Fast Recognition of *Lecanicillium* spp., and Its Virulence Against *Frankliniella occidentalis*

Yeming Zhou¹, Xiao Zou², Junrui Zhi¹*, Jiqin Xie¹ and Tao Jiang¹

¹ Institute of Entomology, Guizhou University; The Provincial Key Laboratory for Agricultural Pest Management of Mountainous Region, Guiyang, China, ² Institute of Fungus Resources, Guizhou University, Guiyang, China

**Background:** *Frankliniella occidentalis* (Thysanoptera: Thripidae) is a highly raspsucking pest of numerous crops. The entomogenous fungi of *Lecanicillium* spp. are important pathogens of insect pests, and some species have been developed as commercial biopesticides. To explore *Lecanicillium* spp. resources in the development of more effective *F. occidentalis* controls, efficient barcode combinations for strain identification were screened from internal transcribed spacers (ITS), SSU, LSU, TEF, RPB1, and RPB2 genes.

**Results:** Six genes were used to reconstruct *Lecanicillium* genus phylogeny. The results showed that ITS, TEF, RPB1, and RPB2 could be used to identify the strains. All phylogenetic trees reconstructed by free combination of these four genes exhibited almost the same topology. Bioassay studies of a purified conidial suspension further confirmed the infection of second-instar nymphs and adult female *F. occidentalis* by seven *Lecanicillium* strains. *L. attenuatum* strain GZUIFR-lun1405 was the most virulent, killing approximately 91.67% *F. occidentalis* adults and 76.67% nymphs after a 7-day exposure. *L. attenuatum* strain GZUIFR-lun1405 and *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01 were selected to compare the fungal effects on the number of eggs laid by *F. occidentalis*. The number of *F. occidentalis* nymphs significantly decreased when *F. occidentalis* adults were treated with *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01.

**Conclusions:** The combination of ITS and RPB1 could be used for fast recognition of *Lecanicillium* spp. This is the first report of the pathogenicity of *L. attenuatum, L. cauligalbarum, L. araneogenum, and L. aphanocladii* against *F. occidentalis*. Additionally, *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01 caused high *F. occidentalis* mortality and inhibited the fecundity of the pest.

**Keywords:** entomopathogenic fungi, fast recognition, *Frankliniella occidentalis*, *Lecanicillium*, pathogenicity

**Abbreviations:** Spp., species pluralis; GZAC, the Institute of Fungal Resources of Guizhou University; rDNA, ribosomal DNA; LSU, the large subunits of the rDNA; SSU, the small subunits of the rDNA; TEF, the transcription elongation factor-1α; ITS, ITS1–5.8S rDNA–ITS2 region, the first and the internal transcribed spacers; RPB1, DNA-directed RNA polymerase II subunit rpb1; RPB2, DNA-directed RNA polymerase II subunit rpb2.
INTRODUCTION

With the development of molecular methods, it has become easier for biodiversity researchers to identify species by DNA barcoding than by morphological methods (Verkley et al., 2013; Vu et al., 2019). The success of DNA barcoding has facilitated the characterization of bacterial biodiversity in every nook and cranny on the planet (Mau et al., 2014; Afshinnekoo et al., 2015). Compared to bacteria, fungi are difficult to definitively identify because their genomes contain large amounts of non-coding and repetitive DNA (Mohanta and Bae, 2015). Internal transcribed spacer (ITS) sequences are useful for delineating many fungal species (Irinyi et al., 2015; Vu et al., 2016). Unfortunately, ITS sequences from more fungal species are required in GenBank (Hawksworth and Lücking, 2017), and some of the submitted sequences are of poor quality (Nilsson et al., 2006; Vu et al., 2016). Therefore, multilocus (TEF, RPB1, RPB2, LSU, and SSU) sequence data has been used to identify the phylogenetic relationship of some fungi, including as the Ophiocordycipitaceae (Sung et al., 2007; Kepler et al., 2017). However, it would be laborious if analysis of six genes was required to identify each newly collected strain. Some scholars suggest that ITS regions and at least one protein encoding gene with sufficient genetic variation, such as TEF or RPB2, should be sufficient for strain identification instead of using conserved 28S or 18S rDNA sequences (Jeewon and Hyde, 2016). Therefore, identifying the minimum ITS and gene combination required for accurate strain identification will save a lot of time.

Frankliniella occidentalis (Pergande) is a highly polyphagous herbivore that is an economically pernicious pest of many crops and results in especially serious losses to the vegetable and flower industries (van Rijn et al., 1995; Reitz et al., 2011). F. occidentalis feeds on the tender parts of crops and flowers or oviposits, which reduces crop productivity and quality (Shipp et al., 2000). The pest also facilitates the transmission of plant viruses, including tomato spotted-wilt virus and impatiens necrotic-spot virus (Whitfield et al., 2005; Ogada and Poehling, 2015). F. occidentalis was first described in California, United States (Morse and Hoddle, 2006). Facilitated by increasing international agriculture exchanges, F. occidentalis subsequently became a major worldwide pest after the first pesticide-resistant strain was discovered in the 1970s (Mouden et al., 2017; Reitz et al., 2020). F. occidentalis was first reported as an invasive pest in Beijing in 2003 (Zhang et al., 2003). It then gradually spread to many provinces in China, where it has been a dominant pest of floriculture and vegetable crops (Yang et al., 2015). At present, F. occidentalis can be found in more than 10 provinces throughout China (Zhao et al., 2017). Additionally, it has been predicted that F. occidentalis could spread to, and successfully overwinter in, more northern areas of China because of climate change (Wu et al., 2017).

The most common F. occidentalis control measures are chemical pesticides. However, their efficacy is often poor because F. occidentalis tends to reside within the flowers and buds, where it is difficult to reach with spray (Loughner et al., 2005; Demirozer et al., 2012; Mouden et al., 2017). Moreover, varying degrees of resistance are developing due to the overuse of pesticides (Zhao et al., 1995; Bielza et al., 2007; Wang et al., 2011; Gao et al., 2012). Therefore, biological control has received increasing amounts of attention. Representative entomopathogenic fungi for F. occidentalis, including Beauveria bassiana (Gao et al., 2012; Wu et al., 2015; Lee et al., 2017), Metarhizium anisopliae (Ansari et al., 2007; Skinner et al., 2012; Koupri et al., 2015), Lecanicillium lecanii (Schreiter et al., 1994; Vestergaard et al., 1995; Gouli et al., 2009), and Isaria fumosorosea (Ansari et al., 2008; Kivett et al., 2016), are of particular interest to researchers (Wu et al., 2018). Unfortunately, very little is known about the ability of various Lecanicillium species other than typical species of L. lanatus to control F. occidentalis. Therefore, identifying new entomopathogenic fungi, and fast recognition of existing species capable of controlling F. occidentalis, are priorities for our research group because of the needs and demands of the crop growers (Wu et al., 2018).

As insect pathogens, Lecanicillium spp. are effective biological control agents for numerous plant diseases, insect pests, and plant-parasitic nematodes (Goettel et al., 2008). To date, almost 15 Lecanicillium spp.-based commercial preparations have been, or are currently being, developed (Faria and Wraight, 2007). Kepler et al. (2017) concluded that Lecanicillium should be incorporated into Akanthomyces and formally transferred a number of Lecanicillium species, including L. attenuatum, L. muscarium, and L. sabanense. However, Lecanicillium were not very compatible with Akanthomyces. In addition, in later research, the name Lecanicillium was used again, for example L. testudineum and L. restrictum (Crous et al., 2018), L. subprimulinum (Huang et al., 2018), L. coprophilum (Su et al., 2019). To better use Lecanicillium to control F. occidentalis, we use the previous taxon to carry out our work.

Presently, more than 30 Lecanicillium species have been formally described and listed in the Fungorum Index1. Considering that the information provided by ITS limited, researchers have used different genes to identify new Lecanicillium species. This approach successfully identified two new Lecanicillium species (L. araneogenorum and L. uredinophilum) using multilocus (TEF, RPB1, RPB2, LSU, and SSU) sequence data (Park et al., 2016; Chen et al., 2017). Two other new species (L. sabanense and L. caudigitum) were identified based on combined multilocus and ITS sequence phylogenetic analysis (Chirivi-Salomón et al., 2015; Zhou et al., 2018a). Therefore, screening for the most efficient gene combinations for fungal strains identification will have particular significance. These data will facilitate the exploitation of Lecanicillium spp. resources in a more time and budget efficient manner.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Entomopathogenic Fungi

Samples were collected between 2014 and 2018 from forests or tea plantations in Guizhou Province, China. Specimens were preliminarily identified as Lecanicillium spp. by their

1http://www.indexfungorum.org
morphism. Some specimens had been identified and some had not (Table 1). All strains were deposited in GZAC, Guizhou University, Guiyang. The details of the strains are listed in Table 1.

**Insects**

*F. occidentalis* were collected from vegetable plants in the Guiyang area of Guizhou Province, China, and were used to establish a laboratory colony. The individuals were reared and maintained on kidney bean pods in the laboratory of the Institute of Entomology, Guizhou University. The thrips were reared in an artificial-climate chest, with a photoperiod of 14 h light, 10 h dark at 25 ± 1°C and relative humidity of 70 ± 5%.

**DNA Extraction, PCR Amplification, and Sequencing**

Genomic DNA was extracted as previously described (Zhou et al., 2018a). The ITS, SSU, LSU, TEF, RPB1, and RPB2 regions were amplified using previously described primers (Zhou et al., 2018a).

**Comparison of Combination Identification**

DNA sequences used in this study were edited using the LASERGENE software (version 6.0, DNASTAR). Sequences downloaded from GenBank were previously described 29 *Lecanicillium* taxa and one sequence from *Simplicillium lanosoneum* CBS 704.86, which was used as the outgroup (Huang et al., 2018). A total of 46 sequence submissions were selected (Table 2). Multiple sequence alignments for TEF, RPB1, and RPB2 were performed in MAFFFT with the default settings (Katoh et al., 2009). Multiple sequence alignments for ITS, LSU, and SSU were conducted using the MUSCLE algorithm (Edgar, 2004) from MEGA 6 (Tamura et al., 2013). A multiple alignment of the combined partial sequences was assembled with MEGA 6 (Tamura et al., 2013) and SEQUENCEMATRIX 1.7.8 (Vaidya et al., 2011). The command “hompart” in PAUP* 4.0b10 was used for assessment of concordance amongst the genes and the ITS region (Swofford, 2001).

Bayesian inference (BI) was performed using MRBAYES 3.2 (Ronquist et al., 2012) and maximum likelihood (ML) analysis was performed using RAXML (Alexandros, 2014). The ML and BI analyses were performed for each of the six genes (ITS, LSU, SSU, TEF, RPB1, and RPB2). Portfolio analysis was performed for ML and BI analyses on the basis of single gene analysis. Nucleotide substitution models were determined by MrModeltest 2.3 (Nylander et al., 2004). For BI, 10,000,000 generations were performed, with one tree selected every 500th generation. For ML, the GTR+GAMMA model was used, and a bootstrap analysis with 1,000 replicates was performed to assess statistical support for the tree topology. Phylogenetic trees were viewed with TREEGRAPH³.

**Bioassay**

The virulence of *Lecanicillium* spp. strains against second-instar nymphs and adult females was tested. Second, the biometrics of the adults and the number of nymphs hatched under following treatment with each strain treatment were compared. Strains that significantly reduced the number of nymphs underwent preliminary exploration of thrip fecundity to assess whether the strain directly affected fertility and hatchability.

**Preparation of Spore Suspension**

The strains were routinely grown on PDA. Plates were incubated at 25°C for 14-day and aerial conidia were harvested by flooding the plate with 0.025% Tween-80. The conidial suspension was vortexed for 1 min and filtered through double layers of lens paper. The final spore concentrations were resuspended to 5 × 10⁶ conidia ml⁻¹ as determined by counting using a hemocytometer (Shanghai Qiuqing Biochemical Reagent Instrument Co., Ltd.).

**Inoculation of Adult Females**

Females were inoculated using the leaf dipping method with some modifications (bean pods were used instead of leaves) (Zhang et al., 2008). The bean pods were cut longitudinally into long strips of equal size. They were placed in the prepared spore suspension for 15 s, then removed and allowed to dry naturally. The pods were fixed with a paper clip placed in the fingertip tube. Twenty female adults (2–3-day old) *F. occidentalis* were transferred with suction trap into the fingertip tube. Twenty female adults (2–3-day old) *F. occidentalis* were transferred with suction trap into the fingertip tube which was then sealed with cotton wool. The experiment was repeated four times, and 0.025% Tween-80 solution was used as a control. The pods were placed in a light incubator (Jiangnan Instrument Co., Ltd.). The conidial suspension was vortexed for 1 min and filtered through double layers of lens paper. The final spore concentrations were resuspended to 5 × 10⁶ conidia ml⁻¹ as determined by counting using a hemocytometer (Shanghai Qiuqing Biochemical Reagent Instrument Co., Ltd.).

---

³https://treegraph.bioinfweb.info/
Table 2: Specimen information and GenBank accession numbers for strains used in this study.

| Species                  | Voucher information | LSU          | SSU          | TEF          | RPB1         | RPB2         | ITS          |
|--------------------------|---------------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| Lecanicillium acerosum   | CBS418.81           | KM283786     | KM283762     | KM283810     | KM283832     | KM283852     | EF641893     |
| L. antillanum            | CBS350.85           | AF339536     | AF339585     | DG522350     | DG522396     | DG522450     | AJ292392     |
| L. aphanocladii          | CBS797.84           | KM283787     | KM283763     | KM283811     | KM283833     | KM283853     |              |
| L. aranearum             | CBS726.73a          | AF339537     | AF339586     | EF468781     | EF468887     | EF468934     | AJ292464     |
| L. araneogenum           | GZUIFR              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| L. attenuatum            | MN944423            | KM963920     | MT006072     | MT006062     | MT006067     | MN944448     |
| L. cauligalbarum         | GZUIFR              |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| L. dimorphum             | CBS345.37           | KM283788     | KM283764     | KM283812     | KM283834     | KM283854     |              |
| L. flavidum              | CBS300.70D          | KM283789     | KM283765     | KM283813     | KM283855     | EF641877     |
| L. fungicola var. aleophilum | CBS357.80   | KM283791     | KM283767     | KM283815     | KM283835     | KM283856     | NR_111064    |
| L. fusisporum            | CBS164.70           | KM283793     | KM283769     | KM283817     | KM283836     | KM283858     | AJ292428     |
| L. kalimantanense        | BTOC-F23            |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| L. lecanii               | CBS101247           | KM283794     | KM283770     | DG522359     | KM283837     | KM283859     | JN049836     |
| L. nodulosum             | JCM 18525           | AF339560     | AF339608     | EF468784     | EF468890     |              |              |
| L. psalliotae            | CBS532.81           | AF339560     | AF339608     | EF468784     | EF468890     |              |              |
| L. subprimulinum         | JCM 18525           | AB712264     | AF339608     | EF469067     | EF469096     | EF469112     | JN049846     |
| L. testudineum           | UBOCC-A112180       | LT992868     | LT992867     | LT992867     | LT992867     | LT992867     |              |
| L. uredinophilum         | KACC42493           | KM283794     | KM283770     | DG522359     | KM283837     | KM283859     | JN049836     |
| L. wallacei              | CBS101237           | AY184967     | AY184978     | EF469073     | EF469102     | EF469119     | EF641891     |

The bolded values/terms means the representation is provided by us.

typical conidiogenous structure observed by microscope were considered effectively infected.

Inoculation of the Second-Instar Nymphs

The leaf dipping method was adapted by cutting the leaves of common bean into small round blocks of about 1 cm². The leaves of the common bean were soaked in the prepared spore suspension for 15 s and removed and dried naturally. Thirty second-instar nymphs were placed into a 25-mL conjoined plastic dip box (4.3 cm × 3.1 cm × 3 cm, with mesh glued to the holes at the top). The experiment was repeated four times, and 0.025% Tween-80 solution was used as the control. Nymphs were placed into a light incubator with 25 ± 1°C, relative humidity of 70%, and a 12 h light/dark cycle. Thrip death was observed, and the
number of deaths was recorded daily for 7 days. At the end of the experiment, dead thrips were removed and placed in a petri dish with wet filter paper at the bottom for wet culture. Those that showed spore structure after incubation were considered effectively infected.

Effects on *F. occidentalis* Fertility and Hatchability

Eggs of thrips are laid inside the bean pod tissue and are not easily visualized. Therefore, the number of eggs could not be determined. The difference in hatchability was determined by comparing the number of nymphs that appeared after the same number of thrips had laid their eggs over the same period of time. There were two experiments, the first involved treating the bean pods within which thrips had deposited eggs, and the other involved treating bean pods without eggs. The difference resulting from treatment after eggs were laid represented the difference in hatchability, while the difference resulting from the treatment before eggs were laid represented the difference caused by both fertility and hatchability.

In the first experiment, 20 female adult (2–3-day old) *F. occidentalis* were transferred by suction trap into the fingertip tube and sealed with cotton wool. After 24 h, the pods were placed into the spore suspension for 15 s and transferred into a new fingertip tube to identify the effects on the hatchability of eggs in pods. In the second experiment, pods were placed into the spore suspension for 15 s and transferred into a new fingertip tube to identify the effects on the hatchability of eggs in pods. Twenty *F. occidentalis* adults female (2–3-day old) were transferred by suction trap into the fingertip tube, which was immediately sealed with cotton wool. Each experiment was repeated nine times, and 0.025% Tween-80 solution was used as the control. The pods were placed in a light incubator with a light/dark cycle. The number of nymphs that emerged after the same period of time. There were two experiments, the first involved treating the bean pods within which thrips had deposited eggs, and the other involved treating bean pods without eggs. The difference resulting from treatment after eggs were laid represented the difference in hatchability, while the difference resulting from the treatment before eggs were laid represented the difference caused by both fertility and hatchability.

In the second experiment, pods were placed into the spore suspension for 15 s and transferred into a new fingertip tube to identify the effects on the hatchability of eggs in pods. In the second experiment, pods were placed into the spore suspension for 15 s and transferred into a new fingertip tube to identify the effects on the hatchability of eggs in pods. Twenty *F. occidentalis* adults female (2–3-day old) were transferred by suction trap into the fingertip tube, which was immediately sealed with cotton wool. Each experiment was repeated nine times, and 0.025% Tween-80 solution was used as the control. The pods were placed in a light incubator with a temperature of 25 ± 1°C, relative humidity of 70%, and 12 h light/dark cycle. The number of nymphs that emerged after 7-d was recorded.

Statistical Analyses

*F. occidentalis* mortality was analyzed by one-way ANOVA using SPSS software (version 18.0; SPSS, Chicago, IL, United States). Tukey’s honestly significant difference test (*P* < 0.05) was used to analyze the survival rate of the adults and nymphs and the number of nymphs that hatched. Inverse sine square root transformation was used for the percentage data before the ANOVA analysis. All data are presented as mean ± SE. The corrected percent mortality was calculated by the Abbott's formula (Abbott, 1925).

RESULTS

Sequencing and Phylogenetic Analysis

Two software programs (MRBAYES 3.2 and RAxML) were used to identify seven strains (Table 1) based on ITS, SSU, LSU, TEF, RPB1, and RPB2 alone. Among these, ITS, TEF, RPB1, and RPB2 were validated and useful for identifying the strains (phylogenetic incongruence with statistical measures of confidence and Supplementary Figures 1–4). The phylogenetic relationship analysis revealed that LSU and SSU could not be used for identifying the strains alone because of the small interspecific differences. The ITS + TEF + RPB1 + RPB2 partial sequence-based phylogenetic tree was formed using almost all Lecanicillium species (*L. evansi* was not in NCBI) and one *Simplicillium* species (*S. lanosoniveum*) as outgroup (Figure 1). The sequence dataset consisted of 2,735 bases, including inserted gaps (ITS: 523 bp; TEF: 772 bp; RPB1: 555 bp; and RPB2: 885 bp). *L. attenuatum* GZUIFR-lun1404 and *L. attenuatum* GZUIFR-lun1405 formed one branch in a polytomy together with a clade containing *L. attenuatum* (BI posterior probabilities 0.99, ML bootstrap 98%). *Lecanicillium* sp. GZUIFR-lun1403 formed one branch in a polytomy together with a clade containing *L. lecanii* (BI posterior probabilities 0.98, ML bootstrap 97%). *L. araneogenum* GZUI1032Lea and *L. araneogenum*, *L. aphanocladii* GZUIFR-lun1505 and *L. aphanocladii*, and *L. cauligalbarum* GZUIFR-ZHJ01 and *L. cauligalbarum*, formed independent branches (BI posterior probabilities 1, ML bootstrap 100%). *Lecanicillium* sp. GZUIFR-huhu formed one branch in a polytomy together with a clade containing *L. tenuipes* (BI posterior probabilities 0.98, ML bootstrap 100%) (Figure 1). The other phylogenetic trees exhibited almost the same topology (Supplementary Figures 5–9 and Figure 2). No significant differences in topology were observed between BI and ML phylogenies.

Virulence Comparison of the Seven Fungal Strains Infesting *F. occidentalis*

*Lecanicillium* sp. GZUIFR-huhu was non-virulent to *F. occidentalis*. The other six strains were pathogenic to *F. occidentalis*, but their virulence varied (Figure 3 and Supplementary Table 1). *L. attenuatum* strains GZUIFR-lun1404 and GZUIFR-lun1405 were the most virulent of the six strains from the five species. Approximately 8.33% of adult thrips survived after a 7-day exposure to these two *L. attenuatum* strains. Five strains showing effectiveness against *F. occidentalis* adult females were also pathogenic to second-instar nymphs. *L. attenuatum* strain GZUIFR-lun1405 was the most virulent, with approximately 23.33% of nymphs surviving after a 7-day exposure (Figure 4 and Supplementary Table 2).

Differences were found in the number of nymphs hatched by thrips after exposure to different strains. There were no significant differences among *Lecanicillium* sp. GZUIFR-huhu, *L. attenuatum* strain GZUIFR-lun1405, and control groups. The group treated with *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01 had the fewest survivors, and their number of survivors was significantly fewer than those in other treatments and in the control group (*F*$_{2,23}$ = 28.798; *p* < 0.0001) (Figure 5). *L. attenuatum* strain GZUIFR-lun1405 and *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01 were selected for future analysis on the thrips fecundity. There was no significant difference among the number of nymphs hatched from experimental and control groups (*F*$_{2,28}$ = 7.925; *p* = 0.0023) (Figure 6). However, the number of *F. occidentalis* nymphs significantly decreased when adult *F. occidentalis* were treated with *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01 (*F*$_{2,26}$ = 54.117; *p* < 0.0001) (Figure 6). These
results show that the *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01 affected fertility of the thrips.

**DISCUSSION**

DNA barcoding is proposed as an effective way to delineate and distinguish closely related species (Vu et al., 2019). A major advantage of DNA barcoding is that it usually does not require a trained technician and an experienced professional taxonomist. As part of Ophiocrucipitaceae, *Lecanicillium* species are identified by ITS and multilocus (*TEF*, *RPB1*, *RPB2*, *LSU*, and *SSU*) sequence data. In general, combining barcodes shows clear benefits for species discrimination and provides higher discriminatory power than a single locus (Vu et al., 2016). However, we found no substantial benefit of using multilocus barcodes. In the present study, *LSU* and *SSU* could not successfully identify all species of *Lecanicillium* alone. Only *TEF*, *RPB1*, and *RPB2* were found to be useful for identifying all species alone. Our phylogenetic analyses reveal that an *RPB1*-based single locus tree showed better topology than did those based on *TEF* and *RPB2*. However, any one of these genes combined with ITS could also clearly distinguish the *Lecanicillium* genus. We believe a combination of ITS and *RPB1* is optimal for the efficient recognition of *Lecanicillium* spp. based on the richness of each sequence. Moreover, ITS and *RPB1* data already cover almost all species in the genus.
The two phylogenetic trees created in this study (Figures 1, 2) were formed with almost all *Lecanicillium* species. In previous reports, species aggregated with their corresponding sequences and maintained high approval ratings (Table 1). *Lecanicillium* sp. strain GZUIFR-lun1403 was identified as *L. lecanii* based on phylogenetic results. Although the *Lecanicillium* sp. strain GZUIFR-huhu was close to *L. tenueipes* in the phylogenetic tree, the frequency of base substitutions indicated a clear distinction from *L. tenueipes* (Figure 1). Therefore, we considered *Lecanicillium* sp. strain GZUIFR-huhu could be one new species. In all phylogenetic trees two *L. psalliotae* strains were not together in one branch. This indicated that the *L. psalliotae* strains require additional confirmation of the current taxon name by CBS.
Currently, the microbial agents used for *F. occidentalis* control are mainly *Beauveria bassiana* sensu lato (s.l.), *Metarhizium anisopliae* s.l., *Isaria fumosorosea*, and *Lecanicillium lecanii* strains (Wu et al., 2018). We found that *L. attenuatum, L. cauligalbarum, L. araneogenum*, and *L. aphanocladii* were pathogenic to *F. occidentalis*, but their virulence varied. This is the first report detailing the pathogenicity of these strains to *F. occidentalis*. The different host origin of our *Lecanicillium* strains do not appear to be directly associated with *F. occidentalis* virulence. Considering that *L. lecanii* has pathogenicity to many other thrips, we believe that the virulence of these strains to other thrips deserves further examination (Wu et al., 2018). In addition
to direct pathogenicity, sublethal effects of the examined fungi on thrips, including fecundity, longevity, and feeding ability, may be the most important aspects of exposure to microbial control agents (Wu et al., 2018). Zhang et al. (2015) reported that a strain of *B. bassiana*, GZGY-1-3, significantly reduced the reproductive success of *F. occidentalis* and the subsequent fitness of their progeny. Additionally, one *M. anisopliae* strain significantly reduced the fecundity, egg fertility, and longevity of *Megalurothrips sjostedtii* adults (Ekesi and Maniania, 2000). In this article, *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01 did not
produce the highest mortality rate in adults or nymphs, but significantly reduced the number of eggs laid by *F. occidentalis*. This effect could be an important factor to measure in the development of future *F. occidentalis* control projects. It is possible that the fungus competes with the host for nutrients and, consequentially, interferes with egg fertility at the physiological level. This sublethal effect could partially offset the relatively slow death rate of fungal infection compared to conventional insecticides and may play an important role in the control of thrips (Wu et al., 2018). The additional sublethal effects of the *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01 on *F. occidentalis* need to be individually verified.

**CONCLUSION**

Based on the performance of single barcodes and their combinations, we recommend combination of ITS and RPB1 as the best barcodes for *Lecanicillium* identification. These two sequences individually do not currently cover all *Lecanicillium* species, so a combination of ITS and RPB1 should be used for fast recognition of *Lecanicillium* spp. We have provided the first demonstration of the virulence of several *Lecanicillium* spp. against *F. occidentalis*, such as *L. attenuatum*, *L. cauligalbarum*, *L. araneogenum*, and *L. aphanocladii*. In addition, the *L. cauligalbarum* strain GZUIFR-ZHJ01 caused both high *F. occidentalis* mortality and inhibited the fecundity of the pest.

**DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT**

The datasets presented in this study can be found in online repositories. The names of the repository(repositories) and accession number(s) can be found in the article/Supplementary Material.

**ETHICS STATEMENT**

*Frankliniella occidentalis* samples were maintained at our greenhouse at Institute of Entomology, Guizhou University, China – no permission was required.

**AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS**

YMZ performed the experiments, analyzed data, and wrote the article. XZ provided strains of fungus and revised the manuscript. JRZ designed the experiments and revised the manuscript. TJ analyzed the data. JQX performed the experiments. All the authors reviewed the manuscript.

**FUNDING**

This study was supported by the National Science Foundation of China (Project number: 31860507) and Guizhou international science and technology cooperation base [Project number: G(2016)5802].

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

We thank Charlesworth Group (http://charlesworth.com.cn/) for editing a draft of this manuscript. This manuscript has been released as a pre-print at research square (Zhou et al., 2020).

**SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL**

The Supplementary Material for this article can be found online at: [https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fmicb.2020.561381/full#supplementary-material](https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fmicb.2020.561381/full#supplementary-material)

**Supplementary Figure 1** | Phylogenetic analysis of the isolated strains and related species derived from partial ITS sequences. Statistical support values (≥0.5/50%) are shown at the nodes for Bayesian inference posterior probabilities/maximum-likelihood bootstrap support.

**Supplementary Figure 2** | Phylogenetic analysis of the isolated strains and related species derived from partial TEF sequences. Statistical support values (≥0.5/50%) are shown at the nodes for Bayesian inference posterior probabilities/maximum-likelihood bootstrap support.

**Supplementary Figure 3** | Phylogenetic analysis of the isolated strains and related species derived from partial RPB1 sequences. Statistical support values (≥0.5/50%) are shown at the nodes for Bayesian inference posterior probabilities/maximum-likelihood bootstrap support.

**Supplementary Figure 4** | Phylogenetic analysis of the isolated strains and related species derived from partial RPB2 sequences. Statistical support values (≥0.5/50%) are shown at the nodes for Bayesian inference posterior probabilities/maximum-likelihood bootstrap support.

**Supplementary Figure 5** | Phylogenetic analysis of the isolated strains and related species deriving from partial ITS + TEF sequences. Statistical support values (≥0.5/50%) are shown at the nodes for Bayesian inference posterior probabilities/maximum-likelihood bootstrap support.

**Supplementary Figure 6** | Phylogenetic analysis of the isolated strains and related species deriving from partial ITS + RPB1 sequences. Statistical support values (≥0.5/50%) are shown at the nodes for Bayesian inference posterior probabilities/maximum-likelihood bootstrap support.

**Supplementary Figure 7** | Phylogenetic analysis of the isolated strains and related species deriving from partial ITS + TEF + RPB1 sequences. Statistical support values (≥0.5/50%) are shown at the nodes for Bayesian inference posterior probabilities/maximum-likelihood bootstrap support.

**Supplementary Figure 8** | Phylogenetic analysis of the isolated strains and related species deriving from partial ITS + TEF + RPB2 sequences. Statistical support values (≥0.5/50%) are shown at the nodes for Bayesian inference posterior probabilities/maximum-likelihood bootstrap support.

**Supplementary Figure 9** | Phylogenetic analysis of the isolated strains and related species deriving from partial ITS + RPB1 + RPB2 sequences. Statistical support values (≥0.5/50%) are shown at the nodes for Bayesian inference posterior probabilities/maximum-likelihood bootstrap support.

**Supplementary Table 1** | Comparison of the influences of test strains on the mortality rate (%) of *F. occidentalis* adults.

**Supplementary Table 2** | Comparison of the influences of test strains on the mortality rate (%) of *F. occidentalis* second instar nymphs.
REFERENCES

Abbott, W. S. (1925). A method of computing the effectiveness of an insecticide. *J. Econom. Entomol.* 18, 263–267.
Afsarinekoo, E., Meydan, C., Chowdhury, S., Jaroudi, D., Boyer, C., Bernstein, N., et al. (2015). Geospatial resolution of human and bacterial diversity with city-scale metagenomics. *Cell Syst.* 1, 72–87. doi: 10.1016/j.cels.2015.01.001
Alexandros, S. (2014). RAxML version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of large phylogenies. *Bioinformatics* 30, 1312–1313.
Ansari, M. A., Brownbridge, M., Shah, F. A., and Butt, T. M. (2008). Efficacy of entomopathogenic fungi against soil-dwelling life stages of western flower thrips, *Frankliniella occidentalis*, in plant-growing media. *Entomol. Exp. Appl.* 127, 80–87. doi: 10.1111/j.1570-7458.2008.00674.x
Ansari, M. A., Shah, F. A., Whitaker, M., Prasad, M., and Butt, T. M. (2007). Control of western flower thrips (*Frankliniella occidentalis*) pupae with *Metarhizium anisopliae* in peat and peat alternative growing media. * Biol. Control* 40, 293–297. doi: 10.1016/j.biocontrol.2006.12.007
Bielza, P., Quinto, V., Contreras, J., Torné, M., Martín, A., and Espinosa, P. J. (2007). Resistance to spinosad in the western flower thrips. *Frankliniella occidentalis* (Pergande), in greenhouses of south-eastern Spain. *Pest Manag. Sci.* 63, 682–687. doi: 10.1002/ps.1388
Chen, W. H., Han, Y. F., Liang, Z. Q., and Jin, D. C. (2017). *Lecanicillium araneoeum* sp. nov., a new araneoeunous fungus. *Phytotaxa* 305, 29–34. doi: 10.11646/phytotaxa.305.1.4
Chirivi-Salomón, J. S., Danies, G., Restrepo, S., and Sanjuan, T. (2015). *Lecanicillium subprimulinum* (Cordycipitaceae, Hypocreales), a novel species from Baoshan, Yunnan. *Phytotaxa* 348, 99–108. doi: 10.11646/phytotaxa.348.2.4
Irinyi, L., Serena, C., García-Hermoso, D., Arabatzis, M., Desnos-Ollivier, M., Vu, D., et al. (2015). International society of human and animal mycology (ISHAM)-ITS reference DNA barcoding database—the quality controlled standard tool for routine identification of human and animal pathogenic fungi. *Med. Mycol.* 53, 313–337. doi: 10.1093/mmy/myv008
Jeewon, R., and Hyde, K. D. (2016). Establishing species boundaries and new taxa among fungi-recommendations to resolve taxonomic ambiguities. *Mycosphere* 7, 1669–1677.
Katoh, K., Asimenos, G., and Toh, H. (2009). Multiple alignment of DNA sequences with MAFFT, *Methods Mol. Biol.* 537, 39–64.
Kepler, R. M., Luangsara, J., J., Hywel-Jones, N. L., Quandt, C. A., Sung, G. H., Rehner, S. A., et al. (2017). A phylogenetically-based nomenclature for Cordycipitaceae (Hypocreales). *IMA Fungus* 8, 335–353. doi: 10.5598/ imafungus.2017.08.02.08
Kivett, J. M., Cloyd, R. A., and Bello, N. M. (2016). Evaluation of entomopathogenic fungi against the western flower thrips (*Thysanoptera: Thripidae*) under laboratory conditions. *J. Entomol. Sci.* 51, 274–291. doi: 10.18474/jes16-07-1
Koupi, N., Ghazavi, M., Kamali, K., and Baniameri, V. (2015). Virulence of Iranian isolates of *Metarhizium anisopliae* on western flower thrips. *Frankliniella occidentalis* (Pergande) (Thysanoptera: Thripidae) (*Thysanoptera: Thripidae*). *J. Crop Protect.* 5, 131–138. doi: 10.18697/modares.jcp.5.1.131
Lee, S. J., Kim, S., Kim, J. C., Lee, M. R., Hossain, M. S., Shin, T. S., et al. (2017). *Entomopathogenic Beauveria bassiana* granules to control soil-dwelling stage of western flower thrips. *Frankliniella occidentalis* (Thysanoptera: Thripidae). *Biotech Control* 62, 639–648. doi: 10.1002/jbt2.2017.06.11.10.4
Loughner, R. L., Warnock, D. F., and Cloyd, R. A. (2005). Resistance of greenhouse, laboratory, and native populations of western flower thrips to spinosad. *Hortscience* 40, 146–149.
Mau, R. L., Liu, C. M., Aziz, M., Schwartz, E., Dijkstra, P., Marks, J. C., et al. (2014). Linking soil bacterial biodiversity and soil carbon stability. *ISME J.* 9, 1477–1480. doi: 10.1038/ismej.2014.205
Mohanta, T. K., and Bae, H. (2015). The diversity of fungal genome. *Biol. Proc. Online* 17:8.doi: 10.1186/s12575-015-0020-2
Morse, J. G., and Hoddle, M. S. (2006). Invasion biology of thrips. *Annu. Rev. Entomol.* 51, 67–89. doi: 10.1146/annurev.ento.51.110104.151044
Mouden, S., Sarmiento, K. F., Klinkhamer, P. G. L., and Leiss, K. A. (2017). Integrated pest management in western flower thrips: past, present and future. *Pest Manag. Sci.* 73, 813–822. doi: 10.1002/ps.4531
Nilsson, R. H., Ryberg, M., Kristiansson, E., Abarenkov, K., Larsson, K., and Koljalg, U. (2006). Taxonomic reliability of DNA sequences in public sequence databases: A fungal perspective. *PLoS One* 1:e59. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0000059
Nylannder, J. A. A., Ronquist, F., Hueslenbeck, J. P., Nieves-Aldrey, J., and Buckley, T. (2004). Bayesian phylogenetic analysis of combined data. *Syst. Biol.* 53, 47–67. doi: 10.1080/1063515049026499
Ogada, P. A., and Poehling, H. M. (2015). Sex-specific influences of *Frankliniella occidentalis* (Western Flower Thrips) in the transmission of *Tomato Spotted Wilt Virus* (*Tospovirus*). *J. Plant Dis. Prot.* 122, 264–274.
Park, M. J., Hong, S. B., and Shin, H. D. (2016). *Lecanicillium uredophilum* sp. nov. associated with rust fungi from Korea. *Mycotaxon* 130, 997–1005. doi: 10.5248/130.997
Reitz, S. R., Gao, Y. L., and Lei, Z. R. (2011). Thrips: pests of concern to China and the United States. *Agric. Sci. China* 10, 867–892. doi: 10.1007/s1171-2927(11) 60344-1
Reitz, S. R., Gao, Y. L., Kirk, W. D. I., Hoddle, M. S., Leiss, I. A., and Furbender, J. E. (2020). Invasion biology, ecology, and management of western flower thrips. *Annu. Rev. Entomol.* 65, 17–37. doi: 10.1146/annurev-ento-011019-024947
Ronquist, F., Teslenko, M., Vander Mark, P., Ayres, D. L., Darling, A., Hohna, S., et al. (2012). MrBayes 3.2: efficient Bayesian phylogenetic inference and model choice across a large model space. *Syst. Biol.* 61, 539–542. doi: 10.1093/sysbio/syr029
Schreiter, G., Butt, T., Beckett, A., Vestergaard, S., and Moritz, G. (1994). Invasion and 4. Development of *Verticillium lecanii* in the western flower thrips. *Frankliniella occidentalis*. *Mycol. Res.* 98, 1025–1034.
Shipp, J. L., Wang, K., and Binns, M. R. (2000). Economic injury levels for western flower thrips (*Thysanoptera: Thripidae*) on greenhouse cucumber. *J. Econom. Entomol.* 93, 1732–1740. doi: 10.1603/0022-0493-93.6.1732
Skinner, M., Gouli, S., Frank, C. E., Parker, B. L., and Kim, J. S. (2012). Management of \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis} (Thysanoptera: Thripidae) with granular formulations of entomopathogenic fungi. \textit{Biol. Control.} 63, 246–252. doi: 10.1016/j.biocontrol.2012.08.004

Su, L., Zhu, H., Guo, Y., Xu, X., Guo, J., Zhang, L., et al. (2019). \textit{Lecanicillium cophophilum} (Cordycipitaceae. Hypocreales), a new species of fungus from the feces of Marmota monax in China. \textit{Phytotaxa} 387, 55–62.

Sung, G. H., Hywel-Jones, N. L., Sung, J. M., Luangsa-ard, J. J., Shrestha, B., and Spatafora, J. W. (2007). Phylogenetic classification of \textit{Cordyceps} and the clavicipitaceous fungi. \textit{Stud. Mycol.} 57, 5–59. doi: 10.3114/sim.2007.57.01

Swafford, D. L. (2001). \textit{Paup*}: Phylogenetic analysis using parsimony (and other methods) 4.0 b10. Massachusetts: Sunderland.

Tamura, K., Stecher, G., Peterson, D., Filipski, A., and Kumar, S. (2013). \textit{MEGA6}: molecular evolutionary genetics analysis version 6.0. \textit{Mol. Biol. Evol.} 30, 2725–2729. doi: 10.1093/molbev/mst197

Vaidya, G., Lohman, D. J., and Rudolf, M. (2011). SequenceMatrix: concatenation software for the fast assembly of multi-gene datasets with character set and codon information. \textit{Cladistics} 27, 171–180.

van Rijn, P. C. J., Mollema, C., and Steenhuis-Broers, G. M. (1995). Comparative life history studies of \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis} and \textit{Thrips tabaci} (Thysanoptera: Thripidae) on cucumber. \textit{Bull. Entomol. Res.} 85, 285–297.

Verkley, G. J. M., Quaedvlieg, W., Shin, H. D., and Crous, P. W. (2013). A new approach to species delimitation in Septoria. \textit{Stud. Mycol.} 75, 213–305. doi: 10.3114/sim0018

Vestergaard, S., Gillespie, A. T., Butt, T. M., Schreiter, G., and Eilenberg, J. (1995). Pathogenicity of the hyphomycete fungi \textit{Verticillium lecanii} and \textit{Metarhizium anisopliae} to the western flower thrips. \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis}. \textit{Biocontr. Sci. Technol.} 5, 185–192. doi: 10.0053/s315955039909

Vu, D., Groeneveld, M., de Vries, M., Gehrmann, T., Stielow, B., Eberhardt, U., et al. (2019). Large-scale generation and analysis of filamentous fungal DNA barcodes boosts coverage for kingdom fungi and reveals thresholds for fungal species and higher taxon delimitation. \textit{Stud. Mycol.} 92, 135–154. doi: 10.1016/j.simyco.2018.05.001

Vu, D., Groeneveld, M., Szöke, S., Cardinali, G., Eberhardt, U., Stielow, B., et al. (2016). DNA barcoding analysis of more than 9000 yeast isolates contributes to quantitative thresholds for yeast species and genera delimitation. \textit{Stud. Mycol.} 85, 91–105. doi: 10.1016/j.simyco.2016.11.007

Wang, Z. H., Hou, W. J., Hao, C. Y., Wu, Q. J., Xu, B. Y., and Zhang, Y. J. (2011). Monitoring the insecticide resistance of the field populations of western flower thrips. \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis} in Beijing area. \textit{Chin. J. Appl. Entomol.} 48, 542–547.

Whitfield, A. E., Ullman, D. E., and German, T. L. (2005). Tospovirus-thrips interactions. \textit{Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.} 43, 459–489. doi: 10.1146/annurev.phyto.43.040804.140017

Wu, S. Y., Guo, Y. L., Xu, X. N., Goettel, M. S., and Lei, Z. R. (2015). Compatibility of \textit{Beauveria bassiana} with \textit{Neoseiulus barkeri} for control of \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis}. \textit{J. Integr. Agric.} 14, 98–105. doi: 10.1016/s2095-3119(13)60731-5

Wu, S. Y., Tang, L. D., Fang, F., Li, D. G., Yuan, X., Lei, Z. R., et al. (2018). Screening, efficacy and mechanisms of microbial control agents against sucking pest insects asthrips. \textit{Adv. Insect Physiol.} 55, 201–219. doi: 10.1016/bs.aipp.2018.07.005

Wu, S., Tang, L., Zhang, X., Xing, Z., Lei, Z., and Gao, Y. (2017). A decade of a thrips invasion in China: lessons learned. \textit{Ecotoxicology} 27, 1032–1038. doi: 10.1007/s10641-016-0372-x

Yao, X. M., Lou, H., Sun, J. T., Zhu, Y. M., Xue, X. F., and Hong, X. Y. (2015). Temporal genetic dynamics of an invasive species, \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis} (Pergande), in an early phase of establishment. \textit{Sci. Rep.} 5:11877.doi: 10.1038/srep11877

Zhang, S., Kono, S., Murai, T., and Miyata, T. (2008). Mechanisms of resistance to spinosad in the western flower thrips. \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis} (Thysanoptera: Thripidae). \textit{Insect Sci.} 15, 125–132.

Zhang, T., Reitz, S. R., Wang, H., and Lei, Z. (2015). Sublethal effects of \textit{Beauveria bassiana} (Ascomycota: Hypocreales) on life table parameters of \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis} (Thysanoptera: Thripidae). \textit{J. Econom. Entomol.} 108, 975–985. doi: 10.1093/jee/tov091

Zhang, Y. J., Wu, Q. I., Xu, B. Y., and Zhu, G. R. (2003). The occurrence and damage of \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis} (Thysanoptera: Thripidae): a dangerous alien invasive pest in Beijing. \textit{Plant Protect.} 29, 58–59.

Zhao, G. Y., Liu, W., Brown, J. M., and Knowles, H. O. (1995). Insecticide resistance in field and laboratory strains of western flower thrips (Thysanoptera: Thripidae). \textit{J. Econom. Entomol.} 88, 1164–1170.

Zhao, X., Reitz, S. R., Yuan, H., Lei, Z., Paini, D. R., and Gao, Y. (2017). Pesticide-mediated interspecific competition between local and invasive thrips pests. \textit{Sci. Rep.} 7:40512. doi: 10.1038/srep40512

Zhou, Y. M., Zhi, J. R., Ye, M., Zhang, Z. Y., Yue, W. B., and Zou, X. (2018a). \textit{Lecanicillium cauligalbarum} sp. nov. (Cordycipitaceae. Hypocreales), a novel fungus isolated from a stemborer in the Yao Ren National Forest Mountain Park, Guizhou. \textit{MycoKeys} 43, 59–74. doi: 10.3897/mycokeys.43.36203

Zhou, Y. M., Zhi, J. R., Zhang, X., Zou, X., and Yang, K. (2018b). Identification and pathogenicity test of a new soil-derived fungus strain of \textit{Lecanicillium} to \textit{Ephesia kuehniella} (Lepidoptera: Pyralidae). \textit{Acta Entomol. Sin.} 61, 505–510.

Zhou, Y. M., Zou, X., Qu, J. J., Zhou, J. X., and Li, J. (2016). Identification of a parasitic \textit{Lecanicillium} of tea lesser leafhopper and optimization of sporeulation conditions. \textit{Microbial. Chin.} 43, 935–941.

Zhou, Y. M., Zou, X., Zhi, J. R., Xie, J. Q., and Jiang, T. (2020). Fast recognition of \textit{Lecanicillium spp.} and its virulence against \textit{Frankliniella occidentalis}. \textit{Research Square}, 23 March 2020, PREPRINT (Version 1).

\textbf{Conflict of Interest}: The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

\textbf{Copyright} © 2020 Zhou, Zou, Zhi, Xie and Jiang. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.