Biotic Elicitors in Adventitious and Hairy Root Cultures: A Review from 2010 to 2022

Miguel Angel Alcalde 1,†, Edgar Perez-Matas 1,†, Ainoa Escrich 2,†, Rosa M. Cusido 1, Javier Palazon 1 and Mercedes Bonfill 1,*

1 Laboratorio de Fisiologia Vegetal, Facultad de Farmacia, Universitat de Barcelona, Avda. Joan XXIII 27-31, 08028 Barcelona, Spain
2 Department of Medicine and Life Sciences, Universitat Pompeu Fabra, 08003 Barcelona, Spain
* Correspondence: mbonfill@ub.edu; Tel.: +34-93-4020267; Fax: +34-93-4029043
† These authors contributed equally to this work.

Abstract: One of the aims of plant in vitro culture is to produce secondary plant metabolites using plant cells and organ cultures, such as cell suspensions, adventitious, and hairy roots (among others). In cases where the biosynthesis of a compound in the plant is restricted to a specific organ, unorganized systems, such as plant cell cultures, are sometimes unsuitable for biosynthesis. Then, its production is based on the establishment of organ cultures such as roots or aerial shoots. To increase the production in these biotechnological systems, elicitors have been used for years as a useful tool since they activate secondary biosynthetic pathways that control the flow of carbon to obtain different plant compounds. One important biotechnological system for the production of plant secondary metabolites or phytochemicals is root culture. Plant roots have a very active metabolism and can biosynthesize a large number of secondary compounds in an exclusive way. Some of these compounds, such as tropane alkaloids, ajmalicine, ginsenosides, etc., can also be biosynthesized in undifferentiated systems, such as cell cultures. In some cases, cell differentiation and organ formation is necessary to produce the bioactive compounds. This review analyses the biotic elicitors most frequently used in adventitious and hairy root cultures from 2010 to 2022, focusing on the plant species, the target secondary metabolite, the elicitor and its concentration, and the yield/productivity of the target compounds obtained. With this overview, it may be easier to work with elicitors in in vitro root cultures and help understand why some are more effective than others.

Keywords: elicitor; secondary metabolites; hairy root; adventitious root; production; biotic elicitor; phytochemical

1. Introduction

Secondary metabolite production is connected with the differentiation of the plant, and means that secondary pathways are activated in the plant as a whole. Unlike callus and cell suspension cultures, roots are organs that maintain the same structure as in the plant, so its differentiation allows a directed activation of the secondary metabolism. In fact, cell differentiation and organ formation are, in some cases, necessary for producing the bioactive compounds. For this reason, in the middle of the last century, plant biotechnologists began to work in root cultures. The problem of this type of cultures was the low growth rate and in some cases the addition of indol-acetic acid (IAA) to promote growth caused low production of the bioactive compounds.

During this period, hairy root syndrome was discovered in plants in nature, which is induced by Agrobacterium rhizogenes [1]. A. rhizogenes is a bacterium that infects plants in nature transferring a part of its plasmid DNA to the plant cell, the transferred DNA (T-DNA). The genetically transformed cells develop roots called hairy roots or transformed roots. Hairy root cultures show a very high biomass production and a metabolic profile similar to the root of the whole plant.
The genes of the T-DNA which are responsible for the root development [2] are the rol genes. Among the rol genes, the most important are rol A gene which increases the sensitivity of the transformed cell to auxin [3], the rol B gene which has a role in signal transduction related to auxin sensitivity [4] as confirmed by its tyrosine phosphatase activity [5] (this rol gene is crucial for hairy root initiation and elongation, and especially, in meristem formation [6]), and the rol C gene which hydrolyzes the conjugates of cytokinins [3].

This review focuses on one of the strategies to improve the secondary metabolite production in adventitious and hairy root cultures, that is, the addition of biotic elicitors to the culture medium. It screens the biotic elicitors most utilized in root in vitro cultures in the last decade and analyzes the production of the secondary metabolites in relation to the type of elicitor, its concentration and the plant species. A comparison between hairy roots and adventitious roots is made and a discussion about the improvement of yield/productivity of the target secondary metabolite with different biotic elicitors is shown.

In addition, Excel 2010, GraphPad Prism 8 and Tableau 2020.1 were used to organize and analyze data on the maximum production value, range and the most common studied elicitor by group of metabolites, plant family and origin of the research group.

All information about the biotic elicitors used during the last decade were collected from research articles and reviews from 2010 until 2022. The electronic databases employed to obtain relevant information include Web of Science (accessed on 1 April 2022), Scopus (accessed on 1 April 2022) and PubMed (accessed on 1 April 2022).

The analyzed data includes the biotic elicitors most used in hairy root cultures from 2010 to 2022. The data, 87 studies, were organized and analyzed using Microsoft Excel 2016 (Microsoft Corporation, Redmond, WC, USA, 2016), GraphPad Prism 8 (GraphPad Prism Inc., San Diego, CA, USA, 2019) and Tableau 2020.1 (Salesforce, San Francisco, CA, USA, 2019).

2. Root In Vitro Cultures

2.1. Hairy Roots

After infection of the explant (leave, stems, rhizome, etc.) with A. rhizogenes, the obtained hairy roots are cultured in a solid medium for growth and confirmation of their transformed nature.

The confirmed transformed roots are then transferred to liquid medium to optimize their growth and production. The hairy root methodology is based on optimized protocols for the genetic transformation of all species that have been investigated, which include the isolation and selection of the most productive root lines, optimization of the culture conditions by assaying several basic media, plant growth regulators (PGRs), sugar supplements, addition of elicitors, precursors, etc., to improve the production, and finally the scale-up to bioreactors [7]. At this level, the scaling-up process is very difficult since bioreactors are generally designed for the culture of microorganisms and need to be modified to adapt the transformed roots to the new culture conditions.

Some examples of hairy root cultures are transformed root cultures for the production of ajmalicine in Catharanthus roseus [8], ginsenosides in Panax ginseng [9], tropane alkaloids in Datura metel [10], Duboisia sp. [11], Brugmansia candida [12] and Hyoscyamus niger [13], withanolides in Withania coagulans [14], taxol in Taxus spp. [15] and hairy roots of Linum album for the production of podophyllotoxin and methoxypodophyllotoxin [16]. The advantages of the hairy root cultures are the following: there is fast growth in culture media without PGRs; they are economically feasible since high-cost media constituents are not needed; the product is obtained without chemical alterations; and the level of the production is predictable, genetic stability over long culture periods and large-scale cultivation without loss of biosynthetic capacity [17].

One strategy to work during long periods with the same roots (known as a continuous system) and to increase production involves stimulating the release of the target compound to the culture medium. Root cultures frequently accumulate the bioactive compounds inside the cells in vacuoles, so it is necessary to harvest the biomass of the culture in order to
extract the bioactive compounds [17]. Extraction from dry plant matter is a difficult process due to the high quantity of waxes and pigments. Permeabilizing agents, as dimethyl sulfoxide, can release the phytochemicals caught in the root cells to the culture medium, thus facilitating the final extraction process [18].

As the Agrobacterium infection is cell by cell, each root that appears from an inoculated explant should be isolated and treated as an individual hairy root line. In this way, one can obtain several lines of hairy roots that usually have different morphologies. A study with Panax ginseng hairy roots, showed three types of morphologies from the same type explant: 50% of lines with a typical hairy root morphology, 35% with a thick morphology, and 15% with a thin morphology. The behavior of these roots was different in growth and ginsenoside production. However, the metabolic profile was not altered, and interestingly, the same elicitor increased the production in all types of roots [19].

2.2. Adventitious Roots

Adventitious roots constitute another in vitro culture system to produce secondary metabolites [20]. Although they normally have a low growth rate, they can be easily cultured in vitro with the addition of low concentrations of auxin [21], using a similar methodology to that of hairy roots, with the advantage that the infection process with Agrobacterium is avoided. Being a differentiated culture system, adventitious roots also possess genetic and biosynthetic stability [22] and maintain the biosynthetic profile of the target compounds as in hairy roots [16].

3. Use of Elicitors to Increase the Production

Elicitation is one of the most effective techniques currently used for improving the biotechnological production of plant secondary metabolites (PSMs). The use of this biotechnological tool showed good results in different culture systems and several plant species [23,24].

Elicitors are compounds that stimulate any type of plant defense, promoting secondary metabolism to protect the cell and the whole plant [25–28] since they can trigger the expression of key genes in the secondary biosynthetic pathways.

Also, it has been defined that an elicitor is a substance that, when introduced in small concentrations to a living cell system, initiates or improves the biosynthesis of specific compounds [29]; elicitation is a process of induced or enhanced plant biosynthesis of secondary metabolites due to the addition of trace amounts of elicitors [30]. Depending on their origin, elicitors can be classified into abiotic (such as metal ions, inorganic compounds) and biotic (including polysaccharides derived from plant cell walls, micro-organisms and glycoproteins) [30,31].

3.1. Biotic Elicitors

Biotic elicitors have a biological origin, and include substances derived from pathogens (exogenous elicitors) and compounds produced by plants after the action of the pathogen (endogenous elicitors) [32]. Exogenous biotic elicitors include compounds released by microorganisms and other pathogens, or formed by the action of plant enzymes on microbial cell walls, such as microbial enzymes, fungal and bacterial lysates, yeast extracts and polysaccharides from microorganisms’ cell walls (e.g., chitin and glucanes) [33].

Endogenous biotic elicitors include polysaccharides arising from pathogen degradation of the plant cell wall, intracellular proteins and small molecules synthesized by plant cells in response to different types of stress or pathogen attack, including PGRs such as methyl jasmonate (MeJA) or salicylic acid (SA) [28].

The main biotic elicitors used in this period are: Acetylsalicylic acid (ASA), Chitosan (CS), Coronatine (COR), Jasmonic acid (JA), MeJA, Pectin, SA and Yeast extract (YE).
3.1.1. Acetylsalicylic Acid and Salicylic Acid

Salicylic acid (SA) is known to induce systemic acquired resistance to many pathogens [34]. Among the wide range of defense responses, it is included the production of PSM. However, SA is not a global elicitor, and induces only certain classes of secondary metabolites [35]. A derivative of SA, acetylsalicylic acid (ASA), has been used as elicitor due to its similar chemical structure [36].

3.1.2. Chitosan

Chitosan (CS) is a carbohydrate generated from chitin, a cell wall component of fungi and yeast, by partial deacetylation under alkaline conditions or enzymatic hydrolysis by chitin deacetylases [37].

3.1.3. Coronatine

Coronatine (COR), a polyketide phytotoxin produced by microbes, is a non-host specific toxin that causes diffuse chlorosis in a wide variety of plant species [38]. The mechanism underlying the effects of COR is based on an ability to mimic a bioactive jasmonic acid conjugate (JA-Ile) and thus target the JA-receptor. COR directly harnesses JA-signal transduction proteins to hijack hormone signaling. In this way, it can suppress SA-dependent defenses, impede stomatal closure to provide pathogens with access to plant leaves, and suppression of plant cell wall defense through disturbance of secondary metabolism [39].

3.1.4. Jasmonic Acid and Methyl Jasmonate

Jasmonates (JAs), particularly methyl jasmonate (MeJA) are plant-specific molecules whose biosynthesis is induced by pathogen attack and wounding [35]. When exogenously applied to plant cell cultures, JAs stimulate secondary biosynthetic pathways and increase the production of secondary metabolites belonging to the three main groups: terpenoids, alkaloids, and phenylpropanoids [28]. An interesting review of jasmonic acid (JA) and MeJA has been published by Nabi et al. [40].

MeJA is the elicitor most used to enhance secondary metabolite production in root in vitro cultures, and specifically, at the concentration 100 µM. Different PSMs, belonging to the main three groups (terpenes, alkaloids and phenols), respond to the elicitation of MeJA increasing its production [41].

3.1.5. Pectin

Pectin, an essential branched polysaccharide, is a major component of primary cell walls of all land plants and encompasses a range of galacturonic acid-rich polysaccharides. Three major pectic polysaccharides (homogalacturonan, rhamnogalacturonan-I and rhamnogalacturonan-II) are thought to occur in all primary cell walls. The highest concentrations of pectin are found in the middle lamella of the cell wall, decreasing gradually through the primary wall toward the plasma membrane [42].

3.1.6. Yeast Extract

The knowledge of the composition and mechanism of action of yeast extracts (YE) on PSM production is limited and yet full entirely in the empirical approach. However, they are widely used as elicitors to activate plant secondary biosynthetic pathways.

4. The Main Biotic Elicitors Used in Hairy Roots from 2010 to 2022

Table 1 summarizes the data on elicitation of hairy root cultures from 2010 to 2022.
Table 1. Elicitation in hairy roots from 2010 to 2022.

| Metabolite Group | Plant Species | Plant Family | Secondary Metabolites | Yield/Productivity (mg/g DW) | Elicitor Concentration (µM) | Reference |
|------------------|---------------|--------------|-----------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------|
| Alkaloid         | Isatis tinctoria | Brassicaceae | Alkaloids             | 2.9                          | Salicylic acid              | [43] **   |
|                  | Atropa belladonna L. | Solanaceae  | Atropine              | 43.39                        | Yeast extract               | 5.46      | [44] *  |
|                  | Catharanthus roseus | Apocynaceae | Catharanthine         | 0.45                         | Methyl jasmonate            | 50        | [45]    |
|                  | Papaver armeniacum | Papaveraceae | Codeine               | 0.12                         | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [46]    |
|                  | Atropa belladonna | Solanaceae  | Hyoscyamine           | 2.1                          | Methyl jasmonate            | 40        | [47]    |
|                  | Datura titula     | Solanaceae  | Hyoscyamine           | 17.94                        | Salicylic acid              | 100       | [48] *  |
|                  | Datura stramonium | Solanaceae  | Hyoscyamine           | 12.31                        | Salicylic acid              | 100       | [49] *  |
|                  | Papaver armeniacum | Papaveraceae | Morphine             | 0.15                         | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [46]    |
|                  | Papaver orientale | Papaveraceae | Morphine             | 5.38                         | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [50] *  |
|                  | Papaver armeniacum | Papaveraceae | Noscapine            | 0.0603                       | Salicylic acid              | 100       | [46]    |
|                  | Papaver armeniacum | Papaveraceae | Papaverine           | 0.06                         | Salicylic acid              | 100       | [46]    |
|                  | Echium rauwolffii | Boraginaceae | Pyrrolizidine alkaloids | 13.26                     | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [51]    |
|                  | Anisodus luridus  | Solanaceae  | Scopolamine           | 0.068                        | Acetyl salicylic acid       | 100       | [52] *  |
|                  | Atropa belladonna L. | Solanaceae  | Scopolamine           | 9.21                         | Yeast extract               | 5.46      | [44] *  |
|                  | Solanum trilobatum | Solanaceae  | Solasodine            | 9.33                         | Methyl jasmonate            | 4         | [53]    |
|                  | Solanum melongena | Solanaceae  | Solasodine            | 0.15                         | Pectin                      | 10        | [54] *  |
|                  | Papaver armeniacum | Papaveraceae | Thebaine             | 0.041                        | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [46]    |
| Phenol           | Trigonella foenum-graecum | Fabaceae  | Trigonelline         | 35.43                        | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [55] *  |
|                  | Hyoscyamus reticulatus | Solanaceae | Tropane alkaloids     | 60                           | Acetyl salicylic acid       | 100       | [56] *  |
|                  | Atropa acuminata   | Solanaceae  | Tropane alkaloids    | 10.95                        | Coronatine                  | 0.5       | [57] *  |
|                  | Rhazya stricta     | Apocynaceae | Vindoline-type       | 0.4                          | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [58] *  |
|                  | Mentha spicata     | Lamiaceae   | Caffeic acid         | 0.159                        | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [59]    |
|                  | Astragalus membranaceus | Fabaceae  | Calycosin            | 0.61                         | Chitosan                    | 65.5      | [60]    |
|                  | Linum album        | Linaceae    | Catechin             | 0.86                         | Chitosan                    | 131.01    | [61]    |
|                  | Lactuca indica L.  | Asteraceae  | Chicoric acid        | 0.06                         | Methyl jasmonate            | 50        | [62]    |
|                  | Lactuca indica L.  | Asteraceae  | Chlorogenic acid     | 0.03                         | Methyl jasmonate            | 50        | [62]    |
|                  | Mentha spicata     | Lamiaceae   | Chlorogenic acid     | 0.015                        | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [59]    |
|                  | Mentha spicata     | Lamiaceae   | Cinnamic acid        | 0.043                        | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [59]    |
|                  | Lactuca indica L.  | Asteraceae  | 3,5-dicaffeoylquinic acid | 0.12                       | Methyl jasmonate            | 50        | [62]    |
|                  | Ocimum tenuiflorum L. | Lamiaceae  | Eugenol              | 0.41                         | Yeast extract               | 182.28    | [63]    |
|                  | Isatis tinctoria   | Brassicaceae | Flavonoids           | 16.35                        | Chitosan                    | 98.26     | [64] *  |
|                  | Isatis tinctoria   | Brassicaceae | Flavonoids           | 3.8                          | Methyl jasmonate            | 200       | [43] *  |
|                  | Momordica charantia L. | Cucurbitaceae | Flavonols            | 2.489                        | Salicylic acid              | 100       | [65]    |
|                  | Astragalus membranaceus | Fabaceae  | Formononetin        | 0.76                         | Chitosan                    | 65.5      | [60]    |
|                  | Salvia virgata     | Lamiaceae   | Gallic acid          | 123.6                        | Methyl jasmonate            | 100       | [66]    |
| Metabolite Group | Plant Species            | Plant Family    | Secondary Metabolites           | Yield/Productivity (mg/g DW) | Elicitor          | Concentration (µM) | Reference |
|------------------|--------------------------|-----------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|-------------------|-----------|
|                  | Momordica charantia L.   | Cucurbitaceae   | Hydroxybenzoic acid            | 7.96                          | Salicylic acid   | 100               | [65]      |
|                  | Momordica charantia L.   | Cucurbitaceae   | Hydroxycinnamic acid           | 1.09                          | Salicylic acid   | 100               | [65]      |
|                  | Pueraria candolleana     | Fabaceae        | Isoflavonoids                  | 60                            | Yeast extract    | 200               | [67] *    |
|                  | Glycyrrhiza max          | Fabaceae        | Isoflavones                    | 53.16                         | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [68] *    |
|                  | Astragalus membranaceus  | Fabaceae        | Isoflavonoids                  | 2.25                          | Methyl jasmonate | 283               | [69] *    |
|                  | Rehmannia glutinosa      | Orobanchaceae   | Isoverbenoside                 | 1.77                          | Methyl jasmonate | 200               | [70]      |
|                  | Linum austriacum         | Linaceae        | Justicidin B                   | 9.84                          | Coronatine       | 10                | [71] *    |
|                  | Linum album              | Linaceae        | 6-methoxypodophyllotoxin       | 39                            | Chitosan         | 131.01            | [61]      |
|                  | Linum mucronatum         | Linaceae        | 6-methoxypodophyllotoxin       | 75.65                         | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [72]      |
|                  | Gentiana dianerca        | Gentianaceae    | Norswertianin                  | 3                             | Jasmonic acid    | 200               | [73]      |
|                  | Gentiana dianerca        | Gentianaceae    | Norswertianin                  | 2.5                           | Methyl jasmonate | 200               | [73]      |
|                  | Gentiana dianerca        | Gentianaceae    | Norswertianin                  | 4.5                           | Salicylic acid   | 200               | [73]      |
|                  | Gentiana dianerca        | Gentianaceae    | Norswertianin-1-O-primeverosid | 10                            | Jasmonic acid    | 200               | [73]      |
|                  | Gentiana dianerca        | Gentianaceae    | Norswertianin-1-O-primeverosid | 10                            | Methyl jasmonate | 200               | [73]      |
|                  | Gentiana dianerca        | Gentianaceae    | Norswertianin-1-O-primeverosid | 15                            | Salicylic acid   | 200               | [73]      |
|                  | Orthosiphon aristatus    | Lamiaceae       | Phenolic acids                 | 17.99                         | Yeast extract    | 3.28              | [74]      |
|                  | Arachis hypogea          | Fabaceae        | Phenolics                      | 0.0108                        | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [75]      |
|                  | Linum album              | Linaceae        | Podophyllotoxin                | 0.146                         | Chitosan         | 131.01            | [61]      |
|                  | Linum mucronatum         | Linaceae        | Podophyllotoxin                | 11.37                         | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [72]      |
|                  | Salvia virgata           | Lamiaceae       | Flavonoids                     | 5.09                          | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [66]      |
|                  | Agastache foeniculaca    | Lamiaceae       | Rosmarinic acid                | 0.213                         | Chitosan         | 65.5              | [76]      |
|                  | Salvia virgata           | Lamiaceae       | Rosmarinic acid                | 18.45                         | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [66]      |
|                  | Mentha spicata           | Lamiaceae       | Rosmarinic acid                | 0.055                         | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [59]      |
|                  | Lepichinia caulescens    | Lamiaceae       | Rosmarinic acid                | 41.66                         | Methyl jasmonate | 300               | [77]      |
|                  | Salvia przewalskii       | Lamiaceae       | Rosmarinic acid                | 65                            | Methyl jasmonate | 400               | [78]      |
|                  | Prunella vulgaris         | Lamiaceae       | Rosmarinic acid                | 58.3                          | Salicylic acid   | 50                | [79] *    |
|                  | Salvia virgata           | Lamiaceae       | Salvianolic acid               | 2.11                          | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [66]      |
|                  | Salvia miltiorrhiza      | Lamiaceae       | Salvianolic acid               | 80                            | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [80]      |
|                  | Salvia przewalskii       | Lamiaceae       | Salvianolic acid               | 21.5                          | Methyl jasmonate | 400               | [78]      |
|                  | Silybum marianum         | Asteraceae      | Silymarin                      | 0.705                         | Chitosan         | 19.65             | [81]      |
|                  | Silybum marianum         | Asteraceae      | Silymarin                      | 1.2                           | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [82] *    |
|                  | Swertia chirayita        | Gentianaceae    | Swechurn                       | 0.71                          | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [83] *    |
|                  | Swertia chirayita        | Gentianaceae    | 1,2,5,6-tetrahydroxanthone     | 5.5                           | Methyl jasmonate | 100               | [83] *    |
|                  | Rehmannia glutinosa      | Orobanchaceae   | Verbacoside                    | 60.07                         | Methyl jasmonate | 200               | [70]      |
Table 1. Cont.

| Metabolite Group | Plant Species          | Plant Family | Secondary Metabolites          | Yield/Productivity (mg/g DW) | Elicitor               | Concentration (µM) | Reference |
|------------------|------------------------|--------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------|--------------------|-----------|
| Molecules        | Linum album            | Linaceae     | Vitexin                        | 0.44                        | Chitosan               | 131.01             | [61]      |
|                  | Scutellaria lateriflora| Lamiaceae    | Wogonin                        | 30                          | Yeast extract          | 0.18               | [84] *    |
|                  | Rubia cordifolia L.    | Rubiaceae    | Alizarin                       | 4.65 ppm **                 | Chitosan               | 98.3               | [85] *    |
|                  | Psoralea corylifolia   | Fabaceae     | Daidzin                        | 0.02% DW **                 | Jasmonic acid          | 1                  | [86] *    |
|                  | Solanum trilocatum     | Solanaceae   | Flavonoids                     | 521.09 mg/g dry extract (DE)** | Methyl jasmonate     | 4                  | [53]      |
|                  | Brassica rapa          | Brassicaceae | Glucosinolates                 | 85 µmol/g DW **             | Jasmonic acid          | 50                 | [87]      |
|                  | Aster scaber            | Asteraceae   | Phenolic compounds             | 244 mg/g GAE **             | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [88] *    |
|                  | Solanum trilocatum     | Solanaceae   | Phenolics                      | 150.42 mg/g DE **          | Methyl jasmonate       | 4                  | [53]      |
|                  | Plumbago indicus        | Plumbaginaceae | Plumbagin                      | 5% DW **                  | Methyl jasmonate       | 50                 | [89] *    |
|                  | Salvia sclarea          | Lamiaceae    | Abietane diterpenes            | 41.09                      | Coronatine             | 0.1                | [90] *    |
|                  | Salvia sclarea          | Lamiaceae    | Aethiopinone                   | 20.36                      | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [90] *    |
|                  | Andrographis paniculata| Acanthaceae  | Andrographolide                | 6                          | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [91] *    |
|                  | Andrographis paniculata| Acanthaceae  | Andrographolide                | 8                          | Salicylic acid         | 100                | [91] *    |
|                  | Astragalus membranaceus| Fabaceae     | Astragaloside                  | 0.007                      | Chitosan               | 3650               | [92]      |
|                  | Astragalus membranaceus| Fabaceae     | Astragaloside                  | 5.5                        | Methyl jasmonate       | 157.4              | [93]      |
|                  | Taxus media             | Taxaceae     | Baccatin III                  | 0.076                      | Coronatine             | 1                  | [15]      |
|                  | Calotropis gigantea     | Apocynaceae  | Cardenolide                    | 39.3                      | Chitosan               | 32.75              | [94] *    |
|                  | Centella asiatica       | Apiaceae     | Centellosides                  | 27.25                      | Methyl jasmonate       | 50                 | [95]      |
|                  | Panax ginseng           | Araliaceae   | Ginsenosides                   | 0.42                       | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [96] *    |
|                  | Panax quinquefolium     | Araliaceae   | Ginsenosides                   | 32.25                      | Yeast extract          | 182.28             | [97]      |
|                  | Glyceriza inflata       | Fabaceae     | Glycyrrhizin                   | 34.79                      | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [98] *    |
|                  | Silene linicola         | Caryophyllaceae | 2β-hydroxyecdysone        | 0.138                      | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [89]      |
|                  | Lepychina caulecens     | Lamiaceae    | Oleanolic acid                 | 0.57                       | Methyl jasmonate       | 300                | [77]      |
|                  | Calendula officinalis   | Asteraceae   | Oleanolic acid glycosides      | 52.52                      | Jasmonic acid          | 100                | [100] *   |
|                  | Taxus media             | Taxaceae     | Paclitaxel                     | 1.44                       | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [15]      |
|                  | Ajuga bracteosa         | Lamiaceae    | Phytoecdysteroids              | 4.49                       | Coronatine             | 1                  | [101]     |
|                  | Rhinacanthus nasutus    | Acanthaceae  | Rhinacanthin                   | 6.3                        | Methyl jasmonate       | 10                 | [102]     |
|                  | Catharanthus roseus     | Apocynaceae  | Tabersonine                    | 3                          | Methyl jasmonate       | 250                | [103]     |
|                  | Salvia przewalskii     | Lamiaceae    | Tanshinone II A               | 0.4                        | Methyl jasmonate       | 400                | [78]      |
|                  | Salvia miltiorrhiza     | Lamiaceae    | Tanshinones                    | 2.5                        | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [80]      |
|                  | Salvia miltiorrhiza     | Lamiaceae    | Tanshinones                    | 0.95                       | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [104] *   |
|                  | Salvia miltiorrhiza     | Lamiaceae    | Tanshinones                    | 11.33                      | Methyl jasmonate       | 100                | [105]     |
|                  | Salvia castanea         | Lamiaceae    | Tanshinones                    | 1.99                       | Yeast extract          | 729.12             | [106] *   |
|                  | Tripterygium wilfordii  | Celastraceae | Triptolide                     | 0.15                       | Methyl jasmonate       | 50                 | [107]     |
|                  | Psammosilene tunicoides| Caryophyllaceae | Triterpenoid saponins       | 15                         | Chitosan               | 131.01             | [108] *   |
### Table 1. Cont.

| Metabolite Group | Plant Species         | Plant Family | Secondary Metabolites | Yield/Productivity (mg/g DW) | Elicitor          | Concentration (µM) | Reference |
|------------------|-----------------------|--------------|-----------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------|-----------|
|                   | Silene linicola       | Caryophyllaceae | Turkesterone          | 0.138                        | Methyl jasmonate  | 100                | [99]      |
|                   | Lepcehinia cauliculcens | Lamiaceae   | Ursolic acid          | 0.29                         | Methyl jasmonate  | 300                | [77]      |
|                   | Ocimum tenuiflorum L.  | Lamiaceae   | Ursolic acid          | 1.56                         | Yeast extract     | 182.28             | [63]      |
|                   | Valeriana jatamansi   | Caprifoliaceae | Valtrate              | 11.57                        | Methyl jasmonate  | 100                | [26]      |
|                   | Tripterygium wilfordii | Celastraceae | Wilforine             | 3                            | Methyl jasmonate  | 50                 | [107]     |
|                   | Withania somnifera     | Solanaceae   | Withaferin A          | 19.65                        | Chitosan          | 65.5               | [109]     |
|                   | Withania somnifera     | Solanaceae   | Withaferin A          | 5.275                        | Methyl jasmonate  | 15                 | [110]     |
|                   | Withania somnifera     | Solanaceae   | Withanoside A         | 13.21                        | Methyl jasmonate  | 15                 | [110]     |
|                   | Withania somnifera     | Solanaceae   | Withanoside IV        | 0.192                        | Methyl jasmonate  | 15                 | [110]     |
|                   | Withania somnifera     | Solanaceae   | Withanoside V         | 0.161                        | Methyl jasmonate  | 15                 | [110]     |
|                   | Panax ginseng          | Araliaceae   | Ginsenosides          | 58.65                        | Methyl jasmonate  | 20                 | [111]     |

* the study is mentioned in the text. ** yield/productivity is represented in other units, DE (dry extract), GAE (gallic acid equivalent).

Several examples are outlined here, grouping different studies according to the type of secondary metabolite. When a biotic elicitor is not mentioned in a group of secondary metabolites, it is due to the fact that no references have been found.

#### 4.1. Alkaloids

4.1.1. Acetylsalicylic Acid and Salicylic Acid

(A) The yield of the tropane alkaloids hyoscyamine and scopolamine increased after elicitation with 1000 µM ASA in hairy root cultures of *Anisodus luridus*, reaching 57.2 and 14.7 mg/g dry weight (DW), respectively. One thousand µM ASA also strongly induced the release of scopolamine to the culture medium, resulting in a content of 1.02 mg/mL, which is 6.2-fold higher compared to the control [52].

(B) The highest accumulation of hyoscyamine and scopolamine in *Hyoscyamus reticulatus* hairy roots elicited with ASA (1.6- and 3.5-fold higher than in the control, respectively) was obtained at 24 h of exposure to 100 µM ASA. In correlation with these results, semi-quantitative RT-PCR analysis revealed an increased expression of the hyoscyamine-6-beta-hydroxylase (*h6h*) gene, involved in the last biosynthetic step of these tropane alkaloids [56].

(C) A study on transgenic hairy root lines of *Datura stramonium*, *D. innoxia* and *D. tatula* revealed that the optimal elicitation conditions for the highest production of hyoscyamine was with 0.1 µM ASA, yielding up to 7.94 ± 0.14 mg/g DW [48].

(D) Elicitation of *Isatis tinctoria* L. hairy roots with 142.61 mM SA increased the alkaloid content 5.89-fold compared with the control hairy roots. In this study, SA was more effective than ASA and MeJA. The best results for all these elicitors were achieved within the concentration range of 100–200 mM [43].

(E) Diploid and tetraploid hairy roots of *Datura stramonium* were elicited with 100 mM SA and 100 mM ASA. Both elicitors increased hyoscyamine production, although the best treatment for both types of roots was 100 mM SA, which increased the hyoscyamine content to 7.697 mg/g DW in the diploid line and 12.315 mg/g DW in the tetraploid line, an improvement of 190% and 126%, respectively. A synergistic effect of polyploidization and elicitation was observed [49].
4.1.2. Chitosan

The production of trigonelline, an alkaloid synthesized by fenugreek hairy roots (*Trigonella foenum-graecum*), was studied using different concentrations of MeJA (0, 25, 50, 100 and 200 µM) and CS (0, 50, 100, 150, and 200 mg/L). The highest content of trigonelline (37.3 mM/g DW) was obtained with an elicitation treatment of 150 mg/L CS. It was demonstrated that hairy root cultures, in addition to being fast-growing, have rates of secondary metabolite production equal to or greater than the intact plant [55].

4.1.3. Coronatine

Fattahi et al. [57] studied the effect of the new elicitors methyl-β-cyclodextrins (β-CD) and COR on tropane alkaloid biosynthesis in *Atropa acuminata* and *A. belladonna* hairy root cultures. Selected hairy root lines of both species were elicited with 50 mM β-CD, 0.5 µM COR or 50 mM β-CD + 0.5 µM COR on day 14 of culture. In *A. belladonna* hairy roots all the elicitor treatments had a negative effect on both hyoscyamine and scopolamine production, whereas in those of *A. acuminata*, COR elicitation increased the scopolamine content 10-fold compared to the control (10.95 mg/g DW).

4.1.4. Jasmonic Acid and Methyl Jasmonate

(A) Hairy root cultures of *Papaver orientale* were elicited by 100 µM MeJA and 100 µM SA to increase the production of the morphinan alkaloids thebaine, morphine and codeine. MeJA was more effective than SA, resulting in the following improved content: thebaine 3.08 mg/g DW (2.63-fold higher than the untreated control), morphine 5.38 mg/g DW (6.18-fold higher) and codeine 2.57 mg/g DW (3.67-fold higher) [50].

(B) Improved accumulation of terpene indole alkaloids in hairy root cultures of *Rhazya stricta* was obtained by elicitation with MeJA at different concentrations. Treatment with 100 µM MeJA induced a significant increase in the total content of vindoline-type alkaloids [58].

(C) The elicitation of *Taxus x media* var. *Hicksii* hairy roots with 100 µM MeJA proved a highly efficient strategy to enhance taxane production, especially paclitaxel. The production of total paclitaxel (intracellular + released to the medium) increased 3-fold after 7 days of elicitation, reaching a maximum of 1432.5 µg/g DW after 14 days in a perfluorodecalin-supported system [15].

4.1.5. Pectin

Hairy root cultures of *Solanum melongena* were treated with a range of elicitors at different concentrations to increase the content of solasodine, a commercially important alkaloid used as a precursor for the production of complex steroidal compounds. The tested elicitors were YE (1 g/L, 2 g/L, 3 g/L), SA (50, 100, 200, 500 µM) and pectin (0.5%, 1%, 1.5%, 2%). Pectin 1% was found to be the most efficient elicitor to enhance solasodine production, the yield (151.23 µg/g DW) representing a 23-fold increase compared to control hairy roots (6.5 µg/g DW) and up to 88-fold compared to field grown plants (1.71 µg/g DW) [54].

4.1.6. Yeast Extract

(A) Hedayati et al. [44] demonstrated that YE can be used as an effective elicitor to increase tropane alkaloids production in hairy root cultures of *A. belladonna*, although it has a negative effect on growth. Different concentrations of YE (0, 0.5, 1 and 1.5 mg/L) an exposure times (24 and 48 h) were tested. The highest content of scopolamine (9.21%) and atropine (43.39%) were obtained by 1 and 1.5 mg/L YE, respectively, representing a 9- and 5-fold improvement compared to the control.
4.2. Phenols

4.2.1. Acetylsalicylic Acid and Salicylic Acid

(A) Rosmarinic acid production in *Prunella vulgaris* L. hairy roots increased 1.3-fold relative to the control hairy roots after elicitation with 6.9 mg/L SA (58.3 mg/g DW) [79].

4.2.2. Chitosan

(A) Jiao et al. [64] found that elicitation of *Isatis tinctoria* L. hairy root cultures by CS was the best treatment to enhance the production of pharmacologically active flavonoids. Compared to control conditions (2.31 ± 0.29 mg/g DW), a 7.08-fold enhancement of total flavonoids (16.35 ± 0.88 mg/g DW) was achieved in 24-day-old *I. tinctoria* hairy root cultures elicited by 150 mg/L CS for 36 h. Interestingly, in these conditions, the significant increase in multiple hydroxyl-substituted flavonoids (rutin, quercetin, isorhamnetin, and isoliquiritigenin) was accompanied by a significant up-regulation of flavonoid biosynthetic genes.

(B) The effect of CS on the production of alizarin, an anticancer phenol produced by *Rubia cordifolia* L. hairy roots, was clearly demonstrated when elicitation with 150 mg/L CS produced a 10-fold higher accumulation compared to control hairy roots after 15 days of cultivation (4.65 ppm versus 0.48 ppm, respectively) [85].

4.2.3. Coronatine

In a study with different tissues of *Linum austriacum*, the effect of elicitation on biomass production and content of justidicin B, a type of lignan synthesized by *Linum* species for plant defense, was tested. Three different in vitro cultures (calli, adventitious roots and hairy roots) were treated with 100 µM MeJA or 10 µM COR. In control samples, the phenol content in hairy roots was double that of calli and adventitious roots. The highest accumulation of total phenols in each tissue was achieved by COR treatment, and the highest overall phenol content was observed in the COR-elicited hairy roots (9.84 µg/mg DW) being 1.5-fold higher than in the control [71].

4.2.4. Jasmonic Acid and Methyl Jasmonate

(A) Daidzin (7-O-glucoside of daidzein) production in hairy roots of *Psoralea corylifolia* L. was enhanced after elicitation with JA. The best response was a 2.8-fold increase in daidzin (5.09% DW) after two weeks of treatment with 1 µM JA and a 7.3-fold increase (3.43% DW) after 10 weeks with 10 µM JA compared to the untreated control. ASA was also assayed, but the results were inferior [86].

(B) *Astragalus membranaceus* hairy root cultures were elicited with MeJA, SA and ASA to increase isoflavonoid production. The optimal enhancement was obtained in hairy roots elicited by 283 µM MeJA. The isoflavonoid yield was 2250.10 ± 71.88 µg/g DW, i.e., a 9.71-fold increase compared to the non-treated control. ASA was also assayed, but the results were inferior [69].

(C) Elicitation of *Isatis tinctoria* L. hairy roots with 179.54 mM MeJA increased the content of flavonoids 11.21-fold compared with the control hairy roots. MeJA was more effective than SA and ASA. All three tested elicitors performed best at concentrations of 100–200 mM [43].

(D) *Swertia chirayita* hairy root cultures elicited with 100 µM MeJA was reported as an efficient system for the production of bioactive xanthones. The highest content of swerchirin (0.710 ± 0.13 mg/g DW) and 1,2,5,6-tetrahydroxyxanthone (5.501 ± 0.73 mg/g DW) was obtained only 6 days after elicitation, representing a 1.80- and 6.0-fold increase compared to the control, respectively [83].

(E) Martin et al. [89] reported that the highest production of plumbagin from *Plumbago indica* L. hairy roots was obtained after an elicitation with 50 µM MeJA for 48 h. In these conditions, the yield of plumbagin increased significantly by 5% DW, which was almost 1.5-fold higher compared to the ASA treatment. Additionally, the *Plumbago indica* L. hairy roots were able to produce shoots, and transgenic plantlets were regenerated on MS medium supplemented with 8.8 µM benzyladenine and 2.5 µM indole-3-butyric acid.
(F) Despite reducing growth, elicitation with 100 µM MeJA significantly increased the content of silymarin (1.2 mg/g DW) in *Silybum marianum* hairy roots after 48 h and up-regulated the expression of *lox* (lipxygenase), *pod* (peroxidase) and *apx* (ascorbate peroxidase) genes [82].

(G) The pharmaceutical potential of *Aster scaber* hairy roots was demonstrated when elicitation with 100 µM MeJA for 4 days dramatically increased the accumulation of total phenolics (244.5 ± 2.5 mg/g gallic acid equivalent (GAE)) and flavonoids (6.7 ± 0.3 mg/g quercetin equivalent (QE)) compared to the non-elicited root cultures (181.65 ± 1.5 and 4.65 ± 0.2 mg/g GAE, mg/g QE respectively). These phenolic compounds included six hydroxycinnamic acids, seven flavonols, seven hydroxybenzoic acids, vanillin, homogentisic acid, and resveratrol [88].

(H) The production of isoflavones by *Glycine max* hairy roots was studied using different concentrations of MeJA and SA. Notably, 72 h exposure to 100 µM MeJA enhanced total isoflavones production in 30-day-old hairy roots (53.16 mg/g DW; 10.67-fold increase), which doubled the production obtained using 200 µM SA at 96 h (28.79 mg/g DW; 5.78-fold increase) [68].

4.2.5. Yeast Extract

(A) The effect of abiotic and biotic elicitors (MeJA, CS, SA, *Agrobacterium* and YE) at various concentrations on total isoflavonoid accumulation was studied in hairy root cultures of *Pueraria candollei*. All elicitors stimulated isoflavonoid production, but 0.5 mg/mL YE was the most efficient resulting in a total isoflavonoid yield (60.5 ± 1 mg/g DW), 4.5-fold higher than in the control [67].

(B) Wilczan ska-Barska et al. [84] reported an enhanced secondary metabolite production in *Scutellaria lateriflora* hairy roots after elicitation with 50 mg/L YE. Acetoside increased 1.4-fold (18.5 mg/g DW) and flavone 1.7-fold (14.5 mg/g DW) at 7 and 14 days of elicitation, respectively.

4.3. Terpenes

4.3.1. Acetylsalicylic Acid and Salicylic Acid

(A) Hairy roots of *Andrographis paniculate* were elicited with different concentrations of MeJA and SA to increase production of the diterpenoid andrographolide. Both elicitors were most effective at 100 µM, SA produced better results than MeJA, resulting in an eight-fold increase versus a five-fold increase, respectively, compared to the control hairy roots [91]. Adventitious roots of this plant elicited with 25 µM JA increased andrographolide content 4-fold [112].

4.3.2. Chitosan

(A) Hairy root cultures of *Calotropis gigantea* were elicited with MeJA, YE and CS to increase ardenolide production. While all elicitors had a positive effect, the highest cardenolide yield (1.050 mg/L) was obtained with 50 mg/L CS, which was 2.7-fold higher than in the control [94].

(B) When hairy root cultures of *Psammosilene tunicoides* were elicited with 200 mg/L CS, the total triterpenoid saponin accumulation (14.82 mg/g) increased 4.55-fold compared with the control. This treatment also enhanced the release of saponins to the liquid medium, the maximum (38.6%) being observed at day nine of culture [108].

4.3.3. Coronatine

Vaccaro et al. [90] demonstrated that it was possible to significantly increase the amount of bioactive abietane diterpenes in *Salvia sclarea* hairy roots by transcriptional reprogramming induced by COR, and to a lesser extent, MeJA. Both elicitors significantly improved the accumulation of aethiopinone, but prolonged exposure to MeJA inhibited hairy root growth, which in contrast was unaffected by COR. Based on the aethiopinone content and the final hairy root biomass, the optimal system was considered to be COR.
treatment for 28 days, when the yield was 24-fold higher (up to 105.34 ± 2.30 mg/L) compared to the basal content in untreated hairy roots. MeJA and COR elicitation also enhanced the synthesis of other bioactive abietane–quinone diterpenes.

4.3.4. Jasmonic Acid and Methyl Jasmonate

(A) JA was found to be a very effective elicitor for the enhancement of production, accumulation and secretion of triterpenoids in two lines of *Calendula officinalis* hairy roots. The addition of 100 µM JA increased the accumulation of oleanolic acid saponins in the hairy root tissue up to 20-fold and notably, the secretion of these compounds to the medium up to 113-fold [100].

(B) Diterpenoid production in *Salvia miltiorrhiza* hairy roots increased after elicitation with 100 µM MeJA: 3.9-fold for cryptotanshinone and tanshinone IIA, 3.0-fold for tanshinone I and 1.3-fold for dihydrotanshinone [104].

(C) Hairy roots of *Panax ginseng* elicited with 100 µM MeJA showed an increase in ginsenoside production compared to the control, the levels of the protopanaxadiol group (Rb1, Rb2, Rb3, Re, and Rd) being much higher than those of the protopanaxatriol group (Rg1, Re, Rf, and Rg2) [96].

(D) 100 µM MeJA was reported to be the most efficient elicitor for improving glycyrrhizin production in *Glycyrrhiza inflata* hairy roots. At day 5 of elicitation, the content of this secondary metabolite increased 5.7-fold (almost 109 µg/g DW) compared to control roots. Other elicitors such as CS did not affect the glycyrrhizin content [98].

4.3.5. Yeast Extract

(A) A study on tanshinones accumulation in *Salvia castanea* Diels f. tomentosa Stib. hairy root cultures elicited with YE (200 µM), MeJA (200 µM) and Ag⁺ (15 µM) showed that all three elicitors enhanced the tanshinone yields (cryptotanshinone, tanshinone I and tanshinone IIA), but the highest content of each one was obtained with the YE [106].

5. The Main Biotic Elicitors Used in Adventitious Roots from 2010 to 2022

Table 2 summarizes the data on elicitation in adventitious root cultures from 2010 to 2022.

**Table 2.** Elicitation in adventitious roots from 2010 to 2022.

| Metabolite Group | Plant Species | Plant Family | Secondary Metabolites | Yield/Productivity (mg/g DW) | Elicitor | Concentration (µM) | Reference |
|------------------|---------------|--------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------|---------|-------------------|-----------|
| Phenol           | *Aloe vera*   | Asphodelaceae| Emodin                | 0.025                         | Salycilic acid | 2000               | [113] *   |
|                  | *Morinda coreia* | Rubiaceae     | Anthraquinones        | 292.038                       | Chitosan   | 262.03            | [114] *   |
|                  | *Rubia tinctorum L.* | Rubiaceae     | Anthraquinones        | 31.47                         | Salycilic acid | 20               | [115] *   |
|                  | *Morinda citrifolia* | Rubiaceae     | Anthraquinones        | 103.16                        | Chitosan   | 131.02            | [22] *    |
|                  | *Fagonia indica* | Zygophyllaceae| Apigenin              | 25.3                          | Methyl jasmonate | 2.22             | [116] *   |
|                  | *Polygonum multiflorum* | Polygonaceae  | Bioactive compounds   | 22.08                         | Methyl jasmonate | 50              | [117] *   |
| Phenol           | *Aloe vera*   | Asphodelaceae| Chrysophanol          | 0.55                          | Salycilic acid | 4000             | [113] *   |
|                  | *Morinda citrifolia* | Rubiaceae     | Phenolic compounds    | 75.32                         | Chitosan   | 131.02            | [22] *    |
|                  | *Eleutherococcus koranum* | Araliaceae   | Total flavonoids      | 10                            | Methyl jasmonate | 100             | [118] *   |
| Phenol           | *Morinda coreia* | Rubiaceae     | Phenolic compounds    | 86.8 mg/g GAE **              | Chitosan   | 262.03            | [114] *   |
|                  | *Rubia tinctorum L.* | Rubiaceae     | Phenolic compounds    | 31.63 mg/g GAE **             | Salycilic acid | 40              | [115] *   |
| Phenol           | *Morinda citrifolia* | Rubiaceae     | Phenolics             | 48.57 mg/g GAE **             | Chitosan   | 131.02            | [22] *    |
|                  | *Eleutherococcus koranum* | Araliaceae   | Total phenolics       | 22.48 mg/g GAE **             | Methyl jasmonate | 100             | [118] *   |
### Table 2. Cont.

| Metabolite Group | Plant Species | Plant Family | Secondary Metabolites | Yield/Productivity (mg/g DW) | Elicitor | Concentration (µM) | Reference |
|-----------------|---------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------|---------|-------------------|-----------|
| Terpene         | *Andrographis paniculata* | Acanthaceae | Andrographolide | 25.48 | Jasmonic acid | 25 | [112] * |
|                 | *Perovskia abrotanoides* | Lamiaceae | Cryptotanshinone | 0.44 | Yeast extract | 0.131 | [119] * |
|                 | *Panax Ginseng* | Araliaceae | Ginsenosides | 3.5 | Jasmonic acid | 23778 | [120] * |
|                 | *Panax Ginseng* | Araliaceae | Ginsenosides | 3.3 | Jasmonic acid | 47557 | [120] * |
|                 | *Panax Ginseng* | Araliaceae | Ginsenosides | 3.7 | Jasmonic acid | 237789 | [120] * |
|                 | *Panax quinquefolium* | Araliaceae | Ginsenosides | 43.66 | Methyl jasmonate | 22.29 | [121] * |
|                 | *Panax Ginseng* | Araliaceae | Ginsenosides | 1 | Salycilic acid | 100 | [122] * |
|                 | *Valeriana amurensis* | Caprifoliaceae | Valtrate | 10.58 | Methyl jasmonate | 445.8 | [123] * |
|                 | *Tripterygium wilfordii* | Celastraceae | Wilforidine | 17.81 | Methyl jasmonate | 50 | [124] * |
|                 | *Withania somnifera* | Solanaceae | Whitanone | 1.13 | Salycilic acid | 150 | [125] |
|                 | *Withania somnifera* | Solanaceae | Withaferin a | 0.85 | Salycilic acid | 150 | [125] |
|                 | *Withania somnifera* | Solanaceae | Withanolide a | 1.32 | Salycilic acid | 150 | [125] |
|                 | *Withania somnifera* | Solanaceae | Withanolide b | 1.16 | Salycilic acid | 150 | [125] |

* the study is mentioned in the text. ** yield/productivity is represented in other units, GAE (gallic acid equivalent).

Several examples are outlined here, grouping different studies according to the type of secondary metabolite. When a biotic elicitor is not mentioned in a group of secondary metabolites, it is due to the fact that no references have been found.

### 5.1. Phenols

#### 5.1.1. Acetylsalicylic Acid and Salicylic Acid

(A) The content of anthraquinone and phenolic compounds in adventitious root cultures of *Rubia tinctorum* L. was improved by the action of SA. The root growth decreased significantly when the SA concentration was increased to 40 µM. The highest content of anthraquinones was obtained with 20 µM SA (31.47 mg/g DW) but the total anthraquinone yield decreased when the concentration increased to 40 µM, probably due to the reduction in root growth rate. In contrast, the total phenolic contents were higher when using 40 µM SA than 20 µM (31.63 and 30.49 mg/g DW, respectively) [115].

(B) The yield of emodin increased 10-fold and chrysophanol 13-fold in adventitious roots of *Aloe vera* due to the effect of SA [113].

#### 5.1.2. Chitosan

(A) Elicitation of adventitious roots of *Morinda citrifolia* with 131.02 µM CS increase in secondary metabolites such as anthraquinones (103.16 mg/g DW), flavonoids (48.57 mg/g DW) and phenolic compounds (75.32 mg/g DW) [22].

(B) Elicitation of *Morinda coreira* Buck adventitious roots with 0.4 mg/mL CS, observed to be the most effective concentration, resulted in a reduction in growth ratio and biomass (fresh and DW) from day two to eight, with an increase in yield of anthraquinones (292.038 mg/g DW) and phenolics (86.8 mg/g DW) until day 4 [114].

#### 5.1.3. Jasmonic Acid and Methyl Jasmonate

(A) The total phenolic compounds and more specifically, the total flavonoids produced by adventitious roots of *Eleutherococcus koreanum* Nakai were analyzed by Lee et al. [118]. The use of 100 mM MeJA increased the production of flavonoids 1.35-fold, and total phenolic compounds was 1.69-fold compared to untreated roots [118].

(B) *Polygonum multiforum* adventitious roots were treated with different elicitors: MeJA, CS, SA, and YE. HPLC analysis of various bioactive compounds revealed significantly higher elicitation efficiency for MeJA than for the other treatments. An approximately
2-fold increase in root dry weight (22.08 mg/g DW) was induced by 50 µM MeJA compared with the control (10.35 mg/g DW) [117].

(C) Adventitious roots of *Fagonia indica* were treated with MeJA to increase the content of useful secondary metabolites. As a result of the treatment, the production of apigenin was increased 1.6-fold compared with the untreated control [116].

5.2. Terpenes

5.2.1. Acetylsalicylic Acid and Salicylic Acid

(A) The yield of ginsenosides of *Panax Ginseng* adventitious roots was increased by elicitation with 100 µM SA [122]. However, the maximum productivity (1 mg/g DW) was lower than the highest previously reported by Marsik et al. [120], 3.7 mg/g DW using JA.

5.2.2. Jasmonic Acid and Methyl Jasmonate

(A) Andrographolide is a diterpene lactone whose production in *Andrographis paniculata* adventitious roots increased 10.8-fold after the first week of elicitation with 25 µM JA compared to the control. The other biotic elicitors tested, SA, ASA and methyl salicylic acid, had less effect [112].

(B) Adventitious roots of *Panax ginseng* were elicited with different concentrations of JA: 5, 10 and 50 mg/mL, resulting in a 2.59-, 2.44- and 2.74-fold increase, respectively, in ginsenoside production compared with untreated roots. The maximum yield was achieved by elicitation with 50 mg/mL JA [120].

(C) Adventitious roots of *Tripterygium wilfordii* Hook, f. were treated with MeJA to increase the production of the diterpene triptolide, and the sesquiterpene alkaloids wilforine and wilforine. Compared to the control, improvements in production were 2.61-fold for triptolide (17.81 mg/g DW) with 50 mM MeJA; 2.63-fold for wilforine (152.18 mg/g DW) with 100 mM MeJA (57.75 mg/g DW); and 1.82-fold for wilforine (10.771 mg/g DW) with 100 mM MeJA. The root cultures were also elicited with SA (50 mM and 100 mM) but no significant increase in the production of the three compounds was observed [124].

(D) Adventitious roots of *Valeriana amurensis* Smir. ex Kom were elicited with MeJA, JA, SA, CS and YE to enhance valtrate production. The most effective treatment was MeJA at 100 mg/mL, which achieved a valtrate content of 10.58 mg/g DW, 3.6-fold higher than the control [123].

(E) *Panax quinquefolium* adventitious roots treated with 5 mg/L MeJA had a 5.24-fold higher ginsenoside content than the control (43.66 mg/g versus 8.32 mg/g, respectively) [121].

5.2.3. Yeast Extract

(A) Tanshinone (cryptotanshinone and tanshinone IIA) production in adventitious root cultures of *Perovskia abrotanoides* Karel was determined after elicitation with 200 µg/mL YE. The treatment had a greater effect on cryptotanshinone than tanshinone IIA, the maximum level (443.62 µg/g DW) being 3.6-fold higher compared to the control, whereas tanshinone IIA increased 1.3-fold [119].

(B) When adventitious roots of *Panax Ginseng* were treated with YE, both growth and production of ginsenosides were lower than in the control [120].

6. The Main Combinations of Biotic Elicitors Used from 2010 to 2022

Biotic elicitors are also used in combination with other elicitors, as well as nutrients or precursors, to achieve better results [41]. Although several compounds may be applied together, here we have focused only on combinations of two elicitors, and at least one of them is biotic. Table 3 summarizes the data on the use of combined elicitation in adventitious and hairy root cultures from 2010 to 2022. When a biotic elicitor is not mentioned in a group of secondary metabolites, it is due to the fact that no references have been found.
Table 3. Combined elicitation in adventitious and hairy roots from 2010 to 2022.

| Culture System | Metabolite Group | Plant Species | Plant Family | Secondary Metabolites | Yield/Productivity (mg/g DW) | Elicitor | Reference |
|----------------|------------------|---------------|--------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|---------|-----------|
| Hairy roots    | Alkaloid         | Catharanthus roseus | Apocynaceae | Ajmalicine          | 15.4 | Methyl jasmonate (108.85 µM) + Jasmonic acid (134.08 µM) + Potassium chloride (3.5 g/L) | [126] * |
| Phenol         | Phenol           | Taxus x media  | Taxaceae     | Matairesinol         | 0.199 | Comfrey alcohol (1 µM) + L-phenylalanine (100 µM) + Methyl jasmonate (100 µM) | [127] |
| Terpene        | Phenol           | Gentiana dinarica | Gentianaceae | Norswertianin       | 15  | Chitosan (50 mg/L) + Salicylic acid (200 µM) | [73] * |
| Adventitious roots | Phenol       | Plumbago indica | Plumbaginaceae | Plumbagin           | 11.96 | Chitosan (200 mg/L) + Methyl jasmonate (80 µM) | [126] * |
|                | Alkaloid         | Arachis hypogaea | Fabaceae     | Trans-arachidin-1   | 684 mg/g DE ** | Chitosan (50 mg/L) + Methyl jasmonate (100 µM) + Cyclodextrin (6.87 mM) | [129] |
|                | Phenol           | Centella asiatica | Apiaceae     | Centellosides       | 134.6 | Coronatine (1 µM) + Methyl jasmonate (100 µM) | [130] |
|                | Phenol           | Salvia miltiorrhiza | Lamiaceae   | Tanshinones         | 2.2 | Methyl jasmonate (100 µM) + UV | [131] * |
|                | Phenol           | Salvia miltiorrhiza | Lamiaceae   | Tanshinones         | 3   | β-cyclodextrin + Silver nanoparticles (30 mg/L) | [132] |
|                | Phenol           | Rubia tinctorum | Rubiaceae    | Anthraquinones      | 30.13 | Salicylic acid (20 µM) + L-phenylalanine (50 µM) | [115] * |
|                | Phenol           | Morinda citrifolia | Rubiaceae   | Anthraquinones      | 98.9 | Chitosan (131.02 µM) + Pectin (515.09 µM) | [22] * |
|                | Phenol           | Rubia tinctorum | Rubiaceae    | Phenolic compounds  | 35.2 mg/g GAE ** | Salicylic acid (40 µM) + L-phenylalanine (100 µM) | [115] * |
|                | Phenol           | Arachis hypogaea | Fabaceae     | Trans-arachidin-3   | 543 mg/g DE ** | Chitosan (50 mg/L) + Methyl jasmonate (100 µM) + Cyclodextrin (6.87 mM) | [129] |

* the study is mentioned in the text. ** yield/productivity is represented in other units, DE (dry extract), GAE (gallic acid equivalent).

6.1. In Hairy Roots

6.1.1. Alkaloids

The addition of a statistically optimized mixture of elicitors (134.08 µM JA, 108.85 µM MeJA and 3.5 g/L KCl) after 48 h of fed-batch culture of *Catharanthus roseus* hairy roots resulted in a high production of ajmalicine (123.2 ± 8.63 mg/L), a 4-fold improvement compared to bath cultivation alone [126].

6.1.2. Phenols

(A) Krstić-Milošević et al. [73] studied the effect of SA, JA, MeJA, CS and YE elicitors on growth and xanthone accumulation in two hairy root clones of *Gentiana dinarica*. The highest concentrations of all elicitors strongly increased the content of the xanthone aglycone norswertianin, but reduced the production of its glycoside norswertianin-1-O-primeveroside. The most efficient treatment to enhance norswertianin production was a combination of SA (200 µM) and CS (50 mg/L) applied for 7 days, which yielded a 24-fold increase in norswertianin content.

(B) A combination of biotic and abiotic elicitors was found to be the best treatment in order to increase the contents of plumbagin in *Plumbago indica* hairy roots. The use of a yeast carbohydrate fraction, manganese chloride, copper chloride, CS and MeJA not only significantly enhanced (~1.2 to 2 fold) plumbagin production in a shake flask culture compared with the control, but the co-presence of CS and MeJA also promoted plumbagin release into the culture media. The maximum total plumbagin yield (11.96 ± 0.76 mg/g DW) was obtained after three days of simultaneous exposure to CS (200 mg/L) and MeJA (80 µM). When hairy roots were transferred from shake flasks to a bioreactor culture, a significant increase in fresh root biomass was recorded at day 20, together with a further improvement in total plumbagin production (13.16 ± 1.72 mg/g DW) [128].
6.1.3. Terpenes

Ultraviolet-B irradiation and 100 mM MeJA were applied separately and in combination in *S. miltiorrhiza* hairy root cultures to increase tanshinone production (cryptotanshinone, tanshinone I and tanshinone IIA). The combined treatment induced the maximum tanshinone production (28.21 mg/L), which was 4.9-fold higher compared to the control. The content of cryptotanshinone and tanshinone I was higher than that of tanshinone IIA [131].

6.2. In Adventitious Roots

**Phenols**

(A) The synergic action of SA and L-Phe increased the content of anthraquinones in adventitious root cultures of *Rubia tinctorum* L. and promoted growth. The maximum anthraquinone content achieved was 30.13 mg/g DW. The combined action of 40 μM SA and 100 μM L-Phe also yielded the highest total phenolic content (35.20 mg/g DW) [115].

(B) Adventitious root suspension cultures of *Morinda citrifolia* treated with CS and pectin enhanced anthraquinone production at 98.9 mg/g DW [22].

7. Database Charts and Tables

The data below refer only to hairy roots elicited with a single elicitor, as they are far more numerous than for hairy roots treated with more than one elicitor or for adventitious roots.

In hairy root cultures, the most frequently used elicitor according to the databases is methyl jasmonate (62 studies), with phenolic compounds being the most studied group of secondary metabolites (61 studies) and alkaloids the least (21 studies) (Figure 1).

![Figure 1](image-url)  
*Figure 1.* Number of recorded uses of each elicitor in hairy roots by group of secondary metabolites from 2010 to 11 January 2022.

In hairy roots, the highest production value of a phenolic compound was achieved when using MeJA (123.6 mg/g DW) [66], which is the highest value found for all the secondary metabolites. The highest production value for an alkaloid (60 mg/g DW) was obtained by treatment with ASA [56] and for terpenes JA (58.65 mg/g DW) [111] (Figure 2).
In hairy roots, the highest production value of a phenolic compound was achieved when using MeJA (123.6 mg/g DW) [66], which is the highest value found for all the secondary metabolites. The highest production value for an alkaloid (60 mg/g DW) was obtained by treatment with ASA [56] and for terpenes JA (58.65 mg/g DW) [111] (Figure 2).

Figure 2. Maximum production (mg/g DW) value of each metabolite group in hairy roots according to the elicitor used, from 2010 to 11 January 2022.

In hairy roots, the widest range of elicitor concentration applied was with chitosan (19.7–3650 μM) and yeast extract (0.2–729 μM). The most frequently used elicitor concentration (mode value), regardless of metabolite group, was 100 μM for MeJA and SA. On the other hand, the concentrations of COR are variable according to the metabolite group (Table 4).

Table 4. Concentration range (μM) of elicitors applied in hairy roots according to the metabolite group, from 2010 to 11 January 2022.
Table 4. Cont.

| Elicitor     | Metabolite Group | Alkaloid | Phenol | Terpene |
|--------------|------------------|----------|--------|---------|
| Yeast extract| Range (µM)       | (5.46–5.46) | (0.2–200) | (182.28–729) |
|              | Mode (µM)        | 5.46     | ND     | 182.28  |

In hairy root cultures, the Solanaceae are the most studied plant family and have been treated with various elicitors, except JA and YE. The most frequently used elicitor in a particular family is MeJA in the Lamiaceae (20 cases) (Figure 3).

The highest production value of a metabolite (123.6 mg/g DW) found in this work was observed in MeJA-elicited *Salvia virgata*, a member of the Lamiaceae [66] (Figure 4). The maximum production value was reported by a research group from Iran using methyl jasmonate (123.6 mg/g DW) [66] (Figures S1 and S2).

Furthermore, the widest range of elicitor concentration was found for yeast extract applied in the Lamiaceae (0.2–729 µM). The most common value (mode) of elicitor concentration, regardless of plant family, was 100 µM, above all for MeJA and SA (Table 5).

Figure 3. Number of records of each elicitor applied in hairy root cultures by plant family, from 2010 to 11 January 2022.
Figure 4. Maximum production (mg/g DW) value achieved by each elicitor according to the plant family, from 2010 to 11 January 2022.

Table 5. Concentration range and mode value (µM) of each elicitor by plant family, from 2010 to 11 January 2022.

8. Concluding Remarks

In the last decade, although the use of in vitro culture of adventitious roots has increased, hairy roots are far more commonly used to obtain PSM. In addition, the production of secondary metabolites after elicitation is always lower in adventitious than in transformed roots, regardless of elicitor and metabolite group. Another interesting fact revealed by this review is that simple elicitation is preferred over combined elicitation, with MeJA being the most used elicitor in both types of cultures. The most frequently targeted secondary metabolites in both types of cultures are phenolic compounds, followed by terpenes and then alkaloids.

In hairy roots, MeJA is the most effective elicitor to increase phenol production, whereas JA gave better results for terpenes, and ASA for alkaloids. In adventitious roots,
CS gave the best results for phenol production and MeJA and JA for terpene production. There are no data available for alkaloids in this type of culture.

In hairy roots, the highest values of phenol production (123.6, 80 and 75.65 mg/g DW) were obtained with 100 µM MeJA \cite{66,72,80}, respectively. In contrast, in adventitious roots, the highest phenolic production values (292 and 103.16 mg/g DW) were obtained with CS at 262 µM \cite{114} and 131 µM \cite{22}, respectively. In relation to terpenes, the highest production was achieved with 20 µM JA (58.65 mg/g DW) \cite{111} and 100 µM JA (52.52 mg/g DW) \cite{100} in hairy roots, and with 22.29 µM MeJA (43.66 mg/g DW) \cite{121} and 25 µM JA (25.48 mg/g DW) in adventitious roots \cite{112}.

Regarding alkaloids, the only data found were for hairy roots, 100 µM ASA, 5.46 µM YE and 100 µM MeJA being the best elicitors for production, achieving 60, 43.39, and 35.43 mg/g DW, respectively \cite{44,55,56}.

Few data are available for combined elicitation in hairy and adventitious roots (especially the latter). In both types of cultures, combined elicitation has not improved phenolic production. The best phenolic compound yield was achieved in adventitious roots (98.9 mg/g DW) elicited with chitosan (131.02 µM) + pectin (515.09 µM) \cite{22} and in hairy roots (15 mg/g DW) elicited with chitosan (50 mg/L) + SA (200 µM) \cite{73}. Combined elicitation remains more effective than simple elicitation for increasing terpene yield in hairy roots, but not to increase alkaloid production. There are no data for this in adventitious roots. This discussion is summarized in Table 6.

### Table 6. Summary of the most frequently used elicitors and those that produce the best results for each group of secondary metabolites (from 2010 to 2022).

| Elicitor | Phenols (Most Studies) | Terpenes | Alkaloids |
|----------|------------------------|----------|-----------|
| **Hairy roots**<br>(most production) | | | |
| Most used | MeJA | MeJA | MeJA |
| Best for production | MeJA | JA | ASA |
| **Adventitious roots**<br> | | | |
| Most used | MeJA | MeJA | - |
| Best for production | CS | MeJA/JA | |

ASA: Acetylsalicylic acid; COR: Coronatine; CS: Chitosan; JA: Jasmonic acid; MeJA: Methyl jasmonate.

**Supplementary Materials:** The following are available online at https://www.mdpi.com/article/10.3390/molecules27165253/s1, Table S1: Number of records for each elicitor according to the country of origin of the research group, from 2010 to 11 January 2022. Table S2. Number of records of metabolite group studied by research group origin, from 2010 to 11 January 2022. Figure S1. Maximum production (mg/g DW) value obtained in hairy roots according to the country of origin of the research group, from 2010 to 11 January 2022. Figure S2. Maximum production (mg/g DW) value achieved in hairy roots according to the elicitor used and country of origin of the research group, from 2010 to 11 January 2022. Figure S3. Mode concentration (µM) of elicitors used by research groups according to their country of origin, from 2010 to 11 January 2022. Figure S4. Mode concentration (µM) value by elicitor in each research group origin, from 2010 to 11 January 2022. Figure S5. Maximum production (mg/g DW) value obtained for metabolite group by country, from 2010 to 11 January 2022. Figure S6. Mode concentration (µM) value of elicitor by metabolite group in each research group origin, from 2010 to 11 January 2022.

**Author Contributions:** Conceptualization, M.B. and M.A.A.; methodology, A.E.; software, M.A.A.; validation, J.P., M.B. and E.P.-M.; formal analysis, M.A.A.; investigation, A.E.; resources, E.P.-M.; data curation, A.E.; writing—original draft preparation, M.A.A.; writing—review and editing, M.B.; visualization, E.P.-M.; supervision, M.B.; project administration, R.M.C.; funding acquisition, J.P. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** This research received no external funding.

**Institutional Review Board Statement:** Not applicable.

**Informed Consent Statement:** Not applicable.
Data Availability Statement: The new data presented in this study are available within the article.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References
1. Sharma, P.; Padh, H.; Shrivastava, N. Hairy root cultures: A suitable biological system for studying secondary metabolic pathways in plants. Eng. Life Sci. 2013, 13, 62–75. [CrossRef]
2. Bensaddek, L.; Villarreal, M.L.; Filinaux, M.A. Induction and growth of hairy roots for the production of medicinal compounds. Electron. J. Biotechnol. 2008, 3, 2–9.
3. Matveeva, T.V.; Sokorna, S.V.; Lutova, L.A. Influence of Agrobacterium oncogenes on secondary metabolism of plants. Phytochem. Rev. 2015, 14, 541–554. [CrossRef]
4. Filippini, F.; Schiavo, F.L.; Terzi, M.; Costantino, P.; Trovato, M. The plant oncogene rol B alters binding of auxin to plant cell membranes. Plant Cell Physiol. 1994, 35, 767–771. [CrossRef]
5. Filippini, F.; Rossi, V.; Marin, O.; Trovato, M.; Costantino, P.; Downey, P.M.; Io Schiavo, F.; Terzi, M. A plant oncogene as a phosphatase. Nature 1996, 379, 499–500. [CrossRef]
6. Altamura, M.M.; Capitani, F.; Gazza, L.; Capone, I.; Costantino, P. The plant oncogene rol B stimulates the formation of flower and root meristomides in tobacco thin cell layers. New Phytol. 1994, 126, 283–293. [CrossRef]
7. Hussain, M.J.; Abbas, Y.; Nazli, N.; Fatima, S.; Drouet, S.; Hano, C.; Abbasi, B.H. Root cultures, a boon for the production of valuable compounds: A comparative review. Plants 2022, 11, 439. [CrossRef]
8. Palazon, J.; Cusido, R.M.; Gonzalez, J.; Bonfill, M.; Morales, C.; Pinol, M.T. Relation between the amount of rol C gene product and indole alkaloid accumulation in Catharanthus roseus transformed root cultures. J. Plant Physiol. 1998, 153, 712–718. [CrossRef]
9. Palazon, J.; Cusido, R.M.; Bonfill, M.; Mallol, A.; Moyano, E.; Morales, C.; Pinol, M.T. Elicitation of different Panax ginseng transformed root phenotypes for an improved ginsenoside production. Plant Physiol. Biochem. 2003, 41, 1019–1025. [CrossRef]
10. Cusido, R.M.; Palazon, J.; Piñol, M.T.; Bonfill, M.; Morales, C. Datura metel: In vitro production of tropane alkaloids. Planta Med. 1999, 65, 144–148. [CrossRef]
11. Palazon, J.; Moyano, E.; Cusidó, R.M.; Bonfill, M.; Oksman-Caldentey, K.M.; Piñol, M.T. Alkaloid production in Duboisia hybrid hairy roots and plants overexpressing the Hōt gene. Plant Sci. 2003, 165, 1289–1295. [CrossRef]
12. Cardillo, A.B.; Giuliani, A.M.; Palazon, J.; Bonfill, M. Influence of hairy root ecotypes on production of tropane alkaloids in Brugmansia candida. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2013, 114, 305–312. [CrossRef]
13. Zhang, L.; Ding, R.; Chai, Y.; Bonfill, M.; Moyano, E.; Oksman-Caldentey, K.M.; Xu, T.; Pi, Y.; Wang, Z.; Zhang, H.; et al. Engineering tropane biosynthetic pathway in Hyoscyamus niger hairy root cultures. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 2004, 101, 6786–6791. [CrossRef]
14. Mirjalili, H.M.; Fakhri-Tabatabaei, S.M.; Bonfill, M.; Alizadeh, H.; Cusido, R.M.; Ghasempour, A.; Palazon, J. Morphology and withanolide production of Withania coagulans hairy root cultures. Eng. Life Sci. 2009, 9, 197–204. [CrossRef]
15. Sykłowska-Baranek, K.; Pilarek, M.; Bonfill, M.; Kafel, K.; Pietrosiuk, A. Perfluorodecalin-supported system enhances taxane production in hairy root cultures of Taxus x media var. Heksii carrying a taxadiene synthase transgene. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2015, 120, 1051–1059. [CrossRef]
16. Lalaleo, L.; Alcazar, R.; Palazon, J.; Moyano, E.; Cusido, R.M.; Bonfill, M. Comparing aryltetralin lignan accumulation patterns in four biotechnological systems of Linum album. J. Plant Physiol. 2018, 228, 197–207. [CrossRef]
17. Georgiev, M.I.; Pavlov, A.I.; Bley, T. Hairy root type plant in vitro systems as sources of bioactive substances. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 2007, 74, 1175–1185. [CrossRef]
18. Chandra, S.; Chandra, R.; Chandra, S.; Chandra, Á.R. Engineering secondary metabolite production in hairy roots. Phytochem. Rev. 2011, 10, 371–395. [CrossRef]
19. Mallol, A.; Cusido, R.M.; Palazón, J.; Bonfill, M.; Morales, C.; Piñol, M.T. Ginsenoside production in different phenotypes of Panax ginseng transformed roots. Phytochemistry 2013, 57, 365–371. [CrossRef]
20. Rahmat, E.; Kang, Y. Adventitious root culture for secondary metabolite production in medicinal plants: A review. Plant Biotechnol. J. 2019, 17, 143–157. [CrossRef]
21. Khanam, M.N.; Anis, M.; Javed, S.B.; Mottaghipisheh, J.; Csupor, D. Adventitious root culture-an alternative strategy for secondary metabolite production: A review. Agronomy 2012, 12, 1178. [CrossRef]
22. Baque, M.A.; Shiragi, M.H.K.; Lee, E.J.; Paek, K.Y. Elicitor effect of chitosan and pectin on the biosynthesis of anthraquinones, phenolics and flavonoids in adventitious root suspension cultures of “Marinda citrifolia” (L.). Aust. J. Crop Sci. 2012, 6, 1349–1355.
23. Alvarado, A.M.; Aguirre-Becerra, H.; Cristina Vázquez-Hernández, M.; Magaña-Lopez, E.; Parola-Contreras, I.; Caicedo-Lopez, L.H.; Contreras-Medina, L.M.; Garcia-Trejo, J.F.; Guevera-Gonzalez, R.G.; Feregrino-Perez, A.A. Influence of elicitors and eustressors on the production of plant secondary metabolites. In Natural Bio-Active Compounds: Volume 1: Production and Applications; Springer: Singapore, 2019. [CrossRef]
24. Halder, M.; Sarkar, S.; Jha, S. Elicitation: A biotechnological tool for enhanced production of secondary metabolites in hairy root cultures. Eng. Life Sci. 2019, 19, 880–895. [CrossRef]
25. Klarzynski, O.; Fritig, B. Stimulation of plant natural defenses. C. R. Acad. Sci. III 2001, 324, 953–963. [CrossRef]
26. Zhao, S.; Tang, H. Enhanced production of valtrate in hairy root cultures of Valeriana jatamansi jones by methyl jasmonate, jasmonic acid and salicylic acid elicitors. Not. Bot. Horti. Agrobot. Cluj-Napoca 2020, 48, 839–848. [CrossRef]

27. Baenas, N.; García-Viguerà, C.; Moreno, D.A. Elicitation: A tool for enriching the bioactive composition of foods. Molecules 2014, 19, 13541–13563. [CrossRef]

28. Ramirez-Estrada, K.; Vidal-Limon, H.; Hidalgo, D.; Moyano, E.; Golenioswki, M.; Cusidó, R.M.; Palazon, J. Elicitation, an effective strategy for the biotechnological production of plant secondary metabolites in hairy plant cell cultures. Molecules 2016, 21, 182. [CrossRef]

29. Goel, M.K.; Mehrrota, S.; Kukreja, A.K. Elicitor-induced cellular and molecular events are responsible for productivity enhancement in hairy root cultures: An insight study. Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol. 2011, 165, 1342–1355. [CrossRef]

30. Radman, R.; Saez, T.; Bucke, C.; Keshavarz, T. Elicitation of plants and microbial cell systems. Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol. 2003, 37, 91–102. [CrossRef]

31. Namdeo, A.G. Plant cell elicitation for production of secondary metabolites: A review. Phcog. Rev. 2007, 1, 69–79.

32. Bhaskar, R.; Xavier, L.S.; Udayakumaran, G.; Kumar, D.S.; Venkatesh, R.; Nagella, P. Biotic elicitors: A boon for the in-vitro production of plant secondary metabolites. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2021, 149, 7–24. [CrossRef]

33. Ochoa-Meza, L.C.; Quintana-Obregón, E.A.; Vargas-Arisipuro, I.; Falcón-Rodriguez, A.B.; Aispuro-Hernández, E.; Virgen-Ortiz, J.J.; Martínez-Téllez, M.A. Oligosaccharins as elicitors of defense responses in wheat. Polymers 2021, 13, 3105. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

34. Durrant, W.E.; Dong, X. Systemic acquired resistance. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 2004, 42, 185–209. [CrossRef]

35. Wasternack, C.; Hause, B. Jasmonates: Biosynthesis, perception, signal transduction and action in plant stress response, growth and development. An update to the 2007 review in annals of botany. Ann. Bot. 2013, 111, 1021–1058. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

36. Ali, B. Salicylic acid: An efficient elicitor of secondary metabolite production in plants. Biocatal. Agric. Biotechnol. 2021, 31, 101884. [CrossRef]

37. Rinaudo, M. Chitin and chitosan: Properties and applications. Prog. Polym. Sci. 2006, 31, 603–632. [CrossRef]

38. Rohde, B.H.; Pohlack, B.; Ullrich, M. Occurrence of thermoregulation of genes involved in coronatine biosynthesis among various Pseudomonas syringae strains. J. Basic Microbiol. 1998, 38, 41–50. [CrossRef]

39. Geng, X.; Jin, L.; Shimada, M.; Kim, M.G.; Mackey, D. The phytoxoton coratinine is a multifunctional component of the virulence armament of Pseudomonas syringae. Planta 2014, 240, 1149–1165. [CrossRef]

40. Nabi, N.; Singh, S.; Saffeullah, P. Responses of in vitro culture systems to elicitation: Regulatory role of jasmonic acid and methyl jasmonate: A review. In Vitro Cell. Dev. Biol. Plant 2021, 57, 341–355. [CrossRef]

41. Giri, C.C.; Zaheer, M. Elicitor-induced cellular and molecular events are responsible for productivity enhancement in hairy root cultures: Recent trends and a sky view area appraisal. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2016, 126, 1–18. [CrossRef]

42. Kertész, Z.I. The Pectic Substances; John Wiley & Sons Ltd.: Hoboken, NJ, USA, 1951; Volume 41.

43. Gai, Q.Y.; Jiao, J.; Wang, X.; Zang, Y.P.; Niu, L.L.; Fu, Y.J. Elicitation of Isatis tinctoria L. hairy root cultures by salicylic acid and methyl jasmonate for the enhanced production of pharmacologically active alkaloids and flavonoids. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2019, 137, 77–86. [CrossRef]

44. Hedayati, A.; Hemmaty, S.; Nourozi, E.; Amirsadeghi, A. Effect of yeast extract on h6h gene expression and tropane alkaloids production in Atropa belladonna L. hairy root cultures elicited with salicylic acid and methyl jasmonate. Russ. J. Plant Physiol. 2021, 68, 102–109. [CrossRef]

45. Zhou, M.L.; Zhu, X.M.; Shao, J.R.; Wu, Y.M.; Tang, Y.X. Transcriptional response of the catharanthine biosynthesis pathway to methyl jasmonate/nitric oxide elicitation in Catharanthus roseus hairy root culture. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 2010, 88, 737–750. [CrossRef]

46. Sharifzadeh Naeini, M.; Naghavi, M.R.; Bihamta, M.R.; Sabokdast, M.; Salehi, M. Production of some benzylisoquinoline alkaloids in Papaver armeniacum L. hairy root cultures elicited with salicylic acid and methyl jasmonate. In Vitro Cell. Dev. Biol. Plant 2021, 57, 261–271. [CrossRef]

47. Shiripour, R.; Saffar, R.; Laleh, A.; Amri, M.; Tavakoli, M. Production and gene expression of morphinan alkaloids in hairy root culture of Papaver orientale L. using abiotic elicitors. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2015, 125, 31–41. [CrossRef]

48. Belabbasi, O.; Kehlifi-Slaoui, M.; Zouari, D.; Benyammi, R.; Khalifallah, N.; Malik, S.; Makhzoum, A.; Kehlifi, L. Synergistic effects of polyolipidization and elicitation on biomass and hyoscyamine content in hairy roots of Datura stramonium. Biotechnol. Agron. Soc. Environ. 2016, 20, 408–416. [CrossRef]

49. Hashemi, S.M.; Naghavi, M.R. Production and gene expression of morphinan alkaloids in hairy root culture of Papaver orientale L. using abiotic elicitors. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2015, 2015, 125, 31–41. [CrossRef]

50. Abd El-Mawla, A.M.A. Effect of certain elicitors on production of pyrrolizidine alkaloids in hairy root cultures of Echium orientale L. using abiotic elicitors. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2015, 125, 224–226. [CrossRef]

51. Qin, B.; Ma, L.; Wang, Y.; Chen, M.; Lan, X.; Wu, N.; Liao, Z. Effects of acetylsalicylic acid and UV-B on gene expression and tropane alkaloid biosynthesis in hairy root cultures of Anisodus luridus. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2014, 117, 483–490. [CrossRef]

52. Shilpha, J.; Satish, L.; Kavikkuil, M.; Joe Virgin Largia, M.; Ramesh, M. Methyl Jasmonate elicits the solasodine production and antioxidant activity in hairy root cultures of Solanum trilobatum L. Ind. Crops Prod. 2015, 71, 54–64. [CrossRef]
54. Amita, J.; Saumya, S. Effect of growth regulators and elicitors for the enhanced production of solasodine in hairy root culture of *Solanum melongena* (L.). *J. Indian Bot. Soc.* 2015, 94, 23–39.

55. Qaderi, A.; Akbari, Z.; Kalateh-Jarj, S.; Fatehi, F.; Tolyat, M.; Jalali Moghadam, M.; Naghdi Badi, H. Improving trigonelline production in hairy root culture of fenugreek (*Trigonella foenum-graecum*). *J. Med. Plant Res.* 2016, 15, 73–80.

56. Norozi, A.; Hosseini, B.; Jafari, M.; Farjaminezhad, M.; Palazon, J. Enhanced *H6h* transcript level, antioxidant activity and tropane alkaloid production in *Hyoscyamus reticulatus* L. hairy roots elicited by acetylsaliclyc acid. *Plant Biosyst.* 2018, 153, 360–366. [CrossRef]

57. Fattahi, F.; Shojaeiyan, A.; Palazon, J.; Moyano, E.; Torras-Claveria, L. Methyl-β-Cyclodextrin and coronatine as new elicitors of tropane alkaloid biosynthesis in *Atropa acuminate* and *Atropa belladonna* hairy root cultures. *Physiol. Plant.* 2021, 172, 2098–2111. [CrossRef]

58. Akhgari, A.; Laakso, I.; Maaheimo, H.; Choi, Y.H.; Seppänen-Laakso, T.; Oksman-Caldentey, K.M.; Rischer, H. Methyljasmonate elicitation increases terpenoid indole alkaloid accumulation in *Phaseolus vulgaris* hairy root cultures. *Plants* 2019, 8, 534. [CrossRef]

59. Yousefian, S.; Lohrareb, T.; Farhadpour, M.; Haghiben, K. Effect of methyl jasmonate on phenolic acids accumulation and the expression profile of their biosynthesis-related genes in *Mentha spicata* hairy root cultures. *Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult.* 2020, 142, 285–297. [CrossRef]

60. Gai, Q.Y.; Jiao, J.; Wang, X.; Liu, J.; Wang, Z.Y.; Fu, Y.J. Chitosan promoting formononetin and calycosin accumulation in *Astragalus membranaceus* hairy root cultures via mitogen-activated protein kinase signaling cascades. *Sci. Rep.* 2019, 9, 10367. [CrossRef]

61. Samari, E.; Sharifi, M.; Ghanati, F.; Fuss, E.; Ahmadian Chashmi, N. Chitosan-induced phenolics production is mediated by nitrogenous regulatory molecules: NO and PAs in *Linum album* hairy roots. *Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult.* 2020, 140, 563–576. [CrossRef]

62. Yi, T.G.; Park, Y.; Park, J.E.; Park, N. Enhancement of phenolic compounds and antioxidative activities by the combination of culture medium and methyl jasmonate elicitation in hairy root cultures of *Lactuca indica* L. *Nat. Prod. Commun.* 2019, 14, 1934578/19861867. [CrossRef]

63. Sharan, S.; Sarin, N.B.; Mukhopadhyay, K. Elicitor-mediated enhanced accumulation of ursolic acid and euugenol in hairy root cultures of *Ocimum tenuiflorum* L. is age, dose, and duration dependent. *S. Afr. J. Bot.* 2019, 124, 199–210. [CrossRef]

64. Jiao, J.; Gai, Q.Y.; Wang, X.; Qin, Q.P.; Wang, Z.Y.; Liu, J.; Fu, Y.J. Chitosan elicitation of *Isatis tinctoria* L. hairy root cultures for enhancing flavonoid productivity and gene expression and related antioxidant activity. *Ind. Crops Prod.* 2018, 124, 28–35. [CrossRef][PubMed]

65. Chung, I.M.; Thiruvengadam, M.; Rekha, K.; Rajakumar, G. Enhancement of phenolic compounds and antioxidative activities in hairy root cultures of bitter melon (*Momordica charantia* L.). *Braz. Arch. Biol. Technol.* 2016, 59, 1–10. [CrossRef]

66. Attaran Dowom, S.; Abrishamchi, P.; Radjabian, T.; Salami, S.A. Elicitor-induced phenolic acids accumulation in *Salvia virgata* Jacq. hairy root cultures. *Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult.* 2022, 148, 107–117. [CrossRef]

67. Udomsuk, L.; Jarukamjorn, K.; Tanaka, H.; Pualan, W. Improved isoflavonoid production in *Pueraria candollei* hairy root cultures using elicitation. *Biotechnol. Lett.* 2011, 33, 369–374. [CrossRef]

68. Theboral, J.; Sivanandhan, G.; Subramanyam, K.; Arun, M.; Selvaraj, N.; Manickavasagam, M.; Ganapathi, A. Enhanced production of isoflavones by elicitation in hairy root cultures of soybean. *Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult.* 2014, 117, 477–481. [CrossRef]

69. Gai, Q.Y.; Jiao, J.; Luo, M.; Wang, W.; Gu, C.B.; Fu, Y.J.; Ma, W. Tremendous enhancements of isoflavonoid biosynthesis, associated gene expression and antioxidant capacity in *Astragalus membranaceus* hairy root cultures elicited by methyl jasmonate. *Process Biochem.* 2016, 51, 642–649. [CrossRef]

70. Piatczak, E.; Kuźma, L.; Wysokinska, H. The influence of methyl jasmonate and salicylic acid on secondary metabolite production in *Rehmannia glutinosa* Libbos hairy root culture. *Acta Biol. Crac. Ser. Bot.* 2016, 58, 57–65. [CrossRef]

71. Mascherotti, I.; Alfieri, M.; Lauria, M.; Locatelli, F.; Consonni, R.; Cusano, E.; Gualtieri, A.; Ferrante, F.; et al. New insight into justicidin B pathway and production in *Orthosiphon aristatus*. *Potravin. Slovák J. Food Sci.* 2021, 15, 1–8. [CrossRef]

72. Samadi, A.; Reza, M.; Houshmand, D. Improvement of lignans production in hairy root culture of *Linum mucronatum* using abiotic and biotic elicitors. *Iran. J. Plant Physiol.* 2015, 6, 1535–1542. [CrossRef]

73. Krishna-Milosievic, D.; Jankovic, T.; Uzelac, B.; Vinterhalter, D.; Vinterhalter, B. Effect of elicitors on xanthone accumulation and biomass production in hairy root cultures of *Gentiana dinarica*. *Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult.* 2017, 130, 631–640. [CrossRef]

74. Smetanska, I.; Tonkha, O.; Patyka, T.; Hunaeef, D.; Mamdouh, D.; Patyka, M.; Bukan, A.; Mushtrek, M.; Slobodyanyuk, N.; Omelian, A. The influence of yeast extract and jasmonic acid on phenolic acids content of in vitro hairy root cultures of *Orthosiphon aristatus*. *Potravin. Slovák J. Food Sci.* 2021, 15, 1–8. [CrossRef]

75. Plaisangsueree, V.; Somboon, T.; Tonglairoum, P.; Keawracha, P.; Wongsak, T.; Kongbangkerd, A.; Limmongkon, A. Enhancement of stilbene compounds and anti-inflammatory activity of methyl jasmonate and cyclodextrin elicited peanut hairy root culture. *Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult.* 2018, 132, 165–179. [CrossRef]

76. Nourozi, E.; Hosseini, B.; Hassan, A. A reliable and efficient protocol for induction of hairy roots in *Agastache foeniculum*. *Biologia* 2014, 69, 870–879. [CrossRef]
Wongwicha, W.; Tanaka, H.; Shoyama, Y.; Putalun, W. Methyl Jasmonate elicitation enhances glycyrrhizin production in hairy roots of 
Lepechinia caulescens. PeerJ 2021, 9, e11279. [CrossRef]

Li, J.; Li, B.; Luo, L.; Cao, F.; Yang, B.; Gao, J.; Yan, Y.; Zhang, G.; Feng, L.; Hu, B. Increased phenolic acid and tanshinone 
production and transcriptional responses of biosynthetic genes in hairy root cultures of Salvia przewalskii Maxim. treated with methyl 
jasmonate and salicylic acid. Mol. Biol. Rep. 2020, 47, 8565–8578. [CrossRef]

Ru, M.; An, Y.; Wang, K.; Peng, L.; Li, B.; Bai, Z.; Wang, B.; Liang, Z. Prunella vulgaris L. hairy roots: Culture, growth, 
and elicitation by ethephon and salicylic acid. Eng. Life Sci. 2016, 16, 494–502. [CrossRef]

Pei, T.; Ma, P.; Ding, K.; Liu, S.; Jia, Y.; Ru, M.; Dong, J.; Liang, Z. SmAZB acts as a core repressor regulating ja-induced 
biosynthesis of salvanolic acids and tanshinones in Salvia miltiorrhiza hairy roots. J. Exp. Bot. 2018, 69, 1663–1678. [CrossRef]

Hasanloo, T.; Eskandari, S.; Najafi, F. Chitosan (Middle-Viscous) as an effective elicitor for silymarin production in Silybum 
marianum hairy root cultures. RJP 2014, 1, 9–13.

Gharechahi, J.; Khalili, M.; Hasanloo, T.; Salekdeh, G.H. An integrated proteome approach to decipher the effect of methyl 
jasmonate elicitation on the proteome of Silybum marianum L. hairy roots. Plant Physiol. Biochem. 2013, 70, 115–122. [CrossRef]

Mahendran, G.; Verma, N.; Singh, M.; Shanker, K.; Banerjee, S.; Kumar, B.; Rahman, L. Elicitation enhances swervicin and 1,2,5,6-tetrahydroxynaphthalene production in hairy root cultures of Swertia chirayita (Roxb.) H. Karst. Ind. Crops Prod. 2022, 177, 114488. [CrossRef]

Wilczatska-Barska, A.; Królicka, A.; Glód, D.; Majdan, M.; Kawiak, A.; Krauze-Baranowska, M. Enhanced accumulation of secondary metabolites in hairy root cultures of Scutellaria lateriflora following elicitation. Biotechnol. Lett. 2012, 34, 1757–1763. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

Ghatge, S.; Kudale, S.; Dalvi, S.; Dixit, G. Effect of chitosan elicitation on alizarin production in hairy root cultures of Rubia 
cordifolia L. JCS 2014, 2, 62–69. [CrossRef]

Zeher, M.; Reddy, V.D.; Giri, C.C. Enhanced daidzin production from jasmonic and acetyl salicylic acid elicited hairy root 
cultures of Psoralea corylifolia L. (Fabaceae). Nat. Prod. Res. 2015, 30, 1542–1547. [CrossRef]

Kastell, A.; Smetanska, I.; Ulrichs, C.; Cai, Z.; Mewis, I. Effects of phytohormones and jasmonic acid on glucosinolate content in 
hairy root cultures of Sinapis alba and Brassica rapa. Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol. 2013, 169, 624–635. [CrossRef]

Ghimire, B.K.; Thiruvengadam, M.; Chung, I.M. Identification of elicitors enhances swervicin and 1,2,5,6-tetrahydroxynaphthalene production in hairy root cultures of Swertia chirayita (Roxb.) H. Karst. Ind. Crops Prod. 2022, 177, 114488. [CrossRef]

Martin, K.P.; Saboljvic, A.; Madassery, J. High-frequency transgenic plant regeneration and plumbagin production through methyl 
jasmonate elicitation from hairy roots of Plumbago indica L. J. Crop. Sci. Biotechnol. 2011, 14, 205–212. [CrossRef]

Vaccaro, M.C.; Mariaевыхина, A.; Malafronte, N.; de Tommasi, N.; Leone, A. Increasing the synthesis of bioactive abietane 
diterpenes in Salvia sclarea L. hairy roots by elicited transcriptional reprogramming. Plant Cell Rep. 2017, 36, 375. [CrossRef]

Sharmila, R.; Subburathinam, K.M. Effect of signal compounds on andrographolide in the hairy root cultures of Andrographis 
paniculata. Int. J. Pharm. Sci. 2013, 4, 1773. [CrossRef]

Park, Y.J.; Kim, J.K.; Park, S.U. Yeast extract improved biosynthesis of astragalosides in hairy root cultures of Astragalus 
membranaceus. Prep. Biochem. Biotechnol. 2020, 51, 467–474. [CrossRef]

Jiao, J.; Gai, Q.Y.; Wang, W.; Luo, M.; Zu, Y.G.; Fu, Y.J.; Ma, W. Enhanced astragaloside production and transcriptional responses of biosynthetic genes in Astragalus membranaceus hairy root cultures by elicitation with methyl jasmonate. Biochem. Eng. J. 2016, 105, 339–346. [CrossRef]

Sun, J.; Xiao, J.; Wang, X.; Yuan, X.; Zhao, B. Improved cardenolide production in Calotropis gigantea hairy roots using mechanical 
wounding and elicitation. Biotechnol. Lett. 2012, 34, 563–569. [CrossRef]

Van Nguyet, K.; Pongkitwitoon, B.; Pathomwichaiwat, T.; Viboonjun, U.; Prathanturarug, S. Effects of methyl jasmonate on the 
growth and triterpenoid production of diploid and tetraploid Centella asiatica (L.) Urb. hairy root cultures. Sci. Rep. 2019, 9, 18665. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

Kim, O.T.; Yoo, N.H.; Kim, G.S.; Kim, Y.C.; Bang, K.H.; Hyun, D.Y.; Kim, S.H.; Kim, M.Y. Stimulation of Rg3 ginsenoside 
biosynthesis in ginseng hairy roots elicited by methyl jasmonate. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2013, 112, 87–93. [CrossRef]

Kochan, E.; Szymczyk, P.; Kuzma, L.; Lipert, A.; Szymańska, G. Yeast extract stimulates ginsenoside production in hairy root 
cultures of American ginseng cultivated in shake flasks and nutrient sprayed bioreactor. Molecules 2017, 22, 880. [CrossRef]

Wongwicha, W.; Tanaka, H.; Shoyama, Y.; Putalun, W. Methyl Jasmonate elicitation enhances glycyrrhizin production in Glycyrrhiza 
infrae planta hairy roots cultures. Z. Naturforsch. C. J. Biosci. 2011, 66, 423–428. [CrossRef]

Ert, A.A.; Zibareva, L.N.; Filonenko, E.S. Effect of methyl jasmonate on production of 20-hydroxyecdysone and turkerstone in 
hairy roots of Silene linicola C.C.Gmel. Bio Web Conf. 2018, 11, 00013. [CrossRef]

Alsoufi, A.S.M.; Pączkowski, C.; Szakiel, A.; Długosz, M. Effect of jasmonic acid and chitosan on triterpenoid production in 
Calendula officinalis hairy roots. Phytochem. Lett. 2019, 31, 5–11. [CrossRef]

Kayani, W.K.; Palazón, J.; Cusido, R.M.; Mirza, B. Effect of pRi T-DNA genes and elicitation on morphology and phytoecdysteroid 
biosynthesis in Ajuga bracteosa hairy roots. RSC Adv. 2017, 7, 47945–47953. [CrossRef]

Cheruvathur, M.K.; Thomas, T.D. Effect of plant growth regulators and elicitors on rhinacanthin accumulation in hairy root 
cultures of Rhinacanthus nasutus (L.) Kurz. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2014, 118, 169–177. [CrossRef]
103. Goklany, S.; Rizvi, N.F.; Loring, R.H.; Cram, E.J.; Lee-Parsons, C.W.T. Jasmonate-dependent alkaloid biosynthesis in Catharanthus roseus hairy root cultures is correlated with the relative expression of Orca and Zet transcription factors. Biotechnol. Prog. 2013, 29, 1367–1376. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

104. Liang, Z.S.; Yang, D.F.; Liang, X.; Zhang, Y.J.; Liu, Y.; Liu, F.H. Roles of reactive oxygen species in methyl jasmonate and nitric oxide-induced tanshinone production in Salvia miltiorrhiza hairy roots. Plant Cell Rep. 2011, 31, 873–883. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

105. Hao, X.; Shi, M.; Cui, L.; Xu, C.; Zhang, Y.; Kai, G. Effects of methyl jasmonate and salicylic acid on tanshinone production and biosynthetic gene expression in transgenic Salvia miltiorrhiza hairy roots. Biotechnol. Appl. Biochem. 2015, 62, 24–31. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

106. Li, B.; Wang, B.; Li, H.; Peng, L.; Ru, M.; Liang, Z.; Yan, X.; Zhu, Y. Establishment of Salvia castanea Diels f. tomentosa Stib. hairy root cultures and the promotion of tanshinone accumulation and gene expression with Ag+, methyl jasmonate, and yeast extract elicitation. Protoplasma 2016, 253, 87–100. [CrossRef]

107. Zhu, C.; Miao, G.; Guo, J.; Huo, Y.; Zhang, X.; Xie, J.; Feng, J. Establishment of Tripterygium wilfordii Hook. f. hairy root culture and optimization of its culture conditions for the production of triptolide and wilforine. J. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 2014, 24, 823–834. [CrossRef]

108. Qiu, H.; Su, L.; Wang, H.; Zhang, Z. Chitosan elicitation of saponin accumulation in Paeonia lactiflora hairy roots by modulating antioxidative activity, nitric oxide production and differential gene expression. Plant Physiol. Biochem. 2021, 166, 115–127. [CrossRef]

109. Thilip, C.; Mehaboob, V.M.; Varatharaju, K.; Faizal, K.; Raja, P.; Aslam, A.; Shajahan, A. Elicitation of withaferin-A in hairy root culture of Withania somnifera (L.) Dunal using natural polysaccharides. Biologia 2019, 74, 961–968. [CrossRef]

110. Saxena, P.; Ahlawat, S.; Athar, A.; Khan, S.; Malik, Z.A. Gene expression analysis of the withanolide synthetic pathway in hairy root cultures of Withania somnifera elicited with methyl jasmonate and the fungus Periconia sp. Symbiosis 2017, 71, 143–154. [CrossRef]

111. Yu, K.-W.; Gao, W.-Y.; Son, S.-H.; Paek, K.-Y. Improvement of ginsenoside production by jasmonic acid and some others elicitors in hairy root cultures of ginseng (Panax ginseng C.A. Meyer). In Vitro Cell. Dev. Biol.-Plant. 2000, 36, 424–428. [CrossRef]

112. Zaheer, M.; Giri, C.C. Enhanced diterpene lactone (andrographolide) production from elicited adventitious root cultures of Andrographis paniculata. Res. Chem. Intermed. 2017, 43, 2433–2444. [CrossRef]

113. Lee, Y.S.; Ju, H.K.; Kim, Y.J.; Lim, T.G.; Uddin, M.R.; Kim, Y.B.; Baek, J.H.; Kwon, S.W.; Lee, K.W.; Seo, H.S.; et al. Enhancement of anti-inflammatory activity of Aloe vera adventitious root extracts through the alternation of primary and secondary metabolites via salicylic acid elicitation. PLoS ONE 2013, 8, e62479. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

114. Kannan, N.; Manokari, M.; Shekawat, M.S. Enhanced production of anthraquinones and phenolic compounds using chitosan from the adventitious roots of Morinda citrifolia Buck. and Ham. Ind. Crops Prod. 2020, 148, 112321. [CrossRef]

115. Demirci, T.; Aras Asci, Ö.; Gökţürk Baydar, N. Influence of salicylic acid and L-phenylalanine on the accumulation of anthaquinone and phenolic compounds in adventitious root cultures of Madde (Rubia tinctorum L.). Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2021, 144, 313–324. [CrossRef]

116. Khan, T.; Abbasi, B.H.; Khan, M.A.; Azeem, M. Production of biomass and useful compounds through elicitation in adventitious root cultures of Fagonia indica. Ind. Crops Prod. 2017, 108, 451–457. [CrossRef]

117. Ho, T.T.; Lee, J.D.; Jeong, C.S.; Paek, K.Y.; Park, S.Y. Improvement of Biosynthesis and accumulation of bioactive compounds by elicitation in adventitious root cultures of Polygonum multiflorum. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 2018, 102, 199–209. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

118. Lee, E.J.; Park, S.Y.; Paek, K.Y. Enhancement strategies of bioactive compound production in adventitious root cultures of Eleutherococcus koreanum Nakai subjected to methyl jasmonate and salicylic acid elicitation through airlift bioreactors. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2015, 120, 1–10. [CrossRef]

119. Zaker, A.; Sykora, C.; Gössnitzer, F.; Abrihamchi, P.; Asili, J.; Mousavi, S.H.; Wawrosch, C. Effects of some elicitors on tanshinone production in adventitious roots of Perovskia zboronoiides Karel. Ind. Crops Prod. 2015, 67, 97–102. [CrossRef]

120. Marsik, P.; Langhansova, L.; Dvorakova, M.; Cigler, P.; Hruby, M.; Vanek, T. Increased ginsenosides production by elicitation of in vitro cultivated Panax ginseng adventitious roots. Med. Aromat. Plants 2014, 3, 1. [CrossRef]

121. Wang, J.; Li, J.; Li, J.; Liu, S.; Wu, X.; Li, J.; Gao, W. Transcriptome profiling shows gene regulation patterns in ginsenoside pathway in response to methyl jasmonate in Panax quinquefolium adventitious root. Sci. Rep. 2016, 6, 27263. [CrossRef]

122. Tewari, R.K.; Paek, K.Y. Salicylic acid-induced nitric oxide and ROS generation stimulate ginsenoside accumulation in Panax ginseng roots. J. Plant Growth Regul. 2011, 30, 396–404. [CrossRef]

123. Cui, L.; Wang, Z.Y.; Zhou, X.H. Optimization of elicitors and precursors to enhance valtrate production in adventitious roots of Valeriana amurensis Smir. Ex Kom. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2012, 108, 411–420. [CrossRef]

124. Miao, G.P.; Zhu, C.S.; Yang, Y.Q.; Feng, M.X.; Ma, Z.Q.; Feng, J.T.; Zhang, X. Elicitation and in situ adsorption enhanced secondary metabolites production of Tripterygium wilfordii Hook. f. adventitious root fragment liquid cultures in shake flask and a modified bubble column bioreactor. Bioprocess Biosyst. Eng. 2014, 37, 641–650. [CrossRef]

125. Sivanandhan, G.; Arun, M.; Mayavan, S.; Rajesh, M.; Jeyaraj, M.; Dev, G.K.; Manickavasagam, M.; Selvaraj, N.; Ganapathi, A. Optimization of elicitation conditions with methyl jasmonate and salicylic acid to improve the productivity of withanolides in the adventitious root culture of Withania somnifera (L.) Dunal. Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol. 2012, 168, 681–696. [CrossRef]
126. Thakore, D.; Srivastava, A.K.; Sinha, A.K. Model based fed batch cultivation and elicitation for the overproduction of ajmalicine from hairy roots of Catharanthus roseus. Biochem. Eng. J. 2015, 97, 73–80. [CrossRef]

127. Sykłowska-Baranek, K.; Łysik, K.; Jeziorek, M.; Wencel, A.; Gajcy, M.; Pietrosiuk, A. Lignan accumulation in two-phase cultures of Taxus x media hairy roots. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2018, 133, 371–384. [CrossRef]

128. Gangopadhyay, M.; Dewanjee, S.; Bhattacharya, S. Enhanced plumbagin production in elicited Plumbago indica hairy root cultures. J. Biosci. Bioeng. 2011, 111, 706–710. [CrossRef]

129. Chayjarung, P.; Poonsap, W.; Pankaew, C.; Inmano, O.; Kongbangkerd, A.; Limmongkon, A. Using a combination of chitosan, methyl jasmonate, and cyclodextrin as an effective elicitation strategy for prenylated stilbene compound production in Arachis hypogaea L. hairy root culture and their impact on genomic DNA. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 2021, 147, 117–129. [CrossRef]

130. Alcalde, M.A.; Cusido, R.M.; Moyano, E.; Palazon, J.; Bonfill, M. Metabolic gene expression and centelloside production in elicited Centella asiatica hairy root cultures. Ind. Crops Prod. 2022, 184, 114988. [CrossRef]

131. Wang, C.H.; Zheng, L.P.; Tian, H.; Wang, J.W. Synergistic effects of ultraviolet-B and methyl jasmonate on tanshinone biosynthesis in Salvia miltiorrhiza hairy roots. J. Photochem. Photobiol. B Biol. 2016, 159, 93–100. [CrossRef]

132. Ma, Y.J.; Xia, J.; Wang, Y.; Wang, J.W. Stimulation of tanshinone production in Salvia miltiorrhiza hairy roots by β-cyclodextrin-coated silver nanoparticles. Sustain. Chem. Pharm. 2020, 18, 100271. [CrossRef]