Susceptibilities of Zidovudine-Resistant Variants of Human Immunodeficiency Virus Type 1 to Inhibition by Acyclic Nucleoside Phosphonates

YI-FEI GONG, DANA R. MARSHALL,† RANGA V. SRINIVAS, AND ARNOLD FRIDLAND*
Department of Infectious Diseases, St. Jude Children's Research Hospital, Memphis, Tennessee 38101

Received 6 December 1993/Returned for modification 4 April 1994/Accepted 7 May 1994

The acyclic purine nucleoside phosphonates, a newly described class of broad-spectrum antiviral agents, effectively inhibit human immunodeficiency virus type 1 (HIV-1) replication in vitro and in animal AIDS models. 9-(2-Phosphonylmethoxyethyl)adenine (PMEA) is currently being evaluated in clinical trials in patients with AIDS. In this study, we investigated the efficacy of PMEA and a related analog, 9-(2-phosphonylmethoxypropyl)diaminopurine (PMDPAP), against HIV-1 isolates exhibiting various degrees of resistance to zidovudine (azidothymidine [AZT]). HIV isolates highly (~50 to 200-fold) resistant to AZT were found to be about two- to eightfold less susceptible to PMEA. A comparable degree of cross-resistance to PMDPAP, a structurally related analog of PMEA, was also observed. However, the 50% effective dose values of PMEA or PMDPAP against a panel of HIV isolates showing intermediate levels (~8 to 25-fold) of AZT resistance was indistinguishable from the 50% effective dose values of PMEA (0.7 to 1.7 versus 2 μM) or PMDPAP (0.4 to 1.4 versus 0.8 to 1 μM) against HIV isolates from patients who had not previously used AZT. In addition, we were unable to generate PMEA- (or PMDPAP)-resistant HIV-1 variants by >30 serial passages of the virus in the presence of increasing concentrations of PMEA. Careful analysis of HIV-1 isolates from patients previously treated with AZT for cross-resistance to PMEA are needed to evaluate the significance of these observations.

Several dideoxynucleosides have been shown to inhibit the replication of human immunodeficiency virus (HIV), the etiologic agent of AIDS. Three compounds, 3'-azido-3'-deoxythymidine (AZT or zidovudine) (19, 25), 2',3'-dideoxynosine (ddI or didanosine) (1, 18), and 2',3'-dideoxyctydine (ddC or zalcitabine) (5, 26), have been approved for antiretroviral therapy in AIDS. Administration of AZT, ddC, or ddI has been shown to result in clinical and immunologic improvement and confers increased survival on HIV-infected patients with advanced immunodeficiency. None of these agents is curative, and their long-term use is restricted by either transient or incomplete activities and development of resistances. Recently, a new class of compounds—the phosphonomethyl ether analogs of purine and pyrimidine bases—have been shown to exert broad-spectrum antiviral activity against several DNA and RNA viruses, including HIV (7). Of these, the adenine analog 9-(2-phosphonomethoxyethyl)adenine (PMEA) has been studied extensively and found to be active against HIV and other retroviruses, including HIV type 2 (HIV-2), simian immunodeficiency virus, feline immunodeficiency virus, and Moloney murine sarcoma virus (2, 3). PMEA is also active against various herpesviruses, including herpes simplex virus types 1 and 2, cytomegalovirus, and Epstein-Barr virus (7-10). Thus, PMEA is of interest both as a potential antiretroviral drug for HIV-1 infections and for the treatment of some of the opportunistic infections associated with AIDS. A related phosphonate analog, 9-(2-phosphonomethoxypropyl)diaminopurine (PMDPAP), exhibits greater anti-HIV activity, although it is less effective against herpesviruses. The chemical structures of PMEA and PMDPAP are shown in Fig. 1.

AZT is considered the standard antiretroviral therapy for initiating treatment of patients with HIV infection. Widespread use of AZT monotherapy has led to the emergence of AZT-resistant HIV, and several lines of evidence indicate that late decreases in CD4 cell counts in patients receiving AZT may be due in part to the development of viral resistance (4, 23). Furthermore, primary infections with AZT-resistant HIV are being documented (11). It is therefore important to evaluate the efficacy of new anti-HIV agents for efficacy against AZT-resistant HIV isolates. In this study, we investigated the patterns of susceptibility of various AZT-resistant HIV isolates to the acyclic nucleoside phosphonates PMEA and PMDPAP.

The human T-lymphocytic cell lines H9 and MT-2, as well as the various HIV isolates used in this study, were obtained from the National Institutes of Health AIDS Research and Reference Reagent Repository (Ogden Bioservices, Rockville, Md.). The various HIV isolates used in this study included pairs of predrug (AZT-susceptible) isolates (H112-2 and G762-3) and postdrug (AZT-resistant) isolates G910-6 and G691-2 from patients who underwent long-term AZT monotherapy (14, 15), as well as a panel of four isolates with an intermediate degree of resistance to AZT (1391-4, 1495-2, 1391-1, and G910-11) (16). All of the viruses were propagated in H9 or MT-2 cells maintained in RPMI 1640 medium supplemented with 10% fetal bovine serum and 2 mM glutamate.

Susceptibilities of AZT-resistant HIV-1 mutants to acyclic nucleoside phosphonates. We first examined HIV-1 isolates G910-6 and G691-2, reported to be highly resistant to AZT, and the corresponding AZT-susceptible predrug isolates H112-2 and G762-3 for in vitro susceptibility to AZT, ddI, or PMEA in MT-2 cells by using a tetrazolium (XTT) dye conversion assay (12, 24). The various virus isolates were tested in a cell culture inhibition assay, and the 50% inhibitory concen-
trations of the drugs were determined. Under the experimental conditions used, all of the HIV-infected MT-2 cells succumb to virus infection and no viable cells remain at the end of 7 days. Thus, the drug concentration in which the viable cell numbers of HIV-infected cultures correspond to 50% of the viable cell numbers in uninfected cultures is the 50% effective antiviral dose (ED50). AZT-susceptible isolates H112-2 and G762-3 were both readily inhibited by PMEA (ED50 ~ 2 ± 0.2 μM) (Fig. 2C). Surprisingly, AZT-resistant isolates G-910-6 and G691-2 were four- to eightfold less susceptible to PMEA, with ED50 values of 8 ± 2 and 16 ± 6 μM, respectively. As previously described, compared with H112-2 and G762-3, both G-910-6 and G691-2 were highly resistant to AZT, with ED50 values exceeding an AZT concentration of 20 μM (Fig. 2A). By contrast, the mean ED50 of AZT against susceptible isolates H112-2 and G762-3 in three independent experiments was ~0.05 μM. The susceptibility of the AZT-resistant isolates to ddI was unaffected, and the ED50 values ranged from 12 to 14 μM for the AZT-susceptible and AZT-resistant isolates (Fig. 2B).

The XTT assay is an indirect way to measure the antiviral activities of various compounds, and it measures the protection of HIV-induced MT-2 cells from virus-induced cell killing. We therefore investigated the effects of different compounds on virus yields from HIV-infected MT-2 cells. For these studies, MT-2 cells were infected with various virus stocks by using an inoculum standardized to contain 1 reverse transcriptase (RT) cpm per cell. Virus-infected cells were seeded at a concentration of 0.2 × 10⁶/ml in media containing various concentrations of AZT, ddI, or PMEA. After 5 days of incubation, the RT activities of the culture supernatants were determined and the drug concentrations yielding half-maximal RT activity were calculated. RT assays were performed in accordance with previously described procedures (20), with the following modifications. Primarily, [3H]TTP was used in place of [32P]TTP and incorporation of radioactive TTP was monitored by liquid scintillation in an LKB Betaplate reader instead of autoradiography. The results were similar to those obtained with the XTT assay, and the ED50 values of PMEA against AZT-resistant isolates G910-6 and G691-2 were about four- to fivefold greater than the values against AZT-susceptible isolates H112-2 and G762-3 (data not shown).

FIG. 1. Structures of PMEA, PMPDAP, and AZT.

FIG. 2. Susceptibilities of paired AZT-susceptible and AZT-resistant HIV-1 isolates to AZT, ddI, and PMEA. Two pairs of HIV isolates obtained from two patients prior to and after AZT monotherapy were tested for susceptibility to AZT, ddI, and PMEA in MT-2 cells by XTT assay. The viable cell numbers expressed as percentages of uninfected control cultures were used as a measure of antiviral drug efficacy. H112-2 and G762-3 were pre-AZT isolates, and G910-6 and G691-2 were post-AZT isolates. Data from a representative experiment are shown, and the ED50 values in the text represent means of three independent experiments.


**Table 1. Susceptibilities of various AZT-resistant HIV isolates to PMEA and PMPDAP in peripheral blood mononuclear cell cultures**

| Isolate   | Mutation(s)* | AZT \(\text{ED}_{50} (\mu M)\) ± SD | PMEA \(\text{ED}_{50} (\mu M)\) ± SD | PMPDAP \(\text{ED}_{50} (\mu M)\) ± SD |
|-----------|--------------|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| AZT susceptible |               |                                     |                                 |                                   |
| H112-2    | None (wild type) | 0.04 ± 0.001                        | 2.0 ± 0.1                       | 0.8 ± 0.05                       |
| G762-3    | None (wild type) | 0.04 ± 0.001                        | 2.0 ± 0.2                       | 1.0 ± 0.01                       |
| AZT resistant |            |                                     |                                 |                                   |
| G910-6    | D-67→N, K-70→R, T-215→F, K-219→Q | 6 ± 0.4                             | 8 ± 2.4                         | 3 ± 2                            |
| G691-2    | D-67→N, K-70→R, T-215→Y, K-219→Q | 5 ± 1                               | 16 ± 6                          | 10 ± 5                           |
| Intermediately AZT resistant | |                                     |                                 |                                   |
| 1391-4    | 67 (m→w), 215 (m→w), 70 (w→m) | 0.3 ± 0.02                          | 0.8 ± 0.1                       | 0.6 ± 0.3                        |
| 1391-1    | 215          | 1.1 ± 0.1                           | 0.8 ± 0.1                       | 1.4 ± 0.1                        |
| G910-11   | 215          | 0.6 ± 0.3                           | 1.7 ± 0.5                       | 1 ± 0.1                          |
| 1495-2    | 70,215       | 0.3 ± 0.1                           | 0.7 ± 0.1                       | 0.4 ± 0.1                        |

* The genotypes of AZT-resistant and susceptible isolates have been determined by nucleotide sequencing (11, 13). The intermediate AZT resistance panel has been analyzed for mutations at RT codons 67, 70, 215, and 219 by PCR (12). The prevalence of wild-type (w) or mutant (m) sequences at each codon is indicated when a mutation of viruses was present.

* Each value represents the mean of three independent measurements.

Previous studies have identified several mutations in the RT gene of G910-6 and G691-1, and the presence of multiple mutations has been shown to correlate with a high degree of AZT resistance (14). We therefore tested a panel of genotypically defined HIV-1 isolates that exhibit various degrees of AZT resistance to identify the RT mutations that determine cross-resistance to PMEA. These experiments were carried out in peripheral blood mononuclear cell cultures. Peripheral blood mononuclear cells were isolated from heparinized blood samples collected from healthy volunteers by Ficoll-Hypaque density gradient centrifugation and maintained in lymphocyte stimulation medium (RPMI containing 20% fetal bovine serum, 5 μg of phytohemagglutinin-P per ml, and 1 ng of interleukin-2 per ml) for 48 to 72 h prior to infection. The cells were infected with the various HIV isolates (at a multiplicity of 0.1) and maintained in the absence or presence of increasing concentrations of AZT, PMEA, or PMPDAP for 5 to 7 days. The extent of virus replication was monitored by determining the RT activity in the culture supernatants, and the data were used to calculate the \(\text{ED}_{50}\) values of the different drugs. Table 1 shows that the \(\text{ED}_{50}\) values of AZT were \(~0.04\) μM for susceptible isolates H112-2 and G762-3 and \(~5\) μM for resistant isolates G910-6 and G691-2. The \(\text{ED}_{50}\) values against HIV isolates in the intermediate AZT-resistant panel ranged from 0.3 to 1.1 μM. The \(\text{ED}_{50}\) value of PMEA against the AZT-susceptible isolates was \(~2\) μM. Consistent with the results obtained with MT-2 cells, highly AZT-resistant viruses G910-6 and G691-2 showed some reduction (about four- to eightfold) in their susceptibility to PMEA, compared with the corresponding wild-type isolates H112-2 and G762-3. However, all four isolates with intermediate AZT resistance showed full susceptibility to PMEA (\(\text{ED}_{50}\) 0.7 to 1.7 μM). Essentially similar results were obtained with PMPDAP. The highly resistant AZT strains were \(~4\) to 10-fold less susceptible to PMPDAP than were the corresponding AZT-susceptible isolates, while strains with intermediate AZT resistance retained their susceptibility to PMPDAP (Table 1).

In other studies, we have tried to isolate HIV variants capable of replicating in the presence of high concentrations of PMEA. MT-2 cells were infected with HIV at a multiplicity of 1 RT cm per cell and incubated in the presence of PMEA (1, 2, or 4 μM) or AZT (0.05, 0.1, or 0.2 μM) at concentrations corresponding to 0.5, 1, or 2 \(\text{ED}_{50}\) units of the drugs. At weekly intervals, one-half of the culture was removed and replaced with an equal volume of the culture medium containing the appropriate drug concentrations. The culture supernatants were harvested when the cultures exhibited extensive syncytia, clarified by centrifugation, and used to initiate the next round of infection in fresh MT-2 cells. In each successive passage, a drug concentration that was equal to or twice as high as the drug concentration in the previous passage was used. The \(\text{ED}_{50}\) values of the respective drugs against the viruses isolated from different passages were determined by RT assays. HIV with reduced (\(~10\)-fold) susceptibility to AZT was isolated after about 10 passages (data not shown). By contrast, we were not able to isolate viruses resistant to PMEA, even after 30 passages over a period of 1 year, suggesting that HIV does not readily acquire resistance to acyclic nucleoside phosphonates.

It is interesting to speculate why we were unable to isolate PMEA-resistant HIV-1 variants. It is possible that the drug concentrations used in the selection procedure were insufficient to exert pressure for selection of variants. Alternatively, development of resistance to PMEA might require interplay between mutations at different sites on the RT-encoding gene. Further studies using alternate approaches to investigate aspects of PMEA resistance in HIV are in progress.

In this study, eight clinical isolates with different degrees of susceptibility to AZT were tested for susceptibility to the acyclic nucleotide phosphonates PMEA and PMPDAP. Only two isolates, G910-6 and G691-2, highly (\(~50\)- to 200-fold) resistant to AZT, showed partial resistance to both PMEA and PMPDAP. The cross-resistance observed does not seem to be related to experimental variations, since these isolates did not show reduced susceptibility to ddI. In earlier studies, AZT-resistant HIV isolates were found to exhibit cross-resistance to other nucleoside analogs which contain a 3'-azido group (e.g., 3'-azido-2',3'-dideoxythymidine and 3'-azido-2',3'-dideoxythymidine), but retain their susceptibility to other 2',3'-dideoxynucleosides such as ddI, ddC, ddC, 3'-fluoro-2'-deoxythymidine, and 2',3'-dideoxy-2',3'-dideoxythymidine (21). Mayers et al. (17) recently reported data from a large, multicenter study which demonstrated cross-resistance to ddI and ddC in AZT-resistant HIV from patients receiving prolonged AZT monotherapy. The extent of cross-resistance was found to correlate with the degree of AZT resistance, and an average twofold decrease in ddI-ddC susceptibility was observed for each
AZT-resistant isolates displayed no cross-resistance to ruluses, both carry mutations at four of the five distinct loci different viruses in the intermediate described. loci that influence AZT susceptibility acyclic whether mutations 1686 NOTES 1391-1 and G910-11 both enzymological parallel between inhibition of resistant cross-resistance reasonable 1391-4 contains mixtures of wild-type DNA and DNA cross-resistance include biochemically studies (13, 14). 1991. A phase II/III study of 9-(2-Phosphonomethoxyethyl)adenine effectively inhibits retrovirus replication in vitro and simian immunodeficiency virus in rhesus monkeys. AIDS 5:21–28.

Boucher, C. A., J. A. Lange, F. F. Miedema, G. J. W. Verwerling, M. Koot, J. W. Mulder, J. Goudsmidt, P. Kellam, B. A. Larder, and M. Tersmette. 1992. HIV-1 biological phenotype and the development of zidovudine resistance in relation to disease progression in asymptomatic individuals during treatment. AIDS 6:1259–1264.

Broder, S. 1990. Pharmacodynamics of 2',3'-dideoxyctidine: an inhibitor of human immunodeficiency virus. Am. J. Med. 88(3B):25–78.

Collier, A. C., R. W. Coombs, J. Nienow, M. Paradise, H. H. Yang, S. Troxel, J. Bogg, D. Ebeling, H. S. Jaffe, and L. Corey. 1993. A phase II/III study of 9-(2-Phosphonomethoxyethyl)adenine (PMEA) in advanced HIV infection, abstr. 563. First National Conference on Human Retroviruses and Related Infections, 12–16 December 1993, Washington, D.C.

De Clercq, E. 1991. Broad-spectrum anti-DNA virus and anti-retrovirus activity of phosphonylmethoxypurines and -pyrimidines. Biochem. Pharmacol. 42:963–972.

De Clercq, E., A. Holy, and I. Rosenberg. 1989. Efficacy of phosphonylthioalkyl derivatives of adenine in experimental herpes simplex and vaccinia virus infections in vivo. Antimicrob. Agents Chemother. 33:185–191.

De Clercq, E., A. Holy, I. Rosenberg, T. Sakuma, J. Balzarini, and P. C. Maudgal. 1986. A novel selective broad-spectrum anti-DNA virus agent. Nature (London) 323:464–467.

Eggerink, H., M. Borst, H. Niphuis, J. Balzarini, H. Neu, H. Schellekens, E. De Clercq, M. Horzinek, and M. Koolen. 1990. Suppression of feline immunodeficiency virus infection in vivo by 9-(2-Phosphonomethoxyethyl)adenine. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 87:3087–3091.

Erice, A., D. L. Mayers, D. G. Strike, K. J. Sannerud, F. E. McCutchan, K. Henry, and H. H. Balfour, Jr. 1993. Brief report: primary infection with zidovudine-resistant human immunodeficiency virus type 2. N. Engl. J. Med. 328:1163–1165.

Gong, Y.-F., R. V. Srinivas, and A. Fridland. 1993. 5-Amino-4-imidazoledcarboxamide riboside potentiates the metabolism and anti-human immunodeficiency virus activity of 2',3'-dideoxynosine. Mol. Pharmacol. 44:30–36.

Hitchcock, M. J., and S. A. Lacy. 1993. Bis-pivaloxylomethyl PMEA as an oral prodrug of PMEA: pilot toxicity evaluation in rats, abstr. 567. First National Conference on Human Retroviruses and Related Infections, 12–16 December 1993, Washington, D.C.

Japour, A. J., P. A. Chatlas, H. A. Eronencah, and C. S. Crum- packer. 1991. Detection of human immunodeficiency virus type 1 clinical isolates with reduced sensitivity to zidovudine and dideoxynosine by RNA-RNA hybridization. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 87:3087–3096.

Larder, B. A., G. Darby, and D. D. Richman. 1989. HIV with reduced sensitivity to zidovudine (AZT) isolated during prolonged therapy. Science 243:1731–1734.

Larder, B. A., and S. D. Kemp. 1989. Multiple mutations in HIV-1 reverse transcriptase confer high-level resistance to zidovudine (AZT). Science 246:1155–1158.

Mayers, D. L., A. J. Japour, J. M. Arduino, S. M. Hammer, R. Reichman, K. F. Wagner, R. Chung, J. Lane, C. S. Crumpacker, G. X. McLeod, L. A. Beckett, C. R. Roberts, D. Weislow, D. D.
Burke, and the RV43 Study Group. 1994. Dideoxynucleoside resistance emerges with prolonged zidovudine monotherapy. Antimicrob. Agents Chemother. 38:307–314.

18. Mitsuya, H., and S. Broder. 1986. Inhibition of the in vitro infectivity and cytopathic effect of human T-lymphotropic virus type III/lymphadenopathy-associated virus (HTLV-III/LAV) by 2',3'-dideoxynucleosides. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 83:1911–1915.

19. Mitsuya, H., K. J. Weinhold, P. A. Furman, M. H. St. Clair, S. N. Lehrman, R. C. Gallo, D. Bolognesi, D. W. Barry, and S. Broder. 1985. 3'-Azido-3'-deoxythymidine (BW A509U): an antiviral agent that inhibits the infectivity and cytopathic effect of human T-lymphotropic virus type III/lymphadenopathy-associated virus in vitro. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 82:7096–7100.

20. Potts, B. J. 1990. “Mini” reverse transcriptase assay, p. 103–106. In A. Aldovini and B. D. Walker (ed.), Techniques in HIV research. M. Stockton Press, New York.

21. Richman, D. D. 1990. Zidovudine resistance of human immunodeficiency virus. Rev. Infect. Dis. 12(Suppl. 5):S507–S512.

22. Srinivas, R. V., B. L. Robbins, M. C. Connelly, Y.-F. Gong, N. Bischofberger, and A. Fridland. 1993. Metabolism and in vitro antiretroviral activities of bis(pivaloyloxymethyl) prodrugs of acyclic nucleoside phosphonates. Antimicrob. Agents Chemother. 37:2247–2250.

23. Tudor-Williams, G., M. H. St Clair, R. E. McKinney, M. Maha, E. Walter, S. Santacroce, M. Mintz, K. O'Donnell, T. Rudoll, C. L. Vavro, E. M. Connor, and C. M. Wilfert. 1992. HIV-1 sensitivity to zidovudine and clinical outcome in children. Lancet 339:15–19.

24. Weislow, O. S., R. Kiser, D. L. Fine, J. Bader, R. H. Shoemaker, and M. R. Boyd. 1989. New soluble formazan assay for HIV-1 cytopathic effects: application to high-flux screening of synthetic and natural products for AIDS-antiviral activity. J. Natl. Cancer Inst. 81:577–586.

25. Yarchoan, R., R. W. Klecker, K. J. Weinhold, P. D. Markham, H. K. Lyerly, D. T. Durack, E. Gelmann, S. N. Lehrman, R. M. Blum, D. W. Barry, G. M. Shearer, M. A. Fischl, H. Mitsuya, R. C. Gallo, J. M. Collins, D. P. Bolognesi, C. E. Myers, and S. Broder. 1986. Administration of 3'-azido-3'-deoxythymidine, an inhibitor of HTLV-III/LAV replication, to patients with AIDS or AIDS-related complex. Lancet i:575–580.

26. Yarchoan, R., C. F. Perno, R. V. Thomas, R. W. Klecker, J. P. Allain, R. J. Wills, N. McAtee, M. A. Fischl, R. Dubinsky, M. C. McNeely, H. Mitsuya, J. M. Pluda, T. J. Lawley, M. Leuther, B. Safai, J. M. Collins, C. E. Myers, and S. Broder. 1988. Phase I studies of 2',3'-dideoxycytidine in severe human immunodeficiency virus infection as a single agent and alternating with zidovudine (AZT). Lancet ii:76–81.