On-line Appendix for ‘Marketplace of indicators: Inconsistencies between country trends of measures of the rule of law’

Contents

1 Papers using rule of law indicators ................................................. 2

2 Overview of rule of law, corruption, and democracy indicators .................. 3

3 Correlations between rule of law indicators and democracy indicators ............ 4

4 Correlations among components of rule of law indicators ......................... 5

5 Corruption and democracy indicators ............................................. 10
   5.1 Corruption: Correlations between indicators .................................... 10
   5.2 Democracy: Correlations between indicators ..................................... 10
   5.3 Corruption: Country trends ....................................................... 11
   5.4 Democracy: Country trends ....................................................... 13

6 References .................................................................................. 15
# Papers using rule of law indicators

| Journal                                  | Year | DOI                                           | Indicator | Use      |
|------------------------------------------|------|-----------------------------------------------|-----------|----------|
| American Political Science Review        | 2021 | 10.1017/S0003055420000738                    | WGI*      | dependent|
| British Journal of Political Science     | 2021 | 10.1017/S0007123419000085                    | WGI       | independent|
| Democratization                          | 2019 | 10.1080/13510347.2019.1590815                | WGI       | dependent|
| Democratization                          | 2016 | 10.1080/13510347.2014.993386                 | WGI       | independent|
| Democratization                          | 2019 | 10.1080/13510347.2019.1696310                | VDem      | dependent|
| European Journal of Political Research   | 2016 | 10.1111/1475-6765.12130                      | WGI       | independent|
| European Political Science Review        | 2020 | 10.1017/S1755773920000259                    | DB        | dependent|
| International Political Science Review   | 2016 | 10.1177/0192512116639747                     | WGI       | dependent|
| Journal of European Public Policy        | 2019 | 10.1080/13501763.2018.1478877               | WGI**     | independent|
| Journal of European Public Policy        | 2020 | 10.1080/13501763.2020.1855465               | VDem      | dependent|

Note: VDem = Varieties of democracy, WGI = Worldwide Governance Indicators, DB = Democracy Barometer. * WGI and Freedom House in the main analysis and Polity IV and VDem as robustness checks in the appendix; **WGI as a general rule of law indicator and World Justice Project as an indicator of the criminal justice system.
2 Overview of rule of law, corruption, and democracy indicators

Rule of law:

Varieties of Democracy: Rule of law index (v2x_rule) takes into account conditions of electoral democracy as well as the presence of protection of rights and liberties, rule of law, and judicial independence (Coppedge et al. 2020: 43).

IDEA: measures of *Impartial Administration* (C_A4), one of five attributes of democracy, which “concerns how fairly and predictably political decisions are implemented” (IDEA 2019: 248). It includes two subattributes: *Absence of Corruption* and *Predictable Enforcement*. The *Impartial administration* measure consist of 7 out of the 14 VDem indicators included in the rule of law index described above, as well as two indicators from the International Country Risk Guide on corruption and bureaucratic quality (Tufis 2017).

Democracy Barometer: The Rule of law index (RULEOFLAW) includes equality before the law and the quality of the legal system (Merkel et al. 2018a, 2018b).

Corruption:

Varieties of Democracy: Political corruption index (v2x_corr) measures the pervasiveness of political corruption based on expert assessment of the level of public sector, executive, legislative, and judicial corruption (Coppedge et al. 2020: 279).

Worldwide Governance Indicators: Control fo Corruption (cc_est) ‘captures perceptions of the extent to which public power is exercised for private gain, including both petty and grand forms of corruption, as well as “capture” of the state by elites and private interests’, and combines about 50 indicators from about 30 different sources (World Bank 2019).

IDEA: The Absence of corruption variable (C_SD41) combines expert-coded corruption scores from VDem and from the International Country Risk Guide (Tufis 2017, 41).

Democracy Barometer: The Absence of corruption scale (TR_NOSEC2) includes corruption assessments from the International Country Risk Guide as well as the Corruption Perceptions Index from Transparency International (Merkel et al. 2018a, 2018b).

Democracy:

Varieties of Democracy: Liberal democracy index (v2x_libdem) takes into account conditions of electoral democracy as well as the presence of protection of rights and liberties, rule of law, and judicial independence (Coppedge et al. 2020: 43).

IDEA: Four dimensions: Representative government (C_A1), Fundamental rights (C_A2), Checks on Government (C_A3), and Impartial administration (C_A4), combining almost 100 indicators. The authors note a fifth dimension – Participatory engagement – but discourage users from using a composite index and recommend individual indicators of different types of participation instead (Tufis 2017, 18–19). For the present analysis we took the mean of the four dimensions.

Democracy Barometer: The Democratic Quality index (DQ) combines indicators three principles (Equality, Control, and Freedom), each composed of functions and components, combined via aggregation rules. Democracy is defined broadly to include liberal and participatory ideas, and is measured with 100 indicators from different sources (Merkel et al. 2018a, 2018b).
3 Correlations between rule of law indicators and democracy indicators

The democracy indicators used in this section have their rule-of-law components eliminated:

- the VDem Liberal democracy index (v2x_libdem) has parts of the Liberal component index (v2x_liberal) removed,
- IDEA's democracy index had the Impartial administration (C_A4) component removed,
- DB's Democratic Quality index (DQ) had the Rule of Law (RULEOFLAW) component removed.

| Variables | Overall | Between countries | Mean within countries |
|-----------|---------|-------------------|-----------------------|
| VDem democracy - VDem rule of law | 0.92 | 0.93 | 0.31 |
| VDem democracy - IDEA rule of law | 0.83 | 0.85 | 0.29 |
| VDem democracy - DB rule of law | 0.68 | 0.72 | -0.01 |
| IDEA democracy - VDem rule of law | 0.89 | 0.92 | 0.33 |
| IDEA democracy - IDEA rule of law | 0.91 | 0.93 | 0.39 |
| IDEA democracy - DB rule of law | 0.77 | 0.81 | -0.02 |
| DB democracy - VDem rule of law | 0.64 | 0.70 | 0.08 |
| DB democracy - IDEA rule of law | 0.72 | 0.76 | 0.11 |
| DB democracy - DB rule of law | 0.70 | 0.75 | 0.07 |
4 Correlations among components of rule of law indicators

Varieties of Democracy (Coppedge et al. 2020)

v2x_rule = Rule of law index
v2juhccomp = compliance with high court
v2jucomp = compliance with judiciary
v2juchind = high court independence
v2juncind = lower court independence
v2exrescon = executive respects constitution
v2chrspect = rigorous and impartial public administration
v2cltrnslw = transparent laws with predictable enforcement
v2clacjstm = access to justice for men
v2clacjstw = access to justice for women
v2juacctnt = judicial accountability
v2jucorrdec = judicial corruption decision
v2excrtpts = public sector corrupt exchanges
v2exthftps = public sector theft
v2exbribe = executive bribery and corrupt exchanges
v2exembez = executive embezzlement and theft

Democracy Barometer (Merkel et al. 2018a)

RULEOFLAW = Rule of law index
RL_EQL = Equality before the law
RL_EQL1 = Constitutional provisions for impartial courts
Constfair = Constitutional provisions for fair organization of court system
Pubtrial = Existence of constitutional provisions guaranteeing a public trial
RL_EQL2 = Effective independence of the judiciary
Judindepcor = Judicial independence
Judindepinf = Assessment of the independence of the judiciary
RL_EQL3 = Effective impartiality of the legal system
Impcourts = Impartial Courts
Intgrlegal = Strength and impartiality of the legal system (not available in the public data)
RL_QUAL = Quality of the legal system
RL_QUAL1 = Constitutional provisions for judicial professionalism
Profjudg = Professionalism is a constitutional precondition for appointment of judges to highest courts
Proftenure = Professionalism of judges concerning length of tenure is written in the constitution
RL_QUAL2 = Confidence in the justice system
Confjust = Confidence in the legal system
Fairjust = Assessment of the confidence in the fair administration of justice in the society
RL_QUAL3 = Confidence in the police
Confpolice = Confidence in the police
Fairpolice = Assessment of reliability/effectiveness of the police services

Global State of Democracy (Tufis 2017)

C_A4 = Impartial administration index
C_SD41 = Absence of corruption
v_41_01 = Public sector corrupt exchanges (V-Dem’s v2excrptps)
v_41_02 = Public sector theft (V-Dem’s v2exthftps)
v_41_03 = Executive embezzlement and theft (V-Dem’s v2exembez)
v_41_04 = Executive bribery and corrupt exchanges (V-Dem’s v2exbribe)
v_41_05 = Corruption (International Country Risk Guide)

C_SD42 = Predictable enforcement
v_42_01 = Executive respects constitution (V-Dem’s v2exrescon)
v_42_02 = Transparent laws with predictable enforcement (V-Dem’s v2cltrnslw)
v_42_03 = Rigorous and impartial public administration (V-Dem’s v2chrspct)
v_42_04 = Bureaucratic quality (International Country Risk Guide)

Worldwide Governance Indicators (Kaufmann, Kraay, and Mastruzzi 2011)

Note: To facilitate presentation, the raw indicators, of which there are around 200, were aggregated within the data sources, which is the first step in WGI’s aggregation procedure.

rl_est = Rule of law index
ADB = African Development Bank Country Policy and Institutional Assessments
AFR = Afrobarometer
BPS = Business Enterprise Environment Survey
BTI = Bertelsmann Transformation Index
EIU = Economist Intelligence Unit Riskwire & Democracy Index
FRH = Freedom House
GCS = World Economic Forum Global Competitiveness Report
GII = Global Integrity Index
GWP = Gallup World Poll
HER = Heritage Foundation Index of Economic Freedom
IFD = IFAD Rural Sector Performance Assessments
IPD = Institutional Profiles Database
LBO = Latinobarometro
PIA = World Bank Country Policy and Institutional Assessments
PRS = Political Economic Risk Consultancy Corruption in Asia Survey
TPR = US State Department Trafficking in People report
VAB = Vanderbilt University Americas Barometer
VDM = Varieties of Democracy Project
WCY = Institute for Management and Development World Competitiveness Yearbook
WJP = World Justice Project Rule of Law Index
WMO = Global Insight Business Conditions and Risk Indicators
Figure 1: Correlations across countries and years of rule of law indicators and their components.
Figure 2: Correlations among country means of rule of law indicators and their components.
Figure 3: Means of within-country correlations of rule of law indicators and their components.
5 Corruption and democracy indicators

5.1 Corruption: Correlations between indicators

Table 3: Correlations between pairs of corruption indicators

| Overall      | Between countries | Average within countries |
|--------------|-------------------|--------------------------|
| DB           | WGI   | IDEA | DB    | WGI   | IDEA | DB    | WGI   | IDEA |
| VDem         | 0.85  | 0.92 | 0.95  | 0.89  | 0.93 | 0.95  | 0     | 0.15 | 0.62 |
| DB           | 0.96  | 0.89 | 0.93  | 0.99  | 0.93 | 0.41  | 0.15  | 0.21 |
| WGI          | 0.93  |      | 0.95  |       |      |       |       |      |

5.2 Democracy: Correlations between indicators

Table 4: Correlations between pairs of democracy indicators

| Overall      | Between countries | Average within countries |
|--------------|-------------------|--------------------------|
| DB           | IDEA  | VDem | DB    | IDEA  |      | DB    | IDEA  |      |
| DB           | 0.85  |      | 0.75  | 0.93  | 0.8  | 0.95  |       | 0.22 |
| VDem         | 0.8   | 0.95 | 0.8   | 0.95  |      |       | 0.61  |      |

| DB           | IDEA  | 0.89 | 0.27 |
5.3 Corruption: Country trends

Figure 4: Corruption trends according to different indicators (Albania - India).
Figure 5: Corruption trends according to different indicators (Ireland - Venezuela).
5.4 Democracy: Country trends

Figure 6: Democracy trends according to different indicators (Argentina - Greece).
Figure 7: Democracy trends according to different indicators (Hungary - Uruguay).
6 References

Coppedge, Michael, John Gerring, Carl Henrik Knutsen, Staffan I Lindberg, Jan Teorell, David Altman, Michael Bernhard, et al. 2020. “V-Dem Codebook v10.” Varieties of Democracy (V-Dem) Project. https://www.v-dem.net/media/filer_public/28/14/28140582-43d6-4940-948f-a2df8a31893/v-dem_codebook_v10.pdf.

IDEA. 2019. The Global State of Democracy 2019: Addressing the Ills, Reviving the Promise. International Institute for Democracy; Electoral Assistance. https://doi.org/10.31752/idea.2019.31.

Kaufmann, Daniel, Aart Kraay, and Massimo Mastruzzi. 2011. “The Worldwide Governance Indicators: Methodology and Analytical Issues.” *Hague Journal on the Rule of Law* 3: 220–46.

Merkel, Wolfgang, Daniel Bochsler, Karima Bousbah, Marc Bühlmann, Heiko Giebler, Miriam Hänni, Lea Heyne, et al. 2018a. “Democracy Barometer. Codebook. Version 6.” Aarau: Zentrum für Demokratie. http://www.democracybarometer.org/Data/Codebook_all%20countries_1990-2016.pdf.

———. 2018b. “Democracy Barometer. Methodology. Version 6.” Aarau: Zentrum für Demokratie. http://www.democracybarometer.org/Data/Methodological_Explanatory_1990-2016.pdf.

Tufis, Claudio D. 2017. The Global State of Democracy Indices: Technical Procedures Guide. Stockholm: International Institute for Democracy; Electoral Assistance. https://doi.org/10.31752/idea.2018.74.

World Bank. 2019. “Control of Corruption: Number of Sources.” https://datacatalog.worldbank.org/control-corruption-number-sources.