Elegance in the Song Lyric: A Study of Zhang Yan's Poetics from Western Perspectives

Duan Lian, Williams College

中文提要: 本文旨在探讨南宋词人及批评家张炎的词学理论。张炎词学以“清空”为中心，而“清空”的目的则是“雅”化。在宋词的发展历程中，雅化是主导倾向，这一倾向揭示了南宋文化的一个重要方面，即文化的内向。

Zhang Yan 張炎 (1248 – 1320)，the song lyric writer and poetic theorist of the Southern Song (1127 – 1279)，born in Lin'an (present – day Hangzhou, Zhejiang, China)，left behind two works: a collection of his song lyrics, *Shanzhong baiyun ci* (The Song Lyrics of the White Clouds in the Mountains) and a poetic treatise, *Ciyan* (Fount of the Song Lyric). Written between 1297 and 1307, *Ciyan* consists of 2 chapters, with 14 passages in each. The first chapter considers musical aspects in the song lyric, and the second considers poetics. In *Ciyan*, Zhang Yan promoted the poetic concept *qingkong* 清空 (transparency)，and advocated his poetic ideal *ya* 雅 (elegance). Transparency indicates the trend of elegance in the development of the song lyric, and this trend discloses an important aspect of the Southern Song culture, the tendency to turn inward. The purpose of this article is to explore the significance of Zhang Yan’s poetics, particularly its historical and cultural significance.
I. Explicating the Notion

In the passage “Miscellaneous Comments” in Ciyuan, Zhang Yan stressed that “The song lyric should be elegant and proper; it is where the heart’s intent goes.” To Zhang Yan, the intention in writing Ciyuan and promoting the concept transparency is to restore the poetic ideal of elegance. At the beginning of “Introduction” to Ciyuan, Zhang Yan wrote, “All the musical pieces, music bureau poems, musical ballads, and musical poems of the ancient time, originated from the elegant tradition.” At the end of the introductory passage, he added, “I sigh over the decline of the ancient music patterns and the loss of the elegant tradition of the song lyric poetry.” Clearly, Zhang Yan took the restoration of the lost ideal of elegance in the song lyric as his mission.

In Ciyuan, Zhang Yan used a few terms for elegance, ya 雅, saoya 象雅 (archaic elegance), guya 古雅 (ancient elegance), and yazheng 雅正 (orthodox elegance). As I will articulate soon, archaic elegance and ancient elegance refer to the same: the orthodox elegance. In other words, Zhang Yan’s notion of elegance is the orthodox elegance of the ancient time. Elegance is not a term Zhang Yan himself created, but a term widely used by the song lyric writers of the Song dynasty before Zhang Yan. A writer of the Northern Song, Moqi Yong 萬俟詠 (dates unknown) first used the term to label his song lyrics as yaci 雅詞, elegant song lyrics. Since then, using this term to name anthologies and collections of song lyrics had become fashionable, such as the names of Yuefu yaci 樂府雅詞 (Elegant Song Lyrics in the Music Bureau Style), Fuya geci 復雅歌詞 (Song Lyrics Returned to Elegance), Dianya ci 典雅詞 (Song Lyrics of Elegance), and so forth.

The notion of elegance originally concerned with musicality and tune patterns in the song lyric; Zhang Yan re-connoted it and used it not only for music, but also for the discussion of the lyric and its refinement. The o-
The original meaning of elegance can be traced back to as early as the time of Shijing. In the early times before the end of the Han dynasty (206 BCE – 220 AD), elegance was a notion for the archaic sound of the local dialect in central China. Since central China was the place where the oldest royal court was located, elegance also indicated the standard and correct pronunciation of the Chinese language, which was based on the local sound of central China. The territory of the first dynasty of China, the Xia (2550 BCE – 2140 BCE), was in present day central China, and the capital of the Western Zhou, Fenggao, was located in the territory of the ancient Xia. The Western Zhou scholar Mao Chang 萬錦 considered that the Xia was central and the sound of the Xia was standard and correct. The meaning of being archaic and being correct can be found in Mao Chang's Maoshi xu, the Great Preface to Shijing: "To speak of the affairs of the whole world and to describe customs (feng) common to all places is called Ya [elegance]. Ya means 'proper' (zheng). These show the source of either flourishing or ruin in the royal government." According to this preface, the royal government had the sole right and power to speak of the affairs of China, and only the sound of the royal court was authoritative, correct, and standard. On the one hand, the archaic pronunciation in central China was different from the other local dialects, and on the other, the correct and standard sound in central China represented all the local dialects in the Chinese language. During the Han dynasty, the notion of elegance denoted grand, graceful, exquisite and tasteful style in literature and refined manner in general; it was related to the standard stylistic quality of the fu (grand rhapsody), the mainstream literary genre of the Han. According to scholars in China, the notion of elegance experienced an evolution from sound connoted in early Han to stylistic and aesthetic connoted in Eastern Han (25 AD – 220 AD). The stylistic and aesthetic connotation of elegance refers to the grandness of a literary work in its descriptive manner.
and presentation of subject, and is related to the orthodox morality of the Han court. Such a new connotation has dominated the interpretation of elegance ever since.

Aesthetically, in discussion of the history of Chinese literature, elegance is often accompanied by its opposite, vulgarity, su, which originally refers to the quality or characteristic of folk songs and popular songs, such as the “colloquialisms and banal clichés.” The majority of the poems in Shijing are folk songs; they are categorized as feng. As defined in Maoshi xu, the poems about “the affairs of a single state, rooted in [the experience of] a single person are called Feng.” It is said that Confucius edited Shijing and cut the anthology from more than three thousand poems to three hundred and five. Confucius’ standard of editing came from the morality of the Zhou court; he dropped the vulgar songs, such as those with explicit erotic expressions. Due to the lack of evidence, Confucius’ editing is just an assumption; as alleged by Sima Qian (ca. 145 – 85 BCE), Confucius gave the new anthology an important place in his curriculum; thus, Shijing became one of the fundamental texts of Confucian education. Once Shijing is edited, the folk songs of the feng are no longer considered to be vulgar but elegant, because the editorial work is a process of refinement, and the 305 selected poems represent the standard morality of the Zhou court and Confucian ideology, which has been officially regarded as the central, authoritative and correct morality in Chinese culture since Han dynasty.

Discussing Zhang Yan’s notion of elegance, some contemporary scholars in the West had suggestive views. Xinda Lian argued that Zhang Yan’s elegance meant to return to the tradition of “shi yan zhi” (poetry expresses intent) as well as to avoid becoming “a slave of emotion.” Lian is correct that Zhang Yan emphasized the restrained expression of feeling, which is essential to the notion of elegance. Lian’s conclusive interpretation of elegance is suggestive to our understanding of Zhang Yan’s poetics: “The fact
that Zhang Yan resorted to the authorities of the classics of Confucian poetics again and again shows that his idea about elegance was not just a conception of poetic artifice, but also a moral and ethical one.

This interpretation touches on the keystone of Zhang Yan's re-connotation of elegance, not just turning from musical-oriented to aesthetic-oriented connotation alone: Zhang Yan stressed not only the poetic craft but also the politics of allegorical implication in the song lyric.

By using the term politics here I refer to the Confucian morality tied to the rise and fall of a nation. When talking about music with his disciples, Confucius once said, “I detest the music of Zheng, which sullies the elegant music.”

Confucius' statement about his taste placed the music of Zheng in an opposite position of elegance. Zheng was one of the many small states or kingdoms in the Spring and Autumn period (770 BCE - 476 BCE), and the music of Zheng is considered to be decadent, obscene, and unhealthy. In the Confucian canon Liji, Confucius' above opinion is explained: "the music of Zheng and Wei is the music of a nation in a chaotic time."

The decadent songs do not have a healthy tone of a rising nation, to the Southern Song intellectuals, the song lyrics of the late Northern Song were not too far from the music of Zheng and Wei, and they were tied to the fall of the Northern Song. A Southern Song poet critic Tongyang Jushi 同陽居士 (dates unknown) in his preface to Fuya geci praised the song lyrics of the early Southern Song for the reason that they represented the rise of a new nation in the South.

Speaking of the song lyrics of his time, Tongyang Jushi stressed the correspondence between the rise of the new nation and the force of elegance in the song lyrics, he further stated that these lyric works "contain the interest of the archaic elegance."

In this sense, elegance is a notion with political implications. As we know, Zhang Yan lived in the time from the end of Southern Song to the beginning of the Yuan rule. Although Zhang Yan is neither a military man
nor an active resister, he is not a cooperator with the new ruler either. The decadent music would remind Zhang Yan of the sadness of the fall of the dynasty, and perhaps that is why he advocated the elegant tradition in the song lyric and set it as the poetic goal to pursue.

In addition to the instillation of moral and political implication in elegance, the development of this notion should not be neglected. A Qing scholar and poet Zhu Yizun 朱彝尊 (1629 – 1709) offered an insightful observation on this issue:

People say that one must praise the song lyric of the Northern Song; however, only in the Southern Song did the song lyric reach the ultimate craft, and only at the end of the Song did it reach the ultimate transformation. Jiang Yaozhang [Jiang Kui] is the most outstanding [song lyric writer].

Discussing the achievement of the song lyric towards the late Southern Song, another Qing scholar Wang Sen 汪森 (1653 – 1726) also made an insightful observation on the contributions made by a group of song lyric writers:

Jiang Kui of Poyang emerged, with lapidary verses and refined words that return to purity and elegance. Thereupon Shi Dazu and Gao Guanguo flanked him on either side. Zhang Ji and Wu Wenyeng took him as master first, and Zhao Yifu, Jiang Jie, Zhou Mi, Chen Yunheng, Wang Yisun, Zhang Yan and Zhang Zhu studied him afterwards.

Zhu Yizun and Wang Sen were aware that refinement was a means to reach the poetic ideal of elegance; they regarded the style and aesthetics of those lyric writers as the model for the genre. As Pauline Yu interpreted, the elegant refinement of the song lyric in the course of its generic development “aims to valorize the song lyric vis-à-vis the dominant shih [shi] form, but, even more important, to establish a distinctive and central tradi-
tion within the genre of "tz'u [song lyric] itself." It is in this sense I consider that Zhang Yan's notion of elegance is in accordance with a historical trend in the evolution of the song lyric: the trend of elegance. By using the term "trend of elegance", I mean that being elegant is the mainstream in the development of the song lyric.

II. The Trend of Elegance in Lyric Practice

To elaborate the opinion about the trend of elegance, it is necessary to turn to the song lyric itself and examine its change and development in certain respects. A contemporary scholar, Marsha L. Wagner conducted a study investigating the oral origin of the song lyric found in the Dunhuang (Tun-huang) manuscripts. According to her study, due to the unrefined language and the direct expression, these popular songs of High Tang are considered vulgar. One such song to the tune Quetashi sings:

I can't stand the wily magpie and all his extravagant stories! / He brings me good news, but what proof does he ever have? / One of these times when he flies by, I'll grab him, capture him live, / Shut him up in a golden cage to put a stop to his chatter! / With the best intentions I went to her, delivered my good news - / Who'd have thought she'd shut me up in a golden cage? / I only hope her Soldier's husband comes home soon / So she'll lift me up, turn me loose to head for the blue clouds!

叵耐雀多少謬語, / 送喜何曾有憑據? / 几度飛來活捉取, / 鎖上金籠休共語。/ 比擬好心來送喜, / 誰知鎖我在金籠里。/ 欲他征夫早歸來, / 騰身卻放我向青雲里。

In this folk song, the use of rough words, such as the opening word ponai叵耐 (wily), the straightforward expression of feelings of both the woman and the bird, and the dialogue style show the vulgarity of this song. Kang-i Sun Chang's translation of the first line, "Damn! The magpie often
lies"®, grasped the nature of the vulgarity in the original language, which is the woman's curse upon the bird. As for the meaning of vulgarity in popular songs, Marsha Wagner explained, “Characteristics of oral poetry such as repetition of images, colloquial diction, stock themes, straightforward expression of emotion, dramatic narrative, dialogue and direct speech, abrupt transitions, and fragmentary structure all abound in these texts.” Similarly, discussing this popular song, Kang-yi Sun Chang emphasized the dialogue form as a characteristic of the vulgarity although she didn’t use the exact term “vulgarity”. In Chang’s terminology, popular song and folk song refer to the same thing, and popularity has much in common with vulgarity. From this point of view, in addition to the use of language, Chang also differentiated the popular songs from literati’s lyrics in the respects of subject matter and mode of expression. She wrote:

The obvious difference of subject matter between the literati tz'u [song lyric] and the popular tz'u songs points to a more basic difference regarding the modes of poetic expression. Whereas the literati tz'u songs are characterized almost exclusively by the lyrical mode, the popular songs contain a variety of modes—narrative, dramatic, and lyrical. In fact, a major portion of the Tun-huang [Dunhuang] songs is narrative, or dramatic, rather than lyrical, in nature. Chang regarded literati’s lyrical mode as “a sustained expression of the poet’s emotions, felt in the present, such that external realities are shaped and molded to form part of the artistic world of the self and the present.” Chang’s words about the sustained expression of emotions correspond to Zhang Yan’s call for a restrained expression of feelings. In this sense, literati’s songs are polished and more refined in the aspect of representation, and the popular songs are not.

According to Wagner, popular songs, especially the “songs of lotus boat”, played an essential role in the origin of the song lyric. Mean-
while, as for the development of the song lyric, the songs of courtesans and singing girls in the entertainment quarters made a significant contribution, which promulgated the popular songs. Wagner observed:

Without the Southern singing girls' tradition, the development of tz'u poetry by literati would not have been possible. The popular songs from which tz'u originated were promulgated by the courtesans and other musical entertainers. There is ample evidence that the literati learned the tz'u song form through prolonged and close contact with the singing girls who had mastered the popular style. 

Interestingly, in the preface to the first anthology of the song lyrics by literati, *Huajian ji*, Ouyang Jiong 欧陽炯 (896 – 971) tried to downplay the connection between the popular songs and the literati song lyrics, and tried to differentiate the two. In Wagner’s opinion, the reason why Ouyang Jiong tried to do so is that Ouyang Jiong wanted to promote the acceptance of the song lyrics in both the form and content as a respectable literary genre. Furthermore, Ouyang Jiong “attempted to elevate the social status of the tu'z by denying its connections with the entertainment world, by declaring that the singing girls should adopt the literati style and discard their inferior ‘songs of the lotus boat’.”

It seems that the realization of elegance came from an interaction between the works of literati and the works of singing girls or courtesans. Wagner saw this interaction and remarked:

When scholar-officials visit the entertainment district of Chang – an [Chang’an, present-day Xi’an] or the southern cities, they participate with the courtesans, in the composition of tz'u; as the singing girls learn the refined diction and sophisticated rhyming techniques from the literati, the wen-jen [literati] in turn acquire a refreshingly simple directness and musical lyricism from their imitations of courtesan songs.

Such an interaction made the elevation of the song lyric possible. As
for the trend of elegance in the early times of the development of the song lyric, two literatus poets before the Song dynasty, Wen Tingyun 溫庭筠 (812? - 866) and Wei Zhuang 韋莊 (836 - 910), played important roles. Wen Tingyun, in a way, started the aesthetics of femininity in the song lyric as mainstream, while Wei Zhuang contributed to a stylistic innovation within the mainstream. As for the importance of the two poets to the development of the song lyric, Wagner pointed out that, after them, the later poets followed the style of these highly established poets to write song lyrics rather than following the style of the popular songs. Another scholar Robin Yates, in his study of the role that Wei Zhuang played in the refinement and development of the song lyric, made a more specific observation: "Wei's style of plain, simple language expressing deep personal emotion continued to exercise profound influence on later generations of poets. And eventually the lyric came to be accepted by the literati as a legitimate form." Referring to Wagner and Yates, I am confronted with a question: at the early stage of the lyric development, what is the formal difference, such as the use of language, between the literati's song lyrics and the popular songs? To answer this question, I shall consult Yates again. Comparing with Dunhuang popular songs, Yates analyzed the third piece of a lyric series to the tune "Pusa man" by Wei Zhuang:

Yet now I remember the pleasures of Jiangnan; Young was I then and my spring gown sheer. / I'd rein in my charger on a hump-backed bridge/ For red sleeves beckoned from every building. / Behind halcyon screens with gold hinges/ I'd spend the night sprawled drunk in a thicket of flowers. / This time, if I see a flowering branch/ I swear I will not go home until my head's all white.

如今卻憶江南樂, / 時年少春衫薄。/ 騎馬倚斜橋, / 滿樓紅袖招。/ 翠屏金屈曲, / 醉人花叢宿。/ 此度見花枝, / 白頭暫不歸。
This is a song lyric written in the voice of an old man, about his past and present, about his regret and feelings. Yates observed:

The structure is narrative, so the meaning flows effortlessly from one line to another, and the language is plain and simple, though more refined and elegant than the popular song. He also speaks directly and unambiguously to his audience — but not, in this instance, in direct speech.

According to Yates, Wei Zhuang’s song lyric possesses some characteristics of popular songs as well as that of literati’s, such as narrative structure and simple language on the one hand, and less direct speech but more refined expression on the other. As for the similarity between Wei Zhuang’s song lyrics and the popular songs, the colloquial language used in the above can be regarded as a good example, such as the words rujin 如今 (now) and jiangnan le 江南樂 (pleasure of Jiangnan) in the first line, and dangshi 達時 (then) in the second line. These words by themselves can hardly be seen as vulgar, but when they are read within the context of this song lyric, their colloquial tones can be sensed in their interactions with the other words, such as the word dangshi in comparison with rujin and in contrast with its succeeding words. In the first case, the sense of colloquialism in dangshi is reinforced by its counterpart rujin, both are colloquial; and in the second case the colloquialism is reinforced by the contrast to the opposite words, especially, by nianshao 年少 (young) that is not a colloquial but formal expression. Similarly, Wei Zhuang’s use of verbs, such as qi 騁 (rein) in the third line, zhao 招 (beckoned) in the fourth line, and shi 誓 (swear) in the last line are somewhat colloquial as well. However, as for the difference between Wei Zhuang’s lyrics and the popular songs, his refined language is also a good example, such as chunshan bo 春衫薄 (spring gown sheer) in the second line, yi xieqiao 傾斜橋 (on a hump – backed bridge) in the third line, and the whole sixth line “I
...d spend the night sprawled drunk in a thicket of flowers 醉人花叢宿", particularly the two verbs in this line, ru 人 (enter) and su 宿 (sleep).

In deed, as a lyric writer at a transitional stage in the evolution and development of the song lyric, Wei Zhuang was not totally free of influence of the popular songs, but in the meantime he was also aware of the vulgarity. One of the pioneers in polishing the language and refining the song lyric, Wei Zhuang tried to take the best from the popular songs and to renovate and innovate the language. In the fourth line, manlou 滿樓 (from every building) is colloquial in its context, and so are the words hongxiu 紅袖 (red sleeves) and zhao 招 (beckoned). However, when these words are put together to form the line “For red sleeves beckoned from every building”, a refrained feeling of the poet towards the courtesans is expressed delicately and accurately. As a seductive symbol and a substitution for singing girls or prostitutes, the imagistic compound word hongxiu is vulgar for its direct association with a gaudy color while it is also refined for being a well polished symbolic image standing for entertainers. It is in this very respect Yates concluded: “In capturing the essence of the popular lyric tradition and transforming it to the more refined tastes of the literati, Wei Chuang [Wei Zhuang] made a remarkable contribution to the development of Chinese literature.”® Yates here captured Wei Zhaung’s renovation in language, and pointed out Wei’s innovation in the refinement and development of the form of the song lyric.

Discussing the same song lyric, Kang - i Sun Chang offered a political interpretation that deepens the meaning of the refinement in language. After a recount of the historical background of the Huang Chao rebellion® and its impact on Wei Zhuang’s life and work, Chang remarked “that the first and the second stanzas of this song lyric form a contrast, and the last two lines of the song lyric show that when he was old and still wandering in a strange land, Wei Zhuang came to realize that it was impossible for him to return to...
his home in Luoyang, for the political turmoil was not over yet. That is why “with a certain measure of bitterness he vows not to go home until his hair grows white.” This type of hidden political message is not too rare to the literati song lyrics; it requires a more refined language and a more sophisticated way to deliver. Thus, in terms of refining language and delivering a hidden message, Wei Zhubang's contribution to the development of the song lyric is historical: his refinement concerns both the respects of diction and conceptualization.

While Wei Zhubang’s example illustrates not only the refinement of a specific song lyric, but also, as Wagner suggested, the refinement of the literati song lyric in general at its early stage of the development towards elegance, Jiang Kui and Zhang Yan’s works illustrate the refinement of the song lyric at its highly developed stage. Zhang Yan did not separate elegance from the concept of transparency. In Zhang Yan’s terminology, elegance does not just refer to musicality, but also to the accomplishment of transparency. In this regard, Zhang Yan listed at least eight song lyrics by Jiang Kui as examples. Also in this regard, Zhang Yan himself is similar to Jiang Kui. A Southern Song scholar Qiu Yuan 仇遠 (1261 – ?), in his preface to Zhang Yan’s Shanzhong baiyun ci, remarked that, because of the qualities of “harmonious music” and “lofty spirit”, Zhang Yan was as good as Jiang Kui. The Qing scholar Liu Xizai 劉熙載 (1813 – 1881) noted that the qualities of “far-off purity and refined blandness” and “deep sadness and sentiment” in Zhang Yan’s song lyrics were similar to the qualities in Jiang Kui’s song lyrics. Another Qing scholar Chen Tingzhuo 陳廷焯 (1853 – 1892) made it very clear that Zhang Yan learned the art of the song lyric from his study of Jiang Kui: “Yutian [Zhang Yan] took Baishi [Jiang Kui] as his ancestor; although the appearance of face is changed, his roots can be traced back to Jiang Kui, and he could be the wings of Jiang Kui.”
Like Jiang Kui, Zhang Yan in his practice of writing song lyrics showed his conscientiousness in lyric refinement. His song lyric written to the tune "Shengsheng man", subtitled "Composed with Shen Yaodao at the Capital" is a good example, in which Zhang created a poetic world, offering a space for the expression of his sentiments and thoughts about his own life after the fall of the Southern Song. The first stanza reads:

The flat sandbank emerges from the dawn, / The coldness startles the wild water, / In the misty air the distant hill appears to be small piece of blue. / Ten thousand li of ice and frost, / Has replaced the west wind in one night. / Gradually, all the leaves on the shining tree-tops fall, / Rustling in the autumn, / Only the parasol tree leaves remain. / My sentiment reaches far: / Why should I compose a lamenting poem about the Xiang and Chu? / I have been feeling lazy recently.

This lyric was written in 1290 when Zhang Yan went to the Yuan capital Dadu in the north to answer the call for a calligrapher vacancy in the royal court and failed in gaining it. The northern journey was a regrettable one, and the northern landscape in the lyric writer's eyes was sentimental. The words "dawn" and "wild water" in the first two lines draw an outline of a scene in temporal and spatial dimensions respectively, denoting an open air landscape on a cold morning. If we say that the description of this landscape in the first line is objective, then, in the second line, the words "coldness", "wild water", and "startles" give hints at Zhang Yan's regrettable mood that is reinforced by the succeeding three lines, especially by the line "Has replaced west wind in one night", which suggests the change of mood. Hearing the sound of west wind rustling through the parasol trees,
Zhang Yan felt that his sentiment and thought were reaching far: the present frozen landscape in the north reminded him of another landscape in the south, which was lovely and warm before, but now bleak. Because of the fall of the Southern Song, Zhang Yan was lost in between two worlds: the worlds in the past and present, and the worlds in the north and south. The past was over, the present was hostile; he had no future in the north, for he did not belong to the alien Yuan, and he had no hope in the south either, for he had no longer possessed anything there to live with. This is not only a material loss, but primarily a spiritual loss. The deep feeling and thoughts about such losses turns the landscapes of the north and south into a melancholy poetic world. The tenth line, “Why should I compose a lamenting poem about the Xiang and Chu?” deepens the lost feeling by suggesting a thought about being idle: in the actual world the poet could not do anything meaningful, but only could he do in a imagined world. The deepness of this poetic world is found in Zhang Yan’s mingling of landscapes (the described northern landscape and the suggested southern landscape), feelings (the sad feelings about the loss of his home and the fall of the dynasty), and thoughts (the writing of lamenting poem is meaningless and useless). In this sense, a further meaning beneath the sadness in the last lines in the second stanza can be discovered:

Once again the Lesser Spring comes, / Why are the plum blossoms, Still not seen?

春又小, 甚梅花, 猶自未逢。//QSC 5. 3464

This is almost a desperate hopelessness that Zhang Yan realized through his journey to the north. In this song lyric Zhang used delicate and subtle words with temporal and spatial dimensions to depict scenes and landscapes, which became a poetic world with profound feelings and thoughts infused in. Although such creation of a poetic world is common in song lyric writing, Zhang Yan’s poetic world is more refined in being a
world with double farad of north and south, as well as past and present. Such exquisite refinement makes his expression of feelings and thoughts more delicate, and yet not direct.

As for the refinement in the aspect of conceptualization, Zhang Yan's song lyric to the tune "Jie lianhuan", subtitled "A Lonely Goose", is a good example as well. Reading this song lyric, some scholars have offered a very interesting interpretation of its intended meaning: the birds stand for three types of literati at the historical turn from the Southern Song to the Yuan. The first type of literati is referred to in the last three lines in the first stanza:

I assume that was how the message was delayed, / And so the envoy had to stay, eating with fur, sleeping in the snow, / And so his heart could not be understood

料因循誤了，殘氷擁雪，故人心眼。// QSC 5. 3470

These lines allude to Su Wu 蘇武 (? -60 BCE) of the Han dynasty who went to the north as a Han envoy to the Huns, but was put in prison there. This allusion is allegorically attributed to the Southern Song loyalist heroes, some of them sacrificed themselves for the fallen dynasty, and some were captured to the north, such as Wen Tianxiang 文天祥 (1236 – 1283), a high rank official and patriotic poet of the Southern Song. The second type is referred to in the two lines in the second stanza:

Thinking of companions, who might still be resting in the weeds.

想伴侶，猶宿薈花。// QSC 5. 3470

This type of literati includes Zhang Yan himself and the other Southern Song loyalists who did not want to collaborate with the Yuan conquerors and retreated to a reclusive life. The third type is referred to in the last lines of the second stanza:

Then he would not be embarrassed to see the pair of swallows returning, / And to see the painted curtain being half rolled-up.

85
The returning swallows here symbolize the collaborators. The allegorical implication hidden behind the images of the three types of birds reveals Zhang Yan’s political attitude towards the Yuan conquerors and the Southern Song literati, and this is the hidden intent in this song lyric. Jennifer Jay identified three types of literati under Mongol rule: the resisters, the secluded intellectuals, and the collaborators; the first two are considered Southern Song loyalists. Reading this song lyric symbolically and allegorically, we can see that Zhang Yan was in favour of the first two types of literati and detested the last one. However, this song lyric is highly refined and subtle, the political message and intended meaning are hidden deep within.

The refinement in accordance with the poetics of transparency aims at the goal of elegance. Discussing Zhang Yan’s song lyrics, Chen Tingzhuo made a comment on this issue: “[Zhang Yan’s song lyrics are like] the scissors made in Taiyuan and the pears grown in the garden of the Ai family; [they are] up-lifting to the mind and the eyes.” In terms of its rhetorical tone, this comment is similar to the comment Zhang Yan made on the quality of transparency in Jiang Kui’s song lyrics: “Jiang Kui’s lyric poems are like a wild cloud that flies alone, coming and going without a trace; ……. They cause the reader’s spirit to soar.” Interestingly, because of the similarity, regarding lyric refinement, Chen claimed that Zhang Yan “could be said that he was as good as Jiang Kui” and considered that the works of Jiang Kui and Zhang Yan, as well as the works of some other lyric poets were “the first-class works in the song lyric.”

III. The Trend of Elegance in a Theoretical Context

As a part of the context of Zhang Yan’s poetics, in addition to Tongyang Jushi, another song lyric compiler Zeng Zao 曾慥 (ca. 1146) also ad-
vocated elegance in the early Southern Song. In 1146 Zeng compiled the anthology Yuefu yaci; his standard of selecting lyric works was elegance. In accordance with this standard, as he stated in the preface to Yuefu yaci, he excluded the inelegant works such as the humorous (xiexue 諧譏) and erotic ones (yanqu 色曲). Prior to Zhang Yan, Zeng's contemporary lyric writers, critics and compilers, such as Wang Zhuo 王灼 (dates unknown), Hu Yin 胡寅 (1098 - 1156), Tang Heng 湯衡 (ca. 1170), Chen Yingxing 陳應行 (dates unknown) and so forth, also advocated elegance and denounced vulgarity. Such a historical fact tells that Zhang Yan's poetics is rooted in the literary context of his time.

In this respect, a brief comparison between Yan Yu 嚴羽 (1197? - 1255?) of the late Southern Song and Zhang Yan can illuminate the context of Zhang Yan's poetics. Yan Yu's poetic treatise Canglang shihua 滄浪詩話 (Canglang's Remarks on Poetry) is similar to Zhang Yan's Ci yuan in a number of ways. It is interesting to compare the following passage from the first chapter of Canglang shihua with Zhang Yan's passages on transparency.

Poetry is "to sing what is in the heart". In the stirring and excitement of their poetry, the High Tang writers were those antelopes that hang by their horns, leaving no tracks to be followed. Where they are subtle, there is a limpid and sparkling quality that can never be quite fixed and determined – like tones in the empty air, or color in a face, or moonlight in the water, or an image in a mirror—the words are exhausted, but the meaning is never exhausted.

In this passage of Yan Yu, some phrases and words, the italicized ones, even resemble those of Zhang Yan's in both language and presentation, such as the use of images and metaphors. Zhang Yan's passage on transparency is as follows:

The song lyric should be transparent and not dense. If transpar-
ent, it will have archaic elegance and vigor; if dense, it will be stagn­nate and obscure. Jiang Kui's song lyrics are like a wild cloud that flies alone, coming and going without a trace, and Wu Wenying's song lyrics are like a many-jeweled edifice which dazzles the eye, but when taken apart does not form clauses or sentences. This is my explanation of transparency and density.

(Jiang Kui's song lyrics) are not only transparent, but also elegant. They cause the reader's spirit to soar.

The comparability between Yan Yu and Zhang Yan suggests not only the two critics' similar interests in poetic style and aesthetic ideals, but more importantly, a similar interest of their time, and a cultural current of their time, i.e., the trend of elegance. On the topic of rules for writing poetry, Yan Yu listed construction of form (tizhi 體制), force of structure (geli 格力), atmosphere (qixiang 氣象), and stirring excitement (xingqu 興趣) among others for poets to observe; these concepts in a certain sense correspond to Zhang Yan's poetics, for the fact that they deal with similar issues: the use of words, the methods of representation, the creation of poetic world, and implying intended meaning. The cultural current suggested by these issues is the historical trend of elegance in the development of poetry. Like Zhang Yan, Yan Yu promoted elegance by denouncing vulgarity. When discussing the rules of poetry in Canglang shihua, he called for the elimination of five vulgarities: the vulgar forms, vulgar concepts, vulgar lines, vulgar words, and vulgar rhymes. Stephen Owen investigated the background of Yan Yu's call for the elimination of vulgarity and made three explanations about the negative influence of vulgarity in the Southern Song literary scene:

[First], the development of a semi-vernacular written language used by literary men (which characterizes part of "Ts'anglang's Remarks on Poetry" [Canglang shihua itself]; second, changes in lit-
erary pedagogy involving the widespread use of books; third, the prevalent influence of mixed poetic styles, particularly those of Huang Tingchien [Huang Tingjian] and later of Yang Wan-li [Yang Wanli], which use sharply marked differences, by alternation, between the “high” or “poetic” and the “low” or “vernacular”.

Owen’s investigation into the cultural background of Yan Yu’s time tells why elegance is necessary to the Southern Song poetry. Although neither Yan Yu nor Owen discussed the song lyric, due to the fact that the historical and cultural background of Yan Yu and Zhang Yan is similar—Yan Yu lived in the period between Jiang Kui and Zhang Yan, — I consider that Owen’s three explanations are also applicable to explain the background of the Southern Song song lyric.

In addition to Yan Yu, regarding the context of Zhang Yan’s poetics, Shen Yifu 沈義父 (? – after 1297), another contemporary scholar of Zhang Yan, is a similar case. Discussing his poetic ideal in Yuefu zhimi, Shen Yifu regarded refinement as an elegant characteristic of the song lyric, which differentiated the literati song lyric from popular songs. Shen wrote:

The tones of words should be in harmony with the music; if they do not harmonize, the result would be just shi poetry in lines of unequal length. The diction should be elegant, otherwise it would resemble that of popular songs. The use of words should not be too explicit, as explicitness is blunt and lacks deep, prolonged aftereffects. The expression of sentiments should not be too grandiose; otherwise you end up with wildness and eccentricity and loss sensibility.

In this passage, Shen Yifu touched on the main aspects that Zhang Yan touched on. According to Grace Fong, there are four key points in Shen’s passage about the writing of the song lyric: musicality, elegance, indirection, and sensibility. Fong interpreted, “Among these, sensibility
can be subsumed under elegance as they both deal with language and expression; though indirection begins with how poetic language should be used, it concerns the ideal method or manner of representation. Based on Fong’s interpretation, I see that elegance is the important aspect of Shen Yifu’s poetics; it exists in the use of language, in the application of rhetorical devices, and in the expression of feelings. The case of Shen Yifu is similar to the case of Yan Yu; they both form a part of the theoretical context of Zhang Yan, which indicates the common cultural interest in elegance of their time.

Zhang Yan’s disciple, Lu Fuzhi 陸輔之 (dates unknown) wrote Cizhi to elaborate his mentor’s Ciyuan, in which Lu focused on elegance and stated that the purpose of writing the poetic treatise was to promote Zhang Yan’s ideal of elegance. In the introductory passage to Cizhi Lu stated:

It is difficult to discuss the song lyric. The correct way [in writing the song lyric] is the one that is near elegance, and not far from popular songs either. (The form of the song lyric is inferior to that of the shi poetry, because the song lyric is not far from popular songs. However, since elegance is the goal, the song lyric is still a branch of the shi poetry. Therefore, if there is no elegance, there is no discussion of the song lyric).

He then explained his notion of elegance in the respects of mingyi 命意 (conceptualization), yongzi 用字 (use of words), diaoke 雕刻 (carving, description), transparency and so forth. To illustrate his notion of elegance, Lu Fuzhi named four of lyric poets in Cizhi:

The conceptualized theme should reach far (if indirect, it will be far), the diction should be refined (if use raw words, it won’t be refined), the language should be fresh (artificiality is not fresh; if it can be pure and fresh, then it is near elegance), and the words should be sound. …… The song lyric should be free of conscious art-
istry, otherwise its vital breath will be hurt; it must be natural. The elegant beauty of [the song lyrics by] Zhou Bangyan, the archaic elegance of [the song lyrics by] Jiang Kui, the arrangement of lines [in the song lyrics] by Shi Dazu, and the refinement of diction [in the song lyrics] by Wu Wenying [are good examples]. Take the best from the four and discard the dross of them: this is the gist of Zhang Yan's poetics.  

This is Lu Fuzhi's interpretation of Zhang Yan's poetics. According to Lu, the conceptualization of the intended meaning should reach far, should be profound and lofty, should be unique and not similar to that of any other poets; the diction should be well wrought, and the language should be elegant. All these requirements centered at the notion of elegance.

Lu's contribution to the dissemination of Zhang Yan's poetics is more method-oriented, and more practical towards the teaching of how to compose song lyrics in the fashion of Jiang Kui and Zhang Yan. As poetry critics and literary historians pointed out, there was nothing new or original in Lu's Cizhi, he just repeated almost all of Zhang Yan's opinions. Lu Fuzhi himself also acknowledged this: "I have followed and accompanied Zhang Yan, and truly understand the methods of his profound theory and system. Therefore, upon his request, I take his words and write this Cizhi." It is true that Lu did not contribute anything new to the poetics of the song lyric, or anything new to the development of the song lyric. However, Lu's real contribution is found in his formularization of the teaching of lyric writing in the light of Zhang Yan's poetics. In Cizhi Lu Fuzhi not only offered examples of lines as models for students to study and imitate, but also developed a new curriculum of poetry education. Although we do not have materials regarding the influence of Lu's Cizhi on the practice of song lyric writing in the Yuan, according to a Qing scholar Kuang Zhouyi 慕周頥 (1859 - 1926), Lu Fuzhi's Cizhi spread the interests in working on words and mak-
ing lines more delicate, and “started the habit of daintiness in a later time.”

IV. Towards a Conclusion: the Significance of Elegance

The significance of elegance is related to Zhang Yan’s life as well as the historical change at the end of the Southern Song, which turned Zhang Yan’s life upside down on the one hand, and conditioned the trend of elegance in the development of the song lyric on the other. Dai Biaoyuan 戴表元 (1244 – 1310), a friend of Zhang Yan, recorded the turnaround in Zhang Yan’s life:

Jade-Field Zhang Shuxia [Zhang Yan] and I first met on the West Lake in Hangzhou. Wearing a fine silk garment that fluttered elegantly, he rode on a noble horse. At that time his hair was expansive and radiant, and he regarded himself as more than merely an unemployed offspring of an old meritorious family. When he was about to reach his prime, the age suitable for official service, he lost his funds for travel and consequently he became solitary and stranded.

According to Shuen-fu Lin’s interpretation, that Zhang Yan “lost his funds for travel” refers to the loss of his wealth as a result of the fall of Hangzhou to the Mongols. It was the Mongol capture of Hangzhou, and the fall of the Southern Song, that changed Zhang Yan’s fortune. Because of the tremendous impact of the fall of the nation on his personal life, Zhang Yan withdrew from the social reality and escaped to the shelter of the art of the song lyric.

Zhang Yan’s refinement of the song lyric was framed in the historical context of the misfortune of his nation even before its fall to the Mongol conquest. As for this context, James T. C. Liu made a generalization explaining how the Chinese intellectuals of the Southern Song responded to the political, social and historical situation before the fall of the Southern
Song:

The longer the Sung [Song] conservatives and Neo-Confucians devoted themselves to essentially introspective formulations and the deeper they pondered metaphysical and cosmological topics, the less they tended to be oriented toward mundane and objective social realities and the less they tended to seek verification of their philosophical theories by relating them to the actualities.

Another problem is whether Neo-Confucians tried to look out or outside the system for possible ways to change it? The answer tends to be “no”, for they worked hard on improvements within the system. They were not strictly speaking conservatives in the sense of standing pat. They were inward-looking.

The relationship between the refinement of the song lyric and the intellectuals' personal cultivation from within can be explained by a Confucian notion about the teaching of poetry, wenrou dunhou (being gentle and moderate). A Confucian canon Liji records that, when discussing personal cultivation, Confucius once said, “To a man, being gentle and moderate is the result of the teaching of the Shijing. If one is gentle and moderate and in the meantime is not pedantic, then the one is more profound than what Shijing teaches.” The annotator of Liji, Kong Yingda, offered an interpretation of wenrou dunhou: “Wen is mellowness of color, rou refers to gentleness and moderation of temperament. Poetry persuades and admonishes subtly and does not point at things directly. Therefore, being wenrou dunhou means to be part of the teaching of Shijing.” In writing song lyrics, the teaching of being gentle and moderate is concretized by the notion of restrained expression of feelings or the contained expression of emotions. In fact, Confucius himself offered an insightful view on being gentle and moderate when he talked about the first poem in Shijing: “Pleasure is not carried to the point of excess, and grief is not carried to
the point of self-injury.” The Confucian teaching for being an ideal gentleman has a profound influence on Chinese intellectuals. Chen Tingzuo advocated a notion of *dunhou* (moderate), a variation of gentle and moderate. He mentioned Jiang Kui and his song lyrics to the tunes “Anxiang” and “Shuying”, and praised him for blending profound sentiment for national matters and deep feelings for personal matters. In his eyes, Jiang Kui was not only profound but also moderate. Discussing profundity and moderation, Chen Tingzuo also made use of Zhang Yan’s lyric works as examples, such as the lines from the song lyric written to the tune “Changting yuan”:

What about the people from the old country? / They just forgot yesterday’s rain of Jiangnan.

故人何許? / 渾忘了江南舊雨。// QSC 5. 3578

and

Again looking for spring in the capital now, / must be urged to stay by roses.

如今又京國尋春, / 定應被, 薇花留住。// QSC 5. 3478

The blending of national and personal matters in these lines is in keeping with the Confucian teaching, and this is why, according to a scholar of China, Chen Tingzhuo praised Zhang Yan as well.

In Zhang Yan’s poetics, a restrained expression of personal sentiments is the emphasis in the lyric refinement towards elegance. When discussing how to express feelings in the passage of miscellaneous comments in *Ciyuan*, Zhang Yan stated:

The song lyric should reach the archaic elegance, this is the direction of intention. When the song lyric becomes the slave of passion, it losses its elegance and correct tone. …… Then, the so-called *chunhou* [moderate] becomes faithless.

According to the interpretation of a scholar in China, *chunhou* is *dunhou* (moderate) and also *wenrou dunhou* (gentle and moderate). Schol-
ars of today emphasize the idea of restrained expression of feelings and view it as the key point of Zhang Yan's notion of elegance. Indeed Zhang Yan used the profound and moderate song lyrics of Jiang Kui as examples to illustrate his ideal of elegance. In the eleventh passage on describing feelings in Ciyuan, he noted that, compared to the shi poetry, the song lyric was more feminine because of its amorous motif and emotional expression. In his opinion, if the expression of feelings in a song lyric were not restrained, the lyric would be vulgar, therefore, he wanted song lyric writers "filtrate the superficial amorousness, be joyful without wantonness. This is the intent in the legacy of the Han and Wei music bureau poetry." But how should a song lyric writer restrain his flowing emotion? Zhang Yan suggested that the poet should infuse the emotion and feelings into landscape or scenery. Similarly, in the twelfth passage on writing about parting, Zhang Yan quoted some lines from a rhapsody of Jiang Yan 江淹 (444 – 505) in discussing his idea about restrained expression of feelings:

"Spring grass shows verdant color, spring water has green waves; seeing you off in the Southern Bank, how sad am I?" When write about parting, all the feelings of regrets and sorrows come out. If mingle the melancholy and sentimental emotions, one can reach the best of the song lyric.

Here, to mingle is to restrain. In the aspect of rhetorical expression, Zhang Yan stressed that as long as the expression of the flowing emotion and feelings was restrained, the lyric writer would reach the ideal of being gentle and moderate, and this was what he meant by elegance. To offer a good example, Zhang Yan made use of Jiang Kui's song lyric written to the tune "Pipa xian." A Qing scholar Xu Angxiao 許昂霄 (dates unknown) remarked that every line in this song lyric was about scenery and every line was also about feelings in the mean time. Zhang Yan commented on this song lyric: "feelings and scenery are mingled together, and the implied
meaning is gained from beyond the words." This is to say that, when feelings and scenery are harmonized, the lyric writer's intention to express his overflowing sentiments turns inward, and the implied meaning turns to hide in between the lines. This shows both Jiang Kui's refinement of the song lyric and his personal cultivation, and also suggests his inwardness in composing song lyrics.

In a way, the inwardness is the intention in the song lyrics of Jiang Kui, as well as the intention of the song lyrics of his followers in the late Southern Song, which is hidden underneath the text of the song lyrics. In the terminology of the 20th-century western literary critic Paul de Man, this is a textual intention. Paul de Man brought out the notion of intentional object. In my opinion, a literary work is an intentional object precisely because there is an intentional object in it. To de Man, the intentionality in a poetic work discloses the significance of the work. In his essay *Form and Intent in the American New Criticism*, Paul de Man wrote:

To interpret an intent, however, can only mean to understand it. No new set of relationships is added to an existing reality, but relationships that *were already there* are being disclosed, not only in themselves (like the events of nature) but as they exist for us. We can only understand that which is in a sense already given to us and already known, albeit in a fragmentary, inauthentic way that cannot be called unconscious. Heidegger calls this *Forhabe*, the forestructure of all understanding.

De Man also used another term of Heidegger, foreknowledge, to interpret the textual forestructure and claimed:

For the interpreter of a poetic text, this foreknowledge is the text itself. Once he understands the text, the implicit knowledge becomes explicit and discloses what was already there in full light.

Referring to de Man's conception of intentionality and considering
Jiang Kui's song lyrics, when discuss Zhang Yan's lyric theory, I intend to say that the trend of elegance shows the inward turning intention of Zhang Yan's poetics. Reaching towards elegance is not only the textual intention in Zhang Yan's poetics, but also the intention of the development of the song lyric as a poetic genre at the end of the Southern Song.

James T. C. Liu described a similar intention in a broader sense, and related it to the cultural context of the Southern Song. He stated that, following the Northern Song, the Southern Song culture continued to grow, not towards the direction of reaching out, but towards the direction of modifying itself from within. On this account, he proposed that the Song China, specially the Southern Song, turned from an outward expansion to an inward refinement, particularly the refinement in the cultural aspect. He employed a metaphor to elaborate:

[The] Sung [Song] China looks like an old, luxuriant tree surprisingly vigorous as it grows taller and larger than before, with new branches and fresh leaves spreading all over it. Old roots sprawl beneath the trunk. Then a stormy season somehow saps the vigor of its internal chemistry. The vitality that remains is turned to protective functions. The tree manages to keep on growing quite sturdily, but it remains the same size and shape. 

Then he pointed out:

[The] twelfth century saw elite culture paying more attention to consolidating and extending its values throughout society. Turning more retrospective and introspective than before, it became tempered by a circumspect and sometimes pessimistic tone. In short, while the Northern Song [Song] characteristically reached outward, the Southern Sung [Song] essentially looked inward.

Liu's view is clear, "Chinese culture from the twelfth century on turned inward."
If Liu’s view is in a broad sense, it is about the character of the Southern Song culture in general, then, interestingly, James Cahill held a similar view about the inward intention almost thirty years before Liu, which was more specifically about the art of the Southern Song. In his discussion of Chinese painting of the Southern Song, Cahill pointed out that the failure of the military power and the invasions by its nomadic neighbors from the north were fundamental:

The Sung [Song], for example, unlike the expansive and outward-looking Tang, impresses us as a culture turned inward; · · · · · ·
The only nourishment came from within, · · · · · · the special archaism arose in the late Northern Sung period, to remain a principle ingredient in much of Southern Sung art······. Decisive stylistic innovations belonged to the past, and to the future; this was a period of introspection and retrospection, a time of synthesis and summing up. · · · ·

Another strain to be noted in Southern Sung culture is its intense aestheticism, the super-refinement that at times, unable to go further forward, can only turn and go backward, into a cultivated crudeness, or at least a determined simplicity.

In both a broader sense of cultural intention and a specific sense of the intention of refinement in art, the above opinions of Liu and Cahill suggested that the inwardness revealed the trend of elegance and the trend of elegance revealed the inwardness as well. In this regard, the historical and cultural significance of Zhang Yan’s notion of elegance becomes clear; Zhang Yan’s poetics reveals a certain aspect of the historical change in the development of Chinese literature, namely, the trend of elegance in the evolution of the song lyric and the cultural tendency to turn inward in the late Southern Song China.
Notes:

1. A part of this article is presented under the title "Four Aspects of Zhang Yan's Song Lyric Theory" at the New York State Annual Conference on Asian Studies in October 2002. The author wishes to thank Professor Grace Fong of McGill University for her guidance in writing this article. The editions of Zhang Yan's Ciyuan referred to in this article are the one collected in Tang Guizhang, Cihua congbian (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1993). Thereafter CHCB and the one annotated and edited by Xia Chengtao in Xia Chengtao and Cai Songyun, Ciyuan zhu, Yuefuzhimi qianshi (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 1981).

2. CHCB 1. 266. The translation is taken from Grace Fong, Wu Wenying and the Art of Southern Song Ci Poetry (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987), p. 103.

3. CHCB 1. 255.

4. Ibid.

5. The three anthologies were compiled in the early Southern Song. The first one compiled by Zeng Zao still survives today; the second was lost probably in the period of Ming, and the last one survived until at least the early Qing.

6. See Guo Shaoyu, Zhongguo lidai wenlunxuan (Shanghai: Shangh.ai guji chubanshe, 1979), p. 30. The English translation is taken from Stephen Owen, Readings in Chinese Literary Thought (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992), p. 49, with minor modifications on the pinyin romanization.

7. Grace Fong (1987), p. 50.

8. Guo Shaoyu (1979), p. 30. The translation is taken from Stephen Owen (1992), p. 49.

9. During the reigns of Han Jingdi (156 – 140 BCE) and Han Wudi (140 – 86 BCE), the Confucian scholar Dong Zhongshu (179? – 104 BCE?) advocated Confucianism and made the Han court adopt it as a national teaching.

10. Xinda Lian, The Wild and Arrogant: Expression of Self in Xin Qiji’s Song Lyrics (New York: Peter Lang, 1999), p. 11.

11. Ibid., 12.

12. Qian Mu, Lunyu xinjie (Hong Kong: Xinya yanjiusuo, 1964), p. 608.

13. Wei is another small state or kingdom of the Spring and Autumn period. See
Zheng Xuan and Kong Yingda, eds. *Li ji zhengyi*, Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe, 1999, p. 1080.

10 The complete preface by Tongyang Jushi can be found in Wu Xionghe, *Tang Song ci tonglun* (Hangzhou: Zhejiang guji chubanshe, 1989), pp. 459 – 460.

12 Ibid.

13 Zhu Yizun “Cizong fafan”, in Zhu Yizun and Wang Sen, *Cizong*, annot. Li Qingjia (Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 1978), p. 10. The translation is taken from Pauline Yu, “Song Lyric and the Canon: A Look at Anthologies of Tzu”, in *Voices of the Song Lyric in China*, ed. Pauline Yu (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994), p. 93, with minor modifications on pinyin romanization.

14 Wang Sen “Cizong xu” in Zhu Yizun and Wang Sen, *Cizong* (1978), p. 1. The translation is taken from Pauline Yu (1994), p. 94, with minor modifications on pinyin romanization.

16 Pauline Yu (1994), p. 81.

17 This popular song is translated by Burton Watson, see Victor Mair, ed. *The Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994), p. 303. For the original in Chinese, see Yu Pingbo, comp. *Tangsongci xianshi* (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 1979), p. 4.

19 Kang – i Sun Chang, *The Evolution of Chinese Tzu Poetry; from Late Tang to North Sung* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980), p. 20.

20 Marsha L. Wagner, *The Lotus Boat: The Origins of Chinese Tzu Poetry in Tang Popular Culture* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1984), p. 6.

21 Kang – i Sun Chang (1980), p. 19.

22 Ibid.

23 This term refers to the songs sung by the girls rolling boats in lakes and ponds collecting lotus. See Wagner (1984), p. ix.

24 Ibid.

25 Ibid., pp. xi – xii.

26 Ibid., p. xv.

27 Ibid., p. 143.

28 Robin D. S. Yates, *Washing Silk: the Life and Selected Poetry of Wei Chuang*
(834? - 910) (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1988), p. 47.

3 The translation of this song lyric is taken from Yates, pp. 45 - 46, with minor modifications on pinyin romanization. For the original in Chinese, see Long Yusheng, Tang Song mingjia cixuan (Hong Kong: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1979), p. 16.

2 Robin D. S. Yates (1988), p. 45.

3 Ibid., p. 47.

The Huang Chao rebellion took place in 875 and continued until 884, which brought the Tang dynasty to a closure.

4 Kang-i Chang (1980), p. 48.

5 Marsha L. Wagner (1984), p. 143.

6 See Qiu Yuan, "Preface" to Shangzhong baiyun ci, in Zhu Zumou, Qiangcun congshu (Shanghai: Reprinted, 1922) p. 4a - b.

7 Liu Xizhai, Liu Xizhai lunyi liushong, eds. Xu Zhongyu and Xiao Huarong (Chengdu: Bashu shushe, 1990), p. 109.

3 CHCB 4. 3963.

5 A poem about Xiang and Chu alludes to Jia Yi (200 BCE - 168 BCE), a Western Han (206 BCE - 25 AD) writer and politician, who composed a lament rhapsody, "Diao Qu Yuan fu" (Elegy for Qu Yuan) (340 BCE? - 278 BCE?), when he was banished from the court and went to Changsha in the area of Xiang and Chu. See Sima Qian, Shiji (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1959), vol. 8, p. 2482.

4 Tang Guizhang, ed. Quan Song ci (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1995, thereafter QSC), vol. 5, p. 3464.

5 Liu Yangzhong, Tang Song ci liupai shi (Fuzhou: Fujian renmin chubanshe, 1999), pp. 500 - 1.

6 Jennifer Jay, A Change in Dynasty: Loyalism in Thirteenth-Century China (Bellingham: Western Washington University, 1991), p. 1.

3 CHCB 4. 3814.

4 CHCB 1. 259. The translation is taken partially from Grace Fong (1987), p. 55.

5 CHCB 4. 3814.
The dates of Yan Yu come from a scholarly speculation, see Li Ruiqing, Cang-lang shihua de shige lilun yanjiu (Hong Kong: Zhongwen daxue chubanshe, 1992), pp. 4–7.

The English translation of this passage is taken from Stephen Owen (1992), p. 406. For Chinese original, see Yan Yu Canglang shihua, in Shihua cong-kan, ed., Hongdao gongsi (Taipei: Hongdao wenhua shiye youxian gongsi, 1971), vol. 1, pp. 614–5. The italicization is made by the author of this article for the purpose of comparison.

Yan Yu listed five rules; after the four, the last one is tone and rhyme (yin-jie). The English translation of these terms is taken from Stephen Owen (1992), p. 399. For Chinese original, see Yan Yu Canglang shihua, in Shihua cong-kan, ed., Hongdao gongsi (Taipei: Hongdao wenhua shiye youxian gongsi, 1971), vol. 1, pp. 614–5. The italicization is made by the author of this article for the purpose of comparison.

Yang Wanli (1127–1206), a Southern Song poet.

Stephen Owen (1992), p. 412.

Shen Yifu Yuefu zhimi, CHCB 1. 277. The translation is taken from Grace Fong (1987), p. 45.

Grace Fong (1987), p. 46.

Lu Fuzhi, Cizhi, CHCB 1. 301.

CHCB 1. 301–303.

CHCB 1. 301–2.

CHCB 1. 301.

Kuang Zhouyi, Huifeng cihua, CHCB 5. 4444.

Dai Biaoyuan is a Southern Song loyalist scholar, left behind a collection of works Yanyuan ji.

Dai Biaoyuan, “Song Zhang Shuxia xiyou xu”, in Xia Chengtao, Tang Song ci-ren nianpu (Shanghai; Zhonghua shuju, 1961), p. 201. The translation is taken from Shuen-fu Lin, The Transformation of the Chinese Lyric Traditions.
Shuen-fu Lin (1978), p. 196.

James T. C. Liu, China Turning Inward: Intellectual – Political Changes in the Early Twelfth Century (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1988), pp. 152 –153.

Kong Yingda Liji zhengyi, juan 50, Ruan Yuan, Shisanjing zhushu (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1980), p. 1609.

Ibid. The English translation is based on Xinda Lian (1999), p. 161.

Chen Liangyun, Zhongguo shixue pipingshi (Nanchang: Jiangxi renmin chubanshe, 1995), p. 73.

Guo Shaoyu, ed. Zhongguo lidai wenlun xuan (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1979), p. 11. The English translation is based on Arthur Waley, The Analects of Confucius (New York: Vantage Books, 1989), p. 99.

CHCB 4. 3797.

Zhang Hongsheng, Qingdai cixue de jiangou (Nanjing: Jiangsu guji chubanshe, 1999), pp. 120 –121.

CHCB 1. 266. The translation is taken partially from Fong (1987), p. 52.

Ye Shuxian discussed the two terms from etymological and anthropological perspectives, see Ye Shuxian, Yang ge yu kuangjian (Shanghai: Shanghai wenyi chubanshe, 1999), pp. 192 –198.

CHCB 1. 263 – 264.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

For this song lyric, see QSC 3. 2178, for Zhang Yan’s comment on it, see CHCB 1. 264.

Xu Angxiao, Cizong ouping, CHCB 2. 1559.

CHCB 1. 264.

Paul de Man, Blindness and Insight (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1983), pp. 29 –30.

Ibid. , p. 30.
About the author:

Duan Lian, MA from Concordia University, Ph. D. from McGill University. He has taught at Sichuan University, China, Carleton College, State University of New York, Mount Holyoke College and Williams College, USA. His academic interest covers comparative literature, traditional Chinese poetics and fine art.