National Security in Kautilya’s Arthashastra: A Content Analysis

Muhammad Saad¹ and Prof. Liu Wenxiang²*

¹School of Philosophy, Hubei University, Wuhan, China
²School of Politics, Law and Public Administration, Hubei University, Wuhan, China
*corresponding author: Prof. Lui Wenxiang (Email: wenxiang@hubu.edu.cn)

Abstract—To understand the Indian strategic culture, one must understand Kautilya’s Arthashastra. Contemporary Indian national priorities show a parallel resonance to the teachings of Kautilya’s Arthashastra. However, the existence of national security variables in Arthashastra has been undermined by most of the researches. This research attempts to explore the national security variable in Kautilya’s Arthashastra using summative content analysis. Results show that 69.88% of the text of Arthashastra is purely dedicated to national security issues. The interpretation proves that national security is the prime theme of Kautilya’s Arthashastra that has been systematically classified as Saptanga Theory and Mandala Theory. Its sole aim is real power politics and the securing of a state’s national security interests.

Keywords—Indian Political Philosophy, National Security, Chanakya Kautilya, Arthashastra, Summative Content Analysis.

I. INTRODUCTION

Arthashastra is the most comprehensive treatises on politics in Indian Vedic Civilization¹. It is not only regarded as one of the ancient sources of Vedic wisdom but also that of politics and diplomacy and it has important resonance with contemporary geopolitical realities.² Kautilya has a significant place in the strategic and political thinking of south Asian and Southeast Asian region and his study is important in comparative comprehension of power and conduct of warfare³. Arthashastra remains exclusive in all the Indian literature because of its total absence of lengthy reasoning⁴. Arthashastra attained extreme importance due to its origin of time, when most of the world was in intellectual darkness⁵. An ex-Indian national security advisor Shivshankar Menon said while speaking to a seminar that, ‘Study of Chanakya’s Arthashastra, an ancient Indian treatise on statecraft and military strategy is one of the significant ways to understand Indian strategic culture’. He further said, ‘The study of Arthashastra is one of the significant ways in which India can become more self-conscious about the strategic culture that exists in India and to which Indian intelligentsia can contribute to its evolution’. Today, with the rise of comparative political theory, Indian political philosophy has become an emergent. Ancient Indian political treatise, Arthashastra is the best-known source of ancient Indian political wisdom which is the contextual habitus of the Indian politicians and military

1 Howladar, Mithun, ‘Political thoughts of Kautilya: An overview’, International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Development, 4/3 (2017), 78-80. doi.org/10.22271/ijmr; Prabhu, K. S. Vishnu and Laxmi Dhar Dwivedi, ‘A Brief Comparison on Espionage and the Importance of Spies’ between Kautilya’s The Arthashastra & Sun Tzu’s The Art of War’, Mediterranean journal of social sciences 6/6 (2015) 54. doi. 10.5901/mjss.2015.v6n6s4p544; Malhotra, Divya, ‘Kautilya: The True Founder of Economics by Balbir Singh锡哈’ Strategic Analysis 38/5 (2014), 763-765. Doi: 10.1080/09700161.2014.941229; Sihaq, Balbir S., ‘An introduction to Kautilya and his Arthashastra’ Humanomics 25/1 (2009). doi.org/10.1108/h.2009.12425aaa.002
2 Schottli, Jivanta, ‘How India sees the world today: Kautilya to the 21st Century’, Journal of Indian Ocean Region 15/1 (November 2018), 117-118. doi.org/10.1080/19480881.2018.1550472; Barua, Shrabana, ‘How India Sees the World: Kautilya to the 21st Century’, Journal of Defence Studies 12/4 (2018), 109–113; Kumar, Abhishek, ‘The Arthashastra: Assessing the Contemporary Relevance of an Ancient Indian Treatise on Statecraft’ (2016); Boesche, Roger, ‘The First Great Political Realist: Kautilya and His Arthashastra’, (Lexington Books 2013); Boesche, Roger, ‘Kautilya's Arthashastra on War and Diplomacy in Ancient India’, The Journal of Military History, 67/1 (2003), 9-37.
3 Prabhu, K. S. Vishnu and Laxmi Dhar Dwivedi, ‘Kautilya’s Views on Espionage and its Current Relevance’, Research on humanities and social sciences 5/7 (2015) 60-63; Brekke, Torkel, ‘Wielding the Rod of Punishment-War and Violence in the Political Science of Kautilya’, Journal of Military Ethics 3/1 (March 2004), 40-52. doi:10.1080/15027570410005210.
4 Bislal, Medha, ‘The Concept of stä’Orderchaft™ in Arthashastra’, South Asian Survey, 21/2 (March 2014); 21/2-226; Skare, Mariako, ‘The Missing Link: From Kautilya's the Arthashastra to Modern Economics’, Journal of Philosophical Economics 6/2 (May 2013)
5 Kautilya, Patrick Olivelle and Mark McClatchy, ‘The Arthashastra selections from the classic Indian work on statecraft’. (Indianapolis, Ind Hackett 2012).
establishment. According to Shyam Saran in his book, From Kautula to Modi, ‘Even today’s Indian national security policy and Indian international politics are still highly influenced by the ancient political philosophies of Arthashastra’. Although new concepts are rapidly emerging in the field of politics and international relations, the significance of Kautilya’s Arthashastra remains ever green when it comes to Indian national security issues and Indian conduct of her foreign affairs.

Origin of Arthashastra

Arthashastra was transcribed around 4th Century B.C by the Prime Minister of the Great Mauryan Empire, Chanakya Kautulya, also called Chanakya or Vishnugupta. Arthashastra is a compendium of fifteen different books compiled together in one form. Chanakya Kautulya, the author of Arthashastra worked under the first Mauryan emperor, Chandragupta Maurya (370-283 BC) to stand his empire by serving as his chief strategist and political advisor. In its third generation, this great Mauryan empire also gave birth to one of the greatest rulers in the history of the world, Ashoka who was the grandson of Chandragupta Maurya. Kautulya was one of the main scholars of his time. His main contributions are not only limited to the fields of politics, warfare and economics but also to medicine, astrology, and law but his prime focus remains the survival, establishment and expansion of a state using power politics. Although his work, Arthashastra, was lost near the end of the Gupta Empire, it was rediscovered in 1905 by R. M. Shamasasty and it was published by him in 1909. It is possibly Kautulya’s Arthashastra which stands out to be systematically scientific and the most authoritative in terms of explanation among the prehistoric political studies.

The word Arthashastra is translated as the science of politics. It also is translated as the science of power, influence and wealth. Arthashastra is composed of 15 books mainly focusing on hard core policies and national security issues ranging from operational to foreign relations policy level. It also talks about national governance, law and justice, civil and criminal procedures, ethics, political economics, hiring and firing of state ministers and key officials, diplomacy, theories of war, natures of peace and obligations of a state etc. The structure of the treatise is unique in the sense that while all chapters and the main text is in prose form, every chapter has some poetic transitions in its ending. This style is found in many ancient Hindu scriptures written in Sanskrit where changing poetic style marks the ending of a chapter or a section. It comprises one hundred and fifty chapters. Every chapter ends with a colophon describing the book’s title and its meanings and scope of the topic.

National Security and Chanakya’s Arthashastra

Arthashastra is known as the Bible of Indian political philosophy. It backs rationality in conduct of state affairs and emphasizes systemization of law and its uniformity throughout a state so that all the state resources and state organs can be directed towards augmenting national power and strengthening national security. Though Kautulya lived a long time ago, his political thought is still applicable in modern day political realities. He established a very vital narrative that is political economy, governance and politics must be linked to the strengthening if national security of a given state and against the foe states. When assessing economic ideas of Kautulya, most of the Kautilyan economics is basically war economics. The terminology used by him has changed but the role of national security

6 Sonwalkar, Jayant and Chandan Maheshkar, ‘Chanakya's ‘Arathastra': management practices by Indian values’, International Journal of Indian Culture and Business Management 16/4 (2018), 460-473. doi.org/10.1504/IJICBM.2018.092120; Shaffer, Ryan, ‘The New Arthashastra: a security strategy for India’, Intelligence & National Security 33/2 (September, 2017), 298-300. doi/full/10.1080/02684527.2017.1380146; Liebig, Michael, ‘Kautulya's relevance for India today’, India Quarterly 69/2 (2013), 99-116. doi.org/10.1177/0974928413481811.
7 Barua, Shrabana, ‘How India Sees the World: Kautulya to the 21st Century’, Journal of Defence Studies 12/4 (2018), 109–113.
8 Bisht, Medha, ‘The Concept of â€œOrderâ€™ in Arthashastra’, South Asian Survey, 21/2 (March 2014), 211-226; Modelski, George, ‘Kautulya: Foreign Policy and International System in the Ancient Hindu World’, American Political Science Review 58/3 (1964), 549-560. doi.org/10.2307/1953131.
9 Solomon, Hussein, ‘Critical reflections of Indian foreign policy: Between Kautulya and Ashoka’, South African Journal of International Affairs 19/1 (2012), 65-78. SDIO/10.1080/10220461.2012.670418.
10 Kangle, RP, ‘The Kautulya’s Arthashastra’ (Dehli: Motilal Banarsidass, 1969); Boesche, Roger, ‘Kautulya's Arthasastra on War

https://theshillonga.com/index.php/jhed
Arthashastra provides broad coverage on the overall political economy, which includes infrastructure (road networks, fortification and organized forestry), standard weights and measurements throughout the state, labor and employment, commerce and trade, commodities and agriculture, land use and property laws, money and coinage, interest rates and loan markets, tariffs and taxes, government expenditures and the treasury but the main motive remains the same i.e. the utilization of all the tangible and non-tangible resources in augmenting a state’s national power and making an invincible national security capability. It is astonishing that Arthashastra was written more than two thousand years ago advising for the management of the state and to enhance the national security of a state. For a state’s internal security and stability, Kautilya provides detail as to how this should be effectively undertaken. He also gave instructions about dealing with internal security scenarios including but not limited to the protection of the main assets within the state territory and checking internal dissents and internal spoilers.

Machiavelli shocked his contemporaries and even continues to affect the political and strategic thought today by frankly expressing his political realism with the publication of his book, The Prince. Some modern thinkers simply regard Machiavelli as an evil thinker. For example, Leo Strauss considers Machiavelli as an evil teacher. But if one compares Machiavelli’s thoughts to that of the Indian political thinker, Chanakya Kautilya, one will realize that Machiavelli’s The Prince is harmless as compared to Kautilya’s Arthashastra. This view was expressed by Max Webber in his famous lecture, Politics as Vocation. He noted, ‘Truly radical Machiavellianism is classically expressed in the Indian literature, Arthashastra of Kautilya, written long before the birth of the Christ, ostensibly in the time of Chandragupta Maurya. Compared to it Machiavelli’s The Prince is harmless.’ Henry Kissinger is his book, World Order, considers Kautilya’s Arthashastra as a work of fine political thought that lays down the foundation for power acquisition which is a dominant reality in politics of all times. Kissinger is of the view that Arthashastra has given a realist vision of politics long before The Prince.

Rationale

“Study of Chanakya’s Arthashastra, an ancient Indian treatise on statecraft and military strategy, is one of the significant ways to understand Indian strategic culture,” an ex-Indian National Security Advisor, Shivshankar Menon said in 2013 while speaking to a seminar. Although most of the previous studies on Arthashastra have focused on different variable like justice, economy, public administration and civil law in the Arthashastra, national security has been touched by few scholars. In the post-independence India, domestic politics and her foreign policy is largely based on the political teachings (Dandaniti) of Arthashastra and it has been manifested throughout not only in the post-independence Indian national security history but also in her international relations timeline with her major neighbors. Especially the politico-religious parties and groups in India led by the Bhartiya Janata Party (BJP) still

16 Chandrasekaran, Pravin, ‘KAUTILYA: POLITIES, ETHICS AND STATECRAFT’, (May 2006).
17 Sharma, Arwind, ‘Modern Hindu Thought: Introduction’, (London: Oxford University Press, 2005).
18 Sonwalkar, Jayant and Chandan Maheshkar, ‘Chanakya’s Arthashastra: management practices by Indian values’, International Journal of Indian Culture and Business Management 16/4 (2018), 460-473. doi.org/10.1504/JIICBM.2018.092120
19 Olivelle, Patrick, ‘Manu and the Arthashastra, A Study of Sanscrit Intertextuality’, Journal of Indian Philosophy 32 (2004), 281-291
20 Boesche, Roger, ‘Moderate Machiavelli? Contrasting The Prince with the Arthashastra of Kautilya’, Critical Horizons 3/2 (April 2015), 253-276. doi/abs/10.1163/156851602760586671
21 Sihag, Balbir S., ‘An introduction to Kaulitya and his Arthashastra’ Humanomics 25/1 (2009). doi.org/10.1108/0092000925aa.002
22 Keohane, Robert O, ’Political Science as a Vocation’, PS Political Science & Politics 42/2 (April 2009), 359-363. doi.org/10.1017/S10409066090009489
23 Weber, Max, ‘Politics As A Vocation’, (Munich: Fortress Press, 1965).
24 Ahlawat, Dalbir and Tahmina Rahman, ‘India’s Afghan strategy: revisiting Kaulitya’, Bangladesh Institute of International and Strategic Studies Journal 35/2 (2014), 30-4; Boesche, Roger, ‘Kaulitya’s Arthashastra on War and Diplomacy in Ancient India’, The Journal of Military History, 67/1 (2003), 9-37.
25 India Today, ‘Chanakya’s Arthashastra relevant to strategic culture: Shivshanker Menon’, (Dehli, 9 October 2013). 2018 March 2018. <www.indiatoday.in/india/north/story/chanakya-arthashastra-relevant-to-understand-strategic-culture-shivshankar-menon-213738-2013-10-09>.
26 Manrai, Rishi and Utkarsh Goel, ‘Sustainable economic governance: learning from Kautilya’s Arthashastra’, International Journal of Indian Culture and Business Management 15/2 (2017), 241-253. doi/abs/10.1504/jiicbm.2017.086091; Skare, Marinko, ‘The Missing Link: From Kautilya's the Arthashastra to Modern Economics’, Journal of Philosophical Economics 6/2 (May 2013).
27 Sonwalkar, Jayant and Chandan Maheshkar, ‘Chanakya’s Arthashastra: management practices by Indian values’, International Journal of Indian Culture and Business Management 16/4 (2018), 460-473. doi.org/10.1504/JIICBM.2018.092120; Goel, Utkarsh and Rishi Manrai, ‘Stakeholders’ Welfare and Arthashastra: Learning for Modern Business Management’, Purusharth: A Journal of Management Ethics and Spirituality 9/2 (2016). doi.org/10.21844/pajmes.v9h2.6944.
28 Shaffer, Ryan, ‘The new Arthashastra: a security strategy for India’, Intelligence & National Security 33/2 (September, 2017), 298-300. doi/full/10.1080/02664527.2017.1380146; Vittal, Vinay, ‘Kautilya’s Arthashastra: A Timeless Grand Strategy’, (India: School of Advanced Air and Space Studies, 2011).
29 Shaffer, Ryan, ‘The new Arthashastra: a security strategy for India’, Intelligence & National Security 33/2 (September, 2017), 298-300. doi/full/10.1080/02664527.2017.1380146; Prabh, K. S., Vishnu and Laxmi Dhar Dwivedi, ‘Kautilya’s Views on Espionage
believe in and struggle for the greater India, “Hindutva” (which includes a coercive inclusion of Pakistan and surrounding smaller states into India)30. BJP has historically shown a Hindu nationalistic agenda and an anti-Muslim inclination31. Recent amendment in the Indian citizenship act and marginalization of its huge Muslim minority, the world’s longest curfew and crackdown in Indian occupied Kashmir are only recent developments. In recent history, demolition of Babri mosque and the building of Ram Temple are tip of the iceberg examples of the BJP’s commitment to the religious extremist ideology of Hindutva32. These realities are parallel to the concept of the basis of good governance according to the Arthashastra. In Arthashastra, Kautilya clearly states that a powerful state protects its Dharma (religion based on Vedas) at any cost33.

Since India’s freedom from the British rule, it was unable to maintain peaceful relations with her major neighbors i.e. Pakistan and China. India has fought three full-scale wars (1948, 1965 and 1971) against Pakistan and faced two nuclear standoffs (1999 and 2019) on Kargil and Kashmir issue34. Similarly, India has fought a full-scale war (1962), a military skirmish (1967)35 and a military standoff (February 2019) against China. On the other hand, India has maintained a good relationship with the ‘neighbors of her neighbors’ such as Afghanistan, Iran, Russia, and Japan. These trends in Indian national security policy show a clear homogeneity with Raja Mandala theory of Arthashastra36.

Arthashastra devotes a special chapter to the insertion of secret spies into its enemy states, one of the strategies derived from Saptanga theory37. It also considers the ambassadors posted in other states representing their home states as spies but with ‘immunity’. Kautilya describes the duties of the secret spies in detail in Arthashastra.

and its Current Relevance’, Research on humanities and social sciences 5/7 (2015) 60-63; Liebig, Michael, ‘Kautilya's relevance for India today’, India Quarterly 69/2 (2013), 99-116. doi.org/10.1177/002070200706200406; Kulkarni, Kalyan Venkatrao, ‘Relevance of Kautilyas arthashastra today to the Indian economy’, (1997).

30 Siddiqui, Kalim, ‘Hindutva, Neoliberalism and the Reinventing of India’, 4/2 (June 2017), 142- 186; Ghosh, Gautam, ‘An “infiltration” of time? Hindu Chauvinism and Bangladeshi migration in/to Kolkata, India’, Journal of Comparative Research in Anthropology and Sociology 6/1 (2015), 263-288; Misra, Amalendu, ‘Hindu nationalism and Muslim minority rights in India’, International Journal on Minority and Group Rights 7/1 (2000), 1-18. doi.10.1163/15718110020907873.

31 Ratan, Sudha, ‘HINDUTVA: THE SHAPING OF A NEW “HINDU” IDENTITY’, Southeastern Political Review 26/1 (2008), 201-217. doi.10.1111/j.1747-1346.1998.tb00477.x.abstract.

32 Siddiqui, Kalim, ‘A Critical Study of “Hindu Nationalism” in India’, Journal of Business and Economic Policy 3/2 (June 2016), 9-28; Misra, Amalendu, ‘Hindu nationalism and Muslim minority rights in India’, International Journal on Minority and Group Rights 7/1 (2000), 1-18. doi.10.1163/15718110020907873.

33 Rangarajan, LN, ‘The Arthashastra’ (India: Penguin Classics, 1992).

34 Hashim, Asad, ‘Timeline: India-Pakistan relations’, Aljazeera (March 2019); Bajpai, Kanti. ‘Pakistan and China in Indian

Arthashastra. His teachings are parallel to the recent tensions raised (arrest of a RAW agent, Kalbhushan Yadav in Pakistan) between India and Pakistan38.

To understand the regional political dynamics of South Asia, it is pertinent to understand where the stakes of Indian national Security are and what is the contextual habitus of Indian national security. Today India, is making a framework to sustain her policies and continues her realism driven geopolitical maneuvers while safeguarding her national interests using sheer force and brutality. Therefore, understanding Arthashastra and its focus on national security variable, which is known to be the core of Indian political philosophy, is significant. This article is an attempt to explore National security, according to Kautilya, in Arthashastra. This research was conducted using summative content analysis followed by detailed interpretation and discussion.

II. METHOD

The objective of the study

The objective of this study is to explore and emphasize National Security in Arthashastra.

Research questions

1. What is the frequency of the national security variable in Arthashastra?
2. In which sections of Arthashastra, national security is emphasized?
3. How does Arthashastra describe the national security variable?

Operational definition of national security

Strategic Thought’, International Journal: Canada’s Journal of Global Policy Analysis 6/24 (2007), 805-824. doi.10.1177/002070200706200406.

35 Richardson, Lloyd, ‘Now, Play the India Card’, Policy Review (October – November 2002)

36 Mishra, Shobhit, ‘Kautilya’s Mandala Theory’, Research Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, 3/1 (2012),145-148; Boesch, Roger, ‘Kautilya's Arthasastra on War and Diplomacy in Ancient India’, The Journal of Military History, 67/1 (2003), 9-37.

37 Majumdar, Suchitra, ‘Arthashastra as a source of history’, International Journal of Advanced Research and Development, 3/1 (2018), 753-757. doi.org/10.22271/advanced; Prabhu, K. S. Vishnu and Laxmi Dhar Dwivedi, ‘A Brief Comparison on ‘Espionage’ and the Importance of ‘Spies’ between Kautilya’s The Arthashastra & Sun Tzu’s The Art of War’, Mediterranean journal of social sciences 6/6 (2015) 54. Doi. 10.5911/mjss.2015.66s4p544; Prabhu, K. S. Vishnu and Laxmi Dhar Dwivedi, ‘Kautilya’s Views on Espionage and its Current Relevance’, Research on humanities and social sciences 5/7 (2015) 60-63; Trautmann, Thomas, ‘Arthashastra: The Science of Wealth’, (India, USA: Penguin, 2012); Rangarajan, LN, ‘The Arthashastra’ (India: Penguin Classics, 1992).

38 Indian spy Kulbhushan Yadav confesses to spying in Pakistan in video, The News (Pakistan March 2016).
‘National Security is a blend of political resilience and maturity, human resources, economic structure and capacity, technological competence and industrial base and availability of natural resources and the military might’\(^{39}\). Security of a nation state, including its citizens, economy, and institutions are regarded as a duty of a government and to enforce it a ruling government heavily relies on political, economic and military power as well as its diplomatic policies\(^{40}\).

**Elements of national security**

1. **Economic security**

   Economic Security is the ability of individuals and communities to cover their essential needs sustainably and with dignity. This can vary according to individual needs, environment and prevailing cultural standards\(^{41}\).

2. **Physical security/military security**

   It implies the capability of a nation-state to defend itself and to deter military aggression against it\(^{42}\).

3. **Environmental security**

   Encompasses threats posed by environmental events which effect individuals, communities or nations. It focuses on all the known ecological problems that a nation can face\(^{43}\).

4. **Food security**

   Food Security is the state of having reliable access to enough quantity of affordable and nutritious food. It also includes a government’s ability and capacity of securing enough food supplies in the time famine and drought\(^{44}\).

5. **Border security**

   Protecting the borders from illegal movement of weapons, drugs, contraband and the people while promoting lawful trade and travel is essential to national security\(^{45}\).

**Procedure**

To measure National Security variable in *Arthashastra* text, a summative content analysis method has been utilized\(^{46}\). It is a systematic technique for description and analysis of spoken, written and visual pieces of communication. Basically, it gives a quantitative (statistical/numerical) description of facts. Content analysis can be conducted on books, book chapters, essays, interviews, discussions, newspapers, headlines or any occurrence that involves communicative language\(^{47}\). Any medium that can record the communication and can be retrieved is suitable to apply this method. For applying summative content analysis, the first translation of the original text of *Arthashastra*, written in 1915 by R.M. Shastri\(^{48}\) was obtained in a print version which is publicly available. As it is a huge compendium of 15 books, the books were carefully divided and compiled separately in order. The words of the text were carefully counted from the beginning to the end of the book. To quantify and measure the National Security variable in the text of Arthashastra, coding units (see Table 1) were developed to build a coding scheme. The text has been codified by one coder. National Security variable elements\(^{49}\) were given codes with a reference highlighting color.

**Table 1. Coding Units of National security Elements in Arthashastra**

| Coding Units | National Security Elements |
|--------------|---------------------------|
| NS1 (blue)   | Economic Security         |
| NS2 (green)  | Physical Security         |
| NS3 (yellow) | Environmental Security    |
| NS4 (pink)   | Food Security             |
| NS5 (purple) | Border Security           |

The above-mentioned sub-categories were given codes respectively (N1, N2, N3, N4, and N5). Simultaneously, the coding scheme (see Table 2) was developed to identify the coding units in the text of Arthashastra. The coding units were screened carefully with the application of the coding scheme. The data was collected in the coding form for each book separately. Table 2 shows the codebook of National Security elements in Arthashastra.

**Table 2. Coding Scheme of National Security Elements in Arthashastra**

| Coding Scheme of National Security Elements in Arthashastra |
|------------------------------------------------------------|
| (Total number words, articles, and conjunctions are included except the poetic verses at the end of every chapter) |
| 1. Out of the 15 books of the Arthashastra Compendium, every book was printed and compiled separately. |
| 2. All the meaningful sentences of the text were counted as paragraph wise. |

---

\(^{39}\) Defense National College, ‘Proceedings from Semina’, Maritime Seminar proceedings (New Dehli: Palechri 2008, 1996).

\(^{40}\) Contributors, Wiekipeida, ‘National Security’, Wikipedia (1 May 2019).

\(^{41}\) Cross, ICRC-International Committee of Red. What is Economic Security? 18 June 2015. <https://www.icrc.org/en/document/introduction-economic-security>.

\(^{42}\) Field Manual 3-19.30, Physical Security Headquarters (United States Department of Army, 2001) 7-5

\(^{43}\) Organization, United Nations, ‘United Nations Enviroment Security’, (2018). <https://www.unenvironment.org/about-un-environment>.

\(^{44}\) USDA, ‘U.S. Department of Agriculture’, 2018. <https://www.usda.gov/topics/food-and-nutrition/food-security>.

\(^{45}\) Security, Homeland, ‘Border Security’. 2019. <https://www.dhs.gov/topic/border-security>.

\(^{46}\) Rapport, Frances, ‘Summative Analysis: A New Qualitative Method for Social Science and Health Research’, International Journal of Qualitative Methods - ARCHIVE 9/3 (2010), 270-290. doi/abs/10.1177/16094069100090303.

\(^{47}\) Wester, F.P.J.K. Krippendorff, ‘Content analysis. An introduction to its methodology’, Communications 30 (2005), 124-126.

\(^{48}\) Shamasasya, R, ‘Kautilya’s Arthashastra’ (India: 1915).

\(^{49}\) Contributors, Wikepedia, ‘National Security’, Wikipedia (1 May 2019).
3. Paragraphs were also numbered chapter wise.
4. A total number of words in every chapter were counted and an accumulative summary of the book was recorded in the code form.
5. Book-wise statistical summary was noted down in code form separately according to chapter, book, and the whole compendium.
6. Coding units were assigned a separate color scheme (see Table 1).
7. The text was thoroughly studied word by word.
8. During the screening of the text, main themes were highlighted with the assigned color scheme as mentioned in Table 1.

### III. RESULTS

#### Table 3. Overall Arthashastra Statistics on National Security

| Total number of meaningful words written in Arthashastra | Arthashastra |
|--------------------------------------------------------|-------------|
| Total number of words on National Security             | 144928      |
| Percentage of total words written on National Security  | 69.88%      |

#### Table 4. Arthashastra (English translation) Statistics of National Security

| Sr # | Book Name                             | Total Words | Total Words on National Security | Percentage of words on National Security |
|------|---------------------------------------|-------------|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|
| 1    | Concerning discipline.                 | 13483       | 4044                            | 30.01%                                  |
| 2    | Duties of Superintendents              | 33682       | 29370                           | 87.2%                                   |
| 3    | Concerning Law                         | 19301       | 5674                            | 29.4%                                   |
| 4    | The Removal of Thorns                  | 12986       | 5765                            | 44.4%                                   |
| 5    | The Conduct of Courtiers               | 7144        | 2109                            | 29.5%                                   |
| 6    | The Source of Sovereign States         | 1862        | 1737                            | 93.3%                                   |
| 7    | The End of Six-Fold Policy             | 20560       | 19429                           | 94.5%                                   |
| 8    | Concerning Vices & Calamities          | 4114        | 3888                            | 88.1%                                   |
| 9    | The Work of an Invader                 | 8071        | 7885                            | 97.7%                                   |
| 10   | Relating to War                        | 5319        | 5293                            | 99.5%                                   |
| 11   | The Conduct of Corporations            | 1449        | 1433                            | 98.9%                                   |
| 12   | Concerning a Powerful Enemy            | 4645        | 4482                            | 96.5%                                   |
| 13   | Strategic Means to Capture a Fortress  | 5029        | 4576                            | 91%                                     |
| 14   | Secret Means                           | 5865        | 5601                            | 95.5%                                   |
| 15   | The plan of a Treatise                 | 1418        | 0                               | 0%                                      |

#### Table 5. Code unit’s distribution of National Security in Arthashastra

| Codes | 1  | 2  | 3  | 4  | 5  | 6  | 7  | 8  | 9  | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 |
|-------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| NS1   | 23%| 73%| 36%| 15%| 59%| 40%| 4% | 9% | 43%| 22%| 100%| 100%|    |    |
| NS2   | 30%| 15%| 10%| 68%| 15%| 14%| 11%| 62%| 50%| 43%| 100%| 100%|    |    |
| NS3   | 1% | 5% | 8% |    |    |    |    |    |    |    | 100%| 100%|    |    |
| NS4   | 9% | 5% | 31%| 14%| 22%| 2% | 7% | 9% |    |    |    |    |    |    |
| NS5   | 38%| 6% | 24%| 17%| 11%| 23%| 77%| 21%| 25%| 100%| 100%|    |    |    |

Note: NS1—Economic Security; NS2—Physical Security; NS3—Environmental Security; NS4—Food Security; NS5—Border Security

Table 3 gives statistics about the percentage of National Security in the whole text of Arthashastra. Whereas, Table 4 is the information in book-wise detail. In Table 5, the elements of National security have been looked upon. The results show a detail statistical analysis of National Security. The results show that National Security can be found (69.88%) throughout the Arthashastra text.

---

50 Shamasastry, R, ‘Kautilya's Arthashastra’ (India: 1915).
IV. DISCUSSION

‘A wise king though only ruling over a small territory will surely conquer the world if he gathers around him the best as the other constituent elements’

(6.1.15-18) Kautilya51–

Overview of compendium

Arthashastra was first translated by R.M. Shastri in 1909. This translation was intended to be read by higher level officers and ruling elites. It was not meant to be read by commoners until it was translated into different languages52. The text used in this research is the original translation of R.M. Shastri and the interpretation has been conducted by referring to Arthashastra translated by R.P. Kangle53. The original text of R. M. Shastri was used as to keep the originality of the content analysis however, for interpretation R. P. Kangle’s translation has been utilized mainly because by reading the original translation it is difficult to extract the exact meaning as compared to R.P. Kangle’s translation which has been divided into different sections for readers to understand54. The original compendium comprises of 15 books, 180 chapters, 150 chapters and 6000 shlokas (verses/sentences) put together as one treatise. Each book is divided into different chapters. Arthashastra talks about various topics on dictating statecraft to a ruler. The first five books focus on internal administration of a state and the next eight books dictate the conditions and scenarios of dealing with neighboring states and the last two books deal in miscellaneous issues. Poetic expression is found at many places in the text. Animal analogy has also been used throughout the text to refer to different expressions of statecraft.

Objective of Arthashastra

Arthashastra is written in form of a guidebook for a ruler of a state and the goal of the sutras is aimed at the conquest of the world. It explains ways of attaining that goal by focusing on statecraft through various strategies and tactics like manipulation, deception, monopoly, justice for the indigenous population, better administration, rules of a successful kingship and so on. Guiding a ruler on internal matters of a state it describes an ideal well-organized state, what qualities ideal rulers should attain, practical politics, administrative ethics and moral order in society and local level espionage to sabotage conspiracies, rebellions and dissents. It also formulates and lays down various doctrines that must be deliberated upon before taking decisions at the national level.

Understanding Arthashastra in terms of national security

National Security has been stated through different facets of implementation. The interesting fact about Arthashastra is that it has a certain theoretical explanation for how and why a state should act on specific patterns to protect itself from internal and external threats. It advocates a state to protect its people’s Dharma (religion) based on the Vedic tradition of that time. It emphasizes the importance of power and how to sustain power upon the people. Arthashastra states that the basis of good governance is power and knowledge which is distributed into four parts known as four sciences of governance:

- Anvikasi (Philosophy),
- Trayi (the three Vedas-Sama, Rig and Yajur). These texts establish the four classes (varnas) and the four orders (ashrams).
- Varta (economics, especially agriculture, cattle breeding, and the trade to strengthen national power)
- Dandaniti (the science of governance and politics).

Chanakya Kautilya expressed National Security in the form a theory known as the Saptanga Theory or seven elements of Saptanga. The elements of Saptanga theory are explained in detail from book 1 to book 5 in Arthashastra55. However, in the first chapter of book 6 he mentioned the main idea of Saptanga Theory. In book 6 and 7 he talks about how to expand foreign policy objectives and a state’s influence circle. Book 9 and onwards, he talks about how a state can protect herself in the time of danger/calamity. Basically, he talked about how to protect the seven elements of Saptanga. Whereas book 8 is concerned, Kautilya describes what are the possible calamities that can occur to weaken the seven elements of Saptanga.

The elements of the Saptanga Theory are as follows:

1. Swami, the sovereign King (Internal Element)
2. Mantrin, the ministers (Internal Element)
3. Janapada, the people and the land of people (Internal element)
4. Durga, Fort or the defense system to protect its people (Internal element)
5. Kosha, National reservoir or Treasury (Internal Element)
6. Sena or Danda refers to Army of a state (Internal Element)
7. Mitra refers to Allies (External Element)

The first 5 elements of Saptanga theory focus on internal dimension of national security of a state. The last two deal with the external dimension if national security.

Elements of National Security

Economic Security

One of the major themes in Arthashastra was the prosperity of a state. Kautilya’s Arthashastra can be considered as one of the oldest

51 Shamasstry, R, ‘Kautilya’s Arthashastra’ (India: 1915).
52 Kangle, RP, ‘The Kautilya’s Arthashastra’ (Dehli: Motilal Banarsidass, 1969).
53 Ibid
54 Ibid
55 Shamasstry, R, ‘Kautilya's Arthashastra’ (India: 1915).
compilations talking on economic issues at the time when the world was not as complicated and advanced as today. His rules and applications for economic prosperity are still applicable for a state. The wealth of the state was the totality of the surplus stored in the king’s treasury, the commodity warehouse, the granary, the store for forest produce and the ordinance depots. The base of the economy at that time was agriculture, cattle rearing, and trade and it was through these that resources were generated. Kautilya had a clear understanding of all these shades of national economy. He clearly propounded national economy as the base of military strength to control a state’s population and occupation of more adjoining lands and people. Using these, the king obtained a treasury and an army, which were then used to bring under his control both his own people and the people of the enemy.

He treated the concept of wealth to another end i.e. augmenting national security. Wealth alone enabled the creation of more wealth. He states that a state can utilize its natural resources to build treasury, its army and then more wealth. ‘and wealth is bound by wealth just as elephants are bound by counter-elephants’ The king with depleted treasury will eat into the very vitality of both citizens and country people.

In book 8, Kautilya talks about how to save the state during calamities and his entire emphasis is on protecting the treasury more than anything. In order of importance of the six internal constituent elements of a state, the treasury is placed immediately below the king and ministers and the people, both rural and urban. The treasury is ranked above the army because ‘the army is dependent on finance. In the absence of resources, a (disaffected) army goes to the enemy or even kills the king. Book 5 talks in detail about the means of revenue, state enterprise, how to apply taxes and other means of tax collection. ‘A king who found himself in financial difficulties could collect additional revenue by special methods.

Even ownership of property and other forms of wealth was only a state’s ultimate right according to Kautilya. It included individual property and even the natural resources such as domesticated animals and farmlands. Arthashastra gives the king a supreme authority and binds the people to obey him in entirety. The main principles of the economic administration were that the rulers and the main leadership of the state must run their economy actively, efficiently and earn profits to strength national defense and expansion of national security objectives. ‘The king is advised to be active in the management of the economy because the root of wealth is economic activity; inactivity brings material distress. Without an active policy, both current prosperity and future military gains are destroyed.

Kautilya also introduced a tax system in ancient India. ‘Those who perform sacrifices (ritvik), spiritual guides, priests, and those learned in the Vedas shall be granted Brahmdaya lands yielding sufficient produce and exempted from taxes and fines (adandkarani). ‘lands prepared for cultivation shall be given to tax-payers (karada) only for life (ekapurushakani).’

The Arthashastra economic framework hardly leaves any area in building an economic policy for a nation. Its teachings talk about agriculture, forestry, wildlife, mining, cottage industries, transport and trade. It also provides a detailed explanation of the revenue distribution such as taxes and fines and how to maintain law and order. ‘It is necessary to build storage reservoirs because the water stored after a good rainfall could be made available continuously for irrigation. Water reservoirs, dams’ construction and cautionary actions in the time of natural calamities were all taken care ahead of the time.

Physical Security/Military Security ‘No enemy shall know his secrets. He shall, however, know all his enemy’s weaknesses. Like a tortoise, he shall draw in any limb of his that is exposed. Kautilya stated that the king had two major duties towards his people. One internal and other external. To implement them, he needs a strong army. The war and military practices are mainly stated in book 1 and 13 of Arthashastra. War is extensively defined by Kautilya in which he not only includes physical security but also diplomacy. Prakasayuddha refers to the open warfare; Mantrayuddha refers to war by diplomacy, especially for a smaller state or a weak ruler. Other types of warfare include Kutayuddha which refers to a hidden/concealed war or in modern terms, psychological warfare and the last type is Gudayuddha which refers to the monopoly of a state or covert warfare in which a king sends his agents or spies across the foe nation to make it weak first and then attack.

Kautilya wrote that there were three types of war: open, concealed and silent war. While the concept of open war is obvious, Kautilya had guerrilla war in mind when he talked about concealed warfare. But his original contribution was the concept of silent warfare. Silent war according to him is a kind of warfare against another state in which the ruler and his ministers and unknowingly the people act publicly as if they were at peace with the opposing

62(2.1.11.1), ibid
63(8.1.47.48), Kangle, RP, ‘The Kautilya’s Arthashastra’ (Dehli: Motilal Banarsidass, 1969).
64(5.2), ibid
65(1.19.14.1), Shamasasya, R, ‘Kautilya's Arthashastra’ (India: 1915).
66(2.1.5.1), ibid
67(2.1.7.1) Shamasasya, R, ‘Kautilya's Arthashastra’ (India: 1915).
68(7.14.21.22), ibid.
69(1.15.60), ibid.
state, while secret agents and spies are assassinating important leaders in the foe state creating divisions among key ministers and socio-economic classes and spreading propaganda and disinformation with the ultimate aim of weakening and subjugating it. To put it in Kautilya’s words, Open war is fighting at the place and time indicated: creating fright, sudden assaults, striking when there is error or a calamity in the enemy camp, giving way and striking in one place are types of concealed warfare, that which concerns secret practices and instigations through secret agents is the mark of silent warfare⁷⁰.

His physical security strategies not only included offensive actions (warfare) but also defensive actions (defensive policies) against the enemies. ‘The physical defense included the frontier port protected by the army to protect from the invasion of aliens’⁷¹. He included ‘forts in the form of nature such as mountains, rivers, jungle, and desert as a form of forts’⁷². A proper system of management of the army and paying the troops well enough, to not be bribed by the enemies, is suggested by Kautilya.

‘A nation is dependent on the army for controlling allies and enemies, winning over an enemy’s army and reinforcing one’s own’. Dandaniti refers to the implementation of laws through various means. Kautilya called army, the Danda. He referred Kosa as wealth and stated that Kosadanda is the nation’s strongest power to attain prosperity. In his political and administrative ideas, the focus of attention was the state and the ruler. According to his belief, for smooth functioning of a state, the ruler must be acquainted with the Vedas (Hindu religious texts) and with the four sciences of governance. Sometimes the term Dandaniti is employed for the main subject of Arthashastra which means polity or governance. Kautilya asserted that the ruler should use any means to attain his goals and his actions required no moral sanctions and protect the Dharma nation⁷³.

Environmental Security
‘A king must protect his nation in times of natural calamities and from enemies, both internal and external threat’. When it comes to environmental security, Arthashastra uses the environment as a source of defense. Not, in particular, to save the environment, in fact, use it as a tool to protect the nation against its enemies. ‘Productive forest should be large, near the borders of the country, with river and yield material of high value’⁷⁴. Apart from this, one of the main environmental security shades that exists in Arthashastra is the sustenance of the economy of food, agriculture, forestry, animal husbandry and preservation of minerals such as gold and silver.

Cattle rearing, harvesting, and crop production have also been emphasized. In Arthashastra, Kautilya mentions that natural resources like rivers and mountains play the role of a fort against the foe state.

Food Security
‘The organization of new settlements in uninhabited but cultivable areas of the country is an important activity of the state, not only for the increased revenue it would bring but also make the country more easily defendable. Even in times of great financial stringency, the state is advised to promote new settlements by grants of grain, cattle, and money’⁷⁵. Arthashastra considers food production, a reservoir of food and its safety as a part of national security. ‘Power comes from the countryside, which is the source of all activities’⁷⁶. In book 2 of Arthashastra, he advised that a superintendent should be appointed from cattle rearing and crop production to the exportation of crop lands. He gave utmost importance to land as a tangible factor of national power. ‘Cultivable land is better than mines because mines fill only the treasury while agriculture production fills both the treasury and the store houses’⁷⁷.

‘The king had to ensure that agriculture was protected from harassment by not levying onerous taxes or fines and by not making undue demands for free labor’⁷⁸. He emphasized in keeping reservoirs of food in the times of famine and natural disaster. ‘Whatever in the shape of agriculture produce is brought in by the superintendent of agriculture’⁷⁹.

Border Security
‘The frontier is protected by forts, especially on the trade routes to other countries’⁸⁰. Book 7 primarily deals with the complete formation of a structured state. Its chapter number 10, 11 and 12, he talks about the forts, different kinds of land, irrigation system, forest and mines. Arthashastra emphasizes building a fort around the border of a state to make it secure. At that point of time, forts were not only built to secure a wall around a state but had several roles to play. During the time of war, a fort could hide the state leadership and keep them safe. Not only the leadership but also the people of a state could take refuge inside a fort. Food and domestic animals were secure in the fort for the time of calamities. ‘Other kinds of economic activity were building a fort to ensure a haven for the king and the people in times of trouble’⁸¹.

V. CONCLUSION
Arthashastra talks about political realism and how an efficient government is formed and utilized by a diligent and a successful

---

⁷⁰ (9. 4. 5), Shamasasty, R, ‘Kautilya’s Arthashastra’ (India: 1915).
⁷¹ (2.3.1.2), Kangle, RP, ‘The Kautilya’s Arthashastra’ (Dehli: Motilal Banarsidass, 1969).
⁷² (7.1.16), ibid.
⁷³ Chandrasekaran, Pravin, ‘KAUTILYA: POLITICS, ETHICS AND STATECRAFT’, (May 2006).
⁷⁴ (7.12.6.7), Kangle, RP, ‘The Kautilya’s Arthashastra’ (Dehli: Motilal Banarsidass, 1969).
⁷⁵ (5.2.4), ibid.
⁷⁶ (7.14.19), ibid.
⁷⁷ (7.11.10-12), Shamasasty, R, ‘Kautilya's Arthashastra’ (India: 1915).
⁷⁸ (2.1.37), Shamasasty, R, ‘Kautilya's Arthashastra’ (India: 1915).
⁷⁹ (2.15.2.1), ibid.
⁸⁰ (2.3.1), Kangle, RP, ‘The Kautilya’s Arthashastra’ (Dehli: Motilal Banarsidass, 1969).
⁸¹ (7.14.21), ibid.
leader. In Kautilya’s ideology, we notice that unity, faith, and discipline prevail. Kautilya believed that the goal of politics was the power to control not only outward behavior but also the thoughts of one’s subjects and enemies. A wise ruler needs to bring together all elements of power into a coherent whole in pursuit of his strategic goal. The various elements of power including economic strength, military prowess, diplomacy, espionage, law, cultural traditions, public morale, and opinion, need to be shaped by the ruler into a coherent strategy for strengthening and expanding his kingdom. According to Kautilya, immediate neighboring states existed in a state of latent and permanent hostility. He stressed that every nation acted to maximize its power and promote its political and military interests and therefore, moral principles or obligations had little force in interstate relations.

It is evident from the content analysis of Arthashastra, that its main theme is national security of a state. Internal and external factors of national security start from the very beginning to the end of the book. This content analysis of Arthashastra disagrees with researchers who state that Arthashastra is not about political science but about economics or public policy. No doubt, economics, public policy, administration and law are parts of Arthashastra, but they all revolve around the idea of national security. As explained above, the main theme of the book is the seven elements of Saptanga or Saptanga theory. We can say that Kautilya was one of the founders of political realism and his strategic thought is still superior to that of Machiavelli. Max Weber was the first to point out the importance of Kautilya's Arthashastra, otherwise, it was unrepresented in the world of political science.

Indian political leaders had a special interest in Kautilya’s Arthashastra such as Jawaharlal Nehru. It is evident that when Jawaharlal Nehru was in prison in the winter of 1930, he thoroughly studied Kautilya’s Arthashastra. Former Indian Presidents have shown evident interest of studying Arthashastra. Liebig (2013) in his study gives complete evidence of the Kautilya’s thought in today’s Indian politics. He stated that ‘Not only former presidents of India such as Jawaharlal Nehru, President Pranab Mukherjee, and NSA Shivshankar Menon showed interest but Chanakya thought to prevail in Indian society today’. He added, ‘A symbolic representation of Kautilya such as street names, names of educational institutes, or businesses or pen names, Tv-serials and Kautilya guidebooks or comics are easily available in the market which is a vital evidence of Chanakyan thought in India’.

Besides the manifest presence of Chanakya’s thought, there is a latent dimension of its presence in India. It can be understood as a contextual habitus, a concept propounded by Bourdieu. Habitus is a sociological concept which states that the past is incorporated while socializing in the present and thus, influences the present behavior. In other words, it is a carrier of the past ideas which are forgotten but efficacious. Kautilya’s Arthashastra is a major habitus of the ideational ingredient of the Indian strategic community and Indian strategic culture. This can be found while analyzing the political and defense-related documents which represent the Chanakya thought but do not refer to Chanakya Kautilya because it is taken for granted or commonly understood. Another affinity of Indian political and cultural mindset with Kautilya is clearly depicted in the epics of Mahabharata/ Bhisma dialogue and Panchatantra and Ramayana which play a vital role in the primary socialization in Indian society. The recent rise of India as a major world power and her struggle for becoming the Asian hegemon is majorly due to the rise of Chanakyan thought in India.

Arthashastra is a complete compendium of political realism and it remains exclusive in all Indian Literature. It is not possible for Indian Political thought to totally absent such a unique piece of ideology out of their context or deny its application. What makes it unique is the time at which it originated and the real politic ideas it crafted. Kautilya, undoubtedly can be considered as one of the major and early theorists of political and strategic thought. This study proves through the detailed summative content analysis of Arthashastra, national security is one of the major themes in it. It is also evident that it cannot be taken aback as it is relevant and an important aspect of Indian political culture. To understand the Indian political thought, it is very important to understand Kautilya’s Arthashastra. It is highly recommended for future researches that summative content analysis should be conducted by more than one coder to prove national security’s existence in the text.

REFERENCES

[1] Ahlawat, Dalbir and Tahmina Rahman, ‘India’s Afghan strategy: revisiting Kautilya’, Bangladesh Institute of International and Strategic Studies Journal 35/2 (2014), 30-4.

[2] Anand, Aanchal, ‘Countering Hidden Risks in the India-Pakistan Conflict’, SAIS Review of International Affairs 32/1 (2012), 143-146.

[82] Malhotra, Divya, ‘Kautilya: The True Founder of Economics by Balbir Singh锡has’, Strategic Analysis 38/5 (2014), 763-765. doi:10.1080/09700161.2014.941229;锡has, Balbir S., ‘An introduction to Kautilya and his Arthashastra’ Humanomics 25/1 (2009), doi.org/10.1108/h.2009.12425aaa.002.

[83] Sihas, Balbir S., ‘Kautilya and Machiavelli on Justice, Prosperity and National Security’. Theoretical Economics Letters 7/3 (April 2017), 381-397. doi:10.4236/tel.2017.73029.

[84] Liebig, Michael, ‘Kautilya's relevance for India today’, India Quarterly 69/2 (2013), 99-116. doi.org/10.1177/0974928413481881

[85] ibid.

[86] ibid.

[87] Prasad, Jayant, ‘Kautilya’s Arthashastra: an intellectual portrait: the classical roots of modern politics in India’, Strategic Analysis 42/4 (2018) 451-452. doi.10.1080/09700161.2018.1482621.

[88] Jenkins, Richard, ‘Pierre Bourdieu’ (Routledge: Psychology Press, 2002).

[89] Liebig, Michael, ‘Kautilya's relevance for India today’, India Quarterly 69/2 (2013), 99-116. doi.org/10.1177/0974928413481881
Political thoughts

HINDUTVA: THE SHAPING OF A NEW

April

The Concept of â€œOrderâ€ in Arthashastra,

South Asian Survey, 21/2 (March 2014), 211-226.

Boesche, Roger, ‘Kautilya’s Arthasastra on War and Diplomacy in Ancient India’, The Journal of Military History, 67/1 (2003), 9-37.

Boesche, Roger, ‘Moderate Machiavelli? Contrasting The Prince with the Arthashastra of Kautilya’, Critical Horizons 3/2 (April 2015), 253-276. doi/abs/10.1163/156851602760586671

Boesche, Roger, ‘The First Great Political Realist: Kautilya and His Arthashastra’, (Lexington Books 2013)

Brekke, Torkel, ‘Wielding the Rod of Punishment-War and Violence in the Political Science of Kautilya’, Journal of Military Ethics 40 (March 2004), 40-52. doi:10.1080/150275704100005210

Chandrasekaran, Pravin, ‘KAUTILYA: POLITICS, ETHICS AND STATECRAFT’, (May 2006).

Goel, Utkarsh and Rishi Manrai, ‘Stakeholders’ Welfare and Arthashastra: Learning for Modern Business Management’, Purushartha: A Journal of Management Ethics and Spirituality 9/2 (2016). doi.org/10.21844/pajimes.v9i2.6944

Gowen H. Herbert, ‘The Indian Machiavelli or Political Theory in India two Thousand Years ago’, Political Science Quarterly 44/2 (June 1929), 173-192.

Howladar, Mithun, ‘Political thoughts of Kautilya: An overview’, International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Development, 4/3 (2017), 78-80. doi.org/10.22271/ijmrd

Jenkins, Richard, ‘Pierre Bourdieu’ (Routledge: Psychology Press, 2002).

Kangle, RP, ‘The Kautilya’s Arthashastra’ (Dehli: Motilal Banarsidass, 1969).

Kautilya, Patrick Olivelle and Mark McClish, ‘The Arthashastra selections from the classic Indian work on statecraft’. (Indianapolis, Ind Hackett 2012).

Keohane, Robert O, ‘Political Science as a Vocation’, PS Political Science & Politics 42/2 (April 2009), 359-363. doi/10.1017/S1049095609004089

Liebig, Michael, ‘Kautilya’s relevance for India today’, India Quarterly 69/2 (2013), 99-116. doi/10.1177/0974928413481881

Majumdar, Suchitra, ‘Arthashastra as a source of history’, International Journal of Advanced Research and Development, 3/1 (2018), 753-757. doi.org/10.22771/advanced

Malhotra, Divya, ‘Kautilya: The True Founder of Economics by Balbir Singh Sihag’, Strategic Analysis 38/5 (2014), 763-765. doi.10.1080/09700161.2014.941229.

Manrai, Rishi and Utkarsh Goel, ‘Sustainable economic governance: learning from Kautilya’s Arthashastra’, International Journal of Indian Culture and Business Management 15/2 (2017), 241-253. doi/abs/10.1504/ijicbm.2017.086091.

Mishra, Shobhit, ‘Kautilya’s Mandala Theory’, Research Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, 3/1 (2012),145-148.

Misra, Amalendu, ‘Hindu nationalism and Muslim minority rights in India’, International Journal on Minority and Group Rights 7/1 (2000), 1-18. doi/abs/10.1163/1571811002907873.

Modelski, George, ‘Kautilya: Foreign Policy and International System in the Ancient Hindu World’, American Political Science Review 58/3 (1964), 549-560. doi.org/10.2307/1953131

Olivelle, Patrick, ‘Manu and the Arthashastra, A Study of Sanscrit Intertextuality’, Journal of Indian Philosophy 32 (2004), 281-291

Prabhu, K. S. Vishnu and Laxmi Dhar Dwivedi, ‘A Brief Comparison on ‘Espionage’ and the Importance of ‘Spies’ between Kautilya’s The Arthashastra & Sun Tzu’s The Art of War’, Mediterranean journal of social sciences 6/6 (2015) S4. Doi. 10.5901/mjss.2015.v6n6s4p544

Prabhu, K. S. Vishnu and Laxmi Dhar Dwivedi, ‘Kautilya’s Views on Espionage and its Current Relevance’, Research on humanities and social sciences 5/7 (2015) 60-63.

Prasad, Jayant, ‘Kautilya’s Arthashastra: an intellectual portrait: the classical roots of modern politics in India’, Strategic Analysis 42/4 (2018) 451-452. doi/10.1080/09700161.2018.1482621.

Rangarajan, LN, ‘The Arthashastra’ (India: Penguin Classics, 1992).

Rapport, Frances, ‘Summative Analysis: A New Qualitative Method for Social Science and Health Research’, International Journal of Qualitative Methods - ARCHIVE 9/3 (2010), 270-290. doi/abs/10.1177/160940691000900303.

Rasik, Anuranjini, ‘Kautilya Revitalized’, International Journal of Innovative Research and Advanced Studies 2/4 (April 2015), 10-15.

Ratan, Sudha, ‘HINDUTVA: THE SHAPING OF A NEW “HINDU” IDENTITY’, Southeastern Political Review 26/1 (2008), 201-217. doi/10.1111/j.1747-1346.1998.tb00477.x/abstract.

Richardson, Lloyd, ‘Now, Play the India Card’, Policy Review (October – November 2002)
[35] Saran, Shyam, 'How India Sees The World: From Kautilya to Modi: Kautilya to the 21st Century', (Mumbai: Juggernaut 30 August 2017).

[36] Schottli, Jivanta, ‘How India sees the world today. Kautilya to the 21st Century’, Journal of Indian Ocean Region 15/1 (November 2018), 117-118. doi.org/10.1080/19480881.2018.1550472

[37] Shaffer, Ryan, ‘The new Arthashastra: a security strategy for India’, Intelligence & National Security 33/2 (September, 2017), 298-300. doi/full/10.1080/02684527.2017.1380146.

[38] Shamasaswetry, R, ‘Kautilya's Arthashastra' (India: 1915).

[39] Sharma, Arwind, ‘Modern Hindu Thought: Introduction’, (London: Oxford University Press, 2005).

[40] Siddiqui, Kalim, ‘A Critical Study of ‘Hindu Nationalism’ in India’, Journal of Business and Economic Policy 3/2 (June 2016), 9-28.

[41] Siddiqui, Kalim, ‘Hindutva, Neoliberalism and the Reinventing of India', 4/2 (June 2017), 142-186.

[42] Sihag, Balbir S., ‘An introduction to Kautilya and his Arthashastra’ Humanomics 25/1 (2009). doi.org/10.1108/h.2009.12425aaa.002

[43] Sihag, Balbir S., ‘Kautilya and Machiavelli on Justice, Prosperity and National Security’, Theoretical Economics Letters 7/3 (April 2017), 381-397. Doi.10.4236/ tel.2017.73029

[44] Skare, Marinko, ‘The Missing Link: From Kautilya's the Arthashastra to Modern Economics’, Journal of Philosophical Economics 6/2 (May 2013)

[45] Solomon, Hussein, ‘Critical reflections of Indian foreign policy: Between Kautilya and Ashoka’, South African Journal of International Affairs 19/1 (2012), 65-78. Sdoi/10.1080/10220461.2012.670418>

[46] Sonwalkar, Jayant and Chandan Maheshkar, ‘Chanakya's 'Arthashastra': management practices by Indian values’, International Journal of Indian Culture and Business Management 16/4 (2018), 460-473. doi.org/10.1504/IJJICBM.2018.092120

[47] Trautmann, Thomas, ‘Arthashastra: The Science of Wealth’, (India, USA: Penguin, 2012).

[48] Vittal, Vinay, ‘Kautilya's Arthashastra: A Timeless Grand Strategy’. (India: School of Advanced Air and Space Studies, 2011).

[49] Weber, Max, ‘Politics As A Vocation’, (Munich: Fortress Press, 1965).

[50] Wester, F.P.J.K. Krippendorff, 'Content analysis. An introduction to its methodology', Communications 30 (2005), 124-126.