MEDIA & COMMUNICATION STUDIES | RESEARCH ARTICLE

Paratextual (re)framing of media coverage of Christchurch Mosque Shootings: A translation-oriented study

Hadeel Smadi¹, Mohammed Obeidat² and Ahmad S Haider¹*

Abstract: This study investigates the role of translation in (re)framing different narratives of the Christchurch Mosque Shootings. It focuses on how translators utilized the paratextual elements to re-frame this terror attack and circulate the ideological attitudes of the media outlets they work for. The research data consist of eleven pairs of Arabic and English articles that were collected from five media outlets, namely, The Middle East Media Research Institute (MEMRI), Middle East Online (MEO), Aljazeera, Al-Manar, and Sputnik. Adopting Baker's model of narrative theory, this study showed that the selected media outlets utilized four paratextual framing devices, namely, titles, images with captions, headings (intertitles), and introductions. Adding new headings was the most commonly used device by the selected media outlets, whereas adding new introductions was the least used device. Examining readers' comments on MEMRI's posts on social media exhibited the impact of this incident's re-framing in tarnishing the image of Islam and Muslims. This study is of vital significance to media workers and owners, translators, and researchers in political communication.

Subjects: Intercultural Communication; Mass Communication; Language & Linguistics

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Hadeel M. Al-Smadi is a lecturer in the Department of English Language and Translation at the Applied Science Private University. Her main areas of interest include Media Translation, Scientific Translation, Narrative Theory, and Religious Translation.

Mohammed M. Obeidat is an associate professor of Translation in the Department of English Language and Translation. His research interests include interpreting, discourse analysis, political discourse, pragmatics, and translation theories. He has been teaching translation and interpreting courses since 2011.

Ahmad S Haider (Corresponding) is an associate professor in the Department of English Language and Translation at the Applied Science Private University. He received his Ph.D. in Linguistics from the University of Canterbury/New Zealand. His main areas of interest include corpus linguistics, discourse analysis, pragmatics, and translation studies. http://orcid.org/0000-0002-7763-201X

PUBLIC INTEREST STATEMENT

Media is an effective tool that steers people’s attitudes towards different events. Some pieces of news are originally written in foreign languages and need to be translated. This way, translators are responsible not only for finding language equivalents but also for re-framing the piece of news in a way that suits the agendas and policies of the media institutions they work for. In the current study, we investigated the paratextual re-framing of eleven pairs of Arabic and English news articles on Christchurch Mosque Shootings to evaluate the impact of the political orientation of five news outlets on propagating a particular narrative. The findings showed that media outlets used four paratextual devices, namely titles, images with captions, headings, and introductions to re-frame the source narrative. This study can help readers understand how the same event is covered differently based on the reporting language and the political leanings of media outlets.
Keywords: Christchurch Attack; New Zealand; Framing Narratives; Ideology; Media Translation

1. Introduction
Media is an essential element of mass communication through which people view the world and understand reality. It has a powerful capacity to shape the receivers’ knowledge and affect the individuals’ perceptions about the different local and global events (Al-Salman & Haider, 2021; Haider & Hussein, 2020). In light of this, media translation could be viewed as one of the essential branches in the field of translation as it has increasingly played a crucial role in negotiations and power games. Thus, the process of media translation becomes heftier when the text has a sensitive nature, as is the case in politics. Due to the “cultural turn” that emerged in the late 1970s (Munday, 2016), news translation becomes a complicated area to investigate as power and ideology can intervene in many areas, even in translation, to serve particular agendas. Therefore, translation could be used to manipulate reality and change the mindset and thoughts of people. Baker (2018) has revolutionized translation studies by rejecting Norm theory and Venuti’s ideas; domestication and foreignization, and introducing the narrative theory. This theory may be viewed as a challenge to the West since Baker has proved how incidents and news stories related to Arabs and Muslims could be narrated in different ways by various news agencies to serve different agendas concerning the image of Islam and its relationship to terrorism.

One of the recent events that attracted the attention of the entire world is the Christchurch Mosque Shootings. An Australian white supremacist committed a massacre in two mosques in Christchurch, leaving 51 dead and 49 injured (Haider et al., 2021). This study investigates the role of translation in (re)framing Christchurch Mosque Shootings, which produced different versions of stories, by analyzing the paratextual elements of English and Arabic news articles related to this incident.

This study derives its significance from the fact that the relations between the West and Islam are profoundly unsettled. This is because of linking Islam incorrectly to terrorism. Although few studies tackled (re)framing narratives in media translation, this study is significant since it analyzes and investigates the (re)framing of the March 2019 mosque attack’s narratives. It also shows the sophisticated relationships between translation, politics, ideology, and power. Furthermore, this study analyzes data by adopting the narrative theory; thus, it fills a gap in the literature of translation studies. It attempts to answer the following question:

• What are the main paratextual framing devices that translators used in (re)framing the 2019 Christchurch mosque attacks narratives in five media outlets?

2. Media and translation
Media is a powerful means for circulating political and ideological discourse (Al-Abbas & Haider, 2020; Haider & Olomy, 2019; Saed, 2019). The main factor that makes this power effective is the repetition of some intended narratives through various means such as news articles, reports, and interviews. According to Fairclough (2001, p. 54) “the effects of the media power are cumulative, working through the repletion of particular ways of hanging causality and agency, particular ways of positioning the reader, and so forth.” Van Dijk (1997) argued that sources of information are colonized by certain political agendas to control public opinions.

Media outlets can achieve their political and ideological agendas by exploiting different ideological strategies. Shunnaq (1992) shed light on two of these strategies, namely monitoring and managing. In the former, the media outlet tries to describe events by presenting any evidence available without any intervention, while in the latter, the media outlet tries to direct and steer events to serve its political agendas. Therefore, when the media outlet follows the monitoring strategy, it is viewed as an observer of the event, whereas in the managing strategy, it is viewed as a part of the event itself.
Schäffner and Bassnett (2010) investigated the relationship between media and translation. They stated that although translators' work in media is still a hidden task and, in many cases, translators are named as journalists, translation is a key factor in mass media outlets and involves procedures that affect the content and style of news coverage. Any translated news item must go through a set of stages before being published, starting with initial editing, summarizing, and translating, followed by second editing and publishing. Furthermore, news translation has a set of specific characteristics that distinguish it from other forms of translation. These characteristics include conveying information in a simple, direct, and explicit language that corresponds to all readers' educational levels, which is the primary goal of news translators since news is directed to the mass audiences, not to a specific class of society. In addition, news translators should follow the news agency's policy to which they belong, taking into account available space and culture. Also, in many cases, news translators work as proofreaders and back translators. Finally, they should be objective to the ST rather than faithful since objectivity is the basis of news agencies (Bielsa, 2007).

It is worth mentioning that according to Bielsa (2007), the process of translating news includes different types of textual intervention to meet news agencies' political and ideological goals. These modifications include changing titles, deleting unnecessary information, adding background information, and reordering and summarizing. Furthermore, according to Schäffner and Bassnett (2010), several aspects should be clear before translating any news item. These include determining the SL and the TL, the type of translation, whether written or oral, the number of translators or interpreters, and the person responsible for publishing the material.

3. Review of related literature

3.1. Theoretical framework

This study adopts the narrative theory as a theoretical framework since it is a dynamic and flexible approach that recognizes the complexity of human behavior and does not follow static patterns (Baker, 2010). Furthermore, it focuses on the impact of translation on the target readers, the relation between texts to see the larger narrative, and the role of translators and interpreters as active actors in constructing reality. This theory is introduced by Baker (2018), who defined narrative as:

‘Public and personal ‘stories’ that we subscribe to and that guide our behavior. They are the stories we tell ourselves, not just those we explicitly tell other people, about the world(s) in which we live. The terms’ narrative’ and ‘story’ are interchangeable in this context.’ (Baker, 2018, p. 19)

In other words, narratives are the stories that depict our lives at a specific time and place and are performed by certain characters (protagonists, real or imaginary) who have relationships with each other within the same narrative. Thus, these stories have a vital role in shaping the public's behaviors and morals.

Baker (2018) argued that translators and interpreters play a significant role in disseminating public narratives within their communities by ensuring that all members of a society share the same perspectives promoted in these shared stories. However, translators may also be “loyal to dissenting ideologies internal to a culture, or affiliations and agendas external to a culture” (Tymoczko, 2003, p. 201). Ultimately, this may lead to positioning themselves differently in relation to domestic narratives. Furthermore, translators and interpreters play a role in spreading domestic public narratives outside their own countries to have a large readership for their narratives or try to attract foreign audience with different views.

On a par with narrative, Baker (2018) used the concept of framing to show how translation can construct or (re)frame the same story in the target text. Baker pointed out that there are different ways to (re)frame the same narrative that could be narrated by different narrators based on different skopos and political agendas. Thus, the researcher analyzes data in terms of how translation can maintain, undermine or modify the aspects of a particular narrative.
This study uses the narrative theory as a theoretical framework to analyze and classify some articles related to the Christchurch Shootings based on the paratextual framing. The term “paratext” was first introduced by the French theorist Gerard (Genette, 1997), who studied this notion in literature, stating that all supplementary materials surrounding the main text are considered paratext (Genette, 1997). Furthermore, he stated that a paratext is an essential part of a text, and any text without a paratext is not a text. However, this notion has rapidly received considerable attention from some scholars who tried to adopt this notion to translation studies. For example, Wolf (2006) defined paratext as:

‘parts of individual works and are positioned at their borders but are discernible not only through their liminal position, but also, and, above all, through their function as introductory, explanatory, etc. material that forms a “threshold” to the main text of the work in question.’ (Wolf, 2006, p. 20).

There are several devices that fall under paratextual framings (Wolf, 2006). These devices include titles, epigraphs, footnotes, postscripts, intitiles (in printed literature), the opening or closing credits (in films), images, picture frames, or captions (in visual arts). Wolf (2006) provided a clear borderline between two types of paratextual framing, namely “authorized” or “intra-compositional” or “unauthorized” or “extra-compositional.” While the former refers to the paratextual devices used by the original text writer, the latter refers to the paratextual devices modified or added to the original framed text by others, including translators and interpreters. Generally speaking, the importance of paratextual framing devices lies in their mediating between the text itself and the readers of that text (Kovala, 1996).

3.2. Empirical studies

Al Sharif (2009) examined the Palestinian narratives, in general, and the Palestinian mothers’ narratives, in particular, in terms of translation. The focus was on the materials tackling the issue of Palestinian women translated into the website of MEMRI (the Middle East Media Research Institute). Adopting the narrative theory, the researcher highlighted the primary mechanisms used to (re)frame these narratives in the period of the second Intifada from October 2000 to October 2007. Al Sharif (2009) concluded that MEMRI is one of the most important web-based advocacy groups that accentuate the Arab conflicts and promote certain narratives against Arabs and Muslims. Furthermore, the study found that MEMRI follows systematic procedures to circulate the dominant narrative that depicts Palestinians as terrorists and Israel as a state of law. In addition, it was pointed out that MEMRI constructs certain narratives that portray Palestinian women as heartless mothers who enjoy seeing their sons lying in coffins. Moreover, it was found that MEMRI uses framing mechanisms to convey its hostile narratives towards Arabs and Muslims, such as bracketed additions, worded titles, and summary introductions to include the incidents mentioned in the target text within the larger narratives of terrorism that project Palestinians as an imminent threat.

Pormouzeh (2014) adopted a qualitative research design to investigate the re-narration of Iran’s cultural and political news in Western media from 2000 to 2012. The sample of this study consisted of 15 headlines collected from Western media. Pormouzeh (2014) analyzed the data based on the four features of narrativity in reference to Persian and English narratives. Applying Fisher’s narrative paradigm to assess the English samples, the study concluded that several types of interfering were exploited by translators and institutions in the process of re-narrating Iran’s news, including thematic selection emphasizing that narratives represent reality and constitute this reality.

Similarly, Hijjo and Kaur (2017b) examined the role of media in exploiting translation to reconstruct and (re)frame Daesh’s narratives. The study explored the effectiveness of a contextual framing in changing the narratives on Daesh terrorist’s acts and their influence in distorting the image of Islam and Muslims. The sample of the study consisted of Arabic political editorials on Daesh and their translation in the Middle East Media Research Institute (MEMRI) from 2013 to 2016. The study found that context plays a critical role in (re)frame a narrative, being a dependent variable steered by some factors, such as politics, religion, culture, and ideology. Hijjo and Kaur (2017b) concluded that MEMRI (re) framed Daesh’s narratives by exploiting framing features, such as selective appropriation, relationality,
and temporality, and framing strategies, such as adding new information to the translated text and providing biographic information about the author of the original narrative via preface and introduction.

Boukhaffa (2018) examined narrative (re)framing in the Arabic translation of Lewis’s work, The Crisis of Islam: Holy War and Unholy Terror. The researcher investigated the ways in which Lewis’s narrative is (re)framed to serve different political agendas in Haykal's Arabic translations of the work. Boukhaffa (2018) used a qualitative research design and adopted narrative theory as a theoretical framework. Boukhaffa (2018) found that Haykal used some strategies to retrieve the original Islamic narrative, such as re-appropriation and re-textualization of the cultural and religious indicators, especially in the Quran and Hadiths. The analysis showed that the main drive behind Haykal's translation is to defy and resist the narrative of the Muslim history crafted by Lewis. Furthermore, Boukhaffa (2018) argued that Haykal's translation is a good example of how geopolitical and ideological aspects may affect the translator's use of re-framing strategies.

After reviewing the literature and based on the researchers’ best knowledge, no study has been conducted to investigate the (re)framing of the narratives on March 2019 Christchurch Shootings through translation in five Arabic and English media outlets, namely The Middle East Media Research Institute (MEMRI), Aljazeera, Al-Manar, and The Middle East Online (MOE). It explores the impact of re-framing on shaping readers’ points of view regarding Islam and Muslims. This makes this study significant and fills a gap in the literature of translation studies.

4. Method and procedures
This section introduces the methods and procedures followed in the current study.

4.1. Data collection
The data of this study consist of eleven pairs of Arabic and English articles on Christchurch Mosque Shootings released from five news websites with different ideological perspectives in the period from 15 March 2019 to 1 September 2019. These media outlets are The Middle East Media Research Institute (MEMRI), Middle East Online (MEO), Aljazeera, Al-Manar, and Sputnik.

MEMRI is a pro-Israel media institution launched in 1998. Its public narrative emphasizes the stereotype of Arab and Islam as extremists, terrorists, and anti-Semitic. MEMRI’s articles and translation, which are usually combined in a single article, appear in several languages. The choice of source and target languages differs from time to time based on changes in international relations (Baker, 2010). The Middle East Online (MEO) is an online website located in London. Aljazeera is a well-known news channel founded in 1996 in Qatar. It has more than 80 bureaus worldwide. It is accused of promoting Muslim Brotherhood. Al-Manar is a Lebanese channel known for its affiliation to Hezbollah. It was launched in 1991 in Beirut. Sputnik is a news agency established by the Russian government-owned news agency Rossiya Segodnya in 2014.

4.2. Procedures
The procedures followed in this study are:

- Selecting an event that was densely covered by news outlets: the Christchurch terror attack was selected.
- Looking for news outlets and agencies in Arabic and English: Five media outlets were selected, namely The Middle East Media Research Institute (MEMRI), Middle East Online (MEO), Aljazeera, Al-Manar, and Sputnik.
- Using the main search engines for the selected outlets and searching for some query terms such as New Zealand Massacre, New Zealand Mosque Attack, and Christchurch Mass Shooting.
- Eleven pairs of Arabic and English articles were retrieved.
- Comparing the source text with its translation.
Exercises the translated extracts that were paratextually (re)framed.

- Classifying these extracts based on the primary types of paratextual (re)framing, including introductions and prefaces, titles and headings, images with captions, and cover design.

- Discussing the impact of these (re)framing devices on shaping readers’ attitudes towards Islam and the West.

5. Analysis and results

The researchers examined the paratexual framing devices used by the selected media outlets to (re)frame New Zealand’s event, as Figure 1 shows.

Based on the findings, the selected media outlets utilized four paratexual framing devices, namely titles, images with captions, headings (intertitles), and introductions. As Figure 1 shows, adding headings is the most commonly-used device with 41%, whereas adding introductions is the least used by the selected media outlets with 15%.

5.1. Titles

Titles are the first elements that draw readers’ attention to the content of the text. They affect the way in which readers receive a text. By occupying an initial position with a bold font, titles, whether original or translated, can be exploited to steer and guide people’s thoughts regarding specific events by strengthening or undermining certain public narratives (Lanser, 1981). Therefore, due to the fact that neutral translation is a myth, titles are considered “the first sites of (re)framing—or, manipulating-of the original narrative and signal devices of a new ideologically-positioned narrative” (Hijjo & Kaur, 2017a, p. 25).

The analysis of the selected parallel texts shows that translators employed titles to strengthen or undermine different narratives related to the Christchurch terror attack, Islam, and the West in as (Table 1) shows.

In example (1), the title of the English article, retrieved from Al-Manar, is “Hezbollah Denounces Horrific Massacre against Worshippers in New Zealand” whereas the TT “حزب الله يدين المجزرة في نيوزيلندا: الاعتداءات ضد المسلمين تغذيها الولايات المتحدة” “Hezbollah Condemns the Massacre in New Zealand: extremism against Muslims is fueled by the U.S.” The translator re-framed the original narrative by adding “النظام المتعاظم ضد المسلمين تغذيها الولايات المتحدة” “extremism against Muslims is fueled by the U.S.” to draw the readers’ attention that the U.S. is the source that funds and promotes extremism against Muslims worldwide. In addition, this choice may steer the Arab readers to a framed-oriented interpretation that intends to incite hatred against the United States.

In example (2), Al-Manar replaced the narrative of the ST with a new one. While the ST is “Australian PM Pillories Erdogan for ‘Reckless,’ ‘Vile’ Christchurch Comments,” the TT is “أردوغان حول مجزرة نيوزيلندا المتى،” “Australian Prime Minister praises Erdogan’s more “moderate” position on the New Zealand massacre.” It is clear that Al-Manar, in the translated text, tries to weave a new narrative in order to reduce the intensity of Erdogan’s comments concerning New Zealand’s attack.
Furthermore, the Arabic title may be misleading to the target readers regarding the strained relationships between Tukey, New Zealand, and Australia. It is also worth noting that according to Baker (2018), framing the title should be accompanied by an inevitable shift in the text itself to weave a very well-rehearsed story. Consequently, Al-Manar used different textual framing devices, including selective appropriation feature (select or de-select particular information) to underline the moderation of Erdogan's speech.

In example (3), the English title is “New Zealand Massacre Suspect Pleads Not Guilty to Terrorism, Murder Charges” while the Arabic title is “فسح نوروزليا يفاجئ العالم بتصرح جريء.” “The butcher of New Zealand surprises the world with a bold statement.” Sputnik, in its translation, re-framed the narrative by changing “Australian gunman” to “قاتل” which is an intensive active participle of the Arabic verb “القاتل” which means “whoever sheds blood and is characterized by unjustified murder.” This indicates how horrible the crime he committed is and how merciless, ruthless and cruel the man is. Furthermore, using the phrase “surprises the world with a bold statement” evokes the narrative that the statement of the murderer is unexpected and shocking, and shows his deep-rooted grudge and hatred against Muslims. Drawing on the aforementioned examples, it is evident that manipulating titles by framing “can be used very effectively to (re)frame narratives in translation” (Baker, 2018, p. 129).

| No. | Source               | ST                                                                 | TT                                                                 | Back Translation                                                                 |
|-----|---------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1   | Al-Manar            | “Hezbollah Denounces Horrific Massacre against Worshippers in New Zealand” | https://english.almanar.com.lb/697479                                | Hezbollah Condemns the Massacre in New Zealand: Extremism Against Muslims is Fueled by The U.S |
| 2   | Al-Manar            | “Australian PM Pillories Erdogan for ‘Reckless,’ ‘Vile’ Christchurch Comments” | http://english.almanar.com.lb/700042                                  | Australian Prime Minister Praises Erdogan's More "Moderate" Position on the New Zealand Massacre |
| 3   | Sputnik             | “New Zealand Massacre Suspect Plead Not Guilty to Terrorism, Murder Charges” | https://arabic.sputniknews.com/world/20190614104166708-%D8%B3%D9%81%D8%A7%D8%AD-%D9%86%D9%8A%D9%88%D8%B2%D9%8A%D9%84%D9%86%D8%A7-%D8%B9%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A1%D9%8A%D8%AD-%D8%AC%D8%B1%D9%8A%D8%A1/ | The Butcher of New Zealand Surprises the World with a Bold Statement |
5.2. Images with captions

Images are nowadays essential elements of Media and cover all types of pictures, cartoons, and maps. They have the power to shape and steer the receivers’ opinions regarding any news coverage before they even start reading it. Thus, re-framing the images with their captions means distorting or eliminating other narrative components to serve an intended skopos (Hijjo & Kaur, 2017a). Conducting a contrastive analysis of some selected news articles and their translations showed that paratextual image framing is used by different media outlets to evoke different narratives. (Tables 2, 3, and 4) show examples of changing images with captions.

| Table 2. Example (1) on paratextual image framing |
|-----------------------------------------------|
| ![Source Image](https://www.aphad.tv/%D8%B3%D8%AD%D9%81-%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%82%D8%A7%D9%87%D8%B1%D8%A9-%D9%85%D8%B9%D8%A8%D8%AD%D8%A9-%D9%86%D9%88%D8%B2%D9%8A%D9%84%D9%86%D8%AF%D8%A7%D8%84%D9%88/)
| ![Target Image](https://www.memri.org/reports/reactions-arab-world-new-zealand-mosque-massacre-accusations-islamophobia-terrorism-against)

The “radical right” creates the demon of “Islamophobia” (Al-Sharaq Al-AwsatLDN, March 16, 2019)
Table 2 shows that MEMRI replaced the image of the source article, retrieved from the Egyptian newspaper Al-Ahram, with a new image taken from the Saudi newspaper Al-Sharq Al-Awsat. In the source article, the Egyptian journalist Mursi’ Atallah discussed New Zealand’s massacre and the western movements responsible for this incident without mentioning any specific group. It is evident that colors in the source image are used to refer to the world’s reaction toward the massacre, where black represents grief and red indicates blood. However, MEMRI replaced this image with the target one to elaborate its narrative that Atallah, who represents a national position by employing the contextual thematic framing, accuses the radical right of creating and promoting the
“Islamophobia.” Furthermore, MEMRI set some additional steps to convince the target readers that this image is taken from the original text, leaving the Arabic words "اٰﻟﯿﻤﯿـﺘ(311,490),(691,752)" "the radical right" and "اٰﺳﻼـﻣـﻮـﻔـﯿـﯿـاٰ" “Islamophobia” in the body of the image itself without translation.

Similarly, in example (2), Aljazeera reconstructed the English article under investigation by substituting the source image with another, most likely to frame readers' interpretation (Table 3).

In the source English article, Aljazeera inserted the image of Erdogan with the caption “President Erdogan has said terrorism has no religion, language or race” to highlight Erdogan’s remarks on the incident to the western readers. However, in the target Arabic text, Aljazeera used the Australian PM’s image with the caption "لرئيس وزراء أستراليا وصف تصريحات أردوغان بشأن مجزرة نيوزيلندا بال cinéمة للغة "Australian PM described Erdogan's statements on New Zealand massacre as very offensive.” Such re-framing aims to draw the Arab readers’ attention towards Erdogan's position regarding New Zealand's massacre, considering it part of the attack on Turkey and Islam, on the one hand, and how such remarks are viewed by others, represented by the Australian PM. Therefore, Aljazeera exploited this paratextual device to serve different skopos according to the used language and target audience.

MEO, in example 3, re-framed its narrative to the target readers by changing only the caption of the image in the one instance, and confirms its narrative by adding another image to the TT in another instance.

In the first image, the English caption is “The Christchurch terror attacks sparked global revulsion” expressing the world’s position regarding the attack, while in the Arabic translation, the caption reads
"The UAE never tolerates extremist thought." This latter caption highlights the narrative that UAE confronts extremism and terror, knowing that this caption is preceded by the title "UAE deports man sacked for praising NZ attacks." Moreover, MEO added a new image to the TT displaying the rulers of UAE with Pope Francis, Head of the Catholic Church, and Dr. Ahmad El-Tayeb, the Grand Imam of al-Azhar, to accentuate the UAE’s tolerance and peaceful coexistence narrative and show that the employee’s behavior is an individual case. Therefore, MEO used two paratextual framing devices, namely titles and images with captions, to convince the target reader with its oriented framed narrative.

Based on the examples above, changing images as a paratextual framing device plays a critical role in reconstructing reality and shaping the public’s thoughts. This conclusion is thoroughly discussed by some scholars (see, Al-Herthani, 2009; Baker, 2018; Al Sharif, 2009). According to Al-Herthani (2009, p. 64):

“Images can even be used to challenge the main narrative, or specific narratives [...] These functions and the ‘complex interplay’ between the text and the image assume special importance in the case of translation [...] Thus, images constitute an important paratextual device that can be employed by translators and/or mediators to locate a text within a specific narrative.”
| No. | Source | ST | TT |
|-----|--------|----|----|
| 1   | MEMRI | -  | “Many writers blamed the massacre on the radical right in the West, which has been gaining strength in recent years, and which, they said, is spreading racist hatred against Muslims. Some also described Trump as a leader of the radical right. They called to combat this extremist discourse before it triggers further massacres and perhaps even a war of civilizations and a climate similar to the one that led to the rise of the Nazis in Germany and the outbreak of World War II”. [https://www.memri.org/reports/reactions-Arab-world-new-zealand-mosque-massacre-accusations-islamophobia-terrorism-again](https://www.memri.org/reports/reactions-Arab-world-new-zealand-mosque-massacre-accusations-islamophobia-terrorism-again) |
| 2   | MEMRI | -  | “Some elements in the Arab world, including Hezbollah and the Syrian regime, as well as Jordanian officials and writers, took a harsher line, accusing the West, and in particular the U.S., of being behind ‘every form and type’ of terror in the world. Some even claimed that the U.S. had created the Islamic terror organizations, such as ISIS, with the aim of inciting the world against the Muslims, and are thus also responsible for terror against Muslims, like the New Zealand massacre.” [https://www.memri.org/reports/reactions-Arab-world-new-zealand-mosque-massacre-accusations-islamophobia-terrorism-again](https://www.memri.org/reports/reactions-Arab-world-new-zealand-mosque-massacre-accusations-islamophobia-terrorism-again) |

(Continued)
5.3. Introductions (Prefaces)

Introductions are one of the salient overt framing devices that has a quotable and discernible effect on the recipients’ response to a particular narrative bearing in mind that the location of framing, whether initial, internal, or terminal, plays a pivotal role in the guiding process of the readers’ interpretation of the narrative embedded in the text (Wolf, 2006). Therefore, occupying the initial position in either the ST or the TT is of great importance. Introductions and prefaces function as a mediator between para- and intratextual framings that are considered as “interpretive instructions” (Wolf, 2006, p. 21). They help readers establish connections between the immediate narrative, i.e., the narrative embedded in the text itself, and the larger narrative, i.e., the contextualization that surrounds the text, i.e., the narrative that the text is embedded in (Al Sharif, 2009).

Analyzing some selected texts, it is observed that MEMRI and MEO employed introductions framing to reinforce particular frames that steer readers’ thoughts toward the intended narrative. (Table 5) shows various examples of paratextual introductions framing.

In example (1), MEMRI allocated a specific section for adding an introduction. This deliberate addition is employed to serve the framing process by injecting readers with some information that forms the recipients’ initial expectations regarding the narrative in question, which is elaborated in detail in the translated text (Wolf, 2006). MEMRI re-shaped the TT by adding an ideologically laden introduction before inserting the translated text to offer some insights for recipients before reading the remaining part of the text. It is evident that MEMRI, by adding this introduction, draws the readers’ attention to the “claims” of some Arab writers who attribute the responsibility of the New Zealand massacre to the radical right which is supported by some western countries. Furthermore, MEMRI highlighted the narrative that some of those writers considered Trump, who disseminates the discourse of hate in the West, the leader of the radical right. Moreover, such addition may steer the recipients’ focus towards the writers’ opinion regarding the expected impacts of the continued rising of the radical right in the West without combating. Using the verb “combat” indicates that Arab writers stir war since “combat” means “fighting during a war.” Some expressions in the added introduction may create such an impact. These include “ carrying out more massacres against immigrant minorities, especially against Muslim immigrants,” and “creating a climate similar to the one that led to the rise of the Nazis in Germany and thus outbreaking of World War II.”
aggressive foreign policy of Nazis, headed by Hitler, is considered the primary cause that led to the outbreak of World War II. Therefore, linking Trump and the Radical Right with Hitler and Nazism evoked a narrative that both parties disseminate hatred in the world and thus will ignite a third World War.

By describing the rising power of the radical right on the writers’ lips, MEMRI may direct readers to the narrative that those writers indirectly criticize the western peoples, especially the Americans, for advocating this party. According to Hijjo and Kaur (2017a), MEMRI tends to transfer the roles of the participants. In the investigated text, it appears as if MEMRI is the author of the text, not a translation agency, and the readers of the Arab writers become the readers of MEMRI.

Similarly, MEMRI, in example (2), added another introduction, preceded by the heading “The West, U.S. Are Behind All Terror, Including Islamic Terror,” to the translated text. It is clear that MEMRI attempted to set the scene for the recipients shedding light on the narrative that some Arab official entities, including Hizbullah, the Syrian regime, and some Jordanian officials and writers, are not content with the narrative of attributing the massacre to the radical right. However, they accuse the West, particularly the U.S., of being responsible for all types of terror in the world, including the Islamic terror. Furthermore, MEMRI draws readers’ attention to the “claim” that the U.S. creates all terrorist organizations, like ISIS, in the name of Islam to tarnish Islam’s image and incite the West against Muslims by linking terror to Islam. Using the verb “claim” indicates that the Arab writers accused the U.S. without any evidence since “claim” means “to state or assert that something is the case, typically without providing evidence or proof.” Based on this, MEMRI, by adding this concentrated and deliberate introduction, tries to polish up the image of the U.S. to the target readers by focusing on the “claims” of some Arab officials. It is worth noting that MEMRI, in the two introductions, makes use of thematic contextual framing by using “many,” “some,” “officials,” and “writers” without mentioning the writers’ names to generalize these opinions.

Example (3) shows how MEO replaced the English introduction with a new one in the TT to steer the readers’ thoughts to another narrative. Although the massacre was described as a “terrorist attack” in the English text, MEO deleted the whole expression to deviate the readers’ attention to the remarks of the murderer. Additionally, while the original narrative highlighted the religious extremism in the West by inserting the number of victims, the target narrative focused on ethnic extremism by mentioning that the main suspect believes in white supremacy. Therefore, substituting the narrative in the introduction may accompany shifts in the text to achieve the intended goal of the news agency (Baker, 2018).

5.4. Headings (Intertitles)
Headings are a paratextual material added by the text author to divide a text thematically into sections and therefore facilitate the process of reading (Hijjo & Kaur, 2017a). Headings, intertitles, or internal titles are also employed in translation to (re)frame narratives in translated texts since they have a significant impact on producing coherent narratives by connecting different narrative elements together and guiding readers to a newly designed narrative (Al Sharif, 2009).

The analysis of the selected parallel texts shows that MEMRI’s translators employed paratextual “heading” framing to weave a coherent narrative that fits with a larger narrative. (Table 6) shows examples of paratextual “heading” framing utilized by MEMRI.

MEMRI combined fifteen Arabic articles written in different Arabic newspapers regarding the Christchurch Mosque Shootings under one translated article titled “Reactions In Arab World To New Zealand Mosque Massacre: Accusations Of Islamophobia, Terrorism Against West, U.S., Alongside Calls For Joint Fight Against Extremism.” MEMRI divided the Arabic articles into sections based on the writers’ reactions, whether neutral or against the West, and added a main heading for each section and a heading for each article within the section. As (Table 6) above, MEMRI added the
Table 6. Examples of paratextual “heading” framing

| No. | Source | TT |
|-----|--------|----|
| 1   | MEMRI  | “The West, U.S. Are Behind All Terror, Including Islamic Terror” https://www.memri.org/reports/reactions-Arab-world-new-zealand-mosque-massacre-accusations-islamophobia-terrorism-against |
| 1.1 |        | “Assad Advisor: The Terror In New Zealand Is an Outcome of Western Incitement; The Islamic Terror Organizations Are a Western Creation” |
| 1.2 |        | “Syrian Writers: U.S., Europe Responsible for Spread of Terror in the World” |
| 1.3 |        | “Jordanian MP: The Real ISIS Lurks in the Minds of the American and Western Leaders; The Attacks of Muslim Terrorists were Masterminded by the West” |
| 1.4 |        | “Jordanian Columnist: The West is the Source Of Terrorism; Islam Has No connection to Terrorism” |

main heading “The West, U.S. Are Behind All Terror, Including Islamic Terror” to direct readers’ thought to the designed narrative in which some Arab writers accused the West, particular the U.S., of being the creator of terror, including the Islamic one. Under this heading, MEMRI added four headings before the translated article to mislead the readers that this heading is used in the original Arabic article. As examples (1.1, 1.2, 1.3, and 1.4) show, these headings function as explanatory headings to convince readers of the desired narrative.

MEMRI, by using this strategy, tends to weave a narrative in which some Arab countries attributed the responsibility of all types and forms of terror to the U.S., and therefore immediately activate the narrative of tarnishing Muslims’ image, inciting the West against Muslims, and at the same time beautifying the image of the U.S. to the target readers. In example 1.3, the use of the verb “lurk” is solid evidence to enhance this point since the verb has a connotation of “waiting or moving in a secret way so that you cannot be seen, especially because you are about to attack someone or do something wrong.” By the use of this verb, MEMRI directs the readers’ attention to the Jordanian MP’s viewpoint in which he alludes that there might be worse actions in the future.

6. Discussion
This section aims to highlight the possible impact of media translation in shaping public opinions regarding the image of Islam in the West based on the analysis of the social media webpages of one of the investigated media outlets, namely, MEMRI. The analysis above showed that MEMRI exploited this incident to emphasize its meta-narrative to the English recipients about the stereotype of Arabs as terrorists and extremists. Thus, MEMRI portrayed Islam as a religion of terrorism.
by suppressing and accentuating particular aspects of Christchurch Shootings’ narratives. It narrated some Arab writers as instigators of terrorism, portraying America as the source of terrorism worldwide. MEMRI used (re)framing strategies to serve its political and ideological agendas by feeding the target readers’ thoughts with ideas that match their stereotypes of Arabs. One of the MEMRI website’s sections is “Jihad and Terrorism threat Monitor,” which is introduced as:

‘The MEMRI Jihad and Terrorism Threat Monitor (JT TM) scrutinizes Islamist terrorism and violent extremism worldwide, with special focus on activity within and emanating from the
Arab world, Pakistan, Afghanistan, and Iran, as well as on attacks and activity in the West inspired and encouraged by the Islamic State (ISIS), Al-Qaeda, and other global jihad organizations. This activity includes lone-wolf attacks by residents of Western countries.

The JTMM monitors imminent and potential threats posed by various terrorist and violent extremist organizations – such as ISIS, Al-Qaeda and its affiliates, and emerging jihadi groups – and individuals. These threats, whether strategic, tactical, military, conventional, non-conventional, or cyber, may be against national security and public safety in the U.S. and the West, or against these countries' crucial interests and assets worldwide. It also examines and analyzes the ideological motivations behind these threats, and includes a decade and a half of archives of exclusive content on jihad and terrorism.

Examining some of the readers’ reactions in the social media webpage of MEMRI, it is observed that it works to achieve its skpos by exploiting the New Zealand terror attack in a way that serves its larger narrative. Table 7 includes a sample of comments extracted from posts updated on the popular official webpages of MEMRI on Facebook (185,600 Likes) and Twitter (74.8k Followers) regarding the New Zealand attack.

As it is discussed before, MEMRI intentionally tends to distort the image of Islam and Arabs to the English readers by portraying Islam as the religion of hatred and terrorism. Furthermore, it steers the readers thought to the claims that Islam disseminates hate discourse. The results of this study regarding MEMRI are in line with the ones found by some scholars who examined how MEMRI employed (re)framing strategies to elaborate its narrative regarding Palestinian mothers (Al Sharif, 2009) and Daesh (ISIS; Hijjo & Kaur, 2017a, 2017b).

7. Conclusion and recommendations
This study investigated the role of translation in (re)framing Christchurch terror attack narratives by analyzing eleven pairs of Arabic and English news articles retrieved from five media outlets. It also aimed to highlight the possible impact of media translation in shaping public opinions regarding the image of Islam in the West based on the analysis of the social media pages of one of the investigated media outlets, namely, MEMRI. The findings showed that the five selected media outlets utilized four para-textual framing devices, namely titles, images with captions, headings (intertitles), and introductions. Al-Manar exploited the event to accuse the U.S. of being a supporter of extremism against Muslims. Furthermore, Al-Jazeera and Al-Manar tended to portray Erdogan in a good way. Sputnik narrated the event to Arab readers by illustrating the horror of the crime and the murderer’s hatred of Muslims. MEO maintained a relatively neutral position regarding the incident and highlighted the role of the UAE in fighting terrorism worldwide. Such narratives are in line with the ideological and political positions of the translating institutions and the target readership. Such findings are in agreement with Qin and Zhang (2018), who showed that the target readership, the relationships between countries, and the position of the news agency are the main factors constraining (re)framing narratives.

This study used a particular type of data (media texts) and discussed the coverage of one event (Christchurch Shootings) in two languages (Arabic and English) within a defined theoretical and framework (narrative theory) to answer particular research questions. Further research can be conducted on other critical events that were reported in different language pairs. In addition, other researchers can examine the strategies used in translating the news articles from the source language into a target language. Also, the impact of (re)framing narratives in media translation on shaping and steering readers’ thoughts and behavior can also be quantitatively investigated. The findings of this study could be beneficial for Islamic Research Centers, translation departments, and researchers in media and communication, and media workers and owners.
References

Al Sharif, S. S. (2009). Translation in the service of advocacy: Narrating Palestine and Palestinian women in translations by the middle east media research institute (MEMRI). (Doctoral Dissertation), The University of Manchester. https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?uin=uk.bl.ethos.5029986&bclid=IwAR2n9e2TDELKNowYp5_7Kc0U0cm5Wv4W8NiYoEZVj3l5ySm5Yxcto

Al-Abbas, L. S., & Haider, A. S. (2020). The representation of homosexuals in Arabic-language news outlets. Equality, Diversity Inclusion: An International Journal, 40(3), 309–337. https://doi.org/10.1108/EDI-05-2020-0130

Al-Herthami, M. M. (2009). Edward Said in Arabic: narrativity and paratextual framing. (doctoral dissertation), University of Manchester. https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?uin=uk.bl.ethos.497188

Al-Salmon, S., & Haider, A. S. (2021). The representation of covid-19 and China in Reuters’ and Xinhua’s headlines. Search (Malaysia), 13(1), 93–110. https://flsmjournals.taylors.edu.my/wp-content/uploads/search/search-2021-13-1/search-2021-p8-13-1.pdf

Baker, M. (2010). Narratives of terrorism and security: ‘Accurate’ translations, suspicious frames. Critical Studies on Terrorism, 3(3), 347–364. https://doi.org/10.1080/17539153.2010.521639

Baker, M. (2018). Translation and conflict: A narrative account. Routledge.

Bielsen, E. (2007). Translation in global news agencies. International Journal of Translation Studies, 19(1), 135–155. https://doi.org/10.1075/target.19.1.08bie

Boukhaffa, A. (2018). Narrative (re) framing in translating modern Orientalism: A study of the Arabic translation of Lewis’s The Crisis of Islam: Holy War and Unholy Terror. The Translator, 24(2), 166–182. https://doi.org/10.1080/13556509.2018.1444681

Fairclough, N. (2001). Language and power text. Longman. Genette, G. (1997). Paratexts: Thresholds of interpretation. Cambridge University Press.

Haider, A. S., Al-Salmon, S., & Al-Abbas, L. S. (2021). Courtroom strong remarks: A case study of the impact statements from survivors and victims’ families of the Christchurch Mosque Attacks. International Journal for the Semiotics of Law-Revue Internationale de Sémiotique Juridique, 1–18. doi: https://doi.org/10.1107/s11196-021-09872-4

Haidar, A. S., & Hussein, R. F. (2020). Analysing headlines as a way of downsizing news corpora: Evidence from an Arabic–English comparable corpus of newspaper articles. Digital Scholarship in the Humanities, 35(4), 826–846. https://doi.org/10.1093/fq2074

Hiijo, N. F., & Kaur, S. (2017a). The paratextual analysis of English translations of Arabic media narratives on daesh. IJL: Language, Linguistics, Literature(R), 23(3), 21–36. https://doi.org/10.17576/3L-2017-2303-02

Hiijo, N. F., & Kaur, S. (2017b). Recontextualizing terror: ISIS narratives in the English media. International Journal of Euro-Mediterranean Studies, 10(2), 49–77. https://emuni.si/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/2017-10-2-69-78.pdf

Kovala, U. (1996). Translations, paratextual mediation, and ideological closure. Target. International Journal of Translation Studies, 8(1), 119–147. https://doi.org/10.1075/target.8.1.07kov

Lanser, S. S. (1991). The narrative act: Point of view in prose fiction. Princeton University Press.

Munday, J. (2016). Introducing translation studies: Theories and applications. Routledge.

Pormouzeh, A. (2014). Translation as reparation: Critical analysis of Iran’s cultural and political news in English Western media and press from 2000 to 2012. Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, 5(9), 608. https://doi.org/10.5901/mjss.2014.v5n9p608

Qin, B., & Zhang, M. (2018). Re-framing translated news for target readers: A narrative account of news translation in Snowden’s discourses. Perspectives: Studies in Translationology, 26(2), 261–276. https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2017.1377265

Soed, H. A. (2019). The representation of women in Arabic media: Evidence from Jordan’s news agency (PETRA) in 2017. International Journal of Linguistics, 11(6), 209–228. https://doi.org/10.5296/ijl.v11i6.15273

Schöffner, C., & Bassnett, S. (2010). Politics, media and translation: Exploring synergies. In C. Schöffner & S. Bassnett (Eds.), Political discourse, media and translation (pp. 1–29). Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Shunnaq, A. (1992). Monitoring and managing in the language of broadcasting and newspapers. Irbid: Dar Al-Amal.

Tymoczko, M. (2003). Ideology and the position of the translator. In M. Baker (Ed.), Apropos of ideology: Translation studies on ideology-ideologies in translation studies (pp. 182–200). Routledge.

Van Dijk, T. (1997). Discourse as social interaction (Vol. 2). Sage.

Wolf, W. (2006). Introduction: Frames, framings and framing borders in literature and other media. In W. Wolf & W. Bernhart (Eds.), Framing borders in literature and other media (pp. 1–40). Rodopi.
