Comparison Study about Warehouse Layout from Some Paper Case Studies

Natalia Sudiarta*, Lina Gozali, Iveline Anne Marie, I Wayan Sukania
Industrial Engineering Department, Faculty of Engineering
Universitas Tarumanagara

* natalia.545160069@stu.untar.ac.id, linag@ft.untar.ac.id,
ivelineannemarie@yahoo.com, iwayansukania@gmail.com

Abstract. The warehouse activity has an important role in increasing production. A warehouse may be defined as a place used for the storage or accumulation of goods. The placement of raw materials in warehouse can be a serious problem. To solve the problem, warehouse layout planning is needed. The objective of this paper is to find out the gap between the methods that used in warehouse layout planning. The methods that can be used are Dedicated Storage, Class-Based Storage, Shared Storage, Randomized Storage and also Fishbone Layout. Each methods are used to reduce material handling distance so the flow of raw material will reach an optimum solution.

1. Introduction
Every company has a desire to increase the demands, the efficiency of production time, and also profits. Due to competitive companies, so the improvement of existing systems is needed, as well as the creation of a new system for the company’s progress. To improve the systems, a company needs to fix warehouse activities. Warehouse involves all movements of goods and information within warehouses and distribution centers. It includes activities like receiving, storage, order-picking, accumulation, sorting and shipping. To optimize warehouse activities, an effective layout for the warehouse is needed. The main objective of layout planning is to reduce the distance of moving raw materials from warehouse to production department. To reach the nearer optimal solution, class-based storage can be applied.

2. Literature Study
Warehouse layout is an important consideration for a facility designer because the cost to rent, lease or buy real estate in the United States is increasing[1]. Before layout planning can begin, the specific objectives of a warehouse layout must be determined. In general, the objectives of a warehouse layout are to use space efficiently; to allow the most efficient material handling; to provide the most economical storage in relation to costs of equipment, use of space, damage to material, and handling labor; to provide maximum flexibility in order to meet changing storage and handling requirements; and to make the warehouse a model of good housekeeping. There are two main storage strategies, i.e., the dedicated storage and the shared storage strategies. The concept of dedicated storage or fixed position storage is to locate a product in one specific location. The more popular products are assigned in more convenient locations. In contrast, shared storage is opposite to dedicated storage in which products in shared storage can be located in more than one location [3]. A Class-based storage is a dedicated storage which is related to ABC analysis and it is usually used to increase the overall throughputs. The products in a class-based storage can be categorized into three groups, Group A, Group B, and Group C.
Products categorized as Group A are the most frequently picked products, while Group C is the least frequently picked. The most frequently picked products, about 20 per cent of overall product: Group A, will be assigned to the most convenient locations of the warehouse. However, the percentage for each group is usually depends on the company policies [4].

Class-based storage is a compromise between randomized and dedicated storage. Inventory is assigned a class based on some criteria and each class is assigned a block of storage locations. Within each block of storage locations, material is stored randomly. The objective is to group material with similar characteristics and allocate floor space based on group priority. The classification procedure seeks to increase floor space utilization by limiting the effects of “honeycombing” and decrease material handling by ranking items based on throughput and storage space requirements [5].

The within-aisle travel time is the total travel time inside the aisles that an order picker has to traverse during a pick tour. It is intimately related to the routing method used. If use the return heuristic the within-aisle travel time ($L^{WA}$) can be estimated as the summation (over the set of all aisles) of the product of the probability that aisle/is visited and the expected travel time inside the aisle [6].

Material handling is defined simply as moving material. Material handling is the movement, protection, storage and control of materials and products throughout manufacturing, warehousing, distribution, consumption and disposal. As a process, material handling incorporates a wide range of manual, semi-automated and automated equipment and systems that support logistics and make the supply chain work. Improvements in material handling have positively affected workers more than any other area of work design and ergonomics [7].

3. Comparison study and research gap

3.1 Research of warehouse layout design with class-based storage method

Naragain Phumchusri and Phuntira Kitpipit (2017) research title is Warehouse Layout Design for an Automotive Raw Material Supplier. The objective of this research is to design the layouts of the two permanent warehouses so that the spaces can be efficiently used and the total picking distance is low. The Adapted Class-Based Turnover Assignment is adopted in order to design the layouts for the two warehouses. Layouts of the warehouses are designed, analyzed, and evaluated. The best layouts give the best trade-off between quantitative results, i.e., the total picking distance and the remaining space, and qualitative results, i.e., the usability and the product suitability. The result of this research is the distance can be reduce by 34 km [8].

Santi N.K., Nasir W. S., Ceria F. M. T. (2013) research title is Redesign Layout of Goods Placement in Material Warehouse Based on Class Based Storage Policy. This time material placement in warehouse has not focus on total frequency movement for each material so the fast moving material will have a long distance. The way to solve that problem is through layout improvements [9].

Hidayat, N. P. A. (2012) research title is Warehouse Layout Design with Class Based Storage Method Case Study CV SG Bandung. This company has not had a good layout. It is shown from raw material inventory in storage that has not using storage layout theory. In this research, class based storage method and shelf, separate fabrics are based on type of fabric in raw material storage that able to improving storage capacity. By proposes the
design raw material storage layout, it should be able to increasing storage capacity, thus, it will be able to give space [10].

3.2 Research of warehouse layouts design with fishbone/chevron layout
Goran D. and Tihomir O. (2014) research title is Warehouse Layout. The objective of this research is to reduce travel distance needed to store or retrieve a single pallet, thus improving the efficiency in the storage area. The result of this research is the reduction in the order- picking travel distance with the turnover-based storage could differ with respect to different layouts and patterns used [11].

3.3 Research of warehouse layouts design with shared storage method
Firman A. E., dan Yaumal A.W. (2012) research title is Warehouse Layout Planning Using Shared Storage Method at Plastic Industry Semarang City. The objective of this research is to reduce material handling distance per month and provide convenience in checking raw materials. Shared storage method can be applied in this research because the raw materials have similar size. The result of this paper is give the best layout with lowest distance [12].

Antoni Yohanes (2018) research title is Warehouse Layout Planning with Shared Storage Method at PT Pantjatunggal Knitting Mill. The problems faced by this company in raw material storage. The distance is too much movement of goods and the amount of material handling costs. Shared storage method is a method used to regulate the storage warehouse to be more effective. The results of the analysis and design of warehouse layout of raw materials is a new layout with shared storage methods [13].

3.4 Research of warehouse layout design with CRAFT method
Lina Y., Evi F., and Lely H. (2016) research title is Improvement Suggestion for Warehouse Layout Using CRAFT Method. In this case, the company has a problem in the layout of the warehouse that is not well arranged. The objective of this research is to suggest the improvement of warehouse layout by minimizing material handling distance. The result of this research is reduce the distance so the warehouse activity could be optimum [14].

3.5 Research of warehouse layout design with dedicated storage method
Andrea, F., Laura S., and Massimiliano M.S. (2013) research title is Minimizing Warehouse Space with a Dedicated Storage Policy. This paper presents a possible operations research-oriented solution to provide a tangible reduction of the overall required warehousing space, thereby translating the storage location assignment problem (SLAP) into a vertex colouring problem (VCP). The proposed methodology relies upon a dedicated storage policy, which is easily implementable by companies of all sizes without the need for investing in expensive IT tools [15].

Tita T., Rindra Y., Tita T. (2017) research title is Improvement Suggestion for Finished Goods Warehouse Layout Using Dedicated Storage Method to Increase Effectiveness at PT Restomart Cipta Usaha. The problem in this company is the preparation of finished products in the market is not irregular or is weak orderly. Happened the preparation of units is done in any place in accordance with his project, setting it is also not fixed or fickle, so that cause to flow in and out goods this is not well coordinated. To deal with proposal is required rearrangement with the dedicated storage, from scratch travel
time obtained from goods in and freight out at the conditions [16].

3.6 Research about performance model for orderpicking systems with randomized storage
Charles, J.M., Khalid A.T. (2000) research title is An Integrated Performance Model for Orderpicking Systems with Randomized Storage. Storage area material flow models based on lot size reorder point policies are integrated with orderpicking travel time models to generate aggregate retrieval area space requirements for randomized storage systems. These results are used to develop cycle time models for single and dual command orderpicking transactions and to evaluate the impact of alternative interleaving disciplines on system performance [17].

| Description | Naragain P. | Karnsish S. N. | Nita P. A. H. | Gorna D. | Firmann A. E. | Antoni Y. | Lina | Andreea F. | Tita T. | Charles J. M. |
|-------------|-------------|---------------|---------------|----------|---------------|-----------|------|------------|--------|--------------|
| Method      | Class Based Storage | Class Based Storage | Fishbone Layout | Share d Stora ge | Share d Stora ge | CRAFT | Dedicated Stora ge | Dedicated Stora ge | Rando mized Storage |
| Makespan Improvement | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Industry | Automotiv e | Filter Produ ction | Conv ection | Plasti c | Knitti ng | Groce ries | - | Consum er Good s | - |

| Production Capacity per year |
|-------------------------------|
| Instution/Pub lisher | Chula longkorn | Univer sitas Brawi yaja | Jurnal AL-AZH | Univer sity of Zagreb AR IND ONE SIA | Dina mika Teknik k | Dina mika Teknik k | Jurnal Teknik k Industr i | Univer sity of Rome | Univer sitas Dian Nusw antor o | Applie d Mathe matical Modelli ng |

4. Research and Discussion
Based on study and research among all papers, we can conclude that to reduce material handling distance per month or to arrange raw materials in warehouse, we can use many methods of warehouse layout. The warehouse layout method such as Dedicated Storage, Class-Based Storage, Shared Storage, Randomized Storage, and also Fishbone Layout. We also can combine more than 2 methods to find the nearer optimal result.

References
[1] Heragu, S.S. 2016. Facilities Design. Florida: CRC Press Taylor and Francis Group. 4th Ed.
[2] Salveny, G. 2001. Handbook of Industrial Engineering: Technology and Operations Management. New York: A Wiley-Interscience Publication. 3rd Ed.
[3] J. J. Bartholdi and S. T. Hackman. 2011. Warehouse & distribution science release
0.95. Atlanta: School of Industrial and Systems Engineering, Georgia Institute of Technology.

[4] M. Tostar and P. Karlsson. 2008. *Lean Warehousing, in Communications & Transport System*. The Institute of Technology at Linköping University.

[5] Kusiak, A., 2000. *Computational Intelligence in Design and Manufacturing*. Canada: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

[6] Rene de Koster and W. Delfmann. 2005. *Supply Chain Management-European Perspectives*. Denmark: Copenhagen Business School Press.

[7] Stephen, M.P. and F.E. Meyers. 2013. *Manufacturing Facilities: Design and Material Handling*. Pearson Education, Inc.

[8] Phumchusri, N. And P. Kitpipit. 2017. *Warehouse Layout Design for an Automotive Raw Material Supplier*. Engineering Journal Vol. 21

[9] Karonsih, S. N., N.W. Setyanto, and C. F. M. Tantrika. 2013. Perbaikan Tata Letak Penempatan Barang di Gudang Penyimpanan Material berdasarkan Class Based Storage Policy. Jurnal Rekayasa dan Manajemen Sistem Industri. Vol. 1 No. 2.

[10] Hidayat, N. P. A. Perancangan Tata Letak Gudang dengan Metoda Class-Based Storage Studi Kasus CV. SG Bandung. Jurnal AL-AZHAR INDONESIA SERI SAINS DAN TEKNOLOGI. Vol. 1. No. 3

[11] Dukic, G. And T. Opetuk. 2014. *Warehouse Layouts*. University of Zagreb.

[12] Ekoanindiyono, F. A. And Y. A. Wedana. 2012. Perencanaan Tata Letak Gudang Menggunakan Metode *Shared Storage* di Pabrik Plastik Kota Semarang. Jurnal Dinamika Teknik Vol. VI No. 1.

[13] Yohanes, A. 2018. Perancangan Tata Letak Gudang Bahan Baku dengan Metode *Shared Storage* pada PT Pantjatunggal Knitting Mill. Dinamika Teknik

[14] Yuliana L., Evi F., Lely H. 2016. Usulan Perbaikan Tata Letak Gudang dengan Menggunakan Metode CRAFT (Studi Kasus di Gudang K-Store, Krakatau Junction). Jurnal Teknik Industri. Vol. 4. No. 2

[15] Fumi, A., L. Scarabotti, and M. M. Schiraldi. 2013. *Minimizing Warehouse Space with a Dedicated Storage Policy*. International Journal of Engineering Business Management.

[16] Tasdikin, T., R. Yusianto, and T. Talitha. 2017. Usulan Perbaikan Tata Letak Gudang Barang Jadi dengan Menggunakan Metode *Dedicated Storage* Guna Meningkatkan Efektifitas di PT Restomart Cipta Usaha. Skripsi, Universitas Dian Nuswantoro Semarang.

[17] Malmborg, C. J. And K. Al-Tassan. 2000. *An Integrated Performance Model for Orderpicking Systems with Randomized Storage*. Applied Mathematical Modelling.