Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
Risk of ischemic stroke in patients with COVID-19 infection: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Yanhua Cui\textsuperscript{a,b,c}, Bing Zhao\textsuperscript{d}, Tianbai Li\textsuperscript{a,b}, Zhaofei Yang\textsuperscript{a,b}, Song Li\textsuperscript{a,b}, Weidong Le\textsuperscript{a,b,e,*}

\textsuperscript{a} Center for Clinical Research on Neurological Diseases, The First Affiliated Hospital, Dalian Medical University, Dalian 116021, China
\textsuperscript{b} Liaoning Provincial Key Laboratory for Research on the Pathogenic Mechanisms of Neurological Diseases, The First Affiliated Hospital, Dalian Medical University, Dalian 116021, China
\textsuperscript{c} International Education College, Dalian Medical University, Dalian 116044, China
\textsuperscript{d} Department of Neurology, Qingdao Municipal Hospital, Qingdao University, Qingdao 266000, China
\textsuperscript{e} Institute of Neurology, Sichuan Academy of Medical Sciences & Sichuan Provincial People’s Hospital, School of Medicine, University of Electronic Science and Technology of China, Chengdu 610072, China

\section*{ARTICLE INFO}

\textbf{Keywords:}
Ischemic stroke
COVID-19
Risk
Meta-analysis
Systematic review

\section*{ABSTRACT}

An ongoing global pandemic, the coronavirus disease 2019 is posing threat to people all over the world. The association between COVID-19 and the risk of ischemic stroke remains unclear. This study systematically reviewed published studies and conducted meta-analysis to evaluate the association between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19. This study was conducted according to guidelines from the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses. The protocol used in this study had been registered in the International Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews. EMBASE, PubMed, Cochrane Library and Web of Science were searched from 1st December 2019–19th February 2021. This systematic review and meta-analysis analysed the combined effect estimations based on odds ratios (OR) with the random-effects model. Four studies were screened from 31,634 participants including 171 COVID-19 positive patients with ischemic stroke were included. The mean age of COVID-19 positive patients with ischemic stroke was 69.45 years (Range: 63–77 years) and the male patients were 56%. Countries covered by these articles were USA, Italy and France. Three of the articles were retrospective cohort studies and one was prospective cohort study. Our analysis revealed that the risk of ischemic stroke (combined OR: 2.41; 95\% CI: 1.08–5.38) was significantly increased. Four included studies were significantly heterogeneous ($I^2 = 75.2\%$, $P = 0.007$). Significant association between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19 was observed in the North America group (combined OR: 2.90; 95\% CI: 0.45–18.80, $I^2 = 89.60\%$, $P = 0.002$). This study found that the risk for ischemic stroke was increased in COVID-19 patients, especially in patients from North America. Further studies with larger sample sizes that include different ethnic populations are required to confirm our analysis.

\section*{1. Introduction}

A novel coronavirus, the severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) was first reported in Wuhan, China in December 2019 (Mao et al., 2020; Zhu et al., 2020). It is now well-known that SARS-CoV-2 can cause a series of acute respiratory syndromes including pneumonia and these syndromes are collectively termed coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) according to the World Health Organization. Although COVID-19 affects the respiratory system, it can also cause damage to other systems, such as the immune system and the nervous system (Siow et al., 2021). The COVID-19 has been associated with many neurological complications including strokes (Montalvan et al., 2020). Indeed, previous studies found that 78 of 214 COVID-19 patients from Wuhan, China experienced neurological complications (Mao et al., 2020; Wang et al., 2020). As the most serious form of neurological complications, strokes can be mainly categorized into hemorrhagic strokes and ischemic strokes (Nannoni et al., 2020). To the best of our knowledge, the association between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19 remains inconclusive. While studies pointed out that COVID-19 was a risk factor for the ischemic stroke (Bekelis et al., 2020; Perry et al., 2020), other studies suggested that COVID-19 posed an independent risk to the acute ischemic stroke (Bekelis et al., 2020; Perry et al., 2020).
Belani et al., 2020; Katz et al., 2020; Qureshi et al., 2021). To resolve this contradiction, we systematically reviewed published studies and conducted meta-analysis to evaluate the association between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19.

2. Methods

This study was conducted according to guidelines from the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) (Moher et al., 2009). The protocol used in this study had been registered in the International Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews (PROSPERO, CRD42021244691).

2.1. Search strategy

Databases used in this study included the EMBASE, PubMed, Cochrane Library and Web of Science. MeSH terms and search keywords used were: (COVID-19) OR (COVID 19) OR (COVID-19 Virus Disease) OR (COVID 19 Virus Disease) OR (COVID-19 Virus Diseases) OR (Disease, COVID-19 Virus) AND (Ischemic Stroke) OR (Ischemic Strokes) OR (Stroke, Ischemic) OR (Ischemic Stroke) OR (Ischemic Strokes) OR (Stroke, Ischemic) OR (Acute Ischemic Stroke) OR (Acute Ischemic Strokes) OR (Ischemic Stroke, Acute) OR (Stroke, Acute Ischemic)). Two authors Yanhua Cui (YHC) and Tianbai Li (TBL) screened all titles and abstracts independently. Any disagreements were discussed with a third evaluator Zhao-Fei Yang (ZFY) or resolved through consensus.

2.2. Eligibility criteria

Identified articles were further selected based on the following criteria: observational cohort studies, studies reporting on a minimum of ten patients aged \( \geq \) 18 years; the studies on COVID-19 patients with and ischemic stroke, studies published from 1st December 2019–19th February 2021.

2.3. Excluded criteria

We excluded all studies conducted on animals and reported only hemorrhagic stroke, cerebral venous thrombosis. Other exclusion criteria included publications on patient cohorts previously reported, non-English articles, full-texts unavailable, non-original research papers (systematic reviews, editorials commentaries, opinion papers, letters, protocols, reports, book chapters), non-clinical characteristics reported, as well as COVID-19 diagnosis but no reporting of ischemic stroke as a complication.

2.4. Data extraction

Two authors YHC and TBL independently extracted data from each study based on eligibility criteria and excluded criteria. Any disagreements between these two authors (YHC and TBL) were discussed with a third evaluator ZFY or by consensus. We extracted data about the name of authors, year, study design, country, continent, age, sex, sample size, the number of COVID-19 positive patients with or without ischemic stroke, the number of COVID-19 negative patients with or without ischemic stroke.

2.5. Assessment of quality

Newcastle–Ottawa Scale (NOS) was used to evaluate the quality of all included observational cohort studies. All studies were evaluated based on their outcome, selection and comparability. Two authors YHC and TBL evaluated all included studies independently and discussed discrepancies by consensus.

2.6. Data analysis

To determine the correlation between ischemic stroke and COVID-19, odds ratios (OR) and confidence intervals (CI) were assessed. To assess the heterogeneity between studies, the Cochran’s Q test was performed. The heterogeneity was estimated by calculating the I\(^2\) with levels of 0% (absent), 25% (low), 50% (moderate) and 75% (high). The random effect model was used when the severe heterogeneity had I\(^2\) > 50%, otherwise the fixed effect model was applied. A P-value less than 0.05 was defined as statistic significant. Subgroup analyses were performed according to the type of continent, number of sample size, study design and NOS score. Moreover, sensitivity analysis was conducted by deleting each study individually and thus the quality and consistency of results were evaluated. Begg’s test was used to analysis the publication bias. In this study, statistical analyses were performed using the Stata software package (version 15.1).

3. Results

3.1. Study selection

A total of 1191 publications was identified in the initial literature search. Among these studies, 497 articles were from PubMed, 375 articles were from EMBASE, 313 articles were from Web of Science and 6 articles were from Cochrane Library, and 406 duplicated articles were removed. Thus, we identified 785 unique papers and selected 51 papers for full-text review after reviewing the title and abstract. We excluded 47 articles based on the exclusion criteria. Finally, we included 4 eligible studies in our systematic review and meta-analysis. The flowchart showing the systematic screening and process of selection is reflected in Fig. 1.

3.2. Quality assessment and baseline characteristics

We summarized the main characteristics of included articles in Table 1 The mean age of COVID-19 positive patients with ischemic stroke was 69.45 years (Range: 63–77 years) and the male patients were 56%. Countries covered by these articles were USA, Italy and France. Three of the articles were retrospective cohort studies and one was a prospective cohort study. The study quality indicated by the score of NOS was ranged from 7 to 8 (Table S1).

3.3. Overall analysis of the correlation between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19

We analysed the combined effect estimations based on OR with the random-effects model (Fig. 2). We found that the risk of ischemic stroke (combined OR: 2.41; 95% CI: 1.08–5.38) was significantly increased. Four included studies were significantly heterogeneous (I\(^2\) = 75.2%, P = 0.007).

3.4. Subgroup analyses of correlation between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19

We conducted subgroup analyses based on the continent (North America or Europe), sample size (\(>500\) or \(<500\)), study design (prospective, retrospective) and NOS score (7, 8) in Fig. 3. Significant association between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19 was observed in the North America group (combined OR: 2.90; 95% CI: 0.45–18.80, I\(^2\) = 89.60%, P = 0.002), but not in the Europe group (combined OR: 2.29; 95% CI: 1.22–4.29, I\(^2\) = 0.00%, P = 0.79); Significant association between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19 was also observed in studies with sample size > 500 (combined OR: 2.90; 95% CI: 0.45–18.80, I\(^2\) = 89.60%, P = 0.002), but not in studies with sample size < 500 (combined OR: 2.29; 95% CI: 1.22–4.29, I\(^2\) = 0.00%, P = 0.79); Moreover, significant association between the
risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19 was further observed in retrospective studies (combined OR: 2.39; 95% CI: 0.99–5.45, I² = 82.90%, P = 0.003). In addition, we also assessed the quality of studies based on the NOS score. We found that there was no significant association between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19 studies with a score of 7 (combined OR: 1.53; 95% CI: 0.88–2.67, I² = 63.60%, P = 0.10) or 8.
Studies with smaller sample size also failed to demonstrate an association between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19 probably due to insufficient data for statistical analysis.

Several mechanisms had been proposed to explain the association between the risk of ischemic stroke and COVID-19. The first possible mechanism is the cytokine storm occurred in response to COVID-19 (Chen et al., 2020; Guzik et al., 2020; Zakeri et al., 2020). Indeed, increased levels of proinflammatory cytokines such as interleukine-1β (IL-1β), IL-6, IL-7, IL-8, IL-9, IL-10, IL-12, granulocyte-macrophage colony-stimulating factor, interferon-γ, and monocyte chemotactic protein 1 were associated with the risk of multiple organ dysfunction in patients with COVID-19 (Huang et al., 2020; Mehta et al., 2020; Ojo et al., 2020). In addition, the increased levels of C-reactive protein and IL-6 might also contribute to the increased risk of acute ischemic stroke (Tzoulaki et al., 2007; Zakeri et al., 2020). Another possible mechanism for COVID-19-induced ischemic stroke is the activated innate immune system and the coagulation induced by infection with SARS-CoV-2 (Beyrouti et al., 2020; Campbell and Kahwash, 2020; Majidi et al., 2020; Sweid et al., 2020; Yaghi et al., 2020). In fact, the level of D-dimer was increased in COVID-19 patients with acute ischemic stroke, suggesting that COVID-19 may cause an acute systemic inflammatory response and lead to a procoagulant state (Grau et al., 2010; Merad and Martin, 2020; Wang et al., 2020). Inflammatory cytokines can cause endothelial activation which refers to the procoagulant state of the endothelial cells of blood vessels (Ojo et al., 2020). Thrombin, the serine protease which regulates blood coagulation, can be released by activated endothelial cells and is normally controlled by natural anticoagulants. Uncontrolled thrombin in the blood stream can activate platelets and lead to thrombosis which increases the risk of stroke (Beyrouti et al., 2020; Tang et al., 2020). Moreover, the antiphospholipid antibody syndrome (APS), an autoimmune disorder featured by excess formation of blood clot, might be another mechanism that associated COVID-19 with the ischemic stroke (Beyrouti et al., 2020; Zhang et al., 2020). The APS is mainly classified by an increased level of primary antiphospholipid antibodies including the lupus anticoagulant and aβ2GPI immunoglobulin M or immunoglobulin G antibodies. One study reported that 14 patients were tested positive for lupus anticoagulant and 5 patients were positive for aβ2GPI immunoglobulin M or immunoglobulin G antibodies among 56 COVID-19 patients (Harzallah et al., 2020; Ojo et al., 2020). Therefore, the level of antiphospholipid antibodies might be a good indicator for COVID-19 patients in predicting the risk of ischemic stroke. However, more studies are required to clarify the
contribution of antiphospholipid antibodies to increase the risk of ischemic stroke in COVID-19 patients.

Our study has some strengthens. First, we analysed cohort studies instead of case report or case series. Second, we also considered the generalizability by including studies from different countries. Third, multiple analyses including the publication bias analysis, sensitivity analysis and subgroup analysis, were conducted to evaluate the combined effect size estimation.

Our study has some limitations. First, although we analysed four studies, the sample size remained small. Second, the language bias that favor English exists in this study. Therefore, further studies with larger sample sizes that include different ethnic populations are required to confirm our analysis.

5. Conclusions

Our meta-analysis showed a strong correlation between the increased incidence rate of ischemic stroke and COVID-19, especially in North America COVID-19 patients. Further study is required to develop effective treatments to decrease the ischemic stroke risk in COVID-19 patients.

Funding

This study was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (NSFC 81771521).

CRediT authorship contribution statement

Yanhua Cui, Taibai Li and ZhaoFei Yang searched literatures and performed data extraction. Yanhua Cui and Bing Zhao analyzed the data, drafted and finalized the manuscript. Song Li revised the manuscript. Wei-Dong Le designed the study concept and revised the manuscript. All authors have approved the final article.

Acknowledgments

Not applicable.

Declaration of Conflicts of interest

All authors declared no financial or other conflicts of interest involved.
Appendix A. Supporting information

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found in the online version at doi:10.1016/j.brainresb.2021.12.011.

References

Bekelis, K., Missios, S., Ahmad, J., Labrouroulas, N., Schirm, C.M., Calnan, D.R., Skinner, J., Mackenzie, T.A., 2020. Ischemic stroke occurs less frequently in patients with COVID-19 a multicenter cross-sectional study. Stroke 51 (12), 3570-3576. https://doi.org/10.1161/strokeaha.120.031217.

Benjamin, E.J., Scheifflin, K., Sarna, R., Sinyi, B., Delman, B.N., Mahmoudi, K., Mocco, J., Majid, S., Yeckley, J., Aggar, S.A., Defronzo, D., Doshi, A.H., 2020. COVID-19 is an independent risk factor for acute ischemic stroke. Am. J. Neuroladio. 41 (8), 1361-1364. https://doi.org/10.1017/ajnr.a56605.

Benjamin, R., Adams, M.E., Benjamin, L., Cohen, H., Farmer, S.F., Goh, Y.Y., Humphries, F., Jager, H.R., Losseff, N.A., Perry, R.J., Shah, S., Siminer, R.J., Turner, D., Chandrathavara, A., Werring, D.J., 2020. Characteristics of ischaemic stroke associated with COVID-19. J. Neurol. Neurosurg. Psychiatry 91 (8), 889-891. https://doi.org/10.1136/jnnp-2020-322586.

Campbell, C.M., Kahwash, R., 2020. Will complement inhibition be the new target in COVID-19? Stroke 51 (7), 2002-2008. https://doi.org/10.1161/strokeaha.120.030397.

Cui, Y., Balogun, S.A., Iduow, A.O., 2020. Acute ischemic stroke in COVID-19: putative mechanisms, clinical characteristics, and outcomes. J. Neurol. Neurosurg. Psychiatry. https://doi.org/10.1136/jnnp-2020-322586.

Dann, S., de Groot, R., Beek, M., Mahfuz, H.L.S., 2020. Stroke in COVID-19: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Int. J. Stroke. https://doi.org/10.1177/1747493020972922.

Ojo, A.S., Balogun, S.A., Iduow, A.O., 2020. Acute ischemic stroke in COVID-19: putative mechanisms, clinical characteristics, and outcomes. J. Neurol. Neurosurg. Psychiatry. https://doi.org/10.1136/jnnp-2020-322586.
neurointerventionalist. J. Neurointerv. Surg. https://doi.org/10.1136/neurintsurg-2020-016794.

Zhang, Y., Xiao, M., Zhang, S., Xia, P., Cao, W., Jiang, W., Chen, H., Ding, X., Zhao, H., Zhang, H., Wang, C., Zhao, J., Sun, X., Tian, R., Wu, W., Wu, D., Ma, J., Chen, Y., Zhang, D., Xie, J., Yan, X., Zhou, X., Liu, Z., Wang, J., Du, B., Qin, Y., Gao, P., Qin, X., Xu, Y., Zhang, W., Li, T., Zhang, F., Zhao, Y., Li, Y., Zhang, S., 2020. Coagulopathy and antiphospholipid antibodies in patients with Covid-19. New Engl. J. Med. 382 (17), e38 https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMc2007575.

Zhu, N., Zhang, D., Wang, W., Li, X., Yang, B., Song, J., Zhao, X., Huang, B., Shi, W., Lu, R., Niu, P., Zhan, F., Ma, X., Wang, D., Xu, W., Wu, G., Gao, G.F., Tan, W., China Novel Coronavirus Investigating and Research T, 2020. A novel coronavirus from patients with pneumonia in China, 2019. New Engl. J. Med. 382 (8), 727–733. https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa2001017.