Tolerance Attitude among Religious People in Marine Environment: Case Study of Mosque of Ex-Kampong Texas

Faradila Hasan¹, Rosdalina Bukido², Ismail Suardi Wekke³, Rahman Mantu⁴

¹Faculty of Sharia, IAIN Manado, Sulawesi Utara, Indonesia
Email : faradila.hasan@iain-manado.ac.id

²Faculty of Law, IAIN Manado, Sulawesi Utara, Indonesia
Email : rosdalina.bukido@iain-manado.ac.id

³Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Negeri (STAIN) Sorong, West Papua. Indonesia
Email : ismail@stain-sorong.ac.id

⁴Faculty of Ushuluddin Adab and Da'wah, IAIN Manado, Sulawesi Utara, Indonesia
Email : rahmanmantu530@gmail.com

Abstract. This paper raises the issue of the conflict that occurred between religious people in ex-kampong Texas. The conflict was marked by an action promoted by the Tolerance Care Community Alliance (Makapetor) Tou Minahasa. The method used in this research is qualitative method using multicultural approach. This study focuses on the attitude of tolerance among religious people, in this case, that are Muslims and Christians. From some informant's statement, the writer can draw the conclusion that the tolerance among religious people in Manado City is still available, although it can not be denied that there are still suspicions between each party that there are people who benefit from this conflict and also critic the government of Manado City.

1. Introduction
When hearing about the term ‘multicultural’, this can not be separated from the attitude of tolerance among religious people, although multicultural is not only always associated with inter-religious tolerance, but also the attitude of tolerance among tribes, races, groups and others. In communities, inter-religious conflict often happens. Thus, the word tolerance is often juxtaposed with the word ‘religion’. The discourse of multiculturalism for the context in Indonesia found its momentum when the authoritarian-militaristic national system collapsed with the fall of the Soeharto regime. At that time, various conflicts between ethnic groups and between groups happened. Such conditions made various parties increasingly question what kind of national system was suitable for a change for Indonesia, as well as what system could make the people of Indonesia live peacefully by minimizing the potential for conflict (Masykur, 2016).

Related to tolerance, Baidi (2010) revealed that religious tolerance talks are still important in the context of the plural Indonesian nation. Multiplicity in language, religion, ethnicity, and custom requires a sophistication of conflict management, so that conflict with tension on an ongoing basis can be well managed.
From the image of tolerance among religious people, especially in Manado city whose population consists of several tribes such as the Minahasa, Bolaang Mongondow, Sangihe, Gorontalo, Makassar, Java and many other tribes, we know that the tribes also represent the majority religion that exist in the origin of each and all of these tribes coexist without any meaningful conflict.

Another case of religion is that there are several assumptions of religious leaders and people of Manado city that the actual conflict that occurred was not on the inter-ethnic, but on religion. Their assumption is that there were some minority religions in the city of Manado who felt disturbed, from the case of worship to the case of permissions for the worship houses construction. Of course, this can not be ignored.

However, by looking at the condition of the community, both minority and majority in Manado city, there is still no significant conflict threatening harmony among religious people. This is evidenced by the existence of inter-religious activities where there was a diversity festival held in the Hall of DPRD Building of North Sulawesi Province on December 10, 2016 ago. The festival presented a mix of inter-religions in North Sulawesi, but it caused controversy in the community because in one appearance, shalawat gloria was played, it was shalawat with tones of gloria hum. There was also training activities about interfaith communities, New Generation Initiative and Engagement (INGAGE), in September 2016 in the city of Manado, and many other interfaith activities held in Manado.

From interfaith activities and the absence of meaningful conflicts between religious people and the inter-ethnic cohesion in the city of Manado, it is quite natural that the author says that Manado is a tolerant multicultural city. It is also agreed by Manado State Institute of Islamic Studies (IAIN) by seeking human resources of multicultural insight as it becomes the vision and mission of IAIN Manado in 2020.

We should keep the tolerance that has been established so that all can live peacefully in diversity. However, some time ago exactly on October 26, 2016, the Alliance of Kawanua Community Care Tolerance (MAKAPETOR) Tou Minahasa took action in downtown Manado precisely in District Wenang ex-kampong Texas. This action was allegedly as an intolerant act against Muslims. There were three demands from the action made by the MAKAPETOR Alliance that were: first, the return of the function of ex-kampong Texas as a religious tourism park. Second, the acceleration of the construction of religious tourism parks. Third, the dismantling of buildings that did not fit allotment in Ex-kampong Texas land.

The action is a concern in various circles, there are some that link the action as a backlash of various actions that occurred in the capital of Jakarta, the case of alleged blasphemy by the governor of Jakarta Basuki Tjahaya Purnama (Ahok) which led to the establishment of Ahok as a suspect. Some say that this action is an intolerant action among religious people and there are some that also link this action related to some political interests until certain elements can be benefited.

In fact, there are also some that link this problem with the discriminating efforts by the city government that is intolerant behind and is tolerant in front of the public. We need the best solution on this case so that no party will feel aggrieved if the problem is not protracted. So that in the end, there will be no clash between religious people.

Apart from these views, we need to pay attention to not to do so because the things mentioned above can be our reason for divisiveness. Harmony must be maintained although intolerant behavior is emerging outside the North Sulawasi.

This paper focuses on the attitude of tolerance among religious people who reflected on the conflict between Christians and Muslims that occurred in ex-kampong Texas Masjid Al-Khairiyah in District Wenang Manado City.

2. Research methods
This research includes the type of qualitative research using a multicultural approach which aims to explore information in depth about the reality of tolerance attitude among religious communities in the
city of Manado. The author assessed the form of tolerance through the opinions expressed by some informants who are successfully interviewed. The successfully interviewed informant are 6 people.

Informants in this research are six people. Among them are informants who were directly involved with the actions of the Tolerance Care Community Alliance (MAKAPETOR) Tou Minahasa on Wednesday, October 26, 2016 and also some Christian religious leaders and Imam Masjid Al-Khairiyah ex-kampong of Texas Manado.

Sources of data in this study are obtained from the results of interviews with six informants as well as some scientific literature from books and articles related to the concept of tolerance and multicultural.

3. Results of Research and Discussion
No society can escape from conflict, at least the so-called non-existence or unreal conflict. In contrast to realistic conflicts that really become empirical facts and can be seen by naked eye, unreal conflict is a misunderstanding of other groups contained in human thought. But if there is a trigger, the conflict will be a realistic conflict (Arifin, 2015).

Conflict refers to the relationship between the conflicting individual and / or group. In the social life of friction, conflicts and disputes among the citizens of society is not impossible to be caused by various factors such as social, economic, political, cultural, and so forth. However, conflicts can also be caused by wider issues than these (Maulana, 2016).

Religion is not infrequently used as a "tool" and is accused as the cause of every riot or conflict in society. The problem of differences between religious groups, in this case are Islam and Christianity, is not rarely raised on the surface by the religious elite so that the phenomenon that appears in every religious conflict is more religious jihad form of "holy war" to fight for and defend religion. The use of religious labels has been used as a means of dispute, causing hostilities and worsening the climate of religious harmony. There is a religious tendency to be used as a tool to "raise" and "justify" disputes (Maulana, 2016).

Conflict is created by the desire of a group of people to gain a momentary advantage that causes many victims, but it needs to be understood, not all dissent can mean conflict. Competition is the same as conflict, but it is easy to lead to conflict, especially when there is competition that uses ways that are contrary to agreed rules (Artis, 2011).

According to Artis, the things that cause conflict in the midst of pluralist society are: first, the difference of race and religion. Second, differences in culture. Third, majority and minority issues where the majority feel belonging and power in an area so that the minority feel depressed (Artist, 2011).

The term tolerance comes from Latin "tolerare" which means being patient with something. So tolerance is a behavior of people who follow the rules, in which one can appreciate, respect for the behavior of others. The term tolerance in the socio-cultural and religious contexts means attitudes and actions that prohibit discrimination against different groups or classes within a society, such as religious tolerance, in which the majority religious group within a society provides a place for other religious groups to live in its environment (Bakar, 2015).

Nevertheless, the word tolerance is still controversial and criticized from various quarters, on the principles of tolerance, both from liberals and conservatives. However, religious tolerance is an attitude of respect and respect for other religious groups (Bakar, 2015).

Tolerance is a concept that describes mutual respect and cooperation between different ethnic, linguistic, cultural, political and religious groups. The concept of tolerance is a great and noble concept that fully becomes an organic part of the teachings of religions, including Islam (Hertina, 2010).

Thus, tolerance leads to a willingness to accept the reality of the differences that others have. Tolerance can be interpreted as giving a place to a different opinion, accompanied by an attitude, restraint or patience. Therefore, among people of different opinion, we must pay attention to the same attitude of mutual respect by considering the unity of the nation and the state (Artist, 2011).
According to Hertina (2010), tolerant attitude does not mean to justify the views allowed, but to recognize the freedom and rights of its adherents. There are three kinds of tolerance are as follows:

3.1. Negative Tolerance
The content of the teachings and adherents is not appreciated. The content of the teachings and adherents is only left alone because it is in a state of necessity.

3.2. Positive Tolerance
The content of the teaching is rejected, but the adherents are accepted and respected. For example, you are Muslim must oblige the law to reject the teachings of other religions based on belief in your religious teachings, but you cherish its adherents or human beings.

3.3. Ecumenical tolerance
The content of the teachings and adherents is appreciated, because in their teachings there are elements of truth that are useful to deepen their own beliefs. For example, you and your friends follow the same religion Islam or Christian but different streams or understanding.

In the context of inter-religious tolerance, Islam has a clear concept. "There is no compulsion in religion", "for you your religion and for us our religion" is a popular example of tolerance in Islam. In addition to those verses, many other verses are scattered in various Surahs and also a number of traditions and practices of tolerance in Islamic history. Historical facts show that the issue of tolerance in Islam is not a foreign concept. Tolerance is an integral part of Islam itself whose details are then formulated by scholars in their tafsir works. Then these formulations were perfected by the scholars with new enrichments that eventually became a historical practice in the Islamic community (Aslati, 2012).

Tolerance among religious people in Islam receives important and serious attention. Moreover, religious tolerance is a matter that concerns the existence of human belief in Allah swt. He is so sensitive, primodial and easy to burn conflict so as to absorb great attention from Islam (Bakar, 2015).

But nowadays Islam faces a lot of criticism coming from outside Islam. Islam is considered an intolerant religion that is often discriminatory and extreme. Islam is considered a religion that does not consider religious freedom. Such assumptions are rooted, moreover proliferation of terror in the name of Islamic sharia enforcement by the elements of radical understanding is growing. Muslims must work hard to restore the image of Islam that becomes a blessing for the whole of nature, the attitudes of tolerance exemplified by the Messenger of Allah should be more in da'wah.

Indeed Islam is present as a grace of lil'alamin for the universe. Becoming grace in the sense that the presence of Islam brings peace and avoids conflicts, both vertical and horizontal conflicts. In Islam, correct understanding always leads to good and moderate. There are some circles doing the actions on behalf of Islam that cause horizontal conflict can not necessarily be a reason to blame Islam. Usually such acts occur because of the misconceptions of the teachings of Islam or of emotional factors, such as the consequences of non-Muslim crimes committed in Muslim countries, as happened in the Middle East (Bakar, 2015).

Islam as a religion teaches mankind to always respect and tolerate others and keep the holiness and truth of Islamic teachings. Historical events have proven that Islam is a religion that teaches tolerance to all religions. Islam teaches its people the importance of maintaining unity and harmony, both internally and internationally. Islam also teaches its people to always tolerate to fellow believers and inter-religious people, and love each other among followers of religion. Furthermore, Islam also instills the values of patience and freedom of expression. One of the verses in the Qur'an from the many theorem that enjoins Muslims to respect other religions is “God does not forbid you to do good and do justice to those who have not fought you for religion and have not expelled you from your country. Allah loves those who are just. Allah only forbids you to make your friends those who fight you because of religion and drive you out of your country, and help (others) to drive you out. Whoever
makes them friends, they are the wrongdoers (Surah al-Mumtahanah: 28). Similarly, the hadith of the Prophet who teaches Muslims to respect other religions is "There is actually a body that passes before the Messenger of Allah, then the Apostle stood in his honor. Then, it was said to him: Surely the body is Jewish. " The apostle replied: Is not he also a man" (Bakar, 2015).

The above verses and traditions affirm that there is no prohibition to do good and to be fair to people outside of Islam. Muslims must respect people outside of Islam as long as they do not fight against Muslims.

The standard of tolerance and justice in Islam, in which Islam recommends not to respond to the low and despicable charges of opponents, doing so will make Islam itself cruel. Conversely, forgiveness is a better act and if it is required to retaliate, the reply with the note does not exceed the limits that have been incurred in Islam. That is, if they are powerless and give up, then do not do excessive actions (Burn, 2015).

Tolerance in Islam is authentic. It means familiar and even it has existed since Islam existed. Because of its organic nature, tolerance within Islam is just a matter of implementation and a commitment to practice it consistently. However, religious tolerance according to Islam is not merged into beliefs nor it is to exchange confidence among religious groups of different religions. Tolerance in question is in the sense muamalah (social interaction). So, there are shared limits allowed and should not be violated. This is the essence of tolerance in which each party has to control themselves and provides a space to respect each other's uniqueness without feeling that the belief or rights is threatened (Aslati, 2012).

From the concept of tolerance that has been described above, it can be understood that the concept of tolerance is actually respecting the followers of religion as part of the community but do not share faith in his religion. It is appreciating people of other faiths, but not recognizing or justifying other religious beliefs. In other words, do not interfere with each other's faith, but keep each other's harmony well maintained and coexist peacefully.

To maintain harmony among religious people, multicultural insight becomes very important to be grown and developed as an effort to reduce conflict that often occur in the society. Growing good social values amid a multicultural environment does not come by itself but should be started from family, school and community environment. Multicultural approach in the study of religions has become a demand amid diversity and has a great role in nation building. Indonesia as a country that stands on the diversity of culture requires the importance of multiculturalism in nation building. With this multiculturalism, the principle of "bhineka single ika" as listed in the state base will be realized. The cultural diversity possessed by the Indonesian nation will be an inspiration and potential for the nation's development so that the ideals to bring about a just and prosperous Indonesia society as stated in the preamble of the 1945 Constitution can be achieved (Aslati, 2012).

It has been suggested that multicultural is closely related to tolerance. Because tolerance means accepting the culture of tribe, race, class and even other religions of our own. Characteristics of Indonesian society, especially Manado city people are very plural and the plurality make the people live side by side with peace without any significant conflict.

During this time, this is what is understood by many people. So, the question arises is: is the people of the city of Manado a tolerant multicultural society? Thus, it is necessary to conduct in-depth research on this subject. Do not let, tolerance in the city of Manado is just a false tolerance as some have alleged. Do not let tolerance only be highlighted by leaders who are forced to be tolerant, while the attitude of tolerance that highlighted the leader is not applied to the grassroots. Leaders are tolerant while the people are intolerant.

This tolerance was questioned when a community action calling itself with the Tolerance Care Community Alliance (Makapetor) Tou Minahasa on 26 October 2016 in the ex-kampong area of Texas Al-Khairiyah Mosque, by some allegedly an intolerant act of Christians as a majority to Muslims as minorities in the city of Manado.

For that, the authors interviewed six informants who are considered to represent the city of Manado and the authors shared opinions expressed by the informant are as follows:
Tolerance in the city of Manado has run well and is important to be taken care of. In relation to the action of the Makapetor alliance, one of the informants said that the action was directed to Manado City government, it just happened to Manado Police office which became the point of action adjacent to the house of worship (Mosque) which was in the ex-kampong of Texas. The action done has nothing to do with the demolition of houses of worship (mosque). But according to the informants, this action can provoke misunderstanding and familiarize the perspective of everyone. Even an equally Christian informant criticized the actions of the Makapetor alliance that invite misunderstandings and could harm religious harmony in the city of Manado. This action is not a concern of Minahasa Christians it is marked by the Christian Group of Minahasa Christian Churches (GMIM) that are large enough not to give statements, even GMIM priests continue to preach and urge their congregation not to be provoked by religious issues, because tolerance is a priority in this area, and it has been intertwined and treated for so long.

Related to Minahasa customary values, of course, nothing contradicts with the construction of houses of worship this can be proved by the existence of culture where there are kampong locations that have several groups, such as the Arab village, the village of China, the village of Java Tondano. If this problem continues to be allowed and the government does not take steps to explain the problem, then things that lead to potential conflicts will occur due to small movements. Tolerance is mutual respect, respect between religious communities. Muslims always value other religions, but there are boundaries that should not be exceeded.

Relation with action conducted by Makapetor alliance, some opinion from informant said that action alliance of Makapetor Tou Minahasa which have done since 2015 has counted 4 times. In the action held last year, before going to the ex-kampong Texas land they came to the municipal office and the city council (DPRD) Manado city. In contrast to this last action, the action point was directly to the Police office Manado without visiting the office of city and office (DPRD) of Manado City. This was twisted by the people that our action was leading to the house of worship (Mosque), but it was not like that, the mosque was not guilty but was the new building temporarily built at that location.

The action has drawn criticism from other Christian groups, previously arguing that the action could invite misunderstandings and could harm harmony among people. If the lawsuit concerns illegal buildings that do not have Building Permit (IMB) which is the working area of the city government, why action in front of Manado Police office is not in the Mayor's office? Moreover, the office is adjacent to the ex-kampong area of Texas in which there is a house of worship of the ummah, in this case the action can disrupt the harmony among religious people who are the construction of society and religious leaders for a long time in this area (Manado). Further criticism that Makapetor used the tolerance level in naming it, is that this is a way of showing to the public that the area of North Sulawesi is a tolerance, or a way to show that this alliance movement is not captured as an intolerant movement. Because in reality, the actions taken by the Makapetor alliance can trigger intolerance. Sometimes this kind of action is spontaneous, or just seeking attention. After the request has been followed by the government then this action will be silent again. The positive thing about this action by Makapetor alliance is that it is re-awakening the people of North Sulawesi that the harmony of our religion is dynamic.

This group is only spontaneous, there is no special agenda, but the indication of riding by the beneficiaries and so forth may be true. There are some things that have been cut first, this issue is not a concern of Christians. For example, if you see a small group of Christians of the Minahasa Christian Church (GMIM) do not give statements, on the contrary, GMIM priests continue to preach and encourage their congregation not to be provoked by religious issues, for tolerance is preferred, which has been interwoven and treated for so long. Secondly, sometimes such actions are only spontaneous, or merely seeking attention. After the request has been followed by the government then this action will be silent again.

If the problem is related to the IMB, then what should be done is to urge the government and find out what the target was, instead of taking a government function expert to do the curbing.
There were also Christian informants who were invited to join the Makapetor alliance but refused that, first of all, the demands and targets of the action were not appropriate, which was less precise is this alliance demanding to eliminate the addition of new buildings around the mosque in the area of Ex-kampong Texas, especially if the target was the mosque administrator. Yet from the information obtained in social media that the time of laying the first stone of renovation of the construction of the mosque, the city government was present at that time, other information according to the board of the mosque itself they were entitled because it has long occupied the land. Makapetor Alliance demanded to stop the construction of the new building because there is an agreement from the municipal government that in the land of Texas ex-village will be established as Religious Tourism Park. Although the construction of Taman Wisata Religi itself is not appropriate because considering the area of land that is not possible, for there is no location for parking. In addition, what he questioned was "why is the target of action (demonstration) not directed to the city government as policy maker?"

In an action held by the Makapetor alliance according to the informant, there are some ambiguous things such as there are some banners of inappropriate demands that he witnessed himself when he accidentally passed the action mobs in front of the Manado Police office, he saw a banner saying Reject and Disband FPI, similar information he also got from some friends who were involved in the action according to them even there were banners demands related to "Terrorism" and "Refuse ISIS". Which he thinks is inappropriate and deviates from the main demands, "what municipal policy issues have to do with terrorism, ISIS and FPI!"

Secondly, there was permissiveness of the 'mass organizations' leaders gathered in the Alliance, for example when there were skewed and 'unethical' remarks in the discussions raised by the members, the leaders did not quickly correct them.

In line with the above opinions, the imam of Al-Khairiyah Mosque also revealed that indeed the ex-kampong of Texas land is not eligible to be made Religious Park because of its narrow land. He also suggested, if it will be built as religious tourism park. Instead, it will be moved in the wax monument land next to the Soekarno Bridge. The land is larger and the location is also still adjacent to the ex-kampong area of Texas.

Manado city government in implementing its policies relating to the case of land ex-kampong Texas reap criticism and also advice from each informant. Namely as follows:

First, the city government in managing inter-religious harmony in the city of Manado in order to immediately resolve the problems that exist in the land of Ex-kampong Texas and the government should be more observant to see the problems made by certain elements. Because it has disturbed the people in Manado city, the government in this case the security forces must be firm not only because some people (provocateurs) will lead to chaos. Although the problems that exist in the city of Manado is the responsibility of the municipal government itself, it's just how they live how the city government work together or partner with the community to solve the problems that exist.

Second, the birth of such movements could be due to the lack of government control through the role of Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama (FKUB) and the Inter-Religious Cooperation Agency (BKSAUA). For that reason, there must be an immediate meeting between religious leaders in this area to deal with this, and especially with the problems that exist in the ex-Kampong Texas land there must be a coordination of the related parties, among others the policy makers of the government to conduct a comprehensive study after that the results are socialized to grass root level.

Third, it is the government's weakness in managing religious symbols in the public sphere. Instead, I see it is the weakness of the state, whether he is in favor of the state ideology or the anger of the masses, in favor of the constitution or the ideology of a particular group.

Fourth, the city government who, when planning to establish a religious tourism park at that time, was one of the promises of the campaign, as if the elected government is now a hero for siding with all elements of society, one of them Muslims. This is just a political game of the city government now, they just want to find a voice from the Muslim community. Once traced, it turns out the development of religious tourism park until this religious building has no budget. This plan has been in talk since 2007 but until now it has not been realized.
The alleged existence of individuals who use this case and seek profit, the informants argue that this action can be ridden by certain parties such as investors who use labels and symbols of religion, culture and custom. In the end the struggle is not for the benefit of many people, but only for the sake of a few people, whether it is the investor or one or two people in the organization. Because if it is seen from the demands whether when the government realize the religious tourism park then the affairs are done? What are their advantages of the affair? Or after a religious tourism park is established they will get a job from there? And in the end also many groups will be harmed over such movements. In addition there are also informants who do not associate the action with the elements who take advantage of the action made alliance Makapetor.

All informants said the tolerance in Manado city was well maintained. This can be proved in the SETARA Institute's release results on November 16, 2015 which empirically placed Manado as one of the 10 highest tolerant cities in Indonesia. And the issue of SARA that developed in the community is only a psychological implication of the community from the issue that developed because of the conflict that occurred in Jakarta about the blasphemy case by the Governor of DKI Jakarta (Ahok).

According to the authors, so far the tolerance between religious people in Manado City is quite awake and run well. It is marked by no significant inter-religious conflicts that occurred in Manado City. In line with the informants' opinion about the existence of villages with multiple identity groups and also about the appeal of religious leaders and community leaders to keep restraint and maintain harmony among religious communities. Do not, just because the case of Ex-kampong Texas land and the intolerant issues that exist in the center causing harmony that has been awakened, make the people of Manado plural city directly divide.

Furthermore, for the municipality of Manado, they better as soon as possible solve the existing problems so as not to affect the issue of intolerance. Certainly the solution from the government does not harm all parties (win win solution). Regarding the government policy on the establishment of religious tourism parks in Ex-kampong Texas field we should be escorted by involving all elements of society.

Associated with Makapetor alliance action that reap so many critics that can invite conflict between religious people should be a lesson and warning to the people of Manado city to be more vigilant and not easily instigated by issues that smell SARA. So that is harmed the people of Manado city itself.

Regarding the opinion that there are persons who take advantage of this case for personal gain. According to the authors, there should be further research because it is just an issue and opinion from individuals. It could be true, it could be just a misunderstanding between Makapetor and Muslim alliance parties against government policy

4. Conclusion
From the results of research and discussion above, the authors can conclude that so far, the city of Manado is still categorized tolerant of people of other faiths. This is evidenced by the statement of informants representing Christians and Muslims who only criticize the city government and suspect the existence of elements who try to take advantage of this situation, they do not blame other people. Furthermore, there are still interfaith activities routinely conducted in Manado city and the results of SETARA Institute's release on November 16, 2015 which empirically placed Manado as one of the 10 highest tolerant cities in Indonesia.

References
[1] Arifin, Samsul, (2015). Studi Islam Kontemperor Arus Radikalisasi dan Multikulturalisme di Indonesia, Malang: Kelompok Intrns Publishing.
[2] Artis, (2011). Kerukunan dan Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama, TOLERANSI: Media Komunikasi Umat Beragama, Vol 3, No. 1, h. 86-97.
[3] Aslati, (2012). Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama dalam Perspektif Islam (Suatu Tijauan Historis), TOLERANSI: Media Komunikasi Umat Beragama, Vol 4, No. 1, h. 52-58.
[4] Baidi, (2010). Agama dan Multikulturalisme: Pengembangan Kerukunan Masyarakat Melalui
Pendekatan Agama, *Millah: Jurnal Studi Agama*, Vol 10, h. 1-29.

[5] Bakar, Abu, (2015). Konsep Toleransi dan Kebebasan Beragama, *TOLERANSI: Media Komunikasi Umat Beragama*, Vol 7, No. 2, h. 123-131.

[6] Hertina, (2010). Toleransi Upaya Untuk mewujudkan Kerukunan umat Beragama, *TOLERANSI: Media Komunikasi Umat Beragama*, Vol 1, No. 2, h. 207-217.

[7] Indeks Kota Toleran (IKT) 2015, [http://setara-institute.org/indeks-kota-toleran-ikt-2015/](http://setara-institute.org/indeks-kota-toleran-ikt-2015/), di akses pada tanggal 20 Januari 2017 pukul 23.21 WITA

[8] Masykur, Said, (2016). Pluralisme Dalam Konteks Studi Agama-Agama, *TOLERANSI: Media Komunikasi umat Beragama*, Vol. 8, No. 1, h. 61-77.

[9] Maulana, (2016). Mempertegas Semangat Toleransi dalam Islam, *TOLERANSI: Media Komunikasi Umat Beragama*, Vol 8, No. 2, h. 117-133.