Müzik Eğitimi Alanında Yazılış Olan Lisansüstü Tezlerin İçerik ve Yöntemlerinin Karşılaştırmalı Olarak İncelenmesi

Onur GÜÇLİ*

| Makale Bilgisi | ÖZET |
|----------------|------|
| Geliş Tarihi:  | Bu araştırmda, Türkiye'de müzik eğitimi alanında yazılan lisansüstü tezlerin içerik analizi yapılmıştır. Bu amaç doğrultusunda 339 adet lisansüstü tez incelenmiştir. Betimsel nitelikle olan araştırmda doküman analizi yöntemiyle toplanan veriler, içerik analizi yapılarak çözümlenmiştir. Araştırmda elde edilen veriler betimsel istatistik yöntemleriyle analiz edilerek tablolar halinde sunulmuştur. Araştırmda incelenen lisansüstü tezlerin büyük çoğunluğunun yüksek lisans tezini olduğu, müzik eğitimi alanında erişilebilir ilk tezin 1986 senesinde ve en fazla tezin 2019 senesinde yazıldığı, tezlerin büyük çoğunluğunun Gazi Üniversitesi'nde ve eğitim bilimleri enstitülerinde yapıldığı, tezlerin büyük çoğunluğunun nüfus ya da karma araştırmalar yöntemleri ve tarama modeli kullanılarak çalşıldığı, veri toplama yöntemi olarak görüşme ve anket yönteminin en çok kullanılanı, veri analiz yöntemleri olarak en çok nicel veri analiz yöntemlerinin kullanıldığı, veri toplama arac olarak en fazla doküman analizi ve anketlerin kullanıldığı, deneySEL desen kullanılarak çalışan tezlerde en çok orientasyon testi - son test - kontrol grubu modelin kullanıldığını, deney grubu katılmacılığı sayısının ortalamasının 23,48, kontrol grubu katılmacılığı sayısının ortalamasının 16,34 olduğu, uygulama sürelerinin ortalama 14 hafta süربعüğünü, betimsel ve anlam çarparı istatistiklerin birlikte kullanıldığını ve çalışma grubu olarak en çok müzik alanındaki üniversite öğrencileri ile 6-15 yaş aralığındaki çocuklarnın seçilğini sonucuna ulaşmıştır. Anahtar Sözcükler: Müzik, müzik eğitimi, içerik analizi, lisansüstü tezler |
| Kabul Tarihi:  | 11.01.2021 |
| Erken Görünüm Tarihi: | 16.01.2021 |
| Basım Tarihi:  | 30.04.2022 |

A Comparative Analysis of Content and Methods of Postgraduate Theses Made in the Field of Music Education

| Article Information | ABSTRACT |
|---------------------|----------|
| Received:           | In this research, content analysis of graduate theses written in music education in Turkey was made. For this purpose, 339 postgraduate theses were examined. In the descriptive research, the data collected by the document analysis method were analyzed by making content analysis. The data obtained in the research were analyzed with descriptive statistics methods and presented with tables. Postgraduate thesis in the field of music education, where the majority of the postgraduate theses examined in the research are master's theses, the first thesis accessible in the field of music education and the HEC national thesis center was written in 1986 and the most thesis was in 2019, the majority of these were written in Gazi University and educational sciences institutes. The majority of these are studied using quantitative or mixed research methods and scanning model, interview and survey methods is used as the data collection method, quantitative data analysis methods are used as the data analysis method. The average of the number of participants in the experimental group was 23,48, and the average of the number of participants in the control group was 16,34, while the most used document analysis and questionnaires were used as the data collection tool, the model with the most pre-test - post-test - control group was used in the theses studied using the experimental design. It was concluded that the duration of application lasted 14 weeks on average, descriptive and meaningful statistics were used together, and the university students in the music field and children between the ages of 6-15 were selected as the study group. Keywords: Content analysis, music, music education, postgraduate theses |
| Accepted:          | 11.01.2020 |
| Online First:      | 16.01.2020 |
| Published:         | 30.04.2022 |

doi: 10.16986/HUJE.2021066836 Makale Türü (Article Type): Araştırma Makalesi

Kaynakça Gösterimi: Güçlü, O. (2022). Müzik eğitimi alanında yazılan lisansüstü tezlerin içerik ve yöntemlerinin karşılaştırmalı olarak incelenmesi. Hacettepe Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 37(2), 739-751. doi: 10.16986/HUJE.2021066836

Citation Information: Güçlü, O. (2022). A comparative analysis of content and methods of postgraduate theses made in the field of music education. Hacettepe University Journal of Education, 37(2), 739-751. doi: 10.16986/HUJE.2021066836

* Doç. Dr., Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi, Ahmet Keleşoğlu Eğitim Fakültesi, Güzel Sanatlar Eğitimi Bölümü, Müzik Eğitimi A.B.D., Konya-TÜRKİYE. e-posta: b_onur_k@hotmail.com (ORCID: 0000-0001-5744-4057) e-ISSN: 2536-4758 http://www.efdergi.hacettepe.edu.tr/
1. INTRODUCTION

Postgraduate is a high-level education program process in the context of graduate education (science expertise) or doctorate education provided by the institutes following four years of education at the faculties. It is designed in the discipline or science of interest to train scientists, researchers, and highly qualified labor the societies need, who obtained a bachelor's degree or diploma at a conceptual level (Karaman & Bakurci, 2010, p.97). The general purpose of postgraduate education is to raise highly qualified labor such as the scientist and faculty members that the country needs, and to conduct research for solving the problems of the country and to provide technical development (Sevinç, 2001, p. 126). According to Karasar (2001, p.3), the accumulation of science, in other words, the contribution of the large and small contributions of the previous ones on which it rises, is an integrated product and requires detailed reporting of each scientific research. The detailed reporting of the research carried out for the general purpose of postgraduate education constitutes the postgraduate theses.

The fact that education is a dimension, tool, method and field has made music an indispensable element of education. Education is a process in which verbal, numerical, physical and artistic skills are acquired together and individuals are brought into society as a member of society. In addition, music education has a structure that provides both the communication between other dimensions of education and the interaction between other branches of art (Türkmén, 2016, p. 9). If we associate music education with time, music education is a process and it carries the psychological, social, cultural, cognitive, affective, and psychomotor qualities of the people since the existence of music with itself. It is always the individual and society that interact in this process. Music education starts from pre-school until the end of higher education (Feyzî and Tekin, 2019, s.31). Professional music education is one of the three main types of music education and oriented for individuals who have an aptitude for music or interest in music and choose music as a job, a profession, serious-continuous occupation, task, or study area (Gencel Ataman, 2009, p. 342).

In professional music education, new and extended opportunities emerged with the laws enacted in 1982-1983 to develop research and academic education programs at undergraduate, postgraduate and doctorate or proficiency in art degrees (Ucan, 2005, p. 55). As a result of these efforts, the master's theses written by Sibel Dogan Ozbakan in 1986 named "The decisions are taken by the National Education Councils in the Republican Era regarding music education" and by Filiz Kamacioglu "In-school and out-of-school music education" have taken its place in the literature as the oldest and accessible studies with the keyword music education from the Council of Higher Education National Thesis Center. Today, it is observed that there are postgraduate programs in many universities, and the field of music education research under these programs reached a large proportion.

When the Council of Higher Education National Thesis Center database is reviewed, it is seen that there are 457 postgraduate theses accessible between 1986-2020 with the keyword music education. The content analysis of these studies in the literature is very important in terms of providing important convenience and a guide for researchers who will study in the field. Such content and meta-analysis studies have attracted the attention of many researchers in recent years (Selcuk, Palanci, Kandemir & Dundar, 2014, p. 431). When the literature is reviewed, there can be seen the content analysis studies on postgraduate theses in the field of music (Gencel Ataman, 2009, Karkın, 2011, Topbaş, 2013, Apaydınılı, Yıldırım Orhan ve Evren Tunca, 2014, Çeşit, Kaptanoğlu ve Çanakçı, 2015, Öztrutan, 2016, Arca, Birel ve Qader, Ertekin, 2017, Akıncı, Ertek Baba ve Köse, Kursarslan, Yıldırım Orhan ve Göklent, Tepeli ve Yüksek 2018, Soycan ve Babacan, 2019, Can ve Güneş, Feyzî ve Tekin, Gebelolu, Üstün, 2020, vb.), however, not any content analysis studies in the field of music education reached. It can be considered as the reason for this situation that there are many postgraduate theses (i: 339) accessed with the keyword music education. When international research examined, it is seen that content analysis studies have been made for articles on music education. (Schmidt and Zdzinski (1993), McCharity (1999), Yarbrough (2002), Kantorski and Stegman (2006), Miksza and Johnson (2012), Killian, Liu and Reid (2012), Nichols (2013), Silveria and Diaz (2014), Stambau and Dyson (2016), Silvey, Sims, Pohman and Regier (2019), etc). Based on this, the research aims to present the current situation and to carry out the content analysis of the postgraduate theses, these accessed with the keyword music education from the Council of Higher Education National Thesis Center, have permission to publish and were written between 1986-2020.

2. METHOD

Screening model was adopted as the basic approach in the research. If a research bears a purpose to describe a past or present event as it exists, screening models are used (İslamoğlu and Añaçık, 2014, p. 97). In this descriptive study, the data collected by document analysis method were analyzed by content analysis methods. The data summarized and interpreted in descriptive analysis were subjected to a deeper process in content analysis, and concepts and themes that are not noticeable with a descriptive approach can be discovered as a result of this analysis (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2013, p. 259). Content analysis involves systematically screening of printed and visual materials and analyzing thematically in terms of certain categories. (Saban, 2009, p. 838).
2.1. Research Universe and Participants

The research universe consisted of postgraduate theses scanned with the keyword "music education" at the YÖK national thesis center and without access restrictions. In the limitation of the theses examined in the research, the following parameters were taken into consideration and 339 theses formed the research sample.

1. YÖK national thesis center database was used to determine theses examined.

2. On 29.05.2020, 457 postgraduate theses, which were conducted between 1986-2020, with the keyword "music education" in the database, were included in the research. 109 of these theses that did not have permission to publish and 9 of them, which were reached with the keyword "music education" but were determined outside the field of music education, were excluded from the sample group.

3. In the research, postgraduate theses written in Turkish language were analyzed.

2.2. Creating Content Analysis Themes

Following the literature review of theses written in the field of music education, those done with the content analysis have been chosen as sources. There were 17 themes/questions in total created, 6 of them to analyze the general information about 339 postgraduate theses in the field of music education, 6 of them to analyze the method chapters of the theses and 5 of them to analyze those using experimental design. The themes / questions created were presented to 3 experts to ensure the content validity. In the direction of expert opinions, 2 themes / questions were removed and the remaining 15 themes / questions are shown in Table 1.

| Themes / Questions Created for the Analysis of General Information About Theses | Postgraduate theses in music education; |
| --- | --- |
| 1. What is the distribution by type of publication? |  |
| 2. What is the distribution by publication years? |  |
| 3. What is the distribution according to the universities in which it is made? |  |
| 4. What is the distribution according to the institutes it is made? |  |
| 5. What is the distribution of the researcher by gender? |  |

| Themes / Questions Created for the Analysis of Method Parts of Theses | Theses written using experimental design in the field of music education; |
| --- | --- |
| 6. What is their distribution according to research methods? |  |
| 7. What is their distribution according to research models? |  |
| 8. What are their distributions according to data collection methods? |  |
| 9. What are their distributions according to data collection tools? |  |
| 10. What are their distributions according to data analysis methods? |  |

| Themes / Questions Created for the Analysis of Theses Using Experimental Design |  |
| --- | --- |
| 11. What is their distribution by experiment models? |  |
| 12. What is the distribution according to the number of experiment and control group participants? |  |
| 13. What is the distribution according to the application times? |  |
| 14. What are their distributions according to data analysis methods? |  |
| 15. What is their distribution according to the sample groups? |  |

2.3. Data Analysis

For content analysis of 339 postgraduate theses included in the study, sub-themes of each theme / question were created (164 sub-themes in total) and postgraduate theses are examined many times and coded individually. With coding, data can be conceptualized more easily. In coding, data is made visible using specific pointers, and coding ensures that data captures a certain coherence of meaning (Keller, 1995; as cited in Baltaci, 2017). For ensuring the internal consistency in the coding the data were coded twice by the researcher in three weeks intervals and reliability coefficient calculated by Miles and Huberman formula (Reliability coefficient=number of consensus nominal/ (number of consensus nominal + number of nonconsensus nominal) X100) (Baltaci, 2017, p.8). The coding internal consistency coefficient in the study was %94.39. "Microsoft Excel" and "SPSS package program" were used for both coding and analysis of the encoded data. The data were analyzed with descriptive statistics methods (percentage, frequency, arithmetic mean and standard deviation) and presented in figures with tables.

3. FINDINGS

In this section, the findings are arranged according to sub-problems and presented in tables and graphics.

http://www.efdergi.hacettepe.edu.tr/
Table 2.

*Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by Publication Types*

| Publication Type                  | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|----------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Master Thesis                    | 285           | 84.08           |
| Doctoral Thesis                  | 53            | 15.63           |
| Master’s Application Report      | 1             | 0.29            |
| Total                            | 339           | 100             |

Table 2 indicates the distribution of postgraduate theses written in the field of music education by types of publications. According to Table 2, 285 of the 339 postgraduate theses are master’s theses (84.08%), 53 are doctoral theses (15.63%) and 1 is the master’s application report (0.29%). This table shows that the majority of the theses in the field of music education are master’s theses; It is also noteworthy that the number of doctoral theses remains at one fifth of the number of master’s theses.

Table 3.

*Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by Publication Years*

| Publication Years | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|-------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| 2019              | 70            | 20.65           |
| 2018              | 24            | 7.08            |
| 2017              | 10            | 2.95            |
| 2016              | 15            | 4.42            |
| 2015              | 17            | 5.01            |
| 2014              | 16            | 4.72            |
| 2013              | 14            | 4.13            |
| 2012              | 11            | 3.24            |
| 2011              | 19            | 5.60            |
| 2010              | 16            | 4.72            |
| 2009              | 12            | 3.54            |
| 2008              | 23            | 6.78            |
| 2007              | 14            | 4.13            |
| 2006              | 17            | 5.01            |
| 2005              | 5             | 1.47            |
| 2004              | 7             | 2.06            |
| 2003              | 4             | 1.18            |
| 2002              | 7             | 2.06            |
| 2001              | 3             | 0.88            |
| 2000              | 4             | 1.18            |
| 1999              | 7             | 2.06            |
| 1998              | 5             | 1.47            |
| 1997              | 6             | 1.77            |
| 1996              | 3             | 0.88            |
| 1995              | 4             | 1.18            |
| 1994              | 2             | 0.59            |
| 1992              | 2             | 0.59            |
| 1988              | 1             | 0.29            |
| 1986              | 1             | 0.29            |
| Total             | 339           | 100             |

Table 3 presents the distribution of postgraduate theses in the field of music education by publication years. When Table 3 is examined, it is seen that the first thesis accessible in the field of music education and YÖK national thesis was written in 1986. 80% of theses written in 29 different years were written after 2006 (f: 278). It is seen that the most theses in the field of music education was written in 2019 (f: 70, 20.65%). The level of increase of theses by years is shown in Figure 1.

Figure 1. Distribution of postgraduate theses in music education by publication years
When Figure 1 is examined, it is clearly seen that there has been a great increase in the number of theses in the field of music education especially in the last two years (2018-2019).

Table 4.

Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by University

| University                           | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|--------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Gazi University                      | 95            | 28.02           |
| Marmara University                   | 33            | 9.73            |
| Atatürk University                   | 23            | 6.78            |
| Necmettin Erbakan University         | 19            | 5.60            |
| Pamukkale University                 | 15            | 4.42            |
| İnönü University                     | 14            | 4.13            |
| Selçuk University                    | 14            | 4.13            |
| Uludağ University                    | 14            | 4.13            |
| Dokuz Eylül University               | 13            | 3.83            |
| Afyon Kocatepe University            | 12            | 3.54            |
| Abant Izzet Baysal University        | 9             | 2.65            |
| Cumhuriyet University                | 9             | 2.65            |
| Mehmet Akif Ersoy University         | 9             | 2.65            |
| Samsun On Dokuz Mayıs University     | 9             | 2.65            |
| Ankara University                    | 8             | 2.36            |
| Haliç University                     | 6             | 1.77            |
| Van Yüzüncü Yıl University           | 6             | 1.77            |
| Trakya University                    | 4             | 1.18            |
| Kırıkkale University                 | 3             | 0.88            |
| Ömer Halis Demir University          | 3             | 0.88            |
| Trabzon University                   | 3             | 0.88            |
| Anadolu University                   | 2             | 0.59            |
| İstanbul Teknik University            | 2             | 0.59            |
| Mimar Sinan Güzel Sanatlar University | 2             | 0.59            |
| Adıyaman University                  | 1             | 0.29            |
| Boğaziçi University                  | 1             | 0.29            |
| Hacettepe University                 | 1             | 0.29            |
| İstanbul Aydın University            | 1             | 0.29            |
| İstanbul Okan University             | 1             | 0.29            |
| Karadeniz Teknik University          | 1             | 0.29            |
| Kocaeli University                   | 1             | 0.29            |
| Niğde University                     | 1             | 0.29            |
| Çanakkale On Sekiz Mart U.            | 1             | 0.29            |
| Sakarya University                   | 1             | 0.29            |
| Süleyman Demirel University          | 1             | 0.29            |
| Yıldız Teknik University             | 1             | 0.29            |
| **Total**                            | **339**       | **100**         |

It is seen in Table 4 that postgraduate theses in the field of music education are carried out in 36 different universities. More than half of the 339 postgraduate theses (f: 170) were conducted at Gazi, Marmara, Atatürk and Necmettin Erbakan University. Gazi University stands out as the university where theses are made the most (f: 95, 28.02%). This situation may be caused by Gazi University starting postgraduate education compared to many universities and having a high number of academic staff.

Table 5.

Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by Institutes

| Institutes                                    | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|------------------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Institute of Educational Sciences             | 212           | 62.54           |
| Institute of Social Sciences                  | 86            | 25.37           |
| Institute of Science                          | 28            | 8.26            |
| Fine Arts Institute                           | 7             | 2.06            |
| Graduate Education Institute                  | 4             | 1.18            |
| Institute of Health Sciences                  | 2             | 0.59            |
| **Total**                                     | **339**       | **100**         |

Table 5 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses in the field of music education by institutes. According to Table 5, 212 (62.54%) of the 339 postgraduate theses written in the field of music education are in education institutes, 86 (25.37%) in
social sciences institutes, 28 (8.26%) in science institutes. 7 (2.06%) worked in fine arts institutes, 4 in post-graduate education institutes and 2 in health science institutes. When the overall total is analyzed, it is seen that more than half of the postgraduate theses are studied in educational sciences institutes. This finding indicate that graduate students who want to study in the field of music education prefer music education programs affiliated to educational sciences institutes.

### Table 6.
**Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by the gender of the researcher**

| Gender  | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|---------|---------------|-----------------|
| Male    | 178           | 52.51           |
| Female  | 161           | 47.49           |
| Total   | 339           | 100             |

Table 6 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses in the field of music education by gender of the researcher. As seen in Table 6, 178 of the graduate theses written in the field of music education were prepared by researchers, male (52.51%) and 161 female (47.49%). In line with this finding, it can be said that there is no big difference in the number of male and female researchers who write a postgraduate thesis in the field of music education.

### Table 7.
**Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by Research Methods**

| Research Methods | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Quantitative     | 137           | 40.41           |
| Mixed            | 115           | 33.92           |
| Qualitative      | 87            | 25.66           |
| Total            | 339           | 100             |

According to Table 7, 137 of the postgraduate theses written in the field of music education were prepared using quantitative (40.41%), 115 mixed (33.92) and 87 qualitative (25.66%) research methods. According to this finding, most of the theses (f: 252, 74.33%) written in the field of music education were studied using quantitative or mixed research methods.

### Table 8.
**Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by Research Models**

| Research Models          | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|--------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Descriptive research     | 293           | 86.43           |
| Empirical Methods        | 27            | 7.96            |
| Mixed Typed              | 19            | 5.60            |
| Total                    | 339           | 100             |

Table 8 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses in music education by research models. According to table 8, it is seen that more than three quarters of the total 339 theses are conducted by scanning model (86.43%), and the remaining quarters are carried out by trial model (7.96%) and mixed (5.60%) models. According to this finding, in most of the theses written in the field of music education, the scanning model was used as a research model. This situation may indicate that more studies are needed to be carried out with the experimental model related to the field of music education.

### Table 9.
**Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by Data Collection Methods**

| Data Collection Methods                          | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|-------------------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Interview and Survey Methods                   | 155           | 45.72           |
| Document Analysis                               | 66            | 19.47           |
| Document Analysis - Interview and Survey        | 65            | 19.17           |
| Interview and Survey, Experimental Methods      | 14            | 4.13            |
| Observation and Experimental                    | 12            | 3.54            |
| Experimental                                   | 10            | 2.95            |
| Interview and Survey - Observation             | 6             | 1.77            |
| Interview - Observation and Experimental        | 4             | 1.18            |
| Observation                                    | 3             | 0.88            |
| Document Analysis and Experimental              | 2             | 0.59            |
| Document Analysis and Observation              | 1             | 0.29            |
| Observation and Survey                         | 1             | 0.29            |
| Total                                          | 339           | 100             |

Table 9 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses in music education by data collection methods. According to Table 9, interview and survey (f: 155, 45.72%), document analysis (f:66, 19.47%) and document analysis - interview and survey (f: 65,
19.17% (f: 286, 84.36). In the remaining theses, the data were obtained by other data collection methods (f: 53, 15.62%).

Table 10. 
**Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by Data Collection Tools**

| Data Collection Tools                        | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|---------------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Survey                                      | 80            | 23.60           |
| Document Analysis                           | 68            | 20.06           |
| Interview Form                              | 36            | 10.62           |
| Scale                                       | 33            | 9.73            |
| Survey and Document Analysis                | 25            | 7.37            |
| Survey and Interview Form                   | 21            | 6.19            |
| Scale and Survey                            | 16            | 4.72            |
| Observation Form                            | 11            | 3.24            |
| Document Analysis and Interview Form        | 11            | 3.24            |
| Tests                                       | 10            | 2.95            |
| Tests and Survey                            | 4             | 1.18            |
| Scale - Observation Form - Interview Form   | 4             | 1.18            |
| Interview Form and Scale                    | 3             | 0.88            |
| Scale - Tests                               | 3             | 0.88            |
| Tests - Observation Form - Interview Form   | 3             | 0.88            |
| Observation Form and Survey                 | 3             | 0.88            |
| Evaluation Form                             | 2             | 0.59            |
| Document Analysis and Scale                 | 1             | 0.29            |
| Document Analysis - Tests and Survey        | 1             | 0.29            |
| Tests and Observation Forms                 | 1             | 0.29            |
| Tests - Scale - Survey                      | 1             | 0.29            |
| Observation Forms and Scale                 | 1             | 0.29            |
| Scale - Evaluation Form                     | 1             | 0.29            |
| **Total**                                   | **339**       | **100**         |

Table 10 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses in the field of music education by data collection tools. When Table 10 is examined, it is seen that 7 different data collection tools are used in postgraduate theses (survey, document analysis, interview form, scale, observation form, test, evaluation form). In more than two thirds of the 339 theses (f: 231, 68.14%), survey and document analysis were used either alone or in combination with at least one of the other data collection tools. In one third of the graduate theses (f: 108, 31.86%), other data collection tools were used. According to this finding, it can be said that there is a need for more studies in the field of music education, where data collection tools other than survey and document analysis are used as data collection tools.

Table 11. 
**Distribution of Postgraduate Theses in Music Education by Data Analysis Methods**

| Data Analysis Methods  | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Quantitative           | 159           | 46.90           |
| Mixed                  | 101           | 29.79           |
| Qualitative            | 79            | 23.30           |
| **Total**              | **339**       | **100**         |

Table 11 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses in the field of music education by analysis methods. When Table 11 is examined, it is seen that quantitative (46.90%) methods are used as data analysis method in 159 of a total of 339 theses. In the remaining 101, mixed (29.79%) and 79 were used qualitative (23.30%) methods. According to the findings obtained, it can be said that almost half of the theses are based on quantitative data analysis methods.
Table 12.
Distribution of Postgraduate Theses Studying Using Experimental Design in the Field of Music Education According to Research Models

| Research Models                                    | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|---------------------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Pretest-Posttest-Control Group Model              | 27            | 58,70           |
| Single Group Pretest-Posttest Models              | 7             | 15,22           |
| Posttest Control Group Model                      | 4             | 8,70            |
| Unspecified                                       | 3             | 6,52            |
| Unspecified Control Group Model                   | 2             | 4,35            |
| Pretest - Posttest Matched Control Group Model    | 1             | 2,17            |
| Repeated Posttest Models                          | 1             | 2,17            |
| Multiple Starting Pattern Between Subjects        | 1             | 2,17            |

Table 12 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses studied using experimental design in the field of music education by research models. According to Table 12, 27 of the postgraduate theses studied using an experimental design were used with a pretest-posttest-control group model (58.70%). 7 used single group pretest-posttest model and the remaining 12 used other models (26.08%). This finding shows that more than half of the graduate theses studied using an experimental design use a pretest-posttest-control group model.

Table 13.
Distribution of Postgraduate Theses Written Using Experimental Design in the Field of Music Education by Number of Experimental and Control Groups

| N | Min. | Max. | Ortalama | SD |
|---|------|------|----------|----|
| Experimental Group Numbers | 44 | 2 | 90 | 23,48 | 18,49 |
| Control Groups Numbers     | 35 | 0 | 61 | 20,54 | 13,18 |
| Unspecified                | 2  |    |    |      |    |

Table 13 shows the distribution of the postgraduate theses studied in the field of music education by using experimental design according to the number of participants in the experimental and control groups. According to Table 13, the number of participants in the experimental group of the graduate theses studied using the experimental design varies between 2 and 90, and the arithmetic mean is 23.48. The number of participants in the control group ranged from 0 to 61, and their arithmetic mean was 20.54. In 2 of the theses working using the experimental design, no information was given about the number of participants.

Table 14.
Distribution of Postgraduate Theses Written Using Experimental Design in the Field of Music Education According to the Experiment Durations

| N | Min. | Max. | Ortalama | SD |
|---|------|------|----------|----|
| Experiment Duration (week) | 42 | 1 | 24 | 9,55 | 5,19 |
| Unspecified                | 4  |    |    |      |    |

Table 14 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses by using experimental design in the field of music education, according to the application time. According to Table 14, the application times of theses vary between 1 and 24 weeks, on average, it is around 9-10 weeks. This finding shows that the experimental application times for music education are sufficient.

Table 15.
Distribution of Postgraduate Theses Written Using Experimental Design in the Field of Music Education According to Statistical Methods

| Statistical Methods              | Frequency (f) | Percentiles (%) |
|----------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| Descriptive Statistics           | 6             | 13,04           |
| Descriptive and Predictive statistics | 40          | 86,96           |
| Total                             | 46            | 100             |

Table 15 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses written using experimental design in the field of music education according to data statistical methods. According to Table 15, it is seen that descriptive and predictive statistics methods are used together as data analysis method in 40 of 46 theses (86.96%). In 6, it is seen that only descriptive statistics methods (13.04%) are used. According to the obtained result, both descriptive and predictive statistical methods were used in the data analysis of most of the postgraduate theses written using experimental design.
Table 16 shows the distribution of postgraduate theses written using experimental design in the field of music education according to the sample groups. According to Table 16, in 17 of the graduate theses written using an experimental pattern in the field of music education, university students (36.96%) in the field of music constituted the sample group. N 16 of the graduate theses, children in the 6-15 age group (34.78%) and 13 in the other field and age group or children (28.26%) constituted the sample group. According to this finding, more than 70% of the sample groups of theses are "children in the 6-15 age group" and "university students in the field of music". N the field of music education, it is clear that you need more experimental studies to work with groups other than these two sample groups.

## 4. DISCUSSION

In the survey conducted within the scope of the research, it was seen that the studies in the literature were limited to the sub-dimensions of music education (instrument training, vocal training, etc.) and content analysis was made. In this research, the postgraduate studies obtained as a result of the keyword of music education are discussed. The survey has more comprehensive data in terms of expressing the quantitative and qualitative status of music education research and is therefore important.

The conclusion and discussion section of the research are presented as three titles as follows.

### 4.1. Content Analysis Discussion for Postgraduate Theses Using Experimental Design

It is concluded that the majority of the postgraduate theses examined in the research are master’s theses. When the literature was reviewed, studies consistent with this result were reached. (Çengel Ataman (2009), Karkin (2011), Topaş (2013), Apaydinh (2014), Yildirim Orhan and Tunca (2014), Ceşit (2015), Kaptanoğlu and Canakçı (2015), Küçüksamoğlu (2016), Öztutgan (2016), Arica (2017), Birel and Qader (2017), Ertek Babaç and Köse (2018), Kurtarslan (2018), Yildirim Orhan and Göksan (2018), Can and Guencer (2019), Gebelolu (2020), Öztutgan ve Öztutgan (2020) and Üstün (2020)). In the research, it was concluded that the first thesis accessible in the field of music education and Council of Higher Education Thesis Center was written in 1986 and the most thesis was written in 2019. It is concluded that the majority of postgraduate theses are made at Gazi University and educational sciences institutes, and there is not a big difference in the number of male and female researchers who write a postgraduate thesis in the field of music education. Öztutgan and Öztutgan (2020), in their content analysis studies for 25 graduate studies written in different disciplines of music education in 2020, concluded that most of the master’s theses were written at Hacettepe University, most of the doctoral theses were at Ankara University, and the majority of the theses were conducted by women researchers. In their study conducted in the United States of America, Kantorski and Stegman (2006) examined the content of music education theses in which qualitative research methods were used between 1998-2002 and reached the conclusion that an average of 25 theses were written per year. In Council of Higher Education Thesis Center, there are 2433 theses with the keyword "music" and 457 with the keyword "music education. This result shows that nearly a fifth of the postgraduate theses written about music are about music education. In our country, especially in the level of doctorate, doing more studies, and more in-depth studies in the field of music education will be a significant step in producing solutions for the problems encountered. It is clearly seen that there has been a great increase in the number of theses written in the field of music education, especially in the last two years. With the "GRADUATE EDUCATION and TEACHING REGULATION" announced on April 20, 2016, it can be thought that the new regulation brought by the programs regarding the expel of students has a direct effect on this result. Students who do not complete their thesis studies up to six years in the master's program and twelve or fourteen semesters in the doctoral program are dismissed from the programs.

### 4.2. Content Analysis Discussion for the Methods Parts of Graduate Theses

It was concluded that the majority of the theses, in which the content analysis was conducted, were made with quantitative or mixed research methods. While Öztutgan and Öztutgan (2020) reached the conclusion that most of the theses were prepared based on quantitative approach, Küçüksamoğlu (2016) and Üstün (2020) concluded that the majority of the theses were done with qualitative research methods. Rohrer (2019), in her content analysis study for the articles published between 1989-2017, concluded that the majority of the articles were made with qualitative research methods. Nichols (2013) stated that qualitative methods began to be used in 2003 in the content analysis study of the articles published in the first twenty years.
years of the "Journal of Music Teacher Education" journal (1991-2011), and while a few experimental studies were conducted in the first years, this number stabilized in the early 2000s. Killian, Riu, and Reid (2012) found in the content analysis studies of the articles published in the "Journal of Music Teacher Education" journal between the same years (1991-2011) that there was a significant increase in the number of both quantitative and qualitative studies in the fourth quarter. Silvey et al. (2019) concluded that quantitative research methods were mostly used in content analysis studies for articles published in the journal "NAFME" between 1989-2017. Kantorski and Stegman (2006) examined the content of music education theses in which qualitative research methods were used between 1998-2002 in their study in America. As a result of their research, they reached the conclusion that qualitative methods were mostly used as data collection and data analysis method. In the theses examined, it was seen that the "interview and survey" method was mostly used as the research method, and the "questionnaire" was used as the data collection tool. This result explains the high number of studies conducted with the quantitative research method. It is obvious that qualitative and quantitative research methods have their own strengths and weaknesses. Therefore, using two methods together will increase the reliability of the study.

In the research, it was concluded that the majority of the theses whose content analysis was conducted were studied by using the scanning model. Çeşit (2015), Küçükosmanoğlu (2016), Özutgan (2016), Arıca (2017), Babaç and Köse (2018) have reached the same result in their work.

In the theses examined in the research, it was concluded that the interview - survey method and quantitative data analysis, were used most. It was concluded that document analysis and questionnaires were used mostly as data collection tool.

4.3. Content Analysis Discussion for Postgraduate Theses Using Experimental Design

It was concluded that the pre-test - post-test - control group model was used in the theses studied using the experimental design, the mean number of the participants in the experimental group was 24, the average of the participants in the control group was 17, the duration of the application lasted 14 weeks, and descriptive and meaningful statistics were used together. It was concluded that university students in the field of music were mostly chosen as the study group in the theses studied using the experimental design. It is noteworthy that in more than half of the theses studied using experimental design, one of the real experimental models with the highest scientific value is used as a research model. It is thought that the attachment of "personal information forms" to other data collection tools is effective in the use of descriptive analysis methods and descriptive analysis methods as data analysis method in most of the theses. In the theses examined, the selection of university students in the field of music mostly as a study group can be accepted as an indication that researchers prefer the easily accessible study group in their studies. This result is in line with the content analysis studies of Doğru, Gençosman, Ataalkun and Şeker (2012) and Gülbahar and Alper (2009) in the field of education.

Suggestions

In the study, content analysis was carried out for a total of 339 graduate theses, 285 of which are master's thesis, 53 of which are doctoral thesis and 1 of which is a master's application report, and all of which are scanned and accessible at the YÖK National Thesis Center with the keyword "Music Education". Studies other than graduate theses (articles, papers, foreign publications) are excluded.

The survey results conducted in other disciplines outside the arts of music / work that will be carried out in coordination can create an idea about the development and exchange of academic art education in Turkey.

Studies on different dimensions of music education in the examined thesis studies were also discussed in terms of method, and some results were obtained. When the music education research is examined in terms of methodology, it is thought that considering the availability of the studies conducted in terms of the musical education dimension by the researchers will increase the quality of the studies. For example, while quantitative research methods can be applied with a suitable number in terms of the study group of the studies on the dimensions of music education conducted in groups, the problem of sampling in the dimensions of music education carried out with individual practices such as instrument and vocal training is an obstacle to conduct quantitative studies. At this point, researchers can improve themselves in determining and applying the most suitable research methods for the musical education dimension they want to work with, by following relevant research, thus making future thesis studies more efficient.

Research and Publication Ethics Statement

The author hereby declare that he has not used any sources other than those listed in the references. The author further declare that he has not submitted this article at any other journal for publication.

Contribution Rates of Authors to the Article

This article is a single author article.

---
e-ISSN: 2536-4758 http://www.efdergi.hacettepe.edu.tr/
**Statement of Interest**

The author declare that there is no conflict of interest.

**5. REFERENCES**

Akıncı, M. Ş. (2018). Ses eğitimi alanında yazılan tezlerin konu yönelimi, problem, amaç, sonuç, öneriler bakımından genel boyutta incelenmesi. *Journal of Social and Humanities Sciences Research*, 5(27), 2804-2815. [https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Mehmet_Sahin_Akinci2/publication](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Mehmet_Sahin_Akinci2/publication)

Apaydınla, K. (2014). Türkiye'de koro alanında yazılan lisansüstü tezler üzerine bir bakış. *ODÜ Sosyal Bilimler Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 4(8), 61-66. [https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article/273649](https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article/273649)

Anca, E. (2017). Türkiye'de keman pedagojisi alanında hazırlanan lisans üstü tezler üzerine bir inceleme. *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 32(2), 327-342. [http://www.edergi.hacettepe.edu.tr/yonetim/icerik/makaleler/2503-published.pdf](http://www.edergi.hacettepe.edu.tr/yonetim/icerik/makaleler/2503-published.pdf)

Babaç, E. E. ve Köse, H. S. (2018). Türkiye'de 2011-2018 yılları arasında koro alanında yapılmış olan lisansüstü tezlerin bazı parametrelerine bakılarak incelenmesi. *Online Journal of Music Sciences*, 3(1), 32-55. [https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article/503606](https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article/503606)

Baltacı, A. (2017). Nitel veri analizinde Miles-Huberman Modeli. *Ahi Evran Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 3(1), 1-15. [https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article/318527](https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article/318527)

Birel, A. S. ve Qader, H. M. (2017). Türkiye'de kontrbas konusunda yazılan lisansüstü tezler üzerinde durum tespiti. *YYÜ Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 14(1), 1416-1439. [https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article/374390](https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article/374390)

Can, Ü.K. ve Günenç, B.C. (2019). Türkiye'de gitar alanında yapılan lisans üstü tezlerin incelenmesi. A. Dönger ve H. Yıldız (Yay. Haz.) *Eğitim Bilimlerinde Akademik Çalışmalar* içinde (s. 132-170). Çetinje: IVPE

Çeşit, C. (2015). Türkiye'de viyola üzerine yapılan lisansüstü tezlerin incelenmesi. *International Journal of Social Science*, 38, 445-462. [https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Canan_Cesit2/publication/296976172_AN_ANALYSIS_OF_POSTGRADUATE_THESOSES_ON_VIOLA_IN_TURKEY/links/56dc36c708aee73df6d3f24d.pdf](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Canan_Cesit2/publication/296976172_AN_ANALYSIS_OF_POSTGRADUATE_THESOSES_ON_VIOLA_IN_TURKEY/links/56dc36c708aee73df6d3f24d.pdf)

Doğan Özbanak, S. (1986). *Cumhuriyet döneminde Milli Eğitim şuralarının müzik eğitimi ile ilgili aldığı kararlar* Yayınlananmış yüksek lisans tezi, Gazi üniversitesi, Ankara.

Doğru, M., Gençosman, T., Ataalkın, A. N. ve Şeker, F. (2012). Fen bilimleri eğitiminde çalışılan yüksek lisans ve doktora tezlerinin analizi. *Türk Fen Eğitimi Dergisi*, 9(1), 49-64. [http://www.tused.org/index.php/tused/article/view/420](http://www.tused.org/index.php/tused/article/view/420)

Ertekin, M. (2017). Türkiye'de klasik gitar alanı ile ilgili yayınlanmış makalelerin içerik analizi ve sınıflandırılması. *Egitim ve Öğretim Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 6(3), 352-360. [http://www.jret.org/FileUpload/ks281142/File/33.merve_nihan_ertekin.pdf](http://www.jret.org/FileUpload/ks281142/File/33.merve_nihan_ertekin.pdf)

Feyzi, A. ve Tekin, C. (2019). Geleneksel Türk müziğine ilişkin yapılan lisans üstü çalışmalara dair bir analiz çalışması. *3. Uluslararası Eğitim ve Değerler Sempozyumu 10-13 Ekim 2019* içinde (s. 31-42). İstanbul.

Gebeloluğlu, B. (2020). Türkiye’de klasik Türk müziği bestecileri ile ilgili yazılmış lisansüstü tezlerin incelenmesi. *İDLİ*, 65, 19-30. [http://www.idildergisi.com/makale/pdf/1578293692.pdf](http://www.idildergisi.com/makale/pdf/1578293692.pdf)

Geçen Ataman, Ö. (2009). Ülkemizde flüt ve flüt eğitimi alanlarında yapılan lisans üstü tezler. *Kastamonu Eğitim Dergisi*, 17(1), 341-352. [https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article/file/817952](https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article/file/817952)

Gülbahar, Y. ve Alper, A. (2009). Öğretim teknolojileri alanında yapılan araştırmalar konusunda bir içerik analizi. *Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi Dergisi*, 42(2), 93-111. [https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article/file/508931](https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article/file/508931)

İslamoğlu, H. ve Alnaçık, Ü. (2014). *Sosyal Bilimlerde Araştırma Yöntemleri* (4. bs.). İstanbul: Beta Basım Yayın Dağıtım.

Kamacoğlu, F. (1986). *Okul içi okul dışı müzik eğitimi*. Yayınlananmış yüksek lisans tezi, Marmara üniversitesi, İstanbul.
Kantorski, V. J. and Stegman, S. F. (2006). A content analysis of qualitative research dissertations in music education, 1998-2002. Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education. 168, 63-73

Kaptanoğlu, E. ve Çanakçı, P. (2015). Türkiye’de vokal müzikte piyano eşlik alanında yapılmış yüksek lisans, doktora ve sanatta yeterlilik tezleri, Elektronik Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 14(55), 198-206. https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/70676 adresinden erişildi.

Karaman, S. ve Bakır, F. (2010). Türkiye’de lisansüstü eğitim: Sorunlar ve çözüm önerileri. Sosyal Bilimler Araştırmaları Dergisi, 5(2), 94-114. https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/802124 adresinden erişildi.

Karasar, N. (2001). Araştırmaları Rapor Hazırlama (11. bs.). Ankara: Nobel Yayın Dağıtım.

Karkn, A.M. (2011). Müzik bilimleri alanında yapılan lisans üstü tezlerin incelemesi. İnönü Üniversitesi Sanat ve Tasarım Dergisi, 1(2), 143-149. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/92418 adresinden erişildi.

Killian, J. N., Liu, J. and Reid, J.F. (2012). The journal of music education: A content analysis of articles 1991-2011. Journal of Music Teacher Education, 22(2), 85-99.

Kurtarslan, Z. (2018). Türkiye’de yapılmış calılgarda yazı teknikleri üzerine yapılan lisansüstü tez çalışmalarının incelemesi. Fine Arts (NWSAFA), 13(4), 57-70. https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/553474 adresinden erişildi.

Küçükosmanoğlu, O. (2016). Klasik gitar alanı ile ilgili yapılan lisansüstü tezler üzerine bir içerik analizi çalışması. III Uluslararası Güzel Sanatlar Bilimsel Araştırma Günleri. 08-10 Nisan 2016 içinde (s.439-456).

McCartey, M. (1999). The bulletin of historical research in music education: A content analysis of articles in the first twenty volumes. Journal of Historical Research in Music Education, 20(3), 181-202.

Miksza, P. and Johnson, E. (2012). Theoretical frameworks applied in music education research: A content analysis of the journal of research in music education, 1979 to 2009. Bulletin of the Council for Research In Music Education, 193, 7-30.

Nicholes, B.E., (2013). the first 20 years: A content analysis of the journal of music teacher education, 1991-2011. Journal of Music Teacher Education, 22(2), 73-84.

Öztutgan, Z. (2016). Türkiye’de gitar alanında yapılan lisansüstü tezlerin analizi ve değerlendirilmesi. YYÜ Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 13(1), 684 - 708. http://efdergi.yyu.edu.tr/uploads/geemeabdyyued05022016y-1542230785.pdf adresinden erişildi.

Öztutgan, Z. ve Öztutgan, K. (2020). Analysis of the Graduate Studies in Different disciplines Prepared for Music Education in Turkey. Asian Journal of Education and Training, 6(4), 651-657.

Rohwer, D. (2019). Extending the discussion: An Editor’s addition to the topics adressed in "A content analysis of update: applications of research in music education (1989-2017). National Association for Music Education, 38(1), 63-64.

Saban, A. (2009). Çoklu zeka kuramı ile ilgili Türkçe çalışmaların içerik analizi. Kurum ve Uygulamada Eğitim Bilimleri, 9(2), 833-876. https://docplayer.biz.tr/118689-Coklu-zeka-kurami-ile-ilgili-turkce-calismalarin-icerik-analizi.html adresinden erişildi.

Schmidt C. P and Zdzinski S. (1993). Cited Quantitative research articles in music education research journal, 1975-1990: A content analysis of selected studies. Journal of Research in Music Education, 41(1), 5-18.

Selçuk, Z., Palancı, M., Kandemir, M. ve Dündar, H. (2014). Eğitim ve Bilim Dergisinde yayınlanan araştırmaların eğilimleri: İçerik analizi. Eğitim ve Bilim, 39(173), 430-453. http://egitimvebilim.ted.org.tr/index.php/EB/article/view/3278/720 adresinden erişildi.

Sevinç, B. (2001). Türkiye’de lisansüstü eğitim uygulamaları, sorunlar ve öneriler. Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi Dergisi, 34(1), 125-137. https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/527997 adresinden erişildi.

Silveira, J.M. and Diaz, F.M. (2014). Student teaching in music: A content analysis of research journals in music education. Journal of Music Teacher Education, 23(2), 92-104.

Silvey, B.A., Sims, W.L., Pohlman, G. and Regier, B.J. (2019). A content analysis of update: Applications of research in music education (1989-2017). National Association for Music Education, 38(1), 55-62.
Soycan, M. ve Babacan, E. (2019). Müziksel işitme, okuma ve yazma ile ilgili geliştirilmiş ölçme araçlarının incelenmesi: Bir içerik analizi çalışması. Elektronik Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 18(69), 3343-353. https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/626389 adresinden erişildi.

Stambaugh, L. A. ve Dyson, B. E. (2016). A comparative content analysis of music educators Journal and philosophy of music education review (1993-2012). Journal of Research in Music Education, 64(2), 238-254.

Tepeli, H. ve Yüksel, G. (2018). Türkiye'de flüt alanı ile ilgili yapılan lisansüstü tezlere ilişkin bir içerik analizi çalışması. Güzel Sanatlar Araştırmaları. Çizgi Kitabevi Yayınları , 59-67.

Topbaş, B. (2013). Türkiye'de piyano üzerine yapılan lisansüstü çalışmalar. The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies, 6(3), 715-728. http://muzikegitimcileri.net/bilimsel/makale/B-Toptas_2.pdf adresinden erişildi.

Türkmen, E.F. (2016). Müzik eğitiminde Öğretim Yöntemleri (1. bs.). Ankara: Pegem Akademi.

Uçan, A. (2005). Müzik Eğitimi Temel Kavramlar- İlkeler- Yaklaşımlar ve Türkiye'deki Durum (3. bs). Ankara: Evrensel Müzik Evi.

Üstün, H. (2020). Türkiye’de üflemeli çalgılar alanında yazılmış lisansüstü tezlerin incelenmesi. Balkan Müzik ve Sanat Dergisi, 2(1), 26,41. https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/bmsd/issue/54328/710428 adresinden erişildi.

Yarbrough, C. (2002). 50 years of the "Journal of Research in music education": a content analysis. Journal of Historical Research in Music Education, 50(4): 276-279.

Yıldırım Orhan, Ş. ve Göklı, A. (2018). Türkiye’de oda müziği alanında yazılmış lisansüstü tezler. Z. Karacagıl ve E. Anaz (Yay. Haz.) Sosyal Bilimlerde Güncel Tartışmalar İnsan Çalışmaları 1 içinde (s.96-104). Ankara: Bilgin Kültür Sanat Yayınları

Yıldırım Orhan, Ş. ve Evren Tunca, B. (2014). Türkiye’de oda müziği alanında yazılmış yüksek lisans, doktora ve sanatta yeterlilik tezleri. Folklor/Edebiyat, 20(80), s. 207-219. https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/255700 adresinden erişildi.

Yıldırım, A. ve Şimşek, H. (2013). Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri (9. bs.). Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.