Tumor Necrosis Factor α Cooperates with Interleukin 3 in the Recruitment of a Primitive Subset of Human CD34⁺ Progenitors
By Christophe Caux, Isabelle Durand, Isabelle Moreau, Valérie Duvert, Sem Saeland, and Jacques Banchereau

From the Laboratory for Immunological Research, Schering-Plough, 69572 Dardilly, France

Summary
We have recently demonstrated that tumor necrosis factor α (TNF-α) potentiates interleukin 3 (IL-3)- and granulocyte/macrophage colony-stimulating factor-induced growth of CD34⁺ hematopoietic progenitor cells (HPC), and favors the generation of dendritic/Langerhans cells. The stimulatory effect of TNF-α was detailed in the present study. Thus, CD34⁺ HPC were divided in cycle (S/G2M) after a 48-h pulse with IL-3 expressed the transferrin receptor (TfR), and fluorescence-activated cell sorter-separated TfR⁺ HPC, but not TfR⁻ HPC, showed a high proliferative response to IL-3. In contrast, TfR⁻ HPC were found to undergo strong proliferation in response to IL-3 + TNF-α. Limiting dilution experiments indicated that TNF-α increased both the frequency and the average size of clones generated from TfR⁻ HPC as a result of the development of a higher number of large clones. In contrast, TNF-α did not enhance the IL-3-dependent proliferation of TfR⁺ HPC. Preculturing CD34⁺ HPC for 48 h with TNF-α enhanced the subsequent generation of IL-3-dependent colony-forming units. Precultures with TNF-α or cultures with suboptimal doses of TNF-α allowed the recruitment of cells with both granulocytic and monocytic differentiation potential. Taken together, our results indicate that TNF-α recruits a subpopulation of CD34⁺ HPC hyposensitive to IL-3, with high proliferative capacity and some features of multipotential progenitors, that are likely to be more primitive than those responding to IL-3 alone.

Models of in vitro hematopoiesis have revealed that regulation of development of human hematopoietic progenitor cells (HPC) depends upon so-called "growth stimulatory molecules" such as IL-3, GM-CSF, G-CSF, M-CSF, and stem cell factor, and so-called "growth inhibitory molecules" such as IFN, TGF-β, and TNF (1, 2). However, recent studies have shown that this concept of positive and negative regulators of myelopoiesis needs to be modulated. For instance, IFN-γ has recently been described to potentiate IL-3 and GM-CSF development of normal HPC (3, 4). Also, TGF-β has been shown to enhance the effects of GM-CSF on murine neutrophil (5) and macrophage (6) development. Moreover, we and others have demonstrated that TNF-α and -β stimulate IL-3- and GM-CSF-dependent proliferation of normal human CD34⁺ HPC (7, 8) and murine early progenitors (2).

We have recently described that the potentiating effect of TNF-α on early myelopoiesis was followed by an induction of the generation of dendritic/Langerhans cells (9) and an inhibition of erythroid and granulopoietic development (10). The present study was designed to further elucidate the mechanisms of the stimulatory effects of TNF-α on early myelopoiesis. It is shown that TNF-α potentiates early myelopoiesis through the recruitment of a population of cells hyposensitive to IL-3 alone. The recruited progenitors display a high proliferative potential and likely represent a population more primitive than that responding to IL-3.

Materials and Methods
Collection and Purification of Cord Blood HPC. Umbilical cord blood samples were obtained according to institutional guidelines. Cells bearing CD34 antigen were isolated from nonadherent mononuclear fractions through positive selection by indirect immune "panning" using anti-My10 mAb (HPCA-1; Becton Dickinson & Co., Mountain View, CA), as reported elsewhere (11). A second purification step was performed using a cocktail of mAbs and magnetic beads (Dynabeads M450; Dynal, Oslo, Norway), as described (7). Thus, in all experiments the isolated cells were 95–99% CD34⁺.

Cell Cultures in Liquid Medium. Cells were precultured for 48 h either with 10 ng/ml IL-3 (sp act, 5 × 10⁶ U/mg; Schering-Plough Research Institute, Kenilworth, NJ) before FACS® sorting (Becton Dickinson & Co.) according to transferrin receptor (TfR) expression, or with 25 ng/ml TNF-α (sp act, 2 × 10⁷ U/mg; Genzyme Corp., Cambridge, MA) for preincubation experiments. The medium consisted of RPMI 1640 (Gibco Laboratories, Grand Island, NY) supplemented with 10% (vol/vol) heat-inactivated FCS.
(Flow Laboratories, Irvine, UK), 10 mM Hapes, 2 mM L-glutamine, 5 x 10^-5 M 2-ME, 100 U/ml penicillin, and 100 μg/ml streptomycin (referred to as complete medium). For initiation of clonogenic assays after preincubation with cytokines, cells were washed four times, further incubated for 3 h (37°C) in complete medium, and washed again to eliminate the pulsing cytokine.

**Progenitor Assays in Semisolid Medium.** Semisolid cultures of 1 ml were performed in methylcellulose by plating 10^5 cells per tissue culture-grade 35-mm petri dish (Corning Glass Works, Corning, NY), without erythropoietin (Epo), as previously described in detail (11). Duplicate dishes were plated in each experiment, and after 7 and 14 d (37°C, 5% CO2), colonies (>50 cells) were counted using phase-contrast microscopy.

**Limiting Dilution Studies.** Limiting dilution was performed at one cell per well in 96-well round-bottomed microtest tissue culture plates (Nunc, Roskilde, Denmark), as previously described (7), in IMDM containing 30% FCS, 10^-4 M 2-ME, 0.5% (wt/vol) BSA, and L-glutamine and antibiotics as indicated above. Each factor was tested in 540-2,000 wells. After 6 d of culture, positive wells were scored and the number of cells in each clone was determined. Clone frequency was determined as the log of the fraction of nonresponding wells, and average clone size was calculated as: the ratio of total cell number enumerated in the wells seeded/number of responding cells present in the wells observed. In some experiments, cultures were prolonged until day 20 and cells from individual clones ranging from 2,000 to 8,000 cells were processed for double-color fluorescence analysis (CD14 and CD15). The frequency of such clones was between 2 and 4% of total cells, and thus the probability that observed clones may derive from more than one cell was not significant.

**Flow Cytometry Analysis and Cell Sorting.** For cell surface phenotyping, double-color fluorescence was performed according to standard direct immunofluorescence techniques using FITC-conjugated anti-Leu-M1 (CD15) and PE-conjugated anti-Leu-M3 (CD14) (Becton Dickinson & Co.). Negative controls were performed with unrelated murine mAbs. Fluorescence analysis was determined with a FACScan® (Becton Dickinson & Co.). For cell cycle analysis, cells were incubated for 48-72 h in the presence of 10 ng/ml IL-3, and 0.1 μg/ml colcemid (Gibco Laboratories) was added during the last 16 h. Cells were subsequently processed for membrane fluorescence and permeabilized (15 min) in 70% methanol. After washes, cells were incubated 15 min at 37°C with 2,000 U/ml ribonuclease A (sp act, 4,000 U/mg; Worthington Biochem. Corp., Freehold, NJ). 2 μg/ml propidium iodide (Sigma Chemical Co., St. Louis, MO) was added and cell surface Ag expression and DNA content were analyzed with a FACScan®.

For cell sorting, after 48 h of preincubation in IL-3 (10 ng/ml), cells were collected, washed several times, and labeled with FITC-conjugated anti-TfR (CD71) (Becton Dickinson & Co.). Using a FACStar Plus® (Becton Dickinson & Co.), the cells were separated according to TfR expression into a TfR+ fraction and a TfR- fraction. Reanalysis of the sorted populations showed a purity >97%.

**Results**

**TNF-α Recruits a Subset of CD34+ HPC with High Proliferative Capacity, but Hyporesponsiveness to IL-3 Alone.** We have previously shown that TNF-α stimulates early myelopoiesis through an enhancement of both the frequency and clone size of the responding CD34+ HPC (7). Here we ques-

**Table 1. CD34+ Tfr- Cells Generate Day 7 CFU in Response to IL-3 + TNF-α**

| Exp. | IL-3 | IL-3 + TNF-α | IL-3 | IL-3 + TNF-α |
|------|------|--------------|------|--------------|
| 1    | 37   | 36           | 16   | 70           |
|      | 36   | 35           | 17   | 75           |
| 2    | 45   | 40           | 12   | 100          |
|      | 55   | 32           | 11   | 109          |
| 3    | 38   | 35           | 13   | 82           |
|      | 40   | 33           | 10   | 92           |

CD34+ HPC were FACScan®-sorted according to TfR expression after a 48-h preincubation in IL-3 (10 ng/ml) and assessed for their clonogenic capacity. Duplicate dishes, plated with 10^5 cells in presence of IL-3 (10 ng/ml) or IL-3 + TNF-α (25 ng/ml), were scored for numbers of colonies on day 7 (colonies >50 cells). Values are from three unrelated experiments.
were seeded for each culture condition. After 7 d of culture, done size in the presence of IL-3 (10 ng/ml) or Ib3 + TNF-α (25 ng/ml). 540 wells was determined, by numeration, using an inverted microscope coupled to an image analyzer. TNF-α or medium alone did not induce the development of any clones. The clones were classified according to number of cells per clone. Numbers plotted correspond to the mean of triplicates of three.

Average clone sizes (cells/clone) were 84 for 11:3 and 148 for 11:3 + TNF-α. Data from one experiment representative of three.

Figure 2. TNF-α recruits a population of cells with high proliferative capacity. After 48 h of preincubation in IL-3, and subsequent FACSS®-sorting according to TfR expression, CD34+ HPC were cultured at one cell/well in the presence of IL-3 (10 ng/ml) or IL-3 + TNF-α (25 ng/ml). 540 wells were seeded for each culture condition. After 7 d of culture, clone size was determined, by enumeration, using an inverted microscope coupled to an image analyzer. TNF-α or medium alone did not induce the development of any clones. The clones were classified according to number of cells per clone. Numbers plotted correspond to the mean of triplicates of 180 wells observed. Clone frequency and average clone size were determined as described in Material and Methods. (TfR +) Clone frequencies were 36.0% for IL-3 and 38.7% for IL-3 + TNF-α; average clone sizes (cells/clone) were 102 for IL-3 and 94 for IL-3 + TNF-α. (TfR -) Clone frequencies were 13.6% for IL-3 and 44.8% for IL-3 + TNF-α; average clone sizes (cells/clone) were 84 for IL-3 and 148 for IL-3 + TNF-α. Data are from one experiment representative of three.

A TNF-α Pulse Is Sufficient to Enhance the Proliferative Response to IL-3. As the potentiating effect of TNF-α reflects the recruitment of an IL-3-hyporesponsive population, we wondered whether the presence of TNF-α would be required during the whole course of proliferation or at the initiation of the process. Thus, CD34+ HPC were precultured in the presence of TNF-α or medium alone, and, after extensive washes, tested for their proliferative response to IL-3, as determined by [3H]Tdr uptake and enumeration of day 7 CFU. Kinetics experiments, performed by [3H]Tdr uptake, indicated that a 48-h pulse in TNF-α was sufficient to allow subsequent levels of IL-3-dependent proliferation identical to those obtained when cells were continuously cultured with IL-3+TNF-α (not shown). This enhanced DNA replication was confirmed by enumeration of day 7 colonies. As shown in Fig. 3 A, cells pulsed with TNF-α and subsequently cultured in IL-3 generated virtually as many day 7 CFU as cells incubated in IL-3+TNF-α during the whole culture period. In addition, only TfR- cells were sensitive to the enhancing effect of TNF-α preincubation (not shown). Taken together, these results demonstrate that, to permit recruitment of the IL-3-hyporesponsive population, TNF-α is required only at the initiation of the proliferative process.

TNF-α Recruits a Population of Cells with Both Monocytic and Granulocytic Differentiation Potential. We have recently shown that early potentiation of myelopoiesis by TNF-α is
followed by an inhibition of the development of granulopoietic cells (10), a phenomenon that interferes with the characterization of the progenitors initially recruited. Thus, we studied whether pulsing cells with TNF-α for 48 h would prevent this late inhibition of granulopoiesis. As described above, IL-3-dependent generation of day 7 colonies was equally enhanced by a 48-h pulse or a 7-d TNF-α coculture (Fig. 3 A). However, when CD34+ HPC were plated for 14 d, the IL-3 response differed strikingly between cells cultured with TNF-α for 14 d and those pulsed with TNF-α for only 48 h. Thus, preincubation in TNF-α enhanced total CFU numbers by 41% (Fig. 3 B) as a consequence of a 30 and 48% increase of CFU-G (Fig. 3 C) and CFU-M (Fig. 3 D), respectively. In contrast, the continuous presence of TNF-α resulted in a 23% inhibition of total CFU numbers (Fig. 3 B), mostly as a result of a 46% inhibition of the CFU-G numbers (Fig. 3 C) (10).

Interestingly, a low concentration of TNF-α (1.25 ng/ml) was able to provide virtually all the potentiating effect of TNF-α observed after 7 d of culture, without demonstrating inhibitory effects on day 14 CFU-G and CFU-M (not shown). This lack of inhibitory effects of low concentrations of TNF-α allowed us to study the effects of TNF-α on CFU-GM generation. Thus, CD34+ HPC were seeded at one cell per well in the presence of IL-3 with or without 1.25 ng/ml TNF-α, and after 20 d of culture large clones (2,000–8,000 cells/clone) were selected and analyzed by double-color fluorescence for expression of CD14 (monocytic cells) and CD15 (granulocytic cells). Fig. 4 shows FACS® profile examples of clones lacking both CD14+ and CD15+ cells (undefined CFU; Fig. 4 A); clones containing only CD14+ cells (CFU-M; Fig. 4 B); clones containing only CD15+ cells (CFU-G; Fig. 4 C); and clones containing CD14+ as well as CD15+ cells (CFU-GM; Fig. 4 D).

Table 2. TNF-α Recruits a Population of Cells with Both Monocytic and Granulocytic Differentiation Potential

|             | CD14+CD15− clones (undetermined CFU) | CD14+CD15+ clones (CFU-G) | CD14+CD15− clones (CFU-M) | CD14+CD15+ clones (CFU-GM) |
|-------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------|
| IL-3        | 15.4 (11.5–22.3)                     | 61.6 (54.5–75.0)         | 12.1 (10.0–15.3)         | 9.4 (2.5–13.7)            |
| IL-3 + TNF-α| 12.0 (6.7–21.0)                      | 30.6 (27.9–34.2)         | 10.0 (6.8–12.5)          | 47.5 (32.3–55.6)          |

CD34+ HPC were seeded at one cell per well (2,000 wells seeded per each culture condition) in the presence of IL-3 (10 ng/ml) with or without low concentration of TNF-α (1.25 ng/ml). After 20 d of culture, large clones (2,000–8,000 cells/clone) were selected and analyzed by double-color fluorescence for expression of CD14 (monocytic cells) and CD15 (granulocytic cells). Data represent mean and range (in parentheses) from three unrelated experiments and are expressed as percentage of total analyzed clones (40–50 per each culture condition for each experiment).
References

1. Metcalf, D. 1991. Control of granulocytes and macrophages: molecular, cellular, and clinical aspects. Science (Wash. DC). 254:529.

2. Moore, M.A.S. 1991. Clinical implications of positive and negative hematopoietic stem cell regulators. Blood. 78:1.

3. Caux, C., I. Moreau, S. Saeland, and J. Banchereau. 1992. Interferon-γ enhances factor dependent myeloid proliferation of human CD34⁺ hematopoietic progenitor cells. Blood. 79:2628.

4. Kawano, Y., Y. Takaue, A. Hirao, T. Abe, S.I. Saito, K. Matsunaga, T. Watanabe, M. Hirose, T. Ninomiya, Y. Kuroda, A. Yokobayashi, and S. Asano. 1991. Synergistic effect of recombinant interferon-γ and interleukin-3 on the growth of immature hematopoietic progenitors. Blood. 77:2118.

5. Keller, J.R., S.E.W. Jacobsen, K.T. Sill, L.R. Ellingsworth, and F.W. Ruscetti. 1991. Stimulation of granulopoiesis by transforming growth factor β: synergy with granulocyte/macrophage-colony-stimulating factor. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 88:7190.

6. Celada, A., and R.A. Maki. 1992. Transforming growth factor-β enhances the M-CSF and GM-CSF-stimulated proliferation of macrophages. J. Immunol. 148:1102.

7. Caux, C., S. Saeland, C. Favre, V. Duvert, P. Mannoni, and J. Banchereau. 1990. Tumor necrosis factor-alpha strongly potentiates interleukin-3 and granulocyte-macrophage colony-stimulating factor-induced proliferation of human CD34⁺ hematopoietic progenitor cells. Blood. 75:2292.

8. Backx, B., L. Broeders, F.J. Bot, and B. Lowenberg. 1991. Positive and negative effects of Tumor Necrosis Factor on colony growth from highly purified normal marrow progenitors.

granulocytic development (10). Here, we show, based on three observations, that the enhancing effect of TNF-α on early myelopoiesis is due to the recruitment of primitive hematopoietic progenitor cells hyporesponsive to IL-3. First, by separating IL-3-sensitive and IL-3-hyporesitive CD34⁺ HPC according to TfR expression, TNF-α was found to allow specifically the recruitment of TfR⁻ cells, which proliferate weakly in response to IL-3 alone. Second, preincubation experiments indicated that TNF-α is required only during the initiation of the proliferative process, thus demonstrating that TNF-α prepares cells to respond to IL-3. Third, morphologic and phenotypic characterization of clones generated in HPC according to TfR expression, TNF-α was found to allow the formation of relatively simple explanation for the induction by TNF-α of an enhanced proliferative response of HPC to IL-3 and GM-CSF. A recent study has also shown that TNF-α can upregulate the expression of IL-3 and GM-CSF receptors on murine progenitors (12). However, at variance with our studies showing a direct effect of TNF-α on single cells, this concurrent study argues for an indirect role of G-CSF, which is produced by low density bone marrow cells in response to TNF-α. These contrasting conclusions may derive from species (mouse vs. human) or culture condition differences. In conjunction with the known stimulatory effect of a single in vivo injection of TNF-α on hematopoiesis (23), in vitro studies advocate for considering therapeutic pulses of TNF-α to boost early hematopoiesis. Together with GM-CSF or IL-3, such a treatment may allow a more efficient recovery from therapy-induced aplasia.

We are grateful to N. Courbière and M. Vatan for editorial assistance; Dr. J. P. Favier, Prof. R. C. Rudi dez, Prof. J. M. Thoulon, and colleagues for providing umbilical cord blood samples; and Drs. P. Mannoni, J. A. Waitz, and J. Chiller for support and for critical reading of the manuscript.

Address correspondence to Christophe Caux, Laboratory for Immunological Research, Schering-Plough, 27 chemin des Peupliers, BP 11, 69572 Dardilly, France.

Received for publication 7 January 1993 and in revised form 19 March 1993.
9. Caux, C., C. Dezutter-Dambuyant, D. Schmitt, and J. Banchereau. 1992. GM-CSF and TNF-α cooperate in the generation of dendritic Langerhans cells. *Nature (Lond.)* 360:258.

10. Caux, C., C. Favre, S. Saeland, V. Duvert, I. Durand, P. Mannoni, and J. Banchereau. 1991. Potentiation of early hematopoiesis by Tumor Necrosis Factor-α is followed by inhibition of granulopoietic differentiation and proliferation. *Blood.* 78:635.

11. Saeland, S., C. Caux, C. Favre, J.P. Aubry, P. Mannoni, M.J. Pêbusque, O. Gentilhomme, T. Otsuka, T. Yokota, N. Arai, K. Arai, J. Banchereau, and J.E. de Vries. 1988. Effects of recombinant human interleukin-3 on CD34 enriched normal hematopoietic progenitors and on myeloblastic leukemia cells. *Blood.* 72:1580.

12. Jacobsen, S.E.W., F.W. Ruscetti, C.M. Dubois, and J.R. Keller. 1992. Tumor necrosis factor α directly and indirectly regulates hematopoietic progenitor cell proliferation: role of colony-stimulating factor receptor modulation. *J. Exp. Med.* 175:1759.

13. Reid, C.D.L., A. Stackpoole, A. Meager, and J. Tikerpae. 1992. Interactions of tumor necrosis factor with granulocyte-macrophage colony-stimulating factor and other cytokines in the regulation of dendritic cell growth in vitro from early bipotent CD34⁺ progenitors in human bone marrow. *J. Immunol.* 149:2681.

14. Broxmeyer, H.E., D.E. Williams, L. Lu, S. Cooper, S.L. Anderson, G.S. Beyer, R. Hoffman, and B.Y. Rubin. 1986. The suppressive influences of human tumor necrosis factors on bone marrow hematopoietic progenitor cells from normal donors and patients with leukemia: synergism of tumor necrosis factor and interferon-gamma. *J. Immunol.* 136:4487.

15. Peetre, C., U. Gullberg, E. Nilsson, and I. Olsson. 1986. Effects of recombinant tumor necrosis factor on proliferation and differentiation of leukemic and normal hematopoietic cells in vitro: relationship to cell surface receptor. *J. Clin. Invest.* 78:1694.

16. Rodman, G.D., A. Bird, D. Hutzler, and W. Montgomery. 1987. Tumor necrosis factor-alpha and hematopoietic progenitors: effects of tumor necrosis factor on the growth of erythroid progenitors CFU-E and BFU-E and the hematopoietic cell lines K562, HL60, and HEL cells. *Exp. Hematol.* 15:928.

17. Murphy, M., B. Perussia, and G. Trinchieri. 1988. Effects of recombinant tumor necrosis factor, lymphotakin, and immune interferon on proliferation and differentiation of enriched hematopoietic precursor cells. *Exp. Hematol.* 16:131.

18. Ogata, H., S. Taniguchi, M. Inaba, M. Sugawara, Y. Ohta, K. Inaba, K.J. Mori, and S. Ikemura. 1992. Separation of hematopoietic stem cells into two populations and their characterization. *Blood.* 80:91.

19. Neta, R., J.J. Oppenheim, R.D. Schreiber, R. Chizzonite, G.D. Ledney, and T.J. MacVittie. 1991. Role of cytokines (interleukin 1, tumor necrosis factor, and transforming growth factor β) in natural and polysaccharide-enhanced radioresistance. *J. Exp. Med.* 173:1177.

20. McNiece, I.K., F.M. Stewart, D.M. Deacon, D.S. Temeles, K.M. Zsebo, S.C. Clark, and P.J. Quesenberry. 1989. Detection of human CFC with a high proliferative potential. *Blood.* 74:609.

21. Brandt, J., E.P. Strout, K. Van Besien, R.A. Bridgell, and R. Hoffman. 1990. Cytokine-dependent long-term culture of highly enriched precursors of hematopoietic progenitor cells from human bone marrow. *J. Clin. Invest.* 86:932.

22. Miyajima, A., T. Kitamura, N. Harada, T. Yokota, and K. Arai. 1992. Cytokine receptors and signal transduction. *Annu. Rev. Immunol.* 10:295.

23. Ulich, T.R., J. del Castillo, and S. Yin. 1990. Tumor necrosis factor exerts dose-dependent effects on erythropoiesis and myelopoiesis in vivo. *Exp. Hematol.* 18:311.