The Understanding of the Sixteen Kinds of Śūnyatā in the Prajñāpāramitāpiṇḍārthasamgraha as described in the Bhagavatyāmnāyānusārinīnāmavyākhya

KIMURA Seimin

Introduction

Dignāga’s Prajñāpāramitāpiṇḍārthasamgraha (PPS) is a summary of the Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā (ASPP) and the Bhagavatyāmnāyānusārinīnāmavyākhya (BhĀA) is one of the commentaries of the ASPP. The two main topics of the PPS are the sixteen kinds of emptiness (śūnyatā) and the ten categories of distraction by conceptual cognition (vikalpa-vikṣepa). The BhĀA expounds the sixteen kinds of emptiness in the final part of chapter 29 by quoting verses 6–18 from the PPS. This shows that the BhĀA refers to the PPS in order to explain the idea of emptiness expounded in the ASPP. Moreover, the BhĀA quotes the following verse from the PPS:

The sixteen kinds of emptiness expounded in the ASPP are explained in due succession. It should be understood that they are indicated by other words elsewhere. (PPS k. 6)

In the PPS, Dignāga specifically mentions that “the sixteen kinds of emptiness expounded in the ASPP are explained in due succession.” I have pointed out before that the descriptions about the sixteen kinds of emptiness are quoted and explained “in due succession” as they are in the ASPP (Kimura 2018). In this paper, I will compare the descriptions of the sixteen kinds of emptiness quoted from the ASPP in the PPS and the BhĀA. I attempt to clarify whether the descriptions of the sixteen kinds of emptiness in the BhĀA conform with the descriptions in the PPS, and whether these sixteen kinds of emptiness are “explained in due succession” as they are in the ASPP.

1. The Sixteen Kinds of Emptiness

The number of the kinds of emptiness described in the Prajñāpāramitā-sūtras\(^1\) are not
identical. There are, however, only sixteen kinds of emptiness listed in the Mādhyāntavibhāga (MAV), the PPS, the *Āryaśatasāhasrikāpañcaviṃśatisāhasrikāṣṭādaśasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitābṛhaṭṭīkā (ŚPAB), and the BhĀA. In these texts the sixteen kinds of emptiness are explained in a specific order and the connections between these kinds of emptiness are clarified. As shown in Table 1, the sixteen kinds of emptiness are arranged in three different ways in the MAV, the PPS, and the Pañcaviṃśatisāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā (PSPP) respectively. The sixteen kinds of emptiness are obviously arranged in a different order in the PPS and the BhĀA.

2. Quotations from the ASPP in the PPS

There are six quotations from the APSS found in the PPS as shown in Table 2. In the PPS the above quotations are explained “in due succession” as they are in the ASPP. In the BhĀA, however, sarvadharma-Ś. and paramārtha-Ś. are not quoted in the same order as in the PPS. In other words, they are said not to be quoted “in due succession” as they are in

| MAV/ BhĀA | *PPS | *PSPP/ ŚPAB |
|------------|------|-------------|
| 1 adhyātma-Śūnyatā | adhyātma-Ś. | adhyātma-Ś. |
| 2 bahirdhā-Ś. | bahirdhā-Ś. | bahirdhā-Ś. |
| 3 adhyātmabahirdhā-Ś. | adhyātmabahirdhā-Ś. | adhyātmabahirdhā-Ś. |
| 4 mahā-Ś. | mahā-Ś. | Śūnyatā-Ś. |
| 5 Śūnyatā-Ś. | lakṣaṇa-Ś. | mahā-Ś. |
| 6 paramārtha-Ś. | Śūnyatā-Ś. | paramārtha-Ś. |
| 7 sāṃskṛta-Ś. | prakṛti-Ś. | sāṃskṛta-Ś. |
| 8 sāṃskṛta-Ś. | atyanta-Ś. | sāṃskṛta-Ś. |
| 9 atyanta-Ś. | anavarāgra-Ś. | atyanta-Ś. |
| 10 anavarāgra-Ś. | sarvadharma-Ś. | anavarāgra-Ś. |
| 11 anavakāra-Ś. | paramārtha-Ś. | anavakāra-Ś. |
| 12 prakṛti-Ś. | pudgala-Ś. | prakṛti-Ś. |
| 13 lakṣaṇa-Ś. | dharma-Ś. | sarvadharma-Ś. |
| 14 sarvadharma-Ś. | sāṃskṛta-Ś. | svalakṣaṇa-Ś. |
| 15 abhāva-Ś./anupalambha-Ś. | sāṃskṛta-Ś. | anupalambha-Ś. |
| 16 abhāvasvabhāva-Ś. | anavakāra-Ś. | abhāvasvabhāva-Ś. |
The Understanding of the Sixteen Kinds of Śūnyatā in the Prajñāpāramitāpiṇḍārthasaṃgraha of Śūnyatā in the Prajñāpāramitāpiṇḍārthasaṃgraha as described in the Bhagavatyāmnāyānusāriṇīnāmavyākhyā (Kimura)

Table 2 shows the page number of the Sanskrit manuscript and their corresponding Tibetan manuscript (London).  

| verse number (PPS) | name of śūnyatā | quotations (PPS) Skt. (Tib.) | quotations (BhĀA) Skt. (Tib.) |
|-------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------|
| k. 8              | adhyātma-ś.    | 3.5–7 (L 4b6–8)             | 3.5–7 (L 4b6–8)              |
| k. 9              | bahirdhā-ś.    | 6.2 (L 9a6)                 | 6.2 (L 9a6)                  |
| k. 12             | atyanta-ś.     | 24.6–11 (L 34a1–5)         | 24.6–11 (L 34a1–5)          |
| k. 13             | sarvadharma-ś. | 148.17–19 (L 208a7–8)      | 13.13–15 (L 19b4–5)         |
| k. 14             | paramārtha-ś.  | 148.17–19 (L 208a7–8)      | 156.29–157.1 (L 219b7–8)    |

3. Quotations from the PPS and the ASPP in the BhĀA

Although the BhĀA cites expressions such as adhyātma-ś., bahirdhā-ś., and atyanta-ś. from the PPS in the same order, expressions such as sarvadharma-ś. and paramārtha-ś. are not cited in the same order. This will be demonstrated by the example of the sarvadharma-ś. at this point. In the PPS, the following sentence from the ASPP is cited:

When it is stated that “he sees neither the characteristics of the Buddha nor those of the bodhisattva”, the ten powers of the Buddha and so on are preached. (PPS k. 13)

In chapter 15 of the ASPP it is said that:

“The characteristics of the bodhisattva essentially neither occur nor are annihilated and that the characteristics of the Buddha essentially neither occur nor are annihilated. (ASPP 148. 17–19)

In the BhĀA, the ASPP and the PPS are quoted as follows:

How it is preached in this text (ASPP), “Buddha! Apart from not occurring, the characteristics of the Buddha and the characteristics of the bodhisattva are not perceived” (ASPP 13. 13–15) are indicated. Furthermore, he (Dignāga) preaches “When it is stated that “he sees neither the characteristics of the Buddha nor those of the bodhisattva, the ten powers of the Buddha and so on are preached (PPS k. 13). (BhĀA D 292a6–b1, P 338b6–8)

The above statement from the BhĀA corresponds with chapter 1 in the ASPP, it is therefore located before the listing of atyanta-ś. in the ASPP (cf. Table 2).
Conclusion

The quotations of the sixteen kinds of emptiness from the ASPP are different in the PPS and the BhĀA. Moreover, in the BhĀA these quotations are not explained “in due succession” as they are in the ASPP. Several observations remain to be clarified regarding the study of the BhĀA. For example, the BhĀA follows the order of explanation of the sixteen kinds of emptiness as in the MAV and its contents correspond to the content of the MAV and the ŠPAB. The connections between these texts will be analyzed in further studies.

Notes

1) There are twenty kinds of emptiness explained in the PSPP and the Šatasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā, eighteen in the Daśasāhasrikā P., the Aṣṭādaśasāhasrikā P.,光讃經, 放光般若經, 摩訶般若波羅蜜經, 大般若波羅蜜多經.

2) There are two versions of the ASPP manuscript extant in Tibetan translation. The London manuscript is one of the older manuscripts (cf. Shōji 2016). In this paper, the older version is shown for reference.

Abbreviations and Primary Sources

ASPP  Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā. Ed. P. L. Vaidya. Darbhanga: The Mithila Institute, 1960.
BhĀA  *Bhagavatyāmnāyānusārinināmavyākhya. Tib. D no. 3811 ba 1b1–320a7, P no. 5209 ba 1a1–361b1, L see Shōji 2016.
MAV  Madhyāntavibhāgaḥabhya. Ed. Nagao Gajin. Tokyo: Suzuki Research Foundation, 1964.
ŠPAB  *Āryaśatasāhasrikāpañcaviṃśatisāhasrikāṣṭādaśasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitābhṛṭṭīkā. Tib. D no. 3808 pha 1b1–292b3, P no. 5206 pha 1a1–320a1.
PPS  Prajñāpāramitāpindārthasamgraha of Dignāga. “Dignāga, Sein Werk und seine Entwicklung.” Ed. Erich Frauwallner. Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Süd- und Ostasiens 3 (1959): 83–164.
PSPP  Pañcaviṃśatisāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā. Ed. Kimura Takayas. Tokyo: Sankibō Busshorin, 1986–2009.

Secondary Sources

Kimura Seimin. 2018. “Sixteen Kinds of Śūnyatā in the Prajñāpāramitāpindārthasamgraha and the Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā.” Indogaku Bukkyōgaku kenkyū 66(3): 1091–1095.
Shōji Fumio. 2016. Rondon shahon Kangyuru shoshū Chibetto-go-yaku “Hassenju Hanny” no kenkyū ロンドン写本カンギュル所収チベット語訳『八千頌般若』の研究. Tokyo: Sankibō Busshorin.

Key words  Dignāga, 十六空, Prajñāpāramitāpindārthasamgraha, Bhagavatyāmnāyānusārinināmavyākhya, Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā

(Graduate student, Kyoto University)