The unitary three-body problem in a trap

Félix Werner and Yvan Castin
Laboratoire Kastler Brossel, École Normale Supérieure,
24 rue Lhomond, 75231 Paris Cedex 05, France
(Dated: October 28, 2018)

We consider either 3 spinless bosons or 3 equal mass spin-1/2 fermions, interacting via a short range potential of infinite scattering length and trapped in an isotropic harmonic potential. For a zero-range model, we obtain analytically the exact spectrum and eigenfunctions: for fermions all the states are universal; for bosons there is a coexistence of decoupled universal and efimovian states. All the universal states, even the bosonic ones, have a tiny 3-body loss rate. For a finite range model, we numerically find for bosons a coupling between zero angular momentum universal and efimovian states; the coupling is so weak that, for realistic values of the interaction range, these bosonic universal states remain long-lived and observable.

PACS numbers: 03.75.Ss, 05.30.Jp

With a Feshbach resonance, it is now possible to produce a stable quantum gas of fermionic atoms in the unitary limit, i.e. with an interaction of negligible range and scattering length $a = \infty$. The properties of this gas, including its superfluidity, are under active experimental investigation. They have the remarkable feature of being universal, as was tested in particular for the zero temperature equation of state of the gas. In contrast, experiments with Bose gases at a Feshbach resonance suffer from high loss rates, and even the existence of a unitary Bose gas phase is a very open subject.

In this context, fully understanding the few-body unitary problem is a crucial step. In free space, the unitary three-body problem in a trap

$$
\sum_{i=1}^{3} \left[ -\frac{\hbar^2}{2m} \Delta r_i + \frac{1}{2} m \omega^2 r_i^2 \right] \psi = E \psi.
$$

is a spherical harmonic, $Y_l$ being the total internal angular momentum of the system. The function $\varphi(\alpha)$, where $\alpha = \text{arctan}(r/\rho)$, solves the transcendental equation for $s$:

$$
- \varphi^\prime(\alpha) + \frac{l(l+1)}{\cos^2 \alpha} \varphi(\alpha) = s^2 \varphi(\alpha)
$$

$$
\varphi(\pi/2) = 0
$$

$$
\varphi(0) + \eta(-1)^l \frac{4}{\sqrt{3}} \varphi(\pi/3) = 0
$$

in the limit $r_{ij} \equiv |r_i - r_j| \to 0$ taken for fixed positions of the other particle $k$ and of the center of mass $R_{ij}$ of $i$ and $j$. In the unitary limit considered in this paper, $a = \infty$. When all the $r_{ij}$ are non zero, the wavefunction $\psi$ obeys the non-interacting Schrödinger equation

$$
\sum_{i=1}^{3} \left[ -\frac{\hbar^2}{2m} \Delta r_i + \frac{1}{2} m \omega^2 r_i^2 \right] \psi = E \psi.
$$

$\omega$ is the oscillation frequency and $m$ the mass of an atom.

To solve this problem, we extend the approach of Efimov to the trapped case, and obtain the form

$$
\psi(r_1, r_2, r_3) = \psi_{cm}(C) F(R) \left( 1 + \hat{Q} \right) \frac{1}{r \rho} \varphi(\alpha) Y_l^{m}(\rho/r) .
$$

Since the center of mass is separable for a harmonic trapping, we have singled out the wavefunction $\psi_{cm}(C)$ of its stationary state of energy $E_{cm}$, with $C = (r_1 + r_2 + r_3)/3$. The operator $\hat{Q}$ ensures the correct exchange symmetry of $\psi$: for spinless bosons, $\hat{Q} = \hat{P}_{13} + \hat{P}_{23}$, while $\hat{P}_{ij}$ transposes particles $i$ and $j$: for spin 1/2 fermions, we assume a spin state $\uparrow\downarrow\uparrow$ so that $\hat{Q} = -\hat{P}_{13}$. The Jacobi coordinates are $r = r_2 - r_1$ and $\rho = (r_3 - r_1 - r_2)/\sqrt{3}$. $Y_l^{m}$ is a spherical harmonic, $l$ being the total internal angular momentum of the system. The function $\varphi(\alpha)$, where $\alpha = \text{arctan}(r/\rho)$, solves the eigenvalue problem

$$
- \varphi^\prime(\alpha) + \frac{l(l+1)}{\cos^2 \alpha} \varphi(\alpha) = s^2 \varphi(\alpha)
$$

$$
\varphi(\pi/2) = 0
$$

$$
\varphi(0) + \eta(-1)^l \frac{4}{\sqrt{3}} \varphi(\pi/3) = 0
$$

with $\eta = -1$ for fermions, $\eta = 2$ for bosons. An analytical expression can be obtained for $\varphi(\alpha)$, which leads to the transcendental equation for $s$:

$$
\left[ \frac{4}{\sqrt{3}} \varphi(\pi/3) - \frac{4}{\sqrt{3}} \varphi(\pi/3) \right] [i \leftrightarrow -i] = 0.
$$
Eq. (10), each real solution for bosons, which is purely imaginary. According to total angular momentum universal states. Note that the ground universal state has a \[ a \] universal states \[ 19 \].

This is related to the existence of a scaling solution for the trapped unitary gas \[ 17 \] and the subsequent embedding of the Hamiltonian in a \( SO(2, 1) \) algebra \[ 13 \], leading to an exact mapping between trapped and free space universal states \[ 19 \].

With \( s^2 < 0 \), as is the case in the \( l = n = 0 \) channel for bosons, the Schrödinger equation Eq. (5) does not define by itself an Hermitian problem and has to be supplemented by a boundary condition for \( R \to 0 \) \[ 21 \]:

\[
F(R) \propto \text{Im} \left[ \left( \frac{R}{R_t} \right)^{s_0} \right],
\]

where \( R_t \) is an additional 3-body parameter. For the resulting Efimovian states, the function \( F \) is given by

\[
F(R) = R^{-1} \text{W}(E - E_{cm})/2\hbar\omega, s_0/2(R^2/a_{ho}^2)
\]

(12)

where \( W \) is a Whittaker function, and the energy solves:

\[
\arg \Gamma \left[ \frac{1 + s_0 - (E - E_{cm})/\hbar\omega}{2} \right] = -|s_0| \ln(R_t/a_{ho})
\]

+ \arg \Gamma(1 + s_0) \mod \pi.

(13)

We did not yet obtain all the 3-body eigenstates \[ 22 \]. Indeed, all the above states satisfy the contact condition \[ 11 \] with a non-zero function \( A \). But there are wavefunctions of the unitary gas which vanish when two particles are at the same point; these are also eigenstates of the non-interacting case. An example is the Laughlin state of the Fractional Quantum Hall Effect \[ 23 \]:

\[
\psi = e^{-\sum_{r=1}^{N} \frac{\mathbf{r}_r^2}{2\alpha^2_{ho}}} \prod_{1 \leq \eta \leq 3} \left[ (x_n + iy_n) - (x_m + iy_m) \right]^{\eta}.
\]

(14)

In the limit of high energies \( E \gg \hbar\omega \), there are actually many of these \( A \equiv 0 \) states: their density of states (DOS) is almost as high as the DOS of the non-interacting case:

\[
\frac{\rho_{A=0}(E)}{\rho_{\text{non-inter}}(E)} \xrightarrow{E \to \infty} 1 - O \left( \frac{(\hbar\omega/E)^2}{E} \right).
\]

(15)

In contrast, the DOS of the \( A \neq 0 \) states is only

\[
\frac{\rho_{A\neq0}(E)}{\rho_{\text{non-inter}}(E)} \xrightarrow{E \to \infty} O \left( \frac{(\hbar\omega/E)^3}{E} \right).
\]

(16)

Eq. (16) is a consequence of Eq. (17) given below. We found Eq. (16) by applying the rank theorem to the operator \( \psi_0(r_1, r_2, r_3) \to \left( \psi_0(r_1, r_1, r_3), \psi_0(r_1, r_2, r_1), \psi_0(r_1, r_2, r_2) \right) \) which associates, to each non-interacting eigenstate \( \psi_0 \) of energy \( E \), 3 functions of 2 atomic positions, and whose kernel is the space of \( A \equiv 0 \) states of energy \( E \) \[ 24 \].

This completes our derivation of all eigenstates of the unitary 3-body problem in a trap. Three types of states are obtained in general: universal eigenstates common to the non-interacting case, universal interacting states, and Efimovian states depending on a 3-body parameter.

We now prove that the Efimov effect is absent for 3 equal mass fermions. This fact is known but to our
knowledge not demonstrated. Numerically one can only check the absence of imaginary solution of the transcendental equation in some finite interval of $s$ and $l$. Here we prove that for any $l$ and any imaginary $s$, there is no solution to the problem \(11, 11, 10, 15\). Let us assume that

$$s^2 \leq l(l+1),$$

and that \(11, 11, 10, 15\) are satisfied. We will show that the quantity $Q(l, s^2) \equiv \varphi(0) - (-1)^l \sqrt{3/\pi} \varphi(\pi/3)$ is non-zero, which is incompatible with \(10\). We rewrite \(10\) as \(\varphi''(\alpha) = u(\alpha)\varphi(\alpha)\). This is Newton’s equation, \(\alpha\) being the time \(\varphi\) the position of a fictitious particle subject to an expelling harmonic force with time dependent spring constant

$$u(\alpha; l, s^2) = \frac{l(l+1)}{\cos^2 \alpha} - s^2 \geq 0.$$

Eq.\(10\) imposes that this particle reaches the origin at ‘time’ $\pi/2$. The particle then should not reach the origin earlier, otherwise the expelling force would prevent it from turning back to $\varphi = 0$. We thus can take the normalization $\varphi(0) = 1$, which implies $\varphi'(0) < 0$ and $\varphi(\alpha) > 0$ for $0 < \alpha < \pi/2$. Thus, $Q(l, s^2) < 0$ for $l$ even. For $l$ odd, one needs two intermediate results: (i) $Q(l = 1, s^2 = 2) < 0$ (which we check by explicit calculation); (ii) if $\varphi_1, \varphi_2$ are two solutions with $u_2 \geq u_1$, then $\varphi_2 \leq \varphi_1$, and $Q_2 \leq Q_1$: because the spring constant for particle 2 is larger, particle 2 has to start faster and walk constantly ahead of particle 1 in the race towards the origin, to satisfy Eq.\(10\). Now the assumption $s^2 \leq l(l+1)$ implies $u(\alpha; l, s^2) \geq u(\alpha; l = 1, s^2 = 2)$. One concludes that: $Q(l, s^2) \leq Q(l = 1, s^2 = 2) < 0$. For bosons, we proved similarly that all the $s^2$ are positive, except for the well known $s_n = 0, l = 0 \simeq i \times 1.00624$.

It appears clearly on Fig\(4\) that $s_{l,n}$ gets close to an integer value $\tilde{s}_{l,n}$ as soon as $l$ or $n$ increases, with

$$\tilde{s}_{l,n} = l + 1 + 2n \quad \text{for} \quad l \geq |\eta|,$$

$$\tilde{s}_{l,n} = 2n - l + (2\eta + 11)/3 \quad \text{for} \quad l < |\eta|. \quad (17)$$

To check this analytically, the transcendental equation is not useful. We rather applied semi-classical WKB techniques to the problem \(11, 11, 10, 15\), and obtained \(22\):

$$s_{l,0} - \tilde{s}_{l,0} \sim \eta (-1)^{l+1} 2^{-l-1}/\sqrt{3\pi l} \quad (18)$$

$$s_{l,n} - \tilde{s}_{l,n} \sim \eta \cos \left[ \frac{\pi}{3} (l + 1 - n) \right] (-1)^{l+n+1/4} \frac{\sqrt{3}}{\pi \sqrt{n}} \quad (19)$$

$$\max_{n} \left| s_{l,n} - \tilde{s}_{l,n} \right| \sim \eta \left| \frac{4 A_{l} \max}{3/2 \pi} \right| l^{-5/6} \quad (20)$$

with $A_{l} \max \simeq 0.5357$ the maximum of the Airy function.

We now discuss the lifetime of the 3-body states found here in the trap, due to 3-body recombination to a deeply bound molecular state. The recombination rate is commonly estimated as $\Gamma_{loss} \propto P \phi/(\sigma a^2)$, where $\sigma$ is the range of the interaction potential, and $P$ is the probability that $R < \sigma$. Evaluating $P$ from the 3-body wavefunctions obtained above for the zero range model, this gives for $E$ not much larger than $\hbar \omega$:

$$\Gamma_{loss}^{univ} \propto \omega \left( \frac{\sigma}{a_{ho}} \right)^{2s} \quad (21)$$

for a universal state with exponent $s$, and $\Gamma_{loss}^{eff} \propto \omega$ for an efimovian state. Since $s \geq 1.77$ for fermions and $s \geq 2.82$ for bosons (Fig\(4\)). Eq.\(21\) indicates that the lifetime of universal states is $\gg 1/\omega$ for $\sigma \ll a_{ho}$.

The existence of long-lived bosonic states is an unexpected feature that we now investigate in a more realistic way. The unitary three-body problem in an isotropic harmonic trap may be realized experimentally by trapping 3 atoms at a site of a deep optical lattice, and using a Feshbach resonance. For a broad Feshbach resonance, the effective range is of the order of the Van der Waals length, which is roughly one order of magnitude smaller than $a_{ho}$, for an usual lattice spacing of $\sim 0.5 \mu m$ and a lattice depth of $\sim 50$ recoil energies. This experimental situation is not deeply in the asymptotic regime of a zero range potential. Moreover, in the zero range model, there are energy crossings between universal and efimovian states as a function of $R_{c}/a_{ho}$ (see solid lines in Fig\(2\)); as we shall see, for a finite range, there is a coupling between $l = 0$ universal and efimovian states, leading to avoided crossings \(28\), and to an additional contribution to the loss rate of $l = 0$ universal states not included in Eq.\(21\).

We therefore solve a finite interaction range model, the
Gaussian separable potential of range $\sigma$, defined as

$$
\langle r_1, r_2 | V | r_1', r_2' \rangle = -\frac{\hbar^2}{2\pi^3/2 m \sigma^5 e^{-r_2^2 + r_1'^2}/2\sigma^2 \delta(R_{12} - R_{12}')}.
$$

(22)

This leads to an integral equation that we solve numerically. In Fig 2a, we show two $l = 0$ energy branches as a function of $\sigma$, corresponding in the zero-range model to the lowest $l = 0$ universal state and to an efimovian branch. The smallness of the avoided crossing between the two branches shows that the coupling due to the finite range of the interaction is weak: the energy splitting at the avoided crossing is $\hbar \Omega / 2 \approx 0.01 \hbar \omega$, see inset of Fig 2b.

We now revisit the calculation of the 3-body loss rate for bosons, since Eq. (21) neglects the contamination of the universal state by the efimovian state. To account for the losses we add to the Hamiltonian $H_{\text{sep}}$ of the separable potential model an antihermitian part leading to an integral equation that we solve numerically. In Fig 2a, we show two branches of Fig 2a: the eigenvalues of the resulting $2 \times 2$ matrix have complex parts $-i \hbar \Gamma / 2$. For the universal states, $\Gamma \approx 0.07 \omega$. For the universal states $\Gamma$ is several orders of magnitude smaller; this remains true on the avoided crossing, because the coupling $\Omega / 2$ of the universal state to the efimovian state is much smaller than the decay rate of the efimovian state.

Experimentally, if one starts with the non-interacting ground state, a superposition of $3$-body unitary eigenstates can be prepared by switching suddenly the scattering length from zero to infinity. The Bohr frequencies in the subsequent evolution of an observable would give information on the 3-body spectrum. For bosons, there will be a finite fraction of the sites where the three atoms have a long lifetime. This fraction is equal to the probability of having populated a universal state, which we calculate to be $0.174$, a value dominated by the contribution ($0.105$) of the lowest $l = 0$ universal state.

In summary, we obtained the complete analytical solution of a zero-range unitary 3-body problem in a trap. For bosons, there are efimovian and universal states, while for equal mass fermions we proved that all states are universal. All universal states are stable in the zero-range limit with respect to 3-body losses, not only for fermions, but also for bosons. From the numerical solution of a finite range model, we find that, although the bosonic universal states of zero angular momentum slightly mix with the efimovian states, their lifetime remains much larger than the oscillation period in the trap.

We thank L. Pricoupenko, D. Petrov, T. Köhler, A. Bulgac, D. Bauer for very useful discussions; T. Krämer et al. for their data. LKB is a Unité de Recherche de l’ENS et de l’Université Paris 6, associée au CNRS. Our research group is a member of IFRAF.

[1] K. M. O’Hara et al., Science 298, 2179 (2002); C. A. Regal et al., Nature 424, 47 (2003); T. Bourdel et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 91, 020402 (2003).
[2] C. A. Regal et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 92, 040403 (2004); M. W. Zwierlein et al., ibid. 92, 120403 (2004); M. Bartenstein et al., ibid. 92, 120401 (2004); T. Bourdel et al., ibid. 93, 050401 (2004); G. B. Partridge et al., ibid. 95, 020404 (2005); C. Chin et al., Science 305, 1128 (2004); J. Kinast et al., Science 307, 1296 (2005); M. W. Zwierlein et al., Nature 435, 1047-1051 (2005).
[3] J. Carlson et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 91, 050401 (2003); G. E. Astrakharchik et al., ibid. 93, 200404 (2004).
[4] J. Stenger et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 82, 2422 (1999); J. L. Roberts et al., ibid. 85, 728 (2000); A. Marte et al., ibid. 89, 283202 (2002); T. Weber et al., ibid. 91, 123201 (2003).
[5] T. Kraemer et al., Nature 440, 315 (2006).
[6] E. Braaten, H.-W. Hammer, Phys. Rep. 428, 259 (2006).
[7] E. Braaten et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 88, 040401 (2002).
[8] V. N. Efimov, Sov. J. Nucl. Phys. 12, 589 (1971).
[9] J. Carlson et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 91, 050401 (2003); G. E. Astrakharchik et al., ibid. 93, 200404 (2004).
[10] M. Stoll, T. Köhler, Phys. Rev. A 72, 022714 (2005).
[11] M. Greiner et al., Nature 415, 39 (2002).
[12] M. Köh et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 94, 080403 (2005).
[13] T. Busch et al., Found. Phys. 28, 549 (1998).
[14] V. Efimov, Nucl. Phys. A210, 157 (1973).
[15] $\psi(\alpha) = \frac{1}{4} \sum_{k=0}^{l} \left( \frac{-i \hbar}{2 \pi} \right)^{k} \left( \frac{1 + i \tan \alpha}{\sin(\pi \alpha)} \right) e^{-i \pi \alpha}$.
[16] The integer solutions must be eliminated ($l = 0$, $s = 2$ for fermions; $l = 0$, $s = 4$ and $l = 1$, $s = 3$ for bosons).
[17] Y. Castin, Comptes Rendus Physique 5, 407 (2004).
[18] L.P. Pitaevskii, A. Rosch, Phys. Rev. A 55, R853 (1997).
[19] S. Tan, cond-mat/0412764; F. Werner, Y. Castin, cond-mat/0507399; and cond-mat/0607821.
[20] P. Morse and H. Feshbach, Methods of Theoretical Physics, vol. II, p. 1665 (Mc Graw-Hill, 1953).
[21] G. S. Danilov, Sov. Phys. JETP 13, 349 (1961).
[22] The above solution is based on a sequence of ansatz, which misses some of the eigenstates.
[23] R. B. Laughlin, Phys. Rev. Lett. 50, 1395 (1983).
[24] The rank theorem is: for an operator $T$ acting on a finite dimensional space $\mathcal{E}$, $\dim \mathcal{E} = \dim(\ker T) + \dim(\text{Im} T)$. An upper bound on $\dim(\text{Im} T)$ then leads to the result.
[25] For $\alpha \neq 0$, we used $\partial_{x} \varphi(x) = f_{0} x^{-\pi / 2} \varphi(x)$ where $\varphi$ solves (45) with the normalization $\varphi(0) = 1$.
[26] D. S. Petrov et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 93, 090404 (2004); E. Nielsen et al., Phys. Rev. A 66, 012705 (2002).
[27] We find $\ln(R_{1}/\sigma) \approx 4.40 \mod \pi / s_{0}$ for the separable potential from the free space Efimov states energies.
[28] Avoided crossings also occur for 3 bosons in a box (L.
[29] A similar effect occurs in atomic physics, for an atomic ground state coupled via a weak laser field to an excited state: C. Cohen-Tannoudji, J. Dupont-Roc, G. Grynberg, *Atom-Photon Interactions*, §C1.3b (Wiley, 1992).