Incidence of Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder after a Mild Traumatic Brain Injury: Preliminary Investigation Using the Brief Neuropsychological Screening Test

Mi Sun Choi, M.D.,¹ Sook Jin Seo, R.N.,¹ Chang Hyun Oh, M.D.,² Se-Hyuk Kim, M.D., Ph.D.,¹ Jin Mo Cho, M.D. '*

Department of Neurosurgery,¹ Ajou University College of Medicine, Suwon, Korea
Department of Neurosurgery,² Teun Teun Research Institute, Seoul, Korea

Objective : Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) is a group of diseases that are observed in patients who had experienced a serious trauma or accident. However, some experienced it even after only a mild traumatic brain injury (TBI), and they are easily ignored due to the relatively favorable course of mild TBI. Herein, the authors investigated the incidence of PTSD in mild TBI using brief neuropsychological screening test (PTSD checklist, PCL).

Methods : This study was conducted on patients with mild TBI (Glasgow coma scale ≥13) who were admitted from January 2012 to December 2012. As for PCL, it was done on patients who showed no difficulties in communication upon admission and agreed to participate in this study. By using sum of PCL, the patients were divided into high-risk group and low-risk group. PTSD was diagnosed as the three major symptoms of PTSD according to the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, fourth-edition.

Results : A total of 314 TBI patients were admitted and 71 of them met the criteria and were included in this study. The mean age was 52.9 years-old (range : 15—94). The mean PCL score was 28.8 (range : 17—68), and 10 patients were classified as high-risk group. During follow-up, 2 patients (2.7%) of high-risk group were confirmed as PTSD and there was no patient who was suspected of PTSD in the low-risk group (p=0.017).

Conclusion : PTSD is observed 2.8% in mild TBI. Although PTSD after mild TBI is rare, PCL could be considered as a useful tool for screening of PTSD after mild TBI.

Key Words : Post-traumatic stress disorder · Mild traumatic brain injury · PTSD checklist.

INTRODUCTION

Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) is a group of diseases observed in patients who feel a sensation of fear with physical and mental symptoms since their experience of severe trauma. The PTSD symptoms are so severe that the patient’s normal social activities are often adversely affected. The patient’s mental anguish is amplified, because PTSD could hardly be diagnosed based on external deformations or image test results. The World Health Organization has designated PTSD as a silent epidemic disease to highlight its seriousness.

Mild traumatic brain injury (TBI) accounts for more than 85% of all brain injuries, but it is attracting less clinical attention than moderate or severe brain injury because it shows comparatively favorable prognoses. However, some mild TBI patients complain of severe psychological problems for a long period even though their image test results are acceptable. Despite its clinical importance, PTSD in mild TBI patients may not be taken seriously because it could be associated with non-medical factors such as receiving insurance coverage from malingering. So, its prevalence has not been sufficiently investigated and easily ignored.

In this report, the authors investigated the prevalence of PTSD after mild TBI, and the clinical efficacy of the PTSD checklist (PCL) for screening the PTSD.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Demographic data for all patients were obtained from a pro-
respectively maintained database. This study was conducted after approval of the institutional review board of Ajou University medical center (AJ IRB-MED-OBS-14-043). All patients were mild TBI patients who were admitted to the emergency center single university hospital between January 2012 and December 2012. Mild TBI was defined as a case with between 13 and 15 of Glasgow coma scale. All patients were given serial cranial computed tomography to check the presence of intracranial hemorrhage or skull fracture accompanied by headache and dizziness. All patients were observed for at least 24 hours from admission to check their neurological progression. The neurological diagnosis was categorized into acute subdural hematoma, chronic subdural hematoma, epidural hematoma, traumatic intracerebral hemorrhage (contusional hemorrhage), traumatic subarachnoid hemorrhage, traumatic intraventricular hemorrhage, or skull fracture, and the patients were categorized according to the main neurological diagnosis. The patients who could communicate by reading and writing were selected for PTSD check list (PCL) after informed consent form was taken.

PCL was the US-identified test items translated to Korean12. PCL had 17 questions, and each subject scored between one mark (no symptom) and five marks (severest symptom) according to their severity from own experience (Fig. 1). Each question referred to the PTSD symptoms such as intrusive recollect, upset by reminders, distressing dreams, physical reactions to reminders, avoid thoughts, avoid reminders, psychogenic amnesia, anhedonia, estrangement from others, psychic numbing, foreshortened future, sleep difficulty, irritability/anger, concentration impaired, hyper-vigilant, and exaggerated startle. PCL score was presented as sum of each item score, and the patients with a total score of 44 or more were classified as high-risk group14,19. The diagnosis of PTSD was followed the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, fourth-edifion diagnostic criteria: experiencing symptoms of recollection, avoidance and hyper-arousal for more than a month during the follow-up period12. During the same period, the improvements and changes in the symptoms were monitored, and the subjects who could not visit the hospital were monitored through telephone interviews.

The numbers of the PTSD-suspected patients in the high and low-risk groups were compared using the chi-square test, and the differences in their clinical features were investigated. For the comparison, SPSS 19.0 (SPSS Inc., Chicago, IL, USA) was used in the Mann-Whitney U test. Statistical significance was defined when p-value was lesser than 0.05.

RESULTS

Totally, 341 TBI patients were admitted during the period, and 71 mild TBI patients were met the inclusion criteria and completed the PTSD screening test and the follow-up process. Their mean age was 50.4 (range : 17–84) and 54 cases (76.1%) of them were male (Table 1). Mean follow-up period was 4.0 months (range : 2.2–8.0). Slip down was the most common injury mechanism with 37 cases (52.1%) after fall down, 16 cases (22.5%) after traffic accident, 8 cases (11.3%) with assault, and unknown traumatic event was 10 cases (14.1%). The main neurological diagnosis were followed as 18 cases (25.4%) with traumatic intracerebral hemorrhage (contusional hemorrhage), 16 cases (22.5%) with chronic subdural hematoma, 12 cases (16.9%) with acute subdural hematoma, 11 cases (15.5%) with epidural hematoma, 7 cases (9.9%) with skull fracture, 6 cases (8.5%) with traumatic subarachnoid hemorrhage, and a case (1.4%) with traumatic intraventricular hemorrhage. The insurance types were national health insurance in 54 cases (76.1%), automobile insurance in 11

![PTSD CheckList – Civilian Version (PCL-C)](image)

Fig. 1. Sheet of PTSD checklist. PTSD : post-traumatic stress disorder.
Table 1. Demographic data and characteristics in 71 patients with mild TBI including 2 PTSD cases

| Category               | No. of cases (%) | No. of PTSD cases |
|------------------------|------------------|-------------------|
| Sex                    |                  |                   |
| Male                   | 54 (76.1)        | 2 cases           |
| Female                 | 17 (23.9)        |                   |
| Trauma                 |                  |                   |
| Fall down              | 37 (52.1)        | 1 case            |
| Traffic accident       | 16 (22.5)        | 1 case            |
| Assault                | 8 (11.3)         |                   |
| Others                 | 10 (14.1)        |                   |
| Insurance type         |                  |                   |
| National health insurance| 54 (76.1)   | 1 case            |
| Automobile insurance   | 11 (15.5)        | 1 case            |
| Industrial accident insurance| 5 (7.0) |                   |
| None                   | 1 (1.4)          |                   |

TBI : traumatic brain injury, PTSD : post-traumatic stress disorder

Table 2. The main diagnosis of 71 patients with mild TBI

| Main neurosurgical diagnosis | No. of cases |
|------------------------------|--------------|
| Traumatic intracerebral hemorrhage* | 18 |
| Chronic subdural hematoma    | 16           |
| Acute subdural hematoma      | 12           |
| Epidural hematoma            | 11           |
| Skull fracture               | 7            |
| Traumatic subarachnoid hematoma | 6        |
| Traumatic intraventricular hematoma | 1 |

*contusional hemorrhage. TBI : traumatic brain injury

Fig. 2. Different incidence of PTSD according to the high and low-risk group (p=0.017). PTSD : post-traumatic stress disorder, PCL : PTSD checklist.

PTSD is a group of diseases that are observed in patients who experience a serious incident and then feel fear and anguish from repeated recollections of such incident, and waste their energy in escaping from such feelings. Accordingly, PTSD patients’ social activities are severely and adversely affected. PTSD was introduced by Da Costa when they described the mental anguish of people who had experienced the American Civil War. In 1980, PTSD was defined as a response to a post-traumatic stress; and since then, it has been used as a diagnostic criterion. It was not widely understood in Korea, however, until the Sampoong Department Collapse in 1995. During the clinical observations of the survivors of the collapse, the severity of PTSD drew attention. Since PTSD reflects the cultural backgrounds of the patient, its severity has often been neglected in Korea. In particular, only a few studies on PTSD after mild TBI have been conducted in Korea despite the high prevalence rate of mild TBI because mild TBI patients usually show favorable clinical courses.

It has been argued that PTSD cannot develop after TBI because of the impaired consciousness that is typically associated with TBI. It has been suggested that the loss of consciousness or memory that occurs with TBI precludes encoding of trauma-related memories. Some authors insist that if the trauma-related experience has not been encoded, one cannot have trauma-related memories that mediate re-experiencing PTSD symptoms. In particular, Sbordone insisted that TBI patients cannot suffer PTSD because the injury to the brain results in a temporary ‘shutting down’ of its ability to process and record...
ongoing events. Many authors suggest that PTSD is more likely to occur in less severely brain-injured individuals, and that it may occur in mild TBI cases. Inherent in this proposition is the assumption that anxiety that is causally related to the traumatic experience requires conscious recollections of the event.

According to the most recent studies, however, PTSD has also been observed in TBI patients with varying degrees of severity. One of the possible mechanisms of PTSD is the deterioration of the medial prefrontal cortex that regulates the function of the amygdala. The damage to the prefrontal networks due to the minor TBI may aggravate the functioning of these networks that are implicated in PTSD. Second, cognitive models of PTSD propose that the extent to which people catastrophize a traumatic experience and its aftermath is pivotal in fueling PTSD. This model assumes that trauma patients have adequate cognitive resources to use adaptive cognitive strategies for managing their traumatic experience. Minor TBI can damage the patient's cognitive resources and compromise his or her capacity to engage in the optimal cognitive strategies for managing the aftermath of a psychological trauma.

The prevalence of PTSD after a mild TBI is known to be 17-33%, similar to that after a non-TBI patients. Memory loss after a TBI is believed to seriously affect PTSD development. According to the study of Bryant on post-TBI and memory loss, which targeted 1167 trauma patients, PTSD was observed more often in TBI patients than the non-TBI patients, and the longer memory loss period was, the less PTSD developed.

PCL is a method of patient reporting of his or her own PTSD DSM-IV symptoms. It has been used to screen PTSD patients. There are two forms of PCL: PCL for the military and PCL for civilians. PCL is composed of 17 questions, the answers to which are scored from 1 to 5, and the total score is computed by simply adding all the scores. In this study, we used the civilian version, which is almost identical to the military version, except that it inquires about a “stressful experience from the past,” as opposed to military trauma. PCL is widely used as a self-rating screening test for trauma patients, which is conveniently used in clinical cases. Cut off value of PCL is still in debate. Conventionally, 50 has been considered cut off value for screening test for PTSD. Cut off value could be vary depending on the aims of the clinician or investigator, most of the reviewed studies recommended one or more cutting scores that often differ from conventions. Some authors chose cut scores to balance sensitivity and specificity whereas others recommended the cut score that offered the highest efficiency, although for others the rationale was not clear. Proposed cut scores are ranging from about 30 to 60. We decided 44 as cut off value which somewhat lower than conventional one to increase sensitivity. Our result shows that PCL had a specificity of 88.4% and sensitivity of 100% and it is similar to previous review if we decide 44 as cut off value.

Our study was done on mild TBI patients who were admitted and put under surgical observation for several days. Although the sample size was not large, about 14% (10 of 71) of the mild TBI patients were considered to have had a risk of PTSD development, and 20% of them (2 of 10) were diagnosed with PTSD. Although 60% of patients of high risk patients did not meet the PTSD diagnostic criteria, we come to know that they suffering various psychological problems after mild TBI trauma. In this study, a PCL screening test was conducted for mild TBI patients to prospectively investigate the development of PTSD. In Korea, mild TBI patients have received less clinical attention than moderate to severe TBI patients due to their comparatively favorable clinical courses, but the prevalence rate of PTSD after mild TBI is estimated, through our study, to be about 2.8%, and such a number, although not high, is not one that can be overlooked, and PCL was confirmed to be an helpful tool in screening for high-risk patients.

There are some limitations in our study. PCL method is based on patient self-reports, so the subjective clinical manifestations can be over- or under-evaluated. Also, the diagnoses were not made by a psychiatrist but were based on the DSM-IV diagnostic criteria by neurosurgeon, which may yield a discrepancy from the psychiatric diagnoses. Further studies on this issue may be needed in future studies.

CONCLUSION

PTSD could be suspected in about 2.8% of mild TBI patients reportedly admitted to a hospital. Although the prevalence of PTSD after mild TBI is not high, PCL is thought to be a good screening test that can predict PTSD development in mild TBI patients. Further studies that can overcome the limitations of this study may be needed in the future.

References
1. Bazarian JJ, McClung J, Shah MN, Cheng YT, Fleisher W, Kraus J: Mild traumatic brain injury in the United States, 1998–2000. Brain Inj 19: 85-91, 2005
2. Blanchard EB, Jones-Alexander J, Buckley TC, Forneris CA: Psychometric properties of the PTSD Checklist (PCL). Behav Res Ther 34: 669-673, 1996
3. Bryant RA: Disentangling mild traumatic brain injury and stress reactions. N Engl J Med 358: 525-527, 2008
4. Bryant RA, Creamer M, O'Donnell M, Silove D, Clark CR, McFarlane AC: Post-traumatic amnesia and the nature of post-traumatic stress disorder after mild traumatic brain injury. J Int Neuropsychol Soc 15: 862-867, 2009
5. Bryant RA, Harvey AG: Avoidant coping style and post-traumatic stress following motor vehicle accidents. Behav Res Ther 33: 631-635, 1995
6. Bryant RA, Harvey AG: Posttraumatic stress reactions in volunteer firefighters. J Trauma Stress 9: 51-62, 1996
7. Bryant RA, Harvey AG: Traumatic memories and pseudomemories in posttraumatic stress disorder. Appl Cogn Psychol 12: 81-88, 1998
8. Charney DS, Deutch AV, Krystal JH, Southwick SM, Davis M: Psychobiologic mechanisms of posttraumatic stress disorder. Arch Gen Psychiatry 50: 295-305, 1993
9. Da Costa J: Art. I.-On irritable Heart; a clinical study of a form of func
tional cardiac disorder and its consequences. Am J Med Sci 121 : 2-52, 1871
10. Ehlers A, Clark DM : A cognitive model of posttraumatic stress disor-
der. Behav Res Ther 38 : 319-345, 2000
11. Engleder J, Hall K, Stimpson T, Chaffin S : Mild traumatic brain injury in an insured population : subjective complaints and return to employ-
ment. Brain Inj 6 : 161-166, 1992
12. Foa EB : Post-traumatic Stress Diagnostic Scale (PDS). Minneapolis : National Computer Systems, 1995
13. Harvey AG, Bryant RA : The relationship between acute stress disorder and posttraumatic stress disorder : a 2-year prospective evaluation. J Consult Clin Psychol 67 : 985-988, 1999
14. Hoge CW, McGurk D, Thomas JL, Cox AL, Engel CC, Castro CA : Mild traumatic brain injury in U.S. Soldiers returning from Iraq. N Engl J Med 358 : 453-463, 2008
15. King NS : PTSD and traumatic brain injury : folklore and fact? Brain Inj 22 : 1-5, 2008
16. Landre N, Poppe CJ, Davis N, Schmaus B, Hobbs SE : Cognitive functioning and postconcussive symptoms in trauma patients with and without mild TBI. Arch Clin Neuropsychol 21 : 255-273, 2006
17. Lee MS, Lee JS, Kwak DI : Severity of psychiatric symptoms in survivors of the sampoong accident. J Korean Med Assoc 40 : 86-96, 1997
18. Mayou R, Bryant B, Duthie R : Psychiatric consequences of road traffic accidents. BMJ 307 : 647-651, 1993
19. McDonald SD, Calhoun PS : The diagnostic accuracy of the PTSD checklist : a critical review. Clin Psychol Rev 30 : 976-987, 2010
20. McMillan TM, Williams WH, Bryant R : Post-traumatic stress disorder and traumatic brain injury : A review of causal mechanisms, assessment, and treatment. Neuropsychol Rehabil 13 : 149-164, 2003
21. Rattok J, Boake C, Bonkte CF : Do patients with mild brain injuries have posttraumatic stress disorder, too? J Head Trauma Rehabil 11 : 95-102, 1996
22. Sbordone RJ : Distinguishing traumatic brain injury from posttraumatic stress disorder. The Neurolaw Letter 9 : 3, 1992
23. Sbordone RJ, Liter JC : Mild traumatic brain injury does not produce post-traumatic stress disorder. Brain Inj 9 : 405-412, 1995
24. Schneiderman AI, Braver ER, Kang HK : Understanding sequelae of injury mechanisms and mild traumatic brain injury incurred during the conflicts in Iraq and Afghanistan : persistent postconcussive symptoms and posttraumatic stress disorder. Am J Epidemiol 167 : 1446-1452, 2008
25. Shindo T, Matsumoto Y, Wang Q, Kawai N, Tamiya T, Nagao S : Differ-
ces in the neuronal stem cells survival, neuronal differentiation and neurological improvement after transplantation of neural stem cells between mild and severe experimental traumatic brain injury. J Med Invest 53 : 42-51, 2006
26. Vaishnavi S, Rao V, Fann JR : Neuropsychiatric problems after traumatic brain injury : unraveling the silent epidemic. Psychosomatics 50 : 198-205, 2009
27. Weathers FW, Litz BT, Herman DS, Huska JA, Keane TM : The PTSD Checklist (PCL) : reliability, validity, and diagnostic utility. San Antonio : The International Society for Traumatic Stress Studies, 1993
28. Yehuda R : Post-traumatic stress disorder. N Engl J Med 346 : 108-114, 2002