Evidence for an α/β T Cell-independent Mechanism of Resistance to Mycobacteria. Bacillus-Calmette-Guerin Causes Progressive Infection in Severe Combined Immunodeficient Mice, but Not in Nude Mice or in Mice Depleted of CD4⁺ and CD8⁺ T Cells

By Angelo A. Izzo and Robert J. North

From the Trudeau Institute, Saranac Lake, New York 12983

Summary

Depleting thymectomized mice of CD4⁺ T cells, or CD4⁺ plus CD8⁺ T cells, rendered them incapable of resolving Bacillus-Calmette-Guerin (BCG) infection in their livers, spleens, kidneys, and lungs. However, it did not render them incapable of stabilizing infection in the latter three organs after an initial period of BCG growth. Athymic nude mice showed a similar capacity to control BCG growth in these organs after a certain stage of infection. In contrast, congenitally severe combined immunodeficient (SCID) mice appeared to offer no resistance to BCG infection, in that the organism grew progressively in all organs of these mice and was lethal for them beginning on day 55 of infection. The results suggest that, although CD4⁺ T cells are important for resolving BCG infection, an α/β T cell-independent mechanism of resistance can be acquired at 2–3 wk of infection that is capable of inhibiting further BCG growth in all organs except the lungs. Because this mechanism is absent from SCID mice, it is likely that it depends on the functions of γ/δ T cells, B cells, or both types of cells. In keeping with this possibility is the additional finding that SCID mice engrafted with lymph node cells depleted of CD4⁺ or CD8⁺ T cells were capable of expressing an appreciable level of resistance against BCG infection.

Materials and Methods

Mice. B6D2F₁ (C3H/HeN x DBA/2) mice, BALB/c nu/nu, BALB/c nu/+ mice, C57BL/6J x DBA/2J mice, and their congenic CB-17 (H-2k) counterparts were used. All mice were between 8 and 9 wk of age when they were used in experiments. They were purchased from the Trudeau Institute Animal Breeding Facility and were known to be free of common and viral pathogens according to routine screening performed by the Research Diagnostic Laboratory, University of Missouri. The SCID mice were...
pneumocystis free as a result of having been bred from B cell- and T cell-engrafted parents (5). They were maintained in isolator cages supplied with filtered air, and were provided with sterilized food and water. Nude mice were maintained under similar conditions.

**BCG**. *Mycobacterium bovis*, strain BCG Pasteur (TMC no. 1011), was supplied by the Trudeau Institute Culture Collection as a frozen mid-log-phase culture. Before each experiment a vial was thawed, subjected to brief ultrasound, and diluted in PBS containing 0.01% Tween. It was inoculated in a dose of 2 × 10⁶ CFU in 0.2 ml PBS via a lateral tail vein. BCG was enumerated in lungs, livers, spleens, and kidneys by plating 10-fold serial dilutions of homogenates of these organs on 7H11 agar (Difco Laboratories, Detroit, MI) and counting 2–3 wk later.

**T Cell Depletion and Cytofluorometry.** B6D2F1 mice were thymectomized at 4 wk of age and used in experiments 4 wk later. 2 d before inoculating BCG the mice were injected with 0.5 mg of anti-CD4, anti-CD8, or both mAbs intravenously. On days 7, 14, 21, and 32 after BCG inoculation, mice were again injected intravenously with 0.25 mg of these mAbs. The anti-CD4 mAb was produced by clone GK1.5 (provided by Frank Fitch, University of Chicago, Chicago, IL) and the anti-CD8 mAb by clone TIB 210 (American Type Culture Collection, Rockville, MD) growing as ascites in immunodepressed mice. Anti-Thy-1.2 mAb was produced by clone 30.H.12 (American Type Culture Collection). The mAbs were purified as described previously (6). The extent of T cell depletion was determined at progressive stages of infection by subjecting spleen cells to cytofluorometric analysis on a FACSscan™cytofluorometer (Becton Dickinson & Co., Mountain View, CA) after incubating them in FITC-conjugated F(ab')² fragments of anti-Thy-1.2, anti-CD4, or anti-CD8 mAb. Preparation of F(ab')² fragments and their conjugation to FITC was as described previously (6). Dead cells were stained with propidium iodide and excluded from calculations done on 3,000 events.

**Engrafting of SCID Mice with Lymphoid Cells.** In one experiment, SCID mice were engrafted with 10⁷ lymph node cells from CB-17 mice, or from CB-17 mice depleted of CD4⁺ T cells or CD8⁺ T cells by treatment with anti-T cell subset mAbs as described above. The mAbs were given to the CB-17 donors 2 d before harvesting their popliteal, axillary, brachial superior, and mesenteric node cells. 2 d after infusing SCID recipient mice with CB-17 lymph node cells, the recipients were themselves infused with 0.5 mg of the appropriate anti-T cell subset mAb to eliminate any T cells that survived mAb treatment in the donors. After a further 3 d, they were inoculated intravenously with 2 × 10⁶ BCG, as were appropriate SCID and CB-17 controls.

**Results**

**Failure of BCG to Grow Progressively in Mice Depleted of T Cells with mAbs.** Fig. 1 shows the growth of BCG in the lungs, spleens, kidneys, and lumps of immunocompetent control mice, thymectomized control mice, and thymectomized mice depleted of CD4⁺ T cells alone, or CD4⁺ plus CD8⁺ T cells by treatment with anti-T cell subset mAbs as described above. It can be seen that after ~20 d of BCG growth, immunocompetent mice, but not T cell-depleted mice, began progressively resolving infection in their livers, spleens, and kidneys. However, although incapable of resolving infection in these organs, mice depleted of CD4⁺ or both T cell subsets were nevertheless capable of preventing further BCG growth after day 20 of infection. Consequently, the infection was stabilized until the experiment was terminated on day 80. This was not the case in the lungs, however, in that BCG grew progressively in this organ in mice depleted of CD4⁺ or both subsets of T cells while it was being inactivated in control mice. Fig. 1 also shows that thymectomized control mice were deficient in their capacity to deal with infection in all organs, in that the rate of resolution of infection was slower than in controls. It was found, in addition (result not presented), that treating thymectomized mice with anti-CD8 did not significantly reduce their ability to resist BCG infection in any organ. Therefore, CD4⁺ T cells, rather than CD8⁺ T cells, are involved in resolution of BCG infection.

**Efficiency of T Cell Depletion by mAbs.** The foregoing results showing that mice depleted of CD4⁺ T cells, or both subsets of T cells, retain an appreciable capacity to stabilize infection after ~20 d of progressive BCG growth could mean that T cell subset depletion was not complete. This was investigated by subjecting spleen cells of mAb-treated mice to cytofluorometric analysis. The results in Table 1 show that in infected immunocompetent mice and in infected thymectomized mice, 9.4% and 6.3%, respectively, of spleen cells on day 40 of infection were CD4⁺ T cells. In contrast, only 0.3–0.4% of spleen cells were CD4⁺ in thymectomized mice repeatedly treated with anti-CD4 mAb or with both mAbs. Treatment with both mAbs reduced the number of CD8⁺ T cells to a level that was not detectable by cytofluorometry. Thus, it is apparent that depletion of CD4⁺ and CD8⁺ T cells was essentially complete in terms of the per-
Table 1.  *Cytfluorometric Assessment of T Cell Subset Depletion in B6D2F1 Control and Day 40 BCG-infected Mice*

| Treatment                        | Thy-1* | CD4*  | CD8*  | All cells |
|----------------------------------|--------|-------|-------|-----------|
| Uninfected control               | 16.7 (15.2) | 10.3 (9.38) | 5.8 (5.29) | 118 |
| Uninfected thym. control         | 16.8 (11.2) | 14.4 (9.6)  | 7.8 (5.2)  | 150 |
| Infected control                 | 70.8 (13.3) | 50.0 (9.4)  | 17.0 (3.2) | 532 |
| Infected thym. control           | 37.4 (10.0) | 23.6 (6.3)  | 9.3 (2.5)  | 374 |
| Infected thym. given αCD4$^+$     | 8.3 (4.2)  | 0.6 (0.3)   | 7.1 (3.6)  | 198 |
| Infected thym. given αCD4$^+$ αCD8$^+$ | 8.5 (2.3)  | 1.5 (0.4)   | (0)$^t$    | 368 |

* F(ab')2-FITC reagents were used for cytofluorometry.
$^t$ Thymectomy was performed when mice were 4 wk old, 4 wk before infection.
$^{\$}$ 0.5 mg of mAb was given 2 d before infection with 2 x 10⁶ BCG cells, and this was followed by injection of 0.25 mg mAb on days 7, 14, 21, and 32.
$^{\dagger}$ Level was below that of detection using the FACScan® cytofluorometer.

The ability of athymic nude mice to acquire resistance to BCG infection. As shown above, thymectomized mice repeatedly treated with anti-CD4 and anti-CD8 mAbs, although ~99% depleted of CD4$^+$ and CD8$^+$ T cells on day 40 of infection, were nevertheless capable of preventing further growth of BCG in their livers, spleens, and kidneys after day 20 of infection. It was anticipated, therefore, that the same result would be obtained with 8-wk-old athymic nude mice, which possess a very small number of α/β T cells (7, 8), apparently few of which are functionally normal in vivo and in vitro (9-11). As shown in Fig. 2, athymic nude mice were capable of greatly reducing any further growth of BCG in their livers, spleens, and kidneys, although not in their lungs, after about day 20 of infection. This resulted in an approximate plateauing of BCG growth in all organs except the lungs from day 20 to day 60 of infection when the experiment was terminated. In contrast, syngeneic euthymic mice were able to resolve infection progressively in all organs starting between days 10 and 20.

Progressive lethal growth of BCG in SCID mice but not in SCID mice engrafted with lymph node cells depleted of CD4$^+$ and CD8$^+$ T cells. The foregoing results show that mice depleted of CD4$^+$ and CD8$^+$ T cells, and nude mice, can acquire a mechanism of resistance capable of restricting the growth of BCG after a certain stage of infection. It could be suggested as an argument against this interpretation, however, that in the absence of T cell–mediated immunity BCG growth is eventually self limiting in liver, spleen, and kidney, but not in lung. This possibility was investigated by following the growth of BCG in SCID mice that are devoid of functional T cells (including γ/δ T cells) and consequently possess...
no capacity to resist infection with a range of pathogenic and nonpathogenic organisms. The results in Fig. 3 show unequivocally that BCG grew progressively with little interruption in all organs of SCID mice until the experiment was terminated on day 60. These mice began dying of infection after day 55. Therefore, the growth of BCG in the liver, spleen, and kidney of mice is not self limiting in vivo.

On the other hand, SCID mice engrafted with lymph node cells from CB-17 donors were capable of expressing an appreciable level of resistance against BCG infection. This was the case, moreover, even with lymph node cells from CB-17 mice that had been essentially depleted of CD4+ or CD8+ T cells. This can be seen in Fig. 4, which shows the results of an attempt to provide SCID mice with a capacity to resist infection with $2 \times 10^6$ BCG by infusing them with $10^7$ lymph node cells from normal CB-17 mice or from CB-17 mice depleted of CD4+ or CD8+ T cells by treatment with anti-CD4 or anti-CD8 mAb 2 d before transfer. At the time of transfer, lymph node cells of anti-CD4-treated or anti-CD8-treated CB-17 donors contained <0.1% CD4+ T cells and an undetectable number of CD8+ T cells, respectively. Moreover, in this experiment, recipient SCID mice were themselves treated with anti-CD4 or anti-CD8 mAbs in order to destroy any CD4+ or CD8+ T cells that escaped destruction in the donors. It is obvious from Fig. 4 that lymph node cells depleted of CD4+ T cells, although less protective at day 40 of infection than total lymph node cells, nevertheless provided SCID recipients with a substantial capacity to resist infection in all organs except the lungs. Indeed, the numbers of BCG in the organs of engrafted SCID recipients on day 40 is in keeping with the interpretation that CD-17 donors contained $0.5 \text{ mg}$, respectively, 2 d before death. In this experiment SCID recipients showed a reduced, although appreciable, capacity to protect SCID mice against infection in their kidneys, livers, and spleens, although not in their lungs. Lymph node cells depleted of CD8+ T cells were almost as protective as control lymph node cells. Data are means of five mice per group.

Figure 3. Evidence that BCG infection was progressive in all organs of SCID mice. In CB-17 congenic mice, in contrast, infection underwent progressive resolution in all organs after 2-3 wk of BCG growth.

Discussion
This study shows that CD4+ T cells, rather than CD8+ T cells, are needed by mice to resolve intravenous infection with BCG. However, it shows in addition, that at a certain stage of infection, mice depleted of CD4+ T cells alone, or of both subsets of T cells, acquired the ability to prevent further growth of BCG in their livers, spleen, and kidneys, although not in their lungs, for a protracted period of time. A similar ability to stabilize infection was acquired by athymic nude mice. Stabilization of infection was not the result of self-limiting growth of BCG in vivo, because the organism grew progressively without interruption in all organs of SCID mice, and was lethal for these mice beginning on about day 55 of infection. Therefore, cells exist in mice depleted of CD4+ and CD8+ T cells, and in nude mice, but not in SCID mice, that can stabilize BCG infection after 2-3 wk of progressive BCG growth. Because $\gamma/\delta$ T cells and B cells are possessed by the former mice, but not the latter, it seems reasonable to suggest that either or both of these cell types were involved in the resistance observed. A suggested role for $\gamma/\delta$ T cells is supported by published evidence showing that

Figure 4. Result of attempt to provide SCID mice with the capacity to control or resolve BCG infection by infusing them intravenously with $10^7$ lymph node cells from CB-17 mice, or from CB-17 mice depleted of CD4+ or CD8+ T cells by treatment with anti-CD4 or anti-CD8 mAbs (0.5 mg), respectively, 2 d before death. In this experiment SCID recipients of lymph node cells depleted of CD4+, or CD8+ T cells, were themselves treated with anti-CD4 or anti-CD8 mAb (0.5 mg), respectively, 2 d after cell transfer, and were inoculated intravenously with $2 \times 10^6$ BCG cells 3 d later. Whole lymph node cells provided SCID mice with an impressive capacity to resist BCG infection, in that by day 40 they showed about the same ability as CB-17 donors to inactivate BCG in their lungs, kidneys, livers, and spleens. Lymph node cells depleted of CD4+ T cells showed a reduced, although appreciable, capacity to protect SCID mice against infection in their kidneys, livers, and spleens, although not in their lungs. Lymph node cells depleted of CD8+ T cells were almost as protective as control lymph node cells. Data are means of five mice per group.
a proportion of $\gamma/\delta$ T cells are specific for mycobacterial antigens, including epitopes of the highly conserved 60-kD heat-shock protein (12–15). However, a role for B cells also needs to be considered, because in spite of past failures to transfer antimycobacterial resistance with serum antibodies (16, 17), it is possible that these cells serve to secrete relevant lymphokines and to act as APC at sites of infection. Studies designed to investigate the roles of $\gamma/\delta$ T cells and B cells based on lymphocyte engraftment experiments with SCID mice are currently in progress in this laboratory. The initial results of these studies presented here clearly show that SCID mice engrafted with $\sim 10^7$ lymph node cells from naive congenic CB-17 donors displayed an almost normal capacity to resolve BCG infection. Infection results show, in addition, that an appreciable level of resistance was expressed in SCID mice engrafted with lymph node cells from CB-17 donors depleted of CD4$^+$ or CD8$^+$ T cells. Indeed, when examined at day 21 of infection, SCID mice so engrafted contained no detectable CD4$^+$ or CD8$^+$ T cells. Thus, it seems likely that this model will allow successful analysis of the cellular basis of antimycobacterial immunity.

None of the evidence presented here contradicts evidence published by others (3, 4) showing that CD4$^+$ T cells play an important role in defense against BCG infection. On the contrary, our results support an important role for this subset of $\alpha/\beta$ T cells in resistance to BCG. However, their main purpose is to show that a CD4$^+$ T cell–independent mechanism of defense can be called on by the host to combat infection with this organism. Indeed, an examination of the results of T cell depletion studies published by others (3) shows quite clearly that thymectomized mice treated with anti-CD4 mAb, although deficient in their capacity to resolve BCG infection, retained a capacity to stabilize infection and to even begin resolving infections after a delay. This is entirely in keeping with the data presented here. Unfortunately, it is not possible to know in the case of this published study whether the onset of resolution of infection was the result of incomplete depletion of targeted CD4$^+$ T cells, because the results of cytofluorometric analysis at the time of resolution of infection were not presented. In the case of the study presented here, repeated treatment with anti-CD4 mAb was shown to result in essentially complete depletion of CD4$^+$ T cells, in that the treated mice possessed only 1.2% of the splenic CD4$^+$ T cells possessed by control mice at day 40 of infection. However, because infection caused a large increase in the cellularity of the spleen, the 99% depletion of CD4$^+$ T cells still left mice with $6 \times 10^5$ of these T cells on day 40, a number that cannot be disregarded. It should be brought to mind in this connection, however, that, unlike the repertoire of B cells, which is based to an appreciable extent on somatic hypermutation in Ig V region genes, the repertoire of T cells is relatively fixed after immunologic maturation (18). Therefore, it is likely that few of the 0.3–0.4% CD4$^+$ T cells that existed in anti-CD4-treated thymectomized mice at the beginning of infection were specific for BCG. Indeed, because anti-CD4 mAb was given repeatedly during infection it should have resulted in the repeated destruction of any CD4$^+$ T cells that multiplied in response to infection. Moreover, nude mice that are known to possess only very small absolute numbers of CD8$^+$ and CD4$^+$ T cells, presumably few of which are capable of expressing $\alpha/\beta$ TCRs (7, 8) and of functioning normally in vivo (9, 10) or in vitro (11), gave the same results as T cell–depleted mice. Therefore, the results support the interpretation that CD4$^+$ T cells are not needed for stabilization of BCG infection in the liver, spleen, and kidneys after 2–3 wk of progressive BCG growth. These results with nude mice are in agreement with growth curves published some years ago by others, which on examination show that nude mice (19, 20) and neonatally thymectomized mice (17), although incapable of resolving infection, were capable of restricting BCG growth to a considerable extent in their livers and spleen after a certain stage of infection. The results presented here showing that SCID mice engrafted with lymph node cells depleted of CD4$^+$ T cells are capable of expressing a substantial level of anti-BCG resistance support this conclusion.

It needs to be emphasized that although mice depleted of CD4$^+$ T cells, nude mice, and SCID mice engrafted with CD4$^+$ T cell–depleted lymphoid cells were capable of gaining control of BCG infection in their livers, spleens, and kidneys, they were much less capable of controlling infection in their lungs. Indeed, the results suggest that CD4$^+$ T cells are essential for the control, as well as the resolution, of BCG infection in the lungs. This indicates that the $\alpha/\beta$ T cell–independent mechanism of resistance that exists in other organs may not exist in the lungs. In this regard it has been noted repeatedly over the years that the lung is the most susceptible organ to infection with BCG and M. tuberculosis (22).

In conclusion, this study draws attention to the antimycobacterial resistance that remains in mice in the absence of CD4$^+$ and CD8$^+$ T cells, rather than to the resistance that is lost. Given that the resistance that remains is relatively powerful, and the possibility that it is mediated by $\gamma/\delta$ T cells specific for mycobacterial antigens, it cannot be ignored in any analysis of the cellular basis of antimycobacterial immunity.

We thank Linda Schaefer, Debra Duso, Ron LaCourse, and Lynn Ryan for their technical assistance, and Mary Durett for typing this manuscript.

This work was supported by a grant from the Trudeau Institute.

Address correspondence to Angelo A. Izzo, Trudeau Institute, Inc., P.O. Box 59, Saranac Lake, NY 12983.

Received for publication 20 April 1992.
References

1. Lefford, M.J. 1975. Transfer of adoptive immunity in mice. Infect. Immun. 11:1174.

2. Orme, I.M., and F.M. Collins. 1983. Protection against Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection by adoptive immunotherapy. Requirement for T cell-deficient recipients. J. Exp. Med. 158:74.

3. Pedrazzini, T., K. Hug, and J.A. Louis. 1987. Importance of L3T4+ and Lyt-2+ cells in the immunologic control of infection with Mycobacterium bovis strain Bacillus Calmette-Guerin in mice. Assessment of elimination of T cell subsets in vivo. J. Immunol. 139:2032.

4. Leveton, C., S. Bamass, B. Champion, S. Lucas, B. DeSouza, M. Nicol, D. Banerjac, and G. Rook. 1989. T cell-mediated protection of mice against virulent Mycobacterium tuberculosis. Infect. Immun. 57:390.

5. Harmsen, A.G., and M. Stankiewicz. 1990. Requirement for CD4+ cells in resistance to Pneumocystis carinii pneumonia in mice. J. Exp. Med. 172:937.

6. Dunn, P.L., and R.J. North. 1991. Selective radiation resistance of immunologically induced T cells as the basis for irradiation-induced T cell-mediated regression of immunogenic tumor. J. Leukocyte Biol. 49:388.

7. Kishihara, K., Y. Yoshikai, G. Matsuzaki, T.W. Mak, and K. Nomoto. 1987. Functional α and β T cell chain receptor messages can be detected in old but not in young athymic mice. Eur. J. Immunol. 17:477.

8. Yoshikai, Y., M.D. Reis, and T.W. Mak. 1986. Athymic mice express a high level of functional γ-chain but greatly reduced levels of α- and β-chain T cell-receptor messages. Nature (Lond.). 324:482.

9. Manning, D.D., N.D. Reed, and C.F. Shaffer. 1973. Maintenance of skin xenografts of widely divergent phylogenetic origin on congenitally athymic (nude) mice. J. Exp. Med. 138:488.

10. Kindred, B. 1979. Nude mice in immunology. Prog. Allergy. 26:137.

11. Kung, J.T., and C.A. Thomas. 1988. Athymic nude CD4+8- T cells produce IL-2 but fail to proliferate in response to mitogenic stimuli. J. Immunol. 141:3691.

12. Janis, E.M., S.H.E. Kaufmann, R.H. Schwartz, and D.M. Pardoll. 1989. Activation of γδ T cells in the primary response to Mycobacterium tuberculosis. Science (Wash. DC). 244:713.

13. Augustin, A., R.T. Kubo, and G.-K. Sim. 1989. Resident pulmonary lymphocytes expressing the γδ T-cell receptor. Nature (Lond.). 340:239.

14. Rajasekar, R., G.-K Sim, and A. Augustin. 1990. Self heat shock and γδ T-cell reactivity. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 87:3767.

15. Matsis, L. 1991. Specificity and selection of gamma-delta receptor-expressing T cells. Immunol. Rev. 105:3.

16. Lefford, M.J., D.D. McGregor, and G.B. Mackaness. 1973. Immune response to Mycobacterium tuberculosis in rats. Infect. Immun. 8:182.

17. Reggiardo, Z., and G. Middlebrook. 1974. Failure of passive serum transfer of immunity against aerogenic tuberculosis in rabbits. Proc. Soc. Exp. Biol. Med. 145:173.

18. Hackett, J., C. Stebbings, B. Rogerson, M.M. Davis, and U. Storb. 1992. Analysis of a T cell receptor gene as a target of the somatic hypermutation mechanism. J. Exp. Med. 176:225.

19. Takeya, K., K. Nomoto, S. Muraoka, S. Shimotori, T. Taniguchi, and T. Miyake. 1977. Growth of two strains of Mycobacterium bovis (BCG) in athymic mice. J. Gen. Microbiol. 100:403.

20. Sher, N.A., S.D. Chaparas, L.E. Greenberg, E.B. Merchant, and J.H. Vickers. 1975. Response of congenitally athymic (nude) mice to infection with Mycobacterium bovis (strain BCG). J. Natl. Cancer Inst. 54:1419.

21. Takeya, K., R. Mori, K. Nomoto, and H. Nakayama. 1967. Experimental mycobacterial infections in neonatally thymectomized mice. Am. Rev. Resp. Dis. 96:469.

22. Pierce, C.H., R.J. Dubos, and W.B. Schaeffer. 1953. Multiplication and survival of tubercle bacilli in the organs of mice. J. Exp. Med. 97:189.