This paper examines how the law elects non-Muslim leaders from the Qur’an perspective. The issue raised was based on the Regional Head Election (Pilkada) of the DKI Jakarta on February 6, 2017 where one of the candidates is non-Muslim. Then, the simultaneous local elections on June 27, 2018, and the Legislative Election (Pileg) and the Presidential Election (Pilpres) on April 17, 2019. It has become interesting because the issue of ethnic, racial, and religious sentiments (SARA) in the context of candidate leaders often becomes a serious consideration for voters, in addition to capability and track record of the candidate. This paper uses the thematic interpretation method (maudhû’î) seeks to get a comprehensive genealogy of the verse choosing non-Muslim leaders. The results studies that in the Qur’an there are four terms related to leadership: caliph, uli al-amr, imâm, and awliyâ’. The last term gives rise to various interpretations because it is mentioned 33 times with various meanings: salvation, friend, and leader. From these verses it can be understood that partiality for non-Muslims (Jews and Christians) is not permitted in Islam, especially in the affairs of the nasb al-Imâmah. As for the fulfillment of the rights of non-Muslims as citizens, it is still guaranteed and highly upheld in Islam.
Makrum: Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders..................

Jakarta 6 Februari 2017 yang salah satu calonnya non-Muslim. Kemudian, Pilkada serentak pada 27 Juni 2018, dan Pemilu Legislatif (Pileg) serta Pemilu Presiden (Pilpres) pada 17 April 2019. Hal demikian menjadi menarik sebab isu SARA dalam konteks calon pemimpin acapkali menjadi pertimbangan serius para pemilih, di samping kapabilitas dan rekam jejak (track record) sang calon. Artikel ini dengan menggunakan metode tafsir tematik (maudhû'i) coba memperoleh gambaran yang komprehensif tentang ayat memilih pemimpin non-Muslim. Hasilnya diketahui bahwa dalam Al-Qur’an terdapat empat term yang terkait dengan kepemimpinan: khalifah, uli al-amr, imâm, dan awliyâ’. Term terakhir menimbulkan beragam tafsir karena disebutkan sebanyak 33 kali dengan beragam makna: penolong, teman, dan pemimpin. Dari ayat-ayat tersebut dapat dipahami bahwa keberpihakan kepada kaum non-Muslim (Yahudi dan Nasrani) tidak diperbolehkan dalam Islam, terutama dalam urusan nashb al-imâmah. Adapun dalam pemenuhan hak-hak non-Muslim sebagai warga negara, hal tersebut tetap dijamin dan dijunjung tinggi dalam Islam.

Keywords: Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders, Qur’an, Maudhû’i.

Introduction

Before the 2017 regional head elections, one of the emerging issues that caught public’s attention was a matter of voting for non-Muslim leaders. This issue burst when the Jakarta governor at that time, Basuki Tjahaja Purnama, popularly called ‘Ahok’, issued a statement that was allegedly blaspheming the Qur’an. Ahok delivered his speech in Kepulauan Seribu in September 2016 that referred to Al-Maidah verse 51 in the Qur’an. The former Jakarta governor stated that this verse that was believed to ban Muslims from voting for a non-Muslim leader had been propagandized by severe politicians to manipulate people into voting against him. The alleged blasphemy completely triggered some Muslims from various regions in Indonesia to rally for protesting the Ahok’s speech in Jakarta. It was followed up by “Aksi 411” on November 4, 2016 and “Aksi 212” on December 2, 2016 under the auspices of
The protest rallies continued at the beginning of 2017 demanding Ahok to be immediately arrested by law.

Nevertheless, Indonesia’s Muslims were split into two factions: pro and against the mass rallies. Those who supported the rallies took part in the protests and demanded Ahok to be immediately arrested, while those who were against the rallies stayed calm and stood in a neutral side. In addition, in the Regional Head Election (Pilkada) 2018 and both of Legislative Election (Pileg) and the Presidential Election (Pilpres) 2019, there was an issue of similar thoughts and mass movements to emerge. This inevitably raises questions regarding the concept of leadership in Islam. This paper using the thematic interpretation method (mawdû‘i) seeks to answer what is a Muslim allowed to vote for a non-Muslim leader in Islam? How is the use of the Qur’anic verses in voting for leaders—is it purely a form of religiosity, or does it have political overtones? What are the interpretation of the Qur’anic verses and Hadith on leadership in a country that does not employ Islamic law as its legal basis, including Indonesia?

**Muslim, Kafir, Fasiq and Munafiq**

The issue of faith and the characteristics of prospective leaders are important considerations for Muslims before voting. The average leader candidate in the faith that tends to be chosen. Although it is not necessarily the only parameter because constituents also see other aspects such as morals, competence and experience. In this context Islam explains four characteristics of identity: Muslim, kafir, fasiq and munafiq.

The word “Muslim” with various derivations in *isim fa’il* is frequently mentioned in the Qur’an. It consists of *mufrad* that is stated

---

1 Furthermore about *Aksi Bela Islam*, please read an interesting paper, Muzayyin Ahyar, Alfitri Alfitri, “Aksi Bela Islam: Islamic Clicktivism and the New Authority of Religious Propaganda in the Millennial Age in Indonesia,” *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* (IJIMS), Vol. 9, No. 1, 2019.
three times, once for *mutsanna*, and 38 times for its plural form.\(^2\) The definition of Muslim, referring to QS. Al-Hujurat verse 14, is those who submit to Allah, but the light of faith has not yet arisen and is firm in their hearts. It, therefore, is expected that he will rise to the next level, namely: faith, by obeying God and the Prophet Muhammad and doing good deeds. Nonetheless, Muslims at this level is not the same as hypocrites.\(^3\)

The word “*kafir*” and its equivalence can be noted in several verses of the Qur’an, including QS. Al-Kafirun: 1, At-Taubah: 40, Al-Mumtahanah: 10, An-Nisa’: 89, 141, 150, Fathir: 39, Al-Mukmin: 10, Al-Hajj: 19, 72, An-Naba’: 40, and An-Nur: 39. Literally, an infidel means a person who conceals or denies the truth. *Kufr* is the act of denying what was brought by the Prophet Muhammad, both in part and in whole.\(^4\) Non-Muslims—in this context—are included in the category of infidels since they deny or distrust Islamic tenets taught by the Prophet Muhammad.

Systematically, the term ‘*takfîr*’—whose word derivation is the same as *kafir*—has a strong correlation with other terms articulated in the Qur’an containing bad ethical meanings. Various terms that explicitly shows the similar meaning to *kufr* in essence include *jubud, ilhad, inkar,* and *syirik*. Meanwhile, other terms that indirectly and implicitly imply disbelieves comprising *fusûq, zulm, fujûr, jurm, dhalâl, ghâiy, fasâd, i’tidâ’, isrâf, ’iyân, takabbur, kidzh, and ghaflat*. If the terms are in the form of *isim fâ’il*, they usually refer to unbelievers. This indicates that *kufr/* *kafir* is a term that reveals lots of dimensions and has variations of words representing bad morals.\(^5\)

---

\(^2\) Tim Sembilan, *Tafsir Ma’dhû’i Al-Muntaha* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pesantren, 2004), p. 85-86.

\(^3\) Abu Al-Fida’ Ismail bin Katsir Al-Dimasyqi, *Tafsir Al-Qur’an Al-Azhim*, (Semarang: Thaha Putra, t.t.), p. 218-219.

\(^4\) Moh. Rofiq, “Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur’an”, *Jurnal Sabaja*, Vol. 4, No. 2, 2013, pp. 68-82.

\(^5\) Harifuddin Cawidu, *Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur’an: Suatu Kajian Teologis dengan Pendekatan Tafsir Tematik* (Jakarta: Penerbit Bulan Bintang, 1991).

310 Epistemé, Vol. 14, No. 2, December 2019
Makrum: Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders

It can be stated that the dimensions of *kufr* involve *fasiq* and *kidzq* that reflect the notable characteristics of *munafiq* or hypocrites. Thus, it can be asserted that the wickedness and hypocrisy become one sign of *kufr siri* within a servant. The sin committed by human beings demonstrates that he has committed *kufr nikmat*. Likewise, hypocrisy belongs to the category of *kufr* for it is essentially a form of hidden disbelief.

The word “*fasiq*” can be seen in QS. Ali Imran: 82, Al-Maidah: 47, Al-Araf: 145, Al-Hujurat: 6, Al-Hadid: 27, and Al-Ahqaf: 20. Linguistically, *fasiq* is derived from Arabic words “*fasaqa-yafsuqu-fusqan*” which means to get out of something.⁶ In Ibn Zakariya’s point of view, this word means to come out of obedience.⁷ *Fasiq* is a term addressed for people who have recognized and run Islamic law practices, but then they destroy their confession by committing behavior deviating from the established sharia, either in part or in whole.⁸

Meanwhile, the word “*munafiq*” with various derivations is articulated in QS. Al-Munafiqun: 1, At-Taubah: 67, 79, Al-Ahzab: 60, Al-Hasyr: 11, and Ali Imran: 167. Ibn Kathir views a *munafiq* is a person who puts on a false appearance of virtue of religion that is contradictory to his or her stated beliefs or feelings.⁹ In reference to Hadith, hypocrites can be noticed from three characteristics, namely: (1) when he speaks, he lies, (2) when he makes a treaty, he betrays it, and (3) when he makes a promise, he breaks it. At this point, hypocrisy can plunge someone into true *kufr*.

In the Qur’an, the hypocritical character is portrayed with an undetermined personality and does not have a fixed stance, particularly

---

⁶ Abu Abdillah al-Qurthubi, *Tafsir al-Qurthubi* (Cairo: Dar asy-Syiab, 1372 H), p. 245.
⁷ Abu Husain Ahmad bin Faris bin Zakariya bin Hubaib ar-Razi, *Mu’jam Muqayis al-Lughah* (Cairo: Maktabah al-Kanji, 1981), p. 356.
⁸ Harifuddin Cawidu, *Konsep Kufur dalam Al-Qur’an…*, p. 54.
⁹ Abu Al-Fida’ Ismail bin Katsir Al-Dimasyqi, *Tafsir Al-Qur’an Al-Azhim*, (Semarang: Thaha Putra, t.t.), p. 218-219.
for *akidah*, so he will be cowardly. The culprit of hypocrisy lives with uncertainty and anxiety. For instance, at the time of the Prophet, hypocrites in Medina were too afraid to Muslims in addition to the *musyrik*. Therefore, in the midst of Muslims, they behave as if good Muslims. Conversely, gathered with the idolaters, they claim to be infidels and will help them.\footnote{Moh. Rofiq, “Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur’an”, *Jurnal Sabaya*, Vol. 4, No. 2, 2013, p. 73.}

Thus, it can be understood that “Muslims” are those who are hold or claim to embrace the teachings of Islam, while “*kafir*” are those who do not believe in Allah, the Prophet Muhammad, and people with other religions than Islam. “*fasiq*” is defined as those who believe to Allah, but do not practice Allah’s commands, even commit sins. *Fasiq* are also interpreted as actions that do not care about Allah’s commands, such as misbehavior, doing evil, and committing major sins. The word “hypocrite” itself has two meanings: first, pretending to believe or be faithful to a religion, but actually in his heart he does not. Second, likes to say something that is not in accordance with his actions, two-faced.\footnote{Kamus Besar Babasa Indonesia (KBBI) Luar Jaringan (Luring).}

The definition of these terms can be said to be quite representative and in accordance with the information in the Qur’an that explains the nature and the four characteristics.

In the context of the gubernatorial, legislative, and presidential elections, these four types of identities can be deemed as a reference standard and an assessment of the characteristics of candidate pairs who contest for the people’s votes. Because it cannot be denied that there is a possibility of the emergence of a black campaign that uses elements of ethnicity, religion, race, and intergroup that breaks the unity of the people. Surprisingly, if each of the supporters is fanatical and use religious arguments to tackle the other candidate pairs, the political words, including *kafir, fasiq, and munafiq* tend to burst. The explanation of these four identities provides clear boundaries related to non-Muslim
Makrum: Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders

categories, as well as is a sign for the supporters of each candidate pair not to embed certain labels that lead to the race issues.

Referring to the historical record, after the time of the Prophet Muhammad, one of the reasons for the disunity that occurred in Muslim communities was caused by the embedding of the title of “kafir” without the proper syar’i proposition, which was carried out by the Khawarij against some of Sahabat. They considered that the big sinners had left Islam and belonged to the kafir. Therefore, blood is a halal and property is seized, or in other words, the perpetrators of major sins may be killed and looted.

Moreover, during the Caliph Uthman ibn Affan period, the disunities among the Muslims were quite large, causing the killing of the third Caliph in 35 H. After this tragedy, backbiting reappeared with the occurrence of the Jamal and the Siffin war. Lots of deviations began to emerge by a group of Muslims from legitimate leaders, so the Khawarij sect was formed. They declared innocent of government because of their disagreement over tabkîm (arbitration) policy managed by Ali ibn Abi Thalib after the Siffin war. The Khawarij assumed all the companions who agreed to the arbitration process had been disbelieving the tenets of Islam, hence they asked Ali and the companions of the pro tabkîm to repent.

At the end of the Umayyad and early Abbasids, the phenomenon of takfîr without based on the proposition of syar’i also affects the Mu’tazi

---

12 Sahabat is one who saw the prophet Muhammad and believed in him and died as a Muslim.

13 Zain al-Din Abu al-Faraj Abdurrahman bin Syihab ad-Din bin Ahmad bin Rajab al-Hambali al-Baghdadi (Ibnu Rajab), Jami’ al-Ulum wa al-Hikam fi Syarb Khamsin Hadisan min Jawami’ al-Kalim (Cairo: Daar as-Salam, 2004), p. 116-117.

14 Shalih Khuraisat, Tahdzib Tarikh at-Thabari: Tarikh al-Umam wa al-Muluk (Oman: Daar al-Fikr, 1993), p. 308-316.

15 Ahmad Muhammad Ahmad Jalî, Dirasah ‘an al-Firaq fi Tarikh al-Muslimin: al-Khawarij wa as-Syi’ab (Riyadh: Syarikah ath-Thiba’ah al-Arabiyyah as-Sa’udiyyah, 1986), p. 35.
declaring the concept of manzilah baina al-manzilatain. They pointed out that those who committed great sins were not condemned by believers and are not infidels, but wrong-doers. In other words, they took their positions in manzilah baina al-manzilatain. Consequently, they did not suffer as much azab received in hell as infidels. It illustrates that for they were not believers, they could not be admitted to the heaven.

**Notions of Leaders Stated in the Qur’an**

Etymologically, the leader can be defined as a person who is able to influence and persuade other parties in order to perform certain actions to achieve a common goal. Thus, it concerns the beginning of the structure and the center of the group process. In the Qur’an, the topic of leadership is articulated through some terms, including Caliph, imam, āli al-amr, and waliy/awliyā’.

**Caliph**

Etymologically, the word “Caliph” is derived from the word “khalafa-yakhlufu-khalfan” which means replacing. Thus, Caliph means people who replace or be a substitute. In this case, what is meant is a substitute for leadership duties after the Prophet Muhammad passed away. Mandate stipulated by Caliph was concerned not only religious issues, but also a state or government, as exemplified by the Prophet and al-khulafa’ ar-ramaydan.

One of the verses that mentioning the word “Caliph” is QS. Shad verse 26. This verse explains one of liabilities taken by Caliph was

---

16 A mean is a place between the heaven and the hell.
17 Mani’ bin Hammad al-Juhani, al-Mausu’ah al-Muyassarah fi al-Adyan wa al-Madzahib wa al-Abzab al-Mu‘asharah, Juz 1 (Riyadh: Daar an-Nadwah al-Alamiyyah li ath-Thiba’ah wa an-Nasyr wa at-Tauzi’, 1420 H), p. 68.
18 Departemen Pendidikan Nasional, Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia (Jakarta: Balai Pustaka, 2002), p. 874.
19 Abu Husain Ahmad bin Faris bin Zakariya, Mu’jam Maqayis al-Lughah (Egypt: Isa al-Bab al-Halab wa Awladuh, 1972), p. 210.
20 Thanthâwî defines the word “Caliph” as the person who replace others or continue as a successor. Muhammad Sayyid Thanthawi, At-Tafsir Al-Wâsith, Maktabah
Makrum: Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders

siyāsah an-nās that covers managing the affairs of the human beings.21 Further, the word “siyāsah” has two meanings: al-idārah (administration and management) and al-khiththhah (strategy, politics, and policy).22

Another verse highlighting the word “Caliph” is QS. Al-Baqarah verse 30. The word “Caliph” literally means a successor. In the context of this verse, Caliph means a successor for the creature by Allah before human beings: Bānū al-Jān.23 Besides QS. Shad: 26 and Al-Baqarah: 30, Caliph is also mentioned in its plural forms, khalâ’if, as presented in QS. Fâthir verse 39, Al-An’âm verse 165, and Yûnus verse 14 and 73. Caliph also means a successor from Allah in carrying out the responsibility of taking care of the earth.

At the level of history, the term “Caliph” is used to indicate a person who became a successor after the Prophet Muhammad passed away, in terms of both government and religion. It depicts that the term al-khulafa’ ar-rasyidun appears consisting of Abu Bakar Ash-Shiddiq, Umar ibn al-Khattab, Uthman ibn Affân, and Ali ibn Abi Thalib.

Furthermore, Caliph is derived from the word “khalafa” which means being behind. For this reason, a leader must be behind in order to be a self-impulse and the person he leads to move forward and live a good and right life, while following the will of the person they lead to the truth.24 In other words, the leader must motivate people to be better individuals time by time.

Syamilah, t.t., p. 3611.

21 Ibid.

22 Ahmad Warson Munawwir, Kamus Al-Munawwir (Surabaya: Pustaka Progresif, t.t.), p. 678.

23 In the Tafsir Al-Jalâlain, it has been explained that before Adam was created, the earth was inhabited by a creature named Bānū al-Jān. They did bad deeds which cause damage on earth. As-Suyūthi dan Al-Maḥalli, Tafsîr Al-Jalâlîn, Juz 1 (Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.), p. 36.

24 Siti Patimah, Manajemen Kepemimpinan Islam: Aplikasinya dalam Organisasi Pendidikan, (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2015), p. 38-39.
**Makrum: Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders..................**

**Uli al-Amr**

The second term, ἢλι al-amr, is derived from the word “ulî” which means someone who possesses and “al-amr” which means command, case or problem, power or influence, and power of attorney. The term ἢλι al-amr refers to the ruler. This phrase can also be interpreted as the one who holds authority. The word can be found in several Qur’anic verses, including QS. An-Nisâ’: 59.

Ὡλι al-amr can be viewed as a leader who commands to do the truth and goodness. Another opinion states that what is meant by ἢλι al-amr is the leader of the state or military unit. In addition, there is another opinion which states, ἢλι al-amr is none other than scholars who hold fast to the teachings of religion, who teach religion to the people, order on things that are maruf; and forbid the negation. Another verse articulating the term ἢλι al-amr is QS. An-Nisâ’ verse 83. It is interpreted that the term ἢλι al-amr in this verse denotes a superior friend who is good at various issues. This meaning refers to the meaning of ἢλι al-amr as a smart person or ‘alim (mufrad from ‘ulamâ). It is also asserted that the meaning of al-amr in the verse is the ruler and leader of the troops.

Similarly, there are four meanings of ἢλι al-amr, namely: (1) al-khulafa’ ar-rasyidun, (2) war leaders, (3) scholars who give fatwas regarding laws religion and teach humanity about Islamic tenets, and (4) imam who is awake from sin (ma’shum).

Thus, it depicts that ἢλι al-amr contains various dimensions of meaning, and it can be understood in accordance with the context of the sentence that accompanies the word.

---

25 Ahmad Warson Munawwir, *Kamus Al-Munawwir* …, p. 38.
26 Abû Al-Qâsim Maḥmûd bin Amrû bin Aḥmad Az-Zamakhshyari, *Al-Kasyyâf*, Juz 5, (Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.), p. 424.
27 Muhammad Sayyid Thanthawi, *At-Tafsir Al-Wasith* …, p. 1014.
28 Fakhruddin Ar-Razi, *At-Tafsir Al-Kabir*, 10th Ed. (Beirut: Daar al-Fikr, t.t.), p. 144.
29 Jalaluddin as-Suyuthi explained that asbab al-nuzul of this verse related to the sending of Abdullah bin Hudzaifah ibn Qais by Rasulullah SAW to lead the war army.
**Imam**

The term “*imam*” is initially only used to be adhered for the people who become prayer leaders in congregation. Nevertheless, this term has the meaning of the person who followed in his footsteps and prioritized his affairs, as well as certain books. In the Qur’an, “*imam*” exposes various meanings, including *Lauh Mahfuzh* (QS. Yasin: 12), guideline (QS. Hud: 17), *imam* (QS. Al-Furqan: 74), and directions (QS. Al-Ahqaf: 12). A verse articulating the term “*imâm*” referring to a leader in meaning is QS. Al-Furqân verse 74. The word “*imâm*” in the verse is interpreted with “qudwah” (role model) and “uswah” (example), so that the whole verse means: “Make us role models for those who are pious, so that they can imitate words our good and righteous deeds,” which indicate the nature of a servant of Allah that is strong in faith, clean of soul, and pure in heart.

Additionally, QS. Al-Baqarah verse 124 shows that there is the word “*imâm*” which refers to the appointment of Ibrâhîm as a human leader as he had succeeded in passing test upon test from Allah, while leadership (*al-imâmah*) in the verse copes with apostolic and prophetic elements. Therefore, it is argued that *imâm* is a role model followed by his words and deeds. In line with this meaning, the word *imâm* from *amma-yaummu* means to lead, support and emulate. It suggests that a leader must be in the forefront to set an example in all forms of good deeds. The logical consequence of this meaning portrays that *imâm* must be a person of noble character, who always accustoms himself in virtuous deeds, with

---

This verse indirectly confirms to the companions to obey Abdullah who had been given the mandate by the Prophet. Jalaluddin As-Suyuthi, *Ashabun Nuzul*, trans. Qamaruddin Shaleh (Bandung: Penerbit Diponegoro, 1975), p. 134.

30 Abu Husain Ahmad bin Faris bin Zakariya, *Mu’jam Maqayis al-Lughah* (Mesir: Isa al-Bab al-Halab wa Awladuh, 1972), p. 82.
31 Ar-Raghib Al-Asfahani, *Mufradat li Alfazh Al-Qur’an* (Damascus: Daar al-Qalam, 1992), p. 87.
32 Muhammad Sayyid Thanthâwî, *At-Tafsir Al-Wasith* ..., p. 3146-3147.
33 *Ibid.*, p. 202.
34 Siti Patimah, *Manajemen Kepemimpinan Islam: Aplikasinya dalam Organisasi Pendidikan*, (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2015), p. 38.
good ideas, and in bad faith. In other words, not everyone deserves to be an imâm since he must have good personal qualities.

The term ‘imâmah’ in Sunni and Shia views varies in meaning. Among Sunni, imâmah does not differ from Caliph, whereas according to Shia, imâmah does not only have connotations related to government institutions, but also covers all aspects, including the faith, sharia, and so forth. An imam, according to Shia, must come from the lineage of ablu al-Bayt from Ali ibn Abi Thalib.35

In fact, the conception of imâmah in Shia is almost similar to prophethood, because it is purely a gift of Allah and cannot be chosen based on the majority vote of the people. There are at least three conditions that must be fulfilled, including: (1) chosen and appointed by Allah, not the public; (2) possessing insights that covers all aspects of knowledge that are obtained purely from the side of Allah; (3) staying awake from mistakes and sins (ma'shum).36 It may be that such Shia understanding is inspired by the word “imâm” in QS. Al-Baqarah verse 124, which is the basis of the imâmah in risâlab and siyâsab.

Walîy (Awliyâ’)

The word walîy is a form of mufrad, while the plural is awliya’. The term awliya’ is often related to leadership in the Qur’an. The word walîy itself comes from the word “waliya-yaliy-walâyan” which means close to (something/someone). The fi'il madhi can also be read walaa which has several meanings, including mastering, managing, and commanding. The isim fâil of the word walaa is al-waliyyu, contains severe meanings, including those who love, friends, close friends, those who help, those who take care of someone’s case, neighbors, allies, and followers. The isim fâil of the word walîya is al-walîy, which means ruler.37

35 Surahman Amin & Ferry M. Siregar, “Pemimpin dan Kepemimpinan dalam Al-Qur’an”, Tanzil: Jurnal Studi Al-Quran, Vol. 1, No. 1, 2015.
36 Muhammad Taqi Misbah Yazdi, Iman Semesta: Merancang Piramida Keyakinan (Jakarta: Al-Huda, 2005), p. 290.
37 Ahmad Warson Munawwir, Kamus Al-Munawwir…., p. 1582-1583.
In developments, the word *waliyyu* more broadly. It’s also constitutes people who care for or have custody. In other contexts, it can also be interpreted as someone who is given *karâmah* by Allah, since the quality of faith and piety is above average.

**Voting Leaders in the History of Islam**

After the Prophet Muhammad passed away, Muslims experienced a number of ways to cope with leadership. Started from the periods of *khulafa’ rasyidun*, there are several methods to carry out. This happened because the Prophet did not provide definite direction on how to appoint a successor after him. Therefore, *nashbul imâmah* can be categorized into a problem that belongs to the realm of *ijtihad* whose level of truth is not absolute because it is *zhanniy ad-dilâlah*.

History records after the Prophet Muhammad passed away, Muslims felt a different succession process. From the time of Abu Bakar Ash-Siddiq to the Ottoman period, there were variations in the appointment of the leaders of the *ummah*. The ways to appoint a leader are managed by several methods as follows:

**Appointment by a Communities**

This first method was experienced by the first Caliph, Abu Bakar Ash-Shiddiq. After Prophet Muhammad passed away, Muslims experienced turmoil because the he did not appoint one of his companions, specifically to be his successor. As a result, when word got out that the Prophet passed away, several Anshar gathered to appoint the leader from their group. Representatives from the Khazraj tribe proposed Sa’ad ibn Ubadah to be a successor for the Rasulullah in establishing the government of the Muslims. Nevertheless, the Aus sect opposed the idea, so there was a heated debate.38

38 J. Suyuti Pulung, *Fiqh Siyasah* (Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada Utama, 1994), p. 103.
To handle this situation, Umar ibn al-Khattab immediately invited Abu Bakar Ash-Shiddiq to head to the Tsaqifah Banu Sa’idah meeting hall. When they arrived there, Umar and Abu Bakar saw the Muhajirin and the Anshar arguing fiercely. Each felt more entitled to a leadership milestone. Because it was so tough, Hubab ibn al-Munzir then proposed that Muslims chose one leader from the Anshar and one leader from the Muhajirin. The idea, however, was rejected by Umar arguing that “There are no two leaders at the same time and territory.”

Abu Ubadah ibn Jarrah and Bashir ibn Sa’ad tried to soften the atmosphere by inviting Muslims not to prolong this issue. This effort was then followed by Abu Bakar by proposing two caliph candidates, namely: Abu Ubadah and Umar ibn al-Khattab. Nonetheless, both of them actually rejected the proposal because they felt that Abu Bakar was more appropriate to be a Caliph because the Prophet often asked him to be the prayer leader when he was unable to attend. In addition, Abu Bakar could not be doubted his struggle in supporting the propaganda of the Prophet. Afterwards, Basyir ibn Sa’ad was followed by Umar, Abu Ubadah, as well as companions from the Muhajirin and Anshar groups and took allegiance of Abu Bakar ash-Siddiq.

The method of appointment by a some Sahabat could be the foundation of the legality of succession through ablu al-halli wa al-‘aqdi. Because not all Muslims were involved in the procession, but only a few people from the Muhajirin and Anshar groups witnessed the importance of voting for a leader after the death of the Prophet. In this context, ablu al-halli wa al-‘aqdi consisted of companions who were politically aware of the urgency of the problem of the nashb al-imamah. More importantly, they had an objective assessment in voting for leaders that was based on the quality and contribution to the people, not promoting egoism and ethnicity.

---

39 Ibid., p. 104-105.
40 Ibid., p. 105-106.
A similar method was experienced by the fourth Caliph, Ali ibn Abi Thalib. However, the political conditions faced by Ali and his followers were far more complex. Therefore, the appointment of Ali occurred after the murder of Uthman ibn Affan. Likewise, Ali’s allegiance was also marked by rejection and denial by Mu’awiyah ibn Abi Sufyan, the Sham governor, who in fact was Uthman’s family. Mu’awiyah argued that Ali’s obedience was invalid for several reasons, namely: first, Ali had to be responsible for the killing of Uthman by arresting the murderer. Second, Islamic power had expanded, the determination of leadership was no longer the right of companions which lived in Medina.\(^{41}\)

**Appointment of Successor**

This second method of succession was received by Umar ibn al-Khattab. At the time of his death, Abu Bakar Ash-Shiddiq appointed Umar to be Caliph. He called Uthman ibn Affan to write his message in written form. After Abu Bakar’s death, Umar ibn al-Khattab was later confirmed as the second caliph in the public and open oath of allegiance attended by Muslims at the Nabawi Mosque. This election, however, did not occur automatically and based on personal opinions. It was due to the fact that before Abu Bakar had consulted and sought information in advance from senior companions such as Uthman ibn Affan, Abdurrahman ibn Auf, and Asid ibn Khadir.\(^{42}\)

The appointment of Umar by Abu Bakar might have been due to his concern over the potential for fierce debate among companions, as it had happened at the Tsaqifah meeting hall. To avoid disunity, Abu Bakar took the initiative to take this method. In other words, he sought after death, there would be no conflict in the body of the Muslims regarding the appointment of a leader.

\(^{41}\) Munawir Sjadzali, *Islam dan Tata Negara: Ajaran, Sejarah, dan Pemikiran* (Jakarta: UI-Press, 1993), p. 27-28.

\(^{42}\) Ali Mufrodi, *Islam di Kawasan Kebudayaan Arab* (Jakarta: Logos, 1997), p. 53.
Appointm**ent by an Electoral Committee**

The third method was carried out by Uthman ibn Affan. After the attempted assassination by Abu Lu’lu’ah which caused six stab wounds to the body of Umar ibn al-Khattab, the second Caliph then chose six senior companions to negotiate and decide who would succeed the leadership of the Muslims. According to Umar’s message, one of the six companions had to be chosen as the Caliph. They were Uthman ibn Affan, Ali ibn Abi Talib, Talha ibn Ubaidillah, Zubayr ibn Awwam, Sa’ad ibn Abi Waqqash, and Abdurrahman ibn Auf.43

After Umar’s death, the six companions gathered and consulted about the third Caliph. After conducting various discussions, both between the six companions and the Muslims, announced two names of companions who became the main candidates: Uthman ibn Affan and Ali ibn Abi Talib. Due to the seniority and age considerations, Uthman was appointed to be Caliph succeeding Umar.44

Successor Appointment Based on the Inheritance System

The fourth method started in the Umayyad dynasty which was marked by the death of Mu’awiyah ibn Abi Sufyan. During the periods of *al-khulafa’ ar-rasyidun*, the procession of election and allegiance was organized by companions and Muslims in Medina. Furthermore, during the Umayyad period, the appointment of a successor to the caliph was carried out by the Caliph himself and was taken from his family members. At that time, toward the end of his life, Mu’awiyah appointed his son, Yazid, to be the successor. In other words, the monarchy system started to exist from this period.45 The inheritance system continued to exist at the dynasty of Abbasids and Ottoman.

43 Munawir Sjadzali, *Islam dan Tata Negara …*, p. 25.
44 Adeng Muchtar Ghazali, *Perjalanan Politik Umat Islam dalam Lintasan Sejarah* (Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2004), p. 21.
45 Ibid., p. 52.
Criteria of Leaders in the Qur’an

Several criteria of leaders are identified in the Qur’an are described as follows: first, having faith in Allah. This criterion refers to QS. Al-Anbiya’ verse 73. This verse becomes a clear argument that a leader also functions as a binder as well as a liaison between human beings and Allah in terms of spirituality. QS Fathir verse 39 articulating the term khalāif explicitly states that there will be a threat to disbelief, so that it can be understood that unbelievers should not be appointed as imams.46

Second, performing justice and trustworthiness. QS. An-Nisa’ verse 58 becomes the main basis for the criteria of justice for a leader. This verse instructs the leader to hold the mandate entrusted to him and be fair when giving decisions and formulating policies toward his people. The mandate carried by the leader, as cited from Al-Maraghiy’s opinion, is a responsibility that has three dimensions: human responsibility to Allah, responsibility to fellow human beings, and his responsibility to himself.47

It’s also confirmed in QS. Al-Anfal verse 27, the prohibition of betraying Allah and the Prophet is directly related to the prohibition to damage the mandate. This indicates the act of maintaining the mandate is very important, because the order to fulfill the mandate in essence comes from Allah and the Prophet Muhammad. Thus, the misuse of the mandate means defiance of the orders of them.

Third, demonstrating Rasul behavior. It’s mean to try to perform prophet-like personality traits. This criterion refers to Surah Al-Baqarah verse 124 which indicates that leaders must pass various tests and rigorous selection, possess lots of meaningful experience and can be used as role models by the society they lead. In addition, reflecting on the journey of life (sirah) of the Prophet Muhammad, he was a leader who was able to unite various communities, ethnicities, and religions when building Medina. This reveals that it could be known that one of the Prophet’s

46 Surahman Amin and Ferry M. Siregar, “Pemimpin dan Kepemimpinan dalam Al-Qur’an”, Tanzik: Jurnal Studi Al-Quran, Vol. 1, No. 1, 2015, pp. 34.
47 Ibid., pp. 36-37.
personalities that the leader ideally possessed was the attitude of tolerant (tasâmûb). In the Indonesia context which is closely related to unity in diversity, these criteria are in line with the principles articulated in the Pancasila.

In addition to those criteria, Allah asserts other principles of leadership articulated in the Qur’an: first, QS. Asy-Sûrâ verse 38. Allah teaches one of the important criteria for a leader, which is willing to consult in making decisions. It is indicated from the word syûrâ which means deliberation. It is interpreted that “wa amruhum syûrâ bainahum.”

Rasulullah used to consult with the Sababats on matters relating to war and worldly affairs. He did not deliberate on matters of religion as it came directly from Allah, and did not enter the realm of ijtihad. Meanwhile, Sababats were accustomed to deliberating about laws on new problems that did not exist during the Prophet’s time, including those related to leadership after the death of the Prophet Muhammad, the problem of inheritance of a grandfather, and efforts to fight those who godless (murtad).

During the time of the previous ummah, the ideal practice of deliberation was clearly recorded in QS. An-Naml: 32-34. This verse tells the story of Queen Bilqis who asked for the opinions of her superiors regarding a letter from the Prophet Sulaiman which contained an order that the kingdom of Saba be subject to King Solomon. Bilqis said would not make a decision before hearing advice and consideration from her ministers and top brass. The minister suggested that Bilqis responded to the letter with open war, because they had a strong army. However, Bilqis was worried if her kingdom was defeated and people would become slaves. To measure the military power of Sulaiman’s kingdom,

---

48 Ibid., pp. 37.
49 “When believers are confronted with important issues that need to be re-examined, they will gather and deliberate to decide on policies to be taken, which are more likely to bring benefits.” Muhammad Sayyid Thanthâwî, At-Tafsir Al-Wasith ..., p. 3774.
50 Ibid., p. 3775.
Bilqis decided to send a delegation with gifts. She decided not to fight with consideration of the benefit of the people and their people. The attitude to ask questions indicated that she was not an authoritarian leader.

*Second*, QS. Áli ‘Imrán verse 159. In this verse, Allah commands the Prophet Muhammad to be friendly to his *Sahabat*s and invite them to deliberate in solving worldly problems. Allah explains the causality relationship between meekness and loyalty of the followers of the Prophet. Because of his politeness, *Sahabat*s accompanied the struggle of the Prophet.

*Third*, QS. Al-Baqarah Verse 247. Another crucial element should be possessed by a leader is intelligence, as explained in QS. Al-Baqarah verse 247 about the story of the appointment of Thalut as the king of the Bani Israil since he had strengths in physical and scientific aspects. Nevertheless, the Bani Israil protested because they felt more appropriate. The reason for the rejection was because they had a more noble tradition. It implies that there were people who are descended from the king, while Thalut was only the ordinary people. Furthermore, Thalut was also not a wealthy person, like the people of Israel who were in power at that time.⁵¹

Referring to the verses of the Qur’an above, it can be noticed that the criteria of an ideal leader include having faith in Allah, performing justice and trustworthiness, imitating the personality of the Prophet, open-minded, polite and gentle, intelligent and strong in a manner physical. It proposes that Muslims should use these criteria considerations before voting for a leader. The more complete the characteristics possessed by the prospective leader, the more appropriate the position taken, including a president, governor, or people’s representatives.

**Interpretation of “Awliyâ” and its Socio-political Context**

One issue of debate between cleric in establishing the law to elect leaders is the word *awliyâ’* which is contained in various surah in the

---

⁵¹ Muhammad Sayyid Thanthâwî, *At-Tafsir Al-Wasith* …, p. 453.
Qu'r'an. The word *waliyyu* which is a form of *mufrad* of *awliyā’* is stated 33 times. The word *waliyyu* is widely used in the context of sentences that indicate one of Allah’s characters: The Safeguard. Described in QS. Fushshilat: 34, the word *waliyyu* has a different meaning, it is a friend. In this verse, the word *waliyyu* is juxtaposed with the word *hamim*, and then it becomes a series of *sifat-mansâhib*, means a loyal friend. Contrasted the word *waliyyu* possessing two meanings, *awliyā’* actually exposes more variety of meanings. It can be mean into three meanings: leaders, friends, and safeguard.

The *awliyā’* term with the meaning of a ‘leader’ can be seen in QS. Ali Imran verse 28 which forbids Muslims to vote for infidels as leaders, except because of a strategy to protect themselves from something the believers fear from unbelievers. The *awliyā’* with the meaning of a ‘friend’ can be seen in QS. An-Nisa’ verses 76 and 89, which governs Muslims to fight infidels who are not friends of the devil, and therefore believers should not make them friends. Even so, in the same QS. An-Nisa’, verse 139, *awliyā’* is interpreted to mean a ‘leader’. *Dilâlah* which shows this meaning is *illat* of voting for non-Muslim leaders, that is looking for glory (*al-‘izzah*), and then was denied by Allah that all the glory belongs to Him.

In QS. Al-Maidah verse 51, the word *awliyā’* can contain two meanings: leader or friend. *Dilâlah* in the form of the sentence “*wa man yatawallabun min kum fa innahu minhuma*” can have two meanings: whoever of you (faithful) appoints them (kafir) as rulers/friends, they are part of them. The *tawallâ* means giving up a business or making friends. Even though *awliyā’*

---

52 The *waliyy* term is mentioned in QS. Al-Baqarah: 107, 120, 257; Ali Imran: 68; An-Nisa’: 45, 75, 89, 119, 123, 173; Al-An’âm: 14, 51, 70; At-Taubah: 74, 116; Ar-Ra’d: 37; Al-Isra’: 111; Al-Kahf: 17, 26; Al-Ankabut: 32; Maryam: 5, 45; Al-Ahzab: 17, 65; As-Sajdah: 4; Fushshilat: 34; Asy-Syura: 8, 9, 28, 31, 44; Al-Fath: 22; Al-Jatsiyah: 19.

53 The *awliya’* term is stated in QS. Ali Imran: 3; An-Nisa’: 76, 89, 139, 144; Al-Maidah: 51, 57, 81; Al-A’raf: 3, 27, 30; Al-Anfal: 72, 73; At-Taubah: 23, 71; Yunus:62; Hud: 20, 113; Ar-Ra’d: 16; Al-Isra’: 97; Al-Kahf: 50, 102; Al-Furqan: 18; Al-Ankabut: 41; Az-Zumar: 3; Asy-Syura: 6, 9, 46; Al-Jatsiyah: 10, 19; Al-Ahqaf: 32; Al-Mumtahanah: 1; Al-Jum’ah: 6.
Makrum: Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders

is interpreted as a friend, but *mukhâlafah* mean if make relationship with *kafir* are not allowed to vote for them as leaders who govern the Muslims.

To review the suitability of the meaning of QS. Al-Maidah verse 51, it can be noted that the verse that has the same sentence structure becomes *dilâlah*: At-Taubah verse 23. Although at the end of these two verses, there is the phrase “*wa man yatawallahum minkum*”. However, the consequences of these actions differ. In QS. Al-Maidah, the culprit is considered to be the same or one of the *kafir*, while in QS. At-Taubah the culprit is judged as a *fasiq*.

From the historical aspect, the occasion of *asbab al-nuzûl* of Al-Maidah verse 51 has several versions. Abu Ja’far, as cited by Ibn Jarir, stated that the history showed that this verse came down relating to Ubadah ibn Ash-Shamit and Abdullah ibn Ubay ibn Salul and their Jewish allies. In another narration, this verse was related to the attitude of Abi Lubabah toward the Banu Quraizhah.\(^{54}\)

Abu Ja’far said the right opinion, Allah forbids all faithful to make Jews and Christians as allies. Allah also tells us that whoever makes Jews and Christians as allies and leaders, he be part of them alignments to defeat Allah, the Prophet, and the faithful. Abu Ja’far argues, the purpose of the verse is Muslims make Jews and Christians leaders, so they belong to their group. People who leave over leadership issues and help them to defeat the Muslims, he includes adherents of their faithful and religions.”\(^{55}\)

**Conclusion**

This paper can be concluded a partiality for non-Muslims—in this case Jews and Christians—is not permitted in Islam, especially related to the appointment of leaders (*nashb al-imâmah*). Therefore, Muslims are encouraged that in every election, both legislative elections (*Pileg*), regional head elections (*Pilkada*), and presidential elections (*Pilpres*), to make choices based on the faith, regarding their prospective leaders’

\(^{54}\) Ibnu Jarir Ath-Thabariy, *Tafsir Ath-Thabariy…*, p. 398.

\(^{55}\) *Ibid.*, p. 400.
Makrum: *Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders*..................

capabilities and competencies. As for the fulfillment of the rights of non-Muslims as citizens, it is still guaranteed and highly upheld in Islam.
Bibliography

Al-Asfahani, Ar-Raghib, *Mufradat li Alfazh Al-Qur’an*, Damascus: Daar al-Qalam, 1992.

Al-Dimasyqiy, Abu Al-Fida’ Ismail bin Katsir, *Tafsir Al-Qur’an Al-Azhim*, Juz 4, Semarang: Thaha Putra, t.t.

Al-Farmawi, Abdul Hayy, *Metode Tafsir Maudhi’i*, Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada, 1996.

Al-Hambali, Zain Al-Din Abu Al-Faraj Abdurrahman bin Syihab Ad-Din bin Ahmad bin Rajab (Ibnu Rajab), *Jami’ al-Ulum wa al-Hikam fi Syarh Khamsin Hadisan min Jawami’ al-Kalim*, Cairo: Daar as-Salam, 2004.

Al-Juhani, Mani’ bin Hammad, *al-Mausu’ah al-Muyassarah fi al-Adyan wa al-Madzahib wa al-Abzab al-Mu’ashirah*, Riyadh: Daar an-Nadwah al-Alamiyyah li ath-Thiba’ah wa an-Nasyr wa at-Tauzi’, 1420 H.

Al-Qurthubiy, Abu Abdillah, *Tafsir al-Qurthubiyy*, Cairo: Daar asy-Syiab, 1372 H.

Amin, Surahman & Ferry M. Siregar, “Pemimpin dan Kepemimpinan dalam Al-Qur’an”, *Tanzil: Jurnal Studi Al-Quran*, Vol. 1, No. 1, October 2015.

Ar-Razi, Abu Husain Ahmad bin Faris bin Zakariya bin Hubaib, *Mu’jam Muqayis al-Lughah*, Cairo: Maktabah al-Kanji, 1981.

Ar-Razi, Fakhruddin, *At-Tafsir Al-Kabir*, Beirut: Daar al-Fikr, t.t.

As-Suyuthi, Jalal Ad-din dan Jalal Ad-din Al-Mahalli, *Tafsir Al-Jalâlîn*, Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.

As-Suyuthi, Jalal Ad-din, *Ashabun Nuzul*, trans. Qamaruddin Shaleh, Bandung: Penerbit Diponegoro, 1975.

Ath-Thabariy, Ibnu Jarir, *Tafsir Ath-Thabariyy*, Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.

Az-Zamakhsyarî, Abû Al-Qâsim Mahmûd bin Amrû bin Ahmad, *Al-Kasysyâf*, Juz 5, Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.

Epistemé, Vol. 14, No. 2, December 2019 p. 329
Makrum: Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders

Baidan, Nashruddin, *Metodologi Penafsiran Al-Qur’an*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 1998.

Cawidu, Harifuddin, *Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur’an: Suatu Kajian Teologis dengan Pendekatan Tafsir Tematik*, Jakarta: Penerbit Bulan Bintang, 1991.

Departemen Pendidikan Nasional, *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia*, Jakarta: Balai Pustaka, 2002.

Ghazali, Adeng Muchtar, *Perjalanan Politik Umat Islam dalam Lintasan Sejarah*, Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2004.

Jali, Ahmad Muhammad Ahmad, *Dirasah ‘an al-Firaq fi Tariikh al-Muslimin: al-Khawarij wa as-Syi’ab*, Riyadh: Syarikah ath-Thiba’ah al-Arabiyyah as-Sa’udiyah, 1986.

*Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Luar Jaringan (Luring).*

Khuraisat, Shalih, *Tabdzib Tarikh at-Thabari: Tariikh al-Uمام wa al-Muluk*, Oman: Daar al-Fiqr, 1993.

Mufrodi, Ali, *Islam di Kawasan Kebudayaan Arab*, Jakarta: Logos, 1997.

Munawwir, Ahmad Warner, *Kamus Al-Munawwir*, Surabaya: Pustaka Progessif, t.t.

Patimah, Siti, *Manajemen Kepemimpinan Islam: Aplikasinya dalam Organisasi Pendidikan*, Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta, 2015.

Pulungan, J. Suyuti, *Fiqh Siyasah*, Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada Utama, 1994.

Rofiq, Moh., “Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur’an”, *Jurnal Sahaja*, Vol. 4, No. 2, July 2013.

Sjadzali, Munawir, *Islam dan Tata Negara: Ajaran, Sejarah, dan Pemikiran*, Jakarta: UI-Press, 1993.

Thanthawi, Muhammad Sayyid, *At-Tafsir Al-Wasith*, Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.

Tim Sembilan, *Tafsir Mandbu‘i Al-Munta‘ab*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pesantren, 2004.

Yazdi, Muhammad Taqi Misbah, *Iman Semesta: Merancang Piramida Keyakinan*, Jakarta: Al-Huda, 2005.
Makrum: Voting for Non-Muslim Leaders

Zakariya, Abu Husain Ahmad bin Faris bin, *Mu'jam Maqayis al-Lughah*, Mesir: Isa al-Bab al-Halab wa Awladuh, 1972.