Compositional Dependence of Phase Selection in CoCrCu$_{0.1}$FeMoNi-Based High-Entropy Alloys

Ning Liu $^{1,*,1}$, Chen Chen $^1$, Isaac Chang $^2$, Pengjie Zhou $^1$ and Xiaojing Wang $^1$

$^1$ School of Materials Science and Engineering, Jiangsu University of Science and Technology, Zhenjiang 212003, China; cc187086525@163.com (C.C.); zhoupengjie@just.edu.cn (P.Z.); xjwang.0@163.com (X.W.)

$^2$ Brunel Centre for Advanced Solidification (BCAST), Brunel University, Kingston Lane, London UB8 3PH, UK; isaac.chang@brunel.ac.uk

* Correspondence: lnlynn@l26.com; Tel.: +86-511-8440-1184

Received: 22 June 2018; Accepted: 24 July 2018; Published: 25 July 2018

Abstract: To study the effect of alloy composition on phase selection in the CoCrCu$_{0.1}$FeMoNi high-entropy alloy (HEA), Mo was partially replaced by Co, Cr, Fe, and Ni. The microstructures and phase selection behaviors of the CoCrCu$_{0.1}$FeMoNi HEA system were investigated. Dendritic, inter-dendritic, and eutectic microstructures were observed in the as-solidified HEAs. A simple face centered cubic (FCC) single-phase solid solution was obtained when the molar ratio of Fe, Co, and Ni was increased to 1.7 at the expense of Mo, indicating that Fe, Co, and Ni stabilized the FCC structure. The FCC structure was favored at the atomic radius ratio $\delta \leq 2.8$, valence electron concentration (VEC) $\geq 8.27$, mixing entropy $\Delta S \leq 13.037$, local lattice distortion parameter $\alpha^2 \leq 0.0051$, and $\Delta S/\delta^2 > 1.7$. Mixed FCC + body centered cubic (BCC) structures occurred for $4.1 \leq \delta \leq 4.3$ and $7.71 \leq$ VEC $\leq 7.86$; FCC or/and BCC + intermetallic (IM) mixtures were favored at $2.8 \leq \delta \leq 4.1$ or $\delta > 4.3$ and $7.39 <$ VEC $\leq 8.27$. The IM phase is favored at electronegativity differences greater than 0.133. However, $\Delta S$, $\alpha^2$, and $\Delta S/\delta^2$ were inefficient in identifying the (FCC or/and BCC + IM)/(FCC + BCC) transition. Moreover, the mixing enthalpy cannot predict phase structures in this system.

Keywords: high-entropy alloy; microstructure; eutectic structure; phase selection

1. Introduction

High-entropy alloys (HEAs) represent a new class of materials that have attracted extensive attention since 2004 [1–8]. HEAs are defined as alloys containing at least five major elements wherein every major element has an atomic fraction between 5% and 35% [9]. Various studies on HEAs, including composition, processing, crystal structure and microstructure, and physical and mechanical properties, have been performed in the past years [5–23].

The microstructures and crystalline phases present in HEAs are very sensitive to the alloy composition. An $\alpha$ phase appears when the molar ratio of Mo in AlCoCrFeNiMo$_x$ alloys exceeds 0.1 [17]. Changes in the molar ratio of Fe, Co, and Cr in AlCoCrFeMo$_{0.5}$Ni alloys affect the crystalline phases and mechanical properties. As the Mo content increases, the volume fraction of the $\sigma$ phase increases in Ni$_2$CrFeMo$_x$ alloys [18]. However, the volume fraction of the $\sigma$ phase is increased with increasing Cr content. Eventually, the dendritic matrix of AlCoCr$_2$FeMo$_{0.5}$Ni HEAs is changed from the ordered B2 phase to the $\sigma$ phase [19]. As the Co content in AlCo$_{2}$CrFeMo$_{0.5}$Ni HEAs changes from $x = 0.5$ to $x = 2.0$, the phase changes from BCC to BCC + FCC + $\sigma$, respectively. Recently, it was found that the precipitation of intermetallic (IM) compounds of $\sigma$ and $\mu$ phases could strengthen CoCrFeNiMo$_{0.3}$ alloy without causing serious embrittlement [21]. Moreover, the ordered B2 solid-solution and $\sigma$ phases were...
presented in FeAlCrNiMo₃ HEAs with increasing Mo content [22]. Most previous investigations have focused on the effects of the addition or content change of one or two elements on the microstructure and properties of the HEA. However, studies on the effect of each individual element on the microstructure and phase selection have not yet been reported. Additional systematic research will be necessary in the near future to guide the exploration of HEAs.

Many parameters are related to phase selection in HEAs, including the atomic radii differences (δ), differences in electronegativity (AX), the valence electron concentration (VEC), the enthalpy of mixing (ΔHₘix), and the mixing entropy (ΔSₘix) [24–31]. Based on these parameters, many criteria have been proposed for phase prediction in HEAs. Zhang et al. summarized a solid-solution phase-forming rule for VEC > 8, FCC was [25]. Later, the stability of the σ phase was studied and it was predicted that alloys with 6.88 ≤ VEC ≤ 7.84 were prone to σ phase formation [30]. However, this criterion works well only for Cr- and V-containing HEAs. Recently, complex ordered phases were found to be stable for VEC > 8, FCC was [25].

As mentioned above, the phases present in HEAs are remarkably dependent on the alloy composition. In a previous work, the CoCrCuFeMoNi alloy exhibited the duplex microstructure of BCC + FCC [33]. Under compositional change, the microstructural behavior is uncertain: the HEA could retain this simple solid solution mixture or intermetallic (IM) phases could appear. In order to address this question, it is necessary to study the effect of alloy composition on the phase selection of CoCrCuFeMoNi alloys. Hence, the present work investigates the partial substitution of Mo by Cr, Co, Ni, and Fe. The effect of the relative contents of Cr, Co, Ni, Fe, and Mo on the microstructure and crystal structures of CoCrCuFeMoNi-based HEAs was studied in this work in order to understand the phase selection mechanism in this alloy system.

### 2. Materials and Methods

The proposed HEAs were prepared via vacuum arc melting in a Ti-gettered Ar atmosphere with subsequent melt solidification in a water-cooled Cu crucible. A mixture of the appropriate amounts of the constituent elements with purities > 99.9 wt % for each alloy was flipped and melted at least four times to ensure thorough chemical homogeneity. Table 1 shows the compositions prepared in this study. As-cast samples were then sectioned and polished for microstructural and compositional characterization using scanning electron microscopy (SEM, JEOI-5410, JEOI Ltd., Tokyo, Japan), energy dispersive X-ray spectrometry (EDS, JEOL Ltd., Tokyo, Japan), and an X-ray diffractometer (XRD, Rigaku ME510-FM2, Rigaku Ltd., Tokyo, Japan) at a scanning speed of 4°/min and a scanning range from 30° to 100° using a Cu target and an applied voltage and current of 30 kV and 20 mA, respectively.

| Alloys              | Co  | Cr  | Cu  | Fe  | Mo  | Ni  |
|---------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| Co₁₋ₓCrₓCu₀.₁FeMo₀.₉Ni | 23.53 | 19.61 | 1.96 | 19.61 | 15.69 | 19.61 |
| Co₁₋ₓCrₓCu₀.₁FeMo₀.₉Ni | 21.41 | 19.61 | 1.96 | 19.61 | 15.69 | 19.61 |
| Co₁₋ₓCrₓCu₀.₁FeMo₀.₉Ni | 33.33 | 19.61 | 1.96 | 19.61 | 5.88  | 19.61 |
| CoCr₁₋ₓCuₓFeMo₀.₉Ni | 19.61 | 23.53 | 1.96 | 19.61 | 15.69 | 19.61 |
| CoCr₁₋ₓCuₓFeMo₀.₉Ni | 19.61 | 29.41 | 1.96 | 19.61 | 9.8   | 19.61 |
| CoCr₁₋ₓCuₓFeMo₀.₉Ni | 19.61 | 23.53 | 1.96 | 19.61 | 15.69 | 19.61 |
| CoCr₁₋ₓCuₓFeMo₀.₉Ni | 19.61 | 19.61 | 1.96 | 23.53 | 15.69 | 19.61 |
| CoCr₁₋ₓCuₓFeMo₀.₉Ni | 19.61 | 19.61 | 1.96 | 29.41 | 9.8   | 19.61 |
| CoCr₁₋ₓCuₓFeMo₀.₉Ni | 19.61 | 19.61 | 1.96 | 33.33 | 5.88  | 19.61 |
| CoCr₁₋ₓCuₓFeMo₀.₉Ni | 19.61 | 19.61 | 1.96 | 19.61 | 15.69 | 23.53 |
| CoCr₁₋ₓCuₓFeMo₀.₉Ni | 19.61 | 19.61 | 1.96 | 19.61 | 9.8   | 29.41 |
| CoCr₁₋ₓCuₓFeMo₀.₉Ni | 19.61 | 19.61 | 1.96 | 19.61 | 5.88  | 33.33 |
3. Results

3.1. Co\textsubscript{a}CrCu\textsubscript{0.1}FeMo\textsubscript{2−a}Ni Alloys

The microstructures of the Co\textsubscript{a}CrCu\textsubscript{0.1}FeMo\textsubscript{2−a}Ni (a = 1.2, 1.5 and 1.7) alloys are shown in Figure 1. A typical eutectic structure is found in the inter-dendritic region, and the volume fraction of the eutectic mixture is decreased with increasing Co and decreasing Mo. Table 2 shows the actual composition and contents of different regions in the microstructures, as detected by EDS. The dendrites are enriched in Co, Cu, Fe, and Ni, while the contents of Cr and Mo are higher in the inter-dendritic region B. The composition of the inter-dendritic eutectic region B is approximately (CrMo)\textsubscript{54}(CoCuFeNi)\textsubscript{46} according to EDS. This means that the content of Cr and Mo is 54\% and that of Co, Cu, Fe, and Ni is 46\%. Furthermore, the Cu content in the inter-dendritic region is increased with decreasing Mo content. This is related to the positive $\Delta H_{\text{mix}}$ between Cu and Mo (+19 kJ/mol).

Figure 1d shows the XRD patterns of the Co\textsubscript{a}CrCu\textsubscript{0.1}FeMo\textsubscript{2−a}Ni HEAs. The FCC, $\sigma$, and $\mu$ phases are detected. The crystal structure of the $\sigma$ phase is tetragonal with the lattice constants of $a = 0.885$ nm and $c = 0.459$ nm, and the $\sigma$ phase is similar to the binary Co\textsubscript{2}Mo\textsubscript{3} phase. The $\mu$ phase is tetragonal with lattice constants of $a = 0.7381$ nm and $c = 1.8504$ nm, and probably Co\textsubscript{7}Mo\textsubscript{3} or Fe\textsubscript{7}Mo\textsubscript{6}. Both $\sigma$ and $\mu$ are topologically close-packed (TCP) phases. Obviously, the volume fractions of the $\sigma$ and $\mu$ phases, represented by peaks in the range of 40–50$^\circ$, are decreased as the Co content increases and Mo decreases. According to the EDS and XRD results, we can identify the dendrites as the FCC phase, while $\sigma$ and $\mu$ are eutectic structures.

![Figure 1](image-url)
Table 2. The components of different regions in microstructures of CoCrCu₀.₁FeMoNi-based high-entropy alloys (HEAs).

| Alloy                      | Value | Region | Co  | Cr  | Cu  | Fe  | Mo  | Ni  |
|----------------------------|-------|--------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| Co₉CrCu₀.₁FeMo₂₋₉Ni       |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| a = 1.2                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 23.55 | 18.37  | 1.84| 19.73| 17.93| 18.58|
| A                         | 24.17 | 18.46  | 1.85| 20.45| 14.32| 20.75|
| B                         | 19.32 | 18.01  | 0.43| 14.57| 36.10| 11.57|
| a = 1.5                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 27.92 | 20.60  | 1.8| 19.63| 9.5 | 19.55|
| A                         | 20.45 | 27.40  | 1.68| 21.25| 8.93| 20.29|
| B                         | 17.03 | 33.13  | 0.82| 16.70| 19.91| 12.41|
| a = 1.7                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 33.63 | 19.57  | 1.75| 19.8| 6.0 | 19.25|
| A                         | 34.86 | 17.83  | 1.61| 20.30| 6.09| 19.31|
| B                         | 30.34 | 20.33  | 1.90| 19.79| 8.98| 18.66|

| Co₉CrCu₀.₁FeMo₂₋₉Ni       |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| b = 1.2                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 19.32 | 25.69  | 1.85| 20.44| 12.36| 20.34|
| A                         | 18.68 | 30.11  | -  | 20.20| 9.53| 21.47|
| B                         | 22.51 | 22.99  | 1.77| 17.02| 17.53| 18.17|
| b = 1.5                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 20.02 | 29.45  | 1.51| 19.23| 10.36| 19.43|
| A                         | 15.50 | 26.95  | -  | 18.31| 24.98| 14.25|
| B                         | 16.76 | 24.25  | -  | 19.83| 19.13| 20.03|
| b = 1.7                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 15.33 | 21.76  | 1.83| 23.53| 17.92| 19.63|
| A                         | 15.70 | 21.66  | -  | 20.57| 29.21| 12.86|
| B                         | 14.95 | 22.12  | 0.40| 20.93| 29.95| 11.65|
| Co₉CrCu₀.₁FeMo₂₋₉Ni       |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| c = 1.2                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 17.71 | 21.65  | 1.94| 29.41| 10.82| 18.47|
| A                         | 17.63 | 19.24  | 2.25| 31.42| 10.49| 18.95|
| B                         | 15.51 | 21.98  | 0.34| 23.16| 27.19| 11.83|
| C                         | 15.94 | 22.96  | 0.62| 22.66| 24.96| 12.85|
| c = 1.5                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 20.8  | 19.98  | 1.64| 33.30| 6.05 | 18.23|
| A                         | 18.95 | 19.89  | 1.58| 32.19| 8.45 | 18.94|
| B                         | 22.54 | 20.36  | 1.89| 34.23| 2.81 | 18.16|
| c = 1.7                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 19.37 | 19.63  | 1.36| 19.47| 16.64| 23.53|
| A                         | 19.49 | 18.93  | 1.20| 21.82| 13.50| 25.06|
| B                         | 16.80 | 22.33  | 0.67| 16.58| 27.68| 15.95|
| C                         | 17.03 | 21.79  | 0.45| 13.97| 32.56| 14.20|
| Co₉CrCu₀.₁FeMo₂₋₉Ni       |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| d = 1.2                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 19.79 | 19.68  | 1.96| 19.16| 10.37| 29.04|
| A                         | 19.09 | 19.13  | 2.15| 17.77| 13.22| 28.65|
| B                         | 21.82 | 20.07  | 1.71| 21.02| 3.28 | 32.10|
| C                         | 18.28 | 22.86  | 0.67| 15.67| 21.82| 20.70|
| d = 1.5                   |       |        |     |     |     |     |     |     |
| Content                   | 20.82 | 19.67  | 1.53| 19.74| 6.25 | 31.89|
| A                         | 17.80 | 21.90  | 1.84| 18.78| 8.06 | 31.62|
| B                         | 21.38 | 19.25  | 1.65| 19.93| 4.60 | 33.18|
| C                         | 2.44  | 88.74  | -  | 3.85 | 0.68 | 4.29|

3.2. Co₉CrCu₀.₁FeMo₂₋₉Ni Alloys

The microstructures of Co₉CrCu₀.₁FeMo₂₋₉Ni (b = 1.2 and 1.5) alloys are shown in Figure 2. Dendrites and inter-dendritic regions remain in the Co₉Cr₁₂Cu₀.₁FeMo₀.₈Ni alloy (referred to as Cr₁₂Cu₀.₁Mo₀.₈). The dendrites are enriched in Fe and Ni, and the Cr content in the dendrites is increased (A in Figure 2a), while the inter-dendritic region (B) is enriched with Co and Mo. However, for the Co₉Cr₁₅Cu₀.₁FeMo₀.₅Ni alloy (referred to as Cr₁₅Cu₀.₁Mo₀.₅), a fully eutectic structure is found, indicating that the alloy has a eutectic composition, probably of (CrMo)₅₂(CoCuFeNi)₄₈, according to region A in Table 2 as detected by EDS. This means that the content of Cr and Mo is 52%, and that of Co, Cu, Fe, and Ni is 48%.

It is apparent that Co₉CrCu₀.₁FeMo₂₋₉Ni (b = 1.2 and 1.5) alloys contain FCC, BCC, and TCP phases according to the XRD patterns, as shown in Figure 2c. The TCP phases correspond to the tetragonal σ phase.
(a = 0.917 nm, c = 0.474 nm) and a hexagonal close-packed (HCP) Laves phase (a = 0.473 nm, c = 0.772 nm). As can be seen in Figure 2c, the volume fraction of the BCC phase increases with increasing Cr, which enhances the formation of BCC phase in CoCr$_{1.2}$Cu$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.8}$Ni alloys (b = 1.2 and 1.5). With increasing Cr and decreasing Mo, the BCC phase appears, and the volume fraction of both TCP phases decreases. According to the EDS and XRD results, the dendrites should be FCC, while the eutectic structures include BCC, σ, and Laves phases.

![Figure 2](image)

**Figure 2.** The SEM micrographs and phase structures of CoCr$_{1.2}$Cu$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.8}$Ni alloys. (a) CoCr$_{1.2}$Cu$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.8}$Ni; (b) CoCr$_{1.5}$Cu$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.5}$Ni; (c) XRD patterns.

### 3.3. CoCrCu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{c}$Mo$_{2-c}$Ni Alloys

Figure 3 presents the microstructures of the CoCrCu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{c}$Mo$_{2-c}$Ni (c = 1.2, 1.5 and 1.7) HEAs. A fully eutectic structure is obtained in the CoCrCu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.2}$Mo$_{0.8}$Ni alloy (referred to as Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.2}$Mo$_{0.8}$). As shown in Table 2, the composition of the eutectic region is approximately (CrMo)$_{51}$ (CoCuFeNi)$_{49}$. Similar to the Co$_{1.5}$Cu$_{0.1}$Mo$_{0.5}$ and Co$_{1.7}$Cu$_{0.1}$Mo$_{0.3}$ alloys, the microstructures of the CoCrCu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.5}$Mo$_{0.5}$Ni (referred to as Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.5}$Mo$_{0.5}$) and CoCrCu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.7}$Mo$_{0.3}$Ni (referred to as Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.7}$Mo$_{0.3}$) alloys comprise dendritic and inter-dendritic regions. The volume fraction of the inter-dendritic eutectic region decreases dramatically with increasing Fe and decreasing Mo contents. The dendrites (region A) of the Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.5}$Mo$_{0.5}$ alloy is enriched in Co, Cu, Fe, and Ni; the content of Cr and Mo is higher in the inter-dendritic regions B and C. Region A of the Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.7}$Mo$_{0.3}$ alloy is enriched in Mo; the content of Cu, Co, and Fe is higher in region B; and the contents of Cr and Ni are almost the same.

The XRD patterns of the CoCrCu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{c}$Mo$_{2-c}$Ni (c = 1.2, 1.5, 1.7) HEAs are shown in Figure 3d. FCC, μ (Fe$_5$Mo$_3$), and Laves phases are found in these alloys. The μ phase is trigonal (a = 0.7381 nm, c = 18.504 nm) and the Laves phase is HCP with a = 0.473 nm and c = 0.772 nm. Based on the intensities of the diffraction peaks, decreased Mo and increased Fe contents yield decreases in the volume fractions of the μ and Laves phases and increases in that of the FCC phase. For the Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.2}$Mo$_{0.8}$ alloy, the FCC, μ, and Laves phases form a eutectic structure. For the Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.5}$Mo$_{0.5}$
alloy, region A is FCC, region B should be the $\mu$ ($\text{Fe}_7\text{Mo}_3$) phase, and region C is probably FCC. For the $\text{Cu}_{0.1}\text{Fe}_{1.7}\text{Mo}_{0.3}$ alloy, both region A and B are FCC structures with different contents.

Figure 3. Micrographs and XRD patterns of CoCrCu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{c}$Mo$_{2-c}$Ni HEAs: (a) Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.2}$Mo$_{0.8}$; (b) Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.5}$Mo$_{0.5}$; (c) Cu$_{0.1}$Fe$_{1.7}$Mo$_{0.3}$; (d) XRD patterns.

3.4. CoCrCu$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{2-d}$Ni$_d$ Alloys

A similar microstructure, consisting of a dendritic matrix and inter-dendritic regions, is found in CoCrCu$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{2-d}$Ni$_d$ ($d = 1.2, 1.5$ and $1.7$) HEAs, as shown in Figure 4. For the Cu$_{0.1}$Mo$_{0.8}$Ni$_{1.2}$ alloy, the dendrites are enriched in Co, Cu, Fe, and Ni (Region A in Figure 4a), while the inter-dendritic region (B) is enriched with Cr and Mo. The composition of the eutectic region is found to be approximately (CrMo)$_{54}$(CoCuFeNi)$_{46}$, as shown in Table 2. For the Cu$_{0.1}$Mo$_{0.5}$Ni$_{1.5}$ alloy, region A is enriched in Cu and Mo, region B has a higher content of Cr, Co, Fe, and Ni, and region C is enriched with Cr and Mo. Many flower-like structures with four petals (labeled C) are observed in the Cu$_{0.1}$Mo$_{0.3}$Ni$_{1.7}$ alloy; these structures are enriched with Cr.

The XRD results demonstrate that the alloys contain a trigonal $\mu$ phase ($a = 0.7381$ nm, $c = 18.504$ nm), FCC phase, and a small amount of an HCP Laves phase ($a = 0.473$ nm, $c = 0.772$ nm), as can be seen in Figure 4d. When the molar ratio of Ni is increased to 1.7, only the FCC phase is found in the solidified microstructure. Thus, it is demonstrated that Ni promotes the formation of the FCC phase. For the Cu$_{0.1}$Mo$_{0.8}$Ni$_{1.2}$ alloy, FCC is the dendritic phase, while the $\mu$ and Laves phases form a eutectic structure. For the Cu$_{0.1}$Mo$_{0.5}$Ni$_{1.5}$ alloy, both regions A and B are FCC structures, and region C should be the $\mu$ phase. For the Cu$_{0.1}$Mo$_{0.3}$Ni$_{1.7}$ alloy, both regions A and B are FCC structures with different contents, while region C is an unknown Cr-rich phase that cannot be detected because of its small amount.
4. Discussion

Two eutectic phases are found in the Cr_{1.5}Cu_{0.1}Mo_{0.5} and Cu_{0.1}Fe_{1.2}Mo_{0.8} HEAs, with probable eutectic compositions of (CrMo)_{51–54}(CoCuFeNi)_{46–49}. Similarly, fully eutectic structures have been obtained in CoFeNi_{x}VMo_{y} HEAs at both CoFeNi_{1.4}VMo and CoFeNiVMo_{0.6} [14]. Recently, Lu et al. [34] have proposed a strategy to design eutectic high-entropy alloys (EHEAs) based on ∆H_{mix}. They selected Zr, Nb, Hf, and Ta to replace Al in a previous AlCoCrFeNi_{2.1} EHEA, based on the relationship of ∆H_{mix} for various atomic pairs. Unfortunately, no regularities have yet been found in the current HEA system. Further research is ongoing to clarify this relationship in the future.

The phase selection mechanism in the CoCrCu_{0.1}FeMoNi-based HEAs can be understood using the parameters listed in Table 3. Based on alloy composition, a simple FCC structure is obtained only when the CoCrCu_{0.1}FeMoNi-based HEAs contain higher contents of principal elements, such as Fe/Co/Ni. This suggests that Fe, Co, and Ni are FCC stabilizers in the CoCrCu_{0.1}FeMoNi-based alloys. It can be found that a simple FCC structure is favorable for alloys with the smallest ∆δ, ∆X, and ∆S. Conversely, alloys with large VEC values favor the formation of simple FCC structures, while TCP phases develop in alloys with smaller VEC values. TCP phases are found when the ∆H of the alloys is largely negative, with the exception of Cu_{0.1}Mo_{0.3}Ni_{1.7}. Furthermore, alloys with small α_{2} favor the formation of a single-phase FCC structure. In the current work, the FCC structure is stable when ∆δ ≤ 2.8, FCC+BCC is favored when 4.1 ≤ δ ≤ 4.3, and FCC or/and BCC + IM is found when 2.8 ≤ δ < 4.1 or δ > 4.3, with the only exception of AlCoCrCuFeNiMo_{0.2}. As shown in Figure 5c, the FCC structure is stable when VEC ≥ 8.27, but there is an overlap between the mixture types of FCC+BCC and FCC or/and BCC + IM. The IM phase is favored when ∆X > 0.133 only with the exceptions of the CoCrCu_{0.1}FeMoNi and CoCrCu_{0.3}FeMoNi alloys.
The results are well fitted with the criterion proposed by Lu et al. As shown in Figure 5b, the FCC structure is stable when $\Delta S \leq 13.037$ and $\alpha_2 \leq 0.0051$; however, the (FCC+BCC)-type phase-forming $\Delta S$ and $\alpha_2$ ranges show overlaps with those of the (FCC or/and BCC + IM)-type. All the calculated values of $\Delta H$ are in the range $-15 \leq \Delta H_{\text{mix}} \leq 5$ kJ/mol (Figure 5a), and except for FCC and BCC, IM phases are still found, indicating that the phase structures of the listed alloys cannot be distinguished by $\Delta H$.

Singh demonstrated that a simple solid solution as obtained when $\Delta S_{\text{mix}}/\delta^2 > 0.96$, IM compounds when $\Delta S_{\text{mix}}/\delta^2 < 0.24$, and a mixture thereof when $0.24 < \Delta S_{\text{mix}}/\delta^2 < 0.96$ [36]. As can be seen in Figure 5e, a large $\Delta S/\delta^2$ value favors the formation of a single FCC phase. As the value of $\Delta S/\delta^2$ decreases, more phases appear, and smaller $\Delta S/\delta^2$ values favor the BCC phase. For CoCrCu$_{0.1}$FeMoNi-based alloys, the simple FCC phase structure is favored when $\Delta S/\delta^2 > 1.7$, while multiphase structures containing (FCC or/and BCC + IM) are found when $0.549 \leq \Delta S/\delta^2 \leq 1.28$, and the (FCC+BCC)-type phase-forming $\Delta S/\delta^2$ range shows an overlap with that of the (FCC or/and BCC + IM)-type. The former famous criterion for phase-forming in HEAs cannot be used effectively in this system. Thus, new rules or parameters must be considered in the future.

Table 3. Phases and parameters of CoCrCu$_{0.1}$FeMoNi-based HEAs.

| Alloy | $\delta$ (%) | VEC | $\Delta X$ (%) | $\Delta H$ (kJ·mol$^{-1}$) | $\Delta S$ (J·K$^{-1}$·mol$^{-1}$) | $\alpha_2$ | $\Delta S/\delta^2$ | Phases Ref. |
|-------|-------------|-----|---------------|-----------------|------------------|-------|-----------------|-------------|
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 3.912 | 7.977 | 0.150 | -0.678 | 13.853 | 0.0089 | 0.9052 | FCC + $\sigma + \mu$ |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 3.291 | 8.154 | 0.132 | -0.807 | 13.492 | 0.0070 | 1.2457 | FCC + $\sigma + \mu$ |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 3.707 | 8.271 | 0.118 | -0.740 | 13.037 | 0.0051 | 1.7647 | FCC |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 3.882 | 7.660 | 0.156 | -0.897 | 13.853 | 0.0097 | 0.9192 | FCC + BCC + Laves |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 3.247 | 7.860 | 0.145 | -0.882 | 13.492 | 0.0069 | 1.2797 | FCC + BCC + $\sigma$ + Laves |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 3.900 | 7.938 | 0.150 | -0.847 | 13.853 | 0.0097 | 0.9108 | FCC + Laves + FeMo$_3$ |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 3.260 | 8.056 | 0.132 | -0.745 | 13.492 | 0.0069 | 1.2695 | FCC + Laves |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 2.669 | 8.314 | 0.117 | -0.670 | 13.037 | 0.0045 | 1.8301 | FCC |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 3.933 | 8.016 | 0.150 | -0.923 | 13.853 | 0.0089 | 0.8956 | FCC + Laves + FeMo$_3$ |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 3.339 | 8.252 | 0.133 | -0.907 | 13.492 | 0.0070 | 1.2102 | FCC + Laves |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 2.768 | 8.408 | 0.119 | -0.869 | 13.037 | 0.0051 | 1.7016 | FCC |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 4.35 | 7.80 | 0.159 | -1.116 | 14.45 | 0.0037 | 0.7636 | FCC + Laves [35] |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 4.48 | 7.74 | 0.158 | -1.322 | 14.73 | 0.0045 | 0.7339 | FCC + BCC + Laves + $\sigma$ [35] |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 4.61 | 7.68 | 0.157 | -1.523 | 14.91 | 0.0041 | 0.7016 | FCC + BCC + Laves + $\sigma$ [35] |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 4.85 | 7.57 | 0.151 | -1.915 | 15.05 | 0.0049 | 0.6989 | FCC + BCC + Laves + $\sigma$ [35] |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 5.18 | 7.39 | 0.136 | -2.474 | 14.73 | 0.0041 | 0.5490 | FCC + BCC + $\sigma$ [35] |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 5.08 | 7.77 | 0.133 | -4.47 | 15.6 | 0.00125 | 0.6045 | FCC + BCC [16] |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 5.15 | 7.72 | 0.145 | -4.2 | 15.91 | 0.00275 | 0.5969 | BCC + $\alpha$ [16] |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 5.21 | 7.67 | 0.154 | -3.95 | 16.08 | 0.00144 | 0.9924 | BCC + $\alpha$ [16] |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 5.26 | 7.62 | 0.162 | -3.72 | 16.16 | 0.00131 | 0.5841 | BCC + $\alpha$ [16] |
| Al$_{0.1}$CoCr$_{0.9}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 5.29 | 7.57 | 0.168 | -3.51 | 16.18 | 0.00130 | 0.5782 | BCC + $\alpha$ [16] |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 4.70 | 7.64 | 0.185 | -4.61 | 13.14 | 0.0092 | 0.9048 | FCC + BCC + $\mu$ [13] |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 4.68 | 7.63 | 0.189 | -4.52 | 13.44 | 0.0091 | 0.6136 | FCC + BCC + $\mu$ [13] |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 4.64 | 7.60 | 0.197 | -4.29 | 13.90 | 0.0091 | 0.6456 | FCC + BCC + $\mu$ [13] |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 4.216 | 7.86 | 0.159 | -3.63 | 13.92 | 0.0097 | 0.7051 | FCC + BCC [33] |
| Co$_{0.9}$Cr$_{0.1}$FeMo$_{0.3}$Ni | 4.181 | 7.98 | 0.157 | -1.83 | 14.44 | 0.0096 | 0.8260 | FCC + BCC [33] |

Figure 5. Cont.
Materials 2018, 11, 1290

5. Conclusions

Eutectic or dendritic microstructures were observed in as-solidified CoCrCu_{0.1}FeMoNi-based HEAs. A fully eutectic microstructure was found in CoCr_{1.5}Cu_{0.1}FeMo_{0.5}Ni and CoCrCu_{0.1}Fe_{1.2}Mo_{0.8}Ni alloys. TCP phases were detected in most of the CoCrCu_{0.1}FeMoNi-based HEAs except for the Co_{1.7}CrCu_{0.1}FeMo_{0.3}Ni, CoCrCu_{0.1}Fe_{1.7}Mo_{0.3}Ni, and CoCrCu_{0.1}Fe_{0.3}Ni_{1.7} alloys. A simple FCC single-phase solid solution was obtained when the molar ratio of Fe, Co, and Ni was increased to 1.7 at the expense of Mo. This indicated that Fe, Co, and Ni are FCC stabilizers in the CoCrCu_{0.1}FeMoNi-based alloy system.

Moreover, a simple FCC structure was found in the alloys with the smallest δ, ΔX, and ΔS values. Conversely, alloys with higher VEC were simple FCC structures, while TCP phases appeared to develop in alloys with decreased VEC. TCP phases were found with large negative ΔH values, with the exception of the Cu_{0.1}Mo_{0.3}Ni_{0.7} alloy. Furthermore, the value of α_{2} is smaller when a simple FCC structure is obtained.

For CoCrCu_{0.1}FeMoNi-based alloys, the FCC structure was stable when δ ≤ 2.8, VEC ≥ 8.27, ΔS ≤ 13.037, α_{2} ≤ 0.0051, and ΔS/δ^{2} > 1.7; the mixture of FCC+BCC is favored when 4.1 ≤ δ ≤ 4.3 while the (FCC or/and BCC + IM) mixture is found when 2.8 ≤ δ ≤ 4.1 or δ > 4.3. IM phases are favored when ΔX > 0.133. However, some overlap remained in parameters including VEC, ΔS, α_{2}, and ΔS/δ^{2}. This indicated that these parameters are not sufficient to distinguish (FCC or/and BCC + IM) from (FCC+BCC) phase formation behaviors, and new rules or parameters must be considered for the described system. Moreover, ΔH could not predict phase structures in the current work. In summary, the phase selection behaviors in CoCrCu_{0.1}FeMoNi-based HEAs can be well delineated by δ and ΔX.

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, N.L.; Methodology, C.C. and P.Z.; Software, C.C. and X.W.; Validation, N.L., C.C., I.C., P.Z. and X.W.; Formal Analysis, X.W.; Investigation, N.L. and C.C.; Resources, N.L.; Data Curation, C.C.; Writing-Original Draft Preparation, N.L. and C.C.; Writing-Review & Editing, I.C.; Project Administration, N.L.; Funding Acquisition, N.L.

Funding: This research was funded by the National Natural Science Foundation of China grant number [51201072, 51471079] and the Graduate Student Innovation Projects of Jiangsu Province (KYCX18-2318).

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.
References

1. Cantor, B.; Chang, I.T.H.; Knight, P.; Vincent, A.J.B. Microstructure development in equiatomic multicomponent alloys. Mater. Sci. Eng. A 2004, 375, 213–218. [CrossRef]

2. Miracle, D.B.; Senkov, O.N. A critical review of high entropy alloys and related concepts. Acta Mater. 2017, 122, 488–511. [CrossRef]

3. Gorsse, S.; Miracle, D.B.; Senkov, O.N. Mapping the world of complex concentrated alloys. Acta Mater. 2017, 135, 177–187. [CrossRef]

4. Senkov, O.N.; Rao, S.; Chaput, K.J.; Woodward, C. Compositional effect on microstructure and properties of NbTiZr-based complex concentrated alloys. Acta Mater. 2017, 122, 488–511. [CrossRef]

5. Yurchenko, N.Y.; Stepanov, N.D.; Zherebtsov, S.V.; Tikhonovsky, M.A.; Salishchev, G.A. Structure and mechanical properties of B2 ordered refractory AlNbTiVZr\(_x\) (\(x = 0–1.5\)) high-entropy alloys. Mater. Sci. Eng. A 2017, 704, 82–90. [CrossRef]

6. Stepanov, N.D.; Shaysultanov, D.G.; Chernichenko, R.S.; Ikornikov, D.M.; Zherebtsov, S.V. Effect of Cr and Zr on phase stability of refractory Al-Cr-Nb-Ti-V-Zr high-entropy alloys. J. Alloys Compd. 2018, 757, 403–414. [CrossRef]

7. Yurchenko, N.Y.; Stepanov, N.D.; Zherebtsov, S.V.; Tikhonovsky, M.A.; Salishchev, G.A. Structure and mechanical properties of a new high entropy alloy with a duplex ultra-fine grained structure. Mater. Sci. Eng. A 2018, 728, 82–90. [CrossRef]

8. Wang, Z.J.; Guo, S.; Liu, C.T. Phase Selection in High-Entropy Alloys: From Nonequilibrium to Equilibrium. JOM 2014, 66, 1966–1972. [CrossRef]

9. Lu, Z.P.; Wang, H.; Chen, M.W.; Baker, I.; Yeh, J.W.; Liu, C.T.; Nieh, T.G. An assessment on the future development of high-entropy alloys: Summary from a recent workshop. Intermetallics 2015, 66, 67–76. [CrossRef]

10. Lu, Y.; Dong, Y.; Guo, S.; Jiang, L.; Kang, H.; Wang, T.; Wen, B.; Wang, Z.; Jie, J.; Cao, Z.; et al. A promising new class of high-entropy alloys: Eutectic high-entropy alloys. Sci. Rep. 2014, 4, 6200. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

11. Guo, S.; Ng, C.; Liu, C.T. Anomalous solidification microstructures in Co-free Al\(_x\)CrCuFeNi\(_2\) High-Entropy Alloys. J. Alloys Compd. 2013, 557, 77–81. [CrossRef]

12. Liu, N.; Wu, P.H.; Peng, Z.; Xiang, H.F.; Chen, C.; Wang, X.J.; Zhang, J. Microstructure, phase stability and properties of CoCr\(_{0.5}\)Cu\(_{0.5}\)Fe\(_{0.5}\)Mo\(_{0.5}\)Ni compositionally complex alloys. Mater. Sci. Technol. 2017, 133, 210–214. [CrossRef]

13. Wu, P.H.; Peng, Z.; Liu, N.; Niu, M.; Zhu, Z.X.; Wang, X.J. The Effect of Mn Content on the Microstructure and Properties of CoCrCu\(_{0.1}\)Fe\(_{0.5}\)Mo\(_{1.5}\)Ni near Equiatomic Alloys. Mater. Trans. 2016, 57, 5–8. [CrossRef]

14. Jiang, L.; Cao, Z.Q.; Jie, J.C.; Zhang, J.J.; Lu, Y.P.; Wang, T.M.; Li, T.J. Effect of Mo and Ni elements on microstructure evolution and mechanism properties of the CoFeNi\(_{0.5}\)VMo\(_{0.5}\) high entropy alloys. J. Alloys Compd. 2015, 649, 585–590. [CrossRef]

15. He, F.; Wang, Z.J.; Cheng, P.; Wang, Q.; Li, J.J.; Dang, Y.Y.; Wang, J.C.; Liu, C.T. Designing eutectic high entropy alloys of CoCrFeNiNb\(_{x}\). J. Alloys Compd. 2015, 656, 284–289. [CrossRef]

16. Zhu, J.M.; Zhang, H.F.; Fu, H.M.; Wang, A.M.; Li, H.; Hu, Z.Q. Microstructures and compressive properties of multicomponent AlCoCrFeNi\(_x\) alloys. Mater. Sci. Eng. A 2010, 527, 6975–6979. [CrossRef]

17. Zhu, J.M.; Fu, H.M.; Zhang, H.F.; Wang, A.M.; Li, H.; Hu, Z.Q. Microstructures and compressive properties of multicomponent AlCoCrCuFeNi\(_x\) alloys. J. Alloys Compd. 2010, 497, 52–56. [CrossRef]

18. He, F.; Wang, Z.J.; Zhu, M.; Li, J.J.; Dang, Y.Y.; Wang, J.C. The phase stability of Ni\(_2\)CrFeMo\(_x\) multi-principal-component alloys with medium configurational entropy. Mater. Des. 2015, 85, 1–6. [CrossRef]

19. Hsu, C.Y.; Juan, C.C.; Wang, W.R.; Sheu, T.S.; Chen, S.K.; Yeh, J.W. On the superior hot hardness and softening resistance of AlCoCrFeMo\(_{0.5}\)Ni high-entropy alloys. Mater. Sci. Eng. A 2011, 528, 3581–3588. [CrossRef]

20. Hsu, C.Y.; Sheu, T.S.; Wang, W.R.; Tang, W.Y.; Chen, S.K.; Yeh, J.W. Microstructure and Mechanical Properties of New AlCoCrFeMo\(_{0.5}\)Ni High-Entropy Alloys. Adv. Eng. Mater. 2010, 12, 44–49. [CrossRef]

21. Liu, W.H.; Lu, Z.P.; He, J.Y.; Luan, J.H.; Wang, Z.J.; Liu, B.; Liu, Y.; Chen, M.W.; Liu, C.T. Ductile CoCrFeNi\(_x\) high entropy alloys strengthened by hard intermetallic phases. Acta Mater. 2016, 116, 332–342. [CrossRef]

22. Li, X.C.; Dou, D.; Zheng, Z.Y.; Li, J.C. Microstructure and Properties of FeAlCrNiMo\(_x\) High-Entropy Alloys. J. Mater. Eng. Perform. 2016, 25, 2164–2169. [CrossRef]
23. Tian, L.H.; Xiong, W.; Liu, C.; Lu, S.; Fu, M. Microstructure and wear behavior of atmospheric plasma-sprayed AlCoCrFeNiTi high-entropy alloy coating. J. Mater. Eng. Perform. 2016, 25, 5513–5521. [CrossRef]
24. Zhang, Y.; Zhou, Y.J.; Lin, J.P.; Chen, G.L.; Liaw, P.K. Solid-solution phase formation rules for multi-component alloys. Adv. Eng. Mater. 2008, 10, 534–538. [CrossRef]
25. Guo, S.; Liu, C.T. Phase stability in high entropy alloys: Formation of solid-solution phase or amorphous phase. Prog. Nat. Sci. 2011, 21, 433–446. [CrossRef]
26. Zhang, Y.; Yang, X.; Liaw, P.K. Alloy Design and Properties Optimization of High-Entropy Alloys. JOM 2012, 64, 830–838. [CrossRef]
27. Yang, X.; Zhang, Y. Prediction of high-entropy stabilized solid-solution in multicomponent alloys. Mater. Chem. Phys. 2012, 132, 233–238. [CrossRef]
28. Yang, X.; Chen, S.Y.; Cotton, J.D.; Zhang, Y. Phase stability of low-density, multiprincipal component alloys containing aluminum, magnesium, and lithium. JOM 2014, 10, 2009–2020. [CrossRef]
29. Wang, Z.J.; Huang, Y.H.; Yang, Y.; Wang, J.C.; Liu, C.T. Atomic-size effect and solid solubility of multicomponent alloys. Scr. Mater. 2015, 94, 28–31. [CrossRef]
30. Tsai, M.H.; Tsai, K.Y.; Tsai, C.W.; Lee, C.; Juan, C.C.; Yeh, J.W. Criterion for sigma phase formation in Cr- and V-containing high-entropy alloys. Mater. Res. Lett. 2013, 1, 207–212. [CrossRef]
31. Dong, Y.; Lu, Y.; Jiang, L.; Wang, T.; Li, T. Effect of electro-negativity on the stability of topologically close-packed phase in high entropy alloys. Intermetallics 2014, 52, 105–109. [CrossRef]
32. Wang, Z.J.; Qiu, W.F.; Yang, Y.; Liu, C.T. Atomic-size and lattice-distortion effects in newly developed high-entropy alloys with multiple principal elements. Intermetallics 2015, 64, 63–69. [CrossRef]
33. Wu, P.H.; Liu, N.; Yang, W.; Zhu, Z.X.; Lu, Y.P.; Wang, X.J. Microstructure and Solidification Behavior of Multi-component CoCrCu$_x$FeMoNi High-entropy alloys. Mater. Sci. Eng. A 2015, 642, 142–149. [CrossRef]
34. Lu, Y.; Jiang, H.; Guo, S.; Wang, T.; Cao, Z.; Li, T. A new strategy to design eutectic high-entropy alloys using mixing enthalpy. Intermetallics 2017, 9, 124–128. [CrossRef]
35. Wu, P.H. Microstructure and Solidification Behavior of Multi-Component CoCrCu$_x$FeMoNi High-Entropy Alloys. Master’s Thesis, Jiangsu University of Science and Technology, Zhenjiang, China, 15 June 2016.
36. Singh, A.K.; Kumar, N.; Dwivedi, A.; Subramaniam, A. A geometrical parameter for the formation of disordered solid solutions in multi-component alloys. Intermetallics 2014, 52, 105–109. [CrossRef]

© 2018 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).