Antimicrobial use in paediatric patients in a teaching hospital in Ethiopia

Hafte Kahsay Kebede¹, Hailay Abrha Gesesew²,³ *, Tewodros Eyob Woldehaimanot⁴, Kabaye Kumela Goro⁴

¹ Filtu Hospital, Somali, Ethiopia, ² Department of Epidemiology, College of Health Sciences, Jimma University, Jimma, Ethiopia, ³ Discipline of Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, Nursing, and Health Sciences, Flinders University, Adelaide, Australia, ⁴ Department of Clinical Pharmacy, College of Health Sciences, Jimma University, Jimma, Ethiopia

* hailushepi@gmail.com

Abstract

Background
Antibiotics use in in children are different from adults due to a lack of data on pharmacokinetics, pharmacodynamics, efficacy and safety of drugs, different physiological spectrum, pediatrics populations being vulnerable to the majority of the illnesses, and the adverse effect of their irrational use is more serious. However, antibiotic use is not explored much in a paediatric population. The current study focused on antibiotic use among pediatric population using data from a tertiary hospital in Ethiopia.

Methods
A retrospective cross-sectional study collated data from 614 pediatrics patients admitted in pediatrics ward at Jimma University Teaching Hospital, Southwest Ethiopia. Descriptive analyses were performed to describe the type and pattern of antibiotics. The number of prescriptions per a patient was also compared with the WHO standard. Data analysis was carried out using SPSS version 20 for mackintosh.

Results
Antimicrobials were prescribed for 407(86.4%) patients of which 85.9% were in the form of injectables. A total of 1241 (90%) medicines were administered parenterally followed by oral 110 (8%). The maximum number of medicines per prescription was eight for all types of drugs in general, and five for antimicrobials in particular. All antimicrobials were prescribed empirically without any microbiological evidence. Pneumonia, sepsis and meningitis were the main reasons for antimicrobial use in the ward. Out of the total of 812 antibiotics prescribed; Penicillin G crystalline was the most (20%) frequently prescribed, followed by gentamicin (19%) and ampicillin (16).

Conclusions
Majority of the prescribed antibiotics were antimicrobials, and was in the form of injectables. Antimicrobials were over prescribed and the number of drugs per prescription was also far
from WHO recommendation. Strict prescribing standard guidelines and treatment habits should be developed in the country, to prevent antimicrobial resistance.

Background
The invention of antimicrobials emerged as a transformational turning point in the reduction of the burden of communicable disease in the 20th century[1]. Antimicrobials are among the most widely prescribed therapeutic agents across the world [2–4]. The use of antibiotics among children is different from adults due to a number of reasons but not limited to: (i) a lack of data on pharmacokinetics, pharmacodynamics, efficacy and safety of drugs[5], (ii) different physiological spectrum among different age groups -preterm neonates, full term neonates, infants and toddlers, and older children and adolescents [5], (iii) pediatrics populations being vulnerable to the majority of the illnesses[6], and (iv) the adverse effect of irrational use of antimicrobials being more serious among children than adults[7].

If antibiotics used inappropriately, it leads to the emergence and worrying national and global trends of antimicrobial resistance[8–10]. According to the WHO, the rational medicine use included the appropriate use of medicine, in the proper dose, for an adequate period of time, and at the lowest cost to the individuals and their community [11]. Globally, irrational drug use is a serious problem[12], with WHO estimating that more than half of all medicines are being inappropriately prescribed, dispensed or sold [12]. The prevalence rates of inappropriate antimicrobial use of 37, 47, and 8% in India[13], Turkey[14] and Israel[15] respectively have been reported. Further studies in Africa including from Nigeria[16] and Ethiopia[7] have also reported high magnitude of inappropriate use of medicines. It is well known that prescribing against clinical guidelines, inappropriate self-medication, and improper use of medicines such as overuse, underuse and misuse can be described as inappropriate use of drugs [17,12], and can lead to antimicrobial resistance [9]. In addition, inappropriate drug use leads to treatment failure, high incidence of toxicities and waste of financial resources[18].

In Ethiopia, it has been stated that there is a high rate (55%) of prescriptions that comprises one or more antimicrobials[19]. Studies from Northwest[20] and Southwest[21] of the country documented that antimicrobials accounted for 60 and 26% of all prescriptions respectively. Many pediatrics physicians in Ethiopia habitually prescribe antimicrobials at times can be rational or irrational[22]. In addition, 50% of Ethiopian hospitals’ budget is allocated to antimicrobials[23]. Nevertheless, there is limited number of studies that have described antimicrobial use among children. We assessed antibiotic use among pediatric population using data from a pediatrics ward at Jimma University Teaching Hospital (JUTH), Southwest Ethiopia.

Material and methods
Study design, settings and participants
A retrospective cross-sectional study was carried out in a pediatrics ward at JUTH, Southwest Ethiopia from March 20 up to April 20, 2014. The hospital serves a catchment area of three million people from rural, urban and semi-urban areas. JUTH pediatrics ward serves children who come from out patient departments (OPD) and other wards such as surgical ward. Records of all pediatrics (children ≤ 14 years of old) who were admitted in JUTH were the target population. Incomplete records were excluded from the analysis.
Sampling procedure
The required sample size was calculated via OpenEpi software using single population proportion calculation formula based on the following assumptions: 58% prevalence rate of antimicrobial use[24], 95% confidence level, 4% margin of error and 5% incomplete files. The total calculated sample of records yielded 614. The records were selected randomly using sampling frame from pediatrics records between January 2012 and February 2014. All prescribed antimicrobials of the randomly selected records were evaluated.

Variables in the study
The variables the study included sex, age, co-morbidity index, duration of hospital stay, number of prescribed antimicrobials, purpose of antimicrobial order, surgical procedure done, antimicrobial per encounter, concomitantly used medications and antimicrobial use. Purpose of antimicrobial order was assessed if the antimicrobial was prescribed for therapy, prophylaxis, both or else. Number of diagnosis is the number of diseases explicitly recorded as diagnosis by physician.

Data collection process and statistical analysis
Data were extracted from records of pediatrics patients who were admitted at JUTH pediatrics ward from January 2012 to February 2014. A data extraction checklist was prepared in English. Four hospital pharmacists, who had been trained on how to extract and use the instruments, extracted the data. To ensure the quality of data, the principal investigator and a supervisor checked the data extraction tools for completeness and consistency daily. Descriptive statistics included mean, median, standard deviations, and range values for continuous data; percentage, frequency tables and graphs for categorical data. The analysis was conducted in Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) version 20 for mackintosh.

Ethical considerations
The study was approved by Institutional Review Board (IRB) of College of Health Sciences at Jimma University, Southwest Ethiopia. Permission for the study to be conducted was also obtained from JUTH. Information gathered was treated as confidential and accessible only to the investigators. Data were extracted for pediatrics age patients on targeted variables. Only de-identified data were extracted.

Results
Demographic and clinical characteristics of study participants
Six hundred and fourteen (614) patients attending the JUTH’s pediatrics ward between January 2012 and February 2014 were initially considered eligible. Of these, 143 records were excluded since their charts were not available or incomplete. In total, 471 patients’ records were reviewed. Table 1 shows demographic and clinical characteristics of the participant who received antimicrobial prescription. More than two third of the patients received two or more antimicrobials. The proportion of males and females was similar and the over one third (35%) of the participants represented toddlers and preschool children aged 1–5 years. Compared to urban dwellers, rural settlers comprised more than half (59%) of the study participants. Half (51%) of the patients had a hospital stay of ≤ 5 days with median hospitalization stay of five days. About half (50%) of the participants had one or more co-morbidity index. Only one out of ten patients had history of surgical procedures.
A total of 1241 (90%) medicines were administered parenterally followed by oral 110 (8%). Of these, antimicrobials were prescribed for 407 (86%) patients, and the majority (86%) of the antimicrobials were in the form of injectables. The majority of patients, 276 (68%), received more than one antimicrobials per one prescription order. The maximum number of medicines per prescription was eight for all types of drugs in general, and five for antimicrobials in particular. All antimicrobials were prescribed empirically without any microbiological evidence. While the main reason for antimicrobials prescription was for therapeutic, few were ordered for prophylaxis and, a small proportion were ordered for prophylaxis and therapy (Table 1). Out of the total drugs prescribed, 166 (12%) were mono drug prescriptions.

Percentage of hospitalizations with one or more antimicrobials prescribed was 86%. The mean number of antimicrobials prescribed per hospitalization was two (SD = 0.91) while the mean number of antimicrobial injections prescribed per prescription was 1.7 (SD = 1.1). In addition, the median duration of prescribed antimicrobial treatment was 7 (1–43) days, and the percentage of surgical inpatients who received antimicrobial prophylaxis was 100%. Four out of five (78.8%) of the prescribed antimicrobials were included in the Ethiopian EDL (Essential Drug List). The mean antimicrobial prescription in neonates was relatively higher (2.32; 95% C.I: 2.12–2.51, SD = 0.72) compared to the other age groups (Table 2). Table 3 reports the percentage of number and percentage of prescribed antibiotics in the Pediatric ward. Of the total of 812 antibiotics prescribed, penicillin G crystalline was the most (20%) frequently prescribed, followed by gentamicin (19%) and ampicillin (16).

| Variables                          | Levels     | Frequency (n = 407) |
|------------------------------------|------------|---------------------|
| Sex                                | Female     | 175 (43)            |
|                                   | Male       | 232 (57)            |
| Age                                | 0–27 days  | 56 (14)             |
|                                   | 1month- 1year | 137 (34)          |
|                                   | 1–5yrs     | 144 (35)            |
|                                   | 5–14yrs    | 70 (17)             |
| Residence                          | Urban      | 169 (42)            |
|                                   | Rural      | 238 (59)            |
| Duration of hospital stay (days)   | ≤5         | 207 (51)            |
|                                   | >5–10      | 86 (21)             |
|                                   | >10        | 114 (28)            |
| Co-morbidity index                 | 0          | 202 (50)            |
|                                   | ≥1         | 205 (50)            |
| Purpose of antimicrobial order     | Therapy    | 364 (89)            |
|                                   | Prophylaxis| 31 (8)              |
|                                   | Not documented | 12 (3)          |
| Number of antimicrobials per encounter | 1      | 131 (32)            |
|                                   | ≥2         | 276 (68)            |
| Surgical procedure done            | Yes        | 48 (12)             |
|                                   | No         | 359 (88)            |
| Number of patients concomitantly on other medication | 0      | 171 (42)            |
|                                   | ≥1         | 236 (58)            |

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0173290.t001

Pattern of antimicrobials prescription

A total of 1241 (90%) medicines were administered parenterally followed by oral 110 (8%). Of these, antimicrobials were prescribed for 407 (86%) patients, and the majority (86%) of the antimicrobials were in the form of injectables. The majority of patients, 276 (68%), received more than one antimicrobials per one prescription order. The maximum number of medicines per prescription was eight for all types of drugs in general, and five for antimicrobials in particular. All antimicrobials were prescribed empirically without any microbiological evidence. While the main reason for antimicrobials prescription was for therapeutic, few were ordered for prophylaxis and, a small proportion were ordered for prophylaxis and therapy (Table 1). Out of the total drugs prescribed, 166 (12%) were mono drug prescriptions.

Percentage of hospitalizations with one or more antimicrobials prescribed was 86%. The mean number of antimicrobials prescribed per hospitalization was two (SD = 0.91) while the mean number of antimicrobial injections prescribed per prescription was 1.7 (SD = 1.1). In addition, the median duration of prescribed antimicrobial treatment was 7 (1–43) days, and the percentage of surgical inpatients who received antimicrobial prophylaxis was 100%. Four out of five (78.8%) of the prescribed antimicrobials were included in the Ethiopian EDL (Essential Drug List). The mean antimicrobial prescription in neonates was relatively higher (2.32; 95% C.I: 2.12–2.51, SD = 0.72) compared to the other age groups (Table 2). Table 3 reports the percentage of number and percentage of prescribed antibiotics in the Pediatric ward. Of the total of 812 antibiotics prescribed, penicillin G crystalline was the most (20%) frequently prescribed, followed by gentamicin (19%) and ampicillin (16).
The current study provides important information on pattern of and type for antimicrobial use in Southwest Ethiopia. Compared to studies conducted in other countries such as in the Serbia (54%) [25], South Africa (75%) [26], Uganda (43.2%) [27] and Jordan (36.8%) [28], the current study revealed higher (86.4%) antimicrobial prescribing patterns in a hospital in Ethiopia. The plausible justification for these differences could be related to variations in prevalence rate of infectious disease, socio-cultural factors, awareness of antimicrobial resistance among health professionals, poor prescribing policy and physicians’ skill to diagnose common communicable diseases [29,30]. This may indicate that there is a need to build capacity for health care provision and to develop strict prescribing policy for antimicrobials. For these to be achieved, significant efforts need to be invested into developing standard treatment guidelines and enforcement of appropriate prescribing habits.

Of all prescribed antimicrobials, 86% were injectable antimicrobials. These injectable prescription patterns are higher than those found in studies conducted in Palestine (62%) [22] and Kathmandu Valley of Nepal (75%) [31]. The WHO recommends only 10% of injectables for the total prescriptions for a health setting, and these patterns are by far higher than these recommendations [32]. Several factors could explain and some of these observations including: (i) differences in availability of antimicrobials in other forms, (ii) the gap in skills among healthcare providers, (iii) and availability of standard treatment guidelines.

The number of drugs per prescription was far from the acceptable level compared with the standard (1.6–1.8) [32]. In addition, all antimicrobials were prescribed without any microbial evidence. These findings demonstrate the scarcity of knowledge and understanding regarding the consequences of inappropriate antimicrobial use among physicians who work in pediatrics ward. These findings call for development of drug policy in Ethiopia. Evaluation of healthcare providers prescription knowledge and behaviours would also need to be undertaken in order to addressed the above gaps.

Table 3. The percentage of prescribed Antibiotics in Pediatric Ward of Jimma University Teaching Hospital, Southwest Ethiopia.

| Type of Antibiotics              | Number of prescription, n (%) |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Penicillin G                     | 166 (20)                      |
| Gentamicin                       | 150 (18)                      |
| Ampicillin                       | 128 (16)                      |
| Cloxacillin                      | 107 (13)                      |
| Chloramphenicol                  | 103 (13)                      |
| Amoxicillin                      | 66 (8)                        |
| Ceftriaxone                      | 50 (6)                        |
| Tetracycline eye ointment        | 17 (2)                        |
| Others                           | 25 (3)                        |
| Total                            | 812 (100)                     |

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0173290.t003
The percentage of antimicrobials prescribed from EDL was 79% and this is very low compared to the Ethiopian health policy that recommends 100% of the prescribed drugs should be from EDL. We recommend that the Ethiopian Food, Medicine and Health Care Administration and Control Agency (FMHACA) should put more efforts to increase the awareness of health care providers and availability of the EDL guidelines in every health facility. In addition, the EDL guideline should be distributed to graduating health science students so that their potential towards the guideline heightens and its shortage in the health facility resolves.

The study has the following several limitations. There were significant (23%) incomplete patient charts. The small sample size nature of the retrospective study may limit the generalizability of the findings. The public hospital-based nature of the study may also not be generalized to public health centers and private health institutions due to the different mix of health professionals and availability of drugs. It has been reported that distribution of highly skilled health professionals is skewed towards private and nongovernmental organizations in the country [33]. For example, in 2006–07, 56% of specialists and 38% of general practitioners working in health facilities were outside the public sectors [34]. In addition, the retrospective nature of the current study cannot assure the cause-effect relationship of the significantly associated factors linked to inappropriate antimicrobial use.

**Conclusions**

This study highlights antimicrobial prescription pattern in a pediatrics setting in Southwest Ethiopia. The study is significant because of the emerging and an increase in antimicrobial resistance. The study provides impetus to a national drive toward antimicrobial stewardship. In summary, the findings from the current study agree in many points with the findings of previous publications. Antimicrobials were over prescribed and their injectable forms were prescribed by far higher than the WHO recommendation. The number of drugs per prescription was also far from the acceptable level. In addition, the percentage of antimicrobials prescribed from essential drug list was less than from the national recommendations and expectations.

Developing effective interventions to reduce inappropriate antimicrobial prescribing will require a clear understanding of how these predictors influence antimicrobial prescribing by large scale prospective studies throughout the country. Strict prescribing policy and standard treatment guideline-appropriate prescribing habits should also be developed and enforced in Ethiopia.

**Acknowledgments**

We are grateful to the data collectors who extract the data. We acknowledge Dr. Lillian Mwanri from Discipline of Public Health at Flinders University for editing the paper. This research was funded by Jimma University.

**Author Contributions**

**Conceptualization:** HKK HAG TEW KKG.

**Formal analysis:** HKK.

**Funding acquisition:** HKK.

**Investigation:** HKK.

**Methodology:** HKK HAG TEW KKG.
Project administration: HKK.
Validation: HKK HAG TEW KKG.
Visualization: HKK HAG TEW KKG.
Writing – original draft: HAG.
Writing – review & editing: HKK HAG TEW KKG.

References
1. Katzung B (2001) Basic and Clinical Pharmacology. New York: Lange Medical Books McGraw-Hill Medical Publishing division.
2. Abdulgafar O J (2011) The Pattern of Antibiotic Use in a Family Medicine Department of a Tertiary Hospital in Sokoto, North Western Nigeria. Journal of Clinical and Diagnostic Research 5: 566–569.
3. Adriaenssens N, Coenen S, Versporten A, Muller A, Minalu G, Faes C, et al. (2011) European Surveillance of Antimicrobial Consumption (ESAC): outpatient quinolone use in Europe (1997–2009). J Antimicrob Chemother 66 Suppl 6: vi47–56.
4. Buccellato E, Melis M, Biagi C, Donati M, Motola D, Vaccheri A (2015) Use of Antibiotics in Pediatrics: 8-Years Survey in Italian Hospitals. PLoS One 10: e0139097. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0139097 PMID: 26405817
5. DiPiro J, Talbert R, Yee G, Matzke G, Wells B, Posey L (2002) Pharmacotherapy: A Pathophysiologic Approach. USA: Graw Hill Companies Inc.
6. Mestawot F, Wubante Y, Jimma Likisa L (2013) Prescribing pattern of antibiotics in pediatric wards of Bishoftu Hospital, East Ethiopia. International Journal of Basic & Clinical Pharmacology 2: 718–722.
7. Abula T, Desta Z (1999) Prescribing pattern of drugs in pediatric wards of three Ethiopian hospitals Ethiop J Health Dev 13: 135–140.
8. Thrane N, Steffensen FH, Mortensen JT, Schonheyder HC, Sorensen HT (1999) A population-based study of antibiotic prescriptions for Danish children. Pediatr Infect Dis J 18: 333–337. PMID: 10223685
9. Jan D (2001) Antibiotic resistance in Australia. Health Issues 69: 1–5.
10. Resi D, Milandri M, Moro ML (2003) Antibiotic prescriptions in children. J Antimicrob Chemother 52: 282–286. doi: 10.1093/jac/dkg302 PMID: 12865400
11. WHO (1985) The Rational Use of Drugs—Report of the Conference of Experts, Nairobi 25–29 November 1985
12. WHO (2010) Medicines: rational use of medicines.
13. Mathew B, Rahul S, S K, H D (2013) Assessment of Drug Prescribing Practices Using WHO Prescribing Indicators in a Private Tertiary Care Teaching Hospital. IRJIPS 1.
14. Ceyhan M, Yildirim I, Ecevit C, Aydogan A, Ornek A, Salman N, et al. (2010) Inappropriate antimicrobial use in Turkish pediatric hospitals: a multicenter point prevalence survey. Int J Infect Dis 14: e55–61. doi: 10.1016/j.ijid.2009.03.013 PMID: 19487149
15. Raveh D, Levy Y, Schlesinger Y, Greenberg A, Rudensky B, Yinnon AM (2001) Longitudinal surveillance of antibiotic use in the hospital. Qm 94: 141–152. PMID: 11259689
16. Nwolisa CE, Erinagha EU, Ofotela SI (2006) Prescribing practices of doctors attending to under fives in a children’s outpatient clinic in Owerri, Nigeria. J Trop Pediatr 52: 197–200. doi: 10.1093/tropej/fmi095 PMID: 16339786
17. Schollenberg E, Albirton WL (1980) Antibiotic misuse in a pediatric teaching hospital. Can Med Assoc J 122: 49–52. PMID: 7363195
18. MSH Rational Drug Use: Prescribing, Dispensing, Counseling and Adherence in ART Programs
19. Menassie K (2004) Cross-sectional survey of Drug use in Health facilities of Harari Region. Addis Ababa: Addis Ababa.
20. Desta Z, Abula T, Beyene L, Fantahun M, Yohannes AG, Ayalew S (1997) Assessment of rational drug use and prescribing in primary health care facilities in north west Ethiopia. East African Med J 74: 758–763. PMID: 9557418
21. Wubante Y (2005) Baseline survey in drug prescribing indicators for outpatients in Jimma University specialized Hospital, South West Ethiopia Ethiopian Journal of Health Sciences 15: 147–156.
22. Ansam S, Ghada A, Laila A, Waleed S, Rowa A, Nidal J (2006) Pattern of parenteral antimicrobial prescription among pediatric patients in Al-Watani Government Hospital in Palestina. An-Najah Univ J Res 20: 191–206.
23. Minyahil A W, Sultan S, Netsanet W, Haftay B (2013) Retrospective Study of the Pattern of Antibiotic Use in Hawassa University Referral Hospital Pediatric Ward, Southern Ethiopia. Journal of Applied Pharmaceutical Science 3: 93–98.
24. MoH, WHO (2003) Baseline Assessment of the Pharmaceutical Sector in Ethiopia. Addis Ababa: Ethiopian Ministry of Health.
25. Bozic B, Bajcetic M (2015) Use of antibiotics in paediatric primary care settings in Serbia. Archives of Disease in Childhood 100: 966–969. doi: 10.1136/archdischild-2015-308274 PMID: 25994002
26. Paruk F, Richards G, Scribante J, Bhagwanjee S, Mer M, Perrie H (2012) Antibiotic prescription practices and their relationship to outcome in South Africa: findings of the prevalence of infection in South African intensive care units (PISA) study. S Afr Med J 102: 613–616. PMID: 22748439
27. Mukonzo JK, Namuwenge PM, Okure G, Mwesige B, Namusisi OK, Mukanga D (2013) Over-the-counter suboptimal dispensing of antibiotics in Uganda. J Multidiscip Healthc 6: 303–310. doi: 10.2147/ JMDH.S49075 PMID: 23990728
28. Majed A-A, Muna K, Ruba A-Ra (2015) Evaluation of antibiotic’s use among children during hospitalization. European Scientific Journal 11: 253–258.
29. Cars O, Molstad S, Melander A (2001) Variation in antibiotic use in the European Union. Lancet 357: 1851–1853. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(00)04972-2 PMID: 11410197
30. Goossens H, Ferech M, Vander Stichele R, Elseviers M (2005) Outpatient antibiotic use in Europe and association with resistance: a cross-national database study. Lancet 365: 579–587. doi: 10.1016/ S0140-6736(05)17907-0 PMID: 15708101
31. Palikhe N (2004) Prescribing pattern of antibiotics in paediatric hospital of Kathmandu valley. Kathmandu Univ Med J (KUMJ) 2: 6–12.
32. Isah A, Ross-Degnan D, Quick J, Laing R, Mabadeje A (2004) The development of standard values for the WHO drug use prescribing indicators. University of Benin, Nigeria; WHO.
33. AHO, WHO (2016) African Health Observatory and WHO: Analytical summary- Health workforce: Ethiopia. WHO.
34. FDRE (2010) Health Sector Development Program IV 2010/11–2014/15 Addis Ababa: Ministry of Health.