Development and Roll-Out of A Coronavirus Disease 2019 Clinical Pathway for Standardized Qualified Care in Public Hospitals in Korea

Mi Young Kwak ¹, Eun Young Jo ², BumSik Chin ³, Se Eun Park ¹, Jun Yim ⁴, Jung Eun Lee ⁵, Kyung Eun Jo ⁶, Yeon-Soon Kim ⁷, Jeong Eun Lee ⁶, Young Kyung Yoon ⁷, Yu Bin Seo ⁸, Su Jin Jeong ⁹, Yu Min Kang ⁸, Eun-Jeong Joo ¹¹, Jong Hyun Yoon ¹², Sun Bean Kim ¹³, Ga Yeon Kim ¹, and Min-Kyung Kim ³

¹Center for Public Health, National Medical Center, Seoul, Korea
²Chungcheongnam-do Seosan Medical Center, Seosan, Korea
³Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Internal Medicine, National Medical Center, Seoul, Korea
⁴Graduate School of Urban Public Health, University of Seoul, Seoul, Korea
⁵Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Internal Medicine, Chungnam National University Hospital, Daejeon, Korea
⁶Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Internal Medicine, Pusan National University College of Medicine, Busan, Korea
⁷Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Internal Medicine, Korea University College of Medicine, Seoul, Korea
⁸Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Internal Medicine, Hallym University Kangnam Sacred Heart Hospital, Seoul, Korea
⁹Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Internal Medicine, Kyungnam Sacred Heart Hospital, Seoul, Korea
¹⁰Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Internal Medicine, Myongji Hospital, Goyang, Korea
¹¹Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Internal Medicine, Kangbuk Samsung Hospital, Sungkyunkwan University School of Medicine, Seoul, Korea
¹²Department of Urology, National Medical Center, Seoul, Korea
¹³Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Internal Medicine, Korea University Anam Hospital, Seoul, Korea

ABSTRACT

Despite the coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) vaccination roll-out, variant-related outbreaks have occurred repeatedly in Korea. Although public hospitals played a major role in COVID-19 patients’ care, difficulty incorporating evolving COVID-19 treatment guidelines called for a clinical pathway (CP). Eighteen public hospitals volunteered, and a professional review board was created. CPs were formulated containing inclusion/exclusion criteria, application flow charts, and standardized order sets. After CP roll-out, key parameters improved, such as increased patient/staff five-point satisfaction scores (0.41/0.57) and decreased hospital stays (1.78 days)/medical expenses (17.5%). The CPs were updated consistently after roll-out as new therapeutics drugs were introduced and quarantine policies changed.

Keywords: SARS-CoV-2; COVID-19; Pandemics; Clinical pathways; Hospitals, public
COVID-19 clinical pathway for public hospitals

The first case of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) was reported in Wuhan, China, in December 2019, and it has since spread across the globe [1]. As a result, on March 11, 2020, the World Health Organization (WHO) declared COVID-19 a global pandemic [2].

In Korea, the first case of COVID-19 was reported in March 2020 [3]. As of March 24, 2022, there have been a total of 10,822,836 confirmed cases and 13,902 deaths [4]. As the number of patients increased rapidly, the Korean government designated dedicated COVID-19 hospitals (DCH) according to the Infectious Disease Control and Prevention Act; 8,177 beds existed in 72 DCHs as of July 2021 [5, 6]. DCHs are typically local accountable hospitals with an average of 288 beds, whereas tertiary hospitals in Korea have an average of 1,073 beds [7, 8]. Therefore, specialized pulmonologists or infectious disease doctors are generally not available in DCHs; additionally, doctors in various fields have been engaged in COVID-19 patient care at DCHs. As COVID-19 is a novel infectious disease, standards of care are constantly evolving, and the incorporation of frequent updates on COVID-19 management into the practice of DCHs at the appropriate time is not feasible.

A clinical pathway (CP) is the main instrument for managing clinical processes based on the Clinical Practice Guideline (CPG). The CPG provides evidence-based medical knowledge to support physicians in their specific situations. Both propose a standardization of medical care processes to improve clinical care. In contrast to the CPG, a CP includes all activities of clinical care and administrative processes such as education, diet, medication, etc. As a CP is typically developed for formal organizational objectives, it is more focused on the economic dimension [9]. The Ministry of Health and Welfare and the Center for Public Healthcare (CPH) at the National Medical Center have carried out a CP project for public hospitals based on the Plan for Strengthening the Public Healthcare System (December 2020) and the Second Master Plan for Public Healthcare (2021 – 2025) [10, 11]. CPs aim to supporting hospitals in performing appropriate treatment. A total of 52 CPs have been developed and distributed since 2014 and have been managed through the web-based Public Healthcare CP Monitoring System (www.pubcp.or.kr), through which a COVID-19 CP is also available.

Korea has managed the COVID-19 epidemic effectively from the beginning through its “test and treat” policy, and 31.1% of the population has been vaccinated at least once as of July 15, 2021 [12]. In contrast to most countries, every confirmed case of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) infection has been quarantined either in hospitals or in facilities designated by the Korean response system. However, due to the global epidemic of the Delta variant, more than 1,000 new confirmed cases per day have been reported in Korea since mid-July 2021 [13]. As a result, until herd immunity is achieved in Korea, reinforcement of the issue of COVID-19 patient management is necessitated. As one countermeasure against COVID-19 resurgence, the Ministry of Health and Welfare and the CPH decided to develop and roll out a COVID-19 CP for DCHs in Korea.

As a first step, a survey was sent to all public hospitals and some private hospitals regarding the demand for COVID-19 CPs and their willingness to participate. As a result, 18 hospitals (17 central public hospitals and one national university hospital) responded affirming their interest in participation. Of these hospitals, the 256-bed Seosan Medical Center, a DCH, was selected for the development of the first draft of the CP because the volume of the facility and its human resources were representative of all participants [14]. The draft CP was developed based on actual COVID-19 care practice in operation and consisted of inclusion/exclusion criteria, an application flow chart, and standardized order sets. For
efficient roll-out and follow-up, participants were divided into five regions according to their proximity and characteristics. Additionally, a review board (RB) was created consisting of one representative doctor who was a COVID-19-specialist and who was responsible for organizing the CP application in each region as well as another specialist, typically someone working at a tertiary hospital, who was recommended by the Korean Society of Infectious Diseases for each region.

The draft CP was reviewed by the RB, and a pair of CPs were developed, one for asymptomatic cases (CP-A) and the other for symptomatic cases (CP-S), in consideration of clinical features and therapeutic measures. After the revision of the RB, the CP was disseminated to 18 participating hospitals and was modified to fit each institution. A secondary review was then conducted by the RB, and controversy arose regarding five issues; the recommendation of monoclonal antibody (mAb) use, the use of mAbs with vaccine recipients, the recommended target of anti-thrombotic therapy, the use of antibiotics, and the definition of high-flow oxygen therapy. These issues were decided by a vote within the RB (Supplementary Table 1), and the standardized COVID-19 CP was finalized, consisting of inclusion/exclusion criteria (Supplementary Table 2), an application flow chart (Fig. 1), and standardized order sets (Supplementary Table 3) for each of the CP-A and CP-S. The CPH rolled out the standardized CP to 18 institutions on July 15, 2021, and they applied it to their practice after customizing it to their situations. To measure the performance of the CP, a patient/staff satisfaction survey, data on length of hospital stay, and medical expense data were collected. Target subjects were selected from pre-CP and on-CP cohorts by the participating hospital CP managers, and the satisfaction survey results of 939 patients/846 staff members as well as the hospital stay/medical expenses data of 4,731 patients were collected through October 3, 2021, from 16 DCHs. Data were not available for two hospitals at which COVID-19 patient care was discontinued. An independent t-test was utilized for statistical analysis using SPSS version 27 (IBM Corp., Armonk, NY, USA). Statistical significance was defined at a 95% confidence interval (two-sided). Patient/staff satisfaction was measured using a five-point scale, and the mean patient satisfaction score (SSc) improved by 0.41 points after CP application (P <0.001, Table 1). While the SSc improvement was not significant among patients from DCHs with <200 beds, the mean patient SSc of DCHs with <200 beds was already higher than that of other groups before the CP application.

| Table 1. | Changes in the parameters after COVID-19 clinical pathway (CP) roll-out |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| **Pre-CP** | **On-CP** | **Difference in mean** | **P-value** |
| **Patient satisfaction (five-point scale)** | | | |
| <201 beds | 4.07 ± 0.71 (n = 565) | 4.48 ± 0.56 (n = 374) | 0.41 | <0.001 |
| 201 - 500 beds | 4.37 ± 0.65 (n = 293) | 4.48 ± 0.65 (n = 117) | 0.11 | 0.137 |
| >500 beds | 3.69 ± 0.61 (n = 192) | 4.48 ± 0.51 (n = 216) | 0.79 | <0.001 |
| **Staff satisfaction (five-point scale)** | | | |
| Nurse | 3.38 ± 0.67 (n = 477) | 3.95 ± 0.63 (n = 375) | 0.57 | <0.001 |
| Doctor | 3.28 ± 0.73 (n = 24) | 4.19 ± 0.49 (n = 17) | 0.91 | <0.001 |
| Etc. | 3.31 ± 0.88 (n = 49) | 3.76 ± 0.68 (n = 46) | 0.45 | 0.006 |
| **Hospital stay length (day)** | | | |
| <201 beds | 12.14 ± 6.50 (n = 3,234) | 10.36 ± 3.26 (n = 1,497) | 1.78 | <0.001 |
| 201 - 400 beds | 10.42 ± 3.29 (n = 1,125) | 9.35 ± 2.92 (n = 485) | 1.07 | <0.001 |
| >400 beds | 12.59 ± 6.69 (n = 1,339) | 10.99 ± 1.93 (n = 544) | 1.69 | <0.001 |
| **Medical expense (1,000 Korean Won)** | | | |
| <201 beds | 3,347 ± 2,459 (n = 3,234) | 2,761 ± 944 (n = 1,497) | 586 | <0.001 |
| 201 - 400 beds | 2,501 ± 1,149 (n = 1,125) | 2,398 ± 841 (n = 485) | 103 | 0.075 |
| >400 beds | 3,516 ± 2,353 (n = 1,339) | 2,917 ± 1,076 (n = 544) | 599 | <0.001 |

Values are presented as mean±standard deviation and independent t-test was used for comparison.
COVID-19 clinical pathway for public hospitals

Figure 1. Application flow chart of the clinical pathway (CP). (A) CP for asymptomatic patients (CP-A). (B) CP for symptomatic patients (CP-S). The CP was last updated on March 25, 2022.

1Immunocompromised patients, pregnant women, dialysis patients, cognitive dysfunction such as dementia.
1Applied to patients who are confirmed as infected with major variants of COVID-19, which are predefined by Korea Disease Control and Prevention Agency (KDCA). Others condition, such as immunocompromised patients, can be applied according the policy of institution.
1Conducted after 24-hour interval from the previous test.

PCR, polymerase chain reaction; CXR, chest X-ray; COVID-19, coronavirus disease 2019.
1.78 day and 586,000 Korean Won, and these changes were statistically significant for both parameters (P < 0.001). Additionally, the decrease in the mean of both parameters was largest in DCHs with >400 beds, and the decrease in medical expenses was not significant in DCHs with <200 beds. However, the pre-CP values of both parameters for <200-bed DCHs were smaller than those for the larger DCHs (data not shown), which may be related to the underlying comorbidities and COVID-19 severity. The CPH is planning for further analysis including this information as well as treatment outcome after hospital discharge.

Various healthcare authorities are issuing COVID-19 guidelines in respect to treatment of the disease [15, 16], and local guidelines are also available in Korea [17, 18]. However, the healthcare system and the availability of therapeutic measures to manage COVID-19 are quite variable even within a single country. As previously mentioned, the majority of moderate to severe, non-critical COVID-19 patients are cared for in public hospitals in Korea. While they provide qualified care during normal times, human resources and medical supplies have been limited during the pandemic period. Therefore, it is not feasible that frequent updates in terms of knowledge and recommendations regarding COVID-19 can be incorporated into the practice of public hospitals in a timely manner as the main aim of the public hospital is to provide standardized general medical services rather than high-end medical care. During the recruitment of COVID-19 CP participants, many healthcare workers in public hospitals echoed these sentiments and agreed that peer-reviewed standardized practice protocols contribute to providing qualified care to COVID-19 patients. Additionally, patient/staff SSC improved, and length of hospital stay and medical expenses decreased significantly. This may be due to the standardization of patient care protocols following CP application.

As new SARS-CoV-2 variants with higher transmissibility have been imported into Korea, major prevailing strains have changed, and a massive outbreak of the omicron variant occurred in Korea in early 2022. Because of the dynamic nature of the epidemic and the introduction of novel drugs to treat COVID-19, the therapeutic drug guidelines have been changed frequently, and quarantine requirements have been lifted. The feature of high variability in novel infectious disease is the major limitation of this COVID-19 CP. To overcome this, the CP has frequently been updated, six times since its initial roll-out in September 2021 as of March 25, 2022 (Supplementary Table 4). Updated CPs were rolled out to participating hospitals and simultaneously posted on the CPH webpage (www.pubcp.or.kr). This CP generation-application platform may be utilized for future outbreak events as well.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors thank Jae Phil Choi/Hyo Jeong Yeo (Seoul Medical Center), Eun Hyang Song (Seobuk Hospital Seoul Metropolitan Government), Yeon Lee/Hyun Jin Roh (Seoul Metropolitan Bukbu Hospital), Kim Jin Yong/Choi Geun (Incheon Medical Center), Sun Min Kim/Yeon Deok Shin (Gyenggi Provincial Medical Center Suwon Hospital), Hyeon Ju Jeong/Hyeon Suk Park (Gyeonggi Provincial Medical Center Ansung Hospital), Bo Young Lee/Joon Ho Kim (Gyeonggi Provincial Medical Center Uijeongbu Hospital), Jae Hyun Park/Min Ju Lee (Gyeonggi Provincial Medical Center Gumi Hospital), Ju Young Kim/Hyun Ok Lee (Cheongju Medical Center), Jung Sun Lee/Jung Ja Lee (Cheonan Medical Center), Tak Yong Kim/Ji Eun Park (Seosan Medical Center), Shang Hoon Han/Jae Yong Lee (Hongseong Medical Center), Su Jin Oh/Eun A Kim (Gunsan Medical Center), Seung Ji Kang/Ji Eun Kim (Chonnam National University Bitgoeul Hospital), Hyoun Jung Chin/Hyo Jung Han (Jeju Medical Center), and others for their participation and support. Additionally, the authors thank the Korean Society of Infectious Diseases (KSID) and the Korean Society of Chemotherapy (KSC) for their support and guidance.

https://icjournal.org
https://doi.org/10.3947/ic.2022.0026
Medical Center), Jeong Hun Heo/Eun Ji Cho (Busan Medical Center), Ji won Kim/Yun mi Jung (Sangju Red Cross Hospital), Young Hwa Cho/Young Bo Park (Korea Workers’ Compensation and Welfare Service Changwon Hospital) for their presentations on the customization of CP in their institutions.

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

Supplementary Table 1
Controversial issues decided by the voting within the review board
Click here to view

Supplementary Table 2
Inclusion/exclusion criteria
Click here to view

Supplementary Table 3
Standardized order sets
Click here to view

Supplementary Table 4
Update list of COVID-19 clinical pathway
Click here to view

REFERENCES

1. World Health Organization (WHO). Novel Coronavirus (2019-nCoV): situation report - 1. Available at: https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/330760. Accessed 10 September 2021.
2. World Health Organization (WHO). WHO Director-General’s opening remarks at the media briefing on COVID-19 - 11 March 2020. Available at: https://www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-the-media-briefing-on-covid-19---11-march-2020. Accessed 10 September 2021.
3. Kim JY, Choe PG, Oh Y, Oh KJ, Kim J, Park SJ, Park JH, Na HK, Oh MD. The first case of 2019 novel coronavirus pneumonia imported into Korea from Wuhan, China: implication for infection prevention and control measures. J Korean Med Sci 2020;35:e61.
4. Ministry of Health and Welfare (MOHW). Coronavirus disease-19, Republic of Korea. Available at: http://ncov.mohw.go.kr/. Accessed 17 January 2022.
5. Korea Legislation Research Institute. Korea Law Information Center. Infectious disease control and prevention act. No. 17475, Article 36-37. Updated August 12, 2020. Available at: https://elaw.klri.re.kr/kor_service/lawView.do?hseq=54658&lang=ENG. Accessed 10 September 2021.
6. Ministry of Health and Welfare (MOHW). Transfer of recovering hospitalized COVID-19 patients to residential treatment centers. Available at: http://www.mohw.go.kr/react/al/sal0301vw.jsp?PAR_MENU_ID=0403&CONT_SEQ=366664. Accessed 10 September 2021.
7. Health Insurance Review and Assessment Service. National Health Insurance Statistics (Status of Medical Institutions). Updated December, 2020. Accessed September 10, 2021.
8. Health Insurance Review and Assessment Service. 2019 National Health Insurance Statistical Yearbook. Available at: https://www.hira.or.kr/bbsDummy.do?pgmid=HIRAA02000450200000&brdScnBltNo=4&brdBltNo=2312&pageIndex=1. Accessed 10 September 2021.

9. Schlieter H, Esswein W. From clinical practice guideline to clinical pathway – Issues of reference model-based approach. In: Camarinha-Matos L.M., Boucher X., Afsarmanesh H, eds. Collaborative Networks for a Sustainable World. PRO-VE 2010. IFIP Advances in Information and Communication Technology, vol 336. Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg. Available at: https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-642-15961-9_30. Accessed 10 September 2021.

10. Ministry of Health and Welfare (MOHW). Plan for strengthening public healthcare system. December 13, 2020. Available at: http://www.mohw.go.kr/react/al/sal0301vw.jsp?PAR_MENU_ID=04&MENU_ID=0403&page=1&CONT_SEQ=361639. Accessed 10 September 2021.

11. Ministry of Health and Welfare (MOHW). Second master plan for public healthcare (2021 - 2025). June 2, 2021. Available at: https://www.mohw.go.kr/react/al/sal0301vw.jsp?PAR_MENU_ID=04&MENU_ID=0403&page=1&CONT_SEQ=365931. Accessed 10 September 2021.

12. Ministry of Health and Welfare (MOHW). Coronavirus (COVID-19), Republic of Korea. Available at: http://ncov.mohw.go.kr/. Accessed 17 January 2022.

13. Statistics Korea. COVID-19: COVID-19 dashboard. Available at: https://kosis.kr/covid_eng/covid_index.do. Accessed 10 September 2021.

14. Ministry of Health and Welfare (MOHW). Local accountable hospitals alert system Seosan Medical Center. Available at: https://rhs.mohw.go.kr/Disclosure/View01.do?hospitalNumber=10000020&pageNum=02&subNum=01. Accessed 10 September 2021.

15. National Institutes of Health (NIH). COVID-19 treatment guidelines. Available at: https://www.covid19treatmentguidelines.nih.gov. Accessed 10 September 2021.

16. World Health Organization (WHO). Therapeutics and COVID-19: living guideline. Updated July 6, 2021. Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-2019-nCoV-therapeutics-2021.2. Accessed September 10 2021.

17. Kim SB, Ryoo S, Huh K, Joo EJ, Kim YJ, Choi WS, Kim YJ, Yoon YK, Heo JY, Seo YB, Jeong SJ, Park DA, Yu SY, Lee HJ, Kim J, Jin Y, Park J, Peck KR, Choi M, Yeom JS; Korean Society of Infectious Diseases (KSID). Revised Korean Society of Infectious Diseases/National Evidence-based Healthcare Collaborating Agency guidelines on the treatment of patients with COVID-19. Infect Chemother 2021;53:166-219. PUBMED | CROSSREF

18. National Medical Center. Korea National Committee for clinical management of COVID-19 (KNCCMC) COVID-19 treatment guidelines ver 1.1. Available at: https://www.nmc.or.kr/nmc/bbs/B0000050/view.do?nttId=10977&kmenuNo=200448&pageIndex=1. Updated January 12, 2021. Accessed 10 September 2021.