Culture-Dependent Evaluation of Microbial and Proximate Composition of Ready-to-Eat (RTE) African Salad Sold at Nkpolu-Oroworukwo Ultra-Modern Market (Mile 3, Diobu), Port Harcourt, Rivers State, Nigeria

Lawrence O. Amadi1* and Christian C. Nwankwo1

1Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Science, Rivers State University, Nkpolu-Oroworukwo, P.M.B 5080, Port Harcourt, Nigeria.

Authors’ contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration between both authors. Both authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/SAJRM/2021/v9i330211

Editor(s):
(1) Dr. Ana Claudia Coelho, University of Tras-os-Montes and Alto Douro, Portugal.

Reviewers:
(1) Sunpreet Sahni, PTU University, India.
(2) Babatuyi, Catherine Yemisi, Federal University of Technology Akure (FUTA), Nigeria.
Complete Peer review History: http://www.sdiarticle4.com/review-history/68861

ABSTRACT

This study attempts to evaluate culture-dependent microbial and proximate composition of African salad (Abacha) sold at Nkpolu Oroworukwo (mile 3) market, Port Harcourt, Rivers State, Nigeria. Samples were bought from stationary vendors at market within the months of March, 2019 to March, 2021. Garnished African salad (GAS) and ungarnished African salad (UAS) samples were determined by standard microbiological techniques whereas proximate composition (PC) was analysed by the methods of Association of Official of Analytical Chemists (AOAC) Total aerobic plate counts (TAPCs), total coliform counts (TCCs) and fungal counts (FCs) of GAS were higher 4.5x10^4 CFU/g, 5.3x10^4 CFU/g and 1.1x10^4 CFU/g respectively as against 3.4x10^4 CFU/g, 3.8x10^4 CFU/g and 0.8x10^4 CFU/g for UAG. Microfloral diversity were more in GAS with species such as Escherichia coli, Bacillus subtilis, Klebsiella sp., Micrococcus sp., Bacillus sp., Enterobacter sp., and Aspergillus sp., Penicillium sp., Rhizopus sp., Fusarium sp., Mucor sp., Saccharomyces and

*Corresponding author: Email: lawrence.amadi1@ust.edu.ng;
**Keywords:** Culture-dependent; ready-to-eat; African salad; abacha bioburden; proximate composition.

1. **INTRODUCTION**

African salad (Cassava-tapioca porridge (Abacha) is derived from Cassava (Manihot esculenta Crantz), a basic staple food for an estimated 500 million farmers, countless processors and traders with Nigeria being the largest producer (of Cassava) in the world [1,2,3]. Abacha/Tapioca porridge as a RTE salad, is generally regarded as mixed greens, processed from single or mixed raw ingredients such as vegetables, fish, fruits, spices, potash, palm oil, cooked meat, garden eggs, grains, nuts, etc., with sauce or salad dressing [4,5,6]. The main reasons for street food sales and proliferation of informal markets are associated with the growing demand for cheap, RTE foods and the poverty level of most citizens in most low-and middle-income countries (LMICs). So, these vendors operate without minimum hygiene, regulatory standards and sanitation conditions.

African salad is consumed by a variety of people; school-age children and the fast-paced working class with little or no time to prepare meals as well as a side dish to various Nigerian rice recipes and as a special delicacy during traditional festivals [7,8]. Its economic and social advantage hinges on ease of production, availability, affordability, serviceability and palatability but prone to microbial contamination [9,10]. Processing of African salad necessitates boiling/cooking and fermentation by steeping in potable water for 24h or more to reduce starch and poisonous compounds (e.g., hydrogen cyanide) [8,11] to improve palatability and organoleptic properties prior to consumption. Several researchers have reported poor personal hygiene, lack of education, ingredients, water and sanitary status of the environment as fundamental predisposing factors of microbial contamination of vended RTE foods [12-18]. A variety of the microbes (e.g., bacteria, fungi and viruses) reported in RTE foods not only accentuate public health risks but also produce potential toxigenic compounds [4,19-22]. Cross/post-contamination may also be associated with insect vectors [22,23]. Consequently, these contaminants in salad may result in unwholesomeness which may be linked with outbreaks of FBDs [24,25].

In spite of the long history of vended RTE foods as a source of livelihood to many households, there is paucity of data regarding their contribution to the nutritional value of the diet [26] as well as microbiological safety due to variation in fortification by processors. The quality of food can be assessed by the amount of available nutrients and microbiological quality of the final products. Therefore, deliberate efforts to know the quantity and quality of the nutritional contents of vended RTE foods, their contribution to the overall energy and available nutrient intake is pertinent. Additionally, adoption of more proactive approaches in identifying and reducing food safety risks by bridging the information gap with regard to consistent surveillance, monitoring and evaluation of nutritional and microbiological status of vended RTE foods such as African salad is crucial. Though, they have been reported to be a cheap source of energy and protein intake than pre-packaged processed foods [27,28]. This study, however, focuses on culture-dependent evaluation of microbial and proximate composition of African salad as well as assess the level of compliance to microbiological quality standards.

2. **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

2.1 **Description of Study Area**

Mile 3 market, Diobu, the study area is in Nkpolu-Oworukwo community in Port Harcourt City
Local Government Area, Rivers State, Niger Delta, Nigeria. This community is ranked among the most commercially and industrially lively areas in the city. It accommodates foodstuffs, timber and auto-spare parts markets, auto-mechanic workshop, ceramics and tiles shops, motor park, banks, part of Azienda Generale Italiana Petroli (Agip) base landing jetty, Eagle island as well as educational institutions (Rivers State University inclusive) and is a high densely populated residential area to Nigerians and other nationals. Mile 3 market also called Nkpolu-Oworukwo ultra-modern market, lies at coordinates; 4°46'12.796"N (Latitude) and 6°58'24.4866"E (Longitude) Fig. 1.

2.2 Collection of Samples

Freshly prepared garnished African salad (GAS) and un-garnished African salad (UAS) samples (Plates A and B) were purchased at three stationary locations from different vendor at Mile 3 market, Nkpolu-Oworukwo from the months of March, 2019 to March, 2021 (sampling was truncated by COVID-19 lockdown). All samples were obtained aseptically in sterile sealable take-away containers, package in polyethylene bags and transported to the Microbiology Laboratory of Rivers State University, Nkpolu-Oworukwo, Port Harcourt.

2.3 Microbiological Analysis

Serial dilutions were carried out after blending 25g samples of GAS and UAS in 225mL peptone water (Titan Biotech Ltd. Bhiwadi-301019, Rajasthan, India,) to obtain (10⁻¹) a homogenate respectively. Total viable/Aerobic plate counts (TAPCs) were determined on surface-dried nutrient agar (NA) and plates were incubated in duplicates at 37°C for 24hours. Coliforms including Escherichia coli colonies were determined on MacConkey’ agar (McA) using the spread plate method and duplicate plates were incubated at 37°C for 24hours. Coliforms were further subjected to presumptive and confirmatory tests. Fungal counts (FCs) were determined using an aliquot (0.1ml) portion of serially diluted samples on solidified Sabouraud’ dextrose agar (SDA) and spread-plated with a sterilized bent glass rod, followed by incubated at room temperature (25±2°C) for 3-5days. Discrete colonies from well-isolated plates showing (30-300) colonies were picked at random, sub-cultured for purification, stored on slopes at refrigeration temperature and used for morphological and biochemical tests [29,30].

Fig. 1. Sampled site; Mile 3 market, Nkpolu-Oworukwo, Port Harcourt
2.4 Identification of Isolates

Identification of bacterial isolates was carried out based on their cultural (appearance; pigmentation, consistency, margin and elevation), morphological (Gram’s reaction, size and shape) and biochemical characteristics (catalase, oxidase, indole, citrate utilization, Methyl red and Voges-Proskauer tests, etc.) as well as sugar fermentation tests [31,32,29].

2.5 Determination of pH and Proximate Composition of African Salad

For pH determination, representative 25 g samples were blended with 50 ml deionised water and the pH measured by dipping a pocket-size digital pH meter (HI 2007, Hanna instrument, USA) after it had been calibrated in buffer solution of pH 7. Proximate composition of GAS and UAS were determined for the following nutrient parameters; moisture, ash, crude protein, crude fibre and fat contents in accordance with AOAC [33,34]. Carbohydrate content was determined by subtracting other parameters from100; thus, 100 − (% + % Ash + % Fat + % crude protein + % fibre). PCs were determined in triplicate and calculated in percentages.

2.6 Statistical Analysis

The experiment was replicate and mean and standard deviation were calculated using Microsoft Excel® 2016.

3. RESULTS

Total aerobic plate counts (TAPCs), total coliform counts (TCCs) and fungal counts (FCs) are presented in Table 1. Higher microbial counts were observed in GAS samples than in those of UAS. This may be attributed to nutrient fortification and environmental conditions.

The percentage frequency of occurrence of bacterial species from GAS are presented in Fig. 2.

The % frequency of occurrence of bacterial species ranged from 40-70 with E. coli as the highest, followed by B. subtilis and Enterobacter sp., the least. Six bacterial species belonging to five (5) genera; three Gram negative (E. coli, Klebsiella and Enterobacter species) and three Gram positive (B. subtilis, Bacillus and Micrococcus species) bacteria were identified (Fig. 2).

Table 1. Total aerobic plate counts (TAPCs), total coliform counts (TCCs) and fungal counts (FCs) (CFU/g) of GAS and UAS samples

| (x10⁴CFUg⁻¹) | GAS | UAS |
|--------------|-----|-----|
| **Bacteria** |     |     |
| TAPC         | 4.5 | 3.4 |
| TCC          | 5.3 | 3.8 |
| **Fungi**    |     |     |
| FC           | 1.10| 0.8 |

Legend: GAS = Garnished African salad; UAS = Ungarnished African salad; CFU = Colony forming unit.
The percentage frequency of occurrence of bacteria identified from UAS are displayed in Fig. 3. The bacterial species were similar to those of GAS, except that Enterobacter sp was absent. The % frequency of occurrence of the species were lower (30-60) but with similar trend to those of GAS above.

The fungal species identified from GAS samples are presented in Fig. 4, with Penicillum species having the highest (80%) frequency of occurrences, followed by Aspergillus sp (50%) and the lowest being Candida species (20%). Seven genera of fungi were identified; 5 moulds and 2 yeast (Saccharomyces and Candida) species, Fig. 4.

The percentage frequency of occurrence of fungi identified from UAS are presented in Fig. 5. It indicates that the % frequency was lower, between 20 and 70 depicting similar trend of fungal occurrence in GAS (Fig. 4) except for the absence of Mucor sp.

The pH and proximate composition (PC (%)) values are depicted in Table 2. GAS had higher values of pH, crude protein, fat, fibre, ash, and energy whereas UAS were higher in moisture and crude carbohydrate contents.

**Fig. 2. % Frequency of occurrence of bacterial species from garnished African salad**

**Fig. 3. % Frequency of occurrence of bacterial species from ungarnished African salad**
Fig. 4. % Frequency of occurrence of fungal species from garnished African salad

Fig. 5. % Frequency of occurrence of fungal species from ungarnished African salad

Table 2. pH and Proximate composition (%) values of GAS and UAS samples

| Parameter               | GAS        | UAS        |
|-------------------------|------------|------------|
| pH                      | 6.4        | 5.2        |
| Moisture content        | 62.34±0.33 | 62.52±0.53 |
| Crude protein           | 4.68±0.53  | 2.41±0.57  |
| Carbohydrate            | 21.0±0.06  | 23.21±0.21 |
| Fat                     | 3.25±0.18  | 1.22±0.21  |
| Fibre                   | 3.62±0.02  | 3.42±0.22  |
| Ash                     | 6.81±0.39  | 4.54±0.42  |
| Energy content (Kcal/100 g) | 116.01   | 114.00     |

Legend: GAS = Garnished African salad; UAS = Ungarnished African salad

4. DISCUSSION

African salad as a single recipe is a bland/junk food processed from cassava. The microbial load/count increases based on ingredients used for fortification, education, hygiene, environmental sanitation as well as time-temperature abuse. Bioburden of the samples were slightly above (≥10⁴ CFU/g) the tolerable standard limits by ICMSF [35] and (PHLS [36] for...
African salad is nutritious, consumed fresh and without application of chemical preservatives. The microbial diversity and energy value of African salad depends on the raw material-base and added ingredients. Adequate processing, sanitization of utensils, hygienic practice, education and compliance with environmental sanitary measures would result in an African salad that will meet food standard regulatory policies.

DISCLAIMER

The products used for this research are commonly and predominantly use products in our area of research and country. There is absolutely no conflict of interest between the authors and producers of the products because we do not intend to use these products as an avenue for any litigation but for the advancement of knowledge. Also, the research was not funded by the producing company rather it was funded by personal efforts of the authors.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. Levin CF, Ruel M, Morris SS. Working women in an urban setting: traders, vendor and food security in Accra. World Dev. 1999;27:1977-1991.
2. Plucknett DL, Phillips PT, Kagbo RB. (Eds). A global development strategy for cassava: Transforming a traditional tropical root crop. Surring rural industrial development and raising incomes for rural poor. FAO Plant Production and Crop Protection Division, Rome, Italy; 2000.
3. FAO. FAO in Nigeria, Nigeria at a glance; 2017. Available:http://www.fao.org/nigeria/faq-in-nigeria/nigeria-at-a-glance/en/
4. Makinde OM, Ayeni Ki, Sulyok M, Kriska R, Adeleke RA, Ezekiel1 CN. Microbiological safety of ready-to-eat foods in low- and middle-income countries: A comprehensive 10-year (2009 to 2018) review. Compr Rev Food Sci Food Saf. 2020;19:703–732.
5. Adebayo-Oyetoro AO, Ogundipe OO, Lofinmakin FK, Akinwande FF, Aina DO, Adegbeke SAO. Production and acceptability of chin chin snack made from wheat and tigernut (*Cyperus esculentus*) flour. Cogent Food & Agriculture. 2017;1(1):1282185.

6. Ceyhun Sezgin A, Şanher N. Street food consumption in terms of the food safety and health. Journal of Human Sciences. 2016;13(3):4072–4083.

7. Marky. Nigerian salad recipes. How to make your own. Available: http://ezinearticles.com/?Nigerian Salad-Recipes-How-to-make-Your Own&id=5319370. 2013.

8. Oranusi S, Braide W, Eze UC, Chinakwe E. Quality aspects of African salad. J Emerging Trends in Engineering and Appl Sciences. 2013;4(2):287-292.

9. Al Mamun M, Rahman SMM, Turin TC. Microbiological quality of selected street food items vended by school-based street food vendors in Dhaka, Bangladesh. International Journal of Food Microbiology. 2013;166(3):413–418.

10. World Health Organization (WHO). Basic steps to improve safety of street-vended food. International Food Safety Authorities Network (INFOSAN) Information Note No. 3/2010-Safety of street vended food; 2010. Available: http://www.who.int/foodsafety/fs-management/No-03-StreetFood-Jun10-en.pdf

11. Burns AE, Gleadow RM, Zacarias AM, Cuambe CE, Miller RE, Cavagnaro TR. Variations in the chemical composition of cassava (*Manihot esculenta Crantz*) leaves and roots as affected by genotypic and environmental variation. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry. 2012;60:4946–4956. Available: dx.doi.org/10.1021/jf2047288

12. Salamandane A, Silva AC, Brito L, Malfeito-Ferreira M. Microbiological assessment of street foods at the point of sale in Maputo (Mozambique). Food Quality and Safety. 2021;5:1–9.

13. Nguyen PM. Food safety knowledge and hygiene practice of street vendors in mekong river delta region. International J Applied Engineering Research. 2017;12(24):15292–15297.

14. Abrahale K, Sousa S, Albuquerque G, Padrão P, Lunet N. Street food research worldwide: A scoping review. Journal of Human Nutrition and Dietetics: The Official Journal of the British Dietetic Association. 2018;32(2):152–174.

15. Fadahunsi IF, Makinde D. Occurrence, antibiotic susceptibility pattern and from ready to eat foods in Ibadan, Oyo state. J Applied Life Sciences International. 2018;18(1):1–9.

16. Alimi BA. Risk factors in street food practices in developing countries: A review. Food Science and Human Wellness. 2016;5:141–148.

17. Onyeneho SN, Hedberg CW. An assessment of food safety needs of restaurants in Owerri, Imo State, Nigeria. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health. 2013;10(8):3296–3309.

18. Schirone M, Visciano P, Di Serafino G, Tofalo R, Ciccarelli A, Suzzi G. Assessment of knowledge and applications of hygiene practices in the food service sector. Journal of Food Safety. 2018;38(4):e12457.

19. Adetunji CO, Akande SA, Oladipo AK, Salawu RA, Onyegbula AF. Determination of the microbiological quality and proximate composition of fermented cassava food products sold in Ilorin-west local government area, Nigeria. Ruhuna Journal of Science. 2017;8:76-89.

20. Oranusi S, Nubi FE. Microbiological safety evaluation of ready to eat shrimps and snails sold along Lagos–Shagamu expressway, Nigeria. Covenant Journal of Physical and Life Science. 2016;4(1):20–32.

21. Yongsi NHB. Eating to live or eating to damage one’s health: Microbiological risks associated with street-vended foods in a subtropical urban setting (Yaoundé-Cameroon). Nutrition and Food Science. 2018;6(4):001–0013.

22. International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC). Mycotoxin control in low- and middle-income countries (IARC Working Group Report No. 9). Lyon, France: Author; 2015.

23. Monney I, Agyei D, Ewoenam B, Campaore P. Food hygiene and safety practices among street food vendors: An assessment of compliance, institutional and legislative framework in Ghana. Food and Public Health. 2014;4(6):306–315.

24. Aluko O, Ojeremi T, Olaleke D, et al. Evaluation of food safety and sanitary practices among food vendors at car parks
in Ile Ife, Southwestern Nigeria. Food Control. 2014;40:165–171.

25. Mbae K, Ndewiga M, Kiruki F. Microbiological quality of Kachumbari, a raw vegetable salad popularly served alongside roast meat in Kenya. Journal of Food Quality. 2018;(35):1-7.

26. Steyn NP, Mchiza Z, Hill J, Davids YD, Venter I, Hinrichsen E, Opperman M, Rumbelow J, Jacobs P. Nutritional contribution of street foods to the diet of people in developing countries: A systematic review. Public Health Nutrition. 2013;17:1363-1374.

27. Becquey E, Martin-Prevel YM. Micronutrient adequacy of women’s diet in urban Burkina Faso is low. J Nutr. 2010;140(11):2079S-2085S.

28. Namugumya BS, Muyanja C. Contribution of street foods to the dietary needs of street food vendors in Kampala, Jinja and Masaka districts, Uganda. Public Health Nutr. 2012;15:1503-1511.

29. Forbes BA, Sahm DE, Weissfeld AS. Bailey and scott’s diagnostic microbiology. International edition. 12th edn. Mosby, Inc., an affiliate of Elsevier, Inc., USA; 2007.

30. Cheesbrough M. District laboratory practices in tropical countries. Volume 2 part 2 Cambridge University Press, UK; 2006.

31. Harrigan WF, McCance MF. Laboratory methods in foods and dairy microbiology, academic press, London, UK; 1976.

32. Sneath PHA, Mair NS, Sharpe ME, Holt JG. Bergey’s manual of systemic bacteriology, Williams and Wikins, Baltimore, MD, USA, 1986;2.

33. AOAC. Official method of analysis (18th ed.) Washington, D.C. Association of Official Analytical Chemist; 2006.

34. AOAC. Association of official analytical chemists, official methods of analysis. 19th edition, Washington, D.C, USA; 2012.

35. International Commission on Microbiological Specification for Foods (ICMSF). Microorganisms in Foods 5: Microbiological Specifications of Pathogens; 1996.

36. Public Health Laboratory Service (PHLS). Guidelines for assessing the microbiological safety of ready-to-eat foods placed on the market; 2009.

37. Nwagu IN, Amadi C, Alakwe O. Role of bacteria isolates in the spoilage of fermented African oil bean seed Ugba. Pakistan J Biol Sciences. 2010;13:497-503.

38. Nkere CK1, Ibe NI, Iroegbu CU. Bacteriological quality of foods and water sold by vendors and in restaurants in Nsukka, Enugu State, Nigeria: A comparative study of three microbiological methods. Journal of Health Population and Nutrition. 2011;29(6):560-566.

39. Mugampoz D, Byarugaba G, Nyonyintono A, et al. Occurrence of Escherichia coli and Salmonella spp. in street-vended foods and general hygienic and trading practices in Nakawa Division, Uganda. American Journal of Food and Nutrition. 2013;3(3):167–175.

40. Aruwa CE, Ogunlade ST. Classical identification, 16SrDNA sequencing, and molecular characterization of Bacillus species from convenience foods. British Journal of Applied Science and Technology. 2016;15(5):1–11.

41. Gdoura-Ben Amor M, Siila M, Zayani M, Grosset N, Smaoui S, Messadi-Akrout F, Gdoura, R. Isolation, identification, prevalence, and genetic diversity of Bacillus cereus group bacteria from different foodstuffs in Tunisia. Frontiers in Microbiology. 2018;9:447.

42. Ezekiel CN, Anokwu CU, Fari A, Olorunfemi MF, Fadairo O, Ekeh HA, Akinsanmi F. Microbiological quality and proximate composition of peanut cake (Kulikuli) in Nigerian markets. Academia Arena. 2011;3(4):103–111.

© 2021 Amadi and Nwankwo; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history:
The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
http://www.sdiarticle4.com/review-history/68861