The Prevalence of Post-traumatic Stress Disorder Among Health Care Workers During the COVID-19 Pandemic: An Umbrella Review and Meta-Analysis

Ali Sahebi 1, Atefeh Yousefi 2, Kamel Abdi 3, Yousef Jamshidbeigi 4, Siamak Moayedi 5, Mercedes Torres 6, Ulrich Wesemann 6, Hojjat Sheikhbardsiri 7 and Mohamad Golitaleb 8

1 Non-communicable Diseases Research Center, Ilam University of Medical Sciences, Ilam, Iran, 2 Neurology Resident, Department of Neurology, Shohadaye Tajrish Hospital, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Science, Tehran, Iran, 3 Nursing Department, Faculty of Medicine, Komar University of Science and Technology, Sulaymaniyah, Iraq, 4 Department of Anesthesia, School of Paramedical, Ilam University of Medical Sciences, Ilam, Iran, 5 Department of Emergency Medicine, University of Maryland School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD, United States, 6 Department of Psychiatry, Psychotherapy and Psychotraumatology, Bundeswehr Hospital, Berlin, Germany, 7 Health in Disasters and Emergencies Research Center, Institute for Futures Studies in Health, Kerman University of Medical Sciences, Kerman, Iran, 8 Department of Nursing, School of Nursing, Arak University of Medical Sciences, Arak, Iran

Introduction: Frontline health care workers (HCWs) have had an increased risk of developing health problems during the COVID-19 pandemic. In addition to physical illness, they have experienced mental health challenges, including post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). The aim of this study is to investigate the prevalence of PTSD among HCWs during the COVID-19 pandemic via an umbrella review and meta-analysis.

Methods: This study was conducted using the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guideline to perform a systematic literature search using various medical databases (Web of science, PubMed, Scopus, Cochrane, ProQuest, Science Direct, Embase, and Google scholar). The search included all articles published through the first of January 2020 to the end of March 2021. The systematic review and meta-analysis studies that reported the prevalence of PTSD among health care workers were included in the study, and studies that reported the prevalence of PTSD in normal people or other epidemics were excluded. The random effects model was used to perform a meta-analysis, and the $I^2$ index was used to evaluate heterogeneity among studies. Publication bias was assessed using the Egger test. Data was analyzed using STATA (version 14) software.

Results: The initial literature search yielded 145 studies. After excluding duplicates and assessing the quality of the studies, 7 studies were selected for meta-analysis. The results showed that the overall prevalence of PTSD among HCWs during the COVID-19 pandemic was 13.52% (95% CI: 9.06–17.98, $I^2 = 65.5\%$, $p = 0.008$).

Conclusion: There is a high prevalence of PTSD among frontline HCWs during the COVID-19 pandemic. It is important to invest in efforts to screen HCWs for mental health disorders such as PTSD and provide them with mental health support.

Keywords: COVID-19, PTSD, stress disorder, Health Care Provider, HCWs
INTRODUCTION

The COVID-19 pandemic has affected both the physical and mental health of frontline health workers (HCWs). Mental health problems have been reported among these HCWs irrespective of any history of psychologic illness in the past (1–3). One meta-analysis conducted in Asian countries during the COVID-19 crisis showed that more than 20% of people developed anxiety and depression (4). Evidence suggests that the symptoms of anxiety and depression (16–28%) and self-reported stress (8%), are common psychological reactions to COVID-19 infection (5–7). Studies have also shown an increase in the incidence of feelings of anger, fear-avoidance behaviors, and symptoms of post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) (8, 9).

Throughout the COVID-19 pandemic, HCWs have played a vital role by providing direct care for some of the most severely affected patients (10). They are continually exposed to physical and psychological stressors associated with this work (11). As a result, many have reported increased feelings of irritability, anger, depressed mood, and emotional instability. These individuals are at a higher risk for developing PTSD when compared with the general population (12, 13). This risk is partly attributable to a work environment where many HCWs lack appropriate supplies of personal protective equipment. Furthermore, they bear witness to the ongoing suffering and death of many patients (14). One Chinese study showed that the prevalence of PTSD among HCWs during the COVID-19 crisis was about 9.8%. Those most likely to experience PTSD in this study were nurses who worked on the frontlines and expressed a lack of confidence in protective measures (15, 16).

Numerous systematic reviews and meta-analyses have been conducted to assess for PTSD among HCWs during the COVID-19 pandemic. However, there is no comprehensive study to pool these results and report the overall prevalence of PTSD. This study is the first umbrella review that has evaluated the prevalence of PTSD among healthcare workers globally. Umbrella studies are rare and are among the most comprehensive studies and have the highest level at the pyramid of medical evidence. The aim of this study was to estimate the overall prevalence of PTSD among HCWs by conducting an umbrella review and meta-analysis.

METHODS

The Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guideline was used to conduct this study (17). The study protocol was registered in the International Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews (PROSPERO) under the code of CRD42021248943.

Databases and Search Strategy

PubMed, Scopus, Cochrane, ProQuest, Science Direct, Embase, and Google Scholar, and Web of Science were searched to identify relevant studies. The initial search strategy was developed for PubMed and then adjusted to meet the requirements of the other databases. The searches in databases were performed from January 1, 2020 to March 31, 2021. In order to avoid limiting the search results, time limitation wasn’t applied in the search strategy, and after identifying the search results, time was applied through filtering. PTSD is a disorder, according to ICD-10, characterized by (1) flashbacks or nightmares about the traumatic event which produce terror and strong physiological reactions, (2) avoidance of memories or thoughts related to the event, or to avoid activities, situations or persons related to, and (3) a lasting perception of a current noticeable threat (12, 13). The search strategy in the database was as follows: “posttraumatic stress disorder,” “posttraumatic neuroses,” “Post Traumatic Stress Disorder,” “chronic post-traumatic stress disorder,” “delayed-onset post-traumatic stress disorder,” “acute post-traumatic stress disorder,” PTSD, “Mental health disorder,” “2019 novel coronavirus disease,” COVID19, “COVID-19 pandemic,” “SARS-CoV-2 infection,” “COVID-19 virus disease,” “2019 novel coronavirus infection,” “2019-ncov infection,” “Coronavirus disease 2019,” “2019-ncov disease,” “COVID-19 virus infection,” “Health Personnel,” “Health Care Provider,” “Health worker,” “Healthcare Provider,” “Healthcare Worker,” “Health care professional,” “medical staff,” “Medical worker,” “Systematic review,” “meta-analysis,” “meta-analytic.” Search strategies for different databases are referenced in Table 1.

Eligibility Criteria

Inclusion Criteria

Published studies reporting the prevalence of PTSD among HCWs during the COVID-19 pandemic were included in the meta-analysis.

Exclusion Criteria

The studies were excluded if: Studies reporting the prevalence of PTSD among other groups or during other epidemics were excluded from the analysis.

Study Selection

In order to manage the search results, all of the studies identified in the initial database search were inserted into EndNote X7 software. After excluding duplicates, 113 studies were screened. Of those 113 studies, the full-texts of 25 selected studies were independently reviewed by two of the researchers (AS and MG). Ultimately, 7 studies were chosen for the quality assessment phase (Figure 1).

Quality Assessment and Data Extraction

The methodology of the 7 selected studies was independently assessed by two of the researchers using the Assessment of Multiple Systematic Reviews v2 (AMSTAR-2) tool (18). This checklist (AMSTAR2) has 16 items and authors should answer give yes, to some extent, and no to each question. The Overall reliability of the results of this tool is classified into four levels: Critically low, low, moderate, and high. For data extraction, the two researchers (AS and MG) independently used a checklist prepared in Microsoft Word 2016 to collect the required data including the first author’s name, place of study, number of participants, and rate of heterogeneity among studies included in each review.
The prevalence of PTSD among HCWs during the COVID-19 pandemic is 13.52%. Previous studies have documented a higher incidence of COVID-19-related psychological problems, including PTSD, in future (27–32). Previous studies demonstrate that mental illness among HCWs negatively impacts the quality of the health care provided (4, 5). Studies of HCWs experiencing PTSD during the COVID-19 pandemic have identified the following risk factors: female gender, younger age, frontline worker role, career in nursing, and lack of confidence in personal protective equipment (33–35). According to studies of HCWs caring for patients during the SARS epidemic, new cases of psychological disorders, especially severe PTSD, were observed in 5 to 10% of HCWs 4–5 years subsequent to their direct involvement (36–38). It is expected for HCWs to experience a higher incidence of COVID-19-related psychological problems, including PTSD, in future (32, 33). Therefore, hospital leadership
FIGURE 1 | Flowchart of the selection of studies based on PRISMA.

TABLE 2 | Specifications of studies included in the umbrella review.

| First author       | Country | Sample size | Prevalence of PTSD | Number of articles | Subjects                                      | Number of articles related to COVID-19 | Quality assessment | Heterogeneity |
|--------------------|---------|-------------|--------------------|--------------------|-----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|--------------------|--------------|
| de Pablo GS (20)   | UK      | 470         | 7.7% (95% CI: 5.6–10.5%) | 115                | Nurses, Physicians, Medical Students, Social Workers | 1                                      | Moderate           | I² < 0.001   |
| Marvaldi M (21)    | France  | 23,432      | 21.5% (95% CI: 11.2–31.8%) | 70                 | Physicians Nurses                              | 6                                      | Critically low     | I² = 99.62%   |
| Fan FC (22)        | China   | 17,153      | 19% (95% CI: 6.4–44.8)  | 130                | Healthcare workers                             | 3                                      | Critically low     | P = 0.022     |
| Cenat JM (23)      | Canada  | 4,196       | 21% (95% CI: 0.5–57)    | 55                 | Healthcare workers                             | 4                                      | Low                | I² = 99.72    |
| Batra K (24)       | USA     | 3,676       | 11.4% (95% CI: 3.6–30.9%) | 65                 | Healthcare workers                             | 6                                      | Moderate           | I² = 99.2%    |
| Li Y (25)          | UK      | 97,333      | 21.5% (95% CI: 10.5–34.9%) | 65                 | Healthcare workers                             | 9                                      | Moderate           | I² = 99.7%    |
| Krishnamoorthy Y (26) | India | 171,571     | 13% (95% CI: 11–16%)    | 50                 | Healthcare workers                             | 2                                      | Moderate           | NA           |

NA, Not Applicable.
should pay special attention to the mental well-being of their employees, especially HCWs, as the mismanagement of their mental health can lead to dire public health consequences. Identifying HCWs at risk factors or the development of psychological disorders, especially PTSD, and providing practical coping strategies are essential to ensuring the quality of the health care workforce.

LIMITATIONS

The limitations of this study included the lack of access to the full texts of some studies, high heterogeneity among the studies, and the lack of reporting heterogeneity, gender, and the specialization of HCWs in some studies.

CONCLUSION

The results of this umbrella review show that the overall prevalence of PTSD among HCWs during the COVID-19 pandemic was relatively high. This reality argues strongly for the provision of mental health resources to HCWs during this pandemic. Given the essential role of HCWs, especially during a pandemic, interventions to prevent and address mental illness in this population are paramount. Practical interventions may include holding personal or group counseling sessions, providing education regarding mental illness and prevention strategies, offering mental health counseling, or providing social media outreach resources. Due to the prolongation of this pandemic, health policy makers may consider additional support measures such as efforts to reduce workloads, recruit new staff, provide adequate PPE, offer financial and psychological support, and shorten working hours.

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The datasets presented in this study can be found in online repositories. The names of the repository/repositories and accession number(s) can be found in the article/Supplementary Material.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

AS, AY, KA, YJ, and MG designed the review, developed the inclusion criteria, screened titles and abstracts, appraised the quality of included papers, and drafted the manuscript. AS, SM, AY, KA, HS, UW, MT, and MG reviewed the study protocol
and inclusion criteria and provided substantial input to the manuscript. AS, MG, SM, MT, UW, and KA reviewed the study protocol. AS and MG read and screened articles for inclusion. All authors critically reviewed drafts and approved the final manuscript.

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

The Supplementary Material for this article can be found online at: https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fpsyt.2021.764738/full#supplementary-material
32. Sahebi A, Nejadi B, Moayedi S, Yousefi K, Torres M, Golitaleb M. The prevalence of anxiety and depression among healthcare workers during the COVID-19 pandemic: an umbrella review of meta-analyses. Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry. (2021) 107:110247. doi: 10.1016/j.pnpbp.2021.110247

33. Zhang H, Shi Y, Jing P, Zhan P, Fang Y, Wang F. Posttraumatic stress disorder symptoms in healthcare workers after the peak of the COVID-19 outbreak: a survey of a large tertiary care hospital in Wuhan. Psychiatry Res. (2020) 294:113541. doi: 10.1016/j.psychres.2020.113541

34. Blekas A, Voitsidis P, Athanasiadou M, Parlapani E, Chatzigeorgiou AF, Skoupra M, et al. COVID-19: PTSD symptoms in Greek health care professionals. Psychol Trauma Theory Res Pract Policy. (2020) 12:812–9. doi: 10.1037/tra0000914

35. Chatzittofis A, Karanikola M, Michailidou K, Constantinidou A. Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the mental health of healthcare workers. Int J Environ Res Public Health. (2021) 18:1435. doi: 10.3390/ijerph18041435

36. Hong X, Currier GW, Zhao X, Jiang Y, Zhou W, Wei J. Posttraumatic stress disorder in convalescent severe acute respiratory syndrome patients: a 4-year follow-up study. Gen Hosp Psychiatry. (2009) 31:546–54. doi: 10.1016/j.genhosppsych.2009.06.008

37. Lancee WJ, Maunder RG, Goldbloom DS. Prevalence of psychiatric disorders among Toronto hospital workers one to two years after the SARS outbreak. Psychiatr Serv. (2008) 59:91–5. doi: 10.1176/ps.2008.59.1.91

38. Wu P, Fang Y, Guan Z, Fan B, Kong J, Yao Z, et al. The psychological impact of the SARS epidemic on hospital employees in China: exposure, risk perception, and altruistic acceptance of risk. Can J Psychiatry. (2009) 54:302–11. doi: 10.1177/070674370905400540054

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

**Publisher's Note:** All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

Copyright © 2021 Sahebi, Yousefi, Abdi, Jamshidbeigi, Moayedi, Torres, Wesemann, Sheikhbardsiri and Golitaleb. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.