Sub-Theme: Leadership and Crisis

Implementation of Smart Governance in Realizing Tomohon Smart City

Marthinus M. Mandagi
Universitas Negeri Manado (UNIMA)

Jeane Mantiri
Universitas Negeri Manado (UNIMA)

Sisca B. Kairupan
Universitas Negeri Manado (UNIMA)

Abstract

This study aims to describe the implementation of smart governance in realizing Tomohon Smart City. This study used a qualitative approach, with data collection techniques, namely interviews, observation and documentation. Sources of data from informants are: Head of Tomohon City E-Government Administration, Tomohon City Technology and Communication Infrastructure Section Head, Tomohon City Application Development Section Head, Tomohon City Communication and Informatics Office Staff / Staff, Matani Village Head, and Tomohon City community as users infrastructure and facilities provided by the government. Data analysis using data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions. Data were analyzed descriptively qualitatively. The results showed that: 1) The rules governing the running of the program or policy have not been well socialized and communicated, especially in agencies that have a role as implementers. 2) The government, in this case the Tomohon City Information and Communication Service, is still closed in providing information related to Smart City, especially Smart Governance. 3) The government has not yet launched a public complaint application even though it has been launched since 2016. 4) The government is still not ready to respond to existing technological and social developments, especially in the process of implementing Smart Governance. The Conditional Factors of Policy Implementation are a) Information Distribution, b) Resource Support, c) Government Attitude, d) Implementers. Therefore, it can be suggested, 1) There is a need for better socialization, communication and coordination regarding existing regulations to members and related agencies. 2) The government must be more open to the public, and must better prepare itself in responding to all situations and conditions that exist, especially in running the Tomohon Smart City program. 3) The government must improve work discipline, especially in the recruitment process, in order to create "the right man on the right job".

Keywords:
implementation; smart city; smart governance; local government programs; regional innovation; Tomohon city
Introduction

One of the programs for accelerating bureaucratic reform carried out by Local Governments is related to the development of an integrated electronic government system (e-government). The concept of e-government is present in order to improve the quality of governance in the world. The concept of egovernment is closely related to the development of information and communication technology in the world. Cities are the centers of various activities ranging from economic activities to government activities, so that it gives a consequence that most human activities are in urban areas. The development and growth in urban areas has caused problems such as large population and difficult to census, scarcity of resources, congestion, environmental degradation, the emergence of slum settlements, problems of waste and pollution, there are also problems such as garbage and crime rates increasing along with the development of the city. The role of local governments in supporting a participatory development policy is very important. This is because the Regional Government is the government agency that best knows the potential of the region and also knows the needs of the local people. In the process of solving problems in the city and maintaining its performance, various concepts of city development and management continue to be developed by the city government (Mantiri, 2018).

With the development of the times, technology, communication and information are able to have a big influence on people's activities and lives. Even in a city, the development of increasingly smart technology makes the concept of smart not only applied to various devices, but also to various systems or structures. One of them that has stuck out lately is the concept of Smart City. This Smart City concept connects every existing infrastructure elements using ICT (Information and Communication Technologies) technology. Based on Law no. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government. In Chapter XXI entitled Regional Innovation. This means that the government can make its own innovation for the city or region. The local government innovation policy refers to the principles of: increasing efficiency; effectiveness improvement; service quality improvement; no conflicts of interest; oriented to the public interest; done openly; meet the values of propriety; and can be accounted for the results are not for self-
interest. With the development of media and technology, now Tomohon City as a city with higher growth requires a more capable urban system.

In order to realize a smart city, it takes serious planning and commitment and the involvement of all stakeholders in the city. Not infrequently, smart city is only defined as the use of technology in city management, and ignores public participation in the city development process. The use of ICT is a tool in the process of building a smart city. As explained by Nam and Pardo that "in the development of a smart city, there are three driving dimensions that must be integrated by the city, namely technology, people, and institutions." (Nam: 2011) In an effort to integrate the three driving dimensions of smart city above, a change management is needed, which not only focuses on planned changes but there are unplanned changes (Gerald, 1977).

For this reason, in this digital era, the ability of implementation to supervision from the City Government needs to be upgraded. With the implementation of the city in real time so that it can solve problems effectively and efficiently, especially in the field of service to the public. With that, the City of Tomohon takes the opportunity to create a program and implement new innovations that are created in accordance with the situation and conditions of the city, namely the program with the Smart City concept as stated in Mayor Regulation number 31 of 2019 regarding Tomohon Smart City. The Smart City concept is not only based on following technological developments but how to adapt, use and utilize it. The Smart City concept is divided into 6 indicators; Smart Government, Smart Branding, Smart Economy, Smart Living, Smart Society, and Smart Environment, and in this study researchers focused on implementing Smart Governance.

Based on research conducted by researchers, it turns out that the implementation of the Smart City program, especially in the scope of Smart Governance, is still not in accordance with expectations, where the use of human resources, technology and the existing budget is not maximized properly. Lack of knowledge of existing regulations shows that the implementation of this smart city is not carried out seriously, the procurement of experts, especially in the IT field to support all activities related to hardware / software such as application of public complaints, and information service provider operators are also not fulfilled so that the facilities or infrastructure such as CCTV and Command Center that should have been implemented and utilized has not been realized and the impression was money
wasting, the government’s closed and non-transparent attitude also triggered suspicion about the implementation of this program. With the many awards and acknowledgments given to the local government of Tomohon City in implementing a smart city, with what was realized especially in the scope of Smart Governance, this program feels over-rated and seems to want to show or show what the government itself wants to show. To find out more clearly about these problems, the researchers in this study attempted to examine the process of "IMPLEMENTATION OF SMART GOVERNANCE IN REALIZING TOMOHON SMART CITY.”

Methods

The method used in this research is qualitative research methods. The researchers think this method is good enough and able to help researchers in describing and analyzing problems regarding the Implementation of Smart Governance in Realizing Tomohon Smart City.

The focus in this study: 1) Implementation of Smart Governance in Realizing Tomohon Smart City with 2 (two) sub-focuses or indicators, namely a) Development of Information and Communication Technology Infrastructure a) Application of Public Complaint Applications. 2) Conditional factors in the implementation of smart governance in realizing Tomohon Smart City, which are divided into 4 (four) indicators, namely Information Distribution, Resource Support, Government Attitudes, and Implementers. The data sources were 10 informants, places and events in Tomohon City, documents namely Law no. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government and Mayor Regulation No. 31 of 2019 concerning the Implementation of Tomohon Smart City. Data analysis techniques include data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing.

Results and Discussion

3.1 Implementation of Smart Governance in Realizing Tomohon Smart City

According to Dye (1992) programs cannot be separated from aspects of policy, policy or in this case public policy, in principle, it can be interpreted as "Whatever government choose to do or not to do". Understanding Infrastructure, according to Grigg (1988) infrastructure is a physical system that provides transportation, irrigation, drainage, buildings
and other public facilities, which are needed to meet basic human needs, both social and economic needs. This definition refers to infrastructure as a system. Where the infrastructure in a system is parts of facilities and infrastructure (networks) that are inseparable from one another. Smart Governance or smart governance is one part of the realization of a Smart City.

As a whole, Smart City consists of 6 forming dimensions, namely Smart Governance, Smart Branding, Smart Economy, Smart Environment, Smart Living, Smart Society / Smart People (Cohen, B., 2013). The description of Smart Governance can be seen from the requirements to make it happen, which are intended so that we get a clear and specific picture so that we can easily plan its implementation. Important points related to the description of Smart Governance include: a) Openness of public information b) Maximizing the resources owned for the welfare of the community (Kota Mandiri). c) Smart Culture d) Can express opinions, ideas and desires directly e) Provide job security for its citizens f) Provide a reliable and cheap transportation system g) Children-Friendly Cities. Based on Law no. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government in Chapter XXI entitled Regional Innovation, Tomohon City takes the opportunity to run the Smart City program and its implementation is regulated in Mayor Regulation No. 31 of 2019 concerning the Implementation of Tomohon Smart City.

3.2 Development of Information and Communication Technology Infrastructure

According to Ginanjar Kartasasmita (1994) infrastructure development is a process of change for the better through planned efforts. Meanwhile, according to Robert J. Kodoatie (2005) Infrastructure is a system that supports an environmental system, where this system can be used as a basis for making policies. Smart Governance is part of the realization of Smart City in Tomohon City as it is known that it has been implemented for the past 4 years, but unfortunately many members of government agencies who play a role as still do not know about the existence of Regional Regulations regulating this program. Lack of socialization among the members of the related institutions, the staff and employees are knowledgeable and even the implementing agency does not master in detail what is the purpose of all activities or development activities carried out. Providing information to the public is also one of the important issues where the government as an informant or party has the authority to convey valid information about matters that are in contact with the life of the community itself must be nimble and open, consistent and transparent in order to obtain Public trust especially
during the COVID-19 pandemic, it was found that a lot of information was not conveyed properly and information updates for the public were updated after a lot of false information was circulating. Things that should be public also cannot be accessed by the public, such as the Smart City master plan and Electronic Procurement services. Even though good and quality service has implications of satisfaction to the community, because the community directly assesses the performance of the services provided (Hayat, 2017). Procurement of facilities or infrastructure such as computers and internet / wifi networks, network towers, CCTV that were delivered approximately 55 devices have been distributed but it turns out that only 4 are used, online queues, traffic lights have not been distributed in areas or villages in Tomohon City, services The security of the 112 Tomohon City call centers is also not well socialized so that no community has yet used these facilities and the misuse of the command center facilities used for event activities has made the implementation of Smart Governance still ineffective and inefficient in supporting the realization of the Tomohon Smart City. According to Haang and Keen, Information and Communication Technology is a set of tools that help humans work with information and perform tasks related to information processing. Meanwhile, according to Williams and Sawyer Information Communication Technology is a technology that connects computing (computers) with high-speed lines that carry data, voice, and video..

3.3 Application of Community Complaint Applications t

One of the concrete forms for the realization of a Smart City based on Smart Governance application is an output that must be implemented by the government. In Wikipedia, an application is a subclass of computer software that takes advantage of the ability of a direct computer to perform a task that the user wants. According to Marimin (2011) Applications are programs that can directly perform processes that can be used on computers by users. Based on this understanding, the researcher can argue that the application is a software that can be accessed and simplifies the user's task.

According to Presidential Regulation Number 76 of 2013 concerning Complaint Management Article 1 Number 8 Complaints are complaints submitted by complainants to public service complaint managers regarding implementing services that are not in accordance with service standards, or neglect of obligations and / or violations of prohibitions
by the organizer. According to Presidential Regulation Number 76 of 2013 concerning Complaint Management. In the management of complaints that have been regulated in Presidential Regulation Number 76 of 2013 concerning Complaint Management, there are several important stages that need to be known by public service providers so that Complaint Management can run effectively and efficiently, including: (1) Availability of means of submitting complaints, can by telephone, sms, WA, come directly, etc.; (2) There are officials who manage complaints; (3) There is a complaint procedure mechanism system; (4) There is a period of complaint resolution; (5) Prepare regular reports on the results of complaints management that have been carried out as material for evaluation and consideration of policies for improving public services.

As we know, with the rapid development of the times and the emergence of the internet and increasingly sophisticated technology, it can be said that these things have become a part of life today. All forms of information, both from within the country and from abroad, can be accessed easily by the public with smartphones that provide information support features. The application of applications, especially the application of complaints, is very important for social life, especially in the midst of situations and conditions like now where we as a society no longer need to interact with each other directly. As found in research that this form of communication has often been proposed by the community, but there has been no movement from the government and the government only provides suggestion boxes, even then they are no longer found and are no longer implemented as if this activity is no longer needed because the government does not provide access to the public in a means to convey aspirations. In fact, one form of the Smart City program is at least having a communication platform with the community based on online software. Application of applications such as E-Kinerja, E-Discipline, Electronic Procurement Service (LPSE), Regional Goods Information System (SIMBADA), Online Licensing, Disaster Warning and especially Public Complaints Application should have been implemented because considering the implementation of this program has been running since 4 years ago. A government entitled Smart Governance should be ready and ready to provide facilities that can make it easier for the public, especially in using technology.
3.4 Conditional factors in the implementation of smart governance in realizing Tomohon Smart City

In the view of George Edward III in Widodo, there are 4 factors that influence the success or failure of policy implementation, namely (1) communication, (2) resources, (3) disposition (attitude) and (4) implementers [10]. From the theory of Edward III Horn, the researcher uses it as a research knife and adopts four implementation models, namely information distribution, resource support, government attitudes, and implementers who are used as sub-focus or indicators in focus II of this study in order to obtain information.

1. Information Distribution

According to Edward III in Widodo (2010), communication is defined as "the process of delivering communicator information to communicants". Edward III argues that communication and policy implementation include several important dimensions, namely transmission, clarity and consistency. In addition, according to Agustino (2006); "Communication is one of the important variables that influence the implementation of public policies. Communication is critical to the success of achieving the goals of implementing public policies". Judging from what the researchers found in the field, the government has not maximized the socialization process, especially regarding the applicable regulations in government agencies. The use of advances in communication technology is also not maximized so that the government seems sluggish and unable to adjust to existing progress where there are still limitations in the process of delivering information or poor communication between superiors and subordinates. The delivery of information that is more effective and efficient to the public as a government facility based on Smart Governance is also not implemented properly, such as what researchers found that the delivery of the latest information is still not updated over time and the government is less assertive in conveying information, especially during the COVID-19 pandemic, which is sensitive so there is a lot of miss-communication.

2. Resources

According to Edward III in Widodo (2010) that these resources include human resources, budget resources, equipment resources and authority resources. Makmur
and Thahier resources have various types, forms, and numbers, but if we modify the various types, forms and amounts of resources owned by public organizations, in fact they can be classified as two groups, namely the first is the resource. originating from humans with the terms (human resources) which have different types of weaknesses and types of strength between one human being and another, and the second one is non-human resources which also have very different forms and types. diverse (Makmur: 2016).

Based on the information obtained by researchers, there is indeed a shortage in the procurement of resources, especially human resources, which causes the government to be unprepared and unable to self-synchronize itself with the times. Lack of human resources, especially in the IT sector and operators as well as a workforce dominated by contract workers who do not have the appropriate background, make the implementation of Smart Governance not as it should be. Fulfillment of infrastructure facilities is also not maximized even though the Smart City program has been funded from the APBD.

3. Disposition (Attitude)

The definition of disposition according to Edward III in Widodo (2010) is said to be "the willingness, desire and tendency of policy actors to implement the policy seriously so that what is the goal of the policy can be realized". According to the opinion of Van Metter and Van Horn in Agustino (2006): "the attitude of acceptance or rejection of policy implementing agencies greatly affects the success or failure of public policy implementation". Through the results of research carried out the disposition consists of bureaucratic appointment and incentives, selection or appointment of bureaucracy that is not according to need and sometimes based on nepotism relations has a bad impact in the process of implementing Smart Governance. Incentives that are not implemented also make staff or employees not motivated to work, especially in implementing Smart Governance in Tomohon City, some staff / employees have to take turns overtime due to lack of human resources.

4. Executor (Bureaucratic Structure)

According to Edwards III in Winarno (2008), there are two main characteristics of bureaucracy, namely: "Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) and fragmentation".
Ripley and Franklin in Winarno (2008) identified six characteristics of bureaucracy as a result of observations of bureaucracy in the United States, namely: 1) Bureaucracy was created as an instrument in dealing with public affairs (public affairs). 2) The bureaucracy is a dominant institution in the implementation of public policies which has different interests in each hierarchy. 3) The bureaucracy has a number of different goals. 4) The function of the bureaucracy is in a complex and broad environment. 5) Bureaucracy has a high survival instinct, so it’s rare to find a dead bureaucracy. 6) The bureaucracy is not a neutral force and is not under full control from outside parties.

Based on what the researchers found that the implementer before the researcher carried out research on the location, the implementer still used the SOP as stated in the Minister of Communication and Information Technology Regulation Number 18 of 2016 concerning Guidelines for the Nomenclature of Regional Apparatus in the Communication and Informatics Sector as well as Tomohon Mayor Regulation Number 11 of 2018 concerning Public Service Malls in implementing the Smart City program which should not be an SOP of a Smart City. Then after conducting another interview with the informant who played the role of implementer for a long time, the agency stated that it used Mayor Regulation number 31 of 2019 concerning Tomohon Smart City, but many staff or employees did not know the contents of the regulation. Seeing that this is related to the role of the implementor as a driving force for the running of a program, it does not meet expectations because considering their very important role they should be able to master their main functions, therefore it is not surprising that the implementation of Smart City still seems to be constrained by many things.

**Conclusion**

The implementation of Smart Governance in Realizing Tomohon Smart City, it can be concluded that the implementation of the government has not been optimal yet and still seems far from expectations due to many incompatible factors in the program implementation process. Based on the results data and discussion, the following conclusions can be drawn:
1) Lack of knowledge from the executing apartment regarding the applicable regulations and existing SOPs causes the implementation of Smart Governance to not run properly.

2) The absence of openness or publication of the master plan for the implementation of the Smart City program makes the implementation of this program unstructured and the direction and objectives unclear.

3) Smart Governance is not running well because the support of human resources and facilities is inadequate because most of the implementing staff or employees do not have the appropriate background.

4) The development of technology and communication infrastructure has not been maximized because it is not implemented evenly, and there are facilities that are misused and their use is not realized.

5) The absence of public complaint applications and other community service applications which are important factors in the realization of Tomohon Smart City.

6) Information distribution: Inconsistent information distribution and agencies that are not yet able to adapt to the pace of social media or technology development make the distribution of information less than optimal.

7) Resource support: Limited resources make the implementation of the program not optimal, especially in running a government based on Smart Governance.

8) Disposition (attitude): The attitude of the government that is still not firm or disciplined because the recruitment of employees is not in accordance with the needs of the agency, making the agency seem rich in structure, poor in function.

9) Implementer (bureaucratic structure): Lack of knowledge of implementers in carrying out their duties makes the achievement of the Tomohon Smart City program not appropriate and even seems over-rated.

References
Agustinus, L. (2006). Politics and Public Policy. Bandung: AIPI.

Dye, T. (1992). Understanding Public Policy. New Jersey: Englewood Cliffs.

Ginanjar, K. (1994). Development for the People, Guiding Growth and Equity. PT. Library: CIDES INDO.
Grigg, N. (1988). *Infrastructure Engineering and Management*. John Wiley & Sons.

Life. (2017). *Public Service Management*. PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.

Kodoatie, R & Roestam, S. (2005). *Integrated Water Resources Management*. Yogyakarta.

Makmur, Thahier & Rohana. (2016) *Conceptual and Contextual Administration and Organization Against Public Policy*. Bandung: PT Refika Aditama.

Mantiri, J & Siwi, C. (2018). *The Role of the Government as the Main Key of Village Fund Management in Dulumai Village, Pamona Puselemba District, Poso Regency, Central Sulawesi Province*. *J. Civ. Educ.* Media Kaji: Pancasila and Citizenship.

Marimin and Maghfiroh, N. (2011) *Application of Decision Making Techniques in Supply Chain Management*. IPB Press. Bogor.

Regulation of the Minister of Communication and Information Technology Number 18 of 2016 concerning Guidelines for the Nomenclature of Regional Communication Devices.

Presidential Regulation Number 76 of 2013 concerning Complaint Management

Mayor Regulation No. 31 of 2019 concerning the Implementation of Tomohon Smart City.

Widodo, J. (2010). *Public Policy Analysis*. Malang: Bayumedia.

Winarno, B. (2008). *Public Policy (Theory and Process)*, Jakarta: Media Pressindo.

Nam T. And Pardo, A. 2011. Op.Cit, p. 287.

Gerald Zaltman and Robert Duncan. 1977. *Strategies for Planned Change*. Canada: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., p. 7