Lead poisoning is a complex disorder affecting many organs in the body. Lead inhibits δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase (ALAD), an enzyme with two co-dominantly expressed alleles, ALAD1 and ALAD2. 

**Objective:** Our meta-analysis studied the effects of the ALAD polymorphism on a) blood and bone lead levels and b) indicators of target organ toxicity.

**Data Source:** We included studies reporting one or more of the following by individuals with genotypes ALAD1-1 and ALAD1-2/2-2: blood lead level (BLL), tibia or trabecular lead level, zinc protoporphyrin (ZPP), hemoglobin, serum creatinine, blood urea nitrogen (BUN), dimercaptosuccinic acid–chelatable lead, or blood pressure.

**Data Extraction:** Sample sizes, means, and standard deviations were extracted for the genotype groups.

**Data Synthesis:** There was a statistically significant association between ALAD2 carriers and higher BLL in lead-exposed workers (weighted mean differences of 1.93 µg/dL). There was no association with ALAD carrier status among environmentally exposed adults with BLLs < 10 µg/dL. ALAD2 carriers were potentially protected against adverse hemapoietic effects (ZPP and hemoglobin levels), perhaps because of decreased lead bioavailability to heme pathway enzymes.

**Conclusion:** Carriers of the ALAD2 allele had higher BLLs than those who were ALAD1 homozygous and higher hemoglobin and lower ZPP, and the latter seems to be inversely related to BLL. Effects on other organs were not well delineated, partly because of the small number of subjects studied and potential modifications caused by other proteins in target tissues or by other polymorphic genes.

**Key Words:** ALAD polymorphism, lead, meta-analysis. Environ Health Perspect 115:35–41 (2007). doi:10.1289/ehp.9448 available via http://dx.doi.org/ [Online 15 September 2006]

Lead poisoning is a complex disorder affecting many organs in the body, including developing red blood cells, the kidneys, and the nervous system. Young children are most susceptible to the toxic effects of lead. Major concerns are the cognitive and neurobehavioral deficits resulting from lead exposure levels that were previously considered safe. High levels of exposure can cause encephalopathy and death [Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR) 1999].

Lead deposition in the body consists of three major pools: blood, bone, and soft tissues (Rabinowitz et al. 1976). The blood pool accounts for only 2% of the total body burden, unless there is an acute exposure, but is a rapidly exchangeable component. The bone pool contains >95% of the total body burden, where it may be mobilized and contribute to the blood lead level (BLL) in previously exposed persons. Differences in lead accumulation in various bone types have been reported. Tibia concentrations differ from those observed in the patella. The cortical bone of the tibia represents a long-term storage depot with an elimination half-life for lead in excess of a decade. In contrast, the more dynamic trabecular bone of the patella exhibits a shorter half-life (Rabinowitz et al. 1976). The remainder of the total body load is distributed in an intermediate pool of soft tissues, skin, and muscle. Elimination half-lives for lead are estimated at 30–40 days in blood and up to 20 years or longer in bone (Marcus 1985a, 1985b). Lead is eliminated mainly in the urine.

Lead is a potent inhibitor of δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase (ALAD), coproporphyrinogen oxidase, and ferrochelatase, enzymes that catalyze the second, sixth, and final steps, respectively, in the biosynthesis of heme (Onalaja and Claudio 2000; Warren et al. 1998). Because the metal has the greatest effect on ALAD, measurement of ALAD activity can be used as a marker of effect of lead exposure (Chisolm et al. 1985). ALAD, an octameric zinc-containing enzyme, catalyzes the condensation of two molecules of 5-aminolevulinic acid (ALA) into one molecule of monopyrrole porphobilinogen (PBG). Inhibition of ALAD activity produces increased urinary excretion of ALA (Warren et al. 1998).

Lead displaces zinc from the enzyme’s active site, and the inactivation of ALAD has been implicated in the pathogenesis of lead poisoning. The resulting accumulation of its substrate, ALA, has been shown to have a neuropathogenic effect, probably by acting as a γ-aminobutyric acid (GABA) receptor agonist in the nervous system (Brennan and Cantrill 1979).

Human ALAD, encoded by a single gene localized to the chromosome 9q34 region, is a polymorphic enzyme with two alleles, ALAD1 and ALAD2 (Single Nucleotide Polymorphism database (dbSNP) ID: rs1800435; http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/SNP/index.html), which are co-dominantly expressed (Battistuzzi et al. 1981). The difference between the two alleles lies in a single G→C transversion mutation of nucleotide 177 in ALAD2; the allozyme resulting from the ALAD2 allele contains the substitution of a neutral asparagine for a positively charged lysine at residue 59 (Wetmur et al. 1991b). Three differently charge allozymes, ALAD1-1, 1-2, and 2-2, result from the expression of the ALAD1 and ALAD2 genes. In several white populations, the frequencies of the ALAD1 and ALAD2 genes have been estimated to be 0.9 and 0.1, respectively. Asian and African populations have lower frequencies of the ALAD2 allele (Kedal et al. 2001).

Several epidemiologic studies have attempted to correlate the ALAD allelic variation with a differential susceptibility to lead poisoning. The biologic plausibility for a differential role of the two alleles lies in the fact that the lysine substitution at residue 59 changes the electrical charge of the enzyme (Battistuzzi et al. 1981); the more electronegative ALAD2 enzyme may thus have a higher affinity/stability for the lead cation than ALAD1 (Wetmur et al. 1991b). This could result in an alteration of lead toxicokinetics and susceptibility to lead toxicity. The first studies comparing BLL and ALAD polymorphism were conducted on a chronically exposed population of 202 male lead workers...
in a German factory (Ziemsen et al. 1986), and an environmentally exposed population of 1,051 children with elevated free erythrocyte protoporphyrin (Astrin et al. 1987). These studies showed that individuals carrying one or two copies of the ALAD2 allele exhibited higher BLLs than homozygous individuals with only the ALAD1 allele. These findings led to the suggestion that ALAD2 may be a determinant for increased susceptibility to lead toxicity (Wetmur et al. 1991a). However, some studies have reported either no difference among individuals homozygous for ALAD1 relative to individuals carrying the ALAD2 allele, or the differences among the two groups were not statistically significant.

The extreme variability in the published data is due to several factors: relatively small numbers of subjects, different frequencies of the ALAD2 allele in various populations, and different levels of lead exposure as determined by BLLs in the populations studied. We used a series of meta-analyses to quantify the effects of this genetic polymorphism and to understand lead toxicokinetics.

**Methods**

**Study selection.** MEDLINE (National Library of Medicine 2006) and Web of Science (Thomson Scientific 2006) databases were searched to January 2006 for English-language publications of observational studies. The citations in the articles identified were also searched to find other potentially eligible studies. Common text words and Medical Subject Headings (MeSH) related to lead poisoning, gene polymorphism, and ALAD were used. No attempt was made to contact the authors of any of the articles, except to resolve discrepancies in the reported values.

We required that two *a priori* criteria be met for inclusion in the meta-analysis: a) sample sizes, means, and SDs were either reported or could be determined for the ALAD1-1 and ALAD1-2/2-2 genotypes; and b) combined with one or more of the following measures—BLL, tibia lead level, trabecular (patella or calcaneus) lead level, zinc protoporphyrin (ZPP), hemoglobin, serum creatinine, dimercaptopus- acinic acid–chelatable lead, and systolic or diastolic blood pressure. When multiple studies used the same cohort of subjects, the first publication that reported the values of the variables of interest was included.

**Data extraction.** Sample sizes, means, and SDs according to genotype (homozygous ALAD1-1 and ALAD2-2 and heterozygous ALAD1-2) were extracted independently by two authors (F.S. and D.M.). Wu et al. (2004) reported data in groups of workers subjected to high and low lead exposures. We mathematically combined the data of the two groups to extract the means for all exposed workers according to the genotype. The pooled estimate of the variance from two independent samples was used to extract the SDs according to genotype. Therefore, only one effect size was entered in the model. The data from each study were entered twice to minimize data-entry errors.

**Statistical analysis.** The data were analyzed using Stata software version 7 (StataCorp., College Station, TX, USA). In each study the size of the effect was calculated by the difference between the means of the ALAD1-2/2-2 and the ALAD1-1 groups. Each mean difference was weighted according to the inverse of its variance, and the average was taken [weighted mean difference (WMD)]. To combine data from studies in which the same outcome was measured by different scales (serum creatinine), or when the outcome value was measured by different methods (bone lead, ZPP), the mean difference was standardized by dividing by the within-group SD; the results were then weighted and the average, or standardized mean difference (SMD), taken. The WMD or SMD in each study was pooled using a random-effects model. Results are given with 95% confidence intervals (CIs). Between-study heterogeneity in the results of the studies was assessed using a chi-square test and the *I²* measure of inconsistency. Significant heterogeneity was defined as a chi-square test *p*-value < 0.1. *I²* takes values between 0% and 100%; with higher values denoting greater degree of heterogeneity (*I²* = 0–25%; no heterogeneity; *I²* = 25–50%; moderate heterogeneity; *I²* = 50–75%; large heterogeneity; *I²* ≥ 75–100%; extreme heterogeneity) (Higgins et al. 2003). Furthermore, to examine between-study heterogeneity, we used a *a priori* stratified analyses including the study design (occupational and environmental studies) and age status (children and adults) and presence of Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (HWE). Publication bias was assessed using the methods proposed by Begg and Mazumdar(1994) and by Egger et al. (1997). All *p*-values are two-tailed.

**Results**

The search procedure yielded 45 references that were retrieved for additional information (Figure 1). We initially excluded 4 review papers, 5 non-English research articles, and 2 articles that reported data on different variant of the ALAD2 polymorphism. Of the remaining 34 articles, 7 did not have relevant data for effect size calculation. Moreover, the corresponding author of a study of environmentally exposed children (Shen et al. 2001) was contacted twice by monthly e-mail to resolve some discrepancy in their reported study. Three months after failing to receive an answer, we decided to exclude the study. Therefore, 24 studies were included in the meta-analysis (Alexander et al. 1998; Astrin et al. 1987; Duydu and Suzen 2003; Fleming et al. 1998; Hsieh et al. 2000; Hu et al. 2001; Kim et al. 2004; Lee BK et al. 2001; Lee SS et al. 2001; Perez-Bravo et al. 2004; Sakai et al. 2000; Schwartz et al. 1995, 1997a, 1997b, 2000; Sathishkumar et al. 1997; Smith et al. 1995; Suzen et al. 2003; Theppeang et al. 2004; Weaver et al. 2003; Wetmur et al. 1991a; Wu et al. 2003, 2004; Ziemsen et al. 1986), and of these, 11 were multiple publications that often had other different outcomes of interest. When we found a discrepancy in the reported studies, the authors were contacted and the corrected data were used. Table 1 characterizes the studies that did meet criteria for inclusion.

**ALAD polymorphism and blood lead level.**

Nine occupational studies (Alexander et al. 1998; Fleming et al. 1998; Kim et al. 2004; Sakai et al. 2000; Schwartz et al. 1995, 2000; Suzen et al. 2003; Wetmur et al. 1991a; Wu et al. 2004) were included in our analysis, and 5 environmental exposure studies of which 3 were conducted among adults (Smith et al. 1995; Hsieh et al. 2000; Wu et al. 2003) and 2 among children (Perez-Bravo et al. 2004; Wetmur et al. 1991a). Thus, a total of 14 studies were included in our analysis of blood lead level and ALAD polymorphism. Each of the studies was rechecked for HWE. We did not find HWE in the study by Wetmur et al. (1991a) that presented separate data on previously reported studies of occupational exposure in adults (Ziemsen et al. 1986) and environmental exposure in children (Astrin et al. 1987). The absence of HWE is most likely because of ethnicities of the populations: the occupational study comprised

![Figure 1. Flow chart of study selection.](image-url)
workers of German and Turkish origins (Ziemsen et al. 1986), whereas the study of children included whites, blacks, Hispanics, and Asians (Astrin et al. 1987). Table 2 shows the frequency of the ALAD polymorphism and the status of the HWE in the studies analyzed.

There is evidence that inclusion of studies that deviate from HWE can affect the pooled estimate and be potential sources of heterogeneity across the studies (Trikalinos et al. 2006). Hence, we conducted pooled analysis with and without studies that deviated from HWE.

Pooled WMD analysis among the 14 studies, which included a total of 6,672 subjects, 5,861 (87.84%) were homozygous for ALAD1 and 811 (12.16%) carried the ALAD2 allele, showed a large heterogeneity among the studies ($I^2 = 54.75, p = 0.000$; $I^2 = 76.33\%$) (Table 3; Figure 2). In subgroup analysis (subgroups were defined by the type of study and by population, that is, occupationally and environmentally exposed adults and children), there was no heterogeneity between occupational studies ($I^2 = 0$), between the studies of environmentally exposed children ($I^2 = 0$), and moderate heterogeneity among the studies of environmentally exposed adults ($I^2 = 55.2\%$). After removal of the studies not in HWE, the overall heterogeneity decreased ($I^2 = 17.92, p = 0.07$), and the variation in WMD attributable to heterogeneity was moderate ($I^2 = 38.6\%$) (Table 3). Overall, the pooled WMD analysis indicated that the carriers of ALAD2 allele had a significantly higher BLL (2.31 μg/dL; 95% CI, 0.93 to 3.70) compared with carriers homozygous for the ALAD1 allele, a finding that was mostly driven by the occupational studies. Removal of the two studies not in HWE resulted in a not significantly higher WMD level of BLL (0.86 μg/dL; 95% CI, –0.79 to 1.73). There was no evidence of publication bias according to Begg’s test ($p = 1.0$, with continuity correction) and Egger’s test ($p = 0.10$).

**Occupational studies.** Lead workers carrying the ALAD2 allele had higher BLLs (WMD = 2.56 μg/dL; 95% CI, 1.21 to 3.90), with the difference being statistically significant ($p = 0.027$) (Figure 3). Analysis of the studies in HWE (Table 3) resulted in a decreased but still significant higher WMD (2.24 μg/dL; 95% CI, 0.85 to 3.62).

**Environmental adult studies.** By contrast, the WMD in adults environmentally exposed to lead was 0.05 μg/dL (95% CI, –0.79 to 0.88), which was not statistically significant.

**Environmental children studies.** Pooled analysis of the two studies of children showed a WMD in BLL of 7.34 μg/dL (95% CI, 4.92 to 9.76), with the individuals carrying ALAD2 having significantly higher BLLs ($p = 0.00$).

However, the data should be viewed cautiously because other than deviation from HWE, the individuals selected for the study reported by Wetmur et al. (1991a) had higher initial clinical evaluations of elevated erythrocyte protoporphyrin (EPP) levels thus introducing potentially serious selection bias in the design.

### Table 1. Characteristics of the studies included in the review.

| Source | Population | Gene | Variables |
|--------|------------|------|-----------|
| Ziemsen et al. 1986a | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL |
| Astrin et al. 1987b | Children | ALAD | BLL |
| Wetmur et al. 1991a | Lead workers and children | ALAD | BLL |
| Smith et al. 1995 | Carpenters | ALAD | BLL, PBL, SC, SPB, DBP |
| Schwartz et al. 1995c | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, ZPP |
| Schwartz et al. 1997ab | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, DMSA, ZPP |
| Schwartz et al. 1997b | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, DMSA, ZPP |
| Sithisararakul et al. 1997b | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, ZPP, HB |
| Alexander et al. 1998 | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, ZPP |
| Fleming et al. 1998 | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, TBL, CBL |
| Hsieh et al. 2000 | General population | ALAD | BLL, HB |
| Sakai et al. 2000 | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, ZPP |
| Schwartz et al. 2000d | Lead workers | ALAD, VDR | BLL, TBL, DMSA, HB |
| Lee BK et al. 2001c | Lead workers | ALAD, VDR | BLL, TBL, DMSA, SPB, DBP |
| Hu et al. 2001d | Veterans | ALAD | BLL, TBL, DMSA, SPB, DBP |
| Lee SS et al. 2001c | Lead workers | ALAD, VDR | BLL, TBL, ZPP, HB |
| Suzen et al. 2003c | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL |
| Wu et al. 2003d | Veterans | ALAD | BLL, TBL, PBL, SC, DBP |
| Doydu and Suzen 2003d | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL |
| Weaver et al. 2003f | Lead workers | ALAD, VDR, eNOS | BLL, TBL, SC |
| Kim et al. 2004 | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, ZPP, HB |
| Theppeang et al. 2004 | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, ZPP, HB |
| Wu et al. 2004 | Lead workers | ALAD | BLL, ZPP, HB |
| Perez-Bravo et al. 2004 | Children | ALAD | BLL, HB |

Abbreviations: BLL, blood lead level; BUN, blood urea nitrogen; CBL, calcaneus bone lead; DBP, diastolic blood pressure; DMSA, DMSA-chelatable lead; HB, hemoglobin; PBL, patella bone lead; SBP, systolic blood pressure; SC, serum creatinine; TBL, tibia bone lead; ZPP, zinc protoporphyrin.

*pStatistically significant, p < 0.05.

*These studies use the same population data.

**Table 2. Frequency of ALAD allele and HWE in the studies analyzed.

| Source | Total no. | ALAD1-1 | ALAD1-2 | ALAD2-2 | ALAD1(d) | ALAD2(d) | HWE |
|--------|-----------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|------|
| Wetmur et al. 1991a | 203 | 161 | 32 | 10 | 0.872 | 0.128 | No |
| Schwartz et al. 1995 | 307 | 273 | 34 | 0 | 0.945 | 0.055 | Yes |
| Alexander et al. 1999 | 134 | 114 | 20 | 0 | 0.926 | 0.075 | Yes |
| Fleming et al. 1998 | 387 | 312 | 67 | 3 | 0.914 | 0.086 | No |
| Sakai et al. 2000 | 192 | 161 | 29 | 2 | 0.296 | 0.086 | No |
| Schwartz et al. 2000 | 795 | 716 | 79 | 0 | 0.950 | 0.050 | Yes |
| Suzen et al. 2003 | 71 | 50 | 21 | 0 | 0.852 | 0.148 | Yes |
| Kim et al. 2004 | 1,219 | 1,106 | 113 | 0 | 0.954 | 0.046 | Yes |
| Wu et al. 2004 | 57 | 42 | 15 | 0 | 0.889 | 0.132 | Yes |
| Smith et al. 1995 | 688 | 592 | 94 | 2 | 0.929 | 0.071 | Yes |
| Hsieh et al. 2000 | 660 | 630 | 29 | 1 | 0.977 | 0.023 | Yes |
| Wu et al. 2003 | 709 | 595 | 107 | 7 | 0.915 | 0.085 | Yes |
| Wetmur et al. 1991a | 1,278 | 1,136 | 129 | 13 | 0.939 | 0.061 | No |
| Perez-Bravo et al. 2004 | 93 | 84 | 81 | 0 | 0.946 | 0.054 | Yes |

**Table 3. Summary effect size of blood lead level in ALAD1-2/2-2 versus ALAD1-1 carriers.

| Population and subgroup analysis | No. of studies | WMD (μg/dL; 95% CI) | $\chi^2$ test (p-value) | Publication bias tests (p-value) |
|----------------------------------|----------------|---------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|
| ALL | 14 | 2.31 (0.93 to 3.70) | 0.0 | 76.3 | 1.0 | 0.10 |
| All in HWE | 12 | 0.86 (–0.01 to 1.73) | 0.07 | 38.6 | 1.0 | 0.42 |
| Occupational | 10 | 2.56 (1.21 to 3.90) | 0.65 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.42 |
| Occupational in HWE | 9 | 2.24 (0.85 to 3.62) | 0.97 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.42 |
| Environmentally exposed adults | 3 | 0.05 (–0.79 to 0.88) | 0.11 | 55.2 | 1.0 | 0.32 |
| Environmentally exposed children | 2 | 7.34 (4.92 to 9.76) | 0.57 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 |
| Environmentally exposed children in HWE | 1 | 5.51 (1.39 to 9.63) | 0.94 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 |

*Statistically significant, p < 0.05.

NA, not applicable.
ALAD polymorphism and heme synthesis. Zinc protoporphyrin (ZPP). Six published occupational studies related ZPP to ALAD polymorphism (Alexander et al. 1998; Kim et al. 2004; Lee SS et al. 2001; Sakai et al. 2000; Schwartz et al. 1995; Wu et al. 2004). Because the methods used to measure ZPP were not uniform, we calculated the SMD. The overall pooled SMD was –0.09, indicating that individuals carrying the ALAD2 allele had lower ZPP values (Figure 3). However, the SMD was not statistically significant (95% CI, –0.22 to 0.03; \( p = 0.13 \)).

Hemoglobin. Six published cross-sectional studies related hemoglobin levels to ALAD polymorphism: four occupational (Kim et al. 2004; Schwartz et al. 1997a, 2000; Wu et al. 2004), one on environmentally exposed adults (Hu et al. 2001; Smith et al. 1995) and one on environmentally exposed children (Lee SS et al. 2001; Sakai et al. 2000; Wu et al. 2003)—were analyzed for differences in trabecular lead level and ALAD polymorphism. The overall pooled SMD of –0.07 was not significant (95% CI, 0.20 to 0.05) and no significant heterogeneity existed among the studies (\( I^2 = 0.0\% \)) (Table 4).

**Figure 2.** Random-effect WMD and 95% CI in blood lead level between ALAD1-2/2-2 and ALAD1-1 carriers.

| Study                          | WMD [g/dL (95% CI)] | Weight (%) |
|-------------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Environmental, adults         | –0.10 (–0.18 to 0.06) | 13.8       |
| Occupational                  | –0.19 (–0.58 to 0.21) | 27.6       |
| Overall                       | –0.09 (–0.22 to 0.03) | 100.0      |

**Figure 3.** Random-effect SMD in ZPP values between ALAD1-2/2-2 and ALAD1-1 carriers.

| Study                          | SMD (95% CI) | Weight (%) |
|-------------------------------|--------------|------------|
| Schwartz et al. 1995          | 0.09 (–0.28 to 0.45) | 11.7       |
| Alexander et al. 1998         | –0.24 (–0.71 to 0.24) | 6.6        |
| Sakai et al. 2000              | –0.19 (–0.58 to 0.19) | 10.1       |
| Lee SS et al. 2001             | 0.02 (–0.21 to 0.26) | 27.6       |
| Kim et al. 2004                | –0.19 (–0.39 to 0.00) | 39.7       |
| Wu et al. 2004                 | 0.04 (–0.55 to 0.63) | 4.3        |
| Overall                       | –0.09 (–0.22 to 0.03) | 100.0      |
These data indicate that the bioavailability of lead is greater in ALAD1-I individuals than in ALAD1-2 individuals.

**ALAD polymorphism and kidney function. Serum creatinine.** Four studies reported serum creatinine values and ALAD polymorphism (Bergdahl et al. 1997a; Smith et al. 1995; Weaver et al. 2003; Wu et al. 2003). The study by Bergdahl et al. (1997a) was excluded because it was not possible to calculate the mean and SD. Therefore, only three studies were analyzed by pooled SMD: two conducted in environmentally exposed individuals (Smith et al. 1995; Wu et al. 2003), and one in lead-exposed workers (Weaver et al. 2003). Very high heterogeneity was present \( (p < 0.001; I^2 = 92.9\%) \) (Table 4), that could be attributed to different levels of lead exposure. Pooled analysis of the two studies reporting low levels of lead exposure (environmental studies) shows that individuals carrying the ALAD2 allele had a corresponding significantly higher serum creatinine (SMD = 0.48; 95% CI, 0.33 to 0.62) than those individuals homozygous for ALAD1.

**ALAD polymorphism and blood pressure.** Two cross-sectional studies related systolic blood pressure to ALAD polymorphism (Lee BK et al. 2001; Smith et al. 1995). The pooled WMD was 0.30 mmHg higher in individuals carrying the ALAD2 allele, but the difference was not statistically significant (95% CI, −2.18 to 2.78) (Table 4). Heterogeneity was present among three studies (Lee BK et al. 2001; Smith et al. 1995; Wu et al. 2003) relating diastolic blood pressure to ALAD polymorphism \( (\chi^2 = 6.16; p = 0.05; I^2 = 66.9\%) \) (Table 4). This heterogeneity was most likely due to the different frequency of the ALAD2 allele in the population investigated, as well as the level of lead exposure. Exclusion of the occupational study (Lee BK et al. 2001), which has a low frequency of ALAD2 allele and modestly higher levels of lead exposure, resulted in a nonsignificant test for heterogeneity \( (\chi^2 = 0.47; p = 0.49) \), a significant pooled WMD that was 1.88 mmHg higher in individuals carrying the ALAD2 allele (95% CI, 0.46 to 3.31; \( p = 0.01 \)) (Table 4).

**Discussion**

Our goal in this study was to determine the associations of ALAD polymorphism on blood lead levels and bone deposition, and the role of this polymorphism as a modifier of target organ lead toxicity. Overall, our meta-analysis shows that individuals carrying the ALAD2 allele had generally higher blood lead levels than those homozygous for ALAD1. The data suggest that carrying the ALAD allele is a significant determinant for blood lead concentrations among individuals subjected to high levels, such as lead-exposed workers. ALAD2 does not appear to be a significant determinant of blood lead concentrations among adult individuals exposed to relatively low lead levels (<10 μg/dL).

The biologic plausibility for a differential role of the two ALAD alleles lies in the fact that the ALAD2 enzyme could potentially have a higher affinity and stability for lead than ALAD1. Among lead workers, carriers of the ALAD2 allele had a higher percentage of lead bound to the ALAD enzyme compared to ALAD1 homozygotes (Bergdahl et al. 1997b). The higher percentage of lead bound to the ALAD2 enzyme translates to lower levels of bioavailable lead; the reverse is true in ALAD1 homozygotes. This is consistent with our results. We found that people carrying the ALAD2 allele had a weighted average of 21.30 μg lower DMSA-chelatable lead than individuals lacking the allele.

The insertion of ferrous iron \((\text{Fe}^{2+})\) into the porphyrin ring to form heme is catalyzed by the mitochondrial enzyme ferrochelatase, which shows reduced activity in the presence of lead (Ponka 1997). This reduction in ferrochelatase activity frees protoporphyrin to accept zinc, resulting in the formation of zinc protoporphyrin, which is characteristically increased in both lead poisoning and iron deficiency.

The increased amount of lead bound to the ALAD2 isozyme should result in decreased lead available to inhibit ferrochelatase, which would thus be available to catalyze the formation of heme with subsequent formation of diketopiperazines.
hemoglobin in the presence of Fe$^{2+}$. In contrast, the weaker binding of lead to ALAD1 results in more bioavailable lead that can inhibit ferrochelatase. This results in increased formation of ZPP and decreased production of hemoglobin.

Our meta-analysis supports these modifying effects of the ALAD2 allele. Hemoglobin level was 0.18 g/dL (95% CI, 0.05 to 0.31) higher in lead workers with the ALAD1-2 genotype. Although ALAD2 carriers had a lower ZPP (SMD = −0.10), the difference was not statistically significant. ZPP is characteristically increased in lead poisoning and starts to rise exponentially only at blood lead concentrations > 30 μg/dL in adults or > 25 μg/dL in children (Baldwin and Marshall 1999). It is thus reasonable to expect a modifying effect on ZPP by ALAD polymorphism with increased lead exposure. The absence of a significant effect could be due to differences in exposure levels to the toxicant across the study populations. Schwartz et al. (1995) found that workers carrying the ALAD2 allele in the plant with the highest lead exposures were associated with lower ZPP measurements. The association of ALAD2 with lower ZPP was also reported by Alexander et al. (1998), and this association was more pronounced in workers with blood lead concentrations ≥ 40 μg/dL. Significantly higher levels of ZPP were reported in ALAD1 homozygous Japanese lead workers compared with ALAD2 carriers at BLLs > 20 μg/dL (Sakai et al. 2000). Overall, these studies indicate that the ALAD alleles are a modifying factor in the formation of ZPP at higher blood lead levels (> 20 μg/dL), and that ALAD2 carriers exhibit lower levels of ZPP and higher levels of hemoglobin.

Differences in lead accumulation in various bone types have been reported. Tibia concentrations differ from those observed in the patella. The cortical bone of the tibia represents a long-term storage depot with an elimination half-life for lead in excess of a decade. ALAD status may modify the way in which lead partitions between these bone depots (Smith et al. 1995). That is, the variant ALAD2 protein may effectively increase the blood and soft tissue (e.g., spleen and kidney) compartment half-lives of lead, thus decreasing partitioning to the cortical bone compartment. Our meta-analysis did not find a significant association between ALAD polymorphism and accumulation of lead in the different bone compartments. More recently, emphasis has focused on the role of vitamin D receptor (VDR) polymorphism in modulating the lead level in the bone compartment (Schwartz et al. 2000; Theppang et al. 2004). The vitamin D endocrine system plays an essential role in calcium homeostasis and bone metabolism. Vitamin D is a prohormone that is metabolically converted to the active metabolite 1,25-dihydroxyvitamin D (calcitriol), which facilitates calcium absorption from the gut and directly stimulates osteoblasts in the bone-forming cells. These effects are mediated through activation of the VDR, which alters the transcription rates of target genes responsible for the biological response (Dusso et al. 2005).

Leads is a divalent cation that behaves like calcium in biological systems, and interactions between lead and calcium have been reported. Calcium and calcitriol deficiencies result in increased lead absorption from the gut (Fullmer 1990). Conversely, higher dietary calcium intake results in lower BLLs in children (Mahaffey et al. 1986) and in reduced bone lead accumulation in animals (Bogden et al. 1995). VDR polymorphism may thus influence lead uptake and retention in bone storage pools.

Theppang et al. (2004) found a significantly higher patella lead burden in lead workers carrying the VDR B allele. Schwartz et al. (2000) previously reported in adjusted analyses that lead workers carrying the VDR B allele had significantly higher tibia lead levels (on average 6.4 μg/g) than workers with the VDR bb genotype.

Associations of ALAD polymorphism and renal effects of lead exposure have also been reported. Smith et al. (1995) found that the ALAD2 carriers were more susceptible to decrements in renal function as measured by increases in serum creatinine and blood urea nitrogen (BUN). The increased serum creatinine in individuals carrying ALAD2 was confirmed in a sample of 89 lead workers (Bergdahl et al. 1997a). Conversely, Korean lead workers with the ALAD1-2 genotype exhibited lower BUN and serum creatinine (Weaver et al. 2003). The pooled SMD in our meta-analysis showed higher serum creatinine values among ALAD2 carriers. However, there was significant heterogeneity among the studies that might be ascribed to the level of lead exposure, frequency of the polymorphism in the population investigated, and other possible confounders (e.g., age, sex). Pooled analysis of the studies reporting low levels of lead exposure (environmental studies) shows that individuals carrying the ALAD2 allele had a corresponding statistically significant mean average of 0.10 mg/dL higher serum creatinine than those individuals homozygous for ALAD1.

The effect of lead on blood pressure has also been widely investigated (Kopp et al. 1988; Pirkle et al. 1985). The available literature suggests that there is a positive, albeit weak association between systolic blood pressure and lead concentration. A recent meta-analysis showed that a 2-fold increase in blood lead concentration is associated with a rise in systolic pressure of 1.0 mmHg (95% CI, 0.5 to 1.4; p < 0.001) and an increase in diastolic pressure of 0.6 mmHg (95% CI, 0.4 to 0.8; p < 0.001) (Nawrot et al. 2002).

Our meta-analysis did not find a difference in systolic blood pressure associated with ALAD polymorphism. However, individuals carrying the ALAD2 allele who were environmentally exposed to lead showed an increase in diastolic blood pressure of 1.88 mmHg.

The biological plausibility of a causal relationship between elevated blood pressure and lead exposure has been studied mainly in animals and in vitro. Experiments have demonstrated that lead affects the smooth muscles of blood vessels by interfering with the Na$^+$/K$^+-$pump, cyclic AMP, calcium ions (Ca$^{2+}$), and the rennin–angiotensin system (McAllister et al. 1971; Roels et al. 1990; Sandstead et al. 1970). In this context, the presence of other polymorphic genes, such as that coding for endothelial nitric oxide synthase (eNOS), may play an additional role. Endothelial NOS converts l-arginine into nitric oxide, causing relaxation of vascular smooth muscle (Vaziri and Ding 2001; Vaziri et al. 1999) and associations among eNOS genotypes, hypertension, lead exposure, and intracellular Ca$^{2+}$ concentrations have been reported (Colombo et al. 2002; Sofowora et al. 2001).

Conclusions

Measurement of blood lead level is the most convenient, readily available, and logistically feasible biomarker for assessing risk of lead toxicity. However, the presence of the ALAD2 allele may obscure the clinical interpretation of blood lead values in terms of target organ toxicity. ALAD2 carriers generally show higher BLLs in adults at increased levels of lead exposure, and appear to be protected against adverse hemapoietic effects as measured by hemoglobin levels. The modifying effects of ALAD on other organs remain unclear, partly because of the the small number of studies. These numbers are relatively small and therefore any inferences have to be cautious (Ioannidis et al. 2003). The strength of the present analysis, however, is based on the aggregation of published studies, thus there is more information for investigating the effect of the allele under investigation. Moreover, the role of other genes such as VDR could alter lead deposition in bone. The increasing application of molecular epidemiologic methods has emphasized the interaction between genes and the environment. Multiple gene polymorphisms suggest that genes having a small effect may interact to determine the overall risk. This meta-analysis identifies several issues: a) there are numerous potential sources of heterogeneity, including varying allele frequencies and HWEE in the populations; b) in the context of gene–environment interactions, gene–gene interactions may play a role (for example, ALAD, VDR, and eNOS may interact to modify lead levels in several organs).
References

Alexander BH, Cheekwayo H, Costa-Malen P, Faustman EM, Woods JS, Kelsey KT, et al. 1998. Interaction of blood lead and δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase genotype on markers of homeostatic and sperm production in lead smelter workers. Environ Health Perspect 106:213–216.

Asthin KH, Bishop DF, Wetmur JG, Kaul B, Davidow BS, Desnick RJ. 1987. δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase isoforms and lead toxicity. Ann NY Acad Sci 514:23–29.

ATSDR. 1999. Toxicological Profile for Lead. Atlanta, GA:Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry.

Baldwin DR, Marshall WJ. 1999. Heavy metal poisoning and its laboratory investigation. Ann Clin Biochem. 36:267–300.

Battistuzzi G, Petrucci R, Silvagni L, Urbani FR, Caiola S. 1981. δ-Aminolevulinic acid dehydratase isozymes and correlations of dentin and bone lead levels in adolescent. Ann Hum Genet 45:1041–1048.

Bellinger D, Mazumdar M. 1994. Operating characteristics of a rank correlation test for publication bias. Biometrics 50:1088–1101.

Bellinger D, Hu H, Titballa B, Needleman HL. 1994. Attentional correlates of dentin and bone lead levels in adolescent. Arch Environ Health 52:93–96.

Bergdahl IA, Gerhardsson L, Schultz A, Desnick RJ, Wetmur JG, Skerfving S. 1989a. δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase polymorphism: influence on lead levels and kidney function in humans. Arch Environ Health 55:255–96.

Bergdahl IA, Grubb A, Schultz A, Desnick RJ, Wetmur JG, Sassa S, et al. 1997b. Lead binding to δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase and vitamin D receptor genotypes with hematopoietic outcomes in Korean lead workers. Scand J Work Environ Health 27:402–411.

Bogden JD, Kemp FW, Han S, Murphy M, Fraiman M, Titlebaum L, Needleman HL. 1994. Association of blood pressure and hypertension with lead dose measures and polymorphisms in the vitamin D receptor and δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase gene. Environ Health Perspect 103:289–283.

Lee SS, Lee KB, Lewis WF, Simon D, Kelsey KT, et al. 2001. Associations of blood lead and δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase and vitamin D receptor genotypes with hematopoietic outcomes in Korean lead workers. Scand J Work Environ Health 27:402–411.

Mahaffey KR, Gartside PS, Ouellet C. 1996. Blood lead levels and dietary calcium intake in 1- to 11-year-old children: the Second National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey. 1976–1980. Pediatrics 78:257–262.

Marcus AH. 1985a. Multicompartment kinetic models for lead: Part I: Bone kinetics and variable absorption in human adults without excessive lead exposures. Environ Res 36:441–458.

Marcus AH. 1985b. Multicompartment kinetic models for lead: Part II: Linear kinetics and variable absorption in humans at lead exposures. Environ Res 36:449–472.

McAllister RG Jr, Michelas AM, Sandstead HH. 1971. Plasma renin activity in chronic plumbism. Arch Int Med 127:921–932.

National Library of Medicine. Medline Database. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/entrez/query.fcgi?DB=pubmed [accessed 31 December 2005].

Navrots T, Thips L, Den Hond EM, Roels HA, Staessens JA. 2002. An epidemiological re-appraisal of the association between blood pressure and blood lead: a meta-analysis. J Hum Hypertens 16:123–131.

Onalajo AD, Claudio L. 2000. Genetic susceptibility to lead poisoning. Environ Health Perspect 108:523–528.

Perez-Bravo F, Ruz M, Murin-Jimenez MJ, Oliavares M, Rebolledo A, Codoces J, et al. 2004. Association between aminolevulinate dehydratase genotypes and blood lead levels in children from a lead-contaminated area in Antofagasta, Chile. Arch Environ Contam Toxicol 47:276–280.

Pirkle JL, Schwartz J, Lamdis JR, Harlan WR. 1985. The relations between blood lead levels and blood pressure and its cardiovascular risk implications. Am J Epidemiol 121:246–258.

Ponka P. 1997. Tissue-specific regulation of iron metabolism and heme synthesis: distinct control mechanisms in erythroid cells. Blood 91:81–95.

Rabinowitz MB, Wethell GM, Koppel JE. 1976. Kinetics analysis of lead metabolism in healthy humans. J Clin Invest 56:260–270.

Roels HA, Boecka M, Ceulemans E, Lauwerys RR. 1990. Urinary mercury vapour. Br J Ind Med 47:331–337.

Sassa S, et al. 1997b. Lead binding to δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase and vitamin D receptor genotypes with hematopoietic outcomes in Korean lead workers. Scand J Work Environ Health 27:402–411.

Suzen HS, Duydu Y, Aydin A, Isimer A, Yural N. 2003. Influence of δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase polymorphism on biomarkers of lead exposure in Turkish storage battery manufacturing workers. Am J Ind Med 43:165–171.

Treppkean K, Schwartz BS, Lee BK, Lustberg ME, Silbergeld EK, Kelsey KT, et al. 2004. Associations of patella lead with polymorphisms in the vitamin D receptor, δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase and endothelial nitric oxide synthase genes. J Occup Environ Med 46:329–337.

Thomson Scientific. Web of Science. Available: http://scientific.thomson.com/products/wos/ [accessed 31 December 2005].

Trikalinos TA, Salanti G, Khoury MJ, Ioannidis JP. 2006. Impact of violations and deviations in Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium on postulated gene-disease associations. Am J Epidemiol 163:300–309.

Vaziri ND, Liang K, Ding Y. 1999. Increased nitric oxide inactivation by reactive oxygen species in lead-induced hyperten- sion. Kidney Int 56:1492–1498.

Vaziri ND, Ding Y. 2001. Effect of lead on nitric oxide synthase expression in coronary endothelial cells. Hypertension 37:229–236.

Warren MJ, Cooper JB, Wood SP, Shoeling-Jordan PM. 1998. Lead poisoning, haem synthesis and δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase. Trends Biochem Sci 23:217–21.

Weaver VM, Schwartz BS, Ahn KD, Stewart WF, Kelsey KT, Todd AC, et al. 2003. Associations of renal function with polymorphisms in the δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase, vitamin D receptor, and nitric oxide synthase genes in Korean lead workers. Environ Health Perspect 111:1613–1619.

Wetmur JG, Kaya AH, Pliewinka M, Desnick RJ. 1991a. Molecular characterization the human δ-aminolevulinic dehy- dratase 2 (ALAD 2) allele: implications for molecular screening of individuals for genetic susceptibility to lead poi- soning. Am J Hum Genet 49:757–63.

Wu FY, Chang PW, Wu CC, Lee JS, Kuo HW. 2004. Lack of associ- ation of δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase genotype with cytogenetic damage in lead workers. Int Arch Occup Environ Health 77:395–400.

Wu MT, Kelsey K, Schwartz J, Sparrow D, Weiss S, Hu H. 2003. A-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase (ALAD) polymorphism may modify the relationship of low-level lead expos- ure to uricemia and renal function: the normative aging study. Environ Health Perspect 111:335–341.

Ziemsen B, Angerer J, Lehnert G, Benkheim NG, Goedde HW. 1996. Polymorphism of δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase in lead exposed workers. Int Arch Occup Environ Health 58:245–247.

Kedala SN, Shelton E, Kaufmann RB, Khoury MJ. 2001. δ-Aminolevulinic acid dehydratase genotypic and lead toxic- ity: a HuGE review. Am J Epidemiol 154:1–13.

Kim HS, Lee SS, Lee GS, Hwangbo Y, Ahn KD, Lee BK. 2004. The protective effect of δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase 1-2 and 1-2-2 genotypes against blood lead in Korean home- tologic parameters. Environ Health Perspect 112:534–541.

Kopp SJ, Barron JT, Tow JP. 1988. Cardiovascular actions of lead and relationship to hypertension: a review. Environ Health Perspect 89:31–46.

Lee BK, Lee GS, Stewart WF, Ahn KD, Simon D, Kelsey KT, et al. 2001. Associations of blood lead and δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase genotype and demecap- tassin acid-chelatable lead levels. Arch Environ Health 52:97–103.

Lee BK, Leung WT, Stewart S, Michaelis AM, Sandstead HH. 1971. Plasma renin activity in chronic plumbism. Arch Int Med 127:921–932.

Suzen HS, Duydu Y, Aydin A, Isimer A, Yural N. 2003. Influence of δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase polymorphism on biomarkers of lead exposure in Turkish storage battery manufacturing workers. Am J Ind Med 43:165–171.

Treppkean K, Schwartz BS, Lee BK, Lustberg ME, Silbergeld EK, Kelsey KT, et al. 2004. Associations of patella lead with polymorphisms in the vitamin D receptor, δ-aminolevulinic acid dehydratase and endothelial nitric oxide synthase genes. J Occup Environ Med 46:329–337.

Thomson Scientific. Web of Science. Available: http://scientific.thomson.com/products/wos/ [accessed 31 December 2005].