The Effect of Experience Quality and Satisfaction on Tourist Loyalty in Yogyakarta Creative Tourism

Abstract:
This study aims to examine and analyze the effect of experiential and satisfaction quality on loyalty in creative tourism in Yogyakarta. The population in this study was tourists visiting creative tours in Yogyakarta and surrounding areas. The objects of this study were Solo Batik Laweyan Village, Kasongan Pottery Bantul Village, Nglanggeran Gunungkidul Tourism Village, Timang Gunungkidul Beach, Cave Tubing Pindul Gunungkidul, Merapi Lava Tour Sleman and Umbul Ponggok Klaten. The research sample were 205 respondents who were domestic tourists from Yogyakarta and Central Java and had visited these attractions. Data from the subsequent studies were analyzed using the Structural Equation Model (AMOS v.23). Based on the results of the study, the experiential quality has a positive effect on loyalty. The experiential quality has a positive effect on loyalty and satisfaction also has a positive effect on loyalty. This study reveals that the experiential quality is an important factor that will form a loyalty.

Keywords: Experiential quality, satisfaction, loyalty, creative tourism

1. Introduction
The travelling pattern has changed a lot from something to see and something to buy - product, to something to do or to buy experientials. In the increasingly competitive tourism industry, the ability to be unique and different from other regions is the key to success and sustainability (Almeida-Santana & Moreno-Gil, 2018). In an effort to create distinctiveness and differentiating effects, creative tourism is a sector that is very likely to be developed. When an area has a common resource, an area that has more creativity will be more successful to develop. Many regions have started to build tourism with the concept of creative tourism. Creative tourism usually involves visitors to participate actively in tourism activities, such as learning to make batik in Laweyan Solo, playing and learning in Nglanggeran Gunungkidul Tourism Village, making ceramics in Kasongan Yogyakarta, to creative nature tourism such as trekking, water rafting, underwater tours to historical tourism. The development of creative tourism strongly supports the regional economy, increases attractiveness, and provides unique experiences for visitors (Ali et al., 2016; Chang et al., 2014).

As one of the new types of tourism that begins to be in demand, creative tourism is still weak in anticipating the demands of tourists that change rapidly and are very dynamic (Chang et al., 2014; Hung et al., 2016). Responding to the market demands, the tourism managers, especially creative tourism need to maintain the unique ideas and also challenging, interesting and fresh activities that provide more value for visitors than just merely something to see. The end of this uniqueness compliance is a positive behavior of visitors who have an impact on the sustainability of creative tourism (Suhartanto et al., 2019). In contrast to passive tourism, creative tourism is a tourism activity where tourists are actively involved in the attractions and tourism activities offered (Ali et al., 2016; Richards, 2011; Chen & Chen, 2010). Creative tourism is often referred to as tourism with 'co-creation' concept (Richards, 2011), where tourists can develop their own abilities which will provide satisfaction and positive behavior later. Some determinants in the creative tourism sector that are considered capable of increasing visitor positive behavior including: experiential quality/involvement, motivation, perceived value and visitor satisfaction (Dodds & Jolliffe, 2016; Han & Hyun, 2018; Hung, et al., 2016). In the field of creative tourism, studies that observe the experiential quality, perceived value and visitor motivation is still very limited (Suhartanto et al. 2019; Chang, et al, 2014). Thus, this study will fill that gap.

The purpose of this study is to examine and analyze the role of elements of the visitors’ experiential quality, satisfaction and loyalty to creative tourism activities. Measurement of research variables was done by adaptation and adoption of several previous studies specifically in the field of creative tourism. The object to be addressed is a destination that offers creative activities and visitor involvement. The objects of this study were Solo Batik Laweyan Village, Kasongan Pottery Bantul Village, Nglanggeran Gunungkidul Tourism Village, Timang Gunungkidul Beach, Cave Tubing Pindul Gunungkidul, Merapi Lava Tour Sleman and Umbul Ponggok Klaten. This study is expected to contribute to the achievement of optimizing the improvement of attractions quality and creative tourism experiences so that visitors will meet their motivation and expectations. On the other hand, understanding this model will support the sustainability of creative tourism management.
The urgency of this study first is to shift the motivation to travel from the passive something-to-see to the active and creative something-to-do. Secondly, increasingly intensive tourism industry competition demands high creativity and offers unique and different activities from those offered by other destinations. Third, the sustainability of the tourism business is a sector that contributes greatly to the provision of employment and economic growth.

2. Literature Review and Hypothesis Development

2.1. Creative Tourism

Creative tourism is tourism that provides activities or attractions where tourists are involved in the process of the attraction (Ali et al., 2016; Richards, 2011). Creative tourism activities offer opportunities where tourists do not only passively see and enjoy but are actively involved in tourism attractions (Chen & Chen, 2010). Creative tourism involves more interaction with tourist by using attractions including social, environmental, cultural interaction and interactions with local communities. The tourism literature has followed a growing sector called creative tourism, where visitors, tourism service providers, and local residents work together to create valuable and interesting experiences (Chang et al., 2014; Hung et al., 2016). This creative tour often involves learning, performance or other forms of sharing cultural, artistic, historical or physical activities. Furthermore, the development of creative tourism has the added benefit such as supporting the economy, positively strengthen the attractiveness of the destination, and contribute to the overall tourism experience in the destination (Ali et al., 2016; Chang et al., 2014). With the increasing number of attractions, to differentiate from others, managers offer creative tourism with some attractions that have the most unique and valuable experiences for competitive excellence (Cetin & Bilgihan, 2016; Suhartanto, 2017).

2.2 Tourism Experiential Quality and loyalty

The experiential quality is explained by (Chen & Chen, 2010) as psychological and social reactions of tourists to the performance of tourist attractions / activities. There is a difference in service quality and experiential quality, where tourism experiences provide more opportunities for creativity and fantasy (Cetin, & Bilgihan, 2016). Furthermore, tourists do not merely testify the tourism but there are interactions that allow tourists to contribute creations (Suhartanto et al., 2019). The experiential quality also offers affective and deeper feelings for tourists. The diversity of research related to the tourism experiential quality is highly influenced by the diverse tourism segments, because each segment provides a different real and emotional experience. For example, the spiritual tourism segment will give the impression of emotions and feelings that are different from creative tourism. Research for deepening the experiential quality in different segments is widely open. This study will measure the concept of the tourists’ experiential quality according to Pine and Gilmore (1998) where the tourists’ experiential quality will be analyzed from aspects of escape, peace of mind, involvement, recognition, and learning. Escape emphasizes the aspect of getting out of the routine. Peace of mind emphasizes psychological and physical needs for relaxation and comfort (Xu & Chan, 2010). Involvement emphasizes the opportunity to choose and be involved in the outcomes of tourism activities (Al et al., 2016). Recognition is related to self-confidence and appreciation when doing tourist activities (Xu & Chan, 2010). Learning emphasizes the acquisition of new information and learning from these tourist activities (Chang et al., 2014). Based on the results of the study conducted by Suhartanto (2019), the experiential quality has a positive effect on loyalty. Based on the literature and empirical studies, this research assumes that the experiential quality can determine the visitor loyalty. Besides recognizing satisfaction as an important factor in developing tourist loyalty, the literature (Ali et al., 2016; Chen & Chen, 2010) largely agrees that tourist satisfaction is determined primarily by experiences and attractions. Based on research that has been done before, the hypotheses in this study are:

- H1 The experiential quality has a positive effect on tourists’ loyalty
- H2 The experiential quality has a positive effect on tourists’ satisfaction

2.3 Tourists’ Satisfaction and Loyalty

Due to its effect on customer behaviour, one important factor for the success of tourist attractions is tourist satisfaction (Dodds & Jollie, 2016). Experts define the concept of satisfaction differently, but generally agree that this concept is complex, covering not only cognitive and effective aspects, but also dynamic physiological and psychological elements (Suhartanto, 2018). The definition of satisfaction shows that satisfaction is different from service quality although they are closely related one to others. While satisfaction refers to customer evaluations of products or services with respect to customer expectations, service quality shows consumer ratings of the overall quality level of the company (Dodds & Jollie, 2016). Chen & Chen (2010) stated that tourist satisfaction is a combination of travellers’ expectations of continuing their journey and experiences after travelling. When their expectations before travelling are met by their travel experiences, satisfaction is achieved. For example, a study conducted by Ali et al. (2016) stated that by creative tourism we can conclude that satisfied tourists tend to have good behaviour towards attractions. Ali et al., (2016); Chen & Chen, (2010); Nowacki, (2009); Eid (2015) stated that satisfaction has a positive effect on loyalty. From this, the next research hypothesis is:

- H3 Tourists’ satisfaction has positive effect on tourists’ loyalty.

3. Research Method

Sampling was done by purposive sampling method. The samples used in this study were 205 people. The research was conducted online using Google forms, WhatsApp and Instagram. The questions within the questionnaire were designed based on the literature review and the research subjects. Measurement of the variables value of the question on
the research questionnaire used a Likert scale with an interval scale of 5, ‘1 = strongly disagree’, ‘2 = disagree’, ‘3 = neutral’, ‘4 = agree’, ‘5 = strongly agree’. The respondents' score within the questionnaire consisted of three parts. The first part of this questionnaire discusses the measurement of the experiential quality in 5 dimensions. The second part deals with satisfaction with 4 indicators. Section 3 discusses loyalty with 4 indicators. This research framework is shown in the figure. 1:

![Figure 1: Research Framework](Source: Processed Primary Data)

After compiling a path diagram and making structural equations, the outliers are checked by analyzing the multivariate outliers as seen from the Mahalanobis Distance value. The Mahalanobis Distance test was calculated using the Chi Square value at the degree of freedom with \( p < 0.001 \). Out of 205 data, 4 data contained outliers so they must be discarded. After that, the normality test was conducted. Testing the multivariate normality was done by observing the value of the Critical Ratio (CR) of the data used, if the CR multivariate data values are in the range of \( \pm 2.58 \), then the research data can be said to be normal. The CR value in this study was 0.850. It is between these ranges, so the data meets normality.

The next stage was Confirmatory Factor Analysis for all data. In this analysis the loading factor in each indicator was observed. The loading factor can be used to measure the construct validity where a questionnaire is said to be valid if the questions on the questionnaire are able to reveal something that is measured by the questionnaire. In this study there is a factor loading value < 0.5 on the satisfaction variable, the 4th indicator is 0.281, so the indicator must be excluded from the analysis. Before the model was modified, a reliability test was performed. This test was done by measuring the reliability of the construct. If the construct reliability value is > 0.7 and the extracted variance value is > 0.5, the variable is said to be good (Yamin & Kurniawan, 2009). CR and AV values in this study are presented in table 1:

| Indicators         | Standard Loading | Standard Loading² | Measurement Error | CR   | VE   |
|--------------------|------------------|-------------------|-------------------|------|------|
| Escape (MD)        | 0.83             | 0.68              | 0.32              | 0.88 | 0.81 |
| Recognition (PK)   | 0.76             | 0.58              | 0.42              |      |      |
| Peace of mind (KP) | 0.75             | 0.57              | 0.43              |      |      |
| Involvement (KT)   | 0.74             | 0.55              | 0.45              |      |      |
| Learning (PL)      | 0.76             | 0.58              | 0.42              |      |      |
| Sat 3 (K3)         | 0.52             | 0.27              | 0.73              | 0.84 | 0.79 |
| Sat 2 (K2)         | 0.92             | 0.85              | 0.15              |      |      |
| Sat 1 (K1)         | 0.92             | 0.84              | 0.16              |      |      |
| Lyt 1 (L1)         | 0.62             | 0.38              | 0.62              |      |      |
| Lyt 2 (L2)         | 0.52             | 0.27              | 0.73              |      |      |
| Lyt 3 (L3)         | 0.71             | 0.50              | 0.50              | 0.71 | 0.50 |
| Lyt 4 (L4)         | 0.63             | 0.40              | 0.60              |      |      |

Table 1: Construct Reliability and Variance Extracted
(Source: Processed Primary Data)

4. Research Result

After modifying model and the completing the GOF Test, the final path analysis is more or less like Figure 2:
The regression weight test results in this study are presented in Table 2:

| Notes | Lyt | ExpQ | S.E. | C.R. | P |
|-------|-----|------|------|------|---|
| Accepted | 0.546 | 0.085 | 6.429 | *** | |
| Accepted | 0.744 | 0.085 | 8.767 | *** | |
| Accepted | 0.305 | 0.063 | 4.878 | *** | |

From the table, it can be inferred that:

- C.R. Value 6.429 > 1.96 and value of P *** < 0.05. Therefore, it can be concluded that Experiential Quality (ExpQ) has positive and significant effect on the Loyalty (Lyt). Therefore, H1 of this study is supported.
- C.R. Value 8.767 > 1.96 and value of P *** < 0.05. Therefore, it can be concluded that Experiential Quality (ExpQ) has positive and significant effect on the Satisfaction (Sat). Therefore, H2 of this study is supported.
- C.R. Value 4.878 > 1.96 and value of P *** < 0.05. Therefore, it can be concluded that Satisfaction (Sat) has positive and significant effect on the Loyalty (Lyt). Therefore, H3 of this study is supported.

The effects between variables are presented in Table 3:

| Direct | Indirect | Total Effects |
|--------|----------|---------------|
| ExpQ --> Lyt | 0.652 | 0.271 | 0.923 |
| ExpQ --> Sat | 0.658 | 0 | 0.658 |
| Sat --> Lyt | 0.412 | 0 | 0.412 |

From the table, it can be inferred that:

- The quality of experience has a positive and significant effect on satisfaction. The results of this study are different from that of Suhartanto et al., (2019) where the quality of experience has no effect on satisfaction. However, this study is in line with the findings of Shahijan et al., (2018), Wu et al., (2018) and Chen & Chen, (2010). Tourists who get good

5. Discussion

The motivation to travel today is starting to shift from the passive something-to-see to the active and creative something-to-do. Tourists do not only want to enjoy but also want to be involved in tourist activities. To be actively involved, activities that attract tourists are needed, so that it will provide a good quality experience for the tourists. The results of this study explain that the experiential quality has a positive and significant effect on loyalty. This is in line with previous research done by Suhartanto (2019); Jin et al., (2013); Shahijan et al., (2018); Wu et al., (2018). This can be interpreted that the better the visitors’ / tourists’ experiential quality, the higher their loyalty. A good and memorable of experiential quality will make a good perception towards the objects visited. From the dimensions of involvement and learning on the experiential quality variable, the more visitors feel getting new experiences, the more willingness of visitors to recommend their experiences to others (loyalty). For example, it happens to the Lava Tour Mount Merapi tourism object which is a favorite destination for many tourists. The more the manager is able to provide the experience of exploring excitement through difficult terrain and gaining historical experience when it erupts as well as a tourist guide to former settlements which was affected by the disaster, the increasing tourists’ willingness to share stories and recommend to the others.

The quality of experience has a positive and significant effect on satisfaction. The results of this study are different from that of Suhartanto et al., (2019) where the quality of experience has no effect on satisfaction. However, this study is in line with the findings of Shahijan et al., (2018), Wu et al., (2018) and Chen & Chen (2010). Tourists who get good
experiences in tourist attractions from visiting these tours tend to be satisfied. This satisfaction can be described with a positive sense after visiting a tourist place. In an indicator of peace of mind, when visitors can feel safe and relaxed is one form of satisfaction in carrying out activities during the tour. For example, in the Nglanggeran Tourism Village Region, managers were increasingly able to present a place to rest, a place to relax and exciting creative activities. This, of course, will further increase the sense of satisfaction with the services and facilities in the Nglanggeran Tourism Village.

Ali et al., (2016); Chen & Chen, (2010); Nowacki, (2009); Eid (2015) stated that satisfaction has a positive effect on loyalty. This study gets the same results. Satisfaction obtained when visiting an object can lead to loyalty. This is because tourists want to feel satisfaction when visiting a tourist attraction. In the satisfaction indicator, when tourists feel happy with the experience gained and feel positive about the experience, they tend to be eager to feel satisfaction again. For example, in Solo Batik Laweyan Village when tourists are satisfied towards getting batik knowledge or shopping for batik and enjoying the comfort of a batik village, they will return to either learn batik again or enjoy the atmosphere in Kampung Batik Laweyan. The satisfaction obtained can give a good impression so that in the future they will make a return visit or provide information and a good impression to others.

6. Conclusion and Suggestion

Although the tourists’ experiential quality and satisfaction has a large impact on tourists’ loyalty, the total effect shows that the experiential quality has the greatest effect on tourist loyalty. This effect is corroborating studies in various service industries (Chen & Chen, 2010; Mansour & Ari, 2017; Subrahmanyam, 2017) which highlight the important role of experiential quality, compared to other determinants, in increasing customer behavioral intentions. This means that the experiential quality is an important determinant of tourist loyalty. Traveler ratings of their experiences through attraction are more important in stimulating their loyalty towards creative appeal. So, when talking about creative tourism it is necessary to include the experiential quality as the main determinant when constructing the conceptual framework. These dimensions include involvement, peace of mind, escape, learning, and recognition.

For managers this study has implications for the success of managing and conducting creative tourism objects marketing in developing tourist loyalty. Creative tourist managers need to provide a high-quality experience. The allocation of monetary and non-monetary resources needs to be focused on enhancing the experience of creative tourists with special attractions in the areas of involvement, peace of mind, escape, learning and recognition. To meet this need, managers must ensure that visitors have the opportunity to learn something new and unique, therefore sustainable attraction innovation is a must. Furthermore, the manager must create an attraction that allows visitors to enjoy and relax in the attraction and offer a safe and attractive environment. Managers must also ensure that staff are friendly and knowledgeable and must also train their staff to be competent in providing services.

Creative tourism can contribute greatly to providing employment and economic growth. With the increasing number of creative tours, it will certainly require many employees to work in creative tourism environments. This is because creative tourism requires active involvement from both visitors and managers. With a pleasant relationship and good service, the experiential quality will be good for tourists. In the end, creative tourism will increase economic growth around attractions.

7. Limitation

The limitation of this study is the selected object. Most objects offer less creative tourism, such as the Timang Beach and Merapi Tour the tourist’s involvement is still very limited. Future research can take more creative research objects that involve the total visitor, for example, learning a particular technique or creative activity and producing a product. Tourist loyalty is also influenced by other factors such as image of tourist attractions, tourist trust, word of mouth, repeat their visits and other social factors. Future studies can integrate this or create new models in preparing the tourist loyalty framework so that it can add to the research literature.

8. References

i. Ali, F., Ryu, K., & Hussain, K. (2016). Influence of experiences on memories, satisfaction and behavioral intentions: A study of creative tourism. *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 33(1), 85–100. doi:10.1080/10548408.2015.1038418

ii. Almeida-Santana, Á., & Moreno-Gil, S. (2018). Understanding tourism loyalty: Horizontal vs. Destination loyalty. *Tourism Management*, 65, 245–255. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2017.10.011

iii. Cetin, G., & Bilghihan, A. (2016). Components of cultural tourists’ experiences in destinations. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 19(2), 137–154. doi:10.1080/13683500.2014.994595

iv. Chang, L.-L., Backman, K. F., & Huang, Y.-C. (2014). Creative tourism: A preliminary examination of creative tourists’ motivation, experience, perceived value and revisit intention. *International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 8(4), 401–419. doi:10.1108/IJCTHR-04-2014-0032

v. Chen, C.-F., & Chen, F.-S. (2010). Experience quality, perceived value, satisfaction and behavioral intentions for heritage tourists. *Tourism Management*, 31(1), 29–35. doi: 10.1016/j.tourman.2009.02.008

vi. Dodds, R., & Jolliffe, L. (2016). Experiential tourism: Creating and marketing tourism attraction experiences. *The handbook of managing and marketing tourism experiences*. 113-129.

vii. Eid, R. (2015). Integrating Muslim customer perceived value, satisfaction, loyalty and retention in the tourism industry: An empirical study. *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 17(3), 249-260
vii. Han, H., & Hyun, S. S. (2018). Role of motivations for luxury cruise traveling, satisfaction, and involvement in building traveler loyalty. *International Journal of Hospitality Management, 70*, 75–84. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2017.10.024

ix. Hung, W.-L., Lee, Y.-J., & Huang, P.-H. (2016). Creative experiences, memorability and revisit intention in creative tourism. *Current Issues in Tourism, 19*(8), 763–770. doi:10.1080/13683500.2013.877422

x. Jin, N. P., Lee, S., & Lee, H. (2013). The Effect of Experience Quality on Perceived Value, Satisfaction, Image and Behavioral Intention of Water Park Patrons: New versus Repeat Visitors. *International Journal of Tourism Research, 17*(1), 82–95. doi:10.1002/jtr.1968

xi. Mansour, J. S. A., & Ariffin A. A. M. (2017). The effects of local hospitality, commercial hospitality and experience quality on behavioral intention in cultural heritage tourism. *Journal of Quality Assurance in Hospitality & Tourism, 18*(2), 149–172. doi:10.1080/1528008X.2016.1169474

xii. Nowacki, M. M. (2009). Quality of visitor attractions, satisfaction, benefits and behavioural intentions of visitors: Verification of a model. *International Journal of Tourism Research, 11*(3), 297-309. doi: 10.1002/jtr.689

xiii. Pine, B. J., & Gilmore, J. H. (1998). Welcome to the experience economy. Harvard business review. 76:97-105.

xiv. Richards, G. (2011). Creativity and tourism: The state of the art. *Annals of Tourism Research, 38*(4), 1225–1253.

xv. Shahijan, M. K., Rezaei, S., & Amin, M. (2018). Qualities of effective cruise marketing strategy: Cruisers’ experience, service convenience, values, satisfaction and revisit intention. International Journal of Quality and Reliability Management, 35(10), 2304–2327. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJQRM-07-2017-0135

xvi. Subrahmanyam, A. (2017). Relationship between service quality, satisfaction, motivation and loyalty: A multi-dimensional perspective. *Quality Assurance in Education, 25*(2), 171–188. doi:10.1108/QAE-04-2013-0016

xvii. Suhartanto, D. (2017). The role of store coopetition and attractiveness on the performance of tourism destination and its retail stores. *International Journal of Tourism Policy, 7*(2), 151–165. doi:10.1504/IJTP.2017.10006051

xviii. Suhartanto, D. (2018). Tourist satisfaction with souvenir shopping: Evidence from Indonesian domestic tourists. *Current Issues in Tourism, 21*(6), 663–679. doi:10.1080/13683500.2016.1265487

xix. Suhartanto, Dwi, et al. (2019). Tourist loyalty in creative tourism: the role of experience quality, value, satisfaction, and motivation. *Current Issues in Tourism, 23*(7): 867–879.

xx. Wu, H. C., Li, M. Y., & Li, T. (2018). A study of experiential quality, experiential value, experiential satisfaction, theme park image, and revisit intention. *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Research, 42*(1), 26-73.

xxi. Xu, J., & Chan, A. (2010). Service experience and package Tours. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research, 15*(2), 177–194. doi:10.1080/10941661003629987

xxii. Yamin Sofyan, Kurniawan Heri. (2009). *SPSS COMPLETE: Teknik Analisis Statistik Terlengkap dengan software SPSS*. Jakarta: SalembaInfotek.