Killing of Virulent *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* by Reactive Nitrogen Intermediates Produced by Activated Murine Macrophages

By John Chan,‡ Yun Xing,** Richard S. Magliozzo,* and Barry R. Bloom

From the Howard Hughes Medical Institute, and *Department of Molecular Pharmacology, Albert Einstein College of Medicine, Bronx, New York 10461; and the ‡Department of Medicine, University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey, Newark, New Jersey 07103

Summary

Tuberculosis remains one of the major infectious causes of morbidity and mortality in the world, yet the mechanisms by which macrophages defend against *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* have remained obscure. Results from this study show that murine macrophages, activated by interferon γ, and lipopolysaccharide or tumor necrosis factor α, both growth inhibit and kill *M. tuberculosis*. This antitymocobacterial effect, demonstrable both in murine macrophage cell lines and in peritoneal macrophages of BALB/c mice, is independent of the macrophage capacity to generate reactive oxygen intermediates (ROI). Both the ROI-deficient murine macrophage cell line D9, and its ROI-generating, parental line J774.16, expressed comparable antimycobacterial activity upon activation. In addition, the oxygen radical scavengers superoxide dismutase (SOD), catalase, mannitol, and diazabicyclooctane had no effect on the antimycobacterial activity upon activation. These findings, together with the results showing the relative resistance of *M. tuberculosis* to enzymatically generated H₂O₂, suggest that ROI are unlikely to be significantly involved in killing *M. tuberculosis*. In contrast, the antimycobacterial activity of these macrophages strongly correlates with the induction of the l-arginine-dependent generation of reactive nitrogen intermediates (RNI). The effector molecule(s) that could participate in mediating this antimycobacterial function are toxic RNI, including NO, NO₂, and HNO₂, as demonstrated by the micobacteriocidal effect of acidified NO₂. The oxygen radical scavenger SOD adventitiously perturbs RNI production, and cannot be used to discriminate between cytoidal mechanisms involving ROI and RNI. Overall, our results provide support for the view that the l-arginine-dependent production of RNI is the principal effector mechanism in activated murine macrophages responsible for killing and growth inhibiting virulent *M. tuberculosis*.

Tuberculosis remains the single greatest infectious cause of death in the world today. It is estimated that there are 1.75 billion persons infected with the tubercle bacillus worldwide, with 8 million new cases and 3 million deaths per year (1). Recently, there has been a dramatic increase in the number of persons with disease caused by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, and the portentous emergence of multiply resistant organisms, primarily as a result of the HIV epidemic and inadequate control measures (2).

Although *M. tuberculosis* was discovered by Koch (3) over a century ago, the mechanisms of killing and resistance to this facultative intracellular pathogen that can replicate and persist inside mononuclear phagocytes remain unclear. Since the initial report of the killing of *Mycobacterium microti* by immunologically activated macrophages (4), research efforts to understand antitymocobacterial mechanisms have focused on the toxic effect of reactive oxygen intermediates (ROI) generated by phagocytes during the respiratory burst. Despite such efforts, the role of ROI as effector molecules mediating antitymocobacterial activity remains controversial. Studies on the antimicrobial capability of respiratory burst-deficient macrophages from chronic granulomatous disease patients suggested the existence of "oxygen-independent cytotoxic mechanisms" (5, 6). Such oxygen-independent mechanisms have been reported to participate in the antimicrobial activity of

---

1 Abbreviations used in this paper: BCG, *Bacillus Calmette-Guérin*; DABCO, diazabicyclooctane; HNO₂, nitrous acid; MOI, multiplicity of infection; NMMA, N⁶-monomethyl-l-arginine; NO, nitric oxide; NO₂, nitrogen dioxide; NO₃⁻, nitrite; O₂⁻, superoxide anion; RNI, reactive nitrogen intermediates; ROI, reactive oxygen intermediates; SOD, superoxide dismutase.
macrophages against Toxoplasma gondii (5), Chlamydia psittaci (6), Bacillus Calmette-Guerin (BCG) (7), Leishmania donovani (8), and Schistosoma mansoni (9).

Recently, macrophage-mediated cytotoxicity effective against tumor cells (10-12) has been linked to a metabolic pathway that involves oxidation of the guanidino nitrogen of L-arginine by the enzyme nitric oxide (NO) synthase to generate toxic reactive nitrogen intermediates (RNI): NO, nitrogen dioxide (NO2), and nitrite (NO2-) (for review, see references 13 and 14). The effector molecule(s) responsible for this antitumor activity has been identified as NO/NO2 (11, 12). Subsequently, RNI have been implicated in the antimicrobial effect of activated macrophages against a wide variety of pathogens, including Cryptococcus neoformans, L. major, T. gondii, S. mansoni, and M. leprae (for review, see reference 13). In this study, we examine the antimycobacterial effect of the L-arginine-dependent cytotoxic activity of murine macrophages.

Materials and Methods

**Animals.** 8-wk-old BALB/c female mice were purchased from The Jackson Laboratory (Bar Harbor, ME).

**Cell Cultures.** The murine macrophage cell lines (J774.16 and D9) were passaged in antibiotics-free DME as previously described (15). Cells (1.5 x 10^6) in 200 μl DME were allowed to adhere in wells of flat-bottomed, 96-well tissue culture plates (Fisher Scientific Co., Pittsburgh, PA) for studies of their antimycobacterial activity. Primary mouse peritoneal macrophages were harvested from mice that had been injected intraperitoneally with thioglycollate 4-6 d earlier. Cells (2 x 10^6) in 200 μl DME were allowed to adhere in wells of flat-bottomed, 96-well tissue culture plates for 6 h, and nonadherent cells were washed off before assessing the antimycobacterial activity of these peritoneal macrophages.

**Organisms.** The virulent M. tuberculosis (Erدم strain) was obtained from Dr. Frank Collins (Trudeau Institute, Saranac Lake, New York). All liquid cultures were carried at 37°C in Middlebrook 7H9 broth (Difco Laboratories, Detroit, MI) supplemented with oleic acid–albumin–dextrose complex (OADC) (Difco Laboratories), 0.05% Tween 80, and cyclohexamide (0.1 mg/ml). Determination of colony-forming units (CFU) was done on similarly supplemented Middlebrook 7H10 agar (Difco Laboratories) plates. All experiments were performed with fresh, day 7 cultures of third passage. L. donovani, an isolate from a patient with visceral leishmaniasis (obtained from Dr. Murray Wittner, Albert Einstein College of Medicine), was cultured in Liver Infusion Tryptose medium at 25°C.

**Reagents.** N6-Monomethyl-L-arginine (NNMA) was obtained from Calbiochem-Behring Corp. (La Jolla, CA). Recombinant murine IFN-γ and TNF-α were obtained from Genzyme (Boston, MA). Escherichia coli LPS, t-arginine, sulfanilamide, N-1-naphthyl-ethylenediamine, scopoletin, horseradish peroxidase, catalase, hydrogen peroxide, superoxide dismutase (SOD), mannitol, diabacicyclocloctanate (DABCO), saponin, and PMA were obtained from Sigma Chemical Co. (St. Louis, MO). Phosphoric acid (85%) was obtained from Fisher Scientific Co. [5,6-^3^H]Uracil (sp act, 34 Ci/ mmol) was purchased from New England Nuclear (Boston, MA).

**Measurement of Endotoxin.** Media, sera, and reagents used in macrophage cultures were assayed for endotoxin using the quantitative Limulus amoebocyte assay (Whittaker M.A. Bioproducts, Walkersville, MD). The amount of endotoxin in these materials was found to be consistently <0.1 ng/ml.

Assessment of Antimycobacterial Activity of Macrophages. The antimycobacterial activity of cytokine-activated macrophages was assessed by metabolic labeling of M. tuberculosis with [3H]uracil as previously described with modification (16). It is known that 80% of [3H]uracil is incorporated into the RNA of mycobacteria, and the remainder into DNA (16). Day 7 cultures (third passage) of M. tuberculosis (Erدم strain) were used to infect macrophages at a multiplicity of infection (MOI) of 1-10:1. Based on preliminary experiments, a MOI of 5-10:1 was chosen for experiments using differential labeling of RNA, and an MOI of 1:2:1 was selected for experiments using CFU, to assess the antimycobacterial effect of macrophages. The reason for choosing a higher MOI (5-10:1) in the RNA labeling experiments was simply to achieve high enough [3H]uracil incorporation (>12,000 cpm) by the tubercle bacilli above background of cultures without M. tuberculosis to allow meaningful data analysis. The data for determination of this MOI (5-10:1) were based on standardization experiments using MOIs of 40:1, 20:1, 10:1, 5:1, 2:5:1, 1:2:5:1, 1:1, and 0:5:1. For experiments using CFU to assess the antimycobacterial function of RNI-generating macrophages, the MOI of 1:2:1 chosen has also been derived from preliminary experiments that indicated optimal reduction in CFU, or increase in killing at lower MOI. Macrophages were primed with IFN-γ (250-500 U/ml) for 12-16 h at 37°C in 5% CO2. Medium was removed from wells and LPS (1-3 μg/ml) or TNF-α (4,000 U/ml), and mycobacteria were added back to the primed macrophages in a final volume of 200 μl of DME. Control cultures received no mycobacteria. After 4-5 h of incubation at 37°C in 5% CO2, cultures were washed three times to remove extracellular organisms. In all experiments using CFU as an index for cytotoxicity and growth inhibition, the number of these extracellular tubercle bacilli of each individual culture was ascertained by counting the number of CFU in the supernatants used to wash cultures by direct plating on 7H10 agar. Intracellular organisms were then determined by subtracting the number of extracellular CFU of each individual culture from the number of input bacilli CFU determined again by plating. These estimates were essentially confirmed by electron microscopic examinations of cultured macrophages infected with M. tuberculosis, which demonstrated that virtually all organisms remaining after washing cultures at 6 h postinfection are intracellular, not extracellular or pericellular. At 24 h postinfection, the cultures were pulsed with 2.5 μCi of [5,6-^3^H]uracil for 16-24 h, lysed, and RNAs were TCA precipitated onto GF/C glass fiber filters (Whatman Inc., Clifton, NJ), and counted as previously described (17). This time for pulse was chosen on the basis of preliminary experiments using BCG that indicated that suppression of [3H]uracil incorporation into RNA of the bacilli was observed after 6-9 h of exposure of organisms to RNI-generating macrophages, and peaked at 24 h. In experiments using virulent M. tuberculosis, the degree of suppression of [3H]uracil incorporation by the tubercle bacilli seen after 24 h of exposure of the organisms to activated macrophages (93.7% ± 10%, n = 18) was similar to that seen after 48 h of exposure (97.0% ± 3.1%, n = 6). RNA synthesis by mycobacteria was measured as [3H]uracil incorporation by cultures with organisms minus that by control cultures (dcpm). The inhibitory effect of activated macrophages on mycobacteria was measured as percent suppression of [3H]uracil incorporation expressed as: 100 x (dcpmstimulated - dcpmcontrol)/dcpmstimulated.

In experiments designed to examine the effect of ROI scavengers on the antimycobacterial function of activated macrophages, SOD, catalase, mannitol, and DABCO were added to cultures 4 h before infection at final concentrations of 2.5 mg/ml, 1.0 mg/ml, 50 mM, and 1 mM, respectively. Whenever parallel cultures were set up to assess the antimycobacterial effect...
of activated macrophages by CFU, no [3H]uracil was added, and macrophages were lysed with 0.1% saponin in distilled water at the end of experiments and plated onto 7H10 agar plates at serial dilutions.

**Measurement of NO$_2^-$, Superoxide Anion (O$_2^-$), and Hydrogen Peroxide (H$_2$O$_2$).** Culture supernatants were allowed to react with the Griess reagent, and the NO$_2^-$ content was quantitated by measuring the absorption at 540 nm as described previously (18). Supernatants from mycobacteria-infected cultures were filter-sterilized before measurement. O$_2^-$ generated by IFN-γ- and LPS-activated D9 and J774.16 cells was measured by the SOD-inhibitable cytochrome c reduction assay using a double-beam spectrophotometer as described previously (17). H$_2$O$_2$, generated by the glucose/glucose oxidase system, was quantitated by monitoring the horseradish peroxidase-catalyzed oxidation of fluorescent scopoletin (19).

**Assessment of Antimycobacterial Effect of Enzymatically Generated H$_2$O$_2$.** 2–10 × 10$^6$ cells of *M. tuberculosis* or *L. donovani* in 100 μl of Krebs-Ringer phosphate glucose solution (pH 7.4) were incubated with the H$_2$O$_2$-generating system (glucose/glucose oxidase) for 120 min at 37°C and 25°C, respectively. Control cultures contained no glucose oxidase. Organisms were then washed, resuspended in medium, and incubated overnight at the appropriate temperature. They were then pulsed-labeled with 2.5 μCi of [3H]uracil for 18–24 h, and TCA precipitated as previously described (17). The inhibitory effect of ROI was measured by the decrease in [3H]uracil incorporation in cultures containing enzymes compared with that of controls.

**The Antimycobacterial Effect of Acidified NO$_2^-$**. Approximately 2 × 10$^6$ cells of *M. tuberculosis* were incubated at 37°C for 24 h in 500 μl of 7H9 medium containing different concentrations of sodium nitrite (range, 0.25–10 mM) titrated to different pH (range, 4.5–6.5). NO$_2^-$ was not added to control samples. Organisms were then washed, resuspended in fresh medium, pulsed with 2.5 μCi of [3H]uracil for 18–24 h, and TCA precipitated as described previously (17). The antimycobacterial effect of NO$_2^-$ was determined by the decrease of [3H]uracil incorporation and CFU in NO$_2^-$-containing samples compared with controls.

**Results**

**Production of ROI and RNI by J774.16 and D9 Cells.** Evidence that ROI may not play a significant role in the antimycobacterial activity of murine macrophages has been derived largely from experiments relying on scavengers of ROI (7, 20). This approach obviously suffers from the drawback that scavengers may have nonspecific effects. We chose to pursue an alternative, somatic cell genetic approach by comparing the antimycobacterial activity of an ROI-producing murine macrophage cell line J774.16, with that of a mutant derived from it, clone D9, which is deficient in ROI production (15). Characterization of the IFN-γ- and LPS-induced production of ROI by these cells indicates that the parental clone J774.16 produces O$_2^-$ efficiently (∼4.5 nmol/10$^6$ cells/10 min), while the mutant clone D9 produces only a low level of superoxide anion (∼1 nmol/10$^6$ cells/10 min) (data not shown). In contrast to the disparity in their ability to produce ROI, both J774.16 and D9 macrophages, after activation with IFN-γ and LPS, generate RNI efficiently, as measured by NO$_2^-$ production (Fig. 1). In addition, the capacity for NO$_2^-$ production by these two cell lines at 24 h and 48 h is comparable (Fig. 1). From these preliminary titration studies, the IFN-γ and LPS concentrations chosen for activating macrophages in subsequent experiments were 250–500 U/ml and 1–3 μg/ml, respectively.

**Inhibition of NO Production by NMMA.** NMMA, an analogue of l-arginine, has been shown effectively to block macrophage NO$_2^-$ production (10), through competitive inhibition of NO synthases (21). We confirmed (Fig. 2) that NMMA effectively inhibits NO$_2^-$ production by both J774.16 and D9 cells in a dose-dependent fashion, reaching 70–80% inhibition when used at a final concentration of 300–500 μM. This inhibitory effect of NMMA could be reversed by supplementing the culture with l-arginine, the substrate for NO synthase (data not shown). Based on these results, the concentrations of NMMA and l-arginine used

![Figure 1](https://example.com/image1.png)

![Figure 2](https://example.com/image2.png)
in subsequent experiments were 250–500 μM and 10 mM, respectively.

Effects of NO-producing Macrophages on [3H]Uracil Incorporation by M. tuberculosis (Erdman). Both D9 and J774.16 cells possess effective antimycobacterial activity upon activation with IFN-γ and LPS, inhibiting >90% of [3H]uracil incorporation by M. tuberculosis (Table 1). This antimycobacterial activity was diminished by NMMA, and correlated well with the amount of NO2- produced by the activated macrophages (Table 1), suggesting that the antimycobacterial effect of these macrophages was due to RNI. This was supported further by showing that the antimycobacterial effect of NMMA-treated D9 and J774.16 cells could be restored by addition of excess L-arginine, with concomitant restoration of NO2- production (Table 1). Several lines of evidence support the view that the [3H]uracil incorporation by M. tuberculosis reflects that of intracellular organisms: (a) extracellular organisms were washed off carefully 4–6 h postinfection in all experiments; (b) electron microscopic evaluation of M. tuberculosis-infected macrophage cultures indicated that virtually all organisms remaining after washing cultures at 6 h postinfection were intracellular, and not pericellular or extracellular; and (c) we had monitored TCA-precipitable counts of supernatants removed at the end-point of experiments before lysing cultures. No alteration in the percent suppression of [3H]uracil incorporation by M. tuberculosis in cytokine-activated macrophage cultures was observed even when the

Table 1. Reactive Nitrogen Intermediate-generating D9, J774.16, and BALB/c Peritoneal Macrophages Are Inhibitory to M. tuberculosis

| Mφ | NO3- | NMMA | L-Arginine | -IFN-γ/LPS + TB | -IFN-γ/LPS - TB | +IFN-γ/LPS + TB | +IFN-γ/LPS - TB | Suppression of [3H]Uracil incorporation |
|----|------|------|------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|-------------------------------|
| D9 | 325.3 | -    | -          | 18,898 ± 3,836 | 3,427 ± 243 | 3,770 ± 829 | 2,359 ± 310 | 15,471 ± 1,411 | 90.9 |
| 63.5| +    | -    | -          | 34,505 ± 3,040 | 3,521 ± 1,071 | 29,037 ± 4,007 | 7,161 ± 2,538 | 30,984 ± 21,876 | 32.6 |
| 174.6| +    | +    | -          | 27,612 ± 3,302 | 5,299 ± 2,152 | 5,900 ± 169 | 2,660 ± 1,457 | 22,312 ± 3,240 | 85.5 |
| J774.16 | 365.0 | -    | -          | 24,778 ± 3,830 | 6,236 ± 1,578 | 6,374 ± 2,152 | 4,818 ± 2,512 | 18,541 ± 1,793 | 90.3 |
| 79.4| +    | -    | -          | 42,202 ± 3,636 | 4,527 ± 519 | 34,199 ± 2,152 | 5,168 ± 1,765 | 37,675 ± 27,034 | 28.2 |
| 174.6| +    | +    | -          | 46,398 ± 5,200 | 5,168 ± 1,548 | 6,347 ± 1,740 | 2,621 ± 1,497 | 41,230 ± 3,726 | 91.0 |
| BALB/c | 214.3 | -    | -          | 28,086 ± 1,403 | 1,838 ± 210 | 4,390 ± 430 | 5,016 ± 852 | 26,248 ± 626 | 102.4 |
| 35.7| +    | -    | -          | 33,009 ± 403 | 1,032 ± 365 | 24,431 ± 1,443 | 5,398 ± 252 | 32,977 ± 19,033 | 40.5 |
| 191.4| +    | +    | -          | 30,823 ± 3,969 | 2,594 ± 539 | 3,493 ± 154 | 4,763 ± 752 | 28,229 ± 1,270 | 104.5 |

Data shown are representative of three experiments. All data were derived from triplicate cultures. Macrophages were infected at an MOI of 5–10:1. Infected cultures were pulsed 24 h postinfection, and harvested 16–24 h later. The antimycobacterial effect of these macrophages was assessed by the inhibition of [3H]uracil incorporation by M. tuberculosis (see Methods and Materials for details). The degree of inhibition by the IFN-γ and LPS-activated macrophages strongly correlates with the amount of NO2- produced by these cells. Derivation of dcpm and percent suppression of [3H]uracil incorporation are detailed in Materials and Methods.
supernatant-associated counts were taken into consideration (i.e., correcting the cpm for cell-associated counts) during data analysis (data not shown). Overall, we infer that RNI rather than ROI contribute significantly to the antimycobacterial activity of these macrophages because: (a) there was no correlation between the capacity to generate ROI and the antimycobacterial effect of these murine macrophage cell lines; and (b) in contrast, the ability of D9 and J774.16 to inhibit mycobacteria strongly correlated with RNI production (Table 1).

**Effect of ROI Scavengers on the Antimycobacterial Effect of Macrophages.** Although the D9 cell line produced significantly less ROI than J774.16, the possibility that the antimycobacterial activity of the mutant was due to the small amount of toxic oxygen intermediates generated could not be excluded. Consequently, we examined the effect of ROI scavengers on the antimycobacterial effect of D9 cells. Superoxide dismutase, catalase, mannitol, and DABCO were used as scavengers for $\text{O}_2^-$, $\text{H}_2\text{O}_2$, hydroxyl radicals (OH·), and singlet oxygen ($\text{O}_2^*$), respectively. These scavengers, at the concentrations used, did not affect the viability of macrophages (as assessed by trypan blue exclusion), and had no effect on [$^3\text{H}$]uracil incorporation by *M. tuberculosis* (data not shown). SOD, catalase, mannitol, and DABCO had no effect on the antimycobacterial activity of cytokine-activated D9 cells, suggesting that $\text{O}_2^-$, $\text{H}_2\text{O}_2$, OH·, and $\text{O}_2^*$ do not play a significant role in killing *M. tuberculosis*. Interestingly, treatment with SOD resulted in NO$_2^-$ production by D9 cells that had not been activated with cytokines, rendering these macrophages inhibitory to mycobacteria (Fig. 3). Mannitol, catalase, and DABCO did not affect NO$_2^-$ production. These data indicate that: (a) the antimycobacterial activity of D9 macrophages is clearly related to the amount of NO$_2^-$ produced; (b) scavengers of ROI did not affect the antimycobacterial activity of RNI-generating macrophages, suggesting that oxygen radicals probably do not play a significant role in the ability of these macrophages to inhibit *M. tuberculosis*; and (c) the use of SOD to discriminate between the ROI- and RNI-dependent antimicrobial mechanisms of mononuclear phagocytes could lead to misinterpretation of results because this ROI scavenger renders unstimulated macrophages capable of producing NO$_2^-$, and therefore, antimycobacterial. The effect of SOD on NO$_2^-$ production by macrophages was dose dependent, and abolished by boiling the native enzyme (Fig. 4).

**Effect of H$_2$O$_2$ on *M. tuberculosis*.** While it has been

---

**Table 1.** Effect of ROI Scavengers on the Antimycobacterial Effect of D9 Cells

| Scavenger       | NO$_2^-$ (nmoles / 10$^6$ cells) | % Suppression of [$^3\text{H}$] Uracil Incorporation |
|-----------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|
| SOD (+IFN-γ/LPS) | 216.1                            |                                              |
| SOD (-IFN-γ/LPS) | 189.5                            |                                              |
| Catalase        | 181.0                            |                                              |
| DABCO           | 227.9                            |                                              |
| Mannitol        | 203.4                            |                                              |
| SOD (+IFN-γ/LPS) | 168.2                            |                                              |
| SOD (-IFN-γ/LPS) | 181.0                            |                                              |

Figure 3. Effects of ROI scavengers on the antimycobacterial activity of IFN-γ- and LPS-activated D9 cells. Experiments were set up as described in the legend to Table 1, except that the various ROI scavengers were added to macrophage cultures 4 h before infection with *M. tuberculosis*. The time of pulsing and harvesting of cultures was as outlined in Materials and Methods. Macrophages were infected at a MOI of 5–10:1. The amount of [$^3\text{H}$]uracil incorporated by infected and uninfected cultures was in the same range as that shown in Table 1. SOD, catalase, mannitol, and DABCO had no effect on the antimycobacterial effect of cytokine-activated D9 macrophages, suggesting that $\text{O}_2^-$, $\text{H}_2\text{O}_2$, OH·, and $\text{O}_2^*$ do not play a significant role in defense against *M. tuberculosis*. SOD resulted in NO$_2^-$ production by unstimulated D9 cells, rendering them inhibitory to *M. tuberculosis*. Consequently, the percent suppression of [$^3\text{H}$]uracil incorporation of SOD-treated cultures, both stimulated and unstimulated, was measured against the [$^3\text{H}$]uracil uptake of unstimulated cultures containing no scavengers. Experiments were performed twice with similar results. Data shown were derived from triplicate samples. Similar results were also obtained using J774.16 macrophages (data not shown).

Figure 4. The ROI scavenger SOD perturbs NO$_2^-$ production by D9 cells. Experiments were set up as described in the legend to Fig. 1, except that the various ROI scavengers were added to macrophage cultures 4 h before the addition of LPS. Culture supernatant was assayed for its NO$_2^-$ content 48 h after addition of LPS. Each point represents the mean of triplicate samples, the SD of which is <5%. Results shown are representative of two experiments. SOD treatment of D9 macrophages that were not activated with IFN-γ and LPS resulted in NO$_2^-$ production by these cells, rendering them effectively antimycobacterial (Fig. 3). This effect of SOD is dose dependent, and is abrogated by boiling the enzyme. Similar results were obtained with J774.16 macrophages (data not shown).
M. tuberculosis, is relatively resistant to H2O2 in a cell-free system. Hydrogen peroxide, enzymatically generated by glucose/glucose oxidase, effectively inhibited [3H]uracil incorporation by L. donovani relative to M. tuberculosis. Hydrogen peroxide was quantitated by the horseradish peroxidase-catalyzed oxidation of scopoletin (29). Results shown are representative of four experiments. Each point is shown as the mean of triplicate samples.

Figure 5. M. tuberculosis, is relatively resistant to H2O2 in a cell-free system. Hydrogen peroxide, enzymatically generated by glucose/glucose oxidase, effectively inhibited [3H]uracil incorporation by L. donovani relative to M. tuberculosis. Hydrogen peroxide was quantitated by the horseradish peroxidase-catalyzed oxidation of scopoletin (29). Results shown are representative of four experiments. Each point is shown as the mean of triplicate samples.

demonstrated that M. tuberculosis is resistant to O2− (22), the sensitivity of the tubercle bacillus to H2O2 remains controversial (23). Consequently, we tested the susceptibility of M. tuberculosis to hydrogen peroxide generated by glucose/glucose oxidase in a cell free system. In these experiments, L. donovani, the etiologic agent of visceral leishmaniasis, was used as control. The amount of H2O2 generated was quantitated in parallel samples without cells under the same experimental conditions. M. tuberculosis was significantly more resistant to H2O2 compared with L. donovani over a wide dose range tested (Fig. 5). This relative resistance of M. tuberculosis to H2O2, together with the data demonstrating that SOD, catalase, mannitol, and DABCO did not affect the inhibitory effect of activated D9 cells on M. tuberculosis, strongly suggests that ROI do not play a significant role in the antituberculosis activity of macrophages.

Acidified NO2− is Mycobacteriocidal. Recent reports have shown that NO2− is tumoristatic at low pH, apparently due to the formation of nitrous acid (pKa = 3.4), which then dismutates to generate NO and NO2 (12, 24). Therefore, to examine directly the antituberculosis effect of RNI, we tested the effect of NO2− on M. tuberculosis at various pHs. Results in Fig. 6 show that NO2− becomes inhibitory to mycobacteria upon acidification. While no antituberculosis effect of NO2− was detected at pH 6.0 and 6.5, even when NO2− was used at a final concentration of 10 mM (data not shown), treatment of the bacilli with 2 mM of NO2− for 24 h at pH 4.5 inhibited >95% of [3H]uracil incorporation. In fact, acidified NO2− is mycobacteriocidal (Table 2), achieving complete killing at 5 mM nitrite at pH 4.5. These results formally establish that RNI are mycobacteriocidal.

Effects of RNI-generating Primary Murine Macrophages on M. tuberculosis. To establish whether the findings in murine macrophage cell lines can be extended to primary murine mononuclear phagocytes, we studied the antimycobacterial effect of IFN-γ- and LPS-activated peritoneal macrophages...
of BALB/c mice. Optimal experimental conditions for RNI production by these cells were found to be similar to those established for J774.16 and D9 macrophages (Fig. 1). Results in Table 1 indicate that the antimycobacterial activity of primary murine peritoneal macrophages is comparable with that of the macrophage cell lines, and again, strongly correlated with the amount of RNI generated.

**Discussion**

Although it is generally accepted that resistance to tuberculosis is dependent upon cell-mediated immunity, the mechanisms by which *M. tuberculosis* is killed or growth inhibited are not fully understood. While it has long been reported that the in vitro killing of *M. microti* by murine macrophages could be inhibited by catalase, the scavenger for H2O2 (4), the question as to whether ROI produced by activated macrophages play a significant protective role against *M. tuberculosis* remains unsettled. The recent findings that biosynthesis...
Table 3. Reactive Nitrogen Intermediate-generating D9 and J774.16 Macrophages Are Mycobacteriocidal

| Mφ | NMMA | l-Arginine | CFU 0 h | Decrease in CFU | Decrease in CFU (mean ± SD) | NO2⁻ 0 h | Decrease in CFU | CFU 48 h | Decrease in CFU | Decrease in CFU (mean ± SD) | NO2⁻ 48 h |
|----|------|------------|--------|----------------|-----------------------------|--------|----------------|---------|----------------|-----------------------------|----------|
|    |      |            |        | %              | nmol                        |        |                |         | %              | nmol                        |         |
| D9 | -    | -          | 1.12   | 2.4            | -114.3                      | -122.1 | 1.03           | 0.65   | -114.3         | 41.4 ± 11.1                  | 190.6    |
|    |      |            | 1.00   | 2.3            | -130.0                      | -95.8  | 0.94           | 0.78   | -114.3         | 15.9 ± 1.3                   | 55.6     |
|    |      |            | 1.03   | 2.0            | -94.2                       | -114.3 | 0.96           | 0.59   | -114.3         | 38.5                        |         |
|    | +    | -          | 1.08   | 2.0            | -85.2                       | -95.8  | 0.94           | 0.78   | -114.3         | 15.9 ± 1.3                   | 55.6     |
|    |      |            | 1.01   | 2.1            | -107.9                      | -114.3 | 0.96           | 0.59   | -114.3         | 38.5                        |         |
|    | +    | +          | 1.17   | 2.3            | -139.3                      | -114.5 | 1.03           | 0.62   | -114.3         | 42.9 ± 6.6                   | 103.2    |
| J774.16 | -    |          | 0.86   | 1.5            | -74.4                        | -68.8  | 0.96           | 0.54   | -68.8 ± 14.7   | 43.8 ± 9.9                   | 182.6    |
|    |      |            | 0.89   | 1.6            | -79.8                        | 1.00   | 0.40           | 60.0    |                |                             |         |
|    |      |            | 0.89   | 1.3            | -46.1                       | -46.1  | 0.70           | 0.70   | -46.1          | 0 ± 7.0                     | 39.7     |
|    | +    | -          | 0.95   | 1.4            | -47.4                       | -67.0  | 0.90           | 0.81   | -67.0 ± 24.7   | 10.0                        |         |
|    |      |            | 0.95   | 1.8            | -89.5                       | -91.5  | 0.78           | 0.48   | -91.5          | 38.5                        |         |
|    | +    | +          | 0.97   | 1.4            | -44.3                       | -52.7  | 0.99           | 0.60   | -52.7 ± 35.4   | 39.4 ± 4.7                   | 102.9    |
|    |      |            | 0.90   | 1.1            | -22.2                       |        | 0.85           | 0.45   | -22.2          | 47.1                        |         |

Macrophages were infected at an MOI of 1–2:1. The number of bacilli used to infect macrophages was 1.6 × 10⁵. Direct assessment of the effect of the antimycobacterial effect of RNI-generating macrophages by quantitating CFU indicates that these cells are mycobacteriocidal because culturing M. tuberculosis with activated macrophages for 2 d resulted in a decrease in the input CFU by 41.4% to 55.2%. Data are shown as means of triplicate samples and SDs.

of nitrate occurs in mammalian cells (31), and that macrophages are a major source of mammalian nitrate synthesis (32), have spurred intensive research efforts leading to the discovery of the l-arginine-dependent metabolic pathway used to generate reactive nitrogen intermediates (for review, see references 13, 14, 33, and 34). The biological significance of this novel pathway is underscored by the participation of its products, NO or its related species, in a wide range of physiological processes. NO accounts for the activity of endothelial-derived relaxing factor, which mediates vasodilation through interaction with the heme prosthetic group of cytosolic guanylate cyclase; it functions as a neurotransmitter in the central nervous system; and it inhibits platelet aggregation (for review, see references 13, 14, 33, and 34). In the immune system, the l-arginine-dependent pathway offers a new antimicrobial mechanism for resistance to infectious pathogens (for review, see references 13, and 14). Since the report that antitumor activity of activated macrophages is related to the l-arginine-dependent generation of RNI; (b) the effector molecule(s) that could participate in mediating this antimycobacterial function are toxic RNI, including NO, NO₂⁻, and HNO₂⁻; (c) RNI generated chemically are mycobacteriocidal; (d) ROI are unlikely to be significantly involved in killing M. tuberculosis; (e) the oxygen radical scavenger SOD perturbs NO₂⁻ production and must be used with caution in discriminating between cytocidal mechanisms involving ROI and RNI.

The significance of the l-arginine-dependent cytotoxic mechanism for macrophage inhibition against another pathogenic mycobacterium, M. leprae, has been reported recently (35). Further, our results confirm and considerably extend recent reports that implicated RNI in resistance to M. tuberculosis (20) and BCG (36), but that did not provide direct evidence on the cytotoxic and cytocidal effects of RNI against mycobacteria. It must be stated, however, that the assessment of the growth and killing of M. tuberculosis in macrophage cultures is technically difficult (37, 38). M. tuberculosis is a serious pathogen requiring high-level containment, it clumps
Table 4. Reactive Nitrogen Intermediate-generating BALB/c Peritoneal Macrophages Are Mycobacteriocidal

| Time of harvest (postinfection) | CFU | Decrease in CFU (mean ± SD) | CFU | Decrease in CFU (mean ± SD) |
|---------------------------------|-----|-----------------------------|-----|-----------------------------|
|                                |     | NO2 -                       |     | NO2 -                       |
|                                |     | nmoI × 10^3 | % | % | nmoI × 10^3 | % | % | nmoI |
| 48                              |     | 2.11 | 4.7 | -123.8 | 2.02 | 0.77 | 62.0 |
|                                |     | 2.15 | 3.8 | -76.7 | 100.3 | 33.3 | 5.95 |
|                                |     | 2.74 | 3.7 | -65.2 | -100.3 | 57.7 |
|                                |     | 1.97 | 3.3 | -67.5 | -77.2 | 18.8 | 0 |
|                                |     | 1.96 | 3.9 | -98.9 | - | - |
|                                |     | 1.99 | 3.6 | -80.9 | 1.81 | 0.62 | 65.7 |
|                                |     | 1.99 | 3.1 | -55.9 | -68.4 | 17.7 | 0 |
|                                |     | 1.97 | 7.1 | -260.4 | 2.06 | 1.05 | 49.0 |
|                                |     | 1.97 | 5.6 | -184.3 | -222.4 | 53.8 | 23.8 |
|                                |     | 2.03 | 9.1 | -348.3 | - | - |
|                                |     | 2.05 | 8.9 | -334.1 | -332.1 | 17.3 | 0 |
|                                |     | 2.03 | 8.4 | -313.8 | - | - |
|                                |     | 1.96 | 8.1 | -413.3 | 1.94 | 0.59 | 69.6 |
|                                |     | 1.98 | 10.1 | -410.1 | -374.8 | 63.9 | 0 |
|                                |     | 1.92 | 7.7 | -301.0 | - | - |

Macrophages were infected at an MOI of 1-2:1. The number of bacilli used to infect macrophages was 2.7 × 10^3. Direct assessment of the effect of the antimycobacterial effect of RNI-generating macrophages by quantitating CFU indicates that these cells are mycobacteriocidal, decreasing the number of input CFU by 58.3% at 48 h postinfection. Similar degree of killing was observed when organisms were cultured with activated macrophages for 96 h (56.2%). Data are shown as means of triplicate samples and SDs.

in culture and in macrophages, confounding assessment of growth and killing of single cells, and it requires 3-4 wk for colonies to grow. Commonly encountered technical problems were taken into careful consideration in these experiments. (a) No antibiotics were used in cultures. (b) Extracellular organisms were minimized by carefully washing out cultures after 4-6 h of infection. The medium used for washing as well as the original culture supernatants were pooled and the number of CFU determined. Since the number of CFU used to infect cultures was known, the input of CFU could be determined precisely for each culture well. (c) After infections were set up, cultures were not manipulated until harvest. (d) At the end of the experiment, after careful removal of the culture supernatant, 0.1% saponin was used to lyse cells to minimize errors from clumping. The removed supernatant was centrifuged to assure retrieval of any cells that were removed inadvertently. The cell pellet was lysed with saponin, and pooled together with lysed cells from the corresponding culture for determination of CFU.

It is generally accepted that failure of bacteria to form colonies on nutrient media is the most reliable measure of killing or nonviability. Dormant states are conceivable but not easily demonstrated. Once removed from macrophages, growth-inhibited but viable mycobacteria would be expected to form colonies after 4 wk of culture on nutrient-enriched medium, and correlatively, failure to do so means the organisms are not, by the standard criterion, viable. In preliminary experiments, agar plates were kept and counted for CFU periodically for as long as 2 mo, thereby excluding the possibility of undercounting as a result of a slower growth rate of reversibly inhibited organisms. Therefore, our data (Tables 3 and 4) that RNI-generating macrophages decreased the number of viable input organisms by quantifying CFU on agar plates indicated that these phagocytes are cytotoxic for M. tuberculosis in this in vitro system. The more efficient macrophage antimycobacterial activity seen in experiments using radiolabeling (~90% suppression; Table 1) versus direct counting of CFU (~50% decrease in CFU compared with input intracellular organisms; Tables 3 and 4) as in index for assessment suggests that killing is not complete and that there
is likely to be a significant component of reversible intracellular bacteriostasis in our in vitro system.

The effector molecules mediating mycobacteriocidal activity that result from acidification of NO$_2^-$ could be either NO, NO$_2$, or HNO$_2$, or any combination of the three. The antibacterial effect of sodium nitrite, a compound that can form various oxides of nitrogen at acidic pH (12, 24), has been known for years (39). The mechanisms for this effect had been studied extensively in the past as a result of the widespread use of NO$_2^-$ in meat curing. Data from these studies had shown that the ability of sodium nitrite to kill and to inhibit certain microorganisms was pH dependent, reaching a maximum at the pH range of 4.5-5.5 (24, 39). The reactive nitrogen species directly responsible for the toxicity had been proposed to be NO/NO$_2$ or HNO$_2$ (24, 40). Data from the present study indicate that sodium nitrite effectively killed virulent *M. tuberculosis* at acidic pH (Table 2). At pH 4.5, 1 mM NO$_2^-$ resulted in a 1-log decrease in CFU, reaching 3 log and total killing at 2 and 5 mM, respectively. The pH-dependent mycobacterial effect of NO$_2^-$ may be of relevance in vivo in the acidic environment of phagolysosomes of activated macrophages (as low as pH 4.5) (41). Indeed, the significance of the microbicidal effect of RNI in vivo has been demonstrated recently in a murine cutaneous leishmaniasis model (14, 42). In our system, the difference in efficiency between the mycobacteriocidal activity of RNI generated by acidification of NO$_2^-$ in vitro (Table 2) and by cytokine-activated macrophages (Tables 3 and 4) could be used to challenge the significance of this mechanism in killing *M. tuberculosis* in vivo. Although it is impossible to determine the dosage of bacilli necessary to initiate infection, data obtained from animal studies and clinical observations suggest that human beings under natural conditions probably inhale no more than a few organisms (43, 44). In contrast, the dose of bacilli used to infect macrophage cultures in our experiments was routinely 1-2 × 10$^6$. This large dose of bacilli is nonphysiological, and it is likely that in vivo resistance can be achieved when RNI-generating macrophages are challenged with but a few *M. tuberculosis*. Indeed, it is well known that the character and the course of tuberculous infection in animals depends to a large extent on the dose of *M. tuberculosis* used for infection (43). It is, however, important to bear in mind that the purpose of testing the antimycobacterial effect of acidified NO$_2^-$ was to establish, in a cell-free system independent of the complex events within macrophages, whether chemically produced RNI are mycobacteriocidal. The amount of NO$_2^-$ added in the cell-free system (Fig. 6 and Table 2) is clearly greater than that produced by macrophages stimulated in vitro as measured by quantifying the amount of NO$_2^-$ in culture supernatants. It is, however, possible that the effective concentrations in the cell-free system can be achieved within particular intracellular compartments. Quantitative comparison of the macrophage and cell-free killing systems are, at present, not possible because the actual cytosolic species of RNI within macrophages is not known, nor is its intracellular half-life, concentration, and compartmentalization. Similarly, for the cell-free system, information on the relative concentrations of the various RNI (including NO, NO$_2$, HNO$_2$, etc.), and their stability are not known.

In contrast to the potent antimycobacterial activity of RNI, our data suggest that ROI probably do not play a significant role in macrophage antimycobacterial activity. (a) The ROI-deficient D9 mutant kills *M. tuberculosis* as effectively as its parental line, J774.16, which generates oxygen radicals efficiently (Tables 3 and 4). (b) The antimycobacterial effect of activated macrophages strongly correlates with the amount of RNI generated (Figs. 3 and 7, and Tables 1, 3, and 4). (c) The antimycobacterial effect of nonactivated D9 in the presence of SOD correlates with NO$_2^-$ production (Fig. 3). (d) Scavengers for O$_2^-$, H$_2$O$_2$, OH-, and O$_3$ do not affect the antimycobacterial activity of macrophages (Fig. 3). (e) *M. tuberculosis* is highly resistant to killing by H$_2$O$_2$ generated enzymatically by the glucose/glucose oxidase system (Fig. 5). Consistent with the view that ROI may not contribute significantly to macrophage antimycobacterial activity is evidence that *M. tuberculosis* can parasitize mononuclear phagocytes without eliciting the oxidative burst by gaining entry via the C3 receptor (45). Further, we and others have shown that major cell wall–associated and secreted glycolipids of mycobacteria are efficient scavengers of oxygen radicals (17, 46, 47).

Obviously, our data in vitro do not entirely exclude a role for ROI in defense against *M. tuberculosis*, since D9 cells are capable of generating a low level of oxygen radicals. In addition, the ROI scavengers used may not have removed all the reactive oxygen species generated by activated macrophages, and may produce some nonspecific effect. Indeed, one of the scavengers used in the present study was adventitiously found to affect macrophage NO$_2^-$ production (Figs. 3 and 4). Addition of SOD to D9 cells not exposed to cytokines resulted in significant production of NO$_2^-$ Superoxide anion is known to react with NO to form peroxynitrite anion, which decomposes rapidly once protonated to form OH- and NO$_3$, and subsequently nitrate (48). In a system used to evaluate the vasodilatory effect of NO derived from endothelial cells, SOD has been shown to increase the stability of this RNI by scavenging O$_2^-$ (49). Therefore, it is possible that SOD, by virtue of its ability to scavenge O$_2^-$, stabilizes a basal level of NO released by nonactivated D9 macrophages, thus rendering these cells inhibitory to mycobacteria. The effect of SOD on NO$_2^-$ production was also observed in J774.16 cells (data not shown). The precise mechanisms by which SOD affects NO$_2^-$ production by macrophages are currently unknown; though the fact that this effect was not seen with boiled enzymes suggests that native conformation of the enzyme, which is most likely required for the scavenging of O$_2^-$ by SOD, is important. Thus, SOD, one of the simplest tools for discriminating between microbicidal mechanisms dependent on ROI or RNI perturbs the production of RNI and can lead to significant misinterpretation of data. The biological significance of the effects of SOD on macrophage NO$_2^-$ production remains to be determined, and the relationship between the respiratory burst and the l-arginine-dependent cytotoxic pathway merits reexamination.
Finally, the relevance of the present findings on the antimycobacterial activity of RNI produced by murine macrophages to human tuberculous infections requires comment. It must be stated that convincing evidence that human monococytes produce sufficient amounts of RNI for antimicrobial activity has, despite efforts in several laboratories, not been forthcoming. Thus, the importance of the L-arginine-dependent cytotoxic mechanism in resistance to human pathogens remains to be established.

We thank Jack Peisach for helpful discussion; Vicki Braunstein for assistance in passaging *L. donovani*; and are grateful and indebted to JoAnne Flynn and Ruchira Das Gupta for performing some of the preliminary experiments.

This work was supported by grants AI-07118, AI-23545, AI-26491, AI-30189, and GM-40168 (J. Peisach) from the National Institutes of Health, and the Foundation of the University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey.

Address correspondence to Barry R. Bloom, Department of Microbiology & Immunology, Howard Hughes Medical Institute Research Laboratories, Albert Einstein College of Medicine, 1300 Morris Park Avenue, Bronx, NY 10461.

Received for publication 13 September 1991 and in revised form 21 January 1992.

References

1. Murray, C.J.L., K. Styblo, and A. Rouillon. 1990. Tuberculosis in developing countries: burden, intervention, and cost. *Bull. Int. Union Tuberc.* 65:2.
2. Center for Disease Control. 1989. Tuberculosis and human immunodeficiency virus infection: recommendation of the advisory committee for the elimination of tuberculosis (ACET). *Mortality and Morbidity Weekly Report.* 38:236.
3. Koch, R. 1932. Die Aetiologie der Tuberculose, a translation of New Jersey.
4. Murray, C.J.L., K. Styblo, and A. Rouillon. 1990. Tuberculosis in developing countries: burden, intervention, and cost. *Bull. Int. Union Tuberc.* 65:2.
5. Murray, H.W., R.Y. Rubin, S.M. Carriero, A.M. Harris, and E.A. Jaffe. 1985. Human mononuclear phagocyte antiprotozoal mechanisms: oxygen-dependent vs. oxygen-independent activity against intracellular *Toxoplasma gondii*. *J. Immunol.* 134:1982.
6. Rothermel, C.D., B.Y. Rubin, E.A. Jaffe, and H.W. Murray. 1986. Oxygen-independent inhibition of intracellular Chlamydia psittaci growth by human monocytes and interferon-γ-activated macrophage. *J. Immunol.* 137:689.
7. Flesch, I.E.A., and S.H.E. Kaufmann. 1988. Attempts to characterize the mechanisms involved in mycobacterial growth inhibition by gamma-interferon-activated bone marrow macrophages. *Infect. Immun.* 56:1464.
8. Murray, H.W., and D.M. Cartelli. 1983. Killing of intracellular Leishmania donovani by human mononuclear phagocytes: evidence for oxygen-dependent and -independent leishmanicidal activity. *J. Clin. Invest.* 72:32.
9. Scott, P., S. James, and A. Sher. 1985. The respiratory burst is not required for killing of intracellular and extracellular parasites by a lymphokine-activated macrophage cell line. *Eur. J. Immunol.* 15:553.
10. Hibbs, J.B., Jr., R.R. Taintor, and Z. Vavrin. 1987. Macrophage cytotoxicity: role for L-arginine deaminase and amino nitrogen oxidation to nitrite. *Science (Wash. DC).* 197:473.
11. Hibbs, J.B., Jr., R. Taintor, Z. Vavrin, and C. Rachlin. 1988. Nitric oxide: a cytotoxic activated macrophage effector molecule. *Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun.* 157:87.
12. Stuehr, D.J., and C.F. Nathan. 1989. Nitric oxide: a macrophage product responsible for cytostasis and respiratory inhibition in tumor target cells. *J. Exp. Med.* 169:1543.
13. Nathan, C.F., and J.B. Hibbs, Jr. 1991. Role of nitric oxide synthesis in macrophage antimicrobial activity. *Curr. Opin. Immunol.* 3:65.
14. Liew, F.Y., and F.E.G. Cox. 1991. Nonspecific defense mechanisms: the role of nitric oxide. *Immunology Today.* 12:A17.
15. Goldberg, M., L.S. Belkowski, and B.R. Bloom. 1990. Regulation of macrophage function by interferon-γ. *J. Clin. Invest.* 85:563.
16. Rook, G.A.W., B.R. Champion, J. Steele, A.M. Varey, and J.L. Stanford. 1985. I-A restricted activation by T cell lines of antimycobacterial activity in murine macrophages. *Clin. Exp. Immunol.* 59:414.
17. Chen, J., T. Fujiwara, P.J. Brennan, M. McNeil, S.J. Turco, J.-C. Sibille, M. Snapper, P. Aisen, and B.R. Bloom. 1989. Microbial glycolipids: possible virulence factors that scavenger oxygen radicals. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA.* 86:2453.
18. Green, L.C., D.A. Wagner, J.A. Glogowski, P.L. Skipper, J.S. Wishnok, and S.R. Tannenbaum. 1982. Analysis of nitrite, nitrate, and [15N]-nitrate in biological fluids. *Anal. Biochem.* 126:131.
19. De la Harpe, J., and C.F. Nathan. 1985. A semi-automated micro-assay for H2O2 release by human blood monocytes and mouse peritoneal macrophages. *J. Immunol. Methods.* 78:323.
20. Denis, M. 1991. Interferon-gamma-treated murine macrophages inhibit growth of tubercle bacilli via the generation of reactive nitrogen intermediates. *Cell. Immunol.* 132:150.
21. Olken, N.M., K.M. Rusche, M.K. Richards, and M.A. Marletta. 1991. Inactivation of macrophage nitric oxide synthesis activity by N6-methyl-L-arginine. *Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun.* 177:828.
22. Jackett, P.S., V.R. Aber, and D.B. Lowrie. 1978. Virulence and resistance to superoxide, low pH and hydrogen peroxide among strains of Mycobacterium tuberculosis. J. Gen. Microbiol. 104:37.

23. Lowrie, D.R., and P.W. Andrew. 1988. Macrophage antimycobacterial mechanisms. Br. Med. Bull. 44:624.

24. Shank, J.L., J.H. Silliker, and R.H. Harper. 1962. The effect of nitric oxide on bacteria. Appl. Microbiol. 10:185.

25. Stuehr, D.J., and M.A. Marletta. 1987. Induction of nitrite/nitrate synthesis in murine macrophages by BCG infection, lymphokines, or interferon-γ. J. Immunol. 139:518.

26. Stuehr, D.J., and M.A. Marletta. 1987. Synthesis of nitrite and nitrate in murine macrophage cell lines. Cancer Res. 47:5590.

27. Ding, A.H., C.F. Nathan, and D.J. Stuehr. 1988. Release of reactive nitrogen intermediates and reactive oxygen intermediates from mouse peritoneal macrophages. J. Immunol. 141:2407.

28. Kaufmann, S.H.E., M.E. Munk, T. Koga, U. Steinhoff, A. Wänd-Wuttenberger, A.J. Gatrill, I. Flesch, and B. Schoel. 1989. Effector T cells in bacterial infections. In Progress in Immunology. F. Melchers et al., editors. Springer-Verlag, Berlin. 963-970.

29. Bermudez, L.E., L.S. Young, and S. Gupta. 1990. 1,25 dihydroxyvitamin D3-dependent inhibition of growth or killing of Mycobacterium avium complex in human macrophages is mediated by TNF and GM-CSF. Cell. Immunol. 127:432.

30. Moreno, C., J. Taverne, A. Mehlert, C.A.W. Bate, R.J. Brealey, A. Meager, G.A.W. Rook, and J.H. Playfair. 1989. Lipoarabinomannan from Mycobacterium tuberculosis induces the production of tumour necrosis factor from human and murine macrophages. Clin. Exp. Immunol. 76:240.

31. Green, L.C., K.R. De Luzuriaga, D.A. Wagner, W. Rand, N. Istfan, V.R. Young, and S.R. Tannenbaum. 1981. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 79:7764.

32. Stuehr, D.J., and M.A. Marletta. 1985. Mammalian nitrate biosynthesis: Mouse macrophages produce nitrite and nitrate in response to Escherichia coli lipopolysaccharide. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 82:7738.

33. Ignarro, L.J. 1981. Signal transduction mechanisms involving nitric oxide. Biochem. Pharmacol. 41:485.

34. Marletta, M.A., M.A. Tayeh, and J.M. Hevel. 1990. Unraveling the biological significance of nitric oxide. Biofactors. 2:219.

35. Adams, L.B., S.G. Franzblau, Z. Varrin, J.B. Hibbs, Jr., and J.L. Krehnubuhl. 1991. L-arginine-dependent macrophage effector functions inhibit metabolic activity of Mycobacterium leprae. J. Immunol. 147:1642.

36. Flesch, I.E.A., and S.H.E. Kaufmann. 1991. Mechanisms involved in mycobacterial growth inhibition by gamma-interferon activated bone marrow macrophages: role of reactive nitrogen intermediates. Infect. Immun. 59:3213.

37. Collins, F.M. 1980. Killing intracellular mycobacteria: dogmas and realities. 5th forum in microbiology. Res. Microbiol. 141:265.

38. Rook, G.A.W. 1990. Killing intracellular mycobacteria: dogmas and realities. 5th forum in microbiology. Res. Microbiol. 141:267.

39. Tarr, H.L.A. 1941. Bacteriostatic action of nitrites. Nature (Lond.). 147:417.

40. Castellani, A.G., and C.F. Niven, Jr. 1955 Factors affecting the bacteriostatic action of sodium nitrite. Appl. Microbiol. 3:154.

41. Okumura, S., and B. Poole. 1978. Fluorescence probe measurement of the intralysosomal pH in living cells and the perturbation of pH by various agents. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 75:3327.

42. Youmans, G.P. 1979. Experimental Models of Tuberculous Disease. Charles C. Thomas Publisher, Springfield, IL. 662-711.

43. Rich, A.R. 1951. The Pathogenesis of Tuberculosis. Charles C. Thomas Publisher, Springfield, IL. 662-711.

44. Youmans, G.P. 1979. Experimental Models of Tuberculous Disease. In Tuberculosis. W.B. Saunders Company, Philadelphia, PA. 334–340.

45. Schlesinger, L.S., C.G. Bellinger-Kawahara, N.R. Payne, and M.A. Horwitz. 1990. Phagocytosis of mycobacteria tuberculosis is mediated by human monocyte complement receptors and complement component C3. J. Immunol. 144:2771.

46. Neill, M.A., and S.J. Klebanoff. 1988. The effect of phenolic glycolipid-I from Mycobacterium leprae on the antimicrobial activity of human macrophages. J. Exp. Med. 167:30.

47. Chan, J., X.-D. Fan, S.W. Hunter, P.J. Brennan, and B.R. Bloom. 1991. Lipoarabinomannan, a possible virulence factor involved in persistence of Mycobacterium tuberculosis within macrophages. Infect. Immun. 59:1775.

48. Blough, N.V., and O.C. Zafiriou. 1985. Reaction of superoxide with nitric oxide to form peroxynitrite in alkaline aqueous solution. Inorg. Chem. 24:3502.

49. Gryglewski, R.J., R.M.J. Palmer, and S. Moncada. 1986. Superoxide anion is involved in the breakdown of endothelium-derived vascular relaxing factor. Nature (Lond.). 320:454.