Telemedicine in cardiovascular surgery during COVID-19 pandemic: A systematic review and our experience

Ayomikun Ajibade¹ | Hiba Younas BSc² | Mark Pullan FRCS³ | Amer Harky MSc, MRCS³,4

1Birmingham Medical School, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK
2St George’s Medical School, University of London, London, UK
3Department of Cardiothoracic Surgery, Liverpool Heart and Chest Hospital, Liverpool, UK
4Department of Integrative Biology, Faculty of Life Sciences, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK

Correspondence
Amer Harky, MSc, MRCS, Department of Cardiothoracic Surgery, Liverpool Heart and Chest Hospital, Thomas Drive, Liverpool L14 3PE, UK.
Email: aaharky@gmail.com

Abstract

Objective: The SAR-COV-2 pandemic has had an unprecedented effect on the UK’s healthcare systems. To reduce spread of the virus, elective treatments and surgeries have been postponed or canceled. There has been a rise in the use of telemedicine (TM) as an alternative way to carry outpatient consultations. This systematic review aims to evaluate the extent to which TM may be able to support cardiac and vascular surgery patients in the COVID-19 era.

Methods: We looked into how TM can support the management of patients via triaging, preoperative, and postoperative care. Evaluations targeted the clinical effectiveness of common TM methods and the feasibility of applying those methods in the UK during this pandemic.

Results: Several studies have published their evidence on the benefit of TM and its benefit during COVID-19, the data related to cardiovascular surgery and how this will impact future practice of this speciality is emerging and yet larger studies with appropriate timing of outcomes to be published.

Conclusion: Overall, the use of virtual consultations and remote monitoring is feasible and best placed to support these patients via triaging and postoperative monitoring. However, TM can be limited by the need of sophisticated technological requirement and patients’ educational and know-how computer literacy level.

keywords
cardiac, coronavirus, COVID-19, surgery, telemedicine, vascular

1 | INTRODUCTION TO COVID-19

In late 2019, a novel coronavirus, identified as SARS-COV-2 originated in the city of Wuhan, China.¹⁻² The coronavirus spread worldwide resulting in a global pandemic.¹⁻² The disease caused by the novel coronavirus is commonly known as COVID-19. On the 29th January, the first few cases of COVID-19 were declared in England⁶ and since then there have been over 250,000 confirmed cases and over 40,000 COVID-19 related deaths in the UK.⁵

COVID-19 is a highly infectious disease with an original reproductive value of 2.5 to 3.5;⁶⁻⁷ infections can prompt cough, fever, and shortness of breath in symptomatic individuals.¹ In more severe
cases, COVID-19 can result in acute respiratory distress syndrome or organ failure, leading to some individuals being admitted to intensive care units. The high reproductive value of COVID-19 combined with the limited treatment options or vaccine against the disease has led to an overrun of the UK’s healthcare systems.

The COVID-19 pandemic has influenced the conduct of society: as of 23 March 2020, the UK government announced a lockdown in which strict social distancing measures were to be followed by UK residents. New guidelines meant that residents could only leave for essential work, food shopping, and daily exercise. The lockdown also saw the shutdown of many entertainment and nonessential businesses such as restaurants, cinemas, and concert halls. Since then, as of 22nd May, the lockdown rules in the UK have been drastically relaxed and as the reproductive value fell under 1 and lockdown measures across the globe have been less restrictive as the economy and society seeks to find a new “normal.”

1.1 COVID-19 and the impact on UK healthcare systems

The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on healthcare systems has been equally as disruptive. Critical care systems across western healthcare were originally overwhelmed by the outbreak. Over 250,000 volunteers and 5000 retired National Health Service (NHS) staff were recruited to help deal with the effects of the pandemic. There have been detrimental effects on other aspects of healthcare: regular cancer screenings were paused, and elective surgeries postponed in an attempt to contain the outbreak. As of recently, guidelines have been released to start phasing these procedures back into practice, however, it will be sometime before the impending backlog of surgeries is resolved.

The cancellation of all except essential surgeries, together with guidelines to minimize contact between patients and physicians, had an impact on the practice of all major surgical specialities. Difficult decisions must be made where physicians must weigh up the risk of vulnerable patients being exposed to SARS-COV-2, vs the risk of delaying their surgical treatments. Because of this, there has been a call for the use alternative avenues, such as telemedicine (TM), that may be able to play a role in alleviating some of the impact of COVID-19 by bridging the gap between patients and surgeons.

1.2 Introduction to TM

TM refers to the use of information and telecommunication technologies to facilitate the remote provision of healthcare services. While the origin of TM can be traced back several hundred years, the modern form of TM was established in the 20th century, which saw the rapid evolution of increasingly sophisticated communication technology. A milestone in TM was reached when in the 1960s, the National Aeronautics Space Administration, used satellite communication in a space-flight mission to enable doctors on earth to track the physiological changes of astronauts in space.

The advent of the telephone, television, and two-way audio and video communication channels played major roles in expanding the reach of TM. Now in more recent times, mobile technology and the internet have emerged and become mainstays, making TM remarkably more accessible in the modern era. The main categories of TM include real-time communication (synchronous), for example, videoconferencing for online consultation and diagnosis; store-and-forward communication (asynchronous), for example, electronic transfer of clinical data such as images or medical history; and remote monitoring, which enables doctors to remotely observe and track a patient’s real-time clinical signs.

The World Health Organization has highlighted the benefits of the use of rapidly developing information technologies in medicine, due to the potential scope of providing increasingly convenient, time-saving, and perhaps more cost-efficient doctor-patient interaction. While it has been argued that TM cannot always be an adequate substitute for traditional face-to-face healthcare and physical examination, the advantage of the remote delivery of health services becomes clearly apparent in situations where the point of contention is the distance between the patient and physician. For example, TM has often been vital in linking rural and medically underserved areas to GPs and specialists.

Similarly, in the case of the current SARS-Cov-2 crisis, maintaining social distancing is vital to the suppression of the pandemic, and with the additional factor of the growing strain on NHS resources, these conditions have brought the value of TM to the forefront of medical practice.

1.3 TM use in the UK

Whilst TM has always had strong support on paper, the UK healthcare community at large has been slow in taking advantage of the resource. TM has had a limited history of use in the UK with regards to secondary and tertiary care, however, the current conditions have forced healthcare service providers across all frontiers to adapt to TM on an emergency basis. The NHS and the GMC have released resources and guidelines to assist both primary and secondary care clinicians in implementing online consultations where possible.

TM has already been adapted into primary care, with telephone consultations and home-monitoring systems already in regular use in general practice, however, with the adjustments made to secondary and tertiary care services in the COVID-19 era, it is unclear as to whether TM can meet the needs of complex specialities such as cardiovascular surgery. Thus, we will explore whether, in the COVID-19 era, TM can meet the healthcare demands of cardiac and vascular surgery specialities.

1.4 Evaluating the usefulness of TM in cardiovascular surgery patients

For cardiac and vascular surgery, essential to the management of new and existing patients is effective triaging on the basis of the NHS guidelines for surgical prioritization during the pandemic.
To practice healthcare within the social distancing guidelines, it is necessary to evaluate the potential of TM as a platform through which triaging and preoperative investigations can be remotely carried out in the context of cardiac surgery and vascular surgery.

A major aspect of the research surrounding the use of TM in cardiovascular settings has involved remotely-based cardiac specialists providing expert diagnoses and assessment of patient condition from a distance, using patient history, live biodata, and cardiac imaging. Remote analysis of echocardiograms via real-time teleconsultation was used to triage patients for cardiac surgery with good outcomes, and the remote interpretation of results from a hand held ultrasound proved to be beneficial in the diagnosis of most cardiovascular diseases (CVDs) in comparison to standard echocardiography. Specialist teleconsultations of angiograms have also demonstrated accuracy in diagnosis and referral to procedures such as coronary artery bypass graft (CABG), Similarly remote transmission of cardiac magnetic resonance imaging has been successfully used to assess congenital heart disease in children. However, the use of cardiac imaging in remote diagnosis requires the availability of imaging equipment and trained technicians to perform the scans before the images can be interpreted by a remote specialist. As the current crisis situation calls for minimum contact between patients and healthcare personnel, this category of TM technology for managing cardiac surgery candidates is of limited use amidst COVID-19.

The electrocardiogram (ECG) is amongst the most pivotal tools used in the management of cardiac conditions, and has seen significant development over the years. Since 1906, substantial effort has gone into investigating the efficiency of a tele-ECG interpretation, and most studies have found it to be just as effective, if not superior to a regular 12-lead ECG, in the detection and triaging of patients with myocardial infarction and other complications. However, for the purpose of use during a pandemic like COVID-19, tele-ECG home-monitoring technologies are more relevant. In more recent years, the contribution of mobile health (mhealth) technologies has transformed remote monitoring through the introduction of mobile phone applications that can transmit patient vitals straight to healthcare staff. Single lead portable ECG devices such as the AliveCor Heart Monitor record ECG traces and transmit them to a mobile application to receive and transmit the data to doctors. Thus physicians were able to make more frequent treatment adjustments in the self-monitoring group, compared to the conventional group.

Telemonitoring was also useful in reducing rehospitalization within 30 days of an acute MI. The DICE intervention was effectively carried out using remote biometrics monitoring to track the post-CABG surgery health status of vulnerable patients, demonstrating that this could be implemented in place of conventional in-person follow-up appointments.

While some trials show that superiority of using TM over conventional management may be debatable, the majority of the research indicates that the monitoring of clinical parameters of cardiac patients during COVID-19 is likely to be useful in not only the overall management of the changing health status of patients, but also more specifically in facilitating effective remote presurgical triaging, detecting cardiac deterioration, and managing potential postsurgical complications. Some of the aforementioned HF trials also integrated structured telephone support in patient care, along with telemonitoring, to gather more detailed patient information and receive regular updates. Combined, these TM methods show evidence of reduced hospitalizations, and thus may have benefited during COVID-19 in reducing patient exposure to hospitals which are SARS-Cov-2 hotspots, and in generally reducing doctor-patient contact. Video consultations, combined with remote monitoring, were also a feasible replacement for standard ambulatory follow-up after cardiac device implantation. Moreover, telemonitoring of physiological and haemodynamic data from these implanted devices such as cardiac resynchronization defibrillators has also been extensively studied, as this data can indicate oncoming complications like cardiac decompensations. The IN-TIME trial demonstrated the benefits of the use of such devices in HF patients with implants, in reducing all-cause mortality and rehospitalizations. In a similar TELECART study, implant monitoring did not correlate with reduced all-cause mortality, however, it was useful in making timely improvements to patient management and thus could potentially help reduce
Implanted devices that allow the monitoring of pulmonary artery pressure are also becoming more common, and once again, as demonstrated in the CHAMPION trial, enable physicians to track and make appropriate changes to treatment regimens in CVD patients, reducing hospitalizations.\textsuperscript{53} Implanted devices that allow the monitoring of pulmonary artery pressure are also becoming more common, and once again, as demonstrated in the CHAMPION trial, enable physicians to track and make appropriate changes to treatment regimens in CVD patients, reducing hospitalizations.\textsuperscript{53} Implanted devices that allow the monitoring of pulmonary artery pressure are also becoming more common, and once again, as demonstrated in the CHAMPION trial, enable physicians to track and make appropriate changes to treatment regimens in CVD patients, reducing hospitalizations.\textsuperscript{53}

The feasibility of a home-based cardiac rehabilitation program using TM, to replace the standard in-hospital program for patients who have undergone cardiac surgery (eg, CABG, valvular surgeries), has also been tested. By providing patients with at-home exercise equipment and a one-lead tele-ECG device, and through scheduled telephone and videoconferencing, hospital staffs were able to track patients for any complications, and facilitate effective physiotherapy.\textsuperscript{55,56} While patients were still required to make hospital visits through the duration of the programs, these could possibly be minimized in a critical situation such as the current one. However, these programs would then be less suitable to patients with higher complication risks, who may require in-hospital facilities and face-to-face support. The FIT@Home study conducted a 12-week home-based exercise training program for cardiac surgery patients, where patient status was tracked using a remote heart-rate monitor and regular telephone support. The results were comparable to a conventional rehabilitation control group, and in-person consultations were minimal throughout the study. However, only patients with low to moderate risk of adverse events were included, thus TM based rehabilitation may not be suitable for higher-risk patients.\textsuperscript{57} Postoperative home rehabilitation may also be less than convenient to patients lacking at-home caregivers.

With regards, to vascular surgery, TM has also proved practical and feasible. Surgical site infections are common among patients who have undergone vascular surgery, and thus wound monitoring is a significant aspect of post-op care. Studies have utilized mobile and smartphone technology to assess surgical wounds, in place of standard outpatient care. The accuracy of physician analysis of wound images taken by smartphone and other digital cameras is comparable to that of in-person wound examination.\textsuperscript{58-60} Mousa et al\textsuperscript{61} successfully used a home telemonitoring system (BP, HR, SpO₂, etc) to also track patient status postarterial revascularization procedures. In another instance, videoconferencing was used for the management of patients at home after carotid endarterectomy procedures, which allowed for early patient discharge.\textsuperscript{61} Preoperative management and referral of vascular surgery candidates using TM has also been tested, involving live consultations with off-site specialists, however, this usually requires patients to be physically present at locations which have access to trained staff and diagnostic facilities.\textsuperscript{62-64}

1.5 | TM cannot always be relied upon

TM is limited by the availability of technological resources. The rapid implementation of lockdown measures has led to an increased reliance on essential workers to deliver necessary electronic devices to workplaces and homes around the UK. The increased supply-demand ratio has led to a lack of available resources which drive TM use, including laptops, the correct streaming bandwidth, and specialist communication software. With these resources needed for TM to even work, the implantation of this method of healthcare is likely to benefit the patients who already are in possession of useable and higher quality communication devices, as the rest of patients wait to catch up. Furthermore, TM in the COVID-19 era may fail those who are not as technologically proficient or those who cannot financially support the use of high-quality communication devices and software which benefit TM. Whilst this problem can be overcome using the help of free communication platforms such as Skype, WhatsApp, or Zoom, most of which are easily accessible to those with workable smartphones, there is a privacy concern surrounding these platforms which may put patients in harm’s way.

The guidance given by the GMC recommends that TM should only be used in cases where the clinician is familiar with the patient and has a straightforward clinical need. Situations where the patient has more complex clinical needs or requires more delicate prescriptions such as injectables, then TM is no appropriate.\textsuperscript{65} Therefore, TM, whilst available, may not always be appropriate for use in healthcare especially when dealing with new patients who have more complex clinical needs. In the case of cardiac and vascular medicine, TM may be less appropriate in first-time surgical referrals. However, under the difficult circumstances, physicians have been told that they may have to approach TM use with a “benefits outweigh the risk” policy; where there are situations of technology limitations or lack of resources, clinicians are permitted to use less secure communication platforms or alternative methods to bring healthcare into the homes of patients around the UK.\textsuperscript{66}

A further limitation of TM is that preoperative evaluations are difficult to perform and a full physical examination cannot be conducted over a digital platform.\textsuperscript{66} Regardless of these issues, TM is seen to be just as effective as face-to-face consultations\textsuperscript{67} when it comes to patient satisfaction and clinical effectiveness regarding triaging, straightforward diagnosis, and postoperative rehabilitation. It is important to remember, however, that TM is always dependant on the availability and workability of the technology needed to power it.

Table 1 is a summary from key studies outlining the practice and use of TM and how this can affect clinical practice.

1.6 | Our experience

Since the lockdown has been introduced to United Kingdom on 23rd of March 2020, the healthcare provision in the entire NHS has been modified to accommodate the surge of COVID-19 patients and minimize the risk of acquiring this disease. This has been achieved through isolation and maintaining social distances. This involved cancellation of all elective face-to-face clinics’ appointments and cardiovascular surgical interventions. One of the modalities that has been introduced to keep track of our patients and ensure their wellbeing are maintained is using TM and virtual follow-ups. This has been the main approach, in particular, for outpatient clinics whether as new patient referral or routine follow-up of those who have been discharged following their surgery.
| No. | Ref  | First author, year   | Title                                                                 | Summary of TM intervention                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Summary of findings/conclusions                                                                 | Potential for perioperative use in cardiovascular surgery                           |
|-----|------|----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1   | 27   | Gackowski, 2011      | Development, Implementation, and Multicenter Clinical Validation of the TeleDICOM—Advanced, Interactive Teleconsultation System | Use of a tele-DICOM system for remote diagnostic analysis of coronary angiograms and echocardiograms. Comparison with standard imaging.                                                                                       | Teleconsultations using the tele-DICOM system allowed for accurate decision making for CABG in comparison to decisions made using standard imaging procedures.       | Diagnosis, triage, and management in cardiac surgery patients.                    |
| 2   | 28   | Sekar, 2007          | Telecardiology: Effective Means of Delivering Cardiac Care to Rural Children | Use of videoconferencing and tele-echocardiography to carry out remote diagnoses, and decisions for surgery, in rural children.                                                                                                   | Telecardiology was effective in facilitating off-site decision making for cardiac surgery and allowed transmission of accurate images.                             | Diagnosis, triage, and management in cardiac surgery patients.                    |
| 3   | 29   | Evangelista, 2016    | Hand-held Cardiac Ultrasound Screening Performed by Family Doctors With Remote Expert Support Interpretation | Remote interpretation of a hand-held cardiac ultrasound and comparison with standard echocardiography.                                                                                                                                 | There was a good level of agreement between remote expert interpretation and standard echocardiography.                                                        | Diagnosis, triage, and management in cardiac surgery patients.                    |
| 4   | 30   | Bonvini, 2002        | Telemedicine for cardiac surgery candidates                          | Tele-transmission and remote interpretation of coronary angiograms to facilitate remote diagnosis and decision for surgical intervention. Comparison with direct scrutiny of angiograms.                                    | Decisions based on remote transmissions were accurately made in 91% of the cases. There was a good level of diagnostic agreement between remote transmissions and direct scrutiny. | Diagnosis, triage, and management in cardiac surgery patients.                    |
| 5   | 31   | Garg, 2015           | Remote Delivery of Congenital Cardiac Magnetic Resonance Imaging Services: A Unique Telemedicine Model | Tele-transmission and videoconferencing to facilitate the remote interpretation of Cardiac magnetic resonance imaging in comparison to a conventional CMRI setting.                                                                 | TM based CMRI services were efficacious and comparable to a conventional CMRI service.                                                                       | Diagnosis, triage, and management in cardiac surgery patients.                    |
| 6   | 33   | Schwaab, 2006        | Validation of 12-lead tele-electrocardiogram transmission in the real-life scenario of acute coronary syndrome | Tele-transmission and remote interpretation of a 12-lead ECG, compared with ECGs taken via standard setting.                                                                                                                                 | Tele-ECGs allowed for accurate diagnosis of STEMI and were comparable to diagnoses made via a conventional ECG.                                                                 | Diagnosis, triage, and management in cardiac surgery patients.                    |
| 7   | 34   | Mavrogeni, 2000      | Supervision of thrombolysis of acute myocardial infarction using telemedicine | Tele-transmission and remote interpretation of 12-lead ECGs.                                                                                                                                                                   | Tele-ECGs were effective in the remote management of acute myocardial infarction.                                                                              | Diagnosis, triage, and management of cardiac surgery patients.                    |
| 8   | 35   | Rasmussen, 2014      | Diagnostic performance and system delay using telemedicine for prehospital diagnosis in triaging and treatment of STEMI | Use of tele-ECG in prehospital cardiac triage.                                                                                                                                                                                | Tele-ECG was effective in aiding prehospital remote triage for cardiac surgery.                                                                               | Diagnosis, triage, and management of cardiac surgery patients.                    |
| No. | Ref | First author, year | Title | Summary of TM intervention | Summary of findings/conclusions | Potential for perioperative use in cardiovascular surgery |
|-----|-----|-------------------|-------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|
| 9   | 37  | Chan, 2017        | Head-to-head comparison of the AliveCor heart monitor and Microlife WatchBP Office AFIB for atrial fibrillation screening in a primary care setting | Use of single-lead ECG smartphone monitor AliveCor in the remote detection of atrial fibrillation. Comparison with standard 12-lead ECG. | Effective detection of AF in 66.7% of patients. Concerning a false-negative rate of 33.3%, however, still has a high potential for supplementation in primary care. | Remote monitoring of heart rhythms in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 10  | 38  | Garabelli, 2016   | Comparison of QT Interval Readings in Normal Sinus Rhythm Between a Smartphone Heart Monitor and a 12-Lead ECG for Healthy Volunteers and Inpatients Receiving Sotalol or Dofetilide | Use of single-lead ECG smartphone monitor AliveCor in the remote monitoring of ECG trace. | Effective remote monitoring detection of changes in the ECG signal was feasible and was comparable to results from a standard 12-lead ECG. | Remote monitoring of heart rhythms in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 11  | 39  | Romano, 2014      | The informative contribution of the “virtual medical visit” in a new heart failure telemedicine integrated system | Use of wireless home-monitoring technology and online questionnaires to track changes in health status of cardiac patients. | Remote monitoring system was effective in tracking the health status of HF patients. | Remote monitoring of changes in the vital signs and health status in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 12  | 40  | Kakria, 2015      | A Real-Time Health Monitoring System for Remote Cardiac Patients Using Smartphone and Wearable Sensors | Use of Bluetooth-enabled wearable sensor to remotely monitor cardiac parameters (HR, BP, body temperature). | Enabled effective monitoring and detection of changing cardiac vital signs. Accuracy of data from remote sensors was comparable to data from conventional devices. | Remote monitoring of changes in vital signs and health status in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 13  | 41  | Al-Naggar, 2019   | Design of a Remote Real-Time Monitoring System for Multiple Physiological Parameters Based on Smartphone | Use of wearable sensors and wireless smartphone technology to remotely track health status, including ECG readings, HR, etc. | Allowed accurate tracking of cardiac parameters, with low time delays in data transmission using Wi-Fi. | Remote monitoring of cardiac parameters and health status in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 14  | 43  | Koehler, 2018     | Efficacy of telemedical interventional management in patients with heart failure (TIM-HF2): a randomized, controlled, parallel-group, unmasked trial | Use of home telemonitoring systems in heart failure patients to track ECG readings, BP, weight, and SpO2, combined with structured telephone support. | Remote management of heart failure patients via telemonitoring was feasible and led to improved patient care and patient outcomes. | Remote monitoring and management of cardiac parameters and health status in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 15  | 44  | Ong, 2016        | Effectiveness of remote patient monitoring after discharge of hospitalized patients with heart failure: the better effectiveness after transition-heart failure (BEAT-HF) randomized clinical trial | Wireless home telemonitoring (BP, HR weight, etc.) and structured telephone support for management of heart failure patients. | Remote management using telemonitoring was as effective as standard care with no significant difference in primary outcomes. | Remote monitoring and management of cardiac parameters and health status in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| No. | Ref | First author, year | Title | Summary of TM intervention | Summary of findings/conclusions | Potential for perioperative use in cardiovascular surgery |
|-----|-----|--------------------|-------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| 16  | 45  | Bray, 2010         | Does self-monitoring reduce blood pressure? Meta-analysis with meta-regression of randomized controlled trials | Patient self-monitoring of blood pressure. | Self-monitoring of blood pressure is feasible and led to a reduction in blood pressure compared to usual care. | Remote monitoring of cardiac parameters and health status in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 17  | 46  | McGillicuddy, 2013 | Mobile health medication adherence and blood pressure control in renal transplant recipients: A proof-of-concept randomized controlled trial | Wireless, remote blood pressure monitoring, self-management system. | Telemonitoring of blood pressure led to improved quality of patient care and reduced blood pressures. | Remote monitoring and management of health status in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 18  | 47  | Ben-Assa, 2014     | Is telemedicine an answer to reducing 30-d readmission rates post-acute myocardial infarction? | Use of home telemonitoring technology to manage cardiac patients. | Telemonitoring led to improved outcomes in MI patients. | Remote monitoring and management of vital signs in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 19  | 48  | Kleinpell, 2015    | Randomized Trial of a Discharge Planning and Telehealth Intervention for Patients Aged 65 and older after Coronary Artery Bypass Surgery | Remote home biometrics monitoring and telephone support for management of health status post-CABG surgery (Discharge Intervention for Cardiac Elderly [DICE]). | Overall remote home monitoring was as effective as usual postoperative management, with improved patients outcomes in certain groups. | Remote monitoring and management of cardiac parameters and health status in cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 20  | 49  | Inglis, 2017       | Structured telephone support or noninvasive telemonitoring for patients with heart failure | Structured telephone support and telemonitoring in heart failure patients. | TM interventions were effective and led to improved primary patient outcomes. | Remote monitoring and management of cardiac surgery candidates. |
| 21  | 50  | Sponga, 2018       | Teleconsultation for left ventricular assist device patients: a new standard of care | Remote biometrics monitoring and videoconferencing for patient management postcardiac procedure | Remote interventions allowed effective tracking of patient status and improved quality of care | Remote postoperative management of patient health status. |
| 22  | 51  | Dalouk, 2017       | Outcomes of Telemedicine Video-Conferencing Clinic Versus In-Person Clinic Follow-Up for Implantable Cardioverter-Defibrillator Recipients | Remote patient monitoring postcardiac device implantation via videoconferencing. | TM based postoperative management led to no significant differences in primary and secondary outcomes compared to usual care. | Remote postoperative management of patient health status. |
| 23  | 52  | Hindricks, 2014    | Implant-based multiparameter telemonitoring of patients with heart failure (IN-TIME): A randomized controlled trial | Remote biometrics monitoring of data from implantable cardioverter-defibrillators (ICDs) and cardiac resynchronization defibrillators (CRT-Ds). | Telemonitoring was efficacious, feasible, and led to significant improvement in patient outcomes (lower mortality). | Remote monitoring to manage cardiac surgery patients with implanted devices. |
| 24  | 53  | Sardu, 2016        | Telemonitoring in heart failure patients treated by cardiac resynchronization therapy with defibrillator (CRT-D): the TELECART Study | Remote monitoring of health status of heart failure patients using data from ICDs. | Remote biometric data was a good predictor of hospitalization, and reduced HF-related hospitalizations, however no reduction in mortality was seen compared to control group. | Remote monitoring in the management of cardiac surgery patients with implanted devices. |

(Continues)
| No. | Ref | First author, year | Title | Summary of TM intervention | Summary of findings/conclusions | Potential for perioperative use in cardiovascular surgery |
|-----|-----|--------------------|-------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|
| 25  | 54  | Givertz, 2017      | Pulmonary Artery Pressure-Guided Management of Patients With Heart Failure and Reduced Ejection Fraction | Telemonitoring of pulmonary artery pressures in HF patients with CardioMEMS implants. | Remote monitoring of implanted devices data led to a reduced rate of both hospitalization and mortality. | Remote monitoring to manage cardiac surgery patients with implanted devices. |
| 26  | 55  | Scalvini, 2009     | Home-based exercise rehabilitation with telemedicine following cardiac surgery | Remotely supervised, home-based, postcardiac surgery rehabilitation program with telephone support and wireless ECG transmission. | Home-based rehabilitation was effective and could be a feasible alternative to a standard in-hospital program for certain patient groups. | Remote postoperative rehabilitation of cardiac surgery patients. |
| 27  | 56  | Scalvini, 2013     | Home-Based Versus In-Hospital Cardiac Rehabilitation After Cardiac Surgery: A Nonrandomized Controlled Study | Remotely supervised, home-based, postcardiac surgery rehabilitation program with telephone and video-conference support, and wireless ECG transmission. | Home-based rehabilitation via TM was feasible (for certain patient groups), with few differences between the TM group and control group, and results comparable to the standard in-hospital program. | Remote postoperative rehabilitation of cardiac surgery patients. |
| 28  | 57  | Kraal, 2014        | Effects of home-based training with telemonitoring guidance in low to moderate risk patients entering cardiac rehabilitation: Short-term results of the FIT@Home study | Home-based, postcardiac surgery rehabilitation program with telephone support and wireless HR monitoring. | Home-based rehabilitation via TM was effective and comparable to the center-based control group program. | Remote postoperative rehabilitation of cardiac surgery patients. |
| 29  | 58  | Wiseman, 2016      | Inter-rater agreement and checklist validation for postoperative wound assessment using smartphone images in vascular surgery | Remote surgical wound management based on digital images taken on smartphone, compared with in-person assessment. | Inter-rater concordance was high between digital and in-person groups for wound assessment and management decisions. | Remote postoperative wound monitoring for vascular surgery patients. |
| 30  | 59  | Mousa, 2019        | Results of Telehealth Electronic Monitoring for Post Discharge Complications and Surgical Site Infections following Arterial Revascularization with Groin Incision | Home-based telemonitoring systems to track wound status and general vital signs in patients post vascular surgery, in comparison to usual care. | TM based postoperative wound care was feasible with no overall differences in outcomes in TM vs control group. TM based wound care led to improved patient quality of life and increased satisfaction with care quality. | Remote postoperative wound management for vascular surgery patients. |
| 31  | 60  | Totty, 2018        | Use of photograph-based telemedicine in postoperative wound assessment to diagnose or exclude surgical site infection | Use of digital images for remote postoperative wound assessment. Compared with in-person wound assessment. | High concordance between remote assessors and in-person wound reviews. | Remote postoperative wound management for vascular surgery patients. |
| 32  | 61  | Robaldo, 2010      | Telemedicine in vascular surgery: Clinical experience in a single center | Videoconferencing and remote BP monitoring for remote management of post endarterectomy patients. | Telemonitoring was feasible for remote postoperative management, with results comparable to the in-hospital group, and allowed for early patient discharge. | Remote postoperative wound management for vascular surgery patients. |
TABLE 1 (Continued)

| No. | Ref | First author, year | Title | Summary of TM intervention | Summary of findings/conclusions | Potential for perioperative use in cardiovascular surgery |
|-----|-----|---------------------|-------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|
| 33  | 62  | Hands, 2004         | The use of telemedicine in the management of vascular surgical referrals | Digital images and videoconferencing for the diagnosis and triage of vascular surgery candidates. | TM allows for remote specialist assessment of vascular referrals with correct diagnoses. | Diagnosis, triage, and management in vascular surgery candidates. |
| 34  | 63  | Endean, 2001        | Telemedicine in vascular surgery: Does it work? | Use of video-surveillance and remote transmission of clinical parameters in the assessment of vascular surgery patients, compared with face-to-face assessment. | Accurate assessment and management by a remote specialist were feasible, with high inter-rater reliability between the TM and in-person assessors. | Diagnosis, triage, and management in vascular surgery candidates. |
| 35  | 64  | Lin, 2018           | Implementation of a virtual vascular clinic with point-of-care ultrasound in an integrated healthcare system | Use of videoconferencing, remote imaging technologies in the diagnosis, management, and postoperative follow-up of vascular surgery candidates. | Remote specialist management of vascular patients using TM is useful and effective, both pre and postoperatively. | Diagnosis, triage, and management in vascular surgery candidates. |

Abbreviations: BP, blood pressure; CABG, coronary artery bypass graft; ECG, electrocardiogram; HF, heart failure; HR, heart rate; TM, telemedicine.

2 CONCLUSION AND FUTURE RESEARCH

Overall, in the COVID-19 era remote monitoring shows the most potential for use in the ongoing crisis. Combinations of regular virtual consultations and remote monitoring of clinical parameters are feasible before surgery. Remote monitoring could also be useful to assess and triage patients who were due to come in for face-to-face review, with patients who were due to come in for face-to-face review with more accessible to those best placed to benefit from it. As society and healthcare seek to find a "new normal" greater investor's priority is to explore the use of TM to reduce patient-to-physician contact as much as possible. The use of TM can become more common. The authors believe that more attention is needed to see how TM can become more accessible to those best placed to benefit from it.

At our unit, Liverpool Heart and Chest Hospital which is the regional hub for all cardiac surgery procedures in North-West of England during COVID-19 pandemic, we have used such practice successfully through virtual follow-up using telephone conversations with patients who were due to come in for face-to-face review otherwise. We have also practiced the same method for patients who were due to come in for face-to-face review otherwise. We have also practiced the same method for patients who were due to come in for face-to-face review otherwise. We have also practiced the same method for patients who were due to come in for face-to-face review otherwise. We have also practiced the same method for patients who were due to come in for face-to-face review otherwise.
In addition to this, a potential future for TM may be the use of telepresence surgery on vascular patients. Telepresence surgery would allow for more socially distanced operations to occur via TM and could benefit patients who cannot risk traveling longer journeys for operations. Whilst preliminary research has shown this type of surgery to be effective on swine, and robotic surgery is more widely accepted in healthcare, more research would be needed to see if this surgery could be applicable to humans and how feasible this surgery could be implemented under the NHS.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The authors declare that there are no conflict of interests.

ORCID

Amer Harky http://orcid.org/0000-0001-5507-5841

REFERENCES

1. Sohrabi C, Alsafi Z, O’Neill N, et al. World Health Organization declares global emergency: a review of the 2019 novel coronavirus (COVID-19). Int J Surg. 2020;76:71-76.
2. Singhal T. A review of coronavirus disease-2019 (COVID-19). Indian J Pediatr. 2020;87:281-286.
3. Coronavirus (COVID-19) events as they happen [Internet]. [cited 2020 May 11]. Available from: https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019/events-as-they-happen
4. CMO confirms cases of coronavirus in England - GOV.UK [Internet]. [cited 2020 Jun 2]. Available from: https://www.gov.uk/government/news/cmo-confirms-cases-of-coronavirus-in-england
5. Number of coronavirus (COVID-19) cases and risk in the UK - GOV.UK [Internet]. [cited 2020 Jun 2]. Available from: https://www.gov.uk/guidance/coronavirus-covid-19-information-for-the-public
6. Rothan HA, Byrareddy SN. The epidemiology and pathogenesis of coronavirus disease (COVID-19) outbreak. J Autoimmun. 2020;109:102433.
7. Stedman M, Davies M, Lunt M, Verma A, Anderson SG, Heald AH. A phased approach to unlocking during the COVID-19 pandemic—lessons from trend analysis. Int J Clin Pract. 2020.e13528. https://doi.org/10.1111/ijcp.13528
8. Government publishes latest R number - GOV.UK [Internet]. [cited 2020 Jun 2]. Available from: https://www.gov.uk/government/news/government-publishes-latest-r-number
9. Coronavirus: NHS looking for 250,000 volunteers as new hospital announced | UK News | Sky News [Internet]. [cited 2020 Jun 2]. Available from: https://news.sky.com/story/coronavirus-250-000-strong-volunteer-force-sought-to-help-nhs-deal-with-crisis-11963068
10. Coronavirus and cancer – latest updates - Cancer Research UK - Science blog [Internet]. [cited 2020 Jun 2]. Available from: https://scienceblog.cancerresearchuk.org/2020/03/19/coronavirus-and-cancer-latest-updates/
11. Nepogodiiev D, Bhangu A. Elective surgery cancellations due to the COVID-19 pandemic: global predictive modelling to inform surgical recovery plans. Br J Surg. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1002/bjs.11746
12. Iacobucci G. Covid-19: all non-urgent elective surgery is suspended for at least three months in England. BMJ. 2020;368:m1106.
13. Royal College of Anaesthetists, Association of AnaesthetistsICS and F of ICM. Restarting planned surgery in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic. 2020;(May)1-7. Available from: https://rcمانeاستياساتيسيابيوتص-19.org/restarting-planned-surgery-in-the-context-of-the-covid-19-pandemic
14. Iacobucci G. Covid-19: NHS outlines services to be prioritised to restart in next six weeks. BMJ. 2020;369:m1793.
15. COVID-19: video consultations and homeworking [Internet]. [cited 2020 Jun 2]. Available from: https://www.bma.org.uk/advice-and-support/covid-19/adapting-to-covid/covid-19-video-consultations-and-homeworking
16. Cipolat C, Geiges M. 1.2. The History of Telemedicine. In: Telemedicine and Teledermatology [Internet]. Basel: KARGER; 2002:6-11. [cited 2020 May 18]. Available from: https://www.karger.com/Article/FullText/67346
17. Zundel KM. Telemedicine: history, applications, and impact on librarianship. Bull Med Libr Assoc. 1996;84(1):71-79.
18. Hurst EJ. Evolutions in telemedicine: from smoke signals to mobile health solutions. J Hosp Librariansh. 2016;16(2):174-185.
19. Mechanic OJ, Kimball AB. Telehealth systems. StatPearls. Treasure Island, FL: StatPearls Publishing; 2019. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK459384/
20. 2010 Opportunities and developments Report on the second global survey on eHealth Global Observatory for eHealth series-Volume 2 TELEMEDICINE in Member States. 2010.
21. Webster P. Virtual health care in the era of COVID-19. Lancet. 2020; 395(10231):1180-1181.
22. Nagayoshi Y, Oshima S, Ogawa H Clinical Impact of Telemedicine Network System at Rural Hospitals Without On-Site Cardiac Surgery Backup. Telemed e-Health [Internet]. 2016 Nov 1 [cited 2020 May 18]; 22(11):960-964. Available from: https://www.liebertpub.com/doi/10.1089/tmj.2015.0225
23. Remote consultations - GMC [Internet]. [cited 2020 May 16]. Available from: https://www.gmc-uk.org/ethical-guidance/ethical-hub/remote-consultations
24. Total Triage First, online and video consultation - NHS Digital Primary Care [Internet]. [cited 2020 May 16]. Available from: https://www.covid19-gpg.innovationlab.org.uk/topics/remote-working/total-triage-consult
25. NHSE and NHSI - Clinical guide for the management of remote consultations and remote working in secondary care during the coronavirus pandemic. 2020.
26. The Royal College of Surgeons of England; Royal college of physicians and surgeons of Glasgow, RCS; Royal College of Surgeons of Edinburgh. Clinical guide to surgical prioritisation during the coronavirus pandemic. 2020;(11 April 2020 version 1). Available from: https://www.england.nhs.uk/coronavirus/
27. Gackowski A, Czekierda A, Richardt G, et al. Validation of 12-lead telecardiography. Pediatr Cardiol. 2015;36(1):226
28. Garg R, Sevilla A, Garberich R, Fleishman CE. Remote delivery of congenital cardiac magnetic resonance imaging services: a unique telemedicine model. Pediatr Cardio. 2015;36(1):226-232.
29. Sekar P, Vilvanathan V. Telecardiology: effective means of delivering cardiac care to rural children. Asian Cardiovasc Thorac Ann. 2007;15(4):320-323. Available from: http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/021849230701500411
30. Evangelista A, Galuppo V, Méndez J, et al. Hand-held cardiac ultrasound screening performed by family doctors with remote expert support interpretation. Heart. 2016;102(5):376-382.
31. Bonvini R. Telemedicine for cardiac surgery candidates. Eur J Cardio- Thoracic Surg. 2002;22(3):377-380. Available from: https://academic.oup.com/ejcts/article-lookup/doi/10.1016/S1010-7940(02)00364-0
32. Garg R, Sevilla A, Garberich R, Fleishman CE. Remote delivery of congenital cardiac magnetic resonance imaging services: a unique telemedicine model. Pediatr Cardiol. 2015;36(1):226-232.
33. Fye WB. A History of the origin, evolution, and impact of electrocardiography. Am J Cardiol. 1994;73(13):937-949.
34. Schwaab B, Katalinic A, Richardt G, et al. Validation of 12-lead teleelectrocardiogram transmission in the real-life scenario of acute coronary syndrome. J Telemed Telecare. 2006;12(6):315-318.
35. Mavrogeni SI, Tsirintani M, Kleanthous C, et al. Supervision of thoroblysm of acute myocardial infarction using telemedicine.
70. Cooper TJ, Woodward BL, Alom S, Harky A. Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) outcomes in HIV/AIDS patients: a systematic review. HIV Med. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1111/hiv.12911
71. Khan IH, Zahra SA, Zaim S, Harky A. At the heart of COVID-19. J Card Surg. 2020;35(6):1287-1294. https://doi.org/10.1111/jocs.14596
72. Shafi AMA, Shaikh SA, Shirke MM, Iddawela S, Harky A. Cardiac manifestations in COVID-19 patients—A systematic review. J Card Surg. 2020;35(8):1988-2008. https://doi.org/10.1111/jocs.14808
73. Adam S, Zahra SA, Chor CYT, Khare Y, Harky A. COVID-19 pandemic and its impact on service provision: a cardiology prospect. Acta Cardiol. 2020;1-8. https://doi.org/10.1080/00015385.2020.1787636
74. Harky A, Chen R, Pullan M. Examining the impact of COVID-19 on cardiac surgery services: the lessons learned from this pandemic. J Card Surg. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1111/jocs.14783
75. Harahwa TA, Lai Yau TH, Lim-Cooke M, Al-Haddi S, Zeinah M, Harky A. The optimal diagnostic methods for COVID-19. Diagnosis. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1515/dx-2020-0058
76. Shirke MH, Shaikh SA, Harky A. Tele-oncology in the COVID-19 Era: the way forward? Trends in Cancer. 2020;6(7):547-549. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trecan.2020.05.013
77. Abuelgasim E, Saw LJ, Shirke M, Zeinah M, Harky A. COVID-19: unique public health issues facing Black, Asian and minority ethnic communities. Curr Prob Cardiol. 2020;45(8):100621. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpcardiol.2020.100621
78. Zaim S, Chong JH, Sankaranarayanan V, Harky A. COVID-19 and multiorgan response. Curr Prob in Cardiol. 2020;45(8):100618. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpcardiol.2020.100618
79. Mohamed Abdel Shafi A, Hewage S, Harky A. The impact of COVID-19 on the provision of cardiac surgical services. J Card Surg. 2020;35(6):1295-1297. https://doi.org/10.1111/jocs.14631
80. Whittaker A, Anson M, Harky A. Neurological manifestations of COVID-19: a systematic review and current update. Acta Neurol Scand. 2020;142(1):14-22. https://doi.org/10.1111/ane.13266
81. Harky A, Chiu CM, Yau THL, Lai SHD. Cancer Patient Care during COVID-19. Cancer Cell. 2020;37(6):749-750. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ccell.2020.05.006

How to cite this article: Ajibade A, Younas H, Pullan M, Harky A. Telemedicine in cardiovascular surgery during COVID-19 pandemic: A systematic review and our experience. J Card Surg. 2020;35:2773–2784. https://doi.org/10.1111/jocs.14933