Bioaccumulation of Lead by Pepper Elder (*Peperomia pellucida* (L.) Kunth) in a Lead-Contaminated Hydroponic System

Jessica O. Tablang, Florenda B. Temanel, Ron Patrick C. Campos*, and Helen C. Ramos

College of Arts and Sciences, Isabela State University-Echague, 3309 Isabela, Philippines

**ARTICLE INFO**

Received: 28 Jan 2021
Received in revised: 21 Mar 2021
Accepted: 21 Apr 2021
Published online: 25 May 2021
DOI: 10.32526/ennrj/19/2021010

**ABSTRACT**

Lead (Pb) has become one of the most common heavy metal contaminants, demanding research on economical remediation approaches with minimal ecological impacts. Pepper elder (*Peperomia pellucida*) is a fast-growing plant that can be a candidate for bioaccumulation and phytoremediation. In this study, the lead bioaccumulation of *P. pellucida* was assessed by determining the growth response and absorptive capacity of the plant. Plants were grown in hydroponic solution spiked with 500 mg/L of Pb for 28 days. Growth response, absorptive capacity and tolerance of plants grown in contaminated nutrient solution were determined in comparison with control plants. After 28 days of exposure, lead phytotoxicity symptoms such as wilting, chlorosis and necrosis were observed on some plants. The control plants recorded 3.08 g total dry weight (DW) compared to the 1.35 g in Pb-contaminated plants. The tolerance index (TI) of *P. pellucida* was at 43.40%. The plants were able to absorb lead, with the concentration of lead in the roots (158.6 µg/g) being greater than the concentration of the metal in the shoots (43.2 µg/g). Meanwhile, bioconcentration factor (BCF) and translocation factor (TF) values were recorded at 0.40 and 0.27, respectively. BCF criterion indicates that the plant is not suitable for phytoextraction, but TF value shows that the plant can be a potential excluder. The findings of the study show that *P. pellucida* accumulated considerable amount of lead within its tissues, indicating that the plants may be further exploited for their capacity to absorb heavy metals by tweaking several factors that may affect its bioaccumulation ability.

**Keywords:** Pepper elder/ *Peperomia pellucida*/ Phytoremediation/ Heavy metal/ Lead

* Corresponding author:
E-mail: ronpatrick.campos@gmail.com

1. INTRODUCTION

Global industrialization and human activity have caused the widespread contamination of persistent pollutants that resulted in the degradation of the environment (Lado et al., 2008). This is caused by contamination of inorganic and organic pollutants from various sources such as direct discharge of industrial effluents to soil, accidental spillage of chemicals, application of agrochemicals to soils and the percolation of contaminated surface water to subsurface stratum, or improper disposal of wastes (Mirsal, 2004). Many heavy metals can be considered essential to the life cycles of both flora and fauna, but may reach toxic levels when the number of pollutants exceeds the demand of the inherent biological systems (Mandkini et al., 2016). Furthermore, the non-biodegradability of heavy metal pollutants creates a hazard when discharged in soils and bodies of water (Thayaparan et al., 2013).

Lead (Pb) has become one of the most common heavy metal contaminants in the soil (Thayaparan et al., 2013; Solidum et al., 2010). Lead contamination has become prevalent due to existing mining and smelting activities (Liu et al., 2010) and the disposal of sewage sludge and industrial wastes (Ona et al., 2006), as well as being a component of common products such as paints, gasoline and explosives.

Phytoremediation is a cheap and reliable technology that is utilized for the cleansing of polluted environments that can potentially address the problems of contaminated areas affected by urban and industrial activities (Mojiri, 2011). It is based on exploiting plant’s natural mechanisms to detoxify and accumulate heavy metals within soil or from aquatic environments.
environments (Mandkini et al., 2016). Plants can be used to either partially or substantially remediate different media including sludge, soil, groundwater, sediment and waste water contaminated with pollutants (Salt et al., 1998).

Owing to its physiological and morphological characteristics, *Peperomia pellucida* can be a candidate for bioaccumulation and phytoremediation. This plant, commonly referred to as shiny bush, clear weed or pepper elder, belongs to the family Piperaceae. It is an herbaceous plant found in many South American and Asian countries (Arquion et al., 2015) and is distinguished by its heart-shaped and fleshy leaves with lush and succulent stems, shallow roots and small flowers, which eventually develop into numerous tiny seeds attached on cord-like spikes (Tablang et al., 2020). In the Philippines, the plant has been listed as one of the clinically tested and approved alternative herbal medicines endorsed by the Department of Health (Tolentino et al., 2019). Traditionally, the plant is used in the treatment of different ailments such as convulsions, conjunctivitis, headache, fever, gout, skin diseases, and rheumatic pains (Tolentino et al., 2019; Mosango, 2008; Raghavendra and Kekuda, 2018).

Pepper elder possesses a number of remarkable qualities which makes it a candidate for phytoremediation. It is (1) a plant with fast growth rates (McIntyre, 2003); (2) produces large biomass above and below ground (Mosango et al., 2008); (3) establishes a vast niche for the development of rhizosphere microorganisms (Kirk et al., 2002); and (4) is widely distributed, well adapting to different climatic conditions. In a study by Anoliefo et al. (2006), *P. pellucida* was labelled as the plant species with the most engine oil-tolerant phytoremediation capacity in Benin City, Nigeria because it was found in every heavy metal contaminated site in the city. *P. pellucida* grown on lead, copper and manganese contaminated soils also showed accumulation of up to 1,769 ppm of copper, 2,478 ppm of lead and 621 ppm of manganese (Calawagan et al., 2012). Belonias (2009) further supported the capacity of the plant to bioaccumulate lead, concluding that *P. pellucida* can tolerate Pb levels as high as 400 ppm without affecting its growth. Moreover, it was reported that *P. pellucida* can contain high amount of toxic metals like lead (Pb) and cadmium (Cd) surpassing the limits allowed by the World Health Organization (De Guzman, 1999).

The deterioration of the environment due to lead contamination demands technology involving economical approaches with minimal ecological impacts. Phytoremediation through bioaccumulation can be one of these approaches. With the objective of determining the lead-absorptive capacity and heavy metal tolerance of *P. pellucida*, this study was conducted to evaluate the potential of *P. pellucida* in the bioaccumulation of lead *ex situ* and determine the growth response of the plant upon exposure to Pb contamination in a hydroponic setting.

2. METHODOLOGY

2.1 Plant collection and acclimatization

Plant samples of *P. pellucida* were obtained from uncontaminated sites in Isabela State University, Echague, Isabela (16.7212° N, 121.6887° E). Young and healthy plants in uniform height were selected, and tested for initial heavy metal content to ensure absence of heavy metals prior to experimentation. Collected plants were transplanted individually in a sowing bed containing 50.8 mm-deep coconut coir dust. The plants were watered regularly for three (3) days. After which, each plant was transferred to individual growing pots and introduced to the nutrient solution for ten (10) days to allow the plants to adapt to the experimental conditions and to obtain substantial biomass prior to contamination.

2.2 Hydroponic system set-up and experimental set-up

This study employed the Simple Nutrient Addition Program (SNAP) hydroponics system, a non-circulating, passive aeration hydroponics system (Santos and Ocampo, 2005).

A treatment series of 0 mg/L (control) and 500 mg/L Pb (Pb-contaminated) was prepared on par with the regulatory standards for environmental levels of the heavy metal (USEPA, 1992). Lead stock solution was prepared using analytical grade Pb (NO₃)₂. After the 10-day acclimatization period, the nutrient solution was spiked with 500 mg/L of lead by dissolving 8.789 g of Pb (NO₃)₂ in every 11 litre-capacity culture boxes. Control plants were grown exclusively on nutrient solution.

In each treatment, four hydroponic culture boxes were set up, each containing eight (8) individual plants of *P. pellucida*. The schematic diagram of the hydroponic set up is presented in Figure 1. The experiment was conducted for 28 days and toxicity symptoms of plants were observed throughout the experiment.
2.3 Monitoring of growth response

Growth response to lead contamination was determined by measuring the observable physical changes in the test plants, such as height, leaf area and number of leaves. Measurement was done periodically before and after Pb contamination. These factors are the indications that the tested plant species had undergone lead bioaccumulation in terms of physical changes. Dry weight of the plants was calculated using the formula:

$\text{Dry Weight (g)} = \frac{\text{Total dry weight of plants in treatment (g)}}{\text{Total number of plants in treatment}}$

2.4. Plant harvesting

At the end of the 28-day growth period, the *P. pellucida* plants were gently removed from each growing pot while carefully separating the coconut coir dust from roots. After which, they were rinsed with distilled water to remove adherent debris, taking extra caution to preserve as much root as possible. The roots of the plant were then gently separated from shoots (stems and leaves). Separately, the above ground and below ground parts were cut into smaller pieces and blot-dried. Root and shoot samples were separately placed in microwavable containers, labelled and subjected to oven-drying at 80°C for 72 h. After which, the dried plant samples were weighed and acid-digested.

2.5 Sample preparation and analysis

The USEPA (2007) Method 7000B as modified by Atayese et al. (2009) was used in the preparation of plant tissues for lead-content analysis. Once the drying process is completed, the tissue was removed from the containers and ground using a mortar and pestle. Approximately, 0.5 g of homogenized powder (shoot or root) was transferred into a 100 mL conical flask and 5 mL of concentrated H$_2$SO$_4$ was added, followed by the addition of 25 mL of concentrated HNO$_3$. Then, the contents of the conical flask were heated on a heating plate at 100°C until a clear solution is obtained. After cooling, distilled water was added to the falcon tube to obtain a final volume of 25 mL. The filtered and rinsed solution was collected in a sterile, 25 mL capacity graduated falcon tube. Finally, the falcon tube was left to settle down for 24 h. Each tube was labelled and prepared for Flame Atomic Absorption Spectroscopy (Flame AAS) analysis.
2.6 Computation of absorptive capacity and tolerance parameters

In response to Pb exposure, the following heavy metal absorptive capacity and tolerance parameters were determined: survival rate (SR), tolerance index (TI), bioconcentration factor (BCF), translocation factor (TF) and lead metal uptake. These were calculated following the equations of Meenikuriit et al. (2012), Zhivotovsky et al. (2011), Yaowakhan et al. (2005), Tanhan et al. (2007), Niu et al. (2007), and Vamerali et al. (2010):

1) Survival rate (SR): This is percentage of plants still alive after the experimentation period computed as:

\[
SR = \left( \frac{\text{Final number of plants}}{\text{Initial number of plants}} \right) \times 100
\]

2) Tolerance index (TI): This is the ratio of dry weight in plants grown on contaminated solution and control plants grown on uncontaminated solution, and is expressed as a percentage using the formula:

\[
TI (\%) = \left( \frac{\text{Dry weight of plant in Pb treatment (g)}}{\text{Dry weight of plant in control treatment (g)}} \right) \times 100
\]

3) Bioconcentration factor (BCF): This was determined by the ratio of lead concentration in plant tissues to the total metal initial concentration expressed in mg/kg. This was obtained using the following equation (Wilson and Pyatt, 2007):

\[
BCF = \frac{\text{Pb concentration in whole plant (mg/kg)}}{\text{Initial Pb concentration in solution (mg/L)}}
\]

4) Translocation factor: This was used to evaluate the efficiency of *P. pellucida* in translocating the accumulated metal from its roots to shoots. The value was obtained by measuring the ratio in concentration in the aerial tissues and that in the roots, respectively, with the heavy metal content expressed as mg/kg. The following formula was used (Padmavathamamma and Li, 2007):

\[
TF = \frac{\text{Heavy metal concentration in shoot (mg/kg)}}{\text{Pb concentration in root (mg/kg)}}
\]

5) Pb concentration: This is the ratio of the product of AAS reading and dilution factor to the weight of sample used for acid digestion. This was calculated using the formula:

\[
Pb \text{ accumulation} = \frac{\text{AAS Reading (µg/mL) } \times \text{ Dilution Factor (mL/g)}}{\text{Weight of sample (g)}}
\]

6) Pb uptake: It is the ratio of the lead concentration in the tissues of *P. pellucida* and the dry biomass of the plant after experimentation. This is determined by the following formula:

\[
Pb \text{ uptake (µg/plant)} = \frac{\text{Pb accumulation (µg/g) } \times \text{ dry weight (g/plant)}}
\]

2.7 Statistical analysis

Paired Student’s t-test was used to evaluate the growth response of the plant on Pb exposure. The dry weight was also compared using the said test. For heavy metal absorptive capacity and tolerance parameters, the values were computed based on given formula.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Growth response of *P. pellucida* on lead (Pb) contamination

The growth response and performance of *P. pellucida* in the presence of Pb can determine its viability as a phytoremediator. The physiological parameters and growth response of *P. pellucida* upon lead-exposure is presented in Figure 2-4. Throughout the experimental growth period, *P. pellucida* plants grown exclusively on nutrient solution were constantly growing, as noticed in the gradual and continuous increase in plant height, leaf number and leaf area (Figure 2-4). On the other hand, *P. pellucida* plants exposed to 500 mg/L of Pb were growing relatively at the same rate as the unexposed plants during the first two weeks of experimentation; however, manifestation of lead phytotoxicity appeared during the third week, where biomass production was affected as implied in the reduction of plant height, leaf number and leaf area of lead-exposed plants. Relative growth of uncontaminated and contaminated plants became divergent during the third week of experimentation. Plants grown solely on nutrient solution depicted an upward slope of relative growth, exhibiting constant linear increment in height, and leaf number and area; whereas lead-contaminated plants showed a curb in the figures of plant height, leaf number and leaf area during the third week of exposure (Figure 2-4), mainly due to the slowed
growth and death of some plants. Symptoms of lead phytotoxicity such as drooping, necrosis and leaf bleaching also started to manifest as early as the second week, while the indications became more apparent during the third and fourth week where lead-exposed plants started to wilt, lose turgidity and die.

**Figure 2.** Effect of 500 mg/L Pb on the plant height of *P. pellucida.*

**Figure 3.** Effect of 500 mg/L Pb on the leaf number of *P. pellucida.*

**Figure 4.** Effect of 500 mg/L Pb on the leaf area of *P. pellucida.*
Throughout the first two weeks of experimentation, the plant height, leaf number and leaf area of the plants were not significantly affected \((p>0.05)\) by the presence of 500 mg/L of Pb concentration. This is because of the consistent increment of biomass produced in both treatments during the first two weeks. However, at the conclusion of the experimental period, final mean values for plant height, leaf number and leaf area were determined to be significantly different from each other \((p>0.05)\) with respect to the presence or absence of 500 mg/L of Pb.

As plants grow in a contaminated environment, they tend to continue to absorb Pb and sequester the metal within their tissues, causing the toxicity symptoms in the plant to increase. In hydroponics experiment, \(P.\ pellucida\) grew well without the presence of Pb concentrations, and little to no morphological symptoms such as chlorosis and necrosis were observed. However, lead-exposed plants had reduced total biomass which is a result of decreased number of leaves, fresh and dry weight, and length of root and shoot. According to Belonias \((2009)\), \(P.\ pellucida\) can tolerate lead levels of up to 400 ppm, with Pb-treated plants and the control showing comparably uniform vigorous growth during a 3-week experimental period. However, in this study, the 500 mg/L concentration had significant effect on the growth response of the plant. Same results were obtained by some other studies at the calculated lead concentration on different plants; root, shoot and leaf growth, fresh and dry biomass were critically reduced in \(Pisum\ sativum,\ Zea\ mays,\ Paspalum\ distichum,\ Cynodon\ dactylon,\ Lycopersicon\ esculentum,\ Ipomoea\ aquatica,\ Phaseolus\ vulgaris,\) and \(Lens\ culinaris\) \((Nas\ and\ Ali,\ 2018;\ Jaja\ and\ Odoemena,\ 2004;\ Gothberg\ et\ al.,\ 2004)\).

The result of the study shows that manifestation of Pb effect on plant is evident after two to three weeks. Manifestations of toxicity became apparent as the plants were increasingly exposed to the Pb. Visual examination of the plants exposed to Pb also shows signs of toxicity such as necrosis of leaf tip and darkened shoot base, pale-colored leaves, drooped and shrunken shoots and short and dark roots, with heavily shrunken shoot base (Figure 5).

![Figure 5. Lead-phytotoxicity symptoms during the four-week exposure period; (A) second week plants showing necrosis of leaf tip and darkened shoot base; (B) third week plants with pale-colored leaves and drooped and shrunken shoots; (C) final week plants showing short and dark roots, with heavily shrunken shoots base (top) and deceased plant (bottom).](image)
These results and observations corroborate with the findings of Sharma and Dubey (2005) and Nas and Ali (2018). According to them, the visual non-specific symptoms of Pb toxicity are rapid inhibition of root growth, stunted growth of the plant and chlorosis. This claim is also supported. They stated that Pb toxicity is manifested outwardly in the plant such as stunted growth, chlorosis and blackening of the root system. In addition, Pb inhibits photosynthesis, upsets mineral nutrition and balance, changes hormonal status and affects membrane structure and permeability. These disorders upset normal physiological activities of the plants (Nas and Ali, 2018).

It can also be noted in the result that symptoms of Pb toxicity were manifested by the plants in the later part of the experimental period. This may mean that the amount of Pb absorbed in the earlier part of the experiment is not yet considerable. According to Putra et al. (2016), the amount of Pb accumulation must be in considerable amount to inhibit plant metabolism before showing a visible phytotoxic and oxidative damage effect.

### 3.2 Lead tolerance of *P. pellucida*

Tolerance is an organism’s ability to cope with heavy metals that are excessively accumulated within its body. The effect of lead on biomass production and the parameters for lead tolerance are presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Lead tolerance of *P. pellucida* after 28 days of exposure.

| Treatments          | Dry weight (g) | Lead tolerance parameters |
|---------------------|----------------|--------------------------|
|                     | Roots          | Shoots                   | Total                  | Survival rate (%) | Tolerance index (%) |
| Control (0 mg/L)    | 0.43±0.20³     | 2.65±0.95³               | 3.08±1.08³             | 93.70             | -                     |
| Pb-contaminated     | 0.21±0.10³     | 1.15±0.37³               | 1.35±0.46³             | 71.80             | 43.40                 |

Note: Each value is mean of four replications ± standard deviation. Mean of each column indexed with different small letters denote a significant difference of relative leaf number between absence and presence of Pb concentration (500 mg/L) as determined by paired t-test at p≤0.05.

Higher survival rate was also observed in the control group with 93.70%, while only 71.80% survival rate was observed in Pb contaminated plants. Result also shows that plants exposed to 500 mg/L Pb had a tolerance index (TI) of 43.40% which is relatively low. Herlina et al. (2020) suggested that plants with TI values greater than 100% reflect a net increase in biomass and tolerance-acquisition of the plant, whereas, TI values lower than 100% indicate a net decrease in biomass and a stressed plant condition. However, it was suggested by Zhivotovsky et al. (2011) and Wang et al. (2014) that a 60% TI criterion value indicates ability of plants to tolerate heavy metals. The recorded TI value for *P. pellucida* (43.40%) was far below 100%, indicating that the plants have become stressed throughout the experiment as evident in the retardation of growth of the plants.

Different plant species develop different mechanisms to tolerate excess levels of metals (Aini Syuhaida et al., 2014). The earliest mechanism is a synthesis of polysaccharide such as callose (β-1, 3 glucan) deposited on the outside of the cell membrane, thereby reducing the diffusion of heavy metal ions into the plant cell. In *in situ* applications and in soil experiments, plant roots secrete exudates into the soil matrix to chelate metals and to prevent their uptake inside the cells (Furini, 2012; Małachowska-Jutsz and Gnida, 2015). However, in a hydroponics experiment, this mechanism is hardly employed due to the roots being suspended in a liquid environment, thus preventing the roots from releasing the exudates and thereby reducing the resistance from lead uptake.

### 3.3 Lead accumulation and lead absorptive capacity of *P. pellucida*

Table 2 presents the accumulation and absorptive capacity of *P. pellucida* after 28 days of exposure to 500 mg/L to Pb. This lead absorptive capacity was measured in terms of Pb uptake (µg/plant), bio-accumulation factor (BCF) and translocation factor (TF).
Results showed that there is an accumulation of Pb in the tissues of *P. pellucida* plants. The amount of Pb accumulated in the roots (158.6 µg/g) is greater than the amount accumulated in the shoots (43.2 µg/g). This result implies that the roots system of the *P. pellucida* has the ability to absorb Pb; however, translocation into the shoot system might have been restricted. According to Mleczek et al. (2019), mechanisms of metal uptake and accumulation in plants have demonstrated that plants have the ability to translocate selected elements in its tissues, with the roots being the most capable organ in taking up significant quantities of Pb whilst simultaneously restricting translocation to hypogeous parts.

The Pb concentrations (158.6 µg/kg in shoots, and 43.2 µg/kg in roots) from this study were lower than Pb concentrations reported in shrubs; for example, *Chromolaena odorata* (L.) with Pb in shoots 1,721 mg/kg, and in roots 51,493 mg/kg (Niu et al., 2007). The results follow a similar trend as some other studies. The other common phenomenon is Pb accumulation in roots more than that in shoots and several previous studies, including this study, show the same pattern. Zhivotovsky et al. (2011) found that at the highest Pb concentration of 241 µM, *Salix lucida, Salix nigra,* and *Salix serissima* had higher Pb concentration in roots than in aerial tissue, such as wood, in shoot and in leaves. Liu et al. (2015) found that *Phyllostachys pubescens* grown in nutrient solution supplemented with 200 µM Pb contained higher Pb in the root (1,221 mg/kg) as compared to that in the stem (351 mg/kg) and in leaf (165 mg/kg).

The Pb uptake of *P. pellucida* plants was calculated to be 272.43 µg/plant. Meanwhile, BCF and TF values were recorded at 0.40 and 0.27, respectively. Ramana et al. (2021) stated that (BCF) and Translocation Factor (TF) are the defining parameter in phytoremediation by providing insight on metal uptake, mobilization and storage. Since, BCF and TF values are used to evaluate a plant’s ability to accumulate and translocate heavy metals, and identify the suitability of plants for phytoextraction and phytostabilization (Niu et al., 2007; Wang et al., 2014), values >1 indicate that the plant has the potential for phytoextraction (Ali et al., 2013). With BCF criterion, *P. pellucida* shows relatively low potential for bioaccumulation.

According to Napoli et al. (2020), a high value of TF (TF>1) signifies promising ability of a plant to translocate heavy metals from roots to aerial tissues. On the other hand, a low value (TF<1) indicates a limited capacity of a plant to translocate the metal to aerial tissues. In this study, *P. pelludica* recorded TF value <1. This is indicative of *P. pelludica*’s low capacity to uptake high quantity of Pb, potentially classifying the plant as an excluder of Pb.

The uptake and translocation of a pollutant in plants depends on many factors: (1) the pollutant’s concentration in the solution, (2) its efficiency to enter the root system, and (3) the rate of transpiration in the plants (Glime, 2017). Pepper elder plants are very reliant to the turgor pressure within their systems, and any disruption in this system might compromise the integrity of their structures and the plant in general.

In this study, *P. pellucida* was determined to have the capacity to accumulate and uptake lead in its tissues. On the other hand, the results showed values of phytoremediation parameters (SR, TI, BCF, TF) that are below the criterion for each respective parameter. This implies that, the plants were affected by the spiking of 500 mg/L of Pb. Despite this, the plants showed the capacity to uptake lead and still survive, which is promising considering that the concentration of lead used to spike the nutrient solution was relatively high. Nevertheless, it must still be taken into account that the experiment was conducted *ex situ* in a hydroponic setting with a single treatment. The present conditions might have affected the capacity of *P. pellucida* to survive, uptake and accumulate lead in its tissues, and different results may be obtained in a pot experiment.

**4. CONCLUSION**

Manifestations of toxicity became apparent as the plants were exposed longer to Pb. Prolonged exposure to Pb induced phytotoxicity symptoms and reduced biomass production, affecting plant height, leaf number and leaf area as implied in the curb of the respective growth parameters during the third week of exposure, which consequently caused retardation of
growth. Lead-absorptive capacity parameters imply that the plant may be classified as a heavy metal excluder. Despite the manifestations of phytotoxicity, \textit{P. pellucida} absorbed considerable amounts of lead within its tissues, especially its roots. This indicates that the plant may be further exploited for their capacity to absorb heavy metals. Only a limited number of studies and reports on bioaccumulation, phytoremediation potential and heavy metal uptake capacity of \textit{P. pellucida} are available. Hence, this study may establish a framework for future studies to improve efficiency and ability of the plant in heavy metal accumulation.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

The author would like to give special thanks to the faculty of the Department of Biological Sciences of Isabela State University for their assistance in carrying out this study.

**REFERENCES**

Aini Syuhaida AW, Norkhidijah SIS, Praveena SM, Suriyani A. The comparison of phytoremediation abilities of water mimosa and water hyacinth. ARPN Journal of Science and Technology 2014;4:722-31.

Ali H, Naseer M, Sajad MA. Phytoremediation of heavy metals by \textit{Trifolium alexandrinum}. International Journal of Environmental Science 2013;2:1459-69.

Anoliefo G, Ikhaijabe B, Okonofhua B, Diae F. Eco-taxonomic distribution of plant species around motor mechanic workshops in Asaba and Benin City, Nigeria: Identification of oil tolerant plant species. African Journal Of Biotechnology 2006;5(19):1757-62.

Arquion RD, Galanida CC, Villamor B, Aguilar HT. Ethnobotanical study of indigenous plants used by local people of Agusan del Sur, Philippines. Asian Pacific Higher Education Journal 2015;5(2):1-11.

Atayese MO, Egbadon AI, Oluwa KA, Adesodun JK. Heavy metal contamination of amaranthus grown along major highways in Lagos, Nigeria. African Crop Science Journal 2009;6:135-225.

Belonias BS. Bioaccumulation of lead in the medicinal plant \textit{Peperomia pellucida} (L.) Kunth. Philippine Journal of Crop Science 2009;34(1):115.

Calawagan KM, Japitana JJ, Lapada JA, Alvior HB. Phytoremediation potentials of carabao grass (\textit{Paspalum conjugatum}), talahib (\textit{Saccharum spontaneum}), and ulasimang bato (\textit{Peperomia pellucida}) in removing copper (Cu), lead (Pb), and manganese (Mn) in soils. Proceedings of the PSSN 13th National Scientific Meeting; 2013 May 21-25; Cebu Business Hotel, Cebu City: Philippines; 2013.

De Guzman CC. Hydroponic culture of panisit-pansitan (\textit{Peperomia pellucida}). Proceedings of the 1998 Regional Research and Development Symposia, Philippine Council for Agriculture, Forestry and Natural Resources Research and Development; University of the Philippines Los Baños, Los Baños, Laguna: Philippines; 1999. p. 120.

Furini A. Plants and Heavy Metals. Dordrecht, Netherlands: Springer; 2012.

Glime JM. Water relations: Conducting structures. In: Glime JM, editor. Bryophyte Ecology (Volume 1). USA: Michigan Technological University and the International Association of Bryologists; 2017. p. 1-26.

Gothenberg A, Gregor M, Holm K, Bengtsson BE. Influence of nutrient levels on uptake and effects of mercury, cadmium, and lead in water spinach. Journal of Environmental Quality 2004;33(4):1247-55.

Herlina L, Widianaroko B, Sunoko HR. Phytoremediation potential of \textit{Cordyline fruticosa} for lead contaminated soil. Jurnal Pendidikan IPA Indonesia 2020;9(1):42-9.

Jaja ET, Odooema NA. Effect of Pb, Cu, and Fe compounds on the germination and early seedling growth of tomato varieties. Journal of Applied Sciences and Environmental Management 2004;8(2):51-3.

Karimi R, Fitzgerald TP, Fisher NS. A quantitative synthesis of mercury in commercial seafood and implications for exposure in the United States. Environmental Health Perspective 2012;120:1512-9.

Kirk JL, Klimnomos JN, Lee H, Trevors JT. Phytotoxicity assay to assess plant species for phytoremediation of petroleum-contaminated soil. Bioremediation Journal 2002;6:57-63.

Lado LR, Hengl T, Reuter H. Heavy metals in European soils: A geostatistical analysis of the FOREGS Geochemical database. Geoderma 2008:148:189-99.

Liu S, Xia X, Shen M, Liu R. Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in urban soils of different land uses in Beijing, China: Distribution, sources and their correlation with the city’s urbanization history. Journal of Hazardous Materials 2010;177:1085-92.

Liu D, Li S, Islam E, Chen JR, Wu JS, Ye ZQ, et al. Lead accumulation and tolerance of Moso bamboo (\textit{Phyllostachys pubescens}) seedlings: Applications of phytoremediation. Journal of Zhejiang University Science B 2015;16(2):123-30.

Malachowska-Jutsz A, Gnida A. Mechanisms of stress avoidance and tolerance by plants used in phytoremediation of heavy metals. Archives of Environmental Protection 2015;41(4):96-103.

Mandkini LL, Bandara NG, Gunawardana D. A Study on the phytoremediation potential of \textit{Azolla pinnata} under laboratory conditions. Journal of Tropical Forestry and Environment 2016;6(1):36-49.

McIntyre T. Phytoremediation of heavy metals from soils. Advances in Biochemical Engineering/Biotechnology 2003;78:97-123.

Me秦国 YuK, Pokethityyook P, Kratuchave M, Tanpan P, Chaiyarat R. Phytostabilization of a Pb-contaminated mine tailing by various tree species in pot and field trial experiments. International Journal of Phytoremediation 2012;14:925-38.

Mirsal IA. Soil Pollution, Origin, Monitoring and Remediation. Berlin, Heidelberg, Germany: Springer; 2004.

Mleczek M, Rutkowski P, Kaniuczak J, Szostek M, Budak A, Magdziak Z, et al. The significance of selected tree species age in their efficiency in elements phytoextraction from wastes mixture. International Journal of Environmental Science and Technology 2019;16:3579-94.

Mohir A. The potential of corn (\textit{Zea mays}) for phytoremediation of soil contaminated with cadmium and lead. Journal of Biological and Environmental Science 2011;5(13):17-22.
