A Multimodal Critical Discourse Analysis of Samsung’s *Ingenius*, Website, Consumers’ Comments, and Samsung-Apple Brand Positioning

Marcella Evelyn
English Department, Faculty of Languages and Literature, Petra Christian University, Siwalankerto 121-131, Surabaya 60236, INDONESIA
Email: m11415049@john.petra.ac.id; cellaevelynn@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This study analyzed *Ingenius* video advertisement. *Ingenius* is a video advertisement produced by Samsung. However, Samsung only shows its competitor’s product (Apple IPhone X) from the beginning until the end of the video. The video is divided into seven segments and was analyzed by using both Multimodal Discourse Analysis and Critical Discourse Analysis three-dimension framework by Fairclough. This study is expected to find how the Apple IPhone X is represented by Samsung in their *Ingenius* video advertisement, to find the *Ingenius* messages according to Samsung’s website, to see the reaction of its consumers, and to find how the brand positioning of Samsung and Apple in the society. Multimodal Discourse Analysis is used to analyze the inner dimension of the framework by using *Ingenius* video advertisement as the text or discourse. The second dimension is analyzed by using the official Samsung explanation from its website about the video to see the meaning of each segment from the producer to consumers and using the YouTube comments to see how the consumers of the video (viewers) react after watching the video. The outer dimension sees the brand positioning from online newspapers, websites, and blogs to see how the society perceives Apple and Samsung as smartphone brands.

Keywords: Multimodal Discourse Analysis (MDA), Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), Advertisements, Discourse.

INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, it is nearly impossible to avoid being exposed to advertising. Advertisements occur to be found everywhere and in many situations. Advertising is basically a way of communication to encourage an audience for making purchase decision about a product or service and conveying information to viewers (Ryans, 1996). The major aim of advertising is usually to impact on buying behavior (to make the audience make a purchase on a certain product or service). This kind of advertising purpose is used in general direct advertising, where through an advertisement, a brand communicates directly to the viewers about their product therefore the viewers will become interested and then make a purchase. Another type of advertisement is called indirect advertising that has the opposite meaning, where instead of promoting a specific product, a brand chooses to promote their brand through an advertisement. These two are the general concepts of how a brand does their advertisement, direct and indirect.

*Ingenius* is a video advertisement produced by Samsung when both IPhone X had been launched in November 2017 and Samsung launched Galaxy S9 in 16 March 2019. This video advertisement is different from direct or indirect type of advertising as mentioned above. *Ingenius* was made in an indirect way to represent another brand (its competitor). In an advertisement, advertisers are supposed to offer a product that is shown to the public through social media (Rhenald Khasali, 1992). However, Samsung does not do that in this video advertisement. Instead of showing the best features of the product that they wanted...
to advertise (Samsung Galaxy S9), Samsung made the video concept of using the Apple brand. It is definitely an indirect type of advertising, but in a direct way by fully using Samsung’s greatest competitor’s (Apple) store, brand, and product in their advertisement. *Ingenius* has the same main character in every scene, a long-hair-ponytailed guy wearing a blue shirt named Pat as the Shop Assistant (SA) (Image1.1).

![Image 1.1](Image1.1)

Figure 1 Pat, the main character of *Ingenius*

He (Pat) always provides odd logic and disappointing responses trying to represent iPhone against Samsung positive points brought out by the seven customers in six different scenes. Each scene shows a different criticism of iPhone X (read: ten) such as the lack of fast charger, memory slot, the need for an additional dongle (a small device able to be connected to and used with a computer, headphone, charger), the camera that gets lower DxOMark test score than the Galaxy S9 (the difference was 99 to 97), and several more.

The writer got interested in conducting this research particularly on this Samsung video advertisement *Ingenius* for three reasons. First, Apple and Samsung brands are the most two best-selling smartphone brands in the market and also at the same time they both are the greatest competitors. Second, it is obviously clear that in this advertisement Samsung does not only want to advertise their new S9 product, but they must also have another meaning behind. It can be seen through the whole video is talking about Apple (Samsung’s competitor) instead of the brand Samsung itself. Also, the writer was curious to know whether there is a reaction of another brand (Apple) to Samsung regarding their brand (Apple) being copied (logo and real product included) and why there is or there is not such a reaction from Apple.

In this study, the writer used Multimodal Discourse Analysis (MDA) and Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) because she believed that it would not be enough if she only uses Discourse Analysis (DA) or either one of them. Since what she had was a video advertisement that means not only spoken and written language but also several other semiotic resources (such as the verbal and visual modes) combined together, MDA is a suitable way of analysis. She added CDA (three-dimensional framework by Fairclough) to find how the Apple IPhone X is represented by Samsung in their *Ingenius* video advertisement, to find the messages of *Ingenius* that the producer (Samsung) wanted to show and the consumers’ reaction, and to see the brand positioning of Samsung and Apple in the society.

**METHODS**

In this study, the writer used qualitative approach. In advertising research, qualitative analysis can provide in-depth information on how consumers see and process ads and their meaning (Belk, 2017). Moreover, this study could be qualified as a qualitative study because the data itself is a video, that contains verbal (conversation), action, facial expression, clothing, and physical appearance.

The data of this research was all based on a video advertisement, a Samsung video created by Samsung in 2018. This series has in total of seven segments. Each segment’s duration is around 50 seconds, and these segments are compiled into one video in 3 minutes and 33 seconds. All
the characters in the video speak in English, more specifically American English, because this brand of Apple itself originated in the United States of America. The characters in this video are the Shop Assistant (SA) and seven customers. They consist of three males and four females. The seven customers come from different races: Chinese, African-American, and American. Each customer has a different question or problem about the IPhone X to the SA. They then always end up by comparing it with Samsung Galaxy S9. For example, the first customer has a question concerning the IPhone X’s download speed that she thought it has the fastest download speed, but when compared to Samsung Galaxy S9 it turns out that it does not have the fastest download speed. The second customer starting the conversation with the SA by questioning and also comparing the camera quality of the IPhone X and Samsung Galaxy S9, then it turns out the camera quality of Samsung is better than the Apple IPhone X.

In order to simplify the process of the analysis and make it easier for the readers to follow, the writer analyzed the video advertisement by each segment, it became segment one to seven. The analysis started from the inner, middle, and then outer dimension. In the inner dimension, there are verbal, facial expression, physical appearance, and clothing. The conversation contains sentences spoken by the characters in the advertisement was analyzed in a table. The writer analyzed it sentence by sentence to show the meaning of each sentence said by the characters in the video advertisement in a table 1 as below.

| No | Speaker | Line | Interpretation |
|----|---------|------|----------------|
| 1  |         |      |                |
| 2  |         |      |                |
| 3  |         |      |                |

The analysis continued with the middle dimension, the discourse practice. This dimension involves the production and consumption of the text. Therefore, in order to find what the consumers (Ingenius video viewers) have in mind about this video advertisement from the producer (Samsung), the writer took the YouTube comments as the supporting data. Not all comments are taken as the data since there are more than 15 million viewers and more than 66,000 comments, all comments chosen are the 15 related viewers’ opinion-based comments after watching Ingenius.

The next analysis is the third dimension, the sociocultural practice. It analyzes the social conditions that cause the practice of text production or consumption. The social condition that caused this advertisement being made was actually the competition between the two highest rivalries between Samsung and Apple, that is still happening until today. In this analysis, the writer took some explanations and discussions of these two brands’ competition based on facts and surveys from several trustworthy sources.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

After she had finished collecting, transcribing, and grouping the data. In this analysis, she uses Multimodal and Critical Discourse Analysis. In the first analysis, the text analysis, MDA is used to find how the four semiotic resources work together to make a meaning by analyzing them separately. It is considered as the first or inner dimension of the CDA (text). Then, using CDA to analyze the middle dimension, that is to find the purpose of producing this video and how the consumers (video viewers) react to the video made by Samsung as the producer. The outer dimension is also being analyzed with CDA to find the actual cause of making this video advertisement.
In analyzing the multimodal discourse, the writer refers to the analysis as textual analysis (text level in Fairclough three dimensional framework) that she divided into four parts: verbal mode, facial expression, clothing, and physical appearance. The verbal mode discusses the conversation between the Shop Assistant (SA) and each customer of their interpretation of the IPhone X compared to Samsung. Facial expression discusses the facial expression made by the customers and SA during the conversation. Clothing discusses what the SA and each customer are wearing and how they are represented with the clothing they are wearing in the video advertisement. Physical Appearance discusses the SA’s and each customer’s appearance including skin tone, hair type and color, eyes, and nose. The analysis then continued with the second dimension, the discourse practice analysis. It discusses how Samsung as the producer of Ingenius represents the brand Apple. Then the last part is the sociocultural analysis that discusses what the society sees or thinks about both brands Samsung and Apple or what the society has in mind about these two brands.

**TEXTUAL ANALYSIS**

The textual analysis started with the verbal mode analysis, that was analyzed by each segment. The analysis of the text was divided into two: problem (asked by customer) and the suggestion or solution answer (offered by the SA). Then, the response was analyzed whether it is a positive or negative given by the SA towards the IPhone X. Based on the verbal mode analysis, it was shown that in all segments (one to seven), Apple IPhone X has lack of features (Table 2) if it is compared with the Samsung Galaxy S9. Lack of features meaning the Samsung Galaxy S9 is better than the Apple IPhone X.

| Segment   | Smartphone Features | Apple IPhone X | Samsung Galaxy S9          |
|-----------|---------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|
| Segment 1 | Download speeds     | Slower         | Faster                      |
| Segment 2 | Camera              | Lower          | Better (DxOMark Score)      |
| Segment 3 | Ports               | Has one port   | Has two ports               |
| Segment 4 | Fast Charger        | Need to buy    | Included                    |
| Segment 5 | Multitask           | Need another app. | Able to multitask (no app needed) |
| Segment 6 | MicroSD Slot        | No slot        | Has the slot                |
| Segment 7 | Notch               | Has notch      | Full screen (no notch)      |

As seeing the main points of the conversation in every segment as listed (Table 2), it shows that the producer (Samsung) only points out seven smartphone features that are all better in the Samsung Galaxy S9 side and worse in the Apple IPhone X side. It shows that Samsung wants to represent their smartphone is better than the Apple’s. Clearly that a hidden message behind these sentences in Ingenius are seen as how Samsung wants to represent their competitor’s product as it is worse than their product. The interpretation would be different if Samsung pointed out fifty-fifty the good and bad sides of each smartphone.

Some facial expressions made by the Pat (Pat, a Shop Assistant of Apple Inc.) were analyzed while he is discussing about the IPhone X with the seven customers to see how the Apple IPhone X is represented. It is stated in a career guide (myjobsearch.com), that the duties of a shop assistant of a retail company are to be always ready to answer customers’ questions and to keep the stock (in this case, IPhone) in the shop looking its best. As non-verbal features can express what someone is thinking, analyzing the SA’s facial expressions helps the writer in finding the answer of how Apple is being represented. Each facial expression has a meaning that can support an utterance said by the SA. There are three types of facial expressions that
could be categorized after analyzing these seven segments: during Samsung discussion, during IPhone X discussion, and unidentified. In Samsung discussion, the SA shows excitement and seriousness, he also seems very confident and sure about his answers. On the other hand, less excitement and seriousness are seen when the discussion is about the IPhone X, even once the features of Samsung Galaxy S9 mentioned by the customers, the SA lost his words to answer and defend IPhone. Lastly, there are some unidentified expressions, they all have meanings but not relevant to the context.

Clothing analyzed how each character’s clothing is the video. Based on the clothing, the writer predicted the current job of the characters based on the general knowledge of how someone would dress up, as what people are wearing can represent their social status. It is discussed through the table 3 on the next page.

Table 4.3 Table of clothing and job prediction of each character

| Character | Clothing                                                                 | Job Prediction                                      |
|-----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|
| SA        | Blue T Shirt with a silver Apple logo on the left side chest. (A standard regular uniform for an Apple Sales Associate all around the world). | Apple Sales Assistant                               |
| Customer 1 (female) | Floral blouse, with a black cardigan on top of it. Bringing a saddle-colored sling bag on her shoulder. | Nurse or waitress                                   |
| Customer 2 (male) | Bold glasses. Buttoned up blue striped-shirt, with a brown shoulder bag. | Might be working in a company in IT section         |
| Customer 3 (male) | Patterned-white-shirt, army color ¾ pants. Black headphones hanging on his neck. | Might be a shopkeeper or a taxi driver              |
| Customer 4 (female) | White blouse, with black leather jacket as the outer. Wearing a diamond shape gold necklace. She is wearing glasses with the type of Asian frame of glasses (round). | Might be a supervisor, or an office worker.         |
| Customer 5 (female) | A colorful tribal oversized shirt. She has long colored nails and well-manicured. | Might be working in a saloon or a saloon owner.     |
| Customer 6 (female) | Floral blouse, holding a coat on her left hand (color light brown), wearing a sling bag (saddle color), white trousers, small round gold earrings. | Might be a housewife.                               |
| Customer 7 (male) | A shirt with a nice green gold-patterned jacket on top of it, black pants. He is wearing a big backpack. | Might be a university student.                     |

Based on the analysis, every customer seems to have different job as the clothes they are wearing. It can be determined that the producer (Samsung) points out a good point of Apple in this video advertisement, that the Apple IPhone users come from many and different social status, gender, and professions, not only limited by some certain people. However, in this study, clothing cannot support the writer in finding the answer about how Samsung represents the brand Apple. It is only limited to show that Apple brand is known and used among many people.

The physical appearance discussed each character’s appearance in the Ingenius video advertisement. The physical appearance including age, hair type and color, skin tone, eye shape
and color, and nose, referred as characteristic features. Then the writer predicted the race based on each character’s physical appearance in table 4.4.

| Character | Characteristic Features | Race         |
|-----------|-------------------------|--------------|
| SA        | Age: around 25-30 years old. Light skin tone, dark almost black eye color. Long straight dark brown hair, ponytailed. Neat looking. | American.    |
| Customer 1 (female) | Age: around 28-35 years old. Red hair, dark brown eye color, light skin tone. Curly short red hair (pixie cut) | American.    |
| Customer 2 (male) | Age: around 30-35 years old. Medium skin tone. Curly dark hair. Brown to black eye color. | African-American. |
| Customer 3 (male) | Age: Around 25-30 Very deep skin tone. Very short black hair (almost bald). Big body figure. Wide eyes (color black), Nubian nose (a longer bridge with wide base) | African-American. |
| Customer 4 (female) | Age: around 25 – 30 years old. Light skin tone, small black hooded eyes. Black straight long hair. East-Asian nose (slim, flat shape, a shorter tip) | Chinese-American. |
| Customer 5 (female) | Age: around 30-35 years old. Dreadlock black long hair, deep skin tone, wide eyes (black colored). Nubian nose (a longer bridge with wide base). | African-American (Hippie). |
| Customer 6 (female) | Age: around 30-35 years old. Blonde hair, green-blue eyes. Light skin tone. Celestial nose (turned up) | American.    |
| Customer 7 (male) | Age: around 18-23 years old. Red curly short hair. Light skin tone. Green eyes. Greek nose (straight bridge) | University Student. |

**DISCOURSE PRACTICE ANALYSIS**

The analysis is then continued with the second dimension of Fairclough’s Three Dimension Framework. It sees the reaction and interpretation of the production and consumption of the text (*Ingenius* video advertisement). The production of *Ingenius* is all done by Samsung as the producer. It is shown in the opening of every segment “Samsung presents”. Also, the seven segments are uploaded in Samsung official website (www.samsung.com) with a brief explanation written next to each segment. The text (video) is consumed by the viewers as the consumers of this video.

The messages from the producer to the consumers are shown in the table 4.5. The messages are taken from the Samsung official website. The aim of this table is to show the message from Samsung of producing each segment in *Ingenius*.

| No | Name | Message |
|----|------|---------|
|    |      |         |
|   | Title (Ingenius)                                                                 |   |
|---|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
| 1 | Upgrade to Galaxy, Blazing fast speeds. Our most intelligent camera yet. Switching to the Galaxy S9 or S9+ is a smart move. |   |
| 2 | Segment 1: Incredible speed. Download and stream the content you want at speeds you’ve only dreamed about. The Galaxy S9/S9+ helps you to watch, listen, and play more. |   |
| 3 | Segment 2: Innovative camera. The Galaxy S9 and S9+ have an innovative camera with advanced dual aperture that adapts to bright light as well as super low light, automatically. So enjoy clear, crisp photos no matter the time of day. |   |
| 4 | Segment 3: Simple connections. You shouldn’t have to choose audio over charging. Galaxy smartphones include the standard headphone jack so you can keep using your favorite headphones and ditch the double dongle all together. |   |
| 5 | Segment 4: Convenient charging. The Galaxy S9 smartphones offer a speedy charge right out of the box. Wireless charging is available with Fast Charge Wireless Charging Stands, so no need to fumble with cables or stop watching or texting. |   |
| 6 | Segment 5: Simple multitasking. No need to fuss or swipe through to find what you need. Multi-window is built in to let you conveniently see and use two apps on the same screen. |   |
| 7 | Segment 6: More storage. Keep all your photos and videos without worrying about space on your phone. The Galaxy S9/S9+ offers expandable storage for up to 400GB of total storage on your device |   |
| 8 | Segment 7: Immersive display. Enjoy cinema-quality viewing on the sleek edge-to-edge Infinity Display. The screen curves over the sides for a fully immersive experience—a notch above the rest. |   |

Ingenius is the title of their video advertisement. Samsung uses “Upgrade to Galaxy” as their tagline. They describe Galaxy S9 as a smartphone that has the best camera. The word “switch” and “upgrade” are preferred to use in the explanation in order to highlight that iPhone X is a smartphone with different level compared to it. If people want to be smart enough to have a smart move, they need to switch and upgrade their smartphones to Samsung Galaxy S9, “Upgrade to Galaxy... Switching to the Galaxy S9 or S9+ is a smart move.”

In seven segments of Ingenius, Samsung does not focus on their Galaxy S9, but instead they focus more on criticizing the iPhone X. Some common issues found from iPhone X users are collected then used as the seven contents of Ingenius. They compare their smartphone with the iPhone X from its speed, camera, connector, charger, multitask feature, storage, and display. Some comparisons can be clearly seen from several lines: “Galaxy smartphones include the standard headphone jack so you can keep using your favorite headphones and ditch the double dongle all together”, “The screen curves over the sides for a fully immersive experience—a notch above the rest”. Samsung states with their Galaxy S9 no need for double dongles and no notch because they have infinity display.

All these comparisons can show and be a clue of how Samsung uses iPhone X as their standard for the Galaxy S9, since every feature in detail is compared to the features in iPhone X. As a standard, iPhone X must have come out before Samsung launched their Samsung Galaxy S9, which in fact yes it did. iPhone X was launched on November 3, 2017 and Samsung Galaxy S9 on March 16, 2018. Therefore, it is possible to say that after the iPhone X was launched, Samsung checked the iPhone X in details, collected all the failures and complaints of the iPhone X, and then made the best version of a smartphone, Galaxy S9, which has no failures and lack of features as what its standard has.
The messages from the consumers to producer shown by their reaction or responses toward this video advertisement after they have watched it. The consumers are the *Ingenius* viewers, which are YouTube viewers. These messages are collected from YouTube comments as where the writer downloaded the video from. There are more than 60,000 comments in found in YouTube comment section dated from August 10, 2018 until May 24, 2019 when this analysis was made. Since it is not possible to analyze all the thousands of comments, 15 comments out of more than 60,000 are taken to represent the others. The writer selected the top comments which are opinion-based and related to the video advertisement.

From reading the comments, generally the writer could categorize the comments into three groups: positive, negative, and neutral comments from the viewers after watching *Ingenius*. Comments are categorized as positive if the purpose of this video advertisement is successful, to make the viewers switch their smartphones to Samsung Galaxy S9 after watching the video advertisement. Not many positive comments could be found in the comment section. The direct comparison of seven features between the IPhone X and Samsung Galaxy S9 in *Ingenius* have obviously changed some viewers’ thoughts about the IPhone X. Hossan even wrote he regrets his IPhone after watching *Ingenius*, which it seems like he realizes that Samsung is better than his IPhone, but poorly he had already purchased an IPhone before watching *Ingenius*. Another consumer wants to switch to Samsung because he thinks that Apple is a waste of money and cannot do everything as what Samsung can do. There is also a consumer who does not say whether he is an IPhone or Samsung user, but after watching the advertisement he could conclude that Apple sucks (bad). Some comments are considered as negative if this advertisement does not accomplish its purpose to gain customers, or else bad comments about the video itself. Almost all of the comments or most of them turned out to be all negative. However, the negative itself involves different kinds of reason: ethics, smartphone features, video content, and brand loyalty.

Facial expression analysis shows that each facial expression has a meaning that can support an utterance said by the SA. There are three types of facial expressions that could be categorized after analyzing these seven segments: during Samsung discussion, during IPhone X discussion, and unidentified. In Samsung discussion, the SA shows excitement and seriousness, he also seems very confident and sure about his answers. On the other hand, less excitement and seriousness are seen when the discussion is about the IPhone X, even once the features of Samsung Galaxy S9 mentioned by the customers, the SA lost his words to answer and defend IPhone. Lastly, there are some unidentified expressions, they all have meanings but not relevant to the context.

In this section, the writer discusses about how each character’s clothing is the video. Based on the clothing, the writer predicted the current job of the characters based on the general knowledge of how someone would dress up, as what people are wearing can represent their social status. It is discussed through the table 4.2 on the next page.

| Character | Clothing | Job Prediction |
|-----------|----------|----------------|
| SA        | Blue T Shirt with a silver Apple logo on the left side chest. (A standard regular uniform for an Apple Sales Associate all around the world). | Apple Sales Assistant |
| Customer 1 (female) | Floral blouse, with a black cardigan on top of it. Bringing a saddle-colored sling bag on her shoulder. | Nurse or waitress |
Customer 2 (male) | Bold glasses. Buttoned up blue striped-shirt, with a brown shoulder bag. | Might be working in a company in IT section
---|---|---
Customer 3 (male) | Patterned-white-shirt, army color ¾ pants. Black headphones hanging on his neck. | Might be a shopkeeper or a taxi driver.
Customer 4 (female) | White blouse, with black leather jacket as the outer. Wearing a diamond shape gold necklace. She is wearing glasses with the type of Asian frame of glasses (round). | Might be a supervisor, or an office worker.
Customer 5 (female) | A colorful tribal oversized shirt. She has long colored nails and well-manicured. | Might be working in a saloon or a saloon owner.
Customer 6 (female) | Floral blouse, holding a coat on her left hand (color light brown), wearing a sling bag (saddle color), white trousers, small round gold earrings. | Might be a housewife.
Customer 7 (male) | A shirt with a nice green gold-patterned jacket on top of it, black pants. He is wearing a big backpack. | Might be a university student.

According to the analysis, it is shown that every customer seems to have different job as the clothes they are wearing. It can be determined that the producer (Samsung) points out a good point of Apple in this video advertisement, that the Apple IPhone users come from many and different social status, gender, and professions, not only limited by some certain people. However, in this study, clothing cannot support the writer in finding the answer about how Samsung represents the brand Apple. It is only limited to show that Apple brand is known and used among many people.

In physical appearance analysis, the writer discusses about the physical appearance of each character in the *Ingenius* video advertisement. The physical appearance including age, hair type and color, skin tone, eye shape and color, and nose, referred as characteristic features. Then the writer predicted the race based on each character’s physical appearance in table 4.7.

| Character | Characteristic Features | Race |
|---|---|---|
| SA | Age: around 25-30 years old. Light skin tone, dark almost black eye color. Long straight dark brown hair, ponytailed. Neat looking. | American. |
| Customer 1 (female) | Age: around 28-35 years old. Red hair, dark brown eye color, light skin tone. Curly short red hair (pixie cut) | American. |
| Customer 2 (male) | Age: around 30-35 years old. Medium skin tone. Curly dark hair. Brown to black eye color. | African-American. |
| Customer 3 (male) | Age: Around 25-30 Very deep skin tone. Very short black hair (almost bald). Big body figure. Wide eyes (color black), Nubian nose (a longer bridge with wide base) | African-American. |
| Customer 4 (female) | Age: around 25 – 30 years old. Light skin tone, small black hooded eyes. Black straight long hair. East-Asian nose (slim, flat shape, a shorter tip) | Chinese-American. |
Customer 5  
(name)  
(female)  
Age: around 30-35 years old.  
Dreadlock black long hair, deep skin tone, wide eyes (black colored). Nubian nose (a longer bridge with wide base).  
African-American (Hippie).  

Customer 6  
(name)  
(female)  
Age: around 30-35 years old.  
Blonde hair, green-blue eyes. Light skin tone. Celestial nose (turned up)  
American.  

Customer 7  
(name)  
(male)  
Age: around 18-23 years old.  
Red curly short hair. Light skin tone. Green eyes. Greek nose (straight bridge)  
University Student.  

Based on the physical appearance analysis above, it can be seen that the customers come from different races, American, African-American, Chinese-American with the age range 17-35 years old. It can be determined that the producer (Samsung) points out one more good point of Apple in this video advertisement, that the Apple IPhone users come from different races and age. Unfortunately, physical appearance is only limited to give an additional information about the customers. It could not help further as it is not relevant with the writer purpose which is to find how Samsung represents Apple in the video advertisement.  

DISCOURSE PRACTICE ANALYSIS  

Discourse practice analysis is the second dimension of Fairclough’s Three Dimension Framework. It sees the reaction and interpretation of the production and consumption of the text (Ingenius video advertisement). The production of Ingenius is all done by Samsung as the producer. It is shown in the opening of every segment “Samsung presents”. Also, the seven segments are uploaded in Samsung official website (www.samsung.com) with a brief explanation written next to each segment. The text (video) is consumed by the viewers as the consumers of this video. The messages proposed by the producer and how the consumers react are analyzed as below.  

The messages from the producer to the consumers are shown in the table 4.8. The messages are taken from the Samsung official website. The aim of this table is to show the message from Samsung of producing each segment in Ingenius.  

Table 4.8 Official explanations of seven segments by Samsung  

| No | Name         | Message                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|----|--------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1  | Title (Ingenius) | Upgrade to Galaxy, Blazing fast speeds. Our most intelligent camera yet. Switching to the Galaxy S9 or S9+ is a smart move.                                                                              |
| 2  | Segment 1    | Incredible speed. Download and stream the content you want at speeds you’ve only dreamed about. The Galaxy S9/S9+ helps you to watch, listen, and play more.                                                |
| 3  | Segment 2    | Innovative camera. The Galaxy S9 and S9+ have an innovative camera with advanced dual aperture that adapts to bright light as well as super low light, automatically. So enjoy clear, crisp photos no matter the time of day. |
| 4  | Segment 3    | Simple connections. You shouldn’t have to choose audio over charging. Galaxy smartphones include the standard headphone jack so you can keep using your favorite headphones and ditch the double dongle all together. |
| 5  | Segment 4    | Convenient charging. The Galaxy S9 smartphones offer a speedy charge right out of the box. Wireless charging is available with Fast                                                                         |
In seven segments of Ingenius, Samsung does not focus on their Galaxy S9, but instead they focus more on criticizing the IPhone X. Some common issues found from IPhone X users are collected then used as the seven contents of Ingenius. They compare their smartphone with the IPhone X from its speed, camera, connector, charger, multitask feature, storage, and display. Some comparisons can be clearly seen from several lines: “Galaxy smartphones include the standard headphone jack so you can keep using your favorite headphones and ditch the double dongle all together”, “The screen curves over the sides for a fully immersive experience—a notch above the rest”. Samsung states with their Galaxy S9 no need for double dongles and no notch because they have infinity display.

All these comparisons can show and be a clue of how Samsung uses IPhone X as their standard for the Galaxy S9, since every feature in detail is compared to the features in IPhone X. As a standard, IPhone X must have come out before Samsung launched their Samsung Galaxy S9, which in fact yes it did. IPhone X was launched on November 3, 2017 and Samsung Galaxy S9 on March 16, 2018. Therefore, it is possible to say that after the IPhone X was launched, Samsung checked the IPhone X in details, collected all the failures and complaints of the IPhone X, and then made the best version of a smartphone, Galaxy S9, which has no failures and lack of features as what its standard has.

The messages from the consumers to producer shown by their reaction or responses toward this video advertisement after they have watched it. The consumers are the Ingenius viewers, which are YouTube viewers. These messages are collected from YouTube comments as where the writer downloaded the video from. There are more than 60,000 comments in found in YouTube comment section dated from August 10, 2018 until May 24, 2019 when this analysis was made. Since it is not possible to analyze all the thousands of comments, 15 comments out of more than 60,000 are taken to represent the others. The writer selected the top comments which are opinion-based and related to the video advertisement. From reading the comments, generally the writer could categorize the comments into three groups: positive, negative, and neutral comments from the viewers after watching Ingenius. Some screenshots of the comments are included then interpreted by the writer to see how each consumer reacts concerning this video.

Comments are categorized as positive if the purpose of this video advertisement is successful, to make the viewers switch their smartphones to Samsung Galaxy S9 after watching the video.
advertisement. Not many positive comments could be found in the comment section, only several top latest ones are taken as shown in two screen shots below. The direct comparison of seven features between the IPhone X and Samsung Galaxy S9 in Ingenius have obviously changed some viewers’ thoughts about the IPhone X. One of the consumer even wrote he regrets his IPhone after watching Ingenius, that seems like he realizes that Samsung is better than his IPhone, but poorly he had already purchased an IPhone before watching Ingenius. Another viewer wants to switch to Samsung because he thinks that Apple is a waste of money and cannot do everything as what Samsung can do. There is also a viewer who does not say whether he is an IPhone or Samsung user, but after watching the advertisement he could conclude that Apple sucks (bad).

Some comments are considered as negative if this advertisement does not accomplish its purpose to gain customers, or else bad comments about the video itself. Almost all of the comments or most of them turned out to be all negative. However, the negative itself involves different kinds of reason: ethics, smartphone features, video content, and brand loyalty. A consumer agrees that it is true Apple have some problems but it is not appropriate to make fun of other companies to increase sales, in this case make fun of Apple to increase sales of Samsung Galaxy S9. Another consumer defines both companies: Samsung as a company who does the bully and Apple as a company who is not a bully and gives hate. It means somehow Ingenius gives hates to Apple and influence its viewers to do the same thing. Also, one of the consumers sees Ingenius as a worse Samsung advertisement, which means the previous advertisements were already bad and now they are worse. he realizes that actually this advertisement was made to stand out Galaxy S9 as superior compared to its competitor. he seems to be an IPhone user who is loyal to the Apple brand. As an IPhone user he still prefers IPhone because it is more simple, even though he has watched seven lack of features in the IPhone X. It shows that this advertisement might not work for some loyal users who would still prefer IPhone and accept its failures. Besides, he as an IPhone user seems to be angry after watching his smartphone being compared and mocked in Ingenius. It can be seen of how he uses three exclamation marks “!!!” at the end of his sentence which exclamation mark usually refers to strong feeling and anger.

Neutral comments mean not supporting either brand of smartphone, comments which are considered as neutral are the responses that not taking sides. The number of neutral comments is less than the negative ones found in the comment section. Below are some examples of neutral comments. After reading the neutral comments, the writer could conclude that these viewers might be either IPhone, Samsung, or other brands users who do not get bothered with the Ingenius advertisement being made because choosing either brand is just a matter of preference and it is just as simple as that “If you like IPhone buy an IPhone. If you like Samsung buy a Samsung”. Another viewer comments that IOS (Apple) is good and Android (Samsung) is good too. IOS and Android are different operating systems used in Apple and Samsung.

According to the analysis of the middle dimension of Fairclough framework, it can be concluded that there is no exact same response from consumers which either positive or negative only, the responses are various and come from both IPhone and Samsung users. However, concerning the highest number of comments comes from the negative category, it shows that this advertisement is not fully successful in accomplishing its purposes to persuade and influence the audience: viewers, listeners or readers (Wells,1992). In this case is to gain more customers, to influence and change people’s thoughts from choosing Apple IPhone X to Samsung Galaxy S9.
SOCIOCULTURAL PRACTICE

The outer dimension of Fairclough three dimensional framework data is collected from some online newspapers and reliable blogs which discuss about the two brands: Samsung and Apple. Because of the time limitation and millions of data existence, the writer selected several data to represent other thoughts and ideas which are not selected. This dimension sees the two brands’ (Apple and Samsung) position and how they are perceived by the society in the world as the two most popular smartphone brands.

The *Ingenius* video advertisement is an advertisement produced by Samsung to advertise their newest smartphone, Galaxy S9 series. However, Samsung does not review the best features in the Galaxy S9. The conversation between the Shop Assistant (SA) and each customer is mainly about the Apple IPhone X and later they talk about how the Apple IPhone X cannot beat the Samsung Galaxy S9 in every feature.

Bloomberg (2018) labelled Apple as a multinational technology company founded and developed by Steve Jobs in 1976, that is well known for its smartphone called the IPhone. Bloomberg (2018) labelled Apple as a multinational technology company founded and developed by Steve Jobs in 1976, that is well known for its smartphone called the IPhone. According to Forbes, Apple is the top first world’s most valuable brand (Figure 4.1). The rating itself is based on customers’ evaluation of the benefits and costs of the brand Apple compared to another (Forbes, 2019).

![Forbes The World’s Most Valuable Brands](image)

Figure 4.1 The World’s Most Valuable Brands (Forbes, 2018)

The more customers willing to pay with a higher price for a product, the more valuable a brand is. Customers believe that the product from a certain valuable brand is high quality, then it becomes a status symbol. That is why, Apple does not sell a cheaper iPhone. Each new generation of IPhone releases with a higher price than its last generation (businessinsider, 2018). Apple fans explain that Apple is like BMW (automobile company), they always sell their products in a high price because they do not want to sell anything with cheaper and lower quality. Apple fans (2018), “It does not like selling cheap plastic crap. Because Apple doesn't want to make phones for the masses. Apple only makes products for people who like (and are willing to pay for) the finer things in life-like BMW”. This might be the reason why most people perceive Apple more as a lifestyle brand and not a functional brand (thebrandspecialist, 2018). Subconscious minds of customers have been built by Apple that it is a lifestyle brand that means using Apple products make its users belong to a certain class.

In Appleinsider (2018), it is discussed that news, rumor, forum discussion website for Apple products and services, and everyone including Apple haters agree that Apple has attracted people with a different class of customer compared with other brands: Samsung, Xiaomi, Google, Microsoft or any other major tech brand. Even some other technology brands mock Apple and its customer in advertisements to show how ridiculous the Apple’s fans are, as it is
shown in one example of a Microsoft advertisement (Figure 4.1). This advertisement was made when the sales of their Windows smartphone was not a hit or failed.

Samsung is a South Korean multinational electronics company in Suwon, South Korea and one of the rivals of Apple. However, unlike Apple that only sells gadgets, Samsung also makes other products because they are also a company selling household appliances, making TVs, fridges, washing machines, etc. So they are seen as an approachable brand to all consumers and a good choice (Rosario, 2017). Samsung targets both high ends and middle market by having products in different price range so that people from different level of markets are able to purchase it, including their smartphones. Samsung has their Galaxy S9 as the high end smartphone, then Galaxy A50 for the mid-range, and Galaxy J7 as their cheapest one (Android Authority, 2018). Samsung uses android as their operating system which is also used in some other smartphones with the same system. However, fans of Samsung are not the same and as many as Apple’s. It is shown as Samsung is willing to pay hundreds and even thousands of people to come to their launching product as their fans (Phone Arena, 2016). It happened in one of Samsung Galaxy S6 launching event in China. Samsung paid 500 people in order to make the event looks crowded and success. People were instructed to come with a motivation to check out and take pictures of their new phone (Galaxy S6), but most of these people were taking pictures with their IPhones (Phone Arena, 2016). They were paid for $10 for only 15 minutes attending the event.

Samsung is also known for copying Apple because other brands including Samsung have made Apple smartphones as their standards, after seeing the success of the brand Apple as the most valuable smartphone brand in the world (Forbes, 2019). The overall appearance of the Samsung Galaxy smartphone, the screen, the icons, even the box looked the similar as the IPhone’s (Vanity Fair, 2014). Even some patented features such as “rubber-banding,” a feature that is able to bounce a screen image slightly when a user tries to scroll past the bottom, were identical. Also the “pinch to zoom” feature, that allows its users to manipulate image size by pinching the thumb and forefinger together on the screen and continues with others.

It shows how Apple and Samsung are basically two different smartphone brands based on their target market, operating system, and class. People are calling the IPhones as premium products and in a different class with other smartphones because of the high quality and how Apple makes everything Apple including its operating system and applications). It is in contrast with Samsung which uses android. Even though Samsung and Apple are different, they both have been in competition for some time. Since the designs, software, icons, marketing, retail strategy, and branding of the IPhone have been copied by its rival, Samsung, Steve Jobs got furious about it and sued Samsung (Vanity Fair, 2014). It costs the two companies more than a billion dollars and producing millions of pages of legal papers.

From the above discussion, the writer has been able to answer the question of how Apple is being represented by Samsung and what messages behind it. The closest things that can be analyzed is based on the Samsung advertisement then combined with a brief explanation and how the society perceives about each brand. The writer can conclude that this might be the reason why Samsung started making their comparison advertisements. Since they are no longer able to copy the IPhone, they started to compare their products with the IPhone to show the differences and how Samsung is better than the IPhone, represented in Ingenius video advertisement. The copying and comparison indirectly show Samsung takes the IPhone as their highest standard and then try to make their products above the standard. Samsung might choose Apple as the standard due to its premium brand with a class and certain market which no other brands have.
CONCLUSION

This chapter presents the general conclusion of the writer’s study on Samsung and Apple brands competition based on Ingenius video advertisement. The writer analyzed the discourse (Ingenius) by using both Multimodal Discourse and three-dimension framework by Fairclough as the Critical Discourse Analysis.

In analyzing the first dimension of the advertisement with MDA the writer could find four semiotic resources in Ingenius, but only two of them that could help the writer in finding the answers for her study: verbal mode and facial expression. Verbal mode between the SA and seven customers shows how the content of Ingenius focuses more on another brand, Apple IPhone X’s lack of features. Each lack of feature is insinuated in every segment then said that Samsung Galaxy S9 can do that or have that at the end of every segment. The verbal mode is supported by the facial expression of the SA character in each segment during each discussion. The SA tends to show more excitement, confidence, and seriousness when he explains about Samsung Galaxy S9. On the other hand, the SA tends to lose excitement and confidence when he explains about the IPhone X to the customers. Also regarding at the seven customers’ physical appearance and clothing, the writer concluded that the seven customers come from races and occupations in Ingenius which show that the IPhone users belong any races and occupations.

According to the middle dimension analysis, the writer could find the negative responses took the highest number that come from both Samsung and Apple users which means this advertisement is not fully accomplished its purpose. Its failures can be seen through the responses which are mostly negatives from the viewers as explained in 4.2.2 Consumer to Producer.

The outer dimension of Fairclough three-dimension framework or the sociocultural practice which is the social conditions of Samsung and Apple as two smartphone brands. Based on the analysis of this dimension, it is seen that Apple and Samsung are different types of brand. Apple is considered as premium and has its own class, and Samsung is known for its wide range of smartphones starting from its lowest until highest price. Samsung is also known for copying Apple for its hardware and features even before the comparison video advertisement existed. This advertisement might be a next step of Samsung after they are no longer able to copy IPhone.

From the findings and analysis, the writer could conclude that as a producer, Samsung represents Apple products (IPhone) as its standard by comparing each feature of Samsung Galaxy S9 to IPhone X. The message behind the advertisement is shown by how Samsung Galaxy S9 shows that it has passed the standard and covered all seven IPhone issues in Ingenius video advertisement.

Finally, the writer hopes that her study will be a good example for its readers to understand more about MDA and CDA because there are still not many studies using the combination of MDA and CDA. Also, since now people are living in a multimodal world, most of the texts used in the society are multimodal, including picture books, text books, graphic novels, films, e-posters, web pages, and oral storytelling as they require different modes to be used to make meaning, they have to think more critically.
REFERENCES

Carroll, P. (2019, January 22). Apple iPhone X: Top performer for stills. Retrieved from https://www.dxomark.com/apple-iphone-x-top-performer-stills/

Cohen, Efrat K. “Facial Expressions – The Art of Non-Verbal Communication.” Everyday Power, 12 Mar. 2019, everydaypower.com/facial-expressions-the-art-of-non-verbal-communication/.

Dash, A. G. (2018, August 10). (UPDATED) All Samsung Ingenious Ads. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=WzqXzYGN-gs).

Dilger, D. E. (n.d.). The secret of Apple’s success in selling premium tech as an affordable luxury. Retrieved from https://appleinsider.com/articles/18/12/19/the-secret-of-apples-success-in-selling-premium-tech-as-an-affordable-luxury

Eichenwald, K. (2017, September 19). The Great Smartphone War: Apple vs. Samsung. Retrieved from https://www.vanityfair.com/news/business/2014/06/apple-samsung-smartphone-patent-war

Jewitt, C. (2009). The Routledge Handbook of Multimodal Analysis. London: RoutledgeFalmer.

Kress, G. (2003). Literacy in the New Media Age. London: Routledge.

Kress, G. & Van Leeuwen. (1996). Reading Images: the Grammar of Visual Design. London: Routledge.

Fairclough, N. (1995). Media Discourse. London: Edward Arnold.

Fairclough, N. (2003). Analysing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research. London: Routledge.

O’Halloran, K. L., Tan, S., Smith, B. A. & Podlasov, A. (2011). Multimodal Analysis within an Interactive Software

Polhemus, T. (1994). Streetstyle: From Sidewalk to Catwalk. London: Thames and Hudson, Inc.

Rehm, L. (2019, January 22). Samsung Galaxy S9 Plus review: Premium specs, top-end performance. Retrieved from https://www.dxomark.com/samsung-galaxy-s9-plus-review-premium-specs-top-end-performance-2/

Searle, John R. (1976) Speech Acts. London: Syndics of the Cambridge University Press

Suzuki, D. (2019). The Nature of Things: The Seven Universal Emotions We Wear on Our Face.

Titscher, S. Meyer, M. Wodak, R. (2000). Methods of Text and Discourse Analysis: In Search of Meaning. London: Sage Publications.

VanLeeuwen, T. (2005). Introducing Social Semiotics. London: Routledge.

Wodak, R. (1998). The Discursive Construction of National Identity. Edinburgh: University Press.