Biofilm Formation Protects *Salmonella* from the Antibiotic Ciprofloxacin *In Vitro* and *In Vivo* in the Mouse Model of chronic Carriage

Juan F. González¹, Halley Alberts², Joel Lee¹, Lauren Doolittle¹ & John S. Gunn¹

Typhoid fever is caused by the human-restricted pathogen *Salmonella enterica* sv. Typhi. Approximately 5% of people that resolve the disease become chronic carriers, with the gallbladder as the main reservoir of the bacteria. Of these, about 90% present with gallstones, on which *Salmonella* form biofilms. Because *S.* Typhi is a human-restricted pathogen, these carriers are the main source of dissemination of the disease; unfortunately, antibiotic treatment has shown to be an ineffective therapy. This is believed to be caused by the inherent antibiotic resistance conferred by *Salmonella* biofilms growing on gallstones. The gallstone mouse model with *S.* Typhimurium has proven to be an excellent surrogate for *S.* Typhi chronic infection. In this study, we test the hypothesis that the biofilm state confers *Salmonella* with the increased resistance to antibiotics observed in cases of chronic carriage. We found that, in the biofilm state, *Salmonella* is significantly more resistant to ciprofloxacin, a common antibiotic used for the treatment of *Salmonella*, both *in vitro* (p < 0.001 for both *S.* Typhi and *S.* Typhimurium with respect to planktonic cells) and *in vivo* (p = 0.0035 with respect to control mice).

Typhoid fever is primarily caused by the human-restricted pathogen *Salmonella enterica* sv. Typhi (*S.* Typhi). This disease is a global problem that affects millions of people and causes over 600,000 deaths annually¹. Typhoid fever is an acute illness with symptoms that include high fever, malaise, and abdominal pain. This disease is of special importance in developing nations where the lack of clean water and poor sanitation favor the capacity of the bacteria to spread. Although the incidence of Typhoid in developed countries is low, travelers are still at risk².

Typhoid has a mortality rate of 2–3% even with adequate antibiotic therapy. The emergence of multidrug-resistant (MDR) strains of *S.* Typhi is a significant problem as inexpensive and readily available antibiotics including ampicillin, chloramphenicol, trimethoprim-sulfamethoxazole and streptomycin are frequently ineffective³-⁴. Although resistance to ciprofloxacin, a second-generation fluoroquinolone, is increasing, it is still recommended as first line therapy for children and adults⁵-⁷.

In most cases, the infection is resolved and the patient recovers, but approximately 5% of people infected with *S.* Typhi fail to clear the bacteria within one year and become chronic carriers. Carriers are typically asymptomatic and can spread the disease through fecal shedding. The chronic carrier state is associated with *Salmonella* colonization of the biliary tract and is positively correlated with the presence of gallstones (GS); in fact, approximately 90% of chronically infected carriers have GS⁸. Antibiotic treatment is ineffective in the resolution of chronic *S.* Typhi colonization, making gallbladder removal the only effective therapy⁹-¹¹.

The presence of *Salmonella* biofilms on the gallstones of both typhoid carrier patients and mice (in a gallstone model of chronic carriage) has been previously demonstrated¹²,¹³. Biofilms are bacterial communities that attach to a biological or non-biological surface and are enveloped by a bacterial-initiated matrix. This structure allows bacteria to survive in hostile conditions such as exposure to UV light, metal toxicity, acid exposure, dehydration.

¹Department of Microbial Infection and Immunity, Infectious Diseases Institute, The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio, USA. ²School of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, University of Rio Grande, P.O. Box 500, Rio Grande, OH, USA. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to J.S.G. (email: john.gunn@osumc.edu)
and salinity, phagocytes, and several antibiotics and antimicrobial agents. It is hypothesized that this growth state accounts for the recalcitrance. shows to antibiotic treatment in chronic carriers. Since the host range of is restricted to humans, Salmonella enterica sv. Typhimurium (S. Typhimurium) infection of mice has been widely used to study typhoid fever pathogenesis and immunity. The gallstone mouse model developed by us using S. Typhimurium has proven to be a powerful tool that mimics human chronic carriage.

In this study, we test the hypothesis that the biofilm state confers to both S. Typhimurium and S. Typhi substantial resistance to the antibiotic ciprofloxacin compared to planktonic cells. Experiments in vitro assess the hypothesis by colony-forming unit (CFU) quantification and confocal microscopy, while our gallstone mouse model was utilized in vivo to examine if biofilms on gallstones conferred S. Typhimurium with resistance to ciprofloxacin.

Results
It is widely accepted that bacterial biofilms are more resistant to environmental stress, including the presence of antimicrobial agents, than free-swimming bacteria. In order to investigate whether biofilm formation on gallstones contributes to antibiotic resistance typically observed in S. Typhi human chronic carriers treated with antibiotics, we conducted a series of experiments comparing the survival of bacterial cultures in both planktonic and biofilm states exposed to the antibiotic ciprofloxacin. Such experiments were performed both in vitro and in a murine gallstone model. In vitro assays utilized cholesterol-coating of the wells to mimic gallstones.

In vitro antibiotic susceptibility. The The Minimum Inhibitory Concentration (MIC) for ciprofloxacin was determined to be 0.125 µg/mL for JSG210 (S. Typhimurium) and 0.5 µg/mL for JSG624 (S. Typhi) which puts our two laboratory strains in the “intermediately susceptible” range for Salmonella (data not shown). These concentrations were used as a baseline for further broth and biofilm culture analyses. To compare the effect of ciprofloxacin on the different growth conditions, planktonic cell numbers were normalized to the CFU in 5-day biofilm cultures and the effect of the antibiotic was monitored for 8 hours (see Methods section). The antibiotic concentration used against S. Typhimurium was the same as the MIC, while for S. Typhi the concentration was decreased to 0.02 µg/mL after determining that the MIC calculated for S. Typhi using the dilution method in microtiter plates was too high for growth in tubes on a rotator drum. A dramatic and steady decrease in CFU numbers over time was observed for S. Typhimurium planktonic cultures, reaching a 6-log difference after 8 hours (p < 0.001), with respect to the control (Fig. 1a). In contrast, ciprofloxacin treatment had a modest one-log difference with respect to biofilm cell numbers. S. Typhi showed a similar trend over the 8 hours tested (Fig. 1b), dropping steadily until reaching an almost 5-log decrease after 8 hours (p < 0.001) for planktonic cultures, while biofilms were reduced less than one log. In conclusion, in an in vitro model mimicking in vivo chronic carriage conditions, Salmonella biofilms were dramatically more resistant to killing by ciprofloxacin.

Biofilm integrity. In order to evaluate the integrity of Salmonella biofilms after treatment with ciprofloxacin (same conditions as CFU enumeration), GFP-labeled biofilms were observed under an inverted confocal microscope, which gives an indication of biofilm architecture and biomass. As can be seen in Fig. 2, no visual difference was observed between the biofilm cultures grown in growth media alone or media supplemented with ciprofloxacin for 8 hours prior to imaging for either S. Typhimurium (Fig. 2a and c) or S. Typhi (Fig. 2e and g). Additionally, no significant difference was found in either biomass or average height in the biofilms calculated from Z-stacks which gives an indication of biofilm architecture and biomass. As can be seen in Fig. 2, no visual difference (same conditions as CFU enumeration), GFP-labeled biofilms were observed under an inverted confocal microscope, while our gallstone mouse model was utilized in vivo to examine if biofilms on gallstones conferred S. Typhimurium with resistance to ciprofloxacin.

Discussion
Third generation fluoroquinolones have replaced first-line drugs to become standard for the treatment of acute Typhoid fever with some success observed in chronic carriers. However, with ever increasing antibiotic resistance coupled with the lack of consistent success of antibiotics in chronic carriers, antibiotics alone are usually not sufficient and cholecystectomy is necessary to fully clear the gallbladder infection. This is believed to be caused by Salmonella biofilm formation on gallstones, as biofilms have been demonstrated to provide bacteria recalcitrance towards antibiotics. In this study, we test this hypothesis in vitro and in vivo.

Here, we demonstrated that Salmonella biofilms are much more resistant to ciprofloxacin, an antibiotic of the fluoroquinolone family widely used to control Salmonella infections. In vitro, both S. Typhimurium and S. Typhi biofilms show a decrease in CFU numbers of less than 1-log after 8 hours of antibiotic treatment. Conversely, planktonic cells show a 5–6-log reduction. Additionally, no differences in biofilm structure, biomass or average height were detected after antibiotic treatment (Fig. 2). It is worth mentioning that an observable difference is
evident between S. Typhimurium and S. Typhi biofilms (Fig. 2a and c vs. e and g). This is due to their different growth conditions: S. Typhimurium biofilms were grown in 96-well plates while S. Typhi were grown in 8-well chamber slides, the latter resulting in a more robust biofilm formation. For in vivo assessment, we used the gallstone mouse model, which mimics human gallbladder carriage, as most human carriers possess gallstones. S. Typhimurium is used in this model, as S. Typhi is human-specific, consequently resulting in a non-productive infection in mice. S. Typhimurium showed no reduction in CFU numbers after 10 days of ciprofloxacin treatment in our murine gallstone model, while dropping approximately 2-logs in mice without gallstones. These results are consistent with the hypothesis that the presence of gallstones accentuates Salmonella resistance towards antibiotics.

Biofilms have been shown to provide bacteria with protection against antimicrobial agents in various environments including chronic infections associated with cystic fibrosis, infective endocarditis and chronic otitis media. Furthermore, biofilm resistance to ciprofloxacin has been shown for various organisms including P. aeruginosa, where this antibiotic reduced CFU numbers in urinary catheters by only two-logs. Additionally, Burkholderia cepacia biofilms were found to be 150 times more resistant to ciprofloxacin than planktonic cells and in vitro evaluation of Klebsiella pneumoniae biofilm resistance to ciprofloxacin yielded a modest one log reduction in CFUs. Finally, Proteus mirabilis biofilms showed a small 0.1-log reduction in CFUs in vitro after

Figure 1. The in vitro effect of ciprofloxacin on planktonic vs. biofilm Salmonella cultures. (a) S. Typhimurium cultures were treated with 0.125 μg/mL ciprofloxacin and (b) S. Typhi with 0.02 μg/mL for a total of 8 hours. CFUs were enumerated every 2 hours. Data is presented as mean and SD. There are significant differences between ciprofloxacin treated and untreated planktonic cultures of both S. Typhimurium (P < 0.001) and S. Typhi (P < 0.001). Comparisons of data were performed using one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) followed by Tukey’s Studentized range test at the 8 hr time point. For all parameters P < 0.05 was considered the level of significance. The data presented are representative of three independent experiments each performed in triplicate.
ciprofloxacin treatment\(^{30}\). Regarding *Salmonella*, high levels of *S*. *Typhimurium* biofilm resistance to ciprofloxacin *in vitro* have been previously reported, as a high dose of 1000 µg/mL for one hour produced only a modest 0.7 log reduction in viable cell numbers in biofilms while the ciprofloxacin MIC for planktonic cells was 0.125 µg/mL\(^{31}\). While we used a much lower dose of 0.125 µg/mL for our biofilms, our results are consistent with these as we only observed a decrease in CFU numbers of less than 1 log, even after 8 hours of treatment (Fig. 1a). Clinical isolates have also been shown to have an increased resistance towards ciprofloxacin when grown in biofilms. A study of 194 clinical isolates from 13 different serotypes in Greece showed that 56% were biofilm-forming and, although they showed a modest 2.8% increased resistance towards ciprofloxacin, the minimum inhibitory concentration for bacterial growth (MIC\(_{BR50}\)) increased from < 0.25 to 1 mg/L\(^{32}\). An *in vitro* study of 30 clinical isolates of *S*. *Typhi* in Pakistan, showed that 23 were robust biofilm producers. When these were exposed to a dose of 1 µg/mL of ciprofloxacin, planktonic cultures were completely eliminated, while biofilms were reduced from 10\(^4\) to 10\(^1\) but never eradicated\(^{33}\). Contrary to our data, ciprofloxacin was shown in one study to significantly lower the biofilm production of *S*. *Typhimurium*, albeit under different conditions than those used in our study. Majtan and colleagues found that the content of exopolysaccharides (EPS) decreased in several clinical isolates after a 24 hour incubation in sub-inhibitory concentrations of ciprofloxacin\(^{34}\). Their data originate from a study focused on the effects of sub-inhibitory concentrations of different antibiotics acting as signal molecules on biofilm formation, while our experiments were performed on fully formed biofilms. Additionally, their clinical isolates had lower MICs than our strains, which had an intermediate susceptibility, and they measured EPS as a gauge of biofilm content, while our study focused on CFU counts.

Our data shows that *Salmonella* biofilms on GSs/cholesterol-coated surfaces are much more resistant to the primary antibiotic used clinically against human infections, ciprofloxacin. The *in vivo* results clearly mirror the *in vitro* data (Fig. 2). Without gallstones, there is a significant decrease in CFU numbers after ciprofloxacin treatment (\(P = 0.0035\)) although not as dramatic as in the *in vitro* experiment (Fig. 3b). However, when growing in biofilms on gallstones, CFU numbers stay constant after 10 days of antibiotic treatment. These results are consistent with clinical reports that indicate an elevated level of antibiotic resistance in chronic carriers\(^{35,36}\), especially if they suffer
from gallstones. Notably, our results highlight the importance of the chronic carriage mouse model, as they recapitulate one of the hallmark characteristics of chronic Typhoid carriage: the correlation between the presence of gallstones and recalcitrance towards antibiotics, in this case ciprofloxacin.

Interestingly, there is a marked difference between the CFU numbers of the two untreated control groups, where mice on a normal diet showed a 2-logs higher CFUs than mice on a lithogenic diet. This differs from other observations previously made by our group, where gallbladders with gallstones usually present higher bacterial loads. A possible explanation might be the infection dose; in this experiment, \(5 \times 10^4\) CFUs/mL were injected IP as opposed to the \(1 \times 10^4\) CFUs/mL used in previous studies.

Ciprofloxacin has been shown to effectively penetrate biofilms composed of different bacteria and works by inhibiting cell division by targeting DNA gyrase and topoisomerase IV. This antibiotic is also more effective than other antibiotics in vivo against a wide range of Gram positive and negative bacteria and has excellent penetration inside tissue. Additionally, it has been shown to significantly reduce *Salmonella* CFU in C57BL/6 mice, although some bacteria can survive in dendritic cells in some organs. There are various hypotheses as to why biofilms are more resistant to antibiotics (including ciprofloxacin) than planktonic cells. These include slow or incomplete penetration of the antibiotic into the biofilm, an altered chemical microenvironment within the biofilm, and that a subpopulation of micro-organisms in a biofilm might be in a highly protected spore-like state (persisters). We have observed that *in vitro* *Salmonella* biofilms reach maximum CFU levels after about 48 hours and, even though the biofilm matrix increases in size, CFU numbers stay constant (data not shown), suggesting low levels of cell division, or persister cells, which could be protected from ciprofloxacin action.

Fluoroquinolone resistant isolates emerged soon after the widespread use of these antimicrobials and are now endemic in large parts of Asia and Africa. Such strains are also increasing in non-endemic areas like Europe and North America, primarily due to international travel. A recent global phylogeographical analysis identified mutations in the primary targets of fluoroquinolones, DNA gyrase subunits *gyrA* and *gyrB* and topoisomerase IV components *parC* and *parE*, more commonly in the MDR strain H58 than in other Typhi isolates. Moreover, we have previously established a positive correlation between biofilm formation and antibiotic resistance, which could indicate that the biofilm state might provide an ideal environment for the transfer of resistance genes. This is a worrying scenario as genetic resistance coupled with the inherent resistance of biofilms could render the elimination of carriers an arduous task. *S. Typhi* is a human-restricted pathogen and as such, humans are the only reservoir that spread the disease. As sanitation and access to clean water improves in developing countries, chronic carriers should play an even more important role in disease transmission. Additionally, understanding the unique conditions of the gallbladder that allow *Salmonella* to establish a chronic infection will be a crucial step towards eliminating the disease.

**Figure 3.** The *in vivo* effects of ciprofloxacin on planktonic vs. gallstone biofilms. (a) Experimental setup: mice fed for 8 weeks with a ND or LD received PBS or \(5 \times 10^4\) CFU *S. Typhimurium*. After 5 days (to allow biofilm development for LD mice), a regimen of ciprofloxacin treatment (or PBS control) was initiated and continued for 10 days. (b) Bacterial loads in mice GBs. The limit of detection was 10 CFU/ml. Bars represent the mean. Comparisons of data were performed using one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) followed by Tukey’s Studentized Range test. For all parameters, \(P < 0.05\) was considered significant. ND = normal diet; LD = lithogenic diet; IP = intraperitoneal; GB = gallbladder.
Methods

Ethics statement. Mouse care and housing was carried out in accordance with guidelines established by the Ohio State University (OSU) Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee (IACUC). Animal work was previously approved by OSU IACUC. The Ohio State University Animal Care and Use Program is accredited by the Association for the Assessment and Accreditation of Laboratory Animal Care International (AAALAC). Research activities conform to the statutes of the Animal Welfare Act and guidelines of the Public Health Service as required in the Guide for the Care and Use of Laboratory Animals.

Bacterial Strains and Growth Conditions. S. Typhimurium strain 14028 (JSG210) and S. Typhi Ty2 (JSG624) were streaked on Luria-Bertani (LB) agar plates and incubated at 37 °C overnight. Single colonies were used to start overnight (O/N) liquid cultures. Planktonic cells were grown at 37 °C on a rotating drum in LB, or tryptic soy broth (TSB). Green fluorescent protein (GFP; pFPV25.1) expressing strains JSG1149 (S. Typhimurium) and JSG1150 (S. Typhi) were grown in Amp (100 μg/ml−1) to keep selective pressure on the plasmid.

Biofilm growth. S. Typhimurium biofilms were grown on non-treated polystyrene 96-well plates (Corning, Kennebunkport, ME) by normalizing overnight (O/N) cultures grown in TSB to OD_{600} = 0.8, then diluting 1:10 into biofilm-growth media (TSB diluted 1:20), and dispensing 0.1 ml per well. The plates were incubated at 30 °C in a GyroMini rotating mixer (LabNet International, Inc., NJ) at 24 rpm. S. Typhi biofilms were grown as follows: O/N liquid cultures were incubated in TSB at 37 °C with aeration. These were then normalized to OD_{660} = 0.65, diluted 1:2500 in TSB, and 200 μl/well were dispensed into 8-well Permanox chamber slides (Thermo Fisher, Rochester NY) and incubated at 37 °C with 5% CO_{2}. To simulate growth conditions on gallstones, wells were pre-coated with cholesterol by adding a solution of 5 mg/ml ethanol and air-dried overnight. Media was changed daily for both S. Typhimurium and S. Typhi biofilm growth.

Antimicrobial Susceptibility Testing. Ciprofloxacin (≥98%, HPLC) was purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (St. Louis, MO). The Minimum Inhibitory Concentration (MIC_{50}) of ciprofloxacin for planktomic Salmonella serovars was determined by the broth-dilution method using the CLSI guidelines for Salmonella. Biofilm MIC assays were performed in 96-well plates. Planktonic and biofilm bacteria were incubated (0–8 hours) in the presence or absence (control) of ciprofloxacin at or near the calculated MIC_{50} (0.125 μg/ml for S. Typhimurium and 0.02 μg/ml for S. Typhi). In order to evaluate antimicrobial susceptibility on an equal amount of cells, planktonic cultures were normalized to the biofilm cell concentration by CFU enumeration of a dilution series (5-day biofilm CFUs were previously determined, and planktonic CFUs were diluted to match this) and by total protein measurements using the bicinchoninic acid (BCA) method (Pierce/ThermoFisher). CFU numbers were calculated prior to antibiotic treatment (T_{0}) then every 2 hours for a total of 8 hours. To detach biofilms from the abiotic surfaces, media was removed to discard planktonic cells. The matrix was then scratched from the surface of the plates with a 200-μL pipette tip and washed with 100 μL PBS twice. PBS was then added to a volume of 1 ml and vortexed on high speed for 60 to 75 s to disrupt cell aggregates. Serial dilutions were plated on LB agar.

Murine Model of Typhoid Carriage. A total of 48 129X/SvJ (The Jackson Laboratory, Bar Harbor, ME) mice were used in this experiment. Half of the mice were fed a normal diet (ND) and the remaining half were fed a lithogenic diet (LD) for 8 weeks. Mice from both ND and LD groups were injected intraperitoneally with a dose of 5 × 10^{6} CFUs/ml of S. Typhimurium or PBS (control). Five days post-infection, ciprofloxacin injections of 1 mg/kg/day were administered to half of the treatment and control mice daily for a 7-day period (Fig. 3a). At the end of the study, all mice were sacrificed and their gallbladders removed. Gallbladders were macerated with a TissueLyser LT (Qiagen, Valencia, CA). Total bacterial concentration (CFUs/gallbladder) was calculated by serially diluting gallbladder macterates on LB agar plates.

Confocal Microscopy. Established biofilms of strains JSG1149 and JSG1150 were incubated with or without ciprofloxacin for 8 hours prior to imaging. Biofilms were washed twice in PBS and fixed in 2% paraformaldehyde (PFA, Affimetrix, Cleveland, OH) for 20 minutes at room temperature at each time point and saved for later imaging. The amount of biofilm and the structure of the biofilm can be inferred by the amount of GFP signal detected. Biomass and average thickness were assessed by automated capturing of 10 random Z-stacks per well later imaging. The amount of biofilm and the structure of the biofilm can be inferred by the amount of GFP signal detected. Biomass and average thickness were assessed by automated capturing of 10 random Z-stacks per well in 5 wells per treatment using a Nikon A1R Live Cell Inverted Confocal microscope. The Z-stacks were then analyzed using the software package COMSTAT2.

Data Analysis. Planktonic and biofilm experiments were performed using 5 biological replicates and were repeated at least three times. CFU numbers were Log-transformed prior to analysis and statistical significance testing and was performed using R 3.2.3 or Graph Prism 7. All p values < 0.05 were considered significant.

References
1. Crump, J. A., Luby, S. P. & Mintz, E. D. The global burden of typhoid fever. Bull. World Health Organ. 82, 346–353 (2004).
2. Bhan, M. K., Bahl, R. & Bhatnagar, S. Typhoid and paratyphoid fever. Lancet 366, 749–762 (2005).
3. Simon, H. J. & Miller, R. C. Ampicillin in the treatment of chronic typhoid carriers. Report on fifteen treated cases and a review of the literature. N Engl J Med 274, 807–815 (1966).
4. Nolan, C. M. & White, P. C. Treatment of Typhoid Carriers With Amoxicillin. JAMA 263, 2352–2354 (1978).
5. Thaver, D. et al. A comparison of fluoroquinolones versus other antibiotics for treating enteric fever: meta-analysis. BMJ 338, b1865–b1865 (2009).
6. Eiff, E. E. et al. Fluoroquinolones for treating typhoid and paratyphoid fever (enteric fever). Cochrane Database Syst Rev CD004530 https://doi.org/10.1002/14651858.CD004530.pub4 (2011).
7. Zavala Trujillo, I., Quiroz, C., Gutierrez, M. A., Arias, J. & Renteria, M. Fluoroquinolones in the treatment of typhoid fever and the carrier state. Eur J Clin Microbial Infect Dis 10, 334–341 (1991).
8. Schierer, H., Christiansen, E. D., Høynes, G., Rasmussen, S. N. & Grebe, J. Biliary calculi in chronic Salmonella carriers and healthy controls: a controlled study. Scand. J. Infect. Dis. 15, 17–19 (1983).

9. Dinbar, A., Altmann, G. & Tulcinsky, D. B. The treatment of chronic biliary salmonella carriers. The American journal of medicine (1969).

10. Parry, C. M., Hien, T. T., Dougan, G., White, N. J. & Farrar, J. J. Typhoid fever. N Engl J Med 347, 1770–1782 (2002).

11. Gunn, J. S. et al. Salmonella chronic carriage: epidemiology, diagnosis, and gallbladder persistence. Trends in Microbiology 22, 648–655 (2014).

12. Crawford, R. W. et al. Gallstones play a significant role in Salmonella spp. gallbladder colonization and carriage. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 107, 4333–4338 (2010).

13. Prouty, A. M., Schwesinger, W. H. & Gunn, J. S. Biofilm formation and interaction with the surfaces of gallstones by Salmonella spp. Infect. and Immunity 79, 2640–2649 (2002).

14. Hall-Stoodley, L. et al. Direct Detection of Bacterial Biofilms on the Middle-Ear Mucosa of Children With Chronic Otitis Media. JAMA 296, 202 (2006).

15. Rodríguez-Martínez, J. M., Ballesta, S. & Pascual, A. Activity and penetration of fosfomycin, ciprofloxacin, amoxicillin/clavulanic acid and co-trimoxazole in Escherichia coli and Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilms. International Journal of Antimicrobial Agents 30, 366–368 (2007).

16. Desai, M., Bühler, T., Weller, P. H. & Brown, M. R. Increasing resistance of planktonic and biofilm cultures of Burkholderia cepacia to ciprofloxacin and ceftazidime during exponential growth. J. Antimicrob. Chemother. 42, 153–160 (1998).

17. Anderl, J. N., Franklin, M. J. & Stewart, P. S. Role of antibiotic penetration limitation in Klebsiella pneumoniae biofilm resistance to ampicillin and ciprofloxacin. Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy 44, 1818–1824 (2000).

18. Talar, M., Scher, K., Chikindas, M. L. & Yaron, S. The synergistic activity of triclosan and ciprofloxacin on biofilms of Salmonella Typhimurium. FEMS Microbiology Letters 301, 69–76 (2009).

19. Papavasileiou, K. et al. Comparative antimicrobial susceptibility of biofilm versus planktonic forms of Salmonella enterica strains isolated from children with gastroenteritis. Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis 29, 1401–1405 (2010).

20. Zhao, A. et al. Effect of biofilm formation on the excretion of Salmonella enterica serovar Typhi in feces. Int. J. Infect. Dis. 25, 164–169 (2011).

21. Majtán, J., Majtánová, L., Xu, M. & Majtán, V. In vitro effect of subinhibitory concentrations of antibiotics on biofilm formation by clinical strains of Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium isolated in Slovakia. Journal of Applied Microbiology 104, 1294–1301 (2008).

22. Phillips, W. E. Treatment of Chronic Typhoid Carriers With Ampicillin. JAMA 217, 913 (1971).

23. González-Escobedo, G. & Gunn, J. S. Gallbladder epithelium as a niche for chronic Salmonella carriage. Infection and Immunity 81, 2920–2930 (2013).

24. LeBel, M. Ciprofloxacin: Chemistry, Mechanism of Action, Resistance, Antimicrobial Spectrum, Pharmacokinetics, Clinical Trials, and Adverse Reactions. Pharmacotherapy: The Journal of Human Pharmacology and Drug Therapy 8, 3–30.

25. Zeiler, H. J. & Grohe, K. The in vitro and in vivo activity of ciprofloxacin. Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis 3, 339–343 (1984).

26. Colino, C. I., Sanchez Navarro, A., Lanao, J. M. & Aragon, S. Tissue distribution pharmacokinetics of ciprofloxacin vs ofloxacin in rabbits. 45, 248–149.

27. Kaiser, P. et al. Cecum lymph node dendritic cells harbor slow-growing bacteria phenotypically tolerant to antibiotic treatment. Plos Biol 12, e1001793 (2014).

28. Stewart, P. S. & Costerton, J. W. Antibiotic resistance of bacteria in biofilms. Lancet 358, 135–138 (2001).

29. Lewis, K. Persistor cells, dormancy and infectious disease. Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 5, 48–56 (2007).

30. Wong, V. K. et al. Phylogeographical analysis of the dominant multidrug-resistant H58 clade of Salmonella Typhi identifies inter- and intracontinental transmission events. Nat. Genet. 47, 632–639 (2015).

31. Eguiarte, T. et al. The multicellular morphotypes of Salmonella Typhimurium and Escherichia coli produce cellulosic as the second component of the extracellular matrix. Journal of Applied Microbiology 117, 961–971 (2014).

32. Olsen, S. I. et al. Outbreaks of typhoid fever in the United States, 1960–89. Epidemiol. Infect. 130, 13–21 (2003).

33. Keddy, K. H. et al. Molecular epidemiological investigation of a typhoid fever outbreak in South Africa, 2005: the relationship to a previous epidemic in 1993. Epidemiol. Infect. 139, 1239–1245 (2011).

34. Wiegand, I., Hilpert, K. & Hancock, R. E. W. Agar and broth dilution methods to determine the minimal inhibitory concentration (MIC) of antimicrobial substances. Nat Protoc 3, 163–175 (2008).

35. Franklin, M. J., Chang, C., Akiyama, T. & Bothner, B. New Technologies for Studying Biofilms. Microbiol Spectr 3, (2015).

36. Vorregaard, M. Comstat2 - a modern 3D image analysis environment for biofilms. IMM-M.Sc.-2008–08 (2008).

37. Team, R. C. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing (2015).

Acknowledgements
The work presented here was funded by grants AI109002 and AI116917 from the National Institutes of Health to J.S.G. We would like to thank Sara Cole at the Campus Microscopy and Imaging Facility (CMIF) in The Ohio State University for her help with microscopy experiments.
Author Contributions
J.S.G. and J.F.G. designed research, analyzed data and wrote the paper; H.A., L.D. and J.L. and J.F.G. performed *in vitro* experiments; J.F.G. performed *in vivo* experiments.

Additional Information
Competing Interests: The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Publisher’s note: Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.