Contrasted optimal environmental windows for both sardinella species in Senegalese waters
Ousmane Diankha, Aliou Ba, Patrice Brehmer, Timothee Brochier, Bamol Ali Sow, Modou Thiaw, Amadou Thierno Gaye, Fambaye Ngom, Herve Demarcq

To cite this version:
Ousmane Diankha, Aliou Ba, Patrice Brehmer, Timothee Brochier, Bamol Ali Sow, et al.. Contrasted optimal environmental windows for both sardinella species in Senegalese waters. Fisheries Oceanography, Wiley, 2018, 27 (4), pp.351-365. 10.1111/fog.12257. hal-01826581

HAL Id: hal-01826581
https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-01826581
Submitted on 21 May 2020

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L’archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d’enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.
Contrasted optimal environmental windows for both sardinella species in Senegalese waters

Ousmane Diankha1 | Aliou Ba2,3 | Patrice Brehmer3,4 | Timothée Brochier3,5 | Bamol Ali Sow6 | Modou Thiaw4 | Amadou Thierno Gaye1 | Fambaye Ngom4 | Hervé Demarcq7

1Laboratoire de Physique de l’Atmosphère et de l’Océan Siméon Fongang (LPAO-SF), Ecole Supérieure Polytechnique (ESP), Université Cheikh Anta Diop (UCAD), Fann Dakar, Sénégal
2Université Cheikh Anta Diop (UCAD), UCAD II, Institut Universitaire des Pêches et d’Auculture (IUPA), Dakar, Sénégal
3Institut de Recherche pour le Développement (IRD), UMR 195 Lemar (Laboratory of Marine Environment), Dakar, Sénégal
4Centre de Recherches Océanographiques de Dakar-Thiariyoe (CRODT), Institut Sénégalais de Recherches Agricoles (ISRA), Dakar, Sénégal
5Institut de Recherche pour le Développement (IRD), UMI 209, UMMISCO, Univ Paris 06, Sorbonne Universités, Bondy, France
6Laboratoire d’Océanographie, des Sciences de l’Environnement et du Climat (LOSEC), Département de Physique, Université Assane Seck de Ziguinchor (UASZ), UFR Sciences & Technologies, Ziguinchor, Sénégal
7Institut de Recherche pour le Développement (IRD), UMR 248 MARBEC (Marine Biodiversity, Exploitation and Conservation), Sète, France

Correspondence
O. Diankha
Email: ousmane.diankha@ucad.edu.sn

Funding information
IRD; BMBF, Grant/Award Number: 01DG12073E; European Commission’s Seventh Framework Programme, Grant/ Award Number: 603521

[The copyright line for this article was changed on 16 April 2018 after original online publication.]

Abstract
We investigate Sardinella aurita and Sardinella maderensis recruitment success relative to the variability of oceanographic conditions in Senegalese waters using generalized additive models (GAM). Results show that recruitment of both species is marked by a strong intra-annual (seasonal) variation with minimum and maximum in winter and summer, respectively. Their interannual variations are synchronous until 2006 (recruitment decreasing), while from 2007 there is no synchrony. The model developed shows that sardinella recruitment variability is closely related to the tested environmental variables in the study area. However, the key environmental variables influencing the recruitment success are different for both species: the Coastal Upwelling Index and the sea surface temperature for S. aurita and S. maderensis, respectively. We report that recruitment success of S. aurita and S. maderensis are associated with distinct ranges of sea surface temperature, upwelling intensity, wind-induced turbulence, concentration of chlorophyll-a and north Atlantic oscillation index. Considering food security and socio-economic importance of both stocks, we recommend that consideration is given to the environmental variability in the small pelagic fish national management plans, particularly in the context of climate change.

KEYWORDS
recruitment success, Sardinella aurita, Sardinella maderensis, upwelling, West Africa
1 INTRODUCTION

Hydroclimatic conditions along Senegalese coasts are particularly favorable to many fishes, due to enrichment by one of the most productive upwelling systems (Auger, Gorgues, Machu, Aumont, & Brehmer, 2016; Binet, 1988; Roy, Cury, Fontana, & Belvèze, 1989). Indeed, their abundance is thought to be related to the enrichment of the euphotic zone which increases primary production (Bakun, 1997; Cury & Roy, 1987; Demarquq & Samb, 1991). This eastern boundary upwelling system is characterized by a strong seasonal and interannual variability, well known to impact the fluctuations of abundance and distribution of small pelagic fishes (Bakun, 1996; Cury & Roy, 1989; Teisson, 1982).

To date, it is well established that large marine ecosystems (LME) have been continuously warming during the 1982–2006 period, and to a lesser extent the California and Humboldt LME (Belkin, 2009), also including eastern boundary upwelling systems. In California, thermal trends are extremely variable within sub-regions, as noted by Mendelssohn and Schwing (2002) between 1945 and 1990, whereas global warming is evident across the 1950–2000 period in this system (Syedman et al., 2014). Based on in situ data, surface temperature in the Canary Current large marine ecosystem (CCLME) increased by 0.52°C from 1982 to 2006 (Belkin, 2009) and between 0.50 and 0.75°C from 1950 to 2000 (Harrison & Carson, 2007). Remote sensing observations also showed that this warming is spatially heterogeneous, particularly in the Southern part of the CCLME (Demarquq, 2009). Recent updates (A. Sarre et al., personal communication, March 2017) show extreme warming rates of 0.5°C per decade from 1982 to 2015 in the Mauritanian and Senegalese region. A depletion of phytoplankton biomass is usually associated with this warming (i.e., Richardson & Schoeman, 2004), even if moderate and spatially restricted to Mauritania and Senegal from 1998 to 2014 (Demarquq & Benazzouz, 2015). Therefore, such changes might influence the recruitment success of small pelagic fish populations (Chassot, Floch, Dewals, Planet, & Chavance, 2011; Longhurst, 2010; Moore, Harvey, & Van Niel, 2009; Oliver & Irwin, 2008).

Round sardinella (Sardinella aurita) and flat sardinella (Sardinella maderensis), the only Sardinella sampled in the Senegalese area, account for more than 80% of the Senegalese artisanal fisheries total landings (Diankha et al., 2017; FAO, 2012), which are marked by strong seasonal and interannual fluctuations (Thiaw et al., 2017). Both species have short-lived, zooplankton feeders with similar shape and size (maximum fork length ~30 cm; Ba et al., 2016), and occupy almost the same geographical areas over the Senegalese continental shelf (Cury & Fontana, 1988). However, these species have some physiological differences. Sardinella aurita undergoes an intensive seasonal migration from Morocco to Guinea passing through Mauritania, Senegal and Gambia due to the spatial variability and strong seasonality of the Senegalo-Mauritanian Upwelling System (Boély, 1982; Boély & Fréon, 1979). This seasonal displacement makes its spawning heterogeneous, which occurs preferentially over the Arguin Bank (Mauritania) and the south of Cap-Vert (Senegal; Boély, Chabanne, & Fréon, 1978; Boély, Chabanne, Fréon, & Stéquert, 1982; Conand, 1977; Tiedemann & Brehmer, 2017). The migration of S. maderensis is less marked around its nursery area (Boély, 1982; Cury & Fontana, 1988), suggesting that this species is able to adapt more readily to environmental variations. Sardinella maderensis is less sensitive to climatic/environmental fluctuations than S. aurita and has a less flexible adaptive strategy resulting in a smaller plasticity of their biological parameters (Ba et al., 2016). Moreover, S. maderensis showed smaller variability of biological and demographic parameters than S. aurita (Cury & Fontana, 1988).

Several studies attempted to investigate the dynamic of sardinella populations in relation to environmental change. Sabatés, Martin, Lloret, and Raya (2006) showed that abundance of S. aurita in West Mediterranean waters is positively correlated to sea surface temperature (SST). In Mauritanian waters, it has been demonstrated that high abundance of S. aurita is associated with SST below 21°C (Zeeberg, Corten, Tjoë-Awie, Coca, & Hamady, 2008). Diankha, Wade, et al. (2015) suggested that important catches of S. aurita in Senegalese waters occur with SST ranges of 22–24°C. Recently, Bacha, Jeyid, Vantrepotte, Dessailly, and Amara (2016) demonstrated that a high part of the catch variability of S. aurita in Mauritanian waters could be associated with SST variations. New investigations carried out by Thiaw et al. (2017) showed that the variations in sardinella biomass in Senegalese waters were driven by environmental conditions. Similar studies on the second sardinella, i.e., S. maderensis, are scarce.

However, it is worth highlighting that the assessment of reliable abundance indices of small pelagic fish from artisanal fisheries landings remains complex (Ould Taïlib Sidi, 2005). It relies on parameters difficult to estimate such as the fishing effort (Mangel & Bede, 1985), particularly in the artisanal sector targeting the sardinella which are mainly targeted when occurring in fish school structures (Brehmer et al., 2007). The approach used in this study avoids misleading interpretation due to eventual bias in the catch per unit of effort (CPUE) estimation because the number of trips (outings) considered as fishing effort is not a proxy of the real effort. Moreover, the relationships between pelagic habitats and marine resources are fairly complex due to their fundamentally non-linear characteristics (Boély, 1982; Rothschild, 2000). This is why links between the fluctuations of environmental conditions and the abundance of sardinella is still not well understood and difficult to predict for management and decision making support.

This study contributes to a better understanding of the relationships between environmental variability and the local abundance fluctuations of sardinella. It aims to define the environmental conditions associated with recruitment success of S. aurita and S. maderensis in Senegalese waters, based on the monitoring of landings per size classes. The influence of four environmental variables on the recruitment of both species is tested and quantified over one decade.

2 MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1 Study area

The study area is the Senegalo-Mauritanian upwelling system (Figure 1), a part of the Canary Current Large Marine Ecosystem.
(CCLME), influenced by the Canary Current (CC) flowing along the African coast from north to south between 30°N–10°N and offshore to 20°W (Fedoseev, 1970). This upwelling system begins in late autumn and ends in spring (Teisson, 1982). In the region north of Dakar, where the continental shelf is narrow, the upwelling occurs near the coast, while south of Dakar characterized by a larger continental shelf and the upwelling is a trapped cold water tongue in the middle of the continental shelf surrounded by warmed waters (Ndoye et al., 2014). The Senegalese upwelling is marked by great seasonal and interannual variability thought to have effects on small pelagic fish (Bakun, 1996; Cury & Roy, 1987; Fréon, 1991; Fréon & Mendoza, 2003).

FIGURE 1  Map of the study area situated on the Senegalese coast showing the main sardinella landing ports. The landing ports are grouped by sub-region: the northern coast (e.g., Saint-Louis, and Cayar), the Dakar region (e.g., Yoff, Ouakam, Soumbédione and Hann) and the south of the country (Mbour and Joal; reproduced from Thiaw et al., 2017).

2.2 Biological fisheries data for both Sardinella

Landing data per size classes were used to estimate sardinella recruitment applying the virtual population analysis (VPA) cohort modeling technique widely used in fisheries science (Jones, 1984; Lassen & Medley, 2001; Pope, 1972). Monthly data were used in this work combining two data sets: (i) total landing of both sardinella species from artisanal fishing over the period 2004–2013. This dataset was extracted from the database of the national Senegalese fisheries and oceanographic center the CRODT (Centre de Recherche Océanographique Dakar-Thiaroye), collected from the main Senegalese landing ports: Saint-Louis, Cayar, Yoff, Ouakam, Soumbédione, Hann, Mbour Joal, Foundiougne and Kafountine (Figure 1).
The number of trips per fishing gear was recorded on a daily basis, while landings data were randomly collected for about 5 days a week. After aggregating the data by port, gear and period (fortnightly), total landings per port were estimated by multiplying mean landings of sampled trips by the total number of fishing trips (Chaboud et al., 2015; Thiao, 2009). Note that landings were summed per month for each landing port (Chaboud et al., 2015; Thiao, Ngom, & Thiam, 2012). (ii) A secondary data set was only used for the VPA, the monthly size distributions of both species from the same landing ports within a period of 15 months between July 2014 and September 2015. The total number of measured individuals was 96,963 split between 51,295 individuals of *S. aurita* and 45,668 individuals of *S. maderensis*. It is worth mentioning that fish samples were randomly taken while individual weights as well as size were recorded. To estimate the recruitment from VPA, the number of individuals per size classes is first transformed into size frequencies. Missing data were then substituted by the average of the corresponding missing month of the time series for the same fishing port. We assume that all monthly landings were distributed according to this average size frequency per fishing port. Then we used a size-age key to convert size class data into seasonal age groups by applying the growth equation of von Bertalanffy (Matsinos & Wolff, 2001) using the growth parameters of sardinella (Fröen, 1988). Seasonal time step (winter: January–March, spring: April–June, summer: July–September and autumn: October–December) was chosen to consider biological characteristics of both species, fast growth and short life cycle (Boëly, 1980). Seasonal and interannual sums were also computed.

### 2.3 Environmental variables

Monthly data concerning five environmental variables often applied to investigate relationships between fish abundance and environmental conditions (Bacha et al., 2016; Cury & Roy, 1989; Klemas, 2012; Thiaw et al., 2017) were used in our study: sea surface temperature (SST, in °C), chlorophyll-α concentration (Chl-α, in mg/m³), wind-induced turbulence (WTI, in m²/s²) and a Coastal Upwelling Index (CUI, in m³/s³ per meter of coast) deduced from wind data and North Atlantic Oscillation index (NAO). Except NAO, all variables were averaged from the coast to the 200 m isobaths, i.e., over almost all the Senegalese sardinella habitat, the continental shelf from 12 to 17°N (Figure 1). Their seasonal and interannual means were also computed.

SST is commonly used to investigate relationships between environment and fish abundance (Kellogg & Gift, 1983; Ramos, Santiago, Sangra, & Canton, 1996). Chl-α is considered as an index of biological productivity (Lorenzen, 1970) and a proxy of food abundance. In this work, we used the Aqua-MODIS “Level 2” SST and Chl-α data from January 2004 to December 2013 obtained from the NASA Goddard Space Flight Center (GSFC) through the NASA web site (http://oceancolor.gsfc.nasa.gov). The spatial resolutions of these data were 4 km.

Wind speed data (m/s) from January 2004 to December 2013 were obtained from the historic reanalysis wind data, from the National Center for Environmental Prediction and the National Center for Atmospheric Research (NCEP/NCAR, 2.5° resolution). We defined the WTI as the cube of the wind speed, similarly to early ecological studies (Bacha et al., 2016; Ueyama & Monger, 2005). CUI were estimated from the equation:

\[
CUI = \frac{\tau}{\rho_w f}
\]

where \(\tau\) is the along shore component of wind stress within the coastline (from Saint-Louis to Joal), \(\rho_w\) is the seawater density (1,025 kg/m³) and \(f\) is the Coriolis parameter (2Ω sin (Φ)), with Ω and Φ equal to the Earth’s angular velocity and latitude, respectively.

The NAO is considered to be the most important mode of atmospheric variability over the North Atlantic Ocean, and plays a major role in weather and climate variations over the North Atlantic continent (Hurrell, 1995, 1996). For this study, monthly time series of NAO indices were downloaded from the year 2004 to 2013, from the website of NOAA (US National Environmental and Atmospheric Administration, http://www.noaa.gov/).

### 2.4 Statistical modeling approach

The general additive model (GAM) of Hastie and Tibshirani (1986) was used: (i) to quantify the contribution of the climatic variables; and (ii) to investigate ranges of each environmental variable associated with high recruitment success. Unlike in general linear models (GLM), GAM do not require any prior assumption on the functional link between each variable and the recruitment index. These relationships are modeled with continuous smoothing functions. The dependent variables (*S. aurita* and *S. maderensis* recruitment) were modeled as the additive sum of non-parametric functions of covariates. The explanatory variables included in the model were: SST, Chl-α, WTI, CUI and NAO. The “mgcv” package in the R software (Wood, Scheipl, & Faraway, 2013) was used. The Gaussian distribution and the family equal to the Earth’s angular velocity and latitude, respectively).

The NAO is considered to be the most important mode of atmospheric variability over the North Atlantic Ocean, and plays a major role in weather and climate variations over the North Atlantic continent (Hurrell, 1995, 1996). For this study, monthly time series of NAO indices were downloaded from the year 2004 to 2013, from the website of NOAA (US National Environmental and Atmospheric Administration, http://www.noaa.gov/).

The general additive model (GAM) of Hastie and Tibshirani (1986) was used: (i) to quantify the contribution of the climatic variables; and (ii) to investigate ranges of each environmental variable associated with high recruitment success. Unlike in general linear models (GLM), GAM do not require any prior assumption on the functional link between each variable and the recruitment index. These relationships are modeled with continuous smoothing functions. The dependent variables (*S. aurita* and *S. maderensis* recruitment) were modeled as the additive sum of non-parametric functions of covariates. The explanatory variables included in the model were: SST, Chl-α, WTI, CUI and NAO. The “mgcv” package in the R software (Wood, Scheipl, & Faraway, 2013) was used. The Gaussian distribution and the family equal to the Earth’s angular velocity and latitude, respectively).

The data included in the model consisted of seasonal data from 2004 to 2013, so the number of observations are \(n = 40\).
The relative importance of each variable in the total deviance was determined from the “relaimpo” R package (Tonidandel & LeBreton, 2011). The application of this package allows the partition of the total explained deviance among the four predictors to better understand the role played by each one.

The variance inflation factors (VIFs) were calculated for all environmental variables in order to detect possible high dimensional collinearities (Zuur, Elena, & Chris, 2010). In fact, it was suggested by these authors that covariates with VIFs >5 are highly collinear. However, all VIF values calculated here were <2.

3 | RESULTS

3.1 | Variability of Sardinella aurita and S. maderensis recruitment

Sardinella recruitment in Senegalese waters is characterized by a marked seasonal variability (Figure 2a,b). For both species, the recruitment showed maximum and minimum values in summer and winter, respectively. According to their interannual variability, the highest S. aurita recruitments were observed in summer and spring in 2007 and 2009, respectively (Figure 2c). The lowest recruitment

![Figure 2](image-url)

**Figure 2** (a and b) Boxplots of seasonal variability of Sardinella aurita and Sardinella maderensis recruitment in Senegalese waters from January 2004 to December 2013, respectively. The whiskers correspond to the minima and maxima, the horizontal lines and the black dots in the boxes are the median and the mean, respectively. (c) Interannual variability of Sardinella aurita recruitment (black line) and Sardinella maderensis recruitment (grey line) in Senegalese waters from January 2004 to December 2013. The black and grey dashed lines correspond to the fitting curves for S. aurita and S. maderensis, respectively. Wi, Winter (January–March); Sp, Spring (April–June); Su, Summer (July–September) and Au, Autumn (October–December)
of *S. aurita* was noted in winter in 2004. For *S. maderensis*, the highest recruitment was recorded in summer 2004, and the lowest in winter in 2008 and 2013 (Figure 2c). The recruitment is synchronous (and decreasing) for both species until 2006, while from 2007 no synchrony is observed.

### 3.2 Variability of the environmental variables

Except for the NAO index, the other tested variables showed that Senegalese waters are characterized by a strong season to season variability in environmental parameters (Figure 3). SST showed a maximum and a minimum in summer and winter, respectively (Figure 3a). The Chl-α showed a downward trend with a peak in spring and minimum values in autumn (Figure 3b). Maximum and minimum values of WTI and CUI are associated with winter and summer seasons, respectively (Figure 3c,d).

The interannual variability of these variables shows a marked pattern. The SST showed that summer in 2005 and winter in 2009 were the warmest and coldest periods of our time series (Figure 4). The summers in 2006, 2011 and 2010 corresponded to periods of lowest primary production while the highest values were recorded in spring 2011 and 2012 (Figure 5). The WTI time series variability showed higher values in winter in 2009 and 2011, and lower in summer in 2006 and 2009 (Figure 6). With respect to CUI interannual variations, the weakest intensity in winter occurred in 2008, while the strongest were recorded in 2009 and 2011 (Figure 7). As for the NAO year to year variation, the lowest and highest values were associated with spring and autumn 2008 and 2011, respectively (Figure 8).

### 3.3 Effect of the environmental variables on *S. aurita* recruitment

The relationships between *S. aurita* recruitment and the selected variables generated by the GAM showed that each variable had a specific influence on *S. aurita* recruitment (Figure 9, first row). SST showed a positive effect on *S. aurita* recruitment between 22.0 and 28.5°C (Figure 9a). A positive effect of the Chl-α occurs for low values (≤3.3 mg/m³) and high values (Figure 9b). The influence of WTI is positive for values <150 m³/s³ (Figure 9c) while CUI showed a similar positive effect up to 1.4 m³ s⁻³ m⁻¹ (Figure 9d). The effect of NAO on *S. aurita* recruitment is dome-shaped with positive effect between −1 and 0.5 (Figure 9f). The year to year variability of the effects of the environmental variables deduced from the GAM indicates that the highest effect of the variables occurred between 2008 and 2009 (Figure 10, first row). The model reveals that the five environmental variables explained 77.6% of the deviance (Table 1a). The CUI alone explains 36.7% (55% of the total contribution). SST and WTI were the second and third most important variables explaining 16.4% and 14.5% of the variability of *S. aurita* recruitment, respectively. Chl-α account for 8.3% of the total deviance. The contribution of NAO is very low, <1%.

![FIGURE 3](image) Boxbplot of seasonal variability of the environmental variables tested (SST, Chl-α, WTI, CUI and NAO) from 2004 to 2013. SST, Sea surface temperature (°C); Chl-α, concentration of chlorophyll-α (mg m³); WTI, wind-induced turbulence index (m³/s³); CUI, coastal upwelling index (m³/s³ per meter of coast); NAO, North Atlantic oscillation index. The whiskers correspond to the minima and maxima, the horizontal lines and the black dots in the boxes are the median and the mean, respectively.
**FIGURE 4** Interannual variability of the sea surface temperature (SST, °C) from 2004 to 2013. Wi, Winter (January–March); Sp, Spring (April–June); Su, Summer (July–September); Au, Autumn (October–December)

**FIGURE 5** Interannual variability of the concentration of chlorophyll-a (Chl-a, mg m⁻³) from 2004 to 2013. Wi, Winter (January–March); Sp, Spring (April–June); Su, Summer (July–September); Au, Autumn (October–December)
**FIGURE 6** Interannual variability of the wind-induced turbulence index (WTI, m$^3$/s$^3$) from 2004 to 2013. Wi, Winter (January–March); Sp, Spring (April–June); Su, Summer (July–September); and Au, Autumn (October–December)

**FIGURE 7** Interannual variability of the coastal upwelling index (CUI, m$^3$/s$^3$ per meter of coast) from 2004 to 2013. Wi, Winter (January–March); Sp, Spring (April–June); Su, Summer (July–September); and Au, Autumn (October–December)
3.4 Effect of the environmental variables on S. maderensis recruitment

The shapes of the relationship between variables SST and CUI and S. maderensis recruitment generated with the GAM (Figure 9, second row) are quite different from those obtained for S. aurita (Figure 9, first row), while that with Chl-a and WTI are similar. Indeed, high recruitment is associated with high SST i.e., above 25°C (Figure 9e), instead of 22°C for S. aurita. High recruitment of S. maderensis is associated with low Chl-a (<4.4 mg/m³) on the continental shelf, while a negative effect occurred above this value (Figure 9f). Positive effect of WTI is recorded for values <140 m³/s³ (Figure 9g). Values

FIGURE 8 Interannual variability of the North Atlantic oscillation index (NAO) from 2004 to 2013. Wi, Winter (January–March); Sp, Spring (April–June); Su, Summer (July–September); Au, Autumn (October–December)

FIGURE 9 General additive model (GAM) derived effect of environmental variables (SST, Chl-a, WTI, CUI and NAO) on Sardinella aurita (first row) and Sardinella maderensis (second row) recruitment from January 2004 to December 2013. SST, sea surface temperature (°C), Chl-a, concentration of chlorophyll-a (mg m⁻³); WTI, wind-induced turbulence index (m³/s⁳); CUI, coastal upwelling index (m³/s³ per meter of coast); NAO, North Atlantic oscillation index; “ti”, smoother function used.
below 0.7 m$^3$ s$^{-1}$ m$^{-1}$ for CUI are associated with high *S. maderensis* recruitment (Figure 9h). The effect of NAO on *S. aurita* recruitment is different from that on *S. maderensis* recruitment. Negative effect of NAO is observed between $C_0$ 0.2 and 1.0 (Figure 9j). The interannual variability of the effect of all variables (Figure 10, second row) shows that the environmental effects are more favorable to recruitment during two periods over the considered decade: 2004–2005 and 2010–2012. The results of the GAM (total and partial deviances) are summarized in Table 1b; the total explanation reaches 66.1% of the variation in *S. maderensis* recruitment during the study period. SST accounts for 20.4% of the total variability and is the most determinant factor. Others factors are, WTI, Chl-$\alpha$, CUI and NAO which support 15.9%, 14.2%, 10.5% and 5.1%, respectively.

### DISCUSSION

The originality of this study relies on the use of recruitment estimations from the VPA method to investigate the influence of environmental conditions on the natural variability of sardinella in Senegal combined with a GAM. Previous studies were only based on CPUE.
data which strongly depends on fishing effort reliability, a parameter difficult to quantify (Mangel & Bede, 1985), especially for Senegalese artisanal fisheries where the unit of effort is expressed in number of outings. This does not reflect the real changes in fishing effort due to, for example, the non-consideration of the increase of distance traveled by the canoe and fishing activity duration, as reported in Ba et al. (2017). Moreover, the quick and important development of the Senegalese artisanal fishery sector, along with structural and conjunctural changes, makes the choice difficult for the fishing effort unit. The use of the VPA may be limited by several sources of potential uncertainties, mainly related to catch extrapolations, assessment of discards and estimation of fishing mortalities used to initiate the cohort analysis (Gascuel, 1994). In our case, because of their high demand in the fish market, discards of sardinella are not frequent. Therefore, biases related to the distribution of catches by age class could be assumed to be negligible. Moreover, the sardinella are migratory species and the two main nursery areas are situated in Mauritanian (banc d’Arguin) and Senegal (petite cote); thus the sampling had covered a complete annual cycle, and such facts confirm our assumption that the whole populations have been sampled.

Results show that sardinella recruitment, like the environmental variables, are characterized by strong temporal variability. Both sardinella show similar seasonal variation in recruitment with a minimum and maximum in winter and summer, respectively. Winter and summer are opposite hydrological seasons. In Senegalese water, winter is characterized by cold waters, strong wind-induced turbulence and upwelling intensity, while the opposite occurs in summer. These results seem to suggest that at this stage, sardinella prefer oceanographic conditions in the summer. These results are in accordance with previous studies which suggest that variability in abundance and distribution of sardinella is mainly under the influence of oceanographic changes, such as cooling or warming waters (Bacha et al., 2016; Sabatés et al., 2006; Thiaw et al., 2017; Zeeberg et al., 2008).

This study is consistent with the findings of previous work which showed that the dynamics of small pelagic are closely linked to oceanographic conditions (Bacha et al., 2016; Bakun, 1996; Cury & Roy, 1989; Diankha, Thiaw, et al., 2015; Diankha, Wade, et al., 2015; Fréon, 1991; Fréon & Mendoza, 2003; Thiaw et al., 2017). The use of GAM, which takes into account the potentially complex non-linear relationships between the covariates, allowed a better illustration of the links between S. aurita, as well as S. maderensis and the oceanographic conditions off Senegal. The environmental variables considered in this work (SST, Chl-a, WTI CUI and NAO) were responsible for 76.7% and 66.1% of the variability of S. aurita and S. maderensis recruitment, respectively. The CUI and SST together accounted for 53.1% and 30.9% of the total explained variance for S. aurita and S. maderensis, respectively. Our results are in accordance with those found in Mauritanian waters, showing that SST and CUI were also the main environmental parameters explaining the variability of S. aurita (Bacha et al., 2016). The CUI played the major role in S. aurita recruitment variability, while for S. maderensis the SST was the key factor. However, SST was the second most important variable in S. aurita recruitment variability. The role of the upwelling intensity on S. aurita abundance was already well established (Bacha et al., 2016; Thiam, et al., 2015; Mbaye et al., 2015). Nevertheless, to our knowledge, studies quantifying the effect of upwelling intensity on S. maderensis abundance have not previously been reported. The effect of SST and CUI does not hide the influence of Chl-a and WTI which had significant effect on both sardinella recruitment success in this study. These observed differences might be due to their physiological characteristics which are relatively distinct: S. aurita is more sensitive to temperature and salinity fluctuation than S. maderensis, which tolerate higher change in salinity and temperature (Ba et al., 2016; Cury & Fontana, 1988). This is also explained by the fact that, even if both species occupy the same area in Senegal (Cury & Fontana, 1988), their relative abundance strongly differs between Northern Senegal (in connection with Mauritania) and Southern Senegal (Capet et al., 2016; Ndoe et al., 2014), warmer and less sensitive to the detrimental effects of a strong upwelling season.

The role of temperature on small pelagic fish stock dynamics has been previously reported (Pepin, 1991). Temperature always affects fish populations at different stages of their life cycles, including during spawning and the development and survival of the eggs and larvae, as well as influencing their distribution, diet, migration pattern and schooling behavior (Gordoa, Maso, & Yoges, 2000; Laevastu & Hayes, 1981; Sun, Blackburn, & Williams, 1981). Several studies have shown that abundance of sardinella is related to SST variability (Bacha et al., 2016; Diankha, Wade, et al., 2015; Sabatés et al., 2006; Thiaw et al., 2017; Zeeberg et al., 2008). However, S. maderensis is more associated with warmer waters (>24°C), as shown by Boély (1979), than S. aurita. Furthermore, the ideal balance between a moderate upwelling and warmer waters in Southern Senegal highly favors S. maderensis recruitment and its abundance, and makes it predominantly sensitive to environmental thermal variations and prey abundance with a low direct dependency of the upwelling intensity, whose detrimental effects are low in this region, characterized by a high physical retention capability of eggs and larvae (Demarcq & Faure, 2000; Mbaye et al., 2015; Roy et al., 1989).

The landings of small pelagic fish in the Pacific may be related to Chl-a (Ware & Thomson, 2005) and the influence of Chl-a is more important on sardine (Sardina pilchardus) than on S. aurita in Mauritania (Bacha et al., 2016). We also found a moderate influence of Chl-a on the recruitment success of S. aurita because its variability seems to be partly hidden by the upwelling intensity, whose effect is a direct increase of the primary production. The apparently higher influence of Chl-a (14.2%) for S. maderensis is explained by the low influence of the upwelling intensity, and despite the fact that its preferred habitat (Southern Senegal) is almost constantly enriched by both the coastal upwelling and a potential local enrichment from coastal estuaries (e.g., Saloum, Gambia mouth, Casamance river) and a much wider continental shelf versus Northern Senegal.

It is worth highlighting that the low effect of the North Atlantic Oscillation index (NAO; explaining 0.5% and 5% of S. aurita and S. maderensis recruitment variability, respectively), does not mean that its influence was negligible. We hypothesize that its influence...
on sardinella was not adequately taken into account in our GAM formulation, or was expressed through another variable. In fact, several studies suggested NAO influence on marine resources were generally reflected through its effect on SST (Caballero-Alfonso et al., 2010; Diankha, Wade, et al., 2015; Ottersen, Planque, Post, Reid, & Stenseth, 2001). These findings are in accordance with this study because the effect of SST on S. aurita increased when NAO took into account the global model. However, findings in this study are in contrast with Thiaw et al. (2017) who found that abundance indices for both sardinella species respond to the winter NAO index. The difference with the environmental correlations we found with recruitment may be attributed to two factors. First, the average adult spatial distribution and migration patterns at the sub-regional scale may change according to large scale climate indices such as NAO, without necessarily impacting the local (national) favorability for recruitment. Second, since 2004 fishing agreements were passed with surrounding countries, especially with Mauritania, so that Sardinella landed in Senegal may contain catch outside the Senegalese Exclusive Economic Zone (EEZ; Thiaw et al., 2017).

This study highlights the existence of distinct ranges of SST, Chlor-a, WTI, CUI and NAO associated with successful recruitment of S. aurita and S. maderensis in Senegalese waters (i.e., distinct optimal environmental windows; Cury & Roy, 1989). Indeed, higher recruitment of S. aurita and S. maderensis was associated with low upwelling intensity (<2 m³ s⁻³ m⁻¹ for S. aurita and <1 m³ s⁻³ m⁻¹ for S. maderensis), with SST ranging from 22 to 28°C for S. aurita and from 26 to 28°C for S. maderensis, low Chlor-a (<3 mg/m³ for S. aurita and <4 mg/m³ for S. maderensis) and WTI <150 m³/s² for S. aurita and <140 m³/s² for S. maderensis. In Bacha et al. (2016), SST above 24°C positively affects the abundance of S. aurita in Mauritanian waters and it has been established that some species avoid entering the coldest upwelling zone (SST between 15 and 21°C; Zeeberg et al., 2008). Unfavorable conditions mainly include low temperature having a negative effect on their growth (Cole & McGlade, 1998). In addition, it was suggested that a marine environment with Chlor-a above 0.2 mg/m³ could support sustainable fisheries (FAO, 2003; Gower, 1986). The pioneering work of Cury and Roy (1989) suggested that in upwelling areas there is an optimal wind speed value outside which recruitment success is lower. However, such optimal wind speed values are different from those found in this study. Cury and Roy (1989) highlighted that wind speeds values outside 5–6 m/s (corresponding to WTI from 125 to 216 m²/s³) had a negative effect on sardinella CPUE in Senegal, whilst we found a constantly higher recruitment success for low wind values for both sardinella species. This difference is probably due to the use of distinct indices in Cury and Roy (1989), and because they have worked on the S. aurita CPUE as abundance index, while our study considered the recruitment.

5 | CONCLUSION

The results obtained on the estimation of S. aurita and S. maderensis recruitment in Senegalese waters showed how their success is related to direct environmental conditions and the existence of different ranges of environmental conditions (optimal environmental windows) associated with high recruitment of S. aurita and S. maderensis. Moreover, both clupeid species present distinct responses to these environmental factors probably because of their different physiological and ecological intrinsic characteristics. The explanations of our variables are unexpectedly high (76.7% and 66.1%). In other words, we obtained a good explanation of recruitment success with only environmental variables that describe the in situ environmental conditions, or habitat of the exploited fish. As sardinella, mainly round sardinella (S. aurita), perform strong seasonal migration it suggests that national policy prerogatives for the management of such fisheries should be done at the regional level. Such an approach to facilitate common sub-regional management plans should allow a better mitigation of loss and damage in the fisheries sector in the context of overfishing and climate change.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

An early draft of this paper was presented at an international conference held in 2016 in Dakar (ICAWA). We are grateful to the AWA project funded by IRD and the BMBF (grant agreement 01DG12073E), the Preface project funded by the European Commission’s Seventh Framework Programme (2007-2013) under Grant Agreement number 603521, and all ISRA/CRODT technicians and researchers working all year long on the main Senegalese landings sites. Size distributions of both sardinella species were obtained during a 15 month monitoring program financed by USAID COMFISH project. We also thank the spatial agencies, mostly the NOAA and ESA for providing continuous high quality environmental data sets. We would also like to thank the anonymous referee comments and suggestions that greatly helped to improve this paper.

ORCID

Ousmane Diankha http://orcid.org/0000-0001-5107-0736

REFERENCES

Auger, P.-A., Gorgues, T., Machu, E., Aumont, O., & Brehmer, P. (2016). What drives the spatial variability of primary productivity and matter fluxes in the North-West African upwelling system? A modelling approach and box analysis. Biogeosciences, 13, 6419–6440. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-13-6419-2016

Ba, A., Schmidt, J., Demé, M., Lanckerb, K., Chaboud, C., Cury, P., ... Brehmer, P. (2017). Profitability and economic drivers of small pelagic fisheries in West Africa: A twenty year perspective. Marine Policy, 76, 152–158. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2016.11.008

Ba, K., Thiaw, M.,azar, N., Sarr, A., Brochier, T., Ndialye, I., ... Brehmer, P. (2016). Resilience of key biological parameters of the Senegalese sardine in the context of overfishing and climate change. PLoS ONE, 11 (6), e0156143. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0156143

Bacha, M., Jeyid, M. A., Vantreppote, V., Dessailly, D., & Amara, R. (2016). Environmental effects on the spatio-temporal patterns of
abundance and distribution of Sardina pilchardus and sardinella off the Mauritanian coast (North-West Africa). *Fisheries Oceanography*, 26, 282–298. https://doi.org/10.1111/fog.12192

Bakun, A. (1996). Patterns in the Ocean: Ocean Processes and Marine Population Dynamics. University of California Sea Grant, San Diego, California, USA, in cooperation with Centro de Investigaciones Biológicas de Noroeste, La Paz, Baja California Sur, Mexico. ISBN 1-88696-018. 323 pp.

Belkin, M. I. (2009). Rapid warming of large marine ecosystems. *Progress in Oceanography*, 81, 207–213. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pocean.2009.04.011

Binet, D. (1988). Rôle possible d’une intensification des alizés sur le changement de répartition des sardines et sardinelles le long de la côte ouest africaine. *Aquatich Living Resources*, 1, 115–132. https://doi.org/10.1515/alar.1988014

Boely, T. (1979). Biologie des deux espèces de sardinelles (Sardinella aurita Val. 1847 et Sardinella maderensis Lowe 1841) des côtes sénégalaises. Thèse de doctorat. Université de Paris VI et M.N.H.N. Paris.

Boely, T. (1980). Biologie de deux espèces de sardinelles: Sardinella aurita (Valenciennes 1847) et Sardinella maderensis (Lowe 1841) des côtes sénégalaises. Thèse doctorat d’état de Paris 6, 2870p.

Boely, T. (1982). Les ressources en poissons pélagiques des côtes ouest-africaines entre la Mauritanie et le fleuve Congo. Rapp Rappports et Procès-Verbaux des Réunions/Conseil Permanent International Pour L’exploration de la mer, 180, 423–431.

Boely, T., Chabanne, J., & Fréon, P. (1978). Schémas migratoires, aires de concentrations et périodes de reproduction des principales espèces de poissons pélagiques côtiers dans la zone sénégalo-mauritanienne. In Rapport du groupe de travail ad-hoc sur les poissons pélagiques côtiers ouest-africains de la Mauritanie au Libéria (26’N à 5’N), Dakar-Sénégal COPACE/PACE, Série 78/10, 63–70.

Boely, T., Chabanne, J., Fréon, P., & Stéquert, B. (1982). Cycle sexuel et migrations de Sardinella aurita sur le plateau continental ouest-africain, des îles Bissagos à la Mauritanie. Rappports et Procès-verbaux des Réunions/Conseil International pour l’Exploration de la Mer, 180, 350–355.

Boely, T., & Fréon, P. (1979). Les ressources pélagiques côtières dans la zone du COPACE. ORSTOM, pp. 13–79.

Braham, C.-B., Fréon, P., Laurec, A., Demarcq, H., & Bez, N. (2014). New insights in the spatial dynamics of sardinea stocks off Mauritania (North-West Africa) based on logbook data analysis. *Fish. Res.*, 154,195–204.

Brehmer, P., Gerløtt, F., Laurent, C., Cotel, P., Achury, A., & Samb, B. (2007). Schooling behaviour of small pelagic fish: Phenotypic expression of independent stimuli. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 334, 263–272. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps334263

Caballero-Alfonso, A. M., Ganzedo, U., Trujillo-Santana, A., Polanco, J., Santana del Pino, A., Ibarra-Berasteji, G., & Castro-Hernández, J. J. (2010). The role of climatic variability on the short-term fluctuations of octopus captures at the Canary Islands. *Fisheries Research*, 102, 258–265. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fishres.2009.12.006

Capet, X., Estrade, P., Machu, E., Ndiaye, S., Grelet, J., Lazar, A., ... Brehmer, P. (2016). On the dynamics of the southern Senegal upwelling center: Observed variability from synoptic to super-inertial scales. *Journal of Physical Oceanography*, 47(1), 155–180. https://doi.org/10.1175/jpo-d-15-0247.1

Chaboud, C., Fall, M., Ferraris, J., Fontana, A., Fonteune, A., Laloë, F., ... Thiao, D. (2015). Comment on "Fisheries catch misreporting and its implications: The case of Senegal". *Fisheries Research*, 164, 322–324. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fishres.2014.10.012

Chassot, E., Floch, L., Dewals, P., Planet, R., & Chavance, P. (2011). Statistics of the French purse seine fleet targeting tropical tunas in the Indian Ocean (1991–2010). *Indian Ocean Tuna Commission document, IOTC-2011-WPPT-20*, 31 p.

Cole, J., & McGlade, J. (1998). Clupeoid population variability, the environment and satellite imagery in coastal upwelling systems. *Reviews in Fish Biology and Fisheries*, 8, 445–471. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1008861224731

Conand, F. (1977). Œufs et larves de la sardinelle ronde (Sardinella aurita) au Sénégal: Distribution, croissance mortalité, variations d’abondance de 1971 à 1976. Cahier ORSTOM, 15, 201–214.

Cury, P., & Fontana, A. (1988). Compétition et stratégies démographiques comparées de deux espèces de sardinelles (Sardinella aurita et Sardinella maderensis) des côtes ouest-africaines. *Aquatich Living Resources*, 1, 165–180. https://doi.org/10.1016/11888018

Cury, P., & Roy, C. (1987). Upwelling and pêche des espèces pélagiques côtières de Côte d’Ivoire: Une approche globale. *Oceanologica Acta*, 10(3), 347–357.

Cury, P., & Roy, C. (1989). Optimal environmental window and pelagic fish recruitment success in upwelling areas. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, 46, 670–680. https://doi.org/10.1139/f89-086

Demarcq, H. (2009). Trends in primary production, sea surface temperature and wind in upwelling systems (1998–2007). *Progress in Oceanography*, 83(1–4), 376–385. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pocean.2009.07.022

Demarcq, H., & Benazzouz, A. (2015). Trends in phytoplankton and primary productivity off Northwest Africa. In L. Valdés & J. Deniz-González (Eds.), *Oceanographic and biological features in the Canary Current Large Marine Ecosystem* (pp. 331–341). Paris, France: IOC-UNESCO. IOC Technical Series, 115.

Demarcq, H., & Faure, V. (2000). Coastal upwelling and associated retention indices derived from satellite SST. *Application to Octopus vulgaris recruitment*. *Oceanologica Acta*, 23(4), 391–408. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0399-1784(00)01113-0

Demarcq, H., & Samb, B. (1991). Influence des variations de l’upwelling sur la répartition des poissons pélagiques au Sénégal. In P. Cury & C. Roy (Eds.), *Pécheries ouest africaines* (pp. 290–306). Paris, France: ORSTOM.

Diankha, O., Demarcq, H., Fall, M., Thiaw, D., Thiaw, M., Sow, B. A., ... Brehmer, P. (2017). Studying the contribution of different fishing gears to the Sardinella small-scale fishery in Senegalese waters. *Aquatic Living Resources*, 30, 27. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0399-1784(00)01113-0

Diankha, O., Thiaw, M., Sow, B. A., Brochier, B., Gaye, A. T., & Brehmer, P. (2015). Round sardina (Sardinella aurita) and anchovy (Engraulis encrasicolus) abundance as related to temperature in the Senegalese waters, Thalassas, 31(2), 9–17.

Diankha, O., Wade, M., Sow, B. A., Thiaw, M., Brochier, B., & Gaye, A. T. (2015). Effect of climatic variability on horse mackerel abundance in Senegalese waters. *Indian Journal of Geo-Marine Science*, 44(1), 7–11.

FAO (2003). The application of remote sensing technology to marine fisheries: an introductory manual (Section 7). *Food and Agriculture Organization Corporate Document Repository.*

FAO (2012). FAO working group on the assessment of small pelagic Fish off northwest Africa. Dakar, Senegal, 21–25 May 2012. FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Report, 1036, 256 pp.

Fedoseev, A. (1970). Geostrophic circulation of the surface waters on the shelf of north-west Africa. *Rapp Rappports et Procès-Verbaux des Réunions/Conseil Permanent International Pour L’exploration de la mer*, 159, 30–37.

Fréon, P. (1988). Réponses et adaptations des stocks de clupeïdes d’Afrique de l’ouest à la variabilité du milieu et de l’exploitation: Analyse et réflexion à partir de l’exemple du Sénégal. Thèse de Doctorat, Université d’Aix-Marseille, 287 pp.

Fréon, P. (1991). L’introduction d’une variable climatique dans les modèles globaux de production. In P. Cury & C. Roy (Eds.), *Pécheries ouest-africaines, variabilité, instabilité et changement* (pp. 395–424). Paris, France: ORSTOM éditions.
Tonidandel, S., & LeBreton, J. M. (2011). Relative importance analysis: A useful supplement to regression analysis. *Journal of Business and Psychology, 26*, 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10869-010-9204-3

Ueyama, R., & Monger, B. C. (2005). Wind-induced modulation of seasonal phytoplankton blooms in the North Atlantic derived from satellite observations. *Limnology and Oceanography, 50*(6), 1820–1829. https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.2005.50.6.1820

Ware, D. M., & Thomson, R. E. (2005). Bottom-up ecosystem trophic dynamics determine fish production in the northeast Pacific. *Science, 308*, 1280–1284. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1109049

Wood, S. N., Scheipl, F., & Faraway, J. J. (2013). Straightforward intermediate rank tensor product smoothing in mixed models. *Statistics and Computing, 23*(3), 341–360. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11222-012-9314-z

Zeeberg, J., Corten, A., Tjoe-Awie, P., Coca, J., & Hamady, B. (2008). Climate modulates the effects of *Sardinella aurita* fisheries off Northwest Africa. *Fisheries Research, 89*, 65–75. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fishres.2007.08.020

Zuur, A. F., Elena, N. I., & Chris, S. E. (2010). A protocol for data exploration to avoid common statistical problems. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution, 1*, 3–14. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2041-210X.2009.00001.x

**SUPPORTING INFORMATION**

Additional Supporting Information may be found online in the supporting information tab for this article.

**How to cite this article:** Diankha O, Ba A, Brehmer P, et al. Contrasted optimal environmental windows for both sardinella species in Senegalese waters. *Fish Oceanogr*. 2018;27:351–365. https://doi.org/10.1111/fog.12257