Performance metrics and economics of superior labrum anterior-posterior tear repairs in Major League Baseball pitchers

Vani Sabesan, MDab, Kiran Chatha, MDb, Eric Guo, MDC, James Whaley, MDC, Michael Amadora a, Alessia Lavin, MDb

aPalm Beach Shoulder Service - Atlantis Orthopaedics HCA Florida, Palm Beach, FL, USA
bDepartment of Orthopaedic Surgery, Cleveland Clinic Florida, Weston, FL, USA
cWayne State University Department of Orthopaedic Surgery, Taylor, MI, USA

Keywords: Major league baseball
Performance metrics
Cost
Economics
Superior labrum anterior posterior
Surgical treatment

Level of evidence: Level IV; Economic Analysis

Background: Superior labrum anterior-posterior tears (SLAP) can be a career-altering injury for Major League Baseball (MLB) pitchers. Surgery and postoperative rehabilitation keep pitchers on the injured list (IL) for extended time, which results in a significant cost to a team. To date, no analyses have focused on the financial cost of SLAP repairs in MLB pitchers.

Methods: A retrospective review of MLB pitchers with SLAP repair from 2004 to 2019 was conducted utilizing IL and financial contract data from the MLB website. Cost of injury was calculated from salary of the player. Performance metrics including earned run average, walks + hits per innings pitched, and innings pitched (IP) were averaged for one and all seasons played before and after injury. Return to play and return to prior performance rates were calculated and reported.

Results: Of the 55 players identified, 22 players (40%) returned to play and 18 of these 22 players (82%) returned to prior performance. Annual cost increased over the study period (R2 = 0.288) averaging $3.5 million, and a stable average of 172 days was spent on the IL (R2 = 0.001). Performance was negligible except IP (106.95 vs. 50.85; P < .01) for 1 season before and after injury. For all seasons, earned run average and walks + hits per innings pitched significantly increased (4.13 vs. 5.19; P = .030, and 1.36 vs. 1.53; P = .033, respectively), while IP downturned without significance (P = .058).

Conclusion: SLAP repairs in MLB pitchers have significant financial impact and time spent on the IL, which surprisingly has not changed over time. It is encouraging to know return-to-play pitchers return without profound decline in performance level following SLAP repair.

© 2022 Published by Elsevier Inc. on behalf of American Shoulder and Elbow Surgeons. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).
Methods

A retrospective review was performed on MLB pitchers who underwent a SLAP repair surgery from 2004 to 2019. These athletes were identified through the publicly available MLB IL (Major League Baseball Injured List) (previously referred to as the disabled list) database and verified by ESPN statistics.13 Players with multiple shoulder surgeries or other injuries leading to placement on the IL were excluded from the study. Players who did not play in at least 10 innings prior to injury or players who had multiple concomitant injuries at the time of shoulder surgery were also excluded from this study. Player name and length of time on the IL were collected from the MLB database. Player statistics before and after surgery were collected from MLB database and verified based on ESPN and CBS sports websites per previously published methods.18 We included statistics for earned run average (ERA), walks + hits per inning pitched (WHIP), and innings pitched (IP). ERA is the average of earned runs allowed by a pitcher per 9 IP; thus, a lower ERA is better. Similarly, WHIP is a measurement of the number of base-runners a pitcher has allowed per inning pitched; therefore, a lower WHIP indicates a better performance. To analyze the immediate impact of SLAP repair, average values included 1 full season played prior to the injury, and average values of performance after recovery included 1 full season played after treatment and rehabilitation. To further analyze performance metrics as a career, we compared average values for all full seasons played before the injury; likewise, average values for performance after the player’s recovery included all full seasons played after treatment and rehabilitation. Successful RTP was defined as the ability to pitch for a minimum of 1 entire season at the MLB level following SLAP repair. Players who were not able to RTP for at least one complete season following surgery or returned to play at the minor league level were considered a failure of RTP. Return to prior performance (RTPP) was defined as an ERA within 2.00 and WHIP within 0.500 before the injury as previously described by Erickson et al and Fedoriw et al in separate evaluations of MLB pitchers.1,7

To determine financial impact of SLAP impact, analyzed variables included days spent on the IL, annual salary of injured player, and salary of their temporary replacement which were calculated based on a previously published methodology.1 Financial impact associated with SLAP injuries per game was determined by dividing a player’s annual salary by 182 days (the number of days in regular MLB season). Replacement player salaries per game were calculated using a similar previously established formula: ([annual salary/182] days on roster), the league minimum salary specific for the year of the SLAP injury divided by 182 days long season, to determine their salary per game, and multiplied by the number of days spent filling the roster spot.

Statistical analysis

Descriptive statistics for the average age, days spent on the IL, and financial costs were calculated. Pitcher performance before injury and after the injury was analyzed using a paired sample t tests. To determine the significance of trends over time, a best-fit line was demonstrated to show the change over the years for the days on the IL, costs, and incidence of SLAP injuries. All statistics were performed using Excel (Microsoft Corporation, Redmond, WA, USA) and SPSS software (IBM Inc, Armonk, NY, USA) with a significance level of 0.05.

Results

A total of 55 MLB pitchers who underwent a SLAP repair between 2004 and 2019 were included in this study with a mean age of 29 years. Of the 55 players, 33 players had a career-ending injury, and 22 players had a successful surgery and RTP at the major league level. The overall RTP following surgery was 40% (22/55) of pitchers. During the study period, the average days spent on the IL was 172 per year. There was no change seen in the average number of days spent on the IL over the study time period (R² = 0.001) (Fig. 1). Looking at the financial impact of SLAP repair on MLB, the total cost for pitchers on the IL after SLAP repair was $171,977,859 during the study period, with an average of $3.5 million per year. Over the study period, the number of SLAP tears and repairs remained stable (Fig. 2). With increasing salaries during our time span, results did demonstrate an increase in average cost of replacing pitchers on the IL (R² = 0.288) (Fig. 1).

After exclusion of the 33 pitchers with a career-ending SLAP injury, analysis of short-term performance metrics comparing 1 season prior to surgical treatment showed no significant difference for ERA (3.84 vs. 4.78; P = .445) and WHIP (1.28 vs. 1.48; P = .138). There was a significant decrease in number of IP postsurgical treatment averaging 50.85 IP compared to 106.96 IP before the injury (P < .01) (Table I). Of the 22 returning players, 13 players (59%) were able to achieve RTPP in the first season immediately following treatment and rehabilitation. When analyzing performance metrics for all seasons played after surgery, both ERA and WHIP significantly increased (4.13 vs. 5.19; P = .030 and 1.36 vs. 1.53; P = .033, respectively). There was a strong trend toward decreasing IP to 265.30 including all seasons pitched after injury from 503.63 before injury (P = .058) (Table II). A large majority of players (82%) were able to achieve RTPP overall when looking at all seasons combined following treatment and rehabilitation.

Discussion

SLAP tears are a disabling shoulder injury for overhead throwing athletes, particularly for elite-level MLB players.15 The primary purpose of this study was to analyze the impact of these SLAP injuries resulting in the need for surgery in high-level professional MLB pitchers. Our results demonstrated majority of players were not able to RTP after SLAP repair, and there was a trend of higher costs for these SLAP repairs, due to the increase in the salaries of MLB players over the study period. In addition, the overall incidence of SLAP repairs remained stable throughout the study period, as did the number of days pitchers spent on the IL per year. In contrast, Erickson et al found a decreasing trend in the incidence of type II SLAP repairs over a 10-year period.16 Although their study did not specifically evaluate MLB players, this type of SLAP tear is most prevalent in athletic pitchers.7

The high-velocity throwing motion of MLB pitchers causes repetitive microtrauma to the ball-and-socket joint which can disrupt the intricate anatomy of the shoulder joint. SLAP tears and sometimes repairs in these high-level pitchers can alter their performance because of changes in accuracy and velocity. The literature shows that SLAP tears are associated with significantly high number of days spent on the IL up to even a year.1,12,13 Smith et al concluded that over 60% of MLB pitchers who underwent surgical repair returned to play with recovery days in isolated labrum injuries averaging at 314 days, and 326 days with labrum injuries and rotator cuff injuries concurrently. In our study, the mean time interval for RTP was 172 days, which is lower than that in previous studies.17,12 Consistent with previous studies, we found no significant decline in sports performance following surgical repair; more than 70% of MLB pitchers returned to play, at an average of 13 months postoperatively, without significant difference in performance level.15

Our results indicated an RTP rate of 40% and a successful RTP rate of 82% over the entire career of players. Previous studies report
a 62.5% RTP in pitchers following shoulder surgery, based on performance equivalent to preinjury level.18 Smith et al also reported an RTPP rate of 86.7% for pitchers who were able to RTP.18 Similar to our results, their study concluded no significant difference in pitching statistics before and after surgical repair except for IP for players that were able to RTP. In general, there remains a lower expected RTP for baseball players than for other overhead athletes, and literature varies regarding RTP for patients who participate in pitching.10,14 Gilliam et al reported a similar RTP in pitchers averaging 59% and a higher RTP of 76% for nonpitchers; however, their study also noted pitchers did not feel the same or better than how they were before injury.8 Conversely, a systematic review of elite pitchers highlighted that postoperatively overhead players demonstrated excellent results on patient-reported outcomes but with a decreased performance.9,17 Neri et al reported that 57% of elite overhead athletes returned to play at a preinjury level of sports performance.12 Consequently, 26% (6/23) in their study still suffered from pain upon RTP. Neuman et al also found that baseball players compared to other overhead athletes had a lower percentage of RTP after SLAP repair, with pitchers more likely to RTP than position players.13

In proportions, upper extremity injuries are higher in MLB pitchers than in those at all other positions.15 In particular, SLAP tear is debilitating to both the pitcher and the team with regard to performance and economics. Seventeen percent of players who suffered a SLAP tear never pitched again competitively,12 and only a small percentage of players (14%) returned to play during the same season.16 With such extended lengths of time spent on the IL,
previous studies of MLB injuries have shown that the financial impact of replacing injured players is substantial.\(^1\) We found that pitchers with SLAP tears incur a mean annual cost of $3,546,155, resulting in a total of $171,977,859. In comparison to the total costs reported by Conte et al ($7,618,817,407), the magnitude of SLAP injuries alone in our study is approximately 2.3%. Their study was based on data of 8357 MLB players assigned to the IL over a period of 18 years. The injuries evaluated were those of multiple body regions, including shoulder, elbow, chest/back/spine, wrist/hand/ fingers, lower leg/knee, and the upper leg/ thigh.\(^1\)

It is encouraging to say that aside from the high financial impact of this injury, players are able to RTP and do not face a significant decline in outcomes as assessed by our performance statistics. In our study, we did not have access to players’ complete treatment history, and so we could only assess outcomes based on 1 known (surgical) procedure.\(^5\) We were unable to determine players’ progress and extent of recovery.

Conclusion

Our study shows that while players who suffer SLAP tears spend an extensive number of days on the IL and often results in a hefty financial burden for teams, those who undergo surgical repair for SLAP tears are able to RTP at a level commensurate with their preinjury performance. Given the overall negative impact of SLAP tear injuries, implementation of techniques aimed at preventing or reducing SLAP tears during the preseason may be the most efficacious and beneficial way of addressing this issue moving forward.

Disclaimers:

Funding: No funding was disclosed by the authors.

Conflicts of interest: Vani J. Sabesan receives research support from Orthofix, Inc. and Wright Medical Technology, Inc. Kiran Chatha is a paid employee of Depuy Synthes Mitek and paid consultant of DermaSensor, Inc. The other authors, their immediate families, and any research foundation with which they are affiliated have not received any financial payments or other benefits from any commercial entity related to the subject of this article.

References

1. Conte S, Camp CL, Dines JS. Injury trends in major league baseball over 18 seasons: 1998–2015. Am J Orthop (Bellevue Md) 2016;45:116–23.
2. Conte S, Requa RK, Garrec JC. Disability days in major league baseball. Am J Sports Med 2001;29:431–6.
3. Erickson BJ, Gupta AK, Harris JD, Bush-Joseph C, Bach BR, Abrams CD, et al. Rate of return to pitching and performance after Tommy John surgery in major league baseball pitchers. Am J Sports Med 2014;42:536–43. https://doi.org/10.1177/0363546513510890.
4. Erickson BJ, Jain A, Abrams CD, Nicholson GP, Cole BJ, Romeo AA, et al. SLAP lesions: trends in treatment. Arthroscopy 2016;32:976–81. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.arthro.2015.11.044.
5. Edwards SL, Lee JA, Bell JE, Packer JD, Ahmad CS, Levine WN, et al. Nonoperative treatment of superior labrum anterior posterior tears: improvements in pain, function, and quality of life. Am J Sports Med 2010;38:1459–61. https://doi.org/10.1177/0363546510370937.
6. Fares MY, Salhab HA, Khachte HH, Kane L, Fares Y, Fares J, et al. Upper limb injuries in major league baseball. Phys Ther Sport 2020;41:49–54. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ptsp.2019.11.002.
7. Fedorov WW, Ramkumar P, McCulloch PC, Lintner DM. Return to play after surgical treatment of superior labral tears in professional baseball players. Am J Sports Med 2014;42:1155–60. https://doi.org/10.1177/0363546514528096.
8. Gilliam BD, Douglas L, Fleissig GS, Aune KT, Mason KA, Dugas JR, et al. Return to play and outcomes in baseball players after superior labral anterior–posterior repairs. Am J Sports Med 2018;46:109–15. https://doi.org/10.1177/0363546517728256.
9. Harris JD, Frank JM, Jordan MA, Bush-Joseph CA, Romeo AA, Gupta AK, et al. Return to sport following shoulder surgery in the elite pitcher: a systematic review. Sports Health 2013;5:367–76. https://doi.org/10.1177/1941738113482988.
10. Ide J, Maeda S, Takagi K. Sports activity after arthroscopic superior labral repair using suture anchors in overhead-throwing athletes. Am J Sports Med 2005;33:507–14. https://doi.org/10.1177/03635465042269255.
11. Namdari S, Baldwin K, Ahn A, Huffman GR, Sennett BJ. Performance after rotator cuff tear and operative treatment: a case-control study of major league baseball pitchers. J Athl Train 2011;46:296–302. https://doi.org/10.4085/1062-6050-46.3.296.
12. Neri BR, ElAttrache NS, Oswyile KC, Mohr K, Yosum LA. Outcome of type II superior labral anterior posterior repairs in elite overhead athletes: effect of concomitant partial-thickness rotator cuff tears. Am J Sports Med 2011;39:114–20. https://doi.org/10.1177/0363546510379971.
13. Neuman BJ, Boisvert CB, Reiter B, Lawson K, Ciccotti MG, Cohen SB. Results of arthroscopic repair of type II superior labral anterior posterior lesions in overhead athletes: assessment of return to preinjury playing level and satisfaction. Am J Sports Med 2011;39:1883–8. https://doi.org/10.1177/0363545411423137.
14. Park JV, Chung SW, Jeon SH, Lee JG, Oh KS. Clinical and radiological outcomes of type 2 superior labral anterior posterior repairs in elite overhead athletes. Am J Sports Med 2013;41:1372–9. https://doi.org/10.1177/0363545413485561.
15. Posner M, Cameron KL, Wolf JM, Belmont PJ Jr, Owens BD. Epidemiology of major league baseball injuries. Am J Sports Med 2011;39:1676–80. https://doi.org/10.1177/0363546511417000.
16. Ricchetti ET, Woindner Z, Lawrence JT, Sennett BJ, Huffman GR. Glenoid labral repair in major league baseball pitchers. Int J Sports Med 2010;31:265–70. https://doi.org/10.1055/s-0030-1247596.
17. Sayde WM, Cohen SB, Ciccotti MG, Dodson CC. Return to play after Type II superior labral anterior-posterior lesion repairs in athletes: a systematic review. Clin Orthop Relat Res 2012;470:1595–600. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11999-011-2295-6.
18. Smith R, Lombardo DJ, Petersen-Fitts GR, Frank C, Tenbrunsel T, Curtis G, et al. A higher RTP rate and improved performance in professional baseball pitchers after repair of superior labral anterior–posterior tears. Orthop J Sports Med 2016;4: https://doi.org/10.1177/2325967116675822. 2325967116675822.
19. Thavanan A, Yu J, Horner NS, Leroux T, Alolabi B, Khan M. Return to sport after arthroscopic superior labral anterior–posterior repair: a systematic review. Sports Health 2019;11:520–7. https://doi.org/10.1177/1941738119873892.