EXPLAINING THE TOURISM RELATIONSHIP MANAGEMENT (TRM) IN TOURISM ENTERPRISES (CASE STUDY: ISFAHAN)

Teymour Marjani
1 Assistant Professor, Faculty of Management, University of Science and Culture
Tehran, Iran
tmarjani@gmail.com

Siavash Imeni Gheshlagh
2 Assistant Professor, Faculty of Tourism Sciences, University of Science and Culture
Tehran, Iran
s_imeni@yahoo.de

Alireza Sarfi
3 PhD student of Tourism Management, Science and Culture University
Tehran, Iran
alirezasarfi@gmail.com

Abstract

Manuscript type: Research paper

Research Aims: The aim of the present study is to explain the relationship management with tourism in Isfahan tourism enterprises using structural equation modeling methodology.

Design/methodology/approach: Based on distributing 312 questionnaires, the sample size was 300 academic experts, specialists and experts working in Isfahan tourism enterprises and professors and tourists in the fields of tourism management, IT and marketing selected by combining non-probability purposive (judgmental) sampling and snowball sampling methods.

Research Findings: The results showed a correlation between “applications of TRM system” and “users’ satisfaction with TRM” based on path analysis concerning confirmatory factor loadings analysis as 0.566 and a correlation between “applications of TRM system” and “IMHTs” based on path analysis concerning confirmatory factor loadings analysis as 0.521. Moreover, there was a correlation between “Consumers’ satisfaction with TRM” and “IMHTs” based on path analysis concerning confirmatory factor loadings analysis as 0.936.

Theoretical Contribution/Originality: The conceptual model of the study involves components including “the applications of TRM system,” “satisfaction of the tourists with TRM,” and “information management of health tourists (IMHTs)”.

Practitioner/Policy Implication: 1) the analysis of information of health professionals, 2) converting information of health professionals, 3) retrieving information from health professionals, strategic attention in organizational decisions in tourism enterprises of Isfahan because the general manager of cultural heritage, tourism and handicrafts of Isfahan from holding the first quarterly meeting to review the tourism situation in Isfahan in 2021 entitled “path recognition” with the presence of young and elite tourism activists and announced to create futuristic thinking and the need for elite thinking in the future of Isfahan.

Research limitation/Implications: The tourism industry of Isfahan is currently so important in the comprehensive development of countries that economists call it invisible exports, and it is one of the largest industries in the world today.

Keywords: TRM, tourism enterprises, IMHTs, Isfahan, SEM.
INTRODUCTION

According to statistics published by World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), Iran's tourism in 2016 grew by 12%, whereas global tourism growth was 4% (WTTC, 2017). Perhaps, private sector investment in tourism has grown by 20 to 30% during 2016. As tourism and attracting tourists has a drastic effect on the economic development of the country (Kia and Sadeghi, 2017), TRM (which means Tourism Relationship Marketing) is critical for the continuation of the tourism industry and one can attract foreign tourists to the desired destinations by TRM methods (Baksi, 2014) and (Lin, et al. 2019).

It is clear that proper utilization of the capacities of the tourism industry is needs (Chang, et al. 2020) careful study and planning where the marketing information system seems to be a good introduction to establishing a “TRM system” (Pike et al.) al. 2010) and (Kia and Sadeghi, 2017).

The main problem of the study is the lack of a comprehensive system to communicate continuously with investors to determine their requirements and desires to enhance the quality of services to the tourists to increase satisfaction and subsequently tourists' loyalty.

By using such a regular and organized system, attracting tourists as important customers of a business as well as retaining customers will happen more effectively, resulting in significant cost savings and increased profitability.

Many of the concepts that are introduced in tourist relationship management are derived from the concepts of customer relationship management. With the difference that in customer relationship management, emphasis is placed on sales and profitability, and in tourist relationship management, in addition to sales and profitability, there is much more emphasis on service and provision of services. In fact, tourist relationship management deals with a group of management methods and technological solutions for customer relationship management based on their generality (Liao et al, 2012). Managing a relationship with a tourist does not mean getting more information from tourists, but about providing timely, consistent and responsive access to tourism information and services through the channels that tourists prefer (Liao et al, 2012).

In fact, understanding the needs and wants of the customer and providing services tailored to these needs is an issue that needs to be addressed. In this regard, it is necessary to create channels for communication and two-way interaction between customers and the firm. In fact, tourist relationship management is a combination of managerial and technological issues to meet the needs of tourists together (Maggon et al, 2015). In tourist relationship management, the main goal is to identify the needs and wants of tourists and try to improve service delivery and increase their level of satisfaction. Instead of traditional and hierarchical communication, IT tools help companies to establish dynamic and satisfying communication with effective interaction with tourists, not only as a customer but also as elements of business decision-making.

In the present study, the explanation of TRM model is presented using the combined methodology of grounded theory in the research field related to the subject. Indeed, the problems of the study can be stated by the complexity and ambiguity of decision makers and managers of Isfahan tourism enterprises because of the combination of
various methods of modeling multivariate relationships “TRM system applications” and “tourist satisfaction with TRM” and “IMHTs” (IMHT stands for "Information management of health students" which it is one of the components and variables of research) in tourism enterprises of Isfahan in increasing confidence in decision-making, as well as the need for multiple expertise through the simultaneous use of information from experts in different areas to solve the problems of Isfahan tourism enterprises. The basic question of this research is that how is the appropriate model for managing relationships with tourists in the tourism businesses? and what are the specifications and dimensions of this model?

LITERATURE REVIEW

Theoretical foundations

"Travel" is a as old as history. Humans have constantly been moving and traveling since their birth for different reasons (Sharifi et al., 2017). According to the World Tourism Organization, tourism is a social, cultural, and commercial phenomenon that requires people to move to places other than their place of residence and work.

However, it has to be noted that such transfers and travels differ drastically from what is now called tourism (De-Gracia, et al., 2020) and (Chang, et al., 2020). The motivation, means, composition, time, place and the effects of travel have changed over time. Nowadays, tourism is considered as one of the important tools in presenting national and cultural identity, education, income, growth and economic dynamism (Karkehabadi et al., 2016). One of the factors for success in any business and industry is to know the customers and communicate properly with them. The tourism industry is no exception to this (Khelghatdoust and Safari, 2016). Tourism refers to a set of activities that occur during a tourist’s trip. This process includes any activity such as trip planning, trip to destination, accommodation, return and even recalling memories. It also includes activities that the tourist does as part of the trip, such as buying various goods and interacting between the host and the guest.

In general, any activity and interaction that occurs during a tourist trip can be considered tourism. The tourism industry in Iran needs a national planning and model in the customer relationship management to integrate the tourism system in the country as a profitable industry and one of the most important non-oil exports (Wu & Lu, 2012), (Karkehabadi et al., 2016), and (Khelghatdoust and Safari, 2016).

Customer relationship management is an organizational approach to understanding and influencing customer behavior through meaningful communication to improve the process of acquiring, retaining, loyalty and profitability of customers. Customer relationship management is also considered as "strategic use of information, processes, technology and people to manage customer relationship throughout the life cycle of the customer" (Bull, 2013). Customer relationship management is also an integrated customer strategy in a company to more effectively manage customers by providing specific goods and services and maximizing the value of the customer life cycle (Taherikia and Rezaei, 2015). Today, due to the intensification of competition in new dimensions, more than ever, the ability to understand and manage to establish and maintain long-term relationships with the customer to achieve business goals is considered. Today, tourism is one of the most important and dynamic industries in the world. In many countries, this industry is considered as the main source of income,
employment, private sector growth and infrastructure development. Tourist relationship management is a business strategy that attracts, retains and promotes customers, and companies will be able to achieve their competitive advantage, which is tourists, by implementing tourist relationship management. Tourist relationship management is involved in how companies become "tourist-oriented" in providing effective services to tourists through the use of information technology tools. Tourist relationship management lies in different phases of different levels of technology (Vogt, 2010).

Customer relationship management is based on the principle that providing diverse services does not simply mean achieving customer satisfaction; Rather, the main point is to identify customer needs and respond to them based on customer relationship management. In fact, understanding the needs and wants of the customer and providing services tailored to these needs is an issue that needs to be addressed. In this regard, it is necessary to create channels for communication and two-way interaction between customers and the firm. In fact, tourist relationship management is a combination of managerial and technological issues to meet the needs of tourists together (Maggon et al, 2015).

Customer relationship management (CRM) is one of those new technologies with a vital role in retaining customers and turning them into loyal customers (Bayih & Singh, 2020) and (Khelghatdoust and Safari, 2016). Nowadays, given the intensification of competition in new aspects, the ability to understand and manage establishing and maintaining long-term relationships with the customer is focused on to achieve business goals more than ever before (De-Gracia, et al. 2020) and (Bayih & Singh, 2020) and (Alipour, 2015).

Today, tourism is considered as one of the most important and dynamic industries in the world. In many countries, this industry is considered as the main source of income, employment, private sector growth and development of infrastructure. Tourism is the third largest industry in the world after the oil and automobile industries. The tourism industry has become one of the leading industries in many developed countries and even Middle Eastern countries due to its numerous advantages and opportunities for the economic growth and development of societies (Amiri, 2019). Thus, countries such as the United States, which is one of the largest producers of oil in the world, has the highest rate of attracting tourists and considers this sector as one of its important sources of income.

In the Middle East and North Africa, countries such as Qatar, the United Arab Emirates and Bahrain, which, like Iran, have oil and gas resources, earn a large share of their revenues through this industry, and rank first three in the world in this ranking. Have occupied the area (Lin et al, 2019). The tourism industry has grown virtually unstoppably in recent decades, reflecting the strength and durability of the industry despite the occurrence of cross-sectional shocks. The number of global tourism travelers increased from 25 million worldwide in 1950 to 278 million in 1980, then to 674 million in 2000, and to 1 billion 235 million in 2016. Global revenues of the tourism industry through international destinations rose from 2 billion dollars in 1950 to 104 billion dollars in 1980, then 495 billion dollars in 2000 and 1,220 billion dollars in 2016 (Teymouri, 2019). According to international documents, Iran ranks fourth in the Middle East with 2.5
million tourists in 2015. Many studies have examined the quality of tourism services and its effect on customer satisfaction. This is a subject closely related to the culture and sociology of Iranian civilization. All the efforts of tourism enterprises are to achieve customer satisfaction (Alipour, 2015) and (Talebzadeh and Acceptance, 2013) to be able to guarantee their business environment (Firoozi, 2019). Studying climate and tourism is of the basic studies for the development of tourism industry (Amiri, 2019). Creative tourism is the last part of the evolutionary chain of tourism that after recreational and cultural tourism, today one can see the pervasive demand for creative tourism products. The world today is transitioning from the industrial age to the creative age (Wu & Lu, 2012), (Karkehabadi et al., 2016) and (Khelghatdoust and Safari, 2016).

Fundamental changes on the demand and supply sides of tourism, as well as creating models of experience economy and knowledge-based economy in the macro environment of economic development, has moved tourism towards creativity (Teimouri, 2019). “Tourism industry” has become one of the leading industries in many developed countries and even Middle Eastern countries due to its numerous advantages and opportunities for economic growth and development of societies (Firouzi, 2019) and (Amiri, 2019). Hence, countries like the United States, the largest producer of oil in the world, have the highest rate of attracting tourists and consider this sector as one of their significant sources of income. In the Middle East and North Africa, countries like Qatar, the United Arab Emirates, and Bahrain, which, like Iran, have oil and gas resources, make up a large portion of their revenues through the industry, ranking first three in the world in terms of attractiveness in this area. UNWTO mentioned and declared the tourism industry as the key to the development, prosperity and welfare of countries (Khelghatdoust and Safari, 2016), (Talebzadeh and Paziresh, 2013), (Albayrak & Caber, 2018) and (Baksi, 2014). The number of global tourism destinations constantly grows, tuning into the main driver of socio-economic development through the creation of new jobs and businesses, export profits and the expansion of infrastructure with the increase in investment in this industry (Amiri, 2019), (Pike, et al., 2010), (Alipour, 2015), (Teimouri, 2019) and (Lin, et al., 2019). The tourism industry has grown virtually unremittingly in recent decades, which shows the strength and durability of the industry despite the occurrence of cross-sectional shocks. The number of global tourism travelers increased from 25 million worldwide in 1950 to 278 million in 1980, then to 674 million in 2000, and 1.235 billion in 2016. Global revenues of the tourism industry through international destinations increased from $ 2 billion in 1950 to $ 104 billion in 1980, then $ 495 billion in 2000 and $ 1,220 billion in 2016 (Amiri, 2019) and (Alipour, 2015) and (Teimouri, 2019).

The table below is a summary of the existing studies in the theoretical foundations in the form of internal studies up to 2020 and the foreign studies up to 2020.
Table 1. Summary of research background

| Authors            | Title                                                                 | Summary of the study background                                                                 |
|--------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Lin et al. 2019    | Examining the effect of tourist-tourist relationships on tourism experience with an emphasis on the mediating role of solidarity and intimacy | The results show that self-disclosure indirectly betters tourist-tourist relationships by enhancing perceived coherence and perceived intimacy. These results contribute to the development of research on tourism experience from the perspective of tourist-tourist interactions and the literature of social interactions by examining the unique interaction mechanism among the tourists. |
| Baksi et al. 2014  | Examining the aspects of TRM on the quality of tourism services, satisfaction and loyalty of tourism | The TRM framework was presented with inspiration from the CRM model and the addition of dimensions compatible with the dynamics of tourism. A study conducted in India confirmed the modulating effects of TRM dimension performance on the quality of tourism services. |
| Pie et al., 2010   | Examining the role of visitor relationship management (VRM) for destination marketing organizations | The purpose of the paper is to report CRM exploratory vendor relationship management (VRM) by DMOs. Immediate VRM opportunities and challenges were discussed based on interviews with executives from 11 Regional Tourism Organizations (RTOs) in Queensland, Australia. While each RTO recognized the potential of VRM. |
| Kia and Sadeghi, 2017 | Examining the effect of marketing information system on CRM | The results confirm all hypotheses except the effect of distribution on TRM and the effect of marketing information system (product and price) on TRM. |

This section examines the theoretical foundations of the research “explaining TRM” from various perspectives. Indeed, the conceptual framework is the framework that shows the reality of explaining TRM in the tourism enterprises and shows certain aspects of the real world in the field of IT that are relevant to the issues under consideration and reveals the important relationships between different aspects of the variables affecting the explanation of TRM in tourism enterprises. The table below is the theoretical framework of the study, inspired by the studies of (De-Gracia, et al. 2020), (Bayih & Singh. 2020), (Chang, et al. 2020), (Baksi, 2014) and (Lin, et al. 2019) and (Pike, et al. 2010) and (Teimouri, 2019) and (Kia and Sadeghi, 2017) and (Matteucci & Gnoth, 2017).

Table 2. Theoretical framework for explaining TRM

| Components of “Tourist Satisfaction with TRM” | Components of “Tourist Information Management” |
|----------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|
| Possibility of introducing the mentioned system to others by tourists | Analyzing tourist information |
| Tendency of tourists to re-interact with the system | Conversion of tourist information |
| Intrinsic satisfaction of the Tendency of tourists with the electronic interaction with the system | Information tourist retrieval |

| “Applications of the TRM system” | |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|
| High quality TRM system information processing | TRM system responsiveness |
| Economic profitability of TRM system | Optimal use of TRM system information resources |

After reviewing the theoretical foundations and reviewing the literature, given the research gap in the field of research and explaining the model to establish continuous communication with tourists to identify their
needs and tastes to increase service quality and thus increase satisfaction and loyalty. Moreover, to advise the manager to decide on the explanation of the relationship management with the investor, focusing on “TRM system applications” (high quality TRM system information processing, TRM system responsiveness, TRM system economic profitability, TRM system, optimal use of information resources) components of “consumer satisfaction with TRM” (Possibility of introducing the mentioned system to others by incumbents, inclination of tourists to re-interact with the system, internal satisfaction of incumbents from electronic interaction with the system), components of “tourist information management” (tourist information analysis, tourist information conversion, tourist information retrieval), the importance of the present research is foregrounded.

**METHODOLOGY**

**Research Design and Method**

Grounded Theory is a qualitative research method used to identify the underlying categories of the phenomenon under study. The main tool for collecting data in this way using a variety of interviews. By analyzing and coding the text of the interviews, a paradigm model is presented. In grounded theory method, a theory is developed using a set of data. So that this theory explains a process, action or interaction on a large scale. The scientific philosophy of the grounded theory method is based on the theory of interactionism or symbolic interactionism.

In other words, grounded theory is rooted in the interpretive paradigm of symbolic interactionism. In symbolic interactionism, it is believed that people behave and interact with each other based on how they interpret and interpret certain symbols such as cover, verbal and non-verbal expressions. Foundation data theory is one of the research strategies through which theorizing is formed based on the main concepts derived from the existing data in the field. This kind of theorizing is based on the metaphor of collage and, like the trash can model, is a decision that is created by the random intersection of components and, of course, with the art of a new, innovative and attractive combination theorist. In other words, grounded theorist travels in a land of numerous and varied scattered data and combines them with art in order to achieve new theories. Creativity is one of the most important components of grounded theory. The procedures of this method force the researcher to break the assumptions and create a new order from the old elements (Matteucci, Xavier & Gnoth. 2017). Grounded theory is based on three types of open, axial and selective coding, each of which is described below:

- **Open coding**: Coding is the process of analyzing data. Open coding is part of the data analysis process that deals with shredding, comparing, naming, conceptualizing, and categorizing data. During open coding, the data is broken down into separate sections and examined for similarities and differences. Open coding includes the following procedures.

- **Axial coding**: Axial coding is the second stage of analysis in contextual theorizing. The purpose of this step is to establish a relationship between the categories generated in the open coding step. This coding is called pivotal because the coding takes place around the axis of a category. At this stage, the researcher selects one of the categories as the central category, explores it as the central phenomenon in the process center, and
determines the relationship of other categories with it.

- Selective coding: The phenomenon in question, the central idea and thought, is the incident, event, or event to which the flow of actions and reactions is directed to manage, control, or respond to it. The central phenomenon is accompanied by the main question, what do the data indicate? The central category is the idea (idea, conception) or phenomenon that is the basis and axis of the process. This category is the title (concept name or label) that is intended for the framework or design created. The category that is selected as the central category should be abstract enough to be able to relate to the other main categories (Strauss and Corbin, 1998).

**Population and Sample**

Indeed, the population can be divided into two general groups: the first group including knowledgeable professors (academic experts), and the second group including specialists and experts working in Isfahan tourism enterprises (industry experts). The sampling method was a combination of non-probabilistic purposeive (judgmental) sampling and snowball sampling methods. Given the nature of the sampling method, the sample size was the experts available and willing to cooperate.

**Collecting Data Method**

Given the use of papers and documents related to explaining TRM from various sources, Internet browsing, research studies, books, papers in domestic and foreign journals, study of statistics and published documents used by the university in library studies phase. For field studies, the researcher-made tools to collect data, interviews with information technology experts, staff and administrators of the university and information technology organizations and professors of the university are considered. The need for observation and interview were the prerequisite for evaluating this study. A questionnaire was prepared based on theoretical sources, papers and texts related to the subject and will be approved by experts to validate the study. The reliability of the questionnaire was tested using Cronbach's alpha coefficient at the beginning and end of the distribution. In other s, the two main criteria for testing the accuracy and goodness of the indices are validity and reliability (Danaeifard et al., 2004).

**Data Analysis Method**

One of the most important reasons for researchers to use structural equation modeling (AMOS) is the ability to test theories in the form of equations between variables. Another reason for considering measurement error by this method is that it allows the researcher to report his / her information analysis taking into account measurement error (Qadaksazzadeh and Momeni, 2015).

Conventional models in structural equation modeling actually consist of two parts. A measurement model that examines how hidden variables are explained by the obvious explicit variables (questions) and a structural model that shows how the hidden variables are related to each other. There are many advantages to using structural equation modeling, five of the most important of which are (Lee & Kim. 2018; Yun & Kang, 2018; Mohammad & Yasin. 2015): a) Multiple relation estimation; b) Ability to measure variables Hidden (unobserved concepts); and c) Measurement error calculation d) Ability to investigate the
In the present study, as we do not try to determine other dimensions in the model, confirmatory factor analysis was used. As is seen, AMOS software provides a set of indices for measuring the goodness of fit of the developed model. All the mentioned indices are examined (Chiao & Huang, 2018), (Lee & Kim, 2018), (Yun & Kang, 2018), (Sharipour, 2001) and (Qadksazzadeh and Momeni, 2015).

DATA ANALYSIS

Descriptive Characteristics

The population was university professors, specialists and experts working in Isfahan’s tourism enterprises and professors and students in the fields of tourism management, IT and marketing. Ultimately, after distributing 312 tools during the summer of 2020, the sample size of this study was 300 specialists and experts working in Isfahan tourism enterprises and professors and students in the fields of tourism management, IT and marketing available and willing to cooperate selected using a combination of non-probability purposive (judgmental) and snowball sampling methods. The following table briefly describes the demographic of the sample (specialists and experts working in Isfahan tourism enterprises and professors and tourists in the fields of tourism management, IT and marketing).

Research Findings

Scientific documents and study standards based on qualitative methodology (GT coding inspired by the studies of (Baksi, 2014) and (Lin, et al., 2019) and (Pike et al. 2010) and (Teimouri, 2019) and (Kia and Sadeghi, 2017) and (Matteucci & Gnoth, 2017) as well as the opinions of supervisors and consultants and some specialists and experts working in tourism enterprises in Isfahan were used to examine how much the

| Specification type | Specifications | Frequency | Relative frequency (percentage) |
|--------------------|----------------|-----------|--------------------------------|
| Gender             | Male           | 235       | 78                             |
|                    | Female         | 65        | 22                             |
| Academic degree    | Bachelor’s degree | 180     | 60                             |
|                    | Master’s degree | 100      | 33                             |
|                    | PhD            | 20        | 7                              |
| Work history       | 3 to 5 years   | 200       | 67                             |
|                    | 6 to 10 years  | 80        | 26                             |
|                    | More than 10 years | 20    | 7                              |
measurement tool measures the desired feature and the tool for determining the variables of the initial decision model reached its final form after applying their views.

Factor analysis method is used to understand the underlying variables of a phenomenon or to summarize a dataset. As the correlation coefficient sign is the regression line slope, based on the factor loadings of the fitted model, the correlation based on path analysis between the research variables shows a favorable situation, because the factor loadings between “economic profitability of TRM system (A2)” “Applications of TRM system” equal to 77% (very significant relationship), between “high quality information processing of TRM system (A4)” and “applications of TRM system” equal to 92% (quite significant relationship), between “optimal use of information resources of TRM system” (A3) “and” TRM system applications “equal to 54% (significant relationship), between” TRM system responsiveness (A1) “and” TRM system applications “equal to 44% (relatively significant relationship).

On the other hand, “tourists” internal satisfaction with electronic interaction with the system (B1)” has the greatest effect on tourists’ satisfaction with TRM as their correlation coefficient is calculated as 86% and “health tourists’ information analysis (C1)” has more effect as their correlation coefficient is 90%. According to the model plotted in AMOS, the following table and diagram show the confirmatory factor analysis of the variables to present TRM explanation model (important indices of the main variables).

| Observed variables | Latent variables | Latent variables symbol in the model | Confirmatory factor analysis loadings |
|--------------------|-----------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Inner satisfaction of the tourists with electronic interaction with system (B1) | < --- > | Tourist Satisfaction with TRM | B 0.857 |
| Economic profitability of TRM system (A2) | < --- > | Applications of TRM system | A 0.767 |
| TRM System Response (A1) | < --- > | Applications of TRM system | A 0.436 |
| High quality TRM (A4) system information processing | < --- > | Applications of TRM system | A 0.916 |
| Information analysis of health professionals (C1) | < --- > | IMHTs | C 0.899 |
| Information retrieval of health professionals (C2) | < --- > | IMHTs | C 0.125 |
| The possibility of introducing the mentioned system to others by tourists (B3) | < --- > | Tourist Satisfaction with TRM | B 0.358 |
| Tendency to re-interact with the system (B2) | < --- > | Tourist Satisfaction with TRM | B 0.761 |
| Optimal use of TRM (A3) system information resources | < --- > | Applications of TRM system | A 0.537 |
| Information transformation of health professionals (C3) | < --- > | IMHTs | C 0.691 |
A glance at the confirmatory factor analysis table of the variables extracted from AMOS software reveals the high values of the factor loadings of the variables. The following is a correlation table between the indices of the variables in the path analysis of the model of explaining TRM in Isfahan tourism enterprises.

Table 5. Correlation between the variables of existing variables in model path analysis

| Correlation between the variables of existing variables in model path analysis | The applications of TRM system | Tourist Satisfaction with TRM | IMHTs |
|---|---|---|---|
| The applications of TRM system | 1 | - | - |
| Tourist Satisfaction with TRM | 0.566 | 1 | - |
| IMHTs | 0.521 | 0.936 | 1 |

Because of the strong correlation between the components of the research model, professors and experts working in Isfahan's tourism enterprises and the professors and students in the fields of tourism management, IT and marketing have to act strategically based on the functional and practical status of the research model.

Here, path analysis-based correlation between “the applications of the TRM system” and “tourist satisfaction with TRM” based on confirmatory factor analysis loadings is 0.566 and the correlation-based correlation between “applications of the TRM system” and “IMHTs” based on the confirmatory factor analysis loadings is 0.521. Moreover, the correlation based on path analysis between “tourist satisfaction with TRM” and “IMHTs” is calculated based on confirmatory factor analysis loadings equal to 0.936. Thus, a positive and significant relationship between research variables to explain the relationship management with tourism based on the opinions of experts working in Isfahan tourism enterprises and professors and tourists in the fields of tourism management, IT and marketing. On the other hand, one of the main goals in using SEM in the model is to know the degree of consistency between experimental data with the initial and theoretical model. Some indices are used, which are called goodness-of-fit indices to understand the degree of consistency between the experimental data and the initial model. The table below shows the fit indices of modeling the structural equations of the research model.

Table 6. Absolute fitness indices of the research model

| Model | RMR | GFI |
|---|---|---|
| Absolute fit indices | 0.000 | 1.000 |

As is seen, RMR, the difference between the elements of the matrix observed in the sample group and the elements of the estimated or predicted matrices assuming the model is correct, the closer the RMR is to zero for the test model, the better the model fits. The value of this index to explain TRM
is equal to zero and the model is appropriate. On the other hand, GFI for the research model is equal to one.

Table 7. Comparative fitness indices of the research model

| Model            | Normalized fit index (NFI) | Incremental Fit Index (IFI) | Comparative Fit Index (CFI) |
|------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Comparative fit  | 1.000                      | 1.000                       | 1.000                       |
| of research model|                            |                             |                             |

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Conclusion

The tourism industry is now so important in the comprehensive development of countries that economists call it invisible exports. This industry is one of the largest industries in the world today. One of the types of this industry is rural tourism, which exists especially in Isfahan province. This industry is more than a century old and is very important for the economy of this region. The main pillar of rural tourism activities is related to the enjoyment of nature, architectural culture and rural products that are found in abundance in this area.

The findings of this study are important in various dimensions and showing these dimensions is very key for managers and policy makers. In the economic dimension, with proper planning and in accordance with the conditions, the rural tourism strategy can be used for the economic stability of the village. In other s, an important step to reduce poverty is taken with the development of small employment centers in Isfahan province (such as eco-tourism resorts and handicrafts and traditional home arts).

In the social dimension, it causes entrepreneurship, prevention of migration and even reverse migration, as well as more connections of villagers with other communities and promotion of village culture, customs and identity of the place in Isfahan province and finally creates sustainable development of rural tourism in Isfahan province. Also, in the environmental dimension, it helps to preserve natural resources and the environment.

One of the significant results of the study is that the most important and key proposal of the present study for tourism enterprises in Isfahan is the functional status of the variable “the applications of the TRM system (A)” including items like TRM system response, economic profitability of TRM system, optimal use of TRM system information resources, and high quality TRM system information processing. “Tourists' satisfaction with TRM (B)” including items like tourists' internal satisfaction with the electronic interaction with the system, the tendency of activists to re-interact with the system, possibility of introducing the mentioned system to others by activists, and the variable “IMHTs (C)” including items like 1) the analysis of information of health professionals, 2) converting information of health professionals, 3) retrieving information from health professionals, strategic attention in organizational decisions in tourism enterprises of Isfahan because the general manager of cultural heritage, tourism and handicrafts of Isfahan from holding the first quarterly meeting to review the tourism situation in Isfahan in 2021 entitled “path recognition” with the presence of young and elite tourism activists and announced to
create futuristic thinking and the need for elite thinking in the future of Isfahan.

“Currently, over 370 tourism projects with a capital of 11,000 billion riyals are being implemented in the province, so we hope that in the next century we will be able to overcome the biggest tourism problem in Isfahan, which is the lack of beds in accommodation units.” “At the beginning of 2013, Isfahan had only 10,000 beds in the area of tourist accommodation, and this is while with everyone's efforts, this capacity has increased to 35,000 beds by the end of 2019.

The tourism industry of Isfahan is currently so important in the comprehensive development of countries that economists call it invisible exports, and it is one of the largest industries in the world today. One of the types of this industry is rural tourism in Isfahan, which is more than a century old. The main pillar of rural tourism activities is related to enjoying nature, architectural culture and rural products. Ultimately, some strategies are presented for the success of tourism centers in Isfahan:

### Table 8. The strategies for the success of tourism centers in Isfahan

| Change | From (status quo) | To (optimal condition) |
|--------|-------------------|------------------------|
| **Data-based solution** | Generating data in business is costly | Data is constantly generated everywhere |
| | The challenge for data is to store and manage it | The challenge with data is to turn it into valuable information |
| | Businesses use only structured data | Unstructured data is increasingly usable and valuable |
| | The data is managed in operational repositories | The value of data lies in its connection between repositories |
| | Data is a tool for optimizing processes | Data is an intangible key asset for value creation |
| **Innovation-based solution** | Decision making is based on direct perception (intuition) and seniority | Decisions are made based on testing and validation |
| | Testing ideas is costly, slow, and difficult | Testing ideas is cheap, fast and easy |
| | Tests are rarely performed by specialists | Tests are done continuously by everyone |
| | The challenge of innovation is to find the right solution | The challenge of innovation is to solve the problem properly |
| | Damage and negligence are avoided at all costs | Failures are learned from scratch and cheaply |
| | The focus is on the “final” product | The focus is on minimum test samples that are viable and repeatable after the first release |
| **Value-based solution** | Suggested value has been defined by industry | Suggested value has been defined by changing customer needs |
| | Execute your current value proposition | Discover the next opportunity for value proposition to the customer |
| | Optimize your business model as much as possible | Grow and thrive before you have to be ahead of the curve |
| | Judgment is changed by how it affects the current business. | Judgment is changed by how it can create the next business. |
| | Market success allows for satisfaction with it. | |
| **Customer-based solution** | Customers as a mass market | Customers as a dynamic network |
| | One-way communication with the customer | Communications are mutual |
| | The business is the key influence | Customers are key influencers |
| | Marketing to persuade to buy | Marketing to create the incentive for buying, loyalty, and advocacy |
| | One-way value flows | Reciprocal value flows (mutual) |
| | Economies of scale (business) | |
| **Competition-based solution** | Competition in industries is defined and specified | Competition is fluid and changeable across the industries |
| | Clear distinction between partners and competitors | Uncertain distinction between partners and competitors |
| | Competition is a zero or one game | Competitors cooperate in important and key areas |
| | Important assets are held within the business | Significant assets are located in external networks |
| | Products with unique features and benefits | Platforms with partners who exchange value |
| | The number of dominant competitors in each category is small. | The winner wins everything because of the effects of the network. |
As mentioned in previous sections, the most significant recommendations and suggestions for future studies can be expressed as follows: Using other artificial intelligence (AI) techniques, especially artificial neural network (ANN) and the most important and relevant algorithms in the field of artificial intelligence to increase the content richness of the system and to enhance its inference process in explaining TRM. Using fuzzy multi-criteria decision-making techniques (MCDM) to rank the communication networks between explaining TRM. Constructing a fuzzy ontology for comprehensive modeling in explaining TRM.

**Implications to Management**

- **Data-based solution:**
  It is suggested that data related to tourists be generated in all parts and everywhere and then the data become valuable information; The more data, the easier and better the decision.

- **Innovation-based solution:**
  The key point is to collect new ideas and test ideas Since convenient, fast and cheap, decisions taken in respect of them based on test ideas.

- **Value-based solution:**
  It is recommended that with the correct understanding of changing customer needs, new values be created in the firm, and by creating new values if needed, move towards creating a new business.

- **Customer-based solution:**
  It is necessary to create a dynamic network with customers to establish two-way communication; Because customers are the most influential people and the most key in the company.

- **Competitive solution:**
  There is competition in fluid and changeable industries; Therefore, it is possible to cooperate with competitors in important and key areas.

**Academic Implication**

- The purpose of designing a model for managing the relationship with tourists in tourism companies is to increase the level of satisfaction of tourists, establish deeper relationships with them and ultimately provide better services to tourists. Therefore, examining the relationship between TRM success factors and tourist satisfaction and participation can be a good research to help manage tourist relationship management.

- The use of action research (AR) method is recommended to determine, evaluate and modify CSFs and measurement criteria in tourism enterprises.

- Another important suggestion is to use the AHP method to prioritize and weight the factors and criteria.

- One of the key recommendations of this study is to use the Process Quality Management (PQM) method to measure and evaluate the proposed CSFs and adapt them to the necessary processes to establish tourist relationship management.

- It is necessary to modify and revise the CSF model to improve and empower tourism enterprises in the post-implementation phase.

- It will be important and practical to study and research how to integrate and integrate the existing information systems in tourism companies with a new TRM system called systems integration.

- It is recommended to study the role of data mining (text data and content analysis) in the process of establishing a tourist relationship management strategy in a separate study and the findings should be made available to the public.
References

Amiri, A. (2009). Tourism and Climate Design Calendar in Northern Iran Using First, Second and Third Generation Bioclimatic Indicators, Fourteenth Congress of the Geographical Association of Iran, Tehran, Geographical Association of Iran.

Albayrak, Tahir & Meltem Caber. (2018). Examining the relationship between tourist motivation and satisfaction by two competing methods. Tourism Management, Volume 69, December 2018, Pages 201-213.

Alipour, M. (2015). Investigation of the effect of CRM on the tourism industry in relational marketing, National Conference on New Ideas in Agriculture Agriculture, Ardabil, Institute for Supporters of the Ideal Environment

Azar, A., Momeni, M. (2009). Statistics and its application in management. Volumes I and II: Statistical Analysis. Organization for the Study and Compilation of University Humanities Books (SAMT).

Bahadori, A. (2018). Qualitative research on grounded theory, "coding" and its importance, steps and method of implementation in Farhangian University internship. Journal of "Strategic Management Thought". Article 4, Volume 4, Number 5, Spring and Summer 2018, pp. 69-88.

Baksi, Arup Kumar. (2014). Moderating impact of Tourism Relationship Management dimensions on tourism service quality, tourist satisfaction and destination loyalty. Journal: Decision Science Letters (DSL) | Year: 2014 | Volume: 3 | Issue: 2. Pages 169-186.

Bayih, Berhanu Esubalew & Apar Singh. (2020). Modeling domestic tourism: motivations, satisfaction and tourist behavioral intentions. HeliyonSeptember 2020.

Bull, Christopher. (2013). Strategic issues in customer relationship management (CRM) implementation. Business Process Management Journal, 9(5), 592-602.

Chang, Shu-Yun. (2020). Tour member fit and tour member–leader fit on group package tours: Influences on tourists’ positive emotions, rapport, and satisfaction. Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management

Chiao, Huei-Ming & Wei-Hsin Huang. (2018). Data on the acceptance of a tourism navigation system applying structuring equation modeling analysis. Data in Brief, Volume 20, October 2018, Pages 2013-2017.

Danaeifard, H., Eslami, A., Maghsoudi, E. (2011). Application of research strategy of data foundation theory in practice; Build a theory of organizational indifference. Publisher: Imam Sadegh University. Published: October 23, 2011. Number of pages: 178. ISBN: 978-600-214-084-5.

De-Gracia, Maria, et al. (2020). Importance of family for individual tourist satisfaction. Annals of Tourism ResearchNovember 2020.

Firouzi, Gh. (2009). Quality of service and customer satisfaction in the tourism sector: a combination of Persian language studies, Quarterly Journal of Art and Civilization of the East.

Ghasemi, V. (2010). Structural Equation Modeling in Social Research Using Amos, Sociologists Publications, Tehran.

Hsu, I. –Yuang, et al. (2012). Analysis of business safety performance by structural equation models. Safety Science, Volume 50, Issue 1, January 2012, Pages 1-11.
Karkehabadi, Z., Ghaffari, A., Asraei, M.B. (2016). A Study of the Role of Electronic CRM and Urban Tourism (Case Study: Khorraramabad), the First National Conference on Geography, Ardabil, Institute for Supporters of the Ideal Environment.

Khalqatdoost, A., Safari, M. (2016). Presenting a Framework for CRM Implementation in the Tourism Industry in Iran, International Congress of Architecture, Tourism and Tourism, UAE-Dubai, Azar Tabar Iranian Company.

Kia, K., Sadeghi, T. (2017). The Impact of Marketing Information System on TRM in Mashhad Hotels, 10th International Conference on Accounting and Management and 7th Open Entrepreneurship and Innovation Conference, Tehran, Mehr Ishraaq Conference.

Lee, HaNa & JooHyun Kim. (2018). A Structural Equation Model on Korean Adolescents’ Excessive Use of Smartphones. Asian Nursing Research, Volume 12, Issue 2, June 2018, Pages 91-98.

Liao, Shu-hsien; Chen, Yin-Ju; Deng, Min-yi.; (2012). Mining customer knowledge for tourism new product development and customer relationship management. Expert Systems with Applications, 37(6), 4212-4223.

Lin, Hongxia, et al. (2019). Impact of tourist-to-tourist interaction on tourism experience: The mediating role of cohesion and intimacy. Annals of Tourism Research, Volume 76, May 2019, Pages 153-167.

Matteucci, Xavier & Juergen Gnoth. (2017). Elaborating on grounded theory in tourism research. Annals of Tourism Research, Volume 65, July 2017, Pages 49-59.

Maggon, Mohita; Chaudhry, Harish. (2015). Revisiting Relationship Marketing and Customer Relationship Management in Leading Tourism and Hospitality Journals: Research Trends From 2001 to 2013. Journal of Relationship Marketing, 14(1), 53-77.

Mohammad, Nazeri & Ruhizan Mohamad Yasin. (2015). Creative Teaching in Design and Technology Curriculum: Using Structural Equations Modeling. Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, Volume 204, 24 August 2015, Pages 240-246.

Momeni, M., Qayyumi, A. (2016). Statistical analyzes using SPSS. ISBN: 9789640466933. Publication Date: 2016.

Pike, Steven, et al. (2010). Visitor Relationship Orientation of Destination Marketing Organizations. Journal of Travel Research. Travel and Tourism Research Association. June 7, 2010.

Qadksazzadeh, M., Momeni, M. (2015). The effect of human resources outsourcing on organizational agility with the modifier of human resource strategies using structural equation modeling (SEM), the second national conference and the second international conference of management, accounting and management.

Sharepour, M. (2001). Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) Introduction to Program Applications (LISREL) in Social Research. Articles in scientific journals. Social Sciences, Quarterly. 13 and 14. Spring and Summer 2001. 205 to 231.

Sharifi Chalnber, K., Rahimi Klor, H., Hazeri, H., Bashkouh Ajirloo, M. (2017). Identification and Ranking of Barriers to Health Tourism Development in Gilan Province, The First International Conference on Systems Optimization and Business Management, Babol, Noshirvani University of Technology - Iranian Association for Practical Research.

Taherikia, Fariz; Rezaei, Fatemeh. (2015). Investigating success factors influencing in e-CRM adoption: Evidence from banking industry. Management Science Letters, 5(1), 79-84.
Talebzadeh, S., and Abdolqayyum, P. (2013) The Role of Electronic Customer Relationship Management in Tourism in Chabahar, International Conference on Management, Challenges and Strategies, Shiraz.

Teimouri, S. (2009) Development of Creative Tourism in Regenerating Worn Tissues in District 20 of Tehran, 14th Congress of the Geographical Association of Iran, Tehran, Geographical Association of Iran.

Vogt, Christine A. (2010). Customer Relationship Management in Tourism: Management Needs and Research Applications. *Journal of Travel Research, 50*(4), 356-364.

Wu, Shwu-Ing & Chien-Lung Lu. (2012). Comparison between hotels and motels using CRM effect model – An empirical study in Taiwan. *International Journal of Hospitality Management, Volume 31, Issue 4, December 2012*, Pages 1254-1263.

Yun, Seonyoung & Jiyeon Kang. (2018). Influencing Factors and Consequences of Workplace Bullying among Nurses: A Structural Equations Modeling. *Asian Nursing Research, Volume 12, Issue 1, March 2018*, Pages 26-33.