Examining the effects of internal control system on crisis management skills: The case of IMM fire service department

Tamer Aksoy(a), Murat Saglam(b)

(a) Professor of Accounting and Finance, School of Business, Ibn Halbusan University, Istanbul, Turkey
(b) Institute of Social Sciences, Ibn Halbusan University, Istanbul, Turkey

A R T I C L E  I N F O

Article history:
Received 05 June 2020
Received in rev. form 18 July 2020
Accepted 08 August 2020

Keywords:
Internal Control, COSO, Crisis
Management Skills, Istanbul
Metropolitan Municipality, Disaster,
Corporate Governance

JEL Classification:
M42, G32, G34

A B S T R A C T

This study examines the effects of the effectiveness of the internal control system (ICS) on crisis management skills (before, during, and after the crisis) in the event of a disaster through the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality (IMM) Fire Service Department. Methodologically, a comprehensive survey questionnaire was used to collect data from 251 workers of the IMM fire service department located on the Anatolian side of Istanbul. Statistic Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 22 was used to analyze data by running among other reliability tests, T-Test, ANOVA, and Regression analysis. The results of the study indicated that ICS of the Fire Service Department of IMM showed high levels of effectiveness in the event of a disaster and that the institution has a high level of crisis management skills. In addition, the study found that a high positive relationship existed between ICS and Crisis Management Skills of the IMM fire service department before, during, and after the crisis in the event of a disaster. Finally, the study revealed that, ICS has a positive and high impact on IMM crisis management skills before, during, and after the crisis, and that the effectiveness of ICS had increased the crisis management skills of the institution.

(Received 05 June 2020; Revised 18 July 2020; Accepted 08 August 2020)

© 2020 by the authors. Licensee SSBFNET, Istanbul, Turkey. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

Introduction

In the recent past, there have been accounting and auditing scandals in the United States, which began with Enron and became widespread and had a global impact. Various factors played a dominant role in the formation of scandals. One of the most important of these factors is the ineffectiveness of the internal control (IC) & internal control system (ICS) associated with some basic business functions (financial reporting, accounting, auditing, finance, oversight, corporate governance etc). IC weakness had a significant impact on global scandals.

At Enron, the ICS and crosschecks were disabled, excluded, and the effectiveness was not controlled. IC methods were eliminated and no work was done on the availability and competence of the system. Necessary inspections were not made to reduce mistakes. Corporate errors formed the basis for global scandals. In addition to this, the deliberate damage and violation of ethical principles such as accuracy, honesty, transparency, independence and accountability in scandals has also been effective. The Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002 (SOX, 2002) proposed important practices for CG failures that were instrumental in scandals. A variety of factors played a role in their occurrence. The most important factors are summarized as (Aksoy, 2005): unreliable information and financial reporting about businesses; inadequate corporate responsibility for fraudulent financial reporting; lack of CG; deterioration of auditor independence; lack of IC; ineffective ICs; lack and ineffectiveness of management, external audit and public authority regarding the surveillance/monitoring of IC

Accordingly, effectiveness of ICS have become vitally important along with the ethical principles following the scandals. In other words, with the lessons learned from the scandals and the SOX enacted in the United States following the scandals, the importance of ICS become even more prominent in the world.
In addition, Inter alia IC function has become one of critical ‘safety valves’ for the protection of the mutual interests of all stakeholders in terms of reliable reporting, achieving corporate goals, corporate governance and quality assurance, as well as transparency, accuracy, accountability, sustainability and competitiveness.

Furthermore, in addition to the scandals, a process of change and development has been taken place simultaneously throughout the world in recent years. During this period, a series of changes, new trends and developments (i.e. Globalization, rapid change, technological developments, deregulation, environmental complexity and turbulence, digital technologies, sustainability, financial mobility, intensification of economic activities, increase in competition, convergence of markets, complexity, international standards, corporate governance, enterprise risk management, quality assurance, etc.) have profound and multi-dimensional impact on business ecosystem and all strategic business functions. All these developments and new trends have deeply affected and highlighted the importance of effectiveness of ICS which is also a crucial element of the business ecosystem.

On the other hand, institutions and businesses, like all people, also face unexpected events and disasters. Disasters are natural or human-induced extraordinary situations that interrupt the social and economic activities of people hence causing physical, social and economic losses. From time to time, people may face natural or man-made disasters unexpectedly (Sahin & Sipahioglu, 2009). Correct and timely response to disasters is important both in preventing or keeping losses of life and properties at a minimum level. Besides, managing the crises have also close relationships with survival of the business, achieving the goals, maintaining the sustainability and competitiveness. So, in the occurrence of unexpected events and disasters, institutions need to be able to manage and overcome crises in a healthy way in order to come out of these disasters. For this reason, institutions that work in direct combat with disasters must have effective Crisis Management Skills (CMS). Crisis Management is defined as the organization of as well as the management of resources relating to all humanitarian aspects of emergencies in order to lessen the impact of disasters (Kadroğlu 2013). For an effective CMS to be achieved, there should be a methodology put in place to combat internal and external forces that might cause hindrances (Aksoy & Mohammed, 2020). Because disaster situations are a crisis process for institutions that respond to disasters and must be managed effectively.

Thanks to their crisis management skills, organizations can manage the crisis process successfully and ensure that there are no or minimal losses (Akar, 2013). Effective crisis/ disaster management and the existence of an effective ICS are among the key components of corporate governance. Effective ICSs are also thought to have a positive effect on the crisis management skills of institutions. Accordingly, crisis/disaster management processes and procedures together with their ICs should be predetermined and all responsibilities, duties, authorities, responsibilities and cross-checks in terms of compliance with corporate governance principles should be clarified and well known to all internal/external parties, including employees. It should be emphasized again that not only the establishment of these processes, but also the effectiveness and protection of crisis management processes together with their IC process is very important. IC is defined as the rules and policies adopted by the organization in order to achieve its goals and objectives. In short, it is the methods and methods of organization (COSO, 2013).

It is vital to have effective ICSs both in all organizational processes and especially in crisis management processes. The way to do this is to be prepared and have a high level of awareness for the disasters and crises that corporate organizations may be exposed to (Fidan & Gülsünler, 2003). It is important to have clear duties, authorities and responsibilities It is considered that this will have an effect on reducing uncertainties encountered in crisis management and increasing crisis management skills. It is stated that the development within the institution can be possible with the implementation of corporate governance principles and the establishment of effective ICS. Since the authorities and responsibilities in corporate organizations will be determined precisely, there will be no disruption in the flow of information and there will be no negativity due to the strong/effective ICS (COSO, 2013).

As far as it is known, as a result of the literature review, although there are different specific studies on internal control, internal control effectiveness and crises/disaster management, there is no direct empirical study that addresses the effects of the effectiveness of the ICS on the organization's crisis management skills. The study is considered to be a first in its subject in this context. The study includes an application that examines the effectiveness of the ICS on the IMM fire department, which has an institutional organization that is likely to encounter disasters, on the crisis management skill of the institution.

This study aims to examine the effects of ICS on crisis management skills in the event of disaster of the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality (IMM) Fire Service Department.

In this study, firstly, the conceptual background of internal control, COSO internal control framework and importance of ICS in crises management are briefly discussed. In addition, the literature review elaborated. Furthermore, a comprehensive questionnaire based on COSO-compliant statements about the effectiveness of the ICS and the Statements about employees' crisis management skills. More also, analysis of the data conducted and lastly, the study ends with the results, discussion, recommendations and references.

With focus on COSO IC framework, the study deems to examine the effects of ICS on crisis management skills in the event of disaster of the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality (IMM) Fire Service Department.

And finally, this study seeks answers on (i) to whether there is a relationship between the effectiveness of IMM's ICS and crisis management skills?, (ii) to what is the effect of ICS's effectiveness on IMM's pre-crisis management skills?, (iii) to what is the impact of effectiveness of ICS has on during crisis management skills of IMM?, (iv) to what is the impact of effectiveness of ICS has on
post-crisis management skills of IMM?, (iv) to at what level the responds of the respondents vary according to descriptive characteristics (age, marital status, educational background, term of duty, scientific program participation status, training in disaster psychology/awareness/management).

Literature Review

Theoretical and Conceptual Background

Agency theory

Agency theory has to do with the relationship that exist between a shareholder (owner) and manager (agent) in an organization. The theory which is also called agency relationship was introduced by Ross & Mitnick in 1973. The supposition of agency theory according to Lang (2007) is that, it leads to one party having more information than. To a large extend, the agents are well informed about the administration of the business entity than the owners (Ellifsen et al, 2006). Trust is tantamount to success (Mohammed, 2020). The owner vest more running power onto the agent to represent the utmost interest of the owner and this could lead goal conflict (Pratt & Zeckhauser, 1985). Therefore, the owner sets standards to control the actions of the agent. IC and auditing are the frequently used control means. The lack of trust between owner and agent, the issues of information disproportionateness and the fact that all parties are rational leads to agency cost that affects the performance of the business. According to Payne & Jensen (2003), IC serves as the best tool in reducing agency costs, hence, the importance of this theory to this study. 'IC monitors the actions of the agent and reports appropriately to the owner, which decreases the problem of information disproportionateness and increase performance, which results in high yields of profit for both parties’ (Mohammed, 2020).

Contingency theory

This theory introduced by Drazin & Van de Van (1985; Badara, 2017) has to do with the environment in which an entity operates. It states that, the optimum organization of an organization depends on the environment within which it works. Contingency theory stipulates that an entity cannot achieve optimal performance if it does not place much attention on the environment within which it operates’. According to Jokipii (2006) firms consider the features of the environment in which they operate and structure themselves to fit in. Hence the need for an effective organizational structure to enhance and maintain performance. IC as a part of organizational structure is the best tool employed in this context. This theory is important to this study because the environment of an organization serves as the organizational attitude for effectiveness and efficiency.

Internal Control framework

IC refers to a wide process that is carried out by the Board of Directors (BoDs), senior management and all employees and provides reasonable assurance for realizing goals (i.e. achieving goals, protecting assets, avoiding loss/damage, accurate/reliable financial reporting, compliance with legal and internal/external regulations, increasing the efficiency and productivity of activities, etc.). This concept contains all kinds of policies, plans, procedures, measures, methods and systems applied in this direction (COSO, 2013).

IC is a concept that encompasses the process and actions taken by the BoDs, managers, employees and other relevant parties to achieve the business objectives, increase the likelihood of achieving goals, and manage risks (IIA, 2020).

IC is a vital part of the day to day management of an organization. It ensures effectiveness and efficiency in activities, budget accuracy, reliability and transparency of the financial statements and compliance with applicable laws and regulations (Güner, 2009). According to Basel (1998) IC is a procedure which affects the board of directors, senior management and all levels of personnel of an organization and Mayo & BPP (1988) posit that the main role of IC is to protect the resources against fraud and wastage whilsts ensuring transparency in financial reports. IC stresses on the attainment of the organization's goals and mission. According to International Federation of Accountants (IFAC) IC helps managers to oversee and manage corporate risks (IFAC, 2011).

IC lacks a worldly acknowledged definition because as some scholars see it as a portion of an organization others see it to cut across all sections of the organization. Nevertheless, according to COSO (1994) the following points should be noted when defining and executing IC.

- IC is a process.
- It is a tool used to achieve goals.
- IC is not just a set of regulations and forms; is open to interaction with employees.
- IC can provide significant assurance, but not absolute assurance.
- The purpose of IC is to ensure the achievement of corporate goals.

According to Yılanç, (2006) COSO defined IC as a process carried out by the board of directors, management and other personnel of the institution in order to achieve the objectives of ensuring the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities, reliable financial reporting and compliance with the relevant laws and regulations. The American Institute of Certified Public Accountants (AICPA) adopted the definition in the COSO model in the auditing standard no 78 in 1995 (Demirbaş, 2005). In addition, Awe (2005) defined IC as an implemented organizational structures, procedures and policies to prevent risk and ensure that organizational goals are
attained based on management-initiated concerns. IC is a complete system established by management to ensure efficiency, adherence in management strategies, safeguarding of business properties and transparency in reports and accuracy in records (Olatunji, 2009).

The objectives of IC activities in the COSO ICS are categorized under three headings operational, reporting and compliance (COSO, 2013);

Operational Objectives: Refers to the operating system of an enterprise to show efficiency and effectiveness in protecting assets and in realizing operational and financial objectives.

Reporting Objectives: Includes transparency, reliability, time limits and other issues stipulated in internal/external financial/non-financial reporting by regulatory agencies and reporting to the top management.

Compliance Objectives: Includes laws and other regulations that the business is responsible for complying with.

Models of IC have been developed and used in different parts of the globe. Among them include COSO, CoCo, SysTrust, SAC, Turnbull and CoBiT.

COSO Internal Control Framework and Its Components

COSO is the widely used and highly developed model. It was developed by a commission known as the Committee of Sponsoring Organizations (COSO), created in cooperation with various accounting-audit-finance professional organizations in the United States which include AAA (American Accounting Association), AICPA (American Institute of Certified Public Accountants), FEI (Financial Executives International), IMA (Institute of Management Accountants), IIA (Institute of Internal Auditors).

COSO model consists of five interrelated components (COSO, 1994). These main components of IC which is vital for business survival and success are control environment, risk assessment, control activities, information and communication and monitoring activities. These components of IC are also parallel to those in international auditing standards-ISAs (IFAC, 2020). In an effective ICS, the following five components work to support the achievement of an entity’s mission, strategies and related business objectives: (COSO, 2013).

This model has been adopted as the generally accepted framework for IC and is widely recognized as the definitive standard against which organizations measure the effectiveness of their ICs (Protiviti, 2020). The COSO model defines IC as “a process effected by an entity’s BoDs, management and other personnel designed to provide reasonable assurance of the achievement of objectives in the following categories:

- Operational Effectiveness and Efficiency
- Financial Reporting Reliability
- Applicable Laws and Regulations Compliance

COSO provides a road map to building a fundamental foundation of IC to ensure that the risks an organization takes are monitored and mitigated through sound business decisions. It is a flexible, reliable, and cost-effective approach to the design and evaluation of ICs for organizations looking to achieve operational, compliance, and reporting objectives. COSO was updated in 2013. The 2013 Framework can be applied regardless of organization size or type: public companies, privately held companies, not-for-profit entities, and governmental entities (COSO, 2013).

Table 1: Five Fundamental Components and Principles of COSO-Based Integrated IC Framework

| 5 Fundamental Components | Fundamental Principles |
|--------------------------|------------------------|
| Control environment      | • Demonstrates commitment to integrity and ethical values  
                           | • Exercises oversight responsibility  
                           | • Establishes structure, authority, and responsibility  
                           | • Demonstrates commitment to competence  
                           | • Enforces accountability. |
| Risk assessment          | • Specifies suitable objectives  
                           | • Identifies and analyzes risk  
                           | • Assesses fraud risk  
                           | • Identifies and analyzes significant change |
| Control activities       | • Selects and develops control activities  
                           | • Selects and develops general controls over technology  
                           | • Deploys control activities through policies and procedures |
| Information and communication | • Uses relevant information  
                               | • Communicates internally  
                               | • Communicates externally |
| Monitoring activities    | • Conducts ongoing and/or separate evaluations  
                           | • Evaluates and communicates deficiencies |

Source: COSO (2013)
Control Environment (CE): The control environment is the basic element of IC, the success or failure of IC depends on the control environment in which the IC process takes place (Doymangöl, 2001). The control environment dimensions include ethical values, management philosophy, board oversight, authorities and responsibilities, human resources policies and practices, commitment of management to expertise, the structure of the organization, and the transfer of authorities and responsibilities (COSO, 2013). In this respect, the control environment is also defined as the way the institution operates. Strong control environment increases the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities and managerial success; mistakes and cheats and contributes to the accuracy of corporate information and corporate transparency.

Risk assessment: It is the process of identifying important internal and external risks that prevent the realization of corporate goals, analysis of these risks and their management. The IC process should be carried out with a risk-oriented approach (Saltık, 2007). The prerequisite of risk assessment is that the goals and objectives of the institution are clearly, clearly and consistently (COSO, 2013).

If the goals and objectives of the institution are determined, possible risks that will prevent the achievement of these goals and objectives can be determined and managed.

Control Activities: Control activities are the policies and procedures that will help the organization to fulfill the orders and instructions of the management along with the risk management activities COSO (2013). Control activities are policies and procedures put in place to deal with the risks to achieve the goals of the organization and to achieve the goals of the organization. Control activities should be extended to all processes and activities of the organization.

Information and Communication: Information is needed at all levels of an organization to establish an effective ICS and achieve the goals of the organization. In order for employees to fulfill their responsibilities, information on IC must be recorded, classified and announced to the relevant parties immediately. The plans, control area, risks, control activities and performance of the organization should be announced in certain ways and periods and a proper communication should be established between senior managers and employees (COSO, 2013). Communication, beyond financial reporting, is about a clear understanding of IC policies and procedures, and how individuals become accustomed to and responsibilities regarding those policies and procedures. Communication can be written or verbal, depending on the size of the institution.

Monitoring: It is the continuous monitoring and evaluation of the ICS (Yılancı, 2003). Surveillance is one of the most important components in the COSO model. Continuous improvement can only be achieved by renewing the monitoring, evaluation and IC process (Güner, 2009). Surveillance is the process that consists of evaluating the quality of the IC activity at certain time intervals, the design and operation of the controls and the measures to be taken (COSO, 2013). The monitoring of the ICS can be done by different groups. The IC unit itself, the directors of the institution, the internal audit unit and the independent auditor can evaluate the ICS. At this stage, it is important to eliminate the deficiencies that arise as a result of the evaluation and to implement the suggestions for the continuous improvement of the ICS.

Empirical Review

Some instances of the applied research result related IC, ICS and its effectiveness/impact in the international literature can be exemplify this subject. In the study by Çevik & Ağmaz (2019), compliance action plans of metropolitan municipalities to public IC standards were analyzed in Turkey. He researched the general compliance status of the ICSs of metropolitan municipalities with the public IC standards. It has been revealed that the compliance of the ICSs of the metropolitan municipalities with the public IC standards is not at the desired level, and especially the compliance levels with the elements of risk assessment and control activities that form the basis of the ICS are quite low. In Ağmaz’s (2017) study, the ICS was addressed as a concept; the importance, purpose and elements of an ICS as well as the ICS of the municipalities were examined; and the efficiency of the ICSs of the municipalities in Turkey was analysed on the basis of the findings of the external audit general evaluation report of the Turkish Court of Accounts. The study revealed the importance of an effective ICS for municipalities and that effective ICS contributes the elimination of the deficiencies detected in audits.

Yetiş (2017) aimed to evaluate the effectiveness of the ICS in hotel businesses and to investigate whether the elements of the ICS have an impact on the business performance. The questionnaire form prepared was applied to the managers of 4-star and 5-star hotel enterprises with tourism management certificate, and 55 people consisting of accounting or finance department managers and employees in the Central Anatolia Region. As a result of the research, it was found that control activities and monitoring, which are among the elements of the ICS, have an effect on the business performance; However, it has been determined that the control environment, risk assessment, information and communication elements have no effect on the business performance. In the study, it was also determined that the efficiency and operating performance of the ICS in hotel businesses do not differ according to the class (4-star and 5-star) and status (independent, national chain and international chain) of the hotel enterprises. Gezegen (2015) researched the role of municipal IC practices in achieving institutional goals as a management model. The research has revealed that IC practices have a positive effect on achieving corporate goals. The studies by Collins (2014), Mbilla et al. (2020), Mavand (2008), Chebungwe and Kwasira (2014), and Widyaningsih (2014) shown that ICS and IC activities have positive influence on firm performance.

Similarly, Çınar (2019) aimed to examine the factors affecting the efficiency of the public ICS on the employees of state universities. Purpose of Internal Auditors working in the direction of the state universities in Turkey and Head of the Department of Strategy...
Development for employee survey was administered to 176 people. It has been concluded that the support of senior management to the public ICS, the competence of public employees and the use of information technologies in the public ICS positively affect the effectiveness of the public ICS. The study by Aksoy & Mohammed (2020) revealed that there is a linear correlation between the effectiveness of ICS and financial and non-financial performance in COSO-based Ghana banks. Karagiorgos et al., (2010) found that a well-organized IC plays great role in the survival and success of business and internal audit effectiveness. Muhunyo & Jagongo (2018) conducted their research to determine the effect of ICSs on financial performance in higher education institutions in Nairobi City County. In the research, they conducted a survey on 96 employees working in different departments of Higher Education Public Institutions in Nairobi City County, Kenya. As a result of the research, information and communication which is a part of the control environment, risk assessment, control activities and ICS; They conclude that Higher Education Institutions in Nairobi City have a significant impact on their financial performance. They found that the components of the ICS explained 99.1% of the changes in the financial performance of the institutions.

In Al-Hanini’s study (2015), found the existence of the reliability of the IC methods on the computerized information systems in Jordanian banks. In his research, Korga (2017) aimed to reveal the role and importance of the control environment, risk assessment, control activities, information and communication, surveillance components determined by COSO in order to evaluate the effectiveness of the ICS of banks and to establish an effective ICS on the risk management process. Within the scope of the study, a questionnaire was applied to 110 people working in banks operating in Kirikkale. As a result of the research, it was determined that there is a positive and significant relationship between IC components and the risk management process. In addition, it has been concluded that the components that make up the ICS have a statistically significant and positive effect on the risk management process. Çağlı (2019) researched the effect of ICS on institutionalization in state universities. The study was carried out for internal audit units within state universities. Questionnaires consisting of scales on institutionalization and IC issues were sent by mail to the internal auditors and heads of internal audit units working in the said internal audit units, and 68 usable questionnaires were reached. When the data obtained were analyzed, it was determined that there was a high degree of relationship between the institutionalization level of state universities and the ICS; It has been determined that the ICS also has a significant effect on the level of institutionalization.

Hayali et al.(2012) revealed that IC activities are observed to the international standards among Turkish banks. Olatunji (2009) revealed that ICS is very important in the prevention and detection of frauds in the banking sector. A Study by Saleh &Mohammed (2010) was on the role ICS play in reducing the risks related to auditing. The study revealed that the higher the risk resulting from ICS, the higher the risk concerning audit. Spira and Page (2003) based their studies on the role IC plays in changing internal audit and risk management. Several studies on IC have been related to other variables, such as framework for ethics initiatives (Schneider and Becker, 2010), study process (Verdina and Kasetiene, 2014), financial accountability (Godfrey, 2013; Aramide and Bashir, 2015), the efficiency of the management of funds (Otieno, 2013).

Research and Methodology

Data, Sampling and Questionnaire
The research was designed according to the relational screening model. Relational screening models are the research models aiming to determine the presence and/or level of change between two or more variables and to specify the relationships between the variables (Uredi, 2017). The universe of the research is comprised of the employees of IMM Fire Department's Anatolian Side Fire Service Department in 2020. The surveys were applied online in June 2020 to people determined by convenience sampling method. Primary data was employed in this study and was collected with a questionnaire form which was filled by the workers of IMM fire service units.

The questionnaire was in 3 parts. Part one consisted of the personal information of the participants like sex, age, marital status, educational status, duties, terms of office, disaster awareness, training for disasters and participation in disaster exercises. Part two of the questionnaire was designed to determine the perceptions of the participants about the effectiveness of ICS in the department. A scale consisting of 14 propositions in 5-point Likert type was used based on the five components of the COSO IC Framework. Part three was on "Crisis Management Skills Scale", developed by Aksu & Deveci (2009) and adapted by Özarslan (2020) on municipal employees, was used to determine the crisis management skills levels of the participants. The scale includes 30 propositions in 3 dimensions (Pre-crisis, During crisis and Post-crisis) and 5-point Likert scale type employed. The first 7 questions are about the pre-crisis management skills dimension, 8-14 crisis period management skills dimension and 15-30 post-crisis management skills.

Statements about the ICS and crisis management skills in the questionnaire applied in the research are presented in the table 2 below.
Table 2: Statements in questionnaires applied in the study*

| 1- Crisis Management Skills Scale | 2- Scale on The Effectiveness of the internal control system |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|
| Statements about employees' crisis management skills | COSO- compliant statements about the effectiveness of ICS |
| • The institution can perceive the crisis signals coming from different sources before the crisis occurs | • Adherence to ethical values and the principle of honesty has been achieved throughout the organization |
| • Crisis scenarios are created before the crisis occurs | • Organization management is independent of execution and supervises the ICS and its activities |
| • Problems that may pose a danger to the institution are determined in advance | • Emphasis is placed on competence, competence and specialization within the organization. |
| • The institution does not follow the crises that occur in the environment | • I think that the management philosophy and working style are balanced and appropriate for the ICS of the organization |
| • Any situation that may cause a crisis is carefully studied | • The structure of the organization is in a structure that enables the flow of information related to the work we carry out both vertically and horizontally with other functions |
| • The institution is not sensitive to signs of crisis | • Within the organization, the authorities and responsibilities in line with the targets, reporting relationships and channels have been clearly defined and distributed. |
| • There are employees in the organization who are knowledgeable about the strategies to avoid the negative effects of the crisis | • Human resources procedures within the organization are clearly defined and known to all employees. |
| • A written crisis management plan is prepared to protect against the crisis | • The vision, mission, strategy and basic business objectives of the organization have been clearly and clearly defined by the management and corporately announced to all employees. |
| • A crisis communication plan is prepared within the framework of the crisis management plan | • The organization performs assessments/analyzes to eliminate and manage all the risks that will prevent the achievement of all institutional goals and targets. |
| • There is no emergency action plan to be implemented during the crisis period | • There are mechanisms for managing change within the organization, and it is evaluated how and in what way significant changes and changes in business processes will affect the organization throughout the organization. |
| • The institution leads the crisis management team to receive the necessary training | • While assessing the risks within the organization, the risks of misconduct / fraud / corruption are also considered. |
| • The institution keeps all employees informed of the crisis management plan | • Employees know what to do when these risks occur. |
| • Employees are informed about the crisis experienced | • The policies, targets and implementation procedures regarding control activities throughout the organization and in all business, processes are clearly established and effectively implemented. |
| • There are no trainings on crisis management that will cover all employees | • Quality information is obtained and used by the authorities related to the activities of the organization, and the reports within this scope contain sufficient information. Necessary internal and external communication is provided |
| • Cooperation is provided between the employees of the institution in the crisis management process | • Continuous monitoring and assessments are made regarding the existence and functioning of IC elements throughout the organization and in business processes. Corrective and improving measures are taken. |
| • Employees are enabled to participate in the decision-making process | | |
| • Obstacles preventing efficient working in the crisis management process are removed | | |
| • The goals and objectives of the institution are constantly reviewed | | |
| • The institution makes a multi-faceted assessment of the crisis process | | |
| • There is no situation analysis in the institution after the crisis | | |
| • New targets are set in the institution after the crisis | | |
| • The institution evaluates the crisis management realized and determines the deficiencies | | |
| • The institution is carrying out a restructuring work after the crisis | | |
| • The vision of the institution is being developed after the crisis | | |
| • The institution sees its strengths and weaknesses after the crisis | | |
| • Effective methods are being developed to combat the crisis | | |
| • The crises experienced are turned into opportunities and made useful for the institution | | |
| • It is not possible to train the crisis management team in accordance with new developments | | |
| • New strategies and tactics are determined to deal with the possible crisis | | |
| • Employees are given the opportunity to develop and use new skills | | |

*The table was formed by combining the statements of the Likert-based questionnaires applied by researchers

Data analysis

Percentage and frequency analyses were used to determine the descriptive characteristics of the employees participating in the study. Arithmetic mean and standard deviation statistics were used to determine the participants' perceptions of the effectiveness of the ICS and their crisis management skills. In the evaluation of the data obtained from the scales, 1.00-1.80 is very low, 1.81-2.60 is low, 2.61-3.40 is medium, 3.41-4.20 is high and 4.21 5.00 is evaluated as very high level.

The relationship between the effectiveness of the ICS in the fire brigade and the perceptions of the participants on crisis management skills. Correlation analysis examined the effects of the functioning of the ICS on crisis management skills using multiple regression analysis.

T-Test, One-Way Anova Test and Scheffe analyses were used to examine the differentiation of the perceptions of the ICS and the crisis management skill of the organization according to the descriptive characteristics of the participants. In the difference tests, since all the participants are male, the gender variable, the distribution of the majority according to their duties and the "Do you have any information about which institutions the fire brigade will work with in response to disasters / emergencies?" These questions
were not included in the analysis since all but 4 of the participants answered yes to the question. Analyses of the data was carried out using SPSS 22.0 for Windows program at 0.05 significant level.

Pre-Test

Table 3: Reliability test

| Variables                        | Cronbach’s Alpha |
|----------------------------------|------------------|
| Pre-Crisis Management Skills     | 0.928            |
| During Crisis Management Skills  | 0.933            |
| Post-Crisis Management Skills    | 0.947            |
| Total average                    | 0.936            |

Source: Survey data by researchers.

Reliability estimates both consistency and stability of data utilizing using Cronbach’s Alpha (Nantambulele, 2018). Cronbach's Alpha coefficient is the broadly utilized device in testing the reliability of data. Cronbach's Alpha is a record of reliability connected with the variety represented by the correct score of the constructs being referred to (Santos, 1999).

The coefficient of Cronbach’s Alpha varies for 0 to 1, the closer to 1, the reliable it is (Sekaran & Bougie, 2016). While Nunnaly (1978) and Pallant (2010) are of the view that a 0.7 coefficient is recommended for a reliable scale analysis, 0.6 and above according to Secer (2013) is accepted in the literature. The average Cronbach’s Alpha ascertained was 0.968 meaning the data was highly reliable, stable and consistent. See table 3 for details of the Cronbach’s Alpha of the variables.

Findings

RQ1: Finding the Relationships that exist between Internal Control’s effectiveness and Crisis Management Skills.

Table 4: Correlation Analysis between Internal Control’s effectiveness and Crisis Management Skills

| Variables                        | Effectiveness of the Internal Control System |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|
| Pre-Crisis Management Skills     | r 0.743 p 0.000                               |
| During Crisis Management Skills  | r 0.807 p 0.000                               |
| Post-Crisis Management Skills    | r 0.843 p 0.000                               |

Source: Survey data by researchers.

Table 4 displays the results of the correlation analysis done to ascertain the relationship that exist between ICS and Crisis Management Skills. It is seen that there are positive and significant relationships between ICS and pre-crisis management skills (r = 0.743), ICS & During Crisis Management Skills (r= 0.807), and ICS & Post Crisis Management skills (r= 0.843).

For RQs 2a, 2b and 2c, regression analysis was run as can be seen from related tables.

Table 5: The Effect of Internal Control System on Pre-Crisis Management Skills

| The dependent variable | Independent variable | β     | t     | p     | F     | Model (p) | R ²   |
|------------------------|----------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-----------|-------|
| Pre-Crisis Management  | Constant             | 1.468 | 10.904| 0.000 | 305.036| 0.000     | 0.750 |
| Skills                 | Effectiveness of the Internal Control System | 0.656 | 17.465| 0.000 |

Source: Survey data by researchers.

According to Table 5, regression analysis performed to determine the cause-effect relationship between the ICS and pre-crisis management skills was found to be significant (F = 305.036; p = 0.000 <0.05). The total change in pre-crisis management skills level is explained by the effectiveness of the ICS by 55% (R ² = 0.750). IC increases pre-crisis management skills (β = 0.656).
Table 6: The Effect of Internal Control System on Management Skills in Crisis Period

| The dependent variable | Independent variable          | β    | t     | p    | F     | Model (p) | R²   |
|------------------------|-------------------------------|------|-------|------|-------|-----------|------|
| During-Crisis Management Skills | Constant                   | 1.101| 9.327 | 0.000| 464.638| 0.000     | 0.751|
|                         | Effectiveness of the Internal Control System | 0.711| 21.555| 0.000|       |           |      |

Source: Survey data by researchers

Regression analysis performed to determine the cause-effect relationship between the effectiveness of the ICS and crisis management skills was found to be significant (F = 464,638; p = 0.000 <0.05). The total change in the level of management skills during the crisis period is explained by the effectiveness of the ICS at a rate of 65.1% (R² = 0.751). According to Table 6, The effectiveness of the ICS increases the level of management skills during the crisis period (β = 0.71).

Table 7: The Effect of the Efficiency of Internal Control System on Post-Crisis Management Skills

| The dependent variable | Independent variable          | β    | t     | p    | F     | Model (p) | R²   |
|------------------------|-------------------------------|------|-------|------|-------|-----------|------|
| Post-Crisis Management Skills | Constant                  | 0.822| 6.969 | 0.000| 609.135| 0.000     | 0.759|
|                         | Effectiveness of the Internal Control System | 0.813| 24.681| 0.000|       |           |      |

Source: Survey data by researchers.

Regression analysis performed to determine the cause-effect relationship between the efficiency of the ICS and post-crisis management skills was found to be significant (F = 609.135; p = 0.000 <0.05). The total change in the level of management skills after the crisis is explained by the effectiveness of the ICS at a rate of 70.9% (R² = 0.759). According to Table 7, The effectiveness of the ICS increases the level of management skills after the crisis (β = 0.813).

Findings Regarding the Differentiation of Participants' Perceptions Regarding the Effectiveness of the Internal Control System and Crisis Management Skill Levels According to their Descriptive Characteristics using T-Test and ANOVA.

Table 8: T-Test Differentiation Status of Participants' Internal Control System and Crisis Management Scores According to Their Marital Status

| Group                  | N   | Averages | Std | t    | sd  | p    |
|------------------------|-----|----------|-----|------|-----|------|
| Internal Control System |     |          |     |      |     |      |
| The married            | 230 | 3.433    | 0.956| -0.800| 249 | 0.424|
| Single                 | 21  | 3.606    | 0.879|      |     |      |
| Pre-Crisis Management Skills |     |          |     |      |     |      |
| The married            | 231 | 3.715    | 0.835| -1.389| 250 | 0.166|
| Single                 | 21  | 3.976    | 0.708|      |     |      |
| Crisis Management Skills |     |          |     |      |     |      |
| The married            | 231 | 3.537    | 0.834| -0.964| 250 | 0.336|
| Single                 | 21  | 3.719    | 0.757|      |     |      |
| Post-Crisis Management Skills |     |          |     |      |     |      |
| The married            | 231 | 3.618    | 0.914| -0.999| 250 | 0.319|
| Single                 | 21  | 3.824    | 0.756|      |     |      |

Source: Survey data by researchers

T-test was conducted to examine the differentiation of the participants' perceptions of the effectiveness of the ICS and crisis management skill levels according to their marital status as displayed in table 8. The effectiveness of the ICS, pre-crisis management
skills, during crisis management skills and post-crisis management skills scores do not differ significantly according to the marital status variable (p> 0.05).

Table 9: ANOVA Differentiation Status of Participants' Effectiveness of ICS and Crisis Management Skill Scores According to Their Age

| Group                        | N  | Averages | Std  | F     | p     | Difference |
|------------------------------|----|----------|------|-------|-------|------------|
| Effectiveness of the ICS     |    |          |      |       |       |            |
| 26-35                        | 52 | 3,316    | 1,085| 1,333 | 0.266 |            |
| 36-45                        | 162| 3,443    | 0.945|       |       |            |
| 46 and Above                 | 37 | 3,649    | 0.723|       |       |            |
| Pre-Crisis Management Skills |    |          |      |       |       |            |
| 26-35                        | 52 | 3,663    | 0.817| 1.003 | 0.368 |            |
| 36-45                        | 163| 3,722    | 0.853|       |       |            |
| 46 and Above                 | 37 | 3,905    | 0.713|       |       |            |
| Crisis Management Skills     |    |          |      |       |       |            |
| 26-35                        | 52 | 3,404    | 0.864| 1,892 | 0.153 |            |
| 36-45                        | 163| 3,555    | 0.831|       |       |            |
| 46 and Above                 | 37 | 3,749    | 0.732|       |       |            |
| Post-Crisis Management Skills|    |          |      |       |       |            |
| 26-35                        | 52 | 3,415    | 0.955| 2.242 | 0.108 |            |
| 36-45                        | 163| 3,670    | 0.904|       |       |            |
| 46 and Above                 | 37 | 3,792    | 0.780|       |       |            |

Source: Survey data by researchers

As can be seen from table 9, Effectiveness of the ICS before crisis management skills, during crisis management skills and post-crisis management skills and general crisis management scores are not significantly different according to age variable (p> 0.05).

Table 10: ANOVA Differentiation Status of Participants' Effectiveness of Internal Control System and Crisis Management Skill Scores According to their Educational Status

| Group                        | N  | Averages | Std  | F     | p     | Difference |
|------------------------------|----|----------|------|-------|-------|------------|
| Effectiveness of the ICS     |    |          |      |       |       |            |
| 1-High School and Below      | 109| 3,650    | 0.824| 4,838 | 0.009| 1> 3       |
| 2-Associate Degree           | 39 | 3,394    | 1.010|       |       |            |
| 3-License and Above          | 103| 3,253    | 1.012|       |       |            |
| Pre-Crisis Management Skills |    |          |      |       |       |            |
| 1-High School and Below      | 109| 3,806    | 0.832| 1,920 | 0.149|            |
| 2-Associate Degree           | 40 | 3,859    | 0.649|       |       |            |
| 3-License and Above          | 103| 3,617    | 0.873|       |       |            |
| Crisis Management Skills     |    |          |      |       |       |            |
| 1-High School and Below      | 109| 3,715    | 0.788| 4,076 | 0.018| 1> 3       |
| 2-Associate Degree           | 40 | 3,513    | 0.765|       |       |            |
| 3-License and Above          | 103| 3,396    | 0.866|       |       |            |
| Post-Crisis Management Skills|    |          |      |       |       |            |
| 1-High School and Below      | 109| 3,720    | 0.874| 2,024 | 0.134|            |
| 2-Associate Degree           | 40 | 3,755    | 0.725|       |       |            |
| 3-License and Above          | 103| 3,499    | 0.982|       |       |            |

Source: Survey data by researchers

ANOVA test was conducted to examine the differentiation in the efficiency of the ICS and crisis management skills according to the educational background of the participants. As can be seen in table 10, IC scores differ significantly according to the education level.
of the employees \((F = 4.838; \ p = 0.009 < 0.05)\). According to the post-hoc analysis made to determine the reason for the difference; education level of high school and six points of the IC \((3.650 \pm 0.824)\), educational status of the license and the ones above \((3.253 \pm 1.012)\) is higher.

The during crisis management skills scores differ significantly according to the educational status of the employees participating in the study \((F = 4.076; \ p = 0.018 < 0.05)\). According to the post-hoc analysis made to determine the reason for the difference; education level of high school and crisis management skills in six of those points \((3.715 \pm 0.788)\), educational status of the license and the ones above \((3.396 \pm 0.866)\) is higher.

Pre-crisis management skills and post-crisis management skills scores of the employees participating in the study do not differ significantly according to the educational level variable \((p > 0.05)\).

**Table 11: ANOVA - The Effectiveness of the Internal Control System and Crisis Management Skill Scores of Participants Differentiation According to the Term of Duty**

| Group                         | N  | Averages | Std  | F   | p    | Difference |
|-------------------------------|----|----------|------|-----|------|------------|
| **Effectiveness of the Internal Control System** |     |          |      |     |      |            |
| 6-10 Years                    | 17 | 3.342    | 1.169| 1.657| 0.161|            |
| 11-15 Years                   | 155| 3.360    | 1.019|     |      |            |
| 16-20 Years                   | 21 | 3.411    | 0.868|     |      |            |
| 21 Years and More             | 37 | 3.727    | 0.652|     |      |            |
| **Pre-Crisis Management Skills** |     |          |      |     |      |            |
| 5 Years and Below             | 21 | 3.910    | 0.465| 0.866| 0.485|            |
| 6-10 Years                    | 17 | 3.618    | 1.068|     |      |            |
| 11-15 Years                   | 156| 3.688    | 0.866|     |      |            |
| 16-20 Years                   | 21 | 3.719    | 0.861|     |      |            |
| 21 Years and More             | 37 | 3.911    | 0.656|     |      |            |
| **Crisis Management Skills**  |     |          |      |     |      |            |
| 5 Years and Below             | 21 | 3.719    | 0.426| 1.676| 0.156|            |
| 6-10 Years                    | 17 | 3.535    | 0.927|     |      |            |
| 11-15 Years                   | 156| 3.460    | 0.880|     |      |            |
| 16-20 Years                   | 21 | 3.624    | 0.825|     |      |            |
| 21 Years and More             | 37 | 3.814    | 0.672|     |      |            |
| **Post-Crisis Management Skills** |     |          |      |     |      |            |
| 5 Years and Below             | 21 | 3.657    | 0.502| 1.363| 0.247|            |
| 6-10 Years                    | 17 | 3.488    | 0.999|     |      |            |
| 11-15 Years                   | 156| 3.588    | 0.988|     |      |            |
| 16-20 Years                   | 21 | 3.543    | 0.939|     |      |            |
| 21 Years and More             | 37 | 3.943    | 0.534|     |      |            |

**Source:** Survey data by researchers.

The results from Table 11 indicate that, the effectiveness of ICS, pre-crisis management skills, crisis management skills and post-crisis management skills scores do not differ significantly according to the term variable \((p > 0.05)\).

**Table 12: ANOVA Participants of the Internal Control System and Crisis Management Effectiveness of the Skill Points edited by the Scientific Program Participation Status**

| Group                         | N  | Averages | Std  | F   | p    | Difference |
|-------------------------------|----|----------|------|-----|------|------------|
| **Effectiveness of the Internal Control System** |     |          |      |     |      |            |
| Yes                           | 97 | 3.620    | 0.925| 6.438| 0.002| 1 > 3      |
| Sometimes                     | 106| 3.475    | 0.915|     |      |            |
| No                            | 48 | 3.036    | 0.967|     |      |            |
| **Pre-Crisis Management Skills** |     |          |      |     |      |            |
| Yes                           | 98 | 3.809    | 0.868| 2.116| 0.123| 2 > 3      |
| Sometimes                     | 106| 3.768    | 0.756|     |      |            |
| No                            | 48 | 3.520    | 0.870|     |      |            |
| **Crisis Management Skills**  |     |          |      |     |      |            |
| Yes                           | 98 | 3.720    | 0.838| 6.894| 0.001| 1 > 3      |
| Sometimes                     | 106| 3.560    | 0.748|     |      |            |
| No                            | 48 | 3.192    | 0.876|     |      |            |
| **Post-Crisis Management Skills** |     |          |      |     |      |            |
| Yes                           | 98 | 3.815    | 0.888| 6.148| 0.002| 1 > 3      |
| Sometimes                     | 106| 3.635    | 0.816|     |      |            |
| No                            | 48 | 3.269    | 1.016|     |      |            |

The results in table 12 indicate that, IC scores differ significantly according to the variable of participation in scientific programs of the employees \((F = 6.438; \ p = 0.002 < 0.05)\). According to the post-hoc analysis made to determine the reason for the difference; IC
scores of those who participated in organized scientific programs \((3.036 \pm 0.967)\) and sometimes \((3.475 \pm 0.915)\) were higher than those who did not \((3.036 \pm 0.967)\).

Pre-crisis management skills of the employees participating in the study do not differ significantly according to the variable of participation in scientific programs \((p>0.05)\).

Crisis period management skill scores differ significantly according to the variable of participation in scientific programs of the employees participating in the study \((F = 6.894; p = 0.001 <0.05)\). According to the post-hoc analysis made to determine the reason for the difference; Crisis period management skill scores \((3.560 \pm 0.748)\) of those participating in organized scientific programs \((3.720 \pm 0.838)\) and sometimes participating were higher than those who did not \((3.192 \pm 0.876)\). 

Post-crisis management skill scores differ significantly according to the variable of participation in scientific programs of the employees participating in the study \((F = 6.148; p = 0.002 <0.05)\). According to the post-hoc analysis made to determine the reason for the difference; The post-crisis management skill scores of those participating \((3.815 \pm 0.888)\) and sometimes participating in the scientific programs organized \((3.635 \pm 0.816)\) were higher than those who did not \((3.269 \pm 1.016)\). 

**Table 13:** T-Test Differentiation Status of Participants' Effectiveness of ICS and Crisis Management Skills Scores According to their Training in Disaster Psychology / Awareness / Management

| Effectiveness of the Internal Control System | Yes | 150 | 3.571 | 0.945 | 2.542 | 249 | 0.012 |
|------------------------------------------------|-----|-----|--------|-------|-------|-----|-------|
| No                                             | 101 | 3.264 | 0.930  |       |       |     |       |

| Pre-Crisis Management Skills | Yes | 151 | 3.770 | 0.890 | 0.768 | 250 | 0.443 |
|-------------------------------|-----|-----|--------|-------|-------|-----|-------|
| No                            | 101 | 3.688 | 0.724  |       |       |     |       |

| Crisis Management Skills      | Yes | 151 | 3.637 | 0.869 | 1.998 | 250 | 0.047 |
|-------------------------------|-----|-----|--------|-------|-------|-----|-------|
| No                            | 101 | 3.426 | 0.748  |       |       |     |       |

| Post-Crisis Management Skills | Yes | 151 | 3.727 | 0.966 | 1.972 | 250 | 0.050 |
|-------------------------------|-----|-----|--------|-------|-------|-----|-------|
| No                            | 101 | 3.499 | 0.783  |       |       |     |       |

As can be seen in table 13, ICS scores \((\bar{x} = 3.571)\) of employees who received training on disaster psychology / awareness / management were higher than those who did not receive training \((\bar{x} = 3.264)\) \((t(249) = 2.542; p = 0.012 <0.05)\).

Employees disaster psychology / awareness / management-related education of employees of crisis management skills scores \((X = 3.637)\), education for those \((\bar{x} = 3.426)\) were higher \((t(250) = 1.998; p = 0.047 <0.05)\).

Employees disaster psychology / awareness / management-related education of employees post-crisis management skills scores \((X = 3.727)\), training to get those \((\bar{x} = 3.499)\) were higher \((t(250) = 1.972; p = 0.050 <0.05)\).

Pre-crisis management skills and general crisis management scores of employees do not differ significantly according to the variable of educational status related to disaster psychology / awareness / management \((p>0.05)\).

**Conclusions**

The aim of this research is to examine the effects of ICS on crisis management skills in the event of disaster of the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality (IMM) Fire Service Department. 251 people working under the Istanbul Anatolian Side Fire Service Department participated in the study.

First of all, the participants' perceptions of the effectiveness of the ICS in the event of disasters and their perceptions of the organization's crisis management skills were examined. The effectiveness of the ICS was examined on a one-dimensional scale prepared according to COSO components and evaluated over 5-point Likert scale. The average of participants' perceptions about the effectiveness of the ICS was 3.447. Hence, it was concluded that the ICS of the IMM fire service department is highly effective. The crisis management skills of the IMM fire service department in the event of a disaster were discussed in three dimensions: pre-crisis, during crisis and post-crisis. Again, according to the evaluation made out of 5-point Likert scale, the pre-crisis management skill of IMM fire service department in case of disaster has an average value of 3.737, 3.552 and 3.635 for pre-crisis, during crisis and post-crisis respectively. From these values, it is concluded that IMM fire service department has a high level of crisis management skills in case of disaster.

In the study, the relationship between the effectiveness of the IMM's ICS and crisis management skills in the event of a disaster was examined by correlation analysis. As a result of the analysis, it was determined that there are highly positive and significant
relationships between the effectiveness of the ICS and management skills before, during and after the crisis. In other words, it can be said that the decrease or increase in the effectiveness of the ICS causes the crisis management skills to decrease or increase in the same direction.

In the study, the effects of the ICS on crisis management skills were examined using regression analysis. As a result of the analysis, it was determined that the effectiveness of the ICS positively and highly affected the pre-crisis, during crisis and post-crisis management skills, and the effectiveness of the ICS increased the crisis management skills of the institution.

In the study, whether there is a difference in the perceptions of the participants on the effectiveness of the ICS and crisis management skills according to the descriptive characteristics was examined. Among the descriptive variables considered in this regards include age, marital status, tenure of work, training received. It was determined that there was no difference in the perceptions of the participants regarding the effectiveness of the ICS and crisis management skills according to their marital status, age, tenure and participation in in-service training. In other words, the perceptions of the participants who are married or single, at different ages and with different tenures, and those who receive and do not receive in-service training, about the effectiveness of the ICS are similar.

Limitation and Recommendations

The following recommendations have been made in line with the results of the research: This research is limited to the perceptions of 251 employees of IMM Anatolian Side fire service department. More researches can be made conserving the European side IMM fire service department as well as other organizations; Despite ICS of IMM fire service department being effective and the crisis management skills at higher level, necessary practices within the institution should continue to be implemented in order to protect and improve this achievement; Disasters can happen impromptu, so organizations are advised to follow professional publications and encourage their employees to participate in scientific programs for a more effective ICS and crisis management skills.

References

Asgnaz, S. (2017). Türkiye’deki belediyelerin iç kontrol sistemlerinin etkinliğini dış denetim bulgularına göre analizi, Kastamonus Üniversitesi İBF Dergisi, 19(4), 74-92. https://doi.org/10.21180/kubiibf.2017434556

Akar, S. (2013). Doğal afetlerin kamu maliyesine ve makro ekonomiye etkileri: Türkiye değerlendirme. Yönetim ve Ekonomi Araştırmaları Dergisi, (21),185-206. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.11611/JMER197

Aksoy, T., & Mohammed, A. (2020). Assessing bank’s internal control effectiveness: The case of Ghanaian listed banks, International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science (2147-4478), 9(4), 96-206. https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v9i4.743

Aksoy, T. (2005). Küresel etkili muhasebe ve denetim skandallarının nedenleri işığında ICS etkinliğinin dış denetim bulgularına göre analizi, World of Accounting Science, 7(4), 45-79. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3253704

Aksu, M., Deveci, S. (2009). İlköğretim okulu müdürlerinin kriz yönetimi becerileri ve liderlik becerileri üzerine bir araştırma, New World Sciences Academy, 4(2), 448-64. Retrieved 12.04.2020 from https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/nwsaedu/issue/19828/212453

Al-Hanini, E. (2015). Evaluating the Reliability of the Internal Control on the Computerized Accounting Information Systems: An Empirical Study on Banks Operating in Jordan. Research Journal of Finance and Accounting, 6(8), 176-186. Retrieved at 23.03.2020 from https://jiste.org/Journals/index.php/RJFA/article/viewFile/21987/22427

Aramide, S.F. and Bashir, M.H. (2015). The Effectiveness Of Internal Control System And Financial Accountability At Local Government Level In Nigeria. International Journal Of Research In Business Management, 3(8), 1-6, available at http://oajj.net/articles/2015/490-1440162921.pdf

Awe W. O. (2005). The Theory and Practice of Auditing. Akure & Adefeyo Publishing House. Akure, Nigeria

Badara, M.S. (2017). The Relevant of Contingency Theory and Stewardship Theory on the Internal Audit Research. Journal of World Economic Research. 6(2), 17-22.

Basel. (1998). Framework for Internal Control System in Banking Organisations. Basel committee. Federal Reserve Bank, New York.

Chebungwe, N. and Kwasira J. (2014). An Assessment of Internal Control System on Financial Performance in Tertiary Training Institutions in Kenya: A Case Study of AIRDSs. International Journal of Science and Research (IJSR). 3(3), 2319-7064. Paper ID: 020131230, retrieved 28.04.2020 from https://www.ijsr.net/archive/v3i3/MIdwMTMxMjMw.pdf

Collins, O. (2014). Effect of internal control on financial performance of micro-finance institutions in Kisumu central constituency, Kenya. Journal of Scientific Research and Essay, 3, 139-155. Retrieved: 29.04.2020 from file:///C:/Users/Tamer%20AKSOY/Downloads/Effect_of_internal_control_on_financial.pdf

COSO. (2013). Internal Control-Integrated Framework. COSO. USA: AICPA, https://www.coso.org/Documents/ COSO-CROWE-COSO-Internal-Control-Integrated-Framework.pdf (retrieved: 18.03.2020)

COSO. (1994). Internal Control: Integrated framework. New York. United States of America: AICPA.

Çağlı, T. (2019). İç Kontrol Sisteminin Kurumsallaşma Üzerine Etkisi: Devlet Üniversiteleri Üzerine Bir Araştırma. Yüksek Lisans Tezi, Yozgat Bozkır Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yozgat. https://doi.org/10.32951/mufider.752097
Çevik, O. & Ağmaz, S. (2019). Türkiye’deki büyükşehir belediyelerinin iç kontrol sistemlerinin kamu iç kontrol standartlarına uyum durumlarının araştırılması, Mehmet Akif Ersoy Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 11(27), 78-96. https://doi.org/10.20875/makusobed.493346

Çınar, S. (2019). Kamu İç Kontrol Sistemi Etkinliği Analizi: Devlet Üniversiteleri Örneği. Yüksek Lisans Tezi, Gebze Teknik Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Gebze.

Demirbağ, M. (2005), İç Kontrol ve İç Denetim Faaliyetlerinin Kapasımda Meydana Gelen Değişmeler, İstanbul Ticaret Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 4 (7), 167-188. Retrieved: 12.05.2020 from https://ticaret.edu.tr/uploads/kutuphane/dergisi/s7/M00089.pdf

Drazin, R., & Van de Ven, A. H. (1985). Alternative forms of fit in contingency Theory. Administrative Science Quarterly, 30, 514-539

Doyardan, N. (2001). Sermaye Piyasası Aracı Kurumlarda Etkili Bir İç Kontrol Sistemi ve iç Denetim Fonksiyonu, Lebik Yalkın Matbaası, İstanbul

Eilifsen, A., Messier Jr, W. F., Glover, S. M. Prawitt, &Douglas F., (2006). Auditing and Assurance Services.

Fidan, M., & Gülsünler, M.E. (2003). Kurum kimliğinde kriz yönetiminin yeri ve önemi. Selçuk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 10, 465-75. Retrieved: 17.05.2020 from file:///C:/Users/Tamer20AKSOY/Downloads/777-1536-1-SM.pdf

Gezegen, S. (2015). Bir Yönetim Modeli Olarak, İç Kontrol Uygulamalarının Kurumsal Hedef ve Amaçlara Ulaşmadaki Rolü (Sivas Belediyesi Örneği). Unpublished MBA thesis, Cumhuriyet University SBE.

Godfrey, J. (2013). Internal Control Environment and Financial Accountability in Mbale District Local Government. Makerere University Business School

Güner, M. F. (2009). Kamu idarelerinin etkin yönetiminde iç kontrol uygulamalarının rolü. Maliye Dergisi, 157, 183-195.

Hayali, A., Dinç, Y., Sarlı, S., Dizman, A.S., Gündoğdu, A. (2012). Importance of Internal Control System in Banking Sector: Evidence from Turkey. (PhD Thesis. M.Ü., Turkey).

IFAC. (2012). Final Pronouncement: Evaluating and Improving Internal Control in Organizations, ISA-315

Jokipii, A. (2009). Determinants and consequences of internal control in firm: A contingency theory-based analysis. Journal of Management and Government, 14(2), 115-144.

Kadıoğlu, M. (2013). Afet Yönetimi Beklenmemeyeni Beklemek En Kötüsünü Yönetmek. İstanbul: T.C. Marmara Belediyeler Birliği Yayınları.

Kalogiorgos, T., Drogalas, G., Dimou, A. (2010). Effectiveness of Internal Control System in the Greek Bank Sector. The South european Review of Business Finance & Accounting. 6 (2).1-11. Retrieved: 03.04.2020 from https://repository.ihu.edu.gr/xmlui/handle/11544/29490

Korga, S. (2017). Risk Yönetiminde İç Kontrol Sisteminin Rolü: Bankacılık Sektöründe Bir Uygulama. MA Thesis, Kırıkkale Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Kırıkkale.

Lang, K. A. (2007). Cognition, agency theory, and organizational failure: A Saskatchewan Wheat Pool case study (Doctoral dissertation, University of Saskatchewan).

Mawand, S.P. (2008). Effects Of Internal Control Systems On Financial Performance In An Institution Of Higher Learning In Uganda. Uganda Martyrs University.Dissertation

Mayo and BPP. (1988). A Study Test on Auditing and Investigation. Oxford University Press, Oxford.

Mbilla, S., Nyeadi, J.D., Gbegble, M.K., Ayimpoya, R.N. (2020). Assessing the Impact of Monitoring, Information and Communication on Banks Performance in Ghana. Asian Journal of Economics, Business and Accounting, 58-71.

Mohammed, A. (2020). The evaluation of effectiveness of internal control system and its impacts on the financial and non-financial performance of banks using COSO internal control framework: the case of Ghanaian banks. MA unpublished thesis, Ibn Haldun University, Istanbul, Turkey

Muhunyo, B. Mugi., A. O. Jagongo (2018). Effect of internal control systems on financial performance of public institutions of higher learning in nairobi city county, Kenya. Academic Journal of Human Resource and Business Administration, 3 (2), 1-16. Retrieved:08.05.2020 from https://iajournals.org/articles/iajhrba_v3_i2_273_287.pdf

Nantembelele, F. A., & Gopal, S. (2018). Assessing the Challenges to E-Commerce Adoption in Tanzania. Global Business and .Organizational Excellence, 37(3), 43-50. https://doi.org/10.1002/joe.21851

Nunnally, J. (1978). Psychometric Theory. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Olatunji, O. C. (2009). Impact of Internal Control System in Banking Sector in Nigeria. Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences, 6(4), 181-189. https://doi.org/10.1002/joe.21851

Otiowo, S. (2013). Effectiveness of Internal Control Procedures on Management Efficiency of Free Primary Education Funds: A case of Public Primary schools in Kisi central District, Kenya. Journal of Sociology and Social Work. 1(1), 22-41

Özarslan, C. (2019). Kamu Kurumlarının Kriz Yönetimi Becerileri: Samsun Büyükshehir Belediyesi Çalışanlarına Yönelik Bir Araştırmca. Yüksek Lisans Tezi, Gümüşhane University SBE, Gümüşhane.
Pallant, J. (2010). SPSS Survival Manual: A Step-By-Step Guide to Data Analysis Using SPSS. 4th Edition, McGraw Hill, New York.

Payne, J. L. & Jensen, K. L. (2003). Management Trade-Offs of Internal Control and External Auditor Expertise. Auditing: A Journal of practice & theory, 22(2), 99-119. https://doi.org/10.2308/aud.2003.22.2.99

Pratt, J. W., & Zeckhauser, R. J. (1985). Principals and agents: An overview. Principals and agents: The structure of business, 1, 12-15.

Protiviti. (2020). What are the five components of the COSO framework https://info.knowledgeleader.com/bid/161685/what-are-the-five-components-of-the-coso-framework (retrieved: 13.05.2020).

Saltık, N. (2007). İç kontrol standartları. Bütçe Dünyası Dergisi, 2 (26),58-69. Retrieved: 08.04.2020 from https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/aud/issue/36606/416342

Saleh, K. M. & Mohammed, A. (2010). Internal Control and Its Role in Reducing the Risk of Auditing in the Sudanese Banking Sector from the Perspective of Auditors. (Doctoral dissertation, Sudan University of Science and Technology).

Santos, J. R. A. (1999). Cronbach’s Alpha: A Tool for Assessing the Reliability of Scales. Journal of Extension, 37(2), 1-5. Retrieved:23.03.2020 from https://www.joe.org/joe/1999april/tt3.php

Schneider, K.N. and Becker, LL. (2011). Using the COSO model of Internal Control as a Framework for Ethics initiatives in business schools, Journal of Academic&Business Ethics; 4,1 retrieved: 11.02.2020 from http://www.aabri.com/manuscripts/10725.pdf

Seçer, İ. (2013). SPSS ve LISREL ile pratik veri analizi. 3rd edition. Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.

Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R. (2016). Research Methods for Business: A Skill Building Approach. John Wiley & Sons.

SOX (2002). Sarbanes-Oxley Act 2002, https://www.soxlaw.com/ (retrieved:21.03.2020)

Spira, L. F., & Page, M. (2003). Risk Management: The Reinvention of Internal Control and the Changing Role of Internal Audit. Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal. https://doi.org/10.1108/09513570310492335

Şahin, C., & Sipahioglu, Ş. (2009). Doğal afetler ve Türkiye. Ankara: Gündüz Eğitim ve Yayıncılık.

Uredi, L. (2017). Investigating the Relationship between Job Satisfaction Levels of the Teachers in Educational Institutions and Their Attitudes towards Teaching Profession, Journal of Education and Practice, 8(12),175-182. Retrieved:19.03.2020 from https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1140644.pdf

Verdina, G.& Kasetiene, N. (2010). The Role of The Internal Control in The Study Process. Leidykla.vgtu.lt/conference.

Widyaningsih, A. (2015). The Influence of Internal Control System on the Financial Accountability of Elementary Schools in Bandung, Indonesia. Research Journal of Finance and Accounting. 6(24), 89-96. Retrieved:18.05.2020 https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Aristanti_Widyaningsih/publication/290264043_The_Influence_of_Internal_Control_System_on_the_Financial_Accountability_of_Elementary_Schools_in_Bandung_Indonesia/links/5695d58308ae820ff074e64d.pdf

Yetiş, Z. (2017). İç Kontrol Sisteminin İşletme Performansı Üzerindeki Etkisi: Otel İşletmeleri Örneği, (unpublished MA thesis), Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Konya. Retrieved:11.05.2020 from https://acikerisim.erbakan.edu.tr/xmlui/bitstream/handle/20.500.12452/3462/10139765.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

Yılancı, M. (2006). İç denetim: Türkiye’nin 500 büyük sanayi işletme üzerine bir araştırma. (2. baskı). Eskisehir: Nobel Yayıncı Dağıtım.