Random-length Random Walks and Finite-size Scaling in high dimensions

Zongzheng Zhou,1 Jens Grimm,1‡, Sheng Fang,2 Youjin Deng,2,3* and Timothy M. Garoni1†

1ARC Centre of Excellence for Mathematical and Statistical Frontiers (ACEMS), School of Mathematical Sciences, Monash University, Clayton, Victoria 3800, Australia
2Department of Modern Physics, University of Science and Technology of China, Hefei, Anhui 230026, China
3National Laboratory for Physical Sciences at Microscale, University of Science and Technology of China, Hefei, Anhui 230026, China

(Dated: November 2, 2018)

We address a long-standing debate regarding the finite-size scaling of the Ising model in high dimensions, by introducing a random-length random walk model, which we then study rigorously. We prove that this model exhibits the same universal FSS behaviour previously conjectured for the self-avoiding walk and Ising model on finite boxes in high-dimensional lattices. Our results show that the mean walk length of the random walk model controls the scaling behaviour of the corresponding Green’s function. We numerically demonstrate the universality of our rigorous findings by extensive Monte Carlo simulations of the Ising model and self-avoiding walk on five-dimensional hypercubic lattices with free and periodic boundaries.

Finite-size Scaling (FSS) [1, 2] is a fundamental theory which characterizes the asymptotic approach of finite systems to the thermodynamic limit, close to a continuous phase transition. While critical systems above the upper critical dimension $d_c$ exhibit simple mean-field behaviour in the thermodynamic limit [3], their FSS behaviour above $d_c$ is surprisingly subtle and the subject of long-standing debate; see e.g. [4–10]. In this work, we clarify a number of these subtleties by introducing a simple model, which can be studied rigorously.

The $n$-vector model [11], which describes interacting spin systems on a lattice, plays a central role in various areas of physics such as statistical mechanics and condensed matter physics. Prominent examples are the Self-avoiding Walk (SAW) ($n → 0$) in polymer physics, and the Ising ($n = 1$) and XY ($n = 2$) models of ferromagnetism. The latter can be related to the Bose-Hubbard model [12] which describes bosonic atoms in an optical lattice.

On an infinite hypercubic lattice $\mathbb{Z}^d$, it is known rigorously [12, 13] that for sufficiently large dimension $d$, the two-point functions of the critical Ising and SAW models exhibit the same scaling behaviour as the Green’s function of the Simple Random Walk (SRW). On finite lattices this connection breaks down because SRW is recurrent, implying that its Green’s function does not exist.

In this Letter, we argue that if one considers random walks with an appropriate random (finite) length $N$, then the Green’s function displays the same finite-size scaling as the two-point functions of the SAW and Ising models, defined on boxes in $\mathbb{Z}^d$ of linear size $L$. For this Random-length Random Walk (RLRW) model, one can prove [15] that if $d ≥ 3$ and $(N) \propto L^\mu$ with $\mu > 2$, then the Green’s function scales as

$$g(x) = \begin{cases} |x|^{2-d}, & |x| \leq O(L^{(d-\mu)/(d-2)}) \\ L^{\mu-d}, & |x| \geq O(L^{(d-\mu)/(d-2)}). \end{cases}$$

In words, if $\mu > 2$, $g(x)$ exhibits the standard infinite-lattice asymptotic decay $|x|^{2-d}$ at moderate values of $x$, but then enters a plateau of order $L^{\mu-d}$ which persists to the boundary. Since a typical RLRW will explore distances of order $N^{1/\mu}$ from the origin, no plateau exists for $\mu < 2$ because typical walks will be too short to feel the boundary; in this case $g(x)$ decays significantly faster than $|x|^{2-d}$ for $|x| > N^{1/\mu}$.

The above scaling behaviour of the Green’s function holds on boxes with both free and periodic boundaries. As a consequence of this scaling [16], one can prove [15] that the corresponding susceptibility scales as

$$\chi \propto L^\mu, \quad \text{for any } \mu > 0. \quad (2)$$

The mean walk length of SAW, restricted to a finite box in $\mathbb{Z}^d$, depends strongly on the boundary conditions imposed. For a given choice of SAW boundary conditions, one can consider a RLRW where $(N)$ is chosen to scale in the same way as it does for the SAW. Our numerical results below strongly suggest that the scaling of the Green’s function of this RLRW model, given by Eq. (1), then correctly predicts the two-point function scaling of the corresponding SAW model. We therefore conclude that the SAW two-point function is only affected by geometry via its effect on the mean walk length. These observations are seen to hold not only at the thermodynamic critical point, but also at general pseudo-critical points. We numerically demonstrate the universality of these predictions by showing that they also correctly describe the FSS behaviour of the Ising two-point function.

These observations shed light on a number of open questions regarding the FSS behaviour of the Ising model above $d_c$. For periodic boundary conditions (PBC) at criticality, the scaling of the Ising two-point function has been actively debated in [13]. The known [17] behaviour of the mean walk length of SAW on the complete graph, together with extensive Monte Carlo simulations in five dimensions, suggest that on high-dimensional tori at criticality we have $(N)_{\text{SAW}} \propto L^{d/2}$. We therefore
predict that the critical SAW and Ising two-point functions should be given by Eq. (1) with $\mu = d/2$. This prediction is in agreement with the conjectured behaviour of the critical Ising two-point function given in [19], and is in excellent agreement with the numerical results presented in [16].

For free boundary conditions (FBC), the possible existence of the FSS behaviour $\chi \sim L^{d/2}$ at pseudo-critical points is the subject of ongoing debate [4, 7, 11]. Specifically, denoting by $T_L$ the temperature which maximizes $\chi(T_L, L)$ on a box of size $L$, it was observed numerically in [10] that $\chi(T_L, L)$ has the same $L^{d/2}$ scaling observed at criticality for periodic systems. The results in [11] are in agreement with this observation, however, the more recent work [4] refuted this claim, and numerically observed only the standard mean-field scaling $L^2$. From Eq. (2), we see that one can observe $\chi \sim L^{d/2}$ in a RLRW model in which the mean walk length scales as $L^{d/2}$. Universality then suggests that this scaling should also be observable in SAW and Ising models, at appropriate pseudo-critical points. Our numerical results below confirm this.

**Random-length Random Walk.** — Let $(S_t)_{t \in \mathbb{N}}$ be a simple random walk on a box of side length $L$ in $\mathbb{Z}^d$, centered at the origin. Let $\mathcal{N}$ be an $\mathbb{N}$-valued random variable, independent of each choice of step in $(S_t)_{t \in \mathbb{N}}$. We refer to $(S_t)_{t \in \mathbb{N}}$ as the corresponding RLRW. We study its Green’s function

$$g_{\text{RLRW}}(x) := \mathbb{E} \left( \sum_{n=0}^{\mathcal{N}} P(S_n = x) \right),$$

which is the expected number of visits to $x$, and the corresponding susceptibility $\chi_{\text{RLRW}} := \sum_{x} g_{\text{RLRW}}(x)$. Here, $P(S_n = x)$ denotes the probability that the RLRW is at site $x$ after $n$ steps.

Consider a RLRW with mean walk length $N := \langle \mathcal{N} \rangle \approx L^\mu$ on a $d \geq 3$ dimensional hypercubic lattice, with either periodic or free boundary conditions. If $\mu \geq 2$, it can then be proved [16] that the Green’s function exhibits the piecewise asymptotic behaviour in Eq. (1). In particular, the case $\mu > 2$ shows the existence of a macroscopic plateau of order $L^{\mu-d}$ for large distances, while this plateau is absent for $0 < \mu < 2$. The case $\mu = 2$ is marginal.

**Numerical setup for $n$-vector models.** — We study the two-point function $g_{\text{Ising}}(x) := \mathbb{E}(S_0 S_x)$ for the zero-field ferromagnetic Ising model, defined by the Hamiltonian $H = -\sum_{ij} s_i s_j$. Here, $s_i = \pm 1$ denotes the spin at site $i$ of a hypercubic lattice of side length $L$, and the sum is over nearest neighbours. We simulate the Ising model at fugacities $z := \tanh(\beta)$, where $\beta$ is the inverse Ising temperature, via the worm algorithm introduced in [21].

We also investigate the SAW on a box with linear size $L$ in the variable length ensemble. We study the two-point function $g_{\text{SAW}}(x) := \sum_{s: \mathbb{Z}^d \rightarrow \{-1, 1\}} P(s_0 s_x)$, where the sum is over all SAWs starting at the origin 0 and ending at $x$. We simulated this ensemble using an irreversible version of the Berreitii-Sokal algorithm [21, 22]. For both models we study the corresponding susceptibility, defined by $\chi_{\text{Ising/SAW}} := \sum_x g_{\text{Ising/SAW}}(x)$.

We study our models on hypercubic lattices, in the case of both free and periodic boundary conditions. The Ising model was simulated at the estimated location of the infinite-volume critical point $z_{c, \text{Ising,5d}} = 0.113 915 0(5)$ in five dimensions, and the simulations for the SAW were performed at the estimated infinite-volume critical point $z_{c, \text{SAW,5d}} = 0.113 140 84(1)$ [22]. We also simulated the FSS behaviour at pseudo-critical points $z_L = z_c - a L^{-\lambda}$ for various $a \in \mathbb{R}$ and $\lambda > 0$. We simulated linear system sizes up to $L = 71$ in the Ising model and $L = 201$ for the SAW. To estimate the exponent value for a generic observable $Y$ we performed least-squares fits to the ansatz $Y = ayL^\nu + cY$. A detailed analysis of autocorrelation times can be found in [22] for the worm algorithm and in [22] for the irreversible Berreitii-Sokal algorithm.

**Universal scaling at criticality.** — We now argue that Eqs. (1) and (2) correctly predict the FSS behaviour of...
is excellent agreement with the complete graph prediction two-point functions collapse except at distances close to the boundary. This shows that g_{l}ous FSS at the pseudo-critical point \( \tilde{\lambda} \) estimates for behaviour as on periodic boundaries at criticality.

Standard mean-field scaling

\[ N \] scaling variable data collapse for appropriately scaled versions of the two-point functions and the susceptibility of the critical SAW and Ising models, with either FBC or PBC.

On free boundaries at criticality, our fits for \( N_{\text{SAW}} \) lead to the exponent value 2.50(1), in excellent agreement with the complete graph prediction of \( d/2 \). Combining this scaling for \( N_{\text{SAW}} \) with our results for the RLRW, the two-point functions of the critical Ising and SAW models on high-dimensional tori are then predicted to display the scaling in Eq. (1) with \( \mu = d/2 \). Figure (a) verifies this prediction, showing an excellent data collapse for appropriately scaled versions of the two-point functions of the Ising and SAW models onto the scaling variable \( y = |x|/\langle \lambda \rangle^{d/2-\mu} \) with \( \mu = d/2 \). As a corollary of this two-point function scaling, we obtain \( \lambda \approx L^{d/2} \), in agreement with the numerical studies for the Ising model in \( \tilde{\lambda} \), and with our direct exponent estimates for \( d = 5 \) of 2.50(1) for \( \chi_{\text{SAW}} \), and 2.51(2) for \( \chi_{\text{Ising}} \).

On free boundaries at criticality, our fits for \( N_{\text{SAW}} \) lead to the exponent value 2.00(1), strongly suggesting that \( N_{\text{SAW}} \approx L^{2} \). Combining this scaling for \( N_{\text{SAW}} \) with our results for the RLRW, the two-point functions of the critical Ising and SAW models on high-dimensional boxes with free boundaries are then predicted to display the scaling in Eq. (1) with \( \mu = 2 \). Figure (a) verifies this prediction, showing an excellent data collapse for the two-point functions of the critical Ising and SAW models onto the ansatz in Eq. (1) with \( \mu = 2 \). Equation (2) then predicts \( \chi \approx L^{2} \), in agreement with the numerical study of the Ising model in \( \tilde{\lambda} \), and with our direct exponent estimates for \( d = 5 \) of 2.01(8) for the Ising model and 1.99(1) for the SAW.

Universal scaling at pseudo-critical points. — We now turn to the actively debated question of whether one can observe the scaling behaviour \( \chi \approx L^{d/2} \), corresponding to critical PBC behaviour, on free boundaries at pseudo-critical points. This also motivates the reverse question, of whether it is possible to observe the standard mean-field behaviour \( \chi \approx L^{d/2} \), corresponding to critical FBC behaviour, at pseudo-critical points on periodic boundaries. The above results for the RLRW suggest that the FSS behaviour of the SAW two-point function should only depend on the boundary conditions through their effect on \( N \). We now numerically verify that this is indeed the case, and that analogous results also hold for the Ising model.

For periodic boundaries, we study FSS at pseudo-critical points \( \tilde{\lambda} = \tilde{\lambda} - aL^{-\lambda} \), with \( a \) chosen positive so that the walk lengths are decreased compared with criticality. On the complete graph, it can be shown that at a pseudo-critical point \( \tilde{\lambda} \) \( \approx \tilde{\lambda} = -aL^{-\lambda} \), we have \( N_{\text{SAW}} \approx V^{1/2} \), if \( \zeta \geq 1/2 \), while \( N_{\text{SAW}} \approx V^{5/2} \) if \( \zeta \leq 1/2 \). Considering a RLRW on a high-dimensional torus, whose mean walk length scales in this way, the Green’s function and susceptibility then scale as in Eqs. (1) and (2) with \( \mu = d/2 : \lambda \) for any \( 0 < \lambda \leq d/2 \), and \( \mu = d/2 : \tilde{\lambda} \) for \( \lambda \geq d/2 \). By universality, we then expect the same behaviour to hold for both SAW and the Ising model at the pseudo-critical point \( \tilde{\lambda} = \tilde{\lambda} \) on high-dimensional tori.

Taking \( \lambda = 2 \), the above arguments predict that the pseudo-critical two-point functions display the mean-field behaviour \( g(x) \approx |x|^{2-d} \). Fig. (a) shows an appropriately scaled version of the two-point functions of the Ising model and SAW onto the ansatz in Eq. (1) with \( \mu = 2 \). The excellent data collapse provides strong evidence for the predicted existence of standard mean-field behaviour at \( \tilde{\lambda} \).

We emphasize that, despite appearances, the two-point functions in Fig. (a) and (b) do not display the same FSS behaviour. In particular, it follows from the scaling ansatz in Eq. (1) that if \( |x| \approx L/2 \), then the critical two-point functions scale as \( g(x) \times L^{d/2} \), while \( g(x) \times L^{2-d} \) at \( \tilde{\lambda} \).

Considering more general values of \( \lambda \), Fig. (a) shows the scaling of \( N_{\text{SAW}} \) at \( \tilde{\lambda} \) on five-dimensional tori for \( \lambda = 1, 1.5, 2, 2.5 \). Our fits lead to the exponent values 0.998(2) for \( \lambda = 1, 1.499(2) \) for \( \lambda = 1.5, 2.01(1) \) for \( \lambda = 2, \)
and \(2.47(4)\) for \(\lambda = 2.5\), in excellent agreement with the corresponding results on the complete graph. Figure 3(b) then shows the scaling behaviour of the susceptibility for \(\lambda = 1, 1.5, 2, 2.5\). Our fits for the SAW lead to the exponent values \(1.005(6)\) for \(\lambda = 1\), \(1.503(5)\) for \(\lambda = 1.5\), \(2.00(1)\) for \(\lambda = 2\), \(2.46(5)\) for \(\lambda = 2.5\). For the Ising model, our fits lead to \(1.00(1)\) for \(\lambda = 1\), \(1.51(2)\) for \(\lambda = 1.5\), \(2.05(7)\) for \(\lambda = 2\), and \(2.41(1)\) for \(\lambda = 2.5\). These estimates are all in excellent agreement with above predictions.

Finally, we consider pseudo-critical behaviour with free boundary conditions. There has been considerable debate \(4, 7, 10\) concerning the existence of critical PBC FSS behaviour on lattices with PBC at a pseudo-critical point which maximizes \(\chi(T, L)\) on a box of linear size \(L\). It has been numerically established that this pseudo-critical point has shift exponent \(\lambda = 2\) \(4, 7, 10\). A simple methodology to gauge the possibility of observing \(\chi \approx L^{d/2}\) at such a pseudo-critical point is to define a sequence \(a_L\) such that \(\chi_{PBC, zc}(L) = \chi_{PBC, zc}(L)\) with \(z_L := z_c + a_L L^{-2}\), and to then show that \(a_L\) converges. If such a convergent sequence exists, this approach forces \(\chi_{PBC, zc}(L)\) to scale as \(L^{d/2}\), where \(z_L := z_c + a_L L^{-2}\). The inset of Fig. 4 shows the sequence \(a_L\) in the Ising and SAW models. For SAW, the series \(a_L\) clearly appears to converge, and our fits predict \(a_{SAW, \infty} = 0.824(2)\). The Ising data are roughly consistent with the SAW data, albeit over a much smaller range of \(L\) values.

Figure 3: FSS behaviour of the mean walk length \(N_{SAW}\) (top) and the susceptibility \(\chi_{Ising, SAW}\) (bottom) with periodic boundary conditions in five dimensions. The diamonds (squares) display SAW (Ising) data. To emphasize universality, the Ising and SAW data were translated onto the same curve. In each figure, the line on the top corresponds to the critical scaling behaviour \(N, \chi \approx L^{d/2}\). The remaining lines (top to bottom) correspond to the scaling behaviour \(N, \chi \approx L^{d/2}\) at pseudo-critical points \(z_L(\lambda) = z_c - a L^{-\lambda}\) \((a > 0)\) with \(\lambda = 2.5, 2, 1.5, 1\).

Figure 4: FSS behaviour of the mean walk length \(N_{SAW}\) with free boundary conditions in five dimensions. The inset shows the convergence of \(a_L\) in the SAW (circles) and Ising model (triangles).

Discussion.— In this Letter, we have introduced a random-length random walk model to clarify a number of open questions regarding the FSS behaviour of the Ising model above \(d_c\). For periodic boundaries, by combining the RLRW model with the scaling of the mean walk length of SAW on the complete graph, we were able to predict the asymptotic scaling of the Ising and SAW two-point functions on high-dimensional tori at a family of pseudo-critical points \(z_L(\lambda) = z_c - a L^{-\lambda}\), and showed that the scaling exponents vary continuously with \(\lambda\) when \(0 < \lambda \leq d/2\). As special cases, at \(z_c\) we recovered the behaviour conjectured in \(10\), while at \(z_L(2)\) we showed the Ising two-point function displays standard mean-field behaviour.

On free boundaries, combining the RLRW model with the numerical scaling of \(N_{SAW}\) predicts that the critical Ising two-point function displays standard mean-field decay. It follows that the susceptibility scales as \(L^2\), in agreement with the numerical observation in \(9\). We also studied the actively debated FSS behaviour at the pseudo-critical point \(z_L = z_c + a L^{-2}\). We established that the Ising two-point function displays the same FSS behaviour as on periodic boundaries at criticality, in agreement with the numerical observations in \(7, 10\).

Recently, three-dimensional quantum spin models,
which are related to the corresponding four-dimensional classical counterpart \cite{20}, have been the subject of intensive theoretical, experimental and numerical studies \cite{27–29}. Our work has focused on the FSS behaviour of the $n$-vector model above $d_c = 4$. Although at $d_c$ the situation is likely complicated by logarithmic corrections, we believe that our results for $d > d_c$ are a necessary first step in understanding the correct scaling behaviour for applications to three-dimensional quantum spin models.

We would like to thank Andrea Collevecchio, Eren M. Elci and Kevin Leckey for fruitful discussions. This work was supported under the Australian Research Council’s Discovery Projects funding scheme (Project Number DP140100559). It was undertaken with the assistance of resources from the National Computational Infrastructure (NCI), which is supported by the Australian Government. This research was supported in part by the Monash eResearch Centre and eSolutions-Research Support Services through the use of the MonARCH HPC Cluster. J. Grimm acknowledges Monash University and the Australian Mathematical Society for their financial support. Y. Deng and S. Fang acknowledges the support by the National Key R&D Program of China under Grant No. 2016YFA0301604 and by the National Natural Science Foundation of China under Grant No. 11625522.

* Electronic address: jens.grimm@monash.edu
† Electronic address: yjdeng@ustc.edu.cn
‡ Electronic address: tim.garoni@monash.edu

\[1\] M. E. Fisher, Critical Phenomena, in Proceedings of the 51st Enrico Fermi Summer School, Varenna, Italy, edited by M. S. Green (Academic Press, New York, 1971).

\[2\] M. E. Fisher, M. N. Barber, Scaling theory for finite-size effects in the critical region, Phys. Rev. Lett. 28, 1516 (1972).

\[3\] R. Fernández, J. Fröhlich, A. D. Sokal, Random Walks, Critical Phenomena, and Triviality in Quantum Field Theory, Springer, Heidelberg (1992).

\[4\] P. H. Lundow, K. Markström, The scaling window of the 5D Ising model with free boundary conditions, Nucl. Phys. B911, 163 (2016).

\[5\] E. Flores-Sola, B. Berche, R. Kenna, M. Weigel, Role of Fourier Modes in Finite-Size Scaling above the Upper Critical Dimension, Phys. Rev. Lett. 116, 115701 (2016).

\[6\] J. Grimm, E. M. Elci, Z. Zhou, T. M. Garoni, Y. Deng, Geometric explanation of anomalous finite-size scaling in high dimensions, Phys. Rev. Lett. 118, 115701 (2017).

\[7\] M. Wittmann, A. P. Young, Finite-size scaling above the upper critical dimension, Phys. Rev. E 90, 062137 (2014).

\[8\] R. Kenna, B. Berche, Fishers scaling relation above the upper critical dimension, Europhys. Lett. 105, 26005 (2014).

\[9\] P. H. Lundow, K. Markström, Finite size scaling of the 5D Ising model with free boundary conditions, Nucl. Phys. B889, 249 (2014).

\[10\] B. Berche, R. Kenna, J.-C. Walter, Hyperscaling above the upper critical dimension, Nucl. Phys. B865, 115 (2012).

\[11\] H. E. Stanley, Dependence of Critical Properties on Dimensionality of Spins, Phys. Rev. Lett. 20, 589 (1968).

\[12\] B. Svistunov, E. Babaev, N. Prokofev, Superfluid States of Matter (CRC Press, Boca Raton, 2015).

\[13\] T. Harada, Decay of correlations in nearest-neighbor self avoiding walk, percolation, lattice trees, and animals, Ann. Probab. 36, 530 (2008).

\[14\] A. Sakai, Lace Expansion for the Ising Model, Commun. Math. Phys. 272, 283344 (2007).

\[15\] Z. Zhou, J. Grimm, Y. Deng, T. M. Garoni, In prepara-

\[16\] To guarantee $g(x)$ decays sufficiently fast at large $|x|$ for $\mathbb{E}$ to hold when $\mu < 2$, we make the physically reasonable assumption $\sqrt{\text{Var}(N)} = O(\langle N \rangle)$.

\[17\] A. Yadin, Self-avoiding walks on finite graphs of large girth, ALEA, Lat. Am. J. Probab. Math. Stat. 13, 521 (2016).

\[18\] The complete graph on $V$ vertices is a graph in which each pair of vertices is adjacent, so that there are $V(V - 1)/2$ edges in total.

\[19\] V. Papathanakos, Finite-Size Effects in High-Dimensional Statistical Mechanical Systems: The Ising Model With Periodic Boundary Conditions, Ph.D. thesis, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey, (2006).

\[20\] N. Prokofev, B. Svistunov, Worm Algorithms for Classi-

\[21\] A. Berretti, A. D. Sokal, New Monte Carlo method for the self-avoiding walk, J. Stat. Phys. 40, 483 (1985).

\[22\] H. Hu, X. Chen, Y. Deng, Irreversible Markov chain Monte Carlo algorithm for self-avoiding walk, Front. Phys. 12, 120503 (2017).

\[23\] Y. Deng, T. M. Garoni, A. D. Sokal, Dynamic Critical Behavior of the Worm Algorithm for the Ising Model, Phys. Rev. Lett. 99, 110601 (2007).

\[24\] K. Binder, Critical properties and finite-size effects of the five-dimensional Ising model, Z. Phys. B 61, 13 (1985).

\[25\] G. Parisi, J.J. Ruiz-Lorenzo, Scaling above the upper critical dimension in Ising models, Phys. Rev. B 54, R3698R3702 (1996).

\[26\] More generally, the quantum system in $d$ spatial dimensions is related to the classical model in $d+1$ dimensions.

\[27\] Y.-Q. Qin, B. Normand, A. Sandvik, Z.-Y. Meng, The amplitude mode in three-dimensional dimerized antiferromagnets, Phys. Rev. Lett. 118, 147207 (2017).

\[28\] Bissbort, U., Götzé, S., Li, Y., Heinzle, J., Krauser, J. S., Weinberg, M., C. Becker, K. Sengstock, W. Hofstetter, Detecting the Amplitude Mode of Strongly Interacting Lattice Bosons by Bragg Scattering, Phys. Rev. Lett., 106, 205303, (2011).

\[29\] Rüegg, C., Normand, B., Matsumoto, M., Furrer, A., McMorrow, D. F., Krämer, K. W., H.-U. Gädel, S. N. Gvasaliya, H. Mutka, M. Boehm, Quantum Magnets under Pressure: Controlling Elementary Excitations in Ti3 CuCl3, Phys. Rev. Lett., 100, 205701, (2008).