Acupuncture as an adjuvant therapy for management of treatment-related symptoms in breast cancer patients

Systematic review and meta-analysis (PRISMA-compliant)

Soobin Jang, KMD, PhD®, Youme Ko, MD (TCM), PhD®, Yui Sasaki, PhD®, Sunju Park, KMD, PhD®, Junyoung Jo, KMD, PhD®, Na-Hoon Kang, KMD, MSc®, Eun-Sil Yoo, MSc, KMD®, Nam-Chun Park, MSc, KMD®, Seong hee Cho, KMD, PhD®, Heejea Jang, KMD, PhD®, Bo-Hyoung Jang, KMD, MPH, PhD®, †, Deok-Sang Hwang, KMD, PhD®, ‡, Seong-Gyu Ko, KMD, MPH, PhD®

Abstract

Background: Although randomized controlled trials have revealed the considerable effectiveness of acupuncture in breast cancer patients, there have been no studies exploring current acupuncture research trends for treatment induced various symptoms in breast cancer patients. This review evaluated the effectiveness of acupuncture for treatment-induced symptoms in breast cancer patients.

Methods: We performed a systematic review and meta-analysis of the literature regarding acupuncture to treat symptoms associated with breast cancer therapies. The following databases were searched for relevant RCTs published before June 2018: MEDLINE, EMBASE, the Cochrane Library, AMED, CINAHL, OASIS, CNKI, and CiNii.

Results: Among the 19,483 records identified, 835 articles remained after screening titles and abstracts. A total of 19 RCTs were included in this qualitative synthesis. Among the studies, 8 explored climacteric symptoms, 4 explored pain, 2 explored lymphedemas, 2 explored nausea and vomiting and 3 investigated miscellaneous symptoms. Explored miscellaneous symptoms due to cancer treatments. Most of the studies reported that acupuncture can alleviate various symptoms of breast cancer treatment. However, there is a lack of evidence as to whether acupuncture can alleviate chemotherapy associated side effects.

Conclusions: Acupuncture may alleviate the treatment-related symptoms of breast cancer; however, further studies are necessary to obtain conclusive evidence of the effectiveness of acupuncture in treating breast cancer.

Registration number: CRD42018087813

Abbreviations: AI = aromatase inhibitor, AT = acupuncture, AVLT = auditory-verbal learning test, BC = breast cancer, BDI = Beck depression inventory, BDNF = Brain-derived neurotrophic factor, BFI = Brief fatigue inventory, BPI-SF = Brief pain inventory - short form, C = control, CAM = complementary and alternative medicine, CDT = Clock-drawing test, CES-D = center for epidemiological studies depression scale, CRP = C reactive protein, DASH = disabilities of the arm, shoulder and hand score, EA = 

© Copyright 2020 the Author(s). Published by Wolters Kluwer Health, Inc.

How to cite this article: Jang S, Ko Y, Sasaki Y, Park S, Jo J, Kang NH, Yoo ES, Park NC, Cho Sh, Jang H, Jang BH, Hwang DS, Ko SG. Acupuncture as an adjuvant therapy for management of treatment-related symptoms in breast cancer patients: systematic review and meta-analysis (PRISMA-compliant). Medicine 2020;99:50 (e21820).
Breast cancer (BC) is the most common type of cancer among women globally. The estimated incidence and the age-standardized incidence rate for female BC patients was 2.4 million and 63.5 per 100,000 women in 2015.[1,2] The increasing incidence of BC may have an impact on the economic burden of care and productivity of patients.

In general, BC patients experience multiple symptoms related to cancer treatment, including fatigue, pain, sleep disturbances, depression, nausea, and vomiting.[3] Dong et al reported that these symptoms are often concurrent, with more than 8 symptoms occurring at any given time.[4] Several studies have used non-pharmacological approaches to treat these symptoms, such as acupuncture, fatigue, sleep disturbance, and quality of life, in a safe and effective manner.[5-6]

A substantial number of BC patients visit complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) clinics to receive treatment for cancer as well as for treatment-related symptoms, such as psychosocial distress, hot flushes, insomnia, and fatigue.[9-11] Currently, acupuncture is widely used as a safe and highly accessible adjunctive treatment for various symptoms induced by BC treatment.[12] Based on the principles of traditional medicine, acupuncture regulates energy pathways and controls the balance of energy circulation to alleviate various symptoms of cancer, as evidenced by the changes in neurophysiologic and neurohumoral activities.[13]

Previous studies have explored the efficacy of a broad range of CAMs in improving the symptoms of BC treatment-related symptoms.[14-17] Kim et al. recently reviewed the current clinical evidence of acupuncture for Korean BC survivors and reported that there is a lack of evidence for the benefits of acupuncture in BC patients within Korea.[18]

There has been no thorough systematic review of various acupuncture treatments for BC treatment-induced symptoms. Thus, we reviewed all relevant studies and conducted a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials (RCTs) to investigate the efficacy and safety of acupuncture in relation to the various symptoms induced by BC treatment.

2. Methods
All data of this study analyzed were collected from published trials, so ethical approval is not necessary.

1. Introduction
Breast cancer (BC) is the most common type of cancer among women globally. The estimated incidence and the age-standardized incidence rate for female BC patients was 2.4 million and 63.5 per 100,000 women in 2015.[1,2] The increasing incidence of BC may have an impact on the economic burden of care and productivity of patients.

In general, BC patients experience multiple symptoms related to cancer treatment, including fatigue, pain, sleep disturbances, depression, nausea, and vomiting.[3] Dong et al reported that these symptoms are often concurrent, with more than 8 symptoms occurring at any given time.[4] Several studies have used non-pharmacological approaches to treat these symptoms, such as acupuncture, fatigue, sleep disturbance, and quality of life, in a safe and effective manner.[5-6]

A substantial number of BC patients visit complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) clinics to receive treatment for cancer as well as for treatment-related symptoms, such as psychosocial distress, hot flushes, insomnia, and fatigue.[9-11] Currently, acupuncture is widely used as a safe and highly accessible adjunctive treatment for various symptoms induced by BC treatment.[12] Based on the principles of traditional medicine, acupuncture regulates energy pathways and controls the balance of energy circulation to alleviate various symptoms of cancer, as evidenced by the changes in neurophysiologic and neurohumoral activities.[13]

Previous studies have explored the efficacy of a broad range of CAMs in improving the symptoms of BC treatment-related symptoms.[14-17] Kim et al. recently reviewed the current clinical evidence of acupuncture for Korean BC survivors and reported that there is a lack of evidence for the benefits of acupuncture in BC patients within Korea.[18]

There has been no thorough systematic review of various acupuncture treatments for BC treatment-induced symptoms. Thus, we reviewed all relevant studies and conducted a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials (RCTs) to investigate the efficacy and safety of acupuncture in relation to the various symptoms induced by BC treatment.

2. Methods
All data of this study analyzed were collected from published trials, so ethical approval is not necessary.

1. Introduction
Breast cancer (BC) is the most common type of cancer among women globally. The estimated incidence and the age-standardized incidence rate for female BC patients was 2.4 million and 63.5 per 100,000 women in 2015.[1,2] The increasing incidence of BC may have an impact on the economic burden of care and productivity of patients.

In general, BC patients experience multiple symptoms related to cancer treatment, including fatigue, pain, sleep disturbances, depression, nausea, and vomiting.[3] Dong et al reported that these symptoms are often concurrent, with more than 8 symptoms occurring at any given time.[4] Several studies have used non-pharmacological approaches to treat these symptoms, such as acupuncture, fatigue, sleep disturbance, and quality of life, in a safe and effective manner.[5-6]

A substantial number of BC patients visit complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) clinics to receive treatment for cancer as well as for treatment-related symptoms, such as psychosocial distress, hot flushes, insomnia, and fatigue.[9-11] Currently, acupuncture is widely used as a safe and highly accessible adjunctive treatment for various symptoms induced by BC treatment.[12] Based on the principles of traditional medicine, acupuncture regulates energy pathways and controls the balance of energy circulation to alleviate various symptoms of cancer, as evidenced by the changes in neurophysiologic and neurohumoral activities.[13]

Previous studies have explored the efficacy of a broad range of CAMs in improving the symptoms of BC treatment-related symptoms.[14-17] Kim et al. recently reviewed the current clinical evidence of acupuncture for Korean BC survivors and reported that there is a lack of evidence for the benefits of acupuncture in BC patients within Korea.[18]

There has been no thorough systematic review of various acupuncture treatments for BC treatment-induced symptoms. Thus, we reviewed all relevant studies and conducted a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials (RCTs) to investigate the efficacy and safety of acupuncture in relation to the various symptoms induced by BC treatment.

2. Methods
All data of this study analyzed were collected from published trials, so ethical approval is not necessary.

1. Introduction
Breast cancer (BC) is the most common type of cancer among women globally. The estimated incidence and the age-standardized incidence rate for female BC patients was 2.4 million and 63.5 per 100,000 women in 2015.[1,2] The increasing incidence of BC may have an impact on the economic burden of care and productivity of patients.

In general, BC patients experience multiple symptoms related to cancer treatment, including fatigue, pain, sleep disturbances, depression, nausea, and vomiting.[3] Dong et al reported that these symptoms are often concurrent, with more than 8 symptoms occurring at any given time.[4] Several studies have used non-pharmacological approaches to treat these symptoms, such as acupuncture, fatigue, sleep disturbance, and quality of life, in a safe and effective manner.[5-6]

A substantial number of BC patients visit complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) clinics to receive treatment for cancer as well as for treatment-related symptoms, such as psychosocial distress, hot flushes, insomnia, and fatigue.[9-11] Currently, acupuncture is widely used as a safe and highly accessible adjunctive treatment for various symptoms induced by BC treatment.[12] Based on the principles of traditional medicine, acupuncture regulates energy pathways and controls the balance of energy circulation to alleviate various symptoms of cancer, as evidenced by the changes in neurophysiologic and neurohumoral activities.[13]

Previous studies have explored the efficacy of a broad range of CAMs in improving the symptoms of BC treatment-related symptoms.[14-17] Kim et al. recently reviewed the current clinical evidence of acupuncture for Korean BC survivors and reported that there is a lack of evidence for the benefits of acupuncture in BC patients within Korea.[18]

There has been no thorough systematic review of various acupuncture treatments for BC treatment-induced symptoms. Thus, we reviewed all relevant studies and conducted a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials (RCTs) to investigate the efficacy and safety of acupuncture in relation to the various symptoms induced by BC treatment.

2. Methods
All data of this study analyzed were collected from published trials, so ethical approval is not necessary.

1. Introduction
Breast cancer (BC) is the most common type of cancer among women globally. The estimated incidence and the age-standardized incidence rate for female BC patients was 2.4 million and 63.5 per 100,000 women in 2015.[1,2] The increasing incidence of BC may have an impact on the economic burden of care and productivity of patients.

In general, BC patients experience multiple symptoms related to cancer treatment, including fatigue, pain, sleep disturbances, depression, nausea, and vomiting.[3] Dong et al reported that these symptoms are often concurrent, with more than 8 symptoms occurring at any given time.[4] Several studies have used non-pharmacological approaches to treat these symptoms, such as acupuncture, fatigue, sleep disturbance, and quality of life, in a safe and effective manner.[5-6]

A substantial number of BC patients visit complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) clinics to receive treatment for cancer as well as for treatment-related symptoms, such as psychosocial distress, hot flushes, insomnia, and fatigue.[9-11] Currently, acupuncture is widely used as a safe and highly accessible adjunctive treatment for various symptoms induced by BC treatment.[12] Based on the principles of traditional medicine, acupuncture regulates energy pathways and controls the balance of energy circulation to alleviate various symptoms of cancer, as evidenced by the changes in neurophysiologic and neurohumoral activities.[13]

Previous studies have explored the efficacy of a broad range of CAMs in improving the symptoms of BC treatment-related symptoms.[14-17] Kim et al. recently reviewed the current clinical evidence of acupuncture for Korean BC survivors and reported that there is a lack of evidence for the benefits of acupuncture in BC patients within Korea.[18]

There has been no thorough systematic review of various acupuncture treatments for BC treatment-induced symptoms. Thus, we reviewed all relevant studies and conducted a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials (RCTs) to investigate the efficacy and safety of acupuncture in relation to the various symptoms induced by BC treatment.
observational studies, cohort studies, case reports, case series, non-RCT studies, animal and experimental studies, and theses were excluded.

2.2.2. Participants. Participants were women currently being treated for BC. No restrictions were used with respect to the diagnosis criteria for BC and stage of cancer. Both metastatic and non-metastatic BC patients were included. Patients with other types of cancer were excluded.

2.2.3. Types of interventions. We included studies that evaluated the effect of various types of acupuncture in the management of treatment-related symptoms in breast cancer patients. Interventions including manual acupuncture, ear acupuncture, and electro-acupuncture (EA) were included. There were no restrictions on concomitant conventional treatment, such as chemotherapy and hormone therapy, if the study applied concomitant treatment for all groups homogeneously. Studies were excluded if they did not mention penetration of the skin during the procedure of acupuncture, which, for example, occurs with acupressure.

2.2.4. Types of comparisons. There were no special restrictions on comparisons. Sham acupuncture, active-control (such as conventional medicine and exercise), no-treatment, and wait-list control groups were all permitted.

2.2.5. Outcome measures. There were no designated primary outcomes in this review. Outcomes used for the evaluation of BC-related symptoms were accepted without restriction.

2.3. Data collection, extraction, and assessment

2.3.1. Selection of studies. Two authors (SJ and YK) independently screened the titles and abstracts of the searched studies, after excluding duplicate articles from 8 databases. Then, the full text of the selected articles was reviewed to verify that each article met the inclusion criteria. Another reviewer (BHJ) made the final decision when the earlier two authors had a difference in opinion. This process is summarized in a flow diagram in the PRISMA (Fig. 1).[19]

2.3.2. Data extraction. One author (SJ) conducted data extraction, and another author (YK) reviewed the extracted document. Extracted items regarding study population, type of symptom, intervention, outcomes, and conclusion were collected from the studies.

Figure 1. The PRISMA Flow Diagram of Study Selection.
2.3.4. **Meta-analysis.** We planned to perform a meta-analysis if RevMan (Cochrane Collaboration Software, version 5.3) using Review Manager (Cochrane Collaboration Software, 2007). Data were extracted from the included studies and 19 RCTs [21–38] were included in the quantitative synthesis of this review. Therefore, these 2 studies were examined together as 1 study in this review.

Each item of every RCT was categorized as “high risk (H),” “unclear (U),” or “low risk (L).” The RoB graph was generated using Review Manager (Cochrane Collaboration Software, RevMan) version 5.3.

2.3.4. **Meta-analysis.** We planned to perform a meta-analysis if sufficient studies were identified for symptoms or outcome measurements. We used the risk ratio (RR) for dichotomous variables and mean difference (MD) for continuous variables as effect estimates.

3. **Results**

3.1. **Results of the search**

In total, 19,483 records were identified from the eight databases. Of these, 16,929 articles remained after eliminating duplicates. After screening titles and abstracts, 835 articles were retained, and finally, through reviewing the full texts, 19 RCTs [21–40] (described in 20 articles) fulfilled the eligibility criteria for inclusion. The flow chart of the study selection and exclusion criteria is shown in Figure 1. Hervik’s studies were published twice, in 2009 [27] and 2014 [28]. Both were based on the same primary patient complaints, pain locations, and pattern identifications. [22,29,30,38] The total number of treatment sessions ranged from 4 to 40 sessions. Of the ten trials [21–29,31–33] follow-up investigation was conducted in Tables 2 and 3. Of the remaining 8 trials did not mention specific periods of 9 to 12 weeks [21–23,25–27,29,33,36,40]

3.2. **Included studies**

A detailed description of the characteristics of the included studies is presented in Tables 2 and 3. The following is a brief overview of the studies.

3.3. **Study designs**

Data were extracted from the included studies and 19 RCTs [21–40] were included in the qualitative synthesis of this review.

3.4. **Settings**

Of the 19 studies, [21–23,26,30,31,37,38] were conducted in the United States, [22,23,26,30,31,37,38] in Europe, [22,23,26,30,31,37,38] in Australia, [131] in Brazil, and [4,15,36,39,40] in China. The published year of each trial varied between 2006 and 2018.

3.5. **Participants**

The number of participants in the trials ranged between 32 and 190. All trials contained women with breast cancer. The mean participant age was distributed between the 40 seconds and 60 seconds. Of the seven trials that targeted women with breast cancer below stage 3 [23,26,30–32,35,38] two trials enrolled patients below stage 2 [134,39] one trial recruited patients with breast cancer higher than stage 2 [137] one trial [24] used TNM stage as inclusion criteria, and the remaining 8 trials did not mention specific stages of BC [21,22,23,27–29,33,36,40]. The symptoms accompanying breast cancer were as follows: climacteric symptoms 8 [21–29], pain 4 [30–33], nausea and vomiting 2 [34,35], breast cancer-related lymphedema 2 [36,37], peripheral neuropathy 1 [38], cognitive impairment 1 [39] and gastrointestinal symptom 1 [40]. Chemo-therapy, aromatase inhibitor (AI) therapy, hormone therapy, surgery, and symptom-specific treatments were mentioned as concurrent treatments during the trial period (Table 2).

3.6. **Interventions**

Interventions used in all included studies were manual acupuncture and EA. Four trials [21,24,34,38] used EA, and the remaining 15 trials used manual acupuncture. [22,23,25–33,35–37,39,40] Among the manual acupuncture trials, one trial [40] employed a combination of symptomatic therapy, umbilical application with acupuncture, one [30] applied integrated therapy with acupuncture and auricular acupuncture, two trials [33,36] employed various exercises in addition to acupuncture, and one trial [29] used a booklet with acupuncture. All of the studies applied manual acupuncture stimulation to treat certain symptoms caused by cancer treatment, of the four studies that used a combination of EA [21,24,34,38]. Most of the studies mentioned acupuncture points and mostly included a range between 3 and 19 points. However, Crew et al. did not mention specific acupuncture points other than full body and auricular acupuncture. [30] Fourteen studies applied fixed acupuncture points based on previous studies, textbooks, and expert opinions [21,23,28,31–37,40] while the remaining five studies used semi-fixed acupuncture points as indicated by primary patient complaints, pain locations, and pattern identifications [22,29,30,38,39].

Acupuncture and EA treatment were administered at least once or twice per week. The treatment period ranged from 3 days to 12 weeks; four trials had periods of 4 weeks or under [22,35,36,40], seven trials had periods of 5–8 weeks [25,26,30–32,37,39] and 8 had periods of 9 to 12 weeks [21,23,24,27–29,33,34,38]. The number of treatment sessions ranged from 4 to 40 sessions. Of the ten trials [21–29,31,32] follow-up investigation was conducted in those identified in Tables 2 and 3.

3.7. **Comparisons**

There were three types of comparisons in this review. Active-control, placebo, and no-treatment groups were included as the control groups. Sham acupuncture was applied as a placebo in 8 trials [22,23,28,30–32,35,38] and sham EA was used in 2 trials [34,38]. The conventional medicine, venlafaxine (VNF), was used as an active control in one trial [23] and hormone therapy in 3 trials [21,24] various exercises [33,36], relaxation [21] enhanced self-care by clinicians by providing a brochure, [29] and symptomatic therapy [40] were also selected for comparisons. Furthermore, no treatment [39] and wait-list [37] control groups were also used.

3.8. **Outcomes**

The outcomes of each trial were used to assess the common accompanying symptoms that were caused by cancer treatment; for example, climacteric symptoms (frequency and severity of hot flush and sweating) [21–29], pain (severity, functional disability,
| Study ID                  | Characteristics of study | Interventions                                                                 |
|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| **Study ID**              | Sample size (enrolled)    | Age (mean, SD)                   | Stage | Main symptoms | Acu-type | Control intervention | Total duration of treatment | Outcomes | Effect estimates (Mean difference after-before treatment, event (x %)) | Adverse events | Conclusion                        |
| **Nedstrand (2006)**      | 38.1±9.0 C:19             | 53 n.r. Hot flush               | EA    | Applied relaxation | 12 w + 3 m (FM) | 1. Mlaad scale  | 1. -0.90 [-1.02, -0.78] | 2. SCL | 2. 5.10 [1.75, 8.45]  | 3. -10 [-0.22, 0.02] | 4. 1.90 [0.63, 2.17] | 5. 0.40 [-0.68, 1.48] | n.r. | “... improved in both groups, but did not differ significantly.” |
| **Deng (2007)**           | 72.4±2.3 C:35             | 1. 56 C:56 n.r. Hot flush       | AT    | Sham          | 4 w + 5 m (FM) | 1. Hot flush FREQ | -0.10 [-0.28, 0.08] | 4. MenQoL (vasomotor) | 1. 12: slight bleeding or bruising at the needle site | none | “... cannot exclude the possibility that a longer and more intense acupuncture intervention could produce a larger reduction of these symptoms.” |
| **Walker (2010)**         | 50.6±2.9 C:25             | Median 55 (35–77) 0-II Hot flush | AT    | VNF | 12 w + 9 m (FM) | 1. Hot flush FREQ | 1. P<.05 | 2. P>.01 | 3. P<.01 | 4. P<.01 | C: 18 nausea, headache, difficulty sleeping, dizziness, etc. | none | “A safe, effective and durable treatment for vasomotor symptoms secondary to long term antiestrogen hormone use in patients with BC.” “EA should be further evaluated as treatment for women with BC and climacteric complaints, since HT no longer can be recommended for these women.” |
| **Frisi (2013)**          | 45.3±7.1 C:3.44           | T1 or T2 with max 4 MNU, T3 without metastasis | EA    | HT | -12 w + 25 m (FM) | 1. Hot flush FREQ | 1. 0.60 [0.47, 0.73] | 2. Severity of Hot flush | 3. MenQoL (vasomotor) | 4. BDI-PC* | none | “... shoves that both true and CTRL reduce vasomotor symptoms in BC patients treated with adjuvant tamoxifen.” |
| **Ullagen (2012)**        | 84.Ø±4.2 C:43             | 1. 56±6.8 C: 56±9.3 n.r. Hot flush | AT    | Sham          | 5 w + 12 w (FM) | 1. Hot flush FREQ | 1. -10 [0.60, 0.40] | 2. Severity of Hot flush | 3. MenQoL (vasomotor) | 4. BDI-PC* | none | “... shoves that both true and CTRL reduce vasomotor symptoms in BC patients treated with adjuvant tamoxifen.” |
| **Bao (2014)**            | 51.0±2.2 C:28             | Median I: 61 (44–83) C: 61 (40–85) 0-II Aromatase Inhibitor-induced Musculo-skeletal Symptoms | AT    | Sham          | 8 w + 4 w (FM) | 1. Hot flush FREQ | 1. 1.50 [-4.01, 7.01] | 2. Severity of Hot flush | 3. MenQoL (vasomotor) | 4. BDI-PC* | none | “... shoves that both true and CTRL reduce vasomotor symptoms in BC patients treated with adjuvant tamoxifen.” |
| **Henrik (2009) & Henrik (2014)** | 59.3±3.0 C:29 | 1. 52±8.4 C: 52±9.5 n.r. Hot flush | AT    | Sham          | 10 w + 2 y (FM) | 1. Hot flush FREQ | -5.69 [-5.71, -5.67] | 4. MenQoL (vasomotor) | 1. 12 mild adverse events (muscle pain, headache, menorrhea/bleed) | none | “Acupuncture seems to have a positive effect on health related quality of life for up 3 months post-treatment, but no significant effect 2 years FU.” |
| **Lesi (2018)**           | 100.8±6.5 C:105           | 1. 50±9 C: 49±8.5 n.r. Hot flush | AT + Enhanced self-care based on Brochure | Enhanced self-care based on Brochure | 12 w + 6 m (FM) | 1. HFS | 1. -11.14 [-16.4, -6.3] | 2. 4.6 [9.4, -4.2] | 3. -14 [-2.1, -11] | 4. [-8.1, 1.3] | none | “... is an effective integrative intervention for managing hot flashes.” |

*(continued)*
| Study ID | Sample size (enrolled) | Age (mean, SD) | Stage | Main symptoms | Acu-type | Control intervention | Total duration of treatment | Outcomes | Effect estimates (Mean difference after-before treatment, event n or %) | Adverse events | Conclusion |
|----------|------------------------|----------------|-------|--------------|----------|---------------------|-----------------------------|----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Crew (2010) | 43 (23, 20) | Median I: 58 (44–77) C: 57 (37–77) | I-III | Joint pain or stiffness | AT + Auricular | AT | 6 w | WOMAC (pain, stiffness, function) | -0.7 [-1.1, -0.3] | I: 2 -174.00 [−212.22, -135.78] | none | Acupuncture is an effective and well-tolerated strategy for managing this common treatment-related side effect. |
| Oh (2013) | 51 (35, 26) | Median I: 61 (44–82) C: 61 (45–85) | 0-II | Musculo-skeletal Symptoms | AT | Sham | 6 w + 6 w (FM) | HAQ-DI | * | none | ..did not observe a significant difference in AIMSS changes between real and sham acupuncture. |
| He (2017) | 64 (32, 32) | 142.1 ±4.29 C4E2± 4.11 | I-IIIa | Nausea & Vomiting | AT | Sham | 1 w | Severity of N/V (NCCN-CTC 4.0, ≥IV) | 1.24 [0.95, 1.55] | 1 -1.27 [-1.18, -1.37] | n.r. | ..could help BC patients relieving N/V, improving the symptoms of poor appetite and body tiredness, and reducing HADS... |

(continued)
### Table 2 (continued)

| Study ID     | Sample size (enrolled) | Age (mean, SD) | Stage | Main symptoms | Acu-type            | Control intervention | Total duration of treatment | Outcomes                                                                 | Effect estimates (Mean difference after-before treatment, event (n or %)) | Adverse events                                                                 | Conclusion                                                                 |
|--------------|------------------------|----------------|-------|---------------|----------------------|----------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Lymphedema (2) China (06)  | 60 (I:30, C:30)        | n.r.           | n.r.  | BC related upper limb lymphedema | Abdominal acupuncture + Upper limb exercise | Upper limb exercise   | 4 w                       | 1. Pain (VAS)† ‡, 2. Arm circumference, 3. Incidence of severe edema         | 1. -1.22 [-1.48, -0.96], 2. -1.47 [-1.62, -1.32], 3. 5/8                | n.r.                                                                         | “... is of better curative effect in eliminating edema and improving pain in phantom, which is worthy of promotion ” |
| Bug (2018) US (39)         | 82 (I:40, C:42)        | I:65 C:58     | II    | BC-related limb lymphedema       | AT Wait-list          | 6 w                       | 1. Arm circumference, 2. Bioimpedance                                  | 1. -0.38 [-0.89, 0.12], 2. -1.06 [1.75, 5.72]                             | t: Incidence of severe edema                                                | “... did not significantly reduce BCRL in pre-treated patients receiving concurrent lymphedema treatment.” |
| Miscellaneous Symptoms (3) | 63 (I:33, C:30)        | I:58.8±10.7   | I-II  | Taxane-induced peripheral neuropathy | EA Sham EA           | 12 w                      | 1. BPI SF, 2. FACT-N Tx, 3. FACT-T, 4. NPS                          | 1. -0.90 [-3.66, 0.86], 2. 1.40 [-2.87, 5.67], 3. 0.70 [-1.69, 10.29], 4. -0.60 [-0.89, 0.12] | t: minor swelling and bruising at needle site                              | “... there were no differences in pain or neuropathy between groups.” |
| Tong (2018) China (09)  | 80 (I:40, C:40)       | I:43.1±4.23   | 0-II  | Chemotherapy-related cognitive impairment | AT No treatment     | 8 w                       | 1. FACT-COG, 2. AVL (Immediate recall, delayed recall, recognition), 3. VFT, 4. SDMT, 5. CDT, 6. TMF a, 7. EAFN  | 1. 3.43 [3.15, 3.71], 2. 0.21 [0.30, 0.12], 0.01 [0.05, 0.007], 0.55 [0.46, 0.64], 3. 0.32 [0.54, 0.10], 4. -0.19 [0.78, 0.05], 5. 0.51 [0.39, 0.63], 6. 1.83 [5.54, 2.12], 7. 3.65 [3.33, 3.77] | n.r.                                                                         | “... is effective in the treatment of OCR in BC patients through a mechanism that may be related to an increase of EBNF.” |
| Zhang (2018) China (40) | 70 (I:35, C:35)       | 149.9±3.20   | C:30.5±3.16 | Chemotherapy-induced gastrointestinal symptoms | AT + Umbilical application + Symptomatic therapy | Symptomatic therapy (Sensation. Hyperesthesia, Sens deprecation) | 3 d                     | Response rate (diarrhea, constipation, N/V)                                | 91.4%/82.9%, 94.3%/86.0%, 91.4%/77.1% (all P < 0.05)                     | n.r.                                                                         | “... can effectively relieve the symptoms of diarrhea, constipation, N/V, and improve clinical efficacy.” |

Al = aromatase inhibitor, AT = acupuncture, AVL = Auditory-verbal learning test, BDQ = Beck depression inventory, BDNF = Brain-derived neurotrophic factor, BF1 = Brief fatigue inventory, BPI-SF = Brief pain inventory–short form, C = control, CDT = Clock drawing test, CSS-D = Center for epidemiological studies depression scale, CRP = C reactive protein, DASH = Disabilities of the arm, shoulder and hand score, EA = electroacupuncture, ESR = Erythrocyte sedimentation rate, EXE = Exercise, F/U = follow-up, FACT-COG = Functional assessment of cancer treatment cognition, FACT-G = Functional assessment of cancer therapy–general, FACT-NX = Neurotoxicity component of functional assessment of cancer therapy taxane scale, FACT-TAX = Functional assessment of cancer therapy taxane scale, GCS = Greene characteristic scale, HAOS = Hospital anxiety and depression scale, HADS = Hospital anxiety and depression scale, H-QOL = Health assessment questionnaire disability index, HFCS = Hot flush composite score, HFS = Hot flush score, HT = hormone therapy, I = intervention, K = Kupperman’s index, MenQoL = Menopause specific quality of life, MLN = metastatic lymph node, M-SAGAH = Modified score for the assessment and quantification of chronic rheumatoid affections of the hands, MAMW = Measure yourself concerns and wellbeing questionnaire, n.r. = not reported, NPS = Neuropathic pain scale, PGAS = Psychological and general well-being index, PGQ = Pittsburgh sleep quality index, SIDMF = Symptom distress modality test, SHBG = Sex hormone binding globulin, TAM = tamoxifen, tgAI = third generation of AI, TMF = Trail-making test part B, TROP = Troplexion, VAS = Visual analog scale, VFT = Verbal fluency test, WHQ = Wellbeing questionnaire, WHQ = Women’s health questionnaire, WOMAC = Western Ontario and McMaster Universities osteoarthritis index.

† Higher score indicates severe symptoms.

‡ Dichotomous variables.
| Study ID                  | Acupuncture rationale                        | Acupuncture points used          | Number of needles | Needle stimulation | Number of sessions | Frequency of acupuncture treatment                                                                 | Concurrent treatment       |
|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------|-------------------|-------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Climacteric Symptoms (8) | N. R.                                         | Fixed acupoints BL23, BL32       | 4                  | Manual stimulation+EA | 14                | Twice a week for the first 2 w + once a week for remaining 10 w                                   | N. R.                      |
| Nedstrand (2006) Sweden  | Derived from previous reports & standard acupuncture textbooks | Semi-fixed acupoints according to symptoms GV14, GB30, BL13, PC7, HT6, KI7, ST36, SP6, Ear AT | 19                 | Manual stimulation  | 8                 | Twice a week for the first 4 w + once a week for remaining 8 w                                     | SERMs, GnRH or AI          |
| Deng (2007) US (22)      | n. r.                                         | Fixed acupoints KI3, BL23, SP6, GB20, GV14, GV20, ST36, LR3, HT7, PC7, CV6, LU9 | 12                 | Manual stimulation  | 16                | Twice a week for the first 2 w + once a week for remaining 10 w                                     | Hormone therapy with Tamoxifen or Arimidex |
| Walker (2010) US (23)    | n. r.                                         | Fixed acupoints BL15, BL23, BL32, GV20, HT7, PC6, LR3, SP6, SP9 | 12                 | Manual stimulation+EA | 14                | Twice a week for the first 2 w + once a week for remaining 10 w                                     | N. R.                      |
| Frisk (2012) Sweden (24) | Based on earlier studies                      | Fixed acupoints LI4, HT6, LR3, ST36, SP6, KI7 | 8                  | Manual stimulation  | 10                | Twice a week, 5 w                                                                                   | Tamoxifen                  |
| Liljegren (2012) Sweden  | According to previous reports and from expert opinion, as found in standard acupuncture textbooks | Fixed acupoints CV4, CV6, CV12, U4, GV34, ST36, KI3, BL65 | 15                 | Manual stimulation  | 8                 | Once a week, 8w                                                                                   | AI therapy                 |
| Bao (2014) US (26)       | Based on our clinical experience suggesting that AMSS resulted from Qi deficiency | Semi-fixed acupoints according to pattern identification SP6, LI11, CV4 + additional points according to TCM syndrome | 2≥3               | Manual stimulation  | 10                | Twice a week for the first 5 w + once a week for remaining 5 w                                     | AI therapy (anastrozole, letrozole, or exemestane) |
| Hervik (2009) (27) & Hervik (2014) Norway (28) | Fixed acupoints LI3, GB20, LU7, KI3, SP6, GB34, PC7, LI8 | 8                  | Manual stimulation  | 15                | Once a week, 10w                                                                                   | Cisplatin + chemotherapy |
| Lesi (2016) Italy (23)   | According to Maciocia’s recommendations       | Semi-fixed acupoints                        | 2≥3               | Manual stimulation  | 12                | Twice a week, 6w                                                                                   | TgAI (anastrozole, letrozole, or exemestane) |
| Crew (2010) US (30)      | full body + auricular acupuncture + 3 most painful areas | Semi-fixed acupoints according to pain location (max 3 points) | 2≥3               | Manual stimulation  | 12                | Twice a week, 6w                                                                                   | TgAI                        |
| Bao (2013) US (31)       | Based on our clinical experience suggesting that AMSS resulted from Qi deficiency. Derived from standard acupuncture textbooks | Fixed acupoints CV4, CV6, CV12, U4, GV34, ST36, KI3, BL65 | 15                 | Manual stimulation  | 8                 | Once a week, 8w                                                                                   | TgAI                        |
| Oh (2013) Australia (32) | Based on our clinical experience suggesting that AMSS resulted from Qi deficiency. Derived from standard acupuncture textbooks | Fixed acupoints Day1: LI4, LI11, GB34, ST40, LR3, GV20, EX-HN1, EX-UE9 Day2: GB31, TE5, ST36, SP8, LR3, GV20, EX-HN1, EX-UE9 | 12                 | Manual stimulation + EA | 12                | Twice a week, 6w                                                                                   | TgAI                        |
|                          | Fixed acupoints                              |                                   | 12                 | Manual stimulation  | 10                | Once a week, 10w                                                                                   |                            |

(continued)
| Study ID | Acupuncture rationale | Acupoint selection principle | Acupuncture points used | Number of needles | Needle stimulation | Number of sessions | Frequency of acupuncture treatment | Concurrent treatment |
|----------|-----------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------|------------------|------------------|-------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------|
| Giron (2016) Brazil (33) | in accordance with the recommendations of Standards for Reporting of Controlled Trials in Acupuncture (RCTA) | Fixed acupoints | CV3, SP9, ST36, KI7, LR3, GB21, LI15, HT14, LU5, L4, ST38, BL60 | 3 | Manual stimulation | 4 | 2 hr prior to chemo; on day 1 & 2 of the first two cycles | Adjuvant or neo-adjuvant Paclitaxel |
| Beith (2012) Australia (34) |  | Fixed acupoints | PO6 (left), U4 (right), ST36 (both) | 3 | Manual stimulation | 4 | Every other day, 8d | OOT |
| He (2017) China (35) | Based on the expert opinion Prof. Wang from Capital Medical University Beijing Hospital of Traditional Chinese Medicine | Fixed acupoints | CV12, LR13, CV6, ST25, PO6, ST36 | 6 | Manual stimulation | 28 | Once a day, 28d | n.r. |
| Zhan (2017) China (36) | Based on the theory of meridians | Fixed acupoints | CV12, CV10, CV6, CV4, ST24, ST26 | 6 | Manual stimulation | 12 | Twice a week, 6w | Common standard dose chemotherapy regimens |
| Bao (2018) US (37) | based on previous pilot study | Fixed acupoints | CV12, CV3, TE14, LI15, LU5, L4, ST36, SP6 | 8 | Manual stimulation |  |  |  |
| Greenlee (2016) US (38) | Developed based on a standard TCM protocol for qi and xue deficiency and stagnation and informal practitioner query. | Semi-fixed acupoints according to pain location | GB34, ST36, LU10, LU3, LU5, GV14 | 4-8 | Manual stimulation + EA | 12 | Once a week, 12w | Hormonal treatment |
| Tong (2018) China (39) |  | Semi-fixed acupoints according to symptoms | GV20, EX-HN1, GV24, ST36, KI13, KI14, GB39 | 3-10 | Manual stimulation | 40 | Once a day for 5 days, 2 days of rest/w, 4w/cycle, 3d rest between cycle, 2 cycles | Chemotherapy |
| Zhang (2018) China (40) |  | Fixed acupoints | RN4, RN6, RN10, RN12, ST24, ST25, SP15 | 8 | Manual stimulation | 9 | 30 min' session, twice a day, 3 d | Granisetron hydrochloride |
quality of life including sleep and emotional status), nausea and vomiting (frequency, severity, and WHO grading), lymphedema (level of edema, arm circumference), neuropathic pain (severity and function), cognitive impairment (functional assessment and neuropsychological tests), and gastrointestinal symptoms (overall response rate). The details of the effectiveness of acupuncture for the management of treatment-induced discomfort of the main problematic symptoms indicated in each study were as follows:

In patients experiencing climacteric symptoms, Hervik et al reported that general climacteric symptoms after treatment significantly reduced in the acupuncture group compared to the sham group using Kupperman’s Index, but Nedstrand et al. reported a significant effect in the applied relaxation group compared to the EA group. Walker et al reported that the acupuncture group had a significant decrease in the daily frequency and severity of hot flushes after treatment compared to the Venlafaxine group (P < 0.05). Frisk et al reported that compared to hormone therapy, the EA group demonstrated a significantly lower frequency of hot flushes (MD -0.5; 95% CI -0.9, -0.1). Assessing the reduction rate of hot flushes with the Hot Flush Score, Lesi et al. reported that acupuncture with an enhanced self-care group had a higher reduction rate than did the single self-care group (64.9%/16.9%, P < 0.05). However, Frisk et al showed that the hormone therapy group had a higher reduction rate than the EA group (100%/80%). Two studies reported a significant effect of the intervention with respect to menopause-specific quality of life (P < 0.05).

In patients experiencing pain induced by cancer treatment, Crew et al. demonstrated significant differences after treatment between acupuncture and sham groups using the Western Ontario and McMaster Universities Arthritis Index (WOMAC), Brief Pain Inventory-short form (BPI-SF), and Functional Assessment of Cancer Therapy-General (FACT-G), except the pain domain in the WOMAC and the social/family domain in the FACT-G (P < 0.05). However, in Oh et al, none of the outcomes that Crew reported significant differences for showed any significant differences. Giron et al showed significant differences in functional measures of flexion (MD 9.0; 95% CI 3.45, 12.55), adduction (MD 2.30; 95% CI 1.36, 3.24), and abduction (MD 10.0; 95% CI 4.38 15.62), and significant reduction in depression measures (MD -1.7; 95% CI -3.06, -0.34).

Of the 4 studies that assessed the effect of acupuncture on cancer treatment-induced nausea and vomiting, Beith et al. reported a higher incidence of acute (9/11) and delayed (10/11) nausea in the sham group, but there were no significant differences between groups (P > 0.5). Incidence vomiting also resulted in a higher incidence of acute (2/1) and delayed (1/0) vomiting in the EA group (P > 0.5). The incidence of severe nausea and vomiting after treatment was reported in one study using the US National Cancer Institute Common Terminology Criteria for Adverse Events v 4.0 (NCI-CTC 4.0) and showed a significantly higher incidence of severe nausea and vomiting in the control group (2/4, P < 0.05). The concomitant symptoms associated with treatment induced nausea and vomiting, such as anxiety, depression, loss of appetite, abdominal bloating, and fatigue, were measured using the Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale and TCM symptom grading scale. He et al. showed a significant reduction in the severity of anxiety (MD -1.46; 95% CI -1.94, -0.98), depression (MD -1.14; 95% CI -1.26 -1.02), fatigue (MD -1.21; 95% CI -1.33, -1.09), and loss of appetite (MD -1.27; 95% CI -1.31 -1.23) in acupuncture with ondansetron group compared to controls.

In patients experiencing lymphedema, Zhan et al. reported a significant decrease in the change of arm circumference compared to upper limb exercises (MD -1.47; 95% CI -1.62, -1.32) but Bao et al did not show any significant difference compared to the wait-list group (MD -0.38; 95% CI -0.89, 0.12). The intensity of joint-related pain using the Visual Analog Scale was statistically significant after acupuncture and upper limb exercise treatment compared to the upper limb exercises group (MD -1.22; 95% CI -1.48, -0.96).

Taxane-induced peripheral neuropathy was assessed over time in one study, Greenlee et al. assessed symptoms or concerns associated with chemotherapy and pain by using the Neurotoxicity Component of Functional Assessment of Cancer Therapy (FACT-NTX), Functional Assessment of Cancer Therapy Taxane Scale (FACT-TAX), BPI-SF, and neuropathy pain scale (NPS), but there were no significant differences between groups.

In patients experiencing chemotheraphy-related cognitive impairment, Tong et al. reported a greater improvement in the Functional Assessment of Cancer Treatment Cognition (FACT-COG) (MD 3.43; 95% CI 3.15, 3.71), recognition of Auditory-Verbal Learning Test (MD 0.55; 95% CI 0.46, 0.64), Clock-Drawing Test (MD 0.51; 95% CI 0.39, 0.63), and serum brain-derived neurotrophic factor (BDNF) (MD 3.65; 95% CI 3.53, 3.77) in the acupuncture group.

In patients complaining of chemio-induced gastrointestinal symptoms, Zhang et al reported greater improvement in diarrhea (91.4%/82.9%), constipation (94.3%/80.0%), as well as nausea and vomiting (91.4%/77.1%) in the acupuncture group, with significant differences between groups. Due to the heterogeneity of assessment measurements, we could not thoroughly analyze this section. Table 2 summarizes the details of the outcomes.

### 3.9. Adverse events

Adverse events were assessed in 11 trials. Four studies reported no incidence of adverse events. Five studies reported mild adverse events such as pain, bleeding or bruising from the needles. In one study, various adverse reactions (i.e., nausea, headache, dizziness, and sleeping difficulty) were reported in the control group treated with VNF and the remaining study showed muscle pain, headache, or menstrual bleeding in the treatment group.

### 3.10. RoB in the included studies

The methodological quality of the included studies was assessed using the RoB tool, which evaluated 7 areas. In the performance bias category, only three studies used participant and assessor blinding and were assessed as ‘low-risk’. Seven studies did not report random sequence generation and 14 studies did not mention an allocation concealment method. Thus, the category of selection bias was largely assessed as ‘unclear’. The detection bias was high because self-reporting questionnaires were generally used. The majority of studies reported what they mentioned in the methodology section and thoroughly collected outcome results. Thus, attrition bias and reporting bias were assessed as low-risk. Additionally, the category of other bias was assessed as unclear, since 9 studies did not adequately describe the baseline data. The details of the RoB assessment are presented in Figure 3.
3.11. Meta-analyses

Due to the variety of outcomes, we only included 7 studies in the quantitative synthesis.\cite{21,22,24,25,27,28,36,37} Overall, acupuncture was significantly effective for improving arm circumference due to cancer-related lymphedema and quality of sleep. On the other hand, menopausal symptoms such as hot flushes and KI did not improve compared to the control group (Fig. 2). The following is a brief overview of the meta-analysis results.

3.11.1. Hot flash frequency (overall, nighttime time). Five trials were suitable for meta-analysis.\cite{21,22,24,25,27,28} The mean differences in daily hot flash frequency between the acupuncture and sham acupuncture or relaxation therapy groups (MD 0.3; 95%CI -0.84, 1.44; \(P = .61; \) I\(^2\) = 47%; 177 participants; 3 trials) (Fig. 4) and night time frequency between the acupuncture and wait-list groups (MD -0.83; 95%CI -1.94, 0.28; \(P = .14; \) I\(^2\) = 95%; 96 participants; 2 trials) were not statistically significant (Fig. 5).

3.11.2. Menopausal symptoms. Sufficient data on menopausal symptom assessments by KI were reported in two studies.\cite{21,27,28} There were no statistically significant differences in the total KI score between the acupuncture and wait-list or relaxation therapy groups (MD -2.61; 95%CI -7.35, 2.14; \(P = .28; \) I\(^2\) = 99%; 126 participants; 2 trials) (Fig. 6).

3.11.3. Arm circumference. Two trials compared mean differences in arm circumference between the acupuncture and waitlist or exercise therapy groups (MD -1.61; 95%CI -1.92, -1.31; \(P < .00001; \) I\(^2\) = 72%; 133 participants; 2 trials), which were statistically significant, in favor of the control group\cite{36,37} (Fig. 7).

4. Discussion

The purpose of this review was to provide an overview of previous studies which investigated symptoms induced by BC treatments and to investigate the overall effectiveness of acupuncture. Nineteen studies were included in this review, and 7 studies were suitable for meta-analysis. The sample size of the included studies varied between 32 and 190, with 1,216 participants overall. These studies mentioned possible positive effects of acupuncture on BC treatment induced various symptoms, such as climacteric symptoms, pain, lymphedema, nausea, and miscellaneous symptoms. However, most of the authors suggested further confirmatory trials with conclusive evidence were needed, which indicates that there is still a lack of sufficient trials on acupuncture treatment as adjuvant therapy for BC. Overall, sixty distinct outcomes were measured in this review; the most frequently assessed outcomes were climacteric symptoms, pain, lymphedema, nausea and vomiting.

This study has several strengths. First, this study aimed to examine all of the acupuncture trials concerning the symptoms induced by BC treatment, in order to identify the efficacy of acupuncture treatment. Thus, we determined that the climacteric symptoms, pain, nausea, vomiting, lymphedema, cognitive impairment, gastrointestinal symptoms, and neuropathy were the main complaints in BC patients. Second, we reviewed a number of studies which were identified by a rigorous literature search strategy and we used standardized tools for reporting reviews and assessing bias.

Through this review, we learned that most of the studies were conducted in the United States, Europe, and China, while no studies have been published from Korea. In Korea, breast cancer is the second-most common cancer with a rapidly increasing incidence in Korean women. However, we identified a lack of evidence for the management of concomitant symptoms during BC treatment.

We also learned that most interventions have focused on manual acupuncture or EA. Interventions included enhanced self-care, auricular acupuncture, kinesio-therapy, exercises, symptomatic therapy, and umbilical application. However, due to the heterogeneity across the studies, they differed widely in terms of participant characteristics, duration, frequency of the interventions, and outcome measurement tools. Thus, we could not thoroughly evaluate the effectiveness of outcomes for measuring the benefit on certain symptoms. Only the change in affected arm
circumference due to lymphedema was significantly different before and after treatment, which contradicts previous studies.\cite{41,42} Such differences may be due to variations between measurement tools. With regard to climacteric symptoms, most of the studies reported a significant effect on general menopausal symptoms, but there was no improvement in the frequency and severity of hot flush, which is consistent with the results of previous studies.\cite{43,44} Our findings with respect to musculoskeletal symptoms indicate that acupuncture may or may not alleviate pain and improve the function of the affected region. Conflicting with our data, a study on arthralgia previously reported that acupuncture reduced the pain and stiffness, but this was not statistically significant.\cite{45} This difference may be due to the musculoskeletal symptoms which were not classified into body regions. Regarding nausea and vomiting, we found that acupuncture was associated with a statistically significant increase in appetite and reduce the level of fatigue, anxiety, and depression. Further, studies on cognitive impairment and gastrointestinal symptoms demonstrated significant effects of acupuncture, including in cognitive function, levels of BDNF, incidence of diarrhea, constipation, nausea, and vomiting. However, there are no published studies to which these studies can be compared.

Despite the beneficial results of acupuncture treatment on various symptoms induced by BC treatment, most studies had a low level of reporting quality and a high heterogeneity in methodological quality. Furthermore, there are few studies in which specific symptoms are treated by acupuncture and subsequently evaluated.

This review has some limitations. First, there was no specific restriction on the study selection characteristics for breast cancer, such as stage of cancer, size of tumor, type of surgery, type of chemotherapy. Therefore, these findings only provide preliminary evidence for BC and further studies with a systematic methodology will be needed. Second, acupuncture points were not discussed because there was no similarity among the included trials. Our research team will analyze this topic using network meta-analysis in the near future. Third, although we searched all published studies concerning acupuncture for symptoms induced by BC treatment, we could not identify any studies in the Korean population. Thus, ethnic differences between countries should be examined in future comparative trials for appropriate planning in Korea. Despite these limitations, none of the studies reported severe adverse effects other than minor events, such as slight bleeding and/or bruising due to needle puncture.

This systematic review and meta-analysis of women being treated for breast cancer confirmed that acupuncture had no significant effect on the frequency and severity of hot flushes, but was associated with a significant reduction in general climacteric symptoms and an increase in quality of life. We conclude that acupuncture is not inferior, with respect to safety, to hormone therapy or other applied relaxation therapies in alleviating the symptoms of menopause.

5. Conclusions

There is currently insufficient evidence to conclude that acupuncture is of any benefit to patients suffering from symptoms caused by cancer treatment. Therefore, more rigorous studies are needed to clearly reveal the effectiveness of acupuncture in symptoms induced by BC treatment.
Acknowledgments

We thank Editage for English language editing. This manuscript was edited for English language by Editage.

Author contributions

BHJ and DSH designed the entire study. SJ and YK wrote the manuscript. All authors have read and consent to the publication of the manuscript.

References

[1] Ginsburg O, Bray F, Coleman MP, et al. The global burden of women’s cancers: a grand challenge in global health. Lancet 2017;389:847–60.
[2] Fitzmaurice C, Allen C, Barber RM, et al. Global, Regional, and National Cancer Incidence, Mortality, Years of Life Lost, Years Lived With Disability, and Disability-Adjusted Life-years for 32 Cancer Groups, 1990 to 2015: A Systematic Analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study. JAMA Oncol 2017;3:524–48.
[3] Kwekkeboom KL. Cancer symptom cluster management. Semin Oncol Nurs 2016;32:373–82.
[4] Dong ST, Butow PN, Costa DS, et al. Symptom clusters in patients with advanced cancer: a systematic review of observational studies. J Pain Symptom Manage 2014;48:411–50.
[5] Yeh CH, Chien L, Lin W, et al. Pilot randomized controlled trial of auricular point acupressure to manage symptom clusters of pain, fatigue, and disturbed sleep in breast cancer. Cancer Nurs 2015.
[6] Hu XD, Li Y, Peng YX, et al. Research progress of symptom clusters in cancer patients. J of Nurs Admin 2020;20:195–200.
[7] Li Z, Zheng Z, Wang L, et al. Efficacy evaluation of heat-sensitive moxibustion for chemotherapy symptoms of large intestine cancer. Chin Acupunct Moxibust 2015;35:1010–3.
[8] Jiao J, Luo ZQ, Zhang WM. Study for the effects of acupressure on symptom clusters for patients with advanced cancer. J Nurs Train 2015;30:2221–3.
[9] Schapira MM, Mackenzie ER, Lam R, et al. Breast cancer survivors willingness to participate in an acupuncture clinical trial: a qualitative study. Support Care Cancer 2014;22:1207–15.

[10] DiGianni LM, Garber JE, Winer EP. Complementary and alternative medicine use among women with breast cancer. J Clin Oncol 2002;20:345–85.

[11] Gerber B, Scholz C, Reimer T, et al. Complementary and alternative therapeutic approaches in patients with early breast cancer: a systematic review. Breast Cancer Res Treat 2006;95:199–209.

[12] Ernst E. Assessments of complementary and alternative medicine: the clinical guidelines from NICE. Int J Clin Pract 2010;64:1350–80.

[13] Joshi N, Araque H. Neurophysiologic basis for the relief of human pain by acupuncture. Acupunct Electrother Res 2009;34:165–74.

[14] Wong LYE, Wong CK, Leung PC, et al. The efficacy of herbal therapy on quality of life in patients with breast cancer: self-control clinical trial. Patient Prefer Adher 2010;4:223–9.

[15] Xue D, Sun H, Li P-P. Long-term Chinese herbs decoction administration for management of hot flushes associated with endocrine therapy in breast cancer patients. Chin J Cancer Res 2011;23:74–8.

[16] Ma H, Sullivan-Halley J, Smith AW, et al. Estrogenic botanical supplements, health-related quality of life, fatigue, and hormone-related symptoms in breast cancer survivors: A HEAL study report. BMC Complement Altern Med 2011;2011:1–1.

[17] De Oliveira Campos MP, Riechelmann R, Martins LG, et al. Guaraná (Paullinia cupana) improves fatigue in breast cancer patients undergoing systemic chemotherapy. J Altern Complement Med 2011;17:505–12.

[18] Kim TH, Kang JW, Lee MS. Current evidence of acupuncture for symptoms related to breast cancer survivors: A PRISMA-compliant systematic review of clinical studies in Korea. Medicine (Baltimore) 2018;97:e11793.

[19] Shamsi L, Moher D, Clarke M, et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015: elaboration and explanation. BMJ 2015;350:g7647.

[20] Higgins JP, Altman DG, Gotoz C, et al. The Cochrane Collaboration’s tool for assessing risk of bias in randomised studies. BMJ 2011;343:d5928.

[21] Elizabeth Niederstrand YW, Mats Hammar , Klaas , et al. Psychological well-being improves in women with breast cancer after treatment with applied relaxation or electro-acupuncture for vasomotor symptom. J Psych Obstet Gynecol 2006;27:193–9.

[22] Deng G, Vickers A, Yeung S, et al. Randomized, controlled trial of acupuncture for the treatment of hot flushes in breast cancer patients. J Clin Oncol 2007;25:5584–90.

[23] Walker EM, Rodriguez AI, Kohn B, et al. Acupuncture versus venlafaxine for the management of vasomotor symptoms in women with hormone receptor-positive breast cancer: a randomized controlled trial. J Clin Oncol 2010;28:634–40.

[24] Frisk J, Kallstrom AC, Wall N, et al. Acupuncture improves health-related quality-of-life (HRQoL) and sleep in women with breast cancer and hot flushes. Support Care Cancer 2012;20:715–24.

[25] Liljegren A, Gunnarsson P, Landgren BM, et al. Reducing vasomotor symptoms with acupuncture in breast cancer patients treated with adjuvant Tamsixifen: a randomized controlled trial. Breast Cancer Res Treat 2012;135:791–8.

[26] Bao T, Cai L, Snyder C, et al. patient-reported outcomes in women with breast cancer enrolled in a dual-center, double-blind, randomized controlled trial assessing the effect of acupuncture in reducing aromatase inhibitor-induced musculoskeletal symptoms. Cancer 2014;120:381–9.

[27] Hervik J, Mjåland O. Acupuncture for the treatment of hot flashes in breast cancer patients, a randomized, controlled trial. Breast Cancer Res Treat 2009;116:311–6.

[28] Hervik J, Mjåland O. Long term follow up of breast cancer patients treated with acupuncture for hot flashes. Springerplus 2014;3:1–41.

[29] Grazia Lesi GR, Assunta Musti M, Stavanello E, et al. Acupuncture as an integrative approach for the treatment of hot flashes in women with breast cancer: a prospective multicenter randomized controlled trial (AcCliMaT). J Clin Oncol 2016;34:1795–802.

[30] Crew KD, Capodice JL, Greenlee H, et al. Randomized, blinded, sham-controlled trial of acupuncture for the management of aromatase inhibitor-associated joint symptoms in women with early-stage breast cancer. J Clin Oncol 2010;28:1154–60.

[31] Bao T, Cai L, Giles JT, et al. A dual-center randomized controlled double blind trial assessing the effect of acupuncture in reducing musculoskeletal symptoms in breast cancer patients taking aromatase inhibitors. Breast Cancer Res Treat 2013;138:167–74.

[32] Oh B, Kimble B, Costa DS, et al. Acupuncture for treatment of arthralgia secondary to aromatase inhibitor therapy in women with early breast cancer: pilot study. Acupunct Med 2013;31:264–71.

[33] Giron PS, Haddad CA, Lopes da Almeida Ruzii SK, et al. Effectiveness of acupuncture in rehabilitation of physical and functional disorders of women undergoing breast cancer surgery. Support Care Cancer 2016;24:2491–6.

[34] Jane M, Beth BO, Mark D, et al. Electroacupuncture for nausea, vomiting, and myelosuppression in women receiving adjuvant chemotherapy for early breast cancer: a randomized controlled pilot trial. Med Acupunct 2012;24:241–8.

[35] PeriShan H, Xiao-min W, Guo-Wang Y, et al. Prospective randomized controlled trial of treating and preventing chemotherapy-related nausea and vomiting on breast cancer patients with ‘experienced ten acupuncture’. China J Trad Chin Med Pharm 2017;32:2805–7.

[36] Zhan Jing LC-s. Clinical observation of abdominal acupuncture combining with upper limb functional exercise in treatment of patients with breast cancer-related upper limb lymphoedema. Chin J Woman Child Health Res 2017;28:570–2.

[37] Bao T, Iris Zhu W, Vertosick EA, et al. Acupuncture for breast cancer-related lymphoedema: a randomized controlled trial. Breast Cancer Res Treat 2018;170:77–87.

[38] Greenlee H, Crew KD, Capodice J, et al. Randomized sham-controlled pilot trial of weekly electro-acupuncture for the prevention of taxane-induced peripheral neuropathy in women with early stage breast cancer. Breast Cancer Res Treat 2016;156:453–64.

[39] Tong T, Pei C, Chen J, et al. Efficacy of acupuncture therapy for chemotherapy-related cognitive impairment in breast cancer patients. Med Sci Monit 2018;24:2919–27.

[40] Zhang ZY. Clinical study of abdominal acupuncture combined with umbilical patch for acute gastrointestinal adverse reactions after chemotherapy for breast cancer. Guide China Med 2018;16:187.

[41] Chien TJ, Liu CY, Fang CJ. The effect of acupuncture in breast cancer-related lymphoedema (BCRL): a systematic review and meta-analysis. Integr Cancer Ther 2019;18:1534735419866910.

[42] Hou W, Pei L, Song Y, et al. Acupuncture therapy for breast cancer-related lymphoedema: a systematic review and meta-analysis. J Obstet Gynaecol Res 2019;45:2307–17.

[43] Chien T-J, Hsu CH, Liu CY, et al. Effect of acupuncture on hot flush and menopause symptoms in breast cancer—A systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS One 2017;12:e0180918.

[44] Wang XP, Zhang DJ, Wei XD, et al. Acupuncture for the relief of hot flashes in breast cancer patients: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials and observational studies. J Can Res Ther 2018;14(Suppl S1):600–8.

[45] Chien TJ, Liu CY, Chang YF, et al. Acupuncture for treating aromatase inhibitor-related arthralgia in breast cancer: a systematic review and meta-analysis. J Altern Complement Med 2015;21:231–60.