Metrical Dissonances in the Baroque Minuet: Theory and Practice

Eduardo Sola Chagas Lima
(Burman University, Lacombe, Canada)

Abstract: The present paper serves a theoretical as well as a musicological purpose in addressing metrical dissonances in the multifaceted act of Baroque dance music. In identifying the centrality of the minuet in eighteenth-century repertoire as a capital example of the aesthetic style of the time, this article discusses its complex metrical structure in the integrative art of music and dance. By way of established analytical tools designed by contemporary theorists (KREBS, 1999; LERDAHL; JACKENDOFF, 1983; LITTLE; JENNE, 2001) the minuet’s metrical dissonances are systematically analyzed. The complex metrical structure of the minuet is then discussed in light of its practical implications for today’s performance scene. Such a discussion illuminates the need for mutuality between theory and practice in an intentional endeavour to reconcile and, therefore, better understand the historically segregated arts of music and dance in the performance of Baroque repertoire.

Keywords: Metrical dissonances; metrical structure; baroque dance; minuet.
Dance holds a central place in Western music composition and performance during the Baroque period. Yet, the integration between music and dance was lost due to various societal and cultural factors at play throughout the late eighteenth, nineteenth, and twentieth centuries. Systematic attempts to reconstruct this integration have been gradually changing this historical paradigm, however, since the insurgence of revivalist movements that brought Medieval, Renaissance, and Baroque music to the forefront of scholarly and performative attention in the last five decades. Rather than merely resurfacing less-known repertoire from these historical periods, these revivalist movements that radically shook the foundations of music-making during the late twentieth century had a more profound aesthetical agenda. Performers, historians, and musicologists have since then worked ceaselessly to revive this repertoire in light of its immediate historical context, thus seeking to understand and render this music with its authentic and pristine quality.

In the specific case of Baroque music, the historical context is complex and multifaceted. It incorporates an understanding of its social milieu, its multicultural pan-European backdrop, and the philosophical trends involved in the epistemologies of the time. The cosmological relationships between music and the other arts and sciences were frequently described by Baroque theorists. In particular, the relationship between music and the important arts of rhetoric, the affections (passions and feelings), and, of course, dance, were given prominence in historical documents. Rhetoric and the affections have been systematically discussed in contemporary studies such as Bartel's (1997) work on pre-Classical music semiotics. As for dance, efforts to restore its relationship with music has been less consistently felt in literature as theorists, musicologists, and performers gradually begin to realize their conceptual proximity. The study of dance, movement, and gesture has been slowly integrated into music curricula geared toward the teaching of historically informed performance in different post-secondary institutions across the globe. As instructors and students awake to the seamless integration between music and dance in the Baroque period, efforts have been made to understand and apply the latter to performance in a way that maintains the aesthetic originality of the repertoire. In other words, a thorough understanding of dance in the performance of Baroque music has been a defining factor in ensuring the historicity and accuracy of the repertoire.

The act of music composition in the Baroque was often rooted in specific dance genres and styles, whether or not the composer chose to make this allusion clearly in the title of a piece. A survey of the pervading influence of Baroque dance on music of the time has been elegantly carried out in the work of Little and Jenne (2001). For instance, the authors explore J. S. Bach's extensive use of dance-like patterns and rhythms as the basis for his compositional output. The gestures and rhythmic patterns they approach, which are characteristic of different dance types and genres involved, were in fact discussed by composers and theorists at the time as well as used as affective and rhetorical devices in both sacred and secular repertoire (BarTEL, 1997: 47).

Despite the gradual reunion between the cognate arts of music and dance, they still remain conceptually separated in many respects in contemporary understanding. The present study accounts for one such instance—a theoretical issue that has not been extensively explored in the literature. It contemplates meter in the joint performative moment of Baroque dance and its accompanying music from both a theoretical and practical perspective. In particular, it focuses on the minuet, its characteristic metrical conflicts, and the gestural challenges it may pose to the performers involved in the rendering of this dance type, whether musicians or dancers. If music and dance cannot be dissociated in this historical context, an analysis of meter cannot be singularly music-theoretical in nature. Rather, it must consider the gestures and movements that take place in the real, physical act of dance. It is also paramount to regard music performance as a physical act that elapses in space and time. In this sense, in analyzing the minuet and providing examples
of metrical dissonances throughout this paper, the reader is encouraged to think beyond the sheet music and the metric-structural elements that are notated on the page. After all, metrical accents ultimately take place in physical realms, such as that of sound, image, gesture, and movement.

The objective of this paper is dual. Firstly, it analyzes the various metrical layers involved in the performance of the Baroque minuet, with particular attention to the metrical dissonances created between them. The theoretical framework used for the analysis was imported from the concepts of metrical dissonance developed by Krebs (1999) and that of hypermetrical structures coined in Lerdahl and Jackendoff's (1983) foundational text. The historical perspectives of Little and Jenne (2001) were also accounted for in the analysis. Secondly, this paper briefly discusses the implications of metrical complexities for perception and performance of this repertoire, suggesting a holistic approach grounded in both theory and practice.

1. Metrical Dissonance

The notion of “metrical dissonance”, originally coined by Romantic French composer Hector Berlioz (WILLNER, 2013: 91), currently denotes in music theory points of metrical conflict between different metrical layers. The term is currently employed in reference to passages in the music discourse where prominent metrical units (such as downbeats or accents, for instance) do not temporally coincide, thus resulting in potential conflict and displacement in the overall metrical structure.

Krebs (1999) elaborates extensively on the concept of metrical dissonance in his book on Robert Schumann’s music. The author identifies distinct metrical layers within the musical discourse, making an ontological differentiation between the different yet complementary concepts of notated meter, surface rhythm, harmonic rhythm, etc. Krebs (1999) points out to how they interact with one another in various pieces of music. In his text, the interaction between metrically synchronized (“in-phase”) layers is labeled “metrical consonance”, and the interaction between unsynchronized (“out-of-phase”) layers is generally labeled “metrical dissonance”. Although this analytical tool was developed with and for the music of Schumann—that is, a repertoire dating from approximately one century after the courtly minuet ceased to be a central aspect of European social gatherings—Krebs's (1999) theoretical framework can be adapted to Baroque music.

Lerdahl and Jackendoff’s (1983) systematic approach to hypermeasures consists in an effective method for visually representing and organizing different levels of metrical hierarchy on the music score. In this paper, these tools are conceptually combined into a simplified analytical method and applied to the complex, multilayered metrical structure of the Baroque minuet.

Although this paper focuses on the minuet, the method used for the analysis of complex multilayered metrical structures can be applied to other analogous dance styles, especially if they feature similar metrical conflicts between different layers. Some characteristics of the minuet have analogous instances in faster dances such as the passepied, for instance. In fact, the parallels traced between the minuet and the passepied are numerous in historical documents (LITTLE; JENNE: 2001, 83-91). This is to say that the applicability of the analytical method used in this study is wide ranging.

2. The Baroque Minuet

French court dancing was disseminated throughout European upper classes with the migration of French dance-masters (LEPPERT, 2009: 90). Professional dancer-masters were
invariably male (as were professional music instructors) and had a thorough knowledge of music. They were also often versed in one or more instruments. In fact, conducting dance lessons from musical instruments that belong to the violin family was commonplace in France and England in the eighteenth century. Leppert (2009: 78-88) compiles a collection of visual representations from the eighteenth century depicting the dance lessons taking place to the sound of an accompanying instrument. In some of the examples the dance-master himself is shown teaching his pupils while playing the instrument. Figure 1 shows a mid-century French engraving portraying the dance-master instructing a young girl with the kit—a small treble violin.

![Fig. 1: J. P. Le Bas, Le Maître de Dance (1745), after painting by Ph. Canot; engraving. Haags Gemeente Museum, The Hague, The Netherlands.](image)

Given its portability, the kit was the perfect instrument for dance-masters to carry with them to lessons. The instrument was unfretted (REMNANT, 2001), like the violin, and its small size suggests that players may have only performed easier tunes in lower positions. As Fig. 1 shows, the kit was held in chin-off position, at the chest, thus allowing the instructor freedom of movement. A regular violin would have hindered the ease of movement and physical expression required for Baroque dance gestures. The dance-master pictured in this illustration stands as an example of the praxial interrelationship between Baroque music and dance. This interrelationship also pervaded the work of professional musicians, composers, and theorists, as the following paragraphs outline in further detail.

The plethora in translations of dance treatises also contributed to the spreading of dance instruction throughout Europe. By the early eighteenth century it had become an indispensable aspect of social gatherings, featured among the fundamental skills a courtier must possess for
life in court. It is in this context that the minuet displays growing hegemonic power over other dance genres. Dance historian Sachs (1965: 396), in his foundational volume on the topic, suggests that despite its modest origins as a natural and peasant-like dance type, the minuet eventually became the main courtly dance in Europe. This centrality afforded the minuet a higher esteem in comparison to other court dance types.

The aristocracy took advantage of the minuet’s popularity among higher strata of society. In addressing the physical experience of court dancing and the other social implications it entailed, Leppert (2009) identifies the minuet as a means for power exertion in French and English aristocracy:

The minuet was a ritualized microcosmic social order, exactly replicating a real one. It demanded an exactingly prescribed behaviour. The dance was extraordinarily difficult, not because of its steps in themselves were so difficult, but because it involved precise control over the entire body, from the carriage and turn of the head to the position of the arms, wrists, hands, legs and feet. By dancing the minuet in the prescribed manner (the only way permissible), the French aristocracy nightly affirmed visually and formally their submission to the King – and, equally important, they did so silently, moving without speech in time to music and under the King’s watchful eye. (LEPPERT, 2009: 89)

Hence, in its height, the Baroque minuet was a symbol of propriety for the courtier and of order and social control for the ruling class.

In character, however, the minuet was praised as an elegant and light dance. Although the minuet came “from people, from nature” (SACHS, 1965: 396) it developed into a dance genre of sheer elegance and refinement. Brossard (1965) writes about the minuet in 1703, saying its “movement is quite fast and gay”, adding that its occasional offbeat accents contribute to its playful and cheerful character (LITTLE; JENNE, 2001: 63). Rousseau disagrees, accounting for the minuet’s more serious qualities: “the character of the Menuet is [of] a noble and elegant simplicity; the movement is moderate rather than quick. It may be said that the least gay of all the kinds of dances used in our balls is the Menuet” (ROUSSEAU, 1765 apud LITTLE; JENNE, 2001: 63). Mattheson, in Der Vollkommene Capellmeister, describes the minuet as a dance of “moderate delight” in character and argues that it should be used in compositions that aim to arise analogous affections and passions in the listener (MATTHESON, 1739 apud BARTEL, 1997: 47).

To be sure, not all Baroque dance music was composed for the court’s ballroom. Nor was the minuet exclusively composed for musical performances that involved staged dancers, such as the Baroque opera or ballet. Yet, the rhythms, patterns, and other conventions of dance are almost invariably present in its music. In this sense, instrumental music involving dance references—such as the Baroque suite or, in some cases, the sonata—are aesthetically tied to the dance conventions and gestures associated with specific dance types (minuet, bourrée, gavotte, etc.).

As Galant and Classical music rose, nevertheless, the musical minuet was gradually separated from the dance genre that originated it. Rather, composers gradually begin to use dance as a reference to something extramusical in the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. In other words, dance becomes a musical figure1 (topoi) that serves as a common code between the composer and his audience to denote a light and dance-like movement. For instance, it is

---

1 A thorough discussion of the semiotics of post-Baroque eighteenth-century repertoire, involving topics (topoi) and signs, can be found in Agawu (1991) and Mirka (2014).
frequently featured as a middle movement in Classical and early-Romantic symphonies, gradually resembling less and less the Baroque dance minuet. The minuet’s music thus goes from being a potential accompaniment to an actual dance performance to either an extramusical reference to dance-like elements or a mere allusion to “gaiety” and “light-heartedness”. The middle movements of symphonies are usually contrasting to the harmonic/motivic complexity, elaborated formal design, and length of outer movements (normally in Sonata Form and Rondo).

Before this transition took place, the minuet enjoyed considerable stability in remaining aesthetically faithful to its purely dance-related roots (along with the physicality involved in the latter). In the Baroque, the minuet dance (steps and gestures) as well as the musical minuet (notation) still displayed commonalities, shared characteristics, and intersecting patterns, that define it as such. Several of these characteristics impact the minuet’s meter and contribute to its complex metrical structure. The sections that follow discuss these characteristics in terms of diverse metrical layers.

3. Metrical Dissonances in the Baroque Minuet

In expanding on Krebs’s (1999) aforementioned identification of different metrical layers within a piece of music, this paper singles out at least three such metrical strata for the analysis of metrical dissonance in the minuet. The layers discussed in this analysis are: (1) the notated grid metrical layer (depicted in the time signature and bar lines), (2) the notated surface metrical layer (notated music), and (3) the dance metrical layer (dance steps and gestures).

In exploring these sources of meter individually, it will become clearer and easier to evaluate how they collectively result in a complex metrical structure.

3.1. Notated Grid Metrical Layer

The minuet features a simple metrical plan in triple meter and normally makes use of a ¾ time signature. It is obvious from the notated bar lines that the tactus of the minuet features recurrent 3-beat groupings. In analyzing historical sources, however, Little and Jenne (2001: 68) identify different ways to “beat time” in the minuet, such as grouping beats by bar (groups of three beats) or grouping beats by every couple of bars (groups of six beats). The latter approach to beating time is of particular interest in the present analysis because it was widely used by dance-masters at the time (LITTLE; JENNE, 2001: 68) and aligns with Lerdahl and Jackendoff’s (1983) notion of hypermeasure. Little and Jenne (2001: 68) allude to this historical approach to beating time as grounded on the interpolation of “good” bars (arsis) and “bad” or “false” bars (thesis), so to speak. Thus, the metrical plan of the minuet is organized into units of 2 bars instead of 1 (featuring groupings of 6 beats instead of 3). Figure 2 shows the alternative hypermeasure layer (as used by dance-masters in the Baroque period) and the bar layer. In the metrical analysis–based on Lerdahl and Jackendoff’s (1983) framework–diamonds (◆) represent strong beats and dots (•) represent weaker beats.

2 The minuet in G minor from G. F. Handel’s (1886: 67-68) Watermusic is used in the present paper as a textbook example of the employment of the hemiola in the cadential portion of a minuet phrase. The top line in the example is notated for “Flauti piccoli”, a perfect fourth above, in C minor. The remaining lines are for “Tutti Violini”, “Viola”, and “Tutti Bassi”, respectively in the concert pitch G minor.
Thus, the notated grid can be organized in different ways and may in itself encompass multiple metrical interpretations\(^3\). The hypermeasure layer will prove of special importance when the dance metrical layer is discussed below, given the alignment between the two.

### 3.2. Notated Surface Metrical Layer

The notated surface of a metrical structure consists in the rhythmic figures and patterns of the music discourse itself—the notes on the page. Little and Jenne (2001: 70) suggest rhythmic patterns that are characteristic of the minuet, all of which are “in-phase” or consonant with the notated grid in that they align with bar and hypermeasure layers. Yet, this paper accounts for a notorious musical event that takes place recurrently in cadential progressions in the minuet: the hemiola.

Krebs (1999: 31-39) makes a further distinction between two types of metrical dissonances: grouping dissonance and displacement dissonance. The former type is of particular interest here because it relates to cadential hemiolas—a recurrent characteristic of musical phrases in the Baroque minuet. The hemiola consists in a regrouping of the original time signature heard at the surface layer. Despite the absence of notated accents, it regroups the beats contained in two triple-meter bars—or two groups of three beats each (3 + 3)—recombining them into three groups of two beats each (2 + 2 + 2). In other words, the alternative grouping in the surface layer (2 + 2 + 2) conflicts with the established metrical layer (3 + 3). Krebs (1999: 31) states that “grouping dissonances in pre-twentieth century tonal music generally involve one of the metrical layers and one conflicting interpretive layer, or ‘antimetrical layer’”. Not only is the hemiola out of phase with the bar layer, but also with the hypermeasure layer, in that its downbeat falls on the thesis (the “bad” bar), rather than the arsis. Figure 3 shows the hemiola’s metrical “displacement” (GRAVE, 1985) elapsing at the cadential portion of the minuet’s phrase—immediately prior to the cadence proper.

---

\(^3\) Lerdahl and Jackendoff (1983) discuss various hierarchical levels in defining hypermetrical layers, which reflect various possible metrical interpretations. The authors devise a multilayered hierarchical metrical structure that can be subdivided into lower-level layers, whenever necessary in the analysis. The two-bar grouping was chosen as the highest metrical unit in this paper given the historical basis of such metrical interpretation (LITTLE; JENNE, 2001: 68). Higher-order groupings could, nonetheless, be used for the analysis of longer phrases in the minuet (e.g. four-bar or eight-bar groupings, for instance).
Metrical Dissonances in the Baroque Minuet: Theory and Practice

The harmonic rhythm in the cadential pattern suggests the presence of a hemiola. In the context of B-flat major—the key in which the cadential pattern takes place—it could be argued that there are significant indicators of accentuation on the third beat of m. 30 and on the second beat of m. 31. The former is achieved through a deceptive cadence at scale degree 6 of the scale (G minor harmony). The latter is achieved through a double appoggiatura on scale degree 5, finally resolving into a B-flat major harmony in the last bar of the phrase (m. 32).

Hence, based on Krebs’s (1999) proposition, the hemiola operates at an antimetrical level in that it shows metrical displacement against the notated grid. To be sure, metrical dissonances caused by metrical displacement at an antimetrical level can appear in any of the Baroque dance genres. The hemiola is, nonetheless, typical in dance genres that feature a triple meter (3-beat groupings at the bar level) and it occurs often in the cadential portions of the minuet phrase. This paper will demonstrate in the following section that the hemiola is not the only antimetrical layer in the totality of the minuet’s performance. The dance metrical layer, which entails gestures and steps, offers at least one more potentially dissonant metrical layer in addition to the hemiola.

Additionally, in this case, the hemiola features an accelerated harmonic rhythm. In the passage depicted in Fig. 3, the established harmonic rhythm of the entire cadential phrase involves a change in harmony at every bar. At the onset of the hemiola, nonetheless, the harmony begins to change at every beat, as the continuo part shows (mm. 30-31). This change in harmonic rhythm adds to the climatic feel of the cadential phrase. Hemiolas frequently feature harmonic changes at the beat rate; yet it is important to note that there are instances in the repertoire in which the hemiola does not cause a change in harmonic rhythm.

3.3. Dance (Steps) Metrical Layer

As the previous section suggests, metrical conflict is not only a result of the interactions between the purely notated metrical layers (notated grid and notated surface). If music and dance must necessarily be studied and understood jointly for an accurate historical delivery of

---

* Little and Jenne (2001) differ from other literature in the terminology they use to denote a “beat”. The authors provide in their text a comprehensive overview of Baroque dance meters and the different hierarchical levels they entail (LITTLE; JENNE, 2001: 18).
Baroque music, as the introduction to this paper proposed, the inflections of dance must also be analyzed. This section contemplates groups of dance steps/gestures that may create an additional metrical layer in the complex structure of the minuet. The paragraphs that follow explore these gestures in detail, first with an explanation of their qualities followed by an interpretation of their characteristics within the analytical framework fostered in this paper.

The basic steps contained in the minuet feature small, rather natural gestures. They are also uncomplicated in comparison to more physically demanding Baroque dance steps, thus pointing to the etymology of the word that gives origin to the minuet's very name: menu ("small" or "tiny") (SACHS, 1965: 397). Inside and outside of the Baroque minuet, groups of such steps are commonly emphasized/accentuated by specific types of gestures.

Three dance steps are of particular importance in the present analysis. Figure 4 shows a graph of a summary of these steps and their possible combinations in the minuet represented by arrow symbols ("↑", "↓", and "→") for the sake of simplification and commodity of reference throughout the illustrations provided.

The first is the élevé (↑). Little and Jenne (2001: 22) define the élevé as an accented dance step. It entails a literal elevation of the body at the tip of one’s foot (or feet) in an upward motion, therefore conveying a visual idea of expansion. The élevé is often preceded by the plié (↓)–a dance step characterized by a bending of both knees with both feet flat on the floor. The plié visually conveys the opposite of expansion. It conveys instead a downward gesture of retraction. Together, they form a demi-coupé (Fig. 4, a.). In the demi-coupé, the juxtaposition of retraction and expansion adds emphasis to the effect of the latter as a metrical accent.

The third step of interest is the pas marché (→), which features a step at the tip of one’s feet in élevé position. In fact, the pas marché often follows an élevé. It does not suggest retraction or expansion in that it does not involve either an upward or downward motion of the body. Rather, the body remains in the same level achieved by the élevé, with the dancer moving forward at the tip of the foot. Thus, the pas marché entails a prolongation of the élevé’s accented gesture. When one pas marché is added to the demi-coupé, a full coupé is created (Fig. 4, b.). If two pas marchés, in turn, are added to the demi-coupé, the pas de bourrée is formed (Fig. 4, c.).

These steps can also be organized in larger step groups. The pas de menuet à deux mouvements (minuet steps in two movements) and the pas de menuet à trois mouvements (minuet steps in three movements)–two of the most common step groups at the time (LITTLE; JENNE, 2001: 64). The former features a demi-coupé followed by a pas de bourrée (Fig. 5, a.) and the latter features a demi-coupé followed by a full coupé and another demi-coupé (Fig. 5, b.).
Fig. 5: Groups of steps in the Baroque minuet.

Fig. 6: Handel’s (1886: 68) Watermusic, Minuet, mm. 25-32. Metrical representation of the pas de menuet à deux movements, featuring a 2 + 4 grouping organization.

The pas de menuet à deux movements spans two musical bars (6 beats), therefore remaining in-phase with the notated grid metrical layer. However, the two “movements” – demi-coupé and pas de bourrée – generate interdependent groups of two and four beats, respectively (2 + 4), whose organization bears a resemblance to the hemiola (2 + 2 + 2). Consequently, the pas de bourrée (4 beats in length) – the second “movement” of this group of steps – becomes metrically dissonant against the bar-level grid by one anticipated beat. Note in Fig. 6 that every other bar features accents on both the first and third beats whereas the interpolating bars are not at all accentuated.

4. The Minuet’s Complex Metrical Structure

In reiterating one of the overarching purposes of this paper – that of analyzing music and dance as a single, united performative entity – it is crucial to contemplate dance gestures in the minuet before addressing practical questions related to perception and performance.
The present section summarizes the different metrical layers analyzed thus far and points to a height of metrical conflict generated by the various sources of meter involved in the minuet.

Figure 7 shows all metrical layers discussed heretofore: (1) the notated grid metrical layer (represented in two separate sub-layers: hypermetrical layer and bar layer), (2) the notated surface metrical layer, and (3) the dance steps layer featuring the pas de menuet à deux movements. While the latter generates recurring metrical dissonances during the pas de bourrée step group, it is around the cadential portion of the phrase—the last four bars—that the height of metrical conflict takes place. Measures 29-32 of the example contain four distinct organizational groups happening almost simultaneously at different metrical layers (6 beats, 4 beats, 3 beats, and 2 beats), as the rounded rectangles show. The metrical dissonances created overlap during the cadential hemiola and cause several accented beats almost in succession. The accelerated harmonic rhythm during these bars also adds to this cadential climax.

Fig. 7: Handel’s (1886: 68) Watermusic, Minuet, mm. 25-32. Overview of groupings at different layers overlapping within the last four bars of the minuet phrase.

The same analytical procedure used to identify meter and groupings in the pas de menuet à deux movements was applied to the pas de menuet à trois movements – another combination of minuet steps groups proposed above – as well as other potential combinations. Figure 8 shows the latter in detail. The élevé steps in the pas de menuet à trois movements generate a 2 + 3 + 1 organization. The rounded rectangles show groupings of 6, 3, 2, and 1 beat taking place during the cadential hemiola in mm. 21-24.

[^5]: For the sake of variety of illustration, J. S. Bach’s (1871: 26) minuet from Brandenburg Concerto No. 1 was selected for this example.
In recapitulating metrical dissonances in the context described by Krebs (1999)—that of multiple layers of metrical activity—it is safe to say that they may impact perception and performance significantly. When consciously aware of the multiple gestures involved in the minuet's music and dance and how they contribute to this complex metrical structure, performances of the minuet may require multifocal attention depending on the performative choices made. In emphasizing or de-emphasizing specific metrical accents, performers may have to travel between different multiple foci of attention. While the purely phenomenological impact of multiple metrical dissonances is deferred to future studies, the section that follows discusses some of the practical implications for the perception and performance of this complex metrical structure.

5. Practical Implications for Performance

The simplicity involved in the minuet's basic steps vis-à-vis its metrical complexity is a salient aspect to consider at this juncture. The ease, gaiety, and elegance of the minuet dance steps are in stark contrast with the complex metrical structure that results from their combination with the purely musical layers of meter. On the one hand, the minuet consists in a collection of dance gestures that do not require advanced skills. Its growth in popularity as well as centrality in eighteenth-century European courts are grounded in the minuet's accessibility to the average courtier. As a means to exert social power, the minuet consisted in a dance genre that could be
learned quickly by a courtier and performed with moderate ease. While a requirement for a life in court, complex dance gestures were not necessarily mastered by the common courtier as they were by advanced or professional dancers, at least not in the same level. The minuet was, thus, a dance that individuals could potentially perform satisfactorily.

On the other hand, the sheer simplicity of the step-groups involved in the minuet are met with a complex metrical structure and the displaced accents that they pose to musicians and dancers. In its eighteenth-century historical context, this simplicity and natural origin (SACHS, 1965: 396) was also contrasted by the anxiety generated by the social functions the minuet served. In France, for instance, the inability to dance the minuet at court with both grace and exactitude despite this dual pressure (both intra- and extramusical) generated a potential source of embarrassment and public shame, in the least. In other words, its original naturalness transpired only “naturalized control” (LEPPERT, 2009: 89-90). The minuet thus embodies a conceptual duality.

The historically oriented performance of the minuet today is, of course, stripped of its use for social control and the potential anxiety it signified for the eighteenth-century courtier. Its metrical structure, nonetheless, remains intact. As suggested in the introductory portions of this paper, the gradual reconciliation of Baroque music and dance – afforded in part by the reviver movements of the late twentieth century – has yielded authentic performances featuring musicians and dancers on one and the same stage. As both musicians become more aware of what the dancers do in this collective performance and vice-versa, the reintegration between the two arts has been well underway.

Metrical dissonances in this collective performative act of Baroque dance music have not, nevertheless, been extensively discussed in scholarly literature, especially in terms of the intentionality involved in this enterprise. In the specific case of the minuet, the lack of metrical synchronicity poses performative implications for the dancer and musician alike (including singers6) in the performance choices they make. The delivery of the performance, the priority for cohesion, as well as a potential desire to emphasize metrical conflict depend on awareness and intentionality on the part of the performers involved. If the complexity of the minuet’s metrical structure were known to the eighteenth-century musician, its swingy, staggering quality may have been aspects performers tried to reveal rather than conceal in that historical context. This paper argues that an analogous intentionality in performing Baroque dance music is needed from performers today. A conscious involvement with these metrical dissonances may expand and magnify these idiosyncratic qualities of the Baroque minuet and signal the aforementioned historical duality it embodies. The mutual knowledge performers possessed at the time of both music and dance as an integrated whole encourages an analogous involvement from musicians and dancers today. This involvement may go beyond the immediacy of their art.

The analysis of meter, therefore, provides a unique opportunity for further reflection. The rediscovery of metrical dissonances in this repertoire and their intrinsic significance inside and outside the purview of the minuet brings to the surface the need for a more organic integration between music and dance—an integration based on engaged analytical study as well as practical application. It follows that the reintegration of Baroque music and dance needs to be of a theoretical as well as practical nature. The mere juxtaposition of music and dance on the stage only reproduces by way of mimicry the performative historicity in which they once took place. Conversely, meaningful reconstructions of the performative intersectionality between the arts

---

6 Little and Jenne (2001: 299-306) provide a full list of Bach’s vocal works that derive from dance styles, pointing to the pervading influence of Baroque dance rhythms and patterns not only on instrumental repertoire of the time.
of music and dance require an involved and intentional approach to these arts as, essentially, one and the same in this historical context.

There have been in the literature studies that foster this reconciliatory endeavour in a praxial (theoretical and practical) way. Capital examples include discussions of phenomenological processes involved in the perceptual models of meter (LONDON, 1995) and the role of focal attention (LONDON, 2011) in the perception of tempi. The latter study's framework may prove particularly helpful in understanding metrical dissonances and changing focal attention between different metrical layers throughout the performance. Hence, extant literature could greatly benefit from phenomenological approaches to meter specifically in Baroque dance music.

Moreover, studies geared specifically toward integration of dance gestures and music-performative gestures – such as the historical use of “downbows” and “upbows” to emphasize or detract emphasis from metrical accents in bowed-string instruments, for instance—may prove particularly relevant for performance practice. For example, the sixteenth, seventeenth and eighteenth centuries produced a series of “rules” that focused on the emphasis of metrically accented beats (LIMA, 2014). Different versions of these rules were followed strictly by performers of both stringed as well as other instruments (LIMA, 2014) and implied an accentuation of metrically strong beats. In the specific case of Baroque dance music, accented gestures performed by dancers (such as the élévé step discussed in this paper) might have been visually dissonant with the expansive movement of the “downbow” in stringed instruments, for instance. A consideration of such physical gestures that are visually discerned may be an additional performative aspect to be studied. This is to say that metrical dissonances in this repertoire and their practical implications for the performers of this dynamic music may require further and deeper analysis.

6. Conclusion

This study has addressed complex metrical dissonances that contribute for the climax of the Baroque minuet's cadential phrase. As the analysis suggests, the study of meter in eighteenth-century dance music requires a multilayered approach not only because of internal complex metrical dissonances. To be sure, the hemiola, as a recurrent signature of the Baroque minuet's metrical structure, poses a surface rhythmic cell that is out-of-phase with both the hypermeasure grid as well as the notated meter at the bar level. Yet, because of its intersection with dance gestures, the analysis of this music may require one or more additional layers in a holistic approach to this climatic moment. Just as the musical discourse needs to be distributed into different layers, dance gestures may need further distribution. The accompanying arm and hand movements associated with the dance steps discussed in this paper, for example, may need to be analyzed separately—especially in instances in which they pose additional metrical dissonances.

It is also important to reiterate that the analytical process used in this article may be applied to other gestures within and without the minuet. Various other groups of steps and other dance types may benefit from an analogous approach to understanding their integration with the musical discourse. Little and Jenne (2001) discuss complex groups of steps that can prove not only more demanding in execution but may require a heightened awareness on the part of performers in securing a seamless integration and historical accuracy in the performative delivery.
Finally, this paper has contemplated metrical dissonances in Baroque dance repertoire as an opportunity to reimagine and reconceptualize the unique nature of the intersectionality between dance and music in today’s historically oriented performance practice. This intersectionality is unique in that it is reconciliatory. It reflects issues of reconceptualization of a historical relationship that was once lost and calls for awareness and intentionality in every step of the way.

Bibliography

AGAWU, Kofi. Playing with signs: a semiotic interpretation of classic music. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991.

BACH, Johann Sebastian. Six Brandenburg concertos. Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1871.

BARTEL, Dietrich. Musica Poetica: musical-rhetorical figures in German Baroque music. London: University of Nebraska Press, 1997.

BROSSARD, Sébastien de. Dictionnaire de la musique, contenant une explication des termes Grecs, Latins, Italiens & François, les plus usitez dans la musique. Paris, 1703. Hilversum: Knuf, 1965.

GRAVE, Floyd. Metrical displacement and the compound measure in eighteenth-century theory and practice. Theoria, v. 1, 25-60, 1985.

HANDEL, Georg Friedrich. Wassermusik, Feuerwerksmusik. Leipzig: Deutsche Händelgesellschaft, 1886. Music Score.

HOULE, George. Meter in music, 1600-1800: performance, perception, and notation. Bloomington: University of Indiana Press, 1987.

KREBS, Harald. Fantasy pieces: metrical dissonance in the music of Schumann. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.

LEPPERT, Richard. Music and image: domesticity, ideology, and socio-cultural formation in eighteenth-century England. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009.

LERDAHL, Fred, and JACKENDOFF, Ray. A generative theory of tonal music. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1983.

LESTER, Joel. Compositional theory in the eighteenth century. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992.

LIMA, Eduardo Sola Chagas. Uccellini’s Sonata Ottava: Perspectives in Grouping, Meter and Metrical Dissonance. Revista Hodie, v. 14, n. 2, 199-212, 2014.

LITTLE, Meredith, and JENNE, Natalie. Dance and the music of J. S. Bach. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2001.

LONDON, Justin. Some examples of complex meters and their implications for models of metric perception. Music Perception, v. 13, n. 1, 59-77, 1995.

LONDON, Justin. Tactus ≠ tempo: some dissociations between attentional focus, motor behavior, and tempo judgment. Empirical Musicology Review, v. 6, n. 1, 43-55, 2011.

MIRKA, Danuta (Org.). The Oxford handbook of topic theory. New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.
REMNANT, Mary. *Kit*. Oxford Music Online, 2001. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.15075>. Access on Jul. 30, 2020.

WILLNER, Channan. Metrical displacement and metrically dissonant hemiolas. *Journal of Music Theory*, v. 57, no. 1, 87-118, 2013.

---

**Eduardo Sola Chagas Lima** is Assistant Professor of Music at Burman University (Alberta, Canada) where he teaches music history and music theory and conducts the symphony orchestra (BUSO). He holds a Ph.D. in curriculum theory from Andrews University (Michigan, USA), an M.A. in musicology from the University of Toronto (Ontario, Canada), a B.Mus. in baroque violin from the Royal Conservatorium of Den Haag (The Netherlands), and a B.Mus. in violin from EMBAPE, Parana State University (Brazil). He has performed worldwide as a baroque and modern violinist. His research interests currently focus on music cognition, music theory, analysis, and music history. His scholarly work has been featured in academic publications as well as international conferences worldwide. eduardosola@burmanu.ca