Abstract: Salt weathering is the main erosive process affecting diverse geological materials in historical and contemporary structures and can also contribute to visual changes by surface crystallization. The main goal of the present paper is to assess publications concerning the study of salt weathering of natural stone considering the main approaches (laboratory tests and field observations). Our focus will be on rock types other than sedimentary carbonate rocks and sandstones (which are the most studied rocks both in laboratory and field studies). Granite and pyroclastic rocks are dominant in the studied set. Also deserves highlight (for scientific reasons) the scarcity of studies regarding foliated rocks and marble.

Keywords: cultural heritage; built environment; laboratory tests; fieldwork

1. Introduction

Soluble salts can contribute to visual alteration of surfaces of diverse types of rocks used as stones due to surface crystallization and they are the main erosive agent of these materials.

Salt weathering can affect stone elements on diverse locations, not being limited to coastal areas given that there are diverse other sources besides seawater (for a classical review see Arnold & Zehnder[1]). It can affect historical heritage and recent structures (as in Alves et al.[2]).

In this paper we will attempt to assess the situation in terms of approaches to salt weathering of stones, considering simulation studies (by exposition and laboratory tests) and field studies. In order to have a manageable set of works to analyze in the framework of the present work, we will analyze publications on this theme published in or after 2010 (focusing on studies of the present decade) found in the Scopus database (this will leave out many publications, including several of our own!). Only cases with actual natural stone will be considered.

2. Analysis of publications

We found few studies concerning controlled exposition to environmental conditions: one with volcanic rocks in Japan (Seiki et al.[3]) and another one regarding dolostones in Spain (Cámara et al.[4]).

A large majority of the studies found concerned limestones (we will also include here dolostones) and sandstones and there are many publications that will not be discussed specifically here, besides those that are referred in the context of methodological issues (laboratory studies with these rocks alone amounted to around fifty).

Laboratory studies are, in general, more frequent than field studies (around a half higher), with diverse types of salts and weathering conditions (for recent reviews on laboratory salt
weathering testing see Alves et al.[5], Lubelli et al.[6]). In the selected set, the main rock types are volcanic rocks (Seiki et al.[3]; Yu & Oguchi[7]; Yavuz[8]; López-Doncel et al.[9]; Germinario et al.[10]; Özen et al.[11]; Çelik & Aygün[12]; Martínez-Martínez et al.[13]; Pötzl et al.[14]; Sato & Hattanji[15]; Zalooli et al.[16]), being dominated by studies of pyroclastic rocks, and plutonic rocks (Cámara et al.[4]; Yu & Oguchi[7]; López-Arce et al.[17]; Silva et al.[18]; Vázquez et al.[19]; Cerrillo et al.[20]; Martins et al.[21]; Sousa et al.[22]; Vázquez-Nion et al.[23]; Graus et al.[24]) with granite being dominant in this subset. In our present review we found fewer publications concerning laboratory testing of metamorphic rocks; most of them studying marbles (Vázquez et al.[19]; Martínez-Martínez et al.[25]; Navarro et al.[26]; Vazquez et al.[27]) with one studying gneiss (Ricardo et al.[28]) but none in slates or schists. There are several questions connected with these laboratory studies in terms of relations to real conditions, namely in terms of scale (which might affect their potential for assessing the effects of rock heterogeneity). The diversity of testing conditions also hinders meta-analysis of results, tending to create a certain “case study” framework.

Under field studies we will consider works dedicated to the study of human objects that have been subjected to actual weathering conditions (not laboratory simulations). These studies have focused in general in the distribution of salt occurrences and associated decay forms which can include 2D-3D documentation of the structure using laser scanner and photogrammetry (Bala‘awi et al.[29]). These assessments can contribute to evaluate the effect of time by comparison of stone decay with age of emplacement (Příkryl et al.[30]).

Field studies can include the performance of diverse tests on site such as the use of Drilling Resistance Measurement System (Modestou et al.[30]), and many generally non-destructive procedures such as measurements of moisture content and water absorption (Zoghlami et al.[32]), Schmidt rebound test (Boumezbeur et al.[33]), ultrasonic velocity propagation (Zoghlami et al.[32]; Zezza[34]), rock Surface Micro-topography (Kamh & Koltuk[35]), image analyses (Zezza[34]; Ruiz-Agudo et al.[36]), colorimetric studies (Columbu et al.[37]).

Field studies also frequently include the characterization of the salts, namely in terms of types, amounts and sources, using diverse mineralogical and chemical techniques, including advanced analytical techniques such as isotopic analyses in the search for the sources of the salts (Hosono et al.[38]; Siedel et al.[39]; Rivas et al.[40]; Kloppmann et al.[41]). The involved sampling mostly consist of collecting salt concentrations (efflorescences) and loose stone portions (which are considered as already compromised by the action of the soluble salts) but can include contact by extraction by paper pulp poultices (Egartner & Sass[42]) and more invasive procedures such as microdrilling (Ruiz-Agudo et al.[36]; Siedel et al.[39]). There are some cases where it was possible to collect laboratory specimens from discarded blocks (but these are rare situations that generally cannot be replicated for other study places so they will not be specifically considered here).

In the case of field studies we found some more balance between the studied rocks (of course excluding limestones and sandstones). Nonetheless, there is some predominance of igneous rocks, clearly dominated by granites (Sousa et al.[22]; Rivas et al.[40]; Silva Hermo et al.[43]; Warke et al.[44]; Costa[45]; Pozo-Antonio et al.[46]), followed by volcanic rocks (Seiki et al.[3]; Columbu et al.[37]; Antonelli et al.[47]). But we also found studies of gabbros (Matović et al.[48]) and diorites (Bader et al.[49]).

In terms of metamorphic rocks we found studies of slates (Cann[50]), schists (Peñas Castejón et al.[51]), marbles (Zezza[34]; Antonelli et al.[47]) and gneiss (Küng & Zehnder[52]; da Conceição Ribeiro et al.[53]; Gaylarde et al.[54]).

These field studies focused on real anthropogenic objects of stone but they suffer from the “case study” stigma (they concern a limited set of rocks under conditions of a given place) and furthermore, there is insufficient historical information in terms of these materials and conditions.

Some papers include field and laboratory studies. We can highlight in relation to this the publication by Martínez-Martínez et al.[55] concerning a study of limestones in Spain, which based in the comparison of laboratory and field studies presents a proposal of equivalence in terms of time.
3. Final considerations

This review highlights the predominance of limestones and sandstones in terms of studies of salt weathering, while in a kind of second level are studies concerning plutonic and pyroclastic rocks. The incidence of laboratory studies of salt weathering concerning rock types seems to be in part related to the relevance of those rock types in terms of cultural heritage, which might explain the scarcity of studies including slates and schist but certainly will not explain the few studies with marbles. Hence, the perceived susceptibility of stone types also seems to influence the selection of stones for these studies (this seems a more likely explanation for the relatively scarcity of studies considering marbles).

But this situation can leave out some issues with scientific relevance in terms of understanding the relation between petrographic features and salt weathering processes such as the influence of anisotropy planes (which can be specially marked in some metapelitic rocks, depending on their characteristics) and heterogeneity, which can be significant in marbles. One can question the usefulness of laboratory testing of marble heterogeneity without previous indication from field. This indicates a particular interesting case in terms of the problem-situation concerning salt weathering of stones: the special value of field observations that show the effects of salts in heterogeneous marble stones.

The diversity of procedures for laboratory salt weathering constitutes an obstacle to the meta-analysis of results and the definition of universal trends for salt weathering susceptibility.

Author Contributions: Both authors contributed to the present paper.

Funding: The Lab2PT - Landscapes, Heritage and Territory laboratory - AUR,04509 is supported by the Portuguese FCT - “Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia” (Portuguese funds and where applicable the FEDER co-financing, in the aim of the new partnership agreement PT2020 and COMPETE2020 - POCI 010145 FEDER 007528). The authors also gratefully acknowledge the support of the CERENA (funded by a strategic project of the FCT-UID/ECI/04028/2019) and the LAMPIST of the Instituto Superior Técnico, University of Lisbon.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

1. Arnold, A., & Zehnder, K. (1991) Monitoring wall paintings affected by soluble salts. The Conservation of wall paintings, Cather, S., Courtauld Institute of Art, Getty Conservation Institute, Eds., Getty Conservation Institute: Marina del Rey, USA, 103–135.

2. Alves, C., Figueiredo, C., & Maurício, A. (2017). Water-stone Interaction in Contemporary works of the Built Environment. Procedia Earth and Planetary Science, 17, 320–323. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proeps.2016.12.081

3. Seiki, T & Satoh, A & Kikuchi, K. (2012). Weathering mechanisms and mechanical property changes of Oya tuff. Harmonising Rock Engineering and the Environment - Proceedings of the 12th ISRM International Congress on Rock Mechanics, 821-824. https://doi.org/10.1201/b11646-150

4. Câmara, B., De Buergo, M.A., Fort, R., Ascaso, C., De Los Ríos, A., Gomez-Heras, M. (2014). Another source of soluble salts in urban environments due to recent social behaviour pattern in historical centres. Science, Technology and Cultural Heritage, 89-94. https://doi.org/10.1201/b17802

5. Alves, C., Figueiredo, C., & Maurício, A. (2017). A Critical Discussion of Salt Weathering Laboratory Tests for Assessment of Petrological Features Susceptibility. Procedia Earth and Planetary Science, 17, 324–327. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proeps.2016.12.082

6. Lubelli, B., Cnudde, V., Diaz-Goncalves, T., Franzoni, E., van Hees, R. P. J., Ioannou, I., Menendez B., Nunes C., Siedel H., Stefanidou M., Verges-Belmin, V., Viles, H. (2018). Towards a more effective and reliable salt crystallization test for porous building materials: state of the art. Materials and Structures, 51:55. https://doi.org/10.1617/s11527-018-1180-5
7. Yu, S., & Oguchi, C. T. (2010). Role of pore size distribution in salt uptake, damage, and predicting salt susceptibility of eight types of Japanese building stones. Engineering Geology, 115(3-4), 226-236. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enggeo.2009.05.007

8. Yavuz, A. B. (2012). Durability assessment of the Alaçatı tuff (Izmir) in western Turkey. Environmental Earth Sciences, 67(7), 1909-1925. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-012-1632-0

9. López-Doncel, R., Wedekind, W., Leiser, T., Molina-Maldonado, S., Velasco-Sánchez, A., Dohrmann, R., Kral, A., Wittenborn, A., Aguillon-Robles, A., Siegesmund, S. (2016). Salt bursting tests on volcanic tuff rocks from Mexico. Environmental Earth Sciences, 75(3). https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-015-4770-3

10. Germinario, L., Siegesmund, S., Maritan, L., & Mazzoli, C. (2017). Petrophysical and mechanical properties of Euganean trachyte and implications for dimension stone decay and durability performance. Environmental Earth Sciences, 76(21). https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-017-7034-6

11. Öüşen, H., Bozdağ, A., & Ince, I. (2017). Effect of salt crystallization on weathering of pyroclastic rocks from Cappadocia, Turkey. Arabian Journal of Geosciences, 10(12). https://doi.org/10.1007/s12517-017-3027-8

12. Çelik, M. Y., & Aygün, A. (2018). The effect of salt crystallization on degradation of volcanic building stones by sodium sulfates and sodium chlorides. Bulletin of Engineering Geology and the Environment. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10064-018-1354-y

13. Martínez-Martínez, J., Pola, A., García-Sánchez, L., Reyes Agustin, G., Osorio Ocampo, L. S., Macías Vázquez, J. L., & Robles-Camacho, J. (2018). Building stones used in the architectural heritage of Morelia (México): quarries location, rock durability and stone compatibility in the monument. Environmental Earth Sciences, 77(5). https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-018-7340-7

14. Pötzl, C., Siegesmund, S., Dohrmann, R., Koning, J. M., & Wedekind, W. (2018). Deterioration of volcanic tuff rocks from Armenia: constraints on salt crystallization and hydric expansion. Environmental Earth Sciences, 77(19). https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-018-7777-8

15. Sato, M., & Hattanji, T. (2018). A laboratory experiment on salt weathering by humidity change: salt damage induced by deliquescent and hydration. Progress in Earth and Planetary Science, 5(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40645-018-0241-2

16. Zalooli, A., Freire-Listia, D. M., Khamechchiyan, M., Nikudel, M. R., Fort, R., & Ghasemi, S. (2018). Ghaleh-khargushi rhyodacite and Gorid andesite from Iran: characterization, uses, and durability. Environmental Earth Sciences, 77(8). https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-018-7485-4

17. López-Arce, P., Varas-Muriel, M. J., Fernández-Revuelta, B., Álvarez de Burgo, M., Fort, R., & Pérez-Soba, C. (2010). Artificial weathering of Spanish granites subjected to salt crystallization tests: Surface roughness quantification. CATENA, 83(2-3), 170-185. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.catena.2010.08.009

18. Silva, Z. C. G., Simão, J. A. R., Sá, M. H., & Leal, N. (2013). Rock Finishing and Response to Salt Fog Atmosphere. Key Engineering Materials, 548, 275-286. https://doi.org/10.4028/www.scientific.net/KEM.548.275

19. Vázquez, P., Luque, A., Alonso, F. J., & Grossi, C. M. (2013). Surface changes on crystalline stones due to salt crystallisation. Environmental Earth Sciences, 69(4), 1237-1248. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-012-2003-6

20. Cerrillo, C., Jiménez, A., Rufo, M., Paniagua, J., & Pachón, F. T. (2014). New contributions to granite characterization by ultrasonic testing. Ultrasonics, 54(1), 156-167. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ultras.2013.06.006

21. Martins, L., Vasconcelos, G., Loureno, P. B., & Palha, C. A. O. F. (2016). Influence of the salt crystallization in the durability of granites used in vernacular masonry buildings. In 16th International Brick and Block Masonry (pp. 517-524). Taylor & Francis.

22. Sousa, L., Siegesmund, S., & Wedekind, W. (2018). Salt weathering in granitoids: an overview on the controlling factors. Environmental Earth Sciences, 77(13). https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-018-7669-y

23. Vázquez-Nion, D., Troiano, F., Sanmartin, P., Valagussa, C., Cappitelli, F., & Prieto, B. (2018). Secondary bioreceptivity of granite: effect of salt weathering on subaerial biofilm growth. Materials and Structures, 51(6). https://doi.org/10.1617/s11527-018-1283-z

24. Graus, S., Vasconcelos, G., & Palha, C. (2019). Experimental Characterization of the Deterioration of Masonry Materials Due to Wet and Dry and Salt Crystallization Cycles. In R. Aguilar, D. Torrealva, S. Moreira, M. A. Pando, & L. F. Ramos (Eds.), Structural Analysis of Historical Constructions (Vol. 18, pp. 687-695). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-99441-3_74
25. Martinez-Martinez, J., Benavente, D., & Garcia-del-Cura, M. A. (2011). Spatial attenuation: The most sensitive ultrasonic parameter for detecting petrographic features and decay processes in carbonate rocks. Engineering Geology, 119(3–4), 84–95. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enggeo.2011.02.002

26. Navarro, R., Cruz, A. S., Arriaga, L., & Baltuille, J. M. (2017). Caracterización de los principales tipos de mármol extraídos en la comarca de Macael (Almería, suroeste de España) y su importancia a lo largo de la historia. BOLETÍN GEOLÓGICO Y MINERO, 128(2). https://doi.org/10.21701.bolgeomin.128.2.005

27. Vazquez, P., Sartor, L., & Thomacht Schneider, C. (2018). Influence of substrate and temperature on the crystallization of KNO₃ droplets studied by infrared thermography. Progress in Earth and Planetary Science, 5(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40645-018-0229-y

28. Ricardo, A. M., Barroso, E. V., Mansur, K., Vasquez, G. F., & Ribeiro, R. C. C. (2017). Rock Decay by Salt Crystallization and Seismic Signature. In 51st US Rock Mechanics/Geomechanics Symposium, Volume 2, 1350-1354. American Rock Mechanics Association.

29. Balawie, F., Alshawabkeh, Y., Alawneh, F., & Masri, E. A. (2012). Damage assessment and digital 2D-3D documentation of Petra treasury. Mediterranean Archaeology & Archaeometry, 12(2), 21-41.

30. Přikryl, R., Weishauptová, Z., Novotná, M., Přikrylová, J., & Šťastná, A. (2011). Physical and mechanical properties of the repaired sandstone ashlars in the facing masonry of the Charles Bridge in Prague (Czech Republic) and an analytical study for the causes of its rapid decay. Environmental Earth Sciences, 63(7-8), 1623–1639. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-010-0819-5

31. Modestou, S., Theodoridou, M., & Ioannou, I. (2015). Micro-destructive mapping of the salt crystallization front in limestone. Engineering Geology, 193, 337–347. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enggeo.2015.05.008

32. Zoghlami, K., Lopez-Arce, P., & Zornoza-Indart, A. (2017). Differential Stone Decay of the Spanish Tower Façade in Bizerte, Tunisia. Journal of Materials in Civil Engineering, 29(6), 05016005. https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)MT.1943-5533.0001774

33. Boumezbeur, A., Hmaidia, H., & Belhocine, B. (2014). Limestone Weathering and Deterioration in the Tebessa Roman Wall N E Algeria. In Engineering Geology for Society and Territory - Volume 8 (pp. 169–174). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-09408-3_27

34. Zezza, F. (2010). Digital Image Processing in Weathering Damage Analysis and Recovery Treatments Monitoring. In M. Ioannides, D. Fellner, A. Georgopoulos, & D. G. Hadjimitsis (Eds.), Digital Heritage (Vol. 6436, pp. 71–84). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-16873-4_6

35. Kambh, G. M. E., & Koltuk, S. (2016). Micro-topographic and Geotechnical Investigations of sandstone Wall on Weathering Progress, Aachen City, Germany, case study. Arabian Journal for Science and Engineering, 41(6), 2285–2294. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13369-015-1887-3

36. Ruiz-Agudo, E., Lubelli, B., Sawdy, A., van Hees, R., Price, C., & Rodriguez-Navarro, C. (2011). An integrated methodology for salt damage assessment and remediation: the case of San Jerónimo Monastery (Granada, Spain). Environmental Earth Sciences, 63(7–8), 1475–1486. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-010-0661-9

37. Columbu, S., Piras, G., Sitzia, F., Pagnotta, S., Raneri, S., Legnaioli, S., Palleschi, V., Lezzerini, M. & Giamello, M. (2018). PETROGRAPHIC AND MINERALOGICAL CHARACTERIZATION OF VOLCANIC ROCKS AND SURFACE-DEPOSITIONS ON ROMANESQUE MONUMENTS. Zenodo. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.1256051

38. Hosono, T., Uchida, E., Suda, C., Ueno, A., & Nakagawa, T. (2006). Salt weathering of sandstone at the Angkor monuments, Cambodia: identification of the origins of salts using sulfur and strontium isotopes. Journal of Archaeological Science, 33(11), 1541–1551. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2006.01.018

39. Siedel, H., Pfefferkorn, S., von Pfefferkorn, S., & Leisen, H. (2010). Sandstone weathering in tropical climate: Results of low-destructive investigations at the temple of Angkor Wat, Cambodia. Engineering Geology, 115(3–4), 182–192. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enggeo.2009.07.003

40. Rivas, T., Pozo, S., & Paz, M. (2014). Sulphur and oxygen isotope analysis to identify sources of sulphur in gypsum-rich black crusts developed on granites. Science of The Total Environment, 482-483, 137–147. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2014.02.128

41. Kloppmann, W., Bromblet, P., Vallet, J. M., Vergès-Belmin, V., Rolland, O., Guerrot, C., & Gosselin, C. (2011). Building materials as intrinsic sources of sulphate: A hidden face of salt weathering of historical monuments investigated through multi-isotope tracing (B, O, S). Science of The Total Environment, 409(9), 1658–1669. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2011.01.008
42. Egartner, I., & Sass, O. (2016). Using paper pulp poultices in the field and laboratory to analyse salt distribution in building limestones. Heritage Science, 4(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40494-016-0110-5

43. Silva Hermo, B., Prieto Lamas, B., Rivas Brea, T., & Pereira Pardo, L. (2010). Origen y efectos deteriorantes del yeso en monumentos graníticos del noroeste de España. Materiales de Construcción, 60(297), 97–110. https://doi.org/10.3989/mc.2010.46808

44. Warke, P. A., Smith, B. J., & Lehane, E. (2011). Micro-environmental change as a trigger for granite decay in offshore Irish lighthouses: implications for the long-term preservation of operational historical buildings. Environmental Earth Sciences, 63(7–8), 1415–1431. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-010-0662-8

45. Costa, D. (2014). The dialogue between stone and environment: Learning from practice. Science, Technology and Cultural Heritage, pp. 471-476. https://doi.org/10.1201/b17802

46. Pozo-Antonio, J. S., Pereira, M. F. C., Rocha, C. S. A., Puente, I., & Figueiredo, C. (2016). Comparative study of deterioration forms on nearby granitic bridges from an urban setting in the NW Iberian Peninsula. Geomorphology, 274, 11–30. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geomorph.2016.09.009

47. Antonelli, F., Lazzarini, L., Cancelliere, S., & Tesser, E. (2016). Study of the deterioration products, gilding, and polychromy of the stones of the Scuola Grande Di San Marco’s façade in Venice. Studies in Conservation, 61(2), 74–85. https://doi.org/10.1017/S00393630150000004

48. Matović, V., Vasković, N., Erić, S., & Srečković-Baćanin, D. (2010). Interaction between binding materials—the cause of damage to gabbro stone on the monument to the unknown soldier (Serbia). Environmental Earth Sciences, 60(6), 1153–1164. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-009-0257-4

49. Bader, N. A., Moubark, K. M., & El-Hakim El-Badry, A. (2015). Investigation Of Environmentally Driven Deterioration Of Diorite Statues In Mut Temple, Egypt And Concepts For Conservation. Zenodo. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenedo.27745

50. Cann, J. H. (2012). Physical weathering of slate gravestones in a Mediterranean climate. Australian Journal of Earth Sciences, 59(7), 1021–1032. https://doi.org/10.1080/08120099.2012.727868

51. Peñas Castejón, J. M., Maciá Sánchez, J. F., Jiménez Medina, M. P., & Peñalver Martínez, M. J. (2014). Cyclical salt efflorescence weathering: an invisible threat to the recovery of underground mine environment for tourist exploitation. Environmental Earth Sciences, 72(6), 1901–1913. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-014-3098-8

52. Küng, A., & Zehnder, K. (2016). Pickeringite: A deleterious salt on buildings. Studies in Conservation, 62(5), 304–308. https://doi.org/10.1080/00393630.2016.1207341

53. da Conceição Ribeiro, R., Marques Ferreira de Figueiredo, P., & Silva Barbutti, D. (2018). Multi-Analytical Investigation of Stains on Dimension Stones in Master Valentim’s Fountain, Brazil. Minerals, 8(10), 465. https://doi.org/10.3390/min8100465

54. Gaylarde, C., Baptista-Neto, J. A., Tabasco-Novelo, C., & Ortega-Morales, O. (2018). Weathering of granitic gneiss: A geochemical and microbiological study in the polluted sub-tropical city of Rio de Janeiro. Science of The Total Environment, 644, 1641–1647. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.07.303

55. Martínez-Martínez, J., Benavente, D., Jiménez Gutiérrez, S., García-del-Cura, M. A., & Ordóñez, S. (2017). Stone weathering under Mediterranean semiarid climate in the fortress of Nueva Tabarca island (Spain). Building and Environment, 121, 262–276. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.buildenv.2017.05.034

© 2018 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).