend to suffer from emotional exhaustion before any other burnout dimensions. According to an evaluation of the burnout domain causal relationship by Toon\textsuperscript{26} et al., which was supported by Houkes' study\textsuperscript{27} in general practitioners, emotional exhaustion is the first symptom that may develop as a result of chronic job-related stress. This, in turn, leads to depersonalization marked with the dysfunction of a personal coping mechanism. If depersonalization persists, it will automatically allow the person to the feeling of low achievement.

The clinical environment is an igniting setting for developing burnout. Physicians in the clinical unit face many problems in providing care to patients. In addition to this, there is a responsibility to accomplish additional tasks, such as managing a medical resume or completing an initial assessment. In our institution, general practitioners, especially those who have their duty in the ward, act as front liners in emergency interventions and administrative requirements. This made the administrative burden outdoes the clerical responsibilities towards patients. This was also reflected in the national survey in 2014, which examined less satisfaction and high personal exhaustion in physicians using electronic health records (EHRs) and computerized physician order entry (CPOE).\textsuperscript{25}

This study has several limitations. Firstly, as a cross-sectional study, this study only provides the association between socio-demographical factors with burnout syndrome. Secondly, this study did not assess the consequences of burnout as well as personality type as a risk factor for burnout. Consequently, further research with cohort design and specific variables are required to validate the result.

Conclusions
Burnout was generally observed in General Practitioners of X Hospital who were female, married, aged under 30 years, working in clinical units, had a less working experience, had longer working hours, and had lower income. Age was the only significant associating factor. With burnout

Acknowledgments
The authors wish to thank Tri Aprilliana Wulandari, SKM who provided statistical assistance.

References
1. Chunming WM, Harrison R, Macintyre R, Travaglia J, Balasoooriya C. Burnout in medical students: A systematic review of experiences in Chinese medical schools. BMC Med Educ. 2017;17(217):1–11.
2. Gazelle G, Liebschutz JM, Riess H. Physician burnout: Coaching a way out. J Gen Intern Med 2014;30(4):508–13.
3. Albieri D, Salvagioni J, Melanda FN, Mesas AE. Physical, psychological and occupational consequences of job burnout : A systematic review of prospective studies. PLoS One 2017;12(10):1–29.
4. Shenoi AN, Kalyanaraman M, Pillai A, Raghava PS, Day S. Burnout and psychological distress among pediatric critical care physicians in the United States. Crit Care Med 2018;46(1):116–22.
5. Amofo E, Hanbali N, Patel A, Singh P. What are the significant factors associated with burnout in doctors ?. Occup Med (Chic III) 2014;65(2):117–21.
6. Tang L, Pang Y, Chen Z, Leng J. Burnout among early career oncology professionals and the risk factors LiLi Tang. J Psychol Soc Behav Dimens Cancer 2018;27(10):2436–41.
7. Hall LH, Johnson J, Watt I, Taipa A, Connor DBO. Healthcare Staff Wellbeing , Burnout , and Patient Safety : A Systematic Review. PLoS One 2016;11(7):1–12.
8. West CP, Dyrbye LN, Shanafelt TD. Physician burnout : contributors , consequences and solutions. J Intern Med 2018;283:516–29.
9. Patel RS, Bachu R, Adikey A, Malik M, Shah M. Factors related to physician burnout and its consequences : A review. Behav Sci 2018;8(98):1–7
10. Schaufeli WB, Bakker AB, Hoogduin K, Schaap C, Kladler A. On the clinical validity of the Maslach Burnout Inventory and the burnout measure. Psychology & Health 2001;16(5):565-82.
11. Imo UO. Burnout and psychiatric morbidity among doctors in the UK : a systematic literature review of prevalence and associated factors. Br J Psychiatr 2017;41(4):197–204.
12. Halliday L, Walker A, Vig S, Hines J, Brecknell J. Grit and burnout in UK doctors : a cross-sectional study across specialties and stages of training. Postgr Med J 2016;93(1101):389-94.
13. O’Dea B, O’Connor P, Lydon S, Murphy AW. Prevalence of burnout among Irish general practitioners : a cross-sectional study. Ir J Med Sci 2016;186(2):447–53.
14. Maria A, Roldán A, Quijano M. Burnout syndrome, family and work related variables on general practitioners in Bogota. A Strategy of work quality. Rev Colomb Psiquiatr 2015;44(4):198–205.
15. Adam S, Mohos A, Kalabay L, Torzsa P. Potential correlates of burnout among general practitioners and residents in Hungary : the significant role of gender, age, dependant care and experience. BMC Fam Pract 2018;19(193):1–10.
16. Mahfouz EM, Seedhom AE, Aw Si To. Burnout syndrome among healthcare providers in different hospitals in Minia City. Egypt J Occup Med 2018;42(1):21–31.
17. Shaik AA, Shaikh AA, Kumar R, Tahir A. Assessment of burnout and its factors among doctors using the Abbreviated Maslach Burnout Inventory Cureus. 2019;11(2):1–9.
18. Al-shoriaian GMJ, Hussain N, Alajmi MF, Kamel MI, El-shazly MK. Burnout among family and general practitioners. Alexandria J Med 2011;47(4):359–64.
19. Pitanupong J, Chonnakarn J. A study on the comparison of burnout syndrome among medical doctors in the restive areas and non-restive areas of the South Thailand insurgency. J Heal Sci Medican Res 2011;43(1):92–6.
20. International Labour Organization. International labour standards on working time [web page on the Internet]. No date [cited 2020 Apr 30]. Available from: https://www.ilo.org/global/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/working-time/lang--en/index.htm
21. International Labour Organization. Law no. 13/2003 concerning manpower [web page on the Internet]. No date [cited 2020 Apr 30]. Available from: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/natlex4.detail?p_lang=en&p_isn=64764
22. International Labour Organization. Minister of manpower and transmigration decree no. Kep.233/MEN/2003 concerning types and nature of jobs that must be performed uninterrupted [web page on the Internet]. No date [cited 2020 Apr 30]. Available from: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/natlex4.detail?p_lang=en&p_isn=71277
23. Pengurus Besar Ikatan Dokter Indonesia. Acuan (tarif) jasa medik dokter. Jakarta: Ikatan Dokter Indonesia; 2013.
24. Jibril M. 83 Persen Dokter Umum Bergaji di Bawah Standar [web page on the Internet]. No date [cited 2019 Sep 4]. Available from: https://kumparan.com/makhyan-jibril/83-dokter-umum-bergaji-dibawah-standar-idi-milih-jadi-dokter-atau-tukang-parkir-154766898268925964
25. Ham I Van, Verhoeven AAH, Groenier KH, Groothoff JW, Haan J De, Ham I Van, et al. Job satisfaction among general practitioners: A systematic literature review. Eur J Gen Pract 2009;12(4):174–80.
26. Aras A, Yerli EB. Burnout syndrome, job satisfaction and associated factors among primary health care doctors in Erzurum, Turkey. J Surg Med 2018;2(2):105–10.
27. Soler JK, Yaman H, Esteva M, Dobbs F, Asenova RS, Katic M, et al. Burnout in European family doctors: The EGPRN study. Fam Pract 2008;25(4):245–65.
28. Shanafelt TD, Dyrbye LN, Sinsky C, Hasan O, Satele D, Sloan J, et al. Relationship between clerical burden and characteristics of the electronic environment with physician burnout and professional satisfaction. Mayo Clin Proc 2016;91(7):836–48.
29. Toon TP, Pascale LB, Schaufeli WB, Schreurs PJ. Are there causal relationships between the dimensions of the Maslach Burnout Inventory? A review and two longitudinal tests. Work & Stress 2007;19(3):238-55.
30. Houkes I, Winants Y, Twellaar M, Verdonk P. Development of burnout over time and the causal order of the three dimensions of burnout among male and female GPs. A three-wave panel study. BMC Public Health. 2011;11(240):1-13.