Connecting Indigenous and Scientific Ecological Knowledge in the Madidi National Park, Bolivia †

Julia G. de Aledo 1,2,*, Frans Bongers 2, Luis Cayuela 3 and Manuel J. Macía 1,4

1 Departamento de Biología, Área de Botánica, Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, Calle Darwin 2, 28049 Madrid, Spain; manuel.macia@uam.es
2 Forest Ecology and Forest Management Group, Wageningen University, PO Box 47, 6700 AA Wageningen, The Netherlands; frans.bongers@wur.nl
3 Área de Biodiversidad y Conservación, Departamento de Biología y Geología, Universidad Rey Juan Carlos, Calle Tulipán s/n, 28933 Móstoles (Madrid), Spain; luis.cayuela@urjc.es
4 Centro de Investigación en Biodiversidad y Cambio Global (CIBC–UAM), Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, Calle Darwin 2, 28049 Madrid, Spain

* Correspondence: julia.gonzalezdealedo@uam.es
† Presented at the 1st International Electronic Conference on Forests—Forests for a Better Future: Sustainability, Innovation, Interdisciplinarity, 15–30 November 2020; Available online: https://iecf2020.sciforum.net.

Abstract: Across the Amazon basin, indigenous communities harbor a deep understanding of their surrounding ecosystems. However, the extent to which humans depend on ecosystem services across different ethnic groups and spatial scales remains poorly understood. The purpose of this study is to understand the role of ecological processes in determining the human use of plants in the context of the Tacana people in Madidi National Park (Bolivia). Two different hypothesis are tested: (1) the availability of the species shapes their final use and (2) plant biodiversity influences how the forest is used. The data were compiled in a total of 44 plots (0.1 ha), measuring all woody plants with dbh ≥ 2.5 cm, within five different regions (both submontane and lowland tierra-firme forests). Results showed that (1) the species appearance plays a significant role in the selection of plants for its use and (2) the maximal use of a forest depends on intermediate levels of plant diversity. This study highlights the human capacity to adapt to specific environmental conditions based on the availability and/or biodiversity of the plant resources. Therefore, the integration of indigenous perception in conservation strategies is crucial as the ecology of the Amazonian forests is shaped by the long-lasting effects of its ancient and modern inhabitants.

Keywords: ethnobotany; traditional knowledge; plant diversity; Amazonia; tierra firme forests; ecosystem services; sustainability; livelihoods

1. Introduction

The ecology of the Amazonian forests reflects the interaction between the natural environment and the influence of human long-settled populations [1]. Indigenous communities living in these environments have developed numerous strategies to use the natural resources. Understanding the ecological factors that shape the use of plant resources is essential for the management and the conservation of this unique and threatened ecosystem [2].

Ethnobotany aims to understand how humans use plant resources in their natural environments [3]. In this study, we explore how different ecological theories are related to the traditional knowledge of the Tacana people in the Madidi National Park. More specifically, two different hypothesis are tested: (1) the availability of the species might influence the final use by the Tacana people and (2) the plant biodiversity has an effect in the degree of forests’ usefulness.
1.1. Species Availability Influences Plant Use

The ecological apparency hypothesis (EAH) explores the relationship between the importance of the use and the availability of local resources [4], revealing that the plant species that are most used are those most frequently encountered. Although it has been generally proven that resource availability may influence human choice, results do not reach an agreement. The EAH has been demonstrated both in tropical rainforests [2,4–12] and in semi-arid regions [10,13,14]. However, some studies have found opposite results to those expected by the EAH [4,15,16]. Additionally, the relationship between species availability and its utilization varies according to the use category. Whereas fuel [2,10], timber [5], construction [6,17,18], and technology show a positive relationship with plant availability, there is typically no general pattern for the medicinal category [6,19], with studies showing both positive [9,19] and negative relationships with plant availability [20].

Here, the overall objective was to test the support to the EAH based on cultural and ecological importance of tropical tree species in the Madidi National Park. Thus, we asked the following questions: (1.1) how does the usefulness of the species relate to its ecological importance? and (1.2) which use categories support the EAH?

1.2. Biodiversity Shapes Forest Use

The presence of different species in a given forest allows humans to maximize the number of plants they can draw for their livelihoods [21]. Therefore, biodiversity might be the major identifiable ecological variable that explains useful plant diversity [3]—the higher the species diversity of a region is, the greater is the potential of perceived usefulness. However, studies combining ethnobotanical research with biodiversity are scarce, and their results are heterogeneous. Some studies have evidenced the existence of positive correlations between biodiversity and useful species [3,22], whereas others found negative significant correlations [21,23], meaning that the overall use value of transects decreases with increasing plant diversity, which might be indicating that anthropogenic pressure might endanger biodiversity. Then, we ask, how is the use of a forest related with species diversity?

2. Materials and Methods

2.1. Floristic Inventory

The study sites were the Amazonian forests of the Madidi National Park, Bolivia (Figure 1). The study area was placed in both tierra firme lowlands and submontane regions, with a range of elevations from 260 to 1070 m. The inventory was carried out in closed canopy of an old growth mature forest [24].

The field inventory was carried out between 2001–2002, based on temporary plots following a defined protocol [25]. A total of 41 plots of 0.1 ha (50 × 20 m) were established at five different sites in a north-south gradient. The plots were at least 500 m apart to assure floristic independence.

All trees, palms, lianas, and hemiepiphytes with diameter at breast height (DBH) ≥ 2.5 cm were measured and inventoried. All stems were identified in the field when possible or collected for further determination. Vouchers MJM 3876-7051 [24] were kept in the LPB (La Paz Herbario Nacional de Bolivia).
2.2. Ethnobotanical Data Collection

Before initiating in situ data collection, an oral consent was obtained from both the community and the participant. Seven male experienced informants (>40 years old) from the Tacana communities of Macahua, Tumupa sa, and San Buenaventura participated in this study. Semi-structured ethnobotanical interviews about the traditional uses of all the inventoried plant individuals were performed in the plots. The questions were: “Do you know this stem (vernacular name)?” and “Can you tell me the possible uses for it?” [20,26]. The use-reports from interviews were classified into 10 use categories (construction, cultural, environmental, fuel, food, medicine, marketed, tools, toxic, and wild animal food) and their respective subcategories following the Economic Botany Data Collection Standard [27], with recently proposed modifications to adapt it to tropical regions [26].

2.3. Data Analysis

2.3.1. Species Availability Influences Plant Use

Regarding the ecological importance, the importance value index (IVI) was used as an indicator of the species apparency because it includes relative dominance, frequency, and abundance of each species [20]. To identify which are the most important species to the Tacana ethnic group, the use value index (UV) for each species was calculated using the following formula [28]:

\[
UV = \frac{\Sigma U_i}{N},
\]

Ui being the number of uses mentioned by each informant i, while N is the total number of informants interviewed in the locality. Similarly, the UV per use-category (UVc) was

![Figure 1. Location of the study area and the 41 plots placed in both lowland and submontane forest in Madidi National Park, Bolivian Amazonia.](image)
calculated, dividing the informants who cited each given use by the total number of informants [29]. Then, UV and IVI were log-log transformed. The variables were analyzed by means of Spearman rank correlation coefficient for non-parametric data on a log basis.

2.3.2. Biodiversity Shapes Forest Use

In order to explore the relationship between the cultural importance of a forest and its diversity, Fisher’s alpha index was used as a proxy of biodiversity because it relates the total number of woody plants species and the total number of individuals for each plot [30]. To assess forest cultural importance, the use value index of a plot (UVp) was calculated as the summed UV of all individual plants (n) divided by the total number of plant individuals (N) found in the plot [21,31,32]:

\[
UVp = \frac{\Sigma (UVs \times n)}{N},
\]

The relation between Fisher’s alpha index and its UVp value for the different plots was analyzed using generalized linear modeling (GLM) with a Gaussian error distribution (Table 1). We selected the UVp as the response variable and Fisher’s alpha (linear and quadratic terms), the forest types (lowland and submontane forest), and the interaction between the covariant and the factor as the explanatory variables. Models were compared using the Akaike information criterion (AIC) [33]. In order to avoid heterogeneity of the different forest shaping the humpbacked curves, the analysis was carried out for both lowlands and submontane forests.

All the analyses were conducted in the R 3.0.3 software [34].

Table 1. Ranking alternative generalized linear modeling (GLM) by Akaike information criterion (AIC)-based model selection procedure. UVp: use value index of a plot.

| Alternative Models (UVp as a Function of Biodiversity) | AIC   |
|--------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| UVp~ Fisher α                                          | 20.47 |
| UVp~ Fisher α * Forest Type                             | 18.46 |
| UVp~ Fisher α + Forest Type                             | 17.35 |
| UVp~ Fisher α² Forest Type + Fisher α ² Forest Type     | 17.94 |
| UVp~ Fisher α * Forest Type + Fisher α ²               | 15.96 |
| UVp~ Fisher Alpha + Fisher Alpha ² + Forest Type        | 14.36 |

3. Results

3.1. Species Availability Influences Plant Use

A total of 11,955 individuals, 795 species, and 99 families were found in 41 0.1 ha plots of the Amazonian forests of the Madidi National Park (Bolivia). A total of 436 (54.84%) species were reported as useful by the Tacana ethnic group. More than half of the species were used for construction and fuel, while the remaining were used mostly for food, tools, medicines, and cultural activities. The UV and all the UVc were significantly correlated with the IVI (Table 2), and the scatter plot showed this positive correlation between the UV and the IVI (Figure 2). When analyzing per categories, UVc showed a strong linear relation with its IVI for construction and fuel uses (Table 2). On the other hand, the cultural and the medicinal categories had a small Spearman’s coefficient, indicating a weaker relation with the IVI.
Table 2. r$_s$ Spearman correlation values between importance value index (IVI) and use value index (UV), all significant $p < 0.001$; S, number of species in each category.

| Category   | S   | r$_s$ |
|------------|-----|-------|
| Total      | 436 | 0.60  |
| Construction | 240 | 0.48  |
| Fuel       | 194 | 0.44  |
| Tools      | 130 | 0.30  |
| Food       | 138 | 0.28  |
| Medicinal  | 118 | 0.27  |
| Cultural   | 85  | 0.25  |

Figure 2. Scatter plot of the UV against IVI. Each point represents the combination of UV and IVI of each species ($n = 795$).

3.2. Biodiversity Shapes Forest Use

In ethnobotany, the use as a function of the species richness has only been assessed under linear correlations. Here, we alternatively studied this relationship under a nonlinear response model. With increasing diversity, a greater UVp is found until reaching a certain plateau. Then, the pattern reverses, and when increasing Fisher’s alpha, the UVp drops (Figure 3).
4. Discussion

4.1. Species Availability Influences Plant Use

This study shows that the availability of a resource plays a significant role in the human choice of plant species, but the strength of the relationship between environmental and local use varies depending on the category of use, following the general pattern on studies in humid forests [8]. This result can be explained in light of the optimal foraging theory (OFT), that has been frequently applied to humans in order to explain its resource use patterns [2,7]. Tacana people may behave as “generalist” when the resources are chosen for categories of use as construction and fuel. This selection is mainly driven by the apparency and the availability of the species rather than its quality. When regarding wood requirements, plants are more easily substitutable in terms of their physical qualities (e.g., mechanical resistance or durability) and are likely to be shared by many species [2,20]. In addition, more availability means more reliability because it is most likely to be accessed when demanded [35]. On the other hand, Tacana people behave as “specialist” when the resources are destined for cultural or medicinal categories, meaning that other factors than apparency influence the selection of these species. The quality of the resource might outweigh availability, becoming a limiting factor for the human choice. Plants need to accomplish certain intrinsic requirements to be destined to this specific use, holding specific chemical characteristics responsible for their edibility, taste, or medicinal properties [20]. These properties might be much harder to substitute, forcing the use of this specific plant despite its apparency. Therefore, the dynamic balance between availability and quality when selecting species mirrors in humans the ability of performing as generalists or specialists.

3.2. Biodiversity Shapes Forest Use

The present study reports that the maximal use of a forest is dependent on intermediate levels of plant diversity. The usefulness of a forest increases with diversity until reaching an optimum, where high plant variation of structures, chemical compositions, and lifespan [36] enable usefulness to be maximized. At this peak, there is an optimal equilibrium between the quantity and the quality of the resource, i.e., a great number of useful species together with species with a greater use. The presence of different species
enables humans to maximize the number of plants from which they can draw for their livelihoods [14]. Then, usefulness decreases as diversity increases due to the decline of species with high use as a consequence of the development of rare species. Rare species are often less reliable in terms of use due to its reduced likelihood to be accessed when demanded [35].

5. Conclusions

This study highlights the human capacity to adapt to specific environmental conditions based on the availability or biodiversity of the plant resources. The reliance of local people on rainforest has often been cited as one reason for conservation of these forests. We suggest future research to explore the indigenous reality in depth in order to develop consistent conservation strategies that reinforce ethnic identity and reduce environmental damage.

Institutional Review Board Statement: Approval for this study was granted by the Committee for Ethical Research of the UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA DE MADRID (Protocol code CEI-103-1970 PI Manuel J. Macía, date of approval: 19 November 2019).

Informed Consent Statement: Informed consent was obtained from all subjects involved in the study.

Data Availability Statement: The data presented in this study are available on request from the corresponding author. The data are not publicly available due to ethical issues (data subjected to intellectual property rights).

Acknowledgments: Cristina Gil is acknowledged for technical assistance when processing the ethnobotanical data. We thank all the Tacana community (informants, assistants, cookers) who generously shared their time and knowledge of the forest with us. I personally thank the people of droef, my far-away-family and my toda-la-vida-friends for their patient support. We received financial support from Consejería de Educación (Comunidad de Madrid), and Universidad Autónoma de Madrid – Banco Santander for which we are grateful.

References

1. Levis, C.; Costa, F.R.C.; Bongers, F.; Peña-Claros, M.; Tamanaha, E.K.; Figueiredo, F.O.G.; Salomão, R.P.; Castilho, C.V.; Zartman, C.E.; Vasquez, R.; Andrade, A.; et al. Persistent Effects of Pre-Columbian Plant Domestication on Amazonian Forest Composition. *Science* 2017, 355, 925–931.
2. Soldati, G.T.; de Medeiros, P.M.; Duque-Brasil, R.; Coelho, F.M.G.; Albuquerque, U.P. How Do People Select Plants for Use? Matching the Ecological Apparency Hypothesis with Optimal Foraging Theory. *Environ. Dev. Sustain.* 2017, 19, 2143–2161, doi:10.1007/s10668-016-9844-1.
3. Salick, J.; Biun, A.; Martin, G.; Apin, L.; Beaman, R. Whence Useful Plants? A Direct Relationship between Biodiversity and Useful Plants among the Dusun of Mt. Kinabalu. *Biodivers. Conserv.* 1999, 8, 797–818, doi:10.1023/A:1008853413930.
4. de Albuquerque, U.P.; de Lucena, R.F.P. Can Apparency Affect the Use of Plants by Local People in Tropical Forests? *Interciencia* 2005, 30, 506–511.
5. Lawrence, A.; Phillips, O.L.; Ismodes, R.; Lopez, M.; Rose, S.A.M.; Wood, D.; Jose, A. Local Values for Harvested Forest Plants in Madre de Dios, Peru: Towards a More Contextualised Interpretation of Quantitative Ethnobotanical Data. *Biodivers. Conserv.* 2005, 14, 45–79.
6. Phillips, O.; Gentry, A.H. The Useful Plants of Tambopata, Peru: II. Additional Hypothesis Testing in Quantitative Ethnobotany. *Econ. Bot.* 1993, 47, 33–43.
7. Byg, A.; Vormisto, J.; Balslev, H. Using the Useful: Characteristics of Used Palms in South-Eastern Ecuador. *Environ. Dev. Sustain.* 2006, 8, 495–506, doi:10.1007/s10668-006-9051-6.
8. Ribeiro, J.P.O.; Carvalho, T.K.N.; Ribeiro, J.E.S.; Sousa, R.F.; Lima, J.R.F.; Alves, C.A.B.; Jardim., J.G.; Lucena, R.F.P. Can Ecological Apparency Explain the Use of Plant Species in the Semi-Arid Depression of Northeastern Brazil. *Acta Bot. Brasilica* 2014, 28, 476–483.
9. de Lucena, R.F.P.; de Lima Araújo, E.; de Albuquerque, U.P. Does the Local Availability of Woody Caatinga Plants (Northeastern Brazil) Explain Their Use Value? *Econ. Bot.* 2007, 61, 347–361, doi:10.1663/0013-0001(2007)61[347:DLAO]2.0.CO;2.
10. De Lucena, R.F.P.; de Medeiros, P.M.; de Araújo, E.L.; Alves, A.G.C.; de Albuquerque, U.P. The Ecological Apparency Hypothesis and the Importance of Useful Plants in Rural Communities from Northeastern Brazil: An Assessment Based on Use Value. *J. Environ. Manag.* 2012, 96, 106–115, doi:10.1016/j.jenvman.2011.09.001.
11. Torre-Cuadros, M.D.L.A.; Islebe, G.A. Traditional Ecological Knowledge and Use of Vegetation in Southeastern Mexico: A Case Study from Soferino, Quintana Roo. *Biodivers. Conserv.* 2003, 12, 2455–2476, doi:10.1023/A:1025861014392.

12. Galeano, G. Forest Use at the Pacific Coast of Choco, Colombia: A Quantitative Approach. *Econ. Bot.* 2000, 54, 358–376, doi:10.1007/BF02864787.

13. Ayantunde, A.A.; Henriaux, P.; Briejer, M.; Udo, H.; Tabo, R. Uses of Local Plant Species by Agropastoralists in South-Western Niger. *Etnobot. Res. Appl.* 2009, 7, 53–66.

14. Thomas, E.; Vandelbroek, I.; van Damme, P. Valuation of Forests and Plant Species in Indigenous Territory and National Park Isiboro-Sécure, Bolivia. *Econ. Bot.* 2009, 63, 229–241, doi:10.1007/s12231-009-9084-5.

15. Ferraz, J.S.F.; Albuquerque, U.P.D.; Meunier, I.M.J. Valor de Uso e Estrutura Da Vegetação Lenhosa Às Margens Do Riacho Do Navio, Floreska, PE, Brasil. *Acta Bot. Brasilia* 2006, 20, 125–134, doi:10.1590/S0103-33062006000100012.

16. Lucena, R.F.P.D.; Sousa, R.F.D.; Guerra, N.M.; Ribeiro, J.E.D.S.; Leite, A.P.; Abreu, D.B.D.O.; Carvalho, T.K.N.; Trovão, D.M.D.B.M.; Bel, C.A.; Nunes, E.N. The Ecological Apparency Hypothesis and Dry Tropical Forests: An Ethnobotanical Assessment. *Etnoecológica* 2014, 10, 70–86.

17. Lucena, R.F.P.; Leite, A.P.; Pedrosa, K.M.; Lucena, C.M.; Vasconcelos-Neto, C.F.A.; Ribeiro, J.P.O. O Uso de Espécies Vegetais No Vale Do Pianco Pode Ser Explicado Por Sua Disponibilidade Local? Rev. Biol. Farmaçia 2012, Esp, 55–71.

18. Phillips, O.; Gentry, A.H. The Useful Plants of Tambopata, Peru: I. Statistical Hypotheses Tests with a New Quantitative Technique. *Econ. Bot.* 1993, 47, 15–32, doi:10.1007/BF02862203.

19. da Ribeiro, J.E.S.; Carvalho, T.K.N.; de Ribeiro, J.P.O.; Guerra, N.M.; da Silva, N.; Pedrosa, K.M.; Alves, C.A.B.; de Sousa Júnior, S.P.; Souto, J.S.; Nunes, A.T.; et al. Ecological Apparency Hypothesis and Availability of Useful Plants: Testing Different Use Values. *Etnobot. Res. Appl.* 2014, 12, 415–432.

20. Guéize, M.; Luz, A.C.; Paneque-Gálvez, J.; Macia, M.J.; Orta-Martínez, M.; Pino, J.; Reyes-Garcia, V. Are Ecologically Important Tree Species the Most Useful? A Case Study from Indigenous People in the Bolivian Amazon. *Economic Bot.* 2014, 68, 1–15, doi:10.1007/s12231-014-9257-8.

21. Thomas, E.; Vandelbroek, I.; Van Damme, P.; Goetghebeuer, P.; Douterlunge, D.; Sanca, S.; Arrazola, S. The Relation between Accessibility, Diversity and Indigenous Valuation of Vegetation in the Bolivian Andes. *J. Arid Environ.* 2009, 73, 854–861, doi:10.1016/j.jaridenv.2009.03.010.

22. Saqib, Z.; Naseem Malik, R.; Shinwari, M.I.; Shinwari, Z.K. Species Richness, Ethnobotanical Species Richness and Human Settlements along a Himalayan Altitudinal Gradient: Prioritizing Plant Conservation in Faisal Valley, Pakistan. *Pakistan J. Bot.* 2011, 43, 129–133.

23. Anderson, M.J.; Crist, T.O.; Chase, J.M.; Vellend, M.; Inouye, B.D.; Freestone, A.L.; Sanders, N.J.; Cornell, H.V.; Comita, L.S.; Davies, K.F.; et al. Navigating the Multiple Meanings of β Diversity: A Roadmap for the Practicing Ecologist. *Ecol. Lett.* 2011, 14, 19–28, doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2010.01552.x.

24. Macia, M.J. Woody Plants Diversity, Floristic Composition and Land Use History in the Amazonian Rain Forests of Madidi. *Biodivers. Conserv.* 2008, 2671–2690, doi:10.1007/s10531-008-9348-x.

25. Arellano, G.; Cala, V.; Fuentes, A.; Celaya, L.; Jergensen, P.M.; Macia, M.J. A Standard Protocol for Woody Plant Inventories and Soil Characterisation Using Temporary 0.1-Ha Plots in Tropical Forests. *J. Trop. For. Sci.* 2016, 28, 508–516.

26. Macia, M.J.; Armellina, P.J.; Câmara-Leret, R.; Paniagua-Zambrana, N.; Villalba, S.; Balslev, H.; Pardo-de-Santayana, M. Palm Uses in Northwestern South America: A Quantitative Review. *Bot. Rev.* 2011, 77, 462–570, doi:10.1007/s12229-011-9086-8.

27. Cook, F. E. M. *Economic Botany Data Collection Standard. Prepared for the International Working Group on Taxonomic Databases for Plant Sciences (TDWG);* Royal Botanic Gardens (Kew): London, UK, 1995.

28. Rossato, S.C.; De Leitã-O-Filho, H.F.; Begossi, A. Ethnobotany of Caicaras of the Atlantic Forest Coast (Brazil). *Econ. Bot.* 1999, 53, 387–395, doi:10.1007/BF02667116.

29. Tardio, J.; Fardo-de-Santayana, M. Cultural Importance Indices: A Comparative Analysis Based on the Useful Wild Plants of Southern Cantabria (Northern Spain). *Econ. Bot.* 2008, 62, 24–39, doi:10.1007/s12231-007-9004-5.

30. Fisher, R.A.; Corbet, S.A.; Williams, C.B. The Relation between the Number of Species and the Number of Individuals in a Random Sample of an Animal Population. *J. Anim. Ecol.* 1943, 12, 42–58.

31. Phillips, O.; Gentry, A.H.; Wilkin, P.; Gálvez-Durand, B.C. Quantitative Ethnobotany and Amazonian Conservation. *Conserv. Biol.* 1994, 8, 225–248, doi:10.1046/j.1523-1739.1994.08010225.x.

32. Câmara-Leret, R.; Paniagua-Zambrana, N.; Svenning, J.C.; Balslev, H.; Macia, M.J. Geospatial Patterns in Traditional Knowledge Serve in Assessing Intellectual Property Rights and Benefit-Sharing in Northwest South America. *J. Ethnopharmacol.* 2014, 158, 58–65, doi:10.1016/j.jep.2014.10.009.

33. Burnham, K. P.; Anderson, D. R. *Model Selection and Multimodel Inference: A Practical Information-Theoretic Approach*, 2nd ed.; Springer-Verlag New York, NY, USA, 2002.

34. R Development Core Team. *R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing;* R Foundation for Statistical Computing: Vienna, Austria, 2010.

35. Albuquerque, U.P.D. Implications of Ethnobotanical Studies on Bioprospecting Strategies of New Drugs in Semi-Arid Regions. *Open Complement. Med. J.* 2010, 2, 21–23, doi:10.2174/1876391x01002020021.

36. Patrick, R. Biodiversity: Why Is It Important? In *Biodiversity II: Understanding and Protecting our Biological Resources;* Joseph Henry Press: Washington, DC, USA, 1997; pp. 15–24.