Modulation of Acupuncture on Cell Apoptosis and Autophagy

Dan Luo,1 Rui Chen,1 and Feng-xia Liang2

1Department of Traditional Chinese Medicine, Union Hospital, Tongji Medical College, Huazhong University of Science and Technology, No. 1277 Jiefang Street, Wuhan, Hubei 430022, China
2Department of Acupuncture and Moxibustion, Hubei University of Traditional Chinese Medicine, No. 1 Tanhualin Street, Wuhan, Hubei 430060, China

Correspondence should be addressed to Rui Chen; unioncr@163.com

Received 23 June 2017; Revised 20 August 2017; Accepted 14 September 2017; Published 27 November 2017

Acupuncture has been historically practiced to treat medical disorders by mechanically stimulating specific acupoints. Despite its well-documented efficacy, its biological basis largely remains elusive. Recent studies suggested that cell apoptosis and autophagy might play key roles in acupuncture therapy. Therefore, we searched PubMed, Embase, Web of Science, and China National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI), aiming to find the potential relationship between acupuncture and cell apoptosis and autophagy. To provide readers with objective evidence, some problems regarding the design method, acupoints selection, acupuncture intervention measure, and related diseases existing in 40 related researches were shown in this review. These findings demonstrated that acupuncture has a potential role in modulating cell apoptosis and autophagy in animal models, suggesting it as a candidate mechanism in acupuncture therapy to maintain physiologic homeostasis.

1. Introduction

Acupuncture is a key component of traditional Chinese medicine (TCM) and a main form of alternative medicine [1]. The therapy functions by means of stimulating certain acupoints in the human body to activate meridians and collaterals and regulate the function of Zang-Fu organs and Qi and blood [2]. Acupuncture, with many categories such as manual acupuncture (MA), electroacupuncture (EA), laser acupuncture, and acupoint injection, has turned out to be relatively safe with few adverse effects [3].

Apoptosis and autophagy are two important cellular processes which control cell survival or death [4] and are also considered as a balanced response to pathogens and other immune stimuli that play an important role in maintaining physiologic homeostasis [5]. Apoptosis- and autophagy-related mechanisms have been increasingly valued in neurological diseases [6], diabetes mellitus [7], and cancer [8]. However, there are few effective and safe ways to regulate cell apoptosis and autophagy in clinical practice right now.

The treatment of acupuncture in diseases like nerve injury has been extensively studied for a long time [9]. Acupuncture could regulate multiple molecules and signaling pathways that lead to excitotoxicity, oxidative stress, inflammation, and neurons death and survival and also promote neurogenesis, angiogenesis, and neuroplasticity after ischemic damage [10]. Based on recent studies, the mechanism of acupuncture to treat medical disorders has a high degree of overlap with cell apoptosis and autophagy, which may provide a new direction for the clinical application and basic research. Up to now, there has been no review to clarify the potential relationship between acupuncture and cell apoptosis and autophagy. Herein, we performed a review, in particular focused on the therapy of acupuncture, including design method, acupoints selection, acupuncture intervention measure, and related diseases, trying to find out the detailed mechanism and objective evidence for modulation of acupuncture on cell apoptosis and autophagy.

2. Materials and Methods

Relevant studies were identified from the online electronic databases PubMed, Embase, Web of Science, and China National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI). Search terms
consisted of three groups: apoptosis and autophagy (an important mechanism for the treatment of diseases or maintaining homeostasis), intervention (acupuncture and other related terms), and study type (randomized controlled trial and other related terms). Methodological quality of individual studies was assessed by (1) risk of bias, (2) inconsistency, (3) indirectness, (4) imprecision, and (5) publication bias. Finally, 40 articles were identified in this review, which were published in English only and provided full text until May 2017.

3. Results

All 40 articles were randomized controlled trials for animal studies. There was a huge change regarding the literature published from 2003 to 2017. During the first decade, only a few reports were published each year, with a substantial increase in the last four years (Figure 1).

Acupoints selection was performed according to both clinical reports and traditional Chinese medicine theory. Most articles were related to neurological diseases like ischemia-reperfusion (I/R) that caused some certain acupoints to be used more frequently than others such as GV20 (Baihui) and ST36 (Zusanli).

All results indicated that acupuncture has the effect of suppressing cell death (TUNEL assay or other tests, \( p < 0.05 \) or 0.01), inhibiting inflammation, or removing pathologic products though regulating cell apoptosis and autophagy (\( p < 0.05 \) or 0.01). The mechanism of acupuncture in modulation of cell apoptosis and autophagy, which was associated with regulating the expression of Bcl-2/Bax, caspase family, Fas/FasL, c-Fos, TNF-\( \alpha \), or NFkB, has been extensively and intensively studied from biological and immunological perspectives. Detailed information of all researches is shown in Table 1.

4. Discussion

To our knowledge, this is the first review to explore the efficacy of acupuncture for modulating cell apoptosis and autophagy. Based on the biological and immunological results in 40 studies, it is indicated that acupuncture could regulate the expression of Bcl-2/Bax, caspase family, Fas/FasL, c-Fos, TNF-\( \alpha \), and NFkB, which modulated cell apoptosis and autophagy to reduce cell death (TUNEL assay or other tests, \( p < 0.05 \) or 0.01) in different pathological states especially ischemic stroke. Most studies suggested that acupuncture suppresses cell apoptosis. However, it is interesting that acupuncture plays a dual role in regulating autophagy. Acupuncture could not only promote autophagy to remove pathology products, but also inhibit autophagy against cell death in different periods of diseases. All the results suggested that acupuncture on cell apoptosis and autophagy does not have specificity and involves numerous pathways.

Acupuncture has been known as an effective therapy in neurobiology [11] and immunology [12], but the mechanism is still unclear. It is recognized that cell apoptosis and autophagy are associated with more and more diseases. Apoptosis, a key regulator of tissue homeostasis, is tightly regulated with the interaction of activating and inhibitory pathways. Aberrant induction of cell apoptosis may result in neurodegenerative, chronic, inflammatory, and autoimmune diseases, among others [12]. Autophagy, an intracellular process in which cytoplasmic materials are transported by double-membraned autophagosomes to lysosomes for degradation [13], is a highly conservative biological degradation pathway that plays essential roles in cell homeostasis, development, and survival [14]. So, we hypothesize that cell apoptosis and autophagy might play key roles in acupuncture treatment of diseases.

The latest researches reported that epigenetic modification plays a great role in cell apoptosis and autophagy [15, 16]. SIRT1 (silent mating type information regulation 2 homolog 1) is an NAD-dependent deacetylase which has a deacetylation activity in the modulation of cell stress signals via epigenetics [17], and the deacetylation of histone via SIRT1 was considered as an important intervention for apoptosis and autophagy [18]. Our previous study confirmed that acupuncture induces the activation of SIRT1 [19], so it is expected that acupuncture-SIRT1-epigenetic modification to modulate cell apoptosis and autophagy will be investigated in the near future.

There are some limitations to this review. Firstly, our search only included English articles and excluded those articles published in other languages. Although we have performed comprehensive literature search, the total number of studies and the total sample size were too small to be reliable.
Table 1: Modulation of acupuncture on cell apoptosis and autophagy.

| Diseases related           | Models                                      | Control group | Acupoints       | Effects of acupuncture intervention                                                                 | Study |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| Alzheimer’s disease (AD)  | Intrahippocampally injected Ap1-40 model, rats | Non-EA        | Du20, BL23, EA  | (1) The Hoechst 33342 positive apoptotic cells decreased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(2) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(3) The protein expression of Bax was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(4) The mRNA expression of Notch1 and hes1 was decreased \( p < 0.05 \) and \( p < 0.01 \) | [20]  |
| Brain function disorder   | Normal, rats                                | Non-MA        | SJ5, MA         | Both the mRNA and protein expression of Bcl-2 were increased \( p < 0.01 \)                        | [21]  |
| Central poststroke pain (CPSP) | The CPSP model, single collagenase injection into the left ventral posterolateral nucleus of the thalamus, rats | Non-EA        | GV20, ST36, EA  | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(2) The expression of COX-2, \( \beta \)-catenin, and NK-1R was decreased \( p < 0.01 \) | [22]  |
| Cervical spondylosis (CS) | Inducing cervical IVD degradation through unbalanced dynamic and static forces, rats | Non-EA        | GV14, EA        | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(2) The expression of TNF-\( \alpha \), TNFRI, and caspase-8 was decreased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(3) Both the mRNA and protein expression of integrin-\( \beta \)1 and Akt were increased \( p < 0.05 \) | [23]  |
| Cerebral palsy (CP)       | Hypoxia-ischemia (HI), rats                 | Non-MA        | GV20, Ex-HN1, MA | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(2) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(3) The protein expression of Bax, caspase-3, and caspase-9 was decreased \( p < 0.05 \) | [24]  |
| Depressive-like and anxiety-like behaviors | The CUS model, rats                           | Non-EA        | DU20, GB34, EA  | (1) The BrdU-positive cells (ANPs) obviously increased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(2) The Hoechst 33342 positive apoptotic cells (QNPS) decreased \( p < 0.05 \) | [25]  |
| Heroin addiction          | Heroin readdiction was produced through repeated exposure and detoxification, rats | Non-EA        | GV20, GV14, EA  | (1) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(2) The protein expression of Bax was decreased \( p < 0.01 \) | [26]  |
### Table 1: Continued.

| Diseases related       | Models                                                                 | Control group | Acupoints       | Effects of acupuncture intervention                                                                 | Study |
|------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| Ischemic stroke        | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats                     | Non-EA        | LU5, LI4, ST36, SP6, EA | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(2) The protein expression levels of p-ERK were increased \( p < 0.05 \)                                  | [27]  |
| Ischemic stroke        | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats                     | Non-EA        | GV 20, EA       | (1) Both the mRNA and protein expression of NDRG2 were inhibited \( p < 0.01 \)  
(2) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                  | [28]  |
| Ischemic stroke        | Transient global ischemia, gerbils                                     | Non-MA        | ST36, LI4, MA   | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells obviously decreased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(2) The BrdU-positive cells obviously increased \( p < 0.01 \)                                  | [29]  |
| Ischemic stroke        | The common carotid arteries (CCAs) were occluded using aneurysm clips for 5 min, gerbils | Non-MA        | ST36, LI4, MA   | (1) The expression of εPKC was increased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(2) The TUNEL-positive cells obviously decreased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(3) The caspase-3-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(4) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(5) The protein expression of Bax was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                  | [30]  |
| Ischemic stroke        | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats                     | Non-EA        | GV 20, EA       | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(2) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(3) The protein expression of Bax was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(4) The BrdU+/Nestin+ cells obviously increased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(5) Both the mRNA and protein expression of MMP-9 were decreased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(6) Both the mRNA and protein expression of TIMP-1 were increased \( p < 0.05 \)                                  | [31]  |
| Ischemic stroke        | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats                     | Non-EA        | GV20, LI4, LR3, EA | (1) The protein expression of LC3 and Beclin-1 was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(2) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.01 \)  
(3) The Bcl-2-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                  | [32]  |
| Ischemic stroke        | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats                     | Non-EA        | GV26, EA        | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(2) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased \( p < 0.05 \)  
(3) The Bcl-2-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                  | [33]  |
| Diseases related          | Models                                      | Control group | Acupoints  | Effects of acupuncture intervention                                                                 |
|--------------------------|---------------------------------------------|---------------|------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Ischemic stroke          | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats | Non-EA        | GV20, GV16 | (1) The ratio of cytosolic p-p38 MAPK/p38 MAPK expression was increased \( p < 0.05 \)          |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (2) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased \( p < 0.05 \)                                |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (3) The protein expression of Bax was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                 |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (4) The expression of caspase-3 was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                  |
| Ischemic stroke          | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats | Non-EA        | LII1, ST36, EA | (1) The level of LC3BII/LC3BI was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                   |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (2) The expression of mTORC1 was increased \( p < 0.01 \)                                    |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (3) The expression of Beclin-1 was decreased \( p < 0.01 \)                                  |
| Ischemic stroke          | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats | Non-EA        | DU20, DU24 | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                           |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (2) The expression of NF-κB p65 was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                 |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (3) The mRNA expression of Bax and Fas was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                          |
| Ischemic stroke          | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats | Non-EA        | LII1, ST36 | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.01 \)                                           |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (2) The expression of PI3K and p-Akt was increased \( p < 0.05 \)                            |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (3) Both the mRNA and protein expression of Bcl-2 were increased \( p < 0.05 \)               |
| Ischemic stroke          | Model of cerebral ischemia-reperfusion, rats | Non-EA        | BL3, BL17, GV20 | The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.01 \)                                                |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (1) The expression of GluR2 was increased \( p < 0.05 \)                                      |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (2) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased \( p < 0.05 \)                             |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (3) The protein expression of Bax was decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                              |
| Ischemic stroke          | Global cerebral ischemia, mice              | Non-EA        | GV20, EA   | (1) The number of autophagosomes was decreased \( 12 \text{ h after I/S} \) \( p < 0.05 \) |
|                          |                                             |               |            | (2) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased \( p < 0.05 \)                                        |
| Diseases related          | Models                                                                 | Control group | Acupoints | Effects of acupuncture intervention                                                                 | Study |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|-----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| Ischemic stroke          | Middle cerebral artery occlusion (MCAO) model, rats                    | Non-EA        | GV20, EA  | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(2) The number of autophagosomes was increased (2h after I/S) ($p < 0.05$)  
(3) The ratio of p-mTOR/mTOR was increased ($p < 0.01$) | [41]  |
| Ischemic stroke          | Cerebral ischemia-reperfusion model, rats                              | Non-EA        | GV4, GV6, GV14, GV20, GV24, GV26, EA | The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.01$) | [42]  |
| Intracerebral hemorrhage (ICH) | Intracranial hemorrhage model, rats                              | Non-MA        | GV14, GV16, MA | (1) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased ($p < 0.05$)  
(2) The protein expression of Bax was decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(3) The protein expression of caspase-3 was decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(4) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.001$) | [43]  |
| Ischemic preconditioning (IPC) | Chest incision and 20 minutes of ischemia followed by 40 minutes of reperfusion, rats | Non-EA        | PC6, CV7, EA | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(2) The expression of c-Fos mRNA was increased ($p < 0.05$) | [44]  |
| Intracerebral hemorrhage | Model of intracerebral hemorrhage, rats                              | Non-MA        | ST36, MA  | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(2) The caspase-3-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.05$) | [45]  |
| Intervertebral disc (IVD) degeneration | Inducing cervical IVD degradation, rats                              | Non-EA        | DU14, LI10, EA | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.01$)  
(2) The expression of Bcl-2 was increased ($p < 0.05$)  
(3) The expression of Bax was decreased ($p < 0.01$)  
(4) The expression of caspase-3 and caspase-9 was decreased ($p < 0.01$)  
(5) Both the mRNA and protein expression of CrK and ERK2 were increased ($p < 0.05$) | [46]  |
| Intervertebral disc degeneration (IVDD) | Using a custom-made external compression device to stimulate disc degeneration, rats | Non-EA        | Ex-B2, EA  | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(2) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased ($p < 0.05$) | [47]  |
Table 1: Continued.

| Diseases related                      | Models                                                                 | Control group | Acupoints | Effects of acupuncture intervention                                                                 | Study |
|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|-----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| Peripheral nerve injury               | Model was established by mechanical clamping of the sciatic nerve stem, rats | Non-EA        | GB30, EA  | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased $(p < 0.05)$                                                | [48]  |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (2) The expression of Bcl-2 was increased $(p < 0.05)$                                              |       |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (3) The expression of Bax was decreased $(p < 0.05)$                                               |       |
| Parkinson’s disease (PD)              | PD model, MPTP 30 mg/kg/d, 5 days, mice                                | Non-MA        | GB34, MA  | (1) The expression level of LC3II was decreased $(p < 0.05)$                                        | [49]  |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (2) The expression level of LAMP1 was increased $(p < 0.05)$                                        |       |
| Spinal cord ischemia-reperfusion (I/R) injury | The spinal cord I/R model received aortic arch exposure or cross-clamping for 14 min, rats | Non-EA        | GV6, GV9, EX-B2, EA | (1) The expression of miR-214 was increased $(p < 0.01)$                                          | [50]  |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (2) The protein expression of Bcl-2 was increased $(p < 0.01)$                                      |       |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (3) The protein expression of Bax was decreased $(p < 0.01)$                                        |       |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (4) The protein expression of caspase-3 was decreased $(p < 0.01)$                                 |       |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (5) The TUNEL-positive cells obviously decreased $(p < 0.01)$                                       |       |
| Spinal cord injury (SCI)              | Models were deeply anesthetized with an intraperitoneal injection of 1% pentobarbital sodium (35 mg/kg), rats | Non-EA        | GV6, GV9, EA | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells obviously decreased $(p < 0.001)$                                     | [51]  |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (2) The expression of miR-449a was increased $(p < 0.01)$                                          |       |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (3) The ratio of Bax/Bcl-2 expression was decreased $(p < 0.01)$                                    |       |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (4) The protein expression of caspase-3, TNF-α, and IL-1β was decreased $(p < 0.01)$               |       |
| Spinal cord injury (SCI)              | Model of bladder dysfunction after SCI, rabbits                        | Non-EA        | BL54, ST28, CV6, CV3, EA | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased $(p < 0.001)$                                              | [52]  |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (2) The expression of p-Akt and p-ERK1/2 was increased $(p < 0.01)$                               |       |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (3) The expression of Cyt c and caspase-3 was decreased $(p < 0.01)$                               |       |
| Spinal cord injury (SCI)              | T10 segment spinal cord injury (SCI) model, rats                        | Non-EA        | DU9, EA   | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased $(p < 0.01)$                                                | [53]  |
|                                       |                                                                        |               |           | (2) The ratio of Bax/Bcl-2 expression was decreased $(p < 0.01)$                                    |       |
| Sepsis (for brain injury)             | Exposing cecum with ligation and puncture, rats                        | Non-EA        | GV20, ST36, EA | (1) The expression of IL-6, TNF-α, NF-κB, and TLR-4 was decreased $(p < 0.05)$               | [54]  |
| Diseases related | Models | Control group | Acupoints | Effects of acupuncture intervention | Study |
|------------------|--------|---------------|-----------|------------------------------------|-------|
| Surgical trauma  | Model of surgical trauma, rats | Non-EA | ST36, EXTRA37, EA | (1) The number of splenocytes was increased ($p < 0.01$)  
(2) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(3) The protein expression of Fas was decreased | [55] |
| Surgical trauma  | Model of surgical trauma, rats | Non-EA | ST36, EXTRA37, EA | (1) The apoptotic rate of the splenic lymphocytes was decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(2) The protein expression of TNF-α and TNFR1 was decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(3) The protein expression of caspase-3 and caspase-8 was decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(4) The activity of JNK and NF-κB was decreased ($p < 0.05$) | [56] |
| Transient brain ischemia | High-sustained positive acceleration (+Gz) exposure, rats | Non-EA | GV20, EA | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.05$)  
(2) The expression of caspase-3 was decreased ($p < 0.05$) | [57] |
| Ulcerative colitis (UC) | Model of ulcerative colitis was established by immunological methods and local stimulation, rats | Non-EA | RN6, ST25, EA | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells obviously decreased ($p < 0.01$)  
(2) The expression of Bcl-2 was increased ($p < 0.01$)  
(3) The expression of Bax was decreased ($p < 0.01$)  
(4) The expression of Fas/FasL was decreased ($p < 0.01$) | [58] |
| Vascular dementia (VaD) | 0.3 mL of 3% clot suspension was injected into the internal carotid artery, rats | Non-MA | CV17, CV12, CV6, T36, SP10, MA | (1) The TUNEL-positive cells decreased ($p < 0.01$)  
(2) Both the mRNA and protein expression of Bax were decreased ($p < 0.01$)  
(3) Both the mRNA and protein expression of Bcl-2 were increased ($p < 0.01$) | [59] |

EA: electroacupuncture; MA: manual acupuncture; I/R: ischemia-reperfusion; TUNEL: terminal deoxynucleotidyl transferase-mediated dUTP-biotin nick end labeling; TNF-α: tumor necrosis factor-α; IL-1β: interleukin-1β; MMP-9: matrix metalloproteinase-9; LC3: microtubule-associated protein light chain; NDRG2: human N-Myc downstream-regulated gene 2; COX-2: cyclooxygenase-2; NK-1R: neurokinin 1 receptor; BrdU: 5-bromo-2′-deoxyuridine; ERK1/2: Ras-dependent extracellular signal-regulated kinase 1/2; CUS: chronic unpredictable stress; εPKC: epsilon protein kinase C; TIMPs: tissue inhibitors of metalloproteinases; mTORC1: mammalian target of rapamycin complex 1; NF-κB: nuclear factor-kappa B; TLR-4: toll-like receptor-4.
Secondly, articles which reported negative results may not be popular to publish so that the effectiveness of published articles would be better than those unpublished, which may cause publication bias. Thirdly, due to the lack of repeat test under the same conditions, the conviction of the conclusion is still insufficient. Based on the above limitations, detailed results of each study were shown in this review to provide objective evidence on acupuncture modulation of apoptosis and autophagy.

5. Conclusion

In conclusion, studies suggested that acupuncture has a potential role in modulating cell apoptosis and autophagy in animal models, suggesting it as a candidate mechanism in acupuncture therapy to maintain physiologic homeostasis. However, detailed mechanisms were still not very legible and the publication bias may reduce persuasiveness of positive results. Hence, more high-quality randomized controlled trials to clarify the role of the relevant mechanisms are needed in the future.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

Acknowledgments

This review was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (no. 81574065).

References

[1] Y. Ye, W. Zhu, X.-R. Wang et al., "Mechanisms of acupuncture on vascular dementia—a review of animal studies," Neurochemistry International, vol. 107, pp. 204–210, 2016.

[2] X.-C. Zhang, X.-P. Xu, W.-T. Xu et al., "Acupuncture therapy for sudden sensorineural hearing loss: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials," PLoS ONE, vol. 10, no. 4, Article ID e0125240, 2015.

[3] L. Xu, H. Xu, W. Gao, W. Wang, H. Zhang, and D. P. Lu, "Treating angina pectoris by acupuncture therapy," Acupuncture & Electro-Therapeutics Research, vol. 38, no. 1-2, pp. 17–35, 2013.

[4] S. Mukhopadhay, P. K. Panda, N. Sinha, D. N. Das, and S. K. Bhutia, "Autophagy and apoptosis: where do they meet?" Apoptosis, vol. 19, no. 4, pp. 555–566, 2014.

[5] M. G. Kemp, "Crosstalk between apoptosis and autophagy: environmental genotoxins, infection, and innate immunity," Journal of Cell Death, vol. 10, p. 117967071668508, 2017.

[6] C. J. Hong, H. Park, and S.-W. Yu, "Autophagy for the quality control of adult hippocampal neural stem cells," Brain Research, vol. 1649, pp. 166–172, 2016.

[7] J. Su, L. Zhou, X. Kong et al., "Endoplasmic reticulum is at the crossroads of autophagy, inflammation, and apoptosis signaling pathways and participates in the pathogenesis of diabetes mellitus," Journal of Diabetes Research, vol. 2013, Article ID 193461, 6 pages, 2013.

[8] G. Liu, F. Pei, F. Yang et al., "Role of autophagy and apoptosis in non-small-cell lung cancer," International Journal of Molecular Sciences, vol. 18, no. 2, article 367, 2017.

[9] A. Yang, H. M. Wu, J. L. Tang, L. Xu, M. Yang, and G. J. Liu, "Acupuncture for stroke rehabilitation," Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, vol. 8, p. D4131, 2016.

[10] W. Zhu, Y. Ye, Y. Liu et al., "Mechanisms of acupuncture therapy for cerebral ischemia: an evidence-based review of clinical and animal studies on cerebral ischemia," Journal of Neuroimmune Pharmacology, vol. 12, no. 4, pp. 575–592, 2017.

[11] L. Bai and L. Lao, "Neurobiological foundations of acupuncture: the relevance and future prospect based on neuroimagining evidence," Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine, vol. 2013, Article ID 812568, 9 pages, 2013.

[12] Y.-T. Peng, P. Chen, R.-Y. Ouyang, and L. Song, "Multifaceted role of prohibitin in cell survival and apoptosis," Apoptosis, vol. 20, no. 9, pp. 1135–1149, 2015.

[13] M. Bras, B. Queenan, and S. A. Susin, "Programmed cell death via mitochondria: different modes of dying," Biochemistry (Moscow), vol. 70, no. 2, pp. 231–239, 2005.

[14] B. Levine and G. Kroemer, "Autophagy in the pathogenesis of disease," Cell, vol. 132, no. 1, pp. 27–42, 2008.

[15] S. H. Baek and K. I. Kim, "Epigenetic control of autophagy: nuclear events gain more attention," Molecular Cell, vol. 65, no. 5, pp. 781–785, 2017.

[16] J. Han, Q.-C. Wang, J. Zhu et al., "Deoxynivalenol exposure induces autophagy/apoptosis and epigenetic modification changes during porcine oocyte maturation," Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology, vol. 300, pp. 70–76, 2016.

[17] Y. Nakatani and R. Inagi, "Epigenetic regulation through SIRT1 in podocytes," Current Hypertension Reviews, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 89–94, 2016.

[18] Á. Bánréti, M. Sass, and Y. Graba, "The emerging role of acetylation in the regulation of autophagy," Autophagy, vol. 9, no. 6, pp. 819–829, 2013.

[19] D. Koya, F. Liang, R. Chen et al., "Low-frequency electroacupuncture improves insulin sensitivity in obese diabetic mice through activation of SIRT1/PGC-1α in skeletal muscle," Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine, vol. 2011, Article ID 735297, 9 pages, 2011.

[20] H.-D. Guo, J.-X. Tian, J. Zhu et al., "Electroacupuncture suppressed neuronal apoptosis and improved cognitive impairment in the ad model rats possibly via downregulation of notch signaling pathway," Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine, vol. 2015, Article ID 393569, 9 pages, 2015.

[21] D. Lin, L.-L. Lin, K. Sutherland, and C.-H. Cao, "Manual acupuncture at the SJ5 (Waiguan) acupoint shows neuroprotective effects by regulating expression of the anti-apoptotic gene Bcl-2," Neural Regeneration Research, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 305–311, 2016.

[22] G.-H. Tian, S.-S. Tao, M.-T. Chen et al., "Electroacupuncture treatment alleviates central poststroke pain by inhibiting brain neuronal apoptosis and aberrant astrocyte activation," Neural Plasticity, vol. 2016, Article ID 1437148, 14 pages, 2016.

[23] J. Liao, L. Zhang, J. Zheng, D. Yu, M. Ke, and T. Xu, "Electroacupuncture inhibits annulus fibrosis cell apoptosis in vivo via TNF-α-TNFRI-caspase-8 and integrin β1/Akt signaling pathways," Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine, vol. 34, no. 6, pp. 684–690, 2014.

[24] Y. Zhang, R. Lan, J. Wang et al., "Acupuncture reduced apoptosis and up-regulated BDNF and GDNF expression in hippocampus following hypoxia-ischemia in neonatal rats," Journal of Ethnopharmacology, vol. 172, pp. 124–132, 2015.
[25] L. Yang, N. Yue, X. Zhu et al., “Electroacupuncture promotes proliferation of amplifying neural progenitors and preserves quiescent neural progenitors from apoptosis to alleviate depressive-like and anxiety-like behaviours,” *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, vol. 2014, Article ID 872568, 13 pages, 2014.

[26] X. R. Hou, R. J. Zhang, H. Lv, X. H. Cai, G. C. Xie, and X. G. Song, “Acupuncture at Bailai and Dazhui reduces brain cell apoptosis in heroin readicts,” *Neural Regeneration Research*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 164–170, 2014.

[27] C.-X. Wu, J. Wang, C. Li et al., “Effect of electroacupuncture on cell apoptosis and erk signal pathway in the hippocampus of adult rats with cerebral ischemia-reperfusion,” *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, vol. 2015, Article ID 414965, 10 pages, 2015.

[28] F. Wang, Z. Gao, X. Li et al., “NDRG2 is involved in anti-apoptosis induced by electroacupuncture pretreatment after focal cerebral ischemia in rats,” *Neurological Research*, vol. 35, no. 4, pp. 406–414, 2013.

[29] J. H. Chung, E. Lee, M. Jang et al., “Acupuncture decreases ischemia-induced apoptosis and cell proliferation in dentate gyrus of gerbils,” *Neurological Research*, vol. 29, supplement 1, pp. S23–S27, 2007.

[30] M.-H. Jang, M.-C. Shin, T.-H. Lee et al., “Acupuncture suppresses ischemia-induced increase in c-Fos expression and apoptosis in the hippocampal CA1 region in gerbils,” *Neuroscience Letters*, vol. 347, no. 1, pp. 5–8, 2003.

[31] Q. Wang, X. Li, Y. Chen et al., “Activation of epsilon protein kinase C-mediated anti-apoptosis is involved in rapid tolerance induced by electroacupuncture pretreatment through cannabinoid receptor type 1,” *Stroke*, vol. 42, no. 2, pp. 389–396, 2011.

[32] R. Ma, B. Yuan, J. Du et al., “Electroacupuncture alleviates nerve injury after cerebra ischemia in rats through inhibiting cell apoptosis and changing the balance of MMP-9/TIMP-1 expression,” *Neuroscience Letters*, vol. 633, pp. 158–164, 2016.

[33] S. Shu, C.-M. Li, Y.-L. You, X.-L. Qian, S. Zhou, and C.-Q. Ling, “Electroacupuncture ameliorates cerebral ischemia-reperfusion injury by regulation of autophagy and apoptosis,” *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, vol. 2016, Article ID 7297425, 8 pages, 2016.

[34] C.-Y. Cheng, J.-G. Lin, N.-Y. Tang, and C.-L. Hsieh, “Acupuncture at different frequencies (5Hz and 25Hz) ameliorates cerebral ischemia-reperfusion injury in rats: possible involvement of p38 MAPK-mediated anti-apoptotic signaling pathways,” * BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, vol. 15, no. 1, article 241, 2015.

[35] W. Liu, G. Shang, S. Yang et al., “Electroacupuncture protects against ischemic stroke by reducing autophagosome formation and inhibiting autophagy through the mTORC1-ULK1 complex-Becn1 pathway,” *International Journal of Molecular Medicine*, vol. 37, no. 2, pp. 309–318, 2016.

[36] X. Feng, S. Yang, J. Liu et al., “Electroacupuncture ameliorates cognitive impairment through inhibition of NF-kB-mediated neuronal cell apoptosis in cerebral ischemia-reperfusion injured rats,” *Molecular Medicine Reports*, vol. 7, no. 5, pp. 1516–1522, 2013.

[37] X. Xue, Y. You, J. Tao et al., “Electro-acupuncture at points of Zusanli and Quchi exerts anti-apoptotic effect through the modulation of PI3K/Akt signaling pathway,” *Neuroscience Letters*, vol. 558, pp. 14–19, 2014.

[38] J.-X. Zhao, Y.-X. Tian, H.-L. Xiao, M.-X. Hu, and W.-R. Chen, “Effects of electroacupuncture on hippocampal and cortical apoptosis in a mouse model of cerebral ischemia-reperfusion injury,” *Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine*, vol. 31, no. 4, pp. 349–355, 2011.

[39] Z. Liu, Y. Han, L. Ma et al., “Involvement of Glu R2 up-regulation in neuroprotection by electroacupuncture pretreatment via cannabinoid CB1 receptor in mice,” *Scientific Reports*, vol. 5, article ID 9490, 2015.

[40] Z. Wu, Z. Zou, R. Zou, X. Zhou, and S. Cui, “Electroacupuncture pretreatment induces tolerance against cerebral ischemia/ reperfusion injury through inhibition of the autophagy pathway,” *Molecular Medicine Reports*, vol. 11, no. 6, pp. 4438–4446, 2015.

[41] Z.-Q. Wu, S.-Y. Cui, L. Zhu, and Z.-Q. Zou, “Study on the mechanism of mTOR-mediated autophagy during electroacupuncture pretreatment against cerebral ischemic injury,” *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, vol. 2016, Article ID 912597, 8 pages, 2016.

[42] J. C. Chen, “The effects of acupuncture and traditional Chinese medicines on apoptosis of brain tissue in a rat intracerebral hemorrhage model,” *Physiology & Behavior*, vol. 151, pp. 421–425, 2015.

[43] Z. Lu-hui and S. Zhong-ren, “Gene control of acupuncture and moxibustion preconditioning on apoptosis in ischemic cardiac muscle cells with reperfusion,” *World Science and Technology*, vol. 10, no. 6, pp. 37–40, 2008.

[44] N.-H. Cho, J.-D. Lee, B.-S. Cheong et al., “Acupuncture suppresses intrastriatal hemorrhage-induced apoptotic neuronal cell death in rats,” *Neuroscience Letters*, vol. 362, no. 2, pp. 141–145, 2004.

[45] J. Liao, M. Ke, T. Xu, and L. Lin, “Electroacupuncture inhibits apoptosis in annulus fibrosis cells through suppression of the mitochondria-dependent pathway in a rat model of cervical intervertebral disc degeneration,” *Genetics and Molecular Biology*, vol. 35, no. 3, pp. 686–692, 2012.

[46] G.-F. Huang, J. Zou, J. Shi et al., “Electroacupuncture stimulates remodeling of extracellular matrix by inhibiting apoptosis in a rabbit model of disc degeneration,” *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, vol. 2015, Article ID 386012, 9 pages, 2015.

[47] L. Dai, Y. Han, T. Ma et al., “Effects of deep electroacupuncture stimulation at ‘huantiao’ (GB 30) on expression of apoptosis-related factors in rats with acute sciatic nerve injury,” *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, vol. 2015, Article ID 157897, 8 pages, 2015.

[48] T. Tian, Y. Sun, H. Wu et al., “Acupuncture promotes mTOR-independent autophagic clearance of aggregation-prone proteins in mouse brain,” *Scientific Reports*, vol. 6, Article ID 19714, 2016.

[49] Z. Fang, M. Qin, Y. Li et al., “Electroacupuncture preconditioning and postconditioning inhibit apoptosis and neuroinflammation induced by spinal cord ischemia reperfusion injury through enhancing autophagy in rats,” *Neuroscience Letters*, vol. 642, pp. 136–141, 2017.

[50] J. Liu and Y. Wu, “Electro-acupuncture-modulated miR-214 prevents neuronal apoptosis by targeting Bax and inhibits sodium channel Nav1.3 expression in rats after spinal cord injury,” *Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine*, vol. 31, no. 4, pp. 349–355, 2011.
injury,” Biomedicine & Pharmacotherapy, vol. 89, pp. 1125–1135, 2017.

[52] Q. Renfu, C. Rongliang, D. Mengxuan et al., “Anti-apoptotic signal transduction mechanism of electroacupuncture in acute spinal cord injury,” Acupuncture in Medicine, vol. 32, no. 6, pp. 463–471, 2014.

[53] Y. Zhu, Y. Wu, and R. Zhang, “Electro-acupuncture promotes the proliferation of neural stem cells and the survival of neurons by downregulating miR-449a in rat with spinal cord injury,” EXCLI Journal, vol. 16, pp. 363–374, 2017.

[54] Y. Chen, Y. Lei, L.-Q. Mo et al., “Electroacupuncture pretreatment with different waveforms prevents brain injury in rats subjected to cecal ligation and puncture via inhibiting microglial activation, and attenuating inflammation, oxidative stress and apoptosis,” Brain Research Bulletin, vol. 127, pp. 248–259, 2016.

[55] J. Wang, Y. Wang, J. Yu, X. Cao, and G. Wu, “Electroacupuncture suppresses surgical trauma stress-induced lymphocyte apoptosis in rats,” Neuroscience Letters, vol. 383, no. 1-2, pp. 68–72, 2005.

[56] K. Wang, H. Wu, M. Chi, J. Zhang, G. Wang, and H. Li, “Electroacupuncture inhibits apoptosis of splenic lymphocytes in traumatized rats through modulation of the TNF-α/NF-κB signaling pathway,” Molecular Medicine Reports, vol. 11, no.1, pp. 237–241, 2015.

[57] S. Feng, Q. Wang, H. Wang et al., “Electroacupuncture pretreatment ameliorates hypergravity-induced impairment of learning and memory and apoptosis of hippocampal neurons in rats,” Neuroscience Letters, vol. 478, no. 3, pp. 150–155, 2010.

[58] H. G. Wu, X. Gong, L. Q. Yao et al., “Mechanisms of acupuncture and moxibustion in regulation of epithelial cell apoptosis in rat ulcerative colitis,” World Journal of Gastroenterology, vol. 10, no. 5, pp. 682–688, 2004.

[59] T. Wang, C. Z. Liu, J. C. Yu, W. Jiang, and J. X. Han, “Acupuncture protected cerebral multi-infarction rats from memory impairment by regulating the expression of apoptosis related genes Bcl-2 and Bax in hippocampus,” Physiology & Behavior, vol. 96, no. 1, pp. 155–161, 2009.