Evaluation of a Policy for the Distribution of Islamic Boarding School Grant Funds in Banten

Ujang Giri¹, Rahman Mulyawan², Budiman Rusli¹ and Asep Sumaryana¹

¹Department of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia
²Department of Government Science, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia

ORCID
Ujang Giri: 0000-0002-6101-1593

Abstract. Banten Province has eight regional autonomous areas consisting of four cities and four regencies, namely Cilegon City, Serang City, Tangerang City, South Tangerang City, Lebak Regency, Pandeglang Regency, Serang Regency, and Tangerang Regency. There are many Islamic boarding schools in Banten, which is often referred to as the city of santri in the land of champions. Banten Province distributes social assistance for Islamic boarding schools, through the regulation of the Governor of Banten number 10 of 2019 concerning guidelines for the provision of grants and social assistance sourced from the regional revenue and expenditure budget of the Banten Province. Based on the data collected in this study, there were 3,703 Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province in 2020. However, 918 Islamic boarding schools had administrative problems, including those that did not have legal status, an operational permit, or a deed of establishment from the Islamic Boarding School Foundation.

Keywords: policy evaluation, distribution grant fund, Islamic boarding school

1. Introduction

Banten Province is one of the provinces in Indonesia that distributes social assistance for Islamic Boarding Schools. With the regulation of the Governor of Banten Number 10 of 2019 concerning Guidelines for the Provision of Grants and social assistance sourced from the regional revenue and expenditure budget of the Banten Province. The number and amount of grants issued by the Banten provincial government for Islamic boarding schools, as listed in the table below:

| Governor's Regulation | Year | Budget | Volume | Quantity |
|-----------------------|------|--------|--------|----------|
| Number 10/ 2019       | 2020 | 111,090 M | 3703  | 30,000,000 |

Data: from various sources that have been processed.
Based on the table above, the distribution of grant funds for Islamic Boarding Schools in Banten Province in 2020 has a total budget of Rp. 111,090,000,000,- (one hundred and eleven billion ninety million rupiah), for 3703 Islamic Boarding Schools in Banten Province. Thus that social assistance for Islamic boarding schools in the province of Banten. Provision of Islamic Boarding School grants issued by the Banten Provincial government in realizing the policy of Governor Regulation Number 10 of 2019 concerning Guidelines for Providing Grants and Social Assistance Sourced from the Banten Province Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget.

The realization of the Banten Province Islamic Boarding School grant assistance program for the 2020 fiscal year of Rp. 111,090,000,000,- (One hundred and eleven billion ninety million rupiah), with the following details:

| Number | Area                | Quantity | Amount          |
|--------|---------------------|----------|-----------------|
| 1      | Serang City         | 181      | 5,430,000,000   |
| 2      | Cilegon City        | 35       | 1,050,000,000   |
| 3      | Tangerang City      | 69       | 2,070,000,000   |
| 4      | Tangerang Selatan City | 46    | 1,380,000,000   |
| 5      | Serang Regency      | 841      | 25,230,000,000  |
| 6      | Pandeglang Regency  | 819      | 24,570,000,000  |
| 7      | Lebak Regency       | 1087     | 32,610,000,000  |
| 8      | Tangerang Regency   | 625      | 18,750,000,000  |
| VOLUME |                     | 3,703    | 111,090,000,000 |

Data: from various sources that have been processed.

From the data above, it shows that the results of the recapitulation of the recipients of Islamic boarding school assistance for the 2020 budget year are based on the Banten Governor’s Regulation Number 10 of 2019 concerning the guidelines for providing grant funds and social assistance sourced from the Banten province’s regional revenue and expenditure budget. The total number of Islamic boarding schools is 3,703 with a budget ceiling of Rp. 111,090,000,000,- (one hundred and eleven billion ninety million rupiah), with each Islamic boarding school receiving a grant of 30 million.

From the data above, it shows that Lebak Regency has 1087 Islamic boarding schools, Pandeglang Regency has 819 Islamic Boarding Schools, Serang Regency has 841 Islamic Boarding Schools, Tangerang Regency has 625 Islamic Boarding Schools, Cilegon City has 35 Islamic Boarding Schools, Serang City has 181 Islamic Boarding Schools, Tangerang City as many as 69 Islamic boarding schools, and the City of South
Tangerang as many as 46 Islamic boarding schools. The total of all Banten Province in the realization of grant funds was 3,703 Islamic boarding schools.

The data above shows that Lebak Regency as much as Rp. 32,610,000,000,- consisting of 1087 Islamic boarding schools, Pandeglang Regency Rp. 24,570,000,000,- consisting of 819 Islamic boarding schools, Serang Regency Rp. 25,230,000,000,-

Figure 1: Number of Islamic Boarding Schools Recipients of Grants for Fiscal Year 2020. (*Data: from various sources that have been processed*).

Figure 2: Number of Islamic Boarding Schools Recipient of Grants for Fiscal Year 2020. (*Data: from various sources that have been processed*).
consisting of 841 Islamic boarding schools, Tangerang Regency amounting to Rp. 18,750,000,000,- consisting of 625 Islamic boarding schools, Cilegon City Rp. 1,050,000,000 consisting of 35 Islamic boarding schools, Serang City of Rp. 5,430,000,000 consisting of 181 Islamic boarding schools, Tangerang City of Rp. 2,070,000,000 consisting of 69 Islamic boarding schools, and South Tangerang City of Rp. 1,380,000,000 consists of 46 Islamic boarding schools. The total for the entire province of Banten in the realization of grant funds amounting to Rp. 111,090,000,000,- consisting of 3,703 Islamic boarding schools.

The image above is the result of data visualization based on the search results regarding the evaluation of grant funds that the author did through VOSviewer. This dataset is sourced from Google Scholar with the keyword “Evaluation of Grant Fund Policy” which is limited for the last 5 years with search results of 996 articles. The results found, as shown above, in the last 5 years, articles related to “Evaluation of Grant Fund Policy” are related to process evaluation, green climate fund, policy strategy, energy policy, grant agreement, innovation fund, teacher incentive fund in context, while research on the policy of grant funds that are specifically given to special schools, namely pesantren, is still rarely discussed.

2. Literature Review

To assess the success of a policy, several indicators need to be developed, because the use of a single indicator will be dangerous, in the sense that the research results can be biased from the actual one. Dunn (1) develops indicators or evaluation criteria that include the following six indicators:
First, Dunn’s Effectiveness states that effectiveness is concerned with whether an alternative achieves the expected results (results), or achieves the objectives of the action. Second, Efficiency According to Dunn explains that efficiency is related to the amount of effort required to produce a certain level of effectiveness. Efficiency is usually determined by calculating the cost per unit of product or service. The policy that achieves the highest effectiveness at the lowest cost is called efficiency.

Third, Dunn’s adequacy stated that adequacy relates to how far a level of effectiveness satisfies the needs, values, or opportunities that cause problems. Adequacy is still related to effectiveness which measures how far existing alternatives can satisfy needs, values, or opportunities in solving existing problems.

Fourth, Dunn’s Equity states that the equality criterion (Equity) is closely related to legal and social rationality and refers to the distribution of consequences and efforts between different groups in society. Dunn also said that policies that are oriented towards equity are policies whose business is distributed fairly. A particular program may be effective and sufficient if the cost of benefits is evenly distributed.

Fifth, Responsiveness The success of a policy can be measured through the public’s response to its implementation after first predicting what effect will occur if a policy is implemented. The public’s response after the impact of the policy has begun to be felt in a positive form in the form of support or a negative form in the form of rejection. Responsiveness criteria are important because the analysis can satisfy other criteria. Dunn says that accuracy is a criterion used to select several alternatives to be recommended by assessing whether the results of the alternatives The recommendation is a feasible choice of goals. This criterion concerns the substance of the goal, not the means or instruments to realize the goal.

Based on the description above, policy evaluation is inseparable from evaluation indicators to assess the success of a policy, namely. Effectiveness, Efficiency, Adequacy, Equity, Responsiveness, and Accuracy.

3. Methods

Based on the research problem and aims to answer research questions regarding the evaluation of policies for the distribution of grant funds for Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province in 2020, which is further emphasized with the aim of the research that wants to obtain a new concept in the form of an evaluation model for policy distribution of Islamic boarding school grants in Banten Province. Through primary data collection
from informants and observations as well as secondary data processing in the field(2). Therefore, this research was conducted using qualitative methods(3).

4. Results and Discussion

4.1. Definition of Grant

According to the Big Indonesian Dictionary, a grant means a gift (voluntarily) by transferring the right to something to someone else. Definition of Grants The word grant has 2 (two) meanings, namely interpersonal grants as referred to in the Civil Code (KUH Perdata) and grants related to regional finance, following the object of this legal writing, as regulated in the provisions of the legislation as follows:

1) Article 1666 of the Civil Code, states that a grant/grant (checking) is an agreement/agreement (overeenkomst) with/in which the party who grants (Schenker), while he is still alive, is free of charge (om niet) and cannot be withdrawn, surrenders/releases an object to/for the grantee (begiftigde) who receives the delivery/grant.

2) Elucidation of Article 27 paragraph (7) letter f PP Number 58 of 2005 concerning Regional Financial Management, states that grants are used to budget for the provision of money/goods or services to the government or other regional governments, regional companies, communities, and community organizations, which the designation has been specifically determined, is not mandatory and is not binding, and is not continuous.

3) Article 42 of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 13 of 2006 concerning Guidelines for Regional Financial Management, which has been amended several times, most recently by the Minister of Home Affairs Number 21 of 2011 concerning the Second Amendment to the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 13 of 2006 concerning Guidelines for Regional Financial Management, which states that grant spending used to budget for grants in the form of money, goods and/or services to the government or other regional governments, regional companies, communities, and community organizations whose allocations have been specifically determined.

4) Article 1 point 14 of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 32 of 2011 concerning Guidelines for Grants and Social Assistance sourced from the Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget, which has been amended by Permendagri Number 39 of 2012 concerning Amendments to the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 32 of 2011 concerning Guidelines for Giving Grants and Social Assistance sourced from Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budgets, the definition of grants is the provision
of money/goods or services from the regional government to the government or other regional governments, regional companies, communities and community organizations, whose allocations have been specifically determined, are not mandatory, and not binding, and not continuously aimed at supporting the implementation of regional government affairs.

5) Article 1 (28) Law 33 of 2004 concerning Financial Balance between the Central Government and Regional Government Grants are Regional Revenues originating from foreign state governments, foreign agencies/institutions, international agencies/institutions, the Government, domestic agencies/institutions, or individuals, either in the form of foreign exchange, rupiah or goods and/or services, including experts and training that do not need to be paid back.

6) Article 44 of Law 33 of 2004 concerning Financial Balance between the Central Government and Regional Governments:
   a. Grant income is non-binding assistance;
   b. Grants to Regions originating from abroad are carried out through the Government;
   c. The grant is outlined in a text of an agreement between the Regional Government and the grantor;
   d. The grant is used following the agreement text as referred to in.

7) Technical Bulletin Number 4 Government Accounting Standards (SAP) concerning the Presentation and Disclosure of Government Expenditures, states that Grants are government expenditures in the form of money/goods or services to the government or other governments, regional companies, communities, and community organizations, specifically the allocation has been determined, is not mandatory and is not binding, and is not continuous.

8) Technical Bulletin Number 13 SAP concerning Grant Accounting, which states that grant spending is government spending in the form of money/goods or services that can be provided to governments of other countries, international organizations, central/regional governments, state/regional companies, community groups, or community organizations whose designations have been specifically determined, are not obligatory and non-binding and are not continuous unless stipulated otherwise in the laws and regulations.
4.2. Evaluation

Research on the Evaluation of Policy for the Distribution of Islamic Boarding School Grants in 2020 in Banten Province. Grants are one of the important factors in realizing Good Governance or good governance where the Central Government and Regional Governments can work together to assist in the form of money, goods/services. Grants are one of the important factors in realizing community welfare.

Through local government policies contained in Governor Regulation Number 49 of 2017 and Governor Regulation Number 10 of 2019 concerning guidelines for granting grants and social assistance sourced from the regional budget for revenues and expenditures of Banten Province. Local Government Grants can assist in following the needs of the community in various fields and sectors such as agriculture, education, health, religion, and other sectors. Procedures for Disbursement of Money Grants at Local Governments include the Process for submitting Grants by Agencies/Institutions, Community, Community Organizations, other Regional Governments or BUMDs to related SKPDs, Verification, Approval of Grants by the Governor, Disbursement of Grants, and Accountability. Where a series of procedures must be following applicable regulations and policies so that there is no fraud or embezzlement of Grant funds that benefit certain parties.

In the distribution of grant funds in the Banten Province which is intended for the religious sector, in this case, there are Islamic boarding schools in the Banten Province area. The policy in distributing Islamic boarding school grants in Banten concerning regional regulations Number 10 of 2019 resulted in several notes in the process of distributing Islamic boarding school grants in Banten Province. First, there are cuts in the process of distributing Islamic boarding school grants to recipients of assistance in the 2020 fiscal year in Banten Province. Second, the distribution process for Islamic Boarding Schools in Banten Province does not match the data in the field (Fictional PONPES data) that received Social Assistance. Third, the process of distributing HIBAH funds in Banten Province to Islamic boarding schools that do not have an IJOP (Operational Permit) and do not have an AKTA for the establishment of the Islamic Boarding School Foundation.

Evaluation of the policy for distributing grant funds to Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province in 2020. This study uses the evaluation theory proposed by William N Dunn which consists of 6 indicators related to program evaluation. With this theory, it
is expected to be able to explain clearly the evaluation of the policy for the distribution of grant funds for Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province.

1. Effectiveness

To find out the results of the evaluation of a program, several indicators must be studied, the first is effectiveness. Effectiveness is always related to the relationship between the expected results and the results achieved. Effectiveness according (4) is a measure that gives an idea of how far the target can be achieved. In general, effectiveness indicates the extent to which the goals that have been set have been achieved. Goals are very important in measuring the effectiveness of a program.

The number of grants disbursed only amounting to 30,000,000 could not provide significant benefits, with this value considered too small to build and develop education at the level of Islamic boarding schools. And it is not effective towards the goal to be achieved.

2. Efficiency

Efficiency refers to the amount of effort required to produce a certain level of effectiveness. Efficiency, which is a synonym for economic rationality, is the relationship between effectiveness and effort, the latter generally being measured by monetary costs. Efficiency is usually determined by calculating the unit cost of a product or service. Policies that achieve the highest effectiveness with the lowest costs are called efficient” (1)

The amount given of 30,000,000 does not meet the standards and needs of Islamic boarding schools, if distributed to Islamic boarding schools it will not have a significant impact on the prosperity of a boarding school.

3. Adequacy

In public policy, adequacy can be interpreted by how far the results that have been achieved can solve the problem. Dunn states that adequacy (adequacy) relates to how far a level of effectiveness satisfies needs, values, or opportunities that foster problems. So the adequacy in the evaluation of public policy has a relationship with effectiveness in measuring how far the existing alternatives can meet the needs.

4. Alignment

Equity in public policy according to Dunn is that equity is closely related to legal and social rationality and refers to the distribution of consequences and efforts between different groups in society. The alignment in this evaluation indicator should be able to
answer the question of “are the costs and benefits distributed equally among different groups?”.

All Islamic boarding schools receive Rp. 30,000,000 but in this case, the principle of distribution is not appropriate because it is not seen from other aspects including the number of students, building area, and level of demand for Islamic boarding schools. This should be considered so that there is an even distribution of grant funds.

5. Responsiveness

Responsiveness relates to how far a policy can satisfy the needs, preferences, or values of certain community groups (1). The responsiveness criterion is important because an analysis that can satisfy all other criteria (effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equality) still fails if it does not respond to the actual needs of the groups that should benefit from the existence of a policy.

The distribution of grants amounting to Rp. 30,000,000 in each Islamic boarding school is certainly considered inappropriate both in terms of quantity and in terms of quality. So in this case it is considered less responsive to conditions in the field at each Islamic boarding school.

6. Accuracy

 Appropriateness is a criterion used to select several alternatives to be used as recommendations by assessing whether the results of the recommended alternatives are a viable goal choice. Eligibility criteria are associated with rationality.

There were some findings in the field that there were irregularities in the distribution of grant funds resulting in state losses and legal findings, this shows that the distribution of Islamic boarding school grants is not properly distributed in its entirety without field verification and monitoring from the Banten Provincial Government.

5. Conclusion

Evaluations that support the policy on the distribution of grants in Banten Province that are transparent, accountable, and integrated into Banten Province can be evaluated from the effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy in the policy process. the distribution must be following the applicable mechanisms and rules, besides that, in-depth and comprehensive monitoring and evaluation must also be carried out. So that the distribution of grant funds can be felt by the community, especially for residents of Islamic boarding schools in Banten Province.
References

[1] Dunn WN. Public Policy Analysis: An Introduction. Pearson. Prentice Hill. 2008.

[2] Sugiyono S. Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&B. Bandung: Alfabeta; 2012.

[3] Creswell JW. Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative and Mix Method Approaches [Internet]. 4th ed. SAGE Publications. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications; 2014. Available from: https://adams.marmot.org/Record/.b40623245

[4] Dye TR. Understanding Public Policy 4th ed. New Jersey: Englewood Cliffs, 2002