Migration as a Threat to National Security

Sergei Metelev*
Omsk Institute (Branch) of Plekhanov Russian University of Economics, Omsk, Russian Federation; metelev-ce55@mail.ru

Abstract

Background/Objective: The purpose of the study is to analyze the impact of illegal immigration on the national and regional labor markets as a national security indicator in the social and labor sphere. Methods: The economic-mathematical and statistical methods were used to achieve the objectives of the study. The official statistical data in the field of labor and employment in the Russian Federation over the past five years served as empirical base of the research. With the help of statistical methods analytical indicators were designed, which allowed identifying the main trends in the labor market. Findings: Exogenous factors of national security become a priority in the economic aspect of Russia’s security, since it is the level of economic development of the country that largely determines the degree of its protection from external and internal threats. In this paper the author analyzes the factors affecting national security and focuses on illegal migration as a phenomenon actively involved in the social, economic and legal spheres. The impact of illegal migration on the national and regional labor markets viewed as an indicator of national security in the social and labor spheres has been studied. The use of outsourced manpower (studied in relation to its professional qualifications, distribution in Russia and industry labor markets) has been treated as a potential source of social and ethnic conflicts. Based on the empirical data the research provided quantitative and qualitative description of the real threats posed by illegal immigration, formed in the country in recent years, both in the economic and social sphere. Application/Improvements: The interested executive bodies may use these results to develop management solutions aimed at more efficient management of migration processes and reduction of illegal immigrants, eliminating unnecessary administrative barriers for the mostly needed professionals.

Keywords: Crime Rate, Illegal Migration, Labor Market, Labor Migration, Migration, National Security

1. Introduction

The growing attention of the state and society to the issues of Russia’s national security has become a feature at the beginning of the XXI century. It caused the necessity of scientific approaches to the study of this phenomenon. Ensuring national security becomes a particularly pressing issue in the time of transformation, economic and legal reforms which are an integral tendency in the contemporary Russian Federation.

At present migration serves as a foundation of the world globalization process. The growing tendencies of global labor division enhancing the migration flows are becoming a major challenge of present day economies since the migration processes entail both benefits for and certain threats to the receiving states.

On the one hand, global labor migration leads to leveling out differences in average wage resulting from the efficient use of labor resources. Due to their international redistribution the aggregated world output increases.

On the other hand, a pronounced ethno-social and ethno-political nature of migration as a mass uncontrolled phenomenon represents a potential threat to the national security. It affects the personalities of those forced to move to other territories in search of a quiet life and a better future.1

According to the classification of threats to the Russian Federation’s national security2 on the part of, primarily,
illegal migration, the economic sphere threats are considered to be:

- The domestic labor market dependence on foreign labor for certain types of professions.
- Increased competition between domestic and foreign employees in the Russian labor market.
- Capital export by foreign labor.
- Illegal economic activity (without taxes and duties payment) and its criminalization.
- Undermining of economic cooperation in the border regions of Russia and neighboring countries.
- Increase in the scale of smuggling activity.
- Uncontrolled export of financial resources and raw materials.
- Illegal migrants’ employment alongside with the local population unemployment.
- Disorganization of trade activity, etc.

Topicality of the subject is determined by the readiness of the states to face challenges caused by migration processes as an integral part of the strategy for socioeconomic and political reforms. Strengthening of international integration and liberalization of economic relations have led to increased mobility of all resources of economic and social development: Financial, material, technological, information, labor, and educational ones. Labor migration has become an essential point of the global economy. Sharp differentiations in the income level and living standards, the search for material well-being, avoidance of involvement in military conflicts as well as unemployment are forcing migrants to leave their homes. Current trends of the world development in many ways indicate that the number of labor migrants will increase. Migration flows are intensified in the conditions of the economic crisis in Russia. Economy fluctuations affect the labor market through changes of the unemployment rate and the real pay growth rate.

Security and strategic development for mankind on the threshold of the third millennium were closely linked with the problems of sustainable development of regions of the planet and the civilization as a whole. These issues were considered by the international community at the UN conference in Rio de Janeiro in 1992 and 1997. And in 2002 and 2012 the World Summit suggested a balanced development of the three components: Nature, society and economy. Along with the economic issues, social and environmental aspects were discussed, i.e., complex cultural problems that require a systematic approach needed to resolve irregularities and disparities in the development which lead to the aggravation of the crisis situations.

2. Research Methods

The author applied integrative and systemic approaches to the migration flows analysis, as well as statistical framework to identify patterns and the qualitative features of migration in Russia.

The attractiveness of the labor market depends on potential earned income. At the same time Russia faces significantly decreased income levels and solvency of both employees and employers hiring foreign nationals caused by the economic crisis and the sharp devaluation of the Russian ruble. It resulted in the decreased income of labor migrants and in a simultaneous increase in the cost of stay in the country. Structure analysis of the labor migrants’ employment by industries shows that 90% of legal non-residents in 2013 were employed in the six major types of economic activities: civil engineering (36.3%); trade (16.6%); manufacturing activities (13.5%); the service sector (9.9%); agriculture (9.1%); transport and communications (4.3%). The job cuts in the civil engineering and services sectors which employ a large number of labor migrants will affect employment and incomes of migrants in Russia.

According to statistics, in 2015 most of the foreign nationals had a work permit for employment in civil engineering to be engaged in mining operations, capital mining operations, building and assembly operations and construction and repair works (21.1%); in unskilled jobs (19.0%); in semi-skilled jobs with qualification in physics and engineering (10.2%). Most of foreign labor with valid work permits (29.0%) was engaged in the economy of Moscow; the number of people with legally effective labor patents constituted 30.0%. In St. Petersburg these figures made 13.1% and 6.9%, respectively, amounting to 9.7% and 13.1% in the Moscow region; 3.7% and 1.7% in the Khanty-Mansiisk Autonomous District-Yugra; 3.1% and 3.2% in the Krasnodar Territory.

Economic conditions in the employment area in respect to the demographic situation determine the specificity of the domestic labor market which will keep the demand for labor in the long term. This suggests real wages decline during the crisis being affected by high inflation rate that will influence the income level. Thus, according to analytical indicators, as of April 2015 the
unemployment rate growth was 5.7%, and the rate of remuneration decreased by 13.2% over the period under review compared to the previous year.

3. Results

The migration tendencies during the study period of 2014-2015 (Table 1.) show a steady migration increase, while in 2015 there was a decline of 8,732 people. According to the Federal Migration Service, the number of foreign nationals with valid work permits in the 2nd quarter of 2015 reached 556.2 thousands. Over the same period 58.0 thousand foreign citizens got work permits; most of them for the period from 9 to 12 months – 90.7%.

The specifics of the Russian labor market shows that its adjustment in the economic crisis is performed via the mechanism of real income decrease without the automatic rise in unemployment. Analytical statistics of the comparable data for the years 2012-2015 corroborates this fact (Table 2).

Despite the negative impact of downward oil prices in the world commodity markets and geopolitical tension which took the form of economic sanctions against Russia, the total number of foreign arrivals for the period of

| Table 1. Total migration in 2015 (first half-year period/people) |
|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| **2015** | For information 2014 |
| **Number of arrivals** | **Number of departures** | **Migration gain (+) loss (-)** | **Number of arrivals** | **Number of departures** | **Migration gain (+) loss (-)** |
| Russian Federation | 2128624 | 2020683 | +107941 | 2013601 | 1896928 | +116673 |
| Central Federal District | 585001 | 474306 | +110695 | 497458 | 417475 | +79983 |
| Northwestern Federal District | 258946 | 260024 | -1078 | 273022 | 249248 | +23774 |
| Southern Federal District | 193177 | 170395 | +22782 | 180697 | 157160 | +23537 |
| North Caucasian Federal District | 90307 | 102525 | -12218 | 92515 | 101044 | -8529 |
| Volga Federal District | 387095 | 401896 | -14801 | 385456 | 384041 | +1415 |
| Ural Federal District | 192166 | 189188 | +2978 | 195282 | 193074 | +2208 |
| Siberian Federal District | 276871 | 284531 | -7660 | 271455 | 271588 | -133 |
| Far Eastern Federal District | 111285 | 123326 | -12041 | 107379 | 117851 | -10472 |
| Crimean Federal District | 33776 | 14492 | +19284 | 10337 | 5447 | +4890 |

*Source: Labor and Employment in Russia. 2015: Statistical book. Rosstat: Moscow, 2015.*

| Table 2. Migration situation in the Russian Federation (the first 4 months of 2012 – 2015) |
|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| **Indicators / years** | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 |
| Arrivals | 5,385,947 | 6,103,163 | 5,913,462 | 6,026,774 |
| Put on migration record | 2,626,461 | 2,186,343 | 3,372,740 | 2,975,849 |
| Denied entry to foreign nationals and stateless persons | 20,560 | 52,856 | 269,128 | 189,022 |
| Expelled and deported | 7,706 | 11,403 | 40,764 | 31,991 |
| Issued work permits | 418,878 | 42,1299 | 412,423 | 89,744 |
| Issued work permits for highly qualified and qualified personnel | 9,559 | 17,064 | 24,985 | 17,036 |
| Issued patents | 324,864 | 349,737 | 738,557 | 598,280 |

*Source: Labor and Employment in Russia. 2015: Statistical book. Rosstat: Moscow, 2015.*
January-April 2015 is not considerably different from that of the same period in past years. During the period under review there was a sharp increase in the number of expelled and deported foreign citizens in 2014. This is related to the changes in the legal framework and the impact of new regulatory measures on migrants’ employment which came into effect in January, 2015. This factor also influenced the decline in the rate of migrants’ employment in 2015; compared with 2014 the number of work permits issued decreased by 78% and the number of patents decreased by 19%.

During the first half of 2015 the number of internal migrants increased by 98.4 thousand persons (5.6%) compared with the corresponding period of the previous year. Migratory gain in Russia decreased by 8.7 thousand people (7.5%) due to the increased number of departures from the Russian Federation (24.4 thousand people, or 16.7%). It also included 21.3 thousand people, or 17.0% of emigrants to the CIS member states. At the same time there was an increase in the number of arrivals from outside of Russia by 16.6 thousand people, or 6.3%, including those from the CIS member states by 17.6 thousand people, or 7.5%. In general, there is a decrease in migration gain. The largest reduction gain is seen in the migration exchange with Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Kyrgyzstan and China. The increase in migration gain was caused only by the Ukrainian population.

As noted above, the Russian labor market demonstrates long-term demand for labor. According to Rosstat forecasts, in 2016-2030 there will be population increase by 0.9 million people, but the number of working age people will decrease by 5 million. The permanent population of the Russian Federation as of July 1, 2015 totaled 146.3 million people. Starting from the beginning of the year the number of people in Russia increased by 46.6 thousand or by 0.03%.

According to Table 3 there was a natural population decline in the Russian Federation in 2014 (-0.4), and in 2015 (to -0.8). Migratory gain has fully compensated for the population loss and exceeded it by 76.0%.

Researchers estimate that by the beginning of 21st century the total number of labor migrants in the world without their family members ranged from 36 to 42 million people and that with family members exceeded this estimate twice or thrice.

Being a host country Russia uses foreign labor as a factor of its productive forces development. Immigrants tend to be involved in industries not popular in the local labor market. This allows industrialized countries to move labor at lower costs during the period of relatively high rates of economic growth and to iron out disparity in industries subjected to significant structural changes in connection with the scientific and technological revolution, or the process of integration.

However, the international experience proves that each country while forming national structure of migration employment niches faces a mixed reaction of the host society. Two polar opinions have developed with regard to this issue. According to the first opinion, migrants displace

**Table 3. Birth and death rates and natural population growth in the 1st half year period**

|                         | Per 1,000 people | Infant deaths per 1,000 born |
|-------------------------|------------------|-----------------------------|
|                         | born             | deceased             | Natural gain (+) | decrease (-) | 2015 2014 | 2015 2014 | 2015 2014 |
| Russian Federation      | 12.8             | 12.9                 | 13.6             | 13.3         | -0.8      | -0.4      | 6.6       | 7.6       |
| Northwestern Federal District | 12.0             | 11.9                 | 13.9             | 13.4         | -1.9      | -1.5      | 5.8       | 6.0       |
| Southern Federal District | 12.1             | 12.0                 | 14.0             | 13.5         | -1.9      | -1.5      | 6.1       | 7.6       |
| North Caucasian Federal District | 15.7             | 16.6                 | 8.2              | 8.3          | +7.5      | +8.3      | 9.4       | 11.1      |
| Volga Federal District  | 12.9             | 13.0                 | 14.7             | 14.1         | -1.8      | -1.1      | 6.4       | 7.4       |
| Ural Federal District   | 14.6             | 14.9                 | 13.0             | 12.5         | +1.6      | +2.4      | 6.0       | 6.2       |
| Siberian Federal District | 14.0             | 14.5                 | 13.8             | 13.5         | +0.2      | +1.0      | 7.2       | 7.9       |
| Far Eastern Federal District | 13.5             | 13.6                 | 13.1             | 12.8         | +0.4      | +0.8      | 7.7       | 10.0      |
| Crimean Federal District | 11.9             | 11.4                 | 15.9             | 14.9         | -4.0      | -3.5      | 5.4       | 5.2       |

Source: Labor and Employment in Russia. 2015: Statistical book. Rosstat: Moscow, 2015.
local labor force taking economically profitable workplaces. This thesis is confirmed by the fact that migrants compete with the Russians in the labor market and may drive them out to take a niche: "... more or less considerable part of jobs occupied by migrants have become jobs for migrants only, i.e., they are "reserved" for years to come .... " The second opinion states that migrant workers are employed in most non-prestigious and low-paid jobs that are not of interest to local residents which reduces costs and improves the competitiveness of the economy⁴.

4. Discussion

The author believes that foreign citizens performing labor activities within the territory of the Russian Federation will not be able to displace local skilled professionals when labor market is regulated by the state, since this requires relevant decisions by the authorities, and the employers' interest for cheap labor enhances the role of labor migrants in the labor market. Employers take advantage of the lower level of wage rates, thus provoking the emergence of artificial, virtual niches of jobs shortage in non-prestigious and low-wage areas where migrant workers are willingly engaged⁵. European scholars suggest that the impact of immigration on labor market in general is in significant and often positively affect total employment⁶. In the international experience these facts are related to a clear segmentation of the labor market which imposes severe restrictions on the access of foreign nationals to certain vacancies and differentiation of employment spheres for local and foreign employees. Another factor that can lead to serious social consequences is an extremely inefficient use of migrants’ labor potential. This is due to both the existing tension in local labor markets, especially in the villages and towns with single-industry structure of employment, and the mismatch of branch structure needs of regional labor markets in the labor force with professional structure of arrivals. For example, in the European part of Russia people with experience in agriculture are most often required, while those coming mostly apply for intellectual labor. In Siberia, the Urals, the Far East, on the contrary, there is an increased demand for the intellectual labor force, but the immigration flow is dominated by people of other professions. The contradiction in the imbalance of supply and demand is settled by the employment of labor migrants in jobs not requiring highly specialized skills and qualifications, which reduces the effectiveness of foreign labor resources. More than 40% of able-bodied migrants, who received Russian Federation citizenship, do not work in their specialties⁷.

Among the threats to national security posed by migration in the social field particular attention should be paid to the intensification of social stratification and social tension in society, to the building up fear of both social and ethnic conflicts; the increased number of criminal organizations and groups formed by migrants, etc.

Thus, in the whole crime structure the emphasis is laid on the monitoring of the level of crimes committed by foreign citizens and stateless persons. According to official statistics of Ministry of Internal Affairs of Russia this category of citizens committed 42.7 thousand crimes in the territory of the Russian Federation (as of January 1st, 2013), which is 3.4% of the registered crimes in the country.

According to the Federal Migration Service (FMS of Russia), there are currently from 5 to 15 million illegal immigrants in the Russian Federation who pose a threat to national labor markets contributing to the development of the shadow economy. Annual global profit of the criminal sector in this field of activity ranges from 5 to 9.5 billion dollars.

In 2012 the total number of reports on administrative violations of the rules of stay and employment of foreign nationals in Russia amounted to almost 533.5 thousand (in 2011 this figure was almost 650 thousand). And in 2012 there were 109,155 reports on the violation of the established regulation of labor activity concerning foreign nationals (Article 18.10 of the Administrative Code) (almost 145 thousand ones in 2011) and almost 89 thousand reports concerning employers (almost 118 thousand ones in 2011). In the author’s view a considerable predominance of “illegal component” in the structure of labor migration in many respects is caused by the peculiarities of formation and transformation of the economic model in which the informal sector is a contributing factor. It produces about a quarter of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and employs 20-30% of the total workforce. Illegal migrants predominate in those sectors of national economy where shadow segment share is considerable⁸.

5. Conclusion

External and internal threats to the regional national security and the national security as a comprehensive assessment of the socio-economic development of the region were presented on the basis of statistical and ana-
lytical data and indicate the scale of illegal migration and the factors contributing to its negative impact.

An even greater threat to national security is an illegal migration, which contributes to the increase in crime, and the expansion of the labor black market9.

The cultural consequences of mass migration are not less dangerous than the economic ones. Migration blurs Russian culture causing a number of problems when migrants will be used as a “fifth column” to start the process of destabilization of the Russian Federation, its collapse10.

Thus, there is now an urgent need for the improvement of migration processes management and the reduction of illegal immigrants’ number as well as elimination of superfluous administrative barriers for those professionals who are most required by the country. Changes to the Federal Law “On Legal Status of Foreign Citizens” will allow addressing the problems of illegal immigration and tax arrears more effectively. On the whole, migration policy has to become more efficient through a rational combination of administrative, legal, financial, economic and socio-psychological methods of influence.

6. References

1. Gross D. Immigration flows and regional labor markets dynamics. Washington: IMF. Working paper 98/47; 1998. Available from: www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/wp/wp9847.pdf

2. Dolgopolov EY. Regional conflicts: Origins and ways of settlement. Foreign Military Survey. 1988; 7:34–47.

3. Sorensen E. Immigrants and Immigration Policy. Moscow: Grinvich; 2001.

4. Bezborodova TM. Migrants in the Russian labor market. Sociological Research. 2013; 5:66–72.

5. Metelev SE, Permakova IP. Foreign labor force in the economy of modern Russia: Trends and prospects: Monograph. 2nd ed. Omsk: Omsk Institute Press; 2014.

6. Stalker P. Workers without frontiers: The impact of globalization on international migration. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers/ILO; 2000.

7. Storesletten K. Sustaining fiscal policy through immigration. Journal of Political Economy. 2000; 2:300–23.

8. Vitsenets T. Assessment of the sources of additional labour force. Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research. 2014; 19(9):1179–81.

9. Taran PA. Vulnerable groups: Migrant workers. United Nations Commission on Human Rights. 59th Session, Item 14(a) of the agenda; 2003. Available from: http://www.jcwi.org.uk/lawpolicy/uklaw/ilo_vulnerablegroups.pdf

10. Dmitriev AV. Migration. Conflict Measurement. Moscow: Al’fa-M; 2006.