Title
The southwest Indian Monsoon over the last 18000 years

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8sk0r5vr

Journal
CLIMATE DYNAMICS, 12(3)

ISSN
0930-7575

Authors
Overpeck, J
Anderson, D
Trumbore, S
et al.

Publication Date
1996-02-01

DOI
10.1007/BF00211619

License
https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/ 4.0

Peer reviewed
The southwest Indian Monsoon over the last 18000 years

Jonathan Overpeck1,2, David Anderson1, Susan Trumbore3 and Warren Prell4

1 NOAA Paleoclimatology Program, National Geophysical Data Center, 325 Broadway, Boulder, Colorado 80303, USA
2 Institute of Arctic and Alpine Research, University of Colorado, Boulder, Colorado 80309, USA
3 Department of Earth System Science, University of California, Irvine, CA, 92717 USA
4 Department of Geological Sciences, Brown University, Providence, RI 02912, USA

Received: 28 March 1995 / Accepted: 7 July 1995

Abstract. Previously published results suggest that the strength of the SW Indian Monsoon can vary significantly on century- to millenium time scales, an observation that has important implications for assessments of future climate and hydrologic change over densely populated portions of Asia. We present new, well-dated, multi-proxy records of past monsoon variation from three separate Arabian Sea sediment cores that span the last glacial maximum to late-Holocene. To a large extent, these records confirm earlier published suggestions that the monsoon strengthened in a series of abrupt events over the last deglaciation. However, our data provide a somewhat refined picture of when these events took place, and suggest the primacy of two abrupt increases in monsoon intensity, one between 13 and 12.5 ka, and the other between 10 and 9.5 ka. This conclusion is supported by the comparisons between our new marine data and published paleoclimatic records throughout the African-Asian monsoon region. The comparison of data sets further supports the assertion that maximum monsoon intensity lagged peak insolation forcing by about 3000 years, and extended from about 9.5 to 5.5 ka. The episodic nature of rapid monsoon intensification coincides with major shifts in North Atlantic-European surface temperatures and ice-sheet extent. This coincidence, coupled with new climate model experiments, suggests that the large land-sea thermal gradient needed to drive strong monsoons developed only after glacial conditions upstream of, and on, the Tibetan Plateau receded (cold North Atlantic sea-surface temperatures, European ice-sheets, and extensive Asian snow cover). It is likely that abrupt changes in seasonal soil hydrology were as important to past monsoon forcing as were abrupt snow-related changes in regional albedo. Our analysis supports the hypothesis of a monsoon responded more linearly to insolation forcing after the disappearance of glacial boundary conditions, decreasing gradually after about 6 ka. Our data also support the possibility that significant century-scale decreases in monsoon intensity took place during the early to mid-Holocene period of enhanced monsoon strength, further highlighting the need to understand paleomonsoon dynamics before accurate assessments of future monsoon strength can be made.

Introduction

The southwest Indian Monsoon system is one of the major climate systems of the world, impacting large portions of both Africa and Asia. The modern large-scale time-averaged seasonal variations in this monsoonal system are fairly well understood, and are closely linked to the greater heat capacity of the ocean relative to the surrounding land masses (Hastenrath 1991; Fein and Stephens 1987). In the Northern Hemisphere summer, the Tibetan Plateau warms rapidly relative to the Indian Ocean. The resulting low pressure over Asia and higher pressure over the ocean gives rise to the strong low-level atmospheric pressure gradient that in turn generates the SW monsoon. In years of low snowfall, the Tibetan Plateau is able to warm earlier and generate a stronger monsoonal circulation (Dickson 1984; Barnett et al. 1988, 1989; Meehl 1994). Deep snow depths, and associated influences on albedo and soil hydrology, delay and weaken the monsoon (Barnett et al. 1989). In the winter, the continent cools relative to the ocean, the pressure gradient completely reverses, and the dominant flow across the Arabian Sea becomes northeasterly.

Terrestrial and marine paleoclimatic records indicate that century- to millennia-scale variations in the monsoon are larger than any observed over the past century, and that these variations are likely to have multiple causes (Kutzbach 1981, 1987; Street-Perrott and Roberts 1983; Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990; Clemens et al. 1991; Prell and Kutzbach 1992; Ander-
Table 1. List of sites with paleomonsoon records shown in Figs. 1 and 2

| Site number | Site or core name          | Reference(s)                        |
|-------------|----------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 1           | Oyo                        | Ritchie et al. 1985; Ritchie 1994   |
| 2           | Bir Atrun (El Atrun Oasis) | Ritchie 1987; Ritchie and Haynes 1987 |
| 3           | Lake Sidig complex         | Pachur and Hoelzmann 1991           |
| 4           | Selima Oasis               | Ritchie and Haynes 1987             |
| 5           | Wadi Howar                 | Pachur and Kröpelin 1988; Kröpelin and Soulie-Marshe 1991 |
| 6           | Muchoya Swamp              | Taylor 1990                         |
| 7           | Ahakagyazi Swamp           | Taylor 1990                         |
| 8           | Lake Kivu                  | Haberyan and Hecky 1987             |
| 9           | Kuruyange                  | Bonnefille et al. 1991              |
| 10          | Lake Cheshi                | Stager 1988                         |
| 11          | Lake Tanganyka             | Gasse et al. 1989; Haberyan and Hecky 1987; Vincens 1989, 1991 |
| 12          | Lake Rukwa                 | Haberyan 1978                       |
| 13          | Lake Victoria              | Adamson et al. 1980                 |
| 14          | Mts. Satima mire           | Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990      |
| 15          | Lake Turkana               | Owen et al. 1982                    |
| 16          | Lake Ziway-Shala complex   | Gasse and Street 1978; Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990 |
| 17          | Lake Abhe                  | Gasse and Street 1978; Gillespie et al. 1983 |
| 18          | Lake Afrera                | Gasse and Street 1978; Gillespie et al. 1983 |
| 19          | Lake Asal                  | Gasse and Street 1978; Gillespie et al. 1983 |
| 20          | Rub‘al Khali               | McClure 1976                        |
| 21          | Nizwa complex              | Clark and Fontes 1990               |
| 22          | Marine core RC27-23        | New data – this paper               |
| 23          | Marine core RC27-28        | New data – this paper               |
| 24          | Marine core RC27-14        | New data – this paper               |
| 25          | Lunkaransar                | Bryson and Swain 1981; Swain et al. 1983 |
| 26          | Dibdana Lake               | Bryson and Swain 1981; Swain et al. 1983; Singh et al. 1990 |
| 27          | Sumix Co                   | Gasse et al. 1991; Van Campo and Gasse 1993 |
| 28          | Southern Tibet lakes       | Fang 1991                           |

son and Prell 1993). Terrestrial records of past change from Asia and Africa indicate that the monsoon was significantly weaker than present during glacial times (ca. 18 ka), much stronger than present during the early to mid-Holocene (ca. 9 to 5 ka), and weaker up to the present-day (Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990; Porter et al. 1992; An et al. 1993; Jarvis 1993; Winkler and Wang 1993; references cited in Table 1). Marine records of past change from the Arabian Sea yield a similar record of change (Duplessy 1982; Van Campo et al. 1982; Prell 1984; Prell et al. 1990; Sirocko et al. 1991). Climate model simulations and available paleoclimatic data suggest that two mechanisms exert the dominant forcing on millennial-scale variations in monsoon strength. First, changes in the orbit of the Earth, predominantly in the precession of the equinoxes, control the amount of insolation reaching the Earth as a function of season, and hence the ability of the Tibetan Plateau to warm in the summer (Kutzbach 1981; Prell 1984; Kutzbach and Street-Perrott 1985; Prell and Kutzbach 1987; COHMAP 1988; Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990; Clemens and Prell 1990; Prell and Kutzbach 1992; Winkler and Wang 1993). Second, changes in glacial boundary conditions [ice volume, sea surface temperature (SST), albedo, and atmospheric trace-gas concentrations] have been cited as mechanisms that can alter the way in which the monsoon can respond to astronomical forcing (Duplessy 1982; Manabe and Broccoli 1985; Prell and Van Campo 1986; Prell and Kutzbach 1987; Overpeck et al. 1989; Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990; Gasse et al. 1991; Prell and Kutzbach 1992; Anderson and Prell 1993; Sirocko et al. 1993; deMenocal and Rind 1993).

Recently, the results of Clemens and co-workers (Clemens and Prell 1990, 1991; Clemens et al. 1991) have sparked an important controversy regarding the forcing of millennial-scale changes in monsoon strength. Based on the frequency-domain analysis of new 350-ky marine sediment records from two sites (the Owen Ridge, 300 km off the coast of Oman, and the southwestern Indian Ocean), they have argued that, while precession-forced insolation changes are the major pacemaker of monsoon strength, glacial boundary conditions have played only a minor role in determining the timing and strength of the Arabian Sea monsoon (Clemens and Prell 1991). More recently, several authors (Gasse et al. 1991; Prell and Kutzbach 1992; Anderson and Prell 1993; Sirocko et al. 1993; Van Campo and Gasse 1993) have confirmed that it is still important to recognize the central role of glacial boundary conditions in modifying the response of the monsoon to astronomical forcing. A purpose of our paper is to synthesize new well-dated 18-ky paleoclimatic time series from three monsoon-sensitive Arabian Sea sediment cores, along with available terrestrial data and model results, to produce a better understanding of how monsoon intensity was forced over the last precession cycle.

Recent results from ice-core and marine sediment records in the Greenland-North Atlantic region have
highlighted the capability of the climate system to shift abruptly between different climate states (Broecker and Denton 1989; Lehman and Keigwin 1992). Although much evidence points to salinity-driven changes in ocean thermohaline circulation as the primary forcing mechanism behind these abrupt glacial and deglacial changes (Manabe and Stouffer 1988; Stocker and Wright 1991; Paillard and Labeyrie 1994), synchronous abrupt climatic changes far from northern North Atlantic may point to alternative causal mechanisms. Our new data, analyses and model experiments, however, emphasize how abrupt changes in the North Atlantic may be invoked to explain abrupt changes at low latitudes and far from the North Atlantic.

Growing attention has also focused on the abrupt changes in monsoon strength that apparently took place during the Holocene, in the absence of significant changes in glacial boundary conditions (Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990; Gasse and Van Campo 1994). This is important to debates over how monsoon intensity will change in the future, because climate model results suggest that the future will be characterized by an enhanced monsoon (Houghton et al. 1992; Meehl and Washington 1993), just as the early to mid-Holocene was. Our new data support the existence of major century-scale changes in monsoon strength during the Holocene, but also points to the lack of a plausible theory to explain these changes. Additional data will be needed to define the exact spatio-temporal aspects of abrupt interglacial “warm-climate” climatic events, and to understand the processes that give rise to them.

New high-resolution records of monsoon variability

Marine sediments from the Oman margin of the Arabian Sea (Fig. 1) provide one of the best opportunities to study past variations in Indian Ocean monsoon variability because the sediments accumulate rapidly (>10 cm/ky), can be well dated and contain multiple proxy records of past monsoon variation. In this paper, we present new data from three cores collected approximately 150 km offshore Oman (RC27-14: 18.25°N, 57.66°E, 590 m water depth; RC27-23: 18.00°N, 57.59°E, 815 m; and RC27-28: 17.90°N, 57.59°E, 866 m; Fig. 1, Table 1). Each of the cores, selected from a suite of 26 collected during cruise RC2704, is characterized by homogenous green to olive green foraminifer-nannofossil oozes with CaCO3 contents varying between 30–60%. We placed our records in a chronostratigraphic framework using δ18O measurements and 35 AMS radiocarbon measurements on single species (<150 m size fraction) samples of planktonic foraminifera (Fig. 2). All of the AMS measurements were made at the Institut für Mittelenergiephysik, Zurich and corrected by 400 year to account for the difference in radiocarbon content between surface waters and the atmosphere (Broecker et al. 1988). Only minor age differences were found between dates on each of seven pairs of coexisting species. With the exception of the lowest (below 270 cm) section of RC27-23, and a possible core hiatus near 145 cm in RC27-28, the core stratigraphies appear continuous and reliable. More complete descriptions and analyses of the cores will be published elsewhere.

Following the successful past use of foraminifera and pollen proxies for reconstructing paleomonsoon variability (Prell 1984; Prell et al. 1990; Van Campo et al. 1982; Prell and Van Campo 1986), we used these two independent proxies and standard methods (Prell 1984; Van Campo et al. 1982) to produce a multi-core multi-proxy record of monsoon variability spanning the past 20000 year. Pollen counts were only made for sections of cores with well-preserved pollen, and palynomorph identifications were made with the help of
Fig. 2a–c. New paleoclimatic records from three Oman margin sediment cores. a RC27-23, b RC27-28, c RC27-14. In each case, oxygen isotope, percent G. bulloides, and percent pollen data are plotted where available. AMS radiocarbon dates are on single or paired single-species samples of planktonic foraminifera (G.b., Globigerina bulloides; N.d., Neogloboquadrina dutertrei). The SW monsoon pollen index was defined previously (Prell and Kutzbach 1987), and the NE monsoon pollen index is defined as the percentage of pollen indicative of Asian steppe in each sample (Table 2; Van Campo et al. 1982). Pollen data were only generated for core sections that had abundant and well-represented fossil pollen, and are presented as a percentage of all fossil pollen found in a given sample. The lower two arrows in each plot mark the timing at which the SW monsoon increased in strength, whereas the upper arrow marks the approximate time the monsoon began to weaken from early Holocene maximum levels.

the extensive pollen reference collection at the Laboratoire de Palynologie, Montpellier, France. Pioneering work with modern air sampling and sediments has illustrated the power of reconstructing monsoon variations using fossil pollen (Van Campo et al. 1982; Prell and Van Campo 1986; Prell and Kutzbach 1987). During the modern SW monsoon season (summer) and past periods of stronger SW monsoon flow, more poll-
The broad-scale patterns of change recorded in our new high-resolution records of monsoon variability confirm earlier studies of the low-frequency pattern of monsoonal change over the last 20000 year (Fig. 2; Duplessy 1982; Prell 1984; Van Campo et al. 1982; Prell and Van Campo 1986; Sirocko et al. 1991). Abundances of upwelling (monsoon) foraminifera G. bulloides are lowest during glacial times, highest during the early-middle Holocene, and then drop off again. This pattern of variation is also supported by our pollen data. Monsoon taxa go from low to high abundances over the last deglaciation, mirrored by decreases in the abundances of pollen indicative of a stronger NE flow from Asia (Fig. 2).

Our new data provide the first available AMS-dated marine pollen and foraminifera records for the fine-scale direct assessment of monsoonal change over the last deglaciation. These records (Fig. 2) confirm the heterogeneous nature of paleo-upwelling records and the corresponding need for more than one sediment core when trying to reconstruct the long-term variation in upwelling, and hence surface wind-stress (Peterson et al. 1991). Our data also confirm that $\delta^{18}O$ variations are not a reliable proxy of past monsoon-driven upwelling variations, because they can be influenced, to a varying degree, by changes in global ice volume and variations in regional river discharge. Comparison between our core data, and those of Sirocko et al. (1993), indicate that major shifts in the SW Indian Monsoon can only be inferred reliably when coincident shifts in both G. bulloides and the monsoon pollen indices are observed.

Taken together, the three new records suggest four key points regarding monsoon evolution over the last 20000 years. First, the monsoon did not increase monotonically and gradually in response to astronomical forcing over the last deglaciation. Instead, the monsoon appears to have increased in strength abruptly in two steps. The exact timing of these increases are difficult to determine, even with our well-dated records, but they appear to be coincident with the two periods of abrupt $\delta^{18}O$ change at about 13 to 12.5 ka (Termination Ia, Duplessy et al. 1981) and between 10 and 9.5 ka (Termination Ib). Second, the monsoon appears to have peaked in strength between 9.5 and 5.5 ka, with the maxima in monsoon pollen probably being the most reliable indicator of peak monsoon conditions because G. bulloides percentages appear to saturate above 35–40% (Anderson and Prell 1993). Third, our new high-resolution records confirm that the period of strong monsoon strength (9.5 to 5.5 ka) may have been punctuated by centuries-long periods of weaker monsoon circulation. Finally, our records suggest a close correspondence between the records of monsoon in the Arabian Sea and those from terrestrial sites in the adjacent areas of Africa and Asia. This close correspondence confirms that records from the Oman margin should be useful in reconstructing paleomonsoon variations over much of the late Quaternary (Anderson and Prell 1993).


eum typical of East African humid tropical vegetation typify shipboard air filters and sediment samples. In contrast, periods of weaker SW monsoon flow are characterized by larger proportions of pollen typical of the Asian steppe to north of the Arabian Sea. We follow the well-established convention (Van Campo et al. 1982; Prell and Van Campo 1986; Kutzbach and Prell 1987) of presenting the pollen data as two indices that discriminate between past strong southwest (SW monsoon pollen index) and northeast (NE monsoon pollen index) flow (Table 2, Fig. 2).

Table 2. List of pollen taxa in the two monsoon pollen indices

| SW Monsoon pollen index | NE Monsoon pollen index |
|-------------------------|-------------------------|
| Avicennia                | Artemisia               |
| Combretaceae            | Calligonum              |
| Connauphora             | Centaurea               |
| Cyperaceae              | Compositae lig          |
| Indigofera              | Ephedra                 |
| Kohautia                | Erodium                 |
| Mallotus                | Omelbeliferae           |
| Olea                    | Plantago                |
| Phyllantus              | Podocarbus              |
| Rhizophoraceae          |                           |
| Sapotaceae-Meliaceae spores |                 |

Following the convention of Van Campo et al. (1982), Prell and Van Campo (1986) and Prell and Kutzbach (1987). Data are presented (Fig. 2) as percentages of all fossil pollen found in a given sample.
en data support a rapid increase in monsoon strength, from weak glacial levels to peak early-Holocene levels, on isotope termination I (Van Campo et al. 1982). Van Campo et al. (1982) also make the observation that centuries-long periods of weakened monsoon strength can be resolved within the hypothesized period of strong monsoonal circulation. None of the previously published marine records of monsoon variation contain a clear picture of change for the period since the early Holocene.

The best-dated previously published marine record of SW Indian monsoon dynamics is one based primarily on a deep water (3212 m) sediment core collected significantly seaward of our cores (Sirocko et al. 1993). Based on an interpretation of oxygen isotopic, dolomite and carbonate variations, Sirocko et al. (1993) suggested that the monsoon increased episodically in a series of four steps between 14.3 and 8.7 ka. Comparison between this data and that presented in this paper, however, indicates that a number of observed abrupt events in each of the marine cores are local in nature and probably not related to changes in the strength of the SW monsoon. Instead, it appears that an abrupt increase in monsoon intensity affected all four of the AMS-dated cores between 15 and 12.5 ka, and then between 10 and 9.5 ka (Sirocko et al. 1993). The entire suite of cores also supports the interpretation that the monsoon was strongest between 9.5 and 5.5 ka (Sirocko et al. 1993).

Terrestrial records of paleomonsoon variability from the African and Asian regions around the Arabian Sea, although not always continuous and well-dated, are sufficient for comparison to the marine record of change in both radiocarbon ka (Figs 1 and 3; Table 2) and in corrected calendar ka (Bard et al. 1990) (Fig. 4, corrected for direct comparison with hypothesized insolation forcing). Consistent with the marine record, the terrestrial records support the concept of a two step increase in monsoon strength during the last deglaciation, and peak monsoon strength in the early to middle Holocene. Almost all of the region surrounding the Arabian Sea was apparently driest just before approximately 13 to 12.5 ka (Fig. 3). Not all records resolve a two-step increase, but those that do suggest that the first increase in monsoon strength occurred at approximately 13 to 12.5 ka (Fig. 4), and the second between 10 and 9 ka. Peak wetness at these sites, scattered from Tibet down through Arabia and East Africa, generally occurred between 10 and 5 ka (about 11.5 and 5.0 calendar ka, Bard et al. 1990), with the end apparently more gradual than the beginning (Fig. 4). Many of the terrestrial records also show evidence of centuries long drier events within the period 13 to 4 ka (Bryson 1989; Gillespie et al. 1983; Street-Perrot and Roberts 1983; Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990; Van Campo and Gasse 1993; An et al. 1993; Roberts et al. 1993, Gasse and Van Campo 1994), quite plausibly corresponding to those suggested by existing and new marine paleomonsoon records (Fig. 2; Van Campo et al. 1982).

Climate forcing and abrupt climatic change

Our new time series of monsoon variation over the past 20 ky, when coupled with existing marine and terrestrial data, suggest a clear pattern of change. Climatic change over the African and Asia regions now influenced by the SW Indian Ocean monsoon appear to have been dominated by this monsoon system over the past 20 ky and probably the entire late Quaternary (Anderson and Prell 1993; Prell and Kutzbach 1992). We confirm that the SW Indian Ocean monsoon was weak until approximately 13 to 12.5 ka, at this time the monsoon strengthened abruptly, increasing rates of coastal upwelling, pollen transport from the SW, and
Overpeck et al.: SW Indian Monsoon over 18000 years

Fig. 4a–c. Summary figure illustrating the hypothesized insolation forcing and the lagged response of the southwest Indian monsoon. In order to compare time series of insolation forcing and monsoon response, all radiocarbon ages in this figure were converted to calendar using the U/Th age calibration of Bard et al. (1992).

a June and July insolation for 40°N (Berger and Loutre 1991),
b RC27-23 G. bulloides abundance, and c histograms of the events mapped in Fig. 3, including the timing of the first abrupt increase in monsoon strength (mean, 14.5 calendar ka), the timing of the second abrupt change (mean, 11.4 calendar ka), and the date at which the period of maximum monsoon strength apparently ended at each site (mean, 5.5 calendar ka). Note that the period of maximum monsoon strength (11 to 5 calendar ka) lags peak insolation (14 to 8 calendar ka). See Figs. 2 and 3 for the timing of events in radiocarbon ka

Maximum monsoon strength and North Atlantic warmth were thus coincident with each other between 9.5 and 5.5 ka, lagging significantly the period of maximum summer insolation. Furthermore, peak monsoon strength and North Atlantic warmth began abruptly at 9.5 ka, and waned more gradually after 5.5 ka. We hypothesize that monsoon strength increased non-linearly to insolational forcing until the influence of glacial boundary conditions, primarily cold North Atlantic SSTs and European ice sheets, abruptly declined between 10.0 and 9.5 ka. After 5.5 ka, the monsoon weakened more gradually in concert with slowly decreasing summer insolation.

Physical climatology and climate model experiments provide an idea of how the observed changes in monsoon strength may have been linked to abrupt changes in the North Atlantic and European regions. Abrupt warming in the North Atlantic at 13 to 12.5 ka may have led to slightly greater warming over the Tibetan Plateau in spring and summer, a response supported by climate model experiments (Rind et al. 1986). This warming may have been sufficient to reduce Tibetan Plateau snow cover in spring and early summer, and hence (via influences on albedo and soil hydrology) to permit the development of a warmer Tibetan Plateau and an earlier and stronger monsoon (Duplessy 1982; Dickson 1984; Barnett et al. 1989; Sirocko et al. 1991). An abrupt increase in atmospheric CO₂ and CH₄ concentrations at the same time (Barnola et al. 1987; Chappellaz et al. 1990; White et al. 1994) may have also acted in summer to warm the Tibetan Plateau more than the ocean, and thus drive a stronger mon-
soon (Prell and Kutzbach 1992; Meehl and Washington 1993). This change may have, in turn, triggered land cover (i.e., vegetation) changes that also contributed, via positive feedbacks, to a stronger monsoon (Street-Perrott et al. 1990; Overpeck 1993; Gasse and Van Campo 1994).

We recently performed two additional climate model sensitivity experiments to investigate how abrupt change in the North Atlantic-European region might have affected the strength of the SW Indian Monsoon. Following the experimental strategy of Rind et al. (1986; see also Overpeck et al. 1989), the two experiments, carried out with the Goddard Institute for Space Studies (GISS) Model II general circulation model (Hansen et al. 1983). The model simulates the full seasonal cycle, solving the equations for conservation of mass, energy, momentum, and moisture, and calculates the radiative fluxes, cloud cover, surface fluxes, etc. (Rind et al. 1986). It has realistic topography at an 8° × 10° (latitude by longitude) horizontal resolution with fractional grid representation for land and ocean. Ground temperature calculations include the diurnal variation and seasonal heat storage, while ground hydrological parameters are a function of vegetation type. Hansen et al. (1983) has shown that the model produces realistic temperature fields when modern sea surface temperatures (SSTs) are prescribed. Our two new experiments were identical except for two important differences (Table 3; Fig. 5). Both experiments were run for five years with the same 11 ka insolation, as well as prescribed SSTs and ice-sheet configurations that were identical except in the North Atlantic-European region. In this region, one experiment (WARM) was prescribed to have modern SST’s and no Scandinavian Ice Sheet, whereas the other experiment (COLD) was set to have glacial (Younger Dryas) SSTs down to about 40°N, as well as a Scandinavian ice sheet with approximately 11 ka height and extent (Fig. 5; Rind et al. 1986). We used 11 ka boundary conditions to be comparable to previous model results (where only SSTs were changes), and because it would not decrease the applicability of the climate model sensitivity experiments to the 10 to 9.5 ka event (Rind et al. 1986; Overpeck et al. 1989).

The two climate model simulations were run to approximate the abrupt change that apparently took place in the North Atlantic-European region between 10 and 9.5 ka. Given the observation that early Holocene high-latitude North Atlantic temperatures were warmer than present, and that the Scandinavian Ice Sheet disappeared significantly before the Laurentide
Simulated spring and summer anomalies between climate experiment WARM minus experiment COLD. These anomalies illustrate the type of changes that would have been induced by an abrupt warming of the North Atlantic region, coupled with a rapid disappearance of the Scandinavian Ice Sheet. These abrupt changes resulted in a significant warming and a decrease in snow cover on the Tibetan Plateau during spring, as well as significant summer snow cover reduction and warming. These changes would have led to an earlier and stronger SW Indian monsoon circulation.

Ice Sheet (Birks 1991; Svendsen and Mangerud 1992), it is likely that our prescribed North Atlantic SST increases (i.e., the difference between SSTs in the COLD and WARM experiments) were an underestimate of the warming that actually took place between 10 and 9.5 ka. Comparison between the two climate model simulations (WARM-COLD) suggests the type of climatic change that may have taken place over the Tibetan Plateau in response to the abrupt changes in SST and ice-sheet height/extent upstream and to the west.
Whereas earlier 11 ka model results (Rind et al. 1986) suggest that the SST changes alone were not enough to drive a shift in monsoon strength, our new results (Fig. 6) indicate that these abrupt North Atlantic-European changes together may have been sufficient to significantly warm the Tibetan Plateau in all seasons (only spring and summer are plotted), and to cause an earlier melting of snow cover in spring. This reduction in spring snow cover, coupled with greater warming of the Plateau in summer (Fig. 6) would have led to an abruptly stronger monsoon circulation, with a resulting increase in available moisture over much of the area affected by this monsoon.

Our summary of the available data (Figs. 3 and 4) suggests that, whereas the deglacial intensification of the monsoon was probably concentrated in two abrupt events, the weakening of the monsoon during the middle to late-Holocene was apparently more gradual, and less concentrated into any single event. This assertion makes sense in light of the fact that the influence of glacial boundary conditions on the Tibetan Plateau disappeared after the early Holocene, allowing the strength of Plateau heating to be more directly linked to Milankovich-driven insolation forcing. As summertime Northern Hemisphere insolation waned after the early Holocene, the monsoon gradually weakened in strength.

Despite the assertion made above, many sites around the monsoon region (Fig. 1) apparently did experience a sharp reduction in effective moisture between 7 and 3 ka. It is possible that these changes were influenced by forcing other than Milankovitch alone. In addition, many sites throughout the region, including those represented by our new Arabian Sea data, support the existence of significant century-scale monsoon weakening events during the early to middle Holocene (Van Campo et al. 1982; Bryson 1989; Gillespie et al. 1983; Street-Perrott and Roberts 1983; Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990; Van Campo and Gasse 1993; An et al. 1993; Gasse and Van Campo 1994). Separate climate model results suggest that possible thermohaline-driven changes in North Atlantic sea-surface temperatures during the Holocene were probably not sufficient to affect the Tibetan Plateau (Rind and Overpeck 1993). In contrast, if recent assertions that solar irradiances may have varied by as much as 25% during the Holocene are correct (Lean et al. 1992; Lean and Oglesby 1992), then it is quite plausible that the Tibetan Plateau may have warmed abruptly, using terrestrial evidence from the Tibetan Plateau. Available data suggest that the Tibetan Plateau may have warmed abruptly at the same times that the monsoon increased in strength, particularly between 10 and 9.5 ka, and that these abrupt changes were coincident with rapid decreases in snow and glacier coverage (Wang and Fan 1987; Fang 1991; Gasse et al. 1991; Jarvis 1993; Porter et al. 1992; An et al. 1993; Gasse and Van Campo 1994). However, more well-dated paleoclimatic records from the Tibetan Plateau are needed to fully test our hypothesis.

Large abrupt changes appear to have taken place throughout the climate system over the last deglaciation, and the southwest Indian monsoon is no exception. Our results illustrate a mechanism by which abrupt change in the North Atlantic region may have driven abrupt change a quarter of the way around the globe, and at low, even southern latitudes. Climate model experiments seem to confirm that deglacial climate change over NW Africa may have also been linked to the same high-latitude abrupt change (Fig. 6; Overpeck et al. 1989; Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990; Lamb et al. 1995). Our new Arabian Sea data support the previous finding that major century-scale changes in monsoon strength were common during the present interglacial (Bryson 1989; Gillespie et al. 1983; Street-Perrott and Roberts 1983; Street-Perrott and Perrott 1990; Van Campo and Gasse 1993; An et al. 1993; Gasse and Van Campo 1994). Multiple well-dated records of past monsoon change are needed to define the exact nature and timing of these century-scale events, an exercise that may be crucial to understand how the

Conclusions

The comparison of our new Arabian Sea time series with terrestrial records of monsoon change over Africa and Asia supports the idea that the southwest Indian monsoon did not respond linearly to insolation forcing over much of the past 20 ka. Instead, reductions of glacial climate boundary conditions at 13 to 12.5 ka and 10 to 9.5 ka (about 15.3 to 14.7 and 11.5 to 10.8 calendar ka, Bard et al. 1990) may have acted as triggers in permitting the Tibetan Plateau to warm strongly in the summer and generating the pressure gradient needed for a strong southwest Indian monsoon. After the early Holocene and disappearance of glacial boundary conditions, millennial-scale variations in the SW monsoon appear to have been linked more linearly to insolation-driven forcing, particularly as the monsoon weakened gradually after 5 ka. Although abrupt changes in North Atlantic SST, northern European ice cover, and atmospheric trace-gases are coincident with the two abrupt increases in monsoon strength, it is also plausible that abrupt changes in Southern Hemisphere trade winds may have affected deglacial monsoon strength (Clemens and Prell 1990, 1991; Clemens et al. 1991; Clemens and Oglesby 1992). Whereas the trade wind hypothesis may be difficult to test due to the lack of sufficiently high-resolution southern Indian Ocean sediment cores, it should be possible to determine if and when the Tibetan Plateau warmed abruptly, using terrestrial evidence from the Tibetan Plateau. Available data suggest that the Tibetan Plateau may have warmed abruptly at the same times that the monsoon increased in strength, particularly between 10 and 9.5 ka, and that these abrupt changes were coincident with rapid decreases in snow and glacier coverage (Wang and Fan 1987; Fang 1991; Gasse et al. 1991; Jarvis 1993; Porter et al. 1992; An et al. 1993; Gasse and Van Campo 1994). However, more well-dated paleoclimatic records from the Tibetan Plateau are needed to fully test our hypothesis.
monsoon may change in the future (Broecker 1987). This is particularly true since the past abrupt events occurred when Northern Hemisphere summers were significantly warmer than present (COHMAP members 1988), just as future summers may be warmer than present in a greenhouse-warmed world (Houghton et al. 1992).

Acknowledgements. We thank W. Wolff, S. Ivy, M. Klas for their help with radiocarbon dating, E. Van Campo, D. Duzer, M. Van Campo for help with pollen identification and many useful discussions. We also thank K-B. Liu and D. Jarvis for discussion of Asian climate and vegetation change, R. Healy and D. Rind for help with the climate model experiments, and J. Cole, F. Sirocko, R. Webb and an anonymous reviewer for critical comments on the manuscript. This work was supported by the Climate Dynamics Program of the National Science Foundation, the NOAA Paleoclimatology Program, and a French C.N.R.S. Laboratory Travel Award to JTO.

References

Adamson DA, Gasse F, Street FA, Williams MAJ (1980) Late Quaternary history of the Nile. Nature 287:50–55
An Z, Porter SC, Weijian Z, Jianzhang R, Hongbo Z (1993) Episode of strengthened summer monsoon climate of Younger Dryas Age on the loess plateau of Central China. Quat Res 39:45–54
Anderson DM (1993) A 300 KYR record of upwelling off Oman during the Late Quaternary: evidence of the Asian Southwest Monsoon. Paleoclimatology 8,(2) 193–208
Anderson DM, Prell WL (1992) The structure of the southwest monsoon winds over the Arabian Sea during the Late Quaternary: observations, simulations, and marine geology evidence. J Geophys Res 97:15481–15487
Anderson DM, Prell WL (1993) A 300 Ky record of upwelling off Oman during the late Quaternary: evidence of the Asian Southwest Monsoon. Paleoclimatology 8,(2) 193–208
Anderson DM, Brock JC, Prell WL (1992) Physical upwelling processes, upper ocean environment and the sediment record of the southwest monsoon. Geol Soc Spec Publ 64:121–129
Atkinson TC, Briffa KR, Coope GR (1987) Seasonal temperatures in Britain during the past 22000 years, reconstructed using beetle remains. Nature 328:587–592
Bard E, Arnold M, Maurice P, Duprat J, Moyes J, Duplessy JC (1987) Retreat velocity of the North Atlantic polar front during the last deglaciation determined by C14 accelerator mass spectrometry. Nature 328:791–794
Bard E, Hamelin B, Fairbanks RG, Zindler A (1990) Calibration of the 14C timescale over the past 30000 years using mass spectrometric U-Th ages from Barbados corals. Nature 345:6274:405–410
Barnett TP, Domienl L, Schlese U, Roeckner E (1988) The effect of Eurasian snow cover on global climate. Science 239:504–507
Barnett TP, Domienl L, Schlese U, Roeckner E, Latif M (1989) The effect of Eurasian snow cover on regional and global climate variations. J Atmos Sci 46,(5) 661–684
Barnola JM, Raynaud D, Korotkevich YS, Lorius C (1987) Vostok ice core provides 160000-year record of atmospheric CO2. Nature 329:408–414
Bangerger A, Loutre MF (1991) Insolation values for the climate of the last 10 million years. Quat Sci Rev 10:297–317
Birks HH (1991) Holocene vegetational history and climatic change in west Spitsbergen – plant macrofossils from Skarftjorn, an Arctic lake. The Holocene 1:209–218
Bonnefille R, Riollet G, Buchet G (1991) Nouvelle Sequence pollinique d’une tourbiere de la crete Zaire-Nil (Burundi). Rev Paleobot Palynol 67:315–330
Broecker WS (1987) Unpleasant surprises in the greenhouse? Nature 328:123–126
Broecker WS, Andree M, Wolff W, Oeschger H, Bonani G, Kennett J, Petet D (1988) The chronology of the last deglaciation: implications to the cause of the Younger Dryas event. Paleoecology 3:1–19
Broecker WS, Denton GH (1989) The role of ocean-atmosphere reorganizations in glacial cycles. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 53:2465–2501
Bryan RA (1989) Modelling the NW India monsoon for the last 40000 years. Clim Dyn 3:169–177
Bryan RA, Swain AM (1981) Holocene variations of monsoon rainfall in Rajasthan. Quat Res 16:135–145
Chappellaz J, Barnola JM, Raynaud D, Korotkevich YS, Lorius C (1990) Ice-core record of atmospheric methane over the past 160000 years. Nature 345:(6271) 127–131
Clark ID, Fontes J (1990) Paleoclimatic reconstruction in northern Oman based on carbonates from hyperalkaline groundwaters. Quat Res 33:320–336
Clemens SC, Prell WL (1990) Late Pleistocene variability of Arabian Sea summer monsoon winds and continental aridity: eolian records from the lithogenic component of deep-sea sediments. Paleoclimatology 5:(2) 109–145
Clemens SC, Prell WL (1991) Late Quaternary forcing of Indian Ocean summer-monsoon winds: A comparison of fourier model and general circulation model results. J Geophys Res 96:(D12) 22683–22700
Clemens SC, Oglesby RJ (1990) Interhemispheric moisture transport in the Indian Ocean summer monsoon: data-model and model-model comparisons. Paleoecology 7:(5) 633–643
Clemens S, Prell W, Murray D, Shimmield G, Weedon G (1991) Forcing mechanisms of the Indian Ocean monsoon. Nature 353:720–725
COHMAP Members (1988) Climatic changes of the last 18000 years: observations and model simulations. Science 241:1043–1052
CLIMAP Project Members (1981) Seasonal reconstruction of the Earth’s surface at the last glacial maximum. Geol Soc Am Map Chart Ser MC-36
deMenocal PB, Rind D (1993) Sensitivity of Asian and African climate to variations in seasonal insolation, glacial ice cover, sea surface temperature, and Asian orography. J Geophys Res 98:7265–7288
Denton G, Hughes T (eds) (1981) The last great ice sheets. Wiley, New York
Dickson RR (1984) Eurasian snow cover versus Indian monsoon rainfall – An extension of the Hahn-Shukla results. J Clim Appl Meteorol 23:171–173
Duplessy JC (1982) Glacial to interglacial contrasts in the northern Indian Ocean. Nature 295:494–498
Duplessy JC, Delibrias G, Turon JL, Pujol C, Duprat J (1981) Forcing mechanisms of the Indian Ocean summer-monsoon winds: A comparison of fourier model and general circulation model results. Paleoecology 7: (5) 633–643
Duplessy J, Delibrias G, Turon JL, Pujol C, Duprat J (1981) Deglacial warming of the northeastern Atlantic Ocean: correlation with the paleoclimatic evolution of the European continent. Palaeogeogr Palaeoclim Palaeoecol 35:121–144
Fang J (1991) Lake evolution during the past 30000 years in China, and its implications for environmental change. Quat Res 36:37–60
Fein JS, Stephens PL (eds) (1987) Monsoons. John Wiley, New York
Gasse F, Street FA (1978) Late Quaternary lake-level fluctuations and environments of the northern Rift Valley and Afar region (Ethiopia and Djibouti). Palaeogeogr Palaeoclim Palaeoecol 24:279–325
Gasse F, Van Campo E (1994) Abrupt post-glacial climate events in West Asia and North Africa monsoon domains. Earth Planet Sci Lett 126:435–456
Gasse F, Ledee V, Massault M, Fontes J (1989) Water-level fluctuations of Lake Tanganyika in phase with oceanic changes during the last glaciation and deglaciation. Nature 342: 6245–6249.

Gasse F, 12 others (1991) A 13000-year climate record from western Tibet. Nature 353: 742–745.

Gillespie R, Street-Perrott FA, Switsur R (1983) Post-glacial arid episodes in Ethiopia have implications for climate prediction. Nature 306: 680–683.

Habayen KA (1987) Fossil diatoms and the paleoecology of Lake Rukwa, Tanzania. Freshwater Biol 17: 429–436.

Habayen KA, Hecky RE (1987) The late Pleistocene and Holocene stratigraphy and paleoecology of Lakes Kivu and Tanganyika. Palaeogeogr Palaeoclim Palaeoecol 61: 169–197.

Hansen J, Russell G, Rind D, Stone P, Lacs A, Ledeff S, Ready R, Travis L (1983) Efficient three-dimensional global models for climate studies: Models I and II. Mon Weather Rev 111: 669–662.

Hastenrath S (1991) Climate dynamics of the Tropics. Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht.

Houghton JT, Callander BA, Varney SK (1992) Climate Change 1992: The Supplementary Report to the IPCC Scientific Assessment. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK.

Jarus DI (1981) Pollen evidence of changing Holocene monsoon in Sichuan Province, China. Quat Res 39: 325–337.

Karpuz NK, Jansen E (1991) Wadi Howar: paleoclimatic evidence from an extinct river system in the southeastern Sahara. Science 237: 298–300.

Kroç N, Jansen E, Halldidason H (1993) Paleoceanographic reconstructions of surface ocean conditions in the Greenland, Iceland and Norwegian Seas through the last 14 ka based on diatoms. Quat Sci Rev 12: 115–140.

Krooplin S, Soulie-Marsche I (1991) Charophyte remains from Wadi Hower as evidence for deep Mid-Holocene freshwater lakes in the Eastern Sahara of Northwest Sudan. Quat Res 36: 210–223.

Kutzbach JE (1981) Monsoon climate of the early Holocene, climatic experiment using the earth’s orbital parameters for 9000 years ago. Science 214: 59–61.

Kutzbach JE (1987) The changing pulse of the Monsoon. In: Fein JS, Stephens PL (eds) Monsoon 247–268. John Wiley, New York.

Kutzbach JE, Street-Perrott FA (1985) Milankovitch forcing of fluctuations in the level of tropical lakes from 18 to 0 kyr BP. Nature 317: 130–134.

Lamb HF, Gasse F, Benkaadour A, El Hamouti N, van der Kaars S, Perkins WT, Pearce NJ, Roberts CN (1995) Relation between century-scale Holocene arid intervals in tropical and temperate zones. Nature 373: 134–137.

Lean J, Rind D (1994) Solar variability: Implications for global change. EOS Trans Am Geophys Union 75: 5–7.

Lean J, Skumanich A, White O (1992) Estimating the Sun’s radiative output during the Maunder Minimum. Geophys Res Lett 19: 1591–1594.

Lehman SJ, Forman SL (1992) Late Weichselian glacier retreat in Kongsfjorden, West Spitsbergen, Svalbard. Quat Res 37: 139–154.

Lehman SJ, Keigwin LD (1992) Sudden changes in North Atlantic circulation during the last deglaciation. Nature 366: 57–59.

Manabe S, Broccoli AJ (1985) The influence of continental ice sheets on the climate of an ice age. J Geophys Res 90: 2167–2190.

Manabe S, Stouffer RJ (1988) Two stable equilibria of a coupled ocean-atmosphere model. J Clim 1: 841–866.

McCulre HA (1976) Radiocarbon chronology of late Quaternary lakes in the Arabian Desert. Nature 263: 755–756.

Mechl GA (1994) Influence of the land surface in the Asian summer monsoon: external conditions versus internal feedbacks. J Clim 7: 1033–1049.

McClure HA (1993) South Asian summer monsoon variability in a model with doubled atmospheric carbon dioxide concentrations. Science 260: 1101–1105.

Overpeck JT (1991) Century-to-millenium-scale climatic variability during the late Quaternary. In: Global changes of the past. Bradley R (ed) UCAR/Office for Interdisciplinary Earth Studies, Boulder, CO, pp 139–173.

Overpeck JT (1993) The role and response of continental vegetation in the global climate system. In: Global changes in the perspective of the past. Eddy JA, Oeschger H (eds), J. Wiley, New York, pp 221–238.

Overpeck JT, Peterson LC, Kipp N, Imbrie J, Rind D (1989) Climatic change in the circumpolar region during the last deglaciation. Nature 338: 553–557.

Owen RB, Barthelme JW, Renaut RW, Vincens A (1982) Paleoclimatology and archaeology of Holocene deposits north-east of Lake Turkana, Kenya. Nature 298: 525–529.

Pachur H, Krooplin S (1987) Wadi Hower: paleoclimatic evidence from an extinct river system in the southeastern Sahara. Science 237: 298–300.

Pachur H, Hoelzmann P (1991) Paleoecological implications of late Quaternary lacustrine sediments in western Nubia, Sudan. Quat Res 36: 257–276.

Palland D, Labyrie L (1994) Role of the thermohaline circulation in the abrupt warming after Heinrich events. Nature 372: 162–164.

Peterson LC, Overpeck JT, Kipp NG, Imbrie J (1991) A high resolution late Quaternary upwelling record from the anoxic Cariaco Basin, Venezuela. Paleoceanography 6: 99–119.

Porter SC, An Z, Zheng H (1992) Cyclic Quaternary alluviation and terracing in a nonglaciated drainage basin on the north flank of the Qinling Shan, central China. Quat Res 38: 157–169.

Prell WL (1984) Variations of monsoonal upwelling: a response to changing solar radiation. In: Hansen JE, Takahashi T (eds) Climate processes and Climate sensitivity. Geophysical Monograph 29.48-57. Washington, D.C.: American Geophysical Union.

Prell WL, Kutzbach JE (1987) Monsoon variability over the past 150 000 years. J Geophys Res 82: 8411–8425.

Prell WL, Kutzbach JE (1992) Sensitivity of the Indian monsoon to forcing parameters and implications for its evolution. Nature 360: 647–652.

Prell WL, Van Campo E (1986) Coherent response of Arabian Sea upwelling and pollen transport to late Quaternary monsoonal winds. Nature 323: 526–528.

Prell WL, Marvil RE, Luther ME (1990) Variability in upwelling fields in the northwestern Indian Ocean. Data-model comparison at 9000 B.P. Paleoceanography 5: (3) 447–457.

Rind D, Overpeck J (1993) Hypothesized causes of decade- to century-scale climate variability: climate model results. Quat Sci Rev 12: 357–374.

Rind D, Peteet D, Broecker WS, McIntyre A, Ruddiman WF (1986) Impact of cold North Atlantic sea surface temperatures on climate: implications for the Younger Dryas cooling (11-10k). Clim Dyn 1: 3–33.

Ritchie JC (1987) A Holocene pollen record from Bir Atrun, northwest Sudan. Pollen Spores 29: (4) 391–410.

Ritchie JC (1994) Holocene pollen spectra from Oyo, northwestern Sudan: problems of interpretation in a hyperarid environment. The Holocene 4: (1) 9–15.

Ritchie JC, Haynes CV (1987) Holocene vegetation zonation in the eastern Sahara. Nature 330: 645–647.

Ritchie JC, Eyles CH, Haynes CV (1985) Sediment and pollen evidence for an early to mid-Holocene humid period in the eastern Sahara. Nature 314: 352–355.

Roberts N, Taieb M, Barker P, Damiatl B, Icole M, Williamson D (1993) Timing of the Younger Dryas event in East Africa from lake-level changes. Nature 366: 146–148.
Overpeck et al.: SW Indian Monsoon over 18000 years

Ruddiman WF (1987) Northern oceans. In: Ruddiman WF, Wright HE. The geology of North America. K-3. The Geological Society of America, Boulder pp 137–154

Singh G, Wasson RJ, Agrawal DP (1990) Vegetational and seasonal climatic changes since the last full glacial in the Thar Desert, northwestern India. Rev Palaeobot Palynol 64:351–358

Sirocko F, Sarntrein M, Lange H, Erlenkeuser H (1991) Atmospheric summer circulation and coastal upwelling in the Arabian Sea during the Holocene and the last glaciation. Quat Res 36:72–93

Stager JC (1988) Environmental changes at Lake Cheshi, Zambia since 40000 Years BP. Quat Res 29:54–65

Stocker TF, Wright DG (1991) Rapid transitions of the ocean’s deep circulation induced by changes in surface water fluxes. Nature 351:729–732

Street-Perrott FA, Roberts N (1983) fluctuations in closed-basin lakes as an indicator of past atmospheric circulation patterns. In: Street-Perrott A, Beran M, Ratcliffe R (eds) Variations in the global water budget. D. Reidel, Dordrecht, 331–345

Stocker TF, Wright DG (1991) Rapid transitions of the ocean’s deep circulation induced by changes in surface water fluxes. Nature 351:729–732

Stocker TF, Wright DG (1991) Rapid transitions of the ocean’s deep circulation induced by changes in surface water fluxes. Nature 351:729–732

Van Campo E, Gasse F (1993) Pollen- and diatom-inferred climatic and hydrological changes in Sumxi Co Basin (western Tibet) since 13000 yr BP. Quat Res 39:300–313

Vincens A (1989) Paleoenvironnements du bassin nord-Tanganyika (Zaire, Burundi, Tanzanie) au cours des 13 derniers mille ans: apport de la palynologie. Rev Palaeobot Palynol 61:69–88

Vincens A (1991) Late Quaternary vegetation history of the South-Tanganyika Basin. Climate implications in South Central Africa. Palaeogeog Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol 86:207–226

Wang F, Fan CY (1987) Climatic changes in the Qinghai-Xizang (Tibetan) region of China during the Holocene. Quat Res 28:50–60

White JWC, Ciais P, Figge RA, Kenny R, Markgraf V (1994) A high-resolution record of atmospheric CO₂ content from carbon isotopes in peat. Nature 367:153–156

Winkler M, Wang PK (1993) The late-Quaternary vegetation and climate of China. In: Wright HE Jr, Kutzbach JE, Webb T III, Ruddiman WF, Street-Perrott FA, Bartlein PJ (eds) Global climate since the Last Glacial Maximum. University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis, pp 221–261

Zielinski GA, Mayewski PA, Meeker LD, Whitlow S, Twickler MS, Morrison M, Meese DA, Gow AJ, Alley RB (1994) Records of volcanism since 7000 B.C. from the GISP2 Greenland ice core and implications for the volcano-climate system. Science 264:948–952