Honax and Fake News by Saracen Syndicate and the Problems for National Cyber Security

Andre Tri Wibowo*
Indonesian Cybercrime Fighting Community
Komunitas Masyarakat Perangi Cybercrime Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia

ABSTRACT: Along with the times, information technology has taken an important role in society. Information technology not only has a positive impact but also has a negative impact, this is what then gives rise to an idiom that we often hear together, that information technology is like a double-edged knife. On the one hand, with the existence of information technology, it encourages demand for products. The technology itself, such as computers, modems, facilities to build internet networks and so on, then facilitates business transactions, especially financial businesses in addition to other businesses. But on the other hand, the use of information technology also invites crime. Cybercrime is a form of virtual crime by utilizing computer media that is connected to the internet and includes everything related to criminal acts.

KEYWORDS: Cybercrime, Hoax and Fake News, National Security, Cyber Security

Copyright © 2022 by Author(s). This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License. All writings published in this journal are personal views of the authors and do not represent the views of this journal and the author's affiliated institutions.

How to cite:
Wibowo, Andre Tri. "Hoax and Fake News by Saracen Syndicate and the Problems for National Cyber Security". Indonesian Journal of Counter Terrorism and National Security 1, No. 1 (January-June, 2022): 91-108. https://doi.org/10.15294/ijctns.v1i1.56732

* Corresponding author’s email: andretriwibowo@gmail.com
Submitted: 19/11/2021 Reviewed: 30/11/2021 Revised: 28/12/2021 Accepted: 15/01/2022
I. INTRODUCTION

Information and communication currently allow people to use the internet through personal computers (PCs) or other electronic media anywhere. These conveniences and benefits for humans have provided many conveniences and benefits for humans in their efforts to improve the welfare of mankind. Information and communication technology is currently used by individuals, corporations, governments, and community groups for various human activities, such as education, health, business, government, communication, entertainment, and others. This information and communication are also followed by negative impacts that threaten and endanger the social and economic development of mankind in the world, not only materially but also human lives, for example the threat of attacks on information and communication technology infrastructure facilities that are connected globally, which can harm no one else. only material but also human life.

The crimes that arise in the field of information technology, among others, are data manipulation, espionage, sabotage, provocation, money laundering, hacking, software theft and the most widespread hoax today.¹

According to the big Indonesian dictionary, "hoa" is 'fake news'. In the Oxford English dictionary, 'Hoax' is defined as 'malicious deception' or 'lies made with malicious intent', unfortunately, many social media users define 'Hoaxes' as 'news that I do not like. Hoaks

¹ Antony Lee, "Online Hoaxes, Existential Threat, and Internet Shutdown: A Case Study of Securitization Dynamics in Indonesia." Journal of Indonesian Social Sciences and Humanities 10, No. 1 (2020): 17-34; Aprinus Salam, "The Hoax Phenomenon in Indonesian Society: Observing Anti-Diversity Memes since 2014." Humaniora 30, No. 3 (2018).
or 'fake news' is not something new, and widely circulated, and has been in circulation since Gutenberg invented the printing press in 1439. Before the internet, hoaxes were even more dangerous than they are today because they are difficult to verify.²

CNN Indonesia even stated that the data presented by the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology stated that there were as many as 800,000 sites in Indonesia which were indicated as spreading fake news and hate speech. The Ministry of Communication and Informatics also during 2016 blocked 773 thousand hundred based on 10 groups. The ten groups include elements of pornography, SARA, fraud-illegal trade, drugs, gambling, radicalism, violence, children, internet security, and intellectual property rights, of which pornography is the most.³

With such facts, a legal instrument is needed that can regulate this, so that crimes that can harm humans can be avoided. Law is a component of a social system that is considered more effective in solving social problems in the form of crime in society. Changes in

---

² Muhammad Ridwan Siregar, and Vesa Yunita Puri. "Relevansi Hate Speech Atas Dasar Agama Melalui Internet Dengan Cyber Terrorism." Justitia et Pax 33, No. 2 (2017); Pratiwi Utami, "Hoax in modern politics: the meaning of hoax in Indonesian politics and democracy." Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik 22, No. 2 (2018): 85-97.
³ Aurellya Desita Ananda Putri, "Pertanggungjawaban Pidana Komunitas Penyebaran Berita Bermuatan Sara Melalui Media Sosial." Jurist-Diction 4, No. 2 (2021): 543-558; Febriansyah Febriansyah, and Nani Nurani Muksin. "Fenomena Media Sosial: Antara Hoax, Destruksi Demokrasi, dan Ancaman Disintegrasi Bangsa." Sebatik 24, No. 2 (2020): 193-200; Khaerudin Imawan, "Jurnalisme Data Resistensi Ruang Siberdi Era Post Truth." Jurnal Signal 6, No. 2 (2018): 237-258; Kuntarto Kuntarto, Rindha Widyaningseh, and Muhamad Riza Chamadi. "The Hoax of SARA (Tribe, Religion, Race, and Intergroup) as a Threat to the Ideology of Pancasila Resilience." Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun 9, No. 2 (2021): 413-434.
society can trigger changes in crime which in fact follow the
development of the community. Laws or rules made by humans, or
an area are strongly influenced by local habits, norms, and values that
live in the community itself. with other members of the community
in one norm guaranteeing normative life values.

The existence of law in society, among others, is to regulate the
interests that arise in society, where these interests can conflict with
each other. For this reason, the law regulates in such a way that in a
traffic, interests do not conflict with each other. The law protects a
person by assigning a power to him to act in the context of his
interests. The allocation of this power is carried out in a measurable
manner in the sense that it is determined by law. Such power is
referred to as a right. However, not every power in society can be
called a right but rather only certain powers, namely those given by
law to a person, this is what is then called legal rights.4

The public international legal instrument that regulates cyber crime
issues that currently receive the most attention is the 2001 Convention
on Cyber Crime, which was initiated by the European Union.
Although this convention was originally made by European regional
organizations, in its development it is possible to be ratified and
accessed by any country in the world that is committed to efforts to
overcome cyber crime. From cyber crime, either through law or
international cooperation.5

---

4 Fairuz Rhamdatul Muthia, and Ridwan Arifin. "Kajian Hukum Pidana Pada Kasus Kejahatan Mayantara (Cybercrime) dalam Perkara Pencemaran Nama Baik di Indonesia." RESAM Jurnal Hukum 5, No. 1 (2019): 21-39.

5 Ana I. Cerezo, Javier Lopez, and Ahmed Patel. "International cooperation to fight transnational cybercrime." Second International Workshop on Digital Forensics and Incident Analysis (WDFIA 2007). IEEE, 2007; Peter Grabosky, "The global dimension of cybercrime." Global Crime 6, No. 1 (2004): 146-157; Olena
II. METHODS

This research is normative juridical research. Sampling was carried out not on people but on library materials, especially those related to information regulations and electronic transactions. The data used is secondary data. Secondary data sourced from library materials, and legal materials. Method of Data Collection by means of identification. How to identify by collecting library data in the form of archives, official documents, other library data that are closely related to research problems. Library data (secondary data) were analyzed using a combination of deductive and inductive thinking patterns. The results of data processing are qualitatively analyzed, then analyzed using normative qualitative methods, interpretation methods in legal science, and interpreting data based on theories as mentioned in the literature review.

III. CYBERCRIMES IN HISTORICAL, SOCIAL & LEGAL PERSPECTIVE: INDONESIA & GLOBAL EXPERIENCE

Research on forms of cybercrime has been carried out by Stenford Research International (SRI) in the United States from 1971 to 1985. The research found 1600 cases that occurred since 1958, as well as public and government reactions to them, including settlements based on civil law. In 1979 SRI obtain more valid data, which states that of the 244 cases that occurred, 191 could be brought to court and the defendants from 161 cases could be convicted. The studies conducted in the 1970s were not able to clearly show the arrangements in criminal law, so they have not been included. into

V. Sviatun, et al. "Combating cybercrime: economic and legal aspects." WSEAS Transactions on Business and Economics 18 (2021): 751-762.
criminal statistics Several forms of cyber crime in the United States attracted public attention between 1974 and 1988.6

1. 1974
   A number of Brooklyn College New York students illegally accessed computer data to the academy’s registration section, then changed it to their own and their friends' list of academic achievements online. After an investigation was conducted, it was proven that 12 students had committed the act.

2. 1977
   Two employees of the computer programming department in a company used the company's computer illegally for 3 years. The computer was used to meet the needs of other companies founded by criminals.

3. 1986
   Three children have been detained by US police for allegedly destroying credit card company TRW security systems and copying other people's credit card numbers and spending USD 10,000

4. 1988
   A student managed to enter the internet worm virus in the internet system which caused disturbances to 6000 internet systems.

---

6 See also Abraham D. Sofaer, et al. A proposal for an international convention on cyber crime and terrorism. Stanford University, Center for International Security and Cooperation, 2000; Donn B. Parker, "The dark side of computing: SRI International and the study of computer crime." IEEE Annals of the History of Computing 29, No. 1 (2007): 3-15; Stein Schjolberg, "The history of global harmonization on cybercrime legislation—the road to geneva." Journal of International Commercial Law and Technology 1, No. 12 (2008): 1-19.
Based on a court decision, cyber crime has occurred in Indonesia since 1983, namely in the case of the burglary of the Bank Rakyat Indonesia (BRI) branch of Brigadier General Katamso Yogyakarta, in 1986 there was a burglary of Bank Negara Indonesia (BNI) by using computer facilities. In 1898 there was a bank burglary. Bali with the suspect Budiman Hidayat, in 1990 Cybercrime occurred in Bandung, namely the unauthorized copying of the Word Star program version 5.0 In the following year, there were many cyber crimes such as cracking, credit card counterfeiting, bank break-ins, pornography, including abuse of dominant names, the most prevalent nowadays are hoaxes and hate speech.

At first, Cybercrime was defined as a computer crime, regarding the definition of computer crime itself until now scholars have not agreed on the meaning or definition of computer crime. Even the use of the term criminal offense for computer crime in English is still not uniform. The law commission in England, defines "computer fraud" as computer manipulation in any way carried out in bad faith to obtain money, goods and other benefits or is intended to cause harm to other parties.

At first, legal experts focused on tools/hardware, namely computers. However, with the development of information technology in the form of internet networks, the focus of identification on the definition of cybercrime was further expanded, namely as wide as activities that can be carried out in the cyber/virtual world through the information system used. So, it is not just the hardware component that the crime is defined as cyber crime but has been expanded in the scope of the world explored by the information technology system concerned. So it would be more appropriate if the meaning of cybercrime is
Information Technology crime, as well as what Barda Nawawi Arief said as cyber crime.

Based on several sources and practices, cybercrime has several characteristics, namely:

1. The act that is carried out is not in accordance with the law and, without rights or is unethical, occurs in the cyber/cyberspace/territory, so it cannot be ascertained which country’s jurisdiction applies to it.
2. Manufacture is done using equipment that is connected to the internet.
3. The act resulted in material loss or not and tended to be greater than conventional crimes
4. Perpetrators are people who understand the use of the internet and its applications
5. These acts are often carried out transnationally/across national borders.

Hoax is an attempt to deceive or trick the reader/hearer into believing something, even though the creator of the fake news knows that the news is fake. One of the most common examples of fake news is claiming an item or event with a different name from the actual item/event. The definition states Hoax is a hoax used to believe something that is wrong and often unreasonable through online media. Hoax aims to create public opinion, lead public opinion, shape perceptions also just for fun. The purposes of spreading Hoaxes vary widely but generally speaking, these lies are distributed as jokes or just to play, bring down competitors, fraudulent promotions, or invitations to do good deeds that have no clear argument in them. People are more likely to believe in hoaxes if the information matches
their opinion or attitude. Furthermore, types of hoax information as follows:

1. **Fake news**
   News that tries to replace the original news, this news aims to falsify or include untruths in some news. Fake news writers usually add things that are not true and conspiracy theories, the more bizarre, the better. Fake news is not a humorous comment against some news.\(^7\)

2. **Clickbait**
   Links strategically placed on a site with the aim of attracting people to other sites. The content in these links is factual, but the title is exaggerated or has interesting images attached to lure readers.\(^8\)

3. **Confirmation bias**
   The tendency to interpret recent events as well as evidence as a pre-existing belief.

4. **Misinformation**
   False or inaccurate information, especially those intended to deceive.

---

\(^7\) Gordon Pennycook, and David G. Rand. "The psychology of fake news." *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 25, No. 5 (2021): 388-402; Jonathan Albright. "Welcome to the era of fake news." *Media and Communication* 5, No. 2 (2017): 87-89.

\(^8\) Martin Potthast, et al. "Clickbait detection", in *European Conference on Information Retrieval*. (Chamb: Springer, 2016).
5. Satire
An article that uses humor, irony, exaggeration to comment on current events. Satirical news can be found on television shows such as "Saturday Night Live" and "This Hour has 22 Minutes".

6. Post Truth
Events where emotions play a role more than facts to shape public opinion.

7. Propaganda
Activities spreading information, facts, arguments, half-truth gossip, or even lies to influence public opinion.

So, how hoaxes work? According to a psychologist's point of view, there are two things that make a person believe easily against fake news, people tend to believe lies if their information is what they believe various conspiracy theories about satellite photos, then that person will believe because it's a flat earth follower, so tend not to care whether the information he receives is correct or just inventive information. This is then exacerbated if the hoax advocate has poor knowledge of using the internet and cannot learn what he or she can.

IV. THE SARACEN SYNDICATE AS A MEDIA FOR SPREADING HOAXES & ENFORCEMENT OF THE LAW IN INDONESIA

Saracen is a special syndicate that has recently shocked the public, this is because Saracen is one of the syndicates that run a hate speech
'business' by accepting orders from various parties, the order value starts from Rp. 75 million to Rp. 100 million. These called themselves the Saracens, the name for adherents of Islam in the Middle Ages.

Recorded in the Encyclopedia Britannica, Saracen is a term for Muslims, both Arabs and Turks who live on the Sinai Peninsula, the term Saracen was then used to refer to all Arabs in the following centuries. And, after the formation of the caliphate. Byzantium called all Muslims caliphs as the Saracens. Through the Byzantines and the crusaders, the name spread to western Europe and persisted into modern times.

The discovery of the Saracen network is considered a serious cyber threat. The reason is the Saracen group is suspected of not only attacking one religion but attacking various parties including the government with fighting techniques. The development of cyber crimes that have occurred today has received reactions from countries in the world both nationally, regionally, and internationally, with various policies using criminal law. The state's reaction to the development of cyber crimes is a consequence of the sovereignty of a country.  

In Indonesia, regulations regarding cyber crime, especially in cases of hoaxes and hate speech, are regulated in such a way with various rules, for example with the Criminal Code, then Law No. 11 of 2008

---

11 Muhamad Tarmiji, "Strategi Komunikasi Polres Metro Jakarta Pusat dalam Kampanye Anti Hoax (Studi Kasus Sindikat Saracen)". *Dissertation* (Jakarta: Universitas Bakrie, 2018); Yunita Rahayu Kurniawati, "Pertanggungjawaban Pidana Atas Penyebaran Berita Bohong (Hoax) di Media Sosial." *Dinamika: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Hukum* 26, No. 4 (2020): 422-437; M. Ravii Marwan, and A. Ahyad. "Analisis penyebaran berita hoax di Indonesia." *Jurusan Ilmu Komunikasi, Fakultas Ilmu Komunikasi Universitas Gunadarma* 5, No. 1 (2016): 1-16.
concerning Information and Electronic Transactions, along with Law No. 40 2008 on the Elimination of Race and Ethnic Discrimination.

In Law No. 11 of 2008 concerning Electronic Information and Transactions, namely article 27 paragraph (3), it is regulated about the prohibition of someone from spreading electronic information without knowledge and containing forms of insults and defamation, while the article reads: Everyone intentionally and without the right to distribute and/or transmit and/or make accessible electronic information and/or electronic documents containing insults and/or defamation.

The National Police has also disseminated Circular Letter Number SE/06/X/2015 to all members of the National Police regarding the Handling of Hate Speech with the aim that Polri members understand and know the forms of hate speech in various media and how to handle it. This circular letter of the Chief of Police refers to several laws, including; the Criminal Code (KUHP), Law No. 39 of 1999 concerning Human Rights, Law No. 2 of 2002 concerning the National Police, Law No. 12 of 2008 concerning the Ratification of the International Convention on Civil and Political Rights, Law No. 11 of 2008 concerning Information and Electronic Transactions, Law No. 40 of 2008 concerning the Elimination of Racial and Ethnic Discrimination, as well as Law No. 7 of 2012 concerning Handling Social Conflict. Number 2 letter (f) Circular Letter of the Chief of Police Number SE/06/X/2015 states that: hate speech can be in the form of criminal acts as regulated in the Criminal Code (KUHP) and other criminal provisions outside the Criminal Code, which include:

1. Humiliation;
2. Defamation;
3. Blasphemy;
4. Unpleasant conduct;
5. Provoking;
6. Incite; and
7. Spreading fake news and all of the above actions have a purpose or can have an impact on acts of discrimination, violence, disappearance of life, and / or social conflict.

Furthermore, in letter (g) Circular Letter Number SE/06/X/2015 it is stated: Hate speech as referred to above, aims to incite and incite hatred against individuals and/or groups of people, in different communities distinguished from:

1. Tribe;
2. Religion;
3. Religious sects;
4. Belief or belief;
5. Race;
6. Between classes;
7. Skin color;
8. Ethnicity;
9. Gender;
10. Disabled people; and
11. Sexual orientation.

In letter (h) Circular Letter Number SE / 06 / X / 2015 it is stated that: Hate speech as mentioned above can be done through various media, including:

1. In campaign activities orations;
2. Banners or banners;
3. Social media networks;
4. Public opinion submission (demonstration);
5. Religious lectures;
6. Print or electronic media;
7. Pamphlets in the territory of Indonesia.

As for now, articles that are quite effective in preventing the emergence of Hoax and hate speech crimes are articles 27, 28, and 29 of the ITE Law, although many also regret the existence of this article due to its rubbery nature, until 2015 this article 134 victims have been ensnared. Of the 134 cases, only 20 have been processed and the rest of the status is still unclear. This victim has increased significantly since 2013 with the number of victims as many as 20 people with the largest percentage being a violation of Article 27 paragraph 3 of the ITE Law.

Furthermore, how to overcome hoax news? Because the spread of hoaxes is increasingly massive and out of control, an effort is needed to dispel the hoax news, as for steps that can be taken to assist in identifying which news is hoax and which news is genuine.

1. Be careful with provocative titles

   Hoax news often uses provocative sensational titles, for example by directly pointing the finger at a certain party, the contents can also be taken from official media news, but they are changed to create the perception that the hoax maker wants. Therefore, if you encounter news with provocative titles, you should look for references in the form of similar news from official online sites, then compare the contents, whether they are the same or different. Thus, at least we as readers can get a more balanced conclusion.

2. Pay attention to the site address

   For information obtained from the website or include a link, pay attention to the URL address of the site in question. If it comes from a site that has not been verified as an official press institution, for example using a blog domain, then the information can be
considered dubious. Because according to the records of the Press Council, there are around 43,000 sites in Indonesia in Indonesia which claims to be a news portal. Of these, less than 300 have been verified as official news sites. This means that there are at least tens of thousands of sites that have the potential to spread fake news on the internet that must be watched out for.

3. Fact checks
Pay attention to where the news comes from and who the source is, whether from official institutions such as the KPK or the Police. Pay attention to the balance of news sources, if there is only one source, the reader does not get the complete picture. Another thing that needs to be observed is the difference between news made based on facts and opinions. Facts are events that occur with testimony and evidence, while opinions are the opinions and impressions of news writers so that they have a tendency to be subjective.

4. Photo authenticity
In the current era of digital technology, not only content in the form of photos or videos, there are times when fake news makers also edit photos to provoke readers.

5. Join an anti-hoax discussion group
On Facebook, there are several anti-hoaxes fanpages and discussion groups, such as the Anti-Slander, Incitement and Hoaks Forum, the Indonesian Hoaccess Fanspage, and the Lifeboat Group. In such groups, netizens can participate in selecting which news is classified as hoaxes or not.12

---

12 Bonardo Marulitua Aritonang, "Grup Facebook Hits from the 80’s & 90’s Sebagai Ruang Publik Menangkis Hoax dan Hatespeech." *Cakrawala Jurnal Penelitian Sosial* 7, No. 2 (2018): 179-204.
V. CONCLUSION

The development of information technology has changed all patterns of communication and social order so that it becomes a new forum for people to express their opinions and expressions. On the one hand, this development is very useful because it can make it easier for people to communicate, but on the other hand this development can also trigger the emergence of new problems, namely Hoaks and hate speech. People are very easy to spread information that is not clear, and the truth is conveyed hate speech. With the existence of a good media literacy campaign and law enforcement through the law on information and electronic transactions, it is hoped that the spread of hoaxes and hate speech crimes can be reduced, and the use of information technology can be wiser.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

None.

COMPETING INTERESTS

The Authors declared that they have no competing interests.

REFERENCES

Albright, Jonathan. "Welcome to the era of fake news." Media and Communication 5, No. 2 (2017): 87-89.
Aritonang, Bonardo Marulitua. "Grup Facebook Hits from the 80's & 90's Sebagai Ruang Publik Menangkis Hoax dan Hatespeech." Cakrawala Jurnal Penelitian Sosial 7, No. 2 (2018): 179-204.
Cerezo, Ana I., Javier Lopez, and Ahmed Patel. "International cooperation to fight transnational cybercrime." *Second International Workshop on Digital Forensics and Incident Analysis (WDFIA 2007).* IEEE, 2007.

Febriansyah, Febriansyah, and Nani Nurani Muksin. "Fenomena Media Sosial: Antara Hoax, Destruksi Demokrasi, dan Ancaman Disintegrasi Bangsa." *Sebatik* 24, No. 2 (2020): 193-200.

Grabosky, Peter. "The global dimension of cybercrime." *Global Crime* 6, No. 1 (2004): 146-157.

Imawan, Khaerudin. "Jurnalisme Data Resistensi Ruang Siberdi Era Post Truth." *Jurnal Signal* 6, No. 2 (2018): 237-258.

Jones, Jeffrey P., and Geoffrey Baym. "A dialogue on satire news and the crisis of truth in postmodern political television." *Journal of Communication Inquiry* 34, No. 3 (2010): 278-294.

Kuntarto, Kuntarto, Rindha Widyaningsih, and Muhamad Riza Chamadi. "The Hoax of SARA (Tribe, Religion, Race, and Intergroup) as a Threat to the Ideology of Pancasila Resilience." *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun* 9, No. 2 (2021): 413-434.

Kurniawati, Yunita Rahayu. "PertanggungJawaban Pidana Atas Penyebaran Berita Bohong (Hoax) di Media Sosial." *Dinamika: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Hukum* 26, No. 4 (2020): 422-437.

Lee, Antony. "Online Hoaxes, Existential Threat, and Internet Shutdown: A Case Study of Securitization Dynamics in Indonesia." *Journal of Indonesian Social Sciences and Humanities* 10, No. 1 (2020): 17-34.

Marwan, M. Ravii, and A. Ahyad. "Analisis penyebaran berita hoax di Indonesia." *Jurusan Ilmu Komunikasi, Fakultas Ilmu Komunikasi Universitas Gunadarma* 5, No. 1 (2016): 1-16.

Mudawamah, Nita S. "Membekali Diri untuk Menghadapi Fenomena Post-truth." *IJAL (Indonesian Journal of Academic Librarianship)* 1, No. 3 (2018): 21-28.

Muthia, Fairuz Rhamdhatul, and Ridwan Arifin. "Kajian Hukum Pidana Pada Kasus Kejahatan Mayantara (Cybercrime) dalam
Perkara Pencemaran Nama Baik di Indonesia." RESAM Jurnal Hukum 5, No. 1 (2019): 21-39.

Parker, Donn B. "The dark side of computing: SRI International and the study of computer crime." IEEE Annals of the History of Computing 29, No. 1 (2007): 3-15.

Pennycook, Gordon, and David G. Rand. "The psychology of fake news." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 25, No. 5 (2021): 388-402.

Potthast, Martin, et al. "Clickbait detection", in European Conference on Information Retrieval. (Chamb: Springer, 2016).

Putri, Aurellya Desita Ananda. "Pertanggungjawaban Pidana Komunitas Penyebaran Berita Bermuatan Sara Melalui Media Sosial." Jurist-Diction 4, No. 2 (2021): 543-558.

Salam, Aprinus. "The Hoax Phenomenon in Indonesian Society: Observing Anti-Diversity Memes since 2014." Humaniora 30, No. 3 (2018).

Schjolberg, Stein. "The history of global harmonization on cybercrime legislation—the road to geneva." Journal of International Commercial Law and Technology 1, No. 12 (2008): 1-19.

Siregar, Muhammad Ridwan, and Vesa Yunita Puri. "Relevansi Hate Speech Atas Dasar Agama Melalui Internet Dengan Cyber Terrorism." Justitia et Pax 33, No. 2 (2017).

Sofaer, Abraham D., et al. A proposal for an international convention on cyber crime and terrorism. (Stanford University, Center for International Security and Cooperation, 2000).

Sviatun, Olena V., et al. "Combating cybercrime: economic and legal aspects." WSEAS Transactions on Business and Economics 18 (2021): 751-762.

Tarmiji, Muhamad, "Strategi Komunikasi Polres Metro Jakarta Pusat dalam Kampanye Anti Hoax (Studi Kasus Sindikat Saracen)". Dissertation (Jakarta: Universitas Bakrie, 2018).

Utami, Pratiwi. "Hoax in modern politics: the meaning of hoax in Indonesian politics and democracy." Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik 22, No. 2 (2018): 85-97.