DIGITAL BANKING IN THE MARKETING MIX AND HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT: IMPROVING THE APPROACH TO THE ASSESSMENT AS AN INNOVATIVE COMPONENT

INTRODUCTION

In conditions of the significant competition in the financial markets, digital banking and innovation are an urgent need for the stable development of the banking sector. Digital banking is becoming increasingly popular (KUKSA et al., 2019; ZOS-KIOR et al., 2021; GRYSCHENKO et al., 2021; BROCKOVA et al., 2021). According to Visa, mobile payments and online banking are used by almost 90% of residents of Turkey, Denmark, Norway, Sweden, and Israel. In Ukraine, about 50% of citizens use the Internet for banking operations. At the same time, the growth rate of digitalization of banking services in Ukraine is higher than in Europe – 7% per year against 3%. Innovative products of virtual spaces are currently in demand.

Digitalization poses severe challenges to existing business models and marketing activities of banks. The marketing mix of banks is becoming innovative. Therefore, research on the evaluation of the marketing mix needs attention given the high rate of digital banking development. The urgency is also since Ukraine has set a course for integration into the European digital space.

Researchers pay considerable attention to current trends in the national banking sector development in many countries. In Ukraine, scientists mainly cover the problems of integration processes in the banking sector (DIATLOVA, 2019), the consequences of crisis phenomena (ZVERYAKOV and ZHERDETSKA, 2019), the risks of servicing export-import operations (FOKINA-MEZNTESEVA et al., 2020), competition with foreign banks (DIATLOVA et al., 2021). The issues of digital banking are less studied. Meanwhile, the total digitalization of products and services is a characteristic of the modern world economy. The banking sector is at the center of such processes.

Most banking innovations are related, namely, to digital banking. Lipton, Shrier and Pentland (2016) substantiates that digital banking has forever changed the relationship with consumers. Most scholars note the benefits of digital banking for marketing activities and financial results.

Megargel, Shankararaman and Reddy (2018) believe that digital banking allows real-time marketing, for example, to reach customers and partners through digital platforms. In the digital services market, banks can no longer compete solely on products that have become commercial. On the contrary, they must compete based on service differentiation. Marketing becomes even more effective in supporting business expansion and increasing a bank’s income.

In the work of Bapat (2017), it was proved that digital banking contributes to the expansion of a multi-channel banking environment for customer interaction with the bank and has a positive effect on their loyalty. Garzaro, Varotto and Pedro (2020) investigated the impact of interactivity and social presence on interaction with the bank’s customers. Researchers have found that
these relationships affect customer satisfaction and loyalty, but there are differences between
digital service channels (websites and applications).

A study by Mbama (2018) demonstrates how digital banking increases bank profitability. The
results of the study show that attributes such as perceived value, convenience, quality of
functionality, quality of services, and digital banking innovations are essential for improving
customer satisfaction and loyalty, the financial performance of banks.

Csikóssová, Čulková and Janošková (2016) and colleagues have tried to quantify the marketing
performance of the banking sector and its effectiveness. The obtained data show a lag in the
growth rate of loans compared to the overall growth rate of the market and the negative
growth of customer profitability.

Acar and Temiz (2017) have established a positive relationship between advertising costs and
financial indicators that increase over time (interest income, total operating income, and return
on assets).

However, scientists, in particular Dermine (2016), draw attention to the threat posed by digital
banking in the context of a long series of innovations in the banking sector, including
telephone banking, payment cards, capital markets, the Internet, smartphones, and cloud
computing. Researchers believe that digital banking is currently one of the main strategic
challenges facing banks regarding threats and opportunities. In particular, it is necessary to
address the issue of borrowers and investors protection, and the importance of the new
players, the fintechs start-ups specialised in financial services.

Given the above mentioned, the study of digital banking as an innovative component of the
banking marketing mix and the development of an approach to evaluating its use is relevant.
It is important to establish a system of indicators to assess the effectiveness of digital banking.

The article aims to enhance the approach to evaluating digital banking as an innovative
component of the marketing mix and substantiate the relationship with performance indicators
of banks. It has to be noted that in the banking sector of Ukraine, there are still no methods for
assessing marketing use. Usually, the effectiveness of marketing activities is assessed on the
ratio of marketing costs and results in terms of sales or profits.

The developed methodological approach is based on analyzing both traditional elements of
the marketing mix and its innovative components. All indicators were evaluated according to
the information of the National Bank of Ukraine and the official websites of Ukrainian banks as
of January 1, 2021. As of this date, the banking sector of Ukraine is represented by 75 banks,
of which 5 are state-owned, 50 are private, and 20 are foreign.

RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
The analysis of scientific works shows that banks' introduction of remote customer service
systems, particularly in the European market, took place in the late XX – early XXI century.
Digital banking is a characteristic of modern banks' activities using digital technologies and
social networks to convergence sales and communication channels. It is believed that banking
marketing as a branch type began to evolve in developed countries, including Western
Europe, in the early '60s of the twentieth century. Evolutionary processes are due to the
specifics of banking services as an object of sales in the market. Digital banking services are
essentially new. Therefore, the study of digital banking marketing, its innovative components,
and its evaluation approach is a new direction.

First of all, the authors studied the marketing mix of banks according to the basic model «4P»
- product (product policy regarding banking services, their range, properties, quality), price
(pricing policy regarding the cost of services, margins, discounts), place (distribution policy,
distribution channels, competitive positions, staff), promotion (sales policy regarding
promotion, advertising, sales promotion). It is vital to establish the connection between the
components of the marketing complex and the leading indicators of the effectiveness of their
use (Figure 1).

Fig 1. Structural and logical scheme of the relationship of the banking marketing mix
components with the leading effectiveness indicators use
The use of individual components of the marketing mix aims to maximize the bank's profit in the total profit of the banking services market. Firstly, such profit growth depends on the bank's market share and the number of customers, and secondly, on the profitability of banking services. Among all the marketing mix components, only the price directly impacts the bank's profitability. Marketing components such as products, promotion, and place focus on increasing the number of customers and market share in specific market segments.

In the future, the evaluation of using specific components of the marketing mix of Ukrainian banks in the conditions of digital banking and the assessment of their impact on the leading indicators of banking efficiency are studied. To assess the component «product», the authors used indicators of the number of banking services, such as deposits to private customers, loans to private customers, business deposits, business loans, payment services, and services in the sphere of foreign economic activity, card products, and other services. The innovative component of the «products» considers the number of services available through contactless communication channels (application, Internet banking, customer banking, mobile banking).

The indicators of the «place» component include quantitative indicators of branches, mobile applications in the Play Market and their rating, and the number of ATMs and commercial POS terminals. Data on the number of bank branches are taken from the National Bank of Ukraine's official website and for applications (innovative component) - in the mobile device «Play Market». To assess the «promotion» component, the authors used the cost of advertising according to bank reports, as well as such innovative components as page availability and rating on social networks (number of subscribers, preferences, views, searches) on Facebook, Instagram, YouTube, Twitter, Google.

To assess the innovative component of the «price» marketing mix, the indicators calculated from the official reporting of banks, such as borrowing value, placement cost, spread, net interest margin, commission income/assets, interest income/assets, and total return (sum of two recent indicators) were used.

The results of statistical data processing for each component of the marketing mix indicate the following (Table 1).

**Table 1.** Results of statistical data processing for each component of the marketing mix of Ukrainian banks
According to the data on the «product» component, banks offer a wide range of services to their customers. The system is more active in attracting funds from private clients, offering more products in the business lending sector. Traditionally, banks sell a significant number of card products, while the list of transactions related to foreign economic activity is growing. The most considerable coefficient of variation has been established for banking products connected via non-contact channels. This means that banks, offering a generally traditional set of primary products and services, introduce product innovations quite unevenly. The most active in implementing innovations are large banks, whose market share exceeds at least 1%. However, there is no direct link between market share and the activity of introducing innovative products. This is because large banks actively work with corporate clients, information about which is not detailed on the site, compared to the private segment and the segment of small and medium-sized businesses.
According to the component of the «place», the following has been noted. The number of banks is declining, which is due to the policy of the National Bank of Ukraine to remove insolvent banks from the banking sector. However, large banks with an extensive network of branches remain in the market, in which the pace of replacing traditional marketing with the marketing of banking innovations is slow. Compared to the «product» component, the «place» component indicators are characterized by a greater level of variation in both traditional and innovative components. This is due to the significant difference between banks in the number of ATMs, POS terminals, and applications. Data on individual indicators are incomparable for individual banks. Therefore, the calculation of the normalized indicator is proposed:

\[ x_{i,j} = \frac{P_{i,j}}{P_e} \quad (1), \]

\[ \bar{x}_i = \frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n} x_{i,j}}{n} \quad (2), \]

where \( x_{i,j} \) - normalized value for each component indicator (branches, number of applications and their ratings, number of ATMs and trade POS terminals); \( P_{i,j} \) - value of a separate indicator of the i-th bank; \( P_e \) - value of a separate indicator of the bank, which is the standard (the best value); \( \bar{x}_i \) - average for the component of the marketing mix.

The values of normalized indicators of the «place» component indicate that the leaders are systemic banks. However, the innovation component, such as the number of applications and their rating, is high, mainly for large banks. According to the «promotion» component of the marketing mix, the uneven distribution of indicators of the bank's activity in the use of social networks while informing consumers about the benefits of banking products has been established. Facebook is a more used channel for promoting banking products than Instagram. The capabilities of the YouTube channel are not used by all banks, which causes such variability in this indicator. The ratio of net assets to advertising costs was used due to the need for a relative indicator for banks of different volumes and the requirement for a normalized indicator as a stimulant. Thus, the more assets per unit of advertising costs, the more effective are the bank's advertising. The values of the indicator for the innovation component show that market leaders are most active in using social networks and the Internet. Logically, the figure is higher for systemic banks.

According to the «price» component of the marketing mix, it has to be noted that bank reporting does not allow assessing the price and profitability of the sale of innovative banking products, the value of which is determined not by costs but by value for customers. To insert such trends in work, the profitability of credit and non-credit services is singled out (Table 1).

integral assessments of the component indicators are characterized by a greater level of variation in both traditional and innovative components. This is due to the significant difference between banks in the number of ATMs, POS terminals, and applications. Data on individual indicators are incomparable for individual banks. Therefore, the calculation of the normalized indicator is proposed:

\[ x_{i,j} = \frac{P_{i,j}}{P_e} \quad (1), \]

\[ \bar{x}_i = \frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n} x_{i,j}}{n} \quad (2), \]

where \( x_{i,j} \) - normalized value for each component indicator (branches, number of applications and their ratings, number of ATMs and trade POS terminals); \( P_{i,j} \) - value of a separate indicator of the i-th bank; \( P_e \) - value of a separate indicator of the bank, which is the standard (the best value); \( \bar{x}_i \) - average for the component of the marketing mix.

According to the «promotion» component of the marketing mix, the uneven distribution of indicators of the bank’s activity in the use of social networks while informing consumers about the benefits of banking products has been established. Facebook is a more used channel for promoting banking products than Instagram. The capabilities of the YouTube channel are not used by all banks, which causes such variability in this indicator. The ratio of net assets to advertising costs was used due to the need for a relative indicator for banks of different volumes and the requirement for a normalized indicator as a stimulant. Thus, the more assets per unit of advertising costs, the more effective are the bank’s advertising. The values of the indicator for the innovation component show that market leaders are most active in using social networks and the Internet. Logically, the figure is higher for systemic banks.

According to the «price» component of the marketing mix, it has to be noted that bank reporting does not allow assessing the price and profitability of the sale of innovative banking products, the value of which is determined not by costs but by value for customers. To insert such trends in work, the profitability of credit and non-credit services is singled out (Table 1). According to the data, the activity of Ukrainian banks is characterized by a high level of spread and net interest margin. This is a consequence of the high level of interest rates, allowing banks to receive a higher level of profitability and indicates an increased risk to the national economy.

To assess the primary sources of bank income, the indicators of return on assets from the commission and interest income are calculated. For the banks of Ukraine, the authors believe that the predominance of profitability from the provision of banking services is more optimal, as this component is exposed to less risk and might be an additional indirect indicator of the banking innovations’ effectiveness in marketing. The practicality of using this indicator is explained by the fact that customers quickly get used to the convenience of innovative products, become more loyal, and do not look for cheaper products. Small banks have the highest efficiency indicators in the «price» component of the marketing mix. At the same time, the highest profitability from the provision of banking services belongs to large banks - market leaders who use banking innovations. Integral assessments of the components of the marketing mix of Ukrainian banks in general and the innovation component, in particular, are shown in Figure 2.

Thus, at the present stage of the banking sector development of Ukraine, the use of innovations contributes to the effective implementation of the «4P» marketing mix. This statement is supported by the high value of the correlation coefficient between the estimated data of the complex «4P» and its innovative component «4P (I)» (\( R = 0.9064 \)). Leaders in the use of marketing innovations in the banking sphere are Joint Stock Companies «Privatbank», «Universalbank», «Alfa-Bank», «First Ukrainian International Bank», «Oschadbank», «A-Bank», «Raiffeisen Bank Aval», «UkrSibbank», «Commercial Bank Ukrgasbank» and «OTP-Bank».
CONCLUSIONS

As a result of the research, the approach to evaluating digital banking as an innovative component of the marketing mix was improved. The proposed approach is based on a statistical analysis of both traditional elements of the marketing mix and its innovative components; their relationship with performance indicators of their use was substantiated. Statistical analysis was performed using official data of the National Bank of Ukraine and websites of Ukrainian banks. An innovative component includes services that are available through contactless communication channels.

It is established that only the component «price» directly impacts the bank's profitability. Components of marketing mix such as «products», «promotion», and «place» focus on increasing the number of customers and market share in specific market segments. The activity of using the marketing mix by banks is established by its components based on trends in traditional and innovative elements. It is determined that banks introduce product innovations somewhat unevenly.

The pace of replacing traditional marketing with the marketing of banking innovations is slow. Banks use social networks and the Internet to promote products; they use Facebook more often than Instagram. Not all banks use YouTube's features. More active are the big banks, which are the market leaders. According to the «price» component of the marketing mix for Ukrainian banks, it is recommended to focus on the rate of return on assets from commission income due to its lower risk and the possibility of using it as an indirect indicator of the efficiency of banking innovations in marketing.

It is established that digital banking innovations contribute to the effective implementation of the marketing mix components. This is proved based on correlation-regression analysis of the relationship between integrated assessments of the banking marketing mix and its innovation component. The leading banks in the use of banking innovations in the marketing mix have been identified.

Source: Search data.
REFERENCES

ACAR, M.; TEMIZ, H. Advertising effectiveness on financial performance of banking sector: Turkey case. International Journal of Bank Marketing, 2017, vol. 35, no. 4, p. 649-661. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1108/IJBM-03-2016-0036 Access: May 11, 2021.

BAPAT, D. Exploring the antecedents of loyalty in the context of multi-channel banking International. Journal of Bank Marketing, 2017, vol. 35, iss. 2, p. 174-186. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1108/IJBM-10-2015-0155. Access: May 12, 2021.

BROCKOVA, K.; ROSSOKHA, V.; CHABAN, V.; ZOS-KIOR, M.; HNATENKO, I.; RUBEZHANSKA, V. Economic Mechanism of Optimizing the Innovation Investment Program of the Development of Agro-Industrial Production. Management Theory and Studies for Rural Business and Infrastructure Development, 2021, 43(1), p. 129-136. Available at: https://doi.org/10.15544/mts.2021.11 Access: May 11, 2021.

CSIKÓSOVÁ, A.; ČULKOVÁ, K.; JANOŠKOVÁ, M. Evaluation of quantitative indicators of marketing activities in the banking sector. Journal of Business Research, 2016, vol. 69, iss. 11, p. 5028-5033. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2016.04.075 Access: May 12, 2021.

DERMINE, JE. Digital banking and market disruption: a sense of déjà vu? Financial Stability Review Banque de France, 2016, iss. 20, p. 17-24. Available at: https://publications.banque-france.fr/sites/default/files/medias/documents/financial-stability-review-20_2016-04.pdf. Access: May 12, 2021.

DIATLOVA, YU. The development of the banking sector of Ukraine in the context of Eurointegration: economic basis and strategic objectives International. Journal of New Economics, Public Administration and Law, 2019, 1(3), p. 13-22. Available at: https://doi.org/10.31264/2545-093X-2019-1(3)-13-22. Access: May 12, 2021.

DIATLOVA, YU.; KUZNETSOVA, L.; DIELINI, M.; TKACHENKO, O.; ONYSHCHENKO, Y.; NYANCHUK, N. Improving Approach to Conditions' Statistical Assessment for Ukraine Banking Sector Competitive Development under the Foreign Banks Presence in the Financial Market. Journal of Physics: Conference Series, 2021, vol. 1804(1), 012142. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1804/1/012142. Access: May 12, 2021.

FOKINA-MEZENTSEVA, K.; MELNYK, T.; DIATLOVA, V.; BUHAS, V.; SHATSKA, Z. Determination of the critical risk zone for the indicator of foreign trade import coverage by the export of goods and services subject to its normal distribution. International journal of scientific & technology research, 2020, vol. 9, iss. 3, p. 4843-4847. Available at: https://www.ijstr.org/research-paper-publishing.php?month=mar2020. Access: May 12, 2021.

GARZARO, D. M.; VAROTTO, L. F.; PEDRO, S. D. C. Internet and mobile banking: the role of engagement and experience on satisfaction and loyalty. International Journal of Bank Marketing, 2020, vol. 39, no. 1, p. 1-23. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1108/IJBM-08-2020-0457. Access: May 12, 2021.

GRYSHCHENKO, I.; GANUSHCHAK-EFIMENKO, L.; SCHCHERBAK, V.; NIFATOVA O.; ZOS-KIOR M.; HNATENKO, I.; MARTYNOVA, L.; MARTYNOV, A. Making Use of Competitive Advantages of a University Education Innovation Cluster in the Educational Services Market. European Journal of Sustainable Development, 2021, 10(2), p. 336.

KUKSA, I.; HNATENKO, I.; ORLOVA-KURILOVA, O.; MOISIEIEVA, N.; RUBEZHANSKA, V. State regulation of innovative employment in the context of innovative entrepreneurship development. Management Theory and Studies for Rural Business and Infrastructure Development, 2019, 41(2), p. 228-236. Available at: https://doi.org/10.15544/mts.2019.19 Access: May 11, 2021.
LIPTON, A.; SHRIER, D.; PENTLAND, A. Digital banking manifesto: the end of banks? Connection Science & Engineering. Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 2016, 20 p. Available at: http://ftp.shuju.cn/platform/file/2018-01-09/4ccbef11b284e2e953c4c5dc651bd22.pdf. Access: May 12, 2021.

MBAMA, C. I. Digital Banking Services, Customer Experience and Financial Performance in UK Banks, 2018, 308 p. Available at: http://shura.shu.ac.uk/23305/1/Mbama__PhD_DigitalBankingServices.pdf. Access: May 12, 2021.

MEGARGEL, A.; SHANKARARAMAN, V.; REDDY, S. Real-time inbound marketing: A use case for digital banking. Handbook of blockchain, digital finance, and inclusion: Cryptocurrency, FinTech, InsurTech, and regulation, 2018, vol. 1, p. 311-328. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-810441-5.00013-0. Access: May 12, 2021.

ZOS-KIOR, M.; HNATENKO, I.; ISAI, O.; SHTULER, I.; SAMBORSKYI, O.; RUBEZHANSKA, V. Management of Efficiency of the Energy and Resource Saving Innovative Projects at the Processing Enterprises. Management Theory and Studies for Rural Business and Infrastructure Development, 2021, 42(4), p. 504-515. Available at: https://doi.org/10.15544/mts.2020.52 Access: May 11, 2021.

ZOS-KIOR, M.; SHKURUPII, O.; HNATENKO, I.; SHULZHENKO, I.; RUBEZHANSKA, V. Modeling of the investment program formation process of ecological management of the Agrarian cluster. European Journal of Sustainable Development, 2021, 10(1), p. 571-583. Available at: https://doi.org/10.14207/ejsd.2021.v10n1p571 Access: May 11, 2021.

ZVERYAKOV, M.; ZHERDETSKA, L. Currency failures and inflation crisis: Ukrainian specific and relationship assessment Financial and credit activity: problems of theory and practice, 2019, vol. 1, no. 28, p. 130-138. Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/332689053_CURRENCY_FAILURES_AND_INFLATION_CRISIS_UKRAINIAN_SPECIFIC_AND_RELATIONSHIP_ASSESSMENT Access: May 12, 2021.
Digital banking in the marketing mix and human resource management: improving the approach to the assessment as an innovative component

Banco digital no mix de marketing e gestão de recursos humanos: melhorar a abordagem da avaliação como componente inovador

Banco digital en el marketing mix y gestión de recursos humanos: mejorar el enfoque de la evaluación como componente innovador

Resumo
A pesquisa avalia a atividade do uso do banco digital em componentes do mix de marketing dos bancos ucranianos, como "produto", "lugar", "promoção" e "preço". A abordagem metodológica desenvolvida baseia-se na análise dos elementos do mix de marketing do banco tradicional e seus componentes inovadores, principalmente o banco digital. Foi estabelecido que os bancos, oferecendo um conjunto geralmente padrão de produtos primários, introduzem inovações de produtos de forma bastante desigual. De acordo com o componente "place" do mix de marketing, nota-se que o ritmo da substituição tradicional de marketing pelo marketing de inovações bancárias é lento. Em relação ao componente "promoção" do mix de marketing, a distribuição dos indicadores da atividade do banco no uso das redes sociais é desigual. O Facebook é mais usado que o Instagram, e nem todos os bancos usam os recursos do YouTube. Os bancos são líderes de mercado que usam as redes sociais e a Internet de forma mais ativa.

Palavras-chave: Banco digital. Mistura de marketing. Componente. Inovação. Avaliação.

Abstract
The research evaluates the activity of using digital banking in components of the marketing mix of Ukrainian banks, such as "product", "place", "promotion", and "price". The developed methodological approach is based on the analysis of traditional bank's marketing mix elements and their innovative components, mainly digital banking. It has been established that banks, offering a generally standard set of primary products, introduce product innovations quite unevenly. According to the "place" component of the marketing mix, it has been noted that the pace of traditional marketing replacement by banking innovations marketing is slow. Regarding the "promotion" component of the marketing mix, the distribution of the indicators of the bank's activity in the use of social networks is uneven. Facebook is more used than Instagram, and not all banks use YouTube's capabilities. Banks are market leaders that use social networks and the Internet most actively.

Keywords: Digital banking. Marketing mix. Component. Innovation. Evaluation.

Resumen
La investigación evalúa la actividad del uso del banco digital en componentes de la mezcla de marketing de los bancos ucranianos, como «producto», «lugar», «promoción» y «precio». El enfoque metodológico desarrollado se basa en el análisis de los elementos de marketing mix del banco tradicional y sus componentes innovadores, principalmente la banca digital. Se ha establecido que los bancos, que ofrecen un conjunto generalmente estándar de productos primarios, introducen innovaciones de productos de manera bastante desigual. De acuerdo con el componente «lugar» de la mezcla de marketing, se ha observado que el ritmo de la sustitución del marketing tradicional por el marketing de innovaciones bancarias es lento. En cuanto al componente de «promoción» del marketing mix, la distribución de los indicadores de la actividad del banco en el uso de las redes sociales es desigual. Facebook es más utilizado que Instagram, y no todos los bancos utilizan las capacidades de YouTube. Los bancos son líderes del mercado que utilizan las redes sociales e Internet de manera más activa.

Palabras-clave: Banco digital. Mezcla de marketing. Componente. Innovación. Evaluación.