PROTECTIVE EFFECTS OF SILYMARIN, ALONE OR IN COMBINATION WITH CHLOROGENIC ACID AND/OR MELATONIN, AGAINST CARBON TETRACHLORIDE-INDUCED HEPATOTOXICITY

Nouf Al-Rasheed¹, Laila Faddah¹, Nawal Al-Rasheed¹,², Yieldez A. Bassiouni¹,³, Iman H. Hasan¹, Ayman M. Mahmoud⁴, Raeesa A. Mohamad⁵, Hazar I. Yakoub¹

¹Department of Pharmacology and Toxicology, College of Pharmacy, King Saud University, ²Department of Pharmaceutical Sciences, College of Pharmacy, Princess Nourah Bint Abdulrahman University, ³Department of Anatomy, College of Medicine, King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia, ⁴Department of Pharmacology, Faculty of Medicine, Alexandria University, Alexandria, ⁵Department of Zoology, Division of Physiology, Faculty of Science, Beni-Suef University, Beni-Suef, Egypt

Submitted: 21-02-2016 Revised: 01-04-2016 Published: 07-07-2016

ABSTRACT

Objective: The aim of this study was to evaluate the hepatoprotective effects of silymarin (SIL), alone and combined with chlorogenic acid (CA) and/or melatonin (ME), using a rat model of carbon tetrachloride (CCl₄)-induced injury. Materials and Methods: Hepatotoxicity was induced by a single dose of CCl₄ (1 ml/kg, IP). One day after, rats were received SIL (200 mg/kg) alone or in combination with CA (60 mg/kg) and/or ME (20 mg/kg) for 21 days. Results: SIL significantly decreased serum alanine aminotransferase, inflammatory cytokines, and vascular endothelial growth factor levels. Histological alterations, fibrogenesis, oxidative DNA damage, inflammatory mediators, and caspase-3 activity were significantly attenuated. Conclusions: These data indicate that SIL, alone and combined with CA and/or ME, protected the liver against CCl₄-induced hepatotoxicity via attenuating inflammation, oxidative DNA damage, apoptosis, and fibrotic changes. The significantly intensified hepatoprotective effects of SIL, when combined with both CA and ME, suggest a possible synergism. These synergistic effects need to be further confirmed using detailed studies.

Key words: Carbon tetrachloride, chlorogenic acid, inflammation, melatonin, silymarin

SUMMARY

- Silymarin, chlorogenic acid and melatonin possess in vivo hepatoprotective activity
- Silymarin, chlorogenic acid and melatonin attenuate fibrogenesis, oxidative DNA damage, inflammation and apoptosis
- Chlorogenic acid and melatonin enhance the hepatoprotective effect of silymarin

INTRODUCTION

The liver plays a central role in many important body functions such as metabolism and bile secretion. Through detoxification and elimination, the liver protects the body from exposure to toxic substances and drugs. Therefore, a healthy liver is essential to overall body health. Excessive exposure of the liver to environmental toxins, drug overdose, alcohol, and chemotherapy agents can cause hepatotoxicity. Hepatotoxins are exogenous compounds that cause liver injury. Hepatotoxins may include industrial chemicals, certain drugs, microcystins, dietary supplements, and herbal remedies. Carbon tetrachloride (CCl₄)-induced liver...
injury results from the toxic metabolites of CCl₄ that cause centrilobular hepatic necrosis and steatosis and impair essential cellular processes. CCl₄ is biotransformed by the cytochrome P450 system in liver microsomes, producing trichloromethyl free radical (CCl₃•) that can react with cellular molecules and impair crucial cellular processes. In the presence of oxygen, CCl₃• is converted to trichloromethylperoxy radical (CCl₃O•) resulting in oxidative stress, lipid peroxidation, and loss of membrane integrity. Therefore, antioxidant molecules might have the capacity to protect against CCl₃•-induced hepatotoxicity.

Silymarin (SIL) is a flavonoid complex extracted from the seeds of Silybum marianum (milk thistle). It contains 4 the isomeric flavonoids silibinin, silydianin, isosilibinin, and silychristine. SIL has been well demonstrated to exert multiple beneficial effects and thus used as a natural remedy for the treatment of hepatitis, jaundice, and cirrhosis. It protects against liver injury induced by radiation, alcohol abuse, ischemia, iron overload, environmental toxins, and CCl₃•. The antioxidant, anti-inflammatory, anti-apoptotic, and immunomodulating effects of SIL have also been reported. Chlorogenic acid (CA) (3-caffeoyl-D-quinic acid) is a polyphenolic compound found in coffee, beans, apples, potatoes, and other agricultural products. It is formed by esterification of quinic and caffeic acids. Studies have demonstrated that CA exhibits multiple biological properties, including antioxidant, anti-inflammatory, anti-carcinogenic, anti-bacterial, and cholesterol lowering activities. In addition, CA showed protective effects against lipopolysaccharide (LPS) and acetaminophen. Melatonin (ME) or N-Acetyl-5-methoxytryptamine, a hormone produced by the pineal gland, is known to be involved in the modulation of circadian rhythms, seasonal reproduction, and immune function. ME has also been reported to prevent hemorrhagic shock and CCl₃•-induced liver injury in rats. In vitro and in vivo studies have suggested a protective effect of ME against oxidative stress by scavenging free radicals, stimulating the synthesis of endogenous antioxidants and up-regulating the expression of intracellular antioxidant enzymes. The individual protective effects of SIL, CA and ME against hepatotoxins-induced liver injury have been investigated. However, studies demonstrating the hepatoprotective efficacy of these therapeutic agents in combination are scarce. This study tests the hypothesis that CA and/or ME may have a synergistic effect with SIL. Therefore, we used a rat model of CCl₃•-induced hepatotoxicity and investigated several parameters following treatment with SIL alone and combined with CA and ME.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Chemicals**

SIL, CA, ME and CCl₄ were purchased from Sigma Chemicals (St. Louis, MO, USA). All other chemicals and reagents were of analytical grade and obtained from standard commercial supplies.

**Experimental animals**

Male Wistar rats weighing between 160 and 180 g were obtained from the Experimental Animal Center, College of Pharmacy, King Saud University (Saudi Arabia). Animals were housed in special cages at controlled temperature of 20–22°C and humidity of 60% and fed a standard rat pellet chow with free access to tap water ad libitum. Rats were kept for 1 week before the experiment for acclimatization. All animal procedures were performed in accordance with the guidelines provided by the Experimental Animal Laboratory and approved by the Animal Care and Use Committee of the College of Pharmacy, King Saud University (Saudi Arabia).

**Experimental design**

Forty-eight rats were randomly allocated into six equal groups, each consisting of 8 (n = 8) animals as follows:

- **Group I (Control):** Rats received a single intraperitoneal injection of corn oil and the vehicle gum acacia (2% w/v) by oral gavage for 21 successive days.
- **Group II (CCl₄):** Rats received a single intraperitoneal injection of 1 ml/kg body weight CCl₄ in corn oil (1:1) and gum acacia by oral gavage for 21 successive days.
- **Group III (CCl₄ + SIL):** CCl₄-administered rats received SIL (200 mg/kg/day) dissolved in gum acacia by oral gavage for 21 successive days.
- **Group IV (CCl₄ + SIL/CA):** CCl₄-administered rats received SIL (200 mg/kg/day) and CA (60 mg/kg/day) dissolved in gum acacia by oral gavage for 21 successive days.
- **Group V (CCl₄ + SIL/ME):** CCl₄-administered rats received SIL (200 mg/kg/day) and ME (20 mg/kg/day) dissolved in gum acacia by oral gavage for 21 successive days.
- **Group VI (CCl₄ + SIL/CA/ME):** CCl₄-administered rats received SIL (200 mg/kg/day), CA (60 mg/kg/day) and ME (20 mg/kg/day) dissolved in gum acacia by oral gavage for 21 successive days.

SIL, CA, and ME were supplemented 24 h after CCl₄ administration. The doses of CCl₄, SIL, CA and ME were selected according to the studies of Feng et al., Huang et al., Shi et al., and Abdel-Wahhab et al., respectively. The dosage was balanced weekly as indicated by any change in the body weight.

**Samples collection and preparation**

At the end of the experiment, blood samples were collected, left to coagulate and centrifuged at 1000 × g for 10 min to separate serum. Sera were collected and stored at −20°C until used. Rats were then sacrificed by decapitation and livers were quickly excised and washed thoroughly in ice-cold saline. Liver sample from each rat was homogenized (10% w/v) by decapitation and livers were quickly excised and washed thoroughly in ice-cold saline. Liver sample from each rat was homogenized (10% w/v) by cold phosphate buffered saline. The homogenates were centrifuged at 1000 × g for 10 min to separate serum. Sera were calculated from the standard plots.

**Biochemical assays**

**Determination of alanine aminotransferase activity**

Serum alanine aminotransferase (ALT) activity was determined by a coupled enzyme assay using reagent kit purchased from Sigma (USA) following the instructions provided.

**Determination of inflammatory mediators and vascular endothelial growth factor levels**

Serum interleukin 6 (IL-6), interferon gamma (IFN-γ) and vascular endothelial growth factor (VEGF) and liver tumor necrosis factor alpha (TNF-α) levels were measured using specific enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (ELISA) kits purchased from R and D systems (USA) following the manufacturer’s instructions. Concentrations of the assayed proteins were determined spectrophotometrically at 450 nm using BioTek μQuant plate reader (BioTek Instruments, Winooski, VT, USA). Standard plots were constructed using standard corresponding proteins, and the concentrations for unknown samples were calculated from the standard plots.
Liver C-reactive protein (CRP) was measured using latex-enhanced immunonephelometry on a Behring BN II automated Nephelometer (Dade Behring), according to the manufacturer's instructions. In this assay, CRP present in the sample binds polystyrene beads coated with rat monoclonal antibodies and form aggregates which scatter light. The intensity of the scattered light reflects the concentration of CRP present in the sample.

**Determination of cytochrome P450 2E1 activity**

Microsomes fraction was prepared from homogenized liver samples following the method of Benson et al.[29] and used for cytochrome P450 2E1 (CYP2E1) determination using p-nitrophenol as a substrate.[30] CYP2E1 activity was normalized against protein content and presented as percentage of corresponding control. Protein content was determined using Bradford protein assay.[31]

**Determination of caspase-3 activity**

Caspase-3 activity was measured using the CaspACE assay system (Promega, Madison, WI, USA) according to the manufacturer instructions. The test is based on the ability of caspase-3 to release the yellow chromophore p-nitroaniline from the substrate Ac-DEVD-pNA. Caspase-3 activity was normalized against protein content and presented as a percentage of corresponding control.

**Determination of 8-Oxo-2′-deoxyguanosine levels**

DNA was extracted from frozen liver samples using DNA purification kit (Promega, USA). Eight-Oxo-2′-deoxyguanosine (8-OxodG) levels were determined using OxiSelect Oxidative DNA Damage ELISA Kit where the 8-OxodG content in unknown samples was determined by comparison with predetermined 8-OxodG standard curve.

**Comet assay**

The alkaline comet assay (single gel electrophoresis) was performed according to the method of Singh et al.[32] Briefly, a small piece of liver was minced in cold Hank's balanced salt solution, digested with collagenase, mixed with low melting point agarose at ratio of 1:7 and spread onto microscope slides precoated with normal melting point agarose. The slides were covered with a third layer of low melting point agarose, and a cover slip was applied to spread the sample. The slides were placed in lysis buffer for 20 min and subsequently electrophoresed at 4°C in alkaline electrophoretic solution (pH >13) for 30 min at 30 V. The slides were then normalized, stained with ethidium bromide and examined using fluorescence microscope. For each sample, 100 comets were randomly selected and measured for tail length and %DNA in tail.

**Histopathological study**

Small pieces of liver were fixed by 10% neutral buffered formalin and then embedded into paraffin, sectioned (5–6 μm), and mounted on glass microscopic slides using the standard histopathological technique. The sections were stained with hematoxylin and eosin (H and E) and Masson's Trichrome stains, and then examined by light microscopy.

**Statistical analysis**

Statistical analysis was performed using GraphPad Prism (GraphPad Software, San Diego, CA, USA), and all statistical comparisons were made using the one-way analysis of variance test followed by Tukey's test post hoc analysis. Results were expressed as mean ± standard error of the mean and the value of P < 0.05 was considered statistically significant.

**RESULTS**

Silymarin alone or in combination with chlorogenic acid and/or melatonin prevent carbon tetrachloride-induced liver injury and fibrogenesis

Data represented in Figure 1 show the effects of SIL alone and in combination with CA and/or ME on serum ALT activity, the main liver activity biomarker, in CCl₄-intoxicated rats. Administration of CCl₄ produced a significant (P < 0.001) increase in serum ALT activity when compared with the control rats. Concurrent administration of SIL significantly (P < 0.001) decreased serum ALT activity in CCl₄-intoxicated rats. Treatment of CCl₄-intoxicated rats with SIL combined with CA, ME or both significantly (P < 0.001) ameliorated serum ALT activity when compared with either CCl₄ or SIL treated rats.

Histopathological examination of the H and E-stained liver sections of control rats showed the normal histological structure of the hepatocytes [Figure 2a]. On the other hand, sections in the liver of rats treated with CCl₄ showed focal areas with massive degeneration, necrosis, and inflammatory cellular infiltration [Figure 2b]. Liver of CCl₄-intoxicated rats treated with SIL revealed moderate improvement of hepatic cellular degeneration [Figure 2c]. CCl₄-induced rats treated with SIL combined with CA [Figure 2d] or ME [Figure 2e] showed marked improvement of hepatocellular degeneration, but still there are scattered areas of degeneration and focal areas of cellular infiltration. Rats received CCl₄ and treated with SIL, CA, and ME showed apparently normal liver tissue [Figure 2f]. To demonstrate the effects of CCl₄ and treatment with SIL alone or combined with CA and/or ME on collagen deposition, liver sections were stained with Masson’s trichrome. Control rats showed little collagen fibers, especially in the portal area [Figure 3a] while CCl₄-intoxicated rats showed large patches of fibrous tissue [Figure 3b]. Treatment of the CCl₄-intoxicated rats with SIL [Figure 3c] and its combination with either CA [Figure 3d] or ME [Figure 3e] decreased fibrous tissue deposition but still some scattered areas of collagen deposition in the portal area. The combined triple treatment (SIL, CA and ME) significantly reduced collagen deposition and showed apparently normal collagen distribution within the liver tissue of CCl₄-intoxicated rats [Figure 3f].
Silymarin alone or in combination with chlorogenic acid and/or melatonin reduce serum vascular endothelial growth factor levels in carbon tetrachloride-intoxicated rats

CCl₄-administered rats exhibited a significant (P < 0.001) increase in serum levels of VEGF as represented in Figure 4. Treatment with SIL or its combination either with CA or with ME significantly (P < 0.05) decreased serum VEGF levels when compared with the CCl₄-intoxicated rats. Treatment of the CCl₄-intoxicated rats with SIL, CA and ME potentially (P < 0.001) decreased serum VEGF. Compared with SIL alone, no significant differences on serum VEGF levels were recorded when combined with CA and/or ME.

Silymarin alone or in combination with chlorogenic acid and/or melatonin attenuate carbon tetrachloride-induced inflammation

CCl₄-intoxicated rats showed a significant (P < 0.001) increase in liver levels of the pro-inflammatory cytokine TNF-α, as represented in Figure 5a. Oral administration of SIL alone significantly (P < 0.01) decreased levels of TNF-α in the liver of CCl₄-induced rats. Treatment of the CCl₄-intoxicated rats with SIL combined with CA and/or ME produced a marked decrease (P < 0.001) in TNF-α when compared with the CCl₄ control rats. The combination of SIL and CA significantly (P < 0.05) alleviated serum TNF-α levels when compared with SIL alone. Treatment of the CCl₄-intoxicated rats with SIL combined with either ME or CA and ME produced a more potent effect (P < 0.001) on liver TNF-α levels when compared with SIL alone.

CRP showed a significant (P < 0.001) increase in the liver of CCl₄-intoxicated rats when compared with the control group [Figure 5b]. Oral administration of SIL and its combination with CA and/or ME produced a significant (P < 0.001) decrease in liver CRP levels. The combination of SIL with CA or ME produced no significant change in liver CRP levels compared with SIL-treated group, its combination with both CA and ME significantly (P < 0.05) reduced CRP levels.

IL-6 exhibited a significant (P < 0.001) elevation in the serum of CCl₄-intoxicated rats when compared with the corresponding control rats [Figure 5c]. Treatment of the CCl₄-intoxicated rats with SIL significantly (P < 0.01) decreased serum IL-6. In addition, SIL in combination with CA and/or ME produced a marked (P < 0.001) decrease in serum levels of IL-6 in CCl₄-intoxicated rats. While its combination with either CA or ME showed a nonsignificant (P > 0.05) effect, SIL combined with both agents significantly (P < 0.05) decreased IL-6 levels as compared with SIL alone.

Serum IFN-γ exhibited nearly the same behavioral pattern. CCl₄ administration produced a significant (P < 0.001) increase in serum
levels of IFN-γ when compared with the control rats as depicted in Figure 5d. Concurrent treatment of the CCl₄-intoxicated rats with SIL or SIL combined with either CA or ME significantly (P < 0.01) ameliorated serum IFN-γ. When combined with both CA and ME, SIL produced a significant (P < 0.001) amelioration of serum IFN-γ in CCl₄-intoxicated rats.

Silymarin alone or in combination with chlorogenic acid and/or melatonin prevent carbon tetrachloride-induced oxidative DNA damage

 Comet assay data represented in Figure 6a and b show the effects of SIL alone and in combination with CA and/or ME on DNA fragmentation in the liver of CCl₄-intoxicated rats. Rats received CCl₄ showed a significant (P < 0.001) DNA damage as indicated by the significant increase in comet tail length and DNA% when compared with the control group. SIL, alone or combined with CA and/or ME, significantly (P < 0.001) attenuated DNA damage in CCl₄-intoxicated rats. While the combination of SIL with either CA or ME produced no effect on comet tail length, both combinations significantly decreased tail DNA% when compared with SIL alone. On the other hand, the triple combination significantly decreased both comet tail length (P < 0.05) and DNA% (P < 0.001) when compared with SIL monotherapy.

To further investigate the protective effects of SIL, CA and ME on CCl₄-induced oxidative DNA damage, liver 8-OxodG was assayed.
8-OxodG showed a significant ($P < 0.001$) increase in the liver of CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats when compared with the corresponding control group [Figure 6c]. Oral treatment of CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats with SIL significantly ($P < 0.01$) decreased 8-OxodG levels in the liver. When combined with CA and/or ME, SIL produced a significant ($P < 0.001$) decrease in liver 8-OxodG levels.

Silymarin alone or in combination with chlorogenic acid and/or melatonin ameliorate activity of cytochrome P450 2E1 and caspase-3 in liver of carbon tetrachloride-intoxicated rats

CCl$_4$-administered rats showed a significant ($P < 0.001$) decrease in hepatic CYP2E1 activity, as represented in Figure 7a. Treatment with...
SIL alone significantly ($P < 0.001$) restored hepatic CYP2E1 activity in CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats. Oral administration of SIL combined with CA and/or ME produced marked improvement ($P < 0.001$) of CYP2E1 activity in liver of CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats. The combination of SIL, CA and ME significantly ($P < 0.001$) alleviated hepatic CYP2E1 activity when compared with SIL alone.

Conversely, the apoptosis marker caspase-3 showed a significant ($P < 0.001$) increase in liver of CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats, as represented in Figure 7b. Oral treatment with SIL either alone or combined with CA and/or ME significantly ($P < 0.001$) reduced hepatic caspase-3 activity. The combination of SIL with CA or ME did not affect liver caspase-3 when compared with SIL alone. On the other hand, the combination of SIL, CA and ME significantly ($P < 0.05$) decreased liver caspase-3 activity when compared with SIL monotherapy.

**DISCUSSION**

In this investigation, we evaluated the protective effects of SIL alone and combined with CA and/or ME against liver injury induced by CCl$_4$, a frequently used model mimicking the liver damage caused by hepatotoxins in human. Our results showed that a single intraperitoneal dose of CCl$_4$ produced liver damage in rats, demonstrated by a significant elevation in serum ALT activity as well as the histopathological alterations. Elevated level of serum ALT is indicative of cellular leakage and loss of functional integrity of cellular membrane in liver. The elevated serum ALT activity is consistent with the findings of several previous studies.$^{[10-13,34]}$ A number of histopathological alterations including necrosis, degenerated hepatocytes, inflammatory cells infiltration, dilated hepatic sinusoids, steatosis, and large patches of fibrous tissue are evident in CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats. The present findings demonstrate that treatment of the intoxicated rats with SIL, alone and combined with CA and/or ME, potentially attenuated CCl$_4$-induced hepatocellular injury. Several studies have clearly reported that SIL,$^{[10,34]}$ CA$^{[20]}$ and ME$^{[20]}$significantly decreased liver ALT activity and histopathological alterations in rats. Interestingly, combination of SIL with CA or ME significantly ameliorated serum ALT and liver histological findings when compared with SIL alone. When combined with both CA and ME, SIL produced more potent amelioration, suggesting a possible synergy.

On liver injury, the damaged cells release a variety of cytokines, which then trigger the release of more inflammatory mediators from Kupffer cells.$^{[36]}$ Kupffer cells and activated hepatic stellate cells (HSCs) have been reported to secrete chemokines, pro-inflammatory cytokines and adhesion factors which play central roles in inflammation and liver fibrosis.$^{[27]}$ In accordance, CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats exhibited marked increase in liver TNF-α and CRP, and circulating IL-6 and IFN-γ, demonstrating inflammation. Further, CCI$_4$ administration induced the formation of patches of fibrous tissue in the liver of the rats. The increased inflammatory mediators could be explained by CCl$_4$-induced activation of nuclear factor-kappa B (NF-kB) leading to the induction of pro-inflammatory cytokines$^{[38]}$ such as TNF-α and IL-6. These inflammatory responses are usually accompanied by biliary obstruction$^{[39]}$ and are implicated in increased markers of end-organ injury and death. TNF-α is a pro-inflammatory cytokine contributes to the pathological complications observed in several diseases$^{[41]}$ and activates the pro-apoptotic caspase cascade.$^{[40]}$ Therefore, inhibition of TNF-α synthesis or activity could attenuate liver injury induced by various toxicants. A recent study conducted by AlSaid et al.$^{[41]}$ reported significant up-regulation of TNF-α and IL-6 mRNA expression that was observed in the CCl$_4$-administered rats. In the same context, Ebad et al.$^{[20]}$ demonstrated increased TNF-α mRNA expression in the liver tissue of a rat model of CCl$_4$-induced hepatotoxicity.

Oral treatment of the CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats with SIL, alone or combined with CA and/or ME, markedly ameliorated liver TNF-α as well as serum IL-6 levels. These findings could be attributed to the anti-inflammatory and immunomodulatory effects of SIL, CA and ME. The anti-inflammatory efficacy of SIL in CCl$_4$-induced rats has been reported in a number of studies.$^{[42]}$ Previous work conducted by Shalan et al.$^{[43]}$ Shafer et al.$^{[44]}$ and Rasool et al.$^{[34]}$ clearly demonstrated that SIL possesses anti-inflammatory potential and can attenuate CCl$_4$-induced histopathological changes, such as necrosis, ballooning, and inflammatory infiltration of lymphocytes. Since CCl$_4$-induced liver injury is thought to be mediated partly through the action of inflammatory cytokines on hepatocytes, the anti-inflammatory function of CA may contribute to its hepatoprotective effects. It has been shown that CA inhibits staphylococcal exotoxin-induced production of inflammatory cytokines in human peripheral blood mononuclear cells.$^{[45]}$ Furthermore, CA presented anti-inflammatory activity in an animal model of carrageenan-induced inflammation.$^{[46]}$ Furthermore, CA has been reported to regulate the expression of inflammatory cytokines in LPS-activated macrophages$^{[47]}$ and mice.$^{[48]}$ The anti-inflammatory effect of CA has been recently shown to be mediated through inhibition of toll-like receptor 4 signaling pathway in CCl$_4$-treated rats.$^{[27]}$ ME has been demonstrated to decrease the mRNA expression of TNF-α, IL-1 β, and NF-kB in aged mice.$^{[49]}$ ME inhibited the expression of NF-kB and decreased production of pro-inflammatory cytokines from Kupffer cells in liver tissue of fibrotic rats.$^{[47]}$ ME also reduced cytokine levels in surgical neonates$^{[49]}$ and in CCl$_4$-induced rats.$^{[28]}$ The study conducted by Ebad et al.$^{[34]}$ reported that ME treatment produced significant down-regulation of TNF-α and IFN-γ mRNA expression in the liver of CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats. The anti-inflammatory effect of the treatment agents was further confirmed by the decreased serum IFN-γ and liver CRP levels in CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats. An interesting finding in the present investigation is the potentiated anti-inflammatory effect of SIL when combined with CA and ME. The anti-inflammatory effects of SIL, CA and ME could be explained regarding their antioxidant and radical scavenging activities. During its biotransformation by CYP2E1, CCl$_4$ produces highly reactive CCl3OO• and superoxide anion free radicals. NF-kB has been well-documented to be up-regulated by free radicals, leading to production of pro-inflammatory cytokines.$^{[49]}$ These cytokines, particularly TNF-α, activate the pro-apoptotic caspase cascade.$^{[44]}$ In the present investigation, CCl$_4$ induced a marked increase in hepatic caspase-3. As the central place of detoxification, liver is constantly exposed to cell stress which disrupts the balance of inflammatory cytokines that promote or prevent injury.$^{[9]}$ Under stress, hepatocytes become more susceptible to the lethal effects of Fas ligand, IFNγ and TNF-α. Subsequently, TNF and Fas receptor-associated death domain proteins activates caspase-8 which can start apoptosis through a direct activation of caspases-3, 6, and 7.$^{[34]}$ Treatment of the CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats with SIL alone or in combination with CA and/or ME significantly decreased hepatic caspase-3 activity. These results support the beneficial effect of the three treatment agents in counteracting hepatotoxicity induced by CCl$_4$. In consistent with our findings, Patel et al.$^{[32]}$ and Al-Rasheed et al.$^{[10]}$ reported elevated caspase-3 activity in doxorubicin and CCl$_4$-induced rats, respectively, and the ameliorative effect of SIL. Similarly, acetaminophen-induced liver injury in rats has been associated with up-regulated caspase-3, an effect that was reversed following treatment with CA.$^{[50]}$ In addition, studies showed that ME attenuated apoptosis in CCl$_4$ and acetaminophen-treated rats.$^{[33]}$ Further, Ebad et al.$^{[20]}$ reported that ME treatment reduced FAS expression in the liver of CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats.

CCl$_4$-induced oxidative stress acts as a stimulus for the process of fibrogenesis in experimental animals and humans.$^{[50]}$ Apoptosis has also been considered as one of the events involved in the fibrosis of the liver.$^{[50]}$ In this study, increased level of collagen deposition in the liver of CCl$_4$-intoxicated rats is evident from the Masson’s trichrome special staining. This was concomitant with the increased inflammatory cytokines which are known to activate HSCs, major collagen-producing cells in injured liver.$^{[50]}$
findings were further confirmed by the increased serum levels of VEGF. Increased expression of VEGF and its receptors has been reported in experimentally-induced cirrhosis[16] and CCl₄-induced fibrosis. Moreover, VEGF has been suggested to contribute to the development of liver fibrosis through inducing the proliferation of sinusoidal endothelial cells and HSCs. In this study, we found that serum levels of VEGF were decreased in CCl₄-treated rats treated with SIL alone or combined with CA and/or ME. Therefore, it seems that attenuated production of VEGF by SIL and CA and/or ME plays a central role in decreasing collagen production in HSCs. Free radicals produced during the biotransformation of CCl₄ can covalently bind to macromolecules such as lipids and induce an increase in free peroxide and lipoperoxide radicals. These free radicals can cause oxidative DNA damage including genetic mutations, strand breakage, formation of DNA adducts, and chromosomal alterations.[38] In addition, the free radicals can increase 8-OxodG concentration in tissues of experimental animals.[32] Data of this study indicated CCl₄-induced DNA oxidative damage and strand breakage as showed from the results of 8-OxodG and comet assays. 8-OxodG is a predominant form of free radical-induced nuclear and mitochondrial DNA oxidative damage and has thus been used as a biomarker for oxidative stress.[63] Comet assay is a sensitive tool used for the detection of DNA damage.[44] Administration of SIL alone or combined with CA and/or ME, respectively decreased 8-OxodG and DNA strand breaks in the liver of CCl₄-intoxicated rats, which could be associated with their antioxidant effects. The protective effects of SIL, CA and ME on CCl₄-induced hepatotoxicity could also be connected to their ability to increase the activity of CYP2E1. Multiple studies have reported that in both human and rodents the biotransformation of CCl₄ is principally mediated by CYP2E1.[10] In this context, the study of Wong et al.[41] demonstrated the resistance to CCl₄ hepatotoxicity in CYP2E1 knockout mice. Here, we found that CCl₄ administration induced a considerable decrease in hepatic CYP2E1 activity, an effect that was reversed in CYP2E1 knockout mice. Here, we found that CCl₄-induced DNA oxidative damage and strand breakage as showed from the results of 8-OxodG and comet assays. 8-OxodG is a predominant form of free radical-induced nuclear and mitochondrial DNA oxidative damage and has thus been used as a biomarker for oxidative stress.[63] Comet assay is a sensitive tool used for the detection of DNA damage.[44] Administration of SIL alone or combined with CA and/or ME, respectively decreased 8-OxodG and DNA strand breaks in the liver of CCl₄-intoxicated rats, which could be associated with their antioxidant effects. The protective effects of SIL, CA and ME on CCl₄-induced hepatotoxicity could also be connected to their ability to increase the activity of CYP2E1. Multiple studies have reported that in both human and rodents the biotransformation of CCl₄ is principally mediated by CYP2E1.[10] In this context, the study of Wong et al.[41] demonstrated the resistance to CCl₄ hepatotoxicity in CYP2E1 knockout mice. Here, we found that CCl₄ administration induced a considerable decrease in hepatic CYP2E1 activity, an effect that was reversed following treatment with SIL either alone or combined with CA and/or ME. In consistent with our findings, the expression[38][40][41] and activity[10][42] of hepatic CYP2E1 showed significant decrease in CCl₄-treated rodents. Recently, SIL has been reported to ameliorate hepatic CYP2E1 activity in CCl₄-intoxicated rats.[16][38] Interestingly, the ameliorative effect of SIL on CYP2E1 activity was significantly increased when combined with both CA and ME.

CONCLUSION
This study demonstrates that SIL alone and combined with CA and/or ME protected the liver against CCl₄-induced injury via attenuating inflammation, oxidative DNA damage, apoptosis, and fibrotic changes. The effects of SIL were significantly intensified when combined with both CA and ME. These findings suggest a synergistic effect between SIL, CA, and ME. This synergism plays an active role in their protective mechanism against CCl₄-induced liver injury. However, the hypothesized synergistic effects need to be further confirmed using detailed pharmacological, toxicological, and clinical studies.

Acknowledgment
The authors wish to acknowledge the Research Center of the Female Scientific and Medical Colleges, Deanship of Scientific Research, King Saud University, Saudi Arabia.

Financial support and sponsorship
This research project was supported by a grant from the Research Center of the Female Scientific and Medical Colleges, Deanship of Scientific Research, King Saud University, Saudi Arabia.

Conflicts of interest
There are no conflicts of interest.

REFERENCES
1. Pradhan SC, Girish C. Hepatoprotective herbal drug, silymarin from experimental pharmacology to clinical medicine. Indian J Med Res 2006;124:491-504.
2. Navarro VJ, Senior JR. Drug-related hepatotoxicity. N Engl J Med 2006;354:731-9.
3. Willett KL, Roth RA, Walker L. Workshop overview: Hepatotoxicity assessment for botanical dietary supplements. Toxicol Sci 2004;79:4-9.
4. Papay JI, Cines D, Rafi R, Yuen N, Britt SD, Walsh JS, et al. Drug-induced liver injury following possible drug recharge. Regul Toxicol Pharmacol 2009;54:84-90.
5. Weber LW, Boll M, Stapfli A. Hepatotoxicity and mechanism of action of halokanics: Carbon tetrachloride as a toxicological model. Crit Rev Toxicol 2003;33:105-36.
6. Manibustain MK, Odin M, Eastrom DA. Postulated carbon tetrachloride mode of action: A review. J Environ Sci Health C Environ Carcinog Ecotoxicol Rev 2007;25:185-209.
7. Cornelli MC, Mengs U, Schneider C, Prosdocimi M. Toward the definition of the mechanism of action of silymarin: Activities related to cellular protection from toxic damage induced by chemotherapy. Int J Cancer Ther 2007;6:129-0.
8. Fraschini F, Demartini G, Esposti D. Pharmacology of silymarin. Clin Drug Investig 2002;22:51-65.
9. Pradeep K, Mohan GV, Gobianand K, Karthikeyan S. Silymarin modulates the oxidant-antioxidant imbalance during diethylthiouracil induced oxidative stress in rats. Eur J Pharmacol 2007;560:110-6.
10. Al-Rasheed N, Faddah L, Sharaf IA, Mohammad AM, Al-Rasheed N, Abdelbaky N. Assessment of the potential role of silymarin alone or in combination with Vitamin E and/or curcumin on the carbon tetrachloride induced liver injury in rat. Braz Arch Biol Technol 2015;58:833-42.
11. Karimi G, Vahabzadeh M, Lari P, Rashedina M, Moshin M. “Silymarin,” a promising pharmacological agent for treatment of diseases. Iran J Basic Med Sci 2011;14:308-17.
12. Clifford MN. Chlorogenic acids and other cinnamates – Nature, occurrence, dietary burden, absorption and metabolism. J Sci Food Agric 2000;80:1033-43.
13. Kasi H, Fukada S, Yamaizumi S, Sugie S, Mon H. Action of chlorogenic acid in vegetables as an antioxidant and as an inhibitor of 8-hydroxydeoxyguanosine formation in vitro and in a rat carcinogenesis model. Food Chem Toxicol 2000;38:467-71.
14. Feng R, Lu Y, Bowman LL, Qian Y, Castranova V, Ding M. Inhibition of activator protein-1, NF-kappaB and MAPKs and induction of phase II detoxifying enzyme activity by chlorogenic acid. J Biol Chem 2005;280:27888-95.
15. Shan J, Fu J, Zhao Z, Kong X, Huang H, Luo L, et al. Chlorogenic acid inhibits lipopolysaccharide-induced cyclooxygenase-2 expression in RAW264.7 cells through suppressing NF-kappaB and JNK/AP-1 activation. Int Immunopharmacol 2009;9:1042-8.
16. Wan CW, Wong CN, Pin WK, Wong MH, Kwok CY, Chan RY, et al. Chlorogenic acid exhibits cholesterol lowering and fatty liver attenuating properties by up-regulating the gene expression of PPAR-α in hypercholesterolemic rats induced with a high-cholesterol diet. Phytother Res 2013;27:545-51.
17. Xu Y, Chen J, Yu X, Tao W, Jiang F, Yin Z, et al. Protective effects of chlorogenic acid on acute hepatotoxicity induced by lipopolysaccharide in mice. Inflammm Res 2010;59:817-7.
18. Li J, Jiang P, Lu B, Sheng Y, Wang X, Wang Z. Chlorogenic acid, a dietary polyphenol, protects acetaminophen-induced liver injury and its mechanism. J Nutr Biochem 2013;24:191-9.
19. Reiter RJ, Calvo JR, Karbowink M, Qi W, Tan DX. Melatonin and its relation to the immune system and inflammation. Ann NY Acad Sci 2000;917:376-86.
20. Ebadz H, Bashandy SA, Alhzaza IM, Rady A, El-Shemy S. Folic acid and melatonin ameliorate carbon tetrachloride-induced liver injury, oxidative stress and inflammation in rats. Nutr Metab (Lond) 2013;10:20.
21. Altn A, Ugur-Altn B. Melatonin: Therapeutic and clinical utilization. Int J Clin Pract 2007;61:835-45.
22. Hsu JT, Kuo CJ, Chen TH, Wang F, Lin CJ, Yeh TS, et al. Melatonin prevents hemorrhagic shock-induced liver injury in rats through an Akt-dependent HD-1 pathway. J Pains Res 2012;53:410-6.
23. Allegra M, Reiter RJ, Tan DX, Gentile C, Tesoriere L, Livrea MA. The chemistry of melatonin’s absorption and metabolism. J Sci Food Agric 2000;80:1033-43.
24. Rodriguez C, Mayo JC, Sanz RM, Antolin I, Herrera F, Martin V, et al. Regulation of antioxidant enzymes: A significant role for melatonin. J Pineal Res 2003;34:1-10.
25. Feng Y, Siu KY, Ye X, Wang N, Yuan MF, Leung CH, et al. Hepatoprotective effects of berberine on carbon tetrachloride-induced acute hepatotoxicity in rats. Chin Med 2010;5:33.
26. Huang GJ, Deng JS, Chiu CS, Liao JC, Hsieh WT, Sheu MJ, et al. Hipsolin protects against acute liver damage in the rat by inhibiting lipid peroxidation, proinflammatory cytokine, and oxidative stress and downregulating the expressions of iNOS, COX-2, and MMP-9. Evid Based Complement Alternat Med 2012;2012:480714.
γ

46. tetrachloride-induced hepatic fibrogenesis in rats via inhibition of oxidative stress. Life Sci Wang H, Wei W, Wang NP, Gui SY, Wu L, Sun WY, Gerontol 2010;45:950-6.

38. inflammation processes in liver of senescence-accelerated prone male mice (SAMP8). Exp Cuesta S, Kireev R, Forman K, García C, Escames G, Ariznavarreta C, analgesic and antipyretic activities of the natural polyphenol chlorogenic acid. Biol Pharm Shaker E, Mahmoud H, Mnaa S. Silymarin, the antioxidant component and toxicity on rat liver with Vitamin C and silymarin supplements. Toxicology 2005;206:1-15.

33. Shalan MG, Mostafa MS, Hassouna MM, El-Nabi SE, El-Refaie A. Amelioration of lead oxidative damage in the rodent model. Biomed Res Int 2015;2015:359358.

30.-effectiveness of FasL/Fasl mRNA expression and TNFα release in cancanavalin A-induced liver injury in mice by bicyclol. World J Gastroenterol 2010;14:1779-85.

29. Brydson MM. A rapid and sensitive method for the quantitation of microgram quantities of protein utilizing the principle of protein-dye binding. Anal Biochem 1987;162:248-54.

28. Abdel-Wahhab MA, Abdel-Gall MM, El-Lithey M. Melatonin counteracts oxidative stress in rats fed an ochratoxin A contaminated diet. J Pineal Res 2005;38:130-5.

27. Shi H, Dong L, Jiang J, Zhao J, Zhao G, Dang X, et al. Chlorogenic acid reduces liver inflammation and fibrosis through inhibition of toll-like receptor 4 signaling pathway. Toxicology 2013;303:107-14.

26. Silymarin, the antioxidant component and effectiveness of Silybum marianum (Silimaniy) and Glycyrhiza glabra (Glycyrhin) in combination: A possible synergy. Evid Based Complement Alternat Med 2014;2014:641957.

25. Zavodnik LB, Zavodnik IB, Lapshina EA, Belonovskaya EB, Martinich DK, Kravchuk RI, et al. Protective effects of melatonin on carbon tetrachloride hepatotoxicity in rats. Cell Biochem Funct 2005;23:353-9.

24. Luckey SW, Petersen DR. Activation of Kupffer cells during the course of carbon tetrachloride-induced liver injury and fibrosis in rats. Exp Mol Pathol 2001;71:184-91.

23. Mehmetçiçek G, Ozdemirier G, Köçek-Toker N, Çevikbasi U, Uysal M. Effect of pretreatment with arachioth extract on carbon tetrachloride-induced liver injury and oxidative stress. Exp Toxicol Pathol 2009;60:475-80.

22. Rasoil M, Ibañez J, Malik A, Ramzan HS, Qureshi MS, Asif M, et al. Hepatoprotective effects of Silybum marianum (Silimaniy) and Glycyrrhiza glabra (Glycyrhin) in combination: A possible synergy. Evid Based Complement Alternat Med 2014;2014:641957.

21. Bradford MM. A rapid and sensitive method for the quantitation of microgram quantities of protein utilizing the principle of protein-dye binding. Anal Biochem 1987;162:248-54.

20. Singh NP McCoy MT, Tice RR, Schneider EL. A simple technique for quantitation of low levels of DNA in individual cells. Exp Cell Res 1988;175:184-91.

19. Mahli A, Koch A, Czech B, Peterburs P, Lechner A, Haunschild J, Luckey SW, Petersen DR. Activation of Kupffer cells during the course of carbon tetrachloride-induced liver injury and fibrosis in rats. Exp Mol Pathol 2001;71:226-8.

18. Pirzani M, Macias-Barragan J. Update on the pathophysiology of liver fibrosis. Expert Rev Gastroenterol Hepatol 2010;4:459-72.

17. Ali S, Mann DA. Signal transduction via the NF-κB pathway: A targeted treatment modality for infection, inflammation and repair. Cell Biochem Funct 2004;22:67-79.

16. Minter RM, Bili X, Bien-Josef G, Wang T, Hu B, Arbabi S, et al. LPS-binding protein mediates LPS-induced liver injury and mortality in the setting of biliary obstruction. Am J Physiol Gastrointest Liver Physiol 2009;296:G45-54.

15. Tacke F, Luedde T, Trautwein C. Inflammatory pathways in liver homeostasis and liver injury. Clin Rev Allergy Immunol 2009;36:4-12.

14. Al-Said M, Mothana R, Raish M, Al-Sohaibani M, Al-Yahya M, Ahmad A, et al. Evaluation of phytoextracts for hepatoprotective and anticancer activity. Clin Rev Allergy Immunol 2009;36:4-12.

13. Shalan MG, Mostafa MS, Hassouna MM, El-Nabi SE, El-Refaie A. Amelioration of lead toxicity on rat liver with Vitamin C and silymarin supplements. Toxicology 2005;206:1-15.

12. Shaker E, Mahmoud H, Mnaa S. Silymarin, the antioxidant component and Silybum marianum extracts prevent liver damage. Food Chem Toxicol 2010;48:893-6.

11. Krakauer T. The polyphenol chlorogenic acid inhibits staphylococcal exotoxin-induced inflammatory cytokines and chemokines. Immunopharmacol Immunotoxicol 2002;24:113-9.

10. dos Santos MD, Almeida MC, Lopes NP, de Souza GE. Evaluation of the anti-inflammatory, analgesic and antipyretic activities of the natural polyphenol chlorogenic acid. Biol Pharm Bull 2006;29:2236-40.

9. Cuesta S, Kisee R, Forman K, Garcia C, Escames G, Ariznavarreta C, et al. Melatonin improves inflammation processes in liver of senescence-accelerated prone male mice (SAMP8). Exp Gerontol 2010;45:950-6.

8. Wang H, Wei W, Wang NP, Gui SY, Wu L, Sun WY, et al. Melatonin ameliorates carbon tetrachloride-induced hepatic fibrogenesis in rats via inhibition of oxidative stress. Life Sci 2005;77:1902-15.

7. Gitto E, Romeo C, Reiter RJ, Impellizzeri P, Pesce S, Basile M, et al. Melatonin reduces oxidative stress in surgical neonates. J Pediatr Surg 2004;39:184-9.

6. Mahmoud AM, Al Dera HS. 18β-glycyrrhetinic acid exerts protective effects against cyclophosphamide-induced hepatotoxicity: Potential role of PPARγ and Nr2f 2 upregulation. Genes Nutr 2015;10:41.

5. Nanji AA, Jokelainen K, Rahentulsa A, Miao L, Fogt F, Matsumoto H, et al. Activation of nuclear factor kappa B and cytokine imbalance in experimental alcoholic liver disease in the rat. Hepatology 1998;30:934-43.

4. Li M, Liu GT. Inhibition of Fas/Fasl, mRNA expression and TNFα release in cancanavalin A-induced liver injury in mice by bicyclol. World J Gastroenterol 2010;14:1779-85.

3. Patel N, Joseph C, Corcoran GB, Ray SD. Silymarin modulates dstoxonubin-induced oxidative stress, Bcl-xl and p33 expression while preventing apoptotic and necrotic cell death in the liver. Toxicol Appl Pharmacol 2010;245:143-52.

2. Jia X, Han C, Chen J. Effects of tea on preneoplastic lesions and cell cycle regulators in rat liver. Cancer Epidemiol Biomarkers Prev 2002;11:1663-7.

1. Choi HS, Kang JW, Lee SM. Melatonin attenuates carbon tetrachloride-induced liver fibrosis via inhibition of necroptosis. Transl Res 2015;166:292-303.

ABOUT AUTHOR

Ayman M. Mahmoud obtained his Ph.D. degree in 2012 from the Faculty of Science, Beni-Suef University, Egypt. Dr. Mahmoud was an Erasmus Mundus Postdoctoral fellow at the School of Pharmacy, Granada University (Spain) and then an International Atherosclerosis Society (IASS, USA) fellow at Manchester Metropolitan University and Manchester Academy for Health Sciences (UK). His research interest is in cell signaling, oxidative stress, inflammation and cardiovascular diseases. He has research and experience base in the field of molecular therapy for the treatment of endothelial dysfunction, inflammatory diseases, diabetes, liver disorders and cancer. Currently, he is involved in projects related to small molecule glycomimetics, endothelial microparticles and nanotechnology as well as evaluation of phytoextracts for hepatoprotective and anticancer activity.

Ayman M. Mahmoud