Strategy to Internalizing Religious Moral Values in the Learning Process in Higher Education

Samsul Susilawati¹, A. Fatah Yasin², Aniek Rahmaniah³, Abdulloh Chakim⁴, Triyo Supriyatno⁵

¹ Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia; e-mail: susilawati@pips.uin-malang.ac.id
² Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia; e-mail: yasin.a.fattah@pai.uin-malang.ac.id
³ Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia; e-mail: arahmaniah@pips.uin-malang.ac.id
⁴ Universitas Islam Negeri Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Indonesia; e-mail: chakim73@iain-tulungagung.ac.id
⁵ Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia; e-mail: triyo@pai.uin-malang.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:
Higher Education; learning processes; Moral and religious values.

Article history:
Received 2021-07-25
Revised 2021-10-07
Accepted 2022-03-21

ABSTRACT

This study aims to describe strategies for internalizing moral and religious values in the learning process in universities. This research is descriptive research with a qualitative approach. The research subjects were lecturers at the Islamic Education Department at the State Islamic University of Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, the University of Muhammadiyah Malang, and the Islamic University of Malang. Data were collected through interviews, observations, and documents. The triangulation technique assessed confidence data. The results showed that the strategies for internalizing moral and religious values in the learning process include: modelling, analyzing actual problems in society, developing contextual educational values, and strengthening the moral values that students have. The Internalization Strategy of Religious Moral Values in the Learning process carried out in the three PTKIS shows that moral education is conveyed in the form of cognitive moral values and is already at the stage of internalizing values by carrying out the direct practice of moral values in education. Student life and activities every day. It is hoped that from the internalization of moral education, the character of moderate Muslims who are friendly and tolerant will be built.

This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-SA license.

Corresponding Author:
Samsul Susilawati
Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia; e-mail: susilawati@pips.uin-malang.ac.id

1. INTRODUCTION

Education is a strategic choice for a nation to rise from adversity (Bin, Abidin, Esa, Rashid, & Ahmad, 2010). Likewise, it has become imperative for Indonesia to place education as a top priority in
Values and morals are two different concepts that are often juxtaposed in their use. (Harto & Tastin, 2019) explain the meaning of value by comparing it with facts. Fact, according to him, is something that exists or just happens. While value applies, something that attracts or appeals to us. Facts can be found in the context of a description of all the elements can be described one by one, and the description is, in principle, acceptable to everyone. Values play a role in an atmosphere of appreciation or judgment and will often be judged differently by many people. Values are always related to a person's judgment, while facts concern only objective characteristics. Another definition of value was put forward by (Sukardi, 2016)(Coates, 2005). According to him, value is a benchmark or standard of choice patterns that can guide a person or group towards satisfaction, fulfillment, and meaning. These standards or criteria provide the basis for critical considerations about religious, aesthetic, and moral obligations. While the term moral, according to (Carlos, Implicaciones, & Zerpa, 2007) (Ramdani, Hidayat, Sumarna, & Santika, 2020) (Muslih, 2010), comes from the Latin mores from the syllable mos, which means customs, behaviour, character, character, morals. The moral is the principle of good and bad that exists and is inherent in a person. However, even though morals are in the individual, they are in a system in the form of rules. Moral and morality are two different concepts.

Moral is the principle of good and bad, while morality is the quality of good-bad judgment. Thus, the nature and meaning of morality can be seen from the way individuals have morals in obeying and carrying out the rules. In internalizing moral values, (n.d.) describes four approaches that can be used: the moral cultivation approach, the free value transmission approach, the exemplary approach, and the value clarification approach. Value education needs to be carried out using a comprehensive approach. A comprehensive approach to valuing education means a comprehensive or comprehensive value education that can be viewed in terms of the methods used, the participating educators (teachers, parents), and the context in which values education occurs (schools, families). (Istiqomah, Rivadah, Potabuga, & Rahman, 2020), (Ramdani et al., 2020) In applying the exemplary method, teachers and parents need to have assertive and listening skills. Both of these skills are indispensable for establishing interpersonal and intergroup relationships. Therefore, teachers and parents must be able to be an example for children. Assertive skills are the skills to express opinions openly in ways that do not hurt the feelings of others. Listening skills are listening skills with understanding and critically. These two skills must be developed in a balanced way because they are vital components of communication. Children who have these two skills will be children who can respect the opinions of others and can assertively convey their ideas to others. In addition to being comprehensive in terms of methods, value education must also be comprehensive in terms of content, time, actors, and assessment.

In terms of content, value education should cover all issues related to the choice of personal values to ethical questions in general. Comprehensive in terms of time, value education takes place throughout a child’s life (Milevsky, Schlechter, Netter, & Keehn, 2007). Comprehensive in terms of actors, that value education can be carried out by all adults, whether planned or unplanned. Then it is comprehensive in
the assessment, which means measuring the effectiveness and progress of value education using formative and summative evaluations that measure knowledge, attitudes, and value skills. The description above shows that there are many methods that can be used to internalize the value (Domenech Rodríguez, Donovick, & Crowley, 2009).

Table 1 Kohlberg Moral Development Model

| Kohlberg's Model of Moral Development |
|--------------------------------------|
| Preconventional Level | Level 1 (age 6-8) | Punishment and obedience orientation (will I be caught? will I be punished?) |
| | Level 2 (age 8-10) | Instrumental relativist orientation (what do I get from this?) |
| Conventional level | Level 3 (age 10-12) | Concordance interpersonal orientation (what do other people expect from me? How can I please adults so I can be called a good child?) |
| | Level 4 (age 12-15) | Law and order orientation (what does the law say? what are my obligations?) |
| Post-conventional stage | Level 5 (age 15+) | Social contract and consensus orientation (what has the group agreed on? and what are my personal responsibilities in this regard?) |
| | Level 6 | The orientation of universal ethical principles (what are my principles, and do they have universal meaning?) |

Value education can be done at every level of education (Bhardwaj, 2016), including in college. Creating a campus atmosphere that is comfortable, peaceful, and full of religiosity is the responsibility of every civitas in a university. Starting all that, of course, requires an in-depth study of where and how the right method is to be used in implementing religious, moral values in campus life. Given that so many religious moral values exist, this research study is limited to religious, moral values in the form of the values piety, sincerity, and responsibility. An in-depth study through research in the internalization of religious, moral values in campus life is a strategic step that must be taken immediately. Through research, it is hoped that an appropriate model or strategy will be found in internalizing religious and moral values in the learning process in higher education.

2. METHODS

This research is a descriptive study using a qualitative approach (Sugiyono, 2012) (Rachmawati, 2007). It is descriptive research because this research intends to create a picture of a situation or event, namely a strategy for internalizing religious, moral values in the learning process in higher education. This is in line with the opinion (H. Mudjia Rahardjo, 2010) that descriptive research aims to create a picture of a situation or event so that it intends to carry out a mere accumulation of basic data. This research was conducted at the Department of Islamic Studies at the State Islamic University of Maulana
Malik Ibrahim Malang (UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang), the University of Muhammadiyah Malang (UMM), and the Islamic University of Malang (Unisma). The subjects of this study were four lecturers who teach at the Department of Islamic Religious Education. The subject was chosen based on the consideration of the scientific family in the Department of Islamic Education. This study’s data collection techniques are interviews, observation, and documentation (Hammarberg, Kirkman, & Lacey, 2016). Interviews were used to collect data or information related to the strategies used in internalizing religious moral values. Observations are used to obtain data regarding the implementation of the methods used in internalizing religious moral values in the learning process. Documentation is used to obtain data regarding the description of the existence of the object under study. In addition, to complete the data from interviews and observations. To obtain data that can be scientifically justified, the validity of the data that has been collected is checked first. In this study, the technique of checking the validity of the data used is the triangulation technique, which is a technique of crossing information obtained from sources so that in the end only valid data is used to achieve research results (Sofaer, 2002). The triangulation technique used in this research is method and source triangulation, namely by reconfirming the information from interviews with documentation and observation. Research data obtained from different sources through interviews were reconfirmed with data obtained through observation and documentation. The data used in this study is valid data after going through the process of crossing information. The data analysis technique used in this study is an inductive analysis technique, which is an analysis that starts from the data and leads to general conclusions.

3. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Each lecturer has a different method or strategy for internalising religious moral values. This difference is due to the unclear religious and moral values that will be instilled in the learning process. This means that there are no common values (generally agreed values) to be implemented in the learning process in the classroom. Religious, moral values that are still too general need to be described in more detail as indicators to clarify what values are to be instilled in the learning process. Religious moral values to be implemented are still too general, causing there to be different interpretations from each lecturer on the moral values to be implemented in the learning process. Different points of view on religious moral values have implications for the various strategies applied by lecturers in implementing these moral values in the learning process. In general, lecturers apply several strategies in the Department of Islamic Religious Education to implement religious moral values in the learning process. Each of these strategies has its own characteristics and advantages. A complete description of each strategy implemented is as follows:

**EXAMPLE STRATEGY**

Based on the results of interviews conducted by researchers, several lecturers apply the strategy of implementing religious, moral values through the exemplary method. This exemplary strategy can be divided into internal modelling and external modelling. Internal exemplary can be done by giving examples by the lecturers themselves in the learning process. Meanwhile, an external example is carried out by providing good examples from figures who can be imitated, both local and international figures. Religious moral values in the form of piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility can be instilled in students through exemplary, both internal and external examples. The internal example carried out by lecturers, for example, is done by starting and ending each lecture by praying. Lecturers always set an example for discipline in several matters, such as the cleanliness of the classroom, arriving on time, and having a commitment to a mutually agreed learning contract. To be a good role model requires a long process. Students can imitate a lecturer through good habits that he always does in class. Another thing that lecturers can do related to internal examples is giving or telling stories about “religious experiences” experienced by lecturers. Sometimes, a lecturer has an interesting religious experience in his life, and it becomes something interesting that students can emulate. An example of the power of a prayer that overcomes all. Closeness to Allah as a Most Gracious and Merciful God has led to a success
that may not have been expected before. This kind of experience shows the importance of understanding the existence of something Almighty above all else. An understanding of religious values, especially related to the value of piety in the life of a human being, becomes an important thing. The second example is an external example, which is an example that comes from outside the lecturer. This kind of example can be done by presenting stories about religious figures that can be used as role models in living life. For example, the figures of the Prophet Muhammad, the companions of the prophet, the Great General Sudirman, and other important figures both in Indonesia and outside Indonesia are worthy of imitation. The presentation of interesting stories about the stories of these figures is expected to make students idolize and imitate the positive actions they take. These figures have an attitude of piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility that students can imitate. Prophet Muhammad is an example or example of a human figure with extraordinary piety that deserves to be imitated. In addition to the stories of exemplary figures, exemplary external strategies can be carried out by showing character films. For example, a writer’s persistence through the film Freedom Writers or the latest stories like the film “Laskar Pelangi”. From the stories presented in the film, students can learn a useful lesson themselves. Honesty, sincerity, responsibility, innocence, persistence, hard work, and many more moral values can be imitated through film stories that are shown in the classroom. Students can analyze and discuss film stories shown in class so that the learning atmosphere will be more interesting. Through this exemplary strategy, the lecturer does not directly include things related to the example in the lesson plan. That is, religious, moral values such as piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility that are instilled in students are hidden in the curriculum. Through stories of important figures and film screenings, a lecturer hopes that the values contained in them can be something interesting and can be imitated or imitated by students.

**CASE ANALYSIS:**

Lecturers in the Department of Islamic Religious Education apply this strategy in implementing religious moral values in the learning process. Students are given the task of analyzing cases that contain religious moral values. They get these cases through searching articles in various media. Religious moral values to be instilled through this strategy are the moral values of piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility. After they found several cases that contained religious moral values, the next step was to conduct case analysis. This strategy can actually be said as a form of value clarification. Because in practice, students are asked to clarify the values contained in a problem they find. Students will get positive and negative values from a case from the case analysis. In other words, this strategy is almost the same as problem-based learning. Students are asked to analyze the problem. Then they provide the best solution to the problem they are discussing. After the problem is completed, the student can take lessons or learn from the problem he solved. This problem or case analysis strategy is actually something interesting and important to do. Problems regarding the implementation of religious values such as piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility in daily life are often found in writings or articles in the mass media. Moreover, the articles published in the mass media are usually articles that are currently being discussed. For example, related to the moral values of honesty and responsibility. Often the mass media contain articles about cases of corruption and abuse of power by government officials. The articles that contain these cases can be used as a means for students to analyze the content of moral values contained in them. Students will usually feel happy and serious in attending lectures through interesting discussions in class. Another important thing that needs to be considered in applying this case analysis strategy is how students can apply these religious moral values in real life. Students are not only able to analyze cases and solve them but can actually internalize these religious moral values in their lives. So, after discussing or analyzing the cases in the article, students can find religious values such as piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility. It is hoped that these values can be implemented in everyday life. So that slowly but surely, the personality or morals of students will be formed into a good personality.
CONTEXTUAL EDUCATIONAL VALUES

This strategy can be done by directly or indirectly incorporating religious moral values into learning materials. The concepts developed in a course must contain educational values. This means that the concepts developed in a course should not only prioritize theoretical studies on the development of the science. However, how the concepts are developed also contains important educational elements that deserve to be studied. In providing educational value concepts, it is better to start from contextual and actual things. For example, related to the bill’s ratification on anti-pornography and pornography. The pros and cons of this bill become something interesting to give in class. Lecturers providing contextual and actual examples can be done when doing apperception or pre-learning activities. To be able to clearly instill contextual educational values, it is necessary to include them in the process of making learning designs in the classroom. Lecturers can create and write educational values that contain religious elements which include the values of piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility in the learning implementation plan. The religious moral values are written clearly when they will be delivered and how long it will take to convey them in class. The problem lies in the absence of permanent contextual religious moral values that have been mutually agreed upon. Actual and contextual religious moral values often go hand in hand with problems emerging in society. For example, when discussing corruption cases, it will become an actual and contextual theme to instill moral values in the form of honesty and responsibility. However, contextual religious moral values will change. Therefore, it is necessary to conduct a workshop to determine contextual religious moral values. Through activities such as workshops, it is hoped that it will be agreed what values are contextual and can be applied in the learning process in the classroom.

STRENGTHENING VALUES

This strategy is carried out with the assumption that students have religious moral values such as piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility. But how they believe and practice these values needs to be strengthened. Beliefs in religious moral values that students have owned sometimes experience ups and downs. Students sometimes, because of the influence of the environment or peers, forget the importance of these religious moral values in everyday life. Every lecturer actually has the same opportunity to be able to do that. Lecturers can insert the spirit of religious moral values in every lecture. Reinforcement can be done by the lecturer at any time giving a lecture. There is no need to directly write it down in a lesson plan in class. The insertion of religious moral values can also be done for each course. Every lecturer who teaches courses can strengthen religious moral values. It’s just how the form of strengthening moral values carried out by each lecturer has its own characteristics. Strengthening religious moral values such as piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility is not solely the responsibility of lecturers who teach Religious Education courses. The courage to always insert the spirit of religious moral values in lectures is a big challenge for lecturers. All of this is done through a long process. These religious moral values will not necessarily become values that are directly internalized in students. The long process must still be carried out so that students understand religious moral values that they must implement in their daily lives. In addition, there needs to be commitment and collaboration between lecturers who support courses to create a learning system or atmosphere that allows these religious moral values to be instilled properly.

The strategy of internalizing religious moral values in the learning process applied by each lecturer has diversity. The strategy is chosen based on what religious moral values will be instilled in students. Each moral value has its own characteristics, so it cannot use the same method for all religious moral values that will be instilled in students. The success of the method of internalizing religious moral values used is also very dependent on the ability and experience of a lecturer in choosing and applying the right method to internalize the moral values to be instilled. Before applying the method of internalizing religious moral values in the learning process, there should be a mutual agreement on what religious moral values will be internalized in the learning process. Then once agreed, these values need to be translated into more detailed indicators. The existence of a common understanding of religious moral values that will be instilled in students can actually make it easier for lecturers when
choosing the right strategy to internalize religious moral values in the learning process. Differences in understanding or perception of religious moral values will be instilled cause various methods chosen by lecturers. Lecturers can apply the strategy of internalizing religious moral values in the learning process planned or unplanned. In a planned manner, this is done by incorporating indicators of religious moral values embedded in the learning implementation plan.

Lecturers create learning scenarios that are intentionally designed to instill certain moral values in learning. Lecturers can also insert religious moral values when delivering lecture material. Unplanned, lecturers can insert moral values at certain times which allows a lecturer to insert religious moral values. The insertion of religious moral values can be done in the introduction, core, or closing of the lecture. Based on the description of the research results that have been put forward, it shows that the approach used by lecturers in internalizing religious moral values is different. This is in line with the opinion (Rahmat, 2018) which states that in internalizing moral values, four approaches can be used: the moral cultivation approach, the free value transmission approach, the exemplary approach, and the value clarification approach. This study illustrates that the approaches used in internalizing religious moral values applied by lecturers in the Department of Islamic Education include the moral inculcation approach, exemplary approach, and value clarification approach.

The moral cultivation approach is used to instil moral values that are considered to be accepted because their existence cannot be doubted. Religious moral values such as religious aqidah and piety are moral values whose existence cannot be doubted. This approach is used by lecturers through the application of strategies to strengthen religious moral values that students have owned. One of the strengthening of the religious moral values of piety possessed by students can be done in learning Religious Education. Through religious education learning materials, lecturers can strengthen the values of piety possessed by students. An exemplary approach is used to teach moral values through the appointment of public figures whose personalities are exemplary. These public figures include prophets or apostles, lecturers, teachers, parents, community leaders, scientists, and scholars. Lecturers use this approach through the application of modelling strategies. The example used in cultivating religious moral values is in the form of internal and external examples. Internally, the lecturer is a figure who can be used as an example. Lecturers set an example in many good ways; such as starting and ending lectures by praying, speaking and behaving politely, having responsibility, being honest, being disciplined in giving lectures, being fair, and being sincere in doing everything. Externally, this can be done by providing good examples of exemplary figures.

The value clarification approach is used to strengthen moral values through reviewing, selecting, and applying the values it faces. Lecturers use this approach by applying problem or case analysis strategies and inculcating contextual educational values. Through case analysis or contextual problems containing educational values, students can get positive and negative values from a case. After the problem is completed, students can take lessons or positive values and can learn from the problem solved. In addition, students can also apply in their lives the good grades from the results of case analysis that have been completed in learning. In addition to using the approach that has been proposed, the internalization of religious moral values in the learning process in universities should also be carried out comprehensively. As stated (Kim & Rehg, 2018) (Paufler, 2018) . A comprehensive approach to values education can be used as an option. The content of value education to be instilled in students must be comprehensive. In the context of internalizing religious moral values in the learning process, religious moral values that need to be a top priority include the values of piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility. The selection of moral values that become the main priority is in line with the functions and objectives of national education, namely developing the potential of students to become human beings who believe and fear God Almighty, have noble character, are healthy, knowledgeable, capable, creative, independent, and become a democratic and responsible citizen. Other religious moral values can be instilled outside the learning process. For example, through the creation of a system or campus atmosphere that allows religious moral values to be instilled in students properly. Through the slogans that exist in every corner of the campus can be used as a means to instill religious moral values. The creation of religious nuanced campus programs or activities can also be

Samsul Susilawati, A. Fatah Yasin, Aniek Rahmaniah, Abdallah Chiakim, Triyo Supriyatna / Strategy to Internalizing Religious Moral Values in the Learning Process in Higher Education
developed as a means that can be used to internalize religious moral values in campus life. The inculcation of religious moral values should not be done partially but must include all religious moral values.

In terms of the methods used, the internalization of religious moral values in learning must also be carried out comprehensively. Lecturers must be able to be role models for their students in acting and speaking. Students need to be prepared to become independent young people by teaching and facilitating them in making responsible moral decisions. In addition, it is necessary to equip students with academic and social skills. Students are equipped with critical thinking skills and conflict resolution skills. Internalization of religious moral values needs to be carried out in the entire educational process in the classroom, in extra and intra-campus activities, in the guidance process with academic advisors, and in all aspects of life. Students can do this through group discussion activities, use of reading materials and writing topics on goodness, use of strategies and clarification of values and moral dilemmas, not smoking, not behaving corruptly, being generous, not lying, and so on. Internalization of religious moral values can be done by every lecturer, either planned or unplanned. Then lastly, the internalization of religious moral values in the learning process must be comprehensive in terms of assessment. The effectiveness and progress of this activity must be measured comprehensively using formative and summative evaluations that can measure the knowledge, attitudes, and skills possessed by students.

CONCLUSION

From the research that has been carried out, it can be concluded that the strategy of implementing religious moral values is applied in the learning process in the PAI Department at the State Islamic University of Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, University of Muhammadiyah Malang, and Islamic University Malang. Department of Islamic Education, Faculty of Tarbiyah Sciences includes: modelling, problem or case analysis, teaching contextual educational values, and strengthening existing moral values. Religious moral values that are the main priority to be developed in the learning process include the moral values of piety, honesty, sincerity, and responsibility. Each strategy used to cultivate religious moral values has its advantages and disadvantages. Internalization of religious moral values in the learning process in higher education can apply a comprehensive approach that includes aspects of content, method, time, actors, and assessment.

Recommendations for further research are that it is better to look for learning strategies that use technology, for example, learning strategies using online through short video analysis that is relevant to the theme uploaded on YouTube or sent on E-learning or via WhatsApp Group then analyzed and discussed in PAI material. Students discuss the theme to find a solution.

REFERENCES

Adya, K., Solihin, I., Ruswandi, U., Erihadiana, M., & Buana. (2020). Moderasi Islam Dalam Pembelajaran PAI Melalui Model Pembelajaran Konstekstual Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Ciencias , Jurnal Pengembangan Pendidikan, 3(2), 82–92.

Al-falah, D. I. P. P., & Ahmad, N. (n.d.). Nilai-Nilai Modernis Beragama. (Kawangung 2019), 43–51.

Beragama, I. N. M., & Chadidjah, S. (n.d.). ( Tinjauan Analisis Pada Pendidikan Dasar, Menengah Dan Tinggi ) Al-Hasanah : Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Al-Hasanah : Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam. 6.

Bhardwaj, A. (2016). Importance of Education in Human Life. International Journal of Science and Consciousness, 2(2), 23–28. Retrieved from https://www.boundless.com/biology/textbooks/boundless-biology-textbook/fungi-24/importance-of-fungi-in-human-life-153/importance-of-fungi-in-human-life-601-12945/

Bin, R., Abidin, Z., Esa, A. B., Rashid, M., & Ahmad, B. W. (2010). Pendidikan Sepanjang Hayat: Sekolah Peneraju Utama Menjana Generasi Terbilang. Seminar Kebangsaan Pengurusan Pendidikan PKPGB 2009, 7 Mei 2009, UTHM PENDIDIKAN, 8(5), 10.

Carlos, E., Implicaciones, L., & Zerpa, C. E. (2007). TRES TEORÍAS DEL DESARROLLO DEL JUICIO
MORAL: FORMACIÓN MORAL.

Coates, H. (2005). The value of student engagement for higher education quality assurance. Quality in Higher Education. https://doi.org/10.1080/13538320500074915

Domenech Rodríguez, M. M., Donovick, M. R., & Crowley, S. L. (2009). Parenting styles in a cultural context: Observations of protective parenting in first-generation Latinos. Family Process, 48(2), 195–210. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1545-5300.2009.01277.x

For, L, Thinking, C., On, A., & Materials, S. (2020). Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan Creative Problem Solving (Cps) -Based Assessment Instrument for Critical Thinking Ability on Berbasis Creative Problem Solving (Cps) Pada. 12(2), 230–245. https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v12i2.227

H. Mudjia Rahardjo. (2010). Triangulasi dalam Penelitian Kualitatif. https://doi.org/10.1360/zd-2013-43-6-1064

Hammarberg, K., Kirkman, M., & Lacey, S. De. (2016). Qualitative research methods: when to use them and how to judge them. 31(3), 498–501. https://doi.org/10.1093/humrep/dev334

Harto, K., & Tastin, T. (2019). Pengembangan Pembelajaran Pai Berwawasan Islam Wasatiyah: Upaya Membangun Sikap Moderasi Beragama Peserta Didik. At-Ta’lim: Media Informasi Pendidikan Islam, 18(1), 89. https://doi.org/10.29300/attalim.v181i1280

Istiqmoham, N. A., Rivadah, M., Potabuga, M. N., & Rahman, A. (2020). Strategi Dan Peluang Pembelajaran Pai Berkultural Multikultural. 291–301.

Kim, H., & Rehg, M. (2018). Faculty Performance and Morale in Higher Education: A Systems Approach. Systems Research and Behavioral Science, 35(3), 308–323. https://doi.org/10.1002/sres.2495

Milevsky, A., Schlechter, M., Netter, S., & Keehn, D. (2007). Maternal and paternal parenting styles in adolescents: Associations with self-esteem, depression and life-satisfaction. Journal of Child and Family Studies, 16(1), 39–47. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10826-006-9066-5

Muslih, M. (2010). Pembelajaran Moral Melalui Pembelajaran Kooperatif. Edukasi Islamika.

Nana, N., & Surahman, E. (2019). Pengembangan Inovasi Pembelajaran Digital Menggunakan Model Blended POE2WE di Era Revolusi Industri 4.0. Prosiding SNFA (Seminar Nasional Fisika Dan Aplikasinya), 4, 82. https://doi.org/10.20961/prosidingsnfa.v4i0.35915

Paufler, N. A. (2018). Declining Morale, Diminishing Autonomy, and Decreasing Value: Principal Reflections on a High-Stakes Teacher Evaluation System. International Journal of Education Policy and Leadership, 13(8). https://doi.org/10.22230/ijepl.2018v13n8a813

Rachmawati, I. N. (2007). Pengumpulan Data Dalam Penelitian Kualitatif: Wawancara. Jurnal Keperawatan Indonesia. https://doi.org/10.7454/jki.v11i1.184

Rahmat, M. (2018). Model Perkuliahan Pendidikan Agama Islam Yang Damai, Moderat, dan Toleran. Nadwa, 12(1), 39. https://doi.org/10.21580/nw.2018.12.1.2180

Ramdani, D., Hidayat, D. N., Sumarna, A., & Santika, I. (2020). Ideal Character of Muslim Generation of Industrial Revolution Era 4.0 and Society 5.0. Jurnal Iqra’: Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan, 5(1), 171–182. https://doi.org/10.25217/ji.v5i1.644

Sofaer, S. (2002). Qualitative research methods. 14(4), 329–336.

Sugiyono. (2012). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R & D.Bandung:Alfabeta. Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif Dan R & D.Bandung:Alfabeta. https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO978107015324.004

Sukardi, I. (2016). Character Education Based on Religious Values: an Islamic Perspective. Ta’dib. https://doi.org/10.19109/td.v2i1I.744

Tinggi, K. P. (2019). Panduan Penyusunan Kurikulum. Belmont, Kemristekdikti.

Uswatun Khasanah, & Herina. (2019). Membangun Karakter Siswa Melalui Literasi Digital Dalam Menghadapi Pendidikan Abad 21 (Revolusi Industri 4.0). Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pendidikan Program Pascasarjana Universitas Pgi Palembang, 21, 999–1015.
