Brief report

Use of mycelia as paths for the isolation of contaminant-degrading bacteria from soil

Shoko Furuno, Rita Remer, Antonis Chatzinotas, Hauke Harms and Lukas Y. Wick*
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research – UFZ, Department of Environmental Microbiology, 04318 Leipzig, Germany.

Summary

Mycelia of fungi and soil oomycetes have recently been found to act as effective paths boosting bacterial mobility and bioaccessibility of contaminants in vadose environments. In this study, we demonstrate that mycelia can be used for targeted separation and isolation of contaminant-degrading bacteria from soil. In a ‘proof of concept’ study we developed a novel approach to isolate bacteria from contaminated soil using mycelia of the soil oomycete *Pythium ultimum* as translocation networks for bacteria and the polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon naphthalene (NAPH) as selective carbon source. NAPH-degrading bacterial isolates were affiliated with the genera *Xanthomonas*, *Rhodococcus* and *Pseudomonas*. Except for *Rhodococcus* the NAPH-degrading isolates exhibited significant motility as observed in standard swarming and swimming motility assays. All steps of the isolation procedures were followed by cultivation-independent terminal 16S rRNA gene terminal fragment length polymorphism (T-RFLP) analysis. Interestingly, a high similarity (63%) between both the cultivable NAPH-degrading migrant and the cultivable parent soil bacterial community profiles was observed. This suggests that mycelial networks generally confer mobility to native, contaminant-degrading soil bacteria. Targeted, mycelia-based dispersal hence may have high potential for the isolation of bacteria with biotechnologically useful properties.

Introduction

As an adaptation to heterogeneous environments (Young and Crawford, 2004), soil fungi and other mycelial microorganisms (e.g. oomycetes) have developed a unique ramified growth form, which is sustained by polarized internal cellular organization to support apical growth (Glass et al., 2004). Fungi represent about 75% of the subsurface microbial biomass (0.2–0.4 mg g dry soil\(^{-1}\)) with the total length of their hyphae reaching up to \(10^3–10^4\) m per g of arable, pasture and forest topsoils respectively (Ritz and Young, 2004). In soil, fungi and bacteria often occupy shared microhabitats referred to as the bacterial–fungal interface (Johansson et al., 2004). Their growing mycelia continuously form new interfaces and novel (habitable or hostile) microhabitats for local soil bacteria (Warmink et al., 2009). Mycelia may further modify the soil structure, enter soil pores (Wösten et al., 1999) and release nutrients and/or carbon exudates (de Boer et al., 2005). By connecting air-filled space between water-filled pores (Wessels, 1997) they also provide efficient dispersal networks ['fungal highways' (Kohlmeier et al., 2005)] for otherwise immobilized bacteria and their catalytic capabilities (Wick et al., 2007; Harms et al., 2011).

Mycelia-mediated bacterial dispersal appears to depend on various factors including synergistic and antagonistic interactions, bacterial mobility (Warmink and van Elsas, 2009), physicochemical surface properties of bacterial and mycelial surfaces (Kohlmeier et al., 2005) or chemotactic movement along hyphae to chemoeffectors hotspots (Furuno et al., 2010). Such movement appears to facilitate the access to suitable microhabitats for growth (Nazir et al., 2010) and/or efficient contaminant biodegradation (Banitz et al., 2011). To date, mycelia-mediated transport of bacteria has only been reported for axenic cultures or defined microbial communities in sterile soil and never has been applied for the extraction and isolation of contaminant-degrading bacteria from soil. In a ‘proof of concept study’ we here present a novel approach for the isolation and enrichment of naphthalene (NAPH)-degrading bacteria from soil by taking advantage of bacterial dispersal along the mycelia of the oomycete *Pythium ultimum* (Maurhofer et al., 1992). We thereby
propose the use of mycelia-bound bacterial dispersal as a selection criterion for the targeted isolation and channelling of specialized bacteria to suitable growth environments.

Results and discussion

Isolation and enrichment of naphthalene-degrading bacteria

This study was motivated by earlier observations that mycelial growth of soil microorganisms enables the dispersal of defined bacterial populations in air-filled porous media (Leben, 1984; Kohlmeier et al., 2005; Warmink and van Elsas, 2009) suggesting the idea of using ‘fungal highways’ (Kohlmeier et al., 2005), i.e. mycelia as paths for the separation and isolation of contaminant-degrading bacteria. Figure 1 depicts the experimental set-up and the work flow for the separation and enrichment of NAPH-degrading bacteria by migration along the dense mycelial network of *P. ultimum* (Furuno et al., 2010): bacterial suspensions obtained from the mineral medium agar (MMA) plate and covered with 1.5 g of NAPH-contaminated urban soil (containing the bacterial community A prior to addition to the microcosm) allowing for > 0.5 cm headspace to the agar. The oomycete was subsequently allowed to penetrate the headspace and to serve as path for the movement of bacteria to the MMA. Air-borne NAPH emanating from solid NAPH deposited at > 1 cm distance to the soil served as carbon source. Capital letters indicate the sample label of the T-RFLP community analysis of bacterial 16S rRNA genes; i.e. enrichment B denominates the wash-off of the migrant community from the agar surface 5 days after first contact of the hyphae with the agar, which gave rise to isolated colonies on MMA/NAPH (enrichment D) and R2A agar (enrichment C). Simultaneously, bacteria from soil overlying the *P. ultimum*-inoculated patch (community E) were enriched on MMA/NAPH (enrichment F). Please refer to Supporting information for detailed description of the microcosms, the cultivation, sample handling techniques, the T-RFLP analysis and the identification and phylogenetic characterization of the bacterial strains.
five distinct operational taxonomic units (OTUs). Three of them were found in both the soil-community and the migrant communities. 16S rRNA gene sequence analysis of several representatives of each OTU identified the five OTUs (sequence homology within one OTU: 98–100% similarity) as Arthrobacter sp. \( (n = 3 \) colonies), Pseudomonas sp. \( (n = 20) \), Stenotrophomonas sp. \( (n = 2) \), Rhodococcus sp. \( (n = 18) \) and Xanthomonas sp. \( (n = 14) \) (Table 1). Except for Arthrobacter sp., all OTUs were found in the migrant communities. NAPH-degrading isolates were further tested for their ability to utilize selected polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) (i.e. phenanthrene, fluorene, pyrene and anthracene). Except for Stenotrophomonas sp. and Xanthomonas sp., the isolates grew on most of the PAHs tested (Table 1). The mycelia-based discrimination seems to be driven by the inherent motility of the bacteria. A recent study for instance revealed that mycelia allow for chemotactic movement of PAH-degrading bacteria to substrate hotspots even in water-unsaturated systems (Furuno et al., 2010). Such studies support the relevance of mycelial networks for successful colonization of new microhabitats in soil (Wick et al., 2007; Nazir et al., 2010) especially in vadose environments. The results of this study suggest that a majority of the cultivable NAPH-degrading bacterial consortium (Table 1) may have been capable of using the hyphal network for dispersal. Both enrichments shared three out of the five NAPH-degrading isolates \( (\text{Pseudomonas} \ sp., \ \text{Rhodococcus} \ sp. \ \text{and} \ \text{Xanthomonas} \ sp.) \). In contrast, Arthrobacter sp. and Stenotrophomonas sp. were detected only in enrichment \( F \) or \( C \), respectively (Fig. 1). Most isolates exhibited either swimming or swimming motility on standard agar plate assays with average colony diameters \( \leq \) of motile soil bacterium \( \text{Pseudomonas} \ sp. \ \text{putida} \ \text{PpG7} \) (NAH7) but \( \geq \) of poorly motile \( \text{Mycobacterium} \ \text{frederiksbergense} \ \text{LB501T} \) (Table 1). It is remarkable that the poorly motile Arthrobacter sp. appears to be fully retained in the soil, whereas the likewise poorly motile \( \text{Rhodococcus} \ sp. \) was found to move along the hydrophilic (Smits et al., 2003) hyphae of \( \text{P. ultimum} \). Due to the suspected effect of physicochemical cell surface properties of the bacteria on mycelia-mediated bacterial transport (Kohlmeier et al., 2005), the water contact angles \( (\theta_w) \) and \( \zeta \)-potentials of the migrating bacteria were further measured as descriptors for the hydrophobicity and charge of the isolates’ cell surfaces. No significant differences, however, of \( \theta_w \) were observed with all strains being moderately hydrophobic \( (\theta_w \ of \ 30^\circ \ to \ 70^\circ) \) (Table 1) according to the classification by others (Bastaens et al., 2000). The \( \zeta \)-potentials of the isolates ranged from –3 to –46 mV and exhibited no significant difference between isolates derived from enrichments \( C \), \( D \) (migrant communities) and \( F \) (soil bacterial community) as did the results from motility tests of the same strains.

Development of microbial communities was followed by cultivation-independent 16S rRNA gene-based T-RFLP analysis of DNA isolated from soil and the total bacterial colonies on agar surface in contact with the mycelia during the experiment (Fig. 1). Multivariate redundancy analysis (RDA) explained 70% of the variability of the T-RFLP fingerprints (Fig. 2) and revealed considerable variations between soil prior exposure to \( P. \ \text{ultimum} \) \( (A) \), soil penetrated by \( P. \ \text{ultimum} \) \( (E) \) and the bacteria mobilized by \( P. \ \text{ultimum} \) \( (B) \). Not surprisingly, the similarities \( (P < 0.05) \) between \( A \) and \( B \) (22%), \( A \) and \( E \) (29%), as well as \( B \) and \( E \) (29%) were low. Higher similarities, however, were found between communities directly derived from each other by dilution and plating, namely 36% between \( B \) and \( C \) (different C-substrate) and 58% between \( B \) and \( D \) (identical C-substrate). Interestingly, a high similarity (63%) between both the cultivable NAPH-degrading migrant \( \text{(B)} \) and the cultivable parent soil bacterial community profiles \( (\text{F}) \) was observed. This supports the hypothesis that mycelial networks confer mobility to a majority of the NAPH-degrading soil bacteria and likewise demonstrates that previously predicted mycelia-bound dispersal of axenic bacteria also holds true for native, soil-bound bacteria.

At this time, generalizations about the selectivity of the dispersal are difficult to make; mycelia-mediated bacterial translocation is multifactorious and may include active flagellar or non-flagellar migration in aqueous or mucoid films surrounding the hyphae of fungi and other mycelia-forming microorganisms (Wong and Griffin, 1976; Kohlmeier et al., 2005; Warmink and van Elsas, 2009) and the likely passive transport after adhesion to the apical zone of growing hyphae (Kohlmeier et al., 2005). Warmink and van Elsas (2009) even found that fungus-mediated dispersal may depend on bacterial community interactions as solely 4 out of 10 species migrated as single species along the mycelia of a saprotrophic fungus. Bacterial migration in the hyphosphere may further be driven by other factors including random bacterial dispersal, metabolic interactions and biofilm formation on the hyphae (Frey-Klett et al., 2007), chemotactic (Furuno et al., 2010) and infotactic (Vergasola et al., 2007) dispersal. Chemotactic swimming towards hyphae may already preselect certain bacteria by controlling the access to mycelial networks in soil as their metabolites may be available to bacterial commensals in the hyphosphere (Wick et al., 2010). Furthermore, due to the likely bioaccumulation of organic chemicals in the hyphal cell membranes, mycelia may act as an effective three-dimensional bio-sorbent network for hydrophobic organic compounds and thus allow for easy chemotaxis-driven access of the heterogeneously distributed contaminant to degrading bacteria in the hyphosphere.
Origin and characterization of bacterial isolates obtained from enrichment on NAPH or R2A as described in Fig. 1.

Table 1. Origin and characterization of bacterial isolates obtained from enrichment on NAPH or R2A as described in Fig. 1.

| Isolates | Accession No. | Swarming (cm) | Swimming (cm) | Zeta potential (mV) | Contact angle (degree) | NAPH | PHEN | FLUO | ANTH | PYRE |
|----------|---------------|---------------|---------------|--------------------|------------------------|------|------|------|------|------|
| **C**    |                |               |               |                    |                        |      |      |      |      |      |
| Stenotrophomonas sp. | GU586312 | 0.3 ± 0.0 | 0.3 ± 0.0 | -3 ± 1 | 37 ± 1 | No | No | No | No | No |
| Xanthomonas sp. | EU373342 | 2.1 ± 0.0 | 4.5 ± 0.9 | -4 ± 0 | 33 ± 2 | Yes | No | No | No | No |
| Pseudomonas sp. | GU391489 | 0.9 ± 0.0 | 2.2 ± 0.3 | -28 ± 1 | 43 ± 2 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Rhodococcus opacus | AF095715 | 0.3 ± 0.1 | 0.1 ± 0.0 | -29 ± 2 | 67 ± 4 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| **D**    |                |               |               |                    |                        |      |      |      |      |      |
| Pseudomonas sp. | EF062805 | 1.6 ± 0.1 | 2.1 ± 0.2 | -4 ± 1 | 42 ± 3 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Pseudomonas sp. | GU391489 | Vidé infra | Vidé infra | -46 ± 2 | 40 ± 2 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Pseudomonas sp. | EF062805 | 1.9 ± 1.1 | 0.6 ± 0.2 | -39 ± 1 | 43 ± 2 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Rhodococcus opacus | FJ768000 | 0.6 ± 0.2 | 0.4 ± 0.1 | -29 ± 2 | 67 ± 4 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Xanthomonas sp. | EU373342 | 1.1 ± 0.1 | 1.7 ± 0.1 | -10 ± 1 | 43 ± 2 | Yes | No | No | No | No |
| **F**    |                |               |               |                    |                        |      |      |      |      |      |
| Arthrobacter sp. | DQ158001 | 0.6 ± 0.3 | 0.1 ± 0.0 | -24 ± 2 | 41 ± 2 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Rhodococcus opacus | FJ768000 | 1.4 ± 0.7 | 1.0 ± 0.4 | -28 ± 1 | 48 ± 1 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Reference strains | | | | | | | | | |
| M. frederiksbergense LB501T | | | | | | | | | |
| – | | 0.1 ± 0.0 | 0.2 ± 0.0 | -41 ± 5 | 107 ± 3 | No | No | No | Yes | No |
| – | | 2.0 ± 1.1 | 4.1 ± 0.3 | -35 ± 3 | 41 ± 2.5 | Yes | Yes | No | No | No |

a. Motility was scored as the diameter of bacterial displacement on swarm plates after incubation for 24 h at 20°C. Data represent the means ± standard deviation from six readings of three replicate plates per treatment.

b. Growth in liquid culture on NAPH except for Stenotrophomonas sp. and M. frederiksbergense LB501T with growth on R2A.

c. Growth on MMA in presence of solid PAH: NAPH = naphthalene; PHEN = phenanthrene; FLUO = fluoranthene; ANTH = anthracene; PYRE = pyrene. Bacterial growth was tested on minimal medium agar (MMA) plates with 15 mg of the corresponding solid PAH spread onto the agar surface. Growth and utilization of PAH as carbon source was considered to take place after formation of clearly visible colonies after 17 days of incubation, otherwise not found if the strains were plated on MMA in the absence of a PAH source.

d. Bastiaens and colleagues (2000).

e. Dunn and Gunsalus (1973).
Potential for biotechnological applications

This study therefore has been designed to deliver the ‘proof of principle’ that mycelia facilitate bacterial movement in non-sterilized soil and that this phenomenon may be used for the isolation of contaminant-degrading bacteria. All isolates obtained by our approach belong to genera previously known to biodegrade PAHs (e.g. Efroymson and Alexander, 1991; Uz et al., 2000; Polek et al., 2002; Molina et al., 2009). Although no new genera were isolated by the enrichment procedures used in this study, there is much potential to tailor mycelia-based enrichment set-ups for the isolation of bacterial strains with desired specific properties. Possible variations include (i) the choice of the mycelial network (e.g. phylum, physicochemical surface properties, PAH-degradation capacity or other ecological traits of the hyphal microorganism), (ii) the time allowed for migration to separate bacteria of variable motility (i.e. allowing for a chromatographic effect in the dispersal of soil bacteria), and (iii) meaningful positioning of chemoattractants or chemorepellents. Beside its potential value for the isolation of novel degrader organisms, this research may lead to a better understanding of the interactions between mycelia (of, for example, fungi) and bacteria. It can thus result in improved remediation approaches for soils polluted with PAHs or other hydrophobic organic contaminants.

Acknowledgements

This study was supported by the European MC-EST 20984 grant (RAISEBIO). It contributes to the CITE research programme of the Helmholtz Association. Technical help from M. Kolbe, J. Reichenbach, B. Würz, V. Jaschik and K. Lübke is greatly acknowledged. We also thank I. Fetzer for support in performing the statistical analyses.
References

Abdo, Z., Schuette, U.M.E., Bent, S.J., Williams, C.J., Forney, L.J., and Joyce, P. (2006) Statistical methods for characterizing diversity of microbial communities by analysis of terminal restriction fragment length polymorphisms of 16S rRNA genes. *Environ Microbiol* 8: 929–938.

Baehler, E., de Werra, P., Wick, L.Y., Pechy-Tarr, M., Mathys, S., Maurhofer, M., and Keel, C. (2006) Two novel MvaT-like global regulators control exoproduct formation and biocontrol activity in root-associated *Pseudomonas fluorescens* CHAO. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 19: 313–329.

Banitz, T., Fetzer, I., Johst, K., Wick, L.Y., and Frank, K. (2011) Assessing biodegradation benefits from dispersal networks. *Ecol Model* 222: 2552–2560.

Bastaens, L., Springael, D., Wattiaux, P., Harms, H., de Wachtler, R., Verachtert, H., and Diels, L. (2000) Isolation of adherent polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon (PAH) degrading bacteria using PAH sorbing carriers. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 66: 1834–1843.

de Boer, W., Folman, L.B., Summellber, R.C., and Boddy, L. (2005) Living in a fungal world: impact of fungi on soil bacterial niche development. *FEMS Microbiol Rev* 29: 795–811.

Dunn, N.W., and Gunsalus, I.C. (1973) Transmissible plasmid coding early enzymes of oxidation in *Pseudomonas putida*. *J Bacteriol* 114: 974–979.

Efroymson, R.A., and Alexander, M. (1991) Biodegradation by an *Arthrobacter* species of hydrocarbons partitioned into an organic-solvent. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 57: 1441–1447.

Frey-Klett, P., Garbaye, J., and Tarkka, M. (2007) The mycorrhiza helper bacteria revisited. *New Phytol* 176: 22–36.

Furuno, S., Pätzolt, K., Rabe, C., Neu, T., Harms, H., and Wick, L. (2010) Fungal mycelia allow chemotactic dispersal of PAH-degrading bacteria in water-unsaturated systems. *Environ Microbiol* 12: 1391–1398.

Glass, N.L., Rasmussen, C., Rocca, M.G., and Read, N.D. (2004) Hyphal homing, fusion, and mycelial interconnect- edness. *Trends Microbiol* 12: 135–141.

Harms, H., Schlosser, D., and Wick, L.Y. (2011) Untapped potential: exploiting fungi in bioremediation of hazardous chemicals. *Nat Rev Microbiol* 9: 177–192.

Himmel, P.C. (1986) *Principles of Colloid and Surface Chemistry*. New York, NY, USA: Marcel Dekker.

Johansson, J.F., Paul, L.R., and Finlay, R.D. (2004) Microbial interactions in the mycorrhizosphere and their significance for sustainable agriculture. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 48: 1–13.

Kohlemeier, S., Smits, T.H.M., Ford, R., Keel, C., Harms, H., and Wick, L.Y. (2005) Taking the fungal highway: mobilization of pollutant degrading bacteria by fungi. *Environ Sci Technol* 39: 4640–4646.

Leben, C. (1994) Spread of plant pathogenic bacteria with fungal hyphae. *Phytopathology* 74: 983–986.

van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., Lyklema, J., Norde, W., Schraa, G., and Zehnder, A.J.B. (1987) Electrophoretic mobility and hydrophobicity as a measure to predict the initial steps of bacterial adhesion. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 53: 1898–1901.

Maurhofer, M., Keel, C., Schneider, U., Voisard, C., Haas, D., and Défago, G. (1992) Influence of enhanced antibiotic production in *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain CHAO on its disease suppressive capacity. *Phytopathology* 82: 190–195.

Molina, M.C., Gonzalez, N., Bautista, L.F., Sanz, R., Simarro, R., Sanchez, I., and Sanz, J.L. (2009) Isolation and genetic identification of PAH degrading bacteria from a microbial consortium. *Biodegradation* 20: 789–800.

Nazir, R., Warmink, J.A., Boersma, H., and van Elsas, J.D. (2010) Mechanisms that promote bacterial fitness in fungal-affected soil microhabitats. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 71: 169–185.

Polek, B., Dragun, M., Gocdickova, J., and Ferianc, P. (2002) Naphthalene biodegradation by microbial consortium as a contribution to bioremediation treatments. *Biologia* 57: 305–311.

R Development Core Team (2009) R: A language and environment for statistical computing [WWW document]. URL http://www.R-project.org.

Ritz, K., and Young, I.M. (2004) Interactions between soil structure and fungi. *Mycologist* 18: 52–59.

Smits, T.H.M., Wick, L.Y., Harms, H., and Keel, C. (2003) Characterization of the surface hydrophobicity of filamentous fungi. *Environ Microbiol* 5: 85–91.

Uz, I., Duan, Y.P., and Ogram, A. (2000) Characterization of the naphthalene-degrading bacterium, *Rhodococcus opacus* M213. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* 185: 231–238.

Vergassola, M., Villermaux, E., and Shraiman, B.I. (2007) ‘infoaxes’ as a strategy for searching without gradients. *Nature* 445: 406–409.

Warmink, J.A., and van Elsas, J.D. (2009) Migratory response of soil bacteria to *Lysophyllum* sp strain Karsten in soil microcosms. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 75: 2820–2830.

Warmink, J.A., Nazir, R., and van Elsas, J.D. (2009) Universal and species-specific bacterial ‘fungiphiles’ in the mycospheres of different basidiomycetous fungi. *Environ Microbiol* 11: 300–312.

Wessels, J.G.H. (1997) Hydrophobines, proteins that change the nature of the fungal surface. *Adv Microb Physiol* 38: 1–45.

Wick, L.Y., Remer, R., Würz, B., Reichenbach, J., Braun, S., Schäfer, F., and Harms, H. (2007) Effect of fungal hyphae on the access of bacteria to phenanthrene in soil. *Environ Sci Technol* 41: 500–505.

Wick, L.Y., Furuno, S., and Harms, H. (2010) Fungi as transport vectors for contaminants and contaminant-degrading bacteria. In *Handbook of Hydrocarbon Microbiology*. Timmis, K.N. (ed.). Berlin, Heidelberg, New York: Springer-Verlag, pp. 1556–1561.

Wong, P.T.G., and Griffin, D.M. (1976) Bacterial movement at high matric potentials I. In artificial and natural soils. *Soil Biol Biochem* 8: 215–218.

Wösten, H.A.B., van Wetter, M.A., Lugones, L.G., van der Mei, H.C., Busscher, H.J., and Wessels, J.G.H. (1999) How a fungus escapes the water to grow into air. *Curr Biol* 9: 85–88.

Wu, Q.L.L., Chatzinotas, A., Wang, J.J., and Boenigk, J. (2009) Genetic diversity of eukaryotic plankton assemblages in eastern Tibetan lakes differing by their salinity and altitude. *Microb Ecol* 58: 569–581.

Young, I.M., and Crawford, J.W. (2004) Interactions and self-organisation in the soil-microbe complex. *Science* 304: 1634–1637.
Supporting information

Additional Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this article:

Detailed information on experimental procedures on: Organisms and culture conditions; microcosm for the separation of bacteria after migration along mycelia; isolation of NAPH degraders from soil; identification and phylogenetic characterization of bacterial strains; T-RFLP analysis of the enriched microbial communities; determination of physicochemical cell surface properties; and bacterial motility assays.

Please note: Wiley-Blackwell are not responsible for the content or functionality of any supporting materials supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing material) should be directed to the corresponding author for the article.