Professor Pangloss and the Pangenome: Does *Staphylococcus aureus* Have the Best of All Possible Worlds?

In Voltaire’s 1759 novel *Candide*, the eponymous hero is indoctrinated by his tutor, Professor Pangloss, to believe that “everything is for the best in the best of all possible worlds.” In this issue of the *Journal*, Long and colleagues (pp. 1127–1137) present a meticulous and detailed analysis of whole genome sequencing data of 1,382 isolates of *Staphylococcus aureus* from 246 children with cystic fibrosis (CF), attending five U.S. care centers (1). The authors suggest that *S. aureus*, through access to an open pangenome (the collective genetic content of all isolates), develops persistent genotypes, well adapted to the CF lung. For *S. aureus*, this may indeed be “the best of all possible worlds.” The authors offer us some intriguing insights into how *S. aureus* achieves this and the implications this may have for the patient with CF.

In the first account of CF, Dorothy Andersen described “…plugging of the lumens of most if not all of the bronchi with tenacious, greenish-gray mucopurulent material…” (2). We now know that these appearances result from dysfunction of the CF transmembrane conductance regulator, leading to viscid respiratory secretions, failure of the mucociliary escalator, bacterial infection, and bronchiectasis (3). In a subsequent article (4), Andersen described the microbiology of CF as, “Cultures taken early in the course of the disease grow *S. aureus* hemolyticus in nearly every case. . . .” Contemporary registry data support the high prevalence of *S. aureus* early in life, but suggest that the organism is present in over half of individuals with CF well into the fourth decade (5). Long and colleagues describe some of the secrets behind the organism’s remarkable longevity in the CF airway.

Almost half of the 246 children studied were infected with multiple, coexisting *S. aureus* lineages, often with different antibiotic susceptibility profiles. The authors note that these infections were more often concurrent than they were sequential. Multiple lineages of *S. aureus* do not primarily arise from hypermutation of resident organisms in the CF airway—mutation rates in this study were comparable to other patient groups. Mutations in the *agr* and *rsbU* transcriptional regulators, well recognized as important mediators of the acute–chronic transition in *S. aureus*, were common in *S. aureus* isolates in this study and were confirmed to modulate virulence through altered protease production and hemolysis.

But the ability to interrogate relationships between pathogen genotype and patient history in this large cohort adds interesting new detail to the picture of how persistent infection is established. Mutations in *thyA*, which confer resistance to trimethoprim-sulfamethoxazole, were associated with the patient being treated...
with this specific antimicrobial. In addition to trimethoprim-
sulfamethoxazole resistance, thyA mutation has been associated
with a switch to the small colony variant phenotype, which results
in generally increased antibiotic tolerance and in vivo persistence
(6). In contrast, rpoB, mutations in which confer resistance to
rifampycin, had the strongest signature of natural selection in the
study, despite the fact that only a minority of patients with de novo
mutations in this gene were exposed to this drug. Mutations in
rpoB have previously been associated with S. aureus persistence
through increased tolerance of mammalian antimicrobial peptides
(7). Thus, antibiotic-mediated selection for resistance may also
confeder a general survival advantage in the CF airway (thyA), and,
conversely, selection for increased survival in the CF airway may
have the byproduct of resistance to an antibiotic (rpoB) that the
organism has not yet encountered.

The data presented by Long and colleagues raise an important
question about microbial ecology: How spatially structured are the
diverse S. aureus populations within the lungs of people with CF?
There is good evidence for spatial structuring of microbial
populations across the CF lungs (8), and the degree of intermixing
(or not) of S. aureus subpopulations will be key in understanding
the selection of persisting strains. Do different strains of S. aureus
coeexist side by side or do they rarely meet? This may also resolve
some open questions about how S. aureus lives in CF lungs: are
some or all populations intracellar (9), associated with the
bronchial tissue surface (10), or living within mucus in the
bronchial lumen (11)?

This study not only provides insights into the lifestyle of
S. aureus but also suggests practical conclusions for infection
prevention and control. Using granular molecular epidemiology,
Long and colleagues provide detailed information on 11 paired
cases in which “strain sharing” between individuals with CF is
likely (isolates were separated by ≤36 variants). Strain sharing may
be explained by sibling pairs (5 pairs). However, for several pairs
attending different CF centers, acquisition of the organism
appeared after contact with a single care provider who moved from
one CF center to another. Around one-third of the U.S. population
will carry S. aureus in the nasopharynx (12). These data underscore
the need for scrupulous adherence to infection prevention and
control guidelines (13).

The data on antimicrobial resistance are important for clinical
practice. In the United Kingdom, but not in the United States (14),
it is standard practice to use prophylactic antistaphylococcal
antibiotics in young infants with CF from diagnosis (15). As noted
above, children in this study could be infected simultaneously with
multiple, different S. aureus lineages. One individual might harbor
both methicillin-resistant S. aureus (MRSA) and sensitive strains.
Indeed, lineages could change from methicillin-resistant to
methicillin-sensitive over time. This suggests that culture and
sensitivity techniques, currently used in CF centers, may not be
sufficiently comprehensive for optimal treatment of MRSA. The
authors propose that routine laboratory tests might be developed to
characterize coexisting S. aureus lineages better, using either culture
or whole genome sequencing. Furthermore, long-term surveillance
may be necessary before successful eradication of MRSA can be
claimed. The STaph Aureus Resistance - Treat Or Observe (STAR-
too) trial of MRSA eradication (16) reported 82% eradication at 28
days, dropping to 54% at 84 days.

Finally, the authors suggest that new antimicrobial agents
might be designed to reduce the virulence of the organism without
exerting selective pressure for resistance, and such agents have been
proposed as useful “antibiotic adjuvants” (17). Voltaire’s novel
Candide contains an incident (based on historical fact) in which a
British Admiral is shot by firing squad “to encourage the others.”
Candide is a satire—it is plainly ridiculous to expect survivors to be
encouraged by the execution of one of their number—or is it? In
the field of antimicrobial resistance, the execution of bacteria, with
an antimicrobial, exerts selective pressure and “encourages”
bacterial resistance. Long and colleagues have described an
organism exquisitely adapted for long-term survival in the CF
airway. New approaches are needed to combat S. aureus infection as
it enjoys “the best of all possible worlds.”

Author disclosures are available with the text of this article at
www.atsjournals.org.

Freya Harrison, D.Phil.
School of Life Sciences
University of Warwick
Coventry, United Kingdom

Alan R. Smyth, M.A., M.B. B.S., M.R.C.P., M.D., F.R.C.P.C.H.
School of Medicine
University of Nottingham
Nottingham, United Kingdom

and

Paediatric Respiratory Medicine
Nottingham Children’s Hospital
Nottingham, United Kingdom

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-5494-5438 (A.R.S.).

References
1. Long DR, Wolter DJ, Lee M, Precit M, McLean K, Holmes E, et al.
Polyclonality, shared strains, and convergent evolution in chronic
cystic fibrosis Staphylococcus aureus airway infection. Am J Respir
Crit Care Med 2021;203:1127–1137.
2. Andersen DH. Cystic fibrosis of the pancreas and its relation to celiac
disease: a clinical and pathologic study. Am J Dis Child 1938;56:
344–399.
3. Elborn JS. Cystic fibrosis. Lancet 2016;388:2519–2531.
4. Andersen DH. Therapy and prognosis of fibrocystic disease of the
pancreas. Pediatrics 1949;3:406–417.
5. Cystic Fibrosis Foundation Patient Registry. 2018 annual data report.
Bethesda, MD: Cystic Fibrosis Foundation; 2019.
6. Johns BE, Purdy KJ, Tucker NP, Maddocks SE. Phenotypic and
genotypic characteristics of small colony variants and their role in
chronic infection. Microbol Insights 2015;8:15–23.
7. Gao W, Cameron DR, Davies JK, Kostoulias X, Stepnell J, Tuck KL, et al.
The RpoB H481Y rifampicin resistance mutation and an active
stringent response reduce virulence and increase resistance to innate
immune responses in Staphylococcus aureus. J Infect Dis 2013;207:
929–939.
8. Williner D, Haynes MR, Furlan M, Schmieder R, Lim YW, Rainey PB,
et al. Spatial distribution of microbial communities in the cystic fibrosis
lung. ISME J 2012;6:471–474.
9. Jarvis TM, Cheung AL. Staphylococcus aureus escapes more efficiently
from the phagosome of a cystic fibrosis bronchial epithelial cell
line than from its normal counterpart. Infect Immun 2006;74:
2568–2577.
10. Schwab UE, Wold AE, Carson JL, Leigh MW, Cheng PW, Gilligan PH,
et al. Increased adherence of Staphylococcus aureus from cystic
fibrosis lungs to airway epithelial cells. Am Rev Respir Dis 1993;148:
365–369.
It’s Not Just a Smoking-related Disease: Outdoor Pollution May Increase Risk of Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease

It is well accepted that air pollution exacerbates existing respiratory diseases in adults, including asthma and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD). It is less clear if cumulative exposure to air pollution increases the incidence of new obstructive lung diseases in adults. In this issue of the Journal, Shin and colleagues (pp. 1138–1148) present a population-based study of all 5 million adults living in the Canadian province of Ontario who were free of asthma or COPD diagnosis in 2001 (1). During the 15-year study follow-up period, over 340,000 incident cases of COPD and over 218,000 incident cases of asthma were identified. Using a 3-year average of air pollution exposure with a 1-year lag, the authors found that multiple outdoor pollutants, including fine particulate matter (PM$_{2.5}$), nitrogen dioxide (NO$_2$), and ozone (O$_3$), were associated with greater COPD incidence, which is defined as a COPD hospitalization or at least three physician claims for COPD within 2 years. In contrast, there were no associations between exposure to these pollutants and new adult-onset asthma.

Ontario is a large contiguous geographic area that includes a large metropolitan area and more rural areas with sufficient variability in the long-term exposure to these pollutants to examine associations with asthma and COPD incidence, even at the relatively low pollution concentrations in Canada. A major strength of this population-based cohort study is that it included all Ontarians with minimal concern for selection bias because everyone is eligible for the publicly funded health plan. However, the use of administrative claims data has the important limitation that the authors could not directly adjust for individual-level habits such as tobacco use, which is the number one cause of COPD. The authors attempted to address this limitation by adjusting for individual-level comorbidities, fine-scale neighborhood characteristics, and indirectly adjusted for smoking and obesity using an auxiliary dataset. The findings for COPD were robust to adjustment for these potential confounding variables. Interestingly, healthier adults (those without comorbidities and those who were younger at baseline) had a larger relative risk of COPD in association with pollution than those who had more comorbidities or were older. As in other research on the health effects of pollution, residents in neighborhoods of lower socioeconomic position had a heightened risk of COPD incidence in association with PM$_{2.5}$ compared with those in more privileged neighborhoods.

The authors examined the shape of exposure–response relationships and found “supralinear functions” for PM$_{2.5}$, O$_3$, and the redox-weighted oxidative potential of O$_3$ and NO$_2$, meaning that the exposure–response relationship for COPD incidence was steeper at lower exposure concentrations (<10 μg/m$^3$ PM$_{2.5}$ and <40 ppb O$_3$) and less steep at higher exposure concentrations. This pattern of greater health effects per increment of pollution at the lower range of exposure has been observed for other health effects of PM$_{2.5}$ and O$_3$ exposure, including mortality (2). For NO$_2$ exposure, there appeared to be a threshold effect with increasing risk for COPD only above 25 ppb. The authors importantly highlight that these adverse effects were observed for concentrations well below the current U.S. national ambient air quality standard for PM$_{2.5}$, O$_3$, and NO$_2$. Several recent reports have concluded that despite the strong plausibility that outdoor pollution causes COPD (based in part on the compelling evidence for tobacco and indoor biomass smoke), the evidence thus far has been deemed insufficient to determine causality (3–5). This study provides compelling evidence that long-term exposure to higher concentrations of ambient pollution increases the incidence of COPD.

In contrast, results for adult-onset asthma were null. There are several possible reasons for these null results: 1) there is truly no effect of air pollution during adulthood on adult-onset asthma at the pollution concentrations observed; 2) sampling error, which randomly resulted in variation from the true population effect; or 3) bias was present in the study that only (or more severely) impacted the asthma analysis and not the COPD analysis. We discuss each of these below.

Air pollution exposure may not increase the risk of asthma in adults at the concentrations observed in this study. A recent American Thoracic Society workshop concluded that traffic-related...

---

*This article is open access and distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial No Derivatives License 4.0 ([https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/)). For commercial usage and reprints, please contact Diane Germ (dgerm@thoracic.org).

Originally Published In Press as DOI: 10.1164/rccm.202011-4168ED on December 4, 2020