Foraging Behavior of Bumble Bees (*Bombus haemorrhoidalis* Smith) and Honey Bees (*Apis mellifera* L.) on Kiwifruit (*Actinidia delicosa* Chev.)

Rohit Kumar Nayak*, Kiran Rana, Harish K. Sharma, Paramveer Singh, Shabnam Thakur and Panma Yankit

Department of Entomology, Dr YSP University of Horticulture and Forestry, Solan, Himachal Pradesh-173 230, India

*Corresponding author

**Abstract**

Foraging behavior of bumble bees and honey bees with respect to foraging activity, foraging rate, foraging speed, loose pollen grains and abundance were studied by utilization of bumble bees (*B. haemorrhoidalis*) and European honey bees for the pollination of kiwifruit cv. Allison under caged condition at kiwifruit orchard of Dr. YS Parmar University of Horticulture & Forestry, Nauni, Solan (HP) during 2017. The results revealed that high activity of bumble bees in cage with one colony and cage with two colonies were recorded during 1600-1800hr whereas activity of honey bees was maximum during 1200-1400hr. Bumble bees visited more number of flowers per minute than honey bees, however, honey bees took more time for completing a single foraging trip and spent significantly more time per flower than bumble bee. Peak abundance of bumble bees was recorded at 1600-1800hr and it was between 1200-1400hr for honey bees. Pollination index showed that *B. haemorrhoidalis* scored higher than *A. mellifera*. *B. haemorrhoidalis* carried more number of loose pollen grains adhered to its body as compared to *A. mellifera*. Number was almost double than that carried by *A. mellifera*. The present study suggests that bumble bee foragers preferred to visit kiwifruit bloom during morning and evening time than mid-day with more activity, foraging rate and foraging speed during these hours of the day while honey bees preferred mid-day hours with more activity, foraging rate and foraging speed to visit kiwifruit bloom.

**Keywords**

Foraging behavior, Bumble bees, Honey bees, Kiwifruit pollination

**Introduction**

Pollination is one of the major factors responsible for good quality and high productivity of any agricultural and horticultural crop. Insect pollinators like bumble bees, honey bees and solitary bees helps in the process of reproduction of many field and fruit crops by transferring pollens from flower to flower. They are in commercial use for successful crop production (McGregor, 1976). Bumble bees are the superstars of pollination also known as teddy bear of insects. Bumble bees are most diverse group of pollinators in temperate regions and only 34 species out of the 250
species found in the tropics (Williams, 1998). Frequent crossover appears to facilitate the carryover of viable pollen from pollen-fertile staminate to pollen-sterile pistillate flowers. Pomeroy and Fisher (2002) suggested that bumble bees exhibited a greater degree of crossover between male and female flowers than honey bees, based on an examination of male and female pollen in corbicular loads. The bumble bees are more efficient and reliable pollinators especially under protected conditions (Mackenzie, 2009). Cobert et al., (1991) observed the temperature and pollinating activity of social bees. They suggested that bumble bees are remarkably hardy and will forage in very cold conditions and even when it is raining. Wearing (1983) conducted an experiment on kiwifruit pollination with increasing bumble bee density. He reported that fruit size increased with increasing number of bumble bees. He also observed that 900 viable pollen grains were found on the stigma after a bumble bee visit. Bumble bees collected seven times more viable pollen and the production was higher when population of the bumble bees increased on the flowers. Abak et al., (2000) conducted an experiment on eggplants grown in unheated plastic houses and observed that bumble bee’s activity on eggplants was increased between 9:00 and 11:00 a.m., the peak activity was observed between 10:00 and 11:00 a.m. then decreases gradually and they stopped between 13:00 and 14:00 p.m. They started foraging again in the afternoon between 15:00 and 18:00 p.m. Spivak (2000) found that bumble bees are more efficient foragers than honey bees on cranberry flowers because they are capable of buzz-pollination. Bumble bees hang on to the flower and buzz it by vibrating their muscles that control flight. Bumble bees are the most efficient pollinators not only for the wild plants, but also for pollination services, used in both outdoor and greenhouse horticulture and orchards (Wolf and Moritz, 2008).

Materials and Methods

The study was carried out in 5 year old kiwifruit orchard of Dr. YS Parmar University of Horticulture & Forestry located at Nauni, Solan (Himachal Pradesh) during 2017. The vines of Allison cultivar were spaced at 4 x 6 m and trained on standard T-bar trellis system. Four cages, each measuring 36 x 8 x 10 ft., made of insect proof nylon were erected over single male and a female vine before flowering (Plate 1). Laboratory reared bumble bee (B. haemorrhoidalis) colonies were utilized for pollination of kiwifruit cv. Allison at the time of 5-10% flowering. In all there were six treatments, one bumble bee colony (10-12 foragers) was placed in middle of first cage, 4-framed A. mellifera colony in second cage, third with two bumble bee colonies (16-18 foragers) and fourth cage was without pollinators (control). Other two treatments were hand pollination and open pollination. In hand-pollination, bearing shoots were bagged with muslin cloth after pollination (Plate 1). Bumble bee colonies were fed with 50% sucrose solution and honey bees with sugar solution. Bumble bees were also fed with fresh pollen collected from honey bee colonies for first two days to make them acclimatized to the field environment. Data on various parameters like abundance of bumble bees and honey bees on kiwi flowers, foraging rate, foraging speed and loose pollen grains were recorded on kiwifruit grown inside cage from early morning (0600hr) till late in the evening (1800hr) at two hour interval consecutively for nine days during three bloom stages of kiwifruit viz. early bloom (20-25%), full bloom (75%) and late bloom (90%). Counts of bees visiting the kiwifruit bloom/5 minutes/m² were made during the activity period i.e. 0600hr to 1800 hr. Foraging speed of bees on the bloom was recorded by observing time spent by the forager on each flower using stop watch. Foraging rate was recorded in term of number
of flowers visited by a forager/minute. Number of loose pollen grains adhering to the body of bees was determined by capturing the forager and killing immediately in 5 ml of 70% alcohol in glass vials. From the rinsate an aliquot of 0.02 ml (replicated three times), was taken on a counting dish and the pollen grains were counted under binocular microscope at 100× magnification. Total number of pollen grains in the whole rinsate was then calculated. Pollination efficiency of bumble bees and honey bees was assessed on the basis of their abundance and foraging behavior, such as foraging rate, foraging speed, number of loose pollen grains sticking to their bodies. The data were analysed statistically using randomized block design.

Results and Discussion

Data on abundance and foraging behaviour of bumble bees (B. haemorrhoidalis) and honey bees (A. mellifera) on kiwifruit have been summarized as follows:

Foraging activity of bumble bees at nest entrance

B. haemorrhoidalis has long working hours as it started foraging activity on kiwifruit inside cage from early morning (0610 hr) till late in the evening (1750 hr). Foraging activity of bumble bees inside kiwifruit cage with one colony and two colonies were recorded to be peaked i.e. 5.07 bumble bees/5min and 8.09 bumble bees/5min, respectively at 1600-1800 day hours while minimum activity was recorded at 1200-1400hr for both bumble bee treatments (Fig. 1). It was observed that the activity of bumble bees peaked at evening and minimum during noon hours under caged conditions. These findings are in conformity with the report of Chauhan (2011) who reported the activity of bumble bees on cucumber plants grown under green house to be maximum (8.24 bumble bees/5min) during 1800-1900hr while the minimum (4.41 bumble bees/5 min) activity at 1200-1300hr, respectively. Yankit (2016) also reported the maximum activity of bumble bees on tomato grown under protected conditions during 1800-1900hr (8.33 bumble bees/5min) while the minimum at 1200-1300hr (4.67 bumble bees/5min). The foraging activity of honey bees inside kiwi cage was recorded highest at 1200-1400hr (19.02 honey bees/5min) while minimum during 0600-0800hr (12.11 honey bees/5min). These results are in line with the observations of Jay and Jay (1983) who observed the activity of honey bees on the kiwifruit flowers only between 0900 and 1400hr, with peak activity recorded at noon.

Foraging rate

Foraging rate of bumble bee on kiwifruit inside cage with one colony and two colonies was peaked at 1000-1200hr (7.60 flowers/min and 7.84 flowers/min), respectively while minimum foraging rate was recorded during same day hour 1200-1400hr (2.11 flowers/min and 2.29 flowers/min), respectively (Fig. 2). These results are in agreement with the observations of Yankit (2016) who found that foraging rate of bumble bees on tomato under polyhouse was maximum (4.74 flowers/min) during morning (1000-1100hr) and minimum (2.37 flowers/min) at noon (1200-1300hr).

These findings also corroborated by the results of Ahmad et al., (2015) who reported that foraging rate of B. terrestris was more in morning time as compared to evening time inside polyhouse on tomato. Honey bees (A. mellifera) visited maximum (3.82 flowers/min) number of flowers during noon (1200-1400hr) and minimum (1.60 flowers/min) during evening (1600-1800hr). Bakshi in 2015 found the foraging rate of honey bees (A. mellifera) in sweet cherry under caged condition to be maximum during
1000-1200hr (7.00 flowers/min) and minimum at 1500-1600hr (5.67 flowers/min).

**Foraging speed**

*B. haemorrhoidalis* was found to spend 7.82 and 8.02 sec per flower (maximum foraging speed) during 0800-1000hr and 3.42 and 3.62 sec/flower during 1200-1400hr (minimum), respectively on kiwifruit inside cage with one colony and two colonies, respectively (Table 1 and 2). Similar results were found by Kashyap (2007) and Yankit (2016) for foraging rate and speed for *B. haemorrhoidalis* on cucumber and tomato, respectively under polyhouse. These findings are also in conformity with Ahmad et al., (2015) who reported that foraging rate of *B. terrestris* was more in morning time as compared to evening time. Foraging speed of honey bees was recorded to be maximum (11.50 sec/flower) during 1000-1200hr and minimum (9.09 sec/flower) during 0600-0800hr. Bakshi (2015) reported average foraging speed of honey bees (*A. mellifera*) on sweet cherry to be maximum at 1000-1100hr (8.9 sec/flower) inside cage.

**Loose pollen grains**

The data recorded on loose pollen grains on the body of bees revealed that more number of average loose pollen grains were adhered to the body of *B. haemorrhoidalis* during full bloom (4429.00±137.95), early bloom (3472.67±68.26) and end bloom (3293.67±57.83) than *A. mellifera* during full bloom (2409.00±162.20), early bloom (1886.00±68.54) and end bloom (1664.67±107.62) (Table 3). It is evident from this study that bumble bees carried more number of loose pollen grains on their body than honey bees during all stages of kiwifruit bloom. These results are in agreement with earlier findings of Chauhan (2011) and Yankit (2016) who found that bumble bees carried more loose pollen grains as compared to *A. mellifera* in cucumber (2179±344; 1730±205) and tomato (1967±107.10) under polyhouse.

**Abundance**

The data on abundance (number /m²/5min) of *B. haemorrhoidalis* recorded at two hour interval consecutively for nine days during three bloom stages of kiwifruit viz. early bloom (20-25%), full bloom (75%) and late bloom (90%) revealed that *B. haemorrhoidalis* on kiwifruit inside cage with one colony and two colonies was highest during full bloom and evening hours (6.43 and 8.60, respectively) and minimum during early bloom and at noon hours (4.41 and 6.64, respectively) (Table 4 and 5). The present results are in conformity with observations of Yankit (2016) who found that maximum (11.12 bumble bees/m²/5min) mean abundance of bumble bees was during full bloom and evening hours and minimum (4.88 bumble bees/m²/5min) during early bloom and at noon hours on tomato under protected conditions. The abundance of honey bees was recorded to be highest (18.93) during full bloom and minimum during early bloom (15.01). These results are in conformity with Mehta (2009) who reported that abundance of honey bees on guava was low in the beginning of flowering period, increased with the increase in flowering and decrease till the cessation of flowering. Bumble bee foragers preferred to visit kiwifruit bloom during morning and evening time than mid-day with more activity, foraging rate and foraging speed during these hours of the day while honey bees preferred mid-day hours with more activity, foraging rate and foraging speed to visit kiwifruit bloom.

**Pollination index**

The data on pollination index showed that *B. haemorrhoidalis* (22.88) scored higher value
than *A. mellifera* (16.98) on kiwifruit bloom (Table 6). No literatures have been found on pollination index in kiwifruit bloom. However, Chauhan (2011) recorded high pollination index for *B. haemorrhoidalis* on cucumber bloom. On the basis of foraging rate, foraging speed, loose pollen grains and relative abundance of pollinators *B. haemorrhoidalis* is rated as more efficient pollinator than *A. mellifera* in the kiwifruit.

**Table.1** Foraging speed of *B. haemorrhoidalis* and *A. mellifera* inside kiwifruit cage during different day hours at kiwi block during April-May 2017

| Pollinators | Time spent by foragers/flower during different day hours (in sec) (Mean) |
|-------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|             | 0600-0800 | 0800-1000 | 1000-1200 | 1200-1400 | 1400-1600 | 1600-1800 |
| Bumble bee (cage with one colony) | 4.67 | 7.82 | 6.31 | 3.42 | 5.36 | 5.56 |
| Honey bee | 9.09 | 10.53 | 11.50 | 10.57 | 9.88 | 9.70 |
| Bumble bee (cage with two colonies) | 4.87 | 8.02 | 6.36 | 3.62 | 5.33 | 5.76 |

**Table.2** Foraging speed of bumble bees and honey bees inside kiwifruit cages during different flowering stages

| Pollinators | Time spent by foragers/flower during different flowering stages (in sec) (Mean) |
|-------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|             | Early bloom | Full bloom | Late bloom |
| Bumble bee (cage with one colony) | 4.89 | 6.50 | 5.18 |
| Honey bee | 9.56 | 11.19 | 9.88 |
| Bumble bee (cage with two colonies) | 5.09 | 6.51 | 5.38 |

**Table.3** Number of loose pollen grains on bodies of *B. haemorrhoidalis* and *A. mellifera* captured inside kiwifruit cages at kiwi block during April-May 2017

| Pollinators | No. of loose pollen grains/forager (Mean±S.E.) |
|-------------|------------------------------------------------|
|             | Early bloom | Full bloom | Late bloom |
| Bumble bee | 3472.67±68.26 | 4429.00±137.95 | 3293.67±57.83 |
| Honey bee | 1886.00±68.54 | 2409.00±162.20 | 1664.67±107.62 |

**Table.4** Abundance of *B. haemorrhoidalis* and *A. mellifera* inside kiwifruit cage during different day hours at kiwi block during April-May 2017

| Pollinators | Number of foragers/m²/5min during different day hours (Mean) |
|-------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|
|             | 0600-0800 | 0800-1000 | 1000-1200 | 1200-1400 | 1400-1600 | 1600-1800 |
| Bumble bee (cage with one colony) | 4.60 | 5.13 | 3.69 | 2.69 | 7.62 | 8.31 |
| Honey bee | 14.49 | 18.51 | 17.49 | 21.56 | 18.40 | 11.44 |
| Bumble bee (cage with two colonies) | 6.18 | 6.78 | 6.93 | 3.51 | 9.71 | 11.44 |
Table.5 Abundance of bumble bees and honey bees inside kiwifruit cages during different flowering stages

| Pollinators                              | Number of foragers/m²/5min during different flowering stages (Mean) |
|------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                          | Early bloom  | Full bloom | Late bloom  |
| Bumble bee (cage with one colony)        | 4.41         | 6.43       | 5.18        |
| Honey bee                                | 15.01        | 18.93      | 17.00       |
| Bumble bee (cage with two colonies)      | 6.64         | 8.60       | 7.03        |

Table.6 Comparative pollination efficiency of *B. haemorrhoidalis* and *A. mellifera* on kiwifruit bloom

| Pollinator       | Rank assigned on the basis of statistically analysis/efficiency | Average score | Relative abundance (bees/m²/5min) | Pollination index |
|------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------|
|                  | Foraging rate | Foraging speed | Loose pollen grains             |                   |                   |
| *B. haemorrhoidalis* | 2            | 2              | 2                                | 11.44             | 22.88 (2)         |
| *A. mellifera*    | 1            | 1              | 1                                | 16.98             | 16.98 (1)         |

Fig.1 Activity of bumble bees and honey bees at nest entrance inside kiwifruit cage

Fig.2 Comparative foraging rate of bumble bees and honey bees on kiwifruit inside cages at kiwi block during April-May 2017
Plate 1 Different treatments of experiment

a) General view of experimental field

b) Cage with one bumble bee colony
c) Cage with two bumble bee colonies

d) Bagging after hand-pollination
e) *B. haemorrhoidalis* foraging on kiwifruit flower
In conclusion, bumble bees as their large size and hairy body allows for the extremely effective collection and deposition of large quantities of pollen than honey bees. The more pollen transferred, the better and effective pollination by bumble bees increases the kiwifruit quality (number of seeds developed, improving fruit size, weight and shape), as well as the quantity (percentage of fruit set, overall number of fruit) and may be the reason of a bountiful crop.

Acknowledgement

The authors are thankful to all India coordinated research project on honey bees and pollinators, Indian Council of Agricultural Research, New Delhi for providing financial assistance.

References

Abak, K., Ozdogan, A. O., Dasgan, H. Y., Derin, K., and Kaftanoglu, O. 2000. Effectiveness of bumble bees as pollinators for eggplants grown in unheated greenhouses. ActaHorticulturae. 514:197-204.

Ahmad, M., Bodlah, I., Mehmood, K., Sheikh, U. A. A., and Aziz, M. A. 2015. Pollination and foraging potential of European bumble bee, Bombus terrestris (Hymenoptera: Apidae) on tomato crop under greenhouse system. Pakistan Journal of Zoology. 47:1279-1285.

Bakshi, N., 2015. Studies on insect pollination of sweet cherry (Prunus avium L.). M.Sc. Thesis, Department of Entomology, Dr YS Parmar University of Horticulture and Forestry, Solan, India.

Chauhan, A., 2011. Refinement of bumble bee rearing technology and its use in cucumber pollination. M.Sc. Thesis, Department of Entomology, Dr. YS Parmar University of Horticulture and Forestry, Nauni, Solan, India.

Corbet, S. A., Williams, I. H., and Osborne, J. L. 1991. Bees and the pollination of crops and wild flowers in the European community. Bee World. 72:47-59.

Jay, D., and Jay, C. 1983. Some observations of honey bees in kiwifruit orchards. New Zealand Beekeeper Number. 180:21-22.

Kashyap, L. 2007. Domiciliation of bumble bees (Bombus spp) and to study resource partitioning with honey bees. M.Sc. Thesis, Department of Entomology, Dr. YS Parmar University of Horticulture and Forestry, Solan, India.

Mackenzie, K. 2009. Pollination practices and the use of bees in the vaccinium crops. ActaHorticulturae. 810:207-213.

McGregor, S. E. 1976. Insect pollination of cultivated crops plant. Agriculture Handbook, Academic Press, London. 496p.

Mehta, N. 2009. Diversity, visitation frequency and pollination ecology of insect pollinators of Psidium guajava L. (Guava). Ph.D. Thesis, Department of Entomology, College Of Basic Sciences & Humanities Ccs Haryana Agricultural University Hisar, India.

Pomeroy, N. and Fisher, R. M. 2002. Pollination of kiwi fruit (Actinidia deliciosa) by bumble bees (Bombus terrestris): Effect of bee density and patterns of flower visitation. New Zealand Journal of Entomology. 25:41-49.

Spivak, M. 2000. What can you do to improve cranberrypollination.http://www.library.wisc.edu/guides/agnic/cranberry/proceedings/2000/whaspi.pdf [8:20 P.M March 18 P.M].

Wearing, C. H. 1983. Expert reviews bee research. Horticultural News. 5:3-5.

Williams, P. H. 1998. An annotated checklist of bumble bees with an analysis of
patterns of description (Hymenoptera: Apidae). Bulletin of the Natural History Museum, Entomology. 67:79-152.

Wolf, S., Moritz, R. F. A. 2008. Foraging distance in Bombus terrestris L (Hymenoptera: Apidae) Apologie. 39:419-427.

Yankit, P. 2016. Studies on bumble bee pollination in tomato (Solanum lycopersicum Mill.) under protected condition. M.Sc. Thesis, Department of Entomology, Dr. YS Parmar University of Horticulture and Forestry, Nauni, Solan, India.

How to cite this article:

Rohit Kumar Nayak, Kiran Rana, Harish K. Sharma, Paramveer Singh, Shabnam Thakur and Panma Yankit. 2019. Foraging Behavior of Bumble Bees (Bombus haemorrhoidalis Smith) and Honey Bees (Apis mellifera L.) on Kiwifruit (Actinidia delicosa Chev.). Int.J.Curr.Microbiol.App.Sci. 8(05): 2043-2051. doi: https://doi.org/10.20546/ijcmas.2019.805.237