Association between a DJ-1 polymorphism and the risk of Parkinson’s disease: a PRISMA-compliant systematic review and meta-analysis

Jie Liu1, Chunrong Li1, Xiaoyang Zhou2, Jian Sun1, Meng Zhu1, Hongliang Zhang1, Lei Cheng1, Guobin Li1, Tao He3 and Wenshuai Deng1

Abstract
Objective: In recent years, a number of case–control studies have focused on the association between the DJ-1 g.168_185del polymorphism and the risk of Parkinson’s disease (PD). However, the results have been conflicting. To estimate the relationship between the DJ-1 g.168_185del polymorphism and PD susceptibility, a comprehensive meta-analysis was performed.

Methods: Eligible studies concerning the DJ-1 g.168_185del polymorphism and PD susceptibility were searched for in the PubMed, Web of Science, Embase, Wanfang, CNKI, and VIP databases. Odds ratios and 95% confidence intervals were calculated to estimate the strength of the associations. In total, 11 studies were included in this meta-analysis, including 13 case–control studies with 2890 cases and 3043 controls.

Results: This meta-analysis revealed that DJ-1 g.168_185del variants are associated with PD susceptibility in the non-Asian population, but not in the Asian population.

Conclusions: Our meta-analysis suggests that DJ-1 gene variants are not associated with the risk of PD in the overall population.

1Department of Neurosurgery, The Affiliated Hospital of Qingdao University, Qingdao, China
2Department of Vascular Surgery, The Affiliated Hospital of Qingdao University, Qingdao, China
3Department of Neurosurgery, People's Hospital of Rizhao, Jining Medical University, Rizhao, China

Corresponding author:
Wenshuai Deng, Department of Neurosurgery, The Affiliated Hospital of Qingdao University, 16 Jiangsu Road, Qingdao, Shandong 266003, People's Republic of China. Email: dwshuai@126.com
Keywords
DJ-1, meta-analysis, polymorphism, Parkinson’s disease, g.168_185del, disease susceptibility

Date received: 13 March 2020; accepted: 16 July 2020

Introduction
Parkinson’s disease (PD) is one of the most common neurodegenerative movement disorders worldwide, affecting more than 1% of the population over 65 years of age. It is characterized by variable combinations of bradykinesia, rigidity, resting tremors, and postural abnormalities. In the human brain, PD is pathologically typified by the degeneration of dopaminergic neurons and the presence of Lewy bodies. The etiology of PD remains unclear. However, genetic factors such as PARK16, SNCA, or VPS13C variants, as well as certain environmental factors, have been shown to contribute to the increased risk of PD.

In humans, the DJ-1 (PARK7) gene is located on chromosome 1p36. It contains eight exons, spanning 24 kb, and encodes a protein consisting of 189 amino acids that belongs to the ThiJ/PfpI superfamily. Oxidative stress and mitochondrial damage reportedly play important roles in the pathology of PD. Notably, DJ-1 is considered to play a key role in protecting neurons from oxidative stress and mitochondrial damage. DJ-1 is also regarded as a chaperone, protease, and oncogene in glial cells and neurons of the substantia nigra and striatum. With regard to the DJ-1 gene g.168_185del polymorphism, numerous case–control studies have estimated the association between this polymorphism and PD susceptibility. However, results have been conflicting. We therefore performed a comprehensive meta-analysis in the present study, to clarify the relationship between the DJ-1 gene g.168_185del polymorphism and PD risk.

Materials and methods
The present meta-analysis was performed according to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) statement.

Literature and search strategy
Two investigators (J Liu and WS Deng) identified all studies with a focus on the association between the DJ-1 g.168_185del polymorphism and PD risk using the PubMed, Web of Science, Embase, Wanfang, CNKI, and VIP databases, dating to March 15 2019. The keywords “(DJ-1) and (polymorphism) and (Parkinson’s disease or PD or parkinsonism)” were used to search within the English electronic databases, and the Chinese electronic databases were searched using the corresponding Chinese characters. Only studies published in English or Chinese were included in this meta-analysis. The two investigators also reviewed the references of the relevant and included studies to identify any additional studies.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria
The published studies adhered to the following inclusion criteria: (1) focused on the association between the DJ-1 g.168_185del polymorphism and PD susceptibility; (2) case–control or cohort
studies; (3) provided the genotype distributions of the cases and controls, so that odds ratios (ORs) and 95% confidence intervals (CIs) could be calculated; (3) published in English or Chinese; (4) the genotype distribution of the controls was consistent with the Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium (HWE). Reviews, abstracts, case reports, and duplicate reports were excluded.

**Data extraction and quality assessment**

For each eligible study, the following information was independently extracted by two investigators: first author, publication year, region or country, HWE in controls, sample size, and the numbers of case and controls. Any disagreements between the two investigators were resolved through discussion. In addition, the Newcastle–Ottawa Scale (NOS) was used to estimate the quality of eligible studies; a score above 5 was considered to be of moderate-to-high quality.

**Statistical analysis**

The strength of the association between the DJ-1 gene g.168_185del polymorphism and PD susceptibility was assessed using ORs and their 95% CIs under the five genetic models (allelic model: D vs. I, dominant model: DD+DI vs. II, homozygous model: DD vs. II, heterozygous model: DI vs. II, and recessive model: DD vs. DI+II). The degree of heterogeneity among the included studies was determined using the Q test and inconsistency index ($I^2$) statistics (no heterogeneity: $I^2 < 25\%$, moderate heterogeneity: $I^2 = 25\%$ to 50\%, significant heterogeneity: $I^2 > 50\%$). If $I^2 > 50\%$, the random-effect model was used to calculate the OR and 95% CI; otherwise, the fixed-effect model was adopted. To assess the reliability of the present meta-analysis, a sensitivity analysis was performed according to the leave-one-out method. Begg’s funnel plots and the Begg’s test were conducted to evaluate potential publication bias. Here, an asymmetrical funnel plot and a Begg’s test P-value of $<0.05$ implied potential publication bias. The Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium (HWE) was estimated using the chi-squared test in the genotype distributions of the control groups. In addition, a subgroup analysis was performed based on ethnicity (Asian and non-Asian) within the overall population. All statistical analyses in this study were performed using Stata software, version 12.0 (Stata Corporation, College Station, TX, USA).

**Results**

**Characteristics of selected studies**

A total of 132 studies were identified from several electronic databases (PubMed, Web of Science, Embase, Wanfang, CNKI, and VIP databases). A flow diagram describing the selection process is presented in Figure 1. After strictly screening the identified studies based on the inclusion and exclusion criteria, 11 studies containing 2890 cases and 3043 controls were finally included in this meta-analysis. Of these studies, seven were published in English and four in Chinese. The characteristics of all eligible studies are listed in Table 1. All selected studies scored $>5$ stars in the NOS test, indicating that the quality of the eligible studies was moderate or high (Table 2).

**Association of the DJ-1 gene polymorphism with PD susceptibility**

All eligible studies (including 2890 cases and 3043 controls) were used to estimate the association between the DJ-1 gene g.168_185del polymorphism and PD susceptibility. The pooled ORs and their 95% CI are summarized in Table 2. There were no significant associations in the overall
population in any of the five models (Figure 2 and Table 2). The fixed-effect model was used in all genetic models (Table 2). In the subgroup analysis by ethnicity (Asian and non-Asian), the DJ-1 gene g.168_185del polymorphism was associated with a significantly increased risk of PD in the non-Asian population, but not in the Asian population (Table 2).

**Sensitivity analysis and publication bias**

A sensitivity analysis was performed to assess the influence of each study on the pooled ORs and 95% CIs by omitting each study in turn. There were no significant changes in the pooled ORs or 95% CIs in the dominant model (Figure 3), indicating the stability of the present meta-analysis. Begg’s funnel plot and Begg’s test were used to assess the publication bias of the included case–control studies. The shapes of the funnel plots were roughly symmetrical (Figure 4), and Begg’s test revealed no significant publication bias in this meta-analysis (DD+DI vs. II: $P = 0.161$).

**Discussion**

PD is a common neurodegenerative movement disorder in individuals over 65 years of age. In recent years, numerous
Table 1. General characteristics of the 13 case–control studies.

| First author | Year | Country | Ethnicity | Cases/controls (n) | Cases (n) | Controls (n) | HWE NOS |
|--------------|------|---------|-----------|-------------------|-----------|--------------|---------|
| Chen18       | 2008 | China   | Asian     | 192/197           | 190       | 2            | 196      |
| Liu19        | 2008 | China   | Asian     | 213/195           | 188       | 25           | 166      |
| Li20         | 2012 | China   | Asian     | 364/346           | 318       | 45           | 308      |
| Cal21        | 2013 | China   | Asian     | 90/105            | 80        | 10           | 91       |
| De Marco22   | 2010 | Italy   | Caucasian | 294/298          | 215       | 77           | 259      |
| Eerola23     | 2003 | Finland | Caucasian | 136/129          | 64        | 59           | 63       |
| Sadhukhan24  | 2012 | India   | Asian     | 282/225           | 218       | 62           | 184      |
| Glanzmann25 (a) | 2014 | African | Caucasian | 285/264          | 284       | 1            | 264      |
| Glanzmann25 (b) | 2014 | African | Mixed     | 99/132           | 97        | 2            | 129      |
| Morris26     | 2003 | England | Caucasian | 46/96            | 28        | 15           | 65       |
| Huo27        | 2017 | China   | Asian     | 348/325           | 285       | 60           | 268      |
| He28         | 2019 | China   | Asian     | 523/599           | 460       | 62           | 510      |

DD: del/del; DI: del/ins; II: ins/ins; HWE: Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium; NA: not available; NOS: Newcastle–Ottawa Scale.

Table 2. Meta-analysis of the association between the DJ-1 gene g.168_185del polymorphism and Parkinson’s disease susceptibility.

| Items          | n   | D vs. I | DD vs. DI vs. II | DD vs. II | DI vs. II | DD vs. DI vs. II |
|----------------|-----|---------|------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------------|
| n              |     | OR (95% CI) | 1^2 (%) | P | OR (95% CI) | 1^2 (%) | P | OR (95% CI) | 1^2 (%) | P |
| Ethnicity      |     |            |         |   |            |         |   |            |         |   |
| Asian          | 6   | 1.09 (0.95, 1.26) | 44.70 | 0.215 | 1.55 (0.99, 1.34) | 48.90 | 0.069 | 1.04 (0.59, 1.82) | 0.9 | 1.16 (0.99, 1.36) | 48.30 | 0.06 |
| None-Asian     | 7   | 1.35 (1.09–1.66) | 36.80% | 0.02 | 1.56 (1.23–1.97) | 36.80% | 0.02 | 1.28 (0.65–2.52) | 0.48 | 1.57 (1.23–2.00) | 40.10% | 0.00 |

CI: confidence interval; D: del; DD: del/del; DI: del/ins; I: ins; II: ins/ins; OR: odds ratio.
case–control studies have focused on the relationship between the \textit{DJ-1} gene g.168_185del polymorphism and PD susceptibility. However, the results of these studies have been inconsistent. To assess if any such association exists, we performed a comprehensive meta-analysis of 11 studies, including 13 case–control studies with 2890 cases and 3043 controls.

Variants in promoter regions are involved in gene transcription activity because of the DNA-binding ability of transcription factors. Siegel et al.\textsuperscript{36} reported that the Ins allele of g.168_185del variants might affect the transcriptional activity of \textit{DJ-1} by binding to nuclear factors. The DJ-1 protein, which was initially identified almost a century ago, is expressed in many different tissue types.\textsuperscript{14,37,38} DJ-1 is considered to play a key role in protecting neurons from oxidative stress and mitochondrial damage.\textsuperscript{11,14} In addition, \textit{DJ-1} gene polymorphisms are closely associated with autosomal recessive early-onset PD.\textsuperscript{9,39} Moreover, DJ-1 can eliminate hydrogen peroxide by undergoing self-oxidation. In doing so, reactive oxygen species are decreased.\textsuperscript{12} \textit{DJ-1}-related oxidative damage is reportedly evident within the brains of sporadic PD patients.\textsuperscript{40,41} In addition, Waragai et al.\textsuperscript{42} reported that DJ-1 levels in the cerebrospinal fluid of sporadic PD patients are significantly higher than in healthy controls. Furthermore, DJ-1 was found to promote the expression of anti-apoptotic genes and suppress apoptosis-associated pathways.\textsuperscript{43–46} Overall, it seems that DJ-1 is associated with PD, although Figure 2. Forest plot of the associations of \textit{DJ-1} gene g.168_185del variants with Parkinson’s disease susceptibility in overall populations under the dominant model. CI: confidence interval; OR: odds ratio.
one study reported no significant difference between PD patients and controls in serum levels of DJ-1 protein.\textsuperscript{47}

In the present study, the \textit{DJ-1} gene g.168_185del polymorphism was associated with an increased risk of PD under both the allelic and dominant models, based on data collected from 13 case–control studies (2890 cases and 3043 controls in the overall population). No significant heterogeneity was present in the five models that were used (Table 2). Additionally, in the subgroup

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{sensitivity_analysis_dominant_model}
\caption{Sensitivity analysis of the summary odds ratio coefficients under the dominant model. CI: confidence interval.}
\end{figure}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{beggs_funnel_plot}
\caption{Begg's funnel plot of publication bias for the associations between the \textit{Dj-1} gene g.168_185del polymorphism and Parkinson's disease under the dominant model. OR: odds ratio.}
\end{figure}
analysis, we revealed that *DJ-1* gene g.168_185del variants were not associated with PD susceptibility among the Asian population (Table 2). However, the *DJ-1* gene g.168_185del polymorphism was associated with an increased risk of PD among the non-Asian population (Table 2). Furthermore, no obvious publication bias was detected in this meta-analysis (DD+DI vs. II: \( P = 0.161 \)). In summary, this comprehensive meta-analysis indicated that the *DJ-1* gene g.168_185del polymorphism is associated with an increased risk of PD in the non-Asian population, but not in the Asian population.

Several potential limitations exist in this meta-analysis. First, the included studies were published only in Chinese or English. Thus, potential publication bias may exist. Second, only four studies focused on the associations between the *DJ-1* gene g.168_185del polymorphism and PD risk among Caucasians, while one study targeted mixed and black populations. Hence, a sub-group analysis was conducted based on ethnicity (Asian and non-Asian). Third, we were unable to test environmental factors and gene–gene or gene–environment interactions because insufficient information was collected.

**Conclusion**

This comprehensive meta-analysis of 13 case–control studies demonstrated that the *DJ-1* gene g.168_185del polymorphism is associated with PD susceptibility among the non-Asian population, but not among the Asian population. However, considering the limitations of this study, the present results should be interpreted with caution. Further studies with larger sample sizes and diverse ethnic groups should be conducted to validate the resulting associations.

**Declaration of conflicting interest**

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest.

**Funding**

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

**ORCID iD**

Wenshuai Deng https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3790-8576

**References**

1. Kalia LV and Lang AE. Parkinson’s disease. *Lancet* 2015; 386; 896–912.
2. Williams DR and Litvan I. Parkinsonian syndromes. *Continuum (Minneap Minn)* 2013; 19: 1189–1212.
3. Glizer D and MacDonald PA. Cognitive training in Parkinson’s disease: a review of studies from 2000 to 2014. *Parkinsons Dis* 2016; 2016: 9291713.
4. Zhang HN, An CN, Zhang HN, et al. Protocatechuic acid inhibits neurotoxicity induced by MPTP in vivo. *Neurosci Lett* 2010; 474: 99–103.
5. He T, Wang J, Wang X, et al. Association between PARK16 and Parkinson’s disease: a meta-analysis. *Neurosci Lett* 2017; 657: 179–188.
6. Fang J, Hou B, Liu H, et al. Association between SNCA rs2736990 polymorphism and Parkinson’s disease: a meta-analysis. *Neurosci Lett* 2017; 658: 102–107.
7. Zou M, Li R, Wang JY, et al. Association analyses of variants of SIPA1L2, MIR4697, GCH1, VPS13C, and DDRGK1 with Parkinson’s disease in East Asians. *Neurobiol Aging* 2018; 68: 159.e7–159.e14.
8. Huai Q, Sun Y, Wang H, et al. Crystal structure of DJ-1/RS and implication on familial Parkinson’s disease. *FEBS Lett* 2003; 549: 171–175.
9. Bonifati V, Rizzi P, Van Baren MJ, et al. Mutations in the DJ-1 gene associated with autosomal recessive early-onset parkinsonism. *Science* 2003; 299: 256–259.
10. Lin MT and Beal MF. Mitochondrial dysfunction and oxidative stress in neurodegenerative diseases. *Nature* 2006; 443: 787–795.

11. Lev N, Ickowicz D, Melamed E, et al. Oxidative insults induce DJ-1 upregulation and redistribution: implications for neuroprotection. *Neurotoxicology* 2008; 29: 397–405.

12. Taira T, Saito Y, Niki T, et al. DJ-1 has a role in antioxidative stress to prevent cell death. *EMBO Rep* 2004; 5: 213–218.

13. Olzmann JA, Bordelon JR, Muly EC, et al. Selective enrichment of DJ-1 protein in primate striatal neuronal processes: implications for Parkinson’s disease. *J Comp Neurol* 2007; 500: 585–599.

14. Nagakubo D, Taira T, Kitaura H, et al. DJ-1, a novel oncogene which transforms mouse NIH3T3 cells in cooperation with ras. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 1997; 231: 509–513.

15. Zhou W, Zhu M, Wilson MA, et al. The oxidation state of DJ-1 regulates its chaperone activity toward alpha-synuclein. *J Mol Biol* 2006; 356: 1036–1048.

16. Shendelman S, Jonason A, Martinat C, et al. DJ-1 is a redox-dependent molecular chaperone that inhibits alpha-synuclein aggregate formation. *PLoS Biol* 2004; 2: e362.

17. Abou-Sleiman PM, Healy DG, Quinn N, et al. The role of pathogenic DJ-1 mutations in Parkinson’s disease. *Ann Neurol* 2003; 54: 283–286.

18. Chen WJ, Peng R, Li T, et al. Association of the DJ-1 gene polymorphism with sporadic Parkinson’s disease in Sichuan province of China. *Chin J Med Gen* 2008; 25: 566–569.

19. Liu SX, Guo JF, Yi CH, et al. Relationship between the monocyte of the g.168_185del polymorphism of the promoter in DJ-1 gene and Parkinson’s disease. *J Clin Neurol* 2008; 21: 267–269.

20. Li HJ, Yan YR and Yang XL. Association between the polymorphism of DJ-1 gene g 168_185del and Parkinson’s disease in Xinjiang Uygurs and Hans. *J Clin Neurol* 2012: 189–191.

21. Cai M, Duan XZ, Ouyang ZY, et al. Mutation analysis of DJ-1 in patients with early-onset Parkinson’s disease and relationship between the g 168_85del polymorphism and Parkinson’s disease. *Chin J Neurol* 2013; 46: 655–658.

22. De Marco EV, Annesi G, Tarantino P, et al. DJ-1 is a Parkinson’s disease susceptibility gene in southern Italy. *Clin Genet* 2010; 77: 183–188.

23. Eerola J, Hernandez D, Launes J, et al. Assessment of a DJ-1 (PARK7) polymorphism in Finnish PD. *Neurology* 2003; 61: 1000–1002.

24. Sadhukhan T, Biswas A, Das SK, et al. DJ-1 variants in Indian Parkinson’s disease patients. *Dis Markers* 2012; 33: 127–135.

25. Glanzmann B, Lombard D, Carr J, et al. Screening of two indel polymorphisms in the 5’UTR of the DJ-1 gene in South African Parkinson’s disease patients. *J Neural Transm (Vienna)* 2014; 121: 135–138.

26. Morris CM, O’Brien KK, Gibson AM, et al. Polymorphism in the human DJ-1 gene is not associated with sporadic dementia with Lewy bodies or Parkinson’s disease. *Neurosci Lett* 2003; 352: 151–153.

27. Huo Z, Luo X, Zhan X, et al. Genetic analysis of indel markers in three loci associated with Parkinson’s disease. *PLoS One* 2017; 12: e0184269.

28. He L, Lin S, Pan H, et al. Lack of association between DJ-1 gene promoter polymorphism and the risk of Parkinson’s disease. *Front Aging Neurosci* 2019; 11: 24.

29. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. *BMJ* 2009; 3: 123–130.

30. Wells GA, Shea B, O’Connell D, et al. The Newcastle–Ottawa Scale (NOS) for Assessing the Quality of Nonrandomised studies in Meta-analyses; 2011. http://www.ohri.ca/programs/clinical_epidemiology/oxford.asp (accessed 5 November 2014).

31. Higgins JP and Thompson SG. Quantifying heterogeneity in a meta-analysis. *Stat Med* 2002; 21: 1539–1558.

32. Zintzaras E and Ioannidis JP. Heterogeneity testing in meta-analysis of genome searches. *Genet Epidemiol* 2005; 28: 123–137.

33. Patsopoulos NA, Evangelou E and Ioannidis JP. Sensitivity of between-study heterogeneity in meta-analysis: proposed
metrics and empirical evaluation. *Int J Epidemiol* 2008; 37: 1148–1157.
34. Egger M, Davey SG, Schneider M, et al. Bias in meta-analysis detected by a simple, graphical test. *BMJ* 1997; 315: 629–634.
35. Griffiths JF, Miller JH, Suzuki DT, et al. *An Introduction to Genetic Analysis*. New York: W. H. Freeman & Co, 2000.
36. Siegel JL, Hampton K, Rabinstein AA, et al. Oxygen therapy with high-flow nasal cannula as an effective treatment for perioperative pneumocephalus: case illustrations and pathophysiological review. *Neurocrit Care* 2018; 29: 366–373.
37. Kim RH, Peters M, Jang Y, et al. DJ-1, a novel regulator of the tumor suppressor PTEN. *Cancer Cell* 2005; 7: 263–273.
38. Wagenfeld A, Yeung CH, Strupat K, et al. Shedding of a rat epididymal sperm protein associated with infertility induced by ornidazole and alpha-chlorohydrin. *Biol Reprod* 1998; 58: 1257–1265.
39. Maita C, Maita H, Iguchi-Ariga SM, et al. Monomer DJ-1 and its N-terminal sequence are necessary for mitochondrial localization of DJ-1 mutants. *PLoS One* 2013; 8: e54087.
40. Choi J, Sullards MC, Olzmann JA, et al. Oxidative damage of DJ-1 is linked to sporadic Parkinson and Alzheimer diseases. *J Biol Chem* 2006; 281: 10816–10824.
41. Bandopadhayay R, Kingsbury AE, Cookson MR, et al. The expression of DJ-1 (PARK7) in normal human CNS and idiopathic Parkinson’s disease. *Brain* 2004; 127: 420–430.
42. Waragai M, Wei J, Fujita M, et al. Increased level of DJ-1 in the cerebrospinal fluids of sporadic Parkinson’s disease. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 2006; 345: 967–972.
43. Shinbo Y, Taira T, Niki T, et al. DJ-1 restores p53 transcription activity inhibited by Topors/p53BP3. *Int J Oncol* 2005; 26: 641–648.
44. Fan J, Ren H, Jia N, et al. DJ-1 decreases Bax expression through repressing p53 transcriptional activity. *J Biol Chem* 2008; 283: 4022–4030.
45. Junn E, Taniguchi H, Jeong BS, et al. Interaction of DJ-1 with Daxx inhibits apoptosis signal-regulating kinase 1 activity and cell death. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2005; 102: 9691–9696.
46. Karunakaran S, Diwakar L, Saeed U, et al. Activation of apoptosis signal regulating kinase 1 (ASK1) and translocation of death-associated protein, Daxx, in substantia nigra pars compacta in a mouse model of Parkinson’s disease: protection by alpha-lipoic acid. *FASEB J* 2007; 21: 2226–2236.
47. Maita C, Tsuji S, Yabe I, et al. Secretion of DJ-1 into the serum of patients with Parkinson’s disease. *Neurosci Lett* 2008; 431: 86–89.