Occurrence of genes encoding spore germination in *Clostridium* species that cause meat spoilage

Sara A. Burgess¹*, Faith P. Palevich², Amanda Gardner², John Mills², Gale Brightwell²,³ and Nikola Palevich⁴

Abstract

Members of the genus *Clostridium* are frequently associated with meat spoilage. The ability for low numbers of spores of certain *Clostridium* species to germinate in cold-stored vacuum-packed meat can result in blown pack spoilage. However, little is known about the germination process of these clostridia, despite this characteristic being important for their ability to cause spoilage. This study sought to determine the genomic conditions for germination of 37 representative *Clostridium* strains from seven species (*C. estertheticum*, *C. tagluense*, *C. frigoris*, *C. gasigenes*, *C. putrefaciens*, *C. aligidicarnis* and *C. frigidicarnis*) by comparison with previously characterized germination genes from *C. perfringens*, *C. sporogenes* and *C. botulinum*. All the genomes analysed contained at least one *gerX* operon. Seven different *gerX* operon configuration types were identified across genomes from *C. estertheticum*, *C. tagluense* and *C. gasigenes*. Differences arose between the *C. gasigenes* genomes and those belonging to *C. tagluense*/*C. estertheticum* in the number and type of genes coding for cortex lytic enzymes, suggesting the germination pathway of *C. gasigenes* is different. However, the core components of the germination pathway were conserved in all the *Clostridium* genomes analysed, suggesting that these species undergo the same major steps as *Bacillus subtilis* for germination to occur.

DATA SUMMARY

The authors confirm all supporting data, code and protocols have been provided within the article or through supplementary data files. All clostridia isolates that were genome-sequenced in this study were deposited in GenBank (BioProject accession number PRJNA574489).

INTRODUCTION

Spore-forming bacteria are common contaminants of food and the environment, and as such represent a major source of food poisoning and food spoilage. Blown pack spoilage (BPS) typically occurs in red meat that has been vacuum packaged and stored at consistent chilled temperatures (−1.5 °C) [1], and has been reported in chilled vacuum-packed meats from many countries, including Brazil, Canada, Iceland, Ireland, Germany and New Zealand. BPS is caused by psychrophilic and psychrotrophic *Clostridium* species, including *Clostridium estertheticum* and *Clostridium gasigenes* [2–4]. The economic losses in New Zealand and worldwide attributed to product spoilage and market access issues are significant [5, 6], in particular BPS of chilled meat (e.g. venison, lamb and beef) [7].
Spore germination occurs when spores sense specific molecules in the environment [8]. Following germination, bacterial cells are more susceptible to inactivating processes such as heat, desiccation, chemical sanitization and UV radiation [9, 10]. Currently, inactivation of spores relies on the use of strong disinfectants or toxic chemicals, including 10% bleach solutions and fumigation with oxidating agents [11]. These strategies can be challenging to implement over large areas or on porous surfaces. Historically, due to the lack of genetic systems, our understanding of the mechanisms of spore germination in *Clostridium* species has lagged far behind that of the genus *Bacillus* [12–15].

Genome sequences are rapidly becoming available for many different clostridia [16–18], and recently we have gathered genome sequences of several *Clostridium* species involved in meat spoilage [4, 19–25]. These genomes will yield important information about the modes of germination that will inform the development of germination induction strategies for a group of economically important spoilage organisms for the New Zealand meat industry. Until recently, germination of Gram-positive anaerobic spore-formers was thought to be similar to that of *Bacillus subtilis* [26]. However, studies in *Clostridium sporogenes* and *Clostridioides difficile* have identified two different mechanisms of spore germination. *C. sporogenes* follows a similar germination pathway to that of *B. subtilis*, whereas a different pathway has been observed in *C. difficile* that has not been observed in any other endospore-forming organisms to date [27]. Determination of the genomic conditions for germination in meat spoilage clostridia may allow for the identification of candidate spore germinants.

Triggers of spore germination in *Clostridium* are usually low-molecular-weight biomolecules found in the environment and commonly include amino acids and other molecules (cholesterol-based compounds, organic acids, nucleosides, peptidoglycan fragments, etc.). Once triggered, spore germination is initiated via a germinant receptor (GR) followed by the release of dipicolinic acid (DPA) into the core of the developing spore via the SpoVA proteins [15]. Release of DPA results in partial hydration of the core and subsequent activation of the cortex-lytic enzymes (CLEs) CwlJ, SleB-C or Csp1-C [8, 9]. The spore cortex is then broken down by the CLEs that allows additional core hydration and facilitates core expansion, and thus completion of germination and initiation of spore outgrowth. However, the germinant systems and mechanisms differ within the genus *Clostridium* and in some cases within species.

To identify the known genes responsible for germination, we incorporated long-read (MinION) technology to re-sequence and improve the quality of recent genomes sequenced, combined with an in-depth comparative in silico genomics analysis of selected meat-associated clostridia. This study aimed to apply a genomics-based approach to investigate the occurrence of genes encoding germination of clostridia spores associated with meat spoilage. This approach can be adopted to control other spore-forming bacteria associated with other food systems, and human or veterinary health.

**METHODS**

**Bacterial cultivation and growth conditions**

The methods for isolation and cultivation of the various meat spoilage-associated *Clostridium* species (strains FP1, FP2, FP3, FP4 and M14) have been previously detailed [4, 28]. *C. estertheticum* strains DSM 14864^T^ and DSM 8809^T^, as well as *C. bowmanii* DSM 14206^T^ were acquired from the Leibniz Institute DSMZ – German Collection of Microorganisms and Cell Cultures. All cultures were retrieved from storage, grown anaerobically at 10°C in pre-reduced peptone, yeast extract, glucose, starch broth (PYGS) [29], and culture purity was checked by plating. The PYGS was pre-reduced by boiling to remove oxygen and then adding the reducing agent cysteine-HCl. Following autoclaving the PYGS medium was placed into the anaerobic cabinet to reduce further overnight.

**Preparation of genomic DNA and whole-genome sequencing**

Genomic DNA was extracted from freshly grown cells using a modification of the phenol–chloroform procedure [4]. Bacterial strain identity was verified by 16S rRNA gene amplification [30]. Total DNA concentrations were determined using a NanoDrop ND-1000 (Thermo Scientific) and a Qubit Fluorometer dsDNA BR Kit (Invitrogen), in accordance with the manufacturer’s instructions. Genomic DNA integrity was verified by agarose gel electrophoresis, NanoDrop ND-1000 spectrophotometer (Nanodrop Technologies) and the Qubit dsDNA broad-range (BR) assay kit (Life Technologies).
Long-read genome sequencing and assembly

Long-read sequencing using the Oxford Nanopore Technologies (ONT) MinIon was carried out on the New Zealand meat spoilage strains FP1, FP2, FP3, FP4 and M14, as well as the *C. estertheticum* strains DSM 14864\(^T\) and DSM 8809\(^T\). Libraries were prepared using the ONT rapid barcoding kit (SQK-RBK004) and sequencing was carried out using a MiniION Mk 1B device with a SpotON R9 flow cell (version FLO-MIN106D). Sequencing was followed by base-calling using Guppy v.5.0.7. Reads were demultiplexed using qcat v.1.1.0 (ONT), trimmed using Porechop v.0.2.4 and filtered using Filtlong v.0.2.0. Genome assembly was carried out using Unicycler v.0.4.9b [31] in hybrid mode using previously sequenced Illumina reads [19–25].

Genome sequences

The genome sequences of the seven meat spoilage *Clostridium* strains [five strains previously isolated from New Zealand vacuum packed venison and lamb (FP1, FP2, FP3, FP4, M14) and two strains (*C. estertheticum* DSM 14864\(^T\) and DSM 8809\(^T\)) from spoiled beef] were compared with the genome sequences of 33 other strains from the genus *Clostridium* previously sequenced by other institutes (Table S1, available in the online version of this article) [32–37]. All these genomes were re-annotated using Prokka v.1.13.3 [38].

Comparative pan genome analysis

The program Roary v.3.8.2 [39], using the Prokka-generated GFF file (this is in GFF3 format and comprises both the annotation and sequence for each CDS [38]) as the input, was used to generate a core-genome nucleotide sequence alignment using PRANK. A neighbor-net was constructed in Splits Tree v.4.14.8 [40], using the core-genome alignment.

Comparative genomics of the germination genes were carried out using the OrthoMCL algorithm from the tool GET_HOMOLOGUES v.3.4.2 [41], where a default E-value of 1\(^{-50}\) and a coverage of 20% was used. Previously characterized germination genes (Table S2) concatenated in Geneious v.9.1.8 [42] and exported as a GBK file were used as the reference. Nucleotide and amino acid orthologous clusters were generated. The additional script ‘compare_clusters.pl’ within GET_HOMOLOGUES was used to generate a pangenome matrix using the amino acid sequence clusters only. A heatmap and dendrogram were generated to visualize the number of homologues for each germination gene using the heatmap2 function in the gplots library of R (v.4.1.2), visualized in Rstudio (v.2021.09.1). The dendrogram was generated using the euclidean measure to obtain a distance matrix and the complete agglomeration method for clustering. To examine whether there was any correlation between the core genome phylogeny and the dendrogram representing the germination gene presence, a tanglegram was generated using the tanglegram function in the dendextend library of R.

The gerX operons were identified using both the annotations generated by Prokka and the orthologous clusters containing the reference gerX genes using GET_HOMOLOGUES, then extracted using Geneious (v.9.1.8). The GerA, GerB and GerC proteins were aligned using the default settings of MUSCLE in MEGA v.10.0.5 [43] and a phylogenetic tree was generated using the maximum-likelihood method with the Jones–Taylor–Thorton substitution model.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

To gain an understanding of whether genome phylogeny was related to the number of germination gene orthologues and type of germination receptors in *Clostridium* species associated with meat spoilage, a comparative genomics approach was taken. To improve the quality of the assemblies we undertook an illumina short-read and ONT long-read hybrid approach on five strains previously isolated from New Zealand vacuum packed venison and lamb, as well as the type strains *C. estertheticum* DSM 14864\(^T\) and DSM 8809\(^T\) (Table S3). These strains were compared with 33 strains from ten *Clostridium* species previously associated with meat spoilage [5, 6, 44–49].

Core genome analysis

Roary was used to carry out a pan-genome analysis of the 40 *Clostridium* strains and *B. subtilis* 168, with 111 genes identified in the core genome. To examine the genomic phylogeny of these strains, a phylogenetic neighbour-network was generated using the core genome alignment (Fig. 1). In agreement with previous studies, our analysis grouped these genomes into two distinct groups. *C. estertheticum*, *Clostridium tagluense*, *Clostridium bowmanii* and *Clostridium frigoris* along with strains FP3, CF012, FP4, CM028 and CM027 formed one group (A; (a) in Fig. 1). *Clostridium botulinum*, *Clostridium perfringens*, *C. gasigenes*, *Clostridium frigidicarini*, *Clostridium algidicarini* and *Clostridium putrefaciens* along with strain M14 formed a second group (B; (b) in Fig. 1). The New Zealand strains FP1 and FP2 sat within the *C. tagluense* group, whereas strains FP3, FP4 and M14 formed distinct subgroups. FP3 and FP4 were most closely related to *C. tagluense* (type strain A121) and *C. bowmanii* (type strain DSM 14206) respectively. Similarly, M14 was most closely related to *C. gasigenes*. The species boundaries identified in our study (as indicated by the coloured ovals in Fig. 1) agree with those proposed by previous comparative genomics analyses using average nucleotide identify (ANI) [4, 17]. Similarly, in these same studies the three strains FP3, FP4 and M14 have been proposed as representing new taxa. However, phenotypic analyses are required to confirm this proposition.
Conservation of germination genes in meat spoilage Clostridium species

Germination comprises five main stages: (1) germination recognition, (2) germination activation, (3) DPA release, (4) cortex hydrolysis and (5) spore hydration [50, 51]. Experimental studies suggest C. sporogenes follows the order of this pathway and is similar to Bacillus species [52]. By contrast, cortex degradation begins before DPA release in C. perfringens and C. difficile [53–55]. In our study, differences in the number and type of germination genes conserved by the different meat spoilage Clostridium species suggests that there are differences in the germination pathway. However, the number and type of germination genes conserved within each strain did not necessarily relate to its core genome phylogeny. This relationship between core genome phylogeny and the conservation of germination genes was depicted using a tanglegram (Fig. S1), with a cophenetic correlation coefficient of 0.36. All of the germination genes detected were present on the chromosome for those strains sequenced using ONT long-read sequencing.

During the first stage of germination, a germinant is recognized by a germination receptor. Germination receptors are generally made up of three proteins: GerA, GerB and GerC [50]. Strain CF003 had the greatest number of gerX genes, with seven gerXA, 12 gerXB and nine gerXC orthologues.

In the model organism B. subtilis, DPA uptake during sporulation and DPA release during germination are associated with the spoVA operon (spoVAa, spoVAB, spoVAC, spoVAD, spoVAea, spoVAeb, spoVAF) [56–58]. Three of these genes, spoVAC, spoVAD and spoVAE, are conserved in Clostridium species [59, 60]. Few studies have investigated the function of SpoVA proteins in Clostridium, but one study suggests that SpoVAC is a ‘mechanosensing’ protein, and in C. difficile senses changes in osmolarity.
Fig. 2. Conservation of selected germination genes in Clostridium species associated with meat spoilage. This heatmap shows 20 genes involved in spore germination (a). The presence of a homologue was determined by using the OrthoMCL algorithm in the GET_HOMOLOGUES tool. No homologues were identified in the Clostridium genomes of the additional representative genes from B. subtilis: gerPA, gerPB, gerPC, gerPD, gerPE, gerPF, yfkQ, yfkR, spore germination (a). The presence of a homologue was determined by using the OrthoMCL algorithm in the GET_HOMOLOGUES tool. No homologues were identified in the Clostridium genomes of the additional representative genes from B. subtilis: gerPA, gerPB, gerPC, gerPD, gerPE, gerPF, yfkQ, yfkR, yfkT. (b) Three potential pathways as represented by each colour. (c) Those genes that are linked.

resulting in release of DPA [61]. However, in C. perfringens the spoVA operon is not essential for germination [62]. C. gasigenes strains as well those strains belonging to group A (Fig. 1), which included C. estertheticum, C. frigoris, C. bowmanii and C. tagluense species, all harboured two copies of the spoVA operons (Fig. 2). The presence of two spoVA operons has been found in some strains of C. botulinum and C. sporogenes as well as various Bacillus species and has been associated with increased heat resistance [63, 64].

In B. subtilis and C. sporogenes, cortex degradation occurs through activation of the cortex lytic enzymes CwlJ and SleB followed by peptidoglycan degradation [52, 65–67]. Studies suggest that YpeB is required for SleB activation [66, 68]. Orthologues of ypeB as well as sleB and cwlJ were present in all the strains belonging to group A (Fig. 2), suggesting that cortex degradation is initiated via at least the SleB/YpeB pathway. A previous study demonstrated that although some strains of C. botulinum harbour both sleB and cwlJ genes, CwlJ was not crucial for germination [68]. In C. perfringens, the cortex lytic enzyme SleC is activated by a protease CspB [69, 70]. In our analysis, strain M14 and all the C. gasigenes genomes contained both an sleC and cspA homologue, suggesting these strains follow a similar germination pathway to that of C. perfringens.

Germination gene clusters
To investigate the diversity of germination receptor operons of meat spoilage clostridia, we searched the genomes of the five New Zealand meat spoilage strains along with strain CF003 and the three strains C. estertheticum DSM 14864, C. tagluense A121 and C. gasigenes CGAS001 for gerX operons. Five different putative gerX configurations were identified (types 1, 3, 4, 5 and 6), along with a lone gerA in M14 and a lone gerB in strain CF003 (Fig. 3). Three of these configurations (types 1, 3 and 4) have been previously identified in a variety of Clostridium species, including C. botulinum, Clostridium kluyveri,
Germination receptor gerX operon configurations in selected strains of Clostridium associated with meat spoilage. The gerX operon configurations (a) were designated types 1–7 based on the classifications defined previously [59]. Maximum-likelihood phylogenetic trees of the GerA (b), GerB (c) and GerC (d) amino acid sequences from the C. estertheticum strains DSM 14864 and CF003, the C. tagluense strains A121, FP1 and FP2, the C. gasigenes strain CGAS001, the New Zealand strains FP3, FP4 and M14, as well as the reference strains C. botulinum ATCC 3502, BKTO15925, Loch Maree, Ekland 17-B, C. sporogenes NCIMB10696 and B. subtilis 168. The GerX type is denoted by the number after the X and the colour block represents each different gerX configuration. The scale bar is the number of substitutions per site.

Clostridium tetani and C. perfringens [59, 71]. To our knowledge, the configuration types 5 and 6 have not previously been identified. Type 5 has a gerABCCBC operon configuration and was identified in three of the New Zealand meat spoilage strains (FP1, FP2, FP3), as well as the strains C. estertheticum DSM 14864 and C. gasigenes CGAS001 (Fig. 3). Multiple gerB genes have been identified in other gerX configurations, but to our knowledge this is the first time a putative gerX operon with multiple gerC genes has been identified. Type 6 has a gerBCA configuration and was identified in two New Zealand meat spoilage strains, FP2 and FP3, but not in any of the reference strains. Interestingly GerB from the BCA cluster was in the same orthologous group as GerB from the ACB configurations as defined using GET_HOMOLOGUES. Strain M14 was unusual in that it contained one putative gerBAC operon and a lone gerA gene. A lone GerA in C. botulinum has previously been shown to be required for l-alanine-initiated germination [72].

The gerX operons have previously been grouped into subtypes based on the similarity of the amino acid sequences [59]. In agreement with previous results [59], amino acid sequences encoding the Ger A, B and C proteins clustered by type or subtype not by strain (Fig. 3b). The gerX type 1 configurations ABC were distributed throughout, with them grouping by subtype. All the strains (except for M14) harboured at least one type 1 operon. Type 1 germination receptors have been shown to sense a variety of germinants, including l-alanine, l-cysteine, l-methionine, l-serine and l-phenylalanine (in the presence of l-lactate) [73].

Our findings suggest that Clostridium species follow two germination pathways (Fig. 4). The first pathway recognizes germinants through multiple receptors, and cortex degradation occurs via the cwf/sleB pathway similar to that of B subtilis. The
Second pathway recognizes germinants through the GerX1 or GerX3 type receptors with cortex degradation occurring through the cspA-C/sleC pathway.

CONCLUSIONS
This study was carried out to determine whether a genomics approach could be used to provide insights into the possible molecular mechanisms of germination in meat spoilage clostridia. The core components of the germination pathway were conserved in these Clostridium species, indicating that they undergo the same major steps as B. subtilis for sporulation to occur. A key difference between C. gasigenes and the C. estertheticum/C. tagluense cluster strains was the presence of the gene sleC coding for a cortex lytic enzyme in C. gasigenes strains but not strains from the C. estertheticum/C. tagluense cluster, suggesting C. gasigenes strains follow a germination pathway similar to that of C. perfringens. Two additional putative ger operon configurations were identified in some strains of C. estertheticum and C. tagluense. Experimental data are needed to determine whether these additional ger gene clusters recognize alternative germinants.

Funding information
This work was funded by the AgResearch Ltd Strategic Science Investment Fund (SSIF), contract number A25980.

Acknowledgements
We thank Patrick Biggs for advice on bioinformatics methodologies as well as the Food Integrity Systems Team, AgResearch and the “EpiLab, Massey University, for supporting Dr Burgess’ post-doctoral research fellowship.

Author contributions
S.B., F.P.P., A.G., J.M., G.B. and N.P. were involved in the investigation; S.B. and N.P. performed the formal analysis; J.M., G.B. and N.P. were involved in the funding acquisition and conceptualization of the study; S.B. and N.P. drafted the manuscript; S.B., F.P.P., A.G., J.M., G.B. and N.P. revised this manuscript.

Conflicts of interest
The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest.

References
1. Dainty RH, Edwards RA, Hibbard CM. Spoilage of vacuum-packed beef by Aclostridium sp. J Sci Food Agric 1989;49:473–486.
2. Collins MD, Rodrigues UM, Dainty RH, Edwards RA, Roberts TA. Taxonomic studies on a psychrophilic Clostridium from vacuum-packed beef: Description of Clostridium estertheticum sp. nov. FEMS Microbiol Lett 1992;96:235–239.
3. Broda DM, Saul DJ, Lawson PA, Bell RG, Musgrave DR. Clostridium gasigenes sp. nov., a psychrophile causing spoilage of vacuum-packed meat. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2000;50:107–118.
4. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Altermann E, Gardner A, et al. Comparative genomics of Clostridium species associated with vacuum-packed meat spoilage. Food Microbiol 2021;95:103687.
5. Mills J, Donnison A, Brightwell G. Factors affecting microbial spoilage and shelf-life of chilled vacuum-packed lamb transported to distant markets: a review. Meat Sci 2014;98:71–80.

6. Wambui J, Püntener S, Corti S, Cernela N, Stephan R. Detection of Psychrophilic Clostridium spp. Causing “Blown Pack” spoilage in meat juice samples from chilled vacuum-packaged beef and lamb meat imported from different countries to Switzerland. J Food Prot 2020;83:56–59.

7. Adam KH, Flint SH, Brightwell G. Psychrophilic and psychrotrophic clostridia: sporulation and germination processes and their role in the spoilage of chilled, vacuum-packaged beef, lamb and venison. International Journal of Food Science & Technology 2010;45:1539–1544.

8. Bhattacharjee D, McAllister KN, Sorg JA. Germinants and their receptors in Clostridia. J Bacterial 2016;198:2767–2775.

9. Driks A, Eichenberger P. Spore Germination. The Bacterial Spore: From Molecules to Systems. Washington, DC, USA, 2016. pp. 217–236.

10. Foster SJ, Johnstone K. Pulling the trigger: the mechanism of bacterial spore germination. Mol Microbiol 1990;4:137–141.

11. Kohler LJ, Quirk AV, Welkos SL, Cote CK. Incorporating germination-induction into decontamination strategies for bacterial spores. J Appl Microbiol 2018;124:2–14.

12. Jones SW, Paredes CJ, Tracy B, Cheng N, Silbers R, et al. The transcriptional program underlying the physiology of clostridial sporulation. Genome Biol 2008;9:1–21.

13. Setlow P. I will survive: DNA protection in bacterial spores. Trends Microbiol 2007;15:172–180.

14. Broussolle V, Alberts F, Shearman CA, Mason DR, Botella L, et al. Molecular and physiological characterisation of spore germination in Clostridium botulinum and C. sporogenes. Anaerobe 2002;8:89–100.

15. Paredes-Sabja D, Torres JA, Setlow P, Sarker MR. Clostridium perfringens spore germination: characterization of germinants and their receptors. J Bacterial 2008;190:1190–1201.

16. Yu Z, Gunn L, Brennan E, Reid R, Wall PG, et al. Complete genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum DSM 8809, a microbe identified in spoiled vacuum-packed beef. Front Microbiol 2016;7:1764.

17. Wambui J, Cernela N, Stevens MJA, Stephan R. Whole genome sequence-based identification of Clostridium estertheticum complex strains supports the need for taxonomic reclassification within the species Clostridium estertheticum. Front Microbiol 2021;12.

18. Sebaihia M, Peck MW, Minton NP, Thomson NR, Holden MTG, et al. Genome sequence of a proteolytic (Group I) Clostridium botulinum strain Hall A and comparative analysis of the clostridial genomes. Genome Res 2007;17:1082–1092.

19. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum subsp. laramense DSM 14864, isolated from spoiled uncooked beef. Microbiol Resour Announc 2019;8:e01275-19.

20. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium sp. strain FP1, with similarity to Clostridium tagluense, isolated from spoiled lamb. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00321-20.

21. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Whole-genome sequencing of Clostridium sp. strain FP2, isolated from spoiled venison. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00434-20.

22. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum-Like Strain FP3, isolated from spoiled uncooked lamb. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00338-20.

23. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum-like Strain FP4, isolated from spoiled uncooked lamb. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00338-20.

24. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of psychrotolerant Clostridium sp. Strain M14, isolated from spoiled uncooked venison. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00314-20.

25. Palevich FP, Palevich N, Maclean PH, Altermann E, Mills J, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium bowanii DSM 14206′, isolated from an Antarctic microbial mat. Microbiol Resour Announc 2022;11:e013521.

26. Paredes-Sabja D, Setlow P, Sarker MR. Germination of spores of Bacilliales and Clostridiales species: mechanisms and proteins involved. Trends Microbiol 2011;19:85–94.

27. de Hoon MJL, Eichenberger P, Vitkup D. Hierarchical evolution of the bacterial sporulation network. Curr Biol 2010;20:R735–45.

28. Broda DM, De Lacy KM, Bell RG. Efficacy of heat and ethanol spore treatments for the isolation of psychrotrophic Clostridium spp. associated with the spoilage of chilled vacuum-packed meats. Int J Food Microbiol 1998;39:61–68.

29. Lund BM, Graham AF, George SM, Brown D. The combined effect of incubation temperature, pH and sorbic acid on the probability of growth of non-psrotolytic, type B Clostridium botulinum. J Appl Bacteriol 1990;69:481–492.

30. Brightwell G, Clemens R. Development and validation of a real-time PCR assay specific for Clostridium estertheticum and C. estertheticum-like psychrotolerant bacteria. Meat Sci 2012;92:697–703.

31. Wick RR, Judd LM, Gorrie CL, Holt KE. Unicyclist: Resolving bacterial genome assemblies from short and long sequencing reads. PLoS Comput Biol 2017;13:e1005959.

32. Zhang P, Ward P, McMullen LM, Yang X. A case of “blown pack” spoilage of vacuum-packaged pork likely associated with Clostridium estertheticum in Canada. Lett Appl Microbiol 2020;70:13–20.

33. Wambui J, Cernela N, Stevens MJA, Corti S, Stephan R. Draft genome sequences of two phylogenetically distinct Clostridium gasigenes strains, CM001 and CM004, isolated from chilled vacuum-packed meat. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:42.

34. Wambui J, Cernela N, Stevens MJA, Ghiemletti G, Stephan R. Draft genome sequences of two Clostridium algidicarnis strains isolated from meat juice samples of chilled vacuum-packed lamb meat. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:45.

35. Wambui J, Cernela N, Stevens MJA, Stephan R. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum CEST001, belonging to a novel subspecies of C. estertheticum, isolated from chilled vacuum-packed lamb meat imported to Switzerland. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:33.

36. Myers GSA, Rasko DA, Cheung JK, Ravel J, Seshadri R, et al. Skewed genomic variability in strains of the toxigenic bacterial pathogen, Clostridium perfringens. Genome Res 2006;16:1031–1040.

37. Sebaihia M, Peck MW, Minton NP, Thomson NR, Holden MTG, et al. Genome sequence of a proteolytic (Group I) Clostridium botulinum strain Hall A and comparative analysis of the clostridial genomes. Genome Res 2007;17:1082–1092.

38. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum subsp. laramense DSM 14864, isolated from spoiled uncooked beef. Microbiol Resour Announc 2019;8:e01275-19.

39. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium sp. strain FP1, with similarity to Clostridium tagluense, isolated from spoiled lamb. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00321-20.

40. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Whole-genome sequencing of Clostridium sp. strain FP2, isolated from spoiled venison. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9.

41. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum-Like Strain FP3, isolated from spoiled uncooked lamb. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00434-20.

42. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum-Like Strain FP4, isolated from spoiled uncooked lamb. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00338-20.

43. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum-like Strain FP4, isolated from spoiled uncooked lamb. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00338-20.

44. Palevich N, Palevich FP, Maclean PH, Jauregui R, Altermann E, et al. Draft genome sequence of Clostridium estertheticum-like Strain FP4, isolated from spoiled uncooked lamb. Microbiol Resour Announc 2020;9:e00338-20.
and without germinant receptors and cortex-lytic enzymes. spores with germination of individual spores lacking either SpoVAC or dipicolinic acid. J Bacteriol 2017;8:2047.

Li Y, Boland FM, Donnelly ML, Cooper G. Spore germination. Microbiology (Reading) 2000;146 (Pt 1):57–64.

Moir A, Cooper G. Spore germination. Microbiol Spectr 2018;6:2276–2283.

Tovar-Rojo F, Chander M, Setlow B, Setlow P. The products of the spova operon are involved in dipicolinic acid uptake into developing spores of Bacillus subtilis. J Bacteriol 2012;194:1875–1884.

Wang G, Yi X, Li Y, Setlow P. Germination of individual Bacillus subtilis spores with alterations in the GerD and Spova proteins, which are important in spore germination. J Bacteriol 2011;193:2301–2311.

Brunt J, van Vliet AHM, van den Bos F, Carter AT, Peck MW. Diversity of the Germination Apparatus in Clostridium botulinum Groups I, II, III, and IV. Front Microbiol 2016;7:1702.

Galperin MY, Mekhodov SL, Puigbo P, Smirnov S, Wolf YI, et al. Genomic determinants of sporation in Bacilli and Clostridia: towards the minimal set of sporulation-specific genes. Environ Microbiol 2012;14:2870–2890.

Francis MB, Sorg JA. Dipicolinic acid release by germinating Clostridium difficile spores occurs through a mechanosensing mechanism. mSphere 2016;1:e00306–16.

Paredes-Sabja D, Setlow B, Setlow P, Sarker MR. Characterization of Clostridium perfringens spores that lack Spova proteins and dipicolinic acid. J Bacteriol 2008;190:4448–4459.

Li Z, Schottroff F, Simpson DJ, Ganzele MG. The copy number of the spova(2mob) operon determines pressure resistance of bacillus endospores. Appl Environ Microbiol 2019;85:19.

Butler RR, Schill KM, Wang Y, Pombert J-F. Genetic characterization of the exceptionally high heat resistance of the non-toxic surrogate Clostridium sporogenes PA. Front Microbiol 2017;8:545.

Boland FM, Atrih A, Chirakkal H, Foster SJ, Moir A. Complete spore-cortex hydrolysis during germination of Bacillus subtilis 168 requires SleB and YpeB. Microbiology (Reading) 2000;146 (Pt 1):57–64.

Chirakkal H, O’Rourke A, Atrih A, Foster SJ, Moir A. Analysis of spore cortex lytic enzymes and related proteins in Bacillus subtilis endospore germination. Microbiology (Reading) 2002;148:2383–2392.

Li Y, Butzin XY, Davis A, Setlow B, Korza G, et al. Activity and regulation of various forms of CwU, SleB, and YpeB proteins in degrading cortex peptidoglycan of spores of Bacillus species in vitro and during spore germination. J Bacteriol 2013;195:2530–2540.

Meaney CA, Cartman ST, McClure PJ, Minton NP. Optimal spore germination in Clostridium botulinum ATCC 3502 requires the presence of functional copies of SleB and YpeB, but not CwU. Anaerobe 2015;34:86–93.

Paredes-Sabja D, Setlow P, Sarker MR. SleC is essential for cortex peptidoglycan hydrolysis during germination of spores of the pathogenic bacterium Clostridium perfringens. J Bacteriol 2009;191:2711–2720.

Paredes-Sabja D, Setlow P, Sarker MR. The protease CspB is essential for initiation of cortex hydrolysis and dipicolinic acid (DPA) release during germination of spores of Clostridium perfringens type A food poisoning isolates. Microbiology (Reading) 2009;155:3464–3472.

Xiao Y, Francke C, Abee T, Wells-Bennik MHJ. Clostridial spore germination versus bacilli: genome mining and current insights. Food Microbiol 2011;28:266–274.

Brunt J, Carter AT, Pye HV, Peck MW. The orphan germinant receptor protein GerXAO (but not GerX3B) is essential for L-alanine induced germination in Clostridium botulinum Group II. Sci Rep 2018;8:7060.

Brunt J, Plowman J, Gaskin D, Itchner M, Carter AT, et al. Functional characterisation of germinant receptors in Clostridium botulinum and Clostridium sporogenes presents novel insights into spore germination systems. PLoS Pathog 2014;10:e1004382.