Study of Effectiveness of Integrated Public Space

T. Herry Rachmatsyah* and Chicilia
Universitas Prof. Dr. Moestopo (Beragama)
Jl. Hang Lekir I No. 8, Jakarta Pusat 10270, Indonesia

*herry.rachmatsyah@dsn.moestopo.ac.id

Abstract. Child Friendly Integrated Public Space is one of the important policies/programs of the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Provincial Government to realize Jakarta as a Child Decent City. It is a place and/or open space that combines the activities of citizens by implementing the 10 Main Program for the Family Empowerment and Welfare with the Child Decent City Program. To find out the effectiveness of the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in Cideng Subdistrict, indicators for fulfillment of functions were used as contained in Article 4 of the Governor Regulation of the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Province Number 123 Year 2017 concerning Management and Requirements for Facilities and Infrastructure of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces. Data were collected through observations, document reviews, and in-depth interviews with informants consisting of the Secretary of the Family Empowerment and Welfare Activator Team, consultants, managers, and user communities. The collected data were analyzed using quantitative and qualitative descriptive analysis techniques. The results of the study concluded that the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space has been effective in all indicators of fulfillment of functions, but still requires assistance from the government in terms of maintenance of infrastructure and facilities as well as the development of a management information system that is supported by a complete set of hardware, software, databases, as well as computer networks and data communications.

Keywords : Effectiveness, Child Friendly Integrated Public Space, Child Decent City

1. Introduction
Indonesia has ratified the Convention on the Rights of the Child through the Presidential Decree Number 36 of 1990 concerning Ratification of the Convention on the Rights of the Child and has signed the World Fit for Children Declaration. Therefore, Indonesia is obliged to improve and fulfill the rights of children. The next step taken was to amend the 1945 Constitution and to issue the of the Minister of Women Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 2 of 2009 concerning Child Decent Regencies/Cities Policy. Jakarta then became one of the cities that had to be developed into Child Decent City based on the Minister of Women Empowerment and Child Protection Decree Number 56 of 2010 concerning Appointment and Stipulation of Provinces that Develop Child Decent Regencies/Cities. One of the things done by the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Provincial Government to accelerate the achievement of Child Decent City is to build child friendly integrated public spaces.

According to Garau, public space is a place where people perform a number of functions that are shared with all: moving from place to place; enjoying public recreational and cultural opportunities; visiting other parts of the city or other private locations; shopping; meeting others or
simply strolling [1]. Public space is an important element for a city. Public space can help build a sense of togetherness, civic identity, and culture. Public space also facilitates social capital, economic development, and community revitalization. Having access to public space does not only improve the quality of life but is also the first step towards community empowerment and greater access to institutional and political space. The active and sustainable use of public space will lead to a well-maintained, healthy and safe urban environment, making a city an attractive place to live and work. Public spaces can consist of open spaces (for example roads, walkways, parks and gardens) and protected spaces where all important civic functions can be carried out in all weather conditions (for example schools, libraries and museums). In 1999 UNICEF developed a children's rights-based program called Child Friendly Spaces to support and protect children. In Indonesia, this program was then implemented into Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces. Referring to the Governor Regulation of the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Province Number 123 Year 2017 concerning Management and Requirements for Facilities and Infrastructure of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces, child friendly integrated public space is a place and/or open space that combines the activities of citizens by implementing the 10 Main Program for the Family Empowerment and Welfare with the Child Decent City Program [2]. What is meant by a child is a person who is not yet 18 years old, including a fetus who is still in the womb. Research on child friendly integrated public spaces has actually been conducted by other researchers.

Research conducted by Hernowo and Navastara concluded that the Bahari Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in South Jakarta had a variety of characteristics that must be present in a public space. It was complete, safe, had many trees, was comfortable, had many activities, and easily accessible [3]. Research conducted by Purnama on the South Gandaria Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in South Jakarta concluded that the public space was able to attract the interest of residents to come there because of its diverse facilities [4]. Research conducted by Herlina and Nadiroh on the Utama Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in West Jakarta concluded that the public space was not maximal and optimal in fulfilling children's rights [5]. Research conducted by Prakoso and Dewi on 10 Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces spread across various regions in Jakarta concluded that children had a sense of attachment and positive assessment of the child friendly integrated public spaces [6]. Research conducted by Rahmiati and Prihastomo on the Kambang Iwak Park Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in Palembang, South Sumatra concluded that the facilities and elements in the public space were not specifically specific to children and might be harmful to them. The public space was actually a pleasant and comfortable public space, but safety and health factors had not been considered in its design [7]. Research conducted by Lestari and Prima on Traffic Park Child Friendly Integrated Public Space and Janggan Park Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in Denpasar, Bali concluded that kindergarten schools utilized both parks for learning activities outside the classroom as a learning model [8]. Research conducted by Nurhashi on Kalijodo Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in West Jakarta concluded that the performance of the public space had not been satisfactory in terms of safety, health, security, comfort, attractiveness, accessibility, and facilities [9]. Research conducted by Mustaram on Nusa Indah Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in West Jakarta concluded that in addition to having a positive impact, the existence of the public space also had a negative impact in the form of disorder, waste and reduced security [10]. Research conducted by Utami, Mungkinas, dan Munandar on Sungai Bambu Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in North Jakarta, Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in Central Jakarta, Bahari Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in South Jakarta, Kembangan Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in West Jakarta Barat, and Cililitan Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in East Jakarta concluded that these public spaces as active spaces, ecological spaces, individual spaces, and cultural spaces were not yet optimal in supporting child development [11]. Research conducted by Faeddullloh, Prasetyanti, and Indrawati on Sungai Bambu Child Friendly Integrated Public Space dan Sunter Jaya Berseri Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in North Jakarta concluded that the public spaces were not merely a means of gathering and playing for children, but also accommodating social interaction that could increase the potential for deliberative democracy [12].
on the Kalijodo Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in West Jakarta concluded that the public space was the result of social processes that were influenced and shaped by the interrelation between structuring forces and various actors [13].

All of these studies generally examined the design aspects of a public space by relating it to the characteristics that must be possessed by a child friendly integrated public space. The success of a child friendly integrated public space is not solely in the hands of the town planner, urban designer, or architect; but it relies also on people adopting, using and managing the space. Effectiveness is one measure to assess this success. Effectiveness is also used as one of the criteria for evaluating policies/programs. According to Dunn, effectiveness refers to the achievement of a valued outcome. Effectiveness is measured in terms of units of products or services or their monetary value [14]. So far there has been no research on child friendly integrated public spaces that highlights aspects of public space as a policy/program that after implementation must be evaluated for effectiveness using indicators contained in the policy/program. This then became the background of this research. The problem raised in this study was “How was the effectiveness of the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in Cideng Subdistrict, Central Jakarta?” Thus, the purpose of this study was to describe the effectiveness of the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in Cideng Subdistrict, Central Jakarta.

2. Method
This research was descriptive in accordance with the purpose of the study which was to describe the phenomenon that was the object of research. The Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space was chosen as a research location because it was the first generation of child friendly integrated public space which was a pilot project in Jakarta (inaugurated on May 30, 2015) [15]. Data was collected through observations, document reviews, and in-depth interviews with 7 informants consisting of 1 Secretary of the Family Empowerment and Welfare Activator Team, 1 consultant, 2 managers, and 3 user communities. The collected data were analyzed using quantitative and qualitative descriptive analysis techniques. For the purposes of quantitative analysis, scoring was used to measure effectiveness. Informants were asked to provide value using ineffective, less effective, effective, and very effective criteria. Not effective given a perception value of 1, less effective given a perception value of 2, effectively given a perception value of 3, and very effective given a perception value of 4. The indicators assessed were the fulfillment of functions as contained in Article 4 of the Governor Regulation of the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Province Number 123 Year 2017 concerning Management and Requirements for Facilities and Infrastructure of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces: public open parks; a place for community interaction of all ages; partnership infrastructure and facilities between the regional government and the community in fulfilling children's rights; part of infrastructure and facilities for Child Decent City; green open space and groundwater absorption site; infrastructure and facilities for citizens' social activities including the development of knowledge and skills of the Family Empowerment and Welfare cadres; efforts to increase family income, family consultation and information center; green, organized, beautiful, and comfortable family yard; and management information system. In-depth interviews were conducted with the results of assessments given by the informants. Qualitative analysis was used further to understand and explain the results of quantitative analysis.

3. Results and discussion
To find out the effectiveness of the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space, measurements were made on indicators of fulfillment of functions as contained in Article 4 of the Governor Regulation of the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Province Number 123 Year 2017 concerning Management and Requirements for Facilities and Infrastructure of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces. Table 1 shows that the public space can be considered effective overall. All indicators that were assessed had effective and very effective values where the effective perception value (80.95%) was more than the very effective perception value (19.06%). However, specifically for the part of
infrastructure and facilities for Child Decent City indicator and the management information system indicator, none of the informants rated it very effectively. Each indicator assessment result will be discussed sequentially.

| Number | Functions                                                                                                                            | Level of Effectiveness |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|
|        |                                                                                                                                       | Ineffective | Less Effective | Effective | Very Effective |
| 1      | Public open parks                                                                                                                     | 0           | 0              | 0          | 5             | 71.43       | 2             | 28.57       |
| 2      | A place for community interaction of all ages                                                                                         | 0           | 0              | 0          | 5             | 71.43       | 2             | 28.57       |
| 3      | Partnership infrastructure and facilities between the regional government and the community in fulfilling children’s rights            | 0           | 0              | 0          | 6             | 57.14       | 1             | 42.86       |
| 4      | Part of infrastructure and facilities for Child Decent City                                                                            | 0           | 0              | 0          | 7             | 100         | 0             | 0           |
| 5      | Green open space and groundwater absorption site                                                                                       | 0           | 0              | 0          | 4             | 57.14       | 3             | 42.86       |
| 6      | Infrastructure and facilities for citizens’ social activities including the development of knowledge and skills of the Family Empowerment and Welfare cadres | 0           | 0              | 0          | 6             | 57.14       | 1             | 42.86       |
| 7      | Efforts to increase family income; family consultation and information center                                                           | 0           | 0              | 0          | 6             | 57.14       | 1             | 42.86       |
| 8      | Green, organized, beautiful, and comfortable family yard                                                                               | 0           | 0              | 0          | 5             | 71.43       | 2             | 28.57       |
| 9      | Management information system                                                                                                         | 0           | 0              | 0          | 7             | 100         | 0             | 0           |
|        | Total                                                                                                                                | 0           | 0              | 0          | 51            | 80.95       | 12            | 19.06       |

3.1. Public open parks
The Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space was designed as a public open park where all people can visit it for free. It is located on Jl. Makian No. 1, Cideng Subdistrict, Gambir District, Central Jakarta with an area of 2,583m². It was built on the right location in a densely populated residential area (consisting of 10 RW and 113 RT) with relatively high poverty rates. The existence of the public space is very much needed because in these locations there are not enough infrastructure and facilities available, especially the playground needed for children's growth and development as well as other infrastructure and facilities expected by the local residents. It has a building (indoor) with an area of 144m², in which there is a library, multipurpose room, lactation room or nursing room, and a manager’s room. For outdoor, various game facilities such as swings and sports arenas such as futsal court, basketball court, and badminton court are provided in accordance with the needs of residents during social mapping prior to the construction of the public space. It is also equipped with an interactive park (for playing and relaxing), a nutritional park (for farming), and supporting facilities for the park (parking area, park bench, manager post, lighting, etc.). Various facilities provided allow children to be able to play happily because these facilities have been designed to be friendly and safe for children.

3.2. A place for community interaction of all ages
The Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space can be utilized by all groups of residents starting from the age of zero, toddlers, to the elderly. All can come visit and take advantage of the facilities in the public space. Around 80 children visit it to play and learn and use various facilities every day. Even on holidays, the number of children who visit can reach 150 people. It does not carry out activities only for children, the management also organizes various activities that involve the active role of the Family Empowerment and Welfare cadres, mothers, teenagers, and the elderly such as training, games, learning forums, socialization and a forum for meetings between local neighborhood
association and subdistrict or district parties. It has also become a place for residents to exercise and gather to communicate with and interact with fellow citizens.

3.3. Partnership infrastructure and facilities between the regional government and the community in fulfilling children’s rights

The development of the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space was carried out by the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Provincial Government by involving the private sector, PT Pembangunan Jaya in the form of Corporate Social Responsibility funding for the construction and provision of facilities. The development process begins with a social mapping of the public space site conditions carried out by PT Pembangunan Jaya together with the Community, Women, and Family Planning Empowerment Agency and the Family Empowerment and Welfare Activator Team by involving the participation of residents and community leaders using focus group discussion to compile the design and activities of the public space to be built. This was done so that the public space that was built, fits the needs of children and local residents.

3.4. Part of infrastructure and facilities for Child Decent City

Child friendly integrated public space development is an implementation of the Minister of Women Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 11 of 2011 concerning Child Decent Regency/City Development Policy and the Minister of Women Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 12 of 2011 concerning Child Decent Regency/City Indicators. The Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space has been equipped with a variety of adequate infrastructure consisting of multipurpose rooms, libraries, sports fields (basketball, futsal, and badminton), interactive parks (for playing and relaxing), nutrition parks (for planting), children’s playgrounds (in the form of children's play facilities), nutritional ponds (for raising fish), pedestrian paths (for jogging, walking, and cycling), and supporting facilities for parks (parking areas, park benches, management posts, lighting, etc.). Various facilities provided in the public space allow children to play happily. Children feel happy because they get a place to gather with their peers to play futsal, swing, and other games. The existence of infrastructure and facilities provided in the public space is not only felt by children who live around its location, even children who live far from it, such as children who live in Duri Pulo Subdistrict. They came to visit to use the various game facilities available in the public space. For two to three months after the inauguration of the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space, many parties supported the public space, but entered into the Phase II (2016) and Phase III (2017) development, support from the government diminished because the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space was considered to be independent and the government concentrated more on other child friendly integrated public spaces which were built in the Phase II and Phase III. In Phase I (2015), budgeting and maintenance were the responsibility of the Office of Empowerment, Child Protection, and Population Control, Central Jakarta Administrative City while in 2016 the budgeting was handed over to Cideng Subdistrict but its maintenance was still the responsibility of the Office of Empowerment, Child Protection, and Population Control, Central Jakarta Administrative City. In fact, if there is a damage and then reported by the managers to the Office of Empowerment, Child Protection and Population Control Central Jakarta Administration City, the report has never been followed up. This causes the managers together with residents to initiate self-help to repair and/or replace damaged infrastructure and facilities. The managers hope that the public space will continue to get assistance at least in terms of maintenance of infrastructure and facilities.

3.5. Green open space and groundwater absorption site

The land of the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space that can be built is limited to a maximum of 1500m², while the rest is used as a green open space which also functions as a groundwater absorption site. In the public space, 15 biopore holes have been built, which were the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Province Water Service program. Through these biopore holes, rain
water can be collected so that it can get back into the ground so that the availability of groundwater for locations around the public space is never dry and always clean.

3.6. Infrastructure and facilities for citizens' social activities including the development of knowledge and skills of the Family Empowerment and Welfare cadres

The Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space has carried out various activities that not only include the activities for children but also has carried out activities for the Family Empowerment and Welfare cadres, mothers, teenagers, and the elderly. The existence of a multipurpose room can be utilized by community members as a place for training and socialization to develop knowledge and skills. The activities that have been carried out include training in the use and management of waste in collaboration with Rumah Pelangi and traditional dance training for children. It has also carried out other activities such as the elderly medical examination and free dental examination in collaboration with Obor Foundation, the Faculty of Medicine Universitas Atmajaya, and Prodia Clinical Laboratory; Healthy with Milo; as well as futsal tournaments for children and adolescents. In addition to the multipurpose room, there is also a library that is very useful for children and adolescents to get reading resources so that they can add knowledge and insight.

3.7. Efforts to increase family income; family consultation and information center

The Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space has conducted various training to produce something that can be sold, for example training in knitting in collaboration with Crafts Community, training in making bread and cakes in cooperation with PT Bogasari, training in growing vegetables and fruit, and training in processing vegetables and fruit after harvest. The products of the citizens' production can also be exhibited and sold at the Family Empowerment and Welfare Mart and bazaar held at the public space. The efforts made are not only in the form of increased incomes but also in reducing expenses by implementing a low-cost market where goods are sold at subsidized prices that are lower than market prices so that citizens can meet their daily needs with lower expenses. It also seeks to become a center for information and family consultation by holding various socialization activities such as socialization of clean and healthy behavior in cooperation with PT Unilever, socialization of parenting, socialization of the dangers of narcotics and juvenile delinquency, and socialization of prevention of violence against women and children.

3.8. Green, organized, beautiful, and comfortable family yard

The Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space was designed as a family yard that is overgrown with various trees and plants to add to the environmental greenish, order, beauty, and comfort for local residents who live in a densely populated area.

3.9. Management information system

The Family Empowerment and Welfare has a database containing citizen data that can be used to determine the potential for community participation if the managers want to carry out an activity in the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space. The public space is also a place to socialize the results of the coordination meeting between local neighborhood association and subdistrict or district parties. The benefits of the public space are not only for citizens but also for the government. Various forms of citizen data collection placed at the public space can be filled out by residents where the data can later be used in the formulation, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of policies/programs by the government. However, the public space does not yet have a management information system that is supported by a complete set of hardware, software, databases, as well as computer networks and data communications that can produce information that is useful for the managers in making decisions and performing managerial functions.
4. Conclusion
Child friendly integrated public space is a place and/or open space that combines the activities of citizens by implementing the 10 Main Program for the Family Empowerment and Welfare with the Child Decent City Program. One of the pilot and longest operating child friendly public spaces in Jakarta is the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space. The success of the public space depends very much on the people who adopt, use, and manage the public space. Effectiveness is one measure to assess this success. To find out the effectiveness of the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space, measurements were made on indicators of fulfillment of functions as contained in Article 4 of the Governor Regulation of the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Province Number 123 Year 2017 concerning Management and Requirements for Facilities and Infrastructure of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces: public open parks; a place for community interaction of all ages; partnership infrastructure and facilities between the regional government and the community in fulfilling children's rights; part of infrastructure and facilities for Child Decent City; green open space and groundwater absorption site; infrastructure and facilities for citizens' social activities including the development of knowledge and skills of the Family Empowerment and Welfare cadres; efforts to increase family income, family consultation and information center; green, organized, beautiful, and comfortable family yard; and management information system. The results shows that the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space can be considered effective in fulfilling these functions. However, there are two things that need attention. First, it still requires assistance from the government in terms of maintaining infrastructure and facilities. Secondly, it is necessary to develop a management information system that is supported by a complete set of hardware, software, databases, as well as computer networks and data communications that can produce information that is useful for the managers of the public space in making decisions and performing managerial functions.

References
[1] Pietro Garau, *Global Public Space Toolkit: From Global Principles to Local Policies and Practice*, Nairobi: United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat), 2015
[2] Governor Regulation of the Special Capital Region of Jakarta Province Number 123 Year 2017 concerning Management and Requirements for Facilities and Infrastructure of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces
[3] Endi Hernowo and Ardy Maulidy Navastara, “Characteristics of the Bahari Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in Cilandak District, South Jakarta”, Jurnal Teknik ITS Vol. 6 No. 2, pp. 567-570, June 2017
[4] Muhammad Sega Purnama, “Application of the Concept of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces in Settlements Case Study of the South Gandaria Child Friendly Integrated Public Space”, FaktorExactaVol. 10 No. 4, pp. 401-405, December 2017
[5] Netti Herlina and Nadiroh, “Strategic Role of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces in the Context of Fulfilling Children’s Rights to the Environment”, Jurnal Pendidikan Usia Dini Vol. 12 No. 1, pp. 104-117, April 2018
[6] Susinety Prakoso and Julia Dewi, “Children’s Sense of Attachment to Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces”, NALARs Vol.17 No. 1, pp. 1-10, January 2018
[7] Desti Rahmiati and Bondan Prihastomo, “Identification of the Implementation of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces Concept in the Kambang Iwak Park Palembang”, Vitruvian Vol. 8 No. 1, pp. 29-42, October 2018
[8] Putu Indah Lestari and Elizabeth Prima, “The Role of Child Friendly Integrated Public Spaces for Early Childhood”, Jurnal Obsesi Vol. 4 Issue 1, pp. 471-481, December 2019
[9] Muhammad Nurhasbi, “Performance Evaluation of the Kalijodo Child Friendly Integrated Public Space West Jakarta”, Jurnal Mahasiswa Jurusan Arsitektur Vol. 7 No. 1, pp. 1-12, March 2019
[10] Agnatsya Listianti Mustaram, “Analysis of the Existence Of Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in the Housing Complex Location Object of Study: Nusa Indah Child Friendly Integrated
Public Space, West Jakarta”, Jurnal Muara Sains, Teknologi, Kedokteran, dan Ilmu Kesehatan Vol. 2 No. 2, pp. 492-501, October 2018

[11] Putri Kharisma Utami, Wahju Qamara Mugnisjah, and Aris Munandar, “Benefit-Based Urban Community Participation In Shaping Children Friendly Public Park”, Jurnal Lanskap Indonesia Vol. 8 No. 2, pp. 28-38, October 2016

[12] Dodi Faedlulloh, Retnayu Prasetyanti, and Indrawati, “Initiating Deliberative Democracy-Based Public Space: A Study on Dynamic Management of Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in North Jakarta”, Spirit Publik Vol. 12 No. 2, pp. 43-60, October 2017

[13] Sahala Simatupang, “Social Process in the Production of Public Space ‘Kalijodo Child Friendly Integrated Public Space’ in Jakarta”, Jurnal Arsitektur Vol. 5 No. 1, pp. 43-55, August 2017

[14] William N. Dunn, Public Policy Analysis: An Integrated Approach Sixth Edition, New York: Routledge, 2018

[15] Riena Juliannisa Surayuda. “Community Center and Collective Memory Contestation: Case Study of the Kenanga Child Friendly Integrated Public Space in Cideng, Central Jakarta”, Masyarakat Vol. 21 No. 2, pp. 233-261, August 2016