Images of time: temporal aspects of auditory and movement imagination

Rebecca S. Schaefer*

Department for Psychological and Brain Sciences, SAGE Center for the Study of the Mind, University of California, Santa Barbara, Santa Barbara, CA, USA

*Correspondence: rebecca.schaefer@sagecenter.ucsb.edu

Keywords: auditory imagery, motor imagery, temporal processing, expertise

Research on mental imagery has shown that when we imagine something, the related neural processes overlap with those related to actually perceiving or performing that same percept or action (Kosslyn et al., 2001). Although visual imagery has long been the dominant modality for the investigation of sensory imagery, involvement of modality-specific brain regions (i.e., visual areas being implicated in visual imagery, and so on) has now also been reported for auditory, olfactory and tactile imagery (Halpern, 2001; Plailly et al., 2012; Schmidt et al., 2014). Movement or action imagery has informed theories of action representation (Jeannerod and Decety, 1995) and has recently gained interest in the context of mental practice for expert skill acquisition such as sports or surgery (Cocks et al., 2014) and movement rehabilitation (Malouin and Richards, 2010). Increasingly, the neural underpinnings of imagery have become clearer, and both modality-specific and modality-unspecific neural activations related to imagery have been found (Daselaar et al., 2010; Zvyagintsev et al., 2013). However, the growing body of neuroimaging literature on imagination has yet to include an account of temporal imagery. Although the reproduction of time intervals has been a research topic of interest, the contribution of temporal imagery—namely internal timekeeping or creating the temporal aspects of imagery in other modalities—is largely unexplored. As such it is unclear whether, similar to other perceptual modalities, imagery for time shares cerebral substrate with brain networks involved in time perception or regularity detection. Specifically for actions or sounds, the temporal structure of the imagined stimulus or action is crucial in conjuring a faithful image, suggesting that in scientific findings of auditory and motor imagery, temporal imagery is included. The temporal patterns we create internally arguably lie at the basis of any self-paced movement, be it a fast sprint, a musical performance, or an easy walk in the park. Here, I argue that the shared components between movement and auditory (specifically music) imagery may offer a window into timing and temporal skills, which may carry cognitive importance beyond movement or auditory functions. Whereas the reciprocal influences of rhythmic sound and movement have been shown, with rhythmic movement supporting auditory acuity (Su and Pöppel, 2012) and rhythmic sound supporting movement efficiency (Bood et al., 2013), few studies have looked at the extent to which imagery can functionally replace perception or action and show similar interactions, which may point to shared processing in their temporal structure. Music imagination was reported to affect finger tapping similarly to perceived music (Repp, 2001) and has been used to support movement in clinical settings (Satoh and Kuzuhara, 2008). Anecdotal observation from music imagery experiments (such as described in Schaefer et al., 2011b), suggests that tapping a finger along to music imagery supported accurate imagery timing, and auditory cues are reported to increase motor imagery vividness (Heremans et al., 2009). Furthermore, motor timing skills and anticipatory music imagery ability appear to be related (Pecenka and Keller, 2009; Keller and Appel, 2010). These findings suggest that the links between motor and music processing may extend into imagined stimuli or actions, and the contribution of the current piece is to bring together findings from temporal processing, music and motor research, and to assert that firstly, the commonalities between music and motor imagery may reveal more about internally driven timing mechanisms, and secondly, one might speculate that these internal timing patterns are related to expertise, and as such may be seen in the context of findings on temporal skills and cognitive abilities (Madison et al., 2009; Holm et al., 2011).

IMAGERY FOR TEMPORAL PATTERNS

Auditory patterns and movement sequences share a strong dependence on temporal structure. Specifically in music and speech sounds, a fine-grained temporal ordering of acoustic features forms a meaningful percept, and precise perceptual skills are required to decode or extract information from these signals. Similarly, skilled movement sequences are intricately ordered, and often need to be concatenated through extensive practice. When sounds or complex movements are imagined, their temporal structure crucially needs to be integrated in the image, creating an imagined temporal pattern. The direction of time in imagined sounds or movement sequences is non-reversible, although single elements can be imagined in reverse; for instance, you may imagine single movement elements in reverse, or a construct working memory task that makes use of sensory imagery through the mental reversal of melodies, see...
Zatorre et al. (2009), although this changes the identity of the sound or movement, and likely requires increased imagery ability and domain-specific expertise.

The discourse on the temporal structure of imagery is most developed for the motor domain, where researchers aim to understand and increase the efficacy of the mental practice of skilled movement (for reviews, see Guillot et al., 2012; Smith and Wakefield, 2013). Although the timing of an imagined action will not necessarily convey information about the content or vividness of the imagery, the assumption is that it at least gives an indication of whether the temporal structure of the imagined action is similar to the actual action. Among the factors that can affect the timing of motor imagery are the type, complexity and duration of the imagined action and the age, expertise level and imagery strategy of the subject (Guillot et al., 2012). Although there is still little evidence to suggest that accurately timed mental practice actually improves motor learning, the timing of movement imagination has been shown to impact the timing of subsequent motor performance (Debarnot et al., 2011). Again, changing the speed of a complex movement changes its nature (although much more subtly than when reversing a sequence), and the ability to manipulate imagery tempo may only be available to movement experts. Smith and Wakefield (2013) further argue that as movement rhythms are crucial to success in sports, the rhythm of imagined actions should also receive more consideration, rather than recording only their overall timing. However, good paradigms to assess imagined movement rhythm need to be developed.

The temporal structure of auditory imagery has not received as much specific research attention, but given that rhythmic patterns are integral to music, the imagery of temporal structure is perhaps even more crucial to music imagination. Several studies have shown that accurate (or veridical) imagery, be it of movements or music, is typically associated with expertise. Several investigations note increased vividness and/or accuracy for imagery of experts.

Commonalities between the brain activity patterns of (auditory) rhythm perception and movement have long been interpreted as related to temporal structure (Ivry, 1996; Schubotz et al., 2000), implicating the cerebellum, striatum, premotor cortex (PMC), and (pre-) supplementary motor cortex (SMA). These areas are also part of a network of areas identified in a meta-analysis of 41 studies of interval timing tasks, where conjunctions for perceptual and motor timing tasks were reported in the bilateral SMA, PMC, parietal areas, bilateral inferior frontal gyrus (IFG), striatum, right insula and bilateral posterior cerebellum for sub-second intervals and in the bilateral SMA, left pre-central gyrus, right cingulate gyrus, right IFG and bilateral insula for supra-second intervals (Wiener et al., 2010). Specifically for auditory perceptual timing, distinct patterns were found for duration- and beat-based timing processes (Teki et al., 2011), showing absolute, duration-based timing tasks to mostly activate cerebellar and brainstem areas, and relative, beat-based timing to activate the basal ganglia, PMC, (pre-)SMA and dorsolateral prefrontal cortex. Comparing these results to reports of imagined music and imagined movement reveals considerable anatomical overlap, with temporal processing being a common feature in the interpretation of these activations during imagination. Findings from music imagery provide consistent reports of activation in the secondary auditory cortex, IFG and (pre-)SMA, as well as cerebellar and striatal areas (Halpern and Zatorre, 1999; Leaver et al., 2009; Herholz et al., 2012). A recent meta-analysis of 75 movement imagery studies reported that when combining all types of movement, the areas that are most commonly found to be active during movement imagery include SMA, bilateral precentral gyrus, IFG, parietal areas, striatum, and cerebellum (lobule VI) (Hétu et al., 2013). Collectively, it appears that there is considerable overlap in the brain areas activated by music and motor imagery, and similar brain area networks are implicated in timing tasks. However, the striking apparent similarity between brain networks engaged in motor and perceptual timing, auditory imagination and imagined actions is of course no indication that each of these functions depends on identical neural mechanisms.

The investigation of temporal structure is inherently hampered by the fact that these structures are embedded in actions or percepts, which, as discussed above, are known to interact with imagery. However, this may be overcome by using ambiguous percepts or actions with different imposed temporal structures or interpretations, for instance by imposing different temporal structures on ambiguous stimuli (Fujikawa et al., 2010; Schaefer et al., 2011a), or looking at individual differences in beat perception (Grahn and McAuley, 2009). Using ambiguous stimuli to look at temporal structure, by imposing different temporal structures on identically performed actions, is much harder to achieve for actions. However, experiments looking directly at the common components of music and motor imagery can be easily conceived, for instance by directly comparing the manipulation of tempo in auditory and movement imagery. Thus, there are ways to overcome the complexity of the embedded, implicit nature of temporal patterns in experimental settings.

**TEMPORAL SKILLS AND EXPERTISE**

Imagery has long been thought of as an integral part of learning and memory, perception and action, information processing and reasoning (Kosslyn et al., 1995). Accurate (or veridical) imagery, be it of movements or music, is typically associated with expertise. Several investigations note increased vividness and/or accuracy for imagery of experts.
(Ozel et al., 2004; Janata and Paroo, 2006; Pecenka and Keller, 2009), and, in the case of musicians, accurate imagery is considered an integral aspect of music performance (Hargreaves, 2012) and a mark of good musicianship (as evident from historical musical aptitude scales; i.e., Gordon, 1965). Although this is correlational evidence, it may thus be the case that imagery skills are acquired with expertise. While for expert musicians strong temporal skills are clearly needed, the rhythm of movement is also highly important for effective sports performance (MacPherson et al., 2009), and again the implication is that temporal skills can be acquired. Temporal skills are not only important for music and movement, but are reported to be related to intelligence (Madison et al., 2009; Holm et al., 2011), and especially prospective timing may be related to attention and learning (Taatgen et al., 2007). Findings of increased executive functioning after music training (Moreno et al., 2011) could thus be interpreted as being related to increased temporal skills, potentially related to imagery ability. Although it is highly speculative at this point, one could hypothesize that the relation between cognitive control and imagery on one hand, the relation between imagery and temporal skills on the other, and the relation between temporal skills and cognitive ability, all depend on similar or overlapping neural mechanisms. This would have implications for the effects of training temporal skills for imagery ability (which has been identified as an issue in movement rehabilitation settings, cf. Malouin and Richards, 2010), as well as possibilities in cognitive training or rehabilitation.

In sum, I have argued that imagination of music and movement have shared components, which is supported by experimental evidence of their interactions and brain activations, and may be related to generating temporal patterns. Domain-specific expertise appears to be related to both imagery ability and temporal skills, with implications that are based on the known relations between both temporal skills and imagery skills and cognitive functioning. Future work, employing highly specific experimental designs, needs to clarify whether music and movement imagery timing are mediated by similar neural mechanisms, and whether increasing skills in one domain may carry over to increases in the other domain, or to cognitive ability.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT
I thank Corina Logan for comments on an earlier version of this manuscript, and the SAGE Center for the Study of the Mind at the University of California at Santa Barbara for supporting this work.

REFERENCES
Bood, R. J., Niijsen, M., van der Kamp, J., and Roerdink, M. (2013). The power of auditory-motor synchronization in sports: enhancing running performance by coupling cadence with the right beats. *PloS ONE* 8:e70758. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0070758
Cocks, M., Moulton, C.-A., Lao, S., and Cil, T. (2014). What surgeons can learn from athletes: mental practice in sports and surgery. *J. Surg. Educ.* 71, 262–269. doi: 10.1016/j.jsurg.2013.07.002
Daselaar, S. M., Porat, Y., Huijbers, W., and Pennartz, C. M. A. (2010). Modality-specific and modality-independent components of the human imagery system. *NeuroImage* 52, 677–685. doi: 10.1016/j.neuroimage.2010.04.239
Debarnot, U., Louis, M., Collet, C., and Guillot, A. (2011). How does motor imagery speed affect motor performance times? Evaluating the effects of task specificity. *App. Cogn. Psychol.* 25, 536–540. doi: 10.1002/acp.1718
Fujïoka, T., Zendel, B. R., and Ross, B. (2010). Endogenous neuromagnetic activity for mental hierarchy of timing. *J. Neurosci.* 30, 3458–3466. doi: 10.1523/JNEUROSCI.3086-09.2010
Gordon, E. (1965). *Musical Aptitude Profile*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin.
Grahn, J. A., and Mcauley, J. D. (2009). Neural bases of individual differences in beat perception. *NeuroImage* 47, 1894–1903. doi: 10.1016/j.neuroimage.2009.04.039
Guillot, A., Hoyek, N., Louis, M., Collet, C., and Bernard, C. (2012). Understanding the timing of motor imagery: recent findings and future directions. *Int. Rev. Sport Exerc. Psychol.* 5, 3–22. doi: 10.1080/1759924X.2011.623787
Halpern, A. R. (2001). Cerebral substrates of musical imagery. *Ann. N. Y. Acad. Sci.* 930, 179–192. doi: 10.1111/j.1749-6632.2001.tb05733.x
Halpern, A. R., and Zatorre, R. J. (1999). When that tune runs through your head: A PET investigation of auditory imagery for familiar melodies. *Cereb. Cortex* 9, 697–704.
Hargreaves, D. J. (2012). Musical imagination: perception and production, beauty and creativity. *Psychol. Music* 40, 539–557. doi: 10.1080/03057356.12444893
Heremans, E., Helsen, W. F., De Poel, H. J., Allaert, K., Meyns, F., and Feyaerts, P. (2009). Facilitation of motor imagery through movement-related cueing. *Brain Res.* 1278, 50–58. doi: 10.1016/j.brainres.2009.04.041
Herholz, S. C., Halpern, A. R., and Zatorre, R. J. (2012). Neuronal correlates of perception, imagery, and memory for familiar tunes. *J. Cogn. Neurosci.* 24, 1382–1397. doi: 10.1162/jocn_a_00216
Hétu, S., Grégoire, M., Saimpont, A., Coll, M.-P., Eugène, F., Michon, P.-E., et al. (2013). The neural network of motor imagery: an ALE meta-analysis. *Neurosci. Biobehav. Rev.* 37, 930–949. doi: 10.1016/j.neubiorev.2013.03.017
Holm, L., Ullen, F., and Madison, G. (2011). Intelligence and temporal accuracy of behaviour: unique and shared associations with reaction time and motor timing. *Exp. Brain Res.* 214, 175–183. doi: 10.1007/s00221-011-2817-6
Ivry, R. B. (1996). The representation of temporal information in perception and motor control. *Curr. Opin. Neurobiol.* 6, 851–857.
Janata, P., and Paroo, K. (2006). Acuteness of auditory imagery in pitch and time. *Percept. Psychophys* 68, 829–844. doi: 10.3758/BF03193705
Jeannerod, M., and Decety, J. (1995). Mental motor imagery: a window into the representational stages of action. *Curr. Opin. Neurobiol.* 5, 727–732.
Keller, P. E. (2012). Mental imagery in music performance: underlying mechanisms and potential benefits. *Ann. N.Y Acad. Sci.* 1252, 206–213. doi: 10.1111/j.1749-6632.2011.06439.x
Keller, P. E., and Appel, M. (2010). Individual differences, auditory imagery, and the coordination of body movements and sounds in musical ensembles. *Music Percept.* 28, 27–46. doi: 10.1525/MP.2010.28.1.27
Kosslyn, S. M., Behrmann, M., and Jeannerod, M. (1995). The cognitive neuroscience of mental imagery. *Neuropsychologia* 33, 1335–1344.
Kosslyn, S. M., Ganis, G., and Thompson, W. L. (2001). Neural foundations of imagery. *Nature Rev. Neurosci.* 2, 635–642. doi: 10.1038/35090055
Leaver, A. M., Lare, V. J., Zielinski, B., Halpern, R. A., and Rauschecker, J. P. (2009). Brain activation during anticipation of sound sequences. *J. Neurosci.* 29, 2477–2485. doi: 10.1523/JNEUROSCI.4921-08.2009
Levin, D. J., and Cook, P. R. (1996). Memory for musical tempo: additional evidence that auditory memory is absolute. *Percept. Psychophys.* 58, 927–935.
MacPherson, A. C., Collins, D., and Obhi, S. S. (2009). The importance of temporal structure and rhythm for the optimum performance of motor skills: a new focus for practitioners of sport psychology. *J. Appl. Sport Psychol.* 21, 548–561. doi: 10.1080/10413200802595930
Madison, G., Forsman, L., Blom, Ö., Karabanov, A., and Ullen, F. (2009). Correlations between intelligence and components of serial timing variability. *Intelligence* 37, 68–75. doi: 10.1016/j.intell.2008.07.006
Malouin, F., and Richards, C. L. (2010). Mental practice for relearning locomotor skills. *Phys. Ther.* 90, 240–251. doi: 10.2522/ptj.20090029
Moreno, S., Bialystok, E., Barac, R., Schellenberg, E. G., Cepeda, N. J., and Chau, T. (2011). Short-term music training enhances verbal intelligence and executive function. *Psychol. Sci.* 22, 1425–1433. doi: 10.1177/0956797611416999
Ozel, S., Larue, J., and Molinario, C. (2004). Relation between sport and spatial imagery: comparison of three groups of participants. *J. Psychol.* 138, 49–63. doi: 10.3200/JRLP.138.1.49-64
Pecenka, N., and Keller, P. E. (2009). Auditory pitch imagery and its relationship to musical synchronization. *Ann. N.Y. Acad. Sci.* 1169, 282–286. doi: 10.1111/j.1749-6632.2009.04785.x

Plailly, J., Delon-Martin, C., and Royet, J.-P. (2012). Experience induces functional reorganization in brain regions involved in odor imagery in perfumers. *Hum. Brain Mapp.* 33, 224–234. doi: 10.1002/hbm.21207

Povel, D., and Essens, P. (1985). Perception of temporal patterns. *Music Percept.* 2, 411–440.

Repp, B. H. (2001). Effects of music perception and imagery on sensorimotor synchronization with complex timing patterns. *Ann. N.Y. Acad. Sci.* 930, 409–411. doi: 10.1111/j.1749-6632.2001.tb05754.x

Sato, M., and Kuzuura, S. (2008). Training in mental singing while walking improves gait disturbance in Parkinson's disease patients. *Eur. Neurol.* 60, 237–243. doi: 10.1159/000151699

Schaefer, R. S., Vlek, R. J., and Desain, P. (2011a). Decomposing rhythm processing: electroencephalography of perceived and self-imposed rhythmic patterns. *Psychol. Res.* 75, 95–106. doi: 10.1007/s00426-010-0293-4

Schaefer, R. S., Vlek, R. J., and Desain, P. (2011b). Music perception and imagery in EEG: alpha band effects of task and stimulus. *Int. J. Psychophysiol.* 82, 254–259. doi: 10.1016/j.ijspsycho.2011.09.007

Schmidt, T. T., Ostwald, D., and Blankenburg, F. (2014). Imaging tactile imagery: changes in brain connectivity support perceptual grounding of mental images in primary sensory cortices. *NeuroImage* 98, 216–224. doi: 10.1016/j.neuroimage.2014.05.014

Schubotz, R. I., Friederici, A. D., and Von Cramon, D. Y. (2000). Time perception and motor timing: a common cortical and subcortical basis revealed by fMRI. *NeuroImage* 11, 1–12. doi: 10.1006/nimg.1999.0514

Smith, D., and Wakefield, C. (2013). A timely review of a key aspect of motor imagery: a commentary on Guillot et al. (2012). *Front. Hum. Neurosci.* 7:761. doi: 10.3389/fnhum.2013.00761

Su, Y.-H., and Poppel, E. (2012). Body movement enhances the extraction of temporal structures in auditory sequences. *Psychol. Rev.* 76, 373–382. doi: 10.1007/s00426-011-0346-3

Taatgen, N. A., van Rijn, H., and Anderson, J. (2007). An integrated theory of prospective time interval estimation: the role of cognition, attention, and learning. *Psychol. Rev.* 114, 577–598. doi: 10.1037/0033-295X.114.3.577

Teki, S., Grube, M., Kumar, S., and Griffiths, T. D. (2011). Distinct neural substrates of duration-based and beat-based auditory timing. *J. Neurosci.* 31, 3805–3812. doi: 10.1523/JNEUROSCI.5561-10.2011

Wiener, M., Turkeltaub, P., and Coslett, H. B. (2010). The image of time: a voxel-wise meta-analysis. *NeuroImage* 49, 1728–1740. doi: 10.1016/j.neuroimage.2009.09.064

To view this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/