Adverse childhood experiences and implications of perceived stress, anxiety and cortisol among women in Pakistan: a cross-sectional study

Naira Ikram, Allison Frost, Katherine LeMasters, Ashley Hagaman, Victoria Baranov, John Gallis, Siham Sikander, Elissa Scherer, Joanna Maselko

To cite: Ikram N, Frost A, LeMasters K, et al. Adverse childhood experiences and implications of perceived stress, anxiety and cortisol among women in Pakistan: a cross-sectional study. BMJ Open 2022;12:e052280. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2021-052280

ABSTRACT

Objectives Adverse childhood experiences (ACEs) are linked to poor maternal mental health. The goal of this study is to examine the associations between ACEs and multiple manifestations of stress (including perceived stress, anxiety and cortisol) among mothers in rural Pakistan.

Design This study used a cross-sectional design. Mothers were originally recruited during their third trimester of pregnancy and followed until 36 months post partum. Cortisol was collected at 12 months post partum, and self-report data were collected at 36 months post partum.

Setting All participants reside in rural villages in Rawalpindi, Pakistan. The measures were administered at home visits by field interviewers.

Participants Data were collected from 889 mothers. All mothers in the sample provided data on ACEs and perceived stress, 623 provided data on anxiety and 90 provided hair cortisol.

Primary and secondary outcomes measures ACEs were captured retrospectively using an adapted version of the ACE International Questionnaire, and represented as a continuous variable and subdomains (neglect, home violence, family psychological distress, community violence). Primary outcomes included perceived stress measured with the Cohen Perceived Stress Scale (PSS) and anxiety measured with the Generalised Anxiety Disorder-7 scale (GAD-7). Hair-derived cortisol was included as a secondary outcome. Generalised linear models with cluster-robust SEs were used to estimate associations between ACEs and the outcome variables.

Results All models featured positive associations between ACE items and PSS. The continuous total ACE score (B=0.4; 95% CI 0.0 to 0.8) was associated with higher anxiety symptoms on the GAD-7. Home violence (B=6.7; 95% CI 2.7 to 10.8) and community violence (B=7.5; 95% CI 1.4 to 13.6) were associated with increased hair cortisol production.

Conclusions All four ACE domains were associated with elevated levels of perceived stress, anxiety and cortisol, with varying precision and strength of estimates, indicating that the type of ACE has a differential impact. This study informed our understanding of the differential impact of specific ACEs on perceived stress, anxiety and hypothalamic pituitary adrenal-axis functioning, providing implications for future clinical intervention and research development.

OBJECTIVES

The prevalence of adverse childhood experiences (ACEs) is extremely high, with population estimates ranging from 50% to 70% in low/middle-income countries (LMICs). 1 A robust literature links ACEs with compromised physical health, mental health and overall functioning in adulthood.2-6 Those exposed to ACEs are less likely to obtain high levels of education, leading to financial insecurity, lower socioeconomic status and a lack of psychosocial resources.5 The compounding nature of adversity is especially impactful in LMICs where rates of ACEs are high and other stressors, such as poverty, may lead to and co-occur with ACEs.7-9 One developing setting in which ACEs have been
understudied is Pakistan. Of the few studies set in Pakistan, most broaden the definition of ACEs to include broadly negative life events like food insecurity and poor family support, making it difficult to compare findings across ACEs studies in other contexts. In addition, while the majority of past studies on these topics sample well-educated, urban populations, the majority of Pakistani women have spent their life in rural areas, which are tied to unique stressors, such as low education and literacy of women and transportation barriers. Assessing the effects of ACEs in this context is critical for understanding the global impact of ACEs exposure. The impact of ACEs on maternal mental health is of particular concern; maternal mental health may function as a mediator between maternal ACE exposure and child mental health. Mothers who experience ACEs may be more likely to suffer from mental health difficulties that interfere with their ability to provide safe, nurturing and sensitive environments for their children. Children in such environments may then be more likely to develop mental health problems, perpetuating a cycle of intergenerational trauma. Studies of ACEs and maternal mental health may inform early intervention supporting the mother in promoting her own emotion regulation as well as the well-being of her child. Informed by life course theory’s linkage of adult disease risk to psychosocial exposures stemming from childhood, understanding the associations between ACEs and adult health may offer important insights into preventing compounding health issues throughout life for both mothers and children.

While the overall literature linking ACEs to mental health is robust, several key questions are not well understood. The first is to what extent examining the unique effects of different types of ACEs is important for elucidating how early experiences impact adult functioning. Much of past work has focused on specific ACEs (eg, sexual abuse) or the cumulative effect of ACEs; often, domain-specific (eg, abuse, neglect, household dysfunction) results have either not been reported or have been ambiguous. Nonetheless, multiple researchers have pointed to the utility of separating ACEs into distinct domains. There is a lack of consensus about which types of ACEs are related to women’s mental health. For instance, Negriff found that in the USA, experiencing neglect, but not physical abuse, predicted anxiety symptoms in adolescence and ACEs related to child maltreatment were more predictive of mental health outcomes than ACEs related to household dysfunction. In our team’s prior work with a cohort of women in Pakistan at 36 months post partum, we have found that exposure to community violence was much more strongly correlated with maternal depression than other domains such as neglect. A significant potential driver of different findings is the diversity of social, economic and cultural contexts in which the ACEs take place. Hence, studies from multiple geographic regions and population groups make important contributions towards better understanding of how various ACEs may differentially impact mental health.

A second area of inquiry focuses on the biological stress-related pathways linking ACEs to various health outcomes. Specifically, there is evidence that ACEs impact stress regulation systems, including the hypothalamic pituitary adrenal (HPA) axis and its end product of cortisol. ACEs are associated with both hyperactivation and hypoactivation of the HPA axis, leading to elevated or reduced cortisol levels, respectively. Some studies indicate that exposure to acute stress leads to initial hyperactivation of the HPA axis, while chronic, prolonged stress leads to reduced activity of the HPA axis. Salivary cortisol involves methodological disadvantages, stemming from high sensitivity to short-term confounds, such as circadian rhythm, compared with hair-derived cortisol. Therefore, HPA axis hormones extracted from hair samples capture chronic stress and HPA axis activity over the course of months, which may be an important mediator between early life experiences and later mental health. The majority of this research has also been conducted in high-income settings, further demonstrating the need for studies to be conducted in low-resource settings including Pakistan.

In the current study, we examine how retrospectively reported ACEs are associated with multiple stress-related outcomes later in life including anxiety, perceived stress and hair-derived cortisol in a sample of mothers living in rural Pakistan. We hypothesise that ACEs in all domains will predict heightened levels of perceived stress, anxiety symptoms and hair cortisol. Studies have linked ACEs with experiences of perceived stress, increased risk for anxiety disorders and altered cortisol in adulthood, although none of this work has been conducted in Pakistan. Perceived stress and anxiety capture related but distinct constructs associated with psychological stress, with perceived stress representing short-term feelings of being overburdened and anxiety representing chronic worry and physiological dysregulation consistent with generalised anxiety disorder (GAD). Cortisol represents a physiological correlate of stress. Understanding how ACEs may differentially relate to these outcomes can shed light on the nuanced associations between childhood experiences and women’s well-being.

METHODS

Study design and participants

The data in the present analysis come from mothers of the Bachpan cohort, a longitudinal birth cohort of mother–child dyads in rural villages in Rawalpindi, Pakistan, which is north of the Punjab Province (Sikander et al, 2015). In this study, we conducted a secondary analysis using data collected at the 36-month assessment. One of the purposes of the Bachpan cohort was to evaluate the impact of a peer-delivered, community-based perinatal depression intervention, embedded within the cohort, on maternal mental health and child development. Pregnant women from 40 village clusters were screened for depression and invited to participate.
in the study. Twenty of the 40 village clusters were randomised to receive both the perinatal intervention and enhanced usual care, while the other 20 clusters received enhanced usual care alone. The intervention consisted of both individual and group-based sessions focused on behavioural activation, problem-solving and peer support. Participants engaged in weekly sessions during the prenatal period, biweekly sessions between birth and 6 months and monthly sessions between 7 and 36 months. Past research has shown that those receiving the intervention showed reduced depressive symptoms at 6 months; however, the effects of the intervention weakened over time.\(^4\) In addition, an equal number of non-depressed pregnant women were recruited and followed in parallel as part of the Bachpan cohort to understand the degree to which the intervention could mitigate the risk of intergeneration transmission of poor mental health from mothers to their children.\(^47\) Women were assessed at baseline (during their third trimester of pregnancy) and at an additional five timepoints: 3, 6, 12, 24 and 36 months post partum. At the 36-month assessment, participants completed questionnaires assessing ACEs, anxiety and perceived stress. In addition, a subsample of participants at the 12-month interview, were asked to provide hair for cortisol assay. Of the 1154 women included at baseline, 889 participated in the 36-month questionnaire, providing information on ACEs and perceived stress. Due to a delay in administering the anxiety assessment, 623 participants provided information on anxiety symptoms. We approached a randomly selected subsample of 107 women for hair cortisol collection, and of those, 93 provided valid samples. Finally, 90 mothers provided both hair cortisol and ACEs measurement. The outcomes were collected at home visits by field interviewers.

**Measures**

**Adverse childhood experiences**

ACEs were assessed retrospectively at the 36-month data collection period using an adapted 12-item ACE International Questionnaire (WHO, 2018). It has been validated in other LMIC settings, namely Malawi and Nigeria.\(^49\)\(^50\) The ACE International Questionnaire was adapted to the Pakistani context based on feedback from the local field team to remove the sexual abuse questions. This was mainly due to concerns around stigma. Data collection was conducted in participants’ homes, where the team was not able to guarantee privacy and where respondents might feel uncomfortable disclosing information around childhood sexual abuse. The questionnaire was also translated into Urdu. To discern the impacts of different ACE subtypes and methods of representation, we created a summed score and indicators for the theorised domains: neglect, family psychological distress, home violence and community violence (Table 1). The domains are dichotomous, representing exposure to any of the ACEs comprising the domain.

**Perceived stress**

Perceived stress was measured using the Perceived Stress Scale (PSS). The PSS is a 10 item instrument that measures the degree to which life situations are appraised as stressful in the last month.\(^51\) The summed score ranges from 0 to 40 and has demonstrated reliability and validity in South Asia.\(^52\)\(^53\) In the current sample, the PSS demonstrated high reliability (\(\alpha=0.91\)).

**Anxiety**

Anxiety was measured using the seven-item version of the Generalised Anxiety Disorder-7 screening tool (GAD-7). The frequency of symptoms in the last 2 weeks is assessed on a 4-point Likert scale. The summed score ranges from 0 to 21, with a cut-off of 10 typically representing a clinically significant level to identify probable cases of generalised anxiety disorder.\(^54\) The total summed GAD score was used in analyses. The GAD-7 measure has demonstrated reliability and validity in Pakistan.\(^55\) In the current sample, this scale demonstrated high reliability (\(\alpha=0.93\)). In the overarching study, the intervention did not show sustained effects on anxiety symptoms.\(^47\)

**Cortisol**

Hair samples were collected using a standard protocol: approximately 200 strands of hair were cut from the posterior vertex. Research suggests that 1 cm of hair reflects hormonal output for the previous month.\(^56\) The present analysis uses 2 cm of hair, reflecting HPA-axis hormone output for the past 2 months. No participant reported hair treatment, hair product, oral or topical steroid usage. Cortisol was extracted and measured by Dresden LabService using standard liquid chromatography-mass spectrometry.\(^57\) We did not observe any outliers. Levels are reported as pg/mg.

**Covariates**

Informed by existing literature, several variables were selected for the models to adjust for design characteristics and to identify potential confounders. These included maternal age, natal family’s history of mental illness, participant level of educational attainment, baseline depression, peer-delivered perinatal intervention allocation status and assessor at 36 months.\(^58\)\(^59\)

**Statistical analysis**

For this cross-sectional analysis, a series of generalised linear models with an identity link were created to estimate coefficients for the total PSS and GAD scores as well for the maternal hair cortisol concentrations. All models used cluster-robust SEs to account for clustering at the village cluster level. The PSS and GAD models were adjusted for baseline depression and treatment allocation status, mother’s age at baseline and education level, history of natal family mental health and assessor at 36 months. For each outcome (perceived stress, GAD and hair cortisol), we examined associations with: (1) the number of endorsed ACEs modelled as a continuous indicator and (2) dichotomous indicators for each domain.  

Ikram N, et al. BMJ Open 2022;12:e052280. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2021-052280
of ACEs (neglect, family psychological distress, home violence and community violence). Since the cortisol subsample was included as an exploratory analysis, which we will build on in future work, the analyses were not statistically powered. Additionally, due to the mental health focus of the intervention, we examined differences in each outcome by intervention group. We also examined whether the association between ACEs and each outcome was moderated by intervention group (online supplemental table 1). Stata V.16.1 was used for data analysis (StataCorp). All presented betas are unstandardised.

**Patient and public involvement**
Patient collaborators were not directly involved in the design, recruitment or dissemination of this study. However, women in the recruitment populations have expressed a high degree of interest in the issue of maternal mental health.

**RESULTS**

**Descriptive statistics**
Our analytic sample consisted of 889 women who were interviewed at 36 months post partum. Baseline (third trimester of pregnancy) participant characteristics of these participants are displayed in table 2. The majority (66.4%) received at least a fifth-grade education and had one to three children (62.5%); the mean age (SD) at baseline was 26.7 (4.4) years old. About 10% reported growing up in a household with a family member who had a mental health illness. The mean (SD) total score on the PSS-10 stress scale was 12.0 (8.8).

Fifty-eight per cent of women experienced at least one ACE (table 3), with a mean (SD; minimum, maximum) total number of ACEs of 1.2 (1.4; 0, 10). Among the 12 specific ACE items, emotional abuse (33.1%), physical abuse (23.5%) and emotional neglect (15.1%) were the most common. The most prevalent ACE domain was home violence (38.3%), followed by neglect (19.9%), family psychological distress (15.8%) and community violence (6.6%) (table 3). The distribution of ACEs was similar across the GAD and cortisol subsamples.

Of the 623 women present at the 36-month wave that completed the GAD-7, the mean (SD) total score was 4.0 (3.4) and 101 of the 623 participants (16.2%) had a score above the clinically significant cut-off of 10, which

| Description                              | Question                                                                 |
|------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Neglect                                  |                                                                          |
| Emotional neglect                        | Caregiver did not understand your problems/worries; did not know what you were doing with your free time |
| Physical neglect                         | Caregiver did not give you enough food or sending you to school even it could easily been done; too drunk/intoxicated by drugs to take care of you |
| Family psychological distress            |                                                                          |
| Alcohol and/or drug misuser in household | Lived with a household member who was a problem drinker, alcoholic or misused street/prescription drugs |
| Incarcerated household member            | Lived with a household member who ever sent to jail or prison             |
| Someone chronically depressed, mentally ill, institutionalised or suicidal | Lived with a household member who was depressed, mentally ill or suicidal |
| One or no parents, parental separation or divorce | Parents ever separated/divorced, or father/mother/guardian died |
| Home violence                            |                                                                          |
| Physical abuse                           | You being spanked/slapped/kicked/punched/beaten up; or being hit/cut with an object by parents/guardian |
| Emotional abuse                          | You were yelled at/screamed at/sworn at/insulted or humiliated, or were threatened/abandoned, thrown out by parents/guardian |
| Household member treated violently        | Saw or heard a parent/household member being yelled at/screamed at/sworn at/insulted or humiliated; being slapped/kicked/punched/beaten up; or being hit/cut with an object |
| Community violence                       |                                                                          |
| Bullying                                 | Being bullied                                                            |
| Community violence                       | See or hear someone being beaten up, stabbed, shot or being threatened with a knife or gun in real life |
| Collective violence                      | Forced to go and live in other place; experienced disruption of home due to these events; you or family member or friend killed or beaten up by soldiers, police, gangs or militia |
indicates moderate anxiety and signifies clinically significant GAD cases (online supplemental table 2).

There were no significant differences regarding descriptive characteristics between the three samples (N=889 for perceived stress, N=623 for anxiety, N=90 for cortisol). Compared with the PSS group, women in the GAD sample tended to be younger (M=26.7 in the PSS group, M=20.6 in the GAD group) (online supplemental table 2). The mean number of ACEs was higher in the cortisol subsample; fewer experienced 0 ACEs (24.4% in the cortisol group, 41.5% in the PSS group) and more experienced 4 or more (12.2% in the cortisol group, 6.8% in the PSS group). The cortisol subsample also experienced home violence at a higher rate compared with the PSS sample (52.2% vs 38.3%).

We also tested differences in the outcome variables by intervention group. Among women who were depressed at baseline, there were no significant differences in the PSS (p=0.38), GAD (p=0.23) or hair cortisol (p=0.33) based on whether they were assigned to the intervention or control group.

**Perceived stress**

The continuous total ACE indicator was associated with a higher PSS score (table 4, panel 1, model 1, B=1.0, 95% CI 0.7 to 1.3) at 36 months post partum, meaning that for every 1-point increase on the ACE scale (in other words, exposure to an additional adverse event), indicated a 1-point increase on the PSS. Higher scores on each of the ACE domains, family psychological distress, home violence and community violence, were associated with higher perceived stress.

**Anxiety**

The continuous total ACE score was associated with higher anxiety symptoms on the GAD-7 at 36 months post partum (table 4, panel 2, model 1, B=0.4; 95% CI 0.04

| Table 2 | Demographic features of mothers in the Bachpan cohort study |
|---------|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| Descriptor | ACEs and PSS, n=889 | Sample, N=889 |
| Baseline (third trimester of pregnancy) characteristics | | |
| Age | 26.7 | 8.4 |
| Education > 5th grade | 590 | 6.8 |
| Living with mental health issue in the natal home | 96 | 12.7% |
| Living children | | |
| First pregnancy | 258 | 29.0% |
| 1–3 children | 556 | 62.5% |
| 4+ children | 75 | 8.4% |
| Number of rooms, mean | 6.2 | 1.9 |
| People per room, mean | 2.4 | 1.7 |
| Socioeconomic status quintiles, mean | 2 | 0.05 |
| Nuclear family | 113 | 12.7% |
| Baseline PHQ-9 total | 8.4 | 6.7 |
| Outcome variables from 36-month postnatal interview | | |
| Total Perceived Stress Score (PSS), mean | 12 | 8.8 |
| Total Generalised Anxiety Disorder Score (GAD), mean, N=623 | 4 | 5.4 |
| Hair-derived cortisol, mean, N=90 (pg/mg) | 12.06 | 9.72 |

ACE, adverse childhood experience; PSS, Perceived Stress Scale.

| Table 3 | Maternal ACE characteristics in full sample |
|---------|--------------------------------------------|
| Description | Sample, N=889 |
| Neglect | | |
| Emotional neglect | 134 | 15.1% |
| Physical neglect | 49 | 5.5% |
| Family psychological distress | | |
| Household alcohol and/or drug use | 24 | 2.7% |
| Incarcerated household member | 16 | 1.8% |
| Depressed, mentally ill, institutionalised or suicidal household member | 21 | 2.4% |
| One or no parents, parental separation or divorce | 97 | 10.9% |
| Home violence | | |
| Physical abuse | 209 | 23.5% |
| Emotional abuse | 294 | 33.1% |
| Household member treated violently | 130 | 14.6% |
| Community violence | | |
| Bullying | 12 | 1.4% |
| Community violence | 60 | 6.8% |
| Collective violence | 4 | 0.5% |
| Domains | | |
| Neglect | 173 | 19.9% |
| Family psychological distress | 143 | 15.8% |
| Home violence | 349 | 38.3% |
| Community violence | 64 | 6.6% |
| Number of ACEs | | |
| 0 ACEs | 369 | 41.5% |
| 1 ACE | 239 | 26.8% |
| 2 ACEs | 139 | 15.6% |
| 3 ACEs | 82 | 9.2% |
| 4+ACEs | 61 | 6.8% |
| Any ACE Exposure | 520 | 58.5% |
| Total number of ACEs | 1.2 | 1.4 |

ACE, adverse childhood experience.
to 0.8). Anxiety symptoms were most strongly associated with a history of family psychological distress (model 4, B=1.6; 95% CI 0.3 to 2.9).

### Cortisol

In the cortisol subsample, experiencing higher levels of ACEs was correlated with higher cortisol levels (table 4, panel 3). Of the specific ACEs domains, home violence (model 5, B=6.7; 95% CI 2.7 to 10.8) and community violence (model 6, B=7.5; 95% CI 1.4 to 13.6) were associated with increased hair cortisol.

### DISCUSSION

The purpose of this study was to examine the impact of retrospectively reported ACEs on self-reported perceived stress, anxiety symptoms and hair cortisol in a sample of mothers residing in rural Pakistan. Our results revealed that ACEs are associated with increased perceived stress and anxiety later in adult life. These findings contribute to previous work indicating that the number of ACEs an individual experiences predicts their psychological functioning in adulthood.20 21 59 We found that an increased total ACE score predicted increased stress, anxiety and cortisol. The individual domains of ACEs did not reliably predict adult stress across outcome types. Together, these results suggest that the cumulative effect of multidimensional early adversity, as captured by a continuous ACE measure, may be more important in predicting adult stress than the individual domains of adversity.

A higher percentage of our sample experienced at least one ACE compared with other study samples set in Pakistan, likely due to the study sample being collected from a rural population with unique sources of stress and adversity.9 60 Indeed, additional studies set in rural contexts were needed. This prevalence was comparable to samples in other LMICs.61 62 In our sample, the continuous ACEs score, as well as most ACEs domains (including family psychological distress, home violence and community violence) were associated with perceived stress. The accumulation of disadvantages (ie, a higher number of ACEs) increases the likelihood that individuals who were exposed to ACEs experience a stressful environment later in life, potentially explaining the predictive power of many domains of ACEs on perceived stress.63

The continuous ACE score and the family psychological distress domain were associated with anxiety. These findings suggest that many domains of ACEs are associated with current perceptions of life stress, but only family psychological distress was linked to anxiety. The family psychological distress domain encompasses several ACEs (eg, parental separation, parental substance use) related to uncertainty and loss, which may be particularly impactful for the development of anxiety symptoms compared with the experience of stress. Indeed, experiences of loss and intolerance of uncertainty are indicated in the development of anxiety disorders.64 65 In addition, these findings may reflect the heritability of anxiety disorders. Mothers whose parents suffered from anxiety may be more likely to have experienced family psychological distress as children, and may also be more likely to experience anxiety as adults.

When examining the association between ACEs and hair cortisol, we found that the continuous ACE score or experiencing home violence were significant predictors of increased hair cortisol. This partially aligned with our hypothesis that early adversity is associated with increased HPA axis activity, and a subsequent increase in cortisol production.25 66 These results add to the body of evidence linking ACEs to HPA axis hyperactivity. Supporting our results, a study in India analysed hair cortisol in children and found it linked with adversity.67 Other studies have shown that among early life experiences, violence particularly has a potent impact on re-programming the HPA axis.68 Past research examining stress exposure and cortisol has been mixed, with studies indicating that both high and low levels of cortisol are associated with chronic stress exposure.69 Chronic stress may lead to an initial increase of HPA axis activity followed by a decrease in activity due to the HPA axis’ negative feedback loop. Our results would suggest that early exposure to violence...
is associated with increased activation of the HPA axis in adulthood. However, it is important to consider chronic suppression of the HPA axis as a potential outcome of early life stress. Furthermore, we did not control for additional factors that may contribute to hair cortisol concentration, including maternal BMI, hair-washing, recent stress exposure and illness. Future studies would benefit from a larger sample size to more fully investigate the relationship between ACE exposure and cortisol.

In LMICs, home violence in the form of interpersonal violence is particularly common, which is also reflected in our sample. Home violence was the only domain that significantly predicted cortisol, possibly because it is linked to consequences that are emotional in nature: isolation, fear, guilt, low self-esteem. Violence experienced at home may be internalised to a greater extent because it is physical, occurring closer to the child with a large presence in the child’s life. Domestic violence also increases the risk for other kinds of abuse. Young girls living in households with domestic violence are at risk for developing internalising mental health issues. Importantly, we did not control for current interpersonal violence, which might interact with earlier adverse exposures and mediate HPA axis activity. We also did not find associations between the emotional abuse items and cortisol. Threatening, violent behaviours lead to the activated kinds of outcomes we focused on compared with ones that stem from neglectful experiences, which tend to be emotional in nature.

Past research has suggested that experiences of deprivation (such as neglect) have distinct effects on development from experiences of threat (such as abuse or violence exposure). Specifically, researchers have found that deprivation experiences are associated with deficits in cognitive control and language development, whereas experiences of threat are more strongly associated with decreased emotion regulation and hypersensitivity to threat. The outcomes measured in this study (stress, anxiety and cortisol) may be more strongly associated with threat experiences rather than deprivation. Future studies interested in capturing the full scope of the effects of ACEs may benefit from also including outcomes related to individuals’ cognitive functioning.

This study benefited from a number of strengths. In particular, we investigated the impact of ACEs both continuously and as domains (neglect, home violence, family psychological distress, community violence). In particular, few prior studies have examined childhood adversity in the form of neglect. Neglect is the most common type of maltreatment, increasing the importance to explore it in research. Thus, we broke neglect into its subtypes of emotional and physical. The findings concerning neglect differed from the other domains, and future studies should examine neglect separately in addition to investigating its impact alongside other types of ACEs. In addition to modelling ACEs in multiple ways, we also approached the outcomes from two angles—perceived stress and anxiety—to discern nuances between the two seemingly similar yet ultimately distinct constructs. The results of our study point to their distinctive relationships with ACEs. Additionally, the inclusion of the cortisol subanalysis is another way to approach the study of stress and anxiety, with cortisol representing a biological contrast to behavioural self-report measures, PSS and GAD-7. Finally, our study was situated in an LMIC context, where ACEs have been understudied yet pose a significant public health burden.

These results should be interpreted in the context of several limitations. First, the study design was cross-sectional, limiting the potential to assess a temporal link between ACE exposure and the outcome variables. The cortisol subanalysis included a relatively small sample (n=90). Although this subanalysis was not able to be statistically powered, we intend to build on our findings to inform future work with this measure. Additionally, cortisol may not be as comparable to GAD-7 and PSS as it was measured at a different timepoint (12 months post partum vs 36 months post partum). We did not control for current depression in this sample as it is highly correlated with stress, anxiety and hair cortisol. In this study, we did not intend to test the effect of ACEs on stress, anxiety and cortisol distinct from other, often comorbid, mental health concerns, such as depression. However, depression may be important to consider in future studies as it may serve as a confounder influencing both retrospective self-report of childhood experiences and reports of stress. In addition, depression may be a mediator linking ACEs to later stress, anxiety and cortisol.

Another limitation is that the ACEs questionnaire involved recall bias due to questions asking about events that occurred years, if not decades ago, although the measure we used was designed to be asked retrospectively. All measures were self-reported and focused on the appraisal of experiences rather than the actual objective content, providing another pathway to produce subjective results. Retrospective reporting may be limited because it relies on participants’ memories of their childhood experiences; however, these reports may be relevant for understanding adult mental health. Newbury et al found that although both retrospective and prospective reports of maltreatment (which encompassed physical/emotional/sexual abuse and/or emotional/physical neglect) were associated with psychopathology, the strongest associations were discerned with the retrospective reports, a finding reinforced by other studies. Furthermore, there was low concordance between prospectively and retrospectively reported cases of maltreatment. Understanding the mechanisms behind these differential results should be further investigated in future work as this study and others suggest that whether and how an individual remembers ACEs, rather than what ACEs were experienced, may be relevant for adult outcomes.

A related limitation to the collection of data was that we did not measure childhood socioeconomic status and instead used participant education level as a proxy. We also did not include current stressful life events and...
violent exposure. The relatively wide confidence intervals indicate that our results warrant further follow-up with larger samples.

One important consideration is the potential impact of the intervention on the study outcomes. The broader intervention that this study is embedded in could have had priming effects on the participants. However, we did not see effects of the intervention on perceived stress or anxiety in this sample, indicating that the relationship between ACE exposure and mental health was independent of the intervention (online supplemental table 1).

Due to the potential risk to respondents and under-reporting, we excluded the ACE questions related to sexual abuse, presenting an additional limitation. A meta-analysis reported increasing burden of childhood sexual abuse on adult-onset mental and physical health in LMICs, as well as the need to understand how to support individuals who have faced such trauma.86 Childhood sexual abuse survivors face a lifetime of psychological distress, with differing effects on mental health compared with other types of ACEs.89 By excluding childhood sexual abuse from our study, we may not have captured the full extent of participants’ exposure to early adversity, nor were we able to capture the unique association between childhood sexual abuse and adult outcomes in this sample.

These results inform our understanding of how ACEs are associated with perceived stress, anxiety and HPA-axis functioning. ACEs were associated with heightened levels across all three domains of perceived stress, anxiety and cortisol, with varying precision and strength of estimates. Our study attempts to disentangle adversity into subtypes (neglect, home violence, family psychological distress, community violence) to pinpoint the impact of specific adverse events on HPA axis functioning, and therefore mental health conditions related to stress. Most studies of ACEs have focused on higher-income, well-educated populations, yet toxic stress tends to be embedded in social disadvantage and intergenerational adversity is often comorbid with other forms of maltreatment.17

Future research should centre on identifying potential moderators and mediators between ACEs and perceived stress and anxiety in order to create targeted interventions that support mental health among women who have experienced ACEs and reside in LMICs. For instance, social support, emotion regulation skills and positive self-perceptions are powerful protective factors that buffer women from the harmful effects of ACEs. In addition to exploring protective factors, it is important to investigate other unmeasured moderators, mediators and confounders impacting the relationship between ACEs and mental health. Furthermore, it would be insightful to disentangle the interplay among ACEs, adult stress and anxiety, and adult stress system functioning, which are not well understood in LMICs and has not been deeply explored in South Asia specifically.5 80 90 Stress, anxiety and cortisol are highly correlated as individuals who experience high anxiety, or clinically significant GAD, may be more likely to report higher levels of perceived stress. Exploring how this leads to or is caused by altered cortisol levels would be beneficial to inform intervention and policy, which also requires an understanding of protective, buffering factors that mitigate the consequences of ACEs at the individual, household and community levels. This is especially relevant as ACEs have been found to be predictive on a population level rather than on an individual level.92 Interventions targeting girls within community or school settings that harness these protective factors and prevent the consequences of ACEs have the potential to lessen HPA axis hyperactivity, prevent the intergenerational transmission of adversity and improve mental health outcomes in this population. As this study implies, understanding the differential impact of specific ACEs on perceived stress, anxiety and HPA-axis functioning can provide the foundation to then work on re-appraising traumatic experiences and reinforcing resilience.

Acknowledgements The authors thank the team at the Human Development Research Foundation (HDRF), including Raakshanda Liaqat, Tayyiba Abbasi, Maria Sharif, Samina Bilal, Quratul-Ain, Anum Nisar, Amina Bibi, Shaffaq Zargar, Sonia Khan, Ahmad Zaide, Ilchiq Ahmad and Najia Afif for their contributions to the study’s data collection, design and implementation. We also want to acknowledge the larger Bachpan and SHARE Child study teams as well as the women, children and communities that are a part of the Bachpan cohort. We are also grateful to Professor Fared Aslam Minhais from the Institute of Psychiatry, Rawalpindi Medical University for the assistance in the biomarker component of the study.

Contributors NI, JM, AF, KL, ES conceptualised the analysis. NI and VB analysed the data and JG, AF, KL, JM further contributed to the data interpretation. NI drafted the manuscript and all authors contributed substantively to revisions and further edits. JM, AH, VB, SS designed the larger study. JM served as the guarantor. All authors approved the final version to be submitted for publication and NI was responsible for the final submission.

Funding The study and study team received support from the US Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Health and Human Development for the larger research programme (R01HD075875) and Robertson Scholars Leadership Programme for general support and the US National Institute of Mental Health for research program funding (U19MH95687). Hair hormone collection and analysis was funded by the University of Melbourne (NIA). Funding for analyses was further secured from the NICHD (R30HD097434). JG was supported in part by CTSA grant UL1TR002553.

Competing interests None declared.

Patient and public involvement Patients and/or the public were not involved in the design, or conduct, or reporting, or dissemination plans of this research.

Patient consent for publication Not applicable.

Ethics approval This study involves human participants and the study was approved by institutional review boards at the Human Development Research Foundation, Duke University and the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill (19-2853 and 16-2361). Participants gave informed consent to participate in the study before taking part.
pathways of transmission to child behavior problems. Child Abuse Negl 2019;33:27–37.
16. Isobel S, Goodyear M, Furness T, et al. Preventing intergenerational trauma transmission: a critical interpretive synthesis. J Clin Nurs 2019;28:1100–13.
17. Rieder AD, Roth SL, Musyimi C, et al. Impact of maternal adverse childhood experiences on child socioemotional function in rural Kenya: mediating role of maternal mental health. Dev Sci 2019;22:e12833.
18. Ben-Shlomo Y, Kuh D. A life course approach to chronic disease epidemiology: conceptual models, empirical challenges and interdisciplinary perspectives. Oxford University Press, 2002.
19. Irish L, Kobayashi I, Delahantry DL. Long-term physical health consequences of childhood sexual abuse: a meta-analytic review. J Pers Disord 2019;35:450–61.
20. Mersky JP, Topitzes J, Reynolds AJ. Impacts of adverse childhood experiences on health, mental health, and substance use in early adulthood: a cohort study of an urban, minority sample in the U.S. Child Abuse Negl 2013;37:917–25.
21. Seiler A, Kohler S, Ruf-Leuschner M, et al. Adverse childhood experiences, mental health, and quality of life of Chilean girls placed in foster care: an exploratory study. Psychol Trauma 2016;8:180.
22. Racine NM, Madigan SL, Plamondon AR, et al. Differential associations of adverse childhood experiences on maternal mental health. Am J Prev Med 2018;54:368–75.
23. Negriff S. ACEs are not equal: examining the relative impact of household dysfunction versus childhood maltreatment on mental health in adolescence. Soc Sci Med 2020;243:112686.
24. LeMasters K, Bates LM, Chung EO, et al. Adverse childhood experiences and depression among women in rural Pakistan. BMC Public Health 2021;21:400.
25. Danase A, McEwen BS. Adverse childhood experiences, allostatics, allostatic load, and age-related disease. Physiol Behav 2012;106:29–39.
26. Hagaman AK, Baranov V, Chung E, et al. Association of maternal depression and home adversities with infant hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal (HPA) axis biomarkers in rural Pakistan. J Affect Disord 2020;276:592–9.
27. Naurus PS, Green S, Logan-Greene P, et al. Stress pathways to health inequalities: embedding ACEs within social and behavioral contexts. Int Public Health J 2016;8:241.
28. Khoury JE, Bosquett Enlow M, Plamondon A, et al. The association between adversity and hair cortisol levels in humans: a meta-analysis. Psychoneuroendocrinology 2019;103:104–17.
29. Kalmakis KA, Meyer JS, Chioldo L, et al. Adverse childhood experiences and chronic hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal activity. Stress 2015;18:446–50.
30. Iob E, Lacey R, Steptoe A. The long-term association of adverse childhood experiences with C-reactive protein and hair cortisol: cumulative risk versus dimensions of adversity. Brain Behav Immun 2020;87:318–28.
31. Fries E, Hesse J, Hellhammer J, et al. A new view on hypocortisolism. Psychoneuroendocrinology 2005;30:1010–6.
32. Gunnar MR, Vasquez DB. Low cortisol and a flattening of expected daytime rhythm; potential indices of risk in human development. Dev Psychopathol 2001;13:515–38.
33. Iglesias S, Jacobsen D, Gonzalez D, et al. Hair cortisol: a new tool for evaluating stress in programs of stress management. Life Sci 2015;141:188–92.
34. Russell E, Koren G, Rieder M, et al. Hair cortisol as a biological marker of chronic stress: current status, future directions and unanswered questions. Psychoneuroendocrinology 2012;37:589–601.
35. Steude-Schmiedgen S, Kirschbaum C, Alexander N, et al. An integrative model linking traumatization, cortisol dysregulation and posttraumatic stress disorder: insight from recent hair cortisol findings. Neurosci Biobehav Rev 2016;69:124–35.
36. D’Anna-Hernandez KL, Ross RG, Natvig GL, et al. Hair cortisol levels as a retrospective marker of hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis activity throughout pregnancy: comparison to salivary cortisol. Physiol Behav 2011;104:348–53.
37. Pochigaeva K, Druzhkova T, Yakovlev A, et al. Hair cortisol as a biomarker of hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis activity in female patients with major depressive disorder. Metab Brain Dis 2017;32:577–83.
38. Karatekin C, Ahluwalia R. Effects of adverse childhood experiences, stress, and social support on the health of college students. J Interpers Violence 2020;35:150–72.
39. Samia P, Premji S, Tavangar F, et al. Adverse childhood experiences and changing levels of psychosocial distress scores across

Ikram N, et al. BMJ Open 2022;12:e052280. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2021-052280

Provenance and peer review Not commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

Data availability statement Data are available upon reasonable request. The dataset used in the current study are available from the corresponding author (naira.ikram@duke.edu) on reasonable request.

Supplemental material This content has been supplied by the author(s). It has not been vetted by BMJ Publishing Group Limited (BMJ) and may not have been peer reviewed. Any opinions or recommendations discussed are solely those of the author(s) and are not endorsed by BMJ. BMJ disclaims all liability and responsibility arising from any reliance placed on the content. Where the content includes any translated material, BMJ does not warrant the accuracy and reliability of the translations (including but not limited to local regulations, clinical guidelines, terminology, drug names and drug dosages), and is not responsible for any error and/or omissions arising from translation and adaptation or otherwise.

Open access This is an open access article distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, remix, adapt, build upon this work non-commercially, and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited, appropriate credit is given, any changes made indicated, and the use and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is

ORCID iD Katherine LeMasters http://orcid.org/0000-0002-1754-1730

REFERENCES

1. Ramiro LS, Madrid BJ, Brown DW. Adverse childhood experiences (ACE) and health-risk behaviors among adults in a developing country setting. Child Abuse Negl 2010;34:842–55.
2. Hughes K, Bellis MA, Hardcastle KA, et al. The effect of multiple adverse childhood experiences on health in a systematic review and meta-analysis. Lancet Public Health 2017;2:339–66.
3. De Venter M, Demyttenaere K, Bruffaerts R. The relationship between adverse childhood experiences and mental health in adulthood: A systematic literature review. Tijdtschr Psychiatr 2013;55:259–68.
4. McLafferty M, Armour C, McKenna E, et al. Child health adversity profiles and adult psychopathology in a representative Northern Ireland study. J Anxiety Disord 2015;35:42–8.
5. Manyema M, Norns SA, Richter LM. Stress begets stress: the association of adverse childhood experiences with psychological distress in the presence of adult life stress. BMC Public Health 2018;18:1–12.
6. Felitti VJ, Anda RF, Nordenberg D, et al. Relationship of childhood abuse and household dysfunction to many of the leading causes of death in adults. The adverse childhood experiences (ACE) study. Am J Prev Med 1998;14:245–58.
7. Fisher J, Cabral de Mello M, Patel V, et al. Prevalence and determinants of common perinatal mental disorders in women in low- and lower-middle-income countries: a systematic review. Bull World Health Organ 2012;90:139–49.
8. Walker SP, Wachs TD, Grantham-McGregor S, et al. Inequality in early childhood: risk and protective factors for early child development. Lancet 2011;378:1325–38.
9. Haaris Sheikh M, Naveed S, Waqas A, et al. Association of adverse childhood experiences with functional identity and impulsivity among adults: a cross-sectional study. PLoS One 2017;6:1978.
10. Premji SS, Lalani S, Shaikh K, et al. Comorbid anxiety and depression among pregnant Pakistani women: higher rates, different vulnerability characteristics, and the role of perceived stress. Int J Environ Res Public Health 2020;17:7296.
11. Bhandari S, Levitch AH, Ellis KK, et al. Comparative analyses of stressors experienced by rural low-income pregnant women experiencing intimate partner violence and those who are not. J Obstet Gynaecol Malays 2008;37:49–51.
12. Tariq S, Tarq S, Tarq S, et al. Perceived stress, severity and sources of stress among female medical students in a private medical college in Pakistan. J Pak Med Assoc 2020;70:162–7.
13. Shah M, Hasan S, Malik S, et al. Perceived stress, sources and severity of stress among medical undergraduates in a Pakistani medical school. BMC Med Educ 2010;10:2.
14. Shamai U, Hatcher J, Shamai A, et al. A multicentre matched case control study of risk factors for preeclampsia in healthy women in pregnancy. BMC Womens Health 2010;10:14.
15. Cooke JE, Racine N, Plamondon A, et al. Maternal adverse childhood experiences, attachment style, and mental health:
pregnancy in Kenyan women. *Int J Environ Res Public Health* 2020;17:3401.

40. Wong AE, Dirghangi SR, Hart SR. Self-concept clarity mediates the effects of adverse childhood experiences on adult suicide behavior, depression, loneliness, perceived stress, and life distress. *Self and Identity* 2019;18:247–66.

41. Reiser SJ, McMillan KA, Wright KD, et al. Adverse childhood experiences and health anxiety in adulthood. *Child Abuse Negl* 2014;38:407–13.

42. Sachs-Ericsson NJ, Sheaffer JL, Stanley IH, et al. When emotional pain becomes physical: adverse childhood experiences, pain, and the role of mood and anxiety disorders. *J Clin Psychol* 2017;73:1403–28.

43. Munoz RT, Pearson LC, Hellman CM, et al. Adverse childhood experiences and posttraumatic stress as a antecedent of anxiety and lower hope. *Traumatology* 2018;24:209–18.

44. Bowers K, Ding L, Gregory S, et al. Maternal distress and hair cortisol in pregnancy among women with elevated adverse childhood experiences. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 2018;95:145–8.

45. Sikander S, Lazarus A, Bangash O, et al. The effectiveness and cost-effectiveness of the peer-delivered thinking healthy programme for perinatal depression in Pakistan and India: the share study protocol for randomised controlled trials. *Trials* 2015;16:1–14.

46. Turner EL, Sikander S, Bangash O, et al. The effectiveness of the peer delivered thinking healthy plus (THPP+) programme for maternal depression and child socio-emotional development in Pakistan: study protocol for a three-year cluster randomized controlled trial. *Trials* 2016;17:422.

47. Maselko J, Sikander S, Turner EL, et al. Effectiveness of a peer-delivered, psychosocial intervention on maternal depression and child development at 3 years postnatal: a cluster randomised trial in Pakistan. *Lancet Psychiatry* 2020;7:775–87.

48. Vanobbergen F, Weiss HA, Fuhr DC, et al. Effectiveness of the thinking healthy programme for perinatal depression delivered through Peers: pooled analysis of two randomised controlled trials in India and Pakistan. *J Affect Disord* 2020;265:660–8.

49. Kidman R, Smith D, Piccolo LR, et al. Psychometric evaluation of the adverse childhood experience international questionnaire (ACE-IQ) in Malawian adolescents. *Child Abuse Negl* 2015;45:58–70.

50. Kazem OT. A validation of the adverse childhood experiences scale in Nigeria. *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences* 2015;5:18–23.

51. Cohen S, Kamarck T, Mermelstein R. Perceived stress scale: measuring stress: a guide for health and social scientists. *Oxford University Press*, 1994.

52. Chakraborti A, Ray P, Sanyal D, et al. Assessing perceived stress in medical personnel: in search of an appropriate scale for the Bengali population. *Indian J Psychol Med* 2013;35:29.

53. Stubbbs B, Veronese N, Vancampfort D. Adverse childhood experiences, stress and smoking across 41 countries: a global perspective across Europe, Asia, Africa and the Americas. *Sci Rep* 2017;7:7597.

54. Spitzer RL, Kroenke K, Williams JBW, et al. Brief measure for assessing generalized anxiety disorder: the GAD-7. *Arch Intern Med* 2006;166:1092–9.

55. Ahmad S, Hussain S, Shah FS, et al. Urdu translation and validation of GAD-7: a screening and rating tool for anxiety symptoms in primary health care. *J Pak Med Assoc* 2017;67:153640.

56. Stapor T, Kirschbaum C. Analysis of cortisol in hair--state of the art and future directions. *Brain Behav Immun* 2012;26:1019–29.

57. Gao W, Stalder T, Foley P, et al. Quantitative analysis of steroid hormones in human hair using a column-switching LC-APCI-MS/MS assay. *J Chromatogr B Analyt Technol Biomed Life Sci* 2013;938:1–8.

58. Cohen S, Janicki-Deverts D, Chen E, et al. Childhood socioeconomic status and adult health. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* 2010;1186:37–55.

59. Herrenkohl TI, Hong S, Kilka JB, et al. Developmental impacts of child abuse and neglect related to adult mental health, substance use, and physical health. *J Fam Violence* 2013;28:191–9.

60. Shaikh K, Premji SS, Lalani S, et al. Ethnic disparity and exposure to supplements rather than adverse childhood experiences linked to preterm birth in Pakistani women. *J Affect Disord* 2020;267:49–56.

61. Flores-Torres MH, Corneford E, Signorelli L, et al. Impact of adverse childhood experiences on cardiovascular disease risk factors in adulthood among Mexican women. *Child Abuse Negl* 2020;99:104175.

62. Escueva M, Whetten K, Ostermann J, et al. Adverse childhood experiences, psychosocial well-being and cognitive development among orphans and abandoned children in five low income countries. *BMC Public Health* 2014;14:1–13.

63. Rutter M. Pathways from childhood to adult health. *J Child Psychol Psychiatry* 1989;30:23–51.

64. Kendler KS, Hettema JM, Butera F, et al. Life event dimensions of loss, humiliation, entrapment, and danger in the prediction of onsets of major depression and generalized anxiety. *Arch Gen Psychiatry* 2003;60:789–96.

65. Koerner N, Dugas MJ. A cognitive model of generalized anxiety disorder: the role of intolerance of uncertainty, worry and its psychological disorders: theory, assessment and treatment. 2006: 201–16.

66. Shenk CE, Putnam FW, Noll JG. Experiential avoidance and the relationship between child maltreatment and PTSD symptoms: preliminary evidence. *Child Abuse Negl* 2012;36:118–26.

67. Bhopal S, Verma D, Roy R, et al. The contribution of childhood adversity to cortisol measures of early life stress amongst infants in rural India: findings from the early life stress sub-study of the spring cluster randomised controlled trial (SPRING-ELS). *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 2019;107:241–50.

68. Dajani R, Hadfield K, van Uum S, et al. Hair cortisol concentrations in war-affected adolescents: a prospective intervention trial. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 2018;89:138–46.

69. Miller GE, Chen E, Zhou S. If it goes up, must it come down? Chronic stress and the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenocortical axis in humans. *Psych Bull* 2007;133:25.

70. Daley D, MaCauley M, van den Broek N. Interventions for women who report domestic violence during and after pregnancy in low- and middle-income countries - foundational r...
determinations in an at-risk sample of young adolescents. *Child Maltreat* 2008;13:14–26.

88 Veenema TG, Thornton CP, Corley A. The public health crisis of child sexual abuse in low and middle income countries: an integrative review of the literature. *Int J Nurs Stud* 2015;52:864–81.

89 Banyard VL, Williams LM, Siegel JA. The long-term mental health consequences of child sexual abuse: an exploratory study of the impact of multiple traumas in a sample of women. *J Trauma Stress* 2001;14:697–715.

90 Naveed S, Wagas A, Chaudhary AMD, et al. Prevalence of common mental disorders in South Asia: a systematic review and meta-regression analysis. *Front Psychiatry* 2020;11:573150.

91 Chapman DP, Whitfield CL, Felitti VJ, et al. Adverse childhood experiences and the risk of depressive disorders in adulthood. *J Affect Disord* 2004;82:217–25.

92 Baldwin JR, Caspi A, Meehan AJ, et al. Population vs individual prediction of poor health from results of adverse childhood experiences screening. *JAMA Pediatr* 2021;175:385–93.