Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
Nine-month outcomes of tracheostomy in patients with COVID-19: A retrospective study

Xin-Hao Zhang 1, Xiao-Bo Long 1, Kai Xu 1, Xiang Lu * , Zheng Liu *

Department of Otorhinolaryngology Head and Neck Surgery, Tongji Hospital, Tongji Medical College, Huazhong University of Science and Technology, Wuhan 430030, China

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:
COVID-19
Tracheostomy
Survival
Long-term outcomes

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The outcome of performing a tracheostomy in patients with coronavirus disease (COVID-19) seems promising based on the reported 30-day survival rate. However, long-term outcomes are still lacking. Therefore, our aim in this study was to evaluate the long-term outcomes of tracheostomy performed in critically ill COVID-19 patients.

Methods: This was a retrospective analysis of 27 COVID-19 patients on whom tracheostomy was performed between February 28, 2020, and April 7, 2020, at Tongji Hospital (Wuhan, China). Patients' clinical characteristics, complications, and outcomes were analyzed.

Results: All patients underwent successful bedside tracheostomy. Thirteen patients (48.1%) were successfully weaned off ventilation within 1 month. The survival rate at one, three, and nine months after tracheostomy were 63.0%, 37.0%, and 29.6%, respectively. At nine months after tracheostomy, 8/27 patients had survived, with five (62.5%) being discharged home while the remaining were dependent on nursing care.

Conclusion: The survival rate of COVID-19 patients who underwent tracheotomy decreased markedly from 1 to 3 months after tracheotomy, remaining stable between 3 and 9 months. Medical support is much needed for COVID-19 patients over the first 90 days after tracheotomy.

1. Introduction

Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) is spreading globally. As of Feb 12, 2021, more than 408 million people have been infected globally, with over 5 million deaths. The disease may cause acute progressive respiratory failure and even death. Early studies revealed that approximately 20–25% of patients with severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) infection developed acute respiratory distress syndrome (ARDS) and required admission to the intensive care unit (ICU) [1–3]. Invasive mechanical ventilation, including endotracheal intubation, is required for some critically ill patients. For patients who require prolonged intubation, tracheostomy may be considered important for optimal respiratory care. Recent studies have reported on the short-term outcomes [4–6], with a higher 30-day survival and shorter ICU stay for patients who received tracheostomy than non-tracheostomized patients [6]. To the best of our knowledge, no previous study has described the long-term (>3 months) outcomes of tracheostomy among COVID-19 patients. In this study, we retrospectively analyzed 27 critically ill patients with COVID-19, who underwent tracheostomy in a medical center in Wuhan, focusing on the long-term outcomes.

2. Methods

2.1. Statement of ethics

Our study was approved by the Ethics Committee of Tongji Hospital and written informed consent was obtained from patients' legal representative.

2.2. Study design and group

This was a retrospective descriptive case series on long-term outcome after tracheostomy. Twenty-seven patients with a confirmed COVID-19 diagnosis who underwent tracheostomy between February
28, 2020, and April 7, 2020, at Tongji Hospital affiliated with Tongji Medical College, Huazhong University of Science and Technology, Wuhan, China, were documented.

2.3. Clinical cases

The clinical characteristics of the patients in our study group are detailed in Table 1. All patients received invasive mechanical ventilation on admission to the ICU, with 10 treated using extracorporeal membrane oxygenation (ECMO). Anticoagulant therapy was administered to all patients owing to increased coagulation activity; of note, anticoagulant therapy was suspended in five cases after occurrence of cerebral hemorrhage or gastrointestinal bleeding.

2.4. Outcomes

The endpoint of follow-up was 9 months after tracheostomy or death, whichever occurred earlier. The primary outcome was the survival rate at 9 months. Secondary outcomes were successful weaning from mechanical ventilation within 1 month of tracheostomy, survival rate at 1 and 3 months after tracheostomy, and cause of death. Variables associated with death and liberation from mechanical ventilation with one month were analyzed. We performed propensity score matching (PSM) in 27 patients undergoing tracheostomy to compare long-term survival with case-matched cohort consisting of patients with closely matched clinical characteristics who received mechanical ventilation but had no tracheostomy. Twelve variables for PSM matching were selected, including demographic data, duration from illness onset to intubation, laboratory test results, and comorbidities (Table 3). The propensity scores for receiving one treatment option (tracheostomy or no tracheostomy) were calculated using the logistic regression model. The continuous variables in groups were compared using Student's t-tests (normally distributed) or Mann-Whitney U test (non-normally distributed), while the categorical variables were analyzed by the Fisher's exact test or χ² test. The Kaplan-Meier method was used to assess survival with significance calculated using the log rank test.

2.5. Medical staff, instruments, and procedures

The medical staff included two skilled surgeons and an intensive care specialist responsible for administering anesthesia and monitoring patients. Tracheostomies were performed in a single, well-ventilated ICU room to avoid unnecessary transportation. The procedures for bedside open tracheostomy and percutaneous tracheostomy have been detailed in previous literature, including one of our previous studies [7,8].

3. Results

The median age of the patients in our study group was 67 (range, 38–86) years. Twenty-two (81.5%) patients had at least one underlying comorbidity, the most common being hypertension (59.3%), diabetes (37.0%), cerebrovascular disease (33.3%), coronary heart disease (22.2%), and malignancy (7.4%). The median duration from the onset of illness to tracheostomy was 43 (range, 10–90) days. The median intubation period was 26 (range, 5–50) days. No deaths were attributed to the tracheostomy procedure.

The overall survival rate at 1, 3, and 9 months after tracheostomy were 63.0%, 37.0%, and 29.6%, respectively (Fig. 1). The median time from tracheostomy to death was 29 (range, 4–236) days. At the final time point of follow-up at 9 months, 8 of 27 (29.6%) patients had survived, resulting in a 9-month mortality rate of 70.4%. Among the eight patients who survived, five (62.5%) were discharged home. The other three remained dependent on nursing care, two of whom remained canulated. Within 30 days after tracheostomy, 10 patients had died of respiratory failure (9/10) and cerebral hemorrhage (1/10). Between 30 and 90 days after tracheostomy, seven patients died of respiratory failure (cases 2, 10, and 24), gastrointestinal hemorrhage (case 14), cerebral hemorrhage (case 17), sepsis (case 8), and acute myocardial infarction (case 23). At the 3-month follow-up, two more patients had died of cerebral hemorrhage (cases 4 and 6). Among the 13 out of 27 patients who were successfully weaned off ventilation within 30 days, eight patients died. Among the other 14 patients who failed to be liberated from ventilation in the first month, only one survived until the 9th month. Accordingly, there was a significant correlation between mortality and the incidence of weaning success within 30 days (P < 0.05, Table 2).

We were able to match 27 COVID-19 patients (tracheostomy group) to 27 patients (no tracheostomy group) at a ratio of 1:1 (Table 3), using the nearest neighboring method. Before propensity score matching, the neutrophil count was lower in the no tracheostomy group, compared with the tracheostomy group (P = 0.001) (Table 3). Hypertension tended to be more common in the tracheostomy group (P = 0.08) (Table 3). After matching, the two groups showed no significant differences in age, gender, duration from illness onset to intubation, laboratory test results, and comorbidities (P > 0.05). In the PSM cohort, the Kaplan-Meier survival of the two groups showed a significant difference (P = 0.03). The 9-month survival rate of the two groups was similar (29.2% in tracheostomy group vs. 25.9% in no tracheostomy group, P = 1.00).

4. Discussion

Recent retrospective studies have evaluated 1-month outcomes of tracheostomy in COVID-19 patients [5,6,8,9]. The 30-day survival of patients receiving tracheostomy was higher than that of non-tracheostomized patients [6]. However, no long-term outcome data are available yet. We observed that seven of 17 survivors at the 30-day follow-up died in the subsequent 2 months, highlighting the difficulty and complexity of the medical treatment of critically ill COVID-19 patients.

Prolonged intubation (≥14 days) remains the most common indication for tracheostomy in critically ill COVID-19 patients [10,11]. In our study, 22 of 27 patients were intubated for >14 days. Our findings revealed a marked decrease in the survival rate from 1-month follow-up (62.9%) to the 3-month (37.1%) follow-up (Fig. 1). The cause of death for seven of 17 patients who died between the 1- and 3-month follow-up included respiratory failure (three patients), gastrointestinal or cerebral hemorrhage (two patients), and acute myocardial infarction (one patient). Autopsy of a COVID-19 patient lung tissue showed diffuse alveolar damage with cellular fibromyxoid exudates and hyaline membrane formation [12]. Moreover, a recently published elegant study showed that a considerable proportion COVID-19 patients who were discharged showed impaired pulmonary diffusion capacities and abnormal chest imaging manifestations at 5 months after symptom onset [13]. Our data also showed that respiratory failure is a leading cause of death (11/15) within 2 months after tracheostomy, especially within the first month (9/10).

Three months after tracheostomy, the survival rate was relatively stable. The cause of death among patients after the 3-month follow-up were varied. Two patients (cases 4 and 6) died of cerebral hemorrhage. Case 4 was of a 70-year-old male who had hypertension, diabetes, and coronary disease. Case 6 was of a 42-year-old male who developed multiple organ failure and had required repeated ECMO salvage. Considering that two other patients (case 17, 25) died of hemorrhage within 3 months after tracheostomy suggests that hemorrhage is a critical cause of death, especially after the 2-month time-point after tracheostomy (3/4 patients). According to a recent large cohort study, over 10% of COVID-19 patients discharged from hospital died within the subsequent 5 months [14]. The incidence of major adverse cardiovascular event (MACE, a composite of heart failure, myocardial infarction, stroke, and arrhythmia) is significantly higher among COVID-19 patients than the general population (24.4% vs 5.6%, respectively) over this 5-month period after discharge [14]. In agreement with these
| Case No. | Age (years) | Gender | Duration from illness onset to intubation (days) | Duration of endotracheal intubation (days) | Comorbidity | Methods | ECMO | Duration since tracheotomy (days) | Cause of death | Duration of mechanical ventilation (days) | Duration from intubation to decannulation (days) | Weaning from ventilator in 30 days after tracheostomy | Outcome |
|----------|-------------|--------|-----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|-------------|---------|------|-----------------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|---------|
| 1        | 60          | M      | 20                                           | 9                                      | None        | PT      | Yes  | 29                                | Respiratory failure, infectious shock | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 2        | 70          | M      | 27                                           | 5                                      | Diabetes    | PT      | No   | 44                                | Respiratory failure              | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 3        | 55          | F      | 13                                           | 27                                     | Hypertension, diabetes | OT      | No   | NA                                | NA                  | NA                                 | Yes                              | Deceased                     |
| 4        | 70          | M      | 10                                           | 27                                     | CD, Hypertension, diabetes | OT      | No   | 236                               | Cerebral hemorrhage              | 45                                | NA                              | Yes                              | Deceased                     |
| 5        | 65          | F      | 13                                           | 21                                     | CD, Hypertension, diabetes | OT      | No   | NA                                | NA                  | 41                                | 201                             | Yes                              | Recovery                      |
| 6        | 42          | M      | 20                                           | 25                                     | None        | PT      | Yes  | 91                                | Cerebral hemorrhage              | 62                                | 64                               | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 7        | 42          | M      | 14                                           | 29                                     | None        | PT      | Yes  | NA                                | NA                  | 34                                | 36                              | Yes                              | Recovery                      |
| 8        | 67          | F      | 16                                           | 17                                     | Hypertension, CHD, Hypertension, diabetes | OT      | No   | NA                                | NA                  | 41                                | 201                             | Yes                              | Deceased                     |
| 9        | 55          | F      | 24                                           | 26                                     | Hypertension, diabetes         | PT      | No   | NA                                | NA                  | 46                                | 56                              | Yes                              | Recovery                      |
| 10       | 66          | M      | 27                                           | 15                                     | Hypertension, diabetes, CHD    | PT      | No   | 72                                | Respiratory and circulatory failure | NA                                | NA                              | Yes                              | Deceased                     |
| 11       | 45          | F      | 22                                           | 16                                     | None        | PT      | Yes  | 10                                | Respiratory failure              | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 12       | 79          | F      | 28                                           | 13                                     | Hypertension               | OT      | Yes  | 24                                | Respiratory failure, multiple organ failure | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 13       | 47          | M      | 12                                           | 29                                     | None        | PT      | Yes  | 21                                | Respiratory failure              | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 14       | 69          | M      | 22                                           | 24                                     | Hypertension, diabetes         | OT      | No   | 41                                | Gastrointestinal hemorrhage      | NA                                | NA                              | Yes                              | Deceased                     |
| 15       | 56          | M      | 21                                           | 32                                     | Hypertension, CHD             | OT      | Yes  | NA                                | NA                  | 112                               | 116                             | No                              | Recovery                      |
| 16       | 69          | M      | 11                                           | 36                                     | CD                        | OT      | No   | NA                                | NA                  | 54                                | NA                              | Yes                              | Partial recovery              |
| 17       | 68          | F      | 24                                           | 9                                      | CD, Hypertension, diabetes    | OT      | No   | 86                                | Cerebral hemorrhage              | NA                                | NA                              | Yes                              | Deceased                     |
| 18       | 67          | M      | 20                                           | 33                                     | CD                         | OT      | No   | 18                                | Respiratory failure              | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 19       | 86          | M      | 3                                            | 50                                     | Hypertension, CHD, CD         | PT      | No   | NA                                | NA                  | 62                                | NA                              | Yes                              | Partial recovery              |
| 20       | 80          | F      | 41                                           | 15                                     | Hypertension, CHD             | OT      | Yes  | 6                                 | Respiratory failure              | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 21       | 74          | F      | 29                                           | 27                                     | Hypertension, CHD             | OT      | No   | 13                                | Respiratory failure              | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 22       | 38          | M      | 3                                            | 7                                      | CD                         | PT      | No   | 4                                 | Cerebral hemorrhage              | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 23       | 47          | M      | 27                                           | 26                                     | Hypertension, diabetes        | OT      | Yes  | 44                                | Acute myocardial infarction      | NA                                | NA                              | Yes                              | Deceased                     |
| 24       | 81          | F      | 34                                           | 37                                     | CD                         | PT      | No   | 32                                | Respiratory failure              | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 25       | 77          | M      | 65                                           | 25                                     | CD, CHD                    | OT      | No   | 12                                | Respiratory failure              | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
| 26       | 69          | M      | 10                                           | 32                                     | CHD, Hypertension, malignancy | OT      | No   | NA                                | NA                  | 52                                | 55                              | Yes                              | Recovery                      |
| 27       | 58          | F      | 37                                           | 33                                     | Hypertension, diabetes        | OT      | Yes  | 23                                | Respiratory failure, Multiple organ failure | NA                                | NA                              | No                              | Deceased                     |
findings, four of 17 patients in our study group died of organ hemorrhage after the 30-day follow-up. This finding emphasizes the importance of managing the coagulation system for long-term tracheostomized COVID-19 patients.

Evidence is lacking regarding whether performing tracheostomy contributes to better prognosis at 9-month follow-up. The prolonged life-sustaining treatment of critically ill COVID-19 is extremely resource intensive. Regarding mechanical ventilation for respiratory failure, it is generally accepted that a tracheostomy should not be considered in a person who cannot readily benefit from the advantages that the airway may offer [15]. Our data showed that liberation from ventilation with 1 month is the only risk-factor that is associated with the 9-month mortality. In the present study, 13 patients (48.1%) were successfully weaned off ventilation within 30 days, which is similar to the proportion (56.6%) reported by another group [5]. Thirteen out of 14 patients who failed to be weaned from ventilation in the first month died by the endpoint of follow-up at 9 months after tracheostomy. This may aid us in predicting the prognosis and evaluating the benefit of tracheostomy.

According to our paired adjustment for COVID-19 patients who were intubated for >14 days, compared with non-tracheostomy group, the tracheostomy group did not show statistically significant difference on 9-month mortality (P > 0.05, Fig. 2). The survival advantage of COVID-19 patients receiving a tracheostomy was seen significantly in 30-day outcomes in a previous study [6], which is also the scenario in our present study. However, this advantage was attenuated significantly due to increased death after one month in our tracheostomized group. There may be confounding factors including a selection bias of healthier patients for the non-tracheostomy group, and tracheostomy in patients with questionable prognoses. However, our data revealed that the advantage of performing tracheostomy in COVID-19 patients may need to be evaluated at a longer than 30-day follow-up.

This study has several limitations which should be acknowledged. First, our case series included only 27 patients, a relatively small sample,
Whether tracheostomy in COVID-19 patients contributes to better clinical outcomes needs further investigation in future large-scale cohort studies. Third, due to the lack of knowledge and treatment guidelines when we encountered this newly identified disease, some of our treatments were empirical which may have influenced the final outcomes. Multicenter collaborations with a larger sample size are better to address the entire picture as to long-term outcomes of tracheostomy for COVID-19 patients.

5. Conclusion

Our study showed that the survival rate of COVID-19 patients after tracheostomy decreased steadily in the first 90 days after tracheostomy, and patients stayed relatively stable after 90 days. Medical support is much needed for COVID-19 patients over the first 90 days after tracheostomy. Respiratory failure was the leading cause of death within the first 90 days after tracheostomy, and patients stayed relatively stable after 90 days. Medical support is much needed for COVID-19 patients over the first 90 days after tracheostomy.

Availability of data and materials

The datasets used and/or analyzed during the current study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

Funding

This work was supported by National Natural Science Foundation of China (NSFC) grant 81400448 to Dr. Xiaobo Long, 81702687 to Dr. Kai Xu, and 81670911 to Dr. Xiang Lu.

CRediT authorship contribution statement

XL and ZL devised the project. XHZ, XBL, KX performed the surgery and collected patient data for study. XHZ, KX wrote the manuscript. ZL and XL and ZL devised the project. XHZ, KX wrote the manuscript. ZL and XBL and KX performed the surgery and collected patient data for study. XHZ, XBL, KX performed the surgery and collected patient data for study. XHZ, KX wrote the manuscript. ZL, XBL and KX performed the surgery and collected patient data for study. ZL, XBL and KX performed the surgery and collected patient data for study.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Acknowledgements

Not applicable.

References

[1] Chen N, Zhou M, Dong X, et al. Epidemiological and clinical characteristics of 99 cases of 2019 novel coronavirus pneumonia in Wuhan, China: a descriptive study. Lancet 2020;395(10223):507–13. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)30211-7.
[2] Huang C, Wang Y, Li X, et al. Clinical features of patients infected with 2019 novel coronavirus in Wuhan, China. Lancet 2020;395(10223):497–506. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)30183-5.
[3] Wang D, Hu B, Hu C, et al. Clinical characteristics of 138 hospitalized patients with 2019 Novel Coronavirus-infected pneumonia in Wuhan, China. JAMA. 2020;323(11):1061–2. https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.1585.
[4] Krishnamurthy S, Polanco A, Coleman N, et al. The safety and efficacy of tracheostomy in patients diagnosed with COVID-19: an analysis of 143 patients at a major NYC medical center. Ann Surg 2020. https://doi.org/10.1097/SLA.0000000000002612.
[5] Chao TN, Harbison SP, Bradow BM, et al. Outcomes after tracheostomy in COVID-19 patients. Ann Surg 2020;272(3):e181–6. https://doi.org/10.1097/SLA.0000000000002416.
[6] Queen Elizabeth Hospital Birmingham C-at. Safety and 30-day outcomes of tracheostomy for COVID-19: a prospective observational cohort study. Br J Anaesth 2020;125(6):872–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bja.2020.08.023.
[7] Xu K, Zhang XH, Long XB, Lu X, Liu Z. An environmental study of tracheostomy in patients diagnosed with COVID-19: an analysis of 143 patients at a major NYC medical center. Ann Surg 2020. https://doi.org/10.1097/SLA.0000000000002612.
[8] Long SM, Chen A, Feit NZ, et al. Percutaneous and open tracheostomy in patients with COVID-19: comparison and outcomes of an institutional series in New York.
[9] Murphy P, Holler E, Lindroth H, et al. Short-term outcomes for patients and providers after elective tracheostomy in COVID-19-positive patients. J Surg Res 2021;260:38–45. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jsr.2020.10.013.

[10] Sommer DD, Engels PT, Weitzel EK, et al. Recommendations from the CSO-HNS taskforce on performance of tracheotomy during the COVID-19 pandemic. J Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg 2020;49(1):23. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40463-020-00414-9.

[11] McGrath BA, Brenner MJ, Warrillow SJ, et al. Tracheostomy in the COVID-19 era: global and multidisciplinary guidance. Lancet Respir Med 2020;8(7):717–25. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2213-2600(20)30230-7.

[12] Xu Z, Shi L, Wang Y, et al. Pathological findings of COVID-19 associated with acute respiratory distress syndrome. Lancet Respir Med 2020;8(4):420–2. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2213-2600(20)30076-X.

[13] Huang C, Huang L, Wang Y, et al. 6-month consequences of COVID-19 in patients discharged from hospital: a cohort study. Lancet 2021;397(10270):220–32. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)32656-6.

[14] Ayoubkhani D, Khunti K, Nafilyan V, et al. Post-covid syndrome in individuals admitted to hospital with covid-19: retrospective cohort study. BMJ 2021;372:n693. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.n693.

[15] Chiang SS, Aboutanos MB, Jawa RS, et al. Controversies in tracheostomy for patients with COVID-19: the when, where, and how. Respir Care 2020;65(11):1767–72. https://doi.org/10.4187/respcare.08100.