Review

Treeline Research—From the Roots of the Past to Present Time. A Review

Friedrich-Karl Holtmeier 1 and Gabriele Broll 2,*

1 Institute of Landscape Ecology, Westfälische Wilhelms-University Münster, 48149 Münster, Germany; fkholtmeier@arcor.de
2 Institute of Geography, University of Osnabrück, 49074 Osnabrück, Germany
* Correspondence: Gabriele.Broll@uni-osnabrueck.de

Received: 30 November 2019; Accepted: 17 December 2019; Published: 26 December 2019

Abstract: Elevational and polar treelines have been studied for more than two centuries. The aim of the present article is to highlight in retrospect the scope of treeline research, scientific approaches and hypotheses on treeline causation, its spatial structures and temporal change. Systematic treeline research dates back to the end of the 19th century. The abundance of global, regional, and local studies has provided a complex picture of the great variety and heterogeneity of both altitudinal and polar treelines. Modern treeline research started in the 1930s, with experimental field and laboratory studies on the trees’ physiological response to the treeline environment. During the following decades, researchers’ interest increasingly focused on the altitudinal and polar treeline dynamics to climate warming since the Little Ice Age. Since the 1970s interest in treeline dynamics again increased and has considerably intensified from the 1990s to today. At the same time, remote sensing techniques and GIS application have essentially supported previous analyses of treeline spatial patterns and temporal variation. Simultaneously, the modelling of treeline has been rapidly increasing, often related to the current treeline shift and its implications for biodiversity, and the ecosystem function and services of high-elevation forests. It appears, that many seemingly ‘new ideas’ already originated many decades ago and just confirm what has been known for a long time. Suggestions for further research are outlined.

Keywords: history of treeline research; elevational treeline; polar treeline; treeline dynamics

1. Introduction

Elevational and polar treelines, the most conspicuous vegetation boundaries in high mountains and in the Subarctic, have attracted researchers from numerous disciplines. Thus, scientific approaches to treeline have become increasingly complex. Treeline research dates back to more than two centuries. Since the end of the 20th century, treeline publications have been rapidly increasing. Nearly 60% of the articles and books from the 1930s onward were published during the two last decades. Older contributions have gradually become disregarded in recent articles, or have been cited from secondary sources. The objective of the present article is to highlight in retrospect the scope of treeline research, scientific approaches and hypotheses on treeline causation, and its spatial and temporal structures.

The cited references can only represent a very small selection of an abundance of relevant publications. This also means, that we could not cover all topics in treeline research. Anthropogenic pressure (pastoralism, use of fire, mining, etc.), for example, is only randomly considered, although it has controlled treeline position and spatial pattern in the inhabited world for thousands of years, often overruling the influence of climate. Moreover, the multiple influences of wild animals, pathogens, and diseases have not been concentrated on, as the species’ distribution, populations and kinds of
impact vary locally and regionally. Extensive reviews on this particular topic and the anthropogenic impact were presented by [1–4].

Early publications were usually descriptive, and the results were not tested statistically. Anyway, going ‘back to the roots’, the reader will soon realize that many ‘new ideas’ seemingly representing the actual ‘frontline’ of treeline research originated many decades ago and just confirm what has been known for a long time such as the fundamental functional role of heat deficiency in treeline control [5,6], or the advantage of short plant tree stature in high mountain and subarctic/arctic environments (e.g., [7,8]).

2. Scope and Topics of Treeline Research

2.1. Early Treeline Research

Early treeline research started around the end of the 18th century and the beginning of the 20th century. In the beginning, treeline research was closely linked with the exploration of high-mountains and the northern forest-tundra. There were occasional and more general observations, including the physiognomy and distribution of vegetation and hypotheses on the influence of climate on treeline (e.g., [9–16]) (Figure 1).

Figure 1. Scope and main topics of treeline research in the course of time.

Systematic research dates back to the end of the 19th century/beginning of the 20th century [5,7,17–37] (Figure 1). Coincidence of treeline position and certain isotherms of mean growing season temperatures became apparent which clearly reflected the influence of heat deficiency. Gannet’s article on timberline [38] is regarded as the beginning of systematic treeline research in North America [39]. Later, Griggs [40] published an overview on North American treeline which was followed by a more
popularized introduction to timberlines by Arno [41]. This book is focused on North America but also gives a short worldwide view.

Early researchers ([2] for review, [22,27,33–35,42,43]) already pointed to the treeline raising mass-elevation effect (MEE). Brockmann-Jerosch [33] found MEE often overlapping with the positive influence of the relatively continental climate character in the central parts of big mountain masses (see also [34]). There, the combined effects of greater daily thermal amplitude associated with high elevation, high solar radiation loads, reduced cloudiness, and lower precipitation, resulting in warmer topsoils and microclimate near the ground allow treeline trees to exist at a lower mean growing season air temperature (or annual temperature in the tropics) than in the outer low ranges exposed to moisture-carrying air masses and on isolated mountains (‘summit phenomenon’, sensu [44]). The mechanism of MEE has been approached again in numerous studies largely confirming the previous hypotheses ([2] for literature until 2005). During the last 14 years the discussion on the MEE came up again (e.g., [45–52]).

Growth forms of trees were found to be indicators of the harsh treeline environment. Dwarfed growth of trees, for example, and wide-spacing of trees in treeline ecotones had already been described in detail by early researchers as a characteristic of the climatic treeline (e.g., [7,21]). They considered ‘mats’ and similar low growth forms as ‘trees’ suppressed by recurrent winter injury (desiccation, frost, abrasion) above the protective winter snowpack. The beneficial effect of the relatively warmer conditions (growing season) near the ground surface was also well known (see also e.g., [5,7,8]) and studied later in detail [53].

2.2. Modern Treeline Research

Modern treeline research began in the 1930s, with emphasis on the trees’ physiological response to the harsh treeline environment (Figure 1). A biological study by Däniker [54] on treeline causation in the Alps, with special regard to the influence of climate and tree anatomy, had already opened perspectives for future research. Experimental studies in the field and laboratory became of major importance (e.g., [55–65]). During World War II (1939–1945), the number of publications on treeline at the regional scale considerably decreased, especially in Eurasia, where the political situation made field studies very difficult or even impossible. Nevertheless, a few articles also date from this period [66–71].

Disastrous avalanche catastrophes in the European Alps during the extremely snow-rich winters 1951/1952 and 1953/1954 gave a fresh impetus to basic and applied treeline research. In Austria and Switzerland, basic research on the physiological reponse of treeline trees to their environment combined with the analyses of the functional role of the most relevant site factors and processes created scientific basics for high-elevation forest management and maintenance, including afforestation up to the potential tree limit (e.g., [72–74]) (Figure 2). For practical use in high-altitude afforestation in the central Alps ecograms were developed [75,76] showing a schematic transect from convex to concave microtopography with the distribution of the characteristic plant communities as indicators of the site conditions varying along the transect see also [1,77].
2.2.1. Carbon

Limited carbon gain due to low temperature and a short growing season, has long been considered the main ecophysiological cause of climatic treeline (e.g., [78,79]), the inhibition of carbon investment gained importance (e.g., [80–82]). Increasing CO$_2$ in the atmosphere and associated ecophysiological effects on the treeline environments and trees has again stimulated research on carbon dynamics during the last three decades (e.g., [83–98]).

2.2.2. Winter Desiccation

Winter desiccation (WD) is an additional recurrent topic. It was already considered by early researchers as the bottleneck in the performance of young trees at the alpine and polar treelines (e.g., [7,99–102]), where WD had been observed mainly on strongly wind-swept local topography (see also [103]). WD was blamed for the high cuticular transpiration loss through immature needle
foliage with both frozen soil and the conductive tissue preventing water uptake (e.g., [56,104–120]). This plausible ‘mechanism’ has been readily accepted as a key factor in treeline causation in biology, forestry, and geography textbooks (e.g., [121–123]). Although reduced cuticle thickness and cuticular water loss are common at the treeline in winter-cold mountains, they are not necessarily associated with lethal damage (e.g., [124–126]). If needles and shoots are not killed, they may rapidly rehydrate in the following spring [127,128]. It appears that on extremely windy terrain mechanical injuries (e.g., abrasion by blowing snow/ice and sand, breakage of frozen needles, and shoots) can increase the susceptibility of needle foliage and shoots to WD (e.g., [129–133] for review). Frequent freeze-thaw events may also be involved, as well as early or late frost (e.g., [63,73,134,135]). On the whole it appears that WD cannot be attributed to insufficient cuticle development alone, and its role in treeline causation needs to be relativized.

In 1979 Tranquillini [103] compiled the results of his own and that of others in an often cited book, which represented the state of knowledge about the physiological ecology of treeline at that time. Wieser and Tausz [136] edited a volume with contributions of 11 experts on the eco-physiology of trees at their upper limits. The main focus of this book is on the European Alps. Five years later, Körner [93] gave a concise overview of the present state of knowledge about the ecophysiological response of trees to the environmental constraints at treeline.

2.2.3. Treeline and Temperature

The relationship between treeline and temperature, well known already to early researchers, has also been in the focus of modern research. As root zone temperatures during the growing season correlate better than more widely fluctuating air temperatures with worldwide treeline position (e.g., [86,137]), they were suggested as the universal factor in treeline causation ([86] onward). The relative effects of soil temperature on trees, and especially on tree seedlings, may considerably vary depending on local site conditions (e.g., available moisture, organic matter, decomposition, nutrients, and the species’ specific requirements). In a worldwide view, the location of the potential climatic treeline has been associated with the length of a growing season of at least 94 d, with a daily minimum temperature of just above freezing (0.9 °C) and a mean of 6.4 °C during this period [138]. This largely corresponds to the previous statement by Ellenberg [121] that the altitudinal position of the climatic treeline is associated with an air temperature exceeding 5 °C for at least 100 days. A critical mean root zone temperature of about 6 °C during the growing season comes close to the critical thermal threshold of 5 °C, when biochemical processes are generally impeded [139,140] and tree growth is interrupted [90].

Although the mean growing season temperature is not identical with a real physical threshold temperature below which no trees can exist (e.g., [141,142]), its relation to treeline position once again supports the well substantiated early finding that heat deficiency is the globally dominating constraint on tree existence at the elevational and polar treelines [143]. Therefore, linking treeline with growing season mean soil or air temperature allows an approximate projection of the future climatic treeline position at broad scales (global, zonal) (e.g., [138,144]).

Regional and local variations, however, are more difficult to foresee, as thermal differences may occur on small scales, that are as great in magnitude as those that occur over thousands of kilometers in the lowland [115,145]. Exposure of mountain slopes and microtopography to incident solar radiation and prevailing winds is of major importance in this respect (e.g., [2,115,146–159]). These factors and many additional physical and biotic disturbances (e.g., [134,160]) may prevent tree growth from reaching the temperature-controlled climatic treeline projected by models, as for example the model of [138]. In addition, historical displacement of treeline by humans and a delay of treeline response to climate change also play a major role in the respect. Hence, at finer scales, treeline position is often out-of-phase with climate (e.g., [1,161–176]). Global overviews, necessarily disregarding the local differences, may easily overemphasize coarse drivers such as temperature [167,177,178].
Overall, the assessment of the underlying possible causes at finer scales will be a great challenge to treeline researchers also in the future (e.g., [179]). Modelling the influence of abiotic factors on the New Zealand treeline [180], for example, showed 82% of treeline variation at regional scale being associated with thermal conditions, whereas only about 50% could be attributed to temperature at finer scales.

2.2.4. Treeline Fluctuations

Treeline fluctuations due to warming and cooling periods after the end of the Little Ice Age and during the 20th century were already considered in numerous studies ([2], for literature). However, it appears that the climatically driven current treeline advance to greater elevation and to northern latitude has even attracted greater attention (Figure 1). During the last three decades, especially since the 1990s, publications on this topic have rapidly increased (by about 90%), partly in a broader context with the change of vegetation and biodiversity, and the expected implications for the ecosystem functions and services of high-elevation forests (e.g., [88,134,167,181–205]) (Figure 3). Dendrochronology, pollen analysis, sediment analysis, and radiocarbon-dating of fossil wood remains (mega fossils) have provided a profound insight into Holocene treeline fluctuations (e.g., [203,206–224]). In not a few cases their after-effects have lastingly influenced the current treeline position and spatial patterns (e.g., [1,2] and references therein).

![Figure 3](image-url). Number of treeline-related publications during consecutive 30-years periods, compiled from the reference list of the current article. Note the exorbitant increase since the 1960s and especially since the 1990s, when the number of publications doubled compared to the previous 30 years (1960–1980s).

Treeline studies by geographers, landscape ecologists, foresters, and geobotanists have referred in particular to treeline in the landscape context aiming to explain spatial treeline structures and their development under the influence of multiple, partly interacting abiotic and biotic factors (Figure 2) [225–229]; for more publications prior to 2008 see [2,77,199,230–233]. In this context, natural and anthropogenic disturbances have been increasingly studied (e.g., [2,3,160,166,177,215,232,234–245]).
These studies have contributed to the assessment of treeline fluctuations in a more holistic view. As both natural and anthropogenic disturbances are closely linked with a multitude of locally and regionally varying preconditions, a generalization, however, is problematic.

Traditional ground-based repeat photography (e.g., [168,171,203,246–251]), remote sensing techniques (oblique air photos, satellite images) and GIS data (e.g., [181,242,252–270]) have effectively supported the analysis of current (and also of historical) treeline spatial patterns and temporal variation such as treeline fluctuations, especially in remote areas and areas difficult to access, such as steep and rugged mountain terrain [270,271]. These studies have also contributed to a more complex view of the driving factors and also underlined that factors and processes vary by scale of consideration (e.g., [159,180,184,205,272,273]) (Figure 4). Thus, in addition to the numerous studies on the physiological response of treeline trees to heat deficiency at the broader scales (global/zonal/regional), the influences of local topography (landforms) on treeline spatial patterns and associated ecological processes have been increasingly studied, particularly in Austria and Switzerland (e.g., [75,274–277]) (Figure 4). During the last decades, this issue has moved again in the focus of treeline research worldwide (e.g., [147–149,156,227,229,278–293]).

2.2.5. Soils in the Treeline Ecotone and in the Alpine Zone

The need for maintenance and restoration of high elevation protective forests and afforestation above the present subalpine forest has also fuelled research on soils in the treeline ecotone and in the alpine zone (e.g., [139,279,280,294–312]). High-elevation soils have been considered in a worldwide view by a FAO report [313]. In addition, Egli and Poulenard [314] published a review on soils of mountainous landscapes. However, in most treeline studies soils are considered only briefly, with just a few exceptions (e.g., [256,309,310,315]). Based on many treeline studies in the Alps, northern Europe and North America, the present authors have come to the conclusion that no real treeline-specific soil

![Figure 4. Combined results of research at different scales explain treeline spatio-temporal response to climate change.](image-url)
types exist [2,273,316]. Instead, the treeline ecotone is usually characterized by a mosaic of soil types, closely related to the locally varying conditions [256].

2.2.6. Precipitation and Soil Moisture

While heat deficiency has generally been accepted as the main factor in global treeline control, the role of precipitation and related soil moisture supply at treeline has remained less clear. This may be due to the great regional and local variation. During the last two decades, however, the role of precipitation has been increasingly dealt with, mainly in the context with climatically-driven treeline shifts and the growing number of studies on treeline in mountains influenced by seasonal drought. The impacts of heat deficiency and drought often overlap, and drought periods may overrule the positive effects of climate warming [178,257,263,317–327]. A detailed review on the physiological response of trees to drought and new insights in understanding of trees’ hydraulic function in general was recently presented by Choat et al. [328].

While warming climate is often associated with increasing summer drought, moisture carrying warm air currents may bring about increased winter snowfall at high elevation (e.g., Alps, Himalaya, Alaska). There are great variations, however, due to climate regimes, elevation and distance from the oceans. Anyway, when big snow masses accumulate during a few days of extreme synoptic conditions more destructive (wet snow) avalanches are likely [273,329–332].

Moisture availability is only partly associated with the total amount of precipitation and may considerably vary depending on microtopography, soil physical conditions, and soil organic matter. Moreover, the tolerance of moisture deficiency of tree species differs (e.g., [333]). Seedlings are more sensitive to lack of moisture than deep-rooted mature trees (e.g., [334–337]) which may be attributed to slow initial growth and great reliance on seed reserves [338].

On several tropical/subtropical islands, drought stress affects trees and seedlings above the trade-wind inversion. There may however be many additional factors involved (e.g., geological and vegetation history, climate variability, human impact, etc.) (e.g., [46,339–343]). Thus, the low position of the treeline on some remote ocean islands has also been ascribed to the absence of hardy tree species which could not reach these islands [110,343].

Growing concern about climatically-driven impact by drought, fire, mass-outbreaks of bark beetle, pathogens, and increasing outdoor activities on high mountain resources has fuelled treeline research, often with emphasis on high-elevation forest management ([344] and literature within). High-elevation forests including treeline ecotones are particularly valuable as wildlife habitats and because of their protective function such as avalanche and erosion control (e.g., [160,345]). Not least they serve as an environmental indicator.

2.2.7. Natural Regeneration

While, in general, response of mature trees to climate warming is in the focus, climate change has also stimulated new research on natural regeneration and its particular role as a driving force in worldwide treeline upward and poleward shifts (see [2] for literature prior to 2008 (e.g., [201,346–366]). Publications on regeneration at treeline have increased by more than 60% since the last two decades. Normally, both seed quantity and quality (viability) decrease when approaching the treeline. Occasionally, however, trees growing even far above the mountain forest produce viable seeds, from which scattered seedlings may emerge at safe sites. As the regeneration process usually extends over several years, it is highly prone to disturbances and may therefore fail at any stage [2,336,367].

It has been and still is being debated, whether the scarcity of viable seeds or paucity of safe sites are more restrictive to tree establishment within and above the current treeline ecotone (e.g., [93,109,168,171,182,186,361,368–378]). Whatever, increased production and availability of viable seeds will not necessarily initiate successful seedling recruitment (e.g., [171,182,186,261,367,379–381]) Altogether, seed-based regeneration in and above the treeline ecotone depends on the availability of viable seeds, varying locally, and on the distance from the seed sources, suitable seed beds, and multiple
disturbances (e.g., [2,3,160,191,261,353,355,361,366,367]). Last but not least, mycorrhization is essential for a successful seedling establishment in and especially above the treeline ecotone, where it is closely related to locally varying site conditions (e.g., [382–386]). It appears, that only trees with ectomycorrhiza are able to exist up to the climatic limit of tree growth [382,387]. In the end, however, effective natural regeneration depends on the hardiness of tree seedlings and whether these will attain full tree size or at least survive as suppressed growth form. Overall, operating with long-term growing season temperature alone does not allow a fairly well assessment of whether seed-based regeneration within the treeline ecotone and in the lower alpine zone will be successful or fail. As to current treeline dynamics, the role of layering (the formation of adventitious roots) and also of stump sprouts and root suckers, well known already to early researchers (e.g., [7,21,388]), deserves closer attention [389]. Layering still is active at low temperatures which would prevent seed-based regeneration (e.g., [390–392]). Clonal groups which developed at high elevation under temporary favourable conditions and survived subsequent cooling (after the Little Ice Age) may now serve as an effective seed source far above the current subalpine forest (e.g., [157]).

2.2.8. Feedbacks of Increasing Tree Population

The feedbacks of increasing tree population in the treeline ecotone on their close environment (Figure 5) are being increasingly considered (e.g., [147–149,155,157,258,278,393,394]). Increasing stem density may be associated with both positive and negative effects. Thus, trees and clonal groups growing to greater height reduce wind velocity and increase the deposition of blowing snow, which may provide shelter to young growth from climatic injury in winter-cold climates (e.g., [368,395]), while infection of evergreen conifers by parasitic snow fungi increases and can be fatal for seedlings and saplings. The increasing crown cover will reduce growing season soil temperature in the rooting zone and may thus impede root growth. Whatever, field studies on the response of Swiss stone pines to low soil temperatures as a result of self-shading have provided evidence that fine roots abundance and dynamics at the treeline is not affected by self-shading [396].

Figure 5. Feedbacks of increasing tree population on site conditions, seedling establishment, and survival (modified from [2]).
It has even been argued that densely grouped trees themselves would reduce their possible lifetime through shading the ground [86], whereas, sunlit patches between wide-spaced trees and tree groups usually exhibit higher daytime soil temperatures during the growing season (e.g., [20,22,23,27,131,147,397–401]), that might facilitate tree establishment. Nevertheless, adverse climatic factors [372,402–404] (e.g., recurrent frost damage, precocious dehardening in winter, summer frosts, strong prevailing winds, ice-particle abrasion, and photooxidative stress) can outweigh the advantage of reduced shading between wide-spaced trees (e.g., [2,103,178,359,372,403,405–410]).

Moreover, increasing tree density in the treeline ecotone may aggravate the competition for moisture, nutrients, and light between adult trees and juvenile trees (e.g., [157,293,411,412]). Not least, the competition between young trees, dwarf shrub, and ground vegetation may impede the establishment of trees [293,365,401,413–419]. Competition may even be more important than direct climatic effects, such as the length of the snow-free period, for example [359], or soil temperature. More systematic studies on competition as an ecological factor in the treeline ecotone are needed for a better understanding of treeline spatial and temporal dynamics.

2.2.9. Modelling Treeline and its Environmental Constraints

Since the 1990s, the modelling of treeline and its environmental constraints has rapidly increased. Modelling, in particular when combined with field- and laboratory experiments, allows alternative scenarios of possible treeline response to environmental pressure (Figure 6) (e.g., [87,137,138,145,172,173,258,289,350,365,373,409,420–431]). Due to rapidly growing numbers and the great diversity of modelling techniques it may be difficult, however, to find the most appropriate method (e.g., [432–434]). To apply the results to other environments proves to be problematic or even impossible as models and scenarios are usually based on local data sets collected within a limited period of time (see also [2,205,433]). Thus, model-based projections of future treeline have often failed. At the treeline of Scots pine in northernmost Europe, for example, climate warming did not seem to be sufficient to compensate abiotic and biotic pressures on treeline trees (e.g., [321]). In addition, in north-central Canada (west of Hudson Bay) the climatically-driven northward advance of treeline as predicted by various models has not yet occurred [326].
3. Conclusions and Perspectives

This research review, stemming from the roots of early research in the 1700s to modern research beginning in the 1930s, contributes to a multi-facetted view of the treeline (Figures 1, 2 and 4). Although the number of studies per year and the level of complexity has increased over time, many ‘new ideas’ seemingly representing the actual ‘frontline’ of treeline research, originated decades earlier and just confirm what has been known a long time (Figures 1–3).

Some established hypotheses need to be reassessed, such as global and regional overviews that have often overemphasized coarse drivers such as temperature. A focal point of early treeline research was linking the worldwide treeline position with an empirically found thermal average (mean growing season temperature) seemingly limiting tree growth. Not a few recent treeline studies have still been following the same idea and come to not really ‘new’ insights into trees’ functional response to the treeline environment. Especially during the last two decades, the mass-elevation effect (MEE) was reconsidered in many studies largely confirming the previous hypotheses dating from the early 1900s.

Additional work is needed to decipher the fundamental functional role of heat deficiency in treeline control. The same applies to the role of precipitation (rain, snow) and available soil moisture (dependent on soil texture, humus content, and microtopography) during the growing season in different climatic regions. More research at local and regional scales is required to broaden and corroborate knowledge in this field.

Disastrous avalanche catastrophes during two successive extremely snow-rich winters in the 1950s and current climate warming have become important drivers of modern treeline research. The extremely snow-rich winters in particular stimulated basic and applied treeline research (Figure 2).

Figure 6. Fundamentals, topics, and objectives of modelling treeline (modified from [2]).
As afforestation and maintenance of high-elevation protective forests was the main objective, the nature of the entire elevational belt (treeline ecotone) itself was increasingly considered. Finding out which factors prevent trees in many places from reaching its potential climatic limit has been a strong challenge for researchers since then.

Scales of consideration play an important role in treeline research, as treeline heterogeneity, spatial mosaic, and ecological variety increase from coarse (global, zonal) to finer (regional, landscape, micro) scales (Figure 4). Finer scale assessments of the relative importance and function of the treeline-relevant factors and processes (human impact included) are fundamental for better understanding of treeline causation and its possible response to climate (environmental) change.

Research on episodic reproduction and treeline fluctuations in response to climate warming since the end of the Little Ice Age has steadily increased from the 1940s onward (Figure 1). Since the 1990s, the effects of current climate warming on treeline have considerably fuelled treeline research comparable to the effect of the avalanche catastrophes in the European Alps during the snow-rich winters in the 1950s.

Changes of biodiversity and structural diversity due to feedbacks of increasing tree population (Figure 5) within the current treeline ecotone and in the adjacent lower alpine zone, as well as the resulting implications for the ecological conditions, also require local studies.

As the impact of climate change and treeline response often overlaps with anthropogenic influences and natural factors, it is suggested that future treeline-related research could benefit from means to successfully disentangle the effects of these factors on treeline position, spatial structures and dynamics.

Remote sensing techniques and GIS have become excellent tools for monitoring treeline spatial patterns and structures at coarse and finer scales, particularly in areas difficult to access. Such innovative research techniques will be needed to come to a better assessment of the multiple and often mutually influencing factors and processes controlling treeline causation, spatial patterns, and dynamics. Thus, they will also promote projection of future treeline position (Figure 6).

In addition to specialized research on the physiological functions and response of trees to the harsh treeline environment, studies based on a more holistic approach may considerably contribute to complete our knowledge on nature of treeline. The results from the different disciplines and experts involved in treeline research must be combined and integrated into the varying spatio-temporal patterns of treelines. In this context, research on the effects of recurrent disturbances, disregarded whether natural or anthropogenic, appear as important as tree physiological research.

Author Contributions: Both authors have contributed to this article at equal parts. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding: This research received no external funding.

Acknowledgments: We are grateful to Ingrid Lüllau (Ismaing) for revising the English text.

Conflicts of Interest: There are no conflicts of interest.

References

1. Holtmeier, F.-K. Geoökologische Beobachtungen und Studien an der subarktischen und alpinen Waldgrenze in vergleichender Sicht (nördliches Fennoskandien/Zentralalpen). In Erdwissenschaftliche Forschung; Steiner Verlag: Wiesbaden, Germany, 1974; Volume 8.
2. Holtmeier, F.-K. Mountain Timberlines. Ecology, Patchiness, and Dynamics. In Advances in Global Change Research; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2009; Volume 36.
3. Holtmeier, F.-K. Impact of wild herbivorous mammals and birds on the altitudinal and northern treeline ecotones. Landsc. Online 2012, 30, 1–28. [CrossRef]
4. Crawford, R.M.M. Tundra-Taiga Biology. In Human, Plant, and Animal Survival in the Arctic; Oxford University Press: Oxford, UK; New York, NY, USA, 2014.
5. Wegener, A. Das Wesen der Baumgrenze. Meteorol. Z. 1923, 40, 371–372.
6. Daubenmire, R. Alpine timberlines in the Americas and their interpretation. *Butl. Univ. Bot. Stud.* 1954, 11, 119–136.
7. Kihlman, A.O. Pflanzenbiologische Studien aus Russisch-Lappland; Weilin & Göös: Helsinki, Finland, 1890.
8. Raunkiaer, C. Types biologiques pour la géographie botanique. *Bull. Acad. R. Sci.* 1905, 5, 347–437.
9. Von Haller, A. Historia Stirpium Indigenarum Helvetiae Incohae; Sumptibus Societas Typographica: Bernae, Switzerland, 1768.
10. Hacquet, B. Mineral—Bot. Lustreise von dem Berge Terglu Krain zu dem Berge Glockner Tirol. 1779.
11. Zschokke, H. Beobachtungen im Hochgebirge auf einer Alpenreise im Sommer 1803. In *Isis, Wochenschrift von deutschen und schweizerischen Gelehrten*; Band I/II: Zürich, Switzerland, 1805.
12. Von Humboldt, A.; Bonpland, A. *Essai sur la géographie des Planters*; Chez Levraud, Schoell et Compagnie: Paris, France, 1805.
13. Wahlenberg, G. *Flora lapponica*; Berolini: Berlin, Germany, 1812.
14. Kasthofer, K. Bemerkungen auf einer Alpenreise über den Susten, Gotthard, Bernhardin, und über die Oberalp, Furka und Grimsel; Aarau, Switzerland, 1822.
15. Kasthofer, K. Bemerkungen auf einer Alpen-Reise über den Brünig, Bragel, Kirenzenberg, die Flüela, den Maloja und Splügen; Bern, Suisse, 1825.
16. Von Middendorf, A.T. *Sibirische Reise. Band IV . Teil 1. Übersicht der Natur Nord- und Ost-Sibiriens*; Die Gewächse Sibirien; Vierte Lieferung: St. Petersburg, Russia, 1864.
17. Sendtner, O. *Die Vegetationsvorbäinisse Südbayerns*; Literarisch-Artistische Anstalt: München, Germany, 1854.
18. Landolt, E. Bericht an den hohen schweizerischen Bundesrat über die Untersuchung der schweizerischen Hochgebirgswalderungen, vorgenommen in den Jahren 1858, 1859 und 1860; Bern, Switzerland, 1862.
19. Kerner, A. Studien über die obere Waldgrenze in den österreichischen Alpen. *Österreichische Revue*, 1894/1895. 2/3.
20. Fritzsche, M. Über Höhengrenzen in den Ortler Alpen. In *Wissenschaftliche Veröffentlichungen für Erdkunde 2*; Wien, Austria, 1894; pp. 105–292.
21. Roder, K. Die polare Waldgrenze. Ph.D. Thesis, Philosophische Fakultät der Universität Leipzig, Leipzig, Germany, 1895.
22. Imhof, E. Die Waldgrenze in der Schweiz. *Gerlands Beiträge zur Geophys.* 1900, 2, 241–330.
23. Fankhauser, F. Der oberste Baumwuchs. *Schweiz. J. für Forstwes.* 1901, 2, 1–5.
24. Rikli, M. Versuch einer pflanzengeographischen Gliederung der arktischen Wald-und Baumgrenze. *Vierteljahresschr. der Nat. Ges.* 1904, 49, 128–142.
25. Pohle, R. Vegetationsbilder aus Nord-Russland. In *Vegetationsbilder*; Karsten, G., Schenk, H., Eds.; Gustav Fischer: Jena, Germany, 1907; Volume 5.
26. Koch, M. Beiträge zur Kenntnis der Höhengrenzen der Vegetation im Mittelmeergebiet. Ph.D. Thesis, Universität Halle-Wittenberg, Halle, Germany, 1909.
27. Marek, R. Waldgrenzstudien in den österreichischen Alpen. *Petermanns Geogr. Mitt.* 1910, 48, 403–425.
28. Cleve-Euler, A. Skogträdens höjdgränser I trakten af Stora Sjöfallet. *Sven. Bot. Tidkr.* 1912, 6, 496–509.
29. Holmgren, A. *Studier öfvre Nordligaste Skandinaviens Björkskogar*; Norstedts Förlag: Stockholm, Sweden, 1912.
30. Renvall, A. Die periodischen Erscheinungen der Reproduktion der Kiefer an der polaren Waldgrenze. *Acta For. Fenn.* 1912, 29, 154. [CrossRef]
31. Regel, K. Zur Kenntnis des Baumwuchses und der polaren Waldgrenze. *Sitz. der Ges. für Erdkd. Berl.* 1917, 4, 1–25.
32. Pohle, R. Wald-und Baumgrenze in Nord-Russland. *Z. der Ges. für Erdkd. Berl.* 1917, 4, 1–25.
33. Brockmann-Jerosch, H. Baumgrenze und Klimacharakter; Beiträge zur geobotanischen Landesaufnahme, Rascher: Zürich, Switzerland, 1919.
34. Köppen, W. Baumgrenze und Luftpertemperatur. *Petermanns Geogr. Mitt.* 1919, 6, 201–203.
35. Köppen, W. Verhältnis der Baumgrenze zur Lufttemperatur. *Meteorol. Z.* 1920, 37, 39–42.
36. Regel, K. Die Lebensformen der Holzgewächse an der polaren Wald- und Baumgrenze. *Sitzungsber. Naturfr. Ges. Dorpat* 1921, 26, 1–15.
37. Hannerz, A.G. Die Waldgrenzen in den östlichen Teilen von Schwedisch Lappland. *Sven. Bot. Tidskr.* 1923, 17, 1–29.
38. Gannet, H. The timber-line. *J. Am. Geogr. Soc. N. Y.* 1899, 31, 118–122. [CrossRef]
39. Whiteside, C.J. The unknow father of American timberline research. *Prog. Phys. Geogr.* 2018, 42, 406–412. [CrossRef]
68. Aario, L. Waldgrenzen und subrezente Pollenspektren in Petsamo-Lappland. *Ann. Acad. Sci. Fenn.* 1940, 54, 11--120.
69. Blüthgen, J. Die polare Baumgrenze. Veröffentlichungen des Dtsch. *Wiss. Inst. zu Kph.* 1942, 10, 1--80.
70. Blüthgen, J. Dynamik der polaren Baumgrenze in Lappland. *Forsch. und Fortschr.* 1943, 19, 158--160.
71. Hustich, I. The scotch pine in northernmost Finland and ist dependence on the climate in the last decades. *Acta Bot. Fenn.* 1948, 42, 75.
72. Tranquillini, W. Standortsklima, Wasserbilanz und CO₂-Gaswechsel junger Zirben (Pinus cembra L.) an der alpinen Waldgrenze. *Planta* 1957, 49, 612--661. [CrossRef]
73. Tranquillini, W. Die Frosthärte der Zirbe unter besonderer Berücksichtigung autochthoner und aus Forstgärten stammender Jungpflanzen. *Forstwiss. Centralbl.* 1958, 77, 89--105. [CrossRef]
74. Ott, E.; Frehner, M.; Frey, H.-U.; Lüscher, P. *Gebirgsnadelwälder. Ein praxisorientierter Leitfaden für eine standortgerechte Waldbehandlung*; Haupt: Bern, Switzerland, 1997.
75. Aulitzky, H. Grundlagen und Anwendung des vorläufigen Wind-Schnee-Ökogramms. *Mitt. der Forstl. Bundesvers.* *Marsiabrunn* 1963, 60, 763--834.
76. Turner, H.; Rochat, P.; Steure, A. Thermische Charakteristik von Hangstandortstypen im Bereich der oberen Waldgrenze (Stillberg, Dischmatal bei Davos). *Mitt. der Eidg. Anst. für das Forstl. Vers.* 1975, 51, 95--111.
77. Holtmeier, F.K.; Broll, G. Altitudinal and polar treelines in the northern hemisphere—Causes and response to climate change. *Polarforsch.* 2009, 79, 139--153.
78. Boysen-Jensen, P. *Growth and development of trees. Vol. II*; Academic Press: New York, NY, USA, 1971.
79. Skre, O. High temperature demands for growth and development in Norway Spruce (Picea abies (L.) Karst.) in Scandinavia. *Medd. Fra Den Nor. Skogforsøksvesen* 1959, 53, 82--93.
80. Aulitzky, H. Grundlagen und Anwendung des vorläufigen Wind-Schnee-Ökogramms. *Mitt. der Forstl. Bundesvers.* *Marsiabrunn* 1963, 60, 763--834.
81. Kozlowski, T.T. *Growth and development of trees. Vol. II*; Academic Press: New York, NY, USA, 1971.
82. Shi, P.; Körner, C.; Hoch, G. End of season carbon supply status of wooden species near the treeline in western China. *Basic Appl. Ecol.* 2006, 7, 370--377. [CrossRef]
83. Stevens, G.C.; Fox, J.F. The causes of treeline. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst.* 1980, 11, 381--387. [CrossRef]
84. Sveinbjörnsson, B.; Kauhanen, H.; Nordell, O. Treeline ecology of mountain birch in the Torneträsk area. *Forstwiss. Centralbl.* 1958, 77, 89--105. [CrossRef]
85. Wieser, G. Carbon dioxide gas exchange of cembran pine (Pinus cembra) at the alpine timberline during winter. *Tree Physiol.* 1997, 17, 473--477. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
86. Körner, C. Alpine treeline. In *Functional Ecology of the Global High Elevation Tree Limits*; Springer: Basel, Suisse, 2012.
87. Cairns, D.M.; Malanson, G.P. Environmental variables influencing the carbon balance at the alpine treeline: A modeling approach. *J. Veg. Sci.* 1998, 9, 679--692. [CrossRef]
88. Grace, J.; Berninger, E.; Nagy, L. Impacts of climate change on the treeline. *Ann. Bot.* 2002, 90, 537--544. [CrossRef]
89. Hoch, G.; Körner, C. The carbon charging of pines at the climatic treeline: A global comparison. *Oecologia* 2003, 135, 10--21. [CrossRef]
90. Tranquillini, W. Die Frosthärte der Zirbe unter besonderer Berücksichtigung autochthoner und aus Forstgärten stammender Jungpflanzen. *Mitt. der Forstl. Bundesvers.* *Marsiabrunn* 1963, 60, 763--834.
91. Bugmann, H.; Zierl, B.; Schumacher, S. Projecting the impacts of climate change on mountain forests and landscapes. In Global change and mountain regions. An overview of current knowledge. In *Advances in Global Change Research*; Huber, U.M., Bugmann, H.K.M., Reasoner, M.A., Eds.; Springer: New York, NY, USA, 2005; pp. 477--487.
92. Shi, P.; Körner, C.; Hoch, G. End of season carbon supply status of wooden species near the treeline in western China. *Basic Appl. Ecol.* 2006, 7, 370--377. [CrossRef]
93. Aario, L. Waldgrenzen und subrezente Pollenspektren in Petsamo-Lappland. *Ann. Acad. Sci. Fenn.* 1940, 54, 11--120.
94. Handa, I.T.; Körner, C.; Hättenschwiler, S. A test of the treeline carbon limitation hypothesis by in situ CO₂ enrichment and defoliation. *Ecology* 2005, 86, 1288--1300. [CrossRef]
95. Kammer, A.; Hagedorn, F.; Shevchenko, I.; Leifeld, J.; Guggerberger, G.; Gorcheva, T.; Rigling, A.; Moiseev, P. Treeline shifts in the Ural mountains affect soil organic matter dynamics. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2009, 15, 1570--1583. [CrossRef]
96. Hagedorn, F.; Martin, M.; Rixen, C.; Rusch, S.; Bebi, P.; Zürcher, A.; Hättenschwiler, S. Short-term responses to ecosystem carbon fluxes to experimental soil warming at the Swiss alpine treeline. *Biogeochemistry* **2010**, *97*, 7–19. [CrossRef]

97. Wang, G.; Ran, F.; Chang, R.; Yang, Y.; Luo, J.; Fan, J. Variations in the biomass and carbon pools of Abies georgei along an elevation gradient on the Tibetan Plateau, China. *For. Ecol. Manag.* **2014**, *329*, 255–263. [CrossRef]

98. Grafius, D.R.; Malanson, G.P. Biomass distribution in dwarf tree, krummholz, and tundra vegetation in the alpine treeline ecotone. *Phys. Geogr.* **2015**, *36*, 337–352. [CrossRef]

99. Ebermayer, E. *Die physikalischen Einwirkungen des Waldes auf Luft und Boden. Band I. Anhang: Die Ursachen der Schüttekrankheit junger Kiefernpfanzen*; C. Krebs: Aschaffenburg, Germany, 1873; pp. 251–261.

100. Shaw, C.H. The causes of timberline on mountains: The role of snow. *Plant World* **1909**, *12*, 169–181.

101. Shaw, C.H. Present problems in plant ecology: III Vegetation and altitude. *Am. Nat.* **1909**, *43*, 420–431. [CrossRef]

102. Pisek, A. Zur Kenntniss der Frosthärte alpiner Pflanzen. *Die Naturwissenschaften.* **1952**, *39*, 73–78. [CrossRef]

103. Tranquillini, W. *Physiological Ecology of the Alpine Timberline—Tree Existence at High Altitudes*; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 1967.

104. Tranquillini, W. Über die physiologischen Ursachen der Wald- und Baumgrenze. *Ber. Dtsch. Bot. Ges.* **1957**, *75*, 457–487.

105. Müller-Stoll, W.R. Beiträge zur Ökologie der Waldgrenze am Feldberg im Schwarzwald. *Die Naturwissenschaften.* **1959**, *76*, 232–244.

106. Larcher, W. Winterliche Schäden an Zirben nahe der alpinen Waldgrenze. *Centralbl. für das gesamte Forstwes.* 1959, *76*, 49–81.

107. Holzer, K. Winterliche Schäden an Zirben nahe der alpinen Waldgrenze. *Centralbl. für das gesamte Forstwes.* 1959, *76*, 232–244.

108. Wardle, P. Engelmann spruce (Picea engelmannii) at its upper limits on the Front Range, Colorado. *Ecology* **1968**, *49*, 483–495. [CrossRef]

109. Holtmeier, F.-K. Waldgrenzstudien im nördlichen Finnish-Lappland und angrenzenden Nordnorwegen. *Rep. Kelo Subarct. Res. Stn.* **1971**, *8*, 53–62.

110. Müller-Stoll, W.R. Present problems in plant ecology: III Vegetation and altitude. *Am. Nat.* **1909**, *43*, 420–431. [CrossRef]

111. Hagedorn, F.; Martin, M.; Rixen, C.; Rusch, S.; Bebi, P.; Zürcher, A.; Hältenschwiler, S. Short-term responses to ecosystem carbon fluxes to experimental soil warming at the Swiss alpine treeline. *Biogeochemistry* **2010**, *97*, 7–19. [CrossRef]

112. Tranquillini, W. Der Einfluß von Seehöhe und Länge der Vegetationszeit auf das cutikuläre Transpirationsvermögen von Fichtensämlingen im Winter. *Ber. Dtsch. Bot. Ges.* **1957**, *75*, 457–487.

113. Wardle, P. Englemann spruce (Picea engelmannii) at its upper limits on the Front Range, Colorado. *Ecology* **1968**, *49*, 483–495. [CrossRef]

114. Platter, W. Winterliche Schäden an Zirben nahe der alpinen Waldgrenze. *Centralbl. für das gesamte Forstwes.* 1959, *76*, 49–81.

115. Turner, H. Types of microclimate at high elevations. In *Mountain Environments and Subalpine Tree Growth*; Benecke, U., Davis, M., Eds.; New Zealand Forest Service Technical Paper; New Zealand Forest Service: Wellington, New Zealand, 1980; Volume 70, pp. 21–26.

116. Sowell, J.P.; Koutnik, K.; Lansing, A.J. Cuticular transpiration of whitebark pine (Pinus albicaulis) within an Sierra Nevadaan timberline ecotone, U.S.A. *Arct. Alp. Res.* **1982**, *14*, 97–103. [CrossRef]

117. Tranquillini, W. Frost-drought an its ecological significance. In *Physiological Plant Ecology II—Encyclopedia of Plant Physiology, New Series*; Lange, O.L., Nobel, P.S., Osmond, C.B., Eds.; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 1982; pp. 379–400.

118. Tranquillini, W. Der Einfluß von Seehöhe und Länge der Vegetationszeit auf das cutikuläre Transpirationsvermögen von Fichtensämlingen im Winter. *Ber. Dtsch. Bot. Ges.* **1957**, *75*, 457–487.

119. Sowell, J.B. Winter relations of trees at alpine timberline. In *Establishment and Tending of Subalpine Forests: Research and Management, Proceeding 3rd IUFRO Workshop*; Turner, H., Tranquillini, W., Eds.; Eidgenössische Anstalt für das forstliche Versuchswesen: Birmensdorf, Germany, 1985; pp. 71–77.

120. Cairns, D.M. Patterns of winter desiccation in krummholz forms of Abies lasiocarpa at treeline sites in Glacier National Park, Montana, USA. *Geogr. Ann.* **2001**, *83*, 157–168. [CrossRef]
121. Ellenberg, H. Vegetation Mitteleuropas mit den Alpen in ökologischer Sicht, 2nd ed.; Verlag Eugen Ulmer: Stuttgart, Deutschland, 1963; p. 981.
122. Walter, H.; Breckle, S. Ökologie der Erde, Band 3, Spezielle Ökologie der Gemäßigten und arktischen Zonen Euro-Nordasiens; Gustav Fischer: Stuttgart, Germany, 1986.
123. Richter, M. Vegetationszonen der Erde: Klett-Perthes: Gotha/Stuttgart, Germany, 2001.
124. Barclay, A.M.; Crawford, R.M.M. Winter desiccation stress and resting bud viability in relation to high altitude survival in Sorbus aucuparia L. Flora 1982, 172, 21–34. [CrossRef]
125. Cochrane, P.M.; Slatyer, R.O. Water relations of Eucalyptus pauciflora near the alpine tree line in winter. Tree Physiol. 1988, 4, 45–52. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
126. Slatyer, R.O.; Noble, I.R. Dynamics of Montane Treelines. In Landscape Boundaries: Consequences for Biotic Diversity and Ecological Flows, Ecological Studies; Hansen, A., Di Castri, F., Eds.; Springer: New York, NY, USA, 1992; pp. 346–359.
127. Marchand, P.J.; Chabot, B.F. Winter water relations of the tree-line plant species, New Hampshire. Arct. Alp. Res. 1978, 10, 105–116. [CrossRef]
128. Holtmeier, F.-K. Influence of wind on tree physiognomy at the upper timberline in the Colorado Front Range. In Mountain Environments and Subalpine Tree Growth, Proceedings of the IUFRO Workshop, Christchurch, New Zealand, 1979; Benecke, D., Ed.; New Zealand Forest Service Technical Paper: Wellington, New Zealand, 1980; pp. 247–262.
129. Marchand, P.J. Causes of coniferous timberline in the northern Appalachian mountains. In Mountain Environments and Subalpine Tree Growth; Benecke, U., Davis, M.R., Eds.; New Zealand Forest Service Technical Paper: Wellington, New Zealand, 1980; pp. 231–246.
130. Hadley, J.L.; Smith, W.K. Influence of wind exposure on needle decicitation and mortality for timberline conifers in Wyoming, U.S.A. Arct. Alp. Res. 1983, 15, 127–135. [CrossRef]
131. Hadley, J.L.; Smith, W.K. Wind effects on needles of timberline conifers: Seasonal influences on mortality. Ecology 1986, 67, 12–18. [CrossRef]
132. Grace, J. Cuticular water loss unlikely to explain treeline in Scotland. Oecologia 1990, 84, 64–68. [CrossRef]
133. Holtmeier, F.-K. Blowing snow and sand blast shaping tree physiognomy at certain treeline microsites—A review. Geoöko 2016, 37, 201–233.
134. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. Treeline advance—Driving processes and adverse factors. Landsc. Online 2007, 1, 1–33. [CrossRef]
135. Neuner, G. Frost resistance at the upper timberline. In Trees at Their Upper Limit. Treeline Limitation at the Alpine Timberline—Plant Ecophysiology; Wieser, G., Tausz, M., Eds.; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2007; pp. 171–180.
136. Wieser, G.; Tausz, M. Current concepts for treeline limitation at the upper timberline. In Trees at Their Upper Limit. Treeline Limitation at the Alpine Timberline—Plant Ecophysiology; Wieser, G., Tausz, M., Eds.; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2007; pp. 1–18.
137. Gehrig-Fasel, J.; Guisan, A.; Zimmermann, N.E. Evaluating thermal treeline indicators based on air and soil temperature using air-to-soil temperature transfer model. Ecol. Model. 2008, 213, 345–355. [CrossRef]
138. Paulsen, J.; Körner, C. A climate-based model to predict treeline position around the globe. Alp. Bot. 2014, 124, 1–2. [CrossRef]
139. Retzer, J.L. Alpine soils. In Arctic and Alpine Environment; Ives, J.D., Barry, R.G., Eds.; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK, 1974; pp. 771–802.
140. Karlsson, P.S.; Nordell, O. Effects of soil temperature on nitrogen economy and growth of mountain birch seedlings near its presumed low temperature distribution limit. Ecocience 1996, 3, 181–189. [CrossRef]
141. Hermes, K. Die Lage der oberen Waldgrenze in den Gebirgen der Erde und ihr Abstand zur Schneegrenze. Kölner Geogr. Arb. 1955, 5, 277.
142. Holtmeier, F.-K. Ecological aspects of climatically-caused timberline fluctuations. In Mountain Environments in Changing Climates; Beniston, M., Ed.; Routledge: London, UK, 1994; pp. 220–233.
143. Bünzgen, U.; Frank, D.C.; Kaczka, R.; Verstege, A.; Zwijacz-Kozica, T.; Esper, J. Growth response to climate in a multi-species tree-ring network in the western Carpathian Tatra Mountains, Poland, Slovakia. Tree Physiol. 2007, 27, 687–702. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
144. Ohkawa, M. An interpretation of latitudinal patterns of forest limits in south and east Asian mountains. J. Ecol. 1990, 78, 326–329. [CrossRef]
145. Bueno de Mesquita, C.P.; Tillmann, L.S.; Bernard, C.D.; Rosemond, K.C.; Molotsch, N.P.; Suding, K.N. Topographic heterogeneity explains patterns of vegetation response to climate change (1972-2008) across a mountain landscape, Niwot Ridge, Colorado. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2018, 50. [CrossRef]

146. Turner, H. Die globale Hangbestrahlung als Standortfaktor bei Aufforstungen in der subalpinen Stufe. *Mitt. der Schweiz. Anst. für das Forstl. Vers.* 1966, 42, 1110–1686.

147. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. The influence of tree islands and microtopography on pedocological conditions in the forest-alpine tundra ecotone on Niwot Ridge, Colorado Front Range, U.S.A. *Arct. Alp. Res.* 1992, 24, 216–228. [CrossRef]

148. Tolmachev, A.I. Die Erforschung einer entfernten Waldinsel in der Großlandtundra. *Erdkunde* 1994, 48, 48–59. [CrossRef]

149. Ives, J.D.; Hansen-Bristow, K.J. Stability and instability of natural and modified upper timberline landscapes. *J. Veg. Sci.* 2004, 15, 3–12. [CrossRef]

150. Bekker, M. Positive feedback between tree establishment and patterns of subalpine forests advancement, Glacier National Park, Montana, U.S.A. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2005, 37, 97–107. [CrossRef]

151. Altifine, K.J.; Malanson, G.P. Directional positive feedback and pattern at an alpine treeline. *Ecol. Res.* 2008, 23, 589–605. [CrossRef]

152. Holtmeier, F.-K. Relocation of snow and its effects in the treeline ecotone with special regard to the Rocky Mountains, the Alps and Northern Europe. *Die Erde* 2005, 136, 343–373.

153. Wiegand, T.; Camarero, J.J.; Rüger, N.; Gutiérrez, E. Abrupt population changes at treeline ecotones along smooth gradients. *J. Ecol.* 2006, 94, 880–892. [CrossRef]

154. Humphries, H.C.; Bourgeron, P.S.; Mujica-Crapanzano, L.R. Tree spatial patterns and environmental relationships in the forest-alpine tundra ecotone at Niwot Ridge, Colorado, USA. *Ecol. Res.* 2008, 23, 589–605. [CrossRef]

155. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. Wind as an ecological agent at treelines in North America, the Alps, and the European Subarctic. *Phys. Geogr.* 2010, 31, 203–233. [CrossRef]

156. Elliott, G.P.; Kipfmueller, K.F. Multi-scale influences of slope aspect and spatial pattern on ecotonal dynamics at upper treeline in the Southern Rocky Mountains, U.S.A. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2010, 42, 45–56. [CrossRef]

157. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. Feedbacks of clonal groups and tree clusters on site conditions at the treeline: Implications for treeline dynamics. *Clim. Res.* 2017, 73, 85–96. [CrossRef]

158. Montpellier, E.E.; Soulé, P.T.; Knapp, P.A.; Shelley, J.S. Divergent growth rates of Larix lyallii Parl) in response to microenvironmental variability. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2018, 50. [CrossRef]

159. Maguire, A.; Etel, J.U.H.; Vierling, L.A.; Johnson, D.M.; Griffin, K.L.; Bodman, N.; Jensen, J.E.; Geaves, H.E.; Meddens, A.J.H. Directional positive feedback and pattern at an alpine treeline. *Ecol. Res.* 2008, 23, 589–605. [CrossRef]

160. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. Subalpine forest and treeline ecotone under the influence of disturbances: A review. *J. Environ. Prot.* 2018, 9, 815–845. [CrossRef]

161. Tolmachev, A.I. Die Erforschung einer entfernten Waldinsel in der Großlandtundra. *Colloq. Geogr.* 1970, 12, 98–103.

162. Payette, S.; Gagnon, R. Tree-line dynamics in Ungava Peninsula, northern Québec. *Holarct. Ecol.* 1979, 2, 239–248. [CrossRef]

163. Ives, J.D.; Hansen-Bristow, K.J. Stability and instability of natural and modified upper timberline landscapes in the Colorado Rocky Mountains, U.S.A. *Mt. Res. Dev.* 1983, 3, 149–155. [CrossRef]

164. Holtmeier, F.-K. Human impacts on high altitude forests and upper timberline with special reference to middle latitudes. In *Human Impacts and Management of Mountain Forests*; Fujimori, T., Kimura, M., Eds.; Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute: Ibaraki, Japan, 1987; pp. 9–20.

165. Löfler, J.; Lundberg, A.; Rössler, O.; Bräunling, A.; Jung, G.; Pape, R.; Wundram, D. The alpine treeline under changing land use and changing climate: Approach and preliminary results from continental Norway. *Nor. Geogr. Tidskr.* 2004, 58, 183–193. [CrossRef]

166. Leonelli, G.; Pelini, M.; Battipaglia, G.; Cherubini, P. Site aspect influence on climatic sensitivity over time of a high-altitude Pinus cembra tree-ring network. *Clim. Chang.* 2009, 96, 185–201. [CrossRef]
167. Harsh, M.A.; Hulme, P.E.; McGlone, M.S.; Duncan, R.P. Are treelines advancing? A global meta-analysis of treeline response to climate warming. *Ecol. Lett.* 2009, 12, 1040–1045. [CrossRef]

168. Kullman, L. Norway spruce (Picea abies (L.) Karst.) treeline ecotone performance since the mid-1970s in the Swedish Scandes—Evidence of stability and minor change from repeat surveys and photography. *Geöko* 2007, 35, 23–53.

169. Kullman, L. One century of treeline change and stability—An illustrated view from the Swedish Scandes. *Landscape online* 2010, 17, 1–31. [CrossRef]

170. Kullman, L. The alpine treeline ecotone in the southwestern Swedish Scandes: Dynamics on different scales. In *Ecotones between Forest and Grassland*; Myster, R.W., Ed.; Springer: New York, NY, USA, 2012.

171. Kullman, L. Higher-than-present Medieval pine (Pinus sylvestris) treeline along the Swedish Scandes. *Landscape online* 2015, 42, 1–14. [CrossRef]

172. Bruening, J.M.; Tran, T.J.; Bunn, A.G.; Weiss, S.B.; Salzer, M.W. Fine scale modeling a bristlecone treeline position in the Great Basin, USA. *Environ. Res. Lett.* 2017, 12. [CrossRef]

173. Singh, S.P.; Sharma, S.; Dghyani, P.P. Himalayan arc and treeline: Distribution, climate change responses and ecosystem properties. *Biodivers. Conserv.* 2019, 28, 1997–2016. [CrossRef]

174. Wieser, G.; Oberhuber, W.; Gruber, A. Effects of climate change at treeline: Lessons from space-for-time studies, manipulative experiments, and long-term observational records in the Central Austrian Alps. *Forces 2019*, 10, 508. [CrossRef]

175. Wieczorek, M.; Kruse, S.; Eppi, L.; Kolmogorov, A.; Nikolaev, A.N.; Heinrich, E.; Jetsch, F.; Pestryakova, L.A.; Zibulski, R.; Herzschez, U. Dissimilar response of larch stands in northern Siberia to increasing temperatures—A field and simulation based study. *Ecology 2017*, 98, 2343–2355. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

176. Bonanomi, G.; Rita, A.; Allevato, E.; Cesaran, G.; Saulino, L.; Di Pasquale, G.; Alegrezza, M.; Pesaresi, S.; Borghetti, M.; Rossi, S. Anthropogenic and environmental factors affect the treeline position of Fagus sylvatica along the Apennines (Italy). *J. Biogeogr.* 2018, 45, 2595–2608. [CrossRef]

177. Rössler, O.; Löffler, J. Uncertainties of treeline alterations due to climatic change during the past century in the Norwegian Scandes. *Geöko* 2007, 28, 104–114.

178. Moyes, A.B.; Germino, M.J.; Kueppers, L.M. Moisture rivals temperature in limiting phytosynthesis by trees establishing beyond their cold-edge range limit under ambient and warm conditions. *New Phytol.* 2015, 4, 1005–1014. [CrossRef]

179. Hellmann, L.; Agaonov, L.; Ljungqvist, F.C.; Churakova, O.; Düthorn, E.; Esper, J.; Hülsmann, L.; Kirdyanov, A.V.; Moiseev, P.; Myglan, V.S.; et al. Diverse growth trends and climate responses across Eurasian’s boreal forest. *Environ. Res. Lett.* 2016, 11. [CrossRef]

180. Case, B.; Duncan, R. A novel frame for disentangling the scale-dependent influence of abiotic factors on alpine treeline position. *Ecography* 2014, 37, 838–851. [CrossRef]

181. Callaghan, T.V.; Werkman, B.R.; Crawford, R.M.M. The tundra-taiga interface and its dynamics, concepts and applications. *Ambio Spec. Rep.* 2002, 12, 6–14.

182. Juntunen, V.; Neuvonen, S.; Norokorpi, Y.; Tasanen, T. Potential for timberline advance in northern Finland as revealed by monitoring during 1983–1999. *Arctic 2002*, 55, 348–361. [CrossRef]

183. Lloyd, A.H.; Fastie, C. Spatial and temporal variability in the growth and climate response of treeline trees in Alaska. *Clim. Chang.* 2002, 52, 481–509. [CrossRef]

184. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. Sensitivity and response of northern hemisphere altitudinal and polar treelines to environmental change at landscape and local scales. *Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.* 2005, 14, 395–410. [CrossRef]

185. Wohlgemuth, T.; Bugmann, H.; Lische, H.; Tinner, W. Wie rasch ändert sich die Waldvegetation als Folge von raschen Klimaveränderungen? *Forum für Wissen* 2006, 1, 7–16.

186. Danby, R.K.; Hik, D.S. Variability, contingency and rapid change in recent subarctic alpine tree line dynamics. *J. Ecol.* 2007, 95, 352–363. [CrossRef]
189. Devi, N.; Hagedorn, F.; Moiseev, P.; Bugmann, H.; Shiyatov, S.; Mazepa, V.; Rigling, A. Expanding forest and changing growth forms in Siberian larch at the polar Urals treeline during the 20th century. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2008, 14, 1581–1591. [CrossRef]

190. MacDonald, G.; Kremenetski, K.V.; Beilman, D.W. Climate change and the northern Russian treeline zone. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc.* 2008, 363, 2285–2299. [CrossRef]

191. Smith, W.K.; Germino, M.J.; Johnson, D.M.; Reinhardt, K. The altitude of alpine treeline: A bellwether of climate change effects. *Bot. Rev.* 2009, 75, 163–190. [CrossRef]

192. Van Bogaert, R.; Haneca, K.; Hoogester, J.; Jonasson, C.; De Papper, M.; Callaghan, T.V. A century of tree line changes in subarctic Sweden shows local and regional variability and only minor influence of 20th century climate warming. *J. Biogeogr.* 2011, 38, 907–921. [CrossRef]

193. Batllori, E.; Camarero, J.J.; Gutiérrez, S.; Fernández-García, D. Consequences if treeline shifts for the diversity and function of high altitude tree species. In *Ecotones*, 1st ed.; Myster, R.W., Ed.; Springer: New York, NY, USA, 2012; pp. 247–289.

194. Aakala, T.; Hari, P.; Dengel, S.; Newberry, S.L.; Mizunuma, T.; Grace, J. A prominent stepwise advance of the treeline in north-east Finland. *J. Ecol.* 2014, 102, 1582–1591. [CrossRef]

195. Greenwood, S.; Jump, A.S. Consequences if treeline shifts for the diversity and function of high altitude ecosystems. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2014, 46, 829–840. [CrossRef]

196. Broll, G.; Jokinen, M.; Aradottir, A.L.; Cudlin, P.; Dinca, L.; Gömöryová, E.; Grego, S.; Holtmeier, F-K.; Karlinski, L.; Klopcic, M.; et al. Working Group 2: Indicators of changes in the treeline ecotone. In *SENSFOR Deliverable 5. COST Action ES 1203: Enhancing the Resilience Capacity of Sensitive Mountain Forest Ecosystems and Environmental Change*, EU: Brussels, Belgium, 2016.

197. Broll, G.; Jokinen, M.; Aradottir, A.L.; Cudlin, P.; Dinca, L.; Gömöryová, E.; Grego, S.; Holtmeier, F-K.; Karlinski, L.; Klopcic, M.; et al. Working Group 2: Indicators of changes in the treeline ecotone. In *SENSFOR Deliverable 5. COST Action ES 1203: Enhancing the Resilience Capacity of Sensitive Mountain Forest Ecosystems and Environmental Change*, EU: Brussels, Belgium, 2016.

198. Broll, G.; Jokinen, M.; Aradottir, A.L.; Cudlin, P.; Dinca, L.; Gömöryová, E.; Grego, S.; Holtmeier, F-K.; Karlinski, L.; Klopcic, M.; et al. Working Group 2: Indicators of changes in the treeline ecotone. In *SENSFOR Deliverable 5. COST Action ES 1203: Enhancing the Resilience Capacity of Sensitive Mountain Forest Ecosystems and Environmental Change*, EU: Brussels, Belgium, 2016.

199. Broll, G.; Jokinen, M.; Aradottir, A.L.; Cudlin, P.; Dinca, L.; Gömöryová, E.; Grego, S.; Holtmeier, F-K.; Karlinski, L.; Klopcic, M.; et al. Working Group 2: Indicators of changes in the treeline ecotone. In *SENSFOR Deliverable 5. COST Action ES 1203: Enhancing the Resilience Capacity of Sensitive Mountain Forest Ecosystems and Environmental Change*, EU: Brussels, Belgium, 2016.
209. Kullman, L.; Kjällgren, L. A coherent postglacial tree-limit chronology (Pinus sylvestris L.) for the Swedsish Scandes: Aspects of paleoclimatic and “recent warming”, based on megafossil evidence. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2000, 32, 419–428.

210. Gervais, B.R.; Macdonald, G.M.; Snyder, J.A.; Kremenetski, C.V. Pinus sylvestris treeline development and movement on the Kola Peninsula of Russia: Pollen and stomate evidence. *J. Ecol.* 2002, 90, 627–638. [CrossRef]

211. Kullman, L.; Kjällgren, L. A coherent postglacial tree-limit chronology (Pinus sylvestris L.) for the Swedsish Scandes: Aspects of paleoclimatic and “recent warming”, based on megafossil evidence. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2000, 32, 419–428.

212. Esper, J.; Shiyatov, S.G.; Mazepa, V.S.; Wilson, R.J.S.; Graybill, D.A.; Funkhouser, G. Temperature-sensitive Tien Shan tree ring chronologies show multi-centennial growth trends. *Clim. Dyn.* 2003, 21, 699–706. [CrossRef]

213. Tinner, W.; Theurillat, J.-P. Uppermost limit, extent, and fluctuations of the timberline and treeline ecocline in the Swiss Alps during the past 11.500 years. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2003, 35, 158–169. [CrossRef]

214. Li, K.; Liao, M.; Ni, J.; Liu, X.; Wang, Y. Treeline composition and biodiversity change on the southeastern Tibetan Plateau during the past millennium inferred from high-resolution alpine pollen record. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 2019, 206, 44–55. [CrossRef]

215. Mazepa, V.S. Climate dependent dynamics of the upper treeline ecotone in the Polar Urals for the last millennium. *J. Biogeogr.* 2010, 38, 922–932. [CrossRef]

216. Kononov, Y.M.; Friedrich, M.; Boettger, T. Regional summer temperature reconstruction in the Khibiny low mountains (Kola Pensinsula, NW Russia) by means of tree-ring width during the last four centuries. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2009, 41, 460–468. [CrossRef]

217. Väliranta, M.; Kaakinen, A.; Kuhry, P.; Kultti, S.; Salonen, J.S.; Seppä, H. Scattered late-glacial and early Holocene tree populations as dispersal nuclei for forest development in north-eastern European Russia. *J. Biogeogr.* 2013, 40, 936–947. [CrossRef]

218. Tinner, W.; Kaltenrieder, P. Rapid responses of high-mountain vegetation to early Holocene environmental changes in the Swiss Alps. *J. Ecol.* 2005, 93, 936–947. [CrossRef]

219. Gervais, B.R.; Macdonald, G.M.; Snyder, J.A.; Kremenetski, C.V. Pinus sylvestris treeline development and movement on the Kola Peninsula of Russia: Pollen and stomate evidence. *J. Ecol.* 2002, 90, 627–638. [CrossRef]

220. Hofgaard, A.; Temmervik, H.; Rees, G.; Hansen, F. Latitudinal forest advance in northernmost Norway since the early 20th century. *J. Biogeogr.* 2013, 40, 936–949. [CrossRef]

221. Hofgaard, A.; Temmervik, H.; Rees, G.; Hansen, F. Latitudinal forest advance in northernmost Norway since the early 20th century. *J. Biogeogr.* 2013, 40, 936–949. [CrossRef]

222. Badino, F.; Ravazzi, C.; Vallée, M.; González-Sampériz, P.; Gil-Romera, G.; Bartolomé, M.; Belmonte-Ribas, A.; Goméz-García, D.; Kaltenrieder, P.; Rúbiales, J.M.; Schwörer, C.; Tinner, W.; et al. Ice cave reveals environmental forcing of local climate and movement on the Kola Peninsula of Russia: Pollen and stomate evidence. *J. Ecol.* 2002, 90, 627–638. [CrossRef]

223. Schickhofer, U. The upper treeline in the Himalayas, Hindu Kush and Karakorom: A review of geographical and ecological aspects. In *Mountain Ecosystems. Studies in Treeline Ecology*; Broll, G., Keplin, B., Eds.; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany; New York, NY, USA, 2005; pp. 275–354.

224. Brandes, R. Waldgrenzen griechischer Hochgebirge unter besonderer Berücksichtigung des Taygetos, Südpelopennes (Waldgrenzdynamik, dendrochronologische Untersuchungen); Erlanger Geographische Arbeiten: Erlangen, Deutschland, 2007.
229. Butler, D.R.; Malanson, G.P.; Walsh, S.J.; Fagre, D.B. Influence of geomorphology and geology on alpine treeline in the American West—More important than climatic influences? *Phys. Geog.* 2007, 28, 434–450. [CrossRef]

230. Malanson, G.P.; Brown, D.G.; Butler, D.R.; Cairns, D.M.; Fagre, D.B.; Walsh, S.J. Ecotone dynamics: Invisiblity of alpine tundra by tree species from the subalpine forest. In *The Changing Alpine Treeline: The Example of Glacier National Park, MT, USA: Developments in the Earth Surface Processes*; Butler, D.R., Malanson, G.P., Walsh, S.J., Fagre, D.B., Eds.; Elsevier: Boston, Heidelberg, 2009; pp. 35–61.

231. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. Landform influences on treeline patchiness and dynamics in a changing climate. *Phys. Geogr.* 2012, 33, 403–437. [CrossRef]

232. Kaczka, R.J.; Czajka, B.; Łajczak, A.; Swagrzyk, J.; Nicić, P. The timberline as a result of the interactions among forest, abiotic environment and human activity in Baba Góra Mt., Western Carpathians. *Geogr. Pol.* 2015, 88, 177–191. [CrossRef]

233. Drollinger, S.; Müller, M.; Kobl, T.; Schwab, N.; Böhmer, J.; Schickhoff, U.; Scholten, T. Decreasing nutrient concentration in soils and trees with increasing elevation across a treeline ecotone in Rolwaling Himal, Nepal. *J. Mt. Sci.* 2017, 14, 843–858. [CrossRef]

234. Sibold, J.S.; Veblen, T.T.; Gonzalez, M.E. Spatial and temporal variation on fire regimes in subalpine forests across the Colorado Front Range in Rocky Mountain National Park, Colorado, USA. *J. Biogeogr.* 2006, 33, 631–647. [CrossRef]

235. Potthoff, K. Grazing history affects the treeline-ecotone: A case study from Hardanger, western Norway. *Fennia* 2009, 188, 31–98.

236. Staland, H.; Salomonsen, J.; Hörnberg, G. A thousand years of human impact in the northern Scandinavian mountain range: Long-lasting effects on forest lines and vegetation. *Holocene* 2010, 21, 379–391. [CrossRef]

237. Cunill, R.; Soriana, J.M.; Bal, M.C.; Pelachs, A.; Rodríguez, J.M.; Pérez-Obiol, T. Holocene high-altitude vegetation dynamics in the Pyrenees: A pedoanthroecology contribution to an interdisciplinary approach. *Quat. Int.* 2013, 284, 60–79. [CrossRef]

238. Garbarino, M.; Lingua, L.; Weisberg, P.J.; Boltero, A.; Meloni, F.; Motta, R. Land-use history and topographic gradients as driving factors of subalpine Larix decidua forests. *Landsc. Ecol.* 2013, 28, 305–317. [CrossRef]

239. Palombo, C.; Chirici, G.; Marchetti, M.; Tognetti, R. Is land abandonment affecting forest dynamics at high elevation in Mediterranean mountains more than climate change? *Plant Biosyst.* 2013, 147, 1–11. [CrossRef]

240. Higuera, P.E.; Briles, C.E.; Witlock, C. Fire-regime complacency and sensitivity to centennial-through millennial-scale climate change in the Rocky Mountain subalpine forest, Colorado, USA. *J. Ecol.* 2014, 102, 1429–1441. [CrossRef]

241. Ameztegui, A.; Coll, L.; Brotons, L.; Ninot, J.M. Land-use legacies rather than climate change are driving the recent upward shift of the mountain treeline in the Pyrenees. *Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.* 2015, 25, 263–273.

242. Masseroli, A.; Leonelli, G.; Bollati, I.; Trombino, L.; Pelfini, M. The influence of geomorphological processes on the treeline position in Upper Valtellina (Central Italian Alps). *Geogr. Fis. E Din. Quat.* 2016, 38, 171–182. [CrossRef]

243. Cansler, C.A.; McKenzie, D.; Halpern, C.B. Fire enhances the complexity of forest structures in alpine treeline ecotones. *Ecosystems* 2018, 19, 9, e02091. [CrossRef]

244. Singh, N.; Tewari, A.; Sah, S. Tree regeneration pattern and size class distribution in anthropogenically disturbed subalpine treeline areas of Indian Western Himalaya. *Int. J. Technol. Res.* 2019, 8, 537–546.

245. Vitali, A.; Garbarino, M.; Camarero, J.J.; Malandra, F.; Toromani, E.; Spalevic, V.; Čurović, M.; Urbiniati, C. Pine recolonization dynamics in Mediterranean human-disturbed treeline ecotones. *For. Ecol. Manag.* 2019, 435, 28–37. [CrossRef]

246. Butler, D.R.; Malanson, G.P.; Cairns, D.M. Stability of alpine treeline in Montana, USA. *Phytocoenologia* 1994, 22, 485–500. [CrossRef]

247. Holtmeier, F.-K. Change in the timberline ecotone in northern Finnish Lapland during the last thirty years. *Rep. Kevo Subarct. Res. Stn.* 2005, 23, 97–113.

248. Roush, W.; Munroe, J.S.; Fagre, D.B. Development of a spatial analysis method using ground-based repeat photography to detect changes in the alpine treeline ecotone, Glacier National Park, Montana, U.S.A. *Arct. Antartic Alp. Res.* 2007, 39, 297–308. [CrossRef]

249. Jacob, M.; Frankl, A.; Beeckman, H.; Mesfin, G.; Hendrickx, M.; Guyassa, E.; Nyssen, J. North Ethiopia forest dynamics and forest-cover change since the early 20th century. *Land Degrad. Dev.* 2014. [CrossRef]
250. Kullman, L. Recent treeline shift on Kebnekaise Mountains, northern Sweden – A climate change case. *Int. J. Curr. Res.* **2018**, *10*, 63736–63792.

251. Kullman, L. A review and analysis of factual change on the max rise of the Swedish Scandes treeline in relation to climate. *J. Ecol. Nat. Resour.* **2018**, *2*. [CrossRef]

252. Brown, D.G.; Cairns, D.M.; Malanson, G.P.; Walsh, S.J.; Butler, D.R. Remote sensing and GIS techniques for spatial and biophysical analyses of alpine treeline through process and empirical models. In *Environmental Information Management and Analysis*; Michener, W.K., Stafford, J., Bruns, J., Eds.; Taylor&Francis: London, UK, 1994; pp. 453–481.

253. Allen, T.R.; Walsh, S.J. Spatial and compositional pattern of alpine treeline, Glacier National Park, Montana. *Photogram. Eng. Remote Sens.* **1996**, *62*, 1261–1268.

254. Crawford, R.M.M.; Jeffree, C.E.; Rees, W.G. Paludification and forest retreat in northern oceanic environments. *Ann. Bot.* **2003**, *91*, 213–226. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

255. Rees, G.; Brown, I.; Mikkola, K.; Virtanen, T.; Werkman, B. How can the dynamics of the tundra-taiga boundary be remotely monitored? *Ambio Spec. Rep.* **2002**, *12*, 56–62.

256. Broll, G.; Holtmeier, F.-K.; Anschlag, K.; Brauckmann, H.-J.; Wald, S.; Drees, B. Landscape mosaic in the treeline ecotone on Mt. Rodjanoaivi, Subarctic Finland. *Fennia* **2007**, *185*, 89–105.

257. Dial, R.J.; Berg, E.E.; Timm, K.; McMahon, A.; Beck, J. Changes in the alpine forest-tundra ecotone commensurate with recent warming in southcentral Alaska: Evidence from orthophotos and field plots. *J. Geophys. Res.* **2007**, *112*. [CrossRef]

258. Bekker, M.F.; Malanson, G.P. Modeling feedback effects on linear patterns of subalpine forest advancement. In *The Changing Alpine Treeline—Development in Earth Surface Processes*; Butler, D.R., Malanson, G.P., Walsh, S.J., Fagre, D.B., Eds.; Elsevier: Heidelberg, Germany, 2009; pp. 167–190.

259. Walsh, S.J.; Brown, D.G.; Geeddes, C.A.; Weiss, D.J.; McKittrick, S.; Hammer, E.S.; Tuttle, J.P. Pattern-process relations in the alpine and subalpine environments: A remote sensing and GIScience perspective. In *The Changing Alpine Treeline: The Example of Glacier National Park, MT, USA—Developments in Earth Surface Processes*; Butler, D.R., Malanson, G.P., Walsh, S.J., Fagre, D.B., Eds.; Elsevier: Heidelberg, Germany, 2009; pp. 11–34.

260. Olthof, I.; Pouliot, D. Treeline vegetation composition and damage in Canada’s western Subarctic AVHRR and canopy reflectance modeling. *Remote Sens. Environ.* **2010**, *114*, 805–815. [CrossRef]

261. Stueve, K.; Isaacs, R.E.; Tyrrell, L.; Densmore, R.V. Spatial variability of biotic and abiotic tree establishment constraints across a treeline ecotone in the Alaska Range. *Ecology* **2011**, *92*, 496–506. [CrossRef]

262. Simms, É.L.; Ward, H. Multisensor NDVI-based monitoring of the tundra-taiga interface (Mealy Mountains, Labrador, Canada). *Remote Sens.* **2013**, *5*, 1066–1090. [CrossRef]

263. Salzer, M.W.; Larson, E.R.; Burn, A.G.; Hughes, M.K. Changing climate response near-treeline bristlecone pine with elevation and aspect. *Environ. Res. Lett.* **2014**, *9*. [CrossRef]

264. Gaire, N.P.; Koirala, M.; Bhuju, D.R.; Carrer, M. Site- and site-specific treeline responses to climate variability in eastern Nepal Himalaya. *Dendrochronologia* **2016**, *41*, 44–56. [CrossRef]

265. Chhetri, P.K.; Shresta, K.B.; Cairns, D.M. Topography and human disturbances are major controlling factors in treeline pattern at Barun and Manang area in the Nepal Himalaya. *J. Mt. Sci.* **2017**, *14*, 119–127. [CrossRef]

266. Dinca, L.; Nita, M.D.; Hofgaard, A.; Alados, C.L.; Broll, G.; Borz, S.A.; Wertz, B.; Monteiro, A.T. Forest dynamics in the montane-alpine boundary: A comparative study using satellite imagery and climate data. *Clim. Res.* **2017**, *73*, 97–110. [CrossRef]

267. Poethoff, K. Spatiotemporal patterns of birch regrowth in a Western Norwegian treeline ecotone. *Landsc. Res.* **2017**, *42*, 63–77. [CrossRef]

268. Latwal, A.; Sah, P.; Sharma, S. A cartographic representation of a timberline, treeline and woody vegetation around a central himalayan summit using remote sensing method. *Trop. Ecol.* **2018**, *59*, 177–186.

269. Chhetri, P.K.; Thai, E. Remote sensing and geographic information systems techniques in studies on treeline ecotone dynamics. *J. For. Res.* **2019*. [CrossRef]

270. Morley, P.J.; Donoghue, D.; Chan, J.-C.; Jump, A. Quantifying structural diversity to better estimate change at mountain forest margins. *Remote Sens. Environ.* **2019**, *223*, 291–306. [CrossRef]

271. Rawat, D.S. Monitoring ecosystem boundaries in the Himalayas through an ‘eye in the sky’. *Curr. Sci.* **2012**, *1012*, 1352–1354.

272. Meentemeyer, V.; Box, E.O. Scale effects in landscape studies. In *Landscape Heterogeneity and Disturbance. Ecological Studies*; Turner, M.G., Ed.; Springer: New York, NY, USA, 1987; pp. 15–34.
273. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. Treelines—Approaches at different scales. *Sustainability* **2017**, *9*, 808. [CrossRef]
274. Turner, H. Maximaltemperaturen oberflächenaher Bodenschichten an der alpinen Waldgrenze. *Wetter und Leben* **1958**, *10*, 1–12.
275. Friedel, H. Schneedecken-Andauer und Vegetations-Verteilung im Gelände. *Mitt. der Forstl. Bundesvers. Mariabrnn* **1961**, *59*, 317–368.
276. Aulitzky, H.; Malanson, G.P.; Resler, L.M.; Walsh, S.J.; Wilkerson, F.D.; Schmid, G.L.; Sawyer, C.F. Geomorphic
277. Friedel, H. Verlauf der alpinen Waldgrenze im Rahmen anliegender Gebirgsgeände. *Mitt. der Forstl. Bundesvers. Wien* **1967**, *75*, 79–172.
278. Holtmeier, F.-K. Die bodennahen Winde in den Hochlagen der Indian Peaks Section (Colorado Front Range). *Münstersche Geogr. Arb.* **1978**, *3*, 4–47.
279. Burns, S.F. Alpine Soil distribution and Development. Ph.D. Thesis, University of Colorado, Boulder, CO, USA, 1980.
280. Burns, S.F.; Tonkin, P.J. Soil-geomorphic models and the spatial distribution and development of alpine soils. In *Space and Time in Geomorphology*; Thorn, C.E., Ed.; Allen and Unwin: London, UK, 1982; pp. 25–43.
281. Walsh, S.J.; Butler, D.R.; Allen, T.R.; Malanson, G.P. Influence of snow pattern and snow avalanches on the alpine treeline ecotone. *J. Veg. Sci.* **1994**, *5*, 657–672. [CrossRef]
282. Walder, U. Ausaperung und Vegetationsverteilung im Dischmatal. *Mitt. der Eidg. Anst. für esa Forstl. Vers.* **1983**, *59*, 80–2012.
283. Holtmeier, F.-K. Die Wirkungen des Windes in der subalpinen und alpinen Stufe der Front Range, Colorado, U.S.A. In *Beiträge aus den Arbeitsgebieten am Institut für Landschaftsökologie Münster*; Holtmeier, F.-K., Ed.; Institut für Landschaftsökologie: Münster, Germany, 1996; pp. 19–45.
284. Butler, D.R.; Malanson, G.P.; Bekker, M.F.; Resler, L.M. Lithologic structural and geomorphic controls on ribbon forest patterns in a glaciated mountain environment. *Geomorphology* **2003**, *55*, 203–217. [CrossRef]
285. Millar, C.I.; Westfall, R.D.; Delay, D.L.; King, J.C.; Graumlich, L.-J. Response of subalpine conifers in the Sierra Nevada, California, U.S.A., to 20th century warming and decadal climate variability. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* **2004**, *36*, 181–200. [CrossRef]
286. Kullman, L. Trädgränsen i Dalafjällen. Del I. Gamla og nya träd på hög nivå. *Svensk Bot. Tidskrift* **2005**, *99*, 315–330.
287. Resler, L.M.; Butler, D.R.; Malanson, G.P. Topographic shelter and conifer establishment and mortality in an alpine environment, Glacier National Park, Montana. *Phys. Geogr.* **2005**, *26*, 112–125. [CrossRef]
288. Malanson, G.P.; Butler, D.R.; Fagre, D.B.; Walsh, S.J.; Tombback, D.F.; Daniels, L.D.; Resler, L.M.; Smith, W.K.; Weiss, D.J.; Peterson, D.L.; et al. Linking organism-to-landscape dynamics. *Phys. Geogr.* **2007**, *28*, 378–396. [CrossRef]
289. Bekker, M.F.; Clark, J.; Jackson, M.W. Landscape metrics indicate differences in patterns and dominant control of ribbon forests in the Rocky Mountains, USA. *Appl. Veg. Sci.* **2009**, *12*, 237–249. [CrossRef]
290. Butler, D.R.; Malanson, G.P.; Resler, L.M.; Walsh, S.J.; Wilkerson, F.D.; Schmid, G.L.; Sawyer, C.F. Geomorphic patterns and processes at alpine treeline. In *The Changing Alpine Treeline: The Example of Glacier National Park, MT, USA—Developments in Earth Surface Processes*; Butler, D.R., Malanson, G.P., Walsh, S.J., Fagre, D.B., Eds.; Elsevier: Heidelberg, Germany, 2009; pp. 63–84.
291. Nicklen, E.F.; Roland, C.A.; Ruess, R.W.; Schmidt, J.H.; Lloyd, A.H. Local site conditions drive climate-growth responses of Picea mariana and Pincea glauca in interior Alaska. *Ecosphere* **2016**, *7*, e01507. [CrossRef]
292. Yu, D.; Wang, W.Q.; Liu, J.; Zhou, W.; Qi, L.; Wang, X.; Zhou, L.; Dai, L. Formation mechanisms at the alpine Erman’s birch (Betula ermanii treeline on Changbai Mountain in Northeast China. *Trees* **2014**, *28*, 935–947. [CrossRef]
293. Dearborn, K.D.; Danby, R.K. Spatial analysis of forest-tundra ecotones reveals the influence of topography and vegetation in alpine timberline patterns in the Subarctic. *Ann. Am. Assoc. Geogr.* **2019**.
294. Neuwinger, I. Böden der subalpinen und alpinen Stufe in den Tiroler Alpen. *Mitt. Ostalpin-Dinarische Ges. für Veg.* **1970**, *11*, 135–150.
295. Blaser, P. Der Boden als Standortsfaktor bei Aufforstungen in der subalpinen Stufe (Stillberg, Davos). *Schweiz. Anst. für fas Forstl. Vers.* **1980**, *56*, 529–611.
296. Aulitzky, H.; Turner, H.; Mayer, H. Bioklimatische Grundlagen einer standortgemäßen Bewirtschaftung des subalpinen Lärchen-Arvenwaldes. *Eidgenössische Anst. für das Forstl. Vers.* **1982**, *58*, 327–577.
297. Schönénberger, W. Performance of high altitude afforestation under various site conditions. In Proceedings 3rd IUFRO Workshop; Turner, H., Tranquillini, W., Eds.; Eidgenössische Anstalt für das forstliche Versuchswesen: Birmensdorf, Switzerland, 1985; Berichte 270; pp. 233–240.

298. Neuwinger, I; Wieser, G.; Winklehner, W. Bodenwasseruntersuchungen in einer Hochlagenafforstung bei Haggen im Sellraintal, Tirol. Österr. Wasser Abfallwirtsch. 1988, 40, 57–61.

299. Nimlos, T.J.; McConnell, R.C. Alpine soils in Montana. Soil Sci. 1965, 99, 310–321. [CrossRef]

300. Czell, A. Beitrag zum Wasserhaushalt subalpiner Böden. Mitt. der Forstl. Bundesversuchsanstalt Wien 1967, 1, 305–332.

301. Johnson, P.D.; Cline, A.J. Colorado mountain soils. Adv. Agron. 1965, 17, 233–287.

302. Blaser, P.; Reiser, M. Eine topographische Bodensequenz in subalpinen Lawinengassen auf Silikatgestein. Mitt. der Eidg. Anst. für das Forstl. Vers. 1975, 51, 1199–1214.

303. Neuwinger, I. Bodenökologische Untersuchungen im Gebiet Obergurgler Zirbenwald Hohe Mut. In MaB-Projekt Obergurgl—Veröffentlichungen des Österreichischen MaB-Programm; Patzelt, G., Ed.; Universitätsverlag Wagner: Innsbruck, Austria, 1987; pp. 173–190.

304. Litaor, M.I. The influence of eolian dust on the genesis of alpine soils in the Front Range, Colorado. Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J. 1987, 51, 142–147. [CrossRef]

305. Bowman, W.D.; Theodore, T.A.; Schardt, J.C.; Conant, R.T. Constraints on nutrient availability on primary production in two alpine tundra communities. Ecology 1993, 74, 2085–2097. [CrossRef]

306. Weiss, L.; Shiel, A.B.; Walker, L.T. Soil impacts of bristlecone pine (Pinus longaeva) tree islands on alpine tundra, Charleston Peak, Nevada. West. North Am. Nat. 2001, 65, 536–540.

307. McNown, R.W.; Sullivan, P.F.; Turnball, M. Low photosynthesis of treeline white spruce is associated with limited soil nitrogen availability in the western Brooks Range, Alaska. Funct. Ecol. 2013, 27, 672–683. [CrossRef]

308. Bockheim, J.G.; Munroe, J.S. Organic carbon and genesis of alpine soils with permafrost: A review. Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res. 2014, 46, 987–1006. [CrossRef]

309. Müller, M.; Rudawska, M.; et al. Soil properties as indicators of treeline dynamics in relation to anthropogenic pressure and climate change. Clim. Res. 2017, 73, 73–84. [CrossRef]

310. Moscatelli, M.C.; Bonifacio, E.; Chiti, T.; Cudlin, P.; Dinca, L.; Grego, S.; LaPorta, N.; Karlinski, L.; Pellis, G.; Rudawiska, M.; et al. Soil properties as indicators of treeline dynamics in relation to anthropogenic pressure and climate change. Clim. Res. 2017, 73, 73–84. [CrossRef]

311. Davis, E.L.; Hager, H.A.; Gedalof, Z. Soil properties as constraints to seedling regeneration beyond alpine timberlines in the Canadian Rocky Mountains. Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res. 2018, 50. [CrossRef]

312. Liu, Y.; Wang, L.; He, R.; Chan, Y.; Xu, Z.; Tan, B.; Zhang, L.; Xiao, J.; Zhu, P.; Chen, L.; et al. Higher soil fauna abundance accelerates litter carbon release across an alpine forest-tundra ectone. Sci. Rep. 2019, 9, 10561. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

313. FAO. FAO-report. Understanding Mountain Soils: A Contribution from Mountain Areas to the International Year of Soils 2015; Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations: Rome, Italy, 2015.

314. Egli, M.; Poulenard, J. Soils of mountainous landscapes. Encycl. Geogr. 2016. [CrossRef]

315. Stöhr, D. Heterogeneity at a microscale. In Trees at Their Upper Limit. Treeline Limitation at the Alpine Timberline—Plant Ecophysiology; Wieser, G., Tausz, M., Eds.; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2007; pp. 37–56.

316. Holtmeier, F.K. Die Höhengrenze der Gebirgswälder; Arb. aus dem Inst. für Landschaftsökologie der Westfälischen Wilhelms-Univ.: Münster, Germany, 2000; Volume 8, p. 337.

317. Pearson, R.G.; Phillips, S.J.; Loranty, M.M.; Neck, P.S.A.; Damoulas, T.; Knight, S.J.; Goetz, S.J. Shifts in Arctic vegetation and associated feedbacks under climate change. Nat. Clim. Chang. 2013, 3, 673–677. [CrossRef]

318. Liang, E.; Dawadi, B.; Pederson, N.; Eckstein, D. Is the growth of birch at the upper timberline in the Himalayas limited by moisture or by temperature? Ecology 2014, 95, 2453–2465. [CrossRef]

319. Roland, C.A.; Schmidt, J.H.; Johnstone, F. Climate sensitivity of reproduction in a mast-seeding boreal conifer across its distribution range from lowland to treeline forests. Oecologia 2014, 174, 665–677. [CrossRef]

320. Winkler, D.E.; Chapin, K.J.; Kueppers, L. Soil moisture mediates alpine life form and community productivity responses to warming. Ecology 2016, 97, 1533–1563. [CrossRef]

321. Franke, A.K.; Bräuning, A.; Timonen, M.; Rautio, P. Growth response of Scots pine in polar-alpine tree-line to a warming climate. For. Ecol. Manag. 2017, 399, 94–107. [CrossRef]
32. Kueppers, L.M.; Conlisk, E.; Castanha, C.; Moyes, A.; Germino, M.J.; de Valpine, P.; Torn, M.S.; Mitton, J. Warming and provenance limit tree recruitment across and beyond the elevation range of subalpine forests. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2017, 23, 2383–2395. [CrossRef]

33. Millar, C.I.; Westfall, R.D.; Delany, R.L.; Flint, A.L.; Flint, L.E. (2015): Recruitment patterns and growth of high-elevation pines in response to climatic variability (1883-2013) in the western Great Basin, USA. *Can. J. For. Res.* 2015, 45, 1299–1312. [CrossRef]

34. Andrus, R.A.; Harvey, B.J.; Rodman, K.C.; Hart, S.J.; Veblen, T.T. Moisture availability limit subalpine tree establishment. *Ecology* 2018, 99, 567–575. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

35. Berner, L.T.; Beck, P.S.; Bunn, A.G.; Goetz, S.J. Plant response to climate change along the forest-tundra ecotone in northeastern Siberia. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2018, 19, 3449–3462. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

36. Timoney, K.P.; Mamet, S.D.; Cheng, R.; Lee, P.; Robinson, A.L.; Downing, D.; Wein, R. Tree cover response to climate change in the forest-tundra ecotone of north-central Canada: Fire-driven decline, not northward advance. *Ecoscience* 2018, 26, 133–148. [CrossRef]

37. De Boer, H.J.; Roberston, I.; Clisby, R.; Loader, N.J.; Gagen, M.M.; Giles, H.F.; Young, G.H.F.; Wagner-Cremer, F.; Hipkin, C.R.; McCarroll, D. Tree-ring isotopes suggest atmospheric drying limits temperature-growth responses of treeline bristlecone pine. *Tree Physiol.* 2019, 39, 983–999. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

38. Choat, B.; Brodripp, T.; Brodersen, C.R.; Duursma, R.A.; López, R.; Medin, B.E. Triggers of tree mortality under drought. *Nature* 2018, 558, 531–539. [CrossRef]

39. Beniston, M. The effect of global warming on mountain regions: A summary of the 1995 Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. In *Global Change and Protected Areas—Advances in Global Change Research*; Viskonti, G., Beniston, M., Ianovelli, E.D., Varba, D., Eds.; Springer: New York, NY, USA, 2001; pp. 155–185.

40. IPCC. Climate Change 2014: Synthesis Report. In *Contribution of Working Groups I, II and III to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*; Core Writing Team, Pachauri, R.K., Meyer, L.A., Eds.; IPCC: Geneva, Switzerland, 2014; 151p.

41. Ballestero-Canovas, J.A.; Trappmann, D.; Madrigal-González, J.; Eckert, N.; Stoßel, M. Climate warming enhances snow avalanche risk in the Western Himalayas. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2018, 115, 3410–3415. [CrossRef]

42. Wieser, G.; Holtmeier, F.-K.; Smith, W.K. Treelines in a changing global environment: Ecophysiology, adaptation and future survival. In *Plant Ecophysiology*; Tausz, N., Grulke, N., Eds.; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2014; pp. 221–263.

43. Wieser, G.; Ballestero-Cano, J.A.; Lorenzo, J.R.; González-Rodríguez, A.M.; Morales, P.; Ultaft, G.; Jiménez, M.S. Canopy transpiration of a semi arid Pinus canariensis forest at a treeline ecotone in two hydrologically contrasting years. *Agric. For. Meteorol.* 2015, 201, 120–127. [CrossRef]

44. Wieser, G.; Holtmeier, F.-K.; Smith, W.K. Treelines in a changing global environment: Ecophysiology, adaptation and future survival. In *Plant Ecophysiology*; Tausz, N., Grulke, N., Eds.; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2014; pp. 221–263.

45. Wieser, G.; Ballestero-Cano, J.A.; Lorenzo, J.R.; González-Rodríguez, A.M.; Morales, P.; Ultaft, G.; Jiménez, M.S. Canopy transpiration of a semi arid Pinus canariensis forest at a treeline ecotone in two hydrologically contrasting years. *Agric. For. Meteorol.* 2015, 201, 120–127. [CrossRef]
341. Gieger, T.; Leuschner, C. Altitudinal change in needle water relations of Pinus canariensis and possible evidence of a drought-induced alpine timberline on Mt. Teide, Tenerife. Flora Morphol. Distrib. Funct. Ecol. Plants 2004, 199, 100–109. [CrossRef]

342. Bello-Rodriguez, V.; Cubas, J.; Del Arco, M.J.; Martín, J.L.; González-Macebo, J.M. Elevational and structural shifts in the treeline of an oceanic island (Tenerife, Canary islands) in the context of global warming. Int. J. Appl. Earth Obs. Geoinf. 2019, 82. [CrossRef]

343. Karger, D.N.; Kessler, M.; Conrad, D.; Weigelt, P.; Kreft, H.; König, C.; Zimmermann, N.E. Why treelines are lower on islands—Climatic and biographic effects hold the answer. Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr. 2019. [CrossRef]

344. Rehfeldt, G.E.; Worrall, J.J.; Marchettti, S.B.; Crookston, N.L. Adaptive forest management to climate change impacts. For. Ecol. Manage. 2015, 388–391. [CrossRef]

345. Grau, O.; Ninot, J.M.; Cornelissen, J.H.C.; Callaghan, T.V. Similar tree seedling responses to shrubs and to other plant species in the mountain taiga. For. Ecol. Manag. 2008, 208, 109–123. [CrossRef]

346. Anschlag, K.; Broll, G.; Holtmeier, F.-K. Mountain birch seedlings in the treeline ecotone, subarctic Finland: Variation in above- and below-ground growth depending on microtopography. Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res. 2008, 40, 609–616. [CrossRef]

347. Aune, S.; Hofgaard, A.; Söderström, L. Contrasting climate and land-use driven tree encroachment pattern of subarctic tundra in northern Norway and the Kola Peninsula. Can. J. For. Res. 2011, 41, 437–449. [CrossRef]

348. Leonelli, G.; Pelfini, M.; Morra di Cella, U.; Caravaglia, V. Climate warming and the recent treeline shift in the European Alps: The role of geomorphological factors affecting elevation. Ambio 2011, 40, 264–273. [CrossRef]

349. Carrer, M.; Soraruf, L.; Lingua, E. Convergent space-time tree regeneration patterns along an elevational gradient at high altitude in the Alps. For. Ecol. Manag. 2013, 304, 1–9. [CrossRef]

350. Grau, O.; Ninot, J.M.; Cornelissen, J.H.C.; Callaghan, T.V. Similar tree seedling responses to shrubs and to other plant species in the mountain taiga. For. Ecol. Manag. 2008, 208, 109–123. [CrossRef]

351. Camarero, J.J.; García-Ruiz, J.; Sangüesa-Barrado, G.; Galván, J.D.; Alla, A.Q.; Sanjuán, Y.; Beguería, S.; Gutiérrez, E. Recent and intense climate and climatic dynamics in a formerly static Pyrenean treeline. Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res. 2015, 47, 773–783. [CrossRef]

352. Shresta, K.B.; Hofgaard, A.; Vandvik, V. Tree-growth responses to climatic variability in two climatically contrasting treeline ecotone areas, central Himalaya, Nepal. Can. J. For. Res. 2015, 45, 1634–1653. [CrossRef]

353. Johnson, A.C.; Yeakley, J.A. Microsites and climatic zones: Seedling regeneration in the alpine treeline ecotone worldwide. Forests 2019, 10, 864. [CrossRef]

354. Renard, S.M.; McIntire, E.J.B.; Fajardo, A. Winter conditions—Not summer temperature—Influence establishment of seedlings of white spruce alpine treeline in Eastern Quebec. J. Veg. Sci. 2016, 27, 29–39. [CrossRef]

355. Wang, J.S.; Feng, J.G.; Chen, B.X.; Shi, P.-L.; Zhang, J.-L.; Fang, J.-P.; Wang, Z.-K.; Yao, S.-C.; Ding, L.-B. Controls of seed phenology, seedling number and quality on seedling recruitment of Smith fir along altitudinal gradient in southwestern Tibetan Plateau. J. Mt. Sci. 2016, 13. [CrossRef]

356. Loranger, H.; Zotz, G.; Bader, M.Y. Competition or facilitation? The ambiguous role of alpine grassland for early establishment of tree seedlings at treeline. Oikos 2017, 126, 1625–1636. [CrossRef]

357. Neuschulz, E.L.; Merges, D.; Bollmann, K.; Gugerli, F.; Böhning-Gaese, K. Biotic interactions and seed deposition rather than abiotic factors determine differentiation range limits of an alpine treeline. J. Ecol. 2017, 106, 948–959. [CrossRef]

358. Walker, X.; Henry, G.H.R.; McLeod, K.; Hofgaard, A. Reproduction and seedling establishment of Picea glauca across the northernmost forest-tundra region in Canada. Glob. Chang. Biol. 2017, 18, 322–3211.

359. Bader, M.Y.; Loranger, H.; Zotz, G.; Mendieta-Leiva, G. Responses of tree seedlings near the alpine treeline to delayed snowmelt and reduced sky exposure. Forests 2018, 9, 12. [CrossRef]

360. Bürzel, B.; Schickhoff, U.; Schwab, N.; Vernicke, L.M.; Müller, Y.K.; Böhning, J.; Chaudhary, R.P.; Scholten, T.; Oldeland, J. Seedling recruitment and facilitation dependence on safe sites characteristics in a Himalayan treeline ecotone. Plant Ecol. 2018, 219, 115–132. [CrossRef]

361. Davis, E.L.; Gedalof, Z. Limited prospects for future alpine treeline advance in the Canadian Rocky Mountains. Glob. Chang. Biol. 2018, 24, 4489–4504. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

362. Elliott, G.P.; Petrucelli, C.A. Tree recruitment at the treeline across the continental divide in the northern Rocky Mountains, USA: The role of spring cover and autumn climate. Plant Ecol. Divers. 2018. [CrossRef]

363. Kambo, D.; Danby, R.K. Factors influencing the establishment and growth of tree seedlings at Subarctic alpine treeline. Ecosphere 2018, 9. [CrossRef]
364. Lett, S.; Dorrepaal, E. Global drivers of tree seedling establishment at alpine treelines in a changing climate. *Funct. Ecol.* **2018**, *32*, 1666–1680. [CrossRef]

365. Angulo, M.A.; Ninot, J.M.; Peñuelas, J.; Cornelissen, J.H.C.; Grau, O. Tree sapling response to 10 years of experimental manipulation of temperature, nutrient availability, and shrub cover at the Pyrenean treeline. *Front. Plant Sci.* **2019**, *9*. [CrossRef]

366. Brodersen, C.R.; Germino, M.J.; Johnson, D.M.; Reinhardt, K.; Smith, W.K.; Resler, L.M.; Bader, M.Y.; Sala, A.; Kueppers, L.M.; Broll, G.; et al. Seedling survival at timberline critical to conifer mountain forest elevation and extent. *Front. For. Glob. Chang.* **2019**, *2*. [CrossRef]

367. Holtmeier, F.-K. Der Einfluß der generativen und vegetativen Verjüngung auf das Verbreitungsmuster der Bäume und die ökologische Dynamik im Waldgrenzbereich. Beobachtungen und Untersuchungen in den Hochgebirgen Nordamerikas und in den Alpen. *Geökodynamik* **1993**, *14*, 153–182.

368. Marr, J.W. The development and movement of tree islands near the upper limit of tree growth in the southern Rocky Mountains. *Ecology* **1977**, *58*, 1159–1164. [CrossRef]

369. Kullman, L. Transplantation experiments with saplings of Betula pubescens ssp. tortuosa near the tree-limit in central Sweden. *Holart. Ecol.* **1984**, *7*, 289–293. [CrossRef]

370. Kullman, L. Pine (Pinus sylvestris L.) tree limit surveillance during recent decades, Central Sweden. *Arct. Alp. Res.* **1993**, *25*, 24–31. [CrossRef]

371. Hobbie, S.E.; Chapin, F.S. An experimental test of limits to tree establishment in Arctic tundra. *J. Ecol.* **1998**, *86*, 449–461. [CrossRef]

372. Germino, M.J.; Smith, W.K.; Resor, A.C. Conifer seedling distribution and survival in an alpine-treeline ecotone. *Plant Ecol.* **2002**, *162*, 157–168. [CrossRef]

373. Dullinger, S.; Dirnböck, T.; Grabherr, G. Modelling climate change-driven treeline shifts. Relative effects of temperature increase, dispersal and invisibility. *J. Ecol.* **2004**, *92*, 241–252. [CrossRef]

374. Moen, J.; Cairns, D.M.; Lafon, C.W. Factors structuring the treeline ecotone in Fennoscandia. *Plant Ecol. Divers.* **2008**, *1*, 77–87. [CrossRef]

375. Batllori, E.; Camarero, J.J.; Ninot, J.M.; Gutiérrez, E. Seedling recruitment, survival and facilitation in Pinus uncinata tree line ecotones. Implications and potential response to climate warming. *Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.* **2009**, *19*, 460–472. [CrossRef]

376. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. Response of Scots pine (Pinus sylvestris) to warming climate at its altitudinal limit in northernmost Subarctic Finland. *Arctic* **2011**, *64*, 269–280. [CrossRef]

377. Treml, V.; Šenfeldr, M.; Chuman, T.; Ponocná, T.; Demková, K. Twentieth century treeline ecotone advance in the Sudetes Mountains (Central Europe) was induced by agricultural land abandonment rather than climate change. *J. Veg. Sci.* **2016**, *27*, 1207–1221. [CrossRef]

378. Bruening, J.M.; Bunn, A.G.; Salzer, M.W. A climate-driven tree line position model in the White Mountains of California over the past six millenia. *J. Biogeogr.* **2018**, *45*, 1067–1076. [CrossRef]

379. Harsh, M.A.; Buxton, R.; Duncan, R.P.; Hulme, P.E.; Wardle, P.; Wilmshurst, J. Causes of treeline stability: Stem growth, recruitment and mortality rates over 15 years at New Zealand Nothofagus tree lines. *J. Biogeogr.* **2012**, *29*, 2051–2071.

380. Vitali, A.; Camarero, J.J.; Garbarino, M.; Piermattei, A.; Urbinati, C. Deconstructing human-shaped treelines: Microsite topography and distance from the seed source control Pinus nigra colonization of treeless areas in the Italian Apennines. *For. Ecol. Manag.* **2017**, *406*, 37–45. [CrossRef]

381. Srur, A.M.; Villaля, R.; Rodriguez-Catón, M.; Amoroso, M.M.; Marcotti, E. Climate and Nothofagus pumilio establishment at upper treelines in the Patagonian Andes. *Front. Earth Sci.* **2018**. [CrossRef]

382. Moser, M. Die ektotrophe Ernährungsweise an der Waldgrenze. *Mitt. der forstl. Bundesvers. Wien* **1967**, *75*, 357–380.

383. Schinner, F. Die subalpine Waldgrenze und Bedeutung der Mykotrophie im Gasteiner Tal. In *Ökologische Analysen von Almflächen im Gasteiner Tal*; Cernusca, A., Ed.; Veröffentlichungen des Österreichischen Maß-Hochgebirgsprogramms Hohe Tauern: Innsbruck, Austria, 1978; pp. 311–314.

384. Magnusson, S.H.; Magnusson, B. Effect of enhancement of willow (Salix spp.) on establishment of birch (Betula pubescens) on eroded soils in Iceland. Man and Biosphere Series. In *Nordic Birch Ecosystems*; Wielgolaski, F.E., Ed.; The Partenon Publishing Group: News York, NY, USA; Toronto, ON, Canada, 2001; pp. 317–329.
385. Haselwandter, K. Mycorrhiza in the alpine timberline ecotone: Nutritional implications. In *Trees at Their Upper Limit. Treeline Limitation at the Alpine Timberline*. Plant Ecophysiology; Wieser, G., Tausz, M., Eds.; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2007; pp. 57–66.

386. Reithmeier, L.; Kernaghan, G. Availability of ectomycorrhizal fungi to black spruce above the present treeline in eastern Labrador. *PLoS ONE* 2013, 8, e777527. [CrossRef]

387. Nara, K.; Hogetsu, T. Ecotomycorrhizal fungi on established shrubs facilitate subsequent seedling establishment of successional plant species. *Ecology* 2014, 85, 1700–1707. [CrossRef]

388. Nordfors, G.A. Något om den vegetative föryngringen i fjällskog. *Norrl. Skovårdsförbunds Tisk.* 1923, 1–45.

389. Holtmeier, F.-K.; Broll, G. Layering in the Rocky Mountain treeline ecotone. *Trees* 2017, 31, 953–965. [CrossRef]

390. Kauhanen, H. On growth problems of mountain birch near its distributional limits. *Erdkunde* 1985, 39, 271–285. [CrossRef]

391. Karlsson, P.S.; Weih, M. Soil temperatures near the distribution limit of the mountain birch (Betula pubescens ssp. czerepanovii): Implications for seedling nitrogen economy and survival. *Arct. Antarct. Alp. Res.* 2001, 33, 88–92. [CrossRef]

392. Schröter, C. Das Pflanzenleben der Alpen. Eine Schilderung der Hochgebirgsflora; Raustein: Zürich, Switzerland, 1908.

393. Fries, T.E. Botanische Untersuchungen im nördlichen Schweden I. Ein Beitrag zur Kenntnis der alpinen und subalpinen Vegetation in Torne Lappmark. *Flora och Fauna* 1913, 2, 361.

394. Buckner, D.L. Ribbon Forest Development and Maintenance in the Central Rocky Mountains of Colorado. Ph.D. Thesis, University of Colorado, Boulder, CO, USA, 1977.

395. Daly, C. Snow distribution in the alpine krummholz zone. *Prog. Phys. Geogr.* 1984, 8, 157–175. [CrossRef]

396. Benedict, J.B. Rates of tree-island migration, Colorado Rocky Mountains. *Ecology* 1984, 65, 820–823. [CrossRef]

397. Johnson, D.M.; Germino, M.J.; Smith, W.K. Abiotic factors limiting photosynthesis in *Abies lasiocarpa* and *Picea engelmannii* seedlings below and above the alpine timberline. *Tree Physiol.* 2004, 24, 377–386. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

398. Kubisch, P.; Leuschner, C.; McNown, R.W.; Brownlee, A.H.; Sveinbjörnsson, B. Fine roots abundance and dynamics of stone pine (*Pinus cembra*) at the alpine treeline is not impaired by self-shading. *Front. Plant Sci.* 2017, 9, 602. [CrossRef]

399. Stimm, B. Morphologisch-anatomische Untersuchungen zur Ablegerbildung und sproßbürtigen Bewurzelung der Fichte (*Picea abies* (L.) Karst. *Flora* 1987, 179, 421–443. [CrossRef]

400. Caccianiga, M.; Payette, S. Recent advance of white spruce (*Picea glauca*) in the coastal tundra of the eastern shore of Hudson Bay (Quebec, Canada). *J. Biogeogr.* 2006, 33, 2120–2135. [CrossRef]

401. Takahashi, K.; Hirosawam, T.; Morishima, R. How the timberline formed: Altitudinal changes in stand structure and dynamics around the timberline in central Japan. *Ann. Bot.* 2012, 109, 1165–1174. [CrossRef]
411. Sveinbjörnsson, B.; Hofgaard, A.; Lloyd, A. Natural causes of the tundra-taiga boundary. *Ambio Spec. Rep.* 2002, 12, 23–29.

412. Wang, Y.; Pederson, N.; Ellison, A.M.; Buckley, H.; Case, B.S.; Liang, E.; Camarero, J.J. Increased stem density and competition may diminish positive effects of warming at alpine treeline. *Ecology* 2016, 97, 1668–1679. [CrossRef]

413. Auer, C. Untersuchungen über die natürliche Verjüngung der Lärche im Arven-Lärchenwald des Oberengadins. *Mitt. der Schweiz. Anst. für das Forstl. Vers.* 1947, 25, 3–140.

414. Schönenberger, W. Standortseinflüsse auf Versuchsauforstungen an der alpinen Waldgrenze. *Mitt. Eidgenössische Anst. für das Forstl. Vers.* 1975, 51, 359–428.

415. Weih, M.; Karlsson, P.S. The nitrogen economy of mountain birch seedlings: implications for winter survival. *J. Ecol.* 1999, 87, 211–219. [CrossRef]

416. Liang, E.; Wang, Y.; Piao, S.; Lu, X.; Camarero, J.J.; Zhu, H.; Zhu, L.; Ellison, A.M.; Ciais, P. Specis interactions slow warming-induced upward shifts of treelines on the Tibetan Plateau. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2016, 113, 4380–4385. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

417. Vuorinen, K.E.M.; Oksanen, L.; Oksanen, T.; Pyykönen, A.; Olofson, J.; Virtanen, R. Open tundra persist, but arctic features decline—Vegetation changes in the warming Fennoscandian tundra. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2017, 23, 3794–3807. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

418. Chhetri, P.K.; Cairns, D.M. Low recruitment above treeline indicates treeline stability under changing climate in Dhorpatan Hunting Reserve, Western Nepal. *Phys. Geogr.* 2018, 39, 324–342. [CrossRef]

419. Frei, E.R.; Bianchi, E.; Bernareggi, G.; Bebi, P.; Dawes, M.A.; Brown, C.D.; Trant, A.J.; Mamet, S.D.; Rixen, C. Biotic and abiotic drivers of tree seedling recruitment across an alpine treeline ecotone. *Sci. Rep.* 2018, 8, 10894. [CrossRef]

420. Cramer, W. Modeling the possible impact of climate change in broad-scale vegetation structure: Examples from northern Europe. In *Global Change and Arctic Terrestrial Ecological Studies*; Oechel, W.C., Callaghan, T., Gilmore, T., Holten, J., Maxwell, B., Molau, U., Sveinbjörnsson, B., Eds.; Springer: New York, NY, USA, 1997.

421. Bekker, M.F.; Malanson, G.P.; Alftine, K.J.; Cairns, D.M. Feedback and pattern in computer simulations of the alpine treeline ecotone. In *GIS and Remote Sensing Applications in Biogeography and Ecology*; Millington, A.C., Walsh, S.J., Osborne, P.E., Eds.; Springer International Series in Engineering and Computer Science Book Series: New York, NY, USA, 2001.

422. Rupp, T.S.; Chapin III, F.S.; Starfield, A.M. Modeling the influence of topographic barriers on treeline advance at the forest-tundra ecotone in northwestern Alaska. *Clim. Chang.* 2001, 48, 399–416. [CrossRef]

423. Rickebusch, S.; Lischke, H.; Guisan, A.; Zimmermann, N.E. Understanding the low-temperature limitations to forest growth through calibration of a forest dynamics model with tree-ring data. *For. Ecol. Manag.* 2007, 246, 251–263. [CrossRef]

424. Zeng, Y.; Malanson, G.P. Endogenous fractal dynamics at alpine treeline ecotones. *Geogr. Anal.* 2008, 38, 271–287. [CrossRef]

425. Diaz-Varela, R.A.; Colombo, R.; Meroni, M.; Calvo-Iglesias, M.S.; Buffoni, A.; Tagliaferri, A. Spatio-temporal analysis of alpine ecotones: A spatial explicit model targeting altitudinal vegetation shifts. *Ecol. Model.* 2010, 221, 621–633. [CrossRef]

426. Macias-Fauria, M.; Johnson, E.A. Warming-induced upslope advance of subalpine forests is severely limited by geomorphic processes. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2013, 110, 8117–8122. [CrossRef]

427. Case, B.S.; Hale, J. Using novel metrics to access biogeographic patterns of abrupt treelines in relation to biotic influences. *Progr. Phys. Geogr.* 2005, 39, 310–335. [CrossRef]

428. Weiss, D.J.; Malanson, G.P.; Walsh, S.J. Multiscale relationships between alpine treeline elevation and hypothesized environmental controls in the Western United States. *Ann. Assoc. Am. Geogr.* 2015, 105, 437–453. [CrossRef]

429. Alatalo, J.M.; Ferrari, A. Braking effect of climate and topography on global change-induced upslope forest expansion. *Int. J. Biometeorol.* 2016, 61, 541–548. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

430. Bobrowski, M.; Gertsz, L.; Schickhoff, U. Modelling the potential distribution of Betula utilis in the Himalaya. *Glob. Chang. Conserv.* 2017, 11, 69–83. [CrossRef]

431. Kruse, S.; Gerdes, A.; Kath, N.J.; Herzschuh, U. Implementing spatially explicit wind-driven seed and pollen dispersal in the individual-based larch simulation model: LAVESI-WIND 1.0. *Geosci. Model Dev.* 2018, 11, 4451–4456. [CrossRef]
432. Thuiller, W. Patterns and uncertainties of species’ range shifts under climate change. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2004, 10, 2020–2027. [CrossRef]

433. Araújo, M.B.; Pearson, R.G.; Thuiller, W.; Erhard, M. Validation of species-climate impact models under climate change. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2005, 11, 1504–1513. [CrossRef]

434. Elith, J.; Graham, C.H.; Anderson, R.P.; Dudík, M.; Ferrier, S.; Guisan, A.; Hijmans, R.J.; Huerthmann, F.; Leathwick, J.R.; Lehmann, A.; et al. Novel methods improve prediction of species’ distribution from occurrence data. *Ecography* 2006, 29, 129–151. [CrossRef]

© 2019 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).