Biomarkers of environmental enteric dysfunction are not consistently associated with linear growth velocity in rural Zimbabwean infants

Kuda Mutasa,1 Robert Ntuzini,1 Mduduzi NN Mbuya,1,2 Sandra Rukobo,1 Margaret Govha,1 Florence D Majo,1 Naume Tavengwa,1 Laura E Smith,1,3 Laura Caulfield,4 Jonathan R Swann,5,6 Rebecca J Stoltzfus,7 Lawrence H Moulton,4 Jean H Humphrey,1,4 Ethan K Gough,4 and Andrew J Prendergast1,8

1Zvitambo Institute for Maternal and Child Health Research, Harare, Zimbabwe; 2Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition, Washington, DC, USA; 3Department of Epidemiology and Environmental Health, School of Public Health and Health Professions, University at Buffalo, Buffalo, NY, USA; 4Department of International Health, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MD, USA; 5Division of Digestive Diseases, Department of Metabolism, Digestion, and Reproduction, Faculty of Medicine, Imperial College London, London, United Kingdom; 6School of Human Development and Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, Southampton, United Kingdom; 7Program in International Nutrition, Division of Nutritional Sciences, Cornell University, Ithaca, NY, USA; and 8Blizard Institute, Queen Mary University of London, London, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT

Background: Child stunting remains a poorly understood, prevalent public health problem. Environmental enteric dysfunction (EED) is hypothesized to be an important underlying cause.

Objectives: Within a subgroup of 1169 children enrolled in the SHINE (Sanitation Hygiene Infant Nutrition Efficacy) trial in rural Zimbabwe, we evaluated associations between the concentration of 11 EED biomarkers and linear growth velocity.

Methods: At infant ages 1, 3, 6, 12, and 18 mo, nurses measured child length and collected stool and blood; the lactulose-mannitol test was also conducted at all visits except at 1 mo. Stool neopterin, α1 antitrypsin, myeloperoxidase, and regenerating gene 1β protein; urinary lactulose and mannitol; and plasma kynurenine, tryptophan, C-reactive protein, insulin-like growth factor-1 (IGF-1), soluble CD14, intestinal fatty acid binding protein, and citrulline were measured. We analyzed the change in relative Δ length-for-age z score (LAZ)/mo and absolute (Δ length/mo) growth velocity during 4 age intervals (1–3 mo; 3–6 mo; 6–12 mo; and 12–18 mo) per SD increase in biomarker concentration at the start of each age interval.

Results: In fully adjusted models, we observed only 3 small, statistically significant associations: kynurenine:tryptophan ratio at 12 mo was associated with decreased mean LAZ velocity during the 12–18 mo interval (−0.015 LAZ/mo; 95% CI: −0.029, −0.001 LAZ/mo); mannitol excretion at 6 mo was associated with increased LAZ velocity during the 6–12 mo interval (0.013 LAZ/mo; 95% CI: 0.001, 0.025 LAZ/mo), and plasma IGF-1 at 1 mo was associated with increased LAZ velocity during the 1–3 mo interval (0.118 LAZ/mo; 95% CI: 0.024, 0.211 LAZ/mo). Results for absolute growth velocity were similar, except IGF-1 was also associated with growth during the 12–18 mo interval. We found no other associations between any EED biomarker and linear growth velocity.

Conclusions: None of 11 biomarkers of EED were consistently associated with linear growth among Zimbabwean children.
of intestinal barrier function enables microbial translocation resulting in systemic inflammation. Raised proinflammatory cytokines suppress plasma concentrations of insulin-like growth factor 1 (IGF-1), thereby restraining linear growth (23, 24). EED is acquired early in life among children living in impoverished conditions (25–27). Chronic exposure to enteric pathogens is likely the major cause of EED, although nutrient deficiencies and fungal toxin exposure are also potential causative or predisposing factors (26, 28, 29).

Because endoscopy to collect intestinal biopsy samples is rarely feasible in young children, numerous biomarkers of EED measured in urine, blood, and stool have been proposed; each is intended to reflect a specific component of the hypothesized causal pathway between enteropathogen exposure and the growth plate (23, 26, 30). Some prior studies have defined EED with a single biomarker (31, 32) or small numbers of biomarkers (33–35), some with novel biomarkers (36), whereas others have included large panels of biomarkers (9, 37, 38). Findings from these studies have been highly heterogeneous: for every biomarker, there is evidence both supporting and not supporting its association with linear growth (30).

The SHINE (Sanitation Hygiene Infant Nutrition Efficacy) trial was a cluster-randomized trial that tested the impact of an improved household water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) intervention and an improved infant and young child feeding (IYCF) intervention on attained linear growth at 18 mo of age (39). The SHINE trial was based on the hypothesis that EED is a major underlying cause of stunting, and that the WASH intervention would improve growth, primarily through reducing EED (40). However, the low-cost household-level WASH intervention tested in SHINE had no impact on enteropathogen carriage (41), EED biomarkers (42), or linear growth (43, 44). In this article, we investigate the association between EED biomarkers and linear growth among HIV-unexposed infants (outside the randomized trial design) to explore whether SHINE provides observational evidence that EED underlies linear growth faltering.

### Methods

The SHINE trial (NCT01824940) design and methods (39) and primary outcomes (43, 44) have been published elsewhere; the protocol and statistical analysis plan are available at: https://os f.io/w93hy. Briefly, SHINE randomly assigned clusters, defined as the catchment area of 1–4 village health workers (VHWs) employed by the Ministry of Health and Child Care, to receive 1 of 4 interventions: IYCF, WASH, IYCF + WASH, or Standard of Care. The IYCF intervention included a small-quantity lipid-based nutrient supplement for the infant to consume daily between 6 and 18 mo of age and counselling on complementary feeding. The WASH intervention included services which are most commonly provided to people in rural areas of low- and middle-income countries (LMICs): a ventilated improved pit latrine, 2 handwashing stations, monthly delivery of liquid soap and chlorine, a clean play space to reduce geophagia by separating children from domestic animals and loose dirt, and behavior change modules promoting use of these tools. Between 22 November, 2012 and 27 March, 2015, pregnant women were enrolled after providing written informed consent. VHWs delivered intervention-specific lessons during 15 home visits between enrollment and 12 mo postpartum.

Research nurses made home visits twice during pregnancy and at infant ages 1, 3, 6, 12, and 18 mo. At baseline, maternal education and age, household wealth (45), existing water and sanitation services, and household food security (46) were assessed, and mothers were tested for HIV via a rapid testing algorithm. Infant birth date, weight, and delivery details were transcribed from health facility records. Gestational age at delivery was calculated from the date of the mother’s last menstrual period ascertained at baseline. Infant weight, length, and midupper arm circumference were measured at every postnatal visit. Nurses were standardized against a gold-standard anthropometrist every 6 mo, with retraining provided to those who failed to meet predefined criteria. Given the household-based nature of the trial interventions, home visits were not conducted if the mother was not available in the household where she consented, except for the 18-mo visit (trial endpoint) when follow-up was conducted anywhere within Zimbabwe.

### EED substudy

Between 1 May, 2014 and 27 March, 2015, mothers enrolling into the SHINE trial were invited to join a substudy to investigate biomarkers of EED. Women were informed about the substudy during pregnancy and those with live births were enrolled after providing additional written informed consent. From children enrolled in the EED substudy, stool (passed on the morning of the research visit and collected by the mother into a plain container) and blood (collected by venipuncture into an EDTA-coated tube) were collected at all postnatal visits. In addition, at the 3, 6, 12, and 18 mo visits, the lactulose–mannitol test was undertaken. After a 30-min fast, infants ingested 2 mL/kg body weight (maximum 20 mL) of a sterile solution containing...
250 mg lactulose/mL and 50 mg mannitol/mL; a urine bag was placed, and all urine passed over a 2-h period was collected and preserved with chlorhexidine. Although 5-h urine collections have been used in many previous studies, the lactulose recovery in a 2-h collection better reflects small intestinal permeability (47). Stool and urine samples were transported in a cool box and blood samples were transported at room temperature to the field laboratory where EDTA-coated tubes were centrifuged at room temperature for 5 min at 291 × g to collect plasma, stool specimens were divided into aliquots in cryotubes, and urine specimens were divided into aliquots in cryotubes after measuring total volume. All specimens were stored in the field laboratory at −80°C until subsequent transfer to the Zvitambo Laboratory in Harare for long-term storage at −20°C until analysis. A sample size of 150 infants/arm (600 total) was originally calculated to be sufficient to detect effect sizes of 35%–40% of 1 SD of each biomarker with 80% power, and α = 0.05; however, we chose to recruit 1000 infants to allow for missing or inadequate specimen collection during home visits.

Biomarkers of EED

We chose biomarkers indicative of 5 domains of the structural, functional, and metabolic changes characteristic of EED: altered gut architecture, intestinal inflammation, impaired epithelial regeneration, increased permeability, and microbial translocation; and 2 domains of systemic sequelae: inflammation and suppression of the growth hormone axis (Table 1) (23, 48–55). All ELISA assays were conducted in the Zvitambo laboratory in Harare, Zimbabwe; MS was undertaken at Oregon Analytic Oregon, USA for lactulose and mannitool measurement, and at Imperial College, UK for citruline, kynurenine, and tryptophan, using previously published methods (42).

Statistical methods

Lactulose and mannitol excretion fractions were calculated as:

$$\% \text{ marker excretion} = \frac{\text{excreted marker (mg) } \times 100}{\text{ingested marker (mg)}}$$

$$a = \frac{b}{1000} \times \frac{c \times d}{250} \times 100 \quad (1)$$

Where: $a =$ postingestion urine marker concentration (mg/L); $b =$ volume of urine obtained (mL); $c =$ volume of oral lactulose–mannitol solution ingested (mL); and $d =$ 250 where the marker was lactulose, or 50 where the marker was mannitol.

Lactulose-to-mannitol ratio (LMR) was estimated using the following formula:

$$\text{LMR} = \frac{\% \text{ lactulose excretion}}{\% \text{ mannitol excretion}} \quad (2)$$

The distributions of all EED biomarker values were skewed to high and normalized by log transformation. We also calculated a previously proposed composite index combining fecal myeloperoxidase, α-1 antitrypsin (A1AT), and neopterin [environmental enteropathy score (EE score)] (35, 56).

Length measurements at each time point were converted to length-for-age z scores (LAZs) based on WHO growth standards (57). Infant linear growth velocity during the 4 age intervals between each pair of scheduled postnatal visits (1–3 mo, 3–6 mo, 6–12 mo, and 12–18 mo) was calculated in 2 ways to reflect the relative ($\text{LAZ}_{\text{end}} - \text{LAZ}_{\text{start}}$)/(Age$_{\text{end}}$ - Age$_{\text{start}}$) and absolute [Length (cm)$_{\text{end}}$ - Length (cm)$_{\text{start}}$]/(Age$_{\text{end}}$ - Age$_{\text{start}}$) growth velocity during the interval.

The unadjusted association between linear growth velocity and EED was investigated by fitting separate simple linear regression models for each EED biomarker (expressed as SDs from its mean) during each interval:

$$E \left[ \frac{\text{LAZ}_{\text{end}} - \text{LAZ}_{\text{start}}}{\text{Age}_{\text{end}} - \text{Age}_{\text{start}}} \right] = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \times \text{EED marker}_{\text{start}} \quad (3)$$

The models were repeated substituting length (cm) for LAZ. To investigate whether EED independently explained linear growth, we used multivariable linear regression. Separate models for each biomarker during each age interval were fitted to estimate change in linear growth over the interval per SD increase in biomarker concentration assessed at the start of the age interval using this form:

$$E \left[ \frac{\text{LAZ}_{\text{end}} - \text{LAZ}_{\text{start}}}{\text{Age}_{\text{end}} - \text{Age}_{\text{start}}} \right] = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \times \text{Infant Sex} + \beta_2 \times \text{Infant Age}_{\text{start}} + \beta_3 \times \text{EED marker}_{\text{start}} + \sum \beta_i \times \text{adjustment covariate}_i \quad (4)$$

Minimally adjusted models included infant sex and age at the start of the growth interval. Fully adjusted models also included covariates selected for each model from a set of prespecified candidate variables (Supplemental Text 1) by best subset selection. Briefly, all possible combinations of the prespecified candidate variables were searched, using an efficient branch and bound algorithm, to identify the subset of variables that best explained growth velocity during a follow-up interval (58). The Akaike Information Criterion (AIC) was used to define the most explanatory subset of covariates (58). Multivariable models were also repeated following the aforementioned form, but substituting length (cm) for LAZ.

The robustness of model results to influential outlier observations was assessed by refitting each model after 95% winsorization of biomarker SDs from the mean at the start of each interval (59). In a sensitivity analysis to control for the effect of previous growth faltering on the association between EED and subsequent growth velocity, we refitted each model after excluding infants with stunting (LAZ < −2.0) at the start of each interval. We explored effect modification by infant sex with stratified analyses when the interaction term between sex and the biomarker in a regression for LAZ had a P value < 0.1; the same procedure was followed for potential effect modification by the IYCF treatment group.

To visualize trends in linear growth velocity by infant age and sex, we fitted generalized additive models of LAZ velocity and length velocity against infant age at the end of each follow-up interval using cubic splines with 3–5 knots for smoothing, chosen by AIC, and stratified by child sex. Weight-for-height z score (WHZ) velocity was not a focus of the article but has been calculated and included as supplementary data.

In further analyses we implemented analytic approaches used by other studies, for comparability. These included defining...
| **EED domain**                                      | **Biomarker**                                           | **Rationale and previous reports**                                                                 | **Assay**                                                                 | **Limit of detection** |
|---------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|
| **EED domain**                                     |                                                        |                                                                                                   |                                                                          |                        |
| **Altered intestinal architecture**                | Plasma intestinal fatty acid binding protein           | Found mostly at tips of small intestinal villi. Released into circulation after epithelial damage (48) | ELISA, Hycult Biotechnology, Uden, Netherlands                            | 47 pg/mL               |
|                                                   | Plasma citrulline                                      | Biomarker of total intestinal mass (38, 49)                                                       | Chromatography tandem MS with electrospray ionization, Waters, Wilmslow, United Kingdom | 100 ng/mL              |
| **Impaired intestinal regeneration**               | Fecal regenerating gene 1β                              | Stool regenerating gene protein, which is a measure of intestinal injury and repair (36, 38)       | ELISA, TECHLAB Inc, Blacksburg, VA, USA                                   | 0.625 ng/mL            |
| **Intestinal permeability**                        | Fecal α-1 antitrypsin                                  | Indicates leakage of plasma protein into intestine (35)                                           | ELISA, BioVendor, Brno, Czech Republic Prominence LC (Shimadzu) with mass spectrometer with electrospray ionization (Restek column SciexQTRAP5000) | 1.5 ng/mL, 1 ng/mL for both sugars |
|                                                   | Urinary lactulose:mannitol ratio                       | Uptake of large sugar (lactulose) through impaired intestinal barrier and reduced mannitol absorption due to reduced surface area (20) |                                                                          |                        |
| **Microbial translocation**                        | Plasma soluble CD14                                    | Marker of LPS stimulation of monocytes (50)                                                       | ELISA, R&D Systems, Minneapolis, MN, USA                                  | 125 pg/mL              |
| **Intestinal inflammation**                        | Fecal myeloperoxidase                                 | Biomarker of gut inflammation (51, 53)                                                            | ELISA, Immundiagnostik, Bensheim, Germany                                 | 1.6 ng/mL              |
|                                                   | Fecal neopterin                                       | Biomarker of gut inflammation (53)                                                               | ELISA, GenWay Biotech, Inc., San Diego, CA, USA                          | 0.7 nmol/L             |
| **Systemic sequelae**                              |                                                        |                                                                                                   |                                                                          |                        |
| **Systemic inflammation**                          | Plasma C-reactive protein                              | Acute-phase protein                                                                               | ELISA, R&D Systems, Minneapolis, MN, USA                                  | 0.01 ng/mL             |
|                                                   | Plasma kynurenine-to-tryptophan ratio                  | Induction of IDO enzyme in response to inflammation (52)                                          | Ultra-high performance LC tandem MS with electrospray ionization, Waters, Wilmslow, United Kingdom | 40 ng/mL (kynurenine) 200 ng/mL (Trp) |
| **Growth-hormone axis**                            | Plasma insulin-like growth factor 1                    | Required at growth plate to mediate effects of growth hormone (54, 55)                            | ELISA, R&D Systems, Minneapolis, MN, USA                                  | 0.026 ng/mL            |
|                                                   |                                                        |                                                                                                   |                                                                          |                        |

1EED, environmental enteric dysfunction; IDO, Indoleamine-pyrrole 2,3-dioxygenase.
the exposure at each time point in different ways to enable comparison across studies: 1) as quartiles of biomarker concentration (54), 2) as 2 quantiles of biomarker concentration (38), 3) fourth quartile and interquartile range (second + third quartiles) compared with the first quartile of biomarker concentration (51), and 4) the mean of biomarker concentration at all time points, after detrending for age and breastfeeding status (60). We also implemented the method used by the MAL-ED (The Etiology, Risk Factors, and Interactions of Enteric Infections and Malnutrition and the Consequences for Child Health and Development Project) study to evaluate the associations between EED biomarkers and linear growth by 18 mo of age, where the outcome was defined as LAZ divided into the ranges \(-2 \leq \text{LAZ} < -1\), or \(-1 \leq \text{LAZ} < 1\), and the measure of association was the cumulative odds of being in a lower LAZ category, when exposure was defined as the 25th compared with the 75th quartile of biomarker concentration (8).

Statistical significance was evaluated at \(\alpha = 0.05\). All analyses were conducted in R version 3.5.3 (Free Software Foundation). Best subset selection was performed using the function \texttt{lmSubsets()} in the package \texttt{lmSubsets} (61). Given the exploratory nature of these analyses, we prespecified in our statistical analysis plan that we would not account for multiple comparisons when reporting \(P\) values or CIs.

Ethics and regulatory oversight

The SHINE trial and the EED substudy were approved by the Medical Research Council of Zimbabwe and the Institutional Review Board of the Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health.

Results

Of 5270 women enrolled in the SHINE trial, there were 3989 live births to 3937 HIV-negative mothers. Among these dyads, 1153 mothers were enrolled into the trial during the EED substudy recruitment period and agreed for their 1169 infants to join the substudy. Of these, 33 infants (2.8%) died and 31 (2.7%) were lost to follow-up or withdrew before the 18 mo visit (Figure 1). Follow-up was lowest at the 1-mo study visit when many women were away from home living with extended family in the immediate postnatal period.

At baseline, about one-third of households in the EED substudy had improved sanitation and two-thirds obtained drinking water from an improved source. Women were generally of good nutritional status and well-educated: mean SD midupper arm circumference was 26.7 ± 3.3 cm, and years of schooling 9.6 ± 1.8 (Table 2). Among infants, 15% were born preterm and 8% were low birth weight (Table 2). Compared with mother–infant dyads not enrolled in the EED substudy, those enrolled had a higher household minimum dietary diversity score and a lower proportion of infants born preterm; other characteristics were similar (Supplemental Table 1). The baseline characteristics of infants enrolled in the EED substudy who provided specimens at each time point were similar to those who did not (Supplemental Table 1).

**Trends in linear growth velocity**

As expected, absolute growth velocity [\(\Delta\) length (cm/mo)] decelerated among boys and girls between birth and 18 mo (Supplemental Figure 1). Relative growth velocity (\(\Delta\) LAZ/mo) also decreased over this period as stunting prevalence increased (Supplemental Figure 1). For example, absolute mean growth velocity declined among boys from 2.90 cm/mo (95% CI: 2.81, 3.01 cm/mo) between 1 and 3 mo to 0.94 cm/mo (95% CI: 0.86, 1.02 cm/mo) between 12 and 18 mo; and among girls from 2.88 cm/mo (95% CI: 2.77, 2.98 cm/mo) between 1 and 3 mo to 0.90 cm/mo (95% CI: 0.82, 0.98 cm/mo) between 12 and 18 mo.

**Multivariable regression**

The adjusted and unadjusted mean (95% CI) LAZ velocities (\(\Delta\) LAZ/mo) associated with a 1-SD log increase in each biomarker at the start of each of the 4 age intervals are tabulated in Supplemental Table 2 and adjusted values are shown in Figure 2. [See Supplemental Table 3 for mean (95% CI), geometric mean (95% CI), and median [IQR] child age, LAZ, length, WHZ, and weight; and see Supplemental Table 4 for mean (95% CI), geometric mean (95% CI), and median [IQR] concentrations of biomarkers at each time point.] Supplemental Table 5 tabulates sensitivity analyses of the same associations, conducted to determine robustness to outlier biomarker values. In fully adjusted models, there were no associations between LAZ velocity and any indicator of changes characteristic of EED for intestinal structure [plasma intestinal fatty acid binding protein (1-FABP) and plasma citrulline]; intestinal regeneration [fetal regenerating gene 1\(\beta\) (REG-1-\(\beta\)); microbial translocation (plasma sCD14); or intestinal inflammation (fetal myeloperoxidase and fetal neopterin) during any of the 4 age intervals investigated (Figure 2, Supplemental Table 2). Increased urinary mannitol fractional excretion was associated with a small increase in mean (95% CI) LAZ velocity during the 6–12 mo interval (0.013 LAZ/mo; 0.001, 0.025 LAZ/mo) (Supplemental Table 2), but this association was neither robust to outliers (Supplemental Table 5) nor associated with LAZ velocity during other age intervals. There were no associations between other indicators of intestinal permeability (A1AT, LMR, and lactulose excretion fraction) and LAZ velocity during any age interval. Increased plasma kynurenine-to-tryptophan ratio (KTR) was associated with a small decrease in mean (95% CI) LAZ velocity between 12 and 18 mo (−0.015 LAZ/mo; −0.029, −0.001 LAZ/mo) but this association was neither robust to outliers nor observed during other age intervals. Other indicators of systemic inflammation (plasma C-reactive protein, kynurenine, and tryptophan) were not associated with LAZ velocity during any age interval. Plasma IGF-1 measured at 1 mo of age was associated with a mean (95% CI) increase in LAZ velocity during the 1–3 mo interval only (0.118; 0.024, 0.211 LAZ/mo) and was robust to outliers. The EE score was not associated with LAZ velocity during any age interval.

In a sensitivity analysis which excluded infants who were already stunted at the start of each age interval, mean (95% CI) LAZ velocity was positively associated with plasma IGF-1 during 2 intervals (1–3 mo: 0.076; 0.016, 0.136 LAZ/mo; \(P = 0.013\) and 12–18 mo: 0.020; 0.004, 0.035 LAZ/mo) and negatively associated with plasma KTR between 12 and 18...
6 Mutasa et al.

5280 pregnant women enrolled

1 erroneously enrolled once for 2 pregnancies

5270 pregnant women enrolled

1333 excluded
49 withdrew
90 lost to follow-up
249 miscarried
101 stillbirths
726 HIV positive
114 unknown HIV status
4 died

3937 HIV-negative women

2784 not enrolled in EED substudy

1169 live births to 1153 women

20 infants died; 3 lost to follow-up

1146 eligible, 662 (58%) provided ≥ 1 specimen
472 A1AT; 478 MPO; 475 NEO; 442 REG-1β; 662 CRP;
663 I-FABP; 660 IGF-1; 662 sCD14; 630 CIT; 630 KTR; 0 LM

0 infants died; 2 lost to follow-up

1144 eligible, 769 (67%) provided ≥ 1 specimen
523 A1AT; 531 MPO; 516 NEO; 487 REG-1β; 769 CRP;
768 I-FABP; 767 IGF-1; 768 sCD14; 723 CIT; 723 KTR; 430 LM

4 infants died; 11 lost to follow-up

1129 eligible, 886 (78%) provided ≥ 1 specimen
820 A1AT; 821 MPO; 812 NEO; 796 REG-1β; 886 CRP;
886 I-FABP; 886 IGF-1; 886 sCD14; 827 CIT; 827 KTR; 553 LM

9 infants died; 7 lost to follow-up

1113 eligible, 895 (80%) provided ≥ 1 specimen
898 A1AT; 896 MPO; 890 NEO; 882 REG-1β; 895 CRP;
895 I-FABP; 895 IGF-1; 895 sCD14; 836 CIT; 836 KTR; 546 LM

0 infants died; 8 lost to follow-up

1105 eligible, 997 (90%) provided ≥ 1 specimen
940 A1AT; 941 MPO; 940 NEO; 910 REG-1β; 997 CRP;
997 I-FABP; 997 IGF-1; 997 sCD14; 0 CIT; 0 KTR; 827 LM

FIGURE 1 Flow of participants through the trial. A1AT, fecal α-1 antitrypsin; CIT, plasma citrulline; CRP, plasma C-reactive protein; EED, environmental enteric dysfunction; I-FABP, plasma intestinal fatty acid binding protein; IGF-1, insulin-like growth factor 1; KTR, kynurenine-to-tryptophan ratio; LM, lactulose–mannitol; LMR, lactulose-to-mannitol ratio (urinary); MPO, fecal myeloperoxidase; NEO, fecal neopterin; REG-1β, fecal regenerating gene 1β; sCD14, plasma soluble CD14.

mo (−0.019; −0.037, −0.001 LAZ/mo) (Supplemental Table 6). Among these nonstunted infants, increased mean (95% CI) plasma I-FABP was associated with LAZ velocity during 2 age intervals, but in opposite directions: (+0.053; 0.013, 0.094 LAZ/mo during the 1–3 mo interval; and −0.009; 95% CI: −0.017, −0.001 LAZ/mo during the 6–12 mo interval). No other significant associations between biomarkers and LAZ velocity were observed among nonstunted infants. In investigating
TABLE 2 Maternal, household, and infant baseline characteristics of HIV-negative mothers and live-born infants enrolled in the SHINE (Sanitation Hygiene Infant Nutrition Efficacy) environmental enteric dysfunction substudy.

| Baseline characteristic                          | Value                                                                 |
|------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Mothers, n                                      | 1153                                                                |
| Infants, n                                      | 1169                                                                |
| Household characteristics                       |                                                                      |
| Occupants, n                                    | 5 [3–6]                                                             |
| Wealth quintile                                 |                                                                      |
| 1 (lowest)                                      | 199 of 1124 (17.7%)                                                 |
| 2                                               | 229 of 1124 (20.4%)                                                 |
| 3                                               | 237 of 1124 (21.1%)                                                 |
| 4                                               | 232 of 1124 (20.6%)                                                 |
| 5 (highest)                                     | 227 of 1124 (20.2%)                                                 |
| Improved latrine at household                   | 343 of 1100 (31.2%)                                                 |
| Main source of household drinking water improved | 690 of 1103 (62.6%)                                                 |
| Household meets Minimum Dietary Diversity Score  | 472 of 1003 (47.1%)                                                 |
| Coping Strategies Index score                   | 0 [0–5]                                                             |
| Maternal characteristics                        |                                                                      |
| Age, y                                          | 26.5 ± 6.7                                                          |
| Height, cm                                      | 160.0 ± 7.7                                                         |
| Midupper arm circumference, cm                  | 26.7 ± 3.3                                                          |
| Years of schooling completed                    | 9.6 ± 1.8                                                           |
| Married                                         | 1070 of 1131 (94.6%)                                                |
| Religion                                        |                                                                      |
| Apostolic                                       | 550 of 1138 (48.3%)                                                 |
| Other Christian                                 | 514 of 1138 (45.2%)                                                 |
| Other                                           | 74 of 1138 (6.5%)                                                   |
| Ever booked antenatal care                      | 1060 of 1068 (99.3%)                                                |
| Maternal anemia at baseline (Hb <12 g/dL)       | 158 of 1013 (15.6%)                                                 |
| Infant characteristics                          |                                                                      |
| Female sex                                      | 567 of 1167 (48.6%)                                                 |
| Birth weight, kg                                | 3.1 ± 0.5                                                           |
| Birth weight <2500 g                            | 89 of 1113 (8.0%)                                                   |
| Preterm <37 weeks of gestation                  | 112 of 759 (14.8%)                                                  |
| Vaginal delivery                                | 1056 of 1136 (93.0%)                                                |
| Institutional delivery                          | 1006 of 1120 (89.8%)                                                |
| Trial arm                                       |                                                                      |
| IYCF                                           | 620 of 1169 (53.0%)                                                 |
| Non-IYCF                                       | 549 of 1169 (47.0%)                                                 |
| WASH                                           | 502 of 1169 (42.9%)                                                 |
| Non-WASH                                       | 667 of 1169 (57.1%)                                                 |

1. Values are n, n (%), mean ± SD, or median [IQR]. Baseline variables are presented for mothers who had live births. Maternal and household data were collected ~2 wk after consent was recorded. Baseline for infants was at birth. Hb, hemoglobin; IYCF, infant and young child feeding; WASH, water, sanitation, and hygiene.

Potential effect modification by infant sex, gut inflammation (fecal myeloperoxidase) or permeability (fecal A1AT) may have had a greater adverse effect on LAZ velocity among girls (Supplemental Table 7). The IYCF treatment group did not consistently modify the association between biomarkers and LAZ velocity (Supplemental Table 8).

When growth velocity was defined as change in absolute length per month, plasma IGF-1 was associated with significant mean (95% CI) increases in growth velocity during 2 age intervals (1–3 mo: 0.246; 0.052, 0.440 cm/mo and 12–18 mo: 0.039; 0.002, 0.077 cm/mo) and plasma KTR was associated with reduced growth velocity between 12 and 18 mo (−0.046; −0.087, −0.005 cm/mo) (Table 3) (58). No other associations between biomarkers and change in length per month were observed.

In further analyses, different definitions of biomarker exposure at the start of each age interval which have been reported in the literature were applied. When biomarker concentration was categorized by quartiles (Supplemental Table 9), LAZ velocity was significantly greater during the 12–18 mo interval for I-FABP concentration in the fourth than in the first quartile (0.035; 0.003, 0.066 LAZ/mo); during the 1–3 mo (0.191; 0.011, 0.370 LAZ/mo) and 3–6 mo (−0.102; −0.196, −0.008 LAZ/mo) intervals for IGF-1 concentration in the fourth than in the first quartile at the start of the interval; and during the 6–12 mo interval for mannitol concentration in the fourth than in the first quartile (0.051; 0.005, 0.097 LAZ/mo). When the second and third quartiles of biomarker concentration were collapsed (the IQR) and compared with the first quartile (Supplemental Table 10), LMR was associated with a reduction in LAZ (−0.049; −0.094, −0.004 LAZ/mo) during the 6–12 mo interval for mannitol concentration in the fourth than in the first quartile (0.051; 0.005, 0.097 LAZ/mo). When the second and third quartiles of biomarker concentration were collapsed (the IQR) and compared with the first quartile (Supplemental Table 10), LMR was associated with a reduction in LAZ (−0.049; −0.094, −0.004 LAZ/mo) during the 6–12 mo interval. Finally, when biomarker exposure was defined in 2 quantiles (Supplemental Table 11), LAZ velocity was associated with fecal A1AT during the 6–12 mo interval (−0.027; −0.051, −0.002 LAZ/mo) and in the opposite direction during the 12–18 mo interval (+0.043;
Mutasa et al.

FIGURE 2 Adjusted mean change in LAZ (SD/mo) per 1-SD increase in biomarker concentration at the start of each follow-up interval. The mean (95% CI) LAZsat1,3,6,12, and18mo of age were $-0.84 (-0.93, -0.75)$; $-0.85 (-0.92, -0.77)$; $-0.84 (-0.91, -0.76)$; $-1.13 (-1.20, -1.07)$; and $-1.42 (-1.48, -1.36)$, respectively. A1AT, fecal α1 antitrypsin; CRP, plasma C-reactive protein; EE score, environmental enteropathy score; I-FABP, plasma intestinal fatty acid binding protein; IGF-1, insulin-like growth factor 1; KTR, kynurenine-to-tryptophan ratio; LAZ, length-for-age z score; LMR, lactulose-to-mannitol ratio (urinary); MPO, fecal myeloperoxidase; NEO, fecal neopterin; REG-1β, fecal regenerating gene 1β; sCD14, plasma soluble CD14.

0.005, 0.081 LAZ/mo); with fecal MPO during the 6–12 mo interval ($-0.027; -0.054, -0.001$ LAZ/mo); and with IGF-1 during the 1–3 mo interval ($0.164; 0.022, 0.305$ LAZ/mo).

In further analyses implementing the analytic method used by the MAL-ED study in evaluating EED and attained growth at 2 y, we used ordinal logistic regression to estimate the cumulative OR of attaining the higher or highest compared with the lowest LAZ group (lowest: LAZ < $-2$, higher: $-2 \leq$ LAZ < $-1$, highest $\geq -1$) at 18 mo for the highest compared with the lowest biomarker quartile: KTR was associated with increased odds of attaining the lowest LAZ, whereas REG1β, IGF-1, and tryptophan were associated with reduced odds of attaining the lowest LAZ (Supplemental Table 12). Finally, in adapting the method used by the MAL-ED study for evaluating EED and attained growth at 5 y, the variable representing exposure to each biomarker was calculated by detrending each ln-transformed measurement of the biomarker for age and whether or not the child consumed any breast milk by regression, and then calculating the mean of the residuals from these models. We found 2 significant associations. Higher mean IGF-1 was associated with higher LAZ at 18 mo, and higher mean fecal REG-1β was associated with higher LAZ at 18 mo (Supplemental Table 13). No consistent associations were observed between indicators of EED and change in weight (Supplemental Table 14) or WHZ (Supplemental Table 15).

Discussion

The hypothesis of the SHINE trial was that EED is common in settings of poor sanitation and hygiene and is a major underlying cause of stunting. We have previously reported that rural Zimbabwean infants had substantial derangements in gut structure and evidence of chronic intestinal inflammation, consistent with EED (62). In this article, we assessed the magnitude and strength of association between EED biomarkers...
TABLE 3  Mean change in length (cm/mo) during 4 age intervals per 1-SD increase in biomarker concentration at the start of the interval1

| Biomarker                                  | Interval          | n    | β (95% CI)     | P value | n    | β (95% CI)     | P value |
|--------------------------------------------|-------------------|------|---------------|---------|------|---------------|---------|
| Intestinal fatty acid binding protein      |                   |      |               |         |      |               |         |
| C-reactive protein                         | 1–3 mo            | 557  | 0.109 (0.014, 0.204) | 0.024   | 521  | 0.070 (−0.021, 0.162) | 0.132   |
| Lactulose:mannitol ratio                   | 3–6 mo            | 693  | −0.041 (−0.145, 0.063) | 0.437   | 658  | −0.051 (−0.155, 0.053) | 0.338   |
| Citrulline                                 | 6–12 mo           | 797  | 0.025 (−0.089, 0.139) | 0.668   | 698  | 0.021 (−0.091, 0.134) | 0.713   |
| Soluble CD14                               | 12–18 mo          | 882  | −0.021 (−0.057, 0.016) | 0.265   | 762  | 0.005 (−0.018, 0.029) | 0.650   |
| Regenerating protein 1-β                   |                   |      |               |         |      |               |         |
| A/AT                                       | 1–3 mo            | 369  | −0.031 (−0.157, 0.096) | 0.634   | 354  | −0.065 (−0.181, 0.051) | 0.272   |
| Lactulose excretion fraction               | 3–6 mo            | 438  | −0.078 (−0.143, −0.012) | 0.020   | 433  | −0.049 (−0.120, 0.021) | 0.168   |
| Lactulose:mannitol ratio                   | 6–12 mo           | 722  | −0.016 (−0.046, 0.013) | 0.274   | 683  | −0.013 (−0.042, 0.016) | 0.388   |
| Lactulose excretion fraction               | 12–18 mo          | 869  | −0.027 (−0.067, 0.014) | 0.201   | 755  | 0.005 (−0.022, 0.033) | 0.696   |
| Mannitol excretion fraction                |                   |      |               |         |      |               |         |
| Soluble CD14                               | 3–6 mo            | 404  | 0.191 (0.036, 0.346) | 0.016   | 386  | 0.140 (−0.032, 0.312) | 0.111   |
| Soluble CD14                               | 6–12 mo           | 509  | −0.006 (−0.032, 0.020) | 0.628   | 464  | −0.009 (−0.050, 0.033) | 0.683   |
| Soluble CD14                               | 12–18 mo          | 538  | 0.011 (−0.073, 0.095) | 0.800   | 515  | −0.015 (−0.068, 0.039) | 0.589   |
| Lactulose:mannitol ratio                   | 3–6 mo            | 407  | −0.071 (−0.584, 0.442) | 0.786   | 389  | −0.060 (−0.527, 0.407) | 0.802   |
| Lactulose:mannitol ratio                   | 6–12 mo           | 510  | −0.001 (−0.044, 0.041) | 0.947   | 465  | −0.008 (−0.047, 0.031) | 0.681   |
| Lactulose:mannitol ratio                   | 12–18 mo          | 557  | −0.020 (−0.042, 0.001) | 0.065   | 533  | −0.036 (−0.078, 0.007) | 0.101   |
| Myeloperoxidase                            |                   |      |               |         |      |               |         |
| Neopterin                                  | 1–3 mo            | 556  | −0.045 (−0.189, 0.099) | 0.540   | 520  | 0.026 (−0.129, 0.181) | 0.741   |
| Neopterin                                  | 3–6 mo            | 694  | −0.065 (−0.181, 0.051) | 0.270   | 693  | −0.062 (−0.194, 0.070) | 0.357   |
| Neopterin                                  | 6–12 mo           | 797  | 0.002 (−0.027, 0.030) | 0.917   | 698  | −0.001 (−0.028, 0.027) | 0.966   |
| Neopterin                                  | 12–18 mo          | 882  | 0.002 (−0.042, 0.046) | 0.934   | 762  | −0.009 (−0.067, 0.049) | 0.759   |
| C-reactive protein                         |                   |      |               |         |      |               |         |
| Kynurenine:tryptophan ratio                | 3–6 mo            | 612  | 0.125 (−0.110, 0.361) | 0.297   | 581  | 0.159 (−0.148, 0.466) | 0.310   |
| Kynurenine:tryptophan ratio                | 6–12 mo           | 725  | −0.011 (−0.052, 0.030) | 0.611   | 665  | −0.012 (−0.052, 0.028) | 0.567   |
| Kynurenine:tryptophan ratio                | 12–18 mo          | 801  | −0.031 (−0.057, −0.006) | 0.016   | 757  | −0.046 (−0.087, 0.005) | 0.029   |

(Continued)
and linear growth velocity in >1000 HIV-unexposed children. Although these analyses are observational, the longitudinal cohort design strengthens causal inference. We defined our outcome as the relative (Δ LAZ/mo) and absolute (Δ length/mo) growth velocity during 4 age intervals per log increase in each of 11 biomarkers assessed at the start of the interval. Using our prespecified analytic approach, we observed 3 statistically significant, but small associations: KTR at 12 mo was associated with a decrease in LAZ velocity between 12 and 18 mo, mannitol excretion was associated with an increase in LAZ velocity between 6 and 12 mo, and plasma IGF-1 was associated with an increase in LAZ velocity during the 12–18 mo interval. We found no other associations between any EED biomarker and relative or absolute linear growth velocity than the entire distribution of the biomarker, yield more statistically significant associations between biomarkers and growth. This suggests that biomarkers do capture some component of underlying pathology; however, the lack of association between the full distributions of biomarkers and growth indicates the biomarkers explain very little of the variability in linear growth velocity. In an analysis of the children in the Peru site of the MAL-ED study, Colston et al. (34) showed that fecal A1AT, α-1 antitrypsin; EE score, environmental enteropathy score.

TABLE 3 (Continued)

| Interval | Minimally adjusted2 | | | Fully adjusted3 | |
|----------|---------------------|---|---|----------------|---|
| Kynurenine | | | | | |
| 1–3 mo | 529 | 0.053 (−0.064, 0.170) | 0.376 | 496 | 0.042 (−0.065, 0.148) | 0.445 |
| 3–6 mo | 658 | 0.101 (−0.067, 0.268) | 0.240 | 657 | 0.111 (−0.105, 0.327) | 0.314 |
| 6–12 mo | 745 | −0.002 (−0.033, 0.029) | 0.899 | 656 | −0.013 (−0.044, 0.018) | 0.406 |
| 12–18 mo | 824 | −0.016 (−0.075, 0.043) | 0.597 | 791 | −0.013 (−0.069, 0.043) | 0.648 |
| Tryptophan | | | | | |
| 1–3 mo | 529 | −0.002 (−0.148, 0.144) | 0.983 | 496 | −0.018 (−0.163, 0.127) | 0.807 |
| 3–6 mo | 658 | 0.015 (−0.099, 0.129) | 0.799 | 657 | −0.005 (−0.113, 0.103) | 0.926 |
| 6–12 mo | 745 | −0.002 (−0.030, 0.027) | 0.910 | 656 | −0.006 (−0.033, 0.022) | 0.689 |
| 12–18 mo | 824 | −0.001 (−0.066, 0.063) | 0.971 | 791 | 0.017 (−0.044, 0.078) | 0.588 |
| Insulin-like growth factor-1 | | | | | |
| 1–3 mo | 554 | 0.230 (0.031, 0.428) | 0.023 | 518 | 0.246 (0.052, 0.440) | 0.013 |
| 3–6 mo | 693 | −0.003 (−0.076, 0.070) | 0.937 | 658 | −0.031 (−0.114, 0.052) | 0.462 |
| 6–12 mo | 797 | 0.031 (0.010, 0.053) | 0.004 | 698 | 0.014 (−0.010, 0.037) | 0.249 |
| 12–18 mo | 882 | 0.034 (0.005, 0.062) | 0.023 | 762 | 0.039 (0.002, 0.077) | 0.041 |

1 Results from multivariable linear regression. See Supplemental Table 16 for lists of the retained variables in each model. A1AT, α-1 antitrypsin; EE score, environmental enteropathy score.
2 Adjusted for infant age and sex at the beginning of the interval.
3 Adjusted for the most explanatory subset identified from a list of prespecified candidate covariates (see Supplemental Text 1) by the Akaike Information Criterion (58).

Findings from previous studies investigating child growth and EED have reported highly heterogeneous results. A systematic review of EED and growth studies published between 2010 and early 2017 showed that for every biomarker reported, there were numerous studies that both did and did not provide evidence supporting an association with child growth (30). For example, LMR, the oldest and most commonly studied EED biomarker, was inversely associated with linear growth velocity in studies in The Gambia (20, 33), Malawi (63), Bangladesh (64), and Brazil (38), but not associated with attained linear growth in Malawi (65) or Burkina Faso (66), and not associated with attained LAZ quartile at 2 y in the MAL-ED study (53). In evaluating the association of LMR with attained height-for-age z score at 5 y of age in the MAL-ED study, none of the LMRs assessed during the first 2 y of life were individually associated, but the detrended mean of the LMRs across the first 2 y was (60). Moreover, a recent study demonstrated that, contrary to traditionally held assumptions, mannitol and lactulose are both absorbed through normal-regulated and pathologic-unrestricted pathways; this work challenges our traditional understanding that urinary mannitol reflects only normal absorption whereas urinary lactulose reflects only pathologic translocation, thereby questioning the underlying assumption of the test (67). Many factors contribute to this heterogeneity in the literature. First, there are substantial differences in defining the exposure and outcome variables, which we explored in our data. In general, analytic approaches that compare extremes of growth outcomes (i.e., normal compared with stunted or highest compared with lowest LAZ quartile) rather than Δ LAZ across the entire distribution of growth, or that compare the extremes of biomarker concentration (i.e., first compared with fourth quartile) rather than the entire distribution of the biomarker, yield more statistically significant associations between biomarkers and growth. This suggests that biomarkers do capture some component of underlying pathology; however, the lack of association between the full distributions of biomarkers and growth indicates the biomarkers explain very little of the variability in linear growth velocity.
associations between fecal A1AT or myeloperoxidase and LAZ were very dynamic over the first 3 y of life in Peru, such that the magnitude and direction of association between these biomarkers and LAZ varied by age (34). Fourth, variability in the length of the growth interval after biomarker measurement contributes to the heterogeneity of study findings. In the Peru and Tanzania MAL-ED sites, the association between plasma tryptophan concentration and subsequent growth varied in a U-shaped function with increasing length of age interval assessed: each log increase in plasma tryptophan was associated with +0.05 LAZ when the interval length was 1 mo or 10 mo, but +0.11 LAZ for a 6-mo interval length. Fifth, the association between EED biomarkers and growth may be modified by child sex, as we observed in a sensitivity analysis in this study; this may reflect sex differences in inflammatory and immune responses to infection (68). Sixth, during the first 2 y after birth, absolute growth velocity (Δ length/mo) rapidly decelerates among all children and, among children in LMICs, relative growth velocity (Δ LAZ/mo) declines as stunting prevalence increases. Moreover, the shape of this decline varies for different global regions: in South Asia, LAZ velocity begins decelerating soon after birth, whereas in Africa, this deceleration typically begins after 6 mo. Thus, because both biomarker exposure and growth outcomes are dynamic with age, the association between these factors also changes with age. Finally, child growth is dependent on a myriad of factors other than gut health which may differ across studies, and impede the ability to identify true associations between biomarkers and growth where they exist.

Two concepts remain well-established. First, EED is virtually ubiquitous among people living in resource-poor unsanitary living conditions in LMICs. In studies based on intestinal biopsies, rather than biomarkers, mostly conducted in the 1960s in Asia (69–72), Africa (73–76), and Central America (77, 78), the intestinal characteristics of EED were observed in virtually all asymptomatic adults, as well as infants and young children (74, 79, 80). Second, although we lack empirical evidence that EED causes stunting, there is evidence that EED increases the risk of stunting. Growth depends not only on sufficient dietary intake of macro- and micronutrients, but also on their absorption and utilization. EED reduces absorptive surface area, and reduces or eliminates microvilli where numerous digestive enzymes are produced and nutrient absorption primarily occurs. EED also reduces gut barrier function which enables microbial translocation and chronic immune activation, thereby repartitioning nutrients away from growth to synthesize acute-phase proteins, and to fuel an increased metabolic rate (81). These mechanisms are well known in other inflammatory gut diseases (82, 83) and in animal models (84). Although it is possible that biological (e.g., reduced metabolic rate) or behavioral (e.g., reduced energy expenditure or increased energy intake) compensation mechanisms may dampen the adverse effects of EED, it is unlikely these mechanisms could eliminate the effects of EED on growth. Thus, the absence of consistent associations of clinically important magnitude between EED biomarkers and growth probably reflects the poor sensitivity and specificity of the biomarkers to capture EED, other unmeasured factors besides EED which also affect these biomarkers, and their short half-life. In addition, growth is saltatory: infants have “bursts” of linear growth (85) followed by long periods of stasis; therefore, intermittent measurement of biomarkers may not capture underlying pathology in the subset of children experiencing growth spurts at that time.

SHINE implemented a WASH intervention to test the hypothesis that reducing enteropathogen exposure would ameliorate EED and enhance linear growth. However, because the WASH intervention did not reduce enteropathogen infection, the hypothesized causal chain of events from enteropathogen exposure through EED to linear growth was not affected by our interventions. The WASH Benefits trials conducted in Bangladesh and Kenya tested similar low-cost WASH interventions and also found limited or no impact on enteropathogen infection, EED biomarkers, and linear growth (86, 87). Consensus articles arising from these trials have called for “transformative WASH”—interventions which drastically reduce child exposure to environmental pathogens (88, 89). The 3 trials could not test the hypothesis that EED causes stunting because the WASH interventions did not reduce EED. This article further demonstrates that none of the 11 biomarkers measured among children enrolled in the SHINE trial were consistently associated with linear growth during the first 18 mo after birth: of our 64 main comparisons, only 3 were statistically significant at the 0.05 level, almost exactly what would be expected by chance when testing 64 independent truly null hypotheses.

Further studies are needed to determine whether EED is deleterious in settings of high pathogen burden, to develop new biomarkers with greater sensitivity and specificity to identify EED, and to evaluate preventive and therapeutic interventions. Recent (90) and ongoing (91) studies which correlate EED biomarkers with greater sensitivity and specificity to identify EED, and to evaluate preventive and therapeutic interventions. The WASH Benefits trials conducted in Bangladesh and Kenya tested similar low-cost WASH interventions and also found limited or no impact on enteropathogen infection, EED biomarkers, and linear growth (86, 87). Consensus articles arising from these trials have called for “transformative WASH”—interventions which drastically reduce child exposure to environmental pathogens (88, 89). The 3 trials could not test the hypothesis that EED causes stunting because the WASH interventions did not reduce EED. This article further demonstrates that none of the 11 biomarkers measured among children enrolled in the SHINE trial were consistently associated with linear growth during the first 18 mo after birth: of our 64 main comparisons, only 3 were statistically significant at the 0.05 level, almost exactly what would be expected by chance when testing 64 independent truly null hypotheses.

We thank Gordana Panic and Natasa Giallourou for laboratory analyses conducted at Imperial College, and Mark Jamell and Peter Kosek for laboratory analyses conducted at Oregon Analytic Oregon, Corvallis, OR, USA. We thank Professor Bill Petri for the generous donation of REG-1® kits.

The authors’ responsibilities were as follows—KM, SR, and MG: conducted laboratory studies in the Zvitambo laboratory; FDM and NT: oversaw the collection of specimens and field work; RN: developed the laboratory information system; MNNM, JHJ, RJS, and AJP: designed the study; EKG and LHM: conducted the statistical analysis; EKG, JHJ, and AJP: wrote the manuscript; and all authors: contributed to interpretation of the data and preparation of the manuscript, and read and approved the final manuscript. The authors report no conflicts of interest.

Data Availability

Data described in the article, code book, and analytic code will be made publicly and freely available without restriction at ClinEpi Data Repository, University of Pennsylvania.

References

1. UNICEF. World Health Organization, International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank. Levels and trends in child malnutrition: key findings of the 2019 edition of the Joint Child Malnutrition Estimates. Geneva: WHO; 2019.
2. De Onis M, Habicht JP. Anthropometric reference data for international use: recommendations from a World Health Organization Expert Committee. Am J Clin Nutr 1996;64:650–8.
3. Victora CG, De Onis M, Hallal PC, Blössner M, Shrimpton R. Worldwide timing of growth faltering: revisiting implications for interventions. Pediatrics 2010;125:e473–e80.

4. Victora CG, Adair L, Fall C, Hallal PC, Martorell R, Richter L, Sachdev HS. Maternal and Child Undernutrition Study Group. Maternal and child undernutrition: consequences for adult health and human capital. Lancet 2008;371:340–57.

5. Vollmer S, Hartgenn K, Subramanyan MA, Finlay J, Klasen S, Subramanian SV. Association between economic growth and early childhood undernutrition: evidence from 121 Demographic and Health Surveys from 36 low-income and middle-income countries. Lancet Glob Health 2014;2:e225–e34.

6. Adair LS, Fall CH, Osmond C, Stein AD, Martorell R, Ramirez-Zea M, Sachdev HS, Dahly DL, Bas I, Norris SA, et al. Associations of linear growth and relative weight gain during early life with adult health and human capital in countries of low and middle income: findings from five birth cohort studies. Lancet 2013;382:253–34.

7. Restrepo-Méndez MC, Barros AJ, Black RE, Victora CG. Time trends in socio-economic inequalities in stunting prevalence: analyses of repeated national surveys. Public Health Nutr 2015;18:2097–104.

8. MAL-ED Network Investigators. Childhood stunting in relation to the pre- and postnatal environment during the first 2 years of life: the MAL-ED longitudinal birth cohort study. PLoS Med 2017;14(10):e1002408.

9. Korpe PS, Petri WA Jr. Environmental enteropathy: critical implications of a poorly understood condition. Trends Mol Med 2012;18:328–36.

10. Dewey KG, Adu-Afarwuah S. Systematic review of the efficacy and effectiveness of complementary feeding interventions in developing countries. Matern Child Nutr 2008;4(Suppl 1):24–85.

11. creekley W, Buckley G, Gilman RH, Assis AMO, Guerrant RL, Morris SS, Molbak K, Valdés-Brath P, Lanata CF, Black RE, et al. Multi-country analysis of the effects of diarrhoea on childhood stunting. Int J Epidemiol 2008;37:816–30.

12. Richard SA, Black RE, Gilman RH, Guerrant RL, Kang G, Lanata CF, Maje FD, Smith LE, Panic G, et al. Environmental enteropathy as predictors of growth in infants: an example from a Peruvian birth cohort. Am J Clin Nutr 2017;106:245–55.

13. Prendergast AJ, Kelly P. Enteropathies in the developing world: neglected effects on global health. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2012;86:756–63.

14. Dewey KG, Mayers DR. Early child growth: how do nutrition and infection interact? Matern Child Nutr 2011;7(Suppl 3):129–42.

15. Harper KM, Mutasa M, Prendergast AJ, Humphrey J, Manges AR. Environmental enteric dysfunction pathways and child stunting: a systematic review. Clin Infect Dis 2014;59(Suppl 4):S239–S47.

16. Neufeld LM, Haas JD, Grajeda R, Martorell R. Changes in maternal weight from the first to second trimester of pregnancy are associated with fetal growth and infant length at birth. Am J Clin Nutr 2004;79:646–52.

17. Addo OY, Stein AD, Fall CH, Gigante DP, Guntupalli AM, Horta BL, Kuzawa CW, Lee N, Norris SA, Prabhakaran P. Maternal height and child growth patterns. J Pediatr 2013;163:549–54.e541.

18. Howe LD, Tilling K, Galobardes B, Smith GD, Gunnell D, Lawlor DA. Socioeconomic differences in childhood growth trajectories: at what age do height inequalities emerge? J Epidemiol Community Health 2012;66:143–8.

19. Christian P, Lee SE, Donahue Angel M, Adair LS, Arifeen SE, Ashorn L, Mullen A, Gibson RS. Micronutrient adequacy and dietary diversity long-term association with length. Am J Epidemiol 2013;178:1129–38.

20. Dewey KG, Adu-Afarwuah S, Degan C, Guerrant RL, Lavery JV, Nation JP, Rosenberg BH, Ryan ET, Tarr PI, et al. Environmental enteric dysfunction: pathogenesis, diagnosis, and clinical consequences. Clin Infect Dis 2014;59(Suppl 4):S207–S12.

21. Creese GT, Denno DM, Black RE, Duggan C, Guerrant RL, Lavery JV, Nation JP, Rosenberg BH, Ryan ET, Tarr PI, et al. Environmental enteric dysfunction in rural Malawian children aged 12–35 months in a randomized controlled trial. J Nutr 2016;147:97–103.

22. Smith HE, Ryan KN, Stephenson KB, Westcott C, Thakwalakwa C, Maleka KM, Devaraj S, Manary MJ, Trehan I. A combined intervention of zinc, multiple micronutrients, and albendazole does not ameliorate environmental enteric dysfunction or stunting in rural Malawian children in a double-blind randomized controlled trial. J Nutr 2015;146:2059–65.

23. Campbell DI, Elia M, Lunn PG. Growth faltering in rural Gambian infants is associated with impaired small intestinal barrier function, leading to endotoxia and systemic inflammation. J Nutr 2003;133:1332–8.

24. Colston JM, Peñataro Yori P, Colantuoni E, Moulton LH, Ambikapathi R, Lee G, Rengifo Trigoso D, Siguas Salas M, Kosek MN. A methodologic framework for modeling and assessing biomarkers of environmental enteropathy as predictors of growth in infants: an example from a Peruvian birth cohort. Am J Clin Nutr 2017;106:245–55.

25. Korpe PS, Petri WA Jr. Environmental enteropathy: critical implications of a poorly understood condition. Trends Mol Med 2012;18:328–36.

26. Crane RJ, Jones KD, Berkley JA. Environmental enteric dysfunction: an overview. Food Nutr Bull 2015;36:567–587.

27. Petri PS, Petri WA Jr. Environmental enteropathy: critical implications of a poorly understood condition. Trends Mol Med 2012;18:328–36.

28. Rush RK, Holmes HM, Treasure ML, Reddy VM, et al. Environmental enteric dysfunction among children in rural Bangladesh. J Pediatr Gastroenterol Nutr 2017;65:40–6.

29. Guerrant RL, Leite AM, Pinkerton R, Cavalcante PE, DeBoer M, Kosek M, Duggan C, Gewirtz A, Kagan JC. Biomarkers of environmental enteropathy, inflammation, stunting, and impaired growth in children in northeast Brazil. PLoS One 2016;11:e0158772.

30. Petersen KM, Buss J, Easley R, Yang Z, Korpe PS, Niu F, Ma JZ, Olortegui MP, Haque R, Kosek MN. REG1B is a predictor of childhood stunting in Bangladesh and Peru. Am J Clin Nutr 2013;97:1129–33.

31. Campbell DI, Schulze KJ, Sinclair M, Ali H, Lunn PG, Stoltzfus RJ, et al. The Sanitation Hygiene Infant Nutrition Efficacy (SHINE) trial: rationale, design, and methods. Clin Infect Dis 2015;61:S685–S702.

32. Humphrey JH. Child undernutrition, tropical enteropathy, toilets, and handwashing. Lancet 2009;374:1032–5.

33. Harper KM, Mutasa M, Prendergast AJ, Humphrey J, Manges AR. Environmental enteric dysfunction pathways and child stunting: a systematic review. Clin Infect Dis 2014;59(Suppl 4):S239–S47.

34. Colston JM, Peñataro Yori P, Colantuoni E, Moulton LH, Ambikapathi R, Lee G, Rengifo Trigoso D, Siguas Salas M, Kosek MN. A methodologic framework for modeling and assessing biomarkers of environmental enteropathy as predictors of growth in infants: an example from a Peruvian birth cohort. Am J Clin Nutr 2017;106:245–55.

35. Korpe PS, Petri WA Jr. Environmental enteropathy: critical implications of a poorly understood condition. Trends Mol Med 2012;18:328–36.

36. Peterson KM, Buss J, Easley R, Yang Z, Korpe PS, Niu F, Ma JZ, Olortegui MP, Haque R, Kosek MN. REG1B is a predictor of childhood stunting in Bangladesh and Peru. Am J Clin Nutr 2013;97:1129–33.

37. Campbell DI, Schulze KJ, Sinclair M, Ali H, Lunn PG, Stoltzfus RJ, et al. The Sanitation Hygiene Infant Nutrition Efficacy (SHINE) trial: rationale, design, and methods. Clin Infect Dis 2015;61:S685–S702.

38. Rush RK, Holmes HM, Treasure ML, Reddy VM, et al. Environmental enteric dysfunction among children in rural Bangladesh. J Pediatr Gastroenterol Nutr 2017;65:40–6.

39. Guerrant RL, Leite AM, Pinkerton R, Cavalcante PE, DeBoer M, Kosek M, Duggan C, Gewirtz A, Kagan JC. Biomarkers of environmental enteropathy, inflammation, stunting, and impaired growth in children in northeast Brazil. PLoS One 2016;11:e0158772.

40. SHINE Trial team. The Sanitation Hygiene Infant Nutrition Efficiency (SHINE) trial: rationale, design, and methods. Clin Infect Dis 2015;61:S685–S702.
improved water, sanitation, and hygiene and improved complementary feeding on environmental enteric dysfunction in children in rural Zimbabwe: a cluster-randomized controlled trial. PLoS Negl Trop Dis 2020;14:e0008988.

43. Hofman M, Gatu C, Kontoghiorghes EJ, Colubi A, Zeileis A. ImSubSet: exact variable-subset selection in linear regression for R. J Statistical Software 2020;93(3):1–21.

44. Prendergast AJ, Rukobo S, Chasekwa B, Mutsa K, Ntirizini R, Mbuya MN, Jones A, Moutlon LH, Stoltzfus RJ, Humphrey JH. Stunting is characterized by chronic inflammation in Zimbabwean infants. PLoS One 2011;9:e98929.

45. Chasekwa B, Maluccio IA, Ntirizini R, Moutlon LH, Wu F, Smith LE, Matare CR, Stoltzfus RJ, Mbuya MN, Tielsch JM, et al. Measuring wealth in rural communities: lessons from the Sanitation, Hygiene, Infant Nutrition Efficacy (SHINE) trial. PLoS One 2018;13(6):e0199393.

46. Maxwell D, Watkins B, Wheeler R, Collins G. The Coping Strategy Index: a tool for rapid measurement of household food security and the impact of food aid programs in humanitarian emergencies. Nairobi: CARE and World Food Programme; 2003.

47. Camilleri M, Nadeau A, Lams J, Nord SL, Ryks M, Burton D, Sweetser S, Zinsmeister AR, Singh R. Understanding measurements of intestinal permeability in healthy humans with urine lactulose and mannitol excretion. Neurogastroenterol Motil 2010;22: e15–26.

48. Lau E, Marques C, Pestana D, Santos AT, Carvalho D, Freitas P, Calhau C. The role of I-FABP as a biomarker of intestinal barrier dysfunction driven by gut microbiota changes in obesity. Nutr Metab (Lond) 2016;13:31.

49. Crenn P, Messing B, Cynober L. Citrulline as a biomarker of intestinal failure due to enterocyte mass reduction. Clin Nutr 2008;27:328–39.

50. Martins PS, Colbo Bruni ML, da Luz Fernandez M, Martos LSW, Gomes NE, Rigato O, Salomao R. Bacterial recognition and induced cell activation in sepsis. Endocr Metab Immune Disord Drug Targets 2006;6:183–91.

51. Arndt MB, Richardson BA, Ahmed T, Mafuz M, Haque R, John-Stewart GC, Denno DM, Petri WA Jr, Kosek M, Watson JL, Fecal markers of environmental enteropathy and subsequent growth in Bangladeshi children. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2016;95:694–701.

52. Kosek MN, Mduma E, Kosek PS, Lee GO, Svensen E, Pan WK, Olortegui MP, Bream JH, Patil C, Asayag CR. Plasma tryptophan and the kynurenine–tryptophan ratio are associated with the acquisition of statural growth deficits and oral vaccine underperformance in populations with environmental enteropathy. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2016;95:928–37.

53. Kosek MN, Ahmed T, Bhatta Z, Caulfield L, Guerrant R, Houpt E, Kang G, Kosek M, Lee G, Lima A. Causal pathways from enteropathogens to environmental enteropathy: findings from the MAL-ED birth cohort study. EBioMedicine 2017;18:109–17.

54. Ichul NT, Sadiq K, Syed S, Akhtun I, Urman R, Ahmed S, Yakoob MY, Rahman N, Qureshi S, Xiu W. Promising biomarkers of environmental enteric dysfunction: a prospective cohort study in Pakistani children. Sci Rep 2018;8:2966.

55. Wang X, Xing KH, Qi J, Guan Y, Zhang J. Analysis of the relationship of insulin-like growth factor-1 to the growth velocity and feeding of healthy infants. Growth Horm IGF Res 2013;23:215–19.

56. George CM, Oldia L, Biswas SK, Perin J, Lee GO, Ahmed S, Haque R, Sack RB, Purvin T, Azmi UJ. Fecal markers of environmental enteropathy are associated with animal exposure and caregiver hygiene in Bangladesh. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2015;93:269–75.

57. de Onis M, WHO. Child Growth Standards. Geneva, Switzerland: WHO; 2006.

58. Hofmann M, Gatu C, Kontoghiorghes EJ. Efficient algorithms for computing the best subset regression models for large-scale problems. Comput Stat Data Anal 2007;52:16–29.

59. Dixon WJ, Yuen KK. Trimming and winsorization: a review. Statistische Hefte 1974;15:157–70.

60. Richard SA, McCormick BJ, Murray-Kolbe LE, Lee GO, Seidman JC, Maufuz M, Ahmed T, Guernatt RJ, Petri WA Jr, Rogawski ET. Enteric dysfunction and other factors associated with attained size at 5 years: MAL-ED birth cohort study findings. Am J Clin Nutr 2019;110:131–8.

61. Hofman M, Gatu C, Kontoghiorghes EJ, Colubi A, Zeileis A. ImSubSet: exact variable-subset selection in linear regression for R. J Statistical Software 2020;93(3):1–21.

62. Prendergast AJ, Rukobo S, Chasekwa B, Mutsa K, Ntirizini R, Mbuya MN, Jones A, Moutlon LH, Stoltzfus RJ, Humphrey JH. Stunting is characterized by chronic inflammation in Zimbabwean infants. PLoS One 2011;9:e98929.

63. Ordiz MI, Shaikh M, Trehan I, Maleta K, Staubler J, Shulman R, Devaraj S, Tarr PI, Manary MJ. Environmental enteric dysfunction is associated with poor linear growth and can be identified by host fecal mRNA. J Pediatr Gastroenterol Nutr 2016;63:453–9.

64. Goto R, Mascie-Taylor CN, Lunn PG. Impact of intestinal permeability, inflammation status and parasitic infections on infant growth faltering in rural Bangladesh. Br J Nutr 2009;101:1599–1606.

65. Semb D, Trehan I, Li X, Moaddel R, Ordiz M, Maleta KM, Kraemer K, Sharfell M, Ferrucci L, Manary M. Environmental enteric dysfunction is associated with carniotine deficiency and altered fatty acid oxidation. EBioMedicine 2017;17:57–66.

66. Wessells KR, Hess SY, Rouamba N, Ouedraogo ZP, Kellogg M, Gordon R, Daggan C, Ouedraogo J-B, Brown KH. Associations between intestinal mucosal function and changes in plasma zinc concentration following zinc supplementation. J Pediatr Gastroenterol Nutr 2013;57:348–55.

67. Ordiz MI, Davitt C, Stephenson K, Agapova S, Divala O, Shaikh N, Manary MJ. EB 2017 Article: interpretation of the lactulose:mannitol test in rural Malawian children at risk for perturbations in intestinal permeability. Exp Biol Med 2018;243:677–83.

68. Muenchhoff M, Goulder PJ. Sex differences in pediatric infectious diseases. J Infect Dis 2014;209:5120–58.

69. Sprinz H, Sribhiibhath R, Gangarosa EJ, Benyacati C, Kundel D, Halstead S. Biopsy of small bowel of Thai people. With special reference to recovery from Asiatic cholera and to an intestinal malabsorption syndrome. Am J Clin Pathol 1962;38:43–51.

70. Lindenbaum J, Alam A, Kent TH. Subclinical small-intestinal disease in East Pakistan. Br Med J 1966;2:1616–19.

71. England NWJ, Path MC. Intestinal pathology of tropical sprue. Am J Clin Nutr 1968;21:962–75.

72. Baker SJ, Mathan VI. Syndrome of tropical sprue in South India. Am J Clin Nutr 1968;21:984–93.

73. Chaves F, Veloso FT, Cruz I, Gomes C, Domingues W, Da Silva EM, Lopes C. Subclinical tropical enteropathy in Angola: peroral jejunal biopsies and absorption studies in asymptomatic healthy men. Mt Sinai J Med 1981;48:47–52.

74. Cook GC, Kajubi SK, Lee FD. Jejunal morphology of the African in Uganda. J Pathol 1969;98:157–71.

75. Falaiye JM. Present status of subclinical intestinal malabsorption in the tropics. Br Med J 1971;4:454–8.

76. Thomas G, Clain DJ, Wicks ACB. Tropical enteropathy in Rhodesia. Gut 1976;17:888–94.

77. Bayless TM, Wheby MS, Swanson VL. Tropical sprue in Puerto Rico. Am J Clin Nutr 1968;21:1030–41.

78. Schenk EA, Klipstein FA, Tomasini JT. Morphologic characteristics of jejunal biopsies from asymptomatic Haitians and Puerto Ricans. Am J Clin Nutr 1972;25:1080–3.

79. Chacko CJG, Paulson KA, Mathan VI, Baker SJ. The villus architecture of the small intestine in the tropics: a necropsy study. J Pathol 1969;98:146–51.

80. Rhodes AR, Shea N, Lindenbaum J. Malabsorption in asymptomatic Liberian children. Am J Clin Nutr 1971;24:574–7.

81. Baker SJ. Subclinical intestinal malabsorption in developing countries. Bull World Health Organ 1976;54:485–89.

82. Halstensen TS, Brandtzaeg P. Activated T lymphocytes in the celiac lesion: non-proliferative activation (CD25) of CD4+ T cells in the lamina propria but proliferation (Ki-67) of αβ T cells and γδ T cells in the epithelium. J Immunol 1993;152:505–10.

83. Choy M-Y, Richmond WM, Smith LE, Hildesheim A, McDonald TT. Differential expression of CD25 (interleukin-2 receptor) on lamina propria T cells and macrophages in the intestinal lesions in Crohn’s disease and ulcerative colitis. Gut 1990;31:1365–70.
84. Roura E, Homedes J, Klasing KC. Prevention of immunologic stress contributes to the growth-permitting ability of dietary antibiotics in chicks. J Nutr 1992;122:2383–90.
85. Lampl M, Veldhuis JD, Johnson ML. Saltation and stasis: a model of human growth. Science 1992;258:801–3.
86. Luby SP, Rahman M, Arnold BF, Unicomb L, Ashraf S, Winch PJ, Stewart CP, Begum F, Hussain F, Benjamin-Chung J. Effects of water quality, sanitation, handwashing, and nutritional interventions on diarrhoea and child growth in rural Bangladesh: a cluster randomised controlled trial. Lancet Glob Health 2018;6:e302–e15.
87. Null C, Stewart CP, Pickering AJ, Dentz HN, Arnold BF, Arnold CD, Benjamin-Chung J, Clasen T, Dewey KG, Fernald LC. Effects of water quality, sanitation, handwashing, and nutritional interventions on diarrhoea and child growth in rural Kenya: a cluster-randomised controlled trial. Lancet Glob Health 2018;6:e316–e29.
88. Cumming O, Arnold BF, Ban R, Clasen T, Esteves Mills J, Freeman MC, Gordon B, Gutieres R, Howard G, Hunter PR, et al. The implications of three major new trials for the effect of water, sanitation and hygiene on childhood diarrhea and stunting: a consensus statement. BMC Med 2019;17:173.
89. Pickering AJ, Null C, Winch PJ, Mangwadu G, Arnold BF, Prendergast AJ, Njenga SM, Rahman M, Ntozini R, Benjamin-Chung J. The WASH Benefits and SHINE trials: interpretation of WASH intervention effects on linear growth and diarrhoea. Lancet Glob Health 2019;7:e1139–e46.
90. Liu T-C, VanBuskirk K, Ali SA, Kelly MP, Holtz LR, Yilmaz OH, Sadiq K, Iqbal N, Amadi B, Syed S. A novel histological index for evaluation of environmental enteric dysfunction identifies geographic-specific features of enteropathy among children with suboptimal growth. PLoS Negl Trop Dis 2020;14:e0007975.
91. Mahfuz M, Das S, Mazumder RN, Rahman MM, Haque R, Bhiuyan MMR, Akhter H, Sarker MSA, Mondal D, Muaz SSA. Bangladesh environmental enteric dysfunction (BEED) study: protocol for a community-based intervention study to validate non-invasive biomarkers of environmental enteric dysfunction. BMJ Open 2017;7:e017768.