Microbiological and physicochemical changes during ripening of Camembert cheeses made from raw and pasteurized cow milk produced in Tizi-Ouzou (north of Algeria)

Hilal Sebbane¹, Dalila Almi², Sonia Hadouchi², Louiza Hedjel², Noria Smail-Saadoun¹ and Abderrahmane Mati¹

Received: 01 August 2020 / Accepted: 10 November 2020 / Published online: 28 February 2021
© Indian Dairy Association (India) 2021

Abstract: This study was carried out on two types of Camembert produced in the region of Tizi-Ouzou (northern Algeria), one artisanal (AC) made from raw milk and the other industrial (IC) made from pasteurized milk. This work shows the effect of milk quality and cheese making processes on the progress of physicochemical and microbiological parameters throughout a maturation period of 12 days. The result shows that the repining microflora and undesirable microbial populations were significantly higher (P < 0.05) in the artisanal Camembert (AC) than in the industrial Camembert (IC). The physicochemical and microbiological parameters, during the ripening of the cheeses developed in a similar way with significant differences according to the type and the stage of maturation. During the cheese repining period, AC showed more extensive (P < 0.05) lipolysis and proteolysis than IC. SDS-PAGE of water-soluble proteins (WSP) and insoluble fractions showed more extensive degradation of αs-casein (αs-CN) than β-casein (β-CN). The WSP profile, analyzed by Reversed-Phase High Performance Liquid Chromatography (RP-HPLC), was highest in AC than IC. The highest WSP profile was recorded at the 12th day of repining. The pathogenic flora decreased during the maturation process in AC. This development was confirmed by the results of the antibacterial effect of WSP, performed by the disc diffusion technique on Escherichia coli and Staphylococcus aureus strains. From this study, it can be concluded that AC has a better organoleptic quality, safe for the Algerian consumer and more profitable for the Algerian cheesemakers.

Keywords: Algeria, Camembert, Cheese ripening, Lipolysis, Proteolysis, Raw and pasteurized milks

Introduction

Since the early 1990s, Algeria has implemented a dairy policy in order to enhance the value of local production from cattle breeding (Mamine et al. 2011). With the launch of the National Agricultural Development Plan (NADP) in 2000 and its extension to rural areas, total milk production increased from 1.9 billion liters in 2004 to 3.3 billion in 2018, covering about 60% of national milk needs. This production, even if it faces an insufficient collection circuit (Kali et al. 2011), has enabled some artisanal dairy farmers to process milk into raw milk cheese production. Nevertheless, this approach is quite innovative in Algeria and the microbiological and physicochemical characterization of raw milk cheeses is attracting the interest of public authorities and researchers (Aissaoui et al. 2011; Meribai et al. 2017). Indeed, hygiene requirements have become an important consideration in the production of artisanal cheeses, particularly those with a protected designation of origin (PDO), which are produced with raw milk, such as Camembert de Normandie (France), often produced in mountain areas (Gérard, 2015).

Traditional cheese making, especially for the Camembert, is distinguished from the industrial production by various aspects, and the better organoleptic qualities are obtained with the raw milk (Richard and Zadi 1983). Organoleptic properties are mainly influenced by the growth of lactic acid bacteria and the combined effect of proteolysis and lipolysis on the cheese matrix during the ripening process (Gebreyowhans et al. 2020). The release of bacteriocins and bioactive peptide fractions, endowed with antibacterial activities, inhibit bacterial pathogens (Mane and McSweeney, 2019), such as Listeria ssp. in the case of Camembert (Wan et al. 1997). This is how we set out to evaluate the quality of two soft cheeses, one made from raw milk and the other from pasteurized milk. We particularly explored the physicochemical
and microbiological characteristics of these cheeses at different stages of the ripening process and demonstrate the safety of raw milk cheeses, especially Camembert, in Algeria. To the best of our knowledge, this is the first study to assess the antimicrobial effect of water-soluble peptide fractions extracted from Camembert.

**Materials and Methods**

**Sampling procedure and cheesemaking**

The samples of milk used for the production of Camembert, came from two farms in the region of Tizi-Ouzou. The farms are made up of cows of dairy cattle breeds (Holstein and Montbéliard), with an average age of 4 to 8 years and they are at the same stage of lactation. The maturing period is set at 12 days, with reference to Algerian industrial practices. Two types of Camembert, one artisanal, the other industrial, produced in the region of Tizi-Ouzou (northern Algeria), were selected within the framework of this study. The analyses were based on 108 samples from each Camembert type and on 27 samples from each kind of milk (raw and pasteurized). The sampling of the products were carried from March to June during the period 2014-2016, in order to avoid the seasonality effect on the physicochemical and microbiological composition of the milk. Three samples per month were collected from each milks (raw and pasteurized milk) and cheeses at four ripening stages: first, fourth, sixth and twelfth days (Table 1). Placed in a cooler, the samples were directly taken to the laboratory and the analyses were performed during the following 24 hours.

The moulding of the cheeses (AC and IC) was performed into polyurethane perforated moulds (cylinders 10 to 11 cm in diameter and 13 to 14 cm in height). Demoulding of cheeses (AC and IC) is done on stainless drains (24 to 48 h, 25-28 °C) at a relative humidity (RH) of 95%, turning the cheese every five hours, before it was worked with sprinkling of fine salt. Then, the cheese (AC) was sprayed with a solution of Penicillium camemberti spores (2x10^4 spores/ml) and ripened during 12 days at a temperature of 10 to 12 °C and a RH of 90 to 95%, with a rotation every two to three days.

The industrial Camembert (IC), made from pasteurized milk, was produced in a cheese dairy located in Draa Ben Khedda (Tizi-Ouzou), which was supplied with milk from a close locality (Freha, Tizi-Ouzou). Without undergoing any standardization of fat and protein contents, milk is first pasteurized at 90 °C for 20 seconds and then cooled to 36 °C. After adding CaCl_2 (15-20 g/100 L of milk), milk was seeded with mixed lactic ferments (Mesophilous: DI-PROX M 229, BioProx, France/Thermophilous: DI-PROX TPM 2, BioProx, France) with 0.03% of fungal flora (Chr. Hansen Inc., Danemark) of Penicillium camemberti and Geotricum candidum in order to reach the final concentrations of 10^4 spores/ml and 2x10^4 spores/ml, respectively. After the fermentation period of milk (20-25 minutes at 36°C), the pH reached a value of 6.35, commercial rennet fungal powder Marzyme™ (standard strength of: 150000, Danisco, France) was added (1.5 g/50 Kg of milk), then the coagulum is divided into small cubes (Ø = 30 mm). To accelerate draining, the coagulum was stirred twice during 15 minutes with an interval of five minutes. The whey was evacuated by pumping it out, then the moulding was carried out by

| Sample                  | Ripening days | 1st year | 2nd year | 3rd year | Total number of samples |
|-------------------------|---------------|----------|----------|----------|------------------------|
|                         |               | 1st month| 2nd month| 3rd month| 1st month | 2nd month | 3rd month | 1st month | 2nd month | 3rd month | 3rd year | Total number of samples |
| Artisanal or industrial | 1             | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 27 |
| Raw or pasteurized milk | 4             | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 27 |
|                         | 6             | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 27 |
|                         | 12            | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 27 |

**Table 1** Distribution of the samples according to the kind of the milk and the ripening stage

Cheesemaker breeding dairy cattle under extensive holding conditions and transforms milk to Camembert according to the guidelines of the French legislation related to cheeses and cheese specialties (Art. 9 and 14 of the decree n° 2013-1010 of the 12th of November 2013). Milk was heated up to 35 °C till it reaches an acidity of 22 to 25 °D (2.2 to 2.5 g/l of lactic acid) or at pH 6.30 to 6.35, before a liquid rennet (standard strength of 1:10000, Halal calf Rennet, Chr. Hansen Inc., Danemark) was added (15-20 ml/100 L of milk). After coagulation (1h10 min-1h30 min), the moulding of the cheese was performed directly with a ladle into polyurethane perforated moulds, without stirring the curd, at a rate of 5 ladles per mould, with a rest period of 15 to 20 minutes between each ladle, without stirring the coagulum. Draining was done on stainless drains (24 to 48 h, 25-28 °C) at a relative humidity (RH) of 95%, turning the cheese every five hours, before it was worked with sprinkling of fine salt. Then, the cheese (AC) was sprayed with a solution of Penicillium camemberti spores (2x10^4 spores/ml) and ripened during 12 days at a temperature of 10 to 12 °C and a RH of 90 to 95%, with a rotation every two to three days.

| Sample                  | Ripening days | 1st year | 2nd year | 3rd year | Total number of samples |
|-------------------------|---------------|----------|----------|----------|------------------------|
|                         |               | 1st month| 2nd month| 3rd month| 1st month | 2nd month | 3rd month | 1st month | 2nd month | 3rd month | 3rd year | Total number of samples |
| Artisanal or industrial | 1             | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 27 |
| Raw or pasteurized milk | 4             | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 27 |
|                         | 6             | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 27 |
|                         | 12            | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 3        | 27 |

**Table 1** Distribution of the samples according to the kind of the milk and the ripening stage
mechanically filling the moulds. The coagulum is drained in polyurethane molds placed on stainless drains during 15 to 20 hours at RH of 90 to 95% (27 °C-5 h and 20 °C-15 h), with rotations every five hours. After it was removed from the mold, the cheese was salted by brining (NaCl = 40%, pH = 4.5) during 30 to 60 minutes at 13 °C. The cheese surface was dried in a draining room during 15 hours (14 °C, RH = 85 %) with two rotations. Then, it was sprinkled with a suspension of Penicillium camemberti spores (2.10^9 Spores/ml) (Chr. Hansen Inc., Danemark) and ripened during 12 days (12-13 °C, RH = 90-95 %) with a rotation every two to three days.

**Physicochemical analysis**

Physicochemical parameters during cheese ripening were analysed after removing the cheese crust. Samples of milk were analyzed with Lacto-scan SP (Milkotronic LTD, Bulgaria) for density, fat and proteins. The pH was measured by immersing the pH-meter glass electrode (Hanna-instrument, Italy) directly in the products (cheeses and milks) (Bouton et al. 1994). The titratable acidity (TA) of the milk was expressed in Dornic degree (°D) (AFNOR, 1980), and as % of lactic acid for the cheese (Sulieaman et al. 2012). The dry-matter (DM) was determined using a infrared desiccator IR35 (Denver instrument, Germany) by evaporation (105°C/20 min) of 3 g of milk (AFNOR, 1980) or 5 g of cheese (Randoin and Jourdan, 1952). The Fat content of cheese was determined by Van-Gulik butyrometer (Funkgerber Instrument, Germany) (JORADP, 2014).

**Protein fractionation**

Protein concentration was determined using the Lowry protein procedure at 750 nm with Folin-Ciocalteu’s phenol reagent (Lowry et al. 1951). Bovine Serum Albumin was used as a standard. From slurry prepared from by mixing 20 g of cheese (crust removed and crushed) in 40 ml of sodium citrate buffer (0.5 M, pH 7), three protein fractions, which are the total protein content (TP), the acid soluble protein (ASP) and the non-protein nitrogen (NPN), were obtained by combining the methods reported by Gripon et al. (1975) and Guerra-Martinez et al. (2012).

**Free amino acids**

Total levels of free amino acids (FAA) in the pH4.6-Soluble fractions of the cheese were determined by the 2, 4, 6, trinitrobenzene-1-sulfonic acid (TNBS) method described by Polychroniadou (1988) modified by Bouton et al. (1993). Cheese extracts were prepared, as mentioned above. The use of a range of glycine standard (0.01-0.5 mM) allowed expressing the measurements in mEq glycine/g of protein.

**SDS–polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis (SDS-PAGE)**

Proteolysis during cheese ripening from the water-soluble proteins (WSP) and insoluble protein fractions at pH 4.6 was evaluated by SDS-PAGE (Barac et al. 2016). The fractions were prepared according to the techniques reported by Dupas et al. (2009). The PAGE-SDS was performed according the method described by Laemmli (1970). A marker kit was for bovine serum albumin (67 kDa), ovalbumin (45 kDa), β-Lactoglobulin (18 kDa) and α-Lactalbumin (14 kDa).

**Reversed-phase high performance liquid chromatography (RP-HPLC)**

The proteolysis during cheese repining was also assessed by RP-HPLC. Samples of WSP (3 mg/ml) were prepared in a Bis-Tris buffered solution (pH 4.6) and injected into a column (C12) pH4.6.}

---

**Table 2 Milk and cheese microbial flora enumerated during ripening**

| Microflora                      | Culture medium          | Incubation      |
|--------------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------|
| Aerobic mesophilic flora (AMF)  | PCA-Agar                | 30°C/24-72 h    |
| Total coliforms (TC)           | VRBL agar               | 30°C/24-48 h    |
| Faecal coliforms (FC)          | BEA (bile esculineazide) agar followed by catalase and Gram reactions, growth at 37°C and at 6.5% NaCl in BHI | 44°C/24-48 h |
| Faecal streptococci (FS)       | BEA (bile esculineazide) agar followed by catalase and Gram reactions, growth at 37°C and at 6.5% NaCl in BHI | 37°C/24-48 h |
| Mesophilic lactobacilli (MLAB)  | MRS agar followed by a catalase test and a Gram stain | 30°C/24-48 h |
| Mesophilic lactic Streptococcus (MLS) | M17 agar followed by a catalase test and a Gram stain | 30°C/24-48 h |
| Yeast and molds (Y-L)          | OGA agar                | 22°C/3-7 d      |
| Staphylococcus aureus          | Presumptive testing: Giolitti-Cantoni broth Confirmatory test: Baird Parker agar with the coagulase test | 37°C/48 h |
| Salmonella spp. (samples: 25 ml for milk or 25 g for cheese) | Enrichment on SFB broth and isolation on Hektoen agar | 37°C/48 h |
buffer with a pH 8 and filtered through 0.45 μm nylon filters (Sartorius, Germany). Twenty μl of filtrate was injected in a Lichrosorb C8 column (5 μm, 125x4, 1mm). The mobile phase was constituted by a solvent A (10% acetonitrile, 0.1% trifluoroacetic acid: TFA) and a solvent B (60% acetonitrile, 0.02 % TFA). The elution was performed using a 0-50% binary gradient of the solvent B during 50 minutes with a flow rate of 0.2 ml/min at 35 °C. The detection was performed under UV at 214 nm.

**Lipolysis**

The lipolysis was assessed by measuring the amount of free fatty acids (FFAs) according to the method described by Deeth et al. (1975). The FFAs were expressed in equivalent of oleic acid per 100 g of fat, referring to a standard curve of oleic acid (0.10-10 mg/ml).

**Microbiological analysis**

Milk and cheese microflora during ripening were determined by the conventional techniques for which the incubation conditions and the medium used are reported in Table 2. Cheese samples were collected at 1, 6 and 12 days of repining. The dilutions were prepared either directly from milk or from cheese prepared according the method described by Lenoir (1963) after some modifications. After removing the crust, 10 g samples of cheese were homogenized in a Stomacher 400 (Seward Medical, Londres, UK) with 90 ml of sterile sodium citrate (2%) at 40 °C. Decimal dilutions of milk and cheese solution were prepared with Ringer’s solution. Germ counts were expressed according to the formula of Joffin and Joffin (1999).

**Anti-microbial activity of water-soluble extract**

The raw water-soluble extracts (WSE) were extracted at the 12th day of cheese ripening, as mentioned above (fractionation of WSP), without acidification. In order to eliminate the antagonistic effects of the pH and H₂O₂, the WSE was neutralized to pH 6.8 with NaOH (2N) and after addition of few drops of catalase (1 mg/ml), it was incubated for one hour at 30 °C (Sahraoui et al. 2015). The raw WSE and the neutralized WSE were filtered through 0.22 μm filters. The agar-disc diffusion assay was performed according to protocol reported by Motta and Brandelli (2002).

The antibacterial activity was tested against *Escherichia coli* ATCC 25922 and *Staphylococcus aureus* ATCC 25923. All the strains were standardized by spectrometry (620 nm) at an optical density (OD) of 0.08-01, according to the Antiibiogram Committee CASFM/EUCAST (2019).

Aliquots of 20 μl were applied on five discs (6 mm): two discs of the raw WSE, two discs of neutralized WSE and one disc with broth (as negative control). The Petri dishes were placed in a refrigerator at 4 °C for two hours. The antimicrobial effect of WSE (expressed in mm) was examined after incubation for 24 hours under appropriate culture conditions. Three replicates were performed on different dates.

**Statistical analysis**

The physicochemical composition and microbiological counts, between raw milk and pasteurized milk, were assessed by the Student’s t-test (5% level of significance). An Analysis of variance (ANOVA), using the Tukey test for pair wise comparison of means, was performed (significant level of 5 %), to follow the changes in the physicochemical and microbiological parameters during cheese ripening. A principal component analysis (PCA) was run in order to analyze the effect of the ripening stage on the physicochemical and microbiological interactions during cheese maturation. The statistical analyses were performed using STATbox software ver. 6.4.

**Results and Discussion**

**Physicochemical characteristics of milk**

The milk physicochemical characteristics are reported in Table 3. Among the analyzed parameters, significant difference was only found between the DM and milk TP (P < 0.05). The sampling season can affect the physico-chemical and microbiological quality of milk (Spike and Freeman, 1967; Nalepa et al. 2018). The effect of seasonality was discarded in this study, as sampling occurred during the same periods of the year.

**Changes in physicochemical parameters during ripening**

The statistical analyses of the physicochemical parameters (Table 4) showed significant differences (P < 0.05) depending on the stage of ripening and the type of cheese.

| Composition   | Raw milk     | Pasteurized milk |
|---------------|--------------|------------------|
| pH            | 6.69 ± 0.02  | 6.66 ± 0.06      |
| TA (°D)       | 17 ± 0.93    | 15.66 ± 0.41     |
| Densité       | 1.03 ± 0.01  | 1.027 ± 0.7      |
| DM (g/l)      | 122.1 ± 0.3082 | 108.13 ± 2.31   |
| FAT (g/l)     | 33.66 ± 2.16 | 36 ± 0.61        |
| TP (g/l)      | 29.45 ± 0.09 | 26.66 ± 0.41     |

Results in the same column for the same parameter with different superscripts are significantly different at P < 0.05.
The pH is negatively correlated with titratable acidity between the different cheese types and the ripening stages. From the first to the twelfth day of ripening, the pH values increased from 4.59 and 4.67 (IC) to 5.13 and 5.36, respectively. This is due to the deacidification of the cheese, which is better assessed through measuring the titratable acidity. Indeed, cheese acidity decreased between the first day (9.59% for the artisanal cheese and 9.11% for the industrial) and the last day of ripening (5.83% artisanal cheese and 6.17% for the industrial).

In the case of Camembert the neutralization and deacidification of cheese is due to the assimilation of lactic acid and the releasing of NH₃ by the fungal flora, especially Penicillium camemberti and Geotrichum candidum, which promoted the action of proteolytic enzymes and increased the proteolysis index (ASP%, NPN%, and FAA) (Leclercq-Perlat et al. 2004).

Dry Matter increased during ripening with significant differences between the stages and the cheese types. The values range from 39.40% (AC) and 40.89% (IC) at the first day, to 50.09% (AC) and 49.51% (IC) at the 12th day of ripening. These findings may be attributed to the dehydration during cheese ripening. This phenomenon is caused by water loss and exchanges in volatile compounds (ammoniac, fat volatile fatty acids, etc.) between the cheese surface and the ripening room environment (Bertolino et al. 2011). The dehydration of cheese affects the contents of DM, fat and protein during ripening process. Indeed, at the last ripening day, the fat content reached at 25.99% for the AC and 28.75% for the IC and the protein contents attained 15.25% for the AC and 17.20% for the IC.

**Progress of proteolysis and lipolysis during ripening**

The proteolysis index, ASP/TP (ASP%) and NPN/TP (NPN%) ratios, have been used by many authors as cheese ripening indicators in order to estimate the degree of the proteolysis (Leclercq-Perlat, 2000). Statistical analysis showed significant differences between the types of cheeses and stages of ripening. ASP% increased from the first to the twelfth day of ripening, with the following values respectively: 5.22% to 22.24% for AC and from 4.69% to 17.44% for IC. The non-protein nitrogen values also increased from 0.31% to 0.44% for AC and from 0.22% to 0.28% for IC. The results of the free amino acids contents during cheese ripening, revealed significant differences (P<0.05) between the cheeses. Free fatty acids increased from 0.12 (first day) to 0.25 (12th day) for AC and from 0.09 (first day) to 0.23 (12th day) for IC. The combined effect of the microflora and indigenous enzymes of the raw milk explains the high degree of the proteolysis in AC. The action of intracellular enzymes, released during cell lysis, on the proteolysis of the cheese caseins has been reported by Saboya et al. (2001). The heat treatment of milk slows down cheese proteolysis by modifying the total flora and the proteolysis system during cheese ripening, such as the Camembert (Samelis et al. 2009). The proteolysis activity of the plasmin in ripened cheeses depends on the technology applied in milk processing. The effect of plasmin on caseins of cheese made from pasteurized milk is significant.

**Table 4 Changes in physicochemical parameters during ripening of artisanal and industrial cheeses**

| Physico-chemical parameters | Cheeses | 1      | 4      | 6      | 12     |
|-----------------------------|---------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
| pH                          | Artisanal ^ | 4.59±±0.38 | 4.60±±0.49 | 4.90±±0.35 | 5.13±±0.38 |
|                             | Industrial | 4.67±±0.53 | 4.94±±0.42 | 5.28±±0.4  | 5.36±±0.46 |
| TA (g/100g of cheese)       | Artisanal ^ | 9.59±±0.18 | 8.70±±0.43 | 8.06±±0.42 | 5.83±±0.23 |
|                             | Industrial | 9.11±±0.64 | 7.90±±0.39 | 7.04±±0.52 | 6.17±±0.22 |
| DM (g/100g of cheese)       | Artisanal ^ | 39.40±±2.49 | 41.84±±4.46 | 48.11±±4.48 | 50.09±±2.57 |
|                             | Industrial | 40.89±±4.61 | 42.61±±3.41 | 47.11±±2.59 | 49.51±±2.98 |
| FAT (g/100g of cheese)      | Artisanal ^ | 18.76±±0.82 | 20.15±±0.68 | 23.71±±0.77 | 25.99±±0.44 |
|                             | Industrial | 22.95±±1.53 | 23.61±±1.92 | 27.11±±1.59 | 28.75±±1.64 |
| TP (g/100g of cheese)       | Artisanal ^ | 10.01±±1.34 | 12.07±±1.55 | 14.19±±0.63 | 15.25±±0.67 |
|                             | Industrial | 12.17±±0.32 | 14.27±±0.77 | 15.29±±0.85 | 17.20±±0.78 |
| APS-PT (g/100g of TP)       | Artisanal ^ | 5.22±±0.55 | 5.52±±0.53 | 12.49±±0.59 | 22.24±±2.87 |
|                             | Industrial | 4.69±±0.27 | 4.63±±0.33 | 6.97±±0.42 | 17.44±±2.85 |
| NPN-PT (g/100g of TP)       | Artisanal ^ | 0.31±±0.07 | 0.34±±0.06 | 0.42±±0.03 | 0.44±±0.04 |
|                             | Industrial | 0.22±±0.03 | 0.22±±0.03 | 0.21±±0.03 | 0.28±±0.05 |
| FAA (mEq/g TP)              | Artisanal ^ | 0.12±±0.03 | 0.14±±0.01 | 0.18±±0.02 | 0.25±±0.02 |
|                             | Industrial | 0.09±±0.004 | 0.13±±0.003 | 0.21±±0.03 | 0.23±±0.014 |
| FFA (Eq Oleic acid/100g of FAT) | Artisanal ^ | 0.90±±0.31 | 2.04±±0.006 | 2.61±±0.38 | 3.19±±0.18 |

Results in the same row or column for the same parameter with different superscripts (in upper case or lower case) are significantly different at P < 0.05
milk, decreases significantly with increasing temperatures (Benfeldt et al. 1997; Buffa et al. 2000). The action of the rennet, the plasmin, the proteases and the microbial peptidases on the caseins throughout ripening releases peptides and amino acids, which increases the ripening index: ASP%, NPN% and FAA % (Gonzalez et al. 2003; Upreti et al. 2006; Orlyuk and Stepanishchev, 2014).

Free fatty acids during cheese ripening, increase as does the proteolysis and the fat content. Similar results have been reported by Batool et al. (2018). FFA presents significant differences between the stages and the types of cheeses. The high level of FFA in the AC can be explained by the micro floral composition of raw milk and the lipoprotein lipase activities. Indeed, the negative effect of pasteurization on LPL activities and the highest of lipolysis degrees in cheeses made from raw milk compared to those made from pasteurized milk have been reported by several authors (McSweeney et al. 1993; Franco et al. 2001).

**RP-HPLC profiles**

The RP-HPLC profiles of WSP of the two cheeses, showed an increase in the number of peaks during the ripening process (Figure 1). These peaks were more frequent in AC than in IC. This is due to the high level of proteolysis in AC, the proteolysis activity of the indigenous milk enzymes, the microbial enzymes...
as well as the activity of the residual rennet. The heat treatment has a negative effect on the proteolysis process during cheese ripening. Benfeldt and Sorensen (2001) showed an inverse relationship, during cheese ripening, between the temperature of heat treatment of milk and the proteolysis as followed by an RP-HPLC. According to Trujillo et al. (1997) and Van Hekken et al. (2007), most of the peptides which are released during ripening, are generated from the caseins hydrolysis by rennet and plasmin with a molecular weight ranging from 10 to 20 kDa.

**Electrophoresis of WSP and insoluble proteins fractions**

The figure 2, shows that the indigenous casein migrates as two main bands corresponding to αs-CN and β-CN. The band intensity decreased throughout ripening, leaving two new bands of low molecular weight (Figure 2a).

This trend was most pronounced for AC at the 12th day of ripening. These profiles revealed that the caseins proteolysis changes over time and with the type of the cheese, with higher αs-CN proteolytic rates than with β-CN. Indeed, new bands with lower molecular weight and the increase in peaks of WSP obtained with RP-HPLC, explain the higher proteolysis index and the free amino acids rates observed in AC than in IC. Our findings are consistent with those reported by Gobbetti et al. (2002), who noted that chymosin hydrolyzes easily αs-CN than β-CN, releasing a peptide identified as α1-s-casein f(24-199). Chymosin is also able to hydrolyze β-CN (Addeo et al. 1980). The main cleavage site of chymosin in β-CN is Leu193-Tyr194. However, in pure solution, it can hydrolyze β-CN at seven sites, generating f1-192, f1-189, f1-163/4/5 et f1-139 peptides, which are called -β-I, -β-II and -β-III respectively (Visser, 1993). Orlyuk and Stepanshchev (2014) reported that between the first and the 21st days of the Camembert ripening, the content of αs-CN and β-CN decreased respectively, by 53% and 25%. Proteolysis during the Camembert ripening is mainly due to the action of five proteinases: rennet (chymosin and pepsin), plasmin, aspartyl and methaloprotease of *Penicillium caseicolum*. However, the rennet seems to be inactive on β-CN, but acts early on αs-CN with a similar action to that of aspartyl-proteinase on αs-CN. On the contrary, the action of the plasmin on β-CN is observed at the 21st day, while the proteolysis of β-CN by the aspartyl and by the methaloproteases is detectable after seven and ten days of ripening respectively (Mane and McSweeney, 2019).

**Growth of microflora during ripening**

The results of milk microorganism counts are reported in table 5. The samples comply with the standards described in the Official Journal of the People’s Democratic Republic of Algeria n° 39 of July 2017 (JORADP, 2017). The tests to detect pathogens in the milks and the cheeses, especially for *Staphylococcus aureus* and *Salmonella*, were negative. The number of microorganisms is significantly higher in the raw milk than in the pasteurized. This reflects the lethal effect of the pasteurization on milk microflora.

The results of the microflora evolution during ripening show an inverse relationship between two microbial groups (Figure 3). The group a, including faecal streptococci and faecal and total coliforms, decreased gradually during ripening. The group b, which consists of total aerobic mesophilic flora, streptococci, Lactobacillus, yeast and molds, increased during the ripening process. The trends were similar for both studied cheeses. The differences were rather concerned with variations in the number and distribution of the microflora. Indeed, the growth of the microflora during ripening of AC recorded significant differences between the first and the twelfth days for AMF (7.41±0.35 log cfu/g and 9.35±0.31 log cfu/g respectively), MLAB (4.41±0.23 log cfu/g and 5.98±0.49 log cfu/g respectively), FC (1.60±0.80log cfu/g and 0.33±0.41 log cfu/g respectively) and FS (1.33±0.2 log cfu/g and 0.58±0.15 log cfu/g respectively). However, IC recorded a slight contamination of TC from the beginning until the sixth day of ripening then it dropped drastically at the twelfth day. With regard to fecal coliform, it disappeared from the sixth day of ripening stage of IC.

The decrease of contamination and the pathogen microflora, during the ripening process of cheese raw milk, is due to the increase in the ripening microflora, which modifies the physico-chemical parameters (a and pH) and releases peptides with antibacterial activity (Fontan et al. 2001; Arenas et al. 2004; Kirdar et al. 2018). However, some studies demonstrated that coliforms decrease during the first week and then increase till the end of the ripening process, with higher rates for the Camembert made

---

Table 5 Microbiological count in milk

| Microflora (log CFU/mL) | Raw milk | Pasteurized milk |
|------------------------|----------|-----------------|
| Aerobic mesophilic flora (AMF) | 4.99±0.306 | 3.71±0.42 |
| Total coliforms (TC) | 1.66±0.11 | 0.32±0.24 |
| Faecal coliforms (FC) | 0.19±0.17 | 0.0033±0.0004 |
| Faecal streptococci (FS) | 0 | 0 |
| Mesophilic lactobacilli (MLAB) | 3.63±0.46 | 0.96±0.178 |
| Mesophilic lactic streptococcus (MLS) | 2.49±0.22 | 0.4±0.14 |
| Yeast and molds (Y and M) | 1.57±0.19 | 0.15±0.19 |

Results in the same column for the same parameter with different letters are significantly different at P < 0.05.
Antimicrobial activity analysis

The results of the analysis of the supernatant antimicrobial activity are reported in the Table 6. The presence of inhibition zones after neutralization of the supernatants suggests that the antibacterial effect could only be due to the presence of antibacterial substances, such as bacteriocins and bioactive peptides (Ortolani et al. 2010; Corrêa et al. 2011).

Most of known varieties of cheeses contain a certain amount of kappacins (A and B) in form of caseinomacropeptide, with an antimicrobial activity, which are released as a result of the action of coagulant enzymes (rennet or other coagulant enzymes) on the \( \kappa \)-casein (Vajiheh, 2012). In the case of the Camembert, many studies demonstrated the effect of lactic bacteria and their products on the inhibition of \( Listeria \) spp during cheese ripening (Wan et al. 1997). Lignitto et al. (2012) and Nguyen Thi et al. (2013) reported that inhibition of \( Listeria \) monocytogenes and \( Listeria \) innocua by water soluble extracts of cheese made from raw milk is attributed to peptides with MW < 1 kDa and to the

from raw milk than for those made from pasteurized milk (Mourgues et al. 1977; Rutzinski et al. 1979).

**Table 6** Antibacterial activity statistics for the raw and neutralized supernatants

| Strains                  | Supernatants | Cheeses type | Inhibition zone diameter (mm) | Mean ± SD |
|--------------------------|--------------|--------------|-------------------------------|-----------|
| *Staphylococcus aureus*  | Raw          | IC           | 10.8 ± 0.97                   |           |
|                          |              | AC           | 10.5 ± 0.98                   |           |
|                          |              | IC           | 10 ± 1.94                     |           |
|                          | Neutralized  | AC           | 8.8 ± 0.32                    |           |
|                          |              | IC           | 11.7 ± 0.21                   |           |
| *Escherichia coli*       | Raw          | AC           | 11.3 ± 0.21                   |           |
|                          |              | IC           | 8.2 ± 0.64                    |           |
|                          | Neutralized  | AC           | 7.9 ± 0.32                    |           |

Legend: Artisanal Camembert (AC), Industrial Camembert (IC). **Group a:** Contaminating flora (Total coliforms (TC), Faecal coliforms (FC), Faecal streptococci (FS)). **Group b:** Ripening flora (Aerobic mesophilic flora (AMF), Mesophilic lactobacilli (MLAB), Mesophilic lactic streptococcus (MLS), Yeast and molds (Y and M)).
antimicrobial peptides $\alpha_s$-CN f(1-23) et $\alpha_s$-CN f(183-207). The antimicrobial activity of the cheese water-soluble extracts could not only be attributed to the known intact bacteriocins with MW > 3 kDa, but also for the fraction with MW > 10 kDa (Drider et al. 2006; Pritchard et al. 2010). During the ripening process of the Camembert, 15 peaks-RPHPLC were identified as potentially bioactive, all stemming from $\beta$-CN with predominance of antibacterial fragments $\beta$-CN f(193-209) (Galli et al. 2019).

Interactions among the physicochemical and microbiological parameters and their progress during ripening

A PCA was run to analyze the interactions between the physicochemical and microbiological parameters and their evolution during ripening. The results related to physicochemical parameters during cheese ripening are presented in Figure 4.

The first two axes explain 91% of the total variance. Axis F1 represents the maturity (temporal) gradient during the ripening process. F2 represents the type of the product. The projection of the means obtained from the three years of study from the same stage of ripening shows that F1 opposes the artisanal Camembert to the industrial. The small distance between d1AC and d4AC shows the high correlation (low changes) registered between the two first considered ripening stages of AC. In contrast, the temporal gradient revealed great changes (lower correlations) from the second stage of ripening, expressed here by an increase in the distance between successive stages (d4AC, d6AC, and d12AC). At the same stages, these differences were less pronounced during IC ripening, which registered an appreciable change only between the two last stages (J6IC and J12IC). The degree of maturation of AC is the result of the combined effects related to the production conditions and the physicochemical and microbiological proprieties of the raw milk. Consequently, IC is richer in DM, fat and proteins, but less matured than AC. Moreover, the factorial plane 1-2 highlights the concentration of the points representing fat, DM and proteins close to the last stage of ripening for IC, while the points representing the maturation index (ASP, NPN, FAA and FFA) are gathered towards this final ripening stage of AC.

The results of the component analysis for the physicochemical and microbiological parameters interactions during ripening are presented in Figure 5.

The axes F1 and F2 expressed 69% and 24% of the total variance respectively. The change in the physicochemical parameters is opposed to the contaminating microorganisms. F2 opposes the coliforms (faecal and total), the faecal streptococci to the mesophilic lactic bacteria ($Streptococci$ and $Lactobacillus$), the MFAT, molds and yeasts. This axis also opposes contaminating germs to pH, FAA and ASP.

A scan of figures 4 and 5 explains the decrease of pathogenic organisms during ripening of the artisanal cheese. This could be due to the action of indigenous enzymes of the raw milk and increase in of lactic bacteria and the fungal flora, which lead to the release of bioactive peptides, with antibacterial effects by their proteolytic action, and production of bacteriocins by lactic bacteria. These results are confirmed by the correlation matrix obtained between the physicochemical and microbiological parameters, which revealed that molds and yeasts have an impact on the proteolysis, with significant ($P < 0.05$) positive correlations with the proteolysis products of ASP ($r = 0.88$) and FAA ($r = 0.90$). MLAB showed significant negative correlations with the pathogenic organisms TC ($r = -0.87$), FC ($r = -0.84$) and FS ($r = -0.86$). This explains the effect of MLAB on the decrease of these pathogenic germs during ripening of the cheeses made from raw milk and the role of lactic microflora in their bio-conservation.
Conclusions

The physicochemical parameters showed the same trends and recorded higher values in the Camembert made from raw milk. The inhibition of *Escherichia coli* and *Staphylococcus aureus* by the neutralized water-soluble fractions revealed the effect of the bioconservation of the camembert made from raw milk by an eventual presence, in the cheese, of bacteriocins and bioactive peptides with antibacterial effect. The current study opens up new perspectives within the framework of the dairy industry in Algeria, encouraging stockbreeders and farmers to transform the raw milk into healthy dairy products and provide steady and more active incomes than those generated from selling milk to collectors.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Dr Said Slimani, who read through the text, for his suggestions regarding the English and we also would like to thank Miss Lamia Bouadjela and Zobiri Assia for their technical assistance, from university Mouloud Mammeri Tizi-Ouzou (Algeria).

References

Addeo F, Pelissier JP, Chianes AL (1980) Specific action of milk-clotting enzymes on water buffalo caseins. I. Effect of chymosin on β-casein. J Dairy Res 47:421-426. doi:10.1017/S0022029900021324

AFNOR (Association Française de Normalisation) (1980) Lait. Détermination de la matière sèche. NF V04 207.In AFNOR (Ed.), Recueil de normes françaises. Laits et produits laitiers. Méthodes d’analyse. Paris : Normalisation française, 33-34

Aissaoui ZO, Benatallah L, El Hannachi G, Zidoune MN (2011) Manufacture of Castelmagno PDO cheese in wintertime. Food Chem 129: 1001-1007. doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2011.05.060

Bouton Y, Guyot P, Dasen A, Grappin R (1993) Activité protéolytique de souches de lactobacilles thermophiles isolées de levains et de Comté : I. Validation sur mini fromages des techniques de laboratoire. Le Lait 73: 265-279. doi: 10.1051/lait:1993325

Bouton Y, Guyot P, Dasen A, Grappin R (1994) Activité protéolytique de souches de lactobacilles thermophiles isolées de levains et de Comté : II. Application en sites industriels. Le Lait 74: 33-46. doi: 10.1051/lait:199414

Buffa M, Trujillo AJ, Roy C, Guamis B (2000) Changes in chemical and microbiological characteristics of goat cheese made from raw, pasteurized or high-pressure-treated milk. High Pressure Res 19: 27-32. doi :10.1080/08957950080202531

Claeys WL, Cardoen S, Daube G, De Block J, Dewettinck K, Dierick K, De Zutter L, Huyghebaert A, Imberechts H, Thiange P, Vandenplas Y, Herman L (2013) Raw or heated cow milk consumption: review of risks and benefits. Food Control 31: 251-262. doi :10.1016/j.foodcont.2012.09.03

Conesa C, Rota C, Castillo E, Perez MD, Calvo M, Sanchez L (2010) Effect of heat treatment on the antibacterial activity of bovine lactoferrin against three food borne pathogens. Int J Dairy Technol 63: 209-215. doi: 10.1111/j.1471-0307.2010.00567.x

Corrêa APF, Daroit DJ, Coelho J, Meira SM, Lopes FC, Segalin J, Risso PH, Brandelli A (2011) Antioxidant, antihypertensive and antimicrobial properties of ovine milk caseinate hydrolyzed with a microbial protease. J Agr Food Chem 91: 2274-2275. doi:10.1002/jfoc.4446

Deeth H C, Fitzgerald C H, Wood A F (1975) A convenient method for determining the extent of lipolysis in milk. Aust J Dairy Technol 30:109-111

Drider D, Finland G, Héchard Y, McMullen LM, Prévost H (2006) The continuing story of class Ila bacteriocins. Microbiol Mol Biol 70:564-582. doi:10.1128/MMBR.00016-05

Dumitraşcu L, Stănciuc N, Stanciu S, Râpeanu G (2012) Thermal and biochemical changes during ripening of Ahumado de Aliva cheese: a Spanish traditional variety. Food Chem 74: 463-469. doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2011.07.006

Enderlin M N, Gigante ML, Galli GG, Fontan MCG, Franco I, Prieto B, Tornadijo ME, Carballo J (2001) Microbiological changes in ‘San Simoon’ cheese throughout ripening and its relationship with physico-chemical parameters. Food Microbiol 18: 25-33. doi:10.1016/j.fmicro.2000.0351

Frau B, Trujillo AJ, Roy C, Ayaz M (2018) Electrically stimulated milk: A comprehensive review. Food Chem 271-279. doi:10.1016/S0956-7135(03)00067-7

Gebreyowhans S, Zhang S, Pang X, Yang B, Wang T, Wu Z, Lu J, Iaping J (2013) Antimicrobial properties of ovine milk caseinate hydrolyzed with a microbial protease. J Agr Food Chem 91: 2274-2275. doi:10.1002/jfoc.4446

Gérard Y (2015) Contractualisation et modes de coordination dans la filière laitière. Économie rurale 345: 87-100. doi: 10.4000/economierurale.4580
Spike PW, Freeman A E (1967) Environmental influences on monthly variation in milk constituents. J Dairy Sci 50: 1897-1904
Sulieman EAM, Mohamed Ali RA, Abdel Razig KA (2012) Production and Effect of Storage in the Chemical Composition of Mozzarella Cheese. Int J Food Sci Nutr Engin 3: 21-26.doi: 10.5923/j.food.20120203.02
Trujillo AJ, Guamis B, Carretero C (1997) Hydrolysis of Caprine β-Casein by Plasmin. J Dairy Sci 80: 2258-2263. doi:10.3168/jds.S0022-0302 (97)76174-5
Upreti P, Metzger LE, Hayest KD (2006) Influence of calcium and phosphorus, lactose, and salt-to-moisture ratio on cheddar cheese quality: Proteolysis duringripening. J Dairy Sci 89:444-453
Vajiheh F (2012) Milk Proteins-derived antibacterial peptides as novel functional food ingredients. Ann Biol Res 3: 2520-2526
Van Hekken DL, Tunick MH, Tomasula, PM, Francisco J, Corral M, Gardea A (2007) Mexican Queso Chihuahua: rheology of fresh cheese. Int J Dairy Technol 60: 5-12. doi: 10.1111/j.1471-0307.2007.00291.x
Visser S (1993) Proteolytic Enzymes and Their Relation to Cheese Ripening and Flavor. J Dairy Sci: 329-350. doi:10.3168/jds.s0022-0302 (93)77354-3
Wan K, Harmark BE, Davidson AJ, Hillier JB, Gordon A, Wilcock MW, Hickey MJ (1997) Coventry-Inhibition of Listeria monocytogenes by piscicolin 126 in milk and Camembert cheese manufactured with a thermophilic starter. J Appl Microbiol 82: 273-280