Oxygen vacancies of the TiO₂ nano-based composite photocatalysts in visible light responsive photocatalysis

Buanya Beryl Adormaa,† Williams Kweku Darkwah,†,* and Yanhui Ao,*

The TiO₂ nano-based composite photocatalyst is best known for application in solving the recent issues related to energy and environmental purification. Due to the low cost, nontoxicity, chemical stability and high efficiency of TiO₂, it is unquestionably one of the most considered materials in environmental treatment. In this systematic review, we reveal the outstanding potential of oxygen vacancy in photocatalysis, and discuss the contemporary advancement in the photocatalytic activities, productivity, preparation methods and oxygen vacancy of the TiO₂ nano-based composite photocatalyst for environmental treatment and energy as well as wastewater treatment. This exposé is anticipated to enlighten researchers and engineers on the specific management and assessment of the environment, which warrants prospective research into developing appropriate mechanisms for energy, wastewater treatment and environmental purification.

1. Introduction

Currently, research efforts have shifted toward semiconductor photocatalysts such as TiO₂, ZnO, g-C₃N₄, etc., due to the ability of these metals to convert pollutants into CO₂ and H₂O for environmental applications such as biofuel production and wastewater treatment. For modest and cost-effective treatment, additional efficient photocatalysts are highly preferred to parallel the extensively used TiO₂. The field of water photocatalysis has experienced tremendous growth, following the discovery of photocatalytic H₂ production in the 1980s and the photocatalysis and hydrophilicity of TiO₂ films by Honda and Fujishima in the 1990s, and other scientists in the early 70s.67–72 Further studies have revealed that industrial applications in this area have been wonderfully accomplished since the early 90s based on the outcomes from these basic research efforts.8,105–107

Photocatalysis is the speeding up of oxidation and reduction reactions, brought about through the activation of a catalyst consisting of a semiconductor either alone or in combination with metal/organic/organometallic promoters, through light absorption and the subsequent charge and/or energy transfer, which can lead to the transformation of a pollutant. It must be noted that during the photocatalytic reaction, two actions must

Buanya Beryl Adormaa is a Doctoral degree student at the College of Environment, Hohai University, Nanjing, China. She received her M.Sc. degree from Hohai University, Nanjing, China. Her research interest is mainly focused on photocatalysis-based water remediation technology using nanomaterials.

Williams Kweku Darkwah is a Master’s degree student in the Environmental Engineering Department, College of Environment, Hohai University, Nanjing, China. He received his B.Sc. from the University of Cape Coast, Ghana. His research interest is mainly focused on photocatalysis-based water remediation technology using nanomaterials.
occur simultaneously in order for the successful production of reactive oxidizing species to occur. Typically, the first involves the oxidation of dissociatively adsorbed H₂O by photogenerated holes, the second involves the reduction of an electron acceptor (typically dissolved oxygen) by photoexcited electrons; these reactions lead to the production of a hydroxyl and superoxide radical anion, respectively. In the area of photocatalysis, energy saving green tools are the ultimate, in accordance with photoinduced water cleavage to TiO₂ electrodes, a phenomenon discovered by the pioneers in the field. It is believed that TiO₂ photocatalysis is currently one of the best in the recent research in nanoscience and nanotechnology.

There have been many successful reports on the potential applications of TiO₂ photocatalysts in water and environmental purification and management in the past few decades. In solving the recent issues related to energy and environmental purification, heterogeneous metal oxide semiconductor photocatalysts are best known. Due to the low-cost, nontoxicity, chemical stability and high efficiency of TiO₂, it is unques-tionably one of the most considered materials by researchers in the field of photocatalysis. However, the low quantum efficiency of TiO₂ in photocatalytic mechanisms and the ineffective use of visible light for H₂ harvesting, which mainly comes from its high recombination rate of photogenerated electron–hole pairs and wide band gap, have become problematic in prospective applications.

Scientists in the field have adopted various approaches for the improvement of the photocatalytic efficacy of TiO₂. These strategies can be summarized as morphological modifications, such as increased surface area and porosity, or as chemical modifications, by the incorporation of additional components into the TiO₂ structure. Three basic strategies have been adopted for the structural modification, namely, doping with metallic/non-metallic elements or co-doping of metallic and non-metallic elements, modification through the introduction of defects such as oxygen vacancies and Ti³⁺ in the band gap, and surface modification by treatment techniques. Currently, the attention is centered on oxygen vacancies, which occur naturally in oxides, due to the vital role they play in the physical characteristics of materials; oxygen vacancies may be positive or negative. Oxygen vacancies occur when the number of oxygens in a particular compound is less than what it is supposed to be to make a perfect crystal lattice. This results in materials such as ZnFe₂O₄, where ZnO and Fe₂O₃ are chosen as starting compounds.

This review is centered on the ability and effectiveness of the prospective applications of oxygen vacancies and photocatalysis using TiO₂ composites for energy, wastewater and environ-mental treatment in order to design future implementations to solve environmental problems. This is attractive for ecological uses such as water purification, purified biofuel production and wastewater treatment. Researchers in this field are doing their best in one way or the other to use these composites to solve the environmental crises. This discussion tackles the use of oxygen vacancies of TiO₂ nano-based composites in photocatalysis to solve environmental concerns such as water treatment and related issues.

2. Review

2.1. Photocatalysis

Environmental remediation technology such as aromatic oxygen vacancy compounds and NOx have been suggested by scientists in recent years for the treatment of urban pollution; thus leading to the use of photocatalytic self-cleaning and depolluting constituents. The photocatalytic properties of a thin layer of TiO₂ entrenched in paints or concrete or placed at the surface of the particle influences the choice of these viable products. Photocatalysis is designed to harvest visible light (the major component of solar radiation that reaches the Earth’s surface) using photocatalysts to drive chemical transformations (Fig. 1 and 3). The use of TiO₂ photocatalysts as an evolving pollution control technology has been stated in numerous fields of science. It, therefore, seems that the actual influence and efficiency on the quality of water of these novel advancements have not been fully demonstrated to date but it has been revealed in a very restricted way. Photocatalysis embraces a class of reactions that use a catalyst activated by light and the decomposition of organic composites into water and carbon dioxide, leading to the fascinating properties of surfaces covered with a photocatalyst; these can shield against coating by fouling matter, are self-cleaning, antibacterial and viricidal.

Heterogeneous photocatalysis in gas and liquid phase remediation has been intensively described by many researchers. Typically, the complete procedure is made up of five separate steps (Fig. 2): allocation of the reactants in the gas or liquid phase to the surface, adsorption of at least one of the reactants, reaction in the adsorbed phase, desorption of the product(s), and removal of the products from the interface region.

The third step is where the photocatalytic nature of certain metal oxides plays a role despite all the steps usually found in all heterogeneous processes. Semiconductor catalysts such as TiO₂, ZnO, ZrO₂, CeO₂ etc., with photons carrying energy equal to or in excess of its band gap, create electron–hole pairs similar to photoinduced electron transfer and the absorption of light promotes one electron into the conduction band. The oxide may
transfer its electron to any adsorbed electron acceptor (thereby promoting its reduction), while the hole (or the electron vacancy) may accept an electron from an adsorbed donor (promoting its oxidation).

TiO$_2$ photocatalysis happens when the energy of the photons is enough to promote the electrons in the valence band to jump to the conduction band; this occurs in three steps:

(a) Photon absorption and electron–hole pair generation.

(b) Charge separation and migration to surface reaction sites or to recombination sites.

(c) Surface chemical reactions at active sites containing donor oxidation at valence-band holes and acceptor reduction at electron centers (Fig. 4).

Numerous defects associated with photocatalytic principles have been identified by researchers. During photocatalysis, cation radicals$^{17}$ can be produced by injecting charge from...
excited molecules into the conduction band of TiO₂ (Fig. 4 and 5).

Irradiation is usually the starting process in TiO₂ photocatalysis; thus, the excitation of electrons by photons at the ground state is the prerequisite. Periodically, the excitation stage and thus the photoexcitation of electrons at the ground state also occurs in most of the materials adsorbed on the surface of the semiconductors; e.g., the reaction occurring in dye-sensitized solar cells. There are different pathways that are mainly experienced by the charge carriers. Many of the individual materials such as TiO₂ are mostly used for water splitting, oxidation/reduction, (Fig. 5) in both suspension and electrode systems.

Significant research attention is centered on metal oxides and silicates due to their photocatalytic activities and their wide range of applications in photocatalysis. Several semiconductors, such as TiO₂, ZnO, Fe₂O₃, WO₃, SrTiO₃, NaTaO₃, CdS, Ag₃PO₄, BiPO₄, and g-C₃N₄, NiO, Cr₂O₃, Co₃O₄, Al₂O₃, are known photocatalysts, with their use for effective photocatalytic activities being dependent on their band gap (Fig. 6 and 7). The trapping experiments for holes and free radicals (ROS/RNS) are usually used to explain the photocatalytic schemes of photocatalysts such as TiO₂. Also, the trapping experiments of holes, hydroxyl radicals (·OH), and superoxide radicals (·O₂⁻) have been reported by many studies in photocatalysis as the main oxidative species that are found in photocatalytic processes.

In instituting whether transformation or water splitting (Fig. 5) is really a photocatalytic activity, with direct activation of reactants and intermediates through visible light absorption, it is essential to establish that the photocatalyst absorbs the photons rather than the absorbents.

Photoexcited charge carriers (Fig. 7) drive the conversion of water (Fig. 5) and carbon dioxide into H₂, CO, CH₄, and CH₃OH related oxygenates and hydrocarbons during photocatalytic production.
2.1.1. Hybrid non-porous TiO₂ photocatalysts. The concentration of chemical compounds is determined by the rate of chemical reactions as described by Yu and coauthors.⁵³ TiO₂ has low adsorption ability, specifically for nonporous compounds, which is as a result of its polar structure. The synthesis of TiO₂ with adsorbents is an important factor in improving the adsorption properties of TiO₂ particles; the adsorbents hold the compounds on the adsorbent support. Yu and coauthors⁵⁵ reported that an increase in the photoreaction rate comes about due to the formation of high environmental concentrations of the compounds around the nonporous TiO₂ particle. Consequently, numerous schemes have been established to alter the properties of TiO₂, anticipating the lengthening of the lifespan of the photogenerated electron–hole pairs and a narrower band gap. To extend the optical absorption to the visible region and the lifetime of TiO₂, many successful studies by researchers in the field have centered on doping metal or non-metal elements into the TiO₂ lattice to generate donors or acceptors in the band gap. However, there are substantial restrictions for this approach; the reduced incident photon to electron transformation efficiency in the UV light region and improved carrier recombination centers are the most challenging. Consequently, to heighten the useful application of TiO₂, it is important to decrease the recombination and then increase the visible light absorption.⁴⁵ Various adsorbents such as zeolum, alumina, silica, mordenite, ferrierite, and activated carbon, have been used as the support for TiO₂ and they have shown that the hybrid photocatalysts are effective in achieving high decomposition rates of propionaldehyde in the air. Ao and Lee⁴⁶ used activated carbon with TiO₂ as the hybrid photocatalysts in their research and they made similar conclusions to those made by Yu and colleagues.⁵⁵ The photodegradation efficacy of ZnO, when synergized with activated carbon as the adsorbent, was found to be higher compared to TiO₂.

2.1.2. Preparation of the TiO₂ photocatalysts. Preparation methods (Table 1) for nano-based composites include the hydrothermal technique and water-in-oil microemulsion,⁴⁹ the sol–gel method,⁵⁰ and vapor decomposition of titanium alkyl oxides or TiCl₄ in oxygen.⁴⁸

The TiO₂ nanomaterial obtained is mostly based on the conditions used in its preparation. These include the following:

(1) Preparation of TiO₂ powder using this method usually uses liquid solutions as solvents to harvest the precursors. This usually occurs under increased temperature, <250 °C,⁵⁰ and high-pressure conditions
(2) Crystalline products are often formed (Fig. 8), considering the nucleation and crystal development. These products have different compositions, structures, and morphologies. TiO₂ powders are obtained after critical washing and drying
(3) NaOH or ethanol and water frequently serve as the solvents. TiCl₄ and Ti(SO₄)₂ are also commonly used as precursors
(4) The hydrothermal procedure is best used to improve crystallization on both the laboratory and commercial scales. The crystallization process is influenced by features such as reaction time, reaction temperature, the medium, and type of precursor

3. Coating methods
(1) Studies have revealed that active commercial TiO₂ powder possesses less photocatalytic activity than the TiO₂ film.⁵³ Photocatalytic activity is often influenced by coating the TiO₂.⁵³ TiO₂ doped with elements such as C and N for doped TiO₂ synthesis is less expensive.⁵⁹
(2) There are two main coating methods:
(a) Directly sintering or dip-coating (sometimes called wash-coating) the catalyst powders
(b) Formation of the TiO₂ film on the support. This mostly uses the following preparative techniques:
(i) Metal–organic CVD (MOCVD)
(ii) Chemical vapor deposition (CVD)
(iii) Sol–gel⁴⁰,⁵⁵
(iv) Spray coating

Table 1 Comparison of selected preparative techniques for nonporous TiO₂ photocatalysts

| Preparation methods | Comparison |
|---------------------|------------|
| (1) Hydrothermal     | (1) Preparation of TiO₂ powder using this method usually uses liquid solutions as solvents to harvest the precursors. This usually occurs under increased temperature, <250 °C, and high-pressure conditions |
| (2) Water-in-oil microemulsion techniques | (2) Crystalline products are often formed (Fig. 8), considering the nucleation and crystal development. These products have different compositions, structures, and morphologies. TiO₂ powders are obtained after critical washing and drying |

(1) Gas-phase method.
(2) Liquid-phase method.

2.1.3. Point defects and standard specimens. The idea of defects primarily lies in the solid state physics explanation of

Fig. 8 TEM image of the synthesized TiO₂–SiO₂ catalyst. Reproduced with permission.⁶⁶ Copyright 2006, Chemical Engineering and Processing. Elsevier.
lattice distortion. Lattice distortion is usually in the form of linear defects, point defects, three-dimensional valleys or hetero-impurities and two-dimensional flaws or interfaces. Fujishima and team found that point defects are well studied by scientists in the field and this delivers the principal understanding of the properties of lattice defects, consisting of magnetic, electrical, energetic, optical, and thermal characteristics in solids. OTDs are commonly accepted as point defects. In photocatalytic reactions, the point trap model is best used to analyze oxygen vacancies and OTD-related clusters. In the case of the synthesis process, lattice defects are certainly produced. These defects are thermal and preparation dependent. During material doping, intrinsic point defects are often observed in the lattice. These observed intrinsic point defects exist as atomic impurities, vacancies and interstitials. Studies have shown that these defects are scattered on flat surfaces as observed by STM images. The scattered distribution of these defects is noted to be the main reason for most of the increased photocatalytic activities.

In contrast, the presence of the coordinate and disordered defects in diverse samples makes it barely possible to exactly compare the photocatalytic properties. Under ambient conditions at room temperature, distinct particles are uncommon. To simplify the study on the molecular scale, much research has been devoted to the hypothesis pertaining to well-defined particles. Consequently, there is a strong call for the understanding of the nature of photocatalytic reactions regarding the preparation of comparable standard specimens.

2.2. Oxygen vacancy

Oxygen vacancy occurs when the number of oxygens anticipated in a particular compound is less than what it is supposed to have made it a perfect crystal lattice. Annealing in a reducing atmosphere is a prerequisite for the removal of oxygen from a compound made up of oxygen. Extra oxygenation requires annealing in an oxidizing atmosphere (O2). Simply put, this involves hole doping (the removal of two electrons as a result of adding one oxygen atom from the parent atom), and electron doping (addition of two electrons due to the removal of one oxygen atom from the parent atom). Magnetic and transport properties are mostly determined by the final material’s structure, which is also dependent on its total charge/spin state. This idea is expected to be true in nanomaterials or bulk materials; however, anomalous properties are seen in nanomaterials, due to the ability of these materials to exist in new or active electronic states or environments (Fig. 9).  

Considering spinel type ferrites, the exchange of cations in the tetrahedral and octahedral sites in these magnetic oxides are well known to induce vacancies or lattice defects. There is, therefore, the inversion of normal spinel structures due to the occupation of most divalent transitional metal ions. At this point, the superexchange mechanism is produced due to the relative positions of both octahedral and tetrahedral sites of the atoms. Interatomic distances, anions, cations and bond angles are extensively close. The hopping mechanism that has a give-and-take of an e⁻ to a half-filled shell is often determined by the oxygen atom in the structure. Antiferromagnetic coupling to the unpaired spin of oxygen, as described by the Pauli exclusion and Hund’s rule, or contribution to the net magnetism occurs due to an outstanding exchange with the closest neighbor transition metal. Negative and positive oxygen vacancies are two main types of oxygen vacancy. The concentration is centered on the oxygen vacancy, one of the natural spots in oxides, due to the vital role it plays in the physical characteristics of materials.

2.2.1. Oxygen vacancies and the photocatalytic activity of nonporous, and doped TiO2. Recently, a novel technique involving positron annihilation lifetime spectroscopy was used to characterize oxygen vacancy associated with hydrogenation modified TiO2. This research revealed that hydrogenated TiO2 contains some larger vacancy clusters, a massive amount of small neutral Ti4+/3+ oxygen vacancies and a small number of voids of vacancies. The emergence of new Raman vibrations occurred as a result of these defects, which led to the atomic lattice high-resolution transmission electron microscopy (HRTEM) images. The concentration of oxygen vacancies was measured by X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS) and this was found to be 3% in the TiO2 lattice. There was a remarkable increase in photocatalytic activity when the oxygen vacancies introduced by hydrogenation slowed the charge recombination; this was actually revealed by the photocurrent, photoluminescence (PL) spectroscopy, and degradation of methylene blue. Fujishima and research group adopted reduction in hydrogen atmosphere coupled with an impregnation process to prepare defective TiO2 with oxygen vacancies and Cu(n) nano-cluster modification. There was no improvement in the visible light from the TiO2 photocatalyst samples with optimum oxygen vacancy. Conversely, the photocatalytic enactments of TiO2 samples with a greater quantity of oxygen vacancies were sharply reduced; they even demonstrated much enriched visible light absorptions. Wang and group successfully used the hydrothermal method in their experiment to prepare platinum decorated TiO2−xNx via a facile one-pot route by using nanotubular titanic acid as a precursor. They further evaluated the
photocatalytic performance of Pt/TiO2-Nx for the visible-light-induced degradation of propylene in relation to the synergistic effect among single-electron-trapped oxygen vacancies and N plus Pt dopants. It was proposed that the synergistic effect among oxygen vacancies and dopants led to the enriched photocatalytic activity of the as-synthesized Pt/TiO2-Nx. The TiO2 photocatalyst spectral response to the visible light range is usually improved by impurity doping (Tables 2 and 3). In 2015, experiments performed by Park and group showed that the maximum entropy method (MEM) analysis and X-ray diffraction (XRD) used in the analysis of the changes in the V O concentration as a function of the Co-doping level from ZnO Rietveld refinement generated the same results but X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS) confirmed a different outcome.

The Wendt group’s experiment on adsorption and desorption, where they used oxygen and water as probe molecules that were observed in STM images to bridge oxygen vacancies, and oxygen atoms on surface Ti atoms, reported the production of pure and reduced TiO2 surfaces. Their work further addressed the criteria to determine the cleanliness by STM imaging. Yang and colleagues in their research in 2010 on Chinese housing energy and environment introduced a novel technique for the characterization of oxygen vacancy associates in mostly hydrogen-modified TiO2 photocatalyst using positron annihilation lifetime spectroscopy (PALS). They concluded that small neutral Ti4+ oxygen vacancies (large quantity), vacancy clusters (appreciably large in size), and voids of vacancies (just a few of them) were actually in hydrogenated TiO2. In the research by Fujishima and coworkers, there was a remarkable improvement in the photocatalytic activity of 2% WO3–TiO2 catalysts when an appropriate oxygen vacancy was employed by using Fe3+ as an electron acceptor under UV irradiation in 12 hours.

Researchers have found out that the controlled combustion of Ti metal in a natural gas flame can also be used to synthesize chemically modified n-type TiO2 by using carbon as a doping agent. Inhibition of the charge recombination and trapping of the photoexcited electrons using these doped impurities (Table 3) also helps to increase the photocatalytic activity. There are three methods for preparing the visible light responsive photocatalyst, namely, doping TiO2 with transition metal ions, doping nitrogen into TiO2 and utilizing sensitizing dyes.

Semiconductors such as sensitizing dye (higher band-gap), change the electron-transfer processes during the photocatalytic reaction as described by Vinodgopal and Kamat in the principle of photosensitization of a semiconductor. Dye cation radicals can be produced by injecting charge from the excited dye molecule into the conduction band of TiO2.

Table 2 Comparison of the differences between doped TiO2-Nx and TiO2 photocatalysts (Fig. 10)

| Doped TiO2-Nx photocatalyst                                                                 | TiO2 photocatalyst                                                                                   |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| (a) Several nitrogen-doped TiO2 samples (Fig. 10)7 were found to photodegrade gaseous formaldehyde, acetaldehyde, acetone, 2-propanol, iodoene, and methylene blue. | (a) Pure TiO2 photocatalyst is usually less effective for photo depletion of methylene blue. |
| (b) TiO2-Nx (films and powders) has better photoactivity than TiO2 under visible light irradiation due to higher surface acidity (Fig. 10). | (b) TiO2 has less photocatalytic activity under visible light irradiation. |
| (c) The active wavelength of TiO2-Nx of less than 500 nm covers the main peak of the solar irradiation energy beyond the Earth’s atmosphere (around 460 nm). | (c) A similar active wavelength of 500 nm for TiO2 does not cover the main peak of the solar irradiation energy beyond Earth’s atmosphere. |
| (d) Introduction of ZnO into TiO2-Nx exhibited higher porosity, higher specific surface area, and an enhanced thermal stability. | (d) This feature was absent in TiO2. |
| (e) Decreases the deactivation of the photocatalysts. | (e) Deactivation of the surface occurs very quickly. |

Table 3 Typical metals for TiO2 photocatalyst doping

| Metals                                                                 | Properties                                                                                   | References |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| (1) Transition metal ions such as V, Cr, Mn, Fe, Co, Ni, or Cu        | (1) Extend light absorption into the visible region                                            | 27 and 41  |
| (2) Presence of metals, such as Li+, Zn2+, Cd2+, Ce4+, Co3+, Cr3+, Fe3+, Al3+, Mn3+ and Pt | (2) There is a considerable reduction in the photocatalytic activity in the UV region          | 39 and 41  |
| (3) The presence of Co3+, Cr3+, Ce4+, Mn2+, Al3+, and Fe3+ ion (5 mol% Mn : Ti4+) | (1) Considerably change the photocatalytic activity of TiO2 (2) Sol–gel systems can be used to prepare the Mn7+/TiO2 layers for phenol degradation (1) Has an opposing influence on the photocatalytic activity of the TiO2 photocatalyst (2) There is a decline in the photocatalytic activity of TiO2 under UV irradiation (3) These metal ions act as recombination sites for the photogenerated charge carriers | 41         |
concluded that the activity of catalysts depends on their life-
photocatalyst is reduced, the activity also decreases.

depositing metals or doping TiO2 photocatalysts with some
0.5%, but Co3+ and Al3+ doping decreased the photoreactivity.

Coupling TiO2 catalysts

oxidation and reduction signi-
doped with Fe3+, Mo5+, Ru3+, Os3+, Re5+, V4+, and Rh3+ at 0.1
and Ollis
pores on the photocatalysts’ surfaces, hence, change the

The pristine energy structure of most
energy structure.

Analysis tool Comparison

Table 4 Comparison of selected quantitative analysis tools for oxygen vacancy

Analysis tool Comparison
(1) X-ray
diffraction (XRD) is a simple and useful
tool for the analysis of oxygen vacancy because it
reveals the crystal structure and the electron density
distribution of periodic arrays of atoms
(2) Analysis of X-ray diffraction data using Rietveld
refinement has been attempted for the quantitative
analysis of oxygen vacancies in terms of oxygen site
occupancy
(3) X-ray diffraction requires the use of neutrons or
synchrotron X-rays
(1) The maximum entropy method (MEM) is also
suitable tool for the analysis of oxygen because it
uses the more precise Rietveld refinement that
resolves summation-terminated errors and affords
a better structural model
(2) The maximum entropy technique presents
insignificant modeling errors via the least-biased
electronic reconstruction of X-ray diffraction
patterns in real space

2.2.2. Quantitative analyses of oxygen vacancies. The
quantitative analysis of oxygen vacancies has been successfully
researched by many scientists in the field. Researchers have
adopted the following oxygen vacancy quantitative analysis tools:

(1) The maximum entropy method (MEM).
(2) X-ray diffraction (XRD).

Most research efforts have also proposed a method for the
analysis of oxygen vacancies using conventional XRD and MEM
techniques (Table 4).

The efficiency of a particular photocatalyst depends strongly
on the competence of electron–hole pair separation and the
adsorption ability of gaseous oxygen vacancy compounds.
Coupling TiO2 catalysts28–30 with other semiconductor oxides or
depositing metals or doping TiO2 photocatalysts with some
other metal ions help to improve its photocatalytic activities.
Studies have28 established that the photoreactivity for both
oxidation and reduction significantly improved when they
doped with Fe3+, Mo5+, Ru3+, Os3+, Re5+, V4+, and Rh3+ at 0.1–
0.5%, but Co3+ and Al3+ doping decreased the photoreactivity.29
When the active sites on the reaction surface31 of a gas–solid
photocatalyst is reduced, the activity also decreases.31 It can be
concluded that the activity of catalysts depends on their life-
time, which is potentially essential to the economic process.31
Studies on toluene,23,24 ethanol25 and trichloroethylene,
dimethyl sulfide, and trichloropropene26 have found out that
deactivation in these compounds is really uncommon. Sauer
and Ollis26 in their work stated that particle materials block
poles on the photocatalysts’ surfaces, hence, change the
surfaces of these catalysts.27 The chemical or physical adsorp-
tion of organic substrates on the TiO2 matrix is improved when
of lanthanide ions, for instance, La3+, Eu3+, Pr3+, Nd3+, and Sm3+
amalgamated into the matrix.28

2.2.3. The function of the TiO2 oxygen vacancy in the
energy structure. The pristine energy structure of most
outstanding nanomaterials, such as TiO2 is fabricated by the
conduction band and valence band. It is noted that the de-
velopment of the main active sites, mostly for visible light
absorption and the band gap is supported by these energy
levels. Lv and group stated that the function of oxygen vacancies
as the visible light response sites is due to the defective TiO2
surface during visible light irradiation.27 The influence of the
energy structure of the TiO2 photocatalyst on the charge carrier
migration and light absorption is very high (this happens when
there is the removal of oxygen atoms; Ti4+ is not involved and
when there is the occurrence of oxygen vacancies). This calls for
urgent, precise calculations of the defect state in TiO2 energy
structure.2 Fujishima and group have reported that the defect
states vary remarkably in the band gap. Recent work30 reported
lower energy (for all Fermi-level positions in the band gap) in
photocatalysts. It has been proven that within the band gap of
TiO2, the oxygen vacancy usually forms a mid-gap electronic
state and, therefore, TiO2 functions as the donor. This novel
trend was supported by research performed by Eun Chang and
colleagues.30 These scientists further summarized energy levels
of oxygen vacancies in TiO2. The paradox of the intensely
localized small polarons and the delocalized free polarons
failed to be explained vividly by isolating electronic bands in
many experiments and this led to hybrid function, which has
been a remarkable theory. In the electronic band, it was re-
ported that there exist two types of hybrid functions:

(a) Between the electrons and the conduction band in
the presence of delocalized free electrons.

(b) Between the electrons and the oxygen vacancies in the
form of oxygen vacancy complexes and the ionized shallow-
donor impurities.

Considering the theoretical viewpoint, the highest occupied
molecular orbital and the lowest unoccupied molecular orbital
often shifts due to the influence exerted by the defect states.39 It
was realized from experiment39 that an occupied defect state of
0.7 eV below the bottom of the conduction band was decreased
by the oxygen vacancy.7 Research on the characterization anal-
ysis of anatase, rutile, and brookite showed that anatase and
brookite were made up of oxygen vacancies, which remarkably
improved the photocatalytic activity. In conclusion, it is
presumed that the difference in the absorptions on the surfaces
of the active sites and the reactants (CO2, H2O, CO2–, and CO)
were due to oxygen vacancies.

2.2.4. The influence of oxygen vacancies on charge trans-
fer. In situ-EPR is a versatile technique for monitoring the
separation and transfer of photogenerated electrons in semi-
conductors based on oxides91,102 or carbon nitrides98 since
electrons excited to the conduction band can be trapped at
oxygen vacancies100 and carbon defects.99 The promotion from
the highest occupied molecule orbitals to the lowest unoccu-
pied molecule orbital with light irradiation causes the rapid
movement of an excited single electron in response to the
applied electric field; i.e., the voltage supplied by a power source
or difference in potential between the energy structure of TiO2
and the redox potential of the adsorbed species (Fig. 10). Due to
small lattice distortions in electron creation, the Franck–Con-
don factor is mostly small.60 According to the Marcus–Hush
electron transfer theory, the transfer of charge carriers is restricted by the disappearing reorganization of energy but it usually follows a band model and hopping model (Fig. 11).

Lattice distortion makes use of the original energy provided by an election or a photon. The swiftly vanishing approach for the charge carriers has been reported by many scientists as annihilation at the recombination center. Mitsuhara and coworkers’ studies on semiconductors led to a proposal of three recombination mechanisms (Table 5).

2.2.5. Applications of oxygen vacancies in photocatalysis. The impact of oxygen vacancy in photocatalysis includes the following:

(i) To alter the band energy structure of the pristine TiO₂ as the defect states.
(ii) To trap charge carriers in the migration pathways as the electron pool or recombination center.
(iii) To power the adsorption of reactants (e.g., H₂O, O₂, CO₂, and organic pollutants) as the active sites.

3. Conclusion

This systematic review sums up the novel developments in the photocatalytic applications of TiO₂-based composite photocatalysts with oxygen vacancies in the areas of energy, wastewater treatment and environmental purification. Nonporous TiO₂ has revealed its greatness as one of the best candidates in designing and engineering advanced composite photocatalysts. There is little doubt that the considerable progress in TiO₂ nano-based composites will continue in the near future. More studies are necessary in order to make full use of the excellent properties resulting from the oxygen vacancy of the nonporous TiO₂ photocatalysts.

---

**Table 5** Three recombination mechanisms, their properties and limitations

| Recombination mechanism               | Properties                                                                 | Limitations                                                                                                                | References |
|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| (1) Band-to-band recombination        | (1) It occurs between the excited electron and the hole lying in the empty valence band | (1) The production of available electrons and holes limits this reaction                                                   | 61         |
|                                       | (2) It is second order to the concentration of the charge Carrier          | (1) Shockley–Read–Hall model (SRH model) confirmed that the concentration of charge carriers hinders this reaction or mechanism | 20         |
| (2) Trap-assisted recombination       | (1) This mechanism transpires with the help of the “trap” state            | (1) Shockley–Read–Hall model (SRH model) confirmed that the concentration of charge carriers hinders this reaction or mechanism | 20         |
|                                       | (2) It happens between the excited electrons and holes in the valence band  | (1) Shockley–Read–Hall model (SRH model) confirmed that the concentration of charge carriers hinders this reaction or mechanism | 20         |
| (3) Auger recombination               | (1) This usually happens during the recombination process of the excited electron and hole | (1) Shockley–Read–Hall model (SRH model) confirmed that the concentration of charge carriers hinders this reaction or mechanism | 20         |
Conflicts of interest

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgements

This work was financially supported by grants from National Science Funds for Creative Research Groups of China (No. 51421006), Natural Science Foundation of China (51679063), the Key Program of National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 41430751), the National Key Plan for Research and Development of China (2016YFC0502203), Fundamental Research Funds (No. 2016B43814), and PAPD. Buanya Beryl Adormaa and Williams Kwaku Darkwah were the recipients of scholarship from the Nanjing Government and China Scholarship Council (CSC) respectively for the duration of this work.

References

1 A. Fujishima and K. Honda, Electrochemical photolysis of water at a semiconductor electrode, Nature, 1972, 238, 37–38.
2 A. Fujishima, et al., Combination effect of activated carbon with TiO2 for the photodegradation of binary pollutants at typical indoor air level, Sci. 80, 2006, 4, 2–4.
3 Y. Wang, et al., Coiled-coil networking shapes cell molecular machinery, Mol. Biol. Cell, 2012, 23, 3911–3922.
4 J. H. Park, et al., Analysis of oxygen vacancy in Co-doped ZnO using the electron density distribution obtained using MEM, Nanoscale Res. Lett., 2015, 10, 186.
5 D. J. Wendt, et al., Neutral Endopeptidase-Resistant C-Type Natriuretic Peptide Variant Represents a New Therapeutic Approach for Treatment of Fibroblast Growth Factor Receptor 3-Related Dwarfism, J. Pharmacol. Exp. Ther., 2015, 353, 132–149.
6 X. Yang, Y. Jiang, M. Yang and M. Shan, Energy and environment in Chinese rural housing: Current status and future perspective, Front. Energy Power Eng. China, 2010, 4, 35–46.
7 Y. Liu and J. Brenan, Partitioning of platinum-group elements (PGE) and chalcostite (Se, Te, As, Sb, Bi) between monosulfide-solid solution (MSS), intermediate solid solution (ISS) and sulfide liquid at controlled F02–fS2 conditions, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 2015, 159, 139–161.
8 Y. Iokawa, et al., Photodegradation of toluene over TiO2–xNx under visible light irradiation, Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys., 2006, 8, 1116.
9 R. Asahi, T. Mikawa, T. Ohwaki, K. Aoki and Y. Taga, Visible Light Photocatalysis in Nitrogen-Doped Titanium Oxides, Sci. 80, 2001, 293, 269–271.
10 T. Ihara, M. Miyoshi, Y. Iriyama, O. Matsumoto and S. Sugihara, Visible-light-active titanium oxide photocatalyst realized by an oxygen-deficient structure and by nitrogen doping, Appl. Catal., B, 2003, 42, 403–409.
11 H. Irie, Y. Watanabe and K. Hashimoto, Nitrogen-Concentration Dependence on Photocatalytic Activity of TiO2-x Np Powders, J. Phys. Chem. B, 2003, 107, 5483–5486.
12 S. Miyauchi, et al., Adaptation to left-right reversed vision rapidly activates ipsilateral visual cortex in humans, J. Physiol., 2004, 98, 207–219.
13 S. Wu, L. J. Mickley, D. J. Jacob, D. Rind and D. G. Streets, Effects of 2000–2050 changes in climate and emissions on global tropospheric ozone and the policy-relevant background surface ozone in the United States, J. Geophys. Res. Atmos., 2008, 113, D18312.
14 P. Wang, The economics of foreign exchange and global finance, Econ. Foreign Exch. Glob. Financ., 2005, DOI: 10.1007/3-540-28524-5.
15 R. Li, et al., First report of the cyanotoxins cylindrospermopsin and deoxyxylindrospermopsin from raphidiopsis curvata (cyanobacteria) 1 A strain of Raphidiopsis (Cyanobacteria) isolated from a fish pond in Wuhan, P. R. China was examined for its taxonomy and pr, J. Phycol., 2001, 1126, 1121–1126.
16 K. Vinodgopal and P. V. Kamat, Enhanced Rates of Photocatalytic Degradation of an Azo Dye Using SnO2/TiO2 Coupled Semiconductor Thin Films, Environ. Sci. Technol., 1995, 29, 841–845.
17 C. Nasr, et al., Environmental photochemistry on semiconductor surfaces. Visible light induced degradation of a textile diazo dye, napthol blue black, on TiO2 nanoparticles, J. Phys. Chem., 1996, 100, 8436–8442.
18 W. Choi, A. Termin and M. R. Hoffmann, The role of metal ion dopants in quantum-sized TiO2n 2: Correlation between photoreactivity and charge carrier recombination dynamics, J. Phys. Chem., 1994, 98, 13669–13679.
19 L. J. yi, M. W. hong, L. P. xiang and Z. J. cai, Detection of intermediates in the TiO2-assisted photodegradation of Rhodamine B under visible light irradiation, J. Environ. Sci., 2007, 19, 892–896.
20 B. Zhang, X. Pan, C. H. Cannon, G. P. Cobb and T. A. Anderson, Conservation and divergence of plant microRNA genes, Plant J., 2006, 46, 243–259.
21 M. L. Sauer and D. F. Ollis, Photocatalyzed oxidation of ethanol and acetaldehyde in humidified air, J. Catal., 1996, 158, 570–582.
22 D. F. Ollis, Photocatalytic purification and remediation of contaminated air and water, Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des Sciences - Series IIC - Chemistry, 2000, 3, 405–411.
23 M. A. Blanco, A. M. Pendás, E. Francisco, J. M. Recio and R. Franco, Thermodynamical properties of solids from microscopic theory: applications to MgF2 and Al2O3, J. Mol. Struct.: THEOCHEM, 1996, 368, 245–255.
24 O. D'Hennezel, P. Pichat and D. F. Ollis, Benzene and toluene-phase photocatalytic degradation over H2O and HCl pretreated TiO2: By-products and mechanisms, J. Photochem. Photobiol. A, 1998, 118, 197–204.
25 E. Piera, J. Ayllón, X. Doménech and J. Peral, TiO2 deactivation during gas-phase photocatalytic oxidation of ethanol, Catal. Today, 2002, 76, 259–270.
26 M. L. Sauer and D. F. Ollis, Catalyst Deactivation in Gas – Solid Photocatalysis, J. Catal., 1996, 217, 215–217.
27 J. Zhao and X. Yang, Photocatalytic oxidation for indoor air purification: A literature review, *Building and Environment*, 2003, 38, 645–654.

28 C. Belver, M. J. López-Muñoz, J. M. Coronado and J. Soria, Palladium enhanced resistance to deactivation of titanium dioxide during the photocatalytic oxidation of toluene vapor, *Appl. Catal., B*, 2003, 46, 497–509.

29 X. Fu, L. a. Clark, Q. Yang and M. a. Anderson, Enhanced Photocatalytic Performance of Titania-Based Binary Metal Oxides: TiO2/SiO2 and TiO2/ZrO2, *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 1996, 30, 647–653.

30 R. Méndez-Román and N. Cardona-Martinez, Relationship between the formation of surface species and catalyst deactivation during the gas-phase photocatalytic oxidation of toluene, *Catal. Today*, 1998, 40, 353–365.

31 M. Chang and H. C. Chang, Development of a screening method for biogenic amine producing *Bacillus* spp., *Int. J. Food Microbiol.*, 2012, 153, 269–274.

32 H. Kisch and W. Macyk, Visible-light photocatalysis by modified titania, *ChemPhysChem*, 2002, 3, 399–400.

33 X. Chen, M. C. Schmidt, W. F. Goins and J. C. Glorioso, Two herpes simplex virus type 1 latency-active promoters differ in their contributions to latency-associated transcript expression during lytic and latent infections, *J. Virol.*, 1995, 69, 7899–7908.

34 K. Nagaveni, M. S. Hegde, N. Ravishankar, G. N. Subbanna and G. Madras, Synthesis and Structure of Nanocrystalline TiO2 with Lower Band Gap Showing High Photocatalytic Activity, *Langmuir*, 2004, 20, 2900–2907.

35 K. Nagaveni, G. Sivalingam, M. S. Hegde and G. Madras, Solar photocatalytic degradation of dyes: High activity of combustion synthesized nano TiO2, *Appl. Catal., B*, 2004, 48, 83–93.

36 L. T. Wong, K. W. Mui and P. S. Hui, A statistical model for characterizing common air pollutants in air-conditioned offices, *Atmos. Environ.*, 2006, 40, 4246–4257.

37 D. T. Ho, A. J. Bardwell, S. Grewal, C. Iverson and L. Bardwell, Interacting JNK-docking sites in MKK7 promote binding and activation of JNK mitogen-activated protein kinases, *J. Biol. Chem.*, 2006, 281, 13169–13179.

38 F. P. An, et al., Observation of electron-antineutrino disappearance at Daya Bay, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 2012, 108, 1–7.

39 E. C. Yang, K. M. Kim, J. Runess and S. M. Boo, Morphology and molecular phylogeny of Psilothallia dentata (Ceramiales, Rhodophyta), *Algae*, 2004, 19(4), 283–292.

40 W. T. Tseng, Z. Dörnyei and N. Schmitt, A new approach to assessing strategic learning: The case of self-regulation in vocabulary acquisition, *Appl. Linguist.*, 2006, 27, 78–102.

41 P. V. Kamat and D. Meisel, Nanoparticles in advanced oxidation processes, *Curr. Opin. Colloid Interface Sci.*, 2002, 7, 282–287.

42 T. Mitsuhashi, et al., A Case of a Primary Radiation-Induced Malignant Peripheral Nerve Sheath Tumor in the Cauda Equina in a Patient with Neurofibromatosis, *Journal of Spine*, 2013, 2, 2–4.

43 C. Di Valentin, L. Ferrighi and G. Fazio, Theoretical Studies of Oxygen Reactivity of Free-Standing and Supported Boron-Doped Graphene, *ChemSusChem*, 2016, 9, 1061–1077.

44 C. Di Valentin, et al., Adsorption of Water on Reconstructed Rutile TiO2 (011): TiO2 Double Bonds and Surface Reactivity, *J. Am. Chem. Soc.*, 2005, 127, 9895–9903.

45 H. Yoneyama and T. Torimoto, Titanium dioxide/adsorbent hybrid photocatalysts for photodestruction of organic substances of dilute concentrations, *Catal. Today*, 2000, 58, 133–140.

46 C. H. Ao and S. C. Lee, Combination effect of activated carbon with TiO2 for the photodegradation of binary pollutants at typical indoor air level, *J. Photochem. Photobiol., A*, 2004, 161, 131–140.

47 H. Yu, Y. Ye, S. Zhao and G. Wang, A backprojection-filteration algorithm for nonstandard spiral cone-beam CT with an n-PI-window, *Phys. Med. Biol.*, 2005, 50, 2099–2111.

48 L. Zeatoun and D. Feke, Characterization of TiO2 smoke prepared using gas-phase hydrolysis of TiCl4, *Part. Part. Syst. Charact.*, 2006, 22, 276–281.

49 P. Monnoyer, A. Fonseca and J. B. Nagy, Preparation of colloidal AgBr particles from microemulsions, *Colloids Surf., A*, 1995, 100, 233–243.

50 S. Guo, et al., Pulp and fiber characterization of wheat straw and eucalyptus pulps - A comparison, *BioResources*, 2009, 4, 1006–1016.

51 J. Sun, L. Qiao, S. Sun and G. Wang, Photocatalytic degradation of Orange G on nitrogen-doped TiO2 catalysts under visible light and sunlight irradiation, *J. Hazard. Mater.*, 2008, 155, 312–319.

52 Y. Qi, S. Bai and G. M. Heisler, Changes in ultraviolet-B and visible optical properties and absorbing pigment concentrations in pecan leaves during a growing season, *Agric. For. Meteorol.*, 2003, 120, 229–240.

53 C. C. Huang, Z. Yang, K. H. Lee and H. T. Chang, Synthesis of highly fluorescent gold nanoparticles for sensing mercury(II), *Angew. Chem., Int. Ed.*, 2007, 46, 6824–6828.

54 T. N. Obee and R. T. Brown, TiO2 Photocatalysis for Indoor Air Applications: Effects of Humidity and Trace Contaminant Levels on the Oxidation Rates of Formaldehyde, Toluene, and 1,3-Butadiene, *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 1995, 29, 1223–1231.

55 J. Yu, H. Elderfield and B. Hönisch, B/Ca in planktonic foraminifera as a proxy for surface seawater pH, *Paleoceanography*, 2007, 22, PA2202.

56 X. Feng, et al., Significantly Enhanced Visible Light Photocatalytic Efficiency of Phosphorus doped TiO2 with surface oxygen vacancies for Ciprofloxacin Degradation: Synergistic Effect and Intermediates Analysis, *J. Hazard. Mater.*, 2018, DOI: 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2018.03.013.

57 Y. Lv, Y. Zhu and Y. Zhu, Enhanced Photocatalytic Performance for the BiPO4-x Nanorod Induced by Surface Oxygen Vacancy, *J. Phys. Chem. C*, 2013, 117, 18520–18528.

58 L. Zou, Y. Luo, M. Hooper and E. Hu, Removal of VOCs by photocatalysis process using adsorption enhanced TiO2-SiO2 catalyst, *Chem. Eng. Process.*, 2006, 45, 959–964.
59 B. J. Morgan and G. W. Watson, Intrinsic n-type Defect Formation in TiO2: A Comparison of Rutile and Anatase from GGA+textitU Calculations, J. Phys. Chem. C, 2010, 114, 2321–2328.

60 H. Kisch, et al., Pseudotumor cerebri, Neurol. Clin., 2004, 22, 99–131.

61 J. Of, et al., Oxygen Vacancy Structure Associated Photocatalytic Water Oxidation of BiOCl, J. Phys. Chem. C, 2013, 117, 3601.

62 K. Zeilinger, Angew. Chem., Int. Ed., 2009, 48, 9785.

63 N. M. Dimitrijevic, B. K. Vijayan, O. G. Poluektov, T. Rajh, K. A. Gray, H. He and P. Zapol, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2011, 133, 3964.

64 M. R. Gholipour, C.-T. Dinh, F. Béland and T.-O. Do, Nanocomposite heterojunctions as sunlight-driven photocatalysts for hydrogen production from water splitting, Nanoscale, 2015, 7, 8187–8208.

65 I. Nakamura, N. Negishi, S. Kutsuna, T. Ihara, S. Sugihara and K. Takeuchi, Role of oxygen vacancy in the plasma-treated TiO photocatalyst with visible light activity for NO removal, J. Mol. Catal. A: Chem., 2000, 161, 205–212.

66 L. Zu, Y. Luo, M. Hooper and E. Hu, Removal of VOCs by photocatalysis process using adsorption enhanced TiO2–SiO2 catalyst, Chem. Eng. Process., 2006, 45, 959–964.

67 Y. Ma, X. Wang, Y. Jia, X. Chen, H. Han and C. Li, Titanium Dioxide-Based Nanomaterials for Photocatalytic Fuel Generations, Chem. Rev., 2014, 114, 9987–10043.

68 U. I. Gaya and A. H. Abdullah, Heterogeneous photocatalytic degradation of organic contaminants over titanium dioxide: A review of fundamentals, progress and problems, J. Photochem. Photobiol., C, 2008, 9, 1–12.

69 J. Schneider, M. Matsuoka, M. Takeuchi, J. Zhang, Y. Horiiuchi, M. Anpo and D. W. Bahnemann, Understanding TiO2 Photocatalysis: Mechanisms and Materials, Chem. Rev., 2014, 114, 9919–9986.

70 S. N. Habisreutinger, L. Schmidt-Mende and J. K. Stolarczyk, Photocatalytic Reduction of CO2 on TiO2 and Other Semiconductors, Angew. Chem., Int. Ed., 2013, 52, 7372–7408.

71 R. Daghiri, P. Drogui and D. Robert, Modified TiO2 for Environmental Photocatalytic Applications: A Review, Ind. Eng. Chem. Res., 2013, 52, 3581–3599.

72 K. Nakata and A. Fujishima, TiO2 photocatalysis: Design and applications, J. Photochem. Photobiol., C, 2012, 13, 169–189.

73 S. G. Kumar and L. G. Devi, Review on Modified TiO2 Photocatalysis under UV/Visible Light: Selected Results and Related Mechanisms on Interfacial Charge Carrier Transfer Dynamics, J. Phys. Chem. A, 2011, 115, 13211–13241.

74 S. J. A. Moniz, S. A. Shevlin, D. J. Martin, Z.-X. Guo and J. Tang, Visible-light driven heterojunction photocatalysts for water splitting—A critical review, Energy Environ. Sci., 2015, 8, 731–759.

75 W. Wang, B. Cheng, J. Yu, G. Liu and W. Fan, Visible-Light Photocatalytic Activity and Deactivation Mechanism of Ag3PO4 Spherical Particles, Chem.–Asian J., 2012, 7, 1902–1908.

76 H. Kato and A. Kudo, Visible-Light-Response and Photocatalytic Activities of TiO2 and SrTiO3 Photocatalysts Codoped with Antimony and Chromium, J. Phys. Chem. B, 2002, 106, 5029–5034.

77 H. Kato and A. Kudo, Water Splitting into H2 and O2 on Alkali Tantalate Photocatalysts ATaO3 (A = Li, Na, and K), J. Phys. Chem. B, 2001, 105, 4285–4292.

78 D. Jing and L. Guo, A Novel Method for the Preparation of a Highly Stable and Active CdS Photocatalyst with a Special Surface Nanostructure, J. Phys. Chem. B, 2006, 110, 11139–11145.

79 C. Pan and Y. Zhu, New Type of BiPO4 Oxy-Acid Salt Photocatalyst with High Photocatalytic Activity on Degradation of Dye, Environ. Sci. Technol., 2010, 44, 5570–5574.

80 X. Wang, K. Maeda, A. Thomas, K. Takanabe, G. Xin, J. M. Carlsson, K. Domen and M. Antonietti, A metal-free polymeric photocatalyst for hydrogen production from water under visible light, Nat. Mater., 2009, 8, 76–80.

81 Y. Lan, X. Li, G. Li and Y. Luo, Sol-gel method to prepare graphene/Fe2O3 aerogel and its catalytic application for the thermal decomposition of ammonium perchlorate, J. Nanopart. Res., 2015, 17, 395.

82 M. Krumm, C. L. Pueyo and S. Polzar, Monolithic zinc oxide aerogels from organometallic sol-gel precursors, Chem. Mater., 2010, 22, 5129–5136.

83 J. G. Seo, M. H. Youn, Y. Bang and I. K. Song, Effect of Ni/Al atomic ratio of mesoporous Ni-Al2O3 aerogel catalysts on their catalytic activity for hydrogen production by steam reforming of liquefied natural gas (LNG), Int. J. Hydrogen Energy, 2010, 35, 12174–12181.

84 A. E. Gash, T. M. Tillotson, J. H. Satcher, Jr., L. W. Hrubesh and R. L. Simpson, New sol-gel synthetic route to transition and main-group metal oxide aerogels using inorganic salt precursors, J. Non-Cryst. Solids, 2001, 285, 22–28.

85 T. Zeng, X. Zhang, S. Wang, H. Niu and Y. Cai, Spatial confinement of a Co3O4 catalyst in hollow metal-organic frameworks as a nanoreactor for improved degradation of organic pollutants, Environ. Sci. Technol., 2015, 49, 2350–2357.

86 Z. Novak, P. Kotnik and Ž. Knez, Preparation of WO3 aerogel catalysts using supercritical CO2 drying, J. Non-Cryst. Solids, 2004, 350, 308–313.

87 A. Cabañas, E. Enciso, M. C. Carbajo, M. J. Torralvo, C. Pando and J. A. R. Renuncio, Synthesis of SiO2-aerogel inverse opals in supercritical carbon dioxide, Chem. Mater., 2005, 17, 6137–6145.

88 R. Sui, A. Rizkalla and P. A. Charpentier, Experimental study on the morphology and porosity of TiO2 aerogels synthesized in supercritical carbon dioxide, Microporous Mesoporous Mater., 2011, 142, 688–695.

89 M. B. Chowdhury, R. Sui, R. A. Lucky and P. A. Charpentier, One-pot procedure to synthesize high surface area alumina nanofibers using supercritical carbon dioxide, Langmuir, 2009, 26, 2707–2713.
