mtDNA heteroplasmy level and copy number indicate disease burden in m.3243A>G mitochondrial disease

John P Grady¹,‡, Sarah J Pickett¹,‡, Yi Shiau Ng¹, Charlotte L Alston¹,², Emma L Blakely¹,², Steven A Hardy¹,², Catherine L Feeney¹, Alexandra A Bright¹, Andrew M Schaefer¹, Gráinne S Gorman¹, Richard JQ McNally³, Robert W Taylor¹,², Doug M Turnbull¹ & Robert McFarland¹, **

Abstract

Mitochondrial disease associated with the pathogenic m.3243A>G variant is a common, clinically heterogeneous, neurogenetic disorder. Using multiple linear regression and linear mixed modelling, we evaluated which commonly assayed neurogenetic disorder. Using multiple linear regression and linear mixed modelling, we evaluated which commonly assayed tissue (blood N = 231, urine N = 235, skeletal muscle N = 77) represents the m.3243A>G mutation load and mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) copy number most strongly associated with disease burden and progression. m.3243A>G levels are correlated in blood, muscle and urine (R² = 0.61–0.73). Blood heteroplasmy declines by ~2.3%/year; we have extended previously published methodology to adjust for age. In urine, males have higher mtDNA copy number and ~20% higher m.3243A>G mutation load; we present formulas to adjust for this. Blood is the most highly correlated mutation measure for disease burden and progression in m.3243A>G-carrying individuals; increasing age and heteroplasmy contribute (R² = 0.27, P < 0.001). In muscle, heteroplasmy, age and mtDNA copy number explain a higher proportion of variability in disease burden (R² = 0.40, P < 0.001), although activity level and disease severity are likely to affect copy number. Whilst our data indicate that age-corrected blood m.3243A>G heteroplasmy is the most convenient and reliable measure for routine clinical assessment, additional factors such as mtDNA copy number may also influence disease severity.

Keywords m.3243A>G; MELAS; mitochondrial disease; mtDNA copy number; mtDNA heteroplasmy

Subject Categories Genetics, Gene Therapy & Genetic Disease

Introduction

The pathogenic mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) m.3243A>G variant in the MT-TL1 gene (encoding m-tRNA^Met(Dub)) is the most common heteroplasmic mtDNA disease genotype (Goto et al, 1990; Elliott et al, 2008; Gorman et al, 2015, 2016). Disease burden and progression vary greatly between individuals, and the associated clinical spectrum is broad (Nesbitt et al, 2013). The cause of this heterogeneity is poorly understood; consequently, disease burden and long-term prognosis are very difficult to predict (Chinnery et al, 1997; Kaufmann et al, 2011; Mancuso et al, 2014; Weiduschat et al, 2014; Fayssol et al, 2017).

In individuals harbouring m.3243A>G, mutant and wild-type mtDNA molecules coexist within the same cell, a situation termed heteroplasmy. Tissue segregation patterns of m.3243A>G vary widely; post-mitotic tissues such as muscle have higher levels of mutant mtDNA, whilst levels in blood decrease significantly over time (Sue et al, 1998; Rahman et al, 2001; Pyle et al, 2007; Raja- simha et al, 2008; Mehrzad et al, 2009; de Laat et al, 2012). Although patients with very severe disease tend to have a high proportion of mutant mtDNA, the relationship between heteroplasmy level and clinical phenotype is not straightforward and such intra-individual variation between tissues adds to the uncertainty (Chinnery et al, 1997; Fayssol et al, 2017).

We aimed to determine which putative prognostic factors are most associated with m.3243A>G-related mitochondrial disease burden and progression. To answer this question, we characterised the levels of heteroplasmy and mtDNA copy number in three commonly sampled tissues: blood, urine and skeletal muscle, in 242 m.3243A>G carriers (including 195 symptomatic patients) from the MRC Mitochondrial Disease Patient Cohort UK. Using multiple linear regression, we ascertained which m.3243A>G heteroplasmy measure and mtDNA copy number were the most associated with total disease burden, as determined by the Newcastle Mitochondrial...
Results

m.3243A>G heteroplasmy measures in all three tissues are correlated

In the first instance, we sought to characterise the three measurements of heteroplasmy; all are significantly correlated. The strongest relationship is between blood and urine heteroplasmy levels (Fig 1A; \( R^2 = 0.73, P < 0.001 \)); interaction with age included for a linear fit, \( P < 0.001 \), followed by muscle and blood heteroplasmy levels (Fig 1B; \( R^2 = 0.64, P < 0.001 \), interaction with age included, \( P = 0.029 \)). Finally, urine and muscle levels are correlated (Fig 1C; \( R^2 = 0.61, P < 0.001 \), sex term included, see below). Urine levels are significantly lower than muscle (slope = 0.75, 95% CI = 0.60–0.91, \( P < 0.001 \)).

Blood and urine m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels are negatively correlated with age

The correlation between muscle and blood heteroplasmy (Fig 1A) shows that younger individuals tend to have higher blood heteroplasmy levels, including age in the model increased \( R^2 \) from 0.38 to 0.64 (\( P < 0.001 \)), consistent with previous reports of a decline in blood levels with age (Rahman et al., 2001; Pyle et al., 2007; Rajasimha et al., 2008). We therefore examined the relationship of all tissue heteroplasmy measures with age; both blood and urine heteroplasmy levels show significant negative correlations, although this is greater for blood than urine. Muscle heteroplasmy is not correlated with age (Fig 1D–F).

Blood m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels decline with time

To evaluate reports of an exponential decline in blood m.3243A>G heteroplasmy level, we examined levels in all patients with multiple measurements (Fig 2). Blood levels have declined in the majority of patients observed for 4 years or more but this is not universal and some individuals appear to reach a terminal nonzero plateau of heteroplasmy; therefore, decline is not universally exponential. The rate of heteroplasmy change in blood is not associated with disease burden (\( P = 0.977 \)), and individuals whose level increased or remained stationary had a similar disease burden to those whose levels decreased.

We regressed the rate of heteroplasmy change against initial mutation level, estimating a continuous decline of \(-0.0185/\text{year} (95\% \text{ CI} = -0.0421 \text{ to } 0.0052)\), consistent with previous methodology (Rajasimha et al., 2008). However, the model is a poor fit to our data (\( R^2 = 0.06, P = 0.120 \)); this is improved if age at first measurement is included (\( R^2 = 0.42, P = 0.002 \)), with older individuals having a lower rate of decline.

Blood m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels must be adjusted for age

To understand the decline in blood m.3243A>G levels across the whole cohort, we modelled the decline in blood heteroplasmy using adjusted urine heteroplasmy levels as an estimate of initial mutation level (\( N = 204 \), see below) and validated our model using muscle heteroplasmy levels. We propose the following formula for age correction of blood heteroplasmy levels which represents a compound decline of \(-2.3\% \text{ a year} \) with an added age adjuster to account for a rapid reduction in mutation load in early life (Appendix Supplementary Method 2).

\[
\text{Age-adjusted blood level} = (\text{Blood heteroplasmy})/0.977^{\text{age}+12}
\]

Mean age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy is significantly correlated with mean muscle heteroplasmy (Fig 3A). This is an improvement on unadjusted blood levels (\( R^2 = 0.48 \) compared to 0.38), and the two levels can be more easily compared (slope = 1.03, 95% CI = 0.78–1.28). Adjusted levels are also correlated with urine heteroplasmy (\( R^2 = 0.60, P < 0.001, N = 224 \)) and sex-adjusted urine heteroplasmy (\( R^2 = 0.64, P < 0.001, N = 224 \)). There is a relationship between age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy and age (Fig 3B), but this is weaker and only seen in females.

Urine m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels are dependent on sex

The correlation between urine and muscle heteroplasmy level shows a clear effect of sex; males have, on average, 19.2% higher urine heteroplasmy (Fig 1C; 95% CI = 12.6–25.8%). Including sex in the model increases \( R^2 \) from 0.43 to 0.61 (\( P < 0.001 \)). Consistent with this, a similar effect size is seen in Fig 1F; (male levels are 18.4% higher, 95% CI = 12.7–24.1%, \( P < 0.001 \)). No relationship with sex is seen for blood (\( P = 0.288 \)) or muscle heteroplasmy levels (\( P = 0.245 \)).

Urine m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels must be adjusted for sex

Given the \(-20\% \) difference in m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels between males and females, we used the relationship between urine and muscle levels to derive a method to adjust urine levels for sex (Appendix Supplementary Method 1).

Summary of transformation:

Male adjusted urine level = \( \logit^{-1}((\logit \text{ (Urine heteroplasmy)})/0.791)–0.625 \)

Female adjusted urine level = \( \logit^{-1}((\logit \text{ (Urine heteroplasmy)})/0.791)+0.608 \)

The adjusted levels are significantly correlated with muscle levels (Fig 3C), an improvement on the correlation between uncorrected urine and muscle levels (\( R^2 = 0.55 \) compared to 0.43; sex not included models). There is still a relationship with age, of a similar magnitude to that seen in Fig 1F (Fig 3D).

For 22 individuals, m.3243A>G mutation load in muscle is divergent from urine levels by > 20%; if adjusted urine levels are used, this drops to 12, and if adjusted blood levels are also taken into account, there are only five.

Urine m.3243A>G heteroplasmy measures have the highest variability

We were interested in the intra-individual variability of measurements. Urine heteroplasmy levels appear to have much greater variability than the other tissues; levels in a number of individuals...
Figure 1. Correlations between heteroplasmy measurements and their relationship with age.

A Urine and blood heteroplasmy correlation (N = 224, R^2 = 0.73, P < 0.001; interaction with age included, P < 0.001).

B Muscle and blood heteroplasmy correlation (N = 74, R^2 = 0.64, P < 0.001; interaction with age included, P = 0.029).

C Muscle and urine heteroplasmy correlation, showing different intercepts for males and females (N = 75, R^2 = 0.61, P < 0.001).

D The relationship between age and muscle heteroplasmy levels (N = 77, R^2 = 0.0, P = 0.491).

E The relationship between age and blood heteroplasmy levels (N = 231, R^2 = 0.32, slope = -0.56, 95% CI = -0.67, -0.45, P < 0.001).

F The relationship between age and urine heteroplasmy levels (N = 235, R^2 = 0.22, slope = -0.42, 95% CI = -0.62, -0.22, P < 0.001).

Data information: Points represent mean heteroplasmy level for each individual, and linear regression lines are shown with 95% confidence intervals.
differ by 20–33%, and one individual shows a 55% change. In contrast, the biggest change in blood is 15%.

To quantify the variability, we calculated the coefficient of variation (CV) for each individual with at least three repeated measurements, allowing us to compare the variability across all tissues (excluding muscle where \( N = 1 \)). Age-adjusted blood shows the smallest variability (\( N = 24 \), mean CV = 0.091, 95% CI = 0.051–0.131), followed by unadjusted blood (\( N = 24 \), mean CV = 0.128, 95% CI = 0.084–0.171), although the difference is not significant (\( P = 0.157 \)). The highest variability is seen in urine (\( N = 39 \), mean CV = 0.189, 95% CI = 0.148–0.230) and sex-adjusted urine (\( N = 39 \), mean CV = 0.213, 95% CI = 0.166, 0.259), which are significantly different from age-adjusted blood levels (both \( P < 0.001 \)) and blood levels (\( P_{\text{urine}} = 0.034 \), \( P_{\text{sex-adjusted urine}} = 0.015 \)).

**Total disease burden is most strongly associated with blood heteroplasmy level**

To determine which heteroplasmy measurement is most strongly associated with total disease burden, we performed separate linear regression using each heteroplasmy measure. All are significantly associated, although the total variation explained by heteroplasmy, age and sex is low (\( R^2 \) range = 0.15–0.27; Table 1).

Age-adjusted blood (Fig 4A) and unadjusted blood heteroplasmy levels are more highly associated with total disease burden than adjusted and unadjusted urine levels (Table 1). The difference between using these two measures is small, failing to reach significance (\( P = 0.173 \); Appendix Table S1); however, as age was also included in the model, this is not surprising and provides further validation of our method of adjustment. Sex-adjusted urine level is the next most associated factor and better than uncorrected urine levels (Table 1), although this difference is not significant (\( P = 0.166 \); Appendix Table S1A). A composite measure of adjusted blood and urine m.3243A>G levels explained no more of the variance than using age-adjusted blood levels alone. Interestingly, blood heteroplasmy is significantly more associated with total disease burden than urine heteroplasmy (\( P = 0.007 \)) and this holds when both corrected measures are used (\( P = 0.036 \); Appendix Table S1A).

In individuals with available muscle heteroplasmy data (Table 1), using blood or urine heteroplasmy data (Table 1), using blood or urine heteroplasmy levels are just as good as muscle (Appendix Table S1A).
Disease progression rate is most strongly associated with age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy level

We then asked whether heteroplasmy level is associated with disease progression; we used a linear mixed model to examine the role of heteroplasmy in the rate of NMDAS development. Disease progression is most strongly associated with age-adjusted blood levels, significantly more than urine ($P = 0.010$; Appendix Table S1B) and sex-adjusted urine levels ($P = 0.037$). Although the combination of adjusted blood and adjusted urine levels was

---

**Figure 3.** Sex-adjusted urine and age-adjusted blood m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels.

A. Regression of age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy against muscle heteroplasmy ($N = 74$, $R^2 = 0.48$, $P < 0.001$).
B. Regression of age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy against age ($N = 231$, $R^2 = 0.06$, $P < 0.001$) showing an interaction with sex ($P = 0.022$).
C. Regression of sex-adjusted urine heteroplasmy against muscle heteroplasmy ($N = 75$, $R^2 = 0.55$, $P < 0.001$).
D. Regression of sex-adjusted urine heteroplasmy against age ($N = 235$, $R^2 = 0.07$, slope $= -0.50$, 95% CI $= -0.73$, $-0.27$, $P < 0.001$).

Data information: Linear regression lines and 95% confidence intervals are shown.
m.3243A→G disease burden and progression  

John P Grady et al

Table 1. Comparisons of different m.3243A→G heteroplasm levels in association with total disease burden.

| Heteroplasm measure                        | $R^2$ | $P$-value  |
|-------------------------------------------|-------|------------|
| Larger cohort (N = 210)                   |       |            |
| Blood                                     | 0.2744| < 0.001    |
| Age-adjusted blood                        | 0.2539| < 0.001    |
| Urine                                     | 0.1809| < 0.001    |
| Sex-adjusted urine                        | 0.1989| < 0.001    |
| Mean adjusted blood and urine             | 0.2461| < 0.001    |
| Smaller cohort (N = 69)                   |       |            |
| Blood                                     | 0.1547| 0.001      |
| Age-adjusted blood                        | 0.1809| < 0.001    |
| Urine                                     | 0.1963| < 0.001    |
| Sex-adjusted urine                        | 0.2005| < 0.001    |
| Skeletal muscle                           | 0.2024| < 0.001    |
| Mean adjusted blood and urine             | 0.1955| < 0.001    |

marginally more associated than adjusted blood levels alone, this difference failed to reach significance ($P = 0.624$). Crucially, in the cohort with available muscle heteroplasmy data, muscle m.3243A→G levels were not more strongly associated with disease progression than age-adjusted blood ($P = 0.189$), sex-adjusted urine ($P = 0.297$), unadjusted urine levels ($P = 0.320$) or a combination of adjusted blood and urine levels ($P = 0.696$).

Increasing age and the interaction between age and increasing age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy level are significantly positively associated with disease progression ($P < 0.001$); however, inter-individual variation is extremely high; the standard deviation of the variance due to individual is 2.35 (on NMDAS$^{0.5}$ scale) compared to 0.04 for age. Although individuals with high heteroplasm levels tend to have a higher disease burden and rate of progression and vice versa, there is a large spread in the data as well as considerable overlap (Fig 4B).

Total mtDNA copy number is affected by m.3243A→G heteroplasm level (in blood and sex) in urine)

As only 27% of the total disease burden can be explained by m.3243A→G heteroplasm level and age, we reasoned that the absolute quantity of wild-type mtDNA could affect clinical phenotype. We assessed mtDNA copy number in all three available tissues and determined the relationship between mtDNA copy number, sex, and m.3243A→G heteroplasm level and age. Standardised mtDNA copy number was highest in muscle (median = 3523, IQR = 1708, range = 678–10,610, N = 66) and lowest in blood (median = 144, IQR = 81, range = 24–323, N = 197), whilst urine mtDNA copy number showed the greatest range (median = 1181, IQR = 2870, range = 77–24,730, N = 165).

Blood mtDNA copy number shows a weak positive correlation with unadjusted ($R^2 = 0.03, P = 0.007$) and age-adjusted ($R^2 = 0.02, P = 0.016$) m.3243A→G heteroplasm level (N = 197). We observed no association with sex ($P = 0.088$) or age ($P = 0.163$). Urine mtDNA copy number is significantly higher in males ($R^2 = 0.12, P < 0.001, N = 176$; median$\text{male} = 3,733$, IQR$\text{male} = 5,630$, median$\text{female} = 881$, IQR$\text{female} = 1,468$), which is unsurprising given the differences seen in m.3243A→G heteroplasm level and is likely to be due to differences in cellular composition. No association with age ($P = 0.628$), unadjusted ($P = 0.113$) or sex-adjusted ($P = 0.163$) urine heteroplasm was observed. Muscle mtDNA copy number shows a slight downward trend with age, although this does not reach significance ($R^2 = 0.04, P = 0.060, N = 67$). No association with sex ($P = 0.450$) or muscle m.3243A→G heteroplasm ($P = 0.725$) was detected. We saw no correlation between copy number in the three tissues studied (blood$\times$urine$^{**} P = 0.372, N = 148$; blood$\times$muscle $P = 0.641$, N = 59; urine$^{**}$-muscle $P = 0.493$, N = 52; age-adjusted blood m.3243A→G heteroplasm or **sex included in model).

Low total mtDNA copy number in muscle is an indicator of disease burden

To determine the effect of mtDNA copy number with disease burden, we performed separate linear regression models for each tissue, including age, m.3243A→G heteroplasm level (assessed from the same sample as copy number) and sex (only for urine) as covariates. We found that higher skeletal muscle mtDNA copy number is significantly associated with reduced total disease burden in both single and multiple linear regression ($P_{\text{mtDNA copy number}} < 0.001; N = 66$; Fig 5). We estimate the effect of an increase in mtDNA copy number of 100 is a decrease in NMDAS$^{0.5}$ by 0.055 (95% CI = 0.079–0.031), which is similar to the effect of decreasing muscle m.3243A→G heteroplasm by 1% (0.027, 95% CI = 0.008–0.046, $P = 0.006$). Indeed, mtDNA copy number, muscle heteroplasm and age account for 40% of the variance in disease burden ($P < 0.001$); only 21% is explained when mtDNA copy number is not included. No significant associations were found for mtDNA copy number in either blood ($P_{\text{blood}} = 0.551$, $P_{\text{age-adjusted blood}} = 0.586$; $N = 197$) or urine ($P_{\text{urine}} = 0.144$, $P_{\text{sex-adjusted urine}} = 0.491$; $N = 165$). The interaction between age and muscle mtDNA copy number is associated with disease progression ($P = 0.0177$, $N = 63$), but no association was seen for blood ($P = 0.2491$, $N = 197$) or urine ($P = 0.1726$, $N = 159$).

Discussion

We have characterised m.3243A→G heteroplasm levels and mtDNA copy number in blood, urinary sediment and skeletal muscle, describing previously unreported sexual divergences in urine heteroplasm and mtDNA copy number and confirming a longitudinal and continuous decline in blood heteroplasm level in the majority of individuals. We have developed formulas to adjust urine m.3243A→G heteroplasm for sex and have extended previously published methodology to adjust blood heteroplasm levels for age, accounting for a higher initial rate of decline.

Our data show that age, muscle heteroplasm level and muscle mtDNA copy number explain 40% of the variance in disease burden in m.3243A→G-related disease. This is approaching the 49% variance in disease progression explained in single, large-scale mtDNA deletion disease (Grady et al., 2014). In contrast to previous reports, we do not see significant associations with mtDNA copy number in urine or blood and disease burden; however, our
Figure 4. Association of total disease burden and disease progression with age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy.

Points are coloured according to mean age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy level. Dashed lines and shading represent scores and 95% confidence intervals predicted using a linear model (with the square root of NMDAS score as the dependent variable and age and age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy as independent variables) for individuals with 10% (blue), 50% (orange) and 90% (red) heteroplasmy levels.

A Association of total disease burden with age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy. Points represent mean NMDAS score per individual.

B Association of disease progression with age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy. Each point represents one NMDAS assessment with points from each individual connected by a solid line (N = 210).
multi-variate models also include age and heteroplasmy, which may account for this (Liu et al., 2006, 2013). This result suggests that skeletal muscle is the most useful tissue to access and test in order to understand m.3243A>G-related disease.

Where copy number assessment is not possible, we show that muscle m.3243A>G heteroplasmy is not more highly associated with disease burden or progression than blood or urine. Both adjusted and unadjusted blood heteroplasmy levels are significantly more associated than adjusted and unadjusted urine levels. This contradicts previous studies (Mehrazin et al., 2009; Whittaker et al., 2009; de Laat et al., 2012) and may well reflect our larger sample size, inclusion of age as a risk factor, and the significantly higher within-individual variability that we observe in urine heteroplasmy levels.

Together with age, blood and age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy account for 25–27% of the variance in disease burden, consistent with previous estimates (Whittaker et al., 2009; de Laat et al., 2012). Individuals with high levels tend to have higher disease burden and progression, but, even using muscle mtDNA heteroplasmy and copy number, we observe meaningful inter-individual variation, highlighting the difficulties in providing accurate prognoses to patients with m.3243A>G-related disease and implying that unidentified factors, such as nuclear genetic variation, environmental influences and epigenetics, affect clinical outcome (Picard & Hirano, 2016; Pickett et al., 2018). Efforts to identify these, as well as the mechanisms affecting mtDNA copy number and additional biomarkers for disease severity, will be crucial to understanding m.3243A>G-related mitochondrial disease.

The clear association with muscle mtDNA copy number and disease burden may simply reflect that more severely affected individuals are likely to have lower activity levels, which may reduce muscle mtDNA copy number (Apabhai et al., 2011; Cao et al., 2012). Alternatively, some individuals may have a compensatory mechanism of mitochondrial biogenesis triggered in the presence of mutant mtDNA. MtDNA copy number has been shown to influence the clinical outcome of patients carrying Leber hereditary optic neuropathy mtDNA mutations; asymptomatic carriers have a higher mtDNA copy number than both patients and healthy controls, with fibroblasts from carriers also displaying the highest capacity for activating mitochondrial biogenesis (Giordano et al., 2014). Studies in m.3243A>G cybrids have shown a positive correlation between mtDNA copy number and O2 consumption, indicating that mtDNA

Figure 5. Association of total disease burden with age, m.3243A>G heteroplasmy level and mtDNA copy number in skeletal muscle.

Lines represent scores predicted using a linear model (with the square root of NMDAS score as the dependent variable and age, skeletal muscle heteroplasmy and mtDNA copy number as independent variables). Individuals with 10% (blue), 50% (orange) and 90% (red) heteroplasmy levels and low standardised mtDNA copy number (2,000 copies/nucleus; solid line), medium copy number (3,500 copies/nucleus; dashed line) and high copy number (5,000 copies/nucleus; dotted line) are represented.
copy number may be a limiting factor in the cellular mitochondrial respiratory phenotype within the context of this mutation (Bentlage & Attardi, 1996). Compensatory mechanisms could well be tissue-specific (we know that heteroplasmy plays a greater role for some tissue-specific phenotypes than for others) and determined by environmental or genetic factors, possibly accounting for some of the phenotypic variability seen in this disease (Pickett et al., 2018). It would therefore be fascinating to determine mtDNA copy number in other commonly affected tissues, although the availability of post-mortem nervous and cardiac tissue is likely to be restrictive. Our confirmation of the role of mtDNA copy number in m.3243A>G-related disease opens up the exciting possibility that components of the mitochondrial biogenesis pathway could be targeted by drugs in the treatment of this disease; indeed, change in skeletal muscle mtDNA copy number should be considered as an outcome measure for any clinical trial relating to m.3243A>G-related disease.

We characterised the decline in blood m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels over time, estimating a compound decline of 2.3%/year, consistent with a previous estimate of 2% (Rajasimha et al., 2008). However, our data show more variability, with 14 of 35 individuals showing increasing or stationary blood heteroplasmy levels. There is also clear evidence of either an initial rapid decline, a slowing of decline with time, or both; evaluation of the relative contribution of each requires further study.

In some individuals, blood levels of the m.3243A>G mutation appear to drop to a nonzero and non-trivial proportion. Long-term follow-up is necessary to fully characterise this inter-individual variation in selection against the m.3243A>G mutation. These individuals did not have a significantly different disease burden, but we had limited power to detect an effect. Interestingly, four individuals (all >48 years of age) had detectable mutation loads in urine but not blood, confirming that urine should also be checked for diagnosis if m.3243A>G is suspected.

Our proposed method for calculating age-adjusted blood m.3243A>G heteroplasmy produces levels better correlated with muscle heteroplasmy. A negative correlation with age is still present, although this is weaker and only in females. This is potentially attributable to ascertainment bias, reflecting our active tracing of m.3243A>G within pedigrees resulting in the recruitment of older, mildly affected, females who are more likely to have lower heteroplasmy levels than their more severely affected offspring.

The observed variability and sexual divergence of m.3243A>G heteroplasmy and mtDNA copy number in urinary sediment are likely to be due to differences in cellular content. Urine contains many different cell types, mostly epithelial in nature, and differences in cellular composition arise depending on sex, age and disease status (Benda et al., 2013). Other factors, such as time of day, volume, concentration or infection, could also alter cellular content and therefore influence measured heteroplasmy and copy number levels. If urine is to be pursued for diagnostic testing of m.3243A>G, variability in cellular content and the effect on heteroplasmy levels should be investigated. It is possible that this sexual divergence also exists in other tissues and may explain some of the sex-specific effects seen in mitochondrial disease (Giordano et al., 2014; Mancuso et al., 2014).

There are limitations to our study. We have not considered the baseline level of disease found in the general population in our model, although some features of m.3243A>G-related disease are common (e.g. migraine). However, from a clinical care perspective, overall disease burden is important, irrespective of aetiology. We also recognise that the NMDAS may be weighted towards particular phenotypes and so is not a perfect measure of disease burden; however, it is clinically validated and widely used, and thus the most appropriate tool currently available. Moreover, we have only considered three tissues and our sample size for muscle is considerably smaller than for urine and blood. Diagnostic facilities are limited to relatively easily sampled tissues and are not always representative of those commonly affected, which tend to be post-mitotic with high-energy demand (e.g. skeletal and cardiac muscle and central nervous tissue), but even in samples obtained from autopsy, the relationships between tissue-specific symptoms and heteroplasmy levels are not clear (Betts et al., 2006; Maeda et al., 2016; Picard & Hirano, 2016). Our study reflects the tissue availability in many diagnostic settings, making our results clinically applicable. Finally, our results represent mtDNA copy number and heteroplasmy in homogenate tissue; future work should determine these levels in individual muscle fibres to determine whether muscle fibre type has any influence. Taking account of this unknown and therefore uncontrolled variability may lead to a stronger correlation with disease burden.

This study demonstrates that although a substantial amount of variation in m.3243A>G-related disease burden remains to be explained, the best correlates are skeletal muscle mtDNA copy number, heteroplasmy and age, highlighting the importance of using all three measurements to understand this condition. As skeletal muscle mtDNA copy number is conceivably a marker for activity level, which is affected by disease severity, it may have limited utility in predicting likely disease burden. Blood m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels are just as strongly associated with disease burden and progression as muscle heteroplasmy levels; therefore, we suggest that age-adjusted blood heteroplasmy is reliable and the most convenient heteroplasmy measure to use routinely within the clinical setting. Although urine may be a useful tissue for diagnosis of m.3243A>G, our results suggest that urine heteroplasmy levels should be adjusted for sex and are highly variable, and thus must be interpreted with caution. We have developed a web-based tool (http://www.newcastle-mitochondria.com/m-3243ag-heteroplasmy-tool/) to calculate adjusted blood and urine m.3243A>G mutation levels, supporting clinicians in their management of these patients.
Future research should focus on identifying pathways responsible for modulating mtDNA copy number in affected tissues, identifying additional factors responsible for the extensive clinical variability associated with this disease as well as collecting larger cohorts of muscle samples in order to study the effect of muscle mtDNA copy number on disease progression.

Materials and Methods

Study population

These studies were undertaken using data from 242 adult m.3243A>G carriers (147 females, Appendix Table S2) recruited into the MRC Mitochondrial Disease Patient Cohort UK between 2005 and 2017; all individuals were investigated by the NHS Highly Specialised Service for Rare Mitochondrial Disorders of Adults and Children in Newcastle upon Tyne. Patient follow-up was carried out (median interval = 1.1 years, IQR = 0.77) using the Newcastle Mitochondrial Disease Adult Scale (NMDAS), a validated scale to evaluate multi-system involvement and disease burden in adult mitochondrial disease (Schaefer et al, 2006). The cohort includes 195 symptomatic patients (NMDAS score ≥ 5), 30 asymptomatic carriers (NMDAS < 5) and 17 with incomplete NMDAS data.

The NMDAS assessment comprises 29 questions rated on a scale of 0–5; we calculated the sum of these (excluding the score for respiratory function, which is challenging to record accurately). NMDAS assessments with fewer than 25 of 29 responses were excluded. For those included, the total NMDAS score was divided by the number of questions answered and multiplied by 29 to derive a scaled NMDAS score.

Of the 242 individuals, 231 had at least one m.3243A>G heteroplasmy measurement in blood, 235 in urine and 77 in skeletal muscle. We excluded post-renal transplant urine heteroplasmy measurements, 235 in urine and 77 in skeletal muscle. We excluded post-renal transplant urine heteroplasmy measurements in order to study the effect of muscle mtDNA copy number on disease progression.

mtDNA copy number assessment

mtDNA copy number was determined by real-time PCR using singleplex Taqman assays targeting mitochondrial MT-ND1 and nuclear B2M as previously described and validated (Grady et al, 2014b). Primers and probes were as follows: B2M (GenBank accession number: NG_012920) forward: n.9064-9037; and 5’ 6-FAM labelled B2M probe n.9066-9032; MT-ND1 (GenBank accession number NC_012920.1) forward: m.3485-3504; MT-ND1 reverse: m.3553-3532; and 5’ VIC-labelled MT-ND1 probe m.3506-3529. Probes contained a non-fluorescent quencher and 3’ MGB moiety. DNA was serially diluted to ~10 ng/μl for B2M and ~0.1 ng/μl for ND1; 5 μl DNA was added to each 15 μl reaction. Each 96-well plate contained a standard curve derived from six tenfold serial dilutions of a plasmid containing both B2M and ND1 targets. R<sup>2</sup> values were > 0.999 and gradients fell between ~3.3 and ~3.6 for all standard curves. Each reaction was performed in triplicate; mean threshold cycle (Ct) and standard curves were used to determine the mtDNA copy number per nucleus for each sample. Within sample outliers and samples with Ct standard deviation Ct > 3 or mean Ct > 33 were excluded from the analysis. A control DNA sample included on each plate (coefficient of variation of copy number from 22 plates = 16.8%) was used to standardise mtDNA copy number to control for inter-plate variation using the following formula: standardised copy number = (copy number/on-plate control copy number) x mean control copy number.

Statistical analysis

Linear regression

All statistical analyses were performed using the R statistical package (R Core Team, 2016). For initial investigations, the mean heteroplasmy level and age for each heteroplasmy subtype were utilised, yielding a single independent data point per individual. To quantify the relationships between different heteroplasmy measurements and heteroplasmy with age and time, linear regression was performed. Where appropriate, sex and age and interaction terms were tested for inclusion in models using the analysis of variance test (threshold P < 0.05). Model assumptions were checked by visual inspection of plots of residuals against fitted values, QQ and leverage (threshold; Cook’s distance of < 1). We report adjusted R<sup>2</sup> values, P values (3dp) and, where appropriate, slopes and 95% confidence intervals (CI). We report unadjusted P values for reasons well documented in the literature and, particularly as we are testing a priori hypotheses with variables that are not all independent, this would be too conservative (Perneger, 1998).

Quantifying variability

In order to quantify the variability in heteroplasmy measurements, we calculated the standard deviation of measurements for each

Heteroplasmy measurements

Total DNA was extracted from skeletal muscle (tibialis anterior or vastus lateralis), urinary sediment, and blood by standard procedures. Pyrosequencing on the Pyromark Q24 platform permitted quantification of m.3243G>A heteroplasmy levels, as previously described and validated (de Laat et al, 2016), with mutation-specific pyrosequencing primers according to GenBank Accession number NC_012920.1: 5’ biotinylated forward: m.3143-3163; reverse: m.3331-3353; and reverse pyrosequencing primer: m.3244-3258 (IDT, Coralville, USA). The allele quantification application of Pyromark’s proprietary Q24 software was used to calculate heteroplasmy levels (level of test sensitivity > 3% mutant mtDNA)
The paper explained

Problem
The pathogenic m.3243A>G mitochondrial DNA variant, responsible for a highly heterogeneous neurogenic disorder, is thought to be present in up to one in 400 individuals. It is not only the most common mutation in our mitochondrial disease patient cohort but also the most problematic, giving accurate advice to patients regarding likely disease burden and progression remains incredibly challenging, nearly 30 years since this heteroplasmatic pathogenic mtDNA variant was first described. A high mutation load is thought to be associated with more severe disease, but variation in heteroplasmy levels in commonly sampled tissues and a decline in levels in blood with age adds to the uncertainty.

Results
We have characterised m.3243A>G mutation load and mtDNA copy number in three commonly sampled tissues: blood, urinary sediment and skeletal muscle. m.3243A>G mutation load in urine has the highest variability and is about 20% lower in females compared to males; we present a method to adjust levels for this effect. We also extend previous methodology to adjust blood heteroplasmy levels for the age of the individual, accounting for non-uniform decline throughout a subject’s lifetime. Blood m.3243A>G heteroplasmy levels are more strongly associated than urine levels; 27% of the variance in disease burden can be attributed to m.3243A>G heteroplasmy and age. Skeletal muscle mtDNA copy number, heteroplasmy and age together explain 40% although mtDNA copy number in muscle is likely to be affected by activity level and therefore disease severity.

Impact
Our evidence suggests that clinicians should use age-adjusted blood m.3243A>G mutation load, along with patient age, as an indicator of likely disease burden. If m.3243A>G mutation load data for urine are available, these must be adjusted for the divergence between male and female levels and interpreted with caution due to high variability. If available, skeletal muscle samples could also be used to assay mtDNA copy number, providing valuable information about mitochondrial biogenesis in m.3243A>G-related disease. As the proportion of explained variance remains low, further work to identify additional factors associated with disease burden and progression in patients harbouring the pathogenic m.3243A>G variant is warranted.

Disease burden
For all analyses using NMDAS score, the square root was taken to ensure normality of the residuals. For total disease burden, a single independent point for each subject was determined by taking the maximum scaled NMDAS score and the earliest age at which this was reached. Separate linear regression using each of the different m.3243A>G heteroplasmy measures was conducted, including age and heteroplasmy as predictors of square root scaled NMDAS score. To compare models, the difference between $R^2$ values was calculated as a measure of improvement in the model. Significance ($P$ values representing the probability of the second model being better than the first) and 95% CIs of the difference in $R^2$ values were determined by bootstrapping (1,000 replicates).

Disease progression
To quantify the association between m.3243A>G heteroplasmy, age and progression of disease burden, we used nlme (Pinheiro et al, 2016) to perform a linear mixed effects analysis of the relationship between heteroplasmy level, age and NMDAS scaled score. As a fixed effect, we entered age into the model. As random effects, we had by-subject random slopes for the effect of age and the interaction between age and heteroplasmy level (heteroplasmy on its own was dropped from the model as $P > 0.05$) and no intercept (making the assumption that individuals were asymptomatic at birth). Two-sided $P$ values were obtained from the t-distribution reported in nlme. To assess which m.3243A>G heteroplasmy measure was most highly associated with disease burden, we selected the model with the lowest Akaike information criterion (AIC). Bootstrapping with 1,000 replicates determined the mean difference between AIC values, 95% CIs and significance. Reported $P$ values represent the number of samples with an AIC difference less than zero (representing the first model being a better fit than the second model).

Expanded View for this article is available online.

Acknowledgements
We thank the patients who participated in this study and the Mitochondrial Disease Patient Cohort administrative team. We are grateful to Dr. Mark Roberts (Salford Royal NHS Foundation Trust), Dr. Maria E. Farrugia and Dr. Richard K Petty (Queen Elizabeth University Hospital, Glasgow), Dr. David Dick, (Norfolk and Norwich University Hospital), Dr. Melissa Maguire (The Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust), Dr. Colin Mumford (Western General Hospital, Edinburgh) and Dr. Cheryl Longman (NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde) for patient referral. We would also like to thank the anonymous reviewers whose insightful comments have improved the manuscript, to Dr. Helen A. Tuppen for technical assistance with the mtDNA copy number assay and to Mr. Doug Jerry for cohort data entry. Ethical approval was granted by the Newcastle and North Tyneside Research Ethics Committee (13/NE/036). This work was supported by a Wellcome Trust Fellowship (204709/Z/16/Z) to SJP, the Wellcome Centre for Mitochondrial Research (203105/Z/16/Z), the Medical Research Council (MRC) Centre for Translational Research in Neuromuscular Disease, the Mitochondrial Disease Patient Cohort (UK) (G0800674), the Lily Foundation, the UK NIHR Biomedical Research Centre for Ageing and Age-related Disease Award to the Newcastle upon Tyne Foundation Hospitals NHS Trust and the UK NHS Highly Specialised Service for Rare Mitochondrial Disorders of Adults and Children. CLA was supported by a National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) doctoral fellowship (NIHR-HCS-D12-03-04). YSN holds an NIHR clinical lectureship. The views expressed in the submitted article are the authors’ own and not an official position of the institution or funder.

Author contributions
Conception and design of the study: JPG, SJP, RMcF, RWT, DMT, RJQMcN. Acquisition and analysis of data: SJP, JPG, YSN, CLA, ELB, SAH, AMS, CSG, CLF, AAB, RMcF. Drafting the manuscript: SJP. Critical review of manuscript: JPG, RMcF, RWT, DMT, CSG, RJQMcN, YSN.

John P Grady et al m.3243A-G disease burden and progression EMBO Molecular Medicine
Conflict of interest
The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

References

Apabhai S, Gorman GS, Sutton L, Elson JL, Plotz T, Turnbull DM, Trenell MI (2011) Habitual physical activity in mitochondrial disease. PLoS ONE 6: e22924

Benda C, Zhou T, Wang X, Tian W, Grilli J, Tse HF, Grilli-Voglauer R, Pei D, Esteban MA (2013) Urine as a source of stem cells. Adv Biochem Eng Biotechnol 129: 19–32

Bentlage HA, Attardi G (1996) Relationship of genotype to phenotype in fibroblast-derived transmitted mitochondrial cell lines carrying the 3243 mutation associated with the MELAS encephalomyopathy: shift towards mutant genotype and role of mtDNA copy number. Hum Mol Genet 5: 197–205

Bets J, Jaros E, Perry RH, Schaefer AM, Taylor RW, Abdel-All Z, Lightowlers RN, Turnbull DM (2006) Molecular neuropathology of MELAS: level of heteroplasmy in individual neurons and evidence of extensive vascular involvement. Neuropathol Appl Neurobiol 32: 359–373

Brown CE (1998) Coefficient of variation. In Applied multivariate statistics in geohydrology and related sciences, Brown CE (ed), pp 155–157. Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg

Cao X, Zhao ZW, Zhou HY, Chen GQ, Yang HJ (2011) Effects of exercise intensity on copy number and mutations of mitochondrial DNA in gastrocnemius muscles in mice. Mol Med Rep 6: 426–428

Chinnery PF, Howell N, Lightowlers RN, Turnbull DM (1997) Molecular pathology of MELAS and MERRF. The relationship between mutation load and clinical phenotypes. Brain 120( Pt 10): 1713–1721

Elliott HR, Samuels DC, Eden JA, Reiton CL, Chinnery PF (2008) Pathogenic mitochondrial DNA mutations are common in the general population. Am J Hum Genet 83: 254–260

Faysouil A, Laforet P, Bougouin W, Jardel C, Lombes A, Becane HM, Berber N, Bentlage HA, Attardi G (2012) Impaired respiratory function in MELAS-induced pluripotent stem cells with high heteroplasmy levels. FEBS Open Bio 5: 219–225

de Laat P, Koene S, van den Heuvel LP, Rodenburg RJ, Janssen MC, Smetsink JA (2012) Clinical features and heteroplasmy in blood, urine and saliva in 34 Dutch families carrying the m.3243A>G mutation. J Inherit Metab Dis 35: 1059–1069

de Laat P, Janssen MC, Alston CL, Taylor RW, Rodenburg RJ, Smetsink JA (2016) Three families with "de novo" m.3243A>G mutation. BBA Clin 6: 19–24

Liu CS, Cheng WL, Lee CF, Ma YS, Lin CY, Huang CC, Wei YH (2006) Alteration in the copy number of mitochondrial DNA in leukocytes of patients with mitochondrial encephalomyopathies. Acta Neurol Scand 113: 334–341

Liu H, Ma Y, Fang F, Zhang Y, Zou L, Yang Y, Zhu S, Wang S, Zheng X, Pei P et al (2013) Wild-type mitochondrial DNA copy number in urinary cells as a useful marker for diagnosing severity of the mitochondrial diseases. PLoS ONE 8: e67146

Maeda K, Kawai H, Sanada M, Terashima T, Ogawa N, Idehara R, Makishi T, Yasuda H, Sato S, Hoshi KI et al (2016) Clinical phenotype and heteroplasmy in blood, urine and saliva in 34 Dutch families carrying the m.3243A>G mutation. J Inherit Metab Dis 35: 1059–1069

Mancuso M, Orsucci D, Angelini C, Bertini E, Carelli V, Comi GP, Donati A, Minetti C, Moggio M, Mongini T et al (2014) The m.3243A>G mitochondrial DNA mutation and related phenotypes. A matter of gender? J Neurol 261: 504–510

Mehrazin R, Shanske S, Kaufmann P, Wei Y, Coku J, Engelstad K, Naini A, De Vivo DC, DiMauro S (2009) Longitudinal changes of mtDNA A3243G mutation load and level of functioning in MELAS. Am J Med Genet A 149A: 584–587

Nesbitt V, Piteathly RD, Turnbull DM, Taylor RW, Sweeney MG, Mudenwobho EE, Rahman S, Hanna MG, McFarland R (2013) The UK MRC Mitochondrial Disease Patient Cohort Study: clinical phenotypes associated with the m.3243A>G mutation–implications for diagnosis and management. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 84: 936–938

Perneger TV (1998) What’s wrong with Bonferroni adjustments. BMJ 316: 1236–1238

Picard M, Hirano M (2016) Disentangling (Epi)genetic and environmental contributions to the mitochondrial m.3243A>G mutation phenotype: phenotypic destiny in mitochondrial disease? JAMA Neurol 73: 923–925

Pickett SJ, Grady JP, Ng YS, Gorman GS, Schaefer AM, Wilson IW, Cordell HJ, Turnbull DM, Taylor RW, McFarland R (2018) Phenotypic heterogeneity in m.3243A>G mitochondrial disease: the role of nuclear factors. Ann Clin Transl Neuro 5: 333–345

m.3243A>G disease burden and progression  John P Grady et al
Pinheiro JBD, DebRoy S, Sarkar D, R Core Team (2016) nlme: linear and nonlinear mixed effects models. R package version 3.1-127. URL http://CRAN.R-project.org/package=nlme

Pyle A, Taylor RW, Durham SE, Deschauer M, Schaefer AM, Samuels DC, Chinnery PF (2007) Depletion of mitochondrial DNA in leucocytes harbouring the 3243A->G mtDNA mutation. J Med Genet 44: 69 – 74

R Core Team (2016) R: a language and environment for statistical computing. Vienna, Austria: R Foundation for Statistical Computing. URL https://www.R-project.org

Rahman S, Poulton J, Marchington D, Suomalainen A (2001) Decrease of 3243 A->G mtDNA mutation from blood in MELAS syndrome: a longitudinal study. Am J Hum Genet 68: 238 – 240

Rajasimha HK, Chinnery PF, Samuels DC (2008) Selection against pathogenic mtDNA mutations in a stem cell population leads to the loss of the 3243A->G mutation in blood. Am J Hum Genet 82: 333 – 343

Schaefer AM, Phoenix C, Elson JL, McFarland R, Chinnery PF, Turnbull DM (2006) Mitochondrial disease in adults: a scale to monitor progression and treatment. Neurology 66: 1932 – 1934

Sue CM, Quigley A, Katsabanis S, Kapsa R, Crimmins DS, Byrne E, Morris JG (1998) Detection of MELAS A3243G point mutation in muscle, blood and hair follicles. J Neurol Sci 161: 36 – 39

Weiduschat N, Kaufmann P, Mao X, Engelstad KM, Hinton V, DiMauro S, De Vivo D, Shungu D (2014) Cerebral metabolic abnormalities in A3243G mitochondrial DNA mutation carriers. Neurology 82: 798 – 805

Whittaker RG, Blackwood JK, Alston CL, Blakely EL, Elson JL, McFarland R, Chinnery PF, Turnbull DM, Taylor RW (2009) Urine heteroplasmy is the best predictor of clinical outcome in the m.3243A>G mtDNA mutation. Neurology 72: 568 – 569

License: This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.