Contrasting genetic structure of sympatric congeneric gastropods: Do differences in habitat preference, abundance and distribution matter?

Edward J. G. Wort¹,² | Mark A. Chapman³ | Stephen J. Hawkins¹,⁴
Lucy Henshall¹ | Alfonso Pita¹ | Marc Rius¹,⁵ | Suzanne T. Williams² | Phillip B. Fenberg¹,²

¹Ocean and Earth Sciences, National Oceanography Centre Southampton, University of Southampton, Southampton, UK
²Department of Life Sciences, Natural History Museum, London, UK
³Biological Sciences, University of Southampton, Southampton, UK
⁴The Marine Biological Association of the UK, The Laboratory, Plymouth, UK
⁵Centre for Ecological Genomics and Wildlife Conservation, University of Johannesburg, Johannesburg, South Africa

Abstract

Aim: The relationship of population genetics with the ecology and biogeography of species may be explored by comparing phenotypically similar but ecologically different congeners with overlapping ranges. We compared genetic differentiation between two congeneric rocky intertidal gastropods across a major portion of their sympatric range. We hypothesized that the habitat generalist with high abundance and continuous distribution would exhibit comparatively less genetic differentiation than the habitat specialist with low abundance and a fragmented distribution.

Location: North-east Atlantic from the north-west Iberian Peninsula to southern British coastline.

Taxon: Gastropoda, Trochidae, Steromphala (formerly Gibbula).

Methods: Field surveys were conducted to assess the presence/absence and the abundance of Steromphala umbilicalis (generalist) and S. pennanti (specialist) at 23 localities along ~1,800 km coastline. We isolated polymorphic microsatellite markers for both species (seven loci for S. umbilicalis and eight for S. pennanti) and used these to genotype 187 S. umbilicalis and 157 S. pennanti individuals. We used standard population genetic analyses to compare patterns of genetic differentiation between species in relation to the field surveys.

Results: Steromphala pennanti showed a more fragmented distribution, significantly lower abundance, and greater genetic differentiation than S. umbilicalis. One S. umbilicalis population towards the north of the range (southern Britain) was genetically distinct from all other sampled populations. Steromphala pennanti showed greater genetic differentiation between three southern localities, which may be attributable to its fragmented distribution and lower abundance because of limited availability of its preferred fucoid habitat in this region. We also suggest that oceanographic currents could be associated with regional genetic structure.

Main conclusions: The habitat generalist showed high-local abundances, continuous distribution and low regional genetic differentiation. We found the opposite pattern...
1 | INTRODUCTION

A central question of biogeography asks how the population genetic structure of species is affected by environmental, ecological and life history variables and whether there are any associations with patterns of abundance and distribution (Hellberg, Burton, Neigel, & Palumbi, 2002; Riginos, Crandall, Liggins, Bongaerts, & Treml, 2016; Schiebelhut & Dawson, 2018; Selkoe et al., 2016). It has been classically assumed that early life history traits (e.g. duration of a dispersal phase) are good predictors of population genetic structure (Almeida et al., 2017; McInerny, Allcock, Johnson, & Prodocèhl, 2012). It has been classically assumed that early life history traits (e.g. duration of a dispersal phase) are good predictors of population genetic structure (Almeida et al., 2017; McInerny, Allcock, Johnson, & Prodocèhl, 2012). However, recent meta-analyses are equivocal and approach generalizations with caution because other factors, such as adult body size, egg type and microhabitat preferences, can also influence genetic structure (Kelly & Palumbi, 2010; Riginos, Douglas, Jin, Shanahan, & Treml, 2011; Selkoe & Toonen, 2011). Likewise, the distribution of physical habitat (e.g. geological substrate) and environmental conditions appear to influence genetic structure for some species, but not others (Almeida et al., 2017; Haye et al., 2014; Marko, 2004; Marko & Hart, 2011; McInerny et al., 2012). Recent biogeographical studies have shifted focus to ask whether demographic and ecological traits, such as abundance or habitat specificity, are related to differences in genetic structure (Engler, Balkenhol, Filz, Habel, & Rödder, 2014; Kierepka, Anderson, Swihart, & Rhodes, 2016; Selkoe et al., 2016).

To explore whether differences in species’ abundance and habitat specificity affect population genetic structure, it is useful to compare closely related species. Ideally this comparison would involve co-distributed congeners with the same propagule dispersal type. Such species would experience broadly similar environmental conditions and dispersal potential, but differ in their habitat preferences and overall abundance. This will increase confidence that any population genetic differences between species are related to these targeted ecological or demographic factors, rather than differences in environment or dispersal (Schiebelhut & Dawson, 2018). For example, a habitat generalist species, which should have relatively high abundances and hence, larger population sizes, may exhibit lower population subdivision than a sympatric congener with more restrictive habitat preferences (i.e. more fragmented geographic distribution), and therefore comparatively lower abundances and population sizes. For the high abundance/habitat generalist species, comparatively more offspring are expected to be produced, leading to a greater chance of recruitment, higher gene flow, and ultimately lower population genetic differentiation than for the low abundance/habitat specialist (Scheltema, 1971). Moreover, this species is likely to have shorter dispersal pathways than the habitat specialist among populations due to its more continuous geographic distribution. However, if one or both species have experienced a recent range expansion (e.g. post-glacial), then its genetic signature could mask some of these predicted population genetic patterns (Marko & Hart, 2011).

The relationship between habitat specificity and abundance with genetic population structure has been explored in terrestrial systems, where habitat generalist species exhibited more genetic connectivity than sympatric congeners with more restrictive habitat preferences and therefore a more fragmented geographic distribution (Engler et al., 2014; Kierepka et al., 2016). There are fewer examples in marine systems, but a recent study showed a positive relationship between estimates of local abundance and genetic structure, although this varied between pairs of synchronously diverging co-distributed species (Dawson, Hays, Grosberg, & Raimondi, 2014). In a review of reef community population genetics, all species with “chaotic” genetic structure (highly variable levels of genetic structuring with no obvious spatial patterning) were habitat generalists, whereas habitat specialists showed genetic differentiation between regions (Selkoe, Gaggiotti, Bowen, & Toonen, 2014). Differing habitat preferences and subsequent variation in current and historic distribution in intertidal gastropod congeners have also been associated with population genetic structure (Marko, 2004).

The trochids Steromphala umbilicalis (da Costa, 1778) and Steromphala pennanti (Philippi, 1846) were chosen to explore these patterns because they are phenotypically similar and sympatrically distributed along the rocky intertidal zone of the north-east Atlantic. The recorded range of S. umbilicalis extends from north-west Scotland (Mieszowska, Milligan, Burrows, Freckleton, & Spencer, 2013) to Morocco (Southward, Hawkins, & Burrows, 1995). Steromphala umbilicalis is a habitat generalist, found within the mid to low-intertidal zone in rockpools, cracks, above and under boulders/rock ledges/platforms, and the fucoid zone (Mieszowska et al., 2013; Muñoz-Colmenero et al., 2015). Steromphala pennanti is distributed from the Cherbourg peninsula in northern France to Morocco (Southward et al., 1995) on the low-intertidal zone, and is more closely associated with fucoid habitat, such as Fucus serratus (Linnaeus, 1753), than S. umbilicalis (Bordeyne et al., 2017). Steromphala pennanti is therefore a habitat specialist and largely restricted to the fragmented...
distribution of fucoids along the Bay of Biscay. Regarding dispersal potential, Steromphala species are widely held to produce lecithotrophic larvae and are estimated to have approximately the same maximum larval duration of 7 to 9 days (Keith, Herbert, Norton, Hawkins, & Newton, 2011; Underwood, 1972a,b).

Within the ranges of both species lies 230 km of almost uninterrupted sandy intertidal habitat in south-west France (Castelle et al., 2006). This habitat gap (Figure 1) results in the absence of both species along that shoreline and coincides with the northern range limit of the rocky intertidal gastropods Patella rustica (Linnaeus, 1758) (Lima et al., 2007) and Stramonita haemastoma (Linnaeus, 1767) (EJGW & PBF, personal observation). However, no studies to date assess whether the habitat gap affects population connectivity of rocky shore species that are found on both sides of the gap.

Here, we explored differences in the abundance, distribution, and population genetic structure of S. umbilicalis (habitat generalist) and S. pennanti (habitat specialist) within the sympatric portion of their ranges. In order to evaluate their genetic structure, we isolated and genotyped microsatellite loci of both species. We hypothesized that, if more abundant and continuously distributed (resulting in a larger overall population size), the habitat generalist will have lower-genetic differentiation than the habitat specialist. We also ask whether genetic breaks for both species occur in association with large habitat gaps and/or other physical variables.

2 | MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1 | Sampling

Abundance estimates were made at 23 localities (Figure 1) at low tide in November 2014, August 2015, April 2016 and August 2016, with multiple visits to several localities. These localities were roughly evenly spaced and equally sampled north and south of the habitat gap (11 north and 12 south). At each locality, four people searched the mid to low shore in varied microhabitats where both species occurred, for 2 to 4 minutes. To prevent sampling overlap, a distance of at least 10 m was kept between each person. Timed searches were part of a wider sampling effort to quantify the presence/absence of rocky shore gastropods at each locality (~3 hr per locality). This additional sampling effort was used to increase confidence of any locality-specific S. pennanti absences. For both species, the mean number of individuals found per minute was calculated at each locality where both species were present (n = 16). The normality of abundance distributions was tested using a Shapiro–Wilk test in RSTUDIO 1.1.383, which showed a non-normal abundance distribution in S. pennanti. Therefore, a Wilcoxon–Mann–Whitney test was used in RSTUDIO to compare abundances between species over their sympatric range. Abundance measurements were also compared between mean value of localities to the north of the habitat gap in south-west France against the mean value of localities to the south of the habitat gap for both species.

An average of 27 (SE = 1.04) individuals of S. umbilicalis and 26 (SE = 2.30) individuals of S. pennanti were collected from three localities to the south of the habitat gap and three to the north (Fig. 1 and Table 2) and stored in 95% ethanol. Where it was not possible to collect enough specimens of each species from the same locality, the nearest locality was used instead for the under-sampled species (usually S. pennanti due to its fragmented distribution and often low abundances). Steromphala umbilicalis was also collected from Swanage (the UK) to investigate whether the English Channel was associated with a genetic break.

2.2 | Microsatellite identification and primer development

Microsatellite markers for S. umbilicalis were developed from the transcriptome sequence generated from a single individual collected at Southsea, Hampshire, the UK. Details of the transcriptome sequencing and assembly for S. umbilicalis are given in Appendix S1 in the Supporting Information. The assembled transcriptome of S. umbilicalis was mined for microsatellites using MISA (http://pgrc.ipk-gatersleben.de/misa/) with the minimum number of repeats being: dinucleotide ≥8x, trinucleotide ≥6x and tetranculeotide ≥4x. Loci without ≥20 bp of sequence flanking the microsatellite were removed and longer microsatellites were preferred for primer design.
Microsatellite primers were designed using different methods for each species. For *S. umbilicalis*, the selected sequences of transcripts containing simple sequence repeats (SSRs) were entered into Primer3 4.0.0 (Koressaar & Remm, 2007; Untergasser et al., 2012) one by one with the SSRs highlighted using default settings. For each locus where primers could be designed, the highest ranking primer pair based on default settings was retained. We removed any primers with: (a) non-zero values for self-complementarity score (any_th), (b) the 3’ self-complementarity (3’_th), (c) the value of the melting temperature of the most stable hairpin structure of the primer (hairpin) or (d) low (<60°C) annealing temperatures. Remaining loci were BLAST searched against the mt genome of *S. umbilicalis* in Geneious 8.1.5 (Kearse et al., 2012), and any loci potentially belonging to the mt genome were excluded (Wort, Fenberg, & Williams, 2017). Any primers that contained an SSR-like repeat were excluded, or in some cases a new primer pair was designed with the above conditions.

For *S. pennanti*, DNA extractions from 10 specimens from San Vicente de la Barquera and Vilagarcía de Arousa (referred to for the remainder of the text as Vilagarcia) were diluted to approximately 1 μg of DNA and sent to Genoscreen (Lille, France) to develop microsatellite primers. Generation of multiplex-enriched libraries and sequencing was carried out as reported in Malausa et al. (2011). Briefly, genomic DNA was mechanically fragmented, enriched in microsatellite loci with eight probes (TG, TC, AAC, AGG, ACG, AAG, ACAT and ACTC) before amplification by PCR with a High Fidelity Taq. PCR products were purified, quantified and GsFLX libraries were then carried out following the manufacturer protocols and sequenced on 1/32 of a 454 GS-FLX PTP. The bioinformatics program QDD 3 (Meglécz et al., 2009) was used to analyse *S. pennanti* DNA sequences to obtain PCR primers. Among 5,945 sequences containing a microsatellite motif, 189 primer sets bioinformatically validated were designed which had “perfect” characteristics. After excluding primer pairs that failed to amplify in the majority of samples and those that were monomorphic, seven remained that amplified all *S. umbilicalis* individuals, and eight from an initial nine trialled in *S. pennanti* (Table 1).

PCR was performed in 25 μl reactions containing 1 μl of forward and reverse primers of each microsatellite locus at 10 μM concentration, 12.5 μl of GoTaq G2 Green Master Mix (Promega, Madison, WI), 2 μl of DNA solution between 50 and 500 ng/μl concentration measured using a Nanodrop, and sterile distilled water. Thermal cycling was performed with initial denaturation for 5 minutes at 95°C, 40 cycles of 60 s at 95°C, 60 s at the given annealing temperature (Table 1), 90 s at 95°C, and a final elongation step of 15 min at 72°C. PCR product was then diluted to 1:50 volume with sterile distilled water and sent to DBS Genomics (Durham University, the UK) for fragment length analysis (FLA) using a 3,730 DNA Analyser (Applied Biosystems) with the filter set DS-30, and ROX500 as the size standard. Primers were initially trialled with two samples from three localities using a temperature gradient PCR for annealing temperatures from 52°C to 62°C, and subsequent FLA. Where amplification of polymorphic loci was unsuccessful regardless of temperature or samples, the primers were excluded.

### 2.3 Peak scoring and analysis

Peak scoring was carried out using Peak Scanner 2.0 (Applied Biosystems). The observed (H$_o$) and expected (H$_e$) heterozygosities, and the number of alleles (A) per locus and locality were calculated with GenAlex 6 (Peakall & Smouse, 2006) (Tables 2 and Tables S2.1 and S2.2).
S2.2). Heterozygote deficiency both by locus and by locality were also tested in Genepop on the Web 4.2 (Rousset, 1995, 2008) with 10,000 dememorization steps, 1,000 batches and 10,000 permutations per batch (Fenberg, Hellberg, Mullen, & Roy, 2010) (Table S2.3). Genepop on the Web 4.2 (Rousset, 1995, 2008) was used to obtain pairwise and global $F_{ST}$ (Weir & Cockerham, 1984) and subsequent $P$-values with default settings and significance ($\alpha = 0.05$) determined following the sequential Bonferroni correction. Nei’s pairwise $F_{ST}$ (Nei, 1973) was calculated using the “hierfstat” package (Goudet, 2005) in “adegenet” 2.0.1 (Jombart, 2008) in RStudio and used to generate a discriminant analysis of principal components (DAPC) using the package “adegenet” 2.0.1 (Jombart, 2008; Jombart, Devillard, & Balloux, 2010) in RStudio.

Structure 2.3.4 (Pritchard, Stephens, & Donnelly, 2000) was used with an admixture model on microsatellite data with and without prior populations input to the model. Ten runs were carried out for each of the potential number of populations ($k$) (1–6 for S. pennanti, 1–7 for S. umbilicalis) with a burn-in of 30,000 steps followed by 100,000 Markov Chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) iterations to estimate mean and variance of posterior probabilities and log likelihoods of the number of assumed populations. The best estimate of $k$ was determined in STRUCTURE HARVESTER (Earl, 2012) using the peak in the delta $k$ value. Subsequent visualisation of the data as bar graphs was carried out in CLUMPP (Kopelman, Mayzel, Jakobsson, Rosenberg, & Mayrose, 2015) for the best assumed $k$ value. The population structure was also assessed with R-package GENELAND 4.0 (Guillot, Mortier, & Estoup, 2005) using the spatial model and uncorrelated frequencies. One million iterations, 100 iterations of thinning and a final burn-in of 10% of the saved iterations were used to test for the best $k$ between one and the maximum number of samples in each species.

AMOVAs (Excoffier, Smouse, & Quattro, 1992) were carried out in RSTUDIO using the “poppr” package 2.5.0 (Kamvar, Tabima, & Grünwald, 2014) on each species between two groups for S. pennanti (north and south of the habitat gap), and for S. umbilicalis among three groups (Swanage, north and south of the habitat gap), between sites within those groups, and all individuals. Significance of results was tested using MC tests with 10,000 repeats. The number of migrants per generation was estimated in Genepop on the Web using the private alleles method (Barton & Slatkin, 1986) between localities north and south of the habitat gap. Genetic effective sizes ($N_e$) were calculated with the Linkage Disequilibrium Method implemented in NeEstimator 2.01 (Do et al., 2014).

### RESULTS

#### 3.1 Abundance distribution

Steromphala umbilicalis was significantly more abundant (Wilcoxon–Mann–Whitney test, $W = 219$, $p = 0.0006$) than S. pennanti at localities where both species were present ($n = 16$), with mean abundance of $16.38$ (SE $= 2.03$) individuals per minute search time for S. umbilicalis compared to $5.44$ (SE $= 1.22$) individuals per minute for S. pennanti (Fig. 1). Steromphala pennanti was absent from six localities within our sampling range, four of which were south of the habitat gap where fucoids were not present, whereas S. umbilicalis was present at every locality. Thus, the habitat generalist, S. umbilicalis, was more abundant and more continuously distributed than S. pennanti within their sympatric range. Steromphala pennanti was less abundant south of the habitat gap [mean abundance $= 3.34$ (SE $= 1.08$) individuals per minute, $n = 8$] than north of the habitat gap [mean abundance $= 7.19$ (SE $= 1.98$) individuals per minute, $n = 8$], albeit not significantly due to the small sample size ($W = 45$, $p = 0.1949$). Steromphala umbilicalis showed the opposite pattern, with a mean abundance of $19.12$ (SE $= 2.01$) individuals per minute south of the habitat gap ($n = 13$) and $12.17$ (SE $= 2.55$) individuals per minute north of the habitat gap ($n = 9$) ($W = 16.5$, $p = 0.1149$).

#### 3.2 Microsatellite population genetics

Microsatellite data were obtained for 187 S. umbilicalis and 157 S. pennanti individuals (Table 2). A larger number of between locality measures of differentiation (pairwise $F_{ST}$) were significant for S. pennanti than S. umbilicalis (Table 3). The only significant pairwise differences for S. umbilicalis were found when one population under consideration was the British locality (Swanage). By contrast, S. pennanti showed significant differentiation between San Vicente de la Barquera (on the central north coast of the Iberian Peninsula) and all other localities, and Vilagarcía (NW Iberian Peninsula) with Cap de la Hague (Cherbourg Peninsula, France). The habitat gap did not

| Code | Locality | $N$ | $H_e$ | $H_o$ | $\hat{A}$ ± SD |
|------|----------|-----|------|------|----------------|
| S. umbilicalis | SW Swanage | 22 | 0.703 | 0.234 | 6.86 ± 1.57 |
| | C Cap de Carteret | 27 | 0.626 | 0.481 | 6.43 ± 1.99 |
| | LO Loctudy | 29 | 0.651 | 0.437 | 7.29 ± 2.06 |
| | LP Les Pierrieres | 29 | 0.598 | 0.452 | 6.86 ± 1.86 |
| | B Biarritz | 29 | 0.589 | 0.433 | 7.14 ± 3.48 |
| | V Vilagarcía de Arousa | 24 | 0.582 | 0.379 | 6.43 ± 3.21 |
| S. pennanti | H Cap de la Hague | 33 | 0.566 | 0.245 | 6.75 ± 4.92 |
| | LO Loctudy | 30 | 0.558 | 0.259 | 6.38 ± 4.57 |
| | P Point du Chay | 20 | 0.547 | 0.270 | 4.88 ± 2.17 |
| | SJ St Jean de Luz | 19 | 0.649 | 0.270 | 5.50 ± 4.69 |
| | V Vilagarcía de Arousa | 29 | 0.535 | 0.291 | 6.00 ± 3.66 |
TABLE 3 Pairwise comparisons of microsatellite genotypic differentiation \( (P\)-value) and \( F\)-statistics: localities north of the habitat gap in bold, sites ordered from south (top) to north (bottom); significant \( P\)-value following sequential Bonferroni correction marked with asterisk (*); \( F_{ST} \) WC = \( F_{ST} \) calculated according to Weir and Cockerham (1984); \( F_{ST} \) WC C = corrected \( F_{ST} \) WC values; species = U for Steromphala umbilicalis and P for S. pennanti. Where calculations gave negative \( F_{ST} \) values, these were reported as 0. Locality codes correspond with Table 2.

| Localities | \( P\)-value | \( F_{ST} \) WC | \( F_{ST} \) WC C | Species |
|------------|-------------|----------------|----------------|---------|
| V & S      | 0.074       | 0.011          | 0.023          | U       |
| V & B      | 0.004       | 0.023          | 0.023          | U       |
| V & LP     | 0.046       | 0.007          | 0.007          | U       |
| V & LO     | 0.126       | 0.004          | 0.005          | U       |
| V & C      | 0.072       | 0.004          | 0.011          | U       |
| S & B      | 0.178       | 0.000          | 0.010          | U       |
| S & LP     | 0.629       | 0              | 0.006          | U       |
| S & LO     | 0.189       | 0.009          | 0.017          | U       |
| S & C      | 0.374       | 0              | 0.001          | U       |
| B & LP     | 0.079       | 0.005          | 0.010          | U       |
| B & LO     | 0.342       | 0.009          | 0.011          | U       |
| B & C      | 0.613       | 0              | 0.009          | U       |
| LP & LO    | 0.011       | 0.008          | 0.009          | U       |
| LP & C     | 0.388       | 0              | 0.005          | U       |
| LO & C     | 0.854       | 0              | 0.003          | U       |
| SW & V     | <0.001*     | 0.066          | 0.052          | U       |
| SW & S     | <0.001*     | 0.082          | 0.104          | U       |
| SW & B     | <0.001*     | 0.066          | 0.074          | U       |
| SW & LP    | <0.001*     | 0.075          | 0.074          | U       |
| SW & LO    | <0.001*     | 0.064          | 0.061          | U       |
| SW & C     | <0.001*     | 0.067          | 0.082          | U       |
| V & S      | 0.003*      | 0.014          | 0.016          | P       |
| V & SJ     | 0.005       | 0.028          | 0.035          | P       |
| V & P      | 0.124       | 0.023          | 0.017          | P       |
| V & LO     | 0.078       | 0.014          | 0.017          | P       |
| V & H      | 0.001*      | 0.047          | 0.035          | P       |
| S & SJ     | <0.001*     | 0.052          | 0.071          | P       |
| S & P      | 0.001*      | 0.044          | 0.042          | P       |
| S & LO     | <0.001*     | 0.043          | 0.043          | P       |
| S & H      | <0.001*     | 0.060          | 0.057          | P       |
| SJ & P     | 0.474       | 0.000          | 0.012          | P       |
| SJ & LO    | 0.021       | 0.019          | 0.029          | P       |
| SJ & H     | 0.021       | 0.029          | 0.037          | P       |
| P & LO     | 0.051       | 0.017          | 0.014          | P       |
| P & H      | 0.189       | 0.016          | 0.012          | P       |
| LO & H     | 0.055       | 0.007          | 0.008          | P       |

Coincide with significant genetic differentiation in either species between the two localities immediately north or south, or when tested using AMOVA (Table 4). Analysis of the number of migrants per generation between groups north and south of the habitat gap showed that S. pennanti had 6.91 migrants per generation, whereas S. umbilicalis had 10.87 migrants per generation (excluding Swanage for S. umbilicalis). Using all populations of the data set (excluding Swanage for S. umbilicalis), the number of migrants per generation was 2.71 for S. pennanti and 5.43 for S. umbilicalis. Because the number of migrants per generation is greater than 1 for both species (and between groups), then we can discard random genetic drift as a cause of genetic differentiation among samples (Wright, 1931).

For both species, the optimum \( k \) was determined to be 3 based on the peak in \( \Delta k \), with or without prior population information. However, GENELAND analyses estimated that S. pennanti constituted a single genetic unit (\( k = 1 \)) while two different units were found in S. umbilicalis: the first was represented by the Swanage population, and the second by the continental populations. It is possible that Structure is less useful (Appendix S3) due to high gene flow (Waples & Gaggiotti, 2006). The DAPCs for S. umbilicalis showed substantial overlap of genetic similarity for most populations (Fig. 2a), but Swanage (and to a lesser extent, Vilagarcía) is a clear outlier population. By contrast, the DAPC for S. pennanti showed less overlap between populations (Fig. 2b). \( N_E \) and their 95% confidence interval were calculated by groups within species. The northern group of S. pennanti showed a \( N_E \) of 268 (95% CI = 130–3,813) while for the southern group it was 103 (95% CI = 66–197). Estimates in S. umbilicalis were 198 (95% CI = 114–558) in the northern group (Swanage not included) and 835 (95% CI = 198–∞) in the southern group. Additional microsatellite analyses and results including Mantel tests are available in Appendix S4.

4 | DISCUSSION

Until recently, studies infrequently accounted for the potential of differing abundance and distribution patterns to help explain the contrasting patterns of genetic structure between species. Our study joins a small, but growing literature that combines such field data with population genetics for marine species [e.g. Dawson et al. (2014)]. By integrating field data on abundance and distribution with knowledge of their respective ecologies, we are able to more clearly isolate the ecological and physical mechanisms behind differences in genetic structure of the studied species. Our results are in accordance with recent studies of rocky shore invertebrates and fish (Dawson et al., 2014; Selkoe et al., 2014), as well as butterflies and mammals (Engler et al., 2014; Kierepka et al., 2016), showing that specialist species (which are often less abundant with fragmented distributions) exhibit more genetic differentiation compared to generalist species (which are often more abundant with more continuous distributions).

Within the same region, a habitat generalist species with high-local abundance and a continuously spread distribution should yield greater reproductive output than a phenotypically similar habitat specialist congener with lower abundance and a more fragmented distribution. Assuming juvenile mobility is similar, then this will result in shorter dispersal pathways among populations and more emigrant populations. The DAPCs for S. umbilicalis showed substantial overlap of genetic similarity for most populations (Fig. 2a), but Swanage (and to a lesser extent, Vilagarcía) is a clear outlier population. By contrast, the DAPC for S. pennanti showed less overlap between populations (Fig. 2b). \( N_E \) and their 95% confidence interval were calculated by groups within species. The northern group of S. pennanti showed a \( N_E \) of 268 (95% CI = 130–3,813) while for the southern group it was 103 (95% CI = 66–197). Estimates in S. umbilicalis were 198 (95% CI = 114–558) in the northern group (Swanage not included) and 835 (95% CI = 198–∞) in the southern group. Additional microsatellite analyses and results including Mantel tests are available in Appendix S4.
offsprings for the habitat generalist species, leading to increased gene flow and therefore reduced genetic variation between populations compared to the habitat specialist (Dawson et al., 2014). Other factors such as differences in larval dispersal could also be important [e.g. in congeneric chthamalid barnacles, Pannacciulli, Bishop, and Hawkins (1997)], but remain largely unexplored in rocky intertidal invertebrates. Here we present that the widespread and common S. umbilicalis shows lower genetic differentiation among localities compared to the habitat specialist, S. pennanti, which is characterized by low abundances and a more fragmented distribution (Figure 1; Table 3). Furthermore, S. umbilicalis shows a greater number of migrants between the groups north and south of the Biscayan habitat gap than S. pennanti. The greatest number of significant pairwise differences for S. umbilicalis were found between the British Isles locality of Swanage and the continental localities, while the absence of significant genetic differentiation throughout the Bay of Biscay suggests a largely panmictic population (Table 3). Thus, the English Channel (which S. pennanti does not cross) appears to be a larger barrier to gene flow than the Biscayan habitat gap for S. umbilicalis, as described in both the GENELAND and STRUCTURE analyses. In S. pennanti, the greatest number of significant pairwise differences are found between San Vicente de la Barquera and all other localities (Table 3). San Vicente de la Barquera (central north Iberian coast) coincides with the most fragmented part of its geographic range that we sampled (Figure 1). In addition, this region (south of the habitat gap) is associated with the lowest abundances (albeit not significant due to the small sample size) and estimates of genetic effective population size in S. pennanti. In contrast, this region coincides with highest abundances and estimates of genetic effective population size for S. umbilicalis. Below we will further discuss the biological and physical factors that may explain the differences and commonalities of genetic structure between the two species.

4.1 Differences between species

Steromphala umbilicalis is continuously distributed within the Bay of Biscay and shows high-overall field (census population size) and genetic population sizes (i.e. effective population size). Thus, a panmictic metapopulation fits with predictions for a generalist species such as S. umbilicalis (Dawson et al., 2014; Engler et al., 2014; Kierkepa et al., 2016). By contrast, S. pennanti has a fragmented geographic distribution, lower overall abundance both in field observations and genetic estimations, and is associated with fucoids largely on more sheltered shores (Bordeyne et al., 2017). Given these clear differences between the studied species, we can look more closely at locality specific patterns of genetic differentiation with the abundance and distribution data. For example, we find significant genetic differentiation between San Vicente de la Barquera (central north Iberian coast) and all other localities in S. pennanti. Our surveys show that S. pennanti and Fucus were largely absent within the intervening section of coastline separating St Jean de Luz (SW France) and San Vicente de la Barquera (225 km). The absence of several fucoid species in this region of the Iberian Peninsula has been attributed to its relatively high sea surface temperature (SST) (Duarte et al., 2013; Southward et al., 1995; Zardi et al., 2015). Fucoids act as a bioengineer once established (Pocklington et al., 2017; Seed & O’Connor, 1981) and are thought to facilitate the recruitment of certain gastropods, including S. pennanti (Bordeyne et al., 2017). Conversely, there is no such genetic differentiation between any of the mainland sampled S. umbilicalis populations. This may be largely attributable to the presence of S. umbilicalis at every sampling locality, reducing isolation among populations. Steromphala pennanti is also absent from two of five localities between Vilagarcia (NW Iberian coast) and San Vicente de la Barquera (Fig. 1). This may explain the significant genetic differentiation between the two localities. Interestingly, while S. umbilicalis shows no significant genetic difference between these two localities, there is a relatively high $F_{ST}$ value (0.011) and Vilagarcia appears as an outlier population in the DACP (Fig. 2).

Another major difference between species is the presence of S. umbilicalis on the British Isles. As Steromphala is thought to have originated south of the British Isles (Southward et al., 1995), two possible explanations for extremely rare but successful recruitment of S. umbilicalis from mainland to British shores and the absence of S. pennanti on British shores are: (a) its greater abundance (compared with S. pennanti) increases the number of larvae released, thereby increasing the probability of propagules reaching Britain; or (b) S. umbilicalis has a longer larval duration than S. pennanti, allowing
larvae to disperse further. The significant genetic differentiation between Swanage (Britain) and all other populations (FST = 0.064 to 0.082, p ≤ 0.001 for all pairwise comparisons), suggests diminished recruitment across the Channel for *S. umbilicalis* which was not attributable to distance (see Mantel test in Appendix S3.1). This low connectivity in *S. umbilicalis* may be attributable to the Channel acting as a habitat gap, where tidal currents dominate the transport (Pingree & Maddock, 1977). These currents are not driven in a uniform direction, unlike the long shore currents along the sandy habitat gap in south-west France (Castelle et al., 2006; Lazure, Garnier, Dumas, Herry, & Chifflet, 2009), although the currents can be of a comparable order of magnitude (Pingree & Maddock, 1977).

### 4.2 Patterns associated with both species

According to our hypothesis, there should be low-genetic differentiation among localities in regions where both species are relatively abundant with continuous distributions. As such, we find that on the northern mainland coast (Figure 1) there is no significant genetic differentiation between localities in either species. This cooler region...
has a sustained and well-established fucoid habitat (Southward et al., 1995; Zardi et al., 2015), which is mirrored by the relatively consistent presence and higher abundances of *S. pennanti* in this region relative to south of the habitat gap (albeit a non-significant difference due to low sample number) (Figure 1). However, we acknowledge that potential range expansion dynamics (e.g. post-glacial retreat) could also have contributed to the lack of significant population differences within the northern range of *S. pennanti* (Figure 1). Furthermore, the genetic differentiation between southern Britain (Swanage) and mainland European localities of *S. umbilicus* may be associated with population divergence associated with glacial cycles (Marko, 2004). Future studies should explore these possibilities using a combination of mtDNA and nuclear markers (Marko & Hart, 2011).

We found that both *Stomaphyla* species exhibit no significant genetic differentiation between the sampled localities directly north and south of the habitat gap (*F*<sub>ST</sub> = 0.005, *p* = 0.079 for *S. umbilicus* and *F*<sub>ST</sub> = 0.000, *p* = 0.474 for *S. pennanti*), which has also been found for similar scale sandy habitat gaps for some rocky intertidal species (Ayre, Minchinton, & Perrin, 2009). One possible scenario is southward transport of larvae of both species along the surface water layer of this region during late summer (Lazure et al., 2009). Larval transport spanning this gap of ~230 km would require a mean long-shore current of approximately 0.4 m/s, which would be possible considering the estimated larval duration of ≤7 days for *S. umbilicus* (Keith et al., 2011) and, we assume, *S. pennanti*. Southward-long shore current velocities measured and modelled on this sandy coast mostly range between 0.1 m/s and 0.5 m/s, sometimes reaching 1 m/s (Castelle et al., 2006). These currents may therefore enable southward larval transport over the habitat gap during the spawning season, resulting in genetic connectivity. As such, our results suggest that currents, larval duration and spawning season are more important than absolute distances, when considering genetic differentiation across habitat gaps.

The role of coastal currents and oceanographic fronts in influencing population genetics has been assessed for several species in and around our study region, particularly around Brittany in northern France (Almeida et al., 2017; Couceiro, Robuchon, Destombe, & Valero, 2013). These and other studies highlight the interaction between currents as well as timing of propagule release/spawning (Dong et al., 2012). Spawning of *S. umbilicus* peaks from August to November/December and October/November on the north and west coasts of the Iberian Peninsula respectively (both south of the habitat gap) (Bode, Lomas, & Anadon, 1986; Gaudêncio & Guerra, 1986; Lewis, 1986). Assuming a similar spawning season for *S. pennanti*, November and December ocean currents around the western Iberian Peninsula are wind driven from the south-west, which would enable autumn and winter dispersal of larvae northwards of the centre of the Bay of Biscay (Puillat, Lazare, Jegou, Lampert, & Miller, 2004; Varela, Rosón, Herrera, Torres-López, & Fernández-Romero, 2005). These currents could drive surface water containing larvae away from the suitable habitat on the north coast of the Iberian Peninsula. The remainder of the year, the western Iberian Peninsula is dominated by a northwest oceanic swell (Zardi et al., 2015), possibly resulting in southwards transport of larvae (Ribeiro, Branco, Hawkins, & Santos, 2010). This would reduce recruitment between the north and west coast of the Iberian Peninsula, potentially contributing to Vilagarcia (NW Iberian coast) being an outlier for both species.

## 5 CONCLUSIONS

Our study supports the hypothesis that, over their sympatric range, a habitat generalist with a continuous distribution and high abundances will exhibit lower-genetic differentiation compared to a congener habitat specialist with a fragmented distribution and lower abundances. These genetic differences are likely a function of contrasting population sizes and population isolation, which have long been known to influence genetic differentiation in a broad sense (Frankham, 1996; Riggins & Nachman, 2001). However, our study goes further by providing field data supporting the ecological mechanisms that likely drive the observed differences in population genetics. Compared to the largely panmictic and continuously distributed *S. umbilicus*, higher genetic differentiation in *S. pennanti* is suggested to be caused by an association between habitat availability (fucoid presence/abundance), which is spatially fragmented on the N. Iberian Peninsula where genetic differentiation is highest in this species. Our research broadly supports recent studies that suggest how distribution and abundance data can help the interpretation of comparative population genetic studies (Dawson et al., 2014; Engler et al., 2014; Kierepka et al., 2016). We therefore recommend incorporating a measure of abundance, distribution, and knowledge of the ecology and life history of species in population genetics studies. This can be combined with information on the spatial distribution of habitat availability and environmental variables to inform subsequent interpretation, particularly through targeted sampling of sympatric congeners.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors thank E. Michel and the staff at the Natural History Museum, particularly L. Smith and K. Hopkins, as well as K. Ellis and A. Loveridge at University of Southampton for their help with DNA extractions. This research was partly funded as part of EJGW SPITFIRE DTP PhD from NERC and an Early Career Research Grant from the Malacological Society of London to EJGW. AP was supported by a post-doctoral grant from Xunta de Galicia, Spain (P.P. 0000 421S 140.08). No permits were necessary for sampling.

## ORCID

Edward J. G. Wort [https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2989-9040](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2989-9040)

## REFERENCES

Almeida, S. C., Nicastro, K. R., Zardi, G. I., Pearson, G. A., Valero, M., & Serrião, E. A. (2017) Reproductive strategies and population genetic structure of *Fucus* spp. across a northeast Atlantic biogeographic transition. *Aquatic Living Resources*, 30, 16. [https://doi.org/10.1051/alr/2017012](https://doi.org/10.1051/alr/2017012)
Pocklington, J. B., Jenkins, S. R., Bellgrove, A., Keough, M. J., O’Wort ET AL. Ribeiro, P. A., Branco, M., Hawkins, S. J., & Santos, A. M. (2010). Recent Riginos, C., Crandall, E. D., Liggins, L., Bongaerts, P., & Treml, E. A. Marko, P. (2004). What’s larvae got to do with it? Disparate patterns of post-glacial population structure in two benthic marine gastropods with identical dispersal potential. Molecular Ecology, 13, 597–611. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-294X.2004.02096.x Marko, P., & Hart, M. (2011). The complex analytical landscape of gene flow inference. Trends in Ecology and Evolution, 26, 448–456. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tree.2011.05.007 McInerney, C. E., Allcock, A. L., Johnson, M. P., & Prodöhl, P. A. (2012). Ecological coherence in marine reserve network design: An empirical evaluation of sequential site selection using genetic structure. Biological Conservation, 152, 262–270. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2012.03.009 Meglécz, E., Costedoat, C., Dubut, V., Gilles, A., Malasa, T., Pech, N., & Martin, J.-F. (2009). QDD: A user-friendly program to select microsatellite markers and design primers from large sequencing projects. Bioinformatics, 26, 403–404. Mieszkowska, N., Milligan, G., Burrows, M. T., Freckleton, R., & Spencer, M. (2013). Dynamic species distribution models from categorical survey data. Journal of Animal Ecology, 82, 1215–1226. https://doi.org/10.1111/1365-2656.12100 Muñoz-Colmenero, M., Jeunen, G.-J., Borrell, Y., Martínez, J., Turrero, P., & García-Vazquez, E. (2015). Response of top shell assemblages to cyclogenesis disturbances. A case study in the Bay of Biscay. Marine Environmental Research, 112 B, 2–10. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marenvres.2015.06.012 Nei, M. (1973). Analysis of gene diversity in subdivided populations. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 70, 3321–3323. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.70.12.3321 Pannaccìulli, F., Bishop, J., & Hawkins, S. (1997). Genetic structure of populations of two species of Chthamalus (Crustacea: Cirripedia) in the north-east Atlantic and Mediterranean. Marine Biology, 128, 73–82. https://doi.org/10.1007/s002270050070 Peakall, R., & Smouse, P. E. (2006). GENALEX 6: Genetic analysis in Excel. Population genetic software for teaching and research. Molecular Ecology Resources, 6, 288–295. Pingree, R. D., & Maddock, L. (1977). Tidal residuals in the English Channel. Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom, 57, 339–354. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0025315400021792 Pocklington, J. B., Jenkins, S. R., Bellgrove, A., Keough, M. J., O’Hara, T. D., Masterson-Algar, P. E., & Hawkins, S. J. (2017). Disturbance alters ecosystem engineering by a canopy-forming alga. Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom, 98, 687–698. Pritchard, J. K., Stephens, M., & Donnelly, P. (2000). Inference of population structure using multilocus genotype data. Genetics, 155, 945–959. Puillat, I., Lazure, P., Jegou, A.-M., Lampert, L., & Miller, P. (2004). Hydrographical variability on the French continental shelf in the Bay of Biscay, during the 1990s. Continental Shelf Research, 24, 1143–1163. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.csr.2004.02.008 Ribeiro, P. A., Branco, M., Hawkins, S. J., & Santos, A. M. (2010). Recent changes in the distribution of a marine gastropod, Patella rustica, across the Iberian Atlantic coast did not result in diminished genetic diversity or increased connectivity. Journal of Biogeography, 37, 1782–1796. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2699.2010.02330.x Riginos, C., Crandall, E. D., Liggins, L., Bongaerts, P., & Treml, E. A. (2016). Navigating the currents of seascape genomics: How spatial analyses can augment population genomic studies. Current Zoology, 62, 581–601. https://doi.org/10.1093/cz/zw0067 Rigon’s, C., Douglas, K. E., Jin, Y., Shanahan, D. F., & Treml, E. A. (2011). Effects of geography and life history traits on genetic differentiation in benthic marine fishes. Ecography, 34, 566–575. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0587.2010.06511.x Rigon’s, C., & Nachman, M. (2001). Population subdivision in marine environments: The contributions of biogeography, geographical distance and discontinuous habitat to genetic differentiation in a blemnioid fish, Axoclinus nigricaudus. Molecular Ecology, 10, 1439–1453. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-294X.2001.01294.x Rognstad, R. L., Wethey, D. S., & Hilbish, T. J. (2014). Connectivity and population repatriation: Limitations of climate and input into the larval pool. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 495, 175–183. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps10590 Roussef, F. (1995). ENEPOP (Version 1.2): Population genetics software for exact tests and ecumenicalism. Journal of Heredity, 83, 239. Roussef, F. (2008). genepop007: A complete re-implementation of the genepop software for Windows and Linux. Molecular Ecology Resources, 8, 103–106. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-8286.2007.01931.x Scheltema, R. S. (1971). Larval dispersal as a means of genetic exchange between geographically separated populations of shallow-water benthic marine gastropods. The Biological Bulletin, 140, 284–322. https://doi.org/10.2307/1540075 Schiebelhut, L. M., & Dawson, M. N. (2018). Correlates of population genetic differentiation in marine and terrestrial environments. Journal of Biogeography, 45, in press. Seed, R., & O’Connor, R. J. (1981). Community organization in marine algal epifaunas. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics, 12, 49–74. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.es.12.110881.000405 Selkoe, K. A., Aloia, C. C., Crandall, E. D., Iacchei, M., Liggins, L., Puritz, J. B., … Toonen, R. J. (2016). A decade of seascape genetics: Contributions to basic and applied marine connectivity. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 554, 1–19. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps11792 Selkoe, K. A., Gaggiotti, O. E., Bowen, B. W., & Toonen, R. J. (2014). Emergent patterns of population genetic structure for a coral reef community. Molecular Ecology, 23, 3064–3079. https://doi.org/10.1111/mec.12804 Selkoe, K., & Toonen, R. J. (2011). Marine connectivity: A new look at pelagic larval duration and genetic metrics of dispersal. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 436, 291–305. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps09238 Southward, A. J., Hawkins, S. J., & Burrows, M. T. (1995). Seventy years’ observation of changes in distribution and abundance of zooplankton and intertidal organisms in the western English Channel in relation to rising sea temperature. Journal of Thermal Biology, 20, 127–155. https://doi.org/10.1016/0306-4565(94)00043-I Underwood, A. (1972a). Observations on the reproductive cycles of Monodonta lineata, Gibbula umbilicalis and G. cineraria. Marine Biology, 17, 333–340. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00366744 Underwood, A. (1972b). Spawning, larval development and settlement behaviour of Gibbula cineraria (Gastropoda: Prosobranchia) with a reappraisal of torsion in gastropods. Marine Biology, 17, 341–349. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00366745 Untergerass, A., Cutcutache, I., Koressaar, T., Ye, J., Faircloth, B. C., Remm, M., & Rozen, S. G. (2012). Primer3—new capabilities and interfaces. Nucleic Acids Research, 40, e115. https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gks596 Varela, R. A., Rosón, G., Herrera, J. L., Torres-López, S., & Fernández-Romero, A. (2005). A general view of the hydrographic and dynamical patterns of the Rías Baixas adjacent sea area. Journal of Marine Systems, 54, 97–113. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmarsys.2004.07.006 Waples, R. S., & Gaggiotti, O. (2006). What is a population? An empirical evaluation of some genetic methods for identifying the number of gene pools and their degree of connectivity. Molecular Ecology, 15, 1419–1439. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-294X.2006.02890.x
Weir, B. S., & Cockerham, C. C. (1984). Estimating F-statistics for the analysis of population structure. *Evolution, 38*, 1358–1370.

Wort, E. J., Fenberg, P. B., & Williams, S. T. (2017). Testing the contribution of individual genes in mitochondrial genomes for assessing phylogenetic relationships in Vetigastropoda. *Journal of Molluscan Studies, 83*, 123–128. https://doi.org/10.1093/mollus/eyw044

Wright, S. (1931). Evolution in Mendelian populations. *Genetics, 16*, 97.

Zardi, G., Nicastro, K., Serrao, E., Jacinto, R., Monteiro, C., & Pearson, G. (2015). Closer to the rear edge: Ecology and genetic diversity down the core-edge gradient of a marine macroalga. *Ecosphere, 6*, 1–25.

**BIOSKETCH**

Edward Wort is interested in the biogeography of rocky intertidal species in the Bay of Biscay. This work represents a component of his SPITFIRE PhD at University of Southampton and the Natural History Museum on the effect of habitat and oceanography on species ecology over historic timescales.

Author contributions: E.J.G.W., S.J.H., M.R. and P.B.F. conceived the ideas; E.J.G.W. and P.B.F. carried out fieldwork and led the writing; E.J.G.W., M.A.C., A.P., L.H. and S.T.W. obtained and analysed the genetic data.

**DATA ACCESSIBILITY**

The *S. umbilicalis* and *S. pennanti* microsatellite and abundance data are available as files on the Dryad Digital Repository: (doi:10.5061/dryad.t4kv200) https://emea01.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fdoi.org%2F10.5061%2Fdryad.t4kv200&amp;data=01%7C1%7Cew6g09%40soton.ac.uk%7C55f6b13c4f626e8a08d649ab2f18%7C4a5378f929f44d3eb8ebe89669d03da9d8%7C1&amp;data=%2FFR4sHVZ8wl8Mh2%2FDW46pUWB3IDZbAOAbkuZVNVGF%2BU3D&amp;reserved=0.

**SUPPORTING INFORMATION**

Additional supporting information may be found online in the Supporting Information section at the end of the article.

How to cite this article: Wort EJG, Chapman MA, Hawkins SJ, et al. Contrasting genetic structure of sympatric congeneric gastropods: Do differences in habitat preference, abundance and distribution matter? *J Biogeogr*. 2019;46:369–380. https://doi.org/10.1111/jbi.13502