Transformation of the spiritual and moral foundations of personality development in the education of modern Russia

Elena Tkach1,*, Dina Kazantseva2, Albina Gilyano3

1Pacific National University, 680000, Karl Marx Street, 68, Khabarovsk, Russia
2Southern Federal University, 344006, Bolshaya Sadovaya st., 105/42, Rostov-on-Don, Russia
3Russian State Agrarian University – Moscow Timiryazev Agricultural Academy, 127550, Timiryazevskaya Street, 49, Moscow, Russia

Abstract. The spiritual and moral development of personality in Russia, carried out in the modern socio-cultural environment, depends on the corresponding influence of the mechanisms of state regulation, ensuring the sustainable development of the modern society within globalization. The problem of the spiritual and moral state of an individual is strategic, since its solution ultimately determines the nature and direction of the development not only of a specific individual, but of the country as a whole. In this regard, the purpose of the study was the transformation of the spiritual and moral foundations of personality development in the modern socio-cultural environment and the influence of the mechanism of state regulation on it. For the study, a focus group was conducted in two stages: from March 1 to March 31, 2010 and from February 1 to February 31, 2021. The research region is the Penza region. At the first stage in 2010, the focus group consisted of 15 specialists from three fields of activity: social, political, and economic. On the second one in 2021 there were 20 specialists from three fields of activity: social, political, and economic. All respondents have higher education.

1 Introduction

The questions of spirituality, spiritual and moral development of the individual have recently been increasingly raised at all levels of the hierarchy of the authorities, as well as in the scientific and social environment. The attempts are being made to solve the problem situations that have arisen. The actualization of this topic is determined by the state of the modern Russian society, characterized by a deep crisis of spirituality, morality and culture, both of the younger generation and society as a whole.

A spiritual crisis has engulfed all aspects of the life of a person and the society. Far from the last place in this process belongs to the state regulation of this issue, the state of the rule-making and spiritual and moral rationing, the domestic and foreign media, which is part of the socialization system of both adults and the younger generation, which form the public
opinion, the peculiarities of assessing people and events that regulate the standards of the masses’ life and consciousness.

Young people belong to a social group that determines the future of Russia. As she matures, their spirit world is in a state of formation. Their formation is influenced by the socio-economic and socio-political conditions of the country. As a result, specific social and psychological traits\(^1\), a certain type of the personality are formed.

It is an important task of the state to grow a person capable of thinking about the future of the country, to create their own and public prospects, to set serious tasks and find bold solutions. However, modern youth is developing in a complex environment with the simultaneous presence of both old and new material and spiritual values, different conflicting worldviews, ideas, ideals and meanings.

The formation of an adult personality begins in adolescence and ends in general by the age of 30. Historically, the basis of his formation in Russia is the spiritual and moral foundations, which are basic for all the peoples of the country, corresponding to the mentality of the Russians. Worldview values and meanings, their essential basis, determinants and mechanisms of the development are well represented in the works of D. B. Kazantseva [1], E. K. Klimova, T. E. Chernysheva and others [2], E. N. Tkach and others [3], A. R. Bulatova [4], A. V. Gushchina [5], E. Yu. Pochtareva [6], L. Sagiv, S. Roccas, J. Cieciuch, S. H Schwartz [7], and many others.

The modern transformation of the spiritual values, as well as the provisions that determine the foundations of the spiritual and moral development of the personality of the young generation, who is the future of the modern Russia, are revealed in the works of Yu. V. Verba [8], A.S. Gilyano [9], S. H Schwartz [10], V. Ponizovskiy, L. Grigoryan, U. Kühnen, K. Boehnke [11], G. R Maio [12], I. E. Sokolovskaya and I. P. Kutyakova [13], A. Mostfa [14], S.K. Edara and del Castillo, A. et al. [15], and many others.

Especially significant are the studies that determine the foundations of the civilizational development of Russia by Yu. M. Reznik [16], O. S Anisimov [17], the mentality of the Russians by A. V. Lubsky [18], R. A. Lubsky, V. P. Voitenko and others [19], and many others.

2 Materials and methods

Due to the fact that at present, the study of the spiritual and moral foundations of personality development is especially significant and relevant, the purpose of the study is to transform the spiritual and moral foundations of personality development in the modern sociocultural environment and the influence of the mechanism of the state regulation on it. A focus group was organized and conducted on the problem.

This study was carried out in two stages, from March 1 to March 31, 2010 and from February 1 to February 31, 2021. The Volga region and, directly, the Penza region were selected as the research region. At the first stage in 2010, the focus group consisted of 15 specialists from three fields of activity: social, political, and economic. The average age is 35. By gender there were 10 women and 5 men.

As a continuation of the study, in order to clarify the data on the transformation of the spiritual and moral foundations of the development of a young person’s personality, the ways to solve the problems that have arisen in the society, a second focus group was organized and conducted in February, 2021. It consisted of 20 specialists working in three areas of activity:

---

\(^1\) Order of the Government of the Russian Federation of December 18, 2006 No.1760-p (as amended on July 16, 2009) “On the Strategy of the State Youth Policy in the Russian Federation” // Collected Legislation of the Russian Federation. 2006. No. 52 (part III). Art. 5622.
The selection criteria for the participants were their basic, traditional spiritual and moral values for the country. This criterion was introduced to exclude the problem of intercultural communication and the conflict of the pro-Western and traditional values. All the respondents have higher education. During the focus group, a scenario was prepared for which the questions were developed according to the principle: from general to specific.

3 Result

During 2 stages of the research, the focus groups were prepared and conducted. The subject of the study is the issues of spirituality, morality, the spiritual and moral development, the spiritual and moral potential, the spiritual and moral state of the Russian society, the spiritual and moral education. The study was preceded by the previous studies on this topic in 2009–2010. The important summary results recorded in the protocols and audio recordings during the work of the participants of each focus group in 2010 and 2021, as the analysis units, were the following.

During the discussion of the “spirituality” concept, the 2010 group was divided into those who combined different components in the content and those who separated them, namely, faith in God, that is religiosity, morality, culture and art, the inner world of a person and his mind, strength spirit, which is associated with the soul, spirit, kindness and help to other people. Thus, some participants separated culture from spirituality, considering spirituality to be an internal quality of a person, and culture as an external manifestation; they included the mind and culture in spirituality; they separated the mind from spirituality; they recognized religion as one of the foundations of spirituality, without its absolutization, etc.

In 2021, the fundamental for the participants was that spirituality is faith in God, religiosity, since, in their opinion, spirituality is determined only through religion and it is impossible without God, otherwise the concept itself loses its meaning and becomes “empty”, just a shell, where you can pour any content up to satanism. They noted that art and culture are only derivatives of spirituality.

The concept of “morality” in 2010 was defined by the participants as an internal spiritual principle, the ethical norms and values, as well as, an aggregate concept that includes the internal, spiritual qualities that a person is guided by; the ethical standards, the rules of his behaviour; the value structure of consciousness (a set of the internal attitudes); a way of regulating human actions in all spheres of his life, including his work, everyday life, attitude to the environment; the type of the social relations; restrictions and a system of prohibitions necessary for the society.

In 2021, morality was viewed as an external expression of a person’s spirituality and his religiosity. Due to the fact that spirituality is inseparable from faith and God and the soul, the creation of God cannot exist without it, it was concluded that morality cannot exist without God. Otherwise, the soul is perverted and a person is guided not by conscience, but the principle ‘Take everything from life at once’.

To the question “What do you mean by the concept of ‘the spiritual and moral potential’?”, the following answers were received. According to the 2010 participants’ opinion, the spiritual and moral potential is a person’s ability to cultivate all the best qualities; this is the quality of the higher consciousness that we strive to reveal in ourselves; the inner qualities of a person are potentially inherent in every soul. We need to say that the spiritual and moral potential is not an initially inherent understanding of good and evil, but only the possibility
of its development. However, a person who has lost spirituality cannot develop potential in himself due to the lack of the positive qualities and the most important thing – altruism.

According to the 2021 participants’ opinion, the spiritual and moral potential is a multifaceted phenomenon and a capacious concept. A person with such potential is a believer or living according to the highest moral and ethical laws. He is an example to others, showing his potential in science, art, various areas of reality. The criterion for revealing the spiritual and moral potential is his selfless activity for the good of humanity and even sacrifice in the name of humanity. Such a person has a harmonious unity of the inner world and outer reality.

The following contributes to the decline of spirituality and morality in society, according to the 2010 group’s opinion: the lack of faith and spiritual values, increased aggressiveness of the younger generation; unwillingness to learn; criminalization of the adolescent and youth environment; rejuvenation of the juvenile delinquency, nihilistic attitudes towards the law, marginal lawful behavior; an increase in the number of divorces; an increase in the number of orphans and children left without parental care, children called “refuseniks”; an increase in the use of drugs, alcoholic beverages, beer and tobacco products; an increase in the frequency of the use of obscene and culturally low vocabulary by minors; open access of minors to Internet resources of pornographic, extremist or the content that promotes harshness, violence and the commission of illegal acts; an increase in the number of teenage and youth extremist associations and the number of their members; an increase in the number of minors addicted to video games, computer games, including online games on the Internet, games on game consoles, and games for mobile phones and smartphones. According to the group members’ opinion, the Dulles doctrine, created 60 years ago, is being successfully implemented in the modern Russian society.

According to the 2021 group’s opinion, the main reasons for the decline in spirituality and morality are the state of crisis, when the old system no longer works, it has outlived its usefulness, and the new one has not yet been created. As a result, an imbalance of the material and spiritual values has formed, affecting human development.

The family and the state, decent upbringing and education are considered the mainstay of the spiritual and moral revival in Russia in the 2010 group. The support, according to the 2021 group, is religion and the solution of the state of economic and social problems. The representatives of the group believe that it is necessary to adopt the law on the spiritual and moral development, which determines the methods of the spiritual development and the realization of the spiritual and moral potential in educational and public institutions, religious institutions, family, etc.

Since the state of the child, his behavior is an indicator of the spiritual state of the parents and the spiritual level of the family, then when discussing the issue of the spiritual and moral upbringing, the participants of the 2021 group as a whole noted that spirituality should be “instilled” in children from their childhood, since it cannot appear to itself. At the same time, the opinions were divided. Some participants spoke about the advisability of introducing religious or secular spiritual subjects in schools and universities, both compulsory and optional. The others spoke about the alternative ways of the spiritual and moral growth, not necessarily determined by religion. There was also the point of view that the courses are not needed, since people should have a free choice of the path of their spiritual development.

The issues of the developmental centers, in which the tasks of the spiritual and moral education will be realized, were also discussed. There were proposals, for example, to study spiritual laws already on the basis of a kindergarten, instilling morality through ethics and aesthetics, developing horizons through art, giving knowledge in psychology, children’s philosophy, etc. The main result of it is the development of spirituality from childhood and the implementation of the spiritual and moral behavior. For this, it is necessary to read special, for different ages and levels of consciousness, spiritual literature that combines the aspects of science, religiosity and morality and create an integrated holistic knowledge of life on the
basis of spiritual, objective laws of the development. Traditionally, historically in Russia there was just such a spiritual and moral education.

Also in the 2021 group, it was noted the need at the level of state regulation for the introduction of uniform standards for teaching spirituality and morality, for maintaining the spiritual and moral foundations of the society development, interaction between the state and the church, systematic scientific consecration of the issue at all-Russian and international seminars, conferences on this problem, etc. As noted by the participants, the spiritual and moral revival of the society should begin with the revival of the propaganda of the spiritual and moral foundations of a new life, examples of which have already been in the history of Russia.

4 Discussion

The modern society is characterized by the presence of contradictory tendencies, the pursuit of the traditions and basic spiritual and moral values and the simultaneous active implementation of the Western values. The disruption of the psycho-protective foundations of the mentality of the Russians makes it necessary to analyze the situation on the implementation of the spiritual and moral foundations that determine the development of a young person’s personality at the present stage of the development of Russia.

In general, the similarity of the answers of both groups when considering the concept of “spirituality” is that they viewed religion as a connection between the spiritual and culture, noting that which the religion is, the same culture is formed. Religion determines the power of culture and morality in the society. True religion is from a true understanding of God. The difference of the opinions is that the 2021 group saw the embodiment of spirituality in religiosity, and the 2010 group saw the embodiment of spirituality in all forms and levels of the society. It can be stated that in the period from 2010 to 2021 there were changes in the attitudes towards spirituality, and the participants of the focus 2021 group filled this concept with a religious content.

The analysis of the “morality” concept showed the similarity of the answers of the participants of the focus groups in 2010 and 2021. Considering morality through spirituality, it was concluded that there can be no morality without spirituality, that is: “there is no spirituality, then there is no morality, therefore there are no values. In general, the division into spiritual and moral values is artificial. And this is done when the state ceases to believe that it is religious, so it becomes non-religious. Then only the concepts of “morality” and “moral values” without a spiritual component are taken”. It is in this case, in the opinion of the participants, that abortions become the norm, oblivious to the fact that this is the murder of a human-being, even he is a small one. Murder is becoming the norm in the society. The participants emphasized that only the spiritual and moral norms and values can keep the moral character of a person. Historically, it was spirituality, the foundations of which religion kept, that filled all the moral commandments with meaning. The rejection of God led to the closure of churches and to the desire to no longer obey moral norms: “There is no God and nothing needs to be done”. Filling morality with the spiritual content allowed the participants to create a single cause-and-effect relationship of the process of the spiritual and moral development of the individual.

The cumulative understanding of the spiritual and moral potential as a whole, in the two groups of 2010 and 2021, intersects in an interesting way, complementing each other. To realize the spiritual and moral potential, an inner spiritual space is needed. According to the participants, it is necessary to introduce not a course in religious studies, which causes conflicts between confessions and atheists, but a course in educating the spiritual and moral foundations of a person, influencing through spiritual and moral values on the inner world of a person. Potential is the connection and living interaction of the spiritual and physical world:
the soul as manifestations of the spiritual, and personality as manifestations of the physical. This is a manifestation of the soul, its Divine nature, which in turn gives potential to a person. It is a concentrate that descends from above into the human body. The soul rushes to the inner plane — to the core of the personality and its potential, and transforms, manifesting itself in the results of the external activity of a person. The results collected together are returned to the soul.

It can be noted that the modern events have changed the views of people on many concepts. From 2010 to 2021, the judgments of the participants became deeper, more capacious; the appeal to the spiritual can be traced in all the answers. Tying together the spiritual and moral development and the spiritual and moral potential, the 2021 group members noted that the main task facing the society is the creation of the conditions and structures through which the spiritual and moral potential can be revealed in each person. For this, it is necessary to find the forms of potential manifestation allowing it to be realized. The spiritual and moral development in this case is the education in a person of faith in God and the orientation of the individual to good and moral deeds.

The members of both groups identified the spiritual and moral state of the Russian society as catastrophic. At the same time, the 2021 group pointed to the fact that catastrophes show, first of all, the need to mobilize a person to solve his spiritual problems, which manifested themselves in the “physical” plane. The main prerequisites contributing to the decline of spirituality and morality, in all participants’ opinion, are lack of faith, the massive decline in morals, state policy that does not promote the spiritual and moral values.

The following also contributes to the decline of spirituality and morality in the society (Figure 1): advertising and other TV products that promote and form negative stereotypes of the social behavior (drug addiction, alcohol and tobacco consumption, violence in the society, etc.); Americanization of the society; a low social level of the population; popularization of the Internet network among young people and weak legal regulation of the distribution of information in it harmful for life, as well as for physical, psychological, spiritual and moral health, the development of the young generation; indifference of the authorities to people’s problems; despite the increase of the number of churches, the lack of faith; indifference to the absolute values (the lack of a cult of family, kindness, love, respect, etc.).

![Fig. 1. The decline of spirituality and morality in society?](https://example.com/fig1.png)

The participants in both groups noted that the decline in spirituality and morality is observed in all age groups, since the crisis has affected the entire population of Russia (Figure 2.). At the same time, they emphasized that a massive decline in morals depends on state policy, which renounces the spiritual and moral values. A feature of the problem approach of the 2021 group members was that they identified the cause of the system’s crisis, that is a
change in the basis of the system and, directly, a departure from the spiritual and moral essential foundations of the traditional system of Russia, that is why there was an imbalance of the spiritual and material values, in side of material actualization. It was noted that the current crisis requires, on a new basis, to return to the spiritual development of the society and to combine religion, science and philosophy, revealing the laws of the development of the society and nature, which is the same for the spiritual and material world. The potential of spirituality was revealed to a certain extent under the Soviet regime. In the modern period, it is preserved inside a person. However, due to the lack of spirituality and morality, the forms of its implementation were gone, and this was the reason for the catastrophic state of the society.

The general conclusions reached by the participants of both groups is that religious institutions, state power, educational institutions, and the family should become the mainstay of the spiritual and moral revival in Russia. At the same time, a fundamental role is assigned to government regulation and the creation of policy documents. Each structure must take on its own tasks. Citizens are responsible for their self-education. Family is part of upbringing. State power is the legal support of all processes of the spiritual and moral development of the individual. Educational institutions are education and part of upbringing. Religious institutions and public organizations are a unity of actions aimed at increasing spirituality.

Faith in God and the construction of temples promotes the spiritual and moral growth. All the respondents unanimously noted the role of church institutions. A transformational turn towards religion has taken place over the past ten years with the expressed confidence of the participants that the main thing is faith in God, the second one is the spiritual and moral education, and the third one is the family.

Fig. 2. Support of spiritual and moral revival in Russia.

On the question of what can serve as the most important target indicators of the spiritual and moral growth of young people, the opinions were divided. Some participants spoke about the reduction of the antisocial behavior, the development of family education institutions, the reduction of abandoned children, the creation of the public organizations whose activities will be aimed at developing culture and healthy lifestyles, and innovative activities of youth organizations. The others noted the most important targets for the spiritual and moral growth of young people. These were the decrease in children, students and youth’s aggressive behavior; juvenile delinquency and prevention of criminalization of the adolescent and youth environment; the number of divorces; the number of orphans and children left without parental care, children called “refuseniks”; the level of consumption of drugs, alcoholic beverages, beer and tobacco products; the frequency of the use of obscene and culturally low language by minors; opportunities for minors to access the Internet resources of pornographic, extremist or the content that promotes harshness, violence and the commission of illegal acts;
the number of teenage and youth extremist associations and the number of their members; growth of social optimism of the younger generation, as well as increasing children and adolescents’ competence in morality.

5 Conclusions

The focus groups held in 2010 and 2021 made it possible to consider and analyze the issues of spirituality, morality, the spiritual and moral education and development, the state of the Russian society and the spiritual and moral potential, as well as the transformation of the spiritual and moral foundations of the personality development over the past ten years and the impact of the mechanism of state regulation on them.

The survey made it possible to reveal the transformation of the views of focus group participants over the past ten years, namely, the emerging desire for spiritual and moral upbringing and education to permeate the entire path of the personality development, starting from early childhood. The participants emphasized that the spiritual and moral foundations are the unifying principle of all spheres of life of the Russian society and its traditional way of life. At the same time, the concern was expressed that the mechanism for the formation of the spiritual and moral foundations of the personality development in the mass consciousness, the methods and ways of their formation depend on public administration that integrates common efforts to unite society and which should have spiritual and moral foundations.

References

1. D. B. Kazantseva, Self-actualization of spiritual and moral potential of personality in Russia. Monograph, Prague: Vědecko vydavatelské centrum «Sociosféra-CZ», 50–55 (2020). Access mode: https://www.elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=42622974

2. D. B. Kazantseva, E. K. Klimova, T. E. Chernysheva, Spiritual and moral values of the individual in the Russian society in the XX – XXI centuries: a comparative analysis, Humanities: Actual Problems of the Humanities and Education, 18 (1), 9–19 (2018). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.15507/2078-9823.044.018.201804.446-547, https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/duhovno-nravstvennye-tsennosti-lichnosti-v-rossiya-kom-obschestve-v-xx-xxi-vv-sravnitelny-analiz/viewer

3. E. N. Tkach, D. B. Kazantseva, I. E. Sokolovskaya, Spiritual and mental foundations of personality self-determination against the background of the importance of environmental problems, E3S Web of Conferences: “Sustainable Development of an Industrial Region” (UESF-2021), 258 (2021). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202125807019, https://www.e3s-conferences.org/articles/e3sconf/pdf/2021/34/e3sconf_uesf2021_07019.pdf

4. A. R. Bulatova, Concept of higher value of personality in philosophy of Berdyaev N.A. within a context of French personalism of the first half of the XX century, History of philosophy, 22 (1), 121–135 (2017). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.21146/2074-5869-2017-22-1-121-135, https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/kontseptsiya-vysshey-tsennosti-v-filosofii-n-a-berdyaeva-v-kontekste-frantsuzskogo-personalizma-pervoy-poloviny-hh-v/viewer

5. A. V. Guschina, The value of morality golden rule as the basis of the axiological-pedagogical concept of morality education, Samara Scientific Bulletin, 3 (28), 270–275 (2019). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.24411/2309-4370-2019-13306, https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/tsennost-zolotogo-pravila-nravstvennosti-kak-osnovanie-idei-aksiologo-pedagogicheskoy-kontseptsiy-vospitanija-nravstvennosti/viewer
6. E.Y. Pochtareva, The value-motive sphere of the personality: essence, determinants, and mechanisms of development, Perm University Bulletin, 4, 563–575 (2017). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.17072/2078-7898/2017-4-563-575, https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/tsennostno-smyslovaya-sfera-lichnosti-suschnost-determinanty-mehanizmy-razvitiya/viewer

7. L. Sagiv, S. Roccas, J. Cieciuch, S. H. Schwartz, Personal values in human life, Nature Human Behaviour, 1(9), 630–639 (2017). Access mode: 10.1038/s41562-017-0185-3 https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/31024134/, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/319269391 Personal values in human life

8. Yu.V. Verba, Spiritual nature of a person in existential philosophy of V.E. Frankl, Philosophical Anthropology, 3(1), 135–150 (2017). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.21146/2414-3715-2017-3-1-135-150, https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/duhovnaya-priroda-chelovekav-ekzistentialnoy-filosofii-v-e-frankla/viewer

9. A. Gilyano, D. Kazantseva, I. Sokolovskaya, The problem of moral choice in early adulthood, E3S Web of Conferences, 284, 11023 (2021). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202128411023

10. S. H. Schwartz, Basic individual values: Sources and consequences, Handbook of value. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 63–84 (2015). Access mode: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/277718092_Schwartz_S_H_2015_Basic_individual_values_Sources_and_consequences_In_D_Sander_and_T_Brosch_Eds_Handbook_of_value_Oxford_UK_Oxford_University_PRESS

11. V. Ponizovskiy, L. Grigoryan, U. Kühnen, K. Boehnke, Social Construction of the Value–Behavior Relation, Frontiers in Psychology, 10, 934. Access mode: https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.00934

12. G.R. Maio, Mental representations of social values, Advances in experimental social psychology, 42, 1–43 (2010). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.1016/S0065-2601(10)42001-8

13. I. E. Sokolovskaya, I. P. Kutianova, Value Orientations As a Factor of Non-Adaptive Behavior of Drug Addicts, Scientific Notes of Russian State Social University, 2 (151), 49–59 (2019). Access mode: DOI: 10.17922/2071-5323-2019-18-2-49-59

14. A. Mostfa, Violence and Jihad in Islam: From the War of Words to the Clashes of Definitions, Religions, 12, 966 (2021). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.3390/rel12110966

15. I. R. Edara, and del Castillo, A. et al. Religiosity, Emotions, Resilience, and Wellness during the COVID-19 Pandemic: A Study of Taiwanese University Students, Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health, 18, 6381 (2021). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18126381

16. Y. M. Reznik, Visions of Russia's civilization future: individual projects and possibilities of their integration, Social theory issues, XII, 10–25 (2020). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.30936/2227-7951-2020-12-10-120, https://iphras.ru/uplfile/reznik/almanah_vst_2020/Part_1_1_1.pdf

17. O. S. Anisimov, “Effective country” as a means of designing the future of Russia and the role of radical transformation of the educational mechanism, Experiment and innovations in school, 5, 50–56 (2016). Access mode: https://elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=27020741

18. A. V. Lubsky et al., Mental programs and models of social behavior in the Russian society, Rostov-on-Don: Science and Education Foundation, 2–211 (2016). https://www.elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=27312588
19. A. V. Lubsky, R. A. Lubsky, V. P. Voitenko, *Individualism and Modal Models of Social Behavior in Russian Society*, Humanities in the South of Russia, 6 (3), 225–239 (2017). Access mode: https://doi.org/10.23683/2227-8656.2017.3.20