Contribution of the Wild Food Plants in the Food System of Tribal Belt of Pakistan; The Pak - Afghan Border Region
Abdullah and Shujaul Mulk Khan*

Department of Plant Sciences, Quaid-i-Azam University Islamabad
* Correspondence: shujaqau@gmail.com

Abstract: The tribal belt of Pakistan-the Pak-Afghan border region is famous for its unique culture, ethnography and wild food plants and traditional knowledge. People of these regions gather wild plants for number of purposes including plants or plant parts for direct use, use it in the traditional cuisines and selling in local markets. However, there is huge lack of documentation of food system particularly the Wild Food Plants (WFPs). In current study we have focused on the uses and contributions of the WFPs in the tribal traditional food system. The ethnobotanical data were gathered through questionnaire surveys with Eighty-four informants 69 men and 15 women belonging to 21 different villages. We documented Sixty-three WFP species belonging to 34 botanical families, of which 27 were used as vegetables, 24 as fruits, 6 in different kinds of chutneys (starters) formation and six as fresh food species. Fruits were the mostly used part (40%) followed by leaves (24%), aerial parts (24%), seeds (7%), stem (3%), legume (2%) and young inflorescence (1%). Use of Carthamus oxycanthus & Pinus roxburghii seeds and Marsillea quadrifolia leaves were the novel reports for the gastronomy of Pakistan. The results elucidate that WFPs have a significant contribution in the Tribal Food Systems. Tribal people use WFPs not only due to their nutritional importance but also as a cultural practice - an inseparable component of the tribal communities. This important traditional Knowledge about the consumption of WFPs has been eroding with an alarming speed among the younger generations due to introduction of fast food chains, modernization, and globalization. Therefore, appropriates strategies are imperative not only to safeguard traditional knowledge but also the cultural heritage, food security and hence public healthcare via food supplement in the region.

Keywords: gastronomy; livelihood; public healthcare; traditional knowledge; wild food plants; tribal belt
1. Introduction

Wild Food Plants (WFPs) have a crucial role in the food system since the beginning of human civilization [1]. Wild food plants refer to the plant species that are gathered or harvested by indigenous communities from their surrounding ecosystem and used in the human food system [2]. Ecosystems in the tribal belt is varied and comprise fields, forests and pastures; give rise to variety of wild fruits and vegetables [3]. These WFPs are not only important from nutritional point of view but also have important medicinal values [4,5] some of which have been evaluated for its pharmacological screening in many other parts of the world [5-7]. In current era, number of WFPs are being identified as “functional foods”. They provide healthy diets and could contribute in prevention of some of the major ailments [8,9]. It is also confirmed by researchers that most of them are rich source of bioactive compounds such as essential Fatty Acids, Vitamins and complex sugars [9-11] and can contribute significantly in the mitigation of malnutrition [3]. Its importance is crucially emphasized in income generation, poverty reduction, nutritional balance, ensuring food security and agricultural diversification by number of studies [12,13]. One of the major contribution of WFPs is in food security that also offer alternate source and diversity in the food system of traditional communities [14]. They play a crucial role in human survival during famine [15] and food shortages such as during COVID-19 pandemic crisis, Geopolitical and Tribal Wars of Pakistan especially in these border regions.

Pakistan is the 6th most populous and lower middle-income country in the world [16] gifted with four seasons and great diversity of natural resources [17] but still ranked top 11th developing country facing the issues of food security [18]. According to research [16] about 60 % people of the country are insecure in terms of food. Food insecurities increase in the tribal belt of the country due to conflicts and prevailing dry climate. Pak Afghan border has always been center of tension due to its geopolitical position. Manmade catastrophes, dramatic increase in the human population, least access to food, local livelihood strategies and severe climate are the other major reasons of food insecurities and poverty in the tribal belt [19]. WFPs are one of the important sources for local poor communities that can help them to get rid of hunger and malnutrition. A very little work has been done on the wild vegetables and fruits species used in the food system of Pakistan in general and Pak-Afghan border regions in particular that can be seen in few of the studies referred here.
Tribal culture

People of the region practice and enjoy a centuries old culture known as Pashtunwali or Pukhtunwali. Pashtunwali is very common cultural heritage of the tribal communities living along the Pak-Afghan border. It is a way of their life or legal social code of conduct that governs their life. According to [28] it is a 2000-3000 BC old tradition remains the central pillar of tribal societies. In this era of modernization Pashtunwali perceived as culturally idiosyncratic that significantly influence the perceptions, behaviors and thoughts in the daily life [29,30]. Code of honor (Nang) Hospitality (Melmastia) and revenge (Badal) are the three core pillars of Pashtunwali [31]. Code of honor or self-respect and dignity is a basic nature and character of Pashtun society. Melmastia is a sum of conventions and an immediate reward from the local societies regarding local cultural values while Badal in Pashtun society is just like a debt which ends on the revenge. These three cultural customs are the sum of the tribal communal expectations from the members of their own societies and as well as from outsider members [32]. The tribal belt of Pakistan - Areas of Pak-Afghan border is also well known for its unique traditional food system but up to date has not been explored by researchers in terms to document the precious traditional knowledge about the WFPs. Bajaur area is the most populous, climatically varied and ethnographically rich in the tribal belt depicts the culture and traditional knowledge of the whole Pak-Afghan border and hence been selected for current studies. It is region of relatively dry valleys in the Hindu Kush Mountain Ranges. As for as food system in the tribal belt especially the area under discussion is concerned, it’s worth to mention that people are poor and most of the time utilize local food resources using their traditional knowledge. There is a negligible trend of hoteling an eating outside in the restaurants or other food points. It strengthens the ties of people with wild food resources including WFPs. Climate being one of the main drivers affecting all walks of life including wild food and food systems, bring considerable variations in different units/Tehsil of the studied area i.e Barang in the South, Nawagai and Chamrkand in the South west, Mamund, Salarzai and Utmankehl tehsils in the North and North east. The local communities collect wild vegetables and fruits from the side valleys, mountains and cultivated fields mostly during the collection seasons of the year. They know the best and suitable gathering seasons of wild vegetables using Traditional Ecological Knowledge (TEK). The women usually cook them on the traditional tribal styles. The demand of wild vegetables and fruits increases in various seasons when the cultivated fruits and vegetables are not available. Keep in mind the importance of WFPs in the food system of the tribal communities of the tribal regions current study was designed to (1) document WFPs diversity gathered and consumed by tribal communities (2) assess traditional knowledge about WFPs, their role and contribution in the nutrition as well as traditional tribal food system.

2. Methodology

2.2. Study area

District Bajaur is a tribal area remained part of Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) up to 2018. The tribal areas of Pakistan form a long narrow belt along the historical border Durand line (Pak-Afghan border) - named after Sir Mortimor Durand in 1890-1894 who surveyed and established this borderline between Afghanistan and British India. Ex-FATA comprised of six Frontier Regions (FR), i.e., Kohat, Bannu, Tank, Dera Ismaiel Khan, Peshawar and Lakki Marwat and seven agencies namely Bajaur, Mohmand, Khyber, Orakzai, Kurram, North Waziristan and South Waziristan. According to researchers [33] the British in the mid of 19th century faced with difficulties and challenges in tax collection and effective control over the tribal belt and thus devised a legal and administrative systems known as Criminal Tribes Act - 1871. The law was “designed “for the registration, surveillance and control of certain tribes” [34] that was later on enacted under the name of Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR). It remained effective in the tribal belt

[14,17,20-26]. Abbasi et al., [27] book on the ethnobotanical and nutraceutical aspects of the Wild Edible Vegetables of the Lesser Himalayas is one of the major contribution in this regard.
till 2018. Government of Pakistan in 2018 merged the whole tribal belt of FATA in the mainstream of province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa with a hope to bring harmony and development in accordance with the constitution of Pakistan. The area selected for current study is a mountainous territory with 1296 Km² area situated in the North western border of Pakistan and can be located at 34-51°N latitude and 71-31°E longitudes [35]. It shared 52 Km long border with Afghanistan west of Panjkora River hosting three important passes i.e., Nawa Pass, Ghashki Pass and Letaisar [36]. These three passes play a significant role in the trade and sharing of traditional knowledge between both the countries. The research area is mainly inhabited by Utmankhel and Tarkanri tribes. The Utmankhel tribe lies in the South East bordering the districts of Malakand while the Tarkanri tribe lies in the Northwest on the Pak-Afghan border speak different dialects of Pashto. The Utmankhel tribe divides into sub-tribes of Alizai, Shamozai, Aseel, Gharshamozaiz and Mandal. The Tarkanri tribe comprised sub-tribes Mamund, Salarzai, Safi, Khalji and other sub-ethnic groups lives in the Ex-state of Khar [37]. According to [38] the Utmankhels are the descendants of Kirlan tribe of Waziristan who migrated to the to the valleys of Arang and Barang in Bajaur during 12th century. On the other hand, Tarkanri peoples are the descendants of Afghani Pashtuns. Before 9/11 people of both areas used to visit both the countries easily for various purposes. In short there is great impact of Afghan culture on the Tarkanri people. Most of the people live in rural parts of the area (Figure 1).

The district is gifted with number of other natural resources such as Nawagai, Inzaray, Arang, Barang and especially K-More mountain host different kinds of marble stones and many other minerals as well. Local communities involve in the extraction of marble, limestone, manganese, chromite and talc etc. Geographically, the study area lies in the extreme end of the Hindukush mountain range which creates considerable disparity and uncertainty in the pattern of monsoon rains from year to year. Climate of the district varies from extreme hot to bitter cold while travelling from the South-east to North-west. Weather remains pleasant, for most of the summer but the temperature drops below freezing during winter. The area receives about 800 mm of annual rainfall. Variation in the climatic conditions of the area leads to significant diversity of plants and hence WFPs. People are mostly farmers, few others are teachers, drivers, cobblers, businesses men etc by profession. A considerable number of local peoples work in other parts of the country or abroad and obtain remittances for their livelihood.
2.3. Data Collection

In the current study 21 different villages were selected for interviews and gathering data on WFPs (Table 1). Two visits were made for this purpose from March 2016 till November. Interviews were conducted following the International Society of Ethnobiology Code of Ethics and the American Anthropological Association Code of Ethics [39]. Knowledgeable informants were selected through Snowball sampling methods [40-42]. A total of Eighty-four informants in total were interviewed (four from each village) including 69 men and 15 women (Table 2). The informant ages ranged from 17-85 years (Table 2) who were interviewed in Pashto language. Participants were asked about local names, part used, collection time, recipes and mode of utilization, use in other cuisines, sale or marketing of the WFPs species they gathered and still gathering [42]. The first author belongs to study area and has family ties with few of the villages studied. It helped a lot in gathering data about uses of WFPs and selection of the informants.

The interviewees were asked about the settlement they live in, age, place of birth and occupation. They were further asked (1) what wild vegetables species they collect? (2) what wild fruits species they collect and use for? (3) What species they use is Sauce, Salad or chutney (4) What WFPs they use as raw food (5) what wild herbal drinks they take? (6) what wild edible seeds they collect and use? (7) Do you collected or still collecting WFPs for marketing purposes? (8) How frequently you use the plant in a season? (9) What is the name of WFPs in your language? (10) Which part you use (11) What recipes you prepare? (12) Which one is the best season of collection? (13) What traditional dish has this WFPs? If not now, have they such experiences in the past please mention? All the data based on those questions were arranged in the tabulated form (Table 3). After interviewing 4 people in each village a short field survey along with the interviewees were arranged to collect the available WFPs.

Collected plants specimens were identified with the help of the Flora of Pakistan [43], Wild plants of the Swat Valley [44] and finally plants names were cross checked against the Plant List database (2019) [45]. Plants uses were also compared for comparison and authentication purposes with previous studies of [14,17,20-27,44].

Table 1. Geographical position of the studied 21 villages in 7 Tehsils of the studied area.

| S No | Tehsil Name | Population | Tribes | Studied Villages | Longitude N | Latitude | Altitude (meter) |
|------|-------------|------------|--------|-----------------|-------------|----------|-----------------|
| 1    | Utmankhel   | 107,356    | Shamoza| Arang Bagh       | 34 42 49.42 N | 71 39 13.01 E | 1005            |
|      |             |            |        | Taheed Abad     | 34 43 21.73 N | 71 41 38.56 E | 1156            |
|      |             |            |        | Ghazi Baba      | 34 43 39.08 N | 71 39 57.31 E | 941             |
| 2    | Barang      | 76,558     | Aseel  | Kamal Dara      | 34 38 02.82 N | 71 36 17.07 E | 906             |
|      |             |            |        | Nazar Mina      | 34 40 07.65 N | 71 36 02.20 E | 1013            |
|      |             |            |        | Targhao         | 34 37 47.60 N | 71 42 07.79 E | 688             |
| 3    | Khar        | 247,510    | Alizai, Mamund & Salarzai | Batai | 34 42 23.92 N | 71 35 32.97 E | 994             |
|      |             |            |        | Shinkey         | 34 42 56.00 N | 71 34 00.74 E | 931             |
|      |             |            |        | Saramina        | 34 41 46.70 N | 71 32 26.70 E | 963             |
| 4    | Salarzai    | 268,517    | Salarzai & Mashwani | Dara | 34 48 55.51 N | 71 30 50.10 E | 964             |
|      |             |            |        | Gabar Cheena    | 34 54 52.93 N | 71 30 10.15 E | 1276            |
|      |             |            |        | Tofan Shah      | 34 53 05.17 N | 71 31 36.50 E | 993             |
| 5    | Chamarkand  | 2,868      | Sahibzad, Molan | Karkani | 34 44 45.15 N | 71 18 46.86 E | 1161            |
|      |             |            |        | Kotkai          | 34 43 21.57 N | 71 20 53.18 E | 1060            |
|      |             |            |        | Lar Chamarkan   | 34 41 12.54 N | 71 12 45.37 E | 1057            |
| 6    | Nawagai     | 79,002     | Safis & Miangan | Nawagai | 34 40 07.88 N | 71 17 02.82 E | 959             |
|      |             |            |        | Srogato Miangan | 34 40 32.89 N | 71 17 48.55 E | 1004            |
|      |             |            |        | Khanano kalay   | 34 39 45.39 N | 71 17 39.80 E | 1032            |
| 7    | Mamund      | 311,873    | Mamun & Wara   | Barkhalozio     | 34 51 14.67 N | 71 25 41.36 E | 1185            |
|      |             |            |        | Umarai          | 34 45 58.62 N | 71 26 13.95 E | 955             |
| Age groups | No. of informants | Percentage | Literacy level | No. of informants | Percentage |
|------------|-------------------|------------|----------------|-------------------|------------|
| 17-27      | 7                 | 8.33       | Illiterate     | 39                | 46.43      |
| 28-37      | 9                 | 10.71      | Primary        | 21                | 25         |
| 38-47      | 16                | 19.05      | Middle         | 13                | 15.48      |
| 48-57      | 15                | 17.86      | Secondary      | 7                 | 8.33       |
| 58-67      | 13                | 15.48      | University     | 4                 | 4.76       |
| 68-77      | 15                | 17.86      |                |                   |            |
| 78-85      | 9                 | 10.71      |                |                   |            |

2.3. Data Analysis

Classification of WFPs into various food categories

All WFPs were grouped into different food categories based on the consumption mode following [3]. Those plants species cooked as food were categorized as vegetables for example Caralluma tuberculata, Malva neglecta, Digeria muricata etc. Species which were consumed without cooking were classified in the category of fruits dry or fresh i.e. Ficus carica, Morus alba, Celtis caucasica. Sauce, Salad or chutney species use while mixed with spices and salts for example Mentha longifolia, Mentha royleana, Zanthoxylum armatum etc. Salvia moorcraftiana, Saccharum bengalensis and Silene conoidea were considered as raw food species. Those whose parts were being consumed in raw form other than fruits without cooking.

Relative frequency citation (RFC)

WFPs related data, collected during questionnaire survey were also analyzed qualitatively via Relative Frequency Citation Index to highlight the local significance of each WFP species in the region following [5,46].

\[ RFC = \frac{FC}{N} \ (0 < RFC < 1) \]

where FC denotes the number of informants mentioning a specific WFP species, while N shows the total number of informants interviewed during the survey.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Tribal Food System and WFPs

Tribal people have a unique and simple food system mainly established on WFPs, dairy products and cereal crops they cultivate in their fields. Almost each family in the study area rare domestic animals (sheep, goat, cow or buffalo) to fulfil their dairy requirements [47]. They customarily collect WFPs, while grazing their animals. They usually have a piece of land where they cultivate local vegetables and crops. They prepare and consume various kinds of cultural foods from these entire three main above-mentioned sources. Some of the famous simple foods of this belt include the Jawaro Neeny (roasted corn seeds), the Ghanamo Neeny (wheat grains are roasted and then a little brown sugar is added to form small balls), Dhal (grounded wheat grains are boiled with brown sugar and cow oil), Gongrhi (wheat grains are boiled and then used as food) Shedano rotay (wheat flour mixed with cow oil and Carthamus oxyacanthus seeds and a bread is formed in Tandoor) and Kakori (wheat flour mixed with peanuts, resins, walnuts, coconut and sugar and a special type of bread is formed). Kakori is prepared mostly when the infants start walking for first time. Ghunzakhi (wheat flour mixed with vegetable oil, sugar and Cuminum cyminum seeds) it is a special type of sweet prepared and gifted mostly to women when they go to in law house from mother house. The old tribal people cook lentils and pulses on a unique traditional
tribal style, when the dish become prepared a cup or more of cow oils are added. This dish is offered on special cultural gatherings and customs. Ashar is one among such cultural gatherings and customs. Ashar is centuries-old tradition of Pakhtuns in which members of local communities gather to help each other's during their work without consideration of return, monetary or any other favor. Unfortunately, in recent era this important cultural heritage is on the verge of extinction due to urbanization, modernization and globalization. These traditional foods are considered an important figure and significantly contributes to the tribal food system. Tribal people of the study area living in valleys or across piedmonts collect WFPs to fulfill their food requirements. They are wholly or partially dependent on WFPs resources.

Data on WFPs, i.e. botanical name, local name, family, used parts, habit, mode of utilization, marketing, use reports, relative frequency of citation and the previous literature that reported the uses were gathered via questionnaire as well as literature survey. Sixty-three folk taxa belong to thirty-four botanical families were recorded to signify the current WFPs heritage. This great diversity of WFPs reflects the rich panorama of the tribal food system. A high proportion of these WFPs belongs to the family Amaranthaceae and Leguminosae with five species each followed by Rhamnaceae, Rosaceae, Lamiaceae and Polygonaceae each with four species while the Brassicaceae and Moraceae was represented by 3 species each. The most dominant WFP categories include vegetables (27 species), fruits (24 species), chutney or saucees (7 species) and Raw food species with contribution of six species. The vegetable category mainly composed of weeds locally called Gayyah (unwanted plants species occurs in or along crop fields). The traditional communities gather these species for their own as well as animal food purposes.

3.2. Traditional knowledge related to gathering WFPs

WFPs were reported to gather from diverse localities i.e. agricultural fields, foothills and forests. Plants diversity and availability varies with seasonal variations. Local people possess traditional knowledge WFPs their seasonal availability and time of collection [48]. Spring (March-May,) and summer (June-October) are the peak seasons of WFPs' collection in the region. November-February are the cold months with the absence of the most of WFPs [22] with cold temperature. Leaves and Pot herb grow well in the months of April and August while best season for fruits ranges from June-October. Different vegetable species mostly remains available for 2-9 months whereas certain fruit species such as Sideroxylon mascatensis, Punica granatum, Vitis Jacquemontiana, Morus, Ficus and Ziziphus species availability recorded for fewer months.

The shepherd communities in search of grasses and fodder for their cattle migrate from one region to another in a cyclic manner. They graze their sheep, goat and cows on hills and mountains and also collect WFPs for their own dietary needs. They are totally or partially dependent on WFPs and homemade dairy products.

One of the old aged participants (81 years old man) belongs to Alizai tribe (Utmankhel) mentioned his views about the role of WFPs in the food system of shepherds and grass collectors with these words “In our times when we used to visit mountains for cattle grazing, grasses and fuel wood collection, and feel hunger, we have to eat Mentha longifolia and Rumex hastatus leaves with green chilies, onions, tomatoes and Zanthoxylum armatum seeds with wheat or barley bread. We grind these over the big stony rocks with the help of small round stones along stream or springs. We were using Oxalis corniculata alternate to Rumex hastatus leaves sometimes. Some people used to eat brown sugar with wheat or barley bread”. In current era this trend of eating WFPs has decreased due to modernized, globalized, and urbanized cultures.

3.3. WFPs and the use of its different parts in Traditional cuisines

Our findings showed that fruit are on the top in terms of contribution of the part used that contributed 40% followed by leaves - 24%, aerial parts - 24%, seeds - 4%, stem - 3%, young inflorescence - 2% and legumes - 1% of the total species (Figure 2). The use of various parts varies from species to species and area to area within the region. Leaves and aerial parts are mostly used as vegetables, sauce or as fresh form while the fruits are mostly taken as fresh form. Habit wise,
recorded WFPs are categorized as 57% herb, 22% tree, 19% shrub and 2% climber species.

![Diagram showing the contribution in terms of WFPs' parts used in the Tribal Food System.](image)

**Figure 2.** Contribution in terms of WFPs’ parts used in the Tribal Food System.

### 3.3.1. Vegetable species

During questionnaires survey local people were asked (1) what wild vegetables species they collect? In response to our question interviewees mentioned 27 species as vegetables throughout the studied villages. According to use reports the most cited and used vegetable species were *Nasturtium officinale* (47), *Oxalis corniculata* (44), *Trifolium repense* (44), *Solanum villosum* (37), *Digera muricata* (31), *Portulaca quadrijeta* (29), *Malva neglecta* (28), *Vicia sativa* (27), *Cichorium intybus* (21) and *Caralluma tuberculata* (19). *Nasturtium officinale* locally called as Termera is the top used vegetable species in the region and considered as digestive. The species is collected by local communities along the water bodies such as streams, springs, ponds and lakes in the months of March to November. It has been preferred for its unique taste and availability. *Oxalis corniculata* is the most easily available species grown in the shade of other plants or in humid places in the months of March to December. The vast availability, long season and special taste make it one of the most consumed vegetable species. *Trifolium repense* is semi domesticated species grows along water bodies. Its vegetable is consumed widely throughout the region. Chokanr one of the traditional foods formed of this vegetable by its leaves with rice. It is a very popular dish in the whole belt. *Solanum villosum, Solanum americanum, Descurainia sophia* and *Sisymbrium irio* leaves and young shoots are boiled in concentrated milk and offered to patients as well as older people as digestive food. Similar studies also carried out by different authors on the wild vegetables. Abbas et al [20] reported fifty-three wild vegetable species from the district Kurram. Abbasi et al [23] documented 45 wild vegetables from the Lesser Himalayas Pakistan. In comparison to our study area district Kurram and Lesser Himalayas have great diversity of vegetables because both areas receive great quantity of rainfall and suitable climatic conditions for wild species and particularly WFPs.

Aziz et al., [17] reported twenty-one vegetables used in the remote Yasin and Ishkoman valleys of Gilgit Baltistan while [21] reported 25 wild vegetable species from Northwest Pakistan. Area of Pak-Afghan border is characterized by dry and harsh climatic conditions which has great similarity to climatic conditions of Yasin and Ishkoman valley and Northwest Pakistan. Therefore, these area host low number of wild vegetable species. In another study [26] enlisted 59 wild vegetables from the district Harnai Baluchistan. The traditional communities of district Harnai used various species which have no use trend in our study area such as *Boerhavia procumbence, Erodium cicutarium,*
3.3.2. Fruit Species

Twenty-Four species are being collected from wild and consumed in fresh form by local inhabitants as Fruit. According to the number of use-reports, the most important among the wild fruit species were Ficus carica with 64 use reports, followed by Berberis lycium (58), Myrtus communis (53), Olea ferruginea (48) and Sideroxylon mascatensis (48). Ficus carica is very common species of the studied region and local people collect its fruits in morning to avoid the hot weather because its fruits come in the hottest months of June and July. Berberis lycium fruits are collected and mostly consumed as fresh, some people also make its juice as well and taken for cooling purposes. Sideroxylon mascatensis is another important fruit species of the study area. Its forests occur in the low elevation hills. People collect Sideroxylon ripen fruits in large bottles or pots to avoid pressing and maintaining its shape.

Fruit (acorn) of Quercus baloot locally known as pergay is roasted in the hearth, the exocarp is removed and the endosperm is consumed. In previous era ethnobiologists were unwilling to acknowledge the use of Quercus fruits as human food [49] but its consumption is very common in Turkey [50,51] as well as in Iberian Peninsula [49]. Mendez-Baceta et al., [49,52] mentioned that Quercus acorns in Gorbeialdea considered as a food for livestock or eaten during food scarcity. In this study we have reported that Quercus acorns are not used as staple food, but its roasting is still considered a hobby in the tribal belt and people comes from plain areas to mountains for acorns collection.

Abbasi et al., [14] recorded 35 wild fruits species used by the tribal communities of Lesser Himalaya while [25] recorded 47 species of wild fruits from Swat Valley. The Lesser Himalaya and Swat Valley host great diversity of Plants and receive maximum amount of precipitation during Monsoon compared to the studied region. The Area of Pak-Afghan border at Bajaur receive very little amount of precipitation during Monsoon. These climatic factors distinguish it in term of fruit flora from Swat and Lesser Himalaya. Ahmad and Pieroni [22] studied 31 wild fruits species from Thakhte-Sulaiman Hills, Northwest Pakistan. Thakhte - Sulaiman hills is characterized by dry and harsh climate hosting mostly bushy fruit plants such as Berberis calliobotrys, Ziziphus species Cotoneaster microphyllus, Cotoneaster minutus, Cotoneaster pruinuosus etc on the other hand [53] documented 11 wild fruit species from the district Dera Ismail Khan. Dera Ismail Khan is characterized by very harsh climatic conditions and considered hub for Phoenix dactylifera (Dhaki variety) and Nannorrhops Ritchieana specially in the Abdulkhel and Rahmani Khel areas. Area of Pak-Afghan border at Bajaur have mostly similar plant species such as Sideroxylon mascatensis, Nannorrhops Ritchieana and Ziziphus species. Therefore, we conclude that distribution, diversity and consumption of wild fruits species varies from region to region depends on its availability, climatic conditions and cultural knowledge.

3.3.3. Sauce or Chutneyes

In response to our questionnaire informants have reported only six species used in chutney formation. The custom of herbal sauce or chutney formation was not very common throughout the region. Mentha longifolia (40), Mentha royleana (34), Cuminum cyminum (21), Zanthoxylum armatum (37), Allium ampealoprasum (14), and Thymus linearis (7) are the species used in chutney or sauce formation. Interestingly, all these species are aromatic in nature and used in fresh and dried form as well. The local people shade dries these species in their respective seasons for utilization in off seasons of the year. Abbas et al., [20] documented that in district Kurram Mentha species are used as Salad while in current study we reported that the local people use it as Salad as well as in Chutney formation. Aziz et al., [17] reported that in Ishkoman and Yaseen valleys of Gilgit Baltistan Thymus linearis is used in herbal tea formation while in current study (Table 3) we have reported that it is
used as a spice. Thus, we conclude that variation in the use of WFPs in Chutney or sauce formation varies from area to area may be due to ethnography or traditional knowledge.

3.3.4. Species used as Fresh or raw form

This category was also not very common in the region. Fresh Raw food species are collected from wild and just masticated or chewed with takeout the juice and spitting out the fibers [52] for thirst quenching, appetite suppression or flavor enjoyment. Only six species such as *Saccharum benghalensis* young shoots pulp (17), *Silene conoidea* fruit (22), *Salvia moorcraftiana* young shoots (9) *Indigofera* species aerial parts (3) are consumed in the region. Among these plants species *Carthamus oxycanthus* and *Pinus roxburghii* seeds are used as food. These plants species were not described as raw food species in other studies conducted on the WFPs of Pakistan. *Silene conoidea* is described by [17,20,23] as a cooked vegetable species while in current studied region it was used as raw food species rather than cooked vegetable.

3.3.5. WFPs used in Herbal teas, drinks or decoction

*Myrtus communis*, *Mentha royleana*, *Mentha longifolia* are used in herbal tea formation or decoction. *Myrtus communis* leaves are boiled with green tea and *Mentha royleana* or *Mentha longifolia* to prepare herbal drinks. These drinks are used to treat vomiting, diarrhea, heart burning and other stomach related problems. The local people keep it in dry form in their houses for off season uses. *Berberis lycceum*, *Punica granatum* and *Morus nigra* are used in fresh drinks. Juices of *Berberis lycceum* and *Punica granatum* are considered important drinks in the area. Indigenous people use these plants for body cooling and thirst-quenching. *Berberis* fruits have very short period of availability and could be available in market hardly for 20-30 days. On the other hand, *Punica granatum* fruits are stored by local communities. They store it in grain bins and use it for few months. *Morus nigra* is very common and produce fruits in bulk amount but its juice is not common in study area. Very few informants during interviews reported its use as herbal drink. Aziz et al., [17] mentioned that *Carum carvi* seeds, *Elaeagnus angustifolia* bark and *Thymus linearis* aerial parts are used as seasoning or herbal drinks. In current research work we have reported that aerial parts of *Thymus linearis* are used as herbal spices not as herbal drinks. The other two species *Elaeagnus angustifolia* and *Carum carvi* we have not reported from study area. There is great variation in the climatic conditions and topography of Gilgit Baltistan and Areas of Pak-Afghan border at Bajaur. Gilgit Baltistan occurs in the Karakoram mountain range while Areas of Pak-Afghan border at Bajaur is a part of Hindukush mountains range, it argues that variation in topographic and climatic factor take variation in floral diversity and its traditional uses among the societies.

3.4. Cooking and Cuisines summary of WFPs

Various methods for cooking recipes WFPs were recorded during interviews with local informants. The traditional communities use WFPs on different ways. The consumption methods and knowledge of these plants they maintained from their ancestors. There are different methods used for the preparation of these wild foods depends upon the nature of plants. Wild vegetables i.e. *Amaranthus viridis*, *Amaranthus crissipus*, *Chenopodium album*, *Rumex dentatus*, *Rumex histatus*, *Malva neglecta*, *Digera muricata*, *Nasturtium officinale*, *Lathyrus aphaica*, *Vicia sativa*, *Medicago polymorpha*, *Medicago denticulate*, *Portulaca quadrifida*, *Cichorium intybus*, *Polygonum aviculare*, *Polygonum clebnum*, *Solanum villosum*, *Solanum americanum*, *Marsillia oxyacanthus*, *Silene conoidea*, *Myrtus communis*, *Mentha royleana*, *Mentha longifolia*, *Indigofera benghalensis*, *Saccharum benghalensis*, *Caralluma tuberculata*, *Descurainia sophia*, *Sisymbrium irio*. Bitter vegetables such as *Caralluma tuberculata* is cut into small pieces boiled in water 2-3 times fried in oil with onion, tomatoes, chilies and condiments. Some people cook *Caralluma* with minced meat (Keema/Qeema).
Tribal belt of Pakistan has a unique food system. WFPs are still used in different ways to increase their taste, nutritional values and health benefits. They prepare many traditional cuisines by mixing WFPs with other wild or cultivated vegetables and other foods i.e. rice, meat, chicken handi, qeema, pulses, Indian squash, potato, traditional breads, milk, yogurt, custards etc. Various other products are also prepared of these WFPs i.e. juices, syrups and jams. Carthamus oxyacanthus seeds are mixed with brown sugar and heated till a flat candy formation take place locally called as Kaboray (Caramel Candie).

Guarrera and Savo [10] discussed this tradition in a review article entitled “Wild food plants used in traditional vegetable mixtures in Italy”. Abbasi et al., [23] also mentioned that some of the vegetable species are cooked in mixture with other vegetables or in concentrated milk while working on the wild vegetables of Lesser Himalaya. Abbas et al., [20] documented that “All the seasonal wild vegetables are combined intermittently and a particular dish of seven to ten species is cooked during festivals (Nowruz) in the Shia community” while working on the wild vegetables of district Kurram. Therefore, we elucidate that consumption of WFPs especially wild vegetables in mixture form is an old tradition of human societies to increase their taste, nutritional values and health benefits.

3.5. Storage and uses of WFPs in off seasons

WFPs availability during offseason storage and drying is an important method which provide stability to food system throughout the year [22]. In study area number of species are stored by local communities in dried form for the consumption in off seasons such as aerial parts of Mentha longifolia, Mentha royleana and Punica granatum fruits. In ancient times the local people used to store the pomegranate species in grain bins (the grain bins of the old societies were formed of mud), and then they use it during the time of need. Morus alba, Sideroxylon mascalensis and Prunus armeniaca (Kakhta) fruits are dried and used in winter season of the year. Allium carollianum leaves in the month of April are collected by the traditional communities to prepare local spices or Masalas in their homes. They shade dried its leaves and then used in dried form with Curcuma longa (Korkaman), Cuminum cyminum and Punica granatum seeds. Punica granatum seeds use in spices is a custom of the traditional communities. Myrtus communis leaves and fruits are stored in homes and used in lassi and herbal tea for its enticing aroma and appetizing flavor.

3.6. Relative Frequency of Citation

In the present study, RFC values ranged from 0.01 to 0.8. The highest RFC was recorded for Ficus carica (0.8), followed by Myrtus communis (0.7), Berberis lyceum (0.7) Nasturtium officinale (0.6), Olea ferruginea (0.6) (Table 3). High RFC values of certain Wild fruit species showed their abundant use and extensive knowledge among the tribal communities. Myrtus communis and Berberis lyceum have high RFC values but both species facing conservation threats in the area. The local people have been collecting WFPs from the wild for nutritional and ethnomedicinal purposes since time immemorial. This continuous trend of gathering WFPs has caused alarming decrease in populations of certain species. On the other hand, due to cultural and religious importance of certain species such as, Ficus carica, Olea ferruginea are being respected and hence distributed abundantly in the region. Therefore, we conclude that highest use for WFPs not only depends on the abundance of the species but also on the local preferences, and its highest nutraceuticals values.

3.7. Selling or Marketing of WFPs

During questionnaire we have asked the interviewees that do you collected or still collecting WFPs for marketing purposes? In response they reported ten plants species that are available in the local markets of Bajaur i.e Khar, Pashat, Inayt Kalay, Nawagai, Memola, Chenagai and Tawheed Abad. These 10 marketable species include four wild fruits, five vegetables and one species used as flavoring agent. The fruits include Sideroxylon mascalensis, Berberis lyceum, Ziziphus sativa and Diospyrus lotus. Mentha longifolia, Mentha royleana, Carallumma tuberculate, Spinacia quadrifida and Malva neglecta are the wild vegetables species while Zanthoxylum armatum is used as flavoring agent.
in various traditional dishes. All these species are available in market in fresh form except 
*Sideroxylon mascatensis* which’s fruits is available in the market in the dried form as well during off 
seasons. Marketing of WFPs species play important role in the livelihood of the local poor people. 
Inhabitants of rural areas collect and sell WFPs in local markets for income generation. Abbasi et al., 
[23] reported that *Dryopteris ramosa*, *Bauhinia variegata*, *Chenopodium album*, *Portulaca quadridida*, 
*Nasturtium officinale*, *Malva parviflora*, and *Solanum nigrum* are sold in the markets of Rawalpindi 
and Abbottabad while we have not reported market value for any of these species. According to 
the findings of [20] wild vegetables species available in the local markets of district Kurram were 
*Caralluma tuberculata*, *Mentha spicata*, *Lepidium draba*, *Rumex dentatus*, *Portulaca oleracea*, *Malva 
eglecta*, *Trifolium repens*, *Stellaria media*, and *Nasturtium officinale*. In current study we have 
documented *Caralluma tuberculate* (Figure 3), *Malva neglecta* and *Mentha* species which is similar 
between both the study areas. *Rumex dentatus*, *Malva neglecta*, *Trifolium repens*, *Stellaria media*, and 
*Nasturtium officinale* are the species very common and used by the tribal communities as vegetable 
but we have not reported and not observed in the markets.

3.8. Management and conservation of wild Food plants

The territory has great diversity of wild fruits species. *Ficus carica*, *Ficus palmata*, *Morus alba* and 
*Morus nigra* (Figure 3) are the wild fruits species occurs in abundance across the region. Unfortunately, 
every year a huge mass of these fruits is lost. No or very little number of people dry 
and store these fruits for consumption in other seasons of the year when these fruits are not 
available. There is no plan for the management and use of these species.

*Myrtus communis* occurs in study area in small patches presently as it’s collected by the local 
people continuously due to its unique aroma and taste and hence its population is decreasing [54] 
with an alarming rate. *Berberis lyceum* is another important wild fruit species occurs in the hilly 
parts of the study area and facing the problem of uprooting. Indigenous communities use its roots 
for body cooling, stomach and wound healing purposes. They import its roots into urban areas and 
local herbal shops where they sell it with its market name Ziar largay. *Prunus armeniaca* another 
important fruit tree of the study area. It has a special vegetation patch of about 500 trees at the Batai 
hill. Every year people collect its fruit for their consumption. Unfortunately, due to urbanization 
this forest patch facing the problem of overexploitation. Its beautiful brown color hard wood is 
considered very favorite for furniture. Road construction during 2019 in the forest area was another 
serious threat for the conservation of Prunus forest. Other species facing conservation problems in 
the region is *Nannorrhops richieniana* uprooted by Porcupine [37], *Sagerati thea*, *Sideroxylon mascatensis*, 
*Rosa moschata*, *Myrsine africana*, *Ziziphus nummularia*, *Ziziphus jujuba*, *Ziziphus oxyphylla*, *Zanthoxylum 
armatum* and *Vitis jacquemontii* are the species facing conservation problem due to overexploitation, 
soil erosion and climatic changes.
Figure 3. (a) *Morus nigra* fruits (b) *Morus alba* (c) A young man collecting Mazri fruits (d) *Caralluma tuberculata* (e) A young man collecting wild vegetables (f) *Carthamus oxyanthus* seeds.
### Table 3. Wild food plants (WFPs) gathered and consumed in the tribal belt of Bajaur.

| S. No | Botanical names of WFPs | Local names of WFPs | Family | HB | Part used | Recipes and mode of Utilization in Cuisines | Contribution in Tribal Food System (use in other cookeries) | Coll. Time | Marketing | UR | RFC | Previously reported From Pakistan for food usages |
|-------|------------------------|---------------------|--------|----|-----------|---------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|------------|-----------|----|-----|-----------------------------------------------|
| 1     | *Allium carolinianum* DC | Ogai                | Amaryllidaceae | H  | Leaves    | Leaves are used as salad or fried in oil with Tomato and Red chilies and mixed with different cousins | i. Chicken Handi, ii. Traditional bread iii. Flavering agent | F-Jun      | +        | 14 | 0.17 |                                                                 |
| 2     | *Amaranthus crassipes* Schltdl. | Churlai            | Amaranthaceae | H  | Leaves    | Leaves are boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | i. Indian Squash (*Praecitrullus fistulosus*) | Ap-D       | -        | 8  | 0.10 |                                                                 |
| 3     | *Amaranthus viridis* L | Ganar              | Amaranthaceae | H  | Leaves    | Leaves fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | i. Pulses ii. Indian squash | Ap-D       | +        | 23 | 0.27 | [20,21,23,24,26]                                      |
| 4     | *Asparagus officinalis* L | Asparagaceae       | S       | Aerial parts | Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | | Jun-Jul       | +        | 13 | 0.15 |                                                                 |
| 5     | *Berberis lycium* Royle | Koaray             | Berberidaceae | S  | Fruit     | Taken as fruit | i. Juices | Mar-Nov | + | 58 | 0.69 | [1,23,25]                                          |
| 6     | *Caralluma tuberculata* N.E.Br. | Pamankay         | Asclepideaceae | H  | Stem      | Leaves fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | i. Qeema ii. Meat | Jun-Nov | - | 19 | 0.23 | [20-22,26]                                      |
| 7     | *Carthamus oxyacantha* M.Bieb | Kareza            | Asteraceae  | H  | Seeds     | Seeds are cooked in bread and then the bread is creamed with desi oil | i. Caramel candies | Jul-Sep | - | 13 | 0.15 |                                                                 |
| 8     | *Celtis australis* | Tagh               | Canabaceae  | T  | Fruit     | Taken as fruit | | Mar-Jun | - | 27 | 0.32 | [22,24,25]                                      |
| No. | Plant Name                      | Genus   | Family     | Part      | Uses                                                                 | Season | Yield | Refs                          |
|-----|--------------------------------|---------|------------|-----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------|-------|-------------------------------|
| 9   | Chenopodium album L.           | Sarmay  | Amaranthaceae | Leaves   | Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies.  | Mar-Jun | -     | 11, 0.13 [17,20,22,23,26]    |
| 10  | Cichorium intybus L.           | Kashni  | Asteraceae  | Leaves   | Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies.  | Apr-Jul | -     | 21, 0.25 [21,23,26,27]       |
| 11  | Cuminum cyminum L.             | Zeera   | Apiaceae   | Seeds    | Seeds used for aroma and taste in various traditional foods                  | Apr-May | -     | 19, 0.23                      |
| 12  | Descurainia sophia (L.) Webb ex Prantl | Jenjar | Brassicaceae | Leaves   | Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies.  | Mar-Jun | -     | 8, 0.10 [26]                  |
| 13  | Digera muricata (L.) Mart.     | Sur gulay | Amaranthaceae | Leaves   | Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies.  | Jun-Oct | -     | 31, 0.37 [23]                 |
| 14  | Diospyros lotus L.             | Tor amlook | Ebenaceae  | Fruit    | Taken as fruit                                                            | Oct-Jan | +     | 34, 0.40 [24,25]              |
| 15  | Ficus carica L.                | Inzar   | Moraceae   | Fruit    | Taken as fruit                                                            | Jun-Aug | +     | 64, 0.76 [14,24,25]           |
| 16  | Fragaria nubicola (Lindl. ex Hook.f.) Lacaita | Da zamkay toot | Saxifragaceae | Fruit    | Taken as Fruit                                                            | May-Sep | -     | 22, 0.26 [14,25]              |
| 17  | Indigofera spp.                | Gedarghog | Leguminoseae | Aerial parts | Flowers +Leaves are taken as raw                                             | Mar-May | -     | 3, 0.04 [14]                  |
| 18  | Lathyrus aphaca L.             | Korkaman | Leguminoseae | Aerial parts | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies.            | Mar-Jun | -     | 17, 0.20 [21,23]              |
| No. | Species                        | Common Name | Family   | Part                | Uses                                      | Season          | Score | Refs         |
|-----|--------------------------------|-------------|----------|---------------------|-------------------------------------------|-----------------|-------|--------------|
| 19  | Malva neglecta Wallr           | Panderak    | Malvaceae| Leaves              | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. Mixed with i. Rice ii. Potato iii. Pulses iv. Yogurt v. Beef | Mar-Nov         | +     | [20,21]     |
| 20  | Marsilea quadrifolia L         | Chopatra    | Marsilleaceae| Leaves         | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. i Rice ii. Potato iii. Pulses | May-Jul         | -     | 3 0.04      |
| 21  | Medicago polymorpha L.         | Speshtaray  | Leguminosae| Aerial parts      | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. i. Rice ii. Potato iii. Pulses iv. Yogurt v. Beef | Mar-Jun         | -     | 17 0.20     |
| 22  | Mentha longifolia L.           | Podina      | Lamiaceae| Aerial parts       | Leaves and young shoots are taken as salad i. Flavoring agent ii. Rice iii. Custards iv. Sweets etc. | Mar-Nov         | +     | 40 0.48     |
| 23  | Mentha royleana Wall. ex Benth| Enalay      | Lamiaceae| Aerial parts       | Leaves and young shoots are taken as salad i. Flavoring agent ii. Rice iii. Custards iv. Sweets etc. | Mar-Nov         | Y     | 34 0.40     |
| 24  | Morus nigra L                  | Tor toot    | Moraceae | Fruit              | Taken as fruit i. Juices ii. James iii. Syrup | Apr-Jul         | -     | 23 0.27     |
| 25  | Morus alba L                   | Spin toot   | Moraceae | Fruit              | Taken as fruit i. Juices ii. James | Apr-Jul         | -     | 28 0.33     |
| 26  | Myrsine africana L.            | Manrogaya   | Primulaceae| Fruit             | Taken as fruit | Jul-Sep         | -     | 5 0.06      |
| 27  | Myrtus communis L.             | Myrtaceae   | Shrub    | Fruit              | Taken as fruit i. Flavoring ii. Rice iii. Curd iv. Milk v. Custards vi. Sweets etc. | Sep-Nov         | +     | 53 0.63     |
| 28  | Nannorrhops                    | Mianzarai   | Arecaceae| Fruit              | Taken as fruit | Sep-Oct         | -     | 11 0.13     |
| No. | Species                          | Genus                | Family   | Part      | Uses                          | Season | Quantity | Reference   |
|-----|----------------------------------|----------------------|----------|-----------|-------------------------------|--------|----------|-------------|
| 29  | **Nasturtium officinale** R. Br  | Tarmera              | Brassicaceae | Leaves    | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | Mar-Nov | 47       | 0.56        | [20,21,23]   |
| 30  | **Olea ferruginea** Wall. ex Aitch | Khona               | Oleaceae  | Fruit     | Taken as fruit                | Aug-Oct | 48       | 0.57        | [14,22,24,25]|
| 31  | **Opuntia dillenii** (Ker Gawl.) Haw. | Tafnra              |   | Fruit     | Taken as fruit                | Sep-Oct | 5        | 0.06        | [14,25]     |
| 32  | **Oxalis corniculata** L.        | Trewakay             | Oxilidaceae | Aerial parts | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | Mar-Dec | 44       | 0.52        | [20,21,23,25,26]|
| 33  | **Papaver rhoeas** L.            | Reday                | Papaveraceae | Leaves    | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | Mar-May | 5        | 0.06        |           |
| 34  | **Pinus roxburghii** Sarg.       | Nakhtar              | Pinaceae  | Seeds     | Seeds are eaten as raw        | Dec-Feb | 8        | 0.10        |           |
| 35  | **Prunus armeniaca** L.          | Zardalo              | Rosaceae  | Fruit     | Taken as fruit                | May-Jun | 21       | 0.25        | [25]        |
| 36  | **Polygonum aviculare** L.       | Bandakay             | Polygonaceae | Aerial parts | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | Mar-Nov | 8        | 0.10        | [23,26]     |
| 37  | **Polygonum plebejum** R. Br.    | Bandakay             | Polygonaceae | Aerial parts | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | Mar-Nov | 6        | 0.07        | [20]        |
| 38  | **Portulaca quadrifida** L.      | Warkharay            | Portulacaceae | Aerial parts | Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | Jun-Sep | +        | 29          | [21-23]     |
| 39  | **Punica granatum** L.           | Anangoray            | Punicaceae | Fruit     | Taken as fruit                | Sept-Oct | 27       | 0.32        | [22,24,25]   |
| 40  | **Quercus baloot**               | Serai                | Fagaceae  | Fruit     | Taken as fruit                | Dec-Feb | 8        | 0.10        | [20]        |
| No. | Scientific Name                   | Local Name  | Family       | Type    | Use                  | Season  | Quantity | Reference   |
|-----|----------------------------------|-------------|--------------|---------|----------------------|---------|----------|-------------|
| 41  | Rosa moschata (Herrm)            | Khwrach     | Rosaceae     | S       | Fruit Taken as fruit | Aug-Oct | 4        | [14,20,22] |
| 42  | Rubus fruticosus (G.N.Jones)     | Karwara     | Rosaceae     | S       | Fruit Taken as fruit | Jul-Sep | 23       | [17,25]    |
| 43  | Rubus ulmifolius (Schott)        | Karwara     | Rosaceae     | S       | Fruit Taken as fruit | Jul-Sep | 8        | [14,22]    |
| 44  | Rumex hastatus (D. Don)          | Tarookay    | Polygonaceae | H       | Leaves Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | Mar-Jun | 15       | [21,23]    |
| 45  | Rumex dentatus (L.)              | Shalkhay    | Polygonaceae | H       | Leaves Boiled leaves are fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | Mar-Nov | 11       | [17,20,21,23] |
| 46  | Saccharum bengalense (Retz)      | Sharghashay | Poaceae      | H       | Young inflorescence Young inflorescence taken is raw before blooming | Mar-Apr | 17       | 0.20       |
| 47  | Sageretia thea (Osbeck) (M.C. Johnst) | Momanra    | Rhamnaceae   | S       | Fruit Taken as fruit | May-Jun | 37       | 0.44       |
| 48  | Salvia moorcroftiana (Wall. ex Benth.) | Kharghwa    | Lamiaceae    | H       | Stem young stem used as raw food | Mar-Apr | 9        | 0.11       |
| 49  | Sideroxylon mascatense (A.DC.) T.D.Penn. | Gorgora    | Sapotaceae   | T       | Fruit Taken as fruit | Jun-Jul | 43       | 0.51       |
| 50  | Silene conoidea (L.)             | Mangotay    | Caryophylaceae | H       | Fruit Taken as fruit | Mar-May | 22       | [17,20,23] |
| 51  | Sisymbrium irio (L.)             | Khob kalan  | Brassicaceae | H       | Leaves Taken as fruit | Mar-Jun | 18       | [20,26]    |
| 52  | Solanum americanum (Mill)        | Kachmacho   | Solanaceae   | H       | Aerial parts Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with | Mar-Sep | 7        | [21,22,25] |
| No. | Species                          | Cultivar | Family          | Part     | Preparation                                                                 | Culinary Uses                                                                                     | Season       | Yield | References                     |
|-----|---------------------------------|----------|-----------------|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|-------|-------------------------------|
| 53  | *Solanum villosum* Mill.        | Kachmado | Solanaceae      | Aerial   | Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | i. Rice  
   ii. Potato  
   iii. Pulses                                                                 | Mar-Sep      | 37    | 0.44 [20]                                                                 |
| 54  | *Stellaria media* (L.) Vill.    | Khorenaka | Caryophyllaceae | Aerial   | Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | i. Rice  
   ii. Potato  
   iii. Pulses                                                                 | Mar-May      | 13    | 0.15 [Abbas et al., 2020; Abbasi et al 2013b] | |
| 55  | *Thymus linearis* Benth.        |          | Lamiaceae       | Aerial   | Aerial parts used in spices                                                 | i. Meat  
   ii. Pulses  
   iii. Rice  
   iv. Spices etc.                                                                 | May-Oct      | 23    | 0.27 [22]                                                                 |
| 56  | *Triantema portulacastrum* L.   | Ghana    | Amaranthaceae    | Leaves   | Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | i. Potato                                                                                         | Jun-Sep      | 13    | 0.15                                                                 |
| 57  | *Trifolium repens* L.           | Shaftal  | Leguminoseae     | Aerial   | Leaves boiled in water and then fried in oil with tomato, onion and red chilies. | i. Rice  
   ii. Potato  
   iii. Pulses  
   iv. Yogurt                                                                                     | May-Oct      | 44    | 0.52 [20]                                                                 |
| 58  | *Vicia sativa* L. Arwarai       |          | Leguminoseae     | Legume   | Legume is taken as raw or fried in oil with tomato, onion and Red chilies.   | i. Meat  
   ii. Spinach  
   iii. Rice  
   iv. Indian squash                                                                 | Mar-Jun      | 27    | 0.32 [17,26]                                                               |
| 59  | *Vitis jacquemontii* R. Parker  | Gedarkwar | Vitaceae        | L/S      | Fruits                                                                       | i. Juices                                                                                         | Jul-Aug      | +     | 13 0.15 [14,25]                  |
| 60  | *Zanthoxylum armatum* DC        | Dambara  | Rutaceae        | Seeds    | Seeds are powdered and then mixed with curd, Mint leaves,                    | i. Curd  
   ii. Pulses  
   iii. Rice  
   iv. Custard                                                                                   | Mar-Jun      | 37    | 0.44 [14,24,25]                                                             |
| No. | Species                  | Habit     | Family     | Type | Season       | Use Reports | RFC    | Marketable |
|-----|--------------------------|-----------|------------|------|--------------|-------------|--------|------------|
| 61  | *Ziziphus oxyphylla*     | Enalai    | Rhamnaceae | S    | Fruit        | Aug-Nov     | +      | 0.23       |
|     | *Edgew*                  |           |            |      | Taken as fruit |             |        |            |
| 62  | *Ziziphus jujuba*        | Markhanra | Rhamnaceae | T    | Fruit        | Aug-Sep     | -      | 0.14       |
|     | *Mill*                   | i         |            |      | Taken as fruit |             |        |            |
| 63  | *Ziziphus nummularia*    | Beera     | Rhamnaceae | T    | Fruit        | Oct-Nov     | -      | 0.20       |
|     | *(Burm.f.) Wight & Arn*  |           |            |      | Taken as fruit |             |        |            |

Hb = Habit, H = Herb, S = Shrub, T = Tree, Coll. Time = Collection Time, UR = Use reports, RFC = Relative Frequency of Citation, + = Marketable, & _ = Nonmarketable.
Conclusions

The current research work was the first attempt to study the contribution of WFPs in the food system of the tribal belt of Pakistan-Areas of Pak-Afghan border at Bajaur. The local inhabitants were economically poor and they most of the time utilize local food resources at home. The results showed that WFPs have been and still collected and consumed in the region. In addition to nutritional values ten species have market values and contributes to the economy of local communities. Uses of Carthamus oxyanthus (Figure 3) & Pinus roxburghii seeds and Marsillea leaves were novel reports for the gastronomy of Pakistan after comparing with other region of the country. Myrtus communis, Berberis lyceum, Prunus armeniaca, Nannorrhops Ritchiana, Zanthoxylum armatum and Vitis jacobemontii etc. are the species facing conservation problem due to overexploitation, soil erosion and climatic changes.

The knowledge related to the consumption of WFPs in younger generation is decreasing in the tribal societies. Therefore, more studies are needed to conserve this important cultural gastronomic heritage of the studied region where the modernization, urbanization and industrialization are on the peak. We believe that this study will play a crucial role in the conservation and fostering of the traditional knowledge of WFPs cooking and consumption.

Authors’ contribution: Abdullah carried out the field work and prepared the first draft of the manuscript. SMK contributed in the study design analysis and supervised the project.

Acknowledgments: Special thanks to the local people of study area who generously shared their views about WFPs utilization.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References
1. Abbasi, A.M.; Khan, M.A.; Khan, N.; Shah, M.H.J.o.E. Ethnobotanical survey of medicinally important wild edible fruits species used by tribal communities of Lesser Himalayas-Pakistan. J.Ethnopharmacol. 2013, 148, 528-536.
2. Ju, Y.; Zhuo, J.; Liu, B.; Long, C.J.J.o.E.; Ethnomedicine. Eating from the wild: diversity of wild edible plants used by Tibetans in Shangri-la region, Yunnan, China. J. Ethnobiol. Ethnomed. 2013, 9, 28.
3. Thakur, D.; Sharma, A.; Uniyal, S.K.J.o.e.; ethnomedicine. Why they eat, what they eat: patterns of wild edible plants consumption in a tribal area of Western Himalaya. J. Ethnobiol. Ethnemed. 2017, 13, 70.
4. Guarrera, P.; Savo, V.J.J.o.E. Perceived health properties of wild and cultivated food plants in local and popular traditions of Italy: a review. J. Ethnopharmacol 2013, 146, 659-680.
5. Vitalini, S.; Iriti, M.; Puricelli, C.; Ciuchi, D.; Segale, A.; Fico, G.J.J.o.E. Traditional knowledge on medicinal and food plants used in Val San Giacomo (Sondrio, Italy)—An alpine ethnomedical study. J.Ethnopharmacol. 2013, 145, 517-529.
6. Punchay, K.; Inta, A.; Tiansawat, P.; Balslev, H.; Wangpakapattanawong, P.J.G.R.; Evolution, C. Traditional knowledge of wild food plants of Thai Karen and Lawa (Thailand). Genet Resour Crop Ev 2020, 1-23.
7. Shin, T.; Fujikawa, K.; Moe, A.Z.; Uchiyama, H.J.J.o.e.; ethnomedicine. Traditional knowledge of wild edible plants with special emphasis on medicinal uses in Southern Shan State, Myanmar. J.Ethnobiol.Ethnomed. 2018, 14, 48.
8. Pieroni, A.; Quave, C.L.J.E.; Medicine, H.T.F.a. Functional foods or food medicines? On the consumption of wild plants among Albanians and southern Italians in Lucania. 2006, 101-129.
9. Pieroni, A.; Söükand, R.; Amin, H.I.M.; Zahir, H.; Kukk, T.J.H.E. Celebrating multi-religious co-existence in Central Kurdistan: the bio-culturally diverse traditional gathering of wild vegetables among Yazidis, Assyrians, and Muslim Kurds. Hum. Ecol. 2018, 46, 217-227.
10. Guarrera, P.; Savo, V.J.J.o.e. Wild food plants used in traditional vegetable mixtures in Italy. J.Ethnopharmacol.2016, 185, 202-234.
11. Cornara, L.; La Rocca, A.; Marsili, S.; Mariotti, M.J.J.o.E. Traditional uses of plants in the Eastern Riviera (Liguria, Italy). J.Ethnopharmacol. 2009, 125, 16-30.
12. Sundriyal, M.; Sundriyal, R.; Sharma, E.; Purohit, A.J.O.M. Wild edibles and other useful plants from the Sikkim Himalaya, India. J. Ethnobiol.Ethnomed. 1998, 7, 43-54.
13. Kalle, R.; Söukand, R.; Pieroni, A.J.F. Devil Is in the Details: Use of Wild Food Plants in Historical Võrumaa and Setomaa, Present-Day Estonia. FOOD 2020, 9, 570.

14. Abbasi, A.M.; Khan, M.A.; Khan, N.; Shah, M.H.J.o.E. Ethnobotanical survey of medicinally important wild edible fruits species used by tribal communities of Lesser Himalayas-Pakistan. J. Ethnopharmacol. 2013a, 148, 528-536.

15. Söukand, R.; Hrynevich, Y.; Vaslyeva, I.; Prakoříjeva, J.; Vnukovich, Y.; Pociupa, J.; Hlushko, A.; Knureva, Y.; Litvinava, Y.; Vysvkarka, S.J.J.o.E., et al. Multi-functionality of the few: current and past uses of wild plants for food and healing in Liuban region, Belarus. J.Ethnobiol.Ethnomed. 2017, 13, 10.

16. Sleet, P.J.S.A.P.F.D.I., Retrieved from: http://www. futuredirections. org. au/wp-content/uploads//04/Food-Security-in-Pakistan-Surplus-Food-is-not-Enough-to-Create-a-Food-Secure-Country. pdf. Food security in Pakistan: surplus food is not enough to create a food secure country. F.D.I 2019.

17. Aziz, M.A.; Abbasi, A.M.; Ullah, Z.; Pieroni, A.J.F. Shared but Threatened: The Heritage of Wild Food Plant Gathering among Different Linguistic and Religious Groups in the Ishkoman and Yasin Valleys, North Pakistan. FOOD 2020, 9, 601.

18. Sunderland, T.C.J.F.R. Food security: why is biodiversity important? Int. For. Rev. 2011, 13, 265-274.

19. Shad, M.; Nawaz, H.; Rehman, T.; Ikram, N.J.J.A.P.S. Determination of some biochemicals, phytochemicals and antioxidant properties of different parts of Cichorium intybus L.: A comparative study. J Anim Plant Sci 2013, 23, 1060-1066.

20. Abbas, W.; Hussain, W.; Hussain, W.; Badshah, L.; Hussain, K.; Pieroni, A.J.G.R.; Evolution, C. Traditional wild vegetables gathered by four religious groups in Kurram District, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, North-West Pakistan. Genet Resour Crop Ev 2020, 67, 1521-1536.

21. Ahmad, K.; Weckerle, C.S.; Nazir, A.J.A.S.B.P. Ethnobotanical investigation of wild vegetables used among local communities in northwest Pakistan. Acta. Soc. Bot. Pol 2019, 88.

22. Ahmad, K.; Pieroni, A.J.J.o.e.; Ethnomedicine. Folk knowledge of wild food plants among the tribal communities of Thakht-e-Sulaiman Hills, North-West Pakistan. J. Ethnobiol. Ethnomed. 2016, 12, 17.

23. Abbasi, A.M.; Khan, M.A.; Shah, M.H.; Shah, M.M.; Pervez, A.; Ahmad, M.J.J.o.e.; ethnomedicine. Ethnobotanical appraisal and cultural values of medicinally important wild edible vegetables of Lesser Himalayas-Pakistan. J. Ethnobiol. Ethnomed. 2013b, 9, 66.

24. Abbasi, A.M.; Khan, M.A.; Zafar, M.J.P.J.B. Ethnomedical assessment of some selected wild edible fruits and vegetables of Lesser-Himalayas, Pakistan. P.J. Bot. 2013c, 45, 215-222.

25. Khan, M.P.Z.; Ahmad, M.; Zafar, M.; Sultana, S.; Ali, M.I.; Sun, H.J.J.o.e. Ethnomedicinal uses of edible wild fruits (EWFs) in Swat Valley, Northern Pakistan. J.Ethnopharmacol. 2015, 173, 191-203.

26. Tareen, N.M.; Saeed-ur-Rehman, M.A.; Shinwari, Z.K.; Bibi, T.J.P.J.B. Ethnomedicinal utilization of wild edible vegetables in district Harrari of Balochistan Province-Pakistan. P.J. Bot. 2016, 48, 1159-1171.

27. Abbas, A.M.; Shah, M.H.; Khan, M.A. Wild edible vegetables of lesser himalayas; Springer: 2015.

28. Šälähaddīn’Ahmad, A. Millennium and Charisma Among Pathans. A Crit. Essay in Social Anthropology. Akbar S. Ahmed; Routledge: 1976.

29. Tainter, J.A.; MacGregor, D.G. Pashtun social structure: Cultural perceptions and segmentary lineage organization; MACGREGOR BATES INC COTTAGE GROVE OR: 2011.

30. Lindholm, C. The Islamic middle east: tradition and change; John Wiley & Sons: 2008.

31. Khayyam, U.; Ullah, E.I.; Shah, S.J.T.A.J.o.T.; Sciences, S. Socio-cultural dynamics and their relation with the participatory development in the pashtun tribal society of Pakistan. Int J Humanit Soc Sci 2018, 22, 173-184.

32. Liebl, F.; Schwarz, J.O.J.F. Normality of the future: Trend diagnosis for strategic foresight. Futures 2010, 42, 313-327.

33. Ullah, A.J.J.o.p.s. Governance reforms in federally administered tribal areas (fata) of Pakistan: The past and present. JPolitical.Stud 2015, 22, 215.

34. Fair, C.C.; Hovenstein, N.; Their, J.A. Troubles on the Pakistan-Afghanistan Border; Universitäts-und Landesbibliothek Sachsen-Anhalt: 2006.

35. Jehan, S.; Khan, S.; Khattak, S.A.; Muhammad, S.; Rashid, A.; Muhammad, N.J.M. Hydrochemical properties of drinking water and their sources apportionment of pollution in Bajaur agency, Pakistan. Measurement 2019, 139, 249-257.

36. Aziz, M.A.; Adnan, M.; Khan, A.H.; Sufyan, M.; Khan, S.N.J.J.o.e. Cross-Cultural Analysis of Medicinal Plants commonly used in Ethnoveterinary Practices at South Waziristan Agency and Bajaur Agency, Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA), Pakistan. J.Ethnopharmacol. 2018, 210, 443-468.
37. Abdullah, K., Shujaul Mulk The indispensable bond between Mazri Palm (Nannorrhops ritchiana) and the Indian Porcupine (Hystrix indica) leads them towards extinction! *Biodivers and Conserv* 2019, 28, 3387-3388.
38. Sher, K. Utmankhel and Utmankheli. *Danyal Publishers Timergara* 2019, 1, 110.
39. Dolina, K.; Luczaj, L.J.A.S.B.P. Wild food plants used on the Dubrovnik coast (south-eastern Croatia). *J. Ethnobiol. Ethnomed.* 2014, 83.
40. Tongco, M.D.C. Purposive sampling as a tool for informant selection. *Ethnobot. Res. App* 2007, 5, 147-158.
41. Khan, S.M.; Page, S.; Ahmad, H.; Shaheen, H.; Ullah, Z.; Ahmad, M.; Harper, D.M.J.o.e.; ethnomedicine. Medicinal flora and ethnoecological knowledge in the Naran Valley, Western Himalaya, Pakistan. *J. Ethnobiol. Ethnomed.* 2013, 9, 4.
42. Pieroni, A.J.J.o.H.M. Traditional uses of wild food plants, medicinal plants, and domestic remedies in Albanian, Aromanian and Macedonian villages in South-Eastern Albania. *J. Herb.Med* 2017, 9, 81-90.
43. Ali, S.I.; Qaiser, M.J.P.o.t.R.S.o.E., Section B: Biological Sciences. A phytogeographical analysis of the phanerogams of Pakistan and Kashmir. *P Roy Soc Edinb A* 1986, 89, 89-101.
44. Rehman, M., Ur. *Wild Plants of Swat Valley; Springer Science & Business Media: 2019; Vol. 2.*
45. Kolosova, V.; Belichenko, O.; Rodionova, A.; Melnikov, D.; Sükand, R.J.F. Foraging in Boreal Forest: Wild Food Plants of the Republic of Karelia, NW Russia. *FOOD.* 2020, 9, 1015.
46. Abdullah, K., Shujaul Mulk; Pieroni, A.; ul Haq, Z.; Ahmad, Z.J.J.o.E.; Ethnomedicine. Mazri (Nannorrhops ritchiana (Griff) Aitch.): a remarkable source of manufacturing traditional handicrafts, goods and utensils in Pakistan. *J. Ethnobiol. Ethnomed.* 2020, 16, 1-13.
47. Aziz, M.A.; Khan, A.H.; Adnan, M.; Ullah, H.J.J.o.e.; ethnomedicine. Traditional uses of medicinal plants used by Indigenous communities for veterinary practices at Bajaur Agency, Pakistan. *J. Ethnobiol. Ethnomed.* 2018, 14, 11.
48. Feyssa, D.H.; Njoka, J.T.; Asfaw, Z.; Nyangito, M.J.J.o.H.; Forestry. Seasonal availability and consumption of wild edible plants in semiarid Ethiopia: Implications to food security and climate change adaptation. *J. Hortic. For.* 2011, 3, 138-149.
49. Pérez-Negrón, E.; Casas, A.J.J.o.A.E. Use, extraction rates and spatial availability of plant resources in the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley, Mexico: The case of Santiago Quiotepec, Oaxaca. *J. Arid Environ* 2007, 70, 356-379.
50. Mason, S.; Nesbitt, M.J.F.F.t.F.P.i.h.o.G.C.H. Acorns as food in southeast Turkey: implications for prehistoric subsistence in Southwest Asia. *Oxbow Books 2009,* 71-85.
51. Yeşil, Y.; İnal, İ.J.A.S.B.P. Traditional knowledge of wild edible plants in Hasankeyf (Batman Province, Turkey). *Acta. Soc. Bot. Pol* 2019, 88, 3633.
52. Menendez-Baceta, G.; Aceituno-Mata, L.; Tardio, J.; Reyes-García, V.; Pardo-de-Santayana, M.J.G.R.; Evolution, C. Wild edible plants traditionally gathered in Gorbeialdea (Biscay, Basque Country). *Gen. Res. Cro. Evo.*2012, 59, 1329-1347.
53. Marwat, S.K.; Usman, K.; Khakwani, A.A.; Ghulam, S.; Anwar, N.; Sadiq, M.; Khan, S.J.J.o.M.P.R. Medico-ethnobotanical studies of edible wild fruit plants species from the flora of north western Pakistan (DI Khan district). *Med. Plan. Res* 2011, 5, 3679-3686.
54. Ali, K.; Ullah, F.; Khan, N.; Rahman, L.U.; Ullah, S.; Khan, W.; Ali, M.; Uddin, N.; Nisar, M.J.J.o.B.; Sci, E. Ethnobotanical and ecological study of Myrtus communis (L.) in Bajaur agency (FATA) Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. *J. Biodivers Environ Sci* 2017, 11, 152-164.

© 2020 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).