Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
Periodic recurrent waves of Covid-19 epidemics and vaccination campaign

Gaetano Campi, Antonio Bianconi

Abstract

While understanding of periodic recurrent waves of Covid-19 epidemics would aid to combat the pandemics, quantitative analysis of data over a two years period from the outbreak, is lacking. The complexity of Covid-19 recurrent waves is related with the concurrent role of i) the containment measures enforced to mitigate the epidemics spreading ii) the rate of viral gene mutations, and iii) the variable immune response of the host implemented by vaccination. This work focuses on the effect of massive vaccination and gene variants on the recurrent waves in a representative case of countries enforcing mitigation and vaccination strategy. The spreading rate is measured by the ratio between the reproductive number $R_t(t)$ and the doubling time $T_d(t)$ called RIC-index and the daily fatalities number. The dynamics of the Covid-19 epidemics have been studied by wavelet analysis and represented by a non-linear helicoid vortex in a 3D space where both RIC-index and fatalities change with time. The onset of periodic recurrent waves has been identified by the transition from convergent to divergent trajectories on the helicoid vortex. We report a main period of recurrent waves of 120 days and the elongation of this period after the vaccination campaign.

© 2022 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Periodic recurrent waves occur in out of equilibrium dynamics for propagation into unstable states in viral epidemics [1–4], in population dynamics, ecology, cyclic predator-prey systems, spreading fires, ferroelectrics and membranes [5–20]. The viral pandemic Influenza A appearing in 1918 (called Spanish flu) has shown three main waves in its first two years [1] followed by seasonal waves of influenza variants for many years [2]. The study of periodic waves in the case of measles epidemics has pointed out the role of spatial hierarchy of host population structure and the role of vaccination [3]. The complexity of recurrent waves in epidemics is driven by either i) the spatiotemporal heterogeneities and mobility of population constraining the virus diffusion described by network theory in the macroscopic physical world and ii) the gene point mutations, i.e., atomic substitutions and deletions affecting only one or few nucleotides in the viral gene sequence and in the immunity system of the host cells, which are made up of active atoms which seem to make up unpredictable choices in the microscopic quantum world.

The Covid-19 pandemic has infected 327 million people with 5.5 million fatalities [21–38] in two years from the outbreak, and it has been contrasted in different countries by two policies: i) the “zero Covid” [29–35] and the “mitigation” strategy [36]. In 2021 the vaccination campaign started and new variants appeared [39]. Mathematical models of Covid-19 spreading have been developed based on standard epidemiological theories [25–28] and on network theory [29–35], but quantitative analysis of recurrent waves and the effect of vaccination campaign on these recurrent waves is lacking.

The SARS CoV-2 contagiousness is measured here by the ratio of the time dependent reproductive number, $R_t$ and the doubling time, $T_d$, called RIC-index [21]. In previous works [22–24] we have identified the critical doubling time $T_d^a$ which separates the explosive supercritical regime ($T_d < T_d^a$) from the arrested subcritical regime ($T_d > T_d^a$) of the epidemics spreading. The severity of the impact of the epidemics on the population has been quantified by the number of daily deaths per million population, $D_f$.

The experimental periods of the recurrent waves have been extracted by the Wavelet Transform (WT) [40,41] of either the RIC-index and the $D_f$ time series to extract the frequency (or period) of non-stationary time series data [40–42].

The periodic waves of SARS-CoV-2 are represented in this work by a Covid-19 acentric helicoid vortex in a 3D space by combining the time evolution of daily deaths per million population, $D_f$, and RIC-index.
To quantify the divergence/convergence of non-stationary orbits of the Covid-19 helicoid vortex we have used the Rosenstein algorithm [43] to calculate the Largest Lyapunov Exponents (LLE) of the Covid-19 to identify the onset of periodic recurrent waves. This approach allows to monitor discontinuities and fluctuations at small timescale in complex systems [43–48] described by short time series and intrinsic transient character where the conventional chaotic deterministic nonlinear dynamical approach characterized by the classical Lyapunov exponents fails.

2. Results and discussion

The Covid-19 spreading rate shows a heterogeneous character due to the different containment measures adopted in the different geographical areas. Here we focus on Italy as representative of the West European Area. Data on epidemic spreading and severity from 24/02/2020 to 15/12/2021 have been taken from the recognized public database OurWorldInData [49] to extract the time-dependent doubling time $T_d$ as described in [24] and the time-dependent reproductive number $R_t$ from [49]. The time evolution of both $T_d$ and $R_t$ is shown in Fig. 1a, where the gray horizontal strip indicates the critical phase defined by $50 < T_d < 100$ days [22,24] and $1 < R_t < 1.1$ [28]. This critical strip separates the supercritical regime by the subcritical regime. In the supercritical regime $T_d$ grows up exponentially assuming values less than 100 days, while $R_t$ values result larger than 1. In the subcritical regime $T_d$ becomes large enough ($T_d > 100$), $R_t$ becomes less than 1 and the exponential growth is arrested [21]. The explosive supercritical regime with exponential growth occurred at the threshold of the first two 2020 Covid waves, indicated by red areas in the panel (a), corresponding to a peak in $R_t$ joint with a dip of $T_d$, due to their anti-correlation. The green shadowed vertical rectangle indicates the time of the first lockdown with strict rules (SL) enforced by the “mitigation” policy in the first wave (from 24/02/2020 to 30/04/2020) due to the first variant from Wuhan provided by reference [37]. The red shadowed rectangle indicates the time of the mild lockdown with loose rules (ML) to face the European E20 variant diffusion in the second wave (from 25/10/2020 to 31/12/2020) getting out of the supercritical phase. A third small pocket with critical conditions, occurs around day 430, due to the alpha variant diffusion contrasted by the start of the vaccination campaign at $t_v = 400$ day. The massive vaccination campaign in Italy has been able to freeze the outbreak of the delta variant. In fact, while $R_t$ shows a sharp peak, reaching values larger than 1 but the doubling time $T_d$ shows a minimum that remains much longer than 100 days, therefore the epidemic spreading has been frozen in the subcritical regime during the time of the delta variant.

In order to take into account both $R_t$ and $T_d$ to describe the contagiousness of the pandemic complex dynamics, we have used the parameter introduced in [21]

$$RIC-\text{index} = \log_{10}(R_t / T_d) - 2$$

(1)

The $RIC$-index value is near to zero in the critical phase, assumes negative or positive values in the subcritical or supercritical phases, respectively, as shown in Fig. 1b. In the supercritical explosive supercritical regimes, the $RIC$-index shows a clear peak indicated by the red area. Alongside the variation of the contagiousness of the pandemic, the other important factor to keep in consideration is the danger and the severity of the disease.

At this aim we consider the number of daily fatalities per million population, $Df$, shown in Fig. 1c where the peaks of the recurrent waves correspond with the peaks of the $RIC$-index. The figure shows also the percentage of fully vaccinated people versus time. It is clear how fatalities number is suppressed at larger percentage of vaccinated people, although further recurrent waves with different duration and intensity in the subcritical phase have occurred during the vaccination campaign. In particular, we note first the suppression of a third wave (around day 430, after $t_v = 400$ day in Fig. 1c) due to the diffusion of the alpha variant. In this period and afterwards, during the delta variant diffusion, the vaccination campaign lowers the number of deaths and prevents the spreading rate from falling into the supercritical phase, being the $RIC$-index below threshold.

In order to get quantitative information on the variation of recurrent waves with the onset of vaccination campaign, we have applied the wavelet transform (WT) on both the $RIC$-index and the daily fatalities per million population time series, $Df$, and we have calculated the Largest Lyapunov Exponents map of the $RIC$-index versus $Df$ in the time dependent orbit.
2.1. Wavelet and Fourier Transform of Periodic Recurrent Waves

We have applied the WT to the RIC-index and Df of Covid-19 pandemics evolution to visualize the different periodic fluctuations of Covid-19 spreading in magnitude scalogram color plots. WT are also useful for analysing weak and localized discontinuities, such as metastable phases [21,22]. The WT algorithm has been used to analyze the frequency structure of both the RIC-index and Df time series using the Morse wavelet (see Methods). The RIC-index scalogram, given by the local wavelet power spectrum, LWPS, in Fig. 2a, shows three main periods longer than 50 days indicated by the white dashed lines. Shorter periods are assigned to metastable phases.

The three main periods increase with the progress of the massive vaccination campaign after $t_v = 400$ day which is also shown by the global wavelet power spectrum, GWPS plotted in Fig. 2b. The GWPS is obtained by averaging the LWPS across time (see Methods) before and after $t_v$, giving analogous information of the traditional Fourier spectrum, but in different time windows. The key result presented in this work is evidence of the shift of the periods before and after the vaccination campaign, as indicated by the arrows. The periods pass from 58, 75 and 118 days before the vaccination campaign to 68, 105 and 138 days, during the vaccination campaign.

Similar behavior can be seen in the LWPS and in the GWPS of the Df time series in Fig. 2c and d, respectively, where two main periods result elongated with the vaccination campaign. In particular, the first period passes from 65 to 85 days crossing $t_v$, while the second period of 135 days before vaccinations splits in two periods of 125 and 155 days during the vaccination campaign. The time evolution of the observed Covid-19 recurrent waves is in qualitative agreement with the results of the wavelet analysis applied to periodic travelling waves of measles in London [3].

2.2. Largest Lyapunov MAP of RIC-index versus Daily Deaths Helicoid Time Trajectories

The periodic recurrent waves can be visualized in a three-dimensional space, probing the contagiousness of pandemic spreading correlated with fatality numbers as a function of time. By plotting the time evolution of the RIC-index and Df we obtain a non-linear helicoid vortex shown in Fig. 3a composed by different acentric rings suggesting a chaotically dynamical evolution where the instabilities zones can be given by the Lyapunov exponents of dynamical evolving trajectories along the 3D orbit in Fig. 3a.

The analysis of the helicoidal evolution of the time series of the RIC-index and the Df as function of time are available only over a short limited time interval and it is driven not only by the classical diffusion and random infection by contact events between humans in the macroscopic physical world, but also by the probability rate of the unpredictable virus gene point mutations because of unpredictable atoms replacements or deletions in the microscopic many body quantum world.

Since it is not possible to interpret our time series in term of classical Lyapunov exponents we have used the data-driven method by Rosenstein [43] to estimate the Largest Lyapunov Exponent (LLE) for short time series, used and tested in a wide variety of complex systems [44–48] like biological time series characterized by transient states of living matter which diverge from the basic assumptions for a classical chaotic system.

In our approach we have chosen several initial ranges in the 3D orbit for LLE calculations. In order to follow the dynamics of the system day per day, we have considered all orbits on the intervals $\Delta t_i^2 = [t_i^2 dt_1 + dt_i]$ days, where $t_i^2 = 73$ days is the initial day and $dt_i$ is an initial range spanning from $dt_1 = 32$ days up to $dt_{24}$ 56 days, which is the lowest pandemic period, obtained by WT analysis. We have calculated the Largest Lyapunov Exponent for all orbits obtained by increasing the interval $\Delta t_i^2$ by one day until the LLE becomes positive, at the $t_i^3$ day. This point, called discontinuity point, becomes the new initial instant, and the LLE is calculated on the new $\Delta t_i^3 = [t_i^3 dt_1 + dt_i]$ interval. Than this interval is increased by one day at each LLE calculation up to a new discontinuity point $t_i^4$. The procedure is iterated up the last point of the orbit (see Methods). Changing the initial range $dt_i$ with $1 < i < 24$, we obtain a Lyapunov MAP, shown in Fig. 3b and c. The LLE exponent in each point has been calculated using the Rosenstein approach which ensures accuracy and fast computation for short and noisy data sets [43]. We underline that a positive value of LLE indicates divergent trajectories and unstable system while a negative value indicates convergent orbits.

---

Fig. 2. Wavelet and Fourier Transform of Covid-19 periodic travelling waves in Italy from 24/02/2020 to 15/12/2021. The Covid-19 spreading is visualized as a function of time by wavelet transform of (a) RIC-index and (c) daily deaths per million population, Df, time series. The wavelet analysis decomposes the spreading waves at different scales hidden in time series data. The main periods, before and after the vaccination campaign started at $t_v = 400$ day, are indicated by the white horizontal dashed lines. We note a shift towards longer periods with the activation of the vaccination campaign in both RIC-index and Df time series. We can also visualize shorter lived transient events during the pandemic spreading, corresponding to lower intensity spots at smaller periods. Power is color coded from −2.5 (blue) to 1 (red). Global wavelet power spectrum (GWPS) of periods of (b) RIC-index and (d) daily new deaths time series calculated for $t < t_v$ (blue line) before the vaccination campaign and for $t > t_v$ (red line), after the vaccination campaign. The horizontal arrows represent the periods elongation obtained with the vaccination campaign.
attracting towards a stable fixed point or periodic orbit. A positive LLE represents the instability zones where pandemic spreading results unstable and unpredictable. Than the LLE return to negative values in convergent trajectories with stable fluctuations to explode again in the next discontinuity point. We assume these discontinuity points as the limits of successive pandemic waves in the RIC-Index - Df space, represented by different colored rings in the 3D trajectory of Fig. 3a.

After the 1st wave due to the Wuhan variant (blue ring in Fig. 3a and blue light rectangle in Fig. 3b), we identify the explosion of the 2nd wave by the positive decreasing of the LLE from positive towards negative values, during the diffusion of the European 20E variant (green ring in Fig. 3a and light green rectangle in Fig. 3b). A 3rd wave due to the alpha variant diffusion can be identified by the fluctuations the LLE in the light green rectangle, soon after the beginning of the vaccinations campaign at t_v. In this case the fluctuation remains stable, since negative LLE does not exceed the zero values. After this, we observe a new discontinuity with increasing LLE towards positive values in correspondence with the delta variant spreading around day 470. This is followed by a stabilization of the orbit with negative LLE ascribed to the vaccination campaign which avoids the exponential growth (red ring in Fig. 3a and light red rectangle in Fig. 3b), as found in Fig. 1. Finally, we get evidence of the start of the new omicron variant spreading by the new instability zone around day 700.

3. Methods

3.1. Wavelet analysis

Traditional Fourier analysis partitions the total power (variance) of the time series between sinusoidal components at different frequencies. This approach lacks information on the time sequence of frequencies. By contrast, the wavelet approach allows studying recurrent waves phenomena in time as well as frequency. Rather than a sinusoid, the method is based on the Morse wavelet function [40–42], which capture local (in time) cyclical fluctuations in the time series. As with all wavelets, the frequency-time range over which it does this is set by a scale parameter, s. In general, wavelet scale is related to the conventional Fourier period of oscillations. Local wavelet power spectra, LWPS, of the RIC-index and daily deaths per millions of populations time series are presented in Fig. 2a and c. Power is color-coded as shown. Global wavelet power spectrum, GWPS, of both RIC-index and daily deaths per millions of populations time series have been calculated by averaging the LWPS across time, giving standard Fourier transforms. Waves in the epidemic generates a peak in power spectra. The superimposed parabola represents the cone of influence, which measures the extent of edge effects. The WT has been performed, after smoothing accomplished using Gaussian windows on 14 days, for avoiding higher frequencies due to data collection artefacts during e.g. in the public holidays and weekends.

3.2. Largest Lyapunov Exponents map

Classical Lyapunov exponents provide a measure of the exponential growth due to infinitesimal perturbations on a time series. A classical dynamical system becomes chaotic when very close starting states will diverge exponentially for some short time. The rate of exponential divergence is measured with classical Lyapunov exponents. If two initial states are separated by a small distance s_0, then for a short time interval the separation will evolve according to the equation s(t) ≈ s_0e^{\lambda t}. The value \lambda is defined as the Largest Lyapunov Exponent, LLE, of the system. Chaotic systems show positive Lyapunov exponents and their sensitivity to initial conditions increases with \lambda. Nearby points of an orbit will diverge to any arbitrary separation; therefore, a larger the exponent shows a more unstable system. On the contrary, a negative Lyapunov exponent indicates that the orbit converges to a stable fixed point, as generally occurs in a dissipative system with asymptotic stability; the more negative the exponent, the greater the stability. Finally, the points in the orbit where \lambda = 0, are fixed points where the system is in a steady-state mode or near the transition to chaos. The extraction of the classical lyapunov exponent assumes that the system follows deterministic trajectories over an unlimited time period over a very long time with no transient states, typical of biological systems and the data analysis requires very long time series which are typically not available for epidemics spreading.
Therefore for the Covid-19 short time series we have calculated the Largest Lyapunov Exponents following the Rosenstein algorithm [43]. In this approach it is first necessary to reconstruct the state space from the experimental data record. The original time series data and its time-delayed copies determine the topological structure of a dynamical system [50]:

\[ Y = [X(t), X(t + T), \ldots, X(t + (d - 1)T)] \]  

where \( Y \) is the reconstructed d-dimensional state vector, \( X(t) \) is the observed variable, \( T \) is a time lag, and \( d \) is the embedding dimension. This method looks for the nearest neighbor of each point in phase-space and tracks their separation over a certain time evolution. This separation is also a function of the location of the initial value. To obtain LLE on different initial times, we have built a Lyapunov map. Each point in this map corresponds to a Lyapunov exponent, \( L(Y[i(t)]) \), calculated for the time series \( \{Y[i(t)]\} \), starting from an initial instant, \( t_i \), up to an initial ranges, \( dt \), and increasing by one the successive series up to the discontinuity point, \( t_i^{®} \), where the Lyapunov exponent goes from a negative value to a positive value. These points, \( t_i \), where the convergent trajectory becomes divergent, are called discontinuity points and indicate the transition between stable and unstable regimes. As soon as the Lyapunov exponents become positive, we identify the discontinuity points as initial instants \( t_i^{®} \) of the new series \( \{Y[i^{®}(t)]\} \). The procedure is iterated for the \( \{Y[i^{®}(t)]\} \) time series corresponding to the \( t_i^{®} \) point of discontinuity. The index, \( i \), represents a given initial range chosen from a minimum (32 days) to a maximum value of 56 days not exceeding the minimum non-local period in the wavelet transform calculation.

Thus a Lyapunov exponent of a map with pixels \( (i, j) \) can be written as

\[ L(Y[i(t)]) = L(Y[Ric(\Delta t_i)], Df(\Delta t_i))] \]  

where

\[ \Delta t_i = (t_i, \ldots, t_i + dt, t_i + dt + 1, \ldots, t_i^{®}) \]  

\( Ric \) and \( Df \) are the \textit{Ric-index} and the daily deaths per million of population. In our case a Lyapunov map is made of 24 horizontal profiles, \((1 < i < 24)\); each profile is calculated using the initial range, \( dt = 31 + i \). Each horizontal profile is characterized by \( 1 < j < n_i \) discontinuity points where \( L(Y[i]) \) change sign becoming positive. This procedure allows us to visualize and identify the discontinuity points that are independent from the assumed initial ranges, \( dt \), in calculations. Quantitative determination of the discontinuity points on the helicoid 3D trajectory is made by finding the discontinuity points in the averaged profile of LLE, in the map. As for the WT analysis, the Lyapunov Map is calculated on time series smoothed on Gaussian windows of 14 days, for avoiding higher frequencies due to the mentioned data collection possible artefacts.

4. Conclusions

We have studied the periodic recurrent waves of the pandemic COVID-19 by analysing its contagiousness (\textit{Ric-index}) and the impact on country population (the daily deaths per million of population \( D_j \)) as a function of time in a 3D space parameter. The wavelet transform approach shows that the pandemic periods are elongated during the vaccination campaign. As a result, we present a chaotic helicoid-like vortex behavior and a Largest Lyapunov Exponents map to represent the evolution of contagiousness and impact of the COVID-19 pandemics. Our unconventional chaotic map is obtained by calculating the time-dependent Largest Lyapunov Exponents of a reconstructed space made of 3D orbits evolving day per day of fatalities number versus \textit{Ric-index}. The detection of any possible crossover from negative to positive LLE gives the instability zones corresponding to the onset of new pandemic waves. This provides a quantitative tool needed for prompt response to appearing new waves due to a new mutant of the coronavirus.

In conclusion, we have found that vaccination increases the period of the oscillations, which is crucial for the control action. However, work is in progress to monitor discontinuities points occurring in the Largest Lyapunov Exponents map after the vaccination, related with the appearing of the new variants and the duration of effectiveness of covid vaccine. The use of the proposed approach in the containment policies will provide early warning to critical situations and quantitative measure of the slowing down the rate of diffusion of the virus during the vaccination campaign.

Credit authorship contribution statement

Gaetano Campi: Conceptualization, Methodology, Data analysis, Writing-Reviewing and Editing.

Antonio Bianconi: Conceptualization, Methodology, Data analysis, Writing- Reviewing and Editing.

Declaration of competing interest

Authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Acknowledgments

This work was funded by Superstripes onlus.

References

[1] Cunha BA. Influenza: historical aspects of epidemics and pandemics. Infect Dis Clin. 2004;18(1):141–55.
[2] Taubenberger JK, Morens DM. 1918 influenza: the mother of all pandemics. Rev Biomed. 2006;17(1):69–79.
[3] Grenfell BT, Bjørnstad ON, Kappes J. Travelling waves and spatial hierarchies in measles epidemics. Nature. 2001;414(6865):716–23.
[4] Cummings DA, Izrierry RA, Huang NE, Endy TP, Nisalak A, Ungchusak K, Burke DS. Travelling waves in the occurrence of dengue hemorrhagic fever in Thailand. Nature. 2004;427(6972):344–7.
[5] Hassell MP, Comins LN, May RM. Spatial structure and chaos in insect population dynamics. Nature. 1991;353:255–8.
[6] Sole RV, Valls J, Bascompte J. Spiral waves, chaos and multiple attractors in lattice models of interacting populations. Phys Lett A. 1992;166:123–8.
[7] Jeltsch F, Muller MS, Grimm V, Wissel C, Brandl R. Pattern formation triggered by rare events: lessons from the spread of rabies. Proc R Soc Lond B. 1997;264:455–503.
[8] Bjørnstad ON, Ims RA, Lambin X. Spatial population dynamics: analysing patterns and processes of population synchrony. Trends Ecol Evol. 1999;14:427±432.
[9] Stenseth NC, et al. Common dynamic structure of Canada lynx populations within three climatic regions. Science. 1999;285:1071–3.
[10] Blasius B, Huppert A, Stone L. Complex dynamics and phase synchronization in spatially extended ecological systems. Nature. 1999;399:354±359.
[11] Sherratt JA. Periodic travelling waves in cyclic predator-prey systems. Ecol Lett. 2001;4:30±37.
[12] Neubert MG, Kot M, Lewis MA. Dispersal and pattern formation in a discrete-time predator-prey model. Theor Pop Biol. 1995;48:7–43.
[13] Trofinchuk S, Volpert V. Travelling waves in delayed reaction-diffusion equations in biology. Math Biosci Eng. 2020;17(6):6487–514.
[14] Van Saarloos W. Front propagation into unstable states. Phys Rep. 2003;386:29–222.
[15] Cross MC, Hohenberg PC. Pattern formation outside of equilibrium. Rev Mod Phys. 1993;65:851–1112.
[16] Rarenblatt GI. Scaling, self-similarity, and Intermediate Asymptotics: Dimensional Analysis and Intermediate Asymptotics., 1Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press; 1996.
[17] Fox JM, Whitesides GM. Warning signals for eruptive events in spreading fires. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2015;112:2376–83.
[18] Benedek G, Bussmann-Holder A, Bilk H. Nonlinear travelling waves in ferroelectrics. Phys Rev B. 1987;36(1):630.
[19] Douglas JF, Elfenkno F, Fisher DA, Phelan FR, Genzer J. Propagating waves of self-assembly in organosilane monolayers. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2007;104:10324–9.
[20] Ramaswamy S, Toner J, Prov J. Nonequilibrium fluctuations, traveling waves, and instabilities in active membranes. Phys Rev Lett. 2000;84:3494–7.
[21] Campi G, Mazzotti MV, Valletta A, Ravagnan G, Marcelli A, Perali A, Bianconi A. Metastable states in plateaus and multi-wave epidemic dynamics of Covid-19 spreading in Italy. Sci Rep. 2021;11(1):1–9.
[22] Campi G, Valletta A, Perali A, Marcelli A, Bianconi A. Epidemic spreading in an expanded parameter space: the supercritical scaling laws and subcritical metastable phases. Phys Biol. 2021;18:045005. https://doi.org/10.1088/1478-3975/ac059d.
[23] Bianconi A, Marcelli A, Campi G, Perali A. Ostwald growth rate in controlled Covid-19 epidemic spreading as in arrested growth in quantum complex matter. Condens Matter. 2020;5:23. https://doi.org/10.3390/condmat5020023.

[24] Bianconi A, Marcelli A, Campi G, Perali A. Efficiency of Covid-19 mobile contact tracing containment by measuring the COVID-19 pandemic: growth patterns, power law scaling, and saturation. Phys Biol. 2020;17:065006. https://doi.org/10.1088/1478-3975/abac51.

[25] Fanelli D, Piazza F. Analysis and forecast of Covid-19 spreading in China, Italy and France. Chaos Solitons Fractals. 2020;134:109761. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chaos.2020.109761.

[26] Cadoni M. How to reduce epidemic peaks keeping under control the time-span of the epidemic. Chaos Solitons Fractals. 2020;138:109940.

[27] Singer HM. The COVID-19 pandemic: growth patterns, power law scaling, and saturation. Phys Biol. 2020;17:055001.

[28] Ziff RM. Percolation and the pandemic. Physica A. 2021:125723.

[29] Bell J, et al. Beyond Covid-19: network science and sustainable exit strategies. J Phys Complex. 2021;2:021001.

[30] Bianconi G, Krapivsky PL. Epidemics with containment measures. Phys Rev E. 2020;102:032305. https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.102.032305.

[31] Bianconi G. Multilayer networks: structure and function. Oxford University Press; 2018.

[32] Radicchi F, Bianconi G. Epidemic plateau in critical susceptible-infected-removed dynamics with nontrivial initial conditions. Phys Rev E. 2020;102(5):052309. https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.102.052309.

[33] Ferretti L, Wyman C, Kendall M, Zhao L, Nurtay A, Abeler-Dörner L, Fraser C. Quantifying SARS-CoV-2 transmission suggests epidemic control with digital contact tracing. Science. 2020;368(6491):eabb6936. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abb6936.

[34] Bianconi G, Sun H, Kapsiardi G, Arenas A. Message-passing approach to epidemic tracing and mitigation with apps. Phys Rev Res. 2021;3(1):L012014.

[35] Park YJ, Choe YJ, Park O, Park SY, Kim YM, Kim J. COVID-19 National Emergency Response Center Epidemiology and Case Management Teamcollab. Contact tracing during coronavirus disease outbreak, South Korea. Emerg Infect Dis. 2020;26(10):2405–8.

[36] Ferguson NM, et al. Impact of non-pharmaceutical interventions (NPIs) to reduce COVID-19 mortality and healthcare demand Report 19 Imperial College COVID-19 Response Team. available online: https://spiral.imperial.ac.uk:8443/handle/10044/1/77482; 2020.

[37] Roser Max, Ritchie Hannah, Ortiz-Opisio Esteban, Hasell Joe. Coronavirus Pandemic (COVID-19). Published online at OurWorldInData.org. Retrieved from: https://ourworldindata.org/coronavirus; 2020. [Online Resource].

[38] Callaway E. Beyond omicron: what’s next for COVID’s viral evolution. Nature. 2021;600:204–7. https://doi.org/10.1038/d41586-021-03619-8.

[39] Emma Hodcroft et al. published online at CoVariants. Retrieved from: https://covariants.org/.

[40] Lilly JM, Olhede SC. Generalized Morse wavelets as a superfamily of analytic wavelets. IEEE Trans Signal Process. 2012;60(11):6036–41.

[41] Lilly JM. Element analysis: a wavelet-based method for analysing time-localized events in noisy time series. Proc Royal Soc A Math Phys Eng Sci. 2017;473(2200):20160776.

[42] Wang X, Washington D, Weber GF. Complex Systems Analysis Infoms on the Spread of Covid-19. bioRxiv, 2021. https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.01.06.425544.

[43] Rosenstein MT, Collins JJ, De Luca CJ. A practical method for calculating largest Lyapunov exponents from small data sets. Physica D. 1993;65(1–2):117–34.

[44] Gao J. Multiscale analysis of biological data by scale-dependent Lyapunov exponent. Front Physiol. 2012;2:110.

[45] Valenza G, Citi L, Barbieri R. Estimation of instantaneous complex dynamics through Lyapunov exponents: a study on heartbeat dynamics. PLoS One. 2014;9(8):e105622.

[46] Fang X, Wen J, Bonello B, Yin J, Yu D. Ultra-low and ultra-broad-band nonlinear acoustic metamaterials. Nat Commun. 2017;8(1):1–11. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-017-00671-9.

[47] Navarro-Urrios D, Capuj NE, Colombano MF, García PD, Sledzinska M, Alzina F, Sotomayor-Torres CM. Nonlinear dynamics and chaos in an optomechanical beam. Nat Commun. 2017;8(1):1–10.

[48] McCue Leigh, Treosh W, Armin. Use of Lyapunov exponents to predict chaotic vessel motions. Fluid Mech Appl. 2011;57:415–32. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-007-1482-3_23.

[49] Arroyo-Marioli F, Bullano F, Kucinskas S, Rondón-Moreno C. Tracking R of COVID-19: a new real-time estimation using the Kalman filter. PLoS One. 2021;16(1):e0244474.