INFLUENCE OF EIGHT CHOSEN ESSENTIAL OILS IN THE VAPOR PHASE ON THE GROWTH OF RHIZOPUS STOLONIFER AND RHIZOPUS LYOCOCCUS

Dana Tančinová, Miroslava Hlebová, Denisa Foltinová, Zuzana Mašková, Zuzana Barboráková

ABSTRACT
This study aimed to evaluate the fungicidal effect of eight essential oils against five strains of the genus Rhizopus. Strains were obtained from various moldy foods, namely Rhizopus stolonifer KM 383 from chestnut, R. stolonifer KM 510 from strawberry, R. stolonifer KM 511 from nectarine, R. stolonifer KM 524 from cherry tomatoes, and R. lyococcus KM 512 from blackberry. The essential oils (EO) used in this study were jasmine EO (extract from Jasminum officinale L.), bergamot EO (Mentha aquatica L. var. citrata (Her.) Fresen), bitter orange EO (Citrus aurantium L.), grapefruit EO (Citrus paradisi Macfady), sweet flag EO (East Asian Calamus, from Acorus calamus L. var. angustatus Bes), star anise EO (from Illicium verum J.D.Hook), geranium EO (from Pelargonium graveolens), and lemongrass EO (from Cymbopogon citratus DC). The semi-quantitative composition of the essential oil samples was determined by gas chromatography coupled with mass spectrometry (GC-MS). The antifungal activity of essential oils against the strains of R. stolonifer and R. lyococcus was determined during 7 days, using the micro-atmosphere method (0.625 μL.mL⁻¹ of air). Two essential oils, geranium and lemongrass, completely inhibited the growth of all isolates. Bitter orange essential oil inhibited the growth of all isolates of Rhizopus stolonifer, but isolate of Rhizopus lyococcus began to grow after four days of cultivation. In conclusion, certain essential oils are highly effective in the vapor phase. These could be used in further tests of their antifungal activity and could be used in the control of Rhizopus spp. or other fungal pathogens.

Keywords: essential oils; Rhizopus stolonifer; Rhizopus lyococcus; antifungal activity; vapour phase

INTRODUCTION
Rhizopus species including R. stolonifer are naturally found in soil, debris, and air. Fungal dispersal mechanisms of R. stolonifer are wind, air currents, and some invertebrates such as mites and insects, among others (Bautista-Baños et al., 2014). Rhizopus stolonifer is a ubiquitous fungus and can be isolated from many kinds of foods. It grows rampantly at 25 °C, filling a Petri dish with sporangia and thallus. The mycelia of sporangia and thallus are white at first and then become black. At first, the lesions (soak with water) are rapidly softened and diseased lesions gradually expanded. The mycelia grow vigorously on the surface of fruits and formed stolons. Colonies of R. stolonifer are white cottony at first, becoming heavily speckled by the presence of sporangia and then brownish-black. Throughout its development, this fungus produces yellowish-brown conidia that are dispersed by wind, water, and insects. Rhizopus stolonifer is a destructive pathogen that causes many diseases in plants and vegetables. It is a common pathogen in fresh produce and is often found in foods such as strawberries, apples, tomatoes, cucumbers, and table grapes. In several fruits and crops such as strawberries, peaches, tomatoes, cucumbers, and table grapes, Rhizopus rot causes soft rot during transport and storage (Kassemeyer and Berkelmann-Löhertz, 2009). Infection usually starts from wounding after the cracking of fruits. At first, the lesions (soak with water) are rapidly softened and diseased lesions gradually expanded. The mycelia grow vigorously
nutritional properties of foods, while new ingredients with functional properties contribute to improving health. The “elimination” of additives used in a wide variety of foods is demanded, while “natural” additives are seen as a benefit for both quality and safety (Viuda-Martos et al., 2008). Over the past few years, consumers demand safe, environmentally-friendly, and natural products. It has driven the search for preservation techniques that improve product quality and safety without causing nutritional or sensory losses. Natural antimicrobial essential oils have the potential to provide quality and safety benefits and have fewer impacts on human health (Ju et al., 2019). The development of natural crop protective products as alternatives to synthetic fungicides is currently in the spotlight (Combrinck, Regnier and Kamatou, 2011; Stević et al., 2014).

The present research aimed to determine the inhibitory effect of chosen essential oils on the growth of different Rhizopus stolonifer and Rhizopus lyococcus strains.

Scientific hypothesis
The chosen essential oils can affect the growth of Rhizopus strains.

MATERIAL AND METHODOLOGY

Samples
Essential oils – Hanus Nitra (www.hanus.sk).

Chemicals
Potato dextrose agar (PDA, HIMEDIA India).
Hexane Sigma-Aldrich (HPLC Plus, for HPLC, GC, and residue analysis, ≥95%).
Dimethylsulfoxide (DMSO) Sigma-Aldrich (HybriMax™, sterile-filtered, BioReagent, suitable for a hybridoma, ≥99.7%).

Biological Material:
Strains of Rhizopus spp. – Collection of microscopic fungi of the Department of Microbiology, SUA in Nitra.

Instruments
Agilent 6890 GC-FID (Agilent Technologies, Palo Alto, CA, USA). Agilent 7890A GC coupled to an Agilent MSD5975C MS detector (Agilent Technologies, Palo Alto, CA, USA) with an HP-5MS column (30 m × 0.25 mm, 0.25 mm film thickness). One microliter of the sample was injected in split mode 1:12, at an injector temperature of 250°C and electron ionization energy of 70 eV. Analysis were measured in SCAN mode, the mass range was 40 – 400 m/z. Starting at 60 °C, the oven temperature was increased at a rate of 3 °C/min to a maximum of 231 °C, where it was kept constant for 10 min. The identification of constituents was based on a comparison of their mass spectra and relative retention indices (RI) against the National Institute of Standards and Technology Library (NIST, USA), as well as authentic analytical standards and data from the literature. Relative proportion of EO constituents were assessed by Agilent 6890 GC-FID (Agilent Technologies, Palo Alto, CA, USA) with RTX5 column (Restek, Bellefonte, PA; 20 m × 0.18 mm, 0.2 μm film thickness). The same method for GC-MS was used. Relative proportions were calculated by dividing individual peak area by total area of all peaks. The response factor was not taken into account. Only compounds over 0.1% were included. The used standards are listed in Table 1.

Antifungal activity of essential oils
The micro atmosphere method was used to study the effect of essential oils on the growth of strains of Rhizopus sp. The test was performed in sterile plastic Petri dishes (Ø 90 mm) containing 15 mL of potato dextrose agar (PDA, HIMEDIA India). Evaluation by filter paper was made by the method adapted from Guynot et al. (2003). Essential oils were tested in concentration 0.625 μL.cm⁻² of air. A sterile filter paper (cca.1.5 x 1.5 cm) was placed in the lid of the Petri dish and 50 μL of essential oil was pipetted by micropipette to the paper. Dishes were kept in an inverted position. Filter paper discs impregnated with sterilized distilled water were used as a control to confirm no solvent effect of bioactivity. Each isolate was inoculated on the center of Petri dishes with 5 μL of spore’s suspension (10⁵ spores in 1 mL). Dishes were tightly sealed with parafilm and incubated for seven days at 25 ±1 °C (three replicates were used for each treatment). Diameters (Ø mm) of the growing colonies were measured on the 2nd, 4th, and 7th day with a digital caliper.

Inhibition of mycelial growth
According to Çakir et al. (2005) and Kordali et al. (2008) growth inhibition of treated samples (T) against
control (C) was calculated by the percentage of growth inhibition using the following equation (1):

\[
\% \text{ of inhibition} = \left( \frac{C - T}{C} \right) \times 100
\]

Where:
- C is the mean of six replicates of hyphal extension (mm) of controls;
- T is the mean of six replicates of hyphal extension (mm) of plates treated with either essential oil.

**Minimum inhibitory doses (MIDs)**

Essential oils that completely inhibited the growth of all strains of *R. stolonifer* or strain of *R. lyococcus* were used to determine their minimum inhibitory doses (MIDs). EOs dissolved in dimethylsulfoxide (DMSO) were prepared at different concentrations (500, 250, 125, 63, 31.25, and 15.63 μL.L⁻¹ of air). For each fungal strain, a conidial spore suspension of 10⁶ spore in mL⁻¹ was prepared. The EVE™ Automatic cell counter (NanoEnTek, Korea) was used to determine the number of spores. Petri dishes (90 mm, three-sector, two replicates) containing 15 mL of PDA were inoculated by 5 μL spore suspension. Cultivation was carried out at 25± 1 °C and measured after 7 and 14 days. The MID (expressed as microliters of EOs per volume unit of the atmosphere above the organism growing on the agar surface) was defined as the lowest concentration of the oil which did not permit any visible growth after 7 or 14 days in comparison with control sets.

**Statistical Analysis**

The size of colonies of isolates (mm) for each day of cultivation within treatment was evaluated. Also, the size of colonies of isolate for each treatment to the same isolate in the control group was evaluated too. The results were mathematically processed using the Microsoft Excel program and statistically evaluated by SAS/9.3 (2010). A used statistical model can be written in the following form:

\[
y_{ij} = \mu + \text{ISOLATE}i + \text{TREATMENT}j + \epsilon_{ij}
\]

Where:
- yij = the measurements for size of colonies; μ = overall mean; ISOLATEi = the fixed effects of isolates (i = 1 to 6); TREATMENTj = the fixed effect of treatment (j = 1 to 5); εij = random error, assuming εijk ~ N(0, 1 σε2).

**Probit analyses**

The ability of strains to grow in the presence of EO was coded to a binomial scale (1 – growth observed, 0 – without growth). Such data were processed by probit analysis in Statgraphics Centurion XV (Statgraphics) software. Doses that inhibit the growth in 50% respectively 90% of cases (MID50 and MID90) were reversely predicted from the regression equation.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

According to market data, there are about 400 species, from 67 plant families, which are cultivated on a large commercial scale for the production of essential oils (Bhattacharya, 2016). In this research, we evaluated the antifungal properties of 8 essential oils from families Oleaceae (jasmine EO), Rutaceae (bergamot EO, bitter orange EO, grapefruit EO), Acoraceae (sweet flag EO), Liliaceae (geranium EO), Lamiales bergamot EO (Montha aquatica L. var. citrata (Her.) Fresen), Poaceae (lemongrass EO). According to authors (Ben Farhat et al., 2016; Méndez-Tovar et al., 2016; Dušková et al., 2016), the effect of the growing seasons, the different growth stage of plants, and climatic conditions of each year in terms of the essential oil content and composition were proven. Based on the above, we also focused on the composition of the essential oils we used. The identified compounds are listed in Table 1. The major components according to the concrete essential oil were: bergamot EO - (R)-(+) -Limonene (34.7%) and Geraniol (31.1%), bitter orange EO - (R)-(+) - Limonene (31.9%), grapefruit EO - 1,8-Cineole (92.2%), geranium - Citronellol (28.3%), lemongrass EO - β-Citral (28.3%), jasmine EO - (R)-Borneol (37.7%), Star aniise EO - Trans-Anethole (87.1%), sweet flag EO - cis-Verbenol (87.6%).

Species of genus *Rhizopus* especially *R. stolonifer* are the most important postharvest pathogens for a great variety of fruits and vegetables. Several articles have been published on the possibilities of influencing the growth of these fungi by plant essential oils. Inhibitory effect of *Thymus vulgaris* EO on the *Rhizopus stolonifer* tested Bhaskara Reddy et al. (1998), Bosquez-Molina et al. (2010). Sage EO (Salvia officinalis), savory EO (Satureja hortensis), and zataria or Shiraz thyme EO (Zataria multiflora) were tested by Alizadeh-Saltech et al. (2010) and Alizadeh-Saltech et al. (2013). The essential oils from Mentha piperita, Lavandula angustifolia, Foeniculum vulgare, and Cuminum cyminum were tested by Hadian et al. (2008). Certain essential oils are highly effective in the vapor phase and could be used in the control of foodborne bacterial pathogens (López et al., 2007; Nedorostova et al., 2009). Tyagi and Malik (2011) report significantly higher antimicrobial activity of some essential oils, which we observed in the vapor phase. In our research, we also used the vapor phase to test the effect of selected essential oils on *Rhizopus* growth. The antifungal activity of 7 essential oils against the *Rhizopus stolonifer* (4 strains) and *Rhizopus lyococcus* (1 strain) were determined, using the micro-atmosphere method (625 μL.L⁻¹ of air). The results are shown in Table 2 and Figure 1.

Two essential oils: lemongrass (Cymbopogon citratus DC) and geranium (Pelargonium graveolens) completely inhibited the growth of all strains. Lemongrass (Cymbopogom citratus DC) essential oil is known due to its broad-spectrum antimicrobial activity (Leimann et al., 2009). According to Abdulazeez, Abdullahi and James (2016), Božík et al. (2017), Číscarová et al. (2020) lemongrass oil has been also shown to be an effective fumigant for stored food commodities due to its bioactivity in the vapor phase. Lemongrass EO was found to significantly reduce colony development against key postharvest pathogens: Colletotrichum coccodes, Botrytis cinerea, Cladosporium herbarum, Rhizopus stolonifer, A. flavus, A. parasiticus, A. ochraceus, A. westerdijkiae, and Aspergillus niger in vitro. Lemongrass essential oil at concentrations of 0.5% and 1.0% was incorporated into 0.5% and 1.0% chitosan solution and evaluated as means of controlling anthracnose of bell pepper in vitro and in vivo.
### Table 1

| Compound                | Essential oils | B  | BO | GP | GR | L  | J  | AN | S  |
|-------------------------|----------------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| Asarone                 |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    | 5.4|
| Camphenea               |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |
| (+)-α-Pinene            |                | 1.3| 1.7| 0.6| 3.5| 0.4|    |    |    |
| Estragol                |                | 0.9| 0.3| 0.4|    |    | 1.2|    |    |
| β-Phellandrene          |                | 8.9| 17.5|1.3|   |    |    |    |    |
| (-)-β-Pinene            |                | 6.0| 17.5|1.3|   |    |    |    |    |
| 6-Methylhept-5-en-2-ol  |                | 0.6| 1.8| 1.4|    | 6.0|    |    |    |
| β-Myrcene               |                | 1.6| 1.6| 1.6|    |    |    |    |    |
| α-Phellandrene          |                | 1.6| 1.6| 1.6|    |    |    |    |    |
| p-Cymene                |                | 1.6| 1.6| 1.6|    |    |    |    |    |
| (R)-(+)-Limonene        |                | 34.7|31.9| 9.6|19.2|    |    |    |    |
| 1,8-Cineole             |                | 92.2|2.7 | 1.1|    |    |    |    |    |
| β-Ocimene               |                | 0.7|    |    |    |    |    |    |    |
| γ-Terpineene            |                | 8.5| 3.1| 4.3|15.4|4.3 | 1.0|4.1 |
| (-)-Linalool            |                | 9.2| 3.1| 4.3|15.4|4.3 | 1.0|4.1 |
| (+)-Rose oxide          |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |2.3 |
| Thujone                 |                | 0.3|    |    |    |    |    |    |    |
| cis-Limonene oxide      |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |1.4 |
| (1R)-(+)-Camphor        |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.6 |
| (+)-Citronellal         |                | 1.0| 2.8| 1.3|    |    |    |    |    |
| (-)-Borneol             |                | 5.2|    |    |    |    |    |    |37.7|
| 2-Undecanone            |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |4.6 |
| Pseudo-limonene         |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |3.6 |
| 5-Methylindoide         |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.6 |
| α-Terpineol             |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |1.6 |
| cis-Verbeneol           |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |87.6|
| 4-Carvomenthenol        |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.3 |
| Cinnamaldehyde          |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.4 |
| Citronellol             |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |28.3|
| β-Citronellol           |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.4 |
| β-Citral                |                | 8.2| 0.7|28.3|    |    |    |    |    |
| (-)-Carvone             |                | 0.8|    |    |    |    |    |    |    |
| Geraniol                |                | 31.1|6.9 |11.8|5.0 |1.9 |    |    |    |
| Trans-Anethole           |                | 87.1|0.4 |    |    |    |    |    |    |
| Anis ketone             |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |
| α-Citral                |                | 0.5|12.2|1.4 |35.2|    |    |    |    |
| Neryl acetate           |                | 1.8|    |    |    |    |    |    |    |
| Benzyl benzoate         |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |10.9|
| Citronellyl formate     |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |13.0|
| Carvacrol               |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |3.1 |
| δ-Elemene               |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.6 |
| α-Copaene               |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.7 |
| Geranyl acetate         |                | 6.7| 2.2| 4.2| 0.5|    |    |    |    |
| β-Caryophyllene         |                | 1.3| 0.8|2.3 |    |    |    |    |    |
| Farnesene               |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |2.0 |
| Citronellyl propionate  |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.8 |
| Germacrene-D            |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |4.3 |
| β-Bisabolene            |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.7 |
| γ-Cadinene              |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.5 |
| Myristicin              |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |1.4 |
| Acetyl eugenol          |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.8 |
| (+)-Carvone acetate     |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.6 |
| Caryophyllene oxide     |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.8 |
| Cedrol                  |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |1.2 |
| γ-Eudesmol              |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |5.7 |
| Tau-Cadinol             |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.6 |
| β-Eudesmol              |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |2.0 |
| α-Eudesmol              |                |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |0.6 |
| **Total**               |                | 97.5|96.7|99 |97.3|98.4|98.4|96.6|99.5|

Note: * – identification confirmed by co-injection of authentic standard, GS-MS – gas chromatography coupled with mass spectrometry, B – bergamot, BO – bitter orange, GP – grapefruit, GR – geranium, L – lemongrass, J – jasmine, AN – star anise, S – sweet flag.
Fungal growth was effectively controlled by 0.5% and 1.0% EO in vitro (Ali, Noh and Mustafa, 2015). Moore-Neibel et al. (2011) described the antimicrobial activity of lemon grass oil against Salmonella directly on the leafy greens, romaine, and iceberg lettuces, and both mature and baby spinach described.

As mentioned above, the geranium EO completely inhibited the growth of the Rhizopus strains used in this study, as well. This essential oil has the potential to be used in the food industry to prolong the shelf life of fresh and processed foods (Verma, Chandra Padalia and Chauhan, 2016).

Bouzenna and Krichen (2013) tested the antifungal activity Pelargonium graveolens Eo against Rhizoctonia solani, and results showed that the essential oil was highly active at a dose of 12.5 µL.20 mL⁻¹ of PDA. Naëini, Nazeri and Shokri (2011) reported that P. graveolens EO has considerable anti-Malassezia activities.

Bitter orange (Citrus aurantium L.) essential oil completely inhibited the growth of Rhizopus stolonifer strains. But we recorded growth on day seven of cultivation at the Rhizopus lyococcus strain, in the presence of this essential oil. Bitter orange oil has been reported to possess various pharmacological properties. Properties of bitter orange EO for food preservation are discussed too (Anwar et al., 2016). In contrast with bitter orange EO, grapefruit essential oil inhibited the growth of R. lyococcus completely but only weakly Rhizopus stolonifer. Ng et al. (2016) show that grapefruit oil (Citrus paradisi) exhibits an array of activities encompassing insecticidal and antimicrobial activities.

Table 2 Effect of essential oils (treatment) in the vapor phase on the growth of Rhizopus stolonifer and Rhizopus lyococcus strains.

| Treatment essential oil | Strains of Rhizopus stolonifer | Strain of Rhizopus lyococcus | std. Error |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------|
|                         | 383                            | 510                         | 511        | 524        | 512          |
|                         | Second day of cultivation - means |
| Star anise              | 0 a                            | 12.42 b                     | 7.11 c     | 0.00 a     | 0.00 a       | 0.1548       |
| Bergamot                | 7.63 AA                        | 9.14 a                      | 8.87 a     | 7.67 a     | 14.31 b      | 0.1548       |
| Sweet flag              | 90.00                          | 90.00                       | 90.00      | 90.00      | 90.00        | 0.1548       |
| Geranium                | Completely inhibited growth of strains |
| Grapefruit              | 16.16 AA                       | 16.19 a                     | 28.81 b    | 20.46 d    | 0.00 c       | 0.1548       |
| Jasmine                 | 90.00                          | 90.00                       | 90.00      | 90.00      | 90.00        | 0.1548       |
| Lemongrass              | Completely inhibited growth of strains |
| Bitter orange           | Completely inhibited growth of strains |
| Control                 | 90.00B                         | 90.00B                      | 90.00B     | 90.00B     | 90.00B       | 0.1548       |
|                         | Fourth day of cultivation – means |
| Star anise              | 11.61 AA                       | 27.92bA                     | 20.615cA   | 4.64dA     | 0.00eA       | 0.2232       |
| Bergamot                | 9.24 AA                       | 14.48bA                     | 13.66cB     | 12.35bC    | 90.00d       | 0.2232       |
| Sweet flag              | 90.00                          | 90.00                       | 90.00      | 90.00      | 90.00        | 0.2232       |
| Geranium                | Completely inhibited growth of strains |
| Grapefruit              | 27.75 AA                       | 32.63bB                     | 90.00c     | 39.88dA    | 0.00eA       | 0.2232       |
| Jasmine                 | 90.00                          | 90.00                       | 90.00      | 90.00      | 90.00        | 0.2232       |
| Lemongrass              | Completely inhibited growth of strains |
| Bitter orange           | Completely inhibited growth of strains |
| Control                 | 90.00B                         | 90.00B                      | 90.00B     | 90.00B     | 90.00B       | 0.2232       |
|                         | Seven day of cultivation – means |
| Star anise              | 22.43 AA                       | 90.00b                      | 90.00b     | 34.47cA    | 9.77dA       | 0.2072       |
| Bergamot                | 16.33 A                       | 18.55A                      | 18.41A     | 21.51A     | 90.00        | 0.2072       |
| Sweet flag              | 90.00                          | 90.00                       | 90.00      | 90.00      | 90.00        | 0.2072       |
| Geranium                | Completely inhibited growth of strains |
| Grapefruit              | 36.12 AA                       | 90.00b                      | 90.00b     | 61.61c     | 0.00dA       | 0.2072       |
| Jasmine                 | 90.00                          | 90.00                       | 90.00      | 90.00      | 90.00        | 0.2072       |
| Lemongrass              | Completely inhibited growth of strains |
| Bitter orange           | Completely inhibited growth of strains |
| Control                 | 90.00B                         | 90.00B                      | 90.00B     | 90.00B     | 90.00B       | 0.2072       |

Note: a, b, c, d, e – different letters are significant within treatment at the level p <0.05; A, B – significant difference (p <0.05) of the same isolate within all treatments to the same isolate in control.
Viuda-Martos et al. (2008) point out the good inhibitory activity of grapefruit EO on the moulds Penicillium chrysogenum and Penicillium verrucosum too.

The strains of the test species responded differently to the presence of bergamot EO. Significant antifungal activities were observed in all Rhizopus stolonifer strains. The strain of Rhizopus lyococcus began to grow intensively after two days of cultivation and no growth inhibition was found on the fourth day of cultivation. Some authors e.g. Avila-Sosa et al. (2016), report that bergamot essential oil may be very helpful when applied to food preservation systems.

Jasmine (Jasminum officinale L.) and sweet flag (Acorus calamus L. var. angustatus Bes) essential oils did not inhibit the effect on the growth of tested strains genus Rhizopus. Apart from other uses of jasmine essential oil, it is active against various gram-negative, gram-positive bacteria and fungi. This property of jasmine oil allows it to be used in food preservation. It also possesses antioxidant activity (Ahmed et al., 2016). The possibility of using sweet flag EO as a natural preservative in food was indicated by Miao et al. (2016) and other authors.

Star anise (Illicium verum J. D. Hook) essential oil completely inhibited the growth of two strain R. stolonifer (KMi 383 and KMi 524) to the second day of cultivation.
and strain R. lyococcus to the fourth day of cultivation. The complete inhibition of the germination of spores of Penicillium expansum by star anise EO in the vapor phase is reported by da Rocha Neto et al. (2019).

Essential oils that completely inhibited the growth of R. stolonifer or R. lyococcus isolates were used to determine the minimum inhibitory doses (MIDs). The results are shown in Table 3. High minimum inhibitory doses for R. stolonifer and R. lyococcus strains were determined. The best results (500 μL.L⁻¹ of air) for R. stolonifer KMi 383, KMi 510, KMi 524, and R. lyococcus Kmi 512 on the 7th day of incubation showed lemongrass EO. MIDs for geranium EO were 625 μL.L⁻¹ of air for all strains R. stolonifer and strain R. lyococcus too. The same parameters were determined for geranium EO for all strains of R. stolonifer and grapefruit EO for the strain of R. lyococcus. On the 14th day of incubation, we found the same MIDs, respectively higher. It was found that EOs have different effects on individual strains of R. stolonifer. Tripathi and Shukla (2009) showed absolute fungitoxic activity of geranium EO against Botryodiplodia theobromae (the cause an important postharvest fungal disease of mango), like we. These authors reported MIC 200 ppm for this EO.

Using probit analysis, predicted MIDs90 and MIDs50 were calculated. The results are shown in Table 4. The most effective tested essential oil was lemongrass, less effective bitter orange EO for R. stolonifer strains, and grapefruit EO for R. lyococcus strain.

The specific compounds isolated from the oils may be non-fungi toxic in nature. Different components of the oils as such may also check the development of races of fungi during their application due to more than one site of action. Fungi can easily develop resistance against a single component due to its specific mode of action. The exploitation of the essential oils as such would be more economical than a single component as a fungitoxicant (Tripathi and Shukla, 2009). The safe use of EO ingredients is also supported by their self-limiting properties as flavoring substances in food resulting in low levels of use; their rapid absorption, metabolic detoxication, and excretion in humans and other animals; the wide margins of safety between the conservative estimates of intake and the no observed-adverse effect levels determined from subchronic and chronic studies and the lack of significant genotoxic, developmental and teratology potentials (Adams et al., 2011).

CONCLUSION

In our research, we evaluated the antifungal properties of jasmine EO (extract from Jasminum officinale L.), bergamot EO (Mentha aquatica L. var. citrata (Her.) Fresen), bitter orange EO (from Citrus aurantium L.), grapefruit EO (Citrus paradisi Macfady), sweet flag EO (East Asian Calamus, from Acorus calamus L. var. angustatus Bes), star anise EO (from Illicium verum J.D.Hook), geranium EO (from Pelargonium graveolens), and lemongrass EO (from Cymbopogon citratus DC), two essential oils: geranium and lemongrass completely inhibited the growth of all isolates. Bitter orange essential oil inhibited the growth of all isolates of Rhizopus stolonifer, but isolate of Rhizopus lyococcus began to grow after four days of cultivation. In conclusion, certain essential oils are highly effective in the vapor phase. These could be used in further tests of their antifungal activity and could be used in the control of Rhizopus spp. or other fungal pathogens. In further research, we plan to test the effect of selected essential oils in vitro (on selected fruits). In the next part we will test the impact of EOs on sensory quality of selected fruits.

REFERENCES

Abdulazez, M. A., Abdullahi, A. S., James, B. D. 2016. Lemongrass (Cymbopogon spp.) oils. In Preedy, V. R. Essential Oils in Food Preservation, Flavor and Safety. USA : Elsevier, p. 509-516. ISBN 978-0-12-416641-7. https://doi.org/10.1016/b978-0-12-416641-7.00058-4

Adams, B., Gavin, C. L., McGowen, M. M. Waddell, W. J., Cohen, S. M., Feron, V. J., Marnett, L. J., Munro, I. C. Portoghese, P. S., Rietjens, I. M. C. M., Smith, R. L. 2011. The FEMA GRAS assessment of aliphatic and aromatic terpene hydrocarbons used as flavor ingredients. Food and Chemical Toxicology, vol. 49, no. 10, p. 2471-2494. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2011.06.011

Ahmed, N., Hanani, Y. A., Ansari, S. Y., Anwar, S. 2016. Jasmine (Jasminum sambac L., Oleaceae) oils. In Preedy, V. R. Essential Oils in Food Preservation, Flavor and Safety. USA : Elsevier, p. 487-494. ISBN 978-0-12-416641-7. https://doi.org/10.1016/b978-0-12-416641-7.00055-9

Ali, A., Noh, N. M., Mustafa, M. A. 2015. Antimicrobial activity of chitosan enriched with lemongrass oil against anthracnose of bell pepper. Food Packaging and Shelf Life, vol. 3, p. 56-61. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fsbl.2014.10.003

Alizadeh-Salteh, S., Arzani, K., Omidbeigi, R., Safaei, N., Mohammadi, P. 2013. Savory essential oil effect on postharvest control of Rhizopus rot on packaged peaches in polyethylene films. Acta Horticulturae, vol. 1012, p. 759-762. https://doi.org/10.17660/actahortic.2013.1012.102

Alizadeh-Salteh, S., Arzani, K., Omidbeili, R., Safaei, N. 2010. Essential oils inhibit mycelial growth of Rhizopus stolonifer. European Journal of Horticultural Science, vol. 75, no. 6, p. 278-282.

Anwar, S., Ahmed, N., Speciale, A., Cinimo, F., Saija, A. 2016. Bitter orange (Citrus aurantium L.) oils. In Preedy, V. R. Essential Oils in Food Preservation, Flavor and Safety, USA : Elsevier, p. 259-268. ISBN 978-0-12-416641-7. https://doi.org/10.1016/b978-0-12-416641-7.00029-8

Avila-Sosa, R., Navarro-Cruz, A. R., Sosa-Morales, M. E., Lopez-Malo, A., Palou, E. 2016. Bergamot (Citrus bergamia) oils. In Preedy, V. R. Essential Oils in Food Preservation, Flavor and Safety, USA : Elsevier, p. 247-252. ISBN 978-0-12-416641-7. https://doi.org/10.1016/b978-0-12-416641-7.00027-4

Bautista-Baños, S., Bosquez-Molina, E., Barrera-Necha, L. L. 2014. Rhizopus stolonifer (soft rot). In Bautista-Baños, S. Postharvest Decay. Amsterdam, Netherland : Elsevier, p. 1-44. ISBN 978-0-12-411552-4. https://doi.org/10.1016/b978-0-12-411552-1.00001-6

Ben Farhat, M., Jordán, M. J., Chaouch-Hamada, R., Landoulsi, A., Sotomayor, J. A. 2016. Phenophase effects on sage (Salvia officinalis L.) yield and composition of essential oil. Journal of Applied Research on Medicinal and Aromatic Plants, vol. 3, no. 3, p. 87-93. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jarmap.2016.02.001

Bhaskara Reddy, M. V., Angers, P., Gosselin, A., Arul, J. 1998. Characterization and use of essential oil from Thymus vulgaris against Botrytis cinerea and Rhizopus stolonifer in strawberry fruits. Phytochemistry, vol. 47, no. 8, p. 1515-1520. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0031-9422(97)00795-4
Bhattacharya, S. 2016. Cultivation of essential oils. In Preedy, V. R. Essential Oils in Food Preservation, Flavor and Safety, USA : Elsevier, p. 19-29. ISBN 978-0-12-416641-7. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-416641-7.00003-1

Bosquez-Molina, E., Jesús, E. R., Bautista-Baños, S., Verde-Calvo, J. R., Morales-López, J. 2010. Inhibitory effect of essential oils against Colletotrichum gloeosporioides and Rhizopus stolonifer in stored papaya fruit and their possible application in coatings. Postharvest Biology and Technology, vol. 57, no. 2, p. 132-137. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.postharvbio.2010.03.008

Bouzenna, H., Krichen, L. 2013. Pelargonium graveolens L. Her. and Artemisia arborescens L. essential oils: Chemical composition, antifungal activity against Rhizoctonia solani and insecticidal activity against Rhysopertha dominica. Natural Product Research, vol. 27, no. 9, p. 841-846. https://doi.org/10.1080/14787186.2012.711325.

Božík, M., Cisarová, M., Tančínová, D., Kouřínská, L., Hleba, L., Klouček, P. 2017. Selected essential oil vapours inhibit growth of Aspergillus spp. in oats with improved consumer acceptability. Industrial Crops and Products, vol. 98, p. 146-152. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indcrop.2016.11.044

Cakir, A., Kordali, S., Kılıc, H., Kaya, E. 2005. Antifungal properties of essential oil and crude extracts of Hypericum linarioides Bosse. Biochemical Systematics and Ecology, vol. 33, no. 3, p. 245-256. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bse.2004.08.006

Cisarová, M., Hleba, L., Medo, J., Tančínová, D., Mašková, Z., Čuňoň, J., Kovačič, A., Foltinová, D., Božík, M., Klouček, P. 2020. The in vitro and in situ effect of selected volatile oils in vapour phase against bread spoilage toxigenic aspergilli. Food Control, vol. 110, p. 107007. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2019.107007.

Combrinck, S., Regnier, T., Kamatou, G. P. P. 2011. In vitro activity of eighteen essential oils and some major components against common postharvest fungal pathogens of fruit. Industrial Crops and Products, vol. 33, no. 2, p. 344-349. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indcrop.2010.11.011

da Rocha Neto, A. C., Navarro, B. B., Canton, L., Maraschin, M., di Piero, R. M. 2019. Antifungal activity of palmarosa (Cymbopogon martini), tea tree (Melaleuca alternifolia) and star anise (Illicium verum) essential oils against Penicillium expansum and their mechanisms of action. LWT - Food Science and Technology, vol. 105, p. 385-392. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2019.02.060

Dušková, E., Dušek, K., Indrák, P., Směkalová, K. 2016. Postharvest changes in essential oil content and quality of lavender flowers. Industrial Crops and Products, vol. 79, p. 225-231. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indcrop.2015.11.007

Guynot, M. E., Ramos, A. J., Seto, L., Purroy, P., Sanchis, V., Marin, S. 2003. Antifungal activity of volatile compounds generated by essential oils against fungi commonly causing deterioration of bakery products. Journal of Applied Microbiology, vol. 94, no. 5, p. 893-899. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2672.2003.01927.x

Hadian, J., Ghasemnezhad, M., Ranbar, H., Frazane, M., Ghorbanpour, M. 2008. Antifungal Potency of Some Essential Oils in Control of Postharvest Decay of Strawberry Caused by Botrytis cinerea, Rhizopus stolonifer and Aspergillus niger. Journal of Essential Oil Bearing Plants, vol. 11, no. 5, p. 553-562. https://doi.org/10.1080/0972606X.2008.10643666

Ju, J., Chen, X., Xie, Y., Yu, H., Guo, Y., Cheng, Y., Yao, W. 2019. Application of essential oil as a sustained release preparation in food packaging. Trends in Food Science & Technology, vol. 92, p. 22-32. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2019.08.005

Kassev, M., Kostova, D., Kirov, T., Kostev, P., Ivanov, V. 2016. Antifungal activity of selected essential oils against Botrytis cinerea, Rhizopus stolonifer and Aspergillus niger. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, vol. 55, p. 4348-4356. https://doi.org/10.1021/jf603295u

Korde, S., Kordali, S., Kılıc, H., Kaya, E. 2005. Antifungal properties of essential oil and crude extracts of Hypericum linarioides Bosse. Biochemical Systematics and Ecology, vol. 33, no. 3, p. 245-256. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bse.2004.08.006

Mete, E. 2008. Antifungal, phytotoxic and insecticidal properties of essential oil isolated from Turkish Origanum acutidens and its three components, carvacrol, thymol and p-cymene. Bioresource Technology, vol. 99, no. 18, p. 8788-8795. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2008.04.048

Morales-López, J., Morales-López, J. 2010. Inhibitory effect of essential oils against Colletotrichum gloeosporioides and Rhizopus stolonifer in stored papaya fruit and their possible application in coatings. Postharvest Biology and Technology, vol. 57, no. 2, p. 132-137. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.postharvbio.2010.03.008.

Nádorostová, L., Klouček, P., Kokoska, L., Stolcova, M., Naeini, A. R., Nazeri, M., Shin, J., Shi, R. 2011. Fungi and their possible use against foodborne microorganisms. In Preedy, V. R. Essential Oils in Food Preservation, Flavor and Safety, USA : Elsevier, p. 775-782. ISBN 978-0-12-416641-7. https://doi.org/10.1016/is/00088-2

Neibel, K., Gerber, C., Patel, J., Friedman, M., Ravishankar, S. 2011. Antimicrobial activity of lemongrass oil against Salmonella enterica on organic leafy greens. Journal of Applied Microbiology, vol. 112, no. 3, p. 485-492. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2672.2011.05222.x

Naeini, A. R., Nazeri, M., Shokri, H. 2011. Antifungal activity of Zataria multiflora, Pelargonium graveolens and Cuminum cyminum essential oils towards three species of Malassezia isolated from patients with pityriasis versicolor. Journal de Mycologie Médicale, vol. 21, no. 2, p. 87-91. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmymed.2011.01.004

Nederostova, L., Kloucek, P., Kokoska, L., Stolcova, M., Pulkrabek, J. 2009. Antimicrobial properties of selected essential oils in vapour phase against foodborne bacteria. Food Control, vol. 20, no. 2, p. 157-160. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2008.03.007

Ng, T. B., El-Din Ahmed Bekheit, A., Fang, E. F., Li, X., Lu, Q., Guo, H., Wong, J. H. 2016. Grapefruit (Citrus paradisi) oils. In Preedy, V. R. Essential Oils in Food Preservation, Flavor and Safety, USA : Elsevier, p. 463-470. ISBN 978-0-12-416641-7. https://doi.org/10.1016/b978-0-12-416641-7.00052-3
Conflict of Interest:
The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Ethical Statement:
This article does not contain any studies that would require an ethical statement.

Contact Address:
*Dana Tančinová, Slovak University of Agriculture, Faculty of Biotechnology and Food Sciences, Department of Microbiology, Tr. A. Hlinku 2, 949 76 Nitra, Slovakia, +421 37641 4433, E-mail: dana.tancinova@uniag.sk
ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6790-8169

Miroslava Hlebová, University of SS. Cyril and Methodius, Faculty of Natural Sciences, Department of Biology, Nám. J. Herdu 2, SK–91701 Trnava, Slovakia, +421 33 5565 337, E-mail: miroslava.hlebova@ucm.sk
ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1720-9981

Denisa Foltinová, Slovak University of Agriculture, Faculty of Biotechnology and Food Sciences, Department of Microbiology, Tr. A. Hlinku 2, 949 76 Nitra, Slovakia, E-mail: foltinova@gmail.com
ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4946-7440

Zuzana Mašková, Slovak University of Agriculture, Faculty of Biotechnology and Food Sciences, Department of Microbiology, Tr. A. Hlinku 2, 949 76 Nitra, Slovakia, +421 37641 4432, E-mail: zuzana.maskova@uniag.sk
ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3413-9337

Zuzana Barbóráková, Slovak University of Agriculture, Faculty of Biotechnology and Food Sciences, Department of Microbiology, Tr. A. Hlinku 2, 949 76 Nitra, Slovakia, +421 37 6414494, E-mail: zuzana.barborakova@uniag.sk
ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9890-3993

By clicking accept, I agree to receive emails from Springer. You can withdraw your consent at any time by clicking links in our emails. Learn more about Springer's Privacy Policy.