A SIMPLE CONSTRUCTION FOR A CLASS OF $p$-GROUPS
WITH ALL OF THEIR AUTOMORPHISMS CENTRAL

A. CARANTI

ABSTRACT. We exhibit a simple construction, based on elementary linear algebra, for a class of examples of finite $p$-groups of nilpotence class 2 all of whose automorphisms are central.

1. Introduction

In June 2014, Marc van Leeuwen [vL14] inquired on Mathematics Stack Exchange whether there is a group $P$ with an element $a \in P$ such that there is no automorphism of $P$ taking $a$ to its inverse.

In our answer, we noted that an example was provided by any of the many constructions in the literature [HL74, JK75, Ear75, Hei80, CL82, Car83, Car85, Mor94, Mor95] of finite $p$-groups of nilpotence class two in which all automorphisms are central, for $p$ an odd prime. For, if $P$ is such a group, and $a \in P \setminus Z(P)$, then an image of $a$ under automorphisms is of the form $az$, with $z \in Z(P)$. If $az = a^{-1}$, then $a^2 \in Z(P)$, and thus $a \in Z(P)$, as $p$ is odd.

Marc van Leuween commented that “indeed giving a concrete example is not so easy”. This made us realize that examples of finite $p$-groups in which all automorphisms are central, although not conceptually difficult, usually rely on a fair amount of calculations with generators and relations. The goal of this paper is to give a class of examples of such groups for which calculations can be kept to a minimum, whereas a central role is played by linear algebra.

The examples are based on one of the cases of [Car83, Section 4]. They are constructed according to the linear algebra techniques employed in [HL74, DH75, Car83, GPS11] as described in [Car13], which we review in Section 2. The examples themselves are presented in Section 3, while in Section 4 we mention an extension to endomorphisms.

2. Preliminaries

Let $P$ be a group. Since the centre $Z(P)$ is a characteristic subgroup of $P$, there is a natural morphism $\mathrm{Aut}(P) \to \mathrm{Aut}(P/Z(P))$ whose kernel $\mathrm{Aut}_e(P)$ consists of

\begin{itemize}
  \item Date: 8 July 2014, 12:47 CEST — Version 2.03.
  \item 2010 Mathematics Subject Classification. 20D15 20D45.
  \item Key words and phrases. finite $p$-groups, automorphisms, central automorphisms, endomorphisms.
  \item The author gratefully acknowledges the support of the Department of Mathematics, University of Trento. The author is a member of GNSAGA—Indam.
\end{itemize}
the central automorphisms of $P$, that is, those automorphisms of $P$ that take every $a \in P$ to an element of $aZ(P)$.

We review the setup of [Car13]. Let $V$ be a vector space of dimension $n + 1$ over the field $F = GF(p)$, where $p$ is a prime. Let $W = \Lambda^2 V$ be the exterior square of $V$. If $f : V \to W$ is a linear map, we will consider the group $G$ of the elements of $GL(V)$ that commute with $f$,

$$G = \{ g \in GL(V) : (vg)f = (vf)\hat{g}, \text{ for all } v \in V \} ,$$

where $\hat{g}$ is the automorphism of $W$ induced by $g$. Note that we write maps on the right, so our vectors are row vectors.

Choose now a basis $v_0, v_1, \ldots, v_n$ of $V$, and the corresponding basis $v_j \wedge v_k$ of $W$, for $j < k$. Write $f$ in coordinates, that is,

$$v_i f = \sum_{j < k} a_{i,j,k} \cdot v_j \wedge v_k .$$

If $p$ is odd, we can construct a finite $p$-group $P$ via the following presentation

$$P = \langle x_0, x_1, \ldots, x_n : [x_i, x_j, x_k] = 1 \text{ for all } i, j, k ,$$

$$x_i^p = \prod_{j < k} [x_j, x_k]^{a_{i,j,k}} \text{ for all } i ,$$

$$[x_i, x_j]^p = 1 \text{ for all } i, j \rangle .$$

Note that here the third line of relations follows from the first two. In fact the first two lines of relations say that commutators and $p$-th powers of generators are central, so that we have $1 = [x_i^p, x_j] = [x_i, x_j]^p$, as $x_i$ commutes with $[x_i, x_j]$.

We have that $P$ is a group of nilpotence class two and order $|P| = p^{n+1} \binom{n+1}{2}$, with $P' = \Phi(P) = Z(P)$ of order $p^{\binom{n+1}{2}}$, $P/P'$ of order $p^{n+1}$. Moreover $P^p$ has order $p^{\dim(V)}$.

If $p = 2$, we appeal to an idea of Zurek [Zur82], and modify (2.2) replacing $p$-th powers of generators with 4-th powers. The presentation thus becomes

$$P = \langle x_0, x_1, \ldots, x_n : [x_i, x_j, x_k] = 1 \text{ for all } i, j, k ,$$

$$x_i^4 = \prod_{j < k} [x_j, x_k]^{a_{i,j,k}} \text{ for all } i ,$$

$$[x_i, x_j]^2 = 1 \text{ for all } i, j \rangle .$$

Here we have $|P| = 2^{2(n+1) + \binom{n+1}{2}}$, $P'$ has order $2^{\binom{n+1}{2}}$, $P/P'$ has order $2^{2(n+1)}$, $P^4$ has order $2^{\dim(V)}$, and $P' \leq \Phi(P) = Z(P)$. This time, the relations $[x_i, x_j]^2 = 1$ are necessary.

Now it is shown in [Car13 Section 3] that

**Theorem 2.1.** In the notation above,

$$\text{Aut}(P)/\text{Aut}_c(P) \cong G .$$

The point of this, as explained in [Car13], is that for an automorphism $g$ of $P/Z(P) = P/\Phi(P)$ to be induced by an automorphism of $P$, one needs $g$ to preserve the $p$-th (respectively, 4-th) power relations, that is, the linear map $f$. 
3. The examples

We will now construct a class of linear maps \( f \), as in the previous Section, for which the group \( G \) of \((2.1)\) is \( \{1\} \). According to Theorem \((2.1)\), this will provide examples of finite \( p \)-groups \( P \) of nilpotence class 2 with \( \text{Aut}(P) = \text{Aut}_c(P) \).

Let \( V \) be a vector space of dimension \( n + 1 \geq 4 \) over \( F = \text{GF}(p) \), where \( p \) is a prime. Fix a basis \( v_0, v_1, \ldots, v_n \) of \( V \), and let
\[
U = \langle v_1, \ldots, v_n \rangle.
\]

On the exterior square \( W = \Lambda^2 V \), consider a basis which begins with
\[
v_0 \wedge v_1, v_0 \wedge v_2, \ldots, v_0 \wedge v_n,
\]
and continues with the \( v_i \wedge v_j \), for \( 1 \leq i < j \leq n \).

We now make our choice for \( f \).

**Assumption 3.1.** Consider the linear map \( f : V \to W \) which, with respect to the given bases, has blockwise matrix
\[
\begin{bmatrix}
b & c \\
A & 0
\end{bmatrix},
\]
where \( b \) is a \( 1 \times n \) vector, \( c \) is a \( 1 \times \binom{n}{2} \) vector, \( A \) is an \( n \times n \) matrix, and \( 0 \) is an \( n \times \binom{n}{2} \) zero matrix. Moreover, we take

- \( b, c \neq 0 \), and
- \( A \) to be the companion matrix \([Jac85\text{ p. 197}]\) of the minimal polynomial \( m \) over \( F \) of a primitive element \( \alpha \) of \( \text{GF}(p^n) \).

We collect a few elementary facts about the matrix \( A \).

**Lemma 3.2.**

1. The roots of \( m \), i.e. the eigenvalues of \( A \), are \( \alpha, \alpha^p, \ldots, \alpha^{p^{n-1}} \).
2. \( A \) has multiplicative order \( p^n - 1 \).
3. \( F[A] \) is a field of order \( p^n \), and \( F[A] = \{ 0 \} \cup \{ A^i : 0 \leq i < p^n - 1 \} \).
4. \( F^n \) is a one-dimensional \( F[A] \)-vector space.
5. The centralizer
\[
C_{\text{End}(F^n)}(A)
\]
of \( A \) in \( \text{End}(F^n) \) is \( F[A] \).

**Proof.**

1. follows from the fact that \( \alpha \) is a root of \( m \), and \( m \) is irreducible in \( F[x] \), of degree \( n \).
2. follows immediately from the previous point.
3. follows from \( F[A] \cong F[x]/(m) \), and (2).
4. follows from the fact that \( A \) is a companion matrix, and thus \( F^n \) is a cyclic \( F[A] \)-module.
(5) now follows from the previous point, as the given centralizer is the ring of
endomorphisms of the $\mathbf{F}[A]$-vector space $\mathbf{F}^n$.

We now collect a few facts about $f$ and the group $G$ of (2.1).

**Lemma 3.3.**

1. $f$ is injective.
2. $U f = v_0 \wedge V = v_0 \wedge U$, and this is a subspace of $W$ of dimension $n$.
3. If $u \in U$ satisfies $u \wedge V \leq V f$, then $u = 0$.
4. $(v_0) = \{ x \in V : x \wedge V \leq V f \}$.
5. $(v_0)$ is left invariant by $G$.
6. $U = \{ x \in V : x f \in v_0 \wedge V \}$.
7. $U$ is left invariant by $G$.

**Proof.** (1) follows from Assumption 3.1, since $A$ is invertible, and $c \neq 0$ in (3.1).

The formula of (2) now follows from the shape of the matrix for $f$ in Assumption 3.1.

To prove (3), let $u = c_1 v_1 + \cdots + c_n v_n$ satisfy $u \wedge V \leq V f$. We will show that $c_1 = 0$, but a similar argument yields that all $c_i$ have to be zero. Let us look at the coordinates of $u \wedge v_2$ and $u \wedge v_3$ with respect to $v_1 \wedge v_2$ and $v_1 \wedge v_3$, which yield the $2 \times 2$ matrix

\[
\begin{bmatrix}
c_1 & 0 \\
0 & c_1
\end{bmatrix}
\]

By (1) and (2), the dimension of $V f/U f = V f/(v_0 \wedge V)$ is 1. Thus this matrix must have rank at most 1, so that $c_1^2 = 0$.

To prove (4), let $0 \neq x \in V$ be such that $x \wedge V \leq V f$. By (3), $x = c v_0 + u$, for some $c \neq 0$, and $u \in U$. But then by (2) $u \wedge V \leq V f$, so that $u = 0$ again by (3).

(5) follows from the previous point.

(6) follows from (1) and (2), and implies (7), because of (5).

(Note that the argument in the proof of (3) fails when $n = 2$, see [DH75], and this is the reason we have taken $n + 1 \geq 4$.)

We can now state our main result.

**Theorem 3.4.** With $f$ as in Assumption 3.1, the group $G$ of (2.1) is $\{ 1 \}$.

**Proof.** (5) and (7) of Lemma 3.3 allow us to write an element $g \in G$ in matrix form, with respect to the given basis of $V$, as

\[
g = \begin{bmatrix}
\gamma & 0 \\
0 & \Delta
\end{bmatrix}
\]

where $\gamma \in \mathbf{F}^*$, and $\Delta \in \text{GL}(n, \mathbf{F})$. By the definition (2.1) of $G$, and Assumption 3.1 we have

\[
\begin{bmatrix}
\gamma & 0 \\
0 & \Delta
\end{bmatrix}
\begin{bmatrix}
b & c \\
A & 0
\end{bmatrix}
= \begin{bmatrix}
b & c \\
A & 0
\end{bmatrix}
\begin{bmatrix}
\gamma \Delta & 0 \\
0 & \Delta
\end{bmatrix},
\]

where $\hat{\Delta}$ is the matrix induced by $\Delta$ on $U \wedge U$. We will only need consider the following two consequences of (3.2)
\begin{align}
\Delta A \Delta^{-1} &= \gamma A, \\
\text{and} \quad b\Delta &= b.
\end{align}

To deal with (3.3), we could appeal to [Wal80], but prefer to give a simple direct argument. As noted in Lemma 3.2(1), the eigenvalues of $A$ are
\begin{align}
\alpha, \alpha^p, \ldots, \alpha^{p^{n-1}},
\end{align}
with $\alpha$ a primitive element, so that those of $\gamma A$ are
\begin{align}
\gamma \alpha, \gamma \alpha^p, \ldots, \gamma \alpha^{p^{n-1}}.
\end{align}
By (3.3) we have $\gamma \alpha = \alpha^{p^t}$ for some $t$. If $t > 0$, then
\begin{align}
\alpha^{p^t-1} = \gamma \in \text{GF}(p)^*,
\end{align}
with $p^t - 1 > 0$, so that the order
\begin{align}
\frac{p^n - 1}{p - 1} = 1 + p + \cdots + p^{n-1}
\end{align}
of $\alpha$ in $\text{GF}(p^n)^*/\text{GF}(p)^*$ divides $p^t - 1 < p^{n-1}$, a contradiction. Thus $t = 0$ and $\gamma = 1$.

It follows that $\Delta$ is in the centralizer of $A$ in $\text{GL}(n, \mathbf{F})$, and thus, according to Lemma 3.2 $\Delta$ is a power of $A$.

But once more since the eigenvalues of $A$ are as in (3.5), with $\alpha$ a primitive element, the only power of $A$ to have an eigenvalue 1 is 1. Since we have (3.4), with $b \neq 0$ by Assumption 3.1, we obtain that $\Delta = 1$ and thus $G = \{1\}$ as claimed. \hfill \Box

4. ENDOMORPHISMS

The arguments of the previous Section can be slightly extended to show that the set
\begin{align}
G = \{ g \in \text{End}(V) : (vg)f = (vf)\hat{g}, \text{ for all } v \in V \}
\end{align}
of the endomorphisms of $V$ that commute with $f$ consists of 0 and 1. Now in our examples $P$ the centre $Z(P)$ is fully invariant, as it equals $\Phi(P)$, and thus an immediate extension of Theorem 2.1 yields that an endomorphism of $P$ either maps $P$ into $Z(P)$, or is a central automorphism, so that $P$ is an E-group [Fau71, Mal77, Mal80, Car85, CFdG87], that is, a group in which each element commutes with all of its images under endomorphisms.

To prove this, we proceed as in the previous Section, except that we make no assumptions on $\gamma$ and $\Delta$. We have from (3.2)
\begin{align}
\Delta A = \gamma A\Delta.
\end{align}
If $\gamma = 0$, then $\Delta = 0$. If $\gamma \neq 0$, it follows from (4.1) that $\ker(\Delta)$ is $A$-invariant, that is, a $\mathbf{F}[A]$-vector subspace of the one-dimensional $\mathbf{F}[A]$-vector space $\mathbf{F}^n$. Therefore
we have either $\ker(\Delta) = \{0\}$, that is, $\Delta$ is invertible, and we proceed as above, or $\ker(\Delta) = F^n$, that is, $\Delta = 0$. Now (3.2) yields $\gamma b = 0$, a contradiction to $\gamma \neq 0$ and $b \neq 0$.

**References**

[Car83] A. Caranti, *Automorphism groups of $p$-groups of class 2 and exponent $p^2$: a classification on 4 generators*, Ann. Mat. Pura Appl. (4) **134** (1983), 93–146. MR 736737 (85j:20036)

[Car85] ———, *Finite $p$-groups of exponent $p^2$ in which each element commutes with its endomorphic images*, J. Algebra **97** (1985), no. 1, 1–13. MR 812164 (87b:20029)

[Car13] ———, *A module-theoretic approach to abelian automorphism groups*, Israel J. Math. (2013), accepted for publication.

[CFdG87] A. Caranti, S. Franciosi, and F. de Giovanni, *Some examples of infinite groups in which each element commutes with its endomorphic images*, Group theory (Bressanone, 1986), Lecture Notes in Math., vol. 1281, Springer, Berlin, 1987, pp. 9–17. MR 921685 (88m:20067)

[CL82] A. Caranti and P. Legovini, *On finite groups whose endomorphic images are characteristic subgroups*, Arch. Math. (Basel) **38** (1982), no. 5, 388–390. MR 666909 (84b:20022)

[DH75] G. Daues and H. Heineken, *Dualitäten und Gruppen der Ordnung $p^6$*, Geometriae Dedicata **4** (1975), no. 2/3/4, 215–220. MR 0401907 (53 #5733)

[Ear75] B. E. Earnley, *On finite groups whose group of automorphisms is abelian*, Ph.D. thesis, Wayne State University, 1975, Dissertation Abstracts, V. 36, p. 2269 B.

[Fau71] R. Faudree, *Groups in which each element commutes with its endomorphic images*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **27** (1971), 236–240. MR 0269737 (42 #4632)

[GPS11] S. P. Glasby, P. P. Pálfy, and Csaba Schneider, *$p$-groups with a unique proper non-trivial characteristic subgroup*, J. Algebra **348** (2011), 85–109. MR 2852233 (2012j:20059)

[Hei80] Hermann Heineken, *Nilpotente Gruppen, deren sämtliche Normalteiler charakteris sch sind*, Arch. Math. (Basel) **33** (1979/80), no. 6, 497–503. MR 570484 (81h:20023)

[HL74] Hermann Heineken and Hans Liebeck, *The occurrence of finite groups in the automorphism group of nilpotent groups of class 2*, Arch. Math. (Basel) **25** (1974), 8–16. MR 0349844 (50 #2337)

[Jac85] Nathan Jacobson, *Basic algebra. I*, second ed., W. H. Freeman and Company, New York, 1985. MR 780184 (86d:00001)

[JK75] D. Jonah and M. Konvisser, *Some non-abelian $p$-groups with abelian automorphism groups*, Arch. Math. (Basel) **26** (1975), 131–133. MR 0367059 (51 #3301)

[Mal77] J. J. Malone, *More on groups in which each element commutes with its endomorphic images*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **65** (1977), no. 2, 209–214. MR 0447351 (56 #5664)

[Mal80] ———, *A nonabelian 2-group whose endomorphisms generate a ring, and other examples of $E$-groups*, Proc. Edinburgh Math. Soc. (2) **23** (1980), no. 1, 57–59. MR 582023 (81m:20057)

[Mor94] Marta Morigi, *On $p$-groups with abelian automorphism group*, Rend. Sem. Mat. Univ. Padova **92** (1994), 47–58. MR 1320477 (96k:20037)

[Mor95] ———, *On the minimal number of generators of finite non-abelian $p$-groups having an abelian automorphism group*, Comm. Algebra **23** (1995), no. 6, 2045–2065. MR 1327121 (96a:20028)

[vL14] Marc van Leeuwen, *Can a group have a subset that is stable under all automorphisms, but not under inverse?*, Mathematics StackExchange, June 2014, http://goo.gl/l87A5t.
[Wal80] G. E. Wall, *Conjugacy classes in projective and special linear groups*, Bull. Austral. Math. Soc. 22 (1980), no. 3, 339–364. MR 601642 (82d:20041)

[Zur82] Gerhard Zurek, *A comment on a work by H. Heineken and H. Liebeck: “The occurrence of finite groups in the automorphism group of nilpotent groups of class 2” [Arch. Math. (Basel) 25 (1974), 8–16; MR 50 #2337]*, Arch. Math. (Basel) 38 (1982), no. 3, 206–207. MR 656185 (83k:20034)

(A. Caranti) Dipartimento di Matematica, Università degli Studi di Trento, via Sommarive 14, I-38123 Trento, Italy

*E-mail address*: andrea.caranti@unitn.it

*URL*: http://science.unitn.it/~caranti/