The Association Between Dietary Patterns and Insulin Resistance: A Systematic Review

Tayebeh Doostvandi, Hassan Mozaffari-Khosravi, Parvin Mirmiran, Zahra Bahadoran

1. Introduction

Insulin resistance (IR) is a patho-physiological condition where the insulin reporter is less sensitive and therefore insulin in a natural dose is not enough to produce normal biological effects. Insulin resistance is a major risk factor for the development of type 2 diabetes, cardiovascular disease and metabolic syndrome [1].

In the USA, the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey found that 52.1% obese adolescents had IR [2]. The obesity-associated increase in fatty acids can trigger insulin resistance through intracellular metabolites that activate protein kinases (PKC), leading to the activation of serine/threonine kinases that inhibit insulin signaling [3]. Diet seems to play an important role in IR. Nowadays, various aspects of diet, such as fat, carbohydrate, fiber, whole grain and glycemic index and glycemic load have been related to IR [2]. Traditionally, nutritional epidemiology has examined the relationship between diet and disease by evaluating the effects of single nutrient or specific foods [4]. However in daily life, people consume a variety of foods with complex combinations of nutrients. To carry out nutritional epidemiological research with more closely models on human experience, researchers have proposed studying dietary patterns rather than isolated foods. This approach can help us to more accurately understand the links between food consumption and the spread or prevention of chronic disease [1].

Therefore, the aim of this review is to study the association between dietary pattern and insulin resistance.

2. Material and Methods

2.1. Search Strategy

This paper reviews the articles including cohort and cross sectional studies that published until 2015 in all journals,
using scientific database, including PubMed, Scopus, Iran Medex and Magiran, using keywords which included: insulin, insulin resistance, dietary pattern, diet and other related key words.

2.2. Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

All studies were selected based on their title, abstract and full text of the materials. The experimental and children studies, case control, clinical trial and duplicate article were excluded. Information obtained from different studies (Table 1) is based on following item respectively: a authors, country, sex, age, sample size, follow up period, dietary intake assess, dietary pattern, result and adjustment variable and primary results of data base search revealed over 390 papers in pubmed regarding insulin resistance and dietary pattern. From 2749 articles in scientific data bases, there were 1087on the subject of diets and insulin resistance. After comprehensive review of title, abstracts and the main objectives of studies 12 article were included in this study (Fig. 1).

Table 1. Description of studies of dietary patterns identified via the systematic review.

| Author            | Country (year) | Sex          | Age (year) | Sample size | Follow up period | Dietary intake assess | Dietary pattern | Result                                                                 | adjustment variable                                                                 |
|-------------------|----------------|--------------|------------|-------------|------------------|----------------------|------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Arisawa et al. 2014 | Japan (2008)  | Male and females | 35-70     | 513         | Cross-sectional  | FFQ                  | Prudent          | High fat/western dietary pattern was positively correlated with insulin resistance in Japanese population. | Age, sex, smoking, drinking, physical activity, total energy intake                  |
| Batis et al., 2014 | China (2009)  | Male and females | 27-68     | 4096        | 15 years         | 24- hour recalls, Household food inventory | Prudent          | Dietary pattern trajectories with healthier scores Longitudinally had a lower HbA1c compared to those with unhealthier scores. Mediterranean-style diet, reflected by a higher a priori Mediterranean diet score, was cross-sectional associated with lower insulin levels among non-diabetics,and lower blood glucose prior to adjustment for obesity, but not with lower incidence of Diabetes. | Age, sex, geographic city, physical activity, BMI smoking                           |
| Abiemo et al., 2013 | USA (2000)    | Male and females | 45-84     | 5390        | Cross-sectional 6 yr follow up | FFQ 127 items      | Mediterranean      | Dietary pattern were significantly associated with insulin resistance. | Age, sex, BMI, smoking, physical activity, total energy                            |
| Zuo et al., 2013  | China (2006)  | Male and females | >18       | 1070        | Open ongoing cohort from 2006 | Semi-quantitative FFQ | Western           | Diverse diet, western diet, whole grain and beans,white rice and kimchi,alcohol and coffee low calorie/diet soft drinks, onions, sugar-sweetened beverages, burgers and sausages, crisps and other snacks, and white bread and low consumption of medium-high-fiber breakfast cereals,jam, | Age, sex, education, income, BMI, smoking, alcohol use, physical activity         |
| Song et al., 2012 | South Korea (2007) | Male and females | 30-65     | 3871        | 1 year           | FFQ                  | Diverse diet, western diet, whole grain and beans,white rice and kimchi,alcohol and coffee low calorie/diet soft drinks, onions, sugar-sweetened beverages, burgers and sausages, crisps and other snacks, and white bread and low consumption of medium-high-fiber breakfast cereals,jam, | Age, sex, energy, ethnicity, employment grade, smoking, alcohol, physical activity, BMI, blood pressure |
| McNaughton et al., 2008 | UK (1988)    | Male and females | 35-55     | 7339        | 19 years         | 127 item FFQ        | Mediterranean      | Dietary pattern associated with insulin resistance. | Age, sex, energy, ethnicity, employment grade, smoking, alcohol, physical activity, BMI, blood pressure |
| Author          | Country | Sex                  | Age (year) | Sample size | Follow up period | Dietary intake assess | Dietary pattern                                                                 | Result                                                                 | adjustment variable                                                                 |
|-----------------|---------|----------------------|------------|-------------|------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Lie et al, 2009 | USA     | Male and females     | 2875       |             |                  | FFQ 126 items        | French dressing/vinaigrette, and whole meal bread                             | consumption of a diet rich in fruits, vegetables, whole grains and reduced fat dairy protects against insulin-resistant phenotypes and displacing these healthy choices with refined grains, high-fat dairy, sweet baked foods, candy and sugar-sweetened soda may promote insulin-resistant phenotypes. | Age, sex, total energy                                                            |
| Esmailza deh et al (2007) | Iran | Females teachers | 40-60 | 486         |                  | Semi-quantitative FFQ 168 item | Western Healthy Traditional                                                   | High consumption of fruit, vegetables and legumes is associated with reduce risk of insulin resistance and metabolic syndrome in Tehran female teachers. For prevention and amelioration of insulin resistance in Asian Indian adolescents and young adults, it is prudent to have normal BMI and low intake of \_–\_6 PUFAs. dietary pattern which includes increased fruit and vegetable consumption and a reduction in the intake of fatty foods and processed meat for protection against the occurrence of the metabolic syndrome and glucose intolerance. A prudent diet may be associated with enhanced insulin sensitivity and a lower risk of type 2 diabetes. Adherence to Mediterranean diet is modestly associated with a better insulin sensitivity, lower levels of total cholesterol and lower levels of systolic blood pressure in overweight and obese subjects. This may | Age, anthropology, physical activity, total energy, smoking, current estrogen use and menopausal status |
| Isharwal et al (2008) | India | Male and females   | 18-18     | 352         |                  | 24-hour food recall     | Healthy balanced diet                                                      | Low intake of refined foods, consumption protects against insulin-resistant phenotypes. | Sex, BMI, total fat                                                              |
| Desmond E. M. 2000 | UK2000  | Male and females    | 40-65     | 802         |                  | Cross-sectional FFQ 35 items     | Healthy balanced diet                                                      | Low intake of refined foods, consumption protects against insulin-resistant phenotypes. | Sex, age, Socio-economic group, BMI, Smoking status, Alcohol intake category      |
| Villegas 2004 | Irish | Meal and males       | 1473       |             |                  | Cross-sectional FFQ     | Traditional Irish diet                                                      | Prudent diet may be associated with enhanced insulin sensitivity and a lower risk of type 2 diabetes. Adherence to Mediterranean diet is modestly associated with a better insulin sensitivity, lower levels of total cholesterol and lower levels of systolic blood pressure in overweight and obese subjects. This may | Sex, age, smoking status                                                            |
| Tziman 2007 | Athens | Meal and female      | 20-87     | 3042        |                  | Cohort FFQ               | Mediterranean diet                                                      | Mediterranean diet protects against insulin-resistant phenotypes. | Sex, age, BMI, current smoking, physical activity, waist, waist to hip             |

3. Results and Discussion

In study by Arisawa et al, 513 subjects without treatment for diabetes participated in the baseline survey of cohort study in Tokushima, Japan. Four dietary patterns extracted were: 1- prudent diet (high intake of vegetables and fruits), 2- high fat/western (high intake of fried food, fried dish and meat), 3- bread and dairy products, 4- seafood patterns. Statistical analysis showed that a high fat/western dietary pattern may be positively associated with insulin resistance in the Japanese population [2].

In another study of 4096 adults by Batis et al, with three to six waves of diet data and biomarkers measured in the China health and nutrition surveys, diet was assessed with three 24-hour recalls and a household food inventory. A dietary pattern previously identified with reduced rank regression that positively predicted diabetes in 2006 (high in wheat products and soy milk and low in rice, legumes, poultry, eggs, and fish). Findings suggest that dietary pattern trajectories with healthier scores longitudinally had a lower HbA1c compared to those with unhealthier scores, even when trajectories had similar scores in the end point [5]. Abiemo et al, studied 5390 men and women age, 45-48 years with 6 years follow up in
MESA; dietary intake was assessed as FFQ. A MeDiet score was created based on intake of 10 food components, vegetables, whole grains, nuts, legumes, fruits, ratio of monounsaturated to saturated fat, red and processed meat, dairy, fish and alcohol. MeDiet was not significantly related to risk of incident diabetes. Greater consistency with a Mediterranean-style diet, reflected by a higher a priori Mediterranean diet score, was cross-sectionally associated with lower insulin levels among non-diabetics, and lower blood glucose prior to adjustment for obesity, but not with lower incidence of diabetes [6]. Zuo et al, studied 1070 men and women, aged>18 years who participated in the 2006 phase of the China health and nutrition survey. Dietary intake assessed using a validated FFQ and four dietary patterns were identified: the Western (characterized by animal food, milk, cake, etc), high wheat (high in wheat instead of rice, whole grain and beef/lamb), traditional (high in eggs, tofu, organ meat, pickled, vegetables, etc) and the hedonic pattern (high in beer, wine and alcohols and fresh vegetables). Statistical analysis showed that western pattern was associated with greater odds of insulin resistant; in contrast, the Hedonic pattern was negatively associated with insulin resistance in Chinese adults [1]. In the Song et al, 3871 men and women 30 - 65 years participated in the Korea National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey, using dietary intake to assess was a validated FFQ, and 5 dietary patterns were identified: Diverse diet, western diet, whole grain and beans, white rice and kimchi (traditional fermented cabbage), alcohol and coffee. A dietary pattern, characterized by high consumption of whole grains, beans and fruits was found to inversely associated with insulin resistance in healthy Korean adults [7]. McNaughton et al, assessed 7,339 participants of the Whitehall II study, measuring dietary intake using a 127-item food frequency questionnaire, and the reduced rank regression method to determine dietary patterns, using the homeostasis model assessment of insulin resistance as the intermediate or response variable; the association between the dietary pattern identified and incidence of type 2 diabetes was investigated using Cox proportional hazard regression models. The authors identified a dietary pattern characterized by high consumption of low calorie diet, soft drinks, onions, sugar-sweetened beverages, burgers and sausages, crisps and other snacks, and white bread and low consumption of medium-high/fiber breakfast cereals, jam, French dressing/vinaigrette, and whole meal bread. Higher dietary pattern scores were associated with increased risk of type 2 diabetes. Result demonstrated that a dietary pattern associated with insulin resistance predicts type 2 diabetes risk after adjustment for a range of confounders [8].

Lie et al used data from the fifth examination cycle of the Framingham Offspring Study. Among 2875 participants without diabetes, they identified four dietary patterns based on the predominant sources of energy: ‘Fruits, Reduced Fat Dairy and Whole Grains’, ‘Refined Grains and Sweets’, ‘Beer’ and ‘Soda’. These findings indicated that consumption of a diet rich in fruits, vegetables, whole grains and reduced fat dairy protects against insulin-resistant phenotypes and displacing these healthy choices with refined grains, high-fat dairy, sweet baked foods, candy and sugar-sweetened soda may promote insulin-resistant phenotypes [9]. In a cross-sectional study by Esmaillzadeh et al, 486 Tehran female teachers, aged 40–60 y were assessed, and 3 major dietary patterns were identified by factor analysis, the healthy dietary pattern, the Western dietary pattern, and the traditional dietary pattern. These findings indicate that a dietary pattern characterized by high consumption of fruit, vegetables, poultry, and legumes is associated with reduced risk of insulin resistance and the metabolic syndrome in Tehranian female teachers. In contrast, a dietary pattern with high amounts of refined grains, red meat, butter, processed meat, and high-fat dairy products and low amounts of vegetables and low-fat dairy products is associated with a greater risk of the metabolic syndrome [4].

Ishrawe et al, investigated the relationship between dietary nutrients and insulin resistance in 352 Asian Indian adolescents and young adults, dietary nutrient intake was (24-hour dietary recall and monthly consumption data) result showed that for prevention and amelioration of insulin resistance in Asian Indian adolescents and young adults, it is prudent to have normal BMI and low intakes of 6 PUFAs [10].

In a cross-sectional study by Desmond E. M, 802 subjects aged 40–65 years were randomly selected, and principal component analysis was used to identify four dietary patterns explaining 31±7% of the dietary variation in the study cohort. Component 1 was characterized by a healthy balanced diet with a frequent intake of raw and salad vegetables, fruits in summer and winter, fish, pasta and rice and low intake of fried foods, sausages, fried fish, and potatoes. this component was negatively correlated with central obesity, fasting plasma glucose, 120 min non-esterified fatty acid and triacylglycerol, and was positively correlated with HDL-cholesterol. It therefore appears to be protective against metabolic syndrome; this component was also negatively associated with the risk of having undiagnosed diabetes, an association independent of age, sex, smoking and obesity. These findings support the hypothesis that dietary patterns are associated with other lifestyle factors and with glucose intolerance and other features of the metabolic syndrome [11].

In a cross-sectional study by Villegas et al, 1018 men and women sampled from 17 general practice lists in the south of Ireland. Three dietary patterns were identified by cluster analysis; traditional Irish diet including white bread and refined cereals, chips, butter, whole milk and dairy products, deserts and sweets and lowest intake of poultry, fish, pasta and rice, prudent diet including high intake of pasta and rice, brown and unrefined cereals, spreads, poultry, fish, low fat and dairy products, salad dressing, fruit and vegetables and lowest intake of chips, white bread and refined cereals, butter, high fat dairy, meat, meat products and sweet and Alcohol and convenience pattern including high intake of alcohol, meat, meat products, chips and snacks and the lowest intake, of dessert, fruits, vegetable, brown bread and refined cereal, low fat, dairy products and drink; the results showed that prudent diet may be associated with enhanced insulin sensitivity and...
lower risk of type 2 diabetes [12]. Another study indicated that adherence to Mediterranean diet, high intakes of non-refined cereals and products, vegetables, legumes, fruits, olive oil, dairy products, fish, pulses, nuts, potatoes, eggs, sweets, poultry, red meat and meat products, was modestly associated with a better insulin sensitivity, lower levels of total cholesterol and lower levels of systolic blood pressure in overweight and obese subjects. This may suggest that compared to general population, the beneficial effect of this diet in cardiovascular system of excess body weight people is limited [13].

In conclusion, results of this systematic review indicate that unhealthy food habits which is rich in trans fatty acids and saturated fatty acids, refined carbohydrate with high glycemic index is related to the insulin resistance, hyperglycemia and risk of diabetes type 2.

Acknowledgement

We would like to acknowledge Ms N Shiva for critical editing of the English grammar and syntax of the manuscript.

References

[1] Zuo H, Shi Z, Yuan B, Dai Y, Pan X, Wu G, et al. Dietary patterns are associated with insulin resistance in Chinese adults without known diabetes. The British journal of nutrition. 2013 May; 109(9): 1662-9. PubMed PMID: 22989490. Epub 2012/09/20. eng.

[2] Song S, Paik HY, Song Y. High intake of whole grains and beans pattern is inversely associated with insulin resistance in healthy Korean adult population. 2012.

[3] Lazar1 MQaMA. Mechanisms of obesity-associated insulin resistance: many choices on the menu. 2015.

[4] Esmailzadeh A, Kiamiar M, Mehrabi Y, Azadbakht L, Hu FB, Willett WC. Dietary patterns, insulin resistance, and prevalence of the metabolic syndrome in women. The American journal of clinical nutrition. 2007 Mar; 85(3): 910-8. PubMed PMID: 17344515. Epub 2007/03/09. eng.

[5] Batis C, Mendez MA, Sotres-Alvarez D, Gordon-Larsen P, Popkin B. Dietary pattern trajectories during 15 years of follow-up and HbA1c, insulin resistance and diabetes prevalence among Chinese adults. Journal of epidemiology and community health. 2014 Aug; 68(8): 773-9. PubMed PMID: 24729424. Pubmed Central PMCID: PMC4082755. Epub 2014/04/15. eng.

[6] Abiemo EE, Alonso A, Nettleton JA, Steffen LM, Bertoni AG, Jain A, et al. Relationships of the Mediterranean dietary pattern with insulin resistance and diabetes incidence in the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA). The British journal of nutrition. 2013 Apr 28; 109(8): 1490-7. PubMed PMID: 22932232. Pubmed Central PMCID: PMC4002212. Epub 2012/08/31. eng.

[7] SuJin Song a H-YPa, YoonJu Song. High intake of whole grains and beans pattern is inversely associated with insulin resistance in healthy Korean adult population. 2012.

[8] McNaughton SA, Mishra GD, Brunner EJ. Dietary patterns, insulin resistance, and incidence of type 2 diabetes in the Whitehall II Study. Diabetes care. 2008 Jul; 31(7): 1343-8. PubMed PMID: 18390803. Pubmed Central PMCID: PMC2453656. Epub 2008/04/09. eng.

[9] Liu E, McKeown NM, Newby PK, Meigs JB, Vasan RS, Quatromoni PA, et al. Cross-sectional association of dietary patterns with insulin-resistant phenotypes among adults without diabetes in the Framingham Offspring Study. The British journal of nutrition. 2009 Aug; 102(4): 576-83. PubMed PMID: 19216828. Pubmed Central PMCID: PMC3785063. Epub 2009/02/17. eng.

[10] Black MH, Watanabe RM, Trigo E, Takayanagi M, Lawrence JM, Buchanan TA, et al. High-fat diet is associated with obesity-mediated insulin resistance and beta-cell dysfunction in Mexican Americans. The Journal of nutrition. 2013 Apr; 143(4): 479-85. PubMed PMID: 23343677. Pubmed Central PMCID: PMC3738243. Epub 2013/01/25. eng.

[11] Desmond E. M. Williams ATP, Margaret J. Whichelow, Brian D. Cox, Wareham* NEDaNJ. A cross-sectional study of dietary patterns with glucose intolerance and other features of the metabolic syndrome. British Journal of Nutrition (2000), 1999.

[12] R Villegas AS, MM Collins, A Flynn and JJ Perry*. Dietary patterns in middle-aged Irish men and women defined by cluster analysis. 2004.

[13] Natalia Tzimal CP, Demosthenes B Panagiotakos*1,3, John Skoumas2 AZ, Christina Chrysohooou2 and, Stefanadis2 C. Mediterranean diet and insulin sensitivity, lipid profile and bloodpressure levels, in overweight and obese people; The Attica study. Lipids in Health and Disease 2007, 6: 22. 2007.