Managing Sacred Sites, Service Provision and Visitor Experience
M. Shackley. London: Continuum, 2001. Pp. xviii + 206. ISBN 0-8264-5141-1 (hbk): £60. ISBN 0-8264-5140-3 (pbk): £29.95.

Myra Shackley’s book Managing Sacred Sites addresses one of the most significant forms of heritage tourism, which has to this point been largely neglected by both heritage and tourism specialists. Shackley’s text examines sacred sites as visitor attractions with emphasis on how the sites are constructed as a tourism product and how this product is then sold to the tourists.

The text is arranged around eight main themes: the visitor experience; managing visitor impacts; controlling visitor flows; managing, marketing and planning; pilgrimage, festival and events; cultural landscapes; political and social contents, and the role of secular sites.

The discussion of the visitor experience is a broad reflection on the complex relationship between the visitor and the site, in which the characteristics of the sites, the availability of visitors services and the influence of the staff and site management policies all contribute to the overall experience.

The section on managing visitor impacts examines the physical impact as well as the psychological impact of tourism at the sacred sites. In the discussion of physical impacts the notion of agents of change is introduced, this classifies the physical impact of visitor activity into eight categories. All of these are presented with real world examples and a description of the impact, both on the physical environment and the impact on the visitor experience. In addition to addressing the physical impacts Shackley also discusses the psychological impacts that are particularly evident at mass tourism sites, where the impact is a product of large numbers of tourists jostling for the best view and the optimum photo opportunity.

The section addressing the controlling and management of visitor flows focuses on the issues of visitor access and visitor management at a diverse range of sites. The discussion is enhanced by an examination of the island sites of Rapa Nui (Easter Island), Iona, Lindisfarne, Ninstints and Robben Island. The discussion then addresses the highly complex, inherently problematic and interrelated issues of managing access and multiple uses of the sites.

The economic aspects of the sacred sites are illustrated in the section of the chapter on managing, marketing and planning of sacred sites. The place of the sacred site in larger processes is illustrated with a discussion of Gloucester Cathedral, which has benefited financially from being a filming location in the Harry Potter series of movies as well as being the main site of the television adaptation of Joanna Trollope’s The Choir in 1995. The successful example of Gloucester Cathedral is contrasted with the example of Machu Picchu, where considerable damage occurred when the site was used to film an America television commercial.

In addition to being sites regularly visited by tourists, sacred sites are also the locations of festivals, events, anniversaries, jubilees and pilgrimages. In the discussion of these features Shackley draws upon a range of examples to illustrate the issues associated with staging these events. The example of Southwell Minster’s Time Travelling! event is of particular interest. Time Travelling! has become the largest educational event at any place of worship, school or church in the United Kingdom with over 8000 school children given the opportunity to explore and learn about Southwell Minster. In her discussion of pilgrimages Shackley highlights the tension that exists at sacred sites between pilgrims and tourists, as well as exploring the attributes of pilgrimage sites.

Shackley engages in an illuminating discussion of the role of the cultural landscape as a sacred site, where physical features may either stand alone or combine with built heritage to create a cultural landscape. The cultural landscape is defined and illustrated in terms of scared mountains such as Mt Sinai, Mt Everest; sacred
groves such as the Malshegu Sacred Grove, Ghana; and sacred islands illustrated with the case study of Rapa Nui (Easter Island).

The political and social contexts of sacred sites are discussed by Shackley with particular reference to the effect that is experienced by the local community. This is particularly evident with the case of Lindisfarne, where the volume of tourists has had a negative effect on the host community creating a ‘spatial and social claustrophobia’ (p. 144).

The final section considers the role of secular sites, that is, sites that are of a secular nature and belong to no defined religious tradition. The presence of these sites is explained in the fact that ‘they all share one unifying characteristic, namely that they are locations of outstanding significance to particular ethnic, racial or social groups’ (p. 155). The sites addressed in this section fall into the broad categories of holocaust sites such as Dachau and Auschwitz-Birkenau; war memorials illustrated by the Vietnam War Memorial and the Flanders Fields Museum; the cemeteries and catacombs of Highgate Cemetery, London, the Cimetière de Montparnasse, Paris and the Arlington National Cemetery in Washington, DC; the final category is that of political shrines which is illustrated with the example of Robben Island in South Africa. At this point the link is made between these secular sites and the alternative classification of the sites as locations of dark tourism. Unfortunately, Shackley does not explore this link in any significant detail and does not draw out the obvious links that exist in the two classifications.

Case studies are used extensively throughout the text and serve as excellent illustrations of the general principles addressed. The 19 case studies are drawn from a wide range of locations around the globe and provide excellent local examples of the challenges and issues that arise at sacred sites. The case studies range from the iconic sites of Westminster Abbey, Iona and Stonehenge to the emerging sites of the Cape Coast Castle, Ghana and Robben Island, South Africa.

By Shackley’s own admission this text is focused on an operations management approach to sacred sites. While this is a valid approach, it does, to a certain extent, limit the discussion between the differing themes presented in the text. Nevertheless, this text will be of benefit to a wide audience, particularly tourism and heritage specialists and postgraduate students.

Gillian Blackler
University of Canterbury
Christchurch, New Zealand
(g.blackler@geog.canterbury.ac.nz)

---

**Hosts and Guests Revisited: Tourism Issues of the 21st Century**
V.L. Smith and M. Brent (eds). Elmsford, New York: Cognizant Communication Corporation, 2001. Pp. xvi + 462. ISBN: 1-882345-28-2 (hbk): US$64. ISBN: 1-882345-29-0 (pbk): US$55.

**Tourism and Sustainability: Development and New Tourism in the Third World**
M. Mowforth and I. Munt. (2nd edn). London and New York: Routledge, 2003. Pp. xiii +338. ISBN 0-415-27168-1 (hbk) £75.00. ISBN 0-415-217169-X (pbk) £20.99.

**The Development and Management of Visitor Attractions**
J. Swarbrooke (2nd edn). Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann, 2002. Pp. xviii + 406. ISBN 0 7506 5169 5 (pbk): £21.99.

It is a sign of the rapid growth of the discipline of tourism that new editions of tourism books which have satisfied the market needs of publishers and established themselves in the field are increasingly being published. This review examines three such new editions.

The press release which accompanies Hosts and Guests Revisited describes it as ‘a new edition of a classic in the field’. However, while there is some continuity from previous editions there is also substantial change not only in relationship to the authors but also the topics that are covered. The book consists of 29 chapters and an introduction that cover both case studies and reviews of specific topics. The chapters are divided into six sections: stone age to star trek, nature of tourism, changes and impacts, sustainability, culture brokers,
and issues of the 21st century. According to Valene Smith in the preface, ‘The book is intended as an introductory text of value and interest to students coming into the field of tourism, to provide an understanding of the role of tourism in human lives’ (p.xv). She then goes on to refer to a World Tourism Organization conference on human capital at which the authors spoke to the need to move beyond the present fragmentation of departments, to develop the ‘tourismification of the industry’ (Jafari, 1997, p.210) (p. xv). Unfortunately, while these aims are laudable the book does not succeed in meeting them.

As with many edited books the quality of chapters is variable and there are problems of continuity and comparability. Arguably earlier editions of the book were better integrated, not only because they were more recognisably set within the context of the anthropology of tourism but also because there was a much smaller body of literature on which contributors could draw. The present book still draws substantially upon anthropological and ethnographic studies but seeks to be inclusive of other areas as well. Unfortunately, it often fails. For example, the introduction by Smith and Brent notes that ‘the academic study of tourism, and especially the eclectic anthropology of tourism, is generally dated to the 1974 American Anthropological Association meeting held in Mexico City’ (p. 7). Although anthropologists may use this date, geographers, for example, clearly claim a far longer lineage with an international study group on tourism well established by this date and the first wave of publications on the economic geography of tourism coming out in the 1930s (Hall & Page, 1999). A similarly poor appreciation of the history of tourism studies is to be found in Chapter 2 on the ‘scientification of tourism’ by Jafari. This chapter, which unreflectively repeats numerous elements of previously published writings by Jafari, fails to convey the development of the scholarly field of tourism in light of broader writings on the sociology of scientific knowledge. Instead, the overview comes across as insular and focussed on individual as opposed to disciplinary perspectives. More rewarding is Graburn’s discussion of ‘secular ritual: a general theory of tourism’ (Chapter 3), which, in contrast to the previous chapter, seeks to embrace recent writings and new perspectives in the field. For this reader it is indeed disappointing that there were not more contributions from authors such as Graburn who also appeared in the earlier editions of this book. Their perspectives on continuity and change within their fields of interest would have greatly added to the book as would the possibility for longituudinal studies such as that used by Smith in examining power and ethnicity in Boracay, Philippines (Chapter 10) and Richter on Philippine tourism development (Chapter 22).

Undoubtedly, Hosts and Guests Revisited will be a useful reader for undergraduate students. It contains a number of different perspectives and provides an international coverage of case studies. However, there is insufficient connection made between the chapters and the book does not present tourism, let alone the socio-cultural dimensions of tourism, as being a coherent intellectual field at all. Indeed, this book seemingly suffers from the fragmentation it is seeking to overcome. It should also be noted that the publishers have also done the authors a substantial disservice by printing on very thin paper on which type from one side is easily visible on the other.

In contrast to Hosts and Guests Revisited the second edition of Tourism and Sustainability has extremely high production values with good quality plates and graphics. As with the first edition of the book, the new edition presents a cogent and well argued perspective on the relationship between tourism and sustainability particularly with reference to the Third World. As the authors note in their foreword ‘Much has changed since the first edition of Tourism and Sustainability . . . But the question with which we embarked remains: can new forms of tourism become a significant force in global development?’ (pp. xii–xiii). However, their (self-confessed) pessimistic conclusion remains.

The book remains extremely well written and challenges students with some of the key concepts which exist with respect to the analysis of tourism such as globalisation, power and class. However, in many ways the changes to the book from the previous edition are fundamentally cosmetic in terms of approach. A little over 100 new references have been
added in the five years since the first edition but these are primarily institutional references or from the media rather than tying into recent academic tourism literature. Undoubtedly this is useful in terms of examples and case studies although it does provide a somewhat static perspective of tourism studies. For example, it is surprising, given their institutional affiliations, that the excellent work of Plymouth colleague Kevin Meethan on globalisation and consumption is not referenced (Meethan, 2001), while the recent work of fellow geographers in the field of tourism and sustainability, even when also produced by the same publishers, remains unmentioned (e.g. Hall & Lew, 1998; Fennell, 1999). Although, this noted, it is pleasing to see the authors utilise literature from the fields of development and community studies.

Undoubtedly, these misgivings aside, *Tourism and Sustainability* will continue to be a ‘must-read’ book in the area of tourism in developing countries. Unlike many tourism books in the area it is accessible and provocative. However, without the appropriate revisions in the future it will cease to be cutting edge and lose its potential to be ‘a realistic starting point for an assessment of the forces within which we must work towards change’ (p.xviii).

The final new edition is that of Swarbrooke’s text on visitor attractions. As the publication details indicate, this book has been in substantial demand as an undergraduate text. However, given its excellent lay-out and organisation, this is perhaps not surprising. The book has some 20 chapters followed by a series of studies and a final section which examines the future of attractions. Somewhat frustratingly the book has a list of figures and tables but no table of chapters. This criticism aside, the book has been updated from the first edition to be more international in scope as well as to reflect some of the recent developments in attraction development and management. The book continues to be very accessible for students and no doubt its organisation and structure will appeal to both further education as well as higher education courses.

Arguably the biggest criticisms of the book lie with the only brief description of how visitor attractions fit into the wider destination, not only in terms of impacts but how they might be integrated within destination strategies. Furthermore, the book glosses over the often contested nature of some visitor attractions, particularly if they have a heritage element to them (e.g. Ashworth & Tunbridge, 1996). There is therefore relatively little attention given to the sustainability of visitor attractions in a broader sense, although the final chapter on the future of visitor attractions does provide an interesting starting point for discussion.

Michael James
*Dunedin, New Zealand*

**References**

Ashworth, G.J. and Tunbridge, J.E. (1996) *Dissonant Heritage*. Chichester: Wiley.
Fennell, D. (1999) *Ecotourism*. London: Routledge.
Hall, C.M. and Lew, A. (eds.) (1998) *Sustainable Tourism Development: Geographical Perspectives*. London: Addison-Wesley Longman.
Hall, C.M. and Page, S. (1999) *The Geography of Tourism and Recreation*. London: Routledge.
Jafari, J. (1997) Tourismification of the profession: Chameleon job names across the industry. *Progress in Tourism and Hospitality Research* 3(3), 175–181.
Meethan, K. (2001) *Tourism in Global Society: Place, Culture, Consumption*. Basingstoke: Palgrave