The burden of road traffic injury among trauma patients in Ethiopia

Endalamaw, Aklilu; Birhanu, Yeneabat; Alebel, Animut; Demsie, Amare; Habtewold, Tesfa Dejenie

Published in:
African journal of emergency medicine

DOI:
10.1016/j.afjem.2019.01.013

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:
2019

Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database

Citation for published version (APA):
Endalamaw, A., Birhanu, Y., Alebel, A., Demsie, A., & Habtewold, T. D. (2019). The burden of road traffic injury among trauma patients in Ethiopia: A systematic review and meta-analysis. African journal of emergency medicine, 9(Suppl.), S3-S8. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.afjem.2019.01.013

Copyright
Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Take-down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): http://www.rug.nl/research/portal. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.
The burden of road traffic injury among trauma patients in Ethiopia: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Aklilu Endalamawa,⁎ Yeneabat Birhanub, Animut Alebelc, Amare Demsiea, Tesfa Dejennie Habtewoldd

A Department of Pediatrics and Child Health Nursing, School of Nursing, College of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Gondar, Gondar, Ethiopia
b Department of Surgical Nursing, School of Nursing, College of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Gondar, Gondar, Ethiopia
c Department of Nursing, College of Health Science, Debre Markos University, Debre Markos, Ethiopia
d University of Groningen, University Medical Center Groningen, Department of Epidemiology, Groningen, The Netherlands

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Hospitals
Road traffic injury
Trauma patients
Ethiopia

ABSTRACT

Background: Road traffic injury (RTI) is one of the main reasons for trauma-related admission in Ethiopian hospitals. Nationally representative data is needed to develop and implement the public health emergency management strategy. Therefore, this study was aimed to estimate the national pooled prevalence of RTI among trauma patients in Ethiopia.

Methods: PubMed, Excerpta Medica Database (EMBASE), psycEXTRA, and Google Scholar databases were searched. Heterogeneity of studies was assessed using the I² statistics. Publication bias was checked by using funnel plot and Egger's regression test. The DerSimonian and Laird's random-effects model was used to estimate the pooled prevalence. Subgroup analysis was conducted by age and region. The trend of RTI estimated as well. Regional subgroup analysis showed that the pooled prevalence of RTI was 58.3% in the region of southern, nation, nationalities, and peoples (SNNPR) and 33.3% in Addis Ababa. Subgroup analysis based on patients age showed that the pooled prevalence of RTI was 51.7% in adults, 14.2% in children, and 32.6% in all age group. The time-trend analysis has shown an increasing burden of RTI in Ethiopian hospitals.

Conclusion: The burden of RTI among trauma patients was high. Therefore, strengthening road safety management throughout the country is needed to reduce RTI.

African relevance

- Road traffic injury is a major cause of global disability
- Likewise the burden of road traffic injury was found to be high in Ethiopia
- Strengthening road safety throughout the country is needed to reduce disability

Background

Road traffic injury (RTI) is one of the major causes of patient admission, which increases global disability-adjusted life years (DALYs) population [1] and health care expenditure ($518 billion USD per year) [2,3]. According to 2013 World Health Organization (WHO) report, nearly 20–50 million people were injured due to RTI [4], which attributes to an occurrence of 1.25 million road traffic deaths per year. The burden of DALYS is also apparent and listed under the top ten leading causes of disease [5,6].

In 2009, 1.8 million people injured in Europe, 2.8 million in Eastern Mediterranean, 4.1 million in Western Pacific, 4.7 million in Africa, and 8.6 million in Southeast Asia [7]. Based on 2000–2020 WHO projection, road traffic-related deaths expected to increase by 80% in low- and middle-income countries [8]. The estimated prevalence of RTI among trauma patients in sub-Sahara Africa was 32% [9]. RTI is a hidden epidemic causes of morbidity and mortality in developing countries [10] where by more than 90% of death are related with road traffic accidents [11]. Consequently, RTI will have a significant outcome on the social, economic, political, and health development of different countries [12–14].

To prevent RTI, road safety strategies such as control of driving...
speed and alcohol consumption, using seatbelt and helmet, designing safer roads and vehicles, and new traffic laws have been globally implemented [15]. However, the burden of RTI is not decreasing in various settings including hospitals.

In Ethiopia, the prevalence of RTI among trauma patients in hospital settings ranges from 1.3% [16] to 62.5% [17]. To date, several studies have been conducted in Ethiopia to determine the prevalence of RTI among trauma patients in hospital settings [18–24]. Nevertheless, substantial variability of results hinder generalization of studies. Thus, the national prevalence of RTI among trauma patients remains unknown. This meta-analysis was aimed to estimate the national burden of RTI among trauma patients in Ethiopian hospitals.

Methods

The result of this review was reported based on the Preferred Reporting Items for the Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses guideline (PRISMA) [25].

Searching strategy

PubMed, psycEXTRA, Excerpta Medica Database (EMBASE), and Google Scholar were searched using the following search terms: “injury”, “trauma”, “unintentional injury”, “intentional injury”, “road traffic injury”, “road traffic collision”, “trauma patient”, “injured patient”, “emergency”, “hospital”, “Ethiopia”. The search strategies were developed using “AND” and/or “OR” Boolean operators. Additional file 1 illustrated PubMed search string.

The inclusion criteria were: 1) hospital-based studies, 2) observational studies reported the prevalence of RTI among trauma patients, 3) studies conducted in Ethiopia, and 4) studies published in English.

Articles excluded were: 1) studies based on police reports, 2) studies excluded were: 1) studies based on police reports, 2) studies

Table 1

General characteristics of the included studies.

| Author/Year          | Region    | Sample size | Patient with RTI | Source population | Age of the participant | Quality of studies |
|----------------------|-----------|-------------|------------------|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------|
| Bashah DT et al./2015| Amhara    | 230         | 78               | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Tiruneh BT et al./2014| Addis Ababa| 356         | 131              | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Ayele TA et al./2017 | Amhara    | 616         | 245              | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Woldemichael K & Berhanu N/2011 | Oromia | 1102        | 334              | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Abebe GM et al./2006 | Oromia    | 452         | 6                | all types of trauma | Children              | Low risk           |
| Amdeslasie F et al./2016 | Tigray   | 600         | 85               | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Haillemichael F et al./2015 | SNNPs | 384         | 240              | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Wuhub Z & Tigist B/2014 | Addis Ababa| 380         | 84               | all types of trauma | Children              | Low risk           |
| Osman M et al./2003  | Amhara    | 1982        | 292              | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Taye M & Mune T/2003 | Addis Ababa| 3822        | 1568             | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Wolde A et al./2008  | Addis Ababa| 40,752      | 4523             | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Thomas F & Nebyou S/2014 | SNNPs | 345         | 184              | all types of trauma | Adults                | Low risk           |
| Kebede T et al./2008 | Addis Ababa| 9000        | 2178             | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Mengistu Z & Azaj A/2012 | Addis Ababa| 328         | 161              | all types of trauma | All ages               | Low risk           |
| Tiruneh BT et al./2017 | Amhara | 893         | 173              | all types of trauma | Children              | Low risk           |
| Admasie D et al./2010 | Addis Ababa| 422         | 202              | musculoskeletal trauma | Adults                | Low risk           |
| Anderl I et al./2014 | Oromia    | 52          | 26               | Head trauma         | All ages               | Low risk           |
didn’t report the prevalence of RTI in hospitals, and 3) studies published before 2000. We excluded studies published before 2000 to generate globally fitted data. Global estimation about the burden of RTI was considered the year from 2000 to 2020.

Two reviewers independently evaluated the titles and abstracts of all retrieved studies. These articles passed the title and abstract screening process were further eligible for full-text review. The full-text of the eligible articles were reviewed by two authors. The disagreement was handled based on the settled inclusion and exclusion criteria. Whenever the disagreement would continue, the third reviewer was involved for final decision.

The Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) quality assessment criteria [26] was used to assess the quality of included studies. The criteria were: 1) appropriate sampling frame and technique, 2) sample size adequacy, 3) description of study participants and setting, 4) data analysis with sufficient coverage of sample, 5) using of valid measurement, 6) application of valid measurement for all participants, 7) using of appropriate statistical analysis, and 8) response rate. Two reviewers assessed the quality of included studies. The procedure was repeated whenever disagreement happened. Studies scored ≥50% of the quality assessment criteria were considered low risk of bias.

Two independent reviewers extracted the following data: first author and year, study region, study design, target population, sample size, and prevalence. Reviewers cross-checked for variations in the extracted data. The discrepancies were handled by discussion and re-evaluating the full-text.

The aim of this review was to answer the question “what is the percentage of RTI among trauma patients in Ethiopian hospitals?” The included studies reported the prevalence of RTI among trauma patients in Ethiopian hospitals.

Endnote X-7 reference manager software was used to manage the selection process. STATA version 14 (Stata Corp, College Station, TX, USA) was used for the meta-analysis. Potential publication bias was checked by funnel plot and Egger’s regression test [27]. Heterogeneity of studies was assessed using the I² statistics. The DerSimonian and Laird’s random-effects model [28] was used to estimate the pooled prevalence of RTI among trauma patients. Subgroup analysis by region and age was conducted. The leave-one-out sensitivity analysis was done to assess the effect of individual study on the pooled estimate. In addition, the time-trend analysis was employed to investigate change in...
the burden of RTI over time.

Result

A total of 706 articles were retrieved through searching electronic databases: 654 articles from PubMed, 11 from Excerpta Medica Database (EMBASE), 19 from psycEXTRA, and 22 from Google Scholar. Following a stringent screening process, 17 cross-sectional studies with 61,716 trauma patients were included in the final meta-analysis (Fig. 1).

As presented in Table 1, six studies were published between 2003 and 2010 [16,20–22,24,29] and 11 studies were between 2011 and 2017 [17–19,23,30–36]. Regarding geographical distribution of studies, seven studies were conducted in Addis Ababa [18–24], four in Amhara [29–31,36], three in Oromia [16,32,35], two in SNNP [17,34], and one in Tigray region [33]. None of the included studies were excluded due to poor quality.

Meta-analysis

Fig. 2 shows the distribution of included studies. The symmetrical funnel plot (Fig. 2) and non-significant Egger’s regression test (P = 0.243) revealed the absence of publication bias.

The pooled prevalence of RTI among trauma patients in Ethiopia was 31.5% (95% CI: 25.4%, 37.7%; I² = 99.6%, p < 0.001) (Fig. 3).

Based on regional subgroup analysis, the pooled prevalence of RTI among trauma patients was high in SNNPR (58.3%) followed by Addis Ababa (33.3%) (Fig. 4). Moreover, subgroup analysis based on patients age, the pooled prevalence of RTI was 51.7% in adults, 14.2% in children, and 32.6% in all age group (Fig. 5).

The time-trend analysis showed that RTI among trauma patients in Ethiopian hospitals has risen from 2003 to 2017 (Fig. 6).

The leave-one-out analysis showed that the minimum (29.6%) and maximum (33.5%) prevalence was observed when Hailemichael F et al./2015 [17] and Abebe GM et al./2006 [16] excluded from the overall analysis respectively (Table 2).

Discussion

This study revealed that the pooled prevalence of RTI among trauma patients in Ethiopian hospitals was 31.5%. This finding was comparable with a prevalence report in sub-Saharan Africa (32%) [9] and low- and middle-income countries (13% to 31%) [14]. Although low-income countries have nearly half of the world’s vehicles, the majority of vehicles accident had been occurred in these countries [37] and the burden of RTI in the hospitals become still higher than the developed world.

Based on the regional subgroup analysis, the pooled prevalence of RTI was high in SNNPR followed by Addis Ababa, whereas low prevalence was observed in Tigray region. This discrepancy might be
attributed to high traffic flow in Addis Ababa, in which by the year 2013 more than 16,422 public transportation buses were recorded [38]. In SNNPR, poor road transportation could be a contributing factor to the high burden of RTI. The lowest prevalence in Tigray region might be due to only a single study found and somehow a good road construction has been implemented in this region. In addition, the Tigray ethnic group political dominance since 1991 may leads to good road construction and a lower burden of RTI as a result. Furthermore, the low burden of RTI might be related with population size, low motorization, and strict rules and regulations on driving license accreditation [39].

Our study showed that the burden of RTI in adults higher than...
consequences. The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ajem.2019.01.013.

References

[1] Murray CJ, Vos T, Lozano R, Naghavi M, Flaxman AD, Michaud C, et al. Disability-adjusted life years (DALYs) for 291 diseases and injuries in 21 regions, 1990–2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010. Lancet 2012;380(9859):2197–223.

[2] Finkelstein E, Corso PS, Miller TR. The incidence and economic burden of injuries in the United States. Oxford University Press, USA; 2006.

[3] Commission for Global Road Safety. Safe roads for all: a post-2015 agenda for health and development: Foundation for the Automobile & Society (FIA). London, UK; 2013.

[4] World Health Organization. Global status report on road safety. Geneva, Switzerland; 2013.

[5] Toroyan T. Global status report on road safety: Time for action. WHO 2009.

[6] Peden M,Scarfield B,Steet D,Mohan D,Hyder AA,Jarawam E,etal.World report on road traffic injury prevention. World Health Organization Geneva; 2004.

[7] Paniker J, Graham SM, Harrison JW. Global trauma: the great divide. SICOT J 2015;1.

[8] World Health Organization. World report on road traffic injury prevention. Geneva, Switzerland; 2004.

[9] Vissoci JRN, Shogilev DJ, Krbes E, Andrade LD, Vieira IF, Toomey N, et al. Road traffic injury in Sub-Saharan African countries: a systematic review and summary of observational studies. Traffic Injury Prevention 2017;18(7):767–763.

[10] Hazen A, Ehiri JE. Road traffic injuries: hidden epidemic in less developed countries. J Natl Med Assoc 2006;98(11):73.

[11] Bhatta K, Shotten M, Cohen A, Brauner M, Shahrar S, Burnett R, et al. Transport for health: the global burden of disease from motorized road transport. TRID 2014;11(39).

[12] World Health Organization. Global status report on road safety: time for action. Geneva, Switzerland: 2009.

[13] Alemu MH. Patterns of pre hospital fatal injuries in Mekelle, Ethiopia. Ethiopian Med J 2008;46(2):179–83.

[14] Odero W, Garner P, Zvi A. Road traffic injuries in developing countries: a comprehensive review of epidemiological studies. Trop Med Int Health 1997;2(5):445–60.

[15] Bruhuber JRG, Brasher P, Erdelyi S, Desapriya E, Asbridge M, et al. Reduction in fatalities, ambulance calls, and hospital admissions for road trauma after implementation of new traffic laws. Am J Public Health 2011;101(10):e89–97.

[16] Haillemichael F, Saleiman M, Paolos W. Magnitude and outcomes of road traffic accidents at Hospitals in Wolaita Zone, SNNRPR, Ethiopia. BMC Res Notes 2015;8(1):135.

[17] Tirohi BT, Dachew BA. Stiff BF. Incidence of road traffic injury and affected factors among patients visiting the emergency department of Tikur Anbessa specialized teaching hospital, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Ethiopian Med J 2014;2014.

[18] Wubshet T, Zigit B. A cross-sectional study to assess the paternal收费标准 childhood injuries at TikurAnbessa Hospital. Addis Ababa University Ethiopia; 2014.

[19] Taye M, Munie T. Trauma registry in Tikur Anbessa Hospital, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Ethiopian Med J 2003;41(3):221–6.

[20] Wolde A, Abdelka K, Ahmed E, Tsegaye F, Bahaniy O, Kebusinuge O, et al. Pattern of injuries in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: a one-year descriptive study. East Central Afr J Surgery 2008;13(2):14–22.

[21] Kebede T, Mekonnen T, Bartolomeis K, Taye M, Munie T, Melesas M. Injury surveillance in six hospitals of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Ethiopian Med J 2008;46(4):383–90.

[22] Mengistu Z, Aaz A. Trauma severities scores and their prediction of outcome among trauma patients in two hospitals of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Ethiop Med J 2012;50(3):211–7.

[23] Admassie D, Virgo T, Wamisbo BL. Brief communication: Adult limb fractures in Tikur Anbessa Hospital caused by road traffic injuries: Hay fever strain radiographic pattern. Ethiopian J Health Dev 2010;24(1).

[24] PRISMA. PRISMA transparent reporting of systematic reviews and meta-analyses. Available from http://www.prisma-statement.org/documents/PRISMA-P.

[25] Joanna Briggs Institute. Critical Appraisal Tools Australia: The University of Adelaide; 2018. Available from: http://joannabriggs.org/research/critical-appraisal-tools.html.

[26] Egger M, Smith GD, Schneider M, Minder C. Bias in meta-analysis detected by a simple, graphical test. BMJ 1997;315(7109):629–34.

[27] Borenstein M, Hedges LV, Higgins J, Rothstein HR. A basic introduction to fixed-effect and random-effects models for meta-analysis. Res Synthesis Methods 2010;1(2):97–111.

[28] Osman M, Kebede Y, Anberbir S. Magnitude and pattern of injuries in north Gondar administrative area, northwest Ethiopia. Ethiop Med J 2003;41(2):93–107.

[29] Bashah DT, Dachew BA, Tinereh BT. Prevalence of injury and associated factors among patients visiting the Emergency Departments of Amhara Regional State Referral Hospitals, Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. BMC Emerg Med 2015;15:120.

[30] Ayse TA, Zeleke BM, Tesemma GA, Melak MF. Magnitude and patterns of injuries among patients in Gondar university hospital, northwest Ethiopia: an institutional-based study. Open Access Surgery 2017;10:25–31.

[31] Woldemicheal K, Berhanu N. Magnitude and pattern of injury in jimma university specialized hospital, South West Ethiopia. Ethiopian J Health Sci 2011;21(3).

[32] Amedeslie F, Kidanu M, Berevo W, Ali D. Patterns of trauma in patient seen at the emergency clinics of public hospitals in Mekelle, northern Ethiopia. Ethiop Med J 2016;54(2).

[33] Thomas Fako N. Pattern of injuries and associated factors in patients visiting the emergency department of Havaana university referral hospital; 2014.

[34] Anderel G, Gashaw T, Siebeck M, Mutschler W. Head injury-a neglected public health problem: a four-month prospective study at Jimma University specialized hospital, Ethiopia. Ethiop J Health Sci 2014;24(2):77–83.

[35] Tinereh BT. Factors associated with unintentional injury among the paediatric age population in the hospitals of amhara national regional. Ethiopia: State University of Health Science; 2017.

[36] World Health Organization. Global status report on Road Safety. Geneva, Switzerland; 2015.

[37] Number of Passenger Cars in Addis Ababa [press release]. 2013. Available from http://www.nationmaster.com/country-info/press-release/Ethiopia-1990-2011.

[38] International Organization for Migration. Country Fact Sheet Ethiopia. 2014. Available from https://www.iom.int/countries/ethiopia.

[39] World Health Organization. Global Plan for the Decade of Action for Road Safety 2011–2020. Geneva, Switzerland: 2011.