Intrinsic accuracy in 3-dimensional photoemission band mapping

V. N. Strocov*
Experimentalphysik II, Universität Augsburg, D-86135 Augsburg, Germany
(November 20, 2018)

Fundamental principles of mapping 3-dimensional quasiparticle dispersions in the valence band using angle-resolved photoemission spectroscopy are discussed. Such mapping is intrinsically limited in accuracy owing to damping of the final states, resulting in equivalent broadening in the surface-perpendicular wavevector. Mechanisms of the intrinsic accuracy are discussed in depth based on a physically transparent picture involving interplay of the final- and initial-state spectral functions, and illustrated by photoemission simulations and experimental examples. Other interesting effects of 3-dimensional dispersions include ‘ghost’ photoemission peaks outside the Fermi surface and finite peak width at the Fermi level. Finally, optimization of the experiment on the intrinsic accuracy is discussed.

Keywords: Bandstructure; Photoemission; 3-dimensional effects; Final states; Intrinsic effects

I. INTRODUCTION: WHY INTRINSIC ACCURACY?

The quasiparticle bandstructure $E(k)$, which reflects the peaks of the spectral function $A(E,k)$ depending on energy and wavevector $k$, is the key property of the crystalline solids. Angle-resolved photoemission (PE) spectroscopy (for reviews see, e.g., [1,2]) is the main experimental method to map $E(k)$ with resolution in energy $E$ and, in principle, in the 3-dimensional $k$ (3D band mapping). This is based on conservation of $k$ in the process of photoexcitation from the occupied initial state to unoccupied final state in the bulk of the crystal. However, the PE experiment is inherently performed on the crystal terminated by the surface. By virtue of the remaining surface-parallel periodicity, the surface-parallel wavevector $k_\parallel$ is conserved in the whole system and can be determined from the surface-parallel vacuum wavevector $K_\parallel$ with the accuracy limited only by instrumental resolution. As the surface-parallel periodicity is however broken, the surface-perpendicular wavevector $k_\perp$ is not conserved in the whole system and can not be directly determined. Control over $k_\perp$ is therefore a fundamental problem of 3D band mapping.

The control over $k_\perp$ has two aspects. First, $k_\perp$ is distorted when the photoelectrons exit from the bulk of the solid into vacuum. As $k_\perp$ is conserved in the very photoexcitation process in the bulk, it can nevertheless be recovered if the $k_\perp$-dispersion of the final state $E^f(k_\perp)$ or that of the initial state $E^i(k_\perp)$ back in the bulk is known. Commonly an empirical free-electron-like approximation is used here for the final states, though the accuracy of this can often be insufficient. Nevertheless, the true quasiparticle $E^f(k_\perp)$ including the non-free-electron and self-energy effects in the final state can be determined using very-low-energy electron diffraction (VLEED) spectroscopy (see [3–5] and references therein) based on that the PE final states, as proved by the one-step theory of PE, are the time-reversed LEED states [6,7]. It is a common point of view that knowledge of the final-state $E(k)$ exhaust the whole problem of 3D band mapping. Indeed, variation of the final-state energy $E^f$ in the PE experiment (commonly achieved by variation of the photon energy $h\nu$) would through known $E^f(k_\perp)$ be translated into variations of $k_\perp$, and accurate 3D mapping of the occupied $E(k)$ would be performed.

There is another aspect however. Due to inelastic absorption and elastic reflection from the crystal potential the PE final state is intrinsically damped towards interior of the solid [6,7]. Such a confinement in the surface-perpendicular coordinate is equivalent, by the uncertainty principle, to certain intrinsic broadening in $k_\perp$. The PE signal via this final state is then formed by all initial states within the $k_\perp$-broadening interval, and the PE peak reflects an average of the quasiparticle $E^f(k_\perp)$ in the valence band. A difference of the measured averaged $k_\perp$-dispersion from the true $E^f(k_\perp)$ limits intrinsic accuracy of 3D band mapping. It is borne by fundamental physics of the PE process, and can not be improved instrumentally.

The intrinsic accuracy appears thus as an extrinsic factor to the excited-state self-energy effects as deviations of the quasiparticle excited-state $E(k)$, measured in the ideal PE experiment with undamped final states, from the ground-state bandstructure.

The intrinsic accuracy problem has in pieces been tackled in quite a few papers. Here, my aim is to delineate an entire concept, including essential physics and mechanisms of the intrinsic accuracy, and unveil its non-trivial effects encountered in the PE experiment. The concept is built upon a simple picture involving interplay of the final- and initial-state spectral functions, which gives a clearer physical insight compared to the explicit one-step PE theory with its heavy computational machinery. Finally, I discuss optimization of the PE experiment with respect to the intrinsic accuracy of 3D band mapping.
II. BASIC PHYSICS OF THE PE PROCESS

In the following analysis of the PE process it is implied that $E(k)$ is the quasiparticle bandstructure, already incorporating the excited-state self-energy effects. We will neglect the surface effects and concentrate on the bulk derived states with significant dispersion in $k_{\perp}$ (so-called 3D states). The ideal $E$- and $k_{\parallel}$-resolution of the PE experiment is assumed.

A. Initial and final states of PE

First we will recall physics of the PE initial and final states based on the ideas from [1,2,8]. For simplicity we will assume that their wavefunctions have only one Bloch wave constituent.

The final-state wavefunction is the time-reversed LEED wavefunction. As sketched in Fig.1 (the upper panels represent the final state), the wavefunction is described by a Bloch wave which is damped in the surface-perpendicular direction $r_{\perp}$ towards the crystal interior [3,5,9,10]. There are two sources of such damping: 1) inelastic absorption, expressed by absorption potential $V_{i}$ connected with the electron lifetime as $2V_{i} = \hbar/\tau_{e}$, and 2) elastic reflection from the crystal potential in the final-state band gaps. The damping is described by complex $k_{\perp}^{f}$ component of the final-state wavevector $k_{\perp}^{f}$, with $\text{Im}k_{\perp}^{f}$ connected to the photoelectron escape length $\lambda$ as $2\text{Im}k_{\perp}^{f} = \lambda^{-1}$ (the factor of 2 comes from squaring the wavefunction amplitude for intensity).

The corresponding final-state dispersion $E_{i}^{f}(k_{\perp})$, shown in Fig.1 by black lines, is radically different from this one if the Bloch waves were undamped (propagating), as shown in gray: the dispersions as a function of $\partial E/\partial k_{\perp}$ are smooth and gapless, passing continuously through the band gaps of the undamped $E(k)$ [3,5,9,10]. Such regions will in the following be somewhat loosely referred to as final-state band gaps. Note that due to surface-parallel invariance of the PE process the Bloch waves are undamped in the surface-parallel direction, retaining real $k_{\parallel}$ and gapped $k_{\parallel}$-dispersions [5].

The final-state spectral function $A_{i}^{f}(E,k)$, due to the finite photoelectron lifetime, is in principle characterized by certain distribution in $E$. However, in the PE experiment this is reduced to the $\delta$-function at the energy given by the PE analyser. Due to damping of the final-state wavefunction $A_{i}^{f}(E,k)$ is characterized, on the contrary, by Lorentzian distribution in real $k_{\parallel}$, as shown in Fig.1, centered at $k_{\parallel}^{0} = \text{Re}k_{\perp}^{f}$ of the final-state Bloch wave and having the fullwidth $\delta k_{\parallel} = 2\text{Im}k_{\perp}^{f}$ (in the angle-resolved PE experiment $k_{\parallel}$ is fixed and can be omitted). Therefore, $A_{i}^{f}(E,k)$ is given by

$$A_{i}^{f}(k_{\perp}) \propto \frac{\delta k_{\perp}}{(k_{\perp} - k_{\perp}^{0})^{2} + (\delta k_{\perp}/2)^{2}}$$

where the nominator stands for the normalization $\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} A_{i}^{f}(k_{\perp})dk_{\perp} = 1$. The final state of PE is thus characterized by fixed $E$ and broadening in $k_{\perp}$ whose width is determined by $\text{Im}k_{\perp}^{f}$ of the damped final-state Bloch wave [1,2,8].

Nature of the PE initial state is different and complementary. The initial-state wavefunction is basically undamped: Removal of holes by the finite hole lifetime is compensated by their simultaneous generation by the electromagnetic field, which is almost homogeneous, extending into the crystal interior over a light absorption length of $\sim 100$ Å, very large compared to the final-state damping length. As sketched in Fig.1 (the lower panels represent the initial state), initial-state wavefunction is therefore described by an almost undamped Bloch wave, having well-defined real $k_{\perp}$.

The corresponding initial-state dispersion $E_{i}^{i}(k_{\perp})$ shows up sharp and gapped $k_{\perp}$-dispersions typical of the undamped states, radically different from the final-state.

The initial-state spectral function $A_{i}^{i}(E,k)$ is characterized, owing to well-defined $k_{\perp}$, by distribution in real $k_{\perp}$ reduced to the $\delta$-function. Due to finite hole lifetime $\tau_{h}$ it is characterized, on the contrary, by Lorentzian distribution in energy, as shown in Fig.1, centered at the band energy $E_{i}^{i}(k_{\perp})$ and having the fullwidth $\delta E = \hbar/\tau_{h}$. Therefore, $A_{i}^{i}(E,k)$ is given by

$$A_{i}^{i}(E) \propto \frac{\delta E}{(E - E_{i}^{i}(k_{\perp}))^{2} + (\delta E/2)^{2}}$$

where the nominator ensures $\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} A_{i}^{i}(E)dE = 1$. The initial state of PE is thus characterized, complementarily to the final state, by fixed $k_{\perp}$ and broadening in $E$ whose width is determined by the hole lifetime [1,2,8].

Note that some implementations of the one-step PE theory [7,11] describe the hole lifetime effects by damping of the initial states. However, such an approach is in clear contradiction with the PE experiment, which unambiguously finds in the valence band the gapped $E_{i}^{i}(k_{\perp})$ dispersions typical of undamped states. The same fundamental flaw is implied by an PE lineshape analysis (see, e.g., [12,13]) where the $E$-broadening of the initial state is replaced by an equivalent $k_{\perp}$-broadening $\sim \delta E \left( \frac{\partial \mu}{\partial k_{\perp}} \right)^{-1}$. Although such a replacement does not alter the lineshape while the $k_{\perp}$-dispersions remain linear, it leaves out some of the intrinsic effects discussed here.

Inverse photoemission (IPE) is commonly treated as the time-reversed PE process [14] in which the IPE final state in the conduction band is equivalent to the PE initial state in the valence band. However, the above arguments suggest a fundamental difference between the two:
as the IPE final state is excited by the damped LEED wavefunction, it is, in contrast to the PE initial state, also damped. Correspondingly, the conduction band \( E(k) \) measured in the IPE experiment should be characterized by gapless \( k_\perp \)-dispersions similar to the PE final-state dispersions in Fig.1. Surprisingly, such a fundamental difference between the IPE and PE processes, tracing back to fundamental principles of quantum mechanics, has so far been addressed nor theoretically neither experimentally.

**B. Development of the PE spectrum: Intrinsic \( k_\perp \)-resolution**

We will now apply the above principles to analyze the PE response of 3D states. We will use a simple formalism based on interplay of the spectral functions [1,5,8], which is extremely simple and gives a clear physical insight. Its accuracy, despite principal limitations compared to the explicit one-step PE theory (see III.E), is nevertheless sufficient for evaluation of the PE peak profiles [15].

As illustrated in Fig.2, the photoemission current \( I(E^f, E^i) \) at the final-state energy \( E^f \) and initial-state energy \( E^i = E^f - h\nu \) is formed by adding up the elementary photocurrrants \( dI(E^f, E^i) \) from all \( dk_\perp \) intervals, in which direct transitions take place, with \( k_\perp \) spanning the whole Brillouin zone (BZ). Each \( dI(E^f, E^i) \) is weighted by the above spectral functions, \( A^f(k_\perp) \) to express closeness of \( k_\perp \) to \( k_\perp^0 \) of the final-state Bloch wave, and \( A^i(k_\perp) \) to express closeness of \( E^i \) to the initial-band energy \( E^i(k_\perp) \) at this \( k_\perp \) with \( \delta E \) varying along \( E^i(k_\perp) \). Moreover, each \( dI(E^f, E^i) \) is multiplied by amplitude factors of the final-state surface transmission \( |T| ^2 \) and photoexcitation matrix element \( |M_{fi}|^2 \). This yields \( dI(E^f, E^i) = dk_\perp |T|^2 |M_{fi}(k_\perp)|^2 A^f(k_\perp) A^i(E^i) \). To obtain the whole photocurrent, this expression should be integrated in \( k_\perp \):

\[
I(E^f, E^i) \propto \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} dk_\perp |T|^2 |M_{fi}(k_\perp)|^2 \cdot \frac{\delta k_\perp}{(k_\perp - k_\perp^0)^2 + (\delta k_\perp/2)^2} \cdot \frac{\delta E}{(E^i - E^i(k_\perp))^2 + (\delta E/2)^2}
\]

This integral can be evaluated at negligible computational cost (it can even be performed analytically using Taylor expansion of \( E^i(k_\perp) \) [5]).

Cuts of \( I(E^f, E^i) \) along the \( E^f = const \) line correspond to the constant-final-state (CFS) measurement mode, along the \( h\nu = E^f - E^i = const \) line to the energy-distribution-curve (EDC) mode, and along \( E^i = const \) to the constant-initial-state (CIS) mode. Fig.2 illustrates, for simplicity, the PE spectrum taken using the CFS mode in which \( k_\perp^0 \) is constant throughout the spectrum.

The PE spectrum shows up, whichever the measurement mode, a peak centered roughly at the energy \( E^i(k_\perp^0) \) dictated by the direct transition at \( k_\perp^0 \) between the final and initial bands. Broadening of the peak results from the final-state \( k_\perp \)-broadening combined with the initial-state \( E \)-broadening. In this context the \( k_\perp \)-broadening appears as an intrinsic \( k_\perp \)-resolution of the PE experiment (in the following we will use these terms interchangeably depending on the context). Note that this resolution, in contrast to the instrumentally limited resolution in \( k_\parallel \), is limited by intrinsic mechanisms involved in the PE process and can not be improved instrumentally.

**C. Regimes of the PE experiment**

If the \( k_\perp \)-resolution is at its best extreme \( \delta k_\perp \rightarrow 0 \), then \( A^f(k_\perp) \) becomes \( \delta \)-function \( \delta(k_\perp - k_\perp^0) \) and the integral (3) for \( I(E^f, E^i) \) is reduced to \( A^i(E^f) \) whose maximum points to the initial band energy \( E^i(k_\perp^0) \) in the \( k \)-point dictated by the direct transition. The PE peaks will then exactly follow the 3D quasiparticle dispersions in the valence band. In practice, such a situation is realized under the condition

\[
\delta k_\perp \ll k_\perp^{BZ} \quad (4)
\]

where \( k_\perp^{BZ} \) is the surface-perpendicular dimension of the BZ. This condition identifies the so-called bandstructure regime (BS-regime) of the PE experiment which ensures accurate 3D band mapping [2,6]. In the real space, it reads as \( \lambda \gg c_\perp \), where \( c_\perp \) is the surface-perpendicular dimension of the unit cell.

If the PE final state comprise a few Bloch waves, the condition (4) should be generalized as \( \delta k_\perp \ll \frac{\lambda}{N} \), where \( N \) is the number of the corresponding final bands. Often in the literature (see, e.g., [6]) this number is confused with the number of all unoccupied bands available for given \( E^f \) and \( k_\parallel \); as the latter becomes with energy progressively immense, an erroneous conjecture is made that at high energies any 3D band mapping is impossible. However, in the multitude of the available occupied bands only those are effective as the final bands, whose Bloch waves provide effective transport of the photoelectrons out of the solid by significant coupling to the outgoing plane wave [5,16]. Typically there are only a few (\( N = 1 - 2 \)) final bands in this sense (see examples in III.A).

If the \( k_\perp \)-resolution is at the opposite extreme \( \delta k_\perp \rightarrow \infty \), any resolution in \( k_\perp \) is lost, \( A^f(k_\perp) \) becomes constant and the integral (3) yields, assuming that \( |T|^2 \) and \( |M_{fi}|^2 \) are independent of \( k_\perp \) and \( E^i(k_\perp) \) is linear, the 1-dimensional DOS (1DOS) \( \frac{dk}{\delta E} \). The PE peaks will
then manifest the 1DOS maxima independently of $k_0^0$. In practice, such a situation is achieved under the condition $\delta k_\perp \gtrsim k_\perp^{RZ}$, which identifies the so-called 1DOS-regime [2,6].

Interpretation of the PE data between the bandstructure and 1DOS regimes is doubtful [6,17]: the PE peaks retain some $hv$-dispersion, although damped by strong averaging in $k_\perp$, but they can be far from the true quasi-particle $E'(k_\perp)$.

Evolution of the regimes of the PE experiment with the $k_\perp$-resolution will now be illustrated by a PE simulation. The model employs the initial state whose parameters are chosen to resemble roughly the $sp$-band of Cu [5]: It is described by the free-electron dispersion $E'(k_\perp) = \frac{h^2}{2m} k_\perp^2 + V_{000}$ and the energy broadening $\delta E$ varying linearly as a function of energy to match zero at the Fermi level $E_F$ and an experimental value of 1.7 eV at the bottom of the band. The Fermi-Dirac cut is introduced as the ideal step function. The photocurrent $I(E')$ is evaluated by integration of the spectral functions in $k_\perp$ (3), assuming constant amplitude factors $|T_f|^2$ and $|M_{f\perp}|^2$. The integration also extends above the Fermi vector $k_\perp^F$ to include certain contribution from the tails of $A'(E)$ in the unoccupied region of the valence band (see III B). For clarity, the PE spectra were evaluated for the CFS mode, in which $k_\perp^0$ is constant ($\delta k_\perp$ are deviations from the EDC mode are insignificant, because normally the final-state $\frac{\partial E'}{\partial k_\perp}$ is large enough to ensure small variations of $k_\perp^0$ through the peak profile).

The simulation was performed for four $\delta k_\perp$ values: zero for the ideal $k_\perp$-resolution, 0.2$|\Gamma X|$ as a representative for the BS-regime in a real PE experiment, 0.6$|\Gamma X|$ for degraded $k_\perp$-resolution, and 2$|\Gamma X|$ for the 1DOS-regime. The results are shown in Fig.3 as series of the PE spectra with $k_\perp^0$'s scanning along $\Gamma X$ (upper panels, each series in different intensity scale) and positions of the spectral peaks mapped on top of the true valence band (lower panels).

In the ideal $k_\perp$-resolution limit the PE peak reflects the initial-state $A'(E)$ and ideally follows the true $E'(k_\perp^0)$. Interestingly, upon passing $k_\perp^F$ there appears an extremely small peak just below $E_F$; it replicates the low-energy tail of the spectral function $A'(E)$ whose maximum is already above $E_F$ (see III B).

In the BS-regime ($\delta k_\perp = 0.2|\Gamma X|$ in our simulation) the $k_\perp$-resolution remains sufficient for the PE peaks to closely follow $E'(k_\perp)$. This regime can be used for accurate 3D band mapping. Two peculiarities should be noted here: 1) Despite $A'(E)$ becomes the $\delta$-function upon approaching $E_F$, the PE peak does not sharpen up to singularity; 2) When $k_\perp^0$ passes $k_\perp^F$ and enters into the unoccupied region, the peaks do not disappear but become ‘ghost’ peaks which are highly asymmetric and have their maximum stationary in energy just below $E_F$. Both peculiarities are appearances of the $k_\perp$-broadening and will be analyzed in III B and III C.

As the $k_\perp$-resolution degrades ($\delta k_\perp = 0.6|\Gamma X|$), the concomitant averaging of $E'(k_\perp)$ causes asymmetry of the peaks and strong intrinsic shifts of their maxima from the true $E'(k_\perp)$. Although the PE peaks deceptively keep dispersion on $k_\perp^0$, their use for 3D band mapping will return a distorted valence band dispersion. Note appearance of an additional shoulder-like structure, which originates from the large 1DOS in the bottom of the band and becomes notable as the main peak shifts upwards.

In the 1DOS-regime ($\delta k_\perp = 2|\Gamma X|$) the $k_\perp$-resolution is completely lost. The maxima of the PE peaks become stationary in energy reflecting the maximum of the valence band 1DOS (and a tiny replica of the $A'(E)$ singularity at $E_F$, omitted from the plot). The $k_\perp^0$ changes show up only in the intensity modulation. Note however that the PE peaks are notably shifted from the true 1DOS maximum.

The regimes of the PE experiment in general follow the well-known “universal curve” $\lambda(E')$ [1,2,6] which gives the $k_\perp$-resolution as $\delta k_\perp = \lambda^{-1}$. The BS-regime holds while $\lambda$ remains large, which takes place at low $E'$ below or not far above a plasmon excitation energy of 20-30 eV (see examples in III A). Upon further increase of energy $\lambda$ reaches its minimum around 50-100 eV, and the PE experiment enters into the 1DOS-regime, although in practice the $k_\perp$-dispersion signatures are never completely suppressed. The BS-regime recovers in the high-energy region above $\sim 300$ eV where $\lambda$ rises again (despite at these energies the unoccupied bands become immense in number, only one of them remains effective in the PE final state in the sense of effective coupling to the outgoing plane wave [16]).

The high-energy region is characterized by low PE intensity resulting from small valence band crosssection and from the Debye-Waller factor, in which the increase of $hv$ reduces the PE intensity on equal footing with temperature. However, the advent of new high-brilliance synchrotron radiation sources and multidetection PE analyzers has allowed for PE experiments in this region with reasonable count rates and resolution in $E$ and $k_{\parallel}$ [18,19]. k-resolved experiments were reported, for example, in [20] where the $sp$-band of Al was found to be mirrored in the $hv$-dispersion of the PE signal up to 750 eV. Interestingly, this study has found an increase of the surface to bulk signal intensity ratio with $hv$, opposite to the tendency expected from the “universal curve”, and attributed this surprising phenomenon to intrinsic phonon excitation effects involved in the PE process. These results call for further studies on the role of the phonon excitation in high-energy PE spectroscopy.
III. MECHANISMS LIMITING THE INTRINSIC ACCURACY

Degradation of the $k_{\perp}$-resolution, as we observed above, results in intrinsic shifts of PE peaks from the true valence band $k_{\perp}$-dispersions, limiting the intrinsic accuracy of 3D band mapping. These shifts can originate through various mechanisms, which will now be analyzed.

A. Non-linearity mechanism

Degradation of the $k_{\perp}$-resolution can crawl into the position of the PE peaks, firstly, by non-linearity of the valence band $k_{\perp}$-dispersion. As evident from Fig.2, in this case the integral number of the $dk_{\perp}$-intervals within the $k_{\perp}$-broadening will be different for the initial states whose $E^i$ is above the direct-transition energy $E^i(k_{\perp}^0)$ and for the states whose $E^i$ is below $E^i(k_{\perp}^0)$, being larger where the 1DOS is larger. Correspondingly, the PE peak becomes asymmetric. Its maximum somewhat shifts towards larger integral number of $dk_{\perp}$, deviating from the true $E^i(k_{\perp}^0)$. In the band interior the PE peaks shift towards the band edges, where the 1DOS is larger. Near the band edges the peaks, on the opposite, shift towards the band interior (so-called in-band shifting [4,5]) because beyond the band edge there are no states and the 1DOS is zero. We will refer to this mechanism to limit the intrinsic accuracy as the non-linearity mechanism. It was behind the intrinsic shifts observed in the PE simulation in Fig.3, where the PE peaks clearly followed the characteristic pattern of shifting towards larger 1DOS. Note that the intrinsic shifts due to the non-linearity mechanism depend, apart from $\delta k_{\perp}$ and non-linearity of $E^i(k_{\perp})$, on the initial-state $\delta E$.

The non-linearity mechanism can be illustrated by experimental data for VSe$_2$ (for a detailed discussion see [4]). Information about the final-state dispersions and lifetimes, required for determination of $\delta k_{\perp}$, was achieved in this case by VLEED (see IV). The experimental energy dependence of $V_i$ is shown in Fig. 4 (a). It is characterized by a sharp increases of $V_i$ at the plasmon excitation energy $\hbar \omega_p$. The experimental $E^f(k_{\perp})$ is shown in Fig. 4 (b). Note that these final band can hardly be described by free-electron-like dispersions: there are two bands, and each can be free-electron fitted only locally with the inner potential strongly depending on $E^f$ and $k_{\parallel}$ (such a complicated structure of the final states is in fact typical of many materials with large unit cell, containing more than one atom, due to backfolding of many free-electron bands into the first BZ and their mutual hybridization). An estimate of $\delta k_{\perp}$ was obtained, neglecting some increase in the final-state band gaps, as $2V_i \left( \frac{\partial E^f}{\partial k_{\perp}} \right)^{-1}$ (see IV). The obtained $\delta k_{\perp}$ values are shown in Fig. 4 (b) superimposed on the final bands.

Following the increase of $V_i$, the $k_{\perp}$-resolution degrades above $\hbar \omega_p$. The results of PE band mapping, the binding energy of the PE peaks as a function of $k_{\perp}^0$, are shown in Fig. 4 (c) with distinction for the final states below and above $\hbar \omega_p$. Near the band edges of the 3D bands the experimental points above $\hbar \omega_p$ are systematically shifted towards the band interior compared to those below $\hbar \omega_p$. It should be stressed that here we have an explicit example how the same initial states yield different energies of the PE peaks depending on the $k_{\perp}$-resolution. The observed shifts demonstrate the intrinsic effect of in-band shifting, occurring mainly by the non-linearity mechanism. Interestingly, increase of $E^f$ towards 50 eV results in further increase of $\delta k_{\perp}$ and suppression of any dispersion of the PE peaks [21].

Our analysis demonstrates that for VSe$_2$ the energy region of accurate 3D band mapping is exhausted by low $E^f$ below or not far above $\hbar \omega_p$. Such a situation is in fact fairly general, because a pronounced plasmon threshold is typical of many materials with some exceptions such as Cu and Ni. The intrinsic accuracy effects similar to VSe$_2$ were also observed for TiS$_2$ [4], WSe$_2$ [22], Ge [17], etc.

In the final-state band gaps the Bloch waves experience additional damping due to elastic scattering from the crystal potential [5,23]. Although this is normally much weaker than the damping due to $V_i$, as in the above example, for materials with exceptionally large final-state band gaps the additional damping can cause notable degradation of the $k_{\perp}$-resolution. Graphite is a typical example of this (for a detailed discussion see [24,25]). Its final bands were simulated using the empirical pseudopotential method based on the VLEED data for their energies in the Γ-point (the simulation is therefore less accurate in the BZ interior) and $V_i$. The resulting $E^f(k_{\perp})$ is shown in Fig.5 (a) and (b) as a function of $\Im k_{\perp}$ and $\Re k_{\perp}$ respectively, using the double-BZ representation to reflect the dipole selection rules in graphite. The final states are characterized by a strong increase of $\delta k_{\perp} = 2 \Im k_{\perp}$ in the two band gaps in the Γ-point. Based on these data, we simulated the PE response of the valence π-band, having the 3D character, using the same formalism (3). The results are shown in Fig.5 (b). When the final-state $k_{\perp}^0$ moves towards the Γ-point and enters the band gaps, progressive degradation of the $k_{\perp}$-resolution results, by the non-linearity mechanism, in increasing of the in-band shifts. In the lower band gap, which has the maximal width, the increase of $\delta k_{\perp}$ is particularly strong; the concomitant in-band shifting is so dramatic that it overcomes the trend dictated by the band dispersions themselves and reverses the dispersion of the PE peaks compared to the true π-band. Such an unusual reversed dispersion has indeed been found in the PE experiment [25].

Typically, intrinsic shifts near the band extrema due
to the non-linearity mechanism are of the order of a few tenths of eV. The experiment often suggests however larger shifts [4,21,22]. As degradation of the $k_\perp$-resolution goes along with reduction of the escape length $\lambda$, this reveals certain contribution of surface effects such as suppression of the 1DOS in the band extrema (see III.D). It should be noted that the condition (4) identifying the BS-regime is particularly restrictive for layered materials owing to their small $k_\perp^2$ (see [26] for a specialized survey).

B. ‘Ghost’ peaks at $E_F$

An interesting phenomenon occurs when a 3D band crosses the Fermi surface. This situation is described by the PE simulation in Fig.3: When the direct-transition $k_\perp^0$ moves outside the Fermi surface and starts sampling the unoccupied part of the valence band, the PE peaks, mysteriously, do not disappear. Instead, they become asymmetric and stationary in energy just below the Fermi level $E_F$, and only gradually reduce in amplitude. Experimentally, such a phenomenon has been observed, for example, in a famous PE study on Na, where the sp-band crosses $E_F$ [27,28]. We will refer to this phenomenon as ‘ghost’ peaks. It has in fact two contributions due to different mechanisms.

The first contribution is due to a general mechanism taking place for 3D as well as 2D bands. It comes from the unoccupied states next to $E_F$: The spectral function $A^i(E)$, centered at the band energy above $E_F$, protrudes its low-energy tail, however small the remaining amplitude, below $E_F$ and gives therefore some PE intensity (such an effect for 2D bands is discussed, for example, in [29,30]). Such a contribution can be isolated in our PE simulation by restricting the integration (3) to $k_\perp > k_\perp^f$. It survives even in the limit of the ideal $k_\perp$-resolution, as seen in Fig.3. In any case, the ‘ghost’ peak intensity due this mechanism is very small.

The second contribution, much predominating for the 3D bands, comes from the occupied states: As illustrated in Fig.6, even if $k_\perp^0$ moves outside the Fermi surface, the $dk_\perp$-states at the initial-state $E^i$ below $E_F$ give certain ‘ghost’ intensity by virtue of being accessible via the $k_\perp$-broadening. Upon moving $k_\perp^0$ further from $k_\perp^f$ the $A^i(E)$ profile shifts, reducing its amplitude at the initial band and, concomitantly, the ‘ghost’ peak amplitude. Note that this mechanism gives a significant ‘ghost’ peak intensity even if the initial-state $E$-broadening is vanishing which takes place upon approaching $E_F$.

The ‘ghost’ peak phenomenon complicates identification of the $E_F$ crossings in mapping of the Fermi surface formed by 3D bands. A well-known example is NbSe$_2$, whose 4$p_z$ band forms a 3D pocket of the Fermi surface with extension in $k_\perp$ small compared to the $k_\perp$-broadening; direct mapping of this pocket is precluded by non-dispersive ‘ghost’ intensity [31,32]. Even if the mapping is performed as a function of $k_\parallel$, the ‘ghost’ peaks stay at $E_F$ through the entire interval of $k_\parallel$ where at least some part of the 3D band remains occupied. It should be noted that often the PE data, especially for quasi-2D materials, is interpreted neglecting the 3D effects; in this case such ‘ghost’ peaks in the $k_\parallel$-dispersion are misinterpreted as a sign of unusual self-energy effects. A way to circumvent the ‘ghost’ peak problem in the Fermi surface mapping was suggested in [5]: one varies $k_\parallel$, simultaneously changing $E^f$ to remain in the $E^i(k_\perp)$ minimum.

C. Linewidths near $E_F$

Similar in origin to the ‘ghost’ peaks is an interesting PE linewidth behavior upon approaching $E_F$: As seen in our simulations in Fig.3 for the BS-regime, the PE peak from the 3D band, mysteriously, retains a finite linewidth up to $E_F$ without sharpening up as might be expected from the behavior of the initial-state $A^i(E)$, which becomes singular at $E_F$ because of the vanishing $E$-broadening. The origin of such a counter-intuitive linewidth behavior is again due to the 3D character of the band and the $k_\perp$-broadening [13,33]: As one can conjecture from Fig.6, even if the $E$-broadening is zero, the initial states around the direct-transition energy $E^i(k_\perp^0)$ are accessible via the $k_\perp$-broadening and contribute to the PE peak width. In the ideal $k_\perp$-resolution limit, as demonstrates our simulation in Fig.3, the PE peak well becomes singular towards $E_F$.

An experimental example of such an effect of the $k_\perp$-broadening on the linewidths can be seen, for example, in the PE peak from the sp-band of Cu whose linewidth increases upon approaching $E_F$ [15]. In [13,33] it was shown that the same effect can explain an unusual linewidth energy dependence near $E_F$ observed in Bi$_2$Sr$_2$CaCu$_2$O$_8$, which otherwise would indicate deviations from the Fermi liquid picture.

Significant PE intensity next to $E_F$, seen in all regimes of the simulation in Fig.3, also originates from existence of a 3D band crossing $E_F$ and the $k_\perp$-broadening. Such a peculiarity is typical of the PE experiments on 3D materials such as Cu.

D. Other mechanisms

Intrinsic shifts in the 3D bands can also appear due to a matrix element mechanism: If $M_{fi}$ as a function of energy and $k_\perp$ undergoes sharp variations within the $k_\perp$-broadening, a contribution of the states above and below $E^i(k_\perp^0)$ is different (see Fig.2). The peak becomes asymmetric and it maximum experiences an intrinsic shift from the true band energy. Such a mechanism has been
identifying, for example, in TiS$_2$ [4]. Similar effects due to $T^f$ should be less pronounced, because the energy variations of $T^f$ are normally smooth and become sharper only at extremely low $E^f$, as can be seen in VLEED data (see, e.g., [4,24,34])

The above mechanisms were all based on the bulk bandstructure picture, in which the bandstructure near the surface is considered identical to the bulk one. This implies that the crystal potential, and thus the wavefunctions, ideally repeat the bulk ones up to the surface. In fact, within a few atomic layers of the PE escape depth they can experience notable modification. Such surface effects also give rise to intrinsic shifts. For example, the 1DOS singularities in the band extrema, characteristic of the bulk $E(k)$, are smeared in the local DOS near the surface (see, e.g., [35–37]), which results in an increase of the in-band shifting. The surface effects are harder to control compared to the $k_{\perp}$-resolution effects. Qualitatively, their contribution reduces with increase of $\lambda$ simultaneously with reduction of the intrinsic shifts of the bulk origin due to the concomitant improvement of the $k_{\perp}$-resolution.

Surface photoelectric effect, generated by abrupt change in the dielectric response at the surface barrier and described by the $\nabla \cdot \mathbf{A}$ part of $M_{fi}$, can influence the PE signal from the 3D bands through interference of the surface and bulk PE components (see, e.g., [38–40]). Normally this effect only causes some asymmetry of the PE peaks. However, near the surface and bulk plasmon excitation energies, especially for free-electron metals such as Na, the lineshape changes can be drastic and return large intrinsic shifts [28,41]. In [40] it was demonstrated that the surface and bulk components can be experimentally separated by changing the light incidence angle.

E. Intrinsic accuracy within the one-step PE theory

The intrinsic effects are naturally embodied in the one-step PE theory (see, e.g., [6,7]) which finds the PE intensity as a matrix element $\left| \langle \Phi^f | \mathbf{\hat{A}} \cdot \hat{\mathbf{p}} | \Phi^i \rangle \right|$. Interference between different Bloch wave constituents in the final and initial states, matrix element effects and surface effects, all ignored in the simplified formalism (3) used above, are naturally included here. However, a heavy computational machinery often obscures the physical mechanisms.

An example of the intrinsic accuracy analysis using the one-step PE theory can be found in [42] in application to TiS$_2$. Similarly to the above results for VSe$_2$, for the final states above $\hbar \omega_p$, the $k_{\perp}$-resolution was found to degrade, causing strong broadening and intrinsic shifts of the PE peaks. Surface effects due to smearing of the bulk 1DOS singularities have also been identified. Another example is a calculation on Na [28], which described the ‘ghost’ peaks at $E_F$ and in-band shifting in the bottom of the valence band.

IV. OPTIMIZATION OF THE PE EXPERIMENT USING VLEED

3D band mapping remains relevant if the intrinsic shifts are small. Of the factors affecting these shifts, the non-linearity of the $k_{\perp}$-dispersion, initial-state $E$-broadening and, partly, variations of $M_{fi}$ are all due to inherent properties of the valence bands under study and remain beyond control by the experimentator. The $k_{\perp}$-resolution, on the contrary, is an exclusively final-state property, and by tuning $E^f$ can taken to values which ensure negligible intrinsic shifts. This is achieved in the BS-regime $\delta k_{\perp} \ll k_{i\perp}^{\text{BZ}}$ (see II C). The exact energy ranges of this regime are however much material dependent. Knowledge of the $k_{\perp}$-resolution energy dependence is therefore required.

VLEED, covering the energy range below $\sim 40$ eV, has recently been established as the experimental method giving the most direct access to the PE final states with resolution in the 3D wavevector (see [3–5] and references therein). In the VLEED spectra of elastic electron reflection, the energies of the spectral structures give the critical points in the final bands. $E^f(k_{\perp})$, obtained from this experimental data, can further be used to control $k_{\perp}$ in the PE experiment. Broadening of the VLEED structures, moreover, gives an estimate of the corresponding $V_i$ values [4,34,43]. By performing calculations of the complex bandstructure with the experimental $V_i$ [3,5,34], one obtains the $k_{\perp}$-resolution as $\delta k_{\perp} = 2 \text{Im} k_i^{\perp}$ of the generated Bloch waves (and simultaneously the energy dependence of $\lambda$, as it was recently demonstrated for graphite in comparison with determination of $\lambda$ by the conventional overlayer method [43]). As such calculations can however be time-consuming, $\delta k_{\perp}$ can be estimated in a simplified manner directly from the $V_i$ values and the final-state group velocity $\partial k_{\perp} / \partial E^f$ as [9,12,13]

$$\delta k_{\perp} \sim 2 V_i \left( \frac{\partial E^f}{\partial k_{\perp}} \right)^{-1} \quad (5)$$

This estimate is accurate however only outside the final-state band gaps. Nevertheless, increase of $\delta k_{\perp}$ associated with additional damping in the gaps (see Fig.5) is normally less significant, except for a few materials with exceptionally wide band gaps such as graphite.

Use of the VLEED predictions on the $k_{\perp}$-resolution allows the experimentator to optimize the PE experiment on the intrinsic accuracy by selecting the $E^f$ intervals which ensure the BS-regime (see the examples in III A).

As a concluding remark, it should be noted that one can significantly improve accuracy of 3D band mapping

7
by computational modelling of the intrinsic accuracy effects, as described above, and correcting the experimental data correspondingly. This is often critical for proper evaluation of the true excited-state self-energy effects, for example in graphite [25] and Na [28].

V. CONCLUSION

Fundamental principles of PE have been analysed, focusing on emission from 3D states in the valence band. Damping of the final state due to inelastic and elastic scattering in $k_\perp$, which acts as the intrinsic $k_\perp$-resolution of the PE experiment. The PE peak is then formed as a matrix-element weighted average of the quasiparticle $k_\perp$-dispersion in valence band, which can be shifted from the dispersion itself. Such shifts intrinsically limit the accuracy of 3D band mapping, which remains accurate only in the bandstructure regime, characterized by the intrinsic $k_\perp$-broadening small compared to the BZ extension in $k_\perp$. Upon degradation of the $k_\perp$-resolution the PE experiment yields increasing intrinsic shifts and, finally, enters into the 1DOS regime. The intrinsic $k_\perp$-resolution can be controlled using VLEED, which gives the final-state dispersions and lifetimes. The mechanisms forming the intrinsic shifts have been exposed, including non-linearity of the $k_\perp$-dispersion, variations of the matrix element and surface effects. Appearance of the intrinsic shifts and transformation of the regimes of the PE experiment has been analysed using a physically transparent picture of interplay of the final- and initial-state spectral functions, and illustrated by PE simulations and experimental examples. The $k_\perp$-broadening gives rise to other surprising effects typical of 3D valence states such as ‘ghost’ peaks whose direct-transition $k_\perp$ falls outside the Fermi surface, and finite width of the PE peaks at the Fermi level.

I thank R. Claessen, P.O. Nilsson and R. Feder for promoting discussions. Financial support by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (CL124/5-1) is gratefully acknowledged.

---

*Email F1XVS@fy.chalmers.se. Also with the Institute for High-Performance Computations and Data Bases, St.Petersburg

[1] Angle-Resolved Photoemission, edited by S.D. Kevan (Elsevier, Amsterdam, 1992)

[2] S. Hüfner, Photoelectron Spectroscopy (Springer, Berlin, 1995)

[3] V.N. Strocov, H. Starnberg and P. O. Nilsson, J. Phys.: Cond. Matter 8, 7539 (1996); Phys. Rev. B 56, 1717 (1997)

[4] V.N. Strocov, H.I. Starnberg, P.O. Nilsson, H.E. Brauer and L.J. Holleboom, Phys. Rev. Lett. 79 (1997) 467; J. Phys. Condens. Matter 10 (1998) 5749

[5] V.N. Strocov, R. Claessen, G. Nicolay, S. Hüfner, A. Kimura, A. Harasawa, S. Shin, A. Kakizaki, H.I. Starnberg, P.O. Nilsson and P. Blaha, Phys. Rev. Lett. 81 (1998) 4943; Phys. Rev. B 63 (2001) 205108

[6] P.J. Feibelman and D.E. Eastman, Phys. Rev. B 10 (1974) 4932

[7] J.B. Pendry, Surf. Sci. 57 (1976) 679

[8] R. Matzdorf, Appl. Phys. A 63 (1996) 549; Surf. Sci. Rep. 30 (1998) 153

[9] J.B. Pendry, J. Phys. C: Solid State Phys. 2 (1969) 2283

[10] J.B. Pendry, Low Energy Electron Diffraction (Academic Press, London, 1974)

[11] P.O. Nilsson, J. Kanski and C.G. Larsson, Solid State Commun. 36 (1980) 111

[12] J.A. Knapp, F.J. Himpsel and D.E. Eastman, Phys. Rev. B 19 (1979) 4952

[13] N.V. Smith, F. Thiry and Y. Petroff, Phys. Rev. B 47 (1993) 15 476

[14] J.B. Pendry, Phys. Rev. Lett. 45 (1980) 1356

[15] K. Berge, A. Gerlach, G. Meister, A. Goldmann and J. Braun, Surf. Sci. 498 (2002) 1

[16] V.N. Strocov, Solid State Commun. 106, 101 (1997)

[17] W.D. Grobman, D.E. Eastman, J.L. Freeouf, Phys. Rev. B 12 (1975) 4405

[18] Y. Saitoh, H. Kimura, Y. Suzuki, T. Nakatani, T. Matsushita, T. Muro, T. Miyahara, M. Fujisawa, K. Soda, S. Ueda, H. Harada, M. Kotsugi, A. Sekiyama and S. Suga, Rev. Sci. Instr. 71 (2000) 3254

[19] T. Matsushita, T. Muro, Y. Saitoh, T. Nakatani, A. Sekiyama and S. Suga, Surf. Rev. and Lett. 9 (2002) 1231

[20] P. Hofmann, C. Søndergaard, S. Agergaard, S.V. Hoffmann, J.E. Gayone, G. Zampieri, S. Lizzit and A. Baraldi, Phys. Rev. B 66 (2002) 245422

[21] H.I. Starnberg, H.E. Brauer, P.O. Nilsson, L.J. Holleboom and H.P. Hughes, Mod. Phys. Lett. 8 (1994) 1261

[22] Th. Finteis, M. Hengsberger, Th. Straub, K. Fauth, R. Claessen, P. Auer, P. Steiner, S. Hüfner, P. Blaha, M. Vögt, M. Lux-Steiner and E. Bucher, Phys. Rev. B 55 (1997) 10 400; ibid. 59 (1999) 2461

[23] R. Courths, H. Wern, G. Leschik and S. Hüfner, Z. Phys. B 74, 233 (1989)

[24] V.N. Strocov, P. Blaha, H.I. Starnberg, M. Rohlfing, R. Claessen, J.-M. Debever and J.-M. Themlin, Phys. Rev. B 61 (2000) 4994

[25] V.N. Strocov, A. Charrier, J.-M. Themlin, M. Rohlfing, R. Claessen, N. Barrett, J. Avila, J. Sanchez and M.-C. Asensio, Phys. Rev. B 64 (2001) 075105

[26] V.N. Strocov, in Electron spectroscopies applied to low-dimensional materials (Kluwer, Netherlands, 2000)

[27] E. Jensen and E.W. Plummer, Phys. Rev. Lett. 55 (1985) 1912

[28] K.W.-K. Shung and G.D. Mahan, Phys. Rev. Lett. 57, 1076 (1986)

[29] R. Claessen, R.O. Anderson, J.W. Allen, C.G. Olson, C.
Janowitz, W.P. Ellis, S. Harm, M. Kalning, R. Manzke and M. Skibowski, Phys. Rev. Lett. 69 (1992) 808

[30] R. Claessen, R.O. Anderson, G.-H. Gweon, J.W. Allen, W.P. Ellis, C. Janowitz, C.G. Olson, Z.X. Shen, V. Eyert, M. Skibowski, K. Friemelt, E. Bucher, S. Hüfner, Phys. Rev. B 54 (1996) 2453

[31] V.N. Strocov, Th. Finteis, R. Claessen, G. Nicolay, D. Ehm, V. Colbus, S. Hüfner, H. Starnberg and V. Eyert, BESSY Annual Rep. (1997) 219

[32] K. Rossnagel, O. Seifarth, L. Kipp, M. Skibowski, D. Voss, P. Krüger, A. Mazur and J. Pollmann, Phys. Rev. B 64 (2001) 235119

[33] N.V. Smith, Comments Cond. Mat. Phys. 15 (1992) 263

[34] E.E. Krasovskii, W. Schattke, V.N. Strocov and R. Claessen, Phys. Rev. B 66 (2002) 235403

[35] E. Pehlke and W. Schattke, J. Phys. C: Solid State Phys. 20 (1987) 4437

[36] C.M. Fang, R.A. de Groot and C. Haas, Phys. Rev. B 56, 4455 (1997)

[37] R. Courths, M. Lau, T. Scheunemann, H. Gollisch and R. Feder, Phys. Rev. B 63 (2001) 195110

[38] H.J. Levinson, E.W. Plummer and P.J. Feibelman, Phys. Rev. Lett. 43 (1979) 952

[39] E.D. Hansen, T. Miller and T.-C. Chiang, Phys. Rev. B 56, 1897 (1997) 2807

[40] T. Michalkov, A. Gerlach, K. Berge, R. Matzdorf and A. Goldmann, Phys. Rev. B 62 (2000) 10544

[41] D. Claesson, S.-Å. Lindgren, L. Walldén and T.-C. Chiang, Phys. Rev. Lett. 82 (1999) 1740

[42] E. Pehlke and W. Schattke, Solid State Commun. 69 (1989) 419

[43] N. Barrett, E.E. Krasovskii, J.-M. Themlin and V.N. Strocov, Phys. Rev. B (in press)

FIG. 1. Characteristic behavior of wavefunctions, $k_{\perp}$-dispersions and spectral functions of the final and initial states of PE, shown, respectively, on the upper and lower panels. The final states are characterized by fixed $E$ and broadening in $k_{\perp}$, while the initial state, complementarily, by fixed $k_{\perp}$ and broadening in $E$.

FIG. 2. Development of the PE peak. Its broadening results from the final-state $k_{\perp}$-broadening, defining the intrinsic $k_{\perp}$-resolution $\delta k_{\perp}$, combined with the initial-state $E$-broadening $\delta E$. The maximum of the peak shows an intrinsic shift towards the larger average 1DOS from the position $E'(k_{\perp}^0)$ dictated by the direct transition at $k_{\perp}^0$.

FIG. 3. Simulated PE experiments on a model 3D band, resembling the $sp$-band of Cu, performed with different strength of damping in the final state. The corresponding $\delta k_{\perp}$ values of the intrinsic the $k_{\perp}$-resolution (indicated on top) are characteristic of the BS-regime (left), degraded $k_{\perp}$-resolution (center), and 1DOS-regime (right). The results are shown as series of a few PE spectra (upper panels) whose offsets reflect scanning of the direct-transition $k_{\perp}^0$ along $\Gamma X$, and the position of the spectral peak maxima on top of the true valence band $E'(k_{\perp})$ (lower panels). Finite width of the PE peak upon approaching $E_F$ and 'ghost' peaks remaining after the $E_F$ crossing as both effects of the $k_{\perp}$-broadening. Degradation of the $k_{\perp}$-resolution results in intrinsic shifts of the PE peaks, in this case is due to the non-linearity mechanism, from the true valence band.

FIG. 4. Intrinsic accuracy for VSe$_2$: (a) Energy dependence of the final-state $V_i$ with a characteristic increase due to the plasmon excitation at $\hbar\omega_p$; (b) Final-state bands (including, of all unoccupied bands, only those whose Bloch wave effectively couples to the outgoing photoelectron plane wave). The $k_{\perp}$-resolution is shown by shading; (c) Position of the PE peaks superimposed on DFT-LAPW calculations. The points obtained with $E'_F$ below $\hbar\omega_p$ are shown as solid dots, and above as open dots. A systematic in-band shifting in the 3D bands, following degradation of the $k_{\perp}$-resolution above $\hbar\omega_p$, is mainly due to the non-linearity mechanism.

FIG. 5. Intrinsic accuracy for graphite: (a,b) Empirical pseudopotential simulation of the final bands based on VLEED data (black lines); the band gaps are emphasized by setting $V_i$ to zero (gray); (c) Simulated position of the PE peaks (dense dots) from the valence $\pi$-band on top of its true dispersion. Severe degradation of the $k_{\perp}$-resolution $\delta k_{\perp} = Imk_{\perp}^F$ in the final-state band gaps causes large in-band shifts due to the non-linearity mechanism, and even reverses the dispersion of the PE peaks in the lower gap.

FIG. 6. Mechanism of the 'ghost' peaks from 3D bands crossing the Fermi surface. Even if the direct-transition $k_{\perp}^0$ is in the unoccupied region, the PE signal comes from the occupied part of the valence band accessible via the final-state $k_{\perp}$-broadening.
Fig. 1 by V.N. Strocov
Fig. 2 by V.N. Strocov
Fig. 3 by V.N. Strocov
Fig. 4 by V.N. Strocov
Fig. 5 by V.N. Strokov
Fig. 6 by V.N. Strocov