Are preventive measures adequate? An evaluation of the implementation of COVID-19 prevention and control measures in nursing homes in China

Meihong Shi
West China school of nursing Sichuan University/ West China Hospital, Southwest Medical University
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4349-7163

Fengying Zhang
Sichuan University West China Hospital

Xinxin He
Southwest Medical University

Siyuan Huang
Southwest Medical University

MingFeng Zhang
Southwest Medical University

Xiuying Hu ( westchinahuxiuying@163.com )
Sichuan University West China Hospital  https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1774-6370

Research article

Keywords: COVID-2019, Nursing homes, Prevention and control, Implementation, Evaluation

DOI: https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-46152/v1

License: ☑️ This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.
Read Full License
Abstract

Background

The COVID-19 pandemic has been a challenge for nursing homes in China. Nursing homes are particularly dangerous places regarding the spread of COVID-19 given that they house vulnerable, high-risk populations. As such, several useful guidelines for coping with COVID-19 in nursing homes have been provided. However, the actual implementation rates of such guidelines are unknown. This study aims to document the adherence of nursing homes to the Ministry of Civil Affairs guidelines for COVID-19 prevention and control in nursing homes.

Methods

A cross-sectional study was conducted among 484 nursing homes in 136 cities of 28 provinces in China. A self-report questionnaire was created based on the Ministry of Civil Affairs guidelines for COVID-19 prevention and control in nursing homes (first edition). The questionnaire was sent to nursing home managers via the Wenjuanxing app online from February 7 to 29, 2020. A total of 461 responses were included in the analysis.

Results

The implementation rates of COVID-19 prevention and control measures in nursing homes were moderate, with an average rate of 80.0%. The average implementation rates for hygienic behaviour management, access management, and environmental disinfection management were 75.3%, 78.7%, and 79.9%, respectively. Nursing homes that did not have hospital-nursing home cooperation, did not have medical staff, and had not established a quarantine unit (room) had low implementation rates (p < 0.01). The number of medical staff, education level of the manager, nursing home size, and establishment of quarantine room/unit were found to be strongly positively associated with the total implementation rate (p < 0.01).

Conclusion

Overall, the implementation of prevention and control measures by nursing homes are insufficient during the epidemic in China. Further education for staff and cooperation with hospitals are required to improve the implementation rate. It is urgent for nursing homes to improve the management system to ensure the safety and effectiveness of the emergency.

Background

The COVID-19 pandemic has affected the entire world\(^1\), with more than 10.2 million confirmed cases and 500 thousand casualties. As the COVID-19 pandemic has continued, it has challenged the health system and impacted the lives of humans around the world. Given the absence of effective pharmaceutical interventions, non-pharmacological interventions (NPIs) are required to decrease disease transmission\(^2\).  
The adoption of non-pharmaceutical interventions such as mass confinement, social isolation, increased sanitation, and strict quarantine measures has proven to be beneficial in containing the virus[3].

Nursing homes are particularly dangerous places regarding the spread of COVID-19 given that they house vulnerable, high-risk populations. Older people are susceptible to novel coronavirus pneumonia[4][5]. Approximately 12.6% of the approximately 55 million adults aged 65 and over suffer from respiratory illness[6]. This high prevalence of respiratory illness among the elderly population explains why COVID-19 is particularly lethal among this age group. Elderly residents of nursing homes are considered extremely vulnerable to COVID-19 exposure, infection, and disease consequences due to their high incidence of chronic disease and poor health in general. Furthermore, nursing homes provide an ideal environment for the spread of COVID-19[7], as residents often live together in a crowded place, share sources of air and food, and share bedrooms and bathrooms. In the case of older vulnerable residents who usually require close care and therefore cannot completely adhere to social distancing guidelines both the residents and the workers around them are at high risk of becoming infected with COVID-19[8]. There are an increasing number of reports referencing the spread of novel coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) among nursing homes[7]. COVID-19 has been documented in most nursing homes throughout the United States[9]. As of May 28, 2020, 7,500 nursing homes reported 217,000 COVID-19 cases, and more than 44,000 coronavirus deaths had been reported in nursing and long-term care facilities, accounting for at least 50% of the country's deaths to date[10]. In European countries, such as Italy[11], Spain[12], and England[13], 40% ~ 57% of all COVID-10 deaths have occurred in nursing homes. Outbreaks in nursing homes can threaten the health care system[14], and the immediate implementation of prevention and control measures in nursing homes is needed. As such, several useful guidelines on coping with COVID-19 in nursing homes have been provided[15][16][17].

Approximately 4 million people reside in 31,997 nursing homes in China. Nursing home administrators faced challenges related to the potential spread of COVID-19 infections in nursing homes in late 2019. At the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic, from managers to the staff had no plan for the pandemic. There was no definite treatment for COVID-19, and prevention was considered the best possible defence at their disposal at that moment. Guidance for nursing homes did not become available until January 28, 2020. The Ministry of Civil Affairs published the first edition of the guidelines for COVID-19 prevention and control in nursing homes, which provided prevention and control measures to address the urgent issue. In these guidelines, the minimum standards for nursing homes were published.

All of the nursing homes in China faced the threat of COVID-19 and implemented similar strategies following the guidance of the Ministry of Civil Affairs, but the extent of their preparedness, the swiftness with which the decisions were made and the scale of the measures varied. This paper focuses on adherence to guidelines for reducing virus transmission in nursing homes in China. We argue that there is an urgent need to evaluate the implementation rate of prevention and control measures in different nursing homes and analyse the factors related to their implementation.
Methods

Recruitment of nursing homes

This was a cross-sectional study conducted online. We searched for open-access information about nursing homes on the Civil Affairs websites of all provinces of China. We used a computerized random number generator to draw a sample of 480 nursing homes, which included approximately 1.5% of all nursing homes in China. Given the high decline rate in the online survey, we drew another sample of 480 nursing homes as reserve nursing homes in case institutions declined to participate. We called the nursing homes and described the goal of our survey and asked if they would be interested in participating in our survey. In the first phase, of the 480 invited nursing homes, 270 institutions declined to participate. In the second phase, of the remaining 480 nursing homes, 206 nursing homes declined. Finally, 484 nursing homes agreed to participate in our survey.

Participants

Eligible participants were the managers of the 484 nursing homes. We added the managers as friends on the WeChat app, which is a social connection application widely used in China, and sent them the questionnaire through the app. The inclusion criteria were as follows: managers who were in charge of nursing homes, elderly care settings, or long-term care facilities in China and who agreed to fill out the questionnaire online. The exclusion criteria were a lack of knowledge about the nursing home’s actual situation and the completion of the questionnaire too quickly (in less than 120 s).

Questionnaire

A self-report questionnaire titled “A survey of the implementation of the prevention and control of COVID-19 in nursing homes during the pandemic” was created based on the Ministry of Civil Affairs guidelines for COVID prevention and control in nursing homes (first edition)\(^{15}\). The questionnaire included questions on manager characteristics, nursing home characteristics, the implementation of prevention and control measures, and nursing home needs during the pandemic. The implementation of prevention measures was divided into four aspects: basic management, access management, environmental disinfection management, and hygiene behaviour management. The validity of the questionnaire was 0.810. The Cronbach’s alpha coefficient was 0.866.

The questionnaires were sent to the managers of nursing homes. Managers were required to complete the questionnaire based on the nursing home’s actual situation. Managers were asked to indicate the frequency of the implementation of prevention and control measures in accordance with the recommendations of the Ministry of Civil Affairs in the nursing home they worked at during the last week on a 5-point Likert scale (1 = never, 2 = rarely, 3 = sometimes, 4 = most of time, 5 = always). The total implementation score was the sum of the item scores for the four parts. The average score = (item score ÷ total value) × 100. An average score below 70% was identified as unqualified, 70%~85% was identified as moderate, and above 85% was identified as good.
Data Collection

The questionnaire was sent to the participants via the Wenjuanxing app, which is an e-questionnaire app. All questions in the questionnaire were required to be answered, and the questionnaire could not be submitted if it was not complete. The survey was conducted between February 7 and February 29, 2020, approximately two weeks after the beginning of the roll-out of the quarantine across China. Finally, we received 484 unique responses. After duplicates (from managers in the same nursing home or the same manager) and unqualified responses were removed, the final sample included 461 responses, with an analytic response rate of 48.0%.

Data analysis

The data were analysed by IBM SPSS Statistics (version 25.0, IBM Corporation). A descriptive analysis was performed by percentile. The count data were expressed as the constituent ratio. The Wilcoxon test, Kruskal-Wallis test, and Spearman correlation analysis were used for statistical analysis.

Results

The sample was 43.0% women (n = 198), and the average age was 43.0 years (SD = 10.46, range = 20–78 years). Managers were from 461 nursing homes in 134 cities in 28 provinces, and the average tenure in the current nursing home was 6.6 years (SD = 5.4, range 1 to 30 years). A total of 4.3% of managers had a Master’s degree or above, 33.0% of managers had a Bachelor’s degree, 38.0% of managers had a technical college degree, 18.0% of managers had a high school diploma, and 6.7% had a junior high school diploma. There were 63188 older adults living in the 461 nursing homes, who were cared for by 16057 staff members (including managers, administrators, medical staff, nurse aides, and other staff members).

Table 1 shows the nursing home characteristics. Nursing homes that lacked medical support, such as those that did not have hospital-nursing home cooperation, did not have medical staff, and had not established a quarantine unit (room), had low prevention and control implementation rates (P < 0.01). Nursing homes that were government-owned, located in rural areas, were small (< 100 beds), and had a ratio of elderly residents to nurse aides above 15.00 also had low implementation scores (P < 0.05). (Table 1)
Table 1
Characteristics of the nursing homes and prevention and control implementation scores

| Characteristic                                      | Nursing homes | Total implementation score | H or Z value | P       |
|-----------------------------------------------------|---------------|----------------------------|--------------|---------|
|                                                     | n  | %  | Median (P25, P75)          |
| Ownership                                           |    |    |                             |
| Government-owned                                    | 93 | 20.2 | 145.0(117.5,157.5)         | 8.984        | 0.011*  |
| Private-owned                                       | 287| 62.3 | 151.0(133.0,162.0)         |
| Government-built, for-profit management             | 81 | 17.5 | 149.0(136.5,162.5)         |
| Location                                            |    |    |                             |
| Rural                                               | 75 | 16.3 | 145.0(113.0,159.0)         | -2.349       | 0.019*  |
| Urban                                               | 386| 83.7 | 150.0(133.0,161.0)         |
| Nursing homes size (number of beds)                 |    |    |                             |
| Small (< 100 beds)                                  | 149| 32.3 | 147.0(123.0,159.0)         | 7.018        | 0.015*  |
| Medium (100–200 beds)                               | 160| 34.7 | 148.5(132.0,160.0)         |
| Large (more than 200 beds)                          | 152| 33.0 | 152.5(135.2,164.0)         |
| Ratio of elderly residents to nurse aides           |    |    |                             |
| Above 15.00                                         | 50 | 10.8 | 139.0(112.5,158.7)         | 6.250        | 0.044*  |
| 10.01 ~ 15.00                                       | 34 | 7.4  | 148.5(125.5,159.0)         |
| Below 10.00                                         | 377| 81.8 | 151.0(133.0,161.0)         |
| Presence of hospital-nursing home cooperation       |    |    |                             |
| No                                                  | 353| 76.6 | 147.0(128.5,160.0)         | -2.62        | 0.009** |
| Yes                                                 | 108| 23.4 | 155.0(140.0,162.0)         |
| Number of medical staff                             |    |    |                             |
| None                                                | 91 | 19.7 | 137.0(112.0,158.0)         | 26.755       | 0.000** |
| 1 ~ 5                                               | 199| 43.2 | 148.0(131.0,160.0)         |
| 6 ~ 10                                              | 52 | 11.3 | 154.0(135.7,166.7)         |

Notes: ** p < 0.01, * p < 0.05
The implementation rate of COVID-19 prevention and control measures in nursing homes was generally moderate, with an average rate of 80.0%. Managers reported a high average level of compliance with guidelines for the basic management of nursing homes, with an implementation rate of up to 90.4%, but for access management and environmental disinfection management, the rates ranged from only 78.7–79.0%, respectively. Hygiene behaviour management had the lowest rate of 75.3% (Table 2).

| Characteristic                        | Nursing homes | Total implementation score | H or Z value | P    |
|---------------------------------------|---------------|----------------------------|--------------|------|
|                                       | n    | %      | Median (P25, P75)         |      |      |
| 11–20                                 | 51   | 11.0   | 155.0(143.0,162.0)        |      |      |
| > 20                                  | 68   | 14.8   | 155.0(143.0,164.7)        |      |      |
| Establishment of quarantine room/unit |      |        |                          |      |      |
| None                                  | 70   | 15.2   | 148.0(129.0,157.0)        | 15.862 | 0.000** |
| Quarantine room                       | 256  | 55.5   | 147.0(107.0,160.0)        |      |      |
| Quarantine unit                       | 135  | 29.3   | 155.0(124.0,165.0)        |      |      |

Notes: ** p < 0.01, * p < 0.05
| Items                                                                 | Total value | Average score (%) |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|-------------------|
| **1 Basic management**                                               |             |                   |
| 1.1 Implement home quarantine or in-nursing home quarantine for elderly residents who have left the nursing home | 5           | 94.0              |
| 1.2 Monitor body temperature of residents and staff                  | 5           | 81.4              |
| 1.3 Conduct bedroom patrol and daily active monitoring of symptoms. | 5           | 90.4              |
| 1.4 Provide residents with emotional support and psychological counselling during the pandemic | 5           | 81.4              |
| 1.5 Train staff to address COVID-19 and provide guidance for employees regarding the COVID-19 outbreak | 5           | 93.8              |
| 1.6 Keep an eye on the epidemic                                      | 5           | 96.0              |
| 1.7 Report to the local public health authorities and follow the guidance | 5           | 96.2              |
| **2 Access management**                                              |             |                   |
| 2.1 Notify elderly residents and family members of the suspension of all visitors to the nursing home | 5           | 97.6              |
| 2.2 Prohibit any visitors unless it is for “an end-of-life situation”. Register the visitor and monitor the temperature of visitors, and require them to wear face masks and disinfect their hands | 5           | 73.2              |
| 2.3 Arrange special reception rooms in the nursing home. Permit visitors in the reception room only under special circumstances, prohibit them from entering the living area | 5           | 58.8              |
| 2.4 Offer staff accommodation in nursing homes                       | 5           | 78.8              |
| 2.5 Perform centralized management of the accommodation site for staff | 5           | 46.6              |
| 2.6 Require staff who enter the nursing home to wear face masks and disinfect their hands | 5           | 64.8              |
| 2.7 Suspend all activities (consulting and reception services and unnecessary volunteer activities and social practices) | 5           | 92.2              |
| 2.8 Suspend the acceptance of new elderly residents                  | 5           | 93.2              |
| 2.9 Do not permit the residents to go out                            | 5           | 95.0              |
| 2.10 Arrange for one staff member to receive daily necessities, ordered materials and other packages from family members and disinfect them with 75% alcohol or chlorine disinfectant before giving them to the elderly residents | 5           | 86.4              |
| Items                                                                 | Total value | Average score (%) |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|-------------------|
| **3 Environmental disinfection management**                         | 35          | 79.0              |
| 3.1 Open windows for ventilation and improve air flow at least twice per day | 5           | 87.0              |
| 3.2 Wipe the residents’ bedrooms with clean water at least twice per week | 5           | 72.6              |
| 3.3 Disinfect the residents’ bedrooms with chlorine disinfectant at least twice per week | 5           | 76.8              |
| 3.4 Wipe offices and service areas, including switches, elevator buttons, doorknobs, handrails, faucets, tables, and chairs, with clean water at least twice per week | 5           | 70.4              |
| 3.5 Disinfect offices and service areas, including switches, elevator buttons, doorknobs, handrails, faucets, tables, and chairs, with chlorine disinfectant at least twice per week | 5           | 75.4              |
| 3.6 Disinfect the kitchen, toilet, laundry, and garbage disposal areas with chlorine disinfectant at least once per day | 5           | 78.8              |
| 3.7 Disinfect dining and drinking utensils at least three times per day | 5           | 91.6              |
| **4 Hygiene behaviour management**                                   | 60          | 75.3              |
| 4.1 Ask the residents to wash and disinfect their hands and maintain personal hygiene and help them do so | 5           | 80.6              |
| 4.2 Ask elderly residents to close the toilet lid before flushing | 5           | 68.0              |
| 4.3 Avoid eating together or communal meals, maintain physical distance, and suspend group activities | 5           | 77.0              |
| 4.4 Provide knowledge education to the residents about COVID-19 prevention and control | 5           | 62.2              |
| 4.5 Have staff wear face masks during working time | 5           | 90.0              |
| 4.6 Have residents wear face masks in public areas of the nursing home | 5           | 60.4              |
| 4.7 Have staff and residents wear face masks as appropriate and change into new face masks | 5           | 59.2              |
| 4.8 Have staff wash their hands with soap and water or disinfect their hands using alcohol-based hand sanitizers before touching the residents | 5           | 74.0              |
| 4.9 Have staff wash their hands with soap and water or disinfect their hands using alcohol-based hand sanitizers after touching the residents | 5           | 75.6              |
| 4.10 Ensure that staff appropriately dispose of garbage, sewage and filth | 5           | 82.6              |
| 4.11 Ensure that staff dispose or disinfect them face masks safely, without causing contamination. | 5           | 82.6              |
| 4.12 Have staff implement administrative provisions related to food safety | 5           | 90.4              |
Table 3 shows that the number of medical staff was related to the four aspects of the implementation of prevention and control measures. The education level of the manager, nursing home size, and establishment of quarantine room/unit were found to be positively associated with the total implementation score (p < 0.01).

### Table 3
Spearman correlation between the characteristics of the nursing homes and the prevention and control implementation scores

| Variables                              | Basic management | Access management | Environmental disinfection management | Hygienic behaviour management | Total implementation score |
|----------------------------------------|------------------|-------------------|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------|
| Education level of the manager         | .036             | .135**            | .064                                  | .185**                        | .211**                     |
| Ownership                              | .119*            | .070              | .001                                  | .705                          | .107*                      |
| Location                               | .153**           | .066              | .054                                  | .053                          | .110*                      |
| Nursing home size                      | .183**           | −.010             | 0.87                                  | .129**                        | .135**                     |
| Ratio of the elderly to nurse aides    | .149**           | .038              | .004                                  | .085                          | .111*                      |
| Presence of hospital-nursing home cooperation | .082           | .097*             | −.015                                 | .072                          | .122*                      |
| Number of medical staff                | .210**           | .134**            | .082                                  | .155**                        | .236**                     |
| Establishment of a quarantine room/unit| .109*            | .116*             | .075                                  | .142**                        | .180**                     |

Notes: ** p < 0.01, * p < 0.05

We also investigated the needs of nursing homes during the pandemic, and the results showed that the primary need was protective supplies, including face masks, gloves, alcohol, disinfectant, and; 72.0% of the nursing homes reported a lack of protective supplies. A total of 47.7% of the nursing homes reported staff shortages. Of the nursing homes, 43.8% were difficulties with operation. In addition, 38.0% of the...
elderly residents and staff needed psychological intervention during the lockdown period. Twenty-five percent of the nursing homes reported an inadequate supply of daily necessities (food, consumables, and basic medicine).

**Discussion**

Medical support is a key point in helping nursing homes face the threat of COVID-19

The COVID-19 outbreak spread rapidly across the world. Nursing homes are high-risk settings and face unprecedented challenges. Various preventive measures were implemented in nursing homes in China, including lockdowns, the restriction of visitors, the prohibition of the entry of the people from Wuhan City, 14-day isolation for returning staff and residents, and symptom monitoring for all of the staff and residents. Despite these strict measures, COVID-19 still found its way into 3 nursing homes in Wuhan Province in China that were included in this survey. We must be aware of the many problems and weaknesses in the management of nursing homes. In this study, the average implementation rate was 80.0%, which was at the medium level. The staff and residents in nursing homes generally lacked awareness, knowledge, and basic skills for preventing the spread of infectious disease, which made the guidelines insufficient. The study shows that nursing homes that lack medical support had low implementation rates. In particular, the number of medical staff was strongly related to the total implementation rate (p < 0.01). These findings indicate that medical staff in nursing homes are poised to play a pivotal role in improving the implementation of COVID-19 prevention and control measures. They can provide services to residents directly and provide training to other staff. However, not all nursing homes have doctors and nurses on their staff. In our survey, there were no medical staff (doctors, nurses, or pharmacists) in 19.7% of the nursing homes, as nursing homes tend to strive to create a family environment rather than a medical environment[18]. This scenario leads to preventive measures that cannot be closely followed. Studies in Singapore[19] and Spain[12] suggest that public healthcare workers should be sent into nursing homes to help improve preparedness for and the prevention and control of COVID-19. A study in Canada also reported the experience of the emergency response of an acute-care hospital to a nursing home[20]. Such hospital-nursing home partnerships are a new form of cooperation that has arisen during the COVID-19 pandemic.

A shortage of nurse aides in nursing homes decreases the total implementation rate

Nursing homes often face nurse aide shortages, which have been exacerbated by the current pandemic situation. Nurse aides have to work long shifts, perform high-intensity labour and complete a large amount of extra work during the pandemic because the nursing homes are experiencing high levels of absenteeism. The pandemic coincided with the Spring Festival. Some nurse aids who went home to reunite with their families were unable to return. Nurse aide shortages not only directly affect the achievement and maintenance of care quality in nursing homes but also affect the implementation of COVID-19 prevention and control measures. In our study, the ratio of elderly residents to nurse aides was found to be positively associated with the total implementation rate, which indicates that the fewer
residents each nurse aide cared for, the higher the implementation rate the nursing home achieved. However, nearly half (47.7%) of the nursing homes reported staff shortages. Even before the pandemic, it was difficult to recruit qualified nurse aides in China. Nurse aides are often described as special groups with low social status, lower education level, insufficient training, and poor wages. Other countries face the same problem[19][21][22]. Policies should be designed to ensure that nursing homes are adequately staffed and that infection control protocols are implemented with high quality[14]. Common strategies include having nurse aides extend their hours, asking nurse aides to sacrifice their rest time and encouraging the staff other than nurse aides to temporarily fill the nurse aide role.

Little preparation for the pandemic

COVID-19 has exposed long-standing problems in nursing homes. Given the shockingly high rates of infections and deaths in nursing homes, it is crucial for nursing homes to prepare. However, little planning for infectious disease pandemics has been undertaken in nursing homes. There was no absolute requirement for such planning in the previous policy. Furthermore, in terms of the management system, there is a lack of emergency response plans, emergency leadership committees and emergency supply reserve mechanisms in nursing homes. This is similar to the situation in other countries, such as Ireland[23] and the USA[14], where there is little preparation for pandemics in nursing homes. Even more troubling is that most nursing homes lack the essential materials to protect their residents and staff. In our survey, 72.0% of nursing homes reported a lack of protective supplies, including face masks, gloves, alcohol, disinfectant and PPE. They could not obtain access to the necessary supplies for prevention at the beginning of the pandemic. The shortage of protective supplies is still a problem in many countries[24]. In this light, nursing homes should reserve protective material for emergency use, intensify their efforts to acquire protective supplies during epidemics, improve access to essential resources, and develop optimal distribution strategies for when supplies are insufficient. During the pandemic period, there may be considerable pressure on nursing homes to maintain operation; 43.8% of the nursing homes reported having difficulties operating, and 25.6% of nursing homes reported an inadequate supply of daily necessities in this study. Given the similar lack of preparation and reserves in the nursing home sector during many other natural disasters[23], the COVID-19 pandemic raises questions regarding whether nursing home managers have learned from this experience. Nursing homes need to make emergency preparedness and emergency response plans to avoid future crises.

Access management should be strengthened

COVID-19 is an ongoing pandemic that is challenging nursing homes due to its high infectivity. It is forcing the implementation of drastic measures in nursing homes[25]. Nursing homes have adopted strict access and visitation restrictions according to the provided guidelines[26]. Overall, the rate of adherence to the guidelines for access management among nursing homes in this study was moderate, at 78.7%. However, it is uncertain whether the level of adherence can be maintained throughout the pandemic period. Staff are most likely to cause imported transmission[27]. Staff movements between their homes and nursing home facilities could transmit the disease. Because of limited living space, only 78.8% of
nursing homes can provide staff accommodations in nursing homes. Therefore, 21.2% of nursing home staff have to go home. To decrease the risk of the spread of COVID-19, one infection control measure is to house the staff in the nursing homes, which might mitigate the risk associated with staff moving between their homes and the facilities during the pandemic. If there is no living space in the nursing home, the staff should be centrally managed in an accommodation site without having contact with others. The staff responsible for purchasing should not contact staff who provide services to the residents. Access management is the key form of management; if not strictly implemented, nursing homes will be placed at great risk.

During the COVID-19 epidemic, most nursing homes in China have been completely closed and had little contact with the external environment, with nobody entering and nobody exiting. Lockdown and isolation are appropriate policies to limit the spread of COVID-19, but these measures impact people's mental health. Some residents and staff often feel lonely, anxious and depressed, and they struggle with the absence of relatives. In our study, 38.0% of elderly residents and staff needed psychological intervention during the lockdown period. It is unclear how long isolation will last, but the situations may worsen as enforced isolation continues.

Problems with environmental disinfection management

Environmental cleaning and disinfection are important precautionary measures to prevent indirect COVID-19 infections. Kampf et al. reported that coronaviruses can live on surfaces for up to 9 days. Adopting environmental cleaning and disinfection measures has proven to be beneficial in containing the virus. Therefore, the regular cleaning and disinfection of surfaces and objects are essential to control spread. However, the implementation rate of environmental disinfection management was only 79.0% in this study. The frequency of the cleaning and disinfection of residents' bedrooms and office areas and service places was not up to standard. Although most of the nursing homes had established infection disease prevention and control standards, the staff were insufficiently trained in infectious disease prevention and control skills. The local CDC should be responsible for providing training to the staff in nursing homes regarding disinfection knowledge, including information about what kinds of disinfectants are effective and how to disinfection can be performed effectively. Sanitation and environmental disinfection should be carried out scientifically based on the recommended procedures. Enhanced environmental cleaning and disinfection in nursing homes is important; it should be not a temporary task but should be routine work.

Risk in Hygienic Behaviour Management

Hygienic behaviour management is central to the transmission of COVID-19, and changing behaviour is crucial to prevent transmission. In our survey, the average implementation rate of hygienic behaviour management was only 75.3%, which was the lowest rate among the four aspects of the implementation of COVID-19 prevention and control measures, indicating that hygienic behaviour management is the weakest point in nursing homes. In addition, the implementation rates of measures involving residents,
such as having them wear face masks, providing them with education and maintaining physical distance, were extremely low, which may be related to the cognitive decline of some residents. Aktinson et al\[^{32}\] reported that the size of respiratory droplets from humans typically range from 0.5 to 12 µm and that droplets sized <0.5 µm can remain airborne for significant periods of time. Van Doremalen et al\[^{33}\] found that COVID-19 remains stable in airborne aerosols for at least 3 hours and can persist on inanimate surfaces for 48 to 72 hours. Based on the above, personal protection in the form of improved hygiene behaviour\[^{30}\], such as the appropriate utilization of face masks in public areas, may mitigate future COVID-19 transmission in nursing homes. Among the many considerations, forty-two percent of the elderly have dementia or cognitive decline in nursing homes\[^{34}\], making the enforcement of mitigation strategies such as face mask wearing a major challenge\[^{10}\]. Therefore, items related to wearing face masks as appropriate (item 4.7, item 4.8) showed lower rates of 60.4% and 59.2%, respectively. It has been a controversial issue whether residents must wear masks in nursing homes that are already completely closed. Given that elderly residents often have respiratory diseases\[^{6}\], wearing face masks will affect their respiratory function, which can lead to decreased compliance.

Effective risk communication and knowledge education in the early stage of the COVID-19 outbreak is critical for promoting behavioural compliance. These strategies have proven to be useful for the general public\[^{3}\] but have not been effectively adopted in nursing homes. The implementation rate for the item “Provide knowledge education to the residents about COVID-19 prevention and control” (Item 4.4) was also very low (64.0%). For example, understanding why face masks should be used, why visitors are not coming to see them, and why they should keep distance from others is difficult for residents with dementia. It is also a major challenge for staff to provide education to these residents. The recommendation to “maintain physical distance” (Item 4.3) was also difficult for most elderly and staff. The implementation rate for this measure was 77.0%. In China, residents who live in nursing homes have chronic underlying medical disorders; they usually have considerable personal care needs, including bathing, dressing, and toileting, which make maintaining physical distancing nearly impossible. Considering the characteristics of the residents, there are few strategies that can be used to improve the hygiene behaviour of residents. The best strategy is to prevent COVID-19 from invading nursing homes.

Conclusion

The COVID-19 pandemic is perhaps one of the greatest health threats the world has faced in this century, and it requires not only a cohesive effort but also enormous discipline to follow the guidelines. The current implementation of prevention and control measures is insufficient, and further improvement is required. We argue that effective interventions are urgently needed to increase the implementation rate of access management, environmental disinfection management, and hygienic behaviour management. Shortages in medical staff and nurse aides, a lack of preventive supplies, and little preparation for pandemics are common obstacles encountered by nursing homes. Currently, prevention and control work is still being undertaken in all nursing homes to ensure a high level of preparedness to combat COVID-19 in China. Local officials must inspect nursing homes and provide help; they must ensure that nursing
homes are adequately staffed, that the residents’ needs are being met and that infection control procedures are being followed.

Study considerations

There are some limitations to this study. The survey was conducted online; although we used the random sampling method, more than half of the contacted nursing homes refused to participate in the survey. The results may have been affected by selection bias. While the sample cannot be characterized as nationally representative, these results offer valuable insight into the nursing homes’ adherence to the guidelines. The implementation of prevention and control measures in nursing homes was evaluated from managers’ perspectives; therefore, caution should be exercised in generalizing these findings. Despite these limitations, to the best of our knowledge, this is the first study to evaluate the implementation of prevention and control measures in nursing homes during the early phase of the COVID-19 outbreak in China.

Abbreviations

COVID-19
"coronavirus disease 2019". According to the World Health Organization, severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) is the official name of the virus that causes coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19).

CDC
Center for Disease Control and Prevention

PPE
personal protective equipment

Declarations

Ethical approval

Ethical approval for this study was obtained from the Institutional Review Board of the West China School of Medicine, Sichuan University (Approval number 2019 – 264). All participants gave verbal informed consent.

Consent for publication

Not applicable

Competing interests

The author(s) declare no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.
Funding

This study was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant No. 71871147) and Luzhou Municipal People's Government-Southwest Medical University Science and Technology Strategic Cooperation Project. (Grant No. 2019LZXNYDR09).

Acknowledgements

We thank all 461 nursing homes and their managers for participating in this study. We would like to thank the Association for the Aged of all provinces that provided help in obtaining access to the nursing homes. We would also like to thank Mr. Su Youcheng, Mr. Huang Zaijun, Mr. Shi Yongjin and Mr. Liu Wei for helping with data collection.

Authors’ Contributions

Shi Meihong and Hu Xiuying designed the study. Shi Meihong, He Xinxin, Huang Siyuan, and Zhang Mingfeng collected the data. Shi Meihong analysed the data. Shi Meihong, Zhang Mingfeng and Zhang Fengying interpreted the data. Shi Meihong wrote the first draft of the manuscript. All authors contributed to the final draft.

References

1. Wu JT, Leung K, Leung GM. Nowcasting and forecasting the potential domestic and international spread of the 2019-nCoV outbreak originating in Wuhan, China: a modelling study. Lancet. 2020;395(10225):689–97.
2. Cowling BJ, Ali ST, Ng TWY, Tsang TK, Li JCM, Fong MW, Liao QY, Kwan MYW, Lee SL, Chiu SS, et al. Impact assessment of non-pharmaceutical interventions against coronavirus disease 2019 and influenza in Hong Kong: an observational study. Lancet Public Health. 2020;5(5):E279–88.
3. Lippi G, Henry BM, Bovo C, Sanchis-Gomar F. Health risks and potential remedies during prolonged lockdowns for coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19). Diagnosis. 2020;7(2):85–90.
4. Chen N, Zhou M, Dong X, Qu J, Gong F, Han Y, Qiu Y, Wang J, Liu Y, Wei Y, et al. Epidemiological and clinical characteristics of 99 cases of 2019 novel coronavirus pneumonia in Wuhan, China: a descriptive study. Lancet. 2020;395(10223):507–13.
5. Huang C, Wang Y, Li X, Ren L, Zhao J, Hu Y, Zhang L, Fan G, Xu J, Gu X, et al. Clinical features of patients infected with 2019 novel coronavirus in Wuhan, China. Lancet. 2020;395(10223):497–506.
6. Cohen MA, Tavares J. Who are the Most At-Risk Older Adults in the COVID-19 Era? It’s Not Just Those in Nursing Homes. Journal of aging & social policy 2020:1–7.
7. Kemenesi G, Kornya L, Toth GE, Kurucz K, Zeghibib S, Somogyi BA, Zoldi V, Urban P, Herczeg R, Jakab F: Nursing homes and the elderly regarding the COVID-19 pandemic: situation report from Hungary. Geroscience 2020.
8. Lynn J. Playing the Cards We are Dealt: Covid-19 and Nursing Homes. Journal of the American Geriatrics Society 2020.

9. Abrams HR, Loomer L, Gandhi A, Grabowski DC. Characteristics of U.S. Nursing Homes with COVID-19 Cases. Journal of the American Geriatrics Society 2020.

10. Abbasi J: "Abandoned" Nursing Homes Continue to Face Critical Supply and Staff Shortages as COVID-19 Toll Has Mounted. Jama 2020.

11. Trubucchi M, De Leo D. Nursing homes or besieged castles: COVID-19 in northern Italy. Lancet Psychiatry. 2020;7(5):387–8.

12. Rada AG: Covid-19: the precarious position of Spain’s nursing homes (vol 369, m1554, 2020). Bmj-British Medical Journal 2020, 369.

13. Graham NJ, Downes C, Sharp R. DJ: SARS-CoV-2 infection, clinical features and outcome of COVID-19 in United Kingdom nursing homes. J Infect. 2020;6(03):20–9.

14. Gardner W, States D, Bagley N. The Coronavirus and the Risks to the Elderly in Long-Term Care. J Aging Soc Policy.

15. Guidelines for COVID prevention and control of nursing homes (First edition) http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2020-01/28/content_5472755.htm.

16. Arango VM. Confinement/Isolation: From the Preventive Language of COVID-19 to the Pragmatics of the War in Colombia. Geopoliticas-Revista De Estudios Sobre Espacio Y Poder. 2020;11:285–91.

17. Amer Geriatrics S. American Geriatrics Society Policy Brief: COVID-19 and Nursing Homes. J Am Geriatr Soc. 2020;68(5):908–11.

18. Aiello AE, Malinis M, Knapp JK, Mody L. The influence of knowledge, perceptions, and beliefs, on hand hygiene practices in nursing homes. Am J Infect Control. 2009;37(2):164–7.

19. Tan LF, Seetharaman SK. COVID-19 Outbreak in Nursing Homes in Singapore. Journal of microbiology, immunology, and infection = Wei mian yu gan ran za zhi 2020.

20. Stall NM, Farquharson C, Fan-Lun C, Wiesenfeld L, Loftus CA, Kain D, Johnstone J, McCreight L, Goldman RD, Mahtani R. A Hospital Partnership with a Nursing Home Experiencing a COVID-19 Outbreak: Description of a Multiphase Emergency Response in Toronto, Canada. Journal of the American Geriatrics Society 2020.

21. Statistics BoL. Occupational Outlook Handbook, Nursing Assistants and Orderlies. In. Edited by Washington D. Bureau of Labor Statistics; 2020.

22. Spetz JSR, Chapman S, Bryant N. Home and community-based work-force for patients with serious illness requires support to meet growing needs. Health Aff. 2019;38(6):902–9.

23. Fallon A, Dukelow T, Kennelly SP, O’Neill D. COVID-19 in nursing homes. QJM: monthly journal of the Association of Physicians. 2020;113(6):391–2.

24. Werner RM, Hoffman AK, Coe NB. Long-Term Care Policy after Covid-19 - Solving the Nursing Home Crisis. The New England journal of medicine 2020.
25. Chen W, Wang Q, Li YQ, Yu HL, Xia YY, Zhang ML, Qin Y, Zhang T, Peng ZB, Zhang RC, et al. Early containment strategies and core measures for prevention and control of novel coronavirus pneumonia in China. Chin J Prev Med. 2020;54(3):1–6.

26. Matias T, Dominski FH, Marks DF. Human needs in COVID-19 isolation. Journal of Health Psychology 2020.

27. Bridges CB, Kuehnert MJ, Hall CB. Transmission of influenza: Implications for control in health care settings. Clin Infect Dis. 2003;37(8):1094–101.

28. Kampf G, Todt D, Pfaender S, Steinmann E. Persistence of coronaviruses on inanimate surfaces and their inactivation with biocidal agents. J Hosp Infect. 2020;104(3):246–51.

29. Khachfe HH, Chahrour M, Sammouri J, Salhab HA, Makki BE, Fares MY. An Epidemiological Study on COVID-19: A Rapidly Spreading Disease. Cureus 2020, 12(3).

30. West R, Michie S, Rubin GJ, Amlot R. Applying principles of behaviour change to reduce SARS-CoV-2 transmission. Nature Human Behaviour. 2020;4(5):451–9.

31. Song Jiang-nan CG-q, Jin YIn, Qiong G, Dai Jun-bin.: Implementation of disinfection treatment in the isolation places of coronavirus disease 2019. Practical Preventive Medicine 2020, 27(4):400–2.

32. Natural ventilation for infection control in health-care settings. World Health Organization. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK143281/.

33. van Doremalen N, Bushmaker T, Morris DH, Holbrook MG, Gamble A, Williamson BN, Tamin A, Harcourt JL, Thornburg NJ, Gerber SI, et al. Aerosol and Surface Stability of SARS-CoV-2 as Compared with SARS-CoV-1. N Engl J Med. 2020;382(16):1564–7.

34. Coe NB, Van Houtven CH. Living Arrangements of Older Adults and COVID-19 Risk: It Is Not Just Nursing Homes. Journal of the American Geriatrics Society 2020.

Supplementary Files

This is a list of supplementary files associated with this preprint. Click to download.

- Questionnaire.docx