SOCIOMETRY | RESEARCH ARTICLE

Examining the public sector recruitment and selection, in relation to job analysis in Pakistan

Junaid Ashraf

Abstract: The purpose of this research was to study the recruitment and selection practices in public sector of Pakistan with respect to job analysis. Job analysis is the most essential part of human resource activities. This research tries to study whether job analysis practices are followed or not. The research obtained information from 144 respondents, through questionnaires and some brief interviews. The primary and secondary data collected for the research concludes that the hiring process of public sector is flawed mainly because of poor job analysis. They do not make proper job descriptions and employees tasks do not match with the given job description, which ultimately effects the performance of the public sector organizations in Pakistan.

Keywords: recruitment; selection; job analysis; job description; public sector

1. Introduction

Human resource management has become an integral part in today's competitive world. Efficient and effective management of human capital leads to progress and development of an organization, without proper human resource planning, progress of an organization is indeed difficult.

ABOUT THE AUTHOR

I chose to study Business Administration for my undergraduate, and joined Bahria University, Islamabad, for BBA. After completing my degree, I then went on to join Government and Public Policy MPhil program at the very well reputed National Defense University, Islamabad.

I have worked in Mirpur University of Science and Technology as a Research Associate in order to enhance my Research abilities. I also taught subjects such as Moral & Ethics, English and Human Resource Management at this institution. Currently, I am working in institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad, under their Young Professional Corner.

I have keen interest in research and I am looking to make a career in research. Currently I am working on some independent researches to enhance my portfolio. This research paper which I have submitted would help to highlight the issue of job analysis in public sector of Pakistan and lay foundation for further research on this area as not much research is conducted in this field with respect to Pakistan.

PUBLIC INTEREST STATEMENT

This research paper is taken out of my research dissertation (Recruitment and selection practices and performance in public sector of Pakistan: A descriptive study) of MPhil in Government and Public policy. For research paper I have chosen the area of job analysis as it is the most integral part of recruitment and selection and in Pakistan hardly any research is done on this aspect. The data for the research was collected mainly through survey and some interviews from nine public sector organizations. The findings show that the hiring process of public sector is flawed as they do not make proper descriptions; they do not give their employees direction to work on. It is important for the productivity of any organization that their employees are given specific duties to perform. Furthermore, it is essential that right person for the right job is hired which can only be done through job analysis.
Progressing through the 21st century, globalized workforce is the basis of competition, this has raised the importance of human resource management to another level as without strong consideration to workplace, it is impossible for any organization to excel. The progress, development, and success of any business or an organization are directly linked to the performance of those who work for that business.

Employees are the greatest asset of any organization, for an organization to shine; the organizations depend on the competence and professional attitude of the employees. So, it is imperative that right person for the right job is working whether private or public organization, thus recruitment and selection process becomes most integral, if done in an organized way it leads to selection of right candidates.

The duties of public organization are to maintain social order and provide a system of law and justice to the people. Public organizations provide public goods to its people and thus need efficient and effective human capital to provide the services in an efficient manner. The public sector needs competent workforce to provide services adeptly, so it is of utmost importance that right candidate is there for the right job. Thus the importance of recruitment and selection is indeed great with reference to government organizations. For effective and efficient delivery of services, it is essential that they engage a balance number of skilled human resource strength. Furthermore, the most important aspect of recruitment and selection is Job analysis.

Job analysis is an organized assessment, study and recording the responsibilities, duties, skills, accountabilities, work environment and ability requirements of a specific job. It also involves determining the relative importance of the duties, responsibilities and physical and emotional skills for a given job. All these factors identify what a job demands and what an employee must possess to perform a job productively.

Job analysis is said to be a foundation for human resource management by McCormick (1976). Furthermore, it was found by Sanchez and Levine (2000) that role of job analysis in human resources planning was vital. Other human resource activities can get affected by some human resource practices including recruitment process, performance appraisal, compensation and training & development established on incorrect job analysis.

In 1900’s, Job analysis was established as a management technique in the West. Over the years, Job analysis became one of the many tools, which enabled managers to understand and focus on the organization. However, this significant advancement in human resource practice could not be kept in practice in Pakistan till 2000 (one hundred years gap).

2. Research problem/objectives

• The research paper wants to analyze job analysis in Public sector firms because to have efficiency and effectiveness, it is essential that organizations have right people at the right job, which can only be achieved through proper job analysis. However, Pakistan’s public sector lacks efficiency and effectiveness and this paper wants to gauge that whether right people for the right job are working and are the employees given proper job descriptions and job description to carry out their duties.

• Furthermore, this paper wants to lay foundation for future research with respect to job analysis in Public Sector of Pakistan as hardly any research is conducted on this area in Pakistan.
3. Literature review

Brannick and Levine (2002) described Job Analysis as “a systematic process whereby one can discover the nature of a job.” Job was divided into smaller units and one or more results were recorded. Over the years, other researchers such as Bowin and Harvey (2001) have discussed the significance of job analysis to human resource management but they found job analysis as a strategic human resource (HR) management practice having a prospective contribution in the organizational performance. Newman and Lyon (2009) pointed the typical needs for generating relevant pool for selection of the employees is Job Analysis. Jon Analysis includes developing relevant job description and job specifications with respect to knowledge, skills and abilities (KSA) for the specific job. In addition to this employers also look for suitable personality qualities, attitudes, and values, so that the selected employee is in accordance with organizations need and best fit for the organization and the job. Barber (1998) took note of three decisions related to recruitment which are target population; determine the applicant source, and deciding how to attract applicants to the organization. Recruitment requires effective planning and to collaborate closely with the management, which can only be done by job analysis.

For recruitment process job analysis is the first step. According to Miyake (2002) giving ads for vacant jobs is a usual process to find the right pool of candidates. Jobs analysis is done to create job description and job specifications so that right pool of candidates are attracted and short-listed for further process. Furthermore, he elaborated the selection tools such as conducting interviews, application blanks and reference. In addition to these different tests are used to select the perfect match for the job. These tests are aptitude tests, assessment tests, personality tests and psychological tests. All the criteria used for selection have its own benefits and issues and used in balance to have better reliability and validity.

Davidson, Lepeak, and Newman (2007) discussed the challenges that effect the hiring in government sector, it was a research directed by Equa Terra and surveyed above 150 public sector professionals from United States to study their employment practices. Amongst many hindrances strategic planning (which includes job analysis) for recruitment and selection stood tall. Strategic planning is done in accordance with the current and future needs of human the resource of an organization. Poor strategic planning pointed scattered HR policies in many organizations, which led to ineffective performance. Furthermore, this research identified poor long-term planning for the management of the employees. In addition to this the researchers pin pointed that whether an organization is public or private both struggle to find staff that has pertinent experience, it was concluded that finding the perfect match for the job is a difficult task, so finding specialist for vacant place is an uphill task especially for public organization.

Kaplan and Norton (2004) identified some issues that lead to bad employment decisions; most of them were ignorance in planning, resulting in poor selection of employees due to poor job analysis. One of the most important aspects of recruitment and selection is choosing the best fit candidate for the job, but poor planning and job analysis effects this aspect badly. Furthermore, it is essential that HR specialist manage to enhance the quality of the candidates. Moreover, to choose the most appropriate employee for the job it is essential that the human resource team do its work with great zeal and zest.

Nyangaresi, Nejeru, Mutavi, and Waithaka (2013) stressed on the point that in this competitive world, organizations need to select competent and skillful persons in order to develop and grow as an organization. Public sector organizations need to achieve their objects by providing effective and efficient services to the people and this requires skillful workers. Moreover, the research pointed that job advertisements should contain proper job specifications and job descriptions and employees should be selected on bases of match with job specifications and job descriptions. In addition that, when employees are finally selected in an organization, they should be given extensive overview of the organization which in technical terms means the process of socialization. This gives the selected employee know how of the culture and goals and objectives of the organization and employee can adopt accordingly.
Khan, Ahmed, and Neogy (2011) did research on public sector of Bangladesh and identified that in the public sector the HR departments are weak especially the department of recruitment and selection. It is also referred as an administrative department which takes care of the employees of the government organizations. The HR department does not do proper job analysis, which leads to poor job description and thus the problem of hiring the right candidate for the job as proper job analysis is not done so leads to issue of recruitment and selection in the public sector organizations.

Rehman (2009) researched on HR practices in public sector of Pakistan, which is very rare. He identified the importance of HR practices and selecting the right person for the job. The research shed light on accurate job analysis for selecting the right candidate for the right job, which was completely ignored in public sector of Pakistan according to his findings. He further said that selection of the employees should be done in accordance with the requirement of the job.

4. Methodology

The research study covers the public sector’s “Job Analysis” and the after effect of the public sector’s recruitment and selection process on the overall performance of the organization. It is an endeavor to assess the thinking patterns of the individuals working in the public sector organizations and the various ideas of the workforce with the help of a questionnaire specifically engineered for this purpose. Many aspects of the study can be applied to the real life work environment in order to better understand the logic to workforce’s behaviors in the public sector organizations. The data was processed using SPSS. SPSS was only used for processing the questionnaire and making tables. The research is purely descriptive and it does not require any statistical tests.

4.1. Research design

The foundation of this research was laid on the assessment of job analysis of the public sector of Pakistan. The research used a questionnaire which was distributed nine public sector organization. Some brief interviews were also conducted from the sample. The researcher asked questions from the questionnaire when people were filling the surveys, it made the survey more reliable. So this research relied on both primary and secondary data techniques. The primary data was mainly collected through the close ended questionnaire, while some brief interviews were also taken to get some further details and opinions. Furthermore, the secondary data was mainly the literature from journals that is given in the literature and also formal hiring policies were studies to understand the basic hiring process. These approaches were used with intention to find dependable data and that dependable data could only be collected through satisfactory data collection tools for the sample of the population which needed to be investigated for the topic under this research.

4.2. Sources of data

In order to successfully conducting this research, both the types of data sources were used i.e. primary and the secondary.

4.2.1. Primary sources

There are several techniques available to gather the primary data. The researcher used the technique of questionnaire and few brief interviews in order to collect dependable and valid data for the research.

4.2.1.1. Questionnaires. The researcher used questionnaire because they have proved to be a reliable method for data collection. The main purpose of the research questionnaire is to obtain information that cannot be easily observed or that is not already available in written or computerized form. Evidence from the questionnaire survey can then be used mainly for description, explanation or hypothesis testing. Bulmer (2004) concluded that the questionnaire is a well established technique in the social sciences for collecting information. The research used closed ended questionnaire and the questionnaire for this research was taken from the study of Ruwan Abeysekera in 2007.
4.2.1.2. Interviews. Few data gathering unstructured interviews were also conducted by the researcher besides the questionnaires. The questions were the same as asked in the questionnaire, it was done to make the research more reliable and also get some further details. The details which are not possible to gather in the close ended questionnaire.

4.3. Sample size and organizations
Most of the data was collected via the three following means:

(1) Survey for analysis (Questionnaire)
(2) Interviews
(3) Study of formal policies of few public sector organizations

Two hundred fifty questionnaires were distributed to 9 organizations and 144 responses were received. The names of the organizations are kept confidential.

5. Discussion and results
The research examines the public sector of recruitment and selection, in relation to job analysis in Pakistan’s public sector regulatory authorities of Pakistan. It is essential for organizations that they are in the quest to continue to be competitive to precisely recognize and estimate their employment needs. It is important that they weigh the past trends, analyze the present situation, and estimate the human resources they will require to meet the requisites of their strategic plans. Data must be gathered and analyzed, before making decisions on recruitment and selection needs. The process used to collect the data necessary for making informed decisions is called job analysis.

The methodical way for conducting job analysis includes gathering data that determines the knowledge, skills, abilities, and other characteristics (KSAOCs), required for accomplishing the job in a successful manner and it also leads to developing job specification. Job analysis gives way for making judgments on job related actions, tasks, behaviors and performance standards. Furthermore, it also enlightens the organization to pin point the context of the job. In addition to this, job analysis leads to identification of the personal requirements imperative to perform the required job such as aptitudes, physical characteristics, personality, aptitudes, and most importantly job-related knowledge and skills.

Recruitment and selection: Job analysis determines the KSAOCs vital and required for each position. Job analysis sets the qualifications required for a job including minimum education, certification, or licensing. The fundamental responsibilities of the job are also determined by job analysis. This information is processed by the organizations and further used to hire and recruit future employees. Job analysis plays a crucial part during the pre-employment examinations for selection and promotion. The examinations held must associated with the job. The characteristics for which the people are tested for include knowledge, skill, different abilities, and character (personality) variables. An organization only discovers what knowledge, skills, and abilities to test for when it knows what competencies are required to execute a job successfully.

Developing compensation systems: The requirements of the jobs determine the compensation provided to employees. The requirements include educations, skills and experience needed to perform the job effectively. Salary and other benefits can be now determined by the procedure of job analysis throughout the organization. It provides the foundation for attaining understanding of the value of each job, its relationship to other jobs, and the requirements essential to carry it out for all employees.
Human resources: Employers can make use of the technique of job analysis and recognize the skills required to carry out various jobs. This set of information can be used to design training and career development programs for the employees. Identifying these set of skills is what enables employers to train and evolve employees for promotional activities. The information discovered by job analysis provides all the employees with an understanding of promotion, transferring requirements and recognizing career opportunities.

Performance evaluation: The standard performance level that is set should be derived from how the employees are actually performing at the given job. Job analysis would contribute to identifying the tasks and responsibilities the employees currently have as a part of their jobs. Job analysis can also be used to develop evaluation standards and to determine areas of accountability.

Risk management: A key characteristic of job analysis is to identify job hazards. This includes handling complicated machinery and flammable materials. This information can be further used by the employers to establish programs that inform their employees of the possible hazards a specific job has. This covers the aspects of health, safety and security issues that an employee may be concerned with.

Job design: In order to enable the organization to accomplish its mission, jobs are designed around a set of works activities. Organizations often have to change the structure of work tasks due to external and internal changes carried out. The standardized tasks which are associated with a specific job tend to change over the years. Thus the importance of job analysis can be derived from this which serves to identify and accommodate these changes.

The main utility of job analysis is to develop job description and job specifications. In job description the responsibilities, duties, and tasks related to the job are clearly mentioned. On the other hand, job specification informs the employee about the KSAOCs that are needed to perform the job adeptly.

5.1. Findings of the survey

The results show that public sector organization spends less of their resources, including time, money, and skill on job analysis. The respondents agreed to the fact that the job description does not match with the actual work they are expected to do. Also job specification/person specification also does not match. In many cases those skills cannot be acquired resulting in burden on the organization keeping in view the cost. It is detrimental for the organizations to not conduct just analysis, which is also supported by the literature of the paper. Nyangaresi et al. (2013) emphasized on the point that in this 21st century, organizations need to have competent workforce in order to be effective and efficient as an organization. To have effective and efficient workforce it is important that proper job analysis is conducted and duties should match with the provided job description, which is ignored in government organizations in Pakistan.

According to Table 1 a major portion of the survey depicts that only 39 percent of the employees are clear about their job descriptions. Moreover, the result of the Table 1 also shows that almost 61

| Table 1. Results of the survey: Management has given me clear job description (job description is a document that specifies job purposes, duties and responsibilities, working conditions etc.) |
|-----------------|-------|------|
| Strongly agree  | 16    | 11.1 |
| Agree           | 40    | 27.8 |
| Neutral         | 31    | 21.5 |
| Disagree        | 43    | 29.9 |
| Strongly disagree | 14  | 9.7  |
| Total           | 144   | 100.0 |
percent of the employees are on the other side of the bridge when it comes to clear job responsibilities, including job purposes, duties, responsibilities and working conditions. Davidson et al. (2007) concluded that public sector hiring is an uphill task and job analysis is a very important part of making job description. It can be deduced from the sample that public sector of Pakistan has issues when it comes to conducting proper job analysis as 61 percent of the employees are not clear on their job description. This in turn impacts the performance of the employees as well as the organizations, thus decreasing efficiency and effectiveness.

In addition to that Table 2 shows that 56 percent of the employees were of the opinion that duties which they perform are not according to the duties mentioned in the job description. According to the Table 3 around 31 percent of the employees were of the opinion that their job description does not reflect clear tasks and skills needed to perform the job, while around 24 percent were neutral about it, which again depicts that they are not clear about job description. On the other hand, 45 percent believed that, job description reflects clear tasks and skills needed to perform the job. So it is evident from the research that proper job description is not provided to the employees working in the public sector organizations and employees are not given clear directions towards the work they are doing. Rehman (2009) conducted research on HR practices in public sector of Pakistan with respect to job analysis, which is very rare. He recognized the significance of HR practices and selecting the right person for the job. The research further emphasized on importance of accurate job analysis for selecting the right candidate for the right job, which is completely ignored in public sector of Pakistan according to his findings. Moreover, the research also shed light on importance of giving proper job descriptions and job specifications to the employees as it increases productivity of the organization.

A realistic approach of Job Analysis ensures maximum congruency between job content and job context that is supportive of the recruitment process. The flaws in public sector’s recruitment system occur when they independently deal with job content and job context. The preference is given to job content as it is taken as a benchmark for organization during recruitment and selection while human resource management based recruitment requires interdependent criteria both for job content and context. The job content and context together determine the functions and functionality of a job. They are best understood as intermingled evolving process rather than a linear progression of steps. Many organizations therefore carry a job re-design as a component of the ongoing process of Job

| Table 2. Results of the survey: Duties which I perform actually match with the duties indicated in the job description |
|--------------------------------------------------|
| Frequency | Percent |
| Strongly agree | 16 | 11.1 |
| Agree | 47 | 32.6 |
| Neutral | 36 | 25.0 |
| Disagree | 36 | 25.0 |
| Strongly disagree | 9 | 6.3 |
| Total | 144 | 100.0 |

| Table 3. Results of the survey: My job description reflects clear tasks and skills needed to perform the job |
|--------------------------------------------------|
| Frequency | Percent |
| Strongly agree | 17 | 11.8 |
| Agree | 49 | 34.0 |
| Neutral | 34 | 23.6 |
| Disagree | 35 | 24.3 |
| Strongly disagree | 9 | 6.3 |
| Total | 144 | 100.0 |
Analysis. An effective Job analysis can be conducted after the job has been designed, the employees have been trained and the work has been performed.

Experiments show that in public sector, if job is evaluated after the job is allocated and the job continues with specific practices for prolonged periods then the Human Resource’s best practice gives a detailed overview of different extensions of Job Analysis. Cherrington (1995) pointed out three general cases where Job Analysis is carried out: (1) when the organization launches, (2) when a new job is created, and (3) when a job is changed due to introduction of new methods, procedures and technology in the organization. If third point is specifically taken into consideration, then recruitment needs to be held on the grounds that knowledge, skill and abilities are constantly changing and hence need of new procedures or technology arises and for potential employees to handle them effectively. The results of the current study supported the view that the role of job analysis is important for both enhancing employee’s job performance through job satisfaction and turnover. Furthermore, it was found that the employees that had high level of knowledge, skill and ability were better at performing their jobs. Extensive job analysis must be held on each job to classify the main responsibilities of the respective job.

It can be said that the trend of job analysis in hope of carrying out a successful recruitment process has found little success. Thus, other factors such as like job design, job evaluation, job security and job succession planning, job satisfaction and job retention need to be observed as well.

5.2. Discussion of the interview
Apart from surveys, there were some brief unstructured interviews conducted from the same employees who completed the surveys. The purpose of brief interviews was to complement the questionnaire so that the researcher can correlate the answers of the survey with some more details.

The findings of the interviews were matching with the survey conducting. The interviewees were of the opinion that there are hardly any job descriptions made in public sector. Furthermore, on asking question directly to some employees on job description, it was found from the employees that, they even have to write letters which is job of cleric level. Moreover, it was also found that employees have to do personal work of their directors who is a 19th grade officer, under him are, deputy to director (18th grade) and assistant to director (17th grade). The employees do the personal works of their seniors because director has to write Annual Confidential Report (ACR) of the employees and promotion is dependent on this, so employees helpless for the sake of growth have to do work irrelevant to their job description. Furthermore, it was also found out that there is hardly any job description in public sector, which is ultimately, impacts the performance of public sector. The results of the survey and interviews are harmonizing to each other; both clearly indicate the problem of job analysis in public sector organizations in Pakistan.

6. Conclusion
Job analysis is pillar of recruitment and selection practices in any organization, the literature supports the point that selecting right candidate for the job is very important and job analysis greatly impetus the process. The primary and secondary data collected for the research concludes that the hiring process of public sector is flawed despite good formal polices, mainly because of poor job analysis. The employees are not given proper job descriptions to follow and employees tasks do not match in accordance with the given job description. Recruitment and selection of employees to a greater extent determines the performance of an institution and it is of great importance if institutions want to achieve their goals. Furthermore, in order to enhance effectiveness and efficiency of their employees, it is essential that they are given clear directions towards their work, so that the employees know what is expected out of them. Moreover, job descriptions also lay foundation for key performance indicators (KPIs). KPIs are essential for measuring performance of the employees, so if an organization does not have job description for their employees, how will it measure performance. This further raises questions on promotions in public sector of Pakistan.
This research has its limitations because there is not enough research conducted in Pakistan’s public sector with reference to job analysis. There was only one paper published which had references to job analysis. This topic needs to be further studied and investigated.

Appendix A

Recruitment and selection practices and performance in public sector of Pakistan—a descriptive study

You are?

(a) Civil servant/Cadre officer
(b) Public servant/Ex Cadre officer

What is your grade?

(a) Grade 15
(b) Grade 16
(c) Grade 17
(d) Grade 18
(e) Grade 19
(f) Grade 20
(g) Grade 21
(h) Grade 22
Since how many years have you been working with this organization?

(a) 0–3 years  
(b) 3–6 years  
(c) 6–10 years  
(d) 10–15 years  
(e) Above 15 years

What is your age?

(a) 20–25  
(b) 25–30  
(c) 30–35  
(d) 35–45  
(e) Above 45

What is your gender?

(a) Male  
(b) Female

What is your education level?

(a) GCEA/L/FSC/FA  
(b) Degree/Bachelors/BA  
(c) Diplomas  
(d) Professional qualifications (CIMA, etc.)  
(e) Postgraduate

Organization ………………………

Part 1

Recruitment and selection practices

|   | Strongly agree | Agree | Neutral | Disagree | Strongly disagree |
|---|----------------|-------|---------|----------|-------------------|
| 1 | Organization clearly defines the position objectives, requirements and candidates specification in the recruitment |
| 2 | I received a large amount of information about my job before being employed during the hiring process |
| 3 | All of the information I received at interviews about my job before being employed was relevant |
| 4 | I feel I am the right fit for my current Job |
| 5 | I have clear targets for each of my objectives |
| 6 | Organization has formal policy for recruitment and selection of employees |
| 7 | There are equal opportunities for all (potential) employees when it comes to hiring |
| 8 | Management has given me clear job description (job description is a document that specifies job purposes, duties and responsibilities, working conditions etc.) |
| 9 | Duties which I perform actually match with the duties indicated in the job description |
### Part 2

#### Recruitment and selection and performance

|  | Strongly agree | Agree | Neutral | Disagree | Strongly disagree |
|---|----------------|-------|---------|----------|-------------------|
| 13 | Recruitment and selection practices used in organizations influence personal behavior |       |         |          |                   |
| 14 | I know very well what is expected from me on my job |       |         |          |                   |
| 15 | I know how my job impacts on the mission of our company |       |         |          |                   |
| 16 | I have opportunities to learn and grow |       |         |          |                   |
| 17 | My last performance appraisal accurately reflected my performance |       |         |          |                   |
| 18 | The performance appraisal system is fair |       |         |          |                   |
| 19 | I feel I am valued at the company |       |         |          |                   |
| 20 | If I do good work I can count on making more money (incentives for performance, achieving targets) |       |         |          |                   |
| 21 | If I do good work I can count on being promoted |       |         |          |                   |
| 22 | This organization’s recruitment and selection really inspires the very best in me towards the job performance |       |         |          |                   |
| 23 | Recruitment and selection, transfer, demotion, suspension and dismissal are based on performance |       |         |          |                   |
| 24 | Company is lacking consistency in employment opportunities, having an impact on performance |       |         |          |                   |
| 25 | Performance is determined from Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) mentioned in job description |       |         |          |                   |
| 26 | Turnover rate is linked with poor Recruitment and selection practices |       |         |          |                   |
| 27 | Political hiring influence the performance negatively in my organization |       |         |          |                   |
| 28 | Political interference influence the Recruitment and selection, transfer, demotion, suspension and dismissal in my organization |       |         |          |                   |