Factors Triggering Ethical Dilemmas in Teaching Sector of Pakistan

Shabana Nawaz Khan* | Imrab Shaheen† | Waqas Iftikhar Malik‡

Vol. V, No. I (Winter 2020) | Page: 181 – 190

p-ISSN: 2616-955X | e-ISSN: 2663-7030 | ISSN-L: 2616-955X

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to explore the triggers behind ethical issues arising in teaching sector. The disreputable practices of the teachers cause stress, affect job satisfaction, drops the performance and above all disrupt the future of the students. Theoretical model of the study identified the causes and effects of ethical dilemmas in teaching sector by gathering data from three districts of Pakistan and Azad Kashmir. Results of the study are generated by using regression, correlation and descriptive statistics. There is positive relationship of Job satisfaction and Teacher’s performance with ethical dilemmas. Whereas, the context of Ethical Dilemmas identifies a negative relationship among job satisfaction and Job Performance respectively. The current investigation included some insightful factors triggering ethical dilemmas among the teachers. This study is limited to some specific cities of AJ&K and Pakistan. Only schools and colleges have been focused, universities can be examined in future.

Key Words: Ethics, Business Ethics, Ethical dilemmas, Job Satisfaction, Performance and Stress.

Introduction

The “Ethics is basically about the difference between good and bad, respectable and malicious” (Mahoney, 2009). The philosophy of ethics is surrounding right behavior and good life. Exceptions other than a specific general line must be considered while taking ethics in to account argued by Murray and Colleagues. While considering the methods and techniques for doing a teaching job, significance of education pushed the researchers to investigate the issues and challenges faced by the professionals serving this sector (Hodgkinson, 1991). Among other issues, ethic is an important factor that is under consideration by many researchers for a couple of decades (Campbell 1997). Although a lot of work has been done on ethic but still it needs more attention to explain its different aspects, such as misbehavior, dishonesty, deception, unauthorized ways of earning, and misuse of power are all considered as unethical aspects of a society (Ehrich et al, 2004). On the other hand morality, reliability, efficiency and loyalty towards the work place or society are considered as ethical aspects (Kuther 2003). Ethics in a society helps you to understand how to live in a society where you are clearer about what to do and what not to do (Mahony 2009, p. 983).

There are many factors that result. ethical failure of an employee on a workplace such as job satisfaction, job performance and stress. Some other factors are also reported in the occurrence of ethical dilemmas in education sector, such as involvement of politics, biasness of administrative decisions resulting in ethical conflict arising, student’s behavioral approaches, plagiarism, and disturbance due to professional ethics (Ray 2005).

Education sector is the very key factor that is contributing for the welfare of Pakistan but it is still lacking in ethical development on the teachers prospect (Rashid et al, 2013). There are many questions according to ethics that a researcher can address if he or she really wants to look deep in this area, such as how ethics works in education sector or what is the importance of ethics in education sector (Rashid et al, 2013). This study aims

*PhD Scholar, Department of Public Administration, University of Kotli, AJ&K, Pakistan.
†Assistant Professor/Chairperson, Department of Public Administration, University of Kotli, AJ&K, Pakistan. Email: imrabs@yahoo.com
‡PhD Scholar, Department of Finance, Shanxi university of finance and Economics, Taiyuan,China.
to identify some of them in this study. The teachers face many ethical dilemmas each day in the classroom. There is a dire need to maintain the ethics in the educational sector, which will lead to job satisfaction on the part of the teacher and resultantly would create a positive effect on education and enhance the show of teachers and students as well. In Azad Kashmir, the educational institutions provide a complete background of education to the students to increase their knowledge and improve their skills. It is necessary for the administration to satisfy their employees or teachers, in order to make them work more efficiently and give the excellent result to the institution. Job satisfaction of teacher is a necessary element of any institution because teachers are the main and important pillars of an educational institution.

Everywhere in the world around, the global education is considered the key factor that has been more emphasized by the governments and the authorities to work for the national development (5). The first National Conference on education in 1974 held in Karachi decided that the education system of Pakistan will be exactly according to the interest and objectives of Pakistan. The education system of Pakistan will reflect the need of the people living in Pakistan. Quaid e Azam, Muhammad Ali Jinnah said while addressing to the nation in 1947 that the education system will make the nation generous and characterful (6). According to him, it was expected that a national character would be the focus of education that will be responsible for developing a sense of responsibility towards the nation, avoidance of individualism, and honesty towards their profession and nation. For this instance, many committees and bodies have been formed, however, they all became unable to implement the set rules and regulations and consequently violation became very common (5). Due to this lower educational quality, Pakistan is greatly abased instead of progressing. The distance between educational institution and community is also another reason that prevented Pakistan to progress. The attachment and involvement of the parents in education of a child is also a factor that can promote the quality of education. As, home is the first school of child to learn, it is mandatory to involve the parents in education of their children, otherwise the goal of achieving quality education system will be just a dream (1).

Significance

This study will be a noteworthy input for analysts and teachers as a reference point to meet the personal and professional ethical standards to introduce an ethical environment for students. This study will be a source of literature in the context of Pakistan and more specifically in context of Education Institution of Azad Jammu and Kashmir for exploring the issues faced by the teachers and the students in AJ&K and Pakistan.

This study also helps to find out the factors that cause stress among the teachers and affect their performance.

Problem Statement

Poor Ethical practices by the teachers are creating stress and effecting their job satisfaction and spoiling their performance.

The research study has the following objectives:

Research objectives

1. To find the reasons to address ethical issues.
2. To understand how job satisfaction of teachers can be effected by diverse Ethical dilemmas.
3. To understand the basic ethical dilemmas that can hit the teachers, job satisfaction.
4. To understand the nature of relationship between job satisfaction and performance of the teachers.
5. To analyze that the unethical code of conduct affects the future of the students.
6. To analyze the relationship between stress and ethical dilemmas.

Literature Review

It is necessary to consider all the required elements of a classroom environment to perform educational activities. Performance of a teacher should be based on technical and professional manners to deliver according to the expectations of majority of the students. Teaching is complete mechanism on which the welfare of a
society depends upon. As much as the teachers will have strong ethical values the more would be the chances for ethically strong society. It is very important to consider job satisfaction of primary school teachers (Chinedu I. Okeke 2017). Many studies have found that most of the employees quit their jobs due to dissatisfaction (Calitz, Roux, & Strydom, 2014). Among other issues that result in dissatisfaction of an employee in a workplace, physical working conditions’ environment is also a factor of workplace ethics (Chinedu I. Okeke, 2017). To consider the ethics of an individual, it is necessary to understand the dimensions of ethics. It is not necessary that an employee is hired by an organization due to his or her skills and capabilities but it could be due to ethical values that he or she holds (Shrikant Krupasindhu PANIGRAHI1, 2019). Many practical and theory based exercises need proper environment to be carried out. That means workplace ethics. considers a range of moral and social values in accordance of culture (Geren, 2011). Another term that is mostly spoken at different levels is ethical code to represent the word Ethics. The workplace or the organization better understands the significance of this ethic code to manage the behavioral approach of employees (Valentine & Barnett, 2007a). Formulation and obeying of these codes help advancing satisfaction in employees (Elçiand Alpkan 2009).

Employees’ performance is greatly depends upon the ethical behaviors. (Rashid Saeed, 2013). There are many factors that can result in success and failure of teachers’ performance, but the ethical behavior is one of the key element among other elements that really have significant impact on the performance of an employee. (saedi 2012).

Education System of Pakistan

The education system in Pakistan is not yet developed to the required standard. Unlike the developed nations, the education system in Pakistan is still under the control of feudal till since the time of partition in 1947. This interference hindered the education system to progress with suitable speed and further it has been classified into several divisions such as private and public, general and religious schools. The division is on different school of thoughts based on the so-called beliefs of Maslak. While addressing these issues, there are many other issues that couldn’t get attention of the authorities such as according to a report in 2014, it is seen that there were 52.91 million children ranging from the age of 5 to 16 should be in schools in Pakistan, and just 27.89 are possibly going to schools, where as 25.02 million children are unable to go to school (Tanveer 2017). Due to the classification of education system and lack of attention to this sector, the authorities are unable to gather the facts about the enrolments, it might be possible that among 25.02 million, majority would be in Madrasas for religious education. Injustice and inequalities in the distributions of wealth led the people to classify the education system for their personal interest instead of national interest and as a result unethical and unsocial practices became common in the societies. It has been observed in many studies that education system of madrasas is quite different than the other education systems in Pakistan, where it has also been identified that religious extremism is also been preached by the new era’s religious mentors that Islam does not preach. Hence, this difference stops the schools and education institutions to develop, morally strong members of society that can promote tolerance in the culture of Pakistan. For a couple of decades, it is now assumed that teacher trainings and development programs are necessary to conduct for their moral and ethical development. In this regard, HEC (Higher Education Commission) of Pakistan formulated a strategy to link the schools and universities by offering the training programs for the junior teachers by the professionals serving in Higher Education Institutions of Pakistan.

Value of Education and Ethics in Islam

As, Pakistan is an Islamic country, so it is essential to inculcate the true feelings of a Islam that are prescribed by the religion. In all the universities and other education institution of Pakistan, it is mandatory for all students to seek knowledge about Islam and practice the preaching of Islam in routine life. In this context Allah defines in Quran “the most honorable among you in the view of God is the pious” (Al-Quran, Verse 49:13). Considering and believing that Allah is the one who created the whole universe, comes under the religious and ethical aspect of Islam and it is the obligation of a Muslim to preach this morality to others as well. . Islam is the religion which advises its believers to practice the moral values in the society and. explains the basic rights and
responsibilities of a person in a society. The word “Taqwa” describes that every individual must be aware of his/her rights and consider the rights of others; must be aware of his or her responsibility and control himself/herself of misconduct in order to keep the society safe from conflicts (Tanveer, 2017). Throughout the life, the Prophet of Islam, Muhammad (PBUH), for whom Allah said “Rehmatul lil Alameen” that means “blessings for all worlds”, remained very clear, optimistic and helpful (Al-Qur’an, Verse 21:107). He (PBUH) said that “The person who is good to humanity is best among you all”. Another saying of Prophet (PBUH) makes the value of ethics clearer. is that “The most perfect believer in terms of belief is the one who has the highest ethics and who treats his family in the nicest way” (Saulat 2014). The most appropriate way to serve the society is to educate the people living around you. Quran itself started from the verse, perhaps the first word of Quran is “Iqra” a that means “read” (Al Quran, Verse 96:1). Furthermore, Quran says “Are those who know, equal to those who do not know?” (Al Quran, Verse 39:9). The value of education is clear from another verse of Quran. Where, Allah says to the Prophet (PBUH) to pray “Lord increase me in my knowledge” (Al Quran, Verse 20:114). There are many sayings of the Prophet (PBUH) where He emphasizes the importance of education to the believers. “Acquiring Knowledge (education) is mandatory to every Muslim male and female”, “Seek knowledge though you may have travel to China” (Questions on Islam 2009). At the time of the dawn of Islam, China was considered too far away from the origin place of Islam. It was the most dangerous thing to travel towards China, for this reason China was recommended to explain the value of education (Shakat 2012).

Every human being learns ethics and values from different. Institutions like family, school, state as well as religious and professional ethics that includes organization and responsibilities of the employees, friends and colleagues, and situational circumstances etc.

**Education System and its Value**

Education and ethics are very immensely interdependent, almost in all societies. The most important institutions in the world who teaches ethics are home, schools, religious centers, ethical and professionals’ organizations, friends and company that a person keeps in routine. (Dr. P. Shahanaz, 2019) The role of a teacher in developing ethics of student is considered very important. It is necessary for the teachers to perform ethically in every aspect of life to become a role model for their students and followers. It highly suggested by different researchers that teachers should follow all those ethical standards for which they are employed and must develop the capabilities to cope with serious ethical issues. It also has been seen that many teachers now a days have their own criteria to judge the students and their performance and their negative behavior. Legislations have been passed in the constitutions to protect the rights of the students on behalf of teachers. Their responsibilities and these legislations were considered important factors to the professionalism of the teachers. Many constitutions have passed through reforms in education the sectors, our neighboring country India passed many resolutions to enhance the education system. National council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT) has given by the charge of modeling the significance of ethics in professionalism to conduct preschool practices for elementary and secondary levels.

By adopting so many aspects from existed literature this study constructs the following hypothesis for theoretical framework.

**Hypothesis**

H1: Job satisfaction is negatively affecting the ethical dilemmas of teachers.

H2: Job performance has negative effects on ethical dilemmas of teachers serving in Pakistan.

H3: Ethical dilemmas and stress has a relationship.

**Conceptual Framework**
Methods and Techniques
Sampling Techniques
Simple random sampling technique is used in this study to gather data by using a questionnaire. Three main districts were taken under account to perform the study named as Kotli, Rawlakot, and Rawalpindi/Islamabad. 150 was the sample size.

Method used
Quantitative method was used. For that purpose, 174 questionnaires were distributed and 150 were returned back.

Instrument
Questionnaire method was used to collect the data, and it was a 5 point likert scale questionnaire commencing from strongly disagree to strongly agree.

Unit of Analysis
Individual is the unit of analysis.

Study Type
It is a cross sectional study.

Analysis of data
SPSS was used to calculate the values or data. Relationship among the variables was identified by using correlation. And regression analysis was used to analyze the impact.

  Data was analyzed through SPSS software. Pearson correlation was used to see the relationship between variables. Data was analyzed by applying linear regression.

Results and Conclusion
Study has following findings:

Reliability of the Scale
The steadiness of the variables was identified by Cronbach’s Alpha, by which the reliability is measured. Table 1 and table 2 are presenting the values of reliability among variables.

Table 1. Reliability Statistics

| Cronbach’s Alpha | N of Items |
|------------------|------------|
| .851             | 22         |

Table 2. Reliability of Measuring Scale

| Variables            | Cronbach’s Aplha | No. of Items |
|----------------------|------------------|--------------|
| Ethical Dilemmas     | .738             | 6            |
| Job Satisfaction     | .699             | 5            |
| Job Performance      | .746             | 5            |
| Stress               | .897             | 6            |

Descriptive Statistics
The basic features of data and study are described by using descriptive statistics. Significance of the study was
identified by using T-test. Table 3 showing that all the selected variables have significant relation among them.

The mean value of Ethical Dilemmas, job Satisfaction, Job Performance and Stress were “3.8133, 4.1333, 4.1573 and 4.1000” respectively lies in the reasonably safe areas of the quantifying measures.

**Table 3. Descriptive Statistics**

|                  | N  | Minimum | Maximum | Mean    | Std. deviation |
|------------------|----|---------|---------|---------|----------------|
| Age              | 50 | 23.00   | 39.00   | 29.8667 | 3.91978        |
| Experience       | 150| 1.00    | 8.00    | 3.3353  | 1.93960        |
| Ethical Dilemmas | 150| 1.83    | 5.00    | 3.8133  | .68540         |
| Job Satisfaction | 150| 1.60    | 5.00    | 4.1333  | .60631         |
| Job Performance  | 150| 1.20    | 5.00    | 4.1573  | .69266         |
| Stress           | 150| 1.17    | 5.00    | 4.1000  | .85049         |
| Valid N Listwise |    |         |         |         |                |

**Correlation**

Table 4 is showing the results of Correlation Analysis. Ethical dilemmas has a significant positive correlation with stress with a value (.296**). It means if Ethical Dilemmas increase in organization, the stress will be increased and vice versa. Job Performance was positively correlated with dependent variable with the value (.194*). It depicts if Ethical Dilemmas increase in the study area the job Performance will also increase. Job Satisfaction has also positive correlation to Ethical Dilemmas having value (.273**). It shows if Ethical Dilemmas will increase job satisfaction will also be increased.

**Table 4. Correlation**

|                  | Ethical Dilemmas | Job Satisfaction | Job Performance | Stress |
|------------------|------------------|------------------|-----------------|--------|
| Ethical Dilemmas | Pearson correlation | 1 | .273** | .194* | .296** |
|                  | Sig. (2 tailed)   | .001 | .017 | .000 |        |
|                  | N                | 150 | 150 | 150 | 150    |
| Job Satisfaction | Pearson correlation | .273** | 1 | .237** | .275** |
|                  | Sig. (2 tailed)   | .001 | .004 | .001 |        |
|                  | N                | 150 | 150 | 150 | 150    |
| Job Performance  | Pearson correlation | .194* | .237** | 1 | .462** |
|                  | Sig. (2 tailed)   | .017 | .004 | .000 |        |
|                  | N                | 150 | 150 | 150 | 150    |
| Stress           | Pearson correlation | .296** | .275** | .462** | 1      |
|                  | Sig. (2 tailed)   | .000 | .001 | .000 |        |
|                  | N                | 150 | 150 | 150 | 150    |

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).**

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).**
Regression

Regression analysis is used to identify the impact of one variable to another variable in this study. Here it shows that how much change occurs in ethical dilemmas due to job satisfaction, job performance and stress. R square value is (.129) that shows that 12.0% change in ethical dilemmas occurs due to job satisfaction, job performance and stress and it is shown in table 5.

Table 5. Summary of Model

| Model | R    | R Square | Adjusted R square | Stud Error of the estimation |
|-------|------|----------|-------------------|----------------------------|
| 1     | .359 | .129     | .111              | .64620                     |

a. Predictors: (Constant), Stress, Job Satisfaction, Job Performance

F-statistics was used to check either model is significant or not? The value of F(7.208) and significance level (.000) shows that model is significant to the study. This declares the fitness or correctness of the model and is evident in table 6.

Table 6. ANOVA

| Model   | Sum of Squares | DF | Mean Square | F       | Sig.  |
|---------|----------------|----|-------------|---------|-------|
| 1       | Regression     | 9.030 | 3         | 3.010   | 7.208 | .000  |
| Residual| 60.966         | 146 | .418       |         |       |       |
| Total   | 69.996         | 149 |            |         |       |       |

a. Predictors: (Constant), Stress, Job Satisfaction, Job Performance
b. Dependent Variable: Ethical Dilemmas

Due to unstandardized Beta Coefficient of the study shows that Job Satisfaction impacts 22.9% change in Ethical Dilemmas, but the direction of variation is positive. So the H1 is rejected, that declares that “Ethical dilemmas are negatively affecting the job satisfaction of Teachers”. Job Performance causes only 4.4% variation in Ethical Dilemmas. But the direction of variation is also positive. So, we reject our second hypothesis H2 which states that “Ethical dilemmas are negatively affecting the teacher’s job performance”. As shown in Table 7.

Stress causes only 17.7% variation in Ethical Dilemmas. The direction of variation is positive, and this identifies a progressive possession between Stress and Ethical Dilemmas. So, we accept our third hypothesis H3 claims that Ethical dilemmas and stress have positive relationship among each other. As shown in Table 7.

Table 7. Coefficients

| Model   | Unstandardized Coefficient | Standardized Coefficients | T     | Sig.  |
|---------|----------------------------|---------------------------|-------|-------|
| 1       | (Constant)                 | 1.957 | .441   | 4.436 | .000  |
|         | Job Satisfaction           | .229 | .092   | .203  | 2.501 | .013  |
|         | Job Performance            | .044 | .087   | .045  | .511  | .610  |
|         | Stress                     | .177 | .072   | .219  | 2.472 | .015  |

a. Dependent Variable: Ethical Dilemmas
Discussion and Conclusion

This study shows the factors that affect the ethics. Stress is an important factor in this regard. This study is conducted for this purpose and also to get awareness teachers about the ethical dilemmas in the teaching sectors. For this purpose, the study is conducted and primary source of data collection method is used and through statistical tools the conclusion is made. This study shows that there is a progressive connection among the job satisfaction and Job Performance of teacher with ethical dilemmas and there is a strong relationship between the stress and the ethical dilemmas. It is concluded that H3 is acknowledged that declares that “There is a relationship between ethical dilemmas and stress”, and H1 and H2 is rejected which states that “Ethical dilemmas are negatively affecting the job satisfaction of teachers” and “Ethical dilemmas are affecting negatively the teacher’s job performance” respectively. It means only ethical considerations are not the reasons for job dissatisfaction and poor performance. But there are some other factors that must be considered.

If we ignore ethical problem stress, it will be increased in teaching sector. This is now proven by this study that there is a great need to transform the education system of Pakistan, especially the Higher Education Institutions should be under considerations to develop a strong ethical mechanism. The researchers, the academicians, the teachers and other related stakes should serve the society by serving the educations sector by developing ethics. It is also concluded that there is a lack of quality in current education system of Pakistan that needs to be reform. It is also observed that competences are just on papers or to the extent of formalities required in file works such as reading the syllabus and conduction of exams. This is needed to arrange proper workshops and trainings for the teachers to make them ethically strong and sound for individual as well as organizational welfare.

Recommendations

1. For the welfare of society, it is highly needed to consider the role of teachers and their performances in education institutions. Inside and outside of the institution the teacher should be a role model that influences the student and society by his positive practices.
2. It is very important for authorities to show serious attitude towards the teaching sector to overcome the stress level of the teachers so that they should hold strong ethical aspects.
3. Proper workshops and trainings should be given to the teachers to teach them how to deal with tense situations.
4. While considering that education is also an ethical effort, it is necessary for other stakes of the society to protect the ethical rights of the teachers.
5. It should be made mandatory for the teachers by the government to attend the workshops on ethics at least once in a year.
6. For research prospective, other variables could also be considered to draw some fruitful results and recommendations.
7. To avoid stress the workplace environment should be moderate enough to keep the employees ethically satisfied.
8. The application of this theoretical framework should be extended to the sectors other than education.

Limitations and Suggestions

This study is limited in some regions of AJ&K and Pakistan. Only schools and colleges have been focused, universities can be focused in future.

Secondly, only three independent variables were used. Some other factors can also be considered to make this study more applicable. The overall strength and goodness of the model can be improved by adding more variables.
References

Al-Qur’an: The Holy Quran Arabic text with translation in english text and search. https://www.alislam.org/quran/search2/ Accessed 26 May 2016.

Calitz, T., Roux, A., & Strydom, H. (2014). Factors that Affect Social Workers Job Satisfaction, Stress and Burnout. Social Work, 50(2), 153–169.

Campbell, E. (1997). Administrators’ decisions and Teachers’ Ethical Dilemmas: Implications for Moral Agency. Leading & Managing, 3(4), 245–257.

Chinedu I. Okeke, P. N. (2017). Teacher Job Dissatisfaction: Implications for Teacher Sustainability and Social Transformation. Journal of Teacher Education for Sustainability, 27.

Dr. P. Shahanaz,. (2019). Role of Ethics and Values in Higher Education. Kurnool.: St. Josephs Degree College, Sunkesula Road, Kurnool.

Ehrich, L.C., Cranston, N., & Kimber, M. (2004). Public sector managers and ethical dilemmas. Journal of Australasia and New Zealand Academy of Management, 10(1), 25–37.

Froeschle, Janet G., and Crews, Charles. An Ethics Challenge for School Counselors.

Galant, T. B. (2008). Rights and Wrongs in the College Classroom: Ethical Issues in Postsecondary Teaching: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 31(4):511-512.

Geren, B. (2011). The Work Ethic: Is It Universal? Journal of International Business & Cultural Studies, 5, 1-8.

Hanif, R. (2004). Teacher Stress, Job Performance and Self Efficacy of Women School Teachers.

Hallak, J., & Poisson, M. (2001). Ethics and Corruption in Education: International Institute for Educational Planning / UNESCO.

Hodgkinson, C. (1991). Educational Leadership: The Moral Art. Albany, NY: Suny Press.

Kuther, T.L. (2003). A Profile of the Ethical Professor: Student views. College Teaching, 51(4), 153–160.

Lya, K.H & Zahava, G. (1990). The Inner World of Israeli Secondary School Teachers: Work Centrality, Job Satisfaction and Stress: Taylor & Francis, Ltd. Vol. 26, No. 2/3. 285-298.

Mahony, P. (2009). Should ‘ought’ to be taught? Teaching and Teacher Education, 25, 983–989.

Marshalita S. P. (2005). The Ethical Dilemmas of High-Stakes Testing and Issues for Teacher Preparation Programs, Journal of College and Character, 6:7.

Pope, Nakia, Green, Susan, Johnson, Robert Mitchell & Mark (2007). Examining Teacher Ethical Dilemmas in Classroom Assessment: Teaching and Teacher Education 778-782.

Panigrahi S, K. & AL-Nashash, H.M. (2019). Quality Work Ethics and Job Satisfaction: An Empirical Analysis. Quality Management, 9.

Questions on Islam. (2009). High ethics and good manners of Hazrat Muhammad. http://www.questionsonislam.com/article/8-high-ethics-and-good-manners-hazrat-muhammad. Accessed 25 May 2016.

Rashid, S., Nayyab, H.H, Lodhi, R.N. Baqir, R., Rehman, M.A & Mussawar, S.(2013).Impact of Retention Factors on Organizational Commitment in General Education Division of Pakistan. Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research 17(4):539-545.

Rashid Saeed, M. S. (2013). Ethical Behavior and Employees Job Performance. Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research, 25.

Saeidi, B. (2012). A Model to improve Company Business through Ethics. International Journal on Social Sciences Economics and Arts, 16.

Saulat. (2014). Morality and ethics in Islam. http://www.whyislam.org/social-values-in-islam/ morality-ethics-in-islam/. Accessed 25 May 2016.

Shaukat, Q. (2012). The equality of education for men and women in Islam. http://saypeople.com/2012/05/22/the-equality-of-education-for-men-and-women-in-islam/. Accessed 25 May 2016.

Singer, P. (1993). About Ethics: In Practical Ethics (2nd Ed.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Tanveer, M. H. (2017). Ethics and Education in Pakistan:. Economic Cooperation Organization Science Foundation
Tasnim & Shamima (2006). Job Satisfaction among Female Teachers: A Study on Primary Schools in Bangladesh.

Valentine, S., & Barnett, T. (2007). Perceived organizational ethics and the ethical decisions of sales and marketing personnel. Journal of Personal Selling and Sales Management, 27(4), 373-38

Vincent, A & Meche, M. (2001). Use of Ethical Dilemmas to Contribute to the Knowledge and Behavior of High School Students. The High School Journal 84(4), 50-57