In vitro studies on the management of whitefly with entomopathogenic fungi

Shah Nivedita, Das SB and Balpande S

DOI: https://doi.org/10.22271/chemi.2020.v8.i3u.9412

Abstract

Three entomopathogenic fungi (EPF) viz., Beauveria bassiana, Lecanicillium (=Verticillium lecanii), and Metarhizium anisopliae at three spore concentration (10^6, 10^8 and 10^12 spores/ml) were evaluated for their efficacy against third instar nymphal stage of Bemisia tabaci on soybean cultivar JS 335. The highest nymphal mortality (70.00%) was recorded in EPF L. lecanii, followed by B. bassiana (53.33%) and M. anisopliae (43.33%) at 168 hours after spraying with 1x10^6 spores/ml. However, the two lower doses i.e. 1x10^8 and 1x10^9 spores/ml were not as effective as the highest doses even up to 168 spores/ml against B. tabaci third instar nymphs.

Keywords: Bemisia tabaci, Beauveria bassiana, Metarhizium anisopliae, Verticillium lecanii, Soybean

Introduction

Whitefly, *Bemisia tabaci* (Gennadius) (Hemiptera: Aleyrodidae) is one of the most serious, cosmopolitan sucking pest that causes severe yield losses in soybean. It can lead to damage either directly or indirectly (Hoddle 2013) [1]. Direct damage occurs when the stylet of the whitefly pierces the leaves and sucks the liquid that causes chlorosis in plants. While, the indirect damage occurs due to the accumulation of honeydew that catalyzes the growth of sooty mold on the entire surface of the leaf and disrupts the process of photosynthesis (Hilje and Morales, 2008) [2].

Chemical control using synthetic sprays remains the most commonly used method for the management of whitefly populations in soybean (Vieira et al., 2011) [3]. The prophylactic use of insecticides in the soybean does not lead to higher productivity in the field when compared with the technique of integrated pest management (IPM) and biological control (Bueno et al., 2011) [4]. Excessive insecticide applications also have a negative impact on the environment; one of them is impairing the efficiency of all existing biological control agents for soybean (Carro et al., 2010) [5].

There is a need for an effective alternative and an environmentally safe pest management strategy. The use of entomopathogenic fungi is an environmental-friendly, alternative to plant protection chemicals (Balazy 2004) [6]. The success of fungal entomopathogens as a biological control agent depends not only on its high efficacy against insect pests, but also on its low virulence against non-target insects (Thuongrabeab and Tongma 2007) [7]. Keeping this in view, the present investigation was undertaken to evaluate the efficacy of promising fungal pathogen *B. bassiana, L. lecanii* and *M. anisopliae* on soybean cultivar JS 335 under laboratory conditions.

2. Materials and Methods

The in-vitro studies were carried at Biocontrol Research and Production Centre, Department of Entomology, JNKVV, Jabalpur (M.P.) during the year 2017-2018 with three fungus at three spore concentration with Completely Randomized Design (CRD).

2.1 Media preparation

Potato dextrose agar (PDA) is the most commonly used media for the growth of entomopathogenic fungi. For this purpose, 250 g of potato was washed, the skin peeled off and sliced into small pieces. To the sliced potato 500 ml water and 20g agar was added and boiled for 30 minutes in an open vessel.
Collected the potato extract by filtering through a muslin cloth. Added 20g dextrose to the potato extract and mixed thoroughly and made the volume to 1 litre with distilled water. Poured it in 250 ml conical flask, plugged with non-absorbent cotton wool, covered it with a paper sheet, and tied tightly with a rubber band. Sterilized them in an autoclave at 15 lbs pressure at 121°C for 15 minutes agritech.tnau.ac.in [9].

2.2 Maintenance of insect culture
The culture of B. tabaci was multiplied and maintained on the potted plants of soybean variety JS 335. Initially whitefly adults were collected from the field using an aspirator and were released on the soybean plants which were kept inside the screen house. The whiteflies were allowed to develop and multiply on those plants. The second generation of the non-virulent B. tabaci adults were used for the study.

2.3 Sources of entomopathogenic fungi (EPF)
B. bassiana - Isolated from Bombyx mori larvae (JNKVV, Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh)
M. anisopilae - Isolated from Spodoptera litura larvae (JNKVV, Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh)
L. lecanii - Isolated from Bemisia tabaci (JNKVV, Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh)
(JNKVV: Jawaharlal Nehru Krishi Vishwa Vidyalaya, Jabalpur)

2.4 Culturing of Entomopathogenic fungi
Pure mother culture of all the three fungus was maintained on PDA slants at 4°C under refrigerated conditions until further use. Regular maintenance was done for further multiplication at 25±2°C and 70±10 % RH.

2.5 Materials used
The following materials were used to conduct the efficacy studies: stereo zoom binocular microscope, camel hair brush, needle, pipette, filter paper, marking tags, Petri dishes, soybean cultivar JS 335 (susceptible), atomizer, Tween-80 (0.02%), 20 megapixel camera and walk-in BOD chamber, whitefly third instar nymphs and three entomopathogenic fungi.

2.6 Preparation of fungal suspension
Aqueous conidial suspensions (10 ml) were made from conidia harvested from the slants prepared in conical flasks (250 ml) after 14 days of inoculation. Tween-80 (0.02%) was used to disperse the conidia; it was then filtered through a double-layered muslin cloth. The number of conidia per ml was enumerated using the Plate count method (Reddy et al., 2016) [9]. Initially highest required concentration (1x10^12 spore ml^-1) of the fungal suspension was prepared. This filtrate was the stock solution and further lower concentrations (up to 1x10^8 spore ml^-1) were prepared from it by serial dilution technique (Geroh et al., 2015)\(^{[10]}\).

2.7 Bioassay against whitefly third nymphal stage
The virulence test was conducted against third instar nymph of whitefly as per the methodology proposed by (Wraith et al., 1998)\(^{[11]}\). For this purpose 3rd instar nymph was obtained from soybean cultivar (JS 335) grown in plastic pots. Three different entomopathogenic fungi were tested for their efficacy against whitefly nymphs along with a control (untreated check). In control, the nymphs were treated with distilled water + Tween-80 @ 0.02%. Each treatment was replicated thrice. A filter paper was wetted with distilled water and inserted in Petri dishes and infested soybean leaves having at least 10 third instar nymphs of about the same age were placed on it. Soybean petiole was wrapped with cotton swap containing water to keep the leaves fresh. The conidial suspension was sprayed with atomizer on the leaf surface @1ml of the diluted spore suspension of different spore concentrations (1x10^12, 1x10^10, 1x10^8 spores ml^-1). Petri dishes were placed at 25 ± 2°C, 70±10% RH, and 13h light exposure in the walk-in BOD chamber. Observations on mortality of the 3rd instar B. tabaci nymphs were recorded at every 24 hours interval and was continued up to 168 hours i.e. up to the adult emergence stage. The data was statistically analyzed by using Factorial CRD and the corrected mortality was calculated by using Abbott’s formula. (Prasad. 2014)\(^{[12]}\). Also, mortality data were arcsine square-root transformed to meet the assumptions of the ANOVA.

\[ T - \frac{C}{100} - \frac{C}{100} \]

Where
\[ T = \% \text{ mortality in the treatment,} \]
\[ C = \% \text{ mortality in the control} \]

3. Results
The third instar nymphal stage of B. tabaci was highly susceptible to infection by entomopathogenic fungi (EPF). Out of the three EPF viz., B. bassiana, Lecanicillium (=Verticillium) lecanii and M. anisopilae along with three spore concentrations (10^5, 10^10 and 10^12 spores ml^-1), L. lecanii was found to be most virulent at highest spore concentration (10^12 spores /ml). At 24 hours after spraying with 1x10^12 spores/ ml, no mortality was recorded in all the three EPF. At 48 hours after spraying with 1x10^12 spores/ ml among the EPF, L. lecanii recorded the highest mortality (16.67%) this was followed by B. bassiana (6.67%), while no mortality was recorded in M. anisopilae including control. At 72 hours after treatment with 1x10^12 spores/ ml among EPF, L. lecanii was found to be most effective as it recorded the highest nymphal mortality (23.33%), followed by B. bassiana (20.00%). The least effective EPF was M. anisopilae (6.67%) and was significantly superior to control. A similar trend was recorded at 96, 120, 144 and 168 hours after spray. However, the lower doses i.e. 1x10^10 spores/ml and 1x10^8 spores/ml were not so effective as was evident by the nymphal mortality even after 168 hrs of spray (Table:1). Thus L. lecanii was found to be most virulent at a higher dose of 1x10^12 spores /ml and recorded more than 70% nymphal mortality at 168 hours after treatment, followed by B. bassiana. (Table:2)

| Spore concentration (spores/ml) | EPF Efficiency | Control Efficiency |
|-------------------------------|----------------|-----------------|
| 1x10^12 | 1x10^10 | 1x10^8 |
| Bb | Ma | Ll | Bb | Ma | Ll | Bb | Ma | Ll |
| % Mortality | % Mortality | % Mortality | % Mortality | % Mortality | % Mortality | % Mortality | % Mortality | % Mortality |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| (4.05) | (4.05) | (4.05) | (4.05) | (4.05) | (4.05) | (4.05) | (4.05) | (4.05) |

Table 1: Efficacy of Entomopathogenic fungi (EPF) (1x10^12, 1x10^10, 1x10^8 spores ml^-1) on Bemisia tabaci (III instar nymphs) at different intervals after treatment

\(~ 1544 ~\)
The present studies revealed that the third instar nymphal stage of *B. tabaci* was highly susceptible to infection by entomopathogenic fungi. The present findings conform with those of Mascarin et al. (2013) [18], as they also stated that the mortality began after 2 days of exposure with conidia. The fungus *M. anisopilae*, including control did not cause any mortality at this stage. At 72 hours after spray the EPF *L. lecanii* at spore concentration of 1x10^{12} spores/ml was found to be most effective as it recorded the highest nymphal mortality (23.3%). The present findings corroborate the findings of Bouhous and Larous (2012) [19] and Cuthbertson et al. (2005) [20]. They also reported that *L. lecanii* is particularly infectious for nymphal stages. The differences in the mortality in the present studies might be due to the variation in the virulence of the tested

Note: Figures in parentheses are (x+0.5) arcsin transformed values and values outside parentheses are per-cent mortality values

\[ Bb = Beauveria bassiana \]
\[ Ma = Metarhizium anisopilae \]
\[ L. lecanii = Lecanicillium (= Verticillium) lecanii \]

**Table 2:** Effect of Entomopathogenic fungi (EPF) and spore concentration (Sc) on *Bemisia tabaci* (III instar nymphs) at different hours after treatment

| EPF  | Sc1  | Sc2  | Sc3  | Mean         | EPF | Sc  | EPFXSc | EPF | Sc  | EPFXSc |
|------|------|------|------|-------------|-----|-----|--------|-----|-----|--------|
| Bb   | 6.67(13.96) | 3.33(9.01) | 3.33(9.01) | 4.44(10.66) | 0.68 | 0.68 | 2.04   | 2.02 | NS  | NS     |
| Ma   | 0.00(4.05)  | 0.00(4.05)  | 0.00(4.05)  | 0.00(4.05)  |     |     |        | 2.18 | 2.18 | NS     |
| Ll   | 16.67(24.25) | 13.33(21.58) | 6.67(13.96) | 12.22(19.93) |     |     |        | 2.18 | 2.18 | NS     |
| Mean | 7.78(14.09)  | 5.56(11.55)  | 3.33(9.01)  | -            |     |     |        | 2.18 | 2.18 | NS     |
|      | 16.67(24.33) | 12.22(19.17) | 7.78(14.85)  | -            |     |     |        | 2.18 | 2.18 | NS     |

**4. Discussion**

The present studies revealed that the third instar nymphal stage of *B. tabaci* was highly susceptible to infection by entomopathogenic fungi. The present findings confirm the findings of Vincentini et al., (2001) [13] James et al., (2003) [14]; Al-Deghairi (2008) [15] and Malekan et al., (2015) [16]. In the present study, out of the three spore concentration of three entomopathogenic fungi (EPF), *L. lecanii* was found to be most virulent at the highest spore concentration (1x10^{12} spores/ml) against third instar nymphal stage of *B. tabaci*. It confirms the findings of Karthikeyan and Selvanarayanan (2011) [17]. They also found a linear relationship between mortality and dose concentration. At 48 hours after spraying the differences in the nymphal mortality among different EPF were significant. *L. lecanii* recorded highest nymphal mortality (16.67%), followed by *B. bassiana* (6.67%). The present findings confirm with those of Mascarin et al., (2013) [18], as they also stated that the mortality began after 2 days of exposure with conidia. The fungus *M. anisopilae*, including control did not cause any mortality at this stage. At 72 hours after spray the EPF *L. lecanii* at spore concentration of 1x10^{12} spores/ml was found to be most effective as it recorded the highest nymphal mortality (23.3%). The present findings corroborate the findings of Bouhous and Larous (2012) [19] and Cuthbertson et al., (2005) [20]. They also reported that *L. lecanii* is particularly infectious for nymphal stages. The differences in the mortality in the present studies might be due to the variation in the virulence of the tested
entomopathogenic fungi (EPF) strain and also spore concentration. At 96 hours after spray at a spore concentration of 1x10^{12} spores/ml, the differences in the nymphal mortality among different strains were significant. Among the EPF, L. lecanii was found to be most effective as it recorded highest nymphal mortality (40.00%), followed by B. bassiana (23.33%), but both were statistically at par with each other. The least effective EPF was M. anisopilae (13.33%), but significantly superior to control (3.33%). A similar trend was observed at 120, 144 and 168 hrs after spray at 1x10^{12} spores/ml but with increased nymphal mortality i.e. highest (70.00%) recorded in EPF L. lecanii, followed by B. bassiana (53.33%) and lowest in M. anisopilae (43.33%), respectively. Mortality recorded in control was 10%. The present findings confirm the findings of Reyad (2017) [21]. He also reported L. lecanii to be highly toxic at the highest concentration among the three fungi under laboratory conditions.

Further, Al- Alawi et al., (2014) [22] and Zafar et al., (2016) [23] reported B. bassiana as highly effective in the management of whitefly nymphs. This is in accordance with the present findings, where B. bassiana has proved to be an effective fungus next to L. lecanii. At 168 hrs after spray at a spore concentration of 1x10^{8} spores/ml, there was a slight increase in the nymphal mortality, the highest mortality (46.67%) was recorded in isolate L. lecanii, followed by B. bassiana (33.33%) and lowest in M. anisopilae (30%). However mortality recorded in control was 10%. The present findings confirm the findings of Abdel-Raheem and AL- Keridis (2017) [24]. They also reported L. lecanii to be the most effective fungus that registered up to 100% mortality, compared to M. anisopilae and B. bassiana. Ramos et al., (2000) [25], Kuang (2005) [26] and Islam (2009) [27] reported that after 7 days of spray of B. bassiana @1x10^{6} conidia/ml, nymphal mortality ranged from 62 to 71%, 84.88 to 86.81%, and 38.78 to 72.9%, respectively. However, mortalities in the present research contradict their findings, where L. lecanii had shown the highest nymphal mortality of about 70% at the highest spore concentration of 1x10^{12} spore/ml. The differences in the mortality in the present studies might be due to the variations in the virulence of the EPF and spore concentration Quesada et al., (2006) [28]. The findings also indicate that there is a linear relationship between mortality and dose concentration and are in conformity with the findings of Karthikeyan and Selvanarayanan (2011) [17].

4. Conclusion
The study revealed that Lecanicillium (=Verticillium) lecanii is the most poten fungus at a higher dose of 1x10^{12} spores/ml and recorded more than 70% nymphal mortality at 168 hours after treatment, followed by B. bassiana and M. anisopilae. The overall conclusion represents that the three entomopathogenic fungi (EPF) were significantly superior over control. However, EPF Lecanicillium (=Verticillium) lecanii was the most virulent against B. tabaci third instar nymphs and recorded the highest mortality @ 1x10^{12} spores /ml dose.

5.Acknowledgments
This research was supported by Jawaharlal Nehru Krishi Vishwa Vidyalaya, Jabalpur (M.P). The authors would like to thanks all the laboratory attendants and field workers for their constant and timely help during the investigation.

6. References
1. Hoddle M. The biology and management of the Silverleaf whitefly, Bemisia argentifolii Bellows and Perring (Homoptera: Aleyrodidae) on greenhouse-grown ornamentals. 2013. www.biocontrol.ucr.edu/Bemisia.html
2. Hilje L, Morales PJ. Whitefly bioecology and management in Latin America. In: Capinera J (ed). Encyclopedia of Entomology. Springer, New York, 2008, 4250-4260.
3. Vieira SS, Bueno AF, Boff MIC, Bueno ECOF, Hoffman-Cardo CB. Resistance of soybean genotypes to Bemisia tabaci (Genn.) biotype B (Hemiptera: Aleyrodidae). Neotropical Entomology. 2011; 40(1):117-122.
4. Bueno AF, Batistek MJ, Bueno RCOF, Franca-Neto JD, Nishikawa MAN, Filho AL. Effects of integrated pest management, biological control, and prophylactic use of insecticides on the management and sustainability of soybean. Crop Protection. 2011; 30(1):937-945.
5. Carmo EL, Bueno AF, Bueno RCOF. Pesticide selectivity for the insect egg parasitoid Telenomus remus. Bioccontrol. 2010; 55(4):455-464.
6. Balazy S. Significance of protected areas for the preservation of entomopathogenic fungi. Kosmos. 2004; 53(1):5-16.
7. Thungrabeab M, Tongma S. Effect of entomopathogenic fungi, Beauveria bassiana and Metarhizium anisopliae on non- target insects. KMITL Journal of Science and Technology. 2007; 7(1):8-12.
8. agritech.tnau.ac.in
9. Reddy GB, Vijayavani S, Swarnabala G, Reddy KV. Evaluation of locally available substrates for conidial biomass production of B. bassiana MCC0044 employing solid substrate fermentation. Journal of Agriculture and Veterinary Sciences. 2016; 9(7):59-65.
10. Geroch M, Gulati R, Tehri K. Determination of lethal concentration and lethal time of entomopathogen Beauveria bassiana (Balsamo) Vuillemin against Tetanychus urticae Koch. International Journal of Agricultural Sciences. 2015; 7(5):523-528.
11. Wright SP, Carruthers RI, Bradley CA, Jaronski ST, Lacey LA, Wood P et al. Pathogenicity of the entomopathogenic fungi, Paecilomyces spp. and B. bassiana against the Silverleaf whitefly, Bemisia argentifolii. Journal of Invertebrate Pathology. 1998; 71(3):217-26.
12. Prasad TV. Handbook of Entomology. Third edition. New Vishal Publications. New Delhi, 2014, 252 p.
13. Vicentini S, Faria M, de Oliveira MRV. Screening of Beauveria bassiana (Deuteromycotina: Hyphomycetes) isolates against nymphs of Bemisia tabaci biotype B (Hemiptera: Aleyrodidae) with description of a new bioassay method. Neotropical Entomology. 2001; 30(2):97-103.
14. James RR, Buckner JS, Freeman TP. Cuticular lipids and silver leaf whitefly stage affect conidial germination of Beauveria bassiana and Paecilomyces fumosoroseus. Journal of Invertebrate Pathology. 2003; 84(1):67-74.
15. Al-Deghairy MA. Bioassay evaluation of the entomopathogenic fungi, Beauveria bassiana (Balsamo) Vuillemin against eggs and nymphs of Bemisia tabaci Gennadius (Homoptera: Aleyrodidae). Pakistan Journal of Biological Sciences. 2008; 11(12):1551-1560.
16. Malekan N, Hatami B, Rahim E, Akhavan A, Rouollah R. Evaluation of entomopathogenic fungi Beauveria bassiana and Lecanicillium muscarium on different
nymphal stages of greenhouse whitefly *Trialeurodesaporariorum* in greenhouse conditions. Biharean Biologist. 2015; 9(2):108-112.

17. Karthikkeyan A, Selvanarayanan V. *In vitro* efficacy of *Beauveria bassiana* (Bals.) and *Verticillium lecanii* (Zimm.) Viegas against selected insect pests of cotton. Recent Research in Science and Technology. 2011; 3(2):142-143.

18. Mascarin GM, Kobori NN, Quintela ED, Delalibera I. The virulence of entomopathogenic fungi against *Bemisia tabaci* biotype B (Hemiptera: Aleyrodidae) and their conidial production using solid substrate fermentation. Biological Control. 2013; 66(1):209-218.

19. Bouhous M, Larous L. Efficiency of the entomopathogenic fungus *Verticillium lecanii* in the biological control of *Trialeurodesaporariorum* (Homoptera: Aleyrodidae), a greenhouse culture pest. African Journal of Microbiology Research. 2012; 6(10):2435-2442.

20. Cuthbertson Andrew GS, Walters Keith FA, Northing P. The susceptibility of immature stages of *Bemisia tabaci* to the entomopathogenic fungus *Lecanicillium muscarium* on tomato and verbena foliage. Mycopathologia. 2005; 159(1):23-29.

21. Reyad NF. Impact of entomopathogenic fungi on whitefly, *Bemisia tabaci* in tomato crop in Egypt. International Journal of ChemTech Research. 2017; 10(12):372-377.

22. Al-alawi MS, Obiedat M, Abbasi R. Evaluation of *Beauveria bassiana* (Balsamo) Vuillemin isolates against *Bemisia tabaci* Genn. (Homoptera: Aleyrodidae) based on laboratory and field efficacies. Journal of Food, Agriculture & Environment. 2014; 12(2):478-481.

23. Zafar J, Freed S, Khan Basir Ali, Farooq Muzammil. Effectiveness of *Beauveria bassiana* against cotton whitefly, *Bemisia tabaci* (Gennadius) (Aleyrodidae: Homoptera) on different host plants. Pakistan Journal of Zoology. 2016; 48(1):91-99.

24. Abdel-Raheem MA, Al-Keridis LA. Virulence of three entomopathogenic fungi against whitefly, *Bemisia tabaci* (Gennadius) (Hemiptera: Aleyrodidae) in tomato crop. Journal of Entomology. 2017; 14(4):155-159.

25. Ramos EQ, Alves SB, Tanzini MR, Lopes RB. Susceptibility of *Bemisia tabaci* to *Beauveria bassiana* under laboratory condition. Manejo- Integrado de Plagas-y-Agroecologica. 2000; 56(1):65-69.

26. Kuang-ZhuoBin, Lv-LiHua, Feng-Xia, Chen-Huan Yu, Wu-YaJing, He-YuRong. Pathogenicity of *Beauveria bassiana* isolate to cruciferous vegetable insect pests. Chinese Bulletin of Entomology. 2005; 42(6):673-676.

27. Islam T Md, Steven JC, Ren S. Compatibility of the insect pathogenic fungus *Beauveria bassiana* with neem against sweet potato whitefly, *Bemisia tabaci* on eggplant. The Netherlands Entomological Society. 2009; 134(2):28-34.

28. Quesada-Moraga E, Maranhao EAA, Valverda-Garcia P, Santiago. Alvarez C. Selection of *Beauveria bassiana* isolates for control of the whiteflies, *Bemisia tabaci* and *Trialeurodesaporariorum* based on their virulence, thermal requirements and toxicogenic activity. Biological Control. 2006; 36(3):274-287.