Analysis of Effectiveness of Change of Training Program with Adkar Approach (Awareness, Desire, Knowledge, Ability and Reinforcement)

Ainur Leksono¹*, Praptini Yulianti²
Airlangga University
Corresponding Author: Ainur Leksono ainur.leksono@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO
Keywords: awareness, desire, knowledge, ability, reinforcement
Received: 4 October
Revised: 7 October
Accepted: 28 October

ABSTRACT
Every organisation must experience changes to survive and develop amid increasingly fierce business competition, especially during the Covid-19 pandemic. This study identifies essential changes in the company using the ADKAR model (Awareness, Desire, Knowledge, Ability, Reinforcement) before and after the pandemic. It makes suggestions for improvements to increase the effectiveness of employee performance. The research object is a company engaged in training, namely the Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute Surabaya, using 5 (five) Key Informants. Data mining is carried out through in-depth interviews, and then the data obtained will be validated through FGD. The results of this study got strategic steps for neglecting ADKAR that can be applied, among others building awareness, among others, namely: (a) communication with directors and technicians; (b) preparation of materials following the time allocation; (c) addition of training assistants; (d) creation of animations or creative media to help participants understand the training; (e) cooperation with several vendors who have studios; etc. At the creating desire stage, the following steps are carried out: (a) communication with directors and technicians regarding training innovations; (b) preparation of materials following the time allocation; (c) addition of training assistants; (d) efficiency of agency spending; etc. The foresting ability and reinforcing change stages include: (a) self-study; (b) job immersing; (c) webinars and simulations; (d) FGD (Focus Group Discussion); etc. Meanwhile, reinforcing change includes: (a) assistance; (b) personal coaching; (c) buddy system; (d) negotiations with studio owners; (e) increase in working capital through provision for operating profit; (f) equipment loans through financing institutions or banks; etc.

INTRODUCTION
The Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute is an independent educational institution in Surabaya that provides training related to employee development, consulting with company management in solving problem-solving for company problems, unique research and processing survey data and so on with various fields of management studies such as human resource management, marketing, finance and operations, besides that this institution also provides training and consulting services in the engineering field, especially in the industrial engineering field. However, with the Covid-19 Pandemic at the beginning of 2020, there has been a drastic decrease in the number of clients; at the end of 2020, it became 67 clients, and at the end of 2021, it became 52 clients.

This is undoubtedly a critical issue for the management of the Edu Training Institute because it is related to the organisation's sustainability. Companies that become clients want some sudden changes and require extensive and complex resources. Some of the conditions before the pandemic, among others, (a) trainers or presenters are required to master the material to be taught, (b)
training is carried out offline (face to face) or offline either through On The Job training or On The Job Training, (c) assessing participants' understanding is easier to do because it can be through direct feedback. Direct or interactive, (d) the profit of the Edu Institute is relatively more significant because the company is willing to pay rather expensive and is calculated based on the number of participants, and (e) only standard training equipment is needed, for example, laptops, printers, projectors, pointers and so on.

Meanwhile, during a pandemic, the conditions faced include (1) trainers or presenters, in addition to mastering the material, must also master information technology, (2) conducted online (online), (3) assessing participants' understanding of the material that has been taught is difficult because feedback is not obtained interactively, (4) profit margin relatively small because many costs are cut such as transportation costs, accommodation costs and so on. In addition, often, the number of training participants is not a measure of cost, (5) apart from laptops, modems, routers, LEDs, webcams, mini studios, silencers, equalisers and so on are needed.

Therefore, this study aims to measure and analyse the effectiveness of employee training programs through the ADKAR approach (Awareness, Desire, Knowledge, Ability and Reinforcement) and to obtain suggestions for improving employee training programs at the Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute Surabaya to increase training effectiveness and worker productivity. From this description, the researcher seeks to find solutions so that effective and profitable changes can occur for the training institution.

**METHODS**

Types of Research, Research Objects and Subjects

This research uses qualitative research to measure training effectiveness at the Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute, Surabaya. In this study, the object in question is the Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute, Surabaya. While the subject is a crucial employee with specific criteria from various companies who are trained by the training institution who is aware of the problem being studied and can be an accurate source of data to determine research information, the researcher will use a purposive procedure or in qualitative research commonly referred to as a key informant. Purposive methods are one of the most common strategies for determining information in qualitative research, namely determining criteria relevant to specific research problems [16].

**Data Type**

The types of data in this study are primary data and secondary data. The preliminary data in this study are generated from interviews conducted by researchers on the subject, the distribution of questionnaires, and the researcher's documentation of the research object. In comparison, secondary data is obtained from sources other than the subject of the informant. For example, secondary data can be obtained from training results, training complaints data, and the number of employees being prepared. So on, books, journals or results of previous research related to the study conducted.

**Data Collection Technique**

To obtain more accurate data, the research will use three data collection techniques: observation, interviews, and documentation of data related to training conducted by the Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute.

**Measurement**

Researchers measure the effectiveness of the training conducted by the Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute with several approaches to the ADKAR method.

**Table 1. ADKAR Questions**

| No. | Stages   | Questions                                                                 | Targets |
|-----|----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| 1   | Awareness| How is employee communication with stakeholders in the previous and current conditions | Employee |
|     |          | How is employee access to information on previous and current conditions   | Employee |
|     |          | What is the level of employee need for training in previous and current conditions? | Manager  |
|     |          | What is the individual perspective on the company's condition in the previous and current conditions? | Manager  |
|     |          | How is the                                                                  | Consultant|
management work style in the previous and current conditions?
How is the credibility of the leadership changed in the previous and current conditions?
How is validation related to changes in the company?
What are the risks if the changes are not made?
Is the vision to be achieved by the company related to the changes made?
What things need to be related to determining the scope of change, objectives and timing?

What is the motivation of employees in previous and current conditions?
Are there any risks associated with providing employee training?
What is the level of instruction and communication in the previous and current conditions?
Is there a risk of job loss if changes are not made?
Is there any discomfort that is felt with the change?
If employees make changes, there will be career advancement
Can the changes that occur increase incentives and compensation?
Can the change increase trust in superiors and the organisation?
Can change increase expectations?

Table 2. ADKAR Questions (advanced)

| No. | Stages     | Questions                                                                 | Targets                        |
|-----|------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| 3.  | Knowledge  | What is the proper training method to increase knowledge related to change? | Consultant                     |
|     |            | Do employees have sufficient experience related to changes?                | Manager                        |
|     |            | Do employees have access to information                                    | Employee                       |

4. Ability

| Questions                                                                 | Targets                        |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| How is the availability of resources in the company related to change?    | Manager                        |
| Are employees able to demonstrate their ability to deal with change?      | Employee                       |
| Are employees able to carry out continuous training to deal with change?  | Employee                       |
| How can employees provide feedback regarding changes made by the company? | Employee                       |
| How are the psychological aspects of employees in dealing with changes made by the company? | Consultant                     |
| How is the availability of resources owned by the company in the face of change? | Manager                        |

5. Reinforcement

| Questions                                                                 | Targets                        |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Does the company have standard procedures related to changes?             | Employee                       |
| How does the company give the reward to employees who are willing to make changes desired by the organisation? | Manager                        |
| How can the measurement results and feedback be used to further increase the level of the organisation through change? | Consultant                     |
| How is the implementation of the accountability system in the company related to change | Manager                        |
| Are there any negative impacts felt by employees when changes occur?     | Employee                       |

Analysis Technique

Solving this research problem starts from the identification and problem formulation stage, the preparation and planning stage, the change management design drafting stage, the change
management design validation stage, and the conclusion and suggestion stage.

Preparation and Planning Stage
In the preparation and planning stages, there are several steps, including (1) Determination of the Scope of Change, (2) Formulation of Affected Parties, (3) Change Risk Analysis, and (4) Preparation of Change Management Design Phase. In addition, while at the level of planning this change management plan, there are several steps as follows: (1) Planning for the Building Awareness Level, (2) Planning for the Creating Desire Level, (3) Planning for the Developing Knowledge Level, (4) Planning for the Fostering Ability Level, and (5) Planning Level Reinforcing Change.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
Analysis of Affected Parties
Several parties were affected when the training system changed from offline to online, as shown in Table below.

Table 3. Affected Parties Due to Changes in Business Processes from Offline to Online Training

| Change Key | Format Change | Affected Party |
|------------|---------------|----------------|
| Format of Training | Previous condition: The training is carried out using an offline/offline system which can take the form of On Job Training and Off the Job Training. Present condition: The training is carried out using an online system that can take the form of Full Body and Webinars. | - Trainer, - Technician, - Marketer |
| Financing | Previous condition: The Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute has a tariff with a reasonably large profit margin because, Off Job Training, there is a fee from the hotel or the event venue. And if it takes the form of On Job Training, you will get transportation and accommodation costs from the client. Present condition: Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute has tariffs with thin profit margins because many clients think that online training costs are not much. Meanwhile, for Edu Prima Cemerlang, finding a trainer willing to be paid at a low rate will be challenging. Besides that, a studio rental fee is quite expensive for a total body concept. | - Owner, - Trainer |

Table 4. Affected Parties Due to Changes in Business Processes from Offline to Online Training (advanced)

| Change Key | Format Change                                                                 | Affected Party |
|------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| Delivery of training Theory | Previous condition: Trainers conduct conventional training such as direct teaching and learning process by preparing a laptop and presenting it in the form of slides on the LCD projector. Present condition: Trainers conduct online training by utilising specific devices by using the internet network with the criteria desired by the client. | - Trainer |

Table 4. Affected Parties Due to Changes in Business Processes from Offline to Online Training (advanced)
Figure 1. Change Management Roadmap at Edu Prima Cemerlang Training Institute – Surabaya

Changes that occur in the Edu Prima Cemerlang training institution due to system changes can be mapped from each of its business processes, changes that occur in the form of training from an offline system (offline) to an online system (online), training support equipment for online training, delivery of training materials through a visual interface so that it is more difficult for trainers to provide understanding to training participants, as well as changes related to financing where the training costs paid by clients for online training are lower than offline training, so this has an impact on decreasing the profits of training institutions and the continuity of the training business.

CONCLUSION
In this study, a change management design was carried out using the ADKAR model (Awareness, Desire, Knowledge, Ability, Reinforcement). The plan was successfully mapped out from each stage, among others, in the first stage, namely building awareness, including (a) communication with the board of directors and technicians; (b) preparation of materials following the time allocation; (c) addition of training assistants; (d) creation of animation or creative media to assist the understanding of the trainees. In the second stage, namely creating desire, the following steps were taken: (a) communication with the directors and technicians related to training innovations; (b) preparation of materials following the time allocation; (c) addition of training assistants; (d) creation of animation or creative media to assist the understanding of the trainees. Finally, in the third stage, namely developing knowledge, the following steps are taken: (a) self-study; (b) job immersing; (c) webinars; (d) simulation; (e) FGD (Focus Group Discussion); (f) negotiation.

Change management action plans to support a successful implementation, namely foresting ability and reinforcing change. Foresting ability includes the following activities: (a) self-study; (b) job immersing; (c) webinars and simulations; (d) FGD (Focus Group Discussion); (e) negotiations; (f) teamwork; (g) job shadowing; (h) TNA (Training Need Assessment); (i) STP (Segmenting Targeting and Positioning); (j) Benchmarking; (k) Guaranteed or Warranty; (l) KPI (Key Performance Indicators); (m) Alliance and cooptation; (o) Enrichment Skill

REFERENCES
Hornstein, H. A. The integration of project management and organisational change management is now a necessity. International journal of project management. 2015; vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 291-298.
Kraai, N., & Mashau, P. The influence of training content, learning and training transfer on training effectiveness: a case study of board members of non-profit organisations in Gauteng. Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues. 2020; vol. 8, no. 2, pp. 947-96, 2020
Coch, L., & French Jr, J. R. Overcoming resistance to change, Human relations. 2014; vol. 1, no.4, pp. 512-532.
Nadila, M. Analisis Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia Dalam Upaya Peningkatan Kinerja Karyawan Pada PT. Bank Muamalat Indonesia Cabang Malang. Jurnal Ekobistek,. 2010; vol. 6, no. 2, pp. 37-51.
Tan, A. H., Ong, Y. S., & Tapanuj, A. A hybrid agent architecture integrates desire, intention and reinforcement learning. Expert Systems with Applications. 2011; vol. 38, no. 7, pp. 8477-8487.
Burhan Ismael, N., Jabbar Othman, B., Gardi, B., Abdalla Hamza, P., Sorguli, S., Mahmood
Aziz, H., & Anwar, G. The Role of Training and Development on Organisational effectiveness. Journal of Management Strategic. 2021; vol. 45, no. 6, pp. 3575-3593

Sink, D. S. and Tuttle, T. C. (1989). Planning and Measurement in Your Organization of the Future. IE Press: Norcross. 1998.

Antony, J. P., & Bhattacharyya, S. Measuring organisational performance and excellence of SMEs–Part 2 is an empirical study on SMEs in India. Measuring business excellence,. 2010; vol. 19, no. 4, pp. 1089-1104.

Prabowo, R., Singgih, M. L., Karningsih, P. D., & Widodo, E. New product development from inactive problem perspective in indonesian SMEs to open innovation. Journal of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, and Complexity. 2020; 6(1), 20.

Karambelkar, M., & Bhattacharya, S. Onboarding is a change: applying the change management model ADKAR to onboarding. Human resource management international digest. 2017; vol. 15, no. 6, pp. 139-154.

D’Aniello, G., Gaeta, M., Loia, V., Orciuoli, F., & Tomasiello, S. A dialogue-based approach enhanced with situation awareness and reinforcement learning for ubiquitous access to linked data. 2014 International Conference on Intelligent Networking and Collaborative Systems – IEEE. 2014; pp. 249-256.

Ismael, NB, Othman, BJ, Gardi, B., Hamza, PA, Sorguli, S., Aziz, HM, Ahmed, SA, Sabir, BY, Ali, BJ, Anwar, G. The Role of Training and Development on Organisational effectiveness. International Journal of Engineering, Business and Management. 2021 ; vol. 5, no. 3, pp. 15-24

Jain, G., Sharma, N., & Shrivastava, A. It enhances organisational training effectiveness through blockchain-enabled training effectiveness measurement (BETEM). Journal of Organizational Change Management,. 2021; vol. 22, no. 3, pp. 977-990

Shepherd, M. L., Harris, M. L., Chung, H., & Himes, E. M. Using the Awareness, Desire, Knowledge, Ability, Reinforcement Model to build a shared governance culture. Journal of Nursing Education and Practice. 2014 ; vol. 4, no. 6, pp. 90-106.

Prosci, H. A. The integration of project management and organisational change management is now a necessity. International journal of project management,. 2014 ; vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 291-298.

Parker, D., Verlinden, A., Nussey, R., Ford, M., & Pathak, R. D. Critical evaluation of project-based performance management: Change intervention integration. International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management,. 2013; vol. 14, no. 6, pp. 179-194.