**Ihtisab (Accountability) in Waqf Institutions: A Review and Synthesis of Literature**

Yasmin Umar Assegaf¹
Tjiptohadi Sawarjuwono²
Airlangga University
Surabaya, Indonesia

**Abstract**

Waqf is an Islamic philanthropy which has a very big maslahah for the ummah, but less understood by community due to the lack of socialization. Research findings show the weaknesses on accounting and accountability in waqf institutions that reduce waqf maslahah, the lost or dormant of waqf assets. Most of nazhir (trustee) do not manage waqf assets accountably, efficiently, and effectively. In addition, they also do not present it properly in the financial statement and report it to the public. The situation is due to the unavailability of waqf accounting standard for nazhir. This study was conducted with the aim to synthesize the findings of ihtisab (accountability) studies as a basic theory building of accounting standard which is expected to improve performance of nazhir which, in turn, will increase maslahah of waqf for the ummah. This study employed shuratic method with IIE (Interactive, Integrative and Evolutionary) process modified by meta-synthesis. The research process was carried out by interactive and integrative of individual findings of the same research topics to find an integrative theory of ihtisab as an evolutionary of Islamic science that is the basic of Ihtisab standard. Synthesizing published 20 ihtisab studies leads some basics of ihtisab standard as guidance for nazhir to be responsible by having good understanding of accounting and conducting dual Islamic accountability. To meet the responsibility, Nazhir should be good in akhlak (moral) and bring his members into a good akhlak too as akhlak is a key success for Islamic institutions. Due to the fact that Synthesis of ihtisab research findings has not been done so far, it is expected that this synthesis of the studies can be the basis for subsequent researchers to continue and develop this findings on the other dimensions of theories and models by developing Islamic science and Islamic empirical methods in line with shariah.

**Keywords:** Ihtisab, Meta-Sintesis, Wakaf, Nazhir, Ijtihaad

**Introduction**

Waqf is another Islamic philanthropy which is different from zakah, infaq dan shadaqah with sunnah in fiqh status. Al-Qurán explicitly mention waqf as a part of

---

¹ Doctor Candidate of Islamic Economic, Airlangga University, Surabaya, Indonesia.
² Professor in Accounting, Faculty of Economic and Business, Airlangga University, Indonesia.
shadaqah and implementation of “Islamic distributive justice” for the whole ummah. Waqf give eternally maslahah to all people and also a potential way out of economic crisis and poverty, so it must be empowered as much as possible for the benefit of mankind and specially for waqif (waqf provider). From historical perspective, the waqf institutions play an important role in five areas: (a) an increase in Islamic ideology (b) to improve education and Islamic studies (c) to support the development of Islamic sciences. (d) to support the development of art and architecture. (e) to help understanding the values of the pure Islamic (Mannan, 2005). History has also proven that the waqf became public welfare facilities in various countries, specially in Turkey where waqf serve as a source of public welfare, until the turn of the new government that ignores the customary practice that weaken the waqf deeds (Kahf, 1998).

The important role and benefits is still very small, sporadic and only concentrated on a few countries where waqf is professionally managed. For example in the UK with islamic relief and Singapore with warees, which grows very fast in professionally manage and great benefits for society. This is in line with Islamic business objectives, that is maqashid shariáh that are a welfare protection of duafa’ in five key aspects of life that consists of the well-being of the religion (deen), life (nafs), intellectual (aql’), descent (nasl’) and property (maal).

Past research has shown that a major problem in the waqf institutions are poor management, professionalism and accountability (“accountability” hereafter referred to as ihtisab), beside also weak in control and transparency to the public and waqf (Kahf, 1998; Ilhsan, 2007; Tanim, 2009; Zaki et al., 2006). Ihtisab and transparency present information that motivates people to do more waqf deed because of good management and transparency of waqf fund (Kuran, 2001; Masyita, 2005; Tanim et al., 2009 Hasan & Shahid, 2010; Syamsiyah, 2010; Noraini, 2009).

Assets recording on waqf institution was incomplete, unsystematic and weak in management information system (Rahim, 1999; Kuran, 2001; Syamsiyah, 2010; Basri and Nabiha, 2010 and Noraini, 2009). Cordery & morely, 2005; Ilhsan 2007 found an increase in waqf accounting of Islamic Religious Council’s (SIRC), but there is still no separation of waqf asset in financial statements. Some researchers indicated that these problems caused by the unavailability of accounting standards for Islamic charities, and suggest anticipation by application of standard reporting practice (SORP) 2005 in the UK on the institution of waqf for a while until the establishment of Islamic accounting standards. SORP 2005 inter alia provides: 1) internal financial control, 2) transparency and reporting, 3) management of funds and 4) code of good governance. Thus for the improvement and revitalization of waqf funds and it maslahah, there are need to improve and develop management and specially ihtisab for the waqf institution as nazhir accountability.

Seeing the importance of waqf for the benefit of humanity raises a big question about "What are the causes of weak ihtisab in waqf institution, that reduced waqf maslahah which much needed? And How to compose a basic standard ihtisab for waqf institutions as Nazhir accountability guidelines to optimize waqf maslahah ?
This study aims to assess by using systematic review and synthesize ihtisab research findings of waqf institutions management, to integrate these findings into a unified and integrated findings as a basis for the establishment of ihtisab standards. This study uses shuratic method with interactive, integrative evolutionary process (IIE-process) which is modified by meta-synthesis. Review done by identifying ihtisab theme according to inclusion and exclusion criteria.

Data collection is done by searching ihtisab journal published through data bases and then selecting the articles that are relevant by screening and deep screening process. By using some keywords as needed and then expand the results to find another articles, among others, Islamic accountability, accountability Islamic research, waqf research, waqf management research, waqf institution research and others. Sources of data obtained from various web sites, among others: http://www.monzer.kahf.com; www.campbellcollaboration.org; http://www.waqafsa.Org.za/library&resources.htm; http://ifptest.law.harvard.edu/ifphtml; http://www.wakafcenter.com/rubrik-21.html; http://islamiccenter.kau.edu.sa; www.irtipms.org:http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/cfdev absbyauth.cfm?perid=289526; http://bwi.or.id/index.php/en/download; http://www.isra.my/publications/journal-english/current-issues/volume-4-june-2012.html; www.campbellcollaboration.org/resources; www.cochrane.org/resources and some other websites. From the journal articles, analysis has conducted by doing synthesizing process.

Journal analyzed consisted of 20 ihtisab journals from 1999 to 2013. 1999 was taken because it was the early year of ihtisab journals founded, and 2013 was the latest year ihtisab journals founded. Prior to 1990 very little research on ihtisab. Cadburry report on new governance circulated in 1990 and world bank began using the term in 1989 for the public sector of developing countries (Ruhanen, 2010).

**Ihtisab in Waqf Institution**

God created the heavens and the earth with all its contents in perfect, harmony and balance between it, and then instructs the sustainability to mankind as a vicegerent on earth (Khalifah fil-ardh) and not to do mischief on the earth (Surah: Al-Ahzaab: 72):

إنما عرضنا الأمانة على السماوات والأرض وألجناب فأتين أن يحفظها واسقفا منها وحعلها الإنسان

"Surely We offered the trust to the heavens and the earth and the mountains, so they refused to carry it for fear of trust betrayed, the commission thereof by humans. The man is very cruel and stupid ".

In line with the development of waqf institutions, the need for waqf accounting increased. Modern waqf management emphasizes the principle of "ihtisab and
"transparency" in management as part of organizational governance (good governance) to improve performance of nazhir. Many researches found the weaknesses of ihtisab and financial reporting in waqf institutions, presumably because of unavailability of accounting standards in Islamic social sector.

Ihtisab means to take action and refrain from certain actions, taken into account the actions to be taken by the parties in carrying out the sharia obligations, both contractual and social obligations as a self-correction and behaviour that pushed falah into account. Thus, Islamic accounting would turn into a social accountability activities by stakeholders approach. In organizational context, ihtisab interpreted as an institutional accountability to the public for the success or the failure of the task has been assigned.

Transparency is one element of ihtisab, which means open access to community of information related to management activities through public information system in many ways that are considered effective, making it easier for social control of nazhir performance, operations result and income distribution and future planning of nazhir, such as business development plan, new investment and so on.

Accountable waqf management instrument rests on three basic principles of Islamic management which are: the principle of upholding the truth; carry out the mandate (amanah) and uphold justice, it can be added with some booster items, namely: community involvement, transparency of nazhir and control of resources by the community at an early stage in order to avoid misuse. Accountable management will make nazhir more socially acceptable and can work more efficiently and effectively, and more over as a control over possible corruption.

Synthesis of Ihtisab Research Finding

In Islamic perspective, ihtisab is an Islamic basic concept ingrained in the Muslim community and forming one of the core concepts of belief in the afterlife, heaven and hell, the calculation (muhasabah) and penalties. Ihtisab arise from primordial mandate or beliefs (eg, free will, freedom of choice, knowledge and reason) given to humans only (Al-Faruqi, 1992).

Rahim & Rahman (1998) found ihtisab is a combination of tawhid, the caliphate and taqlid besides adequate accounting and adherence (compliance) and control through institutions of hisbah, religious audit and shura. Ihtisab as part of Islamic governance should start from the application of Islamic values instead of a standard or rule made by human, because ihtisab key is akhlak " of human himself.

Lewis (2001) state that accounting is central to Islam in a broad sense, since ihtisab (accountability) to Allah and to community for all activities is paramount to a muslim’s faith. According to Islamic philosophy, Islam is concern of business ethics (akhlak) conducted in each transactions, which required muslim to be fair, honest and equitable towards others.
Expanding the definition of ihtisab as dual accountability as referring to the Qur’an is a must. The management shall be accountable to human (stockholders, creditur, stakeholders, etc.), and should also be accountable to Allah which is the metaphysical dimension of accountability. Thus it can be concluded that ihtisab is the primary objective of Islamic accounting, both to man and to Allah. Ihtisab against Allah (Primary Accountability) arising from the caliphate concept in which human beings bear Allah's mandate of resources (physical and intellectual). Humans are responsible for the environment maintenance (community, employees, nature, animals and the environment). Primary ihtisab is transcendent, because it deals directly to Allah. On the other hand, secondary ihtisab is the responsibility of human arising from contractual relationship and the trust between them, among other waqf funds contracts.

Triyuwono (2004) believes that ihtisab is the responsibility to the owners (shareholders) and also to the stakeholders at large. Besides, managers must also responsible to Allah as the caliphate (vicegerent) of Allah on earth. Ihtisab is done by implementing shariah supervisory board (SSB) along with akhlak of Islam that arise from religious consciousness.

Asri and Fahmi (2004) states that Ihtisab is a concept of trust (Trustworthiness). Humans would be cautious in using his property, for fear of reckoning and ihtisab to Allah one day, so the concept of “honesty” is very important in Islam, as the Hadist: "honest merchant will be with the righteous and martyrs" (HR: Hakim and Tirmizi).

Thus it can be concluded that all employees and managers must implement and uphold Islamic akhlak in the organization as a basis of ihtisab for the amanah fund (waqf).

Accounting concepts derived from al-Qur’an, which requires human record, calculate and accountable for all that is done based on the principle of “trustworthy, honest and fair”. Islamic law derived from al-Qur’an is perfect, comprehensive and thorough (syummul) law, because it is based on Allah’s law. It is wider than conventional accounting standards made by humans. Islamic law is based on akhlak (Islamic values) and morals of Islam. Another issue about Ihtisab is that Islamic dual accountability. Ihtisab is responsibility to human being (horizontal) and is also responsibility to Allah SWT (vertical) in the form of trust and caliphate. Allah commanded human to record all transactions, which shows the importance of the fulfillment of rights and obligations. QS (2): 282:

نيّبها آلذين عانتموا إذا كنتم بذين إلى أجل مسمى فاكتسحو ولبكتكم كابب بالعدل

“O you who believe! When you incur debt among yourselves for a certain period of time, write it down. And have a scribe write in your presence, in all fairness.”

Management is responsible for internal and external of the company’s operation including to shareholders, creditors and stakeholders. Some other verses with respect to ihtisab are: al-Muttaffifin: 1-3, an-Nisa: 86, al-Ahzab: 72 al-An'am: 152; al-Anfaal: 27. Surah al-Baqarah: 284 confirms the importance of ihtisab as mentions in the Qur’an:
“To Allah belongs everything in the heavens and the earth. Whether you reveal what is within your selves, or conceal it, Allah will call you to account for it. He forgives whom He wills, and He punishes whom He wills. God is Able to do all things”. (Al-Baqarah:284)

Lewis (2006) highlighted the ihtisab issue and concluded that ihtisab include vertical ihtisab to Allah, and horizontal ihtisab to others and society, and both are mandatory as part of the faith.

Ihsan & Adnan (2007) incorporated the ihtisab findings of Hisyam (2006) and Ihsan (2007) concerning ihtisab as an individual responsibility of each party (nazhir, waqf board and regulators) to Allah as the primary ihtisab (hablun min Allah) and to humans (hablun min an-naas), because each individual is responsible for all his own actions. (Q.S: 2:284). Ihtisab against Allah relates to human ihtisab as a fiduciary to the waqf. About information content, Ihsan (2007) agreed that disclosure to stakeholders must contain information as discussed above, while Cordery & Morley (2005) argued that information should include quantitative information (financial statements) as nazhir performance and qualitative information which contains information on management policies, performance objectives specific waqf and development of new waqf.

Ihtisab implementation should start by creating “culture and environment” of transparency, accountability and integrity as the culture of the institution as a whole. Waqf accounting is needed as part of best practice to encourage waqf revitalization process by optimizing nazhir’s performance (Cajee 2007; Pirasteh, 2007; Rashid & Khalid, 2011).

Hasan & Zulkifli (2009) states that ihtisab is implement in line with sharia based on ownership and contractual rights which monitored by Shariah Supervisory Board (SSB), in addition to monitoring by share holders (SH) and the board of directors (BOD), while managers and stakeholders run the Islamic management in line with sharia as part of ihtisab for waqf institutions.

Hasan & Sahid (2010) found that Ihtisab to stakeholders morally bound based on the concept of trust, equity, balance and fairness (‘adl and qist), benevolence and excellence (Ihsaan). On the other hand, Osman & Zamri (2010) formed ihtisab theory as foundation of his empirical research, and found that it is holistic ihtisab (holistic accountability) that is balancing up-wards ihtisab and down-wards ihtisab towards all stakeholders. Improvement of waqf management can be done using beneficiary approach due to ihtisab to beneficiary is an important requirement for the fulfillment of
ihtisab to Allah. Ihtisab can be seen as institution's ability to learn beneficiaries through relationships and participation in order to serve them better.

Basri & Nabiha (2010) found that the majority of Islamic institutions use the principles of fairness, honest, and sincere faith in their management without doing ihtisab correctly for mandate they received so that it is difficult to measure their performance, and it can reduce public confidence due to lack of information and transparency to the public and other related parties.

Al-Faruqi (1992) argued that in ihtisab, internal control is the concept of "trustful and caliphate" (amanah and khilafah). Amanah is a trait that must exist in a Muslim either supervised or not by others, because of the belief that everyone must be in seen by Allah (vertical ihtisab), and on the other hand, human beings should also responsible for others in his position as caliph (vicegerency), which is often called agency relationship (horizontal ihtisab).

Islam requires every person to be honest, but still he or she has to do the reporting duties to the parties who gave the mandate to create transparency to prevent slander, cruelty and discord among humans before he or she is accountable to Allah. Al-Qur'an has provided a warning about it, and also the relevant hadiths.

Daud et al, 2011 discussed tawhidic approach in ihtisab argued that it is the most important concepts in Islam. In conjunction with the institution of waqf endowments they conclude that the ideal ihtisab is based on the 3rd-based models, that are ihtisab to Allah, waqf and also towards extensive stakeholders as stated in the Quran Surah al-Fathir 35-39; surah al-Isra’a: 34; al-Maidah: 23. At the theory level, ihtisab is integration of accountability theory and stakeholders theory (An-Nuur: 38).

Siraj (2012), in an empirical investigation of accounting, ihtisab and management effectiveness of waqf institutions in Malaysia, found several weaknesses in waqf institutions. Firstly, budget is just as the variances between budget and actual budget, not as a control of budget effectiveness and efficiency. Secondly, financial statements do not contain specific chart of accounts for recording assets and fund of Islamic institutions. Finally, strategic planning, human resources, financial position (financial adequacy) and management on SIRC's very limited and weak, especially in ihtisab and management effectiveness of waqf fund, because nazhir responsible for waqf assets as an amanah (trust) and managed that trust fund in line with shari'ah.

Basri & Nabiha (2012) investigating accounting and ihtisab in non-profit organizations, found that ihtisab is based on concept of tawhidd and ownership (Napier, 2007). The concept of tawhid is broader than the concept of ihtisab (accountability) (An-Nisa: 86). Basri & Nabiha (2012) concluded that there is no standard definition of religion based institution, as it depends on the unique characteristics, and they are different among Non-Profit Organizations. These organizations mostly are supported by other parties (founders), so it must be managed professionally. Islamic organizations such as waqf institutions are very phyllantrophy in nature as the oldest phyllantrophy institution in Islamic history, requires renewal and adjustment to the
latest development and social condition (Ijtihaad) to get the optimal maslahah for the ummah. Thus, Islamic organization has dual ihtisab that are vertical ihtisab and horizontal ihtisab. They must comply with shariah in addition to ethical standards, concern to organization's mission, being ethical and protect the rights of stakeholders.

**Discussion**

Many research findings show the differences of accounting practice and the lack of ihtisab on waqf institution. This findings encourage more research on it to follow-up and address the drawback. In relation with that case, it is necessary to optimize waqf maslahah and to define waqf ihtisab for waqf institutions. This article attempts to synthesize research findings in accounting and ihtisab to formulate ihtisab standard by using an interactive integrative evolutionary process of shuratic method. This basic formulation of ihtisab standard will be gained to encourage nazhir performance to improve waqf maslahah as well as encourage Islamic researchers to concern to waqf revitalization.

**Ihtisab Definition**

Based on the problems that have been revealed, there are several important factors to be formulated, that are ihtisab definition, which is very important and must be clear as the basis of performance measurement, evaluation and reporting (Cordery & Morely, 2005; Cutt & Murray, 2000) to prevent occurrence of ihtisab practice variation.

Ihtisab is refrain from certain actions and actions to be taken into account in implementing shari'a obligations, either as contractual obligations or as caliph for self-correction and behaviour that pushed him to think about falah. Thus, ihtisab is part of social accountability with stakeholders approach (Rahim & Rahman, 1998). On the other hand, Sheikh al-Shafi argues that man-made definition is just simply set material status. By law, ihtisab is taqlif, that is obedience which must be done by every person to be responsible for any actions in the hereafter. So ihtisab should be fused and ingrained in Muslim’s mind as Islamic values (akhlaq). Ihtisab is a combination of Tawhid, khilafah and taqlid, beside accounting information, compliance and control through hisbah institutions, shura and religious audit.

Ihtisab as part of Islamic corporate governance should start from application of Islamic values, not just a standard which is man-made. The key of Ihtisab is good akhlaq and moral that forms the basis of faith and belief of the afterlife, heaven and hell with calculations of amal (good deed). Faith will encourage good akhlaq, such as honest, fair, trustworthy, transparent (does not hide a lie), that everything will be accounted for at the end of the day. This will form the core concept of faith, calculation (muhasabah) and retaliation for all actions in the world. Ihtisab arise from amanah or primordial mandate, for example free will, freedom of choice and knowledge given to man alone (Rahim & Rahman, 1998; Al-Faruqi, 1992).
Holistic Dual Accountability

*Ihtisab* is holistic dual accountability, which is *ihtisab* to Allah as *caliph* and balanced with *ihtisab* between human as a trust and a contract, that are to *waqif*, community and government. *Nazhir* must prepare financial report as a transparent information to interested parties to prevent slander, cruelty and cleavage among human (Triyuwono, 2004; Hisyam, 2006; Lewis, 2006; Ihsan & Adnan, 2009; Osman & Zamri, 2010). Daud *et al.* (2011) name it with 3rd based *ihtisab* models and refer it to al-Quran Surah: al-Fatir 35-39; 17:34; al-Maidah: 23; at-Tawbah; Hud: 3; at-Tahrim: 8.

At the theory level, *ihtisab* is an integration of *ihtisab* theory and stakeholders theory (An-Nuur: 38). *Ihtisab* requires control through *sharia* supervisory board (SSB), share holders and board of directors (BOD) along with *akhlaq*, morals and religious awareness too. Islamic morality including attitudes: fair, trustworthy and honest to all organization members, especially a leader as a figure (Qur'an: 2: 282) (Triyuwono, 2004; Asri & Fahmi, 2004; Hasan & Zulkifli, 2009; Lewis, 2006).

Ihtisab Informations Content

Information content in *ihtisab* should be appropriate to the information needed by users (Hisyam, 2006). Useful information should cover quantitative information (financial statements) as *nazhir* performance and also qualitative information (management policy, performance of *Nazhir*’s plan, the development of new *waqf* and others) as planning and growth information (Cordery & Morley, 2005).

Ihtisab Implementation in Waqf Institutions

*Ihtisab* implementation in *waqf* institutions must begin by creating Islamic values as an institution’s culture of *akhlaq* and moral over all members. Islamic culture includes honesty (Trustworthiness), balanced, fairness, *adala*, *qist* and *ihsan* (benevolence and excellence) (Hasan & Sahid, 2010).

Conclusion

This study presents the results of analysis and synthesis of *ihtisab* research findings. Review of 20 research findings try to overcome *ihtisab* problem in *waqf* institutions. Problems identified by the previous researches are the lack of *ihtisab* definition and implementation on Islamic social institutions they lead to differences of *ihtisab* understanding and differences on *ihtisab* practice. Another factor is unavailability of accounting standards for the *waqf* institution in preparing financial statements along with honest and fair, transparence and disclosure.

*ihtisab* is refrain from certain actions and actions to be taken into account in implementing *shari‘a* obligations, either as contractual obligations or as caliph for self -correction and behaviour that pushed him to think about *falah*. Thus, *ihtisab* is part of social accountability with stakeholders approach.
Ihtisab is dual holistic accountability, which are ihtisab to humans, including financial reporting with transparency and adequate disclosure, that covered quantitative and qualitative information. The other one is ihtisab to Allah as transcendent relationship between Nazhir and Allah for responsibility of trust fund under his management. Both must be done in the balance as they are interrelated.

Islamic accounting is social ihtisab with stakeholders and faith approach. The essence of Ihtisab is taqlif, that each person is responsible for any act he made in the world, so ihtisab is already fused and ingrained in Muslim’s mind. However, ihtisab implementation requires adequate accounting, supervision and adherence (compliance and control) through hisbah institutions, shura practice in decision making and religious audit as a means for nazhir ihtisab.

Implementation of Islamic values is the most important factor in every function in Islamic management. Nazhir will be more responsible for managing waqf institution and present financial reports in the honest, fair and equitable way as application of ihsan attitude that arise from akhlaq which is combination of Tawhid, Caliphate and Taqlid. Akhlaq form the basis of faith, that is belief in the afterlife, heaven and hell with computation of amal (everything people did). Faith will encourage morality of Islam honesty, fairness, trustworthiness, transparency (openness), which does not hide any information that is harmful to others. Thus, ihtisab implementation on Islamic institutions will only succeed through akhlaq cultivation and transparent environment, accountable and high integrity in waqf institution that should start from the leader as a figure. Waqf accounting is needed as best practice to encourage revitalization process of waqf fund by optimizing nazhir performance on waqf institution.

It can be concluded that ihtisab is an Islamic accountability that is wider than conventional accountability, because it covers all aspects of cause and effect with the level of the world and the hereafter. Waqf institutions required Nazhir who is professional, capable and expert or high knowledge to perform his duties to optimize waqf maslahah. Nazhir must also provide professional financial statements as transparency and disclosure means that are informative to all related parties to prevent slander, cruelty and discord among human. Waqf accounting as best practice for revitalizing the waqf funds along with supervision and control through institution of hisbah, shura in decision-making and religious audits.

References
Abbasi. A. S., K. Rehman & H. S. Abbasi. "Welfare and protection models for organizational management: The Islamic Perspective". African Journal of Business Management, Vol. 4, No. 5, pp. 739-747.

Abbasi, A. S. & K. Rehman. 2010, "An Islamic Leadership Model accountability Perspective". World Applied Science Journal, Vol 9, No. 3. pp. 230-238.

Al-Faruqi, I. R. 1992. Al-Tawhid: It’s Implications for Thought and Life, vol. 4. Hemdon, Virginia, United State, International Institute of Islamic Thought.
Asri, M. & M. Fahmi. 2004. Contribution of the Islamic Worldview Towards Corporate Governance. http://www.iium.edu.my/iaw/Students%20Term%20Papers_files/Asri%20and%20Fahmi%20IslWWandCG.htm

Beekun, R. & J. Badawi. 2005. “Balancing Ethical Responsibility among Multiple Organizational Stakeholders: The Islamic Perspective”. Journal of Business Ethics.

Baldesari, C. F. 2006. Systematic Review of Qualitative Literature .UK Cochrane Centre Oxford.

Basri, H. A & S. Nabiha. 2010. “Towards Good Accountability: The Role of Accounting in Islamic Religious Organisations”. World Academy of Science, Engineering and Technology

Basri, H. A. & S. Nabiha. 2012. “Governance In Religious Context: Analysing Accountability Issues”. Aceh International Journal of Social Sciences, Vol 1, No. 1, pp. 24-30

Cajee, A. Z. 2007. "Revitalising the Institution of Awqaf in Developing Community." Singapore International Waqf Conference

Charities Statement of Recommended Practice: Small Charities and SORP (revised 2005). Statement by the Charity Commission for England and Wales.

Chowdhury & M. Alam, 1973, “Theory and Practice of Islamic Development Cooperation”. Statistical, Economic and Social Research and Training Centre for Islamic Countries, Ankara, 1973. _______________________, 2004. “The Islamic World System, A Study in Polity-Market Interaction”. Routledge Curzon. Taylor and Francis Group, London and New York. _______________________, 2007. “The Universal Paradigm and The Islamic World System. Economics, Sociatic, Ethics and Science”. World Scientific Publishing Co. London.

Chowduury, M. Alam & M. Z. Haque. 2006. “Corporate Governance in Islamic Perspectives”. Vol. 6 No. 2 2006, pp. 116-128, Emerald Group Publishing Limited

Cordery, C. J & R. B. Morley. 2005. “Charity Financial Reporting regulation: a comparison of the United Kingdom and her former colony”, New Zealand Working Paper Series no. 20

Cordery & Baskerville. 2005. “Hegemony, Stakeholder Salience and the Construction of Accountability in the Charity Sector” Working Paper no. 25. School of Accounting and Commercial Law, Victoria University of Wellington.

Cutt, J. & V. Murray. 2000. Accountability and effectiveness evaluation in non-profit organizations. Routledge. London.
Daud, Rahman & Sulaiman. 2011. “Waqf Reporting to Fulfil Stakeholder Attribution in Waqf Islamic Councils”. BMQR Vol.2, No.1. University Publication Centre (UPENA) and Institute of Business Excellence 2180-2777 School of Accounting and Commercial Law, Victoria University of Wellington.

Farid A. S., Z. Yuserrie & A. Azlan. 2011. “Religion as an Emerging Institutional Factor behind Sustainability Disclosure Practices in Bangladesh: The Case of an Islamic Bank”. World Journal of Social Sciences Vol. 1, No. 1.

Garas, S. N. & C. Pierce. 2010. Shari’a Supervision of Islamic Financial Institutions. Journal of Financial Regulation and Compliance Vol. 18, No. 4.

Ghozali, I. In Nabil, N. 2000, “The Phylosophy of Ghazali. A Prospects: the quarterly review of comparative education” (Paris, UNESCO: International Bureau of Education), vol. XXIII, no. 3/4, 1993, p. 519-542.

Hadist Web 0,5, 2011: Al-Qurán and translation; Hadist Buchori; Hadist Muslim

Hasan & Zulkifli. 2008. Corporate Governance from Western and Islamic Perspectives.

Hasan & Zulkifli. 2009. “Corporate Governance from Western and Islamic Perspectives” The Annual London Conference on Money, Economy and Management in 3rd-4th July 2008, Imperial College, South Kensington, UK.

Hasan & Sahid. 2010. “Management and Development of the Awqaf Assets” The Seventh International Conference, The Tawhidi Epistemology: Zakat and Waqf Economy, Bangi.

Hisyam, Y. 2006. “Waqf Accounting in Malaysian State Islamic Religious Institutions: The Case of Federal Territory SIRC” A Dissertation of Kulliyyah of Economics and Management Sciences International Islamic University Malaysia

Ibrahim, S.H. & R. Yahya. 2005. “The Emerging Issues on the Objectives and Characteristics of Islam Accounting for Islamic Business Organizations”. Malaysian Accounting Review, Vol. 1.

Ibrahim, S.H., Yacob, H, 2005: “Wakaf Accounting in Malaysian State Islamic Religious Institutions”; The Case of Federal territory SIRC. International Islamic University Malaysia.

Ibrahim, S.H., H. Ihsan and A.M. Ayedh, 2009. “Towards the betterment management and transparency of waqf institutions”. Available from http://www.scribd.com/mishahul/documents

Ihsan, H. 2007. “An Exploratory Study of Waqf Accounting and Management in Indonesian Waqf Institutions: The Cases of Dompet Dhuafa and UII Waqf Foundations” A Dissertation in Accounting. Kulliyyah of Economics and Management Sciences International Islamic University Malaysia.

Ihsan & Adnan. 2009. “Waqf Accounting and The Construction of Accountability. Waqf-Accounting-The-Construction-of-Accountability.-Place.-Pub.pdf”
Kahf, M. 1998, “Fiqhi Issues on the Revival of Awqaf”. Paper presented at Harvard Forum on Islamic Finance and Economic, Harvard University.

Kuran. 2001. The Provision of Public Goods under Islamic Law: Origins, Contributions, and Limitations of the Waqf System.

Lewis, M. K. 2001. Islam and Accounting. Feature Article, Blackwell Publisher Ltd. UK and USA.

Lewis, M. 2006. “Accountability and Islam” The Fourth International Conference on Accounting and Finance in Transition, Adelaide, April 10-12.

Mannan, M.A, 2005. “The Role of Waqf in Improving the Ummah Welfare” International Seminar on Islamic Economics as Solution organized by Indonesian Association of Islamic Economists and Muamalat Institute, Jakarta Medan, Indonesia

Masyita, Tasrif & Telaga. 2005. “A Dynamic Model for Cash Waqf Management as One of The Alternative Instruments for The Poverty Alleviation in Indonesia” The 23rd International Conference of The System Dynamics Society. Massachussets Institute of Technology (MIT), Boston, July 17-21, 2005.

Muzafar & A. Syech. 1988. “Ethics in Decision Making- In Islamic and Western Environment”. The American Journal of Islamic Social Science, Vol. 5

Napier, 2007. “Other Cultures Other Accounting?: Islamic Accounting From Past to Present” The 5th Accounting History International Conference, Banff, Canada, 9-11August 2007.

Noraini, Othman, Said & Ghani. 2009. “Financial Reporting Practices of Charity Organisations: A Malaysian Evidence”. International Bulletin of Business Administration, Vol 6.

Organization of Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD). 2004. OECD Principles of Corporate Governance. Head of Publications Service, OECD Publications Service. France.

Oliver S. D. 2009, The Caliphate Questions, The British Government and Islamic Governance. Littlefield Publisher Inc., UK.

Osman, A. & Zamri. 2010. “Accountability of Waqf Management: Insight from Praxis of Non Govermental Organization (NGO)” The Seventh International Conference – The Tawhidi Epistemology: Zakat and Waqf Economy, Bangi.

Pirasteh, H. & H. Abdolmaleki, H. 2007. “Developing awqaf properties and Islamic financial engineering: a conceptual and empirical analysis”. The Singapore International Waqf Conference. The Fullerton Hotel, Singapore.

Popay & Robert. 2006. “Moving beyond effectiveness in evidence synthesis Methodological issues in the synthesis of diverse sources of evidence” Discussion Paper, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE).
Rahim & Rahman. 1998. The American Journal of Islamic Social Sciences, Vol 15, No.1.

Rasyid & S. Khalid. 2011. Certain Legal and Administrative Measure for Better Management of Awqaf. Working Paper Series, WP . 1432-02 Islamic Economic Studies, Volume 19 No. 1. IRTI & IDB.

Rice, G. 1999. “Islamic Ethics and the Implications for Business”. Journal of Business Ethics, Vol 18, pp. 345–358.

Rosnia, Masruki & S. Zurina. 2013. “The Development of Waqf Accounting in Enhancing Accountability” Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research, Vol 13.

Ruhanen, L., N. Scott, B. R. & A. Tkaczynski. 2010. “Governance: a review and synthesis of the literature”, Tourism Review Journal, Vol. 65, No. 4, pp. 4-16.

Sandelowski, Margareth, S. Docherty & C. Emden. 1996. “Focus on Qualitative Methods, Qualitative Metasynthesis: Issues and Techniques” Research in Nursing and Health, No 20, p. 365-370.

Sandelowski & Barosso. 2007. Handbook for Synthesizing Qualitative Research. Springer Publishing Company. New York

Sirageldin, I. 1995. “Islam, Society and Economic Policy”. Working Paper 9529. Economic Research Forum.

Siraj, S. A. 2012. “An Empirical Investigation into the Accounting, Accountability and Effectiveness of Waqf Management in the State Islamic Religious Councils (SIRCs) in Malaysia” A Dissertation on Accounting and Finance Section of Cardiff Business School, Cardiff University

Syamsiyah. 2010. “Contemporary Shari’a Compliance Structuring for the Development and Management of Waqf Assets in Singapore”, Kyoto Bulletin of Islamic Area Studies, pp. 143–164

Tanim, Laila, Maqsood & A. Shafi. 2009 “Waqf-Based Islamic Philanthropic Instruments for Micro-Funding of Micro-Finance”. SSRN: http://ssrn.com/abstract=1331278 or http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.1331278

Siswanto. 2010. “Systematic Review Sebagai Metode Penelitian untuk Mensintesis Hasil Penelitian: Sebuah Pengantar”. Buletin Penelitian Sistem Kesehatan, Vol. 13, No. 4, Pp. 326–333.

Swasono & S. Edi. 2005. “Kebersamaan dan Azaz Kekeluargaan: Mutualism and Brother hood”. UNJ Press.

Undang-undang Waqaf No, 41 tahun 2004. http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&ved=0CD

Triyuwono, I. 2004. “Trust (Amanah), The Divine Symbol: Interpretations in the Context of Islamic Banking and Accounting Practices” Fourth Asia Pacific Interdisciplinary Research in Accounting Conference 4 to 6 July 2004, Singapore.
Zaki, A., N. Daud & Zuina. 2006. “Waqf Property Management and Potential of Educational Progress towards Muslims in Malaysia”. The Conference of Wakaf Endowments. The Legend Hotel, Kuala Lumpur, 12-14 September