Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
Thyroid autoimmunity and SARS-CoV-2 infection: Report of a large Italian series

Poupak Fallahi, Silvia Martina Ferrari, Giusy Elia, Sabrina Rosaria Paparo, Armando Patrizio, Eugenia Balestri, Valeria Mazzi, Laura Gragnani, Clodoveo Ferri, Chiara Botrini, Francesca Ragusa, Alessandro Antonelli*

A Department of Translational Research of New Technologies in Medicine and Surgery, University of Pisa, Pisa, Italy
B Department of Clinical and Experimental Medicine, University of Pisa, Pisa, Italy
C Department of Surgical, Medical and Molecular Pathology and Critical Area, University of Pisa, Pisa, Italy
D Department of Emergency Medicine, Azienda Ospedaliero-Universitaria Pisana, Pisa, Italy
E MASVE Interdepartmental Hepatology Center, Department of Experimental and Clinical Medicine, University of Florence Center, Center for Research and Innovation CRIA-MASVE, Firenze, Italy
F Rheumatology Unit, University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, School of Medicine, Modena, Italy
G Rheumatology Clinic ‘Madonna Dello Scoglio’ Cotronei, Crotone, Italy

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:
Graves' disease
SARS-CoV-2
COVID-19
Chronic lymphocytic thyroiditis
Autoimmune thyroid diseases

ABSTRACT

Since the beginning of the pandemic, numerous risk factors have been associated with SARS-CoV-2 infection and COVID-19 outcomes, such as older age, male sex, and the presence of comorbidities, such as hypertension, obesity, and diabetes. Preliminary data also suggest epidemiological association between SARS-CoV-2 infection and systemic autoimmune disease. For this reason, we investigated if patients affected by autoimmune thyroid disorders (AITD) are at risk of developing SARS-CoV-2 infection or COVID-19 disease.

From April to September 2020, we have conducted a telephone survey that included 515 consecutive unselected patients with known thyroid disorders, of which 350 were affected by AITD. All 11 definitive diagnosis of COVID-19 (def-sympt-COVID-19) belonged to the AITD group, while the rest 14 cases highly suspected for COVID-19 (suspect-sympt-COVID-19) were equally detected in both group (7 in AITD and 7 in not-AITD). The overall prevalence of symptomatic COVID-19 (def-sympt-COVID-19 + suspect-sympt-COVID-19), recorded in the 350 AITD population was statistically significant higher compared to that reported in the Italian and Tuscan general population at the same time period of the present survey (18/350 = 5.14% vs 516/100000 = 0.51% [p < 0.001; OR = 10.45, 95% CI 6.45–16.92] and vs 394/100000 = 0.39% [p < 0.001; OR = 13.70, 95% CI 8.44–22.25], respectively).

Therefore, our results suggest a higher prevalence of SARS-CoV-2 infection and COVID-19 disease in patients with AITD.

1. Introduction

As of 31st January 2022, the COVID-19 pandemic caused by SARS-CoV-2 has spread around the world with nearly 300 million cases and >5 million confirmed deaths, based on the WHO databases [1]. SARS-CoV-2 infection can run asymptomatically or provokes mild upper respiratory tract symptoms as dry cough, headache, fever, and loss of smell and taste, or it can induce an interstitial pneumonia that can result in ARDS (Acute Respiratory Distress Syndrome) with the need for mechanical ventilation [2].

To date, the most effective weapon to fight SARS-CoV-2 infection is represented by primary prophylaxis with vaccines. In a short time, numerous sera have been released [3], including, for the first time, mRNA technology based vaccines (Pfizer-Biontech’s BNT162b2 and Moderna’s mRNA-1273) [4,5]. Since the beginning of the pandemic, numerous risk factors have been associated with severe COVID-19, need of hospitalization and/or intensive care unit admission and, consequently, increased mortality

* Corresponding author at: Immuno-Endocrine Section of Internal Medicine, Professor of Medicine, Endocrinology, Clinical Pathology, Laboratory of Primary Human Cells, Department of Surgical, Medical and Molecular Pathology and Critical Area, University of Pisa, School of Medicine, Via Savi, 10, I-56126 Pisa, Italy.
E-mail address: alessandro.antonelli@unipi.it (A. Antonelli).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autrev.2022.103183
Received 9 August 2022; Accepted 18 August 2022
Available online 23 August 2022
1568-9972/© 2022 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.
and their recognition helped to hasten more focused health interventions by the Public Health administrations. Among the frequent features associate with severe COVID-19 and death, there are older age, male sex, and the presence of comorbidities, such as hypertension, obesity, and diabetes [6].

Moreover, other researchers suggested epidemiological association between SARS-CoV-2 infection and several pre-existent diseases, including systemic autoimmunity disease, showing higher incidence of the infection among people affected by this subset of diseases, especially connective tissue diseases, whose significant immune-system impairment may enhance susceptibility to infections [7–11]. These observations did not contemplate autoimmune thyroid diseases (AITD) and few data have been collected on the risk of infection in patients affected by these thyroid diseases.

For the reason, based on these preliminary observations, we investigated if patients affected by AITD are at risk of developing SARS-CoV-2 infection or COVID-19 disease.

2. Patients and methods

We have conducted an observational study that included 515 consecutive unselected patients with known thyroid disorders (from our institution list) by means of telephone survey from April to September 2020. Patients were divided in two groups: (a) patients with AITD (autoimmune thyroiditis, Graves’ disease, patients operated for different kind of thyroid diseases and presence of circulating AbTPO, or AbTg); (b) patients without autoimmune disorders (not-AITD): nodular or multinodular goiter, patients operated for different kind of thyroid diseases, all without cytological, histological, or humoral evidence of thyroid autoimmunity.

2.1. COVID-19 classification

On these bases, COVID-19 was classified as: (a) definite diagnosis of COVID-19 disease (def-sympt-COVID-19): presence of symptomatic COVID-19 infection always confirmed by positive oral/nasopharyngeal swabs at polymerase-chain-reaction testing; (b) highly suspected COVID-19 disease (suspect-sympt-COVID-19); (c) patients without autoimmune disorders (not-AITD): nodular or multinodular goiter, patients operated for different kind of thyroid diseases, all without cytological, histological, or humoral evidence of thyroid autoimmunity.

Table 1 Demographic data and COVID-19 prevalence in Italian patients with AITD vs not-AITD.

| Gender | Mean Age | COVID-19 Definite | P* RR value 95% CI | COVID-19 Highly suspected | P* RR value 95% CI | COVID-19 Definite + Highly suspected | P* RR value 95% CI |
|--------|----------|-------------------|--------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------|
| AITD vs not-AITD | 54 M/296 F | 61.7/11 | 1.004–1.487 | 7 | ns | 18 | ns |

3. Results

Of 515 interviewed patients, 350 were affected with AITD, of which 30 had also a diagnosis of thyroid cancer with thyroid antibodies positivity (AbTg and/or AbTPO). 165 patients had no AITD nor thyroid antibodies positivity, included 36 patients with thyroid cancer. The mean age was 58.91 years old and there was a female gender predominance in all subgroups of patients (Table 1).

3.1. Prevalence of Covid-19

Overall, COVID-19 was recorded in 25 (def-sympt-COVID-19+ suspect-sympt-COVID-19) out of 515 patients (4.8%). Of these 11 had a definitive diagnosis of COVID-19 (def-sympt-COVID-19), while the rest 14 reported a clinical history highly suspected for COVID-19 (suspect-sympt-COVID-19). All 11 confirmed case (mean age 52.09, 9/11 [81.8%] were female) belonged to the AITD group, while 7 suspect-sympt-Covid-19 cases were detected in each group (AITD and not-AITD). Among the 11 confirmed cases, 4 have been hospitalized because of development of COVID-related pneumonia (Tables 2, 3). The overall prevalence of symptomatic COVID-19 (Table 2), (def-sympt-COVID-19+ suspect-sympt-COVID-19), recorded in the 350 AITD population was statistically significant higher compared to that reported in the Italian and Tuscan general population at the same time period of the present survey (18/350 = 5.14% vs 516/100000 = 0.51% [p < 0.001; OR = 10.45, 95% CI 6.45–16.92] and vs 394/100000 = 0.39% [p < 0.001; OR = 13.70, 95% CI 8.44–22.25] respectively); data from the Italian Superior Institute of Health (ISS) [12]. These results were confirmed also when only the 11 definite cases have been considered (11/350 = 3.14% vs 516/100000 = 0.51% [p < 0.001; OR = 6.25, 95% CI 3.41–11.47] and vs 394/100000 = 0.39% [p < 0.001; OR = 8.20, 95% CI 4.46–15.076]).

Noteworthy, the prevalence of COVID-19 confirmed cases (def-sympt-COVID-19) was statistically higher in the AITD group compared to not-AITD group (11/350 = 3.14% vs 0/165 = 0% [p < 0.021; Relative Risk (RR) = 1.487, 95% CI 1.004–1.487]) (Table 1).

4. Discussion

Heterogeneous data have been collected about the potential impact of pre-existing thyroid diseases on COVID-19 development and prognosis.

For example, in the early phase of the pandemic, exploratory cohort-based retrospective analysis have reported that patients treated for hypothyroidism or hyperthyroidism seem to be not at increased risk of SARS-CoV-2 infection, hospitalization, mechanical ventilation nor death and that therapy for thyroid disease, when controlling for relevant confounding, does not affect the prognosis of SARS-CoV-2 infection [13,14]. Nonetheless, none of these aforementioned researches have addressed the underlying etiologies of hypothyroidism and hyperthyroidism conditions, which in turn can have a different impact on the risk and the course of the infection. In fact, other studies have suggested that thyroid autoimmunity increased the risk of COVID-19 infection [15], and that, hypothyroidism was associated with a more severe COVID-19 disease instead [16].

Mantel-Haenszel; AITD: autoimmune thyroid diseases.

References

[6]
On the other hand, there are more and more evidences that COVID-19 itself may acutely disrupt the thyroid function. The range of thyroid disorders associated with SARS-CoV-2 infection is rather broad non-thyroidal illness syndrome (NTIS), thyrotoxicosis and subacute thyroiditis (SAT) [17–19], and in part, they could be explained by the direct virus replication within thyroid follicular cells through the angiotensin-converting enzyme 2 (ACE2) receptor [20–22]. However, preliminary prospective studies suggested that when altered, the thyroid dysfunction recovers to baseline during the follow-up without specific therapy and the meaning of such thyroid perturbations could be rather their relationship with more severe disease and worse prognosis during acute presentation with COVID-19 [23].

In particular, it appeared that low T3 syndrome (low FT3, normal or low TSH, normal FT4) is a marker of inflammation in COVID-19 infection, it can be associated with the severity of the disease, with cytokine storm, and with treatments, such as corticosteroids [24–26].

Our findings suggest a higher prevalence of SARS-CoV-2 infection and COVID-19 disease in patients with AITD. To date, in the literature there is only one other study which evaluate the prevalence of SARS-CoV-2 infection in a smaller sample of AITD patients and through a similar methodology (retrospective telephone survey) and it suggests that this subset of patients carries similar risk of COVID-19 compared to the general population [27]. However, differently from this paper, our study has considered a wider sample and it has been conducted only during the first peak of the pandemic, with no vaccinated patients enrolled, which may justify the discordant susceptibility to COVID-19 of the examined populations.

Understanding the impact of SARS-CoV-2 infection in AITD patients may be clinically relevant since hypothyroidism (the thyroid dysfunction most frequently associated with AITD) has been demonstrated to be associated with an increased death rate in the general population [28].

Therefore, we aim to shed a light on the incidence and risk of developing SARS-CoV-2 infection or COVID-19 disease in patients with thyroid autoimmune disease. This survey presents some limitations, such as: 1) the time of the survey study; it has been conducted in the first phase of the pandemic spread, during which there were several issues in the management of the disease, such as the lack of virological tests to assess the presence of the virus. Therefore, the number of asymptomatic, or with mild symptoms patients could be higher; 2) since the modality of collecting data was based on a telephone survey, the possibility of a recall bias should be considered.

Despite the above-mentioned limitations, our strengths are: 1) data obtained from a broader AITD population of different areas of Italy; 2) the study has been conducted during the first phase of the pandemic wave, during which no vaccine protection was available, and the only types of protection that could aid in preventing the infection were the use of masks and social distancing.

However, larger prospective studies are needed to compare and evaluate the different impact of the various SARS-CoV-2 variants as well as the effect of anti SARS-CoV-2 vaccines in this subset of population with autoimmune thyroid disorders [29].

Funding

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

Declaration of Competing Interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

References

[1] World Health organization (WHO). Coronavirus (COVID-19) Dashboard. http://covid19.who.int; 2022 [accessed 31 January 31 2022].
[2] Guan WJ, Ni ZY, Hu Y, Liang WH, Ou CQ, He JX, et al. Clinical characteristics of coronavirus disease 2019 in China. N Engl J Med 2020;382:1708–20. https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa2002032.
[3] Mathieu E, Ritchie H, Ortiz-Ospina E, Roser M, Hasell J, Appel C, et al. A global database of COVID-19 vaccinations. Nat Hum Behav 2021;5:947–53. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41562-021-01122-8.
[4] Baden LR, El Sahly HM, Essink B, Kozlof K, Frey S, Novak R, et al. Efficacy and safety of the mRNA-1273 SARS-CoV-2 vaccine. N Engl J Med 2021;384:403–16. https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa2035289.

[5] Polack FP, Thomas SJ, Kitchin N, Absalon J, Gurtman A, Lockhart S, et al. Safety and efficacy of the BNT162b2 mRNA COVID-19 vaccine. N Engl J Med 2020;383:2603–15. https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa2034577.

[6] Semenzato L, Botton J, Drouin J, Guenter F, Drey-Spira R, Weill A, et al. Chronic diseases, health conditions and risk of COVID-19-related hospitalization and in-hospital mortality during the first wave of the epidemic in France: a cohort study of 66 million people. Lancet Reg Health Eur 2021;8:100158. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lanepe.2021.100158.

[7] Ferri C, Giuggioli D, Raimondo V, Dagna L, Riccieri V, Zanatta E, et al. COVID-19 patients treated for hypothyroidism and hyperthyroidism. Lancet Diabetes Endocrinol 2020;9:3195–204. https://doi.org/10.1016/s1168-0102(20)30334-7.

[8] Semenzato L, Botton J, Drouin J, Guenter F, Drey-Spira R, Weill A, et al. Chronic diseases, health conditions and risk of COVID-19-related hospitalization and in-hospital mortality during the first wave of the epidemic in France: a cohort study of 66 million people. Lancet Reg Health Eur 2021;8:100158. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lanepe.2021.100158.

[9] Antonelli A, Fallahi P, Elia G, Ragusa F, Paparo SR, Mazzi V, et al. Effect of the COVID-19 pandemic on patients with systemic rheumatic diseases. Lancet Rheumatol 2021;3:e166–8. https://doi.org/10.1016/s2665-9913(21)00007-2.

[10] Fendt P. Fallahi et al. Chronic diseases, health conditions and risk of COVID-19-related hospitalization and in-hospital mortality during the first wave of the epidemic in France: a cohort study of 66 million people. Lancet Reg Health Eur 2021;8:100158. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lanepe.2021.100158.

[11] Lania A, Sandri MT, Cellini M, Mirani M, LaveZZI E, Mazzotti G. Thyroid autoimmunity in patients with COVID-19: the THYRCOV study. Eur J Endocrinol 2020;183:81–7. https://doi.org/10.1530/EJE-20-0035.

[12] Iremi BG, Şendur SN, Unlütüük U. Three cases of subacute thyroiditis following SARS-CoV-2 vaccine: postvaccination ASIA syndrome. J Clin Endocrinol Metab 2021;106:2600–5. https://doi.org/10.1210/clinem/dgab373.

[13] Antonelli A, Ferrari SM, Corrado A, Di Domenicantonio A, Fallahi P. Autoimmune and systemic autoimmune systemic diseases: role of pre-existing lung involvement and ongoing treatments. Curr Pharm Des 2021;27:4245–52. https://doi.org/10.2174/1381612827666210903103935.

[14] Ferri C, Giuggioli D, Raimondo V, L’Andolina M, Tavoni A, Cecchetti R, et al. COVID-19 and rheumatic autoimmune systemic diseases: report of a large Italian patients series. Clin Rheumatol 2020;39:3195–204. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10067-020-05334-7.

[15] Ferri C, Giuggioli D, Raimondo V, Dagna L, Riccieri V, Zanatta E, et al. COVID-19 and systemic sclerosis: clinicopathological implications from Italian nationwide survey study. Lancet Rheumatol 2021;3:e166–8. https://doi.org/10.1016/s2665-9913(21)00007-2.

[16] Antovelen LM, et al. Latent rheumatic, thyroid and phospholipid autoimmunity in hospital patients with COVID-19. J Transl Autoimmun 2021;4:100091. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jtauto.2021.100091.

[17] Guo W, Ran LY, Zhu JH, Ge QG, Du Z, Wang FL, et al. Identifying critically ill hospitalized patients with COVID-19. J Transl Autoimmun 2021;4:100091.

[18] Clarke SA, Abbara A, Dhillon WS. Impact of COVID-19 on the endocrine system: a mini-review. Endocrinology 2022;163:bqab203. https://doi.org/10.1210/endo/bqab203.

[19] Lut DTW, Lee CH, Chow WS, Lee ACH, Tam AR, Fong CHY, et al. Role of non-thyroidal illness syndrome in predicting adverse outcomes in COVID-19 patients predominantly of mild-to-moderate severity. Clin Endocrinol 2021;95:469–77. https://doi.org/10.1111/cen.14476.

[20] Guo W, Ran LY, Zhu JH, Ge QG, Du Z, Wang FL, et al. Identifying critically ill patients at risk of death from coronavirus disease. World J Emerg Med 2021;12:18–23. https://doi.org/10.5847/wjem.j.1920-8642.2021.01.003.

[21] Malik J, Malik A, Javad T, Zahid T, Ishq U, Shoaib M. Thyroid function analysis in COVID-19: a retrospective study from a single center. PLoS One 2021;16:e0249421. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0249421.

[22] Santacroce G, Lenti MV, Aronica N, Miceli E,lovatti E, Lucotti PC, et al. Impact of COVID-19 in immunosuppressive drug-naive autoimmune disorders: autoimmune gastritis, celiac disease, type 1 diabetes, and autoimmune thyroid disease. Pediatr Allergy Immunol 2022;33(Suppl. 27):105–22. https://doi.org/10.1111/pai.13646.

[23] Lillevang-Johansen M, Abrahamsen B, Jorgensen L, Brix TH, Hegedüs L. Over-and under-treatment of hypothyroidism is associated with excess mortality: a register-based cohort study. Thyroid 2018;28:566–74. https://doi.org/10.1089/thy.2017.0517.

[24] Antonelli A, Ferrari SM, Corrado A, Di Domenicantonio A, Fallahi P. Autoimmune thyroid disorders. Autoimmun Rev 2015;14:174–7. https://doi.org/10.1016/s2213-8587(21)00028-0.