Histamine content in rennet ripening cheeses during storage at different temperatures and times

Anna Madejska, Miroslaw Michalski, Marzena Pawul-Gruba, Jacek Osek
Department of Hygiene of Food of Animal Origin
National Veterinary Research Institute, 24-100 Pulawy, Poland
josek@piwet.pulawy.pl

Received: October 31, 2017 Accepted: February 26, 2018

Abstract

Introduction: In recent years, there has been a great interest in biogenic amines such histamine, as they are associated with the quality and safety of some kinds of fermented foods. The aim of this study was to evaluate the effect of temperature and storage time on the content of histamine in cheeses. Material and Methods: Samples of mould and hard cheeses were examined with RP-HPLC with an organic-aqueous mobile phase containing acidic buffer and chaotropic salt. The samples were stored either at 22 ± 2°C for 42 days (mould and hard cheeses) or at 4 ± 2°C for 112 days (mould cheeses) and 133 days (hard cheeses). Results: The mean total histamine content in cheeses stored at 22°C was higher than the content in those stored at 4°C, with the highest concentrations found in Gorgonzola Piccante cheese (730.47 mg/kg). Histamine concentration in some types of cheeses exceeded the toxic threshold dose, indicating that after long or inadequately cool storage they may not be safe for consumers. Conclusion: To protect cheeses from contamination with histamine-producing bacteria and to safeguard consumers from poisoning, factors conducive to this amine’s formation should be minimised during cheese processing. Suitable temperature and time during storage of cheeses are recommended to avoid the intoxication. Monitoring of this toxin in food is necessary to ensure safety of consumers.

Keywords: histamine, cheeses, HPLC-DAD, storage conditions, health risk.
histamine in the range of 850–1,870 mg/kg (8). Other literature data reported histamine levels in cheeses up to 2,500 mg/kg (3, 10).

The provisions of European Union regulations specify a permissible level of histamine only for fish and fish products (7). Currently, there are no established criteria relating to the level of this amine in cheeses. The aim of this study was to determine the histamine content in hard and mould cheeses stored at different temperatures and time periods.

Material and Methods

Sample collection. Four types of mould cheese (Lazar Blue, Président Brie Natural, Camembert Erival, and Gorgonzola Piccante) and two types of hard cheese (Salami, Mlekdamer) from various local shops in the eastern region of Poland were investigated. Each kind of cheese sample was divided into two equal portions and one part was stored at 4 ± 2°C for up to 112 (mould cheeses) and 133 days (hard cheeses) and the other was kept at room temperature of 22 ± 2°C for up to 42 days. After a suitable storage period, a piece of cheese (200 g) was homogenised and analysed. All cheeses were tested for histamine content immediately after delivery to the laboratory (day 0). Mould cheeses were then examined on days 14, 28, and 42 of storage at room temperature and on days 28, 56, 84, and 112 if stored at 4 ± 2°C. Hard cheeses were additionally tested at day 35 of storage at room temperature and on days 91 and 133 if stored at 4 ± 2°C. For each type of cheese the experiments were performed in triplicates.

Reagents. All reagents used were HPLC or analytical grade. Histamine dihydrochloride and 1-octanesulphonic acid were obtained from Acros Organics (Belgium). Trichloroacetic acid (TCA), potassium dihydrogen phosphate, orthophosphoric acid, and methanol were purchased from POCh (Poland). Polimeric weak anion solid phase extraction (SPE) cartridges (200 mg, 3 mL) were sourced from Phenomenex (USA) and nylon syringe filters (0.45 μm) were procured from Agilent Technology (USA). Water was purified using the Milli-Q system (Millipore Sigma, USA).

Histamine stock standard solution (10 g/L) was prepared by dissolving of 828 ± 0.1 mg of histamine dihydrochloride in 50 mL of deionised water and storing the solution at 2–8°C for up to one month. Working standard solutions for the calibration curve were prepared on the day of analysis by appropriate dilutions of the stock in phosphate buffer (0.01 M, pH 3.0).

Extraction of histamine from cheese samples and clean-up. Cheese samples of weight 10 ± 0.01 g were weighed in a 50 mL polypropylene centrifuge tube. A total of 25 mL of TCA (0.2 M) was added and the sample was mixed by vortexing for 2 min. centrifuged for 10 min at 4,000 × g at 15°C, and kept at ≤–18°C for 30 min. The upper lipid layer was discarded and 5 mL of the supernatant was transferred into a 10 mL flask which was filled up with deionised water. The sample was filtered through a 0.45 μm nylon syringe filter into a glass tube and then cleaned up by SPE apparatus (J.T. Baker, USA) using polimeric weak anion SPE cartridges. The cartridges had previously been conditioned with 5 mL of methanol and then with 10 mL of phosphate buffer (0.01 M, pH 3.0). Seven millilitres of the extract was transferred to the SPE column and passed through the cartridge into a 10 mL flask. Afterwards, the column was washed with 2 mL of phosphate buffer. The eluate was supplemented to 10 mL with phosphate buffer.

HPLC-DAD conditions and validation parameters. The content of histamine was analysed by high performance liquid chromatography using the Pro Star system (Varian, Netherlands) equipped with a diode array detector, quaternary pump, autosampler, and column thermostat, and controlled by the Galaxie Workstation software (Varian). The chromatographic separation was performed on a Unisol C18 column of 150 × 4.6 mm, particle size 3 μm, connected to a C18 precolumn of 10 × 3 mm (Agela Technologies, USA). The mobile phase, consisting of 15% methanol in 0.1 M potassium dihydrogen phosphate (150/850, v/v) with 1.6 mM 1-octanesulphonic acid, was applied under isocratic conditions. The column oven temperature was maintained at 25°C, the flow rate at 0.5 mL/min, and the injection volume was 20 μL. The UV detection was monitored at 215 nm.

The range of the method for hard cheeses was 4.25–420 mg/kg and the limits of detection and quantification were 3.52 mg/kg and 4.25 mg/kg respectively, whereas the range of the method for mould cheeses was 7.13–420 mg/kg and the limits of detection and quantification were 6.27 mg/kg and 7.13 mg/kg respectively. The repeatability (n = 6) and the reproducibility (n = 18) for hard cheeses were 3.6% and 4.6% respectively, whereas for mould cheeses these parameters were 1.9% and 3.0%. Recovery of the method ranged from 80.1% for hard cheeses to 82% for mould cheeses.

Results

Histamine content in mould cheeses. The histamine content in mould cheeses is presented in Figs 1 and 2 as the mean ± SD of three replicates. The results show changes in the amine formation during storage at different temperatures and time. The highest amount of histamine (730.47 ± 20.01 mg/kg) was identified in Gorgonzola Piccante cheese stored for 42 days at room temperature (Fig. 1). In Camembert Erival cheese kept at 4°C, histamine was detected at a high level (405.21 ± 30.06 mg/kg) at the end of the storage period (112 days). In Gorgonzola Piccante cheese stored at 22°C and in Camembert Erival kept at 4°C, an
increase in the amount of histamine was observed with the extended period of storage. Besides the Italian Gorgonzola Piccante and French Camembert Erival cheeses, other ambient-stored cheeses showed a slight increase in histamine content up to 40.49 ± 18.29 mg/kg (Président Brie Natural cheese) and 10.85 ± 3.97 mg/kg (Lazur Blue cheese) after 42 days of storage. With storage over 42 days at 22°C, the average concentration of histamine was more than twofold higher than that found in cheeses stored at 4°C for 112 days.

**Fig. 1.** Concentration of histamine in mould cheeses during storage at 22 ± 2°C. Each bar represents results as mean ± SD

**Fig. 2.** Concentration of histamine in mould cheeses during storage at 4 ± 2°C. Each bar represents results as mean ± SD

**Fig. 3.** Concentration of histamine in hard cheeses during storage at 22 ± 2°C. Each bar represents results as mean ± SD of three replicates
Histamine content in hard cheeses. The analysis of histamine presence in hard cheeses revealed that it was highest in Mlekdamer cheese after 35 days of storage at room temperature (35.84 ± 4.12 mg/kg) (Fig. 3). Histamine concentration in this cheese ranged from 10 to 15 mg/kg during the 91 days of storage at 4 ± 2°C and decreased after 112 days (Fig. 4). In Salami cheese the amine was found only in small amounts in samples stored at room temperature, and in samples stored at 4 ± 2°C it was below the limit of detection of 3.52 mg/kg. Storage over 42 days at 22°C resulted in the average concentration of histamine being more than twofold higher than the level found after storage at 4°C for 133 days.

Discussion

Histamine content in Gorgonzola cheese at the beginning of the study (day 0) was 162.63 ± 23.57 mg/kg, which may suggest improper storage conditions during ripening or manufacture of the cheese from raw material with a significant amount of histamine. The ripening and storage periods are considered one of the key factors influencing histamine production (4, 8, 11, 32). During that time, a marked change in texture and flavour occur which is mainly associated with enzymatic degradation of casein resulting in steady increase in free amino acids. Some of the amino acids are subjected to a further breakdown reaction as decarboxylation catalysed by bacterial decarboxylases, which gives rise to the formation of carbon dioxide and histamine (11). Thus, cheese could be considered an ideal environment for this amine production through bacterial decarboxylation of histidine.

Given that the toxic threshold dose for histamine in cheeses has been temporarily established at 400 mg/kg (29), it was found that the amine content exceeded this value in Gorgonzola cheese after 28 and 42 days of storage at 22°C, where its levels reached 74–411 mg/kg and its level increased throughout the storage period and at 20°C as compared to 5°C (32). El-Kosi et al. (11) studied the effect of time (7 to 120 days) and temperature (7°C, 22°C, and 32°C) on the content of histamine in traditional Egyptian cheese varieties. Their results confirmed the theory of the stimulating effects of long storage time and higher temperatures on histamine level. The effects of storage conditions on histamine content were also tested in other Egyptian cheeses and in them likewise the accumulation of histamine increased remarkably in the ripening and storage periods (13). The growth of biogenic amines during production and storage may also occur in

![Fig. 4. Concentration of histamine in hard cheeses during storage at 4 ± 2°C.](Image)

Each bar represents results as mean ± SD of three replicates.
unripened cheeses. In 12-day, 25°C-stored Mexican quesos chihuahuas white cheese an increased content of biogenic amines was observed (histamine up to 452 mg/kg) (28). Budak et al. (4) noted that histamine concentration reached the level of 265.5 mg/kg after 90 days’ ripening at 10°C and it was detected in an amount higher than those of other biogenic amines in the Turkish white cheese samples investigated.

The results of the current investigation showed that histamine level did not always increase linearly during storage of cheeses. This finding may indicate that the formation of histamine in cheese depends on complex factors accelerating or retarding the production of this amine such as different numbers of decarboxylating microorganisms in certain parts of the cheese and internal microenvironmental conditions (access to O2 or effects caused by water) (18, 22).

**Conflict of Interests Statement:** The authors declare that there is no conflict of interests regarding the publication of this article.

**Financial Disclosure Statement:** This study was supported by the Polish Ministry of Science and Higher Education within the statutory activity of the Institute.

**Animal Rights Statement:** None required.

**References**

1. Aliakbarlu J., Alizadeh M., Razavi-Rohani S.M., Vahabzade Z., Saei S.S., Agh N.: Effects of processing factors on biogenic amines production in Iranian white Brine cheese. Res J Biol Sci 2009, 4, 23–28.

2. A. Madejska et al. (2018) 65-69

3. Bodmer S., Imark C., Kneubuhl M.: Biogenic amines in food. Histamine and food processing. Inf

4. Budak G.N.F., Karahan A.G., Çakmakçi M.L.: Factors affecting histamine and tyramine formation in Turkish White Cheese. Hacettepe J Biol Chem 2008, 36, 197–206.

5. Calzada J., del Olmo A., Picón A., Gaya P., Nuñez M.: Reducing biogenic-amine-producing bacteria, decarboxylase activity, and biogenic amines in raw milk cheese by high-pressure treatments. Appl Environ Microbiol 2013, 79, 1277–1283.

6. Calzada J., del Olmo A., Picón A., Nuñez M.: Proteolysis and biogenic amine buildup in high-pressure treated ovine milk blue-veined cheese. J Dairy Sci 2013, 96, 4816–4829.

7. Commission Regulation (EC) No. 2073/2005 of 15 November 2005 on microbiological criteria for foodstuffs. Official J. L. 338, 12.

8. Doeglas H.M.G., Huisman J., Nater J.P.: Histamine intoxication in cheese. In: Cheese Chemistry, Physics and Microbiology, Fox P.F., McSweeney P.L.H., Cogan T.M., Guinee T.P. (eds), London 2004, pp. 561–571.

9. Paleologos E.K., Savvaidis I.N., Kontominas M.G.: Biogenic amines formation and its relations to microbiological and sensory attributes in ice-stored whole, gutted, and filleted Mediterranean Sea bass (Dicentrarchus labrus). Food Microbiol 2004, 21, 549–557.

10. Pawłô M., Michalski M., Osek J.: Histamine occurrence, detection, and health risk to consumers. Med Weter 2013, 69, 466–470.

11. Pinho O., Ferreira I.M.P.L.V.O., Mendes E., Oliveira B.M., Ferreira M.: Effect of temperature on evolution of free amino acid and biogenic amine contents during storage of Azetâlo cheese. Food Chem 2001, 75, 287–291.

12. Rak L.: Biogenic amines in dairy products. Med Weter 2005, 61, 391–393.

13. Rauscher-Gabernig E., Grossgut R., Bauer F., Paulsen P.: Assessment of alimentary histamine exposure of consumers in Austria and development of tolerable levels in typical foods. Food Control 2009, 20, 423–429.

14. Roig-Sagués A.X., Molina A.P., Hernández-Herrero M.M.: Histamine and tyramine forming microorganisms in Spanish traditional cheeses. Eur Food Res Technol 2002, 215, 96–100.

15. Schirone M., Tofalo R., Visciano P., Corsetti A., Suzzi G.: Toxins in cheese. In: Cheese Chemistry, Physics and Microbiology, Fox P.F., McSweeney P.L.H., Cogan T.M., Guinee T.P. (eds), London 2004, pp. 561–571.

16. Schirone M., Tofalo R., Visciano P., Corsetti A., Suzzi G.: Toxins in cheese. In: Cheese Chemistry, Physics and Microbiology, Fox P.F., McSweeney P.L.H., Cogan T.M., Guinee T.P. (eds), London 2004, pp. 561–571.

17. Schirone M., Tofalo R., Visciano P., Corsetti A., Suzzi G.: Toxins in cheese. In: Cheese Chemistry, Physics and Microbiology, Fox P.F., McSweeney P.L.H., Cogan T.M., Guinee T.P. (eds), London 2004, pp. 561–571.