Extending the Students’ Narrative Text Comprehension through Reading SMART Protocol

Fachri Ardiansyah, Aswadi Jaya
aswadijaya@yahoo.com

English Education Study Program, PGRI University of Palembang

Abstract: The problem of this study was “is there any significant difference on students’ reading achievement in learning narrative text to the tenth grade students of state vocational high school 1 Palembang who are taught through smart technique and those who are not?”. The main objective of this study was to find out whether or not there is any significant difference on students’ reading achievement in learning narrative texts to the tenth grade students of state vocational high school 1 Palembang who are taught through smart technique and those who are not. This study applied a Quasi Experimental Designs. The population was the Tenth grade students at State Vocational High School Palembang with the total number of the 389 students. The sample was 60 students. They were 30 students from X AKL 1 as control group and X AKL 2 as experimental group taken by using Purposive Random Sampling. The data were collecting by using a written test with multiple choice questions and analyzed by using Independent t-test. The result of the study showed that the students’ average score in control group in pre-test was 35.07 and in post-test was 47.04 and in experimental group in pre-test was 55.54 and in post-test was 84.54. The value of t-obtained 4.951 was higher than the value t-table 1.669, at the significant level 0.05 in two - tailed with df=64, It is found that there was significant difference on the tenth grade students’ reading achievement between those who are taught through Smart Technique and those who are not of State Vocational High School 1 Palembang.

Keywords: Teaching, Reading, Narrative Text, and Smart Technique.

I. INTRODUCTION
Reading is an activity to get many information and knowledge. For examples; book, newspaper, magazine, etc. Even though, reading is not an easy task to do because reading comprehension is an effort to understand, evaluate and also recognize the author’s ideas of reading text. However, the more we read, the more we discover new things, gain knowledge, develop mind, and improve analytical thinking capacity. Therefore, we must learn to read.

According to Harmer (2007:99), reading is useful for language acquisition, provided that students more or less understand about what they read, the more they read, and
the better they get at it. Moreover, Brown (2003:3) states, reading are a process of communication from the author. The reader arguably if the most essential skill for success in all education contexts reminds a skill of paramount importance as we create assessment or general language ability. Furthermore, Grellet (2004:7) states that reading is a constant process of guessing and what one brings to the next is often more important than what one finds in it.

In reading, the students should be taught to use what they know to understand unknown elements, whether these are ideas or simple words. Many people have their own purpose to read, for those who have a career, they read for developing their career, for general people they read for their own pleasure. To develop reading ability, students can read many kinds of text. One of them is narrative text. Narrative text is a kind of passage that has meaningful sequence of events told in words. It is sequential in that the events are ordered, not merely random. According to Ellyattin Butcher (2006:198), storytelling/narrative is usually combined with human actions or events that effect human beings. The meaning of each event is produced by the part it plays in the whole episode. Meanwhile, Abbott (2008:19) notes that narrative is the representation of events, consisting of story. The story in narrative text has the elements that can make the story more interesting and entertaining the reader like conflict and conclusion of the story.

Students often find difficulty to comprehend the English reading texts. Because according to Oakkhill, Cain, and Elbro (2015:6) “poor comprehends have difficulties with reading comprehension, despite developing good word reading skills and having no other apparent language or cognitive problems”. So, Reading concerns not only with sound and words but also with understanding of what is written. By reading it is hoped that students will get much information to exchange their language. It is considered clear that reading is one of the skills that should be learned and mastered. But, the students still have problems in comprehending reading materials. One of the problems is their reading ability. Many students still have problems in reading, because many students do not understand the meanings of the texts. Other factors that affect student’s ability to comprehend is the presence of unknown vocabulary, idiomatic expressions, complex sentence structure, and an unfamiliar style such as a formal academic style or a regional dialect.

Based on the writer’s experience on observing the students’ learning condition. The writer found that the students got difficulties in reading, translating and understanding the text because of their reluctance in reading activities, lack of vocabulary, confused in determining the main idea of the text. Many students often did not like reading session in the classroom. They may consider reading is a boring task and extremely a difficult subject. Furthermore, students found it difficult to read or recite some texts. After they read the texts, many students did not understand what information the text gave. In other
words, students only read the text without knowing the information from the text.

There are so many strategies to apply; one of the strategies that can be used is SMART strategy. Buehl (2001:130) said that Self-Monitoring Approach to Reading and Thinking (SMART) strategy is a strategy in teaching reading that helps students get idea based on the premise that successful reading begins with recognizing what is understood and not understood in a passage. Thus, Self-Monitoring Approach to Reading and Thinking is based on the idea that effective reading starts with recognizing what is understood and not understood in a particular text.

This strategy can help the students become better at monitoring their comprehension and learn to carry on an internal monologue while they read. The students can understand the story well by identifying what is understood and not understood in a passage. Teacher should also help the students understand the material. This strategy chosen not only promotes reading comprehension but also provides opportunities for students to learn to monitor their own understanding.

Based on the background above, the writer is interested in conducting a study entitled Extending the Students’ Narrative Text Comprehension through Reading SMART Protocol.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW
a) Concept of Teaching

Brown (2007:8) claims that “Teaching is guiding and facilitating learning, enabling the learner to learn, setting the conditions for learning” Then, according to Gage (2009:2) “Teaching is the search for relationships between variables where at least one of the variables is a behavior, a thought, or a characteristic of teachers”. In other hand, “Teaching is acting so as deliberately and directly to facilitate learning. While what is done to achieve the purpose of teaching may be almost infinitely diverse, it is the purpose of these activities, not the activities themselves, which is definite” state Moon, et al (2002:13). Moreover, “teaching is one of the first things a college teacher learner is that there is an astonishing level of collective wisdom and knowledge in a class of thirty students. It may not be factual knowledge, or at least not factual knowledge about a wide range of historical topics, since that is not what our culture values much, but it is judgment and insight of a high order” said Nelson and Watt (2009:281). While Harmer (2010:24), stated that “teaching is not an easy job, but it is a necessary one, and can be very rewarding when we see our students’ progress and know that we have helped to make it happen. It is true that some lessons and students can be difficult and stressful at times, but it is also worth remembering that at its best teaching can also be extremely enjoyable”. Based on statement about writer concluded that teaching is a process in learning where there is students as a media to received knowledge and teacher as a media to transfer knowledge. So, this process can be a media for transfer knowledge in learning at the classroom.
Based on some definitions above, the writer concludes that teaching is a process which is done by the teacher such as guiding, transferring, explaining and evaluating in learning process. Whereas students get knowledge from the teacher who transferred the knowledge by doing teaching process.

b) Concept of Reading

Johnson (2008:3), states “Reading is the practice of using text to create meaning. The two key words here are creating and meaning. If there is no meaning being created, there is no reading taking place”. While Macca (2007:4), “Reading is a dialogue between the reader and the author, and during this “dialogue,” the reader should generate questions to help anticipate meaning, search for information, respond intellectually and infer ideas from and explain further the content of the text.” Then, Birch also said that (2002), Reading is complex when examined with all it is detail, it is complicated because it involves a great deal a precise knowledge which must be acquired or learned and many processing strategies which must be practiced until they are automatic. Reading is one of skill in English. According to Fischer (2003:2), “reading is of course the ability to make sense of written or printed symbols. The reader’s uses the symbols to guide the recovery of information from his or her memory and subsequently uses this information to construct a plausible interpretation of the writer’s message.”

Then, Patel & Jain (2008:117) claimed that, there are 4 types of reading. Those types are common faced by students. Here are 4 types of reading:

1. **Extensive Reading**

   Extensive reading is other types of reading. Extensive reading will help students to develop to active vocabulary and enrich learners’ knowledge. Extensive reading is reading for pleasure. The readers do not care about specific or important information after reading. Most of them update.

2. **Intensive Reading**

   Intensive reading is related to further progress in language learning under the teacher’s guidance. Extending knowledge or vocabulary and idioms will be provided by intensive reading. The goal of this reading is to read shorter text. This reading is done to carry out get specific information.

3. **Silent Reading**

   Silent reading is done to acquire a lot of information. Teacher has to make students read silently in reading. Silent reading makes students very active and accurate, concentrates the attention of students toward text or subject, and develops the skill of reading fast.

4. **Aloud Reading**

   Aloud reading pushes students to talk and read any subject matter. The students should pronounce very well in English. Aloud reading enable
students to develop the skill of reading very well by speaking or expressing ideas and pronunciation as well.

Based on some definitions above, the writer concludes that reading is a skill in English which explains about the meaning of the text and reader can get information from author by reading the text. Then, in reading text there are 4 kinds of reading. Such as: Extensive reading, Intensive Reading, Silent Reading and Aloud reading.

c) Concept of Narrative Text

“Narrative text follow a typical story pattern and some shorter stories contain simple story patterns, whereas longer stories are more complex what makes narrative text easier for student to comprehend than informational text is their familiarity with stories” stated Antonacci and O’callaghan (2011:114). According to Knapp and Watkins (2005:220), “Narrative is one of the most commonly read, though least understood of all the genres. Because narrative has been and continues to be such a popular genre, there is a belief that it is a genre that students ‘pick up’ and write ‘naturally’.” On the other hand, Narrative is the one of reading material that is often taught in Junior High School. But there are still many students cannot catch the information from what they read. We use narrative texts to entertain the readers/or listeners with our stories (Mukarto et al., 2007:123). Furthermore, According to Dymock (2007:161) narratives are more than simple lists of sentences or ideas. Narratives are stories. Research suggests that comprehension of narrative text is better when the text is organized to a well-known story grammar. Sulaiman (2017:47) points out that:

The narrative text defines as a story or book which is in the form of story or series of events of a story. It is a text telling a story, deal with problematic which lead to a crisis or turning point of some kind which in turn find a resolution. The communicative purpose of narrative text is to entertain readers about the story and to teach and inform writer's reflection on experience.

Based on some definitions above, the writer concludes that narrative text is a shorter story which has popular genres. Narrative texts use to entertain the reader, then it is also give information from stories for students.

In addition, the generic structure of narrative text focuses on a series of stages that purpose to build a story. (Mukarto et al., 2007:123). A narrative text usually has three main parts: orientation, complication, resolution.

1. Orientation : telling about setting in time and place, and characters.
2. Complication : telling about problem(s) to be solved by characters.
3. Resolution : describing the solution to the complication(s) and gives an ending to the story.

Based on statement above writer concludes that narrative text is a text which tell about stories that related with fiction, legend, folktales,
fairytale, and story in some places which has function as a text to entertain the reader

**Concept of SMART Technique**

According to Vaughn and Estes in Buehl (2001:105) SMART strategy is one strategy that triggers students to think about how their reading is proceeding. SMART is based on the premise that successful reading begins with recognizing what is understood and not understood in a passage (Buehl, 2001:105). So, the use of this strategy is supposed to be able to make our learners comprehend reading passages better. SMART can solve the English and students’ problem in reading comprehension. Based on statement above, Smart technique is a strategy where readers understand and comprehend what they read of the text. It can make students discuss about what the passage which they read.

Furthermore Smart Technique has Advantages and Disadvantages according to Buehl (2001:108) follow:

SMART offers a number of advantages as a teaching technique: Firstly, Students are provided with a system that helps them actively monitor their reading success. Secondly, students learn to verbalize what they do and do not understand in a reading. Thirdly, students are encouraged not to be satisfied until an entire reading makes sense, and they are given specific steps to try to clear up trouble spots. Lastly, students become involved in putting the material into their own words thus helping them to remember as well as understand it. This strategy is adaptable to most subject areas and is appropriate for elementary through high school age students. It is especially effective in cooperative group or tutorial settings.

However, SMART Technique also has disadvantages. First, SMART strategy represents only one strategy which covers several activities for reading comprehension. Second, it can be difficult for beginning teacher, take more time than other instructional model, and some students are not active and there are many activities. Finally, although SMART strategy is relatively simple, it takes much time for students especially those who are low achievers to be proficient in using their reading tasks.

**Procedures of SMART Technique**

Buehl (2009:106) describes how to apply SMART technique that involves the following steps:

1. select a passage of four or five paragraphs that you find personally challenging and ask students to follow along as you think aloud about your reading;
2. after reading the entire passage, model to students how to paraphrase material in words that make sense to them,
3. Introduce the SMART protocol to students; and
4. Have students read a passage on their own using the check mark and question mark system.

Practically, the above steps can be elaborated as follows:

**Step 1:** Do I understand? Place a check (√) in the margin of the text or on a sticky note when you understand
and a question mark (?) when you have a question.

**Step 2:** What have I just read? At the end of each paragraph, stop and summarize in your own words what you just read (look back at text if necessary).

**Step 3:** Does it make sense now? After reading the whole text, return to each paragraph that has a question mark and reread. If it still doesn't make sense, move to step 4.

**Step 4:** Why am I having trouble? Try to pinpoint the problem. Is it unfamiliar words? Concepts? Is the sentence structure too complex? Do you have little background information about the topic? Figure out your particular problem before going to step 5.

**Step 5:** Where can I get help? Try a variety of aids: glossary, appendix, dictionary, chapter summary... If you are still confused, ask a classmate or teacher.

**Procedure of Teaching Reading Narrative Texts Through SMART Technique**

As explained by (Buehl, 2009), the procedure of Smart technique are described as follow:

**a. Pre-Activity**

1) Prepare the instruction of how to use SMART for students.

2) Distribute the student worksheet.

3) Teacher introduces and explains about SMART Technique to the students.

**b. Whilst-Activity**

1) Give a model of Narrative text by giving brief explanation then followed by suggestion and motivation. For example, teacher explains briefly material about narrative text and gives motivation to students.

2) Ask students to read the narrative text individually. For example, teacher ask to the students to read a narrative text such as Malin Kundang.

3) Ask students to place a check mark (v) next to each paragraph that they understand and place a question mark (?) next to each paragraph that contains something they do not understand individually. For example, the teacher tells to the students to give check mark if they understand in every each paragraphs and students give question mark if they do not know in each paragraphs in the story about Malin Kundang.

4) Teacher asks students to explain with their own words what they read.

5) Teacher asks students to go back to each (?) and see if they can now make sense of paragraph by using SMART protocol. It includes: read,
self-translate, and troubleshoot.
6) Teacher asks the students to form in group and appointing a student as leader.
7) Teacher asks students to discuss to do the tasks based on the passage that they have read.
8) Teacher monitors students and gives them assistance.
9) Teacher ask students to read the tasks individually.

c. Post-activity
   1) Guide students to take the conclusion of lessons that they have learned and do reflection of learning process.
   2) Give reinforcement for students by giving them home tasks.

The Advantages and Disadvantages of SMART Technique

Buehl (2001) claims that SMART offers a number of advantages as a teaching strategy:
1. Students are provided with a system that helps them actively monitor their reading success.
2. Students learn to verbalize what they do and do not understand in reading.
3. Students are encouraged not to be satisfied until an entire reading makes sense and they are given specific steps to clear up trouble spots.
4. Students become involved in putting the material into their own words thus helping them to remember as well as understand it.

This strategy is adaptable to most subjects areas and is appropriate for elementary through high school age students. It is especially effective uncooperative group or tutorial settings.

Then, some limitations can also be addressed to SMART technique such as:
1. SMART technique represents only one strategy which covers several activities for reading comprehension.
2. It can be difficult for beginning teacher, take more time than other instructional model and some students are not active and there are many activity.
3. Although SMART technique is relatively simple, it takes much time for students especially those are low achievers to be proficient in using their reading task.

Previous Related Study

There were three studies which are related to the writer’s research.
First, the research entitled “Improving Reading Comprehension Achievement on Narrative Text By Using Reap Strategy to The Eighth Grade Students of Smp Muhammadiyah 1 Palembang” This was written by FitriAmalia in 2016. Based on the result of data analysis, it showed that Reap strategy was effective on students reading ability of narrative text. It can be seen by the result of pre-test and post-test. Post-test is 71.89 and pretest is 63.33 from the result is greater than t-table.
with n=70. It means that the use of Reap Strategy to can improve the student’s reading ability.

From that study, there are similarities and differences between the previous study. The similarities are, the both discuss “Reading Narrative text and in this study writer used two kinds of test, namely pre-test and post-test. Meanwhile, the differences are; (1) location and population (2) the previous study is teaching through Reap strategy, whereas this study is teaching through Smart Technique.

Second, the research entitled “The Use of SMART Strategy to Improve the Reading Comprehension of the ninth Grade students of MtsN Bantarwaru – Majalengka” this was written by Tori Satori in 2011. The formulation of problem is “To improve the students’ reading comprehension through the use of SMART strategy. In this study, there are similarities and differences between the previous studies. The similarities are(1) the both researcher analysis for students’ reading achievement, the previous study analysis students’ comprehension. (2) The previous study tests the ninth grade students and writer tests for tenth grade students. (3) The writer uses Quasi–Experimental and the previous study uses classroom action research design.

The last one was “Teaching Reading Narrative Text Through Exit Slips Strategy to the Eighth Grade students of State High School 12 of Palembang” this was written by selvi fitriani in 2017. The formulation of problem is “Is it effective to teach reading narrative text in the theme “Fairy Tale” through ESS to the eighth grade students of State High School 12 of Palembang?” Based on the result of study the achievement of junior state high school 12 of Palembang can be seen from the average of the students’ score in the pre-test it was 63.26 and in the post-test the average of the students’ was 77.42. The t-obtained was 8.821 exceeding 1.687 as it is critical value. It means that was effective teaching reading narrative text through exit slips strategy. In this study, there are similarities and differences between the previous studies. The similarities are(1) the both researcher analysis for students’ reading achievement in learning narrative text. (2) The both of them use pre-test and post-test. Meanwhile the differences are (1) writer and that previous study use different strategy, the previous study use exit slip strategy then writer will use smart technique. (2) The previous study tests the eighth grade students and writer test for tenth grade students.

III. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY
This study used experimental research. The writer used Quasi-Experimental Design and Pre-test and Post-test non-equivalent group. In this research, two classes had selected by writer. Which was one class used as control group which used manual strategy in learning and teaching process, and one another as
experimental class which is given treatment through SMART Technique. Where, the pre-test have been given at the first time of beginning the experimental research before writer give treatment through SMART Technique.

The population of this research is all of the tenth grade students of State Vocational High School of Palembang in the academic year of 2019-2020 that consist of 389 classes which contain 25-35 students.

The sample was taken by using purposive sampling. There are 60 members of students which divided into two groups; they were control and experimental sample (X AKL 1 & X AKL 2).

For collecting the data, the writer used use a written test. Then, the type of test used is multiple choice tests. the test is given consist of 40 items, in the types of 40 multiple choices in the theme “fairy tale” that should be done by the students. The writer used content validity and for reliability the writer used Kuder-Richardson Approaches (KR21) formula.

For analyzing the data, the writer used paired t-test and independent test. The calculation used SPSS statistics 23. Whereas independent t-test used to compare the result of pre-test and post-test between two groups and the conditions of two experimental then difference participants were assigned to each condition. SPSS 23 is used to apply the independent t-test.

IV. FINDINGS AND INTERPRETATION

a) Findings

This study was done at State Vocational High School 1 Palembang. There are three classes chosen and used in this study, they are X OTKP 1 (as the try out group), X AKL 1 (as the experimental group), and X AKL 2 (as the control group). The data in this study were taken from pre-test and post-test. The students have been given multiple choice tests. From the tests, the lowest score was 32.5 and the highest score was 80. Then, the mean score was 55.54 in pre-test of experimental group. While the lowest score was 17.5 and the highest score was 60 and the mean score was 35.07 in per-test of control group. Then, for post-test experimental the lowest score was 60 and the highest score was 97.5. Then, the mean score was 84.54. Meanwhile, in pre-test of control class the lowest score was 27.5 and the highest score was 67.5. Then, the mean score was 47.04.

Based on the result of paired sample t-test, it was found that the mean difference between pre-test and post-test experimental group was 43.31061 and the significant level was 0.000 since was lower than alpha value 0.05, it showed that in control class gained reading achievement significantly. Based on The analysis of independent sample t-test showed than the mean difference of the post-test each group was 31.72727 and the significant level was 0.000 since 0.000 was lower than alpha value 0.05, it showed that there was significant difference in reading between the two groups. This confirmed that the students in experimental group got better scores’ reading achievement which was
compared to those of the students in control group.

In this study, there were 33 students in experimental and control group. So, there were 66 students. This research was carried out for three weeks. The English teacher in this class study named Meriyati S.Pd.

b) Interpretation

Based on the findings data above, writer found that there was a significance difference between students` reading achievement in learning narrative texts to the tenth grade students of State Vocational High School 1 Palembang who are taught through Smart Technique and Those who are not. It can be showed from the average score of the students in the post-test in experimental group was 84.54 and the average score in the post-test in control group was 47.04.

The result of t-obtained was 12.119. Furthermore, its critical value at 0.05 significance level with 64 (df) was 1.669 and t-obtained 12.119 was higher than t-table 1.669 as a critical value. Which, Ho was rejected and Alternative Hypothesis was accepted. It means that there was significant difference between students` reading achievement in learning narrative texts to the tenth grade students of State Vocational High School 1 Palembang who are taught through Smart Technique and Those who are not.

According to Vaughn and Estes in Buehl (2001:105) SMART strategy is one strategy that triggers students to think about how their reading is proceeding. SMART is based on the premise that successful reading begins with recognizing what is understood and not understood in a passage (Buehl, 2001:105). SMART can solve the English and students’ problem in reading comprehension. Based on statement above, Smart technique is a strategy where readers understand and comprehend what they read of the text. It can make students discuss about what the passage which they read.

SMART technique is one of techniques which can be used for teaching reading narrative. It can be showed from previous related study entitled “The Use of SMART Strategy to Improve the Reading Comprehension of the ninth Grade students of MtsN Bantarwaru – Majalengka” this was written by Tori Satori in 2011. It showed that, the used of SMART Technique can improve the students’ achievement in reading comprehension.

V. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of pre-test and post-test in experimental and control class. There was significance difference between the both of class. It can be concluded that the students’
achievement in reading activity can be better by applying SMART Technique. It was shown in the students’ scores in experiment class was higher than the students’ scores control class. While it can be seen in mean score of post-test in experimental class which was greater than the mean of post-test in control class.

Furthermore, the writer used independent t-test to compare the students’ scores in the pre-test and post-test. It was found that t-obtained was 4.951, on the other hand, the significance level was 0.05 with df=64, and critical value of t-table was 1.669, it indicated that t-obtained was higher than the value of t-table. Furthermore, the null hypothesis (H₀) was rejected and alternative hypothesis (Hₐ) was accepted.

It can be concluded that there was significant difference on the tenth grade students’ reading achievement between those who are taught through SMART Technique and those who are not of State Vocational High School 1 Palembang. So the SMART Technique was effective to teach in reading skill.

REFERENCES
Abbott, H. Porter. (2008). The Cambridge Introduction to Narrative, 2nd Ed. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Brown, H. D. (2007). Principles of Language Learning And Teaching. San Fransisco: Pearson Education, Inc All Rights Reserved.

Bryman, A. (2012). Social Research Methods. New York: Oxford University Press Inc.

Buehl, Doug. (2001). Classroom Strategies for Interactive Learning. Newark: International Reading Association.

Butcher, Susan E. (2006). Narrative as a Teaching Strategy. The Journal of Correctional Education, 57(3), 195-208. Retrieved from http://www.olc.edu.

Creswell, J.W. (2012). Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Quantitative and Qualitative Research (4th Ed). University of Nebraska–Lincoln: Pearson Education, Inc.

Fraenkel, J. R, et al., (2012). How to design and evaluate research in education (8th ed). New York: McGraw-hill.

Gage, N. L. (2009). A Conception of Teaching. USA: Springer Science Business Media, LLC.

Grallet, F. 2004. Developing Reading Skills. United state of America: Cambridge University Press.

Griffee, D. T. (2012). An Introduction to Second Language Research.
Harmer, Jeremy. (2007). How to Teach English. New Edition. Pearson Education Limited: Edinburg Gate.

Hatch, E., & Lazaraton, A. (1991). The Research Manual Design and Statistics for Applied Linguistics. Los Angeles: Heinle & Heinle Publishers, a division of Wadsworth, Inc.

Johnson, A. P. (2008). Teaching Reading and Writing: A Guide Book for Tutoring and Remediating Students. New York: Rowman and Littlefield Education.

Knapp, Peter., & Watkins, M. (2005). Genre, Text, Grammar Technologies for Teaching and Assessing Writing. Sydney: University of New South Wales Press Ltd.

Macceca, S. (2007). Reading Strategies For Science. USA: Shell Education.

Moon, B, et al., (2002). Teaching, Learning and the Curriculum in Secondary schools. London, New York: Routledge Falmer.

Weiss, N. A. (2012). Introductory Statistics (9th Ed.). United