Comparison of Morocco, Egypt, Turkey, and Tunisia Traditional Settlement as Muslim City and Kampung Naga Settlement as Indonesian Traditional Settlement in Perspective Form of Entrance

Y Pratiwi 1,2
1 Department of Architecture, Islamic University of Indonesia, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
2 Fatih Sultan Mehmet Vakıf Üniversitesi, Istanbul, Turkey
E-mail: yulia.pratiwi@uii.ac.id

Abstract. Settlement in Muslim city consists of forms of entrance or form of submission. There are control, use, and ownership. Therefore the purpose of this study is to compare by examining responsibility and control in the form of entrance perspective in the form of ownership, control, and use in both traditional settlements in Muslim cities and Kampung Naga. This research used descriptive comparative method because to know between the form of entrance of traditional settlements in Muslim cities and traditional settlements in Kampung Naga. The conclusion of this research are (1) based on the cases of form of entrance in Muslim settlement in Muslim city, the most ideal form of entrance is the unified form because applied Islamic legal system or shari’ah; (2) residents of Kampung Naga are the owner, user, and controller of settlement. Traditional settlements in Kampung Naga have a unified form of entrance where this is the ideal form in the Islamic legal system. Every resident have same rights or huquq. Even though in reality Kampung Naga is not a Muslim village, but Kampung Naga can be an example of the application of justice for all citizens to be able to control, own, and use in Indonesia.

1. Introduction
The background of this research is the result of a study of the book by Jamel Akbar in 1998 the first edition and the second edition in 2021 with the title "Crisis in The Built Environment: The Case of Muslim City". This book discusses the characteristics of Muslim settlements in the past, forms of waqf, the rights received by residents in Muslim cities known as huquq, responsibility in the Muslim settlements, synthesis of forms of submission (ownership, control, and use), growth and formation of towns, and freedom and control in the settlement of Muslim city. Form of submission can be interpreted as form of entrance. This book provides examples of Muslim settlements in the past in Muslim countries on the West Asian continent namely Saudi Arabia; the continent of North Africa namely Tunisia, Algeria, Morocco; and countries on two continents, namely Turkey and Egypt, and etc.

Based on Akbar (2021), for example, the form of responsibility. Through the pattern, responsibility determines the structure of the environment and influences it. In this book, the pattern of responsibility in the traditional environment is different from the current pattern of responsibility both socialist and capitalist and affects all aspects of the built environment. Traditional settlement in muslim cities applied Islamic Legal System or Shari’ah and all residents have the same responsibility and same rights (huquq) in using, owning, and controlling objects or properties in the built environment. To give some examples, traditional patterns of responsibility affect the conventions of form-making, the territorial structure of
cities, the potential for the physical environment, social relations between residents, the economy, and the building industry. From the aspect of control over settlements in Muslim cities. Control is under the authority of the residents, not under the authority of the state. For example, control of residents living in dead-end areas. The dead end is an example of the pattern of responsibility that prevails in traditional Muslim circles. Residents in dead-end areas legally own and control their path. However, control is not only carried out by residents who are in dead-end areas, but can also be carried out by other residents without requiring the consent of all residents.

Indonesian traditional settlements which historically were formed due to elements of acculturation of Indonesian culture with several religions, namely Islam, Hinduism, and Buddhism, have values and norms in life. These values and norms are used as guidelines for behavior in traditional settlements. Values and norms greatly affect the character and form of traditional settlements, the responsibility for managing traditional settlements, and controlling traditional settlements.

Traditional Indonesian society, which has values and norms that apply to local customs, has similarities with traditional settlements in Muslim cities in terms of responsibility and control over the use of settlements. Indonesian traditional communities have full responsibility and control, even the state gives authority to indigenous peoples to control local settlements. The Indonesian people who still maintain the values and norms of their ancestors are the Kampung Naga people in West Java. The people of Kampung Naga Village, who maintain local values and norms, influence the form of responsibility and control over their settlements. The Kampung Naga settlement was chosen as the object of research that represents traditional settlements in Indonesia. The reason for choosing the Kampung Naga settlement is the preservation of customs, values, and norms that are still applied today, both in terms of behavior in living and structuring housing and settlements.

The existence of similarities in terms of community responsibility and control over settlements between traditional settlements in Muslim cities and traditional Indonesian settlements, this is the background for the need for further research. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to compare by examining the responsibility and control in the form of entrance perspective in the form of ownership, control, and use in both traditional settlements in Muslim cities and traditional settlements in Indonesia, especially in Kampung Naga Village.

2. Literature Review

2.1. The Meaning of Submission and Submission in Architecture and Built Environment

Submission has several meanings. According to Meriam Webster's dictionary (2021), submission has 4 meanings, namely:

- Legal agreement to submit to the decision of arbitrators
- An act of submitting something (as for consideration or inspection); also something submitted (such as a manuscript)
- The condition of being submissive, humble, or compliant
- An act of submitting to the authority or control of another

The meaning of the form of submission can also be said as a form of entrance. The form of entrance or submission in architecture and built environment is a synthesis of two concepts. These concepts are the concept of claims and the concept of parties in the built environment. The concept of claims is based on the plurality of owning, using, and controlling an object or property in the built environment. The concept of parties is the decision made by a party is based on the interaction of norms, values, instinctive, cognitive, motivations, cultural, psychological, traditional, social, and religious factors. All of these factors converge in a specific decision. From the point of view of the property in the built environment not the persons but property can be owned by one party only. The same notion applies to control. Property is controlled by one party only for example the decision to transform a vehicular street into a pedestrian mall is a single decision. Decision-makers and residents may disagree, but ultimately the decision must be made by the controlling party whether or not to transform the street (Akbar, 2021). Therefore based on the book of Akbar (Crisis in The Built Environment: The Case of Muslim City), the
word "Submission" in the built environment is a term used as a manifestation of claims and parties in the scope of use, ownership, and control in the built environment.

2.2. Form of Entrance
According to Akbar (1998 and 2021), there are 5 forms of entrance. They are:

- Unified Form of Entrance
  The first form of entrance is called Unified Form. This form of entrance occurs when the same party controls, owns, and uses the property. In this case, the party only deals with itself. The individual who both uses the house and owns it does not need permission to change things in the house.

- Dispersed Form of Entrance
  The second form of entrance is called Dispersed Form. The Dispersed Form occurs when a property is shared by three independent parties: one party owns the property, the second controls it and the third uses it. Therefore in this situation, that is called the dispersed form, each party must deal and communicate with the other two parties. An example is an endowment (waqf) whose assets are dedicated to God, not human property, controlled by an appointed trustee, and used by third parties such as elderly people.

- Trusteeship Form of Entrance
  Trusteeship Form occurs when the party who controls the property has to deal with the party who uses and owns it, such as the trustee of the property of the orphan who lives in it.

- Possessives Form of Entrance
  In the Possessive Form, the party who controls and uses a property must deal with the party who owns the property, such as a farmer who inhabits and cultivates the land belonging to his lord.

- Permissive Form of Entrance
  Permissive Form is formed when a property is shared by two independent parties. This division can take three different forms, depending on the relationship between the claims and the parties. In the Permissive Form, the party using the property must deal with the parties who control and own the property, such as the tenants of the rented apartment and the owners.

![Five Forms of Entrance](image)

Figure 1. Five Forms of Entrance \(\text{\textcopyright Akbar, 2021}\)

2.3. Control of The Property
Control of the property means the exercise of dominion over the property and includes, but is not limited to, taking, carrying away, or possessing the property, or selling, conveying, or transferring title to or an interest [3].

3. Materials and Methods
The research method used is descriptive comparative. This research used descriptive comparative because to know between the form of entrance of traditional settlements in Muslim cities especially in Morocco, Egypt, Turkey, Tunisia, and traditional settlements in Kampung Naga Indonesia. The data collection method uses a literature study, namely to obtain form of entrance data for traditional settlements in Muslim cities in the first edition of Jamel Akbar's book (in 1998) and second (in 2021).
Meanwhile, to obtain form of entrance data in the traditional settlements of Kampung Naga using a secondary study method by searching for information through the internet and books about the characters of the form of entrance in the Kampung Naga settlement. The main variable in this study is to examine the form of entrance with three indicators. These indicators are use, ownership, and control in traditional settlements in Muslim cities (Morocco, Egypt, Turkey, Tunisia) and traditional settlements in Kampung Naga, Indonesia.

4. Results and Discussion

4.1. Form of Entrance in The Traditional Settlements in Muslim Cities (Morocco, Egypt, Turkey, Tunisia)

The first case occurred in a muslim traditional settlement in Morocco. Figure 2 shows that there is ownership, control and use by the Moroccan population. In this photo, it shows the use of part of the dead end by the residents by building a wall. Because the ownership, user, and control are under the residents, then this case is a case of unified form of entrance.

![Figure 2. Unified Forms of Entrance in Morocco](Akbar, 2021)

The second case can be found in Turkey. In the days of the Ottoman Empire, many fountains were built. The fountain comes from waqf. Waqf is an institution that is common in the Muslim world and is often found in the form of dispersed entrance. Therefore fountains as dispersed form of entrance.

![Figure 3. The Fountain and Sebil of Sultan Ahmed III as Dispersed Forms of Entrance in Turkey](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sebil_(fountain))

![Figure 4. Sabil-Kuttab of Katkhuda, Cairo Egypt, built in 1744](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sebil_(fountain))
The third form of entrance is the permissive form of entrance. This section looks at the case of settlements in Tunisia. In the traditional settlement in Muslim city, discharging rainwater is considered an easement right. Rainwater ows from a roof to another. The first revivor has the right to drain water and the next revivor.

Figure 5. Rainwater system in Tunisia as system was in the hands of users who own it, but did not cost society much \{Akbar, 2021\}.

The fourth form of entrance is possessive form. Based on Akbar, 2021 the possessive form is also shared by two parties. One party uses and controls, the other owns the property. Although the association between ownership and control is the natural state of properties, if the owner is not capable, not allowed, or not interested in exercising control, then it may shift to the user. It is generally the remoteness of owners from the property which characterizes this form of entrance. The owner who does not control his property is usually the authority, as with agricultural lands owned by the state but controlled and used by the farmers or places in markets that are owned by all Muslims collectively but are controlled and used by merchants. In Morocco, the spaces outside the shops are used and controlled by the merchants. They have to follow the rules of not building things that narrow the street.

Figure 6. Possessive Form in Morocco \{Akbar, 2021\}.

The fifth form of entrance is trusteeship form. The Trusteeship form is both rare and unstable. In this form, two parties share the property. One controls it only, the other uses and owns it, like a resident of a house who owns it and yet cannot make decisions about it. It is known among Muslim jurists as h i j r , which means preventing a person from manipulating his own property for some reason (Akbar, 2021).

4.2. Form of Entrance in The Indonesian Traditional Settlement (A Case of Kampung Naga Village) Kampung Naga Village is a traditional village whose people still hold on to the traditions of their ancestors. They refuse intervention from outside parties if it interferes and destroys the sustainability of the village. There is a local genius whose existence can still be seen for example Kampung Naga settlement locations that do not move, do not increase, and do not decrease. This is considered by the locals as a norm that must be maintained to this day. To maintain the size of the village location related to population growth, it was overcome by the release of young family members from the village of Kampung Naga out of Kampung Naga. However, in traditional ceremonies, Kampung Naga residents that live outside Kampung Naga are still involved. The residents of Kampung Naga Village are all Muslim but they are also very obedient to the customs and beliefs of their ancestors. Even though they claim to embrace Islam, they still maintain their ancestral cultural heritage. According to the belief of the people of Kampung Naga, by carrying out the
customs of the ancestral heritage means respecting the ancestors. Everything that does not come from the teachings of the Kampung Naga ancestors and anything that the ancestors do not do is considered taboo. If these things are done by the people of Kampung Naga, it means violating customs, not respecting their ancestors, this will surely cause havoc.

Kampung Naga Village is a village that is unique in terms of customs and culture. In addition, in the perspective of the form of entrance, Kampung Naga Village is interesting to examine in detail both from the aspect of ownership, control, and use. Kampung Naga village community is a party that as owner, controller and user. The following is a study of the form of entrance in Kampung Naga as traditional village in Indonesia.

Figure 7. Kampung Naga Village

4.2.1. Ownership. The ancestor of the Kampung Naga people who passed down the descendants and customs of the Kampung Naga was Si Singaparna. Until now, the status of the land is customary land whose ownership is owned by all residents of Kampung Naga Village. Therefore ownership of land and dwellings belongs to the residents of Kampung Naga, it is not allowed for residents from another village live in Kampung Naga. The residents of Kampung Naga have an area of 1.5 hectares consisting of 111 buildings, ponds, rice fields, plantations and forests.

4.2.2. Control. The control of the Kampung Naga village is entirely by the Kampung Naga village community. Control in this case, the community is guided by the norms that have existed since their ancestors. The norms controlling in the level of macro space (land use), micro space (house/building) and life style.

Control in the number of buildings

In 2021, the population of Kampung Naga Village is 325 people and there are 111 buildings. The population of the Kampung Naga village is allowed to increase or decrease but these 111 buildings may not increase or decrease, consisting of 108 houses and 3 buildings consisting of mosques and 2 community halls. In 1921 there were 7 houses and in 1936 there were 40 houses, and then since 1994 the building can not increase and decrease.
Control in the use of electricity and electronics

What makes this village unique is the village policy that refuses modernization. They all live as they are without electricity. The use of electronics such as television, radio is not permitted, but in 2012 according to an agreement all residents of Kampung Naga were allowed. However, until now, only a few houses have televisions powered by batteries. They also do not use other electronics such as gas stoves, refrigerators, and other electronic devices.

Figure 10. Kitchen in Kampung Naga Village [https://direktori-wisata.com/wisata-kampung-naga-garut-di-lembah-perbukitan-garut-jawa-barat/]

Control in the use of furnitures in Kampung Naga house
The house should not be equipped with furniture, such as chairs, tables, and beds.

Figure 11. Living room in Kampung Naga Village [https://direktori-wisata.com/wisata-kampung-naga-garut-di-lembah-perbukitan-garut-jawa-barat/]

Control in building regulations
The houses must lined up neatly and must face north or south by extending from east to west following the direction of the sun. The house must a stage made of bamboo and wood. The walls of the house must be made of woven bamboo. The house can not be painted, but it can be whitewashed. The roof of the house must be made of palm leaves, fibers or reeds. The floor must be made of bamboo or wooden boards.

Figure 12. Control in building regulation in Kampung Naga Village [https://idea.grid.id/read/09913705/tak-hanya-tahan-gempa-4-fakta-menarik-rumah-ador-adiad-kampung-naga?page=all]
Control in land use regulations
There is a clean area that is used for residents' houses, and a dirty area that is used for bathing which is shared by residents. No bathroom in every house. The house is not allowed to have a bathroom inside the house.

Figure 13. Bathroom and toilets above fish pond in Kampung Naga Village
{http://tjuputography.com/tasikmalaya-the-crazy-adventure.html}

4.2.3. Use. In Kampung Naga Village, the residents of Kampung Naga jointly plant food in the fields and gardens owned by the community. The harvest is divided among all the residents of the Kampung Naga Village. Residents cultivate crops and raise livestock for their own consumption or for sale to other villages. Residents of Kampung Naga are drying their agricultural products in the form of grain (seeds from the rice plant). This grain is dried in the sun and then ground into rice and the rice becomes food for the residents of Kampung Naga themselves. To meet the clean water needs of Kampung Naga Village, it is obtained from clean water from Mount Cikuray which flows into Kampung Naga Village. Residents of Kampung Naga Village can take water freely because water is one of the natural resources that is shared by the whole of community. Residents who are entitled to continue living in Kampung Naga are residents who are married to fellow residents of Kampung Naga Village. Kampung Naga residents who marry people outside the Kampung Naga Village will live outside the Kampung Naga Village. Therefore, the users of the Kampung Naga Village are the original residents of the Kampung Naga Village.

Figure 14. The land can be used by all residents of Kampung Naga
{http://ar-magz.blogspot.com/2016/05/blog-post.html}

Figure 15. Form of entrance in the Kampung Naga settlement
Ownership: The status of land and houses is owned by the residents of Kampung Naga Village.
Control: Control is in the hands of the people of Kampung Naga based on the traditional norms of Kampung Naga Village.
Use: All land and houses can be used by the indigenous people of Kampung Naga who live in Kampung Naga Village.

Based on this analysis, the type of form of entrance of Kampung Naga traditional settlement is unified form. Kampung Naga community as the main actors in holding control, ownership and users. Kampung Naga community is the party that owns, controls, and uses the property (land and houses), it is the Kampung Naga community who has the responsibility and role in maintaining the condition of the property in Kampung Naga Village.

Table 1. Comparison of Traditional Settlement in Muslim City and Kampung Naga Traditional Settlement

| Form of entrance (ownership, use, and control) of traditional settlement in muslim cities | Form of entrance (ownership, use, and control) in Kampung Naga settlement |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| **Morocco** (The use of part of the dead end by the residents by building a wall. The ownershp, user, and control are under the residents, then this case is a case of unified form. In Morocco, there is also the spaces outside the shops are used and controlled by the merchants. They have to follow the rules of not building things that narrow the street and then this case is a case of possessive form because in this case we found that one party uses and controls, the other owns the property) | **Kampung Naga** (Ownership: The status of land and houses is owned by the residents of Kampung Naga Village. Control: Control of settlement is in the hands of the people of Kampung Naga based on the traditional norms of Kampung Naga Village. Use: All land and houses in Kampung Naga can be used by the indigenous people of Kampung Naga who live in Kampung Naga. Therefore the type of form of entrance of Kampung Naga traditional settlement is unified form) |
| **Turkey and Egypt** (Many fountains were built. The fountain comes from waqf. Fountains as dispersed form) | |
| **Tunisia** (In the traditional settlement in muslim city, discharging rainwater is considered an easement right. Rainwater owns from a roof to another. The first revivor has the right to drain water and the next reviver. Then this case is a permissive form) | |

Historically, most rural lands were governed and owned by Indigenous and local communities. People under systems of customary tenure. However, over time, most of these lands have also been claimed by states under the statutory law. In many of the so called as developed world or developed countries this assertion of state claims has led to the reallocation of community lands to households and companies as private property, although public ownership remains important in some countries. In developing countries, states often continue to assert direct claims to community lands, resulting in a situation of overlapping claims to lands that extend over large areas of the world to this day (Rights and Resources Initiative, 2015). From
Rights and Resources Initiative (RRI), we can compare that at present, land and the built environment are claimed as state property. This is contrary to the Islamic legal system that land is owned by everyone because everyone has the same rights or *huquq* which can be seen in the case of traditional settlements in Morocco with a unified form. But uniquely, it turns out that currently there are still settlements that indirectly have the same concept as the Islamic legal system, namely the concept of customs, values, and norms that are applied to the case of traditional settlements of Kampung Naga located in Indonesia.

5. Conclusion

In the Islamic legal system (Shari’ah), the most ideal and desirable form of entrance is the unified form. From the data and analysis that has been done, it can be concluded that in settlements in Muslim cities, there are 5 types of form of entrance. They are Unified Form, Dispersed Form, Trusteeship Form, Possessives Form, and Permissive Form. But based on the cases of form of entrance in muslim settlement in muslim city, the most ideal form of entrance is the unified form because applied Islamic legal system and all residents have the same responsibility and same rights “*huquq*”. The traditional settlements in Kampung Naga have a unified form of entrance where this is the ideal form in the Islamic legal system. Even though in reality Kampung Naga is not a Muslim village, but Kampung Naga can be an example of the application of justice for all citizens to be able to control, own, and use.

Acknowledgments

The author gratefully acknowledge financial support and motivation from Department of Architecture, Faculty of Civil Engineering and Planning, Islamic University of Indonesia so this research can be completed. In addition, author would like to thank Professor Jamel Akbar, Ph.D who has given many lectures discussing form of submission/ entrance based on the book Crisis in The Built Environment in postgraduate degree course in the Architecture Program at Fatih Sultan Mehmet Vakıf Üniversitesi in the spring 2021 period.

References

[1] Akbar Jamel 1998 *Crisis in The Built Environment The Case of The Muslim City First Edition* (Singapore: Concept Media)
[2] Akbar Jamel 2021 *Crisis in The Built Environment The Case of The Muslim City Second Edition* (Turkey: Insan)
[3] Rights and Resources Initiative. 2015. Who Owns the World’s Land? A global baseline of formally recognized indigenous and community land rights. (Washington, DC: RRI)
[4] https://www.lawinsider.com/dictionary/control-over-the-property (Retrieved August 14, 2021)
[5] https://nationalgeographic.grid.id/read/131251907/menyepi-dari-dunia-modern-dan-teknologi-di-kampung-naga-tasikmalaya?page=all (Retrieved June 15, 2021)
[6] https://idea.grid.id/read/09913705/tak-hanya-tahan-gempa-4-fakta-menarik-rumah-adat-kampung-naga?page=all (Retrieved June 15, 2021)
[7] https://www.republika.co.id/berita/ovys6b314/potret-kampung-naga-2 (Retrieved June 15, 2021)
[8] https://tindaktandukarsitek.com/2013/10/15/kampung-naga-dalam-uraian-uriya/ (Retrieved on June 15, 2021)
[9] https://direktori-wisata.com/wisata-kampung-naga-garut-di-lembah-perbukitan-garut-jawa-barat/ (Retrieved June 15, 2021)
[10] http://tjuputography.com/tasikmalaya-the-crazy-adventure.html (Retrieved June 15, 2021)
[11] http://ar-magz.blogspot.com/2016/05/blog-post.html (Retrieved June 15, 2021)
[12] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sebil_(fountain) (Retrieved August 14, 2021)
[13] Merriam-Webster. (n.d.) Submission. In *Merriam-Webster.com dictionary*. Retrieved August 29, 2021, from https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/submission