Efficacy and hypnotic effects of melatonin in shift-work nurses: double-blind, placebo-controlled crossover trial
Khosro Sadeghniiat-Haghhighi*, Omid Aminian, Gholamreza Pouryaghoub and Zohreh Yazdi

Address: Baharloo Hospital, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran
Email: Khosro Sadeghniiat-Haghhighi* - sadeghniiat@tums.ac.ir; Omid Aminian - oaminian@tums.ac.ir; Gholamreza Pouryaghoub - pourya@tums.ac.ir; Zohreh Yazdi - zohrehyazdi@yahoo.com
* Corresponding author

Abstract

Background: Night work is associated with disturbed sleep and wakefulness, particularly in relation to the night shift. Circadian rhythm sleep disorders are characterized by complaints of insomnia and excessive daytime sleepiness that are primarily due to alterations in the internal circadian timing system or a misalignment between the timing of sleep and the 24-h social and physical environment.

Methods: We evaluated the effect of oral intake of 5 mg melatonin taken 30 minutes before night time sleep on insomnia parameters as well as subjective sleep onset latency, number of awakenings, and duration of sleep. A double-blind, randomized, placebo-controlled crossover study with periods of 1 night and washouts of 4 days comparing melatonin with placebo tablets was conducted. We tried to improve night-time sleep during recovery from night work. Participants were 86 shift-worker nurses aged 24 to 46 years. Each participant completed a questionnaire immediately after awakening.

Results: Sleep onset latency was significantly reduced while subjects were taking melatonin as compared with both placebo and baseline. There was no evidence that melatonin altered total sleep time (as compared with baseline total sleep time). No adverse effects of melatonin were noted during the treatment period.

Conclusion: Melatonin may be an effective treatment for shift workers with difficulty falling asleep.

Background

There is substantial evidence that the prevalence of sleep disorders is an important occupational health problem, especially among health care professionals on night or on rotating work shifts [1-10]. An important aspect of the work environment of nurses is that they are required to work at any point in the 24 hour day [11]. Night work is associated with disturbed sleep and impaired alertness. The impact of sleep is the result of the circadian interference with sleep during daylight hours and circadian suppression of pineal gland by light at night [12].

The definition of insomnia is a complaint of disturbed sleep, manifested as difficulties in sleep initiation, sleep maintenance, early morning awakenings, or nonrestorative sleep. Many sources also add the presence of associa-
Consenting participants were randomized to one of two sequences: placebo followed by melatonin or melatonin followed by placebo. The randomization list was completed using a random number generator. The treatment phase of each sequence consisted of taking a 5 mg tablet of melatonin about 30 minutes before habitual nighttime sleep. The placebo phase consisted of taking an identical looking placebo on the same schedule. Both melatonin and placebo were taken on the first night after night work. All participants had 3 visits to the hospital. At the first visit, eligibility was checked, participants gave informed consent, and baseline insomnia parameters were assessed by using seven questions [32]. Participants were asked to scale their difficulties in falling asleep, staying asleep and waking up too early with scores from 1 (no problem) to 5 (very severe problem). They were also asked to specify their sleep quality (satisfaction with their sleep) using scores from 1 (very satisfied) to 5 (very unsatisfied) and were asked to answer the following three questions about their habitual night time sleep: 1) How long does it take you to fall asleep? 2) How many times do you wake up during the night? 3) How many hours do you sleep?

All the participants who reported sleep problems in the baseline questionnaire were included in the study. In the first visit, one placebo or one melatonin was given to the nurses. They were asked to use it at home on the first night after shift work, about 30 minutes before their intended sleep. On the following morning, upon awakening, each participant answered the questionnaire. In the second visit, after the 4 days of washout and receiving their completed questionnaire, patients entered into another study period, conducted as in the first. In the third visit, the last completed questionnaire was received from nurses.

**Data Analysis**

We used SPSS 11.5 for Windows for statistical analysis. When the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test confirmed normality, parametric tests were conducted. One-way analysis of variance was used to determine the statistical significance of subjective scores of insomnia from each phase of the trial. Statistically significant results detected by analysis of variance (p < 0.05) were further analyzed by using Tukey post hoc paired comparisons. Results in the text are expressed as mean +/- standard deviation.

**Results**

Eighty-six out of 118 participants completed the study. Eleven subjects dropped out during the first treatment phase because they could not attend the scheduled tablet taking, whereas one did not complete the second treatment phase because of an acute illness unrelated to the study protocol. Twenty participants did not report sleeping problems in the baseline questionnaire. Table 1 presents a description of the 86 subjects who completed
the study. Females accounted for 80.2% of the participants, and the mean age was 30.05 years (range: 24–46 years). Subjective parameters of sleep obtained from the baseline questionnaire are shown in Table 1.

Differences in sleep data at baseline, while taking placebo, and while taking melatonin are shown in Tables 2 and 3. Subjective sleep onset latency (SOL) was 37.5 +/- 41.3 minutes at the baseline. There was evidence of an effect of melatonin treatment on SOL. Specifically, the mean SOL for subjects being treated with melatonin was significantly lower than the mean SOL for subjects given placebo. Furthermore, means for both the subjects given melatonin and those given placebo were significantly different from the baseline mean (see Table 2). Although melatonin treatment did not significantly alter other insomnia variables compared with baseline values, there was a significant improvement in sleep quality with melatonin treatment (see Table 3).

**Discussion**

In 86 shift-work nurses with insomnia disorders, administration of 5 mg of melatonin about 30 minutes before a night time sleep significantly decreased sleep onset latency (SOL) and increased sleep quality as compared to baseline, which supports the well known capacity of this hormone to change biological rhythms [33-36].

Placebo was not equal to baseline for SOL. A general meta-analysis of placebo effects pointed to a nonsignificant beneficial effect on sleep latency (a 10-min decrease in subjective estimates of sleep latency) in five clinical trials [37]. Melatonin did not alter the other sleep parameters that we measured. These findings are in accordance with those of earlier open trials using smaller numbers of subjects [38,39].

The focus of our analysis was a comparison of assessment of insomnia parameters (sleep onset, sleep maintenance, sleep quality) in nurses with shift working at baseline, after a one-night melatonin treatment, and after a one-night placebo treatment. Our study revealed no major impact of melatonin on difficulty staying asleep or waking up too early. Our results agree with a previous investigation suggesting that patients with primary insomnia have a pathophysiologic disturbance that is not reversed by melatonin [40]. No adverse effects of melatonin were noted during the treatment.

The fact that we observed a reduction in SOL but no change in sleep duration after melatonin administration has at least two possible explanations: either 1) melatonin caused a small (16 min) phase advance of the circadian system or 2) random variation obscured a correspondingly small lengthening of total sleep time. Our data do not provide the basis for favoring either one or the other of these alternatives.

A limitation of this study is that we were unable to perform polysomnography or actigraphy to evaluate sleep parameters objectively. Our results based on subjective self-reports were, however, very encouraging. Regarding

| Table 1: Demographic and subjective sleep data of subjects (N = 86) |
|---------------------------------------------------------------|
|                  | Mean (SD) or percentage (n)                          |
| Sex              | 80.2% female (69)                                   |
| Age              | 30.05 (5.2)                                        |
| Mean BMI in kg/m2 | 26.7 (3.1)                                         |
| Subjective sleep onset latency in min | 37.5 (41.3)                              |
| Subjective number of awakenings | 5.2 (2.1)                                 |
| Subjective duration of sleep in min | 450.5 (82.3)                           |

| Table 2: Subjective sleep parameters during a randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled crossover study of shift work nurses: results at baseline and after 1 night melatonin or placebo treatment (N = 86) |
|---------------------------------------------------------------|
|                  | Mean     | SD      | P(vs.baseline\(^a\)) | P(vs.placebo\(^a\)) | F\(^b\) | P\(^b\) |
| Sleep onset latency | Melatonin | 21.5    | 17.7    | < 0.05            | < 0.05 | 6.3   | 0.01 |
|                     | Placebo  | 49.7    | 30.3    | < 0.05            |        |       |      |
|                     | Baseline | 37.5    | 41.3    |                    |        |       |      |
| Total sleep time    | Melatonin | 392.1   | 52.4    | > 0.05            | > 0.05 | 0.49  | NS  |
|                     | Placebo  | 372     | 49.4    | > 0.05            |        |       |      |
|                     | Baseline | 450.5   | 82.3    |                    |        |       |      |
| Number of awakenings| Melatonin | 5.1     | 1.9     | > 0.05            | > 0.05 | 0.64  | NS  |
|                     | Placebo  | 5.1     | 1.9     | > 0.05            |        |       |      |
|                     | Baseline | 5.2     | 2.1     |                    |        |       |      |

\(^a\) p values for Tukey post hoc analysis.
\(^b\) Overall test for differences
Table 3: Subjective assessment of insomnia: results at baseline and after 1 night of melatonin or placebo treatment (N = 86)

|                          | Mean | SD  | P (vs. baseline) | P (vs. placebo) |
|--------------------------|------|-----|------------------|-----------------|
| Difficulty falling asleep| Melatonin | 1.63 | 0.61 | < 0.05 | < 0.05 |
|                          | Placebo | 2.53 | 0.62 | > 0.05 | 4.5 | 0.01 |
|                          | Baseline | 2.67 | 0.80 |          |          |
| Difficulty staying asleep| Melatonin | 2.32 | 0.83 | > 0.05 | > 0.05 |
|                          | Placebo | 2.31 | 0.69 | > 0.05 | 0.71 | NS |
|                          | Baseline | 2.48 | 1.11 |          |          |
| Problem waking up too early| Melatonin | 2.26 | 0.81 | > 0.05 | > 0.05 |
|                          | Placebo | 2.40 | 0.74 | > 0.05 | 0.42 | NS |
|                          | Baseline | 2.39 | 1.29 |          |          |
| Sleep quality            | Melatonin | 2.58 | 0.76 | < 0.05 | < 0.05 |
|                          | Placebo | 2.69 | 0.67 | > 0.05 | 1.2 | 0.02 |
|                          | Baseline | 3.16 | 0.92 |          |          |

a p values for Tukey post hoc analysis.

b Overall test for differences

the high prevalence of insomnia in shift workers, more studies about melatonin effect on different kinds of insomnia parameters (difficulty falling asleep, difficulty staying asleep, problem waking up too early, and sleep quality) causing by shift working is recommended.

Conclusion
Melatonin may be an effective treatment for shift workers with difficulty falling asleep.

Competing interests
The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Authors’ contributions
KHS helped with the conception and design of the study, helped to supervise the staff and helped to draft the manuscript. OA and GHP helped with the conception and design of the study and helped draft the manuscript. ZY helped with the conception and design of the study, helped to collect the data, participated in the data analyses and interpretation, and helped draft the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Acknowledgements
This study was supported by Tehran University of Medical Sciences (TUMS). The authors gratefully acknowledge (i) the efforts of Dr. Ramin Mehrdad who helped with data analysis and interpretation, (ii) the time and effort generously provided by all participants, (iii) the assistance with data collection provided by staff and students at Imam and Baharloo Hospital/Tehran University of Medical Sciences.

References
1. Coffey L, Skipper J, Jung F: Nurses and shift work: effects on job performance and job-related stress. J Adv Nurs 1988, 13:245-254.
2. Esryn-Behar M, Kaminski M, Peigne E, Bonnet N, Vaicheire E, Gozian C, Azzoulay S, Giorgi M: Stress at work and mental health status among female hospital workers. Br J Ind Med 1990, 47:20-28.
3. Skipper J, Jung F, Coffey L: Nurses and shiftwork: effects on physical and mental health. J Adv Nurs 1990, 15:835-842.
4. Golde D, Rogacz S, Bock N, Tortenson T, Baum T, Speizer F, Czeisler C: Rotating shift work, sleep and accidents related to sleepiness in hospital nurses. Am J Public Health 1992, 82:1011-1014.
5. Kandolin I: Burnout of female and male nurses in shiftwork. Ergonomics 1993, 36:141-147.
6. Menna-Baretto L, Benedetto-Silva A: Individual differences in night and continuously-rotating shiftwork: seeking anticipatory rather than compensatory strategy. Ergonomics 1993, 36:135-140.
7. Neidhammer I, Lert F, Marne M-J: Effects of shift work on sleep among French nurses. A longitudinal study. J Occup Med 1994, 36:667-674.
8. Barton J, Spelten E, Totterdell P, Smith L, Folkard S: Is there an optimum number of night shifts? Relationship between sleep, health and well-being. Work Stress 1995, 9:109-123.
9. Elfinger J, Nelson L, Starr J: Understanding circadian rhythms: a holistic approach to nurses and shiftwork. Holist Nurs 1995, 13:306-322.
10. Hakola T, Harma M, Laitinen J: Circadian adjustment of men and women to night work. Scand J Work, Environ Health 1996, 22(2):133-138.
11. Fitzpatrick JM, While AE, Roberts JD: Shift work and its impact upon nurse performance: current knowledge and research issues. J Adv Nurs 1999, 29:18-27.
12. Lowden A, Akerstedt T, Wibom R: Suppression of sleepiness and melatonin by bright light exposure during breaks in night work. J Sleep Res 2004, 13:37-43.
13. National Institutes of Health: State-of-the-Sciene Conference Statement on Manifestations and Management of Chronic Insomnia in Adults. Sleep 2005, 28:1049-1057.
14. Drake CL, Roehrs T, Richardson G, Walsh JC, Roth T: Work sleep disorder: prevalence and consequences beyond that of symptomatic day workers. Sleep 2004, 27:1453-1462.
15. Menna-Baretto L, Benedetto-Silva A: Individual differences in night and continuously-rotating shiftwork: seeking anticipatory rather than compensatory strategy. Ergonomics 1993, 36:135-140.
16. Herdis Sveinsdottir: Self-assessed quality of sleep, occupational health, working environment, illness experience and job satisfaction of female nurses working different combination of shifts. Scand J Caring Sci 2006, 20:229-237.
17. Vanecek J: Cellular mechanisms of melatonin action. Physiol Rev 1998, 78:687-721.
18. Borjigin J, Li X, Snyder SH: The pineal gland and melatonin: molecular and pharmacologic regulation. Ann Rev Pharmacol Toxicol 1999, 39:53-65.
19. Reiter RJ: Oxidative damage in the central nervous system: protection by melatonin. Prog Neurobiol 1998, 56:359-384.

20. Naguib M, Baker MT, Spadoni G, Gregerson MS: The hypnotic and analgesic effects of 2-bromomelatonin. Anesth Analg 2003, 97:763-768.

21. Naguib M, Hammond DL, Schmid IP: Pharmacological effects of intravenous melatonin: comparative studies with thiopental and propofol. Br J Anaesth 2003, 90:504-507.

22. Wurtman RJ, Zhdanova I: Improvement of sleep quality by melatonin. Lancet 1995, 346(8988):1491.

23. Tzischinsky O, Lavie P: Melatonin possesses time-dependent hypnotic effects. Sleep 1994, 17:638-645.

24. Petrie K, Conaglen JV, Thompson L, Chamberlain K: Effect of melatonin on jet lag after long haul flights. BMJ 1989, 298:705-707.

25. Folkard S, Arendt J, Clark M: Can melatonin improve shift workers’ tolerance of the night shift? Some preliminary findings. Chronobiol Int 1993, 10:315-320.

26. James M, Tremes MO, Jones JS, Krohmer JR: Can melatonin improve adaptation to night shift? Am J Emerg Med 1998, 16:367-370.

27. Jorgensen KM, Witting MD: Does exogenous melatonin improve day sleep or night alertness in emergency physicians working night shifts? Ann Emerg Med 1998, 31:699-704.

28. Shapiro CM, et al.: Working the shifting: a self-health guide. Jolijoco Publications 1997:40-44.

29. Morris CM: Insomnia: Psychological Assessment and Management New York, NY: Guilford Press; 1993.

30. Sack RL, Hughes RJ, Edgar DM, Lewy AJ: Sleep-promoting effects of melatonin: at what dose, in whom, under what conditions, and by what mechanisms? Sleep 1997, 20:908-915.

31. Almeida Montes LG, Ontiveros Uribe MP, Cortes Sotres J, Heinze Martine G: Treatment of primary insomnia with melatonin: a double-blind, placebo-controlled, crossover study. J Psychiatry Neurosci 2003, 28:191-196.