Enzyme biotechnology development for treating polymers in hydraulic fracturing operations

Gabrielle Scheffer, 1 Carolina Berdugo-Clavijo, 1 Arindom Sen 2 and Lisa M. Gieg 1
1 Department of Biological Sciences, University of Calgary, Calgary, AB, Canada.
2 Department of Chemical and Petroleum Engineering, Schulich School of Engineering, University of Calgary, Calgary, AB, Canada.

Summary

Carboxymethyl cellulose (CMC) is a polymer used in many different industrial sectors. In the oil and gas industry, CMC is often used during hydraulic fracturing (fracking) operations as a thickening agent for effective proppant delivery. Accumulations of CMC at fracture faces (known as filter cakes) can impede oil and gas recovery. Although chemical oxidizers are added to disrupt these accumulations, there is industrial interest in developing alternative, enzyme-based treatments. Little is known about CMC biodegradation under fracking conditions. Here, we enriched a methanogenic CMC-degrading culture and demonstrated its ability to enzymatically utilize CMC under the conditions that typify oil fields. Using the extracellular enzyme fraction from the culture, significant CMC viscosity reduction was observed between 50 and 80°C, at salinities up to 20% (w/v) and at pH 5–8 compared to controls. Similar levels of viscosity reduction by extracellular enzymes were observed under oxic and anoxic conditions. This proof-of-concept study demonstrates that enzyme biotechnology holds great promise as a viable approach to treating CMC filter cakes under oilfield conditions.

Introduction

Cellulose is a versatile polymer that is widely used for a variety of applications in multiple sectors including in the food, pharmaceutical, biomedical and alternative energy (e.g. biofuel) industries (Lavanya et al., 2011; Weiner and Kotkoskie, 1999). Cellulose is insoluble in water due to the strong inter- and intramolecular interactions of the hydrogen bonds between the polymer chains (Hinterstoisser and Salmén, 1999). Many chemical modifications of cellulose have been investigated for their abilities to create new cellulose derivatives with properties suitable for different industrial applications (Lavanya et al., 2011). One of these cellulose derivatives is carboxymethyl cellulose (CMC), a polymer wherein the hydroxyl groups on the glucopyranose units of cellulose are randomly replaced by carboxymethyl groups that render CMC water-soluble and more chemically reactive (Lavanya et al., 2011).

In the oil and gas industry, CMC is used as a gelling or thickening agent (also known as a viscosifier) that is added to water-based fracturing fluids to optimize proppant delivery into fractures created during hydraulic fracturing processes to keep the fissures open (Harris, 1988; Fink, 2013; Barbati et al., 2016). Over the years, different types of gelling agents, including guar gum and CMC, have been used by the energy industry depending on their availability and market pricing (Fink, 2013; Azizov et al., 2015). A recent study highlighted the sustainability of using CMC as the polymer of choice (compared to guar gum, for example) to deliver proppant to the fractures (Azizov et al., 2015). CMC has also been proven to be an effective substitute to guar gum in fractured wells due to its better stability at high temperature (up to 90°C), a better regain of conductivity after its degradation, and for superior proppant suspension (Aliu, 2017).

Though useful as gelling agents, polymers such as CMC can accumulate on the face of a rock fracture, eventually creating a filter cake that can impede oil and gas flow, thus reducing recovery if left untreated (Prud’homme and Wang, 1993). One subsurface phenomenon leading to filter cake formation is leakoff, wherein water from the fracturing fluid adsorbs into the surrounding rock matrix. This process can shear the polymer into smaller molecular weight molecules, allowing them to absorb partially into the rock and also allowing for polymer accumulation at the rock surface, resulting in fracture face blockage (Charoenwongsa et al., 2013).

The hydraulic fracturing industry frequently relies on chemical oxidizers to degrade filter cakes (Smith and Montgomery, 2015). Although highly efficient, the use of
chemical oxidizers has several drawbacks. First, the addition of oxidizers can be coupled with the addition of acids such as hydrochloric acid which can lead to corrosion of oilfield equipment (Freeman et al., 2005). Second, oxidizers do not react with specific substrates, potentially leading to undesirable reactions such as with iron to create equipment-damaging iron oxides (Chopade et al., 2015; Freeman et al., 2005). Third, high concentrations of chemical oxidizers are necessary to ensure treatment efficacy, and these high chemical concentrations are poorly soluble in solution (Chopade et al., 2015; Freeman et al., 2005).

These potential drawbacks can be addressed by using enzymes as biotechnological replacements for chemical oxidizers during the filter cake removal process. Enzymes do not require the addition of strong acids to be efficient, therefore minimizing corrosion. Also, they are highly specific and will react only with the substrate in question. Enzymes are highly active, and thus, significantly smaller quantities are required compared to chemical oxidizers for comparable levels of filter cake removal (Chopade et al., 2015; Freeman et al., 2005; Gupta and Prasek, 1995). The enzymatic treatment of guar gum-based filter cakes has found success in the hydraulic fracturing industry (Politz et al., 2000).

Cellulose (and related derivatives such as CMC) is hydrolysed by three different enzymes: (i) endo-\(\beta\)-1,4-glucanase, (ii) exo-\(\beta\)-1,4-glucanase and (iii) \(\beta\)-1,4-glucosidase (Fig. 1). The endoglucanase randomly hydrolyses the backbone of the polymer, resulting in the formation of cellobiose, cellotriose and other oligomers. The rapid decrease in polymer chain length is responsible for the concurrent reduction in viscosity observed in these systems (Martinez-Richa, 1998; Walker and Wilson, 2003). The exoglucanase hydrolyses the ends of the oligomer polymer chains, resulting in the formation of cellobiose, which can then be further hydrolysed by the \(\beta\)-1,4-glucosidase to form glucose (Walker and Wilson, 2003).

Although cellulose metabolism has been widely studied in the context of biofuel production (Brown, 2015; Yang et al., 2015; Lusk et al., 2017), and enzymes targeting other gelling agents (guar gum) have been developed (Tjon-Joe-Pin, 1993; Cheng and Prud'homme, 2000; Politz et al., 2000; You et al., 2016), little information exists for the breakdown of CMC in the context of filter cake removal. As hydraulic fracturing is widely used for oil and gas recovery from tight subsurface reservoirs, and CMC can be used as a gelling agent in this process (Trabelsi and Kakadjian, 2013; Azizov et al., 2015), we aimed here to develop an enzyme-based solution for treating CMC filter cakes that may form during hydraulic fracturing. Following the establishment of a CMC-degrading microbial consortium and confirmation of its enzymatic activity, we tested the properties of the CMC-utilizing enzymes under different pH, temperature and...
salinity conditions that can characterize produced oilfield fluids associated with hydraulic fracturing operations. This proof-of-concept study shows strong potential for the use of enzyme-based breaker technology to treat CMC filter cakes.

Results and discussion

CMC-degrading methanogenic enrichment

After testing the different environmental inocula and isolates for their ability to metabolize CMC as a sole carbon source under oxic and/or anoxic conditions at 50°C, the methanogenic cattle-manure enrichment showed the most significant degradation of CMC in the shortest amount of time compared to sterile and CMC-free controls (results not shown). For this reason, this enrichment culture was selected for all further work described herein to study the degradation of CMC under thermophilic conditions and to characterize enzymatic activity.

Due to the presence of numerous carbon sources presumed to be present in the initial manure sample, seven successive transfers were required to establish a methanogenic microbial community wherein CMC was the sole carbon source. CMC-utilizing cultures were established under methanogenic conditions because deep subsurface oil and gas reservoirs are anoxic and dominated by methanogenic microbial communities (Head et al., 2014); thus, developing enzyme technology that can be applied under these conditions was crucial. Manure was chosen as the environmental source for establishing the CMC-degrading culture because there is a known symbiotic activity between cellulose degraders and methanogens in cattle rumen (Hook et al., 2010) and, hence, in manure. The initial culture, where manure was added directly to minimal medium, reached its maximum methane production after 8 days with a production of 4862 μM CH₄ (Fig. S1). The corresponding CMC-free control also showed high initial methane values, reaching 2387 μM CH₄, suggesting the methanogenic conversion of other carbon sources present in the initial inoculum. Following the seven transfers, methane production was no longer evident from the CMC-free controls compared to the CMC-amended enrichment which produced 155.5 ± 9.2 μM CH₄ after 70 days of incubation. Stoichiometric predictions using the Buswell equation (Symons and Buswell, 1933) showed that 7.3% of CMC was converted to methane as one of the products formed during CMC hydrolysis. This calculation was done using the molecular weight value of CMC from a commercially available source (Sigma-Aldrich, Oakville, ON, Canada) since the molecular weight of the industrially sourced CMC could not be divulged for confidentiality reasons. A study done by Miller et al. (2002) showed that cellulose addition to cattle manure enrichments resulted in a high production of volatile fatty acids in addition to methane. In our methanogenic consortium, we speculate that CMC degradation resulted in similar products, with only a small amount of the CMC carbon being converted to methane by methanogens. Regardless of the products formed by the methanogenic community, significant viscosity reduction was observed compared to sterile controls, suggesting a high level of CMC hydrolysis (see results below).

Once a CMC-degrading culture was established, several tests were done to definitively demonstrate CMC biodegradation and enzyme activity by the culture. Trypan blue staining was first carried out to indicate CMC hydrolysis. Within the first 6 days of incubation of the CMC-degrading culture, cultures changed from a dark purple/blue colour to completely clear, while sterile and CMC-free controls remained stained (Fig. S2). The control results indicated that Trypan blue was not abiotically degraded and that the microbial community was not metabolizing the Trypan blue itself, suggesting that all observed colour changes were due solely to enzymatic CMC hydrolysis. Thus, this staining result indicated that the culture hydrolysed CMC within 6 days to form smaller intermediates.

As a second line of evidence for CMC metabolism by the enrichment culture, enzyme activities for the endo-, exo-β-1,4-glucanases and β-1,4-glucosidases were measured using p-4-nitrophenyl-β-D-cellobioside, known as pNPC (for glucanases), and p-4-nitrophosphoryl-β-D-glucopyranoside, known as pPNG (for glucosidase) assays. Even though cultures were incubated under methanogenic conditions, our preliminary assay showed similar enzyme activity under oxic and anoxic conditions therefore, these assays were done on the bench in the presence of air. As shown in Fig. 2, the highest observed glucanase activity (0.34 ± 0.17 U ml⁻¹) was recorded within the initial 2 days of incubation. This result was expected as glucanases act directly on the CMC backbone (Fig. 1) to form smaller carbohydrate chains, including cellobiose, that can then be further hydrolysed by β-1,4-glucosidase. The enzymatic activity for the β-1,4-glucosidases was at its highest activity later in the incubation, reaching 0.95 ± 0.13 U ml⁻¹ after 28 days. By this point, most of the CMC has been hydrolysed to cellobiose and other products, explaining why the β-1,4-glucosidases are active later in the CMC degradation process (Fig. 1). These enzyme activities are similar to those reported in the literature for Clostridium (Tuka et al., 1990; Benoit et al., 1995), a member of the Firmicutes related to Ruminococcaceae which was the dominant family found in the enrichment (see Fig. 4).

Finally, viscosity measurements were performed to indicate the activity of the endo-β-1,4-glucanase. This enzyme, which randomly hydrolyses internal β-1,4 bonds...
between the glucose monomers in the CMC backbone (Fig. 1), is the key enzyme responsible for reducing CMC solution viscosity. Previous research has noted that the direct relationship between substrate hydrolysis rate, enzyme activity and polymer chain size can explain viscosity reduction, a key parameter that can be used to assess the success of a filter cake breaker (Martinez-Richa, 1998).

Initial viscosity measurements showed that the CMC-degrading culture amended with 0.5% CMC reached 7.36 ± 2.17 cP at 75 rpm (Fig. 3). Within 4 days of incubation, viscosity dropped to 2.98 ± 0.55 cP. After 14 days, the viscosity reached its lowest value at 1.86 ± 0.21 cP, staying around this value until the end of the experiment (77 days) and nearing the viscosity value for cultures incubated in the absence of CMC. By comparison, the viscosity did not significantly decrease in the sterile controls over time (Fig. 3). These viscosity measurements thus confirmed the Trypan blue test and the enzyme assays showing CMC degradation by the enrichment culture.

Microbial community analysis

Figure 4 shows the results from 16S rRNA gene sequencing of the initially established culture and the final enrichment after seven transfers wherein CMC was present as the only carbon and energy source for the methanogenic community. The initial culture was composed of 17 different families at >1% amplicon sequence variant (ASV) and 10.2% of the ASV were of <1% relative abundance, showing greater diversity than the established culture using CMC as a sole carbon source. After seven transfers, the enrichment culture cultivated solely on CMC became less diverse. The established culture was comprised of seven families, and only 2.4% ASV were of <1% relative abundance. The enriched culture was dominated by methanogenic archaea (Methanomicrobiaceae and Methanosarcinaceae at 51.1% and 2.2% relative abundance, respectively) that were presumably responsible for the observed methane production, along with several bacterial taxa known to be associated with the degradation of cellulose and/or its metabolites, including (in % relative abundance) Ruminococcaceae (29.4%), Solibacteraceae (7.8%), Thermoanaerobacteraceae (1.8%), Caldicoprobacteraceae (1.7%) and Limnochordaceae (0.5%) (Fig. 4). Members of the Ruminococcaceae family are well known for their ability to ferment cellulose or its by-products (Flint et al., 2012) as are members of the Caldicoprobacteraceae and Limnochordaceae families (Watanabe et al., 2015; Lusk et al., 2017). Thus, one or
more of these taxa were presumably involved in the initial hydrolysis of CMC. Members of the *Thermoanaerobacteraceae* are thermophilic anaerobic bacteria known to ferment cellobiose, glucose and other small compounds, but not cellulose (Kim *et al.*, 2001), and thus, likely utilized the smaller CMC degradation products.
of these taxa are affiliated within the Firmicutes, a phy-
lum primarily composed of endospore-forming anaerobic
bacteria. Interestingly, the second most dominant bacte-
rial taxon in the CMC enrichment culture is affi-
liated with

the Solibacteraceae

family (7.75% ASV), within the phy-
lum Acidobacteria. To date, there is only one isolate cul-
tured from the Solibacteraceae, known as ‘Candidatus

Solibacter usitatus’ Ellin6076 (Ward et al., 2009). Gen-
ome analysis of this isolate showed that it harbours genes for cellulose metabolism (Ward et al., 2009); thus,
members of the Solibacteraceae family may also be involved in CMC hydrolysis. Overall, the microbial com-

munity composition of the CMC-degrading methanogenic
enrichment reflects that which would be expected for the
anaerobic digestion of polymers such as cellulose or
CMC in that it is composed of cellulose degraders, glu-
cose and small molecule fermenters and methanogens (Zieminski and Frac, 2012).

**Enzyme efficacy from different cell fractions**

Different cell fractions from the CMC-degrading enrich-
ment culture were obtained in order to pinpoint the loca-
tion of the greatest CMC-degrading enzymatic activity.
Figure 5 shows the viscosity measurements taken during
incubation of 2% (w/v) CMC with intracellular, extracellu-
lar and cell membrane fractions over the course of a
316 h incubation. A significant decrease in viscosity was
observed within the initial 48 h of incubation for the
extracellular fraction, with a decrease from 610.89 ± 0.01 cP to 433.61 ± 38.45 cP. The other frac-
tions took a longer amount of time before a decrease in
viscosity was detected; 70 h for the intracellular fraction
and 140 h for the cell membrane fraction. After 316 h,
incubations with the extracellular fraction reached the
lowest viscosity, at 56.88 ± 7.39 cP (Fig. 5). Based on
this result, the extracellular fraction was selected for fur-
ther experiments since it showed the best potential to
hydrolyse viscous CMC solutions.

**Enzyme efficacy under different conditions and in oilfield
produced waters**

The extracellular fraction containing CMC-degrading
enzymes was evaluated for their efficacy across ranges
of temperature, pH levels and salinities found in typical
hydraulic fracturing operations. Viscosity reduction was
used to determine enzyme efficacies. Since tempera-
tures within wells experiencing hydraulic fracturing will
typically reach between 50 and 80°C (Marina et al.,
2015), enzymes used for treating CMC

filter cakes

should be thermostable at these temperatures. Figure 6A
shows enzyme efficacy under different temperatures
ranging between 50 and 80°C. The incubation at 50°C
revealed the fastest and greatest viscosity reduction of
all the temperatures tested, a result that was expected
since this is the temperature at which the CMC-degrad-
ing enrichment was maintained. This temperature is also
the average temperature at which hydraulically fractured
wells are operated (Trican Well Services, personal com-
munication). At 50°C, the viscosity reduction decreased
the most within the initial 48 h of incubation, starting at
611.47 ± 0.00 cP and reaching 121.87 ± 54.11 cP.
After 312 h, the lowest viscosity value was reached
(10.17 ± 0.41 cP). Surprisingly, the incubation at 80°C
yielded the second largest viscosity reduction, achieving
a viscosity of 76.14 ± 12.85 cP after 312 h. Controls
with the autoclaved culture supernatant confirmed that
these results are due to the enzymatic activity itself and
not by-products of growth within the medium (results not
shown). Enzymatic degradation of CMC also occurred at
60 and 70°C but not as effectively as observed at 50 or

© 2021 The Authors. *Microbial Biotechnology* published by Society for Applied Microbiology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd., *Microbial Biotechnology*, 14, 953–966
Fig. 6. Viscosity measurements comparing the efficacy of the extracellular enzymes from the methanogenic enrichment under different A) temperatures, B) pH values, and C) salt concentrations (% w/v). Speed = 16 rpm, n = 3.
80°C. Tests showed that the microorganisms cannot grow at 80°C, yet clear enzymatic activity was observed. Literature supports this trend as thermophiles (microorganisms that grow between 50 and 80°C) express enzymes that are active in this same range, between 60 and 80°C (Vieille and Zeikus, 2001). Another explanation for apparent viscosity reduction at 80°C could be due to a structural change of the polymer at this temperature that makes the polymer backbone more accessible for the enzyme activity compared to other temperatures. As this was the only temperature where abiotic degradation of the polymer was observed (Fig. 6A), is it possible that such a structural change occurred.

The second parameter tested was pH, as diverse pH values can characterize different production well fluids. Different pH levels were tested (3–9), but results at pH 3 and 4 are not presented because these lower pH values influence the stability of the polymer, and it is impossible to discern whether viscosity is due to chemical or enzymatic hydrolysis (Esmaeilirad et al., 2016). As shown in Fig. 6B, the most effective viscosity reduction was observed at pH 8 with a viscosity decrease from 590.54 ± 0.00 cP to 10.27 ± 6.98 cP in 140 h. Viscosity reduction was also obtained when enzymes were at pH 7, with viscosity decreasing from 593.26 ± 33.56 cP to 130.96 ± 31.96 in 312 h. While little or no enzymatic activity was recorded at pH 9, there was still activity detected at pH 5 with a decrease from 547.53 ± 60.13 cP to 193.75 ± 101.05 cP within 312 h. Similar results were obtained at pH 6 with a decrease from 690.26 ± 0.00 cP to 67.81 ± 0.00 cP in 140 h. These results suggest that the enzymes are active between pH 5 and 8, which was expected since the medium that was used to enrich the microbial culture is between 7.1 and 7.3.

The last parameter tested was salinity. The salt concentrations tested were chosen to be similar to those of produced water associated with oilfields (Table 1). Results were as expected: the viscosity from the solution with the lowest salt concentration (0.04%, the salinity of the medium used to cultivate the CMC enrichment) decreased to the greatest extent, from 611.47 cP to 23.64 ± 7.27 cP in 312 h (Fig. 6C). However, the extracellular enzyme fraction was also effective under the 5 and 10% salt concentrations tested, reaching 35.07 ± 0.34 cP and 81.76 ± 17.86 cP, respectively, after 312 h of incubation. Although not as effective, extracellular enzymes were also active at 20% (w/v) salt concentration and were able to decrease viscosity from 611.47 cP to 211.76 ± 86.68 cP after 312 h. In all, the CMC-utilizing enzymes derived from the enrichment culture were found to be effective in reducing viscosity up to 80°C, within a pH range of 5-8, and up to 20% salinity, conditions that can be present in oilfield produced waters.

Additionally, the enzymes were tested for their ability to degrade CMC under oxic and anoxic conditions since the oilfield environment to which they would be applied is anoxic. As the CMC-degrading enzymes were derived from a methanogenic culture, it was expected that they would be active under anoxic conditions. Figure 7 shows the viscosity reduction by the extracellular enzymes in the presence and absence of oxygen. Although the initial

---

Table 1. Characteristics of the produced water samples (as analyzed by Trican Well Services) used in this study to test for enzymatic CMC viscosity reduction.

| Produced Water Sample | Salt concentration (% w/v) | pH  | Viscosity reduction (%) |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------|-----|-------------------------|
| 1                     | 20.00                       | 5.76| 0.00                    |
| 2                     | 18.00                       | 6.39| 67.38                   |
| 3                     | 7.90                        | 7.30| 98.32                   |
| 4                     | 0.87                        | 8.39| 96.84                   |

---

© 2021 The Authors. *Microbial Biotechnology* published by Society for Applied Microbiology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd., *Microbial Biotechnology*, 14, 953–966
rate of viscosity reduction was higher under oxic conditions, incubations under both conditions converged to the same viscosity values after 96 h. Under anoxic conditions, viscosity was reduced to 59.67 ± 7.93 cP, while viscosity was reduced to 40.98 ± 11.09 cP under oxic conditions. These results demonstrate that the enzymes are metabolically flexible and are efficient at hydrolysing CMC under either oxic or anoxic conditions.

Produced water samples from hydraulically fractured wells were tested to determine whether the extracellular enzyme fraction could degrade CMC in the presence of real-world produced water chemistries. Figure S3 shows the viscosity measurements for four different produced water samples (see Table 1 for chemical characteristics). Due to the different speeds at which the samples were analysed in the viscometer, samples cannot be compared with one another. Ions have an effect on the polymer rheology by preventing cross-linking in many polymers; therefore, lower pH levels will result in lower viscosities (Esmaeilirad et al., 2016). For this reason, different rheometer programmes were used with different speeds to reach optimal measurements. Of the four samples tested, produced water sample 1 (20% salinity, pH 5.76) was the only sample that did not show a significant viscosity reduction, likely due to the combination of high salinity and lower pH. Enzymes tested against produced water samples 3 (7.9% salinity, pH 7.3) and 4 (0.87% salinity, pH 8.4) resulted in the largest decrease in viscosity, from 1077.75 ± 0.00 cP to 62.34 ± 12.63 cP for sample 3 and from 324.34 ± 17.20 cP to 40.30 ± 7.49 cP for sample 4, in only 24 h. Produced water sample 2 (18% salinity, pH 6.39) also showed a significant decrease in viscosity, from 353.39 ± 75.45 cP to 128.82 ± 75.78 cP in 144 h. Although the effect was not as pronounced as samples 3 and 4, the results showed that the extracellular enzyme fraction was capable of significant CMC degradation in comparatively high salinity produced waters. These results showed that the extracellular enzymes are able to degrade CMC concentrations that may be found in wells where filter cakes are formed and in chemical environments that are similar to those found in fractured wells and under similar temperatures (50°C).

Overall, we demonstrated that extracellular enzymes derived from a CMC-degrading methanogenic culture significantly reduced CMC viscosity under the environmental conditions and were observed in hydraulically fractured wells (50 and 80°C, pH from 5 to 8 and at 0.04% and 20% (w/v) salinities), providing a proof-of-concept for the application of such biotechnology to treat CMC filter cakes. Although the enzymes used in this study were not derived from microorganisms inhabiting oilfield fluids, our results demonstrating effective CMC viscosity reduction under oilfield conditions and in oilfield samples indicated that effective filter cake breaker enzymes can be derived from other sources. Similarly, effective guar-breakage enzymes for use in oilfield applications have been derived from soil-associated microorganisms such as Aspergillus niger (Tjon-Joe-Pin, 1993) and Enterobacter (You et al., 2016) rather than oilfield fluids. Since enzyme breaker technology would involve the use of specific enzymes rather than whole cells, the source of the enzymes would not factor into enzyme performance providing that they function under field-relevant conditions. As such, we showed that extracellular enzymes derived from cattle manure were able to effectively reduce CMC viscosity in the presence of real-world, produced water samples containing a variety of oilfield chemistries. Future work to characterize the enzyme biotechnology to treat CMC filter cakes using a laboratory-scale high pressure chamber will help to assess the feasibility of field application.

**Experimental procedures**

**Chemicals**

Carboxymethyl cellulose (CMC), chemical oxidizers (proprietary) and a guar-degrading enzyme formulation were provided by Trican Well Services (Calgary, AB, Canada). 4-Nitrophenyl-β-D-glucopyranoside (pNPG), 4-nitrophenyl-β-D-celllobioside (pNPC), D-glucono-1,5-β-lactone and trypan blue were purchased from Sigma-Aldrich Canada (Oakville, ON, Canada). All other chemicals used were obtained from Sigma-Aldrich or VWR (Radnor, PA, USA).

**Field samples and isolates**

Various environmental samples and isolates were obtained to examine CMC biodegradation. Cattle manure samples were collected at the Crowfoot Creek Ranch (Hussar, AB, Canada), sheep rumen was collected at the W.A. ranch operated by University of Calgary (Calgary, AB, Canada), and sewage sludge samples were collected from a municipal wastewater treatment plant (Calgary, AB, Canada). Based on literature reports describing their cellulose-degrading abilities at higher temperatures, three bacterial isolates were acquired from Deutsche Sammlung von Mikroorganismen und Zelkulturen (DSMZ, Braunschweig, Germany). The strains included Thermobifida fusca (DSM43792) (Gomez del Pulgar and Saadeddin, 2013), Geobacillus stearothermophilus (DSM22) (Agüéloglu & Enez, 2014) and Aeribacillus pallidus (DSM3670) (Scholz et al., 1987). Produced water samples with characterized pH levels and salinities (Table 1) were obtained from four different hydraulic fracturing operations (provided by Trican Well Services).
Cultivation methods

Each environmental sample and commercially available bacterial isolate was tested for CMC-degrading ability at 50°C under oxic and/or anoxic conditions.

Isolates were grown by using their respective recommended medium from DSMZ supplemented with 0.5% (w/v) CMC. Cultures were incubated at 50°C until the optical density (600 nm) reached a value of 0.6. Each culture was subsequently transferred into fresh medium (20% v/v) to which all other carbon sources except CMC (0.5% w/v) were removed to assess the capacity of the strain to use CMC as a sole carbon source.

For aerobic cultivation of the environmental samples (sheep rumen, cattle manure, sewage sludge), a minimal salts medium (Bao et al., 2012) was prepared with the addition of 0.2% (w/v) of CMC. Bottles were closed and autoclaved at 121°C for 20 min and then left 12 to 24 h at 50°C to allow for the polymer to fully hydrate in solution. Initial incubations were inoculated with 20% (w/v) of cattle manure or 20% (v/v) sewage sludge samples and incubated at 50°C.

For anaerobic cultivation, a minimal salts medium (McInerney et al., 1979) was prepared under strict anoxic conditions with minor modifications to the original medium composition (no clarified rumen fluid was used, and sodium sulfide instead of cysteine sulfide was used as the reductant). No electron acceptor was added in order to establish methanogenic enrichments. Serum bottle incubations were flushed with a mixture of N₂/CO₂ (90%/10%) and sealed with butyl rubber stoppers and aluminium crimps. Carboxymethyl cellulose was added at a final concentration of 0.5 to 2% CMC (w/v), and bottles were sterilized by autoclaving at 121°C for 20 min. Initial incubations were inoculated with 20% (w/v) cattle manure samples and incubated at 50°C. Unless otherwise stated, all incubations and enzyme tests were conducted at 50°C. This temperature was selected based on temperatures frequently found associated with hydraulic fracturing systems (Trican Well Services, personal communication).

Methane measurements

Methane production was monitored using a gas chromatograph equipped with a flame ionization detector (GC-FID) (Fowler et al., 2012) for the anaerobic cultures as a surrogate measurement for growth. Once methane production had reached the plateau phase in a culture, 20% (v/v) inoculum was transferred into fresh minimal medium either in the presence or absence of 2% (w/v) CMC. Transfers were performed several times until methane production ceased from the CMC-free cultures to ensure that CMC was the sole carbon source in the CMC-amended cultures. The same procedure was carried out for the aerobic cultures except that CO₂ was measured as an indication of growth using a gas chromatograph equipped with a thermal conductivity detector (GC-TCD; Agilent 7890A, Santa Clara, CA, USA) and a HP-PLOT/Q capillary column (30 m). For CO₂ analysis, the inlet temperature was set at 250°C, the detector temperature was set at 200°C, and the oven temperature was held at 80°C for 5 min.

Carboxymethyl cellulose staining process

CMC hydrolysis was visualized through the addition of 0.01 % (v/v) trypan blue to the cultures that were prepared as described above. Trypan blue is known to bind to the intact polymer backbone of β-glucans such as CMC (Williams, 1983). Fresh CMC solutions supplemented with trypan blue appear dark purple/blue. However, subsequent enzymatic hydrolysis of the β-1,4 bonds releases the dye (Kim et al., 2012), causing the colour intensity to decrease with an increasing degree of hydrolysis, until the solutions finally appear colourless. Substrate-free and sterile controls were also stained to verify that the culture was metabolizing CMC to glucose and that the CMC was not being transformed abiotically.

Enzyme activity determinations

Enzyme activities for various steps of the CMC degradation process were measured using an assay that involves the hydrolysis of pNPG and pNPC at 50°C as described by Lokapirnasari et al. (2015). pNPC is a common reagent used during spectrophotometric assays to measure endo- and exo-β-1,4-glucanase activities, as its hydrolysis releases nitrophenol that then reacts with sodium carbonate under alkaline conditions to develop a yellow colour (Lokapirnasari et al., 2015). D-glucoso-1,5-δ-lactone was added to a final concentration of 0.25 mg ml⁻¹ to the pNPC solution to inhibit the β-1,4-glucosidase activity (Holtzapple et al., 1990; Mandels and Reese, 1963). This was done to ensure that the pNPC assay measured only activity from the glucanase since glucosidase can also hydrolyse pNPC if not inhibited, resulting in a false positive. pNPG follows the same chemical reaction, but is precisely hydrolysed by β-1,4-glucosidases (Cai et al., 1999; Lokapirnasari et al., 2015). Enzyme activity was measured by measuring yellow colour development by spectrophotometry (405 nm). One unit was defined as one micromole of p-nitrophenol released by hydrolysis per minute under the experimental conditions.

Viscosity measurements from different culture fractions

To determine whether the enzymes responsible for CMC degradation were extracellular, intracellular or membrane-bound, CMC-degrading enrichment cultures were
grown until the polymer was hydrolysed (~6 days) and then centrifuged at 6000 rpm for 30 min at 4°C. Although we found that the highest enzyme activity for the gluconase was after the initial 2 days of incubation of the enrichment (as measured using the pNPC hydrolysis assay, Fig. 2), we found that after 2 days of incubation, the viscosity of the medium prevented successful enzyme recovery. Thus, when the enrichment culture was prepared for viscosity assays, the culture was pregrown for 6 days which we found to be the optimum time for enzyme recovery from the enrichment.

The supernatants were collected and saved as the extracellular fraction. The cell pellets were re-suspended in lysis buffer and were lysed using a FastPrep-24 Grind-er (MP Biomedicals, Santa Ana, CA, USA) for 40 s at 6 m/s and placed immediately on ice. After a second centrifugation, the resulting supernatant was collected and saved as the intracellular fraction, while the pellet, re-suspended in lysis buffer, was saved as the cell membrane fraction.

Each saved fraction was then evaluated for its efficacy in degrading CMC. Deionized water (20 ml) containing 2% (w/v) CMC was prepared in serum bottles that were sealed with butyl rubber stoppers and aluminium crimps. The bot-tles were autoclaved at 121°C for 20 min and agitated (120 rpm) overnight at 50°C to allow for full hydration of the polymer. The serum bottles were divided into 3 groups, with each group being supplemented with 5 ml of a particular saved culture fraction, prior to being incubated. Controls for the extracellular fraction were prepared by adding 5 ml minimal medium, while controls for the intracellular and cellular membrane fractions were prepared by adding 5 ml lysis buffer (50 mM Tris, 150 mM NaCl; pH 7).

Viscosity of the resulting solutions in each group was measured using a Brookfield DV-II + Pro viscometer (Brookfield, Middleboro, MA, USA) with a CP52 type spindle. Viscosity was measured at 40°C using 1 ml of sample. Samples were subjected to a speed range of 2–28 rpm with an increment of 2 rpm every 10 s. Viscosity readings were recorded before each speed change.

Viscosity measurements from the extracellular enzymes under different conditions

All assays to determine CMC enzymatic activity under different pH, salinity and temperature conditions were performed using the extracellular enzyme fraction. Every condition was tested independently. Enzyme performance was assessed using viscosity measurements (as described above). All enzyme tests were carried out in triplicate for 14 days using a 2% CMC solution, during which samples were removed periodically to measure viscosity. Triplicate enzyme-free controls were also prepared for each condition tested.

To determine the salinities at which the enzymes were capable of degrading CMC, various concentrations of NaCl (0.04, 5, 10 and 20% (w/v) NaCl) were added to a 2% (w/v) CMC solution. For the determination of the temperature range for activity, serum bottles were incubated at 50, 60, 70 or 80°C. Enzyme activities were also assessed at pH values of 3 to 9. Two different buffers were used to assess the pH range covered by these buffers. Citrate buffer was used to obtain the pH solutions of 3 to 6, and Tris buffer was used to obtain the pH solution of 7 to 9 (Stoll and Blanchard, 2009). Viscosities were monitored over time for each condition.

To determine the effect of oxygen on extracellular enzyme activity, one set of bottles was prepared with a 2% (w/v) CMC solution with oxygen in the headspace, while a second set was prepared anoxically by boiling the solution, and flushing the headspace was flushed with N2 to remove any oxygen from the bottles. Triplicates were prepared for each condition. Oxic and anoxic tests were incubated at 50°C, and viscosities were monitored over time.

The effect of the extracellular enzyme fraction on the viscosity of produced water samples (characteristics shown in Table 1) obtained from different oil fields was also evaluated. The assays were performed as described above, except the produced water samples were used to prepare the CMC solution instead of deionized water. Because ions can have a strong effect on polymer rheology by preventing cross-linking, solutions characterized by higher salinities and low pH values can lower viscosity (Esmaeili-Rad et al., 2016). Thus, due to the various salt concentrations and pH values associated with the different produced water samples (Table 1), different final concentrations of CMC were prepared to be in the same range of viscosity. Produced water samples 1 and 2 were prepared to have a final CMC concentration of 5% (w/v), while the samples 3 and 4 were prepared to have a final CMC concentration of 2% (w/v).

DNA extraction and 16S rRNA gene sequencing

Genomic DNA was extracted both from the initial CMC-degrading methanogenic enrichment and from the established CMC-degrading culture (after seven transfers) using a commercial kit (FastDNA Spin Kit for Soil, MP Biomedicals, Solon, OH, USA) according to the manufacturer’s protocol. Results were quantified by fluorometry (Qubit; Thermo Fisher Scientific, MA, USA). Amplification of the V6-V8 hypervariable region of the 16S rRNA gene was accomplished by following the protocol provided with the KAPA HiFi HotStart ReadyMixPCR (KAPA Biosys-tems, MA, USA) with 10 ng of template DNA and using the 926F (3’-AACCTAAAAAGGTACGGCA-5’) and 1392R (3’- CGGTTACCTGGTACGACTT-5’) primers (Menon and Voordouw, 2016). Initial denaturation was
done at 95°C for 3 min, followed by 35 cycles of denaturation at 98°C for 20 s, annealing at 65°C for 15 s and extension at 72°C for 15 s. A final extension step was carried out at 72°C for 1 min. PCR products were analyzed on a 1% agarose gel to ensure the presence of a single band and were quantified again after purification. The second PCR to attach the adapters was done with the same PCR mix and same PCR programme as described previously and sequenced on the Illumina MiSeq platform at the University of Calgary.

All data were visually inspected and cleaned of low-quality ends using DADA2 (Callahan et al., 2016). Data were processed with QIIME 2 (Bolyen et al., 2019). Denoising was done by merging a 50 bp overlap with mismatches of ≤ 10% allowed and subjected to additional quality control steps (removal of chimeras, ambiguities and sequences with an average quality lower than 20). Quality-controlled reads were analysed as amplicon sequence variants (ASV) and classified using the SILVA 132 database (Quast et al., 2013). All ASVs over 1% relative abundance were selected for analysis.

Statistical analyses

All statistical analyses were performed doing an unpaired t-test using the t-test calculator from GraphPad (Graph pad, 2018). All data considered statistically significant had a p-value lower than 0.05. To distinguish significant from non-significant data, groups were formed and designated a, b, c, etc. Groups with the same letter signify that the values within the group are not significantly different (p-value higher than 0.5), while groups with different letters signify that the values in that group are significantly different than the values from the other lettered groups (p-value lower than 0.5).

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada (CRD grant #CRDPJ469717-14), Trican Well Services Inc., the Schmeekl Foundation and the Fonds de Recherche du Québec – Nature et Technologies. We are indebted to Dr. Rhonda Clark for providing the manure samples and to Harvey Quintero and Bill O’Neil for providing field samples, chemicals and helpful discussions.

Conflict of interest

None declared.

References

Agülöblu Fincan, S., and Enez, B. (2014) Production, purification, and characterization of thermostable α-amylase from thermophilic Geobacillus stearothermophilus. Starch 66: 182–189.

Alu, A. O. (2017) Rheology, regain fracture conductivity and viscous fingering phenomenon for propellant suspension in CMC hydraulic fracturing fluid. SPE-189278-STU.

Azizov, E., Quintero, H.J., Saxton, K., and Sessarego, S. (2015) Carboxymethylcellulose a cost-effective alternative to guar. CMHPG and surfactant-based fluid systems. SPE-175904-MS.

Bao, M., Wang, L.N., Sun, P.Y., Cao, L.X., Zou, J., and Li, Y.M. (2012) Biodegradation of crude oil using an efficient microbial consortium in a simulated marine environment. Mar Pollut Bull 64: 1177–1185.

Barbati, A.C., Desroches, J., Robinson, A., and McKinley, G.H. (2016) Complex fluids and hydraulic fracturing. Annu Rev Chem Biomol Eng 7: 415–453.

Benoit, L., Cailliez, C., Gehin, A., Therion, J., Raval, G., and Petitdemange, H. (1995) Carboxymethylcellulose and avicelase activities from a cellulolytic Clostridium strain A11. Curr Microbiol 30: 305–312.

Bolyen, E., Rideout, J.R., Dillon, M.R., Bokulich, N.A., Abnet, C.C., Ab-Ghalith, G.A., et al. (2019) Reproducible, interactive, scalable and extensible microbiome data science using QIIME 2. Nat Biotechnol 37: 852–857.

Brown, T.R. (2015) A techno-economic review of thermo-chemical cellulosic biofuel pathways. Bioresour Technol 178: 166–176.

Cai, Y.J., Chapman, S.J., Buswell, J.A., and Chang, S.T. (1999) Production and distribution of endoglucanase, cellobiolyrase, and beta-glucosidase components of the cellulolytic system of Volvariella volvacea, the edible straw mushroom. Appl Environ Microbiol 65: 553–559.

Callahan, B.J., McMurdie, P.J., Rosen, M.J., Han, A.W., Johnson, A.J.A., and Holmes, S.P. (2016) DADA2: high resolution sample inference from Illumina amplicon data. Nat Methods 13: 581–583.

Charoenwongsa, S., Kazemi, H., Fakcharoenphol, P., and Miskimins, J. (2013) Simulation of gel filter cake formation, gel cleanup, and post-frac well performance in hydraulically fractured gas wells. SPE-150104-MS.

Cheng, Y., and Prud’homme, R.K. (2000) Enzymatic degradation of guar and substituted guar galactomannans. Biomacromolecules 1: 782–788.

Chopade, P., Fontenelle, L., Reddy, B.R., and Coria, B. (2015) Novel stabilized enzyme breaker for fracturing applications. SPE-173583-MS.

EsmaeiliRad, N., White, S., Terry, J.A., Prior, A., and Carlson, K. (2016) Influence of inorganic ions in recycled produced water on gel-based hydraulic fracturing fluid viscosity. J Petrol Sci Eng 139: 104–111.

Fink, J. (2013) Hydraulic Fracturing Chemicals and Fluids Technology. St. Louis, MO: Gulf Professional Publishing.

Flink, H.J., Scott, K.P., Duncan, S.H., Louis, P., and Forano, E. (2012) Microbial degradation of complex carbohydrates in the gut. Gut Microbes 3: 289–306.

Fowler, S.J., Dong, X., Sensen, C.W., Sulita, J.M., and Gieg, L.M. (2012) Methanogenic toluene metabolism: community structure and intermediates. Environ Microbiol 14: 754–764.

Freeman, M., Norman, M., Ballard, D., Jiang, P., Symes, K., and Mistry, K. (2005) Method and composition for the
triggered release of polymer-degrading agents for oil field use. Patent US2005013084S1.

Gomez del Pulgar, E.M., and Saadeddin, A. (2013) The cellulolytic system of Thermobifida fusca. Crit. Rev Microbiol 40: 236–247.

Graphpad. (2018) GraphPad QuickCalcs: t-test calculator. Retrieved from https://www.graphpad.com/quickcalcs/ttest1/.

Gupta, D.V.S., and Prasek, B.B. (1995) Method for fracturing subterranean formations using controlled release breakers and compositions useful therein. Patent US5437331A.

Harris, P.C. (1988) Fracturing-fluid additives. J Petroleum Technol 40: 1277–1279.

Head, I.M., Gray, N.D., and Larter, S.R. (2014) Life in the slow lane; biogeochemistry of biodegraded petroleum containing reservoirs and implications for energy recovery and carbon management. Front Microbiol 5: 566.

Hinterstoisser, B., and Salmén, L. (1999) Application of dynamic 2D FTIR to cellulose. Vib Spectroscop 22: 111–118.

Holtzapple, M., Cognata, M., Shu, Y., and Hendrickson, C. (1990) Inhibition of Trichoderma reesei cellulase by sugars and solvents. Biotechnol Bioeng 36: 275–287.

Hook, S.E., Wright, A.-D.G., and McBride, B.W. (2010) Methanogens: methane producers of the rumen and mitigation strategies. Archaea 2010: 1–11.

Kim, B.C., Grote, R., Lee, D.W., Antranikian, G., and Pyun, Y.R. (2001) Thermoanaerobacter yonseiensis sp. nov., a novel extremely thermophilic, xylose utilizing bacterium that grows up to 85 degrees C. Int J Evol Microbiol 51: 1539–1548.

Kim, Y.-K., Lee, S.-C., Cho, Y.-Y., Oh, H.-J., and Ko, Y.H. (2012) Isolation of cellulolytic Bacillus subtilis strains from agricultural environments. ISRN Microbiol 2012: 1–9.

Lavanya, C., Kulkarni, P., Dixit, M., Raavi, P.K., and Krishna, L.N.V. (2011) Sources of cellulose and their applications – a review. Int J Drug Formul Res 2: 19–38.

Lokapirnasari, W.P., Nazar, D.S., Nurhajati, T., Supranianondo, K., and Yullinto, A.B. (2015) Production and assay of cellulolytic enzyme activity of Enterobacter cloacae WPL 214 isolated from bovine rumen fluid waste of Surabaya abattoir. Indonesia. Vet World 8: 367–371.

Lusk, B.G., Collin, A., Parameswaran, P., Rittmann, B.E., and Torres, C.I. (2017) Simultaneous fermentation of cellulose and current production with an enriched mixed culture of thermophilic bacteria in a microbial electrolys cell. Microb Biotechnol 11: 63–73.

Mandels, M., and Reese, E.T. (1963) Inhibition of Cellulases and beta-Glucosidases: Advances in Enzymic Hydrolysis of Cellulose and Related Materials. Oxford, UK: Pergamon.

Marina, S., Derek, I., Mohamed, P., Yong, S., and Imo-Imo, E.K. (2015) Simulation of the hydraulic fracturing process of fractured rocks by the discrete element method. Environ Earth Sci 73: 8451–8469.

Martinez-Richa, A. (1998) Variation of intrinsic viscosity in the hydrolysis of hydroxyethylcellulose, and its relationship with resistance to enzymatic degradation. Polymer 39: 3115–3118.

McInerney, M.J., Bryant, M.P., and Pfennig, N. (1979) Anaerobic bacterium that degrades fatty acids in syntrophic association with methanogens. Arch Microbiol 122: 129–135.

Menon, P., and Voordouw, G. (2016) Impact of light oil toxicity on sulfide production by acetate-oxidizing, sulfate-reducing bacteria. Int Biodeterior Biodegrad 126: 208–215.

Miller, D.N., and Varel, V.H. (2002) In vitro study of the biochemical origin and production limits of odorous compounds in the cattle feedlots. J Anim Sci 79: 2049–2056.

Politiz, O., Krah, M., Thomsen, K.K., and Borris, R. (2000) A highly thermostable endo-(1,4)-beta-mannanase from the marine bacterium Rhodothermus marinus. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 53: 715–721.

Prud’homme, R.K., and Wang, J.K. (1993) Filter-cake formation of fracturing fluids. SPE-25207-MS.

Quast, C., Pruesse, E., Yilmaz, P., Gerken, J., Scherer, T., Yarza, P., et al. (2013) The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved data processing and web-based tools. Nucleic Acids Res 41: 590–596.

Scholz, T., Demharter, W., Hensel, R., and Kandler, O. (1987) Bacillus pallidus sp. nov., a new thermophilic species from sewage. Syst Appl Microbiol 9: 91–96.

Smith, M.B., and Montgomery, C. (2015) Hydraulic Fracturing. Bosa Roca, FL: CRC Press.

Stoll, V.S., and Blanchard, J.S. (2009) Buffers: principles and practice. Methods Enzymol 463: 43–56.

Symons, G., and Buswell, A. (1933) The methane fermentation of carbohydrates. J Am Chem Soc 55: 2028–2036.

Tjon-Joe-Pin, R.M. (1993) Enzyme breaker for galactomannan based fracturing fluids. US-5: 201370-A.

Trabelsi, S., and Kakadjian, S. (2013) Comparative study between guar and carboxymethylcellulose used as gelling systems in hydraulic fracturing application. SPE-164486-MS.

Tuka, K., Zverlov, V.V., Bumazkin, B.K., Velikodvorskaya, G.A., and Strongin, A.Y. (1990) Cloning and expression of Clostridium thermocellum genes coding for thermostable exoglucanases (cellobiohydrolases) in Escherichia coli cells. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 169: 1055–1060.

Vieille, C., and Zeikus, G.J. (2001) Hyperthermophilic enzymes: sources, uses, and molecular mechanisms for thermostability. Microbiol Mol Biol Rev 65: 1–43.

Walker, L.P., and Wilson, D.B. (2003) Enzymatic hydrolysis of cellulose: an overview. Bioressour Technol 36: 3–14.

Ward, N.L., Challacombe, J.F., Janssen, P.H., Henrissat, B., Coutinho, P.M., Wu, M., et al. (2009) Three genomes from the phylum Acidobacteria provide insight into the lifestyles of these microorganisms in soils. Appl Environ Microbiol 75: 2046–2056.

Watanabe, M., Kojima, H., and Fukui, M. (2015) Limnochordales ord. nov. and Limnochordales classis nov. in the phylum Firmicutes. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 65: 2378–2384.

Weiner, M. L. & Kotkoskie, L. A. (1999) Excipient Toxicity and Safety. 1st Ed, Boca Raton: CRC Press.

Williams, A.G. (1983) Staining reactions for the detection of hemicellulose-degrading bacteria. FEMS Microbiol Lett 20: 253–258.

Yang, X., Xu, M., and Yang, S.-T. (2015) Metabolic and process engineering of Clostridium cellulovorans for biofuel production from cellulose. Metab Eng 32: 39–48.
You, J., Liu, J.F., Yang, S.Z., and Mu, B.Z. (2016) Low temperature active and salt tolerant β-mannanase from a newly isolated Enterobacter sp. strain N18. J Biosci Bioeng 121: 140–146.

Zieminski, K., and Frac, M. (2012) Methane fermentation process as anaerobic digestion of biomass: transformations, stages and microorganisms. Afr J Microbiol Res 11: 4127–4139.

Supporting information

Additional supporting information may be found online in the Supporting Information section at the end of the article.

Fig. S1. Methane production from A) the initial CMC-degrading culture established with cattle manure as the inoculum in a minimal salts medium, and B) the established CMC-degrading methanogenic enrichment culture after seven transfers of the culture, n = 3.

Fig. S2. Established CMC-degrading methanogenic enrichment supplemented in 0.01% (v/v) Trypan Blue as an indicator for CMC biodegradation. ‘Sterile Ctl’ stands for sterile control. ‘CMC-free Ctl’ is the control without CMC added to the medium (substrate-free 6#control), n = 3.

Fig. S3. Viscosity measurements for the cell-free extract containing extracellular enzymes (empty symbol) compared to sterile controls (full symbol) in different produced water samples (B) sample 1; C) sample 2; D) sample 3; E) sample 4) from fractured wells with different pH and salinities (%) compared to A) a positive control with CMC hydrated in deionized water. Refer to Table 1 for sample details, n = 3.