Interplay Between Intracellular $Ca^{2+}$ Oscillations and $Ca^{2+}$-stimulated Mitochondrial Metabolism

Benjamin Wacquier$^2$, Laurent Combettes$^{2,3}$, Guy Tran Van Nhieu$^{4,5,6,7}$ & Geneviève Dupont$^1$

Oscillations of cytosolic $Ca^{2+}$ concentration are a widespread mode of signalling. Oscillatory spikes rely on repetitive exchanges of $Ca^{2+}$ between the endoplasmic reticulum (ER) and the cytosol, due to the regulation of inositol 1,4,5-trisphosphate receptors. Mitochondria also sequester and release $Ca^{2+}$, thus affecting $Ca^{2+}$ signalling. Mitochondrial $Ca^{2+}$ activates key enzymes involved in ATP synthesis. We propose a new integrative model for $Ca^{2+}$ signalling and mitochondrial metabolism in electrically non-excitable cells. The model accounts for (1) the phase relationship of the $Ca^{2+}$ changes in the cytosol, the ER and mitochondria, (2) the dynamics of mitochondrial metabolites in response to cytosolic $Ca^{2+}$ changes, and (3) the impacts of cytosol/mitochondria $Ca^{2+}$ exchanges and of mitochondrial metabolism on $Ca^{2+}$ oscillations. Simulations predict that as expected, oscillations are slowed down by decreasing the rate of $Ca^{2+}$ efflux from mitochondria, but also by decreasing the rate of $Ca^{2+}$ influx through the mitochondrial $Ca^{2+}$ uniporter (MCU). These predictions were experimentally validated by inhibiting MCU expression. Despite the highly non-linear character of $Ca^{2+}$ dynamics and mitochondrial metabolism, bioenergetics were found to be robust with respect to changes in frequency and amplitude of $Ca^{2+}$ oscillations.

In most organisms, mitochondria play an important role in ATP production and act as $Ca^{2+}$ stores, both functions of these organelles being tightly connected. Mitochondria sequester and release $Ca^{2+}$, thereby affecting the shape, the frequency and the amplitude of the $Ca^{2+}$ spikes in the cytosol$^{1,2}$. In turn, increased mitochondrial $Ca^{2+}$ ([Ca$^{2+}]_{m}$) linked to the transfer of $Ca^{2+}$ from the cytosol to mitochondria during [Ca$^{2+}]_{c}$ signals stimulates mitochondrial metabolism and allows the coupling of ATP supply with energy demand$^{4,7}$. At rest, [Ca$^{2+}]_{c}$, and [Ca$^{2+}]_{m}$, are similar, in the 100 nM range$^8$. Upon cell stimulation by an agonist, inositol 1,4,5-trisphosphate (IP$_3$) is produced and triggers cytosolic $Ca^{2+}$ oscillations$^9$. In non-excitable cells, these oscillations are due to a cyclical exchange of $Ca^{2+}$ between the cytosol and the endoplasmic reticulum (ER), through the biphasic regulation of the IP$_3$ receptor (IP$_3R$) by cytosolic $Ca^{2+}$. Fast activation and slow inhibition of the opening of the IP$_3$R by $Ca^{2+}$ indeed suffice to generate either $Ca^{2+}$ oscillations in classical deterministic models or repetitive spiking, if noise is considered to play a predominant role in cellular $Ca^{2+}$ dynamics$^{10-12}$. $Ca^{2+}$ entry into mitochondria occurs through a multistep mechanism. By extruding protons out of mitochondria, the respiratory chain creates a large inside-negative potential difference across the inner mitochondrial membrane. This $\Delta \Psi$, which is harnessed by the ATP synthase for the production of ATP, allows the Mitochondrial Calcium Uniporter (MCU) to transport $Ca^{2+}$ inside mitochondria$^{13,14}$. $Ca^{2+}$ entry then depolarizes the mitochondria, thus reducing its own driving force. When [Ca$^{2+}]_{m}$ returns to its basal value, extrusion of $Ca^{2+}$ out of mitochondria occurs through both a Na$^{+}$/$Ca^{2+}$ exchanger (NCX) and a H$^{+}$/$Ca^{2+}$ exchanger, possibly identified as LETM1, although the contribution of this channel to mitochondrial $Ca^{2+}$ transport is not yet firmly established$^{15-17}$. Uptake by mitochondria of pyruvate, the end product of cytosolic glycolysis, is at the onset of the oxidative phosphorylation cascade. A pyruvate dehydrogenase transforms substrates into acetyl-CoA which enters the Krebs cycle, also called the acid citric cycle or tricarboxylic acid cycle (TCA). This 9-step cycle converts the
chemical energy of pyruvate into the reducing power of NADH. In addition, the activity of the malate-aspartate shuttle (MAS) also increases mitochondrial NADH\(^+\). NADH then feeds the oxidative phosphorylation pathway in which electrons are transferred and finally used to extrude protons and establish a proton gradient between the intermembrane space and the interior of mitochondria. This electrochemical source of energy is then harnessed by the F\(_{1}\)F\(_{0}\)-ATPase to phosphorylate ADP into ATP. An increase in [Ca\(^{2+}\)]\(_{m}\) activates metabolism as pyruvate dehydrogenase and two rate-limiting enzymes of the TCA cycle, isocitrate dehydrogenase and \(\alpha\)-ketoglutarate dehydrogenase, are up-regulated by Ca\(^{2+}\)\(^19\). Thus, upon stimulation, the transfer of Ca\(^{2+}\) from the cytosol into mitochondria allows for the enhancement of mitochondrial ATP production by the F\(_{1}\)F\(_{0}\)-ATPase. Cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) also directly influences mitochondrial metabolism as a component of the MAS, the aspartate-glutamate carrier (AGC), is stimulated by modest increases in cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\)\(^18\). Given the complexity and highly non-linear character of Ca\(^{2+}\) and mitochondrial dynamics, it is useful to resort to computational modelling to clarify their interplay. Several models have been proposed. Many of them focus on mitochondrial metabolism, but less on the effect of this metabolism on Ca\(^{2+}\) signalling\(^{20–25}\). Other models in contrast, extend computational descriptions of ER-cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) exchanges to incorporate Ca\(^{2+}\) handling by mitochondria. These models shed new light on important specific questions, such as the effect of mitochondria on the amplitude of the Ca\(^{2+}\) spikes\(^{28}\), the effect of glucose on the frequency of Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations\(^{27}\), the modulation of NADH metabolism in pancreatic \(\beta\)-cells\(^{28}\), the mechanism responsible for Ca\(^{2+}\) wave propagation in mitochondrial suspensions\(^{29}\), or the importance of the distance between the ER membranes and mitochondria for their cross talk\(^{30}\).

Here we extend these previous studies to propose a model accounting for a variety of already published experimental observations centred on Ca\(^{2+}\) in non-excitable cells. These observations concern the effect of Ca\(^{2+}\) on mitochondrial metabolism, as well as changes in cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) dynamics occurring when the kinetic properties of the mitochondria are modified. The model is mainly built from the combination of previously published kinetic expressions. One of our aims is to clarify this complex issue by using simple expressions when possible and by motivating the resort to complex mathematical expressions when necessary. This is for example the case for the kinetics of the MCU that we analysed in details. We also found that a reversible Ca\(^{2+}\) leak between the cytosol and the mitochondria, which could correspond to the low conductance mode of the mitochondrial permeability transition pore, was necessary to account for a number of experimental observations. The phase relationship between Ca\(^{2+}\) peaks in the cytosol, the ER, and the mitochondria\(^{31}\) was investigated in details. The effect of modifying the activity of the MCU or of the NCX was next analysed in the simulations, with respect to previous experimental observations in HeLa cells\(^{32,33}\).

We found that increasing the activity of the MCU first increases and then decreases the frequency of Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations. We tested this counter-intuitive prediction by silencing the MCU in HeLa cells. We then switched to the validation of the model concerning mitochondrial metabolism by comparing computationally obtained time series with the evolution of NADH\(^4\), voltage difference across the inner mitochondrial membrane (\(\Delta\Psi\))\(^{34}\), and ATP in response to a single Ca\(^{2+}\) spike\(^3\) or in response to sustained Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations\(^{35,36}\). This validated model could then be used to investigate the sensitivity of mitochondrial metabolism to changes in the frequency and amplitude of cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) spikes. Besides a strong robustness of mitochondrial metabolism with respect to the characteristics of the cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) changes, the model predicted that ATP synthesis by mitochondria is most efficient for frequencies and amplitudes of Ca\(^{2+}\) spikes usually observed experimentally.

**Methods**

**Model.** The processes considered in the model are schematized in Fig. 1. Fluxes and reactions are described by ordinary differential equations. As we neglect spatial aspects, we do not consider Ca\(^{2+}\) microdomains. More specifically, we do not explicitly incorporate MAM (mitochondria-associated ER membranes) in the model\(^38\) and focus on cellular average behaviour. All concentrations (including Michaelis-Menten constants) are thus averages on the volume of a given intracellular compartment: cytosol (c), endoplasmic reticulum (ER) or mitochondria (m). Thus, the fluxes are scaled by the appropriate volume ratio when necessary (see the legend of Table 1 for a more accurate description).

We adopt a fully deterministic approach, which is appropriate to obtain predictions about the average effect of the different individual fluxes on Ca\(^{2+}\) dynamics\(^37\) and mitochondrial metabolism. As described in previous approaches\(^27,28\), there is no distinction between the inter-membrane mitochondrial space and the cytosol, as the outer membrane is highly permeable to Ca\(^{2+}\) and H\(^+\). The model is defined by 7 evolution equations and 4 conservation relations given here below (Eqs. (1–11)). The fluxes appearing in these equations are defined by Eqs. (12–23).

**Evolution equations:**

- Cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) concentration

  \[
  \frac{dC_c}{dt} = f_c (\alpha I_{IP3} - I_{SERCA} - \delta I_{MCU} + \delta I_{NCX} - \delta I_a) \tag{1}
  \]

Using the framework of rapid buffering approximation\(^38\), \(f_c\) is the Ca\(^{2+}\) buffering capacity of the cytosol. The different volumes of the compartments are taken into account via \(\alpha = V_{ER}/V_c\) and \(\delta = V_m/V_c\). \(I_a\) is a bidirectional Ca\(^{2+}\) leak (see the ‘Results' section for the rationale of this term). Ca\(^{2+}\) exchanges with the extracellular medium are not taken into account since they do not play a major role in the interplay between cytosolic and mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) during the early spikes following stimulation\(^31\). Also, we do not consider Ca\(^{2+}\) fluxes through the mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}/H^+\) exchanger. Although this is not firmly established\(^37\), the Ca\(^{2+}/H^+\)
exchanger is thought to correspond to the LETM1 protein and the levels of expression of LETM1 appear to be inconsequential for mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) export during physiological stimulation of HeLa cells.

- Mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) concentration

\[
\frac{dC_m}{dt} = f_m (J_{MCU} - J_{NCX} + J_x)
\]

\(f_m\) is the Ca\(^{2+}\) buffering capacity of mitochondria.

- Fraction of inactivated IP\(_3\) receptors

\[
\frac{dR_i}{dt} = k_{i} C_i^n \left( \frac{1}{1 + \left( \frac{C_{i}}{K_i} \right)^n} \right) - k_{i} R_i
\]

This equation reflects the biphasic regulation of the IP\(_3\) receptors by Ca\(^{2+}\).

- Mitochondrial NADH concentration

\[
\frac{d[NADH]}{dt} = J_{PDH} - J_O + J_{AGC}
\]

- Mitochondrial ADP concentration

\[
\frac{d[ADP]_m}{dt} = J_{ANT} - J_{F1FO}
\]

- Cytosolic ADP concentration

\[
\frac{d[ADP]_c}{dt} = J_{HYD} - \delta J_{ANT}
\]

- Voltage difference across the inner mitochondrial membrane (positive corresponding to an excess of positive charges in the cytosol)

\[
\frac{d\Delta\Psi}{dt} = (a_1 R_O - a_2 J_{F1FO} - J_{ANT} - J_{H, leak} - J_{NCX} - 2 J_{MCU} - 2 J_x - J_{AGC}) / C_p
\]

\(C_p\) is a constant that includes both the membrane capacitance and the Faraday constant.

- Conservation of intracellular Ca\(^{2+}\)
| Parameter  | Definition                                                                 | Value      | Ref.    |
|-----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|--------|
| a1        | Scaling factor between NADH consumption and change in membrane voltage     | 20         | This work |
| a2        | Scaling factor between ATP production by ATPase and change in membrane voltage | 3.43       | 28     |
| α         | Volumic ratio between the endoplasmic reticulum and the cytosol            | 0.1        | 40     |
| αc        | Factor taking cytosolic ADP and ATP buffering into account                | 0.111      | 27     |
| αm        | Factor taking mitochondrial ADP and ATP buffering into account            | 0.139      | 27     |
| A_c<sub>tot</sub> | Total concentration in cytosolic adenine nucleotides              | 2500 μM    | 73     |
| A_m<sub>tot</sub> | Total concentration in mitochondrial adenine nucleotides          | 15000 μM   | 28     |
| b         | Ca<sup>2+</sup> leak from the endoplasmic reticulum                       | 0.01       | This work |
| C<sub>i</sub> | Mitochondrial inner membrane capacitance divided by F               | 1.8 μM.mV<sup>-1</sup> | 28     |
| δ         | Volumic ratio between the mitochondria and the cytosol                    | 0.0733     | 28     |
| F         | Faraday constant                                                           | 96480 C.mol<sup>-1</sup> |        |
| f<sub>ER</sub> | Fraction of free over buffer-bound Ca<sup>2+</sup> in the ER                 | 0.01       | 27     |
| f<sub>ER</sub> | Fraction of free over buffer-bound Ca<sup>2+</sup> in the ER                 | 0.01       | 27     |
| f<sub>m</sub> | Rate constant of the Ca<sup>2+</sup> flux through IP<sub>R</sub>          | 30 s<sup>-1</sup> | 27     |
| K<sub>1</sub> | Dissociation constant for Ca<sup>2+</sup> translocation by the MCU      | 6 μM       | This work |
| K<sub>2</sub> | Dissociation constant for MCU activation by Ca<sup>2+</sup>            | 0.38 μM    | 20     |
| K<sub>4</sub> | Dissociation constant of Ca<sup>2+</sup> from the activating site of the IP<sub>R</sub> | 0.3 μM    | 74     |
| K<sub>AGC</sub> | Dissociation constant of Ca<sup>2+</sup> from AGC                    | 0.14 μM    | 50     |
| K<sub>a</sub> | Dissociation constant of ATP from SERCA pumps                           | 0.05 μM    | 41     |
| k<sub>GLY</sub> | Velocity of glycolysis (empirical)                                     | 450 μM.s<sup>-1</sup> | 28     |
| K<sub>b</sub> | Michaelis-Menten constant for ATP hydrolysis                            | 1000 μM    | This work |
| k<sub>ATP</sub> | Maximal rate of ATP hydrolysis                                           | 100 μM.s<sup>-1</sup> | 28     |
| K<sub>IP</sub> | Dissociation constant of IP<sub>R</sub> binding from its receptor        | 1 μM       | 54     |
| k<sub>1</sub> | Rate constant of Ca<sup>2+</sup> dissociation from the inactivating site of the IP<sub>R</sub> receptor | 0.02 s<sup>-1</sup> | 74     |
| k<sub>2</sub> | Rate constant of NADH oxidation by ETC                                   | 600 μM.s<sup>-1</sup> | 28     |
| K<sub>c</sub> | Dissociation constant of Ca<sup>2+</sup> from SERCA                      | 0.35 μM    | 54     |
| k<sub>3</sub> | Rate constant of Ca<sup>2+</sup> binding to the inhibiting site of the IP<sub>R</sub> | 20 μM<sup>-1</sup>s<sup>-1</sup> | This work |
| k<sub>4</sub> | Rate constant of bidirectional Ca<sup>2+</sup> leak from mitochondria    | 0.008 s<sup>-1</sup> | This work |
| L         | Allosteric equilibrium constant for uniporter conformations              | 50         | 21     |
| n<sub>i</sub> | Hill coefficient of Ca<sup>2+</sup> binding to the activating site of the IP<sub>R</sub> | 3          | 74     |
| NAD<sub>m</sub> | Total concentration of mitochondrial pyridine nucleotides               | 250 μM     | This work |
| n<sub>i</sub> | Hill coefficient of Ca<sup>2+</sup> binding to the inhibiting site of the IP<sub>R</sub> | 4          | 74     |
| q<sub>1</sub> | Voltage dependence coefficient of MCU activity                          | 0.1 mV<sup>-1</sup> | This work |
| q<sub>2</sub> | Voltage dependence coefficient of NCX activity                           | 0.016 mV<sup>-1</sup> | This work |
| q<sub>3</sub> | Voltage dependence coefficient of calcium leak                          | 0.05 mV<sup>-1</sup> | This work |
| q<sub>4</sub> | Voltage dependence coefficient of AGC activity                          | 0.01 mV<sup>-1</sup> | This work |
| q<sub>5</sub> | Michaelis-Menten-like constant for NAD<sup>+</sup> consumption by the Krebs cycle | 1          | 28     |
| q<sub>6</sub> | S<sub>50</sub> value for activation the Krebs cycle by Ca<sup>2+</sup>    | 0.1 μM     | This work |
| q<sub>7</sub> | S<sub>50</sub> value for indirect inhibition of the AGC by cytosolic Ca<sup>2+</sup> | 0.1 μM     | This work |
| q<sub>8</sub> | Michaelis-Menten constant for NADH consumption by the ETC              | 100 μM     | 28     |
| q<sub>9</sub> | Voltage dependence coefficient 1 of ETC activity                        | 177 mV     | 28     |
| q<sub>10</sub> | Voltage dependence coefficient 2 of ETC activity                       | 5 mV       | 28     |
| q<sub>11</sub> | Inhibition constant of ATPase activity by ATP                           | 10000 μM   | 28     |
| q<sub>12</sub> | Voltage dependence coefficient of ATPase activity                      | 190 mV     | 28     |

Continued
\[ \alpha \delta = \left( \frac{C_f}{C_f} \right) \]

\( f_{ER} \) is the Ca\(^{2+} \) buffering capacity of the ER.

- Conservation of total (oxidized and reduced) NADH

\[ [NADH] + [NAD^{+}] = [NADH]_m^{TOT} \]

- Conservation of di- and trisphosphorylated adenine nucleotides in mitochondria

\[ [ADP]^+_m + [ATP]^+_m = [ATP]_m^{TOT} \]

- Conservation of di- and trisphosphorylated adenine nucleotides in the cytosol

\[ [ADP]^-_c + [ATP]^-_c = [ATP]_c^{TOT} \]

The conservation relations described by Eqs. (10) and (11) do not always hold as adenine nucleotide/Mg\(^{2+} \) transporters, known as SCaMCs, mediate net transfer of ADP and/or ATP to the mitochondrial matrix. However, on the short time scales investigated in this study, we expect this transporter to have a minor role since SCaMCs are much slower than the adenine nucleotide translocases (ANT) and have a low affinity for cytoplasmic Ca\(^{2+} \). 18.

**Kinetic expressions for fluxes and reaction rates.**

- \( J_{IP3} = k_i (b + IR_a) (C_{ER} - C_c) \)

where \( IR_a = (1 - R_i) \frac{j_2^2 + j_2^3 K_{NAD}^+ C_N^{NAD^+}}{j_2^2 + j_2^3 K_{NAD}^+ C_N^{NAD^+} + j_2^2 + j_2^3 K_{NAD}^+ C_N^{NAD^+}} \)

This is a classical expression for the Ca\(^{2+} \) flux through the IP\(_3 \) receptor that is rapidly activated at low cytosolic Ca\(^{2+} \) and more slowly inhibited at high cytosolic Ca\(^{2+} \). 40. It is defined with respect to the volume of the ER. I stands for the concentration of IP\(_3 \) that is taken as a parameter whose value directly reflects the level of cell stimulation.

- \( J_{SERCA} = V_p \frac{C_c^2}{K_p^2 + C_c^2 K_c^+} \)

It represents the Ca\(^{2+} \) flux through an unidirectional SERCA ATPase, that transports Ca\(^{2+} \) from the cytosol into the ER, against the concentration gradient, using the energy provided by the hydrolysis of ATP. 41. It is defined with respect to the volume of the cytosol.

We now describe the kinetic expressions for mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+} \) fluxes and metabolism. Most of these processes have been already individually described by complex models quantitatively accounting for energetic-redox mechanisms under various (patho) physiological conditions. Assembling these models would lead to an extremely complex network. Our aim here is to build an intelligible model, centred around Ca\(^{2+} \) signalling and its interplay with mitochondrial metabolism. The kinetic expressions used are thus a trade-off between complexity and appropriate conceptualization.
\[ J_{\text{MCU}} = V_{\text{MCU}} \frac{C_m}{C_c} \left( 1 + \frac{C_c}{C_m} \right)^3 e^{P_1 \Delta \Psi} \]  

(14)

\( J_{\text{MCU}} \) stands for the flux of Ca\(^{2+}\) from the cytosol into mitochondria that occurs through the MCU, defined with respect to the mitochondrial volume. This flux is cooperatively stimulated by cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) through the MICU1 subunit\(^{42,43}\). We based this kinetic equation on that proposed by Magnus and Keizer\(^{20}\). Although this expression was proposed before the discovery\(^{26}\) of the molecular identity of the MCU (previously called the Ca\(^{2+}\)-uniporter), it is in agreement with the observed properties of this channel. Supplementary Fig. S1 shows the flux through the MCU as a function of cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) concentration (black curve). This curve, entirely based on the expression and the parameter values proposed by Magnus and Keizer\(^{20}\) is in very good agreement with the results of Görgdás et al. (2013) on the MCU\(^{44}\). If the activation by cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) is removed \((K_1 \rightarrow \infty)\), the curve (in red) becomes less sigmoidal and is shifted to the left, as observed for the MICU1 knock-down. As shown by the blue curve, the simplified expression proposed by Bertram et al.\(^{28}\) does not accurately reproduce the original expression if \([\text{Ca}^{2+}] > 1 \mu\text{M}\). Eq. (14) is based on the Monod-Wyman-Changeux formalism for allosteric enzymes\(^{45}\) and further assumes that Ca\(^{2+}\) cannot bind to the transporter when subunits are in the so-called “tense” form. Concerning the dependence of this rate on the mitochondrial potential, we have simplified the expression used by Magnus and Keizer and simply used Eyring’s theory. Thus, the rate constant of Ca\(^{2+}\) transport increases with the potential difference across the mitochondrial membrane in an exponential manner. As explained in the ‘Results’ section, this change was moreover required to account for the observation that energising mitochondria leads to a decreased frequency of Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations\(^{4,46}\).

\[ J_{\text{NCX}} = V_{\text{NCX}} \left( \frac{C_m}{C_c} \right)^3 e^{P_1 \Delta \Psi} \]  

(15)

This is the expression proposed by Bertram et al.\(^{28}\) for the rate of Ca\(^{2+}\) extrusion out of mitochondria mediated by the Na\(^{+}/\text{Ca}^{2+}\) exchanger, defined with respect to the mitochondrial volume. This channel exchanges 1 Ca\(^{2+}\) for 3 Na\(^{+}\) and is thus electrogenic. It is assumed that the cytosolic Na\(^{+}\) concentration remains constant and that channel activity is favoured by a large ratio of Ca\(^{2+}\) concentrations between the cytosol and mitochondria. As reported previously\(^{15}\), we did not consider a possible reverse mode \((C_c \rightarrow C_m)\). The dependency on the potential has the same form as for the MCU.

\[ J_x = k_x (C_c - C_m) e^{P_1 \Delta \Psi} \]  

(16)

This flux, defined with respect to the mitochondrial volume, was not considered in previous models. Its molecular nature remains to be fully identified (see ‘Results’). We found necessary to consider this flux to account for many experimental results and, in particular, for the fact that \(C_m\) does not drop in MCU-knocked down cells\(^{42}\). The existence of this flux also accounts for the observation that mitochondria take up Ca\(^{2+}\) from the cytosol at nanomolar concentrations, at which the MCU is inactive\(^{15}\). It is chosen bidirectional to allow for the existence of sustained \(C_c\) oscillations when the NCX is totally inhibited\(^{15}\). If the flux was unidirectional, NCX inhibition would otherwise lead to Ca\(^{2+}\) accumulation in mitochondria and arrest of oscillations. As explained in the Results section, we hypothesise that this flux may reflect the low conductance state of the mitochondrial Permeability Transition Pore (mPTP)\(^{46}\).

\[ J_{\text{PDH}} = \frac{k_{\text{GLY}}}{q_1 + \left[ \text{NAD}^+ \right]/[\text{NADH}]} \frac{C_m}{C_c} q_2 + C_m \]  

(17)

This expression is taken from Bertram et al.\(^{28}\), who proposed a simplified mathematical expression showing the same behaviour as that derived by Magnus and Keizer (1998)\(^{21}\) and taking into account the activation of this enzyme through Ca\(^{2+}\)-sensitive reversible phosphorylation. This rate not only accounts for the Pyruvate DeHydrogenase (PDH)-catalysed reaction but gathers the glycolytic pathway \((k_{\text{GLY}})\) and the Krebs cycle. The Krebs cycle reduces \(\text{NAD}^+\) into NADH, hence the dependency on the adenine nicotinamide ratio. \([\text{NAD}^+]\) is computed from the conservation relationship (Eq. (9)). We have modified the value of \([\text{NAD}^+]_{\text{intr}}\) with respect to Bertram et al.\(^{28}\) to account for experimental observations in HeLa cells\(^{49}\). The last factor in Eq. (17) reflects the activation of both the PDH dehydrogenase and the Krebs cycle by Ca\(^{2+}\), the latter one occurring at the levels of both the isocitrate- and the α-ketoglutarate dehydrogenases. In agreement with experimental data\(^{19}\), the \(K_0\) value for activation by Ca\(^{2+}\) \((q_1)\) is taken equal to 0.1 \(\mu\text{M}\).

\[ J_{\text{AGC}} = V_{\text{AGC}} \frac{C_c}{K_{\text{AGC}} + C_c} \frac{q_2}{q_2 + C_m} e^{P_1 \Delta \Psi} \]  

(18)

The aspartate-glutamate carrier is part of the MAS NADH shuttle. The two mammalian carriers, aralar and citrin, are activated by moderate cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) increases \((100 \mu\text{M} < S_{\text{Ca}} < 350 \mu\text{M})\)\(^{58,59}\). This is taken into account by the second factor in Eq. (18). In many cases, the activation of the MAS pathway is not maintained at Ca\(^{2+}\) levels at which the MCU becomes active, although the cross-talk between the Ca\(^{2+}\) activation of MAS and the mitochondrial dehydrogenases may vary from tissue to tissue. By activating the Krebs cycle, mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\)
increase would lead to a decrease in the amount of α-ketoglutarate, a key-metabolite of the MAS. To take this limiting step into account in the model, we considered in Eq. (18) that the activity of AGC is inhibited by mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) with a threshold value \(q_1\) that is the same as the threshold for activation of the Krebs cycle by mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\). As the AGC is electrogenic, \(J_{AGC}\) also appears in Eq. (7).

\[
J_O = k_o \frac{[NADH]}{q_4 + [NADH]} \left(1 + e^{-\frac{\Delta \Psi - q_4}{\eta}}\right)^{-1}
\] (19)

Downstream the Krebs cycle, NADH is then oxidized in the Electron Transport Chain (ETC) to extrude protons from mitochondria. \(J_O\) thus represents both the rate at which NADH is oxidized (Eq. (4)) and the rate at which H\(^+\) are extruded. In the rate expression for \(J_O\) (Eq. (19)), the change of rate with variation in the proton concentration gradient is not considered as in Magnus and Keizer (1997) and Bertram et al. (2006). Although protons are not considered explicitly in the model, they appear in the evolution equation of the membrane potential (protons extrusion leads to an increase in voltage). In Eq. (7), \(J_O\) is multiplied by \(a_1\) to scale the NADH production into a change in voltage due to the proton flux. Eq. (19) is that proposed by Bertram et al. as a simplification of that initially proposed by Magnus and Keizer (1998). The exponential factor contains the dependency on both the membrane voltage and the proton gradient.

\[
J_{ANT} = \frac{V_{ANT}}{1 + \frac{\alpha [ATP]}{\alpha_m [ADP_m]} e^{-0.5 \frac{\Delta \psi}{\eta}} + \frac{[ADP_m]}{\alpha_m [ATP_m]}}
\] (20)

This rather complex expression describes the activity of a translocator that needs to bind either ATP or ADP on both sides for a conformational change of the carrier to occur. This change allows for a ligand exchange. Thus, 4 possible combinations of ligands are possible (ATP\(^c\)-ATP\(^m\); ATP\(^c\)-ADP\(^m\); ADP\(^c\)-ATP\(^m\); ADP\(^c\)-ADP\(^m\)). The \(\alpha's\) stand for the fact that only a fraction of nucleotides has access to the transporter. ADP and ATP are negatively charged (3- and 4-, respectively), which explains the potential dependence of this flux. It is defined with respect to the mitochondrial volume. This equation has been erroneously transcribed and simplified in previous publications. We refer the readers to this reference for a discussion about the usefulness of keeping the original expression.

\[
J_{FIFO} = \frac{V_{FIFO}}{1 + \frac{q_h}{q_h + [ATP_m]} \left(1 + e^{-\frac{\Delta \psi - q_4}{\eta}}\right)^{-1}}
\] (21)

This is the rate of ATP synthesis by the F\(_{1}\)F\(_{0}\)-ATPase. This expression, proposed by Bertram et al. accounts for a weak decrease in rate with increasing ATP\(^m\) (i.e. with decreasing ADP\(^m\)), but for a steep sigmoidal dependency on the mitochondrial potential. ATP synthesis is driven by the proton flux from the cytosol into the mitochondria, which depolarizes the membrane. Thus \(J_{FIFO}\) also enters the evolution equation for \(\Delta \Psi\) (Eq. (7)), with the scaling factor \(a_2\).

\[
J_{HYD} = \frac{J_{SERCA}}{2} + k_{HYD} \frac{[ATP]}{[ATP] + K_h}
\] (22)

This term represents the rate of ATP consumption in the cytosol. In contrast with previous models, we incorporate the link between Ca\(^{2+}\) activity and ATP consumption in the cytoplasm. SERCA pumps (Eq. (13)) are Ca\(^{2+}\)-ATPases transporting 2 Ca\(^{2+}\) ions for one molecule of ATP hydrolysed. The second term of Eq. (22) encompasses the other ATP-consuming processes in the cytoplasm.

\[
J_{H, leak} = q_h \Delta \Psi + q_{10}
\] (23)

This simplified expression for the ohmic mitochondrial proton leak is taken from Bertram et al.

Parameter values are listed in Table 1. These values are the same as those proposed in previous studies when we used kinetic expressions previously published. For new expressions, values were fitted manually to get reasonable agreement with available experimental data. To remain as coherent as possible, we chose data obtained in HeLa cells when available. The full system of equations is simulated using the software package XPPAUT developed by Bard Ermentrout. Bifurcation diagrams are obtained numerically, by solving the differential equations with the MATLAB solver ode23, or ode23tb when using pulses.

**Experiments.** Cell lines and silencing MCU expression. HeLa cells were from ATCC and were grown in RPMI medium containing 5% fetal calf serum in a 5% CO\(_2\) incubator. Cells were transfected with a non-targeting siRNA (scrambled) or with two pooled siRNA sequences against the MCU using the lipofectamine RNAi Max (Invitrogen) following the manufacturer’s instructions. For all experiments MCU mRNA silencing (> 70%) was confirmed at 48 h post-siRNA. The rabbit polyclonal antibody against the MCU and Cyclosporin A were from Sigma and siRNAs against the MCU were from Eurogentec.

---

Scientific Reports | 6:19316 | DOI: 10.1038/srep19316
this difference. In agreement with this hypothesis, we found that the value taken for the Ca\(^{2+}\) significantly lower (see Supplementary Fig. S2). This is due to the fact that mitochondria slowly release the Ca\(^{2+}\) in the model by the fact that in the absence of mitochondria (J MCU
\(= 0\)), the mitochondria (blue) in the presence of first a relatively high (from 0 to 200 s), followed by a low IP\(_{3}\) concentration. The period of oscillations is of the order of 30 s, while their half-width is ~1/5 of the period. A detailed view of one peak is shown in Fig. 2B, where time 0 corresponds to the minimum of Ca\(^{2+}\) in the cytosol, during sustained oscillations. From this starting point, Ca\(^{2+}\) slowly increases both in the cytosol and in the ER, while C\(_{m}\) is still decreasing. Thus, release of mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) is responsible for the increase in C\(_{c}\), which itself allows the replenishment of the ER. The rise in C\(_{c}\) then stimulates the IP3R and CER starts decreasing fast. C\(_{m}\) only starts increasing during the fast rising phase of the cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) peak. Then, C\(_{c}\) reaches its maximum, slightly before CER gets to its minimum value (vertical lines in Fig. 2B). As long as C\(_{c}\) is large, the ER refills fast. A change in slope occurs when the rate of CER increase is imposed by the rate of Ca\(^{2+}\) release from the mitochondria into the cytosol. Concerning C\(_{m}\), it keeps accumulating quite late after the peak in C\(_{c}\). C\(_{m}\) finally decreases until the onset of the new cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) spike, but, interestingly, C\(_{m}\) does not recover to basal values during the interspike period. This mechanism is in agreement with the observations of Ishii et al. (2006) who observed the same sequence. Thus, mitochondria play an important role in triggering the cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) spike as they continuously release Ca\(^{2+}\) during the silent phase of cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations. This effect of mitochondria on Ca\(^{2+}\) dynamics is confirmed in the model by the fact that in the absence of mitochondria (J MCU = J NCX = I\(_{x}\) = 0), the frequency of cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations is lower, but the amplitude is higher. In addition to these modifications, mitochondria also alter the shape of the cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) peak. Indeed, when J MCU = J NCX = I\(_{x}\) = 0, the rate of cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) decrease is significantly lower (see Supplementary Fig. S2). This is due to the fact that mitochondria slowly release the Ca\(^{2+}\) accumulated during the rising part of the oscillation. This more asymmetric shape of the spike is in agreement with experimental observations in HeLa cells.

In response to a sudden decrease in IP\(_{3}\) (Fig. 2A), oscillations rapidly stop in the cytosol, while ER Ca\(^{2+}\) evolves towards a high steady value and mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) slowly decreases towards its resting state, close to the basal cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) concentration. This slow decrease in mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) down to a basal concentration of about 100 nM is in agreement with observations in HeLa cells and chromaffin cells. Reported concentrations of mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) during oscillations are highly variable, depending on the study: some experiments report levels in the \(\mu\)M range while others describe peaks in C\(_{m}\) reaching several tens of \(\mu\)M. It is highly plausible that results are influenced by the nature of the probe used to monitor Ca\(^{2+}\) changes in the mitochondria. However, intercellular and subcellular heterogeneity in mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) signalling has been observed using the CEPIA probe in HeLa cells suggesting that specific characteristics of mitochondria could also explain this difference. In agreement with this hypothesis, we found that the value taken for the Ca\(^{2+}\) buffering capacity of mitochondria (f\(_{m}\)) has a very strong influence on the values of C\(_{m}\) associated with changes in C\(_{c}\) (Fig. 3A).

Western-Blot analysis. The equivalent of 4 \times 105 cells were scraped in Laemmli-loading buffer. Samples were subjected to Western-blot analysis using the indicated primary antibody followed by anti-rabbit HRP-conjugated antibody. Detection was performed using ECL plus reagent (GE Healthcare Biosciences).

Calcium fluorescence microscopy imaging. Analysis of Ca\(^{2+}\) variations was performed by loading cells with 3 \(\mu\)M Fluo-4-AM (Invitrogen) in EM buffer containing 120 mM NaCl, 7 mM KCl, 1.8 mM CaCl\(_{2}\), 0.8 mM MgCl\(_{2}\), 5 mM glucose, 25 mM HEPES pH 7.3, as described previously. Samples were analysed at 33 °C on an inverted Nikon fluorescence microscope, and images were captured every 3 s, using an EM-CCD camera (Hamamatsu), digitized and integrated in real time by an image processor (Compix). All images were corrected for background fluorescence.

Results

Ca\(^{2+}\) dynamics. Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations occur in the cytosol, the ER and the mitochondria with well-defined phase relationships. We first compared the behaviour of the model defined by Eqs. (1) to (7) with respect to this relationship. Figure 2A shows the evolution of the free Ca\(^{2+}\) concentrations in the cytosol (black), the ER (red) and the mitochondria (blue) in the presence of first a relatively high (from 0 to 200 s), followed by a low IP\(_{3}\) concentration. The period of oscillations is of the order of 30 s, while their half-width is ~1/5 of the period. A detailed view of one peak is shown in Fig. 2B, where time 0 corresponds to the minimum of Ca\(^{2+}\) in the cytosol, during sustained oscillations. From this starting point, Ca\(^{2+}\) slowly increases both in the cytosol and in the ER, while C\(_{m}\) is still decreasing. Thus, release of mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) is responsible for the increase in C\(_{c}\), which itself allows the replenishment of the ER. The rise in C\(_{c}\) then stimulates the IP3R and CER starts decreasing fast. C\(_{m}\) only starts increasing during the fast rising phase of the cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) peak. Then, C\(_{c}\) reaches its maximum, slightly before CER gets to its minimum value (vertical lines in Fig. 2B). As long as C\(_{c}\) is large, the ER refills fast. A change in slope occurs when the rate of CER increase is imposed by the rate of Ca\(^{2+}\) release from the mitochondria into the cytosol. Concerning C\(_{m}\), it keeps accumulating quite late after the peak in C\(_{c}\). C\(_{m}\) finally decreases until the onset of the new cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) spike, but, interestingly, C\(_{m}\) does not recover to basal values during the interspike period. This mechanism is in agreement with the observations of Ishii et al. who observed the same sequence. Thus, mitochondria play an important role in triggering the cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) spike as they continuously release Ca\(^{2+}\) during the silent phase of cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations. This effect of mitochondria on Ca\(^{2+}\) dynamics is confirmed in the model by the fact that in the absence of mitochondria (J MCU = J NCX = I\(_{x}\) = 0), the frequency of cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations is lower, but the amplitude is higher. In addition to these modifications, mitochondria also alter the shape of the cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) peak. Indeed, when J MCU = J NCX = I\(_{x}\) = 0, the rate of cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) decrease is significantly lower (see Supplementary Fig. S2). This is due to the fact that mitochondria slowly release the Ca\(^{2+}\) accumulated during the rising part of the oscillation. This more asymmetric shape of the spike is in agreement with experimental observations in HeLa cells.

In response to a sudden decrease in IP\(_{3}\) (Fig. 2A), oscillations rapidly stop in the cytosol, while ER Ca\(^{2+}\) evolves towards a high steady value and mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) slowly decreases towards its resting state, close to the basal cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) concentration. This slow decrease in mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) down to a basal concentration of about 100 nM is in agreement with observations in HeLa cells and chromaffin cells. Reported concentrations of mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) during oscillations are highly variable, depending on the study: some experiments report levels in the \(\mu\)M range while others describe peaks in C\(_{m}\) reaching several tens of \(\mu\)M. It is highly plausible that results are influenced by the nature of the probe used to monitor Ca\(^{2+}\) changes in the mitochondria. However, intercellular and subcellular heterogeneity in mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) signalling has been observed using the CEPIA probe in HeLa cells suggesting that specific characteristics of mitochondria could also explain this difference. In agreement with this hypothesis, we found that the value taken for the Ca\(^{2+}\) buffering capacity of mitochondria (f\(_{m}\)) has a very strong influence on the values of C\(_{m}\) associated with changes in C\(_{c}\) (Fig. 3A). As shown in Fig. 3B, this factor does not much affect Ca\(^{2+}\) changes in the cytoplasm. Thus, different Ca\(^{2+}\) buffering capacities in mitochondria due either to intrinsic cell variability or to different concentrations of probes may explain, at least in part, the large range of reported C\(_{m}\).
In a next step, we altered the rates of the individual Ca\(^{2+}\) fluxes between mitochondria and the cytosol. We first analysed the effect of changing the maximal rate of the NCX. A complete inhibition of the activity of the NCX leads to a decrease in the frequency of the Ca\(^{2+}\) spikes (Supplementary Fig. S3). This inhibition indeed leads to a slower Ca\(^{2+}\) release from mitochondria and hence to a delayed priming of the IP\(_3\)R to generate the cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) spike. This decrease in frequency has been observed in HeLa cells stimulated by histamine in the presence of the inhibitor of the mitochondrial Na\(^{+}\)-Ca\(^{2+}\) exchanger CGP37157\(^{23}\). The inhibition of the exchanger practically does not change the bifurcation diagram as a function of IP\(_3\), thus confirming that Ca\(^{2+}\) release from mitochondria modulates, but does not cause or inhibit, cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations.

We next modified the rate constant of the MCU, which is the mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) flux opposite to the NCX. As shown in Fig. 4A (black curve), the model predicts a biphasic effect: increasing the activity of the MCU first increases then decreases the frequency of oscillations. At large rates, raising \(V_{\text{MCU}}\) slightly slows down the oscillations (Fig. 4A, black curve) because mitochondria buffer Ca\(^{2+}\) changes in the cytosol. This slows down the ER-cytosol Ca\(^{2+}\) exchanges. Surprisingly, at moderate rates the frequency of oscillations decreases when decreasing the rate of Ca\(^{2+}\) entry into mitochondria, as also exemplified in Fig. 4B. Indeed, in the range of low values of \(V_{\text{MCU}}\), Ca\(^{2+}\) accumulation in the mitochondria becomes so limited that the subsequent release of Ca\(^{2+}\) through the NCX is too weak to boost the IP\(_3\) receptor. In other words, the amount of Ca\(^{2+}\) entering via the MCU becomes the limiting factor in mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) handling. In agreement with this explanation, the frequency of Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations is a monotonous increasing function of \(V_{\text{MCU}}\) when the rate constant of the NCX is increased (red curve in Fig. 4A); in these conditions indeed, mitochondria never slow down the cytosol-ER Ca\(^{2+}\) exchanges as the Ca\(^{2+}\) sequestered by mitochondria is always rapidly released into the cytosol. This complex relationship between the frequency of Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations and the activity of the uniporter accounts for the observation that activators of the MCU (PPT and kaempferol) stimulate and inhibit the oscillatory behaviour in HeLa cells and in fibroblasts\(^{22}\). Interestingly, it is reported in the same studies that the inhibitory effect (i.e. decrease in frequency) is more pronounced if the activity of the NCX is reduced.

That decreasing the rate of Ca\(^{2+}\) entry into mitochondria through the NCX slows down Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations appeared as a rather counter-intuitive prediction of the model. We tested this prediction experimentally using HeLa cells transiently transfected with scrambled siRNA or siRNA against MCU (see Supplementary Fig. S4). Indeed, it has been shown that inhibition of the MCU allows to selectively modify the Ca\(^{2+}\) uptake capacity of mitochondria without interfering with bioenergetic properties or organelle structure\(^{4,38}\). The results of a typical experiment are shown in Fig. 4C (control) and D (siRNA anti-MCU). In qualitative agreement with the model, the average period of Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations in response to stimulation by 3 \(\mu\)M histamine increases from 31 s (±19 s, \(n = 63\)) to 97 s (±39 s, \(n = 28\)) in the cells that do not express the MCU. Experiments thus confirmed that MCU inhibition leads to a decrease in the frequency of Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations in HeLa cells. Our interpretation of this observation is that, in the absence of MCU, the very low level of mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) does not allow the release of mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) between two ER-generated spikes, release that is responsible for the ‘pacemaker-like’ Ca\(^{2+}\) trigger of the IP\(_3\) receptor occurring in control cells.

The increase in period observed in the experiments is, however, much larger than that predicted by the model. We thus investigated if the MCU siRNA treatment shifts the effective dose response to histamine. Supplementary Table S1 shows that this was indeed the case: at 0.3 \(\mu\)M histamine, only 3% of MCU siRNA treated cells displayed a Ca\(^{2+}\) response while 39% of control cells oscillated. However, this shift is not the only reason for the observed decrease in period in the cells inhibited for the MCU. Indeed, the period of Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations at the highest histamine dose in anti-MCU siRNA treated cells (10 \(\mu\)M histamine; 98 s) is still larger than that seen at the lowest histamine dose in Scrbl siRNA treated cells (0.1 \(\mu\)M histamine; 50 s). Thus, oscillations in the absence of MCU at maximal stimulation, which corresponds to the smallest possible period, are still slower than those obtained at low levels of stimulation in the presence of MCU, pointing to a specific role of the MCU in the control of the frequency of oscillations.

![Figure 3](https://www.nature.com/scientificreports/images/figure3.png)

**Figure 3.** The Ca\(^{2+}\) buffering capacity of mitochondria modifies the amplitude of Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations. (A) Effect on mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\). (B) Effect on cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\). Curves indicate the minima and maxima reached during oscillations. Parameter values are listed in Table 1. IP\(_3\) = 1 \(\mu\)M.
Possible nature of the bidirectional Ca$^{2+}$ flux between the mitochondria and the cytosol. In the model, there is another flux allowing a Ca$^{2+}$ exchange between the mitochondria and the cytosol ($J_x$, see Eqs. (2) and (16)). This flux was initially incorporated in the model to account for the observation that mitochondria can still take up Ca$^{2+}$ when the MCU is inactive. We found, however, that assuming a reversible flux, the direction of which depending on the electrochemical gradient, led to a better agreement with experimental results as oscillations are maintained when the NCX is inhibited, indicative that Ca$^{2+}$ is extruded from mitochondria by another pathway. For both directions, best agreement is obtained when assuming a low conductance, proportional to the Ca$^{2+}$ concentration gradient. A plausible candidate for this flux is the low conductance mode of the mitochondrial permeability transition pore (PTP). We analysed the impact of this flux on the simulated Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations. As this flux is bidirectional, it could either boost or slow down Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations. Figure 5A shows that its suppression always decreases the frequency of Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations, as for the NCX. Interestingly, in hepatocytes, an inhibition of the PTP by cyclosporin A (CSA) results in an increase in the interspike interval, in agreement with the behaviour of the model. Experiments also reveal a rise in the mitochondrial membrane potential, which is also observed in the model provided that the flux of protons is reduced, reflecting the fact that the PTP is also permeable to protons.

To further challenge the prediction that the low conductance mode of the mPTP could be involved during cytosolic Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations in HeLa cells, we stimulated CSA-treated cells with histamine. As shown in Fig. 5B, inhibition of the mPTP indeed increased the period of Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations in response to both 0.3 and 1 μM histamine. A plausible candidate for this flux is the low conductance mode of the mitochondrial permeability transition pore (PTP). We analysed the impact of this flux on the simulated Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations. As this flux is bidirectional, it could either boost or slow down Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations. Figure 5A shows that its suppression always decreases the frequency of Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations, as for the NCX. Interestingly, in hepatocytes, an inhibition of the PTP by cyclosporin A (CSA) results in an increase in the interspike interval, in agreement with the behaviour of the model. Experiments also reveal a rise in the mitochondrial membrane potential, which is also observed in the model provided that the flux of protons is reduced, reflecting the fact that the PTP is also permeable to protons.

To further challenge the prediction that the low conductance mode of the mPTP could be involved during cytosolic Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations in HeLa cells, we stimulated CSA-treated cells with histamine. As shown in Fig. 5B, inhibition of the mPTP indeed increased the period of Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations in response to both 0.3 and 1 μM histamine. A plausible candidate for this flux is the low conductance mode of the mitochondrial permeability transition pore (PTP). We analysed the impact of this flux on the simulated Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations. As this flux is bidirectional, it could either boost or slow down Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations. Figure 5A shows that its suppression always decreases the frequency of Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations, as for the NCX. Interestingly, in hepatocytes, an inhibition of the PTP by cyclosporin A (CSA) results in an increase in the interspike interval, in agreement with the behaviour of the model. Experiments also reveal a rise in the mitochondrial membrane potential, which is also observed in the model provided that the flux of protons is reduced, reflecting the fact that the PTP is also permeable to protons.

Mitochondrial variables. We next investigated the dynamics of the mitochondrial variables in response to a prototypic Ca$^{2+}$ peak in the cytosol. The Ca$^{2+}$ peak simulated in Fig. 6 is a square wave pulse of 10 s duration and 1.5 μM amplitude. We chose this type of stimulation to optimise the comparison with experimental data. Figure 6A shows the massive and long-lasting (> 200 s) increase in NADH resulting from the cytosolic Ca$^{2+}$ spike. It is in agreement with observations in phenylephrine-stimulated hepatocytes. This accumulation of NADH stimulates the Krebs cycle (Eq. (19)) and increases the mitochondrial potential. However, this increase is preceded by a transient decrease in ΔΨ due to the entry of Ca$^{2+}$ from the cytosol into mitochondria (Fig. 6B). Such dynamics for ΔΨ has been observed in HeLa cells stimulated by histamine. The biphasic change in potential induces

![Figure 4](https://www.nature.com/scientificreports/)

**Figure 4.** The rate of Ca$^{2+}$ entry into mitochondria alters cytosolic Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations. (A) Relationship between the frequency of oscillations and the rate constant of the MCU. The rate constant of the NCX is the default value (black curve, $V_{\text{NCX}} = 0.35$ μM s$^{-1}$) or is increased (red curve, $V_{\text{NCX}} = 1$ μM s$^{-1}$). (B) Effect of the rate constant of the MCU on cytosolic Ca$^{2+}$ oscillations, as predicted by the model. The black curve shows oscillations for the default value ($V_{\text{MCU}} = 0.0006$ μM s$^{-1}$) given in Table 1, while the red curve shows oscillations obtained when $V_{\text{MCU}} = 0$. (C, D) Measurement of Ca$^{2+}$ variations in control (C) or MCU-silenced HeLa cells (D). Cells loaded with Fluo4 were perfused with 3 μM histamine for the time shown by the black line. Experiments are representative of more than five trials. See also Supplementary Fig. S4.
a similar dynamics of ATP (Fig. 6C) synthesis as the F_{1}F_{0}-ATPase is highly sensitive to the mitochondrial voltage (Eq. (21)). The initial drop in mitochondrial ATP is also observed experimentally 35,61. In one of these studies35, the authors suggested that the drop is a consequence of the initial activation of cytosolic processes, such as those involving ion pumps or contractile proteins, which consume ATP. The drop in mitochondrial ATP would result from its rapid transfer to the cytosol in supply for energy demand. As the increase in NADH occurs later than the rise in Ca^{2+}, ATP synthesis is expected to occur later. The model however disagrees with this interpretation.

A rise in ATP consumption by the SERCA pumps is indeed observed in the cytosol (Fig. 6D). However, the flux of the translocator (Eq. (20)) is outward for ATP, which suggests that the initial decrease in ATP can be ascribed to the decrease in \( \Delta \Psi \).

Figure 6 shows that the rate of decay of \([\text{NADH}]_{m}\) is much lower than that of Ca^{2+}. Thus, when \( C_{c} \) displays sustained oscillations, \([\text{NADH}]_{m}\) does not decrease significantly between the spikes, and remains elevated as
leads to a decrease in the period of Ca\textsuperscript{2+}. This question is best addressed by modelling. Thus, we simulated Ca\textsuperscript{2+} oscillations with a lower frequency of the Ca\textsuperscript{2+} spiking that are typically observed in HeLa cells (~0.04 s\textsuperscript{−1} and ~800 nM). Since we imposed a rather steep dependence of the MCU on \(\Delta\Psi\) and, in particular, a sensitivity that is larger than that of the NCX (\(p_1 > p_2\)),

Robustness of mitochondrial metabolism with respect to Ca\textsuperscript{2+} dynamics. Stimulus-induced Ca\textsuperscript{2+} rises in mitochondria have been suggested as essential for physiological cell bioenergetics\textsuperscript{62,63}. For such an important function, one expects Ca\textsuperscript{2+} regulation of mitochondrial metabolism to be both versatile and robust. Given the complexity and the highly non-linear character of the regulation of mitochondrial metabolism, this question is best addressed by modelling. Thus, we simulated Ca\textsuperscript{2+} spikes of different frequencies and amplitudes and computed the resulting average values of mitochondrial NADH and ATP concentrations. The results shown in Fig. 8A,B were obtained when simulating artificial square-wave Ca\textsuperscript{2+} pulses lasting 10 s, with a 100 nM basal level of Ca\textsuperscript{2+}. We found that maximal average values of NADH\textsubscript{m} and ATP\textsubscript{m} were obtained for frequencies and amplitudes of Ca\textsuperscript{2+} spiking that are typically observed in HeLa cells (~0.04 s\textsuperscript{−1} and ~800 nM). Interestingly, optimised metabolism is naturally obtained in the model for the parameter values listed in Table 1, which were independently adjusted to account for published observations on Ca\textsuperscript{2+} and mitochondrial metabolism.

Average \([\text{NADH}]_{\text{in}}\) is an increasing function of both the frequency and the amplitude of the Ca\textsuperscript{2+} spikes. As shown in Supplementary Fig. S6(A), at low frequencies the minimal values reached during oscillations much depend on the frequency. As NADH decrease is slow (Fig. 6A and Supplementary Fig. S5), \([\text{NADH}]_{\text{in}}\) does not regain its basal level between the Ca\textsuperscript{2+} spikes, the minimal value reached being fixed by the oscillations’ period. Moreover, AGC also influences this minimal value, as it is activated by low levels of cytosolic Ca\textsuperscript{2+}. In consequence, one observes a frequency modulation of the average \([\text{NADH}]_{\text{in}}\) which is more pronounced with a lower amplitude of the Ca\textsuperscript{2+} spikes. There is a similar amplitude modulation of the average \([\text{ATP}]_{\text{in}}\) more pronounced with a lower frequency of the Ca\textsuperscript{2+} spikes (Supplementary Fig. S6(C)). In contrast to \([\text{NADH}]_{\text{in}}\), average values of \([\text{ATP}]_{\text{in}}\) decrease with large frequency and/or amplitude of the Ca\textsuperscript{2+} spikes. This is due to the decrease in \(\Delta\Psi\) associated with Ca\textsuperscript{2+} entry in mitochondria, which leads to a decrease of the F\textsubscript{i}/F\textsubscript{m} ATPase activity. Consequently, an optimal amplitude and frequency of Ca\textsuperscript{2+} spiking, above which ATP synthesis decreases, can be observed (Fig. 6B and Supplementary Fig. S6 (B and D)).

Discussion

We are proposing a model for intracellular Ca\textsuperscript{2+} dynamics and mitochondrial metabolism accounting for previously published experimental observations about: (1) the effect of mitochondrial metabolism on Ca\textsuperscript{2+} cycling between ER, cytoplasm and mitochondria during oscillations induced by IP\textsubscript{3}-generating agonists, and (2) the effect of changes in cytosolic Ca\textsuperscript{2+} on mitochondrial metabolism. The model is built from a selection of previously proposed kinetic expressions for the various fluxes and reaction rates, except for the increase of mitochondrial NADH mediated by the malate-aspartate shuttle, which, to the best of our knowledge, has not been considered in previous models. We have modified the expressions for the MCU concerning its dependence with respect to \(\Delta\Psi\), and, in particular, the fact that mitochondrial Ca\textsuperscript{2+} mised metabolism is naturally obtained in the model for the parameter values listed in Table 1, which were independently adjusted to account for published observations on Ca\textsuperscript{2+} and mitochondrial metabolism.

![Figure 7. Decreasing the glycolytic input slows down the cytosolic Ca\textsuperscript{2+} oscillations.](image-url)
was introduced in the model for internal coherence. We found that ATP consumption by this pump only slightly affects cytosolic ATP dynamics. Ca^{2+}-stimulated production of mitochondrial ATP overtakes this effect by far, in contrast to what has been assumed^{35,64}.

As compared with previous modelling approaches, we also considered the existence of one additional Ca^{2+} exchange flux between the cytosol and the mitochondria (Eq. (16)). As put forward in some experimental studies, a small influx into mitochondria was found necessary to account for the observed moderate increase in mitochondrial Ca^{2+} when the MCU is inactive^{15,54,62}. Similarly, a small flux from mitochondria is required to account for the maintenance of cytosolic Ca^{2+} oscillations when the NCX is inhibited^{33}. Given these requirements, a simple assumption is the existence of a passive small flux, whose direction is imposed by the electrochemical gradient. A plausible channel that could mediate this flux is the mitochondrial PTP in its low conductance state. This assumption is corroborated by the observed increase in the period of Ca^{2+} oscillations in CSA-treated HeLa cells (Fig. 5B). Accordingly, a MCU-independent Ca^{2+} influx pathway has been characterized in HeLa cells^{65}. In disagreement with our simple expression for $j_{m}$ (Eq. (16)), studies performed in neurons however report that the mPTP can only open in response to a rise in mitochondrial Ca^{2+}^{66}. On the other hand, the requirement for an efflux pathway other than the NCX has been proposed by Bernardi and Von Stockum^{67}, who further assumed that this efflux should correspond to transient openings of the PTP.

Other modes of Ca^{2+} uptake into mitochondria, not considered in the model but reported to be active at low concentrations of cytosolic Ca^{2+}, could also play a role. In particular, Ryanodine receptors have been shown to transport Ca^{2+} inside mitochondria in cardiomyocytes and neurons^{68}. Also, a rapid mode of Ca^{2+} uptake by mitochondria (RaM) of yet poorly identified molecular nature has been reported in mitochondria isolated from liver and cardiac cells^{15,69}. The present model could be easily extended to take these fluxes into account (see for example Bazil and Dash (2011))^{70}.

The model is fully consistent with the reported effect of alterations in the rates of mitochondrial Ca^{2+} exchanges on the characteristics of Ca^{2+} oscillations. A surprising result of the simulations is that the frequency of oscillations can decrease when inhibiting the activity either of the NCX (Supplementary Fig. S3) or of the MCU (Fig. 4A) despite the fact that these fluxes have opposite directions. This behaviour of the model is confirmed experimentally^{33} (and Fig. 4). It emphasizes the fact that the slow release of Ca^{2+} from mitochondria that occurs between the cytosolic Ca^{2+} spikes paces the oscillations, as suggested by Ishii et al.^{31}. The increase in the period of oscillations in the absence of MCU is however much larger in the experiments than in the model. This suggests that the absence of MCU alters processes distinct from the oscillatory mechanism and modifies the effective sensitivity to histamine (Supplementary Table S1). In any case, our results confirm that besides IP$_3$, mitochondria play a role in determining the interspike interval in addition to other processes more often considered in models, as the time taken by the IP$_3$ receptors to recover from Ca^{2+}-induced inhibition^{71} or random opening of a sufficient number of channels^{11,12}.

Altering mitochondrial metabolism in the model also accounts for corresponding published experimental observations about energising mitochondria for example (Fig. 7). Along these lines, we also found (not shown) that decreasing the activity of the ETC ($k_\text{E}$ in Eq. (19)) increases the frequency of Ca^{2+} oscillations by diminishing the rate of Ca^{2+} pumping into mitochondria, as we have previously reported for Hint2-knock down hepatocytes^{72}. Besides, we found that the MAS NADH shuttle participates in the frequency- and amplitude-modulation of Ca^{2+}-activated metabolism, by boosting metabolism at low levels of cytosolic Ca^{2+}. Thus, the MAS NADH shuttle can increase the amplitude of NADH$_m$ oscillations. Interestingly if the effect of the shuttle is not limited when the activity of the MCU becomes significant, NADH oscillations tend to follow cytosolic Ca^{2+} variations and become spiky instead of saw tooth-like as observed experimentally. This in silico observation thus confirms the hypothesis that, upon massive activation of the Krebs cycle, $\alpha$-ketoglutarate becomes limiting for the activity of the MAS NADH shuttle^{18}.
The model finally predicted that mitochondrial metabolism remains relatively robust with respect to the amplitude and frequency of the stimulating Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations. From a physiological point of view, this property ensures that mitochondrial metabolism filters out the randomness inherent to Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations\(^{11}\) to stabilize ATP synthesis, which is a vital process. This was not expected a priori from a modeller’s point of view, given that mitochondrial metabolism is described by highly non-linear kinetic equations. The theoretically predicted robustness of mitochondrial metabolism with respect to changes in Ca\(^{2+}\) dynamics is in agreement with MCU knock-down experiments reporting no changes in mitochondrial respiration when MCU expression was reduced\(^{58}\). ATP production, however, modestly varies with the dynamical characteristics of the Ca\(^{2+}\) spikes, being at large values for periods around 25 s and amplitudes around 800 nM. These values are in the range of those usually seen in HeLa cells, on which our parameter values had been calibrated. Thus, in such a prototypic non-excitable cell, mitochondrial metabolism and Ca\(^{2+}\) dynamics are coordinated to optimise bioenergetics.

References

1. Zimmermann, B. Control of InsP\(_3\)-induced Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations in permeabilized blowfly salivary gland cells: contribution of mitochondria. *J Physiol* 525, 707–719 (2000).
2. Szabadkai, G. & Duchen, M. R. Mitochondria: the hub of cellular Ca\(^{2+}\) signaling. *Physiology* 23, 84–94 (2008).
3. Rizzuto, R., De Stefani, D., Raffaello, A. & Mammiacci, C. Mitochondria as sensors and regulators of calcium signalling. *Nat Rev Mol Cell Biol* 13, 566–78 (2012).
4. Gaspers, L. D., Memin, E. & Thomas, A. P. Calcium-dependent physiologic and pathologic stimulus-metabolic response coupling in hepatocytes. *Cell Calcium* 52, 93–102 (2012).
5. Tarasov, A. I. et al. Frequency-dependent mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) accumulation regulates ATP synthesis in pancreatic β-cells. *Pflugers Arch* 465, 543–554 (2013).
6. Glancy, B. & Balaban, R. S. Role of mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) in the regulation of cellular energetics. *Biochemistry* 51, 2599–2973 (2012).
7. Duchen, M. R. Contributions of mitochondria to animal physiology: from homeostatic sensor to calcium signalling and cell death. *J Physiol* 516, 1–17 (1999).
8. Babcock, D. F., Herrington, J., Goodwin, P. C., Park, Y. B. & Hille, B. Mitochondrial participation in the intracellular Ca\(^{2+}\) network. *J Cell Biol* 136, 833–44 (1997).
9. Berridge, M., Bootman, M. & Roderick, H. Calcium signalling; dynamics, homeostasis and remodelling. *Nat Rev Mol Cell Biol* 4, 517–29 (2003).
10. Keener, J. & Sneyd, J. In *Mathematical Physiology 2nd edn*, Vol. 8 (Springer 2009).
11. Skupin, A., Kettenmann, A. H. & Falke, M. Calcium signals driven by single channel noise. *PLoS Comput Biol* 5, e1000870 (2010).
12. Thul, R., Bellamy, T., Roderick, H., Bootman, M. & Coombes, S. Calcium oscillations. *Adv Exp Med Biol* 641, 1–27 (2008).
13. Raffaello, A. et al. The mitochondrial calcium uniporter is a multimer that can include a dominant-negative pore-forming subunit. *EMBO J* 32, 2362–76 (2013).
14. Patron, M. et al. MUC1 and MUC2 finely tune the mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) uniporter by exerting opposite effects on MCU activity. *Mol Cell* 53, 726–37 (2014).
15. Santo-Domingo, J. & Demaurex, C. Calcium uptake mechanisms of mitochondria. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 1797, 907–912 (2010).
16. Jiang, D., Zhao, L. & Clapham, D. E. Genome-wide RNAi screen identifies Letm1 as a mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) uniporter. *Science* 326, 144–147 (2009).
17. De Marchi, U. et al. NCLX protein, but not LETM1, mediates mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) extrusion, thereby limiting Ca\(^{2+}\)-induced NAD(P)H production and modulating matrix redox state. *J Biol Chem* 289, 20377–20385 (2014).
18. Satrústegui, J., Pardo, J. & Del Arco, A. Mitochondrial transporters as novel targets for intracellular calcium signalling. *Physiol Rev* 87, 89–67 (2007).
19. Gaspers, L. D., Memin, E. & Thomas, A. P. Calcium-dependent physiologic and pathologic stimulus-metabolic response coupling in hepatocytes. *Cell Calcium* 52, 93–102 (2012).
20. Thul, R., Bellamy, T., Roderick, H., Bootman, M. & Coombes, S. Calcium oscillations. *Adv Exp Med Biol* 641, 1–27 (2008).
21. Raffaello, A. et al. The mitochondrial calcium uniporter is a multimer that can include a dominant-negative pore-forming subunit. *EMBO J* 32, 2362–76 (2013).
22. Cortassa, S., Aon, M. A., Marbán, E., Winslow, R. L. & O’Rourke, B. An integrated model of cardiac mitochondrial energy metabolism and calcium dynamics. *Biophys J* 84, 2734–55 (2003).
23. Brummer, S. Characterization and possible functions of mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) transport mechanisms. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 1787, 1291–308 (2009).
24. Marhi, M., Schuster, S. & Brumen, M. Mitochondria as an important factor in the maintenance of constant amplitudes of cytosolic calcium oscillations. *Biophys Chem* 71, 125–32 (1998).
25. Fall, C. P. & Keizer, J. Model of intracellular Ca\(^{2+}\) signaling. *J Theor Biol* 210, 151–165 (2001).
26. Bertram, A., Pedersen, M. G., Luciani, D. S. & Sherman, A. A simplified model for mitochondrial ATP production. *J Theor Biol* 243, 576–586 (2006).
27. Oster, A. M., Thomas, A. P. & Shu, J. Optimal microdomain crosstalk between endoplasmic reticulum and mitochondria for Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations. *Scientific Reports* 5, 7984 (2015).
28. Ishii, K., Hirose, K. & Ino, M. Ca\(^{2+}\) shunting between endoplasmic reticulum and mitochondria underlying Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations. *EMBO report* 7, 390–396 (2007).
29. Yav, L. et al. Modulation of Ca\(^{2+}\) release and Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations in HeLa cells and fibroblasts by mitochondrial Ca\(^{2+}\) uniporter stimulation. *J Physiol* 580, 33–49 (2007).
30. Hernandez-San-Miguel, E. et al. The mitochondrial Na\(^{+}/Ca\(^{2+}\) exchanger plays a key role in the control of cytosolic Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations. *Cell Calcium* 40, 53–61 (2006).
31. Jouaville, L. S., Pinto, P., Bastianutto, C., Rutter, G. A. & Rizzuto, R. Regulation of mitochondrial ATP synthesis by calcium: evidence for a long-term metabolic priming. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 96, 13807–13812 (1999).
32. Griffiths, E. J. & Rutter, G. A. Mitochondrial calcium as a key regulator of mitochondrial ATP production in mammalian cells. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 1787, 1324–1333 (2009).
33. Hayashi, T., Rizzuto, R., Hajnoczy, G. & Su, T. P. MAM: more than just a housekeeper. *Trends Cell Biol* 19, 81–8 (2009).
34. Cao, P., Tan, X., Donovan, G., Sanderson, M. J. & Sneyd, J. A deterministic model predicts the properties of stochastic calcium oscillations in airway smooth muscle cells. *PLoS Comput Biol* 10, e1003783. (2014).
35. Smith, G. D., Wagener, J. & Keizer, J. Validity of the rapid buffering approximation near a point source of calcium ions. *Biophys J* 70, 2527–2539 (1996).
Author Contributions

B.W., L.C., G.T.V.N. and G.D. conceived and designed the simulations and experiments. B.W., L.C. and G.T.V.N. performed the experiments. B.W. performed the simulations. B.W., L.C., G.T.V.N. and G.D. analysed the data. B.W., L.C., G.T.V.N. and G.D. wrote the manuscript.

Additional Information

Supplementary information accompanies this paper at http://www.nature.com/srep
**Competing financial interests:** The authors declare no competing financial interests.

**How to cite this article:** Wacquier, B. *et al.* Interplay between intracellular Ca\(^{2+}\) oscillations and Ca\(^{2+}\)-stimulated mitochondrial metabolism. *Sci. Rep.* 6, 19316; doi: 10.1038/srep19316 (2016).

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article’s Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in the credit line; if the material is not included under the Creative Commons license, users will need to obtain permission from the license holder to reproduce the material. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/