FACTORS INFLUENCING JOB SATISFACTION OF NURSES IN PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SECTOR’S HOSPITALS: A CROSS SECTIONAL STUDY

Habib Ullah¹, Sehrish A², Anwar CH³, Meerub⁴, Saleem M Rana⁵

¹ Health Services Acadmy Islamabad, Pakistan
² University of Lahore, Pakistan
³ Allama Iqbal Medical College Lahore, Pakistan
⁴ Rahbar Medical College and Dental College, Lahore, Pakistan
⁵ CSPH, UHS, Lahore, Pakistan
Correspondence: Sehrish Ather, Email: sather20s@hotmail.com

Abstract

Background: Human resource works as an engine to provide sustainable service delivery. An individual's perception in the organization plays a vital role in job satisfaction. In Health Care Nurse's job satisfaction in their jobs determines whether their roles are fulfilled towards service delivery for their clients of various communities. Better performance has been directly related with organizational working environment, social and financial aspects of the job are also important factors.

Methods: A cross sectional descriptive study was carried out. 100 nursing officers working in two tertiary care hospitals (50 from each) was randomly selected from age group 22 to 60 years. The data was collected by using a self-administered structured questionnaire and was analyzed statistically to compare both the variables by using SPSS version 20.

Results: Pay is the most important factor that leads to job satisfaction. Majority of nurses from government hospital are moderately satisfied from their pay scales only 2% were observed satisfied working in private hospital. Government hospital nurses were more satisfied (82%) with their job due to job security as compared to private hospital nurses.

Conclusion: The study developed the significant differences in the job satisfaction of nursing officers between public and private sector hospitals. Workload, professional support, training arrangement, and working environment found main factors that influence job satisfaction. It is evident from the study that the nurses working in Public sectors are more satisfied than in Private sector.

Keywords: Job satisfaction, public and private, nurses.

Introduction

Job satisfaction mostly determines the efficacy of the productivity and efficiency of human resource working for health ( ). Pakistan has a major shortfall of trained human resource of health. Human resource in any organization is the valuable asset and it works as an engine to provide sustainable service delivery ( ). Quality assurance in health includes all the actions taken to promote and enhance health care ( ). Improvement in a health care delivery system involves not only adding new resources to a system, but also making changes within an organization to make the best use of resources, especially human resources( , ). An individual’s perception in organization plays a vital role in job satisfaction ( ). In health care setting doctors' satisfaction plays an important role in their performance and satisfaction among their patients. Similarly nurse’s job satisfaction in their jobs determines whether their roles are fulfilled towards service delivery for their clients of various communities ( ). Better performance has been directly related with it. Job satisfaction has also been inversely associated with absenteeism, turnover in an organization, and level of stress as well as eventual exhaustion ( , ). In contrast with this, high patient to nurse ratios, dissatisfaction with the quality of work, poor leadership, and inadequate empowerment at work have been shown to be associated with burnout and poor job satisfaction( , ). Job dissatisfaction was also strongly associated with organizational factors and poor working conditions, social aspects of the job were found to be an important factor in job satisfaction as well( ). Evidence exists that there is a close alliance between job satisfaction of health care professionals and the overall quality of health services ( ). Productivity and quality of work in any organization depends on the job satisfaction of nursing staff. This complex phenomenon of approach
towards one’s job has an impact not only on inspiration, but also on career, health and relation with peers (, , ). Job satisfaction can be defined as an employee’s emotional response to a job or work, based on evaluating real outcomes with the desired outcomes. The satisfaction of nurses’ is directly linked with the patients’ overall satisfaction and ultimately to quality of healthcare whereas, dissatisfaction of an employee leads to absenteeism, conflicts, and increase turnover. Unsatisfied employee report an increase intention to leave, while the influence of job satisfaction is reported to be as powerful as that of pay. Job satisfaction is a key factor of nurses’ lives which can have an effect on patient protection, employee’s morale, efficiency and performance, healthcare quality, retention, dedication to the organization and the job and hiring and training of new staff for the organization ().

Job satisfaction is a matter of key importance not only for nurses but also to their organizations, because job satisfaction among nurses has direct effect on the nursing performances in any health care setup. This study was aimed to find out the actual factors that are responsible for affecting the job satisfaction among nurses in order to plan for overcoming these factors which will result in increasing job satisfaction and ultimately will lead to quality of healthcare. A qualified nurse offers nursing care for promotion of health and illness prevention( ). They form a significant connection between the patient and the doctor by providing the healthcare and the reducing the communication gap between the patient and the doctor ( ). For the health system to work appropriately, nurses have to be motivated, which is directly associated with their job satisfaction ( ).

**Methodology**

This is a cross sectional descriptive study to find out the job satisfaction of nurses between Public and Private Hospitals in Peshawar. The total population included all nurses who were working in two tertiary hospitals. Simple random sampling technique was adopted to select 100 nurses ranging from 22 to 60 years of age from the public and private hospitals on equal number in order to draw a comparison of job satisfactions of nurses working in two sectors. Structured questionnaire was used to collect data from the participants. Data was analyzed through using the SPSS v20.0 and descriptive statistics were generated. The results have been shown in percentages and proportion, and significant test by using chi square test.

**Results**

Nurses were interviewed through the pretested questionnaire. Data was collected and analyzed on the basis of different variables.

### Table 1. Sociodemographic features

| Variable       | Public Hospital (IMC) | Private Hospital (RMI) |
|----------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| Age            | 36.5±8.7              | 33.4±6.8               |
| Gender         |                       |                        |
| Male           | 3                     | 6%                     | 5            | 10%                     |
| Female         | 47                    | 94%                    | 45           | 90%                     |
| Qualification  |                       |                        |
| Trainee Nurse  | 4                     | 8%                     | 0            | 0                       |
| RN             | 35                    | 70%                    | 42           | 82%                     |
| BSc Nursing    | 8                     | 16%                    | 6            | 12%                     |
| Post Graduate N| 3                     | 6%                     | 2            | 4%                      |
| Cadre          |                       |                        |
| Assistant Nurse| 4                     | 8%                     | 0            | 0                       |
| Charge Nurse   | 30                    | 60%                    | 33           | 66%                     |
| Nursing Supervisor | 10             | 20%                    | 12           | 24%                     |
| Head Nurse     | 6                     | 12%                    | 5            | 10%                     |
| Job Nature     |                       |                        |
| Contract Employee | 10              | 20%                    | 35           | 70%                     |
| Permanent Employee | 40             | 80%                    | 15           | 30%                     |
| Marital Status |                       |                        |
| Single         | 12                    | 24%                    | 20           | 40%                     |
| Married        | 36                    | 72%                    | 28           | 56%                     |
| Divorced       | 02                    | 4%                     | 1            | 2%                      |
| Separated      | 00                    | 0%                     | 0            | 0%                      |
| Residence      |                       |                        |
| Hostel         | 10                    | 20%                    | 15           | 30%                     |
| Home           | 40                    | 80%                    | 35           | 70%                     |

### Table 2. Level of satisfaction for pay scale

| Satisfaction level with Pay scales/ options | Govt. Hospital Nurses | Private Hospital Nurses |
|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| Frequency | Percentage | Frequency | Percent  |
| Very much satisfied                        | 10 | 20 | 1 | 2 |
| Moderately satisfied                       | 26 | 53 | 28 | 56 |
| Dis satisfied                              | 8 | 16 | 13 | 26 |
| Highly dis satisfied                       | 6 | 12 | 8 | 16 |
| Total                                      | 50 | 100 | 50 | 50 |

Pay was the most important factor that leads to job satisfaction. Majority of nurses from government hospital Hayatabad Medical Complex Peshawar were moderately satisfied from their pay scales i.e. 52%. In Rehman Medical Institute as private hospital also majority of the nurses were moderately satisfied from their pay scales i.e. 60%. Furthermore very much satisfied from Government Hospital were 20% and only 2% were observed very much satisfied with the pay scales of nurses working in Rehman Medical Institute in private hospital Peshawar.
Table 3. Level of satisfaction with workload

| Workload       | Govt. Hospital nurses | Private hospital nurses |
|----------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|
|                | Frequency | Percent | Frequency | Percent |
| Very much workload | 22       | 44       | 30       | 60      |
| Moderately workload | 18       | 36       | 14       | 28      |
| Light work      | 10       | 20       | 6        | 12      |
| Very Light work | 0        | 0        | 0        | 0       |
| Total           | 50       | 100      | 50       | 100     |

Excessive work at work place always acts as a de-motivating and dissatisfactory factor. Among the 50 nurses surveyed from the Hayat abad Medical Complex government hospital majority of them found the work to be excessive for them i.e. 44%. Even in private sector among the 50 nurses surveyed most of them felt the work load to be excessive for them i.e. 60%. Thus, nurses from both the sectors had excessive work to do.

Table 4. Level of satisfaction with behavior of superiors

| Behavior of Superior | Govt. Hospital nurses | Private hospital nurses |
|----------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|
|                     | Yes | Percentage | Yes | Percentage |
| Autocratic           | 7   | 3          | 3   | 6          |
| Professional         | 16  | 32         | 9   | 18         |
| Cooperative          | 14  | 38         | 30  | 60         |
| Very Cooperative     | 17  | 34         | 30  | 60         |
| Total                | 50  | 100        | 50  | 100        |

Superior had to be co-operative along with being demanding and professional in order to increase job satisfaction among its employees. Most of the superiors in government hospital were very cooperative i.e. 34%. But in private hospitals superiors were only 60% cooperative.

Table 5. Level of satisfaction with social security schemes

| Social security scheme | Govt. Hospital nurses | Private hospital nurses |
|------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|
|                        | Frequency | Percentage | Frequency | Percentage |
| Adequate               | 18       | 36         | 7         | 14         |
| Moderately Adequate    | 20       | 40         | 13        | 26         |
| In adequate            | 12       | 24         | 30        | 60         |
| Total                  | 50       | 100        | 50        | 100        |

More amounts of social security schemes always lead to increase in level of job satisfaction. Majority of the government nurses found the social security schemes available to them as moderately adequate i.e. 40% but same was not the case with private nurses where majority of them felt social security schemes to be inadequate i.e. 60%. Thus, in government nurses the level of satisfaction was more in regard to social security schemes as compared to private nurses where very few nurses were satisfied.

Table 6. Level of satisfaction with promotion policy

| Promotion policy | Govt. Hospital nurses | Private hospital nurses |
|------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|
|                  | Yes | Percentage | Yes | Percentage |
| Very much satisfied | 4   | 5          | 3   | 6          |
| Moderately satisfied | 8   | 16         | 18  | 36         |
| Dissatisfied      | 13  | 26         | 13  | 26         |
| Highly dissatisfied | 25  | 50         | 16  | 32         |
| Total             | 50  | 100        | 50  | 100        |

Nurses were in favor of seniority cum merit type of promotion policy. Most of the government nurses said that Seniority type of promotion policy is followed in their organization as such majority of the nurses i.e. 50% were dissatisfied with this type of promotion policy whereas in private hospitals most of the nurses said that Seniority cum Merit type of promotion policy was mostly adopted as such majority of the nurses i.e. 36% were satisfied with the promotion policy. Thus, nurses from private sector were more satisfied with the promotion policy of their organization.

Table 7. Availability of growth opportunities

| Availability of growth opportunities | Govt Hospital nurses | Private hospital nurses |
|--------------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|
| Training                            | 50                   | 50                      |
| Refresher Courses                   | 14                   | 8                       |
| Seminars                            | 16                   | 6                       |
| Workshops                           | 21                   | 0                       |

Growth opportunities were available more in government hospitals thus nurses from this sector were more satisfied (figure 1)

Figure 1. Percent of nurses satisfied with job security

Discussion
The study was carried out to see job satisfaction level among nurses of public and private hospitals, affected by many factors of the intrinsic and extrinsic. There was a significant difference in job satisfaction level among nurses in both public and private hospitals. The both sectors nurses were satisfied from their job but comparatively, public hospital nurses are more satisfied with their job as compared to private hospital nurses.
A study conducted by Habib. A Bahalkani on job satisfaction among nurses working in tertiary care settings of Islamabad. The results demonstrated that the significant majority of the participants were dissatisfied with their job. Among them 26% were highly dissatisfied and 60% were just not satisfied of their job. Overall dissatisfaction among nursing staff at a public sector tertiary care hospital of Islamabad is cause for concerns are efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability of the healthcare system. Pakistan has public and private health care system. The public sector is usually over resourced but serves only 30% of total population and rest of 70% served by private sector.

Satisfaction level with pay scale is the most important factor that leads to job satisfaction. The majority 52% of nurses from Government Hospital Hayatabad Medical Complex Peshawar were moderately satisfied from their pay scales. In the other hand the majority 60% of the nurses are moderately satisfied from their pay scales working in Rehman Medical Institute as private hospital. Furthermore, from Government Hospital 20% were very much satisfied and only 2% respondents were observed very much satisfied from pay scales of working in private hospital Peshawar. Pay is somewhat better in Government sector for the last two or three years. In our study area the respondents belonging to Government sector hospital Hayatabad Medical Complex are more satisfied with their pay scale.

As per as satisfaction with workloads the work at work place always acts as a demotivating and dissatisfactory factor among respondents. Among the 50 nurses the majority 44% nurses were found the work to be excessive at the Hayatabad Medical Complex Government Hospital. But in private sector among the 50 nurses the most 60% of them feel the work load to be excessive for them. Thus, nurses from public and private sectors have excessive workloads.

Nurses working both sectors are worried about the workload and dissatisfied with workload. They have to look after more beds than recommended beds.

Most of the nurses from both Government and Private Hospital are moderately satisfied from their pay scales.

Nurses from both sectors feel that they have to do excessive work.

Nurses from Government and Private Hospitals have long but convenient working hours.

Satisfaction among private nurses is more in regards to relationships with their colleagues.

Most of Government nurses views that their superiors are very cooperative.

Government nurses are more satisfied from social security schemes available in their organization.

Private hospitals follow the seniority cum merit type of promotion policy for nurses. Due to this account satisfaction in private nurses is more.

Nurses are more satisfied from the working environment of the private sectors hospitals.

The nurses of the Government sector hospitals are more satisfied as compared to private nurses due to more upward opportunities.

Government nurses are more proud to be associated with their organization as compared to private nurses. The nurses from both sectors are proud of their profession.

As compared to private nurses’ government nurses is less in number who is willing to shift from their job due to job satisfaction.

Job security is more in government hospitals whereas in private nurses. ‘Less job security among private hospitals nurses are another factor responsible for job satisfaction.

Most of the nurses from both sectors nurses are willing to opt. voluntary retirement scheme due their family issues.

According to the study results nurses from both sectors seemed to be quite satisfied from their jobs however, the level of satisfaction is found to be more in government hospitals nurses as compared to the private nurses. At the same time the research study showed there are certain factors on which private nurses are more satisfied from their job. For improvement of job satisfaction results in fewer turnovers, better quality patient care, less physical and mental injuries to health care staff and betterment of entire organization. In order to increase the level of job satisfaction among nurses, hospital management should align with modern technology, rationalize compensation, adequate promotion policy, establishing grievance redressed system and provision of more growth opportunities.

A study was conducted by Petersen on the job satisfaction of hospital nursing staff showed that there was no clear difference between general levels of job satisfaction and dissatisfaction, although more respondents were dissatisfied (56%) than those who were satisfied (44%). Respondents were also somewhat more dissatisfied with extrinsic work factors (58%) than with intrinsic factors (52, 5%).

On the intrinsic factors, specifically, they were more satisfied with the Job Itself (52%) than with Promotion (43%). With regard to the Job Itself, most of the respondents (63%) indicated that their jobs were worthwhile.

57% of the respondents (irrespective of age and rank) were not satisfied with their working conditions. Overall, most of the nursing staff (63%) was dissatisfied with their supervisors. More specifically, the majority of respondents were unhappy with Pay (61%). They felt that they did not get paid enough for what they did (79%) or that remuneration was less than what they deserved (77%). However, most of them (73%) did not feel insecure and felt that the organization had enough resources to pay their salaries. Only 49% of the respondents were satisfied with their organization 51.

A study done in Jordan (Mrrayan, 2005) indicates that...
Factors Influencing Job Satisfaction Of Nurses

Habib Ullah, Sehrish A and others

8. Haas JS, Cook EF, Puopolo AL, Burstin HR, Cleary PD. and Brennan TA. Is the professional satisfaction of general internists associated with patient satisfaction? J Gen Intern Med (2000):15(2):122-128.

9. McManus IC, Keeling A, Paice E. Stress, burnout and doctors’ attitudes to work are determined by personality and learning style: a twelve year longitudinal study of UK medical graduates. BMC Med (2004):2:29.

10. Visser MR, Smets EM, Oort FJ, De Haes HC. Stress, satisfaction and burnout among Dutch medical specialists. CMAJ (2003):168(3):271-275.

11. Aiken LH, Clarke SP, Sloane DM, et al. Nurses’ reports on hospital care in five countries. Health Aff (Millwood) (2001):20(3):43-53.

12. Miller JF. Burnout and its impact on good work in nursing. J Radiol Nurse (2011):30(4):146-149.

13. Kekana HP, du Rand EA, van Wyk NC. Job satisfaction of registered nurses in a community hospital in the Limpopo Province in South Africa. Curationis (2007):30(2):24-35

14. Bodur S. Job satisfaction of health care staff employed at health centers in Turkey. Occup Med (Lond) (2002):52:353-5.

15. van den Berg TI, Alavinia SM, Bretd FJ, Lindeboom D, Elders LA, Burdorfe A. The influence of psychosocial factors at work and life style on health and work ability among professional workers. Int Arch Occup Environ Health (2008):81:1029-36.

16. Bresic J, Knezovic B, Milosevic M, Tomljanovic T, Golubic R, Mustajbegovic J. Stress and work ability in oil industry workers. Arh Hig Rada Toksikol (2007):58:399-405.

17. Makowiec-Dabrowska T, Koszada-Wlodarczyk J, Knezevic M, Tomljanovic T, Bortkiewicz A, Gadzicka E, Siedlecka J, Jozwiak Z, et al. Occupational and non-occupational determinants of workability. Med Pr (2008):59(1):9-24.

18. Hegney D, Plank A, Parker V. Extrinsic and intrinsic work values: their impact on job satisfaction in nursing. Journal of Nursing Management (2006):14 (4):271-281.

19. RP Lephlala, VJ Ehlers, MJ Oosthuizen. Factors influencing nurses’s job satisfaction in selected private hospitals In England. Curationis.2008 Sep:31(3);60-69.2008.

20. Chase LK. Nurse manager competencies. Iowa. Dec 2010.

21. Lambrou P, Kontodimopoulos N, Niakas D. Motivation and job satisfaction among medical and nursing staff in a Cyprus public general hospital. Human Resource for Health.2010 Nov:8;26.

nurses in private hospitals were more satisfied, and had higher intentions to stay, than nurses in public hospitals. Khowaja et al., (2005:34) cite Thomas’ (1997) report about work stress in the NHS (UK) that had been aggravated by increased workloads, nursing shortages, job insecurities and organizational changes, influencing nurses’ job satisfaction negatively.52

Conclusion
Job satisfaction of healthcare workers is an essential part of ensuring high quality care and motivation at work. This study may serve as a base for future studies in different organizations on a larger scale. Nursing staff had reported low satisfaction with professional development opportunities, recognition, poor salaries, benefits, doing a lot of improper tasks and having more work pressure. Majority participants were unsatisfied due to workplace dignity, assigning improper tasks and lack of freedom in decision making at their work places. Interventions should be carried out to increase level of job satisfaction among nursing staff by reinforcing relevant human resource polices, improving working conditions and compensations.

Involving the nursing staff in a cooperative way, team approach will allow for consideration and improving the work environment to increase job satisfaction. Consequently it will positively affect individual, organizational and quality of health care services by improving capacity building, promotions and giving due rewards on job performance.

References
1. Habib AB. Job satisfaction in nurses working in tertiary level health care settings of Islamabad. J Ayub Med Coll Abbottabad (2011): 23(3).

2. Hafeez A, Khan Z, Bile KM, Jooma R. and Sheikh M. Pakistan human resources for health assessment, 2009. East Mediterr Health J (2010):16(Suppl):145-151.

3. Massoud R, Askov K. and Reinke J. A Modern Paradigm for Improving Healthcare Quality. Bethesda, MD: Published for USAID by the Quality Assurance Project (2001).

4. Bahamon C, Dwyer J. and Buxbaum A. Leading a change process to improve health service delivery. Bull World Health Organ (2006): 84(8): 658-661.

5. Savigny D. and Adam T. Systems thinking for health systems strengthening. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization (2009). http://www.unicef.org/protection/World_report_on_disability_eng.pdf.

6. Green A. An Introduction to Health Planning in Developing Countries, Volume 2. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press (1999).

7. Anton C. The impact of role stress on workers' behavior through job satisfaction and organizational commitment. Int J Psychol (2009):44(3):187-194.

8. Haas JS, Cook EF, Puopolo AL, Burstin HR, Cleary PD. and Brennan TA. Is the professional satisfaction of general internists associated with patient satisfaction? J Gen Intern Med (2000):15(2):122-128.