Evolutionary sex allocation theory explains sex ratios in natural Plasmodium falciparum infections

Petra Schneider a,*, Hamza A. Babiker b, Amal A.H. Gadalla b,c, Sarah E. Reece a

a Institute of Evolutionary Biology & Institute of Immunology and Infection Research, School of Biological Sciences, University of Edinburgh, Charlotte Auerbach Road, Edinburgh EH9 3JF, United Kingdom
b College of Medicine and Health Sciences, Sultan Qaboos University, PO Box 35, Alkhoud 123, Oman
c Division of Population Medicine, School of Medicine, Cardiff University, Cardiff CF14 4XN, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT
Malaria transmission is achieved by sexual stages, called gametocytes, and the proportion of gametocytes that are male versus female (sex ratio) influences transmission success. In malaria model systems, variation in gametocyte sex ratios can be explained by the predictions of evolutionary sex allocation theory. We test these predictions using natural Plasmodium falciparum infections. The predicted negative correlation between sex ratio and gametocyte density holds: the sex ratio increases when gametocyte densities decrease, and this is most apparent in single genotype infections and in the dry season. We do not observe higher gametocyte sex ratios in mixed compared with single genotype infections.

ARTICLE INFO
Article history:
Received 27 September 2018
Received in revised form 29 March 2019
Accepted 5 April 2019
Available online xxxx

Keywords:
Fertility insurance
Local mate competition
Sex allocation
Gametocyte density
Seasonal malaria transmission
Competition

Malaria parasites (Plasmodium spp.) replicate asexually in their vertebrate hosts, but require a single round of sexual reproduction to achieve between-host transmission via mosquito vectors. Sexual stages, called gametocytes, are formed in the vertebrate host and both the density and sex ratio (defined as the proportion that are male) of gametocytes shape parasite fitness/transmission (Reece et al., 2008; Mitri et al., 2009; Bradley et al., 2018). Gametocyte sex ratios of malaria parasites vary considerably, both during infections and in different hosts. Studies using a variety of model systems (rodent and lizard parasites, and the human parasite Plasmodium falciparum in vitro) have demonstrated that variation in gametocyte sex ratios is influenced by parasite genotype, genetic diversity of infections (multiplicity of infection, MOI), transmission-blocking immunity, and the density of red blood cells, reticulocytes and gametocytes (Paul et al., 2000, 2002; West et al., 2001; Reece et al., 2005, 2008; Ramiro et al., 2011). Evolutionary sex allocation theory can explain why parasite fitness is maximised by adjusting sex ratio in response to the above factors (West et al., 2001; Paul et al., 2002; Gardner et al., 2003; Reece et al., 2008; Neal and Schall, 2014). Evolutionary sex allocation theory predicts that each clone within an infection should adjust its gametocyte sex ratio in response to the number of co-infecting clones within the host, gametocyte density and the number of gametes produced by each male gametocyte (Nee et al., 2002; Gardner et al., 2003). Specifically, in single genotype infections, the number of offspring is maximised (and thus, competition for females is minimised; “local mate competition theory”) when just enough males are produced to fertilise all females. For malaria parasites this means a female-biased gametocyte sex ratio (up to eight females per male) because female and male gametocytes each transform into one female gamete or up to eight male gametes, respectively. However, malaria infections often contain multiple parasite genotypes and males can fertilise females from their own as well as unrelated genotypes. Whereas fitness for parasites in single genotype infections is determined by the total number of offspring, the fittest genotype for outbreeding parasites in mixed genotype infections is that with the highest genetic representation in the next generation (i.e. that with the highest proportion of matings). Thus, higher sex ratios are favoured in mixed genotype infections because each genotype can take advantage of the females belonging to co-infecting genotypes by producing male gametocytes, the more fecund sex (Supplementary Fig. S1A). However, at low gametocyte densities (e.g. due to low gametocyte conversion or during anaemia) or when male gametocyte survival and/
or fecundity is low (e.g. due to immunity or drugs, which both can disproportionately affect males), the probability that a blood meal contains enough males to fertilise all females is reduced (Paul et al., 2002; Ramiro et al., 2011; Delves et al., 2013). Therefore, parasites should compensate by increasing their investment in males (West et al., 2001; Gardner et al., 2003) (Supplementary Fig. S1B).

Experiments with Plasmodium chabaudi in vivo and P. falciparum in vitro are consistent with predictions that higher sex ratios are produced in mixed genotype infections, and when fertility insurance is required to avoid male limitation (Paul et al., 2002; Reece et al., 2008; Mitri et al., 2009). Data from natural P. falciparum infections are scarce, but higher sex ratios are observed in mixed genotype infections and in anaemic hosts (Read et al., 1992; Robert et al., 2003; Sowunmi et al., 2009a,b). Other studies – generally related to Plasmodium spp. infecting lizards – do not support fertility insurance theory but these produce high gametocyte densities and therefore may not require fertility insurance (Neal and Schall, 2014). However, whether sex ratios are adjusted according to variation in the genetic diversity of infections and male limitation have rarely been tested simultaneously in natural infections with parasite species expected to adopt both sex allocation strategies (Neal and Schall, 2014). Here, we examine whether the rules of sex allocation theory apply to the gametocyte sex ratios of P. falciparum in natural infections.

Until the recent development of sex-specific reverse-transcriptase quantitative PCR (RT-qPCR) assays (Schneider et al., 2015; Santolamazza et al., 2017; Stone et al., 2017), methods to determine the sex ratio of P. falciparum gametocytes were laborious and suffered from low accuracy, particularly at low densities. We took advantage of sex-specific RT-qPCR assays to test whether gametocyte sex ratios in natural P. falciparum infections in Asar village, Eastern Sudan, follow the predictions of theories for local mate competition and fertility insurance. In this region, transmission is distinctly seasonal (September–December), chronic infections may persist asymptomatically throughout the year and mixed genotype infections are common (Gadalla et al., 2016). Ethical clearance was granted by the Ethical Committee of the Sudanese Ministry of Health. A detailed description of the study and methods used has been previously published (Gadalla et al., 2016). Briefly, individuals with symptomatic P. falciparum infections were enrolled after informed consent was obtained. Monthly blood samples were collected between November 2001 and October 2002, and another sample in December 2002. Symptomatic infections were treated with antimalarial drugs after samples were taken, according to national treatment guidelines at the time of the study. Therefore, we investigate sex ratios independently of any impact of drugs. Thirty-one individuals had at least three parasite-positive samples during the study and produced gametocytes, resulting in a total of 98 gametocyte-positive samples. Gametocytes, sex ratio and MOI (minimum number of genotypes present) were quantified by sex-specific RT-qPCRs and P. falciparum gene Pfmc377 genotyping, respectively (Abdel-Wahab et al., 2002; Gadalla et al., 2016) (see Supplementary Methods S1). Using these samples, we tested the predictions (Supplementary Fig. S1) that gametocyte sex ratios are negatively correlated with gametocyte densities (fertility insurance) and are higher in mixed versus single genotype infections (local mate competition).

Plasmodium falciparum gametocyte sex ratios vary considerably between samples, ranging from all male to all female. Overall, as expected, the majority of samples (94%) have a female-biased gametocyte sex ratio (mean 0.07 ± S.E.M. 0.02). The relationship between gametocyte density and sex ratio varies with MOI (interaction between MOI and gametocyte density: $\chi^2 = 76.06, P < 0.001$) (Fig. 1A, model A in Table 1). Despite low MOI in this area (mean minimum number of genotypes present 1.55 ± S.E.M. 0.07), we observe a difference in sex ratio between single and mixed genotype infections (Fig. 1A). This is, however, the opposite of the pattern predicted by local mate competition theory: sex ratios are higher in single than in mixed genotype infections. Further, in single infections, the sex ratio decreases with increasing gametocyte densities, following the logistic pattern predicted by fertility insurance (Supplementary Fig. S1B) (effect size $-2.08 ± S.E.M. 0.13, z = -15.60, P < 0.001$), but not in mixed genotype infections (effect size $0.33 ± S.E.M. 0.39, z = 0.84, P = 0.40$) (Fig. 1A). Our data originate from an area with distinct seasonal transmission and parasites are suggested to adopt different transmission strategies in different seasons (Cornet et al., 2014; Gadalla et al., 2016; Pigeault et al., 2018). Accounting for the impact of season on fertility insurance (interaction between season and gametocyte density, $\chi^2 = 7.06, P = 0.008$) and local mate competition (interaction between season and MOI, $\chi^2 = 18.43, P < 0.001$) significantly improves the explanatory power of our model ($\Delta$AIC = 62.97; model B in Table 1). When season is taken into account, fertility insurance is detectable in both single and mixed genotype infections (Fig. 1B and C).

![Fig. 1](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpara.2019.04.001)
Moreover, any problems to account for repeated sampling, and a binomial error structure.

Specifically, fertility insurance is more apparent in single compared with mixed genotype infections (interaction between season and gametocyte density, effect size $-0.81 \pm$ S.E.M. 0.31; $z = -2.59, P = 0.010$). It is possible that the observed impact of MOI may vary with season, but we cannot formally test for this because the model including the interaction between season, gametocyte density and MOI does not converge.

Adjusting the ratio of male versus female gametocytes should enable malaria parasites to optimise gametocyte sex ratios in response to changing in-host conditions in a manner that maximises fitness. Our data suggest that the complex patterns of gametocyte sex ratios for *P. falciparum* parasites in natural infections are consistent with predictions of fertility insurance theory concerning male limitation. In addition, our data suggest that fertility insurance is more apparent in single compared with mixed genotype infections, and in the dry compared with the wet transmission season. We find no evidence for local mate competition in relation to MOI. Our marker to assess the extent of multiplicity (*Pfg377*) has at least five alleles in this parasite population (Abdel-Wahab et al., 2002) and it is possible that multiple genotypes within an infection share the same allele. If so, then our approach is conservative; the difference between single and mixed infections is likely greater. However, whilst we found a difference in sex ratios between single and mixed genotype infections, the pattern was the opposite of that predicted: sex ratios are more female-biased in mixed genotype infections. There are several potential explanations for this result. In theory, male gametocytes may be detected less efficiently in mixed genotype infections. However, sex-specific gametocyte assays (Schneider et al., 2015; Santolamazza et al., 2017; Stone et al., 2017) target conserved areas of the genome and there is no evidence that these assays function differently between single and mixed genotype infections. Our study reports a mean sex ratio lower than most field studies (Tadesse et al., 2019). This could be associated with males being detected less efficiently than females (Schneider et al., 2015; Stone et al., 2017). If samples with low gametocyte densities had particularly high sex ratios but were not detected, and therefore not included in our study, the true population mean may be closer to the theoretical minimum of approximately 0.1 (Tadesse et al., 2019). Moreover, any problems introduced by low gametocyte densities cannot explain why local mate competition is not apparent at higher gametocyte densities. Additionally, whereas mixed genotype infections in this seasonal transmission area are common, the genotype ratios within infections may be heavily skewed. If so, rare genotypes may be hard to detect by PCR. However, by definition rare genotypes will not influence the genetic diversity of gametocyte mating groups much and thus sex ratios that are best in single infections remain optimal (or very close to) in this case. Further research is required to investigate how proportional representation of genotypes within mixed genotype infections impacts sex ratios.

Finally, we measured sex ratios of mature gametocytes and thus some, potentially sex-specific, gametocyte death may have occurred. Male gametocytes are more vulnerable to drug treatment and to immune attack (e.g. Ramiro et al., 2011; Delves et al., 2013; Dicko et al., 2018). If such immune responses are stronger in mixed genotype infections, male mortality rates may be elevated substantially beyond that for which fertility insurance can compensate. High male mortality could simultaneously dampen fertility insurance (especially in mixed genotype infections) and local mate competition. Elevated male mortality may also explain observations that: (i) *P. chabaudi* matches sex ratio to the predictions of local mate competition and fertility insurance before infections peak and immune responses develop (Reece et al., 2008); (ii) why parasites in natural, chronic *Plasmodium mexicanum* infections do not match local mate competition - compared with experimental infections of naïve lizards (Neal and Schall, 2014); and (iii) because antimalarial immune responses peak during the wet season, compared with the dry season in Eastern Sudan (e.g. Cavanagh, 1998), parasites match fertility insurance better in the dry season. However, explaining why parasites cannot sufficiently increase male production in mixed genotype infections to compensate for high levels of male-specific mortality is a challenge. Non-mutually exclusive hypotheses include that parasites may have an upper limit in their ability to detect male killing (or its proxies); mechanistic constraints on development may limit the production of males; or increasing male production even more may be counterproductive if subsequent killing of these males disproportionately stimulates anti-male immune responses.

Despite the unexpected results for sex ratios in mixed genotype infections, in a seasonal malaria setting in Eastern Sudan we observed fertility insurance in natural human malaria infections. Facultative adjustment of gametocyte sex ratios in natural infections has implications for disease control. For example, parasites that are exposed to interventions with sex-specific effects (e.g. drug treatment proportionally affecting male gametocytes or transmission-reducing vaccines targeting females only) can adjust both their conversion rates and gametocyte sex ratio to partially compensate, thus undermining the efficacy of such interventions (Reece et al., 2008; Wu et al., 2008; Sowunmi et al., 2009b; Ramiro et al., 2011; Delves et al., 2013; Dicko et al., 2018). Furthermore, if the cues that parasites use to determine the appropriate level of fertility insurance can be identified, parasites could be tricked into producing suboptimal gametocyte sex ratios, thus reducing transmission (Carter et al., 2014). Finally, we recommend future studies extend our approach to different epidemiological settings, categorise data by season, and gather data on immunity to explore the extent to which male-biased mortality affects the ability of *P. falciparum* to follow the rules of sex allocation theory.

### Table 1

Results from mixed effect logistic regression models to analyse gametocyte sex ratios.

| Model | Chi square | P-value | AIC | $r^2$ marg/cond |
|-------|-----------|---------|-----|-----------------|
| Model A: SR $\sim$ GCT*MOI | 76.06 | $<0.001$ | 479.24 | 0.52/0.75 |
| GCT*MOI mix | | | | |
| Model B: SR $\sim$ GCT*MOI + SEAS*GCT + SEAS*MOI | | | | |
| MOI*SEAS | 18.43 | $<0.001$ | | |
| GCT:SEAS | 7.06 | 0.008 | 416.27 | 0.54/0.77 |

GCT, 10 log gametocyte density/µL of blood; MOI, multiplicity of infection (single or mixed); SEAS, season (wet transmission season 1 August – 25 December or dry season 26 December – 31 July); $r^2$ marg, marginal; $r^2$ cond, conditional (i.e. taking into account inter-individual differences between patients).

* Generalised linear mixed effect models ([lme4, R v3.2.4; The R-Foundation, Vienna, Austria, see Supplementary Methods S1]) with patient number included as a random effect to account for repeated sampling, and a binomial error structure.

* Gametocyte sex ratios were analysed as a two-vector response variable (males, females) to enable weighted regression that takes into account sample sizes from which gametocyte sex ratios were estimated.
Acknowledgements

We thank Aidan O’Donnell for assistance during the experiments. This work was supported by the National Environment Research Council, UK [NE/I015329/1; NE/K006029/1]; the Wellcome Trust, UK [WT082234MA; 202769/Z/16/Z]; and the Royal Society, UK [UF110155]. The funders played no role in the study design; the collection, analysis and interpretations of the data; in the writing of the report or in the decision to submit the article for publication.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpara.2019.04.001.

References

Abdel-Wahab, A., Abdel-Muhsin, AA., Ali, E., Suleiman, S., Ahmed, S., Walliker, D., Babiker, H.A., 2002. Dynamics of gametocytes among Plasmodium falciparum clones in natural infections in an area of highly seasonal transmission. J. Infect. Dis. 185, 1838–1842.

Bradley, J., Stone, W., Da, D.F., Morlais, I., Dicko, A., Cohuet, A., Guelbeogo, W.M., Mahamar, A., Nsango, S., Sounare, H.M., Diawara, H., Lanke, K., Graumann, W., Siebelink-Stoter, R., van de Vegte-Bolmer, M., Chen, I., Tiono, A., Goncalves, B.P., Gosling, R., Sauerwein, R.W., Drakeley, C., Churcher, T.S., Bousema, T., 2018. Predicting the likelihood and intensity of mosquito infection from sex specific Plasmodium falciparum gametocyte density. Elite 7, e34463.

Carter, L.M., Schneider, P., Reece, S.E., 2014. Information use and plasticity in the reproductive decisions of malaria parasites. Malar. J. 13, e115.

Cavanagh, D.R., Elhassan, I.M., Roper, C., Robinson, V.J., Giha, H., Holder, A.A., Hvid, L., Theander, T.G., Arnot, D.E., McBride, J.S., 1998. A longitudinal study of type-specific antibody responses to Plasmodium falciparum merozoite surface protein-1 in an area of unstable malaria in Sudan. J. Immunol. 161, 347–359.

Cornet, S., Nicot, A., Rivero, A., Gandon, S., 2014. Evolution of plastic transmission strategies in avian malaria. PLoS Pathog. 10, e1004308.

Delves, M.J., Ruecker, A., Strachul, A., Lelièvre, J., Marques, S., López-Barragán, M.J., Herreros, E., Sinden, R.E., 2013. Male and female P. falciparum gametocytes show different responses to antimalarial drugs. Antimicrob. Agents Chemother. 57, 3268–3274.

Dicko, A., Roh, M.E., Diawara, H., Mahamar, A., Sounare, H.M., Lanke, K., Bradley, J., Sanogo, K., Kone, D.T., Diarra, K., Keita, S., Issiaka, D., Traore, S.F., McCulloch, C., Stone, W.J.R., Hwang, J., Müller, O., Brown, J.M., Sinnavas, V., Drakeley, C., Gosling, R., Chen, I., Bousema, T., 2018. Efficacy and safety of primaquine and methylene blue for prevention of Plasmodium falciparum transmission in Mali: a phase 2, single-blind, randomised controlled trial. Lancet Infect. Dis. 18, 627–635.

Gadalla, A.A.H., Schneider, P., Churcher, T.S., Nassir, E., Abdel-Muhsin, A.A., Ranford-Cartwright, L.C., Reece, S.E., Babiker, H.A., 2016. Associations between season and gametocyte dynamics in chronic Plasmodium falciparum infections. PLoS ONE 11, e0166699.

Gardner, A., Reece, S.E., West, S.A., 2003. Even more extreme fertility insurance and the sex ratios of protozoan blood parasites. J. Theor. Biol. 223, 515–521.

Mitri, C., Thiery, I., Bourgoin, C., Paul, R.E., 2009. Density-dependent impact of the human malaria parasite Plasmodium falciparum gametocyte sex ratio on mosquito infection rates. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. Ser. B 276, 3721–3726.

Neal, A.T., Schall, J.J. 2014. Testing sex ratio theory with the malaria parasites Plasmodium mexicanum in natural and experimental infections. Evolution 68, 1071–1081.

Nee, S., West, S.A., Read, A.F., 2002. Inbreeding and parasite sex ratios. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. Ser. B 269, 755–760.

Paul, R.E.L., Coulson, T.N., Raibaud, A., Brey, P.T., 2000. Sex determination in malaria parasites. Science 287, 128–131.

Paul, R.E.L., Breya, P.T., Robert, V., 2002. Plasmodium sex determination and transmission to mosquitoes. Trends Parasitol. 18, 32–38.

Pigeault, R., Caudron, Q., Nicot, A., Rivero, A., Gandon, S., 2018. Timing malaria transmission with mosquito fluctuations. Evol. Lett. 2, 378–389.

Ramiro, R.S., Alpeidrinha, J., Carter, L., Gardner, A., Reece, S.E., 2011. Sex and death: the effects of innate immune factors on the sexual reproduction of malaria parasites. PLoS Pathog. 7, e1001309.

Read, A.F., Narara, A., Nee, S., Keymer, A.E., Day, K.P., 1992. Gametocyte sex ratios as indirect measures of outcrossing rates in malaria. Parasitology 104, 387–395.

Reece, S.E., Duncan, A.B., West, S.A., Read, A.F., 2005. Host cell preference and variable transmission strategies in malaria parasites. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. Ser. B 272, 511–517.

Reece, S.E., Drew, D.R., Gardner, A., 2008. Sex ratio adjustment and kin discrimination in malaria parasites. Nature 453, 609–614.

Robert, V., Sokhna, C.S., Rogier, C., Atey, F., Trape, J.F., 2003. Sex ratio of Plasmodium falciparum gametocytes in inhabitants of Dielmo, Senegal. Parasitology 127, 1–8.

Santolamazza, F., Avellino, P., Siciliano, G., Yao, F.A., Lombardo, F., Ouedraogo, J.B., Modiano, D., Alano, P., Mangano, V.D., 2017. Detection of Plasmodium falciparum male and female gametocytes and determination of parasite sex ratio in human endemic populations by novel, cheap and robust RTqPCR assays. Malar. J. 16, 468.

Schneider, P., Reece, S.E., Schajik, B.C.I.V., Bousema, T., Lanke, K.H.J., Meeden, C.S.J., Gadalla, A., Ranford-Cartwright, L.C., Babiker, H.A., 2015. Quantification of female and male Plasmodium falciparum gametocytes by reverse transcriptase quantitative PCR. Mol Biochem. Parasitol. 199, 29–33.

Sowunmi, A., Balogun, S.T., Gbotosho, G.O., Hoppiti, C.T., 2009a. Plasmodium falciparum gametocyte sex ratios in symptomatic children treated with antimalarial drugs. Acta Trop. 109, 108–117.

Sowunmi, A., Gbotosho, G.O., Hoppiti, C.T., Folarin, O.A., Babiker, S.T., 2009b. Population structure of Plasmodium falciparum gametocyte sex ratios in malnourished children in an endemic area. Parasitol. Int. 58, 438–443.

Stone, W., Sowa, P., Lanke, K., Ringma, S., Oriango, R., Nyuuru, M., Osoko, P., Osoit, V., Mahamar, A., Diawara, H., Woestenek, R., Graumann, W., van de Veite-Bolmer, M., Bradley, J., Chen, I., Brown, J., Siciliano, G., Alano, P., Gosling, R., Dicko, A., Drakeley, C., Bousema, T., 2017. A molecular assay to quantify male and female Plasmodium falciparum gametocytes: results from 2 randomized controlled trials using primaquine for gametocyte clearance. J. Infect. Dis. 216, 457–467.

Tadese, F.G., Meerstein-Kessel, L., Goncalves, B.P., Drakeley, C., Ranford-Cartwright, L., Bousema, T., 2019. Gametocyte sex ratio: the key to understanding Plasmodium falciparum transmission? Trends Parasitol. 35, 226–238.

West, S.A., Reece, S.E., Read, A.F., 2001. Evolution of gametocyte sex ratios in malaria and related apicomplexan/protozoan parasites. Trends Parasitol. 17, 525–531.

Wu, Y., Ellis, R.D., Shaffer, D., Fontes, E., Malkin, E.M., Mahanty, S., Faye, M.P., Narum, D., Rausch, K., Miles, A.P., Aebig, J., Orcutt, A., Muratova, O., Song, G., Lambert, L., Zhu, D., Mura, K., Long, C., Saul, A., Miller, L.H., Durbin, A.P., 2008. Phase 1 trial of malaria transmission blocking vaccine candidates Pf25 and Pvs25 formulated with montanide ISA 51. PLoS ONE 3, e2636.