Analysis of the Related Party Transactions in terms of managerial and financial issues for the Kenyan Savings and Credit Cooperatives

Munene Halldess Nguta
School of Business and Economics Meru University of science and Technology, Kenya
ORCID ID 0000-0003-4748-2531

Ken Mugambi
Methodist University, Kenya

Abstract

Related party transactions are a key factor to the sustainability of Savings and Credit Cooperatives (SACCOs). In view of this fact, loans to directors and staff are viewed as a factor which can greatly influence savings and credit cooperatives into either falling into financial distress or helping them to remain a float and become financially stable entities. The stakeholder theory holds that entities should be managed a manner that will satisfy every stakeholder. The stewardship theory reiterates that managers have the organisation at heart and can it to profitability as if it were their own. However approval of loans and other transactions to managers and staff, may not positively impact the entity. This study was designed to establish the effect of related party transactions on the relationship between board characteristics and financial distress of deposit taking SACCOs in Nairobi County. We applied Descriptive research design on Deposit taking SACCOs in Nairobi County which was identified purposively while a census was conceded for all deposit taking SACCOs in the county. We obtained secondary data from SASRA using a data collection sheet after which we performed panel data analysis by use of STATA software. Findings were presented using tables. The study concluded that related party transactions influenced the relationship between board characteristics and financial distress of Deposit Taking SACCOs in Nairobi County. Related party transactions can be an avenue of causing financial distress and should be kept as low as possible. The regulator should come up with a tool based on Altman’s Z score models to predict financial distress in SACCOs in order to offer timely advice to alleviate more distress and consequent bankruptcy which may lead to closure of SACCOs. Another research may be carried out to establish other factors causing financial distress and how to turn around the SACCOs already in distress.

Keywords: finance; related party transactions; Savings and Credit Cooperatives; management

JEL Classifications: D10; D14
**Introduction**

The Kenyan financial sector has been dogged with a number of challenges among them financial distress. Corporate governance has contributed to this problem immensely especially due to the characteristics of the boards that govern these institutions. The Kenyan SACCO subsector is among these financial institutions. Theoretical and empirical literature indicates that financial distress is mainly caused by corporate governance and especially board characteristics in many institutions in the world (Bergman et al., 2012). SACCO’s are very instrumental in developing the economy of any country since they help to mobilize money assets from low income earners, nurture liquidity and uphold proper functioning of the SACCO’s financial system (Kamau, 2016).

Ooko et al. (2013) established that SACCOs on average suffer financial distress consistently while Gikuri and Paulo (2016) urge that SACCOs suffer financial distress due to excessive donor dependency while Odhiambo (2011) and Otieno et al. (2015) contend that SACCOs suffer financial distress due to existence of opportunities to mismanage such entities. Mwaura (2005) indicated that some actions of the board of directors may distort the performance of the SACCOs. In the current study, the researcher endeavored to find out the relationship between board characteristics and financial distress of Deposit taking SACCOs in Nairobi County.

Financial distress has been defined to encompass circumstances whereby a business organization experiences impediments in paying off its financial contracts, and in particular, those of its creditors (Kariuki, 2013). It means that there is a tight cash situation (insolvency) and if prolonged may occasion bankruptcy or liquidation. Financial distress may not force a firm into bankruptcy and liquidation. It could just mean that the firm is experiencing an unfavorable and risky position financially (Aasen, 2011). Corporate financial distress can also be taken to mean a situation where a corporate organization experiences extreme lack of liquidity that cannot be rectified without serious restructuring of business operations and capital structure (Jaafar et al., 2018).

Corporate governance of which board characteristics is part of has been of great concern hence becoming a frequent feature in various corporate meetings, often featured in the media as well as other stakeholder groups (Subramanian, 2015). The Recent financial crunches, corporate failure, fraudulent financial reporting, as well as failure to report have been a point of discussion in such corporate meetings (Brown & Caylor, 2006). Giant corporations such as Enron, WorldCom, Parmalat, Arthur Andersen, Freddie Mac, HealthSouth and Tyco International have also not been spared. These corporate failures have had hostile outcome on share prices, capital markets and investors’ confidence considering that investors have lost sums of money in relation to their investments. The board also assists members and other stakeholders to instigate measures of ensuring that the concerns of members as well as that of other stakeholders are addressed. This is achieved through separation of ownership and control functions and the resultant agency problem that calls for the board of directors to effectively and efficiently carry out their oversight functions (Elad et al., 2018). A co-operative has been defined by the International Cooperative Alliance as an independent conglomeration of individuals voluntarily united to fulfill common social, cultural and economic objectives through a jointly-owned and democratically-controlled business.

The SACCOs are financial institutions which are part of the cooperative movement of Kenya which can further be divided into two major categories or subdivisions. Financial co-operatives (Savings & Credit Co-operative Societies- SACCOs) and Non-financial cooperatives (includes farm produce and other commodities marketing cooperatives, housing, transport and investment co-operatives).

The Financial Services Bill of 2016 aimed at promoting and enhancing the safety and soundness of prudentially-regulated financial institutions, enhancing and supporting the efficiency and integrity of financial markets, promoting public confidence in and encouraging development of the financial sector, and protecting financial clients through promotion of fair handling of financial clients by economic entities (Government of Kenya [GOK], 2011). However, previous findings such as that by Kiaritha (2015) have shown high failure rate (51 percent) of SACCOs with three (3) in every seven (7) of the licensed Deposit Taking SACCOs (DTS) having their deposit-taking licenses revoked due to perpetual negligence in addressing non-conformity matters which both exposed members’ interest earned on their deposits as well as financial endurance of the deposit-taking enterprise. Related party transaction is described as a transfer of resources or obligations between related parties, whether this transfer is expressed in monetary terms or not. A related party can be described as a party who can control or have influence on an entity or a party that is controlled or owned by the entity specified (Idrees & Qayyum (2018).
Literature Review

This section reviewed relevant theories and also relevant past studies and came with appropriate hypothesis to guide the research. Board Characteristics are regarded as a blend of characteristics which can be possessed by members of a formal group which may regulate decisions of an entity. These comprises of age, gender, education, experience, diversity among others (Wayne et al., 2010).

SASRA (2015) reiterates that the board is also responsible for setting the apex tone by requiring management to uphold the standards so set which exhibits the firm’s promise of reliability as well as compliance with legal requirements. The tone establishes the foundation for an organizational culture which is then transmitted to the workforce at every level of the entity. It is also the responsibility of the board to approve, implement and monitor strategic plans of the organization. The board can achieve this by having considerable input in the organization’s strategic plan right from inception to execution. It is also expected to approve the organization’s strategic plans and must frequently assess the execution of such strategies which are intended to generate lasting value whilst evaluating the risk inherent in the strategic plans and finding solutions to them at the same time.

For a company which has experienced financial distress, the role of the board and the responsibilities if individual directors transform to other essential techniques as compared to the same roles and responsibilities when the company had not fallen into financial problems (Rechden & Miller, 2015). A case in point is where the owners and other stakeholders assume that the board will apply a more practical strategy than in the past in an attempt to position that firm back to being financially healthy and being profitable. Board characteristics are among various elements which may influence financial performance of corporates consequently leading to financial distress. Conclusions on the various researches conducted in the area of corporate governance point out to the need for more research to establish how board characteristics influence a firm’s financial performance which may in turn cause firms to be financially distressed (Manzaneque et al., 2016). Among the many board characteristics, this research focuses only on board independence, board size, board diversity, board independence, Education qualifications of board members and board tenure.

It is necessary that the board should make certain that its composition factors relate to geographical distribution, gender parity, occupation, ethnicity, age, work experience and academic achievements of the directors. Further, it is also required that as a standard measure of ensuring that the board observes stipulations for guaranteeing suitably qualified individuals being recommended or nominated for appointment to the board that a nominating committee is instituted and its roles involves all facets of the appointment of SACCO’s directors (SASRA, 2015).

The agency theory advocates the existence of progressively large number of outside directors in the boards as this helps in controlling as well as limiting the opportunistic character of managers stemming from their skill, objectivity and independence essential for the control function. It is further argued that the existence of external directors (non-executive) enhances efficiency such that the concern has more disclosures to make. Birjandi et al. (2015) reiterated that majority of external directors in a board enhance the oversight and efficiency of fiscal disclosures and reduced earnings resultant of withholding information. The composition of the board may influence the performance of a SACCO though its relationship is found to be positive. However, it is worth noting that boards comprised of more external directors may assist in mitigation of the agency problem by curtailing on the managers opportunistic behavior (Oguku & Olweny, 2016).

According to Gordon et al. (2004) RPTs aids organizations to curtail transaction costs with other parties and therefore it significantly moderates the correlation of corporate governance and the performance of firms listed in Indonesian stock exchange. Conversely, Pozzoli and Venuti (2014), Magdalena and Dananjaya (2015), and Downs et al. (2016) find that RPTs do not significantly affect the relationship between political affiliation and firm performance. Due to the inconclusiveness of the literature, the current study concentrates on the establishment of the moderating effect of related party transactions on the relationship between Board Characteristics and Financial Distress of Deposit taking SACCOs in Nairobi County. Based on these arguments, the study proposed the following hypothesis:

H0: Related Party Transactions do not significantly moderate the relationship between board characteristics and financial distress SACCOs in Nairobi County.
Research Methodology and Results

The study used descriptive longitudinal research design. A longitudinal research is conducted over long time (could be decades). In this form of research, an aspect is observed iteratively. The research entailed collecting and analysing secondary panel data for the 2012 – 2018 time period, on deposit taking SACCOs in Nairobi County and therefore this research design was deemed most apt for the study on sample of 43 Savings and credit cooperatives drawn purposively from a population of 174 deposit taking SACCOs in Nairobi County, Kenya with the related party transactions being measured by the proportion of loans to directors on total loans issued by the SACCO.

The researcher undertook a descriptive data analysis, in order to capture a general picture of the raw data. In particular, the following metrics about the data for all variables were computed: mean maximum, minimum, variance, standard deviation, skewness, and kurtosis. The mean indicates the average value of all recorded observations, while the maximum shows the highest recorded observation for each variable. Further, the minimum indicates the least recorded observation for each variable. Variance and standard deviation are measures of dispersion which show the variability of the observations about the mean. Further, skewness indicates whether the observed values were conforming to a symmetrical distribution or were skewed, either positively or negatively. Finally, kurtosis indicates the level of peakedness of the observed values.

| Table 1: Descriptive Statistics | Mean  | Maximum | Minimum | Variance | Standard Deviation | Skewness | Kurtosis |
|---------------------------------|-------|---------|---------|----------|--------------------|----------|----------|
| Financial Distress              | 1.870 | 6.644   | -19.332 | 3.242    | 1.801              | -5.553   | 7.659    |
| Board Size                      | 6.929 | 9.000   | 5.000   | 1.643    | 1.282              | 0.065    | 1.993    |
| Board Composition               | 0.314 | 0.600   | 0.111   | 0.022    | 0.148              | 0.324    | 1.841    |
| Board Independence              | 0.469 | 0.857   | 0.111   | 0.053    | 0.231              | 0.037    | 1.677    |
| Board Average Level of Education| 1.968 | 2.500   | 1.500   | 0.104    | 0.323              | 0.275    | 1.797    |
| Board Tenure                    | 5.570 | 15.783  | 1.009   | 12.013   | 3.466              | 1.011    | 3.360    |
| Related Party Transactions      | 0.0187| 0.080   | 0.000   | .000254  | .0159              | 2.258    | 7.999    |

From table 1, it is evident that the independent variable (Financial Distress, as measured using the Altman’s Z score) had a mean of 1.87, which is quite low and thereby implies that on average, deposit taking SACCOs operating in Nairobi County is financially distressed. The maximum observation for the Altman’s Z score is 6.644, while the least is -19.332. The dependent variable has a relatively low extent of variation since the variance is 3.242 and the standard deviation is 1.801. Additionally, it can be seen that this variable is negatively skewed (Skewness = -5.553), thereby implying that most of the observations were less than the mean. Further, the kurtosis is quite high (kurtosis = 7.659). This implies that majority of the observed values for Altman’s Z score either coincided with the mean or was very close to the mean.

In order to conceptualize the intrinsic relationship between the studies independent, moderating, and intervening variables, correlation analysis was undertaken. Another essence of this procedure was to evaluate the strength of linear interrelationships between these variables, thereby precluding the problem of multicollinearity. Results of correlation analysis are as shown
As shown in table 2, all the indicators did not have any excessive levels of strong correlation. Thus, they can be jointly fitted as regressors in panel models. From the table, it is evident that board size has a positive correlation with other indicators of board characteristics as well as firm revenue and external borrowing. Board composition has a negative linear relationship with board independence and external borrowing, but a positive relationship with other indicators. Board independence has a negative relationship with the Board Average Level of Education but a positive relationship with all other variables. Further, Board Average Level of Education was found to have a negative correlation with Related Party Transactions and External Borrowing but a positive relationship with the other variables. Board tenure has negative relationship with Related Party Transactions.

Diagnostic tests are pre estimation procedures that evaluate whether the assumptions of Ordinary Least Squares (OLS) panel regression analysis are upheld. In particular, a strong linear relationship should not exist between any variables that are fitted jointly as regressors in a model (no multicollinearity), there should be panel level stationarity, error terms should be linearly independent (no autocorrelation), the variance of the error terms should be constant (no heteroscedasticity), and the error terms should be normally distributed (with a mean of zero and a constant variance). These assumptions and the particular tests that were used to test for each of them are discussed in detail as follows:

The test for multicollinearity indicates that there was no linear relationship amongst the indicators of the independent variable and the moderating variable. This is ascertained from the fact that all variables had a VIF of below 10, and a tolerance that exceeded 0.1

Since all the values of tolerance are greater than the minimum threshold of 0.1 (Table 3), then the data was deemed to pass the assumption of no multicollinearity.

On Serial Correlation assumption, Wooldridge test for autocorrelation in panel data was used to test whether the study’s data conformed to the assumption of no autocorrelation and the results are as shown below:

From the Wooldridge test, it can be seen that there was presence of first order autocorrelation, since this test was statistically significant (p value = 0.0003).
Table 4: Wooldridge test for autocorrelation

| Wooldridge test for autocorrelation in panel data |
|--------------------------------------------------|
| H0: no first-order autocorrelation               |
| F( 1, 41) = 12.631                               |
| Prob> F = 0.0010                                 |

The Wooldridge test for autocorrelation in panel data had a p value which was strongly statistically significant (Table 4). Therefore, the autocorrelation was deemed to be evident in the data this informed the choice of the model. The Likelihood Ratio test was used to test the data for heteroscedasticity and the following results were obtained.

Table 5: Likelihood-ratio Test for Heteroscedasticity

| Likelihood-ratio test | LR chi2(41) | Prob> chi2 |
|-----------------------|-------------|------------|
| (Assumption: nested in hetero) | 366.56 | 0.0000 |

Each violation of CLRM assumptions has a remedy. In instances where there is multicollinearity, the variable with the highest Variance Inflation Factor (VIF) should be excluded from further analysis. In cases of autocorrelation, a PraisWinsten Panel Regression model should be fitted while in cases where there is heteroscedasticity, a normal panel model (but with corrected standard errors) should be fitted. The PraisWinsten procedure generates robust results in the presence of autocorrelation, while the corrected standard errors implement a correction mechanism to reverse the effects of heteroscedasticity, thereby ensuring that the estimators so generated are still BLUE (Best, Linear and Unbiased Estimators). Table 6 shows the results of model fitting. Owing to the presence of autocorrelation and heteroscedasticity, the empirical model for step two of testing the moderating effect of related party transactions was undertaken using the Prais-Winsten panel regression with corrected standard errors as shown in table 6.

Table 6: Panel Regression Results for Step Two of Testing the Moderating Effect

| Prais-Winsten regression, heteroskedastic panels corrected standard errors |
|-------------------------------------------------|----------------|-----------|
| Group variable: saccoid                         | Number of obs: 294 |
| Time variable: year                            | Number of groups: 42 |
| Panels: heteroskedastic (balanced)             | Obs per group: min |
| Autocorrelation: panel-specific AR(1)          | avg: 7 |
| Estimated covariances = 42                     | max: 7 |
| Estimated autocorrelations = 42                | R-squared: 0.2714 |
| Estimated coefficients = 11                    | Wald chi2(5): 19.94 |
| FD Coef. Het-corrected Std. Err. z P>|z| [95% Conf. Interval] |
| BS -0.009 0.004 2.070 0.004 |
| BC -1.100 1.134 -0.970 0.333 |
| BI -1.103 0.292 -3.780 0.011 |
| BE -0.668 0.270 -2.470 0.013 |
| BT 0.036 0.010 3.750 0.010 |
| RPT 0.515 0.223 2.310 0.021 |
| IT1 0.202 0.071 2.840 0.016 |
| IT2 -0.355 0.208 -1.710 0.087 |
| IT3 -0.316 0.087 -3.630 0.010 |
| IT5 2.603 0.845 3.080 0.002 |
| _cons 0.009 0.004 2.070 0.004 |

FD = Financial Distress, BS= Board Size, BC = Board Composition, BI = Board Independence, BE = Board Average Level of Education, BT = Board Tenure, RPT = Related Party Transactions, IT1 = Interaction Term 1, IT2 = Interaction Term 2, IT3 = Interaction Term 3, IT5 = Interaction Term 5
As evident from table 6, board size, board independence and board education have negative and statistically significant effect on financial distress. Board tenure has positive and statistically significant effect on financial distress. Likewise, the moderation variable and all interaction terms, except IT2 and IT3 have positive and significant effect on the dependent variable. IT3 has negative and significant effect on the dependent variable. It can also be noticed that there was an increase in the coefficient of determination (R2) after inclusion of the interaction terms, i.e. from 26.66% to 27.14%. Therefore, the moderating effect of related party transactions on the relationship between board characteristics and financial distress is deemed present; because the value of the coefficient of determination (R2) increases after inclusion of the interaction terms.

As such, null hypothesis two that related party transactions do not significantly moderate the relationship between board characteristics and financial distress of deposit taking SACCOs in Nairobi County, was rejected in favor of the alternative hypothesis that related party transactions have a moderating effect on the relationship between board characteristics and financial distress of deposit taking SACCOs in Nairobi County.

The findings are supported by Gordon et al. (2004) who contend that related party transactions are non-beneficial and value reducing for shareholders. It can also be noted that management use related party transactions both to direct wealth to themselves and to come up with deceptive financial statements (Kohlbeck & Mayhew, 2010). Gordon et al. (2004) and Abdul et al. (2018) are among other studies which hold a similar opinion.

Kim et al. (2019) and Aharony et al. (2005) are other studies which hold the opinion that related party transactions are negatively related to firm performance and can therefore encourage financial distress. However, Zakaria et al. (2017) are of a different opinion that related party transactions impact firm performance positively albeit the effect varies according to the parties involved.

Conclusion

SACCOs need to have lean boards, since board size was found to have detrimental effects on financial distress. Board composition should also be improved in terms of the number of female members, due to the fact that this helps in forestalling financial distress. Additionally, there should be more inclusion of independent members on SACCO boards since this indicator has an inverse relationship with financial distress. Further, there should be deliberate inclusion of members with high and relevant education credentials, since this attribute was found to be helpful in curtailing financial distress. Moreover, board tenure was found to have a positive relationship with financial distress. Therefore, SACCO boards should have term limits for their members to allow fresh members periodically, who are likely to inject new ideas into the boards’ decision making mechanism. The study further recommends that related party transactions should be kept at a bare minimum, since they were found to have a moderating effect on the relationship between board characteristics and financial distress.

References

Aasen, M. R. (2011). Applying Altman’s Z-Score to the Financial Crisis: an empirical study of financial distress on Oslo Stock Exchange [Master's thesis, Norwegian School of Economics]. Digital archives. https://openaccess.nhh.no/nhh-xmlui/bitstream/handle/11250/169347/Aasen%202011.pdf?sequence=1

Abdul, W. E. A., Marzuki, M. M., Jaafar, S. B., & Masron, T. A. (2018). Board diversity and total directors’ remuneration: evidence from an emerging market. Pacific Accounting Review, 30(2), 243-272. https://doi.org/10.1108/PAR-02-2016-0021

Adams, R. B., & Ferreira, D. (2009). Women in the boardroom and their impact on governance and performance. Journal of Financial Economics, 94(2), 291-309. http://hermes-ir.lib.hit-u.ac.jp/rs/bitstream/10086/29282/1/WP2008-7.pdf

Aharony, J., Yuan, H., & Wang, J. (2005). Related party transactions: A “real” means of earnings management and tunneling during the IPO process in China (Working Paper Series). Social Science Research Network. http://www.ssrn.com

Altman, A. (2016). The theory of financial intermediation. Journal of Banking & Finance, 121(1), 1461-1485. https://ideas.repec.org/b/erl/erfstu/23.html
Altman, Edward I. (2018), A Fifty-Year Retrospective on Credit Risk Models, the Altman Z-Score. Family of Models and their Applications to Financial Markets and Managerial Strategies (December 11, 2018). Journal of Credit Risk, Vol. 14, No. 4, 2018. Available at SSRN: https://ssrn.com/abstract=3299519

Bathula, H. (2008). Board characteristics and firm performance: Evidence from New Zealand [Doctoral dissertation, Auckland University of Technology]. Institution repository http://hdl.handle.net/10292/376

Bergman, D., Cooperman, E. S., & Wolfe, G. A. (2010). Director tenure and the compensation of bank CEOs. Managerial Finance, 36(2), 86-102. https://ideas.repec.org/a/mfp/mpfip/v36y2010i2p86-102.html

Campbell, J., Hilscher, J., & Szilagyi, J. (2005). In search of distress risk. The Journal of Finance, 23(6), 41. https://scholar.harvard.edu/files/campbell/hilscherszilagyi_2005.pdf.

Chaganti, R. S., Mahajan, V., & Sharma, S. (1985). Corporate board size, composition and corporate failures in retailing industry. Journal of Management Studies, 22(4), 400-417. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1467-6486.1985.tb00005.x

Chundu, P. P. (2014). Determinants of SACCOS’ financial sustainability in Ilala Municipality [Doctoral dissertation, The Open University of Tanzania]. Institution repository. http://repository.out.ac.tz/502/1/P10_-_FINAL_FOR_BLACK_BOOK.pdf

Combs, A., & Glass, B. (2007). U.S. Patent Application No. 11/703,961. https://patentimages.storage.googleapis.com/e2/44/81/e22bd65b696f/US20070203140A1.pdf

Daily, C. M., & Dalton, D. R. (1994). Bankruptcy and corporate governance: The impact of board composition and structure. Academy of Management Journal, 37(6), 1603-1617. https://journals.aoan.org/doi/abs/10.5465/256801

Dalton, D. R., Daily, C. M., Johnson, J. L., & Ellstrand, A. E. (1999). Number of directors and financial performance: A Meta-analysis. Academy of Management Journal, 42(6), 674-686. https://journals.aoan.org/doi/abs/10.5465/256988

Darmadi, S. (2013). Board members’ education and firm performance: evidence from a developing economy. International Journal of Commerce and Management, 23(2), 113-135. https://doi.org/10.1108/1056921131324911

Delves, B. D., & Patrick, B. (2006). Agency Theory Summary. https://docplayer.net/23937778-Agency-theory-summary-by-don-delves-and-brian-patrick.html

Elad, F., Wong, M. N., & Bongbee, N. (2018). The Role of board characteristics in effective corporate governance: The case of Airbus Group. International Journal of Social Sciences Perspectives, 2(1), 87–95. https://econpapers.repec.org/scripts/redir.pl?u=http%3A%2F%2Fonlineacademicpress.com%2Findex.php%2FJISSP%2Farticle%2Fview%2F42;h=repec:oap:ijossp:2018:p:87

Forbes, D. P., & Milliken, F. J. (1999). Cognition and corporate governance: Understanding boards of directors as strategic decision-making groups. Academy of Management Review, 24(3), 489-505. http://assets.csom.umn.edu/505/1444895/2018/F42;h=repec:oap:ijossp:2018:p:87.pdf

Fuzi, S. F., Halim, S. A., & Julizaerma, M. K. (2016). Board independence and firm performance. Procedia Economics and Finance, 37(1), 460-465. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2212567116301526/pdf?md5=9e93be848123c3tfb103ab28fe9781&pid=1-s2.0-S2212567116301526-main.pdf&_valck=1

Gathigia, W. R. (2016). Influence of corporate governance practice on financial performance [Master’s Thesis, University of Nairobi]. Digital archives. http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/11295/100230/Wanderi_Influence%20of%20Corporate%20Governance%20Practice%20on%20Financial%20Performance%20in%20Distress%20Among%20Commercial%20Ban%ks%20in%20Kenya.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

Gikuri, P. A., & Paulo, A. (2016). SACCOS and members expectations: factors affecting SACCOs capacity
to meet members expectations. (Co-operative Research Workshop). Moshi Co-operative University, Tanzania.  
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/308948542_FACTORs_AFFECTING_SACCoS_CAPACITY_2OMEET_MEMBERS_EXpecTATIONS

Gordon, E., Henry, E., & Palia, D. (2004). Related party transactions and corporate governance. Advances in Financial Economics, 9(1), 1-27. 10.1016/S1569-3732(04)09001-2.

Idrees, S., & Qayyum, A. (2018). The impact of financial distress on equity returns: A case study of non-financial firms of Pakistan stock exchange. Journal of Economics Bibliography, 5(2), 49-59.  http://www.kspjournals.org/index.php/JEB/article/viewFile/1623/1656

Jaafar, M., Alwi, S., Karim, N., Rahman, S., & Binti, A. (2018). Determinants of financial distress among the companies practice, Bursa Malaysia. International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences, 8(11), 798-809. 10.6060/IJARBSS/v8-i11/4956

Jensen, M. C., & Meckling, W. H. (1976). Theory of the firm: managerial behavior, agency costs and ownership structure. Journal of Financial Economics, 3(4), 305–360.  https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-405X(76)90026-X

Kabaiya, F. M. (2012). The relationship between corporate governance practices and financial performance of SACCOS in Muranga’s County [Master Thesis, University of Nairobi]. Digital archive. http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/11295/16412/Kabaiya%20-%20The%20Relationship%20Between%20Corporate%20Governance%20Practices%20And%20Financial%20Performance%20Of%20SACCOS%20In%20Murang%27a%20County?sequence=3&isAllowed=y

Kahuthu, D. G. (2016). Impact of prudential regulation on financial performance of deposit taking savings and credit co-operative societies in Kenya [PhD Thesis, Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture and Technology]. Institution repository. https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/f146/834162b261ce716b28e21324b15b30651a7.pdf

Kamau, C. G. (2016). Effect of management practices on creative accounting among corporations listed at the Nairobi Securities exchange [PhD Thesis, Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture and Technology]. Digital archive. http://ir.jkuat.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/123456789/2084/Kamau%2C%20C.G.%20PhD%20B.A.%202016.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

Kanyi, A. M., Maina, K. E., & Kariuki, S. (2018). Corporate governance and financial performance of savings and credit cooperatives in Embu County, Kenya. International Journal of Finance, Accounting and Economics (IJFAE), 1(2), 1-11. https://www.google.co.ke/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=&ved=2ahUKEwjyoiatLqAhXDBMBHIZQOuAEGlAQAB&url=https%3A%2F%2Fzenodo.org%2Frecord%2F1465578%2Ffiles%2FCorporate-Governance-and-Financial-Performance-of-Savings-and-Credit-Operatives-in-Embu-County-Kenya%25282529.pdf&psid=AOvVaw2553xtDBaFbmbZoc8Z

Kariuki, H. N. (2013). The effect of financial distress on the financial performance of commercial banks in Kenya [Master's Thesis, University of Nairobi]. Digital archive. http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/11295/58672/The%20Effect%2of%20Financial%20Distress%20on%20Financial%20Performance%20of%20Commercial%20Banks%20in%20Kenya.pdf?sequence=3

Kariuki, N. W. (2017). Effect of credit risk management practices on financial performance of deposit taking savings and credit cooperatives in Kenya. The Nairobi Securities Exchange Quarterly. 29(1), 346-364. 10.1016/j.eaqua.2017.06.001.

Kisch, A. (2018). The gender composition of corporate boards: A review and research agenda. The Leadership Quarterly, 29(1), 346-364. 10.1016/j.leaqua.2017.06.001.

Kiaritha, H. W. (2015). Determinants of the financial performance of savings and credit co-operatives in the banking sector in Kenya [PhD Thesis, Jomo Kenyatta University of Technology]. Digital archive. http://ir.jkuat.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/123456789/1598/KIARITHA%2C%20HANNA%20WAITHERA%20PHD%20BUSINESS%20ADMINISTRATION%202015.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

Kim, Y., Kang, S., & Park, S. (2019). The effect of management style on financial statement comparability: Peer-reviewed Academic Journal published by SSBFNET with respect to copyright holders.
evidence from Korean business groups. Asia-Pacific Journal of Accounting & Economics. 1-18. https://doi.org/10.1080/16081625.2019.1566870

Kinyariro, D., Meeme, M., Maina, J., & Murithi, M. (2016). Implications of Basel III accord adherence on financial distress status of commercial banks in Kenya. International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management, 4(7), 1-15. http://ijjem.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/4744.pdf

Kinyua, A. (2014). Factors affecting the performance of small and medium enterprises in the jua kali sector In Nakuru Town, Kenya. Journal of Business and Management, 16(1), 80-93. 10.9790/487X-16148093.

Kiptoo, G. K., Wanyoike, D. M., & Gathogo, G. (2015). Influence of cross-borrowing on financial performance of savings and credit cooperative societies in Eldama Ravine Sub-County, Kenya. IOSR Journal of Business and Management, 17(4), 58-65. http://repository.mut.ac.ke:8080/xmlui/bitstream/handle/123456789/4398/Kiptoo_Influence%20of%20Cross-Borrowing%20on%20Financial%20Performance.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

Kirimu, P., Simiyu, J., & Murithi, D. (2017). Effect of debt finance on financial performance of savings and credit cooperative societies in Maara Sub-County, Tharaka Nithi County, Kenya. International Journal of Accounting, Finance and Risk Management, 2 (3), 113-130. 10.11648/j.ijafrm.20170205.11

Kivuvo, R. M., & Olweny, T. (2014). Financial performance analysis of Kenya's Sacco sector using the Altman Z score model of corporate Bankruptcy. International Journal Bussiness Social Science, 5(9), 34–52. http://ijbssnet.com/journals/Vol_5_No_9_1_August_2014/4.pdf

Kohlebeck, M., & Mayhew, B. W. (2010). Valuation of firms that disclose related party transactions. Journal of Accounting and Public Policy, 29(2), 115-137. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S027842540900088X

Kombo, D. K., & Tromp, D. L. (2006). Proposal and thesis writing: an introduction. Pualines Publications Africa.

Kosikoh, J. C. (2014). Determinants of financial distress in insurance companies in Kenya. [Master's Thesis, Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture and Technology]. Institution repository. http://ir.jkuat.ac.ke/handle/123456789/5162

Lakhal, F., Aguir, A., Lakhal, N., & Malek, A. (2015). Do women on boards and in top management reduce earnings management? Evidence in France. Journal of Applied Business Research (JABR), 31(3), 1107-1118. https://www.clutejournals.com/index.php/JABR/article/download/9236/9274

Liao, Q., & Mehidian, S. (2016). Measuring financial distress and predicting corporate bankruptcy: an index approach. Review of Economic and Business Studies, 6(17), 33-51. https://ideas.repec.org/a/aic/revebs/y2016j17liaoq.html

Lubawa, G. & Louangrath, P. (2016). “Using Altman Z-Score to Assess the Financial Effects of Multiple Loans on SMEs.” Inter. J. Res. Methodol. Soc. Sci., Vol. 2, No. 1: pp. 63-86. (Jan. – Mar. 2016).

MacKinnon, D. P., Fritz, M. S., Williams, J., & Lockwood, C. M. (2007). Distribution of the product confidence limits for the indirect effect: program PRODCLIN. Behavior Research Methods, 39(3), 384-389. https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.3758/BF03193007.pdf

Mahadeo, J., Soobaroyen, T., & Oogarah-Hanuman, V. (2011). Board composition and financial performance: uncovering the effects of diversity in an emerging economy. Journal of Business Ethics. 105, 375-388. 10.1007/s10551-011-0973-z.

Maina, F. G., & Sakwa, M. M. (2012). Understanding financial distress among listed firms in nairobi stock exchange: a quantitative approach using the Z-Score multi-discriminant financial analysis model (JKUAT Annual Scientific Conference Proceedings). Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture and Technology, Nairobi. http://ir.jkuat.ac.ke/handle/123456789/3399

Maina, R. G. (2009). The role of cooperative education in the performance of savings and credit cooperative societies: a case of SACCOs in Nyeri District [Master’s Thesis, Kenyatta University]. http://ir-library.ku.ac.ke/handle/123456789/984

Magdalena R, Dananjaya Y (2015) Effect of related party transactions to the value of enterprises listed on Indonesian Stock Exchange. European Journal of Business and Management 7 (6): 47-57 www.iiste.org

Makori, J., Munene, C., & Muturi, W. (2013). The challenges facing deposit-taking Savings and Credit Cooperative Societies’ regulatory compliance in Kenya. A case of the Gusii Region, Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business, 4(12), 1013–1081. http://hdl.handle.net/123456789/3311

Manzaneque, M., Priego, A. M., & Merino, E. (2016). Corporate governance effect on financial distress likelihood: Evidence from Spain. Revista de Contabilidad, 19(1), 111-121.
https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1138489115000205

Mathuva, D. (2016). Drivers of financial and social disclosure by savings and credit cooperatives in Kenya: A managerial perspective. *Journal of Co-operative Organization and Management, 4*(2), 85–96. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2888397

McNamara, R., Duncan, K., & Kelly, S. (2013). Micro and macro determinants of financial distress. In T. Hoque (Ed.), *Proceedings of the 15th International Business Research Conference* (pp. 1–25). Melbourne: World Business Institute Australia. https://pure.bond.edu.au/ws/portalfiles/portal/27700878/Micro_and_macro_determinants_of_financial_distress.pdf

Membra, F., & Nyanumbua, J. A. (2013). Causes of financial distress: a survey of firms funded by industrial and commercial development corporation in Kenya. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business, 4*(12), 1171–1185. https://journal-archives31.webs.com/1171-1185.pdf

Milliken, F. J., & Martins, L. L. (1996). Searching for common threads: Understanding the multiple effects of diversity in organizational groups. *Academy of Management Review, 21*(2), 402-433. https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/bd50/cd079148065f632db8226eb4861cb9b8f06e.pdf

Ministry of Industrialization and Enterprise Development. (2014). History and organization of cooperative development and marketing sub sector in Kenya. http://www.industrialization.go.ke/index.php/downloads/123-history-and-organization-of-cooperative-development-and-marketing-sub-sector-in-kenya

Mirvis, T. N., & Savitt, W. (2015). The dangers of independent directors. *Del. J. Corp. L., 40*, 481. https://www.wlrk.com/webdocs/wlrknew/AttorneyPubs/WLRK.25278.16.pdf

Mitnick, B. M. (2007). *Origin of the theory of agency: an account by one of the theory’s originators*. SSRN 1020378. https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.1020378

Mudibo, E. K. (2005). Corporate governance in Co-operatives the East African experience. *Conference Pan-African Consultative Forum on Corporate Governance*. Dakar, Senegal. www.ifc.org/ifcext/.../Edward+K+Mudibo+(Co-op.doc

Mugenda, O. M., & Mugenda, A. G. (2003). *Research methods: Quantitative and qualitative approaches*. African Centre for Technology Studies.

Muriithi, J. G. (2016). *Effect of financial risk on financial performance of commercial banks in Kenya* [PhD Thesis, Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture and Technology]. Institution repository. http://ir.jkuat.ac.ke:8080/bitstream/handle/123456789/2376/jane%20gathiga%20muriithi%20phd%20financel%20thesis%202016.pdf?sequence=3&isallowed=y

Mwanza, D. K. (2009). Corporate governance practices and performance of afya SACCO society limited [Master's Thesis, University of Nairobi]. Digital archives. http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/11295/12467/Mwanza%20Daniel%20K_Corporate%20Governance%20Practices%20and%20Performance%20of%20Afya%20SACCO%20Society%20Limited.pdf?sequence=2

Mwaura, F. (2005). *An analysis of factors affecting performance of Savings and Credit Cooperatives in Kenya* [Unpublished MBA project, University of Nairobi]. https://chss.uonbi.ac.ke/sites/default/files/chss/MWAURA%20FRANCIS%20KAMAU.doc.pdf

Ndirangu, D. K. (2013). *The effect of agency banking on financial performance of commercial banks in Kenya* [Master's Thesis, University of Nairobi]. Digital archive. http://chr.sankacr.uc.ac.ke/sites/default/files/chssth/THE%20EFFECT%20OF%20AGENCY%20BANKING%20ON%20FINANCIAL%20PERFORMANCE%20OF%20COMMERCIAL%20BANKS%20IN%20KENYA%20Dunca.pdf

Ndung'u, M. W. (2013). Relationship between risk management practices and financial performance of SASRA regulated SACCOs in Nairobi [Master's Thesis, University of Nairobi]. Institution repository. http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/handle/11295/58435

Njagi, G. M., Kimani, E. M., & Ngugi, N. N. (2012). The impact of front office SACCO activity on SACCO performance in Kenya. A case study of Meru South and Maara district in Tharaka Nithi County in Kenya. *Global Advanced Research Journal of Management and Business Studies, 2*(5), 285-290. http://garj.org/garjmbp/pdf/2013/May/Njagi%20et%20al.pdfNilsson, J. (1996). The nature of cooperative values and principles: transaction cost theoretical explanations. *Annals of Public and Cooperatives Economics, 67*(4), 633-653. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8292.1996.tb01411.x

Njogo, N. S. (2011). *A survey into the causes of financial distress in co-operative societies in nairobi* [Master's Thesis, University of Nairobi]. Institution repository. http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/11295/13070/Ndirangu_Asurvey%20into%20the%20causes%20of%20financial%20distress.pdf
ntim, C. G., & Osei, K. A. (2011). The impact of corporate board meetings on corporate performance in South Africa. African Review of Economics and Finance, 2(2), 83-103. https://ssrn.com/abstract=1974115

Ntoki, J. (2013). Determinants of financial distress facing local authorities in service delivery in Kenya [PhD Thesis, Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture and Technology]. https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Determinants-of-Financial-Distress-Facing-Local-in-Ntoki/b1fc85b6f8da165f1d726d3794d70c8085bddb0

Nyaga, K. J. (2014). The effect of corporate governance on the financial performance of SACCOs regulated by SASRA [Master’s Thesis, University of Nairobi]. Institution repository. http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/handle/11295/12776

Nytor, T., & Mejabi, S. K. (2013). Impact of corporate governance on non-performing loans of Nigerian deposit money banks. Journal of Business and Management, 2(3), 12-21. http://dx.doi.org/10.12735/jbm.v2i3p12

Odhiambo, J. (2011). The relationship between working capital management and financial performance of deposit taking savings and credit co-operative societies licensed by SACCO societies regulatory authority in Nairobi county. [Master’s Thesis, University of Nairobi]. http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/handle/11295/12025

Oguku J. O., & Olweny, T. (2016). The effect of corporate governance on financial performance of deposit taking SACCO’s in Kiambu County, Kenya. International Journey of Science and Technology Information Technology, 2(3), 178-183. https://www.academia.edu/25919374/the_effect_of_corporate_governance_on_financial_performance_of_deposit_taking_SACCOs_in_Kiambu_county_kenya

Olando, C. O. (2012). An assessment of financial practice as a determinant of growth of savings and credit co-operative societies’ wealth in Kenya: the case of Meru County [PhD Thesis, Kenyatta University]. Institution repository. http://library.ku.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/123456789/6533/CLEMENT%20OOKO%20OLANDO.pdf?sequence=3

Olando, C. O., Mbewa, M. O., & Jagongo, A. (2012). Financial practice as a determinant of growth of savings and credit co-operative societies wealth. International Journal of Business and Social Science, 3(24), 204-219. http://ir.library.ku.ac.ke/handle/123456789/7758

Ombaba, K. B. M., & Omuya, J. (2016). Women in institutional boards and their influence on board effectiveness in Africa. International Journal of Management Education and Governance (AIJMEG), 1(2): 33-39. http://library.garissauniversity.ac.ke/jspui/handle/1/86

Ooko, C. O., Jagongo, A., & Mbewa, M. O. (2013). The contribution of SACCO financial stewardship to growth of SACCOs in Kenya. International Journal of Humanities and Social Science, 3(17), 112-137. http://www.ijhssnet.com/journals/Vol_3_No_17_September_2013/14.pdf

Orodro, J. A. (1997). Research and publications in private and public universities in Kenya: an agenda for the 21st century. Bureau of Educational Research.

Otieno, K., Mugo, R., Njeje, D., & Kimathi, A. (2015). Effect of corporate governance on financial performance of SACCOs in Kenya. Research Journal of Finance, 6(2), 48-59. https://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/RJFA/article/view/19174

Outecheva, N. (2007). Corporate financial distress: an empirical analysis of distress risk [Doctoral Dissertation, University of St. Gallen]. Institution repository. http://www.unisg.ch/www/edis.nsf/syslkpbyidentifier/3430/$file/dis3430.pdf

Pálinkó, É., & Svoób, Á. (2016). Main causes and process of financial distress. Public Finance Quarterly, 61(4), 516. https://www.penzugyszemle.hu/pfq/upload/pdf/penzugyi_szemle_angol/volume_61_2016_4/palinko_2016_4_a.pdf

Pereira, V. M., & Filipe, J. A. (2015). Measuring the board’s members effect on banks’ performance: an application to Portugal. Measuring the board’s members effect on banks’ performance: an application to Portugal, 4(1), 1015-1030.University Institute of Lisbon https://repositorio.iscte-iul.pt/bitstream/10071/11709/5/3_IIJLTES_Paper_2___Portuguese_Banks1_12112015.pdf

Perryman, A. A., Fernando, G. D., & Tripathy, A. (2016). Do gender differences persist? An examination of gender diversity on firm performance, risk, and executive compensation. Journal of Business Research, 69(2), 579-586. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0148296315002143

Plöckinger, M., Aschauer, E., Hiebl, M., & Rohatschek, R. (2016). The influence of individual executives on corporate financial reporting: a review and outlook from the perspective of upper echelons theory.
Journal of Accounting Literature, 37(3), 55-75. https://www.wiwi.uni-siegen.de/mac/forschung/publikationen/pdfs/ploeckinger_asherchauer_hiebl_rohatschek_%28jal_forthcoming%29__uet_in_financial_reporting.pdf

Pohjanen, B., Bengtsson, D., & Smith, E. (2010). Return on diversity? A study on how diversity in board of directors and top management teams affects firm performance [Thesis, Kristianstad University College]. Institutional repository. https://www.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid.diva2.324492

Pollet, J., Delport, F., Janssen, K. P., Jans, K., Maes, G., Pfeiffer, H., & Lammertyn, J. (2009). Fiber optic SPR biosensing of DNA hybridization and DNA–protein interactions. Biosensors and Bioelectronics, 25(4), 864-869. https://perswww.kuleuven.be/~u0018648/Pollet-etal-2009.pdf

Pozzoli M, Venuti M (2014) Related party transactions and financial performance: is there a correlation? Empirical evidence from Italian Listed Companies. Open Journal of Accounting 03 (01): 28-37. https://doi.org/10.4236/ojacct.2014.31004.

Rechden, C. N., & Miller, K. B. (2015). Company in distress?: Directors needn’t be-mitigating risks at the Board (No. 95381, pp. 1-12). The World Bank. http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/167701468328788969/Company-in-distress-Directors-neednt-be-mitigating-risks-at-the-Board

Reen, K. P. (2014). The effect of size, age and growth on the profitability of savings and credit cooperative societies in Nairobi County [Master's Thesis, University of Nairobi]. Institution repository. https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/e878/b0551db8b10b7177e5b655f58ebf0ca79b13.pdf

SACCO Societies Regulatory Authority. (2015). Guidelines on good governance deposit-taking SACCO. SASRA. https://www.google.com/url?q=https://www.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2.324492&ei=7tIaZ0frkAhUDWxoKHczoD2QQfAAegQIARAC&sa=q&usg=AOvVaw2L9XGw1zKnolFG92DI4a_&sresall=on&source=bksource

Saleemi, N. A. (2018). Economic simplified: Revised, updated and expanded edition (5th ed.). Saleemi Publications Ltd

Saunders, A., & Cornett, M. M. (2012). Financial markets and institutions: a risk management approach. (6th ed.). McGraw-Hill, Arwin.

Schnake, M. E, Williams, R. J., & Fredenberger, W. (2006). Women on boards of directors: effects on firm social performance in the basic materials and financial services sectors. Journal of Applied Business Research, 22(1) 31-40. https://www.clutejournals.com/index.php/JABR/article/download/1443/1424

Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R. J. (2016). Research methods for business. (7th ed.). Wiley.

Senbet, L. W. (2010). Corporate financial distress and bankruptcy: a survey. Foundations and Trends in Finance, 5(4), 243–335. https://doi.org/10.1561/0500000009

Sporta, F. (2018). The distressing effect of non-performing assets to asset quality for commercial banks in Kenya. International Journal of Innovation and Economic Development, 3(6), 71-83. https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Cpa_Drfred_Sporta_Phd/publication/324110209_The_Distressing_Effect_of_NON-Performing_Assets_to_Asset_Quality_for_Commercial_Banks_in_Kenya/links/5a9e0d/The-Distressing-Effect-of-Non-Performing-Assets-to-Asset-Quality-for-Commercial-Banks-in-Kenya.pdf

Stone-Romero, E. F., & Liakhovitski, D. (2002). Strategies for detecting moderator variables: a review of conceptual and empirical issues. Elsevier.

Subramanian, S. P. (2015). Transforming Business with Program Management: Integrating Strategy, People, Process, Technology, Structure, and Measurement. CRC Press

Tang, C, & Ye, L. (2015). Diversified Knowledge, R&D Team Centrality and Radical Creativity. Creativity and Innovation Management, 24(1), 123-135. https://doi.org/10.1111/caim.12110

Tesfamariam, Y. (2014). The determinants of financial distress in the case of manufacturing share companies in Addis Ababa-Ethiopia [Master's Thesis, Addis Ababa University Addis Ababa]. http://localhost:80/xmlui/handle/123456789/5744

Vafeas, N. (2003). Length of board tenure and outside director independence. Journal of Business Finance & Accounting, 30(7-8), 1043-1064. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1468-5957.00525

Wanderi, G. W. (2016). Effect of organizational justice on organizational commitment in public secondary schools and commercial banks in Kenya [PhD Thesis, Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture and Technology]. Institution repository. http://ir.jkuat.ac.ke/bitstream/handle/123456789/2458/KARANJA%20GEOdRE%20Wand

Waqas, H., & Md-Rus, R. (2018). Predicting financial distress: Applicability of O-score and logit model for

Peer-reviewed Academic Journal published by SSBFNET with respect to copyright holders.
Pakistani firms. *Business and Economic Horizons (BEH)*, 14(1232-2019-760), 389-401. https://ageconsearch.umn.edu/record/285182/files/Waqs%20.pdf

Ward, A., & McKillop, D. (2005). An investigation into the link between UK credit union characteristics, location and their success. *Annals of Public and Cooperative Economics.* 76(1), 461-489. 10.1111/j.1370-4788.2005.00286.x.

Wayne, V., Dirk, M., Manfred, P. (2010). *The A to Z of corporate social responsibility* (2nd Revised ed.). John Wiley & Sons.

Zakaria, Z., Nor, S. M., & Ismail, R. M. (2017). Financial Literacy and Risk Tolerance towards Saving and Investment: A Case Study in Malaysia. *International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues,* 7(4), 507-514. https://www.google.co.ke/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=2ahUKEwiMkL7_n_LqAhUxREEAHUIIA6sQF|AcgQ|AhAB&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.econjournals.com%2Findex.php%2Fijefi%2Farticle%2Fview%2F5113&usg=AOvVaw3DDG3ERcbyVNZSRe3ITszd

Zikmund, W., Babin, J., Carr, C., & Griffin, M. (2010). *Business research methods.* (8th ed.). Mason, OH: Cengage Learning. https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/e4a6/312402a230f5f72904b0ac4c53d89852ad11.pdf