A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): Parents’ and Teachers’ Perspectives

Dr. Muhammad Makki Kakar
Doctoral Researcher Sociology, Centre of Excellence for Results Based Management, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Pakistan.
Email: makkikakar@gmail.com

Dr. Farhan Navid Yousaf
Associate Professor, Institute of Social and Cultural Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan.
Email: drfarhan.iscs@pu.edu.pk

Dr. Muhammad Shoaib
Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology, University of Gujrat, Pakistan.
Email: shoaibsoc@uog.edu.pk

Received on: 26-01-2022 Accepted on: 28-02-2022

Abstract
This qualitative study aimed to highlight parents’ and teachers’ perspectives on school reforms during 2013-2020 in Balochistan. This study is informed by the epistemological cannons of interpretivists’ tradition. In this research, qualitative research design is used, and exploratory research method is employed. A sample size of 20 participants was interviewed through In-depth interview schedule that includes ten parents and teachers each working in public schools. Moreover, purposive sampling technique was employed to interview the Teachers and parents whose children are studying in public schools. Thus, the data were recorded, transcribed, and interpreted through thematic analysis. The study found that free text provision, teacher training, teachers capacity building, the medium of instruction, infrastructure provision, curriculum development, monitoring, and evaluation system still require great attention of the concerned authority to properly implement the reforms and promote literacy in the area. The study suggests that the education sector plan should be seriously implemented with the provision of required resources to observe the prosperous future of Balochistan public schools.

Keywords: Curriculum, Evaluation, Infrastructure, Monitoring, Reforms, Textbook.

Introduction
Education has been a significant factor to bring change by reforming society for ages. Globally, change is attributed to the well-designed education system producing effective reforms and policies. Similarly, Gleeson, Klenowski, and Looney (2020) revealed that the smooth
A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...
in Pakistan along with 560,642 (43% in public and 57% in the private sector) teachers (Education, 2018). Furthermore, the dropout and enrollment rate in Balochistan is at the bottom of the four provinces of Pakistan (Mughal, 2020). Moreover, it is pertinent to mention here that only 1,091 high schools (with total of 2,195 classrooms) are in Balochistan with an enrollment of 75,651 students and the total number of teachers 22,948 (Education, 2018).

Research Questions
This study is guided by the following research questions in line with the reformation at the public-school level.
1. Do the government authorities of education department provide the free textbooks to students at elementary school level?
2. Does government ensure the transparent recruitment of teachers in schools?
3. How the teachers are provided training opportunities along with smooth working/teaching environment, including infrastructure, for the quality education at schools?
4. What is the mechanism of bridging the teachers and parents to enhance the cooperation to know and evaluate the performance of the student in schools?
5. How effective monitoring and evaluation system exist at elementary school level?

Review of Literature
A substantial body of literature has been conducted on school reforms in the developing and developed world (e.g., Puad & Ashton, 2020; Roberts & King, 2020). This heap of literature shows that the school reforms have been taken up by both developed and developing countries. However, the situation is different in developed and developing countries. As developed nations have achieved benchmarks by reforming the public schools thus their education system further developed. On the other hand, the education system in developing countries despite of efforts and considerable spending, still remain ineffective. A large number of studies have been conducted on different aspects of the reforms related issues in public schools across the world. It also included studies conducted on qualified teaching staff, research-based education, incompetent administration, financial budget, examination standards, educational facilities (Rushton & Reiss, 2020; Schachter, Flynn, Napoli, & Piasta, 2020; Sheppard, Wollfer, & Talbert, 2020). Moreover, Abdullah (2020) asserted that multiform frameworks of education in Pakistan are the source of inequality and the main hurdle to unanimous reforms (Slabbert & Naudé, 2020; Smyth, 2020). A great issue of the medium is being faced by the students in public, private, and Madrassas. For example, Urdu is a medium of instruction in public schools and English in private schools while Arabic in Madrassas (Puad & Ashton, 2020). Similarly, it is also an issue in Iran where Persian is the language and Saudi Arabia and other Gulf countries where the education is in the local languages. Moreover, the issue also exists in India and most of the African countries where the policies are made according to the international standards but when applied these misfit with the existing system. These either don’t correlate with the local system or have the higher standard order that are not met by the schools. In Pakistan, education is perceived as a source of materialism rather than the inevitable basic right according to the religious injections [Holy Quran] and the universal declaration of human rights (UDHR). Thus, there exists a wide
A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

gap in reforming the school education either on the religious or modern lines. Although, efforts are made in every regime to restructure the public-school policy however it has never been equitable. So, here is the point to ponder about the unanimous education policy enforcing an undisputed syllabus that will equally benefit the humans and society (Xiong, Warwick, & Chalies, 2020; Yuen, Lee, & Chung, 2020). It is thus found from research that most of the developing countries either set the international standards in reforms or miss the local context and leading towards failure to achieve the considerable goals. As it will address the issues of poor educational policies, shortage of quality instructors, lack of scientific laboratories are such components that declined the significance of compulsory education in society (Stunell, 2020; Su, Guo, & Wang, 2020; Szeto, Sin, & Leung, 2020; Wills, 2020).

According to Jabeen (2020), Pakistan is found low proficient in comparison to other developing nations i.e., India, Sri Lanka, Iran, South Africa. For example, low financial budget, poor quality of educational projects, incompetent administration, and supervision contribute to less proficiency of the country in Pakistan (Slabbert & Naudé, 2020; Smyth, 2020; Stavrou, 2020). Similarly, the imbalance of three different levels of education including public, private, and religious proved obstacles in transforming the system (Smits & Janssenswillen, 2020). Moreover, such disparities obstructed the unanimous system of education in Pakistan followed by the ill intention of the legislators (Rushton & Reiss, 2020; Schachter et al., 2020; Sheppard et al., 2020). Worldwide, education is a three-tier process i.e., primary, secondary, and higher secondary. As primary education is considered the cornerstone in education and the rest of the secondary and higher level is built on it (Roberts & King, 2020). In education, monitoring and evaluation have a significant impact on the construction of education reforms and policies by providing the base to sort out the loopholes and address in the reform process (Stunell, 2020). Therefore, the mechanism of monitoring and evaluation is only documented and unable to evaluate the progress of the education department (Muckenthaler et al., 2020; Sheppard et al., 2020). Besides, the inclusion of parents and teachers in the development of the new curriculum and its implementation may bear fruitful results to the school reforms (Kauppinen et al., 2020; Lazareva & Zakharov, 2020; Mankki et al., 2020).

Worldwide, literature revealed that various societies took initiatives of educational reforms and successfully executed and found the greater outcomes in transforming the education system (Erdreich, 2020; Gleeson et al., 2020; Henderson, Williams, & Bradshaw, 2020). Elacqua, Sánchez, and Santos (2020) unveiled those educational reforms in developed countries paved the way forward to the development of education. Similar reforms might patronize the education system in developing countries. Jang (2020) argued that the minor reforms in the traditional educational system may give rise to scientific reforms. It may be advantageous to the students' learning and achievements on a large scale (Sakirudeen & Uwe, 2020). Reforms in the education system would turn the educational system technologically and scientifically sound (Muckenthaler et al., 2020; Proctor et al., 2020; Roberts & King, 2020). While reforming, the curriculum bureau/wing may prove helpful to introduced different new methods of teaching (Sheppard et al., 2020; Smyth, 2020; Stunell, 2020). Similarly, many reforms such as public and private financial resources available for training and education of teachers might be introduced (Masbiorotni et al., 2020; Proctor et al., 2020). Consequently, a quality education system would fulfill the demand for educated
professionals and skilled laborers to compete with the national and international market and a benchmark of equality would be achieved (Mankki et al., 2020; Stunell, 2020). Since the inception of Pakistan, a series of education policies were developed to meet the challenges in the education system (Faroqui & Forbes, 2020; Mughal, 2020), however not even a single educational policy was implemented so far. Almost all the policies were developed for five years of plans (Tripathi & Raghuvanshi, 2020). Unfortunately, such policies were not able to define the unanimous education system in Pakistan and yet to meet the international standards of education (Faroqui & Forbes, 2020; Khan et al., 2020). As the constitution of the state-guaranteed the right to education according to article 37 b & c of the 1973 constitution by taking responsibility to eradicate illiteracy and ensure the provision of all sorts of education. It is also coupled with improving the quality of textbooks, an increase in education funds, provision of teacher training, and compulsory primary education (Faroqui & Forbes, 2020).

Since the 18th amendment in Pakistan, education was subjected to the provinces by the federal government. Soon after the development, the Balochistan education sector plan (2013-2018) was launched for five years by the collation government of Balochistan in 2013. It aimed to introduce reforms in the education sector to improve the quality of education. Major educational reforms include an increase in enrollment ratio, up-gradation of schools, provision of infrastructure, provision of textbooks, curriculum development, instrumental scientific laboratories, recruitment transparency, free cheating environment, the proper medium of instruction, gender unbiased school education, teachers training, monitoring and evaluation and inclusive education (Faroqui & Forbes, 2020). This policy plan is still not executed to reform the schools to draw some robust results.

Materials and Methods
This research was fashioned in the epistemological cannons of interpretivist tradition. In this tradition, the phenomenon was explored by using qualitative research design while an exploratory research method was employed to know about the problems being faced by the teachers and parents in the public sector school of Balochistan. In this research, we included two important stakeholders as the participants comprising parents and teachers. The objective was to know about the teachers’ and parents’ perspective on the school reforms. A sample size of 20-25 was selected for the study by using the purposive sampling technique. Owing to the nature of phenomenon being explored, an insight of the problem was required, thus, we designed and employed the in-depth interview guide to gather the data from participants. The ethical approval was taken from each participant on the page associate with the interview guide. However, every participant was asked to read the statement of research ethics that further keeps the indemnity and information of the participant anonymous. After compete understanding and approval, the participants were interviewed. The interview guide consisted ----- questions. Among the 20-25 participants, 20 participants i.e., 10 teachers and 10 parents of students from different public sector schools in the Quetta district of Balochistan province were interviewed. As saturation was achieved on every 10th participant both in the case of Teachers and Parents. All these schools were affiliated with the Balochistan Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BBISE), Quetta. Similarly, the teachers were from a few of these schools working as Senior School Teachers (SSTs), and those parents were
interviewed whose children were students in these schools. This research was conducted from April 2020 to July 2020. Each interview lasted for 40-60 minutes, and each participant was interviewed once. The participants, senior schoolteachers (SSTs), were selected from the different public sector schools. By using in-depth interviews as a technique of data collection in order to obtain information from the participants. We captured the personal experiences of each participant in audio tape while notes were also taken. To maintain the accuracy, all the interviews were recorded with the consent of the participants. Another purpose of recording was to overcome the natural limitation and human memories and the intuitive glosses that may have occurred because of listening and writing. As the transcribed interviews are subjected to thematic analysis. We allowed them to re-examine the interview recording. Thus, we organized and prepared the collected data for analysis by repeatedly listening the audio recordings of interviews to get an insight of every interview and to make sure that questions were responded. We thus transcribed the recording and read line to line to include each significant statement relevant to the topic according to the patterns of themes. It was to ensure the deep understanding and comprehensive explanation of the data.

Similarly, the participants were given pseudonyms (see table below) to keep the identity confidential. Finally, we analyzed and presented the results and concluded the study.

**Table 1: Pseudonyms of participants**

| No. | Teachers’ Pseudonyms | No. | Parents’ Pseudonyms |
|-----|----------------------|-----|---------------------|
| 1   | Teacher-A            | 1   | Parent-A            |
| 2   | Teacher-B            | 2   | Parent-B            |
| 3   | Teacher-C            | 3   | Parent-C            |
| 4   | Teacher-D            | 4   | Parent-D            |
| 5   | Teacher-E            | 5   | Parent-E            |
| 6   | Teacher-F            | 6   | Parent-F            |
| 7   | Teacher-G            | 7   | Parent-G            |
| 8   | Teacher-H            | 8   | Parent-H            |
| 9   | Teacher-I            | 9   | Parent-I            |
| 10  | Teacher-J            | 10  | Parent-J            |

**Ethical Consideration**

This study carries human subject thus at school level/district level there is no ethical review board to evaluate and provide the ethical approval for research. However, Ethical Institutional Review Board (IRB) of university has provided the approval to conduct this research. The approval can be provided.

**Results and Discussion**

This study aimed to examine the teachers’ and parents’ perspectives regarding the school reforms in Balochistan from 2013 to 2020. School reforms have great significance in restructuring the public schools worldwide. As effective school reforms are witnessed in developed countries. It further incapacitated the educational reforms at large scale, thus, the
A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

The educational system progressed in developed countries. On the other hand, reform in developing countries although brought however remained ineffective in most of the countries including Pakistan. As it is revealed that the school reforms at elementary level have been effective in Pakistan. It is pertinent to mention here that this research in in the context of developing countries i.e., Pakistan where although efforts are made to reform the public schools however failed to restructure the educational institution at elementary level. We extracted different sub themes from the broad themes undertaken for the study. After careful treatment of recording, we have categorically transcribed the narratives of the teachers and parents. Thus, the findings stemming out of transcription is interpreted through thematic analysis as follows.

**Distribution of free textbooks at the school level**

Distribution of free textbooks in the school level remained one of the priorities under school reforms in Balochistan. As it was aimed to enhance the enrollment rate by providing basic education unanimously to the marginalized children in the region. However, many loopholes in the provision of the free textbooks were expressed by the parents and teachers collectively free textbooks were not provided before the commencement of the annual session. Moreover, students usually received free textbooks late therefore teachers faced problems for day-to-day teaching lessons. Additionally, the distribution of free textbooks was not according to the needs of students and badly affected students’ class performance. Similarly, parents were also unhappy with the provision of free textbooks as they witnessed that the books were neither available in school nor market (Drake, 2020; Smyth, 2020). One of the parents said, “It is difficult to get all the books, set of books, at one time. So, the provision of books is uneven and unavailable to the people”. Several researchers also assert similar study findings across the world that the problems in the provision of books have been faced by the parents and students (Ihmeideh et al., 2020; Li, Li, Devlieghere, & Vandenbroeck, 2020; Proctor et al., 2020).

The inclusion of free textbooks was a stimulus to promote education and enhance the enrollment rate. Thus, we found that most parents and teachers were unhappy with the provision of free textbooks before the commencement of annual classes. However, free textbooks were not provided according to the need of students. Most of the teachers endorsed the argument of the parents that, “books are not provided in time so that education of children would not be disturbed”. The similar nature of findings have also been reported in developing countries (Breidenstein, Krüger, & Roch, 2020; Davy & Cordoba, 2020; Drake, 2020; Erdreich, 2020).

**Teachers’ training and recruitments**

Recruitment of teachers on merit is one of the components where qualified teachers are required to be hired. To further train the newly appointed teachers, teacher training is the essential component to build the capacity of teachers. So, it was added as school reform in Balochistan. Parents and teachers observed that teachers do not possess professional qualifications as they were not provided in-service teacher training either by the Department of Education or any other private education organization. However, most of the teachers were unaware of reforms introduced at the provincial level in Balochistan. Most of the teachers
shared experiences as “teacher training is not unanimously available to the newly recruited teachers moreover the mechanism of training does not even employ to rest of the teachers”. One of the teachers highlighted the political influence in such a way, “all those who politically influence in the department are given training and in almost every training they get nominated while leaving no room for newly recruited teachers”. Regarding the transparent recruitment policy, they were satisfied and appreciated the measures taken in recruiting the new teachers. As far as the salary packages are concerned, teachers were found dissatisfied with the salary packages they offered (Mankki et al., 2020; Oliemat et al., 2020; Stunell, 2020). It is worth mentioning that our findings are similar to the several research works conducted in the developing and developed countries in terms of teachers’ training and recruitment procedures (Rushton & Reiss, 2020; Schachter et al., 2020; Sheppard et al., 2020; Slabbert & Naudé, 2020).

Professional qualification is the backbone of any discipline (Lazareva & Zakharov, 2020; Muckenthaler et al., 2020). Concerning the teachers’ professional qualifications, most of the teachers were found less qualified. Similarly, teachers were disappointed in the poor implementation of teacher training and awareness programs regarding educational reforms. On the other hand, most parents and teachers were contented with the trend of meritocracy in recruitments. Most of the respondents agreed that “Newly recruited teachers are less likely qualified according to the professional requirements”. Similar findings were also reported by Farooqi and Forbes (2020) revealing the lack of professional qualifications and training among the newly appointed teachers in Pakistan.

Cooperation between teachers and parents
The involvement of teachers and parents in policy-making has been a salient feature in the reform process the world over (Jabar, 2020) however the teachers and parents were kept out of the realm of reforms process at the school level in Balochistan. We found that parents do not know about the school reforms initiated by the government and alienated them intentionally while teachers-parents council or school management committees were not established to proceed with the discussions of teachers and parents regarding the issues of the education. However, negligence on the part of parents is also observed as most of the parents neither inquired about the performance of children nor interested in school reforms. Moreover, parents do not motivate children towards the significance of education and found less cooperative with teachers to resolve the issue of dropout rate at the school level (Mughal, 2020). Similarly, parents and teachers lack cooperation for the educational development of children. Most of the respondents agreed that “Negligence is found on both ends of teachers and parents where education of children is nevertheless monitored by both stakeholders. Likewise, there is no system of school management teachers’ committees (SMC) for the interaction of parents and teachers to discuss the performance of the children”. Several studies across the globe revealed that parents’ and teachers’ interaction and involvement significantly affect the student learning outcomes (Lopes & Oliveira, 2020; Slabbert & Naudé, 2020; Stunell, 2020; Wills, 2020). As parents’ teachers’ cooperation is a compulsory element of educational development worldwide (Li et al., 2020). It is thus concluded that parents were not aware of reforms and do not cooperate with teachers. Furthermore, teachers were also worried about the lack of interest in a childhood education as indicated by different
researches (Farooqi & Forbes, 2020).

**Teachers’ capacity at the school level**

It is a significant fact that enhancing the teachers’ capacity is necessary to introduce the educational reforms at the school level (Slabbert & Naudé, 2020). The opinion on the phenomenon was inquired from parents and teachers. All the participants identified the shortage and saturation of teaching staff at the school level depending upon the rural-urban segregation. Moreover, teachers do not strategize to facilitate students’ learning. Furthermore, the implementation of reforms is dependent on the availability of qualified teaching staff, but the province is mainly experiencing a shortage of staff [both teaching and administrative staff] by and large. Therefore, parents and teachers explained issues that build the capacities of teachers will be a milestone in the promotion and implementation of reforms at the school level. All the participants explained, “Professional capacity of teachers should be enhanced to take the responsibilities and improve the learning of the students to perform efficiently”. Similarly, different studies revealed that the capacity of teachers significantly matters in terms of students’ academic performance (Knight, 2020; Lopes & Oliveira, 2020; Puad & Ashton, 2020). It is obvious that competent teachers deliver more and try to develop a friendly learning environment for students as reported by several researchers (Muckenthaler et al., 2020; Stavrou, 2020; Stunell, 2020). Teachers’ capacity building plays a vital role in the promotion of quality education (Lopes & Oliveira, 2020). We found parents and teachers dissatisfied due to the shortage of qualified teachers. As the existing staff is overloaded and the promotion of education is an uphill task in such a situation. Moreover, teachers do not strategize to guide students properly (Farooqi & Forbes, 2020). Consequently, the academic performance of students suffers from tertiary level education (Muckenthaler et al., 2020; Puad & Ashton, 2020; Stavrou, 2020). Most of the participants explained, “Government should take measures to provide staff to improve the learning of the students”.

**The working environment for teachers**

Globally, a conducive working environment for teachers has also been the focus of educational reforms generally in education and particularly at the school level (Su et al., 2020). In this regard, parents and teachers demonstrated that the socio-cultural environment has always been a bottleneck in introducing reforms. Parents shared their experiences that the current environment is not helpful for educational reforms to empower society however teachers believed that the current working environment is better to initiate the reforms. Both the stakeholders have a different view of introducing the educational reforms. All the parents were of the view, “Presently the environment is not conducive for the education reforms while teachers are in the favor of reforms”. It has also been found in the developing world that a proper work environment is not provided to teachers for class preparation and student guidance (Knight, 2020; Lazareva & Zakharov, 2020; Li et al., 2020; Stunell, 2020). Resultantly, it affected the performance of students in schools (Muckenthaler et al., 2020). Worldwide, a better working environment paves the way for the implementation of reforms (Paredes-Chi & Viga-de Alva, 2020; Puad & Ashton, 2020). We found that parents and teachers could not find a better environment to initiate reforms in society. While parents and
teachers are concerned to promote a better learning environment for students in schools (Amod, 2020). As the environment is not teacher-student friendly. Thus, a conducive teaching and learning environment is significant for students’ academic performance and education reforms (Slabbert & Naudé, 2020; Stunell, 2020) that may be helpful at a higher level of studies (Li et al., 2020; Wills, 2020).

**Provision of infrastructure**

The provision of infrastructure has been the backbone of any institution the world over (Roberts & King, 2020). We found that infrastructure plays an important role in the introduction of educational reforms at the school level as a stimulus to increase enrollment ratio. It has been observed by the Parents that the infrastructure of schools was neither constructed nor renovated. However, the repair of old classrooms was not heeded. Furthermore, parents and teachers shared that boundary walls, water supply, gas provision, electricity supply, furniture, and teaching material has been mainly found missing in most of the schools. Therefore, reforms were not very effective at the school level. Most of the participants said, "There is a need to improve the infrastructure in most of the schools while providing the other facilities to promote the education in schools". In Pakistan, several studies highlight that public sector schools are mainly deprived of proper physical infrastructure (Chen & Teo, 2020; Farooqi & Forbes, 2020; Hautz, 2020). Moreover, it is also noted that teachers and students both have improper seating arrangements in terms of infrastructure. Consequently, parents prefer to send their children to private schools. However, the cost of private school also matters for parents specifically in Balochistan. Thus, lack of physical infrastructure in public sector schools also adds to the problems not only for students but also for teachers and students generally in developing countries and specifically in Pakistan (Mughal, 2020).

The provision of proper infrastructure in schools is still a dream for many developing countries (Puad & Ashton, 2020), including Pakistan (Khan et al., 2020). One of the participants said, "Schooling infrastructure is nevertheless priority of the authorities that significantly affects the reforms where children do not have the proper place to sit and study while teaching aids are missing in most of the schools". Similarly, all the parents showed dissatisfaction with the provision of infrastructures such as rooms, water, electricity, gas, furniture, and teaching material or library. All the participants said, "There is an uneven distribution in the provision of cluster fund however the utilization by schools is also found inappropriate". Additionally, the lack of facilities is mainly contributing to high dropout and low enrollment in the region (Mughal, 2020). Consequently, a low literacy rate has been found as compared to other regions stemming from chain reaction i.e., poverty, conflicts, and lack of awareness (McMullen & Eaton, 2020; Puad & Ashton, 2020).

**Monitoring and evaluation system at the school level**

Globally, every institution has its monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system to monitor and measure the performance and sway the loopholes to sharpen the working capacity of teachers and administrative staff (Qazi, 2020). Similarly, a monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system exists in the educational system however remained nonfunctional in Pakistan. Keeping in view educational reforms, only teachers were inquired regarding the monitoring
and evaluation system. Most of the participants said, “M&E is good for teachers’ and students’ attendance maintenance and performance and take measures to sway the ambiguities”. However, keeping and checking records were found obscured while corporal punishment is prevalent in most of the schools resulting in less effectiveness of reforms. Moreover, the authorities did not provide enough resources to meet modern challenges according to the changing landscapes of society. As few studies highlighted the ghost schools in a different part of Pakistan particularly in Balochistan. Similarly, parents and teachers are frustrated due to ill monitoring and evaluation mechanisms. It consequently affects the performance and learning of students. Likewise, some teachers are less interested to teach students rather make their ends. In some cases, the attendance of teachers and students has also been questioned (Elacqua et al., 2020; Gleeson et al., 2020). Thus, the examination results were affected due to inadequate mechanisms implemented in reforms (Romans, Wills, Huffman, & Garrison-Kane, 2020; You, 2020).

Monitoring and evaluation is an effective component for keeping attendance record of teachers and students in schools (Mughal, 2020) and identifying the ambiguities and taking radical measures to address the issues. Therefore, teachers expressed disagreement with the transparency of monitoring and evaluation and restrictions on the punishment of students. Similar findings have been reported across the globe (Gleeson et al., 2020; Romans et al., 2020).

**Curriculum development at the school level**

It has been found that every country develops its curriculum according to the socio-cultural milieu of the country (Roberts & King, 2020). As the parents and teachers expressed that the curriculum was not designed according to the social and cultural makeup of the society. However, it does not meet the standards of modern education in creative abilities, skills, learning, and knowledge. In the nutshell, it was observed that both parents and teachers were dissatisfied with the curriculum. Designing the curriculum according to the aspiration of the people is more helpful for the attainment of knowledge and skills (You, 2020). All the participants agreed, “Curriculum development is not up to the mark and does not satisfy the needs of changing modern landscapes of society”. Moreover, it is not designed according to the socio-cultural environment of the region. It is worth mentioning to state that the curriculum of schools develops public opinion, ideologies, and patriotism of the nation (Byrne & Prendergast, 2020). In Pakistan and several other developing nations, lack of infrastructure and funding issues (Gleeson et al, 2020), curriculum design and reforms are major concerns to change the education system (Eli et al, 2020). Thus, the developed world imposes sanctions and strict conditions on developing countries to receive funding (Zhao, 2020) and influence curriculum development as well (Jang, 2020).

**Discussion**

The research revealed different findings that further need to be anticipated with reference to the literature and findings cited so far from the developed and developing and particular in the context of Pakistan. As long as the reforms in Balochistan are concerned, the books were provided free of cost to the students at elementary level however without addressing other elements of the reform policies it remained ineffective. This shows that without addressing
all the interrelated factors provision of the free books was useless. Similar findings are reported by the researcher from India and Sri Lanka indicating that in reform process all the necessary elements need to be integrated for the effective execution of the reform policies. At the same time, research from Iran unveiled that reform policies in education need to be implemented by its spirit. As considerable outcomes have been achieved by Iran in reforming public schools. On the other hand, most of the African countries have failed in getting the educational reform goals so far. As it is reported that this failure is due to the ignorance of necessary measures that are needed to execute the school reforms.

Another most important element of school reform is transparent recruitment of teachers and their training. The developed nations have a transparent procedure of recruiting the teachers and then training them so that they could teach and handle the students to their best. We found that there is transparent procedure of recruiting the teachers in Balochistan. Most of the teachers are appointed on the political basis. The teachers are not trained as there is criteria of recruiting teachers having a degree of Bachelor in Education (B.Ed.) and this degree is mostly achieved either from distance learning or privately. Thus, there exist gap of not being trained as students are properly trained in the regular degree program. It has been found that training of teacher program exist however all the teachers are not provided training after the recruitment. It is also found that relevant officers depute their near and dear ones on training even though they are not newly recruited. Due to these factors, the capacity of teachers at school is low thus they are unable to produce the quality education. In addition, those teachers who are capable or have competency to work do not find friendly environment for teaching at schools. So, it is concluded that without training program teaching cannot be effective in Balochistan, Pakistan. Similar issues have been faced by the other developing countries i.e., India, Sri Lanka, Bangladesh, and Iran. It is revealed that effective reform policies regarding the training of teachers/working environment and quality teaching exist there however the implementation is ineffective. Moreover, this element is also found weak in different African countries by various researchers.

In the integration of school reform policies, cooperation between parents and teachers is also an important factor that leads to effective education system. We found that there is gap between teachers and parents. It is either teachers do not intimate performance of the students or parents do not take interest in education of their children. Without cooperation of teachers and parents the performance of the students cannot be monitored. In every school reform policy there is a major clause of teacher’s parents’ cooperation however it always remained ineffective. Similar problems have been faced in India as Farooq (2020) indicated that there is lack of cooperation between teachers and parents. Likewise, issues have been faced in Bangladesh, Iran and Gulf countries. On the other hand, in African countries, although the school reform policies are intact while cooperation less likely exist between teachers and parents to examine the performance of the students.

Research shows that the infrastructure has been issue in the educational structure of school reforms. In case of Pakistan, it has been one of the big challenges for the reformers/government to provide the proper infrastructure to the elementary schools. As we also found infrastructure as one of the key hurdles in the school reforms. Most of the schools have either old building and with zero amenities required for the school education. Although the land is available however the infrastructure has never been priority of the authorities. This situation
A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...
A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...
A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

doi:10.1080/00220272.2019.1657955

19. Ju, Y., & Liu, J. (2020). Mechanisms of the tailoring workshops for teacher sustainable development: A case study of a middle school in Shanghai. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 1-15. doi:10.1080/00131857.2020.1794275

20. Karacabey, M. F., Bellibaş, M. Ş., & Adams, D. (2020). Principal leadership and teacher professional learning in Turkish schools: examining the mediating effects of collective teacher efficacy and teacher trust. *Educational Studies*, 1-20. doi:10.1080/03055698.2020.1749835

21. Kauppinen, M., Kainulainen, J., Hökkä, P., & Vähäsantanen, K. (2020). Professional agency and its features in supporting teachers' learning during an in-service education programme. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 43(3), 384-404. doi:10.1080/02619768.2020.1746264

22. Khan, F. Z. A., Manzoor, S. A., Akmal, M., Imran, M. U., Taqi, M., Manzoor, S. A.,…, Joseph, S. V. (2020). Modeling pesticide use intention in Pakistani farmers using expanded versions of the theory of planned behavior. *Human and Ecological Risk Assessment: An International Journal*, 1-21. doi:10.1080/09645292.2020.1750345

23. Knight, R. (2020). The tensions of innovation: experiences of teachers during a whole school pedagogical shift. *Research Papers in Education*, 35(2), 205-227. doi:10.1080/02671522.2019.1568527

24. Lazareva, O., & Zakharov, A. (2020). Teacher wages and educational outcomes: evidence from the Russian school system. *Education Economics*, 28(4), 418-436. doi:10.1080/09645292.2020.1775181

25. Li, Y., Li, J., Devlieghere, J., & Vandenbroeck, M. (2020). What parents and teachers say about their relationships in ECEC: a study in rural China. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal*, 28(3), 332-348. doi:10.1080/1350293X.2020.1755489

26. Lopes, J., & Oliveira, C. (2020). Teacher and school determinants of teacher job satisfaction: a multilevel analysis. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 1-19. doi:10.1080/09243453.2020.1764593

27. Mankki, V., Mäkinen, M., & Räihä, P. (2020). Teacher educators’ predictability and student selection paradigms in entrance examinations for the Finnish Primary School Teacher Education programme. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 43(2), 151-164. doi:10.1080/02619768.2019.1672653

28. Marklund, E. (2020). Who was going to become a teacher? The socio-economic background of primary school teachers in northern Sweden 1870–1950. *History of Education*, 1-23. doi:10.1080/0046760X.2020.1760946

29. Masbirorotni, M., Mukminin, A., Habibi, A., Haryanto, E., Hidayat, M., Marzulina, L.,…, Kamil, D. (2020). Why Student Teachers Major in English Education: An Analysis of Motives for Becoming Future Teachers. *Journal of Elementary Education*, 13(4), 429-452.

30. McGarr, O., & O’Gallchóir, C. (2020). Exploring pre-service teachers’ justifications for one-to-one technology use in schools: implications for initial teacher education. *Technology, Pedagogy and Education*, 29(4), 477-490. doi:10.1080/1475939X.2020.1784261

31. McMullen, J., & Eaton, P. (2020). The impact of a school-based life skills intervention in Ugandan secondary schools: perspectives of teachers and students. *Pastoral Care in Education*, 1-20. doi:10.1080/02643944.2020.1751687

32. Muckenthaler, M., Tillmann, T., Weiß, S., & Kiel, E. (2020). Teacher collaboration as a core objective of school development. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 31(3), 486-504. doi:10.1080/09243453.2020.1747501

33. Mughal, A. W. (2020). Secondary school students who drop out of school in rural Pakistan: The perspectives of fathers. *Educational Research*, 62(2), 199-215. doi:10.1080/00131881.2020.1755604

34. Oliemat, A., Al-Zboon, E., & Al-Dababneh, K. (2020). The importance of and barriers to using a
A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020) ...
A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

Mental Borders and Their Implications for India–Pakistan Relations. *Journal of Borderlands Studies, 35*(2), 195-210. doi:10.1080/08865655.2019.1646151

52. Wills, G. (2020). Teachers’ unions and industrial action in South African primary schools: Exploring their impacts on learning. *Development Southern Africa, 37*(2), 328-347. doi:10.1080/0376835X.2019.1682969

53. Xiong, Z., Warwick, I., & Chalies, S. (2020). Understanding novice teachers’ perspectives on China’s sexuality education: a study based on the national pre-service teacher education programme. *Sex Education, 20*(3), 252-266. doi:10.1080/14681811.2019.1640113

54. You, Y. (2020). Run by others: school autonomy in Shanghai’s entrustment management reform. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education, 1*-15. doi:10.1080/02188791.2020.1772198

55. Yuen, M., Lee, Q. A. Y., & Chung, Y. B. (2020). Meaning in life, connectedness, and life skills development in junior secondary school students: teachers’ perspectives in Hong Kong. *Pastoral Care in Education, 1*-17. doi:10.1080/02643944.2020.1774634

56. Zhao, W. (2020). Problematizing “epistemicide” in transnational curriculum knowledge production: China’s suyang curriculum reform as an example. *Curriculum Inquiry, 50*(2), 105-125. doi:10.1080/03626784.2020.1736521