An Evaluation of Halal Tourism Program in East Lombok Regency Using Kirkpatrick’s Model

* Syawalina Fithry¹ and Syafri Anwar²

1) Master Program Student of Geography Education Faculty of Social Science, Universitas Negeri Padang, INDONESIA
2) Department of Geography, Universitas Negeri Padang, Indonesia

Email: syawalinafithry@gmail.com

*Corresponding Author, Received: February 17, 2018, Revised: April 25, 2018, Accepted: May 24, 2018

Abstract

This research was aimed to describe an evaluation of Halal Tourism program in East Lombok Regency, Nusa Tenggara Barat Province, Indonesia. This study was a program evaluation research which employed Kirkpatrick’s evaluation model (Reaction, Learning, Behavior, Result) and descriptive qualitative approach. Instruments of data collection were interview guideline, observation guideline, document review, and questionnaire. The data was analysis by using Miles and Huberman’s model which consisted of data display, data reduction, and conclusion drawing/verification. The result of this research showed that the reaction of Government Tourism Office and local community in East Lombok Regency towards Halal Tourism program was at moderate category (75.46%); community’s reaction towards the learning and carrying capacity of Halal tourism program was at moderate category (75.17%); community’s knowledge of Halal Tourism scored 82.93%; management system, both operational and administrative, scored 70.62%; and Community’s reaction towards the aspects of Halal Tourism program scored 79.03%. The effectivness of Halal Tourism program according to community’s reaction towards facility aspects scored 65.52% or was at moderate category. Moreover, the result from questionnaire revealed that 91.67% of participants thought that the knowledge they obtained in Halal Tourism program was less practical.

Keywords: Program Evaluation, Halal Tourism, Kirkpatrick’s Model, Result

Introduction

Indonesia is a country with the largest Muslim population in the world, with a total of 207,167,162 Muslims (BPS, 2010). This is new potential market for tourism sector in Indonesia by combining the concept of tourism and islamic values, also known as Syariah tourism. Recent years, the number of tourists, both local and foreign, that visit Indonesia are dominated by tourists from ASEAN countries such as Malaysia, Singapore, and others. Moreover, some of them are from european countries, especially Russia, then from America, Australia, and Middle East countries like Saudi Arabia, Qatar, and others. Of those countries, most of foreign tourists outside ASEAN countries are from the Middle East countries, especially Saudi Arabia, United Arab Emirates and some countries in gulf area (Suherlan, 2011).

Therefore, it is necessary to have an insight about the development of Halal tourism potential in Indonesia by focusing on Middle East Tourists as the main market target, so that the design of marketing strategy can be more focused and attracting potential tourists from Middle East countries such as Saudi Arabia, Bahrain, Kuwait, Oman, Qatar, UAE, and Egypt to visit and become a significant contributor of foreign tourists in Indonesia. Halal tourism is one form of culture-based tourism that setting out the values and norms of Islamic
Syariah as its basic foundation. As a new concept in tourism industry, Syariah tourism requires further development and a more understanding of the collaboration between Islamic values and tourism activities. Muslim tourists dominate the number of tourists in Indonesia. The concept of Halal tourism is one of solutions for the amount of untapped market in Indonesia. With its world’s largest muslim population, Indonesia has the biggest Halal tourism potential market in the world. This potential should be realized by tourism industry in Indonesia since the ongoing business of Halal tourism will significantly give economic contributions to all involved actors in the business (Widagdyo, 2015).

The foundation of Syariah tourism is an understanding of Halal in all aspects in tourism activities including hotel, transportation facilities, food and beverages, financial system, and tour service providers and facilities. For example, a Syariah hotel will not accept unmarried couple to stay (the couple must be able to show their marriage certificate) and will not sell food and beverages that against Islamic Syariah like Alcohol and pork (Sofyan, 2012). Moreover, in Syariah tourism, the selection of tourist destination should consider Islamic Syariah values. For example, Every destination must have adequate prayer facility such as mosque or mushola, nightlife and prostitution must be neglected, and local people should support the practicing of Islamic Syariah values such as not doing gambling, cockfighting, and other rituals that against Islamic teaching (Indonesia Travel, 2013). However, one should understand that Syariah tourism does not necessarily mean a religious tourism which is commonly implemented today (Kovjanic, 2014).

Nusa Tenggara Barat, with its famously exotic natural resource and beauty attracts domestic and even foreign tourists to spend their holiday, in this case, in Lombok which is also known as a place of A Thousand Mosque. Lombok offers its natural beauty and endless tourist destinations ranging from the easternmost area to the northernmost area, for example, the endless beaches which pamper the eyes, the waterfall attractions that offer relaxing atmosphere, and the tourists can indulge themselves by sunbathing and relaxing in famous islands like Gili Mantra (Gili Trawangan, Gili Meno, and Gili Air). It is no exaggeration to say that it takes a long time to discuss about each natural resource and beauty in Lombok Island. Unexpectedly, NTB is one of the iconic Halal tourist destinations in Indonesia. This achievement becomes a pride for people of NTB especially Lombok that currently increasingly spread its wings in the world’s tourism industry (Awalia, 2017). This research purpose was to evaluate Halal tourism program in East Lombok Regency by using Kirkpatrick’s model.

This research was conducted because Halal tourism program in East Lombok still need evaluation as reference for future decisions. Program evaluation is an activity of collecting information about a program that will be used as a reference for decision in policy making (Arikunto, 2008; Hermon, 2012; Hermon, 2014; Hermon, 2017). Basically, public decision is a unit of mutually cooperative mechanisms that requires “a policy evaluation”. The evaluation of Halal tourism program in East Lombok adopted Kirkpatrick’s model in order to know the level of conformity between the levels of evaluation mentioned in Kirkpatrick’s model. According to Kirkpatrick (1998) in Widoyoko (2012), the components of Halal tourism program in East Lombok is relevant to Kirkpatrick’s evaluation model. In this research, the researcher adopted this model to evaluate the level of reaction, learning, behaviour, and result of the program. Generally, this study was aimed to determine the success of Halal tourism program implementation in East Lombok. Operationally, this evaluation research had a purpose of: (1) knowing the satisfaction level of government, agency, and local people (community) related to the implementation of Halal tourism program in East Lombok Regency (reaction); (2) measuring the achieved target of knowledge and skill and community’s behavioral changes after they participate in the program that has been implemented for this last two years (learning); (3) knowing the application of community’s behavioral changes; and (4) knowing the effect of behavioral changes of government, agency, and community (result). Reaction evaluation is a stage in evaluation that investigate the effectiveness of Halal tourism program according to participants’ reaction towards the implementation of the program being attended. This evaluation used customer satisfaction sheet whose purpose was to get community’s feedback and comment about the program. The sheet asked about community’s satisfaction with service and implementation of Halal tourism, the beach destinations, and facilities that supported Halal tourism program. These 4 stages of evaluation by Kirkpatrick’s model is very important for Halal tourism program. Each stage must be done thoroughly and continuously. Therefore, this research was focused on the evaluation of Halal tourism program in East Lombok Regency by using Kirkpatrick’s evaluation model (Sugiono, 2013).
Method

Based on research problems and purposes explained above, a program evaluation research was conducted by employing a descriptive qualitative approach. The result of this research give a clear, detailed and comprehensive description about the evaluation of Halal tourism program in East Lombok Regency. The researcher adopted Kikpatrick’s model to evaluate the program. The data, both primary and primary were collected by using various instruments. To collect primary data, the researcher used interview and observation as instruments. By using these techniques, the situation in the field could be directly observed and a factual information and a broader opinion about the program could be obtained. The informant were chosen through purposive sampling technique. In order to obtain reliable result of the research, the researcher triangulate the various data collected from the informant and documents (triangulation). The research was conducted for three days on 17th of July to 19th of July in 2017. The study was conducted at Government Tourism Office of East Lombok and the community of East Lombok Regency. A descriptive qualitative evaluation was hoped to be able to measure the effectiveness of Halal tourism program regarding its quality according to community’s satisfaction level of the program service and implementation and community’s behavior changes and result changes of Halal Tourism and the effect of those changes on the improvement of organizational performance. The evaluation was divided into 4 phases of evaluation based on Kirkpatrick’s model including reaction, learning, behavior, and result. The techniques of data collection were observation, interview, document review, and questionnaire. Observation was directly done in the research location while the program was taking place. Interview was conducted by directly interacting and communicating with the Government Tourism Officials and the people of East Lombok Regency. Document review was aimed to review and analysis written data used in Halal tourism program. The documents being reviewed were primary and secondary document. The questionnaire was distributed to the local people to measure satisfaction level of Halal tourism program. The questionnaire asked about strengths and weaknesses of Halal tourism including the facilities provided by the Government of NTB. Analysis was done narratively by following three procedures mentioned in Miles and Huberman method (2009), namely data reduction, data display and conclusion drawing/verification. Data processing stages were arranging, classifying, reviewing, interpreting the data in certain pattern and relating the data to the focus of this evaluation. Raw data collected through observation and interview was arranged in tally then its percentage was calculated. The percentage became the basis in decision making. After going through the process of data collection and analysis, the researcher should ensure that research findings and interpretation were valid. Therefore, the validation was conducted through member checking strategy and triangulation. These strategies were used in order to avoid any biases in analysis method and ease the researcher to narrow extensive and overlapping information. To carry out the strategies, the researcher asked some informants or participants to check accuracy and validity of the data that had been analysis. This strategy offers a more objective and accurate data and justified information. Member checking was done written through questionnaire, interview, or document review.

Results and Discussion

Data analysis explained that program evaluation of Halal tourism in East Lombok was successfully implemented. It gathered enough information related to Halal tourism in Lombok especially its beach destination and community’s understanding about Halal tourism in various tourism potential in East Lombok. Some tourist attractions that can be found in Lombok are coastal attractions, beautiful underwater sites, mountaineering, and historical sites. Tourist sites in Lombok is no less interesting than the ones in Bali. Some tourist attractions in Lombok, for example, are Kura-Kura Beach, Senggigi Beach, Gili Trawangan Beach and Mount Rinjani. Indonesia government is aware of this potential and develops Halal tourism industry in Lombok to attract more foreign tourists especially tourists from Muslim-majority countries. To support this effort Indonesia government speeds up the construction and development in Lombok Island (Firdaus, 2017). All of this information was easily obtained because this evaluation model by Kirkpatrick could reach every aspect of the program, for example how far the knowledge of Halal tourism are reflected in Government Tourism Office and the people of East Lombok.

Actors in Halal tourism industry should understand and implement the meaning of Halal in every tourism activity like hotel, transportation facility, Halal food and beverages including facilities and services of
the travel agency itself. For example, a Halal or Syariah hotel will not allow unmarried couples to stay in the hotel if they do not have their marriage certificate and it also will not sell *haram* (non-halal) food and drinks such as alcohol and pork. Moreover, in Syariah tourism, the selection of tourist destination should consider Islamic Syariah values. For example, every destination must have adequate prayer facilities such as mosque or mushola, family recreation, and be surrounded by Islamic atmosphere such as Islamic schools. In this research, first stage of evaluation of Kirkpatrick model found that the majority of local people were satisfied with or they agreed with the existence of Halal tourism program in East Lombok.

According to the results obtained in this study, generally, it can be said that Kirkpatrick’s evaluation model is useful for evaluating Halal tourism program in East Lombok Regency. The reasons are the four aspects or stages in Kirkpatrick’s model can give an insight about behavioral and attitude changes of East Lombok people, the improvement of knowledge and skills, and final result of the evaluation of Halal tourism program. Furthermore, it also reveals tourism potentials in East Lombok. Evaluation of the program should be performed by government institutions, especially tourism office, lectures, and college students. Those evaluations will be contributions for the development of facilities and infrastructures in tourism potential in East Lombok. Kirkpatrick’s Evaluation model also helps the researcher to obtain rich information from the local government tourism office and the local people in East Lombok Regency. Each phase of the evaluation was performed separately. In the first phase of Kirkpatrick’s model (*Participant Reaction*), the evaluation was focused on participant’s satisfaction level of benefits given by Halal tourism program in East Lombok. The second phase was focused on studying the knowledge aspect of Halal tourism program. It was done to find all Halal tourism potentials in East Lombok Regency. As the most important part of evaluation, the third phase or level of Kirkpatrick model was performed to evaluate to what extent the program concepts were applied and implemented by community and schools in their daily lives. The last phase of evaluation was result evaluation which analysis and concluded the result of the program.

Reaction evaluation was conducted after the researcher analyzed descriptive information obtained from interview with informants and document review. The analysis then directed to identifying required needs of knowledge, skills, and attitude. These needs were used as reference for determining carrying capacity of Halal tourism program. All the community was assumed to need same carrying capacity from the Government of NTB, especially East Lombok Regency, despite their different skills, backgrounds, and work experiences. Moreover, the evaluation also found that the community only knew about Halal tourism program and there were only few people who could access the information about Halal destinations in East Lombok regency. The result of evaluations can been in detail in the following charts:

![Figure 1. Chart of Community’s Reaction towards the Implementation of Halal Tourism Program](image-url)
Learning evaluation was aimed to measure the improvement of community’s knowledge, skills, and attitude after attending Halal tourism program. The evaluation result of Halal tourism program was got during the program was taking place through setted evaluation mechanism conducted for three days. Final result evaluation was conducted after processing and analysing the scores of obtained data from interview, observation and document review. The result showed that according to participants the program was good (enough) because East Lombok Regency had an open culture and friendly people who were devoted to their religion (Islam).

![Figure 2. Evaluation of Halal Tourism in East Lombok Regency](image)

Behaviour evaluation was aimed to evaluate the application or implementation of the knowledge, skills and attitude in the workplace. The evaluation was done on the data collected from interview session. The data from questionnaire found that 91.67% of participants thought that the materials and knowledge given during the program were less practical. However, in the interview, most of participants stated that all information from Halal tourism program is very important and help them in running their business or in their workplace. After studying about participant’s work place, work unit and responsibility, the researcher assumed that the contradiction was normal because every participant had different perception. Behavioural changes were the cause and consequence of community’s involvement in supporting government’s income through implementation of Halal tourism program in East Lombok regency. This research showed that the level of success and effectiveness of the program according to participant’s reaction scored 65.52 or was at moderate category.
Result evaluation assesses the success level of the program which has been supporting tourism organizations to achieve their set goals and helping in increasing community and regional income in East Lombok Regency. The result aspects being evaluated are the purpose of Halal tourism program and its role in improving the quality of conserved cultures, services, and community’s confidence in the organization. Finally, the manifestation of learning in the result of Halal tourism program could also be affected by interactions with more complex variables.

**Conclusion**

According to the research findings and discussion above, conclusion can be drawn as follows: (1) Community’s reaction towards carrying capacity of Halal Tourism program, the aspects of the program, and facility aspects of the program were at moderate category. It was reflected in the community’s assessment towards Halal tourism program. (2) Learning of Halal tourism program whose purpose was to improve the operational competence of Halal tourism in East Lombok Regency had been achieved. It was reflected in community’s assessment score of Halal tourism program with an average score of 81.25 which met participant’s achievement qualifications of Halal tourism program in satisfied category. (3) There found behavioral changes of the community after participating in Halal tourism program in East Lombok Regency. The improvement of knowledge and skills and changes in attitude and behavior could be applied in their work unit. (4) The result of Halal tourism program in East Lombok Regency and the competency fulfillment of Government Tourism Office and community related to the program had an impact on the enhancement of officials’ performance especially in public service.

**References**

Arikunto, S. (2008). Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktik. Yogyakarta: PT. Rineka Cipta.
Awalin, H. (2017). Jurnal Studi Komunikasi. Jurnal Komodifikasi Pariwisata Halal NTB dalam Promosi Destinasi Wisata Islami di Indonesia, 1 (19-30).
BPS. (2010). Kabupaten Lombok Timur dalam Angka. Pemkab. Lombok Timur.
Firdausi, I., Marantika, Stanijuantita, Firdaus, Nidaulhaq, Z., & Rifqah, S. (2017). Lombok Halal Tourism as a New Indonesia Tourism Strategy. 4th International Conference on Humanities, Social Sciences and Education (ICHSSSE-17). March 13-14 2017 Dubai (UAE).
Hermon, D. (2012). Mitigasi Bencana Hidrometeorologi: Banjir, Longsor, Degradasi Lahan, Ekologi, Kekeringan, dan Puting Beliung. UNP Press.
Hermon, D. (2014). Geografi Bencana Alam. Radjawali Press.

Hermon, D. (2017). Climate Change Mitigation. Radjawali Press (Radjagrafindo). Jakarta.

Miles, Matthew B. & A. Michael Huberman. (2009). Analisis Data Kualitatif. Terjemahan. Tjetjep Rohendi Rohidi. Jakarta: UI-Press.

Indonesia Travel. (2013). Pariwisata Syariah Indonesia. Dari http://www.indonesia.travel/id/event/detail/760/pariwisata syariah - indonesia. Diakses 8 Februari 2018 Pukul 22.38 WIB.

Kovjanic, G. (2014). Islamic Tourism as a Factor of the Middle East Regional Development. Turizam, 18, 33-43.

Sofyan, Riyanto. (2012). Prospek Bisnis Pariwisata Syariah. Jakarta: Republika

Suherlan, A. (2011). Laporan Akhir Analisa Wisatawan Timur Tengah.

Sugiono. (2013). Metode Penelitian Manajemen. Bandung: Alfabeta.

Widagdyo, Kurniawan Gilang. (2015). The Journal of Tauhidinomics. Analisis Pasar Pariwisata Halal Indonesia, 1, 73-80.

Widoyoko S. Eko Putro. (2012). Evaluasi Program Pembelajaran. PT. Pustaka Pelajar: Yogyakarta.