Effects of Homemade Nano-Hydroxyapatite and Olive Oil Paste on Remineralization of Early Caries Lesions

*Ayşe Dina Erdilek¹, Sevdiye Burke¹, Merve Şahin¹, Ata Efes², Begüm Güray Efes¹

¹Department of Restorative Dentistry, Faculty of Dentistry, Istanbul University, Istanbul, Turkey. ²Department of Molecular Biology and Genetics, Faculty of Science, Koç University, Istanbul, Turkey. *Email: derdilek@yahoo.com

Abstract: Nano-hydroxyapatite (nHAP) particles are a new generation of materials reported to remineralize enamel lesions. The purpose we aimed was to compare the in vitro effects of fluoride gel, sodium fluoride toothpaste, and homemade nHAP paste on remineralizing artificial early enamel caries. Methods: Incipient caries were induced in 21 extracted, sound premolar teeth by storing each specimen in a demineralization solution for 72 hours, followed by pH cycling. The samples (n= 7, each) were then treated with 2% neutral fluoride gel, 0.25% sodium fluoride toothpaste, or homemade nHAP paste, comprising a mixture of nHAP powder and olive oil. After demineralization and remineralization, the results were compared using the DIAGNOdent pen (KaVo, Germany). The data were statistically analyzed using paired t-tests and a one-way ANOVA test. Outcomes: The degree of demineralization in each of the three groups (fluoride gel group, 15.71; sodium fluoride dentifrice group, 15.28; nHAP paste group, 16.71) was significantly elevated compared to baseline (3, 2.5, 2.28, respectively); however, no significant difference was observed between the remineralization readings in each of the three groups (6, 7, 5.5, respectively) (p > 0.05). In conclusion, we concluded that the homemade nHAP paste had a beneficial effect on the remineralization of initial enamel caries lesions.

Keywords: Demineralization; dentifrice; remineralization; artificial caries; nano-hydroxyapatite paste

INTRODUCTION

Preventive dentistry is the preferred research area for developments in maintaining natural tooth structure and decreasing the risk of caries¹. Demineralization occurs when the pH of the oral environment falls below 5.5, resulting in the loss of minerals from the tooth surface. In the early stages of enamel decay, remineralization controls the decay process and reverses caries by depositing minerals on the demineralized tooth surface. Calcium and phosphate ions in the saliva can be deposited on the surface of the lesion, which remineralizes the initial lesions².

Remineralization can be achieved with agents such as fluoride, which is administered through gels, toothpaste, and mouthwashes³.⁴ However, it has been reported that chronic exposure to low fluoride levels can have toxic effects on systemic health⁵. In addition, the extensive use of fluoride, mainly in the form of dentifrices, has contributed to a rising incidence of dental fluorosis⁶.
Hence, research has emphasized using biomimetic oral care products containing hydroxyapatite particles in preventive dentistry\(^7,8\). Nano-hydroxyapatite (nHAP) has the same chemical and physical properties as the enamel apatite structure, shows a high affinity for dental hard tissues\(^7\), and can penetrate the enamel pores. Therefore, nHAP may serve as a safe and effective alternative dentifrice for home use by patients with limited access to professional dental care.

The ingredients in commercial toothpastes, including abrasives, detergents, and antibacterial agents, have some side effects. Moreover, water in these products can increase the potential for microorganism growth. These limitations have prompted individuals to seek natural alternatives, such as oil-based homemade oral care products, which remove plaque through mechanical action\(^9\). However, while homemade pastes are popular and contain natural ingredients, they are not necessarily effective. Researchers and dental professionals must also measure the remineralizing properties of homemade pastes to determine their clinical merit.

It is essential to diagnose carious lesions correctly to determine the degree of remineralization within the dental tissue. The DIAGNOdent pen has been used to detect caries using laser fluorescence and measure lesions numerically\(^10\). The DIAGNOdent has been implemented in clinical practice and used effectively since it first entered the market.

With the advent of new remineralizing formulas, more in-vitro research is required to develop alternative homemade dentifrices containing hydroxyapatite particles. This study aimed to determine the effectiveness of nHAP on the remineralization by comparing the in-vitro activity of three different remineralizing agents (fluoride gel, sodium fluoride toothpaste, and homemade nHAP and olive oil paste). We hypothesized that the nHAP-based homemade dentifrice would promote equal enamel remineralization compared to fluoride dentifrice and fluoride gel.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Sample selection and preparation**

Twenty-one premolars extracted for orthodontic and periodontal purposes were selected from a collection of teeth. The ethics committee approved this project of Istanbul University Faculty of Dentistry (2018/102). Gingival tissues were manually removed using hand instruments. First, the roots of the teeth were embedded in wax. A 3 × 3-mm\(^2\) square tape was attached to the buccal enamel surfaces of the samples in all three groups, and the remaining areas were covered with two coats of acid-resistant nail varnish (Max Factor, France). The adhesive tape was then removed from the specimens, and they were kept at room temperature for 24 hours to allow the varnish to dry. The residues were cleaned with ethyl alcohol, and an area of 3 × 3 mm\(^2\) was obtained for experimental applications. This case isolated the demineralization and remineralization to the window area.

**Preparation of demineralizing solution**

High-grade analytical chemicals and deionized water were used to prepare the demineralizing solution. Demineralizing solutions were produced using a mixture of 2.2 mM calcium chloride dihydrate, 2.2 mM sodium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate, and 0.05 M lactic acid solution (\(2H_2O, CaCl_2 = 2.2\) mM; \(2H_2O, NaH_2PO_4 = 2.2\) mM; lactic acid = 0.05 M) at pH 4.5\(^11\).
Lesion Formation
All the teeth used in the study were immersed in the demineralizing solution for 72 hours at 37°C, to produce artificial incipient caries lesions.
All the lesions were measured and the scores showed values between 12–24, which indicated the necessity for a preventive therapy, according to the DIAGNOdent pen clinical guideline.

Remineralization solution
The 21 teeth were then maintained in sterilized saliva for one day. Saliva was freshly collected in the morning from a single male donor who chewed paraffin for 5 minutes after rinsing his mouth.

Treatment
The specimens were randomly divided into three groups (n = 7) (Table 1).
Group 1: Fluoride gel (2% Neutral Sodium Fluoride, Imicryl) was applied for 4 minutes to the tooth surfaces according to the manufacturer's instructions.
Group 2: Sodium fluoride toothpaste (Opalescence Whitening Toothpaste, Ultradent) was applied for 2 minutes to the buccal enamel surface. The toothpaste slurry was prepared in a 3:1 weight ratio of deionized water to toothpaste by EN ISO 11609–2017 (Dentistry-Dentifrices - Requirements, test methods, and marking).
Group 3: Homemade nHAP paste (Geistlich, Bio-Oss powder + olive oil) was applied for 2 minutes on the tooth surfaces. The paste was prepared in a 1:1 weight ratio of olive oil to nHAP powder (Geistlich, Bio-Oss) without any fluorides.

DIAGNOdent Pen measurements
The same DIAGNOdent pen was used throughout the study, and one examiner performed all measurements. After calibration with the ceramic standard, the fluorescence of a solid spot on the tooth's smooth surface was measured to provide a baseline value, as per the manufacturer's instructions. DIAGNOdent pen readings were taken at baseline, after lesion formation, after sterilized saliva exposure, and immediately after remineralization. The enamel surface was dried before each measurement, and the device probe (tip 2) was used for smooth scanning surfaces. Each area was scanned twice with the pen, and the highest value from the two readings was registered.

Statistical analysis
The data analysis were performed using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS, ver 11, SPSS Inc. Chicago, Illinois, USA). Descriptive statistics for each group were presented as mean and standard deviations. The differences between the baseline DIAGNOdent pen readings and those after demineralization were compared using paired t-tests. The level of significance was set at p < 0.05. The differences between the DIAGNOdent pen values of the treatment groups were compared using the one-way ANOVA test (p < 0.05).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
The readings at baseline, after lesion formation, after sterilized saliva exposure, and after treatment using the DIAGNOdent pen are shown in Table 2. Alterations on the lesion surface due to the demineralization and remineralization process was observed in all enamel specimens. The DIAGNOdent scores after demineralization were significantly elevated compared to those at baseline (p < 0.05); however, no significant differences
were observed between the DIAGNOdent scores after remineralization treatment in each of the three groups (fluoride gel group, 6; sodium fluoride dentifrice, 7; nHAP paste group, 5.5) (p > 0.05).

Table 1. Ingredients of Remineralizing Agents Used in This Study

| Remineralizing agent          | Ingredients                                                                 | Manufacturers                                |
|-------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|
| Polimo Fluoride Gel           | 2% Neutral Sodium Fluoride (9050 ppm)                                       | Imicryl, Konya, TURKEY                       |
| Opalescence Whitening Toothpaste (Sodium fluoride dentifrice) | Sodium Fluoride 0.25 % w/w (1100 ppm) Glycerin, Water (aqua), Silica, Sorbitol, Xylitol, Flavor (aroma), Poloxamer, Sodium Lauryl Sulfate, Carbomer, FD&C Blue#1 (Cl 42090), FD&C Yellow#5 (Cl 19140), Sodium Benzoate, Sodium Hydroxide, Sparkle (Cl 77019, Cl 77891), Sucralose, Xanthan Gum. | Ultradent, South Jordan, UT, USA |
| Homemade nHAP paste           | Bio-Oss powder (nHAP powder from the cancellous parts of bovine bone) + olive oil | Geistlich Pharma North America Inc. Princeton, NJ USA |

Table 2. Mean Values and Standard Deviations of the Three Groups Using DIAGNOdent Pen Scores

| Tested Configurations | Measurements Scores (Mean (Standard Deviation)) |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------------------------|
| Remineralization material Types | Baseline | After demineralization | After sterilized saliva | After remineralization |
| 1 Polimo Fluoride Gel  | 3.7 (±1.26) | 15.71 (±4.55) | 12.57 (±2.14) | 6 (±1.97) |
| 2 Opalescence Whitening Toothpaste (Sodium fluoride dentifrice) | 2.57 (±1.51) | 15.29 (±4.27) | 12.29 (±0.75) | 7 (±0.98) |
| 3 Homemade nHAP paste   | 2.29 (±2.35) | 16.71 (±5.01) | 13.57 (±3.62) | 5.57 (±0.52) |
In vitro systems are usually preferred for caries research as they are less expensive and time-consuming compared to other testing methods. Artificial caries lesions in the enamel are more reproducible and stable than natural caries lesions\textsuperscript{13}. A pH-cycling model was used in the present study, and artificial caries lesions were produced using standardized demineralizing solutions.

Even when using bacterial biofilms and saliva, "artificial mouth" systems cannot fully simulate the complex intraoral conditions that lead to caries development. The saliva covers all the surfaces in the mouth and has a protective pH-increasing effect owing to its enzyme and glycoprotein content. To take advantage of the functional properties of pellicle formation, sterilized saliva was used as a remineralizing solution, as shown by White\textsuperscript{14} and Casals et al\textsuperscript{15}.

The present study could have been followed up using scanning electron microscopy (SEM); however, SEM is not suitable for clinical settings. Moreover, SEM is more expensive than the DIAGNOdent pen and requires a specialized laboratory environment. An analysis of available data indicates the utility of the DIAGNOdent pen for reproducible caries detection, with good sensitivity and specificity\textsuperscript{16}. The DIAGNOdent pen has been used on smooth surface areas in both in situ\textsuperscript{17} and in vivo\textsuperscript{18} studies. The results indicated that all the three remineralizing agents had a significant remineralization effect on initial caries. The efficacy of ionic fluoride in toothpaste has been confirmed in recent in vitro studies\textsuperscript{19-21} and is supported by in vivo studies\textsuperscript{22-24}. To date, the most effective remineralizing agent is fluoride. However, the mineral nHAP also has a practical reparative effect on dental tissue\textsuperscript{25}.

We confirmed our hypothesis that the nHAP-based homemade dentifrice would promote equal enamel remineralization relative to the fluoride dentifrice and fluoride gel. In the current study, nHAP was applied for only a short time during the pH cycle. Due to the low solubility of pure hydroxyapatite, there are not sufficient Ca\textsuperscript{2+} and PO\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{3-} ions available to prevent the enamel dissolution and they increase the stability of hydroxyapatite in enamel. However, tiny-sized nHAP crystals (50-1000 nm) have a filling effect on the pores of the demineralized and porous enamel; therefore, nHAP may have precipitated into the surface pores and formed an infrastructure for the mineralization\textsuperscript{26}. This mineral deposition on the surface is comparable to the precipitation of CaF\textsubscript{2} after NaF application. Further, in the present study, we observed that the homemade nHAP paste, sodium fluoride dentifrice, and fluoride gel had similar remineralization effects in treating initial caries.

This finding is supported by prior studies that reported no significant difference between nHAP and other remineralizing agents, including sodium fluoride\textsuperscript{27-29}. In a previous study, nHAP was observed to induce remineralization by forming a homogeneous apatite layer on the demineralized surfaces of enamel after only 10 minutes of treatment. This surface comprises synthetic hydroxyapatite nanocrystals that chemically bond to natural enamel crystals. Additionally, the hardness and elastic modulus of the restored enamel is similar to those of the natural structure\textsuperscript{8}. According to transmission electron microscopy (TEM) observations, the nHAP solution is reported to fully integrate into the enamel\textsuperscript{30}.

In the present study, the effects of the fluoride dentifrice and neutral sodium fluoride gel were similar. However, a previous study demonstrated that the microhardness of enamel was significantly higher when treated with a fluoride dentifrice than a neutral
sodium fluoride gel\textsuperscript{31}. Increasing fluoride concentrations may not produce a further significant increase in remineralization\textsuperscript{32}. Moreover, some in vitro studies have reported significantly greater remineralization efficiency with 1000 ppm and 1400 ppm sodium fluoride than nHAP treatments\textsuperscript{33,34}. These conflicting results may be attributed to the different variables within the studies (in vitro/in vivo study, type of remineralization agent, application time, etc.).

An in vivo study compared the effectiveness of three different remineralizing agents using the DIAGNOdent pen, in which nHAP was shown to be the most effective one\textsuperscript{35}. Further, a randomized clinical trial has reported that an nHAP-containing toothpaste performed better than a fluoride-containing one, based on DIAGNOdent readings\textsuperscript{36}. In the current study, the nHAP paste was prepared by mixing olive oil with Geistlich Bio-Oss pure nHAP powder with low solubility, making this method easy to use at home and applying to the tooth surface. Hydroxyapatite powder is soluble in olive oil and the food-grade olive oil is harmless to human health. Olive oil has been used in preparations of hydroxyapatite\textsuperscript{37,38} and as an additive agent to hydroxyapatite\textsuperscript{39}. Commercial toothpastes often contain water as an ingredient; however, in a homemade toothpaste, water provides a suitable environment for the growth and proliferation of microorganisms. Therefore, oil is preferred instead of the water.

Quality and safety of biomaterial manufacturing processes are subject to quality management systems, and Geistlich Pharma is certified according to ISO 9001 and ISO 13485 international standards\textsuperscript{40}. The pure nHAP particles in the toothpaste formulation increase its overall cost. However, different manufacturing methods may help overcome this economic restriction.

Homemade nHAP dentifrices may be recommended to manage patients with high caries risk and high caries activity. Individuals who do not wish to use fluoride due to toxicity concerns should not neglect their oral health. In these cases, the nHAP may be offered to patients as an alternative to fluoride. Further in vitro studies, controlled in vivo studies, and clinical trials are needed to ascertain the true clinical efficacy of homemade dentifrices containing nHAP.

CONCLUSION
The present study concluded that the homemade nHAP paste had a beneficial effect on the remineralization of initial enamel caries lesions. nHAP may be provided as an alternative to high caries risk patients and for patients with limited access to professional dental care.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST
The author report no conflicts of interest and no funding resources in this study.

REFERENCE
1. Brostek AM, Walsh LJ. Minimal intervention dentistry in general practice. Oral Health Dent Manag. 2014;13(2):285-94. PMID: 24984635.
2. Peters MC, Bresciani E, Barata TJE, et al. In vivo dentin remineralization by calcium-phosphate cement. J Dent Res, 2010; 89(3):286-291. doi: 10.1177/0022034509360155.
3. Reddy R, Manne R, Chandra Sekhar G et al. Evaluation of the efficacy of various topical fluorides on enamel demineralization adjacent to orthodontic brackets: an in vitro study. J Contemp Dent Pract, 2019; 20(19):89-93. doi: 10.5005/jp-journals-10024-2481.

4. De Sousa MLR, Wagner M, Sheiham A. Caries reductions related to the use of fluorides: A retrospective cohort study. Int Dent J, 2002; 52(5):315-320. doi: 10.1002/idj.1875-595X.2002.tb00877.x.

5. Kanduti D, Sterbenk P, Artnik B. Fluoride: A Review of Use and Effects on Health. Mater Sociomed, 2016; 28(2):133-137. doi: 10.5455/msm.2016.28.133-137.

6. Zohoori FV, Maguire A. Are there good reasons for fluoride labelling of food and drink? Br Dent J, 2018; 224(4):215-217. doi: 10.1038/sj.bdj.2018.123.

7. Roveri N, Battistella E, Bianchi CL et al. Surface enamel remineralization: Biomimetic apatite nanocrystals and fluoride ions different effects. J Nanomater, 2009; (2009):9 pages, doi: 10.1155/2009/746383.

8. Li L, Pan H, Tao J et al. Repair of enamel by using hydroxyapatite nanoparticles as the building blocks. J Mater Chem, 2008; 18:4079-4084. doi: 10.1039/b806090h.

9. Lippert F. An Introduction to Toothpaste - Its Purpose, History and Ingredients. Toothpastes, Monogr Oral Sci, 2013; 23(1):1-14. doi: 10.1159/000350456.

10. Akarsu SAktug KS. In Vitro Comparison of ICDAS And DIAGNOdent Pen in the Diagnosis and Treatment Decisions of Non-Cavitated Occlusal Caries. Odontos, 2019; 21(1), 67-81. doi: 10.15517/ijds.v0i0.34896.

11. Lata S, Varghese NO, Varughese JM. Remineralization potential of fluoride and amorphous calcium phosphate-casein phospho peptide on enamel lesions: an in vitro comparative evaluation. J Conserv Dent, 2010; 13(1):42-46. doi: 10.4103/0972-0707.62634.

12. Rudney JD, Chen R, Lenton P, Li J, Li Y, Jones RS, Reilly C, Fok AS, Aparicio C. A reproducible oral microcosm biofilm model for testing dental materials. J. Appl. Microbiol, 2012; 113, 1540–1553. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2672.2012.05439.x.

13. Yu OY, Zhao IS, Mei ML et al. A review of the common models used in mechanistic studies on demineralization-remineralization for cariology research. Dent J, 2017; 5(2):20. doi: 10.3390/dj5020020.

14. White DJ. Use of synthetic polymer gels for artificial carious lesion preparation. Caries Res, 1987; 21(3):228-42. doi: 10.1159/000261026.

15. Casals E, Boukpessi T, McQueen CM, Eversole SL, Faller RV. Anticaries potential of commercial dentifrices as determined by fluoridation and remineralization efficiency. J Contemp Dent Pract, 2007; 8(7):1-10. PMID: 17994149.

16. Lussi A, Hibst R, Paulus R. DIAGNOdent: an optical method for caries detection. J Dent Res, 2004; 83(1_suppl), 80–83. doi: 10.1177/154405910408301S16.

17. Moriyma CM, Rodrigues JA, Lussi A, Diniz MB. Effectiveness of fluorescence-based methods to detect in situ demineralization and remineralization on smooth surfaces. Caries Res, 2014; 48(6):507-514. doi: 10.1159/000363074.

18. Aljehani A, Yousif MA, Angmar-Månsso B, Shi XQ. Longitudinal quantification of incipient carious lesions in postorthodontic patients using a fluorescence method. Eur J Oral Sci, 2006; 114(5):430-434. doi: 10.1111/j.1600-0722.2006.00395.x.

19. Gonçalves FMC, Delbem ACB, Gomes LF et al. Combined effect of casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium phosphate and sodium trimetaphosphate on the
prevention of enamel demineralization and dental caries: an in vitro study. Clin Oral Investig, 2020; 25(5):2811–2820. doi: 10.1007/s00784-020-03597-7.

20. Tomaz PLS, Sousa LA, Aguiar KF et al. Effects of 1450-ppm Fluoride-containing Toothpastes Associated with Boosters on the Enamel Remineralization and Surface Roughness after Cariogenic Challenge. Eur J Dent, 2020; 14(01):161-170. doi: 10.1055/s-0040-1705072.

21. Ali S, Farooq I, Al-Thobity AM et al. An in-vitro evaluation of fluoride content and enamel remineralization potential of two toothpastes containing different bioactive glasses. Biomed Mater Eng, 2020; 30(5-6):487-496. doi: 10.3233/BME-191069.

22. Fiorillo L, Cervino G, Herford AS et al. Stannous fluoride effects on enamel: A systematic review. Biomimetics, 2020; 5(3):41. doi: 10.3390/biomimetics5030041.

23. Clark-Perry D, Levin L. Comparison of new formulas of stannous fluoride toothpastes with other commercially available fluoridated toothpastes: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised controlled trials. Int Dent J, 2020; 70(6):418-426. doi: 10.1111/idj.12588.

24. Benson PE, Parkin N, Dyer F et al. Fluorides for preventing early tooth decay (demineralised lesions) during fixed brace treatment. Cochrane Database Syst Rev, 2019; Issue 11. Art. No.: CD003809. doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD003809.pub4.

25. Manchery N, John J, Nagappan N et al. Remineralization potential of dentifrice containing nanohydroxyapatite on artificial carious lesions of enamel: A comparative in vitro study. Dent Res J (Isfahan), 2019; 16(5):310-317. doi: 10.4103/1735-3327.266096.

26. Huang S, Gao S, Cheng L, Yu H. Remineralization potential of nano-hydroxyapatite on initial enamel lesions: an in vitro study. Caries Res, 2011; 45(5):460-468. doi: 10.1159/000331207.

27. Souza BM, Comar LP, Vertuan M, Fernandes Neto C, Buzalaf MA, Magalhães AC. Effect of an Experimental Paste with Hydroxyapatite Nanoparticles and Fluoride on Dental Demineralisation and Remineralisation in situ. Caries Res, 2015; 49(5):499-507. doi: 10.1159/000438466.

28. Itthagarun A, King NM, Cheung Y. The effect of nano-hydroxyapatite toothpaste on artificial enamel carious lesion progression: an in-vitro pH-cycling study. Hong Kong Dent J, 2010; 7(2):61-66. Available from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/4838092.

29. Najibfard K, Ramalingam K, Chedjieiu I, Amaechi BT. Remineralization of early caries by a nano-hydroxyapatite dentifrice. J Clin Dent, 2011; 22(5):139-143. PMID: 22403978.

30. Yamagishi K, Onuma K, Suzuki T et al. Materials chemistry: a synthetic enamel for rapid tooth repair. Nature, 2005; 433(7028):819. doi: 10.1038/433819a.

31. Delbem ACB, Brighenti FL, Vieira AE, Cury JA. In vitro comparison of the cariostatic effect between topical application of fluoride gels and fluoride toothpaste. J Appl Oral Sci, 2004; 12(2):121-126. doi: 10.1590/s1678-77572004000200008.

32. Amaechi BT, AbdulAzeez PA, Alshareif DO et al. Comparative efficacy of a hydroxyapatite and a fluoride toothpaste for prevention and remineralization of dental caries in children. BDJ Open, 2019; 5:18. doi: 10.1038/s41405-019-0026-8.
33. Huang SB, Gao SS, Yu HY. Effect of nano-hydroxyapatite concentration on remineralization of initial enamel lesion in vitro. Biomed Mater, 2009; 4(3):034104. doi: 10.1088/1748-6041/4/3/034104.

34. Körner P, Schleich JA, Wiedemeier DB et al. Effects of additional use of bioactive glasses or a hydroxyapatite toothpaste on remineralization of artificial lesions in vitro. Caries Res, 2020; 54(4):336-342. doi: 10.1159/000510180.

35. Alhamed M, Almalki F, Alselami A et al. Effect of different remineralizing agents on the initial carious lesions – A comparative study. Saudi Dent J, 2020; 32(8):390-395. doi: 10.1016/j.sdentj.2019.11.001.

36. Badiee M, Jafari N, Fatemi S et al. Comparison of the effects of toothpastes containing nanohydroxyapatite and fluoride on white spot lesions in orthodontic patients: A randomized clinical trial. Dent Res J (Isfahan), 2020; 17(5):354-359. doi: 10.4103/1735-3327.294328.

37. Kakiage M, Yoshida M, Kobayashi H. Fabrication of porous hydroxyapatite having nanometer/micrometer-size pores. J Ceram Soc Jpn, 2019; 127(5):327-330. doi: 10.2109/jcersj2.19027.

38. Balakrishnan S, Kulandaivelu R. Olive oil assisted synthesis of nano hydroxyapatite by hydrothermal method. Int J Res Anal Rev, 2018; 5(4):476-478. doi: 10.1729/Journal.18636.

39. Zakrzewski W, Dobrzynski M, Nowicka J et al. The influence of ozonated olive oil-loaded and copper-doped nanohydroxyapatites on planktonic forms of microorganisms. Nanomaterials, 2020; 10(10):1997. doi: 10.3390/nano10101997.

40. Geistlich Pharma. Quality and safety. 2021/10/25. Available from: https://www.geistlich-pharma.com/en/dental/further-sites/quality-safety/bone-substitute-devices/.