Improving pitting corrosion resistance of the commercial titanium through graphene oxide-titanium oxide composite

Talal A. Aljohani\textsuperscript{a,*,} Muntathir I. Albeladi\textsuperscript{a}, Basheer A. Alshammari\textsuperscript{b}

\textsuperscript{a} National Centre for Chemical Technologies, King Abdullah City for Science and Technology (KACST), Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{b} Materials Science Research Institute, King Abdullah City for Science and Technology (KACST), Riyadh, Saudi Arabia

Abstract

Titanium oxide has been commonly used for wide range of applications due to excellent corrosion resistance. This study presents the impact of graphene oxide (GO) addition to titanium oxide as coating materials during titanium anodization process on the corrosion behaviour. The GO was prepared by electrochemical exfoliation using low voltage mode in a sodium sulphate electrolyte, which is easier and more environmentally friendly compared to the chemical approach. Raman and scanning electron microscope were used to examine the success of the exfoliation process. The surface morphologies and potentiodynamic polarization results indicate that the addition of GO significantly inhibit the pitting corrosion and stabilize passivation current densities over wide ranges of anodic potentials. The untreated titanium, however, noticeably displayed fluctuation of anodic current densities, confirming the presence of pitting corrosion. The results obtained by electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) also confirm that the addition of GO enhanced corrosion protection even at higher frequency ranges. The cyclic polarization scan results show a positive shift in the re-passivation potential $E_{\text{rep}}$ after the addition of GO. This work emphasizes that the addition of GO during anodization of titanium not only protect its surface from pitting corrosion but also provide a strong passive layer.

1. Introduction

In the earth's crust, titanium is the ninth most abundant element, and it is found naturally in its oxides' states such as TiO$_2$ in which the world produces 4.3 million tons each year [1]. Among various metals, titanium and its alloys have superior properties such as low density, high strength to weight ratio, non-toxicity, high stability, easy dispersity, fatigue and excellent corrosion resistance [1]. Therefore, these materials are being used extensively in various applications such as solar energy, photocatalytic synthesis, medical purpose and particularly in coating applications [2, 3, 4, 5]. The titanium passivation layer is not very stable under certain conditions and is sensitive to the local breakdown, so cracks resulting from the localized breakdown potential on a microscopic scale ultimately lead to enhanced ending of the titanium or its alloy substrate at localized sites (i.e. pitting corrosion) [6, 7, 8, 9]. Therefore, surface modification of titanium is often performed in order to enhance corrosion behavior for some applications [10, 11, 12].

Metal corrosion has become a very serious issue. The global annual corrosion cost is estimated to be around 3–5% of the GDP [13]. Coating on metal substrates to reduce corrosion is widely used as an effective solution. For example, coating on mild steel with diamond like carbon plus incorporated copper showed superb anti corrosion behavior in 3.5 wt.% NaCl due to higher sp$^2$ carbon bonds by using magnetron sputtering method [14, 15]. Polyurethane incorporated with functionalized graphene oxide by (3-glycidyloxypropyl) trimethoxysilane is an organic coating used on mild steel and showed no corrosion spots up to 600 h in salt spray experiment and higher $|Z|_{10\text{ mHz}}$ values which indicate a barrier to the corrosive electrolyte [16].

There are several techniques for the surface modification including physical and chemical vapor deposition, laser deposition, thermal oxidation, plasma spray, plasma-immersion ion implantation (pulsed-plasma doping), abrasive blasting, plasma electrolytic oxidation, and electrochemical oxidation (anodic oxidation). However, there are several parameters including electrolyte voltage, current density, electrolyte type, temperature, alloying elements and process time can control the quality and thickness of the oxide films and finally morphology of the surface [2, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 41].

Nanomaterials have been widely used as fillers to improve the corrosion resistance and mechanical properties of polymer and metals. TiO$_2$–Al$_2$O$_3$ nanocomposite coatings, ceramic coating, using...
electrophoretic enhanced micro arc oxidation method improved pitting corrosion of titanium substrate [22]. Chitosan, a polymeric inhibitor, and titanium dioxide nano composite hybrid system shifted the corrosion potential into more positive values and gave 84.7% inhibition efficiency using Tafel plot for mild steel samples in 0.1 N HCl [23]. Titanium dioxide and reduced graphene coating using plasma electrolytic oxidation technique on titanium substrate showed an increase in polarization resistance from $1.88 \times 10^5$ to $195.3 \times 10^6 \Omega \cdot \text{cm}^2$ with 0.5 g L$^{-1}$ reduced graphene oxide addition [24]. S.C. Vanithakumaria, et al. coated titanium with graphene oxide using electrophoretic deposition and then with silanized silica nanoparticles which formed covalent bonds to the graphene oxide sheet, as a result, biofouling of titanium was lowered as bacterial adhesion decreased of the coated sample by 3–5 orders [25]. Graphene oxide was modified by TiO$_2$ nanoparticles improved the corrosion resistance performance of epoxy coating due to high dispersion and exfoliation of the hybrid [26].

Graphene oxide (GO) is one of nanomaterials that has 2D carbon sheet with oxygenated functional group; GO is obtained through the exfoliation of the graphite. During the exfoliation, the introduction of functional groups reduces the interlayer interactions resulting in graphite intercalation compounds which well known as graphite oxide or expandable graphite [27, 28, 29, 30]. The most oxidation technique used of graphite exfoliation is a chemical oxidation of graphite by means of strong oxidants such as potassium permanganate and sulfuric acids. This oxidation is followed by sonication process for GO, which then chemically, thermally, or electrochemically reduced to eliminate the majority of the oxygen functionalities to get a graphene nanoplatelets. One of the modern techniques to make GO is the electrochemical exfoliation of graphite in anodic or cathodic environments, which forces the intercalation of electrolyte ions between their graphene layers. Several different electrolytes have been investigated. For instance, Ambrosi et al [31], investigated different electrolytes (lithium perchlorate, sulfuric acid and sodium sulfate) for the electrochemical exfoliation of graphite. They reported that all electrolytes create graphene with high structural defects. However, different quantities of oxygen groups were also reported. The quality of exfoliated graphene is strongly affected by the potential applied and the electrolyte type employed. The presence of defect or structural damage aids the electron transfer with redox molecules which is useful for electrode materials [31, 32, 33]. GO is usually used as additive/filler with hydrophilic materials to reduce the migration and adsorption of corrosive media and improve wear resistance. Thus, it is of great interest to explore the addition of GO nano-particles or nanosheets into titanium in order to enhance its superior properties to be used in the coating filed [13, 34, 35].

Therefore, in this study, graphite sheet was exfoliated by electrochemical anodization method under low voltage to obtain GO with less structural damage. The GO nanomaterials were functionalized during the anodization process of titanium to fabricate some new composite materials with excellent anticorrosion characteristic, which probably suitable for environments and applications that require corrosion protection. Accordingly, this study is of great importance for the practical application of TiO$_2$/GO as a hybrid anti-corrosive material.

2. Experimental section

2.1. Graphene oxide and titanium oxide composite coating procedure

Graphite sheet was supplied from Dasen Technology Co in China. Graphite sheet and stainless steel were used as anode and cathode, respectively. In a small coating cell, electrochemical exfoliation was performed at 10 V in [0.5 M] sodium sulphate (Na$_2$SO$_4$) solution. Subsequently, the ash of exfoliated GO was filtered using a microfilter paper and a vacuum pump then it was heated at 80°C in the oven. After that, BRANSON Digital Sonifier sonicated the GO for 5 min under 30% amplitude. The fined GO particles were dried and kept in a small screw cap bottle for Ti anodization experiment.

Pure Ti foils (99.6% purity, 0.25-mm thickness, Alfa Aesar) were thoroughly cleaned in the ultrasonic baths of ethanol and DI water for 5 and 10 min, respectively. Titanium dioxide (TiO$_2$) film were produced by a two-step electrochemical step. Initially, titanium sheet was electrochemically cleaned in a solution contains (7 g/l Na$_2$SiO$_3$, 2.7 g/l KOH), basic solution. Subsequently, the anodic titanium oxidation (ATO), step was achieved using N8738A Power Supply (85 V, 42 A, 3360 W, supplied

| Samples          | $\mu$A (mV.dec$^{-1}$) | $\nu$C (mV.dec$^{-1}$) | $E_{corr}$ (mV/SCE) | $i_{corr}$ ($\mu$Acm$^{-2}$) |
|------------------|------------------------|------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------------|
| Ti sheet         | 212.1                  | 93.60                  | -279.5              | 0.038                         |
| TAO basic soln   | 431.7                  | 122.3                  | -206.1              | 0.023                         |
| TAO basic soln +5mg GO | 301.0                 | 123.1                  | -287.2              | 0.020                         |
| TAO basic soln +10mg GO | 129.5               | 61.00                  | -326.5              | 0.018                         |
| TAO basic soln +20mg GO | 123.0            | 75.8                   | -340.0              | 0.021                         |
| TAO basic soln +50mg GO | 130.3             | 58.8                   | -292.2              | 0.015                         |

Figure 1. SEM image of (a) graphite powder, (b) graphene oxide before sonication, which used to disperse GO during anodization process.
by KEYSIGHT). The pure TiO$_2$ film was grown on titanium anode by fixing the potential at 84V for 30 min in the basic solution and platinum was used as a cathode. GO/TiO$_2$ composite coating was grown at the same potential but adding a designated amount of GO into the basic solution as 5, 10, 20 and 50 mg/L.

2.2. Material characterisation

Scanning electron microscope type SEM, JSM-IT300 InTouchScope™, in combination with X-MaxN Oxford energy-dispersive X-ray spectrosopy EDS analyzer was used to characterize morphology of both graphite and GO. Raman spectroscopy Thermo-Fisher DRX2 Raman spectrometer was also utilized in this study. Both SEM and Raman were utilized in order to ensure the exfoliation process taken place successfully.

2.3. Electrochemical measurement

A coating cell with three electrodes was used. A carbon rod and Ag/AgCl electrode were used as the counter and reference electrode, respectively. Measurements were performed in a 0.6M NaCl aqueous solution at room temperature using SP-200 Potentiostat (Bio-Logic). A

| Treatment solution | $R_s$ ($\Omega$.cm$^2$) | CPE1 ($\Omega^{-1}$.s$^n$.cm$^{-2}$) | $n_1$ | $R_p$ ($\Omega$.cm$^2$) | CPE2 ($\Omega^{-1}$.s$^n$.cm$^{-2}$) | $n_2$ | $R_{ct}$ ($\Omega$.cm$^2$) |
|--------------------|----------------|----------------|------|----------------|----------------|------|----------------|
| Ti sheet           | 3.74           | $8.67 \times 10^{-5}$ | 1    | 126748         | $1.35 \times 10^{-4}$ | 0.72 | 2770           |
| TAO basic soln     | 1.12           | $1.1 \times 10^{-4}$ | 1    | 95186          | $3.05 \times 10^{-4}$ | 0.65 | 26533          |
| TAO basic soln +5mg GO | 0.43     | $8.56 \times 10^{-5}$ | 0.95 | 199569         | $9.46 \times 10^{-4}$ | 0.52 | 61843          |
| TAO basic soln +10mg GO | 0.57    | $6.89 \times 10^{-5}$ | 0.89 | 166890         | $4.14 \times 10^{-4}$ | 0.57 | 67.97          |
| TAO basic soln +20mg GO | 2.47    | $7.54 \times 10^{-5}$ | 0.90 | 263865         | $7.12 \times 10^{-4}$ | 0.52 | 1589625        |
| TAO basic soln +50mg GO | 1.64    | $6.73 \times 10^{-5}$ | 0.87 | 374280         | $1.46 \times 10^{-4}$ | 0.68 | 345.4          |
potentiodynamic polarization (PDP) was applied in a wide potential window with 0.166 mV/s scan rate. Cyclic polarization scan was applied over a wide range of potential from -0.6 to 1.2 V. Electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) was performed at the open-circuit potential, $E_{corr}$, by applying a sinusoidal voltage between $\pm 10$ mV in a frequency range of 10 mHz–100 kHz.

3. Results and discussion

3.1. Electrochemical exfoliation of graphene oxide

The nature of the graphite surface and its exfoliation process were investigated using SEM images and Raman spectroscopy. As shown in Figure 1a, the as-received graphite sheet paper exhibits bulky and large platelets. On the other hand, GO showed a rougher surface with the detached palettes, which appears much smaller than as received graphite. In addition, visible cracks are noticed after exfoliation that resulted from breakdown of expandable graphite structures during the exfoliation process [35]. Therefore, these signs observed in Figure 1b indicate the success of the electrochemical exfoliation of graphite at sodium sulphate electrolyte presented in this study. Similar observation of SEM morphologies of graphite and GO were reported elsewhere [36,37].

Figure 6. Surface morphologies after corrosion test (a) Ti sheet, (b) TAO basic soln, (c) TAO with 5mg GO, (d) TAO with 10mg GO, (e) TAO with 20mg GO (f) TAO with 50mg GO. TAO stands for titanium anodization oxidation.

Figure 7. Cyclic Potentiodynamic curves for investigated samples in a synthetic sodium chloride electrolyte [0.6M] at room temperature; scan rate is 1 mV/s. Basic solution only contains $[\text{Na}_2\text{SiO}_3$ and KOH].
In order to ensure the successful preparation of GO Raman spectroscopy was used. It is clear from Figures 2 and 3 that GO was successfully produced as the ratio of ID/IG coincide with the literature [33,38]. In Figure 2, graphite has a small D peak at 1349 cm\(^{-1}\), G peak at 1580 cm\(^{-1}\), G* peak at 2452 cm\(^{-1}\) and 2D peak at 2716 cm\(^{-1}\). Compared to graphite, graphene oxide’s D peak intensity increased and it broadened due to sp\(^3\) carbon modes in Raman while its 2D peak intensity decreased due to increased functional groups that contain oxygen which are in accordance with literature [39]. GO peaks are the following: D peak at 1349 cm\(^{-1}\), G peak at 1584 cm\(^{-1}\) and two overtone peaks which are 2D or G at 2703 cm\(^{-1}\) and D + D at 2836 cm\(^{-1}\) that is induced by sufficient defects in the sample as noticed also elsewhere [38,40].

The present results show similar pattern to few layers wrinkled graphene that obtained from graphite in a single process.

### 3.2. Corrosion performance

Figure 4 shows corrosion potential performance before and after anodizing process. It is clear that forming titanium oxide composite film increases the corrosion potentials toward passive potentials. The sample with less GO loading shows more passive and stable corrosion potentials. In general, coated samples show nobler corrosion potentials than pure titanium sheet.

Potentiodynamic curves are presented in Figure 5. The titanium sheet shows breakable passivation performance. Besides, the oscillation of the anodic current densities indicates the presence of sever pitting corrosion. The anodized samples, however, display a clear passivation performance. In addition, no indication for pitting corrosion was observed. The samples with GO loading i.e. 5-50 mg/L show more passivation. This coincides with corrosion potentials results presented in Figure 4. Furthermore, as shown in Figure 6, surface morphologies show a formation of oxide layer on the anodized samples. The Ti sheet, however, exhibits small and dark dots that probably associated with corrosion pitting signs shown in Figure 5. The addition of low loading of GO significantly improved oxide layer on surface morphologies as seen in Figure 6c,d. The corrosion current density decreased after anodization process as presented in Table 1. The addition of 10 mg/L of GO exhibits further reduction in the corrosion current density. Small shift toward the negative potential associated with the addition of GO. The cathodic current density increased after anodization process indicating the formation of titanium hydride (TiH\(_2\)). The latter phase probably facilitated the binding of GO to the titanium oxide surface producing a stable passivation layer over wide ranges of anodic potentials. Another evidence of the formation of TiH\(_2\) is the noticeable decrease in the cathodic Tafel constant as presented in Table 1. This also observable in the inset in Figure 5.

To examine localized corrosion susceptibility, the cyclic potentiodynamic polarization test was performed as shown in Figure 7. The
pure titanium shows transient oscillation of anodic current, which indicates the occurrence of localized corrosion i.e. metastable pits. The anodized samples at basic solution and the one with GO addition show no indication of pitting corrosion. Furthermore, they display more positive re-passivation potential (E_{pp}) in comparison with pure titanium. The low loading of GO exhibits the best corrosion protection and the re-passivation potential shifts toward passivity region. In addition, it shows a fully passivation on wide positive potentials range.

The electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) results reveal that the anodized samples display higher corrosion resistance as shown in Figure 8. The untreated sample viz. titanium sheet shows only charge transfer resistance process. However, the anodized samples exhibit both charge transfer and diffusion control process. This agrees with anodic passivation witnessed in Figures 5, 7.

At Figure 9a, the Bode plots of phase angle vs. log f exhibit additional characteristics. The untreated titanium shows unstable (i.e. pitting corrosion) at lower frequency range and a clear reduction of the phase angle at higher frequency range. At the intermediate frequency range, it shows an adequate protection and the phase angle has not changed. The anodized titanium with basic solution i.e. TAO basic solution, displays improvement of oxide film protection at the higher frequency range; however, at the intermediate frequency range the phase angle degree slightly reduced, indicating that the formed oxide has a lower compactness despite increasing the charge transfer resistance. This data is simulated using EC presented in Figure 9b and the fitted results are presented in Table 2. The EC consist of inner and outer layer. The hybrid coating may contain more than two layers depending on the coating system [39]; [cc]. The total corrosion resistance is the sum of polarization resistance and charge transfer resistance (R_{p} + R_{ct}). After anodization with only basic soln (with no GO additive), the polarization resistance decreased where the charge transfer resistance increased. This indicates that the outer layer of coating improved but the inner layer still not fully compact. The addition of GO changed the phase angle performance at all frequency ranges. For instance, as shown in Figure 9a observable shift to higher phase angle with appearing two-time constants (i.e. labeled by arrows) particularly with addition of 5 and 10mg GO. The higher loading 50 mg of GO constantly improved the polarization resistance by 195%, compared with neat Ti sheet. The fitting date of charge transfer resistance displays variable performance.

4. Conclusion

GO was successfully exfoliated in sodium sulphate (Na_{2}SO_{4}) solution using electrochemical method at low potential voltage. The fine GO particles with different loadings were used during titanium anodization to obtain TiO$_2$/GO composite coating. The incorporating 5–50 mg of GO remarkably inhibited pitting corrosion and improve polarization resistance by three to four times compared to pure Ti sheet and TAO basic solution. The passivation layer and re-passivation ability were investigated by cyclic potentiodynamic scan. The addition of GO increases the re-passivation potential and the E_{pp} shifted to more positive values. The formation of titanium hydride (TiH$_2$) phase probably facilitated the binding of GO.

Declarations

Author contribution statement

Talal A. Aljohani: Conceived and designed the experiments; Analyzed and interpreted the data; Wrote the paper.

Muntahir I. Albeladi: Performed the experiments; Wrote the paper.

Basheer A. Alshammari: Analyzed and interpreted the data; Contributed reagents, materials, analysis tools or data; Wrote the paper.

Funding statement

This work was supported by King Abdulaziz City for Science and Technology (KACST) in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (Ref. no. 37502500).

Data availability statement

Data included in article supplementary material/referenced in article.

Declaration of interests statement

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Additional information

No additional information is available for this paper.

References

[1] C. Chen, J. Wang, Nanoscale titanium dioxide: environmental health and ecotoxicological effects, Environ. Environ. Heal. (2011) 12–21.

[2] A.K. Sharma, Anodizing titanium for space applications, Thin Solid Films 208 (1992) 48–54.

[3] J.L. Delplancke, M. Degree, A. Fontana, R. Winand, Self-colour anodizing of titanium, Surf. Technol. 16 (1982) 153–162.

[4] R. Narayanan, S.K. Seshadri, Phosphoric acid anodization of Ti-6Al-4V - structural and corrosion aspects, Corrosion Sci. 49 (2007) 542–558.

[5] M. Lewandowska, M. Piszczek, K. Rozniatowski, M. Grzanka-Dublik, M. Janik-Czachor, K.J. Kurzydłowski, Nanoscale characterization of anodic oxide films on Ti-6Al-4V alloy, Thin Solid Films 515 (2007) 6460–6464.

[6] Y. Jiang Cheng, X.Q. Wu, Z. gang Xue, E. Marykina, P. Skeldon, G.E. Thompson, Microstructure, corrosion and wear performance of plasma electrolytic oxidation coatings formed on Ti-6Al-4V alloy in silicate-hexametaphosphate electrolyte, Surf. Coating. Technol. 217 (2013) 129–139.

[7] I.J. Kotejczyk, M.L. Vera, C.E. Scherez, E. Heredia, A.E. Ares, TiO2 coatings in alkaline electrolytes using anodic oxidation technique, Procedia Mater. Sci. 8 (2015) 65–72.

[8] D. Landolt, S. Mischler, Introduction, Tribocorrosion Passiv. Met. Coatings, 2011.

[9] C.C. Chen, J.H. Chen, C.G. Chao, W.C. Yeh, Electrochemical characteristics of surface of titanium formed by electrolytic polishing and anodizing, J. Mater. Sci. 40 (2005) 4053–4059.

[10] Q. Mohsen, S.A. Fadl-Allah, Improvement in corrosion resistance of commercial pure titanium for the enhancement of its biocompatibility, Mater. Corros. 62 (2011) 310–319.

[11] S. Kumar, T.S.N.S. Narayanan, S. Ganesh Sundara Raman, S.K. Seshadri, Surface modification of CP-Ti to improve the fretting corrosion resistance: thermal oxidation vs. anodizing, Mater. Sci. Eng. C 20 (2010) 921–927.

[12] K. Das, S. Bose, A. Bandopadhyay, Surface modifications and cell-materials interactions with anodized Ti, Acta Biomater. 3 (2007) 573–585.

[13] H. Yuan, F. Qi, N. Zhao, P. Wan, B. Zhang, H. Xiong, B. Liao, X. Ouyang, Graphene oxide decorated with titanium nanoparticles to reinforce the anti-corrosion performance of epoxy coating, Coatings 10 (2020).

[14] S. Khamseh, E. Alibakhshi, M. Mahdavian, M.R. Saeb, H. Vahabi, N. Kokayani, P. Labue, Magnetron-sputtered copper/diamond-like composite thin films with super anti-corrosion properties, Surf. Coating. Technol. 333 (2018) 148–157.

[15] Mohammad Reza Derakhshandeh, Mohamad Eshraghi, M. Javaheri, Sara Khamseh, G. Strnad, C. Petrovan, O. Russu, L. Jakab-Farkas, TiO2 nanostructured surfaces for titanium, Surf. Coating. Technol. 16 (1982) 153–162.

[16] H. Niazi, S. Yari, F. Golestani-Fard, M. Shahmiri, W. Wang, A. Alfantazi, R. Bayati, Functionalized graphene oxide on the mechanical and anti-corrosion properties of polyurethane coating, J. Taiwan Inst. Chem. Eng. 86 (2018) 199–212.

[17] G. Strnad, C. Petrovan, O. Russu, L. Jakab-Farkas, TiO2 nanostructured surfaces for biomedical applications developed by electrochemical anodization, IOP Conf. Ser. Mater. Sci. Eng. 161 (2016).

[18] S.L. De Anis, S. Wolynec, I. Costa, Corrosion characterization of titanium alloys by electrochemical techniques, Electrochim. Acta 51 (2006) 1815–1819.

[19] H. Niazi, S. Yari, F. Golestan-Fard, M. Shahmiri, W. Wang, A. Alfantazi, R. Bayati, How deposition parameters affect corrosion behavior of TiO 2 – Al 2 O 3 nanocomposite coatings, Appl. Surf. Sci. 353 (2015) 1245–1252.

[20] S. John, A. Salam, A.M. Baby, A. Joseph, Corrosion inhibition of mild steel using chitosan/TiO2 2 nanocomposite coatings, Prog. Org. Coating 129 (2019) 254–259.

[21] A. Bordbar-Khiabani, S. Ebrahimi, B. Yarmand, Highly corrosion protection properties of plasma electrolytic oxidized titanium using rGO nanosheets, Appl. Surf. Sci. 486 (2019) 153–165.

[22] M.T. Mohammed, Z.A. Khan, A.N. Siddiquee, Surface modifications of titanium materials for developing corrosion behavior in human body environment: a review, Procedia Mater. Sci. 6 (2014) 1610–1618.
