Public Communication of Local Government Leaders: A Case Study of Three Major Governors in Indonesia

Syamsul Bahri Abd. Rasyid\(^1\), Achmad Nurmandi\(^2\), Suswanta\(^2\), Dyah Mutiarin\(^2\), and Salahudin\(^3\)

\(^1\) Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
syamsulbahri100296@gmail.com

\(^2\) Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Jusuf Kalla School of Government, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

\(^3\) Department of Government Science, Social and Political Science Faculty, Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, Malang, Indonesia

Abstract. For public purposes and political contact, political insiders, regional leaders, and state officials are increasingly utilizing Twitter. To the full extent that it is a lobbying method for issues that have not become a public concern, Twitter can relay messages. This paper intends to review the use of Twitter from the official Twitter accounts of the three governors with the most followers, namely; Anies Baswedan (DKI Jakarta), Ganjar Pranowo (Central Java), and Ridwan Kamil (West Java), in the six months, with indicators; empowering citizens, building public trust in public institutions, civic engagement, providing significant insights, and strengthening transparency, which researchers draw from previous research. This study used descriptive qualitative research methods to describe the comparison and connectivity between Twitter usage indicators by @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil. Nvivo 12 plus software with crosstab query features, word frequency, cluster analysis, and project map was used to analyze tweet intensity, conversation topics, relations between indicators, and indicator relations with each Twitter account. This study’s findings show that Twitter usage by @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil is outstanding by always tweeting oriented towards the indicators in question and having a relationship between indicators on each Twitter account. This paper’s contribution is to depict the use of Twitter as a means of communication and public interaction between the three governors’ accounts and their communities. It is essential to conduct studies on the usage of Twitter with more subjects of the governor account using a mixed-method approach.

Keywords: Social media · Twitter · Governors · Local government · Public communication · Indonesia

© The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2021
T. Antipova (Ed.): ICADS 2021, AISC 1352, pp. 487–497, 2021.
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-71782-7_43
1 Introduction

Twitter is one of the most followed social networks in the world. Twitter has been one of the fastest-growing media networking sites in the last few years since its release in 2006 [1]. A survey result from a survey institute, Statista, said that up to the third quarter of 2018, there were 326 million Twitter users. Twitter’s active users in Indonesia are the third-largest after America and India, which reached 24.34 million. Apart from being used as a social media to establish relationships with other users, history also notes that Twitter is often used as a media for social movements in developed countries, for example, the Egyptian Revolution to overthrow President Husni Mubarak. At the same time, it is known as events of social movements protesting Iran’s election results. From 2009 to 2010. While in Indonesia itself, Twitter is also widely used as a medium for political communication, both by political figures [2].

For the number of followers on Twitter, Ridwan Kamil has the most followers, followed by Anies and Ganjar. Since February 2010, Anies Baswedan has 4 million followers. Meanwhile, Ganjar Pranowo’s Twitter account has 1.7 million followers since January 2010. Meanwhile, Ridwan Kamil has 4.3 followers since October 2009. With the use of Twitter and the massive followers of the three governors, as well as its benefits that can speed up the flow of information from local government to the community, then the use of social media to address complaints faced by the community can be resolved if social media is utilized correctly. This situation is in line with what Ganjar Pranowo and Ridwan Kamil said, “public complaints will be known and resolved if channeled through social media”. Utilization of social media Twitter in the Governor of Central Java government bureaucracy, Ganjar Pranowo and Gubernur West Java, Ridwan Kamil to improve excellent service, has implemented service standards, namely ability, attitude, appearance, attention, action, and responsibility [3].

The indicators in this paper are a collection of indicators that the authors took from previous studies: engaging citizens and strengthening transparency [4], empowering citizens [5], building public trust in public institutions [6], and providing significant insights [7]. As far as the quest of the previous studies is concerned. The authors have not found @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil’s social media use on Twitter with indicators: inspiring people, building public trust in public institutions, engaging citizens, providing valuable insights, and reinforcing accountability in a single research paper. Therefore, the authors refer more to studies [4, 5, 6]; and [7] to compile a paper on the official Twitter accounts of the three governors with the indicators above.

2 Literature Review

2.1 Social Media and Government

Social media use by government agencies is extensive across various disciplines, focusing on various topics [8]. Social media can be defined as a collection of technological instruments that enable public bodies to promote citizen engagement [4]. The use of social media by government agencies and citizens has now become mainstream. Platforms such as Facebook, Twitter, and WeChat represent global tools that can transform the interaction between government agencies, businesses, and citizens [9].
In Al-Masaeed’s study, the Jordanian government identified e-participation as the focus of its strategic initiatives. Also, it vowed to create an environment that empowered people to be more involved in government activities [5]. In 2015, the China Cyberspace Administration Office issued statements on the central government’s social media strategy and the commitment of the government’s social media function, namely censoring government information, engaging with people, reacting to popular perception, and supporting public services [7]. The key findings from [10] also found: (1) the significant influence of disaster information came from the probability of participants requesting additional disaster data from the newspapers, local government websites, and federal government websites; (2) respondents defined the most crucial intention to link immediately to the disaster via offline interpersonal forms rather than online organizational and personal forms; and (3) if requested by the government, participants reported a firm intention to relocate.

2.2 Challenges of Social Media

Some of the substantial challenges of social media are (1) lack of implementation plan, making the use of social media more ad hoc and challenging in the long term to sustain; (2) low quality of interaction of an institution which may not encourage citizens to take part, thus damaging the image of the institution; (3) the potential to disseminate gossip or question authority; (4) difficulty understanding the details on different social media sites that are processed every day; and (5) Exclusion, due to impairment or financial loss, of non-Internet users [11].

Moreover, disinformation on chat apps such as WhatsApp, Signal, or Telegram is an essential medium by which individuals share news and information, coordinate political activity, and discuss politics [12]. Social media users can assist policy-makers and decision-makers (media and press agencies) and providers of journalism services in Egypt to consider the essence of those that use social media as a source of awareness and attract researchers and media practitioners interested in information sources. Government journalists are often described as people working under government finance and administration control and are considered mediators and information carriers between the state and individuals [13].

2.3 Social Media Strategies

Understanding the value of government perceived by a government service through social media and social media synchronicity under government services’ characteristics can provide significant insight into the government’s social media [6]. Experts claim that designing a social media strategy will help governments reinforce accountability policies or promote a transparent government picture to the public [7]. In this research, the authors will discuss social media use by the government through the Twitter accounts of @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo and @ridwankamil with indicators: empowering citizens, building public trust in public institutions, citizen engagement, providing significant insights, and strengthening transparency. The research questions are: (1) What is the intensity of the tweets carried out by the @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo and @ridwankamil accounts in October 2020? (2) What are the most dominant themes
in the tweets of @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo and @ridwankamil? (3) How do @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo and @ridwankamil accounts carry out the relationship between the indicators’ tweets in the regional head’s leadership in utilizing social media?

3 Research Method

The approach used in this research was descriptive qualitative, which described Twitter in empowering citizens, building public trust in public institutions, involving citizens, providing significant insights, and strengthening transparency. Descriptive analysis in this study used the NVivo 12 plus software application. This study’s data came from the Twitter accounts of @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, @ridwankamil, and supported by previous studies related to the government’s social media use. Data were obtained using the Ncapture feature in Nvivo 12 plus by capturing tweets @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil written for six months (July 2020–15 December 2020).

Data were analyzed using crosstab query features, word frequency, cluster analysis, and project map on the Vivo 12 Plus. The crosstab query was used to determine the intensity of tweets made by the Twitter accounts @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil. Word frequency found out the topics of conversation or words most often used in tweets. Cluster analysis was used to determine the relationship between indicators in the use of social media Twitter. Meanwhile, the project map determined the relationship between Twitter accounts (@aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil) and their tweets on social media. The data from the three Twitter accounts of the regional heads can be seen in the table below.

| Name              | Position                  | Twitter Account | Followers | Tweets July-15 December 2020 |
|-------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|-----------|-----------------------------|
| Anies Baswedan    | Governor of DKI Jakarta   | @aniesbaswedan  | 4 M       | 356                         |
| Ganjar Pranowo    | Governor of Central Java  | @ganjarpranowo  | 1,7 M     | 481                         |
| Ridwan Kamil      | Governor of West Java     | @ridwankamil    | 4,3 M     | 145                         |

This research aims to look at the usefulness of social media in the hands of the government, with indicators: empowering citizens, building public trust in public institutions, civic engagement, providing significant insights, and strengthening transparency, based on the tweets of the three most active governors on Twitter, namely the Governor of DKI Jakarta (@aniesbaswedan), the Governor of Central Java (@ganjarpranowo), and the Governor of West Java (@ridwankamil). The object of this research study is to answer the following three research questions.
What is the intensity of the tweets carried out by the @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo and @ridwankamil accounts in October 2020?

What are the most dominant themes in the tweets of @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo and @ridwankamil?

How do @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo and @ridwankamil accounts carry out the relationship between the indicators’ tweets in the regional head’s leadership in utilizing social media?

Data analysis was carried out in three stages; namely, the first stage is NCapture text Twitter account; the second stage was data analysis with the Nvivo 12 Plus software reading text and content with similarities between one account and another, finding related items, and looking for interrelated meanings, words, and contexts between the three accounts; The third stage was discourse analysis, which was the analysis and meaning of the three Twitter accounts and relevant articles to the government’s social media.

4 Result and Discussion

4.1 Tweets Intensity

In Table 1, regarding the comparison of Twitter accounts based on the number of followers, Ridwan Kamil is in the highest position with 4.3 million followers since joining Twitter in October 2009, followed by Anies Baswedan with 4 million followers February 2010, and Ganjar Pranowo with 1.7 Million followers since January 2010. However, this condition is inversely proportional to the tweet’s intensity. Ganjar Pranowo tweets more frequently and far surpass Anies Baswedan and Ridwan Kamil.

On the @ganjarpranowo account, the indicator citizen involvement with a value of 479, followed by builds public trust in public institutions with a value of 472, strengthening transparency with a value of 472, empowering citizens with a value of 433, and providing significant insights with a value of 378. Meanwhile, on the @aniesbaswedan account, citizen involvement indicators, building public trust in public institutions, and empowering citizens, have a value of 355, 352, and 349, followed by indicators of strengthening transparency with a value of 330 and indicators of providing significant insight with a value of 268. Finally, on the @ridwankamil account, citizen involvement indicators and building public trust in public institutions have the same value of 150, followed by indicators of empowering citizens, strengthening transparency, and providing significant insights with a value of 143, 127, and 112.

Data sourced from the Twitter account of the Governor of DKI Jakarta (@aniesbawedan), the Governor of Central Java (@ganjarpranowo), and the Governor of West Java (@ridwankamil) in July-December in Fig. 1, shows that @ganjarpranowo’s tweets more frequently than @aniesbaswedan and @ridwankamil. In a row, @ganjarpranowo and @aniesbaswedan tend to be an indicator of citizen involvement. Meanwhile, @ridwankamil share a tendency towards two indicators, namely citizen involvement and building public trust in public institutions. The data above is how the governors of DKI Jakarta, Central Java, and West Java use social media in carrying out their duties as regional heads, with indicators of citizen involvement, building public trust in public
Institutions, and empowering citizens, providing significant insights, and strengthening transparency.

In the tweet intensity data above, it is following research conducted by [4–6]; and [7], that the use of social media government can engage citizens, build public trust in public institutions, empower citizens, provide significant insights, and strengthen transparency. In the study [4], online openness, mood, the activity level on social media, and interactivity provided by local government websites were considered essential to citizen engagement. This study’s findings contribute significantly to understanding how the form of social media adopted affects citizen interaction. The research conducted in Spain is in line with the indicators of citizen involvement and strengthening transparency, which the author did on the Twitter accounts @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil, where the use of social media by local governments involves citizens in their tweets as well as a form of strengthening of transparency online.

In [5] in Jordan, the government’s latest published strategy identified electronic engagement as the focus of its strategic initiatives and promised to create an environment that empowers individuals to be more involved in government activities. In line with this research, this research also shows the government’s use of social media via tweets on their Twitter accounts, demonstrating its desire to empower the citizens. In line with research at the Office of Investment and One Stop–Integrated-Services (Dinas Penanaman Modal dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Provinsi DKI Jakarta) [6], the results of my research are also that the use of social media can enhance government trust as long as the public feels transparency and interactivity of social media communication. The government’s transparency through social media has an effect on public trust in them.

Meanwhile, social media’s practical use, particularly knowledge acquisition and participation, is an essential predictor of perceptions of government accountability, responsiveness, and citizen satisfaction in research [7] in Beijing, China. In contrast, the position of public services is urgent. The increasing perception of the government’s response is also in line with the current research on the government’s social media
use, namely @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, @ridwankamil, which also provides significant insights to the public in every tweet.

4.2 The Intensity of the Tweet Topic

Based on word frequency analysis, the accounts @ridwankamil and @ganjarpranowo always tweet about covid, unlike @ridwankamil, which prioritizes the province’s name DKI Jakarta. The most frequently discussed topics from the @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil accounts can be seen in the pictures below, which the author has analyzed using the word frequency feature in the Nvivo Plus 12 software (Figs. 2, 3 and 4).

![Word Frequency of @aniesbaswedan](image1)

![Word Frequency of @ganjarpranowo](image2)

![Word Frequency of @ridwankamil](image3)

The word frequency from the @aniesbaswedan social media accounts results from Jakarta is the word most often used. This situation is in line with his position as governor of DKI Jakarta. Other words whose visualization is also remarkable are #jagajakarta, dki, #covid19, data, and virus, which means that Anies Baswedan uses his Twitter account as governor of DKI Jakarta. Meanwhile, covid words are most often used by
the @ganjarpranowo account, which means it is in line with his position as governor of Central Java, where he uses his Twitter account to inform about health protocols against COVID-19. Other words with great visualization are kesehatan, masker, desa, jawa, and pandemi. This result illustrates that Ganjar Pranowo concerns his citizens’ health by frequently making tweets related to COVID-19. Similar to @ganjarpranowo, covid is also the most dominant word on the @ridwankamil account. This result means that the @ridwankamil also has grave concerns for the health of their citizens. Other words with good visualization are jawa, kota, ekonomi, bandung dan warga. Thus, the tweets from the @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil accounts are in line with the indicators of research from [4–6]; and [7].

4.3 Connectivity and Similarity of Tweets Between Twitter Accounts

The relationship between indicators in the accounts @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil is defined based on cluster analysis results, connectivity between indicators, namely, empowering people and building public confidence in public institutions, citizen engagement, providing essential insights, and strengthening transparency in each Twitter account.

On the @aniesbaswedan account, indicators of empowering citizens, providing significant insights, and strengthening transparency have the most substantial relationship with details of the respective values, with 12.05%, 11.94%, and 11.84%, followed by indicators building public trust in public institutions of 11.20% and citizen involvement 9.09%. On the @ganjarpranowo account, the indicator of empowering citizens has the most substantial relationship with a value of 15.55%, followed by indicators providing significant insights of 15.32%, indicators of building public trust in public institutions 14.15%, indicators of strengthening transparency 14.05%, and citizen involvement 12.56%. While on the @ridwankamil account, the indicator empowers citizens and provides significant insights, has the most substantial relationship with the details of the same value, namely 5.30%, followed by indicators of strengthens transparency of 5.05%, indicators of building public trust in public institutions 4.48%, and indicators of citizen involvement 3.95% (Figs. 5, 6 and 7).

The cluster analysis results above show that each indicator: empowering citizens, building public trust in public institutions, citizen engagement, providing significant insights, and strengthening transparency, correlated with each other in the orientation of the use of social media by the Twitter accounts of @aniesbaswedan @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil, in line with the research of [4] in Spain, [5] in Jordan, [6] at the Office of Investment and One Stop-Integrated-Services (Dinas Penanaman Modal dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Provinsi DKI Jakarta), and [7] in Beijing, China.

4.4 Relationship Between Twitter Accounts

Project Map data is the last stage of the data analysis process using Nvivo 12 plus. This process is a sub-process that is on the Map. A map is a visualization tool used to explore ideas and display the connections between one data and another. Meanwhile, the project map is a graphic representation of various items that have been made in the study. In this stage, the authors created an analysis map from coding, case, and related source data to
display the data processing flow and the relationship of each data that the researcher has done from the beginning to the end (Fig. 8).

The results of the project map above show the Twitter accounts @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil have a mutual relationship because the accounts @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo and @ridwankamil, can utilize social media (Twitter), to write tweets related to empowering citizens, building public trust in public institutions, citizen engagement, providing significant insights, and strengthening transparency.
5 Conclusion, Contribution, Research Limitations and Recommendations for Further Research

The use of social media by the Twitter accounts @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil as DKI Jakarta, Central Java, and West Java governors is considered perfect. Concerning the tweets’ frequency from the three Twitter accounts, the tweets from @ganjarpranowo are more severe than @aniesbaswedan and @ridwankamil. The debate topics from these three accounts also appear to be identical, namely prioritizing each tweet the names of provinces and COVID-19. This finding shows that @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil aim to make the best use of the social media of Twitter to connect and communicate with the citizen.

This paper helps explain similarities between governors to stimulate Twitter social media use by governors across Indonesia so that government and public information exchange can run faster and community concerns can be resolved quickly due to the rapid flow of information through Twitter social media. While this research contributes to the definition of @aniesbaswedan, @ganjarpranowo, and @ridwankamil’s use of Twitter social media in disseminating knowledge and engaging with the group, a significant triangulation study between qualitative data and quantitative data has not yet been demonstrated by the data analysis approach used. For this reason, in subsequent studies with a mix-method approach, problems about the government’s use of Twitter social media need to be analyzed more thoroughly and concentrate on more comparisons of official government accounts.

References

1. Habibi, M.: Analisis Konten Jejaring Sosial Twitter Dalam Kasus Pemilihan Gubernur Dki 2017, Teknomatika, no. March 2018. https://tekno.kompas.com/read/2015/03/26/16465417/Pengguna.Twitter.di.Indonesia.Capa
2. Juditha, C.: Dukungan Sosial Warganet Di Twitter Terhadap Gaya Komunikasi Pasangan Calon Presiden Pada Debat Pemilu 2019. J. Stud. Komun. dan Media 23(1), 87 (2019). https://doi.org/10.31445/jskm.2019.1982

3. Suminto, A., Al Farizi, A.: Analisis Pemanfaatan Media Sosial Twitter oleh Ganjar Pranowo dan Ridwan Kamil. Sahafa J. Islam. Commun. 2(2), 191 (2020). https://doi.org/10.21111/sjic.v2i2.4394

4. Haro-de-Rosario, A., Sáez-Martín, A., del Carmen Caba-Pérez, M.: Using social media to enhance citizen engagement with local government: Twitter or Facebook? New Media Soc. 20(1), 29–49 (2018). https://doi.org/10.1177/1461448816645652

5. Al-Masaeed, S.: Social media use by the government: adoption and efficiency. Int. J. Electron. Gov. 11(2), 205–216 (2019). https://doi.org/10.1504/IJEG.2019.101497

6. Marpianta, D.A.: Influence of use of social media of government agencies on trust to the government: study on social media Owned by Dinas Penanaman Modal dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Provinsi DKI Jakarta. J. Komun. Indones VIII(2) (2019)

7. Jia, Z., Liu, M., Shao, G.: Linking government social media usage to public perceptions of government performance: an empirical study from China. Chin. J. Commun. 12(1), 84–101 (2019). https://doi.org/10.1080/17544750.2018.1523802

8. Nadzir, M.M.: Proposed e-government 2.0 engagement model based on social media use in government agencies. In: 2019 IEEE Conference on e-Learning, e-Management e-Services, IC3e 2019, pp. 16–19 (2019). https://doi.org/10.1109/IC3e47558.2019.8971778

9. Medaglia, R., Scholl, M.C., Loukis, E.: Introduction to the minitrack on social media and government. In: Proceedings of the 51st Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences, no. January, pp. 3–4 (2018). https://doi.org/10.24251/hicss.2018.318

10. Liu, B.F., Fraustino, J.D., Jin, Y.: Social media use during disasters: how information form and source influence intended behavioral responses. Commun. Res. 43(5), 626–646 (2016). https://doi.org/10.1177/0093650214565917

11. El-taliawi, O.G.: Global encyclopedia of public administration, public policy, and governance. In: Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance, no. January 2018 (2020). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5

12. Bradshaw, S., Howard, P.N.: Challenging Truth and Trust: A Global Inventory of Organized Social Media Manipulation. Comprop.Oi.Ox.Ac.Uk, p. 26 (2018). https://comprop.oii.ox.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/sites/93/2018/07/ct2018.pdf

13. Mansour, E.: The adoption and use of social media as a source of information by Egyptian government journalists. J. Librariansh. Inf. Sci. 50(1), 48–67 (2018). https://doi.org/10.1177/096100616669977