On the efficiency of entomopathogenic nematodes (Rhabditida: Heterorhabditidae and Steinernematidae) on rust red flour beetle, *Tribolium castaneum* (Herbst.) (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae)

Fatma Dolunay Erdoğan*

**Abstract**

**Background:** The rust red flour beetle, *Tribolium castaneum* (Herbst.) (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae) is a serious pest of stored grains and grain products across the world. This beetle is hold a significant place in Turkey by causing damages on stored products. *T. castaneum* primarily attacks milled grain and its derivates. Entomopathogenic nematodes (EPNs) are regarded as extremely an important biological control agent. EPNs kills their hosts within 48 h by the bacteria they carry.

**Results:** Efficacies of 4 isolates of EPNs *Steinernema carpocapsae* (Tokat Bakirli 05), *S. feltiae* (Tokat-Emir), *Heterorhabditis bacteriophora* (TOK-20) and *H. bacteriophora* (11-KG) against *T. castaneum* was investigated under laboratory conditions. The experiments were carried out thrice with 10 replicates at 2 different temperatures (15 and 25 °C). EPNs isolates were tested at 3 different concentrations (250, 500 and 1000 IJs/ml) with a pure water as control. The overall mortality caused by *H. bacteriophora* (Kg11) was significantly higher than the other EPN species. At 25 °C, *H. bacteriophora* (Kg11) at the highest concentration (1000 IJs/ml) caused 87.6% mortality after 120 h., followed by *S. carpocapsae* and *S. feltiae* with 79.22 and 75.3% mortality rates, respectively. The mortality percentages exhibited by all nematodes’ species at both temperatures were lowest at the concentration of (250 IJs/ml). At 15 °C, *H. bacteriophora* (Kg11) caused (55.2%) mortality rate at the highest concentration (1000 IJs/ml) after 120 h.

**Conclusion:** The study suggested that these nematodes were efficient and could be recommended to control *T. castaneum* in its biological control programs.

**Keywords:** Entomopathogenic nematodes, *Tribolium castaneum*, Efficiency, Biological control

**Background**

The red flour beetle, *Tribolium castaneum* (Herbst.) (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae) is a cosmopolitan pest of stored products (Nenaah 2014), with a polyphagous feeding habit (Bachrouch et al. 2010), attacking widespread variety of stored products and their by-products causing a loss in both quantity and quality (Obeng-Ofori and Reichmuth 1999). Product attacked by *T. castaneum* usually contains carcasses, and exuviae. Both larvae and adults cause serious losses by feeding on product and processed foods. The damage of larvae are mostly confined to the germ of the grains in wheat (White and Lmbkin 1988). Fumigation by chemical pesticides still the main method for control stored grain pests. These
chemical pesticides have hazard effects on both the environment and the consumers, on the other hand caused insect resistance (Lu and Wu 2010), therefore, scientists work to use other methods to control store insects rather than chemical pesticides.

Entomopathogenic nematodes (EPNs) are an important biological control agent found in soil all over the world. Today, in many countries, EPNs are used in biological control programs of many economic insect pests. They are a group of soil dwelling nematodes that parasitize insects pests. Use of these nematodes is economical and eco-friendly, since they are harmless to non-target organisms, human health and the environment (Gulcu et al. 2017). These organisms infect insects in soil through natural openings or thin parts of the cuticle and release their symbiont bacteria in insect hemolymph. Death occurs within 16–24 h due to the bacteria reproducing in the insect’s body (Kepenekci 2012).

This study aimed to evaluate the virulence of 4 EPNs’ isolates against T. castaneum under laboratory conditions.

**Methods**

EPNs, T. castaneum adults, the great wax moth, *Galleria mellonella* L. cultures constituted the main materials of the study. Experiments carried out under laboratory conditions in the Nematology Laboratory of the Central Research Institute of Plant Protection (Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry of the Republic of Turkey) in 2020.

**Nematode culture**

Infected juveniles of *Steinernema carpocapsae* (Tokat, Baksı 05), *S. feltiae* (Tokat, Emir), *Heterorhabditis bacteriophora* (TOK-20), *H. bacteriophora* (11-KG) were obtained from Tokat Gaziosmanpaşa University. All nematode species were reared on *G. mellonella* mature larvae as described by Kaya and Stock (1997).

**Rearing Galleria mellonella larvae**

A special nutrient diet, containing 890 g of flour, 222 g of dry baker’s yeast, 500 g of glycerin, 500 g of honey, 445 g of milk powder and 445 g of flour, bran, milk powder and yeast, mixed and then poured on a mixture of honey and glycerin, was prepared (Mohammed and Coppel, 1983). *Galleria mellonella* eggs were placed on a food medium in 1 lt glass jars and then placed in the incubator (16/8 h lighting set at 23–24 °C) for hatching and development of the larvae.

**Rearing of entomopathogenic nematode species**

Mature instar larvae of *G. mellonella* were used for rearing the EPNs. The larvae were placed on Whatman paper (White, 1927), soaked in sterile water, in small Petri dishes (diameter of 6 cm). The 2nd and 3rd stages of infective nematode were collected from the water by a dropper and applied on the *G. mellonella* larvae. Then, the lids of the Petri dishes were wrapped by a parafilm and placed in the incubator (20–23 °C). The Petri dishes were inspected every 10 days. The obtained juveniles were kept in a refrigerator (10 °C).

**Rearing of T. castaneum**

*Tribolium* population grown in the Stored Crop Pests Unit of the Entomology Department, Ankara Plant Protection Central Research Institute, Turkey was used in the study. A mixture of dry yeast and wheat flour (1: 3) was used in the cultivation of *Tribolium*. 250 g of the nutrient mixture, sterilized at −18 °C for 120 h, was placed in a 1 L glass jar with a perforated lid for ventilation. Glass jars were kept in climate chambers at 25 ± 1 °C and 60 ± 5% RH. 500–750 adults were placed in each jar for oviposition and after a week, adults were removed from by passing through a 30 mesh sieve. The screened adult individuals were placed to a new jar containing food, and the continuity of the cultures was ensured.

**Laboratory experiments of EPNs**

For each nematode species, the experiments were carried out in plastic Petri dishes (9 cm) under the same conditions 3 times on different dates with 10 replicates per repeat and at 2 different temperatures (25 and 15 °C) in a climate chamber. T. castaneum adults (10 individuals) were placed by the help of soft forceps into Petri dishes with 5 g sterilized wheat crumbs bedding. Then, the EPN isolates prepared, using distilled water at 250, 500 and 1000 IJs/ml, were applied directly into the Petri dish. After the application, the Petri dishes were covered by a parafilm. Only pure water was used in the control group. The vitality of the adult individuals in the Petri dishes was counted regularly at the end of 48, 72 and 120 h and the mortality % were calculated. Cadavers were taken place “White trap” and were examined under a stereomicroscope. After one week, EPNs juveniles were obtained from infected T. castaneum adults.

**Statistical analysis**

Duncan multiple comparison test was performed with SPSS statistics 17. Square root transformation was applied to non-normally distributed data, followed by ANOVA (Duncan test).

**Results**

Statistical evaluations of the activity of the EPNs (48, 72 and 120 h post-inoculation), all the 3 parameters (nematode species, levels and temperatures) and their interactions were significant. The of all EPNs species was
directly proportional to the mortality percentage of pest adults as presented in tables (1 and 2). The lowest mortality % was recorded at the lowest applied concentration (250 IJs/ml) and at 15 °C for the 4 EPNs species.

*H. bacteriophora* (Kg11) isolate was the most effective one at 15 °C causing (55.2%) mortality at the highest level (1000 IJs/ml) 120 h post-treatment, followed by *H. bacteriophora* (Tok 20) with (43.2%), *S. feltiae* with (34.7%), and *S. carpocapsae* with (33%), respectively. No mortality occurred in the control treatments, pure water-only (Table 1).

At 25 °C, *H. bacteriophora* (Kg11) caused (87.6%) insect mortality at the highest concentration (1000 IJs/ml) after 120 h, followed by *S. carpocapsae* (79.22%), *S. feltiae* (75.3%) and *H. bacteriophora* (Tok 20) (Table 2).

**Discussion**

Although EPNs are most effective in the larval stage, they can be effective on all insect stages. They enter the host’s hemocell through the host’s natural openings such as the mouth, anus, stigmas, hair follicles, or through thin parts of the cuticle (only in Heterorhabdites) (Bedding and Molyneux 1982; Wang and Gaugler 1998). EPNs are in a symbiotic relationship with bacteria of the genus Xenorhabdus (in Steinernematids) and Photorhabdus (in Heterorhabdites). IJs entering

| Concentrations | *Steinernema carpocapsae* (Tokat Bakişlı 05) | *S. feltiae* (Tokat Emir) | *Heterorhabditis bacteriophora* (Tok 20) | *H. bacteriophora* (Kg11) |
|----------------|--------------------------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| **48 h**       |                                            |                          |                                         |                            |
| 250            | 0.00c                                      | 1.50c                    | 0.00c                                   | 0.00c                      |
| 500            | 0.00c                                      | 4.50bc                   | 1.00c                                   | 1.50c                      |
| 1000           | 6.00b                                      | 4.50bc                   | 30.00a                                  | 26.56a                     |
| **72 h**       |                                            |                          |                                         |                            |
| 250            | 0.00f                                      | 1.50ef                   | 0.00f                                   | 7.00ef                     |
| 500            | 0.00f                                      | 5.50cde                  | 1.00f                                   | 41.61b                     |
| 1000           | 6.00cd                                     | 7.50c                    | 38.33b                                  | 46.00b                     |
| **120 h**      |                                            |                          |                                         |                            |
| 250            | 8.50e                                      | 6.50ef                   | 0.00f                                   | 2.50ef                     |
| 500            | 20.33 ± 2.82d                              | 30.72c                   | 2.00def                                 | 18.61d                     |
| 1000           | 33.22c                                     | 34.67c                   | 43.17a                                  | 55.17a                     |

*F*<sub>15.3</sub> = 23, 48,104 and 71 for 48, 72, 120 h, respectively. *P* < 0.01

| Concentrations | *Steinernema carpocapsae* (Tokat Bakişlı 05) | *S. feltiae* (Tokat Emir) | *Heterorhabditis bacteriophora* (Tok 20) | *H. bacteriophora* (Kg11) |
|----------------|--------------------------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| **48 h**       |                                            |                          |                                         |                            |
| 250            | 14.6g                                      | 19.39fg                  | 24.06f                                  | 21.06fg                    |
| 500            | 17.00fg                                    | 39.83cd                  | 31.56e                                  | 24.50f                     |
| 1000           | 58.78b                                     | 38.67d                   | 46.61c                                  | 66.33a                     |
| **72 h**       |                                            |                          |                                         |                            |
| 250            | 27.17h                                     | 25.11h                   | 28.94gh                                 | 36.11fg                    |
| 500            | 44.50de                                    | 47.61cde                 | 40.61ef                                 | 29.83gh                    |
| 1000           | 65.17b                                     | 55.22c                   | 52.05cd                                 | 81.56a                     |
| **120 h**      |                                            |                          |                                         |                            |
| 250            | 34.28g                                     | 32.83g                   | 40.61fg                                 | 39.44fg                    |
| 500            | 52.11de                                    | 54.45d                   | 47.11def                                | 45.67ef                    |
| 1000           | 79.22b                                     | 75.33b                   | 65.33c                                  | 87.61a                     |

*F*<sub>15.3</sub> = 67, 77 and 108 for 48, 72, 120 h, respectively. *P* < 0.01
the host, change their coats and deposit the symbiotic bacteria they carry into the host hemocoll. Bacteria that reproduce by breaking down the insect tissue cause the host to die within 48 h (Constant and Boven 2000, Glazer and Lewis 2000).

Some studies have assessed the potentials of EPNs on *T. castaneum*. For instance, the study of Ramos-Rodríguez et al. (2007) investigated the efficacy of *Steinernema riobrave* against *T. castaneum*. In laboratory biosays, *S. riobrave* reduced survival of *T. castaneum*, larvae, pupae and adults from 77.9 ± 3.2% in the controls to 27.4 ± 2.5% in treatments. The study also stated that the larval stage were the most susceptible to EPNs and that temperature (25 and 30 °C) and RH (43, 57, 75 and 100%) had non-significant effects on the efficiency of *S. riobrave*. Erturk et al. (2013) evaluated the activities of Aydın isolates of *S. feltiae*, *S. carpocapsae* and *H. bacteriophora* against *T. castaneum* and *T. confusum* adults under laboratory conditions. The results showed non-significant difference between *S. feltiae* and *H. bacteriophora* applications, while *S. carpocapsae* was found to be the most effective isolate against *T. castaneum* (86.47% mortality) and *T. confusum* (85.35% mortality) adults at a concentration of (2000 IJs).

Javed et al. (2020) evaluated the efficacy of *Steinernema pakistanense* (LM-07), *S. bifurcatum* (LM-30), *S. affine* (GB-14) and *S. cholasionense* (GB -22) against *T. confusum* and *Rhyzopertha dominica* adults at 3 different concentrations (50, 100 and 150 IJs / insect) and 3 different temperatures (20, 25 and 30 °C) under laboratory conditions. *S. pakistanense* at (150 IJs/insect) concentration caused (100%) death at 30 °C. Another study for the virulence of Pakistani isolates of *S. bifurcatum* and *S. affine* against *T. castaneum* and *Lasioderma serricorne* under laboratory conditions found that the insect larvae were more sensitive than adults to nematode infection, and that at the highest concentration (200 IJs/insect) used in the trial, *S. bifurcatum* caused (92%) *L. serricorne* and 93% *T. castaneum* larval mortality, while *S. affine* caused (90 and 95%) mortality in *L. serricorne* and *T. castaneum*, respectively (Khanum and Javed 2021).

**Conclusions**

All EPN species tested in this study were found to be effective against the *T. castaneum* adults at 25 °C. But *H. bacteriophora* (Kg11) was the most effective species against the flour beetle adults under controlled conditions. The isolates *H. bacteriophora* (Kg11), *S. carpocapsae* (Tokat Bakiş 05) and *S. feltiae* (Tokat Emir) can be recommended to be used in biological control programs against *T. castaneum*.

**Abbreviations**

EPNs: *Entomopathogenic nematodes*; IJs: *Infective juveniles*; *T. castaneum*: Tribolium castaneum; *H. bacteriophora*: *Heterorhabditis bacteriophora*, *S. carpocapsae*: *Steinernema carpocapsae*, *S. feltiae*: *Steinernema feltiae*, *G. melonella*: *Galleria melonella*, Rust red flour beetle: Tribolium castaneum.

**Acknowledgements**

I would like to extend our thanks to Professor İller KEPENEKÇİ for providing entomopathogenic nematode isolates, Tuğba Akdeniz FIRAT for providing rust red flour beetle and Assist. Prof. Didgdem SAGLAM ALTINKÖY for advice on statistical analysis.

**Authors’ contributions**

F.D.E. She carried out all the stages of the study.

**Funding**

This study is funded by Republic of Turkey Ministry of Agriculture And Forestry General Directorate of Agricultural Research and Policies co-partner with Vefa İlaç Sanayi ve Tic. A.Ş. Company. These funder provided all chemicals and materials used in experimental bioassay.

**Availability of data and materials**

The datasets used and analyzed during the current study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

**Declarations**

**Ethics approval and consent to participate**

Not applicable.

**Consent for publication**

Not applicable.

**Competing interests**

None.

**Received**: 26 May 2021 **Accepted**: 14 August 2021

**Published online**: 25 August 2021

**References**

Bachrouch O, Jemaa JMB, Talou T, Marzouk B, Abderraba M (2010) Fumigant toxicity of Pistacia lentinus oil against *Tribolium castaneum* and *Lasioderma serricorne*. Bull Insectol 63:129–135

Bedding RA, Molyneux AS (1982) Penetration of insect cuticle by infective juveniles of *Heterorhabditidae* spp. (Heterorhabditidae: Nematoda). Nematologica 28:354–359

Constant RHF, Bowen DJ (2000) Novel insecticidal toxins from nematode symbiotic bacteria. Cell Mol Life Sci 57:828–833

Glazer I, Lewis EE (2000) Bioassays for entomopathogenic nematodes. In: Navon A, Ascher KRS (eds) Bioassays of entomopathogenic microbes and nematodes. CAB International, Wallingford, pp 229–238

Guçu B, Cimen H, Raja RK, Hazir S (2017) Entomopathogenic nematodes and their mutualistic bacteria: their ecology and application as microbial control agents. Biopestic Int 3(2):79–112

Javed S, Tabassum AK, Khan S (2020) Biocontrol potential of entomopathogenic nematode species against *Tribolium confusum* (Jac.) (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae) and *Rhyzopertha dominica* (Fab.) (Coleoptera: Bostrichidae) under laboratory conditions. Egypt J Biol Pest Control 30:5

Kaya HK, Stock SP (1997) Techniques in insect nematology. In: Lacey L (ed) Manual of techniques in insect pathology. Academic Press, San Diego, pp 281–324

Kepenekci I (2012) *Nematology (Plant Parasitic and Entomopathogen Nematodes)* Education. Extension and Publication Department, Ankara, p. 1130

Khanum AK, Javed S (2021) Pathogenicity of Pakistani isolates of *Steinernema bifurcatum* and *S. affine* (Rhabditida: Steinernematidae) in management of stored grain pests *Lasioderma serricorne* and *Tribolium castaneum* (Coleoptera: Ptinidae, Tenebrionidae). Egypt J Biol Pest Control 31:73.

https://doi.org/10.1186/s41938-021-00418-1
Lu J, Wu SH (2010) Bioactivity of essential oil from Ailanthus altissima bark against 4 major stored-grain insects. Afr J Microb Res 4:154–157
Mohamed MA, Coppel HC (1983) Mass rearing of the greater wax moth Gal- lena melonella (Lepidoptera: Galleridae) for small-scale laboratory. Great Lakes Entomol 16(4):139–141
Nenaah GE (2014) Chemical composition, toxicity and growth inhibitory activi- ties of essential oils of three Achillea species and their nano-emulsions against Tribolium castaneum (Herbst). Ind Crops Prod 53:252–260
Obeng-Ofori D, Reichmuth CH (1999) Plant oils as potentiation agents of monoterpenes for protection of stored grains against damage by stored product beetle pests. Int J Pest Manag 45(2):155–159
Ramos-Rodríguez O, Campbell JF, Ramaswamy SB (2007) Efficacy of the entomopathogenic nematode Steinernema riobrave against the stored- product insect pests Tribolium castaneum and Plodia interpunctella. Biol Control 40(1):15–21

Wang Y, Gaugler R (1998) Host and penetration site location by entomopatho- genic nematodes against Japanese beetle larvae. J Inverteb Pathol 72:313–318
White GF (1927) A method for obtaining infective nematode larvae from cultures. Science 66:302–330
White GG, Lambkin TA (1988) Damage to wheat grain by larvae of Tribolium castaneum (Herbst) (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae). J Stored Prod Res 24(2):61–65

Publisher’s Note
Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.