Entropy of the Bose-Einstein-condensate ground state: Correlation versus ground-state entropy
Moochan B. Kim, Anatoly Svidzinsky, Girish S. Agarwal, and Marlan O. Scully
Phys. Rev. A 97, 013605 — Published 5 January 2018
DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevA.97.013605
I. INTRODUCTION

The properties of a Bose condensate [1, 2] are usually studied using a grand canonical ensemble by making a number of assumptions which can be justified in the thermodynamic limit [3–5]. For a condensate consisting of relatively small number of particles, it is better to use a canonical ensemble. This ensemble is useful in understanding the particle number distribution, as well as the fluctuations in the number of particles in ground states and excited states, has been obtained [6–10]. Such calculations do not require thermodynamic limit. An important result is the distribution of the number of particles in the ground state. Recent work presents the entropy of the ground state of an ideal Bose-Einstein condensate (BEC) from the condensate density matrix [11, 12]

\[ \rho_{n_0 n_0} = \frac{\mathcal{H}^{N-n_0}}{(N-n_0)!} e^{-\mathcal{H}}, \]

where \( \mathcal{H} = N(T/T_c)^3 \) for a harmonic trap at temperature \( T \) and critical temperature \( T_c \) and \( n_0 \) is the number of atoms in the condensate state.

This distribution has some novel features—it is like the well known laser distribution for photons in a single mode laser. This distribution can be used to calculate the thermodynamic properties of the ground state; in particular the approximate expression for entropy was obtained. From the von Neumann entropy

\[ S = -k_B \sum_n \rho_{nn} \ln \rho_{nn}, \]

with Boltzmann constant \( k_B \), one finds [12]

\[ S = k_B \ln W + \frac{k_B}{2}, \]

where \( W = \sqrt{2\pi(\Delta n_0)^2} = \sqrt{2\pi\mathcal{H}} \). Note that for \( T \to 0 \), we need to use the expression (1) or the full canonical ensemble calculation.

In this paper we study the Bose gas in a three dimensional trap. We use the canonical ensemble to obtain exact results for the quantum statistical entropy. Our exact results reveal new features of the Bose gas. We consider the density matrix associated with the ground state \( \rho_{\text{gnd}} \) and for the excited states \( \rho_{\text{ex}} \) obtained from the full canonical density matrix. The considerations of exact canonical ensemble reveal that the total entropy of the Bose gas at any temperature \( T \) is equal to the entropy of the particles in the excited states; although the entropy of the ground state particles is nonzero. This

FIG. 1. Entropy of Ground state in an Ideal Bose Gas, which is trapped in 3D Harmonic trap. The total number of particles is \( N = 200 \). The critical temperature for 3D harmonic trap is \( T_c = \hbar \Omega/(k_B N/\zeta(3))^{1/3} \), with harmonic trap oscillation frequency \( \Omega \), and Riemann’s zeta function \( \zeta(s) \). This exact result on entropy is calculated by Canonical Ensemble Partition function, which is explained in Appendix A and B, and it is drawn as a solid red line. From the approximate density matrix, Eq. (1), the corresponding von Neumann’s entropy is plotted as a dashed blue line.
remarkable result implies the existence of the correlation entropy in Bose gas and in fact the correlation entropy must cancel the contribution from the ground state. We trace this result to the fact that in the ensemble the number of particles is fixed and thus the total density matrix does not factorize $\rho_T \neq \rho_{\text{gnd}} \otimes \rho_{\text{ex}}$. The nonfactorized nature of the full density matrix is further clarified by calculating the correlation functions between the ground state and excited state particles.

In Sec. II, we derive reduced density matrices from the total matrix in number occupation representation, and consider the corresponding entropies. Explicit example is shown in Table I. Furthermore, the equality of the total entropy and entropy of the excited particles is confirmed by comparing the forms of two density matrices. In this procedure, the correlation entropy is defined, also. In Sec. III, we derive the explicit relations among the entropies of particles in Ideal BEC, which leads to Joint entropy theorem for the total entropy. In Sec. IV, the consideration of correlation functions has provided more clear understanding on the correlation entropy in BEC system. The correlations between the occupations of ground state and that of excited states has shown a similar tendency as the correlation entropy along temperature, as shown in Fig. 3. In Sec. V, we conclude this paper by asserting the equality between two entropies: the total entropy and the entropy of the excited particles of BEC in Canonical Ensemble. Explicit procedures to calculate the partition function and related thermodynamic quantities in Canonical Ensemble have been shown in Appendix A and B.

![Table I](image)

**TABLE I.** (a) The system consists of two identical Bose particles (red dot), which are distributed among three different states (blue lines). Due to the Bose statistics, the number of possible configurations is 6. (b) The total density matrix $\rho_T$ and the corresponding entropy $S(\rho_T)$ and (c) the reduced density matrix $\rho_{\text{ex}}$ for excited states and the corresponding entropy $S(\rho_{\text{ex}})$. By comparing insets (b) and (c), we can easily confirm the equality of the two entropies. (d) The density matrix and entropy for the ground state. The relation between the occupation probability for the ground state and the whole joint probability is explicitly shown.

II. BEC JOINT GROUND STATE ENTROPY

We first prove that the total entropy of the ideal Bose Gas at a temperature $T$ is same as the entropy of excited states of that system. At equilibrium, the total density matrix for an Ideal Bose gas with fixed total number of particles $N$ is given by

$$\rho_T = \sum_{n_0, \{n_i\}} p(n_0, \{n_i\}) |n_0, \{n_i\} \rangle \langle n_0, \{n_i\}| \delta_{N-n_0, \sum n_i},$$  

(4)

with the occupation distribution $\{n_i\}$ on the excited states constrained by the condition $\sum n_i = N - n_0$. The reduced density matrices for the ground state and for the excited states are

$$\rho_{\text{gnd}} = \text{Tr}_{\{n_i\}}(\rho_T) = \sum_{n_0} p(n_0) |n_0 \rangle \langle n_0|,$$

(5a)

and

$$\rho_{\text{ex}} = \rho_T - \rho_{\text{gnd}}.$$
The occupation probability for the ground state is

$$p(n_0) = \sum_{\{n_i\}} p(n_0, \{n_i\}). \quad (7)$$

Note that the probabilities for the states $\{|n_i\}\rangle$ in $\rho_{\text{ex}}$ are the same joint probabilities as for the states $|n_0, \{n_i\}\rangle$ in $\rho_T$. The explicit example for calculating the corresponding probability is explained in Table I.

From the von Neumann entropy, Eq. (2), the corresponding entropies are

$$S(\rho_T) = -k_B \text{Tr}_{n_0}\langle n_1 \rangle (\rho \ln \rho) \quad (8a)$$

$$= -k_B \sum_{n_0, \{n_i\}} p(n_0, \{n_i\}) \ln p(n_0, \{n_i\}), \quad (8b)$$

and

$$S(\rho_{\text{ex}}) = -k_B \text{Tr}_{\{n_i\}} (\rho_{\text{ex}} \ln \rho_{\text{ex}}) \quad (9a)$$

$$= -k_B \sum_{n_0, \{n_i\}} p(n_0, \{n_i\}) \ln p(n_0, \{n_i\}). \quad (9b)$$

Showing that the entropy of the total system, Eq. (8b), is equal to that for the excited states, Eq. (9b), since the accessible states and corresponding probabilities are the same. Table I shows this property explicitly for a system of two Bose particles in three non-degenerate levels.

Similarly, we can write the entropy of ground state.

$$S(\rho_{\text{gnd}}) = -k_B \text{Tr}_{n_0}\langle n_1 \rangle (\rho_{\text{gnd}} \ln \rho_{\text{gnd}}) \quad (10a)$$

$$= -k_B \sum_{n_0} p(n_0) \ln p(n_0). \quad (10b)$$

Furthermore, the above result is applicable for any quantum system of identical particles including an ideal Fermi atoms in a trap with a fixed total number of particles. Hence, we can say that the removal of any single state in canonical ensemble preserves the entropy, since the total number of particles is fixed by the constraint.

Since the total entropy of the system is same as that of the excited states, what is learned from this result? In a system of $N$ ideal Bose particles, we can divide the system into two parts: one is the ground state and the other is the excited states [Eqs. (5a) and (6a)]. It is also possible to define the entropy of each part [Eqs. (10a) and (9a)]. Since the total density matrix, Eq. (4), does not factorize as, $\rho_T \neq \rho_{\text{ex}} \otimes \rho_{\text{gnd}}$, we expect that the entropy of the total system is not the summation of entropy of each part, $S(\rho_T) \neq S(\rho_{\text{gnd}}) + S(\rho_{\text{ex}})$, and we thus introduce the correlation entropy [13] as

$$S_{\text{cor}}(\rho_{\text{gnd}}, \rho_{\text{ex}}) \equiv S(\rho_{\text{gnd}}) + S(\rho_{\text{ex}}) - S(\rho_T). \quad (11)$$

Remarkably, since $S(\rho_T) = S(\rho_{\text{ex}})$, we see that

$$S_{\text{cor}}(\rho_{\text{gnd}}, \rho_{\text{ex}}) = S(\rho_{\text{gnd}}). \quad (12)$$

Therefore, the entropy of ground state can be interpreted as the correlation entropy between the ground state and excited states. According to information theory [14], the correlation entropy $S_{\text{cor}}(\rho_{\text{gnd}}, \rho_{\text{ex}})$ is called as the mutual information. Hence, according to the information theory we can say that the status of the excited states can provide total information about the ground state.

![FIG. 2. Entropy for ideal Bose Gas which is trapped in a three dimensional harmonic trap. The detailed parameters are as in Fig. 1. The total entropy is drawn with a dashed blue line, using procedure in Appendix A and B, and the entropy of the ground state is in the solid red line. In this picture, the entropy for the ground state is multiplied by 100. From the behavior of the occupation number in the ground state, we can see the entropy contribution of the ground state is important below the critical temperature. In a similar way, in terms of correlation entropy the relevant range of the correlation is also below the critical temperature. The inset shows that both entropies below $T/T_c = 0.2$.]

III. BEC CONDITIONAL GROUND STATE ENTROPY

In statistics and Shannon’s information theory [15], conditional distributions and the conditional entropy are useful concepts. Using the conditional probability, we can identify the amount of contribution of the ground state in entropy to the excited states. The conditional probability for the excited states with a given number of particles in the ground state is

$$p(\{n_i\}|n_0) = \frac{p(n_0, \{n_i\})}{p(n_0)} \quad (13)$$

where the ground state occupation probability is given by Eq. (7). The entropy of $\rho_{\text{ex}}$ can be further evaluated.
\[ S(\rho_{\text{ex}}) = -k_B \sum_{\{n_i\}} \sum_{n_0} [p(n_0)p(\{n_i\}|n_0)] \log[p(n_0)] - k_B \sum_{\{n_i\}} \sum_{n_0} [p(n_0)p(\{n_i\}|n_0)] \log[p(\{n_i\}|n_0)] \]
\[ = -k_B \sum_{n_0} p(n_0) \log p(n_0) - k_B \sum_{n_0} p(n_0) \sum_{\{n_i\}} p(\{n_i\}|n_0) \log p(\{n_i\}|n_0) \]
\[ = S(\rho_{\text{gnd}}) + \sum_{n_0} p(n_0)S(\rho_{\text{ex}}^{N-n_0}). \]

where \( \rho_{\text{ex}}^{N-n_0} \) is the reduced density matrix of excited states with \( N-n_0 \) particles, and \( S(\rho_{\text{ex}}^{N-n_0}) \) is the corresponding entropy. Hence, the excited states \( S(\rho_{\text{ex}}) \) contain information about the ground state.

Similarly, we can rewrite the above relation for the total entropy as
\[ S(\rho_T) = S(\rho_{\text{gnd}}) + \sum_{n_0} p(n_0)S(\rho_{\text{ex}}^{N-n_0}). \]

This relation is known as Joint entropy theorem [14, 16, 17]. The entropy contribution of ground state is in the total entropy. We can interpret that \( S(\rho_{\text{gnd}}) \) as the entropy of the ground state and as the correlation entropy.

The explicit procedure how to calculate the entropy for the \( S(\rho_T) \) and \( S(\rho_{\text{ex}}^{N-n_0}) \) is explained in Appendix B. Fig. 2 shows the entropy of ground state, or the correlation entropy for the Ideal Bose Gas with 200 particles in 3D harmonic trap.

IV. CORRELATION FUNCTION

In order to better appreciate the nature of correlations in the Bose gas at low temperatures, we examine the variety of correlations of the occupation numbers between the ground state and the excited states. The entropy is defined by the distribution of occupation numbers, that is the density matrix, and the correlation function is defined by the corresponding random variables, that is the occupation numbers. For the ground state distribution the occupation number \( n_0 \) for ground state is the corresponding variable, and for the excited states the occupation number is \( \sum_i n_i = N - n_0 \).

As in statistical description of correlation between two random variables, we can introduce the correlation between the numbers of particles in the ground state and in excited states as
\[ C_1(n_0, \sum_i n_i) \equiv \frac{\langle n_0 \sum_i n_i \rangle}{\sqrt{\langle n_0^2 \rangle \langle \sum_i n_i \rangle^2}} = \frac{\langle n_0(N-n_0) \rangle}{\sqrt{\langle n_0^2 \rangle \langle (N-n_0)^2 \rangle}}. \]

Note that the Schwarz inequality implies that \( C_1 \leq 1 \). We note that over the temperature range \( T/T_c \sim [0.2 - 0.8], C_1 \simeq 1 \) implying very high degree of correlation. Beyond this temperature the correlation starts falling. Next we introduce the correlation defined as the fluctuation around the mean
\[ C_2(n_0, \sum_i n_i) \equiv \left[ \langle n_0 \sum_i n_i \rangle - \langle n_0 \rangle \langle \sum_i n_i \rangle \right]^{1/2} = \sqrt{\langle (n_0)^2 \rangle - \langle n_0 \rangle^2}. \]

It is interesting that the conservation of total number \( N \) of particles makes \( C_2 \) identical to the (variance)^{1/2} of the ground state number. The \( C_2 \) shows a behavior which has similarities to the behavior of the correlation entropy. However, the correlation entropy shows much slower dependence on \( T \). This can be understood as the ground state entropy is the mean value of \( p(n_0) \) and is related in principle to all order of moments of \( n_0 \). If \( p(n_0) \) were to be approximated by a Gaussian, then \( \ln p(n_0) \) is directly related to \( \ln C_2 \) and because of logarithmic dependence, entropy shows much slower dependence on \( T \) than \( C_2 \).

In this figure we also show a very interesting character of the statistics of the fluctuations in the ground state: the fluctuations in the region close to \( T/T_c \ll 1 \) are predominantly sub-Poissonian as \( \Delta n_0/\sqrt{\langle n_0 \rangle} < 1 \). The result from the approximate expression, Eq. (1), are close to the exact result.

Although the fluctuations of the ground state populations have not been yet studied experimentally, this is possible in principle from the snapshots of the images of the distribution of particles in the trap. The peak and tail of the snapshots should yield the ground state and the excited state distributions. Such images have been used for studying the particle number fluctuations in a trap when interparticle interactions are important [18].

We next consider the correlation between two specific states defined by
\[ \tilde{C}_1(n_i, n_j) \equiv \frac{\langle n_i n_j \rangle}{\sqrt{\langle (n_i)^2 \rangle \langle (n_j)^2 \rangle}} \]

where
\[ \langle n_i n_j \rangle = \sum_{n_i=1}^{N-n_0} \sum_{n_j=1}^{N-n_0} e^{-\beta n_i \epsilon_i - \beta n_j \epsilon_j} \frac{Z_{N-n_i-n_j}(\beta)}{Z_N(\beta)}, \]
which is derived in the supplementary information.
The correlation between the ground state and the first excited state is shown in Fig. 4. Though the occupation number of the first excited states is considerable around $T/T_c \sim 1$, the correlation between two states are negligible except at low temperatures $T/T_c \lesssim 0.1$, where it is of order $1/N$.

V. SUMMARY

The most important result of our exact calculation based on the canonical ensemble is that the entropy of a Bose gas confined to a three dimensional harmonic trap is equal to the entropy associated with the atoms in the excited states. This is so even though, at any temperature, the entropy of the particles in the ground state is nonzero. We bring out the reasons for this surprising result by showing that the total entropy associated with the full system consists of three contributions—the entropy of the ground state, the entropy associated with the particles in the excited state and a contribution which we refer to as the correlation entropy [analog of the mutual information from information theory]. We show on a very general ground that the correlation entropy cancels the ground state contribution. This appears due to the fixed number of particles distributed among the quantum states [19]. The explicit nature of correlations among the particles in ground state and excited states is brought about by studying different types of correlation functions involving the numbers in ground state and excited states. Because of the number conservation, these correlations become related to the ground state fluctuations. Since the entropy of the ground state is the mean value of the log $p(n_0)$, the fluctuations of $n_0$ determine the value of the entropy of particles in the ground state.

This paper is supported by the Office of Naval Research (Award No. N00014-16-1-3054) and by the Robert A. Welch Foundation (Grant No. A-1261).

Appendix A: Exact Partition Function and Occupation Probability in Canonical Ensemble

The partition function $Z_N$ in canonical ensemble (CE) can be written in terms of occupation number in each accessible state as

$$Z_N = \sum_{\{n\}} e^{-\beta \sum_i n_i \varepsilon_i}$$

where the sum is over all states $\{n\}$. Here $n_i$ is the occupation number of the $i$-th state and $\varepsilon_i$ is the energy of the $i$-th state.
where \( \beta = (k_B T)^{-1} \) is the inverse temperature with the Boltzmann constant \( k_B \).

The probability for \( \nu \) state to have \( n \) particles is

\[
P(n_\nu \geq n) = \frac{1}{Z_N} \sum_{n_\nu=0}^{\infty} \sum_{n_1=0}^{\infty} \cdots \sum_{n_n=0}^{\infty} e^{-\beta n_\nu \epsilon_\nu} e^{-\beta n_1 \epsilon_1} \cdots e^{-\beta n_n \epsilon_n} \delta \left( N - \sum \nu n_\nu \right)
\]

\[
P(n_\nu = n) = \frac{1}{Z_N} \sum_{n_\nu=0}^{\infty} \sum_{n_1=0}^{\infty} \cdots \sum_{n_n=0}^{\infty} e^{-\beta n_\nu \epsilon_\nu} e^{-\beta n_1 \epsilon_1} \cdots e^{-\beta n_n \epsilon_n} \delta \left( N - \sum \nu n_\nu \right)
\]

The correlation function between the two states can be easily obtained. Explicitly, it is

\[
\langle n_\nu n_\mu \rangle = \sum_{n_\nu=0}^{N} \sum_{n_\mu=0}^{N} e^{-\beta n_\nu \epsilon_\nu} e^{-\beta m \epsilon_\mu} \frac{Z_{N-n_\nu-m}(\beta)}{Z_N(\beta)}.
\]

Appendix B: Thermodynamic Quantities in Canonical Ensemble

Partition function \( Z_N(T, V) \) in canonical ensemble is related to the Helmholtz free energy \( A(T, V) \) [3, 4]

\[
Z_N(T, V) = e^{-\beta A(T, V)}
\]

or

\[
A(T, V) = -k_B T \ln Z_N(T, V)
\]

Thermodynamic quantities can be calculated from the Helmholtz free energy through the Maxwell relations. For example, pressure \( P \) and entropy \( S \) are

\[
P = -\left( \frac{\partial A}{\partial V} \right)_T
\]

\[
S = -\left( \frac{\partial A}{\partial T} \right)_V
\]

\[
U = \langle H \rangle = A + TS
\]

\[
C_V = \left( \frac{\partial U}{\partial T} \right)_V
\]

with isochoric heat capacity \( C_V \).
In terms of partition function,

\[
\frac{A}{k_B} = -T \ln Z_N \quad \text{(B7)}
\]

\[
P = \left( \frac{\partial \ln Z_N}{\partial V} \right)_T \quad \text{(B8)}
\]

\[
S = k_B \ln Z_N + k_B T \left( \frac{\partial \ln Z_N}{\partial T} \right)_V \quad \text{(B9)}
\]

\[
U = k_B T^2 \left( \frac{\partial \ln Z_N}{\partial T} \right)_V + k_B T^2 \left( \frac{\partial^2 \ln Z_N}{\partial T^2} \right)_V \quad \text{(B10)}
\]

\[
C_V = 2k_B T \left( \frac{\partial \ln Z_N}{\partial T} \right)_V \quad \text{(B11)}
\]

Derivatives of the partition function \( \ln Z_N \) with respect to the temperature \( T \) or to the volume \( V \) give to the corresponding thermodynamic quantities in canonical ensemble.

[1] C.J. Pethick and H. Smith, *Bose-Einstein Condensation in Dilute Gases* (2nd ed.), (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2008).

[2] R. Ziff, G. Uhlenbeck and M. Kac, “The Ideal Bose-Einstein Gas, Revisited”, Physics Reports 32, 169 (1977).

[3] K. Huang, *Statistical Mechanics* (2nd ed.), (John Wiely & Sons, New York, 1987).

[4] R.K. Pathria and Paul D. Beale, *Statistical Mechanics* (3rd ed.), (Elsevier, Amsterdam, 2011).

[5] L.D. Landau and E.M. Lifshitz, *Statistical Physics* (3rd, revised and enlarged ed.), (Pergamon Press, Oxford 1980).

[6] C. Weiss and M. Wilkens, “Particle number counting statistics in ideal Bose gases”, Opt. Exp. 1, 272 (1997).

[7] P. Navez, D. Bitouk, M. Gajda, Z. Idziaszek, and K. Rzążewski, “Fourth statistical ensemble for the Bose-Einstein condensate”, Phys. Rev. Let. 79, 1789 (1997).

[8] Z. Idziaszek, M. Gajda, P. Navez, M. Wilkens and K. Rzążewski, “Fluctuations of the weakly interacting Bose-Einstein condensate”, Phys. Rev. Let. 82, 4376 (1999).

[9] V.V. Kocharovsky, Vl. V. Kocharovsky, and M.O. Scully, “Condensate statistics in interacting and ideal dilute Bose gases”, Phys. Rev. Let. 84, 2306 (2000).

[10] M. Holthaus and E. Kalinowski, “Condensate Fluctuations in Trapped Bose Gases: Canonical vs. Microcanonical Ensemble”, Ann. Phys. (New York) 270, 198 (1998).

[11] M. O. Scully, “Condensation of N Bosons and the Laser Phase Transition Analogy”, Phy. Rev. Lett. 82, 3927 (1999); V.V. Kocharovsky, M. O. Scully, S.-Y. Zhu, and M. S. Zubairy, “Condensation of N bosons. II. Nonequilibrium analysis of an ideal Bose gas and the laser phase-transition analogy”, Phy. Rev. A 61, 023609 (2000).

[12] M. O. Scully, “Entropy of Photon and Atom Lasers,” (To be published).

[13] The correlation entropy has been introduced in the same way as in this article. For example, M. H. Partovi, “Quantum Thermodynamics”, Phys. Lett. A 137, 440 (1989), and H. Huang and Girish S. Agarwal, “General linear transformations and entangled states”, Phys. Rev. A 49, 52 (1994).

[14] M. A. Nielsen and I. L. Chuang, *Quantum Computation and Quantum Information* (10th Anniversary Ed.) (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2010).

[15] M. M. Wilde, *Quantum Information Theory*, (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2013).

[16] M. O. Scully, “Entropy of Photon and Atom Lasers,” (To be published).

[17] A. Wehrl, “General properties of entropy”, Rev. Mod. Phys. 50, 221 (1978).

[18] C.-S. Chuu, F. Schreck, T. P. Meyrath, J. L. Hansen, G. N. Price, and M. G. Raizen, “Direct Observation of Sub-Poissonian Number Statistics in a Degenerate Bose Gas”, Phys. Rev. Lett. 95, 260403 (2005).

[19] This is also applicable to particles obeying Fermi-Dirac statistics. Consequences of this would be the subject of future study.

[20] P. T. Landsberg, *Thermodynamics with quantum statistical illustrations*, Vol. 2 in Monographs in Statistical Physics and Thermodynamics, Ed. I. Prigogine (Interscience Publishers Inc., New York, 1961).