Topical Issues of Staffing in the Hospitality Industry of the Republic of Crimea

O R Zhavoronkova, I R Nikiforov

1Department of Sustainable Development Management
V.I. Vernadsky Crimean Federal University, Simferopol, Russia
2Department of Valeology and Safety of Human Vital Activity V.I. Vernadsky
Crimean Federal University
Simferopol, Russia

E-mail: olga-zhavor@mail.ru, nikiforoir@mail.ru

Abstract. The paper deals with the current state of staffing the hospitality industry enterprises with qualified personnel. The dynamics of staff flows, as well as their remuneration rate are described. In addition, the paper highlights main activities undertaken by the Ministry of Tourism and Resorts of the Republic of Crimea and the Ministry of Education, Science and Youth of the Republic of Crimea connected with personnel availability in collective accommodation facilities. It is proved that these measures solve the issue of staffing during the holiday season partially. At the same time, the existing policy does not contribute to the human resource capacity building and development, as it leaves unsettled challenges associated with employee turnover and their full employment. The relevant factors with a negative influence on the staffing in the hospitality industry enterprises are considered. Certain activities carried out to neutralize the negative impact of these factors are described. Some possible solutions for the problem under consideration are proposed. It is stated that solving staffing issues must be addressed comprehensively with resolution of common challenges in the hospitality industry. Considering an uneven distribution of resources in the Republic of Crimea, including collective accommodation facilities, the paper explains practicability of creating a tourism cluster in the region. To cope with challenges noted in the paper, a concentric diversification scenario of creating a tourism cluster is proposed. Some dominant factors of creating the tourism cluster, such as establishing boundaries of the state’s partnership with representatives of the business environment and other institutions in education, health, catering, leisure and other related areas, are noted. When establishing partnerships between the government and potential participants in the cluster, it is necessary for the government to provide support for defining the collaborative mechanism, beneficiaries and each cluster member’s responsibilities.

1. Introduction

The Republic of Crimea is a unique region of the Russian Federation with a rich natural, climatic, historical and cultural potential necessary for successful sustainable development of tourism and recreation. The main advantage of the Republic as a resort is its wide variety of natural resources. However, the tourism industry development in the region lags far behind most popular resorts in the world.
It is quite difficult to define the hospitality industry particularly and concisely because of its numerous constituent industries. The nature of the hospitality industry is complicated and complex; it involves different types of services available for guests and a set of various techniques to cope with professional tasks and delicate situations. The enterprises that the industry is based on have a number of functional purposes and, despite certain common characteristics, they are unique in their own way, as they express hospitality in various manners. When exploring the nature of the hospitality industry, it is important to realize that it includes different areas and sectors.

2. Formulation of the problem
Being a strategic multiplier of social and economic anagenesis, the sphere of tourism and recreation reflects the state-of-the-art of its constituent sectors. The hospitality industry is a strategic component of the sphere of tourism and recreation, which requires an increased attention and systematic monitoring. However, a small number of year-round enterprises doesn’t allow to fully use the personnel potential in the region, which affects the quality of personnel involved in the hospitality industry negatively. The lack of trained professionals, both in the hotel industry and in related areas is one of the most essential problems in the industry, which is largely due to distinct seasonality of the market.

3. Overview of recent research and publications
The topicality of the issue stated joined a number of scientists and economists. Algafri M. A. [3], Balaaleva, O. N. [4], Belysheva, G. G. [5], Rudenko K. V. [5], Zhukovskaya I. F. [9], Popov V. A. [12], Potapov A. E. [13], Sajbel N. Yu. [16], ZhiliostovaE. N. [17], Sofronova L. Yu [18] have greatly contributed to the study of issues and prospects of the hospitality industry in the Republic of Crimea. Such scholars as Sushko E. Y. [19] and Hasbulatova B. M. [20] were engaged in solving the staffing problems in the hospitality industry. The works of Benko E. V. [6], Zhavoronkova O. R. [7], and Zhavoronkov A. N. [8] are devoted to special personnel training for the sectors of the national economy, including the hospitality industry and business partnership with educational institutions. Such scientists as Klimovets O. V. [10], MuhamadievaV. P. [11], Prokofyeva M. A. [14], and RzhepkaE. A. [15] have given much attention to human resource development in the hospitality and tourism industry. They have studied a fairly wide amount of theoretical issues. However, the hospitality industry is quite dynamic, and the staffing level may vary by regions and cities due to their unequal economic development.

4. The paper’s objective and tasks
The objective of the article is to assess the availability of qualified personnel in the hospitality industry. To reach the objective, the following tasks were carried out:
1. Considering the current state of staffing enterprises of the hospitality industry with qualified personnel;
2. Identifying the staffing problems in the hospitality industry;
3. Identifying perspectives of human resources development in the hospitality industry.

5. Presentation of the main material
The hospitality industry combines all cooperating companies and organizations, each performing its specific functions aimed at meeting the needs of guests. Despite the fact that the hospitality industry includes a number of sectors, it should be considered comprehensively – as a full-fledged industry satisfying the needs of every customer.
In recent years, Russia has achieved significant success in the development of tourism and hotel business. Besides, hotel service has been improved seriously. Due to the latest economic and geopolitical changes in our country, the popularity of the Republic of Crimea among Russian tourists is growing. The period 2015 – 2017 has shown a positive dynamics in the number of tourists in the Republic of Crimea (Table 1) [1].
Table 1. Overall dynamics in the number of tourists in the Republic of Crimea.

| Indicators                                                      | 2015   | 2016    | 2017    | 2018    |
|----------------------------------------------------------------|--------|---------|---------|---------|
| The number of tourists (K people), incl. in collective         | 4598   | 5573.5  | 5395.1  | 6800    |
| accommodation facilities (K people)                            | No data provided | 1250.9 | 1261    | 159.8   |
| Average length of stay (days)                                  | 11     | 13      | 13      | 8       |
| Average occupancy of operating accommodation facilities at the | 20     | 17      | 21.7    | 35.4    |
| end of the year (%)                                            |        |         |         |         |

In January-September 2018, 6,062.3 thousand tourists visited Crimea, which is 29% higher than in the same period last year.

In 2017, the average number of days of stay per one tourist in Crimea amounted to 13, which corresponds to that of last year. The average occupancy rate of collective accommodation facilities is low. In December 2015, it was 20%, while in the same period in 2016 this indicator sank to 17% and increased to 21.7% in 2017. However, for some individual tourist regions of Crimea, this indicator amounts to 50% or more: Saki (81%), Simferopol (68%), Feodosia (51%) [1].

On the territory of the Republic of Crimea, there are 781 accommodation facilities (sanatorium-resorts and hotels), with a total capacity of 157.1 thousand accommodation places. The total dynamics in the number of accommodation facilities is presented in Table 2.

Table 2. Number of accommodation facilities in the Republic of Crimea for the period 2015-2017.

| Indicators                                                      | 2015   | 2016    | 2017    | Capacity (K places) |
|----------------------------------------------------------------|--------|---------|---------|---------------------|
| Facilities providing health resort treatment (units)            | 144    | 148     | 151     | 58.8                |
| Facilities providing health services (units)                    | 216    | 213     | 206     | 56.6                |
| Enterprises providing temporary accommodation services (units)  | 410    | 406     | 424     | 41.7                |
| Year-round operating facilities (units)                         | 262    | X       | 254     | No provided         |
| Total                                                           | 770    | 767     | 781     | No provided         |

“142 health resorts and 112 hotels are suitable for year-round operation, which is 32% of the total number of collective accommodation facilities. Traditionally, over the past few years, collective accommodation facilities have accommodated 1.1 million people or 1,434 people per collective accommodation facility per year, which is 119 people per month” [3].

Among other things, low occupancy of collective accommodation facilities is determined by the fact that the hotel infrastructure does not meet modern requirements. “To reach the strategic objective of the resort and tourism sector development, it is necessary to reorganize infrastructure, modernize (reconstruct) objects of sanatorium and resort complexes, which are currently under republican ownership” [3]. Most sanatorium and resort facilities in Crimea are based on the infrastructure preserved from the Soviet era, and a number of newly built mini-hotels cannot satisfy modern requirements for the quality of services provided. The depreciation of collective accommodation property assets and medical facilities is 70-90%.

Of 188 collective accommodation facilities owned by the Russian Federation and state-owned by the Republic of Crimea, at least 107 units are in need of reconstruction and modernization. The estimated total cost of reconstructing and modernizing rooms and medical facilities ranges from 85 to
200 million rubles for each object. In this regard, to transit to year-round service successfully, the state government is required to cooperate with private investors.

In addition, one of the distinctive features of the hotel business is an uneven territorial distribution of accommodation facilities in urban districts (Table 3, Fig. 1). Besides, the natural and climatic, as well as historical and cultural potential is also allocated unevenly followed by unequal demand for tourist facilities in the Republic of Crimea.

**Table 3.** Territorial distribution of collective accommodation facilities in urban districts in 2018.

| Indicators | Simferopol | Alushta | Evpatoria | Armyansk | Dzhankoy | Kerch | Krasnoperkopsk | Sudak | Feodosia | Yalta | Saki |
|------------|------------|---------|-----------|----------|----------|-------|----------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Number of collective accommodation facilities (units) | 40 | 109 | 154 | 13 | 4 | 54 | 6 | 84 | 121 | 213 | 103 |
| Number of places in collective accommodation facilities (units) | 1496 | 24847 | 32900 | 1290 | 29 | 4400 | 175 | 7916 | 11316 | 38130 | 7418 |

The territorial distribution of collective accommodation facilities in the context of economic micro-regions is shown in Fig. 1.

**Figure 1.** The number of collective accommodation facilities in urban districts of the Republic of Crimea in the context of economic micro-regions in 2017.

Thus, an increased tourist number does not ensure full functioning and development of collective accommodation facilities.

A sufficient number of collective accommodation facilities does not reflect the state-of-the-art of the hospitality industry in the region. One of the fundamental challenges of operating hotels and sanatoriums is the scarce qualified personnel. As a rule, most hotel business jobs are taken as one-
time, seasonal part-time employment for two or three months, and not as a full-fledged profession, which influences workforce professional competence, skills and abilities.

To staff collective accommodation facilities with qualified personnel, various forms of training are widely used. Since the beginning of 2017, the need for personnel in accommodation facilities in the Republic of Crimea has been monitored and generalized.

According to the data of February 10, 2017, there were 2000 job openings for accommodation facilities (2025) in: Yalta – 758, Alushta – 258, Sudak – 213, Saki – 169, Feodosiya – 156, Leninsky district – 137 Rozdolenskiy district – 103.

A significant number of vacancies in the hospitality industry is due to distinct seasonality of most accommodation facilities. Low occupancy of accommodation facilities that operate year-round is a factor limiting material incentives for employees (Table 4).

| Indicators                      | 2015   | 2016   | 2017   |
|--------------------------------|--------|--------|--------|
| Average monthly nominal accrued wage (RUB) | 17026 2 | 20458  | 19660  |
| Average number of employees (pers.)     | 8516   | 15249  | 11878  |

According to [2].

Such a decrease in wages is related to the end of the beach season directly. The cyclical nature of wages in the hospitality industry is the main reason for potential employees to consider this area as seasonal and choose jobs with more stable earnings, what causes a high employee turnover rate in the industry (Table 5).

| Indicator                        | persons |
|----------------------------------|---------|
| Employees recruited, incl.       | 3242    |
| • temporary workplaces           | 678     |
| Employees retired, incl.         | 1198    |
| • job cuts                       | 12      |
| • employee’s own will            | 864     |

According to [2].

To solve the problem, the Ministry of Resorts and Tourism of the Republic of Crimea signed an agreement with All-Russian Public Organization “Russian Student Groups” (hereinafter MOOO “RSO”) [1]. The context of cooperation enabled to find employers ready to conclude seasonal employment contracts with students.

Thus, since 2017, service groups (maids, waiters), PJSC Hotel complex “Yalta-Intourist” (Yalta) for 380 persons, OOO “Park-Hotel Porto Mare” (Alushta) for 90 persons, clinical sanatorium “Poltava-Crimea” (Saki) for 50 people were established. Counselors were sent to the children’s recreation camp “Solnechny” (Alushta), “Fortuna” health improvement center for children (Evpatoria), LLC “Avtomobilist” rehabilitation and recreation institution for children (Leninsky district), LLC “Children’s recreation camp Brigantina” (Bakhchisaray district). As of December 01, 2017, there were representatives from 25 regional offices of MOOO “RSO” employed on the territory of the Republic of Crimea (Table 6).

| Indicators                              | 2016   | 2017   |
|-----------------------------------------|--------|--------|
| Number of vacancies in accommodation facilities in the Republic of Crimea (units.) | 227    | 2025   |
| Temporary employment of students in health care and hotel facilities (pers.) | 4500   | 2352   |

According to [2].
Having solved the personnel problem by means of student teams, we have to face new obstacles, such as workforce professional competence, skills and abilities. It is a common opinion that there is low service rate in the hospitality industry, without any compliance with international standards. Since May 15, 2017, the Ministry of Resorts and Tourism of the Republic of Crimea has created a contact center operating as “hotline”. Appeals were accepted around the clock. During its work (from May 15 to October 15, 2017), from the total number of complaints (11% of the total number of calls) 18.6% of complaints were against service quality provided by health resort and hotel facilities, as well as by tourist and tour companies.

In this situation, there is a need for training activities for personnel employed in the hospitality industry.

In 2016, the Ministry held 42 training events in May and in the period from September to December for collaborators of accommodation facilities to improve the service quality, as well as to promote the Crimean tourist product to enterprises, organizations and institutions of the Republic of Crimea. Among them, 28 seminars were held for line staff and managers of sanatoriums and hotel complexes in order to improve their service level and professional skills. In addition, 7 field seminars were held to address key issues of resort regions on the peninsula identified after studying feedbacks of the Crimean visitors. They took place in Yalta, Evpatoria, Alushta, Simferopol, Kher, Feodosia and Sudak. Over the same period last year, 10 training events were arranged.

The Ministry of Resorts and Tourism of the Republic of Crimea carries out systematic work in this direction (Table 7).

| Organizers | Event name |
|------------|------------|
| The Federal Agency for Tourism (Rosturizm) together with the Ministry of Resorts and Tourism of the Republic of Crimea | Annual All-Russian Educational Conference “Knowledge. Technology” |
| The Federal Agency for Tourism (Rosturizm) | Within the framework of the Federal Targeted Programme “Developing Domestic and Inbound Tourism in Russia (2011-2018)” the project “National system of training and advanced training of specialists in the tourism industry” is still being implemented (project implementation period is 2015-2018). |
| The Federal Agency for Tourism (Rosturizm) | Specialists’ training in the tourism industry on 14 programmes of advanced training and professional retraining |
| The Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation | The project “Important issue” (online seminar) has been launched, which discusses current issues related to the tourism industry development in the Crimea. In 2017, 13 webinars were held. |
| The Ministry of Resorts and Tourism of the Republic of Crimea | 10 training events were provided for collaborators from the tourism industry. |

According to [1]

As part of the annual All-Russian Educational Conference “Knowledge. Technology”, some topical issues of the tourism industry development in the Republic of Crimea and other regions of the Russian Federation were discussed.

In general, the training conducted by the Ministry of Resorts and Tourism is carried out in the following areas:

- improving the service quality and promoting the Crimean tourist product in the cities of Yevpatoria, Saki, Feodosia, Alushta, Yalta effectively;
dealing with guest service, internal marketing, staff motivation, modern solutions, hotel quality management (reservation, reception and accommodation service),

understanding operational standards of the economic hotel service: structure, principles of development and implementation, standard list and examples, maid rules for rooms and guest areas;

non-standard room situations, training of waiters, standards of quality guest service, competent sales policy, effective sales techniques for tourist products;

introducing medical services, using entertainment programmes in accommodation facilities of the tourism industry, such as cultural and ethnographic centers, as well as rural guest houses, organization and operating peculiarities of tourist reception from the People’s Republic of China, the Republic of India, the Islamic Republic of Iran (traditions and religions). Cross-cultural communication.

In 2017, 900 people were trained. The events proposed by Rosturizm are aimed at students being experts working in the field of tourism and hospitality, including potential employees with higher or secondary vocational education in tourism services.

The Ministry of Resorts and Tourism of the Republic of Crimea informed tourist and hotel enterprises of Crimea on the training possibility.

While cooperating with the Ministry, the Employment Center of Crimea guides sanatoriums and hotel complexes in selecting applicants for open vacancies, providing effective staffing, as well as retraining and advanced training of specialists.

Despite the importance and necessity of such events, their fundamental nature should be taken into account. The current state of the tourism industry requires specific activities to improve the personnel professional competence, their practical skills and, consequently, customer experience.

Training and retraining of tourism and hospitality personnel is a key driver to competitiveness of both individual enterprises and the whole industry. The service quality and level depend on personnel professional skills.

Analysis findings obtained lead to a conclusion that currently enterprises in the hospitality industry use outsourcing services, without putting specialists on the staff. Considering plans and prospects designed for tourism industry development, certain efforts should be made to provide quality training for professional personnel. The teaching techniques used in training are conventional. However, according to the specifics of the hospitality industry, it is more appropriate to apply a competency-based learning approach. The competence-based approach combines traditional forms (lectures, seminars, and webinars) with modern active techniques (workshops, internships, presentations). The difference between a competent specialist and a qualified one is that the former not only possesses specific knowledge, skills and abilities, but also is able to apply them in his or her work.

Due to the seasonal nature of collective accommodation facilities, there is scarce qualified personnel. Employing students during the holiday season reduces the staff quality. Some ongoing training activities have a short-term effect, as the holiday season’s end means unemployment for most of the staff. Such events do not contribute to the development of professional skills and special practical knowledge. Considering personnel as a factor of competitive advantage, it is necessary to establish partnerships between collective accommodation facilities and educational institutions. Such a partnership may take the form of:

• outsourcing, or delegating individual functions to a partner organization (specialized personnel training, conducting training courses according to a jointly established plan);

• outtasking, or delegating only a separate task to the partner (participating of representatives of collective accommodation facilities in staff selection among students).

• outstaffing, or staff leasing, providing students for performing certain tasks in the holiday season as a kind of practical training.

However, without full employment, the hospitality industry will face staff outflow. Thus, it can be said that cooperation with educational institutions is aimed at solving seasonal issues of staffing, human resource development. To find a holistic solution, it is necessary to neutralize the impact of negative factors on seasonality of the hotel business as well as on hotel room capacity.
High infrastructure wear and tear together with discrepancy of service cost and quality have a negative impact on tourist flow and earning power of enterprises. These indicators have caused low occupancy of collective accommodation facilities in all economic micro-regions of the Republic of Crimea and led to impossibility of year-round operation.

Thus, to solve the problem under consideration, it is not enough to deal with educational initiatives only. In addition, various hotel complexes of year-round operation, including sports, leisure infrastructure, should be developed. A categorization mandatory for all accommodation facilities will make it possible to differentiate costs in accordance with service quality. It is also required to modernize infrastructure, minimize tax burdens on enterprises of the tourism industry that renovate, create or update their property assets. A promising trend should be cooperation with infrastructure organizations, which will provide tourists with a variety of leisure programmes, as well as the development of additional services that increase the hotel attractiveness.

The findings of the study demonstrate the feasibility of using a concentric diversification scenario of creating a tourist cluster in the Republic of Crimea. This scenario involves the tourism development with regard to resource and territorial specialization in micro-regions. This specialization enables taking advantage of main opportunities of the external environment to identify peculiarities of the Republic of Crimea, as well as to neutralize significant threats, which are qualified personnel outflow and increased competition among regions of the Russian Federation. As a result, it can be argued that a concentric diversification scenario of creating a tourist cluster is aimed at obtaining not only economic but also social effect.

In the context of a concentric diversification scenario of creating a tourism cluster, a dominant factor is establishing boundaries of the state’s partnership with representatives of the business environment and other institutions in education, health, and leisure areas. While building partnership relations, it is necessary to develop a mechanism to define beneficiaries of this interaction and to establish shared responsibility.

According to the concentric diversification scenario, a special role is given to marketing policy in the context of popularization and promotion of territories and positioning the specifics of individual economic micro-regions for the development of various types of tourism. Marketing activities will allow to neutralize certain risks associated with establishing a spontaneous and distorted image of the Republic of Crimea and with an intensified competition as well.

Since this scenario is characterized by an increased investment focus of the economic growth, it is inevitable to create a modern tourist infrastructure and competitive micro-regions of the Republic of Crimea, with the required resources, which confirms the need for partnership relations between the state and the private sector. Thus, cluster operations are followed by creating a regional tourist labour market, as a result of building cooperation networks.

Currently, tourism is one of the steadily developing sectors of the world economy, which has a significant impact on the social and economic situation in a number of countries. The global crisis, the market economy growth, and fundamental changes in the international economic arena have emphasized the fact that it is necessary to transform ways of organizing national production, which have exhausted themselves.

Clustering of the tourism industry helps to attract more foreign and national tourists, to upgrade regional infrastructure, as well as to develop and implement innovative projects. Besides, it leads to a large-scale multiplier effect.

References
[1] The Ministry of Resorts and Tourism of the Republic of Crimea URL https://mtur.rk.gov.ru/ru/structure/1051
[2] Federal State Statistics Service in the Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol Krymstat URL http://crimea.gks.ru
[3] Algafri M A 2016 The problems of Russian tourism Molodojuchenij 10–114 pp 586–588
[4] Balaeva O N, Gordin V E, Predvoditeleva M D 2011 Hospitality and tourism industry: problems and tasks of master’s training Universitetskoe upravlenie: praktika i analiz. 1(71) pp 41-51

[5] Belysheva G G, Rudenko K V, Shapovalova E O 2016 Prospects and problems of hospitality industry development in Crimea Molodojuchenyy 11.1 pp 13-15 https://moluch.ru/archive/115/30717/

[6] Benko E V 2013 Hospitality and tourism industry as a sophisticated cross-sectoral complex: the concept of the industry, main directions of improving the system of inter-sectoral interaction Vzaimodejstvie vlasti, biznesa i obrazovaniya v usloviyah vstupleniya Rossii v VTO: Materialy III Mezhdunarodnoj nauchno-prakticheskoj konferencii pp 49-63

[7] Zhavoronkova O R 2016 Development of educational institutions in the context of staffing sectors of the economy V knige: DNI NAUKI KFU im. V L Vernadskogo Sbornik tezisov uchastnikov II nauchnoj konferencii pp 55-57

[8] Zhavoronkov A N, Zhavoronkova O R 2016 A new paradigm of training qualified personnel for sustainable economic growth in the region Problemy sovremennogo pedagogicheskogo obrazovaniya 35 pp 134-141

[9] Zhukovskaya I F, Yares O B 2016 The hospitality industry in Russian regions Strategiya ustojchivogo razvitiya regionov Rossii 35 pp 134 - 141

[10] Klimovec O V, Fandij K V 2013 Conceptual framework for improving the human resource potential of the tourism and hospitality industry Voprosy novoj ekonomiki 3(27) pp 40-46

[11] Muhamadieva Yu P, Polupanov I I 2017 Actual problems of staffing in tourism Molodoj uchenyy 13.2 pp 15-17 https://moluch.ru/archive/147/42016/

[12] Popov V A 2013 The hospitality industry: definition, structure and factors of development Vestnik Saiarskogo gosudarstvennogo ekonomicheskogo universiteta 5(103) pp 90-93

[13] Potapov D O, Tayurskij A I 2013 Peculiarities of personnel potential in the hospitality industry Upravlenie chelovecheskimi resursami – osnova razvitiya innovacionnoj ekonomiki 4 pp 310-314

[14] Prokofyeva M A, Abdikarimova M B 2017 Human resources management in the hospitality industry Sovremennye tendentsii i aktual'nye voprosy razvitiya turizma i gostinichnogo biznesa v Rossii: materialy mezhunarodnoj nauchno-prakticheskoj konferencii pp 432-440

[15] Rzhepka E A, Novichkova T R 2016 Hospitality industry: exploring career opportunities Servis v Rossii zarubezhom vol 10 9(70) pp 118-132

[16] Sajbel N Yu, Potapova A E 2016 Current state and prospects of the tourist market development in the Republic of Crimea Molodojuchenyy 9 pp 705-708 https://moluch.ru/archive/113/29553/

[17] Sajbel' Ya V, Zhiliostova E N 2016 Current state analysis of tourism in Russia Molodojuchenyy 11 pp 950-953 https://moluch.ru/archive/115/30937/

[18] Sofronova Yu. L 2014 Modern hospitality industry: prospects of sociological analysis Vestnik NGTU im. R E Alekseeva Seriya: Upravlenie v social'nyh sistemah. Kommunikativnye tekhnologii 2 pp 66-72

[19] Sushko Yu E 2017 Challenges of tourism industry development Molodojuchenyy 21 pp 255-258 URL https://moluch.ru/archive/155/43811/

[20] Hasbulatova B M 2015 Challenges and prospects of tourism industry development Teoriya i praktika obschestvennogo razvitiya 6 pp 63–65