Critical success factor in blended learning for English training: A systematic literature review

M R Putri¹, J Y Luke², and S T Sela³

¹Language Center, Hotel Management Department, Faculty of Humanities, Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta, Indonesia 11480
²Language Center, English Department, Faculty of Humanities, Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta, Indonesia 11480
³Language Center, Computer Science Department, Faculty of Humanities, Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta, Indonesia 11480

mrputri@binus.edu

Abstract. The rapid development of technology has impacted many aspects in education world. The technology development has challenged how education was brought to learners. The traditional way may no longer fit the demand. This research aimed to investigate the critical success factors in blended learning for English Training. Systematic literature review was established to reach the conclusion. 30 journal articles published in 2013 to 2017 were examined to gain the results and findings. The result showed there were 11 key success factors in delivering the English training by blended learning. The most critical factors were the course design of blended learning, the instructional model of blended learning, and the teaching learning method in the blended learning course. It was suggested in the future to emphasize the research on the various designs of blended learning, the tools for the online sessions, and the suitable teaching learning method in the blended learning course.

1. Introduction

The advanced development in technology has made a lot of breakthrough in many aspects of human life, as well as in the education world. The development of technology has its own challenge in education system. One of the challenges is in the teaching-learning delivery method. The traditional method, also known as face to face, seems could not accommodate the demand in this technology era. Thus, blended learning is proposed as the answer to the demand. An initial research report investigated the need analysis for English training showed there were 46% the faculty members preferred to have training in blended learning as the delivery method rather than face to face [1]. As the preparation to establish the suitable scenario and standard of the implementation of blended learning in the English training, it would be beneficial to study the aspects and key success factors of blended learning implementation. Blended learning as the combination of face to face learning and learning in practice with technology-mediated learning, they also found that blended learning may provide opportunity to enhance students’ learning performance [2, 3]. To find out the critical success factor, there are three main aspects in blended learning, namely pedagogical aspect, textbook, and the usability of the learning environment [3]. The three aspects were deciphered into teaching-learning methods, online video lecturers, online discussion group, printed textbook and digital textbook, learning management system, and the online course design. There were no significant differences between the traditional
face to face session, e-learning session, and blended learning session [4]. On the other hand, blended learning might improve the students’ participation and interest in the face to face session since they already learnt the learning materials on e-learning or online learning session [5]. The successful of blended learning might also be influenced by the instructor’s competencies and the technical issues during the implementation of blended learning. Blended learning might improve the students’ autonomous learning and motivation [6]. Thus, it would be beneficial to find out the critical success factors in blended learning implementation in order to support the successful implementation of the blended learning courses.

2. Methodology

The method used in this study was a systematic literature review.

2.1. Research Objective

To find out the critical success factor of the blended learning for English training, a systematic literature review was established in this study. The systematic literature review implemented in this study was based on the Kitchenham’s Procedures for Performing Systematic Reviews [7]. The purpose of this research was to find out the key success factors in implementing the blended learning for English training in higher education setting. Achieving the purpose, the research questions of this study were:

RQ1. What research topics are being discussed?
RQ2. How is blended learning being implemented?
RQ3. What are the students’ and faculty members’ perspective in the implementation of blended learning?
RQ4. What aspects are affecting the implementation of blended learning?

2.2. Search Process

The search process of the data for this study was gained through comprehensive investigation process in finding the suitable journal articles available online from across the world in the recent five years to provide a broad view of blended learning for English training in higher education. Research expressions that have been used to gather the result were “blended learning”, “blended learning for English training”, “English training”, and “critical success factors”. There were 30 examined journal articles were selected from 24 journals. The selected journal articles were reviewed by all three researchers (i.e. Putri, Luke, and Sela). The researchers were responsible for searching the specific journals based on the inclusion and exclusion criteria.

2.3. Inclusion an Exclusion Criteria

Since blended learning issue is not a new thing in education world now a day, the examined journal articles were limited to the articles that were published in the recent five years from 2013 to 2017 in order to accommodate the rapid development of technology. Further, the other inclusion criteria of this study were as follow:

- Research papers examined blended learning in higher education setting.
- Research papers which participants were university students or faculty members.
- Research papers which examined the aspects of blended learning.
- On the other hand, the exclusion criteria of this study were as follow:
  - Research paper were published before 2013
  - Research paper which examined the blended learning in primary & secondary level
  - Research paper which did not stated the sample or subject clearly

2.4. Quality Assessment
The Kitchenham’s study was used as the base of quality assessment to analyze the data [8]. The criteria of Database of Abstracts for Reviews and Dissemination (DARE) were used in conducting the quality assessment (QA) of systematic literature review as follow:

QA1. Did the research study discuss the aspects in blended learning?
QA2. Did the research study present the result of the implementation of blended learning for professional development purpose?
QA3. Did the research study present the result from the students’ or lecturers’ perspective?
QA4. Were the basic data of the research presented?

Following the procedure of systematic literature review, the questions were scored as follow:

QA1: (Y) the research study presented 2 or more aspects of blended learning; (P) the research study only presented 1 aspect of blended learning; (N) the research study did not present the aspect of blended learning.

QA2: (Y) the research study presented the result of the implementation of blended learning for professional development purpose; (N) the research study did not present the result of the implementation of blended learning for professional development purpose.

QA3: (Y) the research study presented the result both from the students’ and lecturers’ perspective; (P) the research study only presented the result from the students’ or lecturers’ perspective; (N) the research study did not present the result from the students’ and lecturers’ perspective.

QA4: (Y) the research study presented the basic information of the study; (N) the research study did not present the basic information of the study.

The scoring procedure was based on Kitchenham’s study [8] that ‘Y’ scored 1, ‘P’ scored 0.5, and ‘N’ scored 0.

The objectiveness of this study was based on the availability of information in the research study rather than qualitative in nature.

The data were tabulated systematically into multiple tables for analysis as follow:

- A table measuring the quality of evaluation of the research study
- A table measuring the aspects of blended learning presented in the research study
- A table investigating the key success factors of blended learning for English teaching

2.5. Data Collection and Analysis

The selected journal articles were extracted as follow:

- The source and full reference
- Main topic area
- The author(s) and their institution
- Summary of the study
- Research questions or issues discussed
- Quality evaluation
- Blended learning aspects
- The data were tabulated to show:
  - The trending topic of blended learning in the recent 5 years (addressing RQ1)
  - The blended learning aspects examined in the research study (addressing RQ1, RQ2, and RQ4)
  - The way blended learning was implemented all around the world (addressing RQ2)
  - Students’ and faculty members’ perspective on the implementation of blended learning (addressing RQ3)
  - Factor affecting the implementation of blended learning (addressing RQ4)

The aspects of blended learning found by [3] were used as the foundation in identifying the blended learning aspects in the examined research study.
3. Result
The result showed that all selected research studies discussed blended learning. Answering the first research question, the selected research studies mostly discussed course design, instructional model, the teaching-learning method in the blended learning, and the tools for online learning session. For the second research question, the selected research studies describe the combination of face to face teaching-learning sessions with the e-learning or online learning sessions. All selected research studies noted the positive perspectives both from the faculty members as well as the students toward the implementation of blended learning for language learning. And for the last research question, figure 1 showed the aspects that might affect the implementation of blended learning. The most frequently discussed aspect was the online course design. And the least frequently discussed were the online video lecturers and the textbook as the sources in the blended learning.

![Blended Learning Aspects](image)

**Figure 1.** Blended Learning Aspects.

The result showed that the blended learning resources were not the main concern in the blended learning implementation. Teachers, lecturers, and other educators were suggested to carefully setting the online course design and use the proper teaching-learning method. These results aligned with the finding in critical success factor as presented in the figure 2.

![Critical Success Factor](image)

**Figure 2.** Critical Success Factor of Blended Learning for English Training.

The result showed there were 11 key critical success factors of blended learning for English training, namely 1) teaching-learning method, 2) instructional model, 3) teaching-learning materials, 4) learning management system, 5) course design of blended learning, 6) learning outcomes or learning objective, 7) institutional support, 8) tools for the online learning, 9) demographic condition, 10) students’ learning engagement & involvement, and 11) students’ learning style. Align with the most critical blended learning aspects, course design of blended learning became the most critical issues to be considered for the blended learning implementation. The result followed by the instructional model to be concerned. The teachers, lecturers, and educators should also determine the most suitable teaching learning method to be implemented in the blended learning establishment since this issue gave sufficient influence to the blended learning implementation. It was interesting that the
result showed demographic condition was included as one of the critical success factors in blended learning implementation.

As the consideration for the implementation of blended learning, the 11 critical success factors were classified into two parts. The first part as for the preparation before implementation were teaching-learning method, instructional model, teaching-learning materials, learning management system, course design of blended learning, learning outcomes or learning objective, institutional support, tools for the online learning, and the demographic condition. The second part as for the consideration during the process was the students’ learning engagement & involvement, and students’ learning style.

4. Conclusion
There is no objection that the rapid technology in education has modified how people learn nowadays. Blended learning was implemented to answer the unavoidable demand of technology in teaching-learning process. In implementing the blended learning, the practitioners were suggested to determine the 11 critical success factors. For the further research, it would be beneficial to emphasize the research on the various designs of blended learning, the used-tools for the online sessions, and the suitable teaching learning method in the blended learning course. The result also found an interesting finding related to the demographic condition of the places where blended learning implemented. It would be a distinguish research to find out the impact of the demographic condition toward the blended learning implementation.

5. References
[1] Luke J Y, Putri M R and Sela S T 2017 The expectation of faculty on english language skills study through online learning Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Information and Education Technology Unpublished paper
[2] Jokinen P and Mikkonen 2013 Nurse Education in Practice 13 pp 524-528
[3] Precel K, Alkalai Y E and Alberton Y 2009 International Review of Research in Open and Distance Learning 10(2) pp 1-16
[4] Al-Qahtani A and Higgins S E 2013 Journal of Computer Assisted Learning 29(3) pp 220-234
[5] Gedik N, Kiraz E and Ozden M Y 2013 Australasian Journal of Educational Technology 29(1) pp 1-19
[6] Banditvilai C 2016 The Electronic Journal of E-Learning 14(3) pp 220-229
[7] Kitchenham B 2004 Technical Report Keele University
[8] Kitchenham B 2009 Information and Software Technology 51 pp 7-15

Acknowledgments
This research paper was funded by the research grant from Bina Nusantara University.