A comparison of patient, intervention, comparison, outcome (PICO) to a new, alternative clinical question framework for search skills, search results, and self-efficacy: a randomized controlled trial

Lorie A. Kloda, AHIP; Jill T. Boruff, AHIP; Alexandre Soares Cavalcante

APPENDIX C

Question formulation rubric for comparison of patient, intervention, comparison, outcome (PICO) to new framework (taken from Modified Fresno Test; point scheme modified)

QUESTION #1: Read the clinical scenario. Write a focused clinical question for that scenario that will help you organize a search of the clinical literature.

|                          | Excellent (4) | Strong (3) | Limited (2) | Minimal | Not evident (0) |
|--------------------------|---------------|------------|-------------|---------|-----------------|
| a: Population            | Multiple relevant descriptors; e.g., “work-related injury,” “female,” or “acute,” or “low-back pain”; e.g., “boy with hemiparesis” specific age group, gender, diagnosis, motor presentation | One appropriate descriptor as above examples; e.g., “women,” or “worker,” or “low-back pain”; e.g., “hemiparesis,” “boy,” “10-year-old,” “post-stroke” | A single general descriptor unlikely to contribute to search; e.g., “patient” | None of the above present |
| | Excellent (4) | Strong (3) | Limited (2) | Minimal | Not evident (0) |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| b: Intervention /4 | Includes specific intervention of interest (intervention could be a diagnostic technique):  
- manual therapy  
- specific individual components of manual therapy  
- combination of exercise and manual therapy  
- task-specific strengthening | Mentions intervention but unlikely to contribute to search; e.g., “methods,” “options,” “treatments” | None of the above present |
| c: Comparison /4 | Identifies specific alternative of interest; e.g., “no manual therapy”; “low intensity stretching” | Mentions comparison but unlikely to contribute to search; e.g., “alternate methods” | None of the above present |
| d: Outcome /4 | Outcome that is objective and meaningful to patient or patient case (if question is diagnostic, should relate to diagnosis trying to detect); e.g., return to work, pain reduction, injury prevention; e.g., selective motor control or functional use of paretic extremities, walking velocity | Nonspecific outcome:  
- recovery  
- spasticity  
- tone  
- strength | Reference to outcome, but so general as to be unlikely to contribute to search:  
- effects  
- change the outcome  
- effective  
- improvement  
- success  
- change the outcome | None of the above present |