Short communication. Recruitment and early growth of *Pinus pinaster* seedlings over five years after a wildfire in NW Spain

L. Calvo*, O. Torres, L. Valbuena and E. Luis-Calabuig

*Area of Ecology. Faculty of Biological and Environmental Sciences. University of León. 24071 León, Spain*

**Abstract**

**Aim of study:** The main aim of this study was to analyse the post-fire recruitment and growth of *Pinus pinaster* seedlings during the first five years after wildfire and also to analyse the effects of climatic conditions on the survival of *P. pinaster* seedlings.

**Area of study:** The study area was located in a *P. pinaster* stand in León province (NW Spain) burned in 1998.

**Material and methods:** Three sites in the burned area were selected. In each site three permanent transects of 20 m × 1 m were placed. In each transect, twenty 1 m² sampling units were marked and the number and height of each pine seedlings was recorded at 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12 months and 2, 3, 4 and 5 years after the wildfire. The soil of study area is Cambisol.

**Mean results:** Mean *Pinus* regeneration densities varied between 33.2 seedlings/m² after 7 months and 6 seedlings/m² five years after wildfire. In this *P. pinaster* stand, maximum mortality appeared during the summer months in the first year of regeneration. There was a significant increase in seedling height associated with a decrease in density.

**Research highlights:** The post-fire recruitment is considered enough to ensure good natural *Pinus pinaster* forest regeneration. In the short term post-fire management strategy in this type of forest could be the remaining branches with cones of burned trees that allow the dissemination of the seeds during the first few years after fire and ensure natural regeneration.

**Key words:** fire effects; natural regeneration; León province (NW Spain); seedlings density; growth and survival.

**Introduction**

The population of *Pinus pinaster* Ait. in the Sierra de Teleno (NW Spain) is characterised by high frequency lightning fires (>1 fire 100 km² year⁻¹) (Gil et al., 1991, Tapias et al., 2004). Thus fire recurrence, in addition to factors such as climate and site quality, has affected the characteristics of the population in the Sierra de Teleno, such as the fact that 97% of the *Pinus* trees are serotinous and produce a large number of mostly serotinous cones (Gil et al., 1991).

Since *P. pinaster* is a seeder species and has fixed serotinility in this population (Tapias et al., 2004), its regeneration relies on the recruitment of a post-fire cohort of seedlings. It produces an abundant yearly seed crop, part of which is held in serotinous cones, thus constituting a cumulative canopy seed bank, as occurs in other types of Mediterranean pine species (de las Heras et al., 2002). Post-fire regeneration of *P. pinaster* depends mainly on the canopy seed bank (Calvo et al., 2008). Seed germination and seedling recruitment occur in the resource-rich environment generated by fire (Luis-Calabuig et al., 2002; Rego et al., 1991). In general, post-fire seed germination takes place almost exclusively during the first post-fire stages, as in the case of *P. halepensis* (Arianoutsou and Ne’eman, 2000). Seedling mortality has been reported in the first post-fire year (Thanos et al., 1996) or at some locations during the second year (Ne’eman, 1997).

Seedling establishment, growth and mortality have been described widely for *P. halepensis* over much of its range (De la Heras et al., 2002; Herranz et al., 1997; Thanos et al., 1996); however, studies of *P. pinaster* recruitment are still limited (Calvo et al., 2003; Gallegos et al., 2003; Rego et al., 1991). Therefore, it is necessary to extend knowledge about the post-fire
regeneration and recruitment of \textit{Pinus} seedlings, as well as the possible influence of climatic conditions on the regeneration process, since these factors will provide an ecological basis for defining a suitable management strategy.

The main goal of this study is to analyse the post-fire recruitment and growth of \textit{P. pinaster} seedlings during the first five years after fire in a population with adaptations to recurrent fires. Similarly, we try to define the influence of climatic conditions on the survival of \textit{P. pinaster} seedlings.

**Material and methods**

**Study area**

The study area is located in a \textit{P. pinaster} stand in the Sierra del Teleno, León province (NW Spain), at an elevation of 1,100 m. In this area, 3,000 ha were burned by a wildfire in September 1998. The vegetation present in the area before the fire was dominated by 60-85 year old \textit{Pinus pinaster} trees, with a density of 500-900 trees/ha.

The climate is Mediterranean with 2-3 months dryness in summer and annual precipitation of 650 to 900 mm (Ministerio de Agricultura, 1980). Mean annual temperature is 10.3°C and the soil is Cambisol (Junta de Castilla y León, 1987).

We selected three sites in the burned area: S1, S2 and S3. All of them were situated at a gentle slope (< 10%) and showed homogeneity in tree characteristics. Site 1 (S1) was north-facing (42° 16’ 16” N; 6° 11’ 52” W); site S2 was S-W facing (42° 15’ 30” N; 6° 11’ 24” W) and site S3 was N-W facing (42° 15’ 10” N; 6° 11’ 03” W).

**Sampling data**

In each study site three permanent transects of 20 m × 1 m were placed perpendicular to the slope. The burned pines remained in the sites during the study period. In each transect, twenty 1 m² sampling units were marked and the number and height of each pine seedlings was recorded at 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12 months and 2, 3, 4 and 5 years after the wildfire.

**Statistical analysis**

A two-way repeated measures analysis of variance was carried out to compare changes in the density and height of \textit{Pinus} seedlings in different sites (S1, S2 and S3) over time, using time as the repeated measure. The Tukey test was used to assess whether differences were significant ($p = 0.05$). The David et al. (1954) test was used to check normality and the Cochran (1941) test was used to check homoscedasticity. The Kolmogorov-Smirnov test was used to check the normality.

Correlations between the densities of \textit{P. pinaster}, precipitation (mm) and aridity index of Martonne were tested. We also evaluated the correlations between the densities and the mean seedling height. Correlation was calculated by Pearson coefficients.

**Results**

\textit{Pinus pinaster} highest seedlings densities (Fig. 1) were recorded during 7th month at sites S1 and S3 and during the 8th month at S2. There was great heterogeneity in seedling densities among the three sites with significant differences ($F_{2.78} = 33.10, p < 0.01$) among them during the initial years of regeneration. In general, mean regeneration densities varied between 33.2 seedlings/m² after 7 months and 6 seedlings/m² five years after wildfire.

Analysis of seedling dynamics in each site through time (Fig. 1) showed a significant decrease ($F_{9.552} = 220.0; p < 0.01$) in S1 from the 7th month (76.3 seedling/m²) to the 10th month (17.4 seedling/m²). However, from this month onward, there were no significant temporal differences, reaching 9 seedlings/m² during the 5th year. The site S2, with the lowest seedling density, presented a less marked decrease during the initial months of regeneration, reaching 4.68 seedlings/m² at 5th year. In S3, changes in seedling density behaviour were similar to S1 and a significant decrease ($F_{4.552} = 37.97; p < 0.01$) was observed from the 7th month (17.2 seedlings/m²) until the 9th (8 seedlings/m²). No significant changes were subsequently observed at this site. In general, at sites with the highest \textit{Pinus} seedling density (S1 and S3) two important decrease points were observed, one between the 7th and 8th months and a second during the summer months: July, August and September (months 10, 11 and 12, respectively) in the first post-fire year.

Positive correlation was observed between precipitation, aridity of Martonne and the total density of \textit{P. pinaster} seedlings, although these were not significant in any of the study sites.
Mean seedling height showed (Table 1) a significant increase in time (5 years) at the three study sites, S1 (from 1.92 to 45.79 cm) \((F_{9,495} = 469.7; p < 0.01)\); S2 \((F_{9,495} = 145.2; p < 0.01)\) (from 1.29 to 40.76 cm) and S3 \((F_{9,495} = 279.9; p < 0.01)\) from 1.89 to 65.06 cm. However, the increase was more pronounced from 24 months after fire. Site S3 showed the greatest height (65.06 cm) 5 years after fire. The correlation analysis between mean number of Pinus seedlings and mean seedling height showed a significant negative correlation in S1 \((r = -0.28, p < 0.05)\), S2 \((r = -0.10, p < 0.05)\) and S3 \((r = -0.13, p < 0.05)\). The site with

**Figure 1.** Mean number of Pinus seedlings/m² and standard error in the three study sites (S1, S2, S3) through time.

**Table 1.** Mean height (cm) of Pinus seedlings, standard error and range (minimum-maximum) of height values in the three study sites (S1, S2, S3) through time. Different letters indicate significant differences in each study site through time

| Months after wildfire | Study sites | S1 | Range (cm) | S2 | Range (cm) | S3 | Range (cm) |
|-----------------------|-------------|----|------------|----|------------|----|------------|
|                       | X           | SE | Range (cm) | X  | SE         | X  | SE         | X  | SE         |
| 7                     | 1.92 a      | 0.03 | 0.5-4      | 1.29 a      | 0.04 | 0.5-3      | 1.89 a      | 0.04 | 0.5-4      |
| 8                     | 4.58 a      | 0.04 | 2.0-8.0    | 3.18 a      | 0.14 | 1-5        | 3.74 ab     | 0.04 | 1-7        |
| 9                     | 4.24 ab     | 0.07 | 2.0-8.0    | 4.00 a      | 0.05 | 2-6.5      | 4.68 ab     | 0.08 | 2-10       |
| 10                    | 5.41 b      | 0.10 | 2.0-10.0   | 4.77 a      | 0.12 | 2-9        | 6.48 ab     | 0.12 | 2.5-15     |
| 11                    | 6.21 b      | 0.17 | 2.0-16.0   | 5.64 a      | 0.21 | 2-18       | 8.69 b      | 0.19 | 2-19       |
| 12                    | 6.62 b      | 0.19 | 1.5-18     | 5.45 a      | 0.2  | 2-13.5     | 9.13 b      | 0.21 | 1.5-22     |
| 24                    | 10.97 c     | 0.4  | 2-35       | 12.17 b     | 0.61 | 2-40       | 21.32 c     | 1.02 | 3-60.5     |
| 36                    | 23.23 d     | 0.8  | 3-66       | 25.08 c     | 1.59 | 5-69       | 38.99 d     | 1.84 | 5-94       |
| 48                    | 34.57 e     | 1.22 | 3-87       | 32.35 d     | 1.6  | 3-87       | 48.42 e     | 2.40 | 3-120      |
| 60                    | 45.79 f     | 1.67 | 4-113      | 40.76 e     | 2.23 | 5-103      | 65.06 f     | 4.18 | 14-132     |
low *Pinus* density (S3 = 4.53 seedlings/m²) during the fifth year (Fig. 1) showed the tallest saplings (65.06 cm) (Table 1).

**Discussion**

The high density of seedlings after fire shows that there was good natural regeneration of *P. pinaster* in the study area. The density of seedlings is higher than those reported by other authors (Gallegos *et al*., 2003) in studies carried out in a *P. pinaster* forest in the south of Spain. The large proportion of serotinous cones in Sierra del Teleno’s population (Tapias *et al*., 2004) that allowed good seeds protection against fire could explain these differences.

First post-fire establishment of *Pinus pinaster* in the study sites occurred 7 months after fire in the rich-resource environment generated by the fire passage. This early seedling establishment may be related to the great dissemination power of pines and its heliophily (Thanos *et al*., 1996). In general, the great seedling recruitment occurs during the first post-fire years, although we observed sporadic emergence of seedlings until the fifth year, similar to the results found by Herranz *et al.* (1997). These new seedlings may come mainly from adhering serotinous cones on the burned trees that were present in the study zone.

The results obtained showed great heterogeneity in the regeneration process among study sites (S1 and S3 greater than S2) regardless of being located at the same elevation and slope. These differences could be explained by the different exposure of sites S1 (North), S3 (North-West) and S2 (South-West). Some authors (Gracia *et al*., 2002) explain that the number of *Pinus* in north- or northwest-facing areas was higher than in west-facing areas.

These differences among sites were also found in the analysis of the seedlings density dynamics after fire. A significant decrease was observed in zones S1 and S3 (sites with a higher seedling density) from the 7th to the 10th regeneration month. The main cause of pine seedling mortality was the harsh meteorological conditions, particularly summer drought as has been found by other authors (Madrigal *et al*., 2005; Thanos *et al*., 1996; Trabaud *et al*., 1997). In this sense, in our study sites the precipitation in the summer (64.7 mm) and also the average annual precipitation in the first post-fire year (354.7 mm) were extremely low (an approximate reduction of 75%) in comparison with the mean annual precipitation (718.48 mm) for the area in the following years.

Seedling height increments were more pronounced from the 2nd year after the fire and showed inter-site variability. So five years after fire the S3 site showed the tallest saplings with significant negative correlation between density and height. Some authors have related the enhanced growth of pine seedlings to soil characteristics (Ne’eman, 1997; Pausas *et al*., 2003). In our study the soils at site S3 showed the highest quantity of nitrogen and organic matter (Calvo *et al*., 2008).

In conclusion, in the study area seedling density was high enough to ensure natural regeneration of *P. pinaster* forest. The sites with higher densities (S1 and S3) showed greater seedling mortality during the first post-fire summer. However, site S2, with lower densities, showed less pronounced changes. During the first two years great recruitment of new seedlings was observed from cones which were opened but not killed by heat, and which remained on trees and were able to shed seeds during this time. No significant correlations were found between *Pinus* seedling densities and environmental factors (precipitation, and aridity index). The site with low *Pinus* density (S3) during the fifth year after fire showed the tallest saplings.

In the short term post-fire management strategy in this type of *Pinus pinaster* forest could be the remaining branches with cones of burned trees that allow the dissemination of the seeds during the first few years after fire, and ensure natural regeneration. In medium term, probably thinning of this type of forest would be a good management treatment to improve seedlings growth and to reduce fuel accumulation.

**Acknowledgements**

The study was developed as part of project LE17/99 subsidized by the Junta de Castilla y León (Spain).

**References**

Arianoutsou M, Ne’eman G, 2000. Post-fires regeneration of natural *Pinus halepensis* forest in the east Mediterranean basin. In: Ecology, biogeography and management of *Pinus halepensis* and *Pinus brutia* forest ecosystems in the Mediterranean Basin Ne’eman G, Trabaud L, eds). Backhuys Publishers, Leiden, Netherlands. pp: 269-289.
Calvo L, Santalla S, Marcos E, Valbuena L, Tárrega R, Luis E, 2003. Regeneration after wildfire in one community dominated by obligate seeder Pinus pinaster and in another dominated by a typical resprouter Quercus pyrenaica. For Ecol Man 184: 209-223.

Calvo L, Santalla S, Valbuena L, Marcos E, Tárrega, R, Luis-Calabuig L, 2008. Post-fire natural regeneration of a Pinus pinaster forest in NW Spain. Plant Ecol 197: 81-90.

Cochran WG, 1941. The distribution of the largest of a set estimated variances as a fraction of their total. Ann Eugen 11: 47-61.

David HA, Hartley MO, Pearson ES, 1954. The distribution of the ratio, in a single normal sample of range to standard deviation. Biometrika 41: 482-493.

De las Heras J, Martínez-Sánchez JJ, González-Ochoa AI, Ferrandis P, Herranz JM, 2002. Establishment of Pinus halepensis Mill. Saplings following fire: effects of competition with shrub species. Acta Oecol 23: 91-97.

Gallegos V, Navarro R, Fernández P, Valle G, 2003. Postfire regeneration in Pinus pinea L. and Pinus pinaster Aiton in Andalucía (Spain). Environm Manag 31: 86-99.

Gil L, Gordo J, Alía R, Catalán G, Pardos JA, 1991. Pinus pinaster Aiton en el paisaje vegetal de la Península Ibérica. Ecología. Fuera de Serie 1: 469-495.

Gracia M, Retana J, Roig P, 2002. Mid-term successional patterns after fire of mixed pine-oak forest in NE Spain. Acta Oecol 23: 405-411.

Herranz JM, Martínez-Sánchez JJ, Marín A, Ferrandis P, 1997. Post-fire regeneration of Pinus halepensis Miller in a semi-arid area in Albacete province (south-eastern Spain). Ecoscience 4: 86-90.

Junta de Castilla y León, 1987. Mapa de suelos de Castilla y León. Junta de Castilla y León, Spain.

Luis-Calabuig E, Torres O, Valbuena L, Calvo L, Marcos E, 2002. Impact of large fires on a community of Pinus pinaster. In: Fire and biological processes (Trabaud L, Prodon R, eds). Backhuys Publishers, Leiden. pp: 1-12.

Madrigal J, Hernando C, Martínez E, Gujarro M, Diez C, 2005. Regeneración post-incendio de Pinus pinaster Ait. en la Sierra de Guadarrama (Sistema Central, España): modelos descriptivos de los factores influyentes en la densidad inicial y supervivencia. Invest Agrar Sist Recur For 14: 36-51.

Ministerio de Agricultura, 1980. Caracterización agroclimática de la provincia de León. Dirección General de Producción Agraria, Subdirección General de la Producción Vegetal, Madrid, Spain.

Ne’eman G, 1997. Regeneration of natural pine forest-review of work done after the 1989 fire in Mount Carmel, Israel. Int J of Wildland Fire 7: 295-306.

Pausas JG, Ouadah N, Ferran A, Gimeno T, Vallejo R, 2003. Fire severity and seedling establishment in Pinus halepensis woodlands, eastern Iberian Peninsula. Plant Ecol 169: 205-213.

Rego FC, Bunting SC, Silva JM, 1991. Changes in understorey vegetation following prescribed fire in maritime pine forest. For Ecol and Manag 41: 21-31.

Tapias R, Climent J, Pardos JA, Gil L, 2004. Life histories of Mediterranean pines. Plant Ecol 171: 53-68.

Thanos CA, Daskakakou EN, Nikolaidou S, 1996. Early post-fire regeneration of a Pinus halepensis forest on Mount Parnis, Greece. J Veg Sci 7: 273-280.

Trabaud L, Martinez Sánchez JJ, Ferrandis P, González Ochoa AI, Herranz JM, 1997. Above-ground vegetation and soil seed bank: The contribution to the cyclical stability of a mixed pine forest of Pinus halepensis and P. pinaster. Canadian Journal of Botany 75: 1012-1021.