1,25-dihydroxyvitamin D3 and development of tuberculosis in cattle

Citation for published version:
Rhodes, SG, Terry, LA, Hope, J, Hewinson, RG & Vordermeier, HM 2003, '1,25-dihydroxyvitamin D3 and development of tuberculosis in cattle' Clinical and Diagnostic Laboratory Immunology, vol. 10, no. 6, pp. 1129-35.

Link:
Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version:
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Published In:
Clinical and Diagnostic Laboratory Immunology

Publisher Rights Statement:
Copyright 2003 American Society for Microbiology

General rights
Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy
The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
1,25-Dihydroxyvitamin D₃ and Development of Tuberculosis in Cattle

S. G. Rhodes,¹ L. A. Terry,² J. Hope,³ R. G. Hewinson,¹ and H. M. Vordermeier¹*

* Corresponding author. Mailing address: TB Research Group, Veterinary Laboratories Agency, Addlestone, Surrey KT15 3NB, United Kingdom.

Received 2 April 2003/Returned for modification 23 May 2003/Accepted 23 July 2003

This report describes the presence and activity of 1,25-dihydroxyvitamin D₃ (1,25-D₃) in experimental bovine tuberculosis. Animals that went on to develop tuberculous lesions exhibited a rapid transient increase in serum 1,25-D₃ within the first 2 weeks following infection with Mycobacterium bovis. 1,25-D₃-positive mononuclear cells were later identified in all tuberculous granulomas by immunohistochemical staining of postmortem lymph node tissue. These results suggest a role for 1,25-D₃ both at the onset of infection and in the development of the granuloma in these infected animals. Using a monoclonal antibody to the vitamin D receptor (VDR) as a VDR agonist, we confirmed that activation of the vitamin D pathway profoundly depresses antigen-specific, but not mitogenic, bovine peripheral blood T-cell responses (proliferation and gamma interferon production). Investigation of the mechanism of this suppression showed that the VDR antibody modified the expression of CD80 by accessory cells, such that a significant positive correlation between T-cell proliferation and accessory cell CD80 emerged.

Sunshine and cod liver oil both have a long association with the treatment of tuberculosis and represent the two sources of vitamin D available, via UV irradiation of the skin and diet. Reports from the mid-19th century suggest that vitamin D in the form of cod liver oil was beneficial in the treatment of tuberculosis, and calcium therapy with or without vitamin D was used before specific chemotherapy became available (18). More recent reports have associated low or disturbed serum vitamin D levels with increased susceptibility to tuberculosis (13, 18, 20, 51), and this is supported by genetic linkage studies (13, 18, 20, 51), and this is supported by genetic linkage studies of vitamin D receptor (VDR) gene polymorphism that indicate an association between the VDR and susceptibility or resistance to tuberculosis (5, 44, 45, 51).

The active component of vitamin D, 1,25-dihydroxyvitamin D₃ (1,25-D₃) acts exclusively via its specific nuclear receptor (49), and therefore the distribution of the VDR within the immune system provides information on the active sites of this steroid hormone. The VDR is constitutively expressed in human peripheral monocytes but can be induced in activated lymphocytes (6, 36). VDR expression in both monocytes and T cells can be further up-regulated by exposure to 1,25-D₃. 1,25-D₃ production by monocytes and macrophages has long been recognized (1, 26, 31), but it is also now apparent that T cells could equally be a major site of 1,25-D₃ activity (7, 11, 47), and this may also be the case in tuberculosis (7, 11).

It is becoming increasingly accepted that 1,25-D₃ has an important role in the development of immune responses. Reported activities of 1,25-D₃ include the suppression of T-cell proliferation (40), inhibition of gamma interferon (IFN-γ) and interleukin-2 (IL-2) production (15, 25), differential regulation of CXC and CC chemokines (29), and enhanced generation of regulatory (23) and Th2 (8) T cells. Some of the effects of 1,25-D₃ on T-cell responses are thought to be indirect via the antigen-presenting cell. Reports describe a reduced ability of monocytes to induce antigen-dependent T-cell proliferation, which is now known to be at least partly due to alterations in antigen-presenting and costimulatory molecules, and the retardation of dendritic cell development (12, 33, 34, 39).

In this report we describe the presence and activity of 1,25-D₃ in cattle infected with Mycobacterium bovis. Bovine tuberculosis is an increasing problem in the United Kingdom herd, despite a government test-and-slaughter policy (35), and has led to an independent scientific review (28) that advocates the production of new and improved vaccines and diagnostic reagents. Underpinning this work is the investigation of the immunology of bovine tuberculosis, using an experimental regimen that generates pathology similar to that seen in naturally infected cattle (10). Using this experimental approach, we investigated the kinetics of serum 1,25-D₃ following infection and the presence of 1,25-D₃ within the tuberculous granuloma. The effects of VDR activation on antigen-specific lymphocyte responses were also assessed.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Animals. This study utilized eight Friesian cows from tuberculosis-free herds that were infected intratracheally with either 4 × 10⁵ CFU (four animals), 6 × 10⁵ CFU (two animals) or 6 × 10⁶ CFU (two animals) of virulent M. bovis (AF212297). A naturally exposed M. bovis field reactor was also included in certain experiments as indicated. Sequential serum samples were taken from all experimentally infected animals. The experiments described were carried out with experimentally infected animals approximately 3 to 4 weeks prior to slaughter (ca. 17 weeks postinfection). The tuberculin skin test was carried out 2 weeks prior to slaughter of these experimentally infected cattle. Cattle exposed to the two higher doses of M. bovis (4 × 10⁵ and 6 × 10⁶ CFU) converted to skin test positivity. Cattle exposed to the lower dose of M. bovis (6 × 10⁵ CFU) remained skin test negative. Euthanasia was carried out at approximately 20 weeks postinfection by intravenous injection of sodium pentobarbital, and a detailed post-mortem analysis was performed. Skin test-positive animals all presented with gross tuberculous lesions typical of natural bovine tuberculosis. Lymph nodes affected included the lateral and medial retropharyngeal, submandibular, bronchiol, and mediastinal lymph nodes. Lung lesions were also identified. Lesions were confirmed as tuberculous by histopathological staining and M. bovis culture from infected tissues. No lesions were identified in either of the skin test-negative animals. Acid-fast bacilli could not be found in any tissues from these two
low-dose-infected animals, which were also *M. bovis* culture negative. In addition to *M. bovis*-infected animals, we utilized a group of eight *M. bovis* BCG-vaccinated cattle in our final experiment. These animals were Fresian cows from tuberculosis-free herds that had been vaccinated subcutaneously with two doses (8 weeks apart) of 10⁶ CFU of *M. bovis* BCG-Pasteur. The experiment described was carried out with these animals 2 weeks after their second dose of BCG-Pasteur, when strong specific immune responses (IFN-γ and proliferation) were still apparent.

**Immunohistochemistry.** Lymph nodes (left bronchial and left medial retropharyngeal in this investigation) were removed at postmortem, cut into approximations of 0.3 by 0.5 by 1.0 cm pieces, fixed in 10% buffered formalin, and processed and embedded in paraffin wax by standard histological procedures. Four-micrometre sections were cut and stored at 4°C until required. Sections were brought to room temperature and dewaxed in xylene (three times for 6 min) followed by absolute ethanol (two times for 6 min). Endogenous peroxidase was blocked by incubation in 1% 

**RESULTS**

Rapid mobilization of serum 1,25-D₃ following infection. Figure 1 shows the serum 1,25-D₃ concentrations in four animals prior to (week 0) and following exposure to virulent *M. bovis*. Each graph shows the results for one animal, monitored over a 20-week period. Figure 1a and b show the results for the two animals exposed to 6×10⁶ CFU of *M. bovis*, which are representative of those for all six skin test-positive experimentally infected animals in this study. Figure 1c and d show the results for the two animals exposed to the lowest dose of 6×10⁴ CFU of *M. bovis*, which remained skin test negative. The prechallenge serum 1,25-D₃ levels ranged from 52 to 138 pM between individuals. Following infection, serum 1,25-D₃ increased in all skin test-positive animals (peak levels of 132 to 200 pM within the group). This rapid increase in 1,25-D₃ was transient, lasting 1 to 2 weeks, after which time the levels of 1,25-D₃ dropped and gradually returned to preexposure levels. In contrast, the two animals exposed to the lowest dose (6×10⁴ CFU) of *M. bovis* and that had remained skin test negative (Fig. 1e and d) did not exhibit such an increase in serum 1,25-D₃, but instead the levels remained relatively stable (Fig. 1e) or even appeared to decrease (Fig. 1d) following exposure to *M. bovis*. Linear regression to measure correlation coefficients was carried out for the data in Fig. 5 and 6. The data were found to follow a Gaussian distribution and were therefore analyzed by using Pearson's product moment correlation. All statistical analyses were carried out with Prism software (GraphPad Software Inc., San Diego, Calif.) using 95% confidence intervals.

**Lymphocytes within the granuloma produce 1,25-D₃.** Figure 2 shows the immunohistochemical staining of an infected left bronchial lymph node section from one representative animal at magnifications of ×20 (Fig. 2a) and ×100 (Fig. 2b). Figure
2a shows that 1,25-D$_3$-positive cells (stained brown) were concentrated almost exclusively within the granuloma, with very few 1,25-D$_3$-positive cells present in the surrounding lymphoid tissue. Figure 2b shows these 1,25-D$_3$-positive cells to be mononuclear cells. This concentration of 1,25-D$_3$-positive cells within the granuloma was found in all animals investigated (six experimentally infected animals) and in all granulomas, large or small, suggesting that 1,25-D$_3$ has an important role in

![Graphs showing serum 1,25-D$_3$ concentrations](image)

**FIG. 1.** Serum 1,25-D$_3$ concentrations in four individual cattle prior to and following exposure to *M. bovis*. (a and b) Cattle exposed to 6 x 10$^4$ CFU; (c and d) cattle exposed to 6 x 10$^3$ CFU. Concentrations in serum were measured with a commercial radiometric assay.

![Images of lymph node tissue](image)

**FIG. 2.** Sections of lymph node tissue (left bronchial) from one representative animal stained with a monoclonal antibody to 1,25-D$_3$. Sections show a granuloma at magnifications of ×20 (a) and ×100 (b). 1,25-D$_3$-positive mononuclear cells are stained brown.
granuloma development and/or maintenance in bovine tuberculosis.

VDR ligation down-regulates T-cell responses. We next investigated the effects of 1,25-D3 on peripheral T-cell responses in both experimentally infected and naturally exposed animals. To exert its effect, 1,25-D3 must bind and activate the nuclear VDR. This allows the mobilization of the VDR into the nucleus, where it binds to specific response elements within the promoter regions of target genes (9). We found that a commercially available monoclonal antibody raised against the VDR acted as an agonist, in that this specific VDR antibody inhibited lymphocyte proliferation in a dose-dependent manner. Figure 3 shows the increased inhibition of PBMC proliferation of a naturally exposed field reactor animal with increased concentration (lower dilution) of VDR antibody. Two different rat antibody controls were incorporated in these experiments, an isotype-matched IgG2b and a total IgG (see Materials and Methods) used at the same dilutions as the anti-VDR antibody. Figure 3a and b show the effect of VDR antibody on proliferation to the dominant mycobacterial antigen ESAT-6 and the mitogen ConA, respectively. These results show that the inhibition by the VDR antibody is dependent upon antibody concentration within the culture, as the effect titrates out with increased dilution. It can be seen that at a dilution of 1/400, the inhibition of antigen-specific proliferation remains high (>85%) while the inhibition of mitogenic proliferation is low (<20%). The inhibitory effects of control antibodies were minimal in comparison at this antibody dilution. We therefore chose 1/400 for subsequent experiments using this antibody.

The inhibitory effect of the VDR antibody was then tested in a group of seven infected animals. Figure 4 shows the mean inhibition of proliferation induced by the VDR antibody in six experimentally infected animals plus the M. bovis field reactor (see above) to PPD-B, ESAT-6, and ConA. Antigen-specific responses were effectively blocked by the VDR antibody (>95% inhibition by antibody at a 1/400 final dilution), while mitogenic responses were barely affected (the mean represents one animal at 39% inhibition plus six animals with zero inhibition of ConA proliferation). Inhibition of antigen (PPD-B or ESAT-6)-specific proliferation by the VDR antibody was statistically significant compared with that by either the IgG2b or IgG control antibody ($P < 0.0001$ in all cases).

In a repeat experiment using five experimentally infected

FIG. 3. Inhibition of PBMC proliferation to ESAT-6 (a) and ConA (b) by a monoclonal antibody to the VDR. Antigen and mitogen concentrations were both 5 μg/ml. Antibodies were at final dilutions of 1/100, 1/200, 1/400, and 1/800. The anti-VDR antibody (IgG2b) was of unknown concentration, and therefore two control antibodies were used: an IgG2b isotype control (also of unknown concentration) and a total IgG control of known concentration (12.5 μg/ml at 1/800, 25 μg/ml at 1/400, 50 μg/ml at 1/200, and 100 μg/ml at 1/100). Results are expressed as the percent inhibition of proliferation compared to cultures of PBMC plus antigen or mitogen (no antibody). The vertical dashed lines indicate the chosen dilution of antibody (1/400) for subsequent experiments.

FIG. 4. Inhibition of PBMC proliferation of seven animals (six experimentally infected animals and one naturally exposed field reactor) to antigen (PPD-B and ESAT-6) and mitogen (ConA) by the VDR antibody. Anti-VDR and control antibodies were used at a final dilution of 1/400 in PBMC cultures. The results are expressed as the mean (plus standard deviation) inhibition of proliferation compared to cultures of PBMC plus antigen or mitogen (no antibody). The VDR antibody (solid bars) significantly inhibited the proliferative response of PBMC to both PPD-B and ESAT-6 compared with either control antibody (IgG2b [shaded bars] or IgG [open bars]) ($P < 0.0001$ in all cases).
animals, we also confirmed the inhibitory effect of the VDR antibody on PPD-B-induced IFN-γ production. VDR antibody was again used at 1/400. Figure 5 shows the correlation between the inhibition of proliferation and the inhibition of IFN-γ production by PBMC in these animals. In this experiment the inhibition caused by the VDR antibody was more variable than that in the previous experiment with the same animals, with ranges of inhibition of 0 to 84% for proliferation and 24 to 96% for IFN-γ. However, a significant positive correlation \( r^2 = 0.9254; P = 0.0088 \) was observed between the inhibition of proliferation and inhibition of IFN-γ production mediated by the VDR antibody, demonstrating the potential of vitamin D to interfere with antigen-specific type 1 responses in these animals.

VDR ligation modifies CD80 expression on antigen-presenting cells. In the light of the results obtained above, i.e., inhibition of antigen-specific rather than mitogenic responses, we reasoned that the effects of the VDR antibody were indirect, via the antigen-presenting cell. We therefore investigated the effect(s) of the VDR antibody upon MHC and costimulatory molecule expression by accessory cells within antigen-stimulated PBMC. This last experiment was carried out with PBMC from a group of eight BCG-vaccinated cattle, as *M. bovis* infected cattle were not available at this time. These animals were all responding well to PPD-B, and PPD-B-specific PBMC proliferation could be inhibited by the VDR antibody as shown for *M. bovis*-infected animals above. PBMC were cultured in bulk in six-well plates, with PPD-B in the presence or absence of a 1/400 dilution of VDR antibody. After 6 days, the adherent cells were harvested, washed, and labeled with monoclonal antibodies specific for the surface molecules MHC class I, MHC class II, CD80, CD86, and CD40. Percent positive staining was calculated by using isotype-matched control antibodies.

Figure 6 shows the correlation between PBMC proliferation to PPD-B and the percentage of CD80-positive cells within the adherent cell population of PPD-B-stimulated PBMC following culture with VDR antibody. Proliferation inhibition by VDR antibody varied in this group of animals from zero to 66%. The percentage of CD80-positive cells within the adherent cell population, after subtracting the background staining of the isotype-matched control antibody (background staining was variable between individual animals), was low, and ranged from zero to 8%. Nevertheless, these data clearly show a significant correlation \( r^2 = 0.72; P = 0.0079 \) between the percentage of CD80-positive adherent cells and the level of proliferation within PBMC cultures, with the greatest proliferation (lowest inhibition) in those cultures with the highest percentage of CD80-positive cells and the lowest proliferation (greatest inhibition) in those cultures with the lowest percentage of CD80-positive cells. This correlation was not apparent in PPD-B-stimulated cultures that did not contain the VDR antibody. No other correlation was found between PBMC proliferation and any of the other surface markers investigated (MHC class I, MHC class II, CD86, or CD40). This experiment suggests that CD80 expression by accessory cells is important for antigen-specific T-cell responses and that the expression of CD80 by accessory cells can be modified by the activation of the vitamin D pathway.

**DISCUSSION**

In this study we have shown that the bioactive component of vitamin D, 1,25-D₃, is rapidly mobilized following infection of cattle with *M. bovis*. This mobilization was identified as a transient increase in serum 1,25-D₃ within 2 weeks of infection in those animals that went on to develop tuberculous lesions. A similar transient increase in plasma 1,25-D₃ (mean increase from 37 to 118 pM) has been reported for postparturient dairy cattle (2) coincident with an increased susceptibility to other infections, such as mastitis, metritis, and paratuberculosis (24). Interestingly, dietary supplements of vitamin D and vitamin A (which is known to enhance the effects of vitamin D) are recommended for postparturient dairy cattle to prevent hypocalcaemia (50). Whether such supplements, combined with the increased 1,25-D₃ levels in these animals at this time, contribute to a lowered resistance to infection is an interesting
question. Further to this, we found that two animals that were exposed to a lower dose of *M. bovis* and that remained disease free did not display any increase in serum 1,25-D$_3$ following exposure to *M. bovis*. We know that these animals were infected, however, as specific IL-4 responses, but no consistent IFN-γ responses, were detected (38).

The observed changes in serum 1,25-D$_3$ occurred at least 2 weeks before specific immune responses (IFN-γ, IL-2, and proliferation) generally begin to be detected in this infection model (37), indicating a role for 1,25-D$_3$ at the initiation of host immune reactivity to *M. bovis*. This role could conceivably include effects on cellular recruitment via modulation of chemokine production (29) and/or effects on early T-cell polarization (46) or apoptosis (14).

In those animals that went on to develop tuberculous lesions, 1,25-D$_3$-positive mononuclear cells were identified within every granuloma, clearly placing 1,25-D$_3$ at the heart of pathogenesis. Although we did not identify the cell type, previous reports have described the production of 1,25-D$_3$ by local monocytes and the critical role that monocytes, and in particular macrophages, play in the pathogenesis of TB (40). This suggests that the function of 1,25-D$_3$ within the tuberculous lesion likely lies in the construction and maintenance of the granuloma and the dampening of potentially harmful inflammatory T-cell responses, while at the same time activating macrophages to kill intracellular bacilli.

We further investigated the ability of 1,25-D$_3$ to affect specific T-cell responses. The suppression of antigen-specific and mitogenic bovine T-cell responses by 1,25-D$_3$ has previously been described (3), and a more recent study indicated that this inhibitory activity of 1,25-D$_3$ was also observed in cell lines infected with *M. bovis* (48). We attempted to clarify this effect of 1,25-D$_3$ in our *M. bovis*-infected cattle by using a monoclonal antibody raised against the VDR as a receptor agonist. We found that addition of VDR antibody to antigen-stimulated PBMC cultures could profoundly depress antigen-specific proliferation and IFN-γ production but had a far lesser effect upon mitogenic proliferation. We therefore hypothesized that the observed effects of the VDR antibody on T-cell responses in these animals were indirect, acting via the antigen-presenting cell by affecting either antigen-presenting (MHC class I and MHC class II) or costimulatory (CD80, CD86, and CD40) molecules.

We investigated the presence of these molecules by flow cytometry on peripheral blood monocytes (plastic-adherent cells) isolated from PBMC following stimulation with antigen, with or without the addition of the VDR antibody. We found that the addition of the VDR antibody modified the expression of CD80 on accessory cells, such that a significant correlation emerged between the percentage of CD80-positive cells present and the level of PBMC proliferation observed in the individual cultures. These results were surprising given that these accessory cells would have been a heterogeneous population of cells and that the percentages of CD80-positive cells measured within the adherent cell populations were low (although they were similar to levels measured in 3-day plastic-adherent PBMC in other, unrelated experiments [J. Hope, unpublished observations]). Our results therefore clearly suggest that the expression of CD80 by accessory cells is an important factor for bovine antigen-specific T-cell responses and that the modification of the expression of this molecule on accessory cells represents one mechanism by which vitamin D may affect downstream T-cell responses in cattle.

This conclusion is supported by murine studies that have described the inhibition of Th1 cells by CD80 suppression on Langerhans cells (32), the prevention of graft-versus-host disease by the blockade of Th1 responses with monoclonal antibodies to CD80 and CD86 (43), and the correlation between CD80-positive accessory cells and elevated Th1 responses in experimental autoimmune encephalomyelitis (22). In addition, CD80 expression by human and mouse accessory cells has been shown to be crucial for the induction of CD4$^+$ cytotoxic T cells (30). Whether such cytotoxic T cells are active in bovine tuberculosis is yet to be discovered.

In summary, our work on bovine tuberculosis supports a role for 1,25-D$_3$ at the very onset of infection with *M. bovis* and in the development of pathogenesis. Our data support an anti-inflammatory role for 1,25-D$_3$ in the reduction of Th1 responses, for which the expression of accessory cell CD80 may be important.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENT**

This work was funded by the Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA), United Kingdom.

**REFERENCES**

1. Adams, J. S., O. P. Sharma, M. A. Gacad, and F. R. Singer. 1983. Metabolism of 25-hydroxyvitamin D$_3$ by cultured pulmonary alveolar macrophages in sarcoidosis. J. Clin. Invest. 72:1858-1860.
2. Ametaj, B. N., D. C. Beitz, T. A. Reinhardt, and B. J. Nonnecke. 1996. 1,25-Dihydroxyvitamin D$_3$ inhibits secretion of interferon-γ by mitogen- and antigen-stimulated bovine mononuclear leukocytes. Vet. Immunol. Immunopathol. 52:77-90.
3. Ametaj, B. N., B. J. Nonnecke, R. L. Horst, and D. C. Beitz. 2000. Effects of retinoic acid and 1,25-dihydroxyvitamin D$_3$ on IFN-γ secretion by mononuclear leukocytes from nulliparous and postparturient dairy cattle. Int. J. Nutr. Res. 78:92-101.
4. Aung, H., Z. Toossi, S. M. McKenna, P. Gogate, J. Sierra, E. Sada, and E. A. Rich. 2000. Expression of transforming growth factor-β but not tumor necrosis factor-α, interferon-γ and interleukin-4 in granulomatous lung lesions in tuberculosis. Tuberc. Lung Dis. 81:61-67.
5. Bellamy, R. 2000. Identifying genetic susceptibility factors for tuberculosis in Africans: a combined approach using a candidate gene study and a genome-wide screen. Clin. Sci. (Colch). 98:245-250.
6. Bhat, A. K., E. P. Amento, T. L. Clemens, M. F. Holick, and S. M. Krane. 1983. Specific high affinity receptors for 1,25-dihydroxyvitamin D$_3$ in human peripheral blood mononuclear cells: presence in monocytes and induction in T lymphocytes following activation. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 57:1308-1310.
7. Biyoudi-Vouenze, R., J. Cadreul, D. Valeyre, B. Milleron, A. J. Hance, and P. Soler. 1991. Expression of 1,25(OH)$_2$D$_3$ receptors on alveolar lymphocytes from patients with pulmonary granulomatous diseases. Am. Rev. Respir. Dis. 143:1376-1380.
8. Bonnaire, A., F. J. Barrat, C. Crain, V. L. Heath, H. F. Savelkoul, and A. Boonstra, A. 2001. In, 25-Dihydroxyvitamin D$_3$ has a direct effect on naïve CD4$^+$ T cells to enhance the development of Th2 cells. J. Immunol. 167:4974-4980.
9. Bouillon, R., W. H. Okamura, and A. W. Norman. 1995. Structure-function relationships in the vitamin endocrine system. Endocrinol. Rev. 16:200-257.
10. Biddle, B. M., D. Keen, A. Thomson, G. Jowett, J. Jeslof, G. W. deLisle, and J. L. Stanford. 1995. Protection of cattle from bovine tuberculosis by vaccination with BCG by the respiratory or subcutaneous route, but not by vaccination with killed Mycobacterium vaccae. Res. Vet. Sci. 59:10-16.
