Distribution and Safety Assessment of Heavy Metals in Fresh Meat from Zhejiang, China

Jian Long Han  
Zhejiang Provincial Center for Disease Control and Prevention

Xiao Dong Pan  (✉ zjupanxiaodong@hotmail.com)  
Zhejiang Provincial Center for Disease Control and Prevention

Qing Chen  
Zhejiang Provincial Center for Disease Control and Prevention

Research Article

Keywords: Meat, Heavy metal, Toxic elements, Health risk, Exposure assessment

Posted Date: November 30th, 2021

DOI: https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-1102078/v1

License: ☕️ This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.  
Read Full License
Abstract

There are increasing concerns on heavy metals in animal derived foods. We analyzed the levels of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb in 1066 fresh meat samples including pork, beef, mutton, chicken and duck from Zhejiang province, southeast China. The average levels of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb were 0.018, 0.002, 0.061, 0.801, 0.0038, 0.055, and 0.029 mg/kg wet weight respectively. There are significant positive correlations among Cd, Hg and Pb ($P<0.05$) and negative correlations for Cu-Pb or Cu-Cd ($P<0.05$). The exposure assessment showed that the health risk to humans by consuming these meat products was relatively low. However, regular monitoring of heavy metals in meat products is still recommended considering their intensive industrial activities.

Introduction

Meat products are major sources of human nutrients, including protein, minerals, vitamins, and fats. Based on Statistical Yearbook of China 2016, Chinese output of pork, beef and mutton had reached 86.25 million tones. It has become the main pork producer, which accounts about 50% of the world’s production. Although the majority of Chinese residents still keep a plant-food-based dietary pattern, consumption of animal-derived foods has been increasing. Recently, concern has been raised about various toxic elements in meat products.

Contamination of harmful elements in livestock and poultry might be mainly caused by animal feeds, especially in some areas with intense manufacturing activity, the industrial emissions, coal combustion and ore mining. When toxic elements, such as cadmium (Cd) and lead (Pb) were released into water, soil or air, they could be accumulated by plants and fishes which are the main raw materials of animal feeds. For example, Tao et al. reported that the incidence rates of Cd, mercury (Hg), chromium (Cr), and arsenic (As) contamination for feedstuffs and feeds were high. It was found that animal feeds were commonly contaminated with Cr, followed by As, Cd, and Hg. Wang et al. observed high level of Cr in meat products, which was possibly originated from the dietary feeds of animal husbandry.

The high exposure to these metals in meat consumption has negative effects to human body, such as nerve damage, nephropathy and cancers. For example, Pb can lead to diseases of kidney failure, cardiovascular disease and nerve development of children. Chronic exposure of Cd can cause liver harm, bone degeneration, blood damage, and renal dysfunction. Hg could damage the nervous system of unborn and newborn children. Therefore, it is necessary to monitor and control toxic elements in meat product from China which is one of the largest meat production and consumption countries.

Zhejiang is a fast-developing province with a high population density in the southeast of China. Our previous studies have reported the possible pollution of heavy metals in vegetables, rice, marine fish and seaweeds from Zhejiang. However, to our knowledge, few studies on metal contamination in meat products were reported. The aims of this study were to investigate distribution of heavy metals in
livestock and poultry meat and evaluate the health risk to local inhabitants. Our data may provide some insights into toxic elements accumulation in farmed animals and serve as a basis for profiling the public health problem.

**Materials And Methods**

*Sampling*

Total 1066 meat samples were collected in Zhejiang, China whose latitudes range from 27° 09' to 31° 11' N, and the longitudes from 118° 02' to 122° 57' E. Fresh edible meats of livestock and poultry were collected in 11 sampling areas as shown in Fig. 1 which was drawn by software of MapGIS K9 SP2 free trial edition (Zondy Cyber Comp., China, http://www.mapgis.com/index.php/index-view-aid-280.html). The detailed edible parts such as leg, chest and waist were randomly selected. The samples were pork (511), beef (184), mutton (47), chicken (250) and duck (74) collected from 2018 to 2020. All samples transported in plastic bags were refrigerated at -20 °C until later analysis in the laboratory. The storage period was not more than 7 days.

*Chemical analysis*

The concentrations of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb were tested according to the Chinese standard analysis method of GB 5009.268-2016. Briefly, samples (0.5-1.0 g) were digested in acid-clean Teflon vessels containing 6 mL HNO₃ in a Mars-6 microwave digestion system (CEM, Charlotte, NC, USA). The samples in closed vessels were heated at 190 °C for 20 min. After digestion, the residue was heated at 150 °C till nearly dry. For the Hg test, the digested sample was directly diluted without heating for remove residual acid. Then, it was diluted to 20 mL by ionized water for instrumental analysis. As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb in all samples were tested using NexION 300 ICP-MS (Perkin Elmer, Inc., Shelton, CT USA). For quality assurance and quality control purposes, sample blanks, certified reference materials (CRMs), and duplicates of the samples (10% of the load) were applied in each batch of treated samples.

*Method validation*

The analytical procedures were verified by analysis of appropriate certified reference materials (CRMs) using the same digestion and analytical methods. Two CRMs (Table 1) were purchased from National Research Center for Certified Reference Materials, China (NRCCRM). Quantitative results (no more than 10% of the certified value) were obtained for targeted elements of CRMs. Limits of detection (LODs) were defined as 3 times the standard deviation of 10 runs of blank measurements. LODs of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb were 0.003, 0.001, 0.005, 0.005, 0.0003, 0.004 and 0.004 mg/kg respectively.

*Consumption data*

The meat consumption data were provided by the Zhejiang Food and Drug Administration of China. Briefly, it performed the food consumption survey in 2008. In this survey, 9798 people represented certain
areas were questioned twice about their last 24-h consumption. Furthermore, the selection of interviewed people and the moment of the interview were designed for a representative consumption profile of the population over 1 year.

**Health risk assessment**

According to the recommendation of the report Reliable Evaluation of Low-Level Contaminations of Food issued by WHO, half of LOD was assigned to all results of element levels below the LOD, where the proportion of data below the LOD is not more than 60%.

The targeted hazard quotient (THQ) and hazard index (HI) were used to estimate health risk according to US EPA's IRIS database. We adopted the mean and 97.5th percentile (P97.5) of obtained element level to represent the consumers with normal and high exposure, respectively. The sum of all THQs for each element was referred as the HI. The formulas were as follows:

$$\text{Exposure Dose} = \frac{C_i \times D_i \times E_d}{B_w \times A_t}$$

(1)

$$\text{Targeted Hazard Quotient (THQ)} = \frac{\text{Exposure Dose}}{RfD}$$

(2)

$$\text{Hazard Index (HI)} = \sum_{k=1}^{n} \text{Targeted Hazard Quotient}$$

(3)

$C_i$ is the average or P97.5 concentration of the element in meat samples (mg/kg wet weight); $D_i$ is the daily intake of livestock and poultry meat (112.9 g/capita/day); $E_d$ is the average exposure duration (e.g., 70 years); $B_w$ is the average weight (e.g., 60 kg); $A_t$ is the average lifetime (e.g., 70 years). $RfD$ is the recommended reference dose (RfD); According to US EPA guidelines for assessing conservative risk, HI were calculated by sum of the THQ. When HI < 1, no health risk is expected to occur; If HI ≥ 1, there is moderate or high risk for adverse human effects.

**Statistical analysis**

Data analysis and statistical analysis were performed using Excel (2017 edition) and SPSS16 (Tried edition). The difference was considered as significant by single factor analysis (one-way ANOVA) when $P<0.05$. The correlation between each factor was analyzed by Pearson correlation analysis.

**Results And Discussion**

**Heavy metals in meats**

Total 1066 meat samples including 511 pork samples, 250 chicken, 184 beef, 74 duck, and 47 mutton purchased from local markets of Zhejiang were analyzed in this study. As shown in Table 2 and Table 3, average levels of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb were 0.018, 0.002, 0.061, 0.801, 0.0038, 0.055, and 0.029
mg/kg wet weight respectively. Based on the Chinese National Food Safety standard\(^{27}\), the maximum allowable concentrations (MAC) of As, Cd, Cr, Hg and Pb in meat in China were 0.5, 0.1, 1, 0.05 and 0.2 mg/kg. The number of sample exceeding the MAC is 1 for As, 2 for Hg and 10 for Pb. Our results were similar with those found in Beijing China, where there are Cr (0.573 mg/kg), Cd (0.015 mg/kg), Pb (0.167 mg/kg), As (0.053 mg/kg), Hg (0.018 mg/kg) in meats (pork, beef, mutton, chicken)\(^{28}\). In some potential polluted areas, average level of heavy metals, such Cd and Pb were more than 0.2 mg/kg in meat product\(^{29,30}\).

Different animal species may have different bio-accumulation ability for heavy metals. The average levels of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb in different meat samples were shown in Figure 2. Compared with beef, chicken, duck and pork, mutton had relative lower levels of As, Cd, and Cr \( (P<0.05)\). High Cu concentration (average 3.1 mg/kg) was found in duck meat. Considering the nearly 80% water content in duck meat, our result was similar with the report of Aendo et al.\(^{31}\), who found duck meat with 15.28 mg/kg dry weight for Cu in Thailand. For Hg, Ni, and Pb, there was no significant difference among five targeted meats \( (P<0.05)\). Furthermore, 4 of 248 chicken muscle samples contained Pb with levels above the safety threshold of 0.2 mg/kg (fresh weight). The ratio of over-limit was lower than that reported in Guangzhou, China where 2 of 63 muscle samples had Pb contents exceeding this limit\(^{32}\). The Cd (0.002 mg/kg) in beef was lower than report of Hashemi\(^{33}\) who found 0.28 mg/kg Cd in Iran.

Pearson correlation analysis (Table 4) showed that there were significant positive correlations for Cd-Hg \( (r=0.9141, P<0.05)\), Pb-Hg \( (r=0.98837, P<0.05)\) and Cd-Pb \( (r=0.9504, P<0.05)\) in meat samples. Negative correlations in Cu-Cd \( (r=-0.6515, P<0.05)\) and Cu-Pb \( (r=-0.6101, P<0.05)\) were found in our results. We suppose that two groups of Cd-Hg-Pb and Cu were accumulated by different sources. Actually, most of livestock and poultry in Zhejiang were farming with artificial feeds which may be the main source of heavy metals. The contamination incidence rates of harmful elements, such as Cd, Hg, Pb, and As in feedstuffs and feeds were high, and feeds were most often contaminated with Cr, followed by As, Cd, and Hg\(^{9}\). The mean As contents of chicken feeds collected in Jiangsu province of southern China was reported to be 0.13 mg/kg\(^{34}\) while the total contents of As in poultry feeds in northeastern China varied from 0.02 to 6.42 mg/kg\(^{35}\). Previous studies showed that Cu was typically present at levels 2 to 8 times higher than the required ones in poultry and livestock feeds in China\(^{34,35}\). As we known, compounds containing Cu element were commonly used as a growth promoter in diets of poultry, especial duck\(^{36}\).

**Exposure assessment and health risk**

According to the data of food consumption survey\(^{23}\), the estimated livestock and poultry meat intake was 112.9 g/day/person. The recommended reference doses (RfDs) or safe values were based on previous reports\(^{30,32}\). The mean and high exposure was presented by the average and P97.5 elements levels\(^{\mu g/kg bw/day}\) respectively. As shown in Table 4, mean exposure doses of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb by meat consumption were 0.034, 0.004, 0.115, 1.507, 0.007, 0.103, and 0.055 \( \mu g/kg bw/day\). And high exposure
values were 0.207, 0.024, 0.598, 7.696, 0.047, 0.790, and 0.339 μg/kg bw/day. Our mean exposure data (As, Cd, Cr, Hg and Pb) were lower than those reported in Beijing, China \(^{28}\).

To appraise the health risk associated with these metals, targeted hazard quotient (THQ) was calculated by dividing daily intake of elements by their reference doses. Hazard index (HI) combined all THQs was adopted to assess the total health risk \(^{37, 38}\). An HI more than 1 is considered as not safe for human health. As shown in Table 5, all THQs were less than 1. Both mean and P97.5 HIs were no more than 1. HI for P97.5 level presented as the high exposure was 0.768. It indicated that there was low health risk to exposure of common toxic elements by intake of these meats. However, it should be noticed that other potential exposure pathways for foods, such as vegetables, cereals, fruits, and fish might be considered except for livestock and poultry meats.

**Conclusion**

The present study revealed the levels of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb in livestock and poultry meats from Zhejiang China, which showed 0.09% (As), 0.19% (Hg) and 0.94% (Pb) were exceeding the maximum allowable concentrations set by Chinese legislation. Low average levels of As (0.018 mg/kg), Cd (0.002 mg/kg), Cr (0.061 mg/kg), Cu (0.801 mg/kg), Hg (0.0038 mg/kg), Ni (0.055 mg/kg), and Pb (0.029 mg/kg) were observed in these meat samples. Obvious positive correlations among Cd, Hg and Pb and negative correlations for Cu-Pb and Cu-Cd were found in analyzed samples. Dietary exposure assessment showed that there is relatively low health risk to these elements for general people in Zhejiang, China. However, the regular monitoring of heavy metals in livestock and poultry meats is still strongly recommended in this area with respect to the fast developing industry.

**Declarations**

**Acknowledgements**

The authors would like to thank many colleagues in CDC of Zhejiang provincial cities for their laboratory work.

**Author contributions statement**

X.-D. P, and Q. C. conceived the experiment(s), X.-D. P, and Q. C. conducted the experiment(s), X.-D. P, Q. C, and J.-L. H. analyzed the results. All authors reviewed the manuscript.

**Additional Information**

Competing Interests: The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

**References**

1. Bureau of Statistics. *China Statistical yearbook* (China statistics press, Beijing, 2016).
2. Soare, E. & Chiurciu, I. A. Study on the pork market worldwide. Scientific Papers Series Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development, 17 (4), 321–326 (2017).

3. He, Y., Yang, X., Xia, J., Zhao, L. & Yang, Y. Consumption of meat and dairy products in China: a review. Proceedings of the Nutrition Society 75, 385-391 (2016).

4. Yang, S. et al. Comparison of the concentrations, sources, and distributions of heavy metal (loid)s in agricultural soils of two provinces in the Yangtze River Delta, China. Environmental pollution, 264, 114688 (2020).

5. Hu, B. et al. Current status, spatial features, health risks, and potential driving factors of soil heavy metal pollution in China at province level. Environ. Pollut, 266, 114961 (2020).

6. Chen, Q., Pan, X. D., Huang, B. F. & Han, J. L. Distribution of metals and metalloids in dried seaweeds and health risk to population in southeastern China. Scientific reports, 8, 1–7 (2018).

7. Filippini, T. et al. Diet composition and serum levels of selenium species: A cross-sectional study. Food and Chemical Toxicology, 115, 482–490 (2018).

8. Malavolti, M. et al. Lead exposure in an Italian population: Food content, dietary intake and risk assessment. Food Res. Int, 137, 109370 (2020).

9. Tao, C. et al. Zhang, N. Heavy Metal Content in Feedstuffs and Feeds in Hubei Province, China. Journal of Food Protection, 83, 762–766 (2020).

10. Wang, X. et al. Spatial analysis of heavy metals in meat products in China during 2015–2017., 104, 174–180 (2019).

11. Huang, Z., Pan, X. D., Wu, P. G., Han, J. L. & Chen, Q. Health risk assessment of heavy metals in rice to the population in Zhejiang, China. PloS one, 8, e75007 (2013).

12. Wai, K. M. et al. Impact of prenatal heavy metal exposure on newborn leucocyte telomere length: a birth-cohort study. Environ. Pollut, 243, 1414–1421 (2018).

13. Rehman, K., Fatima, F., Waheed, I. & Akash, M. S. H. Prevalence of exposure of heavy metals and their impact on health consequences. Journal of cellular biochemistry, 119, 157–184 (2018).

14. Kim, J. J., Kim, Y. S. & Kumar, V. Heavy metal toxicity: An update of chelating therapeutic strategies. Journal of Trace elements in Medicine and Biology, 54, 226–231 (2019).

15. Anyanwu, B. O., Ezejiofor, A. N., Igweze, Z. N. & Orisakwe, O. E. Heavy metal mixture exposure and effects in developing nations: an update. Toxics, 6, 65 (2018).

16. Aaseth, J., Hilt, B. & Bjørklund, G. Mercury exposure and health impacts in dental personnel. Environmental research, 164, 65–69 (2018).

17. Zhou, G., Zhang, W. & Xu, X. China’s meat industry revolution: Challenges and opportunities for the future. Meat science, 92, 188–196 (2012).

18. Zhang, W. et al. Technological demands of meat processing–An Asian perspective. Meat Sci, 132, 35–44 (2017).

19. Pan, X. D., Tang, J., Chen, Q., Wu, P. G. & Han, J. L. Evaluation of direct sampling method for trace elements analysis in Chinese rice wine by ICP–OES. European Food Research and Technology, 236
20. Huang, Z., Pan, X. D., Wu, P. G., Han, J. L. & Chen, Q. Heavy metals in vegetables and the health risk to population in Zhejiang, China. *Scientific reports*, **36**, 248–252 (2014).

21. Han, J. L., Pan, X. D., Chen, Q. & Huang, B. F. Health risk assessment of heavy metals in marine fish to the population in Zhejiang, China. *Scientific reports*, **11**, 1–9 (2021).

22. GAQSIQ (General Administration of Quality Supervision. *Inspection and Quarantine of the People’s Republic of China*) GB 5009.268-2016. National Food Safety Standard. Determination of Multi-elements in Food (in Chinese) (China Standards Press, Beijing, 2016).

23. ZJFDA. A report on the dietary intake in Zhejiang province, China. Hangzhou, ZJFDA (2008). Available from: http://www.zjfda.gov.cn/news/detail/13556.html

24. WHO. (1995) Reliable Evaluation of Low-Level Contaminants of Food. Workshop in the frame of GEMS/Food-EURO. Kulmbach, Germany. Available from: http://www.who.int/foodsafety/publications/chem/en/lowlevel_may1995.pdf

25. Concepts, U. S. E. P. A. *Methods, and Data Sources for Cumulative Health Risk Assessment of Multiple Chemicals, Exposures and Effects. A Resource Document* (US Environmental Protection Agency Washington, DC), 2007.

26. WHO & Joint FAO/WHO consultation on food consumption and exposure assessment to chemicals in food. Geneva, Switzerland. Available from: http://www.who.int/foodsafety/publications/chem/exposure_feb1997/en/index.html (1997)

27. MHPRC (Ministry of Health of the People’s Republic of China). *Maximum levels of contaminants in foods (GB2762-2017)* (MHPRC, Beijing, China, 2017). (In Chinese)

28. Liang, G. *et al.* Analysis of heavy metals in foodstuffs and an assessment of the health risks to the general public via consumption in Beijing, China. *International journal of environmental research and public health*, **16**, 909 (2019).

29. Abbas, M. *et al.* Public health risk of heavy metal residues in meat and edible organs of broiler in an intensive production system of a region in Pakistan. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 26*, 23002–23009 (2019).

30. Barone, G. *et al.* Trace Metals in Pork Meat Products Marketed in Italy: Occurrence and Health Risk Characterization.Biological Trace Element Research,1–11(2020)

31. Aendo, P. *et al.* Pb, cd, and cu play a major role in health risk from contamination in duck meat and offal for food production in Thailand.Biological Trace Element Research,1–10(2020)

32. Hu, Y., Zhang, W., Chen, G., Cheng, H. & Tao, S. Public health risk of trace metals in fresh chicken meat products on the food markets of a major production region in southern China. *Environmental pollution*, **234**, 667–676 (2018).

33. Hashemi, M. Heavy metal concentrations in bovine tissues (muscle, liver and kidney) and their relationship with heavy metal contents in consumed feed. *Ecotoxicology and environmental safety, 154*, 263–267 (2018).
34. Cang, L., Wang, Y., Zhou, D. & Dong, Y.-h. Heavy metals pollution in poultry and livestock feeds and manures under intensive farming in Jiangsu Province, China. Journal of Environmental Sciences 16, 371-374 (2004).

35. Zhang, F., Li, Y., Yang, M. & Li, W. Content of heavy metals in animal feeds and manures from farms of different scales in northeast China. International journal of environmental research and public health, 9, 2658–2668 (2012).

36. Attia, Y. et al. Effect of different dietary concentrations of inorganic and organic copper on growth performance and lipid metabolism of White Pekin male ducks. Br. Poult. Sci, 53, 77–88 (2012).

37. Chen, C. et al. Evaluation of pesticide residues in fruits and vegetables from Xiamen, China., 22, 1114–1120 (2011).

38. Osman, K. A., Al-Humaid, A., Al-Rehiayani, S. & Al-Redhaiman, K. Estimated daily intake of pesticide residues exposure by vegetables grown in greenhouses in Al-Qassim region, Saudi Arabia., 22, 947–953 (2011).

Tables

Table 1 Determination of certified reference materials (n=6)

| Element | GBW10018 Chicken | GBW10051 Pork liver |
|---------|------------------|---------------------|
| Certified mg/kg | Measured mg/kg | Certified mg/kg | Measured mg/kg |
| As      | 0.109±0.013 | 0.099±0.021 | 1.4±0.3 | 1.5±0.2 |
| Cd      | - | - | 1.00±0.07 | 0.98±0.06 |
| Hg      | 0.0036±0.0015 | 0.0039±0.0018 | 0.045±0.008 | 0.049±0.011 |
| Pb      | 0.11±0.02 | 0.10±0.04 | 0.12±0.03 | 0.11±0.06 |
| Cu      | 1.46±0.12 | 1.36±0.22 | 52±3 | 50±6 |
| Cr      | 0.59±0.11 | 0.55±0.17 | 0.23±0.06 | 0.19±0.09 |
| Ni      | 0.15±0.03 | 0.11±0.08 | - | - |

Table 2 The concentration of heavy metals in meat samples from Zhejiang province (mg/kg fresh weight)

| Element | n | Mean | P97.5 | Range | MAC | No. of > MAC | LOD |
|---------|---|------|-------|-------|-----|-------------|-----|
| As      | 1066 | 0.018 | 0.11 | 3.2 | 0.5 | 1 | 0.003 |
| Cd      | 1063 | 0.002 | 0.013 | 0.089 | 0.1 | 0 | 0.001 |
| Cr      | 1066 | 0.061 | 0.318 | 0.996 | 1 | 0 | 0.005 |
| Cu      | 1062 | 0.001 | 4.09 | 9.81 | - | - | 0.005 |
| Hg      | 1066 | 0.0038 | 0.0252 | 0.076 | 0.05 | 2 | 0.0003 |
| Ni      | 1066 | 0.055 | 0.42 | 1.4 | - | - | 0.004 |
| Pb      | 1060 | 0.029 | 0.18 | 0.536 | 0.2 | 10 | 0.004 |

a Target analytes with concentrations lower than LOD were treated as one-half of LOD when calculating the mean values.

b Maximum allowable concentrations of contaminants in foods.

Table 3 Comparison of different metals in meat with some previous reports
| Meat type | Area                | N  | Mean level (mg/kg fresh weight) | References               |
|-----------|---------------------|----|---------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Pork      | Italy (meat products) | 100 | Cr 0.15-0.23; Cd 0.01-0.03; Hg 0.01-0.02; Cu 1.08-1.21; Pb 0.22-0.38 | Barone et al., 30, Liang et al., 28 |
|           | Beijing, China      |    | Cr 0.483; Cd 0.003; Pb 0.029; As 0.043; Hg 0.015 |                          |
|           | Zhejiang, China     | 511 | Cr 0.062; Cd 0.002; Pb 0.058; As 0.020; Hg 0.004; Cu 0.633; Ni 0.058 | This study               |
| Beef      | Beijing, China      |    | Cr 0.504; Cd 0.015; Pb 0.201; As 0.077; Hg 0.010 | Liang et al., 28, Hashemi 33 |
|           | Iran                | 72  | Cd 0.028; Cd 0.028; Hg 0.003 |                          |
|           | Zhejiang, China     | 184 | Cr 0.062; Cd 0.002; Pb 0.061; As 0.018; Hg 0.004; Cu 0.673; Ni 0.061 | This study               |
| Mutton    | Beijing, China      |    | Cr 0.654; Cd 0.031; Pb 0.128; As 0.008; Hg 0.005 | Liang et al., 2019 28, This study |
|           | Zhejiang, China     | 47  | Cr 0.045; Cd 0.002; Pb 0.061; As 0.008; Hg 0.003; Cu 0.956; Ni 0.061 |                          |
| Chicken   | Beijing, China      |    | Cr 0.650; Cd 0.031; Pb 0.291; As 0.045; Hg 0.017 | Liang et al., 28, Hu et al., 32 |
|           | Guangzhou, China    | 30  | Cr 0.11; Cd 0.002; Pb 0.073; As 0.029; Cu 0.757; Ni 0.069 |                          |
|           | (Drumstick)         |    |                                |                          |
|           | Pakistan            | 60  | Cd 0.017; Pb 0.16; Ni 0.39 |                          |
|           | Zhejiang, China     | 250 | Cr 0.060; Cd 0.003; Pb 0.058; As 0.018; Hg 0.004; Cu 0.535; Ni 0.042 | This study               |
| Duck      | Thailand            | 90  | Pb 3.13 (dry wet); Cd 0.33 (dry wet); Cu 15.28 (dry wet) | Aendo et al., 31, This study |
|           | Zhejiang, China     | 74  | Cr 0.073; Cd 0.003; Pb 0.058; As 0.014; Hg 0.004; Cu 3.1; Ni 0.047 |                          |

**Table 4** Pearson correlations of the heavy metal pollutants in the meat samples.

|     | As    | Cd    | Cr    | Cu    | Hg    | Ni    | Pb    |
|-----|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| As  | 1     |       |       |       |       |       |       |
| Cd  | 0.1039| 1     |       |       |       |       |       |
| Cr  | 0.1096| 0.5807| 1     |       |       |       |       |
| Cu  | -0.0685| **-0.6515** | -0.3624| 1     |       |       |       |
| Hg  | 0.1041| **0.9141** | 0.5752 | -0.5708| 1     |       |       |
| Ni  | 0.0672| 0.5181 | 0.4162 | -0.2900| 0.5052| 1     |       |
| Pb  | 0.0981| **0.9504** | 0.5695 | **-0.6101** | **0.8837** | 0.5010| 1     |

**Table 5** Estimated exposure to As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb for the general population in livestock and poultry meats from Zhejiang province and the health risk assessment
| Element | Safe value μg/kg bw/day | Exposure Dose μg/kg bw/day | Targeted hazard quotient (THQ) | Hazard index (HI) |
|---------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------|
|         | Mean  | P97.5 | Mean  | P97.5 | Mean  | P97.5 |
| As      | 3.0   | 0.034 | 0.207 | 0.011 | 0.069 | 0.146 |
| Cd      | 0.8   | 0.004 | 0.024 | 0.005 | 0.031 | 0.000 |
| Cr      | 3000  | 0.115 | 0.598 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |
| Cu      | 40    | 1.507 | 7.696 | 0.038 | 0.192 | 0.339 |
| Hg      | 0.14  | 0.007 | 0.047 | 0.051 | 0.339 | 0.040 |
| Ni      | 20    | 0.103 | 0.790 | 0.005 | 0.040 | 0.000 |
| Pb      | 1.5   | 0.055 | 0.339 | 0.036 | 0.226 | 0.000 |

**Figures**

![Map of Zhejiang province with sampling sites](image-url)
The simple map of sampling areas in Zhejiang province of China

**Figure 2**

The levels of heavy metals (As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, and Pb in different meats