Strontium isotope evidence for a highly mobile population on the Pamir Plateau 2500 years ago

Xueye Wang1,2, Zihua Tang1,3, Jing Wu4, Xinhua Wu4, Yiqun Wu5 & Xinying Zhou6

Archeological researches have proposed arguments for human mobility and long-distance trading over the Eurasia before the Silk Roads. Here we utilize biologically available strontium isotope analysis to assess the extent of pre-Silk Road population movements and cultural communications across the Asian interior. From an early Iron Age cemetery (ca. 2500 yr B.P.) on the eastern Pamir Plateau, mean $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ ratios from 34 individuals display considerable isotopic variability, and 10 individuals are distinguished as migrants based on the local strontium isotope range of 0.710296–0.710572 defined by 12 ovicaprine bones. Comparison of the proportion (10/34) with the regional census data completed in 1909 A.D. (3% non-locals) suggests a highly migratory behavior on the plateau 2500 years ago. Furthermore, exotic mortuary objects, such as silk fabrics from eastern China and angular harp originated from the Near East, clearly demonstrate an interaction between different cultures on the plateau before the establishment of the Silk Road.

Well-established civilizations over the eastern and western part of the Eurasian continent at least can be dated back to the Bronze Age. It is a long-standing viewpoint, however, that east-west communications crossing the continental interior had not burgeoned until the establishment of the Silk Roads at 114 B.C.1–3 (Fig. 1a). More recently, archaeological researches provide subtle hints for pre-Silk Road intercultural communications across inner Asia4. For instances, ancient Tarim inhabitants between 4000 and 3500 years before present (yr B.P.) had a diverse maternal ancestry originating from both the West and the East4,6, and a silk thread was found from a ca. 1000 B.C. mummy’s hair in ancient Egypt7,8. Although these discoveries have implied the existence of long-distance migration and trade, little information on the extent and intensity of interactions between the pre-Silk Road cultures is available yet.

Ancient cultural communications directly result from human migrations9, which can be effectively traced by strontium (Sr) isotopes in archaeological researches10. As a high-mass element, Sr shows no measurable isotope fractionation as Sr passes from weathered rocks up through food chain into mineralized tissues where Sr substitutes for Ca, and the $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values thus essentially depend on regional geologic background11,12. Animals typically consume plants over a wild area and hence generate homogenized strontium compositions, serving as reliable local values as human at the same location. In practice, the mean $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ value with ±2 s.d. in archaeological animal bones is conventionally defined as the local range for charactering ancient migration10,11.

At the junction of East Asia, South Asia, and central Asia, the Pamir Plateau is both a communication corridor and a meeting place of various civilizations since the late Paleolithic Age13–15. We present here the first set of biologically available $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ data from a 2500-year-old cemetery on the plateau to investigate the extent of pre-Silk Road human mobility around the region.

Results

Results for all samples are listed in Tables 1 and 2, as well as illustrated in Fig. 2. The $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ ratios measured in 12 ovicaprine bones range from 0.710303 and 0.710528 with a mean value of 0.710434 ± 0.000069 (1 s.d.). Accordingly, the local range for $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ is 0.710296–0.710572.

1Key Laboratory of Cenozoic Geology and Environment, Institute of Geology and Geophysics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100029, China. 2University of Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100049, China. 3CAS Center for Excellence in Tibetan Plateau Earth Sciences, Beijing, China. 4Institute of Archaeology, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing 100071, China. 5History Department of Humanities School, Xinjiang University, Urumqi 830046, China. 6Key Laboratory of Vertebrate Evolution and Human Origin, Institute of Vertebrate Paleontology and Paleoanthropology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100044, China. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to Z.T. (email: tangzhua@mail.iggcas.ac.cn)
Although the enamel samples are of higher variance for $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ ratios, their mean value is $0.710428 \pm 0.000217$ (1 s.d.), almost identical to the mean value of $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ ratios measured in the bone samples. There are 10 values falling out of the local range for the region (Fig. 2).

**Discussion**

Twenty-four out of 34 individuals analyzed (70.6%) have $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ ratios within the defined local range for the Jirzankal cemetery, suggesting they were locally born and raised. Meanwhile, the rest 10 individuals (29.4%) have $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ ratios outside the local range, suggesting that they migrated to the cemetery from someplace else after childhood. These data indicate a highly mobile population settled on the Pamir Plateau around 2500 yr B.P. when compared to a historical population census data in the Kashgar where the cemetery affiliated. The census completed in 1909 A.D. demonstrated that only 3% non-locals, both from outside and inside Xinjiang Province, lived in the Kashgar Prefecture (17,215 migrants out of 599,578 populations).

**Table 1.** $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ ratios for ovicaprine bones. ‘$M_i$’ represents grave number.

| Sample No. | Sample | $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ |
|------------|--------|---------------------------------|
| 1          | M10    | 0.710445                        |
| 2          | M11    | 0.710429                        |
| 3          | M16    | 0.710351                        |
| 4          | M17    | 0.710528                        |
| 5          | M18    | 0.710504                        |
| 6          | M22    | 0.710468                        |
| 7          | M23    | 0.710413                        |
| 8          | M25    | 0.710303                        |
| 9          | M28    | 0.710371                        |
| 10         | M29    | 0.710401                        |
| 11         | M30    | 0.710502                        |
| 12         | M46    | 0.71049                         |

Figure 1. (a) Sketch map of the Silk Roads in the Han dynasty; (b) Simplified geologic map overlapping the topographic map of the eastern Pamir Plateau. Figures are designed and prepared by ZT using DIVA-GIS 7.5 (http://www.diva-gis.org).
### Table 2. \(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr} \) ratio for human tooth enamel.

The sample is marked as Mi-j, where ‘Mi’ represents grave number and ‘j’ represents individual number in the grave. The element of tooth is coded with the FDI’s two-digit notation system.

| Sample No. | Sample | Sex | FDI Notation | \(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr} \) |
|------------|--------|-----|--------------|-------------------------------|
| 1          | M1-1   | Male | 46           | 0.710646                     |
| 2          | M1-2   | Female | 46            | 0.710659                     |
| 3          | M1-3   | ?    | 26           | 0.709967                     |
| 4          | M11-1  | Female | 27            | 0.710451                     |
| 5          | M11-2  | Female | 47            | 0.710337                     |
| 6          | M13-1  | Female | 48            | 0.710816                     |
| 7          | M14-1  | Male | 48           | 0.710291                     |
| 8          | M14-2  | Female | 38            | 0.710375                     |
| 9          | M14-3  | Male | 37           | 0.710354                     |
| 10         | M14-4  | Male | 38           | 0.710036                     |
| 11         | M15-2  | Female | 37            | 0.71032                      |
| 12         | M16-1  | Female | 37            | 0.710421                     |
| 13         | M17-1  | ?    | 37           | 0.711032                     |
| 14         | M18-1  | Female | 47            | 0.710674                     |
| 15         | M23-1  | Male | 48           | 0.710382                     |
| 16         | M24-1  | Male | 47           | 0.710344                     |
| 17         | M24-3  | Male | 47           | 0.710308                     |
| 18         | M24-4  | Male | 46           | 0.710344                     |
| 19         | M25-1  | Male | 18           | 0.710329                     |
| 20         | M25-2  | Male | 37           | 0.710373                     |
| 21         | M25-3  | Female | 34            | 0.710469                     |
| 22         | M25-4  | ?    | 36           | 0.710343                     |
| 23         | M26-1  | Female | 16            | 0.710342                     |
| 24         | M27-1  | Female | 47            | 0.710315                     |
| 25         | M30-1  | Male | 46           | 0.710297                     |
| 26         | M30-2  | Female | 27            | 0.710391                     |
| 27         | M31-1  | Female | 47            | 0.710361                     |
| 28         | M31-2  | Male | 46           | 0.710349                     |
| 29         | M32-1  | Male | 16           | 0.710795                     |
| 30         | M32-2  | Female | 38            | 0.710358                     |
| 31         | M35-1  | Male | 38           | 0.710357                     |
| 32         | M35-2  | Female | 37            | 0.710337                     |
| 33         | M46-1  | ?    | 46           | 0.710362                     |
| 34         | M50-1  | Female | 17            | 0.710864                     |

**Figure 2.** Scatter chart of \(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr} \) ratios for human enamel with local range in gray.
There is no gainsaying that mobile ovicaprine is not the best choice for defining local range for $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ as human commensal species, particularly pigs. However, different from high-frequency co-occurrences of ovicaprine and human remains, we found rare bone fragments of eagle ($n = 1$), fox ($n = 1$), dog ($n = 1$) and rabbit ($n = 2$). Furthermore, isotope analysis shows that $δ^{15}\text{N}$ values of human bones ($13.26 \pm 0.55‰$, $n = 13$) are significantly higher than that of ovicaprine bones ($8.33 \pm 1.46‰$, $n = 13$), indicating ovicaprine greatly contributed to human diet\textsuperscript{17}. Considering its availability and high portion in diet, the ovicaprine bone with minor variance of $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values than human tooth enamel could be a preferred candidate for defining the local range.

Seasonal movement of herds might yield a broader range of $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ than the accurate one. On the eastern Pamir Plateau, human beings mainly settle in low altitude river valley, ~3000 m a.s.l and, in winter, they share the pastures with herds that graze on highlands more than 3500 m a.s.l in summer. The highlands are geologically dominated by granitoid characterized by high $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values (0.82–1.2\textsuperscript{18,19}), while the valley holds vast detrital deposits eroded from the granitoid with high $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values and Permian-Triassic marine carbonates typically of low values (0.7068–0.7080\textsuperscript{20,21}). Consequently, the local range for $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ of human values are enveloped by those of the herds, and mainly grouped in the lower part within the faunal range, as evidenced by our data distribution (Fig. 2). The non-local proportion (10/34) reported here is thus a minimum estimation for the immigrants.

Ten non-locals as identified by Sr isotope analysis come from seven graves. Among them, all three individuals from the grave M1 are non-locals with one below and two above the local range for Sr isotope ratios, and two out of four individuals from M14 are classified as migrants with Sr isotope ratios below the local range (Fig. 2). The non-local $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values falling both above ($n = 7$) and below ($n = 3$) the local range for the cemetery suggest the ancient inhabitants in the Pamir Plateau were derived from various places. Furthermore, the divergent $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values between enamel and ovicaprid bone from an identical grave, such as M17 and M18 (Tables 1 and 2), provide us a detailed immigrating scenario. The individuals moved onto the plateau after childhood and were buried with local ovicaprids after death, especially considering the significant differences of lifespan between human beings and ovicaprids.

Highly heterogeneous $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values clarify a complex geologic history on the regional (Fig. 1b) scales, and make it difficult to constrain the locations where migrants originated. Taking into consideration the harsh condition on the plateau, we here tentatively argue that the non-locals emigrated from locations beyond the Pamir Plateau. This argument was backed by the characteristic mortuary objects in the cemetery. During the two excavation seasons, 42 wooden objects and abundant wood/charcoal fragments were found from the cemetery and seven tree species have been identified\textsuperscript{22}. Among them, junipers, silver berry, and willow can be found nearby on shady mountains slopes or on floodplains along the Tashkurgan River, while honeysuckle, syrian ash, birch, and poplar mainly develop in typical temperate climate. These introduced species account for the majority the wooden materials found in the cemetery\textsuperscript{22} and provide additional information for the migration distance of ancient inhabitants.

There are some early Iron Age graves found within two nearby cemeteries, Xiangbaobao\textsuperscript{23} and Xiabandi\textsuperscript{24}. These cemeteries, especially the Xiangbaobao cemetery, were slightly older than the Jirzankal cemetery and prevailed cremation, a strikingly contrast to the dominance of shaft burials in the Jirzankal cemetery presented here. The burial customs of the Jirzankal cemetery indicate some uniqueness of the study site. In our study cemetery, some typical mortuary goods accompanied with non-local individuals are ideal archives for cultural transmission. As mentioned above, the graves M1 and M14 hold three and two non-locals, respectively. In M1 the discoverers have found fragments of silk fabric (Fig. 3a). It is widely accepted that silk was first produced in eastern China around the fourth or fifth millennium B.C.\textsuperscript{25}. After being closely guarded for generations, the culture of silkworm and the manufacturing technology of silk exported westward since the Han dynasty along the Silk Roads. According to official documents, the knowledge and technique reached the Tarim Basin by 50 A.D.\textsuperscript{26} and further India by 140 A.D.\textsuperscript{27}. Beyond these regions, silk gradually symbolized the pre-modern China and bridged the empire to the western world.
This instrument has been recognized as an angular harp, a hollow trough that is assumed to a sound box, a rod perpendicular to the neck through a square hole assumed to a tuning contraption, and a thin stick to fasten the rob28. This invention has been recognized as an angular harp, a kind of ancient stringed instrument originated in the Near East29. The earliest harps were arched, found in Sumer around 3000 B.C.30, and angular harps followed around 1900 B.C.31. Probably carried by nomadic tribes such as the Scyths, angular harps quickly penetrated the Central Asian steppe eastward during the first millennium B.C. and arrived at the Pamir area ca. 500 B.C., as presented here. Almost at the same time or slightly later, the harps appeared in Xinjiang, NW China32 and finally reached East Asia by 2nd century B.C.33.

Silk is the symbol of agriculture civilization of eastern China, while harp is a typical musical instrument originated in the Near East. Their presences as mortuary goods on the Pamir Plateau strongly suggest a vigorous long-distance cross-culture communications ca. 2500 year ago.

Strontium isotopes provide a promising method of separating immigrants with 87Sr/86Sr ratios out of the local range. We use the ratios in dental enamel to distinguish migrant individuals for an early Iron Age cemetery (ca. 2500 yr B.P.) for the first time and our results confirm a highly mobile population on the Pamir Plateau. The coexistence of particular mortuary goods, such as silk fabrics originated from East China and angular harp from the Near East, strongly suggests far-reaching cultural interactions on the Pamir Plateau long before the opening of the Silk Roads.

### Study Site and Specimens.
Jirzankal cemetery (75°12′11″N, 37°50′54″E) is located on the western bank of the Tashkurgan River, eastern Pamir Plateau (Fig. 1b). The region, 3050 meters above sea level, has a typical alpine climate with long winters and brief summers. The cemetery is approximately 10 km away from the Tashkurgan City to the south and 180 km away from Kashgar, the capital of the prefecture where the cemetery situated.

Thirty-nine graves were excavated in 2013–2014. A typical grave within the cemetery was a shaft chamber covered by encircling stones. The chambers with primary and secondary burials were dug into bedrock or fluvial gravel layer. During the two excavation seasons, at least 39 individual human corpses and two hundred mortuary goods were revealed. The mortuary goods included abundant pottery items, stone tools, wooden items, textiles, sporadic copper objects and ironware. AMS radiocarbon dating of various samples from nine graves, including five bones, six wood charcoal fragments and one textile, jointly assign the cemetery to ca. 2500 yr B.P., corresponding to the early Iron Age (Table 3).

Bone samples from 12 ovicaprids (goat/sheep) and enamel samples from 34 individuals were analyzed for strontium isotope ratios. Depending on availability and preservation, mostly molars were selected with an exception of premolar (sample M25-3).

### Methods
Teeth were abraded with a carbide dental burr on a dental drill to remove any visible contamination from the sample and a sample (10–20 mg) was taken from the crown, while bone samples were ashed at 750 °C for 8 hours10,34. All samples were cleaned with deionized water and dissolved in Teflon-PFA vials using 2 mL of 0.2N HCl. Sr was separated from matrix using AG50W × 12 resin, a Sr-selective resin (200–400 mesh diameter) loaded into the tip of a 2 mL Teflon column. The whole procedure blanks for Sr were typically lower than 0.250 picograms. Isotopic ratios were measured on a Finnigan MAT262 thermal ionization mass spectrometer (TIMS) housed at the State Key Laboratory of Lithospheric Evolution at the Institute of Geology and Geophysics, Chinese Academy of Sciences (IGGCAS) using the internal ratio 88Sr/86Sr = 8.375209 to correct for mass fractionation15. All 87Sr/86Sr isotope ratios were normalized to a value of 87Sr/86Sr = 0.710255 for NBS-987 standard, which was run concurrently with samples and produced an average value of 0.710269 ± 0.000012 (2 s.d.) during this work (n = 9).

---

**Table 3. List of radiocarbon dates for the Jirzankal cemetery.** Calibrated using the IntCal13 curve. **Cited from ref. 22.**
References
1. Hansen, V. The Silk Road: A New History. 1–304 (Oxford University Press, 2012).
2. Kuzmina, E. E. The Prehistory of the Silk Road. (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008).
3. Liu, X. The Silk Road in World History. 1–154 (Oxford University Press, 2010).
4. Mair, V. H. & Hickman, J. Reconfiguring the Silk Road: New Research on East-West Exchange in Antiquity. 1–136 (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014).
5. Li, C. et al. Evidence that a West-East admixed population lived in the Tarim Basin as early as the early Bronze Age. BMC Biol. 8, 15, doi:10.1186/1741-7007-8-15 (2010).
6. Li, C. et al. Analysis of ancient human mitochondrial DNA from the Xiaohe cemetery: insights into prehistoric population movements in the Tarim Basin. China. BMC Genet. 16, 78, doi:10.1186/s12863-015-0237-5 (2015).
7. Good, I. On the question of silk in pre-Han Eurasia. Antiquity 69, 959–968 (1995).
8. Lubec, G., Holubaek, J., Feldt, C., Lubec, B. & Strouhal, E. Use of silk in ancient Egypt. Nature 362, 25 (1993).
9. Frachetti, M. D. Migration concepts in Central Eurasian archaeology. Annual Review of Anthropology 40, 195–212 (2011).
10. Price, T. D., Burton, J. H. & Bentley, R. A. The characterization of biologically available strontium isotope ratios for the study of prehistoric migration. Archaeometry 44, 117–135 (2002).
11. Bentley, R. A., Price, T. D. & Stephan, E. Determining the ‘local’ 87Sr/86Sr range for archaeological skeletons: a case study from Neolithic Europe. Journal of Archaeological Science 31, 365–375 (2004).
12. Grupe, G. et al. Mobility of Bell Beaker people revealed by strontium isotope ratios of tooth and bone: a study of southern Bavarian skeletal remains. Appl. Geochem. 12, 517–525 (1997).
13. Glantz, M. M. The History of Hominin Occupation of Central Asia in Review. 101–112 (2011).
14. Quintana-Murci, L. et al. Where west meets east: the complex mtDNA landscape of the southwest and Central Asian corridor. Am J Hum Genet 74, 827–845 (2004).
15. Vishnyatsky, L. B. The Paleolithic of Central Asia. World Prehistory 13, 69–122 (1999).
16. Wu, Y. The research of population change of Kashgar in Qing Dynasty. The Western Region Studies in press (2016).
17. Guo, Y. In The First China Archaeological Congress.
18. Scharer, U., Copeland, P., Harrison, T. M. & Sear, M. P. Age, cooling history, and origin of post-collisional Leucogranitoids in the Karakoram Batholith: A multi-system isotope study. The Journal of Geology 98, 233–251 (1990).
19. Zhang, Q., Liu, Y., Huang, H., Wu, Z. & Zhou, Q. Petrogenesis and tectonic implications of the high-K Alamas calc-alkaline granitoids at the northwestern margin of the Tibetan Plateau: Geochemical and Sr–Nd–Hf–O isotope constraints. J. Asian. Earth. Sci., doi:10.1016/j.jseaes.2016.05.026 (2016).
20. Dufour, M. S., Koltsov, A. B., Zolotarev, A. A. & Kuznetsov, A. B. Corundum-bearing metasomatic rocks in the Central Pamirs. J. Asian. Earth. Sci., doi:10.1016/j.ijasi.2015.09.015 (2015).
21. Wu, X. & Tang, Z. Jirzankal Cemetery covered wtih rows of black-and-white stones: key excavations and primary research. The Western Region Studies, 5–18 (2004).
22. White, S. et al. The use of strontium isotope analysis to investigate Tiwanaku migration and mortuary ritual in Bolivia and Peru. Archaeometry 46, 5–18 (2004).
23. Li, C.-F. et al. Rapid and precise determination of Sr and Nd isotopic ratios in geological samples from the same filament loading by thermal ionization mass spectrometry employing a single-step separation scheme. Anal. Chim. Acta 727, 54–60 (2012).

Acknowledgements
This work is financially supported by the Ministry of Science and Technology, China (grant No. 2014FY210500) and the National Planning Office of Philosophy and Social Science (grant No. 10&ZD068). We are indebted to the four anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments, which greatly improve the manuscript. We also extend thanks to research Prof. Qin Dahai for insightful discussion, to Wei Liangliang, Shen Hui for sampling assistance, and to Dr. Li Chaoeng, Li Youlian and Xue Dingshuai for laboratory assistance.

Author Contributions
Z.T. and X. Wu designed the research. X. Wang and Z.T. conducted the measurements and drafted the initial manuscript. All authors shared ideas, contributed to interpretation of the results and to produce the final manuscript.

Additional Information
Competing financial interests: The authors declare no competing financial interests.

How to cite this article: Wang, X. et al. Strontium isotope evidence for a highly mobile population on the Pamir Plateau 2500 years ago. Sci. Rep. 6, 35162; doi: 10.1038/srep35162 (2016).
