Lessons from AlphaZero for Optimal, Model Predictive, and Adaptive Control

by

Dimitri P. Bertsekas

Arizona State University
and
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

WWW site for book information and orders
http://www.athenasc.com

Athena Scientific, Belmont, Massachusetts
ABOUT THE AUTHOR

Dimitri Bertsekas studied Mechanical and Electrical Engineering at the National Technical University of Athens, Greece, and obtained his Ph.D. in system science from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. He has held faculty positions with the Engineering-Economic Systems Department, Stanford University, and the Electrical Engineering Department of the University of Illinois, Urbana. Since 1979 he has been teaching at the Electrical Engineering and Computer Science Department of the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (M.I.T.), where he is McAfee Professor of Engineering. In 2019, he joined the School of Computing and Augmented Intelligence at the Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, as Fulton Professor of Computational Decision Making.

Professor Bertsekas’ teaching and research have spanned several fields, including deterministic optimization, dynamic programming and stochastic control, large-scale and distributed computation, artificial intelligence, and data communication networks. He has authored or coauthored numerous research papers and nineteen books, several of which are currently used as textbooks in MIT classes, including “Dynamic Programming and Optimal Control,” “Data Networks,” “Introduction to Probability,” and “Nonlinear Programming.” At ASU, he has been focusing in teaching and research in reinforcement learning, and he has developed several textbooks and research monographs in this field since 2019.

Professor Bertsekas was awarded the INFORMS 1997 Prize for Research Excellence in the Interface Between Operations Research and Computer Science for his book “Neuro-Dynamic Programming” (co-authored with John Tsitsiklis), the 2001 AACC John R. Ragazzini Education Award, the 2009 INFORMS Expository Writing Award, the 2014 AACC Richard Bellman Heritage Award, the 2014 INFORMS Khachian Prize for Lifetime Accomplishments in Optimization, the 2015 MOS/SIAM George B. Dantzig Prize, and the 2022 IEEE Control Systems Award. In 2018 he shared with his coauthor, John Tsitsiklis, the 2018 INFORMS John von Neumann Theory Prize for the contributions of the research monographs “Parallel and Distributed Computation” and “Neuro-Dynamic Programming.” Professor Bertsekas was elected in 2001 to the United States National Academy of Engineering for “pioneering contributions to fundamental research, practice and education of optimization/control theory, and especially its application to data communication networks.”
ATHENA SCIENTIFIC
OPTIMIZATION AND COMPUTATION SERIES

1. Lessons from AlphaZero for Optimal, Model Predictive, and Adaptive Control by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 2022, ISBN 978-1-886529-17-5, 235 pages

2. Abstract Dynamic Programming, 3rd Edition, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 2022, ISBN 978-1-886529-47-2, 420 pages

3. Rollout, Policy Iteration, and Distributed Reinforcement Learning, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 2020, ISBN 978-1-886529-07-6, 480 pages

4. Reinforcement Learning and Optimal Control, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 2019, ISBN 978-1-886529-39-7, 388 pages

5. Dynamic Programming and Optimal Control, Two-Volume Set, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 2017, ISBN 1-886529-08-6, 1270 pages

6. Nonlinear Programming, 3rd Edition, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 2016, ISBN 1-886529-05-1, 880 pages

7. Convex Optimization Algorithms, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 2015, ISBN 978-1-886529-28-1, 576 pages

8. Convex Optimization Theory, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 2009, ISBN 978-1-886529-31-1, 256 pages

9. Introduction to Probability, 2nd Edition, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas and John N. Tsitsiklis, 2008, ISBN 978-1-886529-33-5, 544 pages

10. Convex Analysis and Optimization, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, Angelia Nedić, and Asuman E. Ozdaglar, 2003, ISBN 1-886529-45-0, 560 pages

11. Network Optimization: Continuous and Discrete Models, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 1998, ISBN 1-886529-02-7, 608 pages

12. Network Flows and Monotropic Optimization, by R. Tyrrell Rockafellar, 1998, ISBN 1-886529-06-X, 634 pages

13. Introduction to Linear Optimization, by Dimitris Bertsimas and John N. Tsitsiklis, 1997, ISBN 1-886529-19-1, 608 pages

14. Parallel and Distributed Computation: Numerical Methods, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas and John N. Tsitsiklis, 1997, ISBN 1-886529-01-9, 718 pages

15. Neuro-Dynamic Programming, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas and John N. Tsitsiklis, 1996, ISBN 1-886529-10-8, 512 pages

16. Constrained Optimization and Lagrange Multiplier Methods, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 1996, ISBN 1-886529-04-3, 410 pages

17. Stochastic Optimal Control: The Discrete-Time Case, by Dimitri P. Bertsekas and Steven E. Shreve, 1996, ISBN 1-886529-03-5, 330 pages
## Contents

1. **AlphaZero, Off-Line Training, and On-Line Play**
   1.1. Off-Line Training and Policy Iteration, p. 3
   1.2. On-Line Play and Approximation in Value Space - Truncated Rollout, p. 6
   1.3. The Lessons of AlphaZero, p. 8
   1.4. A New Conceptual Framework for Reinforcement Learning, p. 11
   1.5. Notes and Sources, p. 14

2. **Deterministic and Stochastic Dynamic Programming Over an Infinite Horizon**
   2.1. Optimal Control Over an Infinite Horizon, p. 20
   2.2. Approximation in Value Space, p. 25
   2.3. Notes and Sources, p. 30

3. **An Abstract View of Reinforcement Learning**
   3.1. Bellman Operators, p. 32
   3.2. Approximation in Value Space and Newton’s Method, p. 39
   3.3. Region of Stability, p. 46
   3.4. Policy Iteration, Rollout, and Newton’s Method, p. 50
   3.5. How Sensitive is On-Line Play to the Off-Line Training Process?, p. 58
   3.6. Why Not Just Train a Policy Network and Use it Without On-Line Play?, p. 60
   3.7. Multiagent Problems and Multiagent Rollout, p. 61
   3.8. On-Line Simplified Policy Iteration, p. 66
   3.9. Exceptional Cases, p. 72
   3.10. Notes and Sources, p. 79

4. **The Linear Quadratic Case - Illustrations**
   4.1. Optimal Solution, p. 82
   4.2. Cost Functions of Stable Linear Policies, p. 83
   4.3. Value Iteration, p. 86
   4.4. One-Step and Multistep Lookahead - Newton Step Interpretations, p. 86
## Contents

4.5. Sensitivity Issues ................................................. p. 91
4.6. Rollout and Policy Iteration ................................. p. 94
4.7. Truncated Rollout - Length of Lookahead Issues .... p. 97
4.8. Exceptional Behavior in Linear Quadratic Problems ... p. 99
4.9. Notes and Sources ............................................... p. 100

5. Adaptive and Model Predictive Control

| Section | Title | Page |
|---------|-------|------|
| 5.1.   | Systems with Unknown Parameters - Robust and PID Control | 102 |
| 5.2.   | Approximation in Value Space, Rollout, and Adaptive Control | 105 |
| 5.3.   | Approximation in Value Space, Rollout, and Model Predictive Control | 109 |
| 5.4.   | Terminal Cost Approximation - Stability Issues | 112 |
| 5.4.   | Notes and Sources | 118 |

6. Finite Horizon Deterministic Problems - Discrete Optimization

| Section | Title | Page |
|---------|-------|------|
| 6.1.   | Deterministic Discrete Spaces Finite Horizon Problems | 120 |
| 6.2.   | General Discrete Optimization Problems | 125 |
| 6.3.   | Approximation in Value Space | 128 |
| 6.4.   | Rollout Algorithms for Discrete Optimization | 132 |
| 6.5.   | Rollout Algorithms with Multistep Lookahead - Truncated Rollout | 149 |
| 6.6.   | Constrained Forms of Rollout Algorithms | 153 |
| 6.7.   | Adaptive Control by Rollout with a POMDP Formulation | 167 |
| 6.8.   | Rollout for Minimax Control | 174 |
| 6.9.   | Small Stage Costs and Long Horizon - Continuous-Time Rollout | 183 |
| 6.10.  | Epilogue | 190 |

Appendix A: Newton’s Method for Fixed Point Problems

| Section | Title | Page |
|---------|-------|------|
| A.1.   | Newton’s Method for Differentiable Fixed Point Problems | 196 |
| A.2.   | Newton’s Method Without Differentiability of the Bellman Operator | 201 |
| A.3.   | Local and Global Error Bounds for Approximation in Value Space | 204 |
| A.4.   | Local and Global Error Bounds for Approximate Policy Iteration | 206 |

References ......................................................... p. 211
Preface

With four parameters I can fit an elephant, and with five I can make him wiggle his trunk.†

John von Neumann

The purpose of this monograph is to propose and develop a new conceptual framework for approximate Dynamic Programming (DP) and Reinforcement Learning (RL). This framework centers around two algorithms, which are designed largely independently of each other and operate in synergy through the powerful mechanism of Newton’s method. We call these the off-line training and the on-line play algorithms; the names are borrowed from some of the major successes of RL involving games. Primary examples are the recent (2017) AlphaZero program (which plays chess), and the similarly structured and earlier (1990s) TD-Gammon program (which plays backgammon). In these game contexts, the off-line training algorithm is the method used to teach the program how to evaluate positions and to generate good moves at any given position, while the on-line play algorithm is the method used to play in real time against human or computer opponents.

† From the meeting of Freeman Dyson and Enrico Fermi (p. 273 of the Segre and Hoerlin biography of Fermi, The Pope of Physics, Picador, 2017): “When Dyson met with him in 1953, Fermi welcomed him politely, but he quickly put aside the graphs he was being shown indicating agreement between theory and experiment. His verdict, as Dyson remembered, was “There are two ways of doing calculations in theoretical physics. One way, and this is the way I prefer, is to have a clear physical picture of the process you are calculating. The other way is to have a precise and self-consistent mathematical formalism. You have neither.” When a stunned Dyson tried to counter by emphasizing the agreement between experiment and the calculations, Fermi asked him how many free parameters he had used to obtain the fit. Smiling after being told “Four,” Fermi remarked, “I remember my old friend Johnny von Neumann used to say, with four parameters I can fit an elephant, and with five I can make him wiggle his trunk.” See also the paper by Mayer, Khairy, and Howard [MKH10], which provides a verification of the von Neumann quotation.
Both AlphaZero and TD-Gammon were trained off-line extensively using neural networks and an approximate version of the fundamental DP algorithm of policy iteration. Yet the AlphaZero player that was obtained off-line is not used directly during on-line play (it is too inaccurate due to approximation errors that are inherent in off-line neural network training). Instead a separate on-line player is used to select moves, based on multistep lookahead minimization and a terminal position evaluator that was trained using experience with the off-line player. The on-line player performs a form of policy improvement, which is not degraded by neural network approximations. As a result, it greatly improves the performance of the off-line player.

Similarly, TD-Gammon performs on-line a policy improvement step using one-step or two-step lookahead minimization, which is not degraded by neural network approximations. To this end it uses an off-line neural network-trained terminal position evaluator, and importantly it also extends its on-line lookahead by rollout (simulation with the one-step lookahead player that is based on the position evaluator).

Thus in summary:

(a) The on-line player of AlphaZero plays much better than its extensively trained off-line player. This is due to the beneficial effect of exact policy improvement with long lookahead minimization, which corrects for the inevitable imperfections of the neural network-trained off-line player, and position evaluator/terminal cost approximation.

(b) The TD-Gammon player that uses long rollout plays much better than TD-Gammon without rollout. This is due to the beneficial effect of the rollout, which serves as a substitute for long lookahead minimization.

An important lesson from AlphaZero and TD-Gammon is that the performance of an off-line trained policy can be greatly improved by on-line approximation in value space, with long lookahead (involving minimization or rollout with the off-line policy, or both), and terminal cost approximation that is obtained off-line. This performance enhancement is often dramatic and is due to a simple fact, which is couched on algorithmic mathematics and is the focal point of this work:

(a) Approximation in value space with one-step lookahead minimization amounts to a step of Newton's method for solving Bellman's equation.

(b) The starting point for the Newton step is based on the results of off-line training, and may be enhanced by longer lookahead minimization and on-line rollout.

Indeed the major determinant of the quality of the on-line policy is the Newton step that is performed on-line, while off-line training plays a secondary role by comparison.
Significantly, the synergy between off-line training and on-line play also underlies Model Predictive Control (MPC), a major control system design methodology that has been extensively developed since the 1980s. This synergy can be understood in terms of abstract models of infinite horizon DP and simple geometrical constructions, and helps to explain the all-important stability issues within the MPC context.

An additional benefit of policy improvement by approximation in value space, not observed in the context of games (which have stable rules and environment), is that it works well with changing problem parameters and on-line replanning, similar to indirect adaptive control. Here the Bellman equation is perturbed due to the parameter changes, but approximation in value space still operates as a Newton step. An essential requirement within this context is that a system model is estimated on-line through some identification method, and is used during the one-step or multistep lookahead minimization process.

In this monograph we will aim to provide insights (often based on visualization), which explain the beneficial effects of on-line decision making on top of off-line training. In the process, we will bring out the strong connections between the artificial intelligence view of RL, and the control theory views of MPC and adaptive control. Moreover, we will show that in addition to MPC and adaptive control, our conceptual framework can be effectively integrated with other important methodologies such as multiagent systems and decentralized control, discrete and Bayesian optimization, and heuristic algorithms for discrete optimization.

One of our principal aims is to show, through the algorithmic ideas of Newton’s method and the unifying principles of abstract DP, that the AlphaZero/TD-Gammon methodology of approximation in value space and rollout applies very broadly to deterministic and stochastic optimal control problems. Newton’s method here is used for the solution of Bellman’s equation, an operator equation that applies universally within DP with both discrete and continuous state and control spaces, as well as finite and infinite horizon. In this connection, we note that the mathematical complications associated with the formalism of Newton’s method for nondifferentiable operators have been dealt with in the literature, using sophisticated methods of nonsmooth analysis. We have provided in an appendix a convergence analysis for a finite-dimensional version of Newton’s method, which applies to finite-state problems, but conveys clearly the underlying geometrical intuition and points to infinite-state extensions. We have also provided an analysis for the classical linear-quadratic optimal control problem, the associated Riccati equation, and the application of Newton’s method for its solution.

While we will deemphasize mathematical proofs in this work, there is considerable related analysis, which supports our conclusions, and can be found in the author’s recent RL books [Ber19a], [Ber20a], and the abstract DP monograph [Ber22a]. In particular, the present work may be viewed as
a more intuitive, less mathematical, visually oriented exposition of the core material of the research monograph [Ber20a], which deals with approximation in value space, rollout, policy iteration, and multiagent systems. The abstract DP monograph [Ber22a] develops the mathematics that support the visualization framework of the present work, and is a primary resource for followup mathematical research. The RL textbook [Ber19a] provides a more general presentation of RL topics, and includes mathematical proof-based accounts of some of the core material of exact infinite horizon DP, as well as approximate DP, including error bound analyses. Much of this material is also contained, in greater detail, in the author’s DP textbook [Ber12]. A mix of material contained in these books forms the core of the author’s web-based RL course at ASU.

This monograph, as well as my earlier RL books, were developed while teaching several versions of my course at ASU over the last four years. Videolectures and slides from this course are available from my website

http://web.mit.edu/dimitrib/www/RLbook.html

and provide a good supplement and companion resource to the present book. The hospitable and stimulating environment at ASU contributed much to my productivity during this period, and for this I am very thankful to my colleagues and students for useful interactions. My teaching assistants, Sushmita Bhattacharya, Sahil Badyal, and Jamison Weber, during my courses at ASU have been very supportive. I have also appreciated fruitful discussions with colleagues and students outside ASU, particularly Moritz Diehl, who provided very useful comments on MPC, and Yuchao Li, who proofread carefully the entire book, collaborated with me on research and implementation of various methods, and tested out several algorithmic variants.

Dimitri P. Bertsekas, 2022

dimitrib@mit.edu