Women's Leadership as Top Management in Educational Institution: Society Construction and Cultural Dilemma

Siti Nurbayani, Siti Komariah, S. Nurohim, D. Nurhizkhy
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia
Bandung, Indonesia
s.nurbayani@upi.edu

Abstract—The leadership of a woman in a top management position in educational institution is still in a small number, what causes the number of women in top management positions is low. This research tries to explain how society and culture constructions affect women to be in top management position in educational institution. The study was conducted in a public university in Bandung with 17 informants as academic and non-academic structural officers and subordinates from female leaders. The data were collected by observation, interview, and literature study, using qualitative descriptive analytical approach. The results of this study indicate that there is lack of trust in the woman’s leadership due to the construction of society and culture that form the assumption that a leader must be man. Therefore, it reduces competition and the desire of women to compete, and emerging their weaknesses by not daring to take risks over the opportunity.

Keywords—gender, leadership; education

I. INTRODUCTION

The social construction of Indonesian society places women in a lower position than men in all aspects of life including in social, cultural, political, economic and scientific life. Such circumstances provide a very visible limit on the things women do as well as rights that women get in life in society. One is defined as gender stereotypes forming by the prevailing socio-cultural expectations; the other is prejudice; it is common think that the masculine generally considered superior than femininity. Therefore, stereotypes testify individuals’ orientation and past experiences, which could manifest positively or negatively as individuals interact with others within and outside their immediate environment [1].

Several years ago, successful leaders have been connected with stereotypical masculine assigns such as readiness to take risks, task orientation and competitiveness. Latest studies, even so, show that high level executives and female middle no longer compare successful leadership with these masculine characteristics. The experience of the female managers shows that there are no differences in leadership efficiency and ability from their experienced male counterparts. The difference existed only in female-dominated industries where women were found to be more interpersonally oriented than men [2,3].

The gender system is closely related to hierarchy and leadership because in gender stereotypes there is a belief that the status and competence of men is superior to women. By a similar logic, the differing distributions of women and men into the roles of homemaker and employee may account for the stereotypic beliefs that women are communal and men are agentic [4]. Gender differences begins with attention to organizational efficiency and are oriented towards the applicability and relevance of practitioners and a leader might be evaluated more positively or negatively because of characteristics peripheral to his or portrayed leadership style [5,6]. The representation of women in leadership positions has created a gender gap that exists not only in education but also in many areas of the workplace. Society has established that only men are good leaders. Therefore, it continues to deny simple access for women who seek a leadership role because they are not in accordance with the norm. Women who seek leadership positions face obstacles and repeatedly give up because they feel overwhelmed to face the clear obstacles [7].

The fact that gender plays a significant role in attaining a leadership position within a corporation does not appear to be limited to a specific country or culture. The lack of significant proportions of women in leadership and senior management positions in almost every organization, irrespective of whether in the commercial industrial, military, or public sector appears to be a worldwide phenomenon and although women have made advances in the academy, they have not climbed career ladders with the same speed or ease as their male counterparts [8].

Any organization is influenced by two types of culture, the internal culture that spreads among its employees which covers the psychology, attitudes, experiences, beliefs and values, and the external culture which represents forces coming from outside the organization, although out of its control, it may nonetheless affect organizational performance. Organizational and social culture are thus the two main forms of culture which have been identified as factors that determine the success rate of leadership in an organization [9].

Ability in work and the ratio of the number of women to men is not much different in university. It should be directly proportional to the number of female leaders who can occupy
and be positioned as a leader in academic and non-academic structural positions. In the academic community of university, leaders are still dominated by men, although the academic ability of women and men has no difference [7].

The dilemma faced by women when they are given the opportunity in leadership positions is not about women's ability to be a leader but rather to the position of women who often prefer in safe zones, preferring to take care of the household affairs that are the responsibility of a woman. In addition, in the women's point of view when comparing men and women as leaders, women generally do not support women as leaders [7]. This means that support from fellow women is not necessarily obtained for women trying to get out of their domestic zones. The dilemma women face in straddling the two worlds of work and home for achieving success in leadership positions is to be given a thought and better understood [10].

Women's leadership is a problem of women that must be solved by the women themselves. The tendency of the general public increasingly gives a positive picture of women's leadership. In his view Sjahrrí reveals that "the role of women will be increasingly prominent and needed either as important human resources, thinkers as well as decision makers". Given the significant differences about women's roles and leadership, researchers are interested in researching women's leadership within the academic community of university.

Given the significant differences about women's roles and leadership, researchers are interested to examine women's leadership within the academic community in educational institution and see how the description of the issue of women's leadership in educational institution.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

In this study, the authors present several other studies that have been conducted by previous researchers in relation to women's leadership. The first study Ridgeway [4], Glass and Cook [11] tries to answer the question of how gender credentials create networks that inhibit expectations and interpersonal reactions that are the main causes of glass ceiling. They argue that beliefs about the status of eligibility and competence of male status are more a component of the gender system very dangerous, as they instill an important hierarchical element into the basic cultural conception of who the men and women are. Belief in gender status binds men or women to hierarchy, women's efforts to achieve leadership and high levels of authority are the basic battleground for the maintenance or change of the gender system.

A second study Dunn and Gerlach [6], Ballenger and Austin [12] examines the lack of access to higher education leadership for women. The results of the study suggest that cultural and structural conditions and practices that lead to women's position in achieving leadership positions are lack of mentoring, and gender inequality. Affirmative action and diversity initiatives are seen as cultural and structural opportunities for women who aspire to leadership positions. Another result suggests that law enforcement and university awareness of the importance of diverse workforce has helped advance its progress from faculty members to administrators.

The third [5] on how women lead and on issues of leadership and gender in business and education. Research shows that the ideal view of educational leaders, regardless of the call for leaders that shapes the culture, structure, and fundamental goals of educational organizations, stereotypes about leadership need to be challenged and addressed before an educational training program designed to promote women to the top will succeed. Gender differences appear to be guided by attention to organizational efficiency and are oriented towards the applicability and relevance of Practitioners. In this mindset, anyone with a more feminine approach is likely to be harmed, where judgment can be influenced by gender and not by fact.

The fourth study Cook and Glass [13] stated that women's leadership in a male-dominated organization experiences higher levels of visibility and performance pressure, social and professional rights, reduce organizational support, information and assistance from colleagues and superiors. These pressures result in female leaders often experiencing a decrease in performance and job satisfaction that lead to shorter term of office. The pressure that women experience in their leadership in top management can be one cause women rarely take the opportunity to compete with men to be in top management.

The fifth study Johns [14] states that gender stereotypes and gender communication differences create a dilemma for women as well. Gender typecasts create double bonds in which women can be penalized for displaying decisiveness, competitiveness, and too little or too much freedom.45 For example, women's typical communication styles are warmer, less geared, and lighter than men's. This style of communication can degrade the perception of a woman's ability. However, if a woman shows too much firmness, as opposed to stereotypes, her influence and her inability can be lowered.

The sixth study Malilah [15] and Wulandari et al. [16] states that There are several factors shaping the ways people view men and women, such as sexual relation, stereotypes of roles, education of roles, and division of domestic and public domains for the two sexes. However, it is too simplifying to think that the factors are constructed similarly across different societies and cultures. Cultures, belief systems, and social patterns form social concepts and practices in the realities of each society.

III. METHOD

This research is a qualitative research with descriptive method. Qualitative approach is chosen based on the problems studied. This study attempts to answer the question of why women's leadership in top management is low? Judging from the construction of society and culture formed.

The study was conducted at educational institution in Bandung. Participants in the study were 17 people, ten women as academic and non-academic structural officials, one male as a non-academic structural official and six as subordinates of female leaders. The parties are considered to have the information needed by researchers to uncover the problems that have been formulated.
Determination of the participants based on the positions held, ten participants were a female leader at the educational institution in Bandung and one man who served as a leader, and to complete the data the researchers added six participants as subordinates of female leaders.

Selection of research participants using purposive sampling and snowball sampling technique. The results of this study were obtained through observation data collection techniques, in-depth interviews and documentation studies. data processing in this research using phenomenology design. Through phenomenological design the researcher can look closely at the individual's interpretation of his experiences and try to understand the feeding of an experience from the participant's perspective, how a woman can become a leader in top management.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Results

This section of the results presents the results of research on women's leadership as top management seen from society construction and cultural dilemmas. The phenomenon of female leadership in top management at the university will be influenced by the construction of society which certainly affects the construction of academics on how to accept women as leaders. These community constructions consist of a general view of women's leadership, women's position in leadership, general socialization and women's nomination. The construction of these communities leads to a cultural dilemma in women to become leaders in top management.

1) General views: The phenomenon of women's leadership at the educational institution will certainly be influenced by the construction of the academic community about how women's acceptance as a leader. Such social constructions consist of the general view of women's leadership, the superiority of women's leadership, the lack of women's leadership, the position of women in leadership, differences in women's and men's leadership, general socialization, women's nomination and leadership elections. This is realized by the academic community of the University of Education Indonesia as an acceptable and understood in the leadership of women. Here will be the researchers describe based on the results of interviews that have been done.

Based on research, what most informants realize is that women's leadership in the academic community is still minimal, not many women are advancing to become leaders. Women do not want to show their abilities too much, in contrast to men who have a more aggressive nature compared with women. Not only women's efforts to be leaders that make women's opportunities are slightly neglected and not optimized well. Greatest achievement of women's leadership in the academic community of the Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia so far is as the vice rector. Least of women who lead are the result of women not taking the available opportunities.

The results say that a small percentage of women will take the opportunity to lead if no man is capable to advance the institution. When no more men are able to be given the responsibility to advance the institution, then women will go ahead even if they have to risk that it will find opposition from some who still believe that men should be leaders. It shows that women have the same abilities as men, but there is a cultural dilemma, whose status as women in society and religion is not appropriate to be a leader, especially in top management.

2) Women's position in leadership: The findings in this study suggest that women deserve to be leaders because the roles and positions of women within the academic community are considered the same because they are determined in accordance with the procedures. As leaders, women are considered important in an institution. The main problem of women's position within the academic community is the impact of women's attitude that doesn't take the opportunity. Some informants stated that women's positions in limited communities such as education and women's organizations are still considered appropriate. However, if the scope of such a wide-ranging society, it is perceived as less appropriate even if the opportunity is quite open.

3) Socialists in general: In general, about the identical nature of women such as; emotional, sensitive, maternal, full of empathy, always structured and chronological at work, is the nature of women that has become a common view of society. Nevertheless, not all good women leaders generalize the identical traits of women into one idea/ stereotype. Physically, women and men are not alike; the physical differences of men and women bring different social benefits and cultural benefits only to the extent that we can recognize that with such physical existence. It does not actually mean social benefits in other physical forms cannot be done by different physical forms.

The society's construction of women has two views. First, the nature of women as innate from themselves then a society identifies such traits as a general view and constructs each woman as a cycle. Second, the nature of women is an internalization of the accepted, understood and believed.

B. Discussion

Women's leadership as top management can be seen from the society construction and cultural dilemmas that occur in women. Society construction and cultural dilemmas experienced by women in the academic community of university is one of the causes of the lack of women in top management positions. As noted in the journal Dunn and Gerlach [6] that "the lack of representation of women in senior administrative positions within the academic community will result in the wasting of administrative talents in higher education when faced with serious challenges, which will be resolved with strong and effective leadership." In other words, women are deemed less able to deal with the big problems there while leading.

Social conditions are the most influential in the development process and the movement of women leadership, especially in top management. The society construction of women's inability to lead compared to men has been inherent in the psyche of society. The division of rights and obligations of women and men is also the result of deeply rooted cultural values in society. Despite women having the same level of education and stratum, men are more aggressive than women.
who tend to be more passive and calm. This is due to the beliefs that exist in a society that places men as responsible to the family, the motivation that drives men to be courageous and ambitious in pursuing a career.

The construction of society and the culture formed is reinforced by religion, which places women as wives and mothers who are responsible to the family, this creates a cultural dilemma for women in taking the opportunity to occupy positions in top management. Women's leadership is often hampered by religious principles, which are often used as reasons by the community in determining who will be the leader, women are often hindered because some people trust men to be leaders based on public trust in their beliefs. The religious/ideological understanding that women's obligations as wives and mothers has made women bear a double burden, the responsibility to families makes women's time more limited, giving birth to the notion that Leadership is more suitable to be occupied by men and women as followers.

The cultural dilemma for women between taking the opportunity in top management to stay in middle management occurs because of the mindset formed from the construction of society, that the main task of a woman is domestic, namely as wife and mother. So if it remains in the middle management of a woman can still perform his duties as a wife and mother as well as a career, so as not to feel out of the values prevailing in society. In addition, the attitude of some women will take the opportunity to occupy a position when there is no man/person who is able to lead and able to advance the institution. Who reported that men and women did not differ in their interpersonal orientation in industries that were male dominated. The difference existed only in female-dominated industries where women were found to be more interpersonally oriented than men [3].

Equal opportunities between women and men in rights and obligations have been given by the academic community, it's just that sometimes women do not take advantage of the opportunities with consideration. Even if women take the decision to use the opportunity to advance into top management, which often arises is the issue of gender, such as community construction that views that the role and position of women is not worth to lead, women's psychic ability that cannot be given pressure or excessive workload when compared with men. It is precisely this that is likely to be one of the reasons women are not interested in taking the opportunity that has been given by the academic community.

V. CONCLUSION

Inherent community construction considers the status and role of women who are unfit to be a leader and reinforced by religious beliefs that place women in the domestic sphere, where the task of women is to be a wife and mother in charge of the family, this is what gives rise to the cultural dilemma in women to use the opportunities given by the academic community to be in top management. The opportunity to occupy academic and non-academic structural positions has been the same; it's just the cultural dilemma in women that causes the unavailability of the occasion by avoiding competition due to various considerations. If anyone proposes to go forward, what is often encountered is the issue of gender issues that is always raised that it is also possible that women are not interested in taking the opportunity that has been given by the academic community.

REFERENCES

[1] R.B.M. Husain, and L.X. Xiao, “The antecedents of women leadership in SMEs: The Malaysian senior female managerial perspective,” International Journal of Business and Management, vol. 11(5), pp. 179, 2016.
[2] S.H Alnaki, R.H Alnaki, A.B Silong, K.I. and N.W., “The Path of Leadership Experience of Muslim Women Leaders in Higher Education,” pp. 15, 2016.
[3] B.J. Avolio, K. Mhatre, S. M. Norman, and P. Lester, “The moderating effect of gender on leadership intervention impact: An exploratory review,” Journal of Leadership and Organizational Studies, vol. 15(4), pp. 325-341, 2009.
[4] C.L. Ridgeway, “Gender, status, and leadership” Journal of Social issues, vol. 57(4); pp. 637-655, 2001.
[5] C. Trinidad, and A.H. Normore, “Leadership and gender: a dangerous liaison?” Leadership and Organization Development Journal, vol. 26(7), pp. 574-590, 2005.
[6] D. Dunn, J.M. Gerlach, and A.E. Hyle, “Gender and leadership: reflections of women in higher education administration,” International Journal of Leadership and Change, vol. 2(1), pp. 2, 2014.
[7] D. Nurhizkhy, Fenomena Kepemimpinan Perempuan di Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia: Studi Deskriptif terhadap Perempuan Penegang Jabatan Struktural Akademik dan Struktural Non-Akademik. Bandung: Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, 2017.
[8] C. Baker, “Stereotyping and women's roles in leadership positions, Industrial and Commercial Training,” vol. 46(6), pp. 332-337, 2014.
[9] M.M. Kattan, C.D.P. Heredero, J.L.M. Botella, and V.M. Margalina, “Factors of successful women leadership in Saudi Arabia. Asian Social Science,” vol. 12(5), pp. 94, 2016.
[10] R.G. Shetty, “Women Leadership-A Study of Select Women Leaders in the IT Sector in Bangalore city,” DHARANA-Bhavan's International Journal of Business, vol. 11(1), pp. 39-52, 2017.
[11] C. Glass, and A. Cook, “Leading at the top: Understanding women's challenges above the glass ceiling,” The Leadership Quarterly, vol. 27(1), pp. 51-63, 2016.
[12] J. Ballenger, “Women’s Access to Higher Education Leadership: Cultural and Structural Barriers,” In Forum on Public Policy Online (Vol. 2010, No. 5). Oxford Round Table. 406 West Florida Avenue, Urbana, IL 61801, 2010.
[13] A. Cook, and C. Glass, “Women and top leadership positions: Towards an institutional analysis,” Gender, Work and Organization, vol. 21(1), pp. 91-105, 2014.
[14] M.L. Johns, “Breaking the Glass Ceiling : Structural , Cultural , and Organizational Barriers Preventing Women from Achieving Senior and Executive Positions,” perspective in health information management, 2013.
[15] E. Malihah, “Is Woman’s Empowerment Necessary?”, pp. 1–8, 2016.
[16] P. Wulandari, A. Hufad, and S. Nurayani, “The Status and Role of Women in the Community of Suku Dayak Hindu Budha Bumi Segandu Indramayu,” pp. 155–158, 2016.