Investigation of the Relationship Between the Level of Fine Particulate Matter and Stroke Mortality Rate in Mashhad in 2014 and 2015

Sima Baridkazemi 1, Khalilollah Moeininan 1, Ali Taghipour 2, Ayat Rahmani 1 and Hamidreza Nassehnia 1, *

1Department of Environmental Health Engineering, School of Health, Semnan University of Medical Sciences, Semnan, Iran
2Social Determinants of Health Research Center, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran

*Corresponding author: Department of Environmental Health Engineering, School of Health, Semnan University of Medical Sciences, Semnan, Iran. Email: hrnasheh@semums.ac.ir

Received 2019 November 30; Revised 2020 February 09; Accepted 2020 February 27.

Abstract

**Background:** Air pollution is a major social problem, particularly in developing countries, where the rapid expansion of industries, cities, and traffic is the main cause of increased air pollution.

**Objectives:** This ecological study (correlation) has been conducted with the aim of analyzing the correlation between ambient fine particulate matter (PM$_{2.5}$) amount and the rate of stroke mortality in Mashhad during the years 2014 and 2015.

**Methods:** Data were collected from hospitals, the Monitoring Center of Environmental Pollutants, and the Bureau of Meteorology in Khorasan Razavi Province and were analyzed to evaluate the correlation.

**Results:** The results show that the correlation coefficient between PM$_{2.5}$ and the rate of stroke mortality in different seasons in 2014 and 2015 are 0.997 and 0.902, respectively. The correlation was stronger in 2014 and is significant at a confidence level of 0.01.

**Conclusions:** According to the results, the annual average concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ decreased from 29.261 (µg/m$^3$) in 2014 to 25.283 (µg/m$^3$) in 2015, and also, the annual rate of stroke mortality decreased by 4.4% in 2015.

**Keywords:** Air Pollution, PM$_{2.5}$, Stroke Mortality, Mashhad

1. Background

Air pollution is a major social problem, particularly in developing countries, where the rapid expansion of industries, cities, and traffic is the main cause of increased air pollution (1, 2). In general, air pollution is a mixture of several components, including particulate matter (PM), gases, organic compounds, and metals (3, 4). Epidemiological and clinical evidences show that short- and long-term exposure to outdoor air pollution causes adverse health effects and leads to an increase in mortality and various diseases, particularly cardiovascular diseases and stroke (3, 5–11). The World Health Organization (WHO) defines stroke as “rapidly developed clinical signs of focal (or global) disturbance of cerebral function, lasting more than 24 hours or leading to death, with no apparent cause other than of vascular origin” (12). Stroke is the second most common cause of death and the sixth most common cause of disability worldwide (13-16). Recent studies in North America, Europe, and Asia provide evidence of the effects of environmental pollutants on stroke mortality and hospitalization. Among air pollutants, PMs are the largest cause of mortality and various diseases such as stroke. Stroke mortality contributes about 10% of all mortalities worldwide. The World Health Organization estimates that there were 15.3 million strokes worldwide in 2002, of which more than a third (5.5 million) resulted in death (3, 17, 18).

Although several studies are being conducted to prevent strokes in high-income countries, more than 85% of the strokes occur in low-income and middle-income countries (17). Epidemiological studies indicate a correlation between long-term exposures with air pollution, in particular PM$_{2.5}$, and malfunction of the central nervous system (CNS), premature deaths, heart disease, stroke, respiratory diseases, and lung cancer (19-26). Studies by Global Burden of Disease (GBD) showed that in 2010, about 2.3 million deaths (5% of total global deaths) occurred worldwide due to air pollution by PM$_{2.5}$. This pollutant is ranked as the sixth biggest risk factor for premature death (19, 27).

Recent studies show that in areas with high levels of PM$_{2.5}$, increased incidence of cardiovascular mortality and stroke is reported (6, 28-30). Lee et al. in 2014 conducted a study in Korea on the relation between exposure to air pollution...
and cardiovascular disease. Their results showed that PM$_{2.5}$ and PM10 had adverse health effects, such as heart disease, stroke, and high blood pressure; these health effects have a stronger correlation with PM$_{2.5}$ (31). Research studies conducted in 25 communities in America show that a 10 µg/m$^3$ increase in PM$_{2.5}$ raises all causes of mortalities by 1.2% and stroke mortalities by 1.36% (32). In 2015 Shah et al. conducted a study on the relationship between short-term exposure to air pollution and stroke. Their findings showed that the increase in the relative risk of hospital admissions for stroke or stroke mortality was 1.011 for a 10 µg/m$^3$ increase in PM$_{2.5}$ concentration (33). At present, many cities around the world face environmental problems related to air pollution (34-38). The impact of environmental factors on stroke mortality is less commonly considered. Although some studies show that air pollution is a modifiable and important risk factor (33).

2. Objectives

Due to the high air pollution in Mashhad (Iran), caused mainly by the transport and the industry sectors, this study aims to analyze the relationship between the amount of PM$_{2.5}$ and stroke mortality rate in Mashhad during 2014 and 2015.

3. Methods

3.1. Sample Size

In this study, all recorded data on 24-hour average concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant (730 data points) all patients who died of a stroke in Mashhad (475 deaths) and all data pertaining to meteorological parameters (wind speed, relative humidity, temperature, and rainfall) in 2014 and 2015 have been used.

3.2. Data Collection

The data related to the 24-hour average concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutants were collected from the monitoring center for environmental pollutants in Mashhad in the format of excel files. In this center, the concentration of air pollutants is automatically measured through the air quality index (AQI) at 10 stations using the Environment S.A France device. Data of patients who died due to stroke in 2014 and 2015 in Mashhad were collected by referring hospitals, reviewing the dossiers of patients, and using questionnaires. Additionally, data on meteorological parameters were collected from the Bureau of Meteorology in Khurasan Razavi Province in the format of an excel file.

3.3. Statistical Analysis

For statistical analysis, SPSS software was used. To investigate the normal distribution of the variables, the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test was applied. Pearson correlation and linear regression were used to determine the relationship between variables and predict the dependent variable. Tables and figures were drawn through excel and GraphPad Prism software.

4. Results

The results presented in Table 1 show that the Pearson correlation coefficient between the monthly average concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant and the monthly average wind speed in 2015 is -0.624 (P = 0.03). However, there is no significant correlation between PM$_{2.5}$ concentration and other meteorological parameters (relative humidity, temperature, and rainfall).

As shown in Table 2, the investigation of the average concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutants and stroke mortality rate in different seasons of 2014 and 2015 shows that the highest concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant and the highest rate of stroke mortality are observed in the autumn season. Table 3 shows the results of the Pearson’s correlation between the PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant with the stroke mortality in two age groups (30 to 59 years and 60 years and older), gender, and month and season of the year in 2014 and 2015. The results show that the Pearson correlation coefficients between this pollutant and stroke mortality in different months and seasons in 2014 are 0.610 (P = 0.035) and 0.997 (P = 0.003), respectively. Moreover, the Pearson correlation between the PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant and stroke mortality in the age group of 30-59 years in different months in 2014 and 2015 are 0.765 (P = 0.004) and 0.628 (P = 0.029), respectively.

The correlation in different months of 2014 is stronger. Figure 1A and Figure 1B show the relation between PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant and stroke mortality in different months of 2014 and 2015. As seen in Figure 1A, in 2014, the highest concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant (42.939 ± 16.02 µg/m$^3$) and the highest rate of stroke mortality (30 deaths) were observed in October. Figure 1B depicts that in 2015, the highest concentrations of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant (28.934 ± 6.42 µg/m$^3$ and 28.741 ± 9.76 µg/m$^3$, respectively) were detected in September and December. The highest rate of stroke mortality (29 deaths) was seen in December. The results of linear regression between PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant and stroke mortality in different seasons of 2014 show that the correlation between these two variables is R = 0.997.
5. Discussion

The results of this study indicate a significant negative correlation between PM$_{2.5}$ and wind speed only in different seasons of 2015. However, there was no significant relationship between PM$_{2.5}$ concentration and other meteorological parameters. Also, Huang et al., in 2015, in Beijing and Rasheed et al., in 2015, in Pakistan observed a significant negative relationship between wind speed and PM$_{2.5}$ (39, 40). Lin et al., in an investigation of the relationship between PM$_{2.5}$ and meteorological parameters, observed that there is a negative correlation between the concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ and wind speed. Also, they observed a positive relationship between this pollutant and temperature parameter in spring and summer, but not in autumn and winter (41). While the study of Bhaskar et al. in India showed that there is a significant negative relationship between suspended particulate matter concentration and rainfall (42). Zhang et al. also investigated the relationship between different air pollutants (PM$_{2.5}$, PM$_{10}$, CO, SO$_2$, NO$_2$, and O$_3$) and meteorological parameters in three megacities in China. Their results were similar to our study about the relationship between wind speed and PM$_{2.5}$ (43).

The findings also show that in 2014 and 2015, the daily average concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant (120 and 165 days, respectively) was higher than the standard value suggested by WHO (> 25 µg/m$^3$). In 2015, there was an increase
in the wind speed and a reduction in the number of days in which the average concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ was more than the WHO standard. This could reveal the role of wind in the distribution of PM$_{2.5}$. The results of our study show that the highest PM$_{2.5}$ concentration in 2014 and 2015 was observed in autumn. Li et al. also studied the concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ at 11 stations in one of the Chinese cities. In addition, their results indicated that the average concentration of this pollutant was higher in autumn and winter (41).

According to the results, the annual average concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ decreased from 29.261 µg/m$^3$ in 2014 to 25.283 µg/m$^3$ in 2015. Also, the annual rate of stroke mortality decreased by 4.4% in 2015. There is a significant positive relationship between PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant and stroke mortality, especially in the age group of 30 - 59 years. In a study, Hadei et al. studied stroke deaths due to PM$_{2.5}$ exposure in ten cities of Iran. Their findings showed that Tehran, Mashhad, and Isfahan had the highest mortality rate due to stroke. The average mortality due to PM exposure in all the cities surveyed was 41 per 100,000 people. The results of this study indicated the necessity of urgent actions to improve outdoor air quality in Iranian cities (44). Lin et al. investigated the relationship between ambient PM$_{2.5}$ and stroke in six low- and middle-income countries. In this study, 45625 people were studied, and information about ambient PM$_{2.5}$ levels was estimated using satellite data. The results of their study showed that the odds of stroke were 1.13 for each 10 µg/m$^3$ increase in PM$_{2.5}$ (45).

Pascal et al. in 2014 conducted a study on the short-term effects of particulate matter (PM$_{2.5}$, PM$_{10-2.5}$, and PM$_{10}$) on mortality in nine French towns. The results show a direct correlation between mortality and the concentration of PMs in the air (46). Chalbot et al., in 2014, investigated the correlation between the non-randomized process of cardiovascular disease mortality, stroke, and lung cancer and the reduction in PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant in Arkansas. Their results showed that the annual average concentration of PM$_{2.5}$ reduced from 14.5 µg/m$^3$ in 2000 to 11.5 µg/m$^3$ in 2010, causing a decrease in cardiovascular mortality, stroke, and lung cancer by 21%, 30%, and 2% respectively (47).

5.1. Conclusions

The results indicate that there is a significant positive relationship between the level of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant and stroke mortality rate in Mashhad, especially in the age group of 30 - 59 years. Overall, the findings of this study show that improvements in air quality and reduction in concentrations of PM$_{2.5}$ pollutant in Mashhad can lead to a reduction in the rate of stroke mortality in this city.

Acknowledgments

This article has been written for a graduate school thesis with a code of ethics 96/387191. The authors acknowledge and thank the Deputy of the Semnan University of Medical Sciences and Health Services and Deputy of the Mashhad University of Medical Sciences and Health Services, for offering their cooperation to carry out the research project. The authors are also grateful to the Bureau of Meteorology in Khorasan Razavi Province, the Monitoring Center of Environmental Pollutants of Mashhad, and the President of Ghaem Hospital in Mashhad for access to the required information.
Footnotes

Authors’ Contribution: Study concept and design: Sima Baridkazemi, acquisition of data: Khailollah Moeinian, analysis and interpretation of data: Ali Taghipour, drafting of the manuscript: Ayat Rahmani. corresponding author: Hamidreza Nassehinia

Conflict of Interests: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Ethical Approval: Code: IR.SEMUMS.REC.1397.042.

Funding/Support: This manuscript was funded by Semnan University of Medical Sciences.

References

1. Ghude SD, Chate DM, Jena C, Beig G, Kumar R, Barth MC, et al. Premature mortality in India due to PM2.5 and ozone exposure. Geophys Res Lett. 2016;43(9):3.
2. Ghude SD, Jena C, Chate DM, Beig G, Pfister GG, Kumar R, et al. Reductions in India’s crop yield due to ozone. Geophys Res Lett. 2014;41(5):7.
3. Costa LG, Cole TB, Coburn J, Chang YC, Dao K, Roque P. Neurotoxins are in the air: convergence of human, animal, and in vitro studies on the effects of air pollution on the brain. BioMed Res Int. 2014. doi: 10.1155/2014/36385.
4. Ahmadi M, Rahmani K, Rahmani A, Rahmani H. Removal of benzotriazole by Photo-Fenton like process using nano zero-valent iron: response surface methodology with a Box Behnken design. Polish Journal of Chemical Sciences. 2017;19(5):204-12.
5. Andersen ZJ, Kristiansen LC, Andersen KK, Olsen TS, Hvidberg M, Jensen SS, et al. Stroke and long-term exposure to outdoor air pollution from nitrogen dioxide. Stroke. 2012;43(2):6.
6. Gill EA, Curf CL, Adar SD, Allen RW, Auchincloss AH, O’neill MS, et al. Air pollution and cardiovascular disease in the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis. Prog Cardiovasc Dis. 2011;53(5):8.
7. Johnson JM, Rowe BH, Allen RW, Peters PA, Villeneuve PJ. A case-control study of medium-term exposure to ambient nitrogen dioxide pollution and hospitalization for stroke. BMC Public Health. 2013;13(1).
8. Johnson JM, Villeneuve PJ, Pasichnyk D, Rowe BH. A retrospective cohort study of stroke onset: implications for characterizing short term effects from ambient air pollution. Environ Health. 2011;10(1).
9. Oudin A, Strömberg U, Jakobsson K, Stroh E, Lindgren AG, Norrving B, et al. Air pollution and hospitalization for stroke. Atherosclerosis. 2011;218(3):10.
10. Baridkazemi S et al. Hospital admissions for ischemic stroke: does long-term exposure to air pollution interact with major risk factors? Cerebrovascular Diseases. 2018;31(3):30.
11. Yazdanbakhsh AR, Rahmani A, Massoudinejad MR, Jafari MJ, Dashdor M. Accelerating the solar disinfection process of water using modified compound parabolic concentrators (CPCs) mirror. Desalination and Water Treatment. 2016;57(30):23779-86.
12. Gholami M, Rahmani K, Rahmani A, Rahmani H, Estrafil A. Oxidative degradation of clindamycin in aqueous solution using nanoscale zero-valent iron(H2O2)/US. Desalination and Water Treatment. 2016;57(30):23779-86.
13. Coupland AP, Thapar A, Qureshi MI, Jenkins H, Davies AH. The definition of stroke. J R Soc Med. 2017;110(1):4.
14. Gupta A, Giambraone AE, Gialdini G, Finn C, Delgado D, Gutierrez J, et al. Silent Brain Infarction and Risk of Future Stroke. Stroke. 2016;44(3):7.
15. Maheswaran R, Pearson T, Smeeton NC, Beever SD, Campbell MJ, Wolfe CD. Outdoor air pollution and incidence of ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke. Stroke. 2012;43(1):6.
16. Fazlzadeh M, Rahmani A, Nasehinia HR, Rahmani H, Rahmani K. Degradation of sulfathiazole antibiotics in aqueous solutions by using zero valent iron nanoparticles and hydrogen peroxide. Koomesh. 2016;550-6.
17. Chen R, Zhang Y, Yang C, Zhao Z, Xu X, Kan H. Acute effect of ambient air pollution on stroke mortality in the China air pollution and health effects study. Stroke. 2012;43(1):3.
18. Kamououchi M, Ueda K, Ago T, Nitta H, Kitazono T. Relationship between asian dust and ischemic stroke. Stroke. 2012;43(1):3.
19. Apte J, Marshall JD, Cohen AJ, Brauer M. Addressing global mortality from ambient PM2.5. Environ Sci Technol. 2015;49(1):3.
20. García CA, Yap PS, Park HY, Weller BL. Association of long-term PM2.5 exposure with mortality using different air pollution exposure models: impacts in rural and urban California. Int J Environ Health Res. 2016;26(2):33.
21. Kiousmouritzoglou MA, Schwartz JD, Weisskopf MG, Melly SJ, Wang Y, Dominici F, et al. Long-term PM2.5 exposure and neurological hospital admissions in the northeaster United States. Environ Health Perspect. 2016;124(1):7.
22. O’donnell MJ, Fang J, Mittleman MA, Kapral MK, Wellenius GA. Fine particulate air pollution (PM2.5) and the risk of acute ischemic stroke. Epidemiology. 2011;22(3).
23. Power MC, Weisskopf MG, Alexeeff SE, Goull BA, Spiro IA, Schwartz J. Traffic-related air pollution and cognitive function in a cohort of older men. Environ Health Perspect. 2012;120(5):16.
24. Stafoggia M, Cesaroni G, Peters A, Andersen ZJ, Badaloni C, Beelen R, et al. Long-term exposure to ambient air pollution and incidence of cerebrovascular events: results from it European cohorts within the ESCAPE project. Environ Health Perspect. 2014;122(9):7.
25. Nassehinia HR, Rahmani A, Ghaiyenig Mahdinia SM. Application of novel methods in environmental and health hazardous pollutants removal using nanophotocatalysts. Koomesh. 2016;309-16.
26. Zare MR, Amin MM, Nikaen M, Rahmani A, Hemmati-Borji S, Rahmani H. Acute toxicity of Hg, Cd, and Pb towards dominant bacterial strains of sequencing batch reactor (SBR). Environmental monitoring and assessment. 2015;187(5):26.
27. Lee CJ, Martin RV, Henze DK, Brauer M, Cohen A, Donkelaar AV. Response of global particulate-matter-related mortality to changes in local precursor emissions. Environ Sci Technol. 2015;49(7):110.
28. Brook RD, Rajagopalan S, Pope IIIA, Brook JR, Bhatnagar A, Diez-Roux AV, et al. Particulate matter air pollution and cardiovascular disease. Circulation. 2010;122(1):47.
29. Du X, Kong Q, Ge W, Zhang S, Fu L. Characterization of personal exposure concentration of fine particles for adults and children exposed to high ambient concentrations in Beijing, China. J Environ Sci. 2010;22(1):8.
30. Ostro B, Lipsett M, Reynolds P, Goldberg D, Hertz A, Garcia C, et al. Long-term exposure to constituents of fine particulate air pollution and mortality: results from the California Teachers Study. Environ Health Perspect. 2010;118(3):7.
31. Lee BJ, Kim B, Lee K. Air pollution exposure and cardiovascular disease. Toxicol Res. 2014;30(2).
32. Huang W, Coa J, Tao Y, Dai L, Lu SE, Hou B, et al. Seasonal variation of chemical species associated with short-term mortality effects of PM2.5 in Xi’an, a central city in China. Am J Epidemiol. 2012;75(6):31.
33. Shah ASV, Lee KK, Mclllister DA, Hunter A, Nair H, Whiteley W, et al. Short term exposure to air pollution and stroke: systematic review and meta-analysis. Br Med J. 2015;350.
34. Bell M, Cifuentes IA, Davis DL, Cushing E, Telles AG, Gouveia N. Environmental health indicators and a case study of air pollution in Latin American cities. Environ Res. 2011;111(1):30.
35. Daies RE, Cakmak S, Vidal CB. Air pollution and hospitalization for venous thromboembolic disease in Chile. J Thromb Haemostasis. 2010;8(4):6.
36. Leiva GMA, Santibañez DA, Ibarra S, Matus P, Seguel R. A five-year study of particulate matter (PM2.5) and cerebrovascular diseases. *Environ Pollut*. 2013;181(6).

37. Rahmani A, Asadi A, Fatehizadeh A, Rahmani AR, Zare MR. Interactions of Cd, Cr, Pb, Ni, and Hg in their effects on activated sludge bacteria by using two analytical methods. *Environmental monitoring and assessment*. 2019;21(3):124.

38. Rahmani H, Rahmani A, Yousefi M, Rahmani K. Degradation of sulfamethoxazole antibacterial by sono-Fenton process using nano-zero valent iron: influence factors, kinetic and toxicity bioassay. *Desalination and Water Treatment*. 2019;350(220–7).

39. Huang F, Li X, Wang C, Xu Q, Wang W, Luo Y, et al. PM2.5 Spatiotemporal Variations and the Relationship with Meteorological Factors during 2013-2014 in Beijing, China. *PloS one*. 2015;10(11). e0141642.

40. Rasheed A, Aneja VP, Aiyyer A, Rafique U. Measurement and analysis of fine particulate matter (PM2.5) in urban areas of Pakistan. *Aerosol Air Qual Res*. 2015;15(15). doi: 10.4209/aaqr.2009.10.0069.

41. Zhang H, Wang Y, Hu J, Ying Q, Hu XM. Relationships between meteorological parameters and criteria air pollutants in three megacities in China. *Environmental research*. 2015;140(3). doi: 10.1016/j.envres.2015.04.004.

42. Hadei M, Hashemi Nazari SS, Eslami A, Khosravi A, Yarahmadi M, Naghdali Z, et al. Distribution and number of ischemic heart disease (IHD) and stroke deaths due to chronic exposure to PM2.5 in 10 cities of Iran (2013 - 2015); an airq+ modelling. *Journal of Air Pollution and Health*. 2017;2(3):8.

43. Lin H, Guo Y, Di Q, Zheng Y, Kowal P, Xiao J, et al. Ambient PM2.5 and Stroke Effect Modifiers and Population Attributable Risk in Six Low- and Middle-Income Countries. *Stroke*. 2017;48(7). doi: 10.1161/STROKEAHA.116.015739.

44. Pascal M, Falq G, Wagner V, Chatignoux E, Corso M, Blanchard M, et al. Short-term impacts of particulate matter (PM10, PM10–2.5, PM2.5) on mortality in nine French cities. *Atmos Environ*. 2014;95:30.

45. Bhaskar BV, Mehta VM. Atmospheric Particulate Pollutants and their Relationship with Meteorology in Ahmedabad. *Aerosol and Air Quality Research*. 2010;10(15). doi: 10.4209/aaqr.2009.10.0069.