Effectiveness of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections during the Delta variant epidemic in Japan: Vaccine Effectiveness Real-time Surveillance for SARS-CoV-2 (VERSUS)

Haruka Maeda MD, MPH1,2, Nobuo Saito MD, PhD3, Ataru Igarashi PhD4,5, Masayuki Ishida MD, PhD6, Kazuya Suami MD7, Ai Yagiuchi MD7, Yuya Kimura MD8, Masaru Komino RN8, Hiromi Arai RN8, Toru Morikawa MD9, Iori Motohashi MD, MPH10, Rei Miyazawa BL10, Tetsu Moriyama MD11, Hiroshi Kamura MD12, Mayumi Terada MD13, Osamu Kuwamitsu MD14, Tomoichiro Hayakawa MD15, Eiichiro Sando MD, PhD16,17, Yasuji Ohara MD18, Osamu Teshigawara MD19, Motoi Suzuki MD, PhD20, Konosuke Morimoto MD, PhD1.

1 Department of Respiratory Infections, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Nagasaki University, Nagasaki, Japan
2 Department of Clinical Tropical Medicine, Nagasaki University Graduate School of Biomedical Sciences, Nagasaki, Japan
3 Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Medicine, Oita University, Oita, Japan
4 Unit of Public Health and Preventive Medicine, Yokohama City University School of Medicine, Kanagawa, Japan

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.
5 Department of Health Economics and Outcomes Research, Graduate School of Pharmaceutical Sciences, the University of Tokyo, Tokyo, Japan

6 Chikamori Hospital, Kochi, Japan

7 Nagoya Ekisaikai Hospital, Aichi, Japan

8 Saiseikai Kurihashi Hospital, Saitama, Japan

9 Nara City Hospital, Nara, Japan

10 Kawasaki Municipal Tama Hospital, Kanagawa, Japan

11 Moriyama Memorial Hospital, Tokyo, Japan

12 Loco Clinic Nakameguro, Tokyo, Japan

13 Nijigaoka Hospital, Nagasaki, Japan

14 Gohongi Clinic, Tokyo, Japan

15 Hayakawa Internal Medicine Clinic, Fukuoka, Japan

16 Kita-Fukushima Medical Center, Fukushima, Japan

17 Fukushima Medical University, Fukushima, Japan

18 Takagi Hospital, Aichi, Japan

19 Mizuho Street Clinic, Aichi, Japan

20 Infectious Disease Surveillance Center, National Institute of Infectious Diseases, Tokyo, Japan
Corresponding author

Konosuke Morimoto

Address: Department of Respiratory Infections, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Nagasaki University, 1-12-4 Sakamoto, Nagasaki, 852-8523, Japan

Email: komorimo@nagasaki-u.ac.jp

Telephone number: +81-(0)95-819-7842

Fax number: +81-(0)95-819-7843

Alternate corresponding author

Haruka Maeda

Address: Department of Respiratory Infections, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Nagasaki University, 1-12-4 Sakamoto, Nagasaki, 852-8523, Japan

Email: mharuka@nagasaki-u.ac.jp

Telephone number: +81-(0)95-819-7842

Fax number: +81-(0)95-819-7843
Abstract

**Background:** Although high vaccine effectiveness of messenger RNA (mRNA) coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) vaccines was reported in studies in several countries, data is limited from Asian countries, especially against the Delta (B.1.617.2) variant.

**Methods:** We conducted a multicenter test-negative case-control study in patients aged ≥16 visiting hospitals or clinics with signs or symptoms consistent with COVID-19 from July 1 to September 30, 2021, when the Delta variant was dominant (≥90% of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 [SARS-CoV-2] infections) nationwide in Japan. Vaccine effectiveness of BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273 against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections was evaluated. Waning immunity among patients aged 16 to 64 was also assessed.

**Results:** We enrolled 1936 patients, including 396 test-positive cases and 1540 test-negative controls for SARS-CoV-2. The median age was 49 years, 53.4% were male, and 34.0% had underlying medical conditions. Full vaccination (receiving two doses ≥14 days before symptom onset) was received by 6.6% of cases and 38.8% of controls. Vaccine effectiveness of full vaccination against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections was 88.7% (95% confidence interval [CI], 78.8–93.9) among patients aged 16 to 64 and 90.3% (95% CI, 73.6–96.4) among patients aged ≥65. Among patients aged 16 to 64, vaccine effectiveness within one to
three months after full vaccination was 91.8% (95% CI, 80.3–96.6), and was 86.4% (95% CI, 56.9–95.7) within four to six months.

**Conclusions:** mRNA COVID-19 vaccines had high effectiveness against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections in Japan during July 1 to September 30, 2021, when the Delta variant was dominant nationwide.
Introduction

Since December 2019, the severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) has spread globally, including Japan, and has significantly impacted health, livelihoods, and economics. To counter the coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic, COVID-19 vaccines were developed and distributed globally. Clinical trials of COVID-19 vaccines found high vaccine efficacy [1-3], and observational studies evaluated vaccine effectiveness in several countries [4-6]. However, data on vaccine effectiveness of messenger RNA (mRNA) COVID-19 vaccines, especially against the Delta (B.1.617.2) variant, from Asian countries is limited.

In February 2021, the Japanese government initiated a national COVID-19 vaccination campaign (Supplementary Figure 1). It is crucial to assess COVID-19 vaccine effectiveness domestically when evaluating the national policy and, going forward, determining the optimal vaccination policy. Vaccine effectiveness has been estimated to attenuate due to the emergence of new variants [7]. Accordingly, we started surveillance activity from July 1, 2021 to monitor vaccine effectiveness of COVID-19 vaccines in Japan, named Vaccine Effectiveness Real-time Surveillance for SARS-CoV-2 (VERSUS). In this study, we evaluated vaccine effectiveness of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines, BNT165b2 and mRNA-1273, against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections during the Delta variant epidemic in Japan using data registered for our surveillance.
Methods

Design

We conducted a prospective test-negative case-control study in patients visiting hospitals or clinics with signs or symptoms compatible with COVID-19 [8, 9]. The case group included individuals having signs or symptoms compatible with COVID-19 and positive test results of SARS-CoV-2. The following test methods were included, which have high sensitivity and specificity and are commonly used for diagnosis in Japan as well as globally [10, 11]: nucleic acid amplification tests including polymerase chain reaction (PCR), loop-medical isothermal amplification (LAMP) [12], and nicking endonuclease amplification reaction [13]; and antigen quantification tests [14, 15]. Individuals having signs or symptoms compatible with COVID-19 but negative test results of SARS-CoV-2 were included in the control group.

Setting

This study enrolled individuals visiting medical institutes from July 1 through September 30, 2021, at nine hospitals and four clinics in nine prefectures on four main islands in Japan. During this study period, Japan experienced a fifth epidemic wave due to the Delta variant, starting late in June 2021 (Supplementary Figure 2) [16, 17]. Before the fifth wave in Japan, the Japanese government approved and introduced
COVID-19 vaccines [18] (Supplementary Figure 1). The market approval of BNT162b2 was done on February 14, 2021 for aged ≥16 years and expanded for aged 12 to 15 years on May 31, 2021. Two additional vaccines, mRNA-1273 and AZD1222, were approved for aged ≥18 years on May 21, 2021. For mRNA-1273 approval was expanded for aged 12 to 17 years on July 26, 2021. The government decided to publicly fund COVID vaccinations and set up a prioritization strategy, with a design based in part on procurement issues. Healthcare workers were the first to be vaccinated, beginning on February 17, 2021, followed by priority vaccination of older adults aged ≥65 years started on April 12, 2021. For younger citizens, 12 to 64 years of age, a vaccination program was started from June 2021, with priority given to those with underlying medical conditions. All were vaccinated with BNT162b2 until May 24. The first administration of mRNA-1273 for older adults aged ≥65 years began on May 24, 2021, followed by vaccination of aged ≥18 years on June 17, 2021, and aged ≥12 years on August 2, 2021. Administration of AZD1222 became optional for aged ≥40 years from late August. By September 30, 2021, 66% of the Japan population had received at least one dose and 57% received two doses; among people aged ≥65 years, more than 90% had received two doses (Supplementary Figure 2) [19].

Participants

Patients aged ≥16 years were included who had signs or symptoms compatible with
COVID-19 (specifically, one or more of the following: fever $\geq 37.5^\circ\text{C}$, cough, fatigue, shortness of breath, myalgia, sore throat, nasal congestion, headache, taste disorder, or olfactory dysfunction) [20, 21] and were tested for SARS-CoV-2. We excluded cases with episodes tested 15 days or more after symptom onset or cases with undocumented symptom onset dates, because of the inaccuracy of test results [22]. When individuals had multiple episodes, we used the following rules for exclusion: 1) episodes with negative test results within seven days after a previous negative result; 2) episodes with multiple negative test results and identical symptom onset date; 3) episodes with negative test results within three weeks prior to a positive test result, or episodes occurring after a positive test result, due to the possibility of false-negatives; 4) for multiple positive episodes during the study period, we included only the first episode; and 5) we included a maximum of three negative test results for each individual.

**Data collection**

Attending physicians in each medical institute identified eligible patients. Demographic and clinical information was collected from medical charts and recorded on an electronic database using REDCap [23].

We collected demographic and clinical information, including age, sex, place of residence, presence of underlying medical conditions (i.e. chronic heart disease, chronic
respiratory disease, obesity [body mass index ≥ 30 kg/m²], malignancy [including solid or haematological malignancy], diabetes mellitus, chronic kidney disease, receiving dialysis, liver cirrhosis, use of immunosuppressive medicines, or pregnancy), smoking history, history of contact with COVID-19 patients, healthcare employment status, clinical symptoms, and COVID-19 vaccination histories.

**Classification of vaccination status**

We obtained vaccination histories (i.e., vaccination date of administration, type of vaccine product, and vaccination frequency) through interviews with patients or their family members. COVID-19 vaccines are administered as two-dose series. Vaccination status was classified into six categories based on the number of vaccine doses received before symptom onset and the number of days between the last vaccination and symptom onset date; specifically, 1) unvaccinated where individuals had received no vaccine dose before symptom onset; 2) first vaccine dose within 13 days before symptom onset; 3) partially vaccinated where individuals received one dose ≥ 14 days before symptom onset; 4) second vaccine dose within 13 days before symptom onset; 5) fully vaccinated where individuals received two doses ≥ 14 days before symptom onset; and 6) unknown vaccination status where vaccination histories were not documented. For patients whose precise vaccination date was not documented (for example, only the month of the vaccination was documented), the
midpoint between the two possible dates was assumed to be the vaccination date.

Additionally, those for whom only the number of vaccine doses were recorded were included in either the partially or fully vaccinated groups depending on the number of vaccine doses.

**Statistical analysis**

The odds ratio (OR) was calculated by comparing the odds of antecedent COVID-19 vaccination in test-positive versus test-negative patients. A mixed-effects logistic regression model was used to calculate adjusted ORs. Age, sex, presence of underlying medical conditions, calendar weeks, and history of contact with COVID-19 patients were applied as the fixed effects, and study sites as the random effect to the logistic model. Vaccine effectiveness was defined as one minus adjusted ORs, expressed as a percentage [8, 9].

Vaccine effectiveness estimates were calculated for full vaccinated versus unvaccinated and for partially vaccinated versus unvaccinated. We analyzed vaccine effectiveness separately in patients aged 16 to 64 years and in patients aged ≥65 years, taking into consideration the possibility of confounders due to the priority vaccination strategy for patients aged ≥65 years. For BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273 analysis, we pooled patients who received either BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273mRNA COVID-19 vaccines. We also performed analyses on each vaccine product separately. We excluded the episodes with undocumented vaccine products from the analysis of each vaccine product. Additionally, to
assess the extent of waning immunity of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines against the Delta variant in Japan, we evaluated vaccine effectiveness separately between two groups: episodes within one to three months and episodes within four to six months after full vaccination status (14 days after the second vaccine receipt) among patients aged 16 to 64 years. We also conducted subgroup analyses by sex or presence of underlying medical conditions.

Several sensitivity analyses were performed to strengthen our results since some of the vaccination histories were vacant: when the precise vaccination date was uncertain, we set the vaccination date as the most recent possible date (scenario A) or the earliest possible date (scenario B) from symptom onset; we excluded patients with no information of vaccination dates (scenario C); and multiple imputations were performed for those with undocumented vaccination histories (scenario D). All analysis was performed using Stata version 16.0 (Stata Corp., College Station, Texas, USA)

**Ethics**

This study was approved by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) at the Institute of Tropical Medicine, Nagasaki University (approval no. 210225257) and the study sites. For the study sites without IRBs, this study was collectively reviewed by the Institute of Tropical Medicine IRB, Nagasaki University. The study was conducted following the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare Ethical Guidelines for Medical and Biological Research Involving Human
Results

Participants

Between July 1, 2021, and September 30, 2021, 2082 episodes with signs or symptoms consistent with COVID-19 and evidence of tests for SARS-CoV-2 were registered in our surveillance. After excluding 75 episodes with tests ≥15 days after symptom onset, 43 episodes with undocumented symptom onset dates, and 28 episodes with multiple test occasions, we included 1936 patients (396 test-positive cases, 1540 test-negative controls) (Figure 1) enrolled from 13 medical facilities (Supplementary Figure 3). Overall, the median age was 49 years (interquartile range, 30–72), 1033 (53.4%) were male, 659 (34.0%) had one or more underlying medical conditions (Table 1). Test-positive cases were more likely to be male, younger, have histories of contact with COVID-19 patients, and less likely to have underlying medical conditions (p-value <0.001). Thirteen (3.3%) cases and 89 (5.8%) controls had received partial COVID-19 vaccination, 26 (6.6%) cases and 597 (38.8%) controls had received full COVID-19 vaccination, and 290 (73.2%) cases and 523 (34.0%) controls were unvaccinated. Among vaccinated patients, 676 (69.6%) received BNT162b2 and 140 (14.4%) mRNA-1273 but the vaccine products of 155 (16.0%) individuals were unknown; and 86.9% of fully vaccinated individuals had completed full vaccination within
one to three months before symptom onset.

**Vaccine effectiveness**

Vaccine effectiveness of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections are shown in Figure 2. For BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273 analysis among patients aged 16 to 64 years, vaccine effectiveness for full vaccination was 88.7% (95% confidence interval [CI], 78.8–93.9), and 54.3% (95% CI, 8.4–77.2) for partial vaccination. Point estimates were higher for mRNA-1273 (96.6%; 95% CI, 72.8–99.6) than for BNT162b2 (86.7%; 95% CI, 73.5–93.3); however, there was no statistically significant difference (p-value=0.877). Among patients aged ≥65 years, vaccine effectiveness for full vaccination was similar to aged 16 to 64 years: 90.3% (95% CI, 73.6–96.4) for BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273 analysis, and 85.8% (95% CI, 59.4–95.0) for BNT162b2 analysis. Vaccine effectiveness for partial vaccination or mRNA-1273 among patients aged ≥65 years was not evaluated due to the small sample size.

The extent of waning immunity of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections was analyzed among patients aged 16 to 64 years. Vaccine effectiveness for patients within one to three months after full vaccination was 91.8% (95% CI, 80.3–96.6), and 86.4% (95% CI, 56.9–95.7) for patients within four to six months (Figure 2).
In a subgroup analysis by sex, a point estimate was higher for women (92.9%; 95% CI, 81.0–97.4) than for men (83.5%; 95% CI, 62.3–92.8) among patients aged 16 to 64 years, and higher for men (94.1%; 95% CI, 72.5–98.8) than women (88.7%; 95% CI, 49.2–97.5) among patients aged ≥65 years, while the 95% CI overlapped in both age groups (Figure 3).

In a subgroup analysis by the presence of underlying medical conditions, vaccine effectiveness was similar for both age groups. The results of sensitivity analysis are shown in Supplementary Table 1 and are similar to the primary analysis.

**Discussion**

In this prospective test-negative case-control study, we confirmed high mRNA COVID-19 vaccine effectiveness against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections in Japan. We estimated that the vaccine effectiveness of two doses of BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273 against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections was 88.7% (95% CI, 78.8–93.9) among patients aged 16 to 64 years and 90.3% (95% CI, 73.6–96.4) among patients aged ≥65 years. This study adds to real-world evaluations that demonstrated the high vaccine effectiveness of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines against symptomatic SAR-CoV-2 infections in Japan.

The patients included in this study were those examined for SARS-CoV-2 tests between July 1, 2021 and September 30, 2021. During this period, the Delta variant was dominant within Japan, and more than 90% of COVID-19 cases nationwide were estimated to
be caused by the Delta variant since late August. [25, 26]. Therefore, both mRNA COVID-19 vaccines are effective against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections caused by the Delta variant. Our vaccine effectiveness estimates after two doses of vaccines were similar to estimates reported from the United Kingdom (88% [95% CI, 85.3–90.1] for BNT162b2) [27] and Canada (92% [95% CI, 89–94] for BNT162b2 and 92% [95% CI, 90–97] for mRNA-1273) [28]; but higher than those in Israel (40.5% [95% CI, 8.7–61.2] for BNT162b2) [29, 30], the United States (42% [95% CI, 13–62] for BNT162b2 and 76% [95% CI, 58–87] for mRNA-1273) [31], or Qatar (44.4% [95% CI, 37.0–50.9] for BNT162b2 and 73.9 [95% CI, 65.9–79.9] for mRNA-1273) [32]. The Japanese national COVID-19 vaccination campaign started more than two months after these countries [33], and the symptom onset date for approximately 87% of the fully vaccinated patients in our study was one to three months after full vaccination. One reason for the difference between our estimates of vaccine effectiveness and those in Israel, the United States, and Qatar could be due to waning immunity [29, 34, 35]. On the other hand, the study in the UK included SARS-CoV-2 test results in late April to May [27]; whereas in Canada, the vaccination coverage rate started increasing since June 2021 [33] as in Japan (Supplementary Figure 2), which could make waning immunity less than in Israel, the United States, or Qatar [27, 28]. We also evaluated the vaccine effectiveness of each mRNA COVID-19 vaccine among people aged 16 to 64 years. Vaccine effectiveness of mRNA-1273 was higher than that of BNT162b2 in the point estimates,
consistent with previous studies [31, 32]; however, there was no statistically significant
difference (p–value=0.877).

As mentioned above, COVID-19 vaccinations were publicly funded in Japan, just
after the market approval. This policy would be reasonable under the first phase of the
pandemic situation. However, when we re-consider the national COVID-19 vaccination
policy, such as a re-setting of priority-based booster vaccinations, subgroup analyses, such as
stratified by age group, are needed. Older adults were reported to have lower antibody titers
after COVID-19 vaccination compared to younger people [36-38]. On the other hand,
COVID-19 vaccine effectiveness in older adults compared to younger people varied by
studies. For example, in our study, the vaccine effectiveness of two doses of mRNA COVID-
19 vaccines against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections among patients aged \( \geq 65 \) years
was similar to that among patients aged 16 to 64 years, consistent with studies from Canada
and Israel [28, 29]; whereas a study from the United Kingdom reported that vaccine
effectiveness of BNT162b2 against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections caused by the Delta
variant was lower in patients aged \( \geq 65 \) years than in patients aged 16 to 64 years [39].
Because COVID-19 vaccine effectiveness by age group differed by studies, it is crucial to
continue assessing it.

To evaluate the waning immunity of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines against symptomatic
COVID-19, we assessed vaccine effectiveness by dividing the interval between full
vaccination date and symptom onset date into two groups. Although the 95% confidence interval was wide due to the small sample size, the point estimates were slightly lower in patients with a longer interval after vaccination. This result was consistent with studies in Israel, the United States, and the United Kingdom [29, 34, 39].

This study had several limitations. First, the sample size was limited to 13 study sites in nine prefectures between July 1, 2021, and September 30, 2021. Second, recall bias could occur in vaccination histories. In Japan, medical professionals working at medical institutions are not allowed to access governmental vaccination records, and vaccination histories included in this analysis were obtained through interviews with patients or their family members. To strengthen our results, we conducted several sensitivity analyses (Supplementary Table 1). Vaccine effectiveness obtained from sensitivity analyses was similar to the primary analysis, and we considered our results robust. Third, since we didn’t conduct SARS-CoV-2 genome sequencing for test-positive patients, it was impossible to obtain an accurate estimation of vaccine effectiveness of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines against the Delta variant. Fourth, we included test methods other than PCR when determining cases and controls because in Japan, test methods such as LAMP and antigen quantification have been used as commonly as PCR. Since these tests have acceptable levels of sensitivity and specificity, we thought it reasonable to include these test methods.

In conclusion, mRNA COVID-19 vaccines were highly effective for preventing
symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections in Japan from July to September 2021, when the Delta
variant circulated nationwide. Thus, vaccine effectiveness of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines
remained high in Japan despite the dominancy of a variant virus. As we only evaluated the
waning immunity up to six months after the full vaccination, and the sample size within three
to six months after the full vaccination was limited, further follow-up research is needed.

Vaccination is one of the essential strategies to tackle the COVID-19 pandemic, and it is
crucial to continue this surveillance activity, including the evaluation of vaccine effectiveness
against the Omicron variant, to assess the optimal domestic COVID-19 vaccination strategy.

Funding

This work was supported by Japan Agency for Medical Research and Development under
grant number, JP21fk0108612.

Acknowledgements

We are grateful to the medical staff at the participating hospitals and clinics. For their
assistance, we thank Yumi Araki, Kyoko Uchibori, Rina Shiramizu, Fumiyo Tsujita (Institute
of Tropical Medicine, Nagasaki University), and Daichi Hatahara (Nagasaki University). We
thank Yura Ko (National Institution of Infectious Diseases) for his technical support.
Conflict of Interest

The Department of Respiratory Infections, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Nagasaki University has received grants not directly related to this surveillance from Pfizer Inc. The Department of Health Economics and Outcomes Research, the Graduate School of Pharmaceutical Science, the University of Tokyo have received grants not directly related to this surveillance from Takeda Pharmaceutical Company Limited.

References

1. Baden LR, El Sahly HM, Essink B, et al. Efficacy and Safety of the mRNA-1273 SARS-CoV-2 Vaccine. N Engl J Med, 2020; 384:403-416.
2. Polack FP, Thomas SJ, Kitchin N, et al. Safety and Efficacy of the BNT162b2 mRNA Covid-19 Vaccine. N Engl J Med, 2020;383:2603-2615.
3. Voysey M, Clemens SAC, Madhi SA, et al. Safety and efficacy of the ChAdOx1 nCoV-19 vaccine (AZD1222) against SARS-CoV-2: an interim analysis of four randomised controlled trials in Brazil, South Africa, and the UK. The Lancet, 2020;397:99-111.
4. Dagan N, Barda N, Kepten E, et al. BNT162b2 mRNA Covid-19 Vaccine in a Nationwide Mass Vaccination Setting. N Engl J Med, 2021;384:1412-1423.
5. Kissling E, Hooiveld M, Sandonis Martin V, et al. Vaccine effectiveness against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infection in adults aged 65 years and older in primary care: I-MOVE-COVID-19 project, Europe, December 2020 to May 2021. Euro Surveill, 2021; 26: 2100670.
6. Harder T, Koch J, Vygen-Bonnet S, et al. Efficacy and effectiveness of COVID-19 vaccines against SARS-CoV-2 infection: interim results of a living systematic review, 1 January to 14 May 2021. Euro Surveill, 2021; 26: 2100563.
7. World Health Organization. Weekly epidemiological update on COVID-19 - 14 December 2021. Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/weekly-epidemiological-update-on-covid-19---14-december-2021. Accessed 10 January,
2022.

8. Nauta J. Statistics in Clinical and Observational Vaccine Studies 2nd edition: Springer, 2020.

9. Sullivan SG, Feng S, Cowling BJ. Potential of the test-negative design for measuring influenza vaccine effectiveness: a systematic review. Expert Rev Vaccines, 2014; 13: 1571-91.

10. World Health Organization. Diagnostic testing for SARS-CoV-2. Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/diagnostic-testing-for-sars-cov-2. Accessed 13 December, 2021.

11. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Test for Current Infection. Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/testing/diagnostic-testing.html. Accessed 13 December, 2021.

12. Pu R, Liu S, Ren X, et al. The screening value of RT-LAMP and RT-PCR in the diagnosis of COVID-19: systematic review and meta-analysis. J Virol Methods, 2022; 300: 114392.

13. Rhoads DD, Cherian SS, Roman K, Stempak LM, Schmotzer CL, Sadri N. Comparison of Abbott ID Now, DiaSorin Simplexa, and CDC FDA Emergency Use Authorization Methods for the Detection of SARS-CoV-2 from Nasopharyngeal and Nasal Swabs from Individuals Diagnosed with COVID-19. J Clin Microbiol, 2020; 58: e00760-20.

14. Gili A, Paggi R, Russo C, et al. Evaluation of Lumipulse(R) G SARS-CoV-2 antigen assay automated test for detecting SARS-CoV-2 nucleocapsid protein (NP) in nasopharyngeal swabs for community and population screening. Int J Infect Dis, 2021; 105: 391-6.

15. Hirotsu Y, Maejima M, Shibusawa M, et al. Prospective study of 1308 nasopharyngeal swabs from 1033 patients using the LUMIPULSE SARS-CoV-2 antigen test: Comparison with RT-qPCR. Int J Infect Dis, 2021; 105: 7-14.

16. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. Data and Materials Available at: https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/covid-19/data.html. Accessed 10 December, 2021.

17. World Health Organization. WHO Coronavirus (COVID-19) Dashboard, Japan. Available at: https://covid19.who.int/region/wpro/country/jp. Accessed 10 January, 2022.

18. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. COVID-19 Vaccines. Available at: https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/covid-19/vaccine.html. Accessed 10 December, 2021.

19. Government CIOs’ Portal, Japan. Vaccination status of COVID-19 vaccine (general population (including older adults)). Available at: https://cio.go.jp/c19vaccine_dashboard. Accessed 13 December 13.

20. World Health Organization. Coronavirus. Available at: https://www.who.int/health-
21. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Symptoms of Coronavirus. Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/symptoms-testing/symptoms.html. Accessed 10 December, 2021.

22. Lauer SA, Grantz KH, Bi Q, et al. The Incubation Period of Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) From Publicly Reported Confirmed Cases: Estimation and Application. Ann Intern Med, 2020; 172: 577-82.

23. Harris PA, Taylor R, Thielke R, Payne J, Gonzalez N, Conde JG. Research electronic data capture (REDCap)--a metadata-driven methodology and workflow process for providing translational research informatics support. J Biomed Inform, 2009; 42: 377-81.

24. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. Ethical Guidelines for Medical and Biological Research Involving Human Subjects Available at: https://www.meti.go.jp/press/2020/03/20210323004/20210323004-1.pdf. Accessed 10 December, 2021.

25. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. 45th Meeting of the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, Advisory Board on Countermeasures to Combat Novel Coronavirus Infections: Response to Novel Coronavirus Infections (Mutants) (July 28, 2021). Available at: https://www.mhlw.go.jp/content/10900000/000812902.pdf. Accessed 10 January, 2022.

26. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. 54th Meeting of the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, Advisory Board on Countermeasures to Combat Novel Coronavirus Infections, Document 3-2. 6 October 2021. Available at: https://www.mhlw.go.jp/content/10900000/000840249.pdf. Accessed 10 January, 2022.

27. Lopez Bernal J, Andrews N, Gower C, et al. Effectiveness of Covid-19 Vaccines against the B.1.617.2 (Delta) Variant. N Engl J Med, 2021; 385:585-594.

28. Nasreen S, Chung H, He S, et al. Effectiveness of mRNA and ChAdOx1 COVID-19 vaccines against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infection and severe outcomes with variants of concern in Ontario. medRxiv 2021.06.28.21259420 [Preprint]. September 30, 2021 [cited 2022 Jan 10]. Available from: https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.06.28.21259420v3

29. Goldberg Y, Mandel M, Bar-On YM, et al. Waning Immunity after the BNT162b2 Vaccine in Israel. N Engl J Med, 2021; 385:e85.

30. Israel’s Ministry of Health. COVID-19 vaccine effectiveness against the Delta variant. Israel’s Ministry of Health report 2021. Available at: https://www.gov.il/BlobFolder/reports/vaccine-efficacy-safety-follow-up-committee/he/files_publications_corona_two-dose-vaccination-data.pdf. Accessed 13
31. Puranik A, Lenehan PJ, Silvert E, et al. Comparison of two highly-effective mRNA vaccines for COVID-19 during periods of Alpha and Delta variant prevalence. medRxiv 2021.08.06.21261707 [Preprint]. August 21, 2021 [cited 2022 Jan 10]. Available from: https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.08.06.21261707v3

32. Tang P, Hasan MR, Chemaitelly H, et al. BNT162b2 and mRNA-1273 COVID-19 vaccine effectiveness against the SARS-CoV-2 Delta variant in Qatar. Nat Med, 2021; 27: 2136-2143.

33. Our World in Data (Oxford University). Coronavirus (COVID-19) Vaccinations. Available at: https://ourworldindata.org/covid-vaccinations. Accessed 13 December, 2021.

34. Tartof SY, Slezak JM, Fischer H, et al. Effectiveness of mRNA BNT162b2 COVID-19 vaccine up to 6 months in a large integrated health system in the USA: a retrospective cohort study. The Lancet, 2021; 398: 1407-16.

35. Chemaitelly H, Tang P, Hasan MR, et al. Waning of BNT162b2 Vaccine Protection against SARS-CoV-2 Infection in Qatar. N Engl J Med, 2021; 385:e83.

36. Brockman MA, Mwimanzi F, Lapointe HR, et al. Reduced magnitude and durability of humoral immune responses to COVID-19 mRNA vaccines among older adults. J Infect Dis, 2021:jiab592. doi: 10.1093/infdis/jiab592. Epub ahead of print.

37. Schwarz T, Tober-Lau P, Hillus D, et al. Delayed Antibody and T-Cell Response to BNT162b2 Vaccination in the Elderly, Germany. Emerg Infect Dis, 2021; 27: 2174-8.

38. Walsh EE, Frenck RW, Jr., Falsey AR, et al. Safety and Immunogenicity of Two RNA-Based Covid-19 Vaccine Candidates. N Engl J Med, 2020; 383: 2439-50.

39. Andrews N, Tessier E, Stowe J, et al. Vaccine effectiveness and duration of protection of Comirnaty, Vaxzevria and Spikevax against mild and severe COVID-19 in the UK. medRxiv 2021.09.15.21263583 [Preprint]. September 21, 2021 [cited 2022 Jan 10]. Available from: https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.09.15.21263583v1
Figure 1. Patients aged ≥16 years were enrolled in this study who had signs or symptoms compatible with COVID-19 (specifically, one or more of the following: fever (≥37.5°C), cough, fatigue, shortness of breath, myalgia, sore throat, nasal congestion, headache, taste disorder, or olfactory dysfunction) and were tested for SARS-CoV-2 in a medical institute in Japan between July 1, 2021 and September 30, 2021. Abbreviations: COVID-19, coronavirus disease 2019; SARS-CoV-2, severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2.
### Figure 2.
Figure 2. Vaccine effectiveness of messenger RNA COVID-19 vaccines against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections among individuals aged 16 to 64 years and aged ≥65 years, VERSUS study, Japan, July 1–September 30, 2021. The analysis included test-positive cases who had signs or symptoms comparable with COVID-19 and tested positive for SARS-CoV-2, and test-negative controls who had signs or symptoms comparable with COVID-19 and were tested negative for SARS-CoV-2. Vaccine effectiveness were adjusted for age, sex, presence of underlying medical conditions, calendar week, history of contact with COVID-19 patients, and study site. Vaccination status was classified into three statuses based on the number of vaccine doses received before symptom onset and the number of days between the last vaccination date and symptom onset; no vaccination where individuals had received no vaccine dose before symptom onset; partial vaccination where individuals received one dose ≥14 days before symptom onset; and full vaccination where individuals who received two doses ≥14 days before symptom onset. Abbreviations: VE, vaccine effectiveness; COVID-19, coronavirus disease 2019; SARS-CoV-2, severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2; VERSUS, Vaccine Effectiveness Real-time Surveillance for SARS-CoV-2.

| Vaccination History | No. test-positive case /total no. (%) | Adjusted VE% (95%CI) |
|---------------------|--------------------------------------|----------------------|
| **Aged 16–64 years** |                                      |                      |
| BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273 |                                      |                      |
| No vaccination     | 275/717 (36.4)                      | Reference            |
| Partial vaccination| 13/68 (19.1)                        | 54.3% (8.4%, 77.2%)  |
| Full vaccination   | 14/253 (5.5)                        | 88.7% (78.8%, 93.9%) |
| BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273 |                                      |                      |
| No vaccination     | 275/717 (38.4)                      | Reference            |
| Full vaccination (one to three months) | 7/180 (3.9) | 91.8% (80.3%, 96.6%) |
| Full vaccination (four to six months)  | 4/66 (7.1) | 86.4% (56.9%, 95.7%) |
| BNT162b2           |                                      |                      |
| No vaccination     | 275/717 (38.4)                      | Reference            |
| Partial vaccination| 4/32 (12.5)                         | 67.5% (-4.6%, 99.9%) |
| Full vaccination   | 11/182 (6.0)                        | 86.7% (73.5%, 93.3%) |
| mRNA-1273          |                                      |                      |
| No vaccination     | 275/717 (36.4)                      | Reference            |
| Partial vaccination| 3/25 (12.0)                         | 80.8% (28.5%, 94.9%) |
| Full vaccination   | 2/54 (3.7)                          | 96.6% (72.8%, 98.6%) |
| **Aged ≥65 years** |                                      |                      |
| BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273 |                                      |                      |
| No vaccination     | 15/96 (15.6)                        | Reference            |
| Full vaccination   | 12/370 (3.2)                        | 90.3% (73.6%, 96.4%) |
| BNT162b2           |                                      |                      |
| No vaccination     | 15/96 (15.6)                        | Reference            |
| Full vaccination   | 10/289 (3.7)                        | 85.8% (59.4%, 98.0%) |
### Subgroup

#### Aged 16–64 years

| Sex   | No test-positive case /total no. (%) | Adjusted VE% (95%CI) |
|-------|------------------------------------|---------------------|
| **Men** |                                    |                     |
| No vaccination | 181/426 (42.5) | Reference           |
| Full vaccination | 9/108 (8.3) | 83.5% (62.3%, 92.8%) |
| **Women** |                                    |                     |
| No vaccination | 94/291 (32.3) | Reference           |
| Full vaccination | 5/145 (3.4) | 92.9% (81.0%, 97.4%) |
| **Underlying medical conditions** | |                     |
| With underlying medical conditions | |                     |
| No vaccination | 32/114 (28.1) | 90.6% (56.0%, 98.0%) |
| Full vaccination | 2/60 (3.3) |                   |
| Without underlying medical conditions | |                     |
| No vaccination | 234/587 (39.9) | Reference          |
| Full vaccination | 11/189 (5.8) | 88.9% (77.5%, 94.6%) |

#### Aged ≥65 years

| Sex   | No test-positive case /total no. (%) | Adjusted VE% (95%CI) |
|-------|------------------------------------|---------------------|
| **Men** |                                    |                     |
| No vaccination | 8/42 (19.0) | Reference           |
| Full vaccination | 6/194 (3.1) | 94.1% (72.5%, 98.8%) |
| **Women** |                                    |                     |
| No vaccination | 7/54 (13.0) | Reference           |
| Full vaccination | 6/176 (3.4) | 88.7% (49.2%, 97.5%) |
| **Underlying medical conditions** | |                     |
| With underlying medical conditions | |                     |
| No vaccination | 7/60 (11.7) | Reference           |
| Full vaccination | 4/224 (1.8) | 90.7% (58.1%, 97.9%) |
| Without underlying medical conditions | |                     |
| No vaccination | 8/36 (22.2) | Reference           |
| Full vaccination | 8/145 (5.5) | 94.9% (74.2%, 99.0%) |

**Figure 3.** Vaccine effectiveness of messenger RNA COVID-19 vaccines against symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infections by subgroups among individuals aged 16 to 64 years and aged ≥65 years, VERSUS study, Japan, July 1–September 30, 2021. The analysis included test-positive cases who had signs or symptoms comparable with COVID-19 and tested positive for SARS-CoV-2, and test-negative controls who had signs or symptoms comparable with COVID-19 and tested negative for SARS-CoV-2. Vaccine effectiveness was adjusted for age, sex, presence of underlying medical conditions, calendar week, history of contact with COVID-19.
patients, and study site. Vaccination status was classified into three statuses based on the number of vaccine doses received before symptom onset and the number of days between the last vaccination date and symptom onset; no vaccination where individuals had received no vaccine dose before symptom onset; partial vaccination where individuals received one dose \( \geq 14 \) days before symptom onset; and full vaccination where individuals who received two doses \( \geq 14 \) days before symptom onset. Underlying medical conditions included chronic heart disease, chronic respiratory disease, obesity (body mass index \( \geq 30 \text{kg/m}^2 \)), malignancy (including solid or haematological malignancy), diabetes, chronic kidney disease, receiving dialysis, liver cirrhosis, use of immunosuppressive medicines, or pregnancy. Abbreviations: VE, vaccine effectiveness; COVID-19, coronavirus disease 2019; SARS-CoV-2, severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2; VERSUS, Vaccine Effectiveness Real-time Surveillance for SARS-CoV-2.
Table 1: Demographics and characteristics of test-positive cases and test-negative controls:

VERSUS study, Japan, July 1 to September 30, 2021

|                           | Total (n=1936) | Test-positive case (n=396) | Test-negative control (n=1540) |
|---------------------------|---------------|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Median age (IQR), year    | 49 (30–72)    | 35 (26–50)                | 55 (32–76)                    |
| Age category in years, no. (%) |              |                           |                               |
| 16–29                     | 475 (24.5)    | 148 (37.4)                | 327 (21.2)                    |
| 30–39                     | 278 (14.4)    | 78 (19.7)                 | 200 (13.0)                    |
| 40–49                     | 239 (12.4)    | 68 (17.2)                 | 171 (11.1)                    |
| 50–59                     | 201 (10.4)    | 64 (16.2)                 | 137 (8.9)                     |
| 60–69                     | 195 (10.1)    | 12 (3.0)                  | 183 (11.9)                    |
| 70–79                     | 220 (11.4)    | 12 (3.0)                  | 208 (13.5)                    |
| 80–89                     | 242 (12.5)    | 11 (2.8)                  | 231 (15.0)                    |
| ≥90                       | 86 (4.4)      | 3 (0.8)                   | 83 (5.4)                      |
| Male sex, no. (%)         | 1033 (53.4)   | 246 (62.1)                | 787 (51.1)                    |
| Living at home, no. (%)   | 1767 (91.3)   | 385 (97.2)                | 1382 (89.7)                   |
| Living at a long-term care facility, no. (%) | 121 (6.3)     | 1 (0.3)                   | 120 (7.8)                     |
| Underlying medical conditions, no. (%) |            |                           |                               |
| Any                       | 659 (34.0)    | 71 (17.9)                 | 588 (38.2)                    |
| Chronic cardiovascular disease | 166 (8.6)   | 13 (3.3)                  | 153 (9.9)                     |
| Chronic respiratory disease | 182 (9.4)  | 11 (2.8)                  | 171 (11.1)                    |
| Obesity                   | 92 (4.7)      | 24 (6.1)                  | 68 (4.4)                      |
| Malignancy                | 148 (7.6)     | 8 (2.0)                   | 140 (9.1)                     |
| Diabetes mellitus         | 181 (9.3)     | 20 (5.1)                  | 161 (10.4)                    |
| Chronic kidney disease    | 76 (3.9)      | 3 (0.8)                   | 73 (4.7)                      |
| Dialysis                  | 21 (1.1)      | 1 (0.3)                   | 20 (1.3)                      |
| Liver cirrhosis           | 6 (0.3)       | 0                         | 6 (0.4)                       |
| Immunocompromising therapy | 46 (2.4)     | 4 (1.0)                   | 43 (2.7)                      |
| Pregnancy                 | 5 (0.3)       | 2 (0.5)                   | 3 (0.2)                       |
| Smoking history, no. (%)  | 624 (32.2)    | 143 (36.1)                | 481 (31.2)                    |
| Healthcare workers, no. (%) | 108 (5.6)   | 7 (1.8)                   | 101 (6.6)                     |
| History of contact with a COVID-19 patient, no. (%) | 217 (11.2) | 131 (33.1) | 86 (5.6) |
| COVID-19 vaccination statusa, no. (%) |            |                           |                               |
| Vaccination status | Unvaccinated | First vaccine dose within 0–13 days | Partially vaccinated | Second vaccine doses within 0–13 days | Fully vaccinated | (second vaccine doses after ≥14 days) | Unknown vaccination status |
|--------------------|-----------|-----------------|----------------|-----------------|----------------|----------------------------|--------------------------|
|                    | 813 (42.0) | 290 (73.2) | 523 (34.0) | 125 (6.4) | 29 (7.3) | 96 (6.2) | 102 (5.3) | 13 (3.3) | 89 (5.8) | 623 (32.2) | 26 (6.6) | 597 (38.8) | 152 (7.9) | 36 (9.1) | 116 (7.5) |

Among vaccinated patients, vaccine product received, no (%)

| Vaccine product | BNT162b2 | mRNA-1273 | Unknown |
|----------------|----------|-----------|---------|
| Unvaccinated   | 676 (69.6) | 634 (71.4) | 634 (71.4) |
| BNT162b2       | 42 (60.0) | 126 (14.2) | 141 (15.9) |
| mRNA-1273      | 140 (14.4) | 126 (14.2) | 141 (15.9) |
| Unknown        | 155 (16.0) | 141 (15.9) | 141 (15.9) |

Among fully vaccinated patients with documented vaccination date, months after full vaccination, no (%)

| Time after vaccination | One to three months | Four to six months |
|------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|
| BNT162b2               | 458 (86.9)           | 49 (87.1)          |
| mRNA-1273              | 19 (82.6)            | 4 (17.4)           |
| Unknown                | 69 (13.1)            | 65 (12.9)          |

Abbreviations: SARS-CoV-2, severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2; VERSUS, Vaccine Effectiveness Real-time Surveillance for SARS-CoV-2; IQR, interquartile range; COVID-19, coronavirus disease 2019.

aVaccination status was classified based on the number of COVID-19 vaccine doses received before symptom onset. Unvaccinated individuals received no COVID-19 vaccine dose before symptom onset. Partially vaccinated individuals received one dose of COVID-19 vaccine ≥14 days before symptom onset. Fully vaccinated individuals received two doses of COVID-19 vaccines ≥14 days before symptom onset.

bExcluded those with no information of vaccination date: three test-positive cases and 93 test-negative controls were excluded.