Systematic Review

Transcultural Nursing Care in Turkey

Songül Çağlar¹, Naile Bilgili²

¹Department of Public Health Nursing, Bolu Abant Izzet Baysal University, Bolu, Turkey
²Department of Public Health Nursing, Gazi University, Ankara, Turkey

ORCID IDs of the authors: S.Ç. 0000-0002-5412-0708, N.B. 0000-0002-7639-0303.

Cite this article as: Çağlar, S., Bilgili, N. (2020). Transcultural nursing care in Turkey. Florence Nightingale Journal of Nursing, 28(1), 110-123.

ABSTRACT

Aim: For quality and adequate nursing care, nurses should evaluate the cultural factors that patients have, respect these factors, and consider their impact on the patient's health. This review aimed to examine studies conducted in the field of transcultural nursing in Turkey.

Method: Studies published between 2000 and 2018 were searched from the electronic databases of ScienceDirect, Web of Science, Academic Search Complete, PubMed, Scopus, and Google Academic using the keywords care, culture, nursing, transcultural, transcultural nursing, and Turkey.

Results: As a result of the search, 150 studies were obtained, and 31 studies that fit the inclusion criteria were evaluated. These studies attempted to determine the factors that cover different dimensions of transcultural nursing, nursing education and training process, clinical and hospital applications, and several scales and guides and have been adapted and used in the Turkish population.

Conclusion: Studies conducted in the field of transcultural nursing in Turkey have gained momentum recently and have a more basic descriptive level.

Keywords: Care, culture, nursing, systematic review, transcultural, Turkey

INTRODUCTION

Presently, the demographic structure of society changes, and societies are composed of different ethnic and multicultural individuals. Technological developments and social media, including transportation, migration, communication resources, and economic, environmental, and social factors, affect health systems (Ray, 2016). Nurses who cannot adapt to this changing health system cannot offer quality nursing care expected from them.

Care is one of the basic building blocks of nursing. Every individual’s culture is unique, and care needs to be tailored to the individual, so care is a complex situation. Individuals with different cultures may have different perspectives on health, disease, disability, birth, and death (Ray, 2016). A nurse who does not know the value and importance of culturally appropriate care cannot provide effective care (Giger, 2017). To be able to provide better nursing care, nurses should consider race, ethnicity, culture, and cultural heritage (Giger, 2017). This demonstrates the importance of transcultural nursing for effective nursing care. Culturally sensitive care in the provision of health service is not considered a privilege but a human right (Prosen, 2015). Leininger reveals that the transcultural nursing approach prevents cultural problems or errors and increases the quality of care (Seviğ & Gülbu, 2012).

Transcultural nursing care, professionally, began with Leininger’s anthropologic work in the 1950s (Andrews & Boyle, 2008; Prosen, 2015). In 1970, she developed the concept of transcultural nursing (Molloy, Walker, Lakeman & Skinner, 2015). In 1969, the International Council of Nursing started using the culture content in nursing. In 1974, the “Transcultural Nursing Society” was established to educate nurses in this field (Hotun-Şahin, Bayram & Avcı, 2009), and in 1989, the “Journal of Transcultural Nursing” began publication, which aims to develop nurses’ training and practice in transcultural care (http://tcn.sagepub.com/). Associated with the adoption of the concept of transcultural care in vocational practice in nursing in international communities, studies in this area also started in Turkey. Initially, an article that assessed the...
nursing profession from a cultural point of view was published in 1978 (Seviğ & Gülbu, 2012). The Transcultural Nursing Association was established in 2013 (http://kulturlerarasihemsirelikdernegi.com/?page_id=133). There are regular congresses in transcultural nursing in various regions worldwide (Giger, 2017). One of these countries is Turkey. The first “Culture and Nursing” symposium was organized in 2005. Following this, the “Transcultural Competency and Distance Education” workshop in 2006 and “Nursing and Midwifery Cultural Approach” symposium in 2009 were conducted. The first congress in this field was organized in İçel in 2011 under the title “1st International Transcultural Nursing and Midwifery Congress,” which was participated by international delegates. Then, in June 2013, The National Transcultural Nursing Congress was held. In 2015, The International Participatory Transcultural Nursing Congress was organized in Çanakkale (http://www.kahd.org/kongre-4-1.htm). Then, the first international 4th National Transcultural Nursing Congress was organized in Sanliurfa between October 21 and 24 2017 (http://www.kahd.org/kongre-5-2.htm)

In Turkey, nurses contribute to professional development through various studies in the field of transcultural nursing care, and these studies are published in national and international academic journals (Ceylantekin & Öcalan, 2016; Cinar et al., 2015). The “Transcultural Nursing” course is available in nursing undergraduate programs, and thesis studies are conducted in postgraduate education. However, it is shown that still the concept of transcultural nursing is not addressed in all dimensions and studies are concentrated only in certain areas. Determining the present situation by examining the studies conducted to address this issue is important for the development of transcultural nursing in Turkey.

The study aims were as follows:

- To examine the studies in the area of transcultural nursing in Turkey
- To introduce studies that focused on transcultural nursing practice
- To provide readers an idea of transcultural nursing practice in Turkey

**METHOD**

**Study Design**

This study is a systematic review design.

**Search process and study identification**

This review was conducted according to the criteria established by the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (Moher, Liberati, Tetzlaff, & Altman, 2009). The ScienceDirect, Web of Science, Academic Search Complete, Medline, PubMed, Scopus, and Google Academic electronic databases were searched for related studies conducted between 2000 and 2018 using various combinations of keywords, including care, culture, nursing, transcultural, transcultural nursing, and Turkey, in Turkish and English. Studies published in national and international journals were included in the review. A total of 150 articles were obtained. Initially, studies with Turkey and culture, Turkey and culture and nursing, and Turkey and nursing and care keywords in the title were included in the review. Then, the summaries of the studies were read, and the studies conducted according to the eight transcultural nursing areas determined by Leininger were evaluated. Gray literature search was not performed. The latest search was performed in December 2018. A flowchart of the process of study identification is shown in Figure 1.

**Eligibility**

A total of 150 articles were obtained in the first stage, 119 of them were included in the review because studies that did not meet the evaluation criteria were excluded (Table 1). Studies that were excluded in the review were review articles (22), had no full texts (32), and did not have the subject content compatible with the keyword (65).
Data Analysis
Thirty one studies that met the inclusion criteria were grouped according to the eight main areas that Leininger identified as the building block of transcultural nursing (Andrews & Boyle, 2008) (the health of migrants within and among countries; knowledge of faith, life, and values that individuals have and respect; increasing technological developments that may conflict with the cultural values of people; cultural controversy worldwide and impact of violence on healthcare; cultural strife, neglect, and blindness caused by regional laws and practices; ease and diversity of people’s travel to various parts of the world; women and child health needs of feminism and other genders; community and cultural influences of healthcare services on environmental conditions).

Bias
The evaluation synthesis of the results was used depending on the differences in study design, sample population, type of measuring instruments, and significance in the results.

RESULTS
The results of the studies were examined under two headings: characteristics of the study methods and characteristics of the transcultural nursing field determined by Leininger. The results of the review were evaluated in two separate sections.

Characteristics of the study methods
The general properties of studies are shown in Table 2.

Years of studies: There are two studies in 2018 and 2017. Most studies related to the subject (10) were published in 2016, followed by 2014 (5 studies). The number of studies annually decreases retrospectively. There are two studies each in 2015, 2013, 2012, 2011, 2010, and 2009, and one study each in 2008 and 2006. The oldest study was conducted in 2006.

Types of participants: The sample group consisted of nursing students (12 studies), nurses (6 studies), and women (5 studies) in most studies. Two studies were conducted on patients. The size of the sample varies in the studies. Qualitative studies were conducted with a minimum of 9 and a maximum of 181 participants. Quantitative studies were performed with larger sample groups (n=98–1355).

Geographical regions: The studies were conducted in different regions of Turkey and compared Turkey with different countries. In the western part of Turkey, most studies were conducted in the province of Izmir. Moreover, studies on individuals between countries were conducted in Iran with Erzurum and Izmir and United Kingdom and Turkey. Outside of these studies, some were conducted in the form of joint studies in different regions in Turkey.

Ethnic groups in the studies: Although a large part of the studies is conducted on the Turk population, some studies were also conducted on the Syrian, English, and Iranian populations.

Data collection methods used in studies: Questionnaires developed by the researchers were used in 12 quantitative studies and one qualitative study, while the scale was used in 14 studies. All questionnaires used are in nonstandard form created by researchers based on relevant literature review. Scales were used to determine cultural competence in studies: Chen and Starosta’s Intercultural Sensitivity Scale, Nurse Cultural Competence Scale developed by the World Health Organization, and Cultural Awareness Scale. In one qualitative study, questions developed by Campinha-Bacote using the Cultural Qualification Process in the Distribution of Health Services in 2002 were used. Five qualitative studies were conducted through semi-structured interviews.

Table 1. Inclusion and exclusion criteria

| Inclusion                                      | Exclusion                                      |
|-----------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|
| Type of study                                 | Research article                              | Review article                            |
| Publication                                   | National/international journal                 | Gray literature                           |
| Language                                      | English and Turkish                           | Others                                    |
| Participants                                  | Nurses, nursing students, patients, or healthy individuals | -                                          |
| Place                                         | Turkey and between Turkey and other places    | Except Turkey                             |
Table 2. Features of included studies (n=31)

| Name of research and authors                                      | Journal, date       | Purpose                                                                 | Type of study          | Data collection methods                  | Findings and results                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Belief that individuals have and knowledge of their life and values and respect |                      |                                                                         |                        |                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Experiences of patients with newly diagnosed breast cancer in Turkey İnan et al. | TCN, 2016           | To describe the experiences of women in Turkey in the breast cancer diagnosis stage | Phenomenological approach to qualitative research          | 9 women                               | Women have an intense ambiguity about illness, treatment, and social relations and, therefore, exhibit avoidance behavior.                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Traditional and religious death practices in Western Turkey Bahar et al. | Asian Nursing Research, 2012 | To investigate the traditional and religious practices related to death in Narlıdere district of İzmir | Qualitative study | 181 women                               | Among the religious practices following death the first place to pray. It has been found that relatives and friends who participated in the tomb ceremony visited the house of the deceased person to provide social support to their relatives at home, and 55.2% of them had visited the house to express their belief that the deceased person could not claim any further rights. |
| Traditional postpartum practices of women and infants and the factors influencing such practices in Southeastern Turkey Geckil et al. | Midwifery, 2009     | To understand the traditional postnatal practices of women and infants and determine the factors that affect these practices | Descriptive study      | 273 women                               | In the postpartum period, women have several traditional practices. Nutritional practices are particularly important for newborn mothers. Again, these women were found to have traditional practices, such as wrapping a tight cloth, putting a heated brick in the snow, and lying in hot land. |
| Factors influencing women’s decision to deliver at home in rural Turkey Kukulu and Oncel | Midwifery, 2009     | To determine women’s thoughts about homebirth and examine the factors that affect homebirth | Cross-sectional descriptive study | 392 women | The decision of homebirth concerns economic difficulties and the desire to benefit from the help of neighbors. Women who gave birth in the home, planned or unplanned, reported that homebirth was unsafe. |
| Pregnancy planning and antenatal health behavior: findings from one maternity unit in Turkey Arslan Ozkan and Mete | Midwifery, 2010     | To determine the relationship between pregnancy planning and prenatal behavior | Cross-sectional descriptive study | 1355 women | Mothers with unplanned pregnancies smoke more cigarettes and consume more beverages that contain caffeine than mothers who plan their pregnancies. Moreover, these women had lower vitamin levels and had more nutritional problems and did not have the recommended weight during pregnancy. |
| Traditional methods applied in caring for infants of mothers in Karaman Ansoy et al. | Anatolian Journal of Nursing and Health Sciences, 2014 | To determine the traditional methods that the mothers of Karaman province apply to their newborn babies | Cross-sectional and descriptive study | 443 women | During pregnancy, childbirth, and postpartum and postnatal periods, parents receive information from the health workers initially and from the family elders. Mothers use traditional methods in the care of infants such as wrapping their infant with salt, using powder to protect rashes, swaddling the infant, and using antipyretic medications, cold water, and vinegar to lower the infant’s temperature during fever. |
Table 2. Features of included studies (n=31) (Continued)

| Name of research and authors | Journal, date | Purpose | Type of study | Sample size | Data collection methods | Findings and results |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------|---------------|-------------|------------------------|---------------------|
| Traditional methods used in infants | Journal of Child and Civilization, 2016 | To identify the traditional practices of child care of mothers with 0-12-month-old infants | Descriptive study | 88 women | Questionnaire prepared by researchers | Women try to solve their baby’s health problems by using traditional methods that they know or are recommended by their parents. Mothers use a yellow scarf on the baby to prevent jaundice, swaddle, and conduct practices related to the umbilical cord. When the infant is born, they perform Islamic memorial service, apply various practices on the excretion of the shrub, and read a prayer to preserve the religion. |
| The transcultural nursing concept: a study of nursing students in Turkey | INR, 2010 | To determine the cultural diversity of students and the patients they live with and provide patient care services. Transcultural nursing’s knowledge was also investigated | Descriptive study | 622 students | Questionnaire prepared by researchers | Most students have cultural differences in patient care and sometimes have difficulty in caring due to these differences. The lessons on cultural education in the curriculum of the students will reduce the living problems. |
| Experiences and attitudes of nurses regarding complementary health approaches used by themselves and their patients | TCN, 2016 | To describe the experience of nurses’ complementary health practices and personal and professional attitudes toward the use of complementary health practices | Descriptive study | 220 nurses | Questionnaire prepared by researchers | The most popular preferences that have been identified in nurses who use complementary health practices are physical and mental relaxation techniques. According to nurses, complementary health practices are useful, effective, and cheap. Nurses know the risks and potential benefits of complementary health practices and advise their patients on this issue. |
| Cultural sensitivity among clinical nurses: A descriptive study | J Nurs Scholarsh, 2017 | To investigate the cultural sensitivity of nurses working in rural and urban hospitals in Turkey | Descriptive and correlational study | 516 nurses | Sociodemographic Questionnaire Intercultural Sensitivity Scale | Many nurses did not have transcultural nursing courses during university education. Nurses were found to have more problems with language, level of education of the patient (when low), health perception of the disease, and religious beliefs. |
| Cultural perceptions and clinical experiences of nursing students in Eastern Turkey | Int Nurs Rev, 2016 | To explore Turkish nursing students’ perceptions of providing care to patients culturally different from themselves | Qualitative study | 21 students | Focus group interview | While some students focus on language and ethnic differences, some focus on gender and secrecy, while others focus on traditional practices of the cultural subgroup. While most students can describe cultural elements, only a few of them explain how cultural differences will affect the way they care. Students who are aware of historical confrontation have organized more empathic approaches to these elderly illnesses, but they do not know exactly how to behave. Some students, even if they do not have language differences, have weak communication because they refuse to question their patients’ beliefs because of fears of misunderstanding. Some students thought that ethnic and religious differences were obstacles to intervention, while others believe that religious or ethnic similarities increased the confidence of the patient. |
| Name of research and authors | Journal, date | Purpose | Type of study | Data collection methods | Findings and results |
|------------------------------|--------------|---------|---------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Nursing students’ attitudes to suicide and suicidal persons: A cross-national and cultural comparison between Turkey and the United Kingdom Flood et al. | J Psychiatr Ment Health Nurs, 2018 | To undertake a comparative investigation of nursing students’ attitudes toward suicide and suicidal persons in Turkey and the UK | Descriptive study 240 Turkish nurse students, 82 UK nurse students | Eskin’s Attitudes toward Suicide Scale Eskin’s Social Reactions to Suicidal Persons Scale (E-SRSPS) | There are differences in the attitudes of Turkish and UK student nurses. Turkish students have some difficulty in understanding suicide in a nonjudgmental way. Societal influences such as religious belief, culture, and tradition may have a deterrent effect on attitudes to suicide. |

**Cultural conflicts worldwide and studies on the effect of violence on healthcare**

| Name of research and authors | Journal, date | Purpose | Type of study | Data collection methods | Findings and results |
|------------------------------|--------------|---------|---------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Views of women’s sexuality and violence against women in Turkey: a cross-sectional investigation among university students Gursoy et al. | TCN, 2016 | To investigate the opinions of Turkish university students on gender roles, sexuality, and violence against women on issues related to women | Descriptive cross-sectional study 605 students (337 women; 268 male) | Attitude Scale for University Students | Male students have more traditional and unfair attitudes toward women’s problems than female students. Education levels and areas of study do not significantly affect students’ views of women, and a small percentage of students have endorsed violence against women. The traditional, patriarchal qualities of the Turkish society have been found to be extremely effective even in highly educated individuals. |
| Influence of workplace bullying on Turkish nurses’ psychological distress and nurses’ reactions to bullying Bardakçı and Gunusen | TCN, 2016 | To investigate the effect of bullying on psychological problems of nurses | Descriptive study 284 nurses Workplace Bullying Behavior Scale | General Health Questionnaire Nurse Information Form | Nurses are at serious risk of exposure to bullying behavior. Nurses with graduate degrees are more likely to be bullied and nurses who are exposed to bullying have higher levels of psychological distress and prefer to remain silent in this regard. Nurses often stay silent in the face of bullying, sharing with family and friends, or persecuting the tyrant. |

**Studies on the influence of environmental conditions on healthcare services in terms of society and culture**

| Name of research and authors | Journal, date | Purpose | Type of study | Data collection methods | Findings and results |
|------------------------------|--------------|---------|---------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Comparison of attitudes of Turkish and Danish nursing students toward the care of persons with HIV/AIDS | DEUHYO ED, 2013 | To compare the attitudes of nursing students in Turkey and Denmark toward individuals with HIV/AIDS and examine the relationship between attitudes and care willingness | Descriptive study 99 students, (52 students from Turkey; 47 students from Denmark) | AIDS attitude scale (AAS) Demographic Data Collection Form | Danish students’ attitudes toward individuals with HIV/AIDS are more positive than those of Turkish students. There is about a twofold difference between the rates of HIV/AIDS care and dating in the students of the two countries. Danish nursing students have less fear of transmission and negative feelings toward individuals with HIV/AIDS than Turkish students. Danish students are more willing to provide care. To improve the positive attitude toward individuals with HIV/AIDS and increase the willingness to care, it is especially important for nursing students to have a much more diverse cultural background in the future due to the increased cultural mobility and be equipped with the skills to care for cultural competence, and cultural attitudes toward HIV/AIDS must be addressed. |
### Table 2. Features of included studies (n=31) (Continued)

| Name of research and authors | Journal, date | Purpose | Type of study sample size | Data collection methods | Findings and results |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------|---------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Transcultural sensitivity of nursing students according to their empathy level | İKÇÜSBD, 2016 | To determine the relationship between the levels of transcultural sensitivity and empathy of nurse candidates and compare students from first and fourth grade in this respect | Descriptive and comparative study 196 students | Individual Definition Form Transcultural Sensitivity Scale Basic Empathy Scale | In the fourth grade, the ability of female students to empathize is higher than the ability of male students to empathize. Nursing students from the first year of the course is subject to cultural sensitivity, and cultural awareness and cultural issues should be added with an emphatic approach to individuals with different nursing management planning and should be taught. |
| Defining cultural diversities experienced in patient care by nursing students in eastern Turkey Tortumuoglu et al. | Nurse Educ Today, 2006 | To identify the cultural diversity that nursing students have with their patients and offer disease care and determine the effects of the students’ demographic variables on these variations | Cross-sectional study 263 students | Questionnaire prepared by researchers | Nursing students experience cultural differences when they provide nursing care services. Generally, it has been observed that nursing students from Erzurum and other regions outside of Eastern Anatolia and at the beginning of their studies have experienced more cultural diversity while providing disease care. Students who have cultural diversity in patient care experience these diversities while communicating with patients regarding religious beliefs and lifestyle. |
| An analysis of the cultural problems encountered during caregiving by the nurses working in two different regions of Turkey Klic et al. | Int J Nurs Pract, 2014 | To identify the cultural issues faced by nurses working in two university hospitals in the western and eastern regions during their care | Descriptive, comparative study 338 nurses | Questionnaire prepared by researchers | Extremely few nurses obtained transcultural nursing education. In nurses in western hospital, significant differences in beliefs and values between the health staff and the patients should be considered. Most nurses provide care to patients with different cultures (language, traditions, habits, traditions, beliefs, etc.). Most nurses were found to have problems in maintaining care for individuals due to language differences. The most common group are the nurses working in the west. |
| Perception of menopause: the Turkish and German women’s comparison Irmak-Vural et al. Balci-Yangin | GÜSBD, 2016 | To reveal the opinions of Turkish and German women who live in Alanya province and entered menopause regarding menopausal perceptions | Comparative and descriptive study 320 women (160 German Women; 160 Turkish Women) | Questionnaire on the Descriptive Characteristics of Women Opinions on Perception of Menopause form | Turkish and German women had a difference between menopause age and duration, and there were cultural differences in social development, worship, and sexuality during menopausal period. The problems experienced by women in the menopausal period and transcultural differences and the initiatives aimed at the problems were explained to the nurses through the in-service training programs, and preconceptions were grasped. Nurses should be more sensitive to recognize the cultures and reflect this effectively in their services. |
| Attitudes of nursing students toward people with disabilities Uysal et al. | Nursing EducToday, 2014 | To investigate the demographic variables affecting the attitudes of nursing students toward the disabled and the factors affecting this attitude | Descriptive study 587 students | Questionnaire prepared by researchers | Age group, type of school, previous education for disabled individuals and conditions for care for disabled individuals, and factors affecting attitudes of nursing students toward individuals with disabilities. There are still significant gaps in the current knowledge of the attitudes of nursing students in Turkey and factors influencing these attitudes. |
**Table 2. Features of included studies (n=31) (Continued)**

| Name of research and authors | Journal, date | Purpose | Type of study sample size | Data collection methods | Findings and results |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------|---------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Attitudes of Turkish nursing and medical students toward elderly people Ayoğlu et al. | TCN, 2014 | To evaluate the attitudes of medical faculty and nursing students in Turkey toward elderly individuals | Cross-sectional and comparative descriptive study 618 students | Kogan attitude scale against older | Medical students’ attitudes toward old age were more positive than those of nursing students. Concurrently, it was determined that the students had more positive behaviors as their age increased. According to sex, there were differences in attitudes toward elderly individuals, and it was determined that students had negative behaviors. |
| Comparison of nurses in two different cultures: who experiences more burnout Karaman-Özlü et al. | J Perianesth Nurs, 2016 | To determine the burnout levels of nurses working in surgical clinics in two countries | Descriptive study 179 nurses (Turkey, 87; Iran, 92) | Maslach Burnout Inventory Questionnaire prepared by researchers by literature survey | Nurses working in Turkey have more emotional exhaustion and less personal success compared to their counterparts in Iran. Nurses working in surgical units with higher occupational risk and workload and heavier working conditions are expected to improve the working environment and conditions, provide organizational support to increase job satisfaction, decide to prevent burnout, reduce burnout, and strengthen communication skills to cope. Providing psychological counseling services and efficient use of humor has been proposed. |
| A comparison of traditional practices used in pregnancy, labor, and postpartum period among women in Turkey and Iran Ozsoy and Katabi | Midwifery, 2008 | To examine pregnancy, childbirth, and traditional practices of women regarding postpartum period and to compare | Descriptive and comparative field study 300 women (Turkey, 150; Iran, 150) | A questionnaire form prepared by researchers by literature survey and semistructured interview | Cultures in pregnancy, labor, birth, and postpartum period in comparison to the beliefs and practices of the period between Turkey and Iran revealed a large difference. However, despite the cultural differences, some of the practices and beliefs are common. Consuming high-calorie foods; drinking hot herbal teas; applying religious and holy motifs (pray, go to sacred places); mystical practices (bad eye); limitations to specific areas such as traditional practices, physical activity, and sexual intercourse are similar in both countries. Turkish and Iranian cultures depend heavily on Islamic heritage and fertility and are extremely valuable. Pregnancy and birth are important life events that need to be encouraged and preferred. |
| Evaluate Gypsies’ living in Çanakkale according to “Purnell” Cultural Competence Model” Tanriverdi et al. | Anatolian Journal of Nursing and Health Sciences, 2012 | To evaluate the cultural characteristics of Roma with Purnell’s cultural competence model | Qualitative study (focus group interviews, voice recording and written recordings) 30 novels between the ages of 15 and 70 years | Semistructured interview form based on Purnell’s cultural competence model | Negativities such as early marriages (approximately 15 years), adolescent pregnancies, domestic violence against women, alcohol consumption and cigarette smoking among men, drug use at a minimum, prevalence of traditional practices, environmental hygiene insufficiency, and inadequate health behaviors have been identified among Gypsies. It has been found that Gypsies are prone to use primary healthcare services in all health problems. |
### Table 2. Features of included studies (n=31) (Continued)

| Name of research and authors | Journal, date | Purpose | Type of study | Sample size | Data collection methods | Findings and results |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------|---------------|-------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| The relationship between cultural sensitivity and assertiveness in nursing students from Turkey Kılıc and Sevinc | TCN, 2017 | To determine the relationship between cultural sensitivity and assertiveness in university nursing students | Descriptive study | 444 students | Chen and Starosta’s Intercultural Sensitivity Scale (ISS) and Rathus Assertiveness Scale (RAS). | There is relationship between cultural sensitivity and gender and desire to work overseas; assertiveness and year of nursing education and desire to work overseas. Nursing students at both schools had a moderate level of cultural sensitivity and assertiveness. As assertiveness level of the students increased, their intercultural sensitivity also increased. |
| Expectations of relatives of Syrian patients in intensive care units in a state hospital in Turkey Sevinc et al. | J Clin Nurs, 2016 | To describe the personal experiences of relatives of Syrian patients in an intensive care unit in a hospital in Turkey | Descriptive qualitative study | 30 Syrian families treated in Turkey | Semistructured interview | Relatives of Syrian patient who were treated in the intensive care unit in Turkey were found to have problems on their patients, and problems on social support, expectations were not met adequately, and communication difficulties were experienced. |
| A comparison of the prenatal health behaviors of women from four cultural groups in Turkey: an ethnonursing study Tasci-Duran and Sevil | Nurs Sci Q, 2013 | To determine the health behaviors of women in the prenatal period with a transcultural approach | Qualitative ethnonursing model | 18 women | In-depth semistructured interviews | Pregnant women from different cultures have different health behaviors in the prenatal period. Women differ in terms of culture influence and culture, perceptions, and transformations of cultural themes, cultural structure, attitudes, health, and life. |
| Motherhood in the shade of migration: a qualitative study of the experience of Syrian refugee mothers living in Turkey Korukcu et al. | Nurs Health Sci, 2018 | To determine the childbirth experience of Syrian refugee mothers and their transition to motherhood in Turkey | 17 Syrian mothers who gave birth at Akdeniz University Hospital | Individual in-depth interviews (semistructured form) | Syrian refugee mothers giving birth in Turkey had difficulties during their pregnancies. The difficulties are related to the subthemes of fear and struggle. The women are unable to prepare for childbirth due to financial problems and other factors related to poverty. Moreover, they have heavy domestic duties, and this affects their ability to access healthcare services during pregnancy and the postnatal period and their general health and well-being. Refugee mothers want to perform their cultural practices and raise their children according to their own beliefs. |
| Scales related to cultural care adapted in the Turkish society | TCN, 2015 | To adapt the Cultural Competence Scale for Turkish nurses and determine its validity and reliability | Methodological study | 235 nurses | Cultural Competence Scale for Turkish Nurses | The psychometric properties of the Turkish form of Cultural Competence Scale for nurses were found to be highly reliable and valid. The scale can be used in transcultural studies to compare the cultural competences of nurses. |
Result of the studies

Nurse’s studies: These studies frequently examined the state of knowing cultural care and problem of cultural differences in education and care during this period. Based on the results of these studies, the rate of transcultural nursing education is extremely low. Nurses often provide care to individuals from different cultures. The main point that nurses experience cultural differences is the language problem.

Nursing student’s studies: It was determined that, as in the nursing group, similar issues were also analyzed in the student group. It is observed that students have cultural differences in the care of patients, so they have difficulties in the caregiving process, and there is a relationship between empathy levels and cultural sensitivities. Cultural problems are caused by language disabilities, religious beliefs, and lifestyle. Almost all these studies emphasized that courses related to cultural sensitivity should be included in undergraduate nursing education and that awareness should be developed through trainings for nurses working in the field.

Different groups’ studies: These studies were frequently focused on cultural differences and effects of these differences on the use of health services. Although there is a close relationship in geographical location between Turkish and Iranian women and there is a belief based on Islamic heritage in both cultures, both groups have different cultural beliefs and practices. Gypsies who live in Turkey have worked to resolve all health problems of primary healthcare services. A study on Syrian migrants also investigated the difficulties they experienced during treatment with relatives of Syrian patients in intensive care units in a state hospital in Turkey. The most important obstacle for quality nursing care in studies conducted on foreign nationals is language.

Characteristics of the transcultural nursing field determined by Leininger

Studies in the field of transcultural nursing care are quite different. It has been determined that these studies are generally in the areas of health of immigrants who emigrate internationally or internally (Korukcu et al., 2018; Sevinc et al., 2016; Tasci-Duran & Sevil, 2013); knowledge of faith, life, and values the individuals have and respect (Arabaci, Yildirim, Dundar, & Kadam, 2016; Arsoy et al., 2014; Arslan-Ozkan & Mete, 2010; Ayaz et al., 2010; Bahar et al., 2012; Cirik et al., 2016; Geckil et al., 2009; Karatay et al. 2016; Kukulu & Oncel, 2009); cultural conflict and impact of violence on healthcare (Bardakçi &
In a state hospital in Turkey, Syrian patients in intensive care units were evaluated regarding the difficulties they experienced during treatment with their relatives (Sevinc et al., 2016) in studies conducted among countries and health of immigrants within the country itself. In another study conducted on Syrian migrants, it was determined that immigrants had difficulty during their pregnancy due to language barrier, some racist behaviors and discrimination, poverty, culture, and family structures (Korukçu et al., 2018).

In studies on faith, life, and value the individuals have and respect, Inan et al. (2016) found that nurses were aware of psychological difficulties experienced by patients with breast cancer and supported them (Inan et al., 2016). In a study conducted on Turkish and English nursing students, it was determined that Turkish nurses were more judgmental regarding suicide (Flood et al., 2018). Bahar et al. (2012) conducted a study to examine the practices of traditional and religious deaths in the western part of Turkey. At the end of the study, nurses and physicians came to the conclusion that they should recognize the practices of traditional and religious death closely in the community they serve (Bahar et al., 2012). They determined the traditional postpartum practices of women and infants in the southeast region and factors affecting these practices (Geckil et al., 2009). Kukulu and Öncel (2009) determined that factors affecting the decision to give birth at home in rural areas. Arslan-Ozkan and Mete (2010) explored pregnancy planning and antenatal health behavior. Arsoy et al. (2014) determined the traditional methods used by mothers in Karaman province in the care of their babies (Arsoy et al., 2014), and Arabaci et al. (2016) examined the traditional practices of child care of mothers with 0–12-month-old infants. In their study, Ayaz et al. (2010) found that nursing students of the three universities had cultural differences related to language and communication, leading to difficulty in providing care. Cirik et al. (2016) investigated that the point of view of nurses toward cultural situations and their experiences on complementary medical practices about themselves and their families.

In the area of cultural conflict and violence in healthcare, Bardakçı and Gunusen (2016) examined the situations of stressfulness due to workplace bullying of Turkish nurses. Gursoy et al. (2016) analyzed violence and sexuality toward women in university students and determined that the characteristics of patriarchal society in the viewpoint of gender and violence are preliminary.

In areas where community and cultural healthcare services are affected by environmental conditions, researchers have attempted to determine both cultural differences in the Turkish community within healthcare services and the differences in healthcare services compared to those in other societies. Kilic et al. (2014) identified that nurses who work in the western part of Turkey had language as the biggest obstacle while caring for individuals with different cultures. Çimen et al. (2013) compared Turkish and Danish nursing students’ attitudes toward care for individuals with HIV/AIDS and found that Danish students’ attitudes toward individuals with HIV/AIDS were more positive than those of Turkish students. Egelioğlu-Cetişli et al. (2016) found increasing empathy level of nursing students and their transcultural sensitivity in their study. Tortumluoglu et al. (2006) found that nursing students from Erzurum and other regions outside Eastern Anatolia were experiencing cultural diversity in their religious faith, lifestyle, and communication when performing nursing care. Tanriverdi et al. (2012) evaluated the lives of individuals living in Çanakkale based on Purnell’s cultural competence model. It was found that, among those in Roma, early marriages and adolescent pregnancies are common, with domestic violence against women, alcohol consumption and cigarette smoking in men, and drug use at a minimum. However, it was revealed that traditional practices, environmental hygiene deficiency, and inadequacy of healthy lifestyle behavior are widespread. Moreover, they found that those in Roma tend to use primary healthcare services in all health problems. Uysal et al. (2014), who evaluated the attitudes of nursing students toward disabled individuals, found that age group, type of school, previous education for disabled individ-
als, and conditions of care for disabled individuals were factors that affected the attitudes of nursing students toward individuals with disabilities. Ayoğlu et al. (2014) examined the attitudes of nursing and medical students toward elderly individuals and found that medical students had more positive attitudes toward elderly individuals than nursing students. Vural and Balci-Yangın (2016) examined the opinions of Turkish and German women who live in Alanya province and entered menopause regarding perceptions on menopause and found differences in social development, worship, and sexuality in the menopausal period. Karaman-Özlü et al. (2016) investigated burnout in nurses working in Turkey and Iran. Ozsoy and Katabi (2008) examined traditional practices among women in Turkey and Iran during pregnancy, childbirth, and postpartum period.

**Scales adapted to Turkish society**

It was determined that three scales were adapted in the Turkish society. Gözüm et al. (2015) conducted a validity-reliability study of the Nurse Cultural Competence Scale and found that the psychometric properties of the Turkish form were extremely reliable and valid. Başalan İz and Bayık (2017) conducted the validity-reliability study of the Basic Cultural Awareness Scale and reached the conclusion that nursing students can be used to increase their cultural competence. Bulduk et al. (2011) conducted the validity study of the Intercultural Sensitivity Scale and determined that nurse trainers could use the scale to measure the intercultural sensitivity of nursing students. They also emphasized that the scale can be used as a guide in defining students’ cultural sensitivities and evaluating the effectiveness of cultural models and guides in nursing education.

**DISCUSSION**

In this review, it was observed that the number of studies on the field of transcultural nursing in Turkey has increased and the articles have been published in national and international academic journals. This progress is associated with the establishment of the transcultural nursing foundation and organization of congresses. Studies attempted to determine the factors that cover the different dimensions of transcultural nursing, including nursing education and training process, clinical and hospital applications, and some scales and guides were adapted in the Turkish language and became useful in the Turkish population.

The Turkish society is a heterogeneous and multicultural society due to its geographical and geopolitical location (Yılmaz, Toksoy, Direk, Bezirgan, & Boylu, 2017). Turkey has experienced immigration recently due to civil war and confusion in Syria and neighboring countries. Thus, local, national, and global migration can lead to inequality in obtaining and using healthcare services (Yılmaz et al., 2017). However, it was observed that the number of studies on immigrants’ health in Turkey is small.

Leininger’s transcultural nursing theory requires nursing practices to understand and analyze both cultural and universal applications of human life. This process guides nurses in designing and presenting nursing care that fit the individual’s specific lifestyle for a culturally compatible care (Rommelspacher, 2006). However, there were insufficient studies on the contradiction of cultural values of individuals with increasing technological developments; cultural conflicts, negligence, and blindness caused by regional laws and practices; ease and diversity of people’s travel to various parts of the world; and women and child health needs of feminism and other gender phenomena. This can be explained by the fact that the concept of culturally sensitive care has not yet been widely established in nursing care.

It is not possible to achieve the goal of quality care in nursing with an approach that cultural differences are not considered. To provide quality nursing care, nurses should respect the cultural values of individuals and plan nursing care in this direction (Tortumluoglu, 2004). Turkey is a culturally diverse country, where individuals with different cultures live together. It is a requirement of contemporary nursing care to plan and perform care by recognizing this richness and evaluating each individual in their own cultural characteristics, and it does not adopt, exclude and ignore the importance of culture to the individuals of that community.

This review revealed the forefront in areas on the contradiction of cultural values of individuals with increasing technological developments; cultural controversy, neglect, and blindness caused by regional laws and practices; ease and diversity of people traveling to various parts of the world; women with feminism and other gender events, and child health needs. This can be explained by the fact that the concept of culturally sensitive care has not yet been widely established nursing care in Turkey.
Study limitations

Because of the factors that make culture varied, the number of factors influencing transcultural nursing care is also quite large. Therefore, studies on transcultural nursing care are also quite diverse. In this review, studies on this area have been evaluated. However, this review may be inadequate to assess the whole of the studies in transcultural nursing care.

CONCLUSION

The concept of “transcultural nursing” has been used in nursing care since 2004 and included in the nursing curriculum of many universities in Turkey. However, there are deficiencies in providing adequate knowledge to provide culturally sensitive nursing care in studies. Most studies in this review used quantitative methods. Qualitative studies can be beneficial in determining cultural factors and enable acquisition of in-depth knowledge in determining nurse’s views on this issue. In future studies, studies should be conducted using different methods; examine different cultural characteristics; determine the effect of technological development and regional practices on culture, which are the subjects that are hardly studied; and analyze areas such as travel and violence.

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed.

Author Contributions: Concept – S.Ç., N.B.; Design – S.Ç., N.B.; Supervision – S.Ç., N.B.; Resources – S.Ç., N.B.; Materials – S.Ç.; Data Collection and/or Processing – S.Ç., N.B.; Analysis and/or Interpretation – S.Ç., N.B.; Literature Search – S.Ç., N.B.; Writing Manuscript – S.Ç., N.B.; Critical Review – S.Ç., N.B.; Other – S.Ç., N.B.

Conflict of Interest: The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

Financial Disclosure: The authors declare that this study has received no financial support.

REFERENCES

Andrews, M., & Boyle, J. (2008). Transcultural concepts in nursing care (A. MM Ed.): Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.

Arısoy, A., Canbulat, N., & Ayhan, F. (2014). Traditional methods applied in caring for infants of mothers in Karaman. Journal of Anatolia Nursing and Health Sciences, 17(1), 201-207.

Arslan-Özkan, I., & Mete, S. (2010). Pregnancy planning and antenatal health behaviour: findings from one maternity unit in Turkey. Midwifery, 26(3), 338-347. [CrossRef]

Ayaz, S., Bilgili, N., & Akin, B. (2010). The transcultural nursing concept: a study of nursing students in Turkey. International Nursing Review, 57(4), 449-453. [CrossRef]

Ayoğlu, F. N., Kulaçlı, H., Ayıldız, T. K., Arslan, G. K., & Veren, F. (2014). Attitudes of Turkish nursing and medical students toward elderly people. Journal of Transcultural Nursing, 25(3), 241-248. [CrossRef]

Bahar, Z., Beser, A., Ersin, F., Kissal, A., & Aydogdu, N. G. (2012). Traditional and religious death practices in Western Turkey. Asian Nurs Res, 6(3), 107-114. [CrossRef]

Bardakci, E., & Gunusen, N. P. (2016). Influence of workplace bullying on Turkish Nurses’ psychological distress and nurses’ reactions to bullying. J Transcult Nurs, 27(2), 166-171. [CrossRef]

Başalan Iz, F., & Bayık Temel, A. (2017). Cultural awareness scale: psychometric properties of the Turkish andrson. Colle-gian 24, 499-504. [CrossRef]

Bulduk, S., Tosun, H., & Ardiç, E. (2011). Measurement properties of Turkish intercultural sensitivity scale among nursing students. Türkiye Klinikerleri J Med Ethics 19(1): 25–31.

Ceylantekin, Y., & Öcalan, D. (2016). The cultural awareness of the nursing students and their ideas about transcultural nursing. GÜSDB, 5(4), 45-53.

Cinar, F. I., Cinar, M., Yilmaz, S., Ackel, C., Erdem, H., Pay, S., et al. (2016). Cross-cultural adaptation, reliability, and validity of the Turkish version of the compliance questionnaire on rheumatology in patients with Behçet’s disease. J Transcult Nurs, 27(5), 480-486. [CrossRef]

Cirik, V., Efe, E., Oncel, S., & Gozum, S. (2017). Experiences and attitudes of nurses regarding complementary health approaches used by themself and their patients. J Transcult Nurs, 28(4), 381-390. [CrossRef]

Çimen, S., Bahar, Z., Öztürk, C., & Bektas, M. (2013). To compare the attitudes of Turkish and Danish nursing students toward the care of persons with HIV/AIDS. DEUHYO ED, 6(3), 139-143.

Egekoğlu-Çetişli, N., Işık, G., Özgüändn-Öztornaci, B., Ardağahan, E., Özgürsoy-Uran, B. N., Top, E. D., et al. (2016). Intercultural sensitivity of nursing students according to their empathy leadl. İKÜÇUSB, 1(1), 27–33.

Flood, C., Yilmaz, M., Phillips, L., Lindsay, T., Eskin, M., Hi-ley, J., et al. (2018). Nursing students’ attitudes to suicide and suicidal persons: a cross-national and cultural comparison between Turkey and the United Kingdom. J Psychiatr Ment Health Nurs, 25(7), 369-379. [CrossRef]

Geckli, E., Sahin, T., & Ege, E. (2009). Traditional postpartum practices of women and infants and the factors influencing their practices in South Eastern Turkey. Midwifery, 25(1), 62–71. [CrossRef]

Giger, J. N. (2017). Introduction to transcultural nursing Transcultural Nursing Assessment and Interandntion (7 ed.). Riandport Lane Elsevier.

Gozum, S., Tuzcu, A., & Kirca, N. (2016). Validity and reliability of the Turkish version of the nurse cultural competence scale. J Transcult Nurs, 27(5), 487-495. [CrossRef]
Gursoy, E., McCool, W. F., Sahinoglu, S., & Yavuz Genc, Y. (2016). Views of women’s sexuality and violence against women in Turkey: a cross-sectional inadstigation among unian-
drity students. J Transcult Nurs, 27(2), 189–198. [CrossRef]
Hotun-Şahin, N., Bayram, G. O., & Avci, D. (2009). Culturally sensitiand care: transcultural nursing. HEMAR-G, 6(1), 2–7.
Inan, F. S., Gunusen, N. P., & Ustun, B. (2016). Experiences of newly diagnosed breast cancer patients in Turkey. J Trans-
cult Nurs, 27(3), 262–269. [CrossRef]
Journal of Transcultural Nursing. Available from: http://tcn.
sagepub.com/. Accessed 30 December 2019.
Karaman-Özlüt, Z., Çay Yayla, A., Gümüş, K., & Khaghanyard, E. (2017). Comparison of nurses in two different cultures: who experiences more burnout. Journal of PeriAnesthesia Nursing, 32(3), 238–244. [CrossRef]
Karataş, G., Bowers, B., Karadağ, E., & Demir, M. (2016). Cul-
tural perceptions and clinical experiences of nursing students in Eastern Europe. International Nursing Review, 63, 547–554. [CrossRef]
Kılıç, S. P., Besen, D. B., Tokem, Y., Fadiloglu, C., & Karadağ, G. (2014). An analysis of the cultural problems encountered during caregiving by the nurses working in two different re-
gions of Turkey. Int J Nurs Pract, 20(3), 310–319. [CrossRef]
Kılıç, S. P., & Sevinç, S. (2017). The relationship between cultural sensitivity and assertiandness in nursing students from Turkey. Journal of Transcultural Nursing, 1–8.
Korukçu, O., Aydin, R., Conway, J., & Kukulu, K. (2018). Motherhood in the shade of migration: A qualitatiand study of the experience of Syrian refugee mothers living in Turkey. Nurs Health Sci, 20(1), 46–53. [CrossRef]
Kukulu, K., & Oncel, S. (2009). Factors influencing wom-
ent’s decision to haand a home birth in rural Turkey. Midwifery, 25(1), 32–38. [CrossRef]
Kültürlerarası Hemşirelik Derneği. Available from: http://kulturlerarasihemsierekdernegi.com/?page_id=133Accessed 30 December 2019
Kültürlerarası Hemşirelik Derneği. Available from: http://www.kahd.org/kongre-4–1.htm Accessed 5 February 2020
Kültürlerarası Hemşirelik Derneği. Available from: http://www.kahd.org/kongre-5–2.htm Accessed 5 February 2020
Moher, D., Liberati, A., Tetzlaff, J., & Altman, D. G. (2009). PRISMA Group. Preferred reporting items for systematic re-
views and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. BMJ(339), b2535. [CrossRef]
Mollov, L., Walker, K., Lakeman, R., & Skinner I. (2015). Eth-
nursing and the ethnographic approach in nursing. Nurse 
Researcher, 23(2), 17–21. [CrossRef]
Ozsoy, S. A., & Katabi, V. (2008). A comparison of traditional practices used in pregnancy, labour and the postpartum peri-
od among women in Turkey and Iran. Midwifery, 24(3), 291–300. [CrossRef]
Prosen, M. (2015). Introducing transcultural nursing edu-
cation: implementation of transcultural nursing in the post-
graduate nursing curriculum. Procedia - Social and Behavioral 
Sciences, 174, 149–155. [CrossRef]
Ray, M. A. (2016). Theoretical and transcultural caring dy-
namics in nursing and health care. In M. A. Ray (Ed.), Transcul-
tural Caring Dynamics in Nursing and Health Care (2 ed., pp. 
3–35). Philadelphia: F. A. Davis Company.
Rommelspacher, B. (2006). Transculturality and Nursing. Nursing Theories: Conceptual and Philosophical Foundations. 
H. S. Kim and I. Kollak, Springer Publishing Company: 254.
Seviğ, Ü., & Gülbu, T. (2012). Kültürlerarası Hemşireliğin Tanımı, Önemi ve Tarihsel Gelişimi. In Ü. Seviğ and T. 
Gülbu (Eds.), Kültürel Arasılık Hemşirelik (pp. 109–104). Istanbul: 
İstanbul Medikal.
Sevinc, S., Aghif, M., Uzun, O., & Gulbil, U. (2016). Expecta-
tions of relatians of Syrian patients in intensiand care units in a state hospital in Turkey. J Clin Nurs, 25(15–16), 
2232–2241. [CrossRef]
Tannverdi, G., Ünüvar, R., Yalçın, M., Sürer, M., Açar, P., 
Akçay, E., et al. (2012). Evaluate gypsies’ living in Çanakkale according to “Purnell” cultural competence model”. Anadolu 
Hemşirelik ve Sağlık Bilimleri Dergisi, 15(4), 244–253.
Tasci-Duran, E., & Sevil, U. (2013). A comparison of the pre-
natal health behaviors of women from four cultural groups in 
Turkey: an ethnonursing study. Nurs Sci Q, 26(3), 257–266. 
[CrossRef]
Tortumluoğlu, G. (2004). Transcultural nursings and the 
samples of cultural care models. Journal of Cumhuriyet Uni-
cerity School of Nursing. 8(2), 47–57.
Tortumluoğlu, G., Ökanli, A., Ozaycigolu, N., & Akyil, R. 
(2006). Defining cultural diandrsities experienced in patient 
care by nursing students in eastern Turkey. Nurse Educ Today, 
26(2), 169–175. [CrossRef]
Uysal, A., Albayrak, B., Koculu, B., Kan, F., & Aydin, T. (2014). Attitudes of nursing students toward people with disabilities. 
Nurse Educ Today, 34(5), 878–884. [CrossRef]
Vural, P. I., & Yangin, H. B. (2016). Perceotion of menopause: The Turkish and German women’s comparison. GUSBĐ, 5(3), 
7–15.
Yılmaz, M., Toksoy, S., Direk, Z. D., Bezirgan, S., & Boylu, M. 
(2017). Cultural sensitiand among clinical nurses: a descriptiand 
study. Journal of Nursing Scholarship, 49(2), 153–161. [CrossRef]