Detection of rabies virus antigen in brain tissue of dogs slaughtered for human consumption in Taraba State, Nigeria

AB Tirmidhi¹, HM Kazeem², A Jibril², BM Jahun³ & O Orakpoghenor⁴*

¹. Department of Animal Science, Taraba State University, Jalingo, Nigeria
². Department of Veterinary Microbiology, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria
³. Veterinary Teaching Hospital, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria
⁴. Department of Veterinary Pathology, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria

*Correspondence: Tel.: +234 7067522037; E-mail: ochuko.orakpoghenor@gmail.com

Abstract
Rabies as an ancient zoonosis constitutes a threat to public health by causing over 59,000 annual human mortalities worldwide. The aim of this study was to detect rabies virus in brain tissue of dogs slaughtered for human consumption in Taraba State, Nigeria. A total of 150 dogs comprising 136 adults and 14 puppies consisting of 82 males and 68 females was sampled from slaughter points in five Local Government Areas. Brain samples were collected from each dog in labeled sterile sample bottles and screened for rabies virus antigen using direct fluorescent antibody test (DFAT). Results showed that 3 out of the 150 (2%) brain samples screened were positive for rabies virus; out of which 2 were from Unguwan Kasa (14.3%) and 1 was from Quarter Five (7.1%). This therefore suggests the presence of rabies virus in dogs slaughtered for human consumption in Taraba State, Nigeria and their role as reservoirs of the virus. Therefore, there is need for awareness education on safe handling of dog meat to minimize the risk for butchers/meat handlers.

Keywords: Brain samples, dogs, Prevalence, Rabies, Taraba State

Introduction
Rabies is a viral encephalomyelitis transmitted to humans following exposure to infected mammals, mainly dogs, through bites, scratches or licks on damaged skin or mucous membranes (Léchenne et al., 2016). However, transmission of rabies through solid organ transplantation has been reported (Zhang et al., 2018). The disease is caused by a neurotropic virus of the genus Lyssavirus of the family Rhabdoviridae, and is transmissible to all mammals including humans (Shankar, 2009). Following infection, the virus migrates along neural pathways into the central nervous system (brain). From the brain, it travels centrifugally to the peripheral and autonomic nervous systems, eventually migrating to the glands and organs (Zhou et al., 2016). It is widespread in African domestic dogs and certain wild canine populations (Bingham, 2005). This disease represents a global public health concern, causing an
estimate of 59,000 human deaths per year, mainly in low income countries (Leung et al., 2007; Hampson et al., 2015). The limited control measures in many countries and lack of governmental concern make the disease a neglected tropical disease (Knobel et al., 2005; Hampson et al., 2015). The burden of rabies is influenced by age-related and socioeconomic factors: rabies is most commonly reported in children below 15 years of age and in poor and low-income people that have no access to treatment facilities (Sudarshan et al., 2007). Control of rabies in the animal reservoirs (domestic dogs) is the only means to disrupt the transmission cycle of the disease and to eliminate both dog and human rabies cases in the world (Cleaveland et al., 2006; Zinsstag et al., 2009).

It has been reported that apparently healthy dogs harbour and excrete the virus in Nigeria (Baba, 2006; Aliyu et al., 2010). These healthy carrier dogs are sometimes slaughtered and consumed by humans, thus creating a potential risk of transmission of the virus (Baba, 2006). There are also reports of previously vaccinated dogs coming down with rabies in some parts of Nigeria (Okoh, 2000). Dog bite cases by apparently healthy dogs and other dogs in Taraba State of Nigeria have become common (TSSHMR, 2014). The consumption of dog meat by humans is a common practice in Taraba State and many parts of Nigeria, and the public health implication of this practice is yet to be fully assessed (Ameh et al., 2014). Therefore, the aim of this study was to determine the prevalence of rabies virus in apparently healthy dogs slaughtered for meat in Taraba State, Nigeria.

Materials and Methods

Study area
The study was conducted in some selected dog markets/slaughter points in Taraba state, North-Eastern Nigeria. The state lies between latitudes 6°25’N and 9°30’N and between longitudes 9°30’E and 11°45’E (Taraba State Ministry of Land and Survey, 2005). It has 16 Local Government Areas with land mass of 55,920.00 sq. km, population of 2,300,736 people and population density of 54 per sq. km (Taraba State Ministry of Land and Survey, 2005).

Sample size determination
The sample size for the study was calculated using the formula of Mahajan (1997).

\[ N = \frac{Z^2pq}{d^2} \]

Where \( N = \) Sample
\( Z = \) the appropriate value from the desired confidence (1.96)
\( p = \) expected prevalence
\( d = \) Allowable error

Using relative prevalence of 7.98 % from previous study by Ameh et al. (2014)

\[ N = 1.96^2 \times 0.0798 \times (1-0.0798) / 0.05^2 \]
\[ N = 112.8 \]

In order to increase the chances of detecting the antigen, 150 dog brain samples were collected.

Dog sampling
Convenience sampling method was used to select 5 Local Government Areas (Jalingo, Ardo Kola, Gassol Bali and Takum) for this study based on the availability of existing dog markets/slaughter points. The criteria used for the selection of the dog markets/dog slaughter slabs (points) included in the study were the metropolitan and/or heterogenous nature of the towns taken for the study, the recognized dog markets with the availability of a good number of slaughtered dogs of at least 6 per market day being brought from all over the state, the understanding and consent of slaughter points owners, owners of the dogs, and cooperation and participation of the butchers. Simple random sampling technique was employed to select slaughtered dogs intended for human consumption from the aforementioned sampling units over a period of three consecutive months (July to October, 2014).

Specimen collection
Prior to slaughter, the age, sex, breed and vaccination history were obtained and recorded. A total of 150 dog brain tissue samples were collected as described by Barrat and Blancou (1988) from dog slaughter points in the five Local Government Areas of Taraba State, Nigeria. The brainstem was obtained by inserting a straw through the occipital foramen, placed in pre-labelled sample bottles and stored at -20°C in a small Hisense® freezer and later transferred to -80°C freezers in the National Veterinary Research Institute (NVRI) Vom, Plateau State Nigeria.

Rabies virus antigen detection
The brain samples were subjected to the direct fluorescent antibody test (DFAT) for the presence of RABV antigens as described by Dean et al. (1996) at the National Veterinary Research Institute (NVRI) Vom, Plateau State, Nigeria. This was performed using monoclonal fluorescein isothiocyanate-labeled anti-rabies virus antibodies (FITC) (Fujirebio Diagnostics Inc., Malvern, Pennslyvania PA USA) and polyclonal antibody-conjugate (Bio-Rad, Australia).
The results were recorded based on the specific aggregates of rabies virus antigen detection (as apple green fluorescence) using fluorescence microscope.

Results
From the 150 local dogs sampled, 136 were adults while 14 were puppies; 82 were males while 68 were females. Using direct fluorescent antibody test (DFAT), 3 (from adult male dogs) out of the 150 (2%) brain samples collected and screened showed an apple green fluorescence (Figures 1a and 1b) for the two conjugates, hence were positive for rabies virus. Out of the 3 positive samples, 2 were from Unguwan Kasa (14.3%) and 1 was from Quarter Five (7.1%) (Table 1).

![Figure 1a: DFAT negative test sample showing no apple green fluorescence indicating rabies negative sample](image1)

![Figure 1b: DFAT positive test sample showing apple green fluorescence indicating rabies positive sample](image2)

Discussion
A total of 150 dog brain samples from apparently healthy local dogs were collected and examined by DFAT from 11 dog markets/slaughter points in the 3 Senatorial districts of Taraba State, Nigeria. The 2% dog brain samples positive for rabies antigen by DFAT is lower than 7.98% by Ameh et al. (2014) in Wukari Metropolis, Taraba State; 31 % by Ajayi et al. (2006) in Maiduguri Borno State; 43 % by Sabo (2009) in Plateau State; 44% by Aliyu et al. (2010) in Yola Adamawa State; 7.0% by Otolorin et al. (2014) in Aba, Abia State. The lower prevalence reported in this study could be due to the lower number of dogs sampled and the short time duration of sampling (3 months). Also, since only the brainstem was collected, the detection of the antigen could possibly be decreased hence, the lower prevalence. Dogs are

| Location               | No. sampled | Age (adult/puppy) | Sex (male/female) | Breed (local/exotic) | DFAT positive | DFAT rate (%) |
|------------------------|-------------|-------------------|-------------------|----------------------|---------------|---------------|
| Unguwan Kasa           | 14          | 12/2              | 6/8               | 14/0                 | 2             | 14.3          |
| Gidan Yazawa           | 14          | 13/1              | 5/9               | 14/0                 | 0             | 0.0           |
| Mile Six               | 14          | 14/0              | 8/6               | 14/0                 | 0             | 0.0           |
| ATC Bye-pass           | 14          | 12/2              | 9/5               | 14/0                 | 0             | 0.0           |
| ATC Kofai Matai        | 13          | 12/1              | 6/8               | 13/0                 | 0             | 0.0           |
| Opp Tsokwa Lodge       | 13          | 13/0              | 9/4               | 13/0                 | 0             | 0.0           |
| Quarter Five           | 14          | 12/2              | 7/7               | 14/0                 | 1             | 7.1           |
| Ada Barracks           | 14          | 11/3              | 8/6               | 14/0                 | 0             | 0.0           |
| Unguwan Mummuye        | 13          | 11/2              | 7/6               | 13/0                 | 0             | 0.0           |
| Unguwan Dorawa         | 13          | 13/0              | 9/4               | 13/0                 | 0             | 0.0           |
| ATC Kasuwan Bera       | 14          | 13/1              | 8/5               | 13/0                 | 0             | 0.0           |
| **Total**              | **150**     | **136/14**        | **82/68**         | **150/0**            | **3**         | **2.0**       |

The rabies positive brain samples were from adult male dogs.
bred from Plateau and Kaduna States and sold out to buyers from different part of the country including Taraba State of Nigeria. The detection of rabies virus antigen in these dogs in Taraba State was not uncommon as they were probably never vaccinated. Also, these dogs were brought from different part of the state and country with no vaccination records. Apparently healthy dogs are dogs that present no clinical characteristics of rabies such as lethargy, lack of appetite, agitation and anxiety on physical examination. However, they have been demonstrated to be reservoirs of rabies virus in China as reported by Lu et al. (2006) and Zhang et al. (2008). These dogs could bite humans and other dogs thus posing a great danger to the populace as their vaccination status cannot be ascertained. Human rabies deaths due to transmission of rabies through handling and skinning of infected carcasses and subsequent consumption of raw meat had been documented in Asia (Tariq et al., 1991; Hu et al., 2009). This indicated that dogs slaughtered for human consumption could be a source of infection to dog handlers and butchers as most of the individuals involved in dog meat processing do not utilize personal protective equipment. Also, the method of slaughter predisposes these dog meat processors to bites from dogs during handling.

In conclusion, rabies virus antigen was detected in slaughtered apparently healthy local dogs in Taraba State, Nigeria. To the best of our knowledge, this finding confirms the presence of rabies virus in apparently healthy dogs slaughtered for meat consumption in Taraba State, Nigeria. Further studies on the isolation, characterization and virulence of this virus should be carried out in this area. Therefore, implementation of measures to enhance prompt and adequate screening and vaccination of dogs should be intensified whether for human consumption or not. There is also need for awareness education on the risk and danger of rabies to dog handlers, butchers and consumers of dog meat.

Acknowledgement
We are deeply grateful to the dog owners and handlers for granting us access to the animals.

Conflicts of Interest
The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References
Ajayi BB, Rabo JS & Baba SS (2006). Rabies in apparently healthy dogs: Histological and immunological studies. The Nigerian Postgraduate Medical Journal, 12(2): 128-134.

Aliyu TB, De N, Yenda EN & Lynn M (2010). Prevalence of rabies virus antigens in apparently healthy dogs in Yola, Nigeria. Researcher, 2(2): 1-14.

Ameh VO, Dzikwi AA & Umoh JU (2014). Assessment of knowledge, attitude and practice of dog owners to canine rabies in Wukari Metropolis, Taraba State Nigeria. Global Journal of Health Science, 6(5): 226-240.

Baba SS (2006). Detection of rabies virus RNA and antigen in tissues from naturally infected Nigerian dogs; In situ hybridization and immunohistochemical studies. Revue d’Elevage et de Medecine Veterinaire des Pays Tropicaux, 52(3): 85-91.

Barrat J & Blancou J (1988). Simplified technique for the collection, storage and shipment of brain specimens for rabies diagnosis. WHO/Rabies Research/88.27, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland.

Bingham J (2005). Canine rabies ecology in Southern Africa. Emerging Infectious Diseases, 11(9): 1337-1342.

Cleaveland S, Kaare M, Knobel D & Laurenson MK (2006). Canine vaccination providing broader benefits for disease control. Veterinary Microbiology, 117(1): 43-50.

Dean DJ, Abelseth MK & Atanasiu P (1996) The fluorescent antibody test. In: Laboratory Techniques in Rabies. (FX Meslin, MM Kaplan, H Koprowski, editors). World Health Organization, Geneva. Pp 88-95.

Hampson K, Couddeville L, Lembo T, Sambo M, Kieffer A, Attlan M, Barrat J, Blanton JD, Briggs DJ, Cleaveland S & Costa P (2015). Correction: Estimating the global burden of endemic canine rabies. PLOS Neglected Tropical Diseases, 9(5): e0003786.

Hu R, Tang Q, Tang J & Fooks AR (2009). Rabies in China: An update. Vector Borne and Zoonotic Diseases, 9(1): 1-12.

Knobel DL, Cleaveland S, Coleman PG, Fèvre EM, Meltzer MI, Miranda ME, Shaw A, Zinsstag J & Meslin FX (2005). Re-evaluating the burden of rabies in Africa and Asia. Bulletin of World Health Organization, 83(5): 360-368.

Léchenne M, Naisse K, Lepelletier A, Alfaroukh IO, Bourhy H, Zinsstag J & Dacheux L (2016). Validation of a rapid rabies diagnostic tool for field surveillance in
developing countries. *PLoS Neglected Tropical Diseases*, **10**(10): 1-16.

Leung AK, Davies HD & Hon KL (2007). Rabies: Epidemiology, pathogenesis, and prophylaxis. *Advances in Therapy*, **24**(6): 1340-1347.

Lu LQ, Guo JG, Liu Q, Li HM, Yi X, Min Z, Lianbin Z, Bin L & Kai S (2006). Investigation on rabies virus carried by domestic dogs with healthy appearance in Guangxi (English abstract) *Guangxi Agricultural Science*, **37**(1): 88-89.

Mahajan BK (1997). *Methods in Biostatistics for Medical Students and Research Workers*. Sixth edition. Jaypee Brothers Medical Publishers Ltd, India. Pp 88-94.

Okoh AEJ (2000). Antigenic characterization of rabies virus from vaccinated dogs in Plateau State, Nigeria. *Veterinary Research Communications*, **24**(3): 203-211.

Otolorin GR, Umoh JU & Dzikwi AA (2014). Prevalence of rabies antigen in brain tissue of dogs slaughtered for human consumption and evaluation of vaccination of dogs against rabies in Aba, Abia State Nigeria. *World Journal of Public Health Sciences*, **3**(1): 5-10.

Sabo GK (2009). The Role of Dog Trade in The Epidemiologyof Rabies in Plateau State of Nigeria. MSc Thesis, Department of Veterinary Public Health and Preventive Medicine, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria. Pp 13-50.

Shankar BP (2009). Advances in diagnosis of rabies. *Veterinary World*, **2**(2): 74-78.

Sudarshan MK, Madhusudana SN, Mahendra BJ, Rao NSN, Narayana DHA, Rahman SA, Meslin FX, Lobo D & Ravikumar K (2007). Assessing the burden of human rabies in India: Results of a national multi-center epidemiological survey. *International Journal of Infectious Diseases*, **11**(3): 29-35.

Taraba State Ministry of Land and Survey (2005). Administrative Map of Taraba State. Devang Nigeria Limited.

Tariq WUZ, Shafi MS, Jamal S & Ahmad M (1991). Rabies in man handling infected calf (Letter). *Lancet*, **337**(8751): 12-24.

TSSHMR (2014). Taraba Specialist Hospital Medical Review.

Zhang J, Lin J, Tian Y, Ma L, Sun W, Zhang L, Zhu Y, Qiu W & Zhang L (2018). Transmission of rabies through solid organ transplantation: A notable problem in China. *BMC Infectious Diseases*, **18**(1): 273-281.

Zhang Y., Fu ZF, Wang DM, Zhou JZ, Wang ZX, Lv TF, Xiong CL, Zou Y, Yao WR, Li MH, Dong GM, Xu GL, Niezgoda M, Kuzmin I & Rupprecht CE (2008). Investigation of the role of healthy dogs as potential carriers of rabies virus. *Vector Borne Zoonotic Diseases*, **8**(3): 313–319.

Zhou H, Li Y, Chen R, Tao X, Yu P, Cao S, Li L, Chen ZH, Zhu WY & Yin WW (2016). Technical guideline for human rabies prevention and control. *Chinese Journal of Epidemiology*, **37**(2): 139-163.

Zinsstag J, Durr S, Penny MA, Mindekem R, Roth F, Gonzalez SM, Naissengar S & Hattendorf J (2009). Transmission dynamics and economics of rabies control in dogs and humans in an African city. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science of the United States of America*, **106**(35): 14996–15001.