Characteristics of Attempted Suicide by Patients with Schizophrenia Compared with Those with Mood Disorders: A Case-Controlled Study in Northern Japan

Takao Ishii*, Eri Hashimoto*, Wataru Ukai*, Yohei Kakutani, Ryuji Sasaki, Toshikazu Saito

Department of Neuropsychiatry, School of Medicine, Sapporo Medical University, Sapporo, Japan.

Abstract

Recent reports suggest a lifetime suicide risk for schizophrenia patients of approximately 5%. This figure is significantly higher than the general population suicide risk consequently, detection of those at risk is clinically important. This study was undertaken to define the characteristics of suicide attempts by schizophrenia patients compared with attempts by patients with mood disorders. All patients were diagnosed using the ICD-10 criteria. The study population comprised 65 patients with F2 disorders (schizophrenia, schizotypal and delusional disorders), i.e., “the F2 group”, and 94 patients with F3 disorders (mood disorders), i.e., “the F3 group”, who presented in the clinical setting of consultation-liaison psychiatry. The F2 group had a significantly younger mean age and significantly higher ratios of ‘past/present psychiatric treatment’ and ‘more than 3 months interruption of psychiatric treatment’. In contrast, the ratios of ‘physical disorder comorbidity’, ‘alcohol intake at suicide attempt’ and ‘suicide note left behind’ were significantly higher in the F3 group. The F2 group attempted suicide by significantly more serious methods. Furthermore, ‘hallucination-delusion’ was the most prevalent motive in the F2 group and was the only factor that showed a significant association with the seriousness of the method of suicide attempt (OR = 3.36, 95% CI: 1.05–11.33).

Methods

This case-controlled study was conducted at Sapporo Medical University Hospital in Sapporo, Japan. The subjects of the present study were selected from among 397 patients that had attempted...
Suicide Attempts in Schizophrenia Patients

Table 1. Classification of the suicide attempt seriousness.

| Methods                        | Absolutely dangerous group (AD group)                      | Relative dangerous group (RD group)                  |
|--------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|
| Jumping from a height          | >10 m (From higher than fourth floor)                      | ≤10 m (From lower than third floor)                  |
| Jumping in front of a moving   | All cases AD group                                         | -                                                   |
| train/high-speed cars          |                                                            |                                                     |
| Cutting/stabbing               | Presence of the injury of internal organ                   | An internal organ does not have the injury          |
| Drug overdosing                | The fatal dose or more                                     | Less than fatal dose A respirator, dialysis is unused|
| Poisoning                      | Requiring a respirator or hemodialysis                     | Less than fatal dose A respirator, dialysis is unused|
| Hanging                        | All cases AD group                                         | -                                                   |
| Burning                        | More than 30% of extent of burn class II                   | Other than left cases                                |
|                               | More than 30% of extent of burn class III                  | Other than left cases                                |
|                               | Smoke inhalation                                           | Other than left cases                                |
| Drowning                       | Unconsciousness and respiratory failure are present at     | Other than left cases                                |
|                               | discovery                                                  |                                                     |
| Gassing                        | The thing which was coma at discovery                      | Other than left cases                                |
| Freezing                       | Unconsciousness and hypothermia at discovery               | Other than left cases                                |

The classification of the suicide attempter by Asukai [Psychiatry Clin Neurosci. 1995; 49: 91–97.] is partially modified.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0096272.t001

suicide and consulted the department of Neuropsychiatry between December 2002 and July 2013. All patients were diagnosed using the ICD-10 criteria. Of them, 159 were extracted for the study population with F2 (schizophrenia, schizotypal and delusional disorders; 65 patients, i.e., “the F2 group”) or F3 (mood disorders; 94 patients, i.e., “the F3 group”). The F3 group included 11 patients diagnosed with bipolar affective disorder (F31): 1 with F31.0 (Bipolar affective disorder, current episode hypomanic), 8 with F31.3 (Bipolar affective disorder, current episode mild or moderate depression) or F31.5 (Bipolar affective disorder, current episode severe depression without psychotic symptoms), and 2 with F31.6 (Bipolar affective disorder, current episode mixed). The patients other than F31 in the F3 group are diagnosed with F32 (Depressive episode) or F33 (Recurrent depressive disorder), namely unipolar depression. The breakdown of 238 patients other than F2 and F3 group was as follows: 7 with F0 (organic, including symptomatic, mental disorders), 16 with F1 (mental and behavioral disorders due to psychoactive substance use), 13 with F4 (neurotic, stress-related and somatoform disorders), 1 with F5 (behavioral syndromes associated with physiological disturbances and physical factors), 70 with F6 (disorders of adult personality and behavior), 10 with F7 (mental retardation) or F8 (disorders of psychological development), 121 others.

Patients' medical records were reviewed and the following data extracted: age, gender, previous suicide attempt, within-1-year suicide reattempts, physical disorder, unemployed, requiring public assistance, living alone, past/present psychiatric treatment, more than 3 months interruption of psychiatric treatment, seriousness of the method of attempted suicide, alcohol intake at suicide attempt, method, motive and suicide note left behind.

Respecting the seriousness of the method of attempted suicide, the study population was classified into two groups according to the criteria shown in Table 1. These criteria are based on the classification of the suicide attempter by Asukai [13]. We modified it with two additions: 1 adding ‘or high-speed car’ to ‘jumping in front of a moving train’; 2 adding ‘Freezing’ to the methods since our hospital is located in the north part of Japan thus deliberate exposure to winter conditions can be a suicide method. Patients who used serious methods in their suicide attempts were classified as absolutely dangerous group (AD group) and those who used relatively mild methods as relatively dangerous group (RD group).

Then we sought associations between the seriousness of the attempt method and particular characteristics of patient and suicide attempt other than ‘method’ in the F2 group by calculating the odds ratio (OR) and its 95% confidence interval for a 2×2 table between the seriousness of the attempt method and each factor. In this study, we did not use logistic regression analysis because the number of events per variable was relatively small. Peduzzi et al. pointed out that for events per variable (EPV) values of 10 or greater, no major problems occurred, and that for EPV values less than 10, however, the regression coefficients were biased in both positive and negative directions [14]. Statistical processing was performed using SPSS 15.0 J for Windows. To compare investigational indicators in the F2 group and the F3 group, the t-test was used for the interval scale and chi-square or Fisher’s exact test for the nominal scale. The significance level was set at 5% (two-tailed test), with significance probability shown due to numerical figures.

All data were anonymously analyzed without individual patient consent due to the retrospective nature of the study. The Internal Review Board of Sapporo Medical University waived the need for individual informed consent and approved the study. Only demographic data of patients were obtained from the medical records and the data were recorded prior to analysis in a manner where subjects could not be identified either directly or through identifiers linked to the subjects.

Results

Table 2 depicts the patient characteristics comparing the F2 and F3 groups. The ratios of ‘past/present psychiatric treatment’ and ‘more than 3 months interruption of psychiatric treatment’ were significantly higher in the patients with F2 disorders. In the patients with F3 disorders, the ratio of ‘physical disorder comorbidity’ was significantly higher than for the F2 group.
Table 3 summarizes the characteristics of suicide attempts in group F2 compared with F3. Regarding 'seriousness of the method of attempted suicide', the ratio of individuals of AD group was significantly higher in the F2 group than the F3 group. The patients in the F2 group had significantly lower values for the ratio of 'alcohol intake at suicide attempt' and 'suicide note left behind'. As for the method, there were significant differences; the ratio of individuals using 'jumping from a height and jumping in front of a moving train or high-speed car' was higher in the F2 group. Regarding the motive, there were also significant differences; the ratio of individuals with 'hallucination-delusion' was higher in the F2 group.

Finally, we examined the associations between the seriousness of the suicide attempt method and particular factors of patient characteristics and characteristics of suicide attempts other than 'method' in the F2 group by calculating the odds ratios (Table 4). Only 'hallucination-delusion' in Motive was identified as a significant factor (OR = 3.36, 95% CI: 1.05–11.33).

Discussion

We collated the characteristics of suicide attempts in the F2 group (schizophrenic disorders) in comparison with the F3 group (mood disorders) in our university hospital between December 2002 and July 2013. Then we examined the factors influencing the seriousness of the method of suicide attempt by calculating odds ratios.

In this study, we demonstrated that the patients in the F2 group were significantly younger compared to the F3 groups. The onset age of both disorders may influence the result since the onset age of schizophrenic disorder is younger than that of mood disorder [15–17].

We found that the ratio of 'physical disorder comorbidity' was lower in the F2 group than in the F3 group. Physical illness has been shown to be strongly associated with suicide in schizophrenic patients [7]. However, it has also been postulated that there is a strong mutual relationship between mood disorders and physical disorders such as type 2 diabetes [18,19], coronary heart disease [20], cancer [21,22] and other chronic diseases.
Regarding psychiatric treatment, the ratio of ‘past/present psychiatric treatment’ and ‘more than 3 months interruption of psychiatric treatment’ were higher in the F2 group than in the F3 group. Several studies have reported a high risk of suicide in patients during the first episode of schizophrenia [23,24]. In this study, 11 of 65 patients (16.9%) in the F2 group had not experienced any previous psychiatric treatments and all of them were first episode schizophrenics. However, the ratio of individuals who had not experienced any psychiatric treatments was significantly higher in the F3 group. The low psychiatry consultation background [25] in Japan may influence the overall results.

Several studies have pointed out that poor adherence to treatment is one of the risk factors for suicide attempts in patients during the first episode of schizophrenia [23,24]. In this study, 11 of 65 patients (16.9%) in the F2 group had not experienced any previous psychiatric treatments and all of them were first episode schizophrenics. However, the ratio of individuals who had not experienced any psychiatric treatments was significantly higher in the F3 group. The low psychiatry consultation background [25] in Japan may influence the overall results.

Several studies have pointed out that poor adherence to treatment is one of the risk factors for suicide attempts in schizophrenia patients [26,27]. In this study, we defined poor adherence to treatment as ‘more than 3 months interruption of psychiatric treatment’. We found that this ratio of ‘more than 3 months interruption’ was significantly higher in the F2 group.

Regarding the methods of suicide attempt, individuals with schizophrenia tended to make attempts of moderate to extreme lethality [28,29] or often died by violent means [30]. In the present study as well, the ratio of ‘absolutely dangerous’ methods was significantly higher in the F2 group, and patients in the F2 group tended to make suicide attempts by more serious methods such as ‘jumping from a height’ and ‘jumping in front of a moving train or high-speed car’.

Noteworthy was the finding that suicide attempts motivated by ‘hallucination-delusion’ were overwhelmingly more prevalent than those with other motives in the F2 group. Furthermore, ‘hallucination-delusion’ was the only factor that showed a significant association with the seriousness of the suicide attempt methods. In contrast, an earlier systematic review by Hawton et al. [6] in 2005 about risk factors for suicide in schizophrenia concluded that reduced risk was associated with hallucinations (OR = 0.50, 95% CI 0.35–0.71). However, a recent systematic review by Hor and Taylor [7] identified the association between the presence of positive symptoms, in particular auditory hallucinations and delusions, and an increased risk of suicide among patients with schizophrenia. While our study was consistent with this result, further studies are needed to confirm this because these differences may be due to the heterogeneity of the data.

The acute effects of alcohol use act as important risk factors for attempted or completed suicide among individuals with and without alcoholism [31,32]. Acute alcohol use can precipitate

| Table 3. Characteristics of suicide attempts. |
|------------------------------------------------|
| Seriousness of the suicide attempt method | Schizophrenic disorders group (the F2 group) N = 65 | Mood disorders group (the F3 group) N = 95 | p-value |
| Relatively dangerous (RD) (%) | 17 (26.2) | 50 (53.2) | <0.001² |
| Absolutely dangerous (AD) (%) | 48 (73.8) | 44 (46.8) | |
| Alcohol intake at suicide attempt | yes (%) | 7 (10.8) | 22 (23.4) | 0.039² |
| no (%) | 58 (89.2) | 71 (75.5) | |
| unknown (%) | 0 (0) | 1 (1.1) | |
| Method | Jumping from a height (%) | 26 (40) | 10 (10.6) | <0.001² |
| Jumping in front of a moving train/car (%) | 10 (15.4) | 1 (1.1) | |
| Cutting/stabbing (%) | 9 (13.8) | 20 (21.3) | |
| Medicinal drug overdosing (%) | 9 (13.8) | 28 (29.8) | |
| Poisoning (%) | 2 (3.1) | 10 (10.6) | |
| Hanging (%) | 5 (7.7) | 7 (7.4) | |
| Burning (%) | 2 (3.1) | 6 (6.4) | |
| Gassing (%) | 1 (1.5) | 10 (10.6) | |
| Freezing (%) | 0 (0) | 4 (4.3) | |
| Others (%) | 2 (3.1) | 3 (3.2) | |
| Motive | Hallucination-delusion (%) | 46 (70.7) | 8 (8.5) | <0.001² |
| Personal relationship (%) | 8 (12.3) | 28 (29.8) | |
| Economic status (%) | 1 (1.5) | 14 (14.9) | |
| Pain of illness (%) | 4 (6.2) | 21 (22.3) | |
| Job/School issues (%) | 3 (4.6) | 9 (9.6) | |
| Others (%) | 2 (3.1) | 5 (5.3) | |
| Unknown/Obscure (%) | 2 (3.1) | 10 (10.6) | |
| A note left behind | yes (%) | 0 (0) | 8 (8.5) | 0.021¹ |
| no (%) | 65 (100) | 86 (91.5) | |
| unknown (%) | 0 (0) | 0 (0) | |

¹chi-square test; ²Fisher’s exact test.
doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0096272.t003
suicidal behavior by inducing negative affect and impairing problem-solving skills, as well as aggravating impulsive personality traits [32,33]. We found that the F2 group patients had significantly lower values for the ratio of ‘alcohol intake at suicide attempt’ in comparison with the F3 group. Interestingly, we also found that no patients in the F2 group left a suicide note behind while 8% of the patients in the F3 group left them behind. Little is known regarding suicide notes in schizophrenic patients. This result suggests that suicide in schizophrenic patients may tend to be impulsive rather than planned even if they do not use alcohol at the time of the attempt. Further studies are required to elucidate this.

The present study has several limitations that must be addressed. First, it was a retrospective study and, the number of cases was rather small since only one institute was involved. All the patients in the study were seen by psychiatrists in the consultation-liaison settings, the patients who completed suicide were not included. In this study, the F3 group was included the patient with bipolar disorders and unipolar depression. Grouping mood disorders as a whole may be an important limitation. We will consider investigating these issues in the future.

We investigated the clinical features of suicide attempts by schizophrenia patients and compared them with mood disorders, which have been most extensively investigated for association with suicide. The patients in the F2 group were significantly younger. The ratios of ‘past/present psychiatric treatment’ and ‘more than 3 months interruption of psychiatric treatment’ were significantly higher in the F2 group. Meanwhile, the ratios of ‘physical disorder comorbidity’, ‘alcohol intake at suicide attempt’ and ‘suicide note left behind’ were significantly higher in the F3 group. The patients in the F2 group were more likely to make suicide attempts using serious methods. Furthermore, ‘hallucination-delusion’ was the most prevalent motive and was the factor that showed a significant association with the seriousness of the method of attempted suicide. Therefore, psychiatrists and other medical staff should keep in mind that in patients with schizophrenia, anti-suicidal measures must be taken earlier than in patients with mood disorders. Particularly, managing the symptom of hallucination and delusion is very important to reduce the suicide risk.

Acknowledgments

We would like to thank all the staff concerned in consultation-liaison psychiatry at Sapporo Medical University Hospital.

Author Contributions

Conceived and designed the experiments: TI EH TS. Performed the experiments: TI YK. Analyzed the data: TI WU. Contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools: RS. Wrote the paper: TI WU.

References

1. Miles CP (1977) Conditions predisposing to suicide: a review. J Nerv Ment Dis 164: 231–246.
2. Caldwell CB, Gottesman II (1990) Schizophrenics kill themselves too: a review of risk factors for suicide. Schizophr Bull 16: 571–589.
3. Palmer BA, Pankratz VS, Bostwick JM (2005) The lifetime risk of suicide in schizophrenia: a reexamination. Arch Gen Psychiatry 62: 247–253.
4. Meltzer HY (2001) Treatment of suicidality in schizophrenia. Ann N Y Acad Sci 932: 44–50; discussion 50–60.
5. Conwell Y (2001) Suicide in later life: a review and recommendations for prevention. Suicide Life Threat Behav 31 Suppl: 32–47.
6. Hawton K, Sutton L, Haw C, Sinclair J, Deeks JJ (2005) Schizophrenia and suicide: systematic review of risk factors. Br J Psychiatry 187: 9–20.

Table 4. Factors influencing the seriousness of suicide methods in the F2 group.

| Characteristics                                      | Seriousness of suicide methods | Odds Ratio (95% CI) |
|------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------|
|                                                      | AD group (N = 48) | RD group (N = 17) |                  |
| Gender (male)                                        | 30 | 10 | 0.95 (0.30–3.03) |
| Past suicide attempt history                         | 17 | 4  | 1.60 (0.45–5.71) |
| Within-1-year suicide reattempts                     | 9  | 1  | 3.38 (0.39–28.96) |
| Physical disorder                                   | 2  | 1  | 0.65 (0.55–7.71)  |
| Jobless                                             | 37 | 13 | 1.07 (0.25–4.64)  |
| Requirements for public assistance                   | 9  | 5  | 0.50 (0.14–1.78)  |
| Living alone                                         | 11 | 3  | 1.19 (0.28–5.40)  |
| Past/present psychiatric treatment                   | 40 | 14 | 0.95 (0.23–4.37)  |
| More than 3 months interruption of psychiatric treatment | 6  | 2  | 0.98 (0.18–4.02)  |
| Alcohol intake at suicide attempt                    | 6  | 1  | 2.09 (0.23–18.83) |
| (Motive)                                             | 38 | 8  | 3.46 (1.05–11.33) |
| Hallucination-delusion                               | 5  | 3  | 0.49 (0.10–2.34)  |
| Economic status                                      | 0  | 1  |                  |
| Pain of illness                                      | 2  | 2  | 0.30 (0.04–2.31)  |
| Job/School issues                                    | 3  | 0  |                  |
| Others                                               | 2  | 0  |                  |
| Unknown/Obscure                                      | 0  | 2  |                  |

AD group: Absolutely Dangerous group, RD group: Relative Dangerous group.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0096272.t004
7. Hor K, Taylor M (2010) Suicide and schizophrenia: a systematic review of rates and risk factors. J Psychopharmacol 24: 81–90.
8. Goldney RD, Positano S, Spence ND, Rosenman SJ (1985) Suicide in association with psychiatric hospitalisation. Aust N Z J Psychiatry 19: 177–183.
9. Bhatia T, Thomas P, Semwal P, Thelma BK, Nimgunaekar VL, et al. (2006) Differing correlates for suicide attempts among patients with schizophrenia or schizoaffective disorder in India and USA. Schizophr Res 86: 208–214.
10. Pysia R, Pompili M, Immamorati M, Schwitzer J, Lester D, et al. (2009) Sex and ethnic differences among South Tirolian suicides: a psychological autopsy study. Eur Psychiatry 24: 47–56.
11. Silverman MM, Berman AL, Sanddal ND, O’Carroll PW, Joiner TE (2007) Rebuilding the tower of Babel: a revised nomenclature for the study of suicide and suicidal behaviors. Part 1: Background, rationale, and methodology. Suicide Life Threat Behav 37: 248–263.
12. Silverman MM, Berman AL, O’Carroll PW, Joiner TE (2007) Rebuilding the tower of Babel: a revised nomenclature for the study of suicide and suicidal behaviors. Part 2: Suicide-related ideations, communications, and behaviors. Suicide Life Threat Behav 37: 264–277.
13. Asukai N (1995) Suicide and mental disorders. Psychiatry Clin Neurosci 49 Suppl 1: S91–97.
14. Peduzzi P, Concato J, Kemper E, Holford TR, Feinstein AR (1996) A simulation study of the number of events per variable in logistic regression analysis. J Clin Epidemiol 49: 1373–1379.
15. Sadock BJ, Sadock VA (2003) Kaplan & Sadock’s synopsis of psychiatry: behavioral sciences/clinical psychiatry. Benjamin James Sadock VA, editor. Philadelphia Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
16. Jackson D, Kirkbride J, Croudace T, Morgan C, Boydell J, et al. (2013) Meta-analytic approaches to determine gender differences in the age-incidence characteristics of schizophrenia and related psychoses. Int J Methods Psychiatr Res 22: 36–45.
17. Kroon JS, Wohlfarth TD, Dieleman J, Satterland Al, Storsrum JG, et al. (2013) Incidence-based cohort study. Bipolar Disord 15: 306–313.
18. MusseLM DL, Betan E, Larsen H, Phillips LS (2003) Relationship of depression to diabetes types 1 and 2: epidemiology, biology, and treatment. Biol Psychiatry 54: 317–329.
19. Olatunde RD, George O (2013) The comorbidity between depression and diabetes. Curr Psychiatry Rep 15: 390.
20. Barth J, Schumacher M, Herrmann-Lingen C (2004) Depression as a risk factor for mortality in patients with coronary heart disease: a meta-analysis. Psychosom Med 66: 802–813.
21. Chochinov HM (2001) Depression in cancer patients. Lancet Oncol 2: 499–505.
22. Passik SD, Douglas W, McDonald MV, Rosenfeld B, Theobald DE, et al. (1998) Oncologists’ recognition of depression in their patients with cancer. J Clin Oncol 16: 1594–1600.
23. Pompili M, Serafini G, Immamorati M, Lester D, Shrivastava A, et al. (2011) Suicide risk in first episode psychosis: a selective review of the current literature. Schizophr Res 129: 1–11.
24. Sanchez-Gistau V, Barza I, Arango C, Gonzalez-Pinto A, de la Serna E, et al. (2013) Predictors of suicide attempt in early-onset, first-episode psychoses: a longitudinal 24-month follow-up study. J Clin Psychiatry 74: 59–66.
25. Kawakami N (2007) Epidemiology of depressive disorders in Japan and the world]. Nihon Rinsho 65: 1578–1584.
26. De Hert M, McKenzie K, Peuskens J (2001) Risk factors for suicide in young people suffering from schizophrenia: a long-term follow-up study. Schizophr Res 47: 127–134.
27. Steblaj A, Tavvar R, Dernoveck MZ (1999) Predictors of suicide in psychiatric hospital. Acta Psychiatr Scand 100: 383–388.
28. Harkavy-Friedman JM, Restifo K, Malaspina D, Kaufmann CA, Amador XF, et al. (1999) Suicidal behavior in schizophrenia: characteristics of individuals who had and had not attempted suicide. Am J Psychiatry 156: 1276–1278.
29. Koeda A, Otsuka K, Nakamura H, Yambe T, Fukumoto K, et al. (2012) Characteristics of suicide attempts in patients diagnosed with schizophrenia in comparison with depression: a study of emergency room visit cases in Japan. Schizophr Res 142: 31–39.
30. Hunt IM, Kapur N, Robinson J, Shaw J, Flynn S, et al. (2006) Suicide within 12 months of mental health service contact in different age and diagnostic groups: National clinical survey. Br J Psychiatry 188: 153–142.
31. Hufford MR (2001) Alcohol and suicidal behavior. Clin Psychol Rev 21: 797–811.
32. Brady J (2006) The association between alcohol misuse and suicidal behaviour. Alcohol Alcohol 41: 473–478.
33. Dvorak RD, Linnas DA, Malone PS (2013) Alcohol use, depressive symptoms, and impulsivity as risk factors for suicide proneness among college students. J Affect Disord 149: 326–334.