Incidence of Tuberculosis During the First Year of Antiretroviral Treatment in West African HIV-Infected Adults

Boris Tchakounte Youngui, Patrick A., P. Coffie, Eugene Messou, A. Poda, L. Fortes Deguenonvo, D. Hawerlander, Albert Minga, Eric Balestre, François Dabis, Olivier Marcy

To cite this version:
Boris Tchakounte Youngui, Patrick A., P. Coffie, Eugene Messou, A. Poda, L. Fortes Deguenonvo, et al.. Incidence of Tuberculosis During the First Year of Antiretroviral Treatment in West African HIV-Infected Adults. Open Forum Infectious Diseases, Oxford University Press, 2020, 7 (6), pp.ofaa203. 10.1093/ofid/ofaa203. hal-03145508

HAL Id: hal-03145508
https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-03145508
Submitted on 18 Feb 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L’archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d’enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial - NoDerivatives| 4.0 International License
Incidence of Tuberculosis During the First Year of Antiretroviral Treatment in West African HIV-Infected Adults

Boris Tchakounte Youngh,1 Patrick Coffie,2 Eugène Messou,2,3 Armel Poda,3 Louise Fortes Deguenovono,1 Denise Haverlander,4 Albert Mina,5 Eric Balestre,6 François Dabis,8 and Olivier Marcy8

1University of Bordeaux, Bordeaux School of Public Health, ISPED, Bordeaux, France,
2Programme PACCI, site ANRS, Abidjan, Côte d’Ivoire, 3Centre de Prise en Charge de Recherche et de Formation, CePReF-Aconda-VS, Abidjan, Côte d’Ivoire, 4CHU Souro Sanou, Hôpital de Jour, Service des Maladies Infectieuses, Bobo Dioulasso, Burkina Faso, 5CHNU Fann, Service des Maladies Infectieuses et Tropicales Ibrahim Diop Mar, Dakar, Senegal,
6Centre Intégré de Recherches Biocliniques d’Abidjan, CIRBA, Abidjan, Côte d’Ivoire,
7Centre Médical de Suivi de Donneurs de Sang/CNTS/PRIMO-CI, Abidjan, Côte d’Ivoire,
and 8University of Bordeaux, Inserm, French National Research Institute for Sustainable Development (IRD), UMR 1219, Bordeaux, France

We estimated tuberculosis incidence during the first year on antiretroviral therapy without isoniazid-preventive treatment in 6938 West African HIV-infected adults at 3.33 cases per 100 person-years (95% CI, 2.85–3.80). In multivariate Poisson models, sites in Côte d’Ivoire, male gender, low body mass index, low hemoglobin, low CD4 count, and young age were significantly associated with higher incidence.

Keywords. antiretroviral treatment; HIV; incidence; tuberculosis; West Africa.

Tuberculosis remains a major cause of morbidity and mortality in people with HIV (PWH), particularly in Sub-Saharan Africa. The World Health Organization (WHO) estimated that of 920 000 PWH who had tuberculosis in 2017, 300 000 died from the disease, including 252 000 (84.0%) in Sub-Saharan Africa [1]. The progressive introduction of antiretroviral therapy (ART) over the last 2 decades has contributed to a decrease in tuberculosis (TB) incidence in PWH, but it remains significantly higher in this population than in the non-HIV-infected population, irrespective of the duration of ART or the level of CD4 lymphocytes [2–4].

Since 2004, the WHO recommends implementing isoniazid preventive treatment (IPT) for prevention of TB in PWH [5, 6]. Despite this recommendation and recent evidence from Côte d’Ivoire on its effectiveness in reducing overall morbidity and mortality in HIV-infected patients regardless of CD4 count, IPT is rarely implemented for PWH in West Africa [7].

Our hypothesis is that, in the absence of IPT, the incidence of TB remains high among patients on ART, particularly in West Africa. In this study, we analyzed data from the follow-up of patients on ART participating in the International epidemiologic Databases to Evaluate AIDS (IeDEA) collaboration in West Africa to estimate the incidence of TB and look at the risk factors associated with the occurrence of the disease in the first year on ART.

METHODS

We carried out a retrospective cohort analysis enrolling patients initiated on ART in sites from the IeDEA West Africa Cohort, an international epidemiological research collaboration among 16 adult HIV treatment centers in 9 West African countries [8]. Four outpatient HIV clinics with recognized quality for TB data collection contributed to this study: the day care center of the Souro Sanou University teaching hospital (HD/CHUSS) in Bobo Dioulasso, Burkina Faso; the CRFC, Infectious and tropical Disease department, Fann University Teaching Hospital (CRFC/SMITD) in Dakar, Senegal; and the CePReF and CIRBA HIV clinics, both in Abidjan, Côte d’Ivoire.

We included in our analyzes all HIV-infected patients aged ≥16 years who started ART from 2010 to 2016 and who had ≥1 follow-up visit post–ART initiation, excluding those with prevalent TB. Patients were followed up according to usual site procedures. ART was initiated in patients with CD4 ≤350 CD4/mm^3 in all sites except in CIRBA, where it was initiated at CD4 ≤200 before 2012 and ≤350 CD4/mm^3 thereafter. TB diagnosis was done according to the national TB program (NTP) recommendations of each country. Active screening for symptoms suggestive of tuberculosis (fever, cough, night sweats, weight loss) was conducted, per routine, at ART initiation and at each visit only in the CePReF-CI since 2009. No patient received IPT.

Data were abstracted from patient charts by a data clerk. Information collected included sociodemographic characteristics, TB history, ART initiation date, CD4 counts and HIV RNA, new or ongoing TB at the visit, and patient status (death, loss to follow-up, and last visit date). All participating clinical centers obtained authorization from national or local ethics committees for data transfer, exploitation, and statistical analysis.

We defined (i) history of TB as TB reported more than 6 months before ART initiation, (ii) prevalent TB as TB reported between 6 months before and 1 week after ART initiation, and (iii) incident TB as the first TB episode reported after
1 week following ART initiation and during the first year of follow-up. We considered the risk period to be the time between ART initiation and the date of incident TB, death, last follow-up visit, or 1 year after ART initiation, whichever occurred first.

We calculated crude TB incidence rates and their confidence intervals for the overall cohort and each site. We used univariate Poisson models with an offset term to estimate TB incidence rates according to different factors (center, sex, age, body mass index [BMI], previous TB history, year of ART initiation, CD4 count, and hemoglobin level) and corresponding relative risks (RRs). Using a multivariate Poisson model including factors significantly associated with TB incidence at a threshold of .05 in univariate analyses and age that was forced in the model, we estimated the standardized TB incidence rate in the lowest-risk group. We used the missing indicator variable (MIV) method for other observations with missing values on BMI, CD4 cell count, TB history, and Hb level. We performed analyses using R Studio, version 1.1.456 (R Development Core Team, Vienna, Austria). All P values were 2-sided and were considered statistically significant if <.05.

RESULTS

Of 7216 patients who initiated ART and had ≥1 follow-up visit, 275 (3.8%) had prevalent TB at ART initiation, and 6938 were included in the analysis (Supplementary Figure 1). Of those,
4889 (70.5%) were women, their median age (interquartile range [IQR]) was 38.5 (32.4–45.7) years, the median BMI was 20.7 (18.4–23.5) kg/m², the median CD4 count was 214 (99.0–323.0) cells/mL, and 582 (14.0%) patients had a TB history reported (Table 1).

Patients were followed up for a median risk period (IQR) of 1.00 (0.73–1.00) years, with 5679.31 person-years of risk period accrued during the study. A total of 189 TB cases were reported, for an overall incidence rate of 3.33 cases per 100 person-years (95% CI, 2.85–3.80) (Supplementary Table 1). The median time from ART initiation to incident TB (IQR) was 2.84 (0.92–5.55) months.

The crude TB incidence rate differed significantly between sites, with 7.87 (95% CI, 3.70–16.52), 2.60 (95% CI, 1.17–5.66), 2.11 (95% CI, 0.63–6.03), and 1.55 (95% CI, 1.07–2.15) cases per 100 person-years in CIRBA (Abidjan), CePReF (Abidjan), CRCF/SMIT (Dakar), and HDJ/CHUSS (Bobo Dioulasso), respectively (P < .001).

The standardized TB incidence rate in the first year on ART in the lowest-risk group, that is, females aged ≥50 years followed at the HDJ/CHUSS (Bobo Dioulasso) with BMI ≥21 kg/m², CD4 count ≥500 cells/mL, and hemoglobin ≥11g/dL, was 0.14 (95% CI, 0.03–0.47) cases per 100 person-years. In multivariate analysis, TB incidence remained significantly higher in sites in Côte d’Ivoire, in male patients, in patients with low CD4 count, in those with low BMI, in those with a low hemoglobin count, and in the youngest patients (Table 2).
DISCUSSION

TB incidence during the first year on ART was high in 4 West African outpatient HIV clinics not yet implementing IPT at the time of the study. The incidence rate, roughly 3300 cases per 100,000 population, was 10 to 20 times higher than the estimated TB incidence in the general population of the 3 countries.

This is not surprising in the absence of IPT. A high TB incidence has been reported in the first weeks following ART introduction, due either to TB unmasking Immune Reconstitution Inflammatory Syndrome (IRIS) in patients with low CD4 or ART-associated TB during the first months of ART [9]. An early observational study conducted in Brazil showed the superiority of combined ART and IPT compared with ART or IPT alone to reduce TB incidence in PWH [10]. In addition, several observational studies conducted in Africa and a cluster randomized trial conducted in Brazil have shown that using IPT in ART-treated adults in high-incidence settings significantly reduces TB incidence [11–15]. IPT was not implemented in any of the health facilities included in our analysis during the study period. In Côte d’Ivoire and Burkina Faso, IPT was not yet recommended by the national TB and HIV programs. In Senegal, although recommended since 2015, IPT was not available at the CRCF/SMITD.

In our study, TB incidence was significantly higher in Côte d’Ivoire than in Senegal and Burkina Faso. This could be partly explained by the epidemiology of TB in those countries. Indeed, TB incidence in the general population was estimated to 159, 139, and 52 cases per 100,000 in 2015 in Côte d’Ivoire, Senegal, and Burkina Faso, respectively [1]. Site characteristics may also explain this difference; in Côte d’Ivoire, the crude TB incidence rate was significantly higher in CIRBA than in CePReF; possibly because first, ART was initiated earlier in CePReF during the whole study duration, compared with CIRBA, where ART was initiated ≤350 cells/mm³ in 2012, and second, CePReF implemented systematic active TB screening starting in 2009. As reported previously, a previous TB history, low CD4 count, young age, and male gender were associated with higher TB incidence [16–19], as were anemia and low BMI. These risk factors should be taken into account for a particularly exhaustive screening and TB diagnostic process when initiating ART.

Our study has limitations. First, we may have underestimated TB incidence due to the lack of standardized procedures for TB diagnosis and missed TB in those patients who died or those who were lost to follow-up, further contributing to underestimation of TB incidence. Second, we chose to define incident TB as occurring after the first week on ART, and this time cutoff may not always be appropriate to distinguish between undiagnosed prevalent TB and incident TB including unmasking IRIS. Third, we were unable to consider other key co-factors explaining TB incidence such as tuberculin skin test, BCG immunization, or socio-economic status, which were not collected [20–22].

Even if it is well established that ART is associated with a considerable reduction in the risk of TB in PWH, the results from our study emphasize again the need for TB-preventive therapy in PWH initiating ART even in countries with TB incidence below 100 cases per 100,000 population, such as Burkina Faso. The countries participating in this study have now started implementing pilot or large-scale programs to provide IPT to PWH starting ART, but access to tuberculosis-preventive therapy remains limited in West Africa. Expanding access to tuberculosis-preventive therapy should be a priority to reduce tuberculosis incidence and mortality in PWH in West African countries.

Supplementary Data

Supplementary materials are available at Open Forum Infectious Diseases online. Consisting of data provided by the authors to benefit the reader, the posted materials are not copyedited and are the sole responsibility of the authors, so questions or comments should be addressed to the corresponding author.

Acknowledgments

We thank the health workers and the fieldwork teams who performed the data collection on the different sites involved in this study as well as the entire PAC-CI team for their support. We gratefully acknowledge the invaluable contributions of all patients from these various facilities who agreed to participate. We also thank Renaud Becquet, Eric Ouatarra, and Anani Badje from ISPED & INSERM U1219, Bordeaux, France.

Financial support. The study was conducted under the IeDEA West Africa collaboration grants funded by the National Cancer Institute (NCI), the National Institute of Mental Health (NIMH), the Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Health & Human Development (NICHD), and the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases (NIAID); grant number: 5U01AI069919). The funders had no role in the study design and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

Potential conflicts of interest. All authors: no reported conflicts of interest. All authors have submitted the ICMJE Form for Disclosure of Potential Conflicts of Interest. Conflicts that the editors consider relevant to the content of the manuscript have been disclosed.

Prior presentation. This paper was presented at the IAS Conference in 2017 as an oral abstract session (Clinical Science) with interim findings (Presentation code: MOAB0403) and was awarded the 2017 IAS TB/HIV Research Prize.

References

1. World Health Organization. Global Tuberculosis Report 2017. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2017.
2. Bonnet MMB, Pinoges LLP , Varaine FFV , et al. Tuberculosis after HAART initiation in HIV-positive patients from five countries with a high tuberculosis burden. AIDS 2006; 20:1275–9.
3. Lawn SD, Harries AD. Reducing tuberculosis-associated early mortality in antiretroviral treatment programmes in Sub-Saharan Africa. AIDS 2011; 25:1554–5; author reply 1556.
4. Kerschberger B, Schomaker M, Telnov A, et al. Decreased risk of HIV-associated TB during antiretroviral therapy expansion in rural Eswatini from 2009 to 2016: a cohort and population-based analysis. Trop Med Int Health 2019; 24:1114–27.
5. Malhotra B. World Health Organization, Department of HIV/AIDS, Stop TB Department. Guidelines for Intensified Tuberculosis Case-Finding and Isoniazid Preventive Therapy for People Living with HIV in Resource-Constrained Settings. Geneva: Department of HIV/AIDS: Stop TB Department, World Health Organization; 2011.
6. Sculier D, Hjälylausas G; World Health Organization. WHO Policy on Collaborative TB/HIV Activities: Guidelines for National Programmes and Other Stakeholders. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2012.
7. Duda SN, Farr AM, Lindegren ML, et al; International Epidemiologic Databases to Evaluate AIDS (IeDEA) Collaboration. Characteristics and comprehensiveness
of adult HIV care and treatment programmes in Asia-Pacific, sub-Saharan Africa and the Americas: results of a site assessment conducted by the International epidemiologic Databases to Evaluate AIDS (IeDEA) Collaboration. J Int AIDS Soc 2014; 17:19045.

8. Egger M, Ekouevi DK, Williams C, et al. Cohort profile: the International epidemiological Databases to Evaluate AIDS (IeDEA) in sub-Saharan Africa. Int J Epidemiol 2012; 41:1256–64.

9. Lawn SD, Wilkinson RJ, Lipman MC, Wood R. Immune reconstitution and “unmasking” of tuberculosis during antiretroviral therapy. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2008; 177:680–5.

10. Golub JE, Saraceni V, Cavalcante SC, et al. The impact of antiretroviral therapy and isoniazid preventive therapy on tuberculosis incidence in HIV-infected patients in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. AIDS 2007; 21:1441–8.

11. Durovni B, Saraceni V, Moulton LH, et al. Effect of improved tuberculosis screening and isoniazid preventive therapy on incidence of tuberculosis and death in patients with HIV in clinics in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil: a stepped wedge, cluster-randomised trial. Lancet Infect Dis 2013; 13:852–8.

12. Charalambous S, Grant AD, Innes C, et al. Association of isoniazid preventive therapy with lower early mortality in individuals on antiretroviral therapy in a workplace programme. AIDS 2010; 24(Suppl 5):S5–13.

13. Golub JE, Pronyk P, Mohapi L, et al. Isoniazid preventive therapy, HAART and tuberculosis risk in HIV-infected adults in South Africa: a prospective cohort. AIDS 2009; 23:631–6.

14. Fenner L, Forster M, Boullé A, et al; ART-LINC of IeDEA. Tuberculosis in HIV programmes in lower-income countries: practices and risk factors. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 2011; 15:620–7.

15. Sahasaba A, Mwambi H, Somi G, et al. Effect of isoniazid preventive therapy on tuberculosis incidence and associated risk factors among HIV infected adults in Tanzania: a retrospective cohort study. BMC Infect Dis 2019; 19:62.

16. Seyler C, Toure S, Messou E, et al. Risk factors for active tuberculosis after antiretroviral treatment initiation in Abidjan. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2005; 172:123–7.

17. Girardi E, Sabin CA, d'Arminio Monforte A, et al. Antiretroviral Therapy Cohort Collaboration. Incidence of tuberculosis among HIV-infected patients receiving highly active antiretroviral therapy in Europe and North America. Clin Infect Dis 2005; 41:1772–82.

18. The Antiretroviral Therapy in Low-Income Countries Collaboration of the International epidemiological Databases to Evaluate AIDS (IeDEA) and The ART Cohort Collaboration. Tuberculosis after initiation of antiretroviral therapy in low-income and high-income countries. Clin Infect Dis 2007; 45:1518–21.

19. Liu E, Makumbi A, Drain P, et al. Tuberculosis incidence rate and risk factors among HIV-infected adults with access to antiretroviral therapy. AIDS 2015; 29:1391–9.

20. Moreno S, Jarrin I, Iribarren JA, et al; CoRIS-MD. Incidence and risk factors for tuberculosis in HIV-positive subjects by HAART status. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 2008; 12:1393–400.

21. Lawn SD, Badri M, Wood R. Tuberculosis among HIV-infected patients receiving HAART: long term incidence and risk factors in a South African cohort. AIDS 2005; 19:2109–16.

22. Nava-Aguilera E, Andersson N, Harris E, et al. Risk factors associated with recent transmission of tuberculosis: systematic review and meta-analysis. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 2009; 13:17–26.