Nitrilotriacetic acid enhanced lead accumulation in Athyrium wardii (Hook.) Makino by modifying rhizosphere characteristics

Yunhong Zhang  
Sichuan Agricultural University

Huagang Huang  
Sichuan Agricultural University

Haiying Yu  
Sichuan Agricultural University

Juan Zhan  
Chinese Academy of Sciences

Daihua Ye  
Sichuan Agricultural University

Zicheng Zheng  
Sichuan Agricultural University

Xizhou Zhang  
Sichuan Agricultural University

Yongdong Wang  
Sichuan Agricultural University

Tingxuan Li (litinx@263.net)  
Sichuan Agricultural University

Research Article

Keywords: Nitrilotriacetic acid, Dissolved organic carbon, Soil enzyme activity, Microbial activity, Athyrium wardii (Hook.) Makino

DOI: https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-436736/v1

License: This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. Read Full License
Abstract

Chelant-assisted phytoremediation may modify plant rhizosphere, which is closely relevant to heavy metal (HM) accumulation in plants. This work focused on the effects of nitrilotriacetic acid (NTA) on rhizosphere characteristics to investigate the mechanism of lead (Pb) accumulation in *Athyrium wardii* (Hook.) Makino with exposure to 800 mg kg$^{-1}$ Pb. After NTA application, Pb accumulation in the underground part of *A. wardii* increased by 14.3%, accompanying with some changes for the rhizosphere soils. Soil pH decreased by 0.37 and the dissolved organic carbon (DOC) content in the rhizosphere soils significantly increased by 7.6%. The urease, acid phosphatase and catalase activities in the rhizosphere soils significantly increased by 104.8%, 19.7% and 27.1%, respectively. However, a slight inhibition on microbial activities was observed in the rhizosphere of *A. wardii* after NTA application. Soil respiration decreased by 8.9% and microbial biomass carbon decreased by 8.9% in the rhizosphere soils, indicating that NTA addition recruited some microorganisms to maintain rhizosphere functions in Pb-contaminated soils, while inhibited others with low tolerance to Pb. Results suggest that lower pH, more DOC exudation and higher soil enzyme activities after NTA application contributed to the increase of Pb accumulation in *A. wardii*. This study gave some preliminary evidence for NTA-assisted Pb remediation by *A. wardii* by modifying rhizosphere characteristics.

1 Introduction

Lead (Pb) is one of the abundant elements and most hazardous heavy metal (HM) in the environment. A review published by Li et al. (2014) points out that Pb is the second largest inorganic pollutants in mines across China. Pb can persistently exist in soils for decades or even centuries with a half-life up to 740–5900 years (Saifullah et al., 2015; Attinti et al., 2017). Pb is therefore a great threat to food chain and human health, causing a range of diseases (Tighe et al., 2019). Phytostabilization, with native tolerant plants, has been proven to be an economic and environmental strategy for Pb remediation (Anjum et al., 2014; Khalid et al., 2017), showing great applicability in the vegetation development and restoration of mining areas (Dary et al., 2010; Sarwar et al., 2017).

In order to enhance Pb accumulation in plant, lots of researches have proved the possibility and practicability of using biodegradable chelators, such as nitrilotriacetic acid (NTA), which shows high efficiency in promoting Pb uptake by *Brassica carinata* (Quartacci et al., 2007), water spinach (Hseu et al., 2013), *Siegesbeckia orientalis* L. (Lan et al., 2013), *Daucus carota* (Babaeian et al., 2016) and *Scirpus triqueter* (Hu et al., 2017). This strategy makes use of NTA to desorb HM from soil particles into soil solutions, thus enhancing the availability and mobility of HM in soils and improving its uptake by plants (Shahid et al., 2012).

Rhizosphere, a dynamic hotspot for the interaction of plant roots, soils and microbes, is of vital importance in altering HM availability. Chelating agent application alters the dynamic characteristics of rhizosphere, including soil pH, cation exchange capacity, organic compounds and microbe, thus influencing HM availability (Li et al., 2011; Zhan et al., 2018). Soil pH is always regarded as the most
important factor affecting HM availability (Tian et al., 2018). Soil pH decline could be attributed to the excretion of root exudates, thus increasing the content of dissolved organic carbon (DOC) in the rhizosphere soils (Li et al., 2013). Microorganisms, another rhizosphere processes, is of vital importance in plant absorbing of HM. The microorganism colonized in the rhizosphere promote plant growth and affect the availability of HM in soil, thereby improving HM accumulation in plant (Yang et al., 2013; Ayangbenro and Babalola, 2017; Wang et al., 2019). Some microorganisms are sensitive to HM with low tolerance and thereby a decrease on microbial activities, and some high metal resistant microorganisms can survive to keep function on plant growth and HM uptake by plants under metal stress (Shi and Ma, 2017; Antoniadis et al., 2017; He et al., 2019). As the most active soil components, soil enzymes are involved in metabolic process, soil nutrient cycling and the purification of pollutants (Yang et al., 2013; Wang et al., 2019). Some enzymes, such as urease, catalase and acidic phosphatase are most common enzymes and widely accumulated in soils. These enzymes are extracellular enzyme and derived from plant roots and microorganisms, which are closely related to the transformation, accumulation and decomposition of soil organic nitrogen, carbon, phosphorus (Cang et al., 2009; Huang et al., 2016). They are involved in many biochemical processes, subsequently affecting HM availability in the rhizosphere soils by changing pH, complexation and oxidation-reduction reactions (Antoniadis et al., 2017). These researches do prove that these rhizosphere processes play a key role in HM availability and mobility in rhizosphere soils. So, whether and how NTA application modify the rhizosphere soils and, consequently, HM availability in soils? Some work therefore has been processed. It was found that the addition of NTA leads to soil acidification by the exchange of hydrogen ion (Saifullah et al., 2015; Yu et al., 2020). Chelating agents may have a negative effect on microbial growth and enzyme activities. For example, ethylene diamine tetraacetic acid (EDTA) seriously decreased the bacterial count and inhibited catalase and urease activity in soil of S. nigrum (Han et al., 2019). Yet, the processes of how NTA affect rhizosphere characteristics and HM availability in soil associated with HM accumulation in plants still need more investigation.

Athyrium wardii (Hook.) Makino, a perennial fern in Athyriaceae family, was found in a Pb-Zn mining with high tolerance to Pb with extensive roots. It has been proven to be an appropriate plant for the phytostabilization of Pb-contaminated soils (Zou et al. 2011; Zhao et al. 2016). Previous study pointed out that NTA could be useful as a potential chelator to enhance Pb phytostabilization by A. wardii. Meanwhile, 2 mmol kg$^{-1}$ NTA applied for 1 week was a better alternative for improving Pb accumulation in A. wardii (Zhan et al. 2019). Although previous works have elucidated that NTA addition improved Pb accumulation in A. wardi, what happened to rhizosphere environment in response to NTA associated with Pb accumulation is still unclear. We hypothesize that NTA application may modify rhizosphere characteristics to enhance Pb availability in soils, resulting in a great increase of Pb accumulation in A. wardii. Therefore, a pot experiment was implemented to investigate the changes of soil pH, DOC, microbial activities and enzyme activities in the rhizosphere soils of A. wardii after NTA addition, which is beneficial to reveal the mechanism of NTA-enhanced Pb accumulation in A. wardii.

2 Materials And Methods
2.1 Soil and plant preparation

Seedlings of A. wardii were gathered from an old Pb-Zn mine area located in Yingjing, Ya’an, Sichuan Province, PR China (102°31′E, 29°47′N). After separating into similar size, the seedlings of A. wardii were pre-cultured in vermiculite with 1/4 Hoagland solution for 14 days. Then, uniform and well-growing plants were prepared for transplantation.

Grey fluvo-aquic soils and humic substances used for soil preparation, were collected from Dujiangyan, Sichuan Province, PR China. Grey fluvo-aquic soils were obtained from 0- to 20-cm surface soil of farmland uncontaminated with Pb. Humic substances derived from plant litter. Grey fluvo-aquic soils and humic substances were fully mixed (2:3, w/w). After 1 month of homogenization, the soil properties were as follows, total nitrogen of 1.97 g kg$^{-1}$ (TN), available nitrogen of 39 mg kg$^{-1}$ (AN), organic matter of 42.4 g kg$^{-1}$ (OM), available phosphorus of 28.6 mg kg$^{-1}$ (AP), available potassium of 113 mg kg$^{-1}$ (AK), and pH of 5.38. The Pb treatment were homogeneity added with 800 mg kg$^{-1}$ Pb, added as Pb(NO$_3$)$_2$ solutions, and the available Pb after 1 month of homogenization was 89.3 mg kg$^{-1}$.

2.2 Pot experiment

The pot experiment comprised five treatments: (1) CK, (2) NTA2, (3) Pb800, (4) NTA2 + Pb800, (5) NTA2 + Pb800-NP presented in Table 1. Each treatment is with four replicates, and totally 20 pots were arranged randomly. Each pot (5 L) was filled with 5 kg of soils prepared before. The pot experiment was imposed in the glass room with rainproof facilities and natural light in Sichuan Agricultural University, Chengdu, China.

| Treatment     | NTA  | Pb  | Planting |
|---------------|------|-----|----------|
| CK            | -    | -   | +        |
| NTA2          | +    | -   | +        |
| Pb800         | -    | +   | +        |
| Pb800 + NTA2  | +    | +   | +        |
| Pb800 + NTA2-NP | +  | +   | -        |

The plus (+) means “with”. The minus (-) means “without”. CK is for the treatment with planting but without NTA and Pb application. NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg$^{-1}$ of NTA application but without Pb application. Pb800 is for the treatment with planting and 800 mg kg$^{-1}$ of Pb application but without NTA application. Pb800 + NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg$^{-1}$ of NTA and 800 mg kg$^{-1}$ of Pb application. Pb800 + NTA2-NP is for the treatment with 2 mmol kg$^{-1}$ of NTA and 800 mg kg$^{-1}$ of Pb application but without planting.

After 30-day of plant growth, 1 L of deionized water dissolved with 2 mmol kg$^{-1}$ NTA was applied into pot at once. In the treatments with no NTA, 1 L of deionized water took place of NTA. Each pot was irrigated
with the same amount of deionized water per 3 days to maintain water holding capacity of 70% approximately in plant growth period. All pots were placed at random and switched in the stochastic position to keep a coincident growth condition.

After adding NTA for 7 days, the plants were harvested and separated into aboveground and underground part. The underground part was soaked in 20 mmol L$^{-1}$ Na$_2$-EDTA for a quarter to remove Pb sucked on the surface. Then all samples were washed cleanly by deionized water and dried at 75°C to a constant weight. Subsequently, the dried plant samples were ground and stored for Pb analysis. Rhizosphere soils were collected by brushing soils tightly adhering to the roots (approximately 2mm to the root). Some soil samples were stored at 4°C for the analysis of soil respiration, microbial biomass carbon (MBC) and soil enzymes. These indicators were determined within a week. The other soil samples were naturally air-dried, ground, and sieved through 1-mm and 0.15-mm mesh for Pb determination.

2.3 Plant analysis

Determination of Pb in plants was according to Zhao et al. (2016). In short, HNO$_3$ and HClO$_4$ (5:1, v/v) were used to digest about 0.3 g plant samples. After cooling down, the digested solutions were moved to 50 mL volumetric flask and made up to volume, and then filtered through 0.22 µm membrane filters. Finally, a flame atomic absorption spectrophotometry (AA900T, Perkin Elmer, America) was used to determine Pb concentrations in the filtrates.

2.4 Soil analysis

2.4.1 Soil chemical properties

The analysis of soil chemical properties, including pH, TN, AN, AP, AK, and OM were followed by the measures of the International Organization for Standardization (Margesin and Schinner, 2005).

For the determination of total Pb in soils, HNO$_3$, HClO$_4$ and HF (5:1:1, v/v/v) were applied to digest about 0.1 g soil samples by a similar method to plant. Determination of soil available Pb was extracted with diethylenetriaminepentaacetic acid (DTPA) solutions, as described by Zhao et al. (2016).

The DOC was measured based on Jones and Willett (2006). Firstly, soils were extracted with deionized water with a water-to-soil ratio of 5:1 (v/w), and then spined at 200 rpm for 16 h at 25°C. Following this, the suspension was centrifuged for 25 min at 10,000×g. After filtering through 0.45 µm membrane filter, the filtrates for DOC concentrations were analyzed by the total organic carbon analyzer (MultiN/C2100TOC, Analytik Jena AG, Germany).

2.4.2 Soil enzyme activities

Soil enzymes were measured following the method mentioned by Cang et al. (2009). In brief, urease, catalase and acidic phosphatase activity were measured following the method of sodium phenol - sodium hypochlorite colorimetry, permanganimetric method and P - nitrophenyl disodium phosphate colorimetric method, respectively.
2.4.3 Soil microbial activities

As described by Vance et al. (1987), procedures were utilized to measure MBC. Fresh soil samples of 10 g were placed in a vacuum desiccator and full of gasified ethanol-free CHCl₃ at room temperature. After fumigation at 25°C for 24 h in the darkness, removing residual CHCl₃ firstly, then the soil samples were extracted with 0.5 M K₂SO₄, and shaken for 30 min at 25°C on a thermostatic oscillator. Prior to analysis, the extracts were filtered through 0.45 µm membrane filter and subsequently were assayed by the total organic carbon analyzer (MultiN/C2100TOC, Analytik Jena AG, Germany). MBC was calculated as the difference in withdrawable organic carbon between the fumigated and unfumigated soils, using a conversion factor of kc (0.45).

Soil respiration was referred to method of Lu et al. (2013) and determined by measuring the content of carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions for incubation at 25°C within 24 hours.

2.5 Statistical analysis

The mean data originated from four replicates in this study were calculated. Descriptive statistics were performed using SPSS 22.0. Duncan's multiple range test was used to compare the means at a significant level of p < 0.05. All values were processed using origin 9.1 and Excel 2016.

3 Results

3.1 Pb accumulation

The biomass of A. wardii both in aboveground and underground part treated with NTA2 showed no significant changes compared with CK (Fig. 1). The biomass in aboveground and underground part of A. wardii grown in Pb-contaminated soils significantly decreased compared with CK. NTA showed no effect on the biomass of A. wardii both in aboveground part and underground part in Pb-contaminated soils.

In general, NTA application didn't affect Pb accumulation in aboveground part of A. wardii in Pb-contaminated soils (Fig. 2). Pb accumulation in underground part of A. wardii with Pb800 + NTA2 increased by 14.3% compared with Pb800, indicating NTA promoted the Pb accumulation in underground part of A. wardii.

3.2 Pb availability in the rhizosphere soils

The concentration of available Pb in the rhizosphere soils with Pb800 + NTA2 significantly decreased by 23.6% compared with Pb800 (Fig. 3). The concentration of available Pb with the treatment of Pb800 + NTA2-NP was 1.35 times higher than that of Pb800 + NTA2, indicating that NTA application promoted Pb mobilization and Pb depletion in the rhizosphere soils due to the uptake by A. wardii.

3.3 pH and DOC in the rhizosphere soils
There was no significant difference for soil pH between the treatments of Pb800 and CK (Fig. 4a). In general, NTA application significantly reduced the pH of rhizosphere soils compared with CK. In Pb-contaminated soils, the pH in rhizosphere soils remarkably decreased by 0.37 units after NTA addition.

There was no difference for DOC in the rhizosphere soils of *A. wardii* between CK and NTA2 (Fig. 4b). With the exposure to 800 mg kg\(^{-1}\) Pb, the DOC in rhizosphere soils of *A. wardii* significantly increased by 7.6% after NTA application. The DOC in the rhizosphere soil treated with Pb800 + NTA2 was 1.52 times higher than that of Pb800 + NTA2-NP.

### 3.4 Soil enzyme activities in the rhizosphere soils

In general, NTA application significantly increased the activities of urease, catalase and acid phosphatase in the rhizosphere soils of *A. wardii* (Fig. 5). When exposed to 800 mg kg\(^{-1}\) Pb, urease, catalase and acid phosphatase activities in the rhizosphere soils significantly increased by 104.8%, 27.1% and 19.7% after NTA application, respectively. The urease and acid phosphatase activities in the rhizosphere soils treated with Pb800 + NTA2 significantly increased compared with Pb800 + NTA2-NP.

### 3.5 Microbial activities in the rhizosphere soils

Soil respiration showed no significant difference between the treatments of NTA2 and CK (Fig. 6A). Soil respiration in the rhizosphere soils treated with Pb800 significantly reduced by 19.6% compared with CK. Soil respiration in the rhizosphere soils significantly reduced by 8.9% after adding NTA in Pb-contaminated soil. Soil respiration in the rhizosphere soils in the treatment of Pb800 + NTA2 significantly increased by 21.1% in comparison with Pb800 + NTA2-NP. The same trend was observed for MBC (Fig. 6B). When exposed to 800 mg kg\(^{-1}\) Pb, MBC significantly decreased by 16.2% after NTA application. MBC in the rhizosphere soils treated with Pb800 + NTA2 significantly increased by 26.7% compared with Pb800 + NTA2-NP.

The qCO\(_2\) is the ratio of soil respiration and MBC (Fig. 6C). There is no significant difference for qCO\(_2\) in the rhizosphere soils of *A. wardii* between the treatments of NTA2 and CK. qCO\(_2\) in the rhizosphere soils of *A. wardii* treated with Pb800 was 1.37 times higher than that of CK. qCO\(_2\) showed no significant difference between the treatments of Pb800 + NTA2 and Pb800.

### 4 Discussion

In chelating agent-assisted phytoremediation process, it’s the critical point that chelating agents promote the accumulation of HM in plants (Saifullah et al., 2015; Sarwar et al., 2017; Yu et al., 2020). NTA shows great practicability for assisting Pb accumulation in plants due to its high chelating ability, which has been applied successfully to a variety of plants, such as *Festuca arundinacea* (Zhao et al., 2013), *Daucus carota* (Babaeian et al., 2016) and *Scirpus triqueter* (Hu et al. 2017). In this study, NTA application enhanced Pb accumulation in the roots of *A. wardii* grown in Pb-contaminated soils, keeping consistent
with the previous studies of Zhao et al. (2016) and Zhan et al. (2019), indicating that it’s an effective measure to add NTA for improving Pb uptake in *A. wardii*.

HM accumulation in plants mainly depends on the availability of HM in soils (Khalid et al., 2017; Zhang et al., 2019). According to our results, Pb availability in the rhizosphere soils of *A. wardii* dramatically changed among different treatments. Interestingly, Pb availability in the rhizosphere soils significantly decreased with NTA addition under Pb exposure, whereas Pb accumulation in roots significantly increased and Pb availability with Pb800 + NTA2-NP significantly increased compared with Pb800 + NTA2. It indicates a Pb mobilization and therefore enhanced Pb availability in the rhizosphere soils and also Pb uptake by roots of *A. wardii* after NTA application. NTA application improved Pb availability in the rhizosphere soils. NTA reduced the adsorption of Pb and other HM on pure minerals and soils, resulting in an increase for exchangeable Pb and Pb bound to carbonates along with a decrease for Pb bound to organic matters and Fe-Mn oxides (Yu et al., 2020). Thus, after NTA application, more Pb existed in a rapidly available form in soils, thereby enhancing Pb accumulation in *A. wardii*.

It is well known that rhizosphere characteristics are closely related to HM mobilization in soils. Lower pH and more exudation of DOC have contributed to mobilizing HM (Li et al., 2013; Han et al., 2019). Soil pH is often emphasized as an important factor on solubility and speciation of HM in soils, particularly in soil solutions (Tian et al., 2018; Yu et al., 2020). The result showed that pH in the rhizosphere soils of *A. wardii* after NTA application significantly decreased. The addition of NTA leads to soil acidification by the exchange of hydrogen ion, thus increasing Pb availability (Begum et al., 2012; Zhan et al., 2019). The plantation of *A. wardii* further reduced soil pH. This may be attributed to root exudates, which could be proved by the increase of DOC in the rhizosphere with the plantation of *A. wardii*. Meanwhile, an interesting phenomenon is that NTA application stimulated the production of DOC. Similar DOC increase was also found in the study of Usman et al. (2013) after NTA and EDTA application. The increase of DOC in the presence of chelating agents is due to its high affinity for organic substances. Meanwhile, DOM is a mixture composed of aromatic and aliphatic hydrocarbon structures with many functional groups (e.g. carboxyl, amidogen, hydroxyl and so on), which show high affinity with HM, ulteriorly improving HM solubility and availability and thus facilitating HM uptake by plant (Li et al., 2013; Borggaard et al., 2019).

In addition, the increased organic compounds in the rhizosphere soils also increase enzyme activities (Bárta et al., 2014; Huang et al., 2016). The activities of urease, acid phosphatase and catalase in the rhizosphere soils of *A. wardii* significantly increased after NTA addition in Pb-contaminated soils, possibly due to the increase of DOC. The increase of enzyme activities was prone to increase Pb availability, resulting in improving Pb accumulation in plant. They are involved in nutrient cycling, which related to plant growth and thus resulting in an increase of HM accumulation (Xian et al., 2015; Hou et al., 2017). What’s more, they can combine with HM ions by complexation and thereby improving HM availability directly (Antoniadis et al., 2017).

NTA-enhanced Pb availability in the rhizosphere soils was closely related to NTA-metal complexes, with which microorganisms have to endure and cope (Usman et al., 2013; Huang et al. 2015). MBC can be
regarded to reflect soil microbial biomass and soil quality. As the key process of CO\(_2\) transport from terrestrial ecosystems to the atmosphere, soil respiration is evaluated to assess HM effects on soil microbe (Zhou et al. 2017; Zhan et al., 2018). qCO\(_2\) represents the bioenergetic status of microbial biomass. Generally, qCO\(_2\) shows higher value with more serious HM pollution (Parelho et al., 2016; Zhou et al., 2017). In this study, soil respiration, MBC and qCO\(_2\) in the rhizosphere soils of A. wardii demonstrated no apparent difference after NTA application in non-contaminated soils, indicating that NTA itself had no effect on microbial activities. However, a slight inhibition on microbial activities was observed after NTA application in Pb-contaminated soils. This was mainly attributed to the mobilization of Pb by NTA application. Some soil microorganisms are sensitive to heavy metals with low tolerance, which are now known to select only a small subset of the actual soil population. Along with Pb mobilization in the rhizosphere, the mobile HM could combine with the active protein groups and suppresses the growth of microorganisms (Yang et al., 2013; Xian et al., 2015; Ayangbenro and Babalola, 2017). Therefore, increased release of Pb ions after NTA application showed toxicity to some soil microorganisms, thus inhibiting microbial growth and activity. Functional microorganisms retained as the enzyme activities were stimulated, indicating that rhizosphere-competent microorganisms can tolerate high concentrations of HMs and also have potential to adapt to the selective rhizosphere environment. The NTA-induced Pb mobilization selected some keystone taxa representing stable groups to maintain rhizosphere functions. Rhizosphere processes are complex and a further study on rhizosphere microbial community is needed to get a deeper understanding on the role of rhizosphere microbes in the processes of Pb remediation and restoration by A. wardii with NTA application.

5 Conclusion

NTA application altered rhizosphere characteristics of A. wardii grown in Pb-contaminated soils. Reduced pH, increased exudation of DOC and higher enzyme activities were observed after NTA application, making a great contribution to the enhancement of Pb accumulation in A. wardii. However, a slight inhibition on microbial activities was observed in the rhizosphere of A. wardii after NTA application. This is possibly because that NTA addition recruited some microorganisms to maintain rhizosphere functions in Pb-contaminated soil, while inhibited others with low tolerance to Pb. NTA is an effective chelating agent for improving Pb accumulation in A. wardii. Further experiments are necessary to explore the changes of rhizosphere microbial community to get an insight on the role of microbes in the rhizosphere processes of NTA-assisted phytoremediation by A. wardii in Pb-contaminated soils.

Declarations

Ethical approval and consent to participate

Not applicable.

Consent for publication
Availability of data and materials

The data and materials will be available on request.

Competing interests

The authors declare no conflict of interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Funding

This work was financially supported by the National Key Research and Development Programs (2018YFC1802605).

Authors contributions

Tingxuan Li contributed to the experiment design and paper revisions. Yunhong Zhang contributed to the pot experiment, chemical and data analysis and writing. Huagang Huang contributed to the collection of plant seedlings and chemical analysis. Haiying Yu contributed to chemical and data analysis. Juan Zhan contributed to chemical analysis and paper revisions. Daihua Ye contributed to paper revisions. Zicheng Zheng, Xizhou Zhang and Yongdong Wang contributed to the collection of plant seedlings and data analysis.

References

Anjum, N.A., Umar, S., Iqbal, M., 2014. Assessment of cadmium accumulation, toxicity, and tolerance in Brassicaceae and Fabaceae plants-implications for phytoremediation. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res., 21(17): 10286-10293. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-014-2889-5

Antoniadis V., Levizou E., Shaheen S.M., et al, 2017. Trace elements in the soil-plant interface: Phytoavailability, translocation, and phytoremediation-A review. Earth-Sci. Rev., 171: 621-645. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2017.06.005

Attinti, R., Barrett, K.R., Datta R, et al, 2017. Ethylenediaminedisuccinic acid (EDDS) enhances phytoextraction of lead by vetiver grass from contaminated residential soils in a panel study in the field. Environ. Pollut., 225: 524-533. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.01.088
Ayangbenro, A.S., Babalola, O.O., 2017. A new strategy for heavy metal polluted environments: a review of microbial biosorbents. Int. J. Env. Res. Pub. He., 14: 94. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph14010094

Babaeian, E., Homaee, M., Rahnemaie, R., 2016. Chelate-enhanced phytoextraction and phytostabilization of lead-contaminated soils by carrot (Daucus carota). Arch. Agron. Soil Sci., 62(3): 339-358. https://doi.org/10.1080/03650340.2015.1060320

Bárta, J., Šlajsová, P., Tahovská, K., et al, 2014. Different temperature sensitivity and kinetics of soil enzymes indicate seasonal shifts in C, N and P nutrient stoichiometry in acid forest soil. Biogeochemistry, 117: 525-537. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-013-9898-1

Begum, Z.A., Rahman, I.M.M., Tate, Y., et al, 2012. Remediation of toxic metal contaminated soil by washing with biodegradable aminopolycarboxylate chelants. Chemosphere, 87: 1161-1170. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2012.02.032

Borggaard, O.K., Holm, P.E., Strobel, B.W., 2019. Potential of dissolved organic matter (DOM) to extract As, Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Ni, Pb and Zn from polluted soils: A review. Geoderma, 343: 235-246. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2019.02.041

Cang, L., Zhou, D.M., Wang, Q.Y., et al, 2009. Effects of electrokinetic treatment of a heavy metal contaminated soil on soil enzyme activities. J. Hazard. Mater., 172(2-3): 1602-1607. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2009.08.033

Dary, M., Chamber-Pérez, M.A., Palomares, A.J., et al, 2010. “In situ” phytostabilisation of heavy metal polluted soils using Lupinus luteus inoculated with metal resistant plant-growth promoting rhizobacteria. J. Hazard. Mater., 177(1–3): 323-330. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2009.12.035

Gao, Y., Miao, C.Y., Xia, J., et al, 2012. Plant diversity reduces the effect of multiple heavy metal pollution on soil enzyme activities and microbial community structure. Front. Env. Sci. Eng., 6: 213-223. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11783-011-0345-z

Han, R., Dai, H.P., Zhan, J., et al, 2019. Clean extracts from accumulator efficiently improved Solanum nigrum L. accumulating Cd and Pb in soil. J. Clean. Prod., 239: 118055. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118055

He, D., Cui, J., Gao, M., et al, 2019. Effects of soil amendments applied on cadmium availability, soil enzyme activity, and plant uptake in contaminated purple soil. Sci. Total Environ., 654: 1364-1371. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.11.059

Hou, D.D., Wang, K., Liu, T., et al, 2017. Unique rhizosphere micro-characteristics facilitate phytoextraction of multiple metals in moil by the hyperaccumulating plant Sedum alfredii. Environ. Sci. Technol., 51: 5675-5684. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.6b06531
Hseu, Z.Y., Jien, S.H., Wang, S.H., et al, 2013. Using EDDS and NTA for enhanced phytoextraction of Cd by water spinach. J. Environ. Manage., 117: 58-64. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2012.12.028

Hu, X.X., Liu, X.Y., Zhang, X.Y., et al, 2017. Increased accumulation of Pb and Cd from contaminated soil with *Scirpus triqueter* by the combined application of NTA and APG. Chemosphere, 188: 397-402. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2017.08.173

Huang, D.L., Xu, J.J., Zeng, G.M., et al, 2015. Influence of exogenous lead pollution on enzyme activities and organic matter degradation in the surface of river sediment. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res., 22(15): 11422-11435. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-015-4375-0

Huang, S.P., Jia, X., Zhao, Y.H., et al, 2016. Response of *Robinia pseudoacacia* L. rhizosphere microenvironment to Cd and Pb contamination and elevated temperature. Appl. Soil. Ecol., 108: 269-277. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2016.09.002

Jones, D.L., Willett, V.B., 2006. Experimental evaluation of methods to quantify dissolved organic nitrogen (DON) and dissolved organic carbon (DOC) in soil. Soil Biol. Biochem., 38: 991-999. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2005.08.012

Khalid, S., Shahid, M., Niazi, N.K., et al, 2017. A comparison of technologies for remediation of heavy metal contaminated soils. J. Geochem. Explor., 182: 247-268. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gexplo.2016.11.021

Lan, J.C., Zhang, S.R., Lin, H.C., et al, 2013. Efficiency of biodegradable EDDS, NTA and APAM on enhancing the phytoextraction of cadmium by *Siegesbeckia orientalis* L. grown in Cd-contaminated soils. Chemosphere, 91: 1362-1367. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.01.116

Li, T.Q., Di, Z.Z., Islam, E., et al, 2011. Rhizosphere characteristics of zinc hyperaccumulator *Sedum alfredii* involved in zinc accumulation. J. Hazard. Mater., 185, 818-823. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2010.09.093

Li, T.Q., Tao, Q., Han, X., et al, 2013. Effects of elevated CO$_2$ on rhizosphere characteristics of Cd/Zn hyperaccumulator *Sedum alfredii*. Sci. Total Environ., 454-455: 510-516. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2013.03.054

Li, Z.Y., Ma, Z.W., Kuijp, T.J.V.D., et al, 2014. A review of soil heavy metal pollution from mines in China: pollution and health risk assessment. Sci. Total Environ., 468-469: 843-853. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2013.08.090

Lu, M., Xu, K., Chen, J., 2013. Effect of pyrene and cadmium on microbial activity and community structure in soil. Chemosphere, 91: 491-497. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2012.12.009
Margesin, R., Schinner, F., 2005. Manual of soil analysis—monitoring and assessing soil bioremediation. J. Chem. Phys., 90: 47-96. https://doi.org/10.1063/1.456601

Parelho, C., Rodrigues, A.S., Barreto, M.C., et al, 2016. Assessing microbial activities in metal contaminated agricultural volcanic soils - An integrative approach. Ecotox. Environ. Safe., 129: 242-249. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2016.03.019

Quartacci, M.F., Irtelli, B., Baker, A.J. M., et al, 2007. The use of NTA and EDDS for enhanced phytoextraction of metals from a multiply contaminated soil by Brassica carinata. Chemosphere, 68: 1920-1928. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2007.02.058

Saifullah, Shahid, M., Zia-Ur-Rehman, M., et al, 2015. Phytoremediation of Pb-contaminated soils using synthetic chelates. Soil Remediation and Plants: 397-414. In: Khalid RH, Muhanmmad S, Münir Ö, Ahmet RM (eds). Soil remediation and plants. Elsevier, Amsterdam, pp 397-414. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-799937-1.00014-0

Sarwar, N., Imran, M., Shaheen, M.R., et al, 2017. Phytoremediation strategies for soils contaminated with heavy metals: modifications and future perspectives. Chemosphere, 171: 710-721. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2016.12.116

Shahid, M., Pinelli, E., Dumat, C., 2012. Review of Pb availability and toxicity to plants in relation with metal speciation; role of synthetic and natural organic ligands. J. Hazard. Mater., 219-220: 1-12. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2012.01.060

Shi, W., Ma, X., 2017. Effects of heavy metal Cd pollution on microbial activities in soil. Ann. Agr. Env. Med., 24(4): 722-725. https://doi.org/10.26444/aaem/80920

Tian, H., Fang, L., Duan, C., et al, 2018. Dominant factor affecting Pb speciation and the leaching risk among land-use types around Pb-Zn mine. Geoderma, 326: 123-132. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2018.04.016

Tighe, M., Beidinger, H., Knaub, C., et al, 2019. Risky bismuth: Distinguishing between lead contamination sources in soils. Chemosphere, 234: 297-301. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.06.077

Usman, A.R. A., Almaroai. Y.A., Ahmad. M., et al, 2013. Toxicity of synthetic chelators and metal availability in poultry manure amended Cd, Pb and As contaminated agricultural soil. J. Hazard. Mater., 262: 1022-1030. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2013.04.032

Vance, E.D., Brookes, P.C., Jenkinson, D.S., 1987. An extraction method for measuring soil microbial biomass C. Soil Biol. Biochem., 19: 703-707. https://doi.org/10.1016/0038-0717(87)90052-6

Wang, K., Liu, Y.H., Song, Z.G., et al, 2019. Effects of biodegradable chelator combination on potentially toxic metals leaching efficiency in agricultural soils. Ecotox. Environ. Safe., 182: 109399. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2019.109399
Xian, Y., Wang, M., Chen, W., 2015. Quantitative assessment on soil enzyme activities of heavy metal contaminated soils with various soil properties. Chemosphere, 139: 604-608. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2014.12.060

Yang, L., Wang, G., Cheng, Z., et al, 2013. Influence of the application of chelant EDDS on soil enzymatic activity and microbial community structure. J. Hazard. Mater., 262: 561-570. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2013.09.009

Yu, H.Y., Zhan, J., Zhang, Q.P., et al, 2020. NTA-enhanced Pb remediation efficiency by the phytostabilizer Athyrium wardii (Hook.) and associated Pb leaching risk. Chemosphere, 246: 125815. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2020.125815

Zhan, J., Li, T.X., Zhang, X.Z., et al, 2018. Rhizosphere characteristics of phytostabilizer Athyrium wardii (Hook.) involved in Cd and Pb accumulation. Ecotox. Environ. Safe., 148: 892-900. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2017.11.070

Zhan, J., Zhang, Q.P., Li, T.X., et al, 2019. Effects of NTA on Pb phytostabilization efficiency of Athyrium wardii (Hook.) grown in a Pb-contaminated soil. J. Soil. Sediment., 19: 3576-3584. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11368-019-02308-4

Zhang, Q.P., Zhan, J., Yu, H.Y., et al, 2019. Lead accumulation and soil microbial activity in the rhizosphere of the mining and non-mining ecotypes of Athyrium wardii (Hook.) Makino in adaptation to lead-contaminated soils. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res., 26(32): 32957-32966. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-019-06395-1

Zhao, L., Li, T.X., Yu, H.Y., et al, 2016. Effects of [S, S]-ethylenediaminedisuccinic acid and nitrilotriacetic acid on the efficiency of Pb phytostabilization by Athyrium wardii (Hook.) grown in Pb-contaminated soils. J. Environ. Manage., 182: 94-100. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2016.07.042

Zhao, S.L., Jia, L.N., Duo, L., 2013. The use of a biodegradable chelator for enhanced phytoextraction of heavy metals by Festuca arundinacea from municipal solid waste compost and associated heavy metal leaching. Bioresour. Technol., 129: 249-255. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2012.11.075

Zhou, H.M., Zhang, D.X., Wang, P., et al, 2017. Changes in microbial biomass and metabolic quotient with biochar addition to agricultural soils: a Meta-analysis. Agr. Ecosyst. Environ., 239: 80-89. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2017.01.006

Zhu, G.X., Xiao, H.Y., Guo. Q.J., et al, 2018. Heavy metal contents and enrichment characteristics of dominant plants in wasteland of the downstream of a lead-zinc mining area in Guangxi, Southwest China. Ecotox. Environ. Safe., 151: 266-271. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2018.01.011

Zou, T.J., Li, T.X., Zhang, X.Z., et al, 2011. Lead accumulation and tolerance characteristics of Athyrium wardii (Hook.) as a potential phytostabilizer. J. Hazard. Mater., 186: 683-689.
Table

Table 1 Experimental design.

| Treatment      | NTA | Pb  | Planting |
|----------------|-----|-----|----------|
| CK             | -   | -   | +        |
| NTA2           | +   | -   | +        |
| Pb800          | -   | +   | +        |
| Pb800+NTA2     | +   | +   | +        |
| PB800+NTA2-NP  | +   | +   | -        |

The plus (+) means “with”. The minus (-) means “without”. CK is for the treatment with planting but without NTA and Pb application. NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg-1 of NTA application but without Pb application. Pb800 is for the treatment with planting and 800 mg kg-1 of Pb application but without NTA application. Pb800+NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg-1 of NTA and 800 mg kg-1 of Pb application. Pb800+NTA2-NP is for the treatment with 2 mmol kg-1 of NTA and 800 mg kg-1 of Pb application but without planting.

Figures
Figure 1

Effect of NTA application on biomass in aboveground and underground part of A. wardii. CK is for the treatment with planting but without NTA and Pb application. NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg\(^{-1}\) of NTA application but without Pb application. Pb800 is for the treatment with planting and 800 mg kg\(^{-1}\) of Pb application but without NTA application. Pb800+NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg\(^{-1}\) of NTA and 800 mg kg\(^{-1}\) of Pb application. Data are means ± SE (n=4). The lowercase letters refer to significant difference (P < 0.05; Duncan's multiple range test) among different treatments.
Figure 2

Effect of NTA application on Pb accumulation in aboveground and underground part of A. wardii. CK is for the treatment with planting but without NTA and Pb application. NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg⁻¹ of NTA application but without Pb application. Pb800 is for the treatment with planting and 800 mg kg⁻¹ of Pb application but without NTA application. Pb800+NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg⁻¹ of NTA and 800 mg kg⁻¹ of Pb application. Data are means ± SE (n=4). The lowercase letters refer to significant difference (P < 0.05; Duncan’s multiple range test) among different treatments.
Figure 3

Effect of NTA application on available Pb in rhizosphere soils of A. wardii. CK is for the treatment with planting but without NTA and Pb application. NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg\(^{-1}\) of NTA application but without Pb application. Pb800 is for the treatment with planting and 800 mg kg\(^{-1}\) of Pb application but without NTA application. Pb800+NTA2 is for the treatment with planting and 2 mmol kg\(^{-1}\) of NTA and 800 mg kg\(^{-1}\) of Pb application. Pb800+NTA2-NP is for the treatment with 2 mmol kg\(^{-1}\) of NTA and 800 mg kg\(^{-1}\) of Pb application but without planting. Data are means ± SE (n=4). The lowercase letters refer to significant difference (P < 0.05\(\cdot\)Duncan's multiple range test) among different treatments, the same below.
Figure 4

Effect of NTA application on pH (A) and DOC (B) in rhizosphere soils of A. wardii.
Figure 5

Effect of NTA application on soil enzyme activities in rhizosphere soils of A. wardii. A-C are for the three soil enzymes of urease, catalase and acid phosphatase.

Figure 6

Effect of NTA application on soil respiration (A), microbial biomass carbon (B) and qCO2 (C) in rhizosphere soils of A. wardii.