A serological study of severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome using a virus neutralization test and competitive enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay

Hyojin Lee1, Eun-Ju Kim1, In-Soo Cho1, Jae-Young Song1, Jeong Soo Choi2, Ji Youn Lee2, Yeun-Kyung Shin1,*

1Viral Disease Division, and 2Foreign Animal Disease Division, Animal and Plant Quarantine Agency, Gimcheon 39660, Korea

Severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome (SFTS) is caused by the SFTS virus (SFTSV). The SFTSV appears to have a wide host range, as SFTSV-positive ticks have been isolated from both farm animals and wild rodents. Therefore, it is important to monitor SFTSV-positive animals to prevent the transmission of SFTSV from animals to humans. Previously, we developed a competitive enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (cELISA) to detect SFTSV-specific antibodies from field animals and compared the cELISA results to those from an indirect immunofluorescence assay (IFA). In this study, cELISA results were compared to and evaluated against the results from both an IFA and a virus neutralization (VN) test of 193 bovine serum samples (including two bovine positive control sera) and 70 horse serum samples. The consistency (98.9%) between cELISA and VN results was higher than that (97.4%) between cELISA and IFA for the bovine serum samples. Similarly, for the horse serum samples, the consistency (88.6%) between cELISA and VN results was higher than that (84.3%) between the cELISA and IFA. These findings indicate that our newly developed cELISA can be used for surveillance or epidemiological studies of SFTSV in animals.

Keywords: competitive enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay, severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome, virus neutralization test

Introduction

Severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome (SFTS) is a newly emerged tick-borne viral disease in humans. It has been reported in China since 2009 and in South Korea and Japan since 2012 and 2013, respectively; the fatality rate is 12%, 55%, and 61% in China, Japan, and Korea, each [8,17,19]. The name is derived from the clinical symptoms of the disease, i.e., severe fever and thrombocytopenia; therefore, the pathogen is called the SFTS virus (SFTSV). The SFTSV belongs to the family Bunyaviridae and the genus Phlebovirus and has three single-strand negative RNA segments consisting of S, M, and L segments. The S segment encodes the nucleocapsid and non-structural proteins, the M segment encodes two glycoproteins for viral envelope components, and the L segment encodes an RNA-dependent RNA polymerase [10,11].

Domesticated animals from farms located in areas where human patients with SFTS have been reported had a high seroprevalence of SFTSV and shared genetic homology [14,21]. These findings indicate that animals are an important reservoir for the SFTSV; however, little has been reported about the host species or transmission cycle because clinical signs of the illness or disease have not been observed in animals [14]. Therefore, serological diagnosis in multiple animal species is necessary to study how to prevent the transmission of the disease from animals to humans.

Enzyme-linked immunosorbent assays (ELISAs) have become the primary method for assessing a large number of samples with a simplified protocol and standardized results. However, previously developed, high-performance ELISA formats are not commercially available [6]. The competitive ELISA (cELISA), which we developed previously [10], is based on the competition between SFTSV-specific antibodies in the test serum and monoclonal antibodies (mAb) against the SFTSV nucleocapsid protein (NP). This cELISA was designed for the serodiagnosis of SFTSV in multiple animal species and was validated by using bovine serum samples. However, because we used an indirect immunofluorescence assay (IFA)
as the reference test, it was difficult to predict the exact performance of the cELISA when using field samples with non-specific reactions. Therefore, we adopted a virus neutralization (VN) test as the reference to evaluate the developed cELISA. In this study, we collected bovine and horse serum samples and compared the results from the cELISA, VN test, and IFA.

Materials and Methods

Cell culture and virus
Vero E6 cells (CRL-1586; ATCC, USA) were used for virus amplification, neutralization, and the IFA. Vero cell culture was performed according to the maintenance protocol [1]. The SFTSV was obtained from the Korea Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and was isolated from a human patient in South Korea in 2013 [20].

SFTSV-positive control and field samples
All animal experiments followed the protocols of the Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee of the Animal and Plant Quarantine Agency of the Republic of Korea. SFTSV-positive control bovine serum samples were generated by immunizing laboratory animals with inactivated SFTSV [10]. Briefly, 60 mL of 10^7 TCID50/mL SFTSV were inactivated with a 0.025% formalin solution and concentrated five-fold. Inactivated SFTSV (2 mL) was emulsified in adjuvant and injected into two 4-month-old cattle via intramuscular injection. The immunizing dose of virus particles was subcutaneously administered three times every other week, and a SFTSV-specific reverse-transcription polymerase chain reaction using white cells from the target animals was performed to confirm experimental safety.

Field bovine serum samples (n = 191) were collected from farms and slaughter houses in the southern part of South Korea (Gyeongbuk and Jeju provinces) from October 2013 to April 2015. Field horse serum samples (n = 70) were collected from farms in the southern part of South Korea (Jeonbuk province) from June 2013 to April 2015.

cELISA
To perform the cELISA, we followed the previously reported protocol [12]. Briefly, the recombinant NP was used as the coating antigen. Then, 100 ng/well of purified NP was coated onto Polysorp ELISA plates (Nunc, USA) for 16 h at 4°C. The non-specific protein interaction was blocked with 5% skim milk in 1× phosphate-buffered saline, and 50 μL of five-fold-diluted test sera and horseradish peroxidase-conjugated mAb (1:500) were added to the antigen-coated plate. The competitive reaction was performed for 90 min at 37°C. Then, the 3,3',5,5'-tetramethylbenzidine (TMB) peroxidase substrate (KPL, USA) was added as the horseradish peroxidase substrate. Color development was terminated with TMB stop solution (KPL). Optical density (OD) was measured with a spectrophotometer (BioTek Instruments, USA) at both 450 and 630 nm. The OD at 450 nm minus the OD at 630 nm was used for background normalization. The percent inhibition (PI) values were calculated with the following formula: PI = [1 – (OD test sample/OD negative control)] × 100.

IFA
The IFAs were performed as previously reported [10]. Briefly, Vero E6 cells in 150 cm^2 culture vessels (Corning, USA) were sensitized with 2 mL of 1 × 10^5 TCID50/mL SFTSV for 1 h at 37°C. The infected cells were detached with 0.25% trypsin-ethylene diaminetetraacetic acid (Gibco, USA) 6 days after infection. The floating cells were spotted onto reaction wells (Paul Marienfeld, Germany) and fixed with a methanol:acetone (1:1) solution. Sera samples were incubated with fixed cells for 1 h at 37°C, and the fluorescence was detected using fluorescein isothiocyanate (FITC)-labeled secondary antibodies. The fluorescence was observed by using a Nikon TE-2000U fluorescence microscope (Nikon, Japan). The anti-bovine and anti-horse secondary antibodies (KPL) were diluted to 2.5 μg/mL prior to use.

Neutralization test
The VN test was performed as previously reported [3,5,19] with slight modifications. Briefly, heat-inactivated serum samples (30 min at 56°C) were serially diluted from a 1:2 stock. Then, 50 μL of the diluted serum was mixed with an equal volume of 200 TCID50 SFTSV. The mixture was incubated for 1 h at 37°C. After incubation, the mixture and Vero cells (3 × 10^5 cells/100 μL) were cultured in 96-well culture plates for more than 3 days at 37°C. Virus back-titration was included in the test to measure the virus input. The presence of viral infection was determined by using NP-specific rabbit polyclonal antibodies [10] and FITC-labeled secondary antibodies after the cells were fixed. The highest serum dilution that completely protected the cells from virus infection was selected as the neutralizing antibody titer.

Statistical analysis
Efficacy of the cELISA was compared to the reference tests by using the field serum samples and the experimentally immunized serum samples. The Cohen’s kappa coefficient was calculated to measure the agreement between the cELISA and reference test results [9]. The graphs and receiver-operating characteristic (ROC) curves [22] were drawn by using the graph function in Excel 2010 (Microsoft, USA).
Results

Generation of SFTSV-positive bovine sera for the cELISA and VN

In the absence of a reported SFTSV-positive control panel of sera, laboratory-generated SFTSV antibody-positive bovine sera were used to test the efficacy of the cELISA and to confirm the obtained titers with the VN test. Inactivated SFTSV was individually injected into two different cattle, and the antibody titers were tested by using the cELISA and VN test before and after each interval of three antigen injections. The PI value gradually increased from 0% to 89.1% in cattle 1 and from 0% to 96.8% in cattle 2, and the neutralization antibody titer also significantly increased (Fig. 1).

Comparisons among the cELISA, IFA, and VN test for the field bovine sera

The cELISA results were compared to the results of the IFA...
Comparisons among the cELISA, IFA, and VN test for the field horse sera

Serum samples from horses were tested to compare the cELISA results with the results from the reference methods (IFA and VN tests) to determine the developed cELISA usefulness in another animal species. According to the area under the curve (AUC) from the ROC curves from the reference tests, the IFA and VN test cut-off dilution rates that distinguished the positive and negative SFTSV samples were 1:32 and 1:16.

### Table 1. Relative specificity and sensitivity of the competitive enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (cELISA) compared to the immunofluorescence assay (IFA) and the virus neutralization (VN) test as determined by assessing 191 field bovine serum samples and two positive control bovine serum samples

| cELISA | IFA | VN |
|--------|-----|----|
| Positive (≥ 80) | 7 | 5 |
| Negative (< 80) | 1 | 2 |
| Positive (≥ 16) | 4 | 0 |
| Negative (< 16) | 181 | 186 |

- Sensitivity
- Specificity

*The consistency between the IFA and cELISA was 97.4% (188/193) (κ= 0.723). †The consistency between the VN test and cELISA was 98.9% (191/193) (κ = 0.828).

**Fig. 3.** Horse receiver-operating characteristic (ROC) curves for the competitive enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (cELISA) vs. the immunofluorescence assay (IFA) and the virus neutralization (VN) datasets (n = 70), and the frequency distribution of the PI values in the cELISA from 70 horse serum samples. **A** The cELISA ROC curves comparing the correlation with the two different reference methods, i.e., the IFA and the VN test. The area under the curve (AUC) are provided in the inset table. **B** The frequency distributions of the percent inhibition (PI) values from 70 horse serum samples that were determined to be the severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome virus-negative and -positive by the VN test (cut-off dilution rate = 1:16). The established cut-off PI value for the cELISA (57.4%) is indicated by an arrow.
Antibodies against the SFTSV. Moreover, the heartland virus (HRTV), which has a close genetic relationship with the SFTSV, has recently emerged in the United States [13]. As a 17.4% seroprevalence for the HRTV has been reported in horses in the US, we also checked serum samples from field horses in our country [2,16]. Therefore, in the present study, serum samples from both field cattle and horses were primarily tested to detect antibodies against the SFTSV.

The cut-off value for the cELISA was calculated by using SFTSV-negative samples, as determined by the IFA and VN test. Overall, the field serum samples demonstrated that the cELISA had a higher correlation with the VN test than it did with the IFA. Using the IFA as a reference test, the cELISA showed sensitivities of 63.6% and 59.1% for the bovine and horse serum samples, respectively. The low sensitivity is a result of the high number of false negative samples, which were positive in the IFA but negative in the cELISA. Four bovine and nine horse samples with positive signals in the IFA were determined to be false negatives, and the majority of those samples were confirmed to be negative by using the VN test. Consequently, by using the VN test as a reference, our cELISA showed a sensitivity of 100% for the bovine serum samples and a sensitivity of 70.6% for the horse serum samples.

Two bovine samples and three horse samples with PI values greater than the cut-off value displayed low VN titers (<1:16), and five horse samples with high VN titers (≥1:16) had low PI values in the cELISA. This contradictory result between the VN test and cELISA was likely caused by differences in the target antigenic regions of the antibody. It was previously reported that antibodies that can neutralize the SFTSV target the glycoproteins Gn and Gc [5]. However, the developed cELISA detects antibodies against NP, which are not related to the virus-neutralizing reaction [18].

In conclusion, we confirmed the good performance of the newly developed cELISA, performance that is comparable to that of the VN test. We expect to use the developed cELISA to undertake surveillance and epidemiological studies of the SFTSV in animals.

**Acknowledgments**

This study was supported by the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs, Republic of Korea through funds to the Animal and Plant Quarantine Agency.

**Conflict of Interest**

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

**References**

1. Ammerman NC, Beier-Sexton M, Azad AF. Growth and

www.vetsci.org
maintenance of Vero cell lines. Curr Protoc Microbiol 2008, Appendix 4, Appendix 4E.
2. Bosco-Lauth AM, Panella NA, Root JJ, Gidlewski T, Lash RR, Harmon JR, Burkhalter KL, Godsey MS, Savage HM, Nicholson WL, Komar N, Braul AC. Serological investigation of heartland virus (Bunyaviridae: Phleboviruses) exposure in wild and domestic animals adjacent to human case sites in Missouri 2012-2013. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2015, 92, 1163-1167.
3. Cliquet F, Aubert M, Sagné L. Development of a fluorescent antibody virus neutralisation test (FAVN test) for the quantitation of rabies-neutralising antibody. J Immunol Methods 1998, 212, 79-87.
4. Doan HT, Noh JH, Choe SE, Yoo MS, Kim YH, Reddy KE, Quyen DV, Nguyen LT, Nguyen TT, Kweon CH, Jung SC, Chang KY, Kang SW. Molecular detection and phylogenetic analysis of Anaplasma bovis from Haemaphysalis longicornis feeding on grazing cattle in Korea. Vet Parasitol 2013, 196, 478-481.
5. Guo X, Zhang L, Zhang W, Chi Y, Zeng X, Li X, Qi X, Jin Q, Zhang X, Huang M, Wang H, Chen Y, Bao C, Hu J, Liang S, Bao L, Wu T, Zhou M, Jiao Y. Human antibody neutralizes severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome virus, an emerging hemorrhagic fever virus. Clin Vaccine Immunol 2015, 20, 1426-1432.
6. Jiao Y, Zeng X, Guo X, Qi X, Zhang X, Shi Z, Zhou M, Bao C, Zhang W, Xu Y, Wang H. Preparation and evaluation of recombinant severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome virus nucleocapsid protein for detection of total antibodies in human and animal sera by double-antigen sandwich enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay. J Clin Microbiol 2012, 50, 372-377.
7. Kim CM, Kim MS, Park MS, Park JH, Chae JS. Identification of Ehrlichia chaffeensis, Anaplasma phagocytophilum, and A. bovis in Haemaphysalis longicornis and Ixodes persulcatus ticks from Korea. Vector Borne Zoonotic Dis 2003, 3, 17-26.
8. Kim KH, Yi J, Kim G, Choi SJ, Jun KI, Kim NH, Choe PG, Kim NJ, Lee JY, Oh MD. Severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome, South Korea, 2012. Emerg Infect Dis 2013, 19, 1892-1894.
9. Landis JR, Koch GG. An application of hierarchical kappa-type statistics in the assessment of majority agreement among multiple observers. Biometrics 1977, 33, 363-374.
10. Lee H, Kim EJ, Song JY, Choi JS, Lee JY, Cho IS, Shin YK. Development and evaluation of a competitive enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay using a monoclonal antibody for the diagnosis of severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome virus in bovine sera. J Vet Sci 2016, 17, 307-314.
11. Lei XY, Liu MM, Yu XJ. Severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome and its pathogen SFTSV. Microbes Infect 2015, 17, 149-154.
12. Libeau G, DIALLO A, CALVEZ D, LEFÈVRE PC. A competitive ELISA using anti-N monoclonal antibodies for specific detection of rinderpest antibodies in cattle and small ruminants. Vet Microbiol 1992, 31, 147-160.
13. McMullan LK, Folk SM, Kelly AJ, MacNeil A, Goldsmith CS, Metcalfe MG, Batten BC, Albariño CG, Zaki SR, Rollin PE, Nicholson WL, Nichol ST. A new phlebovirus associated with severe febrile illness in Missouri. N Engl J Med 2012, 367, 834-841.
14. Niu G, Li J, Liang M, Jiang X, Jiang M, Yin H, Wang Z, Li C, Zhang Q, Jin C, Wang X, Ding S, Xing Z, Wang S, Bi Z, Li D. Severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome virus among domesticated animals, China. Emerg Infect Dis 2013, 19, 756-763.
15. Park SW, Song BG, Shin EH, Yun SM, Han MG, Park MY, Park C, Ryou J. Prevalence of severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome virus in Haemaphysalis longicornis ticks in South Korea.Ticks Tick Borne Dis 2014, 5, 975-977.
16. Swei A, Russell BJ, Naccache SN, Kabre B, Veeraraghavan N, Pilgaard MA, Johnson BJ, Chiu CY. The genome sequence of Lone Star virus, a highly divergent bunyavirus found in the Amblyomma americanum tick. PLoS One 2013, 8, e62083.
17. Takahashi T, Maeda K, Suzuki T, Ishido A, Shigeoka T, Tomina T, Kamei T, Honda M, Ninomiya D, Sakai T, Senba T, Kaneyuki S, Sakaguchi S, Sato A, Hosokawa T, Kawabe Y, Kurihara S, Izumikawa K, Kohino S, Azuma T, Suemori K, Yasukawa M, Mizutani T, Omatu T, Katayama Y, Miyahara M, Ijuin M, Doi K, Okada M, Umeda K, Saito T, Fukushima K, Nakajima K, Yoshikawa T, Tani H, Fukushi S, Fukuma A, Ogata M, Shimojima M, Nakajima N, Nagata N, Katano H, Fukumoto H, Sato Y, Hasegawa Y, Yamagishi T, Oishi K, Kurane I, Morikawa S, Saito M. The first identification and retrospective study of severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome in Japan. J Infect Dis 2014, 209, 816-827.
18. Yu L, Zhang L, Sun L, Lu J, Wu L, Li C, Zhang Q, Zhang F, Jin C, Wang X, Bi Z, Li D, Liang M. Critical epitopes in the nucleocapsid protein of SFTS virus recognized by a panel of SFTS patients derived human monoclonal antibodies. PLoS One 2012, 7, e38291.
19. Yu XJ, Liang MF, Zhang SY, Liu Y, Li JD, Sun YL, Zhang L, Zhang QF, Popov VL, Li C, Qu J, Li Q, Zhang YF, Hai R, Wu W, Wang Q, Zhan FX, Wang XJ, Kan B, Wang SW, Wan KL, Jing HQ, Lu JX, Yin WW, Zhou H, Guan XH, Liu JF, Bi QZ, Liu GH, Ren J, Wang H, Zhao Z, Song JD, He JR, Wan T, Zhang JS, Fu XP, Sun LN, Dong XP, Feng ZJ, Yang WZ, Hong T, Zhang Y, Walker DH, Wang Y, Li DX. Fever with thrombocytopenia associated with a novel bunyavirus in China. N Engl J Med 2011, 364, 1523-1532.
20. Yun SM, Lee WG, Ryou J, Yang SC, Park SW, Roh JY, Lee YJ, Park C, Han MG. Severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome virus in ticks collected from humans, South Korea, 2013. Emerg Infect Dis 2014, 20, 1358-1361.
21. Zhao L, Zhai S, Wen H, Cui F, Chi Y, Wang L, Yue F, Wang Q, Wang Z, Zhang S, Song Y, Du J, Yu XJ. Severe fever with thrombocytopenia syndrome virus, Shandong Province, China. Emerg Infect Dis 2012, 18, 963-965.
22. Zweig MH, Campbell G. Receiver-operating characteristic (ROC) plots: a fundamental evaluation tool in clinical medicine. Clin Chem 1993, 39, 561-577.