Naturalization of Masculinism: How Female Journalist Leaders in Local Media Resist it

Sunarto

Abstract

The number of male journalists still dominates the media industries, either print or electronic. This phenomenon also happens in local print media. This research focuses on female journalists’ experiences as an editorial management staff of a local print media in Semarang. This research has a main objective to describe significances of the female journalists’ experiences. This qualitative descriptive research used a critical constructionism paradigm as a general guidance to the whole research processes with a critical phenomenological research design. A gender structuration theory was used to understand the phenomenon. Research subjects were four female journalists of a local print media in Semarang who were chosen purposively. All subjects were editorial management staff. Data was analyzed by phenomenological procedures. The result showed that a naturalization of masculinism process took place on female journalist in a local media as part of daily professional activities. All female journalists had to absorb masculinism values as media culture such as courageous, independent, responsible, taking risk, leadership and getting perfection in their professional activities as part of their new personal attribute. Although female journalist adopted the masculinism values such as leadership in the editorial management, they applied female journalism values to be resistant to the dominant ideology. It is suggested to develop internal media policy which can be conducive to female journalists to improve naturally in egalitarian organization.

Kata kunci/Keywords:

Jurnalistik, Wanita, Maskulinisme, Gender, Kepemimpinan

Journalism, Women, Masculinism, Gender, Leadership

INTRODUCTION

The number of female journalists in the media industry is not that high. This industry is still dominated by male journalist (Sunarto, 2014, 2019). Quantitatively, more male journalists hold top positions in editorial management than female journalists. Editorial board of a local and national newspaper shows that many men hold the top management positions than women. It can be seen on data in table 1.
The remaining positions are slotted for male employees (Stellarosa and Silaban, 2018).

AJI’s 2015 report describes that the welfare of female journalists in Indonesia is still far from expectation. Female journalist’s welfare in media is one level under their male counterpart. One of its indications is many media list their female journalists’ marital status as single although they have married and had children. As a consequence, some of female journalist’s rights are not fulfilled, such as a right for family benefit and health insurance for husband and children, even though they have same jobs and responsibilities as male journalists in newsroom. This discrimination in welfare happens because many media companies use Law Number 1/1974 on Marriage to calculate salary for their female workers, instead of Law Number 13/2003 on Labour which does not contain any gender discrimination to fulfill workers’ normative rights (Beritasatu, 2020).

This condition seems to show gender inequality in the print and electronic media. This phenomenon does not comply with Article 281 of the Amendment of the 1945 Constitution, which states that everyone has a right to free of discrimination treatment based on anything and get protection from any discriminative treatment. This value is also relevant with Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women of the United Nations which has been ratified by our government as a national law, namely Law No.7/1984 (Anonymous, 2004).

The phenomenon raises a question related to the essence of women’s experience as journalist and member of editorial management in local media, especially when they are assigned as a leader of certain unit. What is the essence of female journalist leader in local media?

There are many studies related to women leadership in many organizations. Dartningsih and Julijanti (2009) carried out a research on female leadership in government bureau in Bangkalan Madura District. She found that there were 3,932,766 civil servant officers in Indonesia and the number of female workers was only 1,478,719 persons (37.6 percent). The rest of them were male workers. Female civil servant officers in Madura experienced discrimination in mobility promotion. Because of their gender, female officers in Bangkalan might not be promoted as Head of Department. Such condition makes the female officers do not have any ambition to achieve se-

---

| GENDER | LOCAL PAPER | BUSINESS | SUB TOTAL | NATIONAL PAPER | BUSINESS | SUB TOTAL | TOTAL |
|--------|-------------|----------|-----------|----------------|----------|-----------|-------|
|        | CEO Central |          |           | CEO Central |          |           |       |
| Man    | 4           | 51       | 113       | 9             | 14       | 74        | 3      |
| Woman  | 1           | 13       | 16        | 1             | 1        | 42        | 0      |
| TOTAL  | 5           | 64       | 129       | 10            | 15       | 116       | 44     |

Source: List of workers Suara Merdeka (Januari 21, 2020:6) and Kompas (January 21, 2020:6&11)
nior-level position in government bureaucracy.

Similar findings were found by Dartiningisih and Julijanti when Riauawati (2009) researched about women's leadership in political domain in North Maluku. She found that there was a gender bias in political domain at the region. All political positions are dominated by men whether they are executive (Governor, Major/Head of District, Head of Sub-district, Head of Village), judicative (Head of High Court, District Court, Head of District Prosecutor General), and legislative (Head of Political Party, member of Regional People's House of Representative) positions. Domination of patriarchal culture causes a condition where many men and women do not have any gender consciousness to share equal position to both gender in the region.

Jatiningsih (2009) in her study showed that there was a glass ceiling phenomenon in state schools in Surabaya for female headmasters to achieve their position. This phenomenon describes that it seems there are no obstacles for women to achieve top position in organization's management. However, in reality there are "barriers" which stop them to get the position. The reality creates many challenges for women to actualize their vision to be a leader in an organization. The challenge might come from their gender, race, ethnicity, religion, and others. Women in organization often meet this condition. Jellal, Nordman and Wolff (2006) said the same thing. According to them, glass ceiling is an invisible barrier which inhibits promotion opportunities for women, but not for men, and it prevents women from reaching top positions. Ammer in Jatiningsih (2009) stated that it was a discriminatory barrier to the advancement of women into the upper echelons of business, professions, and government.

Other studies on media organization show the same phenomenon. Simon and Hoyt's (2012) research found that exposure to media images in countering stereotypical roles could help to destroy firm gender stereotypes and gender role beliefs. Consequently, these images can help to reduce the perceived congruency between women and leadership and protect women against negative responses in the leadership.

It occurs because media images portray men and women almost exclusively in traditional gender roles, which differentially attribute men to workers and high-status roles and women to homemakers and low-status roles. These media images distribute both beliefs and expectations of the gender and leadership role, and not surprisingly, these expectations and beliefs can have intense effects on how women notice themselves. Geis, Brown, Walstedt, and Porter (in Simon and Hoyt, 2012) found that women who viewed traditional commercials mentioned more about homemaking than achievements compared to men in the same condition. On the other hand, women who view commercials with female and male actors in reverse roles have more aspirations for achievement than women in the traditional condition. Consistent with research exploring the impressionability of gender role beliefs and behavior, other research show that seemingly rigid gender role beliefs can be changed by exposure to different media images.

Beam and Di Cicco (2010) studied about content of small daily newspapers at different time—before and after a woman substituted a man as managing editor. The results were then compared with content changes of "matched" papers at which a man was managing editor for both points in time. The mix of topics that the newspapers covered changed a little across time for both groups of publications. However, the types of articles changed for the papers at which women became managing editors. The emphasis on feature approaches to the news improved, and standard hard news weakened.

In their research about the characteristics of 814 female and male Pulitzer Prize winners from 1917 to 2010, Volz and Lee (2013) borrowed the "compensation model" from political science to study the topic. They showed that female winners were more likely to have a metropolitan background, journalism major, and graduate degree. These differences manifest the logic of compensation: some forms of social capital could be important for female journalists to affect gender disadvantage in contesting for recognition. The compensational model, however, was historically dependent. In more recent years, women journalists no longer need the compensational capital to increase their chances.

Everbach (2006) studied about case study of a U.S. newspaper led by an all-female management team and he found that the culture of the newsroom reflected the so-called "feminine" traits of its leaders. Through qualitative, ethnographic methods of interview and observation, the researcher recognized ways that the female managers brought feminine perspectives to the workplace. Family-friendly policies, openness, teamwork, and communication, identified by management and communication scholars as feminine characteristics, were trademarks of the newspaper's culture.

Correa and Harp (2011) studied about how female journalists affect news content when holding positions of power, reaching a critical mass in the newsroom, and covering an issue that appeals to them. The study compared a male-dominated news organization's coverage of the human papilloma virus (HPV) vaccine with reportage by a more gender-balanced organization in terms of news executives and reporters. It also explored whether content created by female reporters from both organizations differed. The more gender-balanced organization reported the vaccine more frequently and more significantly, and used more varied themes than its colleague. The content produced by female reporters at different outlets also diverged.

Seshu (2014) reported that discrimination in the types of work assigned to female journalists, promotional opportunities, sexual harassment, lack of maternity benefits and poor support conditions for working mothers were all part of the familiar stories communicated by female journalists across South Asian countries. At another level, the representation of women in the media in all South Asian countries is distorted towards celebrity-driven, sex and scandal-prone coverage. As traditional forces fight with the 'modern', the
struggle to provide non-sexist and non-discriminatory coverage of women and women's issues is dominant and becomes important in situations of conflict and violence. Yet, there are a number of female journalists who still struggle to get the story and for fair and gender-sensitive reportage. They put their lives at risk and attempt to expose different and more humane dimensions of the conflict they cover, seeking to speak to women survivors to find another story. They learn to survive with courage among great chances.

All these studies show how dynamic activities of women in media or non-media organizations meet many challenges to run their leadership in organization. There are seen and unseen obstacles that may prevent them to achieve organizational goals. Do female journalist leaders in local media also meet these obstacles? This paper will explore this issue elaborately.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Gender structuration theory in critical constructionism paradigm (Lincoln and Guba, 2000, 2005; Heiner, 2006) was used to understand this phenomenon. The main idea in the paradigm explores the construction of social problem which is determined by an elite group in society. To support its interest this group often distorts reality which is consonant with their interest. The group consists of male journalists and media owners. They are the dominant groups in society which determine the construction of reality.

Meanwhile, when we are talking about gender structuration theory, we are talking about processes of social system production and reproduction, such as gender relation through rules and resources owned by actors (men and women) in social interaction. This theory was developed by combining structuration theory (Giddens, 1986a; Giddens, 1986b) and gender theory (Wolffensperger, 1991; Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006).

Production activities are related to creating something which does not exist before. For instance, rule is created to free a journalist to get advertising from his/her resources as multitasking function. Reproduction activities concern with doing same thing routinely. For instance, the journalist performs multitasking as a new routine custom in order to support the economy situation of their media.

Other concepts to elaborate are rules and resources. Rules concern with interpretive schemas or stock of knowledge owned by the actor, such as degree of education as a proof of mastering certain knowledge. Norms concern about conventions recognized by the actor in society. Person who breaks the norms will be given social punishment by the society, such as exclusion or ostracization. A female journalist must obey her husband as a head of her household. It is an example of social norm in the society to be followed by women working as a journalist or not.

Resources focus on facilities whether material or immaterial which are owned by an actor or agent to influence others in social interaction. There are two kinds of facilities, namely allocative which related with economical matters such as capital and authoritative that related with political matters such as political position or organizational position.

Element of rules in gender structuration theory will constrain an actor to interact with others. The limitation of knowledge and norm will restrain actors to influence others. In the contrary, actors who own resources will enable to influence others as they want.

Both of elements occupy as modality to the actor. An actor who has much of knowledge as an interpretation schema will master stucture of signification in communication interaction. Meanwhile, an actor who knows much more about social norms will master structure of legitimation in sanction interaction. Structure of domination will be mastered by an actor who has much more allocative and authoritative facilities in power interaction.

In structure of gender, sex as modality of actors is mastered by male actors who use violence in interaction to comply with female actors. This condition produces inequal social position to the female actors in the society. Its consequence causes the male actors dominate the female actors in the society. It is why media industries is called as men's sites because this industry is dominated by male journalists in many editorial positions.

It may be understood when construction of reality through publishing of information is determined by male actors. It implies that discourse of media industries is dominated by ideologies of patriarchy and capitalism (Sunarto, 2009). The ideology hides in structure of domination, signification, and legitimation through the use of interpretation schema, norm, and facilities to be mastered by the male journalists as universal interest and natural condition in interaction of communication, power, and sanction with the female journalists. An unequal gender relation is familiarized as a normal condition. It is called as naturalization of gender relation (reification). The process of gender naturalization according to Connel (1987) follows two elements namely politization of gender relation and purification of gender cognition.

Politization of gender relation shows how practices of ideology constantly ignore biological facts through simplification, schematization and moralization. There is opinion in the society that women are emotional because their brain's volume is just little. This simplification delete the reality that not only women may be emotional person but also men. It is an example of simplification. Schematization may be found on separation of public domain for men as workers and domestic domain for women as homemakers. This belief ignores reality that there are many women who work in public domain as workers. Mean-

13
while, moralization defines good women and bad women based on men’s interests. Women become good person when they obey and behave according to the men’s standards and become bad one when they violate the standards.

Furification of gender cognition confirms gender role stereotype through mass media. Besides, it also happens through exclusion and marginalization, and public-private domain dichotomy through romance for women to find true love and heroism for men to use violence.

It seems for female journalists to survive and be successful in media industry, they will depend on their ability to adapt with dominant ideology. Masculinization of female journalists seem to be substantive experience that must be undertook by female journalists. Naturalization of masculinism as a normal personal attribute becomes essential experience for female journalists.

Why did this research use gender structuration theory as a guidance of research’s result? As part of political economy theory of media in critical paradigm, structuration was an entry point to understand the phenomenon (Mosco, 2009). Like Golding and Murdock said (1991; 1995), political economy theory of media has two perspectives, namely liberal and critical.

Liberal perspective sees media as economical institution whose function is to get benefit financially. It focuses on exchange in the market as consumers choose between competing commodities on the basis of utility and satisfaction they offer. In Adam Smith’s term, it is referred to as a hidden hand of “free competition”. It emphasizes on the sovereign individuals of capitalism. It assumes that public intervention must be minimized and market forces are given the widest possible freedom of operation. In practice, media must be freed to get benefit financially as maximum as it can be by selling its information. Any information may be sold provided that it gives any financial benefit to media. Media is liberated to compete with each other in the market.

Meanwhile, critical perspective concerns about the interplay between the symbolic and economic dimensions of media. It assumes a realist conception of the phenomena it studies. It means the theoretical constructs it works with exist in the real world, they are not merely phenomena. It questions action and structure to discern the real constraints which shape the lives and opportunities of real actors in the real world.

Besides, it also assumes a materialist position that focuses on the interaction of people with their material environment and its further concern with the unequal command over material resources and the consequences of such inequality for the nature of the symbolic environment.

It is interested in the investigation and description of late capitalism in its historical context. It means to understand this perspective historically we have to understand the growth of the media, the extention of corporate reach, commodification of cultural life, and the changing role of the state and government intervention.

Critical perspective sees domination of corpora-
tion to the cultural landscape in two ways. First-
ly, an increasing proportion of cultural production is directly accounted for by major conglomerates with interests in a range of sectors from newspaper and magazines, to television, film, music and theme parks. Secondly, corporations which are not directly involved in the cultural industries as producers can employ considerable control over the direction of cultural activity through their role as advertisers and sponsors.

Critical political economy perspective concerns with balance between capitalist enterprise and public intervention. It shows the distortions and inequalities of market system and argues that these deficiencies can only be corrected by public intervention though they disagree on the forms that this should take. According to this perspective, the history of the modern communication media is not only an economic history of their growing incorporation into a capitalist economic system, but also a political history of their increasing centrality to the exercise of full citizenship. This conditions allow people to become full members of the society at every level (public sphere). In this condition, people may access information and possible range of information.

This perspective goes beyond technical issues of efficiency to engage with basic moral questions of justice, equity and public good. According to this perspective, market is not simply as more efficient, but as morally superior, because it gives consumers a free choice between competing commodities: only those goods that provided satisfaction would survive. In sphere of culture, it needs public intervention to increase the level of public knowledge and provide health entertainment. This perspective has three variants to understand the media industry, namely instrumentalism, structuralism, and constructivism (structuration) (Golding and Murdock, 1991; Murdock and Golding, 1995). Instrumentalism focuses on the ways that capitalists use their economic power with a commercial market system to ensure that the flow of public information is consonant with their interests. It sees the privately owned media as instruments of class domination. In our country, several party leader who own group of media use their media to support their interests economically and politically.

Structuralism focuses on the nature and sources of the limits of owners, advertisers and key political personnel to control media. It sees media company in Indonesia as part of global economy media industry which can be controlled by capitalism.

Constructivism (structuration) sees structure as dynamic formations which constantly reproduce and alter through practical action. It analyzes the way that meaning is made and re-made through the concrete activities of producers and
consumers.

The last variant is seen as suitable perspective when it is combined with gender perspective to understand female journalist phenomenon in local media industry since it shows the dynamic of gender interaction in the media praxis.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research used a “critical phenomenology design” in descriptive qualitative approach. It was based on Moustakas’s phenomenology design (1994) which was applied in critical perspective. If Moustakas’s design focused on any individual’s experiences, the new design focused on marginal individual’s experiences. In this case, female journalists were considered as marginal individual. It used perspective of woman to understand her experience as a journalist in a man’s site.

This design, more or less, had the same assumption with the critical phenomenology of Melancon. As an attitude, according to Melancon (2014), critical phenomenology assumes social facts appear as a variation of a single life of which our own is also a part, and that any other is for us another ourselves, another way to be ourselves. Critical phenomenology is the reflection on our situation and those of the people who surround us by the constant confrontation of what unites and separates us, from our body to our most abstract thoughts. It is a radical attempt to understand our lives through those of others. Shortly, it is a way to find ourselves in others and others in ourselves.

In order to understand the phenomenon, it was applied to four subjects of an iconic local print media in Semarang, Central Java, Indonesia. They were interviewed in depth to get data related to their experiences when they performed their occupation as journalist which is a part of the editorial management team.

Data was analyzed by transcendental phenomenological procedures (Moustakas, 1994) through describing epoch process, reducing transcendental phenomenology, imaginative variations, synthesis of meaning and essence.

Epoch processes focuses on marginalizing pre-judgments of phenomena to be studied in order to release the study from early concepts, beliefs and knowledge of the phenomena, experiences and previous professional studies. This process makes the process to be really open, receptive and naïve in catching and listening experiences of the participants about the phenomenon studied.

Reducing transcendental phenomenology is related to analysis of the participants’ stories through bracketing the topic or question (focus of study is bracketed and anything outside of the study is sidelined, so all research processes are only rooted on the topic and research questions), horizontalization (arrangement process of the participants’ statements to find certain horizon or textural meanings), delimited horizons or meaning (deleting the participants’ irrelevant statements), invariant qualities and themes (grouping horizons on coherent elements and themes), individual textural description (integrating elements and textural themes), and composite textural description (integrating all textural to general textural description).

Imaginative variations focuses on looking for possible meaning by using imagination, polarities and reversals to close phenomena from different perspective, position, role and function. It is aimed to find structural description of experiences and underlying factors to explain how about what. This process may be done by varying possible meaning (differentiating possible meaning that might be appeared), varying perspectives of the phenomenon (distinguishing perspectives from different point of view), freeing fantasy variations (considering freely the qualities or possible structural dynamics to be found in textural qualities), constructing a list of structural qualities of the experience (creating list of structural qualities that appear), developing structural themes (grouping structural qualities in certain themes), employing universal structures as themes (using general structure as a theme), describing individual structure (uniting structural qualities and themes of each participant in an individual structural description and describing narratively causal factors that underlie each participant’s experiences), and compositing structural description (uniting all individual structural descriptions in a general structural description of experience and describing narratively combination of all participants’ structural description).

Synthesis of meaning and essence described is related to the unification of reflective-intuitively combination of textural and structural descriptions to create a synthesis of meaning and essence of phenomenon or experience.

In most qualitative studies, central importance is given to the research participants’ stories which are particular, contextual and timely, rather than universal, general and timeless. Given the feminist principles that the personal and political factors are intrinsically linked, and that participants’ stories and voices are of paramount importance in any research document, qualitative research methodologies are therefore particularly well suited to studies that are conducted from feminist perspectives (Dukas, 2014, pp. 36-37).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

In general, the research result shows that the female journalists in local media have experienced the naturalization of masculinism consiously and unconsciously from the beginning of their career in journalism. Women’s journalism was applied to resist the dominant gender ideology in newsroom.

Masculinism rhythms and values such as courageous, independent, responsible, taking risk, leadership, problem solver, and getting perfection influenced female journalist as a consequence of their occupation. They had to work like men jour-
nalist who seemed to have no limitation of time. Anytime they had to be ready for the news covering assignment. From the beginning they had to follow all rules to join in media activities. The number of women who enrolled the position was limited compared to male candidates. It also happened when they chased their career. There was little number of women who might be positioned in the editorial management. Unfortunately, it seemed there was unwillingness of male journalist to be commanded by their female colleagues. Female journalists who hold a position as a leader of certain editorial unit try to develop women’s journalism in their professional activities to defend women’s interests.

There are several issues to be discussed based on the result related to naturalization of masculinism to female journalists and its implication to their leadership capacities. In addition, the paper will elaborate the issue of feminist journalism as a basis of the female journalists’ experience when they apply leadership capacities obtained from masculinism. It serves as a basis of the female journalists’ struggle to show their interest and existence in local media.

Masculinism as Media Culture in Newsroom

Newsroom as a center of journalism activities in media organization becomes the center for the naturalization of masculinism to female journalists. It was described by a participant.

“When I join this media as a journalist, there are many experiences that influence my life, such as I am becoming a brave and independent person not like before. Being in the middle of mass demonstration on certain conflict does not make me scared to cover the story. The same goes for disaster issues, like fire, flood, and others. I also become much more active to take initiatives than before when I am doing my job as a journalist,” said a participant who held a position as a Head of Regional Desk.

Other participant described her experience like this. “I am working in international news department. I have to go to work on afternoon and go home at midnight or early morning everyday. I have to adapt with news custom which is unusual. I’ll be at home from morning until afternoon and at night I’ll be at work. I am used to sleep in early morning.”

Meanwhile, a participant mentioned explicitly the influence of masculinism as a dominant gender in her daily activities as a journalist. “Working in a newspaper has different rhythm. We have to be ready for 24-hour work. Anytime when I am needed. It is a contract which cannot be negotiated. This condition cannot make me to be a spoli person. The dynamic rhythm of working hour pushes me to be a person who can expertly arrange the time for family, work, and other activities. On the other side, working climate which is masculine and full of competition makes me, unconsciously, to be masculine. I always feel as a person who can solve all problems by myself. I become an independent person in anything. Sometimes this condition make me forget that there are many person in my environment that need to be listened”.

As women, the participants have personal attitude as ordinary women in society. The attitude changes from time to time when they become journalist. They embrace new attitude that comes from men’s customs as normal. They have to accept the attitude because they have no choice as new workers if they want to survive in the media company. They have to adapt to the attitude because it fits the media industry. Female journalists have to transform their feminine attitude to masculine one. They already have known that media industry is male site. To survive they have to adapt to masculine values. Connel (1987) called this process as naturalization of masculinism. It happens through politization of gender relation and purification of gender cognition (Connel, 1987).

Politization of gender relation happens when female journalists adapt themselves in men’s working rhythm and values to be accepted in professional relation. They change their emotional attitude to be rational one. They adapt men’s leadership. It is simplification. When they follow the working rhythm, they involve in schematization process to change their original domain in domestic with a new one. Moralization happens when they act as good worker to be professional through following masculinism values. Meanwhile, purification of gender cognition takes place when they are conditioned to accept masculinism values as the only values which must be used in their daily live as journalist.

In Giddens’s term, what the female journalist did is called as rationalization of action (1986a; 1986b). It is women’s competency to have clear basis for every of their action so they may give a logical explanation for every action they did. In many interactions this process is a basis evaluation for others to evaluate women’s competency. Rationalization of action depends on stocks of knowledge or mutual knowledge which is owned by actors in interaction. In our case, when all female journalists joined the media for the first time, they were trained by senior male journalists on how to act as a journalist. It was a part of creating mutual knowledge among them. It is a practical knowledge that must be applied in daily live as a journalist when they want to survive in the professional world. Survival seems as a reason for female journalists to keep involved in the profession. It is part of motivation that push the female journalist to act like they did.

Being natural may happen when something new and uncommon are to be done routinely in daily activities as a rationalization of action. It is like working rhythm. It is common for workers to work in the morning until the afternoon. However, this custom may be not relevant with media
routine due to its deadline standard. Information as source of news may come anytime so all journalists must always be ready to be assigned to get the information whenever it happens prior to the deadline. It is just one example of masculinism values that must be adopted by female journalists.

They need certain values such as tough, brave, independent, leadership, problem solver, taking risk, and creative in order to carry out their activities. It is all part of the masculinism values. Richmond-Abbott (1992) said that society has cultural expectation which is attributable to men and women's attitudes and behaviors. Sexual biological factor such as maleness or femaleness is used to construct a social category such as masculinity for men and femininity for women. It is actualized in gender-role stereotypes.

Stereotype is a simple description about certain group in society. In this category, men have certain personal attributes and behaviors to act like men. It also happens to women who have different personal attributes and behavior. This stereotype is important in the society to be used as a basis to define certain common interaction among each other. This stereotype is maintained by communication mechanism in all levels and contexts and attached in the societal structures, such as family, religion, system of education, economics, and politics.

Those attributes which are attached to men, namely strength, hiding feeling, macho, masculinity action, being a leader, aggressive, ambitious, analytic, athletic, competitive, defending belief, dominant, free, individualistic, easy to make decision, self-confidence, independent, strong personality, able to be responsible, and taking risk. Meanwhile, women have personal attributes such as attractive, feminine, smart, sensitive, emotional, full of affection, cheerful, love children, not speaking abusive language, big desire to sooth hurt feeling, praise, gentle, easy to be cheated, loyal, sensitive to others' needs, shy, soft spoken, sympathetic, patient, emphatic, friendly, compassionate (Unger & Crawford, 1992).

Basically, there are no personal attributes such as tough, independent, creative, being a leader, taking risk which are constructed to be relevant to women in the society. However, when entering the media industry, women must adapt herself to such attributes in order to survive in the organization. Her failure to adapt with the attributes may make her to be ostracized from the journalistic profession.

Does it mean media company only fit for men? I think media as an institution is free for anyone to work in it. It is a matter of adaptability with the culture of the institution (Miller, 2015). According to Miller, organization as culture is a site of interlinked beliefs, values, behaviors and artifacts. Due to its operation, it seems media only suitable for men. It is a reason why media called as men's sites. However, men or women who work in media should accept same treatment. When female journalists may reach senior level in management, it is because of their capabilities to adapt to the culture. It is similar to the research participants' experience. All of them might get a position in management was based on their achievement as a worker.

The participants' experience was also experienced by some of female journalists in some media companies in Indonesia whether they held a position in the management or not in their media company. They said that their company gave same opportunities for female and male journalists to develop their skill professionally and get a position in the management. It depends on the journalist's individual achievement to get benefit from the opportunities (Luviana, 2012).

These informants adapted consciously and unconsciously to masculinism values as media culture to make them not just survive but also able to reach a high position in the management (Keller, 2015). This takes place through their practical and discursive consciousness. One of the values is related to the leadership. Social constructionism does not place leadership as a personal attribute to women. This attribute is learned and adapted by women when they get in the media organization as a journalist. The problem is when female journalist may adapt to the media culture, their male counterparts question about their capabilities to apply it. They do not believe to female journalist's leadership competency to lead them. It should not happen when there is no gender bias in the society which is caused by patriarchism and capitalism (Tong, 1989; Krolokke & Sorensen, 2006).

Female Journalist Leadership Styles in Newsroom

There is a finding which shows how male journalists do not believe female journalist as their leader. A participant said that there were many male journalists underestimated female journalist to be their leader. They belittled the female journalist's abilities to lead male journalists.

“They assume that female journalists are difficult to be organized and like to complain. It seems they do not want to be led by female journalists. They feel that they have to hold higher position than female journalists. I often overhear this statement from my male colleagues,” said the participant who held a position as Head of International Desk.

Other participant who held a position as Economic Desk Editor stated that she once misjudged by her male counterparts related to her position.

“There are many people who do not have any position in the management, usually men, being appreciated, but a person like me who holds a certain position, is being underestimated. They have perception that I cannot lead.”

How did female journalists respond to their environment which did not support their position.
in the management? There were several strategies which could be applied by female journalists as leader to manage their position. A participant took certain social distance and routinely shared information to her male counterpart. Increasing professional competency and being educator for their environment were done by other participant. There was a participant who chose to be problem solver.

“In my position as journalist and leader, I want to be problem solver for my environment. I want to help others to solve their problem. However, there are many of my male counterparts judge me negatively about this. I don’t take it seriously. It is just their perception. I don’t want to be disturbed about that. I give it all to God’s wishes,” said a participant convincingly.

What female journalist leader did to respond to their environment directs us to leadership styles. When we are talking about women’s leadership, we are talking about the capacities of women to influence others (member of organization) to achieve organizational goals. It may be done by interacting, motivating, training and solving problem that faced by subordinates or members of organization (Hughes, Ginnett and Curphy, 2012; Northhouse, 2013). In doing these activities there are several leadership styles, namely X type, Y type, autocratic, laissez-faire, and democratic that may be applied (Gamble and Gamble, 2005).

Firstly, X style of leadership is characterized by a leader who cannot trust subordinates and does not concern with their personal achievements. Secondly, Y style is focused on trust of leader to the subordinates and concerns to personal feeling and achievement of the subordinates. Thirdly, authoritarian style is characterized by domination of leader to determine all policies and give orders to all members of organization. Finally, laissez-faire style is demonstrated by giving freedom to subordinates to do their jobs. This kind of leader leaves their subordinates alone. Democratic style emphasizes on involvement of leader and subordinates in all decision making processes in the organization. This style mixes the authoritarian and laissez-faire styles.

How is the leadership in the media industry? There are four models of leadership in the media management, namely the way model, inspire a shared vision model, challenge the process and enable others to act model, and encourage the heart model (Herrick, 2003).

The way model is like role model. It is done by harmonizing personal values with speaking and acting in the organizational daily life. A leader must be a role model to have a certain consistent attitude between speaking and acting in organizational activities. Inspire a shared vision model concerns with conditioning of the organization’s future through interesting imagination and possibilities to reach the future by asking others to share and get in the vision.

Challenge the process and enable others to act model focuses on searching opportunities through innovative ways for transformation, growth and progression. It also focuses on encouraging to take risk for progression through little winning and learning for past mistakes. Encourage the heart model is related to creating collaboration through pushing to achieve objectives together and building trust in organizational members. This model empowers others through sharing power and discretion.

According to Rosener (Gamble and Gamble, 2005), leadership style of female leader focuses more on sharing of power and information. This style is close to democratic style of leadership or encourage the heart model in Herrick’s term. In this model, a female leader interacts more often with her subordinates, pushes them to participate and shows them how to achieve personal goals together with organizational goals. This style was confirmed by Rosenthal and colleagues’s study (Kaye, 1994). Their study found, without considering root of ethnicity and culture, that women were more superior compared to men in interpreting non-verbal cues of others, especially negative non-verbal cues. It is a part of feminist leadership.

Feminist leadership, according to Humm (1989), is similar to the revolutionary leadership of Paulo Freire. It is a leadership process which involves the leader in a process of dialogic education. This kind of leadership assumes continuous interaction between a leader and other subordinates. The result of this interaction will create conducive working climate to cultivate personal happiness as an important basis to achieve organizational goals. Feminist leadership is an active form of leadership. It is a process where a leader is an arranger for others, responsible for activities or carrier of experience. This leadership style aims to keep a spirit of women’s movement and creates spiritual bonding among women. Everbach (2006) stated that the feminist leadership seemed to be filled by feminine traits. It is something that refers to women’s journalism.

Women’s Journalism: Female Journalist’s Essential Resistance to Masculinism

The existence of female journalists in local media gives certain colour related to the women’s interests. A participant who held a title of a Head of Regional Desk tried to maximize women’s interests in her desk through selecting source of news, editing news which was friendly to women’s interests, and creating a rubric that supported the women’s interests.

“My interaction in the journalistic world made me aware about the importance of information to the society. I think through publishing of writings I want to educate the society and make life better in the future, especially for women. We try to make news related to women or programmes that inspire women. I want to empower women through writings in my paper”, said the informant.
She believed that she made changes in newsroom. It could be seen when her male colleagues asked her about ideas or issues for women rubrication. Due to her gender, her colleagues assumed she knew everything about women and their interests. For her responsibility, she often programmed news for women, such as promoting female politician or businesswomen. She wanted the information which might inspire and empower other women in the society.

“As an editor, I often edit news of sexual crimes which were written by male journalist to be friendly to women and protect women's interests in the news. I change the vulgar writing that may insult and downgrade women to be soft writing which defends women's interests. For instance, I delete the detail of sexual crime chronology and develop the writing that protect victim's future to get fairness and justice. In my opinion, media must be informative and compassionate to inform, educate and empower women,” said the informant about her inspiration to protect women's concerns.

She recognized that she was aware for defending women's interests from editorial policies and women literature activities through reading books or joining seminars and discussions. “I have a strong belief that a good writing to educate society, especially to defend, protect, and empower women, may be best produced by women themselves,” she emphasized.

Other participant stated that she wanted to be a mediator for society and its many elements to help them aware about anything happened in the world. “I want to be a bridge for people who have many information and others who do not have an opportunity to get one. It may be poor people, women and others who do not have any chance to reach it. I want to make the people aware about anything occur in their environment to encourage and support them to empower themselves. With my position as a journalist I can do that. I can write many information to defend the interest”.

Participant who started her career as a translator in international desk thanked God because she got an opportunity to be a journalist. “I have formal educational background. When conducting my job as a journalist I can educate many people through my writing. They may be women or others whom need to be informed about something important in their life”.

The participant’s description about their experience shows how female journalist leader defends women’s interests in the media policy and product. It is relevant to what Lueck and Chang (2002) about women's journalism. According to Lueck and Chang, women’s journalism is a kind of journalistic practices that defend women’s interests. It has several characteristics, namely women speaking in their own voices, media’s role to women, a non-attack approach, and an activist approach.

What the participant did to edit men’s language which is full of vulgarism to be women’s language which is soft and protects women’s future is a kind of example of the first characteristic. It is a voice of women to use soft language to defend women's concerns. The second characteristic may be found when the participant created an article for women and chose women as news sources. Her inspiration that comes from her media policy and existence shows media’s role to empower women. The participants consider themselves as an activist who uses a non-attack approach to literate their organization and society to empower women's interests.

What the participants done is similar to what South Korean female journalists do when they create news that involve women as sources. It was reported by Kim and Yoon (2009) in their study on comparison of news reporting on women’s subject which was written by female and male journalists. The finding showed that in reporting women as Cabinet members in South Korea, female journalists used a more positive tone, stressed conflicting news values less, used fewer stereotypical references to women and employed more gender-sensitive perspectives than male journalists.

Supporting women's interests as a part of women’s journalism can also be found in South Africa. At least this is the finding of Rodny-Gumedé (2015) when he studied about how female journalists used their power in newsroom to determine the content of news that involved women.

It shows that there is a perception that gender equity in the South African news media has improved and the power female journalists hold in the newsroom is equal to their male counterparts. These perceptions might be attributed to the fact that South African news media have reached near gender equality in terms of the workforce. However, the question is whether this translates into women having equal power to influence news agendas and to the extent of the broader public discourse. Through interviews with journalists from a cross-section of the South African English and Afrikaans-language media, the study found that although gender equity in the workforce had improved, female journalists did not think they had the same power to change news agendas as their male counterparts. Furthermore, it also found that although women and men often covered similar beats and stories, they stressed different story angles and also articulated their role in society differently.

The important purpose to place more women in the newsroom is to change news orientation and eliminate gender bias, which was stressed by Ross (2001). She showed that female journalists in the United Kingdom suggested that gender was important in the newsroom for women but not for others and its impact was often felt in negative ways. When the media industry is dominated by men, the low priority is given to cover women’s issues and can be hostile to women with family responsibilities. Most of the female journalists
believe that more women in decision-making positions will have a positive effect on developing a more women-friendly news agenda.

CONCLUSION

Naturalization of masculinism seems inevitable for women to join in local media industry as journalists. It happens through politization of gender relation and purification of gender cognition.

Politization of gender relation stresses on ignoring biological facts through simplification, schematization and moralization. Meanwhile, purification of gender cognition manifests through confirming gender role stereotype in media with exclusion and marginalization of women. Besides, it also establishes by creating separation of public and private domain for men and women. In public domain men are positioned as workers and hero. In the meantime, women are placed in domestic domain as homemakers and searcher of true love from their spouse.

Women must absorb and adapt to masculine values such as courage, independent, leadership, responsibility, taking risk, and getting perfection to survive in the media industry. It has implications for female journalists to perform like men to fulfill their obligation as journalists. It seems the media industry as men’s site has consequences to women to transform themselves to be masculine.

Nevertheless, when female journalists act as a leader in the editorial management to manage their team, their competence to command is impugned by their male counterpart. They are often underestimated by male journalists to have no competence to lead and easy to be distraught. Leadership as a strategic tool to influence others to achieve organizational goals together should be supported by all members of the organization. Moreover, female journalists can be a leader based on their achievement. They are selected together with male journalists. They also apply democratic model to lead their team related to sharing of power and information with their subordinates. However, in fact, not all male journalists support them.

As a leader, female journalists often perform media policy and content as an instrument for empowering women’s concerns. They perform women’s journalism as certain values to challenge male culture in the newsroom. Developing female programmes, choosing women as sources, editing vulgarism to soft language, creating women’s issues, and educating organizational and societal environment to be friendly for women’s interests are some implications of women’s journalism applied by female journalist leaders in local media.

When applying women’s journalism, the female journalists seem to act as an activist for women by using a non-attack approach in order to voice outwomen’s voices and show an ideal media’s role to society in general and women in particular in order to inform and educate them with good and health information.

It is suggested to local media to create internal policy that protects and empowers women’s concerns as journalist or content. As a journalist, women need to be given an equal opportunity to achieve senior-level position in the editorial management team. The number of women in higher positions need to be increased quantitatively. The local media also must abolish policies and cultures which hinder women to achieve top position in the editorial management team. When female journalists become a leader, they must be given opportunities to act freely, innovatively and creatively to paint media content with women’s concerns. For accomplishing this issue, the local media needs to develop media content policy which is friendly to women’s interests. Last but not least, male journalists as colleagues must support female journalists as a leader to achieve and actualize the organization’s vision which is amiable to women’s concerns.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

I may develop this article by financial support from the Dean of the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences at Diponegoro University for my research entitled “Esensi Pengalaman Profesional Pekerja Wanita dalam Industri Media” in the year of 2014 through DIPA of Communication Postgraduate Program.

Bibliography

Anonimous. (2004). Hak-hak Perempuan: Instrumen Hukum untuk Mewujudkan Keadilan Gender. Jakarta: Convention Watch, Pusat Kajian Wanita dan Gender UI dan Yayasan Obor Indonesia. Beäm, R. A., & Di Cicco, D. T. (2010). When Women Run the Newsroom: Management Change, Gender, and the News. Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly, 87(2), 393-411. DOI: 10.1177/107769901008700211. Retrieved from https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/107769901008700211

Beritasatu. (2020). “Pekerja Perempuan di Media Massa Masih Dikriminasi”. Retrieved from https://www.beritasatu.com/konomi/353795-pekerja-perempuan-di-media-massa-masih-dikriminasi

Connel, R.W. (1987). Gender and Power: Society, the Person and Sexual Politics. California: Stanford University Press

Correa, T., & Harp, D. (2011). Women Matter in Newsrooms: How Power and Critical Mass Relate to the Coverage of the HPV Vaccine. Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly, 88(2), 301-319. DOI: 10.1177/107769901108800205. Retrieved from https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/107769901108800205

Dartingsih, B. E., & Julijanti, D. M. (2009). Kepemimpinan yang Berperspektif Gender dalam Birokrasi Pemerintah di Kabupaten Bangkalan Madura. In K. D. Santosa (Ed.), Kepemimpinan yang Berperspektif Gender (hal. 59-65). Yogyakarta: Pusat Studi Wanita Universitas Gadjah Mada.

Dukas, C. J. (2014). A Feminist Phenomenological Description of Depression in Low-Income South African Women. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, Stellenbosch, South Africa.
Everbach, T. (2006). The Culture of a Women-Led Newspaper: An Ethnographic Study of the Sarasota Herald-Tribune. Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly, 83(3), 477-493. DOI: 10.1177/107769900608303031. Retrieved from https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/107769900608303031

Gamble, T. K., & Gamble, M. (2005). Communication Works (8th ed.). The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.; Boston.

Giddens, A. (1986a). The Constitution of Society: Outline of the Theory of Structuration. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Giddens, A. (1986b). Central Problems in Social Research: Action, Structure and Contradiction in Social Analysis. Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press Golding, P. & Murdock, G. (1991). Culture, Communications and Political Economy. James Curran & Michael Gurevitch (Eds.). Mass Media and Society (pp. 15-52). London: Edward Arnold.

Murdock, G. & Golding, P. (1995). “For a political economy of mass communications”. Oliver Boyd-Barrett & Chris Newbold (Eds.). Approaches to Media: A Reader (pp. 201-215). London: Foundations in Media.

MNC. (2020). Retrieved April 15. Retrieved from https://www.mncgroup. icom/page/about/organization-structure

Heiner, R. (2006). Social Problems: An Introduction to Critical Constructionism (2nd ed.). New York: Oxford University Press.

Herrick, D. F. (2003). Media Management In the Age of Giants: Business Dynamics of Journalism. Iowa, Iowa State Press.

Hughes, R. L., Ginnett, R. C., & Curphy, G. J. (2012). Leadership: Memperkaya Pelajaran dan Pengalaman (Leadership: Enhancing the Lesson of Experience) (7th ed.). Yuli Utama Izzati (Translator). Jakarta: Sinar Harapan.

Humm, M. (1989). The Dictionary of Feminist Theory (2nd ed.). Columbus: Ohio State University Press.

Jatininggih, O. (2009). The Glass Ceiling dalam Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah Perempuan di Tiga Jenjang Sekolah Negeri di Surabaya-Yogyakarta. Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi. 16(3), 283-301. DOI: 10.1080/1292980903039004. Retrieved from https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/1292980903039004

Kaye, M. (1994). Communication Management. Sydney: Prentice Hall.

Kirri, D. (2015). Cultural Studies, Multiculturalism, and Media Culture. In Gill Dines & Jean M. Humez (Eds.) (3rd ed.) (pp. 191-216). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Krolokke, C. & Sorensen, A. S. (2006). Gender Communication Theories & Analyses: From Silence to Performance. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (2005). Paradigmatic Controversies, Contradictions, and Emerging Confluences. In Norman K. Denzin and Yvonna S Lincoln (Eds.), Handbook of Qualitative Research (3rd ed.) (pp. 191-216). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Lueck, T. L., & Chang, H. (2002). Tribun’s Womennews: Gives Voice to Women’s Issues. NUH Newspaper Research Journal. 23(1), 59-72.

Luviana. (2012). Jejak Jurnalis Perempuan: Pemetaan Kondisi Kerja Jurnalis Perempuan di Indonesia. Jakarta: Penerbit AAI.

Melancon, J. (2014). Thinking Corporally, Socially, and Politically: Critical Phenomenological after Merleau-Ponty and Bourdieu. Bulletin d’analyse Phenomenologique. X(8). Retrieved from http://pop-ups.ulg.ac.be/1782-2041/@2014Ulg BAP

Miller, K. (2015). Organizational Communication: Approaches and Processes (7th Ed.). Stamford,USA: Cengage Learning.

Mosco, V. (2009). The Political Economy of Communication (2nd ed.). London: Sage Publications.

Murdock, G. & Golding, P. (1995). For a political economy of mass communications. In Oliver Boyd-Barrett & Chris Newbold (Eds.). Approaches to Media: A Reader (pp. 201-215). London: Foundations in Media.

Moustakas, C. (1994). Phenomenology Research Method. California: Sage Publications.

Northhouse, P. G. (2013). Kepemimpinan: Teori dan Praktek (Leadership: Theory and Practice) (6th ed.). Arti Cahayani (Translator). Jakarta: Indeks.

PT. Media Nusantara Citra Tbk. (2020). Struktur Organisasi. Retrieved from https://www.mncgroup.com/page/about/organization-structure accessed at 21/01/2020/13.54 AM

Riauwati. (2009). Kepemimpinan Berperpektif Gender pada Bidang Politik di Maluku Utara. Dalam Sisyarjadi (Ed.), Kepimpinan yang Berperpektif Gender (hal. 66-73). Yogyakarta: Pusat Studi Wanita Universitas Gadjah Mada.

Richmond-Abott, M. (1992). Masculine & Feminine: Gender Roles Over The Life Cycle (2nd ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill Inc.

Rodny-Gumede, Y. (2015). Male and Female Journalists’ Perceptions of Their Power to Influence News Agenda and Public Discourses. Communication, South African Journal for Communication Theory and Research, 41(2), 206-219. Retrieved from DOI:10.1080/0129298015.1066497. Retrieved from https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0129298015.1066497?src=recsys accessed at 28/01/2020/8.54 AM

Ross, K. (2001). Women at Work: Journalism as En-gendered Prac-tise. Journalism Studies, 2(4), 531-544. Retrieved from DOI: 10.1080/146167001200864041. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/233526591_Women_at_Work_Journalism_as_en-gendered_practice accessed 18/05/2020/17:09 PM

Seshu, G. (2014). The Stories Women Journalists Tell: Women in Media in South Asia. A report from the South Asia Media Freedom and Solidarity Project (SAMSN). International Federation of Journalist (IFJ). Retrieved from File:///D:/Downloads/2014_South_Asia_Women_in_Media_Report_-_The_Stories_Women_Tell.pdf accessed at 21/02/2020/11.31 AM

Simon, S. & Hoyt, C. L. (2012). Exploring the Effect of Media Images on Women’s Leadership Self-Perceptions and Aspirations. Journal of Group Processes & Intergroup Relations, 16(2), 232-245. DOI: 10.1177/1368430212451176. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/256486332_Exploring_the_effect_of_media_images_on_women%e2%80%99s_leadership_self-perceptions_and_aspirations accessed at 21/01/2020/13.54 AM

Stellarosa, Y. & Silaban, M. W. (2018). Perempuan, Media dan Profesi Jurnalis. Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi. 16(3), 282-294. September - Desember 2018. Retrieved from file:///D:/Downloads/3209-7393-5-SM%20(1).pdf accessed at 12/04/2020/15.15 PM

Sunarto. (2009). Televisi, Kekerasan dan Perempuan. Jakarta: Kompas-Gramedia

Sunarto. (2014). Maskulinitas Pekerja Wanita dalam Industri Media. Dalam Rajab Ritonga (Ed.), Jurnalisme Profesional dan Literasi Media (hal. 280-295). Jakarta: Ikatan Sarjana Komunikasi Indonesia (ISKI).

Sunarto. (2019). Jurnal Perempuan dalam Organisasi Redaksi dan Jurnalisme. Jurnal Dewan Pers. 19, 17-25

Tong, R. (1989). Feminist Thought: A Comprehensive Introduction. Boulder: Westview Press

Unger, R., & dan Crawford, M. (1992). Women and Gender: A Feminist Psychology. United States of America: McGrawHill.

Volf, Y. Z., & and Lee, F. L. F. (2010). What Does It Take for Women Journalists to Gain Professional Recognition?: Gender Dis-parities among Pulitzer Prize Winners, 1917-2010. Journal-ism and Mass Communication Quarterly, 90(2), 248-266. DOI: 10.1177/1077699013482908. Retrieved from https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1077699013482908 accessed at 21/01/2020/10.34 AM

Wolfensperger, J. (1991). Engendered Structure: Giddens and the Conceptualization of Gender. In Kathy Davis & Colleagues (eds.), The Gender of Power (pp. 87-110). London: Sage Publications