Brief report: a comparison of child mental health inequalities in three UK population cohorts

Collishaw, Stephan, Furzer, Emma, Thapar, Ajay K and Sellers, Ruth (2019) Brief report: a comparison of child mental health inequalities in three UK population cohorts. European Child & Adolescent Psychiatry. ISSN 1018-8827

This version is available from Sussex Research Online: http://sro.sussex.ac.uk/id/eprint/81830/

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies and may differ from the published version or from the version of record. If you wish to cite this item you are advised to consult the publisher’s version. Please see the URL above for details on accessing the published version.

Copyright and reuse:
Sussex Research Online is a digital repository of the research output of the University.

Copyright and all moral rights to the version of the paper presented here belong to the individual author(s) and/or other copyright owners. To the extent reasonable and practicable, the material made available in SRO has been checked for eligibility before being made available.

Copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided that the authors, title and full bibliographic details are credited, a hyperlink and/or URL is given for the original metadata page and the content is not changed in any way.
Brief report: A comparison of child mental health inequalities in three UK population cohorts

Stephan Collishaw\textsuperscript{a}, Emma Furzer\textsuperscript{a}, Ajay K Thapar\textsuperscript{a}, Ruth Sellers\textsuperscript{ab}

Affiliations:

\textsuperscript{a}Cardiff University School of Medicine, Child and Adolescent Psychiatry, Division of Psychological Medicine and Clinical Neurosciences, MRC Centre for Neuropsychiatric Genetics and Genomics, Cardiff, Wales

\textsuperscript{b}University of Sussex, Brighton, England

Corresponding author:

Professor Stephan Collishaw
Cardiff University School of Medicine, Child and Adolescent Psychiatry, Division of Psychological Medicine and Clinical Neurosciences, MRC Centre for Neuropsychiatric Genetics and Genomics, Hadyn Ellis Building, Maindy Road, Cardiff CF244HQ, Wales, UK

Email: collishaws@cardiff.ac.uk
Abstract

There are substantial health disparities between children from low and higher income families. The study aimed to test changes in child mental health inequalities across three large UK population cohorts of 11-year old children assessed in 1999, 2004 and 2012 as part of the British Child and Adolescent Mental Health Surveys and Millennium Cohort Study. Child mental health was assessed using parent and teacher versions of the Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire. There were substantial differences in parent and teacher reported symptom scores between children from low and higher income families in each cohort. Differences in parent reported symptoms increased over time (ES = 0.35 [95%CI = 0.20, 0.49] in 1999, ES = 0.39 [95%CI = 0.17, 0.61] in 2004, ES = 0.54 [95%CI = 0.49, 0.58] in 2012); cohort interaction: p = 0.01). This study found that marked child mental health inequalities exist. The mental health gap between advantaged and disadvantaged children has not reduced over the last 20 years and may be getting worse.
Introduction

Alleviating inequalities in child health is a major policy priority internationally, including for successive UK governments.\textsuperscript{1,2} However, evidence highlights stark and growing inequalities in child physical health.\textsuperscript{3} Less is known about inequalities affecting children’s mental health and whether these have changed over time, but there is some evidence that inequalities in adolescent emotional problems increased in the second half of the 20\textsuperscript{th} Century.\textsuperscript{4} Our aim here was to test family income inequalities in child mental health problems in the UK in the 21\textsuperscript{st} Century.

Methods

Three large unselected UK population cohorts of 11-year-old children were compared: 1999 British Child and Adolescent Mental Health Survey (BCAMHS 1999, $N = 928$), 2004 British Child and Adolescent Mental Health Survey (BCAMHS 2004, $N = 670$) and the Millennium Cohort Study (MCS) 2012 sweep ($N = 11,474$). The use of identical symptom screens allows for valid ‘like-with-like’ comparison of the prevalence of child mental health problems across unselected population cohorts,\textsuperscript{5} and parents and teachers provide unique and complementary information about children’s mental health.\textsuperscript{6} Parents and teachers in each study completed the widely used and extensively validated Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire (SDQ) to assess mental health.\textsuperscript{7} The SDQ total score includes 20 items assessing conduct problems, emotional problems, hyperactivity, and peer problems. For cross-cohort comparisons of mental health inequalities, parent- and teacher-rated total SDQ scores were each standardised within each cohort (mean = 0, SD = 1) to allow direct comparison of effect sizes (i.e. SD unit differences). Parents provided information about gross household income, and analyses compared families below or above the bottom quintile of incomes within each cohort. Standard survey-specific weights accounted for non-response and sample stratification (MCS). Linear regression models tested differences in SDQ total scores within each cohort, and cross-cohort comparisons (using standardised SDQ outcome scores) tested the interaction between cohort and low family income.
Results

There was no overall change in levels of child mental health problems reported by parents (total SDQ symptom scores: 1999 = 8.34 [95%CI: 7.98, 8.70], 2004 = 7.85 [7.40, 8.31], 2012 = 8.12 [8.02, 8.23], p = 0.29) or by teachers (1999 = 6.15 [95%CI: 5.72, 6.57], 2004 = 6.13 [5.59, 6.66], 2012 = 5.92 [5.80, 6.05], p = 0.48). There were substantial income inequalities in child mental health within each cohort (see Figure). In addition, there was a significant cohort by income interaction for parent reports (beta = 0.074 [95% CI = 0.020, 0.176], p = 0.01) showing that income inequalities varied across the study period. Comparing mental health problem scores for children from low and higher income families in each cohort, we observed that effect sizes increased by 54% across the study period (ES = 0.35 [95%CI = 0.20, 0.49] in 1999, ES = 0.39 [95%CI = 0.17, 0.61] in 2004, ES = 0.54 [95%CI = 0.49, 0.58] in 2012). For teacher reports, there were substantial differences between poor and non-poor children within each cohort (ES = 0.41 [95%CI = 0.23, 0.59] in 1999, ES = 0.56 [95%CI = 0.22, 0.90] in 2004, ES = 0.57 [95%CI = 0.51, 0.62] in 2011). The cohort by income interaction tended in the same direction, but was not significant (beta = 0.055 [95% CI = -0.013, 0.165], p = 0.09).

Discussion

Successive UK governments have committed to reducing inequalities in child health and to improving children’s mental health.\(^1\)\(^2\) However, inequalities in children’s physical health are growing,\(^3\) and our study confirms that there are also substantial inequalities in child mental health. The mental health gap between advantaged and disadvantaged children is not reducing and may be getting worse. This has important implications for the future given that more than half of all adult mental disorders are preceded by mental health problems in childhood.\(^8\) These findings on their own do not address reasons for inequalities in mental health, but evidence from intervention and quasi-experimental designs suggests that family poverty does likely have causal effects on child mental health.\(^9\)\(^10\) There have been substantial public spending cuts in many European countries, including
the UK, which over the past decade have disproportionately impacted household incomes, financial security, public support, health programs and mental health services for the most disadvantaged families in society. The findings represent an urgent call to action to close the substantial gap in mental health between poor and better off children, to prioritise social policy that mitigates the impacts of public spending cuts on the most vulnerable families in society, and to make appropriate adjustments in service provision in community and health care settings to support the mental health of children from low-income families.

**Ethical standards**

The British Child and Adolescent Mental Health Surveys and Millennium Cohort Study received ethical approval from the Multi-Centre Research Ethics Committee. Parents in all three studies provided informed consent.

**Conflict of interest**

On behalf of all authors, the corresponding author states that there is no conflict of interest

**Funding**

This work was supported by the Medical Research Council [grant number MR/J01348X/1] and by support to SC from the Waterloo Foundation and to RS from ESRC [ES/N003098/1].

**References**

1Her Majesty’s Treasury (2003). Every child matters (Green Paper). Norwich: The Stationery Office.

2Prime Minister’s Office. (2016). Statement from the new Prime Minister Theresa May. Speech delivered on 13 July 2016. [https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/statement-from-the-new-prime-minister-theresa-may](https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/statement-from-the-new-prime-minister-theresa-may)
3Royal College of Paediatrics and Child Health. (2017). State of Child Health. Report 2017. London: RCPCH.

4Gore-Langton E, Collishaw S, Goodman R, Pickles A, Maughan B. (2011). An emerging income differential for adolescent emotional problems. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry, 52*(10), 1081-1088.

5Collishaw S. (2015). Annual research review: secular trends in child and adolescent mental health. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry, 56*, 370-93.

6Collishaw S, Goodman R, Ford T, Rabe-Hesketh S, Pickles A. (2009). How far are associations between child, family and community factors and child psychopathology informant-specific and informant-general? *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry, 50*, 571-80.

7Goodman R. (2001). Psychometric properties of the Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire. *J American Acad Child Adol Psych, 40*, 1337-1345.

8Kim-Cohen J, Caspi A, Moffitt TE, et al. (2003). Prior juvenile diagnoses in adults with mental disorder: developmental follow-back of a prospective-longitudinal cohort. *Arch Gen Psychiatry*. .717-709:(7)60;2003

9Costello EJ, Compton SN, Keeler J, Angold A. (2003). Relationships between poverty and psychopathology: A natural experiment. *JAMA: Journal of the American Medical Association, 290*, 2023–2029.

10Yoshikawa H, Aber JL, Beardslee W (2017). Austerity and health: the impact in the UK and Europe. *European Journal of Public Health, 27*, Issue suppl_4, 1 October 2017, Pages 18–21

11Stuckler D, Reeves A, Loopstra R et al (2017). Austerity and health: the impact in the UK and Europe. *European Journal of Public Health, 27*, Issue suppl_4, 1 October 2017, Pages 18–21
Figure: Standardized mental health problem scores for three nationally representative samples of 11-year children from high and low-income families. Mean z-scores and 95% CIs. (Panel A: parent reports; Panel B: teacher reports)