Rethinking developed nations’ health systems through a social sustainability perspective in the light of the COVID-19 pandemic. A viewpoint

Gloria Macassa,1,2 Gianpaolo Tomaselli3

1Department of Public Health and Sports Sciences, University of Gävle, Sweden
2EPIUnit – Instituto de Saúde Pública, Universidade do Porto, Portugal
3Department of Health Services Management, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Malta, Msida, Malta

Abstract

This viewpoint paper argues for the need for more socially sustainable care systems that can better contribute to equitable utilization of health care in a post-pandemic era. Health care systems in developed nations need to rethink their role, particularly with regard to the achievement of Sustainable Development Goal 3 (SDG 3) as well as becoming more sustainable societies. Socially sustainable care systems will recognize that systemic factors and processes (social, economic, environmental, cultural) need to be addressed simultaneously in order to achieve health equity. Moreover, these systems are likely to be of paramount importance for post-COVID-19, because of the potential increase in demand for health care due to forgone health care and the increased burden of chronic diseases as spillover effects related to COVID-19 mitigation interventions.

Introduction

The COVID-19 pandemic, which started in China in December 2019, has now reached all continents and many countries are currently struggling to curb infection and death rates.1 Globally, the novel coronavirus has infected 29,032,938 people and 924,831 have died because of the disease.2 Up to date some of the most affected countries have been the US, the UK, Spain and Italy.2,3 The pace of infection and death rates have varied widely and health care systems (and their health care workers) have been at the forefront of these situations so far. However, the pandemic has also exposed various problems affecting health care systems (e.g. reduced bed capacity; insufficient testing systems) across different countries and especially in Europe and the USA.2,3

As agreed by many, health can be seen as essential for the achievement of sustainable human development (health as a human right)4 but also as an important factor for economic development.4 This makes it a measure of the economic development of societies and an adequate measure for any nation’s progress towards sustainable development and achievement of United Nations (UN) Agenda 2030, particularly Sustainable Development Goal 3 (SDG 3), health for all at all ages.4,5 Furthermore, health has an effect on any country’s development through increased productive employment, promotion of social cohesion and reduction of medical expenses.2

In any country, the health care system is expected to provide health care for all individuals, thus contributing to wellbeing and economic prosperity. In addition, the provision of health care should occur without contributing to influencing financial strain, poverty, or to social and health inequity outcomes for individuals and population groups.6 However, the COVID-19 pandemic has exposed the failures associated with the type of health care systems prevailing in some countries. Within this context, we can establish a contrast between how the health care systems in Europe and the US responded, and still do today, as the task of controlling the infection is still unfolding. Similar failures were seen across public health systems regarding disease testing, surveillance and contact tracing.2,3 In European countries, health care is provided through a wide range of different systems run at individual national levels tightly regulated, and competing private health insurance companies, with government subsidies available for citizens who cannot afford coverage. This way, although under pressure as well as facing several other challenges (such as early unpreparedness and lack of personal protective equipment), countries have been able to provide care for all during the pandemic. For instance, Germany health care system is based on a compulsory social insurance that provides comprehensive health coverage to the entire population.7 On the other hand, France have a national health insurance system that provides coverage to all legal residents. It is financed by public social security and private health care financing, combined with a public-private mix in the provision of health care services.8 Italy health care system – although highly decentralized – provides universal coverage to the whole population through corporate and value-added tax revenues collected by the central government and distributed to the
Health systems post COVID-19

Health care systems in developed nations, need to rethink their role, especially with regard to the achievement of SDG 3 and contributing to Agenda 2030. This will be even more important in the post-COVID-19 era because of the likelihood of a potential increase in demand for health services due to i) forgone health care (due to individuals’ lack of income to pay for treatment and medications, consultations and other services); and ii) the increased burden of chronic diseases as spillover effects related to COVID-19 mitigation interventions aimed to the outbreak (e.g., social isolation, strain on social networks, and job and income losses). Here, social sustainability of health systems will help as health care organizations will need to be redeployed as a consequence of short-term reductions in the availability of human resources for health, due to disease risk and job stress associated with fighting the infection (e.g., medical and nursing personnel stress, anxiety, depression and post-traumatic stress disorder). Furthermore, based on WHO recommendations, several measures need to be implemented by health systems worldwide in order to strengthen their responses to pandemic events (e.g., the capacity of communication networks, increasing intensive care unit capacity, protecting the physical and mental health of health care workers, assessing and mitigating financial barriers related to access to care, etc.).

In many countries, as the pandemic still unfolds, with a resur-
gence of cases (due to the massive natural experiment of reopening economies), government expenditure on health care is likely to be strained.\textsuperscript{2,23} Ozili argues that the measures to mitigate the spread of the COVID-19 pandemic (social distancing and shelter in place) affected economies with an impact on financial markets, business and events, as well as corporate offices. In addition, he suggested that the exponential rate of the COVID-19 spread and uncertainty led to flight to safety in consumption and investment among consumers, investors and international trade partners.\textsuperscript{24} Several countries, even industrialized ones might experience reduction in tax revenues linked to economic disruptions, and economic debt from unprecedented economic measures to remedy the pandemic effects (e.g., liquidity support for business organizations, salary supplementation schemes), which may require large-scale sovereign debt financing.\textsuperscript{25-27}

**Conflict of interest:** The authors have no competing interests.

**Ethics approval and consent to participate:** Not applicable.

**Conclusion**

The current pandemic has challenged health systems in developed countries with a variety of outcomes due to differences in the systems of care. We expect that experiences and lessons from the COVID-19 pandemic will serve as catalyst for developed countries to rethink their systems where social equity is a priority. To have sustainable health systems will in turn contribute to sustainable societies as well as the achievement of SDG 3 and Agenda 2030.

**References**

1. Di Germano F, Pizzol D, Marotta C, et al. Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) current status and future perspectives: A narrative review. Int J Environ Res Public Health 2020;17:2690. doi:10.3390/ijerph17082690.
2. Johns Hopkins Corona Virus Resource Center [Internet]. COVID-19 Data in motion. Accessed on: 14 September 2020. Available from: https://coronavirus.jhu.edu/
3. WHO. Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Dashboard. Accessed on: 11 June 2020. Available from: https://covid19.who.int/
4. Franklin P. Sustainable development goal on health (SDG3): The opportunity to make EU health a priority. European Policy Center 2017. Available from: http://aei.pitt.edu/id/eprint/87211
5. Sharma R. Health and economic growth: Evidence from dynamic panel data of 143 years. PLoS One 2018;13:e0204940. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0204940
6. Popescu ME, Militaru E, Cristescu A, et al. Investigating health systems in the European Union: Outcomes and fiscal sustainability. Sustainability 2018;10:3186. doi: 10.3390/su10093186
7. Department for Professional Employees [Internet]. The U.S. health care system: An international perspective. 2016. Available from: https://www.dpeaflcio.org/factsheets/the-us-health-care-system-an-international-perspective
8. Steffen M. Universalism, responsiveness, sustainability – Regulating the French Health Care System. N Engl J Med 2016;374:401-5. doi: 10.1056/NEJMp1504547
9. Nuti S, Chiara S, Vainieri M, Zett S. Assessment and improvement of the Italian Healthcare System: First evidence from a pilot national performance evaluation system. J Healthc Manag 2012;57:182-99.
10. Woolhandler S, Himmelstein DU. Intersecting U.S. epidemics: COVID-19 and lack of health insurance. Ann Intern Med 2020;173:63-4. doi: 10.7326/M20-1491
11. Schwartz SA. Covid-19 and the documented failure of the American illness profit system — We have to stop treating our doctors, nurses, healthcare workers, and ourselves this way. Explore 2020;16:210-3. doi: 10.1016/j.explore.2020.05.001
12. Laurencin CI, Mclinton A. The COVID-19 pandemic: a call to action to identify and address racial and ethnic disparities. J Racial Ethn Health Disparities 2020. doi: 10.1007/S40615-020-00756-0
13. Shah M, Sachdeva M, Dodik-Gad RP. Covid-19 and racial disparities. J Am Acad Dermatol 2020;83:e35. doi: 10.1016/j.jaad.2020.04.046
14. Bhala N, Cussy G, Martineau AR, et al. Sharpening the global focus on ethnicity and race in the time of COVID-19. Lancet 2020;395:P1673-6. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31102-8
15. Nawaz W, Muammer K. Exploring organizational sustainability: Themes, functional areas, and best practices. Sustainability 2019;11:4307. doi: 10.3390/su11164307
16. Maghsoodi T, Cascon-Pereira R, Lara ABH. The role of collaborative healthcare in improving social: A conceptual framework. Sustainability 2020;12:3195. doi: 10.3390/su12083195.
17. Scrutton J, Holley-Moore G, Bamford SM. Creating a sustainable 21st century healthcare system. International Longevity Centre–UK (ILC-UK) 2015. Available from: http://www.ilcuk.org.uk/ (Accessed on 03/06/ 2020).
18. Khayatzadeh-Mahani A, Labonte R, Ruckert A, de Leeuw E. Using sustainability as a collaboration magnet to encourage multi-sector collaborations for health. Glob Health Promot
20. Healthy People 2020 [Internet]. Social determinants of health. Accessed on: 28 May 2020. Available from: https://www.healthypeople.gov/2020/topics-objectives/topic/social-determinants-of-health

21. Chew NWS, Lee GKH, Tan BYQ, et al. A multinational, multicentre study on the psychological outcomes and associated physical symptoms amongst healthcare workers during COVID-19 outbreak. Brain Behav Immun 2020;88:559-65. doi: 10.1016/j.bbi.2020.04.049

22. Cao J, Wei J, Zhu H, et al. Study of basic needs and psychological wellbeing of medical workers in the fever clinic of a tertiary general hospital in Beijing during the COVID-19 outbreak. Psychother Psychosom 2020;89:252-4. doi: 10.1159/000507453

23. WHO. Strengthening the health system response to COVID-19. Recommendations for the WHO European Region Policy brief. Accessed on: 1 June 2020. Available from: https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/333072

24. McKibbin W, Fernando R. The economic impact of COVID-19. In: R. Baldwin and B.W. di Mauro, editors. Economics in time of COVID-19. London: CEPR Press; 2020. pp 45-51.

25. Ozili PK, Arun T. Spill-over of COVID-19: impact on the global economy. SSRN Electronic J 2020. doi: 10.2139/ssrn.3562570

26. Beck T. Finance in times of COVID-19: What next? In: Mitigating the COVID economic crisis: Act fast and do whatever it takes. R. Baldwin and B.W. di Mauro, editors. Economics in time of COVID-19. London: CEPR Press; 2020. pp 1-227.

27. Blanchard O. What it will take to save the economy from COVID-19. Washington DC: Peterson Institute for International Economics; 2020.