Study the production performance of carp poly-culture in earthen ponds at BAPARD by using natural feeds in winter season

MM Nabi

DOI: [https://doi.org/10.22271/fish.2021.v9.i1c.2405](https://doi.org/10.22271/fish.2021.v9.i1c.2405)

Abstract

An experiment was conducted to compare the production performances of different carps i.e. Rohu (Labeo rohita), Catla (Catla catla), Mrigal (Cirrhinus cirrhosus) and Silver carp (Hypophthalmichys molitrix) in different stocking densities of poly-culture by using natural feeds in winter season. Three treatments each with three replications were maintained and the stocking densities of carps were 32, 64 and 128 per decimal in T1, T2 and T3 respectively. The ratio of stocking for Rohu, Catla, Mrigal and Silver carp were 5:1:1:1. The water quality parameter such as pH, temperature, dissolved oxygen and transparency were observed fortnightly. The obtained results showed that the highest weight was gained at 470.12±0.76 g in treatments T3 by Silver carp, followed by Mrigal (401.70±0.31g), Catla (410.10±0.30 g) and Rohu (450.10±0.30 g). Similarly, the highest length was obtained in treatment T1 by Silver carp at 37.10±0.3 cm followed by Rohu at 25.75±1.13 cm Catla at 28.47±2.50 cm and Mrigal 24.33±1.20 cm. However, both the weight gain and the length gain were the lowest in treatment T3 for all species. On the other hand, the highest SGR% was found in treatment T2 for Mrigal (2.10) and the lowest SGR% was in T3 for Rohu (1.37). The highest survival (%) of the fishes was found in treatment T1 than those of treatments T2 and T3. Furthermore, the highest production was obtained in treatment T3 (12.35 kg/dec.) followed by T2 (11.56 kg/dec.) and T1 (10.19 kg/dec.). The BCR was calculated 1:1.28 for T1, 1:0.75 for T2 and 1:0.03 for T3. The findings of this experiment revealed that among three treatments, the stocking density 32 per decimal (T1) is the most suitable.

Keywords: Production performances, stocking densities, winter season, natural feed, SGR, survival and BCR

Introduction

Bangladesh is a delta and most of its 1,47,570 km² area (BBS, 2011) is mainly composed of alluvial deposits borne by the Ganga-Padma, Meghna and Jamuna-Brahmaputra rivers and their branches. Bangladesh is a country blessed with vast fisheries resources including rivers, flood plains, lakes, ponds, ox-bow lakes, etc. which are full of 260 different fish species (DoF, 2014) [8]. The total annual fish production in Bangladesh was estimated at 42.77 Lac MT in 2017–18 fiscal year, of which 2.4 million MT (56.24%) were obtained from inland aquaculture (DoF, 2019) [9]. Natural feed is the best feed for fish. It is healthy. It is a money saver. It gives healthier fry, more successful spawns and better coloration than any prepared feed on the market. Plankton is essentially feed come from green water that grows on suspended urea and TSP in the water column. Optimizing production in pond fish culture by the use of fertilizers is an important task. Fertilizer is helpful for the increase of natural food of fish i.e. plankton, benthos and periphyton. Plankton is the basic food of all the organisms living in the water. Fishes and other aquatic organisms depend on this basic food directly and indirectly. Extensive work on water quality and pond fertilization has been conducted elsewhere (Boyd, 2008) [6] but very few of them have relevance to carp culture. The physicochemical characteristics of pond water are of great importance and essential in case of fish culture and fisheries management. The physicochemical properties play the most important role in governing the production of phytoplankton i.e. primary production in fishponds (Banerjee, 1967) [7]. As for example, Hepher et al. (1971) [11] found in Israel that if there applied no fertilizers in fish pond, the cost of production per ton was 935 dollars and after applying fertilizers, the cost of production of...
fish per ton was 691 dollars. Poly-culture is the practice of culturing more than one species of aquatic organism in the same pond. Poly-culture gives higher production than monoculture in extensive systems because more available natural food is utilized by different fish species efficiently Wahab et al. (2001) [25]. Poly-culture may produce expected results if fish with different feeding habits are stocked in proper ratio and combination (Halver, 1984) [12]. In Asian poly-culture, a wide variety of fish species are cultured of which rohu (Labeo rohita), catla (Catla catla) and mrigal (Cirrhinus cirrhosus) are very popular Rahman et al. (2006) [20]. The farmers prefer to stock Common carp as a bottom feeder instead of mrigal because common carp grows faster than mrigal and the overall production is higher when combined with rohu and catla in polyculture ponds Wahab et al. (2002) [26]. Poly-culture is more productive, capital intensive and profitable activity compared to other culture systems (Dev, 2009) [10].

Gopalganj district is a part of the south-west region of Bangladesh. It is developed by the alluvial flow of the Modumothi River. The livelihoods of a considerable proportion of rural people in this area depend entirely on fishing in inland open water bodies (mainly floodplain areas and ponds). Availability of ponds in this area has the great potentiality of fish production applying natural feed in polyculture system. Maximum pond in the rural areas become unused that can be brought under culture system due to feed cost. Therefore, the present study was conducted to know the contribution of natural feed during winter season (most of the water remain unused). The study is expected to provide some valuable information to the fish farmers. It is expected that the findings of the work will be helpful to prepare a guideline for a sustainable carp poly-culture practices.

Materials and Methods

Study area

The present experiment was carried out for a period of 150 days from November/2019 to March/2020. It is located at the Pond of BAPARD campus, Gopalganj (located at 22.9833°N 89.9917°E). (Fig. 1).

![Study area](image)

Fig 1: Map of Kotalipara Upazilla showing the study area in Gopalganj district

Experimental design

Three different stocking densities (32 nos/dec., 64 nos/dec. and 128 nos/dec.) for T1, T2 and T3 respectively) of rohu, catla, mrigal and silver carp with a ratio of 5:1:1:1 were assessed using three replication for each treatment.

Pond preparation

The ponds were drained out completely and aquatic weeds were removed manually. Liming was done in all ponds at the rate of 1 kg/decimal. One week after liming the ponds were filled with water and fertilized with urea and TSP at the rate of 200 gm/decimal and 100 gm/decimal respectively. TSP was soaked overnight, then urea and TSP were dissolved together and spread manually on pond water surface at sunny day (10-10.30 am). To enhance the growth of natural food for the carps, fertilization was done with urea (200 gm/dec) and TSP (100 gm/dec) ten a month. The ponds were same in size (10 dec.) and similar in shape and depth.
Collection of experimental fish
All the carp fingerlings were collected from Sonali Fish Farm and hatchery (Pvt) Limited, Kotalipara, Gopalganj.

Water quality parameters
Water quality parameters of the experimental ponds were recorded throughout the study period. The water temperature (°C), dissolve oxygen (ppm) and hydrogen ion concentration (pH), ammonia (NH₃) and Nitrite (NO₂) were monitored at the beginning and end of the experiment by using proper instrument.

Estimation of growth performance
Sampling was done 15 days interval from each pond by cast net and the weight of fish was recorded by using electric balance (Model:FKS-5000). After harvesting of fishes final weight were recorded and following parameters were used to evaluate the growth and production of the fishes.

\[
\text{Mean length gain (cm)} = \text{Mean final length (cm)} - \text{Mean initial length (cm)}
\]

\[
\text{Mean weight gain (g)} = \text{Mean final weight (g)} - \text{Mean initial weight (g)}
\]

\[
\text{Specific growth rate (SGR %)} = \frac{\log W_{T_2} - \log W_{T_1}}{T_2 - T_1} \times 100
\]

Here, \(W_{T_2}\): the final live body weight (g) at time \(T_2\) day
\(W_{T_1}\): the initial live body weight (g) at time \(T_1\) day
\(T_2\): time duration at the end of the experiment
\(T_1\): initial time of the experiment (day).

Fish production = No. of fish harvested × final average weight

Weight Data analysis
The recorded data were entered into the spreadsheet in MS Excel 2010 and then summarized properly before statistical analysis. After entering the data, the descriptive statistical analyses were done by MS Excel. The inferential T-test was carried out using SPSS (Statistical Package for Social Sciences) version 22.

Results
Water quality parameters
Water quality parameters of the (Dissolved oxygen, pH, water transparency and temperature) were recorded fortnightly during the study period. The mean values of water quality parameters are presented in the Table 1. The pH values of pond water were found to be fluctuated and ranged from 7.71 to 7.90. The Dissolved oxygen concentrations under different treatments were found to be fluctuated around 4.56±0.50, 4.33±0.53 and 4.15±0.57 in the three treatments \(T_1\), \(T_2\) and \(T_3\). Transparency ranged from 27 to 30 cm and the mean values were 30.69±1.07, 34.11±0.97 and 32.61±1.02 cm in \(T_1\), \(T_2\) and \(T_3\) respectively.

| Treatments | pH     | Ammonia | Dissolved oxygen | Temperature (°C) | Transparency |
|------------|--------|---------|------------------|------------------|--------------|
| \(T_1\)    | 7.80±0.10 | 0.25±0.25 | 4.56±0.50       | 20.25±0.20       | 30.69±1.07   |
| \(T_2\)    | 7.75±0.11 | 0.50±0.25 | 4.33±0.53       | 20.23±0.19       | 34.11±0.97   |
| \(T_3\)    | 7.71±0.14 | 1±0.25   | 4.15±0.57       | 20.15±0.21       | 32.61±1.02   |

Growth performance of carps
The obtained results showed that the highest weight was gained at 470.12±0.76 g in treatments \(T_1\) by Silver carp, followed by Mrigal (401.70±0.31 g), Catla (410.10±0.30 g) and Rohu (450.10±0.30 g). Similarly, the highest length was obtained in treatment \(T_1\) by Silver carp at 37.10±0.30 cm followed by Rohu at 25.75±1.13 cm Catla at 28.47±2.50 cm and Mrigal 24.33±1.20 cm. On the other hand, the highest SGR% was found in treatment \(T_2\) for Mrigal (2.10) and the lowest SGR% was in \(T_1\) for Rohu (1.37). The highest survival (%) of the fishes was found in treatment \(T_1\) than those of treatments \(T_2\) and \(T_3\). The BCR was calculated 1:1.28 for \(T_1\), 1:0.75 for \(T_2\) and 1:0.03 for \(T_3\).
The pH values of pond water were found to be fluctuated from 7.71 to 7.90. In treatment T3, the pH range was from 7.71 to 7.90. In treatment T2, the pH range was from 7.90 to 8.10. In treatment T1, the pH range was from 8.10 to 8.40.

Dissolved oxygen concentrations of different ponds were ranged from 3 to 7. The Dissolved oxygen concentrations under different treatments were found to be fluctuated around 4.56±0.50, 4.33±0.53 and 4.15±0.57 in the three treatments T1, T2 and T3. Roy (2001) [21] considered 5.0 to 7.0 mg/l of dissolved oxygen content of water is fair or good in respect of productivity and water having dissolved oxygen less than 5 mg/l to be unproductive. No significant difference (P>0.05) was observed among the three treatments (Table 1). Temperature of pond water was found to be almost similar in different treatments without any significant difference. In T1, T2 and T3 treatments it had figures of 20.25±0.20 °C, 20.23±0.19 °C and 20.15±0.21 °C, respectively. Bhatnagar and Devi (2013) [4] suggested that the desirable water temperature for carp poly-culture in pond from 20 to 30 °C which was more or less similar in the present study. Transparency ranged from 27 to 30 cm and the mean values were 30.69±1.07, 34.11±0.97 and 32.61±1.02 cm in T1, T2 and T3 respectively. Boyd (1982) [5] suggested that transparency from 15 to 40 cm was good for fish culture. The variation in transparency was due to different pond environments. Transparence values were recorded by Miah et al. [16, 24] suggested that transparency from 15 to 40 cm was good for fish culture. The variation in transparency was due to different pond environments. Transparence values were recorded by Miah et al. [16, 24].

Table 2: Production performance of carp poly-culture under different stocking densities and management practices

| Parameters                      | Treatments | T1 | T2 | T3 |
|---------------------------------|------------|----|----|----|
| Stocking Density (dec.)         |            |    |    |    |
| Rohu                            | 20         | 40 | 80 |    |
| Catla                           | 4          | 8  | 16 |    |
| Mrigal                          | 4          | 8  | 16 |    |
| Silver carp                     | 4          | 8  | 16 |    |
| Initial length (cm)             |            |    |    |    |
| Rohu                            | 6.06±0.00  | 6.06±0.00 | 6.06±0.00 |    |
| Catla                           | 6.41±0.00  | 6.41±0.00 | 6.41±0.00 |    |
| Mrigal                          | 6.20±0.00  | 6.20±0.00 | 6.20±0.00 |    |
| Silver carp                     | 5.40±0.00  | 5.40±0.00 | 5.40±00.00 |    |
| Initial weight (g)              |            |    |    |    |
| Rohu                            | 25.50±0.12 | 25.50±0.12 | 25.50±0.12 |    |
| Catla                           | 20.40±0.15 | 20.40±0.15 | 20.40±0.15 |    |
| Mrigal                          | 21.30±0.17 | 21.30±0.17 | 21.30±0.17 |    |
| Silver carp                     | 23.25±0.11 | 23.25±0.11 | 23.25±0.11 |    |
| Culture duration (days)=150 days |            |    |    |    |

Table 3: Economic analysis for carp production in ponds reared for 150 days

| Components          | Treatments | T1       | T2       | T3       |
|---------------------|------------|----------|----------|----------|
| Expenditure (Tk./dec.) |            | 320/-    | 640/-    | 1,280/-  |
| Fingerlings cost    |            | 320/-    | 640/-    | 1,280/-  |
| Feed cost           |            | -        | -        | -        |
| Urea (10.00 Kg)     |            | 160/-    | 160/-    | 160/-    |
| TSP (5.00 Kg)       |            | 110/-    | 110/-    | 110/-    |
| Lime cost (5.00 Kg) |            | 80/-     | 80/-     | 80/-     |
| Medicine            |            | -        | -        | 160/-    |
| Total expenditure (Tk./dec.) | 670/-     | 990/-    | 1,790/-  |

Income

| Gross return (Tk./dec.) | 1528.50/- | 1,734    | 1,852.50/- |
| Net return (Tk./dec.)   | 858.50/-  | 744/-    | 62/-       |
| BCR (Benefit Cost Ratio)| 1:1.28    | 1:0.75   | 1:0.03     |

Urea per Kg 16/- rate, TSP per Kg 22/- rate and Sale price = Taka 150/-/kg (Average)

Discussion

Dissolved oxygen, pH, water transparency and temperature were recorded fortnightly during the study period. The mean values of water quality parameters are presented in the Table 1. The pH values of pond water were found to be fluctuated and ranged from 7.71 to 7.90. In treatment T1, T2 and T3, the average pH of water were 7.80±0.10, 7.75±0.11 and 7.71±0.14, respectively. For pond fish culture, the suitable ranges of pH are 6.5 to 8.5 [10]. The present findings agree with the findings of (Ahmed, 2004) [3] who found that pH ranged from 6.6 to 8.9 in different treatments. Again, the Dissolved Oxygen concentrations of different ponds were ranged from 3 to 7. The Dissolved oxygen concentrations under different treatments were found to be fluctuated around 4.56±0.50, 4.33±0.53 and 4.15±0.57 in the three treatments T1, T2 and T3. Roy (2001) [21] considered 5.0 to 7.0 mg/l of dissolved oxygen content of water is fair or good in respect of productivity and water having dissolved oxygen less than 5 mg/l to be unproductive. No significant difference (P>0.05) was observed among the three treatments (Table 1). Temperature of pond water was found to be almost similar in different treatments without any significant difference. In T1, T2 and T3 treatments it had figures of 20.25±0.20 °C, 20.23±0.19 °C and 20.15±0.21 °C, respectively. Bhatnagar and Devi (2013) [4] suggested that the desirable water temperature for carp poly-culture in pond from 20 to 30 °C which was more or less similar in the present study. Transparency ranged from 27 to 30 cm and the mean values were 30.69±1.07, 34.11±0.97 and 32.61±1.02 cm in T1, T2 and T3 respectively. Boyd (1982) [5] suggested that transparency from 15 to 40 cm was good for fish culture. The variation in transparency was due to plankton production and rain induced turbidity. Similar transparency values were recorded by Miah et al. (1997) and Wahab et al. (1995) [16, 24].

The obtained results showed that the highest weight was gained at 470.12±0.76 g in treatments T1 by Silver carp, followed by Mrigal (401.70±0.31 g), Catla (410.10±0.30 g) and Rohu (450.10±0.30 g). Similarly, the highest length was...
obtained in treatment $T_1$ by Silver carp at 37.10±0.30 cm followed by Rohu at 25.75±1.13 cm Catla at 28.47±2.50 cm and Mrigal 24.33±1.20 cm. However, both the weight gain and the length gain were the lowest in treatment $T_3$ for all species. Mean Length gain (cm) of fishes in this present study was agreed with the findings of Saha et al. (1999) [22]. Weight gain (g) as observed in this study appeared to be suitable for fish culture which agreed with the findings of Miah et al. (1998) [19]. On the other hand, the highest SGR% was found in treatment $T_2$ for Mrigal (2.10) and the lowest SGR% was in $T_1$ for Rohu (1.37). The result of the study is about same to the findings of Miah et al. (1998) [19]. The highest survival (%) of the fishes was found in treatment $T_1$ than those of treatments $T_2$ and $T_3$. Similar result also observed by Miah et al. (1997) [17]. The variation of production of fishes was found in three treatments. Between three treatments, the higher production of fish was recorded in $T_1$, followed by the production of $T_1$ and $T_2$. Kadir et al. (2006) [15] obtained 1970 kg/ha production in polyculture during 150 days culture period. Sagor (2008) [23] obtained the average production of carp’s 1676 kg/ha/year. Haque (2010) [14] reported good results from the polyculture of Indian carps in three treatments with the productivity ranging from 2618.85±57.5 to 2747.47±116.47 kg/ha/year. The BCR was calculated 1:1.28 for $T_1$, 1:0.75 for $T_2$ and 1:0.03 for $T_3$. In traditional polyculture system of carps in Bangladesh the production range was 3119 to 4067 kg/ha/year Hassain et al. (1997) and Mazid et al. (1997) [15, 18]. Awal et al. (1995) [15] stated that a net production of native, exotic and mixed carp poly-culture system were 1196, 1617 and 982 kg/ha per 6 months, respectively. So, the level of fish production in the present study was more or less similar to the result quoted above.

Conclusion

During winter season most of the ponds are remain unused due to low water level and unavailability of fish fingerlings. Therefore farmers are not agreed to invest any inputs in their ponds during winter season. So it was observed that carp poly-culture using natural feed (inorganic fertilizers) can be done during lean season in winter. The fertilizer treatments effect was found to be significant and strongly influenced water quality and primary production. In the end of the experiment, it was suggested that low stocking density with highest BCR $T_1$ had more viable for carp production in polyculture by using natural feed in winter season.

Acknowledgement

The authors are thankful and grateful to BAPARD faculty members, officers & staffs of Department of Fisheries (DoF) for their kind help in supplying data and information related to carp production in polyculture by using natural feed in winter season.

References

1. Awal S, Wahab MA, Ahmed GU, Rahman MM, Ahmed F. Economics of different polyculture system involving native and exotic carp. Bangladesh Journal of Fisheries. 1995;15-18(1, 2):37-43.
2. Ahmed H. Promotion of small Indigenous Fish Species (SIS) Mola based carp polyculture technology at Gazipur area of Bangladesh, MS Dissertation, Department of Fisheries Management, BAU, Mymensingh 2004, 85.
3. BBS (Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics). Bangladesh Population and Housing Census 2011.
4. Bhatnagar A, Devi P. Water quality guidelines for the management of pond fish culture. International Journal of Environmental Sciences. 2013;3(6):1980-2009.
5. Boyd CE. Water quality management for pond fish culture. Elsevier Sci. Publishers B. V., 1000 AH. Amsterdam-Oxford-New York, 1982, 318.
6. Boyd CE. Pond bottom soil analyses, translated from global aquaculture advocate 2008;1:91-92.
7. Banerjee SM. Water quality and soil condition of fish ponds in some states of India in relation to fish production. Indian Journal of Fisheries 1967;14:115-144.
8. DoF. National Fish Week 2013 Compendium (in Bengali), Department of Fisheries, Ministry of Fisheries and Livestock, Bangladesh 2014, 144.
9. DoF. National Fish Week 2019 Compendium (in Bengali), Department of Fisheries, Ministry of Fisheries and Livestock, Bangladesh 2019, 160.
10. Dev M. Polyculture of carps with tilapia, MS Thesis, Department of Aquaculture, Bangladesh Agricultural University, Mymensingh 2009, 25.
11. Hepher B, Chervinski T, Tagari H. Studies on carp and silver carp nutrition III. Experiments on the effect on fish of dietary protein source and concentration. Bamiidgeh. 1971;23(1):11-37.
12. Halver JEL. Special methods in pen fish husbandry. Akademias Nyomda, Budapest 1984, 146.
13. Hassain MA, Toyub MA, Islam MN, Hasan MR. Effect of species combination on the growth of major and Chinese carps in demonstration pond under Feni district. Banglades Agril. Sciences. 1997;21(2):257-266.
14. Haque R. Growth and production performance of carps in different stocking densities of polyculture, MS Thesis, Department of Aquaculture, Bangladesh Agricultural University, Mymensingh 2010, 35.
15. Kadir A, Kundo RS, Milstein A, Wahab MA. Effects of silver carp and small indigenous species on the pond ecology and carp polyculture in Bangladesh. Aquaculture 2006;261:1065-1076.
16. Latif MA, Ali MM, Islam MA. A comparative physico chemical study of a well manages fish pond and a derelict pond. Bangladesh Journal of Aquaculture 1986;6:71-78.
17. Miah MS, Shahabuddin M, Shah MS. Effect of stocking ratio on the growth and production of fishes in mixed polyculture system. Bangladesh Journal of Fisheries. 1997;20(1, 2):135-138.
18. Mazid MA, Zaher M, Begum NN, Ali MZ, Nahar F. Formulation of cost effective feeds from locally available ingredients for carp polyculture system for increased production. Aquaculture 1997;151:71-78.
19. Miah MS, Shahabuddin M, Shah MS. Effect of fertilizers on the growth of fishes under carp polyculture system. Bangladesh Journal of Fisheries. 1998;21(2):89-92.
20. Rahman MM, Verdegem MCJ, Nagelkerke LAJ, Wahab MA, Milstein A, Verreth JAJ. Growth, production and food preference of Rohu labeoroohita (H.) in monoculture and in polyculture with Common carp Cyprinus carpio (L.) under fed and non-fed ponds. Aquaculture 2006;257:359-372.
21. Roy K. Effect of stocking density on the growth of carps in ponds. M. S. Thesis, Dept. of Aquaculture, Bangladesh Agricultural University, Mymensingh 2001, 72.
22. Saha SB, Gupta MV, Hassain MG, Shahe MG. Growth and survival of rohu (Labeo rohita) fry in rearing ponds
at different stocking densities. Bangladesh Journal of Fisheries 1999;16(2):119-126.

23. Sagor MFH. Effects of different combinations of carp on pond ecology and fish production in carp Molapolyculture, MS Thesis, Department of Aquaculture, Bangladesh Agricultural University, Mymensingh 2008.

24. Wahab MA, Islam MT, Ahmed ZF, Hoq MS, Haque MA, Biswas BK. Effect of frequency of fertilization on the pond ecology and growth of fishes. BAU Research Progress 1995;9:410-419.

25. Wahab MA, Rahman MM, Milstein A. The effect on Common carp and Mrigal as bottom feeders in Indian carp polyculture. Aquaculture 2001;32:50-52.

26. Wahab MA, Rahman MM, Milstein A. The effect of common carp (Cyprinus carpio) and Mrigal (Cirrhinus mrigala) as bottom feeders in Major Indian carp polycultures. Aquaculture Research 2002;33:547-556.