Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company’s public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
Online popularity as a development factor for cooperatives in the winegrowing sector

Enrique Bernal-Jurado, Adoración Mozas-Moral, Domingo Fernández-Uclés, Miguel Jesús Medina-Viruel

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Keywords:
- Winegrowing sector
- Cooperatives
- Websites
- Organic agriculture
- Fuzzy-set qualitative comparative analysis (fsQCA)

A B S T R A C T

Spain is a global leader in the wine sector in terms of production capacity, which is in stark contrast to its low domestic wine consumption. This situation forces Spanish producers to develop a clear focus on exports. Traditionally, the business model in Spain has been based on low prices, high volumes, and a strong dependence on traditional markets, which places Spain at a clear competitive disadvantage in terms of value. Given these commercial challenges in this sector, where cooperatives play a central role, information and communication technologies, particularly websites, offer a source of competitive advantage. The main aim of this research is to analyze the organizational factors and commercial features that are associated with the online popularity of wine producers. This study seeks to verify the influence of organizational aspects (company size and integration), commercial features (sales of bottled wine, internationalization, and organic certification), and website quality on the popularity of corporate websites. The analysis was conducted using fuzzy-set qualitative comparative analysis (fsQCA). The results reveal that the number of website visits is positively related to business integration, organic certification, export activity, website quality, and the marketing of bottled wine.

1. Introduction

Spain plays a leading role in wine production worldwide (International Organization of Vine and Wine, OIV, 2018). According to the figures for wine production, Spain is the third largest producer worldwide, with a production of 32.1 million hectoliters in 2017. However, this high production is in contrast to domestic wine consumption, where the Spanish market is only the seventh largest worldwide (OIV, 2018). This disparity between domestic wine production and consumption in Spain forces Spanish producers to adopt a clear orientation toward foreign markets.

Accordingly, Spain has become the world leader in terms of export volume in recent years, exporting more than 235,000 hectoliters in 2017. However, Spain has only the third largest turnover, with a value of wine exports of 3 billion euros. This situation reflects the traditional business model, which is based on low prices, high volume, and a strong dependence on traditional markets. This model has placed Spanish producers that operate in foreign markets at a clear competitive disadvantage in terms of value (Cervera & Compés, 2018).

The central role of cooperatives in the Spanish wine sector is important. According to Cooperativas Agro-alimentarias (2011), agricultural cooperatives produce 60% of the wine in Spain but bottle, in general terms, less than 5% of their production. Cooperatives account for more than 40% of vineyards, covering 58% of the wine-producing area.

The cooperative model is an important and innovative social and economic model that can address the challenges of globalization as well as situations of uncertainty and recession. Therefore, cooperatives need to modernize and keep pace with the notable developments that have taken place in the Spanish wine industry and that have improved the competitiveness of its products (Vázquez, Chivite, & Salinas, 2019). Meanwhile, cooperatives must also grow in order to improve their...
In response to these commercial problems, information and communication technologies (ICTs), particularly the tools provided by the Internet, offer a source of competitive advantage for the sector by providing access to alternative sales channels capable of helping overcome the commercial shortcomings that agri-food products, particularly organic products, have traditionally faced (Fernández, Bernal, Mozaz, & Medina, 2019). The Internet has undoubtedly become crucial in business and trade around the world because of its rapid widespread penetration in society. Websites represent one of the fundamental tools in online business strategies. Websites are the channel through which communication between companies and their customers takes place and where information about companies’ offerings is displayed (Fernández et al., 2019). Through its website a company can engage in public relations, sales promotion, and relationship marketing initiatives (Louw & Nieuwenhuizen, 2019).

A company website has become a basic tool for interacting with customers, supporting the Direct-To-Consumer (D2C) strategy (Crehan, 2019). Therefore, website popularity in terms of number of visits is a prime objective for organizations (Harto, 2019). Numerous studies have evaluated the impact of the Internet and e-commerce on the marketing of agri-food products (e.g., Cristobal, Montegut, Ferrer, & Daries, 2020; Zeng, Jia, Wan, & Guo, 2017). Many of these studies have demonstrated the capacity of ICT to reduce transaction costs by improving the efficiency of business actions along the value chain (Evans & Wurster, 1997). However, many studies suggest that investing in ICT is not enough. Instead, a series of additional investments and specific organizational practices are needed to make effective use of these tools (Fernández, López, Rodríguez, & Sandulli, 2007). In order to be efficient, investment in ICT must be accompanied by other actions that are just as (if not more) important. Examples of these actions include investment in training, investment in reengineering and redesigning business processes, and investment in other organizational or strategic factors (Barua, Lee, & Whinston, 1996; Becchetti, Andres, & Paganoet, 2003; Devaraj & Kohli, 2000; Mozaz, Bernal, Fernández, & Medina, 2016; Rogers, 2010). There is a gap in the literature due to a lack of studies that aim at identifying which characteristics define the organizations with the most popular websites (greatest number of website visits). Accordingly, this article addresses the following two questions: What organizational factors are associated with greater popularity? What strategies can lead to greater user traffic on a website?

Given this context, the main aim of this research is to analyze the organizational factors and commercial features that are linked to the popularity of wine producers’ websites. Specifically, the aim is to verify the influence of different aspects of the business on these companies’ website traffic. The results show that these aspects consist of organizational and structural features (company size and integration), commercial features (the marketing of bottled wine to end consumers, internationalization, and organic certification), and website quality. To achieve this aim, fuzzy-set qualitative comparative analysis (fsQCA) was used.

The importance of this research lies in the identification of the factors that define the most popular organizations on the Internet. These factors can serve as a guide for the development of organizational strategies regarding the company website. The scientific literature lacks articles that address this issue, hence the originality of this study. To pursue this aim, this study is structured as follows. Following this introduction, the theoretical framework is described, and the research propositions are formulated. Next, the population under study and the method used to conduct the analysis are detailed. The results of the study are then presented and contrasted with those reported in other related studies. Finally, the conclusions are presented, together with the limitations of the study and future lines of research.

2. Theoretical framework

Technological development is a key consideration in an organization’s general strategy and in business management. Organizations must be aware of the digital transformation of society and its impact on business. The literature shows that agri-food cooperatives lag behind other types of organizations in implementing ICTs (Vázquez et al., 2019). This technological challenge must be addressed and must be considered a key competitive factor in today’s context. In this context, corporate websites are key tools that provide a valuable online platform to build and strengthen relationships with consumers (Laroche, Habibi, & Richard, 2013).

The number of visits to a corporate website determines the online popularity of an organization, helping the organization increase its visibility and therefore its sales (Carlín, 2017). Increased popularity (i.e., increased customer traffic on the website measured as the number of visits to the site) is an essential goal in regard to the company website (Harto, 2019). Receiving a visit is a critical opportunity for companies, which must put all their efforts into capturing customers’ attention, securing customers’ commitment, and inducing customers to act (Demangeot & Broderick, 2016). Web traffic is therefore a key variable for an organization to be aware of and measure so that the organization can determine effective strategies to maintain and enhance its online presence while improving its organizational performance (Ghandour, 2015). Accordingly, this study proposes to identify the variables that are positively associated with the number of visits to an organization’s website.

Website quality can be defined using different approaches, and it constitutes a competitive advantage for organizations in their commercial activity (Perçin, 2019). The quality of a website has been measured in the scientific literature in terms of different items grouped into three types of attributes: informational, interactive, and transactional (Ip, Law, & Lee, 2011). A high-quality website is valued positively by users, increasing its visibility and improving commercial relations with consumers (Barnes & Vidgen, 2000; Bernal, Mozaz, Fernández, Medina, & Puentes, 2019). A more developed website not only leads users to stay on the website for longer but also encourages them to return (Jones & Kim, 2010). These factors are linked to user loyalty, which is highly relevant in consumer purchase intentions (Kabadayi & Gupta, 2005).

For some users, websites are the first and only contact they have with an organization, so a high-quality website is a good motivation to visit and recommend it (Loureiro, 2015). The impression that corporate websites make on users depends on the information they provide and their quality, connectivity, and interactivity, which are useful for strengthening the relationship with consumers and increasing the popularity of the website (Chiu, Hsieh, & Kao, 2005). A more developed website in terms of visual appeal, information, and interactivity with other social networks leads to more traffic and better online brand performance (Strzebicki, 2014; Ye, Barreda, Okumus, & Nusair, 2019). The popularity of a website lies in the optimization of its content, its adaptation to customers’ needs, and its ability to facilitate interaction (Butkiewicz, Madhystha, & Sekar, 2011). Based on this line of argument, the following proposition may be formulated:

**Proposition 1.** A higher quality website will attract more visits and will therefore tend to increase its popularity.

In the Internet age, national boundaries have become blurred. Corporate websites have a global reach, so any user anywhere in the world can access them. A high-quality website linked to social networks and presented in different languages is a cheap way of internationalizing and reaching out to a large number of foreign users (Manyika & Lund, 2016). These virtual platforms also give exporting companies numerous functionalities, so they will tend to improve their quality and thereby attract a greater number of users (Kim, 2019). In addition, websites allow small organizations to grow through exports (Qurratu’Aini and
Hapsari, 2019), which entails major marketing efforts through their websites to increase their online popularity (Kim & Stoel, 2004). Thus, websites have become a channel for SMEs to internationalize so as to achieve a high volume of website traffic (Manyika & Lund, 2016; Moral, Mozas, Bernal, & Medina, 2015). Based on these arguments, the following proposition may be formulated:

**Proposition 2. Organizations that internationalize are associated with more popular websites.**

The organic product market has experienced steady growth, so more and more organizations are tending toward organic production. However, on the demand side, consumer misinformation and poor access to the supply of organic products have led consumers to use online channels as an alternative means of purchase (Mozas et al., 2016). This situation is especially relevant given that consumers of organic products need more information (Lee & Yun, 2015) and that traditional sales channels have been unable to respond to this growing need (Roitner, Darnhofer, Somsok, & Vogl, 2008). In addition, the intrinsic characteristics of certain “experiential” agricultural products make them particularly suited to Internet marketing (Stricker, Mueller, & Sumner, 2007). The purchase and consumption of wine, for example, is based on an intensive exchange of information concerning largely intangible aspects of the product, which can significantly improve the perception of the product’s value (Canavari, Regazzi, & Spadoni, 2002).

As a result, users in this segment are attracted to the websites of organizations whose information and communication power can respond to their greater thirst for information (Bernal et al., 2019). Meanwhile, social media have enhanced environmental awareness and the commitment to consuming organic products. Therefore, organizations that offer this type of product benefit from a social media presence, especially if their website is highly functional (Fernández et al., 2019; Hasanov & Khalid, 2015). Based on these arguments, the following proposition may be formulated:

**Proposition 3. The supply of organic products through a website is positively related to the website’s popularity.**

Many researchers have cited integration as a way of strengthening cooperatives and ensuring their survival (Bel, 1996; Carrascos & Garrido, 1991; Julià, 1993; Mozas, 1999; Vargas, 1993). Cooperatives are built on collaborative arrangements that bring together many individual business owners. This group shares the means of production in order to exploit the benefits of collaboration and a larger scale. In this way, the participating co-owners achieve greater benefits (Mozas, 1999). The size of these organizations encourages their online presence because it gives them more resources to devote to online activity (Louw & Nieuwenhuizen, 2019). Several studies have highlighted organizational size as an explanatory factor for innovation and technological adoption (Wamba & Carter, 2014). In addition, according to Borges, Hoppen, and Luce (2009) information systems are used more frequently within organizations than toward the market. Therefore, a cooperative with a larger number of members will have more website visits. Also, due to the network effect, greater social capital (i.e., the interconnected network of individuals who interact with the organization) will increase the usefulness of the website (Karou, Dudezert, & Leidner, 2015) and therefore the traffic it receives. Based on these arguments, the following proposition may be formulated:

**Proposition 4. Organizational size (number of members of the cooperative) positively affects the popularity of an organization’s website.**

One of the main problems facing agri-food entities, particularly the organizations studied here, is a lack of market orientation. As noted above, farmers continue to sell in bulk to international markets at low prices. This approach results in low competitiveness and profitability because of a failure to move up the value chain of the products offered (Cristobal et al., 2020; Heyder, Makus, & Theuven, 2011). ICTs provide a marketing channel for the sale of bottled wine, which captures the value added that escapes producers that sell in bulk (Triana, 2019). Thus, a market orientation is necessary for the success of an organization’s online commercial activity (Borges et al., 2009). In marketing their products, organizations oriented toward the consumer market must design a website that offers guarantees, generates a certain amount of traffic, and encourages transactions (Warlina, Siddiq, & Valentina, 2019). The sales efforts of targeting the consumer market result in a higher quality and more popular website, which enables organizations to listen to, talk to, and interact with the customer network (Durking, Mccowan, & Mckeown, 2013). The commitment to a packaged product, aimed directly at end consumers, increases an organization’s reputation in the market, especially if this commitment is combined with complementary strategies (Fernández et al., 2019). Based on these arguments, the following proposition may be formulated:

**Proposition 5. A market orientation (direct sale of bottled wine) is positively related to the popularity of an organization’s website.**

3. Data and method

3.1. Population

This study examines cooperative winemaking organizations in the Spanish region of Castilla-La Mancha. This region has by far the largest area of vineyards and wine production in Spain and is responsible for 5% of the world’s wine production (Cooperativas Agro-alimentarias, 2019). Despite greater regional competition in the marketing of its wines, Castilla-La Mancha has made slow progress, and brands from this region still have a low profile in the domestic and international consumer markets. This status is due to the region’s traditional focus on table wine, whose commercial outlet is primarily bulk sales. These considerations make this region an attractive context for this study.

The study population was obtained from the records of the Spanish Food Safety and Nutrition Agency (Agencia Española de Seguridad Alimentaria y Nutrición) of registered food companies (RGSEAA). The number of winemaking organizations in Castilla-La Mancha in 2019 was 599. Of these, 204 were cooperatives. A representative random sample was taken from each of the provinces of Castilla-La Mancha. This sample comprised 150 cooperatives, of which 83 had their own website. The details of the sample and method are shown in Table 1.

The organizational data on these entities were obtained from Cooperativas Agro-alimentarias (Agri-food Cooperatives), which represents and protects the economic and social interests of Spanish agricultural cooperatives. Data were also collected using metrics taken directly from the Internet. The online tool Valor de Web (valordeweb.com) was used to obtain the number of visits to each organization’s website. To calculate website quality, a checklist was completed for the website of each of the sampled organizations. In total, 35 items were checked for each website. These items refer to informative features, user interaction, and processing for online shopping. These items have been used in previous studies (Bernal et al., 2019).

| Characteristic         | Details                                      |
|------------------------|----------------------------------------------|
| Geographical coverage  | Castilla-La Mancha, Spain                    |
| Timeframe              | March to May 2019                            |
| Population             | 204 cooperatives                             |
| Sampling unit          | Wine-producing cooperatives                  |
| Sample                 | 150 cooperatives                             |
| Sampling error; confidence | 4.13% sampling error; confidence interval of 95% |

Source: Compiled by the authors.
3.2. Method

Fuzzy-set qualitative comparative analysis (fsQCA) was used to test the propositions. This method does not require large samples (Ragin & Rihoux, 2004; Ragin, Shulman, Weinberg, & Gran, 2003), so it was well-suited to this study. There are essentially two variants of this research technique. The first is crisp-set qualitative comparative analysis (csQCA), or conventional qualitative comparative analysis (QCA), which was the method initially developed by Ragin (1987). The second is fsQCA (Ragin, 2008). By using fuzzy-set theory and Boolean logic, this second variant of QCA overcomes the main limitation of csQCA, which only permits dichotomous variables. Thus, in addition to permitting dichotomous variables, fsQCA enables the use of continuous and interval variables. However, to include continuous or interval variables in the study, prior calibration is necessary to convert these variables into fuzzy categories or fuzzy variables. Calibration of the variables consists of assigning values between 0 and 1, depending on the degree of membership (see Woodside & Zhang, 2012).

FsQCA reveals one or more antecedent combinations that are sufficient for a given outcome to occur. For example, \( X_1 \sim X_2 \sim X_3 \) may be sufficient to produce outcome \( Y \). Adopting the standard notation for this technique, this result would be expressed as \( X_1 \sim X_2 \sim X_3 \rightarrow Y \), where \( X_1, X_2, \) and \( X_3 \) are antecedents; \( Y \) is the outcome of interest; \( \sim \) denotes the union of two or more conditions; and \( \sim \) denotes the absence or negation of a condition, in this case equal to the opposite value of \( X_3 \) (i.e., \( 1 - X_3 \)).

FsQCA identifies one or several antecedent combinations that are sufficient to explain a given outcome, which is analogous to a dependent variable. However, once the variables used in the study have been correctly calibrated, it is necessary to perform sufficiency analysis to check that no variable on its own explains the outcome (Schneider, Schulze-Bentrop, & Paunescu, 2010). In this study, this analysis implies that no single variable can be considered sufficient.

Unlike other techniques such as correlation analysis, fsQCA is especially useful because it enables the evaluation of the interaction of conditions in more complex scenarios, considering the assumptions of causal asymmetry of the established theoretical relationships (Gligor & Bozkurt, 2020). It is an innovative analytical technique that offers a new understanding of a given research problem.

This research aims to discover the relationship between the number of visits to a company’s website (popularity), which acts as the outcome, and a series of conditions (antecedents). The following conditions were considered as antecedents: website quality (Quality), measured as the sum of 35 website quality items on the informational, relational, and transactional nature of a website, \(^1\) which have been used in other studies (Bernal et al., 2019); the presence of the company in international markets (International); whether the marketed wine is organic (Organic); the size of the cooperative, measured as the number of members in the cooperative (Members); and the market orientation, measured as the direct sale of bottled wine (Bottle). The characteristics of the variables used in the study are summarized in Table 2.

4. Results and discussion

Table 3 shows the results of the application of fsQCA to the theoretical model proposed in this study using fsQCA 3.0 software. Prior to the final application of this technique, analysis of necessary conditions was performed. This analysis implies that no condition can be considered necessary because the individual consistency scores (Ragin, 2006) were all less than 0.90. In addition, it was verified that the coverage scores were not too low, exceeding 0.50. Thus, the absence of negative conditions for the application of this technique in the present study was verified, once the relevant tests of necessity and sufficiency had been conducted.

As Table 3 shows, the overall model resulting from this analysis has a total coverage of 0.756996. Thus, in 75.70% of wine cooperatives in Castilla-La Mancha, the number of visits to the corporate website is explained by the chosen set of causal combinations (also called config-

---

\(^1\) The quality of the website was calculated by evaluating the content and tools on the website. Following the scientific method, the presence or absence of the following 35 items grouped into the three following areas was analyzed for each website:1. Information provided about the organization and its offering, 10 items: contact data; information on the location of the organization; information on activities; e-mail and/or contact form; information on the product; attendance at events or fairs; website availability in more than one language; quality certifications; communication of news; promotions and incentives through the Internet.2. Elements that help the company interact with customers and users who visit the website. 22 items: prices and basic information about the products; links to other interesting information about the products (benefits of consumption, recommendations by doctors, etc.); possible recipes and cooking tips; information about visits; promotions; site map; page sharing; downloading of photos and/or brochures; privacy policy or legal notice; FAQs; search engine by words; online store; exclusive web area for customers/partners; multimedia applications; blogs, forums, and/or chats; email newsletters; access to social network profiles; possibility of collecting online comments from customers; possibility for customers to rate quality; satisfaction with products; virtual tour of the winery; mobile web version.3. Elements of a transactional nature related to the presence and characteristics of a virtual store and the secure purchase process. 3 items: complete purchase process; secure online transaction and interaction with the server; database query.
communications. These results are consistent with the results found in the studies mentioned earlier.

The first causal configuration, which has a raw coverage of 0.286147, indicates that the combination of a high-quality website, internationalization, organic certification, and organizational size explains a high number of visits to the company website (in 28.61% of cases). The second causal configuration indicates that the combination of a high-quality website, internationalization, organic certification, and a market orientation (through the sale of bottled wine) explains a high number of visits to the corporate website in 26.61% of cases.

These results indicate that the number of visits to a company’s corporate website is positively related to the quality of information and interaction shown by the website (Chiu et al., 2005; Loureiro, 2015; Ye et al., 2019), the company’s activity in international markets through exports (Kim, 2019; Manjika & Lund, 2016), the organic certification of the wine (Bernal et al., 2019; Lee & Yun, 2015), the size of the cooperative (Karoui et al., 2015; Louw & Nieuwenhuizen, 2019), and the company’s consumer market orientation, measured by the percentage of bottled wine sold (Durking et al., 2013; Warlina et al., 2019). Based on these results, all the proposals considered in this research may be accepted.

5. Conclusions

The Spanish wine market has a considerable imbalance between supply, where it leads the world ranking, and demand, which is low and has followed a downward trend in recent years. This situation has forced the sector to orient its sales toward foreign markets. However, this strategy has been implemented using a business model based on bulk sales, which has resulted in a loss of value added in commercial transactions. One response to this situation is the online marketing of products to end consumers. Given this background, the aim of this study is to analyze the organizational factors and commercial features that are linked to the popularity of wine organizations’ websites.

The Internet has become a key tool for commerce and business communication, modifying the purchasing habits of millions of consumers. Its importance is so great that even as some businesses have closed as a result of the COVID-19 health emergency, others have increased their sales thanks to e-commerce. Thus, the Internet is a strategic sales channel that all organizations should consider. The value of this research lies in the fact that there are no comparable studies. The analysis presented has never been carried out. The only similar study is that of Fernández et al. (2019), who applied a similar approach to the olive oil sector. The results of this study highlight the characteristics of the most popular organizations in terms of their websites. The study not only defines the profile of the most popular organizations on the Internet but also offers strategies to strengthen the online presence of agri-food organizations.

Agri-food organizations should make a strong commitment to the company website, adopting a proactive attitude (Laroche et al., 2013). To do so, they must allocate resources and plan and establish strategies that enable them to reap the full benefits of ICTs. As the literature indicates for other sectors, simply using a website without a solid commitment by allocating resources will not yield the desired results (Mozas et al., 2016). Similarly, different aspects are associated with greater popularity on the Internet. The results of this study indicate that the quality of information and interaction on the website, the presence of the organization in international markets, the organic certification of the wine, the size of the cooperative, and the organization’s orientation toward the consumer market positively affect the popularity of the websites of the cooperatives in this sector. These results are consistent with those of previous studies and lead to acceptance of the five propositions tested in the study.

As noted by Bernal et al. (2019), a high-quality website (measured in terms of the amount of available information and content) is positively valued by users. As suggested by Heinzl and Hu (2006), a high level of information, strong interactivity, and a wide range of services on the website are the most important elements of perceived usefulness and ease of use. There is some consensus that the amount and variety of information available in virtual environments is positively related to the levels of satisfaction of users (Szymanski & Hise, 2000).

On the other hand, internationalization and the use of ICT have a positive relationship, as observed in the agri-food sector (Moral et al., 2015). ICT largely offsets the importance of physical distance, allowing direct and immediate entry into foreign markets (Vivekanandan & Rajendran, 2006). The use of technological platforms facilitates access to export activity. However, this activity also contributes to an increase in the number of users who access the website because it facilitates access to the company by clients and suppliers (Stansfield & Grant, 2003).

The same applies to organic products. ICTs are a means of adjusting to the characteristics of organic supply, and there is also a positive relationship between these variables (Mozas et al., 2016). The current lack of knowledge of the characteristics of certified organic products negatively affects the purchase decision process (Hiilverda, Kuttschreuter, & Giebels, 2017). Therefore, the Internet, which is an essential tool in the search for information when purchasing food products (Kuttschreuter et al., 2014), is especially useful for certified organic products (Lee & Yun, 2015).

In the online environment, the positive network externalities generated by ICTs make these platforms more attractive as the number of users present on them increases (Kaplan & Haenlein, 2010). Thus, the value and usefulness of a social network increase as the number of users linked to the organization increases as a result of the greater volume of information exchanged between users (Torrent, 2015). The network effect and the size of the organization also explain better results on social media (Karoui et al., 2015). Therefore, the number of members of an organization is expected to have a positive impact on its website.

Finally, organizations oriented toward the end market and the marketing of their products generate more traffic and transactions on their online platforms (Warlina et al., 2019). As reported here, the wine sector in some regions faces a major problem regarding the marketing of
its products to end consumers. Therefore, ICTs, particularly websites, offer this sector a crucial channel to solve this structural problem (Gorges et al., 2009). Commercial efforts aimed at the end market will lead to greater innovation through, for example, the design of higher quality websites (Durking et al., 2013).

The results should be interpreted while keeping in mind the major commercial problems highlighted earlier. In addition, it is important to consider the opportunity provided by the presence of the current digital context, which is characterized by continuous growth of e-commerce operations on the domestic and international levels (Cristobal et al., 2020). In this area, food products play an increasingly prominent role. The results provide strategic guidelines for private and public decision makers to follow if they wish to exploit the full potential of ICT. Accordingly, commitment to greater business concentration, internationalization, the flourishing organic product market, and greater market orientation can support the development of this sector not only in conventional markets but also in digital markets.

This article is not exempt from limitations. First, it focuses on a single sector (the wine industry). Despite analyzing the biggest Spanish region in terms of wine production (Castilla-La Mancha), this single-sector focus limits the generalization of results. Furthermore, the study was carried out from the supply perspective. It would be of interest to use a broader approach, also considering demand.

This study focuses on the online presence of companies in the largest wine-producing region in Spain. In the future, it would be of interest to extend the geographical scope of this study. It would also be of interest to perform comparative analyses between different types of companies (cooperatives versus corporates) and to compare the situation of Spanish companies with that of companies in other countries. Doing so would verify whether the results obtained in this study can be replicated in other contexts. It would also be of interest to extend the study using other organizational factors such as degree of innovation, academic education and ICT training of human resources, internal or external ICT management, and efficiency, as in other studies in similar sectors (Fernández et al., 2019; Medina, Mozas, Bernal, & Moral, 2014).

Funding

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

References

Barnes, S., & Vidgen, R. (2000). WebQual: An exploration of website quality. In ECIS 2000 Proceedings (Vol. 74).

Barnia, A., Lee, B., & Whitson, A. (1996). The calculus of reengineering. Information Systems Research, 7(4), 409–428.

Becchetti, L., Andres, D., & Paganetto, L. (2003). ICT investment, productivity and efficiency: Evidence at firm level using a stochastic frontier approach. Journal of Productivity Analysis, 20(2), 143–167.

Bel, P. (1996). Comportamiento de las sociedades cooperativas agrarias en un mercado competitivo [The behavior of agricultural cooperatives in a competitive market]. Cooperación Agraria, 6, 40–41.

Bernal, E., Mozas, A., Fernández, D., Medina, M. J., & Puente, R. (2019). Calidad de los sitios web en el sector agroalimentario ecológico y sus factores explicativos: El papel del cooperativismo [Quality of websites in the organic agro-food sector and its explanatory factors: The role of cooperativism]. CIRIEC-España, Revista de Economía Pública, Social y Cooperativa, 95, 95–118. https://doi.org/10.7203/CIRIEC-E.95.13207

Borges, M., Hoppn, N., & Luus, F. B. (2009). Information technology impact on market orientation in e-business. Journal of Business Research, 62(9), 883–890.

Butkiewicz, M., Madhystha, H. V., & Sekar, V. (2011). Understanding website complexity: Measurements, metrics, and implications. In Proceedings of the 2011 ACM SIGCHI conference on Internet measurement conference (pp. 313–328).

Cannari, M., Regazzi, D., & Spadoni, R. (2002). Origin Labels on the World Wide Web. Working paper. Italy: Università di Bologna, Dipartimento di Economia e Ingegneria Agrarie.

Carlin, E. (2017). Get customers online: Marketing that grows sales, website traffic, and business. ISBN:978-0-692-89334-0.

Carrasco, M., & Garrido, J. (1991). Integración y asociacionismo: Una estrategia competitiva para el cooperativismo agrario [Integration and associationism: A competitive strategy for agri-cooperativism]. Revista de Economía y Empresa, 11 (29–30), 65–75.

Chiu, H. C., Hsieh, Y. C., & Kao, C. Y. (2005). Website quality and customer’s behavioural intention: An exploratory study of the role of information asymmetry. Total Quality Management and Business Excellence, 16(2), 185–197.

Cristobal, E., Montegut, Y., Ferrer, B., & Daries, N. (2020). Rural cooperatives in the digital age: An analysis of the Internet presence and degree of maturity of agri-food cooperatives’ e-commerce. Journal of Rural Studies, 74, 55–66.

Deavenport, C., & Broderick, A. J. (2016). Engaging customers during a website visit: A model of website customer engagement. International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management, 44(6), 814–839.

Devaraj, S., & Kohli, R. (2000). Information technology payoff in the health-care industry: A longitudinal study. Journal of Management Information Systems, 16(4), 41–67.

Durking, M., Mcgowan, P., & Mckenown, N. (2013). Exploring social media adoption in small to medium-sized enterprises in Ireland. Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development, 20(4), 716–734.

Evans, P. B., & Wurster, T. S. (1997). Strategy and the new economics of information. Harvard Business Review, 75(5), 71–82.

Fernández, J., López, J. I., Rodríguez, A., & Sandulchi, F. D. (2007). El impacto del uso efectivo de las TIC sobre la eficiencia técnica de las empresas españolas [The impact of the actual use of the ICT on the technical efficiency of the Spanish firms]. Estudios Gerenciales, 23(103), 65–84.

Fernández, D., Bernal, E., Mozas, A., & Medina, M. J. (2019). The importance of websites for organic agri-food producers. Economic Research-Ekonomska Istraživanja, 321, 2867–2880. https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2019.1694426

Gandour, A. (2015). Ecommerce website value model for SMEs. International Journal of Electronic Commerce Studies, 6(2), 203–222.

Gilg, D., & Boduri, S. (2020). FQSQA versus regression: The context of customer engagement. Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 52, Article 101929.

Harto, A. B. (2019). Implementing website design based on search engine optimization (SEO) checklist to increase web popularity. Journal of Applied Information, Communication and Technology, 4(2), 87–97.

Hasanov, J., & Khalid, H. (2015). The impact of website quality on online purchase intention of organic food in Malaysia: A WebQual model approach. Procedia Computer Science, 726, 382–389.

Heyder, M., Maksa, C., & Theaven, L. (2011). Internationalization and firm performance in agribusiness: Empirical evidence from European cooperatives. International Journal on Food System Dynamics, 2(1), 77–93.

Heine, N., & Hu, Q. (2006). The evolution of corporate web presence: A longitudinal study of large American companies. International Journal of Information Management, 26(4), 313–325.

Hilverda, F., Rutten, M., & Giebes, E. (2017). Social media mediated interaction with peers and anonymous users: Conversation partner and message framing effects on risk perception and sense-making of organic food. Quality and Preference, 56, 107–118.

Ip, C., Law, R., & Lee, H. A. (2011). A review of website evaluation studies in the tourism and hospitality fields from 1996 to 2009. International Journal of Tourism Research, 13(3), 234–265.

Jones, C., & Kim, S. (2010). Influences of retail brand trust, off-line patronage, clothing involvement and website quality on online apparel shopping intention. International Journal of Consumer Studies, 34(6), 627–637.

Julia, J. F. (1993). La economía social y el cooperativismo agrario. Sus nuevas estrategias empresariales [The social economy and agri-cooperativism. New business strategies]. Revista sobre Economía Pública, Social y Cooperativa, CIRIEC-España, 15, 43–66.

Kabadayi, S., & Gupta, R. (2005). Website loyalty: An empirical investigation of its antecedents. International Journal of Internet Marketing and Advertising, 2(4), 321–345.

Kaplan, A. M., & Haenlein, M. (2010). Users of the world, unite! The challenges and implications of the actual use of the ICT on the technical efficiency of the Spanish firms]. Estudios Gerenciales, 23(103), 65–84.

Kim, D. (2019). Internet and SMEs’ internationalization: The role of platform and website. Journal of International Management, 15(4), 1056–1071.

Kabadayi, S., & Gupta, R. (2005). Website loyalty: An empirical investigation of its antecedents. International Journal of Internet Marketing and Advertising, 2(4), 321–345.

Kabadayi, S., & Gupta, R. (2005). Website loyalty: An empirical investigation of its antecedents. International Journal of Internet Marketing and Advertising, 2(4), 321–345.

Kaplan, A. M., & Haenlein, M. (2010). Users of the world, unite! The challenges and implications of the actual use of the ICT on the technical efficiency of the Spanish firms]. Estudios Gerenciales, 23(103), 65–84.

Kim, D. (2019). Internet and SMEs’ internationalization: The role of platform and website. Journal of International Management, 15(4), 1056–1071.

Kabadayi, S., & Gupta, R. (2005). Website loyalty: An empirical investigation of its antecedents. International Journal of Internet Marketing and Advertising, 2(4), 321–345.

Kaplan, A. M., & Haenlein, M. (2010). Users of the world, unite! The challenges and implications of the actual use of the ICT on the technical efficiency of the Spanish firms]. Estudios Gerenciales, 23(103), 65–84.
Lee, H. J., & Yun, Z. S. (2015). Consumers’ perceptions of organic food attributes and cognitive and affective attitudes as determinants of their purchase intentions toward organic food. *Food Quality and Preference*, 39, 259–267.

Loureiro, S. M. C. (2015). The role of website quality on PAD, attitude and intentions to visit and recommend island destination. *International Journal of Tourism Research, 17* (6), 545–554.

Lou, C., & Niewenhuizen, C. (2019). Digitalization strategies for SMEs: A cost vs. skill approach for website development. *African Journal of Science, Technology, Innovation and Development*, https://doi.org/10.1080/20421338.2019.1625591

Manyika, J., & Lund, S. (2016). Globalization for the little guy. *McKinsey Global Institute report.*

Medina, M. J., Mozas, A., Bernal, E., & Moral, E. (2014). Factores determinantes para la exportación en las empresas cooperativas oleícolas andaluzas [Decisive factors for Andalusian olive oil cooperative exports]. *CIRIEC-España, Revista de Economía Pública, Social y Cooperativa, 95*, 29–70.

Moral, E., Mozas, A., Bernal, E., & Medina, M. J. (2015). Efficiency and exports: Evidence from Southern European companies. *Journal of Business Research, 68*(7), 1506–1511.

Mozas, A. (1999). Organización y gestión de las almazaras cooperativas: un estudio empírico [Organization and management of the cooperative oil mills: an empirical study]. Premio Arco iris del Cooperativismo 1997 for the best cooperative research. Consejería de Trabajo e Industria, Dirección General de Economía Social, Sevilla.

Mozas, A., Bernal, E., Fernández, D., & Medina, M. J. (2016). Web quality as a determining factor in the online retailing of organic products in Spain. *New Media, 15* (2), 28–37.

OFV. (2018). Statistical Report on World Vitiviniculture. Available at http://www.ovin.int/public/media/6371/ov-statistical-report-on-world-vitiviniculture-2018.pdf

Perçin, S. (2019). A combined fuzzy multicriteria decision-making approach for evaluating hospital website quality. *Journal of Multi-Criteria Decision Analysis, 26* (3–4), 129–141.

Qurratu-Aini, H., & Hapsari, A. Y. (2019). Interests influence of digital marketing product sales in exports by SMEs in bandung. *Global Business and Management Research, 11*(1), 217–225.

Ragin, C. C. (1987). *The comparative method: Moving beyond qualitative and quantitative strategies.* Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Ragin, C. C. (2008). *Redesigning social inquiry: Fuzzy sets and beyond.* Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Ragin, C. C., & Rihoux, B. (2004). Qualitative comparative analysis (QCA): State of the art and prospects. *Qualitative Methods, 2*(2), 3–13.

Ragin, C. C., Shulman, D., Weinberg, A., & Gran, B. (2003). Complexity, generality and qualitative comparative analysis. *Field Methods, 15*(4), 323–340.

Rogers, E. M. (2010). *Diffusion of innovations.* New York: Simon and Schuster.

Roitner, B., Darnhofer, I., Somsook, S., & Vogl, C. R. (2008). Consumer perceptions of organic foods in Bangkok, Thailand. *Food Policy, 33*(2), 112–121.

Schneider, M. R., Schulze-Bentrop, C., & Paunescu, M. (2010). Mapping the institutional capital of high-tech firms: A fuzzy-set analysis of capitalist variety and export performance. *Journal of International Business Studies, 41*, 246–266.

Stansfield, M., & Grant, K. (2003). An investigation into issues influencing the use of the Internet and electronic commerce among small-medium sized enterprises. *Journal of Electronic Commerce Research, 4*(1), 15–32.

Stricker, S., Mueller, R. A. E., & Sumner, D. A. (2007). Marketing Wine on the Web. Choices Magazine, 22(1). Available at: http://www.choiceismagazine.org/2007_1/foodchains /2007_1_06.htm.

Szczepicki, D. (2014). *The diversity of marketing activities on the websites of Polish dairy producers.* *Acta Scientiarum Polonorum. Oeconomia,* 13*(2), 135–141.

Szymanski, D. M., & Hise, R. T. (2000). E-satisfaction: An initial examination. *Journal of Business Research, 53*(1), 144–152.

Torrunt, J. (2015). Knowledge products and network externalities: Implications for the business strategy. *Journal of the Knowledge Economy, 6*(1), 138–156.

Triana, B. J. (2019). Use of Culture in the Website Brand Management of Kentucky WineProducers. *The Qualitative Report, 24*(9), 2372–2400.

Vázquez, J. J., Chivite, M. P., & Salinas, F. (2019). Digital transformation in the Spanish agri-food cooperative sector: Situation and prospects. *CIRIEC-España, Revista de Economía Pública, Social y Cooperativa, 95*, 29–70.

Vivekanandan, K., & Rajendra, R. (2006). Export marketing and the world wide web: Perceptions of export barriers among Tirupur knitwear apparel exporters – An empirical analysis. *Journal of Electronic Commerce Research, 7*(1), 27–40.

Wamba, S. F., & Carter, L. (2014). Social media tools adoption and use by SMEs: An empirical study. *JOEUC: Journal of Organizational and End User Computing, 26*(2), 1–17.

Warszynski, B., Siddiq, F., & Valentina, T. (2019). Designing website for online business in the agricultural sector. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series, 1402*(6), Article 066080.

Woodside, A. G., & Zhang, M. (2012). Identifying 3-consumers using causal recipes: “Whales” and “jumbo shrimps” casino gamblers. *Journal of Gambling Studies, 28*(2), 13–26.

Ye, B. H., Barreda, A. A., Okumus, F., & Nussair, K. (2019). Website interactivity and brand development of online travel agencies in China: The moderating role of age. *Journal of Business Research, 99*, 382–389.

Zeng, Y., Jia, F., Wan, L., & Gao, H. (2017). E-commerce in the agri-food sector: A systematic literature review. *International Food and Agribusiness Management Review, 20*(1030–2017-2164), 439–459.

Enrique Bernal-Jurado is degree in Economics and Business Administration from the University of Málaga and PhD in Economic and Business Sciences, Extraordinary Doctorate Award, from the University of Jaén. He is a Full Professor of the University and a member of the Department of Economics of the University of Jaén. He has focused his research on two fundamental lines: financial system and electronic commerce. Within this second line, it has focused its efforts on contributing to a greater knowledge of the possibilities offered by the Internet to commercial activity. He has researched financial system and Internet, e-commerce and territorial development and Internet applications in the cooperative-agrarian field, especially in the olive oil sector. He is the author of more than a hundred publications of national and international scope and is Director of the Observatory of Security and Commerce in the Network of the University of Jaén.

Adoración Mozas-Moral is Professor of University, Department of Business Organization, Marketing and Sociology. Doctor in Economic and Business Sciences and Extraordinary Doctorate Award from the University of Jaen. She has participated in 50 projects/research contracts (group leader in 14). She has written 18 books, 31 book chapters, 70 scientific articles that have been published in journals of the highest international and national prestige. She has received 9 Research Awards, 1 Teaching Award. She has made 5 stays in foreign centers. She has held many positions related to university management, among which she stands out as Vice-Rector of Students and Labor Insertion. She is currently President of the CIRIEC-Spain and Counselor of Number in the Institute of Giennenses Studies.

Domingo Fernández-Ucles is Assistant professor in the Business Organization Area of the University of Jaén. He is degree in Business Administration and PhD, with international mention, in Social and Legal Sciences from the University of Jaén. He has focused his research on Information and Communication Technologies, on organic products and on the Social Economy, in the agri-food sector. He has participated in national and international projects and conferences. He is the author of several publications presented at conferences, research articles of the highest international and national prestige and book chapters. He has obtained several research awards, including the Agrarian and Environmental Research Prize in 2016, awarded by the Provincial Council of Jaén.

Miguel Jesús Medina-Viruel is Professor of the University of Cordoba, Department of Applied economic. Doctor in Economic and Business Sciences and Extraordinary Doctorate Award from the University of Jaén, with international mention. He has focused his research on Information and Communication Technologies, on organic products and on the Social Economy, in the agri-food sector. He is author of more than 20 research papers of national and international interests. He has also written 4 books as co-author. He has obtained several research awards, including the Agrarian and Environmental Research Prize in 2016, awarded by the Provincial Council of Jaén.