Covid-19 as a long multiwave event: implications for responses to safeguard younger generations

Mandeep Dhaliwal and colleagues call for urgent correction of the response to covid-19 to safeguard the development of children and young people

As we enter the third year of the covid-19 pandemic, the negative effects have cut across all of the sustainable development goals (SDGs) and led to severe health and developmental challenges. Children and young people in particular continue to face numerous socioeconomic problems as a result of covid-19, including those related to health, poverty, nutrition, education, employment, orphanhood, violence, abuse, and exploitation. Evidence indicates that integrated solutions to mitigate the many different negative effects of the pandemic on children and young people can be delivered quickly and on a sufficient scale. To deliver solutions that help safeguard younger generations, we need to move beyond a narrow framing of covid-19 and use a multilevel, intersectoral response that takes into account the magnitude, complexity, and intergenerational dimensions of the pandemic.

Covid-19 as a multiwave, intergenerational event

After HIV was conceptualised as a long wave event in 1990, it was shown to have three main curves over time: HIV infection, AIDS related deaths, and societal effects such as children being orphaned and food insecurity. Breaking down the HIV/AIDS epidemic into these curves showed the magnitude, complexity, and intergenerational dimensions of the problem. It highlighted the need for longer term projections of the effects of the HIV/AIDS epidemic and mitigation efforts, including tackling the links between HIV, health, and development.

As with the HIV/AIDS epidemic, the full extent of the covid-19 challenge must be recognised. Infections, illness, and death related to covid-19 have many indirect health and socioeconomic effects in the immediate, medium, and longer term. These effects, which range from disrupted health service delivery and education to increased violence and malnutrition, disproportionately affect poor and vulnerable people, including children and young people. They are fuelled by and reinforce inequalities between and within countries, such as in the burden of covid-19, capacity to respond, and social determinants of health—for example, working conditions, housing, and access to healthcare including vaccines. The multiple curves of infection, illness, death, and societal effects from covid-19 are likely to reoccur, creating a multiwave of overlapping health and socioeconomic effects over time.

The duration and multiwave nature of the covid-19 pandemic is mediated by several factors: (a) vaccine inequity, expected to last until 2023 in many low income countries; (b) highly transmissible variants of concern such as the delta and omicron variants; (c) potential for new variants to partly or fully evade current covid-19 vaccines; (d) unpredictable waning of population immunity; and (e) nature and implications of long covid. These and other factors, including inequitable access to covid-19 diagnostics and therapies, varying societal support for public health and social measures, and animal reservoirs of SARS-CoV-2, make it nearly impossible to eradicate the virus.

Effects on children, young people

Children and young people presently account for a relatively small portion of direct illness and death from covid-19, although they are not immune and face risks of long covid. A narrow focus on the direct and immediate health effects of covid-19 obscures the extent to which the pandemic is affecting children and young people. Each wave of covid-19 infection, illness, and death makes children and young people vulnerable to many negative socioeconomic outcomes (box 1). These negatively reinforce each other and could combine given the long and multiwave nature of the pandemic. Consideration of the multiple effects of the pandemic has prompted the Human Rights Council to request a study on how to mitigate the effect of covid-19 on the human rights of young people.

The covid-19 related crises affecting children and young people intersect and exacerbate each other. Being orphaned can trigger mental ill health, greater vulnerability to infectious diseases, physical abuse and sexual violence, and poverty. Disrupted schooling interferes with access to and delivery of essential health and other services, such as nutritious foods. It increases girls’ vulnerability to child marriage, early pregnancy, and gender based violence, making return to school less likely and HIV infection more likely. Disrupted schooling also causes parents, especially mothers, to leave work to provide care, reducing income which could support children and young people. In undermining the development of children and young people, such effects have profound consequences for societies. In December 2021, the World Bank, Unesco, and Unicef warned that the learning crisis alone could result in $17tn ($12.5tn) in lost lifetime earnings at present value globally.

Children and young people in lower income countries will be most adversely affected by covid-19 because of inequities in covid-19 vaccination, fiscal capacity to respond, and social protection coverage. As
of 12 January 2022, just 11.4% of people in low income countries had received at least one covid-19 vaccine dose compared with 67.6% in high income countries. At a time when over 60% of low and middle income countries are highly vulnerable to debt, poorer countries would need to add hundreds of millions of dollars to their existing public debt to cover the cost of vaccinating 70% of their population. Even if they were able to do this, it could compromise investment in other measures to protect children and young people, such as healthcare and nutrition. Furthermore, while the pandemic has driven unprecedented investment in emergency social protection measures, 87% of social spending from March 2020 to May 2021 was by high income countries, compared with just 4.7% by low and middle income countries. Income support programmes appear to have mitigated overall increases in poverty in upper middle income countries, at least temporarily, but have been insufficient to do so in low income countries. More than four billion people, including three in four children, still lack any social protection such as support grants or bursary schemes.

Planning and investing to safeguard generations Understanding covid-19 as a long and multiwave event can inform multilevel, intersectoral responses to mitigate its negative effects on children and young people, thus protecting their health and wellbeing in the short and longer term. Stronger and more resilient systems for health must be at the centre of intersectoral efforts. Such systems are crucial to reduce the spread of the virus, deliver vaccines and other essential health services, and strengthen pandemic preparedness and response. Empowerment and inclusion of young people can help ensure effective, equitable, and rights based approaches. The multilevel, intersectoral responses should focus on longer term planning, layering of effective interventions, and scaled investments.

Long term planning Current global and national plans for responding to the effects of covid-19 on health, development, and society are rarely longer than 18 months and are typically shorter. These plans are also severely underfinanced. To better account for the multiwave effects of the pandemic on children and young people, longer term and fully financed covid-19 plans are needed, covering 24 month surge efforts and 36 month plans. The surge efforts should focus on maintaining essential child health services, ensuring age appropriate remedial support through education, comprehensive social protection, and equitable access to vaccines. The 36 month plans should seek to mitigate and reverse losses in human capital by making use of advances necessitated by covid-19, for example increased use of digital technology for healthcare and education as well as greater emphasis on the mental health of children and young people.

Approaches used during the covid-19 pandemic can guide longer term planning. For example, in what could be seen as part of a surge effort, Liberia, Nepal, and Senegal have employed...
They also need to be cost effective given reduced resources and increased need.37 Evidence from other epidemics indicates the potential of accelerator approaches (eg, government cash transfers, violence prevention and sexual and reproductive health services) to simultaneously tackle several of the overlapping effects of covid-19 on children and young people.38 Studies in the sub-Saharan Africa have identified services that together can improve health, education and sexual health for children and young people in the context of HIV and Ebola virus disease.39 These studies have found consistent evidence of the beneficial effects on many SDGs of social protection combined with evidence based parenting support, sexual and reproductive health and rights education and/or safe school access, and essential child health and nutrition services (fig 1).40 41 The findings suggest the value of layering additional child-focused services, such as parenting programmes and adolescent-friendly health services, into covid-19 social protection responses.

Interventions also need to be delivered on an adequate scale within current systems and with minimal disruption even during lockdown and to families experiencing covid-19 illness and death.42 Digital methods can help deliver packages of support, for example, cash transfers and evidence-based violence prevention programmes, and have inbuilt monitoring systems that can provide evidence of use and effect even when more formal evaluations are limited. New low cost smartphones, innovations in offline first applications that do not require internet access, and cost savings in in-person services may allow provision of basic telephones to support remote service delivery.

Scaled investments

Bold investments are needed to mitigate the socioeconomic effects of the pandemic on children and young people while accelerating longer term progress. This investment includes immediately ending covid-19 vaccine inequity, which persists despite an estimated cost of just $50bn (£37bn) to vaccinate the world.43 Covid-19 vaccination not only protects health, including the health of parents and caregivers of children and young people, but also helps to recover human capital loss by reducing the need for lockdowns and enabling health systems, schools, economies, and early childhood development services to function.44 Investments can reach beyond mitigating the effects of covid-19, in line with commitments of countries and the international community, to build better systems going forward. Ambitious but feasible investments across the SDGs can help the world exceed the development

Layering of effective interventions

Interventions to safeguard children and young people need to mitigate as many important effects of covid-19 as possible.36

Various mitigation strategies to maintain routine immunisation.28 Countries that have safeguarded nutrition and maternal and child health during other crises, such as Bangladesh, Liberia, Peru, and Rwanda, also provide lessons to guide covid-19 planning and investment.29 Other examples of potential surge efforts include the provision of financial aid to children orphaned by covid-19 in Brazil and Peru,30 and parenting support for violence prevention to 210 million people in 198 countries, delivered by Parenting for Lifelong Health, together with United Nations agencies and other academic and development partners, through 34 national government programmes.31 In terms of making use of advances for the future, the pandemic has generated cross country lessons and principles on the effective delivery of remote learning, including the need to have effective teachers, suitable technology, and engaged learners.32 As regards mental health, recognising that the covid-19 pandemic has the “seeds of a major mental health crisis,”33 the Philippines launched a mental health investment case to assess the most cost effective responses, including to invest in schools, health systems going forward. Ambitious but feasible investments across the SDGs can help the world exceed the development
trajectory it was on before the pandemic. For example, an SDG push for education, which includes targeted investments in governance, social protection, and digital innovation, could result in an additional 25 million children obtaining upper secondary education every year by 2030, compared with the pre-pandemic development path, that is if covid-19 had never happened. A monthly investment of just 0.07% of the gross domestic product of low and middle income countries could provide financial security to 613 million women of working age living in poverty. Going beyond a temporary basic income to a universal basic income would further protect children and young people, particularly if combined with universal health coverage.

Global support to lower income countries is crucial to protect the world’s children and young people. The WHO director general recently noted that “Vaccine inequity and health inequity overall were the biggest failures of last year”. These failures have added to the broader development divergence of the past five years characterised by failures to invest adequately in shared, intergenerational challenges such as pandemic preparedness and response and the climate crisis. To reinvigorate solidarity among countries and between generations, in line with the UN secretary general’s report Our Common Agenda, a sustained boost in development assistance for health and development is needed.

Conclusion
Understanding covid-19 as a long and multiwave event helps us to understand the pandemic’s profound effect on children and young people, both now and in the future. This understanding also points to the need for proportional, evidence based strategies for longer term planning, layering of effective interventions, and scaled investments in order to mitigate the effects of covid-19 on children and young people, which will benefit entire societies. This will require greater investment in multilevel, intersectoral responses and stronger and more resilient systems for health.

We thank the reviewers for their comments. Contributors and sources: Under the guidance of MD, all authors co-created the concept of the paper, contributed substantively to the various drafts, and approved the final version. MD, DW, LB have extensive experience in policy and programming on HIV and the social determinants of health in low and middle income countries. LC advises UN and governments on evidence based social intervention and policy, focusing on children and adolescents. MI has expertise in addressing multiple dimensions of health in lower middle income settings. ON, CW and AG are students. LJ is an economist with expertise in development economics, finance, and empirical analysis. All authors have been working on the covid-19 response. MD is the guarantor.

Competing interests: We have read and understood BMJ policy on declaration of interests and declare that we have no competing interests.

Provenance and peer review: Commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

This article is part of a series commissioned for the Prince Mahidol Awards Conference (PMAC) in January 2022. Funding for the articles, including open access fees, was provided by PMAC. The BMJ commissioned, peer reviewed, edited, and made the decision to publish these articles. Rachael Hinton and Kamran Abbasi were the lead editors for the BMJ.

Mandeep Dhalwai, director
Roy Small, policy specialist1
Lucie Cluver, professor1,3
Mona Ibrahim, coordinator2
Ludo Bok, team leader1
Collin Nascimento, intern2
Cheng Wang, intern3
Aidan Garagic, intern1
Lars Jensen, economist1
1United Nations Development Programme, New York, USA
2University of Oxford, Oxford, UK
3University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa
4OXY Occidental College, Kehane United Nations Program, Los Angeles, USA
Correspondence to: M.Dhalwai mandeep.dhalwai@undp.org

This is an Open Access article distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, remix, adapt, build upon this work non-commercially, and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited and the use is non-commercial. See: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/.

OPEN ACCESS

1 Jha A, Kickbusch I, Taylor P, Abbasi K, SDGs Working Group. Accelerating achievement of the sustainable development goals. BMJ 2016;352:i409. doi:10.1136/bmj.i409
2 Nixon SA, Hanassi-Hancock J, Whiteside A, Barnett T. The increasing chronicity of HIV in sub-Saharan Africa: Re-thinking “HIV as a long-wave event” in the era of widespread access to ART. Global Health 2011;7:41. doi:10.1186/1744-8603-7-41
3 United Nations Children’s Fund data hub. COVID-19 and children. Available at: https://data.unicef.org/resources/covid-19-a-threat-to-progress-against-child-marriage/
4 World Bank. Education from disruption to recovery. The World Bank, UNESCO, and UNICEF; 2021. https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/overview/educationresponse
5 Bank. World Bank. Second round of the national pulse survey on continuity of essential health services during the COVID-19 pandemic. January-March 2021. WHO, 2021. https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-2019-nCoV-EHS-continuity-survey-2021.1
6 Hills SD, Umew HT, Chen Y, et al. Global minimum estimates of children affected by COVID-19 associated orphanhood and deaths of caregivers: a modelling study. Lancet 2021;398:391-402. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(21)01253-8
7 United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. Education from disruption to recovery https://unesco.org/covid-19/educationresponse
8 World Bank. Urgent, effective action required to quell the impact of covid-19 on education worldwide. World Bank; 2021. https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/immersive-story/2021/01/22/urgent-effective-action-required-to-quell-the-impact-of-covid-19-on-education-worldwide
9 World Bank. Impact of COVID-19 on labor markets in Latin America and the Caribbean. The gendered impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic on young people. A/84/4212 (18 October 2021) https://un-docs.org/A/HRC/RES/48/421
10 United Nations. Policy brief: Education during COVID-19 and beyond. UN; 2020. https://www.un.org/development/desa/dspd/wp-content/uploads/sites/23/2020/12/pdf/sg_policy_brief_covid-19_education.pdf
11 Pfeffer AE, Levandowski BA, MacPhail C, Padian NS, Cohen MS, Rees HV. Keep them in school: the importance of education as a protective factor against HIV infection among African women. Int J Epidemiol 2008;37:1266-73. doi:10.1093/ije/dyn131
12 World Bank Gender Innovation Lab for Latin America and the Caribbean. The gendered impacts of COVID-19 on labor markets in Latin America and the Caribbean. Policy Brief. May 2021. World Bank; 2021. https://www.worldbank.org/en/results/2021/05/05/the-gendered-impacts-of-covid-19-on-labor-markets-in-latin-america-and-the-caribbean
13 The state of the global education crisis: a path to recovery. The World Bank, UNESCO, and UNICEF; 2021. https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/overview/educationresponse
14 BMJ: first published as 10.1136/bmj-2021-068123 on 27 January 2022. Downloaded from http://www.bmj.com/ on 19 February 2022 by guest. Protected by copyright.

BMJ: first published as 10.1136/bmj-2021-068123 on 27 January 2022. Downloaded from http://www.bmj.com/ on 19 February 2022 by guest. Protected by copyright.
23 UNDP data futures platform. Global dashboard for vaccine equity. https://data.undp.org/vaccine-equity/
24 Jensen L. Sovereign debt vulnerabilities: the developing economies. UNDP. 2021. https://www.undp.org/publications/sovereign-debt-vulnerabilities-developing-economies
25 Fajardo-Gonzalez J, Molina GG, Montoya-Aguirre M, Ortiz-Juarez E. Mitigating poverty: global estimates of the impact of income support during the pandemic. UNDP. 2021. https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/UNDP-DFS-Mitigating-Poverty-Global-Estimates-of-the-Impact-of-Income-Support-during-the-Pandemic.pdf
26 International Labour Organization. World social protection report 2020-22. Social protection at the crossroads - in pursuit of a better future. ILO. 2021. https://www.ilo.org/global/publications/books/crossroads-in-pursuit-of-a-better-future.ILO;2021.
27 United Nations. COVID-19 response. https://www.un.org/en/coronavirus/UN-response
28 Dool SM, Sarr M, Gueye DM, et al. Addressing disruptions in childhood routine immunisation services during the COVID-19 pandemic: perspectives from Nepal, Senegal and Liberia. BMJ Glob Health 2021;6:e005031. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2021-005031
29 Phillips DE, Bhutta ZA, Binagwaho A, et al. Exemplars in Global Health Partnership: Learning from exemplars in global health: a road map for mitigating indirect effects of COVID-19 on maternal and child health. BMJ Glob Health 2020;5:e003430. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2020-003430
30 Newsroom TBR. Brazil’s poorest region moves to help COVID orphans. The Brazilian Report 2021 Aug 27. https://brazilian.report/liveblog/2021/08/27/covid-orphans-northeast
31 Parenting for Lifelong Health. https://www.childdevelopment.org/home
32 World Bank. Remote learning during COVID-19: lessons from today, principles for tomorrow. World Bank. 2021. https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/edutech/brief/how-countries-are-using-edtech-to-support-remote-learning-during-the-covid-19-pandemic
33 United Nations. Policy brief: COVID-19 and the need for action on mental health. UN. 2020. https://undg.un.org/resources/policy-brief-covid-19-and-need-action-mental-health
34 UNDP. The Philippines. The case for investment in mental health. UNDP. 2021. https://www.asia-pacific.undp.org/content/rap/en/home/blog/2021/the-economic-case-for-investing-in-mental-health.html
35 Clark H, Coll-Seck AM, Banerjee A, et al. A future for the world’s children? A WHO-UNICEF-Lancet Commission. Lancet 2020;395:605-58. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(19)32540-1
36 Sherr L, Claver L, Tolmison M, et al. Beyond masks: societal impacts of COVID-19 and accelerated solutions for children and adolescents. UNICEF. 2020. https://www.unicef-irc.org/publications/pdf/UNICEF-Beyond-Masks-Report-Societal-Impacts-of-COVID-19.pdf
37 World Bank. Global economic prospects, June 2021. World Bank. 2021. https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2021/06/08/worldbank-global-economic-prospects-2021
38 United Nations Development Programme. SDG Accelerator and bottleneck assessment. UNDP. 2017
39 Sherr L, Claver L, Desmond C, et al. A new vehicle to accelerate the UN Sustainable Development Goals. Lancet Glob Health 2020;8:e637-8. doi:10.1016/S2214-109X(20)30103-0
40 Claver LD, Orkin FM, Campeau L, et al. Improving lives by accelerating progress towards the UN Sustainable Development Goals for adolescents living with HIV: a prospective cohort study. Lancet Child Adolesc Health 2019;3:245-54. doi:10.1016/S2352-4642(19)30033-1
41 Ismayilova L, Karimli L. Harsh parenting and violence against children: a trial with ultra poor families in francophone West Africa. J Child Adolesc Psychol 2020;49:18-35. doi:10.1080/15574416.2018.1485103
42 Workicho A, Kershaw ML, Berhanu L, Kebede M, Kennedy E. Essential health and nutrition service provision during the COVID-19 pandemic. Curr Dev Nutr 2021;5(4):nzab024.
43 Horobin W. It would cost $50 billion to vaccinate the world, OECD says. Bloomberg Equality Economics 2021 Dec 1. https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2021-12-01/vaccinations-key-for-farward-would-only-cost-50-billion-oecd
44 Rawlings L, Govindaraj R, Wilson D. COVID-19 vaccines – a path for recovering human capital. World Bank blog, 21 Jan 2021. https://blogs.worldbank.org/health/covid-19-vaccines-path-recovering-human-capital
45 Hughes BB, Hanna T, McNeil K, Bohl DK, Moyer J. Pursuing the Sustainable Development Goals in a world reshaped by COVID-19. Frederick S. Pardee Center for International Futures and UNDP. 2021
46 Montoya-Aguirre M, Ortiz-Juarez E, Santiago A. Protecting women’s livelihoods in times of pandemic: temporary basic income and the road to gender equality. UNDP Development Future Series Brief, 2021. https://reliefweb.int/report/world/protecting-women-s-livelihoods-times-pandemic-temporary-basic-income-and-road-gender
47 World Health Organization. WHO director-general’s opening remarks at the media briefing on covid-19—6 January 2022. WHO. 2022. https://www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-the-media-briefing-on-covid-19—6-january-2022
48 Shah R. The COVID charter: a new development model for a world in crisis. Foreign Affairs; 2021. https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/africa/2021-08-24/covid-charter
49 United Nations. Our common agenda. Report of the Secretary-General. UN. 2021. https://www.un.org/en/content/common-agenda-report/assets/pdf/Common_Agenda_Report_English.pdf
50 Ogbuiji O, Mao W, Areyetey G. The long-term impact of COVID-19 on development assistance for health is still uncertain. Lancet 2021;398:1280-1. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(21)01448-3

Cite this as: BMJ 2022;376:e068123
http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj-2021-068123