Neutron valence structure from nuclear deep inelastic scattering

| Citation       | Segarra, E.P., et al., "Neutron valence structure from nuclear deep inelastic scattering." Physical review letters 124 (Mar. 2020): no. 092002 doi 10.1103/PhysRevLett.124.092002 ©2020 Author(s) |
|----------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| As Published   | 10.1103/PhysRevLett.124.092002                                                                                                                                                                    |
| Publisher      | American Physical Society                                                                                                                                                                          |
| Version        | Final published version                                                                                                                                                                            |
| Citable link   | https://hdl.handle.net/1721.1/124844                                                                                                                                                               |
| Terms of Use   | Article is made available in accordance with the publisher’s policy and may be subject to US copyright law. Please refer to the publisher’s site for terms of use.                                         |
Neutron Valence Structure from Nuclear Deep Inelastic Scattering

E. P. Segarra,1 A. Schmidt,1,2 T. Kutz,1,2 D. W. Higinbotham,3 E. Piasetzky,4 M. Strikman,5 L. B. Weinstein,6 and O. Hen1,*

1Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02139, USA
2George Washington University, Washington, D.C. 20052, USA
3Thomas Jefferson National Accelerator Facility, Newport News, Virginia 23606, USA
4School of Physics and Astronomy, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv 69978, Israel
5Pennsylvania State University, University Park, Pennsylvania 16802, USA
6Old Dominion University, Norfolk, Virginia 23529, USA

(Received 10 September 2019; revised manuscript received 4 December 2019; accepted 12 February 2020; published 6 March 2020)

Mechanisms of spin-flavor SU(6) symmetry breaking in quantum chromodynamics (QCD) are studied via an extraction of the free neutron structure function from a global analysis of deep inelastic scattering (DIS) data on the proton and on nuclei from A = 2 (deuterium) to 208 (lead). Modification of the structure function of nucleons bound in atomic nuclei (known as the EMC effect) is consistently accounted for within the framework of a universal modification of nucleons in short-range correlated (SRC) pairs. Our extracted neutron-to-proton structure function ratio \( F_2^n/F_2^p \) becomes constant for \( x_B \geq 0.6 \), equaling 0.47 ± 0.04 as \( x_B \rightarrow 1 \), in agreement with theoretical predictions of perturbative QCD and the Dyson-Schwinger equation, and in disagreement with predictions of the scalar diquark dominance model. We also predict \( F_2^{3\text{He}}/F_2^{\text{D}} \), recently measured, as yet unpublished, by the MARATHON Collaboration, the nuclear correction function that is needed to extract \( F_2^n/F_2^p \) from \( F_2^{3\text{He}}/F_2^{\text{D}} \), and the theoretical uncertainty associated with this extraction.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.124.092002

Introduction.—Almost all the visible mass in the universe comes from the mass of protons and neutrons, and is dynamically generated by the strong interactions of quarks and gluons [1]. These interactions are described by the theory of strong interactions, quantum chromodynamics (QCD). While the structure of low-energy QCD largely follows spin-flavor SU(6) symmetry, this symmetry is broken, as evident by the mass difference between the proton and its first excited state, the delta resonance. The exact symmetry-breaking mechanism is still an open question. This affects our understanding of emergent QCD phenomena such as baryon structure, masses, and magnetic moments [2]. Answering this question is thus one of the main motivations for the ongoing international effort to measure the quark-gluon structure of hadrons.

Different symmetry-breaking mechanisms can be discriminated among experimentally by measuring nucleon structure functions, which are sensitive to the distributions of quarks inside nucleons. Specifically, realistic models of QCD make very different predictions for the relative probability for a single quark to carry all of the momentum of a neutron compared to that of a proton, i.e., the proton to neutron structure function ratio, \( F_2^p(x_B, Q^2)/F_2^n(x_B, Q^2) \), as \( x_B \rightarrow 1 \) (where \( x_B = Q^2/2m \nu \) is the fractional quark momenta in the collinear reference frame where the nucleon is fast, \( Q^2 \) is the four-momentum transfer squared, \( m \) is the nucleon mass, and \( \nu \) is the energy transfer).

While the proton structure function has been extensively measured, the lack of a free neutron target prevents equivalent measurements of the neutron structure function, thereby preventing a direct test of QCD symmetry breaking mechanisms.

Here we use measurements of all available structure functions of nuclei (ranging from deuterium to lead) to extract the free neutron structure function, while consistently accounting for the nuclear-medium induced modification of the quark distributions in atomic nuclei. Using data on such a wide span of nuclei provides a large lever arm that allows us to precisely constrain \( F_2^n(x_B, Q^2)/F_2^n(x_B, Q^2) \), obtaining new insight into the fundamental structure of QCD.

We find that as \( x_B \) approaches unity, \( F_2^n(x_B, Q^2)/F_2^n(x_B, Q^2) \) saturates at a value of 0.47 ± 0.04, giving credence to modern predictions of QCD such as those based on the Dyson-Schwinger equation (0.41–0.49) [2] and perturbative QCD (3/7) [3]. This contrasts with previous extractions that did not include deep inelastic scattering (DIS) measurements of nuclei heavier than deuterium [4–6] and claimed to support the scalar diquark (1/4) [7,8] view of the nucleon.
The large differences between previous extractions of \( F_2^3(x_B, Q^2)/F_2^2(x_B, Q^2) \) and those of this work emphasize the need for direct experimental verification. The MARATHON experiment [9] recently measured \( F_2^3(He, x_B, Q^2)/F_2(He, x_B, Q^2) \) with the goal of providing an independent determination of \( F_2^3(x_B, Q^2)/F_2^2(x_B, Q^2) \) with minimal sensitivity to nuclear medium effects. This extraction is based on the assumption that such effects should be very similar for \(^3\text{He} \) and \(^3\text{H} \), thereby canceling in their ratio. Using the results of our global analysis, we present predictions for the \( F_2^3(He, x_B, Q^2)/F_2(He, x_B, Q^2) \) ratio and the nuclear correction function required to extract \( F_2^3(x_B, Q^2)/F_2^2(x_B, Q^2) \) from it. By comparing our correction function with those of earlier works we quantify the model uncertainty associated with this extraction, which can be as high as \( \sim 25\% \) for current realistic models.

**Universal nucleon modification and the EMC effect.**—Given the lack of a free neutron target, the modification of the quark-gluon structure of nucleons bound in atomic nuclei, known as the EMC effect, is the main issue preventing a direct extraction of the free neutron structure function from lepton DIS measurements of atomic nuclei, see Ref. [10] for a recent review.

We account for the EMC effect in nuclear DIS data by exploiting recent insight to its origin, gained from observations of a correlation between the magnitude of the EMC effect in different nuclei and the relative amount of short-range correlated (SRC) nucleon pairs in those nuclei [10–15].

SRC pairs are predominantly proton-neutron (\( pn \)) pairs [16–21]. They have large relative and individual momenta, smaller center-of-mass momenta, and account for 60%–70% of the kinetic energy carried by nucleons in the nucleus [18,22–24]. Therefore, nucleons in such pairs have significant spatial overlap and are far off their mass shell \( (E^2 - p^2 - m^2 < 0) \).

These extreme conditions, and the observed correlation between SRC pair abundances and the magnitude of the EMC effect in different nuclei and the relative amount of short-range correlated (SRC) nucleon pairs in those nuclei [10–15], are the average spatial overlap and are far off their mass shell \( (E^2 - p^2 - m^2 < 0) \).

These extreme conditions, and the observed correlation between SRC pair abundances and the magnitude of the EMC effect, imply that the EMC effect could be driven primarily by the modification of the structure functions of nucleons in SRC pairs [10–12].

Utilizing scale separation between SRC and uncorrelated (mean-field) nucleons, Ref. [14] modeled the nuclear structure function as having contributions from unmodified uncorrelated nucleons and from modified correlated nucleons in \( np \)-SRC pairs:

\[
F_2^3 = Z F_2^2 + N F_2^2 + n_{\text{SRC}}^A (\Delta F_2^2 + \Delta F_2^3),
\]

where \( N \) and \( Z \) are the number of neutrons and protons in the nucleus \( (N + Z = A) \), \( n_{\text{SRC}}^A \) is the average number of nucleons in \( np \)-SRC pairs, \( \Delta F_2^2 \) and \( \Delta F_2^3 \) are the average differences between the structure functions of free nucleons and nucleons in SRC pairs, and we omitted the explicit \( x_B \) and \( Q^2 \) dependence of the \( F_2 \) structure functions for brevity. This model assumes that both the EMC effect at \( 0.3 \leq x_B \leq 0.7 \) and nucleon-motion effects (which are important at \( x_B > 0.7 \)) are dominated by short-range correlations [15,25,26]. Therefore both are approximately proportional to SRC pair abundances and captured by Eq. (1). This model neglects the contribution of \( pp \) and \( nn \)-SRC pairs that, due to the predominance of the tensor interaction at short distance, are only \( \approx 10\% \) of all \( NN \)-SRC pairs in both light and heavy nuclei [16–21], and have little impact on our results. See Supplemental Material [27] for details.

To reduce sensitivity to isospin, target-mass, and higher twist effects [28,29], DIS data are traditionally given in the form of \( F_2^3/F_2^2 \) ratios. We use Eq. (1) to express this ratio as

\[
\frac{F_2^3}{F_2^2} = \frac{\Delta F_2^2 + \Delta F_2^3}{F_2^2/n_{\text{SRC}}^A} \times \left( \frac{n_{\text{SRC}}^A}{n_{\text{SRC}}^N} - N \right) + (Z - N) \frac{F_2^3}{F_2^2} + N,
\]

where we defined a nucleus independent universal modification function (UMF)

\[
f_{\text{univ}} = n_{\text{SRC}}^A \Delta F_2^2 + \Delta F_2^3 \frac{F_2^3}{F_2^2}.
\]

Consistent UMFs were previously extracted for nuclei from \(^3\text{He}\) to \(^{208}\text{Pb}\), pointing to the existence of a global UMF for SRC pairs in any nucleus (see Fig. 1) [14]. Here we extract the global UMF using Bayesian inference by means of a Hamiltonian Markov chain Monte Carlo (HMCMMC) method[30,31], referred to herein as nuclear-DIS analysis.

![FIG. 1. The extracted global universal modification function (UMF) from the nuclear-EMC effect analysis performed here (red band). The narrow width of the band shows the 68% confidence interval. Data points show the data-driven extractions of Ref. [14], based on individual measurements of \( F_2^3/F_2^2 \) in a variety of nuclei. Open and closed data points show measurements at \( W < \sqrt{2} \text{ GeV} \) and \( W \geq \sqrt{2} \text{ GeV} \), respectively.](image)
We parametrized the UMF for all nuclei as

$$f_{\text{univ}} = \alpha + \beta x_B + \gamma e^{\delta(1-x_B)}$$  \hspace{1cm} (4)$$

and estimated its parameters ($\alpha$, $\beta$, $\gamma$, and $\delta$) using HMCMC-based inference from $F_2^n/F_2^d$ data [14,32,33] for $0.08 \leq x_B \leq 0.95$ in $^3\text{He}$, $^4\text{He}$, $^9\text{Be}$, $^{12}\text{C}$, $^{27}\text{Al}$, $^{56}\text{Fe}$, $^{197}\text{Au}$, and $^{208}\text{Pb}$, via Eq. (2). Here, and throughout this work, we consistently removed all isoscalar corrections previously applied to asymmetric nuclei data. We assumed our nuclear-DIS analysis discussed above (see Fig. 2). Our tagged results are consistent with the experimental extraction using the low-xB limit of Ref. [38]. As consistent parameterizations of $F_2^n/F_2^d$ as a function of $x_B$ are needed for the UMF extraction, we parametrized it as $F_2^n/F_2^d = \alpha_2 + \beta_2 x_B + \gamma_2 e^{\delta_2(1-x_B)}$. We determine all parameters, including those of the UMF and $F_2^n/F_2^d$ simultaneously from data as part of the nuclear-DIS analysis. See the online Supplemental Material [27] for details on the inference procedure, posterior distributions of the parameters, and discussion of the kinematical coverage of the fitted data.

The nuclear-DIS analysis reproduced all the $F_2^n/F_2^d$ data over the entire measured $x_B$ range, see online Supplemental Material [27], Fig. 1. The resulting global UMF (red band in Fig. 1) extends up to $x_B \sim 0.95$ and agrees well with the individual nuclear UMF’s extracted in Ref. [14].

$F_2^n/F_2^d$ extraction.—Using Eq. (1) to model nuclear effects in $F_2^d$ we express $F_2^n/F_2^d$ as

$$F_2^n/F_2^d = 1 - f_{\text{univ}} - F_2^d/F_2^d.$$  \hspace{1cm} (5)$$

We extract $F_2^n/F_2^d$ using $f_{\text{univ}}$ and $F_2^n/F_2^d$ determined by our nuclear-DIS analysis discussed above (see Fig. 2). Our results are consistent with the experimental extraction using tagged $d(e,e'p_S)$ DIS measurements on the deuteron [39]. $F_2^n/F_2^d$ decreases steadily for $0.2 \leq x_B < 0.6$, and becomes approximately constant starting at $x_B \approx 0.6$. The $x_B \rightarrow 1$ limit of $F_2^n/F_2^d$ equals $0.47 \pm 0.04$.

Removing low-\(W\) DIS data ($W < \sqrt{2} \text{ GeV}$) from our analysis limits our extraction to $x_B \sim 0.8$ but does not change its conclusions since $F_2^n/F_2^d$ still saturates starting at $x_B \approx 0.6$. The hatched region of the blue band in Fig. 2 corresponds to our model extraction using the low-\(W\) DIS data to reach up to $x_B \sim 0.95$. Similarly, we verified that evolving $F_2^n/F_2^d$ from $Q^2_S = 12 \text{ GeV}^2$ to $Q^2 = 5 \text{ GeV}^2$ does not significantly change our extraction up to $x_B \sim 0.8$. See the online Supplemental Material [27] for details, which includes Refs. [41,42].

Our nuclear-DIS analysis gives significantly larger values of $F_2^n/F_2^d$ than several previous extractions which do not use $A > 2$ nuclear-DIS data, including (i) CTEQ global analysis (CT14) [4], which uses $W (> 3.5 \text{ GeV})$ and $Q^2 (> 2 \text{ GeV}^2)$ data for $A \leq 2$ (with no corrections for any nuclear effects in the deuteron) combined with various other reactions such as jet production and $W^\pm, Z$ production; (ii) CTEQ-JLab global analysis (CJ15) [5], which uses $A \leq 2$ DIS data with looser cuts of $W > 1.7 \text{ GeV}$ and $Q^2 > 1.3 \text{ GeV}^2$, together with recently published $W^\pm$-boson charge asymmetries from D0 [43] and additional corrections for deuterium off-shell, higher-twist, and target-mass effects; and (iii) Arrington et al. [6], which includes only $A \leq 2$ DIS data with only corrections for Fermi motion and binding (see Fig. 2).

CT14 and CJ15 extracted parton distribution functions rather than nucleon structure functions. In order to compare their results with our $F_2^n/F_2^d$ extraction, we constructed the corresponding nucleon structure functions from their individual parton distribution functions, accounting for valence region corrections (higher twist, target mass) according to Refs. [5,44]. These corrections largely cancel in the $F_2^n/F_2^d$ ratio.

The comparison with CJ15 is particularly interesting as that extraction of $d(x_B)$ is predominantly constrained by the D0 $W^\pm$ boson asymmetry data [5,43], corresponding to $Q^2 = m_W^2$. This may indicate a tension between our low $Q^2$ results and results of the CJ15 analysis of the D0 dataset at $x_B \geq 0.6$.

We find that the $x_B \rightarrow 1$ limit of $F_2^n/F_2^d$ equals $0.47 \pm 0.04$ for our nuclear-DIS extraction. Our results agree with...
predictions based on perturbative QCD [3] and the Dyson-Schwinger equation (DSE) [2] and disagree with the scalar diquark model prediction [7,8]. Our findings disagree with the previous extractions (that apply nuclear corrections to the deuteron but do not consistently use data from heavier nuclei) that either could not discriminate among predictions, or preferred the scalar diquark prediction. Our result is consistent with the upper edge of the CT14 extraction, which does not rely on nuclear corrections. However, our $F_2^d/F_2^n$ has much smaller uncertainties which allow us to discriminate among models.

Thus, accounting for the modification of nucleons bound in deuterium increases $F_2^d$ at high $x_B$. This was seen previously, see, e.g., Refs. [15,45–47]. However, the magnitude of this increase at $x_B > 0.6$ is larger in our analysis as compared with those analyses that only use deuterium data. The high-$x_B$ disagreement between our nuclear DIS analysis and the analyses of Refs. [4–6] underscores the need for the forthcoming independent extraction by the MARATHON Collaboration. Below we present our predictions for their observables and discuss the cancellation of nuclear effects in $F_2^d/F_2^n$.

$F_2^d/F_2^n$: Extraction from $A = 3$ mirror-nuclei data.—The MARATHON experiment recently measured DIS on $^2$H, $^3$H, and $^3$He. They plan to independently extract $F_2^d/F_2^n$ from $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$ using [9]

$$\frac{F_2^d}{F_2^n} = \frac{2R - F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}}{2F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}} - R},$$

where $R$ is a theoretical correction factor which measures the cancellation of nuclear effects in $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$.

$$R \equiv \frac{F_2^{^3\text{He}}}{2F_2^{^3\text{H}}} + \frac{F_2^d + 2F_2^n}{F_2^{^3\text{H}}}.$$ (7)

Since $^3\text{He}$ and $^3\text{H}$ should have similar nuclear effects $R$ should be close to 1.

We use our UMF to predict the expected DIS ratios for $[F_2^{^3\text{He}}/3]/[F_2^d/2]$, $[F_2^{^3\text{H}}/3]/[F_2^d/2]$, and $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$ (see Fig. 3). Since the $n_{\text{SRC}}/n_{\text{SRC}}$ data are not yet published, we assumed $n_{\text{SRC}}^{^3\text{H}} = n_{\text{SRC}}^{^3\text{He}}$. Varying this by ±20% changed our results by less than 5% at moderate and high $x$, see the online Supplemental Material [27].

We compare our predictions for $[F_2^{^3\text{He}}/3]/[F_2^d/2]$, $[F_2^{^3\text{H}}/3]/[F_2^d/2]$, and $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$ with other models, shown as colored lines in Fig. 3. Our prediction is overall similar to that of Kulagin and Petti (KP) [49,50], though there are differences at high $x_B$ in the $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/3/[F_2^d/2]$, and $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$ ratios. The Tropiano et al. (TEMS) analysis [48] combines the CJ15 global PDF fits [5] and their off-shell correction in deuterium, with additional fits to $[F_2^{^3\text{He}}/3]/[F_2^d/2]$ data [33], to extract off-shell corrections in $A = 3$ nuclei. TEMS-CJ assumes fully isoscalar off-shell corrections. In Ref. [48], fits allowing nonisoscalar off-shell corrections were also performed, which required an isoscalar correction as input. TEMS-CJ_{non-iso} uses the isoscalar correction from CJ15, while TEMS-KP_{non-iso} uses a different isoscalar correction, developed by Kulagin and Petti [49,50]. For $x_B > 0.6$, TEMS-CJ_{non-iso} and TEMS-KP_{non-iso} predictions [48] individually disagree with our prediction of $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$. However, the spread of the two curves at $x_B > 0.6$ highlights the minimal sensitivity that $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/3/[F_2^d/2]$ alone can provide to constraining nonisoscalar off-shell effects. We agree with the isoscalar off-shell predictions of TEMS-CJ up to $x_B \sim 0.5$. For $x_B < 0.5$, even including uncertainty of TEMS-CJ_{non-iso} and TEMS-KP_{non-iso} (see Supplemental Material [27]), we predict a slightly higher ratio as compared to these two predictions.

We also studied the effect of different models of $R$ on the extraction of $F_2^d/F_2^n$ from $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$. Figure 4 (left panel) shows several theoretical predictions of $R$. While individual models vary by only a few percent, the choice of model can lead to significant differences in the extracted $F_2^d/F_2^n$. 
especially at large $x_B$. Figure 4 (right panel) shows $F_2^n/F_2^p$ extracted using Eq. (6). Here we assume $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$ from our nuclear-DIS analysis and then use various models of $R$ to extract $F_2^n/F_2^p$, similar to the extraction the MARATHON Collaboration will perform with their measured $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$. While our prediction for $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$ is similar to that of KP (see Fig. 3), the differences at $x_B > 0.7$ create large differences in $R$, which cause a $\sim 10\%$ difference in the extracted $F_2^n/F_2^p$. The predictions of TEMS [48] lead to larger differences in $F_2^n/F_2^p$ and therefore even larger model uncertainties at large $x_B$ [51]. Performing the extraction of $F_2^n/F_2^p$ with different models for $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$ give similar uncertainty in $F_2^n/F_2^p$; see Supplemental Material [27], Fig. 7.

Once the MARATHON $F_2^{^3\text{He}}/F_2^{^3\text{H}}$ data is published, this model uncertainty could be reduced by iteratively improving the extracted $F_2^n$ using Eqs. (6) and (7) [9]. However, in this procedure, care must be taken to ensure consistency with global nuclear DIS data, as was done in our analysis.

Conclusions.—Using Bayesian inference by means of a Hamiltonian Markov chain Monte Carlo method, we extracted a nucleon universal modification function that is consistent with DIS measurements of nuclei from $A = 2$ to 208. We used it to correct deuteron DIS data for bound-nucleon structure-modification effects and to extract $F_2^n/F_2^p$ up to $x_B \approx 0.9$.

The extracted $F_2^n/F_2^p$ ratio saturates at high-$x_B$ at a value of $0.47 \pm 0.04$, which is consistent with perturbative QCD and DSE predictions [2,3], is lower than the SU(6) symmetry prediction of $2/3$ [40], and is significantly greater than the scalar diquark model prediction of $1/4$ [7,8]. Our nuclear-DIS analysis prediction also agrees with the most recent experimental extraction by the BONuS experiment [39]. The BONuS experiment will take more data soon at higher energies and provide a more stringent test of our predictions. The forthcoming parity-violating DIS program using SoLID at Jefferson Lab will further probe $d/u$ directly using a proton target [53].

We also used the UMF to predict the tritium and $^3\text{He}$ DIS cross section ratios, recently measured by the MARATHON experiment [9], and to estimate the nuclear correction function $R$ that they plan to use to extract $F_2^n/F_2^p$ from their data. We showed that different models of $R$ lead to non-negligible model uncertainty in the planned extraction of $F_2^n/F_2^p$.

This work was supported by the U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Science, Office of Nuclear Physics under Awards No. DE-FG02-94ER40818, No. DE-FG02-96ER40960, No. DE-FG02-93ER40771, and No. DE-AC05-06OR23177 under which Jefferson Science Associates operates the Thomas Jefferson National Accelerator Facility, the Pazy foundation, and the Israeli Science Foundation (Israel) under Grants No. 136/12 and No. 1334/16.

*hen@mit.edu

[1] A. Bashir, L. Chang, I. Cloet, B. El-Bennich, Y. Liu, C. Roberts, and P. Tandy, Commun. Theor. Phys. 58, 79 (2012).
[2] C. D. Roberts, R. J. Holt, and S. M. Schmidt, Phys. Lett. B 727, 249 (2013).
[3] G. R. Farrar and D. R. Jackson, Phys. Rev. Lett. 35, 1416 (1975).
