Softening of the insulating phase near $T_c$ for the photo-induced insulator-to-metal phase transition in vanadium dioxide

D. J. Hilton,1 R. P. Prasankumar,1 S. Fourmaux,2 A. Cavalleri,3 D. Brassard,2 M. A. El Khakani,2 J. C. Kieffer,2 A. J. Taylor,1 and R. D. Averitt1

1Center for Integrated Nanotechnologies, MS K771, Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, NM 87545, USA
2Université du Québec, INRS-Énergie et Matériaux et Télécommunications, Varennes, Québec, Canada, J3X 1S2
3Department of Physics, Clarendon Laboratory, University of Oxford, Parks Rd. Oxford, OX1 3PU, United Kingdom

(Dated: February 1, 2008)

We use optical-pump terahertz-probe spectroscopy to investigate the near-threshold behavior of the photoinduced insulator-to-metal (IM) transition in vanadium dioxide thin films. Upon approaching $T_c$, a reduction in the fluence required to drive the IM transition is observed, consistent with a softening of the insulating state due to an increasing metallic volume fraction (below the percolation limit). This phase coexistence facilitates the growth of a homogeneous metallic conducting phase following superheating via photoexcitation. A simple dynamic model using Bruggeman effective medium theory describes the observed initial condition sensitivity.

PACS numbers: (71.30.+h), (78.47.+p), and (72.80.Ga)

Strongly correlated electron materials are characterized by extreme sensitivity to external stimuli which result from the subtle interplay between many degrees of freedom with comparable energy scales (lattice, orbital, electronic and magnetic). High temperature superconductivity, colossal magnetoresistance, ferromagnetism, and insulator-to-metal transitions are some of the best known examples of the exotic behavior exhibited by these materials.

During the past several years, time-resolved optical studies have been utilized to investigate dynamics associated with the competing degrees of freedom in these materials [1]. In many of these studies the goal is to interrogate the dynamics within a particular phase. However, photoinduced phase transitions provide an important complementary approach to investigate the physical pathway connecting different correlated electron states as well as their mutual competition [2].

A photoinduced phase transition can arise following impulsive heating or photo-doping and provides a means of controlling the overall phase of a solid on an ultrafast timescale [3,4,5]. One model system used to study insulator to metal transitions in correlated electron systems is vanadium dioxide (VO$_2$). This material undergoes an insulator to metal transition when heated above 340 K accompanied by a structural distortion from a monoclinic to a rutile phase [6,7,8]. Time-resolved optical studies can provide insight into its origin and its technological potential [9,10,11].

The interplay between band and Mott-insulating behavior in VO$_2$ has been addressed in the time domain, where a limiting structural timescale for the creation of the metallic phase suggests the importance of band insulating character for VO$_2$ [12]. Advances in ultrafast technology have also enabled more comprehensive investigations involving, most recently, femtosecond x-ray absorption spectroscopy [13,14].

In this Letter, we measure the time-dependent conductivity of VO$_2$ during a photoinduced insulator-metal transition. Our dynamic experiments focus on the poorly understood near-threshold behavior, where phase separation and domain formation inhibit the measurement of conventional transport properties since a macroscopic conductivity pathway is not established [12]. As a function of increasing initial temperature (up to $\sim T_c$) we observe a reduction in the deposited energy required to drive the IM transition. Such a response indicates an initial condition sensitivity which we interpret as a softening of the insulating state due to the existence of metallic precursors. These precursors facilitate the growth of a homogeneous metallic conducting phase following superheating. A simple dynamic model using Bruggeman effective medium theory describes the observed response. We emphasize that this percolation model is valid near threshold whereas, at higher fluences, the transition is prompt and nonthermal [12,13,14]. Our results may be relevant in other systems which exhibit tendencies towards phase separation such as spin-crossover complexes [16].

Our (011) oriented VO$_2$ thin film was grown on a (100) MgO substrate by radio-frequency (13.56 MHz) magnetron sputtering of a vanadium target (99.99% purity) in a Ar and O$_2$ mixture at a pressure of 2 mTorr (chamber base pressure of 2 x $10^{-8}$ Torr) and a temperature of 500°C [17]. The stability of the deposition process and the thickness of the films (100 nm) were monitored in-situ by a calibrated microbalance and independently verified using standard ellipsometric techniques. The crystalline quality, grain size, and orientation of the VO$_2$ films were characterized by x-ray diffraction.

First, we determined the time-independent THz conductivity of our VO$_2$ films as a function of sample tem-
perature. We use the output of a 50 fs titanium:sapphire amplifier to generate nearly-single-cycle THz pulses via optical rectification in ZnTe and employ standard terahertz time-domain spectrometry to measure the THz frequency conductivity; further details can be found in refs. 18 and 19. In Figure 1(a), we show the transmitted THz waveform at 340 K, where the top waveform (displaced for clarity) results when the sample is heated from 300 K to 340 K and the bottom results when the sample is cooled from 370 K to 340 K. From the time domain data, the calculated conductivity of the VO$_2$ film from 0.25 THz to 2.25 THz is determined (Figure 1(b)).

Figure 1(c) shows the magnitude of the real conductivity as a function of temperature. We also plot the temperature-dependent DC electrical conductance measured (on the same film) between two metal contacts, which shows good agreement with the temperature dependence of the THz conductivity. The hysteresis is consistent with the first order phase transition in VO$_2$ and the narrow width ($< 5$ K) and magnitude of the metallic state conductivity attest to the quality of our films 1,19.

In order to study the conductivity dynamics of the photoinduced phase transition, we excite the sample using 1.55 eV pulses from the amplified laser and monitor the change in the THz transmission as a function of the relative delay between the pump pulse and the THz probe pulse 1. This film is approximately one optical absorption length thick at 800 nm, which results in a nonuniform excitation profile along the direction of propagation; however, this does not significantly influence our results. We have verified that the induced change in conductivity is frequency independent across the bandwidth of our THz pulse indicating uniform excitation across the THz probe beam.

Figure 2(a) shows the time-resolved conductivity as a function of pump fluence at 300 K. There is a rise time of $\sim$100 ps to obtain the conductivity of the product metallic phase at all fluences. This is significantly longer than the initial excitation pulse, meaning that photoconductivity arising from carriers excited to the conduction band (e.g. as occurs in GaAs) is not responsible for the induced response. Additionally, lattice heating via carrier thermalization occurs in approximately one picosecond indicating that the conductivity dynamics are more complex than simple heating above $T_c$. Crucially, however, for fluences greater than $\sim$10 mJ cm$^{-2}$, the deposited energy density ($\sim$500 J cm$^{-3}$) is considerably above what is required to heat above $T_c$ ($\sim$200 J cm$^{-3}$ at 300 K).

Figure 2(b) shows the maximum induced conductivity, $\Delta \sigma_{max}$, at each pump fluence extracted from the data in Figure 2(a). There is a marked decrease in the maximum obtainable conductivity with decreasing fluence. At a fluence of 19.2 mJ cm$^{-2}$, the induced conductivity at long times is 100% of the metallic phase conductivity (i.e. at 370 K). Extrapolation of the photoinduced conductivity change at 300 K, as shown in Fig. 2(b), yields a non-zero fluence threshold of $\sim$7 mJ cm$^{-2}$. The existence of a fluence threshold is a well-known feature in photoinduced phase transitions, where the cooperative nature of the dynamics results in a strongly non-linear conversion efficiency as a function of the number of absorbed photons. In the present case, photoexcitation leads to a rapid increase of the lattice temperature, initiating the nucleation and growth of metallic domains which coalesce (i.e. percolate) to yield a macroscopic conductivity response.
This occurs since the incident fluence of 12.8 mJ cm$^{-2}$ for various initial temperatures. The maximum possible induced change (●) and the maximum possible induced conductivity change (●). The black lines are a fit as described in the text. (c) Fluence threshold as a function of base temperature.

We have also measured the photoinduced terahertz conductivity as a function of base temperature. An optical pump fluence of 12.8 mJ cm$^{-2}$ was used, less than is required to drive the full metallic transition at room temperature (though, as described above, more than enough to superheat the film above $T_c$). The conductivity dynamics as a function of time at initial temperatures of 300, 310, and 320 K are displayed in Figure 3(a). From Figure 3(a) and (b) it is evident that, below $T_c$, the photoinduced change in the conductivity is less than the maximum possible induced change. However, with increasing initial temperature the induced conductivity change increases and obtains the maximum possible value at 320 K. Thus, in the insulating phase, there is a decrease in the threshold to drive the sample metallic with increasing temperature. At temperatures greater than 330 K, the photoinduced change in conductivity follows the maximum possible induced change (Figure 3(b)). This occurs since the incident fluence of 12.8 mJ cm$^{-2}$ is sufficient to drive the conductivity to its full metallic state consistent with a decreasing threshold. Finally, in Figure 3(c) we plot the fluence threshold as a function of base temperature as determined from several series of data such as that in Figure 2(b). This further emphasizes the softening that occurs in the insulating state with increasing base temperature.

Summarizing the dynamics in Figure 2 and Figure 4, (i) the conductivity rise time of ~100 ps is substantially longer than the excitation pulse or electron thermalization time, (ii) a fluence of 12.8 mJ cm$^{-2}$ heats the sample well in excess of $T_c$, (iii) despite (ii), the maximum possible conductivity is not obtained at 300 K indicating a stiffness with respect to driving the IM transition and, (iv) this stiffness towards fully driving the IM transition decreases with increasing temperature indicating a softening of the insulating phase. While a complete description of the dynamics is difficult, in the following we present a simple dynamic model using Bruggeman effective medium theory that, to first order, describes the experimentally measured dynamics.

Bruggeman effective medium theory (BEMT) is a mean field description to describe inhomogeneous media. For VO$_2$, this corresponds to the coexistence of a metallic volume fraction ($f_m$) and an insulating volume fraction (1-$f_m$) which depend on temperature. Previous work has described the temperature-dependent conductivity (both the finite transition temperature width and hysteresis) in terms of the coexistence of metallic and insulating phases in VO$_2$. More recently, additional experimental support for this idea from time-integrated optical conductivity and scanning probe measurements has been presented.

BEMT describes the conductivity as follows:

$$f_m \frac{\sigma_m - \sigma_{eff}}{\sigma_m + (d-1)\sigma_{eff}} + (1 - f_m) \frac{\sigma_i - \sigma_{eff}}{\sigma_i + (d-1)\sigma_{eff}} = 0 \quad (1)$$

where $\sigma_m$ is the conductivity in the metallic phase ($1000 \, \Omega^{-1} \, \text{cm}^{-1}$), and $\sigma_i = 0$ is the conductivity in the insulating phase. As with previous descriptions of VO$_2$ using BEMT, we take the two-dimensional form ($d=2$) of this expression. In this simple model, there exist disconnected metallic domains in the insulating phase. Percolation of the metallic domains occurs at $f_m = 0.50$, at which point the sample becomes conducting.

We can calculate the metallic volume fraction, $f_m$ using Eq. (1) and the experimental results presented in Figure 4 for temperatures above $T_c$ (● for $T_1$ and • for $T_T$), which we plot in Figure 4. The increasing temperature branch of the metallic fraction, $f_m(T_1)$, increases from 0.52 at 330 K to 0.98 at 350 K, while the decreasing temperature branch, $f_m(T_T)$, returns to 0.61 at 330 K, a consequence of the conductivity hysteresis exhibited in this material. In the insulating phase, we cannot use this approach to determine $f_m$ since the conductivity is below our detection limit.

To describe the conductivity dynamics in the insulating phase using BEMT we determine the temporal dependence of the volume fraction using the following ex-
pression:
\[
\frac{df_m}{dt} = f_m(1-f_m)\beta(T)
\]  
(2)

With this simple model, the growth rate of \( f_m \) depends on directly on \( f_m \), the available nonmetallic fraction \((1-f_m)\), and \( \beta(T) \) which describes the rate at which \( f_m \) evolves. It is reasonable to assume \( \beta(T) = \beta_0 \exp(-\Theta/k_bT) \) which describes an Arrhenius-like temperature dependence where \( \Theta \) is an energy barrier related, in the present case, to the latent heat. For example, for homogeneous domain growth, \( \Theta \propto (T-T_c)^{-2} \). The temperature dependence of \( \beta(T) \) is important to consider as there is a bath (i.e. the substrate) to which deposited heat can escape. This heat escape, described as \( T = T_0 \exp(-t/t_{sub}) \) (where \( t \) derives from the thermal mismatch between sample and substrate) imparts a time dependence to \( \beta(T) \). This allows for the parameterization of \( \beta(T) \) in terms of \( t \). A subsequent Taylor expansion of \( \beta(T(t)) \) about \( t = 0 \) yields an analytical solution to Eqn. 2 given by
\[
f_m(t) = \Phi/(1+\Phi) \text{ where } \Phi(t) = f_m^i/(1-f_m^i)\zeta, \]
where \( f_m^i \) is the initial metallic volume fraction, and \( \zeta = \exp(\tau_{tan}^r\beta_0^r(1-\exp(-t/\tau_{sub}^r))) \). It is the term \( \zeta \) which, even in the presence of superheating well above \( T_c \), prevents the full conductivity from being obtained. The superscript \( r \) indicates that dimensionless factors \((>1)\) from the Taylor expansion have been incorporated into the effective lifetime and and rate to simplify the expressions in this phenomenological model.

This solution describes the situation where the rate of increase of \( f_m \) decreases as energy initially deposited in the film escapes to the substrate. This determines the rise time of the conductivity and maximum induced change which in turn depends on the initial temperature (immediately after heating) and the initial volume fraction. We emphasize that this solution describes the rise time and must be multiplied by another exponential \( \exp(-t/\tau_d) \) to include the subsequent conductivity decay (parameterized by \( \tau_d \)). The solid black lines in Figure 3a are fits using this description where, for two dimensions \( \sigma(t) = (2f_m(t)-1)\sigma_m \). For the fits, \( \tau_{sub}^r = 100 \text{ ps}, \beta_0^r = 3.2 \times 10^{10} \text{ s}^{-1}, \tau_d = 1 \text{ ns}, \) and \( f_m^i = 0.08 \) \((300 \text{ K}), f_m^i = 0.13 \) \((310\text{K}), \) and \( f_m^i = 0.3 \) \((320\text{K}).\) The values of \( f_m^i \) in the insulating phase are plotted in Figure 4a.

We see that BEMT, appropriately extended to describe a dynamic metallic volume fraction, can account for the observed conductivity dynamics and strongly suggests a scenario where metallic precursors grow and coalesce upon photoinduced superheating. Furthermore, the results display an initial condition sensitivity described by the initial volume fraction \( f_m^i \). We note that our analysis has assumed homogeneous growth of \( f_m \) from an initial \( f_m^i \). It is possible that there is also photoinduced nucleation in which case the values of \( f_m^i \) will be smaller than what we have estimated from our analysis. Nonetheless, even in the case of photoinduced nucleation, the experimental data still reveal an initial condition sensitivity consistent with softening of the insulating phase and the BEMT describes the essence of the observed conductivity response.

In summary, we studied the near-threshold behavior of the photoinduced phase transition in VO2. For the first time, we use optical pump THz-probe measurements to directly measure the change in conductivity of the system. The observed dynamics of the photoinduced phase transition result in the enhancement of fluctuations as the temperature is increased towards the transition temperature. These results may also be conducive to high-sensitivity optical devices, which make use of correlated oxides for switching, detection or optical limiters.

We thank G. T. Wang and D. A. Yarotski for assistance with the film thickness measurements and M. Croft for an insightful discussion. This research has been supported by the Los Alamos National Laboratory Directed Research and Development program.

---

* Present Address: Department of Physics, University of Alabama-Birmingham. 1530 3rd Ave S, Campbell Hall 310, Birmingham, AL 35294-1170
* Electronic address: raveritt@physics.bu.edu; Present Address: Department of Physics, Boston University, 50 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, MA 02215

[1] R. D. Averitt, et al., J. Phys.:Cond. Matt. 14, R1357 (2002).
[2] S. Koshihara, M. Kuwata-Gonokami, ed., Special Topics, photoinduced Phase Transitions and their Dynamics, in J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. 75 (2006).
[3] A. Cavalleri, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 87, 237401 (2001).
[4] E. Collet, et al., Science 300, 612 (2003).
[5] S. Iwai, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 91, 057401 (2003).
[6] J. B. Goodenough, J. Sol. Stat. Chem. 3, 490 (1971).
[7] R. M. Wentzcovitch, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 72, 3389 (1994).
[8] A. Zybersztejn, N. F. Mott, Phys. Rev. B 11, 4383 (1975).
[9] I. Balberg and W. R. Roach, in Conduction in Low Mobility Materials, 77-85, (World Scientific, Singapore, 1971).
[10] W. R. Roach, Appl. Phys. Lett. 19, 453 (1971).
[11] M. Rini, et al., Opt. Lett. 30, 558 (2005).
[12] A. Cavalleri, et al., Phys. Rev. B 70, 161102(R) (2004).
[13] A. Cavalleri, et al., Phys. Rev. B 69, 153106 (2004).
[14] A. Cavalleri, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 95, 067405 (2005).
[15] M. Fiebig, et al., Science 280, 1925 (1998).
[16] X.J. Liu, et al., J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. 72, 1615 (2003).
[17] D. Brassard, et al., Appl. Phys. Lett. 87, 051910 (2005).
[18] D. Mittleman, ed., Sensing with Terahertz Radiation, vol. 85 of Optical Sciences (Springer, Berlin, 2003), 1st ed.
[19] L. Duvillaret, F. Garet, and J.-L. Coutaz, IEEE Journal of Selected Topics in Quantum Electronics 2, 739 (1996).
[20] F. J. Morin, Phys. Rev. Lett. 3, 34 (1959).
[21] V. I. Surikov, et al., Sov. Phys: Sol. Stat. 28, 892 (1986).
[22] V. I. Surikov, et al., Sov. Phys: Sol. Stat. 29, 351 (1987).
[23] D. Bruggemann, Ann. Phys. (Leipzig) **24**, 636 (1935).
[24] D. Stroud, Phys. Rev. B **12**, 3368 (1975).
[25] H. S. Choi, *et al.*, Phys. Rev. B **54**, 4621 (1996).
[26] Y. J. Chang, *et al.*, Thin Solid Films **486**, 46 (2005).
[27] J. P. Sethna, *Statistical Mechanics*, 244-246, (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 2007).