Variant antigen diversity in *Trypanosoma vivax* is not driven by recombination

Sara Silva Pereira, Kayo J.G. de Almeida Castilho Neto, Craig W. Duffy, Peter Richards, Harry Noyes, Moses Ogugo, Marcos Rogério André, Zakaria Bengaly, Steve Kemp, Marta M.G. Teixeira, Rosangela Z. Machado & Andrew P. Jackson

African trypanosomes (*Trypanosoma*) are vector-borne haemoparasites that survive in the vertebrate bloodstream through antigenic variation of their Variant Surface Glycoprotein (VSG). Recombination, or rather segmented gene conversion, is fundamental in *Trypanosoma brucei* for both VSG gene switching and for generating antigenic diversity during infections. *Trypanosoma vivax* is a related, livestock pathogen whose VSG lack structures that facilitate gene conversion in *T. brucei* and mechanisms underlying its antigenic diversity are poorly understood. Here we show that species-wide VSG repertoire is broadly conserved across diverse *T. vivax* clinical strains and has limited antigenic repertoire. We use variant antigen profiling, coalescent approaches and experimental infections to show that recombination plays little role in diversifying *T. vivax* VSG sequences. These results have immediate consequences for both the current mechanistic model of antigenic variation in African trypanosomes and species differences in virulence and transmission, requiring reconsideration of the wider epidemiology of animal African trypanosomiasis.
African trypanosomes (Trypanosoma spp.) are unicellular haemoparasites and the cause of African Trypanosomiasis in animals and humans. These parasites are transmitted by tsetse flies (Glossina spp.), and their proliferation in blood and other tissues leads to anaemia, immune and neurological dysfunction, which is typically fatal if untreated. The profound, negative impact of this disease on livestock productivity across sub-Saharan Africa is measured in billions of dollars annually.

*Trypanosoma vivax* is a livestock parasite found throughout sub-Saharan Africa and South America. Although superficially like the more familiar *Trypanosoma brucei* (the species responsible for Human African trypanosomiasis) and *Trypanosoma congolense* (another livestock parasite), *T. vivax* is distinct in morphology and motility, cellular ultrastructure and genetic repertoire, particularly with regard to cell surface-expressed genes. Most conspicuously, it has a simpler life cycle in tsetse flies, lacking a procyelic stage in the insect midgut, and can be transmitted non-cyclically by other genera of haematophagous flies.

Although distinct from *T. brucei*, *T. vivax* shares a defining phenotype with other African trypanosomes. Trypanosome cell surfaces are coated with a variant surface glycoprotein (VSG) that undergoes antigenic variation. Trypanosome genomes encode hundreds of alternative VSG, but each cell expresses just a single variant. Periodically, new variants emerge that have dynamically switched to an alternative expressed VSG. Each VSG is strongly immunogenic but confers no heterologous protection. Thus, as antibodies clear the dominant VSG clones of parasites, the more familiar reference genome, suggesting that the VSG is strongly immunogenic but confers no heterologous protection. Thus, as antibodies clear the dominant VSG clones of parasites, the more familiar reference genome, suggesting that the VSG is strongly immunogenic but confers no heterologous protection.

Species-wide *T. vivax* VSG repertoire contains 174 phylotypes. The VSG gene complements in our strain genome sequences are incomplete. So, while comparing partial strain genomes in combination provides a coherent analysis of species-wide VSG variation, the spatial distribution of COGs, and the number of truly location-specific COGs, will increase with greater sampling. This is clear when we consider that 248 COGs (12.2%) comprise a single Y486-specific sequence, which is the only strain with a complete VSG complement. Presently, a COG-based VAP will include too many false-negative ‘absences’ to reliably profile individual strains.

A VAP that allows comparison of any two strains must be based on universal markers that also vary in the population. COGs are not universal and sub-families do not vary; so, we reasoned that a taxon of intermediate inclusivity would satisfy both criteria. Therefore, we devised another VAP based on phylogenetic, each consisting of multiple, related COGs with ≥70% sequence identity (see Methods and Supplementary Fig. 2 for further explanation of classification system). In all, 174 VSG
Phylotypes accommodated every VSG-like sequence we observed. Figure 2 shows the size and distribution of these across strains and emphasises the widespread distribution of most phylotypes, 86% (149/174) of which are cosmopolitan.

Exceptions to this trend, i.e. structurally distinct VSG subfamilies restricted to specific populations, may be epidemiologically important. Among Nigerian samples, the location with the largest sample (N = 11) and so the most robust presence/absence calls, five phylotypes are unique (P94, P118, P126, P170, P173). These are not recent derivations in Nigerian T. vivax because they are defined by a threshold sequence identity and so are of approximately equally age to other phylotypes. Moreover, their positions in Fig. 2 indicate no significant difference in the node connectivity of Nigeria-specific and cosmopolitan phylotypes overall. As these phylotypes comprised only one or two COGs, we extended the analysis to COGs generally.

We found 130 COGS in at least 9/11 Nigeria strains and no other location. We tested whether the Nigeria-specific COGs were as old as closely related cosmopolitan COGs in the same phylotype or otherwise evolved more recently. If they were younger than the cosmopolitan COGs, this would mean that, at least in Nigeria, novel VSGs were being generated through gene duplication. Thus, we estimated Maximum Likelihood phylogenies for each phylotype containing a Nigerian-specific COG and inferred relative divergence times using the RelTime tool in MEGA v10.0.521 (see Source Data file). This showed that there was no significant difference (p = 0.35, independent t test) in the mean divergence times for Nigeria-specific COGs (µ = 0.038 ± 0.005; N = 83) and cosmopolitan COGS in the same phylotype (µ = 0.041 ± 0.005; N = 212). Therefore, Nigerian-specific COGs and phylotypes are just as ancient as lineages with cosmopolitan distributions, and do not provide evidence for population-specific gene family expansions.

In summary, the incompleteness of strain genomes compelled us to adopt phylotypes as a universal but variable metric to profile T. vivax VSG repertoire. On this basis, T. vivax VSG repertoire
appears to be relatively conserved over large distances. Population variation does exist, especially at COG level, but appears to originate through differential patterns of lineage loss rather than population-specific gene family expansions, since Nigeria-specific COGs are no younger than other VSG. This degree of widespread conservation is quite unlike patterns seen in *T. brucei* [22].

Suspecting that this indicated a more fundamental difference between African trypanosome species in how antigenic diversity evolves, we examined population variation among their VSG sequences in detail.

**Minimal signature of recombination in *T. vivax* VSG sequences.** We took multiple approaches to test the hypothesis [10] that *T. vivax* VSG recombine less than *T. brucei* and *T. congolense* VSG.

First, we asked if VSG sequences assort. Based on the current model of antigenic switching [11], VSG reads from 28 clinical strains would not remain paired after mapping to Y486 because historical recombination events would have distributed them across multiple reference loci. Figure 3a shows that the proportion of strain read-pairs remaining paired after mapping is significantly higher in *T. vivax* (mean = 92%; N = 19) relative to *T. congolense* (mean = 87%; t = 3.23; p < 0.05, independent t test) and *T. brucei* (mean = 76%; t = 12.8; p < 0.001, independent t test), and is almost as high as a negative control comprising adenylate cyclase genes (mean = 97%).

Reversing this approach, we examined how Y486 VSG gene sequences mapped to strain assemblies when broken into 150 bp segments. From this segmental mapping, we characterised VSGs into fully coupled (FC), multi-coupled (MC), or uncoupled (UC), based on how many reference donors each VSG had and how much of the VSG sequence they accounted for (Fig. 3b). FC VSGs have at least one donor contributing to >84% of the sequence; MC VSGs are sequences with donor(s) contributing to less than 84% of the sequence but more than 150 bp, or at least two donor fragments in different regions; and UC VSGs are those with one or more donors contributing with one fragment only (i.e. ≤150 bp).

The mean proportion of Y486 VSG that are mosaics of strain genes (i.e. 'Multi-coupled' (MC: 25%) or 'Uncoupled' (UC: 7%)) is significantly lower than for equivalent comparisons in *T. congolense* (MC: 33%, p < 0.05; UC: 31%, p < 0.001; independent t test) and *T. brucei* (MC: 39%, p < 0.001; UC: 12%, p < 0.001; independent t test), while the number that are essentially orthologous (i.e. 'Fully coupled' (FC: 59%)) is significantly greater (for *T. congolense*, p < 0.001; for *T. brucei*, p < 0.001; independent t test) (Fig. 3c). Analysis of phylogenetic incompatibility in alignments of FC and MC quartets using PHI23 corroborates the
Fig. 3 The frequency of VSG recombination differs between African trypanosome species. a The proportion of read-pairs from strain VSG remaining paired after being mapped to the reference sequence for each trypanosome genome, shaded by species. Adenylate cyclase genes (AC) were included as a negative control. b The definition of fully coupled (FC) and multi-coupled (MC) VSG sequences. Reference VSG sequences were segmented and mapped to strain VSGs. Where ≥85% of pseudo-reads map to the same locus (e.g. Donor T), the gene is fully coupled. Where a strain VSG has multiple segments mapping to multiple locations (e.g. ‘Donor 1-3’), the gene is multi-coupled. Example T. brucei VSG sequence quartets are shown after TOPALi HMM analysis (see Methods). The three line graphs represent the Bayesian probabilities of three possible topologies for a quartet phylogeny. An FC VSG displays the same topology along its whole length. An MC VSG displays different phylogenetic signals along its length, dependent on the identity of the sequence donor. c A comparison of the proportions of FC, MC, uncoupled (UC) and unmapped (UM) VSG in each trypanosome species. The median value is shown as a black bar. Statistical significance of differences in the mean are indicated by asterisks (independent t test, *p < 0.05; **p < 0.01; ***p < 0.001). d Phylogenetic incompatibility among VSG genes using Phi23. The proportion of FC and MC VSG quartet alignments showing significant phylogenetic incompatibility (Pii) in MC and FC VSGs is shown, shaded by species (mean ± s.e.m.). Observed Pii values for simulated sequences generated by NetRecodon either with recombination (R = 2e−05) or without (R = 0), are indicated by dashed lines. e Variation in the ‘time to most recent common ancestor’ (TMRCA) along MC and FC VSG quartet alignments, estimated from ancestral recombination graphs constructed by ACG. The median value is shown as a black bar. f Total sequence orthology among VSG repertoires in each species. Orthology was calculated as the proportion of VSG base-pairs fully coupled between each strain genome sequence and the reference. Number of strain genomes is shown in brackets. Source data are provided as a Source Data file.

mapping patterns. Across all species, FC VSG contain little evidence for phylogenetic incompatibility and not generally more than the adenylate cyclase control (Fig 3d). While MC VSG display phylogenetic incompatibility, T. vivax MC quartets displayed this less frequently (Pii = 41%) than in T. congolense (Pii = 65%) and T. brucei (Pii = 67%).

While there are fewer MC VSG in T. vivax, this sizeable minority might still be genuine mosaics. Alternatively, other processes such as gene paralogy or substitution rate heterogeneity could account for the signature of recombination. Hence, we explicitly modelled the history of recombination within FC or MC sequence quartets using ancestral recombination graphs (ARG) and inferred the time to most recent common ancestor (TMRCA) for each quartet. Average TMRCA was significantly greater for T. vivax FC VSG (0.19 ± 0.17) than either T. congolense (0.05 ± 0.06) or T. brucei (0.06 ± 0.07), indicating much deeper coalescent times for T. vivax VSG. More importantly, the variance in TMRCA along sequence alignments is extremely small for T. vivax FC VSG, showing that the whole alignment shares a common ARG (Fig 3e). Variance is greater for MC VSG, but both MC and FC types are significantly less variable than either other species (p < 0.001, independent t test). Both the relatively small TMRCA and variance in TMRCA along alignments indicates that T. brucei and T. congolense VSG are routinely mosaics, while the coalescence of most T. vivax VSG can be modelled without recombination. Interestingly, TMRCA variance is significantly higher among T. brucei MC VSG quartets than T. congolense VSG (p < 0.001, independent t test), indicating that the former may have a higher recombination rate (explored further in Supplementary Table 1).

In summary, these analyses show that retention of orthology among VSG loci across trypanosome populations varies significantly between species. Figure 3f plots the total pairwise orthology between strains (see Methods). Around 75% of T. vivax VSG are found in multiple strains as orthologues, without evidence for recombination, compared with ~40% in T. brucei (p < 0.001, independent t test) and T. congolense (p < 0.001, independent...
As the VAPs indicated, *T. vivax* VSG typically retain orthology and essentially behave like ‘normal’ genes in the population, while *T. brucei* or *T. congolense* VSGs recombine frequently, causing loss of orthology and the appearance of strain-specific mosaics throughout the population.

**Strong phylogenetic effects on VSG expression in vivo.** Broadly conserved VSG phylotypes containing little signature of historical recombination indicate that VSG mosaics do not contribute to antigenic diversity in vivo. We tested this by measuring VSG transcript abundance in goats experimentally infected with *T. vivax* (strain Lins26) over a 40-day period. Parasitaemia and expression profiles of VSG phylotypes in four replicates are shown in Fig. 4. We observed the expected waves of parasitaemia beginning after 4 days and continuing approximately every 3 days until termination (i.e. 6–9 parasitaemic peaks). Transcriptomes were prepared for each peak and revealed 282 different VSG transcripts across all replicates (Supplementary Data 3), which belonged to 31 different phylotypes (18% of total species repertoire).

Variant antigen profiling of the expressed transcripts characterised the dominant (but more often co-dominant) VSG phylotypes across successive peaks (Fig. 4). Somewhat contrary to expectation, we often saw persistent expression of a phylotype (P) across peaks, e.g. P24 (Supplementary Fig. 3) and P2 (Supplementary Fig. 4), or re-emergence of a phylotype after decline, e.g. P40 (Supplementary Fig. 5) and P143 (Supplementary Fig. 6). The *T. vivax* (Lins) inoculum was not derived from a clone, but rather represents a mixed population with one dominant clone (see Methods); hence, this initial heterogeneity could result in variation in VSG expression between animals. However, despite the unavoidable clonal mixture of the initial inoculum, the identity of expressed phylotypes was partly reproduced across replicates, with 12/31 phylotypes observed in all four animals, and 19 phylotypes in three animals (Supplementary Fig. 7); on 21 occasions this extended to an identical VSG sequence (for detail, see Supplementary Figs. 3–6).

Similarly, the order of VSG expression was partly reproducible across animals. Figure 5 displays transcript number and abundance at early, middle and late points in the experiment, mapped on to the sequence similarity network of all phylotypes. The best example of reproducibility is the dominant distribution of P24 in the middle-to-late period across all animals. Other examples include a group of phylotypes (P2, P40, P142 and P143) expressed early (i.e. peak 1/2, Fig. 5a) in Animal (A) 2 and A3, then re-emerging later at peak 5/6 in A1–3 (Fig. 5b), and even later in A4. For detailed analysis of phylotype abundance at each time-point, see Supplementary Fig. 8. Importantly, however, while phylotypes show consistency in expression through time and across replicates, individual VSG transcripts do not. Hence, while the dominant variant antigen belonged to P24 in every replicate, the actual P24 transcript expressed was different in each case and its variants diverged by up to 26.5% in nucleotide identity. Further examples in Supplementary Figs. 3–6 demonstrate that this was typical.

Across all peaks, groups of related transcripts of the same phylotype were commonly co-expressed at the same peak (e.g. P2 expression comprised 3.08 ± 1.97 transcripts on average, P24 = 2.33 ± 1.3, P40 = 2.67 ± 1.12, P143 = 2.71 ± 1.25). On three occasions, the observed phylotype comprised seven distinct transcripts (P2 at peak 5 in A1, P8 at peak 8 in A4 and P135 at peak 5 in A1). Overall, only 8/31 phylotypes were ever represented by a single transcript. This indicates that the expressed repertoire is determined in part by sequence homology, and Supplementary Fig. 9 shows that expressed transcripts belong to significantly fewer phylotypes than simulated transcript repertoires of the same size, confirming that they are not drawn from the available repertoire by chance. For detailed examples, see Supplementary Figs. 3–6.

An obvious feature in Fig. 5 is the concentration of highly expressed phylotypes in the bottom-left corner of the network. A complex of closely related Fam23 phylotypes (e.g. P2, P40, P142) were expressed early in A1 and A2 (Fig. 5a, b). This was followed by Fam23 phylotypes placed closer to the centre of the network (e.g. P8), and finally, Fam25 phylotypes (e.g. P24/P44) in late infection. In A3 and A4, a similar pattern occurred, except that Fam25 VSG (i.e. P44) were expressed early, followed by the Fam23 ‘complex’ and then P24. This can also be seen in Supplementary Fig. 8, where phylotypes displaying reproducible profiles across replicates are often closely related (e.g. P2, P40, P142 and P143). The connectivity of nodes representing expressed phylotypes is greater than that expected by chance. The clustering coefficient of a sub-network representing all ‘expressed’ nodes across all peaks is significantly greater than randomised sub-networks of the same size (for detail, see Supplementary Fig. 10).

In summary, the major pattern emerging from in vivo expression profiles is a strong phylogenetic signal on three levels. First, the identity and order of expressed phylotypes is partly reproducible (but expression of individual transcripts is typically not). Second, phylotypes expressed at a given peak regularly comprise multiple distinct, but closely related, transcripts. Finally, at the phylotype level, related phylotypes are expressed simultaneously or consecutively, manifested as clustering in Fig. 5 and Supplementary Fig. 8. Therefore, phylogeny (or sequence relatedness) is an important factor in explaining the pattern of VSG expression during these *T. vivax* infections.

**No mosaics of VSG phylotypes during experimental infections.** Expressed VSG in *T. brucei* include sequence mosaics, which is interpreted as evidence for recombination of VSG loci during infections15,25,26. In *T. brucei*, VSG mosaics can be formed between highly divergent donors with as little as 25% identity along their entire lengths26, and can implicate relatively short recombinant tracts of ~100 bp27. We analysed expressed VSG transcript sequence mosaics by comparing 100 bp windows of each transcript to the *T. vivax* Lins genome sequence using BLASTP28. Typically, mosaics would be confirmed where a single transcript displayed affinities to different VSG genes along its length. Unfortunately, since both VSG transcripts and gene sequences were often fragmentary, it was common for a transcript to have multiple affinities as no single gene sequence spanned its length. Even so, without exception, the closest related sequences in every window of each transcript were other sequences in the same phylotype.

With sequence affinities inconclusive, we searched for reorganisation of an expressed VSG sequence relative to a genomic locus by mapping all read-pairs belonging to VSG transcripts to the *T. vivax* Lins genome. After mapping, the percentage of unpaired reads (1.06–5.63%) was greater than the percentage arising from a random selection of 100 housekeeping genes (0.01–0.05%). However, given that *T. vivax* VSG are arranged in tandem gene arrays of closely related paralogues10, we reasoned that this repetitive organisation might lead to multiple mapping of reads. Indeed, the percentage of unpaired VSG reads is not significantly different to that of adenylate cyclases (3.43–7.53%; *p* = 0.892, independent *t* test), which do not form mosaics but are often arranged in tandem arrays29 (see Source Data file).

Nonetheless, the few mis-mapped reads could still derive from rare mosaic transcripts. To examine these explicitly, we aligned...
VSG transcripts with the three most similar genes from the *T. vivax* Lins genome sequence using BLASTn (where three sequences >500 bp in length could be obtained; \(N = 68\)) and used GARD30 to identify potential recombination breakpoints. The closest matches to each transcript were again always from the same phylotype (minimum full-length sequence identity of 86%). GARD found that 54/68 alignments displayed significant topological incongruence not attributable to rate heterogeneity, indicating 1.94 ± 1.66 breakpoints on average (ranging between 0 and 7). At first, this might suggest that mosaicism is widespread within phylotypes; however, this degree of phylogenetic incompatibility was not significantly different to adenylate cyclases (36/
Fig. 4 VSG phylotype expression during experimental T. vivax Lins infections in a goat model (N = 4). Parasitaemia (black line) is shown in the upper graph (detection limit (DL) was 4.1 × 10^3 trypanosome per millilitre of blood). Parasite RNA was isolated at peaks in parasitaemia, indicated as black dots. The number of unique VSG transcripts (red line) observed in each transcriptome is plotted on the same axis. The lower line graph shows the combined transcript abundance for each VSG phylotype (shaded according to key) through the experiment (days post infection) for four replicates animals (A1–A4 from top to bottom). Note that phylotypes can comprise several, distinct transcripts of variable abundance. Across all peaks in all animals, a phylotype was represented by a single transcript in 105/196 observations, (mean = 1.88 ± 1.26 s.d.). However, across the 31 expressed phylotypes, only eight (P3, P13, P14, P16, P38, P141, P151 and P178) occur as single transcripts on every occasion when they were observed. Thus, while a slight majority of phylotypes are represented by only one transcript at a given peak, most phylotypes are present as multiple transcripts at some point. Phylotypes that were dominant (i.e. superabundant) are labelled adjacent to the pertinent lines. A superabundant VSG was defined as having an expression level at least ten times that of the next most abundant VSG, and this was observed at 15–28 peaks. For example, P24 is 128 times more abundant than P44 at peak 5 in A1, and P1 is 32 times more abundant than P155 at peak 7. The classical expectation of VSG expression is that a peak will include a single superabundant VSG like this; often, however, several co-dominant VSG phylotypes occurred with comparable expression levels, for example at peak 1 in A1 and A2. Source data are provided as a Source Data file.

Discussion

In the current model of trypanosome antigenic variation, recombination is the driver behind the creation of novel VSG sequences and persistence in the mammalian host. Unlike T. brucei and T. congolense, we find little evidence for VSG mosaics, either historically in the population or during experimental infections. Instead, T. vivax VSG repertoire comprises 174 conserved phylotypes, and incomplete sorting of these lineages produces population variation.

Although there are several co-dominant phylotypes occurred with comparable expression levels, for example at peak 1 in A1 and A2. Source data are provided as a Source Data file.

In summary, while most transcript alignments contained breakpoints, these only implicated very similar sequences, and the scale of genetic admixture was comparable to other tandemly arrayed gene families. Thus, we believe that the apparent assortment of these paralogous sequences is consistent with rearrangements (real or artefactual) caused by tandem arrangement of T. vivax VSG. Certainly, no transcript contained evidence for mosaics of different VSG phylotypes and therefore, assortment of the same magnitude as T. brucei was not seen.

Discussion

In the current model of trypanosome antigenic variation, recombination is the driver behind the creation of novel VSG sequences and persistence in the mammalian host. Unlike T. brucei and T. congolense, we find little evidence for VSG mosaics, either historically in the population or during experimental infections. Instead, T. vivax VSG repertoire comprises 174 conserved phylotypes, and incomplete sorting of these lineages produces population variation. Although there are T. vivax populations in Eastern and Southern Africa that we have yet to sample, we see now that the deep ancestry of VSG lineages and lack of VSG pseudogenes in T. vivax reflect a long history without recombination.

Experiments in the twentieth century documented the progression of variant antigen types (VATs) during T. vivax infections. VATs represent parasite clones that confer a specific, reproducible immunity, assumed to relate to a specific VSG. Our results confirm the hypothesis that emerged from these experiments that the T. vivax VSG repertoire is smaller than those of other species. While the number of VSG genes is comparable to T. brucei and T. congolense, these provide fewer unique antigens because they are often extremely similar, are expressed simultaneously, and cannot recombine. This explains several features of T. vivax infections, including the propensity for host self-cure and the re-emergence of VATs late in infection. Furthermore, 70% of phylotypes and 45% of COGs are shared between East and West Africa respectively, which could explain the widespread distribution of serodemes, that is, why immunity to VATs in East Africa provides protection against some parasite strains from Western and Southern Africa also.

We have defined VSG phylotypes as universal but variable quantities for variant antigen profiling of any T. vivax strain. The evolutionary conservation of many phylotypes, and their reproducible expression patterns (in contrast with individual genes), has shown that phylotypes are not merely a convenient means of classifying T. vivax VSG, but must have biological relevance. How they are relevant to the mechanism of antigenic variation in T. vivax is not yet clear. Recently, it was suggested that patterns in T. brucei VSG expression could relate to protein length, with longer VSG being expressed as infections progress. Our data do not support this hypothesis in T. vivax, there was no correlation between VSG length and days post infection, using either our own transcript lengths or the full-length, cognate Y486 gene (see Source Data file).

Regardless of why these phylotypes are ubiquitous, a crucial consideration is how they relate to VATs. If individual transcripts in a phylotype cross-react with the same antibody, then VATs are likely to be synonymous with phylotypes, which raises the question of why multiple transcripts are expressed when this confers no benefit to parasite persistence.

Conversely, if all VSG transcripts represent serologically distinct proteins, this poses the question of why co-expression is determined by sequence homology. Either way, the relevance of VSG phylogeny to antigenic variation is clear.

The absence of recombination among VSG genes means that the generation of antigenic diversity in T. vivax differs from T. brucei. We propose, based on the current model of T. brucei antigenic variation, that the mechanism of VSG switching must also be different. Although it should be stressed that antigenic diversity and antigenic variation are distinct processes, it is important to realise that the two are intricately linked in T. brucei by mechanism. T. brucei VSGs are expressed from dedicated cassettes at the telomeres of megabase chromosomes called VSG expression sites (ES). Note that analogous structures have not yet been found in T. vivax. In T. brucei, VSG switching can occur through activation of alternative ES by epigenetic means or through the substitution of the VSG in the active ES mediated by repetitive DNA motifs that do not occur in T. vivax. The latter can occur through SGC, or telomere exchange, and is mostly triggered by double-strand breaks. The other consequence of SGC is the creation of mosaic VSG sequences in T. brucei, that is, antigenic diversity. Therefore, while we have not examined the mechanism of T. vivax antigenic variation directly, we propose that, whatever the mechanism is, it must be different to the T. brucei model because T. vivax VSG show no evidence of mosaicism historically, or during infections. We do not insist that recombination never happens in T. vivax. Among highly similar VSG sequences, for example those found in tandem gene arrays, we would expect either allelic or ectopic recombination to occur when these sequences align. Furthermore, meiotic recombination during sexual reproduction (which is unconfirmed in T. vivax) could promote gene flow and antigenic diversity among parasite populations. Indeed, recombination could still play a role in T. vivax VSG switching, just not in a manner that promotes sequence diversity. We have observed that multiple, related T. vivax VSG transcripts are often expressed simultaneously; if these co-expressed transcripts derive from the same tandem array
of VSG paralogues, rearrangement of the arrays could have a central role in a distinct switching mechanism not dependent on SGC.

Without recombination to create mosaic VSG sequences, there is a fundamental limitation on antigenic diversity in *T. vivax* and therein its capacity for immune evasion. This poses profound new questions of how *T. vivax* persists long enough to transmit (which it evidently does very successfully). Perhaps *T. vivax* has adopted a different life strategy with respect to the transmission-virulence or invasion-persistence trade-offs that govern pathogen evolution. One possibility is that *T. vivax* has evolved a more acute infection strategy than other species and achieves transmission over shorter periods. Some aspects support an invasion-persistence trade-off; *T. vivax* infections (where the host survives) are typically shorter than other species. Furthermore, where trypanosome species have been directly compared,
chronic pathologies such as reduced packed cell volume and humoral immunosuppression are less severe with *T. vivax*. However, there is no evidence that *T. vivax* replicates or transmits quicker, as would be expected under a trade-off. Another possibility is that the idiosyncratic life cycle and wider vector range of *T. vivax* is an adaptation to increase transmission in the absence of long-term persistence in the mammalian host. However, in various reports, animals that survive the initial acute *T. vivax* infection are said to develop a chronic, often asymptomatic, infection during which parasites are not visible, but which may cause progressive neuropathy. Thus, another possibility is that *T. vivax* cause long-term, chronic infections like other species, but has an alternative mechanism for persistence. Dissemination to immune-privileged sites might allow persistence at low cell densities and *T. vivax* does disseminate to the reproductive and nervous systems, but all trypanosome species have a comparable ability for disease tropism.

In conclusion, the orthology of VSG phylotypes across populations, and the considerable structural divergence among them, indicates that the *T. vivax* variant antigen repertoire lacks the dynamism typical of *T. brucei* VSG. Crucially, we find no evidence in *T. vivax* for the vital role that recombination has in diversifying *T. brucei* VSG sequences. This is a major departure from the current model of antigenic variation, indicating that *T. vivax* has a distinct mechanism of immune evasion. Antigenic diversity is limited in *T. vivax*, but not in *T. brucei* and *T. congoense*: this both explains the antigenic exhaustion observed during *T. vivax* infections and poses important new questions of how infections persist under such circumstances. Possibly, the lack of adaptation for persistence reflects a fundamentally different life strategy in *T. vivax*, with profound implications for understanding virulence and transmission of this pervasive and devastating pathogen.

**Methods**

**Ethical considerations.** This study was conducted in accordance with the guidelines of the Brazilian College of Animal Experimentation (CONCEA), following the Brazilian law for ‘Procedures for the Scientific Use of Animals’ (11.794/2008 and decree 6.899/2009). Ethical approval was obtained from the Ethical Committee to the Use of Animals (CEUA) of the Veterinary and Agrarian Sciences Faculty (FCAV) of the State University of São Paulo (USP) - São Paulo campus (São Paulo, Brazil) (protocol no. 001494/18, issued on 08/02/2018). The study was also approved by the Animal Welfare and Ethical Review Body (AWERB) of the University of Liverpool (AWCD0103).

**Sample preparation.** A panel of 25 *T. vivax*-infected blood stabiles (150 µl), representing isolates from Burkina Faso (N = 3), Ivory Coast (N = 3), Nigeria (N = 11), Gambia (N = 1), Uganda (N = 4), Togo (N = 1), were selected from Azizi Biorpository (http://azizi.illr.org/repository/) at the International Livestock Research Institute (ILRI), and the Centre International de Recherches- Développement sur l’Elevage en zone Subhumide (CIRDES). In addition, genomic DNA of three Brazilian isolates previously described was obtained from Développement sur l’Elevage en zone Subhumide (CIRDES), and the Centre International de Recherche-Développement sur l’Elevage en zone Subhumide (CIRDES). For samples from ILRI and CIRDES: Red blood cells were lysed with ACK lysing buffer (Gibco, UK) and discarded by centrifugation. Cells were washed twice in 1 ml MACS buffer by centrifugation (10 min, 2500 rpm). The pellet was re-suspended in 100 µl lysis buffer (aqueous solution of 1 M Tris-HCl pH8.0, 0.1 mM NaCl, 10 µM ethylene-diaminetetraacetic acid (EDTA), 0.5% sodium dodecyl sulphate (SDS), 0.14 µM Proteinase K). Samples were incubated at room temperature for 1 h and DNA was extracted with magnetic Sera-Mag Speedbeads (GE Healthcare Life Sciences, UK) according to the manufacturer’s protocol. For samples from ICB: DNA was extracted following a traditional phenol-chloroform extraction protocol (TvBrRp). For genomic DNA of three Brazilian isolates previously described (TvBrMi), in summary, sample digestion was performed in Digiol buffer (50 mM Tris, 20 mM EDTA, 117 mM NaCl and 1% SDS) with Proteinase K (final concentration 10 mg/ml) for 3 h at 55°C. DNA was precipitated with ammonium acetate (2.5 M final concentration). DNA purification was performed with ethanol precipitation and 70% ethanol washing. Pellets were air-dried for 30 min, DNA re-suspended in 50 μl sterile water and samples stored at −20°C until use.

**Genome sequencing and assembly.** Illumina paired-end sequencing libraries were prepared from genomic DNA using the NEBNext Ultra® DNA Library Prep Kit according to the manufacturer’s protocol (New England Biolabs, UK) and sequenced by standard procedures on the Illumina MiSeq platform, as 150 bp (HiSeq 2500) paired-ends (for each sample, the data yield from sequencing after quality filtering was between 1.69 × 10⁶ and 1.32 × 10⁷ read-pairs. Samples were assembled de novo using Velvet 1.2.10 with a kmer of 65 (ILRI and CIRDES) or 99 (ICB). These produced assemblies with n50 between 238 and 2852 bp (median = 353; mean = 983). The ratio of read depth of an alternative allele over the total read depth was calculated to detect mixed infections. All samples were from single infections only.

**VSG-like sequence recovery and systematics.** VSG-like nucleotide sequences were retrieved from the assembled contigs files by sequence similarity search with tBLASTx (v2.8.0) [28]. We used a database of *T. vivax* Y486 VSG as query and a significance threshold of p < 0.001, contig length ≥100 amino acids, and sequence identity ≥90%. Additionally, we queried a database of *T. brucei* a-VSG and b-VSG sequences, using the same p value and length thresholds, to accommodate VSG genes that might be absent from *T. vivax* Y486, i.e. the possibility that the reference genome is not representative of all strains. In the event, the reference proved to be representative.

VSG-like sequences were translated and clustered using Orthofinder [29] under the default settings. Orthofinder clustered orthologous sequences from the reference and 28 strains. In practice, these clusters of orthologues (COGs) also included near-identical in-paralogues. Sequences in each cluster were aligned using Clustalw (v2.1) [30] and all alignments were edited to remove overhangs and short (<100 bp) sequences. Edited alignments were refined to produce COGs with >90% average sequence identity by combining COGs that were very similar or, more conservatively, subdividing Orthofinder clusters that contained groups until the average sequence divergence was <0.05. In complex cases of large Orthofinder clusters, neighbour-joining phylogenies were estimated to aid sub-division. Sequences that could not be placed with any other such that sequence divergence was <0.05 were categorised as ‘unclustered’ (assumed to be strain-specific VSG).

With the membership of COGs determined, we reverted to the original, unedited sequences to identify the longest representative of that COG (a ‘type sequence’). Type sequences were combined with the original, unclustered sequences and compared with Fam23–26 VSG reference sequences using BLASTp (v2.8.0) to confirm their validity and assign a subfamily. We obtained 2039 type sequences in total, 961 belonging to Fam23, 543 to Fam24, 244 to Fam25, 191 to Fam26. Sequences found not to have a satisfactory match to Fam23–26 VSG were excluded. This process produced 760 COGs (comprising 2582 sequences) and 1279 unclustered, or ‘singleton’ sequences. Each type sequence and singleton was compared against all others using BLASTp to establish cohorts of related COGs/singletons, which we call ‘phylotypes’. A BLASTp output was used to create sequence alignments for phylotypes and to estimate neighbour-joining phylogenies for each. The membership of phylotypes was manually adjusted by removing the most divergent sequences until each met a threshold of 70% identical sequence identity.

Note that the geographical distribution VSG COGs and phylotypes is inferred from the strains in which type sequences were detected. We define a ‘cosmopolitan’ COG or phylotype as being present in more than one location, except if these locations are Brazil and Uganda, or any combination of Ivory Coast, Togo and Burkina Faso. In both cases, we treated the *T. vivax* strains to be too close to justify these as separate populations. COGs or phylotypes found only in Brazil and Uganda are considered ‘East African’ in this study. Those found only in some combination of Ivory Coast, Togo and Burkina Faso are considered ‘West African’.

**Variant antigen profiling.** To produce VAPs for each strain, we used sequence mapping to confirm the presence or absence of individual COGs. For a gene to be present in a strain, at least one read must map with a threshold nucleotide identity of 98% (allowing a maximum of five nucleotides mismatch per 250 bp read). As mapping makes use of low-coverage reads that would not otherwise be integrated into the sequence assemblies, this was more efficient than genome contigs for sequence homology. There was an 11% increase in the observed repertoire size (an average of 87 additional VSG) when mapping relative to BLAST. Mapping indicated that most singleton sequences were present in other strains despite assembled orthologues. Specifically, from the 1279 sequences that could not be placed in a COG with BLAST, only 34 (2.7%) remained unplaced after mapping. For these reasons, trimmed sequence reads were aligned to the 2039 COG type sequences, using Bowtie2 (v2.3.4) [32] set to -D 30 -R 3 -N 1 -L 20. A customised Perl script was used to select entries with a match length ≥245 nucleotides (corresponding to a 2% error rate in a 250 bp sequencing read), a minimum coverage pair, in the correct orientation, and within the expected insert size. This list was compared to the COG database and used to produce the presence/absence binary matrix that represents the T. vivax VAP. VAP-based strain relationships were estimated by hierarchical clustering analysis in R, using binary distance calculation and the Ward’s minimum variance method [33], and compared to the VSG phylotype variation phylogeny. For phylotype-based VAPs, presence/absence and distribution data were generated by summing over all constituent VSG COGs and singletons.
Strain variation. To estimate strain relationships based on the whole genome, MiSeq reads were retrieved and mapped against the *T. vivax* V480 genome using BWA v0.7.17, converted to BAM format, sorted and indexed with SAMtools (v1.9)26. Sorted BAM files were cleaned, duplicates marked and indexed with Picard (http://broadinstitute.github.io/picard/), and single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) were called and filtered with Genome Analytics Toolkit suite (v3.8.0) according to the best practice protocol for multi-sample variant calling66. The multi-sample VCF file obtained from GATK was converted to FASTA format using VCFTools v0.11.467 and a maximum likelihood phylogeny was estimated with PHYML (v3.0)68, using the GTR + I + F model of nucleotide substitution, following Smart Model Selection69.

*T. vivax* experimental infections. Five male Saanen goats of 4–8 months of age, housed at the Veterinary and Agrarian Sciences Faculty (FCAV) of the State University of São Paulo (Ibatibetalon campus) (São Paulo, Brazil), were infected with *T. vivax* VSGs (2×10^7)24. Before inoculation, parasites were cultivated in 8% glycerol were thawed, checked for viability under a light microscope. Each animal was inoculated intravenously with approximately 6×10^7 parasites. There is no in vitro culture system for bloodstream-stage *T. vivax*. Therefore, it is not currently possible to derive single clones from blood, and the frozen stablate used here was derived from propagated cultures. RNA was extracted from 2.23×10^5 to 1.04×10^7 trypanosomes per blood collection, RNA extraction and sequencing. Following the blood collection, animals were clinically examined daily and parasitaemia were estimated for each sample with kallisto (v0.45.0)74 using Trinity pre-compiled scripts. Subsequently, transcript abundances were estimated for each sample with kallisto (v2.8.6)73. Transcript abundances were combined per phylotype, manually curated to remove spurious matches. The resulting lists of VSG transcripts were used as query in a sequence similarity search to identify VSG transcripts matching the list of COGs defined in the VAP. A threshold of E<0.001, contig length >50 amino acids, and sequence identity ≥70% was applied. Finally, VSG transcripts were assigned a phylotype based on sequence similarity comparison to the VSG phylotype network (>70% nucleotide identity across the whole gene sequence). VSG transcript abundances were combined per phylotype, resulting in a transcript expression matrix containing the abundance of each VSG phylotype over time.

Recombination analysis. Fifty previously published genomes from *T. brucei* ssp250,67,72, and *T. congolense*26 and 19 of the *T. vivax* genomes presented in this study were used to compare signatures of recombination across species (Supplementary Data 4). VSGs and adenylate cyclase genes were extracted from genome assemblies by sequence similarity search (BLASTn29) using a nucleotide identity ≥50%, length ≥600 nucleotides, and E <0.001. VSG alignment was quantified by read mapping using Bowtie251. VSG read-pairs were retrieved from the genomes and mapped against reference full-length VSG to calculate the proportion of strain read-pairs remaining paired after mapping. This protocol was repeated for adenylate cyclase genes to provide a negative control; adenylate cyclase genes are multi-copy and include numerous, tandemly arranged genes, but do not undergo SGC13,29.

In the segmental mapping approach, reference VSGs were broken into 150 bp fragments and mapped against the strain VSGs by reading reference reads remaining paired. VSGs were characterised into UC, MC and FC, according to the estimated number of donors (i.e. the reference VSGs from which the pseudo-reads were derived). FC VSGs were those with at least one donor contributing to more than 84% of the sequence. MC VSGs were those with only one more donors contributing with more than one fragment (<300 bp), whereas UC VSGs were those remaining (i.e. one to more donors contributing with one fragment only (i.e. ≤150 bp)). The reference VSGs that were not mapped at least once to the strain VSGs were considered reference-specific variants.

For evidence for past recombination within alignments of MC and FC VSGs and adenylate cyclase genes was examined using phylogenetic incompatibility in PhyPack23. The proportion of alignments showing significant phylogenetic incompatibility (P<0.05) was calculated using Phypack and compared to the P0 of two sets of simulated data (250 replicates, 16 artificial sequences per replicate) with and without recombination. Simulated data were generated with NetRecodon (v6.0.0)78, under a 4-donor model of transspecies evolution, using a random population size between 10^4 and 10^6, a heterogeneity rate of 0.05, and an expected population size of 1000. The population recombination rate (ρ) was set to 0 and 96 for the non-recombiant dataset and recombinant datasets, respectively. Both experimental and simulated sequences were divided into sequence quartets, aligned with Muscle (v3.8.31)79 and iteratively parsed through PhyPack23. MC VSG quartets were created with one MC VSG plus three donor VSGs from the reference. FC VSG, adenylate cyclase and simulated quartets were randomly generated and parsed through PHI 100 times for statistical power. MC and FC quartets were compiled manually with MC VSG and three donors. A sequence orthology in each trypanosome species VSG repertoire was calculated as the proportion of total VSG nucleotides of a strain repertoire shared with the relevant reference genome, averaged over all strains. This includes all FC VSG and conserved segments of MC VSG. The number of shared nucleotides was extracted from the mapping output file using Genomecov from BEDTools (v2.27.0)80.

Estimation of ancestral recombination graphs. Ancestral recombination graphs were reconstructed for multi-coupled and fully coupled VSG quartet alignments and adenylate cyclase control quartet alignments using the ACG software package85. The TMRCAs was estimated along the length of each aligned quartet at 20 bp intervals using a 100-bp-wide sliding window using constant recombination rate/ population size models with an MCMC length of 10,000,000, burn-in of 10,000,000 and sampling frequency of 2500. For each individual quartet the TMRCAs along the length of the alignment was summarised by calculating the mean TMRCAs. To identify evidence of recombination, which would generate a sequence with regions of differing ancestries, the variance in TMRCAs along the alignment was calculated for each individual quartet.

Reporting summary. Further information on research design is available in the Nature Research Reporting Summary linked to this article.

Data availability

The datasets generated during the current study are available in the NCBI repository, under the ENS project accession number PRJNA486085. The source data underlying Figs. 1–3a, 3c–5 and Supplementary Figs. 1 and 8–10 are provided as a Source Data file.

Received: 30 August 2019; Accepted: 18 January 2020; Published online: 12 February 2020
56. Hamilton, P. B., Adams, E. R., Malele, I. I. & Gibson, W. C. A novel, high-throughput technique for species identification reveals a new species of tsetse-transmitted trypanosome related to the Trypanosoma brucei subgenus, Trypanozoon. *Infect. Genet. Evol.* **8**, 26–33 (2008).

57. Zerbino, D. R. & Birney, E. Velvet: algorithms for de novo short read assembly using de Bruijn graphs. *Genome Res.* **18**, 821–829 (2008).

58. Rogers, M. B. et al. Chromosome and gene copy number variation allow major structural change between species and strains of *Leishmania*. *Genome Res.* **21**, 2129–2142 (2011).

59. Tihon, E., Imamura, H., Dujardin, J. C. & Van Den Abbeele, J. Evidence for transmitted trypanosome related to the Trypanosoma brucei subgenus, *Trypanozoon*. *Infect. Genet. Evol.* **8**, 26–33 (2008).

60. Emmes, D. M. & Kelly, S. OrthoFinder: solving fundamental biases in whole genome comparisons dramatically improves orthogroup inference accuracy. *Genome Biol.* **16**, 157 (2015).

61. Larkin, M. A. et al. Clustal W and Clustal X version 2.0. *Bioinformatics* **23**, 2947–2948 (2007).

62. Langmead, B. & Salzberg, S. L. Fast gapped-read alignment with Bowtie 2. *Nat. Methods* **9**, 357–359 (2012).

63. Ward, J. H. Hierarchical grouping to optimize an objective function. *J. Am. Stat. Assoc.* **58**, 236–244 (1963).

64. Li, H. Aligning sequence reads, clone sequences and assembly contigs with BWA-MEM. Preprint at https://arxiv.org/abs/1303.3997 (2013).

65. Li, H. et al. The Sequence Alignment/Map format and SAMtools. *Bioinformatics* **25**, 2078–2079 (2009).

66. Van der Auwera, G. A. et al. From fastQ data to high-confidence variant calls: The genome analysis toolkit best practices pipeline. *Curr. Protoc. Bioinforma.* **43**, 1–33 (2013).

67. Danecek, P. et al. The variant call format and VCFtools. *Bioinformatics* **27**, 2156–2158 (2011).

68. Guindon, S. et al. New algorithms and methods to estimate maximum-likelihood phylogenies: assessing the performance of PhyML 3.0. *Syst. Biol.* **59**, 307–321 (2010).

69. Lefort, V., Longueville, J.-E. & Gascuel, O. SMS: Smart Model Selection in PhyML. *Curr. Protoc. Bioinforma.* **25**, 2078–2079 (2009).

70. Van der Auwera, G. A. et al. From fastQ data to high-confidence variant calls: The genome analysis toolkit best practices pipeline. *Curr. Protoc. Bioinforma.* **43**, 1–33 (2013).

71. Guindon, S. et al. New algorithms and methods to estimate maximum-likelihood phylogenies: assessing the performance of PhyML 3.0. *Syst. Biol.* **59**, 307–321 (2010).

72. Lefort, V., Longueville, J.-E. & Gascuel, O. SMS: Smart Model Selection in PhyML. *Curr. Protoc. Bioinforma.* **25**, 2078–2079 (2009).

73. Guindon, S. et al. New algorithms and methods to estimate maximum-likelihood phylogenies: assessing the performance of PhyML 3.0. *Syst. Biol.* **59**, 307–321 (2010).

74. Lefort, V., Longueville, J.-E. & Gascuel, O. SMS: Smart Model Selection in PhyML. *Curr. Protoc. Bioinforma.* **25**, 2078–2079 (2009).

75. Guindon, S. et al. New algorithms and methods to estimate maximum-likelihood phylogenies: assessing the performance of PhyML 3.0. *Syst. Biol.* **59**, 307–321 (2010).

76. Lefort, V., Longueville, J.-E. & Gascuel, O. SMS: Smart Model Selection in PhyML. *Curr. Protoc. Bioinforma.* **25**, 2078–2079 (2009).

77. Guindon, S. et al. New algorithms and methods to estimate maximum-likelihood phylogenies: assessing the performance of PhyML 3.0. *Syst. Biol.* **59**, 307–321 (2010).

78. Lefort, V., Longueville, J.-E. & Gascuel, O. SMS: Smart Model Selection in PhyML. *Curr. Protoc. Bioinforma.* **25**, 2078–2079 (2009).

79. Guindon, S. et al. New algorithms and methods to estimate maximum-likelihood phylogenies: assessing the performance of PhyML 3.0. *Syst. Biol.* **59**, 307–321 (2010).

80. Quinlan, A. R. & Hall, I. M. BEDTools: a flexible suite of utilities for comparing genomic features. *Bioinformatics* **26**, 841–842 (2010).

81. O’Fallon, B. D. ACG: rapid inference of population history from recombinating nucleotide sequences. *BMC Bioinforma.* **14**, 40 (2013).

82. Milne, I. et al. TOPALi v2: a rich graphical interface for evolutionary analyses of multiple alignments on HPC clusters and multi-core desktops. *Bioinformatics* **25**, 126–127 (2009).

Acknowledgements
This work was supported by grants from the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (BB/M022811/1/BB/R021139/1), an International Veterinary Vaccinology Network (IVVN) pump-priming award, a Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation Grand Challenges Explorations award (Round 11), and the Wellcome Trust (WT206815/Z/17/Z).

Author contributions
Conceived and designed the experiments: S.S.P., A.P.J. Performed the experiments: S.S.P., H.N., M.O., K.J.G.d.A.C.N. Analyised the data: S.S.P., C.W.D., P.R., A.P.J. Contributed reagents/materials/analyses tools: M.R.A., Z.B., S.K., R.Z.M., M.M.G.T., A.P.J. Wrote the paper: S.S.P., A.P.J. Obtained funding: S.S.P., M.M.G.T., R.Z.M., A.P.J.

Competing interests
The authors declare no competing interests.

Additional information
Supplementary information is available for this paper at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-14575-8.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to A.P.J.

Peer review information *Nature Communications* thanks Frederik Van den Broeck and the other, anonymous, reviewer(s) for their contribution to the peer review of this work. Peer reviewer reports are available.

Reprints and permission information is available at http://www.nature.com/reprints

Publisher’s note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

© The Author(s) 2020