An evaluation of genetic causes and environmental risks for bilateral optic atrophy

Andrew T. Chen¹, Lauren Brady¹, Dennis E. Bulman², Arun N. E. Sundaram³, Amadeo R. Rodriguez⁴, Edward Margolin⁵, John S. Waye⁶, Mark A. Tarnopolsky¹(*)

¹ Department of Pediatrics, McMaster University, Hamilton, ON, Canada, ² Children’s Hospital of Eastern Ontario Research Institute, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, ON, Canada, ³ Department of Ophthalmology and Vision Sciences, Sunnybrook Health Sciences Center, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada, ⁴ Department of Ophthalmology, McMaster University, Hamilton, ON, Canada, ⁵ University of Toronto Department of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences, Mount Sinai Hospital, Toronto, ON, Canada, ⁶ Department of Pathology and Molecular Medicine, McMaster University, Hamilton, ON, Canada

☯ These authors contributed equally to this work.
* tarnopol@mcmaster.ca

Abstract

Purpose

To assess the clinical utility of next-generation sequencing (NGS) for the diagnosis of patients with optic atrophy (OA).

Design

Retrospective cohort study.

Methods

97 patients were referred to the McMaster University Medical Center (Hamilton, Ontario) for evaluation of bilateral OA. All patients were sent for NGS including a 22 nuclear gene panel and/or complete mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) sequencing. Positive genetic test results and abnormal vibration sensation were compared in patients +/- environmental exposures or a family history.

Results

19/94 (20.2%) had a positive nuclear variant, of which 15/19 (78.9%) were in the OPA1 gene. No positive mtDNA variants were identified. The detection of a positive genetic variant was significantly different in patients who reported excessive ethanol use, but not in patients who smoke (0/19 (0%) vs. 19/78 (24.4%), P = 0.0164 and 4/22 (18.2%) vs. 15/74 (20.3%), P = 0.829, respectively). Patients with a positive family history were more likely to have a positive genetic variant compared to patients with a negative family history (P = 0.0112). There were significantly more excessive drinkers with an abnormal vibration sensation (P = 0.026), and with a similar trend in smokers (P = 0.074).
Conclusions

All positive genetic variants were identified in nuclear genes. We identified a potential independent pathophysiological link between a history of excessive ethanol consumption and bilateral OA. Further investigations should evaluate and identify potential environmental risk factors for OA.

Introduction

Inherited optic neuropathies are genetic disorders characterized by the slow loss of the retinal ganglion cells (RGCs) and their axons that form the optic nerve [1]. Each optic nerve carries visual information from retinal photoreceptors to the brain. Clinically, patients with inherited optic neuropathies have a distinct presentation: they almost invariably have very symmetric visual loss without the presence of relative afferent pupillary defect which is present in almost all other causes of optic neuropathy and often have characteristic visual field defects (central or cecocentral scotomas). As with any optic neuropathy, optic atrophy (OA) is the end result of the insult affecting an optic nerve and tends to be symmetric in inherited optic neuropathies. It is defined as variable loss of the optic nerve axons and subsequent optic nerve pallor visible on examination with variable deterioration of central visual acuity [2].

The two most common forms of inherited optic neuropathy are autosomal dominant optic atrophy (DOA) secondary to pathogenic variants within \( \text{OPA1} \) (OMIM: 165500), and maternally inherited Leber hereditary optic neuropathy (LHON) (OMIM: 535000) [3]. OPA1 is a ubiquitous GTPase that localizes to the mitochondria and functions in mitochondrial fusion, cristae integrity, and mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) maintenance [4,5]. Three primary mtDNA variants, m.11778G>A, m.3460G>A, and m.14484T>C, account for ~95% of all cases of LHON [6]. All three variants affect complex I subunits of the respiratory chain, resulting in impaired oxidative phosphorylation and increased levels of reactive oxygen species (ROS) [7,8]. Rarer cases of OA can be caused by pathogenic variants in the nuclear-encoded mitochondrial genes such as \( \text{WFS1} \), \( \text{MFN2} \), \( \text{POLG} \), and \( \text{ACO2} \) [9].

DOA typically has an insidious onset during the first two decades of life and presents clinically with an incomplete penetrance and heterogenous clinical expressivity [10]. In contrast, LHON presents with subacute visual loss in one eye followed usually within 1–2 months by visual loss in the opposite eye. Visual loss usually occurs in the second and third decades of life and men are disproportionally affected for reasons that are not entirely clear [11,12]. Powerful molecular diagnostic tools, such as next-generation sequencing (NGS), are now being used in the work-up of individuals who present with optic atrophy.

In addition to hereditary causes, OA may also occur after exposure to environmental factors including: smoking, trauma, industrial toxins, and psychological stress [13]. Some of these exposures can trigger vision loss in LHON mutations [13,14], leading to our hypothesis that other environmental factors such as excessive ethanol use could unmask a potential underlying gene mutation associated with OA. It is well documented that methanol poisoning causes OA [15–17]; however, the excessive consumption of ethanol in association with OA remains unclear either as an independent toxin [18], or a second hit [13,19]. DNA repair pathways may have a role in protecting against DNA damage upon excessive ethanol consumption [20]. Vulnerability of the papillomacular bundle to mitochondrial dysfunction is a likely final etiological common pathway in most cases of OA due to epigenetic disorders [21], and this is further reinforced by the observation that all cases of LHON involve mtDNA genes and most cases of...
OA in association with nuclear mutations occur within genes encoding for mitochondrial proteins.

In this study, NGS was used in the workup of individuals referred to a Canadian neurometabolic clinic for evaluation of OA. Testing included a panel of 22 nuclear genes associated with inherited optic neuropathies as well as sequencing of the entire mitochondrial genome. The main purpose of the current study was to determine the proportion of patients with pathogenic mutations in mtDNA or select nuclear genes associated with optic atrophy. A second aim was to determine whether excessive ethanol use and/or smoking were enriched in the mutation positive (as a trigger or second hit), or negative (independent etiology) patients.

**Methods**

**Patients**

This retrospective chart review involved patients who were assessed at the Neuromuscular and Neurometabolic Clinic in the McMaster University Medical Centre located in Hamilton, Ontario between 2013 and 2019. Approval for the study was obtained by written consent through the Hamilton Integrated Research Ethics Board (Research Ethics Board #2018-5519-C). The Hamilton Integrated Research Ethics Board approved the retrieval of data with knowledge of the identifying information.

All patients were referred for genetic testing after they were first identified by a neuroophthalmologist to have findings of optic nerve pallor or atrophy, with or without visual loss. All but two patients (# 84 and 87 with unilateral OA) had bilateral OA. All patients had a MRI scan of the brain and orbits, and were screened with the testing of vitamin B12, folate, anti-nuclear antibodies, anti-neutrophil cytoplasmic antibodies, angiotensin converting enzyme, syphilis screening, and anti-extractable nuclear antigen, which are the other potential causes of symmetric optic neuropathies. Only patients without a suspected deficiency (i.e. folate, B12) and with no evidence of multiple sclerosis, neuromyelitis optica, or other identified cause for OA were sent for genetic testing. Sixteen patients underwent nuclear DNA sequencing only, three patients underwent mtDNA sequencing only, and 78 patients underwent both. In total, 97 patients who underwent mtDNA and/or nuclear DNA sequencing were reviewed (Fig 1). Patients were referred for mtDNA and/or nuclear DNA genetic sequencing based upon likelihood of variant identification by the referring specialist. Patients were of differing ethnicities and the median age at last evaluation was 38 years. Five patients were children (5.2%) and 92 patients were adults (94.8%). The average age of onset was 28 years (range, 3–79).

Each individual was asked about a family history of vision loss or optic atrophy during their consultation appointment. All patients were classified as having a positive, negative, or uncertain family history.

**Mitochondrial DNA sequencing**

mtDNA sequencing and deletion analysis was performed primarily on leukocyte-derived (and sometimes muscle-derived) mitochondrial DNA by Next Generation Sequencing (NGS) at McMaster University Medical Centre Molecular Genetics Laboratory. The entire mitochondrial genome was sequenced using the Nimblegen’s SeqCap EZ Mitochondrial Genome Design. Typically, the mean depth of coverage was $>10,000$x. Deletions and duplications of sequences within the mitochondrial genome were assessed by normalizing the depth of coverage at each nucleotide against data obtained from samples known to have the normal mtDNA structure [22]. Patients with a detected variant at a heteroplasmy level less than 5% were considered to have a negative test result. All remaining results $\geq 5\%$ heteroplasmy were classified...
Genetic and environmental factors for optic atrophy

Patients referred to a neuroophthalmologist.

Identification of optic nerve pallor or optic atrophy (OA).

Rule out evidence of multiple sclerosis, neuromyelitis optica, and other causes for OA.

Rule out the three common mutations for Leber’s Hereditary Optic Neuropathy.

97 patients referred to neuromuscular and neurometabolic specialist for assessment of environmental risks, family history, vibration sensation, and referral for next-generation sequencing.

Mitochondrial DNA sequencing. Variants detected at ≥ 5% heteroplasmy are classified according to American College of Medical Genetics (ACMG) guidelines.

Nuclear DNA sequencing of OA panel covering 22 nuclear genes. All variants are classified according to ACMG guidelines.
Nuclear DNA sequencing

Nuclear gene testing was performed on blood derived leukocytes at the Children’s Hospital of Eastern Ontario (CHEO)/Newborn Screening Ontario (NSO). The NGS “Progressive External Ophthalmoplegia (PEO)/Optic Atrophy” panel covered 22 nuclear genes: ACO2, AUH, TWNK (C10orf2), C12orf65, CISD2, MFN2, MGME1, MTPAP, NDUFS1, OPA1, OPA3, POLG, POLG2, RRM2B, SLC19A3, SLC25A4, SPG7, TIMM8A, TK2, TMEM126A, TYMP, and WFS1. The panel was created and consistently revised in partnership between Newborn Screening Ontario (NSO), London Health Science Center, and Hamilton Health Sciences to test for genes currently known to be associated with OA. CHEO/NSO followed standard procedures for DNA sample preparation and quality control. Library construction was accomplished with Kapa Hyper Prep library kits. Standard manufacturer protocols were followed to perform targeted capture with Nimblegen’s SeqCap EZ Choice. The coding exons, as well as splice junctions (50 base pair (bp) padding), of the genes in the panel were targeted. Sequencing was done with 150 bp paired-end reads on an Illumina MiSeq, which generates an average of 800 Mbp of sequence for each sample. Mean coverage design and sequencing workflow can consistently cover >99.5% of target coding bases at >30X read depth (>99.7% at >20X), with 20X coverage as their minimal quality standard for reporting. All patients with a detected nuclear variant were reported and classified according to the ACMG guidelines for variant interpretation.

Variant classification

GATK Best Practices were followed throughout the workflow. For preprocessing, prior to alignment, sequence reads were automatically demultiplexed, adaptors were trimmed, and those sequences that did not meet the default settings on MiSeq Reporter (v2.5) were removed. The reads were then aligned to hg19 human reference genome with BWA-mem options -a -M (v0.7.12-r1039). Duplicate reads were marked by Picard 1.134 and excluded from downstream analysis. GATK 3.5 modules for indel realignment and base recalibration were calibrated to known single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs)/indels (eg. dbSNP138 and 1000G gold standard). Variant calling was performed per sample by GATK 3.5 HaplotypeCaller at each CCDS exon with a 10 bp padding. Hard filters for SNPs and indels were applied with default settings to the variant call set. Annovar was used to annotate the variant call set. Tertiary analyses were performed at PierianDX (St. Louis, MO). Variants were filtered initially with minor allele frequency < 3%. Prioritization was given to variants with known ClinVar pathogenicity or those predicted to alter the protein’s function.

Variant classification was following 2015 ACMG Standard and guidelines for the interpretation of sequence variants. A result was considered “Positive” if the variant was classified as “Pathogenic” or “Likely Pathogenic”. Family studies to assist in the interpretation of the genetic variants identified were performed depending on the availability of informative family members. Heterozygous “Variants of Uncertain Significance” (VUS) were reported for genes associated with an autosomal dominant phenotype. Heterozygous VUS in genes associated with autosomal recessive inheritance were not reported in the absence of a second possible variant.
Environmental exposure assessment

Heavy ethanol use was defined as more than one drink per day or 10 drinks per week for women and two drinks per day or 15 drinks per week for men [24]. Binge drinking was defined as four drinks for women and five drinks for men in about two hours [24]. Individuals were classified as excessive drinkers if they reported heavy drinking or binge drinking within two years prior to, or at the time of, vision loss or diagnosis of optic atrophy. Smoking status of patients were assessed and classified as "Smoker" if they reported smoking in the past or currently and "Never smoker" if they did not report any history of smoking.

Neurological examination including vibration sensation testing

Given that there is precedent for the OPA1 [25,26] and some LHON variants [27] to be associated with extra-ophthalmological neurological manifestations [28], a complete neurological examination was carried out in all patients by a single neuromuscular/neurometabolic specialist (MT) to determine whether there was evidence of neurological impairment in addition to the documented OA. The only neurological finding (other than optic atrophy) present in > 10% of the cohort was a reduction in vibration sensation (128Hz tuning fork), and that was graded and recorded using an ordinal scale (0 = normal; 1 = mild; 2 = moderate; 3 = severe reduction; and 4 = completely absent), with any result other than 0 classified as abnormal vibration sensation.

Statistical tests

To test if a positive environmental exposure risk factor was enriched in mutation positive or negative patients, we compared the proportion of patients that had a positive genetic test with a positive or negative history of environmental exposure (drinking/smoking) using a two-sided chi-squared test. Given there is a priori prediction for there to be greater number of individuals with a positive family history to have a positive genetic variant, a one-sided chi-squared test was used to compare the proportion of patients that had a positive genetic test with a positive or negative family history. The latter test was used in comparing abnormal neurological examination findings in patients with a positive or negative history of environmental exposure (drinking/smoking).

Significance was determined at $p < 0.05$, 95% CI. All statistics are done using Graphpad Prism.

Results

Nuclear variants

Ninety-four patients in the cohort had genetic testing through the Optic Atrophy Nuclear Gene panel (Fig 2A, S1 Table). Pathogenic or likely pathogenic variants were identified in 22/94 (23.4%). One patient and his mother (patients # 1 and 67) were identified to have a heterozygous likely pathogenic variant in the ACO2 gene, which previously has only been reported with an autosomal recessive pattern of inheritance [29]. No second variant in this gene was identified. One patient (# 85) was identified to have a heterozygous likely pathogenic variant in the AUH [30,31]. No second variant in this gene was identified. Therefore, these latter three patients were considered to have negative testing. Consequently, a positive genetic test felt to likely explain the OA phenotype was identified in 19/94 (20.2%). As expected, the highest proportion of positive tests were found in the OPA1 gene (15/19 (78.9%)). The remaining four positive tests were identified in ACO2 (patient # 30) and WFS1 (patient # 8, 77, and 97) (Fig 2C).
Variants of uncertain significance (VUS) possibly associated with OA were identified in 9/94 (9.6%) of the patients in this cohort. Overall, 68/94 (70.2%) of the patients in this cohort had a negative genetic test result (Fig 2A).

**Mitochondrial variants**
Eighty-one patients underwent mtDNA sequencing (Fig 2B, S1 Table). We identified no pathogenic or likely pathogenic mtDNA variants in leukocyte-derived DNA associated with OA and as a result, no patients had a positive genetic test result; however, VUS were identified in 16/81 (19.8%). Therefore, 65/81 (80.2%) had a negative mtDNA result (Fig 2B).

**Family history**
In the patients with a positive family history of vision loss or optic atrophy, 10/30 (33.3%) had a positive genetic test result. In contrast, there were significantly fewer (P = 0.011) positive genetic test results in patients with a negative or uncertain family history (9/67 (13.4%)) (Fig 3).

[Fig 2. Variant identification and classification of ninety-seven patients sent for NGS. (A) PEO/Optic Atrophy nuclear panel results (N = 94). (B) mtDNA results (N = 81). (C) Frequency of patients with a definitive positive molecular diagnosis with causative nuclear gene.](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0225656.g002)
Excessive ethanol use

Nineteen patients (19/97) were identified in the cohort to have a history of excessive ethanol consumption. Of the 19 who reported a history of excessive ethanol consumption, none had a positive genetic test result (0/19). In contrast, of those individuals who did not report a history of excessive ethanol consumption, there was a significantly greater (P = 0.016) number of patients (19/78 (24.4%)) who had a positive genetic test result (Fig 4A).

Smoking

Of the 22 patients who reported smoking in the past or currently, 4/22 (18.2%) patients had a positive genetic test result. Of those that had never smoked, there is not a significantly different number of patients that have a positive genetic test result (15/74 (20.3%), (P = 0.829)) (Fig 4B).

Neurological examination and vibration sensation

Other than optic disc pallor/OA, the only abnormal neurological examination finding present in > 10% of the cohort was an abnormal vibration sensation (20.6%). Of these patients, the proportion of patients with a positive history of excessive ethanol use or smoking that demonstrated an abnormal vibration sensation test was compared to the proportion of patients with a negative history that demonstrated an abnormal vibration sensation test. There were significantly more patients (P = 0.026) with an abnormal vibration sensation test who drank excessively (7/19 (36.8%)) as compared to those who did not drink excessively (13/78 (16.7%)) (Fig 5A). Although not statistically significant, there was a trend (P = 0.074) for a greater percentage of patients who smoked to have an abnormal vibration sensation test (7/22 (31.8%)) compared to those who did not smoke (13/74 (17.6%)) (Fig 5B).
Discussion

The first aim of this review was to investigate the diagnostic utility and spectrum of mutations identified using an NGS-based OA nuclear panel and complete mtDNA sequencing in a cohort of patients found to have OA with or without vision loss. In this report, all positive genetic tests detected by NGS were in nuclear genes. Furthermore, 15/19 (78.9%) of the positive genetic test results detected in the nuclear genes were in OPA1. As reported previously, these results support that most cases of inherited optic atrophy can be attributed largely to dominant optic atrophy resulting from genetic changes in OPA1 (50–80%) [32–34]. Most of the individuals reviewed experienced an irreversible loss of visual acuity, where central vision loss tended to manifest first. The neurological examination was normal in all OPA1 patients in this cohort and did not identify any of the extra-ophthalmologic manifestations reported in some OPA1 mutation positive patients [35].

Pathogenic or likely pathogenic variants in the WFS1 and ACO2 genes were found in a smaller proportion of our OA patients. Mutations in WFS1 are usually associated with Wolfram syndrome (OMIM # 222300), sometimes known as DIDMOAD (diabetes insipidus, diabetes mellitus, optic atrophy, and deafness) [36]. Wolfram syndrome is characterized by juvenile diabetes mellitus, hearing loss, and optic nerve atrophy [37]. No patients in our study with WFS1 variants presented with bona fide Wolfram syndrome. In our cohort of patients, biallelic mutations in WFS1 resulted in isolated OA (with or without vision loss) in patients # 8 and 97. Patient # 8 presented with asymptomatic optic atrophy (correctable vision loss) and was identified to have a pathogenic variant (WFS1 c.1941C>A; p.Cys647) [38,39] and a VUS (c.1597C>T; p.Pro533Ser) *in trans* (Table 1) [40]. Patient # 97 had bilateral vision loss and was homozygous for a missense variant (c.1672C>T; p.Arg558Cys) [41,42]. At 33 and 39 years of age, respectively, neither individual had diabetes nor hearing loss, two of the canonical features...
of Wolfram syndrome. These two cases support recent findings that biallelic heterozygous or homozygous \textit{WFS1} variants can be associated with nonsyndromic or syndromic autosomal recessive OA without diabetes or hearing loss [41]. In contrast, two other patients (patients #16 and 77) had biallelic \textit{WFS1} variants and presented with OA but also had type 2 diabetes mellitus (T2DM) and a positive family history of hearing loss, respectively. Family members of both patients were unavailable to phase the variants. While patient #16 was asymptomatic (correctable vision loss), patient #77 did experience a loss of visual acuity because of their OA. The \textit{WFS1} variants detected in patient #16 were c.1682T>G (p.Ile561Ser) [40] and c.1936_1943del (p.Phe646Valfs*63) [43], which has been associated with nonsyndromic OA with T2DM. Patient #77 had a pathogenic \textit{WFS1} variant (c.1309G>C; p.Gly437Arg) and a likely pathogenic variant (c.2020G>A; p.Gly674Arg) that have both been previously documented in cases of autosomal recessive Wolfram [41,44]. Surprisingly, this patient did not present with the other canonical feature of Wolfram syndrome (T2DM). Altogether, these results add to the wide spectrum of mutations and resulting phenotypes in patients with \textit{WFS1} variants.

Table 1. Positive genetic testing of recessive variants likely to explain the OA phenotype.

| Patient No. | Gene  | Allele 1          | Allele 2          | Allele 1          | Allele 2          |
|-------------|-------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
| 8           | \textit{WFS1} | c.1941C>T        | c.1597C>T        | p.Cys647*         | p.Pro533Ser       |
| 16          | \textit{WFS1} | c.1682T>G        | c.1936_1943del   | p.Ile561Ser       | p.Phe646Valfs*63  |
| 77          | \textit{WFS1} | c.1309G>C        | c.2020G>A        | p.Gly437Arg       | p.Gly674Arg       |
| 97          | \textit{WFS1} | c.1672C>T        | c.1672C>T        | p.Arg558Cys       | p.Arg558Cys       |
| 30          | \textit{ACO2} | c.220C>G         | c.2086G>A        | p.Leu74Val        | p.Glu696Lys       |

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0225656.t001

Fig 5. Comparison of patients with drinking or smoking history in relation to performance on vibration sensation test. (A) Percentage of patients that drink or do not drink who have abnormal vibration sensation (OR, 1.02–8.68; *, p = 0.026; CI = 95%). (B) Percentage of patients that smoke or do not smoke who have an abnormal vibration sensation (OR, 0.80–6.06; p = 0.074; CI = 95%).
Optic Atrophy Type 9 (OPA9) is associated with biallelic pathogenic variants in ACO2 [29]. The ACO2 protein is a tricarboxylic acid (TCA) enzyme that interconverts citrate to isocitrate. Only nine families with ACO2-related visual loss have been documented in the literature [29,45–49]. Our finding of a likely pathogenic variant (c.220C>G; p.Leu74Val) and VUS (c.2086G>A; p.Glu696Lys) in trans in patient # 30, suggests that this represents another case of an association between OA and ACO2 mutations. The ACO2 variant (c.220C>G; p.Leu74-Val) has been reported to be associated with cellular respiration defects [49], and reduced protein expression [29], in OA. As previously reported by others [29], our patients had a relatively early age at onset (5y) of OA symptoms, suggesting that OA associated TCA cycle defects present earlier than the more common OPA1 mutations.

In LHON patients, the three primary mutations account for approximately 95% of all cases [50]. The most common mutation at nucleotide position m.11778 accounts for 60–90% of all cases [51]. However, many sporadic cases of idiopathic bilateral symmetric OA have been documented and found to harbour pathogenic mtDNA point mutations [52]. No patients in this study were found to have any of the three common LHON variants, nor any other likely pathogenic or pathogenic variants. This is likely due to the fact that patients who presented with LHON phenotype were already tested for the three most common mutations by referring physicians and thus not sent for further genetic testing in our clinic. Variants of uncertain significance were identified in the mtDNA of 16 individuals, but none were felt to be pathogenic based upon many criteria (heteroplasmy, high prevalence in public data bases, benign prediction model program score, etc.). Consequently, it is very unlikely that any of the VUS found in mtDNA had an etiological link to OA. Given that neither of the three primary LHON mutations [50], the rarer LHON variants, nor any other potentially pathogenic mtDNA variants were found in our cohort of 81 patients, it questions the utility of complete mtDNA sequencing in cases of OA. Our data suggests that mtDNA sequencing may only be needed if a patient reports a family history of vision loss suspicious for mitochondrial inheritance pattern or presents with canonical LHON onset: semi-acute fairly profound visual loss in one eye accompanied by mild optic nerve head swelling which is followed by visual loss in the opposite eye within days to months.

DOA and LHON are both inherited optic neuropathies and genetic testing should be considered in the context of personal and family history. Expectedly, patients who reported a family history of OA were more likely to have a positive genetic test result than those with a negative family history (33.3% vs. 13.4%, P = 0.011) (Fig 3). This demonstrates the importance of obtaining an accurate family history prior to ordering genetic testing [53], but also suggests that the absence of a family history should not preclude patients from getting genetic testing.

Nevertheless, the genetic results from this study were positive for 20.2% patients through the nuclear gene panel and for no patients through mtDNA sequencing. The relatively modest number of positive results from the nuclear gene panel may suggest the presence of genetic changes in rare or candidate genes not on the panel, variants in intronic regions, epigenetic factors, or the presence of other variants not readily identified using NGS (i.e., trinucleotide repeats, large deletions, etc.). It is also possible that there is no Mendelian genetic etiology behind these cases of optic atrophy.

The second aim of this review was to investigate the role of environmental factors, such as excessive ethanol consumption and/or smoking, in the development of OA. Our cohort was evaluated to see if these environmental factors could precipitate OA as a second hit in gene positive patients or be an independent etiology for OA in gene negative patients. In contrast to our a priori hypothesis, none of the patients who reported excessive ethanol use (N = 19) had a pathogenic or likely pathogenic variant. In contrast, of the remaining individuals who did not report excessive ethanol use, 19/78 (24.4%) had a positive genetic test result. Given that
excessive ethanol use was enriched in our gene negative patients, (P = 0.016) our study indirectly supports an independent pathophysiological link between excessive ethanol consumption and the development of OA. The association between ethanol consumption and OA was also supported by anecdotal evidence in our cohort. For example, one patient (patient #42) woke up after one night of binge drinking with a complete bilateral lost of vision. In contrast with the strong pathophysiological link between methanol consumption and the development of OA, the evidence that excessive ethanol consumption per se can lead to OA is less clear [15–17]. For example, a cross-sectional study of 100 optic atrophy patients reported only one chronic alcoholic patient with primary OA [54]. Other case-control [55] and in vivo [56] studies have implicated a possible link between excessive ethanol consumption and OA. Our study suggests it is likely that environmental toxins, such as chronic ethanol consumption, can be an independent cause for the development of OA. However, due to our relatively small sample size of excessive drinkers (N = 19), it remains important even for patients who are presymptomatic carriers of a mitochondrial variant or Mendelian condition associated with DOA to not drink [13,57–59].

Contrary to excessive ethanol use, the difference in the proportion of patients with positive genetic results between smokers and never smokers was not significant (Fig 4). Thus, we could neither conclude that smoking per se was an independent risk factor for OA, nor that it was an exacerbating factor. In contrast, there is strong evidence that smoking exacerbates LHON symptoms through an increase in the production of ROS and further uncoupling of the respiratory chain [60]. Given that we did not find any positive LHON mtDNA variants in our cohort, we could not evaluate a causal relationship with smoking and LHON.

Lastly, we hypothesized that peripheral neurological defects would be more prevalent in the patients who consumed excessive amounts of ethanol compared to those that do not. Our results suggest that excessive ethanol consumption, even in the absence of a positive genetic variant(s), could be associated with greater extra-ophthalmological neurological manifestations. In our cohort of 19 patients who excessively drank, a significantly greater proportion (P = 0.026) had abnormal vibration sensation compared to patients who did not excessively drink (36.8 vs. 16.7%). This further suggests that ethanol use can independently cause OA given that excessive ethanol consumption was associated with a propensity for neurotoxicity, either large fiber sensory nerve and/or dorsal column impairment. One potential confounding variable is the fact that the excessive ethanol consumers were significantly older than the those who do not drink excessively (age at last evaluation 59.6y vs. 40.6y). In contrast, the influence of smoking on extra-ophthalmological neurological manifestations in our cohort is inconclusive but with a trend suggesting that vibration abnormalities may be associated with a positive smoking history (P = 0.074). Further studies will be needed to further understand the potential neurological effects of smoking in patients with optic neuropathies.

In summary, optic atrophy is a debilitating condition that can result from a variety of genetic and non-genetic factors. Mutations in OPA1 are the most commonly identified genetic cause of OA in our cohort. This case series also supports previous observations that variants in WFS1 can be associated with non-syndromic OA instead of Wolfram syndrome. Complete mtDNA sequencing appears to be of limited utility in patients with isolated OA and a clinical history not suggestive of LHON. The uniformly negative result with the mtDNA sequencing likely reflects the selection cohort where patients were referred for OA and not a specific history typical of LHON. Our data also suggests that excessive ethanol consumption, but not smoking, may be an isolated cause or risk factor for OA. There is a need for further research in understanding the genetic and environmental factors contributing to the development and progression of optic atrophy and vision loss.
Supporting information

S1 Table. The summary of 97 patients assessed at the McMaster University Medical Center for optic atrophy. All patients were sent for nuclear and/or mitochondrial sequencing. Variants were classified according to the ACMG guidelines for variant classification. Smoking, excessive ethanol use, type of vision loss, and extra features are reported and described. (XLSX)

Author Contributions

Conceptualization: Lauren Brady, Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

Data curation: Andrew T. Chen, Lauren Brady, Dennis E. Bulman, Arun N. E. Sundaram, Amadeo R. Rodriguez, Edward Margolin, John S. Waye, Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

Formal analysis: Andrew T. Chen, Lauren Brady, Dennis E. Bulman, Arun N. E. Sundaram, Amadeo R. Rodriguez, Edward Margolin, John S. Waye, Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

Funding acquisition: Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

Investigation: Andrew T. Chen, Dennis E. Bulman, Arun N. E. Sundaram, Amadeo R. Rodriguez, Edward Margolin, John S. Waye, Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

Methodology: Andrew T. Chen, Lauren Brady, Dennis E. Bulman, John S. Waye, Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

Project administration: Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

Supervision: Lauren Brady, Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

Writing – original draft: Andrew T. Chen, Lauren Brady, Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

Writing – review & editing: Andrew T. Chen, Lauren Brady, Dennis E. Bulman, Arun N. E. Sundaram, Amadeo R. Rodriguez, Edward Margolin, John S. Waye, Mark A. Tarnopolsky.

References

1. Lenaers G, Hamel CP, Delettre C, Amati-Bonneau P, Procaccio V, Bonneaud E, et al. Dominant optic atrophy. Orphanet J Rare Dis. 2012; 7: 46. https://doi.org/10.1186/1750-1172-7-46 PMID: 22776096

2. Delettre-Cribaillet C, Hamel CP, Lenaers G. Optic atrophy type 1. GeneReviews®. University of Washington, Seattle; 1993. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20301426

3. Chun BY, Rizzo JF. Dominant optic atrophy: Updates on the pathophysiology and clinical manifestations of the optic atrophy 1 mutation. Curr Opin Ophthalmol. 2016; 27: 475–480. https://doi.org/10.1097/ICO.0000000000000314 PMID: 27585216

4. Delettre C, Lenaers G, Griffon J-M, Gigarel N, Lorenzo C, Belenguer P, et al. Nuclear gene OPA1, encoding a mitochondrial dynamin-related protein, is mutated in dominant optic atrophy. Nat Genet. 2000; 26: 207–210. https://doi.org/10.1038/79936 PMID: 11017079

5. Del Dotto V, Mishra P, Vidoni S, Fogazza M, Maresca A, Caporali L, et al. OPA1 isoforms in the hierarchical organization of mitochondrial functions. Cell Rep. 2017; 19: 2557–2571. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.celrep.2017.05.073 PMID: 28636943

6. Jurkute N, Majander A, Bowman R, Votruba M, Abbs S, Acheson J, et al. Clinical utility gene card for: inherited optic neuropathies including next-generation sequencing-based approaches. Eur J Hum Genet. 2019; 27: 494–502. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41431-018-0235-y PMID: 30143805

7. Carelli V, Ghelli A, Zanna C, Baracca A, Sgarbi G, Martinuzzi A. Severe defect of complex I–dependent ATP synthesis shapes the mitochondria–driven path of apoptotic cell death in Leber’s hereditary optic neuropathy (LHON). Invest Ophthalmol Vis Sci. 2004; 45: 1624–1624. Available: https://iovs.arvojournals.org/article.aspx?articleid=2407190

8. Yu-Wai-Man P, Votruba M, Burté F, La Morgia C, Barboni P, Carelli V. A neurodegenerative perspective on mitochondrial optic neuropathies. Acta Neuropathol. 2016; 132: 789–806. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00401-016-1625-2 PMID: 27696015
9. Jurkute N, Majander A, Bowman R, Votruba M, Abbs S, Acheson J, et al. Clinical utility gene card for: inherited optic neuropathies including next-generation sequencing-based approaches. Eur J Hum Genet. 2019; 27: 494–502. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41431-018-0235-y PMID: 30143805

10. Amati-Bonneau P, Milea D, Bonneau D, Chevrollier A, Ferré M, Guillot V, et al. OPA1-associated disorders: Phenotypes and pathophysiology. Int J Biochem Cell Biol. 2009; 41: 1855–1865. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocel.2009.04.012 PMID: 19389487

11. Majander A, Bowman R, Poulton J, Antcliff RJ, Reddy MA, Michaels M, et al. Childhood-onset Leber hereditary optic neuropathy. Br J Ophthalmol. 2017; 101: 1505–1509. https://doi.org/10.1136/bjophthalmol-2016-310072 PMID: 28314831

12. Manickam AH, Michael MJ, Ramasamy S. Mitochondrial genetics and therapeutic overview of Leber's hereditary optic neuropathy. Indian J Ophthalmol. 2017; 65: 1087–1092. https://doi.org/10.4103/ijo.IJO_358_17 PMID: 29136361

13. Kirkman MA, Yu-Wai-Man P, Korsten A, Leonhardt M, Dimitriadis K, De Coo IF, et al. Gene-environment interactions in Leber hereditary optic neuropathy. Brain. 2009; 132: 2317–2326. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/awp158 PMID: 19525327

14. Carelli V, d'Adamo P, Valentino ML, La Morgia C, Ross-Cisneros FN, Caporal I, et al. Parsing the differences in affected with LHON: genetic versus environmental triggers of disease conversion. Brain. 2016; 139: e17–e17. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/awv339 PMID: 26657166

15. Scrimgeour EM, Dethlefs RF, Kevau I. Delayed recovery of vision after blindness caused by methanol poisoning. Med J Aust. 1982; 2: 481–483. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/7155031 PMID: 7155031

16. Sullivan-Mee M, Solis K. Methanol-induced vision loss. J Am Optom Assoc. 1998; 69: 57–65. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/9479937 PMID: 9479937

17. Grzybowski A, Zülsdorf M, Wilhelm H, Tonagel F. Toxic optic neuropathies: an updated review. Acta Ophthalmol. 2015; 93: 402–410. https://doi.org/10.1111/aos.12515 PMID: 25198932

18. Shimozono M, Townsend JC, Lisen PF, Bright DC. Acute vision loss resulting from complications of ethanol abuse. J Am Optom Assoc. 1998; 69: 293–303. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/9610037 PMID: 9610037

19. Morris B, Votruba M. Leber’s optic neuropathy—visual return on alcohol cessation. Acta Ophthalmol. 2012; 90: e568–e568. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1755-3768.2012.02387.x PMID: 22405409

20. Brooks PJ. DNA Damage, DNA Repair, and Alcohol Toxicity-A Review. Alcohol Clin Exp Res. 1997; 21: 1073–1082. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1530-0277.1997.tb04256.x PMID: 9309320

21. Carelli V, Ross-Cisneros FN, Sadun AA. Optic nerve degeneration and mitochondrial dysfunction: genetic and acquired optic neuropathies. Neurochem Int. 2002; 40: 573–84. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/11850115 https://doi.org/10.1016/s0197-0186(01)00129-2 PMID: 11850115

22. Schenkel LC, Kerkhof J, Stuart A, Reilly J, Eng B, Woodside C, et al. Clinical next-generation sequencing pipeline outperforms a combined approach using sanger sequencing and multiplex ligation-dependent probe amplification in targeted gene panel analysis. J Mol Diagnostics. 2016; 18: 657–667. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmoldx.2016.04.002 PMID: 27376475

23. Richards S, Aziz N, Bale S, Bick D, Das S, Gastier-Foster J, et al. Standards and guidelines for the interpretation of sequence variants: A joint consensus recommendation of the American College of Medical Genetics and Genomics and the Association for Molecular Pathology. Genet Med. 2015; 17: 405–423. https://doi.org/10.1038/gim.2015.30 PMID: 25741868

24. Services UD of H and H. Dietary guidelines for Americans 2015–2020. Skyhorse Publ Inc. 2017. Available: https://www.niaaa.nih.gov/alcohol-health/overview-alcohol-consumption/moderate-binge-drinking

25. Yu-Wai-Man P, Griffiths PG, Gorman GS, Lourenco CM, Wright AF, Auer-Grumbach M, et al. Multi-system neurological disease is common in patients with OPA1 mutations. Brain. 2010; 133: 771–786. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/awq007 PMID: 20157015

26. Yu-Wai-Man P, Spyropoulos A, Duncan HJ, Guadagno J V., Chinnery PF. A multiple sclerosis-like disorder in patients with OPA1 mutations. Ann Clin Transl Neurol. 2016; 3: 723–729. https://doi.org/10.1002/acn3.323 PMID: 27656661

27. Bargiela D, Chinnery PF. Mitochondria in neuroinflammation—Multiple sclerosis (MS), Leber hereditary optic neuropathy (LHON) and LHON-MS. Neurosci Lett. 2017; 132932. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neulet.2017.06.051 PMID: 28668384

28. Abu-Amero KK, Bosley TM, Bohlegra S, McLean D. Complex I respiratory defect in LHON plus dystonia with no mitochondrial DNA mutation. Br J Ophthalmol. 2005; 89: 1380–1. https://doi.org/10.1136/bjo.2005.072819 PMID: 16170145
29. Metodiev MD, Gerber S, Hubert L, Delahodde A, Chretien D, Gérard X, et al. Mutations in the tricarboxylic acid cycle enzyme, aconitase 2, cause either isolated or syndromic optic neuropathy with encephalopathy and cerebellar atrophy. J Med Genet. 2014; 51: 834–8. https://doi.org/10.1136/jmedgenet-2014-102532 PMID: 25351951

30. Ly TBN, Peters V, Gibson KM, Liesert M, Buckel W, Wilcken B, et al. Mutations in the AUH gene cause 3-methylglutaconic aciduria type I. Hum Mutat. 2003; 21: 401–407. https://doi.org/10.1002/humu.10202 PMID: 12655555

31. Gunay-Aygun M, Huizing M, Anikster Y. OPA3-related 3-methylglutaconic aciduria. GeneReviews®. University of Washington, Seattle. 1993. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20301646

32. Votruba M, Moore AT, Bhattacharya SS, Votruba S Bhattacharya MS, Votruba M. Clinical features, molecular genetics, and pathophysiology of dominant optic atrophy. J Med Genet. 1998; 35: 793–800. https://doi.org/10.1136/jmg.35.10.793 PMID: 9783700

33. Ferré M, Caignard A, Milea D, Leruez S, Cassereau J, Chevrollier A, et al. Improved locus-specific database for OPA1 mutations allows inclusion of advanced clinical data. Hum Mutat. 2015; 36: 20–25. https://doi.org/10.1002/humu.22703 PMID: 25243597

34. Yu-Wai-Man PRCOpth P, Chinnery FRCP PF. Dominant Optic Atrophy: Novel OPA1 Mutations and Revised Prevalence Estimates. Ophthalmology. 2013. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ophtha.2013.04.022 PMID: 23916084

35. Yu-Wai-Man P, Trenell MI, Hollingsworth KG, Griffiths PG, Chinnery PF. OPA1 mutations impair mitochondrial function in both pure and complicated dominant optic atrophy. Brain. 2011; 134: e164. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/awq288 PMID: 20952381

36. Barrett TG, Bunday SE, Macleod AF. Neurodegeneration and diabetes: UK nationwide study of Wolfram (DIDMOAD) syndrome. Lancet (London, England). 1995; 345: 1458–63. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/7490992

37. Zalloua PA, Azar ST, Delépine M, Makhoul NJ, Blanc H, Sanyoura M, et al. WFS1 mutations are frequent in monogenic causes of juvenile-onset diabetes mellitus in Lebanon. Hum Mol Genet. 2008; 17: 4012–4021. https://doi.org/10.1002/hmg.20333 PMID: 18842734

38. Gasparin MRR, Crispim F, Paula SL, Freire MBS, Dalbosco IS, Della Manna T, et al. Identification of novel mutations of the WFS1 gene in Brazilian patients with Wolfram syndrome. Eur J Endocrinol. 2009; 160: 309–316. https://doi.org/10.1530/EJE-08-0698 PMID: 19042979

39. Zen PRG, Pinto LLC, Schwartz IVD, Barrett TG, Paskulin G. Report of a Brazilian patient with Wolfram Syndrome. J Pediatr (Rio J). 2013; 79: 529–32. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/23647736

40. Astuti D, Sabir A, Fulton P, Zatyka M, Williams D, Hardy C, et al. Monogenic diabetes syndromes: Locus-specific databases for Alström, Wolfram, and Thiamine-responsive megaloblastic anemia. Hum Mutat. 2017; 38: 764–777. https://doi.org/10.1002/humu.23233 PMID: 28432734

41. Grenier J, Meunier I, Daïen V, Baudoin C, Hallay F, Bocquet B, et al. WFS1 in optic neuropathies: Mutation findings in nonsyndromic optic atrophy and assessment of clinical severity. Ophthalmology. 2016; 123: 1989–1998. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ophtha.2016.05.036 PMID: 27395765

42. Bansal V, Boehm BO, Darvasi A. Identification of a missense variant in the WFS1 gene that causes a mild form of Wolfram syndrome and is associated with risk for type 2 diabetes in Ashkenazi Jewish individuals. Diabetologia. 2018; 61: 2180–2188. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00125-018-4690-3 PMID: 30014265

43. Srivastava S, Guibels CS, Dies K, Fulton A, Yu T, Sahin M. Increased survival and partly preserved cognition in a patient with AC02-related disease secondary to a novel variant. J Child Neurol. 2017; 32: 840–845. https://doi.org/10.1177/0883073817711527 PMID: 28545339

44. Swerdlow R, Adzick NS, Haynor DR, Chinnery PF. Dominant optic atrophy: Clinical features, molecular genetics, and pathophysiology. Brain. 2011; 134: e164. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/awq288 PMID: 20952381

45. Srivastava S, Guibels CS, Dies K, Fulton A, Yu T, Sahin M. Increased survival and partly preserved cognition in a patient with AC02-related disease secondary to a novel variant. J Child Neurol. 2017; 32: 840–845. https://doi.org/10.1177/0883073817711527 PMID: 28545339

46. Shankar R, Wierenga KJ, Kessel A, Azem A, Bertini E, Carrozzo R, et al. Clinical, radiological, and genetic characteristics of 16 patients with AC02 gene defects: Delineation of an emerging neurometabolic syndrome. J Inherit Metab Dis. 2019 [cited 22 Feb 2019]. https://doi.org/10.1002/jimd.12022 PMID: 30689204

47. Spiegel R, Pines O, Ta-Shma A, Burak E, Shaag A, Halvardson J, et al. Infantile cerebellar-retinal degeneration associated with a mutation in mitochondrial aconitase, AC02. Am J Hum Genet. 2012; 90: 518–23. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ajhg.2012.01.009 PMID: 22405087
49. Kelman JC, Kamien BA, Murray NC, Goel H, Fraser CL, Grigg JR. A sibling study of isolated optic neuropathy associated with novel variants in the ACO2 gene. Ophthalmic Genet. 2018; 39: 648–651. https://doi.org/10.1080/13816810.2018.1509353 PMID: 30118607

50. Man PYW, Turnbull DM, Chinnery PF. Leber hereditary optic neuropathy. J Med Genet. 2002; 39: 162–169. https://doi.org/10.1136/jmg.39.3.162 PMID: 11897814

51. Riordan-Eva P, Sanders MD, Govan GG, Sweeney MG, Da Costa J, Harding AE. The clinical features of Leber’s hereditary optic neuropathy defined by the presence of a pathogenic mitochondrial DNA mutation. Brain. 1995; 118 (Pt 2): 319–37. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/7735876

52. Chan C, Mackey DA, Byrne E. Sporadic Leber hereditary optic neuropathy in Australia and New Zealand. Aust N Z J Ophthalmol. 1996; 24: 7–14. Available: https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1442-9071.1996.tb01545.x PMID: 8742999

53. Verma IC, Paliwal P, Singh K. Genetic testing in pediatric ophthalmology. Indian J Pediatr. 2018; 85: 228–236. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12098-017-2453-7 PMID: 28971364

54. Bajracharya K, Gautam P, Yadav SK, Shrestha N. Epidemiology and causes of optic atrophy in general outpatient department of lumbini eye institute. J Univers Coll Med Sci. 2016; 3: 26–29. https://doi.org/10.3126/jucms.v3i2.14287

55. Aviñó J, Díaz-Llopis M, España E, Johnsen-Soriano S, Romero B, Marín N, et al. Chronic ethanol feeding induces oxidative stress in the optic nerve of rats. Arch Soc Esp Oftalmol. 2002; 77: 263–8. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/12023745 PMID: 12023745

56. Ahuja S, Kumar PS, Kattimani S, Akkilagunta S. Effect of chronic alcohol and tobacco use on retinal nerve fibre layer thickness: a case–control study. BMJ Open Ophthalmol. 2016; 1: e000003. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjophth-2016-000003 PMID: 29354691

57. Maass J, Matthé E. Bilateral vision loss due to Leber’s hereditary optic neuropathy after long-term alcohol, nicotine and drug abuse. Doc Ophthalmol. 2018; 136: 145–153. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10633-018-9622-5 PMID: 29372350

58. Morris B, Votruba M. Mean cellular volume in a patient with Leber’s optic neuropathy and visual return on alcohol cessation. Acta Ophthalmol. 2014; 92: e77–e77. https://doi.org/10.1111/aos.12100 PMID: 23506347

59. Lenaers G, Hamel CP, Delefortrie C, Amati-Bonaccorso P, Procaccio V, Bonneau D, et al. Dominant optic atrophy. Orphanet J Rare Dis. 2012; 7: 46. https://doi.org/10.1186/1750-1172-7-46 PMID: 22776096

60. Giordano L, Deceglie S, d’Adamo P, Valentino ML, La Morgia C, Fracasso F, et al. Cigarette toxicity triggers Leber’s hereditary optic neuropathy by affecting mtDNA copy number, oxidative phosphorylation and ROS detoxification pathways. Cell Death Dis. 2015; 6: e2021. https://doi.org/10.1038/cddis.2015.364 PMID: 26673666