Evaluation and Strategy of New-type Urbanization Policy Based On S-CAD Method - A Case Study of Wuhan, China

Wei Wei 1, Mengchen Li 2* and Yongli Jiao 3

1School of China Institute of Development Strategy and Planning, Wuhan University, Hubei, China
2School of urban design, Wuhan University, Hubei, China
3China Executive Leadership Academy. Pudong, Shanghai, China

*Corresponding author e-mail: 359873526@qq.com

Abstract. Using S-CAD policy evaluation method to carry out effect, economic and feasibility analysis on Wuhan's new urbanization policy, the evaluation results show that the logic, needs and feasibility of the policy elements are good, and the adequacy of the policy chain is relatively inadequate, Wuhan's various policies promote new-type urbanization effectively and implement the central-level strategies and goals. The next step is to increase efforts to promote equalization of public services, regional coordinated development, and urban quality improvement. Through the case study of Wuhan, it is verified that the S-CAD method is a meta-method and policy evaluation system that combines political wisdom and scientific knowledge, taking into account qualitative judgment and quantitative analysis, and can be applied to the evaluation of new urbanization construction in cities.

1. Introduction

In March 2014, the “National New Urbanization Plan (2014-2020)” (hereinafter referred to as the Plan) was officially launched, becoming a macro, strategic, and basic plan to guide the healthy development of urbanization in China [1]. Subsequently, the country has identified three batches of new-type urbanization comprehensive pilot cities, requiring each locality to adapt to the new-type urbanization construction according to local conditions, and achieve phased results by 2020, forming replicable and propagable experiences. At present, the critical period of the new urbanization reform has been reached. Based on scientific assessment methods and procedures, a comprehensive and systematic analysis and evaluation of the implementation progress, problems and deficiencies of the new urbanization comprehensive pilot work has been conducted. The smooth progress of the project is crucial.

At present, scholars at home and abroad have done a lot of theoretical analysis and empirical research on the measurement of urbanization level and the construction of indicator systems. The research scale covers national, regional, provincial, and municipal levels. The evaluation methods used are mainly entropy methods, Analytic Hierarchy Process, Principal Component Analysis, Tobit Regression Model, etc., are mostly evaluated from a static perspective [2-5], and the construction of index systems is mostly from urban population, economic development, infrastructure, public services, urban and rural select from the aspects of overall planning and ecological environment [6-8]. Among them, Fang C et al. Based on the development quality evaluation of the urban agglomerations around Hangzhou Bay as an
empirical research and proposed a set of system structure and function analysis index system [9]; The evaluation method is completed, and the overall framework evaluation method based on the perspective of "origin" and "modernization" is demonstrated [10].

This article attempts to start from the new national urbanization planning policy and local measures, and introduces the S-CAD policy evaluation method in the public policy field [11]. This method is Professor Liang Henian's "rational" to the West [12] (emphasis on rationality, logic, and cost-effectiveness Analysis) and "progressive" [13] (emphasis on politics, gaming, and identification) are the reference and development of policy evaluation methods of the two factions, which is a more reasonable and feasible policy evaluation method than the two factions. In recent years, the S-CAD method has been used in public The policy field is widely used, and many scholars have used this method to make empirical evaluation and policy recommendations on the logical relationship and economic efficiency of policy design such as land vertical management policy [14], real estate tax policy [15], and information policy evaluation [16]. This article builds a "local policy-central assessment" central-regional interactive assessment system. The importance of the assessment position (S) is determined according to the policy text. Quantitative analysis (CAD) is performed by experts. Taking Wuhan as an empirical object, consistency, efficiency, and feasibility of policy implementation perform qualitative and quantitative assessments, and scientifically evaluate the implementation effect of Wuhan's new urbanization policy, which will help Wuhan further deepen reforms, help the central government to advance the adjustment and optimization of pilot policies, and provide policies for new urbanization and reform of the system to provide a basis.

2. Method Construction

2.1. Evaluation steps
In response to the new national urbanization policy, the central-land interaction theory is introduced into the S-CAD evaluation. According to the S-CAD method, the analysis process is divided into four steps: The first step is to determine the central requirements to evaluate the dominant viewpoint and identify the position of the central policy elements including goals, strategies, and results; extract the local measures and actual results implemented in Wuhan; the second step is to analyze the logic and causality between viewpoints and policy goals, implementation strategies, local measures and expected results from a leading position; The third step is to compare the expected results of the central design policy with the actual results of the local implementation of the policy. The focus of discussion is that the "measures" selected by the local are successful or failed to achieve the "expected results" of the central government; The fourth step is to analysis evaluation strategies for local interactions and the progress and problems of local new-type urbanization, evaluate the evaluation results and make relevant suggestions.

2.2. Evaluation elements
The purpose of the Planning is to clarify the development goals, strategic tasks and implementation paths of future urbanization. From the perspective of content composition, there are 8 chapters and 31 chapters in the layout and the text is divided into planning background, guiding ideology and development goals, orderly promoting the urbanization of agricultural transfer population, optimization the form of urbanization, improving the sustainable development capacity of the city, promoting the integration of urban and rural development, reforming and improving the system and mechanism of urbanization development, and planning and implementation.

With the central policy as the leading position, determine the evaluation elements, including Value, Goals, Strategies, and Expected results based on the text of the Plan [17] and the National Comprehensive New Urbanization Comprehensive Pilot Implementation Plan (hereinafter referred to as the Pilot Implementation Plan).

Value(Position): Analyse the five basic positions of the central government by analyzing the text of the Plan, which are the titles of the third to eighth chapters, and highly condensed the strategic tasks of
the new urbanization, namely: V1 orderly promotes the urbanization of agricultural migration V2 optimizes the layout and form of urbanization, V3 improves the sustainable development capacity of cities, V4 promotes the integration of urban and rural development, and V5 reforms and improve the urbanization development mechanism.

**Goal:** The Central Government clarified the overall requirements for each pilot task in the “the Pilot Implementation Plan”. The five major positions of the central government were specifically defined as small goals at all levels, such as urban population, economic construction, and rural development. The purpose elements are G1-G8 (Table 1).

**Strategies:** Means can be divided into strategies and measures. Strategies provide directions for measures. Measures are specific actions of strategies. The "strategy" should be specifically judged according to the policy document issued by the central government. The main body for the supply and implementation of the "measures" of the policy elements is the locality. The third to eighth chapters of the Plan are the five key points of the country's new urbanization construction. Because the development levels and development stages of various cities in the country are different, the national plan clearly defines universal, basic, and fundamental development. Strategies and policy analysis elements are extracted as T1-T5 (Table 1).

**Results:** Chapter 5 of the Plan summarized the development requirements and expected vision of new-type urbanization by 2020, respectively: ER1 steadily improving the level and quality of urbanization, ER2 more optimized urbanization pattern, ER3 scientific and reasonable urban development model, ER4 urban and rural life is harmonious and pleasant and ER5 urbanization system and mechanism are constantly improved, which has determined the quantitative indicators and expected implementation results of new urbanization for local governments.

### 3. Research object and analysis process

#### 3.1. Study policy element extraction

Wuhan was selected as the evaluation object for the new urbanization. Wuhan is the central city in central China and the first batch of national pilot cities for new urbanization. Wuhan's new urbanization construction will play a leading and demonstrative role in the central region. Through analyzing and summarizing the relevant policy texts of the “Wuhan National Comprehensive Urbanization Comprehensive Pilot Work Plan” and “Wuhan New Urbanization Plan (2014-2020)” and other related policy texts, combined with research visits to collect specific policy arrangements implemented in Wuhan, can be obtained Elements of local measures in Wuhan.

**3.1.1. Wuhan local measures elements.** The Pilot Implementation Plan put forward the overall construction goals, main tasks and safeguard measures for Wuhan City in 2014. In the same year, Wuhan City Plan formulated and issued Wuhan City's New Urbanization Plan (2014-2020), which is aimed at the national construction requirements. Propose development vision and concrete construction measures including construction of a diverse and inclusive harmonious society, leading the integration of the whole region to achieve coordinated and mutually beneficial development, forming a comprehensive urbanization layout and form, constructing the four modernizations, and creating a fair urban and rural public service facility network and promotion innovation.

By analyzing and summarizing the implementation contents and investigations in the above plans, the specific implementation plan made by the Wuhan Municipal Government was collected to obtain a table of local measures in Wuhan (Table 1).
3.1.2. Wuhan policy implementation results. By collecting, collating, and summarizing Wuhan's measures and phases of promoting new urbanization, five practical results of Wuhan's new urbanization progress are obtained:

The level of urbanization has increased significantly. At the end of 2016, the urbanization rate of the permanent population in Wuhan was 79.77%, and the urbanization rate of the registered population was 71.8%, which has reached the overall national planning goal. In addition, Wuhan has implemented a "million university students studying in Wuhan" policy, achieved 301,000 university graduates studying and working in China in 2017, and 142,000 new university students have settled in the city, nearly 2 times and 6 times respectively in 2016[18]. It has been achieved the improvement of the quality of the settled population.

The overall spatial development pattern has been further optimized. Urban agglomerations in the middle reaches of the Yangtze River are gradually becoming integrated [19]. Wuhan, Changsha, Nanchang, and Hefei are accelerating the development of urban-rural development, infrastructure interconnection, coordinated industrial development, co-construction of ecological civilization, public service sharing, and deepening openness. Cooperation in the six major actions has now achieved regional integration results such as the establishment of a collaborative innovation alliance, joint construction of a trustworthy city, off-site loan of provident funds, and cross-provincial settlement of new rural cooperative medical services.

A healthy urban and rural development model was gradually established. Wuhan Economic and Technological Development Zone (Hannan) keeps close to the development of the real economy and continuously improves the level of openness. Now it has formed a modern industrial cluster and a complete industrial chain supported by automobiles and parts, electronics, food and beverages. Since 2017, Wuhan has vigorously implemented the "Three Rural Projects" strategy [20], explored the mechanism of revitalizing farm houses, and borrowed the practice of "three rights separation" reform of contracted land to guide industrial and commercial capital to develop leisure activities such as farmhouses through leases or cooperation. Tourism agriculture has effectively promoted the development of agriculture and rural areas, and has aroused strong repercussions throughout the province and even the whole country, becoming the "Wuhan sample" for implementing the rural revitalization strategy.

The quality of urban and rural development has been continuously improved. Through hard work, the complex water environment of Wuhan has been effectively controlled, the quality of the atmospheric environment has been effectively improved, various types of waste have been collected and disposed of, and the sponge city concept and comprehensive pipe corridor construction have been widely used in urban construction. East Lake, Sha Lake etc. Other urban lakes have become civic parks and urban sponges. The government cooperates with enterprises to promote the development of smart cities, including the establishment of a Wuhan WeChat service port and an online and offline platform for the circulation and trading of agricultural products; the establishment of convenient online channels to encourage such as the public to participate in services and smart city construction.

The urbanization development mechanism has gradually improved. In terms of urbanization of the transfer population, Wuhan has implemented differentiated settlement policies such as settlement of points, and liberalization of overseas Chinese graduates, which has been affirmed by the National Development and Reform Commission. There are Launched a new type of urbanization pilot project in Hannan District, deepened the reform of the rural property rights system, and issued the "Interim Measures for the Evaluation and Management of Rural Collective Assets in Wuhan", which basically completed the "ten powers" of rural areas in 15 experimental streets (towns, towns) Confirm the right to register and award tasks. The implementation of the reform of the administrative examination and approval system and the reform of separation of supervision and management, and the establishment of a post-event and post-event supervision mechanism and system have significantly improved the government environment, business environment and administrative efficiency [20].
Table 1. Extracted and Summarized Policy Elements.

| Value (Position) | V1: Orderly promote the urbanization of agricultural transfer population | V2: Optimize the layout and shape of urbanization | V3: Improving urban sustainable development capabilities | V4: Promote the integration of urban and rural development | V5: Reform and improve the mechanism of urbanization development |
|------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|
| Goal             | G1: Migrant workers integrate into towns                               | G2: Cultivation of new small and medium cities    | G3: Coordinated development of urban agglomerations  | G4: City (Town) Green Smart Development                 | G5: Industry-city integration development                  |
| Tactic           | T1: Establishing a cost-sharing mechanism for the citizenization of agricultural transfers |                                                  |                                                     | T2: Establish a diversified and sustainable urbanization investment and financing mechanism | T3: Reform and improve the rural housing site system       |
| Measure          | M1: Differentiated promotion citizen of the four categories of the population | M4: Create a city cluster in the middle reaches of the Yangtze River | M5: Promote the construction of Wuhan city circle | M6: Wuhan City Forms Overall Urbanization Layout and Form | M7: Optimize industrial development system and strengthen employment supply |
| Expect outcome   | ER1: The level and quality of urbanization have steadily improved       | ER2: More optimized urbanization pattern          | ER3: Scientific and reasonable urban development model | ER4: Pleasant and harmonious urban and rural life        | ER5: Urbanization institutional mechanism has been improved |
| Actual results   | AR1: The quality and level of urbanization have improved significantly  | AR2: Global spatial development pattern is more optimized | AR3: Urban and rural economic vitality continues to be released | AR4: The sound development of urban and rural areas gradually established pattern | AR5: The urbanization development mechanism is gradually improved |

Source: Author's calculation
3.2. Evaluation process based on S-CAD method

Through the description and analysis of the central and local policies, the policy elements can be disassembled into the following element relationships according to the adjusted S-CAD method (Table 1). The relationship between the elements of each link can be analyzed item by item, and the policy links, The logic, efficiency, and feasibility between the chains can draw useful lessons from it.

This article uses expert scoring and survey and interview methods to calculate the scores of policy elements. It selects university scholars (10) in the fields of economics, management, sociology, and urban planning. They conducted interviews and questionnaire surveys with representatives of citizens (20) from Wuhan, including representatives of citizens, business managers and migrant workers, and obtained 45 valid questionnaire data and interview records.

3.2.1. Consistency. Consistency analysis examines the internal logic of policies, focusing on the connectivity, degree of fit, and causality between Positions, Purposes, Means, and Results, and ensuring effects through consistency analysis [21].

(1) Link assessment

Link evaluation refers to the evaluation of the transmission relationship between policy elements, the strength of the corresponding effect of link scores (scores range from 0-10 points). Because there are many element links, we will not repeat them here. Starting from this policy standpoint, the logical relationship between policy elements with high scores in key analysis links is shown in Figure 1.

**Link V1**: Promote the urbanization of agricultural transfer population in an orderly manner (V1) is an important position of a new type of urbanization with "people as the core". The goal is to better integrate migrant workers into towns (G1) and enjoy the same benefits as urban residents Treatment, V1-G1 consistency score is 10. Due to the long-standing problems of the dual urban-rural system, the high cost of urbanization of the agricultural transfer population, and the inadequate equalization of public services, etc. result in obstacles to the integration of the rural transfer population into urban areas, the central planning policy proposed the establishment of agricultural transfer population citizens the cost-sharing mechanism (T1) hopes to strengthen the responsibilities of governments at all levels, share public costs reasonably, fully mobilize social forces, and build a government-led, multi-party participation, cost-sharing, and coordinated promotion of the urbanization of agricultural transfer population [17], Achieve steady improvement in urbanization level and quality (ER1). The Wuhan Municipal Government introduced three specific measures (M1, M2, and M3) from the aspects of system innovation and quality improvement, which have achieved the expected results of the central government are highly consistent with the above-mentioned central planning's stance, Purpose, and Strategy. It’s consistency scores of links are above 8 points.

**Link V2**: Optimizing the layout and form of urbanization (V2) This position puts forward different development requirements for various cities across the country, mainly including the development goals of new medium and small town cultivation (G2) and coordinated development of urban agglomerations (G3). The average logical scores of the strategies T1-T5 and the two goals were 7.6 and 8.0, respectively with high consistency. Wuhan, as the national central city in the central region, shoulders important functions of its own development and regional promotion. Wuhan measures M4, M5, and M6 actively respond to the central G2 and G3 target elements to achieve a more optimized urbanization pattern (ER3). Expected result, the logical score between these elements is above 9 points.

**Link V3**: Continued development ability (V3), the target elements representing the central position G3, G4, G5, G7 with V3 all scored more than 9 points, with high consistency. The central strategy T2, T5 and the target consistency score is about 8 points. The realization of the target policy and local measures require local governments to give full play to their subjective initiative. Wuhan is in the development stage of industrial upgrading and transformation. It takes measures at three levels: industrial structure optimization, industrial innovation, and agricultural modernization (M7, M8, and M9) to improve the competitiveness of the city and the quality of urbanization further, the consensus score with T2 is 8.7 points, and the central expected effect of a more scientific and reasonable urban development model (ER3) is achieved, with a link score of 7.1 points.
Link V4: Promoting the integration of urban and rural development (V4) is the fourth largest stance of the central government. The target elements of migrant workers' integration into towns (G1) and new rural construction (G8) accurately represent this position, with scores close to 10 points. The strategies T3 and T5 given by the central government are effective strategies to solve the problems of rural land distribution and rural development from the root. The scores of the measures taken by Wuhan (M10, M11, M12) provide new methods and ideas for rural revitalization and development. At the same time, strengthen rural infrastructure construction and information construction, urban and rural overall planning, good logic between strategies and measures, and the central and expected results of harmonious urban and rural life (ER4) consistency score of 6.3 points, indicating that the expected results are still achieved animal.

Link V5: The policy objectives of the new central urbanization (G4, G5, G7, G8) are all action goals from the standpoint of reforming and improving the urbanization development mechanism (V5), and comprehensively promote reform and innovation of institutional mechanisms (T5) to pursue the realization of the central goal. Wuhan City has explored and innovated in the reform of the mechanism and system. Among them, M13, M14, M15, and M16 have an average score of 8.5 and the score of T5 is very high. All are working towards the continuous improvement of the urbanization system and mechanism (ER5) as expected by the central government.

Figure 1. High scores for the five positions.

Source: Author's calculation

(2) Chain evaluation
The chain evaluation starts from an established position, and tracks the corresponding purpose, the corresponding means and the corresponding results. It can be divided into two ways: a single element chain and the effect chain of the overall purpose, means, and results in each position. The analysis of the important chain corresponding to a single element is mainly focused on the link analysis. The following will focus on the general the Purpose, Means, and Result chain, V1-V5 system chain construction is shown in Figure 2.
The calculation of the chain value is based on different positions. First, the chain value of a single element is obtained by multiplying the link scores, and then the chain values of the elements in the same position are added to obtain the total chain value of the integrated position. Size, the chain value is converted into a decimal expression, the calculation formula is shown in Figure 3. The final scores of the consistency, need and adequacy chain values of this assessment are shown in Tables 2, 3, and 4.

**Figure 3. Chain value calculation formula.**

Source: Author's calculation

The chain values from the central position V1-V5 to the final expected result ER1-ER5 are 6.71, 6.53, 6.67, 6.51, 7.09, which are all smaller than the chain values from V1-V5 to the actual result AR1-AR5. The gap lies in the MR link. It can be understood that the logic between local measures and local actual results will be slightly stronger. The expected results of the central government are aimed at the completion of new urbanization construction. At present, the actual results of Wuhan City are only staged results, and they cannot reach the central government completely. Expected effect. However, the difference between them is within 0.2, which indicates that the policy of Wuhan is consistent with the central policy and the logical relationship is clear. In addition, the value of the V4 chain of the central
stance is relatively low, because the focus of Wuhan City's construction is to explore innovative mechanisms to revitalize the rural economy, while the central strategy T3 reform and improve the rural homestead system is a basic reform of urban-rural integration, with "San Xiang Project" logic is slightly inconsistent.

### Table 2. Consistency of various chains.

| Chain mean | V1  | V2  | V3  | V4  | V5  |
|------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| The proportion of position | 7.61 | 7.38 | 7.44 | 7.20 | 7.75 |
| V-G        | 8.82 | 8.43 | 8.54 | 8.26 | 8.74 |
| V-G-T      | 8.27 | 7.84 | 7.91 | 7.68 | 8.19 |
| V-G-T-M    | 7.46 | 7.51 | 7.23 | 6.89 | 7.61 |
| V-G-T-M-ER | 6.71 | 6.53 | 6.67 | 6.51 | 7.09 |
| V-G-T-M-AR | 6.82 | 6.60 | 6.83 | 6.62 | 7.12 |

Source: Author's calculation

3.2.2 Adequacy. The adequacy and necessity analysis tests the economics of the policy, focusing on the standpoint of purpose, the pursuit of purpose by means, and the need and adequacy of means to reflect results. The main purpose is to ensure the efficiency of the policy, that is, how to ensure that the policy "takes the least effort to achieve its purpose" [21].

(1) Link assessment

Through analysis, it can be found that in the five central position policy systems of the central government, the objectives and positions of the central planning are in the same line, sufficient and necessary. The central strategy is necessary but not sufficient for the goals. However, in the system, the central The strategic intent is to control the direction of the reform at a macro level and to give localities ample room to explore specific measures for localization. From this perspective, insufficient adequacy is acceptable. Among them, the central strategy should supplement the promotion of equalization of basic public services in urban and rural areas as a necessary means to achieve the central goals G1-G8. In addition, the reform and improvement of the rural housing site system (T3) is also inadequate to drive the construction of a new countryside (G8) with score 7.1. It is also possible to consider adding the strategy of “rejuvenating the diversified development of the rural economy”.

Moreover, local measures are more and more necessary for the central strategy. Wuhan applied the central strategy as a prescription to the local urbanization construction, and introduced more specific localization measures such as M1-M16. The central strategy was accurately implemented, and the average score of elements in the key chains of each position was above 8.7. Then the actual and sufficient results of Wuhan also scored higher, with an average score above 7.38. However, due to the timeliness and the process of policy implementation, the final actual results have not yet reached the level expected by the central government. Therefore, the central government's need is acceptable (average score 7.14) and its adequacy is insufficient (average score 6.32).

(2) Chain evaluation

According to the analysis of the scores, the demand chain value of each position is relatively high, and the sufficiency chain value is relatively low. Among them, the central position V-G-T-M has a larger decline than the V-G-T sufficiency chain value. This is due to the Wuhan strategy for the This is due to the insufficient adequacy of the central strategy. It can be noticed that the value of the V2 stand chain has fallen rapidly, because the full score of the central strategy is low on the one hand, and on the other hand, the Wuhan city circle is in a period of significant spatial differentiation and increasingly significant development [22]. Inadequate construction progress has led to a low degree of realization of the standpoint of optimizing the urbanization layout. In addition, the score of V4 is generally lower than other stances because it is to promote the coordinated development of urban and rural areas and eliminate
the dual structure of urban and rural areas. It is necessary to gradually explore rural system reforms such as the rural household registration system, land system, and financial system. The new urbanization policy failed to cover it.

Table 3. Needs of each chain.

| Chain mean          | V1  | V2  | V3  | V4  | V5  |
|---------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| The proportion of position |     |     |     |     |     |
| V-G                 | 8.28| 8.08| 8.31| 7.53| 8.40|
| V-G-T               | 8.62| 8.52| 8.74| 7.96| 8.64|
| V-G-T-M             | 7.54| 7.92| 7.23| 7.33| 7.31|
| V-G-T-M-ER          | 6.91| 6.98| 7.02| 6.78| 6.97|
| V-G-T-M-AR          | 6.97| 7.00| 7.06| 6.79| 6.99|

Source: Author's calculation

Table 4. Adequacy of each chain.

| Chain mean          | V1  | V2  | V3  | V4  | V5  |
|---------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| The proportion of position |     |     |     |     |     |
| V-G                 | 6.49| 6.60| 7.01| 6.35| 7.75|
| V-G-T               | 7.75| 7.37| 8   | 6.87| 7.75|
| V-G-T-M             | 7.19| 7.01| 7.28| 6.59| 7.17|
| V-G-T-M-ER          | 6.69| 6.64| 6.83| 6.56| 6.81|
| V-G-T-M-AR          | 6.12| 5.97| 6.45| 5.82| 6.38|

Source: Author's calculation

3.2.3 Dependency. Feasibility analysis is mainly an analysis of the degree of recognition and practicality of the policy. In the process of policy formulation and implementation, there are not only "Dominant views", but also many "Relevant views". In the feasibility analysis, it is necessary to identify key approvers, opponents, implementers, and affected persons, and analyse their reasons and strengths for their approval, opposition, implementation, and impact from their premise / position to determine the policy's effectiveness, and then to determine identity and practicality of policy.

(1) Stakeholder analysis

Local governments, as the specific implementers of the new urbanization policy, are one of the most important subjects of relevant views. The most direct stakeholders of the national new urbanization policy are urban residents and rural residents, development interests and enterprises in urban construction have therefore become stakeholders. Their views and reflections on the key chains of the policy will determine the success or failure of the policy.

(2) Analysis of stakeholders' attitudes towards policy

Local government. As the main relevant perspective, the attitude of the Wuhan municipal government has a significant impact on the successful implementation of the pilot. In addition, Wuhan's urban and rural development still has a series of practical problems such as the increasing pressure of population urbanization, the growing gap between urban and rural areas, the shortage of employment supply, and the weakening of agricultural development. The state's promotion of new-type urbanization provides important opportunities for Wuhan to clarify strategic goals, sort out strategic systems, plan strategic measures, and break through development[23]. Therefore, the Wuhan municipal government supports the implementation of pilot policies.
**Rural resident.** The important stance of this policy is to solve the issues related to the integration of migrant workers in cities and towns (G1) and the construction of new rural areas (G8), which are directly related to peasants’ livelihood, income increase and rights protection, so rural residents are the direct beneficiaries. Promoting equalization of urban public services and rural revitalization strategies based on homestead reform are important measures for increasing farmers' income and promoting urban-rural integration. They naturally support the new urbanization reform.

**City dwellers.** Ensuring the promotion of new urbanization can improve the living environment and quality of urban residents. Although the increase in farmers' settlements in cities and towns will cause temporary shortages of urban public resources and decline in urban environment and service levels, it will also promote the expansion of urban development space, increase government public investment, and improve urban vitality and competitiveness beneficial for existing urban residents. Therefore, from the perspective of development, urban residents support the policy.

**Development benefits.** The real estate industry is an important carrier to promote the construction of urbanization[24]. With the further progress of urbanization, the role of real estate in driving domestic demand in the process will become increasingly prominent. The expansion of the territory, a large number of explorations, transformations and innovations, the new development models such as nursing homes, park real estate and cultural tourism real estate have played an important role in the upgrading and development of new urbanization industries. Therefore, development stakeholders should be very supportive of this reform.

To sum up, the analysis of the policy approval of the four main stakeholders is shown in Table 5.

**Table 5. Stakeholder analysis and analysis of policy summary.**

| Local government | City dwellers | Rural residents | Benefit of development |
|------------------|--------------|----------------|------------------------|
| Policy           | ++           | ++             | ++                     |

Annotation: + expression of support
Source: Author's calculation

In summary, the feasibility of the new urbanization policy is good. The new urbanization reform is aimed at benefiting the people and benefiting the people. Although it may objectively bring about small-scale and short-term conflicts of interest, it is relatively small compared to the benefits that policies can bring. The benefits are huge. During the investigation process, all stakeholders have enjoyed the benefits of new urbanization and fully supported the next step of reform.

4. Results and Discussion

The S-CAD analysis results of Wuhan's new urbanization show that the implementation of the central policy has better consistency, higher necessity, adequacy can be improved, and recognition and practice are high. Wuhan's policies have ideally completed the index of urbanization of the transferred population, the urban industrial upgrading and optimization, the implementation of the rural revitalization strategy are well implemented, and the mechanism and system innovation are constantly improved. However, the effect of optimizing the layout of urbanization is not obvious, and the driving effect on urban agglomerations and urban circles is insufficient. The main reason is the insufficient adequacy of economic means. Such measures need to be improved.

In this regard, Wuhan can improve its policies in a targeted manner:

**Promote the full coverage of basic public services for urban permanent residents and reduce the gap between urban and rural basic public services.** Fiscal investment should be increased to strengthen public financial security capabilities for public services. Under the premise of adhering to the responsibility of the government, give full play to the role of the market mechanism, promote the diversification of the main bodies and methods of providing basic public services, and accelerate the establishment of a basic public service supply model led by the government, socially participating, and running by the public and privately run [25].
Lead the green development of urban agglomerations in the middle reaches of the Yangtze River and accelerate the urbanization of the Wuhan urban circle. Relying on the Golden Waterway of the Yangtze River, we will promote transportation in surrounding cities and comprehensively improve the five integrated constructions of industrial layout, public services, infrastructure, regional markets, and ecological protection. Improve the coordinated development mechanism of the urban circle. The governments of the cities in the circle should strengthen communication and cooperation, use institutional innovation to reduce the cost of regional economic development, and provide the driving force from the market to create a good and fair industry development in each city. Operating environment and formulate corresponding market management systems.

Optimize the layout of urban space and enhance the quality and charm of the city. Completion of the preparation of Wuhan's land and space planning, based on the evaluation of the carrying capacity of resources and environment and the suitability of land and space development, to achieve full coverage of the city’s "multiple regulations and one", strengthen the "three districts and three lines" control and promote smart urban growth. Accelerate the planning and construction of Wuhan Yangtze River New City, optimize the main axis of the Yangtze River, build the ecological green heart of East Lake City, and create a world-class urban highlight. Make every effort to highlight the ecological characteristics of the riverside and lakeside, accelerate the construction of the ecological pattern of “two-axis, five-ring, six-wedge multi-corridor, and blue-green weaving city [26]”. It is also necessary to fully excavate the rich ecological landscape resources in mountain areas and build Wuhan ’s ecological green lung and national leisure tourism destination.

5. Conclusion
The "S-CAD New Urbanization Policy Evaluation Method of Central and Local Interactions" was used to evaluate the new urbanization in Wuhan. It was concluded that the central policy has good consistency, adequacy, and feasibility. The new urbanization measures in Wuhan Effectively inherited the central development strategy and better achieved the central stage development goals. Next, we need to focus on implementing and advancing the equalization of public services, leading regional coordinated development, and improving urban quality. As a meta-method, this method provides a good idea for the evaluation of new urbanization in various parts of China from the perspective of policy evaluation. It can be used as a universal evaluation method for the evaluation of various cities. Next, we can explore the use of scientific and technological means to quantify the data and evaluate and analyse the evidence to form a continuous dynamic evaluation process. We can also incorporate the S-CAD method into the government work evaluation system, and regularly evaluate, correct and improve policies, So as to better help guide local urbanization.

Acknowledgments
This work was financially supported by Open Fund of China New Urbanization Research Institute of Tsinghua University.

References
[1] Li DQ, Li W. Analysis of Rheological Changes in the Text Transmission of Provincial New Urbanization Plans [J]. Planner, 2017(9): 85-91.
[2] Xie YQ, Cao YP. Evaluation of the New Urbanization Efficiency of the Central Plains Urban Agglomeration Based on DEA-SBM[J]. Urban Development Research,2018,25(02):135-141.
[3] Liu XY, LiangYL. The Effect of New-type Urbanization Policy from the Perspective of Urban-rural Integration——A Test Based on the Propensity Value Matching Double Difference Method[J]. Business economy, 2018(01):185-192.
[4] Yuan XL, He B, Lu XL, Chen ML. Quality Assessment and Spatial Heterogeneity Analysis of New Urbanization in China[J]. Urban Development Research, 2017,24(06):125-132.
[5] Min ZR, Xu W, Li Z. Construction and Application of New Urbanization Index System Based on Third-Party Evaluation——Taking Jiangxi Province as an Example[J]. Urban Development
[6] An XL, Anwar M. Comprehensive Evaluation of Xinjiang's New Urbanization Level[J]. City planning, 2013, 37(7):23-27.
[7] Yang Y, Wang C, Zhang LL, etc. Construction and Application of a New Urbanization Quantitative Evaluation Index System Based on National Planning: A Case Study of Shandong Peninsula City Group[J]. Economic geography, 2015, (7): 51-58.
[8] Xu L. Evaluation of New Urbanization Development Level and Analysis of Its Spatial Features—Taking Changzhou City, Jiangsu Province as an Example[J]. China Agricultural Resources and Regional Planning, 2018, 39(06):61-66.
[9] Fang C, Wang Z, Quantitative diagnoses and comprehensive evaluations of the rationality of Chinese urban development patterns. Sustainability 2015, 7, 3859–3884.
[10] Bian J, Ren H, Liu P, Zhang, Y. Sustainable Urbanization Performance Evaluation Based on “Origin” and “Modernization” Perspectives: A Case Study of Chongqing, China. Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 2018, 15.
[11] Liang HN. Policy planning and evaluation methods[M] Ding JF, translator. Beijing: Renmin University of China Press. 2009.
[12] Ning S. Public policy [M] 2nd edition Bering: Higher Education Press. 2011.
[13] DYE T R. Understanding public policy[M]. 12th edition. Xie Min, translate Beijing: China Renmin University Press, 2010.
[14] Kang XL, Liang HN, Shi ZL. Review of Land Vertical Management Policy through S-CAD Analysis Framework[J]. China Land Science, 2014, (6):51-57.
[15] Zhang XY, Wang ZF, Xie N. The Policy Analysis of Chongqing Property Tax Pilot-A Study Based on the S-CAD Method[C]. 10th International Conference on Public Administration; 2014.
[16] Wang YJ, Wang JC. Application of S-CAD in Information Policy Evaluation[J]. Intelligence exploration, 2011, (11):8-11.
[17] Information on http://www.gov.cn/gongbao/content/2014/content_2644805.htm, 2014-03-17.
[18] Wuhan Municipal Bureau of Statistics. Wuhan Statistical Yearbook 2018[M]. Beijing: China Statistics Press, 2018.8
[19] Jiang DL, Sun Y, Ren H, Chen YY, Zhang ZK. Research on the Urban Network Characteristics of the Mid-Yangtze River City Group Based on Baidu Index[J]. Resources and Environment in the Yangtze Basin, 2015, 24(10):1654-1664
[20] Information on http://www.ndrc.gov.cn/fzzggz/fzgg/zcfg/201805/t20180503_884936.html
[21] Liang HN. Policy Analysis[J]. Urban Planning, 2004(11):78-85.
[22] Yu Y, Tong Y, Hu SS, Ke YY, Tong Y. Analysis on the Spatiotemporal Evolution of Urban Space Interaction in Wuhan Urban Circle[J]. Resources and Environment in the Yangtze Basin, 2017, 26(11):1784-1794.
[23] Information on https://max.book118.com/html/2017/0721/123280196.shtml, 2016.1
[24] Liu ZF. Accelerating Transformation and Development, Facilitating New Urbanization[J]. Urban development, 2013, 16:70-72
[25] Information on http://www.gov.cn/zwgk/2012-07/20/content_2187242.htm, 2012-7-11
[26] Information on http://fgw.wuhan.gov.cn/portal/article/index/id/10257/cid/86.html, 2018-12-19