A 4-week, lifestyle-integrated, home-based exercise training programme elicits improvements in physical function and lean mass in older men and women: a pilot study [version 2; peer review: 2 approved]

Jessica Cegielski, Matthew S. Brook, Jonathan I. Quinlan, Daniel J. Wilkinson, Kenneth Smith, Philip J. Atherton, Bethan E. Phillips

MRC-ARUK Centre for Musculoskeletal Ageing Research, School of Medicine, University of Nottingham, Derby, UK

Abstract

Background: Developing alternative exercise programmes that can alleviate certain barriers to exercise such as psychological, environmental or socio-economical barriers, but provide similar physiological benefits e.g. increases in muscle mass and strength, is of grave importance. This pilot study aimed to assess the efficacy of an unsupervised, 4-week, whole-body home-based exercise training (HBET) programme, incorporated into daily living activities, on skeletal muscle mass, power and strength.

Methods: Twelve healthy older volunteers (63±3 years, 7 men: 5 women, BMI: 29±1 kg/m²) carried out the 4-week “lifestyle-integrated” HBET of 8 exercises, 3x12 repetitions each, every day. Before and after HBET, a number of physical function tests were carried out: unilateral leg extension 1-RM (one-repetition maximum), MVC (maximal voluntary contraction) leg extension, lower leg muscle power (via Nottingham Power Rig), handgrip strength and SPPBT (short physical performance battery test). A D3-Creatine method was used for assessment of whole-body skeletal muscle mass, and ultrasound was used to measure the quadriceps cross-sectional area (CSA) and vastus lateralis muscle thickness.

Results: Four weeks HBET elicited significant (p<0.05) improvements in leg muscle power (276.7±38.5 vs. 323.4±43.4 W), maximal voluntary contraction (60°: 154.2±18.4 vs. 168.8±15.2 Nm, 90°: 152.1±10.5 vs. 159.1±11.4 Nm) and quadriceps CSA (57.5±5.4 vs. 59.0±5.3 cm²), with a trend for an increase in leg strength (1-RM: 45.7±5.9 vs. 49.6±6.0 kg, P=0.08). This was despite there being no significant differences in whole-body skeletal muscle mass, as assessed via D3-Creatine.

Conclusions: This study demonstrates that increases in multiple aspects of muscle function can be achieved in older adults with just 4-
weeks of “lifestyle-integrated” HBET, with a cost-effective means. This training mode may prove to be a beneficial alternative for maintaining and/or improving muscle mass and function in older adults.

Keywords
home based, exercise, muscle mass, muscle function
Introduction

Older age is associated with the loss of skeletal muscle mass. Termed sarcopenia, age-related muscle wasting is associated with loss of muscle strength (dynapenia), increased morbidity, loss of independence and premature mortality (Rudrappa et al., 2016). There are however proven means by which to offset these detrimental progressive declines. For example, structured and fully-supervised progressive resistance exercise training (RET) has been shown to improve both muscle mass (Phillips et al., 2012) and function (Liu & Latham, 2009).

Despite the established effects of RET on muscle mass and function, compliance is difficult to achieve, due to perceived (and real) socio-economic, psychological and environmental factors (Zlot et al., 2006). Almost all current evidence for the efficacy of RET is based on 2–3 sessions each week, for up to 12 weeks, at a gym or with specialist equipment, reflecting current physical activity guidelines for adults of 2–3 days per week RET for each of the major muscle groups (Bull et al., 2010). However, compliance to physical activity recommendations is poor, with recent data suggesting that they are only achieved by 38% of UK adults (Department of Health, Physical Activity, 2011), a figure that is lesser still in older adults (Jeffers et al., 2014). As a result, home-based exercise training (HBET) programmes have been suggested as an alternative to overcome some of the barriers associated with poor compliance to exercise (Hong et al., 2017; Silveira et al., 2015), whilst also providing a platform to develop the benefits of RET for (pre-) sarcopenic individuals (Maruya et al., 2016).

The majority of HBET studies to date, have focussed on pre- or rehabilitation for specific clinical groups (Bassett & Prapavessis, 2007; Chang et al., 2017). A small number of studies have specifically investigated the efficacy of HBET on skeletal muscle function in the elderly, although the focus of these studies has mainly been on lower limb exercises to improve walking and balance (Ito et al., 2015; Yamauchi et al., 2009) in relation to fall and fracture prevention. Other studies in older adults have incorporated the use of specialist aids e.g. dumbbells (Plotnikoff et al., 2010), elastic bands (Jette et al., 1999; Ribeiro et al., 2009) or ankle weights (Gardner et al., 2001) to provide resistance for HBET; rather than attempting to incorporate exercise into tasks of daily living, as is done herein. To date, no studies have attempted to investigate the efficacy of incorporating whole-body exercise into activities of daily living on muscle mass and function in older adults. Consequently, in this pilot study we aimed to assess the effects of a 4-week, progressive, whole-body HBET fully integrated into activities of daily living, on muscle mass and function in healthy older individuals. We also aimed to utilise a recently re-introduced (Clark et al., 2014) and underexploited creatine method to estimate whole-body muscle mass in humans.

Materials and methods

Ethical statement and recruitment of study participants

Twelve healthy older male and female volunteers (63±3 y, 7 men: 5 women, BMI: 29±1 kg/m²) with no previous chronic disease history were recruited via an advertisement on a local radio station. Before enrolment into the study, all volunteers had an assessment of previous medical history and an ECG to check for any subclinical arrhythmias. The ECG’s were approved by a clinically qualified physician. All volunteers provided written informed consent prior to the start of this study. This study was approved by The University of Nottingham Medical School Ethics Committee (B28102015 SoMS GEM BBC) and conformed to The Declaration of Helsinki.

Study procedures

The study involved two visits by the study participants, before and after the 4-week HBET (Figure 1), to the University of Nottingham Medical School, at the Royal Derby Hospital. All assessments at these visits were conducted by researchers from the MRC-ARUK Centre for Musculoskeletal Ageing Research. At each visit, volunteers provided a baseline urine sample for the muscle mass assessment by D1-Creatine before undergoing measures of height, weight (Marsden Weighing Group, UK), resting heart rate and blood pressure (Omron M5-1 digital BP monitor, Omron, UK). Each volunteer had the thickness, fascicle length (L) and pennation angle (θp) of their vastus lateralis muscle, and the cross-sectional area (CSA) of their quadriceps measured by ultrasound (Mylab 70, Esaote Biomedica, Genova, Italy), using the protocol described by Franchi et al. (2014). Volunteers then completed a number of muscle function assessments:

- maximal voluntary contraction (MVC) for seated leg extension and flexion using an isokinetic dynamometer (Isocom; Isokinetic Technologies, Eurokinetics, UK),
- leg extension 1-repetition maximum (1-RM; ISO leg extension, Leisure Lines Ltd., GB),
- leg power (Nottingham Power Rig; Bassey & Short, 1990),
- handgrip strength (Grip D 5401; Takei Scientific Instruments Co. Ltd., Japan); and
- a short physical performance battery test (SPPBT; Guralnik et al., 1994).

MVC was measured at two knee angles (60 and 90°), whilst isokinetic (eccentric/concentric) contractions were measured over a 70° range (20–90°) at three different speeds (60, 180 and 240°/sec). For both measures, horizontal seated leg extension was set at 0°. Following the muscle function assessments, volunteers ingested 30mg of D1-Creatine dissolved in 100ml H2O for muscle mass assessment, before providing a pooled 24h urine collection and single urine samples at 48 and 72 h post consumption (Clark et al., 2014).

Home-based exercise training programme (HBET)

Volunteers were required to complete 3 sets of 12 repetitions across 8 different exercises, every day, for 4 weeks. Each exercise was designed to be easily incorporated into activities of daily living to minimise the time-commitment required (e.g. bicep curls whilst cooking, see Figure 1). In total the exercise programme...
Figure 1. Study schematic displaying the two visits before and after home-based exercise training (HBET). BL: baseline urine sample; HR: resting heart rate; BP: resting blood pressure; SPPBT: short physical performance battery test; US: leg ultrasound; MVC: maximum voluntary contraction; 1-RM: leg extension 1-repetition maximum; $D_3$-Cr: $D_3$-Creatine for whole-body muscle mass assessment; 48 and 72h represent the time of urine samples post-tracer consumption.
consisted of: squats, lunges, calf raises, bicep curls, tricep extensions, semi-incline press-ups, oblique twists and deadlifts. Participants were instructed to take 2 seconds to perform each phase (eccentric and concentric) of each exercise and to hold for 2 seconds at the mid-point of each exercise. Progression via increased resistance or time-under-tension was encouraged once the full complement of repetitions could be completed. Compliance to exercise was measured by self-report (see self-report log in Figure 1). An exercise would only be marked as complete if 3 sets of 12 repetitions had been performed within a day.

**Measurement of whole-body muscle mass using D$_3$-creatinine**

Using a creatine-tracer measure of muscle mass (Clark et al., 2014), D$_3$-creatinine and D$_3$-creatinine enrichment, plus unlabelled creatine and creatinine in the urine was measured using high-performance liquid chromatography/mass spectrometry (HPLC/MS), as detailed in (Stimpson et al., 2012). Total muscle mass was calculated using the following equation:

$$\text{Total muscle mass} = \left( \frac{MW_{\text{unlabelled}} + MW_{\text{labelled}}}{\text{mean steady state D$_3$-Creatine enrichment ratio}} \right) \times \left( \frac{\text{Amount of D$_3$-Creatine}}{\text{Amount of D$_3$-Creatine enriched}} \right) \times 4.3(\text{g/kg})$$

where $MW_{\text{unlabelled}}$ and $MW_{\text{labelled}}$ represents the molecular weights of both unlabelled and labelled creatine, respectively. The estimated creatine pool size is then divided by 4.3 g/kg, which reflects the concentration of creatine in wet muscle.

**Statistical analysis**

Descriptive statistics were carried out on all datasets and checked for a normal distribution using the Shapiro-Wilk normality test. Datasets were analysed using paired Student’s t test to assess the effect of HBET, with GraphPad Prism Software v5 (La Jolla, CA, USA). All data is presented as mean ±SEM. Significance was set at P<0.05.

**Results**

**Compliance, body weight and cardiovascular parameters**

Using data from the self-report training logs, overall compliance to the HBET was 87.3±3.0% over the 4-week period of training. Adherence to each individual exercise was >86%, with the calf-raises being the most completed exercise (91%). No significant changes were found following HBET for body weight (79.3±4.7 vs. 78.9±4.6 kg), resting heart rate (71.9±3.1 vs. 71.4±3.9 bpm) or blood pressure (systolic: 144.4±3.4 vs. 140.7±4.2, diastolic: 92.2±2.5 vs. 89.0±2.4; average of 3 measurements).

**Muscle function**

HBET did not elicit significant changes in leg extension 1-RM, handgrip strength or SPPBT; there was however, a trend for an increase in leg extension 1-RM (45.7±5.9 vs. 49.6±6.0 kg, P=0.08; Figure 2A). HBET did elicit significant increases in leg power (276.7±38.5 vs. 323.4±43.4 W, P<0.05; Figure 2B) and MVC at 60° (154.2±18.4 vs. 168.8±15.2 Nm, P<0.05; Figure 2C) and 90° (152.1±10.5 vs. 159.1±11.4 Nm, P<0.05; Figure 2D). There were also significant increases in peak torque recorded at 60°/sec during both seated flexion (74.7±8.3 vs. 80.8±8.6 Nm, P<0.05; Figure 2E) and extension (114.9±10.2 vs. 123.8±9.4 Nm, P<0.01; Figure 2F) after HBET.

**Muscle architecture**

CSA of the thigh at 50% of thigh length significantly increased (57.5±5.4 vs. 59.0±5.3 cm$^2$, P<0.05; Figure 3A) after HBET. However, there was no significant increase in muscle thickness, fascicle length ($L_f$) or pennation angle ($\theta_{pen}$) of the m. vastus lateralis. There was a trend for an increase in muscle thickness (25.0±1.6 vs. 25.5±1.7 mm, P=0.08; Figure 3B) after HBET.

**Whole-body muscle mass measured by D$_3$-Creatine**

Corresponding with no significant change in body weight, there was no significant difference in whole-body muscle mass as estimated by D$_3$-Creatine (Figure 3C) after HBET (23.9±2.1 vs. 22.8±2.2 kg).

**Discussion**

In this pilot study, we show that lifestyle-integrated, whole-body HBET has the potential to meaningfully improve muscle function in older adults. We have shown that this training mode can increase leg power by 16.9% in just 4-weeks. Although lower than the 37% power increase demonstrated in a solely lower-extremity focused HBET programme, this study was conducted over an 8-week period (DeBolt & McCubbin, 2004), suggesting that if the magnitude of increase was to continue at a constant rate, our training mode may elicit similar improvements. Additionally, we demonstrate increases in muscle strength (via MVC at 60°) similar to that observed in response to a 6-week, fully-supervised, gym-based training study (Brook et al., 2016). Furthermore, despite no significant increase,
Figure 2. Muscle (leg) function assessments, before and after home-based exercise training (HBET). A) 1-RM leg extension (45.7±5.9 vs. 49.6±6.0 kg, P=0.08), B) Leg power via Nottingham Power Rig (276.7±38.5 vs. 323.4±43.4 W), C) MVC at 60° (154.2±18.4 vs. 168.8±15.2 Nm), D) MVC at 90° (152.1±10.5 vs. 159.1±11.4 Nm), E) Seated leg flexion at 60°/sec (74.7±8.3 vs. 80.8±8.6 Nm), F) Seated leg extension at 60°/sec (114.9±10.2 vs. 123.8±9.4 Nm). Baseline vs. post-HBET (mean ± SEM), n=12, *=p<0.05; **=p<0.01. MVC: Maximal voluntary contraction.
there was a positive trend in the leg extension 1-RM, similar to that seen in an 8-week HBET study by Zion et al. (2003). Thus, while muscle function adaptations to HBET were numerically lesser compared to longer-term structured exercise regimens (some requiring specialist equipment), our data support the notion that just 4-weeks of a ‘lifestyle-integrated’ HBET meaningfully improves muscle function.

Despite these positive results, no changes in handgrip strength were found, a similar result to Nelson et al. (2004), who implemented a 6-month home-based whole-body exercise programme in 70 male and female elderly individuals. This may be due to a lack of exercises specifically targeting the forearm flexors. Indeed, although it is well-established that extant grip strength represents a biomarker of muscle function in older adults (Bassey & Harries, 1993), our data suggests that it is an insensitive biomarker for important functional and mass gains in other muscle groups (e.g. the legs) following certain exercise interventions.

Importantly, increases in thigh CSA (and a trend towards increased muscle thickness), which may partly explain the functional improvements, were observed. Measures of thigh CSA by ultrasound have been positively correlated with those by MRI (Reeves et al., 2004), therefore suggesting (leg) muscle hypertrophy in this study. However, since this occurred in the absence of detectable changes in whole-body muscle mass as measured by D3-Creatine, we speculate i) that preferential hypertrophy of leg muscles occurred, but remained undetectable on a whole-body level; or ii) that measurement of whole-body muscle mass was below the detection threshold for the D3-creatine method.

We acknowledge limitations to our study design. The use of validated physical activity monitors (e.g. Actiheart, CamNtech, Cambridge, UK) to assess compliance to exercise would have provided greater information on the adoption of, and adherence to our exercise programme. Similarly, the use of interactive technologies (e.g. training applications for tablets/smartphones) for motivation and/or instruction may have improved adherence.
(Silveira et al., 2013). The lack of improvements in SPPBT were likely a result of our volunteers achieving optimal scores before the intervention.

To conclude, our findings demonstrate that significant increases in muscle mass, maximal voluntary contraction, maximal power and isokinetic strength can be achieved with just 4-weeks of unsupervised, lifestyle-integrated HBET in older adults. These improvements were achieved via cost-effective means, without the requirement for specialist equipment, facilities or supervision (DeBolt & McCubbin, 2004; Jette et al., 1996; Zion et al., 2003). With high compliance and beneficial physiological effects in only a 4-week period, this study highlights the potential for lifestyle-integrated HBET to improve skeletal muscle ‘health’ in older adults. As increases in muscle mass and strength are positively correlated with overall physical function (Liu & Latham, 2009), this novel training mode may be of particular benefit to older frail/(pre-) sarcopenic adults.

Data availability
Dataset 1: Raw data supporting the findings in this study.
Sheet 1: Maximum Voluntary Contraction (MVC) at 60° and 90°, pre- and post 4-weeks of home-based whole-body exercise training.
Sheet 2: Seated leg extension measures at 60, 180 and 240 deg/sec pre- and post 4-weeks of home-based whole-body exercise training
Sheet 3: Seated leg flexion at 60, 180 and 240 deg/sec pre- and post- 4-weeks of home-based whole-body exercise training
Sheet 4: Handgrip strength, single-leg 1-RM leg extension, SPPBT (short physical performance battery tests) and leg muscle power, measured pre- and post- 4-weeks of home-based whole-body exercise training
Sheet 5: Participant characteristics. Heart rate (HR), systolic and diastolic blood pressure (BP) and body weight, pre- and post- 4-weeks of whole-body home-based exercise training.
Sheet 6: Quadriceps cross-sectional area (CSA), vastus lateralis muscle thickness, fascicle length and pennation angle measured by ultrasound pre- and post- 4-weeks of whole-body home-based exercise training.
Sheet 7: Muscle mass measured by using D1-creatine, pre- and post- 4 weeks of whole-body home-based exercise training.

DOI, 10.5256/f1000research.11894.d170288 (Cegielski et al., 2017).

Competing interests
No competing interests were disclosed.

Grant information
This work was supported by a Medical Research Council [MR/ K00414X/1] and Arthritis Research UK [19891] infrastructure award. The stable-isotope methodologies used in this work were developed and funded via Medical Research Council Confidence in Concept Awards [CiC12019, CiC2014035]. JC is supported by a PhD studentship [RGS117347] from The Abbeyfield Research Foundation (charity number 1167685).

The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

References

- Bassett SF, Papeavessis H: Home-based physical therapy intervention with adherence-enhancing strategies versus clinic-based management for patients with ankle sprains. Phys Ther 2007; 87(9): 1132–43. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- Bassey EJ, Short AH: A new method for measuring power output in a single leg extension: feasibility, reliability and validity. Eur J Appl Physiol Occup Physiol. 1990; 60(5): 385–390. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text
- Bassey EJ, Harries UJ: Normal values for handgrip strength in 920 men and women aged over 65 years, and longitudinal changes over 4 years in 620 survivors. Clin Sci (Lond) 1993; 84(3): 331–337. PubMed Abstract
- Brook MS, Wilkinson DJ, Mitchell WK, et al.: Synchronous deficits in cumulative muscle protein synthesis and ribosomal biogenesis underlie age-related anabolic resistance to exercise in humans. J Physiol 2016; 594(24): 7399–7417. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- Bull FC, Biddle S, Buchner D, et al.: Physical activity guidelines in the U.K.: Review and Recommendations. School of Sport, Exercise and Health Sciences, Loughborough University, 2010; 1–72. Reference Source
- Cegielski J, Brook M, Quinlan J, et al.: Dataset 1 in: A 4-week lifestyle-integrated home-based exercise training programme elicits improvements in physical function and lean mass in older men and women: a pilot study. F1000Research 2017.
- Chang CF, Lin KC, Chen WM, et al.: Effects of a Home-Based Resistance Training Program on Recovery From Total Hip Replacement Surgery: Feasibility and Pilot Testing. J Nurs Res. 2017; 25(1): 21–30. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- Clark RV, Walker AC, O’Connor-Semmes RL, et al.: Total body skeletal muscle mass: estimation by creatine (methyl-13) dilution in humans. J Appl Physiol (1985) 2014; 116(12): 1605–13. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- DeBolt LS, McCubbin JA: The Effects of Home-Based Resistance Exercise on Balance, Power, and Mobility in Adults with Multiple Sclerosis. Arch Phys Med Rehabil. 2004; 85(2): 290–297. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text
- Department of Health, Physical Activity, H.I. and P.: Start Active, Stay Active - A report on physical activity for health from the four home countries’ Chief Medical Officers. 2011.
- Reference Source
- Franchi MV, Atherton PJ, Reeves ND, et al.: Architectural, functional and
molecular responses to concentric and eccentric loading in human skeletal muscle. Acta Physiol (Oxf). 2014; 210(3): 642–54. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Gardner MM, Buchner DM, Robertson MC, et al.: Practical implementation of an exercise-based falls prevention programme. Age Ageing. 2001; 30(1): 77–83. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Gurarrick JM, Simonsick EM, Ferrucci L, et al.: A short physical performance battery assessing lower extremity function: association with self-reported disability and prediction of mortality and nursing home admission. J Gerontol. 1994; 49(2): M85–94. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Hong J, Kim J, Kim SW, et al.: Effect of home-based tele-exercise on sarcopenia among community-dwelling elderly adults: Body composition and functional fitness. Exp Gerontol. 2017; 87(Pt A): 33–39. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Ito S, Hashimoto M, Aduna S, et al.: Effectiveness of locomotion training in a home visit preventive care project: one-group pre-intervention versus post-intervention design study. J Orthop Sci. 2015; 20(6): 1078–1084. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Jeffers BJ, Sartini C, Lee IM, et al.: Adherence to physical activity guidelines in older adults, using objectively measured physical activity in a population-based study. BMC Public Health. 2014; 14(1): 382. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Jette AM, Harris BA, Sleeper L, et al.: A Home-based Exercise Program for Non-Disabled Older Adults. J Am Geriatr Soc. 1996; 44(6): 644–649. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Jette AM, Lachman M, Giorgi MM, et al.: Exercise–It’s never too late: The strong-for-life program. Am J Public Health. 1999; 89(1): 66–72. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text

Liu CJ, Latham NK: Progressive resistance strength training for improving physical function in older adults. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. 2009; 3(CD002759): 1–227. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text

Maruya K, Asakawa Y, Ishibashi H, et al.: Effect of a simple and adherent home exercise program on the physical function of community dwelling adults sixty years of age and older with pre-sarcopenia or sarcopenia. J Phys Ther Sci. 2016; 28(11): 3183–3189. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text

Nelson ME, Layne JE, Bernstein MJ, et al.: The Effects of Multidimensional Home-Based Exercise on Functional Performance in Elderly People. J Gerontol A Biol Sci Med Sci. 2004; 59(2): 154–60. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Phillips B, Williams J, Aheron P, et al.: Resistance exercise training improves age-related declines in leg vascular conductance and rejuvenates acute leg blood flow responses to feeding and exercise. J Appl Physiol (1985). 2012; 112(3): 347–53. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Plotnikoff RC, Eves N, Jung M, et al.: Multicomponent, home-based resistance training for obese adults with type 2 diabetes: a randomized controlled trial. Int J Obes (Lond). 2010; 34(12): 1733–41. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Reeves ND, Maganaris CN, Nacici MV: Ultrasonographic assessment of human skeletal muscle size. Eur J Appl Physiol. 2004; 91(1): 116–118. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Ribeiro F, Teixeira F, Brochado G, et al.: Impact of low cost strength training of dorsi- and plantar flexors on balance and functional mobility in institutionalized elderly people. Geriatr Gerontol Int. 2009; 9(1): 79–85. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Rudrapa SS, Wilkinson DJ, Greerhaff PL, et al.: Human Skeletal Muscle Disuse Atrophy: Effects on Muscle Protein Synthesis, Breakdown, and Insulin Resistance-A Qualitative Review. Front Physiol. 2016; 7: 361. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text

Silveira P, van de Langenberg P, van Het Reve E, et al.: Tablet-based strength-balance training to motivate and improve adherence to exercise in independently living older people: a phase II preclinical exploratory trial. J Med Internet Res. 2013; 15(8): e159. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text

Stimpson SA, Turner SM, Clifton LG, et al.: Total-body creatine pool size and skeletal muscle mass determination by creatine-(methyl-D) dilution in rats. J Appl Physiol (1985). 2012; 112(11): 1940–1948. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Yamauchi J, Nakayama S, Ishii N: Effects of bodyweight-based exercise training on muscle functions of leg multi-joint movement in elderly individuals. Geriatr Gerontol Int. 2009; 9(3): 262–269. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Zion AS, De Mersman R, Diamond BE, et al.: A home-based resistance-training program using elastic bands for elderly patients with orthostatic hypotension. Clin Auton Res. 2003; 13(4): 286–292. PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Zist A, Librett J, Buchner D, et al.: Environmental, Transportation, Social, and Time Barriers to Physical Activity. J Phys Act Health. 2006; 3(1): 16–21. Publisher Full Text
Open Peer Review

Current Peer Review Status:  

Version 2

Reviewer Report 08 November 2017

https://doi.org/10.5256/f1000research.13649.r27145

© 2017 Hennis P. This is an open access peer review report distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Philip Hennis
Nottingham Trent University, Nottingham, UK

This paper is well written and reports findings of an interesting pilot study with implications to clinical practice. Some revisions are suggested below:

Introduction:
A clear rationale for the study was described which resulted in a clear aim. I would remove the last sentence of the introduction regarding the aim to use the creatine method of assessing whole body muscle mass. This sentence detracts from the main study aim and the actual purpose of the study.

Methods:
The exercise intervention and the outcome measurements are described clearly and could be replicated. More information should be included about the participants and how they were recruited. Did the radio advertisement include specific information about who should respond? Were strict inclusion and exclusion criteria applied? The reader needs this information to fully interpret the results. In particular, participants' activity levels preceding the study will impact the reader's interpretation of the adherence rate and changes in all the outcome variables.

Results:
No revisions suggested.

Discussion:
A large part of your rationale for home based exercise was greater adherence to the exercise regime and this was measured in the study. As such, a paragraph is required in the discussion section comparing adherence in the current study with those of other studies using home, gym or hospital based training programs. The limitations paragraph should acknowledge that this study did not use a control group for comparison and the implications of this on drawing strong conclusions.

Is the work clearly and accurately presented and does it cite the current literature?
Yes

**Is the study design appropriate and is the work technically sound?**

Yes

**Are sufficient details of methods and analysis provided to allow replication by others?**

Yes

**If applicable, is the statistical analysis and its interpretation appropriate?**

Yes

**Are all the source data underlying the results available to ensure full reproducibility?**

Yes

**Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the results?**

Yes

**Competing Interests:** No competing interests were disclosed.

**Reviewer Expertise:** Exercise physiology, altitude physiology

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard.

---

**Version 1**

Reviewer Report 08 August 2017

https://doi.org/10.5256/f1000research.12852.r24550

© 2017 Gray S. This is an open access peer review report distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Stuart Gray

Institute of Cardiovascular and Medical Sciences, University of Glasgow, Glasgow, UK

The authors have investigated the effects of HBET on muscle function. This is an important advance as resistance exercise is known to be of benefit to health and yet (due to reasons mentioned in the paper) it is performed by very few people. I have a few comments on this but overall the manuscript is well written and the data clearly presented.

1) I would like to see a bit more detail on exactly how these exercise were integrated into daily life, e.g. what did you tell the participants to do exactly.
2) The authors mention that it may be that the changes in whole body muscle mass may have been below the detection level of the d3-creatine method - could the authors elaborate and provide details.

3) May be worth citing https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/24903908 in the discussion about the lack of change in grip strength.

4) I think it would be useful to highlight in the discussion (as you mentioned briefly when discussing the SPPBT results) that these participants were not that old and were very healthy.

References
1. Tieland M, Verdijk LB, de Groot LC, van Loon LJ: Handgrip strength does not represent an appropriate measure to evaluate changes in muscle strength during an exercise intervention program in frail older people. *Int J Sport Nutr Exerc Metab*. 2015; 25 (1): 27-36 PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text

Is the work clearly and accurately presented and does it cite the current literature?
Yes

Is the study design appropriate and is the work technically sound?
Yes

Are sufficient details of methods and analysis provided to allow replication by others?
Partly

If applicable, is the statistical analysis and its interpretation appropriate?
Yes

Are all the source data underlying the results available to ensure full reproducibility?
Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the results?
Yes

**Competing Interests:** No competing interests were disclosed.

**Reviewer Expertise:** Exercise, muscle, training, ageing.

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard.
The benefits of publishing with F1000Research:

- Your article is published within days, with no editorial bias
- You can publish traditional articles, null/negative results, case reports, data notes and more
- The peer review process is transparent and collaborative
- Your article is indexed in PubMed after passing peer review
- Dedicated customer support at every stage

For pre-submission enquiries, contact research@f1000.com