Outdoor Closed System of Algal Mass Culture: In Sight of Comparison on Vertical and Horizontal Photobioreactor for Cultivating the *Spirulina* sp.

Hilda Farida¹), Puspita Sari Harahap¹), Rifana Sobari¹), Rudyanto Gunawan¹), Delicia Yunita Rahman²), and Dwi Susilaningsih²)

¹) PT. BaratJaya Sentosa Perkasa
Jl. Raya Joglo Ruko Intercon Megah BI W-4/25, Kembangan, Jakarta 11640, Indonesia
Tel./Fax.: (021) 5868485/(021)5868482
²) Research Center for Biotechnology, Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI)
Jl. Raya Bogor, KM. 46 Cibinong, Bogor 16911, Indonesia
Tel/Fax. +62-21-8754587

*) Corresponding author: hilda050512@gmail.com

(Received: May 28, 2019 Accepted: July 19, 2019)

Abstract

*Spirulina* are multicellular and filamentous blue-green algae that has gained considerable popularity in the health food industry and increasingly as a protein and vitamin supplement to aquaculture diets. The challenge for economically and fulfill the requirement for food and medical purposes has create many ways for mass - growth production, that possibly cultivated in the open - system (such as a raceway pond) or closed - system photobioreactors (such as tubular, bubble-column, airlift, flat-panel, and vertical). The cultivation of the *Spirulina* on the vertical and horizontal photobioreactor has been studied. The photobioreactor, namely BJVP and BJHP, has a design to be less energy consumption using the air bubbling or circular paddle. The observation was conducted in a whole year with parameters of rainfall, temperature, light intensity, pH, and salinity. Results showed that cultivation of *Spirulina* on the vertical photobioreactor growth faster than the horizontal photobioreactor systems and the yield of biomass was about 0.94 gDW/L. Average of temperature ranges of BJHP were 31.0°C - 35.5°C, salinities were 35 per mil level, pH were 8.55 - 10.86, and light intensity were 427 - 2001 µmol photon s⁻¹ m⁻². Whereas the BJVP has averages temperature range of 31.4°C - 33.9°C, salinity 33 - 35 per mil level, pH 8.46 - 10.75, and light intensity 532 - 2062 µmol photon s⁻¹ m⁻². The proximate analyses of biomass from BJVP cultivation shows has tendency higher protein content compared to BJHP. The optimization of both reactors has continuing evaluated in order to get the optimum parameters required for economically *Spirulina* cultivation systems.

Keywords: *Spirulina*, BJVP, BJHP, outdoor mass cultivating system, photobioreactor

How to Cite This Article: Farida, H., Harahap, P.S., Sobari, R., Gunawan, R., Rahman, D.Y., and Susilaningsih, D. (2019). Outdoor Closed System of Algal Mass Culture: In Sight of Comparison on Vertical and Horizontal Photobioreactor for Cultivating the *Spirulina* sp., *Reaktor*, 19(2), 54-61, http://dx.doi.org/10.14710/reaktor.19.02.54-61.
INTRODUCTION

Spirulina are multicellular and filamentous blue-green algae which grow under high salinity, pH and temperature conditions. The cell length is about 50 to 500 µm and can form colonies. It is forming populations in freshwater and brackish lakes and some marine environment, mainly alkaline-saline lakes (Vonshak, 1997). From the biotechnological viewpoint, Spirulina is one of the most important cyanobacteria because it is able to produce high concentrations of protein (up to 70%) inside its cells, antioxidant pigments (chlorophyll a, phycocyanin, phycobiliproteins, and carotenoids), fatty acids (γ-linolenic acid/GLA), essential amino acids, minerals, vitamins (especially B12), and polysaccharides (Belay et al., 1993). Nowadays, Spirulina is cultivated in large areas and commercial that has gained considerable popularity in the health food industry, human food supplements, animal feed, and pharmaceuticals (Madkour et al., 2012). Moreover, this microalgae has been successfully employed in integrated systems for wastewater treatment (Kosaric et al., 1974), recovered and re-utilised (Vonshak et al., 1982), also as absorbent material for heavy metals (Solisio et al., 2006). Spirulina is one of the prime candidates for the controlled ecological life support system (CELSS) because it proliferates with a high ratio of edible to non-edible biomass, contain many nutrients, and have gas exchange characteristics compatible with human body standard requirements (Minoo & Bernhard, 1991).

The cultivation systems of microalgae can be done in an open system (lakes, ponds) and in a controlled closed system called photobioreactors (PBR). The merits of open system are relatively economical, easy to clean up after cultivation, suitable for mass cultivation of algae, although has dismerit parts are lack in control of culture conditions, difficulty in growing algal cultures for long periods, less productivity, occupy large land and water sources, limited to few strains of algae, and easily get contamination. For overcoming the obstacles on open reactors some scientists and algal industries propose controllable closed reactors. It is suggested that closed photobioreactors havemany benefits such as better control of the cultivation conditions than open systems, higher biomass productivities and contamination can be easily prevented (Ciferri, 1983).

The design and development of photobioreactors for maximum production of algae are very fundamental. Major environmental factors for high productivity of Spirulina biomass that should be consider for designing the photobioreactors are: luminosity (photo-period 12/12, 40 Kluxes), temperature (30°C), inoculation size, stirring speed, dissolved solids (10 - 60 g/liter), pH (8.5 - 10.5), water quality, macro and micronutrient presence (Ugwu et al., 2007). Furthermore, other factors such as design, cost-effectiveness of the bioreactor, purity of the algae produced, user-friendly, low maintenance, and space convenience need to be optimized. Several bioreactor types which are used for growing cyanobacteria including Spirulina are bubble column photobioreactor, airlift photobioreactor, flat panel bioreactor, horizontal tubular photobioreactor, and stirred tank photobioreactor. These bioreactors have their own advantages and disadvantages (Singh & Sharma, 2012). Biomass growth in a PBR is a complex process, which is the result of multiple effects such as photosynthetic light capture, light attenuation of the suspension and reactor hydro-dynamics. In the case of non-limiting nutrient conditions, light is the most relevant factor for autotrophic growth. Light attenuation could strongly influence the photosynthetic biomass productivity (Sforza et al., 2014).

We have study on open and close reactors for algal biomass production in outdoor condition. In this research is focusing on the utilization of a closed reactor for effective growth of Spirulina in order to compare between vertical or horizontal reactors. The main purpose is to get the fast-growing the algae with high-density cells and less contaminated condition and edible.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Organism and Culture Medium

An axenic strain of the cyanobacteria Spirulina was cultured in modified Zarrouk’s medium (Zarrouk, 1966), containing per liter 2.5 g NaNO₃, 1 g Na₂SO₄, 0.2 g MgSO₄·7H₂O, 0.04 g CaCl₂·2H₂O, 0.01 g FeSO₄·7H₂O, 0.08 g Na₂EDTA, 0.5 g K₂HPO₄, 16.8 g NaHCO₃, 1 ml of trace solution A5. One liter of trace solution A5 contained 2.86 g H₃BO₃, 1.81 g MnCl₂·4H₂O, 0.222 g ZnSO₄·7H₂O, 0.075 g CuSO₄·5H₂O and 0.0818 g Na₂MoO₄·2H₂O. All nutrients were dissolved in distilled water and sterilized in an autoclave at a temperature of 121°C for 15 minutes before use. Spirulina was isolated at Semarang Port, Central Java, Indonesia (2005) and therefore maintained at Research Center for Biotechnology, Indonesian Institute of Sciences.

Cultivations in vertical photobioreactor (BJVP)

The material for BJVP was molding acrylic tubes and designed to stand on the compact rack vertically with a slight inclination and placed on two parallel planes so that they were not superimposed each other and could feel the same light intensity (Figure 1).

The culture was continuously mixed by aeration system from the bottom of the reactor with an air pump, blowing air into a vertical pipe used as a riser. It is made up of vertical tubing that is naturally transparent to allow the penetration of light.

Sparger is attached at the bottom of the reactor which converts the sparged gas into tiny bubbles. Sparging with gas mixture provides overall mixing, mass transfer of CO₂ and also removes O₂ produced during photosynthesis (Sforza et al., 2014). An 8 liter
Outdoor Closed System of Algal Mass Culture…

Figure 1. Design of vertical photobioreactor (BJVP)

of culture is used as stock, and it will be added to 80 liter of media, then it is cultivated for seven days.

Cultivations in horizontal photobioreactor (BJHP)

Specific materials of mix polyurethane, plastic and acrylic were molding for making the knock-down horizontal reactors. Horizontal tubular reactors are placed horizontally, giving the design of a parallel set of tubes and loop shape (Figure 2). This mechanism gives advantage in outdoor culture for their orientation towards sunlight resulting in high light conversion efficiency. Propeller set up with speed 5 rpm for mixing microalgae. A 100 liter of culture is used as stock, and it will be added to 1000 liter of media, then it is cultivated for 7 days.

An Observation on Biomass Production

Quality control of the cultures

*Spirulina* biomass productivity was determined by dry weight of cells measurement and in triplicate culture samples (100 ml each). The biomass productivity was monitored every day. The filtered cells were washed with distilled water and dried at 50°C into a constant mass. The pH and temperature were measured using a pH meter Horiba Navi D-55S. The light intensity measurements were done using a Fisher Scientific Light Meter 0666263, and the salinity was measured using a refractometer (Atago ATC-S/Mill-E). Optical density was measured by UV-VIS spectrophotometer (Shimadzu, UV-1700) at 680 nm.

Protein determination

Proteins were determined with the Bradford protein assay (Bradford, 1976) that measured by spectrophotometric at 595 nm. Bovine serum albumin (BSA) was used as the standard protein for the calibration curve. Total proteins were expressed in mg of protein per ml of a culture. Additionally, total protein concentration was also determined by a modified method of Bradford in the centrifugation tests with BSA as standard.

Lipid determination

The wet biomass of *Spirulina* sp. from culture volume 200 ml were extracted by modified Bligh and Dyer method (Bligh & Dryer, 1959). The extraction of microalga biomass was use mixed solven of methanol : chloroform (1:1). After vigorously vortex the biomass for 30 second, and than additional water on sample, centrifuge sample 2000 rpm 10 minutes. Biomass with the solven resulting three layer of organic, aqueous layers and settling biomass containing the water. The aqueous (contain chloroform) layer were collected and evaporated to dryness, resulting the crude oil (lipid). Repeated the method until the biomass turn white. Gravimetrically the dry lipid was storage.

Figure 2. Design of horizontal photobioreactor (BJHP)
RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Growth and properties of Spirulina biomass

Biomass productivity

Growth duration for cultivating Spirulina is set on seven (7) days cycles. Growth rate that observing by cells density of Spirulina was mirroring the biomass productivity. The algal biomasses production on the each photobioreactors are shown in Figure 1. In general the growth pattern of Spirulina follows usual growth pattern, which are starting from lag phase and following by exponential phase. After 7 days cultivation, the cells are harvested by simply process of filtration. At the beginning of the cultivation period, algal growth rate was slow, because most of energy resources seems to be allocated for adaptation to the environment condition. However, after 3 days of inoculation, the algae cells began to replicate faster. The results of observation on vertical photobioreactor showed the biomass rate accelerating from 0.14 g (dry weight) L\(^{-1}\) to 0.94 g (dry weight) L\(^{-1}\) [1-7 days cultivation]. On the other hand, cultivation on horizontal photobioreactor resulting the biomass production from 0.12 g (dry weight) L\(^{-1}\) to 0.62 g (dry weight) L\(^{-1}\) [1-7 days cultivation]. It is suggested that cultivation on the vertical photobioreactor have biomass production higher than cultivation on the horizontal photobioreactor.

The biomass productivity of the helical tubular photobioreactor in semicontinuous basis is higher than biomass productivity obtained in batch basis. The maximum productivity value was 0.40 g L\(^{-1}\) d\(^{-1}\) (8.52 g reactor\(^{-1}\) d\(^{-1}\) or 6.45 g m\(^{-2}\) d\(^{-1}\)) using a dilution of 1 : 5 and a dilution rate \(D = 0.0078\) h\(^{-1}\) (Travieso et al., 2001). Oncel and Sukan (2014) compared an internal loop airlift and bubble column photobioreactors with respect to their performances during cultivation of Arthrospira platensis (S. platensis). It was observed that a higher dry biomass weight and chlorophyll-a concentration was obtained in the airlift photobioreactors, yielding a maximum growth rate of 0.45 day\(^{-1}\), while a maximum growth rate of 0.33 day\(^{-1}\) was reached in the bubble column PBR.

Protein and Lipid Content

Spirulina has high quality protein content (59 - 65 %), which is more than other commonly used plant sources such as dry soybeans (35 %), peanuts (25 %) or grains (8 - 10 %) (Habib et al., 2008), but have a low lipid content (6 - 13%). The protein content of Spirulina appears to be high also when compared with that of unicellular algae and other cyanobacteria (Vonshak, 1997). Spirulina is not rich in lipids (6 - 13%), it has relatively high cell growth rate with easy process control and rapid biomass recovery due to the filamentous cell structure (Ciferri, 1983).

BJHP and BJVP were 34.61% and 40.49%, respectively, while lipid productivity was 20.45% and 18.66%, respectively (Figure 4). Lipid content of Spirulina in this study is higher than the other study, this is because the extraction method used. Reactors BJVP thed to improve the cultivation with higher protein content, and lower lipid content compares to BJHP.

Figure 3. Growth diagram of Spirulina during cultivation period
Torzillo et al. (1986) reported that no significant differences in the protein content between the biomass grown in tubular photobioreactors and open ponds were found (average 50%). Another study reported that *S. platensis* cultivated in bubble column photobioreactor had the highest crude protein content of the biomass obtained was 68.1% (Chang et al., 2013).

Lipid production of microalgae *S. platensis* cultured in tubular and panel photobioreactor and pond in June and September were compared. The highest lipid amounts were obtained as 7.66% and 7.44% in the tubular photobioreactor (Azgin et al., 2014).

**Various condition of environmental factors**

**pH**

pH is an essential role in the bioreactor system and as health growth indicator of *Spirulina*. The concentration of hydrogen ions or proton (H⁺) in the cell fluid and protoplasm vital for the physiological process. Figure 5 depicting the fluctuation of pH change in the medium. pH fluctuation at the BJHP ranging from 8.55 - 10.86, while the BJVP pH ranging from 8.46 - 10.75. It is suggested pH level of the medium increase during the period of photosynthesis as a consequence of nutrient uptake, such as bicarbonate and nitrate (Ai et al., 2008). In this case, the bicarbonate, NaHCO₃ was used to maintain pH at a high level for stabilizing *Spirulina* cultures. *Spirulina* is well known for cyanobacteria, which are requiring high-level pH and osmotic environment (Chen, 2011). The high level of pH in a culture media is related to the amount of bicarbonate in medium, which then can be used to produce CO₂ to run the photosynthesis process.

*S. platensis* is a typical alcalophytic organism that apparently has a high dependence of its growth rate on pH level. Optimal growth was observed at pH 9 to 10, and there was minimal growth at pH 7.0. At pH 11.5, a growth rate equivalent to 80% of the maximum was maintained (Belkin & Boussiba, 1991). Effect incompatibility of pH will make lysis cell and can change the growth of pigment (Hariyati, 2008).

**Temperature**

Temperature is one of the most important conditions for production and the growth of *Spirulina*. Under proper temperature conditions, the algae can grow rapidly. Basically, the increase in temperature will increase the metabolism and cell production of the microalgae. Figure 6 shows the change of the temperature of the culture medium. The average temperature of the cultures (midday) for BJHP was 31.0-35.5°C, while the average temperature was BJVP 30.5-33.9°C, respectively. Optimum temperatures are 30-35°C for *S. platensis*. The species can live at the 18°C minimum and 39°C maximum (Fox, 1996). Generally, all the temperatures measured were optimum for *S. platensis* culture.

The space and light requirements of microalgal farming implies that a commercial cultivation system will most likely be located outdoor and be exposed to a large range of day/night and seasonal temperature changes. Devising cost-effective and reliable temperature control mechanisms is
therefore a significant challenge in photobioreactor design.

![Figure 5. pH observation during cultivation period](image)

![Figure 6. Temperature observation during cultivation period](image)

It was demonstrated that, without temperature control, the temperature in a closed photobioreactor could reach a level 10 - 30°C higher than the ambient temperature (Wang et al., 2012).

**Light Intensity**

In order to enhance microalgal growth in photobioreactors, light penetration is one of the most important parameters to be addressed. The light intensity is a major factor that contributes to the growth of *Spirulina* sp. as all of the microalgae that accomplish the photosynthesis. Lack of light can lead to abnormality of the photosynthesis process that will affect the growth of *Spirulina* sp. Table 1 shows the light intensity performance on BJHP and BJVP during cultivation period.

The results of this study indicate that the light intensity at the BJHP range from 427 - 2001 µmol photon s⁻¹ m⁻², while the BJVP light intensity ranges between 532 - 2062 µmol photon s⁻¹ m⁻². *Spirulina* sp. resistant to sunlight intensity in the culture field scale that ranges 500 - 350,000 lux, with a maximum of 3 hours long lighting (Kabinawa, 2006).

**Table 1. Light intensity performance on BJHP and BJVP during cultivation period**

| Times (day) | BJHP     | BJVP     |
|-------------|----------|----------|
| 0           | 1455     | 823      |
| 1           | 1828     | 1874     |
| 2           | 1942     | 1946     |
| 3           | 2001     | 2062     |
| 4           | 1931     | 1998     |
| 5           | 1455     | 1508     |
| 6           | 1489     | 1661     |
| 7           | 427      | 532      |

**Salinity**

Since the *Spirulina* is derived from marine environment therefore the salinity level is important to be controlled. Salinity is one of the factors that affect aquatic organisms in maintaining osmotic pressure in the protoplasm with water as the environment. Table 2 shows the salinity performance on BJHP and BJVP during cultivation period. The salinity achieved in the BJHP and BJVP were 35 and 33 - 35 per mil level, respectively. *Spirulina* sp. is able to survive at salinity between 20 - 70 ppt (Richmond, 1986).

Salinity affects the water content contained in microalgae cells. When the media salinity is high (above the normal range) and can not be tolerated, the water in the microalgae cell will be absorbed out and it will make the cell died.

**Table 2. Salinity performance on BJHP and BJVP during cultivation period**

| Times (day) | BJHP | BJVP |
|-------------|------|------|
| 0           | 35   | 35   |
| 1           | 35   | 34   |
| 2           | 35   | 33   |
| 3           | 35   | 34   |
| 4           | 35   | 34   |
| 5           | 35   | 34   |
| 6           | 35   | 33   |
| 7           | 35   | 33   |

**CONCLUSIONS**

*Spirulina* is growing faster on the vertical photobioreactor compare to the horizontal photobioreactor systems with the yield of the biomass of approximately 0.94 gDW/L. The fluctuation of environmental factors in BJHP reactors during...
cultivation period were appearance on temperature level around 31.0°C to 35.5°C, salinities around 35 per mil level, pH around 8.55 to 10.86, and light intensity around 427 - 2001 μmol photon s-1 m-2. On the other hand, the condition of environmental factors in BJVP reactors has averages on the temperature range of 31.4°C to 33.9°C, salinity 33 to 35 per mil level, pH 8.46 to 10.75, and light intensity 532 - 2062 μmol photon s-1 m-2. Reactors BJVP tend to improve the cultivation with higher protein content compared to BJHP.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The works was supported by PT. BaratJaya Sentosa Perkasa Company, Indonesia and annual Indonesian Government Research Budget.

REFERENCES

Ai, W., Guo, S., Qin, L., Tang, Y., (2008). Development of a ground-based space micro-algae photo bioreactor, Adv in Space Res, 41, pp. 742-747.

Azgın, C., Işık, O., Uslu, L., Burcu Ak., (2014). A Comparison the Biomass of Productivity, Protein and Lipid Content of Spirulina platensis Cultured in the Pond and Photobioreactor, J Biol Environ Sci, 8(24), pp. 183-187.

Belay, A., Ota, Y., Miyakawa, K., and Shimamatsu, H., (1993). Current knowledge on potential health benefits of Spirulina, J of Appl Phyco, 5, pp. 235-241.

Belkin, S., Boussiba, S., (1991) Resistance of Spirulina platensis to ammonia at high pH values, Plant Cell Physiol, 32, pp. 953-958.

Bligh, J.M. & W. J. Dryer., (1959). A rapid method of total lipid extraction and purification, Can. J. Biochem. Physiol, 37, pp. 911-917.

Bradford MM., (1976). A rapid and sensitive method for the quantitation of microorganism quantities of protein in utilizing the principle of protein-dye binding, Anal Biochem, 72, pp. 248-254.

Chang Y, Wu Z, Bian L, Feng D, Leung DYC, (2013) Cultivation of Spirulina platensis for biomass production and nutrient removal from synthetic human urine, Appl Energy, 102, pp. 427-431.

Chen, Y.C., (2011). The effect of shifts in medium types on the growth and morphology of Spirulina photobioreactor: An integrated experimental and modeling approach, Chem Eng Res and Design, 92, pp. 1153-1162.

Singh R.N, Sharma S., (2012). Development of suitable photobioreactor for algae production, Renew and Sust Energ Rev, 16, pp. 2347-2353.

Solisio, C., Lodi, A., Torre, P., Converti, A., Borghi, M.D, (2006), Copper removal by pre-treated non-living biomass of Spirulina platensis, Bioresour Technol, 97, pp. 1756-1760.
Torzillo G, Pushparaj B, Bocci F, Balloni W, Materassi R, Florenzano G, (1986), Production of \textit{Spirulina} biomass in closed photobioreactors, \textit{Biomass}, 2, pp. 175-185.

Travieso L, Hall D.O., Rao K.K., Benitez F., Sanchez E, Borja R., (2001), A helical tubular photobioreactor producing \textit{Spirulina} in a semicontinuous mode, \textit{Int Biodeterioration & Biodegradation}, 47, pp. 151-155.

Ugwu, C.U., Aoyagi, H., Uchiyama, H., (2007), Photobioreactor for mass cultivation of algae, \textit{Bioresour Technol}, 99, pp. 4021-4028.

Vonshak A., Abeliovich S., Boussiba S., Arad A., Richmond., (1982), Production of \textit{Spirulina} biomass: effects of environmental factors and population density, \textit{Biomass}, 2, pp. 175-185.

Vonshak A., (1997), \textit{Spirulina platensis} (Arthospira): \textit{physiology, cell-biology and biotechnology}, London: Taylor and Francis, pp. 175-204.

Wang B, Lan CQ, Horsman M., (2012), Closed photobioreactors for production of microalgal biomasses, \textit{Biotechnol Adv}, 30, pp. 904-912.

Zarrouk C. Contribution à l’Étude d’Une Cyanophyceé., (1966), Influence de Divers Facteurs Physiques et Chimiques sur la Croissance et la Photooxythe’se de \textit{Spirulina maxima} Geitler, \textit{PhD Thesis}, Université´ de Paris, France.