Examining maternal beliefs and human papillomavirus vaccine uptake among male and female children in low-income families

Erika L. Fuchs, Mahbubur Rahman, Abbey B. Berenson*

Department of Obstetrics & Gynecology, Center for Interdisciplinary Research in Women's Health, University of Texas Medical Branch, 301 University Blvd, Galveston, TX 77555, United States

A R T I C L E  I N F O

Article history:
Received 14 December 2015
Received in revised form 9 February 2016
Accepted 23 February 2016
Available online 2 March 2016

Keywords:
HPV vaccine
Vaccine series completion
Human papillomavirus
Vaccination
Mothers
Belief

A B S T R A C T

Purpose: This study examines within-family differences in the uptake of the HPV vaccine and HPV-related beliefs by children’s sex.

Methods: From a 2011–2013 survey of mothers of children aged 9–17 years in Texas, mothers with both male and female children (n = 350) were selected.

Results: Mothers were more likely to report having initiated and completed HPV vaccination for their daughters than sons. Mothers did not express differences by children’s sex in HPV-related beliefs. Among those who had not completely vaccinated either child, mothers were more likely to report they wanted their daughters compared to sons vaccinated and were more likely to report feeling confident they could get their daughters vaccinated than their sons.

Conclusion: In this population, mothers were more likely to report HPV vaccination of and motivation to vaccinate daughters compared to sons, although maternal beliefs about HPV did not differ by children’s sex.

© 2016 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

1. Introduction

The human papillomavirus (HPV) is responsible for approximately 18,000 cancers among females and 8000 cancers among males per year in the United States [1]. HPV vaccination has the potential to prevent the majority of HPV-related cancers and genital warts. While the Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices recommends that males and females receive routine HPV vaccination beginning at 11 or 12 years of age [2], recent estimates from the National Immunization Survey – Teen of the receipt of ≥ 1 dose were 60.0% in adolescent females and 41.7% in adolescent males [3]. Thus far, interventions aiming to increase HPV vaccination have had limited success, with mixed results found in two recent reviews [4,5].

Studies have identified differences in barriers to HPV vaccination of sons compared to daughters, including differences in provider recommendation, concerns about safety, and parents not knowing that boys could get the vaccine [6]. Though studies have examined within-family differences in HPV vaccination intention by children’s sex [7], no studies have reported on within-family differences in HPV-related beliefs by children’s sex. The aim of this study was to examine within-family differences by children’s sex in HPV vaccine uptake and HPV-related beliefs.

2. Methods

Between September 2011 and October 2013, women with ≥ 1 child aged 9–17 years were identified through review of the daily census and approached at four reproductive health clinics operated by the University of Texas Medical Branch (UTMB) to participate in a survey on HPV vaccination. Eligible participants were invited to complete a self-administered survey, available in either English or Spanish, and were reimbursed $5 for their time and effort. The UTMB Institutional Review Board approved this study. Of the 1436 women who met eligibility criteria, 1392 (97%) participated and 44 (3%) declined [8]. A subset of the original study, mothers who had both a son and a daughter 9–17 years old (n = 350), were included in these analyses.

Participants responded to questions regarding the HPV vaccine separately for their oldest daughter and oldest son in the 9–17 years age range. Mothers were asked whether their daughter/son had completed the HPV vaccine series, had started (but not completed) the series, had scheduled an appointment to receive it, or had not received any doses. Dichotomous variables were created for initiation (≥ 1 dose received) and completion (≥ 3 doses) of the vaccine series.
Mothers stated their agreement with statements about their beliefs beginning with, “If my daughter/son gets HPV,” and ending with, “it could harm her/his future health,” “it could harm her/his future relationship with her/his partner,” and, “I will be devastated.” Response options were dichotomized with those who reported they strongly disagreed, disagreed, or were neutral versus those who reported they agreed or strongly agreed. Mothers also responded to the following question on a 0–100% Likert scale with eleven points, “If your 9–17 year old daughter/son does NOT get Gardasil, what are the chances that she/he will contract HPV?” A similar question was asked about their child developing genital warts. Response options were dichotomized with those reporting 0% versus > 0%. Mothers also were queried, “I want my daughter/son vaccinated against the human papillomavirus (HPV) within the next year,” and, “I feel confident that I could get Gardasil for my daughter/son.” Response options were dichotomized with those who reported they strongly disagreed, disagreed, or were neutral versus those who reported they agreed or strongly agreed, while mothers with one or both children having completed the vaccine series were excluded from analysis.

McNemar's chi-squared tests for paired samples were used to examine marginal homogeneity across children's sex in maternal beliefs and children's HPV vaccination uptake. Statistical significance was assessed at the α = 0.05 level. All analyses were performed using Stata Version 14.0 [9].

3. Results

A total of 350 mothers indicated they had both a daughter and a son between 9–17 years of age. Most mothers were between 30 and 39 years of age, Hispanic, and married or cohabitating (Table 1). Mothers were more likely to report their daughters compared to sons had initiated the series and completed it, but overall vaccination was low, with 72.3% reporting no HPV vaccination for either child (Table 2). There were no differences by children's sex in mothers' beliefs about HPV, perceived risk of their children contracting HPV, or perceived risk of their children developing genital warts.

Among those who had not yet completely vaccinated either child (n = 277), mothers were more likely to report they wanted their daughters compared to sons vaccinated in the next year (Table 2). Mothers were also more likely to report feeling confident they could get their daughters vaccinated than their sons.

4. Conclusions/discussion

In this population, HPV vaccine uptake differed by children's sex, but maternal beliefs about HPV by children's sex were similar. These results suggest beliefs may not be driving sex differences in HPV vaccination. Mothers were more likely to report they wanted their daughters vaccinated than their sons and were more likely to report feeling confident they could get their daughters vaccinated, despite similar perceptions of risk. Since some physicians report a

---

Table 1
Demographic characteristics of families with both a son and a daughter 9–17 years old (n = 350).

| Maternal age, years | n (%) |
|---------------------|-------|
| < 30                | 19 (5.4) |
| 30–39              | 266 (76.0) |
| ≥ 40               | 65 (18.6) |

| Maternal race/ethnicity | n (%) |
|-------------------------|-------|
| White                   | 67 (19.1) |
| Black                   | 98 (28.0) |
| Hispanic                | 178 (50.9) |
| Other                   | 7 (2.0) |

| Maternal marital status | n (%) |
|-------------------------|-------|
| Single/Never married    | 60 (17.3) |
| Married/Cohabitating    | 189 (54.5) |
| Separated/Divorced/Widowed | 98 (28.2) |

| Maternal education | n (%) |
|--------------------|-------|
| Did not graduate high school | 172 (49.1) |
| High school graduate or GED | 108 (30.9) |
| College degree or some college | 70 (20.0) |

| Maternal employment status | n (%) |
|---------------------------|-------|
| Does not work             | 192 (54.9) |
| Employed (full time or part time) | 158 (45.1) |

| Annual household income | n (%) |
|-------------------------|-------|
| Less than $15,000       | 135 (39.0) |
| $15,000–$29,999         | 158 (45.7) |
| ≥ $30,000               | 53 (15.3) |

| Current maternal smoking | n (%) |
|--------------------------|-------|
| Yes                      | 84 (24.1) |
| No                       | 266 (75.9) |

| Mother ever diagnosed with an STD | n (%) |
|---------------------------------|-------|
| Yes                             | 55 (15.8) |
| No                              | 295 (84.2) |

| Mother ever diagnosed with HPV infection | n (%) |
|------------------------------------------|-------|
| Yes                                      | 21 (6.0) |
| No                                       | 329 (94.0) |

| Mother ever had an abnormal pap smear | n (%) |
|--------------------------------------|-------|
| Yes                                  | 96 (27.6) |
| No                                   | 254 (72.4) |

| Mother ever diagnosed with atypical precancerous cervical cells/ cervical cancer | n (%) |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| Yes                                                                           | 27 (7.7) |
| No                                                                            | 323 (92.3) |

| Age of daughters, mean (SD) | n (%) |
|-----------------------------|-------|
| ≤ 13 years                  | 13.5 (2.4) |
| > 13 years                  | 13.1 (2.5) |

| Age of sons, mean (SD)      | n (%) |
|-----------------------------|-------|
| ≤ 13 years                  | 13.5 (2.4) |
| > 13 years                  | 13.1 (2.5) |

Table 2
Child HPV vaccination uptake and maternal beliefs about HPV in families with both a son and a daughter 9–17 years old (n = 350).

| Initiated HPV vaccine | Both daughters and sons % (95% confidence interval) | Neither daughters nor sons % (95% confidence interval) | Daughters, but not sons % (95% confidence interval) | Sons, but not daughters % (95% confidence interval) | p-value* |
|----------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|---------|
| Initiated HPV vaccine | 8.6 (6.0–12.0)                                      | 72.3 (67.3–76.7)                                      | 17.4 (13.8–21.8)                                   | 1.7 (0.8–3.8)                                    | <0.001  |
| Completed HPV vaccine | 2.6 (1.3–4.9)                                       | 84.3 (80.1–87.7)                                      | 11.7 (8.7–15.5)                                    | 1.4 (0.6–3.4)                                    | <0.001  |
| HPV will harm future health | 41.2 (36.1–46.5)                                                | 42.3 (37.2–47.6)                                      | 6.7 (4.5–9.9)                                     | 9.9 (7.1–11.5)                                   | 0.145   |
| HPV will harm future relationships | 39.1 (34.1–44.4)                                                 | 44.6 (39.4–50.0)                                      | 6.1 (4.0–9.2)                                     | 10.1 (7.4–13.8)                                  | 0.061   |
| Feel devastated if child got HPV | 60.4 (55.1–65.5)                                               | 29.3 (24.7–34.4)                                      | 4.1 (2.4–6.8)                                     | 6.2 (4.0–9.3)                                    | 0.237   |
| Positive risk of contracting HPV | 67.9 (62.6–72.7)                                               | 25.8 (21.4–30.8)                                      | 3.6 (2.1–6.3)                                     | 2.7 (1.4–5.1)                                    | 0.513   |
| Positive risk of developing genital warts | 65.6 (60.2–70.5)                                              | 28.1 (23.5–33.2)                                      | 2.1 (1.0–4.4)                                     | 4.2 (2.5–7.0)                                    | 0.127   |
| Want child vaccinated for HPV in the next year* | 43.3 (37.6–49.3)                                               | 42.6 (36.9–48.5)                                      | 10.1 (7.1–14.3)                                   | 4.0 (2.2–7.1)                                    | 0.007   |
| Feel confident they could get child vaccinated for HPV | 44.4 (38.6–50.3)                                              | 40.1 (34.4–46.0)                                      | 11.2 (8.0–15.5)                                   | 4.3 (2.5–7.5)                                    | 0.004   |

* p-values calculated using McNemar’s chi-squared test for paired samples.
* Mothers who answered questions about at least one child who had completed the HPV vaccine series were excluded from these analyses (n = 73 excluded).
preference to vaccinate girls [10], associations between confidence in getting children vaccinated by sex and provider recommendation should be further explored.

This study has several strengths and limitations. While a strength of this study was the inclusion of a diverse, low-income population, the small sample size limited our ability to conduct multivariate analyses. We focused on views and behaviors that differ by children’s sex within a family, essentially controlling for maternal characteristics, though reliance on maternal report of children’s HPV vaccination is subject to recall bias. The survey used in this study had not been validated.

Mothers did not report different perceptions about how HPV would impact their sons compared to daughters, yet were less likely to vaccinate sons. This may lead to male adolescents being exposed to vaccine-preventable strains of HPV prior to initiating the series. Future interventions should address the disparity in uptake by ensuring parents receive both adequate information about HPV vaccination and equal access to the vaccine for their sons and daughters.

**Disclaimer**

This work reflects the opinions of the authors and does not represent the opinions or influences of the National Institutes of Health.

**Conflict of interest statement**

The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest.

**Acknowledgments**

Federal support for this study was provided by an institutional training grant (T32HD055163; PI AB Berenson) from the Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Health and Human Development to Dr. Fuchs as a postdoctoral fellow.

**References**

[1] Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Human papillomavirus-associated cancers – United States, 2004–2008, MMWR 61 (2012) 258–261.
[2] E. Petrosky, J.A. Bocchini Jr, S. Hariri, et al., Use of 9-valent human papillomavirus (HPV) vaccine: updated HPV vaccination recommendations of the advisory committee on immunization practices, MMWR 64 (2015) 300–304.
[3] S. Reagan-Steiner, D. Yankey, J. Jeyarajah, et al., National, regional, state, and selected local area vaccination coverage among adolescents aged 13–17 years – United States, 2014, MMWR 64 (2015) 784–792.
[4] L.Y. Fu, L.A. Bonhomme, S.C. Cooper, et al., Educational interventions to increase HPV vaccination acceptance: a systematic review, Vaccine 32 (2014) 1901–1920.
[5] L.M. Nicolai, C.E. Hansen, Practice- and Community-Based Interventions to Increase Human Papillomavirus Vaccine Coverage, JAMA Pediatr. 169 (2015) 686–692.
[6] D.M. Holman, V. Benard, K.B. Roland, et al., Barriers to human papillomavirus vaccination among US Adolescents: a systematic review, JAMA Pediatr. 168 (2014) 76–82.
[7] P.L. Reiter, A.L. McRee, J.A. Kadis, et al., HPV vaccine and adolescent males, Vaccine 29 (2011) 5595–5602.
[8] T.T. Gross, T.H. Laz, M. Rahman, et al., Association between mother-child sexual communication and HPV vaccine uptake, Prev. Med. 74 (2015) 63–66.
[9] StataCorp, Stata Statistical Software: Release 14, 2015.
[10] M.A. Allison, L.P. Hurley, M. Lauri, et al., Primary care physicians’ perspectives about HPV vaccine, Pediatrics (2016) 137.