C-Reactive Protein and Cardiovascular Disease in East Asians: A Systematic Review

Isao Saito¹, Koutatsu Maruyama² and Eri Eguchi³,⁴

¹Department of Basic Nursing and Health Science, Ehime University Graduate School of Medicine, Toon, Ehime, Japan. ²Department of Basic Medical Research and Education, Ehime University Graduate School of Medicine, Toon, Ehime, Japan.³Department of Public Health, Okayama University Graduate School of Medicine, Dentistry, and Pharmaceutical Sciences, Okayama, Japan.

Abstract:
Elevated C-reactive protein (CRP) levels are associated with an increased risk of cardiovascular disease (CVD) in Caucasians; however, evidence is lacking for East Asians, who have low CRP levels. PubMed and Google Scholar searches were conducted (1966 through September 2014), and eight prospective studies in East Asian countries (China, Hong Kong, Japan, Korea, Macao, Mongolia, and Taiwan) that documented risk ratios of elevated CRP for CVD were included for meta-analysis with random-effects models. The overall association between CRP levels and stroke was significant in six studies (risk ratio = 1.40 [95% confidence interval (CI), 1.10–1.77], P = 0.008). The association with ischemic stroke was more evident in subgroup analyses. For coronary heart disease (CHD) and CVD, the risk ratio was 1.75 (95% CI, 0.96–3.19, P = 0.07) and 1.76 (95% CI, 1.29–2.40, P < 0.001), respectively. Although East Asians have low CRP levels, this meta-analysis shows that elevated CRP levels were significantly associated with an increased risk of stroke, primarily ischemic stroke.

Keywords: C-reactive protein, cardiovascular disease, East Asia, systematic review

Introduction
The inflammatory hypothesis states that endothelial cell damage promotes atherosclerosis, linking the complex inflammatory process with cardiovascular events.¹,² Among several parameters of inflammation, C-reactive protein (CRP) measurements have great benefits from the viewpoints of cost and quality. Considerable evidences, including data from clinical intervention trials, also confirm that CRP measurements are useful for identifying individuals at high risk for cardiovascular disease (CVD).³,⁴ To date, a meta-analysis has documented strong evidence for adding CRP measurements to the measurement of traditional risk factors for predicting coronary heart disease (CHD). The prediction model that included CRP levels indicated a better fit in comparison with a common model using the Framingham risk score. A US clinical guideline concluded that CRP assessment was beneficial in a clinical setting for detecting high-risk individuals.³

Regardless of such a favorable recommendation, aggregated evidence is lacking for Asian individuals. In particular, East Asian populations have low levels of CRP and lower rates of CHD,⁵,⁶ compared with Western populations.⁷ The meta-analysis included some Asian cohorts, but the overall analysis concealed the Asian characteristics when the data were pooled.
The difference in CRP levels among varied ethnic groups was substantial; therefore, it may not be acceptable to apply the findings from most Western countries to Asian individuals.

Methods

Data sources and searches. We searched the PubMed database for prospective cohort studies of CRP and CVD between 1966 and September 2014 with the following MeSH terms: C-reactive protein, cohort studies, cardiovascular diseases, and Far East. Publications were limited to those written in English. We also examined recent articles published in 2014 from a search of Google Scholar (n = 270).

Study selection. Inclusion criteria for this analysis were as follows: (1) cohort study, including nested case–control study, (2) community-based study in East Asian countries (China, Hong Kong, Japan, Korea, Macao, Mongolia, and Taiwan), and (3) study to estimate the association between CRP and CVD outcomes in adults, defined as incidence or mortality with long-term follow-up. All studies were required to measure standardized CRP by immunoassay. We excluded studies carried out in clinical settings to evaluate the prognosis of diseases or the effect of medications and studies that were conducted with Asian immigrants in the US or other Western countries.

Data extraction and quality assessment. Three researchers evaluated articles in accordance with the inclusion criteria mentioned above. First, after skimming the title and abstract of articles retrieved from the database search, the researchers initially selected the primary articles. Second, potential articles for meta-analysis were retrieved on the basis of evaluation of the full text of the paper. Quality assessment was carried out based on the Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) statement. All the selected articles adequately defined outcomes and mentioned the study design, and each had a sufficient follow-up period.

Data synthesis and analysis. Most studies provided hazard ratios or odds ratios for stroke, CHD, and CVD outcomes grouped in accordance with tertiles, quartiles, or quintiles of CRP distribution after adjustment for established CVD risk factors. Although cut-off points differed among studies, we used the risk ratios published in the articles because they appeared to be similar among homogeneous Asian populations. When studies provided only sex-specific associations, we calculated summarized risk ratios that combined both sexes using the fixed-effect model in each study.

We calculated the F statistics to evaluate the statistical heterogeneity among the studies. We used random-effect meta-regression to evaluate the overall association between CRP and CVD and presented risk ratios and 95% confidence intervals (CIs) stratified by outcomes. The publication bias of selected articles was tested by using funnel plots and the Egger test. All analyses were conducted with Review Manager (RevMan) 5.0 software.

Results

Search results and study inclusion. Our searches retrieved 208 PubMed citations and 2 Google Scholar citations. In all, 22 of them met our inclusion criteria without duplicates (Fig. 1). We excluded 14 articles after a more detailed evaluation, and finally, 8 articles were acceptable for the meta-analysis.

The remaining articles were excluded primarily because they described studies that were performed in a clinical setting.
CRP and CVD in East Asians

Table 1. A summary of studies in East Asian cohorts included in the analysis.

| OUTCOME | STUDY | DESIGN | SAMPLE SIZE, LOCATION | ENDPOINT | RISK RATIOS AND 95% CI'S |
|---------|-------|--------|------------------------|----------|-------------------------|
| Stroke | Wakugawa et al., 2006 | Cohort | n = 2,692, Japan | Incidence | 3.11 (1.04–9.32) in men and 1.34 (0.61–2.91) in women for ischemic stroke; and 0.68 (0.21–2.26) and 1.74 (0.51–5.85) for hemorrhagic stroke, respectively, grouped in the highest vs the lowest quintiles. |
| Stroke | Iso et al., 2009 | Nested | n = 39,242, Japan | Mortality | 1.60 (0.90–2.85) in men and 1.07 (0.58–1.97) in women for total stroke; 2.04 (0.95–4.37) and 1.00 (0.39–2.61) for ischemic stroke; and 1.85 (0.40–8.72) and 1.78 (0.61–5.22) for hemorrhagic stroke, respectively, grouped in the highest vs the lowest quartiles. |
| Stroke | Jiang et al., 2009 | Cohort | n = 2,919, China | Incidence | 1.58 (1.08–2.31) of CRP 2.0 mg/dl for total stroke in both sexes. |

Discussion

Main findings. The meta-analysis confirmed that elevated CRP levels were significantly associated with an increased risk of stroke among East Asian populations, primarily for ischemic stroke. The association with CHD was likely to be the same, though the studies were few, and it did not reach a statistically significant level (P = 0.07). Despite lower average levels of CRP in Asians compared with Caucasians, individuals in the highest quartiles or quintiles of CRP were at increased risk of CVD.

Previous meta-analyses among US or European studies reported a strong association of elevated CRP levels with CHD, ischemic stroke, cardiovascular mortality, and death in East Asians.
| OUTCOME                      | STUDY                          | SURVEY YEAR, SAMPLE SIZE, LOCATION | STUDY DESIGN | CONTROLLED VARIABLES                                             | ENDPOINT          | RISK RATIOS AND 95% CIS                                                                 |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Coronary heart disease      | Arima et al, 2008⁹             | 1988 n=2,589 Japan                | Cohort       | Age, sex, SBP, ECG abnormalities, diabetes, BMI, TC, HDL, smoking, alcohol intake, and regular exercise. | Incidence         | 2.98 (1.53–5.82) in both sexes grouped in the highest vs the lowest quartiles.          |
|                             | Jiang et al, 2009¹⁶            | 1998–2001 n=2,919 China           | Cohort       | the same as the above                                           | Incidence         | 1.13 (0.70–1.83) for CRP >2.0 mg/dl for coronary heart disease in both sexes.           |
|                             | Iso et al, 2009¹¹              | 1988–1990 n=39,242 Japan          | Nested       | the same as the above                                           | Mortality         | 3.68 (1.02–13.3) in men and 3.74 (0.91–15.3) in women grouped in the highest vs the lowest quartiles. |
|                             | Iso et al, 2012¹²              | 1990–1993 n=29,876 Japan          | Nested       | the same as the above                                           | Incidence         | 1.02 (0.58–1.72) in both sexes grouped in the highest vs the lowest quartiles.         |
| Cardiovascular disease      | Jiang et al, 2009¹⁶            | 1998–2001 n=2,919 China           | Cohort       | Same as above                                                   | Incidence         | 1.39 (1.04–1.87) of CRP >2.0 mg/dl for coronary heart disease in both sexes.          |
|                             | Iso et al, 2009¹¹              | 1988–1990 n=39,242 Japan          | Nested       | Same as above                                                   | Mortality         | 2.31 (1.49–3.59) in men and 1.69 (1.06–2.68) in women grouped in the highest vs the lowest quartiles. |
|                             | Sung et al, 2014¹⁴             | 2002–2009 n=288,803 Korea         | Cohort       | Age, sex, BMI, smoking, alcohol intake, regular exercise, history of hypertension, history of diabetes, history of coronary heart disease, glucose, LDL, HDL, and SBP. | Mortality         | 3.48 (1.71–7.10) in men and 0.92 (0.28–3.00) in women grouped in the highest vs the lowest quartiles. |
from cancer. The results of our systematic review were almost consistent with those in Caucasian populations.

Stroke is the most common disease among CVD events in Japan. It is well known that Japan is one of the countries with the highest stroke incidence, mainly because of hypertension and high salt intake, regardless of obesity.6 The explanations associated with frequent incident stroke and traditional risk factors and trends among Japanese adults have been reviewed elsewhere. Moreover, of the six studies we included in the present analysis, four showed risk ratios by stroke subtype, ie, ischemic stroke and hemorrhagic stroke. The association of CRP was more evident for ischemic stroke and was not apparent for hemorrhagic stroke. The findings implied that increased CRP levels are linked with atherosclerosis and thrombosis that are closely related to obesity and the metabolic syndrome.1

Ethnic differences in CRP levels and cut-off points. When compared with previous findings from various studies, the level of CRP in Asian populations was approximately one-third of the median value in Caucasians.2 As shown in Figure 2, it seemed to be true that East Asian individuals had low levels of CRP, and that in most populations, the levels were less than 1 mg/L. CRP levels varied among East Asian populations and were relatively higher in Chinese individuals compared with Korean and Japanese individuals. Some polymorphisms were reported to determine the CRP concentrations in the Chinese population19,20; however, it was unclear why CRP concentrations were higher in Chinese individuals. Although CRP levels in Chinese individuals were still low when compared with those in Caucasians, the heterogeneity among Far East countries might be caused by factors related to genetics, lifestyle, or environmental conditions.

The majority of studies in Western countries reported CRP average levels more than 1 mg/L, and the levels varied greatly among ethnic groups. For example, the Women’s Health Study reported that median CRP values in black women (2.96 mg/L) were significantly higher than in Hispanics (2.06 mg/L), whites (2.02 mg/L), and Asians (1.12 mg/L) in the US.21 The Dallas Heart Study also pointed out significant race and gender differences in the population distribution of CRP levels, with the highest median values in black women (3.5 mg/L).22

The Asian studies in the present meta-analysis set up quartile or quintile levels of CRP as cut-off points to evaluate risk ratios for CVD, corresponding with approximately 1 mg/L of CRP. This implied that CRP levels >1.0 mg/L were associated with an increased risk of CVD in the Asian population.18

The Multiethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA) study investigated CRP levels across four ethnic groups living in the US.23 In that study, the median CRP levels of Chinese men and women were 0.80 and 0.99 mg/L, respectively, which were roughly consistent with the baseline data we found in the present study. This fact indicated that CRP levels in Asians who live in the Far East might be essentially equal to those in Asians who live in the US. Therefore, CRP levels were greatly influenced by ethnic background, and the cut-off
points to detect high-risk individuals should be considered based on ethnicity.

**Potential mechanism.** It was established that CRP levels were closely related to obesity in various populations.\(^{24,25}\) This may to a large extent explain the fact that CRP levels in Asians with higher BMI levels were very low in comparison with Caucasians with higher BMI levels. It is considered that adipose tissue in obesity overproduces proinflammatory cytokines, such as tissue necrosis factor (TNF)-α and interleukin (IL)-6, which stimulate hepatic CRP production. Furthermore, TNF-α in adipose tissue also inhibits insulin-stimulated autophosphorylation of the insulin receptor and causes insulin resistance.\(^{26}\) Ouchi et al suggested a mechanism by showing that CRP mRNA is expressed in adipose tissue and is inversely related to adiponectin mRNA expression.\(^{27}\) These mechanisms potentially connect obesity with increased CRP concentrations.

Recently, several genomic variants that reflected CRP concentrations were studied across ethnic groups.\(^{28,29}\) The contributions of these genetic variants were not large enough to explain

---

**Figure 3.** Risk ratios for stroke, CHD, and CVD with increased CRP levels.
the entire difference thus far, but low CRP concentrations in Asia may be in part a result of the genetic variants.30

**Limitations.** Although this systematic review demonstrated a significant association between CRP levels and CVD in Asians, several limitations should be noted. First, we cannot exclude a publication bias, because the funnel plot was asymmetrical and cohort studies in Asians were very limited. In particular, evidence was very scant to determine an association with CHD events. Second, the risk ratios in each study were calculated with different cut-off points, which might cause bias in estimating the true risk ratio of elevated CRP. Pooled analysis is potentially essential to determine the cut-off point of CRP for CVD prevention. Third, we did not find a sex-specific effect of CRP, because data were not available to find it in this analysis. Some studies documented a difference in the effect between men and women, and the accumulation of further evidence is desired to look at sex differences. Fourth, although risk ratios derived from various cohort studies were adjusted for established CVD risk factors, we will have to investigate whether adding the measurement of CRP levels is valuable in Asians compared with the established prediction models.31

**Conclusion**

Although East Asian adults had very low levels of CRP, a meta-analysis confirmed that elevated CRP levels were significantly associated with an increased risk of stroke, primarily ischemic stroke.

Although it is unclear whether adding CRP measurements to the measurements of traditional risk factors for predicting CHD is beneficial for Asian individuals, original evidence is urgently needed.

**Author Contributions**

Conceived and designed the experiments: IS. Analyzed the data: KM, EE. Wrote the first draft of the manuscript: IS. Contributed to the writing of the manuscript: IS, KM, EE. Agree with manuscript results and conclusions: IS, KM, EE. Jointly developed the structure and arguments for the paper: IS, KM, EE. Made critical revisions and approved final version: IS. All authors reviewed and approved of the final manuscript.

**REFERENCES**

1. Ross R. Atherosclerosis – an inflammatory disease. *N Engl J Med*. 1999;340:115–26.
2. Ridker PM, Hennekens CH, Buring JE, Rifai N. C-reactive protein and other markers of inflammation in the prediction of cardiovascular disease in women. *N Engl J Med*. 2000;342:836–43.
3. Buckley DI, Fu R, Freeman M, Rogers K, Helfand M. C-reactive protein as a risk factor for coronary heart disease: a systematic review and meta-analyses for the U.S. Preventive Services Task Force. *Ann Intern Med*. 2009;151:483–95.
4. Kaptoge S, Di Angelantonio E, Lowe G, et al. Emerging Risk Factors Collaboration. C-reactive protein concentration and risk of coronary heart disease, stroke, and mortality: an individual participant meta-analysis. *Lancet*. 2010;375:132–40.
5. Saito I, Sato S, Nakamura M, et al. A low level of C-reactive protein in Japanese adults and its association with cardiovascular risk factors: the Japan NCVC-Collaborative Inflammation Cohort (JNIC) study. *Atherosclerosis*. 2007;194: 238–44.

6. Saito I. Epidemiological evidence of type 2 diabetes mellitus, metabolic syndrome, and cardiovascular disease in Japan. *Cir J*. 2012;76:1066–73.

7. Kajtaz S, Di Angelantonio E, Pennell L, et al. Emerging Risk Factors Collaboration. C-reactive protein, fibrinogen, and cardiovascular disease prediction. *N Engl J Med*. 2012;367:1310–20.

8. von Elm E, Ahnman DG, Egger M, et al. STROBE Initiative. The strengthening the reporting of observational studies in epidemiology (STROBE) statement: guidelines for reporting observational studies. *Lancet*. 2007;370:1451–7.

9. Arima H, Kubo M, Yonemoto K, et al. High-sensitivity C-reactive protein and coronary heart disease in a general population of Japanese: the Hisayama study. *Atherosclerosis Thrombosis Vascular Biology*. 2009;28:1385–91.

10. Chei CL, Yamagishi K, Kitamura A, et al. C-reactive protein levels and risk of stroke and its subtype in Japanese: the circulatory risk in communities study (CIRCS). *Atherosclerosis*. 2011;217:187–93.

11. Iso H, Cui R, Date C, Kikuchi S, Tamakoshi A, Group JS. C-reactive protein levels and risk of mortality from cardiovascular disease in Japanese: the JACC Study. *Atherosclerosis*. 2009;207:291–7.

12. Iso H, Noda H, Ikeda A, et al. The impact of C-reactive protein on risk of stroke, stroke subtypes, and ischemic heart disease in middle-aged Japanese: the Japan public health center-based study. *J Atherosclerosis Thromb*. 2012;19:756–66.

13. Wakugawa Y, Kiyohara Y, Tanizaki Y, et al. C-reactive protein and risk of first-ever ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke in a general Japanese population: the Hisayama Study. *Stroke*. 2006;37:27–32.

14. Sung KC, Ryu S, Chang Y, Byrne CD, Kim SH. C-reactive protein and risk of cardiovascular and all-cause mortality in 268,803 East Asians. *Eur Heart J*. 2014;35:1809–16.

15. Chen PC, Chien KL, Hsu HC, Su TC, Sung FC, Lee YT. Metabolic syndrome and C-reactive protein in stroke prediction: a prospective study in Taiwan. *Metabolism*. 2009;58:772–8.

16. Jiang S, Bao Y, Hsu K, et al. Serum C-reactive protein and risk of cardiovascular events in middle-aged and older Chinese population. *Am J Cardiol*. 2009;103: 1272–31.

17. Matkic S, Nakamura M, Sato K, et al. Serum C-reactive protein levels can be used to predict future ischemic stroke and mortality in Japanese men from the general population. *Atherosclerosis*. 2009;204:234–8.

18. Liu Y, Wang J, Zhang L, et al. Relationship between C-reactive protein and stroke: a large prospective community based study. *PLoS One*. 2014;9:e107017.

19. Hsu LA, Ko YL, Teng MS, et al. Effect of obesity on the association between common variations in the HNF1A gene region and C-reactive protein level in Taiwanese. *Clin Chim Acta*. 2011;412:725–9.

20. Gu SJ, Chen DH, Guo ZR, Zhou ZY, Hu XS, Wu M. Effect of obesity on the association between common variations in the PPARGene and C-reactive protein level in Chinese Han population. *Endocrine*. 2014. DOI: 10.1007/s12020-014-0218-x.

21. Albert MA, Glynn RJ, Buring J, Ridker PM. C-reactive protein levels among women of various ethnic groups living in the United States (from the Women's Health Study). *Am J Cardiol*. 2004;93:1238–42.

22. Kherra A, McGuire DK, Murphy SA, et al. Race and gender differences in C-reactive protein levels. *J Am Coll Cardiol*. 2005;46:464–9.

23. Lakoski SG, Cushman M, Criqui M, et al. Gender and C-reactive protein: data from the Multiethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA) cohort. *Am Heart J*. 2006;152:593–8.

24. Choi J, Joseph L, Pilote L. Obesity and C-reactive protein in various populations: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Obes Rev*. 2013;14:232–44.

25. Gupta NK, de Lemos JA, Ayers CR, Abdullah SM, McGuire DK, Kherra A. The relationship between C-reactive protein and atherosclerosis differs on the basis of body mass index: the Dallas Heart Study. *J Am Coll Cardiol*. 2012;60:1148–55.

26. Hotamisligil GS, Arner P, Caro JF, Atkinson RL, Spiegelman BM. Increased adipose tissue expression of tumor necrosis factor-alpha in human obesity and insulin resistance. *J Clin Invest*. 1995;95:2409–15.

27. Ouchi N, Kihara S, Funahashi T, et al. Reciprocal association of C-reactive protein with adiponectin in blood stream and adipose tissue. *Circulation*. 2003;107:671–4.

28. Dehghan A, Dupuis J, Barbic M, et al. Meta-analysis of genome-wide association studies in >80 000 subjects identifies multiple loci for C-reactive protein levels. *Circulation*. 2011;123:731–8.

29. Ellii J, Lange EM, Li Jr, et al. Large multiethnic candidate gene study for C-reactive protein levels: identification of a novel association at CD36 in African Americans. *Hum Genet*. 2014;133:985–95.

30. Dorajoo R, Li R, Ikrar MK, et al. Are C-reactive protein associated genetic variants associated with serum levels and retinal markers of microvascular pathology in Asian populations from Singapore? *PLoS One*. 2013;8:e67650.

31. Yatsuha Y, Iso H, Yamagishi K, et al. Development of a point-based prediction model for the incidence of total stroke: Japan public health center study. *Stroke*. 2013;44:1295–302.