Effect of Nanosilver Fluoride Varnish on Demineralized Primary Teeth: A Systematic Review

Abdulwahab Mohammed Rashed AlDubayyan¹, Ahmed Tarik Ahmed Alsuawari¹, Bassam Mansour Alotaibi¹, Hussam Abdullah Fawaz Almalki¹, Faisal Saleh Alkhamsi¹, Bader Al Hussein², Dr. Shahzeb H. Ansari³

¹General Dentist, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
²Consultant Restorative Department, Prince Sultan Military Medical City, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
³Faculty Preventive Dentistry, REU, KSA College of Dentistry, University of Riyadh Elm, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia

Abstract

Demineralization of teeth or caries is a common health problem among pediatric patients. It is a more serious issue among children from low-income households due to their lack of access to proper dental care. Silver diamine fluoride (SDF) has been shown to be an effective agent used to treat demineralization, but experiments are being done to replace it with nanosilver fluoride (NSF). The purpose of this study was to assess the effectiveness of nanosilver fluoride varnish in containing demineralization of primary teeth. A systematic literature review method was used. About 15 articles met the inclusion criteria. Findings are conflicting, but most of the reviewed studies confirmed the effectiveness of an agent with nanoparticles compared to all other alternatives, especially SDF. Apart from suppressing microorganisms that cause demineralization at very low concentrations, agents with nanoparticles protect patients from discoloration of teeth and formation stains. Nanosilver fluoride varnish can be used to replace the current alternatives, but the findings should be used with caution since most of the present studies are experimental.

Keywords: Demineralization, NSF, SDF, varnish, teeth, caries.

INTRODUCTION

Dental caries has remained a highly prevalent chronic condition, despite the progress made in the improvement of the healthcare system. It is a multifactorial disease, and its development is attributed to several etiological factors (such as bacteria, diet, and the host) that contribute to the demineralization that culminates in dental caries (El-Desouky et al., 2020, p. 155). Untreated demineralization or dental caries in primary teeth is one of the common epidemics that occur across the world (Al-Nerabieah et al., 2020, p. 100). Incidents of untreated demineralization of the primary teeth are common in the population of children from low-income households. The untreated condition progresses to a stage where it causes pain, increases the spread of infections, and subjects the affected children to the risk of malnutrition due to the difficulties they experience while eating (Arnaud et al., 2021, p. 207). These effects reduce the quality of life of the patients. This paper presents a systematic literature review of previous studies that focused on the use of nanosilver fluoride varnish in the prevention of demineralization of primary teeth.

Progression of demineralization is associated with the loss of minerals that form the teeth, leading to the development of cavitated lesions. Lessons are more difficult to contain, which creates the need for interventions that can support the process of re-mineralization. Different techniques and interventions have been developed to treat or prevent the carriers. Silver diamine fluoride (SDF) has been shown to be an effective compound that prevents and halts coronary carriers that affect the primary teeth (Nagierreddy et al., 2019, p. 485). SDF is associated with serious side effects, such as the development of reversible lesions that are painful and a tendency to leave black stains on the curious tissue.

Although SDF is an effective and non-invasive intervention, there has been a need to develop...
alternative agents that will control demineralization of the primary teeth without leaving black stains on the teeth. Researchers are filling this gap by introducing nanotechnology. This has led to the development of nanosilver fluoride (NSF) agent which has been shown to be effective in containing dentine caries and does not have a staining effect on the patient’s teeth (Zhao et al., 2020, p. 2829). NSF is obtained from a reddish yellow solution that contains silver nanoparticles (AgNPs), fluoride, and chitosan, but it is currently an experimental agent (El-Desouky et al., 2020, p. 154). NSF combines antimicrobial and cariostatic properties, making it an effective anti-caries agent that arrests demineralization without irritating the soft tissue.

Different researchers have classified NSF as an experimental intervention (El-Desouky et al., 2020, p. 154; Nagiereddy et al., 2019, p. 484). This means that its effectiveness is not fully understood and it is still being studied. Consequently, systematic literature review studies that provide a comprehensive analysis of empirical research on the effectiveness of the new nano agent are scarce. This creates a gap that will be filled in this study. The purpose of this systematic literature review is to provide the analysis of the research articles that focused on examining the efficacy of NSF as an agent for controlling the demineralization of primary teeth.

METHODS

Study Selection

The preferred reporting items of systematic reviews and meta-analyses (PRISMA) framework will be used to present the findings of the studies considered in this paper. The articles reviewed in this paper were located online after performing a literature search through different electronic databases, including Cochrane Library, Web of Science, and PubMed. The search yielded a total of 87 relevant articles as shown in Figure 1. A keyword strategy was used to increase the chances of identifying the most relevant articles with studies linked to the topic. The most important keywords and phrases that were used include NSF and primary teeth demineralization; re-mineralization of primary teeth and NSF; treating children with dental caries and NSF; demineralization prevention and primary teeth; and effectiveness of NSF and primary teeth prevention. This was followed by a review of the titles of the identified articles to determine their relevance to the topic of the research. A total of 27 articles were excluded because of duplication as shown in Figure 1. The remaining articles were reviewed, including their abstracts as well as their full texts to determine their eligibility for this systematic literature review, whereby 15 of them were selected because they met the inclusion criteria as shown in Figure 1.

Inclusion Criteria

Articles were selected if they met all of the following criteria. First, the article must be a primary empirical study, quantitative or qualitative. Secondly, it must be a study based on a randomized controlled trial, case, or cohort control research design. Third, it must have been published in English. Fourth, participants must be humans or children with primary teeth and not animals. Fifth, children who participated in the published study must have been diagnosed with demineralization of the primary teeth and treated with NSF.

Exclusion Criteria

Articles were excluded from the systematic review based on the following criteria. First, participants were children diagnosed with demineralization of the primary teeth, but they were treated with other agents (such as SDF) only without including NSF. Secondly, all non-English articles were excluded. Third, non-empirical publications (including expert opinions and narrative reviews) did not meet the threshold for inclusion in this systematic review. Fourth, articles publishing studies of adult patients with demineralization of permanent teeth and treated with NSF were excluded.

Study Findings

The main purpose of this study was to perform a systematic review of the previous studies that assessed the effectiveness of nanosilver fluoride varnish in controlling the demineralization of primary teeth. In a randomized control trial study of 60 children aged 4-9 years, Nagiereddy et al. (2019, p. 484) investigated the level of effectiveness of NSF in arresting the occurrence of caries. The recruited children were randomly assigned to saline and experimental group. Treatment and monitoring occurred in intervals of seven days, five, and 12 months (Nagiereddy et al., 2019, p. 484). The finding indicated that the treatment had arrested caries in 78 % and 72.91 % of the participants in seven days and five months, respectively, compared to 34 % in the control group (Nagiereddy et al., 2019, p. 484). NSF treatment arrested demineralization in 65.21 % of the participants compared to 28.88 % in the control group (Nagiereddy et al., 2019, p. 484). The findings confirmed the effectiveness of NSF. Zhao et al. (2020, p. 2829) investigated the effect of adding nanoparticles to silver-based agents on the re-mineralization of teeth. A sample of 36 blocks obtained from 12 dentine slices was subjected to the in vitro experiment (Zhao et al., 2020, p. 2829). The treatment involved subjecting the first, second, and third groups to a sodium fluoride solution, a silver agent with nanoparticles, and de-ionized water, respectively. From the results, treatment with a silver agent with nanoparticles led to re-mineralization without discoloration.

Similar to Nagiereddy et al. (2019, p. 484), Al-Nerabieah et al. (2020, p. 100) investigated the efficacy of NSF in controlling caries in children with primary
teeth. The study involved the treatment of primary teeth with NSF (60 children) and SDF (59 children), where monitoring was done in three weeks and six months. Cariostatic efficacy was 77 % and 90 % in NSF and SDF groups after three weeks, respectively, whereby \( p > 0.05 \) (Al-Nerabieah et al., 2020, p. 100). This efficacy was 79.5 % and 67.2 % in SDF and NSF groups, respectively, after six months with \( p > 0.05 \) (Al-Nerabieah et al., 2020, p. 100). Therefore, NSF was less effective than SDF.

El-Desouky et al. (2020, p. 153) investigated the anti-cariogenic effect of a silver agent in a sample of 48 molars. The experiment involved the treatment of the intervention group with NSF. The findings revealed that the lesion depths were 36.36 and -37.30, respectively, for NSF and agents with no nanoparticles and the difference was not statistically significant (El-Desouky et al., 2020, p. 153). The results indicated that NSF and non-silver-based agents were equally effective in containing demineralization.

Arnaud et al. (2021, p. 207) studied the effectiveness of silver nanoparticles in arresting caries, but the study focused on comparing the efficacy of the agent at different concentrations. In this RCT, 337 children who were aged 5-7 years were recruited (Arnaud et al., 2021, p. 207). The study entailed the treatment of the subjects with carious lesions using NSF, which occurred in six months. Similar to Nagierreddy et al. (2019, p. 484), Arnaud et al. (2021, p. 207) found that the nano-based agent (NSF) was effective in arresting caries. However, success rates were 72.7 % and 56.5 % for NSF 600 and 400, respectively (Arnaud et al., 2021, p. 207). Nanoparticles increased the effectiveness of the agents.

Similar to Arnaud et al. (2021, p. 207) and Nagierreddy et al. (2019, p. 484), Santos et al. (2014, p. 1) investigated the effectiveness of NSF as a relatively new agent for controlling caries. This RCT involved the treatment of primary teeth that were randomly sampled and assigned into groups with NSF and a follow-up made for seven days, five and twelve months (Santos et al., 2014, p. 1). The results showed that the agent arrested caries in 81 % of the primary teeth in seven days compared to zero cases in control, whereby \( p < 0.001 \) (Santos et al., 2014, p. 1). It arrested caries in 72.7 % and 66.7 % of the subjects after five and 12 months, respectively (Santos et al., 2014, p. 1). Therefore, the difference between the control and the intervention groups was statistically significant.

Tirupathi et al. (2019, p. 105), similar to Al-Nerabieah et al. (2020, p. 100), explored the cariostatic efficacy of NSF. The RCT involved 159 primary carious lesions of 50 children’s primary molars that were treated using the NSF varnish and monitored for one, three, six, and 12 months (Tirupathi et al., 2019, p. 105). From the findings, the nano-based varnish was highly effective in controlling caries compared to SDF, whereby \( p > 0.05 \) (Tirupathi et al., 2019, p. 105). This success was confirmed at the end of the follow-up period.

An in vivo study involving a combination of silver nanoparticles with fluoride varnish revealed that the use of such an agent is effective in improvement of the teeth structure and promoting re-mineralization (Giron et al., 2017, p. 1). Children with demineralization conditions in both maxillary teeth were recruited whereby they were treated with the varnish with and without nanoparticles three times (Giron et al., 2017, p. 1). The addition of nanoparticles made a significant positive difference.

El-Tekeya and El-Habashy (2020, p. 1931), similar to Giron et al. (2017, p. 1), compared the effectiveness of fluoride varnish with nanoparticles and one without and found that the difference between the treatment groups was not statistically significant as confirmed by the value of \( p = 0.247 \). The agents act as preventive interventions for teeth affected by demineralization, but they are ineffective in performing the sealing function on the affected tooth.

In an experimental study conducted to determine whether NSF can be effective in both arresting and preventing caries, it was discovered that the preventive function was 50 % with \( p < 0.05 \) (Ve et al., 2014, p. 945). Apart from arresting caries, nanoparticles are highly effective in preventing its occurrence. Nozari et al. (2017, p. 97) and Silva et al. (2018, p. 509) assessed the effectiveness of nano-based silver in controlling demineralization or enhancing re-mineralization of the primary teeth. Both studies confirmed high levels of efficacy, but NSF had no statistically significant difference with NaF, whereby \( p > 0.005 \) (Silva et al., 2018, p. 509) and \( p = 0.165 \) (Nozari et al., 2017, p. 970). These findings indicated that the addition of nanoparticles did have any extra therapeutic value.

Several scholars have studied the effectiveness of NSF in reducing demineralization by comparing it with other agents, such as NaF (Teixeira et al., 2018, p. 1 and Soud and Elsaied, 2020, p. 153). Teixeira et al. (2018, p. 1) confirmed that NSF is highly effective and had a statistically significant difference compared to NaF. Soud and Elsaied (2020, p. 153) also confirmed that NSF is more effective than SDF in treating dematerialized enamel. Similarly, Nanda and Naik (2020) reported lesser demineralization when NSF was used compared to patients treated with SDF.

DISCUSSION

This systematic review study focused on the determination of the effectiveness of nanosilver fluoride varnish as an agent for treating demineralization of the primary teeth. In the past, providers used SDF, but it
resulted in staining of the teeth (Zhao et al., 2020, p. 2830). This created a gap that could be filled by developing agents with nanoparticles. NSF is an example of varnishes that contain nanoparticles, but it is still in the experimental stages (El-Desouky et al., 2020, p. 154). NSF is designed to control demineralization without causing stains on the teeth.

After a careful review of the published literature, 15 articles met the inclusion criterion. Most of the studies focused on comparing the effectiveness of NSF and SDF and confirmed that the addition of nanoparticles contributed to a higher level of success (Nagiereddy et al., 2019, p. 484; Tirupathi et al. (2019, p. 105). These findings are consistent with the previous results by Scaropelli et al. (2017, p. 738) indicating that Ag-nano leads to a 100% inhibition of microorganisms at lower rate concentration levels than other agents.

However, some of the studies contradicted the previous research findings by showing that SDF is less effective than NSF (Al-Nerabieh et al., 2020, p. 100). A lack of statistically significant difference between agents with and those without nanoparticles was supported by the findings reported by El-Desouky et al. (2020, p. 153). These results contradicted the previous findings by (Zameer et al., 2021, p. 1) showing that NSF is a more effective alternative that addresses the limitations of NSF.

Overall, NSF is more effective and it is preferred to its SDF alternative because it protects the patient from stains during and after treatment (Zhao et al., 2020, p. 2830). Its effectiveness in controlling caries and containing demineralization has been supported by most of the studies (Nagiereddy et al., 2019, p. 484, Giron et al. (2017, p. 1), and Nozari et al. (2017, p. 97). Therefore, it should be used to treat children whose primary teeth are affected by demineralization.

However, the findings of this systematic review should be used with caution due to some limitations identified in the article. For example, only Ve et al. (2014, p. 945) and Santos et al. (2014, p. 6) addressed the confounding variables. Therefore, it may not be possible to determine whether the efficacy of nano-based agents was affected by confounding variables, such as diet. In addition, the duration covered in some of the studies was short, whereby Nanda and Naik (2020), Teixeira et al. (2018, p. 1) Silva et al. (2018, p. 509) monitored the treatment for 14 days only. The duration is quite short for the assessment of an experimental agent. In addition, most of the studies, including Teixeira et al. (2018), Soud and Elsaied (2020), and Silva et al. (2018), were based on experimental design. This introduced a methodological limitation and reduced the generalization of their findings in real clinical settings.

**CONCLUSION**

Dental care for pediatric patients is significant because it protects children from illnesses and a poor quality of life that may result from conditions, such as caries or demineralization of the primary teeth. Although SDF has been confirmed to be effective and non-invasive, it has clinical limitations, such as staining of the patient’s teeth. Based on the outcomes of this systematic literature review nano silver fluoride varnish can serve as an effective agent for the replacement of SDF in controlling demineralization of the primary teeth.
## Table 1: Summary of the Findings

| Study | Population/Sample | Design/Type of Study | Inclusion/Exclusion Criteria | Test and control | Duration/Monitoring intervals | Results |
|-------|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------------|------------------|-------------------------------|---------|
| Nanda and Naik, 2020 | 20 premolar teeth | RCT | - | ✓ | 14 days | Lesser demineralization occurs with NSF treatment |
| Teixeira et al., 2018 | 20 enamel fragments | Experimental design | - | ✓ | 14 day | NSF is more effective in reducing demineralization compared to SDF |
| Soud and Elsaied, 2020 | 40 specimen | In vitro experiment | ✓ | ✓ | 12 months | NSF is more effective in reducing demineralization than SDF |
| Silva et al., 2018 | 33 teeth | In vitro experiment | ✓ | ✓ | 14 day | NFS enhances re-mineralization, but not statistically significant difference with NaF, where $p > 0.005$ |
| Nozari et al., 2017 | 80 primary teeth | In vitro experiment | ✓ | ✓ | 7 months | NFS enhances re-mineralization, but not statistically significant difference with NaF, where $p = 0.165$ |
| Ve et al., 2014 | 60 children with the mean age of 6.31 | Experimental design | - | ✓ | 12 months | NSF is effective in caries arresting and prevention at 50% success rate and $p < 0.05$. |
| El-Tekeya, and El-Habashy, 2020 | 45 molars | In vitro experiment | ✓ | ✓ | 6 months | The difference between nano-base and one without is statistically insignificant with $p = 0.247$ |
| Giron et al., 2017 | 22 children who were aged 1-6 years | An in vivo experiment | ✓ | ✓ | 3 months | The addition of nanoparticles to a fluoride varnish improved the efficacy |
| Tirupathi et al., 2019 | 159 primary carious lesions of 50 children’s primary molars | RCT | ✓ | ✓ | 1.3.6, and 12 months | NSF was effective compared to SDF with $p > 0.05$ |
| Santos et al., 2014 | 130 decaying primary teeth | RCT | ✓ | ✓ | 7 days, 5 months, and 12 months | Success in arresting caries: 7 days – 81% $p < 0.001$ 5 months – 72.7% $p < 0.001$ 12 months – 66.7% $p = 0.003$ |
| Arnaud et al., 2021 | 337 children aged 5-7 years | RCT | ✓ | ✓ | 6 months at the intervals of 30, 60, 180 days | Success in containing caries is 72.7% ($p = 0.025$) and 56.5% for NSF 600 and 400, respectively |
| El-Desouky et al., 2020 | 48 primary molars | In vitro experiment | ✓ | ✓ | 7 days | Lesion depths were 36.36 and 37.30, respectively, for agents with no nanoparticles, confirming equal effectiveness levels |
| Al-Nerabieah et al., 2020 | 119 preschool children who had 244 dentin lesions | RCT | ✓ | ✓ | 3 weeks and 6 months | Cariostatic efficacy: 77% and 90% in NSF and SDF, respectively after 3 weeks 79.5% and 67.2% in SDF and NSF groups, respectively, after 6 month |
| Nagiereddy et al., 2019 | 60 children aged 4-9 years | RCT | ✓ | ✓ | Seven days, five months, and 12 month | Demineralization/caries arresting: 78% (34% control) in 7 days, 72.91% (34% control) in 5 months, and 65.21% (control - 28.88%) in 12 months |
| Zhao et al., 2020 | 36 blocks from 12 dentine slices | In vitro experiment | - | ✓ | One month | PEG-AgNPs – Increase in re-mineralization with no discoloration |
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

An acknowledgment to the Riyadh Elm Research Center for their guidance and cooperation. There was no conflict of interest, and no financial support was needed, authors were responsible for all expenses.

REFERENCES

1. Al-Nerabieah, Z., Arrag, E., & Rajab, A. Cariostatic efficacy and children acceptance of nano-silver fluoride versus silver diamine fluoride: a randomized controlled clinical trial. Journal of Stomatatology, 73(3), 100-106.

2. Arnaud, M., Junior, P. C., Lima, M. G., e Silva, A. V., Araujo, J. T., Gallembeck, A., ... & Rosenblatt, A. (2021). Nano-silver Fluoride at Higher Concentration for Caries Arrest in Primary Molars: A Randomized Controlled Trial. International Journal of Clinical Pediatric Dentistry, 14(2), 207.

3. El-Desouky, D., Hanno, A., Dowidar, K., Hamza, S. A., & El-Desouky, L. M. (2021). Evaluation of the anticariogenic effect of nano silver fluoride on demineralization of enamel in primary teeth (an in vitro study). Alexandria Dental Journal, 46(2), 153-159.

4. El Habashy, L., & El Tekeya, M. (2020). The Effect of Enamel Pre-treatment with Silver Diamine Fluoride versus Nano Silver Fluoride on the Microleakage of Fissure Sealant: in vitro study. Egyptian Dental Journal, 66(4-October) (Orthodontics, Pediatric & Preventive Dentistry)), 1931–1938.

5. Butrón-Téllez Girón, C., Mariel-Cárdenas, J., Pierdant-Pérez, M., Hernández-Sierra, J. F., Morales-Sánchez, J. E., & Ruiz, F. (2017). Effectiveness of a combined silver nanoparticles/fluoride varnish in dental remineralization in children: in vivo study. Superficies y vacío, 30(2), 21-24.

6. Nagireddy, V. R., Reddy, D., Konadamadugu, S., Puppala, N., Mareddy, A., & Chris, A. (2019). Nanosilver fluoride—a paradigm shifts for arrest in dental caries in primary teeth of schoolchildren: A randomized controlled clinical trial. International journal of clinical pediatric dentistry, 12(6), 484.

7. Nanda, K. J., & Naik, S. (2020). An In-Vitro Comparative Evaluation of Pre-treatment With Nano-Silver Fluoride on Inhibiting Secondary Caries at Tooth Restoration Interface. Cureus, 12(5).

8. Nozari, A., Ajami, S., Rafiei, A., & Niazi, E. (2017). Impact of nano hydroxyapatite, nano silver fluoride and sodium fluoride varnish on primary teeth enamel remineralization: an in vitro study. Journal of clinical and diagnostic research: JCDR, 11(9), ZC97.

9. dos Santos Jr, V. E., Vasconcelos Filho, A., Targino, A. G. R., Flores, M. A. P., Gallembeck, A., Caldas Jr, A. F., & Rosenblatt, A. (2014). A new “Silver-Bullet” to treat caries in children-Nano
Silver Fluoride: a randomised clinical trial. *Journal of dentistry*, 42(8), 945-951.

10. Scarpelli, B. B., Punhagui, M. F., Hoeppner, M. G., Almeida, R. S. C. D., Juliani, F. A., Guiraldo, R. D., & Berger, S. B. (2017). In vitro evaluation of the remineralizing potential and antimicrobial activity of a cariostatic agent with silver nanoparticles. *Brazilian dental journal*, 28, 738-743.

11. e Silva, A. V. C., Teixeira, J. A., Mota, C. C., Lins, E. C. C. C., de Melo Junior, P. C., de Souza Lima, M. G., & Rosenblatt, A. (2018). In Vitro morphological, optical and microbiological evaluation of nanosilver fluoride in the remineralization of deciduous teeth enamel. *Nanotechnology Reviews*, 7(6), 509-520.

12. Tekade, M., Maheshwari, N., Choudhury, H., Gorain, B., Deb, P. K., Tekade, R. K., & Sharma, M. C. (2019). Up-to-Date Implications of Nanomaterials in Dental Science. In *Biomaterials and Bionanotechnology* (pp. 301-336). Academic Press.

13. Teixeira, J. A., Santos Júnior, V. E. D., Melo Júnior, P. C. D., Arnaud, M., Lima, M. G., Flores, M. A. P., & Rosenblatt, A. (2018). Effects of a new nano-silver fluoride-containing dentifrice on demineralization of enamel and Streptococcus mutans adhesion and acidogenicity. *International journal of dentistry*, 2018.

14. Tirupathi, S., Nirmala, S. V. S. G., Rajasekhar, S., & Nuvvula, S. (2019). Comparative cariostatic efficacy of a novel Nano-silver fluoride varnish with 38% silver diamine fluoride varnish a double-blind randomized clinical trial. *Journal of clinical and experimental dentistry*, 11(2), e105.

15. dos Santos Jr, V. E., Vasconcelos Filho, A., Targino, A. G. R., Flores, M. A. P., Galembeck, A., Caldas Jr, A. F., & Rosenblatt, A. (2014). A new “Silver-Bullet” to treat caries in children–Nano Silver Fluoride: a randomised clinical trial. *Journal of dentistry*, 42(8), 945-951.

16. Zameer, M., Birajdar, S. B., Basheer, S. N., Peeran, S. W., Peeran, S. A., & Reddy, A. (2021). Nanosilver fluoride as a caries arresting agent: A narrative. *Contemp Pediatr*, 2(1), 1-13.

17. Zhao, I. S., Yin, I. X., Mei, M. L., Lo, E. C. M., Tang, J., Li, Q., & Chu, C. H. (2020). Remineralising dentine caries using sodium fluoride with silver nanoparticles: An in vitro study. *International journal of nanomedicine*, 15, 2829.