THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE JOURNAL ENVIRONMENT OF LEONARDO

Alkim Almila Akdag Salah, Virtual Knowledge Studio of the Netherlands Royal Academy of Arts and Sciences, Curaçaoweg 31, 1019 AT Amsterdam, the Netherlands. E-mail: <alelma@ucla.edu>.

Loet Leydesdorff, Amsterdam School of Communications Research (ASCoR), University of Amsterdam, Krijnenburgwal 48, 1012 CX Amsterdam, the Netherlands. E-mail: <loet@leydesdorff.net>.

See <www.mitpressjournals.org/toe/leon/45/1> for supplemental files associated with this issue.

Submitted: 4 May 2011

Abstract

The authors present animations based on the aggregated journal-journal citations of Leonardo during the period 1974-2008. Leonardo is mainly cited by journals outside the arts domain for cultural reasons, for example, in neuropsychology and physics. Articles in Leonardo itself cite a large number of journals, but with a focus on the arts. Animations at this level of aggregation enable us to show the history of the journal from a network perspective.

Scientometric indicators such as citations are increasingly used for the evaluation of performance [1]. In the arts and humanities, however, communication should not be considered primarily as a flow of information [2; cf. 3]. Nonetheless, the Arts & Humanities Citation Index (A&HCI) of the Institute of Scientific Information (ISI)—currently owned by Thomson Reuters—contains a rich source of statistical information about journals [4]. For example, this data allows us to study a journal’s development over time in terms of aggregated cross-journal citation relations.

While this mapping technique has been applied to journals in the domains of the sciences and social sciences, the ISI does not publish an aggregated Journal Citations Report (JCR) for the A&HCI. In another context, we constructed such an index [5] and focused on the journal Leonardo as a prime example of an art journal. We downloaded the bibliographic information for all articles published in Leonardo since its inception in 1968 and for all articles citing Leonardo during this whole period.

The citations can indicate the impact of Leonardo on other (groups of) journals as proxies for fields of scholarly activity, whereas the references provided by the authors in Leonardo inform us about what these authors consider the relevant knowledge bases for their publications. Since the retrieved documents did not contain citation information for the period 1970-1973, we limited the analysis to publications since 1974 (5,859 documents). These papers contain 31,147 cited references and were cited 1,680 times. Additionally, we use the 65,285 citations in the citing documents to position Leonardo in its citation impact environment. Based on co-citation analysis and bibliographic coupling, respectively, and for each consecutive year, we generated animations available online at http://www.leydesdorff.net/journals/leonardo/citing and http://www.leydesdorff.net/journals/leonardo/cited/.

Results

These animations locate Leonardo as an interdisciplinary journal connected to the sciences, social sciences, and the arts throughout the time span covered. The goal of Frank Malina, the founding Editor of Leonardo, was to create a journal enabling artists to follow new developments in the sciences. Editorials in the journal emphasized the interdisciplinary intention and orientation throughout the years in question [6]; our animations show this interdisciplinarity evolving over the years in both the journal’s referenced knowledge base (“citing”) and its (“cited”) impact environment.

The citation patterns are not dense and are therefore volatile from year to year. Figure 1 shows the results of the co-citations of 53 journals cited in 924 references from the 157 articles published in Leonardo during 2008. Figure 2 provides the corresponding co-citation map using 107 articles which cited Leonardo in 2008.

In the animation showing the journals cited by contributors to Leonardo, one can distinguish various art movements, among them Kinetic Art, Holographic Art, Cybernetic Art, Computer Art, and Space Art. In addition to art movements, journals from a wide range of scientific fields are cited—e.g., neurology, cognitive science, psychology, vision and computer graphics—as well as topics such as fractal geometry, applied mathematics, and applied optics. The journal Health Hazards is frequently cited, as it contains information about the use of different chemicals and technological appliances in generating artworks.

Art journals form another important group in the animations of the citation patterns of Leonardo. This group is more or less equally divided among journals focusing on aesthetics, art theory, and contemporary art news. Upon closer inspection of the animations, one can see that theoretically oriented journals appear more persistently in the animation based on articles citing Leonardo, while journals reporting on the latest state of the art market cite Leonardo more than they are cited in Leonardo’s publications. Core journals of the arts and art history such as Art News, Studio International, Art Forum, Art Bulletin, and Art Journal are consistently included.

Figure 2 shows an unexpected finding: among the journals which contain documents citing Leonardo in 2008, only 24 contribute more than 0.5% to its being

Fig. 1: Fifty-three journals cited by 157 articles in Leonardo in 2008; no citation threshold within the set; cosine > 0.0. (© Loet Leydesdorff)
cited pattern, and these 24 journals are mainly in the domain of the sciences and the social sciences. Three journal groups are relevant in this citation impact environment: physics, neuroscience, and perception research. These three factors explain 53.8% of the variance. (The nodes are colored in accordance to their highest loadings in the Varimax-rotated three-factor solution.) Leonardo itself is positioned at the edge between the latter two specialties.

The presence of science journals in the impact environment of Leonardo is not stable over the years, but in all years science journals are visible in relatively large clusters. Among the science journals citing Leonardo from year to year, Science, Nature, and Scientific American dominate the animation. Since the mid-80s another cluster contains journals with a focus on computer graphics. A third, relatively stable cluster is provided by journals in cognitive science that enter the picture at the beginning of the 1990s, with strong connections to a psychology cluster. Through studies on vision and perception, journals in neuroscience, cognitive science, psychology, and computer graphics are related to this citation environment.

Since the turn of the century, Leonardo has increasingly lost citations from the art world in favor of citations from journals in the sciences. In 2008 (Figure 2), science journals dominate its citation impact environment. In earlier years, however, certain core-books by Gombrich [7], Arnheim [8, 9], and Goodman [10] were also cited heavily. These art historians are renowned for their interest in psychology and linguistics, and hence their presence as references in the citation networks strengthened Leonardo's citation relations with journals in these disciplines.

**Generalization and Conclusions**

We repeated the analysis of Leonardo as a journal for Art Journal, a publication of the College Art Association. This journal publishes (since 1941) articles related to contemporary art, and in that sense its audience and constituency is akin to that of Leonardo. Like Leonardo, Art Journal is overwhelmingly cited outside the domain of the arts and the humanities. The journals in this larger environment range from physics to advertising research, but most references are to "non-source" journals such as the NY Times, Newsweek, and the Washington Post.

In other words, the impact of journals in the arts is not confined to the Arts & Humanities as scholarly discourses in journals, but reaches a much wider audience including the sciences, the social sciences, and the wider public. These journals are cited primarily in the larger environment, perhaps not so much for intellectual as for cultural and instrumental reasons. The predominant rationale of references to these journals is different from that which governs the sciences and the social sciences, where intellectual organization can explain the patterns of citation.

Furthermore, the patterns of citations in the citing and cited dimensions are different for these art journals. Although they draw on a wider environment, it is possible to identify core groups among the journals in the Art SCI in terms of how the authors in these journals provide references when constructing their arguments. The citation impact of Leonardo on other art journals, however, has decreased over the years.

Given this conclusion, one might indeed be hesitant to assess journals and research covered by the Art SCI in terms of scientometric indicators which use field-specific parameters. These journals may occupy positions that are quite different from the specialty structures typical of the sciences and social sciences. Thus, the journals and the constituting articles can be evaluated also in terms of these wider cultural influences. Citation relations are organized not only on socio-cognitive grounds, but also on the basis of cultural patterns.

**References and Notes**

1. J. Howard, "New Ratings of Humanities Journals Do More Than Rank - They Rankle," The Chronicle of Higher Education 55, No. 7 (October 10, 2008), p. A10.

2. Eugene Garfield, “Data from Arts & Humanities Citation Index Reveal the Interrelationships of Science and Humanities,” Current Contents 46 (1982) pp. 5-7.

3. Janus Limmans, “Why with bibliometrics the humanities does not need to be the weakest link,” Scientometrics 83, No. 2 (2010) pp. 337-354.

4. Loet Leydesdorff, Felix de Moya-Anegón, and Vincente P. Guerrero-Bote, “Journal Maps on the Basis of Scopus Data: A comparison with the Journal Citation Reports of the ISI,” Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology 61, No. 2 (2010) pp. 352-369.

5. Loet Leydesdorff and Almila Akdag Salah, “Maps on the basis of the Arts & Humanities Citation Index: The journals Leonardo and Art Journal, and 'Digital Humanities' as a topic,” Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology 61, No. 4 (2010) pp. 787-801.

6. P. Grant-Ryan, “Art of the Future: The Future of Art,” Leonardo 20, No. 4 (1987) pp. 397-399.

7. E.H. Gombrich, Art and illusion: A study in the psychology of pictorial perception (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1960).

8. R. Arnheim, Art and visual perception: A psychology of the creative eye (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1954).

9. R. Arnheim, Visual thinking (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1969).

10. N. Goodman, Language of Art: An Approach to a Theory of Symbols (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing, 1988).
A WORD OF THANKS

Thanks to Our Supporters

Leonardo/ISAST is a nonprofit organization that serves the international arts community by documenting the work at the intersection of the arts, sciences and technology and by encouraging and stimulating collaboration through its programs and activities. Donations and grants are integral to the future of Leonardo.

Contact <sust@leonardo.info> or visit <http://leonardo.info> for more information.

Leonardo Codex
($5,000 and above)
College of Extended Learning,
San Francisco State University
Roger Malina
The Malina Trust
Sonia Rapoport
Rockefeller Foundation
The San Francisco Art Institute
Al Smith
Darlene Tong
University of Texas at Dallas

Sforza Monument
(The Bronze Horse)
($1,000 to $4,999)
Martin Anderson
Art Science Research Lab
Banff New Media Institute
Lisa Bornstein
CalArts
CalArts University Arts
and Humanities
Concordia University
DeMontfort University Institute for
Creative Technologies
Donna Cox
Creative Disturbance
The Daniel Langlois Foundation
Char Davies
The Exploratorium
Penny Finnie
Steve Forestieri
John Hearst
Intel Corporation
LA-Based Centro de Arte y Creacion Industrial
The LEF Foundation
Alan Malina
Marjorie Malina
Jacques Mandelbroit
Christine Maxwell-Malina
Ontario College of Art & Design University
Sheila Pinkel
Michael Punt
Rhode Island School of Design
Isuo Sakane
School of the Art Institute of Chicago
Scottsdale Center for the Performing Arts
Martin Segal
SPSU International Center for the Arts
Sonia Sheridan
Sibrit School of Art, Design and Technology
swissnex San Francisco
SymbioticA
Marcia Tanner
Makepeace Tao
UCLA Art / Sci Center
UC Santa Barbara, Media Arts and Technology Program
UC Santa Cruz, Digital Arts and New Media Dept.
Universidad Autónoma de Occidente, Engineering Department
Universidad de San Buenaventura, Multimedia Engineering Program
Universidade de Caldas
Universidade do Minho
University of Calabria: Evolutionary Systems Group
University of Denver School of Art and Art History
University of Evora, CHAIA
University of Florida Digital Worlds Institute

University of Illinois
eDREAM Institute
University of Leiden
University of Plymouth, U.K.
University of Washington DXARTS
UTS Creativity and Cognition Studios
ZKM | Center for Art and Media

La Gioconda ( Mona Lisa)
($500 to $999)
Roy Ascott
Lars Ole Beltzage
Martha Blassingg
Anna Campbell Bliss
Leif Brush
James D. Burke
Richard Clair
Una Dora Copley
Bryony Dalefield
Michele Emmer
William Fasley
Arana Greenberg
Greg Harper
Michael Joaquin Grey
Dene Grigar
Rosemary Jackson
Larry Larson
Lynn Hershman Leeson
Guy Levoir
Isabel Maxwell
Merrill Lynch Foundation
Emmanuel Nadler
Nessim & Associates
Sam Okshohun
Steve Oscherwitz
Trudy Reagan
David Rosenboom
Jack Sarfatti
Joel Silverman
Christian Simm
Tami Spector
Meredith Trowble

Flying Machine
($250 to $499)
Flying Machine
Tami Spector
Christian Simm
Joel Silverman
david rosenboom
Trudy Reagan
Sam okoshken
nessim & associates
emanuel nadler
Isabel Maxwell
Guy Levrier
Larry Larson
rosemary Jackson
dene Grigar
Michael JQAin Grey
Greg Harper
arana Greenberg
Lawrence Fane
eugene epstein
eva Craig
david Carrier
Shawn Brixey
ray Bradbury
Loren Basch

Angel
($249 and under)
Anonymous, Aaron Alpar, Charles Ames,
Craig Anderson, Art Science Collaborations Inc. (ASCI), Yasuhiro Aoso, Bret Batrey, Marc Battier, Mark and Lauren Beam, Patricia Bentzon, Timothy Binkley, The Birse Family, Marc Bohlen, Deborah Branton, Robert A. Brown, Ronald Brown, Willi Bruns, Annick Bureaud, James Burke, David Carter, Rosa Cañada-Levion, Webster Cash, Katharine Casida, Joel Chadabe, Alison Chaiken, John Cheonawn, Richard Clar, Computer Art Studio/Gunter Schulz, Ivo Cristante, Elizabeth Crumley, Mary & Michael Cunningham, Danish Film Festival, Bob Davis, Derrick de Kerckhove, Goery Delacote, Lily Diaz, Agnes Denes, Emma Lou Diemer, Steve Dietz, Augus Dorbe, Hubert Duprat, Elmer Duncan, Ann Elias, Sherban Eparue, Theodosia Ferguson, John Fobes, Tim Fox, Alan & Mickey Friedman, Ryozo Fuji
Ka-hung Fung, David Gamper, Jonathan & Donna R. Gennick, George Gessert, Ken Goldberg, Yusef Grillo, Karen Guzik, Craig Harris, Isabel Haylen, Margaret Hermann, Doris Herrick, Estate of Dick Higgins, Anthony Hill, Toshijuku Hiruma, Gerald Holton, Hungarian University of Crafts & Design, Amy Ione, Susan Joyce, Raymond Jurgens, Eduardo Kae, Robert Kadesch, Marshall Kaplan, Ken Knowlton, Zdenek Kociub, Kenji Kohiyama, Thomas Kotssnik, Kathleen Luzia, Levi Family Foundation, Frederick Leoonis, Carl Machover, James Maher, William Marchant, Delle Maxwell, Elliot Mazer, Kevin Meehan, Minneapolis College of Art & Design, Mit Mitopoulos, Moet Hennessey-Louis Vuitton, Jason Monberg, Roger Mulkey, Geetha Narayanan, Alex Nicollf, Greg Niemeyer, Hiroshi Ninomura, Elaine Petesch, Anne Brooks Pister, Glenn R. Phillips, Victor A. Pickett, Otto Piene, Ann Pizzorusso, Herbert & Joan Webster Price, Patric Prince, Wold Rainer, Peter Richards, Ron Rocco, Peter Rudolfi, David M. Russell, Mr. and Mrs. Robert Russett, Colin Sanderson, Piero Scaruffi, Patricia Search, Allan Shields, Gregory C. Shubin, Joel Slayton, John Storq, Avril Sokolov, Kiril Sokolov, Christa Sommerer, Bejanne Spitz, Anait Stephens, Robert Strinzch, The Sun Microsystems Foundation, Inc., Robin and Barbara Tchartoff, Tamiko Thiel, Rodrigo B. Toledo, Heinz Trauboth, Mark Tribe, Karen Tsao, Roman Verosko, Alexandre Vikine, Annette Weirauch, Natalie & Mark Whitson, Alan Thompson & Sharon A. Widmayer, Ioannis Yessios, Robert Zimmerman