The role of tiotropium in the management of asthma

Heung-Woo Park

Department of Internal Medicine, Seoul National University College of Medicine, Seoul 110-744, Korea

Asthma is a chronic respiratory disease characterized by reversible airway obstruction that is secondary to an allergic inflammation and excessive smooth muscle contraction. Cholinergic signals were known to contribute significantly to the pathophysiology of asthma. However, the use of anti-cholinergic agents in asthma has been justified only in acute asthma exacerbations, until tiotropium bromide, a long-acting anti-cholinergic agent was introduced. Recent reports showing a promising role of tiotropium in the treatment of asthma have aroused interest of the use of anti-cholinergic agent for the management of asthma. This report describes pharmacological characteristics, potential effects on inflammatory cells, and the current status of tiotropium in the treatment of asthma.

Key words: Anticholinergics; Asthma; Bronchodilators; Tiotropium

INTRODUCTION

Asthma is a chronic respiratory disease characterized by reversible airway obstruction that is secondary to an allergic inflammation and excessive smooth muscle contraction [1]. Currently, anti-inflammatory drugs (mainly inhaled corticosteroids) and bronchodilators (mainly inhaled β2 agonists) are widely used in the treatment of asthma based on the understanding of asthma pathogenesis. Parasympathetic nervous system is the important neural pathway controlling airway smooth muscle. Stimulation of parasympathetic nerve results in bronchoconstriction, bronchial vasodilatation and mucus secretion via muscarinic receptors [2]. Moreover, parasympathetic tone is known to be increased in asthma by several mechanisms; increased afferent stimulation caused by airway inflammation [3], abnormal muscarinic receptor expressions [4], an increased release of acetylcholine from parasympathetic nerve ending [5], and decreased levels of neuromodulators that attenuate parasympathetic tone [6]. Therefore it seems natural that we can expect a favorable outcome when we use anti-cholinergic agents that block parasympathetic tone in the treatment of asthma. However, early experiences with ipratropium bromide, a short-acting inhaled anti-cholinergic agent, in the treatment of asthma were disappointing [7-9]. The use of anti-cholinergic agents in asthma has been justified only in acute asthma exacerbations [10].
Anti-cholinergic agents had been left orphan in the field of asthma pharmacology until tiotropium bromide, a long-acting inhaled anti-cholinergic agent was introduced. During the last decade, tiotropium has been used widely in the treatment of patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) and is indicated for once-daily maintenance treatment in the current COPD treatment guideline [11]. Recent reports showing a promising role of tiotropium in the treatment of asthma have aroused interest of the use of anti-cholinergic agent for the management of asthma [12-15]. This report describes pharmacological characteristics, potential effects on inflammatory cells, and the current status of tiotropium in the treatment of asthma.

Role of cholinergic signaling in the pathophysiology of asthma

So far, 5 muscarinic receptors (M1-M5 subtype) mediating cholinergic signal has been identified. However, only M1, M2 and M3 receptors have been convincingly demonstrated to exist in human airways. Among them, the M3 receptor in the airway smooth muscle is known to play an important role in the pathophysiology of asthma by inducing bronchoconstriction and mucus secretion [16, 17]. Whereas, the pre-junctional M2 receptor provides a negative feedback to attenuate further release of acetylcholine [18]. An increased release of acetylcholine from cholinergic nerve endings [19] and an abnormal muscarinic receptor expression (either an increase in M1 and M3 receptors or disruption of the M2 receptors) [20] have been proposed to explain an excessive bronchoconstriction found in asthmatics. Afferent sensory nerve endings exposed to the airway lumen by mediator-induced epithelial damage (e.g., eosinophil-derived major basic protein [21]) is thought to be an important mechanism for vagally mediated airway hyperresponsiveness [22]. Mucus hypersecretion is one of the cardinal features found in asthma contributing to an airway obstruction. Submucosal glands are innervated and express M1 and M3 receptors [23]. M3 receptor is thought to be the predominant receptor that mediates mucus secretion [24, 25] and muscarinic receptor stimulation transactivates the epidermal growth factor receptor [26] which is known to regulate goblet cell hyperplasia [27]. Along with this, it is reported that repeated administration of the cholinergic agonists promoted goblet cell hyperplasia and mucus gland hypertrophy in experimental animal models [22]. Interestingly, recent investigations have revealed that most inflammatory cells including T lymphocyte [28, 29], mast cell [28, 30] and eosinophils [31, 32] express functional muscarinic receptors. Those findings suggest that cholinergic signals can modulate inflammatory processes by paracrine and/or autocrine mechanisms [29, 33]. Moreover, there may be a distinct regulatory role for endogenous acetylcholine in promoting airway remodeling induced by allergen [34, 35]. Taken together, cholinergic signals contribute significantly to the pathophysiology of asthma.

Pharmacological characteristics of tiotropium

Tiotropium bromide monohydrate, chemically described as (1α, 2β, 4β, 5α, 7β)-7-{[(hydroxydi-2-thienylacetyl)oxy]-9,9-dimethyl-3-oxa-9-azoniatriacyclo[3.3.1.02,4] nonane bromide monohydrate, is a second-generation inhaled anti-cholinergic agent and is sparingly soluble in water [36]. Compared with other anti-cholinergics, tiotropium shows peculiar selectivity and affinity for muscarinic receptor subtypes. It displays a 6-20-fold higher affinity for muscarinic receptors than does ipratropium [37]. Tiotropium is basically non-selective and thus binds to all three muscarinic receptors in the airway but it dissociates much faster from M2 receptors compared to M1 and M3 receptors [38, 39]. Therefore, it can be categorized as a more selective antagonist for M1 and M3 receptors. A prolonged pharmacologic activity is also attributed to its slow dissociation from M1 and M3 receptors. After an inhaled dose of tiotropium, about 20% is deposited in the lung [40]. Then, it rapidly absorbed into the systemic circulation and reaches the peak plasma concentration within 5 min [41]. The half-life of the tiotropium-M3 receptor complex is approximately 35 h, whereas 0.3 h for ipratropium [37, 39]. After the first dose, mean time to onset of effect is 30 min, mean time to peak effect is about 3 h and maximum effect is obtained after 1 week [37, 39, 42, 43]. It has been calculated that tiotropium at the steady-state concentration would occupy less than 5% of muscarinic receptors, which may explain the relatively low frequency of systemic adverse reactions [39]. There is no evidence for drug accumulation after repeated administration.

Effect of tiotropium on the asthma pathogenesis; results from experimental models of asthma

In both acute and chronic murine model of asthma, treatment with tiotropium significantly reduced airway inflammation and the Th2 cytokine production in bronchoalveolar lavage (BAL) fluid [44]. In this report, authors found that the levels of TGF-β1 in BAL fluid were significantly suppressed after treatment and suggested that
Tiotropium for the management of asthma

the reduction of TGF-β1 production might one of the underlying mechanism for their observations. Another interesting finding of this report was that authors verified that the M3 receptors were present on airway smooth muscle cells, inflammatory cells, goblet cells, and airway epithelium in lung section and on lymphocytes in the spleen section of mouse. As mentioned before, the non-neuronal cholinergic system is widely expressed in epithelial cells, submucosal glands, smooth muscle cells, and a variety of immune cells including lymphocytes, macrophages, and mast cells in the airway and choline acetyltransferase and/or acetylcholine and nicotinic and muscarinic receptors are found in these cells [28, 29]. This non-neuronal cholinergic system may account the reduction in Th2 cytokine production by the tiotropium treatment in murine model of asthma. In this sense, a recent report which evaluated the role of tiotropium on airway hyperreactivity using a vagotomized guinea-pig model of allergic asthma is worthy of being mentioned [45]. Authors focused on the non-neuronal cholinergic system and compared the effect of tiotropium on vagally mediated bronchoconstriction and bronchoconstriction induced by intravenous administration of achetylcholine. They found that tiotropium did not attenuate vagally-induced bronchoconstriction in sensitized controls, although it inhibited bronchoconstriction induced by intravenous administration of achetylcholine. Interestingly, tiotropium inhibited eosinophil accumulation in the lungs and around nerves. We can learn from those observations that tiotropium may inhibit airway hyperreactivity not only by blocking receptors for vagally released acetylcholine but also by working through an anti-inflammatory mechanism. Moreover, tiotropium was also found to decrease airways remodeling in animal models of ovalbumin-induced asthma and these effects were comparable to those of the corticosteroid [46, 47].

Efficacy of tiotropium on the asthma treatment; results from clinical trials

Consideration of tiotropium as a treatment option in asthma management has been provoked by the finding that a large proportion of asthmatics do not achieve control with current treatment options including the combination of long-acting β2 agonist (LABA) and even high dose inhaled corticosteroids (ICSs) [48, 49]. Earlier studies in asthmatics demonstrated that inhaled tiotropium resulted in a rapid onset, sustained bronchodilation and reduced the airways hyperresponsiveness [50, 51]. And successive small-scale studies suggested factors capable of predicting good responses to tiotropium; asthmatics with COPD component [52], severe asthmatics with non-eosinophilic phenotype [53], and severe asthmatics with Arg16Gly and Gly16Gly in AD RB2 (coding β2 adrenoreceptor) [12]. However, despite the early signals of efficacy, beneficial effects of tiotropium have not been fully evaluated in asthmatics. The tiotropium bromide as an alternative to increased inhaled glucocorticoid in patients inadequately controlled on a lower dose of inhaled corticosteroid study was the cornerstone of clinical use of tiotropium in asthma treatment [13]. This was a three-way, double-blind, triple-dummy, cross-over trial, which enrolled patients with milder asthma controlled inadequately by ICS. The purpose of this study was to assess whether the addition of inhaled tiotropium to ICS was superior in efficacy to the ICS double dose and noninferior to addition of the salmeterol (inhaled LABA) to beclomethasone (ICS). Tiotropium added to ICS showed a significantly improved morning peak expiratory flow rate (PEFR) compared to double the ICS dose. And a similar effect was observed by adding salmeterol. The tiotropium regimen also significantly improved the pre-bronchodilator forced expiratory volume in one second (FEV1) as compared to double ICS regimen and LABA regimen. Both the tiotropium and LABA regimens also significantly improved asthma symptoms, quality-of-life scores and lung function as compared to double ICS regimen. This study demonstrates that in partially controlled asthmatics with ICS, we can improve disease control not only by adding LABA but also by adding tiotropium. In addition, recently, well-designed studies showing a promising role of tiotropium in the treatment of moderate to severe asthmatics have been published [14, 15]. Kerstjens and colleagues [14] performed a study to compare the efficacy and safety of two doses of tiotropium (5 and 10 μg daily) administered through the Respimat® inhaler with placebo as an additive therapy in patients with uncontrolled severe asthma. They found that peak FEV1 was significantly higher with 5 μg (difference, 139 mL; 95% CI, 96-181 mL) and 10 μg (difference, 170 mL; 95% CI, 128-213 mL) of tiotropium than with placebo (both p < 0.0001). And trough FEV1 at the end of the dosing interval and daily home PEFR measurements were also higher with both tiotropium doses. In addition, they found that asthma-related health status or symptoms showed no significant difference between the tiotropium and placebo group. In addition, adverse events were similar across groups except for dry mouth which was more common on 10 μg of tiotropium [14]. There has been concerns about the safety of regular use of LABAs in asthmatics [54, 55], especially regarding for asthmatics who are Arg16 homozygote in the coding region of the β2 adrenergic receptor.
gene [56]. Bateman and colleagues tested the hypothesis that tiotropium might be an alternative (non-β2 adrenergic agonist) bronchodilator in Arg16 homozygote asthmatics [15]. In this study, they found that tiotropium was superior to placebo and noninferior to salmeterol in maintaining improved lung function in moderate persistent Arg16 homozygote asthmatics [15]. And safety profiles were comparable [15].

**CONCLUSION**

There is increasing interest in using tiotropium for the treatment of asthma. Based on recent reports (Table 1), tiotropium may be a valuable alternative to LABA for patients whose symptoms are not controlled by ICSs alone and as an additive therapy in patients with severe asthma not controlled with available medications, including LABA. However, we need additional studies testing whether tiotropium reduces asthma exacerbations, an important marker of disease control [57] to the same extent as LABA [58]. In addition, safety issues related tiotropium should be cleared up so that we can determine whether tiotropium is an alternative to LABA for the long-term treatment of asthma. Because there is a concern for the possible association between tiotropium and cardiovascular events [59].

**REFERENCES**

1. The Global Initiative for Asthma. Pocket Guide for Asthma Management and Prevention. Updated 2010. Available from: http://www.ginasthma.org/guidelines-pocket-guide-for-asthma-management.html.
2. Nadel JA, Barnes PJ. Autonomic regulation of the airways. Annu Rev Med 1984;35:451-67.
3. Molfilno NA, Slutsky AS, Julià-Serdà G, Hoffstein V, Szalai JP, Chapman KR, Reubuck AS, Zamel N. Assessment of airway tone in asthma. Comparison between double lung transplant patients and healthy subjects. Am Rev Respir Dis 1993;148:1238-43.
4. Ayala LE, Ahmed T. Is there loss of protective muscarinic receptor mechanism in asthma? Chest 1989;96:1285-91.
5. Barnes PJ. Modulation of neurotransmission in airways. Physiol Rev 1992;72:699-729.
6. Kanazawa H, Kawaguchi T, Shoji S, Fujii T, Kudoh S, Hirata K, Kurihara N, Yoshikawa J. Synergistic effect of nitric oxide and vasoactive intestinal peptide on bronchoprotection against histamine in anesthetized guinea pigs. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 1997;155:747-50.
7. Ruffin RE, Fitzgerald JD, Reubuck AS. A comparison of the bronchodilator activity of Sch 1000 and salbutamol. J Allergy Clin Immunol 1977;59:136-41.
8. Cazzola M, Centanni S, Donner CF. Anticholinergic agents. Pulm Pharmacol Ther 1998;11:381-92.
9. Westby M, Benson M, Gibson P. Anticholinergic agents for chronic asthma in adults. Cochrane Database Syst Rev 2004;CD003269.
10. Gross NJ. Anticholinergic agents in asthma and COPD. Eur J Pharmacol 2006;533:36-9.
11. The Global Initiative for Chronic Obstructive Lung Disease. Global Strategy for Diagnosis, Management, and Prevention of COPD. Available from: http://www.goldcopd.org/guidelines-global-strategy-for-diagnosis-management.html.
12. Park HW, Yang MS, Park CS, Kim TB, Moon HB, Min KU, Kim YY, Cho SH. Additive role of tiotropium in severe asthmatics and Arg16Gly in ADRB2 as a potential marker to predict response. Allergy
Tiotropium for the management of asthma

2009;64:778-83.

13. Peters SP, Kunselman SJ, Icitovic N, Moore WC, Pascual R, Ameredes BT, Boushey HA, Calhoun WJ, Castro M, Cherniack RM, Craig T, Denlinger L, Engle LL, DiMango EA, Fahy JV, Israel E, Janjou N, Kazani SD, Kraft M, Lazarus SC, Lemanske RF Jr, Lugogo N, Martin RJ, Meyers DA, Ramsdell J, Sorkness CA, Sutherland ER, Szefler SJ, Wasserman SI, Walter MJ, Wechsler ME, Chinchilli VM, Bleecker ER. Tiotropium bromide step-up therapy for adults with uncontrolled asthma. N Engl J Med 2010;363:1715-26.

14. Kerstjens HA, Disse B, Schroeder-Babo W, Bantje TA, Gahlemann M, Sigmund R, Engel M, van Noord JA. Tiotropium improves lung function in patients with severe uncontrolled asthma: a randomized controlled trial. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2011;128:308-14.

15. Bateman ED, Kornmann O, Schmidt P, Pivovarova A, Engel M, Fabbri LM. Tiotropium is noninferior to salmeterol in maintaining improved lung function in B16-Arg/Arg patients with asthma. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2011;128:315-22.

16. Disse B, Reinchl R, Speck G, Traunecker W, Ludwig Rominger KL, Hammer R, Ba 679 BR, a novel long-acting anticholinergic bronchodilator. Life Sci 1993;55:55-44.

17. Joos GF. Potential usefulness of inhibiting neural mechanisms in asthma. Monaldi Arch Chest Dis 2000;55:411-4.

18. Haddad el-B, Roussell J. Regulation of the expression and function of the M2 muscarinic receptor. Trends Pharmacol Sci 1998;19:322-7.

19. Disse B, Speck GA, Rominger KL, Witek TJ Jr, Hammer R. Tiotropium bromide (Spiriva): mechanistical considerations and clinical profile in obstructive lung disease. Life Sci 1999;64:457-64.

20. Wessler IK, Kirkpatrick CJ. The non-neuronal cholinergic system: an emerging drug target in the airways. Pulm Pharmacol Ther 2001;14:423-34.

21. Fujii T, Kawashima K. An independent non-neuronal cholinergic system in lymphocytes. Jpn J Pharmacol 2001;85:11-5.

22. Reinehrreim T, Baumgärnter D, Höhle KD, Raché K, Wessler I. Acetylcholine via muscarinic receptors inhibits histamine release from human isolated bronchi. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 1997;156:389-95.

23. Profita M, Giorgi RD, Sala A, Bonanno A, Riccobono L, Mirabella F, Gjomarkaj M, Bonsignore G, Bousquet J, Vignola AM. Muscarinic receptors, leukotriene B4 production and neutrophilic inflammation in COPD patients. Allergy 2005;60:1361-9.

24. Haglorsen E, Einasson A, Aronsson F, Nordlund G, Michaelsson G. The distribution of choline acetyltransferase- and acetylcholinesterase-like immunoreactivity in the palmar skin of patients with palmoplantar pustulosis. Br J Dermatol 2000;142:234-42.

25. Wessler I, Kilbinger H, Bittinger F, Unger R, Kirkpatrick CJ. The non-neuronal cholinergic system in humans: expression, function and pathophysiology. Life Sci 2003;72:2055-61.

26. Gosens R, Zaagsma J, Grootte Bromhaar M, Nelemans A, Meurs H. Acetylcholine: a novel regulator of airway smooth muscle remodelling? Eur J Pharmacol 2004;500:193-201.

27. Halayko AJ, Tran T, Ji SY, Yamasaaki A, Gosens R. Airway smooth muscle phenotype and function: interactions with current asthma therapies. Curr Drug Targets 2006;7:525-40.

28. Wessler IK, Kirkpatrick CJ. The non-neuronal cholinergic system: an emerging drug target in the airways. Pulm Pharmacol Ther 2001;14:423-34.

29. Fujii T, Kawashima K. An independent non-neuronal cholinergic system in lymphocytes. Jpn J Pharmacol 2001;85:11-5.

30. Reinehrreim T, Baumgärnter D, Höhle KD, Raché K, Wessler I. Acetylcholine via muscarinic receptors inhibits histamine release from human isolated bronchi. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 1997;156:389-95.

31. Profita M, Giorgi RD, Sala A, Bonanno A, Riccobono L, Mirabella F, Gjomarkaj M, Bonsignore G, Bousquet J, Vignola AM. Muscarinic receptors, leukotriene B4 production and neutrophilic inflammation in COPD patients. Allergy 2005;60:1361-9.

32. Haglorsen E, Einasson A, Aronsson F, Nordlund G, Michaelsson G. The distribution of choline acetyltransferase- and acetylcholinesterase-like immunoreactivity in the palmar skin of patients with palmoplantar pustulosis. Br J Dermatol 2000;142:234-42.

33. Wessler I, Kilbinger H, Bittinger F, Unger R, Kirkpatrick CJ. The non-neuronal cholinergic system in humans: expression, function and pathophysiology. Life Sci 2003;72:2055-61.

34. Gosens R, Zaagsma J, Grootte Bromhaar M, Nelemans A, Meurs H. Acetylcholine: a novel regulator of airway smooth muscle remodelling? Eur J Pharmacol 2004;500:193-201.

35. Halayko AJ, Tran T, Ji SY, Yamasaaki A, Gosens R. Airway smooth muscle phenotype and function: interactions with current asthma therapies. Curr Drug Targets 2006;7:525-40.

36. Restrepo RD. Use of inhaled anticholinergic agents in obstructive airway disease. Respir Care 2007;52:833-51.

37. Haddad EB, Mak JC, Barnes PJ. Characterization of [3H]Ba 679 BR, a slowly dissociating muscarinic antagonist, in human lung: radioligand binding and autoradiographic mapping. Mol Pharmacol 1994;45:899-907.

38. O’Connor BJ, Towse LJ, Barnes PJ. Prolonged effect of tiotropium bromide on airway inflammation and remodelling in a mouse model of asthma. Clin Exp Allergy 2010;40:1266-75.

39. Witek TJ Jr. Anticholinergic bronchodilators. Expert Opin Invest Drugs 2001;10:733-40.

40. ZuWallack AR, ZuWallack RL. Tiotropium bromide, a new, once-daily inhaled anticholinergic bronchodilator for chronic-obstructive pulmonary disease. Expert Opin Pharmacother 2004;5:1827-35.

41. Disse B, Speck GA, Rominger KL, Witek TJ Jr, Hammer R. Tiotropium (Spiriva): mechanistical considerations and clinical profile in obstructive lung disease. Life Sci 1999;64:457-64.

42. Witek TJ Jr. Anticholinergic bronchodilators. Respir Care Clin N Am 1999;5:521-36.

43. Gross NJ. Tiotropium bromide. Chest 2004;126:1946-53.

44. Ohta S, Oda N, Yokoe T, Tanaka A, Yamamoto Y, Watanabe Y, Minoguchi K, Ohnishi T, Hirose T, Nagase H, Ohta K, Adachi M. Effect of tiotropium bromide on airway inflammation and remodelling in a mouse model of asthma. Clin Exp Allergy 2010;40:1266-75.

45. Buel KS, Jacoby DB, Fryer AD. Non-bronchodilating mechanisms of tiotropium prevent airway hyperreactivity in a guinea-pig model of allergic asthma. Br J Pharmacol 2012;165:1501-14.
46. Gosens R, Bos IS, Zaatasma J, Meurs H. Protective effects of tiotropium bromide in the progression of airway smooth muscle remodeling. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2005;171:1096-102.

47. Bos IS, Gosens R, Zuidhof AB, Schaafsma D, Halayko AJ, Meurs H, Zaatasma J. Inhibition of allergen-induced airway remodelling by tiotropium and budesonide: a comparison. Eur Respir J 2007;30:653-61.

48. Chanez P, Wenzel SE, Anderson GP, Anto JM, Bel EH, Boulet LP, Brightling CE, Busse WW, Castro M, Dahlen B, Dahlen SE, Fabbri LM, Holgate ST, Humbert M, Gaga M, Joos GF, Levy B, Rabe KF, Sterk PJ, Wilson SJ, Vacher I. Severe asthma in adults: what are the important questions? J Allergy Clin Immunol 2007;119:1337-48.

49. Bateman ED, Bousquet J, Busse WW, Clark TJ, Gul N, Gibbs M, Pedersen S. Stability of asthma control with regular treatment: an analysis of the Gaining Optimal Asthma controL (GOAL) study. Allergy 2008;63:932-8.

50. O' Connor BJ, Towse LJ, Barnes PJ. Prolonged effect of tiotropium bromide on methacholine-induced bronchoconstriction in asthma. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 1996;154:876-80.

51. Terzano C, Petroianni A, Ricci A, D'Antoni L, Allegra L. Early protective effects of tiotropium bromide in patients with airways hyperresponsiveness. Eur Rev Med Pharmacol Sci 2004;8:259-64.

52. Magnussen H, Bugnas B, van Noord J, Schmidt P, Gerken F, Kesten S. Improvements with tiotropium in COPD patients with concomitant asthma. Respir Med 2008;102:50-6.

53. Iwamoto H, Yokoyama A, Shiota N, Shoda H, Haruta Y, Hattori N, Kohno N. Tiotropium bromide is effective for severe asthma with noneosinophilic phenotype. Eur Respir J 2008;31:1379-80.

54. Beasley R, Martinez FD, Hackshaw A, Rabe KF, Sterk PJ, Djukanovic R. Safety of long-acting beta-agonists: urgent need to clear the air remains. Eur Respir J 2009;33:3-5.

55. Chowdhury BA, Dal Pan G. The FDA and safe use of long-acting beta-agonists in the treatment of asthma. N Engl J Med 2010;362:1169-71.

56. Kazani S, Israel E. Long-acting beta-agonists and inhaled corticosteroids: is the whole greater than the sum of its parts? J Allergy Clin Immunol 2010;125:357-8.

57. Lane S, Molina J, Plusa T. An international observational prospective study to determine the cost of asthma exacerbations (COAX). Respir Med 2006;100:434-50.

58. Masoli M, Weatherall M, Holt S, Beasley R. Moderate dose inhaled corticosteroids plus salmeterol versus higher doses of inhaled corticosteroids in symptomatic asthma. Thorax 2005;60:730-4.

59. Singh S, Loke YK, Furberg CD. Inhaled anticholinergics and risk of major adverse cardiovascular events in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a systematic review and meta-analysis. JAMA 2008;300:1439-50.