Proanthocyanidin Biosynthesis- a Matter of Protection.

Richard A. Dixon\textsuperscript{1,2} and Sai Sarnala\textsuperscript{3}

\textsuperscript{1}Hagler Institute for Advanced Studies and Department of Biological Sciences, Texas A and M University, College Station, TX, USA; \textsuperscript{2}BioDiscovery Institute and Department of Biological Sciences, University of North Texas, 1155 Union Circle \#311428, Denton, TX 76203-5017, USA; \textsuperscript{3}Texas Academy of Mathematics and Science, TAMS 1155 Union Circle \#305309 University of North Texas, Denton, TX 76203-5017

**ORCID ID:** 0000-0001-8393-9408 (RAD)

**One-sentence summary:** Proanthocyanidins are the second most abundant plant phenolic polymer, but, in spite of intensive investigation, several aspects of their biosynthesis and functions remain unclear.

**Author contributions:** Both authors contributed to writing this review article.

**BACKGROUND**

Proanthocyanidins (PAs, also known as condensed tannins) are polymers of flavan-3-ols that bind to proteins and have been ascribed functions as herbivore feeding deterrents and antimicrobial compounds. They provide astringency to fruits and beverages, positively impact human health, and benefit ruminant livestock by improving nitrogen nutrition and providing protection from pasture bloat (McMahon et al., 2000; Dixon et al., 2012; Rauf et al., 2019). Much progress has been made in recent years in understanding the molecular genetic basis of PA biosynthesis. However, there remain difficulties in resolving the chemical labeling pattern of PAs with their proposed biosynthetic pathway, and defining the subcellular sites of biosynthesis. There is also no model that fully explains the cell biological phenotypes of mutations that interrupt the pathway and disturb the accumulation of PAs in the central vacuole.
Pioneering studies in the 1970s (Jacques and Haslam, 1975; Haslam et al., 1977) established that dimeric PAs can be assembled by attack of a carbocation “extension unit” derived from a flavan-3-4-diol (leucocyanidin in the case of PAs derived from catechin and/or epicatecin) primarily at the nucleophilic C8 position of a flavan-3-ol ((epi)catechin) “starter unit”. The diversity of dimeric PAs depends on the 2,3-sterochemistry of the starter and extension units (Figure 1A). The C8 position of the “upper unit” of the dimer can be attacked by a second extension unit, a process resulting in chains of 4→8-linked units that become insoluble as chain length increases. Based on this model, PA assembly in planta could be non-enzymatic, contrary to the assembly of other major plant polymers such as cellulose, hemicelluloses, and lignin. The facile assembly of PAs according to simple thermodynamic control may necessitate physical and possibly temporal separation of PA precursor units to protect plant cells from reactive pathway intermediates, in addition to protection of proteins from the final oligomeric PAs.

The discovery of transcription factors (TFs) that control PA biosynthesis in crop plants (Mellway et al., 2009; Koyama et al., 2014; James et al., 2017) will facilitate the engineering of these compounds for commercial applications, and recent discoveries of lignin-flavonoid interactions during cell wall biosynthesis open up the possibility of developing novel biomaterials. In addition, the ability to manipulate PA levels in plants is helping our understanding of the ecological roles of PAs in plant–herbivore and plant–pathogen interactions, and some of these results are surprising. We discuss key questions and opportunities in this expanding but complex field.

**BIOSYNTHESIS OF PA STARTER AND EXTENSION UNITS- DO WE HAVE THE WHOLE STORY?**

The enzymes responsible for formation of the flavan-ol skeleton and the hydroxylation pattern of the flavanol B-ring have been known for some time (Dixon et al., 2012). Most commonly, PAs are of the procyanidin type, in which the B-ring possesses 3’-4´-dihydroxy substitution (Figure 1A). Lack of activity of a flavonoid 3’-hydroxylase results in the less common propelargonidin type, with 4´-hydroxy B-ring substitution, whereas activity of flavonoid 3’, 5´-
hydroxylase results in the prodelphinidin type with 3’, 4’, 5’-trihydroxy B-ring substitution, as commonly found in the PAs and flavanols of tea (Camellia sinensis) (Wang et al, 2014). One feature of PA biosynthesis which is proving more difficult to explain is the lack of equivalence of the starter and extension units. Paradoxically, 14C-cinnamic acid is incorporated into the “upper” extension unit of procyanidin B2 ((-)-epicatechin-(4β→8)(-)-epicatechin) at around 3–5 times the level of incorporation into the “lower” starter unit (Figure 1A) (Haslam 1977), whereas labeled epicatechin exclusively labels the starter unit. A second problem is that the 2,3-trans-stereochemistry of flavan 3,4-diol, fixed through the chalcone isomerase reaction (Figure 1B), must switch to allow for formation of the 2,3-cis epicatechin units that account for approximately 55% of PA starter units and 80% of extension units across plant species (Figure 1A). Stafford (1983) proposed the involvement of an epimerase in this stereochemical switch, but the discovery of anthocyanidin reductase (ANR) provided a pathway to 2,3-cis-epicatechin from 2,3-trans-leucocyanidin via achiral cyanidin (Xie et al., 2003) (Figure 1B). However, ANRs from different species can produce different cis- and trans-stereoisomers in vitro irrespective of the stereochemistry of the PAs in that species (Xie and Dixon, 2005; Gargouri et al., 2009; Pang et al., 2013), and the biological significance of this remains to be explained. The discovery of leucocyanidin reductase provided a pathway to 2,3-trans-catechin by direct reduction of 2,3-trans-leucocyanidin (Tanner et al., 2003).

It now seems likely that 2,3-cis extension units can arise through promiscuous reactions of four late pathway enzymes. Anthocyanidin synthase (ANS, also known as leucoanthocyanidin dioxygenase (LDOX)) catalyzes, among other reactions (Figure 1B), the 2-oxoglutarate-dependent oxidation of 2,3-trans-leucocyanidin to cyanidin (Turnbull et al. 2004). A hypothetical intermediate, a 4S-flav-2-en-3,4-diol, can be captured by a 3-O-glucosyltransferase to form a stable anthocyanin (Turnbull et al., 2004), accounting for the biosynthesis of this class of plant pigment, but could theoretically also provide an alternative substrate for reduction (by ANR?) to 2,3-cis-leucocyanidin (Figure 1B). In Medicago truncatula, a second LDOX can convert catechin to cyanidin via a flav-2-en-3-ol intermediate, and this pathway has been shown both genetically and by precursor labeling studies to generate the starter unit but not the extension unit of PAs (Jun et al., 2018). Finally, LAR forms (+)-catechin from 2,3-trans-leucocyanidin and also generates (-)-epicatechin (starter unit) from its cysteine adduct (Epi-cys).
Epi-cys is present in planta, over-accumulates in lar mutants, and acts as an extension unit in vitro (Liu et al., 2016). Loss of function of LAR results in increased levels of insoluble highermolecular-weight PAs in M. truncatula (Liu et al., 2016), and single nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) analysis in a grapevine diversity panel links LAR to PA polymer chain length (Huang et al., 2012; Liu et al., 2016), suggesting that the in vitro conversion of Epi-cys to (-)-epicatechin by LAR has physiological significance for the conversion of extension units to starter units in planta.

Figure 1B presents a model for the generation of PA starter and extension units consistent with the available (bio)chemical and genetic evidence. Unlike other pathways of specialized metabolism, this is neither a linear pathway nor a metabolic grid. The model proposes 2,3-cis-leucocyanidin generated by ANR as an extension unit, consistent with the presence of “epicatechin-only” PAs in Arabidopsis thaliana, a species which lacks an LAR gene (Jun et al., 2018). Leucocyanidins are very difficult to purify and structurally characterize from plant tissues; they form highly reactive intermediates that can be trapped by reaction with either a nucleophile, such as positions C8 or C6 of a flavan-3-ol or “upper unit” of a PA, or a thiol, such as cysteine or glutathione. The presence in planta of the leucocyanidin carbocation was recently inferred from experiments in which it was trapped as the 4-methyl derivative by extraction in acidic methanol (Wang et al., 2020). If formation of Epi-cys turns out to be enzymatic, its formation could be seen as an example of genetically-controlled metabolic “damage pre-emption” (de Crécy-Lagard et al., 2018). For the pathways in Figure 1B to form oligomeric PAs, some form of temporal or physical separation of the shared reactions leading to starter and extension units is required. Haslam et al. (1977) described a gradual switch from starter to extension unit synthesis associated with increasing PA chain length in some species, but the in vivo presence of “trapped” carbocations in the form of Epi-cys in model plants examined to date suggests the absence of tight, stoichiometric coupling of starter and extension unit generation.

TOXICITY OF PA STARTER AND EXTENSION UNITS

PA extension units are highly reactive and therefore potentially toxic to the cell; managing this toxicity appears to require complex subcellular compartmentation as described below. However, the stable flavan-3-ols that comprise the starter units of PAs can also exhibit cellular toxicity. In
this regard, there has been much controversy surrounding reports that (+/-)-catechin exhibits allelopathic activity (Duke et al., 2009). Indirect genetic evidence for catechin toxicity was obtained in studies of the ldox mutant of Arabidopsis that accumulates (+)-catechin (Jun et al., 2018). Independent homozygous null mutants exhibit a strong developmental phenotype in which more than ~80‒90% of the seeds show developmental arrest at 2–4 days after pollination, and cannot be recovered. Generally only 1 or 2 seeds per pod develop normally (Jun et al., 2018). By contrast, the lar ldox double mutant, in which catechin does not accumulate, does not exhibit this seed development phenotype.

Plants generally detoxify polyphenolic compounds by sugar conjugation and transport to the vacuole (Wang and Hou, 2009). Epicatechin 3′-O-glucoside has been detected in both Arabidopsis and M. truncatula (Pang et al., 2008, 2013; Kitamura et al., 2010), and is formed by a glucosyltransferase (UGT72L1) that is regulated by the same TFs that control expression of ANR and LAR (Pang et al., 2008). Epicatechin 3′-O-glucoside is substrate for the vacuolar MATE 1 transporter from M. truncatula and the TT12 MATE transporter from Arabidopsis (Zhao and Dixon, 2009). Because PAs have been assumed to be assembled in the vacuole, it has been tempting to assume that glucosylation and subsequent transport of epicatechin to the central vacuole is a critical step in PA biosynthesis. However, testing this hypothesis is problematic because no ortholog of UGT72L1 has been found in Arabidopsis and exhaustive screening of tt mutants has not revealed a flavanol-specific UGT. UGT72L1 does not act on (+)-catechin, although this molecule can be a starter unit for PAs in M. truncatula ldox mutants (Jun et al., 2018). It therefore remains unclear whether glycosylation of flavan-3-ols is essential for PA biosynthesis or represents a mechanism for detoxification and storage of excess PA starter units; both could potentially be true if synthesis of starter and extension units is temporally or spatially separated.

RECONCILING CELL BIOLOGY WITH BIOCHEMISTRY

Phenotypes of tt Mutants
Genetic mutations that block accumulation of oxidized PAs result in a transparent testa (tt) phenotype, sometimes with dramatic changes to cellular ultrastructure. TT19 is a cytosolic glutathione S-transferase of somewhat unclear function. In the tt19 mutant, PAs are found in
small vesicle structures localized around small vacuoles outlined by the MATE transporter TT12 (Kitamura et al., 2010). *tt19* has higher levels of insoluble PAs than wild-type, and these are reduced in the *tt19/tt12* double mutant (Kitamura et al., 2010). To reconcile these findings with the pathways in Figure 1B, Figure 2 presents a model in which reactive PA extension units are stabilized through interaction with TT19, either in soluble complexes or vesicles, and then delivered to pre-vacuole-like vesicles that contain stable starter units, possibly, although perhaps not exclusively, loaded as glycosylated flavan-3-ols by TT12. Sequestration of starter units is required because they themselves can be phytotoxic (Jun et al., 2018). In this model, fusion of the TT19- and TT12-containing structures results in mixing of starter and extension units to initiate oligomerization; the resulting PA dimers and higher oligomers are finally delivered, perhaps by vesicle fusion, to the central vacuole. TT19 is also present in the tonoplast, where it may be associated with transporters for anthocyanins (Sun et al., 2012) or PAs. Consistent with the model in Figure 2, loss of function of LAR results in higher-molecular-weight PAs through increasing the ratio of Epi-cys extension units to epicatechin starter units (Liu et al., 2016), and loss of function of TT19 results in higher-molecular-weight PAs formed in the cytosol through interaction of excess “unprotected” extension units with cytosolic epicatechin; this is reversed in the *tt19/tt12* double mutant because of the elevated levels of cytosolic starter units (Kitamura et al., 2010). TT13 encodes a tonoplast ATPase necessary for generation of a proton gradient for transport of PA starter units by TT12 (Appelhagen et al., 2015). In both *tt12* and *tt13* mutants, PAs accumulate on the outside of TT12-containing small vacuoles, suggesting that the TT19 complex is targeting the extension units to these vacuoles where the starter units are now backed up; glycosylated epicatechin, presumably cytosolic, accumulates in the *tt12* mutant (Appelhagen et al., 2015; Kitamura et al., 2010).

TT10 encodes a laccase enzyme (AtLAC15 in Arabidopsis) that was originally ascribed a role in PA polymerization, although the non-specific linkage pattern of TT10-catalyzed oligomerization products has led to the hypothesis that the function of the enzyme is more likely the oxidation of pre-formed PAs in the cell wall of the seed coat (Pourcel et al., 2005). TT10 can also catalyze lignin polymerization (Liang et al., 2006), and could potentially catalyze the formation of cross-links between PAs and other cell-wall polymers. Whether oxidation by TT10 is important for formation of insoluble PAs or whether these simply reflect higher-molecular-
weight forms (Liu et al., 2016) remains unclear. In fact, insoluble PAs, although often accounting for more than 50% of the total PA species, remain somewhat poorly characterized. They are easy to quantify by conversion to anthocyanidins by heating in acidic butanol, but this results in the loss of structural information. New methods for analysis of insoluble PAs are clearly required. Although nuclear magnetic resonance approaches are now being applied to PA analysis (e.g. Fryganas et al., 2018), they have yet to provide the structural resolution of similar approaches for the phenylpropanoid polymer lignin (Sette et al., 2011). Increasingly sophisticated mass spectrometry approaches are being applied to PA characterization (Salminen, 2018), but detailed structural features of the internal portions of polymers remain elusive.

The role of metabolons in reactions specific for PA biosynthesis, as suggested in Figure 2, requires further investigation. It is now well established that the earlier reactions in the flavonoid pathway are organized in metabolons anchored to the endoplasmic reticulum through association with the cytochrome P450 enzymes of the pathway (Nakayama et al., 2019; Waki et al., 2020), but physical interactions between the later enzymes of the pathway have yet to be demonstrated. The need for such physical organization of the pathway would appear necessary to explain the differentiation of starter unit from extension unit synthesis using shared enzymes (Jun et al., 2018).

The Tannosome Model

A very different model to describe the subcellular sites of PA biosynthesis has been proposed based on microscopy of tannin-producing cells from across the plant kingdom (Brillouet 2014, 2015; Brillouet et al 2014a,b). In this model, PA precursors are synthesized in chloroplasts and polymerized in an organelle termed the tannosome, which is derived from thylakoids, and protected during their intracellular journey to the vacuole in “shuttles” bounded by membranes derived from both inner and outer chloroplast envelopes that have budded from the chloroplast (Brillouet et al., 2014a). The shuttles are then incorporated into the vacuole as tannin accretions by invagination of the tonoplast, thus protecting the cell contents from the protein-binding activity of polymerized PAs (Brillouet et al., 2014a). It appears hard at first sight to reconcile the tannosome model with our current understanding of the biochemistry and genetics of PA biosynthesis (Box 1), unless different pathways of PA synthesis and trafficking occur in
different species and/or cell types. It is also hard to reconcile a model in which all reactions of
PA biosynthesis occur together in the same subcellular compartment with the asymmetric
labeling of PA subunits (Haslam 1977).

Testing Intracellular Routes of PA Biosynthesis

One impediment to a reconciliation of the models derived from cellular, biochemical, and
genetic examinations of PA biosynthesis is the lack of an optimal experimental model system.
The descriptive studies on the tannosome have used species in which the biochemistry and
genetics of PA biosynthesis are less well defined, and which are poorly amenable to genetic
manipulation. Furthermore, histological observations provide varying pictures of tannin
deposition and vesicles in different cell types (Vio-Michaelis et al., 2020). The species with the
best developed genetic tools (Arabidopsis and Medicago) have significant differences in the
biochemical pathways to starter units (Arabidopsis possesses neither LAR nor a functional
ortholog of Medicago LDOX), and furthermore only accumulate PAs at significant levels
during early seed coat development. Poplar (Populus spp.) may be a better model for future
studies. In poplar, PAs are produced naturally in leaves, providing large amounts of material for
analysis, and the pathway is also inducible by a number of stresses and chemicals (Mellway et
al., 2009; Ullah et al., 2019a). Moreover, poplar is genetically transformable and amenable to
gene editing (Bewg et al., 2018), and a very large collection of fully sequenced natural variants
is available for genome-wide association studies that are already providing new information on
multiple traits including the biosynthesis of the phenolic polymer lignin (Chhetri et al., 2019).

Other emerging model species for PA biosynthesis are tea (Camellia sinensis), in which
genome sequences of cultivated and wild accessions have been mined to inform the
biosynthesis of both PAs and health-promoting PA monomers such as epigallocatechin gallate
(Zhang et al., 2020), and grapevine (Vitis vinifera), in which transcriptomic and association
genetic approaches have been applied to study the PA pathway (Huang et al., 2012; Carrier et
al., 2013). All the above systems produce the classical 4→8-linked B-type PAs. Cranberry
(Vaccinium macrocarpon Ait), also with a sequenced genome, accumulates A-type PAs that
possess additional C2-O-C7 or C2-O-C5 bonds. Transcriptomic studies have addressed the core
genes of PA biosynthesis in this species (Sun et al., 2015), but the exact mechanism for
formation of the additional A-type linkages remains to be determined.
With a suitable model selected, the key approach to solving the problem of coupled PA synthesis and intracellular trafficking will be the proteomic and metabolomic characterization of the vesicles seen in the tannosome model and in the various mutants described above. Methods are available for labeling cellular organelles/compartments to allow for visualization of co-localization within the cell (Geldner et al., 2009) and affinity purification for biochemical analysis (Bayraktara et al., 2019; Xiong et al., 2019), and the sensitivity of both proteomics and metabolomics has now improved to the point where analysis of plant subcellular compartments is possible (Furtauer et al., 2019). The vesicles purported to contain PAs in the tannosome model sedimented to the bottom of the ultracentrifuge tube during purification (Brillouet et al., 2014b) and could therefore be contaminated with precipitated PAs. It is critical to prove directly whether PAs or their precursors are sequestered in vesicles showing chloroplast membrane origin and, if so, whether proteins such as TT12, TT13 and TT19 co-localize with these vesicles. These studies will require the initial generation of a number of engineered lines in which various membrane protein markers are introduced into different genetic backgrounds in which the PA pathway is perturbed, as well as marker lines designed for tracking the cellular pathways temporally after suitable induction. These materials could also be subjected to labeling with $^{13}$C-Phe or $^{13}$C-cinnamic acid to track the distribution of label in starter and extension units as assembling PAs are trafficked to the central vacuole.

An alternative approach is to apply new tools to existing models. Autophagy of chloroplasts can occur through multiple routes, including the process of microchlorophagy in which more than one type of small vesicle can be targeted to the main vacuole (Zhuang and Jiang, 2019). Monitoring this process during the early developmental stages of the Arabidopsis seed coat endothelium, where PA synthesis occurs, could provide a means of testing the tannosome model in a genetically tractable system.

EXAMINING THE PROPERTIES OF PAs FROM A FUNCTIONAL PERSPECTIVE

Roles in Biotic and Abiotic Stress Protection
PAs have been suggested to possess protective functions against oxidative stress, herbivory (insect and animal), and pathogen attack. Studies to address such functions benefit from the use of a plant that produces PAs in major organs and tissues, that possesses well-studied ecology and extensive genetic variation, and that is suitable for genetic manipulation to alter PA profiles. Poplar has emerged as a model species that fits these criteria well. Extracts from poplar bark contain higher concentrations of PAs and greater antioxidant capacity than similar extracts from fir, beech, pine, and oak (Hamad et al., 2019). Manipulation of the expression of two MYB TFs, MYB115 and MYB134, makes it possible to generate poplar lines with widely differing levels of leaf catechin and PAs (James 2017), and such lines have been exploited to address various potential ecological functions of PAs (Box 2).

High light stress and nitrogen deficiency both generate reactive oxygen species (ROS) in hybrid poplar (*P. tremula × P. tremuloides*); exposure to natural sunlight for two weeks caused a 14-fold increase in foliar PA levels, whereas subjection to soil nitrogen deficiency led to a 4- to 5-fold increase. In both cases, the antioxidant capacity of the poplar extracts paralleled the increase in PA levels (Gourlay and Constabel 2019). Moreover, when MYB over-expressing transgenic poplar with elevated PA levels were treated with the ROS-generator methyl viologen, they retained greater chlorophyll fluorescence and produced less hydrogen peroxide and superoxide (Gourlay and Constabel, 2019). High cytosolic flavonol concentrations may be detrimental by acting as pro-oxidants and thereby damaging DNA in the presence of hydrogen peroxide (Krych and Gebicka, 2013; Harding, 2019), but overexpression of MYB134/115 induces PAs without elevating cytosolic flavonol levels (Gouraly and Constabel, 2019).

Many phenolic compounds such as PAs are bitter and thus predicted to act as feeding deterrents, and PAs have additional specific antinutritional effects. For example, mountain hares (*Lepus timidus*) fed birch (*Betula* spp.) bark showed high sodium output through urine, rapid loss of body weight, and did not survive on the diet (Palo 1984). High PA levels can cause oxidative stress in the insect gut, and intestinal damage in vertebrate herbivores (Barbehenn and Constabel, 2011). These detrimental effects are predicted to reduce herbivore food preference for plants with higher concentrations of PAs, and in a classic study with *Quercus*, foliar PA concentration was negatively correlated with herbivore community density (Forkner et al,
However, moving beyond correlations has proven difficult. PAs are induced when poplar is subject to natural herbivory, for example by the white satin moth *Leucoma salicis*, or when mechanically wounded (Peters and Constabel, 2002; Tsai et al., 2006), and this induction may protect the trees against unadapted species. However, PAs are often not effective against adapted herbivore species (Barbehenn and Constabel, 2011). In fact, coevolution may cause CTs to become feeding stimulants for some herbivores (Hjältén and Axelsson, 2015). Further research is therefore necessary to elucidate the roles of PAs in herbivore defense, but the use of transgenic models requires careful examination. For example, after a chance outbreak of thrips, transgenic poplar lines expressing high PA levels were found to be more damaged than their wild-type counterparts. This appears to result from reduction in the levels of phenolic glycosides as a result of the upregulation of the PA pathway (Mellway et al., 2009). In a separate study, high-PA poplar was likewise preferred by the forest tent caterpillar *Malacosoma disstria* and the gypsy moth *Lymantria dispar* because of the reduced phenolic glycoside levels (Boeckler et al., 2014). Future transgenic manipulation studies will need to consider ways of limiting changes in polyphenols to PAs alone.

An interesting concept that requires further evaluation is that PAs are mediators of insect herbivore tolerance rather than resistance (Madritch and Lindroff 2015). The protein-binding capacity of PAs can enhance nitrogen retention and subsequent recycling from the soil, and genetically engineered PA levels in *Populus tremuloides* were shown to correlate with increased nitrogen recovery after defoliation through insect herbivory (Madritch and Lindroff, 2015). PAs may therefore exert their protective functions as much or more after leaves are shed than when they are still on the plant.

Evidence of a role for PAs in pathogen defense is less disputed than for insect defense. Infection by fungal biotrophs such as *Melampsora medusae*, *Marssonina brunnea f.sp. multigermtubi* and *Plectosphaerella populi* induces transcriptional activation of the PA biosynthetic pathway in poplar leaves (Mellway et al., 2009, Ullah et al., 2019b, Yuan et al., 2012), and PAs and monomeric catechin reduce mycelial growth of *P. populi* (Ullah et al., 2017, 2019b). Overexpression of MYB115 in poplar resulted in a 50% reduction in lesions caused by *Dothiorella gregaria*, the causative agent of branch canker, whereas lesion numbers were...
increased by 137.5% in CRISPR/Cas9-generated *myb115* mutant plants (Wang et al., 2017). Both *D. gregaria* and *M. brunnea f. sp. multigermtubi* exhibited reduced mycelial growth, shorter hyphae, swollen tips, and fewer hyphal branches on exposure to extracts from MYB115-overexpressing plants as compared to control plants (Wang et al., 2017, Yuan et al., 2012), and the improved response to fungal attack was directly attributed to PA accumulation, as MYB115 overexpression did not appear to enhance other defense pathways involving genes such as *PR5*, *JAZ10*, *MYB44*, and *NPR1* (Wang 2017).

Most PAs in the soil probably originate from leaf litter. Levels in roots tend to be lower, and not correlated with above-ground levels (Dettlaff et al., 2018). Although tannin-rich leaf litter from MYB134-overexpressing poplar did not result in changes in microbial biodiversity, the leaf litter was found to promote the growth of *Eocronartium muscicola*, a parasite of mosses, which reduced moss proliferation in soil microcosms (Winder et al., 2013). Use of short-term coppiced plants such as poplar for carbon sequestration has been considered (Quinkenstein and Jochheim, 2016). Leaf PAs represent a potentially large sink of carbon for greenhouse gas sequestration, but, before attempting to implement increasing PAs as a carbon-reduction strategy, it will be important to consider further their impacts on nutrient recycling, microbial communities, and greenhouse gas emissions from soil. Furthermore, because of the increasingly realized importance of root PAs for soil carbon sequestration (Adamczyk et al., 2020), more studies are required on the biosynthesis of PAs in roots and the effects of their structural modification on the stabilization of organic matter.

**PAs in Pastures and Animal Feed**

The protein-binding activity of PAs accounts for their ability to protect ruminants from pasture bloat and shield proteins in the ruminant diet and in silage from precocious degradation (McMahon et al., 2000). This has been the stimulus for attempts to engineer PAs in forage crops that lack PAs in vegetative tissues (e.g. Hancock et al., 2012), and long-term proprietary studies utilizing structural and regulatory genes are underway to this end, although as yet unpublished. Because PAs have multiple effects on animal health and performance, it is important to understand exactly what PA structures we need to engineer. This will require collaboration between analytical chemists, ruminant nutritionists, and molecular biologists. Useful approaches
will be the engineering of PAs of broadly defined composition and chain length in planta facilitated by our knowledge of how LAR and LDOX help define starter/extension unit composition and degree of polymerization (Liu et al., 2016; Jun et al., 2018), and the development of more versatile analytical methods for PAs that can be predictive of PA function rather than structure alone (Marsh et al. 2020). There is also a need for further investigation of the biosynthesis of PAs in cereal crops, and the development of the best model organism for such studies. Many grasses and grains, such as tall fescue (Festuca arundinacea), perennial ryegrass (Lolium perenne), and wild rice (Zizania spp.), possess PAs in the seeds (Fraser et al., 2016; Hosoda et al., 2018), but few have them in vegetative tissues. Protective flavonoid synthesis in infected leaves of both sorghum (Sorghum bicolor) and maize (Zea mays) involves the formation of 3-deoxyanthocyanidins, generated via flavan-4-ols through the activity of a flavanone 4-reductase (Kawakigashi et al., 2016). Flavan-4-ols are also believed to be the precursors of the still poorly-defined red phlobaphene pigments found in maize seeds. There is strong interest in engineering PAs in maize; however, in spite of a number of early genetic studies, much more needs to be understood about phlobaphene biosynthesis, which appears, at least on paper, to parallel and potentially compete with flavan-3-ol-derived PA biosynthesis (Box 3). Paradoxically, although several studies have shown that flavonoid-pathway TFs from maize can induce PA accumulation in dicot species (e.g. Li et al., 2007), maize does not itself appear to accumulate PAs to levels that allow rigorous identification. Although the maize genome contains genes with sequence similarity to ANR, the functions of these genes are yet to be determined.

**PAs as Structural Components: The Lignin Connection Revisited**

In a classic review entitled “Proanthocyanidins and the lignin connection”, Stafford (1998) discussed similarities between lignin and PAs, concluding that, although both polymers often occur together in plants, PAs are unlikely to play major structural roles. This conclusion still appears generally valid, although it was hypothesized that the helicoidal tridimensional structures of PAs in cell walls of some African “resuscitation plants” might provide protection from cell wall cracking under intense desiccation, allowing the plants to recover rapidly following reinstated water availability (Pizzi and Cameron, 1986). Whatever the natural functions of PAs in cell walls, it is interesting to consider whether it may be possible to generate, in planta, novel lignin-PA copolymers as biomaterials (Grishechko et al., 2013).
concept appears feasible both chemically and biologically, in view of recent progress in the use of PAs as core molecules for biomaterial design (Garcia et al., 2016), and the newly realized plasticity of lignin structure with resulting potential for designer lignins (Mottiar et al., 2016). Lignin-PA aerogels have been synthesized chemically from lignins and wattle tannin (Grishechko et al., 2013), a polymer comprised primarily of units derived from robinetinidol (a 5-deoxy-flavan-3-ol with a 3´-,4´-,5´-hydroxy-substituted B-ring, Figure 3, compound 1). Epigallocatechin and epigallocatechin gallate (Figure 3, compound 2) have the same B-ring substitution pattern as robinetinidol, and have been shown to incorporate into lignin when fed, along with monolignols, to isolated maize primary cell walls (Elumalai et al., 2012; Grabber et al., 2012). Such incorporation enhances sugar release from lignocellulosic biomass (Elumalai et al., 2012), and density functional theory calculations confirm that incorporation of lignin-flavonoid bonds in the lignin polymer (Figure 3, compound 3) will lead to linkage properties conducive to more facile lignin depolymerization (Berstis et al., 2020).

Lignin-flavonoid linkages occur in nature. Flavonolignans are dimers or higher oligomers comprising at least one monolignol linked to at least one flavonoid, with the best-known example being silybin, a popular dietary supplement from milk thistle (*Silybum marianum*) (Figure 3, compound 4), in which the flavonoid component (taxifolin) may be synthesized in flowers and transported to the seed coat where it is polymerized with coniferyl alcohol (Lv et al., 2017). In some cases, molecules of this type include flavan-3-ol units (Kinvok et al., 2017). Importantly, the flavone tricin (Figure 3, compound 5) is a natural component of lignin in grasses, where it serves as a nucleation site for lignin polymerization (Lan et al., 2015). In maize defective in the *CHALCONE SYNTHASE 2* gene, near total loss of tricin results in increased levels of Klason lignin with the enhancement of dimer linkages (Eloy et al., 2017), whereas loss of function of *FLAVONE SYNTHASE 2* in rice (*Oryza sativa*) results in partial replacement of lignin-associated tricin with its precursor naringenin, decreased lignin syringyl:guaiacyl unit ratio, and enhanced sugar release efficiency (Lam et al., 2017). These results indicate that flavonoids are made in or transported to cells undergoing lignification, and that they can cross into the apoplast to initiate or further contribute to lignification. Although levels of PAs are much lower in stems and developing xylem than in leaves and root tips of
poplar (Tsai et al., 2006), it should be possible to increase these levels through overexpression of the TFs described above.

CONCLUDING REMARKS

In spite of an apparently near-complete understanding of the biochemical machinery required for PA biosynthesis, how these molecules are assembled is still perplexing (see Outstanding Questions). The complex pathways for metabolic elaboration and sequestration in PA biosynthesis may be necessary for protecting the plant cell against reactive/toxic intermediates, and providing order to a polymerization mechanism that relies on thermodynamic rather than enzymatic control. Furthermore, the spatial and temporal separation of starter and extension unit biosynthesis and accumulation provides an explanation for the difference in labeling of the “upper” and “lower” units in PAs, in spite of their largely shared biochemical pathways. The potential toxicity to the plant of the intermediates and final products of the PA pathway presents challenges to successful metabolic engineering of the pathway. It is well worth attempting to overcome these challenges in view of the potential advances in agriculture, chemical ecology, carbon sequestration, and biomaterials science that this will facilitate.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was supported by the Hagler Institute for Advanced Studies, Texas A and M University, and by research grants from Forage Genetics International and GrasslaNZ Research Inc to RAD. SS acknowledges receipt of a TAMS Summer Student Scholarship.

LEGENDS TO FIGURES

Figure 1. Biosynthetic pathways to the starter and extension units of proanthocyanidins. A, Structures and labeling patterns of 4→8-linked procyanidin dimers. Procyanidins B1-B4 represent the four possible combinations arising from dimerization of 2,3-cis-(−)-epicatechin and 2,3-trans-(+)-catechin, with procyanidins B2 and B3 being the homodimers of epicatechin and catechin, respectively. The % values represent the approximate % of known structures with
that particular unit as starter (lower) or extension (upper) unit. The large black arrows signify radiolabel incorporation from trans-cinnamic acid; the upper units incorporate 3–5 times more label than the lower units, and labeled epicatechin labels lower units only in procyanidin B2. B, Scheme for separate origins of starter and extension units in plants with the LDOX/LAR pathway. Green highlighting indicates potential extension units, and the central green box shows the reactive species thus derived (carbocation and quinone methide) and the nucleophiles that can trap them (light blue ovals). Flav-2-en-3,4-diol is proposed as a potential substrate for generation of 2,3-cis-leucocyanidin for epicatechin extension units. In species that possess LAR, expression of this enzyme can determine chain length by converting Epi-cys (extension unit) to epicatechin (starter unit). Brown highlighting indicates starter units. Enzymes are: CHS, chalcone synthase; CHI, chalcone isomerase; F3′H, flavonoid 3′-hydroxylase; F3H, flavanone 3-hydroxylase; FLS, flavonol synthase; DFR, dihydroflavonol reductase; ANS, anthocyanidin synthase; ANR, anthocyanidin reductase; UGT, uridine diphosphate glycosyltransferase; LAR, leucoanthocyanidin reductase; LDOX, leucoanthocyandin dioxygenase. Not all species (e.g. Arabidopsis) possess the LAR/LDOX route to epicatechin starter units.

Figure 2. Hypothetical scheme for the sequestration of starter and extension units during PA biosynthesis in Medicago truncatula. The model proposes that reactions specific for starter unit formation from LAR occur on freely soluble enzymes, whereas those associated with extension unit formation occur through a hypothetical metabolon associated with a sub-domain of the endoplasmic reticulum (ER) with tethering through the membrane anchor of the F3′H cytochrome P450 enzyme. The products of these reactions (leucoanthocyanidins) are “captured” and protected by the TT19 GST, including through formation of Epi-cys from 2,3-cis-leucocyanidin. The TT19 complex interacts with vesicles loaded with starter units through the combined activities of a UGT, the MATE transporter TT12, and the proton APTase TT13 (also known as AHA10). Localization of TT19 to the tonoplast may indicate a tight association with PA extension units until they are safely loaded into vesicles harboring starter units. Fusion of the structures containing starter and extension units allows non-enzymatic condensation to form PA dimers and higher oligomers during migration of the pre-vacuolar vesicles to ultimately fuse with the central vacuole, where they are finally deposited as tannin accretions. Enzymes, represented by small circles, are as in the legend to Figure 1B, plus C4H, cinnamate 4-
hydroxylase. Enzymes and structures circled in green are associated with extension unit formation, in brown with starter unit formation. This model assumes the existence of soluble and insoluble forms of DFR, but other spatial or even temporal controls could allow for separation of the pathways.

**Figure 3.** Flavonoids that form linkages to monolignols or lignin. See text for details.
REFERENCES

Adamczyk B, Heinonsalo J, Simon, J (2020) Mechanisms of carbon sequestration in highly organic ecosystems – importance of chemical ecology. Chem. Open 9: 464–469

Appelhagen I, Nordholt N, Seidel T, Spelt K, Koes R, Quattrochio F, Sagasser M, Weisshaar B (2015) TRANSPARENT TESTA 13 is a tonoplast P3A-ATPase required for vacuolar deposition of proanthocyanidins in Arabidopsis thaliana seeds. Plant J 82: 840-849

Barbehenn RV, Constabel CP (2011) Tannins in plant-herbivore interactions. Phytochemistry 72: 1551-1565

Bayraktara EC, Baudriera L, Özerdema C, Lewis CA, Chanb SH, Kunchok T, Abu-Remaileh M, Cangelosi AL, David M. Sabatini DM, Birsoya K, Chen WW (2019) MITO-Tag mice enable rapid isolation and multimodal profiling of mitochondria from specific cell types in vivo. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 116: 303–312

Berstis L, Elder T, Dixon RA, Crowley M, Beckham GT (2020) Coupling of flavonoid nucleation sites with monolignols studied by density functional theory. ACS Green Chem, in review

Bewg WP, Ci D, Tsai C-J (2018) Genome editing in trees: from multiple repair pathways to long-term stability. Front Plant Sci 9: 1732

Boeckler GA, Towns M, Unsicker SB, Mellway RD, Yip L, Hilke I, Gershenzon J, Constabel CP (2014) Transgenic upregulation of the condensed tannin pathway in poplar leads to a dramatic shift in leaf palatability for two tree-feeding Lepidoptera. J Chem Ecol Feb 2014: DOI 10.1007/s10886-014-0383-7
Brillouet J-M (2014) Plasticity of the tannosome ontogenesis in the Tracheophyta. J Plant Sci 2: 317-323

Brillouet J-M (2015) On the role of chloroplasts in the polymerization of tannins in Tracheophyta: A monograph. Am J Plant Sci 6: 1401-1409

Brillouet J-M, Romieu C, Lartaud M, Jublanc E, Torregrosa T, Cazevieille C (2014a) Formation of vacuolar tannin deposits in the chlorophyllous organs of Tracheophyta: from shuttles to accretions. Protoplasma 2014: DOI 10.1007/s00709-014-0640-1

Brillouet J-M, Romieu C, Schoefs B, Solymosi K, Cheynier V, Fulcrand H, Verdeil J-L, Coneje´ro G. (2014b) The tannosome is an organelle forming condensed tannins in the chlorophyllous organs of Tracheophyta. Ann Bot 2014: 1-12. doi:10.1093/aob/mct168

Carrier C, Huang Y-F, Le Cunff L, Fournier-Level A, Vialet S, Souquet J-M, Cheynier V, Terrier N, This, P (2013) Selection of candidate genes for grape proanthocyanidin pathway by an integrative approach. Plant Physiol Biochem 72: 87-95

Chhetri HB, Macaya-Sanz D, Kainer D, Biswal AK, Evans LM, Chen JG, Collins C, Hunt K, Mohanty SS, Rosenstiel T, Ryno D, Winkeler K, Yang X, Jacobson D, Mohnen D, Muchero W, Strauss SH, Tschaplinski,TJ, Tuskan GA, DiFazio SP (2019) Multitrait genome-wide association analysis of Populus trichocarpa identifies key polymorphisms controlling morphological and physiological traits. New Phytol 223: 293-309

de Crécy-Lagard V, Haas D, Hanson AD (2018). Newly-discovered enzymes that function in metabolite damage-control. Curr Opin Chem Biol 47:101-108

Dettlaff MA, Marshall V, Erbilgin N, Cahill JF Jr. (2018) Root condensed tannins vary over time, but are unrelated to leaf tannins. AoB PLANTS 10: ply044; doi: 10.1093/aobpla/ply044
Dixon RA, Liu C, Jun JH (2012) Metabolic engineering of anthocyanins and condensed tannins in plants. Curr Opin Biotechnol 24: 329-335

Duke SO, Blair AC, Dayan FE, Johnson RD, Meepagala KMM, Cook D, Bajsa J (2009) Is (−)-Catechin a novel weapon of spotted knapweed (Centaurea stoebe)? J Chem Ecol 35:141–153

Eloy NB, Voorend W, Lan W, Saleme MdeLS, Cesarino I, Vanholme R, Smith RA, Goeminne G, Pallidis A, Morreel K, Nicomedes J, Ralph J, Boerjan W (2017) Silencing CHALCONE SYNTHASE in maize impedes the incorporation of tricin into lignin and increases lignin content. Plant Physiol 173: 998-1016

Elumalai S, Tobimatsu Y, Grabber JH, Pan X, Ralph J (2012). Epigallocatechin gallate incorporation into lignin enhances the alkaline delignification and enzymatic saccharification of cell walls. Biotechnol Biofuels 5:59

Forkner R, Marquis R, Lill J (2004) Feeny revisited: condensed tannins as anti-herbivore defences in leaf-chewing herbivore communities of Quercus. Environ Entomol 29: 174-187

Fraser K, Collette V, Hancock KR (2016) Characterization of proanthocyanidins from seeds of perennial ryegrass (Lolium perenne L.) and tall fescue (Festuca arundinacea) by liquid chromatography–mass spectrometry. J Agric Food Chem 64: 6676–6684

Fryganas C, Drake C, Ropiak HM, Mora-Ortiz M, Smith LMJ, Mueller-Harvey I, Kowalczyk RM (2018) Carbon-13 cross-polarization magic-angle spinning nuclear magnetic resonance for measuring proanthocyanidin content and procyanidin to prodelphinidin ratio in sainfoin (Onobrychis vicifolia) issues. J Agric Food Chem 66: 4073-4081

Fürtauer L, Küstner L, Weckwerth W, Heyer AG, Nägele T (2019) Resolving subcellular plant metabolism. Plant J 100: 438-455
Garcia DE, Glasser WG, Pizzi A, Paczkowski SP, Marie-Pierre Laborie M-P (2016) Modification of condensed tannins: from polyphenol chemistry to materials engineering. New J Chem 40: 36

Gargouri M, Manigand C, Maugé C, Ganier T, Langlois d’Estaintot B, Cala O, Pianet I, Bathany K, Chaudiere J, Gallois B (2009) Structure and epimerase activity of anthocyanidin reductase from Vitis vinifera. Acta Crystallogr D Biol Crystallogr 65: 989-1000

Geldner N, Dénervaud-Tendon V, Hyman1 DL, Mayer U, Stierhof Y-D, and Chory J (2009) Rapid, combinatorial analysis of membrane compartments in intact plants with a multicolor marker set. Plant J 59: 169-178

Gourlay G, Constabel PC. (2019). Condensed tannins are inducible antioxidants and protect hybrid poplar against oxidative stress. Tree Physiol 39: 345–355

Grabber JH, Ress D, Ralph J (2012) Identifying new lignin bioengineering targets: impact of epicatechin, quercetin glycoside, and gallate derivatives on the lignification and fermentation of maize cell walls. J Agric Food Chem 60:5152-5160

Grishechko LI, Amaral-Labat G, Szczurek A, Fierro V, Kuznetsov BN, Pizzi A, Celzard A (2013) New tannin–lignin aerogels. Ind Crops Prod 41: 347-355

Hancock KR, Collette V, Fraser K, Greig M, Xue H, Richardson K, Jones C, Rasmussen S (2012) Expression of the R2R3-MYB transcription factor Ta-MYB14 from Trifolium arvense activates proanthocyanidin biosynthesis in the legumes Trifolium repens and Medicago sativa. Plant Physiol 159: 1204–1220

Hamad AMA, Ates S, Olgun C, Gür M (2019) Chemical composition and antioxidant properties of some industrial tree bark extracts. BioRes 14: 5657-5671
Harding SA (2019) Condensed tannins: arbiters of abiotic stress tolerance. Tree Physiol 39: 341–344

Haslam E, Opie CT, Porter LJ (1977) Procyanidin metabolism -a hypothesis. Phytochemistry 16: 99-102

Hjältén J, Axelsson E P (2015) GM trees with increased resistance to herbivores: trait efficiency and their potential to promote tree growth. Front Plant Sci 6:279.

Hosoda K, Sasahara H, Matsushita K, Tamura Y, Miyaji M, Matsuyama H (2018) Anthocyanin and proanthocyanidin contents, antioxidant activity, and in situ degradability of black and red rice grains. Asian-Australas J Anim Sci. 31:1213-1220

Huang YF, Doligez A, Fournier-Level A, Le Cunff L, Bertrand Y, Canaguier A, Morel C, Miralles V, Veran F, Souquet JM, Cheynier V, Terrier N, This P (2012) Dissecting genetic architecture of grape proanthocyanidin composition through quantitative trait locus mapping. BMC Plant Biol 27: 12-30.

Jacques D, Haslam E (1974) Biosynthesis of plant proanthocyanidins. J Chem Soc Chem Commun 1974: 231-232

James AM, Ma D, Mellway R, Gesell A, Yoshida K, Walker V, Tran L, Stewart D, Reichelt M, Suvanto J, Salminen J-P, Gershenzon J, Séguin A, and Constabel CP (2017) Poplar MYB115 and MYB134 transcription factors regulate proanthocyanidin synthesis and structure. Plant Physiol 174: 154–171

Jun JH, Xiao X, Rao X, Dixon RA (2018). Proanthocyanidin subunit composition determined by functionally differentiated dioxygenases. Nat Plants 4: 1034–1043
Kawahigashi H, Kasuga S, Sawada Y, Yonemaru J-i, Ando A, Kanamori H, Wu J, Mizuno H, Momma M, Fujimoto Z, Hirai MY, Matsumoto T (2016) The sorghum gene for leaf color changes upon wounding (P) encodes a flavanone 4-reductase in the 3-deoxyanthocyanidin biosynthesis pathway. G3 2016:1439-1447, https://doi.org/10.1534/g3.115.026104

Kinyok MJ, Bonnet S, Noté OP, Mbing JN, Kamto EL, Van der Westhuizen JH, Pegnyemb DE (2017) A new flavanolignan and a new alkane from the stem bark of Newtonia griffoniana, Nat Prod Res 31:19

Kitamura S, Matsuda F, Tohge T, Yonekura-Sakakibara K, Yamazaki M, Saito K, Narumi I (2010) Metabolic profiling and cytological analysis of proanthocyanidins in immature seeds of Arabidopsis thaliana flavonoid accumulation mutants. Plant J 62: 549–559

Koyama K, Numata M, Nakajima I, Goto-Yamamoto N, Matsumura H, Tanaka N. (2014) Functional characterization of a new grapevine MYB transcription factor and regulation of proanthocyanidin biosynthesis in grapes. J Exp Bot 65:4433-4449

Krych J, Gebicka L (2013) Catalase is inhibited by flavonoids. Int J Biol Macromol 58:148–153.

Lam PY, Tobimatsu Y, Takeda Y, Suzuki S, Yamamura M, Umezawa T, Lo C. (2017) Disrupting flavone synthase II alters lignin and improves biomass digestibility. Plant Physiol 174: 972–985

Lan W, Lu F, Regner M, Zhu Y, Rencoret J, Ralph SA, Zakai UI, Morreel K, Boerjan W, Ralph J (2015) Tricin, a flavonoid monomer in monocot lignification. Plant Physiology 167: 1284–1295

Liang M, Davis E, Gardner D, Cai X, Wu Y (2006) Involvement of AtLAC15 in lignin synthesis in seeds and in root elongation of Arabidopsis. Planta 224:1185-1196.
Li H, Flachowsky H, Fischer TC, Hanke MV, Forkmann G, Treutter D, Schwab W, Hoffmann T, Szankowski I (2007) Maize Lc transcription factor enhances biosynthesis of anthocyanins, distinct proanthocyanidins and phenylpropanoids in apple (*Malus domestica* Borkh.). *Planta* **226**:1243-1254

Liu C, Wang X, Shulaev V, Dixon RA (2016) A role for leucoanthocyanidin reductase in the extension of proanthocyanidins. *Nat Plants* **2**: 16182. doi:10.1038/nplants.2016.182.

Lv Y, Gao S, Xu S, Du G, Zhou J, Chen J (2017) Spatial organization of silybin biosynthesis in milk thistle (*Silybum marianum* (L.) Gaertn). *Plant J* **92**: 995-1004

Madritch MD, Lindroth RL (2015) Condensed tannins increase nitrogen recovery by trees following insect defoliation. *New Phytol* **208**: 410-420

Marsh KJ, Wallis IR, Kulheim C, Clark R, Nicolle D, Foley WJ, Salminen JP (2020) New approaches to tannin analysis of leaves can be used to explain in vitro biological activities associated with herbivore defence. *New Phytol* **225**: 488-498

Mellway RD, Tran LT, Prouse MB, Campbell MM, Constabel PC (2009) The wound-, pathogen-, and ultraviolet B-responsive MYB134 gene encodes an R2R3 MYB transcription factor that regulates proanthocyanidin synthesis in poplar. *Plant Physiol* **150**: 924–941

McMahon LR, McAllister TA, Berg BP, Majak W, Acharya SN, Popp JD, Coulman BE, Wang Y, Cheng K-J (2000) A review of the effects of forage condensed tannins on ruminal fermentation and bloat in grazing cattle. *Can J Plant Sci* **80**: 469-485

Mottiar Y, Vanholme R, Boerjan W, Ralph J, Mansfield SD (2016) Designer lignins: harnessing the plasticity of lignification. *Curr Opin Biotechnol* **37**:190–200
Nakayama T, Takahashi S, Waki T (2019) Formation of flavonoid metabolons: functional significance of protein-protein interactions and impact on flavonoid chemodiversity. Front Plant Sci 10: 821

Palo RT (1984) Distribution of birch (Betula spp), willow (Salix spp) and poplar (Populus spp) secondary metabolites and their potential role as chemical defense against herbivores. J Chem Ecol 10: 499-520

Pang Y, Abeysinghe ISB, He J, He X, Huhman D, Mewan KM, Sumner LW, Yun J, Dixon RA (2013) Functional characterization of proanthocyanidin pathway enzymes from tea and their application for metabolic engineering. Plant Physiol 161: 1103-1116

Pang Y, Peel GJ, Sharma SB, Tang Y, Dixon RA (2008) A transcript profiling approach reveals an epicatechin-specific glucosyltransferase expressed in the seed coat of Medicago truncatula. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 105: 14210-14215

Peters DJ, Constabel CP (2002) Molecular analysis of herbivore-induced condensed tannin synthesis: cloning and expression of dihydroflavonol reductase from trembling aspen (Populus tremuloides). Plant J 32:701-712

Pizzi A, and Cameron FA (1986) Flavonoid tannins - structural wood components for drought-resistance mechanisms of plants. Wood Sci Technol 20:119-124

Pourcel L, Routaboul JM, Kerhoas L, Caboche M, Lepiniec L, Debeaujon I. (2005) TRANSPARENT TESTA10 encodes a laccase-like enzyme involved in oxidative polymerization of flavonoids in Arabidopsis seed coat. Plant Cell. 17: 2966-2980

Quinkenstein A, Jochheim H (2016) Assessing the carbon sequestration potential of poplar and black locust short rotation coppices on mine reclamation sites in Eastern Germany – Model development and application. J Environ Management 168: 53-66,
Rauf A, Imran M, Abu-Izneid T, Ul-Haq I, Patel S, Pan X, Naz S, Sanches Silva A, Saeed F, Suleria HAR (2019). Proanthocyanidins: A comprehensive review. Biomed. Pharmacother. 116: 2019, 108999, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biopha.2019.108999.

Sette M, Wechselberger R, Crestini C (2011) Elucidation of lignin structure by quantitative 2D NMR. Chem Eur J 17: 9529-9535

Salminen J-P (2018) Two-dimensional tannin fingerprints by liquid chromatography tandem mass spectrometry offer a new dimension to plant tannin analyses and help to visualize the tannin diversity in plants. J Agric Food Chem 66: 9162–9171

Stafford HA (1983) Enzymic regulation of procyanidin biosynthesis; lack of a flav-3-en-3-ol intermediate. Phytochemistry 22: 2643-2646

Stafford HA (1988) Proanthocyanidins and the lignin connection. Phytochemistry 27: 1-6

Sun H, Liu Y, Gai Y, Geng J, Chen L, Liu H, Kang L, Tian Y, Li Y. (2015) De novo sequencing and analysis of the cranberry fruit transcriptome to identify putative genes involved in flavonoid biosynthesis, transport and regulation. BMC Genomics 16:652. doi: 10.1186/s12864-015-1842-4.

Sun Y, Li H, Huang J-R (2012) Arabidopsis TT19 functions as a carrier to transport anthocyanin from the cytosol to tonoplasts. Mol Plant 5: 387–400

Tanner GJ, Francki KT, Abrahams S, Watson JM, Larkin PJ, Ashton AR (2003) Proanthocyanidin biosynthesis in plants: purification of legume leucoanthocyanidin reductase and cloning of its cDNA. J Biol Chem 278: 31647-31656

Tsai CJ, Harding SA, Tschaplinski TJ, Lindroth RL, Yuan Y (2006). Genome-wide analysis of the structural genes regulating defense phenylpropanoid metabolism in Populus. New Phytol 172: 47–62
Turnbull JJ, Nakajima J-I, Welford RWD, Yamazaki M, Saito K, Schofield CJ (2004)
Mechanistic studies on three 2-oxoglutarate-dependent oxygenases of flavonoid biosynthesis,
ANTHOCYANIDIN SYNTHASE, FLAVONOL SYNTHASE, AND FLAVANONE 3-
HYDROXYLASE. J Biol Chem 279: 1206-1216

Ullah C, Tsai C-J, Unsicker SB, Xue L, Reichelt M, Gershenzon J, Hammerbacher A.
(2019a) Salicylic acid activates poplar defense against the biotrophic rust fungus Melampsora
larici-populina via increased biosynthesis of catechin and proanthocyanidins. New Phytol 221:
960–975

Ullah C, Unsicker, Fellenberg C, Constabel CP, Schmidt A, Gershenzon J, Hammerbacher A (2017). Flavan-3-ols are an effective chemical defense against rust
infection. Plant Physiol 175: 1560–1578

Ullah C, Unsicker SB, Reichelt M, Gershenzon J and Hammerbacher A (2019b)
Accumulation of catechin and proanthocyanidins in black poplar stems after infection by
Plectosphaerella populi: hormonal regulation, biosynthesis and antifungal activity. Front Plant
Sci 10:1441. doi: 10.3389/fpls.2019.01441.

Vio-Michaelis S, Feucht W, Gómez M, Hadersdorfer J, Treutter D, Schwab W (2020)
Histochemical analysis of anthocyanins, carotenoids, and flavan-3-ols/proanthocyanidins in
Prunus domestica L. fruits during ripening. J Agric Food Chem 68: 2880–2890

Waki T, Mameda R, Nakano T, Yamada S, Terashita M, Ito K, Tenma N, Li Y, Fujino N,
Uno K, Yamashita Y, Aoki Y, Denessiouk K, Kawai Y, Sugawara S, Saito K, Yonekura-
Sakakibara K, Morita Y, Hoshino A, Takahashi S, Nakayama T (2020) A conserved
strategy of chalcone isomerase-like protein to rectify promiscuous chalcone synthase
specificity. Nat Commun 11: 870. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-14558-9
Wan, J, Hou B (2009) Glycosyltransferases: key players involved in the modification of plant secondary metabolites. Front. Biol. China 4:39–46

Wang L, Ran L, Hou Y, Tian Q, Li C, Liu R, Fan D, Luo K (2017) The transcription factor MYB115 contributes to the regulation of proanthocyanidin biosynthesis and enhances fungal resistance in poplar. New Phytol 215: 351–367

Wang P, Liu Y, Zhang L, Wang W, Hou H, Zhao Y, Jiang X, Yu J, Tan H, Wang Y, Xie D-Y, Gao L, and Xia T. (2020) Functional demonstration of plant flavonoid carbocations proposed to be involved in the biosynthesis of proanthocyanidins. Plant J 101: 18–36

Wang YS, Xu YJ, Gao LP, Yu O, Wang XZ, He XJ, Jiang XL, Liu YJ, Xia T (2014) Functional analysis of flavonoid 3′,5′-hydroxylase from tea plant (Camellia sinensis): critical role in the accumulation of catechins. BMC Plant Biol 14: 347 doi:10.1186/s12870-014-0347-7

Winder RS, Lamarche J, Constabel CP, Hameli RC (2013) The effects of high-tannin leaf litter from transgenic poplars on microbial communities in microcosm soils. Front Microbiol 4: 290

Xie D-Y, Dixon RA (2005) Proanthocyanidin biosynthesis – still more questions than answers? Phytochemistry 66: 2127–2144

Xie D-Y, Sharma SB, Paiva NL, Ferreira D, Dixon RA (2003) Role of anthocyanidin reductase, encoded by BANYULS, in plant flavonoid biosynthesis. Science 299: 396-399

Xiong J, He J, Xie WP, Hinojosa E, Ambati CSR, Putluri N, Kim H-E, Zhu MX, Du G (2019) Rapid affinity purification of intracellular organelles using a twin strep tag. J Cell Sci 132: jcs235390. doi:10.1242/jcs.235390

Yuan L, Wang L, Han Z, Jiang Y, Zhao L, Liu H, Yang L, Luo K (2012) Molecular cloning and characterization of PtrLAR3, a gene encoding leucoanthocyanidin reductase from Populus
trichocarpa, and its constitutive expression enhances fungal resistance in transgenic plants. J Exp Bot 63: 2513–2524

Zhang W, Zhang Y, Qiu H, Guo Y, Wan H, Zhang X, Scossa F, Alseekh S, Zhang Q, Wang P, Xu L, Schmidt MH-W, Jia X, Li D, Zhu A, Guo F, Chen W, Ni D, Usadel B, Fernie AR, Wen W (2020) Genome assembly of wild tea tree DASZ reveals pedigree and selection history of tea varieties. Nat Commun 11: 3719. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-17498-6

Zhao J, Dixon RA (2009) MATE transporters facilitate vacuolar uptake of epicatechin 3´-O-glucoside for proanthocyanidin biosynthesis. Plant Cell 21: 2323-2340.

Zhuan X, Jiang L (2019) Chloroplast degradation: multiple routes into the vacuole. Front Plant Sci. 26 March 2019. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2019.00359
ADVANCES

• After half a century, the biosynthesis of PAs is largely understood, and recent work suggests that starter and extension units are made by different pathways.

• Conjugates of flavan-3-ols with cysteine and glucose may represent intermediates of PA biosynthesis, detoxification products, or both.

• PA polymerization is a non-enzymatic process in planta, requiring sequestration of reactive/toxic pathway intermediates from cellular components.

• Manipulation of PA content and composition through genetic engineering is facilitating understanding of the ecological functions of PAs.

• Flavonoids act as initiators of lignin polymerization, inspiring the concept of designer PA-lignin complexes as novel biomaterials.

• Poplar is emerging as a useful model system for multiple aspects of PA research, from biochemistry to ecology.
OUTSTANDING QUESTIONS

- Does the product stereoisomer variation of ANR enzymes in vitro have physiological significance?
- Is the biosynthesis of PA starter and extension units spatially or temporally separated?
- Does any portion of PA biosynthesis occur in chloroplasts?
- What is the origin of the vesicles associated with trafficking of PAs to the vacuole, and are they of more than one type with different cargoes?
- What is the role of TT19 in PA biosynthesis; is it associated with extension unit biosynthesis, starter unit biosynthesis, or both?
- What is the role of glycosylation of flavanols in PA biosynthesis, transport, or detoxification?
- What is the best model for studying PA biosynthesis in monocots?
- Does phlobaphene synthesis preclude formation of PAs in maize?
- Can PA-lignin complexes be assembled in planta?
- What are the roles of monomeric PA precursors and oligomeric PAs in ecological systems?
BOX 1. Key Features of PA Synthesis and Trafficking Models

A. THE MODEL BASED ON ARABIDOPSIS AND MEDICAGO BIOCHEMISTRY AND GENETICS.

• PA and anthocyanin precursors are synthesized in metabolons on the cytosolic face of the endoplasmic reticulum.
• Precursors for both PA and anthocyanin pathways are “protected” by the glutathione S-transferase TT19.
• Separation of PA and anthocyanin biosynthesis is likely temporal in cells that make both classes of compounds; TT19 is also involved in anthocyanin biosynthesis.
• PAs polymerize in vesicles during trafficking to the central vacuole.
• The MATE transporter TT12 and associated vacuolar pH ATPase TT13 are required for loading of PA precursors into vacuoles/vesicles.
• Conjugates of PA precursors with cysteine or glucose may represent storage forms of extension and starter units respectively; transport of glucosides to vacuoles requires TT12.
• PA polymerization is likely non-enzymatic, with LAR (when present) regulating chain length through conversion of extension units to starter units.
• PAs ultimately accumulate in tannin accretions as localized regions within the central vacuole

B. THE TANNOSOME MODEL

• PAs are synthesized in chloroplasts, on the outer surface of thylakoid membranes
• The thylakoids pearl into 30-nm spheres (tannosomes), which are then converted into tannosome shuttles through envelopment by a new membrane formed from both thylakoid membranes.
• Tannosome shuttles are incorporated into the vacuole by invagination of the tonoplast.
• PAs ultimately accumulate in tannin accretions as localized regions within the central vacuole

C. COMMON FEATURES BETWEEN THE MODELS

• PAs traffic from their site of synthesis to the central vacuole in vesicle-like structures.
• PAs ultimately accumulate in tannin accretions in the central vacuole.

D. FINDINGS THAT ARE DIFFICULT TO RECONCILE BETWEEN THE TWO MODELS

• The cytosolic localization of ANS, LDOX, ANR, and LAR (there have been some reports that ANS can be found in the chloroplast).
• The localization of the TT19 GST in cytosol and tonoplast.
• The requirement for a tonoplast MATE transporter and proton ATPase for PA accumulation in the vacuole.
• The vesicle accumulation phenotypes of various tt mutants
BOX 2. Evidence of PA Activities in Poplar

- UV protection and antioxidant activity
  - Inferred from both light treatment/response studies and impacts of engineering elevated PA levels.
- Antiherbivore activity
  - Complex. Supported by some studies with unadapted herbivores, but adapted herbivores may show a preference for higher PA levels. Transgenic modification hard to interpret due to off-target effects.
- Antifungal activity
  - Generally supported by in vitro bioassays and genetic (transgenic) gain and loss-of-function experiments for a range of fungal pathogens.
- Nitrogen recycling
  - Leaf litter from transgenic plants with high PA levels improves soil nitrogen retention and subsequent nitrogen recovery after insect-mediated defoliation.
- Impacts on soil microbiome
  - High PA levels in leaf litter do not grossly affect microbiome biodiversity, but do promote some microbial species with consequences for above-ground species diversity.
- Impacts on carbon sequestration
  - Poplar appears to have positive attributes (Quinckenstein and Jochheim, 2016), but contribution of PAs requires further investigation.
|                  | Proanthocyanidins                                                                 | Phlobaphenes                    |
|------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| **Composition**  | Polymers of flavan-3-ol units (e.g. (-)-epicatechin).                             | Polymers of (predominantly) flavan-4-ol units. |
| ![Proanthocyanidins Diagram](image) | ![Phlobaphenes Diagram](image)                                                   |                                |
| **Distribution** | Broad. Monocots, dicot angiosperms and gymnosperms. Found in bark, pericarp, seed coat, leaves, roots. | Broad. Similar to proanthocyanidins |
| **Biological activity** | Anti-oxidant, anti-pathogen, anti-herbivore (sometimes). | Not obvious. |
| **Transcriptional control** | Understood (e.g. Arabidopsis TT2 MYB gene in a ternary complex). | Understood (e.g. p1 MYB gene in maize, y1 MYB gene in sorghum). |
| **Biosynthesis of monomers** | Complex (involves F3H, DFR, ANS, LAR, LDOX, ANR beyond the flavanone step) (See Figure 1B). | Simple (requires only flavanone 4-hydroxylase (F4H) beyond the flavanone step) (Kawakigashi et al., 2016) |
| **Polymerization** | Likely non-enzymatic. Requires attack of an “activated” extension unit at a nucleophilic center on a “lower” unit. Results in 4-8 and 4-6 linkages. | Not understood. Likely non-enzymatic. Polymers may contain additional components. Linkage types unclear. |
Figure 1. Biosynthetic pathways to the starter and extension units of proanthocyanidins. A, Structures and labeling patterns of 4→8-linked procyanidin dimers. Procyanidins B1-B4 represent the four possible combinations arising from dimerization of 2,3-cis-(−)-epicatechin and 2,3-trans-(+)-catechin, with procyanidins B2 and B3 being the homodimers of epicatechin and catechin, respectively. The % values represent the approximate % of known structures with that particular unit as starter (lower) or extension (upper) unit. The large black arrows signify radiolabel incorporation from trans-cinnamic acid; the upper units incorporate 3-5 times more label than the lower units, and labeled epicatechin labels lower units only in procyanidin B2. B, Scheme for separate origins of starter and extension units in plants with the LDOX/LAR pathway. Green highlighting indicates potential extension units, and the central green box shows the reactive species thus derived (carbocation and quinone methide) and the nucleophiles that can trap them (light blue ovals). Flav-2-en-3,4-diol is proposed as a potential substrate for generation of 2,3-cis-leucocyanidin for epicatechin extension units. In species that possess LAR, expression of this enzyme can determine chain length by converting Epi-cys (extension unit) to epicatechin (starter unit). Brown highlighting indicates starter units. Enzymes are: CHS, chalcone synthase; CHI, chalcone isomerase; F3′H and F3H, flavonoid 3′- and 3-hydroxylase; FLS, flavonol synthase; DFR, dihydroflavonol reductase; ANS, anthocyanidin synthase; ANR, anthocyanidin reductase; UDP-GT, uridine diphosphate glycosyltransferase; LAR, leucoanthocyanidin reductase; LDOX, leucoanthocyanidin dioxygenase. Not all species (e.g. Arabidopsis) possess the LAR/LDOX route to epicatechin starter units.
Figure 2. Hypothetical scheme for the sequestration of starter and extension units during PA biosynthesis in *Medicago truncatula*. The model proposes that reactions specific for starter unit formation from LAR occur on freely soluble enzymes, whereas those associated with extension unit formation occur through a hypothetical metabolon associated with a sub-domain of the endoplasmic reticulum (ER) with tethering through the membrane anchor of the F3’H cytochrome P450 enzyme. The products of these reactions (leucoanthocyanidins) are “captured” and protected by the TT19 GST, including through formation of Epi-cys from 2,3-cis-leucocyanidin. The TT19 complex interacts with vesicles loaded with starter units through the combined activities of a UGT, the MATE transporter TT12, and the proton APTase TT13 (also known as AHA10). Localization of TT19 to the tonoplast may indicates tight association with PA extension units until they are safely loaded into vesicles harboring starter units. Fusion of the structures containing starter and extension units allows non-enzymatic condensation to form PA dimers and higher oligomers during migration of the pre-vacuolar vesicles to ultimately fuse with the central vacuole, where they are finally deposited as tannin accretions. Enzymes, represented by small circles, are as in the legend to Figure 1B, plus C4H, cinnamate 4-hydroxylase. Enzymes and structures circled in green are associated with extension unit formation, in brown with starter unit formation. This model assumes existence of soluble and insoluble forms of DFR, but other spatial or even temporal controls could allow for separation of the pathways.

L-Phe: L-Phenylalanine, C4H: Cinnamate 4-hydroxylase, DFR: Dihydroflavonol 4-reductase, F3’H: Catechol 3’-hydroxylase, LAR: Luteolin 4’-reductase, LDOX: Leucoanthocyanidin dioxygenase, ANR: Anthocyanidin reductase, ANS: Anthocyanidin synthase, UGT: Uridine diphosphate glucuronosyltransferase, GST: Glutathione S-transferase, TMS: Transmembrane signaling proteins, MATE: Monoamine transporter, AHA: Acid homologous, TT12, TT13: Iron-sulfur protein.
Figure 3. Flavonoids that form linkages to monolignols or lignin. See text for details.
A damczyk B, Heinonsalo J, Simon, J (2020) Mechanisms of carbon sequestration in highly organic ecosystems – importance of chemical ecology. Chem. Open 9: 464–469

Appelhagen I, Nordholt N, Seidel T, Spelt K, Koes R, Quattrocchio F, Sagasser M, Weisshaar B (2015) TRANSFER TESTA 13 is a tonoplast P3A-ATPase required for vacuolar deposition of proanthocyanidins in Arabidopsis thaliana seeds. Plant J 82: 840-849

Barbehenn RV, Con stabel CP (2011) Tannins in plant-herbivore interactions. Phytochemistry 72: 1551-1565

Bayraktara EC, Baudriera L, Özerdem a C, Lewis CA, Chanb SH, Kunchok T, Abu-Remaileh M, Cangelosi AL, David M. Sabatini DM, Birsoya K, Chen WW (2019) MITO-Tag mice enable rapid isolation and multimodal profiling of mitochondria from specific cell types in vivo. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 116: 303–312

Berstis L, Elder T, Dixon RA, Crowley M, Beckham GT (2020) Coupling of flavonoid nucleation sites with monolignols studied by density functional theory. ACS Green Chem, in review

Bewg WP, Ci D, Tsai C-J (2018) Genome editing in trees: from multiple repair pathways to long-term stability. Front Plant Sci 9: 1732

Boeckler GA, Towns M, Unsicker SB, Mellway RD, Yip L, Hilk e I, Gershenzon J, Con stabel CP (2014) Transgenic upregulation of the condensed tannin pathway in poplar leads to a dramatic shift in leaf palatability for two tree-feeding Lepidoptera. J Chem Ecol Feb 2014: DOI 10.1007/s10886-014-0383-7

Brillouet J-M (2014) Plasticity of the tannosome ontogenesis in the Tracheophyta. J Plant Sci 2: 317-323

Brillouet J-M (2015) On the role of chloroplasts in the polymerization of tannins in Tracheophyta: A monograph. Am J Plant Sci 6: 1401-1409

Brillouet J-M, Romieu C, Lartaud M, Jublanc E, Torregrosa T, Cazeveille C (2014a) Formation of vacuolar tannin deposits in the chlorophyllous organs of Tracheophyta: from shuttles to accretions. Protoplasma 2014: DOI 10.1007/s00709-014-0640-1

Brillouet J-M, Romieu C, Schoefs B, Solymosi K, Cheynier V, Fulcrand H, Verdel J-L, Cone´je´ro G. (2014b) The tannosome is an organelle forming condensed tannins in the chlorophyllous organs of Tracheophyta. Ann Bot 2014: 1-12. doi:10.1093/aob/mct168

Carrier C, Huang Y-F, Le Cunff L, Fournier-Level A, Vialet S, Souquet J-M, Cheynier V, Terrier N, This, P (2013) Selection of candidate genes for grape proanthocyanidin pathway by an integrative approach. Plant Physiol Biochem 72: 87-95

Chhetri HB, Macaya-Sanz D, Kainer D, Biswal AK, Evans LM, Chen JG, Collins C, Hunt K, Mohanty SS, Rosenstiel T, Ryno D, Wnkeler K, Yang X, Jacobson D, Mohnen D, Muchero W, Strauss SH, Tschaplinski,TJ, Tuskan GA, DiFazio SP (2019) Multitrait genome-wide association analysis of Populus trichocarpa identifies key polymorphisms controlling morphological and physiological traits. New Phyto 223: 293-309

de Crécy-Lagard V, Haas D, Hanson AD (2018). Newly-discovered enzymes that function in metabolite damage-control. Curr Opin Chem Biol 47:101-108
transcription factor Ta-MYB14 from Trifolium arvense activates proanthocyanidin biosynthesis in the legumes Trifolium repens and Medicago sativa. Plant Physiol 159: 1204–1220

Hamad MA, Ates S, Olgun C, Gür M (2019) Chemical composition and antioxidant properties of some industrial tree bark extracts. BioRes 14: 5657-5671

Harding SA (2019) Condensed tannins: arbiters of abiotic stress tolerance. Tree Physiol 39: 341–344

Haslam E, Opie CT, Porter LJ (1977) Procyanidin metabolism-a hypothesis. Phytochemistry 16: 99-102

Hjältén J, Axelsson E P (2015) GM trees with increased resistance to herbivores: trait efficiency and their potential to promote tree growth. Front Plant Sci 6:279.

Hosoda K, Sasahara H, Matsushita K, Tamura Y, Miyaji M, Matsuyama H (2018) Anthocyanin and proanthocyanidin contents, antioxidant activity, and in situ degradability of black and red rice grains. Asian-Australas J Anim Sci. 31:1213-1220

Huang YF, Doligez A, Fournier-Level A, Le Cunff L, Veran F, Souquet JM, Cheynier V, Terrier N, This P (2012) Dissecting genetic architecture of grape proanthocyanidin composition through quantitative trait locus mapping. BMC Plant Biol 27: 12-30.

Jacques D, Haslam E (1974) Biosynthesis of plant proanthocyanidins. J Chem Soc Chem Commun 1974: 231-232

James AM, Ma D, Mollway R, Gesell A, Yoshida K, Walker V, Tran L, Stewart D, Reichelt M, Suvanto J, Salminen J-P, Gershenzon J, Séguin A, and Constabel CP (2017) Poplar MYB115 and MYB134 transcription factors regulate proanthocyanidin synthesis and structure. Plant Physiol 174: 154–171

Jun JH, Xiao X, Rao X, Dixon RA (2018). Proanthocyanidin subunit composition determined by functionally differentiated dioxygenases. Nat Plants 4: 1034–1043

Kawahigashi H, Kasuga S, Sawada Y, Yonemaru J-I, Ando A, Kananomi H, Wu J, Mizuno H, Momma M, Fujimoto Z, Hirai MY, Matsumoto T (2016) The sorghum gene for leaf color changes upon wounding (P) encodes a flavanone 4-reductase in the 3-deoxyanthocyanidin biosynthesis pathway. G3 2016:1439-1447, https://doi.org/10.1534/g3.115.026104

Kinyon MJ, Bonnet S, Noté OP, Mbing JN, Kamto EL, Van der Westhuizen JH, Pegneyemb DE (2017) A new flavanolignan and a new alkane from the stem bark of Newtonia griffoniana,

Kitamura S, Matsuda F, Tohge T, Yonekura-Sakakibara K, Yamazaki M, Saito K, Narumi I (2010) Metabolic profiling and cytological analysis of proanthocyanidins in immature seeds of Arabidopsis thaliana flavonoid accumulation mutants. Plant J 62: 549–559

Koyama K, Numata M, Nakajima I, Goto-Yamamoto N, Matsumura H, Tanaka N. (2014) Functional characterization of a new grapevine MYB transcription factor and regulation of proanthocyanidin biosynthesis in grapes. J Exp Bot 65:4433-4449

Krych J, Gebicka L (2013) Catalase is inhibited by flavonoids. Int J Biol Macromol 58:148–153.

Lam PY, Tobimatsu Y, Takeda Y, Suzuki S, Yamasaki T, Ito M, Kondoh T, Inoue T, Ogasawara T, Ito C (2017) Disrupting flavone synthase II alters lignin and
improves biomass digestibility. Plant Physiol 174: 972–985

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Lan W, Lu F, Regner M, Zhu Y, Rencoret J, Ralph SA, Zakai UI, Morreel K, Boerjan W, Ralph J (2015) Tricin, a flavonoid monomer in monocot lignification. Plant Physiology 167: 1284–1295

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Liang M, Davis E, Gardner D, Cai X, Wu Y (2006) Involvement of AtLAC15 in lignin synthesis in seeds and in root elongation of Arabidopsis. Planta 224:1185-1196.

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Li H, Flachowsky H, Fischer TC, Hanke MV, Forkmann G, Treutter D, Schwab W, Hoffmann T, Szankowski I (2007) Maize Lc transcription factor enhances biosynthesis of anthocyanins, distinct proanthocyanidins and phenylpropanoids in apple (Malus domestica Borkh.). Planta 226:1243-1254

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Liu C, Wang X, Shulaev V, Dixon RA (2016) A role for leucoanthocyanidin reductase in the extension of proanthocyanidins. Nat Plants 2: 16182. doi:10.1038/nplants.2016.182.

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Lv Y, Gao S, Xu S, Du G, Zhou J, Chen J (2017) Spatial organization of silybin biosynthesis in milk thistle [Silybum marianum (L.) Gaertn]. Plant J 92: 995-1004

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Madritch MD, Lindroth RL (2015) Condensed tannins increase nitrogen recovery by trees following insect defoliation. New Phytol 208: 410-420

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Marsh KJ, Wallis IR, Kulheim C, Clark R, Nicolle D, Foley WJ, Salminen JP (2020) New approaches to tannin analysis of leaves can be used to explain in vitro biological activities associated with herbivore defence. New Phytol 225: 488-498

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Mellway RD, Tran LT, Prouse MB, Campbell MM, Constabel PC (2009) The wound-, pathogen-, and ultraviolet B-responsive MYB134 gene encodes an R2R3 MYB transcription factor that regulates proanthocyanidin synthesis in poplar. Plant Physiol 150: 924–941

McMahon LR, McAllister TA, Berg BP, Majak W, Acharya SN, Popp JD, Coulman BE, Wang Y, Cheng K-J (2000) A review of the effects of forage condensed tannins on ruminal fermentation and bloat in grazing cattle. Can J Plant Sci 80: 469-485

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Mottiar Y, Vanholme R, Boerjan W, Ralph J, Mansfield SD (2016) Designer lignins: harnessing the plasticity of lignification. Curr Opin Biotechnol 37:190–200

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Nakayama T, Takahashi S, Waki T (2019) Formation of flavonoid metabolons: functional significance of protein-protein interactions and impact on flavonoid chemodiversity. Front Plant Sci 10: 821

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Palo RT (1984) Distribution of birch (Betula spp), willow (Salix spp) and poplar (Populus spp) secondary metabolites and their potential role as chemical defense against herbivores. J Chem Ecol 10: 499-520

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Pang Y, Abeysinghe ISB, He J, He X, Huhman D, Mewan KM, Sumner LW, Yun J, Dixon RA (2013) Functional characterization of proanthocyanidin pathway enzymes from tea and their application for metabolic engineering. Plant Physiol 161: 1103-1116

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title

Pang Y, Peel GJ, Sharma SB, Tang Y, Dixon RA (2008) A transcript profiling approach reveals an epicatechin-specific glucosyltransferase expressed in the seed coat of Medicago truncatula. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 105: 14210-14215

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only, Title Only, Author and Title
Peters DJ, Constabel CP (2002) Molecular analysis of herbivore-induced condensed tannin synthesis: cloning and expression of dihydroflavonol reductase from trembling aspen (Populus tremuloides). Plant J 32:701-712

Pizzi A, and Cameron FA (1986) Flavonoid tannins - structural wood components for drought-resistance mechanisms of plants. Wood Sci Technol 20:119-124

Pourcel L, Routaboul JM, Kerhoas L, Caboche M, Lepiniec L, Debeaujon I. (2005) TRANSPARENT TESTA10 encodes a laccase-like enzyme involved in oxidative polymerization of flavonoids in Arabidopsis seed coat. Plant Cell. 17: 2966-2980

Pourcel L, Routaboul JM, Kerhoas L, Caboche M, Lepiniec L, Debeaujon I. (2005) TRANSPARENT TESTA10 encodes a laccase-like enzyme involved in oxidative polymerization of flavonoids in Arabidopsis seed coat. Plant Cell. 17: 2966-2980

Quinkenstein A, Jochheim H (2016) Assessing the carbon sequestration potential of poplar and black locust short rotation coppices on mine reclamation sites in Eastern Germany – Model development and application. J Environ Management 168: 53-66

Rauf A, Imam M, Abu-Izneid T, Ul-Haq I, Patel S, Pan X, Naz S, Sanches Silva A, Saeed F, Suleria HAR (2019). Proanthocyanidins: A comprehensive review. Biomed. Pharmacother.

Salmiinen J-P (2018) Two-dimensional tannin fingerprints by liquid chromatography tandem mass spectrometry offer a new dimension to plant tannin analyses and help to visualize the tannin diversity in plants. J Agric Food Chem 66: 9162–9171

Stafford HA (1983) Enzymic regulation of procyanidin biosynthesis; lack of a flav-3-en-3-ol intermediate. Phytochemistry 22: 2643-2646

Stafford HA (1988) Proanthocyanidins and the lignin connection. Phytochemistry 27: 1-6

Sun H, Liu Y, Gai Y, Geng J, Chen L, Liu H, Kang L, Tian Y, Li Y. (2015) De novo sequencing and analysis of the cranberry fruit transcriptome to identify putative genes involved in flavonoid biosynthesis, transport and regulation. BMC Genomics 16:652. doi: 10.1186/s12864-015-1842-4.

Sun Y, Li H, Huang J-R (2012) Arabidopsis TT19 functions as a carrier to transport anthocyanin from the cytosol to tonoplasts. Mol Plant 5: 387–400

Tanner GJ, Francki KT, Abrahams S, Watson JM, Larkin PJ, Ashton AR (2003) Proanthocyanidin biosynthesis in plants: purification of legume leucoanthocyanidin reductase and cloning of its cDNA. J Biol Chem 278: 31647-31656

Tsai CJ, Harding SA, Tschaplinski TJ, Lindroth RL, Yuan Y (2006). Genome-wide analysis of the structural genes regulating defense phenylpropanoid metabolism in Populus. New Phytol 172: 47–62

Turnbull JJ, Nakajima J-L, Welford RWD, Yamazaki M, Saito K, Schofield CJ (2004) Mechanistic studies on three 2-oxoglutarate-dependent oxygenases of flavonoid biosynthesis, ANTHOCYANIDIN SYNTHASE, FLAVONOL SYNTHASE, AND FLAVANONE 3-HYDROXYLASE. J Biol Chem 279: 1206-1216

Ullah C, Tsai C-J, Unsicker SB, Xue L, Reichelt M, Gershenzon J, Hammerbacher A. (2019a) Salicylic acid activates poplar defense against the biotrophic rust fungus Melampsoripanicola via increased biosynthesis of catechin and proanthocyanidins. New Phytol. 224: 77-90.
Ullah C, Unsicker, Fellenberg C, Constabel CP, Schmidt A, Gershenzon J, Hammerbacher A (2017). Flavan-3-ols are an effective chemical defense against rust infection. Plant Physiol 175: 1560–1578

Ullah C, Unsicker SB, Reichelt M, Gershenzon J and Hammerbacher A (2019b) Accumulation of catechin and proanthocyanidins in black poplar stems after infection by Plectosphaerella populi: hormonal regulation, biosynthesis and antifungal activity. Front Plant Sci 10:1441. doi: 10.3389/fpls.2019.01441.

Vio-Michaelis S, Feucht W, Gómez M, Hadersdorfer J, Treutter D, Schwab W (2020) Histochemical analysis of anthocyanins, carotenoids, and flavan-3-ols/proanthocyanidins in Prunus domestica L. fruits during ripening. J Agric Food Chem 68: 2880–2890

Waki T, Mamede R, Nakano T, Yamada S, Terashita M, Ito K, Tenma N, Li Y, Fujino N, Uno K, Yamashita Y, Aoki Y, Denessiouk K, Kawai Y, Sugawara S, Saito K, Yonekura-Sakakibara K, Morita Y, Hoshino A, Takahashi S, Nakayama T (2020) A conserved strategy of chalcone isomerase-like protein to rectify promiscuous chalcone synthase specificity. Nat Commun 11: 870. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-14558-9

Wan, J, Hou B (2009) Glycosyltransferases: key players involved in the modification of plant secondary metabolites. Front. Biol. China 4:39–46

Wang L, Ran L, Hou Y, Tian Q, Li C, Liu R, Fan D, Luo K (2017) The transcription factor MYB115 contributes to the regulation of proanthocyanidin biosynthesis and enhances fungal resistance in poplar. New Phytol 215: 351–367

Wang P, Liu Y, Zhang L, Wang W, Hou H, Zhao Y, Jiang X, Yu J, Tan H, Wang Y, Xie D-Y, Gao L, and Xia T. (2020) Functional demonstration of plant flavonoid carbocations proposed to be involved in the biosynthesis of proanthocyanidins. Plant J 101: 18-36

Xie D-Y, Dixon RA (2005) Proanthocyanidin biosynthesis – still more questions than answers? Phytochemistry 66: 2127–2144

Xie D-Y, Sharma SB, Paiva NL, Ferreira D, Dixon RA (2003) Role of anthocyanidin reductase, encoded by BANYULS, in plant flavonoid biosynthesis. Science 299: 396-399

Xiong J, He J, Xie WP, Hinojosa E, Ambati CSR, Putturi N, Kim H-E, Zhu MX, Du G (2019) Rapid affinity purification of intracellular organelles using a twin strep tag. J Cell Sci 132: jcs235390. doi:10.1242/jcs.235390

Yuan L, Wang L, Han Z, Jiang Y, Zhao L, Liu H, Yang L, Luo K (2012) Molecular cloning and characterization of PtrLR3, a gene encoding leucoanthocyanidin reductase from Populus trichocarpa, and its constitutive expression enhances fungal resistance in transgenic plants. J Exp Bot 63: 2513–2524

Zhang W, Zhang Y, Qiu H, Guo Y, Wan H, Zhang X, Scossa F, Alseekh S, Zhang Q, Wang P, Xu L, Schmidt MH-W, Jia X, Li D, Zhu A, Guo F, Chen W, Ni D, Usadel B, Fernie AR, Wen W (2020) Genome assembly of wild tea tree DASZ reveals pedigree and selection history of tea varieties. Nat Commun 11: 3719. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-17498-6
Zhao J, Dixon RA (2009) MATE transporters facilitate vacuolar uptake of epicatechin 3'-O-glucoside for proanthocyanidin biosynthesis. Plant Cell 21: 2323-2340.

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only Title Only Author and Title

Zhuang X, Jiang L (2019) Chloroplast degradation: multiple routes into the vacuole. Front Plant Sci. 26 March 2019. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2019.00359

Pubmed: Author and Title
Google Scholar: Author Only Title Only Author and Title