A Study to Assess Symptom Profile and Break Through Infections Among Health Care Workers Post Covid Vaccination at Tertiary Care Health Facility

Vishal Malhotra, Simmi Oberoi, Ravinder Khaira, Rajinder S. Balgir, Balpreet Kaur, Sakshi Kaura

Community Medicine Department, Government Medical College, Patiala, Punjab, University of Prosthodontics, Gian Sagar Dental College and Hospital, Patiala, Punjab, India

Abstract

Introduction: Breakthrough infections in fully vaccinated persons pose a major challenge to the ongoing vaccine campaign against SARS-CoV-2 globally. Objectives: To investigate the occurrence of breakthrough infections and the association of Covid symptoms with the vaccination status of health care workers (HCWs). Material and Methods: Done in Government Medical College, Patiala among Covid-positive HCWs who have received one or both doses of Covid vaccine, using pretested semi-structured validated Proforma and telephonic interview from April 1, 2021 to June 15, 2021. Results: Among 3388 HCWs, 115 vaccinated HCWs (1st or 2nd dose) became Covid positive. Among vaccinated Covid positive HCWs, 54 received the first dose and 61 both doses. Breakthrough infections (≥14 days post 2nd dose) occurred in 4.6% (47 of 1021) HCWs. The vaccine is significantly protective as shown by an odds ratio of 0.27; thus, vaccinated HCWs are 73% less likely to get Covid infection as compared to non-vaccinated HCWs. There was no statistically significant difference between symptom profiles of cases whether they took one or both doses of vaccine, except headache. Only tiredness and headache were reported significantly higher in the unvaccinated group in comparison to vaccinated HCWs. Conclusion: Research is needed on tracking the immune response and viral genomic sequence of samples of vaccinated Covid-positive HCWs to have constant vigilance on remerging new strains of the SARS-CoV-2.

Keywords: Covid, HCWs, unvaccinated, vaccinated

INTRODUCTION

With the increase in Covid cases globally and in India, the Covid vaccination has become the main tool of fight against the Covid pandemic. A growing body of evidence suggests that fully vaccinated people are less likely to have asymptomatic infection and potentially less likely to transmit SARS-CoV-2, but the risk cannot be completely eliminated as long as community transmission is there. All authorized COVID-19 vaccines demonstrated high efficacy (≥89%) against Covid-19 severe enough to require hospitalization. The effectiveness of the Covid vaccines ranges from 60% to 95% among different vaccines brands around the globe. The latest data analysis from India, from studies done in Post Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research (PGIMER), reported breakthrough infection among 9.5% of health care workers (HCWs) post vaccination at an infection rate of 1.6%. Another study done in New Delhi reported an even higher percentage of breakthrough infections (13.3%) post the vaccine launch on January 16, 2021 in India. The current study was done in Government Medical College and Rajindra Hospital, Patiala, one of the largest and oldest tertiary care institutes of Northern India, catering to a very high patient load of moderate to severely sick Covid patients from Punjab, Haryana, Himachal Pradesh, Uttarakhand, and Delhi. As most of the HCWs are involved in Covid Isolation facility and have long work hour duties in high-risk exposure zone, this facility is ideally suited to assess the real-time data on vaccine effectiveness, breakthrough infection rate, and symptom spectrum.

Address for correspondence: Dr. Simmi Oberoi, Department of Community Medicine, GMC, Patiala, Punjab, India. E-mail: hodspm.simmi2020@gmail.com

This is an open access journal, and articles are distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 License, which allows others to remix, tweak, and build upon the work non-commercially, as long as appropriate credit is given and the new creations are licensed under the identical terms.

For reprints contact: WKHPRPMedknow_reprints@wolterskluwer.com

How to cite this article: Malhotra V, Oberoi S, Khaira R, Balgir RS, Kaur B, Kaura S. A study to assess symptom profile and break through infections among health care workers post covid vaccination at tertiary care health facility. Indian J Community Med 2022;47:369-74.

Received: 05-08-21, Revision: 09-02-22, Accepted: 07-03-22, Published: 10-10-22

Quick Response Code:  
Website: www.ijcm.org.in

DOI: 10.4103/ijcm.ijcm_1105_21

© 2022 Indian Journal of Community Medicine | Published by Wolters Kluwer - Medknow
of Covid among vaccinated HCWs, particularly when there are questions of vaccine effectiveness against the Delta variant in India. The current study will add to the existing body of evidence about the effectiveness of the Covid-19 vaccine (Covishield ChAdOx1 nCoV-19) against the Delta variant, which is prominent in India and is an emerging new variant globally.

This study was undertaken to investigate the occurrence of breakthrough infection among vaccinated HCWs and find an association between Covid symptoms and vaccination status of HCWs.

**Material and Methods**

The study was done in Government Medical College in North India from January 16, 2021 till June 15, 2021, and the sampling frame was all the HCWs of the institute, including class 3, class 4, and administrative staff. As the vaccination was started in this institute on January 16, 2021, all the HCWs who have received Covid vaccination on or after January 16, 2021 and who become RT-PCR Covid positive after receiving one or two doses of Covid vaccine till June 15, 2021, that is, a follow-up period of 4 months, were included in this study. A pretested semi-structured validated proforma was used and telephonic interviews with all the post-vaccinated Covid-positive HCWs was conducted by senior faculty of the Department of Community Medicine. Verbal informed consent was taken from the HCWs after explaining to them the purpose of the study before beginning the interview. The interview includes questions on baseline characteristics such as age, sex, place of working, date of Covid-positive test report, comorbidities, symptoms of Covid infection, and date of Covid vaccination, which was then cross-checked for accuracy with the vaccination record, duly maintained at the Covid vaccination center of Rajindra hospital Patiala. All the HCWs showed keen interest to participate in the study and gave their informed consent (The study was duly approved by institute Review Board- Ethics committee vide letter no EC/NEW/INST/2020/997/14367).

The data were analyzed, and odds ratio was used to measure the strength of associations. P value was calculated at 95% confidence limits to consider the results of the study to be statistically significant. Epi info version 7 of CDC and Microsoft excel were used for data analysis.

From the available literature, the infection rate among fully vaccinated individuals ≥14 days after the second dose ranges from 1.6% to 9.6% and 13.3% among the latest published and unpublished pre-peer reviewed stage research.

Population size (for finite population correction factor or fpc) 1021

\( N \)

Hypothesized % frequency of outcome factor in the population (p): 13.3±6

Confidence limits as % of 100 (absolute ± %) (d): 6%

Design effect (for cluster surveys-DEFF):

Sample size \( n = \frac{DEFF \times N \times p \times (1-p)}{[d^2/Z_{alpha/2}^2 \times (N-1) + p \times (1-p)]} \) would be 110; however, to increase the power of the study and extrapolate the results to the target population, all the HCWs vaccinated with 1st or 2nd dose of Covid vaccine who become Covid positive during the study period were taken as sample.

**Results**

Out of 3388 HCWs, 232 HCWs became Covid positive during the study period from (April 1, 2021 to June 15, 2021) after the launch of the Covid vaccine (Covishield) on January 16, 2021 in the institute. Out of these 232 HCWs, 115 HCWs have received either one or both doses of Covishield and 117 were unvaccinated. Among these 115 HCWs, females constitute 56% (65) with mean age (SD) of 31.3 (11) years, and males were 43% (50) with a mean age of 35.7 (13.3) years. In these HCWs 25% were junior residents, interns 20%, faculty 18%, senior residents (SRs) 10%, and MBBS students 4.3%. Nursing staff and students constitute 5.2% each. The majority of HCWs (81%) were without any comorbidity, and just 11% have hypertension, CAD 2.61%, and less than 2% have COPD/asthma and diabetes [Table 1].

Among the 3388 HCWs of Government Medical College and Rajindra Hospital Patiala, 2598 (76.68%) received the first dose of ChAdOx1 nCV-19 (recombinant) vaccine, and 1042 (30.7%) subsequently received the second dose of the vaccine; 790 (23.3%) HCWs were unvaccinated. Since the start of vaccination in the institute, 232 HCWs have become Covid positive; among them, 115 (3.3%) tested positive after receiving at least one dose of Covid vaccine. In Covid-positive vaccinated HCWs, 54 received the first dose and 61 received both doses of vaccine. The median time between the receipt of the first dose and positive test was 31.5 days, with an IQR of 31.75 (17–48.75). The median time interval between receipt of 2nd dose and positive test was 39 days with an IQR of 37 (15–52). The median time interval between the first and second dose of vaccine was 39 days with an IQR of 13 (44–31). [Figure 1]. Among the HCWs who have received both doses and have completed at least 14 days of follow-up after the 2nd dose, breakthrough infection occurred in 4.6% (47 of 1021). The median time interval from receipt of second dose and breakthrough infection was 44 days with an IQR of 23 (36–59).

There was a statistically significant difference in Covid infection rate among those vaccinated with one or both doses and those who are unvaccinated. The vaccine is significantly protective as shown by an odds ratio of 0.27, suggesting that vaccination decreases the odds of Covid infection by 73% among vaccinated as compared to the non-vaccinated group [Table 2].

Table 3: Depicts the symptom spectrum of SARS coronavirus among vaccinated HCWs. Asymptomatic cases accounted for 6.96%. Among symptomatic patients, fever was a presenting symptom in 73% of cases, and the majority of them had a low-grade fever. The median number of days fever lasts was 3 days with IQR (2–4). Intermediate to high-grade fever was reported in less than one-third of cases. Cough and myalgia...
were reported in half of the cases. Sore throat was reported in 40% cases; loss of sense of smell and taste in 28%; and headache, cold, and running nose in one-fourth of cases each. Diarrhea was reported in 17% of cases, and less than 2% reported other symptoms such as conjunctivitis, skin rash, and dysgeusia. Among vaccinated Covid-positive cases, 90% have no breathing difficulty, and chest heaviness was reported in just 3.5% of cases. There was no statistically significant difference between symptom profiles of cases whether they took one or both doses of vaccine, except headache, whereas HCWs who took both doses reported significantly less headache.

Table 4: Shows the comparison of symptoms among fully vaccinated and unvaccinated HCWs. Fever was present in 75% of vaccinated and 67.5% of unvaccinated participants, although intermediate to high-grade fever was reported more among unvaccinated HCWs. There was no statistically significant difference among the symptoms of fully vaccinated and unvaccinated HCWs, except tiredness and headache, which was reported significantly less among fully vaccinated HCWs.

**Table 1: Profile of post vaccinated Covid positive HCWS (n=115)**

| HCW Category          | Frequency | Percent |
|-----------------------|-----------|---------|
| Faculty               | 21        | 18.26%  |
| SR                    | 11        | 9.57%   |
| JR                    | 28        | 24.35%  |
| Interns               | 22        | 19.13%  |
| MBBS students         | 5         | 4.35%   |
| Dental college faculty and staff | 1 | 0.87% |
| Nursing students      | 6         | 5.22%   |
| other students (MSC/pharmacy etc.) | 2 | 1.74% |
| Staff Nurse           | 5         | 4.35%   |
| Clerical staff        | 5         | 4.35%   |
| Class 3               | 6         | 5.22%   |
| Class 4               | 3         | 2.61%   |

**Comorbidities**

| Comorbidities          | Frequency | Percent |
|------------------------|-----------|---------|
| Comorbidities absent   | 93        | 80.87%  |
| Hypertension           | 12        | 10.43%  |
| Hypothyroidism         | 4         | 3.48%   |
| CAD                    | 3         | 2.61%   |
| COPD/Asthma            | 2         | 1.74%   |
| Diabetes               | 2         | 1.74%   |
| Neurological disorder  | 1         | 0.87%   |

**Discussion**

Breakthrough infections among vaccinated persons is a major concern with the emergence of delta and delta plus variants as dominant strains, even more in HCWs as they are constantly working in high-exposure zones, particularly in tertiary-level health facilities. In the latest data analysis done in PGIMER, the incidence of infection among those who have received one dose was 2.6% and in those who took both doses and completed at least 14 days was 1.6%. The study done in Chandigarh reported 9.5% breakthrough infections among vaccinated Covid-positive HCWs post the vaccine launch. Another study done in New Delhi by Tyagi K et al. in non-Covid care center of Excellence of diabetes reported 13.3% breakthrough infections among vaccinated staff. In the current study, breakthrough infections occurred in 4.4% (47 of 1021 HCWs). A study done by Bouton et al. reported a prevalence of 1.3% (96/7109) among HCWs who received at least one dose and 0.3% (17/5913) among HCWs who received both doses. Another study done by Amit et al. reported an infection prevalence of 0.54% in vaccinated HCWs. Findings very similar to our findings were reported by Thompson et al. study with a prevalence of 5.2% (205/3950).

A study done in Indraprastha Apollo Hospitals, New Delhi, India reported infection in 2.65% of fully vaccinated HCWs and hospitalization in just 0.06%. Indian Council of Medical Research (ICMR) reported re-infection in just 0.02%–0.04% of individuals vaccinated with ChAdOx1 nCoV-19 (recombinant) and BBV152 vaccines.

In a study in a tertiary care hospital of Mumbai, where retrospective analysis was done, breakthrough infection was reported in 10.1% of HCWs and a significant reduction in the likelihood of infection among vaccinated HCWS in comparison to unvaccinated HCWS was reported, with an odds ratio of 0.34 and confidence limits of 0.16–0.70, which corroborated the findings of the current study, which reported an odds ratio of 0.36 (0.24–0.56). Another study done in Fortis healthcare reported breakthrough infections in 6% of the vaccinated HCWS.

Since the start of vaccination, 232 HCWs have tested positive; among them, 47 (20.2%) have breakthrough infections. A higher incidence of breakthrough infections was reported by Tyagi et al. who had done the study in a non-Covid care facility, indicating that variants such as Delta and Delta Plus have higher chances of causing breakthrough infections, a possibility also reported by Hacisuleyman, Hale, Saito, et al. Another study done in Government Medical College Hospital, Kozhikode reported breakthrough infection among 16% of vaccinated HCWs.

In our study, the majority of infected HCWs were JRs, faculty, interns, and SRs; however, Patil et al. reported high prevalence of infection among LTs and radiographers. Rajindra hospital being a tertiary-level health facility, most of the Covid-related work was done by a team of HCWs, which might be the reason for higher infection in these HCWs.
Another latest study done in CMC Vellore by Dr. Joy J. Mammen and still in preprint pre-peer-reviewed stage reported infection in 9.6% of fully vaccinated HCWs (n = 7080), 47 days (34–58) after the second dose, which is more than double the rate reported by our study. The mean age was 31.5 years, similar to our study, where the mean age was 33.3 years and the female: male ratio was 3:2. The study also corroborated the findings done in our study.
that vaccinated HCWs required less hospitalization, oxygen therapy, and even ICU admission. In our study, just one HCW needed hospitalization. In our study, the median time period between receipt of first dose and development of infection was 31.5 days, similar to the study done in PGIMER, which reported 44 days. A higher median time period of 77 days was reported by a study done in CMC Vellore. In our study, the odds ratio is 0.27; thus, fully vaccinated HCWs are 73% less likely to get infected than unvaccinated HCWs, similar to the study done in CMC Vellore where RR was 0.35 (0.32–0.39).

In a study done in the United Kingdom on a cohort of 23,324 participants with vaccine coverage of 89%, 977 (38%) of unvaccinated participants developed Covid infection and 71 (3.4%) of vaccinated developed the infection. In our study, 15% of unvaccinated developed infection in comparison to just 4.45 among vaccinated HCWs who have received at least one dose of vaccine. Another multicenter trial of ChAdOx1 nCoV-19 vaccine efficacy done in the UK, Brazil, and South Africa reported an overall vaccine efficacy of 70.4%, which is in concordance with our study results.

In our study, the majority of vaccinated HCWs had mild symptoms presenting with mild to moderate fever, and half of them had cough and sore throat. There was no mortality and no need for ICU care and oxygen. All vaccinated HCWs were managed by home isolation treatment. Hospitalization was done in only one HCW for 1–2 days who had received just one dose of vaccine. Similar findings were reported in a study done by Tyagi et al. and study done in Vellore. In our study, 7% of vaccinated HCWs who tested positive were totally asymptomatic; these were interns who got themselves tested for home visit, with a mean age of 23 years, and had taken one dose of vaccine, in comparison to SIREN study done in the UK, which reported 19% asymptomatic infections among the vaccinated group as they have done the study on BNT162b2 mRNA vaccine, which has higher efficacy. A retrospective study done in Mumbai reported asymptomatic infection among 15% of vaccinated HCWs.

**Table 4: Comparison of Covid symptoms among fully vaccinated and unvaccinated HCWs**

| Symptoms of Covid Present | Fully vaccinated (n=61) | %   | Unvaccinated (n=117) | %   | Odds Ratio | P  |
|--------------------------|------------------------|-----|---------------------|-----|------------|----|
| Fever                    | 46                     | 75.4 | 79                  | 67.5 | 1.4 (0.7-2.9) | 0.17 |
| Low-grade fever          | 28                     | 45.9 | 41                  | 35.0 | 1.57 (0.8-2.9) | 0.10 |
| Intermediate to high fever | 18                    | 29.5 | 38                  | 32.5 | 0.8 (0.44-1.7) | 0.40 |
| Dry Cough                | 25                     | 41.0 | 48                  | 41.0 | 0.99 (0.53-1.87) | 0.4 |
| Myalgia                  | 31                     | 50.8 | 55                  | 47.0 | 1.16 (0.62-2.16) | 0.37 |
| Sore throat              | 28                     | 45.9 | 38                  | 32.5 | 1.76 (0.93-3.3)  | 0.055 |
| Tiredness                | 20                     | 32.8 | 59                  | 50.4 | 0.47 (0.25-0.91) | 0.018 |
| Malaise                  | 16                     | 26.2 | 30                  | 25.6 | 1.031 (0.50-2.088) | 0.46 |
| Loss of sense of smell and taste | 20 | 32.8 | 25                  | 21.4 | 1.79 (0.8-3.5)  | 0.06 |
| Headache                 | 10                     | 16.4 | 36                  | 30.8 | 0.44 (0.20-0.96) | 0.02 |
| Cold and running nose    | 14                     | 23.0 | 29                  | 24.8 | 0.9 (0.4-1.87)  | 0.46 |
| Diarrhea                 | 10                     | 16.4 | 11                  | 9.4  | 1.88 (0.75-4.7) | 0.13 |
| Difficulty in breathing  | 5                      | 8.2  | 16                  | 13.7 | 0.56 (0.19-1.62) | 0.68 |
| Asymptomatic             | 5                      | 8.2  | 12                  | 10.3 | 0.78 (0.2-2.3)  | 0.43 |
| Sinusitis and nasal blockage | 5        | 8.2  | 3                   | 2.6  | 3.3 (0.7-14)    | 0.09 |
| Chest congestion         | 3                      | 4.9  | 5                   | 4.3  | 1.15 (0.2-5)    | 0.42 |
| Cough with expectoration | 1                      | 1.6  | 5                   | 4.3  | 0.3 (0.04-3.2)  | 0.3 |
| Conjunctivitis           | 2                      | 3.3  | 1                   | 0.9  | 3.9 (0.34-44)   | 0.2 |
| Skin rash                | 2                      | 3.3  | 0                   | 0.0  | 0               | 0.1 |
| Dysgeusia                | 1                      | 1.6  | 8                   | 6.8  | 0.2 (0.027-1.8) | 1.3 |
| Vomiting                 | 0                      | 0.0  | 3                   | 2.6  | 0               | 0.25 |

**Conflicts of interest**
There are no conflicts of interest.
Malhotra, et al.: A study to assess symptom profile and break through infections among health care workers post Covid vaccination at tertiary care health facility

REFERENCES

1. Available from: https://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/fullarticle/2777536. [Last assessed on 2021 Apr 01].
2. Available from: https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/science/science-briefs/fully-vaccinated-people.html. [Last assessed on 2021 Apr 02].
3. Vaccine breakthrough infections with SARS-CoV-2 variants. Available from: https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMc2101927. [Last assessed on 2021 Apr 03].
4. Tyagi K, Ghosh A, Nair D, Dutta K, Singh Bhandari P, Ahmed Ansari I, et al. Breakthrough COVID19 infections after vaccinations in healthcare and other workers in a chronic care medical facility in New Delhi, India. Diabetes Metab Syndr Clin Res Rev 2021;15:1007-8.
5. Bouton TC, Lodi S, Turcinovic J, Weber SE, Quinn E. COVID-19 vaccine impact on rates of SARS-CoV-2 cases and post vaccination strain sequences among healthcare workers at an urban academic medical center: A prospective cohort study. medRxiv 021:2021.03.30.21254655. doi: 10.1101/2021.03.30.21254655.
6. Amit S, Beni SA, Biber A, Grinberg A, Leshem E, Regev-Yochay G. Postvaccination COVID-19 among healthcare workers at an urban academic medical center. Emerg Infect Dis 2021;27:1220-2.
7. Thompson MG, Burgess JL, Naleway AL, Tyner HL, Yoon SK, Meece J, et al. Interim estimates of vaccine effectiveness of BNT162b2 and mRNA-1273 COVID-19 vaccines in preventing SARS-CoV-2 infection among health care personnel, first responders, and other essential and frontline workers — eight U.S. locations, December 2020–March 2021. MMWR 2021;70:495.
8. Vaishya R, Sibal A, Malani A, Prasad KH, Prasad KH. SARS-CoV-2 infection after COVID-19 immunization in healthcare workers: A retrospective, pilot study. Indian J Med Res 2021;153:550-4.
9. Available from: https://www.livemint.com/news/india/24-per-10-000-people-infected-after-getting-vaccinated-govt-11619022062884.htm. [Last assessed on 2021 Jan 23].
10. Patil Y, Kesari M, Agrawal S, Dhople M, Reheman H. Post vaccination covid infection in health care workers at a tertiary care centre: A retrospective cohort study. Int J Contemp Med Res 2021;8:E1-5.
11. Available from: https://www.financialexpress.com/lifestyle/health/92-of-fully-vaccinated-healthcare-workers-showed-mild-infection-study/2273994/. [Last assessed on 2021 Oct 23].
12. Hacisuleyman E, Hale C, Saito Y, Blachere NE, Bergh M, Conlon EG, et al. Vaccine breakthrough infections with SARS-CoV-2 variants. N Engl J Med 2021;384:2212-8.
13. Available from: https://www.thehindu.com/news/cities/kozhikode/16-of-fully-vaccinated-healthcare-workers-at-kozhikode-hospital-got-infected/article36670111.ece [Last assessed on 2021 Oct 25].
14. Available from: https://www.aninews.in/news/world/asia/vaccines-are-working-against-infection-severe-disease-of-covid-19-reveals-study20210611145455/in press. [Last assessed on 2021 Apr 01].
15. Hall VJ, Foulkes S, Saei A, Andrews N, Oguti B, Charlett A, et al. COVID-19 vaccine coverage in health-care workers in England and effectiveness of BNT162b2 mRNA vaccine against infection (SIREN): A prospective, multicentre, cohort study. Lancet 2021;397:1725-35.
16. Voysey M, Clemens SA, Madhi SA, Weckx LY, Folegatti PM, Aley PK, et al. Safety and efficacy of the ChAdOx1 nCoV-19 vaccine (AZD1222) against SARS-CoV-2: An interim analysis of four randomized controlled trials in Brazil, South Africa, and the UK. Lancet 2021;397:99-111.