Putative Nitrogen-Fixing Bacteria Associated With the Rhizosphere and Root Endosphere of Wheat Plants Grown in an Andisol From Southern Chile

Joaquin I. Rilling1,2,3, Jacquelinne J. Acuña1,2, Michael J. Sadowsky4 and Milko A. Jorquera1,2*

1 Applied Microbial Ecology Laboratory, Departamento de Ciencias Químicas y Recursos Naturales, Universidad de La Frontera, Temuco, Chile, 2 Center of Plant, Soil Interaction and Natural Resources Biotechnology, Scientific and Technological Bioresource Nucleus (BIOREN), Universidad de La Frontera, Temuco, Chile, 3 Programa de Doctorado en Ciencias de Recursos Naturales, Universidad de La Frontera, Temuco, Chile, 4 Department of Soil, Water, and Climate, Department of Plant and Microbial Biology, BioTechnology Institute, University of Minnesota, Saint Paul, MN, United States

Acidic ash derived volcanic soils (Andisols) support 50% of cereal production in Chile. Nitrogen (N) is essential for cereal crops and commonly added as urea with consequent environmental concerns due to leaching. Despite the relevance of N to plant growth, few studies have focused on understanding the application, management and ecological role of N2-fixing bacterial populations as tool for improve the N nutrition of cereal crops in Chile. It is known that N2-fixing bacteria commonly inhabits diverse plant compartments (e.g., rhizosphere and root endosphere) where they can supply N for plant growth. Here, we used culture-independent and dependent approaches to characterize and compare the putative N2-fixing bacteria associated with the rhizosphere and root endosphere of wheat plants grown in an Andisol from southern Chile. Our results showed significantly greater bacterial loads in the rhizosphere than the root endosphere. Quantitative PCR results indicated that the copy number of the 16S rRNA gene ranged from $10^{12} \sim 10^{13}$ and $10^{7} \sim 10^{8}$ g$^{-1}$ sample in rhizosphere and root endosphere, respectively. The nifH gene copy number ranged from $10^{5} \sim 10^{6}$ and $10^{5}$ g$^{-1}$ sample in rhizosphere and root endosphere, respectively. The total culturable bacteria number ranged from $10^{9} \sim 10^{10}$ and $10^{7} \sim 10^{8}$ CFU g$^{-1}$ sample in rhizosphere and root endosphere, respectively. Sequencing of 16S rRNA genes from randomly selected putative N2-fixing bacteria revealed the presence of members of Proteobacteria (Bosea and Roseomonas), Actinobacteria (Georgenia, Mycobacterium, Microbacterium, Leifsonia, and Arthrobacter), Bacteroidetes (Chitinophaga) and Firmicutes (Bacillus and Psychrobacillus) taxa. Differences in 16S rRNA and putative nifH-containing bacterial communities between rhizosphere and root endosphere were shown by denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis (DGGE). This study shows a compartmentalization between...
rhizosphere and root endosphere for both the abundance and diversity of total (16S rRNA) and putative N₂-fixing bacterial communities on wheat plants grown in Chilean Andisols. This information can be relevant for the design and application of agronomic strategies to enhance sustainable N-utilization in cereal crops in Chile.

Keywords: Andisol, root endosphere, N₂-fixing bacteria, rhizosphere, wheat

INTRODUCTION

Agricultural production in southern Chile is established in acidic ash derived volcanic soils (Andisols), which support around 50% of cereal production in Chile (Laval and Garcia, 2018). In these soils, nitrogen (N) fertilization (as urea and other chemicals) is a common practice to improve agricultural production. The application of N is essential for crop yields and its availability is crucial during plant vegetative development and seed development (Ohyama et al., 2014), but also contributes to Andisol acidification and contamination of water bodies by N leaching (Nuñez et al., 2010).

Currently, it is widely accepted that the plant rhizomicrobiome contributes in a direct or indirect way to the growth and fitness of plants, providing phytohormones, solubilizing nutrients, fixing nitrogen (N₂), establishing biocontrol of phytopathogens, and chelating metallic ions (De-la-Peña and Loyola-Vargas, 2014). Biological N₂ fixation by bacteria is the most ecologically and agronomically relevant benefit obtained by plants from their interaction with bacteria. Atmospheric N₂ is reduced to ammonia (NH₃) by the bacterial nitrogenase enzyme complex making it accessible for plant uptake. Thus, the recruitment of N₂-fixing bacteria under symbiotic or non-symbiotic relationships (e.g., nodulation of legume plants by Rhizobium spp. or interaction with free-living associative N₂ fixers) helps the host plant to obtain N directly from atmosphere and fulfill its nutritional requirements (de Bruijn, 2015). Studies have also show that some genera of free-living bacteria (e.g., Azospirillum and Azotobacter, and others) can colonize diverse plant niches such as the rhizosphere (soil influenced by plant roots) and endosphere (inner tissues of plants), contributing to the N needs of non-leguminous plants (Bhattacharyya and Jha, 2012).

The inoculation or bioaugmentation of plants with N₂-fixing bacteria is an attractive alternative to traditional N-fertilization practices and results in decreased fertilization costs and an environmentally friendly alternative to use of agrochemicals. In pastures grown in Chilean Andisols, studies have demonstrated that N₂ fertilization induces changes in total rhizobacterial populations, including potential plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria and populations harboring the nif/H gene (Martínez et al., 2011; Jorquera et al., 2014a). Symbiotic N₂-fixing bacteria (e.g., Bradyrhizobium) have been isolated from nodules of yellow lupin (Lupinus luteus) grown in Chilean Andisols (Campos et al., 2014). Partial sequencing of 16S rRNA genes, the application of denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis (DGGE), and 454-Roche pyrosequencing revealed a great diversity of bacterial group present in pasture and cereal rhizospheres of plants grown in Chilean Andisols, including also some N₂-fixing bacteria such as the bradyrhizobia (Jorquera et al., 2014b; Lagos et al., 2014).

However, despite the relevance of N nutrition in cereal production in Andisols in southern Chile, few studies have been done to explore the association of N₂-fixing bacteria with cereals grown in Chilean acid volcanic soils. Several studies have demonstrated that the abundance, diversity, and activity of bacterial populations associated with plants may play a central role in its productivity (Turner et al., 2013; Berg et al., 2014). Therefore, information on N₂-fixing bacterial populations in cereal crops can be relevant for bioprospecting of native bacterial strains as inoculants as well as the development of management strategies to improve the N nutrition of plants and decreasing our dependency to chemical N fertilization.

In this study, we used culture-independent and dependent approaches to characterize and compare putative N₂-fixing bacterial populations associated with the rhizosphere and root endosphere of wheat plants grown in an Andisol from southern Chile.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Sampling

Wheat plants and their adhered rhizosphere soil were placed into sterile flasks (in triplicates) and immediately transported on ice to the Applied Microbial Ecology Laboratory (EMAlab) of Universidad de de la Frontera, Temuco, Chile. The samples were taken from four wheat cultivars (Triticum aestivum cv. Feña, Patras, Joker, and Rocky, labeled as F, P, J and R, respectively) grown in an Andisol located in the La Araucanía region (38°32’47.55’S, 72°27’43.6″W) of Chile under yearly rotation with rapeseed (Brassica napus) and oat (Avena sativa) since 2012. Prior to sampling, the soil was fertilized with 140 kg of urea ha⁻¹ and treated with Bacara (Bayer Crop Science, Inc.), and a commercial mixture of the pre-emergence herbicides flufenacet, fluramone, and diflufenican, to a final concentration of 1 L ha⁻¹. Rhizosphere, roots and shoots were separated separately prior to further activities.

The chemical properties of rhizosphere samples was determined from composited samples as follows: the soil pH was measured in 1:2.5 soil:deionized water suspensions, extractable P (POlsen) was extracted using Na-bicarbonate (0.5 M) and analyzed using the molybdate-blue method (Murphy and Riley, 1962), exchangeable cations (K, Ca, Mg, and Na) were extracted with CH₃COONH₄ (1 M) at pH 7.0 and analyzed by flame atomic adsorption spectrophotometry (FAAS) (Warncke and Brown, 1998), and exchangeable aluminum was extracted with KCl (1 M) and analyzed by FAAS (Bertsch and Bloom, 1996).
Counts of Putative N<sub>2</sub>-Fixing Bacteria

Total and N<sub>2</sub>-fixing bacteria populations in rhizosphere and root endosphere samples were estimated by quantitative PCR (qPCR) using the 16S rRNA and nifH as target genes. Total DNA was extracted from rhizosphere samples (0.25 g) by using DNeasy PowerSoil Kits (Qiagen, Inc.), according to manufacturer instructions. For endosphere samples (0.15 g), root samples were initially vigorously washed with sterile distilled water (SDW) and rhizoplane surfaces were disinfected by three continuous washes in 80% ethanol for 5 min, followed by a 20 min immersion in 4% sodium hypochlorite and three rinses with SDW as described by Durán et al. (2014). The roots were macerated on sterile ceramic mortars and homogenized in 1.5 mL of sterile 0.85% saline solution. To verify sterility of rhizoplane samples, SDW from the third rinse was collected and processed as a sample for sterility control purposes. Root endosphere total DNA was extracted from 0.25 mL of surface sterile root homogenate using Quick-DNA Plant/Seed Miniprep Kit (Zymo Research Corp.), according to manufacturer instructions. The DNA concentrations were confirmed at ~1.8.

The quantitation of nifH genes was done by using the primer set nifH-g1-for3 (5′-GGT TGT GAG CCG AAA GCT GA-3′) and nifH-g1-rev (5′-CGG TAC ATG GCC ATC TC-3′) (Bürgmann et al., 2003). The following PCR conditions were used: 95°C for 11 s followed by cycles of 95°C for 15s, 60°C for 30 s, and a final extension step at 75°C for 8 s and at 72°C for 10 s (Bürgmann et al., 2003). The quantitation of 16S rRNA genes was done using the mitochondrion- and chloroplast containing primer set 799f (5′-AAC MGG ATT AGA TAC CCK G-3′) and 1115r (5′-AGG GTT GCG CTC GTT G-3′) (Shade et al., 2013) with the following program: cycles of 94°C for 1 min, annealing at 53°C for 1 min and extension at 72°C during 1 min; with a final extension step at 72°C during 10 min. (Beckers et al., 2016). Both qPCR assays were done using PowerUp™ SYBR® Green Master Mix (Thermo Fisher Scientific Inc.). The quantitation of gene copies was estimated by using standard curves prepared with synthetic ~1,500 bp dsDNA ultramers (Integrated DNA Technologies, Inc.) of the nifH gene from Azospirillum brasilense Sp7 (NCBI accession no. X51500) and the 16S rRNA gene from Azospirillum picis (NCBI accession no. AM922283), respectively.

Counts of Culturable and Putative N<sub>2</sub>-Fixing Bacteria

Rhizosphere soil (2 g) was suspended in 50 mL of SDW. Previously macerated root samples (1 mL) from section Counts of Putative N<sub>2</sub>-Fixing Bacteria above were resuspended in 25 mL of SDW. Both sample types were homogenized by sonication for 30 s at 120 kHz. Suspensions were serially diluted in 0.85% saline used in plate counting methods described as follow. Counts of total culturable bacteria were done on Luria Bertani agar medium (LB) (10 g L<sup>-1</sup> Tripton; 5 g L<sup>-1</sup>; Yeast Extract; 5 g L<sup>-1</sup> NaCl; Sambrook and Russell, 2001), and on NM-1 oligotrophic medium (0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> D-glucose, 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> polypeptone, 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> Na-glutamate, 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> yeast extract, 0.44 g L<sup>-1</sup> KH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>, 0.1 g L<sup>-1</sup> (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>, 0.1 gl L<sup>-1</sup> MgSO<sub>4</sub>·7H<sub>2</sub>O, 15 g L<sup>-1</sup> agar, and 1 ml vitamin solution containing 1 g L<sup>-1</sup> nicotinamide, 1 g L<sup>-1</sup> thiamine hydrochloride, 0.05 g L<sup>-1</sup> biotin, 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> 4-aminobenzoic acid, 0.01 g L<sup>-1</sup> vitamin B12, 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> D- pantothenic acid hemorrhagic salt, 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> pyridoxamine dihydrochloride, 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> folic acid; (Nakamura et al., 1995)). Both culture media were amended with 10 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> cycloheximide prevent fungal growth. Autoclaved agar was added before plating at final concentration of 1.5% for both media, as recommended by Tanaka et al. (2014), to prevent hydrogen peroxide formation, resulting in bacterial growth inhibition with the concomitant underestimation of total cultivable bacteria counts (Supplementary Figure 1). Aliquots (50 µl) of appropriated dilutions of the rhizosphere and root endosphere suspensions were separately plated onto petri dishes containing LB and NM-1 media, and incubated for 4 days at 28°C. Colonies grown on agar plates were automatically counted by using CLIQS Colony Counter software (TotalLab Inc., UK).

In parallel, indirect counts of putative N<sub>2</sub>-fixing bacteria were carried out by MPN analyses as recommend by Baldani et al. (2014), using semisolid (0.5% agar) NFb medium tubes [5 g L<sup>-1</sup> malic acid, 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> K<sub>2</sub>HPO<sub>4</sub>, 0.1 g L<sup>-1</sup> NaCl, 0.02 g L<sup>-1</sup> CaCl<sub>2</sub>×2H<sub>2</sub>O, 2 mL of micronutrient solution (0.4 g L<sup>-1</sup> CuSO<sub>4</sub>×5H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.12 g L<sup>-1</sup> ZnSO<sub>4</sub>, 1.4 g L<sup>-1</sup> H<sub>3</sub>BO<sub>3</sub>, 1 g Na<sub>2</sub>MoO<sub>4</sub>×2H<sub>2</sub>O, 1.5 g and MnSO<sub>4</sub>×H<sub>2</sub>O), 2 mL 0.5% bromothymol blue in 0.2N KOH, 4 mL of 1.64% Fe[III] EDTA, and 1 mL of vitamin solution containing 100 µg L<sup>-1</sup> biotin and 200 mg L<sup>-1</sup> pyridoxamine dihydrochloride; (Hartmann and Baldani, 2006)]. Tubes containing 5 mL of NFb medium were inoculated with 100 µL of sample and incubated for 4 days at 37°C. The presence of white layer (or pellicle), an indicator of N<sub>2</sub>-fixing bacterial growth, was checked, and aseptically removed by using sterile cork borers. After MPN analyses, the isolation of putative N<sub>2</sub>-fixing bacteria was performed by resuspension of the pellicle on 1 mL 0.85% NaCl, and 100 µL re inoculated into fresh tubes of NFb medium. Tubes were incubated at 37°C for 4 days. After second incubation, the pellicle was newly aseptically removed, resuspended on 1 mL 0.85% NaCl, serially diluted and plated onto LB and Congo red malic-acid (CRMA; 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> K<sub>2</sub>HPO<sub>4</sub>, 0.2 g L<sup>-1</sup> MgSO<sub>4</sub>×7H<sub>2</sub>O; 0.1 g L<sup>-1</sup> NaCl, 0.5 g L<sup>-1</sup> yeast extract, 0.015 g L<sup>-1</sup> FeCl<sub>3</sub>×3H<sub>2</sub>O; 5 g L<sup>-1</sup> DL-malic acid, 4.8 g L<sup>-1</sup> KOH, and 15 mL<sup>-1</sup> of 1:200 Congo red; Rodriguez-Caceres, (1982) agar media. Colonies (75) were randomly selected from CRMA agar plates according to their morphology, purified by streaking on NFb agar plates, and stored in 1 mL sterile LB-Glycerol (7:3) at~10°C.

Characterization of Putative N<sub>2</sub>-Fixing Bacteria

Total DNA from selected rhizosphere and root endosphere isolates was extracted by using the Proteinase K-CTAB (cetyl-trimethylammonium bromide) method as described by Wilson (2001). To prevent analysis of clones, all isolates were firstly genotyping by using rep-PCR DNA fingerprinting and ERIC primers as described by Versalovic et al. (1991). The 16S rRNA genes were amplified from 20 and 18 genetically-different rhizosphere and root endosphere isolates, respectively, by using
PCR and the universal bacterial primer set 27f (5′-AGA GTT TGA TCC TGG CTC AG-3′) and 1492r (5′-TAC GGY TAC CTT GGT ACG ACT T-3′) (Lane, 1991) and by using the PCR conditions suggested by Jorquera et al. (2012). In parallel, nif H genes were also amplified by using the primer set PolF (5′-TGC GAY CCS AAR GCB GAC TC-3′) and PolR (5′-ATS GCC ATC ATY TCR CCG GA-3′) and PCR condition suggested by Jorquera et al. (2014a).

Synthetic 16S rRNA and nif H genes from Azospirillum picis and Azospirillum brasilense Sp7 were used as positive controls, respectively.

In addition, a variety of universal nif H primer combinations were also tested, including PolFi and PolR; PolF and AQER; nifH-g1-forA and nifH-g1-rev; nifH-g1-forB and nifH-g1-rev; MehtaF and MehtaR (Supplementary Table 1). Despite the large number of primers used, however, sequence analyses indicated that the amplicons were unspecific and not related to nif H.

The PCR products were sequenced by Macrogen Inc. (Seoul, South Korea), trimmed, cleaned up, and compared with those deposited in GenBank database using BLASTn tool (https://blast.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/Blast.cgi). To determine the presence of nif H, nucleotide sequences were translated into amino acids and compared with those present in GenBank by using BLASTX. Sequences (1 from rhizosphere and 7 from the root endosphere) showing positive alignment with the nif H enzyme were used to build a neighboring-joining tree using representative sequences of nif H reported in literature, including Azorarcus, Azospirillum, Azotobacter, Bosea, Bradyrhizobium, Bacillus, Burkholderia, Chitinophaga, Herbaspirillum, Mesorhizobium, Microbacterium, Pontibacter, Rhizobium, and Roseomonas. The alignment of amino acids sequences was done by CLUSTAL W (Larkin et al., 2007) and neighbor-joining trees were built using Geneious version R11 (Bootstrap = 1000) (Kearse et al., 2012).

Sequences obtained in this study were deposited in GenBank under accession numbers MG835569 to MG835606 for 16S rRNA gene, and MH175481 - MH175487 as well as MH175490 for nif H gene sequences.

DGGE Fingerprinting of Total and N2-Fixing Bacterial Communities

Fingerprinting of total and N2-fixing bacterial communities in rhizosphere and root endosphere samples was done by using DGGE of 16S rRNA and nif H as target genes, respectively. For total bacterial communities, 16S rRNA genes were first amplified by using primer set 933f (5′-GCA CAA GGG GTG GAG CAT GTG G-3′) and 1492r. Then, ~600 bp bands were confirmed on electrophoresis, and used as template for a nested PCR with primer set 933f-gc and 1387r (5′-GCC GGG GAA GGT ATT CAC CG-3′). The GC-clamp (5′-CCG CCG CCG CCG GGC GCG GCG GGG GGG GGA CCA CGG GGG-3′) was attached to the 5′-end of primer 933f, and PCR reactions were carried as described by Jorquera et al. (2012). In parallel, the amplification of nif H was done by nested PCR using in the first PCR round the PolF (5′-TGC GAY CCS AAR GCB GAC TC-3′) and PolR (5′-ATS GCC ATC ATY TCR CCG GA-3′) primer set. After specific ~400 bp bands were confirmed on electrophoresis, a second PCR reaction was carried with the PolFI (5′-TGC GAI CCS AAI GCI GAC TC-3′) and AQER-GC30 (5′-GAC GAT GTA GAT YTC TCT GGG-3′) primer set. The GC-clamp (5′-CGC CCG CCG CCG CCG CCG CCG CCG GCG GAC GAT GAT YTC TCT G-3′) was attached to the 5′-end of primer AQER and the PCR conditions were carried out according to described by Jorquera et al. (2014a).

The DGGE analysis was performed using a DCode system (Bio-Rad Laboratories, Inc.). PCR products (20 µL) were loaded onto 6% (w/v) polyacrylamide gel with a 50–75% denaturing gradient (7 M urea and 40% formamide) and electrophoresis was run for 16 h at 80 V. The gel was stained with SYBR Gold (Molecular Probes, Invitrogen Co.) for 30 min and photographed on a UV transilluminator. Image analysis and clustering of DGGE banding profiles were done under CLIQS 1D Pro software (TotalLab Ltd). Based on the matrix obtained from CLIQS 1D Pro analysis, the distances between the bacterial communities from rhizosphere and root endosphere 16S rRNA and nif H genes were calculated by similarity profile analysis (SIMPROF test) with Bray–Curtis similarity index with a 5% significance level and <0.15 stress values with Primer-E v6 (Primer-E Ltd.; http://www.primer-e.com/) (Clarke, 1993; Clarke et al., 2008). A graphical representation of the result was generated through non-metric multidimensional scaling (nMDS) plots, developed with the same software. The similarities of rhizosphere and root endosphere 16S rRNA and nif H communities were compared at 40 and 60%.

Statistical Analysis

The culture-dependent (dilutions, plating, and isolation) as well as independent (DNA extractions, PCR, DGGE, and qPCR) procedures were performed in triplicates and analyzed by one-way ANOVA. Comparisons were carried out for each pair with Tukey HSD test using IBM SPSS Statistics 24 (IBM Corporation). Values are given as means ± standard deviation on means. Differences were considered to be significant when the P-value was ≤ 0.05.

RESULTS

Rhizosphere Soil Properties

No large differences in soil chemical properties were observed between the rhizosphere soils of different wheat cultivars, showing typical characteristics of Chilian Andisols used in agriculture. The properties of rhizosphere soils (Table 1) were as follows: pH ranged from 6.29 to 6.39, organic matter ranged from 15 to 16%, and the ranges for the macronutrients N, P, and K were 52.7–63.1, 29–37, and 138–159 mg kg⁻¹, respectively. The cation exchange capacity ranged from 16.08 to 18.01 cmol c⁻¹ kg⁻¹, with an Al saturation between 0.06 and 0.25%.

Counts of Total- and N₂-Fixing Bacteria

The qPCR analyses indicated that there were large differences in total bacteria loads between rhizosphere and root endosphere samples (Figure 1). Significantly greater (P ≤ 0.05) counts of total bacteria were observed in the rhizosphere (1.8 × 10¹²–9.2 × 10¹³ copies of 16S rRNA genes g⁻¹ sample) compared with the root endosphere (2.2 × 10⁹–3.6 × 10⁸ copies of 16S rRNA genes g⁻¹ sample).
TABLE 1 | Chemical properties of rhizosphere soils used in this study.

| Property         | Feña (F) | Patras (P) | Joker (J) | Rocky (R) |
|------------------|----------|------------|-----------|-----------|
| N (mg kg⁻¹)      | 60       | 52.7       | 63.1      | 55.3      |
| P (mg kg⁻¹)      | 35       | 29         | 37        | 31        |
| K (mg kg⁻¹)      | 156      | 141        | 138       | 159       |
| pH (H₂O)         | 6.35     | 6.31       | 6.39      | 6.29      |
| Organic matter (%) | 16      | 15         | 16        | 16        |
| K (cmol c⁻¹ kg⁻¹) | 0.4      | 0.74       | 0.25      | 0.43      |
| Na (cmol c⁻¹ kg⁻¹) | 0.03    | 0.07       | 0.02      | 0.03      |
| Ca (cmol c⁻¹ kg⁻¹) | 15.87   | 14.35      | 16.23     | 14.07     |
| Mg (cmol c⁻¹ kg⁻¹) | 1.46    | 1.49       | 1.5       | 1.51      |
| Al (cmol c⁻¹ kg⁻¹) | 0.01    | 0.03       | 0.01      | 0.04      |
| CEC (cmol c⁻¹ kg⁻¹) | 17.77   | 16.68      | 18.01     | 16.08     |
| Σ Bases (cmol c⁻¹ kg⁻¹) | 17.76 | 16.65      | 18        | 16.04     |
| Al saturation (%) | 0.06    | 0.18       | 0.06      | 0.25      |

*Calculated as Alcation exchange capacity [Σ (K, Ca, Mg, Na, and Al)] × 100.

Counts of total cultural bacteria were observed in the rhizosphere (1.1 × 10⁵–1.9 × 10⁸ and 9.5 × 10⁷–1.6 × 10⁹ CFU g⁻¹ sample with LB and NM1 media, respectively) compared with root endosphere samples (1.9 × 10⁴–3.4 × 10⁵ and 1.2–5.1 × 10⁴ CFU g⁻¹ sample) on the same media. Smaller distances (less than one order) (P ≤ 0.05) were observed between on putative N₂-fixing culturable bacteria in CRMA medium for rhizosphere samples (2–8.2 × 10³ CFU g⁻¹) compared with those from the root endosphere (8.5 × 10²–1.9 × 10³ CFU g⁻¹) (Figure 2B).

Characterization of Putative N₂-Fixing Bacteria

Thirty-eight of 77 strains examined with ERIC-PCR analysis (49.3%) were recognized as non-redundant putative N₂-fixing bacterial isolates, whose taxonomic assignments are shown in Table 2. Based on partial sequencing of 16S rRNA genes, most of isolates from the rhizosphere samples had an affiliation with the genus Bacillus (15 of 20 isolates), followed by members of genera Microbacterium (3 isolates), Chitinophaga (1) and Arthrobacter (1) genera. In contrast, only 4 of 18 isolates from the root endosphere samples were characterized as member of the genus Bacillus based on sequencing of 16S rRNA genes. Other isolates were characterized as being members of the genera Roseomonas (3), Mycobacterium (3), Georgenia (2 isolates), Bosea (2), Microbacterium (1), Psychrobacillus (1), Chitinophaga (1) and Leifsonia (1).

BLASTx analyses (Table 3) predicted eight amino acid sequences (1 from the rhizosphere and 7 from the root endosphere) that coded the nitrogenase-characteristic P-loop NTase conserved superfamily domain. The neighbor-joining tree analysis also revealed that our partial predicted nitrogenase-like enzymes showed higher dissimilarities compared with those representatives of nitrogenase enzymes taken from GenBank (Figure 3), except for sequences from Chitinophaga sp. 643EA and Roseomonas sp. 523EC.

Fingerprinting of Total and N₂-Fixing Bacterial Communities

Fingerprint analysis of bacterial communities by DGGE revealed significant differences (P ≤ 0.05) between the total bacterial communities found in rhizosphere and root endosphere samples from the wheat cultivars examined (Figure 4A). Two clusters were clearly observed at the 40% similarity level. However, a specific bacterial community for each of the wheat cultivars was not observed, even at higher similarity percentages (60%). Similarly, significant differences (P ≤ 0.05) between rhizosphere and root endosphere samples of wheat cultivars with respect to nifH-harboring bacterial populations. However, a specific nifH-harboring bacterial community for each cultivar was not observed at higher similarity (60%), except for the root endosphere samples from wheat cv “Feña” (Figure 4B).

DISCUSSION

Nitrogen is an essential nutrient for plant growth and N₂-fixing bacteria play an important role in plant nutrition. Studies focused to N₂-fixing bacteria in Chilean agroecosystems are scarce,
particularly with respect to cereal cropping systems. By using culture-dependent methods, N$_2$-fixing bacteria have previously been isolated from alfalfa and lupin plants grown in Andisols from southern Chile (Langer et al., 2008; Campos et al., 2014). Culture-independent methods based on partial sequencing of 16S rRNA genes have also revealed the occurrence of Sinorhizobium strains on wheat (Jorquera et al., 2014b) and Azospirillum in ryegrass (Lagos et al., 2014) rhizospheres. In addition, and to our knowledge, no studies on endophytic N$_2$-fixing bacteria in Chilean agroecosystems have not been done so far.

In this study, qPCR revealed the occurrence of *nif*H-harboring bacterial population in all samples of wheat cultivars analyzed, with a significantly higher abundance of total and N$_2$-fixing bacteria in the rhizosphere, compared with root endosphere samples. Our results showed a large number of copies, $10^{12}$–$10^{13}$, of 16S rRNA genes g$^{-1}$ present in rhizosphere soils, which is two orders of magnitude greater than those reported by Sanguin et al. (2009) in rhizosphere soils from wheat. Lower abundances ($\sim 10^8$ gene copies g$^{-1}$) were also reported in wheat rhizospheres by Reardon et al. (2014). The difference between our results and other wheat studies in literature could be attributed to the variability of 16S rRNA copy number of present in environmental bacteria, which could contain as much as 15 copies per cell (Kembel et al., 2012; Větrovský and Baldrían, 2013). Similarly, 16S rRNA copies in cotton plants has been reported around the values that we report here ($10^{12}$ copies g$^{-1}$ rhizosphere; Zhang et al., 2016).

In relation to the abundance of *nif*H genes, the values obtained in this study were close to those reported by Reardon et al. (2014). We found $\sim 10^8$ copies of *nif*H genes g$^{-1}$ of rhizosphere soils in wheat plants. In contrast, Bouffaud et al. (2016) reported greater *nif*H gene abundances ($\sim 10^9$ gene copies g$^{-1}$) in rhizosphere soils of wheat plants.

Reported counts of 16S rRNA genes, by qPCR, in inner tissues or root endosphere of plants are scarce because of the potential for biased results due to the presence of ribosomes in chloroplasts and mitochondria (Shade et al., 2013). The use of the chloroplast-and mitochondria-excluding primer set 799f and 1115r (Shade et al., 2013) has been reported to produce reliable qPCR results on root endosphere samples (Beckers et al., 2016). Our results showed $\sim 10^7$–$10^8$ copies of 16S rRNA genes g$^{-1}$ root, which are similar to those obtained by Ruppel et al. (2006) in the rice endosphere. Higher loads of endophytic bacteria ($10^{10}$–$10^{13}$ copies of 16S rRNA genes g$^{-1}$ root) were reported in a rice-maize rotation (Breidenbach et al., 2017). In relation to *nif*H genes, studies have reported abundances of $\sim 10^8$ copies of *nif*H genes g$^{-1}$ root in wheat and rapeseed plants (Bouffaud et al., 2016; Puri et al., 2016). Both studies reported three orders higher *nif*H gene numbers, compared to those obtained in this study ($\sim 10^5$ genes copies g$^{-1}$ root).

Similar to qPCR results, bacterial numbers obtained by the plate-counting studies done here suggested the occurrence of cultivable N$_2$-fixing bacteria in all samples of wheat cultivars analyzed, with a significant higher abundance in rhizosphere compared with root endosphere samples. Our results showed counts of total cultivable bacteria of $10^9$–$10^{10}$ CFU g$^{-1}$ and $10^7$–$10^8$ CFU g$^{-1}$ on LB and NM-1 media, respectively. In this context, Jorquera et al. (2014b) reported counts of $10^7$ CFU g$^{-1}$ rhizosphere on cereals (wheat and oats) and pastures (ryegrass) by using NM-1 medium, similar to the results described by Jia et al. (2015) in wheat rhizosphere on meat-peptone agar ($10^6$ CFU g$^{-1}$ rhizosphere). In addition, the counts of cultivable bacteria in root endosphere samples we examined ($10^4$–$10^5$ CFU g$^{-1}$ root) were similar to those observed on wheat roots by Ruppel (1989) and Robinson et al. (2016) with counts of $\sim 10^4$ CFU g$^{-1}$ root in wheat.

Our counts of putative N$_2$-fixing bacteria in the rhizosphere ($10^3$ CFU g$^{-1}$) of wheat were lower than those reported in the wheat ($10^4$ CFU g$^{-1}$), chickpea and sugarcane ($10^4$–$10^5$ CFU g$^{-1}$) rhizospheres examined by Pathania et al. (2014) and Ahmad et al. (2006). This may, in part, due to different culture conditions used in each study. However, our counts...
### TABLE 2 | Taxonomic identity of putative N₂-fixing bacteria isolates obtained by sequencing of 16S rRNA genes.

| Isolate | Taxonomy group | Closest relatives or cloned sequences (accession no.) | Identity | Accession no. |
|---------|----------------|------------------------------------------------------|----------|---------------|
| **RHIZOSPHERE** | | | | |
| 62CR | Actinobacteria; Micrococcales; Microbacteriaceae; Microbacterium | Microbacterium proteolyticum from Halimione portulacoides roots (NR_132869) | 99% | MG835569 |
| 72CR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus megaterium strain p102_H06 from maize rhizosphere (JQ832567) | 99% | MG835570 |
| 102BR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Nitrogen-fixing Bacillus megaterium strain ADU08 from date palm soil (K0694270) | 99% | MG835571 |
| 112BR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus megaterium strain ARD47 from acid soil (K0023249) | 100% | MG835572 |
| 154AR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus sp. strain SZ177 from straw decomposition (K0986708) | 99% | MG835573 |
| 173CR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus megaterium strain PSC1 from sugarcane rhizosphere (KU196781) | 99% | MG835574 |
| 184AR | Actinobacteria; Micrococcales; Microbacteriaceae; Microbacterium | Diazotrophic Microbacterium sp. S2SP302 from sugarcane rhizosphere (KT183549) | 100% | MG835575 |
| 184AR-1 | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus megaterium strain yangueK8 from Jugihas regia rhizosphere (KU977121) | 100% | MG835576 |
| 214AR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus megaterium strain yangueE10 from Jugihas regia rhizosphere (KU977110) | 100% | MG835577 |
| 214AR-1 | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus megaterium strain yangueE10 from Jugihas regia rhizosphere (KU977110) | 100% | MG835578 |
| 222BR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus sp. MP33 from rice rhizosphere (LT629146) | 99% | MG835579 |
| 623EA | Bacteroidetes; Chitinophagaceae; Chitinophaga; Chitinophaga; Chitinophaga | Chitinophaga arvensicola strain MRP-16 from Dioscorea batatas rhizoplane (AB908086) | 99% | MG835588 |
| 243AR | Actinobacteria; Micrococcales; Micrococcaceae; Actinobacter | Arthrobacter sp. strain JQ-1 from phthalate contaminated soil (K0055564) | 100% | MG835580 |
| 322CR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus megaterium strain ARD47 from acid soil (K0023249) | 100% | MG835583 |
| 342CR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus huholouensis strain WJB150 from rice rhizosphere (K1U877672) | 100% | MG835584 |
| 354AR | Actinobacteria; Micrococcales; Microbacteriaceae; Microbacterium | Microbacterium sp. SIB_Cu_R3 from Betula pendula L. rhizosphere (K0X36571) | 100% | MG835585 |
| 354AR-1 | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus megaterium strain Hd from arsenic contaminated soil (K0Y98770) | 100% | MG835586 |
| 372EC | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Nitrogen-fixing Bacillus megaterium strain ADU08 from date palm soil (K0694270) | 99% | MG835587 |
| 503CR | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus aryathatta strain He from arsenic contaminated soil (K0Y98771) | 100% | MG835581 |
| 503CR-1 | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus anolydophacien strain Y14 from peanut rhizosphere (CP017955) | 99% | MG835582 |
| **ROOT ENDOSPHERE** | | | | |
| 223EC | Actinobacteria; Corynebacteriales; Mycocibacteraeae; Mycobacterium | Mycobacterium sp. Site1-11a from manure-fertilized grassland (JF034596) | 99% | MG835593 |
| 382EC | Actinobacteria; Micrococcales; Microbacteriaceae; Microbacterium | Mycobacterium sp. SIB_Cu_R3 from Betula pendula L. rhizosphere (K0X36571) | 100% | MG835590 |
| 424EC | Actinobacteria; Micrococcales; Bogoriellaceae; Georgeria | Georgeria sp. strain MC-14-2 from Populus euphratica endosphere (KF848489) | 99% | MG835581 |
| 444FC | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Psychrobacillus | Psychrobacillus psychrophurans strain EC1 from corn roots (KP334982) | 99% | MG835592 |
| 491EC | Actinobacteria; Corynebacteriales; Mycobacteriaceae; Mycobacterium | Mycobacterium sp. strain OTB74 from Sandy soil (KN022865) | 99% | MG835594 |
| 513EC | Proteobacteria; Alphaproteobacteria; Rhodospirillales; Acetobacteraceae; Roseomonas | Roseomonas sp. A2 from tomato rhizosphere (KP789481) | 99% | MG835595 |
| 523EC | Proteobacteria; Alphaproteobacteria; Rhodospirillales; Acetobacteraceae; Roseomonas | Roseomonas sp. Esch5-313 from popul endosphere (AM489616) | 99% | MG835596 |
| 543EC | Proteobacteria; Alphaproteobacteria; Rhodospirillales; Acetobacteraceae; Roseomonas | Roseomonas sp. strains THG-N2.22 from soil (K0456186) | 98% | MG835598 |
| 564EB | Firmicutes; Bacilli; Bacillales; Bacillaceae; Bacillus | Bacillus anolydophacien strain Y14 from peanut rhizosphere (CP017955) | 100% | MG835599 |

(Continued)
of endospheric N$_2$-fixing bacteria ($10^3$ CFU g$^{-1}$ root) are similar to those obtained by Ruppel (1989) ($10^4$ CFU g$^{-1}$ root) in wheat and Patel and Archana (2017) in several Poaceae plant tissues ($10^3$-$10^5$ CFU g$^{-1}$ root). Most studies on N$_2$-fixing bacterial communities in the wheat root endosphere have examined colonization niches and physiological effect of different diazotrophic endophytes (Liu et al., 2017a,b), instead of determining how abundant are the N$_2$-fixing root endosphere communities. That said, however, it is well known that culture medium type greatly affects the reported numbers of bacteria obtained via plate-counting. Media bias is always an issue in examining microbiota in environmental niches. In this context it has been described that the use of diluted of culture media improves CFU number determination and enhance isolation of N$_2$-fixing bacteria (Janssen et al., 2002; Hashimoto et al., 2017a,b). Despite this limitation, however, our analyses do allow relative comparisons of total and N$_2$-fixing microbes in the plant compartments we examined.

Sequencing of 16S rRNA genes of rhizosphere isolates revealed the occurrence of members of genera Bacillus, Microbacterium, Chitinophaga, and Arthrobacter. Most of isolates were characterized as belonging to the genus Bacillus, which is a common inhabitant in the rhizosphere soil of plants grown in Andisols from southern Chile (Acula and Jorquera, 2011; Martinez et al., 2011). In this context, diazotrophic Bacillus sp. strains have been shown to be associated with N$_2$-fixation in wheats (Pathania et al., 2014), as well as sugarcane (Madhaiyan et al., 2011). It is noteworthy that most of isolates characterized as Bacillus (10 of 15) were phylogenetically close to Bacillus megaterium, a well-known N$_2$-fixing and phosphate-solubilizing bacterium commonly studied as plant growth-promoting bacteria (Ding et al., 2005; Elkoca et al., 2007).
FIGURE 3 | Neighbor-joining tree showing the phylogenetic affiliation between predicted amino acid sequences from nifH gene obtained from rhizosphere and root endosphere isolates in this study (red) and representative nifH-coded enzyme amino acid sequences from known representative plant-soil bacteria deposited in NCBI GenBank database (black). Scale represents substitution sites (Bootstrap = 1,000). In parenthesis is shown the accession number of representative sequences in GenBank or the taxonomic affiliation based on 16S rRNA gene sequencing of isolates.

The remaining five rhizosphere isolates we examined were characterized as *Microbacterium*, *Chitinophaga*, and *Arthrobacter* sp. strains, these microorganisms were previously proposed to be associated with N2-fixation in the rhizospheres of other plant species (Mirza and Rodrigues, 2012; Beneduzi et al., 2013; Moyes et al., 2016).

Our results also showed the occurrence of members of the genera *Bacillus*, *Georgenia*, *Mycobacterium*, *Bosea*, *Microbacterium*, *Psychrobacillus*, *Roseomonas*, *Chitinophaga*, and *Leifsonia* genera in the root endosphere of wheat. Bacteria belonging to the phylum Actinobacteria, such as members of the genera *Georgenia*, *Mycobacterium*, and *Leifsonia*, have been described as common inhabitants of the root endosphere of plants, as well as have many diazotrophs (Mårtensson et al., 2009; Han et al., 2011; Liaqat and Eltem, 2016). It is noteworthy, that the isolation of Proteobacteria belonging to the genera *Bosea* and *Roseomonas* have not been previously reported either soils or *in planta* in Chile. Isolates characterized as *Bosea* have been isolated from lupin root nodules by De Meyer and Willems (2012). In this context, *Bosea* spp. appear to be related to bacteria within the genus *Rhizobium*, well known for forming N2-fixation symbioses with legumes worldwide, as well as with plants grown in acidic soils in Chile (Langer et al., 2008).

In addition, despite that our analysis with BLASTx suggested the presence of the nitrogenase enzyme in genomes of our isolates; the neighbor-joining tree analysis did not show a high similarity when our predicted nitrogenase-like enzymes were compared with representative nitrogenases taken from GenBank. This result also might explain the low specificity of universal primer sets found in the literature and used in this study (Supplementary Table 1), which could not adequately cover the nitrogenases harbored by native bacteria living in Chilean Andisols. Accordingly, and as discussed by Gaby and Buckley (2012), while several universal primers have been designed and empirically tested for nitrogenase, some of them can generate false positive reactions; and therefore, primers must be used with caution and validated with genomic DNA from phylogenetically diverse N2-fixing strains from different environments.

Likewise, members of the genus *Roseomonas* have been recognized as a PGPB found in a wide variety of environments,
including the in rhizospheres of rice (Ramaprasad et al., 2015) and Chinese cabbage (Kim and Ka, 2014), and in contaminated soils (Chen et al., 2014). In this study, we noted that there were large differences in microbiota present in rhizosphere and root endosphere samples. Similarly, Robinson et al. (2016) found differences in endophytic bacteria between roots and leaves, which were attributed to tissue type, phenological stage of plants, and soil nutrient availability. Bouffaud et al. (2016) also proposed that plants recruit its own N₂-fixing endophytic microbiome. These differences in the composition...
and structure of bacterial communities between rhizosphere and root endosphere were also confirmed by DGGE. Our results suggest a compartmentalization between rhizosphere and root endosphere for both studied communities (16s rRNA and nif/H). Such separation has been described as being common in plants (Mahaffee and Kloepper, 1997) and we propose that these differences might also be influenced by a combination of different factors, including soil composition (pH, organic matter, and nutrients), soil management (fertilization, rotation, and tillage) and plant (genotype, phonological stages, and defense mechanisms) and the presence of other microbial communities (fungi, nematode, and protozoa).

In Chilean Andisols, as well as other agroecosystems, our knowledge on N$_2$-fixing bacterial populations associated with plants is very limited. In this sense, based on the relevance of plant microbiome upon fitness and production of crops, an exhaustive study on the abundance, diversity and activity of N$_2$-fixing bacterial populations could be essential to the development of novel fertilizers and management agronomic strategies to improve the efficiency of N fertilization in the field with the consequent low cost for the farmers and environmental benefits.

REFERENCES

Acuña, J., and Jorquera, M. (2011). Indole acetic acid and phytase activity produced by rhizosphere bacilli as affected by pH and metals. J. Soil Sci. Plant Nutr. 11, 1–12. doi: 10.4067/S0707-85712011000300001

Ahmad, F., Ahmad, I., Aqil, F., Wani, A., and Sousche, Y. (2006). Plant growth promoting potential of free-living diazotrophs and other rhizobacteria isolated from Northern Indian soil. Biotechnol. J. 1, 1112–1123. doi: 10.1002/biot.200600132

Baldini, J., Reis, V., Videira, S., Boddey, L., and Baldini, V. (2014). The art of isolating nitrogen-fixing bacteria from non-leguminous plants using N-free semi-solid media: a practical guide for microbiologists. Plant Soil 384, 413–431. doi: 10.1007/s11104-014-2186-6

Berg, G., Grube, M., Schloter, M., and Smalla, K. (2014). Unraveling the plant microbiome: looking back and future perspectives. Front. Microbiol. 5:148. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2014.00148

Bertsch, P., and Bloom, P. (1996). “Aluminum,” in Methods of Soil Analysis, Part 3: Chemical Methods (Madison, WI: Soil Science Society of America, American Society of Agronomy Madison), 517–550.

Bhattacharyya, P., and Jha, D. (2012). Plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria (PGPR): emergence in agriculture. World J. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 28, 1327–1350. doi: 10.1007/s11274-011-0979-9

Boufaud, M., Renoud, S., Moenne-Loccoz, Y., and Muller, D. (2016). Is plant evolutionary history impacting recruitment of diazotrophs and nif expression in the rhizosphere? Sci. Rep. 6, 1–9. doi: 10.1038/srep21690

Breidenbach, B., Brenzinger, K., Brandt, F., Blaser, M., and Conrad, R. (2017). The effect of crop rotation between wetland rice and upland maize on the microbial communities associated with roots. Plant Soil 419, 435–445. doi: 10.1007/s11104-017-3351-5

Bürgmann, H., Widmer, F., Sigler, W. V., and Zeyer, J. (2003). mRNA extraction and reverse transcription-PCR protocol for detection of nifH gene expression by Azotobacter vinelandii in soil. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 69, 1928–1935. doi: 10.1128/AEM.69.4.1928-1935.2003

Campos, D., Acevedo, F., Morales, E., Aravena, J., Amiard, V., Jorquera, M., et al. (2014). Microencapsulation by spray drying of nitrogen-fixing bacteria associated with lupin nodules. World J. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 30, 2371–2378. doi: 10.1007/s11274-014-1662-8

Chen, Q., Sun, L., Zhang, X., He, J., Kwon, S., Zhang, J., et al. (2014). Roseomomas rhizosphaeraceae sp. nov., a triazophos-degrading bacterium isolated from soil. Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol. 64, 1127–1133. doi: 10.1099/ijs.0.057000-0

Clarke, K. (1993). Non-parametric multivariate analyses of changes in community structure. Austr. J. Ecol. 18, 117–143. doi: 10.1111/j.1442-9993.1993.tb00438.x

Clarke, K., Somerfield, P. J., and Gorley, R. N. (2008). Testing of null hypotheses in exploratory community analyses: similarity profiles and biota-environment linkage. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol. 366, 56–69. doi: 10.1016/j.jembe.2008.07.009

De Meyer, S. E., and Willems, A. (2012). Multilocus sequence analysis of Bosea species and description of Bosea lupini sp. nov., Bosea lathyrus sp. nov. and Bosea robiniae sp. nov., isolated from legumes. Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol. 62, 2505–2510. doi: 10.1099/ijs.0.035477-0

De-la-Peña, C., and Loyola-Vargas, V. M. (2014). Biotic interactions in the rhizosphere: a diverse cooperative enterprise for plant productivity. Plant Physiol. 166, 701–719. doi: 10.1104/pp.114.241810

El-Koca, E., Kantar, F., and Sahin, F. (2007). Influence of nitrogen fixing and phosphorus solubilizing bacteria on the nodulation, plant growth, and yield of chickpea. J. Plant Nutr. 31, 157–171. doi: 10.1080/01904160701742097

Funding

This study was funded in part by grants from the Chilean government: FONDICYT Regular No. 1160302 and FONDICYT Initiation into Research No. 11160112, and by the University of Minnesota Agricultural Experiment Station (to MS). Joaquin Rilling acknowledges the support of CONICYT Doctoral Scholarship program, Grant No. 21150794.

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

The Supplementary Material for this article can be found online at: https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fmicb.2018.02710/full#supplementary-material

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

JR performed experiments and developed the manuscript. JA, MS, and MJ contributed to statistical and elaboration of the article.

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

The Supplementary Material for this article can be found online at: https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fmicb.2018.02710/full#supplementary-material

Frontiers in Microbiology | www.frontiersin.org 11 November 2018 | Volume 9 | Article 2710
Sambrook, J., and Russell, D. (2001). “Analysis of gene expression in cultured mammalian cells,” in Molecular Cloning: A Laboratory Manual, Vol. 3, eds J. Sambrook and D. Russel (New York, NY: Cold Spring Harbor Press), 9–10.

Sanguin, H., Sarniguet, A., Gazengel, K., Moënne-Loccoz, Y., and Grundmann, G. (2009). Rhizosphere bacterial communities associated with disease suppressiveness stages of take-all decline in wheat monoculture. New Phytol. 184, 694–707. doi: 10.1111/j.1469-8137.2009.03010.x

Shade, A., McManus, P., and Handelsman, J. (2013). Unexpected diversity during community succession in the apple. MBio 4, 1–12. doi: 10.1128/mBio.00602-12

Tanaka, T., Kawasaki, K., Daimon, S., Kitagawa, W., Yamamoto, K., Tamaki, H., et al. (2014). A hidden pitfall in the preparation of agar media undermines microorganism cultivability. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 80, 7659–7666. doi: 10.1128/AEM.02741-14

Turner, T., James, E., and Poole, P. (2013). The plant microbiome. Adv. Bot. Res. 69, 279–309. doi: 10.1186/gb-2013-14-6-209

Versalovic, J., Koeuth, T., and Lupski, J. R. (1991). Distribution of repetitive DNA sequences in eubacteria and application to fingerprinting of bacterial genomes. Nucleic Acids Res. 19, 6823–6831. doi: 10.1093/nar/19.24.6823

Větrovský, T., and Baldrian, P. (2013). The variability of the 16S rRNA gene in bacterial genomes and its consequences for bacterial community analyses. PLoS ONE 8:e57923. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0057923

Warncke, D., and Brown, J. R. (1998). “Potassium and other basic cations,” in Recommended Chemical Soil Test Procedures for the North Central Region, NCR Publication No. 221, Missouri Agricultural Experiment Station SB 1001, ed J. R. Brown (Columbia: NCR Publications), 31–33.

Wilson, K. (2001). “Preparation of Genomic DNA from Bacteria,” in Current Protocols in Molecular Biology, Vol. 56, ed F. M. Ausubel (Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.), 2.4.1–2.4.5. doi: 10.1002/0471142727.mb0204s56

Zhang, Y., Xie, M., Peng, D., Zhao, J., and Zhang, Z. (2016). Dynamics of microbial population size in rhizosphere soil of Monsanto’s Cry1Ac cotton. Plant Soil Environ. 62, 92–97. doi: 10.17221/770/2015-PSE

Conflict of Interest Statement: The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Copyright © 2018 Rilling, Acuña, Sadowsky and Jorquera. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.