Occurrence and antibiogram of *Listeria monocytogenes* Isolates from Retail Meat Shops at Erbil City, Kurdistan Region, Iraq

Dhary Alewy Al-Mashhadany
Department of Pathological Analysis, College of Science, Knowledge University, Erbil, Kurdistan Region, Iraq

Abstract

*Listeria monocytogenes* is well-known globally as one of the most significant foodborne bacterial pathogens. Listeriosis may trigger life-threatening illness, such as severe sepsis, meningitis, sometimes resulting in lifelong harm and even death. This study aimed to determine the occurrence and antibiotic resistance pattern of *L. monocytogenes* in red meats sold at retail outlets in Erbil city, Kurdistan region, Iraq. Three hundred and seventy-five (375) samples were aseptically collected from retail meat shops between July and December 2018. For isolation of *L. monocytogenes*, samples were cultured on selective media and tested for their susceptibility to common antibiotics by disk diffusion assay. The results revealed that the overall occurrence of *L. monocytogenes* in red meat samples was 13.9%. Warm season was associated with increase in *L. monocytogenes* occurrence. The results of antimicrobial susceptibility testing showed that 98.1%, 94.2%, and 82.7% of isolates were resistant to Streptomycin, Gentamicin, and Ampicillin respectively. This resistance pattern of *L. monocytogenes* is critically alarming owing to the aforementioned antibiotics are the drugs of choice of treatment of listeriosis. This level of resistance requires further investigations and effective countermeasures since it may pose a public health hazard.

Introduction

*Listeria monocytogenes* is a Gram-positive, motile, non-sporing-forming, facultative anaerobic short rods (0.2 × 0.5 to 2 μm) widely distributed in nature and is frequently isolated from a variety of sources, including soil, mud, decaying vegetation, contaminated silage, fecal materials (Buchanan et al., 2017). *L. monocytogenes* can thrive and grow in a cold, moist environment and also survives in the intestinal tract of at least 37 species of mammals, both domestic and wild. It has the capability to grow over a wide range of temperature ranging from 1°C to 45°C, also it survives in harsh conditions, such as a wide range of pH range (4.4 and 9.4), in high salinity (40% w/v), low water activity (aw) (≥0.92), and hypoxic conditions (Thigeeal, 2010; Singh et al., 2019).

*L. monocytogenes* is an intracellular pathogen causing listeriosis in human and other mammals, a disease with significant public health risk. Indeed, listeriosis is one of the greatest hazardous foodborne zoonoses, life-threatening disease responsible for high mortality rate reaching 20-30%. Almost all individuals are susceptible to infection but at-risk populations are pregnant women, neonates, young children, weak or aging people, and those who are immunocompromised. Other conditions that may increase susceptibility to listeriosis are diabetes, cirrhosis, asthma, and ulcerative colitis. The incubation period ranges from three days to several weeks (3 to 70 day), after ingestion of a contaminated item, with a medium of 3 weeks. Listeriosis does not spread from person-to-person except from infected mother to child in uterus or at birth (Murray et al., 2018; Das, 2019).

Listeriosis can cause a diversity of symptoms, depending on the individual and the part of the body affected. Generally, the infection is characterized by flu-like symptoms including fever, myalgia, and sometimes, gastrointestinal symptoms. If infection expansion to the nervous system, symptoms may development to include severe headache, confusion, stiff neck, loss of balance or convulsions (Murray et al., 2018; Davis et al., 2019). Not only the epidemiology of human and animal listeriosis are still largely unknown, but also the data regarding antimicrobial uses and susceptibility pattern of *L. monocytogenes* isolates are extremely scarce in Iraq.

*L. monocytogenes* can be found in some handled foods like processed meats and dairy products owing to post-processing contamination. The food of animal origin such as different types of red meat, poultry meat, dairy products, fish, and seafood are excellent vehicle for transmission and listerial growth, therefore, it can easily be contaminated if it is wrongly handled or stored even in a refrigerator (Lambertz et al., 2012; Desai et al., 2019). Contamination of meat and meat products by *L. monocytogenes* is reported from various developed and developing countries (Maktabi et al., 2015; Almashhadany et al., 2016; Salim et al., 2017; Arsalan and Baytur, 2018; Olanya et al., 2019). Red meat is an important vehicle for *Listeria* transmission in 99% of listeriosis cases (Kurpas et al., 2018; Amusan and Sanni, 2019). Since the isolation of the first multidrug-resistant *L. monocytogenes* strain at France in 1988, several strains isolated from food, clinical, and environmental samples have shown resistance to one or more antibiotics. The levels of resistance vary among strains and are also influenced by antimicrobials use in humans and animals and geographical differences (Noll et al., 2018; Matle et al., 2019). To date, less is known about the occurrence of *L. monocytogenes* in raw red meat and their antibiogram at Erbil city, Kurdistan region. Therefore, the goals of this work were to determine the occurrence and antibiotic susceptibility profile of *L. monocytogenes* in raw meats sold at retail outlets in Erbil city.

Materials and Methods

Study design and sampling

A total of 375 raw meat samples from cattle, sheep, and goats (125 of each) were randomly and aseptically collected from retail shops in different places of Erbil city during the period from July to December 2018 according to previously published method (Almashhadany, 2019). Collected samples were placed in separate sterile polyethylene bags within cold container and transported to Pathological Analysis Department, Knowledge University.
Isolation and identification of \textit{L. monocytogenes}

Under sterile laboratory conditions, samples were cut into small sections by sterile blades to release bacteria into the enrichment broth. A total of 25 gm of red meat (as the optimal sample size) were suspended in 225 ml of \textit{Listeria} Enrichment Broth (LEB) (HiMedia, India) and incubated for 48 hours at 37°C. After incubation period, 0.1ml of the LEB was streaked onto \textit{Listeria Oxford} Medium Base (OXA) plate (HiMedia, India) and incubated at 37°C for 48 h in microaerophilic atmosphere (Alsheikh \textit{et al}., 2013). After incubation period, suspected colonies were examined for typical \textit{L. monocytogenes} morphology including iridescence alongside with Gram stain findings. The biochemical characterization included (Oxidase, Catalase, Indole, H$_2$S production, Urease, Methyl red Voges-Proskauer, haemolysin production, hippurate hydrolysis, and citrate utilization tests) (Almashhadany \textit{et al}., 2016).

Production of virulence-related enzymes

All isolated were tested for the production of virulence-related enzymes; lipase, protease, and DNase according to standardized procedures (Leber \textit{et al}., 2016).

Antibiotics susceptibility testing

Modified Kirby-Bauer disk diffusion assay on Mueller-Hinton agar containing 0.5% defibrinated sheep blood was employed to test for sensitivity of \textit{L. monocytogenes} strains to a panel of generally used antibiotics according to the guidelines of Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute (CLSI) (CLSI, 2011). After 24 h of incubation, the zones of inhibition were measured (mm), and the isolates were categorized as susceptible, intermediate, or resistant to specific antibiotics according to CLSI published breakpoints. The tested antibiotics were: chloramphenicol, tetracycline, kanamycin, gentamicin rifampicin, ampicillin, ciprofloxacin, vancomycin, streptomycin, and trimethoprim.

Statistical analysis

Data were analyzed using SPSS software version 21. Confidence intervals are exact Clopper-Pearson confidence intervals. Chi-Square test was employed to test the difference between samples.

Results

Occurrence of \textit{L. monocytogenes}

Out of 375 red meat samples, 13.9% (52) were positive for the presence of \textit{L. monocytogenes}. Of note, 16.8% of beef samples harbored \textit{L. monocytogenes}. The distribution of positive samples is summarized in Table1. Statistically, it is estimated that up to 17.78% (95% confidence interval) of red meat in Erbil retail outlets are contaminated by \textit{L. monocytogenes}. Despite the apparent difference in occurrence between samples of beef and mutton, the difference is not statistically significant ($\chi^2$=1.621, P=0.2029).

Temporal distribution and pathogenicity of \textit{L. monocytogenes}

The highest occurrence of \textit{L. monocytogenes} was found in August (22.6%) (Figure 1) and the lowest occurrence was in December (81%). It is apparent that the decrease in \textit{L. monocytogenes} occurrence in meat is correlated with the progress of the second half of the year with a good correlation coefficient ($r^2$=0.70). Regarding the ability of \textit{L. monocytogenes} to produce virulence-related enzymes, catalase, haemolysin production, lipase, protease, and DNase, were detected (Table 2). Generally, it was found that all the 52 isolates of \textit{L. monocytogenes} were 100% positive for catalase & haemolysin production, while 88.5% of isolates produce DNA hydrolytic enzyme(s).

Antibiotics susceptibility pattern of \textit{L. monocytogenes}

\textit{L. monocytogenes} isolates (n=52) were tested against 10 antibiotics. The results of antibiotic susceptibility testing are showed in Figure 2. Strikingly, high resistance was found to the drugs of choice for treatment of serious listeriosis; gentamicin (94%) and ampicillin (82%). Moreover, great proportion of isolates showed intermediate susceptibility to tetracycline (80.8%) and rifampicin (84.6%).

Discussion

Infections of \textit{L. monocytogenes} are associated with high fatality rate of approximately 30% worldwide and hospitalization

![Temporal distribution of \textit{L. monocytogenes} in red meat samples.](image-url)

Table 1. Prevalence of \textit{L. monocytogenes} among red meat.

| Type of meats | No. examined | Positive samples n (%) | 95% CI |
|---------------|--------------|------------------------|--------|
| Beef          | 125          | 21 (16.8)              | 10.71-24.53 |
| Mutton        | 125          | 14 (11.2)              | 6.26-18.08  |
| Goats         | 125          | 17 (13.6)              | 8.13-20.88  |
| Total         | 375          | 52 (13.9)              | 10.53-17.78  |

Table 2. Ability of \textit{L. monocytogenes} isolates to produce virulence-related enzymes.

| Enzyme                | Positive isolates. No. % | 95% CI  |
|-----------------------|--------------------------|---------|
| Catalase              | 52 (100)                 | 93.15-100 |
| Haemolysin production | 52 (100)                 | 93.15-100 |
| Lipase                | 48 (92.3)                | 81.46-97.86 |
| Protease              | 41 (78.8)                | 65.30-88.94 |
| DNase                 | 46 (88.5)                | 76.56-95.65 |
rate of more than 95%. This fatality rate is the highest recorded among foodborne pathogens, thus making *L. monocytogenes* one of the most dangerous foodborne pathogens globally (Leong et al., 2016; Buchanan et al., 2017; Matle et al., 2019). In this study, the occurrence of *L. monocytogenes* in red meat samples was 13.9% (Table 1). Such occurrence reflects inadequate hygienic practices in the preparation of red meat at the retail level. These results are consistent with a large South African study which found the occurrence of *L. monocytogenes* in meat and meat products samples was 14.7% (Matle et al., 2019). However, lower rates were reported in previous studies in Erbil city 3.6% (Alzubaidy et al., 2013), India (5.3%) (Sran et al., 2015), Turkey (8.5%) (Sanlıbaba et al., 2018), and Nigeria (7.4%) (Amusan and Sanni, 2019).

In contrast, higher rates were reported from Iran (28.05%) (Mashak, 2015), Yemen (22.9%) (Almarshhdany et al., 2016), Erbil city (28.1%) (Salim et al., 2017), and Turkey (26.6%) (Arslan and Baytur, 2018). These varying occurrence rates may be attributed to difference in geographical location, hygienic condition of meat shops and workers associated with slaughtering and handling meat at different levels, the amount and source of samples collected, laboratory detection methods, and seasonal variations (Singh et al., 2019).

The higher percentage of contaminated red meat samples were found in beef 21/125 (16.8%). This may be a direct result of exposure to many potential contaminating sources due to its wide popularity and preference by consumers in Erbil city. It is important to pay attention to the source of contamination of raw red meats. This type of meat needs different stages of processing at the slaughterhouse including slaughtering, skinning, evisceration and other steps to produce the final meat sold to consumers. Meat and meat products are stored under refrigeration and the absence of competitive bacteria along with suitable *a*<sub>0</sub> and pH conditions allow *L. monocytogenes* to multiply successfully (Meloni, 2015).

In terms of temporal distribution of *L. monocytogenes*, the highest occurrence was in August and late autumn (Figure 1). Several studies had linked warm season to high occurrence of *L. monocytogenes*. Rhodes and associates reported that the isolation of *L. monocytogenes* was higher during warmer months which were compatible with our result in present study (Rhoades et al., 2009). Furthermore, a Turkish study documented that the isolation rates were found to be the highest in autumn, while the rates were low in spring (Elmali et al., 2015). Additionally, a Greek study reported that *L. monocytogenes* in the summer was higher than in winter, spring and rainy seasons (Effimia, 2015). Further supporting reports were emerged from Finland (Sjoman, 2010) and Iran (Fallah et al., 2012). On the other hand, contradictory observations also reported (Guerini et al., 2012). On the other hand, contradictory to the above results, a study conducted by Matle and associates in 2019 in South Africa, all the tested isolates showed resistance to at least 3 of the 19 antibiotics (Matle et al., 2019). Resistance to streptomycin (99.0%), clindamycin (97.3%), fusidic acids (95.6%), nitrofurantoin (79.7%), and gentamicin (74.4%) was observed. However, Wu and colleagues found that penicillin G was the only antibiotic to which all *L. monocytogenes* isolates were susceptible (Wu et al., 2015). Resistance to streptomycin, tetracycline, chloramphenicol, and erythromycin was found in *L. monocytogenes* to be under control of transferable plasmid (Poyart-Salmeron et al., 1990). Indeed, aminoglycosides (i.e. streptomycin and gentamicin) are deactivated by bacterial aminoglycoside-modifying enzymes whose genes may be chromosomally or extra chromosomally encoded (Ramirez & Tolmasky, 2010). It has been reported that streptomycin resistance was attributed to 6-aminoglycoside nucleotide dehydrogenase gene(s) homologous to cat221 gene (encoding a chloramphenicol acetyltransferase) in *Streptococcus* and *Enterococcus* (Poyart-Salmeron et al., 1990; Hadorn et al., 1993; Morvan et al., 2010).

**Figure 2.** Antibiotic sensitivity of *L. monocytogenes* isolates.

**Conclusions**

In conclusion, this study has expanded existing knowledge by illustrating the occurrence of *L. monocytogenes* in retail red meat in Erbil City. Epidemiological and molecular investigations should follow this and the previous studies to assess the risk for consumers. Random antibiotics usage should be restricted to minimize public health hazards of spreading multi-drug resistance.
resistance pathogens. A four-season study is recommended for further investigation on the distribution of \textit{L. monocytogenes} isolates in various meat samples accompanied by antimicrobial susceptibility testing. Obeying the rules of good hygiene practices (GHP), Good Manufacturing Practices (GMP), and Hazard Analysis & Critical Control Point (HACCP) in the slaughterhouses and manufacturing process can significantly decrease the occurrence of \textit{L. monocytogenes}.

\textbf{References}

Almashhadany DA, Ba-Salahm HA, Shater AR, Al Sanabani AS, Abd Al Galil FM, 2016. Prevalence of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in Red Meat in Dhamar Governorate/Yemen. Int J Med Health Res 2:7-38.

Almashhadany DA, Shater AR, Ba-Salahm HA, Abd Algalil FM, 2018. Prevalence of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in Human in Dhamar Governorate/Yemen. J Med Pharma Sci 2:28-48.

Alsheikh ADI, Mohammed GE, Abdalla MA, 2013. Isolation and Identification of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} from Retail Broiler Chicken Ready to Eat Meat Products in Sudan. Int J Anim Vet Adv 5:9-14.

Alzubaidy ZM, Kakey SI, Ali JF, 2013. Isolation and identification of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} by PCR from some food sources in Erbil city. Euphrates J Afric Sci 5:14-26.

Amusan EE, Sanni AI, 2019. Isolation and Identification of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in Fresh Croaker (\textit{Pseudotolithus senegalensis}). IOP Conf. Series: Earth and Environmental Science 210. doi:10.1088/1755-1315/210/1/012004.

Aslan S, Baytur S, 2018. Prevalence and antimicrobial resistance of \textit{Listeria} species and subtyping and virulence factors of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} from retail meat. J Food Saf 39:e12578.

Buchanan RL, Gorris LGM, Hayman MM, Jackson TC, Whiting RC, 2017. A review of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes}: An update on outbreaks, virulence, dose-response, ecology, and risk assessments. Food Control 75:1-13.

Charpentier E, Courvalin P, 1999. Antibiotic Resistance in \textit{Listeria} spp. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 43:2103-8.

Clinical Laboratory Standards Institute, 2011. Performance standards for antimicrobial disk susceptibility tests; document M2-A9. 26:1. Available from: https://clsi.org/media/1631/m02a12_sample.pdf

Collins B, Curtis N, Cotter PD, Hill C, Ross RP, 2010. The ABC transporter AnrAB contributes to the innate resistance of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} to nisin, bacitracin, and various beta-lactam antibiotics. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 54:4416-23.

Das A, 2019. Listeriosis in Australia - January to July 2018. Glob Biosecur 1:150-8.

Davis ML, Ricke SC, Donaldson JR, 2019. Establishment of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in the Gastrointestinal Tract. Microorganisms 7:75.

Desai AN, Anyohac A, Madoff LC, Lassmann B, 2019. Changing epidemiology of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} outbreaks, sporadic cases, and recalls globally: A review of ProMED reports from 1996 to 2018. Int J Infect Dis 84:48-53.

Effimia E, 2015. Prevalence of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} and \textit{Salmonella} spp. in Ready-to-Eat foods in Kefalonia, Greece. J Bacteriol Parasitol 6:1-8.

Elmali M, Can HY, Yaman H, 2015. Prevalence of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in poultry meat. Food Sci Technol Campinas 35:672-5.

Fallah AA, Saei-Dehkordi SS, Mahzounieh M, 2013. Occurrence and antibiotic resistance profiles of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} isolated from seafood products and market and processing environments in Iran. Food Control 34:630-6.

Fallah AA, Saei-Dehkordi SS, Rahnama M, Tahmasby H, Mahzounieh M, 2012. Prevalence and antimicrobial resistance patterns of \textit{Listeria} species isolated from poultry products marketed in Iran. Food Control 28:327-32.

Guerini MN, Brichta-Harhay DM, Shackelford SD, Arthur TM, Bosilevac JM, Kalchayanand N, Wheeler TL, Kooomharaie M, 2007. \textit{Listeria} prevalence and \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} serovar diversity at cull cow and bull processing plants in the United States. J Food Protect 70:2578-82.

Hadorn K, Hächler H, Schaffner A, Kayser FH, 1993. Genetic characterization of plasmid-encoded multiple antibiotic resistance in a strain of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} causing endocarditis. Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis 12:928-37.

Kurpas M, Wieczorek K, Osek J, 2018. Ready-to-eat meat products as a source of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes}. J Vet Res 61:49-55.

Lambertz ST, Nilsson C, Bradenmark A, Sylvén S, Johansson A, 2012. Prevalence and level of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in ready-to-eat foods in Sweden 2010. Int J Food Microbiol 160:24-31.

Leber A, ed. 2016. Clinical microbiology procedures handbook. ASM press, Washington, DC, USA.

Leong D, Alvarez-Ordóñez A, Jooste P, Jordan K, 2016. \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in food: Control by monitoring the food processing environment. Afr J Microbiol Res 10:1-14.

Maktabi S, Pourmehdi M, Zarei M, Moalemian R, 2015. Occurrence and Antibiotic Resistance of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in Retail Minced Beef Distributed in Ahvaz, South-West of Iran. J Food Qual Hazard Control 2:101-6.

Mashak, Z, 2015. Prevalence of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in different kinds of meat in Tehran province, Iran, Br Food J 117:109-16.

Matle I, Mbatha KR, Olivia Lentsaune O, Magwedere K, Morey L, Madoroba E, 2019. Occurrence, serotypes, and characteristics of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in meat and meat products in South Africa between 2014 and 2016. J Food Saf 2019:e12629.

Meloni, D, 2015. Presence of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} in Mediterranean-Style Dry Fermented Sausages. Foods 4:34-50.

Miller WR, Munita JM, Arias CA, 2014. Mechanisms of antibiotic resistance in enterococci . Expert Rev Anti Infect Ther 12:1221-36.

Modzelewsk-Kapitula M, Maj-Sobotka K, 2014. The microbial safety of ready-to-eat raw and cooked sausages in Poland: \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} and \textit{Salmonella} spp. occurrence. Food Control 36:212-6.

Morvan A, Moubareck C, Leclercq A, Hervé-Bazin M, Bremont S, Lecuit M, Courvalin P, Le Monnier A, 2010. Antimicrobial resistance of \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} strains isolated from humans in France. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 54:2728-31.

Murray PR, Rosenthal KS, Pfaffer MA, 2018. \textit{Medical microbiology}. 8th edn. Elsevier Health Sciences, Philadelphia, PA, USA.

Noll M, Kleta S, Al Dahouk S, 2018. Antibiotic susceptibility of 259 \textit{Listeria monocytogenes} strains isolated from food, food-processing plants and human samples in Germany. J Infect Public Health 11:179-90.
Health 11:572-7.
Olanya OM, Hoshide AK, Ijabadeniyi OA, Ukuku DO, Mukhopadhyay S, Niemira BA, Ayeni O, 2019. Cost estimation of listeriosis (Listeria monocytogenes) occurrence in South Africa in 2017 and its food safety implications. Food Control 102:231-9.

Poyart-Salmeron C, Carlier C, Trieu-Cuot P, Courvalin P, Courtieu AL, 1990. Transferable plasmid-mediated antibiotic resistance in Listeria monocytogenes. Lancet 335:1422-6.

Ramirez MS, Tolmasky ME, 2010. Aminoglycoside modifying enzymes. Drug Resist Updat 13:151-71.
Rhoades JR, Duffy G, Koutsoumanis K, 2009. Prevalence and concentration of verocytotoxigenic Escherichia coli, Salmonella enterica and Listeria monocytogenes in the beef production chain: a review. Food Microbiol 26:357-76.

Salim LN, Othman GO, 2017. Detection of Listeria Monocytogenes HlyA gene in meat Samples by Real-Time PCR in Erbil city. ZJPAS J Pure Appl Sci 29:134-9.
Sanliba P, Tezel BU, Cakmak GA, 2018. Prevalence and Antibiotic Resistance of Listeria monocytogenes Isolated from Ready-to-Eat Foods in Turkey. J Food Qual 2018
Singh R, Kaur S, Bedi JS, 2019. Listeria contamination in chevon and mutton from retail meat shops and slaughter house environment of Punjab, India. FEMS Microbiol Lett 366.
Sjoman M, 2010. The use of serotyping and PFGE-typing of Listeria monocytogenes in food processing contamination studies and human foodborne infections. M.Sc. Thesis, department of food hygiene and environmental health. University of Helsinki, Finland.
Sran MK, Kaur S, Singh R, Gill JPS, 2015. Molecular Characterization of Listeria monocytogenes Isolated from swab samples from small scale butchers in Punjab, India. J Vet Pub Health 13:99-104.
Thigeel H, 2010. Listeria control and safe food training for dietary managers. MSc Thesis. Colorado State University, USA.
Wang K, Ye K, Zhu Y, Huang Y, Wang G, Wang H, Zhou G, 2015. Prevalence, antimicrobial resistance and genetic diversity of Listeria monocytogenes isolated from chilled pork in Nanjing, China. LWT-Food Sci Technol 64:905-10.
Wu S, Wu Q, Zhang J, Chen M, Yan Z, & Hu H, 2015. Listeria monocytogenes prevalence and characteristics in retail raw foods in China. PLoS One 10:0136682.