Resilience in Haiti: is it culturally pathological?

Daniel Derivois,1 Jude Mary Cénat,2 Amira Karray,3 Nathalie Guiller-Pasut,4 Jeff M. Cadichon,5 Baptiste Lignier,6 Nephtalie E. Joseph,7 Lisbeth Brolles8 and Yoram Mouchenik9

Not for the first time in recent history, the people of Haiti have been obliged to fall back on their resilience strategies in the aftermath of Hurricane Matthew. Following the powerful earthquake that struck the country on 12 January 2010, the entire population had to find the resources to survive in the face of extensive material damage and loss of life: over 222 000 dead, more than 300 000 injured and between 4000 and 7000 amputees (UNDP, 2010).

Paradoxical resilience

Several post-disaster studies (Cénat & Derivois, 2014a, 2014b; Derivois et al, 2014b) found that there was a marked prevalence (varying between 30 and 50%) of post-traumatic stress disorder and depression symptoms in these studies. Some studies also highlight a paradox: the most vulnerable populations in Haiti have the highest resilience scores. Children living in the street with no schooling have higher resilience levels than children who go to school and have a house in which to live. A recent study (Cadichon & Derivois, 2016) conducted 6 years after the seismic event has revealed that resilience levels are higher among: (a) children and adolescents whose parents do not work (compared with those of working parents), and (b) people with disabilities following the earthquake (compared with those with no disability). Although a high level of resilience does not imply an absence of trauma (as emphasised by Almeidom & Glandon, 2007), it is surprising that children and adolescents who live in the street, do not go to school, have a disability or whose parents are unemployed have more resources to cope with adversity.

Halfway resiliency or a pathological resilience?

How can we make sense of these findings, is resilience the central issue? Various studies (Cénat & Derivois, 2014a, 2014b) have postulated that resilience goes beyond dealing with and adapting to traumatic experiences, i.e. being able to absorb or resist them. Resilience is, above all, the capacity to bounce back and develop in a positive way. The data from studies cited above indicate that the more difficult the conditions are, the more likely people are to invent paradoxical coping strategies. They were not more ready, however, for new natural disasters.

Hurricane Matthew, which left hundreds dead in Haiti, has recently shown that although the population was completely unprepared to tackle...
a natural disaster, it resulted in paradoxical indicators of resilience. For example, while the south was cut off from the rest of the country and thousands of deaths were feared, the inhabitants of Port-au-Prince took to the streets to dance the mam (traditional music band) in the rain. Given these circumstances, is it appropriate to talk about ‘pathological resilience’ (Derivois, 2012)? That is, a form of resilience that sublimes setbacks and makes it possible to ‘roll with the punches’ without the ability to bounce back in the long term? There are two possible hypotheses: The Haitian people are genuinely resilient and exploit this memory of resilience, which is inherited and has developed progressively in response to traumatic events (particularly in the country’s cultural, colonial and traumatic history). The development of this resilience could also be explained by the Haitian social configuration where there is an interconnection between social supports and resources such as family, school, religion, collective spirituality, community networks and personal resources developed by individuals to deal with adverse living conditions (Cénat et al., 2013; Clermont-Mathieu et al., 2016). Alternatively, the people turn to ‘marronnage’ (see below), i.e. they evade the methodological and conceptual tools used to study their fragility and resilience, and – in more general terms – they ‘run away’ when faced with the international, humanitarian and scientific community that claims to understand and assist them or help them grow. Historically, marronnage was a technique used by slaves in the plantations to escape the watchful eye of their colonial masters (Fouchard, 1988). Is it possible that the legacy of marronnage might induce the Haitian people to organise themselves to escape the theoretical tools employed to assess their trauma and resilience? In both of the above cases, the hypothesis of pathological resilience should prompt us not only to question the tools we use but also to seek out the hidden sense of the outcomes. Unless, that is, the concept of ‘resistance’ that resonates more profoundly with the collective history and psyche of Haiti would be a more effective way of thinking about this hidden meaning. The culture could then be a profitable means of analysing the paradoxes of resilience.

The ideas outlined above should help researchers and practitioners work towards a better assessment of the risk factors, defence strategies and traumatic consequences arising from natural disasters in Haiti and other low- and middle-income countries. They should then be in a position to improve the assistance offered to surviving populations by using their own cultural heritage as a therapeutic tool and to potentially reinforce resilience.

References
Almedom A. M. & Glandon D. (2007) Resilience is not the absence of PTSD any more than health is the absence of disease. Journal of loss and Trauma, 12, 127–143.
Cadichon J. M. & Derivois D. (2016) Vulnérabilité et résilience des élèves haïtiens dans le contexte post séisme en Haïti. [Vulnerability and resilience of Haitian students in the post-earthquake context in Haiti.] 57ème congrès annuel de la Société Française de Psychologie, 5–7 September 2016. Paris, France.
Cénat J. M. & Derivois D. (2016a) Psychometric properties of the Créole Haitian version of the Resilience Scale amongst child and adolescent survivors of the 2010 earthquake. Comprehensive Psychiatry, 55, 388–395.
Cénat J. M. & Derivois D. (2014b) Long-term outcomes among child and adolescent survivors of the 2010 Haitian earthquake. Anxiety and Depression, 32, 57–63.
Cénat J. M., Derivois D. & Mérisset G. G. (2013) École et résilience chez les enfants et adolescents dans l’Haïti post-séisme. [School and resilience in children and adolescents in post-earthquake Haiti.] Revue québécoise de Psychologie, 42, 189–201.
Clermont-Mathieu M., Jean-Jacques R. & Derivois D. (2016) Les Tuteurs de résilience des enfants et adolescents vivant dans des camps à Port-au-Prince et dans les villes avoisinantes. [Tutors of resiliency of children and adolescents living in camps in Port-au-Prince and surrounding cities.] L’Encéphale, 42, 670–475.
Derivois D. (2012) L’hypothèse d’une résilience de l’Esprit et des esprits en Haïti. [Reflection about Resilience of Spirit and of religious spirits in Haiti.] Sciences croisées, 11, 1–9. http://sciences-croisees.com/N11/Derivois.pdf.
Derivois D., Cénat J. M. & Mérisset G. G. (2014a) Multi-natural disasters in Gonaves Haiti: long-term outcomes among child and adolescents and social support. International Journal of Emergency Mental Health and Human Resilience, 16, 292–297.
Derivois D., Mérisset G. G., Cénat J. M., et al (2014b) Symptoms of posttraumatic stress disorder and social support among children and adolescents after the 2010 Haitian earthquake. Journal of loss and Trauma: International Perspectives on Stress and Coping, 19, 202–212.
Farmer P. (2012) Haiti After the Earthquake. PublicAffairs.
Fouchard J. (1988) Les Marrons de la Liberté [The Maroons of Freedom]. Editions Henri Deschamps.
United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) (2010) Human Development Report 2010. Palgrave Macmillan.