Life-history changes in the cold tolerance of the two-spot spider mite *Tetranychus urticae*: applications in pest control and establishment risk assessment

N I C O L A W H I T E 1 ◊, J E F F R E Y S. B A L E 2 and S C O T T A. L. H A Y W A R D 2

1Institute of Integrative Biology, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, U.K. and 2School of Bioscience, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, U.K.

Abstract. Lethal time (LTₐ₅₀) and lethal temp (LTempₐ₅₀) are commonly used laboratory indices of arthropod cold tolerance, with the former often being employed to predict winter survival in the field. In the present study, we compare the cold tolerance of different life-history stages (nondiapause and diapause females, as well as males and juveniles) of a major agricultural pest: the two-spot spider mite *Tetranychus urticae* Koch (Acarina: Tetranychidae). Diapausing females from European populations of this species are shown to be freeze avoiding, supercooling to −23.6 ± 0.37 °C and with an LTempₐ₅₀ of −23.2 °C. However, nondiapausing females [supercooling point (SCP) –19.1 ± 0.49 °C, LTempₐ₅₀ –14.32 °C], males (SCP –21.27 ± 0.52 °C, LTempₐ₅₀ –16 °C) and juveniles (SCP –25.34 ± 0.29 °C, LTempₐ₅₀ –18.3 °C) are subclassified as strongly chill tolerant juveniles. LTₐ₅₀ is 148.3 days for non-acclimated diapausing females, whereas nondiapausing females, males and juveniles reach 50% mortality by 21.7 days. When individuals are acclimated at 10 °C for a period of 7 days, no effect is found. Cold tolerance is suggested to be a major contributor to the successful spread of *T. urticae* across temperate countries, although it is dependent on a diapause trait, suggesting a potential target for control. Winter field trial data from diapausing females indicate that LTₐ₅₀ is a reliable indicator of winter survival even within diapause, supporting the use of these indices as a valuable component within environmental niche models for the prediction of future pest invasions.

Key words. Cold stress, diapause, environmental niche model, lethal temperature, lethal time, overwintering, pest control, supercooling point.

Introduction

Increasing evidence suggests that understanding the thermal of a species tolerance can enhance predictions of their potential to invade new geographical regions (Terblanche et al., 2006, 2007; Mitchell & Hoffmann, 2010; Alford et al., 2012). Ecological and environmental factors contribute to the environmental niche model (ENM), which takes the known distribution of a potentially invasive species and correlates it with these variables to predict population establishment in new regions (Elith & Leathwick, 2009; Jiménez-Valverde et al., 2011; Hill et al., 2013). Accordingly, laboratory and field based stress physiology experiments often form the basis of establishment risk assessments with respect to providing a license for the use of novel biological control agents (BCAs) in non-native countries (van Lenteren et al., 2006). This is equally relevant for pest species. Studies on the dark sword grass moth (*Agrotis ipsilon*) suggest that a lack of cold hardiness may explain why this pest is unable to establish a permanent population in the U.K. (Bale, 2002), whereas increased high temperature tolerance in the mite *Halotydeus destructor* corresponds with predicted niche shifts and extended distributions of this species in Australia (Hill et al., 2013).

The two-spot spider mite *Tetranychus urticae* Koch (Acarina: Tetranychidae) is a well-known, highly polyphagous pest with significant economic impact, causing direct damage through...
feeding and reducing photosynthetic activity (Rabbinge, 1985). In the U.K., *T. urticae* is particularly dominant in intensive, high-yield cropping systems such as tomatoes, strawberries and chrysanthemums (Sances et al., 1982; Easterbrook et al., 2001; Gorman et al., 2002). Although, similar to many pests, this species favours glasshouse crops, it is also a major pest of open crop systems (e.g. soybean and cotton) (Ay & Gürkan, 2005; Razmjou et al., 2009). Originally described in Europe, *T. urticae* has gained a worldwide distribution throughout temperate regions, as well as the subtropics (CABI, 2015). It is a good example of a species that posed no major economic threat until the extensive use of pesticides eradicated their natural predators, whereas *T. urticae* developed resistance (Gerson & Weintraub, 2007). This rapid development of pesticide resistance is the dominant factor contributing to the success of this mite; however, the ability to survive temperate winters is also likely to have played an important role in their range expansion.

There are multiple laboratory-based experiments assessing a species’ cold tolerance strategy and ability to survive winter (van Lenteren et al., 2006). Supercooling point is the temperature at which an individual is no longer able to avoid freezing. At the most basic level, where the lower lethal temperature (LTemp) is above the supercooling (freezing) point (SCP), the species is considered to be freeze avoiding (FA), whereas, if the LTemp is below the SCP, then that species is classified as freeze tolerant (FT) (Bale, 1993). However, this simple two-way classification masks a much more complex situation, where mortality is experienced at temperatures often well above the SCP, depending on the species, developmental stage, sex and physiological history, etc. (Bale, 1996). There is a wealth of evidence indicating that different developmental stages of the same species can differ markedly in both their cold tolerance (Block et al., 1990; Lindsay et al., 1998; Paar & Gray, 2011), even whether they are FA or FT (Ansart & Vernon, 2004; Bouchard et al., 2006). Equally, males and females can demonstrate contrasting abilities to survive cold stress (Helden & Dixon, 2002; Yonow et al., 2004; Knapp & Saska, 2012), although this is often neglected in most studies (Renault et al., 2002).

Cold acclimation (the exposure of individuals to sublethal temperatures) and diapause are also shown to influence low temperature tolerance in many arthropod species (Denlinger, 1991; Morewood, 1993; Kandori et al., 2006; Takano, 2014) and there is good evidence for similar molecular processes underpinning both these processes (Ding et al., 2003; Hahn & Denlinger, 2011; Khodayari et al., 2013; Teets & Denlinger, 2013). Adult female diapause is assumed to be the only overwintering stage of *T. urticae* from a wild population in Iran, as shown by their significantly increased cold hardness in the diapause state. This is indicated by an SCP of −25.3 °C compared with −19.6 °C for nondiapausing females and an LTemp50 of −19.7 °C versus −13.3 °C, respectively (Khodayari et al., 2012). Consequently, the disruption of diapause, which is induced by a shortening of the photoperiod, is considered as a potential pest control strategy (Krysan, 1990; Doucet et al., 2007). However, interfering with the diapause trait becomes less relevant if other developmental stages have the capacity to survive winter conditions. Assessing survival outside of diapause is also pertinent in light of climate change because there is increasing evidence that warming temperatures may disrupt the diapause cycle, leaving nondiapausing stages vulnerable to winter cold, which in turn can influence species distribution (Bale & Hayward, 2010; Coleman et al., 2014). Thus, gaps remain in our understanding of *T. urticae* cold tolerance, given that previous studies do not investigate the males, females or juveniles, nor do they investigate populations from more northerly locations likely to encounter colder winter conditions. Lower thermal limits can certainly differ significantly across latitudinal populations of the same species, both within and outside of diapause (Saunders & Hayward, 1998; Addo-Bediako et al., 2000; Sunday et al., 2011).

Winter field trials are also yet to be conducted with *T. urticae* and provide a key indicator of long-term survival under low temperature conditions as well as potential establishment risk. However, although field trials can provide the most realistic assessment of winter survival, they can be difficult to conduct successfully (Hatherly et al., 2005). Problems include the requirement for large numbers of individuals, which, for predatory arthropods, must be kept separate to avoid intraguild predation. Such trials are also typically very time consuming, labour intensive and can encounter issues with highly variable conditions between years. Collectively, these factors make it unfavourable for commercial companies to undertake extensive field trials and so alternative laboratory indices of cold tolerance that are good predictors of winter survival have been sought. Lethal time (LTime) is considered the laboratory equivalent of a winter field trial, where individuals are exposed to low temperatures (most commonly 5, 0 or −5 °C) to assess the length of time needed to experience mortality, often reported as 50% mortality (LTime50) (McDonald et al., 1997; Jing & Kang, 2003; Maes et al., 2015).

Using a linear regression analysis, Hatherly et al. (2005) propose LTime50 at 5 °C as the optimal laboratory-based experiment for European Union (EU) commercial companies to undertake when assessing the capacity for winter survival in temperate countries because a strong correlation between LTime50 and maximal field survival is identified across a range of species. This results in an accumulated dataset of LTime50 at 5 °C for a range of species (latest version: Coombs & Bale, 2014; dataset available on request) and is supported as the basis of U.K. legislation with respect to assessing establishment risk of non-native glasshouse BCAs (Bale, 2011). This LTime50 at 5 °C regression analysis is already reported to be used in the assessment of field survival probability for several species, including the invasive *Harmonia axyridis*, as well as several phytoseiid BCAs: *Amblyseius swirskii*, *Typhlodromips montodorensis*, *Phytoseiulus longipes* and *Neoseiulus californicus* (Hatherly et al., 2005; Allen, 2010; Raak-van den Berg et al., 2012). However, traits such as diapause and acclimatory responses that can increase the thermal tolerance of some species (Colinet & Hoffmann, 2012; Khodayari et al., 2012; Foray et al., 2013; Denlinger & Armbruster, 2014) are not always considered.

Against this background, the present study aimed to investigate the capacity of diapause and nondiapause stages (including males) of European *T. urticae* populations to survive different U.K. winter conditions, at the same time as comparing the efficacy of different laboratory-based cold tolerance indices (LTemp and LTime) with respect to predicting winter survival. For the
first time, the present study also aims to include a diapausing species within the Hatherly et al. (2005) regression and discusses the capacity of *T. urticae* to maintain a cosmopolitan distribution. We discuss the suitability of LTime<sub>50</sub> at 5°C regression as a key component of the ENM, and subsequently as a component of EU BCA applications.

**Materials and methods**

**Rearing**

The population of *T. urticae* was provided by Biobest NV (Belgium) from a laboratory population originally sourced from a range of European sites by Biobest and the University of Warwick. Although this laboratory population has been in culture for many years (at least 8 years), it has regularly been supplemented with wild caught samples and thus is representative of the species’ cosmopolitan distribution and retains the diapause trait expressed in all wild populations. Nondiapauing samples (juveniles, males and females) were reared under quarantine conditions under an LD 18 : 6 h photocycle at 23°C (= non-acclimated condition) on dwarf French bean plant *Phaseolus vulgaris* (Fabales: Fabaceae). Diapause females were reared using the methods described by Singh & Clark (1993). Gravid females were placed on uninfested dwarf French bean plants and allowed to oviposit for 24 h under an LD 24 : 0 h photocycle at 23°C to maximize oviposition. The females were removed and the plant was transferred to an LD 6 : 18 h photocycle at 20°C because both photoperiod and temperature influence diapause induction. Samples were then maintained under an LD 6 : 18 h photocycle at 20°C throughout diapause. After 3–4 weeks, diapausing females were identified by their orange colour. Acclimation is the exposure of an individual to a sublethal temperature that aims to induce a physiological change aiding survival. We acclimated individuals at 10°C for a period of 7 days with fresh cut dwarf French bean leaves. Non-acclimated controls were transferred to stress treatment direct from 23/20°C, unless otherwise stated. The juvenile developmental stage included both protonymphs and deutonymphs, as a result of difficulty in distinguishing between these stages, and were distinguished from adults by only having six legs.

**SCP**

SCP<sup>3</sup> were determined sensu Bale et al. (1984). Individual mites were adhered to type K exposed wire thermocouples with a minimal amount of OecoTak (Oecos, U.K.). The thermocouple was placed inside a size 3 Beem capsule (Agar Scientific Ltd, U.K.), inside a test tube suspended in a programmable alcohol bath (Haake Phoenix II; Artisan Technology Group, Champaign, Illinois). The thermocouples were connected to a computer running PICOLOG RECORDER (Pico Technology). The temperature was ramped at a rate of 0.5 °C min<sup>−1</sup> from 23°C (or the acclimated temperature, 10°C) to −30°C. The SCP was detected by the exothermic release. Mean SCPs for acclimated and non-acclimated treatments were calculated for 30 mites (three replicates of 10 mites).

**LTemp**

Individual mites were separated into size 3 Beem capsules and split into three groups of 10. Each group of 10 capsules were placed in a test tube, which was suspended in a programmable alcohol bath. Samples were ramped (0.5 °C min<sup>−1</sup>) from the rearing temperature (23/20°C) or acclimation temperature (10°C) to a range of predetermined temperatures expected to cause 0–100% mortality (ranging from −6 to −28°C). Mites were held for 10 min at the stressful temperature before being ramped back (0.5 °C min<sup>−1</sup>) to the rearing (23/20°C) or acclimation (10°C) temperature. On return to the rearing temperature, the mites were placed in groups of 10 in a sealed, ventilated container with a non-infested *P. vulgaris* leaf and moisture source. For the control, individuals were held within identical containers suspended in an alcohol bath programmed at their rearing temperature and left for 3 h before being returned to standard rearing conditions. Mortality after 72 h for all life-history stages (adult males, nondiapausing females, diapausing females and juveniles) was assessed for each temperature, using three replicates of *n* = 10.

**LTime and field trial**

Mites were placed into arenas with a dwarf French bean leaf and moisture source before being transferred to 10°C for 1 h, prior to cold exposure, to avoid cold shock. This was not required for acclimated mites. To measure LTime<sub>50</sub>, samples were exposed to 5°C for a series of time periods (between 1 and 50 days, except for diapausing females, where it was extended to >200 days), predetermined to cause 0–100% mortality.

For the winter field trial, all samples were placed in sealed ventilated plastic boxes with access to food at a secure and sheltered location in a field in Birmingham, U.K. (52.4°N). Microclimate conditions within these containers were recorded continuously using TinyTag temperature dataloggers (Gemini Data Loggers, U.K.). Dwarf French bean leaves were replaced periodically. At set time intervals during winter, samples were removed to assess mortality, returning them to rearing conditions (23°C) after 1 h at 10°C (to avoid heat shock) with mortality assessed after 72 h. The control exposure was set up as described but maintained at 23°C for 7 days. Each experiment was conducted with three replicates of *n* = 10.

**Statistical analysis**

All statistical tests were carried out in Minitab, version 17 (Minitab Inc., State College, Pennsylvania). All data were tested for normality using Kolmogorov–Smirnov. Levene’s method and the multiple comparisons method were used to assess equal variances of errors, where necessary.

LTemp and LTime data were analyzed using Probit analysis (Finney, 1971), reporting values that resulted in 50% and 90% mortality. Significance was identified by non-overlapping fiducial limits. SCP data required a nonparametric Kruskal–Wallis test with a post-hoc Mann-Whitney U-test. Winter field trial data

© 2018 The Authors. *Physiological Entomology* published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of Royal Entomological Society, *Physiological Entomology*, 43, 334–345
were analyzed using a binary logistic regression (Harrell, 2015) to detect any significant differences between the cohorts and treatments. Data were assessed for goodness-of-fit using Pearson’s chi-squared statistic. \( P < 0.05 \) was considered statistically significant.

## Results

### SCP

All individuals were found to be freeze intolerant, although there were significant differences between SCPs across acclimated and non-acclimated life stages \( (H = 119.56, \text{ d.f.} = 7, \ P < 0.01) \) (Table 1). Acclimation significantly lowered the SCP of all adult samples but not juveniles \( (W = 951.5, \ P = 0.59) \). Males had lower mean SCPs \((-21.3 \pm 0.5^\circ C) \) than nondiapause females \((-19.1 \pm 0.5^\circ C) \).

### LTemp

LTemp resulting in 50% \( (\text{LTemp}_{50}) \) (Fig. 1a) and 90% \( (\text{LTemp}_{90}) \) (Fig. 1b) mortality of the acclimated and non-acclimated life stages indicated that non-acclimated nondiapausing adult females were the least cold tolerant \( (\text{LTemp}_{50} = -14.2^\circ C) \), with acclimation significantly enhancing their cold survival \( (\text{LTemp}_{50} = -17.2^\circ C; \text{non-overlapping fiducial limits}) \) (Fig. 1). Acclimation did not have a significant effect on the LTemp of any other treatment groups and the cold tolerance of males and nondiapausing females did not differ significantly \( (\text{overlapping fiducial limits}) \) (Fig. 1). Diapausing females \( (\text{non-acclimated and acclimated}) \) had a significantly lower LTemp than all other groups \((-23.2^\circ C) \) for both; non-overlapping fiducial limits) \( (\text{Fig. 1}) \). The LTemp_{90} values of all groups were within \( 3.6^\circ C \) of their corresponding SCP. No mortality was recorded in controls.

### LTime

The LTime_{50} data indicated significant differences in cold tolerance between developmental stages \( (\text{non-overlapping fiducial limits}) \) (Fig. 2). Mortality at \( 5^\circ C \) increased most rapidly in males, with 50% mortality before 10 days, followed by juveniles \( (\text{mean LTime}_{50} \) of approximately 15 days) and nondiapausing females \( (\text{mean LTime}_{50} \) of approximately 20 days). Both non-acclimated and acclimated diapausing females had mean LTime_{50} values beyond 120 days. Acclimation for 7 days at \( 10^\circ C \) did not significantly increase the LTime_{50} of any treatment group \( (\text{overlapping fiducial limits}) \) (Fig. 2). The longest LTime_{50} values were also for diapausing females and these were significantly longer than juveniles, males or nondiapausing females \( (\text{non-overlapping fiducial limits}) \) (Fig. 2b). LTime_{90} values for these other developmental stages did not differ significantly from each other. No mortality was recorded in the control.

## Discussion

As a foreign, invasive species that has become a major agricultural pest, the ability of \( T. urticae \) to develop resistance to pesticides, their response to plant toxins, changes in plant host ranges and genetic differentiation between populations are all well studied (Navajas et al., 2000; Boom et al., 2003; Li & Romeis, 2010; Van Leeuwen et al., 2010; Dermauw et al., 2013). By contrast, the thermal biology of this species is less well characterized, although equally important, because, in temperate regions, winter temperatures can be considered as one of the most important factors affecting the establishment potential of arthropods (DeBach, 1964; van Lenteren et al., 2006). Thus, investigations of cold tolerance can be used to assess establishment risk and potential for range expansion, as well as the survival of winter populations to help predict pest problems in

© 2018 The Authors. *Physiological Entomology* published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of Royal Entomological Society.

*Physiological Entomology, 43*, 334–345
the subsequent year (Samways et al., 1999; van Lenteren et al., 2006; Bale, 2010; Berkvens et al., 2010). The effects of temperature on nondiapausing and diapausing female *T. urticae* from Iran are reported by Khodayari et al. (2012), followed by investigations into the underlying biochemical response mechanisms (Khodayari et al., 2013). Acclimation at 5°C for 10 days is seen to enhance the acute cold tolerance (LTemp50) of diapausing females in particular, and nondiapause females to a lesser degree, whereas 0°C acclimation has a limited effect.

The present study extends this to include an assessment of cold tolerance in a laboratory population of mixed European origins of *T. urticae* and responses to acclimation at 10°C, as well as a characterization of the cold tolerance of both juveniles and males. In addition, we investigate more ecologically relevant long-term cold exposures in the laboratory (LTime), aiming to assess the efficacy of this cold tolerance index to predict winter survival via direct comparison with winter field trials.

The results of the present study concur with those of Khodayari et al. (2012) in that all developmental stages of *T. urticae* are chill tolerant, with SCPs ranging from −19°C for non-acclimated nondiapause females to −25.4°C for acclimated diapausing females, and with LTemp50 spanning −14.3°C (−13.3°C in Khodayari et al., 2012) for non-acclimated nondiapause females to −23.1°C for acclimated diapause females. Interestingly, acclimation at 10°C significantly lowers the SCPs of all adults (Table 1), although it only lowers the LTemp of nondiapause females. This compares with the results of the study by Khodayari et al. (2012) where 10-day acclimation at 5°C has no effect on diapause SCP but improves all other SCP and LTemp50 conditions. This reinforces the idea that SCP temperatures are not always a useful indicator of cold

---

**Fig. 1.** Lethal temperature (± 95% fiducial limits) resulting in 50% mortality (a) and 90% mortality (b) of non-acclimated (dark grey) and acclimated (light grey) *T. urticae* females, males, juveniles and diapausing females. Means with the same lowercase letter are not significantly different (*p* > 0.05).
Cold tolerance of *T. urticae* lifestages

Fig. 2. Lethal time for 50% mortality (a) and lethal time for 90% mortality (b) (± 95% fiducial limits) at 5 °C for various non-acclimated (dark grey) and acclimated (7 days at 10 °C) (light grey) *T. urticae*. Means with the same lowercase letter are not significantly different (*p* > 0.05).

The LTime at 5 °C data indicate that males are the least cold hardy, followed by juveniles, then nondiapause females, with no significant improvement as a result of acclimation (Fig. 2).

LTime as an indicator of thermal tolerance

© 2018 The Authors. *Physiological Entomology* published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of Royal Entomological Society.

*Physiological Entomology*, 43, 334–345
Fig. 3. Mortality (+SE) during winter of (a) female, (b) diapausing females, (c) male and (d) juvenile; non-acclimated (dark grey diamonds) and acclimated (light grey squares) *T. urticae* in a field in Birmingham, U.K., from 17 November 2014. The minimum, maximum and mean temperature exposure during this period are shown in (e).

© 2018 The Authors. *Physiological Entomology* published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of Royal Entomological Society, *Physiological Entomology*, 43, 334–345
Combining the LTime, LTemp and SCP data, it is predicted that males, nondiapause females and juveniles would not survive a U.K. winter, which is confirmed in a winter field trial (Fig. 3).

Diapause in several Phytoseiidae species is confirmed to increase the cold tolerance of females (Denlinger, 1991; Morewood, 1993). The present study also finds that diapausing females of *T. urticae* are the most cold tolerant life cycle stage with an LTemp of $-23.2^\circ C$, an SCP of $-23.6^\circ C$ and an LTime at $5^\circ C$ of 245.1 days. Also, during a winter exposure, only 19% mortality is recorded in the time required for 100% mortality to occur in juveniles, males and nondiapause females. The winter trial is carried out during a mild U.K. winter (average of 5.5 $^\circ C$) (Fig. 4) compared with the U.K. average of 3.8 $^\circ C$ (averaged data from 1981–2010, Met Office) and, as such, it can be assumed that, without a diapause trait, *T. urticae* would not survive most U.K. winter periods. This further reinforces the fact that SCPs are a rarely a good indicator of cold tolerance (Salt, 1961; Sømme, 1982; Knight et al., 1986; Bale, 1996; Renault et al., 2002) because juvenile *T. urticae* have lower SCPs than diapausing females.

Field trials are often proposed as the most reliable method for determining cold tolerance and overwintering abilities. There are limitations, however, where individuals must be in conditions that allow monitoring and assessment of survival, which can reduce the ecological relevance. For example, individuals may not be able to select their most optimal overwintering site such as ground cover or under bark (Piffner & Luka, 2000; Overgaard et al., 2011). These disadvantages can be minimized by including food and water and, where needed or able, mimicking natural shelters. The primary advantage, however, is that the species are directly experiencing winter conditions, with natural temperature fluctuations and light cycles that are difficult to accurately replicate within a laboratory.

As a surrogate measure, LTime at $5^\circ C$ data can provide applicable indices of cold tolerance that are less labour intensive and time consuming to collect. These often show a good correlation with winter field survival (Hatherly et al., 2005), as found to be the case for juvenile, male and nondiapause female *T. urticae* (Fig. 5). Unfortunately, because the winter field trial is terminated before diapausing females reach 100% mortality, they cannot be plotted onto this regression. However, using the regression equation (Fig. 5) combined with an LTime of 143.8 days, we predict that diapausing females could survive in the field for around 220 days (i.e. much longer than a U.K. winter). Diapausing females have an LTime of 245.1 days (Fig. 2b), which complements the predicted survival time from the regression analysis. It can therefore be implied that an LTime at $5^\circ C$ could also be applied with respect to predicting the field survival of diapausing stages in other species.

Although acclimation at 10 $^\circ C$ does not enhance the survival of *T. urticae* in either laboratory experiment, it is important to still consider acclimatory responses when incorporating other species in Fig. 5, especially because there is some evidence that 5 $^\circ C$ may enhance the long-term survival of *T. urticae* (Kho-dayari et al., 2012). Acclimatory responses are also identified in many other important pests, such as the sweet potato weevil *Cylas formicarius* and the melon thrip *Thrips palmi* (McDonald et al., 2000; Kandori et al., 2006), as well as the generalist predator *Euseius gallicus* (N. White, S. A. L. Hayward & J. S. Bale, unpublished data). With an LTime of 40.5 days for acclimated *E. gallicus* adults, the maximal field survival is predicted to be 80 days; however, the survival is reported to only reach 50% mortality after 116 days in the field. Thus, for acclimated *E. gallicus*, the graph does not accurately predict winter survival, highlighting a potential limitation of this regression in some cases.

**Potential underlying molecular mechanisms of cold tolerance**

Metabolic differences between nondiapausing and diapausing females are likely to account for the significant differences in winter survival, particularly the biochemical events related to the cold hardening process characterized in other arthropod species (Li et al., 2001; Koštál et al., 2003; Michaud & Denlinger, 2007; Hahn & Denlinger, 2011). Several studies report considerable overlap in the molecular processes underpinning diapause and cold acclimation (Ding et al., 2003; Hahn & Denlinger, 2011; Teets & Denlinger, 2013). Understanding the metabolic differences could provide an essential starting point for interrupting the diapause trait as a form of biological control in temperate countries in *T. urticae* (Krysan, 1990; Doucet et al., 2007).

**ENM**

All species possess a maximum level of thermal tolerance, which in combination with other factors, limits their distributions and opportunities for future range expansion (Bale, 1996). Using the known distribution of an invasive species and correlating this with environmental variables is proposed as a pre-emptive approach for pest control (Hill et al., 2013). For example, the Asian Longhorn beetle (*Anoplophora glabripennis*) began its invasive spread of North America in the 1990s. A predictive model (ecological niche model) by Peterson & Vieglais (2001) shows that the species had the potential to establish in eastern North America but not along the Pacific coast. So far, there have been no reports of this species along the Pacific coast (EPPO, 2014), supporting the model’s predictions. The same model predicted *Anoplophora malasiaca* as a potential invasive pest, which has now been added to the EPPO watch list, with a non-native population established in Italy (Colombo & Limonta, 2001; EPPO, 2001).

The ENM primarily uses the environmental variables a species experiences (e.g. precipitation and land cover) to predict the potential to invade new regions (Elith & Leathwick, 2009; Jiménez-Valverde et al., 2011; Hill et al., 2013). Although temperature is only one of the environmental factors contributing towards the ENM, it is an important one that can be studied with relative ease. *Tetranychus urticae* is here classified as a freeze avoiding species (chill tolerant for nondiapause stages) (Bale, 1993) with LTime at $5^\circ C$ accurately predicting winter field survival, as is shown in many other species (Coombs & Bale, 2014). The thermal tolerance of *T. urticae* correlates with its cosmopolitan invasion of temperate countries but not the more extreme latitudes (e.g. there are populations
in Canada but not Alaska) (CABI, 2015). Other important factors in the ENM include dispersal ability, competition, predation and access to hibernation sites (Samways et al., 1999; Baker et al., 2000), although these are rarely studied in detail and can be labour-intensive to undertake. Temperature is clearly a primary environmental parameter determining arthropod survival and distribution. As such, LTime\textsubscript{50} at 5°C, which is typically not labour-intensive, is supported as an essential component for consideration in all ENM assessments. By proposing the use of one reliable experiment, the procedures may be refined and used consistently across all research groups, reducing any potential inaccuracy when comparing different species.

It is worth noting that, although 5°C is a common temperature within a U.K. winter, for other temperate countries experiencing lower average temperatures, 0 or −5°C may be a better suited temperature for LTime assessments. Hence, although LTime\textsubscript{50} may be a valuable index in developing ENMs, the temperature at which it is assessed needs to be relevant to the full range of winter conditions experienced by a given species. Certainly, for the U.K., it appears that winter field trials could be replaced by simply assessing LTime\textsubscript{50} at 5°C when investigating the invasive potential of a species, either pest or BCA.

**Conclusions**

*Tetranychus urticae* is a freeze avoidant (diapause)/chill tolerant (nondiapause stages) species. The ability of this species to diapause is likely a major contributing factor to the successful widespread inhabitation of temperate countries, combined with their rapid life cycle, inbreeding habits and arrenhotokous reproduction and pesticide resistance. Without the diapause trait, *T. urticae* cannot survive a temperate winter, suggesting disruption of the diapause trait as a potential control strategy for this species. LTime\textsubscript{50} at 5°C is supported as the optimal laboratory-based representation of field relevant cold stress and is proposed as an essential component for accurate ENMs, with 0
or −5 °C being suggested for countries experiencing lower average temperatures than the U.K.

Acknowledgements

Nicola White was funded by the by the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (BBSRC) in a CASE studentship with Biobest, Belgium. Many thanks are extended to Dr Yves Arijs (Biobest) with respect to the supply of mites.

References

Addo-Bediako, A., Chown, S.L. & Gaston, K.J. (2000) Thermal tolerance, climatic variability and latitude. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences, 267*, 739–745.

Alford, L., Blackburn, T.M. & Bale, J.S. (2012) Effects of acclimation and latitude on the activity thresholds of the aphid *Myzus persicae* in Europe. *Journal of Applied Entomology, 136*, 332–346.

Allen, C. (2010) *Thermal biology and behaviour of two predatory phytoseid mites: Amblyseius swirskii and Phytoseiulus longipes*. PhD Thesis, University of Birmingham.

Ansart, A. & Vernon, P. (2004) Cold hardiness abilities vary with the size of the land snail *Cornu aspersum*. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part A: Molecular & Integrative Physiology, 139*, 205–211 [WWW document]. URL http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S095643304002429 [accessed on 20 February 2018].

Ay, R. & Gürkan, M.O. (2005) Resistance to bifenthrin and resistance mechanisms of different strains of the two-spotted spider mite (*Tetranychus urticae*) from Turkey. *Phytoparasitica, 33*, 237–244.

Baker, R.H.A., Sansford, C.E., Jarvis, C.H. & et al. (2000) The role of climatic mapping in predicting the potential geographical distribution of non-indigenous pests under current and future climates. *Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment*, 82, 57–71.

Bale, J.S. (1996) Classes of insect cold-hardiness. *Functional Ecology, 7*, 751–753.

Bale, J.S. (2014) Insect cold hardiness: a matter of life and death. *European Journal of Entomology*, 93, 369–382.

Bale, J.S. (2002) Insects and low temperatures: from molecular biology to distributions and abundance. *Philosophical Transactions: Biological Sciences, 357*, 849–862.

Bale, J.S. (2010) Harmonization of regulations for invertebrate biocontrol agents in Europe: progress, problems and solutions. *Journal of Applied Entomology, 135*, 503–513.

Bale, J.S. (2011) Regulation of invertebrate biological control agents in Europe: recommendations for a harmonized approach. *Regulation of Biological Control Agents in Europe*. Chapter 16 (ed. by R. Ehlers), pp. 323–374. Springer, The Netherlands.

Bale, J.S. & Hayward, S.A.L. (2010) Insect overwintering in a changing climate. *Journal of Experimental Biology, 213*, 980–994.

Bale, J.S., O’Doherty, R., Atkinson, R. & Stevenson, R.A. (1984) An automatic thermoelectric cooling method and computer-based recording-system for supercooling point studies on small invertebrates. *Cryobiology, 21*, 340–347.

Berkvens, N., Bale, J.S., Berkvens, D. & et al. (2010) Cold tolerance of the harlequin ladybird *Harmonia axyridis* in Europe. *Journal of Insect Physiology, 56*, 438–444.

Block, W., Erzinclioglu, Y.Z. & Worland, M.R. (1990) Cold resistance in all life stages of two blowfly species (Diptera, Calliphoridae). *Medical and Veterinary Entomology, 4*, 213–219.

Boon, C.V.D., Beek, T.V. & Dicke, M. (2003) Differences among plant species in acceptance by the spider mite *Tetranychus urticae* Koch. *Journal of Applied Entomology, 127*, 177–183.

Bouchard, R., Carrillo, M., Kells, S. & Ferrington, L. (2006) Freeze tolerance in larvae of the winter-active Diamesa mendotae Muttkowski (Diptera: Chironomidae): a contrast to adult strategy for survival at low temperatures. *Hydrobiologia, 568*, 403–416.

CABI (2015) *Tetranychus urticae* (Two-Spotted Spider Mite) *Datasheet* [WWW document]. URL http://www.cabi.org/isc/datasheet/53366 [accessed on 31 July 2015].

Coleman, P.C., Bale, J.S. & Hayward, S.A.L. (2014) Cross generation plasticity in cold hardiness is associated with diapause, but not the non-diapause developmental pathway, in the blow fly *Calliphora vicina*. *Journal of Experimental Biology, 217*, 1454–1461.

Colinet, H. & Hoffmann, A.A. (2012) Comparing phenotypic effects and molecular correlates of developmental, gradual and rapid cold acclimation responses in *Drosophila melanogaster*. *Functional Ecology, 26*, 84–93.

Colombo, M. & Limonta, L. (2001) Anoplophora malasiaca Thomson (Coleoptera Cerambycidae Lamiinae Lamiini) in Europe. *Bollettino di Zootagica Agraria e di Bachicoltura, 33*, 65–68.

Coombs, M.R. & Bale, J.S. (2014) Thermal biology of the spider mite predator *Phytoseius macropilis*. *BioControl, 59*, 205–217.

DeBach, P. (1964) *Biological Control of Insects, Pests and Weeds*. Chapman & Hall, U.K.

Denlinger, D.L. (1991) Relationship between cold hardiness and diapause. *Insects at Low Temperature* (ed. by R.E. Lee and D.L. Denlinger), pp. 174–198. Chapman and Hall, New York, New York.

Denlinger, D.L. & Armbruster, P.A. (2014) Mosquito diapause. *Annual Review of Entomology, 59*, 73–93.

Dermaw, W., Wybouw, N., Rombaunts, S. et al. (2013) A link between host plant adaptation and pesticide resistance in the polyphagous spider mite *Tetranychus urticae*. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 110*, E1113–E1122.

Ding, L., Li, Y. & Goto, M. (2003) Physiological and biochemical changes in summer and winter diapause and non-diapause pupae of the cabbage armyworm, *Mamestra brassicae* L. during long-term cold acclimation. *Journal of Insect Physiology, 49*, 1153–1159.

Doucet, D., Frisco, C., Cusson, M. et al. (2007) Diapause disruption with tebufenozide for early-instar control of the spruce budworm, *Choristoneura fumiferana*. *Pest Management Science, 63*, 730–736.

Easterbrook, M.A., Fitzgerald, J.D. & Solomon, M.G. (2001) Biological control of strawberry tarnenomid mite *Phytomenella pallida* and two-spotted spider mite *Tetranychus urticae* on strawberry in the UK using species of *Neoseiulus* (Amblyseius) (Acari: Phytoseiidae). *Experimental & Applied Acarology, 25*, 25–36.

Elih, J. & Leahwick, J.R. (2009) Species distribution models: ecological explanation and prediction across space and time. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics, 40*, 677–977.

EPPO (2001) Anoplophora malasiaca found for the First Time in Italy. Article ID: 2001/101.

EPPO (2014) *PQR Database*. European and Mediterranean Plant Protection Organization, France [WWW document]. URL http://www.eppo.int/DATABASES/pqr/pqr.htm [accessed on 31 July 2015].

Finney, D.J. (1971) *Probit Analysis*. University Press, U.K.

Foray, V., Desouhant, E., Voituron, Y. et al. (2013) Does cold tolerance plasticity correlate with the thermal environment and morphological profiles of a parasitoid wasp? *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part A: Molecular & Integrative Physiology, 164*, 77–83.

Gerson, U. & Weintraub, P.G. (2007) *Mites for the control of pests in protected cultivation*. *Pest Management Science, 63*, 658–676.

Gorman, K., Hewitt, F., Denholm, I. & Devine, G.J. (2002) New developments in insecticide resistance in the glasshouse whitefly (*Trialeurodes vaporariorum*) and the two-spotted spider mite.
(Tetranychus urticae) in the UK. Pest Management Science, 58, 123–130.

Hahn, D.A. & Denlinger, D.L. (2011) Energetics of insect diapause. Annual Review of Entomology, 56, 103–121.

Harrell, F. (2015) Regression Modeling Strategies: With Applications to Linear Models, Logistic and Ordinal Regression, and Survival Analysis (ed. by F. Harrell), Chapter 10: Binary Logistic Regression, pp. 218–274. Springer, New York, New York.

Hatherly, I.S., Hart, A.J., Tullett, A.G. & Bale, J.S. (2005) Use of thermal data as a screen for the establishment potential of non-native biological control agents in the UK. BioControl, 50, 687–698.

Helden, A.J. & Dixon, A.F.G. (2002) Life-cycle variation in the aphid Sitobion avenae: costs and benefits of male production. Ecological Entomology, 27, 692–701.

Hill, M.P., Chown, S.L. & Hoffmann, A.A. (2013) A predicted niche shift corresponds with increased thermal resistance in an invasive mite, Halotydeus destructor. Global Ecology and Biogeography, 22, 942–951.

Jiménez-Valverde, A., Peterson, A.T., Soberón, J. et al. (2011) Use of niche models in invasive species risk assessments. Biological Invasions, 13, 2785–2797.

Jing, X.H. & Kang, L. (2003) Geographical variation in egg cold hardiness: a study on the adaptation strategies of the migratory locust Locusta migratoria L. Ecological Entomology, 28, 151–158.

Kandori, I., Kimura, T., Tsumuki, H. & Sugimoto, T. (2006) Cold tolerance of the sweet potato weevil, Cylas formicarius (Fabricius) (Coleoptera: Brentidae), from the Southwestern Islands of Japan. Applied Entomology and Zoology, 41, 217–226.

Khodayari, S., Moharramipour, S., Kamali, K. et al. (2012) Effects of acclimation and diapause on the thermal tolerance of the two-spotted spider mite, Tetranychus urticae. Journal of Thermal Biology, 37, 419–423.

Khodayari, S., Moharramipour, S., Larvor, V. et al. (2013) Deciphering the metabolic changes associated with diapause syndrome and cold acclimation in the two-spotted spider mite Tetranychus urticae. PLoS ONE, 8, e54025.

Knapp, M. & Saska, P. (2012) The effects of habitat, density, gender and duration on overwintering success in Bembidion lampros (Coleoptera: Carabidae). Journal of Applied Entomology, 136, 225–233.

Knight, J.D., Bale, J.S., Franken, F. et al. (1986) Insect cold hardiness: supercooling points and pre-freeze mortality. CryoLetters, 7, 203.

Koštál, V., Berková, P. & Šimek, P. (2003) Remodelling of membrane phospholipids during transition to diapause and cold-acclimation in the larvae of Chymomyza costata (Drosophilidae). Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part B: Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, 135, 407–419.

Krysan, J.L. (1990) Fenoxycarb and diapause: a possible method of control for pear psylla (Homoptera: Psyllidae). Journal of Economic Entomology, 83, 293–299.

van Lenteren, J.C., Bale, J.S., Bigler, E. et al. (2006) Assessing risks of releasing exotic biological control agents of arthropod pests. Annual Review of Entomology, 51, 609–634.

Li, Y. & Romeis, J. (2010) Bt maize expressing Cry3Bb1 does not harm the spider mite, Tetranychus urticae, or its ladybird beetle predator, Stethorus punctillum. Biological Control, 53, 337–344.

Li, Y.P., Goto, M., Ito, S. et al. (2001) Physiology of diapause and cold hardiness in the overwintering pupae of the fall webworm Hyphantria cunea (Lepidoptera: Arctiidae) in Japan. Journal of Insect Physiology, 47, 1181–1187.

Lindsay, I.L., Barker, I.K., Surgeoner, G.A. et al. (1998) Survival and development of the different life stages of Isodes scapularis (Acari: Ixodidae) held within four habitats on long point, Ontario, Canada. Journal of Medical Entomology, 35, 189–199.

Maes, S., Grégoire, J.C. & De Clercq, P. (2015) Cold tolerance of the predatory ladybird Cylas formicarius (Fabricius). Metabolism, 69, 207–209.

McDonald, J.R., Bale, J.S. & Walters, K.A. (1997) Rapid cold hardening in the western flower thrips Frankliniella occidentalis. Journal of Insect Physiology, 43, 759–766.

McDonald, J.R., Head, J., Bale, J.S. & Walters, K.A. (2000) Cold tolerance, overwintering and establishment potential of Thrips palmi. Physiological Entomology, 25, 159–166.

Michaud, M.R. & Denlinger, D.L. (2007) Shifts in the carbohydrate, polyol, and amino acid pools during rapid cold-hardening and diapause-associated cold-hardening in flesh flies (Sarcophaga crassipalpis): a metabolomic comparison. Journal of Comparative Physiology B, 177, 753–763.

Mitchell, K.A. & Hoffmann, A.A. (2010) Thermal ramping rate influences evolutionary potential and species differences for upper thermal limits in Drosophila. Functional Ecology, 24, 694–700.

Morewood, W.D. (1993) Diapause and cold hardiness of phytoseid mites (Acarina: Phytoseiidae). European Journal of Entomology (Czech Republic), 90, 3.

Navajas, M., Tsagkarakov, A., Langel, J. & Perrot-Minnot, M.J. (M.J.) (2000) Genetic differentiation in Tetranychus urticae (Acari: Tetranychidae): polymorphism, host races or sibling species? Ecological and Applied Zoology, 41, 217–226.

Overgaard, J., Hoffmann, A.A. & Kristensen, T.N. (2011) Assessing population and environmental effects on thermal resistance in Drosophila melanogaster using ecologically relevant assays. Journal of Thermal Biology, 36, 409–416.

Paur, J. & Gray, D.A. (2011) Seasonal dynamics and overwintering strategy of the tachinid fly (Diptera: Tachinidae), Ornia ochracea (Bigot) in southern California. Terrestrial Arthropod Reviews, 4, 145–156.

Peterson, A.T. & Vieglais, D.A. (2001) Predicting species invasions using ecological niche modeling: new approaches from bioinformatics attack a pressing problem. A new approach to ecological niche modeling, based on new tools drawn from biodiversity informatics, is applied to the challenge of predicting potential species’ invasions. Bioscience, 51, 363–371.

Pilifner, L. & Luka, H. (2000) Overwintering of arthropods in soils of arable fields and adjacent semi-natural habitats. Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment, 78, 215–222.

Raak-vanden Berg, C.L., Stam, J.M., de Jong, P.W. et al. (2012) Winter survival of Harmonia axyridis in the Netherlands. Biological Control, 60, 68–76.

Rabbeege, R. (1985) Aspects of damage assessment. World Crop Pests: Spider Mites, their Biology, Natural Enemies and Control (ed. by W. Helle and M.W. Sabelis), pp. 261–272. Elsevier, The Netherlands.

Razmjou, J., Tavakkoli, H. & Fallahi, A. (2009) Effect of soybean cultivar on life history parameters of Tetranychus urticae Koch (Acari: Tetranychidae). Journal of Pest Science, 82, 89–94.

Renault, D., Salin, C., Vannier, G. & Vernon, P. (2002) Survival at low temperatures in insects: what is the ecological significance of the supercooling point? CryoLetters, 23, 217–228.

Salt, R.W. (1961) Principles of insect cold-hardiness. Annual Review of Entomology, 6, 55–74.

Samways, M.J., Osborn, R., Hastings, H. & Hattingh, V. (1999) Global climate change and accuracy of prediction of species’ geographical ranges: establishment success of introduced ladybirds (Coccinellidae, Chilocorus spp.) worldwide. Journal of Biogeography, 26, 795–812.

Sances, F.V., Toscano, N.C., Oatman, E.R. et al. (2001) Physiology of diapause and cold hardiness of phytoseiid mites (Acari: Phytoseiidae). Journal of Insect Physiology, 47, 191–201.

Samways, M.J., Osborn, R., Hastings, H. & Hattingh, V. (1999) Global climate change and accuracy of prediction of species’ geographical ranges: establishment success of introduced ladybirds (Coccinellidae, Chilocorus spp.) worldwide. Journal of Biogeography, 26, 795–812.

Sances, F.V., Toscano, N.C., Oatman, E.R. et al. (2001) Physiology of diapause and cold hardiness of phytoseiid mites (Acari: Phytoseiidae). Journal of Insect Physiology, 47, 191–201.

Sances, F.V., Toscano, N.C., Oatman, E.R. et al. (2001) Physiology of diapause and cold hardiness of phytoseiid mites (Acari: Phytoseiidae). Journal of Insect Physiology, 47, 191–201.

Sances, F.V., Toscano, N.C., Oatman, E.R. et al. (2001) Physiology of diapause and cold hardiness of phytoseiid mites (Acari: Phytoseiidae). Journal of Insect Physiology, 47, 191–201.
Cold tolerance of *T. urticae* life stages

Saunders, D.S. & Hayward, S.A.L. (1998) Geographical and diapause-related cold tolerance in the blowfly, *Calliphora vicina*. *Journal of Insect Physiology*, 44, 541–551.

Singh, P. & Clark, G.K. (1993) A method for continuous production of diapausing two-spotted mite in the laboratory. *New Zealand Entomologist*, 16, 94–99.

Sømme, L. (1982) Supercooling and winter survival in terrestial arthropods. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part A: Physiology*, 73, 519–543.

Sunday, J.M., Bates, A.E. & Dulvy, N.K. (2011) Global analysis of thermal tolerance and latitude in ectotherms. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences*, 278, 1823–1830.

Takano, S.I. (2014) Survival of *Bactrocera latifrons* (Diptera: Tephritidae) adults under constant and fluctuating low temperatures. *Applied Entomology and Zoology*, 49, 411–419.

Teets, N.M. & Denlinger, D.L. (2013) Physiological mechanisms of seasonal and rapid cold-hardening in insects. *Physiological Entomology*, 38, 105–116.

Terblanche, J.S., Klok, C.J., Krafsur, E.S. & Chown, S.L. (2006) Phenotypic plasticity and geographic variation in thermal tolerance and water loss of the tsetse *Glossina pallidipes* (Diptera: Glossinidae): implications for distribution modelling. *American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene*, 74, 786–794.

Terblanche, J.S., Deere, J.A., Clusella-Trullas, S. et al. (2007) Critical thermal limits depend on methodological context. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 274, 2935–2943.

Van Leeuwen, T., Vontas, J., Tsagkarakou, A. et al. (2010) Acaricide resistance mechanisms in the two-spotted spider mite *Tetranychus urticae* and other important Acati: a review. *Insect Biochemistry and Molecular Biology*, 40, 563–572.

Yonow, T., Zalucki, M.P., Sutherst, R.W. et al. (2004) Modelling the population dynamics of the Queensland fruit fly, *Bactrocera* (Dacus) *tryoni*: a cohort-based approach incorporating the effects of weather. *Ecological Modelling*, 173, 9–30.

Accepted 14 August 2018
First published online 12 September 2018

© 2018 The Authors. *Physiological Entomology* published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of Royal Entomological Society.

*Physiological Entomology*, 43, 334–345