High-resolution Bronze Age palaeoenvironmental change in the Eastern Mediterranean: exploring the links between climate and societies

Calian J. Hazell, Matthew J. Pound and Emma P. Hocking

Department of Geography & Environmental Sciences, Northumbria University, Newcastle upon Tyne, UK

ABSTRACT
Bronze Age archaeological records from the eastern Mediterranean identify two periods of widespread so-called societal ‘collapse’ between ca. 4.50–ca. 4.20 cal ka BP and ca. 3.50–ca. 2.80 cal ka BP, respectively, which have been linked to a number of proposed causes, including climate change. However, the role of climate change in the ‘collapse’ of eastern Mediterranean Bronze Age societies has been questioned due to the resolution of climate proxy records. In this paper we present a regional synthesis of the highest resolution palaeoclimate records and compare these to archaeological evidence. By recalibrating radiocarbon dates onto a consistent timescale and using pollen, oxygen and carbon isotopes from both marine and terrestrial deposits, we reconstruct aridity at a 50-year resolution. Our results challenge a simple ‘climate destroyed society’ hypothesis. Instead, we find a more complex record of changing aridity and societal response and provide a nuanced perspective on climate versus non-climate causes of Bronze Age societal ‘collapse’ events. Our results have implications for the generation of palaeoclimate records aimed at exploring links between climate and societal change, emphasising the need for high resolution records proximal to archaeological sites.

1. Introduction
The Mediterranean basin is the largest area on Earth to experience a climate of summer drought and winter rain of cyclonic origin (Roberts et al. 2004). Throughout the Holocene, the Mediterranean region has been highly sensitive to climate variability, with pronounced and often graphically variable environmental responses to global climatic events (Lionello 2012), and a complex atmospheric circulatory system (Roberts et al. 2004; Robinson et al. 2008). It is the epicentre where three global climate forcing mechanisms meet, with the African-Arabian/Asian monsoon exerting greater control in the summer (Russell, Talbot, et al. 2003; Alpert et al. 2006; Baioumy et al. 2010; Triantaphyllou et al. 2014), the Siberian High dominating springtime climates (Rohling et al. 2002; Geraga et al. 2010; Roberts et al. 2012), and the North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) affecting winter conditions (Kaniewski et al. 2015; Katrantsiotis et al. 2019). Evidence suggests a cyclic nature in the extremes of these climatic regimes, typically oscillating every ~1500 years with the NAO (Mayewski et al. 1997; Bianchi and Mccave 1999; Bond et al. 2001) and 2300–2500 years with the Siberian High (Denton and Karlén 1973; Van Campo and Gasse 1993; Bianchi and Mccave 1999; Rohling et al. 2002). The coincidence of these cyclic events can result in widespread, abrupt, and rapid centennial-scale shifts in Mediterranean climates (Mayewski et al. 2004; Finné et al. 2019; Rohling et al. 2019).

Palaeoclimate and archaeological research frequently converges in interests during the Mediterranean Bronze Age, most broadly dated from ca. 5.66–2.75 ka BP (Litt et al. 2009), when two widespread cold and arid centennial-scale abrupt climate change events are recorded. The first is termed the 4.2 K Event, and is reported between 4.50 and 3.90 ka BP (Roberts et al. 2011), the shorter range of 4.50–4.20 ka BP (Kaniewski et al. 2008; Mercuri et al. 2011; Guiot and Kaniewski 2015; Finné et al. 2019), and more specifically at ca. 4.30 ka BP (Guiot and Kaniewski 2015), ca. 4.20 ka BP (Mercuri et al. 2011), and ca. 4.00 ka BP (Mauri et al. 2015). The second is termed the 3.2 K Event and occurred in two distinct phases, the first comprising a cold and arid interval from 3.50 to 3.30 ka BP (Kaniewski et al. 2008; Kaniewski et al. 2010; Finné et al. 2019) and the second a cold and wet interval between 3.10 and 2.90 ka BP (Mayewski et al. 2004; Incarnato et al. 2008; Rohling et al. 2019) that typically featured a three-pulse arid-wet-arid event between 3.35 and 2.80 ka BP (Roberts et al. 2011; Drake 2012; Kaniewski et al. 2013; Mercuri and Sadori 2013; Mauri et al. 2015; Kaniewski et al. 2019). It is widely theorised that these climate change events contributed to two intervals of large-scale so-called societal ‘collapse’ throughout the Mediterranean (Carpenter 1966; Neumann and Parpola 1987; Weiss et al. 1993; Weiss et al. 2004; Finné et al. 2019; Rohling et al. 2019).
1997; Tarasov et al. 1998; Cullen and DeMenocal 2000; Kaniewski et al. 2008; Kaniewski et al. 2010; Roberts et al. 2011; Drake 2012; Kaniewski et al. 2013; Langgut et al. 2013; Kaniewski et al. 2015; Langgut et al. 2015; Kennedy 2016), termed the Early Bronze Age Collapse (EBAC) (Weiss et al. 1993; Weiss and Courty 1993; Weiss 2017) between ca. 4.45 and 3.95 ka BP (Kennedy 2016; Hofmayer 2017a), and the Late Bronze Age Collapse (LBAC) between ca. 3.20 and 3.05 ka BP (Weiss 1982; Cline 2014; Knapp and Manning 2016). The EBAC saw the decline of the Akkadian empire (Bottema 1991; Weiss et al. 1993; Weiss and Courty 1993; Dalfes et al. 1997; Kennedy 2016) and increasing desertion of the surrounding Mesopotamian and Levantine towns (Cooper 1997; Nigro 2000; Kennedy 2016). The LBAC saw the dissolution and disbandment of the Balkan/Mycenaean (Catting 1975; Knapp 2011), Hittite (Hawkins 1974; Bryce 2005) and Assyrian (Liverani 1987; Cline 2014) empires, region-wide abandonment of towns throughout the Levant (Singer 1999; Schwartz et al. 2000; Cohen and Singer 2006; Kaniewski et al. 2013; Langgut et al. 2014), and destabilisation in Egypt (Kaniewski et al. 2015).

The theory of climatic causation to these events is subject to lively and contentious debate (e.g. Cline 2014; Finkelstein and Langgut 2014; Hughes 2014; Holmgren et al. 2016; Knapp and Manning 2016; Hofmayer 2017b; Schloen 2017). The foremost issue is that the extent and timing of the 4.2 K and 3.2 K Events are neither homogenous nor synchronous, but vary by region and even locality (Figure 1). Additionally, a recent synthesis on pollen and archaeo-demographic archives (Roberts et al. 2019) suggested that during the Bronze Age (prior to ca. 3.00 cal ka BP) there is evidence that in some cases human activity alone caused observed changes in land cover and vegetation irrespective of climate influence (e.g. Hughes 2014), while in others there is evidence for climate change directly impacting human society through multiple pathways, including vegetation turnover, resulting in political and economic turmoil and migrations that then had a further direct effect on land cover (e.g. Rosen 2007; Kaniewski and Van Campo 2017). Furthermore, there is evidence that populations expanded not only despite long-term climatic shifts, but also due to them, with climatic adversity acting a stimulus rather than a hindrance to adequately structured societal/organisational adaptive strategies (Roberts et al. 2019). The adopted societal structures of different cultures, the social hierarchies, methods of governance, administrative and economic set-ups, have proven a key factor in human responses and societal resilience (Holmgren et al. 2016; Knapp and Manning 2016). As such, when considering agricultural shifts, single causes should be avoided and integrated environmental, economic, and social factors must be formed into a causal chain (Riehl et al. 2012). There are numerous contributing or alternative causes that must be considered for the EBAC and LBAC events, including tsunamis and earthquakes (Nur and Cline 2000; Kennedy

**Figure 1.** Key palaeoenvironmental literature review conclusions for the Mediterranean Bronze Age. Black Shading – original authors infer increasing aridity from proxy records. Grey Shading – original authors infer decreasing aridity from proxy records. Site Bracketed Letter Key: M – Multiproxy, P – Pollen, F-G – Facies and Geochemistry, D – Diatom, N – Calcareous Nannofossil, F – Foraminifera, C – Coccolithophore, I – Isotope Ratio.
2016; Knapp and Manning 2016), government instability (Stubbings 1975; Kennedy 2016; Knapp and Manning 2016), cessation of international trade (Carpenter 1966; Dickinson 1995; Langgut et al. 2013; Cline 2014; Kennedy 2016; Knapp and Manning 2016), internal rebellion (Maran 2009), foreign invasion (Hawkins 1974; Barnett 1975; Bottema 1982; Weiss 1982; Muhly 1984; Sandars 1987; Singer 1999; Kaniewski et al. 2011; Knapp 2013; Kennedy 2016), potential plague outbreaks (Kaniewski et al. 2020), and a multi-causal ‘perfect storm’ hypothesis attributing equal responsibility to each possible cause for the EBAC (Kennedy 2016) and the LBAC (Langgut et al. 2013; Cline 2014).

While the better integration of archaeological and palaeoenvironmental data has been of interest to both research communities since the turn of the new millennium (Chapman and Geary 2000), the attempt to better conciliate archaeology and palaeoenvironmental science is an area of research gaining even greater interest as of recent years (Arikan et al. 2016; Cremaschi et al. 2016; Holmgren et al. 2016; Izdebski et al. 2016; Mazzini et al. 2016; Morellon et al. 2016; Weiberg et al. 2016; Weiberg and Finné 2018). While there is much evidence for the coincidence of shifts in climate system dynamics during the EBAC and LBAC, such as Mediterranean winter westerlies due to the NAO (Cullen et al. 2000; Cullen and DeMenocal 2000; Wanner et al. 2008; López-Moreno et al. 2011; Di Rita et al. 2018; Isola et al. 2019; Katrantsiotis et al. 2019; Di Rita and Magri 2019), the northern winter-spring Siberian High (Rohling et al. 2002; Mayewski et al. 2004), and the southern-eastern African-Asian summer Monsoon (Neumann and Parpola 1987; deMenocal et al. 2000; Zhang et al. 2000; Hassan et al. 2001; Roberts et al. 2001; Gasse 2002; Magny et al. 2002; Russell, Johnson, et al. 2003; Russell, Talbot, et al. 2003; Roberts et al. 2004; Russell and Johnson 2005; Jones et al. 2006; Magny et al. 2007; Wanner et al. 2008; Cole et al. 2009; Baioumy et al. 2010; Vanni et al. 2011; Triantaphyllou et al. 2014; Ruan et al. 2016; Zanchetta et al. 2016; Katrantsiotis et al. 2019; Persöni et al. 2019), it has been shown that recognising the coincidence of broad scale climate shifts with broad scale societal trends does not allow for resolving the specific interactions between local climate changes and individual societal fluctuations at a site-by-site resolution (Holmgren et al. 2016; Finné et al. 2019). Due to this, there is a need to examine local case studies in an interdisciplinary approach to better understand the mechanisms of climate-society interrelations (Holmgren et al. 2016; Finné et al. 2019). One major problem

| Region                  | Site                  | References                                                                 |
|-------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Turkey                  | Lake Issyk (F-G)      | Ullman et al. 2012                                                         |
|                         | Lake Tavan (F-G)      | Kuznetsov et al. 2013                                                      |
|                         | Lake Nar (F-G)        | Lian et al. 2013                                                            |
|                         | Lake Yar (F-G)        | Wick et al. 2003                                                            |
|                         | Lake Van (F-G)        | Lenncke et al. 1997                                                        |
|                         | Lake Issyk (P)        | Miebach et al. 2016                                                         |
|                         | Karam-Kalehnyuk (P)   | Wright et al. 2015                                                          |
|                         | Lake Yar (P)          | Wick et al. 2003                                                            |
|                         | Goshin Lake (P)       | Eastwood et al. 2007; Eastwood, Roberts, and Lamb 1999                    |
|                         | Sino-Angil (P)        | Roberts et al. 2001                                                        |
|                         | Sino-Angil (P)        | Roberts et al. 2001                                                        |
|                         | Lake Van (I)          | Wick et al. 2003                                                            |
|                         | Soofar Cave (I)       | Greilhuber et al. 2011                                                      |
|                         | Soofar Cave (I)       | Gisler et al. 2011                                                          |
|                         | Goshin Lake (I)       | Eastwood et al. 2007; Eastwood, Roberts, and Lamb 1999                    |
|                         | Samo Central (M)      | Joulivet and Stanley 1989; Stanley, Sheng, and Pan 1988                   |
|                         | Manasala Laggon (F-G) | Ralske et al. 2016; Ruan et al. 2016; Russell and Johnson 2005             |
|                         | Bumilus Laggon (P, F-G)| Krom et al. 2002                                                            |
|                         | Southwest Lekvatina Shif (M)| Kaniewski, Van Campo, Morehanga, et al. 2013                           |
|                         | Nile Delta (M)        | Bynoe and Bryan 1997                                                       |
|                         | Lake Qara (F-G)       | Mlgowska et al. 2006                                                        |
|                         | Lake Qara (F-G)       | Li et al. 2012; Mlgowska et al. 2006                                        |
|                         | Lake Qara (F-G)       | Joosman et al. 2006; Israel et al. 2003                                   |
|                         | Lake Qara (F-G)       | Barton et al. 2007                                                         |
|                         | Lake Qara (F-G)       | Frumkin et al. 1995                                                        |
|                         | Northernmost Syria (P)| Venglaevier et al. 2013                                                      |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Verheyden et al. 2008                                                       |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Bar-Matthews and Austin 2011; Bar-Matthews et al. 2006                     |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Bar-Matthews et al. 2003                                                    |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Shilham, Bar-Matthews, and Almogi-Labin 2003                               |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Frumkin 2009                                                               |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Yesuda, Kitagawa, and Nakagawa 2000                                        |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Focerino et al. 2008                                                       |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Huhtanen et al. 2006                                                       |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Cullen et al. 2000                                                          |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Stevens et al. 2006                                                        |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Stevens, Wish Jr., and no 2001                                            |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Bond et al. 2013; Shari et al. 2015                                        |
|                         | Dead Sea (P)          | Shari et al. 2015                                                           |

Figure 1. Continued.
in assessing the potential role of climate change in so-called societal ‘collapse’ events, surrounds the resolution of palaeoclimate records (Finné et al. 2011; Holmgren et al. 2016; Knapp and Manning 2016; Homsher and Cradic 2017). With the exceptions identified in this paper, many Bronze Age palaeoclimate records suffer from poor chronological control and low-resolution analyses of single proxy records. From an archaeological perspective, (bi-)annual chronologies are ideal for identifying societal shifts, with sub- and multi-decadal records considered adequate and low resolution respectively (Knapp and Manning 2016). Most palaeoclimate records provide multi-centennial resolution, and sub-decadal palaeoclimate records are uncommon, typically restricted to speleothem/varved lake deposits (Wick et al. 2003; Ruan et al. 2016) (Supplementary 1). This makes direct correlation between climatic and societal shifts difficult from both chronological and geographical perspectives (Finné et al. 2011; Butzer and Endfield 2012; Knapp and Manning 2016; Homsher and Cradic 2017). It is possible to use written documentary evidence to accurately date specific climatic events where radiocarbon dating results are of a low resolution (Bronk Ramsey et al. 2010), however where no such written documentary evidence is available, another approach is to take a regional perspective and explore the geographical distribution of climate change (Berger et al. 2016). There is also uncertainty regarding the ability to accurately correlate climatic events between different studies that implement different radiocarbon calibration schemes (Finné et al. 2019). This uncertainty can be addressed by recalibrating radiocarbon datasets using a single calibration scheme, a method that has not been utilised by previous climatic syntheses (Finné et al. 2019). Whilst recent syntheses of Mediterranean climate change records have advanced understanding, these have been focussed at coarser spatial (Bini et al. 2019) or temporal (Drysdale et al. 2006) resolution, and have identified rather than addressed chronological issues.

A further issue is one of anthropogenic obfuscation and what constitutes a definitive anthropogenic signal in pollen datasets. For instance, *Olea* has been considered both indicative of wild xerophilous/sclerophyllous forest/shrub habitats (Prentice et al. 1996; Tarasov et al. 1998; Wick et al. 2003; Neumann, Schözel, et al. 2007; Colombaroli et al. 2008; Allen et al. 2009; Collins et al. 2012; Fall 2012; Kaniewski et al. 2013; Sadori et al. 2013; Gambi et al. 2016), and also indicative of agriculture (Bordon et al. 2009; Litt et al. 2012; Langgut et al. 2016; Margaritelli et al. 2016; Miebach et al. 2016; Sorrel and Mathis 2016).

This paper therefore aims to thoroughly evaluate potential correlation between periods of climatic (aridity) change and intervals of known societal ‘collapse’ between ca. 4.50 and 2.80 ka BP throughout central and eastern Mediterranean regions: Italy, southeast Europe, Anatolia, and the coastal Levant encompassing Syria, Lebanon, Israel and Jordan. A regional synthesis is produced using only standardised palaeoclimate records of the highest temporal resolution, and pollen datasets are subject to multivariate statistical ordination in an effort to associate different assemblage components with anthropological or natural affinities that could otherwise be overlooked. Previously published palaeoenvironmental records are tested against the established data selection criteria of the Pages 2 K consortium (PAGES 2k Consortium T 2014), and proxy records with 50 year resolution chronologies have been recalibrated to the same calibration curve. This dataset is then used to evaluate the role of abrupt climate change events during the EBAC and LBAC in the eastern Mediterranean.

### 2. Materials and methods

#### 2.1. Synthesis of palaeoclimate records

From a search of peer-reviewed literature presenting palaeoclimate proxy datasets from the eastern Mediterranean, 92 studies were found covering the Bronze Age from 4.50 to 2.80 ka BP (Figure 2; Table 1; Supplementary 1). A recent synthesis of Mediterranean climate change through the Holocene focused on hydro-climate proxies and therefore excluded pollen-based reconstructions that can be affected

![Figure 2](image-url)
| Site ID | Site Region         | Latitude (°N) | Longitude (°E) | Original publication          | Record type        | Original ID | Dating method | Proxies       |
|--------|---------------------|---------------|----------------|-------------------------------|--------------------|-------------|---------------|---------------|
| Primary |                     |               |                |                               |                    |             |               |               |
| 2      | Renella Cave, Apuane Alps | Italy       | 44.1           | 10.18                         | Zanchetta et al. (2016) | Speleothem | RL4           | U/Th (years before 1950) | δ¹⁸O, δ¹³C   |
| 5      | Adriatic Sea       | Italy         | 42             | 16                            | Piva et al. (2008)  | Marine sediment core | AMC99-1       | Radiocarbon | δ¹⁸O         |
| 9      | Skala Marion Cave, Thasos | Southeast Europe | 40.64         | 24.51                         | Psomiadis et al. (2018) | Speleothem | A. MAR_L       | U/Th (years before 1950) | δ¹⁸O, δ¹³C   |
| 10     | Mavri Trypa, Peloponnesus | Southeast Europe | 37.74         | 21.76                         | Finné et al. (2017) | Speleothem | S1(mt)        | U/Th (years before 1950) | δ¹⁸O, δ¹³C   |
| 14a    | Lake Van, Taurus Mountains, Turkey | Anatolia | 38.53         | 42.8                         | Wick et al. (2003)  | Lacustrine sediment core | Van 90-10 | Marine sediment core | Van years before 1990 | Pollen, δ¹⁸O |
| 14b    | Lake Van, Taurus Mountains, Turkey | Anatolia | 38.53         | 42.8                         | Şimşek and Çağatay (2018) | Lacustrine sediment core | V08G04 | Marine sediment core | Van years before 2008 | δ¹⁸O, δ¹³C   |
| 15     | Ebla, Idlib Governorate, Syria | Levant | 35.8           | 35.8                         | Fiorentino et al. (2008) | Speleothem | Terrestrial organic matter (outcrop) | U/Th (years before 1950) | δ¹³C|
| 16     | Tell Tweini, Jableh, Syria | Levant | 35.37          | 35.94                        | Kaniewski et al. (2011) | Terrestrial organic matter (wall profile) | – | Radiocarbon | δ¹³C|
| 18     | Jelita Cave, Beirut, Lebanon | Levant | 33.94          | 35.64                        | Verheyden et al. (2008) | Speleothem | JeG-stm-1     | U/Th (years before 2006) | δ¹⁸O, δ¹³C   |
| 19     | Lake Kinneret, Israel | Levant | 32.82          | 35.59                        | Schiebel and Litt (2018) | Lacustrine sediment core | K100(comp) | Radiocarbon | Pollen       |
| 20     | Ashdod Coast, Israel | Levant | 31.94          | 34.37                        | Schilman et al. (2001) | Marine sediment core | GA-112 | Radiocarbon | δ¹³C         |
| 21     | Ein Gedi Shore, Dead Sea, Israel | Levant | 31.76          | 35.65                        | Litt et al. (2012)  | Lacustrine sediment core | K1A5/1/9 | Radiocarbon | Pollen       |
| 22     | Soreq Cave, Judean Mountains, Israel | Levant | 31.75          | 35.05                        | Schilman et al. (2002); Bar-Matthews and Ayalon (2011) | Speleothem | Compilation; 2-N | U/Th (years before 1950) | δ¹³C         |
| Secondary |                   |               |                |                               |                    |             |               |               |
| 1      | Corchia Cave, Apuan Alps | Italy     | 43.98          | 10.22                        | Regattieri et al. (2014) | Speleothem  | CC26          | U/Th (years before 1950) | δ¹⁸O, δ¹³C   |
| 3      | Lago di Massaciuccoli, Tuscany | Italy | 43.98          | 10.33                        | Colombaroli et al. (2007) | Lacustrine sediment core | LML, LMM | Radiocarbon | Pollen       |
| 4      | Lake Accesa, Tuscany | Italy     | 43.98          | 10.88                        | Peyron et al. (2011); Magny et al. (2007) | Lacustrine sediment core | AC3/4, MMA | Radiocarbon | Pollen       |
| 6      | Gulf of Gaeta, Tyrrenian Sea | Italy     | 43.98          | 13.78                        | Margaritelli et al. (2016) | Marine sediment core | SW104-C5 | Radiocarbon | ¹⁸O          |
| 7      | Salerno Gulf, Tyrrenian Sea | Italy     | 43.98          | 14.7                         | Lirer et al. (2013, 2014) | Marine sediment core | C90, C386 | Radiocarbon | δ¹³C         |
| 8      | Lake Maliq, Albania | Southeast Europe | 43.98         | 20.78                        | Bordon et al. (2009)  | Lacustrine sediment core | MALIQS1 | Radiocarbon | Pollen       |
| 11     | Aegean Sea, Greece | Southeast Europe | 43.98         | 26.58                        | Rohling et al. (2002)  | Marine sediment core | LC21 | Radiocarbon | δ¹³C         |
| 12     | Sofular Cave, Zonguldak, Turkey | Anatolia | 43.98          | 31.95                        | Göktürk et al. (2011) | Speleothem  | So-1          | U/Th (years before 1950) | δ¹³C         |
| 13     | Lake Iznik, Bursa Province, Turkey | Anatolia | 43.98          | 29.54                        | Miebach et al. (2016) | Lacustrine sediment core | LC1 | Radiocarbon | Pollen       |
| 17     | Tell Sukas, near Jableh, Syria | Levant | 43.98          | 35.92                        | Sorrel and Mathis (2016) | Lacustrine sediment core | TSII | Radiocarbon | Pollen       |
| 23     | Mount Sedom, Israel | Levant | 43.98          | 35.65                        | Frumkin (2009) | Terrestrial organic matter (tree branch) | SNS | Radiocarbon | δ¹³C         |
by temperature changes (Finné et al. 2019). In this paper pollen records were included for both their climatic (e.g. Bini et al. 2019) and anthropogenic inferences. A second recent climatic synthesis aimed to gather a wide regional coverage using 62 records, and so included records with a relatively low resolution and age controls (Bini et al. 2019). This paper takes an opposite novel approach, aiming to assess the chronological and proxy resolution of each study using the internationally agreed PAGES 2k criteria (PAGES 2k Consortium T 2013, 2014). In this way, all sites utilising pollen or isotope data that featured a continuous age model allowing for interpolation of proxy data were identified. For sites with two or more publications on a single proxy type, preference was given to the most recent record for quantitative analyses. Twelve records passed the original PAGES 2k guidelines (‘primary sites’) and a further eleven records satisfied less stringent criteria (‘secondary sites’) (Table 1). The testing criteria used were; record duration (minimum 500/300 years for primary/secondary sites), chronological accuracy (dating constraints near the start and the end of the record with a minimum average dating resolution of 500/800 years for primary/secondary sites), proxy resolution (minimum average proxy resolution of 200/350 years for primary/secondary sites), and data availability (raw primary data available in a peer-reviewed publication). At passing sites, palaeoclimate proxy data were extracted at 50-year intervals from the original publications. As there are a number of passing sites that feature proxy resolutions that are greater than 50 years (Supplementary 1), this was achieved by normalising pollen datasets followed by the application of Principal Component Analysis (PCA) (see Section 2.3), or standardising isotope datasets to normal values (see Section 2.2), and then interpolating the results to allow for proxy data extraction at a 50-year resolution. This is a similar to the data synchronisation method featured in a recent climatic synthesis, where isotope records were transformed into regional z-scores and then extracted at a 200-year resolution (Finné et al. 2019). As noted by the authors, this method of greater data manipulation resulted in a failure to capture shorter intervals of dry/cold climates, for instance the 4.2 K and 3.2 K Events (Finné et al. 2019). In this paper therefore, a simpler transformation to normal values was utilised for isotope datasets, along with PCA for pollen assemblages, allowing for the implementation of higher resolution intervals for proxy extraction. These methods of data standardisation and interpolation are justified in this case, as it is not absolute values of proxies that are of importance to the environmental reconstructions of the study, but the relative positivity or negativity of standardised trends over time. Isotope data were extracted between 4.50 and 2.80 cal ka BP, whereas full pollen records were used to enable understanding of longer term vegetation changes.

Fifteen of the original publications utilised radiocarbon dating methods, while seven used uranium-thorium dating, and two used varve counting. Varved records were also required to contain 14C or U/Th point dates that passed the PAGES 2K dating resolution, and all dates were standardised to years before 1950 (Table 1). For the radiocarbon studies, the original authors calibrated radiocarbon ages using different calibration curves and applied different marine reservoir corrections (where applicable), a factor that has been previously identified as introducing uncertainty and yet also not previously addressed in a recent climatic synthesis (Finné et al. 2019). In this paper all original published dates were recalibrated in Calib 7.0.4, using the updated IntCal13 calibration curve for terrestrial ages and Marine13 curve for marine ages (Reimer et al. 2013) with the standard global marine reservoir correction (ΔR) value of 400 years (Stuiver and Braziunas 1993).

2.2. Palaeoclimate proxy records

Seven lacustrine sediment cores, six marine sediment cores, seven speleothems, and three terrestrial organic matter archives (a sediment outcrop, an archaeological trench section and a fossilised tree branch cross section) provided palaeoclimate data of sufficient resolution (Figure 2; Table 1). This resulted in a total of eight pollen assemblages, thirteen oxygen isotope profiles, and thirteen carbon isotope profiles (Figure 3; Table 1).

2.2.1. Lacustrine sediment cores

Pollen preserved in lake sediments enables assessment of vegetation changes linked to past climatic shifts (Wick et al. 2003; Colombaroli et al. 2007; Bordon et al. 2009; Peyron et al. 2011; Litt et al. 2012; Miebach et al. 2016; Schiebel and Litt 2018). One lake site also provides an oxygen isotope record (Šimšek and Çağatay 2018). The varying ratio of oxygen isotopes 18O and 16O (herein referred to as δ18O) recorded in autochthonous lacustrine carbonates reflects the balance of precipitation and evaporation (Bar-Matthews et al. 1998; Wick et al. 2003; Roberts et al. 2011). Following Roberts et al. (2011), all stable isotope datasets were statistically transformed to standardised normal values (i.e. the standard deviation about the record’s mean) to overcome site-specific factors such as elevation or absolute precipitation, highlight climatic shifts of more rapid onset, and facilitate inter-site comparability. A trend towards more positive standardised isotope values indicates increasing aridity, while a trend towards more negative standardised isotope values indicates decreasing aridity (Roberts et al. 2011).

2.2.2. Marine sediment cores

δ18O records from marine cores (Schilman et al. 2001; Rohling et al. 2002; Piva et al. 2008; Lirer et al. 2013; Lirer et al. 2014; Margaritelli et al. 2016) again reflect the balance of precipitation and evaporation, this time recorded in planktic foraminifera tests (Schilman et al. 2001; Schilman et al. 2002). One marine core also provides a carbon isotope record (Schilman et al. 2001). The varying ratio of carbon isotopes 13C and 12C (herein referred to as δ13C) measured in foraminifera tests reflects changes in inorganic carbonate runoff of terrestrial origin, and therefore land-based precipitation rates (Schilman et al. 2001; Bar-Matthews and Ayalon...
2.2.3. Terrestrial organic matter

$^{13}$C records within terrestrial buried organic matter (Fiorentino et al. 2008; Frumkin 2009; Kaniewski et al. 2011) are used to infer drought intervals, as during droughts plants close their stomata to retain moisture, thereby taking on less $^{12}$C (Ferrio et al. 2005; Roberts et al. 2011).

2.2.4. Speleothems

Cave deposits including stalagmites, stalactites and flowstones (collectively termed speleothems) contain reservoirs of calcium carbonate that is precipitated by dripping porewaters seeping through to the cave systems from rainfall. The oxygen within these often annually resolvable speleothems has been fractionated by the evaporation–precipitation balance, therefore $^{18}$O can be used to infer this balance around the cave. Variations in $^{13}$C also reflect precipitation levels (as described above) (Lauritzen and Lundberg 1999; McDermott 2004). Combined $^{18}$O and $^{13}$C records come from six speleothems (Schilmann et al. 2002; Verheyden et al. 2008; Bar-Matthews and Ayalon 2011; Regattieri et al. 2014; Zanchetta et al. 2016; Finn et al. 2017; Psomiadis et al. 2018), and one speleothem provides $^{13}$C only (Goñi et al. 2011).

2.3. Pollen

Pollen data were normalised using Box-Cox transformation in PAST version 3.17 (Hammer et al. 2001), excluding aquatics and taxa below 1%. This method normalises percentage data not only at a site level but also between sites, allowing for greater inter-site comparability. Following normalisation, two iterations of PCA were conducted in PAST to assess controls on pollen assemblages first on the full record, and then on the Bronze Age interval. The Bronze Age interval was defined for each core as the closest sample depths before 4.50 and after 2.80 cal ka BP. PCA is a standard method of pollen analysis, and was specifically chosen in this case to identify key environmental drivers of trends in the pollen dataset that

Figure 3. Highest resolution isotope (a, b) and pollen (c, d) records from across the eastern Mediterranean: standardised (a) oxygen and (b) carbon isotope ratios between 4.50 and 2.80 cal ka BP, plotted as excursions from the site specific mean; and arboreal pollen Principal Component Analysis (PCA) loadings inferring water availability against time, recalculated within (c) full Holocene core context and (d) isolated Bronze Age sections. In (c) and (d), plots are ordered by PCA axis weighting, and note x-axis orientations vary in order to maintain a consistent relationship between the directional trends of each graph and the inferred environmental parameter influence (water availability). Also note the Bronze Age section of the Lake Iznik record is not shown on (d) as the PCA axis inferring water availability accounts for less than the threshold 12% variance (Strother et al. 2015). Data points are filled or hollow depending on whether records meet ‘primary’ or ‘secondary’ resolution criteria respectively. Light grey boxes highlight intervals featuring societal ‘collapse’ events in the eastern Mediterranean and Near East (Kennedy 2016; Knapp and Manning 2016). See Table 1 for full site and record details.
could be related to climate and environmental change (Shi 1993; Nguyen et al. 2013; Strother et al. 2015). PCA rotates pollen percentage abundance data through multidimensional space to define and separate the uncorrelated variables controlling assemblage makeup (Delile et al. 2015). These variables, known as principal components, were assigned a statistical weighting for assemblage control within each sample and those inferred to record water availability fluctuations are graphically displayed as a principal component axis against time (Figure 3). Although not necessarily independent from the others, a single principal component axis can be used to infer specific environmental parameters based on the relationship between the taxa at either end of each axis (Enzel et al. 2003; Colombaroli et al. 2009; Zhao et al. 2009; Kaniewski et al. 2015). Full details of these taxa and environmental parameters are provided in Supplementary 2. Strother et al. (2015) considered meaningful variance on a Principal Component axis as at least 14%, however during the Bronze Age five principal component axes account for between 12% and 14% variance. Due to this, only principal component axes accounting for a variance of greater than 12% are examined for possible proxy inferences within the Bronze Age.

3. Results

We present standardised results in Figure 3: oxygen (a) and carbon (b) isotopes, and pollen PCA scores (c, d).

3.1. The Levant

3.1.1. Stable isotopes

Ebla and Mount Sedom δ13C profiles (Figure 3(b)) and the Soreq Cave δ18O (Figure 3(a)) record suggest a general trend of increasing aridity through the EBAC. However, this trend is not observed during the EBAC at Jeita Cave (Figure 3(a,b)) or in the δ13C record from Soreq Cave (Figure 3(b)). Prior to the LBAC, the Jeita Cave and Ashdod Coast isotope records suggest decreasing aridity, followed by a reversal in isotope values indicative of increasing aridity (Figure 3(a,b)). Three δ18O records (Figure 3(a)) suggest the onset of less arid conditions within a 100-year interval at 3.30 cal ka BP at Jeita Cave and Ashdod Coast, and at 3.20 cal ka BP at Soreq Cave. The timing of subsequent increasing aridity varies between 3.25 cal ka BP (Ashdod Coast δ13C; Figure 3(b)), 3.20 cal ka BP (Jeita Cave and Ashdod Coast δ18O; Figure 3(a)), and 3.05 cal ka BP (Soreq Cave δ18O; Figure 3(a), and Jeita Cave δ13C; Figure 3(b)). By contrast, the Tell Tweini δ13C record (Figure 3(b)) suggests increasing aridity 3.35–3.20 cal ka BP, when other sites record decreasing aridity.

3.1.2. Pollen

Long-term records from the Dead Sea and Lake Kinneret (Figure 3(c)) show that prior to the Bronze Age, water availability decreased from ca. 7.00 cal ka BP. After the Bronze Age, water availability continued to decrease in the Dead Sea, but increased at Lake Kinneret (Figure 3(c)). The long-term Tell Sukas record is highly oscillatory (Figure 3(c)).

Increasing water availability is suggested at Lake Kinneret and the Dead Sea preceding and during the EBAC, followed by a sharp decrease after the EBAC (3.95 cal ka BP at Lake Kinneret and 3.80 cal ka BP at the Dead Sea) (Figure 3(d)). Early Bronze Age water availability fluctuates at Tell Sukas, with a long-term decline from 3.60 to 2.90 cal ka BP that is not observed at the other sites (Figure 3(d)).

3.2. Anatolia

3.2.1. Stable isotopes

Both the early Bronze Age δ13C record from Sofular Cave, northwest Turkey (Figure 3(b)), and δ18O record from Lake Van, eastern Turkey (Figure 3(a)), show no significant trends. By contrast, greater shifts in isotope values occurred in the late Bronze Age. Sofular Cave δ13C records increasing aridity 3.30–3.00 cal ka BP (Figure 3(b)), and one Lake Van δ18O record suggests increasing aridity 3.50–3.05 cal ka BP (Figure 3(a)), followed by a short interval of decreasing aridity. However, a second late Bronze Age Lake Van δ18O record and corresponding δ13C record from the same study, offer contrasting evidence of no large changes between 3.45 and 3.15 cal ka BP (δ18O; Figure 3(a)), and increasing aridity 3.35–3.20 cal ka BP (δ13C; Figure 3(b)), followed by decreasing aridity.

3.2.2. Pollen

Within the full core profiles, the observed variance within the pollen records from Lakes Iznik and Van controlled by water variability are ~49.2% (PC1) and ~15.8% (PC2) respectively (Figure 3(c)). While pollen taxa at Lake Iznik infer gradually increasing water availability throughout the full core, at Lake Van water availability is inferred to gradually decrease from 7 cal ka BP (Figure 3(c)), as well as during the Bronze Age interval (Figure 3(d)). Water availability starts to decline 200 years before the onset of the EBAC and there is a sharp decline 250 years before the LBAC (Figure 3(d)).

3.3. Southeast Europe

3.3.1. Stable isotopes

Carbon and oxygen isotopes from Mavri Trypa (Figure 3(a,b)) and carbon isotopes from Skala Marion Cave (Figure 3(b)) suggest increasing aridity preceding the EBAC. This is not reflected in oxygen isotopes from Skala Marion (Figure 3(a)). By contrast, the Aegean Sea δ18O record (Figure 3(a)) indicates a large shift towards increasing aridity at 4.45 cal ka BP, before δ18O values stabilised at 4.15 cal ka BP (onset of the EBAC) until 3.35 cal ka BP. Following a 150-year trend of decreasing aridity, the Skala Marion δ18O record (Figure 3(a)) suggests increasing aridity in the 100 years before the LBAC. Both Mavri Trypa and Aegean Sea δ18O records (Figure 3(a)) show aridity increased later, after the onset of the LBAC. Carbon isotopes from Skala Marion Cave (Figure 3(b)) record increasing aridity 3.40–3.30 ka cal. BP, whilst Mavri Trypa δ13C values (Figure 3(b)) are oscillatory through the LBAC and consistent increasing aridity only occurs from 3.10 cal ka BP.
3.3.2. Pollen

Only one high resolution pollen record exists from this region, Lake Maliq in Albania, where water availability only accounts for 12.5% of the variance (Figure 3(c)). There is a trend of gradually increasing water availability through the Holocene (Figure 3(c)), but no consistent trends during the Bronze Age (Figure 3(d)).

3.4. Italy

3.4.1. Stable isotopes

Early Bronze Age Italian isotope records show no consistent shifts, with significant inter-site variability (Figure 3(a,b)). Corchia and Renella Cave δ13C profiles (Figure 3(b)), and Renella Cave and Gulf of Gaeta δ18O profiles (Figure 3(a)) all suggest relative stability throughout the early Bronze Age. Corchia Cave δ18O values (Figure 3(a)) are also relatively stable, with only a small oscillation (~1 standard deviation from the record mean) between 4.30 and 4.15 cal ka BP. By contrast, the Adriatic Sea δ18O record (Figure 3(a)) suggests decreasing aridity 4.45–4.15 cal ka BP, before aridity increases until 4.00 cal ka BP.

Isotope records from all sites suggest large oscillations throughout the middle Bronze Age (Figure 3(a,b)). Notable excursions from record means occurred at 3.80–3.60 cal ka BP at Corchia Cave (δ18O and δ13C; Figure 3(a,b)) and 3.65–3.35 cal ka BP at Salerno Gulf (δ18O; Figure 3(a)). Increasing aridity is inferred at Corchia Cave immediately before the LBAC 3.55–3.20 (δ13C; Figure 3(b)) and 3.60–3.20 (δ18O; Figure 3(a)) cal ka BP, followed by decreasing aridity 3.15–3.05 (δ13C; Figure 3(b)) and 3.20–3.05 (δ18O; Figure 3(a)) cal ka BP. The δ18O profile from nearby Renella Cave (Figure 3(a)) also suggests increasing aridity 3.30–3.15 cal ka BP, followed by decreasing aridity 3.15–3.05 cal ka BP, but there are no consistent trends in δ13C values (Figure 3(b)). Similarly, no consistent directional trends are present in δ18O profiles from Tyrrhenian Sea cores (Gulf of Gaeta/Salerno Gulf) around the time of the LBAC (Figure 3(a)).

3.4.2. Pollen

Both full core records from Italy, Lago di Massaciuccoli and Lake Accesa, show the Bronze Age interval was the wettest of the Holocene (Figure 3(c)). The early Bronze Age was wetter than the late Bronze Age, with the trend towards...
decreasing water availability starting at both sites at 3.65 cal ka BP (Figure 3(d)).

4. Discussion

Previous research has attempted to relate events such as climatic shifts or earthquakes to societal fluctuations, often relying on spatially or temporally broad events that occur far from archaeological sites (Cullen et al. 2000; Arz et al. 2006; Drysdale et al. 2006; Drake 2012; Kaniewski et al. 2013; Cline 2014; Psomiadis et al. 2018). Recent reviews have suggested that in order to infer direct causation between a climatic shift and specific archaeological event, a precise correlation must be demonstrated at a single site (Kennedy 2016; Knapp and Manning 2016; Homsher and Cradic 2017; Riehl 2017; Jones et al. 2019). Therefore, the synthesis of palaeoclimate records will be compared with archaeological evidence from nearby sites, to assess the potential correlation of climate change with societal shifts and changes. The regional distribution of climate proxy and archaeological records and the nature of climatic/anthropogenic trends preceding and during the EBAC and LBAC intervals are displayed in Figure 4.

Within Figure 4, the magnitude of increased aridity is defined by the categorised (Figure 4), quantitative change in the x-axis scales from the respective graph in Figure 3 for any single, consistent shift in proxy data. Specifically, for isotope data that is a shift in standard deviation plotted as excursions from the site-specific mean, and for pollen data that is a shift in the principal component axis score. The duration and onset of each shift is variable, and defined in Figure 4 by the shade and the shape of the symbology, respectively.

The inclusion of societal ‘Abandonment Sites’ was achieved by reviewing the published archaeological literature discussing Bronze Age societal shifts, and regions are identified that are reported to have experienced destruction, abandonment, contraction or a mixture of these events at the transitions from the early to mid Bronze Age (ca. 4.00 ka BP) (Prag 1986; Whitelaw 2000; Kennedy 2016) and the late Bronze Age to the Iron Age (ca. 3.18–3.13 ka BP) (Wilson 1995; Nur and Cline 2000; Issar 2003; Valsecchi et al. 2006; Mercuri et al. 2006; Knapp and Manning 2016). In this primary archaeological literature, societal decline or abandonment is often inferred where there is a clear change in the sorts of artefacts and material culture being recovered or a complete cessation of such artefacts, a decrease in the number, size, or complexity of archaeological sites in a region at a specific moment in time, ash layers in the sedimentary record and signs of conflagration, an increase in the quantity of battle artefacts such as arrow heads, the construction of mass graves, an apparent decline in elite cultural markers such as expensively adorned burials and the construction or discontinued use of large religious structures and temples (Whitelaw 2000; Kaniewski et al. 2013; Kennedy 2016; Knapp and Manning 2016).

It is important to note that the archaeological chronologies used for making the following comparisons between our palaeoclimate dataset and societal shifts during the Bronze Age have not been examined, recalibrated, or manipulated in anyway during the review and resynthesis of the proxy datasets. In a similar fashion to accepting the previously established archaeological wisdom of where societies declined, contracted, or abandoned sites, here we are relying on the established and widely accepted floating chronologies and relative timescales utilised by the relevant archaeological literature when discussing specific sites and societies. While this is in contrast to the highly selective criteria for the inclusion of radiocarbon chronologies and the subsequent efforts to recalibrate and standardise those temporal datasets, it is the opinion of the authors that any attempt to re-establish or ‘refine’ the well researched and highly scrutinised archaeological interval boundaries would be well beyond the scope of this paper or our expertise. While in the discussion and Figure 4 of this publication we thought it important to use the local archaeological intervals and relative chronologies as stated in the literature for comparison with the resynthesized palaeoclimate dataset, it must be acknowledged that there is a serious limitation in the accuracy and reliability of directly comparing even well-dated climate proxy records to individual societal shifts inferred from specific archaeological horizons. This is because, in a field where the formation and understanding of temporal boundaries and societal shifts is constantly evolving, the revision of archaeological intervals is a commonplace occurrence. As such, it is the primary goal of this paper to provide a synthesis of the highest resolution palaeoclimate data with the highest resolution dating, compare as best we can these results with current archaeological understanding, and then allow future archaeological, and even palaeoclimate research, to use the dataset as a contextual record for their own findings. If, at any given site, there is any future alteration to the archaeological interval boundaries as they are currently defined, it will still be possible to compare such advancements to this contextual palaeoclimate dataset.

4.1. Northern Levant

4.1.1. Early Bronze Age

Archaeological sites at Ebla display two phases of destruction towards the end of the early Bronze Age dated to ca. 2300 BC (ca. 4.25 ka BP) and ca. 2000 BC (ca. 3.95 ka BP) (Fiorentino et al. 2008; Kennedy 2016), which follow increasingly arid conditions inferred from Ebla δ13C records. The nearby site of Ras Shamra also displays two phases of destruction at ca. 2400 and 2300 BC (ca. 4.35–4.25 ka BP and 4.15–4.05 ka BP) (Kennedy 2016), coincident with decreasing water availability (ca. 4.39–4.03 cal ka BP) inferred from pollen at Tell Sukas, 35 km south of Ras Shamra.

However, evidence for climate causation of societal ‘collapse’ is far from equivocal. Inter-site variability between proxy records and in the timing of societal shifts from archaeological records results in a complex picture, and some proxy records contradict archaeological evidence. For example, early Bronze Age settlement decline at Tell Fadoos-Kfarabida (ca. 2500–2000 BC; ca. 4.45–3.95 cal ka BP) (Genz 2017) occurs when crops nearby and isotopes at Jeita Cave
(≈30 km to the south) showed no signs of drought (Riehl 2017). Two further archaeological sites close to Jeita Cave (Byblos, 20 km north, and Sidon, 50 km south) suggest continued occupation during the early Bronze Age (Genz 2010, 2017), with sudden abandonment later at the early Bronze Age termination coincident with a thick (50–140 cm) fine-sand layer interpreted as a tsunami deposit (Kennedy 2016). Evidence for earthquakes in the early Bronze Age has also been found in archaeological excavations at Ebla (Pinnock 2009; Kennedy 2016) and Ras Shamra (Scheffer 1948; Schaeffer 1968; Nur and Cline 2000; Kennedy 2016). In addition, whilst there is evidence for abandonment of individual sites, multiple sites in the northern Levant show social continuity through the early and middle Bronze Age, including Tell Nebi Mend, Qatna, Tell Tuqan and Tell Afis (Kennedy 2016). Expansion of northern palace economies during the early Bronze Age (ca. 2500–2000 BC; ca. 4.45–3.95 cal ka BP) (Schloen 2017) also provides further evidence suggesting that in many locations, correlated climate change was not extreme enough to cause so-called societal ‘collapse’.

4.1.2. Late Bronze Age

There is evidence for increasing aridity preceding the LBAC at Jeita Cave, Tell Sukas and Tell Tweini, as well as archaeological evidence for subsequent societal destruction at ca. 3.15 cal ka BP from both tell sites (Knapp and Manning 2016). Previous interpretations were of destruction by fire (Kaniewski et al. 2011; Knapp and Manning 2016), but it is unclear whether settlements were destroyed by fire during an invasion (Kaniewski et al. 2011), or whether they were abandoned due to deteriorating climate and then subsequently burnt. The correlation with an abrupt increase in aridity at Jeita Cave following the more prolonged increasing aridity trend, may also have influenced the societal response (Riehl 2017). From 3.10 to 3.00 ka BP, the Assyrian Empire experienced crop failure, famines and repeated nomad incursions into built up settlements (Neumann and Parpola 1987).

4.2. Southern Levant

4.2.1. Early Bronze Age

Multiple southern Levant sites record increasing aridity preceding and during the early Bronze Age (Mount Sedom, Soreq Cave, Lake Kinneret, Dead Sea). Pollen evidence suggests water availability declined ca. 4.53–4.23 cal ka BP in the Dead Sea, and ca. 4.55–4.45 and ca. 4.33–4.23 cal ka BP at Lake Kinneret, concurrent with an interval of increasing aridity inferred from the Soreq Cave oxygen isotopes (4.50–4.25 cal ka BP). Subsequent intervals of increasing aridity are also suggested at 4.15–4.00 cal ka BP at Soreq Cave and 4.10–3.95 cal ka BP at Mount Sedom. During this interval of increasing aridity, there is widespread agreement that previously well-established early Bronze Age (ca. 2500–2000 BC; ca. 4.45–3.95 cal ka BP) walled-town structures in the southern Levant declined (Kennedy 2016; Genz 2017; Schloen 2017) and virtually all medium and large settlements were abandoned or greatly reduced in size (Harrison 2012).

Evidence for abandonment is recorded at multiple sites proximal to Lake Kinneret and the Dead Sea, including Tyre (~56 km northwest of Lake Kinneret), Sha’a ́r Har-Golan (~4 km south of Lake Kinneret), Jerico (~15 km northeast of the Dead Sea), Tell Iktanu (~7 km northeast of the Dead Sea), Khirbat Iskandar (~14 km east of the Dead Sea) and Bāb edh-Dhra’ (~11 km south of the Dead Sea) (Kennedy 2016; Genz 2017). More broadly, the northward shift to the southern boundary of inland urban centres between the early and middle Bronze Age has been suggested to represent a withdrawal from areas with lower annual rainfall (Finkelstein and Langgut 2014).

Compared to the north, the southern Levant features a more consistent spread of both societal abandonment and short (~≤150 year) increasingly arid climate shifts during the early Bronze Age (Figure 4). It is plausible that the duration of the climatic shifts was important in ultimately determining societal resilience and adaptability, with aridity events generally being of shorter duration in the southern Levant compared to the north. Where increasingly arid climatic events are longer and more gradual in their onset and escalation, such as during the early Bronze Age in the northern Levant (Figure 4), it has been proposed that elite classes responded to the slowly mounting crises by reorganizing their societal structures (Genz 2012; Harrison 2012; Höfimayer 2017a), whereas southern Levant early Bronze Age communities either attempted to sustain established strategies by opting for urban dissolution (Harrison 2012) or were simply unable to adapt (Rosen 1995) to the shorter, more rapid, increasing aridity (Figure 4).

4.2.2. Late Bronze Age

There is limited evidence for increasing aridity before, and at the onset of, the LBAC in the southern Levant. In fact, proxy records suggest increasing water availability at Ashdod Coast (3.45–3.25 cal ka BP from δ13C and 3.30–3.20 cal ka BP from δ18O), Soreq Cave (3.20–3.05 cal ka BP), Lake Kinneret (ca. 3.41–3.30 cal ka BP) and the Dead Sea (ca. 3.80–3.10 cal ka BP). Only at Ashdod Coast, does a shift towards increased aridity coincide with the LBAC interval, beginning around 3.25–3.20 cal ka BP. This overlaps with an interval of partial destruction between 1225 and 1175 BC (ca. 3.18–3.13 ka BP) at the nearby sites of Ashdod and Ashkelon (Nur and Cline 2000). However, collapsed buildings may provide evidence for seismic activity at this time, and therefore the correlation with increased aridity may be coincidental or of secondary importance (Drews 1993; Nur and Cline 2000). Whilst all presented proxy records satisfy the Pages 2k criteria overall, the late Bronze Age sections are not all of the same resolution. For example, the Dead Sea pollen record is limited due to sand bank deposition ca. 1400–1200 BC (ca. 3.35–3.15 ka BP) (Enzel et al. 2003; Bookman et al. 2004; Neumann et al. 2007; Langgut et al. 2014; Kagan et al. 2015), which hinders preservation of pollen.

In concordance with a lack of evidence for palaeoclimatic deterioration before and during the late Bronze Age, there is also archaeological evidence for settlement continuity. In the Negev and southern Trans-Jordan highlands, both bordering
the Dead Sea, more permanent archaeological settlements are observed from ca. 3.40 ka BP (Issar 2003). Agriculture also expanded around the central Negev between 1500 and 1000 BC (3.45–2.95 ka BP) into areas that today have rainfall below the 200 mm isohyet (Rosen 2017). To the northeast in Gilead, the number of archaeological sites also displays relative continuity, with 24 and 20 in the middle and late Bronze Age respectively (Finkelstein 1995). Furthermore, across the late Bronze Age–Iron Age transition, the Trans-Jordan, Gilead and Galilee mountains (bordering the Dead Sea and Lake Kinneret) underwent rapid and intensive settlement (Issar 2003), with evidence for late Bronze Age settlement decline or destruction being restricted only to sites in central Judea, the Trans-Jordan plateau (Finkelstein 1995), and west of the River Jordan (Knapp and Manning 2016) (Figure 4), where precise dating is uncertain (Cline 2014; Knapp and Manning 2016).

Unlike climate shifts in the northern Levant that were either relatively rapid (≤150 years), large magnitude, or featured an abrupt onset during the so-called ‘collapse’ interval, late Bronze Age climate records from the southern Levant reconstruct either no increasing aridity, longer duration (>250 year), or smaller magnitude shifts to aridity (Figure 4). Late Bronze Age settlement continuity in areas of the southern Levant and the more gradual transition into the middle Bronze Age observed there in the archaeological record (Kennedy 2016), may therefore reflect effective societal resilience aided by the absence of rapid changes in aridity at this time, as in the northern Levant during the EBAC. In summary, it appears there was not a widespread climate change event that acted as a primary driver for widespread societal transformation in the southern Levant during the late Bronze Age. Rather, localised or potentially adaptable long-term changes in aridity may have contributed to an increase in highland settlements in the more southerly regions and a southward shift to the agricultural exploitation boundary.

4.3. Anatolia and Southeast Europe

4.3.1. Early Bronze Age

Four climate reconstructions across Anatolia and Southeast Europe suggest no increase in aridity before or during the EBAC interval, while three more records suggest a long-term (>300 year) trend of increasing aridity beginning ≥150 years before the EBAC interval, and two final records suggest a shorter (151–200 year) trend of increasing aridity that began ≥150 years before the EBAC interval (Figure 4).

Around the eastern Anatolian Lake Van basin, there is pollen evidence for a prolonged interval of decreasing water availability 4.36–3.81 cal ka BP, as well as for reduced human occupation in archaeological excavations (Marro and Özfirat 2005). However, this decrease in water availability is not mirrored in the Lake Van oxygen isotope record. Similar inconsistencies exist between different proxy records and between sites throughout Anatolia and southeast Europe. The carbon isotope record from Skala Marion Cave suggests a 200-year interval of increasing aridity leading into the EBAC, but the oxygen isotope record from the same site and carbon-isotopes from Sofular Cave both suggest aridity did not increase before or during the EBAC interval. At this time, there is evidence for continued human occupation during the early Bronze Age at Thasos and Skala Sotiros, coastal sites 10 km from Skala Marion Cave (Papadopoulos and Malamidou 2008; Nerantzis et al. 2016).

Finally, oxygen isotopes from the southeast Aegean Sea initially indicate increasing aridity, however this trend reverses 100 years before the onset of the EBAC interval. On the island of Crete, located ~50 km southwest of this marine core, there is evidence for urbanisation towards the end of the early Bronze Age, before the number and complexity of sites expanded dramatically throughout the middle Bronze Age (Manning 1994; Whitelaw 2000). The correlation with less arid conditions experienced from ca. 4.30 cal ka BP, could have been a contributing factor to this interval of urbanisation.

In summary, archaeological and palaeoenvironmental records do not provide clear consensus of climate change impacts on early Bronze Age societies, although the relative lack of joint archaeological and high-resolution climate archives for this interval from this region limits discussion. It would appear however, that evidence is not found for widespread climate change in Anatolia and southeast Europe in the early Bronze Age, and there is evidence for societal continuity and even expansion at many sites. For Greece specifically, this conclusion supports similar findings in previous research reviews (Weiberg et al. 2016; Weiberg and Finné 2018).

4.3.2. Late Bronze Age

There is evidence for a stepped increase in aridity from Sofular Cave, northwestern Anatolia, from 3.30 to 3.00 cal ka BP. In archaeological records, the sites of Alaca Höyük and Hattuşa (~265 km from Sofular) and Maşat Höyük (~350 km from Sofular) feature destruction layers and at least temporary abandonment at the end of the late Bronze Age, though precise timing is not well-established (Knapp and Manning 2016). Furthermore, textual evidence from the Hittite Empire records severe dry years in the last decade preceding its disbandment at 3.13 ka BP (Akurgal 2015), while the Beyşehir Occupancy of southwestern Turkey is typically dated from ca. 3.00 ka BP (Eastwood et al. 1998) to 2.50 ka BP (Vermoere et al. 2002), the latter date coinciding with a change from arid to wetter conditions (Vermoere et al. 2002). While the timing of the observed increasing aridity trends may tempt suggestions of a climatic contribution to societal disruption, distances between Sofular Cave and the archaeological sites means any inferences would be highly tenuous. It is also not possible to rule out alternative causes of abandonment that have been suggested, including internal disruption (Knapp and Manning 2016) or external invasion (Bryce 2005).

Archaeological evidence from Lake Van suggests the late Bronze Age interval ended between 1300 and 1200 BC (3.25–3.15 ka BP) at this site following the continuation of a shift from lowland habitation to highland pastoralism that began in the middle Bronze Age (Marro and Özfirat 2005). Water availability inferences from the Lake Van pollen record
suggest broadly decreasing values ca. 3.46–2.91 cal ka BP, and carbon isotope and one oxygen isotope (14a) record indicates increasing aridity from at least 3.35 to 3.20 cal ka BP. However, a duplicate oxygen isotope record from the same site (14b) shows the opposite trend, providing no clear consensus on if or how aridity changed in the late Bronze Age and if this correlates with decreased lowland settlement. Likewise, at Lake Maliq, water availability only explains 12.5% of variance in the pollen record, leading to a fluctuating late Bronze Age record which cannot be used as evidence for clear palaeoclimatic change. At this time, abundant artefacts testify to continued societal occupation at Sovjan on the shore of Lake Maliq until the Iron Age (Fouache et al. 2001; Laffe 2004). Archaeological sites in the region of the Struma River valley to the north reveal a dramatic increase in the number of settlements throughout the region featuring an eastern Mediterranean influence from 3.35 to 3.15 ka BP (Marinova et al. 2012). This may suggest an influx of migrants from farther east (Marinova et al. 2012), to an area which records no increased aridity prior or during the LBAC.

In Greece and the Aegean Sea region, proxy records again do not provide clear consensus on palaeoclimatic conditions. In southern Greece, oxygen and carbon isotopes from Mavri Trypa suggest increasing aridity from 3.15 and 3.10 cal ka BP respectively. However, isotope records from Skala Marion Cave and the Aegean Sea do not show the same clear aridity trends. Whilst there is a small shift inferred from oxygen isotopes at Skala Marion towards increasing aridity immediately preceding the LBAC interval (3.30–3.20 cal ka BP), this is much smaller than preceding isotopic shifts that do not correlate with known societal declines. During this interval of inconsistent palaeoclimatic evidence, there is much clearer evidence for a regional societal shift in the archaeological record, with societal destruction across Crete at the end of the late Minoan interval, 1315 and 1190 BC (ca. 3.27–3.14 ka BP) (Manning 1994; Drake 2012). Reasons for this disparity suggest either a non-climatic cause for societal changes (Weiberg et al. 2016; Weiberg and Finné 2018) or a sub-decadal climate trigger (Carpenter 1966; Bryson et al. 1974; Weiss 1982) which is not resolvable in current proxy records that highlights the need for a high resolution terrestrial palaeoclimate record from Crete, rather than a marine core.

4.4. Italy

4.4.1. Early Bronze Age

We infer short duration increasing aridity trends from oxygen isotopes in Corchia Cave preceding the EBAC and the Adriatic Sea during the EBAC, but carbon isotopes from Corchia Cave, and oxygen and carbon isotope records from all other Italian sites, do not suggest clear continuous shifts towards aridity before/during the EBAC interval. At Lago di Massaciuccoli, a rapid increase in water availability is inferred from 150 years before the EBAC onset, following a decline 4.55–4.31 cal ka BP. By contrast, less than 100 km south, a far higher resolution pollen record from Lake Accesa suggests continuously increasing water availability leading up to the EBAC (4.53–4.15 cal ka BP). Therefore, any patterns of palaeoclimate change appear to be highly site-specific. This conclusion is consistent with a recent review of pollen datasets, which does not report any significant vegetation change in response to the 4.20 ka BP climatic event at Italian sites between 43° and 45°N (Di Rita and Magri 2019). Of greater significance in the early Bronze Age is that archaeological evidence suggests sedentary human occupation of central and southern Italy did not occur until around 1600 BC (ca. 3.55 ka BP) (Bernabò Brea et al. 1997; Mercuri et al. 2006), Stationary open-air sites (as opposed to cave dwellings) were rare during the early Bronze Age (Attema et al. 2010), and permanent dwellings were located only near Lake Garda (De Marinis 1999; De Marinis 2009) and on Sicily (Leonard 1980; Castellana 1987; McConnell 1992) at this time.

4.4.2. Late Bronze Age

Isotope records from Corchia and Renella Caves suggest increasing aridity leading up to 3.20–3.15 cal ka BP. This trend is shorter in duration at Renella Cave (≤150 years) than Corchia Cave (>300 years). Water availability reconstructed from pollen at Lago di Massaciuccoli and Lake Accesa (~30 and ~125 km south of the caves respectively) also declines from around 3.63 cal ka BP. Archaeological evidence suggests the Terramare culture from this region expanded during the middle and late Bronze Age between ca. 1600 and 1175 BC (ca. 3.55–3.13 ka BP) (Bernabò Brea et al. 1997; De Marinis 1999), before many central Po Valley villages were abandoned at the end of the late Bronze Age (ca. 1175 BC; 3.13 ka BP), bringing an end to the Terramare civilisation (Bernabò Brea et al. 1997; Mercuri et al. 2006; Mercuri et al. 2012; Cremaschi et al. 2016). It has been observed that a clear drop in the water table occurred in the water management systems (wells and interconnecting ditches) at the Terramara di Santa Rosa of the Po Plain coincident with a short decrease in aquatic plants (Mercuri et al. 2012). Whereas the general trend towards increasing aridity recorded at Corchia Cave and in the lake cores corroborate previous suggestions that a prolonged climatic deterioration may have contributed to the decline of the Terramare civilisation (Bernabò Brea et al. 1997; Mercuri et al. 2006; Cremaschi et al. 2016), the fact that societal decline closely follows the abrupt aridity shift reconstructed from Renella Cave suggests that a more rapid and intense aridity event may have ultimately triggered the societal response. This conclusion would support the suggestion of a pronounced dry peak coincident with the Terramare societal decline described in (Cremaschi et al. 2016). The Terramara di Montale pollen record strongly suggests local over-exploitation may have amplified the effects of the water crisis (Mercuri et al. 2012), however potential causes driving this over-exploitation are not discussed in the paper. The lack of significant climate change in the Gulf of Gaeta record correlates with recent pollen evidence potentially suggesting continued landscape management and exploitation from 3.40 to 3.00 cal ka BP (Di Rita et al. 2018).

4.3. Eastern Mediterranean

We infer short duration increasing aridity trends from oxygen and carbon isotope records in Corchia Cave (McConnell 1992) and the Adriatic Sea during the EBAC, but carbon isotope records from Corchia Cave suggest that a more rapid and intense aridity event may have ultimately triggered the societal response. This conclusion is consistent with a recent review of pollen datasets, which does not report any significant vegetation change in response to the 4.20 ka BP climatic event at Italian sites between 43° and 45°N (Di Rita and Magri 2019). Of greater significance in the early Bronze Age is that archaeological evidence suggests sedentary human occupation of central and southern Italy did not occur until around 1600 BC (ca. 3.55 ka BP) (Bernabò Brea et al. 1997; Mercuri et al. 2006). Stationary open-air sites (as opposed to cave dwellings) were rare during the early Bronze Age (Attema et al. 2010), and permanent dwellings were located only near Lake Garda (De Marinis 1999; De Marinis 2009) and on Sicily (Leonard 1980; Castellana 1987; McConnell 1992) at this time.

4.4.2. Late Bronze Age

Isotope records from Corchia and Renella Caves suggest increasing aridity leading up to 3.20–3.15 cal ka BP. This trend is shorter in duration at Renella Cave (≤150 years) than Corchia Cave (>300 years). Water availability reconstructed from pollen at Lago di Massaciuccoli and Lake Accesa (~30 and ~125 km south of the caves respectively) also declines from around 3.63 cal ka BP. Archaeological evidence suggests the Terramare culture from this region expanded during the middle and late Bronze Age between ca. 1600 and 1175 BC (ca. 3.55–3.13 ka BP) (Bernabò Brea et al. 1997; De Marinis 1999), before many central Po Valley villages were abandoned at the end of the late Bronze Age (ca. 1175 BC; 3.13 ka BP), bringing an end to the Terramare civilisation (Bernabò Brea et al. 1997; Mercuri et al. 2006; Mercuri et al. 2012; Cremaschi et al. 2016). It has been observed that a clear drop in the water table occurred in the water management systems (wells and interconnecting ditches) at the Terramara di Santa Rosa of the Po Plain coincident with a short decrease in aquatic plants (Mercuri et al. 2012). Whereas the general trend towards increasing aridity recorded at Corchia Cave and in the lake cores corroborate previous suggestions that a prolonged climatic deterioration may have contributed to the decline of the Terramare civilisation (Bernabò Brea et al. 1997; Mercuri et al. 2006; Cremaschi et al. 2016), the fact that societal decline closely follows the abrupt aridity shift reconstructed from Renella Cave suggests that a more rapid and intense aridity event may have ultimately triggered the societal response. This conclusion would support the suggestion of a pronounced dry peak coincident with the Terramare societal decline described in (Cremaschi et al. 2016). The Terramara di Montale pollen record strongly suggests local over-exploitation may have amplified the effects of the water crisis (Mercuri et al. 2012), however potential causes driving this over-exploitation are not discussed in the paper. The lack of significant climate change in the Gulf of Gaeta record correlates with recent pollen evidence potentially suggesting continued landscape management and exploitation from 3.40 to 3.00 cal ka BP (Di Rita et al. 2018).
5. Conclusions

5.1. Early Bronze Age

- Levant: variability in northern Levantine palaeoclimate records and evidence for impacts of seismic hazards in archaeological records prevent correlation between climate change and so-called societal ‘collapse’ in this region in the early Bronze Age and emphasises the need for contextual site-by-site evaluations (Holmgren et al. 2016; Riehl 2017). By contrast, in the southern Levant there is a more ubiquitous spread of both societal ‘collapse’ sites and concurrent short (<150 year) periods of increasingly arid climate conditions, which may suggest a more causal link between climatic and societal change.
- Anatolia and Southeast Europe: there is neither consistent evidence for widespread climate change, nor evidence of concurrent societal ‘collapse’ from archaeological sites.
- Italy: palaeoclimate records are highly site-specific, and only one record reveals a change in aridity that occurs in the EBAC interval. Societies on mainland Italy were mainly nomadic throughout the early Bronze Age, and therefore archaeological remains are infrequent.

5.2. Late Bronze Age

- Levant: northern Levantine sites of so-called societal ‘collapse’ may correlate to aridity changes, which are often rapid (<150 years), large magnitude, and/or onset during the ‘collapse’ interval. However, inconsistent palaeoclimate and archaeological evidence from southern Levant prevents this correlation being established for the entire Levantine region.
- Anatolia and Southeast Europe: proxy records provide no clear consensus on regional palaeoclimate, suggesting observed societal changes are either not climate-related or proxy records are of insufficient resolution to resolve a climate trigger.
- Italy: as the climate became increasingly arid in the northernmost regions, a congruent societal ‘collapse’ in these regions may have been triggered by an intense aridity event. Middle and southern Italian sites do not record significant increases in aridity or evidence of decreased agricultural activity in pollen-derived archaeo-demographic records.

Overall, this synthesis of palaeoclimate records, focussing on those with the highest temporal and sampling resolutions, does not support the over-simplified hypothesis that climate change and increased aridity across the entire Eastern Mediterranean were the sole cause for either the EBAC or LBAC events. Instead, the results present a more nuanced view; aridity does not always correlate with so-called societal ‘collapse’ and vice versa. It is likely that societal resilience to climate change, the severity and speed of any change, how this translated to local level water availability and how widely these climate effects influenced their trade/social network, combined to create complexity in archaeological records of societal change. This synthesis clearly demonstrates a need for more high-resolution multi-proxy records, proximal to archaeological sites for providing societal response context, in order to better understand the role, if any, of climate change in the dynamics of eastern Mediterranean Bronze Age societies.

Acknowledgements

We thank Philippe Sorrel and Andrea Miebach for generously providing us with their original data.

Disclosure statement

The authors declare no competing interests.

Funding

This work was supported by the Northumbria University Researcher Development Fund and the Council for British Research in the Levant (Team-based Fieldwork Research Award).

ORCID

Calian J. Hazell http://orcid.org/0000-0002-9310-6087
Matthew J. Pound http://orcid.org/0000-0001-8029-9548
Emma P. Hocking http://orcid.org/0000-0002-8925-1695

References

Akurgal E. 2015. Ancient civilizations and ruins of Turkey. 8th ed. Philadelphia, Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press.
Allen M, Scaife R, Manning A, Edwards R. 2009. The development and vegetation history of the Akrotiri salt lake, Cyprus. Quaternary Newsletter. 119:1–16.
Alpert P, Jacobet S, Fernandez J, Gonzalez-Rouco F, Garcia-Herrera R, Rodo X, Brunetti M, Nanni T, Mauger T, Turkes M, et al. 2006. Relations between variability in the Mediterranean region and Middle-latitude variability. In: Lionello P, Malanotte-Rizzoli P, Boscolo R, editors. The Mediterranean climate: an overview of the main characteristics and issues. Amsterdam: Elsevier.
Arikan B, Restelli F, Masi A. 2016. Comparative modeling of Bronze Age land use in the Malatya Plain (Turkey). Quaternary Science Reviews. 136:122–133.
Arz H, Lamy F, Pätzold J. 2006. A pronounced dry event recorded around 4.2 ka in brine sediments from the northern Red Sea. Quaternary Research. 66(3):432–441.
Attema P, Burgers G, van Leusen P. 2010. Regional pathways to complexity: settlement and land-use dynamics in early Italy from the Bronze Age to the Republican period. Moormann E, Attema P, Roymans N, Theuws F, editors. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press; p. 1–248.
Baıoumy H, Kayanne H, Tada R. 2010. Reconstruction of lake-level and climate changes in Lake Qarun, Egypt, during the last 7000 years. Journal of Great Lakes Research. 36(2):318–327.
Bar-Matthews M, Ayalon A. 2011. Mid-Holocene climate variations revealed by high-resolution speleothem records from Soreq Cave, Israel and their correlation with cultural changes. The Holocene. 21(1): 163–171. http://apps.webofknowledge.com/full_record.do?product=UA&search_mode=GeneralSearch&sid=1&idend=T1yoyOToVRXZDwY6U&site=3&doc=8.
Bar-Matthews M, Ayalon A, Kaufman A. 1998. Middle to Late Holocene (6,500 yr. period) paleoclimate in the Eastern Mediterranean region from stable isotopic composition of speleothems from Soreq Cave, Israel. In: Issar A, Brown N, editors. Water, environment and society in

C. J. HAZELL ET AL.
Eastwood W, Roberts N, Lamb H. 1998. Palaeoecological and archaeological evidence for human occupation in Southwest Turkey: the Beşeyşeh occupation phase. Anatolian Studies. 48:69–86.

Enzel Y, Bookman R, Sharon D, Gvirtzman H, Dayan U, Ziv B, Stein M. 2003. Late Holocene climates of the Near East deduced from Dead Sea level variations and modern regional winter rainfall. Quaternary Research. 60(3):263–273.

Fall P. 2012. Modern vegetation, pollen and climate relationships on the Mediterranean island of Cyprus. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 185:79–92.

Ferrio J, Resco V, Williams D, Serrano L, Voltas J. 2005. Stable isotopes in arid and semi-arid forest systems. Investigación Agraria: Sistemas y Recursos Forestales. 14(3):371–382.

Finkelstein I. 1995. The great transformation: the second millennium B.C. in the coastal plain of Lebanon: continuity or break? In: Levy T, editor. The archaeology of the ancient Near East. Vol. I. New Jersey: Wiley-Blackwell; p. 629–646.

Finn K, Andrieu-Ponel V, Medail F, Marriner N, Peyron O, Montade V, Frumkin A. 2009. Stable isotopes of a subfossil Tamarix tree from the Dead Sea region, Israel, and their implications for the Intermediate Bronze Age to Early Iron Age transition in the Near East. Chronology, C14 and climate change. Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago; p. 1–28.

Garlan C, Ioakim C, Lykousis V, Tsaila-Monopolis S, Mylona G. 2010. The Northern Levant. In: Potts D, editor. A companion to the archaeology of the ancient Near East. Vol. I. New Jersey: Wiley-Blackwell; p. 349–365.

Geraga M, Ioakim C, Lykousis V, Tsaila-Monopolis S, Mylona G. 2010. The Northern Levant. In: Potts D, editor. A companion to the archaeology of the ancient Near East. Vol. I. New Jersey: Wiley-Blackwell; p. 349–365.

Hammer Ø, Harper D, Ryan P. 2001. PAST: paleontological statistics software package for education and data analysis. Palaeoenvironmental Electonica. 41(1):9.

Harrison T. 2012. The Southern Levant. In: Potts D, editor. A companion to the archaeology of the ancient Near East. Vol. I. New Jersey: Wiley-Blackwell; p. 629–646.

Hammer Ø, Harper D, Ryan P. 2001. PAST: paleontological statistics software package for education and data analysis. Palaeoenvironmental Electonica. 41(1):9.

Hawkins J. 1974. Assyrians and Hittites. Iraq. 36(1)/2:67–83.

Höf Mayer F. 2017a. The late third millennium B.C. in the ancient Near East and Eastern Mediterranean: a time of collapse and transformation. In: Höf Mayer F, editor. The late third millennium in the ancient Near East. Chronology, C14 and climate change. Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago; p. 1–28.

Höf Mayer F, editor. 2017b. The late third millennium in the ancient Near East. Chronology, C14 and climate change. Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago.

Hofmayer F. 2017a. The late third millennium B.C. in the Ancient Near East and Eastern Mediterranean: a time of collapse and transformation. In: Hofmayer F, editor. The late third millennium in the Ancient Near East. Chronology, C14 and climate change. Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago.

Holmgren K, Gogou A, Izdebski A, Luterbacher J, Sicre M, Xoplaki E. 2016. Mediterranean Holocene climate, environment and human societies. Quaternary Science Reviews. 136:1–4.

Homrner R, Crudic M. 2017. The Amorite Problem: resolving an historical dilemma. Levant. 49(3):259–283.

Hughes J. 2014. Environmental problems of the Greeks and Romans. ecology in the ancient Mediterranean. 2nd ed. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Izdebski A, Holmgren K, Weberg E, Stocker SR, Büntgen U, Florenzano A, Gogou A, Leroy SAG, Luterbacher J, Mörhange C, Bretschneider J, Jans G, Morhange C, Cheddadi R, Fischer P, Otto T, Leuenberger M, Fankhauser S, Cheng H, Edwards R, Leuenberger M, Fankhauser S, Tuyuz I, Kramers J. 2011. Climate on the southeastern Black Sea coast during the Late Holocene: implications from the Sofular Cave record. Quaternary Science Reviews. 30(19–20): 2433–2445.

Kaniewski D, Kaniowski D. 2015. The Mediterranean basin and Southern Europe in a warmer world: what can we learn from the past? Frontiers in Earth Science. 3(20):1–16.

Kaniewski D, Marriner N, Bretschneider J, Jans G, Morhange C, Cheddadi R, Otto T, Luce F, Van Campo E. 2019. 300-year drought frames Late Bronze Age to Early Iron Age transition in the Near East: new palaeoecological data from Cyprus and Syria. Regional Environmental Change. 19(8):2287–2297.

Kaniewski D, Marriner N, Bretschneider J, Jans G, Morhange C, Cheddadi R, Otto T, Luce F, Van Campo E. 2020. Climate change and social unrest: a 6,000-year chronicle from the Eastern Mediterranean. Geophysical Research Letters. 47(7):1–10.

Kaniewski D, Paulissen E, Van Campo E, Al-Maqdisi M, Bretschneider J, Van Lerberghe K. 2008. Middle East coastal ecosystem response to
middle-to-late Holocene abrupt climate changes. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America. 105(37):13941–13946. http://www.pnas.org/content/105/37/13941.full.pdf+html

Kaniewski D, Paulissen E, Van Campo E, Weiss H, Otto T, Bretschneider J, Van Lerberghe K. 2010. Late second-early first millennium BC abrupt climate changes in coastal Syria and their possible significance for the history of the Eastern Mediterranean. Quaternary Research. 74(2): 207–215.

Kaniewski D, Van Campo E. 2017. The 3.2 kyr BP event and the Late Bronze Age crisis, a climate-induced spiral of decline. In: Weiss H, editor. Megadrought and collapse: from Early agriculture to Angkor. Oxford: Oxford University Press. p. 161–182.

Kaniewski D, Van Campo E, Guiot J, Le Burel S, Otto T, Baeteman C. 2013. Environmental roots of the Late Bronze Age crisis. PLoS One. 8(8):e71004.

Kaniewski D, Van Campo E, Van Lerberghe K, Boit Y, Vansteynhyse K, Jans G, Nys K, Weiss H, Morhange C, Otto T, et al. 2011. The Sea Peoples, from cuneiform tablets to carbon dating. PLoS One. 6(6): e20232.

Katsaroulis C, Norström E, Smithenberg R, Finne M, Weiberg I, Hättestrand M, Arramidis P, Wastegård S. 2019. Climate changes in the Eastern Mediterranean over the last 5000 years and their links to the high-latitude atmospheric patterns and Asian monsoons. Global and Planetary Change. 175:36–51.

Kennedy M. 2016. The end of the 3rd millennium BC in the Levant: new perspectives and old ideas. Levant. 48(1):1–32.

Knapp A. 2011. The archaeology of Late Bronze Age Cypriot Society: the study of settlement, survey and landscape. In: Knapp A, editor. The archaeology of Late Bronze Age Cypriot Society: the study of settlement, survey and landscape; Occasional Paper Series No. 4. Glasgow: Department of Archaeology, University of Glasgow.

Knapp A. 2013. The archaeology of Cyprus: from earliest prehistory through the Bronze Age. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Knapp A, Manning S. 2016. Crisis in context: the end of the Late Bronze Age in the Eastern Mediterranean. American Journal of Archaeology. 120(1):99–149.

Lafe O. 2004. Archaeology in Albania, 2000–2004. Archaeological Reports.

Langgut D, Adams M, Finkelstein I. 2016. Climate, settlement patterns and olive horticulture in the southern Levant during the Early Bronze and Intermediate Bronze Ages (c. 3600 – 1950 BC). Levant. 48(2): 117–134.

Lalonde R, Finkelstein I, Litt T. 2013. Climate and the Late Bronze collapse: new evidence from the Southern Levant. Tel Aviv. 40(2): 149–175.

Langgut D, Finkelstein I, Litt T, Neumann F, Stein M. 2015. Vegetation and climate changes during the Bronze and Iron Ages (~3600 – 600 BCE) in the Southern Levant based on palynological records. Radiocarbon. 57(2):217–235.

Langgut D, Neumann F, Stein M, Wagner A, Kagan E, Boaretto E, Finkelstein I. 2014. Dead Sea pollen record and history of human activity in the Judean highlands (Israel) from the Intermediate Bronze into the Iron Ages (~2500–500 BCE). Palynology. 38(2):280–302. http://uqsummon.serialsolutions.com:20/2.0/link/0/eLVHCXMwnV3TNtwbELYQEHkCqQFlrNksXvNI47a+Rf37blymnKObMepkCFyXZyDPAfwMwnwDwMvJ...YasVrptT3k4MTJMsK5yzgey4xYmejN2TuzYHmrV2InK5VGvPki2urBG-GycLClU7xf65sEBRksSSvqLaCNKjJnFj1bJ1383De0UdBqGrCoist-mZMGJ5eFLH9eDRO.

Lauritzen S, Lundberg J. 1999. Speleothems and climate: a special issue of The Holocene. The Holocene. 9(6):643–647.

Leonard A. 1980. A Bronze Age settlement on Monte Castellazzo, Sicily. Annu Museum Art Archaeol (University Missouri-Columbia). 14: 19–23.

Lionello P, editor. 2012. The climate of the Mediterranean region: from the past to the future. Amsterdam: Elsevier.

Lirer F, Sprovieri M, Ferraro L, Vallefuco M, Capotondi L, Cassella A, Petrosino P, Insinga DD, Pelosi N, Tamburino S, et al. 2013. Integrated stratigraphy for the Late Quaternary in the eastern Tyrhenian Sea. Quaternary International. 292:71–85.

Lirer F, Sprovieri M, Vallefuco M, Ferraro L, Pelosi N, Giordano L, Capotondi L. 2014. Planktonic foraminifera as bio-indicators for monitoring the climatic changes that have occurred over the past 2000 years in the southeastern Tyrhenian Sea. Integrative Zoology. 9(4): 542–554.

Litt T, Ohlwein C, Neumann F, Hense A, Stein M. 2012. Holocene climate variability in the Levant from the Dead Sea pollen record. Quaternary Science Reviews. 49:95–105.

Litt T, Schöbel C, Kühl N, Brauer A. 2009. Vegetation and climate history in the Westefiel Volcanic Field (Germany) during the past 11 000 years based on annually laminated lacustrine maar sediments. Boreas. 38(4):679–690.

Liverani M. 1987. The collapse of the Near Eastern regional system at the end of the Bronze Age: the case of Syria. In: Rowlands M, Larsen MT, Kristiansen K, editors. Centre and periphery in the ancient world. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press; p. 66–73.

López-Moreno J, Vicente-Serrano S, Morán-Tejeda E, Lorenzo-Lacruz J, Kenawy A, Beniston M, Instituto A. 2011. Effects of the North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) on combined temperature and precipitation winter modes in the Mediterranean mountains: observed relationships and projections for the 21st century. Global and Planetary Change. 77(1-2):62–76.

Margaritelli G, de Beaujoule J, Drescher-Schneider R, Vannière B, Walter-Simonnet A, Miras Y, Millot L, Bossuet G, Peyron O, Brugiapaglia E, et al. 2007. Holocene climate changes in the central Mediterranean as recorded by lake-level fluctuations at Lake Accesa (Tuscany, Italy). Quaternary Science Reviews. 26(13-14):1736–1758.

Magny M, Miramont C, Sivan O. 2002. Assessment of the impact of climate and anthropogenic factors on Holocene Mediterranean vegetation in Europe on the basis of palaeohydrological records. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology. 186(1-2):47–59.

Manning S. 1994. The emergence of divergence: development and decline of the Mediterranean Bronze Age Crete and the Cyclades. In: Mathers C, Stoddart S, editors. Development and decline in the Mediterranean Bronze Age. Sheffield archaeological monographs 8. Sheffield: J.R. Collins Publications; p. 221–270.

Maran J. 2009. The crisis years? Reflections on signs of instability in the last decades of the Mycenaean Palaces. Scienze dell’Antichità. 15: 241–262.

Margaritelli G, Vallefuco M, Di Rita F, Capotondi L, Bellucci L, Insinga DD, Petrosino P, Bonomo S, Cacho I, Cassella A, et al. 2016. Marine response to climate changes during the last five millennia in the central Mediterranean. Global and Planetary Change. 142:53–72.

Marina E, Tonkov S, Bozilova E, Vajsov I. 2012. Holocene anthropogenic landscapes in the Balkans: the palaeobotanical evidence from southwestern Bulgaria. Vegetation History and Archaeobotany. 21(4-5):413–427.

Marco Ç, Özfırat A. 2005. Pre-classical survey in Eastern Turkey, third preliminary report: Dogubayazıt and the eastern shore of Lake Van. Anatolia Antiqua. 13(1):319–356. http://www.persee.fr/web/revues/home/prescript/article/anata_1018-1946_2005_num_13_1_1053.

Mauri A, Davis B, Collins P, Kaplan J. 2015. The climate of Europe during the Holocene: a gridded pollen-based reconstruction and its multi-proxy evaluation. Quaternary Science Reviews. 112:109–127.

Mayewski P, Meeker L, Twickler M, Lyons W, Prentice M, Kaplan J, Meeker L, Holmgren K, et al. 2004. Major features and forcing of high latitude northern hemisphere atmospheric circulation using a 110,000 year long glaciochemical series. Journal of Geophysical Research. 102:D45–366.

Mayewski P, Rohling E, Stager J, Karlén W, Maasch K, Meeker L, Meyerson E, Gasse F, van Kreveld S, Holmgren K, et al. 2004. Holocene climate variability. Quaternary Research. 62(3):243–255.

Mazzini I, Gliozzi E, Galaty M, Bejko L, Sadori L, Soulé-Marsché I, Koči R, Van Welden A, Bushati S. 2016. Holocene evolution of Lake Shkodra: multidisciplinary evidence for diachronic landscape change in northern Albania. Quaternary Science Reviews. 136:85–95.
Rohling E, Marino G, Grant K, Mayewski P, Wening W. 2019. A model for archaeologically relevant Holocene climate impacts in the Aegean-Levantine region (easternmost Mediterranean). Quaternary Science Reviews. 208:38–53.

Rohling E, Mayewski P, Abu-Zied R, Casford J, Hayes A. 2002. Holocene atmosphere-ocean interactions: records from Greenland and the Aegean Sea. Climate Dynamics. 18(7):587–594.

Rosen A. 1995. The social response to environmental change in Early Bronze Age Canaan. Journal of Anthropological Archaeology. 14(1): 26–44.

Rosen A. 2007. Civilising climate. Social responses to climate change in the Ancient Near East. Rossignol-Strick M, editor. Maryland: Altamira Press.

Rosen S. 2017. Basic instabilities? Climate and culture in the Negev over the long term. Geoarchaeology. 32(1):6–22.

Ruan J, Kherbouche F, Genty D, Blamart D, Cheng H, Dewilde F, Hachi S, Edwards R, Régnier E, Michelot J. 2016. Evidence of a prolonged drought ca. 4200 yrBP correlated with prehistoric settlement abandonment from the Gueldaman GLD1 Cave, Northern Algeria. Climate of the Past. 12(1):1–4.

Russell JM, Johnson TC. 2005. A high-resolution geochemical record from Lake Edward, Uganda Congo and the timing and causes of tropical African drought during the late Holocene. Quaternary Science Reviews. 24(12-13):1375–1389.

Russell JM, Johnson TC, Keils KR, Laerdal T, Talbot MR. 2003. An 11 000-year lithostratigraphic and paleohydrologic record from Equatorial Africa: Lake Edward, Uganda-Congo. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology. 193(1):25–49.

Russell JM, Talbot MR, Haskell BJ. 2003. Mid-holocene climate change in Lake Bosumtwi, Ghana. Quaternary Research. 60(2):133–141.

Sadari L, Ortu E, Peyron O, Zanchetta G, Vannière B, Desmet M, Magny M. 2013. The last 7 millennia of vegetation and climate changes at Lago di Pergusa (central Sicily, Italy). Climate of the Past. 9(4):1969–1984.

Sandars N. 1987. The Sea Peoples: warriors of the ancient Mediterranean, 1250-1150 BC. London: Thames and Hudson.

Schafer C. 1948. Stratigraphie Comparee et Chronologie de l’Asie Occidentale (Il Inde et LIndi): Syrie, Palestine, Asie Mineure, Chypre. Perse et Caucase. London: Oxford University Press.

Schafer C. 1968. Commentaires sur les lettres et documents trouvés dans les bibliothèques privées d’Ugarit. Ugaritica. 5:607–768.

Schiebel V, Litt T. 2017. Economic and political implications of raising the date for the disappearance of walled towns in the Early Bronze Age Southern Levant. In: Höffmayer F, editor. The late third millennium in the Ancient Near East. Chronology, C14 and climate change. Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago; p. 59–71.

Schmidt B, Ayalon A, Bar-Matthews M, Kagan E, Almogi-Labin A. 2002. Sea-land paleoclimatic correlation in the Eastern Mediterranean region during the late Holocene. Israel Journal of Earth Sciences. 51(3-4):181–190.

Schilman B, Bar-Matthews M, Almogi-Labin A. 2001. Global climate instability reflected by Eastern Mediterranean marine records during the late Holocene. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology. 176:151–176.

Schloen J. 2017. Economic and political implications of raising the date for the disappearance of walled towns in the Early Bronze Age Southern Levant. In: Höffmayer F, editor. The late third millennium in the Ancient Near East. Chronology, C14 and climate change. Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago; p. 59–71.

Schwartz G, Curvers H, Gerritsen F, MacCormack J, Miller N, Weber J. 2000. Excavation and survey in the Jabbul Plain, Western Syria: the Umm el-Marra project 1996-1997. American Journal of Archaeology. 104(3):419–462.

Shi G. 1993. Multivariate data analysis in palaeoecology and palaeobiography—a review. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology. 105(3-4):199–234.

Şimşek F, Çağatay M. 2018. Late Holocene high resolution multi-proxy climate and environmental records from Lake Van, eastern Turkey. Quaternary International. 486:57–72.

Singh I. 1999. A political history of Ugarit. In: Watson W, Wyatt N, editors. Handbook of Ugaritic studies. Leiden: Erste Abteilung; p. 603–733.

Sorrel P, Mathis M. 2016. Mid- to late-Holocene coastal vegetation patterns in Northern Levant (Tell Sukas, Syria): olive tree cultivation history and climatic change. The Holocene. 26(6):858–873.

Strother S, Salzmann U, Roberts S, Hodgson D, Woodward J, Van Nieuenhuyze W, Verleyen E, Vyverman W, Moreton S. 2015. Changes in Holocene climate and the intensity of Southern Hemisphere Westerly Winds based on a high-resolution palynological record from sub-Antarctic South Georgia. The Holocene. 25(2):263–279.

Stubbins F. 1975. CHAPTER XXVII — the recession of Mycenean civilization. In: Edwards I, Gadd C, Hammond N, Sollberger E, editors. The Cambridge ancient history. The Middle East and the Aegean Region, c. 1380–1000 BC. Vol. 2. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Stuiver M, Braziunas T. 1993. Modeling atmospheric 14C influences and 14C ages of marine samples to 10,000 BC [Database].

Tarasov P, Cheddadi R, Guiot J, Bottema S, Peyron O, Belmonte J, Ruiz-Sanchez V, Saadi F, Brewer S. 1998. A method to determine warm and cool steppe biomes from pollen data; application to the Mediterranean and Kazakhstani regions. Journal of Quaternary Science. 13(4):335–344.

Triantaphyllou MV, Gogou A, Bouloubassi I, Dimiza M, Kouri K, Roussakis G, Kothhoff U, Emeis K-C, Papanikolau M, Athanasiou M, et al. 2014. Evidence for a warm and humid Mid-Holocene episode in the Aegean and northern Levantine Seas (Greece, NE Mediterranean). Regional Environmental Change. 14(5):1697–1712.

Valsecchi V, Tinner W, Finsinger W, Ammann B. 2006. Human impact during the Bronze Age on the vegetation at Lago Lucone (northern Italy). Vegetation History and Archaeobotany. 15(4):99–113.

Van Campo E, Gasse F. 1993. Pollen- and diatom-inferred climatic and hydrological changes in Sumxi Co Basin (Western Tibet) since 13,000 yr BP. Quaternary Research. 39(3):300–313.

Vannière B, Power M, Roberts N, Tinner W, Carrion J, Magny M, Bartlekin P, Colombovalo D, Daniau A, Finsinger W, et al. 2011. Circum-Mediterranean fire activity and climate changes during the mid-Holocene environmental transition (8500-2500 cal. BP). The Holocene. 21(1):53–73.

Verheyden S, Nader F, Cheng H, Edwards L, Swennen R. 2008. Paleoclimate reconstruction in the Levant region from the geochemistry of a Holocene stalagmite from the Jeita cave, Lebanon. Quaternary Research. 70(3):368–381.

Vermorel M, Bottema S, Vanhecke L, Waelskens M, Paulissen E, Smets M. 2002. Palynological evidence for late-Holocene human occupation recorded in two wetlands in SW Turkey. The Holocene. 12(5):569–584.

Wanner H, Beer J, Butikofer J, Crowley T, Cubasch U, Fluckiger J, Goosse H, Grosjean M, Joos F, Kaplan J, et al. 2008. Mid- to Late Holocene climate change: an overview. Quaternary Science Reviews. 27(19-20):1791–1828.

Weißberg E, Fenné M. 2018. Resilience and persistence of ancient societies in the face of climate change: a case study from Late Bronze Age Peloponnesse. World Archaeol. 50(4):584–602.

Weißberg E, Unkel I, Kouri K, Holmgren K, Avramidis P, Bonnier A, Dibble B, Fenné M, Izdebski A, Katrantsiotis C, et al. 2016. The socio-environmental history of the Peloponnese during the Holocene: towards an integrated understanding of the past. Quaternary Science Reviews. 134:60–65.

Weiss B. 1982. The decline of Late Bronze Age civilization as a possible response to climatic change. Climatic Change. 4(2):173–198.

Weiss H. 1997. Late third millennium abrupt climate change and social collapse in West Asia and Egypt. In: Dalfes H, Kukla G, Weiss H, editors. Third millennium BC climate change and old world collapse. New York City: Springer; p. 711–723.

Weiss H. 2017. 4.2 ka BP megadrought and the Akkadian collapse. In: Weiss H, editor. Megadrought and collapse: from early agriculture to Angkor. Oxford: Oxford University Press; p. 93–160.

Weiss H, Courty M. 1993. The genesis and collapse of the Akkadian Empire: the accidental refraction of historical law. In: Liverani M, editor. Akkad: The First World Empire: Structure, Ideology and Traditions; p. 131–156.

Weiss H, Courty M, Wetterstrom W, Guichard F, Senior L, Meadow R, Curnow A. 1993. The genesis and collapse of third millennium North
Mesopotamian civilization. Science (New York, N.Y.). 261(5124): 995–1004.

Whitelaw T. 2000. Settlement instability and landscape degradation in the Southern Aegean in the third millennium BC. In: Halstead P and Frederick C, editors. Landscape and land use in Postglacial Greece. Vol. 3. London: Bloomsbury; p. 135–161.

Wick L, Lemcke G, Sturm M. 2003. Evidence of Lateglacial and Holocene climatic change and human impact in eastern Anatolia: high-resolution pollen, charcoal, isotopic and geochemical records from the laminated sediments of Lake Van, Turkey. The Holocene. 13(5): 665–675.

Zanchetta G, Regattieri E, Isola I, Drysdale R, Bini M, Baneschi I, Hellstrom J. 2016. The so-called “4.2 event” in the central Mediterranean and its climatic teleconnections. Alpine and Mediterranean Quaternary. 29(1):5–17.

Zhang H, Ma Y, Wünnemann B, Pachur H. 2000. A Holocene climatic record from arid northwestern China. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology. 162(3-4):389–401.

Zhao Y, Xu Q, Huang X, Guo X, Tao S. 2009. Differences of modern pollen assemblages from lake sediments and surface soils in arid and semi-arid China and their significance for pollen-based quantitative climate reconstruction. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 156(3-4):519–524.