INTRODUCTION

In the first pediatric blood lead study in Thimphu and Phuentsholing, 44% of infants and children tested had blood lead levels (BLLs) ≥5 μg/dL and 80% had BLLs ≥3.3 μg/dL. There is no known safe level of lead, and there is no treatment to remove all lead from one's body. Preventing the exposure to lead is critical.

Lead is a naturally occurring metal which has been used for centuries and is still used today. Lead can be found in a host of products globally, including some paints, batteries, petroleum products, toys, pipes, ceramics, spices, cosmetics, and traditional medicines. However, sources of lead are geographically unique, varying with historical or ongoing use of products containing lead. For example, the use of lead is associated with certain industries, cultural practices, and artisan work. For this reason, when lead poisoning is present, local environmental data is necessary to determine the sources of lead in a community or region.

Lead is highly poisonous and is a potent neurotoxin. Studies have shown that children who even have blood lead levels below 5 μg/dL can have neurological impairment, revealed in learning problems, poor school performance, and behavioral changes. A 2017 Lancet article found that children with BLLs ≥5 μg/dL had lower IQ scores and a lower socioeconomic status three decades later as adults. In 2020, UNICEF published a comprehensive report on lead poisoning in developing countries among children, which highlights how extensive the problem is.

Multiple medical problems in adults and economic problems are also associated with lead exposure. Lead has been associated with cardiovascular, immunological, renal, reproductive, and endocrine problems. A 2018 article in Lancet Public Health concluded that low-level environmental lead exposure is an overlooked risk factor for cardiovascular disease and death. It stated that lead prevention programs were necessary to further lower cardiovascular disease rates in developed countries. The damage lead causes is irreversible and long-lasting.

Infants and children often put their fingers, toys or other objects in their mouths. When lead is present in the environment, this behavior results in direct ingestion of lead. Eating with hands contaminated by lead can also result in ingestion of lead. If lead is present in dust, it can also be inhaled.
Prevention is critical to reducing and eliminating lead poisoning. For this reason, when lead poisoning is present, local environmental data is necessary to determine the potential sources of lead in a community. In other countries, lead poisoning has been traced to excessive amount of lead in paints, toys, spices, and other items. However, the lack of local data on the potential sources of lead in Bhutan makes prevention nearly impossible.

As infants and children absorb the most lead and have the longest duration of disability, local data is needed to design and implement effective prevention strategies. The objective of this study was to search for potential sources of lead in the environments of children in and around Thimphu.

METHODS

Design
An environmental surveillance study using a portable X-ray Fluorescence (pXRF) analyzer was conducted to search for potential sources of lead in the environments of children. Environmental studies from other countries searching for the sources of lead in children’s environments were reviewed to find items to test in this study. Paint on walls, furniture and other painted items, toys, playground equipment, and soil were analyzed in this study.

Study setting/sites
Bhutan is a developing landlocked country nestled in the Himalayan mountains between India and China. The projected 2022 population of Bhutan was approximately 763,000 and Thimphu Dzongkhag is 158,000. Due to Covid-19 travel restrictions, convenient sampling was used to select 28 testing sites in and outside of Thimphu thromde (city limits) where children typically visit. Hospitals, primary health centers, early childhood care and development (ECCD) & daycare centers, créche facilities, schools, and public parks were selected for inclusion in the study.

Data collection
Prior to data collection, all researchers using the portable XRF were given radiation safety and XRF testing training. Researchers were divided into two teams for testing at different sites. At each site, XRF analysis was done on painted walls, furniture, painted items accessible to children, and to soil. At sites where toys and playground equipment were present, XRF testing was also done on those items.

The XRF results were recorded on a data collection form to document the location of paint or item tested, color of paint, and a description of any test that had elevated levels of lead. Testing was conducted between May 2021 and April 2022.

All testing was conducted using the same Olympus Vanta C-series portable XRF with an Ag X-ray tube with lead paint, RoHS (Restriction of Hazardous Substances), and soil methods. The cut off values used to define excessive amounts of lead in tested items were lead levels greater than: 1 mg/cm² for lead paint using the lead paint method, 1,300 ppm (parts per million) using the RoHS method, and 400 ppm for soil samples using the soil method.

Data analysis
Test results from each site were manually tabulated and entered into Microsoft Excel. Total counts and percentages of positive results by site and type of item tested were calculated. All tests identifying lead were analyzed to determine any patterns in items which contained lead.

Ethical considerations
The research proposal was submitted to Bhutan’s Research Ethics Board of Health, and an exemption (REBH/PO/2021/055) was granted. Before testing, approval was also requested from necessary authorities after providing information about the study and addressing all questions. Care was taken to conduct tests at a safe distance from children and bystanders to prevent any radiation exposure.

RESULTS

A total of 777 XRF analyses were conducted at 28 sites. A distribution of the categories of testing sites, the distribution of sites inside and outside the thromde, and the total number of analyses conducted by category is listed in Table 1. The number of XRF analyses at each testing site ranged from 8–130, depending on the size of the site.

Of the 777 XRF analyses, 2.1% of the analyses found excessive amounts of lead. The distribution of items analyzed

| Category of testing site          | Testing sites | Sites inside thromde | Sites outside thromde | Tests done |
|----------------------------------|---------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|------------|
| Primary Health Centers           | 8             | 3                     | 5                     | 139        |
| Schools                          | 5             | 1                     | 4                     | 189        |
| Playground/parks                 | 4             | 4                     | 0                     | 105        |
| Creche facilities                | 4             | 4                     | 0                     | 81         |
| ECCD/Daycare*                    | 4             | 2                     | 2                     | 85         |
| Hospitals                        | 3             | 2                     | 1                     | 178        |
| Total                            | 28            | 16                    | 12                    | 777        |

Note: Testing of playground equipment at ECCD/Daycare centers are included in the ECCD/Daycare category and hospitals are included in the playground/park category.

*Early Childhood Care Development Centres
as well as the number of analyses which were found to have excessive amounts of lead, above the cut-off value, are shown in Table 2. Paint on walls and other painted items constituted half of the analyses. Of the 16 items found to contain an excessive amount of lead, 15 were from paint or plastic items on playground equipment. Of the testing done at playgrounds, 14.4% of the analyses identified high levels of lead. The only other item with an excessive amount of lead was from a plastic dustpan.

Table 2. Number and percentage of tests and excessive lead found in different items tested by X-Ray Fluorescence, 2021 to 2022

| Item type                  | Excessive lead |   |   |
|----------------------------|----------------|---|---|
|                            | n* (%)         | n* (%) |   |
| Paint on walls             | 216 (27.8)     | 0 (0)   |   |
| Paint on other items‡      | 161 (20.7)     | 1 (0.6) |   |
| Toys                       | 130 (16.7)     | 0 (0)   |   |
| Furniture                  | 114 (14.7)     | 0 (0)   |   |
| Playground equipment       | 104 (13.4)     | 15 (14.4) |   |
| Soil                       | 52 (6.7)       | 0 (0)   |   |
| N† (%)                     | 777 (100)      | 16 (2.1) |   |

* number of respective item type; †percentage; ‡Included paint on doors, windows, window & door frames, hand railings, and other painted items which were not furniture or walls.

Table 3. Excessive lead level measured by colored item of playgrounds in Thimphu, Bhutan, 2021 to 2022

| Playground location | Material                  | Paint color | Value (mg/cm²) |
|---------------------|---------------------------|-------------|----------------|
| Centenary           | Painted metal pole        | Not listed  | 1.731          |
|                     | Painted cement bridge     | Green       | 1.402          |
|                     |                           | Blue        | 1.255          |
| Motithang           | Painted metal poles for different equipment | Yellow | 1.243          |
|                     |                           | Yellow      | 1.105          |
|                     |                           | Yellow      | 1.123          |
|                     |                           | Yellow      | 1.769          |
| JDWNRH*             | Plastic of enclosed slide | Red         | 5.000          |
|                     |                           | Yellow      | 3.056          |
|                     |                           | Green       | 1.460          |
|                     |                           | Yellow      | 4.800          |
|                     |                           | Orange      | 3.055          |
| Olakha              | Canopy wall               | Yellow      | 5.000          |
|                     | Canopy roof               | Orange      | 4.450          |
|                     | Round base                | Orange      | 4.450          |
|                     | Painted metal base        | Yellow      | 1.327          |

*Jigme Dorji Wangchuck National Referral Hospital

The findings from this initial XRF study searching for potential sources of lead in the environments of children in and around Thimphu were encouraging and concerning at the same time. This XRF study was a necessary first step in finding the sources of lead exposure in the environments of children in and around Thimphu. As all but one of this study’s excessive lead levels were found in playground equipment in public locations, one potential source of lead has been identified, however more sources are likely still present and not yet identified.

Overall, 2.1% of the XRF analyses conducted in this study were found to have excessive amounts of lead. Although testing was conducted at a variety of sites, all of the sites were limited to the locations in and around Thimphu due to covid-19 travel restrictions during the duration of data collection.

A study in Jakarta, Indonesia found 2.7% of all XRF analyses in 122 preschools and homes had excessive amounts of lead. Although this number is similar to our finding, testing was carried out in 13 different neighborhoods of varying age and socioeconomic levels, increasing the variety of sampling settings. Because of this diversity in the study design, testing done in 4 of 13 neighborhoods had no excessive lead paint, while other neighborhoods had as many as 2/3 of the sites with excessive lead in the paint10. As more sites in Bhutan are tested, the likelihood of finding excessive amounts of lead in paint will increase.

It was surprising no excessive lead in wall paints were found at any site in this study. Wall paint, especially paints which are older, have a higher chance of containing lead. Dust from lead paint is an important source of lead contamination wherever lead paint has been used. Although lead in paint is currently regulated in India, a 2015 National Report on lead in enamel household paint in India found 46% of tested paint had excessive amount of lead11. In a Jakarta, Indonesia study, 26.3% of preschools had at least one painted wall with excessive amounts of lead10. As Bhutan imports most of its paint from India and other neighboring countries, it is likely that lead-containing paint will still be found as additional XRF studies are conducted.

The most concerning finding in this study is that all the playground sites tested had playground equipment that tested positive for excessive amounts of lead. A description of the playground equipment testing positive for elevated lead is shown in Table 3. A majority (8/15) of the playground items with excessive levels of lead in the paint were from yellow colored paint, followed by green (3/15) and orange (2/15).
from Israel found 90% of paint tested on playground equipment and benches to have excessive amounts of lead\textsuperscript{13}.

The colors most often found on the playground equipment to have high amounts of lead were yellow, green and orange. Other studies have also found the colors yellow, orange, and green to have the highest levels of lead in paints tested\textsuperscript{12,14,15}.

**LIMITATIONS**

Being the first known XRF study in Bhutan, the items chosen to analyze were determined from international studies. This approach potentially missed some sources of lead which are unique to Bhutan. Also, as Covid-19 restrictions limited travel, the finding from this study are not representative for Bhutan.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

As lead research in Bhutan is in its infancy, larger combined blood lead level and XRF studies are necessary to further understand the prevalence of lead poisoning in children and to identify sources of lead in those children’s environments. Additional XRF studies of playgrounds and other areas infants and children visit are also necessary. Once additional data is available, environmental, and governmental policies will need to be developed or strengthened as well as public health initiatives started to reduce lead exposure.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Although this study was the first of its kind and limited in scope, one potentially important source of lead in children’s environment has been identified. As the extent of lead poisoning previously identified in infants and children was extensive, additional XRF studies will be required to identify other potential sources of lead in Bhutan.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

We want to thank the Ministry of Health for financial support and WHO country office support for the pXRF device. Also, a special thanks to the administrations of the health care facilities, schools, ECCDs, daycare & creche centers, and Thimphu Dzongkhag and Thromde for approval to conduct testing.

**REFERENCES**

1. Erbele P, Pem D, Tobgay P, Pelden S, Gurung MS, Ugen S, et al. Blood Lead Levels in children 2 through 59 months old in Bhutan. Bhutan Heal J. 2019 Nov;5(216):7–14. [Full Text | DOI]

2. Lanphear BP, Hornung R, Khoury J, Yolton K, Baghurst P, Bellinger DC, et al. Low-level environmental lead exposure and children’s intellectual function: An international pooled analysis. Environ Health Perspect. 2005;113(7):894–9. [PubMed | Full Text | DOI]

3. Reuben A, Caspi A, Belsky DW, Broadbent J, Harrington H, Sugden K, et al. Association of Childhood Blood Lead Levels With Cognitive Function and Socioeconomic Status at Age 38 Years and With IQ Change and Socioeconomic Mobility Between Childhood and Adulthood. Jama. 2017;317(12):1244. [PubMed | Full Text | DOI]

4. Rees N, Fuller R. The Toxic Truth : Children’s Exposure to Lead Poisoning Undermines a Generation of Future Potential. 2020;1–90. [Full Text]

5. Health Canada. Toxicological Review and Recommended Toxicological Reference Values for Environmental Lead Exposure in Canada. 2010:622. [Full Text]

6. Center for Disease Control and Prevention. Low Level Lead Exposure Harms Children: A Renewed Call for Primary Prevention. Report of the Advisory Committee on Childhood Lead Poisoning Prevention (ACCLP) of the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention 2012. [Full Text]

7. Navas-Acien A, Guallar E, Silbergeld EK, Rothenberg SJ. Lead exposure and cardiovascular disease - A systematic review. Environ Health Perspect. 2007;115(3):472–82. [PubMed | Full Text | DOI]

8. Liu Z, Yu Y, Li X, Wu A, Mu M, Li N, et al. Maternal lead exposure and risk of congenital heart defects occurrence in offspring. Reprod Toxicol. 2015;51:1–6. [PubMed | Full Text | DOI]

9. Lanphear BP, Rauch S, Auinger P, Allen RW, Hornung RW. Low-level lead exposure and mortality in US adults: a population-based cohort study. Lancet Public Heal. 2018;3(4):e177–84. [PubMed | Full Text | DOI]

10. Ericson B, Hariojati N, Susilorini B, Fisher L, Fuller R, Patrick M, et al. Assessment of the prevalence of lead-based paint exposure risk in Jakarta , Indonesia. Sci Total Environ. 2019;657:1382–8. [PubMed | Full Text | DOI]

11. Ipen. National Report Lead in Enamel Household paints in India In 2015. [Full Text]

12. Turner A, Kearl ER, Solman KR. Lead and other toxic metals in playground paints from South West England. Sci Total Environ. 2016;544:460–6. [PubMed | Full Text | DOI]

13. Berman T, Barnett-itzhaki Z, Reicher S, Ardi R, Shammai Y. Lead in spray paint and painted surfaces in playgrounds and public areas in Israel : Results of a pilot study. Sci Total Environ. 2018;637–638:455–9. [PubMed | Full Text | DOI]
AUTHORS CONTRIBUTION
Following authors have made substantial contributions to the manuscript as under:

DP: Concept, design, data collection and analysis, manuscript writing and review.
UW: Design, data collection and analysis, manuscript writing and review
NG: Design, data collection and analysis, manuscript writing and review
KW: Design, data collection and analysis, manuscript writing and review
CW: Design, data collection, manuscript review
PE: Concept, design, data collection and analysis, manuscript writing and review

Author agree to be accountable for all respects of the work in ensuring that questions related to the accuracy and integrity of any part of the work are appropriately investigated and resolved.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST
None

GRANT SUPPORT AND FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE
Ministry of Health, Thimphu, Bhutan

14. Hossain L, Salam MA, Das SR, Hossain I, Nahida SKN, mamun A, et al. Lead Content of Enamel Paints in Leading Paint Companies in Bangladesh. J Environ Sci Toxicol Food Technol. 2013;3(1):48–53. [Full Text]

15. Yusufu S, Musabila M. Lead-based paints and children’s PVC toys are potential sources of domestic lead poisoning - a review. Environ Pollut. 2019;249:1091–105. [PubMed | Full Text | DOI]