TYPE II SUPERNOVAE AS STANDARDIZED CANDLES

MARIO HAMUY,1,2 AND PHILIP A. PINTO

Steward Observatory, University of Arizona, 933 North Cherry Avenue, Tucson, AZ 85721; mhamuy@ociw.edu, ppinto@as.arizona.edu

Received 2001 December 31; accepted 2002 January 16; published 2002 January 30

ABSTRACT

We present evidence for a correlation between expansion velocities of the ejecta of Type II plateau supernovae and their bolometric luminosities during the plateau phase. This correlation permits one to standardize the candles and decrease the scatter in the Hubble diagram from ~1 mag to levels of 0.4 and 0.3 mag in the V and I bands, respectively. When we restrict the sample to the eight objects that are well in the Hubble flow (cz > 3000 km s⁻¹), the scatter drops even further, to only 0.2 mag (or 9% in distance), which is comparable to the precision yielded by Type Ia supernovae and is far better than the “expanding photosphere method” applied to Type II supernovae.

Using SN 1987A to calibrate the Hubble diagrams, we get H₀ = 55 ± 12.

Subject headings: distance scale — galaxies: general — supernovae: general

1. INTRODUCTION

Distances to cosmological objects are the path to getting the expansion rate and the age of the universe. From observations of high-z objects, it is possible to measure how the expansion rate changes with time and derive fundamental parameters, such as the geometry, deceleration, and energy content of the universe. This experiment has been recently done by two groups of astronomers using Type Ia supernovae (SNe Ia; Riess et al. 1996; Phillips et al. 1999), thus hampering the use of SNe II as the geometry, deceleration, and energy content of the universe.

In principle, the apparent magnitudes of stellar objects can be used to derive distances, as long as a class of objects with known luminosities can be identified. Although SNe II are not as bright as the SNe Ia, they are the most common type of SN, and they offer independent checks. Although SNe II are not as bright as the SNe Ia, they are the most common type of SN, and they offer independent checks.

2. OBSERVATIONAL MATERIAL

Table 1 lists the 17 plateau SNe II (SNe IIP) included in this study. These are all SNe IIP for which we have (1) precise optical photometry uncontaminated by host galaxy light and (2) optical spectroscopy. This table lists the specific data sources along with characteristic VI magnitudes and velocities of the expanding ejecta (derived from the minimum of the Fe II 5169 Å line and duly corrected for host galaxy redshifts) for the plateau phase. Redshifts in the cosmic microwave background frame come from the NASA/IPAC Extragalactic Database or our own measurements.

3. LUMINOSITY-VELOCITY RELATION

Bolometric light curves were derived by Hamuy (2001) for these SNe using (1) BV photometry, (2) empirical bolometric corrections, (3) reddening corrections due to our own Galaxy (Schlegel, Finkbeiner, & Davis 1998), (4) host galaxy extinction corrections (assuming that all SNe reach the same color at the end of the plateau), and (5) redshift-based distances (H₀ = 65). The light curves were all placed in the same timescale, using explosion times derived from the EPM analysis and considerations about the discovery and prediscovery image epochs. The resulting bolometric luminosities confirmed the well-known fact that SNe IIP display a wide range (7.5 mag peak to peak) of plateau luminosities. We also noticed that objects with brighter plateaus have higher envelope expansion velocities. Figure 1 compares the characteristic plateau luminosity and velocity of these SNe (both measured 50 days after explosion, which is nearly the middle of the plateau). A remarkable correlation emerges where SN 1992am and SN 1999br appear as extreme objects with high and low velocities, respectively. A weighted least-squares fit yields Vᵥ ∝ L°0.38±0.04, with a reduced χ² of 0.7.

4. TYPE II SUPERNOVAE AS STANDARD CANDLES

The tight luminosity-velocity correlation and the inverse-square law imply that the distance to a SN IIP can be derived from measurements of the apparent magnitude and envelope velocity. To test this hypothesis we used V/I magnitudes measured on day 50 (corrected for dust extinction) and expansion velocities derived at the same epoch (see Table 1). The bottom panel of Figure 2 presents the Hubble diagram in the V filter for all SNe but SN 1987A (which is not in the Hubble flow), while the top panel shows the same magnitudes after correction for expansion velocities. A least-squares fit yields the following
## Redshifts, Magnitudes, and Expansion Velocities of the 17 Type II Supernovae

| SN      | $cz_{\text{CMB}}$ (±300 km s$^{-1}$) | $A_{\text{Gal}}(V)$ | $A_{\text{host}}(V)$ | $V_p$ | $I_p$ | $v_p$ (km s$^{-1}$) | References |
|---------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------|-------|---------------------|------------|
| 1986L   | 1293                                | 0.099                | 0.00                 | 14.57(05) | ... | 4150(300)       | 1          |
| 1987A   | ...                                 | 0.249                | 0.22                 | 3.42(05)  | 2.45(0.05) | 2391(300)       | 2, 3       |
| 1988A   | 1842                                | 0.136                | 0.00                 | 15.00(05) | ... | 4613(300)     | 1, 4       |
| 1990E   | 1023                                | 0.082                | 1.00                 | 15.90(20) | 14.56(0.20) | 5324(300)       | 1, 5       |
| 1990K   | 1303                                | 0.047                | 0.50                 | 14.50(20) | 13.90(0.05) | 6142(2000)    | 1, 6       |
| 1991al  | 4484                                | 0.168                | 0.15                 | 16.62(05) | 16.16(0.05) | 7330(2000)    | 1          |
| 1992af  | 5438                                | 0.171                | 0.00                 | 17.06(20) | 16.56(0.20) | 5322(2000)    | 1          |
| 1992ba  | 14009                               | 0.164                | 0.30                 | 18.44(05) | 17.99(0.05) | 7868(300)     | 1          |
| 1992qa  | 1165                                | 0.193                | 0.00                 | 15.43(05) | 14.76(0.05) | 3523(300)     | 1          |
| 1993A   | 8933                                | 0.572                | 0.00                 | 19.64(05) | 18.89(0.05) | 4290(300)     | 1          |
| 1995S   | 9649                                | 0.054                | 0.30                 | 18.96(05) | 18.25(0.05) | 4569(300)     | 1          |
| 1999br  | 1292                                | 0.078                | 0.00                 | 17.58(05) | 16.71(0.05) | 1545(300)     | 1          |
| 1999ca  | 3105                                | 0.361                | 0.30                 | 16.65(05) | 15.77(0.05) | 5353(2000)    | 1          |
| 1999cr  | 6376                                | 0.324                | 0.00                 | 18.33(05) | 17.63(0.05) | 4389(300)     | 1          |
| 1999eg  | 4694                                | 0.388                | 0.00                 | 18.65(05) | 17.94(0.05) | 4012(300)     | 1          |
| 1999em  | 669                                 | 0.130                | 0.18                 | 13.98(05) | 13.35(0.05) | 3557(300)     | 1          |
| 2000cb  | 2038                                | 0.373                | 0.00                 | 16.56(05) | 15.69(0.05) | 4732(300)     | 1          |

References.—(1) Hamuy 2001; (2) Hamuy & Suntzeff 1990; (3) Phillips et al. 1988; (4) Benetti, Capellaro, & Turatto 1991; (5) Schmidt et al. 1993; (6) Capellaro et al. 1995.

The scatter drops from 0.95 to 0.39 mag, thus demonstrating that the correction for expansion velocities standardizes the luminosities of SNe II significantly. It is interesting to note that most of the spread comes from the nearby SNe, which are potentially more affected by peculiar motions of their host galaxies. When we restrict the sample to the eight objects with $cz > 3000$ km s$^{-1}$, the scatter drops to only 0.20 mag. This implies that the standard candle method can produce relative distances with a precision of 9%, which is comparable to the 7% precision yielded by SNe Ia.

Figure 3 shows the same analysis but in the $I$ band. In this case the scatter in the raw Hubble diagram is 0.80 mag, which drops to only 0.29 mag after correction for expansion velocities. This is even smaller that the 0.39 spread in the $V$ band, possibly due to the fact that the effects of dust extinction are smaller at these wavelengths. The least-squares fit yields the following solution:

$$I_p - A_p + 5.820(\pm 0.764) \log \left( \frac{v_p}{5000} \right) = 5 \log (cz) - 1.797(\pm 0.103).$$

The scatter drops from 0.95 to 0.39 mag, thus demonstrating that the correction for expansion velocities standardizes the luminosities of SNe II significantly. It is interesting to note that most of the spread comes from the nearby SNe, which are potentially more affected by peculiar motions of their host galaxies. When we restrict the sample to the eight objects with $cz > 3000$ km s$^{-1}$, the scatter drops to only 0.20 mag. This implies that the standard candle method can produce relative distances with a precision of 9%, which is comparable to the 7% precision yielded by SNe Ia.

Figure 3 shows the same analysis but in the $I$ band. In this case the scatter in the raw Hubble diagram is 0.80 mag, which drops to only 0.29 mag after correction for expansion velocities. This is even smaller that the 0.39 spread in the $V$ band, possibly due to the fact that the effects of dust extinction are smaller at these wavelengths. The least-squares fit yields the following solution:

$$I_p - A_p + 5.820(\pm 0.764) \log \left( \frac{v_p}{5000} \right) = 5 \log (cz) - 1.797(\pm 0.103).$$
When the eight most distant objects are employed, the spread is 0.21 mag, similar to that obtained from the V magnitudes. Overall, the standard candle method is characterized by a scatter of between 0.39 and 0.20 mag. Evidently more objects in the Hubble flow are required to pin down the actual precision of this technique. The choice of 50 days only has the purpose to represent approximately the middle of the plateau phase, and it is possible that other choices could deliver even better results. In its present form, the method appears very promising for the determination of cosmological distances. Note also that this precision is better than that yielded by EPM (20% in distance, or 0.43 mag; Hamuy 2001), and the standard candle technique is far less complicated. It requires only a few spectra and photometric observations are required during the plateau in order to solve for dust extinction in the host galaxy. The time of explosion is also required. Since the duration of the plateau does not vary much among the different SNe II, it would suffice to get some photometric observations during the plateau/nebular phase transition. Alternatively, an EPM analysis can help at determining $t_m$ but this requires early-time observations.

The standard candle method can be used to solve for the Hubble constant, provided a distance calibrator is available. Among the objects of our sample, only SN 1987A has a precise distance in the Cepheid scale. Assuming a Large Magellanic Cloud distance of 50 kpc, we get $H_0 = 54 \pm 13$ from the entire sample of V magnitudes. When we restrict the sample to the eight most distant objects, we get $H_0 = 55 \pm 15$. The I magnitudes yield $H_0 = 53 \pm 10$ and $56 \pm 12$, respectively. These values agree comfortably well with the 63 $\pm$ 4 value from Cepheids/SNe Ia (Hamuy et al. 1996; Phillips et al. 1999). Clearly, more calibrators are required to improve this estimate, especially considering that given its compact progenitor, SN 1987A is not a prototype of the plateau class and its light curve is quite different than that of typical plateau events. It will be interesting to see the results from SN 1999em that will soon have a Cepheid distance measured with the Hubble Space Telescope.

The specific task of checking the cosmic acceleration indicated by SNe Ia requires observing SNe II at the maximum possible redshift. For a typical SN II with $M_r = -17.5$ during the plateau phase, the apparent magnitude at $z = 0.3$ should be $\sim 23$. Discovering such SNe is clearly feasible nowadays. Obtaining such spectra will be difficult but certainly not impossible with the currently available 8 m class telescopes. In the worst case scenario, the standard candle method can produce distance moduli with a precision of 0.39 mag so that 13 SNe II at $z = 0.3$ should allow us to measure the distances of such objects with a precision of 5% and provide a robust check on the results of SNe Ia.

We thank David Branch for his thorough and constructive referee report. Support for this work was provided by NASA through Hubble Fellowship grant HST-HF-01139.01-A awarded by the Space Telescope Science Institute, which is operated by the Association of Universities for Research in Astronomy, Inc., for NASA, under contract NAS 5-26555. M. H. acknowledges financial support from Dave Arnett via Department of Energy grant DE-FG03-98DP00214/A001. This research has made use of the NASA/IPAC Extragalactic Database, which is operated by the Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology, under contract with the National Aeronautics and Space Administration. This research has made use of the SIMBAD database, operated at Centre de Données astronomiques de Strasbourg, France.

REFERENCES

Barbon, R., Ciatti, F., & Rosino, L. 1979, A&A, 72, 287
Benetti, S., Capellaro, E., & Turatto, M. 1991, A&A, 247, 410
Capellaro, E., Danziger, I. J., Della Valle, M., Gouiffes, C., & Turatto, M. 1995, A&A, 293, 723
Hamuy, M. 2001, Ph.D. thesis, Univ. Arizona
Hamuy, M., Phillips, M. M., Suntzeff, N. B., Schommer, R. A., Maza, J., & Avilés, R. 1996, AJ, 112, 2398
Hamuy, M., & Suntzeff, N. B. 1990, AJ, 99, 1146
Perlmutter, S., et al. 1999, ApJ, 517, 565
Phillips, M. M., Heathcote, S. R., Hamuy, M., & Navarrete, M. 1988, AJ, 95, 1087
Phillips, M. M., Lira, P., Suntzeff, N. B., Schommer, R. A., Hamuy, M., & Maza, J. 1999, AJ, 118, 1766
Riess, A. G., et al. 1998, AJ, 116, 1009
Schlegel, D. J., Finkbeiner, D. P., & Davis, M. 1998, ApJ, 500, 525
Schmidt, B. P., et al. 1994, ApJ, 432, 42
——. 1993, AJ, 105, 2236