Baseline Properties of the Sport Concussion Assessment Tool 3 (SCAT3) in Iranian Professional League Football Players

Bahar Hassanmirzaei,1,2,3,* Zohreh Haratian,2 Navid Moghadam,1 and Amir Ashraf-Ganjouei4

1Sports Medicine Research Center, Neuroscience Institute, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran
2Iran Football Medical Assessment and Rehabilitation Center (IFMARC), Tehran, Iran
3Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran
4Students’ Scientific Research Center, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran

*Corresponding author: Bahar Hassanmirzaei, MD, Iran Football Medical Assessment and Rehabilitation Center, Tehran, Iran. Tel/Fax: +98-214-473-8641, E-mail: bahariane@yahoo.com

Received 2017 February 06; Revised 2017 July 14; Accepted 2017 September 10.

Abstract

Background: SCAT3 is a standardized tool, which can evaluate injured athletes for concussion and provide us with the necessary baseline data. Like any other sport, playing football (soccer) carries a high risk of injury. Thus, this study investigated the baseline properties of SCAT3 in Iranian Professional League football players and evaluated the correlation between different factors and a history of concussion.

Methods: All of the players of 16 different teams who would be participating in the 2016 - 2017 Iranian Professional League (n = 368), were enrolled in this study. Completing SCAT3 was part of the pre-competition Medical assessment. Beside presenting the descriptive data, different variables were analyzes to evaluate the correlation with a "prior history of concussion", in order to find probable risk factors for head injuries.

Results: Forty-one players have had a history of concussion in the previous year and data analysis among the different categories showed that having a history of concussion bore a significant correlation with number of symptoms and symptom severity (P values: 0.023 and 0.041, respectively).

Conclusions: Athletes with a history of concussion reported an increased number of symptoms and a higher severity score, but other SCAT3 properties such as total SAC scores and M-BESS were not affected by a history of concussion. This study aids clinicians in evaluating athletes suffering injuries to the head during football matches.

Keywords: Head Trauma, Sports, Football
Hassamirzae B et al.

(9). Sport concussion assessment tool 5th edition (SCAT5), which is the most recent revision of a sport concussion evaluation tool was also published recently, although it was not available at the time we gathered our data (10). SCAT3 was published in 2013 and is a standardized tool that has been recognized and approved by FIFA and several other large international sporting federations (11). SCAT3 is comprised of 22 questions for symptom evaluation. The evaluation is followed by a cognitive evaluation of the patient as well as a complete neck, balance and coordination examination (11).

Since no previous studies have assessed concussion in adult professional football players, the purpose of this study was to investigate the baseline properties of SCAT3 in Iranian Professional League football players. There are four articles published, evaluating baseline normative values but to the best of our knowledge, no study has evaluated the correlation between different factors and a history of concussion on elite level athletes (7, 12-14). For this reason, we also aimed to analyze different factors that might be affected by a history of concussion.

2. Methods

All of the players of 16 different teams, who would be participating in the 2016 - 2017 Iran Professional League, were enrolled in this study. Since completing SCAT3 was part of the pre-competition Medical assessment (PCMA), all 368 players participated and no one was excluded. All participants were healthy male football players with an average age of 24.9. Minimum and maximum ages were 17 and 40, respectively. Other descriptive variables, which are assessed in the SCAT3 form, are presented in Table 1. The examinations were carried out for all players by the same physician and lasted from May 2016 to July 2016. Testing was done from 9 a.m. to 12 a.m. in the same room, and the players were all examined after having consumed the same breakfast meal. The importance of the SCAT3 was explained to each participant separately, and ethical consent was obtained. It was clarified that the test results would be given to the team physician and would aid diagnosis in the event of concussion. All examinations and SCAT3 tests were done in Persian language and under the supervision of the Iran football Medical assessment and rehabilitation center (IF-MARC).

SCAT3 is a standardized tool for assessing concussion in athletes aged 13 or more. It is composed of several subsections including symptom and cognitive evaluation, and examination of the neck, balance and coordination. Symptom evaluation is comprised of 22 questions that athletes answered based on how they felt at the time of the interview. Each symptom was rated as non-existent (0), mild (1 - 2), moderate (three-4) or severe (5 - 6). The total number of symptoms (with a maximum of 22) and their severity (with a maximum of 132) was then calculated. Standardized assessment of concussion (SAC) consisted of orientation scores (0 - 5), immediate memory scores (0 - 15), concentration scores (0 - 5) and delayed recall score (0 - 5). In order to examine balance, the number of errors in single leg, double leg and tandem stance for 20 seconds were calculated. The modified balance error scoring system (MBESS) is calculated by adding one error point for each error during these three 20-second tests. Tandem gait testing time was also recorded. The coordination score was based on athletes’ ability to repeat the five finger-to-nose action correctly in less than 4 seconds. The delayed recall test was carried out after completion of the balance and coordination examination. Participants’ descriptive data and SCAT3 measures/variables are shown in Tables 1 and 2.

Besides presenting the descriptive data, we analyzed different variables with a “prior history of concussion” in

| Variable Name                          | Values | N | Frequency, % |
|----------------------------------------|--------|---|--------------|
| Post of the player                     | Defender | 119 | 32.3         |
|                                        | Goalkeeper | 44 | 12.0         |
|                                        | Midfielder | 141 | 38.3         |
|                                        | Striker | 64 | 17.4         |
| Dominant leg                           | Left | 46 | 12.5         |
|                                        | Right | 322 | 87.5         |
| History of concussion in the last year | Positive | 41 | 11.4         |
|                                        | Negative | 320 | 88.6         |
| Imaging after concussion               | Yes | 20 | 56.8         |
|                                        | No | 21 | 51.2         |
| Hyperactivity                          | Positive | 5 | 1.4          |
|                                        | Negative | 356 | 98.6        |
| Migraine                               | Positive | 9 | 2.5          |
|                                        | Negative | 352 | 97.5      |
| History of psychological problem       | Yes | 355 | 96.3         |
|                                        | No | 6 | 1.7          |
| Family history of hyperactivity, migraine or any psychological problems | Positive | 24 | 6.7          |
|                                        | Negative | 336 | 93.3        |
| Neck examination                       | Normal | 362 | 97.6         |
|                                        | Abnormal | 6 | 2.4          |
| Coordination test result               | Normal | 367 | 100.0       |
|                                        | Abnormal | 0 | 0.0          |

*N, sample size.
Table 2. Means and Standard Deviations for SCAT3 Scores

| Test                  | All Players | Without History of Concussion | With History of Concussion |
|-----------------------|-------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------|
|                       | N  | M   | SD  | N  | M   | SD  | n  | M   | SD  |
| Symptom severity      | 359 | 2.66 | 5.29 | 309 | 2.48 | 5.06 | 40  | 4.05 | 6.74 |
| Symptom score         | 359 | 1.80 | 2.32 | 309 | 1.35 | 2.32 | 40  | 1.80 | 2.23 |
| SAC total score       | 356 | 24.54 | 3.07 | 305 | 24.51 | 3.07 | 41  | 24.81 | 2.79 |
| Orientation           | 360 | 4.45 | 0.74 | 309 | 4.44 | 0.75 | 41  | 4.30 | 0.84 |
| Immediate memory      | 357 | 13.87 | 1.50 | 308 | 13.83 | 1.53 | 40  | 14.07 | 1.18 |
| Concentration         | 359 | 3.85 | 1.10 | 309 | 3.07 | 1.18 | 40  | 3.10 | 1.18 |
| Delayed recall        | 356 | 3.04 | 1.52 | 305 | 3.06 | 1.49 | 40  | 2.83 | 1.76 |
| M-BESS                | 367 | 2.25 | 2.24 | 309 | 2.23 | 2.48 | 40  | 2.35 | 2.75 |
| Single leg stance     | 367 | 1.75 | 1.66 | 309 | 1.75 | 1.74 | 41  | 1.80 | 2.06 |
| Double leg stance     | 367 | 0.02 | 0.09 | 309 | 0.02 | 0.21 | 40  | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Tandem stance         | 367 | 0.48 | 0.95 | 309 | 0.46 | 0.94 | 40  | 0.65 | 1.02 |
| Tandem gait time, s   | 366 | 9.19 | 2.00 | 309 | 9.11 | 1.78 | 41  | 9.58 | 3.20 |

Abbreviations: M, Mean; SD, Standard Deviation.

3. Results

Forty-one players out of 368 were found to have had a history of concussion in the previous year. Data analysis among the different categories showed that having a history of concussion bore a significant association with number of symptoms and symptom severity scores by P values of 0.023 and 0.041, respectively (Table 3). Total SAC and M-BESS scores were not significantly associated with past concussions. It is worthy of note that with a P value of 0.09, player’s post is not correlated with history of concussion. Further analysis on the measured numerical variables showed that the number of symptoms and symptom severity are also correlated with both “player’s total concussions” and “the time since player’s last concussion” (Table 4).

4. Discussion

Our study described the baseline properties of the SCAT3 in Iranian football players participating in the 2016 - 2017 Professional League. Further analysis showed that symptoms and their severity might be the most significant factors that are correlated with previous concussions. The associations between concussion history and symptoms is correlational, so it is unclear if the symptoms are a result of the prior concussions versus reflecting a risk factor for the occurrence of concussion. At the baseline point, other factors assessed by SCAT3 are less likely to be affected. This data may aid clinicians in evaluating athletes suffering injuries to the head during football matches.

In 2015, Zimmer et al. reported normative values of major SCAT2 and SCAT3 components for a college athlete population, participating in 14 different sports. During the preseason, SCAT2 was completed for 477 college athletes (332 male, 145 female) and these data were analyzed for differences in scores based on sex, sport type and other factors. The average number of positive symptoms and SAC were 1.75 and 27.17 with a standard deviation (SD) of 3.00 and 2.01, respectively. However, our study showed that professional football players have a mean symptom score of 1.41 with an SD of 2.32, as well as a total SAC score of 24.54 with an SD of 3.07.
Chin et al. studied the reliability and validity of SCAT3 in high school and collegiate athletes. They evaluated 2018 athletes to measure their preseason baseline scores, 166 of whom were injured and then re-evaluated. Different factors such as sex, level of competition, learning disability and estimated verbal intellectual ability seemed to affect baseline scores in more than one SCAT3 component. Further analysis showed that symptom scores were significantly higher in those who had suffered a head injury at 24-hour and 8-day assessment, but non-significant at day 15. Effect size for SAC and M-BESS was small to moderate at 24-hour and 8-day assessment, but non-significant at day 15. Our study also showed that a history of head injury during the past year does not affect either SAC or M-BESS. Total SAC scores and M-BESS were not affected by a history of concussion. This study was carried out preseason, future studies may help provide data for players during the game season.

Another study was conducted by Gorman et al., for assessing SCAT3 in non-head-injured and head-injured athletes competing in an international youth football tournament (18). They studied SCAT3 components in three groups of players including non-injured (NI), injured (but not head injured) (I), and head injured (HI) players. Results showed that head injury leads to an increase in both symptoms and severity scores with a P value of less than 0.01. However, no significant change was observed in total SAC score between HI and the other two groups. As mentioned before, we obtained similar results when comparing players with and without a history of concussion. Moreover, data analysis showed that symptoms and severity scores were also correlated with a player’s total number of previous concussions and the amount of time that had passed since the player’s last concussion (Table 4).

To the best of our knowledge, this was the first time that preseason baseline properties of SCAT3 in professional and elite adult football players were reported. These baseline data can be used as normative values for elite football players to identify those players with outlier scores. We also found that athletes with a history of concussion reported an increased number of symptoms and a higher severity score. Total SAC scores and M-BESS were not affected by a history of concussion. This study was carried out preseason, future studies may help provide data for players during the game season.

| Test                      | Total of Number of Player’s Concussions | player’s Last Concussion - Month |
|---------------------------|----------------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Symptom score             | Correlation coefficient                | P values                        |
|                           | 0.140*                                 | 0.013*                          |
|                           | 0.008                                  | 0.023                           |
| Symptom severity          | Correlation coefficient                | P values                        |
|                           | 0.140*                                 | 0.120*                          |
|                           | 0.008                                  | 0.023                           |
| SAC                       | Correlation coefficient                | P values                        |
|                           | -0.004                                 | 0.011                           |
|                           | 0.933                                  | 0.841                           |
| M-BESS                    | Correlation coefficient                | P values                        |
|                           | -0.043                                 | -0.057                          |
|                           | 0.413                                  | 0.286                           |

*Shows a significant correlation.

Table 4. Major SCAT3 Scores Correlation with Other Numerical Values

References

1. Marar M, McIlvain NM, Fields SK, Comstock RD. Epidemiology of concussions among United States high school athletes in 20 sports. Am J Sports Med. 2012;40(4):747-55. doi: 10.1182/jbasic.2010.07.023. [PubMed: 21492537].

2. Eirale C, Faroog A, Smiley FA, Tol JL, Chalabi H. Epidemiology of football injuries in Asia: a prospective study in Qatar. J Sci Med Sport. 2013;16(2):113-7. doi: 10.1016/j.jsams.2012.07.001. [PubMed: 22858446].

3. Decq P, Gault N, Blanluet M, Kerdraon T, Berkual M, EHelou A, et al. Long-term consequences of recurrent sports concussion. Acta Neurol (Wien). 2016;138(2):289-300. doi: 10.1007/s00701-015-2881-4. [PubMed: 2871286].

4. Cantu RC. World Cup soccer; a major league soccer superstar’s career-ending injury; concussion; and World Neurosurgery: a common thread. World Neurosurg. 2010;74(2-3):224-5. doi: 10.1016/j.wneu.2010.07.023. [PubMed: 21492537].

5. Begasse de Bhaem O, Barr WB, Balcer LJ, Galetta SL, Minen MT. Post-traumatic headache: the use of the sport concussion assessment tool (SCAT-3) as a predictor of post-concussion recovery. J Headache Pain. 2017;18(1):60. doi: 10.1186/s10194-017-0767-5. [PubMed: 28505040].

6. Covassin T, Elbin R, Kontos A, Larson E. Investigating baseline neurocognitive performance between male and female athletes with a history of multiple concussions. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry. 2010;81(6):597-601. doi: 10.1136/jnnp.2009.197397. [PubMed: 20952268].

7. Hanninen T, Tuominen M, Parkkari J, Vartiainen M, Ohman J, Iverson GL, et al. Sport concussion assessment tool - 3rd edition - normative reference values for professional ice hockey players. J Sci Med Sport. 2016;19(8):636-41. doi: 10.1016/j.jsams.2015.08.005. [PubMed: 28381879].

8. McCrory P, Johnston K, Meeuwisse W, Aubry M, Cantu R, Dvorak J, et al. Summary and agreement statement of the 2nd international
9. McCrory P, Meeuwisse W, Johnston K, Dvorak J, Aubry M, Molloy M, et al. Consensus statement on concussion in sport - the Third International Conference on Concussion in Sport held in Zurich, November 2008. Phys Sportsmed. 2009;37(2):341–59. doi: 10.3810/psm.2009.08.1721. [PubMed: 20048521].

10. Echemendia RJ, Meeuwisse W, McCrory P, Davis GA, Putukian M, Leddy J, et al. The Sport Concussion Assessment Tool 5th Edition (SCAT5). Br J Sport Med. 2017.

11. McCrory P, Meeuwisse W, Aubry M, Cantu B, Dvorak J, Echemendia RJ, et al. Consensus statement on concussion in sport-the 4th International Conference on Concussion in Sport held in Zurich, November 2012. Clin J Sport Med. 2013;23(2):89–117. doi: 10.1097/JSM.0b013e31828b67cf. [PubMed: 23479784].

12. Brooks MA, Snedden TR, Mixis B, Hetzel S, McGuine TA. Establishing Baseline Normative Values for the Child Sport Concussion Assessment Tool. JAMA Pediatr. 2017;171(7):670–7. doi: 10.1001/jamapediatrics.2017.0592. [PubMed: 28492862].

13. Nelson LD, Loman MM, LaRoche AA, Furger RE, McCrea MA. Baseline Performance and Psychometric Properties of the Child Sport Concussion Assessment Tool 3 (Child-SCAT3) in 5- to 13-year-old Athletes. Clin J Sport Med. 2017;27(4):381–7. doi: 10.1097/JSM.0000000000000369. [PubMed: 27428682].

14. Snedden TR, Brooks MA, Hetzel S, McGuine T. Normative values of the sport concussion assessment tool 3 (SCAT3) in high school athletes. Clin J Sport Med. 2016.

15. Lynall RC, Mauntel TC, Padua DA, Mihalik JP. Acute Lower Extremity Injury Rates Increase after Concussion in College Athletes. Med Sci Sports Exerc. 2015;47(12):2487–92. doi: 10.1249/MSS.0000000000000716. [PubMed: 26057941].

16. Brooks MA, Peterson K, Biese K, Sanfilippo J, Heiderscheit BC, Bell DR. Concussion Increases Odds of Sustaining a Lower Extremity Musculoskeletal Injury After Return to Play Among Collegiate Athletes. Am J Sports Med. 2016;44(3):742–7. doi: 10.1177/0363546515622387. [PubMed: 26780901].

17. Gilbert FC, Burdette GT, Joyner AB, Llewellyn TA, Buckley TA. Association Between Concussion and Lower Extremity Injuries in Collegiate Athletes. Sports Health. 2016;8(6):561–7. doi: 10.1177/1941738116666509. [PubMed: 27587598].

18. Gorman M, Hecht S, Samborski A, Lunos S, Elias S, Stovitz SD. SCAT3 assessment of non-head injured and head injured athletes competing in a large international youth soccer tournament. Appl Neuropsychol Child. 2016;1:5.