Checking Data-Race Freedom of GPU Kernels, Compositionally

Tiago Cogumbreiro
UMass Boston

Dennis Liew
UMass Boston

Julien Lange
Royal Holloway

Hannah Zicarelli
UMass Boston
Today's talk

Motivation

- Why do GPUs matter?
- What makes GPU-based data-races interesting?

Contributions

- A novel analysis of data-race freedom (DRF)
- A tool that can verify 41% more kernels than the state-of-the-art
- Fully formalized using a proof assistant

Our technique

- How behavioral types abstract GPU kernels
- How we encode behavioral types as SMT formula
Motivation
Why do GPUs matter?

GPUs are a computing cornerstone of scientific advancement.
## GPUs in High Performance Computing

Power 8 out of 10 of the Top 10 super computers

| Name                                | GPU |
|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 1 Supercomputer Fugaku              | ☐   |
| 2 Summit                            | ✔   |
| 3 Sierra                            | ✔   |
| 4 Sunway TaihuLight                  | ☐   |
| 5 Selene                            | ✔   |
| 6 Tianhe-2A                         | ✔   |
| 7 JUWELS Booster Module             | ✔   |
| 8 HPC5                              | ✔   |
| 9 Frontera                          | ✔   |
| 10 Dammam-7                         | ✔   |

www.top500.org/lists/top500/2020/11/highs/

Credit: Carlos Jones/ORNL
Topical perspectives

GPU-accelerated molecular modeling coming of age

John E. Stone, David J. Hardy, Ivan S. Ufimtsev, Klaus Schulten

* Beckman Institute, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 405 N. Mathews Ave., Urbana, IL 61801, United States
b Department of Chemistry, Stanford University, 115 Campus Drive, Stanford, CA 94305, United States
c Department of Physics, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1110 W. Green, Urbana, IL 61801, United States

ABSTRACT

Graphics processing units (GPUs) have traditionally been used in molecular modeling solely for visualization of molecular structures and animation of trajectories resulting from molecular dynamics simulations. Modern GPUs have evolved into fully programmable, massively parallel co-processors that can now be exploited to accelerate many scientific computations, typically providing about one order of magnitude speedup over CPU code and in special cases providing speedups of two orders of magnitude. This paper surveys the development of molecular modeling algorithms that leverage GPU computing, the advances already made and remaining issues to be resolved, and the continuing evolution of GPU technology that promises to become even more useful to molecular modeling. Hardware acceleration with commodity GPUs is expected to benefit the overall computational biology community by bringing teraflop performance to desktop workstations and in some cases potentially changing what were formerly batch mode computational jobs into interactive tasks.

© 2010 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.
GPU computing for systems biology

Lorenzo Dematte and Davide Prandi

Submitted: 20th November 2009; Received (in revised form): 30th January 2010

Abstract

The development of detailed, coherent, models of complex biological systems is recognized as a key requirement for integrating the increasing amount of experimental data. In addition, in-silico simulation of bio-chemical models provides an easy way to test different experimental conditions, helping in the discovery of the dynamics that regulate biological systems. However, the computational power required by these simulations often exceeds that available on common desktop computers and thus expensive high performance computing solutions are required. An emerging alternative is represented by general-purpose scientific computing on graphics processing units (GPGPU), which offers the power of a small computer cluster at a cost of ~$400. Computing with a GPU requires the development of specific algorithms. Since the programming paradigm substantially differs from traditional CPU-based computing. In this paper, we review some recent efforts in exploiting the processing power of GPUs for the simulation of biological systems.

Keywords: systems biology; simulation; agent-based modelling; cellular automata; GPGPU, CUDA

doi:10.1093/bib/bbq006
Why do GPUs matter?

GPUs power the AI revolution
Autoware.AI

Autoware.AI is the world's first "All-in-One" open-source software for autonomous driving technology.

22 code results in Autoware.AI/core_perception

ntd_gpu/src/MatrixDevice.cu
  Cuda  Last indexed on Oct 15, 2020

ntd_gpu/src/SymmetricEigenSolver.cu
  Cuda  Last indexed on Oct 15, 2020

vision_darknet_detect/darknet/src/dropout_layer_kernels.cu
  Cuda  Last indexed on Oct 15, 2020

vision_darknet_detect/darknet/src/col2im_kernels.cu
  Cuda  Last indexed on Oct 15, 2020
Why we should care about static verification of GPU programs?
GPU programming, a primer

① High-level of parallelism at a reduced cost
(faster processing, lower cost, reduced power consumption)

② Techniques designed for CPUs do not work for GPUs
(hardware assumptions differ: memory available, execution model)

③ GPUs are difficult to program and debug
GPU programming is difficult

Programming challenges

- high degree of parallelism (up to tens of thousand of threads)
- high degree of concurrency (up to 1,024 threads accessing the same array)
- devices are memory constrained (affects debugging techniques)

Static analysis challenges

- unconstrained access to a shared memory (no locks)
- thousands of threads indexing disjoint portions of arrays
GPU program example

```c
for (int r = 0; r < N; r++) {
    for (int i = 0; i<TILE_DIM; i+=BLOCK_ROWS)
        { tile [ tid .y+i ][ tid .x] = idata [index_in+i*width]; }
    __syncthreads();
    for (int j = 0; j<TILE_DIM; j+=BLOCK_ROWS)
        { odata[index_out+j*height] = tile [ tid .x][ tid .y+j ]; }}
```

Source:
- Optimizing matrix transpose in CUDA. NVIDIA CUDA SDK Application Note 18 (2009).

Also in:
- Padding free bank conflict resolution for CUDA-based matrix transpose algorithm. DOI: 10.1109/SNPD.2014.6888709
GPU program example

```c
for (int r = 0; r < N; r++) {
    for (int i = 0; i<TILE_DIM; i+=BLOCK_ROWS)
        tile[TID_y+i][TID_x] = idata[index_in+i*width];
    __syncthreads();
    for (int j = 0; j<TILE_DIM; j+=BLOCK_ROWS)
        odata[index_out+j*height] = tile[TID_x][TID_y+j];
}
```
GPU program example

for (int r = 0; r < N; r++) {
    for (int i = 0; i<TILE_DIM; i+=BLOCK_ROWS) {
        tile[0][1] = idata[index_in+i*width];
    }
    __syncthreads();
    for (int j = 0; j<TILE_DIM; j+=BLOCK_ROWS) {
        odata[index_out+j*height] = tile[0][1+j];
    }
}

for (int r = 0; r < N; r++) {
    for (int i = 0; i<TILE_DIM; i+=BLOCK_ROWS) {
        tile[1][0] = idata[index_in+i*width];
    }
    __syncthreads();
    for (int j = 0; j<TILE_DIM; j+=BLOCK_ROWS) {
        odata[index_out+j*height] = tile[1][0+j];
    }
}
GPU data-races

Data-race

- Two threads accessing the same array index concurrently
- At least one thread writing

Data-Race Freedom (DRF) analysis

Show that for all possible inputs and executions a program is absent of data-races.
Exhibits a data-race: the code after `__syncthreads()` of iteration $i + 1$ runs concurrently with the code before `__syncthreads()` of iteration $i$.

- Outer loops is used to measure the benefit of an optimization
- Data-race **corrupts** the data in the array and affects the time measurements
Contributions
Contributions

Practical

• **Faial** implements our analysis
• The largest comparative study of its kind (487 kernels, 5 tools compared)

Theoretical

• A novel analysis of data-race freedom
• A formalization of such analysis using a proof assistant
Practical Contributions
Experiment: Real-World Usability

DRF analysis on real-world kernels
Lowest false-positive rate

- Dataset of 227 data-race free real-world kernels
- Can verify 41% more kernels than others

**Faial** (our tool)

- Correct (C): 95.6% (217)
- False Alarm (F): 4.0% (9)
- Unsupported (U): 0.4% (1)

**GPUVerify**

- Correct (C): 68.3% (155)
- False Alarm (F): 22.0% (50)
- Unsupported (U): 0.4% (1)
- Timeout (T): 9.3% (21)

**PUG**

- Correct (C): 35.2% (80)
- False Alarm (F): 2.6% (6)
- Unsupported (U): 62.1% (141)
- Timeout (T): 9.2% (21)

*Largest correct is better (green)*
Better compromise time/memory

Lower and more frequent is better
Experiment: Scalability

Impact of varying a programming-primitive on the analysis
Highest scalability

- Vary the number of constructs from 1 to 50 (250 kernels in total)
- Out of 5 tools, the only that **scales linearly** (time) (PUG, GPUVerify, GKlee, SESA)
Limitations of our analysis

- Cannot handle more than 13 nested synchronized loops
- 3rd out of 5 tools
- We found a maximum nesting level of 3 in our experiments
Theoretical contributions
Our approach

- A behavioral type (syntax+semantics)
- Results on the correctness of the analysis
- Mechanized proofs using the Coq proof assistant (18,000 LOC)
Simplified running example

- A CUDA example, which simplifies our initial example
- Exhibits the same root cause (data-race)

```c
for (int r = 0; r < N; r++) {
    for (int i = 0; i<M; i++)
        { tile [ tid ] = ... ; }

    __syncthreads();

    for (int j = 0; j<M; j++)
        { ... = tile [ tid+j ]; }
}
```

Checking Data-Race Freedom of GPU Kernels, Compositionally. Cogumbleiro, Lange, Liew, Zicarelli.
Memory access protocols

- Behavioral types for SIMT/SPMD that capture memory accesses
- One type per array. Capture: accesses, synchronization, structured loops
- Distinguish between synchronized/unsynchronized loops

```
for (int r = 0; r < N; r++) {
    for (int i = 0; i<M; i++)
        { tile [tid] = ... ;
        syncthreads();
    for (int j = 0; j<M; j++)
        { ... = tile [tid+j];}
}
```

```
for^S r in 0..N {
    for^u i in 0..M { wr[tid] }
    sync;
    for^u j in 0..M { rd[tid + j] }
}
```
The data-race

```
for^S r in 0..N {
  for^U i in 0..M { wr[tid] }
  sync;
  for^U j in 0..M { rd[tid + j] }
}

// r = 0
for^U i in 0..M { wr[tid] } (loop 1)

// r = 1
for^U i in 0..M { wr[tid] } (loop 1)
```

Cogumbreiro, Lange, Liew, Zicarelli.
Proving that a data-race exists

Racy protocol

for^U j in 0..M { rd[tid + j] } (loop 2)
for^U i in 0..M { wr[tid] } (loop 1)

Our approach

\[ \forall j_1, i_1, j_2, i_2: 0 \leq j_1 < M \land 0 \leq i_1 < M \land 0 \leq j_2 < M \land 0 \leq i_2 < M \implies \{ rd[t_1 + j_1] \} \cup \{ wr[t_1] \} \cup \{ rd[t_2 + j_2] \} \cup \{ wr[t_2] \} \]

- Interpret unsynchronized loops as forall-binders:
  - compare one iteration of each loop of each thread
  - collapses all the iterations of a single loop into one

- **One formula per thread**
- **Data-race conditions:** \( t_1 = 0, t_2 = 1, j_1 = 1, M > 1 \): \( rd[1] \) and \( wr[1] \)
Aligning protocols

- We define a notion of **aligned** protocols, where accesses do not "leak" across iterations.
- We show that all protocols can be aligned (modulo notion of well-formedness).
- **Intuition:** unfold loop and rearrange accesses.

```
for^S r in 0..N {
    for^U i in 0..M { wr[tid] }
    sync;
    for^U j in 0..M { rd[tid + j] }
}
```

```
for^U i in 0..M { wr[tid] }
sync;
for^S r in 1..N {
    for^U j in 0..M { rd[tid + j] }
    for^U i in 0..M { wr[tid] }
    sync;
    for^U j in 0..M { rd[tid + j] }
```
Compositional analysis

Checking Data-Race Freedom of GPU Kernels, Compositionally. Cogumbreiro, Lange, Liew, Zicarelli.

\[
\forall r, j_1, i_1, j_2, i_2: \ 1 \leq r < N \land 0 \leq j_1 < M \land 0 \leq i_1 < M \land 0 \leq j_2 < M \land 0 \leq i_2 < M
\]

\[
\rightarrow \{ rd[t_1 + j_1] \} \cup \{ wr[t_1] \} \quad DRF \ with? \quad \{ rd[t_2 + j_2] \} \cup \{ wr[t_2] \}
\]
Conclusion
Conclusion

- Behavioral types being used to enforce data-race freedom
- A compositional analysis, formally proved
- Large experimental evaluation (229 real-world + 258 synthetic = 487 kernels)
- Used our tool to confirm data-races found in the wild
- Our approach is more scalable and more precise (fewer false-positives) than related work
- Source code and proofs available in a free software license

| Artifact: | DOI:10.5281/zenodo.4711923 |
|-----------|------------------------------|
| Tool:     | [https://gitlab.com/umb-svl/faial](https://gitlab.com/umb-svl/faial) |
| Proofs:   | [https://gitlab.com/umb-svl/faial-coq](https://gitlab.com/umb-svl/faial-coq) |