Achiral symmetry breaking and positive Gaussian modulus lead to scalloped colloidal membranes

Thomas Gibaud a,b, C. Nadir Kaplan a,c, Prerna Sharma a,d, Mark J. Zakhary a, Andrew Ward a,e, Rudolf Oldenbourg f,g, Robert B. Meyer a, Randall D. Kamien a, and Zvonimir Dogic a,1

*The Martin Fisher School of Physics, Brandeis University, Waltham, MA 02454; †Université de Lyon, Ens de Lyon, Université Claude Bernard, CNRS, Laboratoire de Physique, F-69342 Lyon, France; ‡John A. Paulson School of Engineering and Applied Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA 02138; §Department of Physics, Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore 560012, India; ¶Program in Cellular and Molecular Medicine, Boston Children’s Hospital, Boston, MA 02115; ††Marine Biological Laboratory, Woods Hole, MA 02543; ‡‡Department of Physics, Brown University, Providence, RI 02912; ‡¶Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA 19104; and ‡‡‡School of Engineering, Brown University, Providence, RI 02912

Edited by David A. Weitz, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA, and approved March 13, 2017 (received for review October 20, 2016)

In the presence of a nonadsorbing polymer, monodisperse rod-like particles assemble into colloidal membranes, which are one-rod-length-thick liquid-like monolayers of aligned rods. Unlike 3D edgeless bilayer vesicles, colloidal monolayer membranes form open structures with an exposed edge, thus presenting an opportunity to study elasticity of fluid sheets. Membranes assembled from single-component chiral rods form flat disks with uniform edge twist. In comparison, membranes composed of a mixture of rods with opposite chiralities can have the edge twist of either handedness. In this limit, disk-shaped membranes become unstable, instead forming structures with scalloped edges, where two adjacent lobes with opposite handedness are separated by a cusp-shaped point defect. Such membranes adopt a 3D configuration, with cusp defects alternatively located above and below the membrane plane. In the achiral regime, the cusp defects have repulsive interactions, but away from this limit we measure effective long-ranged attractive binding. A phenomenological model shows that the increase in the edge energy of scalloped membranes is compensated by concomitant decrease in the deformation energy due to Gaussian curvature associated with scalloped edges, demonstrating that colloidal membranes have positive Gaussian modulus. A simple excluded volume argument predicts the sign and magnitude of the Gaussian curvature modulus that is in agreement with experimental measurements. Our results provide insight into how the interplay between membrane elasticity, geometrical frustration, and achiral symmetry breaking can be used to fold colloidal membranes into 3D shapes.

The possible configurations and shapes of 2D fluid membranes can be described by a continuum energy expression that accounts for the membrane’s out-of-plane deformations as well as the line tension associated with the membrane’s exposed edge (1, 2). Because an arbitrary deformation of a thin layer can have either mean and/or Gaussian curvature, the full theoretical description of membranes, in principle, requires two parameters, the bending and Gaussian curvature moduli. However, lipid bilayers almost always appear as edgeless 3D vesicles, which further simplify theoretical modeling. In particular, integrating Gaussian curvature over any simply closed surface yields a constant (3). Thus, the shape fluctuations of a closed vesicle only depend on the membrane-bending modulus. Consequently, experiments that interrogated mechanics or shape fluctuations of vesicles provided extensive information about the membrane curvature modulus and how it depends on the structure of the constituent particles (4–6). In comparison, significantly less is known about the Gaussian modulus, despite the significant role it plays in fundamental biological and technological processes such as pore formation as well as vesicle fusion and fission (7–11).

Recent experiments have demonstrated that, in the presence of a depooling agent, monodisperse rods robustly assemble into one-rod-length–thick 2D membranes, with in-plane liquid order (12–16). Although more than two orders of magnitude thicker than lipid membranes, the deformations of both colloidal monolayers and lipid bilayers are described by the same elastic energy (17). However, in contrast to conventional membranes that fold into 3D vesicles, colloidal membranes appear as open structures. This presents a unique opportunity to explore the elasticity of 2D fluid sheets, a geometry for which both the Gaussian modulus and edge energy play an important role. Here, we explore the possible shapes of colloidal membranes and demonstrate an unexpected connection between the membrane’s edge structure, Gaussian curvature, and the chirality of the constituent rods.

The semicircular edge profile requires twisting of the rods at the edge, and this twist penetrates into the membrane interior over a characteristic length scale (16, 18, 19). For membranes composed of single-component chiral rods, the handedness of the edge twist along the entire circumference is uniform and dictated by the microscopic chirality of the constituent rods. With decreasing chirality, which is accomplished by mixing rods of opposite handedness, flat 2D circular membranes become unstable, and instead develop complex scalloped edges. In this limit, edge-bound rods exhibit achiral symmetry breaking, forming domains of opposite twist that are separated by cusp-like point defects, where the membrane escapes into the third dimension. The exact structure of the scalloped edge is determined by the competition between the line tension and the Gaussian curvature modulus. Line tension favors circular flat membrane

Significance

A number of essential processes in biology and materials science, such as vesicle fusion and fission as well as pore formation, change the membrane topology and require formation of sable surfaces. The energetic cost associated with such deformations is described by the Gaussian curvature modulus. We show that flat 2D colloidal membranes composed of achiral rods are unstable and spontaneously form scalloped edges. Quantitative analysis of such instability estimates the Gaussian curvature modulus of colloidal membranes. The measured sign and magnitude of the modulus can be explained by a simple excluded volume argument that was originally developed for polymeric surfactants.
that minimizes the exposed edge. In comparison, an undulating scalloped edge creates excess Gaussian curvature and is thus favored by membranes that have positive Gaussian moduli. Thus, observations of scalloped edges demonstrate that Gaussian modulus of colloidal membranes is positive. Tuning the membrane’s chiral composition effectively controls the interactions between cusp defects that can be either attractive or repulsive. Measurements of these interactions leads to an estimate of the Gaussian curvature modulus that is in agreement with the predictions of a simple theoretical model.

**Structure of Colloidal Membranes**

Our experimental model system is a colloidal membrane that spontaneously assembles in a mixture of dilute monodisperse rod-like viruses and nonadsorbing polymer dextran. The viruses alone interact through repulsive screened electrostatic repulsions (20). Addition of nonadsorbing polymer induces attractive depletion interactions that lead to assembly of colloidal membranes, equilibrium structures consisting of a one-rod-length-thick monolayer of aligned rods with a fluid-like internal structure (12). For our experiments, we use wild-type filamentous virus (fd-wt) and fd-Y21M that differs from its wild-type counterpart by a point mutation in the major coat protein (21). Both viruses have comparable contour length (22); however, studies of bulk cholesteric phase demonstrate that fd-wt forms a left-handed cholesteric structure, whereas fd-Y21M forms a right-handed one (Fig. 1A) (23–25). fd-wt/fd-Y12M mixture forms a homogeneous cholesteric phase with a pitch that depends on the ratio, $n_{fd} = n_{fd}(n_{fd} + n_{fdY21M})$, where $n_{fd}$ and $n_{fdY21M}$ are the concentration of fd-wt and fd-Y21M rods, respectively (24). The associated twist wave-number varies monotonically and smoothly from positive (right-handed) to negative (left-handed). It changes sign at $x_{fd} = 0.26$, the ratio at which the virus mixture is effectively achiral.

The structure of the colloidal membrane’s edge is determined by the balance of the surface energy associated with the rod-depletion polymer interface and the elastic distortion energy originating from the nonuniform packing of rods within the membrane. The surface energy favors a curved edge profile, whereas elastic distortions favor a squared edge (15, 16, 19, 26). For fd-virus-based colloidal membranes, the surface energy dominates; consequently, the membrane’s edge is curved and the edge-bound rods have to twist away from the membrane normal to fit the rounded profile imposed by the surface tension. Furthermore, the structure of the edge profile, and in particular the twist penetration depth $\lambda_0$, is independent of the chirality of the viruses; however, the chirality of the viruses does influence the effective edge tension of the membrane (19).

The tilting of edge-bound rods away from the membrane normal results in structural and optical anisotropy in the $x$–$y$ plane (Fig. 1B and C) (15, 16, 19). The optical anisotropy can be quantified by 2D-LC-PolScope that yields images where each pixel’s intensity is proportional to the 2D projection in the $x$–$y$ plane of the retardance, $R$ (27). The resulting twist at the edge penetrates into the membrane interior over a characteristic length scale (18). A radial retardance profile yields a twist penetration length that is significantly different between $fd$-Y21M and fd-wt (Fig. 1F). However, the 2D projection of the retardance map does not reveal the handedness of the edge twist. To extract this information, we use 3D-LC-PolScope (28). Briefly, a microlens array is introduced into the back focal plane of the objective of the 2D-LC-PolScope, producing a grid of conoscopic images on the CCD camera. Each conoscopic image determines the local orientation of rods. An azimuthally symmetric retardance

---

**Fig. 1.** Microscopic chirality of constituent rods determines preferred twist at the membrane’s edge. (A) Bacteriophage fd-wt is a rod-like molecule with left-handed chirality (green). A single point mutation of the major coat protein switches the microscopic chirality, yielding fd-Y21M (blue). (B and C) 2D-LC-PolScope images of fd-wt and fd-Y21M colloidal membranes. The local twist at the membrane’s edge results in optical retardance that is visualized with polarization techniques. The retardance is coded in a linear grayscale that varies from $R = 0$ nm (black) to $R = 3$ nm (white). (D and E) 3D-LC-PolScope image of fd-wt and fd-Y21M membranes reveals that the twist of the edge-bound rods is left-handed for fd-wt and right-handed for fd-Y21M. (F) Comparison of the radial retardance profile, $R(r)$, for both fd-wt and fd-Y21M membranes. The membrane interior is located at $r < 0$ and its edge is at $r = 0$. For fd-wt membranes, the twist penetration length is $\lambda_0 = 0.45 \pm 0.05 \mu m$, whereas for fd-Y21M membranes it is $\lambda_0 = 1.00 \pm 0.11 \mu m$. (G and H) Schematics of fd-wt and fd-Y21M colloidal membranes. (Scale bars: 2 μm.)
profile with a dark spot in the center indicates that rods at that locality are oriented along the $z$ axis. A shift of the zero-retardance spot away from the center of a conoscopic image yields the magnitude of the local virus tilting, whereas its radial position indicates the 3D direction of the birefringence vector. 3D-LC-PolScope images show that fd-wt membranes composed of fd-wt and fd-Y21M viruses are right- and left-handed, respectively (Fig. 1 D and E).

**Weakly Chiral Rod Mixtures Lead to Scalloped Membranes**

Next, we examine the structure of colloidal membranes assembled from a mixture of fd-wt and fd-Y21M. The difference in their contour length of less than a few percent is not sufficient to induce lateral phase separation (29); instead, we observe uniformly mixed membranes throughout the entire range of parameters studied here (Fig. 2). The membranes are stable for a wide range of depletant concentrations and for all ratios $x_{fd}$ (Fig. 24). The twist at the membrane edge is right-handed at low $x_{fd}$ and left-handed at high $x_{fd}$. Surprisingly, for intermediate $x_{fd}$ (0.04 < $x_{fd}$ < 0.45), we no longer observe flat circular membranes; instead, the membrane’s entire edge becomes decorated with a series of outward protrusions that are terminated by cusp-like defects (Fig. 2B). Furthermore, $z$ scans indicate that such scalloped membranes are not flat but have a distinct 3D structure where a cusp point defect located below the membrane is always followed by a defect located above the same plane (Fig. 3).

2D-LC-PolScope images of the scalloped membranes demonstrate that rods at the edge of each outward protrusion have the same twist penetration length (Fig. 3 A and B and Fig. S1A). However, 3D-LC-PolScope reveals that adjacent protrusions have alternating left- and right-handed twist (Fig. 3C). The regions of opposite twist are separated by cusp-like point defects. Because each protrusion is always accompanied with two adjacent point defects alternating above and below the monolayer plane, there can only be an even number of cusp defects along the membrane circumference. The combined z-stack and 3D-LC-PolScope images allow us to schematize the edge structure of the scalloped membranes, which is more intricate compared with the edge structure of chiral colloidal monolayers studied previously (Fig. 3 D–F). The formation of the scalloped membranes is the direct consequence of molecular chirality, because scalloped membranes appear in the limit of weak chirality, that is, between 0.04 < $x_{fd}$ < 0.4 (Fig. 24).

In principle, there could be localized demixing of the two rod species, where fd-wt would preferentially localize at the edges with a left-handed twist, and fd-Y21M at the edges with opposite twist. This was not observed experimentally. We labeled all fd-wt rods with a fluorescent dye (Alexa 488) and fd-Y21M rods with fluorescent dye (Dylight 550). Using dual-view fluorescence, a technique that allows us to simultaneously image fd-wt and fd-Y21M fluorescent rods, we observe that, within experimental error, membranes in bulk and at the edges remain homogeneously mixed for all $x_{fd}$, even within the outward protrusion (Fig. 2B and Movies S1 and S2). Furthermore, using previously described techniques (18, 19), we have measured how the twist penetration length $\lambda_t$, the interfacial tension $\gamma$, and the edge bending rigidity $k_b$ depend on $x_{fd}$. For scalloped membranes, we find that outward protrusions with either handedness had the same $\lambda_t$ (Fig. S2) and $\gamma$ and $k_b$ that could not be distinguished within experimental error. Additionally, these quantities varied continuously from $x_{fd} = 0$ to $x_{fd} = 1$, which also indicates mixture homogeneity (Fig. S1).

**Membrane Coalescence Generates Cusp-Like Deformations**

Lateral coalescence of colloidal membranes can lead to the formation of unconventional defect structures. For example, two laterally coalescing membranes of the same handedness can trap 180° of twist, resulting in a $\pi$-wall line defect (26). To elucidate a possible mechanism that leads to the formation of cusps in scalloped membranes, we observed membrane coarsening by using an angled-light 2D-LC-PolScope. This technique differs from conventional 2D-LC-PolScope; instead of having the light source aligned with the $z$ axis, the almost closed aperture associated with the back focal plane is translated away from the optical center, resulting in the plane waves illuminating the sample at an angle. This in turn reveals the handedness of the local rod twisting. We define a coordinate system in which the optical axis lies along the $z$ direction, and the membrane lies in the $x$-$y$ plane (Fig. 4A). The aperture of the condenser back focal plane is placed so that the incident illumination is tilted in the $z$-$x$ plane. It follows that the rods within a membrane along the $y$ axis (dashed line in Fig. 4B) exhibit a variable tilt with the respect to the illumination plane. The regions where rods are perpendicular to the plane of the illuminating wave will exhibit no optical retardance, whereas retardance will increase with an increasing tilt of rods away from the angle of the incident light. As a result, the lower edge of a right-handed membrane exhibits reduced retardance (relative to the rods in the bulk) as the viruses tilt toward the light source, whereas the upper edge exhibits increased retardance due to the rods tilting away from the light source (Fig. 4B). By the same reasoning, a left-handed membrane will exhibit the opposite behavior, with darker and brighter regions at the top and bottom of the membrane along the $y$ axis, respectively (Fig. 4C). This technique allows us to distinguish between left- and right-handed
Fig. 3. Structure of scalloped membranes. (A) Differential interference contrast (DIC) image of a scalloped membrane formed in a fd-wt/fd-Y21M mixture at the achiral ratio $x_{fd} = 0.26$ ($C_{dextran} = 40$ mg/mL). The membrane’s edge is decorated with a series of cusps separated by local outward protrusions. (B) 2D-LC-PolScope image of the membrane profile around a point defect. The twist penetration length $\lambda_t$ is identical on both sides of the cusp (Fig. S2). (C) 3D-LC-PolScope image of the membrane profile surrounding the defect. The viruses have opposite twist on either side of the point defect. (D) Z scan of the scalloped membranes under confocal microscopy. The point defects alternate above and below the monolayer plane. (E) Reconstruction of the membrane based on the confocal images. (F) Schematic of a point defect inferred from the measurements in C and D. The protrusion amplitude in the $xy$ plane is denoted by $A_2$ and the cusp height by $A_y$. (Scale bars: 2 μm.)

membrane edges with a higher spatial resolution than 3D-LC-PolScope.

For $0.04 < x_{fd} < 0.45$, in the early stages of the sample maturation, we observe circular membranes of either edge handedness, indicating spontaneously broken achiral symmetry. Over time, the intermediate-sized membranes with mixed edge twist continue to coalesce. When two membranes with the same handedness merge, we observe the formation of either a π-wall or an array of pores at the coalescence junction, as was discussed previously (Fig. 4B and Movie S3). By contrast, as the two proximal edges of a membrane pair with the opposite twist rupture, the adjoining neck widens and the twist of the edge-bound rods is expelled by aligning constituent rods with the membrane normal (Fig. 4C and Movie S4). This coalescence process leads to a daughter membrane that has two outward protrusions and two cusp defects at which the twist of edge-bound rods switches handedness. Once formed, the cusp defects remain stable indefinitely. An outward protrusion with a pair of defects can also be imprinted into the edge using optical tweezers (Fig. 4D and Movie S5). The method, which allows for robust engineering of cusp defects, consists of pulling the twisted ribbons out of the membrane. The first few steps of this procedure are similar to the previously studied disk-to-ribbons transition (19). Subsequently, reversing the direction of the optical trap and dragging it toward the membrane leads to the formation of defect pairs.

Effective Interactions Between Adjacent Point Defects

The structure of the scalloped edges greatly depends on the number fraction $x_{fd}$ and how close the membrane is to the achiral limit ($x_{fd} = 0.26$). At the boundary of stability of scalloped membranes, near $x_{fd} = 0.04$ or 0.45, a pair of point defects remains bound to each other at a well-defined distance (Fig. 5A). In comparison, close to the achiral limit the defect pair freely moves along the edge and the total circumference of each outward protrusion exhibits significant fluctuations (Movie S6). These observations can be explained by the chiral control of membrane line tension (19). Increasing the rod chirality raises the free energy of the untwisted interior rods, whereas lowering the free energy of edge bound twisted rods, thus leading to the chiral control of the line tension. Likewise, chirality can also raise the line tension if the twist at the membrane’s edge is the opposite of the natural twist preferred by the constituent molecules.

For achiral membranes, the line tension associated with the exposed edge of left-handed and right-handed outward protrusions is roughly equal. The overall free energy does not significantly change as one outward protrusion extends its length at the expense of another one, by translating the cusp defect. In this limit, the point defects freely diffuse and the lengths of outward protrusions with either handedness exhibit significant fluctuations in agreement with experimental observations. However, away from the achiral limit, there is a finite difference in line tension between the left-handed and right-handed outward protrusions, and the free energy is minimized by reducing the length of the outward protrusions with unfavorable twist.

To quantitatively test these ideas, we have measured the effective interaction between a pair of point defects that are connected by a single protrusion. We used phase contrast microscopy to track the positions, $s_i$, of two adjoining defects along the membrane contour (Fig. 5A). For an achiral sample ($x_{fd} = 0.26$), the separation between two adjoining defects, $\delta s = s_{i+1} - s_i$, fluctuates by many microns over a timescale of minutes (Fig. 5B). However, away from achiral limit, we observe that the relative separation between these defect pairs remains well defined on
experimental timescales. We measured the probability distribution function, $P(\delta s)$, of the defects being separated by distance $\delta s$. The measured distributions are described by a Gaussian: $P(\delta s) = \exp(-\alpha(\delta s - \delta s_0)^2/2k_B T)$, indicating that the defects are bound by a harmonic potential centered around the equilibrium separation, $\delta s_0$ (Fig. 5C). The equilibrium defect separation as well as the strength of the effective binding potential, $\alpha$, depend on $x_{fd}$, the ratio of left- and right-handed rods. By varying membrane composition, we extracted how $\alpha$, as well as the equilibrium separation, $\delta s_0 = \langle \delta s \rangle$, depends on $x_{fd}$ (Fig. 5D and E). Approaching the...
achiral mixture limit ($x_{fd} = 0.26$) leads to the increase of the mean separation $\delta s_0$ and a vanishing $\alpha$. In this limit, the adjacent defects effectively decouple from each other. Increasing chirality away from the achiral limit decreases equilibrium separation and increases the coupling strength, indicating tighter defect binding.

The existence of a finite equilibrium separation indicates a competition between short-range repulsion, due to elastic distortions, and long-range attraction caused by the asymmetry of the line tension associated with the edges of the opposite twist.

The passive fluctuation analysis only maps the binding potential within a few $k_B T$ around its minimum. To measure the entire binding potential, we performed active experiments where we moved one defect by $\delta s$ using an optical trap, while simultaneously measuring the force $F$ exerted on the other defect (Fig. 6 A and B). For this purpose, we embedded 1.5-µm-diameter colloidal beads into two adjoining cusp defects. Once placed there, beads remained attached to a defect for the entire duration of the experiment. To ensure that the beads do not alter the defect structure, we measured thermal fluctuations of a defect pair with and without embedded beads and found them to be identical within experimental error (Fig. S3). We then calibrated the trap to measure the zero force at the equilibrium distance $\delta s_0$ (Fig. S4) and determined the optimal laser power to measure the force $F$ (Fig. S5). We extracted the force as a function of $\delta s$, $F(\delta s)$, which is averaged over 10 identical experiments (Fig. 6 A and B). In the vicinity of the equilibrium separation, $\delta s_0$, the force measurements quantitatively agree with the fluctuation experiments described above. As expected, the force is negative below $\delta s_0$, and positive above $\delta s_0$, confirming that $\delta s_0$ is the stable equilibrium position. The force steeply increases for small separations and saturates at large separations, indicating that a defect pair is permanently bound. The magnitude of the force plateau and the slope of the force-increasing region depend on the number fraction $x_{fd}$. By moving farther away from the achiral limit, we find that the equilibrium distance between bound defects $\delta s_0$ decreases. These experiments also demonstrate that the pairwise defect interactions are governed by a balance between short-range repulsion and long-range attraction.

**Modeling the Interactions Between Two Adjacent Point Defects**

The theoretical model of scollop membranes has been studied previously (30). Here, we provide a quantitative comparison of this theoretical model to experimental data. To summarize, our model reduces the overall 3D geometry of the membrane to an isolated configuration around a point defect. The outward protrusions between two neighboring cusps must form via the interplay between the line tension $\gamma$, the interfacial bending rigidity $k_b$, and the geometrical variables associated with the overall membrane deformation. For an isolated defect, the free energy is then given by the following:

$$F_2 = \int dS (k \kappa_G + \sigma) + \sum_{i=1,2} \int ds_i \gamma \left( x_i + k_b \kappa_G^2 \right),$$

where $\kappa_G$ is the Gaussian curvature, $k$ is the corresponding elastic modulus (31), and $\sigma$ denotes the surface tension of the membrane. The two edge profiles (denoted by the index $i$) with opposite handedness meet at the point defect and are in general different, because their curvature $\kappa_{ij}$ and line tension $\gamma$ can be unequal. The relaxation length of each edge from a space curve to a straight line in the monolayer plane is given by the natural length scale $\xi \equiv \sqrt{k_b/\gamma}$ ($\xi \sim 0.5$ µm), where $k_b$ is the bending modulus of each edge. The bulk terms are integrated over the membrane surface with an area element $dS$, whereas the interfacial terms are integrated along the arc length with elements $ds$. We note that the mean curvature $H$ of the scollop membrane is absent in Eq. 1, because it can only contribute to the membrane free energy when there is a finite pressure difference of the surrounding aqueous solution above and below the membrane surface. However, in the presence of the free edges, the pressure difference vanishes in equilibrium, resulting in $H = 0$, that is, a minimal surface (Theoretical Methods). The stability of the scollop membrane with respect to a flat membrane is determined by the free-energy difference $\Delta F$ between the two configurations. Because we compare flat and scollop membranes with an equal area $S$, the surface tension $\sigma$ cancels out in $\Delta F$. Eq. 1 and its minimization procedure by a variational analysis, which yields the spring constant (Fig. 5D), the equilibrium defect separation (Fig. 5E), and the phase diagram (Fig. 6C), are discussed in detail in Theoretical Methods.

The structure of the scollop edge is determined by the balance between two contributions to the free energy, the line energy and the surface energy. On the one hand, the line energy suppresses the formation of outward protrusions and cusp defects, because they increase the total membrane circumference. On the other hand, each cusp defect generates negative Gaussian
curvature, which lowers the free energy of elastic deformations if the Gaussian modulus is positive and sufficiently large (30). Based on the interplay between these two contributions, our model predicts regions where scalloped membranes are more stable than flat circular membranes as a function of $k$ and $x_{\alpha}$ (Fig. 6C). To calculate this phase diagram, we have used theoretical fits to the experimental values for $\gamma_1$ and $k_0$ (Fig. S1 and Theoretical Methods). When the number fraction of the virus mixture deviates from $x_{\alpha}=0.26$, an increasing magnitude of $k$ is required to stabilize scalloped membranes (Fig. 6C). The reason is that, away from the achiral limit, one of the edges (e.g., associated with $\gamma_2$) has incompatible chirality with the preferred overall handedness along the membrane boundary. Consequently, the rods along that edge tilt into a high-energy configuration, as opposed to the molecules in the adjacent outward protrusion that has lower energy (with $\gamma_1$). This leads to $\Delta \gamma \equiv \gamma_2 - \gamma_1 > 0$, that is, the overall free energy of the scalloped membranes rises, and a long-range attractive interaction between two adjacent defects emerges. The two defects, however, cannot approach very close to each other because the surface in between must then flatten, leading to a diminishing negative Gaussian curvature that in turn raises the free energy. This yields short-ranged repulsive interactions between nearby defects (30, 32). The equilibrium defect separation is determined by the competition between these two effects.

Theoretical predictions for the defects separation length, $\delta_0$, and their coupling strength, $\sigma$, were fit to experimental measurements (Fig. 5 D and E; Theoretical Methods). The line tension $\gamma_1$ and the bending rigidity $k_0$ were taken from experiments (Fig. S1), whereas we took $\Delta \gamma$ and $k$ as fitting parameters. The power spectrum of the membrane edge fluctuations yields $\gamma_1$ and $k_0$ within $\sim10\%$ error. However, because $\gamma_2$ is very close to $\gamma_1$, measurements are not precise enough to extract the effective difference between them. Thus, $\Delta \gamma$ remains a free parameter, and we assume the polynomial form $\Delta \gamma = (115x_{\alpha} + 30)k_0T/\mu m$ that vanishes at $x_{\alpha}=0.26$ and becomes $30k_0T/\mu m$ at $x_{\alpha}=0$, that is, $\Delta \gamma$ stays within the bounds of experimental uncertainty. Likewise, theoretical fits to experimental curves yield the magnitude of the Gaussian modulus, $k = 200k_0T$.

The theory quantitatively reproduces how the effective defect interactions (coupling strength $\sigma$ and equilibrium separation $\delta_0$) depend on the number fraction of the virus $x_{\alpha}$, changing their long-range attraction due to $\Delta \gamma > 0$, and a short-range repulsion associated with membrane Gaussian curvature (Fig. 5 D and E). The modulus $\sigma$ as a function of $x_{\alpha}$, extracted from a linear approximation to the theoretical force-extension curves at the point where the force vanishes, qualitatively agrees with the experimental profiles (Fig. 5D). We note that, without the Gaussian curvature contribution, a simpler 2D theory modeling a flat and thermodynamically unstable scalloped membrane consistently yields smaller $\delta_0$ values than those from the 3D model presented here (Fig. S6). Hence, the Gaussian curvature term with a positive modulus explains the nature of in-plane and out-of-plane deformations as well as the overall stability of the scalloped membranes. Furthermore, the model with the same parameters also reproduces the optical tweezer measurements of the effective defect interactions over a much larger range of separations (Fig. 6B).

Certain precautions need to be taken when interpreting the extracted magnitude of the Gaussian modulus $k = 200k_0T$. In particular, another prediction of the model is that $k$ is equal to the product of the in-plane protrusion amplitude $A$ (Fig. 3F) and the line tension (30). This is because bigger protrusions would make the edge longer at constant $\gamma$, necessitating a higher $k$ to stabilize the scalloped membranes. At $x_{\alpha}=0.26$, when the protrusion size is $2 \mu m$ (Fig. 3A) and the line tension is $\gamma \sim 500k_0T/\mu m$ (Fig. 5D), the Gaussian modulus from this relation is found as $k = 2 \times 10^4 k_0T$. This value is almost an order of magnitude higher than $k = 200k_0T$ extracted for the theoretical fits (Fig. 5D and E). The resulting discrepancy between two estimates of the Gaussian modulus may be due to the fact that our model relies on a simple geometrical assumption, an axially symmetric catenoidal surface, which likely accumulates more negative Gaussian curvature than the experimental shape of the membrane surface. Therefore, our analysis underestimates the Gaussian modulus that stabilizes the scalloped membrane over a flat configuration. Theoretically, compromising axial symmetry or the smoothness of the surface around the cusp could yield a minimal saddle surface with a lower amount of the total Gaussian curvature. On the one hand, this would restore $k$ to higher values to stabilize the scalloped membranes and resolve the discrepancy between two estimates. On the other hand, this would greatly increase the complexity of our model. We note that, experimentally, the surface around the cusp must be governed by the local matching of the rod orientations, which may indeed form a non-smooth surface at the cusp. In this configuration, the structural relation between the Gaussian modulus, the protrusion amplitude, and the line tension must still hold, as discussed elsewhere (30).

There is a discrepancy between the experimental (Fig. 2A) and theoretical (Fig. 6C) phase diagrams because theory implies that at $k = 200k_0T$ there exist no stable flat membranes between $x_{\alpha}=0$ and $x_{\alpha}=1$. There may be two main reasons underlying the difference between the theoretical and experimental stability of the scalloped membranes. First, the theoretical phase diagram is calculated by quantifying only a point defect and the membrane deformations in its neighborhood, whereas the experimental stability of the scalloped membranes is governed by the overall membrane conformation associated with multiple defects (Fig. 2B and Fig. 3A). If the number of defect pairs is less than the overall membrane circumference can support, the scalloped membrane is still stable with respect to a flat membrane but would be in a metastable state. Experimentally, this might be the case, as is evident from the defect pair evolution as a function of chirality, leaving long flat sections between two successive pairs (Fig. 5A). Second, we assumed that $\Delta \gamma = 30k_0T/\mu m$ at $x_{\alpha}=0$ to fit the spring constant (Fig. 5D); however, $\Delta \gamma$ could be larger and could be a strongly decreasing function of $x_{\alpha}$. This would result in a steeper phase boundary away from $x_{\alpha}=0$, and an overall stabilization of flat monolayers away from the achiral limit.

Theoretical Estimate of Gaussian Curvature Modulus

A simple argument can be used to estimate the Gaussian curvature modulus, $k$, of colloidal membranes of thickness $D$, surrounded by the depleting polymers with radius of gyration, $R_g$. We assume that the polymers behave as an Asakura–Osawa ideal gas of particles with effective diameter $d$, which is related to polymer radius of gyration by the following: $d = 4R_g/\sqrt{\pi}$. There are two distinct contributions to $k$: an intrinsic contribution arising from the internal stresses among the virus particles $k_{\alpha}$, and an entropic contribution arising from the polymer depletants $k_p$. First, we consider the intrinsic contribution. Because it is fluid, we assume that the membrane middle surface membrane does not stretch when the membrane bends. The rods can adjust around each other to accommodate a change in curvature without changing their equilibrium spacing in the midplane. However, imposing any curvature onto a membrane will induce a strain that depends on $z$, the distance along the membrane normal away from the midplane. In particular, if the membrane has mean curvature $H$ and Gaussian curvature $K$, then the areal strain of the surface at distance $z$ is given by $\varepsilon(z) = 2Hz + Kz^2/2$ (33). The corresponding lateral membrane stress is $\sigma(z) = \sigma_0(z) + Yz$, where $\sigma_0(z)$ is the stress in the membrane when it is flat, and $Y$ is the modulus for areal compression. Because the rods are uniform along their lengths, we take $Y$ to be independent of $z$. The lateral stress is isotropic because the membrane is fluid. There is a compressive stress in the membrane even when it is flat because the polymer depletants squeeze the membrane (34). The total volume excluded...
to the polymers for a flat membrane of area $A$ is $\gamma_{\text{ex}} = A(D + d)$, leading to a contribution to the free energy per unit area $\gamma = n k_B T (D + d)$, which can also be considered an entropic tension (16). $n$ is polymer concentration. To balance this tension, the rods must experience a compressive stress $\sigma(z) = -nk_B T (D + d)/D$. To calculate the contribution to $k$ from the rods in the membrane with zero mean curvature, we write the membrane free energy per unit mid-surface by integrating the stress with the respect to the strain as

$$F_m = \int d^2 z \frac{1}{2} \kappa_0 dz \langle \sigma \rangle + \int d^2 z \langle \sigma \rangle \sigma'' \approx \int d^2 z \langle \sigma \rangle \sigma'' \approx \int d^2 z \langle \sigma \rangle \sigma'' \approx n k_B T (D + d)/D. $$

To estimate the polymer contribution to the Gaussian curvature modulus, we use the volume excluded to the depleting polymer will yield a larger polymer concentration. To balance this tension, the rods must experience a compressive stress $\sigma(z) = -nk_B T (D + d)/D$. Next, we consider the contribution of the depleting polymer to the total free energy of the system. In general, as the membrane assumes a curved configuration, the volume excluded to the depleting polymers and, thus, will increase the overall system entropy. This excluded volume effect introduces a positive contribution to the Gaussian modulus. Integrating across the membrane thickness and using $F_p = nk_B T \Gamma_{sl} \approx \gamma D' + k_B T \kappa_0 \int d A \kappa_0 \approx \gamma D' k_B T/12$. The net Gaussian curvature modulus is therefore $k = k_0 + k_\infty \approx D' k_B T/6$, where the approximation follows because the membrane is much thicker than the polymer particles, $D >> d$.

To estimate the polymer contribution to the Gaussian curvature modulus, we use $n \sim 40 \text{ mg/mL}$, $D \sim 880 \text{ nm}$, and $d \sim 30 \text{ nm}$ for a dextran with molecular weight of $500,000 \text{ g/mol}$ (36). With these numbers, we find that $k \approx 185$ $k_B T$. Despite its approximate nature, our estimate yields the magnitude $k$ that is in reasonable agreement with experimental measurements. Note that our argument for the polymer contribution is similar to the model put forward to explain negative Gaussian curvature modulus for surfactant interfaces: for a saddle-splay surface with $H = 0$, there is less room for the surfactant chains, which therefore must stretch and incur a higher free energy (37).

Discussions and Conclusions

Our combined theoretical and experimental work demonstrates that membranes composed of achiral rod-like viruses exhibit higher structural complexity compared with flat membranes assembled from achiral rod-like viruses. In the latter case, strong chirality enforces a uniform twist of rods along the entire membrane circumference, leading to the formation of flat 2D disks. By contrast, weakly achiral or achiral membranes exhibit an intriguing instability that is driven by an interplay between the Gaussian curvature of a colloidal membrane and the spontaneous achiral symmetry breaking of rods located at the membrane’s edge. The achiral symmetry breaking induces formation of cusp-like defects. These defects in turn allow the membrane to adopt a 3D shape that decreases the overall energy associated with its negative Gaussian curvature. Despite the important role it plays in diverse processes, measuring the Gaussian modulus of conventional lipid bilayers remains a significant experimental challenge. In comparison, the properties of the colloidal membranes described here allow us to estimate their Gaussian modulus. Conventional bilayers have a negative Gaussian modulus, which means that saddle-shaped deformations increase the membrane energy (7, 10, 11, 38). On the contrary, experiments described here, as well as previous observations of diverse assemblies with excess Gaussian curvatures such as arrays of pores and twisted ribbons (19, 26), demonstrate that colloidal monolayers, in contrast to lipid bilayers, have positive Gaussian moduli.

Achiral symmetry breaking has been observed in diverse soft systems with orientational order, ranging from lipid monolayers and nematic tactoids to confined chromic liquid crystals (39–45). In particular, the measured structure and interactions of the cusp-like defects in colloidal membranes resemble studies of point defects moving along a liquid crystalline dislocation line in the presence of chiral additives (46). The main difference is that in the colloidal membranes the achiral symmetry breaking leads to out-of-plane 3D membrane distortions that couples liquid crystal physics to membrane deformations. This is not possible for inherently confined liquid crystalline films.

From an entirely different perspective, a number of emerging techniques have been developed to fold, wrinkle, and shape thin elastic sheets with in-plane elasticity (47–50). So far, these efforts were focused on studying instability of thin elastic films with finite in-plane shear modulus. The methods to achieve folding or wrinkling of thin sheets involves either engineering of in-plane heterogeneities or imposing an external force. Our work demonstrates that simpler uniform elastic sheets lacking in-plane rigidity can spontaneously assume complex 3D folding patterns that decorate its edge. Finally, methods described here and in our previous work should be applicable to any monodisperse rod type with sufficiently large aspect ratio. Thus, they might offer a scalable method for robust assembly of photovoltaic devices composed of nanorods. Our previous investigation of chiral fd-vt colloidal membranes demonstrated that the twist at their edges introduces a significant energetic barrier that suppresses their lateral coalescence (26). In such samples, membranes with diameters ranging from 10 to 100 μm are commonly found. Compared with chiral colloidal membranes, we find that colloidal membranes of monodisperse virus mixtures that are close to the achiral limit coalesce much faster and can easily reach millimeter dimensions.

Materials and Methods

Sample Preparation. Both viruses, fd and fd-Y21M, were grown in bacteria and purified as described elsewhere (19), fd-Y21M, has a single point mutation in the amino acid sequence of the major coat protein: amino acid number 21 is replaced from Y to M. fd and fd-Y21M were labeled with fluorescent dye as described elsewhere (51). The preparation of optical chambers was described elsewhere (19).

Optical Microscopy. Experiments were carried out on an inverted microscope (Nikon TE 2000) equipped with traditional polarization optics, a differential interference contrast (DIC) module, a fluorescence imaging module, and 2D-LC-PolScope module for dual-view fluorescence imaging, we used DU2V from PhotometriX. We used a 100x oil-immersion objective (PlanFluo, N.A. 1.3, for DIC and PlanApo, N.A. 1.4, for phase contrast). Images were recorded with cooled CCD cameras (CoolSnap HQ (Photometric) or Retiga Exi (Qimaging)). For 3D-LC-PolScope measurements, we used a Zeiss Axiosvert 200M microscope with a Plan Apochromat oil-immersion objective (63x/1.4 N.A.) and a monochrome CCD camera (Retiga 4000R, Qimaging).

Laser Tweezers. A 1,064-nm laser (Coherent Compass) was brought into the optical path of an inverted microscope (Nikon Eclipse Te2000-u) and focused with a 100x objective onto the image plane (Nikon PlanFluo, N.A. 1.3). To simultaneously trap multiple beads, a single beam was time shared between different positions using an acousto-optic deflector (IntraAction-276HD) (52). Bead position was measured using back focal plane interferometry and a quadrant photodiode (QPD) (53). A separate 830-nm laser (Point Source iFlex-2000) was used as a detection beam. To calibrate the photodiode, we scan a bead across the detection beam in known step sizes and measure the corresponding voltage change. Trap stiffness was calibrated by analyzing the power spectrum of the bead position (53).

Acknowledgments. We acknowledge conversations with William Irvine, Robert Pelcovits, and Leroy Jia. We also acknowledge use of Brandeis Materials Research Science and Engineering Centers (MRSEC) optical and biomaterial synthesis facility supported by National Science Foundation (NSF) Grant MRSEC-1420382. T.G. acknowledges the Agence Nationale de la Recherche Française (Grant ANR-11-PDOC-027) for support, P.S., C.N.K., R.B.M., and Z.D. acknowledge support of NSF through Grants MRSEC-1420382 and NSF-DMR-1609742. T.R.P. acknowledges support of the NSF through Grants MRSEC-1420382 and NSF-CMMI-1634552. R.D.K. was partially supported by a Simons Investigator grant and Grant NSF-DMR-1626047.

Gibaud et al.
22. Pouget E, Grelet E, Lettinga MP (2011) Dynamics in the smectic phase of stiff viral...

24. Barry E, Beller D, Dogic Z (2009) A model liquid crystalline system based on rodlike...

28. Oldenbourg R (2008) Polarized light field microscopy: An analytical method using a...

12. Barry E, Dogic Z (2010) Entropy driven self-assembly of nonamphiphilic colloidal...

14. Yang Y, Barry E, Dogic Z, Hagan MF (2012) Self-assembly of 2D membranes from...

15. Kaplan CN, Meyer RB (2014) Colloidal membranes of hard rods: Unified theory of free...

17. Helfrich W (1974) The size of bilayer vesicles generated by sonication.

19. Gibaud T, et al. (2012) Reconfigurable self-assembly through chiral control of in-

21. Lipowsky R (1991) The conformation of membranes. Nature 349:475-481.

23. Kamien RD (2002) The geometry of soft materials: A primer. Rev Mod Phys 74:953.

24. Evans E, Rawicz W (1990) Entropy-driven tension and bending elasticity in condensed-

25. Brochard F, Lennon J (1975) Frequency spectrum of the flicker phenomenon in...

26. Helfrich W (1977) Elastic model for lipid bilayers. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 74:5360–5364.

27. Helfrich W (1979) Elasticity theory for lipid bilayers. Biophys J 25:185–192.

29. Sharma P, Ward A, Gibaud T, Hagan MF, Dogic Z (2014) Hierarchical organization of...

30. Kaplan CN, Gibaud T, Meyer RB (2013) Intrinsic curvature determines the crinkled edges of “crenelated disks.” Soft Matter 9:8210-8215.

31. Deuling HJ, Helfrich W (1976) The curvature elasticity of fluid membranes: A cata-

32. Tu H, Pelcovits RA (2013) Theory of self-assembled smectic-A crenellated disks: Membranes with cusped edges. Phys Rev E Stat Nonlin Soft Matter Phys 87:032504.

33. Safran SA (1994) Statistical Thermodynamics of Surfaces, Interfaces, and Membranes (Perseus Books, Cambridge, MA).

34. Asakura S, Oosawa F (1954) On interaction between two bodies immersed in a so-

35. Semrau S, Idema T, Holtzer L, Schmidt T, Storm C (2008) Accurate determination of...

36. Senti FR, et. al. (1995) Viscosity, sedimentation, and light-scattering properties of fraction of an acid-hydrolyzed dextran. J Polym Sci, Polym Phys Ed 17:527–546.

37. Milner S, Witten T (1988) Bending moduli of polymeric surfactant interfaces. J Phys...

38. Siegel DP, Kozlov MM (2004) The gaussian curvature elastic modulus of N-

39. Viswanathan R, Sadzinski JA, Schwartz DK (1994) Spontaneous chiral-symmetry breaking by achiral molecules in a Langmuir-Blodgett-film. Nature 368:440–443.

40. Link DR, et al. (1997) Spontaneous formation of macroscopic chiral domains in a fluid smectic phase of achiral molecules. Science 278:1924–1927.

41. Hough LE, et al. (2009) Helical nanofilament phases. Science 325:456–460.

42. Hough LE, et al. (2009) Chiral isotropic liquids from achiral molecules. Science 325:452–456.

43. Tortora L, Laurentovich OD (2011) Chiral symmetry breaking by spatial confinement in...

44. Jeong J, Davidson ZS, Collings PJ, Lubensky TC, Yodh AG (2014) Chiral symmetry breaking and surface faceting in chromonic liquid crystal droplets with giant elastic anisotropy. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 111:1742–1747.

45. Jeong J, et al. (2015) Chiral structures from achiral liquid crystals in cylindrical capillaries. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 112:E1837–E1844.

46. Zywocinski A, Pawlik K, Holyst R, Oswald P (2005) Chirality-biased point defects dy-

47. Cerda E, Mahmoud L (2003) Geometry and physics of wrinkling. Phys Rev Lett 90:...

48. King H, Schroll RD, Davidovitch B, Menon N (2012) Elastic sheet on a liquid drop re-

49. Povinville L, et al. (2008) Stress and fold localization in thin elastic membranes.

50. Leocmach M, Nespoulous M, Manneville S, Gibaud T (2015) Hierarchical wrinkling in a...

51. Lettinga MP, Barry E, Dogic Z (2005) Self-diffusion of rod-like viruses in the nematic phase. Europhys Lett 71:692.

52. Molloy JE (1998) Optical chopsticks: Digital synthesis of multiple optical traps.

53. Allersma MW, Gritts F, deCastro MJ, Stewart RJ, Schmidt CF (1998) Two-dimensional tracking of ncd motility by back focal plane interferometry. Biophys J 74:1074–1085.

54. Zou Y, Chen J (1998) Optical tweezers: Application to the study of single cells. Science 279:99–101.

55. Kaplan CN (2012) Colloidal membranes: The rich confluence of geometry and liquid...

56. Miller S, Parkinson GD (1977) Elements of Differential Geometry (Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ).

57. Nitsche J (1989) Lectures on Minimal Surfaces (Chapman & Hall/CRC, London).

58. Stoker J (1969) Differential Geometry (Wiley, New York).

59. Foshty GE, Moler CB, Malcolm MA (1976) Computer Methods for Mathematical Computations (Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ).