Sustainable Development of World Cultural Heritage Tourism——Take Yungang Grottoes as an Example

Bingyu Yang

Shanxi Datong University, Krirk University, No.1, Xingyun Street, Pingcheng District, Datong, Shanxi, China

E-mail: dtdxwsc@sxdtdx.edu.cn

Abstract. World cultural heritage is popular with tourists because of its unique resources. As one of the four largest Grottoes in China, Yungang Grottoes were listed in the world heritage list by the UNESCO World Heritage Committee in 2001. Yungang Grottoes have a long history and delicate carving. The themes are mainly Buddhist statues and Buddhist stories, which integrate the Chinese and Western carving arts and have special cultural and artistic charm. However, with the continuous expansion of popularity and the increasing number of tourists, Yungang Grottoes bear more and more pressure. How to alleviate this pressure and improve the tourists' experience has become the biggest "bottleneck" for its further sustainable development. Only by combining the protection and utilization of cultural heritage, inheritance and innovation, and by actively mobilizing the unity of the government, schools, media, citizens and tourists, can the important radiation and strong attraction of world cultural heritage be better exerted, and the sustainable development of world cultural heritage tourism culture be better promoted. Studying the sustainable development of the world cultural tourism heritage represented by Yungang Grottoes has a positive promotion and promotion effect on the healthy and stable development of China's current tourism market.

1. Introduction

Since the end of World War II, tourism has been developing rapidly all over the world. Despite the impact of malignant events, it does not pose a threat to the rapid development of tourism as the largest industry in the world[1]. As an important part of tourism development, heritage tourism has also brought new development opportunities for developing countries and regions with rich cultural resources but
underdeveloped economy with its amazing development speed [2], and has become one of the most ideal and satisfactory product forms for the sustainable and rapid development of tourism [3].

World heritage refers to the natural regions and cultural heritage with outstanding value that are listed in the UNESCO World Heritage list. World heritage is the highest non-renewable tourism resources of human beings, which has an extraordinary value and significance to the country and local. Since the first batch of world heritage was recognized in 1987, the popularity of world heritage has been rapidly improved. With the rapid rise of tourism in heritage sites, the contradiction between heritage protection and tourism development has become increasingly prominent. How to coordinate the relationship between the two to promote the sustainable development of world heritage tourism has become a common concern of international scholars, businesses and governments.

2. Sustainable development of world cultural heritage tourism

World heritage is the common wealth of all mankind. It carries human history and civilization, integrates culture and nature, represents the most valuable human and natural landscape, and has the value of science, aesthetics, historical culture and tourism. Its rich connotation is the continuous source of knowledge of social science and Natural Science. In 1972, the General Assembly of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization formally adopted the Convention for the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (the "Convention") to define and classify World Heritage, and to implement the predetermined provisions of the Convention in 1976. At the first Convention replacement conference, the UNESCO World Heritage Committee was formally established. From July 5th to July 7th, 2019, the 43rd World Heritage Committee Meeting of Azerbaijani Heritage elected new nominations for countries in 2019. A total of 29 new world heritage sites and an expansion project were added. This number reached a new high after the World Heritage Conference of Suzhou Antiques in 2004. China plus more world heritages. At this time, the number of world heritage sites in China has reached 55, which is the same as that of Italy and ranks first in the world. Therefore, among the world heritages that China has on the border with the world, there are 14 natural heritages, 37 cultural heritages, and 4 cultural and natural dual heritages (mixed heritage). This article mainly discusses the object of world cultural heritage.

2.1. International protection of world cultural heritage

International heritage protection originated in the late 18th century. In 1790 [4], The "Yellowstone Act" promulgated by the United States in 1872 set a precedent for mankind to protect natural heritage, and in 1984, France established the first cultural heritage day. The study of heritage tourism began in the 1980s, and now it has formed a multi-disciplinary and multi-level research category. The Budapest Declaration on World Heritage issued by UNESCO points out that an appropriate and reasonable balance should be found between heritage protection, sustainability and development[5]. It is suggested that the development of tourism in heritage sites can promote the protection of heritage resources and the sustainable development of heritage sites[6-9]. The Convention on the protection of world cultural and natural heritage issued by UNESCO in 1972 not only protects the world heritage, but also brings business opportunities. The principles of authenticity and integrity should be applied in the protection and utilization of the heritage to urge the sustainable development of the world heritage.
As the early use of world heritage sites is understood as scientific research, the concept of tourism development overemphasizes economic dominance and the concept of scientific use has not yet formed, many protection experts believe that tourism development is the destruction of world heritage. With the rationalization of tourism development and utilization, tourism development can improve the self-protection ability of world heritage sites by expanding the utilization to meet the public demand [10].

2.2. China's protection of world cultural heritage

China joined the Convention in 1985 and became one of the contracting states. Over the years, China has made many efforts to protect the common wealth of mankind, and the country has issued a series of laws and regulations. The issuance of the "State Council's Notice on Strengthening the Protection of Cultural Heritage" in December 2005 started the process of China's transition from the protection of cultural relics to the protection of cultural heritage, marking the entry of a new historical stage for China's cultural heritage protection. The progress of social civilization has also raised people's awareness of the protection of world heritage, and the rapid development of tourism brought about by economic development has also seriously damaged cultural and natural heritage. China's current difficulties include: domestic bottlenecks in the common development of economy and nature, inadequate legal system, lack of management and professional talents, and less investment in necessary funds. At the same time, local governments have paid too much attention to performance evaluation indicators and increasingly ignored natural environmental protection projects. Therefore, it should be based on China's current national conditions, and hold high the banner of protection, scientific planning, rational development, and sustainable use, so that the rapid development of economy and culture, while driving the sustainable development of tourism.

2.3. World cultural heritage tourism and sustainable development

In the face of global environmental problems today, the only option for mankind is to strive to find a sustainable development path with coordinated economic, social, environmental and resource. Sustainable development not only requires moderate economic growth to meet human needs, but also emphasizes that it cannot exceed the carrying capacity of the natural environment and resources. It can meet the needs of contemporary people without jeopardizing the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. Ideal human development model. Driven by socio-economic development, the spiritual needs of humankind have been increasing, accompanied by the popularization of tourism, and the development of world heritage tourism resources has become a trend. The development of heritage tourism can increase local economic income, and at the same time, the popularity of heritage sites is improved, which is conducive to people's recognition of traditional culture. Similarly, the economic income brought by tourism development allows the government to invest more funds to effectively manage heritage sites. And protection, it has greatly promoted the inheritance and development of heritage culture. However, the excessive development of the tourism industry has also caused unprecedented damage to the World Heritage. The area is overcrowded, and the installation of a large number of hotels, restaurants and ropeways poses a threat to the integrity of the heritage site. As a non-renewable resource, the development and protection of World Heritage is an important strategic goal for the country to achieve the healthy development of the cultural and tourism industries. In the end,
World Heritage must become a powerful driving force for the harmonious development of the economy and culture of the entire country.

3. Sustainable development of Yungang Grottoes Tourism

3.1. General situation

At the south foot of Wuzhou mountain, 16km west of Datong City, Shanxi Province, there are Yungang Grottoes with magnificent momentum and world-famous. Yungang Grottoes were approved as world cultural heritage by UNESCO World Heritage Committee at the 25th World Heritage conference held in Helsinki in December 2001 [11].

The World Heritage Committee evaluates the Yungang Grottoes as follows: The Yungang Grottoes in Datong, Shanxi Province have 252 caves and more than 51,000 statues, representing the outstanding Buddhist grotto art from the 5th to the 6th century AD. Among them, Wuwu Grottoes, with rigorous and unified layout design, is the first masterpiece of Chinese Buddhist art at its peak.

The Yungang Grottoes are the product of the perfect combination of Western Buddhism and Chinese tradition. As grotto stone carvings, there are not only ancient Greek-style Ionian stigmas, Corinthian stigmas, but also ancient Indian-style elephants, lion-supported Buddhist columns, and Roman architecture with prominent central axes, hatchback symmetry, and frame decoration. feature. As the most typical place of Gandhara art heritage in China, the historical sites and artistic value of Yungang Grottoes are gradually recognized by the world. Appearances of Chinese palace architectural style carvings and Chinese-style Buddha statues developed on this basis were imitated on a large scale in subsequent cave constructions, including Longmen Grottoes in Luoyang and Mogao Grottoes in Dunhuang. The late grotto layout and decoration of the Yungang Grottoes highlight the rich Chinese-style architecture and decoration style, reflecting the continuous deepening of the "Sinification" of Buddhist art. It is not difficult to find that Yungang Grottoes occupy an important position in the world grotto art group through comparison.

3.2. Analysis on the current situation of sustainable development of Yungang Grottoes

In the Northern Wei Dynasty, Yungang Grottoes were dug, cut into mountains for walls, and stones were taken to form grottoes. At that time, the principle of recycling was adopted. A large amount of engineering waste rock produced in the Wuzhou Mountains of the Northern Wei Dynasty is basically used for the construction of river dams and mountain-top tower temples in the grottoes; building stones are mainly used for the construction of the capital Pingcheng, such as the imperial palace and Mingtang Piyong; single Buddhist statues Or all kinds of living utensils, it is full of monasteries, folk and tombs. The sandstone sculptures of Yungang we see today are mostly unearthed from the tombs of Beiwei in the suburbs of Datong [12].

Because of its long history, Yungang Grottoes, a world-famous art treasure house, collapsed, weathered and damaged seriously by human. In the face of the historical remains, after the founding of new China, a special protection and management organization was formally established. In 1960, the State Administration of cultural relics held a "Yungang Grottoes Protection Conference", which opened the prelude to the scientific protection of Yungang Grottoes. In 1961, the State Council announced
Yungang Grottoes as a national key cultural relics protection unit. In 1965, the protection scope of Yungang Grottoes was announced, including key protection areas, safety protection areas and underground safety lines, forming a three-dimensional intersection of the upper, middle and lower levels and a multi-layer protection system of the far, middle and near levels, so as to ensure the safety of the grottoes and lay a good foundation for the protection of the grottoes. Over the past 60 years, Yungang Grottoes have carried out a lot of protection work, and established a Research Institute of grottoes cultural relics. In view of the collapse and weathering of the grottoes, it has been carrying out scientific research and experiments on Grottoes protection, and has achieved a number of scientific research results, which provides a lot of scientific basis for the protection of Yungang Grottoes and promotes the protection of Yungang Grottoes. On August 22, 1997, Datong City issued the regulations on the protection and management of Yungang Grottoes in Datong City, which is the first local regulation on the protection of large-scale Grottoes in China. Its promulgation and implementation will play a positive role in the protection of Yungang Grottoes. In addition, in order to solve the problem of coal dust and waste gas pollution on the statues of the grottoes, the state allocated a large sum of money to implement the relocation project of the Yungang section of national highway 109, which greatly improved the tourism environment of Yungang Grottoes. In 1999, before and after the application for inclusion in the world heritage list, Datong City renovated the surrounding environment of Yungang Grottoes, demolishing a total of more than 50000 square meters of buildings and structures in front of the grottoes. Since becoming a world cultural heritage, the tourism of Yungang Grottoes has been booming. At the same time, Yungang Grottoes together with the Forbidden City and Huangshan have become one of the first batch of 66 5A tourist attractions in China. This is a great affirmation for the protection and tourism development of Yungang Grottoes [13].

In 2010, the construction of the Yungang Grottoes Grand Scenic Area was completed, and the Yungang Grottoes Research Office, Yungang Exhibition Hall, Performing Arts Center, Food Street, Lingyan Temple, Tourist Service Center, Yungang Shadow Puppet, and Puppet The cultural tourism service facilities such as museums have restored the memorial room of Premier Zhou, and restored the historical features of "mountain halls and smoke temples facing each other, Lin Yuan mirror views, and new views" in the Northern Wei Dynasty. The construction of the Yungang Grand Scenic Area has expanded the tourism area, improved the surrounding environment, promoted the protection of cultural relics and cultural display, and helped to enhance the tangible and intangible value of the heritage site. It also helped to improve the quality of Yungang Grottoes and public awareness. degree. The “Complete Collection of Yungang Grottoes” was published in 2019, which established a comprehensive digital database of grotto images, surpassing the research of Japanese scholars, and becoming a national "struggle project".

In the construction of Yungang Grottoes, in addition to the above-mentioned Art Museum, projection hall, history museum, leather cinema and other venues, all of which are formed by the transformation of existing houses, the disabled passage in the scenic area has been added, 5 parking lots, 7 environmental toilets, 11 electric bottle car stops, 13 small garden squares, more than 40 walking paths, and about 8km long landscape retaining walls have been opened, as well as a number of sculpture landscape and functional rooms. Almost all of the construction is to use the abandoned road cement blocks, curbstones, old stone strips, old stone chips and cement bricks in urban and rural areas, the large stone blocks and sand rocks in the nearby mountain areas, the mountain skin stones, crushed stone plates and leftovers abandoned by Fengzhen stone factory, the chimney stones in the closed factory, the remaining large and small timber in the eaves project of Wuhua Grottoes in Yungang, the grinding plates, Lu Qi, tablet heads and inscriptions collected in the local rural areas old stone carvings, such as stone
pillars, tower parts, upper horse stones, tie horse stakes, Shi wengzhong, etc., old iron ore cars, old air ducts, winch wheels, large iron cans eliminated by Datong coal mine power plant, and large sculpture reconstruction idle in urban reconstruction.

The parking lot is no longer hardened, and more environmentally friendly gravel chipped ground is used; hillside canals, river pebble edging, cement blocks at the bottom of the canal are empty, and collected rainwater is poured into the woods through leakage: all newly added walls, The building is made of waste cement, and the texture is generous. According to preliminary statistics, the accumulated investment is about 40 million Yuan, and more than 30,000 cubic meters of solid waste is digested, saving the country about 150 million Yuan. It has changed the current large-scale investment and large-scale universal model of urban and scenic construction, and the disadvantages such as waste of resources, lack of features, and poor quality, which have enabled Yungang scenic spot to take advantage of low-carbon utilization, low-carbon energy conservation, and soil and water conservation. Humanistic innovation. In 2018, Zhang Zhuo, the dean of the Yungang Grottoes Research Institute, won the title of "People of the Year in Green China". Among the nation’s world cultural heritages, only Datang Yungang Grottoes in Shanxi province use clean construction waste and old stone, old materials to beautify the environment and turn waste into treasure [14].

Nowadays, it has become an important place for people from all walks of life at home and abroad to visit, and also a tourist attraction that international friends admire and yearn for.

4. Suggestions and discussion

4.1. Improve the quality of tourists and establish a conscious awareness of protection

Cultural heritage protection is a macro and developmental concept, which reminds the contemporary people to take a comprehensive view of various cultural connotations, forms and industries, and pay attention to the sustainable development of heritage. The protection of Yungang Grottoes requires Yungang people to have broad mind, sensitive conscience, dedicated spirit and brave responsibility. Cultural heritage is the crystallization of human wisdom and the eternal spiritual home of mankind. The protection of cultural heritage needs the enthusiastic participation of the whole people. Only when the whole people care about, understand and support the cause of cultural heritage protection, and consciously join the ranks of cultural relics protectors, "protect cultural heritage" is not an empty talk. In the investigation, it is found that tourists are not aware of the importance of cultural heritage protection, and consciously join the ranks of cultural relics protectors, "protect cultural heritage" is not an empty talk. In the investigation, it is found that tourists are not aware of the importance of cultural heritage protection, and it is difficult to consciously form the awareness of cultural heritage protection. Therefore, cultural relics are often damaged and uncivilized tourism occurs. Cultural heritage involves many knowledge such as history, geography, literature, art, science and technology. It is the most vivid and profound teaching material. We can carry out long-term publicity in this area through schools, museums, libraries, cinemas, stages, media and other carriers to enhance public awareness and understanding of cultural heritage and make it realize the importance of cultural heritage inheritance.

4.2. Integrate enterprise resources to form cultural industry chain

Yungang tourism industry started earlier, but for many years, due to the constraints of ideas and other aspects, Datong City is faltering in the promotion of cultural taste of scenic spots and the process of
tourism industrialization. In 2011, Datong City cultural industry express made great efforts to speed up. It will actively develop the cultural tourism industry with the big ancient capital as the leader, the famous historical and cultural city as the center, the world cultural heritage Yungang Grottoes and the national scenic spot Beiyue Hengshan as the two wings, and build four bases of the famous ancient capital culture, the Buddhist culture of Wei Liao, the military culture of frontier fortress and the leisure culture of Xiadu. In order to integrate cultural resources and create a cultural tourism corridor, Yungang Grottoes Research Institute applied for Yungang Valley National Archaeological Site Park in 2008. In addition to Yungang Grottoes, more than 40 cultural relics such as Buddhist grottoes temple in the Northern Wei Dynasty, stone carving sites of previous dynasties, Neolithic sites of ancient human settlements in Yungang Valley, and buildings in the Qing Dynasty in Yungang valley were included in Yungang Valley National Archaeological Site Park Planning scope. The commercial squares of Huayan Temple and fahua Temple set up a platform for cultural products, holding the Datong International Sculpture Biennale and Datong International Arts and crafts Biennale. Datong Municipal government also encourages the construction of cultural enterprises and groups with local characteristics, and gives policy support and financial support.

4.3. Give full play to the advantages of media and create a social protection atmosphere

The biggest threat of cultural heritage is not the weathering damage under natural conditions, but people ignorance and neglect of cultural heritage. It is not easy to form the concept of cultural heritage protection in the whole society. It is not enough to rely on the attention of the government alone. It also needs the publicity of the media and the participation of non-governmental organizations. The cultural relics department can make use of the propaganda function of the news media to strengthen the guidance of the public to participate in the protection of cultural heritage, and convey the knowledge of cultural heritage protection to the public with the help of some public service advertisements. We can also use the Internet, mobile TV, mobile phone and other new media to narrow the distance between the public and cultural heritage, so that the public can truly feel that cultural heritage protection is around us.

Datong has its own characteristics in publicity: the free and open museum displays many planning and protection processes of cultural heritage sites; there are countless banner pictures on Weidu avenue to promote Datong scenic spots and historic sites; the Datong evening news publishes special articles on cultural heritage every day; the knowledge of cultural heritage protection has been incorporated into primary and secondary school textbooks; every major festival, Huayan Temple Square will hold temple fairs and various art performances. It is worth mentioning that since the Datong Yungang Tourism Festival was successfully held by the Datong Municipal Government on August 8, 2000, its influence has been unprecedentedly high. More tourists come here and more citizens participate in it with the spirit of master. The newly built Yungang Grottoes scenic area is not the same as before, and there are a large number of citizens and tourists coming to visit. While appreciating the wonderful carving technology of Yungang Grottoes, the folk customs, arts, architecture and diet of the city will leave deep memories to every visitor, and stimulate people cognition and love of cultural heritage.

We can also use various means to strengthen publicity, issue commemorative stamps and telephone cards for cultural heritage, publish atlas and maps for cultural heritage, sell puzzles and souvenirs for cultural heritage, etc. Establish a special website to promote heritage protection, so that people can participate directly, understand the protection of urban cultural heritage, and make suggestions for the protection of cultural heritage. In the context of globalization, cultural heritage has evolved into symbols
and symbols of local culture, and different groups gradually become aware of their own and local heritage protection.

4.4. Pay attention to personnel training and improve academic research level

A scientific concept, a scientific concept and a set of scientific theories can promote the healthy development of cultural heritage protection more than a series of specific protection and rescue actions carried out by cultural heritage workers themselves. When Yu Qiuyu, a famous contemporary cultural scholar, art theorist, cultural historian and essayist, came to Datong to give a special lecture, he emphasized that "in addition to the three-dimensional structure of the Yungang Grottoes, cultural cities need the software of experts and scholars who love the work of literature and history, and the protection of famous cities needs the guidance of culture. "For the study of Yungang Grottoes, in addition to the use of traditional research methods, but also the introduction of new frontier disciplines for research, to achieve a deep, multi-lateral, all-round study of the new realm. In Datong, it is necessary to establish "Yungang School" to take on the task of protection, maintenance, data preservation and research. The maintenance and protection of Yungang Grottoes need the cooperation of many natural sciences, such as chemistry, physics, hydrogeology, meteorology, etc.,

As well as the guidance of social scientists and artists. “At this time, the researchers of Yungang Grottoes are at a time when they are out of touch with each other. They need to actively introduce a large number of experts and researchers who study the history and architecture of grottoes, and recruit professional and technical personnel with practical experience in the protection of ancient buildings at home and abroad," said the director of the ancient section of Yungang Grottoes Research Institute. In order to improve the overall academic and research level of our institute, it has been reported to Datong Municipal Government for recruiting a group of senior professional and technical talents with master degree or above to enrich the front line of cultural relics protection. At the same time, Datong University has set up the majors of architecture and Yungang science to recruit undergraduates, so that they can join the ranks of Yungang Grottoes protection after graduation. "In the curriculum of cultural relic protection specialty of regular colleges and universities, the course of cultural relic protection and restoration with Chinese cultural relic characteristics is added as a necessary course to learn modern and traditional restoration technologies at home and abroad. In addition to learning the basic theory of modern cultural relic protection science and technology, students should also participate in the practical restoration of cultural relic protection and cultivate their practical ability. Shanxi Datong University and Datong Municipal government work together to establish a Chinese Sculpture Institute based on the sculpture art of Yungang Grottoes. While protecting the grottoes and inheriting the sculpture culture, it will be built into a sculpture teaching practice base of Chinese institutions of higher learning.

4.5. Increase government investment and broaden fund raising channels

The shortage of funds for the protection of cultural relics in China has always been one of the bottlenecks restricting the smooth progress of heritage protection. Throughout the world, the advanced countries of cultural heritage protection attach more importance to cultural heritage and invest more money than China. The French government invests 1 billion euros, or about 1.9 billion Yuan, in the protection of cultural relics every year; the British government invests 200 million euros, or about 2 billion Yuan, in the protection of cultural heritage every year; the Italian government invests 5 billion euros, or about 50
billion Yuan, in the protection of cultural heritage in recent years. Many countries have also adopted a series of policies and measures to encourage social funds to invest in cultural relics protection. For example, 8% of Italy’s legal lottery revenue is cultural relics protection fund, which alone has an annual fund of 1.5 billion euros (about 15 billion yuan). Britain has a special National Cultural Heritage Lottery Fund. These countries also implement preferential policies such as income tax reduction and exemption, and inheritance tax for donation of cultural heritage public welfare undertakings. The source of funds for cultural heritage protection, relying solely on government investment and ticket income of cultural heritage itself, can only be a drop in the bucket. We must diversify financing and expand the channels of funds for protection. Suzhou classical garden is one of the successful cases. It organically combines the public welfare and economic value of cultural heritage, takes the road of "protection, development, utilization, development and protection" in a virtuous circle, and radiates and drives the development of neighbouring regions, and jointly constructs a protective barrier.

We can learn from the successful experience of other countries in the world, establish a special fund for cultural relics protection and a lottery fund for cultural relics protection, and widely absorb social funds for cultural heritage protection. We will encourage social organizations, non-governmental organizations and individuals to invest, formulate preferential tax policies and loan policies, and guide them to contribute to the protection of cultural heritage.

5. Conclusions

To sum up, we should focus on the coordinated development of World Heritage site protection and tourism. World heritage protection and tourism development from the initial conflict to reconciliation and ultimately achieve synergy. The purpose of protection is to make better use of, the purpose of utilization is to strengthen protection, protection and utilization can be coordinated in the dimension of means, and achieve integration in the practice process, and finally achieve the sustainable development of world cultural heritage sites.

References

[1] WTO. Global troubles took toll on tourism in 2003, growth to resume in 2004 [EB/OL]. http://www.world-tourism.org/newsroom/Releases/2004/janvier/data.htm.

[2] Prentice A. Heritage: A key sector of the "new" tourism [C] // C Cooper, A Lockwood (eds). Progress in tourism recreation and hospitality. London: Belhaven, 1993: 309-324.

[3] Christina A, Adele L, John F. Stakeholder collaboration and heritage management [J]. Annals of Tourism Research, 2005, 32(1): 28-48.

[4] Chen Jinhua. Research progress and enlightenment of foreign heritage protection and utilization [J]. Journal of Henan University (Social Science Edition), 2007 (6): 104-108.

[5] Li Wenhua. Discussion on several issues in the protection of natural and cultural heritage [J]. Geographical Research, 2006 (4): 561-599.
[6] Catibogsinha C. Sustainable Forest Management: Heritage Tourism, Biodiversity, and Upland Communities in the Philippines[J]. Journal of Heritage Tourism, 2011(4):341-352.

[7] Loulanski T, Loulanski V. The Sustainable integration of cultural heritage and tourism: A meta study[J]. Journal of Sustainable Tourism, 2011,19(7):837-862.

[8] Calver S J. Enlightened hesonism: exploring the relationship of service value, visitor knowledge and interest, to visitor enjoyment at heritage Attractions[J]. Tourism Management, 2013,39(3):23-26.

[9] Setyaningsih S. Women empowerment through creative industry: A case study[J]. Procedia Economics and Finance, 2012(4):213-222.

[10] Li Qiaoling, Ma Qinyuan, Zhao Yutian. A Review of Research on the Protection of World Heritage Sites and Tourism Development [J]. Journal of Lanzhou University of Finance and Economics, 2019 (8): 109-110.

[11] Huo Sijia, Fan Wenjing, Sun Keqin. Research on the Sustainable Development of Yungang Grottoes World Heritage Site [J]. Resource Development and Market, 2011 (27): 907.

[12] Zhang Zhuo. Yungang Grottoes Heritage Protection and The road of innovation and development [J]. China Cultural Relics News, 2019 (12): 2.

[13] Ma Baosheng. The Protection of Yungang Cultural Heritage and Tourism Development [J]. Journal of Shanxi Datong University (Social Science Edition), 2008 (6): 50-51.

[14] Zhang Zhuo. The heritage protection and innovative development of Yungang Grottoes [J]. China Cultural Relics News, 2019 (12): 2-3.