Analyzing the environmental effects of conventional and condensing combi boilers using natural gas

Yazar(lar) (Author(s)): Halil İbrahim VARİYENLİ¹, Ataollah KHANLARI²

ORCID¹: 0000-0001-6313-1786
ORCID²: 0000-0001-9691-9799

Bu makaleye şu şekilde atıfta bulunabilirsiniz (To cite to this article): Varîyenli H.İ. and Khanlari A., “Analyzing the environmental effects of conventional and condensing combi boilers using natural gas”, Politeknik Dergisi, 23(4): 1277-1284, (2020).

Erişim linki (To link to this article): http://dergipark.org.tr/politeknik/archive

DOI: 10.2339/politeknik.592313
Analyzing the Environmental Effects of Conventional and Condensing Combi Boilers Using Natural Gas

Highlights
- Investigating the environmental effects of conventional and condensing combi boilers.
- Analyzing different type combi boilers using natural gas.
- The experimental results showed the positive effects of using condensing combi boiler.
- CO₂, NO and NOₓ emissions significantly reduced by utilizing condensing type combi boiler.

Graphical Abstract
In this study the effects of combi boiler type on pollutant gas emissions have been experimentally analyzed.

Figure. Main steps of the present work

Aim
The main aim of this study is analyzing the effects of combi boiler type on pollutant gas emissions.

Design & Methodology
In this work, three various combi boilers including conventional, condensing and full condensing type combi boilers have been experimentally tested to determine their environmental effects.

Originality
There is no study in the literature which compares different combi boilers pollutant gas emissions.

Findings
It can be stated that utilizing condensing and full condensing combi boilers can be reduced pollutant gas emissions in comparison to conventional type.

Conclusion
This study showed that condensing and full condensing combi boilers can be more effective in comparison with conventional type, both in energy saving and environmentally friendly aspects.

Declaration of Ethical Standards
The author(s) of this article declare that the materials and methods used in this study do not require ethical committee permission and/or legal-special permission.
Analyzing the Environmental Effects of Conventional and Condensing Combi Boilers Using Natural Gas

Araştırmacı Makalesi / Research Article

Halil İbrahim VARİYENLİ¹, Ataollah KHANLARI²

¹Gazi University, Technology Faculty, Energy Systems Engineering, Teknikokullar, 06500, Ankara, Turkey
²University of Turkish Aeronautical Association, Mechanical Engineering, 06790, Ankara, Turkey

(Geliş/Received : 16.07.2019 ; Kabul/Accepted : 09.12.2019)

ABSTRACT

Generally, space heating and hot water providing are done by combi boilers. Different types of combi boilers are available. In the recent years condensing combi boilers have been introduced that have high energy efficiency in comparison with conventional types. In the condensing type combi boilers, an additional heat exchanger is utilized to recover energy from flue gas. In this study the effects of combi boiler type on pollutant gas emissions have been experimentally analyzed. In this regard three different combi boiler including conventional, condensing and full condensing type combi boilers have been selected in the experiments. In addition, the experiments have been done in different temperatures to investigate the temperature effect. The obtained results showed that in all temperatures using condensing and full condensing combi boilers reduced CO₂, NO and NOₓ gas emissions considerably. Also, by analyzing combi boilers emissions in different working temperatures, it can be said that in low temperatures CO₂ emission reduction in condensing combi is higher than its reduction in high temperatures in comparison with conventional one.

Keywords: Combi boiler, heat recovery, condensing, natural gas, pollutants gas emissions.

1. INTRODUCTION

Global energy demand increases day by day with increasing world population. Therefore, renewable and alternative energy resources and also efficient energy systems gain importance not only because of limited fossil resources, but also because of pollutant gas emissions. Approximately 40% of annual energy consumption is used in residential buildings and a major part of energy is used for space heating and hot water providing in buildings [1, 2]. Generally hot water and space heating in buildings are supplied by combi boilers. Different types of combi boilers are available. But in the recent years condensing combi boilers have been introduced which have high energy efficiency in comparison with conventional types.

Combi boilers and domestic heating systems have been investigated in different studies in various point of view [3,4]. In the literature different methods were used to enhance the thermal performance of energy systems like combi boilers. Some researcher used nanofluid to improve thermal efficiency of energy systems like combi boilers and heat pipes [5-8]. Also, some researchers used turbulator in the heat exchanger with the aim of increasing thermal efficiency [9]. In addition, some researchers investigated environmental effects of combi boilers. Vignali (2017) studied the environmental effects of two various combi boilers in 3 different climatic regions of Italy. The obtained results indicated that condensing combi boiler has 23% lower environmental impact in comparison with traditional one [10]. Haichao et al. (2013) investigated environmental impact of combined district heating system. They developed a model to analyze the pollutant emissions of heating systems. Their results illustrated the potential of combined systems to reduce CO₂ emission [11]. Aste et al. (2013) investigated environmental and energy impact of domestic heating from 1999 to 2010 in Italy in terms of NOₓ emissions. They indicated that by using new boiler technologies energy saving and pollutant emissions reduction can be achieved [12]. In another study, Comaklı (2008) evaluated economic cost and energy efficiency of condensing and conventional combi boilers. They reported that condensing combi boiler could provide fuel saving by 8% in comparison with conventional type combi boiler [13]. Atmaca et al. (2015) studied transient behavior of two various combi boiler for providing hot water. Their findings indicated that condensing combi boiler have priority in terms of high efficiency and comfort [14]. Weiss et al. (2009) analyzed market diffusion and cost-benefit of condensing type combi boilers in the Netherlands and exhibited energy saving potential and gas emissions reduction by utilizing this type combi boilers [15]. Bălănescu & Homutescu (2018) experimentally investigated the performance of condensing boiler and stated that maximum fuel savings of 17.5% can be achieved in comparison with conventional boiler [16].

The main aim of this study is analyzing the effects of combi boiler type on pollutant gas emissions. In this regard three various combi boiler including conventional, condensing and full condensing type combi boilers have been selected in the experiments. Also, the experiments have been performed in different hot water outlet temperatures to investigate the temperature effect.
2. EXPERIMENTAL SETUP & PROCEDURE

This study investigates the effects of combi boiler type on pollutant gas emissions including CO₂, NO and NOₓ. In this regard, three various combi boilers including; conventional combi boiler, condensing combi boiler and full condensing combi boiler produced by Buderus company have been used in the experiments. All of the selected combi boilers are used for space and water heating. To be able to compare the experimental results, all selected combi boilers have the same heating capacity (24 kW) and can run on natural gas and liquefied petroleum gas (LPG). The main components of used combi boilers are given in Fig. 1-3. The first combi boiler (Fig. 1) is a conventional type that generally is used for domestic heating and hot water providing. The second one (Fig. 2) is condensing combi boiler which recovers thermal energy from combustion gases. In conventional combi boilers combustion gases discharged from combi and a big part of energy is wasted. But in condensing type combi boilers a further heat exchanger is used to recover energy from combustion gases. The working principle of full condensing combi boiler (Fig. 3) is similar to condensing boiler working principle. Available latent and sensible heat in combustion gases recovered in full condensing combi boiler like condensing combi boiler. But, in full condensing combi boilers condensation occur

Figure 1. Conventional combi boiler components [17]: 1. Expansion vessel 2. Fan, 3. Combustion chamber, 4. Burner, 5. Ignition electrode, 6. Safety valve, 7. Inlet air vent, 8. Circulation pump, 9. Pump speed switch, 10. Gas armature, 11. Pressure gauge, 12. Control panel, 13. System filling device, 14. Plate heat exchanger, 15. Type label, 16. Pressure controller, 17. Detection electrode, 18. Water temperature sensor, 19. Safety thermostat, 20. Draught diverter, 21. Differential pressure switch, 22. Combustion air intake, 23. Exhaust gas outlet, 24. Temperature sensor, 25. Safety valve, 26. Flowmeter
in the combustion chamber. This procedure leads to increase in combi boiler thermal performance.

To analyze combi boilers gas emission, ECOM J2KN emissions analyzer has been used and the amount of CO₂, NO and NOₓ gases has been determined. ECOM J2KN emissions analyzer is shown in Fig. 4. Also, technical properties of ECOM J2KN gas analyzer are given in Table 1.

The experiments have been performed in 5 different hot water outlet temperature. In other words, when the temperature of the hot water outlet reached to the set temperature the data recorded. Hot water temperature was set to 40°C, 45°C, 50°C, 55°C and 60°C and each experiment repeated three time to obtain more reliable data. Fig. 5 shows gas emission analyzing in combi boiler using ECOM J2KN emissions analyzer.
**Figure 3.** Full condensing combi boiler [17]; 1. System filling device, 2. Temperature sensor, 3. Condensate drain, 4. Plate heat exchanger, 5. Waste gas temperature controller, 6. Gas pressure controller, 7. Maximum gas regulator, 8. Minimum gas regulator, 9. Expansion vessel, 10. Nitrogen filling valve, 11. Gas pipe, 12. Heating circuit outlet line, 13. Suction pipe, 14. Temperature sensor, 15. Inlet air vent, 16. Igniter, 17. Waste gas duct, 18. Combustion air intake, 19. Control lid, 20. Differential pressure switch, 21. Fan, 22. Waste gas backflow mixing unit, 23. Electrode Set, 24. Safety thermostat, 25. Heat block, 26. Condensate trap, 27. Control lid, 28. 3-way valve, 29. Type label, 30. Circulation pump, 31. Safety valve, 32. Flowmeter, 33. Filling and drain tap, 34. Control panel, 35. Pressure gauge.

| Table 1. Technical properties of ECOM J2KN gas analyzer |
|--------------------------------------------------------|
| **MEASUREMENT (KEY)** | **RANGE** | **ACCURACY** | **RESOLUTION** |
|------------------------|-----------|--------------|----------------|
| Oxygen (%)             | 0-21%     | ± 2% measured| 0.1% vol.      |
| Carbon Monoxide (C)    | 0-4,000 ppm| ± 2% measured| 1 ppm          |
| Nitric Oxiac (N)       | 0-4,000 ppm| ± 2% measured| 1 ppm          |
| Nitrogen Dioxide (N)   | 0-500 ppm  | ± 2% measured| 1 ppm          |
| Nitrogen Oxide (NO)    | 0-50 ppm   | ± 2% measured| 0.1 ppm        |
| Sulfur Dioxide (SO2)   | 0-50 ppm   | ± 2% measured| 1 ppm          |
| Combustibles (A)       | 0-6,000 % vol.| ± 2% measured| 0.001 % vol.   |
| Gas Temperature        | 30-180 °F  | ± 2% measured| 1 deg F        |
| Ambient Temperature    | 0-250 °C   | ± 2% measured| 1 deg F        |
| Draft / Pressure       | ± 4% H2O   | ± 2% measured| 0.1% H2O       |
| O2 Correction          | 0-20% O2   |              |                |
| Smoke Scale            | 0-9       |              |                |
| Carbon Dioxide CO2     | 9-45% CO2 max of fuel | Calculated |
| Efficiency             | 99.99%     | Calculated   |                |
| Excess Air (Lambd)     | 1-10       | Calculated   |                |

**Figure 4.** ECOM J2KN emissions analyzer.
3. RESULTS
In this section the experimental results are given and the effects of combi boiler type on pollutant gas emission are concluded. The effects of condensing type combi boiler on energy saving is obvious. But at the same time the environmental effect of combi boilers is important. Pollutant gas emissions like CO\textsubscript{2}, NO and NO\textsubscript{x} cause to global warming and acid rain. The main objective of these experiments is to clarify the amount of CO\textsubscript{2}, NO and NO\textsubscript{x} pollutant gases in the flue gas of different combi boilers. In addition, pollutant gas emissions for different hot water outlet temperatures have been analyzed. In other words, hot water outlet of the combi boiler has been adjusted in different temperature values and the amount of gas emissions related to each temperature has been measured.

Pollutant gas emissions for 40°C outlet hot water in different combi boilers is given in Fig. 6a. In the figure the amount CO\textsubscript{2}, NO and NO\textsubscript{x} gases in the flue gas are presented. As it can be seen in Fig. 6a full condensing combi boiler has the lowest amount of pollutant gas emissions and the conventional combi boiler has the highest amount of pollutant gas emissions. In addition, utilizing full condensing combi boiler led to reduction in CO\textsubscript{2}, NO and NO\textsubscript{x} emissions by 74%, 75% and 75% respectively in comparison to conventional combi boiler.

Flue gas temperature for 40°C outlet hot water in different combi boilers is given in Fig. 6b. Flue gas in the conventional combi boiler has the highest temperature value and in full condensing combi boiler has the lowest temperature value. In the condensing combi boiler, an extra heat exchanger was added to the system to recover the available latent and sensible heat in the flue gas. The result of recovering available heat in the flue gas led to reduction in the exit flue gas form the combi boiler. Full condensing combi boiler has the lower flue gas temperature in comparison to the condensing combi boiler because condensing phenomena occur in the combustion chamber. Simultaneous realization of combustion processes and condensation in the combustion chamber cause to more reduction in flue gas temperature and increase in combi boiler thermal performance. Consequently, low energy needed to obtain the same heating performance by using condensing technology.

Fig. 7a shows pollutant gas emissions for 45°C outlet hot water in different combi boilers. The amount of CO\textsubscript{2}, NO and NO\textsubscript{x} emissions in the flue gas reduced in full condensing combi as 76%, 68.5% and 68.4%, respectively, in comparison to conventional combi boiler. Also, Fig. 7b shows flue gas temperature for 45°C outlet hot water for three combi boilers. As it can be seen flue gas temperature in full condensing boiler reduced as 46.5% in comparison with conventional combi boiler.

Pollutant gas emissions for 50°C outlet hot water in three various combi boilers is given in Fig. 8a. The same trend for pollutant gas emission is seen in 50°C. The amount of CO\textsubscript{2}, NO and NO\textsubscript{x} emissions in the flue gas decreased as 52.8%, 72.5% and 71.4%, respectively, in full condensing combi in comparison to conventional type boiler. Also, flue gas temperature for 50°C outlet hot water is given in Fig. 8b. Flue gas temperature in full condensing boiler reduced as 45% in comparison with conventional combi boiler.

Finally, pollutant gas emissions for 60°C outlet hot water in three various combi boilers is presented in Fig. 10a. The amount of CO\textsubscript{2}, NO and NO\textsubscript{x} emissions in the flue gas decreased as 23.7%, 70.4% and 69.5%, respectively, in full condensing combi in comparison to conventional type boiler. Also, flue gas temperature reduced as 44% in comparison with conventional combi boiler (Fig. 9b).

In this study pollutant gas emissions of three various combi boilers have been analyzed in different hot water temperatures (40-60°C). Generally, it can be stated that utilizing condensing and full condensing combi boilers can be reduce pollutant gas emissions in comparison to conventional type. By analyzing these combi boilers’ emissions in different working temperatures, it can be said that in low temperatures CO\textsubscript{2} emission reduction in condensing combi is higher than its reduction in high temperatures. The desired temperature of the domestic hot water supply is between 40-45°C and the combi boilers usually are used in this temperature range. Therefore, condensing and full condensing combi boilers can be more effective in comparison with conventional type, both in energy saving and environmentally friendly aspects.
Figure 6. a) Pollutant gas emissions for 40°C outlet hot water, b) Flue gas temperature for 40°C outlet hot water.

Figure 7. a) Pollutant gas emissions for 45°C outlet hot water, b) Flue gas temperature for 45°C outlet hot water.

Figure 8. a) Pollutant gas emissions for 50°C outlet hot water, b) Flue gas temperature for 50°C outlet hot water.
ANALYZING THE ENVIRONMENTAL EFFECTS OF CONVENTIONAL AND CONDENSING COMBI BOILERS... Politeknik Dergisi, 2020; 23 (4) : 1277-1284

4. CONCLUSION
In the present study the effects of combi boiler type on pollutant gas emissions have been investigated. In this regard three different combi boiler including conventional, condensing and full condensing type combi boilers have been selected in the experiments. The measurements have been performed in different hot water outlet temperatures to show the effect of temperature. Generally, it can be stated that utilizing condensing and full condensing combi boilers can reduce pollutant gas emissions in comparison to conventional type. Also, by analyzing these combi boilers emissions in different working temperatures, it can be said that in low temperatures CO\textsubscript{2} emission reduction in condensing combi is higher than its reduction in high temperatures.

DECLARATION OF ETHICAL STANDARDS
The author(s) of this article declare that the materials and methods used in this study do not require ethical committee permission and/or legal-special permission.

REFERENCES
[1] Afshari, F., Comakli, O., Karagöz, S. and Zavaragh, H.G., “A thermodynamic comparison between heat pump and refrigeration device using several refrigerants”, Energy and Buildings, 168: 272-283, (2018).
[2] Khanlari, A. and Ay, İ., “A numerical study on determination of the optimal hole diameter and pitch value for the unglazed transpired solar collectors”, Journal of Politeknik, 22 (1): 163-168, (2019).
[3] Lomas, K. J., Oliveira, S., Warren, P., Haines, V.J. and Chatterton, T., Beizae, A., Prestwood, E., Gething, B., “Do domestic heating controls save energy? A review of the evidence”, Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, 93: 52-75, (2018).
[4] Casanovas-Rubio, M. D. M. and Armengou, J., “Decision-making tool for the optimal selection of a domestic water-heating system considering economic, environmental and social criteria: Application to Barcelona (Spain)”, Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, 91: 741-753, (2018).
Sözen A., Öztürk, A., Özalp, M. and Çiftçi, E., “Influences of alumina and fly ash nanofluid usage on the performance of recuperator including heat pipe bundle”, International Journal of Environmental Science and Technology, 16: 5095-5100, (2019).

Gürü, M., Sözen, A., Karakaya, U. and Çiftçi, E., “Influences of bentonite-deionized water nanofluid utilization at different concentrations on heat pipe performance: An experimental study”, Applied Thermal Engineering, 148: 632-640, (2019).

Khanlari, A., Sözen, A. and Varyenli, H.İ., “Simulation and experimental analysis of heat transfer characteristics in the plate type heat exchangers using TiO$_2$/water nanofluid”, International Journal of Numerical Methods for Heat & Fluid Flow, 29: 1343-1362, (2019).

Khanlari, A., Sözen, A., Varyenli, H.İ. and Gürü, M., “Comparison between heat transfer characteristics of TiO$_2$/deionized water and kaolin/deionized water nanofluids in the plate heat exchanger”, Heat Transfer Research, 50 (5): 435-450, (2019).

Afshari, F., Zavaragh, H.G. and Di Nicola, G., “Numerical analysis of ball-type turbulators in tube heat exchangers with computational fluid dynamic simulations”, International Journal of Environmental Science and Technology, 16: 3771-3780, 2019.

Vignali, G., “Environmental assessment of domestic boilers: A comparison of condensing and traditional technology using life cycle assessment methodology”, Journal of Cleaner Production, 142: 2493-2508, (2017).

Haichao, W., Jiao, W., Lahdelma, R., Pinghua, R. and Shuhui, Z., “Atmospheric environmental impact assessment of a combined district heating system”, Building and Environment, 64: 200-212, (2013).

Aste, N., Adhikari, R.S., Compostella, J. and Del Pero, C., “Energy and environmental impact of domestic heating in Italy: Evaluation of national NO$_x$ emissions”, Energy Policy, 53: 353-360, (2013).

Comaklı, K., “Economic and environmental comparison of natural gas fired conventional and condensing combi boilers”, Journal of the Energy Institute, 81 (4): 242-246, (2008).

Atmaca, A.U., Erek, A. and Altay, H.M., “Investigation of transient behaviour of combi boiler type appliances for domestic hot water”, Applied Thermal Engineering, 82: 129-140, (2015).

Weiss, M., Dittmar, L., Junginger, M., Patel, M.K. and Blok, K., “Market diffusion, technological learning, and cost-benefit dynamics of condensing gas boilers in the Netherlands. Energy Policy, 37: 2962-2976, (2009).

Bălănescu, D.T. and Homutescu, V.M., “Experimental investigation on performance of a condensing boiler and economic evaluation in real operating conditions”, Applied Thermal Engineering, 143: 48-58, (2018).

www.buderus.com