Maintenance of Sex-Related Genes and the Co-Occurrence of Both Mating Types in *Verticillium dahliae*

Dylan P. G. Short1*, Suraj Gurung1*, Xiaoping Hu2, Patrik Inderbitzin1, Krishna V. Subbarao1*

1Department of Plant Pathology, University of California Davis, Salinas, CA, United States of America, 2State Key Laboratory of Crop Stress Biology for Arid Areas and College of Plant Protection, Northwest A&F University, Yangling, Shaanxi, China

Abstract

*Verticillium dahliae* is a cosmopolitan, soilborne fungus that causes a significant wilt disease on a wide variety of plant hosts including economically important crops, ornamentals, and timber species. Clonal expansion through asexual reproduction plays a vital role in recurring plant epidemics caused by this pathogen. The recent discovery of recombination between clonal lineages and preliminary investigations of the meiotic gene inventory of *V. dahliae* suggest that cryptic sex appears to be rare in this species. Here we expanded on previous findings on the sexual nature of *V. dahliae*. Only 1% of isolates in a global collection of 1120 phytopathogenic *V. dahliae* isolates contained the *MAT1-1* idiomorph, whereas 99% contained *MAT1-2*. Nine unique multilocus microsatellite types comprised isolates of both mating types, eight of which were collected from the same substrate at the same time. Orthologs of 88 previously characterized sex-related genes from fungal model systems in the Ascomycota were identified in the genome of *V. dahliae*, out of 93 genes investigated. Results of RT-PCR experiments using both mating types revealed that 10 arbitrarily chosen sex-related genes, including *MAT1-1-1* and *MAT1-2-1*, were constitutively expressed in *V. dahliae* cultures grown under laboratory conditions. Ratios of non-synonymous (amino-acid altering) to synonymous (silent) substitutions in *V. dahliae* MAT1-1-1 and MAT1-2-1 sequences were indistinguishable from the ratios observed in the *MAT* genes of sexual fungi in the Pezizomycotina. Patterns consistent with strong purifying selection were also observed in 18 other arbitrarily chosen *V. dahliae* sex-related genes, relative to the patterns in orthologs from fungi with known sexual stages. This study builds upon recent findings from other laboratories and mounts further evidence for an ancestral or cryptic sexual stage in *V. dahliae*.

Introduction

Sexual reproduction is thought [1] to act as a mechanism to combine fit alleles from different individuals, and to break apart locally disadvantageous allele combinations under dynamic selection pressures [2]. While sexual reproduction may in theory be costly and disrupt favorable gene combinations, experimental evidence has suggested that sex in fungi increases the rate of adaptation to new environments [3]. Prior to molecular techniques, the formation of sexual structures and spores was the primary evidence of sex in fungi. It is now evident that sex in many taxa is rare, unpredictable and elusive. For many fungi, the only documented sexual structures are formed on certain media and/or growth conditions *in vitro* [4,5]. Some putatively asexual plant pathogens have been found to sexually reproduce in nature only in specific ecological conditions and geographic locales, such as near the center of origin of the species [6].

Advances in genetic markers and population biology have led to significant advances in the discovery of rare or cryptic sexual stages in fungi [7]. Populations of many species that lack obvious sexual stages in nature nevertheless have been found to harbor molecular patterns of sexuality based on investigations of mating type frequencies, population structure, multilocus linkage disequilibrium [8,9] and computer simulations [6]. Additionally, bioinformatic surveys of complete genomes, have been used to infer sexuality based on the meiotic gene inventory [10–13]. Advances in genomics have enabled the unprecedented implementation of these approaches to investigate sexuality in fungi. Many seemingly asexual fungi have retained the genes required for the sexual “machinery”, including many that are important to the fields of agriculture and medicine [12,14–16].

*Verticillium* is a small genus of phytopathogenic fungi that causes billions of dollars in agricultural losses annually [17]. *Verticillium dahliae* is a cosmopolitan, soilborne plant pathogen that causes an economically significant wilt disease. It is known for its extremely wide host range [18] and its ability to survive in soils as dormant resting structures for many years [17,19]. Historically, *V. dahliae* has been considered strictly asexual because it has failed to form sexual structures under the laboratory conditions tested. Vegetative anamorphs, the fusion of growing hyphae under laboratory conditions, has been reported [20,21], and several
vegetative compatibility groups (VCGs) have been classified. Deep sequencing of all known VCGs of *V. dahliae* has revealed that VCGs are strongly correlated to clonal lineages [22], but has also revealed that putative sexual recombination between clonal lineages has occurred rarely [23].

Sexual compatibility and fruiting body formation in heterothallic fungi in the Ascomycota is determined by a variety of sex-related gene pathways. Of primary importance are the two idiomorphs of the MAT locus, which differ in gene content and are the master regulators of sexual recombination in the Ascomycota [24]. One idiomorph contains a critical gene that encodes an α domain (MAT1-1-1), while the other contains a critical gene that encodes a DNA-binding domain of the high-mobility group (HMG) type (MAT1-2-1) [25]. Isolates with either of the idiomorphs are referred to as MAT1-1 or MAT1-2 [26]. *Verticillium dahliae* is considered heterothallic because both idiomorphs are known to exist [27], and only one idiomorph has been observed in any one isolate.

Previous sequences of the α and HMG domains of *V. dahliae* MAT genes showed high amino acid conservation with other fungi in the subphylum Pezizomycotina [27,28]. Mating type frequencies in *V. dahliae* have been reported in multiple studies as skewed [23,28,29]. Although previous studies have reported mating type distributions skewed towards MAT1-2 in *V. dahliae*, they have not clearly stated whether both mating types are sympatric in nature, that is, whether isolates of opposite mating coexist in nature. It is also unknown whether genetically identical multilocus microsatellite types contain both MAT idiomorphs, a condition which has previously been interpreted as unequivocal evidence for sexual recombination [11].

In addition to the presence of both mating types, other molecular signatures suggestive of sex have been reported in *V. dahliae*. Multilocus linkage equilibrium has been reported in collections of *V. dahliae* [30], although clonal expansion is of primary importance in pathogen reproduction and dissemination within regions where this pathogen is a severe problem in agriculture [31]. However, even in species with known sexual stages, signatures of clonality can predominate in multilocus data sets [32]. Gene trees with incongruent topologies may be a robust indicator of meiotic recombination when they occur within a strongly supported phylogenetic species [33,34]. Gene trees with incongruent topologies were previously reported in *V. dahliae* based on sequences of the protein coding genes actin (*ACT*), elongation factor 1-alpha (*EF*), glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase (*GPD*), and tryptophan synthase (*TS*) [35]. The strongest evidence yet of recombination between lineages of *V. dahliae* was based on over 20,000 single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) [23].

Genomic investigations of *V. dahliae* have also provided some evidence of sexuality in *V. dahliae*. For example, a single homolog of the gene encoding the DNA methyltransferase (*DMT*) *RID* exists in *V. dahliae* reference strain Ls 17, a gene which was first characterized as part of the Repeat-Induced Point (RIP) machinery in *N. crassa* [36]. Patterns consistent with RIP-like mutation were subsequently discovered in the *V. dahliae* genome in multiple long interspersed element (LINE)-like and long terminal repeat (LTR) retroelement sequences [37] and other transposons [38]. Furthermore, preliminary explorations of the meiotic gene inventory have revealed the presence of genes known to function in sex-related pathways in other fungal systems [23].

Comparative population genomics of *V. dahliae* has significantly advanced the understanding of the molecular basis of races, as well as the existence of inter-Kingdom horizontal gene transfer [39], and has also led some researchers to posit chromosomal reshuffling (genomic rearrangements and chromosomal length polymorphisms, despite a high degree of sequence conservation) as the sole mechanism for generating the diversity observed within *V. dahliae* [40]. Significant chromosomal rearrangements are expected to interfere with meiosis [41], so it is reasonable to expect sex to be impossible between isolates with extreme karyotypic polymorphisms [40,42].

It has been postulated that a detailed understanding of the genes required for the initiation and completion of meiosis in sexual fungi, that it should be possible to understand the molecular mechanisms that control sexual compatibility and to determine which of these genes are missing or nonfunctional in assexual fungi [43]. In fact, imperfect functioning of mating type genes and other sexual factors such as pheromone receptors have been hypothesized in *V. dahliae* [27]. In the context of exploring the functionality of sex-related genes (and not merely the existence of pseudogenes), Reverse transcriptase-PCR has been used to show that both mating type genes are expressed in fungi, for which no known sexual stage has been documented [44], while other studies have demonstrated pheromone receptor and precursor gene expression in other putatively asexual fungi [45]. To date, the expression of MAT genes and other sex-related genes in *V. dahliae* has never been investigated.

Evolutionary theory predicts that if amino acid-altering genetic mutations occur in genes or domains of critical function and result in lower fitness, they will be purged from populations through purifying selection [46]. Conversely, selection acting on mutations in non-essential genes or domains is “relaxed”, and thus accumulation of amino acid-altering mutations is more likely in such regions. Calculations of the Ka/Ks ratios in a set of amino acid sequences can thus be used to estimate an evolutionary history of both positive and purifying selection at each amino-acid site. Strong purifying selection in 9,471 core eukaryotic genes was previously reported in the genomes of several isolates of *V. dahliae* [40]. Whether sex-related genes in the *V. dahliae* genome are similarly conserved, compared to related sexual fungi, is currently unknown.

The goals of this study were to: 1) characterize the mating types of *V. dahliae* from a large collection of phytopathogenic isolates; 2) determine whether isolates of opposite mating types are present concurrently in the same habitat; 3) determine whether genetically identical multilocus microsatellite types contain both MAT idiomorphs; 4) determine if the complete genome sequence of *V. dahliae* strain Ls 17 contains orthology of fungal sex-related genes; 4) test whether such genes are constitutively expressed in both mating types under laboratory conditions; and 5) estimate the extent of positive (relaxed) and purifying selection in a subset of sex-related genes in *V. dahliae*, relative to fungi with known sexual stages.

**Results and Discussion**

**Molecular assays to identify Verticillium species, MAT type, and multilocus microsatellite types**

All isolates used in this study were identified as the phylogenetic species *V. dahliae* sensu stricto [35]. The frequency of MAT idiomorphs was extremely skewed towards an overabundance of MAT1-2 (Table S1). The MAT1-1 idiomorph was only observed in 1% (12/1120) of isolates characterized. The MAT1-1 isolates comprised eight isolates from commercial spinach seed lots from Washington State, USA, two isolates from a commercial artichoke field in California, and one isolate each from two commercial tomato field in CA (Table S1).
Complete multilocus microsatellite types were generated for 941 isolates; all 12 $MAT1-1$ isolates had different MLMTs, whereas 410 different MLMTs were observed for $MAT1-2$ isolates. Thus, after clone correction, 97% (410/422) isolates were $MAT1-2$. Nine of the $MAT1-1$ MLMTs were identical to MLMTs of one or more $MAT1-2$ isolates (Table 1). Of the nine MLMTs that comprised both mating types, three of them were found to have overlapping ecological niches. That is, they were collected at the same time from the same location and were isolated from the same substrate (artichoke, spinach seed, and tomato) (Table S1). The presence of multilocus genotypes common to both mating types has been interpreted as evidence of sexual recombination [11,47]. However, this interpretation assumes no homoplasy, and assumes that isolates of opposite mating types did not acquire the same alleles at the thirteen loci independently through mutation.

Verticillium genome queries and ortholog searches

Out of 93 sex-related genes considered, 88 were found in the V. dahliae genome (Table 2). The five genes not found in V. dahliae genome searches were the N. crassa accessions NCU09799, NCU04329, which are DNA helicase and repair proteins, respectively, and S. cerevisiae accessions YIL027W, YGL033W, and YGL183C, which correspond to $HOP1$, $HOP2$ and $MND1$. Since no orthologs to $HOP1$, $HOP2$ or $MND1$ were found among any of the Sordariomycetes in the FUNGIPath database, including the sexual fungi Neurospora crassa, Podospora anserina, and Nectria haematococca, it is reasonable to speculate that these three genes are not required for a fully functional sexual cycle for taxa in this group.

SELECTON analyses of positive and purifying selection in sex-related genes of V. dahliae

Selective pressures were estimated in 20 V. dahliae genes, including $MAT1-1$ and $MAT1-2$. The subset of 20 genes chosen for SELECTON analysis were distributed in the V. dahliae genome on chromosomes 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7 and 8. No codons under positive selection were detected in either $MAT1-1$ or $MAT1-2$ or any of the other 18 genes using the M8 model (Figure 1A, Figure 2A). However, using the MEC model, positive selection was detected in 12/20 genes investigated (Figure 1B, Figure 2B, Figure S1). Likelihood ratio tests between the MEC and M8a models revealed that in all cases, the AIC score of the MEC model was lower than the M8a model. Using the MEC model, Verticillium dahliae $MAT1-1$ contained 12% of codons under positive selection and 34% of codons under strong purifying selection (Table 3); V. dahliae $MAT1-2$ contained 9% of codons under positive selection and 35% of codons under strong purifying selection (Table 4). Of the 21 codons under positive selection in V. dahliae $MAT1-1$, only 3 were within the highly conserved $z$ domain (Figure 1B); similarly of the 51 codons under positive selection in V. dahliae $MAT1-2$, only 1 was within the highly conserved HMG domain (Figure 2B). When only sequences from sexual fungi were considered, $MAT1-1$ codons under positive and purifying selection ranged from 9–15% and 33–43% respectively (Table 3), whereas $MAT1-2$ codons under positive and purifying selection ranged from 12–22% and 21–30% respectively (Table 4). Thus, the extent and type of selection estimated for V. dahliae MAT genes were comparable to the estimates for MAT genes from sexual fungi. Interestingly, $MAT1-1$ from the putatively asexual P. fulva contained the highest relative numbers of codons under positive selection and the lowest under strong purifying selection (Table 3); however, P. fulva $MAT1-2$ Ka/Ks estimates were similar to sexual fungi (Table 4).
Table 2. *Verticillium dahliae* orthologs of *Neurospora crassa*, *Saccharomyces cerevisiae*, *Podospora anserina* sex-related genes.

| Gene annotation/putative function | *V. dahliae* accession | Synonym | Other accession | Annotated fungal species |
|-----------------------------------|------------------------|---------|----------------|-------------------------|
| **Meiosis**                        |                        |         |                |                         |
| Double-strand DNA breaks formation and processing | | | | |
| Meiotic recombination protein REC12 | VDAG_09359 | SPO11 | NCU01120 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Meiotic recombination protein REC4 | VDAG_07486 | SIK8 | NCU03517 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DEAD/DEAD box DNA helicase MER3 | NA | NCU09793 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Splicing factor 3B subunit 4 | VDAG_08454 | NCU04182 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Double-strand break repair protein MUS23 | VDAG_07631 | NCU08730 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA repair protein RAD50 | VDAG_06865 | USV6 | NCU00901 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA repair protein of the MRE11 complex | NA | NCU04329 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| **Single strand invasion**         |                        |         |                |                         |
| DNA repair protein RAD51 | VDAG_08796 | MEI3 | NCU02741 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA repair and recombination protein RAD52 | VDAG_00265 | MUS11 | NCU04275 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA repair and recombination protein RAD54 | VDAG_02310 | NCU11255 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Replication factor-A protein1 | VDAG_08650 | RPA1 | NCU03606 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Replication factor-A protein 2 | VDAG_10269 | NCU07717 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Strand exchange protein RAD55p | VDAG_00585 | NCU08806 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA-repair protein XRCC3 | VDAG_07164 | NCU01771 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| **DNA damage checkpoint**          |                        |         |                |                         |
| Genome integrity checkpoint protein | VDAG_05896 | NCU00274 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Cell cycle checkpoint protein RAD17 | VDAG_03081 | NCU00517 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| **Proteins involved in crossing over** | | | | |
| DNA mismatch repair protein | VDAG_07693 | NCU05385 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA mismatch repair protein MUTS | VDAG_02856 | MSH4 | NCU10895 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA mismatch repair MUTS family | VDAG_08845 | MSH5 | NCU09384 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| ATP-dependent helicase SG51 | VDAG_04304 | MUS19 | NCU08598 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Melosis specific protein | VDAG_05193 | NCU10836 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA repair protein RAD16 | VDAG_01793 | MUS38 | NCU07440 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA repair protein RAD13 | VDAG_00986 | NCU07498 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| **Synaptosomal complex**           |                        |         |                |                         |
| Histone H2A.Z | VDAG_07626 | NCU05347 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Structural maintenance of chromosome: SMC protein | VDAG_01776 | NCU09065 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Structural maintenance of chromosome: SMC protein | VDAG_09439 | NCU02402 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Exodeoxyribonuclease | VDAG_02157 | NCU06089 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Casein kinase I | VDAG_02638 | NCU00685 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Nucleotide excision repair protein RAD23 | VDAG_09770 | RAD23 | NCU07542 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| ATP-dependent DNA helicase SRS2 | VDAG_01559 | MUS50 | NCU04733 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| **Mismatch repair proteins**       |                        |         |                |                         |
| DNA mismatch repair protein MSH2 | VDAG_02253 | MSH2 | NCU02230 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA mismatch repair protein MSH3 | VDAG_04229 | MSH3 | NCU08115 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA mismatch repair protein MSH6 | VDAG_01192 | MSH6 | NCU08135 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA mismatch repair protein PMS1 | VDAG_09041 | NCU08020 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA mismatch repair protein MUTL | VDAG_08805 | NCU09373 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| **Resolution of recombination intermediates** | | | | |
| Protein involved in DNA repair and recombination | VDAG_05488 | NCU04047 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Crossover junction endonuclease MUS81 | VDAG_03195 | MUS81 | NCU07457 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| GIY-YIG catalytic domain containing protein | VDAG_09908 | NCU01236 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA topoisomerase | VDAG_04479 | NCU09118 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| DNA topoisomerase | VDAG_00604 | NCU06338 | *Neurospora crassa* |
| Gene annotation/putative function | V. dahliae accession | Synonym | Other accession | Annotated fungal species |
|-----------------------------------|----------------------|---------|-----------------|-------------------------|
| DNA topoisomerase                 | VDAG_06518           |         | NCU00081        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| **Non-homologous end joining**    |                      |         |                 |                         |
| Ku70 protein                      | VDAG_10247           | MUS51   | NCU08290        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Ku80 protein                      | VDAG_06524           | MUS52   | NCU00077        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| **Other**                         |                      |         |                 |                         |
| Protein required for meiotic recombination | VDAG_07839         |         | NCU04415        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Repeat-induced point mutation gene | VDAG_05093           | RID     | NCU02034        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Synaptonemal complex protein HOP1 | NA                   | YL072W  | *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* |
| Interhomolog meiotic recombination HOP2 | NA                   | YGL033W | *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* |
| Interhomolog meiotic recombination MND1 | NA                   | YGL183C | *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* |
| **Cohesion**                      |                      |         |                 |                         |
| **Adherin**                       |                      |         |                 |                         |
| Subunit of cohesin loading factor | VDAG_00695           |         | NCU05250        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| **Chromosome cohesion**           |                      |         |                 |                         |
| Cohesin complex subunit           | VDAG_04575           |         | NCU01323        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Chromosome segregation protein SUDA | VDAG_06558           |         | NCU07554        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Cohesin complex subunit required for sister chromatid cohesion | VDAG_08327           |         | NCU01247        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Double-strand-break repair protein RAD21 | VDAG_08702           | RAD21   | NCU03291        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Rec8 protein                      | VDAG_02664           | REC8    | NCU03190        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Protein required for establishment and maintenance of sister chromatid cohesion | VDAG_03579           | V-SNARE | NCU00242        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| **Separin**                       |                      |         |                 |                         |
| Separin                           | VDAG_05810           |         | NCU00205        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| **Condensins**                    |                      |         |                 |                         |
| Nuclear condensin complex subunit 5mc2 | VDAG_00648           |         | NCU07679        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Nuclear condensin complex subunit 5mc4 | VDAG_10489           |         | NCU09063        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Condensin                         | VDAG_09545           |         | NCU09297        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Condensin subunit Cnd3            | VDAG_06322           |         | NCU06216        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| **Chromosome segregation**        |                      |         |                 |                         |
| Spindle pole body component alp14 | VDAG_10219           |         | NCU04535        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| HEC/Ndc80p family protein         | VDAG_10087           |         | NCU03899        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Chromosome segregation protein    | VDAG_09035           |         | NCU07984        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Swi3 domain-containing protein    | VDAG_04932           |         | NCU01858        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Carboxy-terminal kinesin 2        | VDAG_09024           |         | NCU04581        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Tubulin alpha chain               | VDAG_04060           |         | NCU09132        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Tubulin gamma chain               | VDAG_01827           | TBG     | NCU03954        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Tubulin alpha chain               | VDAG_04060           | TBA2    | NCU09468        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| **Anaphase-promoting complex**    |                      |         |                 |                         |
| Anaphase-promoting complex/cyclosome subunit APC1 | VDAG_09956           |         | NCU05901        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Anaphase-promoting complex protein | VDAG_02447           |         | NCU01963        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Anaphase-promoting complex subunit CUT9 | VDAG_01327           |         | NCU01377        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| WD repeat-containing protein slp1  | VDAG_06090           |         | NCU02616        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Anaphase-promoting complex subunit 8 | VDAG_08529           |         | NCU01174        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Nuclear protein BIMA              | VDAG_05870           |         | NCU00213        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Anaphase-promoting complex subunit 10 | VDAG_07093           |         | NCU08731        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| WD repeat-containing protein SRW1  | VDAG_04583           |         | NCU01269        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| Meiosis-specific APC/C activator protein AMA1 | VDAG_01235           |         | NCU01572        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
| **Transcription factor and gene regulation** | | | | |
| Meiosis-specific transcription factor | VDAG_00592           |         | NCU09915        | *Neurospora crassa*     |
In addition to the MAT genes, Ka/Ks patterns were investigated in 18 other sex-related genes (Table 5, Table S2). The percentage of codons in V. dahliae genes under positive and strong purifying selection ranged from 0–5% and 35–62%, respectively. Six genes, KEX1, MEI3, RAD21, RAD54, STE23, and V-SNARE contained no codons under positive selection using either the M8 or MEC model (Table 5, Figure S1).

Expression of sex-related genes based on RT-PCR

RT-PCR using RNA from both mating types of V. dahliae successfully amplified all 10 sex-related genes investigated (Figure 3). As expected, RNA from MAT1-1 and MAT1-2 only amplified from the strain that carried the respective MAT1-1 and MAT1-2 idiomorph (Figure 3). DNAse was used to treat extracted RNA, and no amplification was observed in reactions with reverse transcriptase omitted, indicating that DNA contamination was not present in the reactions (gels not shown). Since fungal isolates were cultured independently, it appears that V. dahliae expressed these genes during vegetative growth on PDA in the absence of a compatible culture of opposite mating type.

Conclusions

The overabundance of MAT1-2 in V. dahliae has been reported on multiple scales, from heavily sampled single agricultural fields to larger scales such as countries. This phenomenon may be partly explained by clonal expansion of certain successful, highly fit genotypes which do not require sexual reproduction to complete the disease cycle [23,31], unlike some other plant pathogens. Nevertheless, in two field sites in coastal California and in commercial spinach seed lots from WA, identical multilocus microsatellite types comprising both mating types were found, indicating at the very least, that both MAT1-1 and MAT1-2 co-occur in some niches currently.

The sample of V. dahliae characterized in the current study was biased toward virulent, phytopathogenic isolates collected from diseased plant tissue, because most were isolated from plants with visible wilt symptoms in agricultural settings. This raises the hypothesis that V. dahliae MAT1-2 may be associated with higher virulence on some, if not all hosts, which is a phenomenon that has been reported in other fungal systems [48–51]. Preliminary data on the virulence of isolates from both idiomorphs originally collected from tomato suggest that MAT1-2 isolates are significantly more virulent than MAT1-1 isolates (Subbarao, unpublished data). A more comprehensive analysis of the virulence of the two idiomorphs is required to confirm these results, however with more experiments and by investigating the mating-type structure in populations of non-pathogenic, endophytic V. dahliae [52,53].

Although the current study clearly documents patterns of purifying selective pressures in protein coding regions of the sex-related V. dahliae genes investigated, it is possible that there are mutations in non-coding, regulatory regions of the genome that affect the level, timing or location of sex-related gene expression and therefore hinder the sexual cycle. Furthermore, it is possible that genes that were originally associated with sexual reproduction in ancestral populations have evolved new functions, and this is the reason they are being maintained under selection. Yet, it has been previously supposed that the presence of the majority, if not all, of the meiosis-specific genes in the genome of a microorganism is the “strongest indicator” that genes are maintained for meiosis and sex, even if it is rare [10]. The V. dahliae genome is clearly replete with orthologs to genes known for their roles in pathways associated with the sexual cycle. Further, the SELECTON analyses provide evidence that sex-related genes are not in the process of becoming pseudogenes.

The production of actual sexual structures in vitro currently remains a mystery in V. dahliae, possibly due to the lack of research into the growth medium content requirements, such as nutrient (i.e. carbon) content and pH, which are highly variable for sexual fungi in the Pezizomycotina [5,16]. Nevertheless, the genomic evidence presented in the current study, taken together with previous studies of population structure and recombination [23], is compelling and could be reasonably interpreted as evidence of an ancestral or rare sexual cycle in this predominantly asexual species.

### Table 2. Cont.

| Gene annotation/putative function | V. dahliae accession | Synonym | Other accession | Annotated fungal species |
|----------------------------------|----------------------|---------|----------------|-------------------------|
| Histidine-lysine N-methyltransferase | VDAG_10394 | NCU06266 | Neurospora crassa |
| Ankyrin repeat protein | VDAG_06433 | NCU00388 | Neurospora crassa |
| SNF2 family ATP-dependent chromatin-remodeling factor SNF21 | VDAG_06547 | NCU06488 | Neurospora crassa |
| **Signal transduction** | | | | |
| Calcium/Calmodulin-dependent protein kinase | VDAG_04474 | NCU09123 | Neurospora crassa |
| Protein kinase GSK3 | VDAG_08431 | NCU04185 | Neurospora crassa |
| Serine/Threonine-protein kinase RIM15 | VDAG_03223 | NCU07378 | Neurospora crassa |
| **Pheromones proteins essential for mating** | | | | |
| Pheromone processing | VDAG_05762 | STE23 | YLR389C | Saccharomyces cerevisiae |
| Peptide pheromone maturation | VDAG_06292 | RCE1 | YMR274C | Saccharomyces cerevisiae |
| Pheromone processing | VDAG_09962 | AFC1 | YJR117W | Saccharomyces cerevisiae |
| Protein processing | VDAG_00116 | KEX1 | YGL203C | Saccharomyces cerevisiae |
| Pheromone receptor | VDAG_05622 | PRE2 | Pa_4_1380 | Podospora anserina |
| Farnesyltransferase subunit beta | VDAG_05598 | RAM1 | Pa_4_7760 | Podospora anserina |
| Putative ABC transporter expressed in the mitochondrial inner membrane | VDAG_01200 | STE6 | Pa_5_11640 | Podospora anserina |

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0112145.t002
Materials and Methods

Fungal culture maintenance and DNA extraction for MAT characterization

In this study, 1120 isolates of *V. dahliae*, collected from 10 different countries, were characterized for mating type (Table S1). No specific permissions were required for isolating *Verticillium* from any of the regions in the current study. The field isolations did not involve endangered or protected species. Importation of *Verticillium* cultures was performed under the appropriate USDA-APHIS permits (P526P-11-02218, P526P-11-02476, P526P-11-02806). *Verticillium* cultures were originally cultivated on semi-selective NP–10 medium [54], and then single-conidium purified and transferred to potato dextrose agar (PDA). Cultures were stored long-term as spore suspensions in 25% glycerol at 220°C. Mycelia for DNA extraction were grown in 250 ml Erlenmeyer flasks containing 50 ml potato dextrose broth (PDB). Each flask was inoculated with a piece of PDA culture with an approximate surface area of 1 cm². Mycelia from PDB were harvested after 10 days, washed with sterile distilled water, dried using paper towels, lyophilized, and ground to a fine powder using a high-speed mixer mill (Model MM301; Retsch Inc., Newtown, PA). Genomic DNA of each isolate was extracted using a FastDNA Kit (MP Biomedicals LLC, Solon, OH) following the manufacturer’s instructions. A Nano Drop (Model ND–1000, Thermo Scientific Inc., Waltham, MA) was used to quantify DNA extractions, which were diluted to 10 ng/μl, and stored in a freezer at –20°C until needed for PCR assays.

Molecular assays to identify *Verticillium* species and mating type

All isolates used in this study were identified as *V. dahliae* using a *Verticillium* species-specific multiplex as previously described [35]. Mating types were determined for 1120 *V. dahliae* isolates PCR assay with the previously developed primers Ali3 (CGATCGCGA-TATCGGCAAGG), MAT11r (CAGTCAGATCCAAACCTG-CTGGCC), HMG21f (CGGCGGCGAAATTGATAGCTCC)

![Figure 1. Color-coded results of SELECTON analyses of *Verticillium dahliae MAT1-1-1*, compared to sequences from nine different sexual fungi in the Pezizomycotina. Shades of yellow (colors 1 and 2) indicate a Ka/Ks ratio>1 (positive selection), and shades of purple (colors 3 through 7) indicate a Ka/Ks ratio<1 (purifying selection); A) results from the M8 model; B) results of the MEC model; amino acid sequence of the α domain is indicated by black border.](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0112145.g001)
Figure 2. Color-coded results of SELECTON analyses of *Verticillium dahliae* MAT1-2-1, compared to sequences from nine different sexual fungi in the *Pezizomycotina*. Shades of yellow (colors 1 and 2) indicate a Ka/Ks ratio >1 (positive selection) and shades of purple (colors 3 through 7) indicate a Ka/Ks ratio <1 (purifying selection); A) results from the M8 model; B) results of the MEC model; amino acid sequence of the HMG domain is indicated by black border.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0112145.g002
and MAT21r (CATGCTTCCATGCCATTAGTAGCC). These primers amplify a ~600-bp fragment from MAT1–1–1 isolates and a ~300-bp fragment from MAT1–2–1 isolates, as previously described [29,35,37]. PCR assays to characterize mating types were performed in 25 μl reactions using GoTaq Green Mastermix (Promega, Madison, WI). All PCR assays in this study were performed in a PTC-100 Peltier Thermal cycler (MJ Research, Inc., Waterman, MA). For mating type multiplex PCR, the following thermal profile was used: 2 min initial denaturation at 94°C, 35 cycles of 10 sec at 94°C, 20 sec at 57°C, and 1 min at 72°C, followed by a final extension of 7 min at 72°C. PCR amplicons were stained with 5 μl SyberGold (Invitrogen Life Technologies, Carlsbad, CA), and aliquots were loaded in a 1.5% (wt/vol) agarose gel and run for 120 min at 75 V in 0.5% TBE buffer [55].

### Table 3. Comparison of codons under positive (relaxed) and purifying selection in MAT1-1-1, in a variety of fungi in the subphylum Pezizomycotina using the MEC model.

| Fungal taxon                  | MAT1-1 accession no. | Transcript length (codons) | Codons under positive selection | Codons under strong purifying selection |
|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------------|
| Verticillium dahliae[^1^]     | NCBI GenBank AB505215 | 421                         | 51 (12%)                       | 146 (34%)                              |
| Aspergillus fumigatus        | NCBI GenBank AY898660 | 369                         | 45 (12%)                       | 125 (33%)                              |
| Aspergillus nidulans[^2^]    | ANID_02755            | 362                         | 45 (12%)                       | 129 (35%)                              |
| Cochliobolus heterostrophus  | NCBI GenBank X68399   | 384                         | 46 (12%)                       | 129 (33%)                              |
| Eupenicillium crustaeacum[^2^]| NCBI GenBank FR729897 | 343                         | 34 (9%)                        | 121 (35%)                              |
| Fusarium graminearum[^2^]    | FGSG_08892            | 345                         | 53 (15%)                       | 126 (36%)                              |
| Fusarium verticillioides     | FVEG_02491            | 383                         | 54 (14%)                       | 129 (33%)                              |
| Histoplasma capsulatum       | HACG_09679            | 305                         | 34 (11%)                       | 107 (35%)                              |
| Nectria haematococca         | NCH17696              | 214                         | 20 (9%)                        | 92 (43%)                               |
| Penicillium chrysogenum      | PC_255945071          | 342                         | 34 (9%)                        | 119 (34%)                              |
| Sclerotinia sclerotiorum     | STIG_04004            | 258                         | 35 (13%)                       | 91 (35%)                               |
| Passalora fulva[^3^]         | DQ659350              | 358                         | 60 (16%)                       | 98 (27%)                               |

[^1^] SELECTON results for the putatively asexual fungus *V. dahliae* were calculated by analyzing a MAT1-1-1 codon sequence alignment including sequences from all other fungi listed except *P. fulva*. Results for the ten species *A. fumigatus* – *S. sclerotiorum* were calculated using a codon alignment of only these ten species.

[^2^] Homothallic fungus.

[^3^] Results for the putatively asexual fungus *P. fulva* were calculated by analyzing a MAT1-2-1 codon sequence alignment including sequences from all other fungi listed except *V. dahliae*.

[^4^] doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0112145.t003

### Table 4. Comparison of codons under positive (relaxed) and purifying selection in MAT1-2-1, in a variety of fungi in the subphylum Pezizomycotina using the MEC model.

| Fungal taxon                  | MAT1-2-1 accession no. | Transcript length (codons) | Codons under positive selection | Codons under strong purifying selection |
|------------------------------|------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------------|
| Verticillium dahliae[^1^]     | VDAG_02444             | 232                        | 21 (9%)                        | 81 (35%)                               |
| Chaetomium globosum          | CHGG_03580             | 342                        | 74 (22%)                       | 101 (30%)                              |
| Aspergillus nidulans[^2^]    | ANID_04734             | 318                        | 70 (22%)                       | 95 (30%)                               |
| Colletotrichum graminicola   | GLRG_04643             | 238                        | 42 (18%)                       | 76 (32%)                               |
| Fusarium graminearum[^2^]    | FGSG_08893             | 253                        | 52 (21%)                       | 76 (30%)                               |
| Fusarium sacchari            | NCBI GenBank JF776855  | 227                        | 48 (21%)                       | 69 (30%)                               |
| Magnaporthe grisea           | MG_02978               | 437                        | 52 (12%)                       | 150 (34%)                              |
| Ophiostoma novo-ulmi         | NCBI GenBank FJ959052  | 183                        | 33 (18%)                       | 59 (32%)                               |
| Podospora anserina           | Pa_1_20590             | 582                        | 74 (13%)                       | 124 (21%)                              |
| Penicillium chrysogenum      | NCBI GenBank AM904545  | 303                        | 64 (21%)                       | 91 (30%)                               |
| Trichoderma reesi            | TRI14830               | 241                        | 46 (19%)                       | 56 (23%)                               |
| Passalora fulva[^3^]         | DQ659351               | 384                        | 45 (11%)                       | 133 (34%)                              |

[^1^] SELECTON results for the putatively asexual fungus *V. dahliae* were calculated by analyzing a MAT1-2-1 codon sequence alignment including sequences from all other fungi listed except *P. fulva*. Results for the ten species *C. globosum* – *T. reseei* were calculated using a codon alignment of only these ten species.

[^2^] Homothallic fungus.

[^3^] Results for the putatively asexual fungus *P. fulva* were calculated by analyzing a MAT1-2-1 codon sequence alignment including sequences from all other fungi listed except *V. dahliae*.

[^4^] doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0112145.t004
Table 5. Comparison of codons under positive (relaxed) and purifying selection in 18 sex-related genes in *Verticillium dahliae* using the MEC model.

| V. dahliae accession | Locus   | Transcript length (codons) | Codons under positive selection | Codons under strong purifying selection |
|----------------------|---------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------------|
| VDAG_00116           | KEX1    | 384                         | 0 (0%)                          | 154 (40%)                              |
| VDAG_08796           | MIZ3    | 354                         | 0 (0%)                          | 142 (40%)                              |
| VDAG_02856           | MSH4    | 843                         | 40 (3%)                         | 313 (37%)                              |
| VDAG_08845           | MSH5    | 863                         | 8 (1%)                          | 340 (39%)                              |
| VDAG_01559           | MUS50   | 1166                        | 5 (-1%)                         | 462 (40%)                              |
| VDAG_01559           | MUTL    | 704                         | 2 (-1%)                         | 281 (40%)                              |
| VDAG_08702           | RAD21   | 530                         | 0 (0%)                          | 258 (49%)                              |
| VDAG_02310           | RAD54   | 651                         | 0 (0%)                          | 261 (40%)                              |
| VDAG_05598           | RAM1    | 469                         | 4 (-1%)                         | 185 (39%)                              |
| VDAG_06292           | RCE1    | 304                         | 1 (-1%)                         | 122 (40%)                              |
| VDAG_02664           | RCE8    | 452                         | 33 (2%)                         | 281 (62%)                              |
| VDAG_01783           | RID     | 957                         | 66 (5%)                         | 343 (36%)                              |
| VDAG_07486           | SKI8    | 336                         | 1 (-1%)                         | 135 (40%)                              |
| VDAG_09359           | SPO11   | 425                         | 38 (3%)                         | 149 (35%)                              |
| VDAG_05762           | STE23   | 941                         | 0 (0%)                          | 377 (40%)                              |
| VDAG_06443           | STE24   | 300                         | 21 (1%)                         | 107 (36%)                              |
| VDAG_01200           | STE6    | 1416                        | 23 (1%)                         | 526 (37%)                              |
| VDAG_03579           | V-SNARE | 128                         | 0 (0%)                          | 51 (40%)                               |

1Fungal taxa and gene accessions used to estimate selective pressures in *V. dahliae* genes are provided in Table S2. Color-coded SELECTON results for each gene are provided in Figure S1.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0112145.t005

Verticillium genome queries and ortholog searches

The FUNGIpath ortholog database was queried using a panel of 93 genes that have been characterized for functions related to sexual reproduction in the fungal model systems *Neurospora crassa*, *Saccharomyces cerevisiae*, and *Podospora anserina*. The set of 93 genes comprised the two mating type genes MAT1-1-1 and MAT1-2-1, 81 previously described *Neurospora crassa* genes associated with meiosis [36,59,60] which were retrieved from the *Neurospora* Genome Database [61,62], four previously described *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* pseudomere-related genes STE23, RCE1, AFC1, KEX1 [63], which were retrieved from the *Saccharomyces* Genome Database [24,64], and three *Podospora anserina* pseudomere-related genes PRE2, RAM1, STE6 [65] which were retrieved from the *Podospora anserina* Genome Database [25,65]. Since *V. dahliae* is heterothallic and the sequenced strain contains only MAT1-2-1, a sequence of *V. dahliae* MAT1-I-1 was obtained through National Center of Biotechnology Information (NCBI) GenBank, Accession AB505215 [27]. Finally, three additional *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* genes broadly associated with meiosis in eukaryotes (*HOP1, HOP2, and MND1*) [10] were queried against the FUNGIpath database. For FUNGIpath ortholog database searches, either gene accession ids. or amino acid sequences were used as input [41]. In this way, *V. dahliae* genes were verified as orthologous to genes from sexual fungi. Ortholog gene accession ids. from other fungi in the *Pezizomycotina* were noted and downloaded from the respective genome databases for subsequent analyses.

Primer design

After identifying orthologs to sex-related genes in the genome of *V. dahliae*, coding sequences of MAT genes and eight other genes associated with meiosis in other systems were arbitrarily chosen...
and downloaded from the Broad Institute website [41]. Forward and reverse primers were designed to amplify ~500 to 1000-bp targets within coding sequences for 8 of the genes, whereas the previously described primers AL3-MAT1r and HMG21f-MAT21r [29] were used to amplify MAT1-1-1 and MAT1-2-1, respectively (Table 6).

**RNA Extraction and RT-PCR**

The two *V. dahliae* isolates 58 (MAT1-1-1) and Ls 17 (MAT1-2-1) were grown on PDA. For each culture, after ten days, 3 ml of sterile distilled water was poured onto the culture surface and spread with a plate spreader. One ml of the resulting conidia and hyphal suspensions was transferred to a 47 mm nitrocellulose membrane (0.45 μm pore size; Whatman, Maidstone, England) overlaid on a PDA plate. Cultures were maintained in the dark at 25°C. After 10 days, the nitrocellulose membranes covered in fungal tissue were harvested with sterilized forceps and ground to a fine powder in liquid nitrogen using a mortar and pestle. Total RNA was extracted from 100 mg of the ground powder using TRizol Reagent (Life Technologies, Carlsbad, CA) following the manufacturer’s protocol. Total RNA extracts were treated with TURBO DNase (Life Technologies, Carlsbad, CA) following the manufacturer’s protocol, in order to degrade genomic DNA.

Reverse-transcriptase PCR (RT-PCR) was performed using a SuperScript III OneStep RT-PCR system with Platinum Taq DNA polymerase (Life Technologies, Carlsbad, CA) following the manufacturer’s protocol. For RT-PCR the following thermal profile was used: a cDNA synthesis cycle of 30 min at 55°C, an initial denaturation of 94°C for 2 minutes, 40 cycles of 94°C for 15 sec, 55°C for 30 sec, and 68°C for 1 min, followed by a final extension of 68°C for 5 min. Separate reactions including ten micromolar concentrations of forward and reverse primers for each and every locus described above were performed. For a positive control, RT-PCR was performed with the primers AaDTr (CTGGATGGAGACGTAGAAGGC) and Df (CTCGATGCT-CAAGCAGTACAT), which target *ACT* (VDAG_08445). Amplicons were visualized as above.

To verify the absence of genomic DNA in both of the RNA preparations, SuperScript III/RT Platinum Taq mix was omitted from PCR assays, and instead, two units of Platinum Taq DNA polymerase (Life Technologies, Carlsbad, CA) were used in reactions using the primers AaDTr and Df, in accordance with the manufacturer’s instructions.

**SELECTON analyses of positive and purifying selection in**

**MAT1-1-1, MAT1-2-1, and other sex-related genes of**

**V. dahliae**

To test the hypothesis that *V. dahliae* mating type and meiosis-associated genes are being maintained under strong purifying selection, ratios of non-synonymous (amino-acid altering) to synonymous (silent) substitutions in *V. dahliae* genes (relative to sexual fungi) were calculated through the SELECTON server [66,67]. All MAT genes used in this study were either identified directly through the FUNGIPath database, or were obtained through NCBI GenBank and verified as orthologs to either
Table 6. Primers used to amplify V. dahliae sex-related genes with RT-PCR.

| Gene name | V. dahliae accession⁠ ¹ | Fw primer 5’–3’ | Rv primer 5’–3’ |
|-----------|-------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| MAT1-1-1  | NA ¹                    | CGATCGGATATCGGCAAGG | CAGTCAGATCCAACCTGCTGAG |
| MAT1-2-1  | VDAG_02444              | GCAAATCTCACCTCGTCAG | CTGCGGATATACACGACCA |
| STE6      | VDAG_01200              | GCAAACTCTCCACCTCGTC | CAGTTCGTCCTCCACCTTTGT |
| MUS50     | VDAG_01559              | GCACCTATCGCGGATCCTAC | CTCTTCTTGGTGCGACAG |
| RAD54     | VDAG_02310              | GCAACGACGTCATCGAAGT | GGTTGACGAGCTTTGGAGG |
| RAM1      | VDAG_05598              | GCTTCCTACGCCCACGACAC | GTCGACCTACGCCCATAC |
| STE23     | VDAG_05762              | ACAGGTTCTGCACCATCC | GACATGTTGTCGTAAAGTC |
| MUTL      | VDAG_08805              | AAGGCTTCTACGCGCAATTTT | TCACTGTTCGCTGCTGCTG |
| MUS58     | VDAG_08845              | CGGGACATTTACCGATGAAC | TCCTCAGCATCCCTCAGTCT |

¹The genome of V. dahliae strain Ls 17 contains only MAT1-2. MAT1-1-1 sequence obtained from NCBI GenBank. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0112145.t006

MAT1-1-1 or MAT1-2-1 using the ortholog search function in the FUNGIPath.

Additionally, ortholog search results from the FUNGIPath database from taxa within the subphylum Pezizomycotina were downloaded for 18 arbitrarily chosen, previously characterized genes associated with meiosis (Table S2), which represented a subset of the aforementioned 93 genes. Unaligned nucleotide sequences are provided in Table 2 and Table S2.

For each of the 20 V. dahliae reported on a scale of 1–7, with scores of one or two indicating different taxa were used as input, based on availability. Transcript sequences from the following fungi with known sexual stages: Aspergillus fumigatus [70], Aspergillus nidulans [71], Botrytis cinerea [72,73], Chaetomium globosum [74], Colletotrichum graminicola [75,76], Epiilec festucae [77], Eupenicillium crustaceum [78], Fusarium graminearum [79], Histoplasma capsulatum [80], Magnaporthe oryzae [81], Neurospora crassa [82], Nectria haematococca [82], Ophiostoma novo-ulmi (NCBI GenBank ADB96163), Penicillium chrysogenum [83], Podospora anserina [65], Sclerotinia sclerotiorum [73], Trichoderma reesei [84] and Zymoseptoria tritici [85]. For each of the 20 V. dahliae genes analyzed, sequences from different taxa were used as input, based on availability. Transcript sequences of the relevant genes from fungal taxa were obtained from multiple sources, and accession numbers of fungal gene sequences are provided in Table 2 and Table S2.

Codon alignments were generated by the SELECTON server and for each codon, the Ka/Ks ratio was estimated using a Bayesian approach. SELECTON results for each codon were reported on a scale of 1–7, with scores of one or two indicating positive selection, and scores of six or seven indicating strong purifying selection. For comparative purposes, two evolutionary models with positive selection enabled were used in the analyses, namely the M8 model [86,87] and the mechanistic–empirical combination (MEC) model [88]. SELECTON implements several codon models, each of which assumes different biological assumptions. The MEC model takes into account the differences between different amino-acid replacement probabilities. For analyses with the MEC model, eight categories for the distribution, a JTT empirical amino-acid matrix, and a high precision level were used. In cases where positive selection sites were detected using the MEC model, a likelihood ratio test between the results of the MEC model and the M8a (null) model was performed, by comparing Akaike Information Content (AIC) scores [89].

Estimates of selection in genes may be influenced by the choice of taxa used in the codon alignment. Therefore, for comparative purposes of the two mating type genes, Ka/Ks ratios within each of the other MAT1-1-1 and MAT1-2-1 sequences from other species were also calculated as above. For these analyses, the V. dahliae sequence was removed from the set of nucleotide sequences, and each sequence from every fungal species was considered independently as the query sequence. Thus, the Ka/Ks ratios of MAT loci were calculated for several sexual fungi, relative to the same set of taxa used to estimate selective pressures in V. dahliae mating type genes. Lastly, the Ka/Ks ratios in MAT1-1-1 and MAT1-2-1 from Passalora fulvum, a putatively asexual species, were calculated in comparison with the same set of sexual fungi used in the analyses of V. dahliae genes.

Supporting Information

Figure S1 Color-coded results of SELECTON analyses of 18 V. dahliae sex-related genes, compared to sequences from nine different sexual fungi in the Pezizomycotina. (PPTX)

Table S1 V. dahliae isolates used in this study along with country of origin, location, plant host, and mating types, as determined by PCR assays. (XLSX)

Table S2 List of fungal gene sequence accessions and results from SELECTON analyses of V. dahliae genes associated with meiosis in model systems. (XLSX)
Acknowledgments

The authors are grateful for the fine technical assistance of Rosa Marchebout.

References

1. Weissman A (1889) The significance of sexual reproduction in the theory of natural selection. In: Poultot EB, Schönland S, Shipley AE, editors. Essays upon kindred biological problems. Oxford: Clarendon. pp. 251-332.

2. Otto SP (2009) The evolutionary enigma of sex. Am Nat 174: S1-S14.

3. Goddard MR, Godfry HJ, Burt A (2005) Sex increases the efficacy of natural selection in experimental yeast populations. Nature 434: 636-640.

4. O’Gorman CM, Fuller HT, Dyer PS (2008) Discovery of a sexual cycle in the opportunistic fungal pathogen, Aspergillus fumigatus. Nature 457: 471-474.

5. Short DPG, O’Gorman CM (2008) Recombination and the multilocus structure of fungal complex in human infections and the descriptions of F. keratoplasticum sp. nov. and P. sordidum stat. nov. Fungal Genet Biol 53: 59-70.

6. Sales D, Xu P, Shen Y, Li G, Adres H, et al. (2012) Sex in the Asian population of the rice blast fungus Magnaporthe oryzae reproduces sexually. Mol Ecol 21: 1350-1354.

7. Dyer PS, O’Gorman CM (2011) A fungal sexual revolution: Aspergillus and Penicillium show the way. Curr Opin Microbiol 14: 649-654.

8. Milgroom MG (1996) Recombination and the multi locus structure of fungal populations. Annu Rev Phytopathol 34: 457-477.

9. Tábaryere M, Kjelberg F, Arnaud J, Ouy B, Bérouard SF, et al. (1991) Are eukaryotic microorganisms clonal or sexual? A population genetics vegetation. P Natl Acad Sci USA 88: 5129-5133.

10. Schurko AM, Logdon JM (2008) Using a metiotic detectable tool to investigate ancient assexual “ascanid” and the evolution of sex. Bioessays 30: 579-589.

11. Henk DA, Shahar-Golan R, Devi KR, Zhan N, et al. (2012) Clonality despite sex: the evolution of host-associated sexual neighborhoods in the pathogenic fungus Penicillium marneffei. PLoS Pathog 8: e1002831.

12. Ramesh MA, Malik S-B, Logsdon Jr JM (2005) A phylogenomic inventory of meiotic genes: evidence for sex in Gonoconidia and an early eukaryotic origin of meiosis.Curr Biol 15: 185-191.

13. Butler G (2010) Fungal sex and pathogenesis. Clin Microbiol Rev 23: 140-159.

14. Butler G, Pauletto M, Archer DB (2003) Genomics reveals sexual secrets of Aspergillus. Microbiol 149: 2301-2303.

15. Dyer PS, O’Gorman CM (2012) Sexual development and cryptic sexuality in field. Phytopathology 45: 180-181.

16. Dyer PS, O’Gorman CM (2012) Sexual development and cryptic sexuality in field. Phytopathology 45: 180-181.

17. Joaquim TR, Rowe RC (1991) Vegetative compatibility and virulence of strains of Verticillium dahliae from soil and potato plants. Phytopathology 81: 592-598.

18. Pahalla J, Hummel M (1983) Vegetative compatibility groups within the Verticillium dahliae Phytopathology 73: 1.

19. Milgroom MG, del Mar Jimenez-Gasco M, Concepcion O-G, Jimenez-Diaz (2013) New insights on the phylogenetic relationships between strains of Verticillium dahliae. In: Koopmann B, Tiedemann Av, editors. 11th International Verticillium Symposium - Göttingen 2013. Braunschweig: DFG-Verlag.

20. Milgroom MG, del Mar Jimenez-Gasco M, Garcia CO, Drott MT, Jimenez-Diaz RM (2014) Recombination between clonal lineages of the assexual fungus Verticillium dahliae detected by genotyping by sequencing. PLoS ONE 9: e916274.

21. Metzenberg RL, Glass NL (1990) Mating type and mating strategies in Neurospora. Bioessays 12: 55-59.

22. Debuchy R, Turgeon BG (2006) Mating-Type Structure, Evolution, and Function in Eukaryotic Systems. In: U K, Fischer R, editors. The Mycota Volume I: Function in Euascomycetes. In: U K, Fischer R, editors. The Mycota Volume I: Function in Euascomycetes. Berlin: Springer-Verlag. 293–323.

23. Turgeon BG, Yoder O (2000) Proposed nomenclature for mating type genes of filamentous ascomycetes. Fungal Genet Biol 31: 1-5.

24. Usami T, Ishi A, Amemiya Y (2009) Asexual fungus Verticillium dahliae is potentially heterothallic. J Gen Plant Pathol 75: 422-427.

25. Usami T, Ishi M, Amemiya Y (2008) Mating type gene MAT1-2 is common among Japanese isolates of Verticillium dahliae. Physiol Mol Plant Pathol 73: 133-137.

26. Inderbitzin P, Davis RM, Usami T, Bostock RM, Subbarao KV (2011) The ascomycete Verticillium longisporum is a hybrid and a plant pathogen with an expanded host range. PLoS ONE 6: e182690.

Author Contributions

Conceived and designed the experiments: DPGS SG KH KVS. Performed the experiments: DPGS SG KH. Analyzed the data: DPGS SG KH PI KVS. Contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools: KVS. Contributed to the writing of the manuscript: DPGS SG KH PI KVS.
Botrytis cinerea

72. Staats M, van Kan JAL (2012) Genome update of

63. Bidard F, Ait Benkhali J, Coppin E, Imbeaud S, Grognet P, et al. (2011)

62. Clutterbuck AJ (1996) Parasexual recombination in fungi. J Genet 75: 281–286.

61. Galagan JE, Calvo SE, Borkovich KA, Selker EU, Read ND, et al. (2003) The

60. Ropars J, Dupont J, Fontanillas E, Rodrı´guez de la Vega RC, Malagnac F, et al.

59. Borkovich KA, Alex LA, Yarden O, Freitag M, Turner GE, et al. (2004) Lessons

58. Pasqualotto AC, Denning DW, Anderson JJ (2007) A cautionary tale: lack of

57. Maruthachalam K, Atallah ZK, Vallad GE, Klosterman SJ, Hayes RJ, et al.

56. Almany GR, De Arruda MP, Arthofer W, Atallah Z, Beissinger SR, et al. (2009)

55. Gurung S, Short D, Adhikari T (2013) Global population structure and

migration patterns suggest significant population differentiation among isolates of

Pyrenophora tritici-repentis. Fungal Genet Biol 52: 32–41.

54. Almany GR, De Arruda MP, Anthorfer W, Atallah Z, Beissinger SR, et al. (2009)

Penicillium genetic resources added to molecular ecology resources database. 1 May 2009–31 July 2009. Mol Ecol Resour 9: 1460–1466.

53. Maruthachalam K, Atallah ZK, Vallad GE, Klosterman SJ, Hayes RJ, et al. (2010) Molecular variation among isolates of Verticillium dahliae and polymerase chain reaction-based differentiation of races. Phytopathology 100: 1222–1230.

52. Pasqualotto AC, Denning DW, Anderson JJ (2007) A cautionary tale: lack of

consistency in allele sizes between two laboratories for a published multilocus microsatellite typing system. J Clin Microbiol 45: 522–528.

51. Borkovich KA, Alex LA, Yarden O, Freitag M, Turner GE, et al. (2004) Lessons

from the genome sequence of Neurospora crassa: tracing the path from genomic

blueprint to multicellular organism. Microbiol Mol Biol Rev 68: 1–108.

50. Rogers J, Dupont J, Fontanillas E, Rodrigues de la Vega RC, Malagnac F, et al.

(2012) Sex in cheese: evidence for sexuality in the fungus Penicillium roqueforti.

PLoS ONE 7: e49665.

49. Galagan JE, Calvo SE, Borkovich KA, Selker EU, Read ND, et al. (2003) The

genome sequence of the filamentous fungus Neurospora crassa. Nature 422: 859–868.

48. Clutterbuck AJ (1996) Parasexual recombination in fungi. J Genet 75: 281–286.

47. Biddard F, Att Benkhali J, Coppin E, Imbeaud S, Grognet P, et al. (2011) Genome-wide gene expression profiling of fertilization competent mycelium in opposite mating types in the heterothallic fungus Podospora anserina. PLoS ONE 6: e21476.

46. Cherry JM, Hong EL, Amdurden C, Balakrishnan R, Binkley G, et al. (2012)

Sacharomyces Genome Database: the genomics resource of budding yeast.

Nucleic Acids Res 40: D700-D703.

45. Espagne E, Lespinet O, Malagnac F, Da Silva C, Jaillon O, et al. (2008) The
genome sequence of the model ascomycete fungus Podospora anserina. Genome

Biol 9: R77.

44. Doron-Faigenboim A, Stern A, Mayrose I, Bacharach E, Pupko T (2005)

Selection: a server for detecting evolutionary forces at a single amino-acid site.
Bioinform 21: 2101–2103.

43. Stern A, Doron-Faigenboim A, Erez E, Martz E, Bacharach E, et al. (2007)

SelectionDB: advanced models for detecting positive and purifying selection

using a Bayesian inference approach. Nucleic Acids Res 35: W506-W511.

42. Grossetête S, Labetdan B, Lespinet O (2010) FUNGIpath: a tool to assess fungal

pathogenicity, in planta virulence, and symbiotic ability of filamentous fungal

species. PLoS ONE 5: e112145.