Integrative analysis reveals pathways associated with sex reversal in *Cynoglossus semilaevis*

Zhan Ye$^{1,2}$, Weifeng Wang$^1$, Yaqun Zhang$^2$, Liping Wang$^{1,2}$, Yu Cui$^2$ and Hengde Li$^2$

$^1$National Demonstration Center for Experimental Fisheries Science Education, Shanghai Ocean University, Shanghai, China
$^2$Key Laboratory of Aquatic Genomics, Ministry of Agriculture and rural affairs, Beijing Key Laboratory of Fishery Biotechnology, Chinese Academy of Fishery Sciences, Beijing, China
$^3$College of Fisheries, Huazhong Agricultural University, Wuhan, China

ABSTRACT

Sex reversal is a complex biological phenomenon exhibited by *Cynoglossus semilaevis*. Some genetic females may irreversibly convert to pseudomales, thus increasing aquaculture costs because males grow much more slowly than females. In this study, an integrative analysis of transcriptome and proteome was performed to compare differences in gene and protein expression in females and pseudomales after gonad differentiation in *C. semilaevis*. Based on RNA-Seq results, 1893 genes showed differences in expression at the transcript level between females and pseudomales. Of these differentially expressed genes (DEGs), zona pellucida sperm-binding protein 4-like (LOC103393374, ZP4), zona pellucida sperm-binding protein 4-like (LOC103396071, ZP4) and forkhead box L2 (*foxl2*) were highly expressed in females and doublesex and mab-3 related transcription factor 1 (*dmrt1*) and doublesex and mab-3 related transcription factor 3 (*dmrt3*) were highly expressed in pseudomales. GO enrichment analysis results indicate that wnt signaling pathways and oocyte maturation are two terms enriched in female. At the protein level, Tandem Mass Tags analysis revealed that 324 proteins differed in their relative abundance between pseudomales and females. KEGG analysis found that pseudo-highly expressed proteins were enriched in the ubiquitin mediated proteolysis pathway. For integrative analysis, the Spearman correlation coefficient between the transcriptome and proteome was 0.59. Among 52 related genes, 46 DEGs (88%) were well matched in their levels of change in protein abundance. These findings reveal major active pathways in female and pseudomale gonads after sex reversal and provide new insights into molecular mechanisms associated with sex reversal regulatory network.

INTRODUCTION

*Cynoglossus semilaevis* is a valuable commercial fish and is distributed along the coast of the Yellow Sea and the Bohai Sea of China (*Jiang & Li, 2017*). *C. semilaevis* is of ZW-type sex determination, with females being heterogametic (ZW♀) and males being homogametic.
Females have considerably higher growth rates than males, so that adult females are two to four times larger than adult males (Chen et al., 2009), and female fish are therefore more desirable in *C. semilaevis* aquaculture. However, during dph 50 to 100 some genetic females can develop into pseudomales, which grow just as slowly as normal males. Due to sex reversal, the cost of breeding *C. semilaevis* has increased and increasing and maintaining the level of females in a population has become an urgent and important issue in *C. semilaevis* aquaculture. In fact, sex reversal is so common that the percentage of females has gradually decreased to below 20% on average in recent years. Several reports have shown that sex reversal ratios are affected by temperature, but their conclusion are not consistent (Tian et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2014). Therefore, whether sex reversal ratios are affected by environmental factors remained uncertain. Our previous studies have elucidated the genetic architecture underlying sex reversal in *C. semilaevis*. We identified two loci associated with sex reversal of *C. semilaevis* by genome-wide association study (GWAS). These two loci are located on the Z chromosome in the third intron of the F-box and leucine-rich repeat protein 17 (*fbxl17*) gene (Cyn_Z_6676874) and the third intron of the *dmrt1* gene (Cyn_Z_8564889) (Jiang & Li, 2017; Cui et al., 2018). Genetic females that contain both the T allele of the Cyn_Z_6676874 locus and the A allele of the Cyn_Z_8564889 locus reverse into pseudomales and have provided scientific guidance for breeding and management of *C. semilaevis* aquaculture.

A set of sex-biased genes potentially associated with growth and reproduction in tongue sole were identified by brain transcriptome analysis (Wang et al., 2016) and transcriptomic analysis revealed candidate networks and genes for sexual dimorphism of body size for *C. semilaevis* (Wang et al., 2018). The process of sex reversal is accompanied with many changes in transcription and translation of certain genes. However, few studies have been published to identify sex-biased proteins involved in sex reversal in *C. semilaevis*. The integrative analysis of the transcriptome and proteome is an efficient tool for identifying differential expressed genes at the whole-genome level. Comparative transcriptomic and proteomic analysis was successfully used to study the development of the mouse stomach and its relationship with the development of gastric cancer at the whole-genome level (Li et al., 2018). However, the relationship between mRNA and protein levels did not follow a simple correlation in which higher mRNA levels always associate with higher protein levels (Becker et al., 2018). In addition, previous studies have demonstrated poor correlation between the transcriptome and the proteome (Anatole et al., 2011; Gygi et al., 1999; Kramer et al., 2014). This divergence might be due to post-transcriptional and translational processes regulating the location, quantity, and efficiency of proteins in the cell. In this study, the comparison of main active pathways in female and pseudomale gonads after sex reversal in *C. semilaevis* were explored through an integrative analysis of the transcriptome and proteome.
MATERIALS & METHODS

Ethics statement
All procedures involving the handling and treatment of fish used in this study were conducted with the approval of the animal care and use committee of Chinese Academy of Fishery Sciences. All animal procedures were carried out according to the guide for the care and use of laboratory animals and the animal welfare in China.

Tissue materials and sex identification
In July 2018, 100 C. semilaevis of 120 days post-hatch (dph) were randomly selected from Tianjin Haisheng Aquaculture Company and their fins and gonads sampled. In our study, experimental fish are taken from the same pond, the temperature of which was 22 °C–23 °C, which will exclude all environmental impacts. Fins were stored in 100% ethanol and the DNA was extracted using the TIANamp marine animal DNA kit following the manufacturer’s protocol (TIANGEN® Biotech Co., Ltd., Beijing, China). Gonads were frozen in liquid nitrogen then stored at −80 °C and RNA extracted using the TIANamp marine animal RNA kit following the manufacturer’s protocol (TIANGEN® Biotech Co., Ltd., Beijing, China). The genetic sex was then determined with fin DNA using a previously described sex-specific marker (Liu et al., 2014). Phenotypic sex was determined by sequencing the Cyn_Z_6676874 and Cyn_Z_8564889 loci and verified by tissue sectioning of gonads (Figs. S1 and S2). The details of tissue sectioning are described in our previous study (Jiang & Li, 2017). Finally, gonad tissues from 4 pseudomales and 4 females were selected for transcriptomic and proteomic analysis.

RNA-Seq analysis
Gonad samples of 4 pseudomales and 4 females were subjected to RNA-Seq using an Illumina HiSeq Xten at the Novogene Biotechnology Co. Ltd (Beijing, China). For RNA-Seq, 3 µg total RNA from each sample was used to enrich mRNA for cDNA library construction. The cDNA library was generated using the NEB Next® UltraTM RNA Prep Kit for Illumina® (NEB, USA) following the manufacturer’s protocol. Raw reads were filtered by removing low-quality reads with ambiguous nucleotides and adapter sequences of “AGATCGGAAGAGC” using FastQC software. Clean data were then aligned using Hisat2 (https://ccb.jhu.edu/software/hisat2/index.shtml) and mapped to C. semilaevis reference genome (NCBI: GCF_000523025.1_Cse_v1.0_genomic). Sequences were assembled based on alignment results and used for further analysis. Gene expression levels were further normalized using the fragments per kilobase of transcript per million mapped reads (FPKM) method to eliminate the influence of differences in gene lengths and the amount of sequencing data on calculations of gene expression (Wang et al., 2018). Differentially expressed genes (DEGs) between females and pseudomales were identified with an absolute log2FC ≥ 2 and a false discovery rate-adjusted P (q value) <0.05 using the ballgown package (https://www.rdocumentation.org/packages/ballgown). The raw data of transcriptomes and proteomics obtained in this bioproject (PRJNA586726), have been deposited in Genbank-SRA under the accession numbers (SRR10492824–SRR10492831).
qRT-PCR verification
To validate the results of high-throughput transcriptome sequencing, 16 DEGs were selected for real-time quantitative reverse transcription PCR (qRT-PCR). All genes used for quantification were selected based on factors such as PCR efficiency, gene expression level, and expression difference level. *C. semilaevis* β-actin gene was used as an internal reference (*Li et al., 2010*). Primers for the 16 DEGs were designed using Primer-blast based on the gene sequences from the RNA-Seq datasets (Table 1). Total RNA (1 µg) was reverse transcribed using the TOYOBO Reverse Transcription Kit then qRT-PCR conducted using SYBR® Green Reagents with 15 µL reactions, each containing 9 µL SYBR® Green, 0.3 µL forward primer, 0.3 µL reverse primer, 0.6 µL cDNA, and 4.8 µL ddH₂O. The following PCR amplification procedure was used: 95 °C for 2 min, followed by 40 cycles of 95 °C for 15 s, 60 °C for 30 s, and 72 °C for 30 s. All reactions were repeated 3 times (*Livak & Schmittgen, 2001*) and dissociation curve analysis performed using an ABI 7500 (Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA) fast real-time PCR system. Relative expression levels for genes of interest in females and pseudomales were then calculated with the 2−ΔΔCt (*Livak & Schmittgen, 2001*) method and the log2 fold change obtained from qRT-PCR and RNA-Seq was compared.

Protein extraction and labeling
Frozen samples of pseudomale and female gonad tissues were ground in liquid nitrogen then the 100 mg of powdered sample transferred into a 1.5 mL tube containing 600 µL phenol extract and protease inhibitor. Samples were then ultrasonicated on ice then mixed with a phenol-tris-HCL saturated solution of equal volume for 30 min at 4 °C. After centrifugation at 15,000 × g for 15 min at 4 °C, the upper phenol layer was transferred to a new tube and proteins precipitated using 0.1 M ammonium acetate-methanol at −20 °C. Proteins were quantified using the BCA protein concentration assay (*Smith et al., 1985*). Next, 100 µg of protein was reduced with 120 µL of reducing agent buffer (10 mM DTT, 8 M urea, 100 mM TEAB, pH 8.0) at 60 °C for 1 h. Reduced proteins were then alkylated for 40 min at room temperature in the dark by the addition of IAA to a final concentration of 50 mM. Proteins were then digested with 2 µL of 1 µg/µL trypsin per sample for 12 h at 37 °C (*Wisniewski et al., 2009*). Digested peptides were collected, mixed with 50 µL of 200 mM TEAB buffer, then centrifuged at 12,000 rpm for 20 min and the resulting lower layer collected and lyophilized. Samples were then resuspended in 200 mM triethylammonium bicarbonate (TEAB) and the peptides labeled using the TMT labeling reagent for 1.5 h at room temperature (*Xiao et al., 2016; Guerreiro et al., 2014*).

Proteomic analysis
After labeling, samples were mixed in a tube and dried with a vacuum pump. Pooled mixtures were fractionated using an Agilent 1100 HPLC with an ultraviolet (UV) absorption detector (210 nm and 280 nm) and a flow rate of 300 µL/min. Eluted peptides were grouped into 10 final fractions, desalted on an Agilent Zorbax Extend C18 column (2. 1×150 mm), and vacuum dried. LC–MS/MS analysis of each fraction was then performed on an EASY-nLC 1200 liquid chromatograph and peptides eluted using a gradient of 2–80% acetonitrile
Table 1 Primers used for quantitative qRT-PCR.

| Gene       | Primers | Sequence (5′∼3′)       |
|------------|---------|------------------------|
| β-actin    | For     | GCTGTGCTGTCCCTGTA      |
|            | Rev     | GAGTAGCCACGCTCTGTC     |
| LOC103393374 | For    | GTAAGTGCGTGCTACGCTGAA |
|            | Rev     | GAGAGCAACCACACCGAGT    |
| LOC103396071 | For    | GTTGTGCGTGTGACTGTGCC  |
|            | Rev     | CCGTTTCGATTTGGGTTGCC   |
| gtf3a      | For     | GCTGCGAAGCTGAGAAAAAC   |
|            | Rev     | AAACAAAAACAAATCCGGTCA  |
| LOC103391323 | For    | CGGTCCTGTCTTTCAAT     |
|            | Rev     | AGAGCAGCTGCTACATCTCA   |
| shspon     | For     | GAGTTGACCTGTGCTCTGGA  |
|            | Rev     | CAGTAGCAGCTCCATAAAACGC |
| cystm1     | For     | TCTGGAAGCTGCTTTGTTGTA |
|            | Rev     | CCGGTTCTCTGTGAGTTGA    |
| LOC103392682 | For    | CGAGCTCAAGAGGAGGAA     |
|            | Rev     | TGAAGACGTGTGTGTTCCATA  |
| LOC103394689 | For    | CAGGCAAGCAAAAGACTG     |
|            | Rev     | CCTCCTTTCTGAGCGGAGA    |
| LOC103391404 | For    | AGAAAGAGGTGGACACAGTTG  |
|            | Rev     | TACAGCACACACTTTTGAGCTG |
| poc1a      | For     | CTTTTGAGGTTTTGATTGAA   |
|            | Rev     | CGTGCTTTAGCGATCAGCA    |
| LOC103392072 | For    | ACAGAGCGCCGTAATGCCA    |
|            | Rev     | TTTTCTAAGGACCTCAGGCTTC |
| LOC103379620 | For    | GAGAGCCATGTTCAGGCCAGA  |
|            | Rev     | GGTCAGTTCTACTCAAAAGGCTT |
| dmt1       | For     | CCACAAACATGCCCTCTCAGTA |
|            | Rev     | CCGGTTGAGATGGAGGAA     |
| dmt3       | For     | CAACCTGAGGAGACCGGATA   |
|            | Rev     | GGAGCTGACGGGATCTTCT    |
| foxl2      | For     | GAGGTCAGCTCAGGCTCCGG   |
|            | Rev     | AGCAGCCGCTAAGTACAGG    |
| wnt9b      | For     | CGCAGTACGGACCTGCTTCT   |
|            | Rev     | CATGGGGCTGTTGTAACCCCA  |

with 0.1% formic acid for 120 min on a Q-Exactive mass spectrometer (Thermo, USA). The MS scanning range was 300–1,600 m/z and the top 10 most intense signals were selected for further MS/MS analysis. The resolutions of the MS and the MS/MS scans were 70,000 and 17,500, respectively, and the dynamic exclusion set to 15 s. Experimental data was analyzed by Proteome Discoverer™ 2.2 (Thermo, USA) software. The protein database used was Acanthomorphata uniprot and the false discovery rate of peptide identification was below 1%. After mass spectrometry analysis, results were retrieved from the database and relevant proteins separated. Differentially expressed proteins (DEPs) were identified...
based on fold changes (FC) calculated by comparing pseudomale and female groups and
*p*-values were obtained by t-tests. Proteins that were significantly differentially expressed
were defined by FC >1.5 or FC <2/3 and a *p*-value <0.05.

**GO and KEGG analysis**
Gene Ontology (GO) functional enrichment analysis was used to determine biological
functions significantly associated with DEGs or DEPs, including relevant molecular
functions, cell components, and biological processes. Kyoto Encyclopedia of Genes and
Genomes (KEGG) pathway enrichment analysis was used to aid biological interpretation
of DEGs and DEPs. GO functional enrichment analysis for DEGs and DEPs was conducted
using the online tool DAVID (https://david.ncifcrf.gov/) and KEGG pathway enrichment
analysis performed with the KOBAS 3.0 online tool (http://kobas.cbi.pku.edu.cn/). Since
*C. semilaevis* is a non-model species, genes were mapped to the zebrafish function database
for analysis.

**Correlations between the transcriptome and proteome**
The Spearman correlation coefficient between mRNA and protein expression was calculated
for genes differentially expressed in both transcriptome and proteome analysis to avoid
masking effects of random variation. DEG sequences were extracted from RNA-Seq
data and used as a nucleic acid database for alignment. Amino acid sequences of
peptides from DEPs were aligned as queries to the DEGs database using the tblastn
(https://blast.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/Blast.cgi) command, then the genes differentially expressed
at both the transcriptome and proteome levels extracted. An alignment result of identity
≥ 80%, e-value ≤ 1, and gap = 0 indicated a perfect matched between mRNA and protein
sequences. Spearman correlation coefficients were calculated based on mean fold changes
for mRNA and protein expression.

**RESULTS**

**Characteristics of high-throughput sequencing data**
A total of 194 Gb of sequence was generated using eight *C. semilaevis* gonadal tissue libraries.
After quality control and adapter removal, 150.7 Gb of clean reads were obtained, 85.14%–
89.43% of which were mapped to *C. semilaevis* genome. The assembled transcriptome
consists of 46,317 transcripts belonging to 25,761 genes. A total of 2,172 (FDR < 1%)
reliable proteins were identified by combining high-throughput TMT technology with
high-resolution LC-MS/MS technology (Table 2).

**Differentially expressed genes between females and pseudomales**
We identified a total of 1,893 differentially expressed genes between females and
pseudomales (Table S1). Of all the differentially expressed genes (DEGs), 785 genes
were more highly expressed in females while 1,108 genes were more highly expressed in
pseudomales (Fig. 1). These differentially expressed genes included several sex-related
genes, such as *dmrt1*, *dmrt3* and *foxl2*. The expression levels of *dmrt1* and *dmrt3*
in pseudomales were 5.09 FC and 16.82 FC higher than in females, respectively. The expression
level of *foxl2* in females was 44.21 FC higher than in pseudomales.
Table 2  The statistics of transcriptome and proteomic data.

| Type of data      | Number       |
|-------------------|--------------|
| Raw data          | 194.0 (Gb)   |
| Clean data        | 150.7 (Gb)   |
| Transcripts       | 46,317       |
| Genes             | 25,761       |
| Mapped rate       | 85.14%~89.43%|
| Reliable protein  | 2172 (FDR <1%)|

Figure 1  Cluster analysis of RNA-Seq datasets. The cluster analysis was performed with all genes, and FPKM was taken as the expression level of all genes. “name” is sample ID, fm: female, pm: pseudomale.

GO enrichment analysis indicated significant enrichment of 49 GO terms \( (p < 0.05) \). Among them, 32 GO terms were identified from 785 genes highly expressed in females (Fig. 2) and 17 GO terms were identified from 1,108 genes highly expressed in pseudomales (Fig. 3). Of these 32 GO terms highly expressed in females, DNA replication initiation is
The DEGs were categorized based on GO annotation, and the number of each category was displayed based for biological processes (BP), molecular functions (MF), and cellular components (CC).

Most significant. In addition, biological processes including wnt signaling pathways, cell development, and oocyte maturation are enriched. Cellular component category extracellular space is enriched with the largest number of differential genes. For molecular functions classification, transforming growth factor beta receptor binding was most significantly enriched. Moreover, the top three categories were growth factor activity, methyltransferase activity, and cytokine activity. Among the 17 GO terms highly expressed in pseudomales, autophagy enrichment was the most significant and cytoplasm enriched with the largest number of differential genes.

KEGG analysis assigned the 1893 DEGs to 30 pathways, in which 19 pathways of highly expressed in females were enriched (Fig. 4), and 11 pathways that are highly expressed in pseudomales are enriched (Fig. 5). Of the 19 pathways, cell cycle was the most significantly enriched. In addition, progesterone-mediated oocyte maturation and oocyte meiosis closely related to female germ cells were enriched. Of the 11 pathways, adipocytokine signaling pathway is the most significant enriched.

The validation of RNA-Seq
Transcriptional regulation revealed by RNA-Seq data was confirmed in a biologically independent experiment using qRT-PCR. A total of 16 genes, including general transcription factor IIIA (gtf3a), somatomedin B and thrombospondin type 1 domain containing (sbspon), cysteine rich transmembrane module containing 1 (cystm1), POC1...
centriolar protein A (poc1a), doublesex and mab-3 related transcription factor 1 (dmrt1), doublesex and mab-3 related transcription factor 3 (dmrt3), wingless-type MMTV integration site family, member 9B (wnt9b), forkhead box L2 (foxl2), zona pellucida sperm-binding protein 4-like (LOC103393374, ZP4), zona pellucida sperm-binding protein 4-like (LOC103396071, ZP4), charged multivesicular body protein 1b-like (LOC103391323), LOC103392682, cilia- and flagella-associated protein 157-like (LOC103394689), tubulin alpha-1C chain-like (LOC103391404), NAD(P)H dehydrogenase [quinone] 1-like (LOC103392072), and LOC103379620 were selected for qRT-PCR analysis. 16 DEGs including nine up-regulated genes were highly expressed in pseudomale (dmrt1, dmrt3, sbsp, cystm1, poc1a, LOC103391323, LOC103392682, LOC103394689, LOC103391404) and others were down-regulated in pseudomale. Except for the gene of dmrt3, other genes were more quantitative than RNA-Seq, but similar up-regulation or down-regulation patterns of these genes were observed in qRT-PCR and RNA-Seq results (Fig. 6). Further Pearson correlation analysis of qRT-PCR and RNA-Seq showed that their correlation was \( \rho = 0.98 \). This indicates that qRT-PCR can effectively validate the results of RNA-Seq.

**Proteomic analysis**

A comparative proteome survey was performed of females and pseudomales using the TMT technique to complement the transcriptome experiments. Out of 2172 reliable proteins,
184 up-regulated proteins and 140 down-regulated proteins were identified in pseudomales compared to females (Fig. 7 and Table S2). Enrichment analysis of DEP’s biological process showed that cytoplasmic mRNA processing body assembly, RNA processing and protein polymerization are the top three females with high expression of DEP enrichment (Fig. 8), while regulation of DNA-templated transcription, elongation is the high expression of DEPs in pseudomales enrich the most significant term (Fig. 9). In addition, U6 snRNP and nucleus are two terms in which female and pseudo-male highly expressed DEPs are enriched in cell component categories, respectively. RNA binding and nucleotide binding are the two main categories of high expression DEPs in females and pseudomales under molecular function, respectively.

KEGG pathway analysis of the female highly expressed proteins revealed that RNA degradation was the most significantly pathway, and the following is spliceosome and metabolic pathways (Fig. 10). However, KEGG pathway analysis of the pseudomale highly expressed proteins founded that protein processing in endoplasmic reticulum, PPAR signaling pathway and fatty acid biosynthesis were the top three pathways (Fig. 11).
Integrative analysis of transcriptomic and proteomic results

A total of 52 genes were differentially expressed between females and pseudomales at both the transcriptomic and proteomic levels. Further correlation analysis for these 52 genes revealed that $\rho = 0.59$ ($p < 0.05$) for the mRNA–protein correlations. Among these 52 related genes, 46 DEGs (88%) were well matched in their levels of protein abundance change. Additionally, compared to females, 33 genes were up-regulated in pseudomales, based on both transcriptomic and proteomic analysis, including YOD1 deubiquitinase ($yod1$), ubiquitin recognition factor in ER associated degradation 1 ($ufd1$), MINDY lysine 48 deubiquitinase 3 ($mindy3$), ubiquitin like domain containing CTD phosphatase 1 ($ublcph1$) and ADP ribosylation factor like GTPase 1 ($arl1$), importin 4 ($ipo4$), microtubule associated protein 1 light chain 3 alpha ($map1lc3a$). Transcriptomic and proteomic analysis both indicated the down-regulation of 13 genes, including Rho GDP dissociation inhibitor alpha ($arhgdia$), neural cell adhesion molecule 1-like (LOC103395384), eukaryotic translation initiation factor 4E nuclear import factor 1 ($eif4eni1$), aldehyde dehydrogenase 6 family member A1 ($aldh6a1$), and zygote arrest 1 ($zar1$). Six genes displayed decoupling
patterns between the transcriptome and the proteome. Both LOC103376887 and heat shock 60 protein 1 (hspd1) were up-regulated in proteome analysis while the corresponding DEGs were down-regulated at transcript level. Creatine kinase M-type (LOC103377896) and sarcoplasmic/endoplasmic reticulum calcium ATPase 2-like (LOC103383309) were both down-regulated at the translation level but up-regulated at the transcriptomic level (Table 3). GO function analysis found that arl1, map1lc3a, and yod1 were enriched in cytosolic component while arl1, ipo4, hspd1, arhgdia, and zar1 were enriched in the cytoplasm component.

**DISCUSSION**

Sex development is a complex process, consisting of sex determination, initiation, differentiation and maintenance, ultimately producing sperm or eggs for germline transmission (Zhang et al., 2016). In this study, we performed integrative analysis of the transcriptomes and proteomes of gonadal tissues of C. semilaevis females and pseudomales. Our findings suggested that dmrt1, dmrt3, and foxl2 showed differential expression after C. semilaevis reversal, which may be related to the maintenance of the gonad phenotype after sexual reversion. Studies have shown that males with dmrt1 mutations form ovary-like testes while expression of the female-related gene foxl2 was significantly increased in the gonads of these mutants (Cui et al., 2017). In addition, abundant dmrt3 expression has been detected in adult Takifugu rubripes testes, with lower levels of ovarian expression...
Figure 7  A volcano plots of DEPs under female compare with pseudomale. The red indicated up-regulated proteins (p-value < 0.05 and FC > 1.5), green indicated down-regulated proteins (p-value < 0.05 and FC < 2/3), black indicated no significant change, the further the log2(FC) and $-\log_{10}$ (p-value) are from 0, the greater the difference in protein expression. (Yamaguchi et al., 2006). Expression of dmrt3 has been detected in developing sperm cells in the testes and in developing oocytes in the ovaries of Monopterus albus (Sheng et al., 2014). This evidences collectively demonstrates that dmrt1 and dmrt3 may be associated with gonadal development in C. semilaevis, which was consistent with previous studies (Wang et al., 2019; Dong, Chen & Ji, 2010). Foxl2 is a critical factor essential for ovary differentiation and maintenance, which is also a depressor for the genetic program for somatic testis determination (Uhlenhaut et al., 2009). In other studies, foxl2 expression was significantly higher in ovaries compared to other tissues, so it was deduced that the foxl2 regulates early differentiation of the ovaries in reproduction via the hypothalamus-pituitary-gonad axis and its function is conserved (Lyu et al., 2019). ZP4 is component of the zona pellucida, an
extracellular matrix surrounding oocytes which mediates sperm binding, may act as a sperm receptor. Down-regulation foxl2 and ZP4, such “female-specific” genes in pseudomales, also showed the sex-reversal from female to male occured at transcript level. Recent study reported that the methylation level of cyp19a1a promoter was higher in gonads in females than in males and pseudomales, suggested that cyp19a1a might be the mechanism for the temperature induced masculinization in C. semilaevis (Liu et al., 2019). However, the cyp19a1a gene was not found in our data, which might be due to its low expression level at certain conditions.

The wnt signaling pathway is a conservative signaling network involved in embryonic development, cell differentiation and proliferation, and growth regulation. Our findings indicate that female highly expressed genes are enriched to the wnt signaling pathway. Wnt is a secreted glycoprotein, and of which different subtypes have been found in animals (Gao et al., 2014). Wnt4 is regarded as a sex determination gene that plays a key role in the morphological development of female mammals (Jordan et al., 2001). Wnt4 regulates müllerian duct formation and the generation of ovarian steroids (Biason-Lauber et al., 2004). Due to our strict differential genetic selection criteria, wnt4 was not identified as a differentially expressed gene in our results. However, querying its expression in transcriptome data found that it is only expressed in females and that wnt4 mRNA levels in pseudomales are close to zero. In this study, wnt9b was differentially expressed based
on our transcriptome data is clearly enriched in the wnt signaling pathway, indicating a regulatory role. Additionally, wnt9b plays a role of organizing signal in the regulation of the mammalian urogenital system (Carroll et al., 2005). Further research is required to elucidate the roles of these genes in the reproductive process of C. semilaevis.

The most important biological processes in the testis and ovaries are spermatogenesis and oogenesis, respectively. As expected, differentially expressed genes we identified include genes associated with oocyte generation stage. The enrichment of progesterone-mediated oocyte maturation and oocyte meiosis pathways in KEGG pathway analysis of the transcriptomes indicated that the gonad function has changed after sex reversal. Previously, sectioning ZW fish revealed chimeric gonads before completion of sex reversal was completed, with normal male gonads present after reversal was complete (Jiang & Li, 2017).

In this study, four ubiquitin-related genes yod1, ufd1, mindy3 and ublc1p were found to be up-regulated in pseudomales and the corresponding proteins were also up-regulated. In addition, pseudo-highly expressed proteins were also significantly enriched in the ubiquitin-mediated proteolytic pathway. Ubiquitin is a small molecular weight protein commonly found in eukaryotic cells. It participates in the selective degradation of most proteins, also plays an important role in various cell life activities, such as signal transduction, immunity response, transcription and translation (Hershko & Ciechanover, 2000).
Therefore, we speculated that protein ubiquitination may be related to some changes in gonad development after sexual reversal. Several studies have analyzed several sperm quality measurements and confirmed their association with ubiquitination (Sutovsky, Terada & Schatten, 2001; Peter et al., 2003; Christopher, Rex & Gary, 2004; Muratori et al., 2005; Ozanon, Chouteau & Sutovsky, 2005; Lovercamp et al., 2008). In addition, the number of ubiquitinated sperm in semen samples is related to infertility or poor sperm quality in humans (Sutovsky, Terada & Schatten, 2001; Ozanon, Chouteau & Sutovsky, 2005), stallions (Peter et al., 2003), bulls (Peter, Evelyn & Gerald, 2002) and boar (Christopher, Rex & Gary, 2004; Lovercamp et al., 2008). The potential effect of ubiquitination on sexual reversal in C. semilaevis needs to be investigated in the future.

Recently, genomics and proteomics studies have shown that although proteins are translated from mRNA, the levels of protein and mRNA are not well correlated (Greenbaum et al., 2003). Therefore, protein levels cannot be reliably predicted from gene expression. Consistent with previous findings, mRNA and protein correlations were also moderate in this study (Spearman correlation coefficients were 0.59). As previously discussed, only a small fraction of corresponding mRNA and protein pairs were identified in transcriptome and proteome correlation analysis, moreover, 6 genes showed inconsistencies.
in transcription and protein levels. These results suggest that changes in mRNA levels provide limited insight into changes in protein expression, and this result builds an evidence that mRNA expression is not sufficient to fully understand expression changes. The discrepancies between mRNA and protein may be related to complex post-transcriptional regulatory mechanisms, different kinetics of RNA or protein degradation, and detection limits or biases of instruments that measure mRNA and protein, among other origins (Li et al., 2018).

CONCLUSIONS

RNA-Seq revealed that 1893 genes, including the sex-related genes *dmrt1, dmrt3* and *foxl2* were found to be differentially expressed between pseudomales and females. At the transcription level, female high-expression genes are mainly enriched in terms of DNA replication initiation, wnt signaling pathways, cell development and oocyte maturation, and enriched in pathways of cell cycle, progesterone-mediated oocyte maturation and oocyte meiosis. The pseudomale-highly expressed genes are mainly enriched in autophagy and cytoplasm term, and adipocytokine signaling pathway and metabolic pathway. At the protein level, cytoplasmic mRNA processing body assembly, RNA processing and protein polymerization are the top three terms female with high expression of DEP.
| Regulation | Gene            | Protein     |
|------------|----------------|-------------|
| arl1       | A0A146NN45     |             |
| cdh15      | A0A096MDF5     |             |
| dusp23     | A0A146ZK5      |             |
| gabarap    | H2TXA4         |             |
| ipo4       | E6ZID3         |             |
| LOC103377360 |            | A0A087XAG8 |
| LOC103377360 |            | H2TXA1     |
| LOC103377360 |            | P83299     |
| LOC103378288 |            | A0A0C511M5 |
| LOC103382184 |            | A0A087XC31 |
| LOC103382184 |            | Q4SP49     |
| LOC103383427 |            | E6ZII0     |
| LOC103385166 |            | G3P7M3     |
| LOC103386869 |            | D988D0     |
| LOC103386869 |            | H2U6U7     |
| LOC103394224 |            | A0A146MKB7 |
| LOC103394643 |            | A0A087XC31 |
| LOC103394643 |            | Q4SP49     |
| LOC103394879 |            | A0A146MPK8 |
| LOC103396142 |            | A0A1A8D0E5 |
| LOC103397615 |            | A0A146MPK8 |
| LOC103397682 |            | A0A087XS77 |
| LOC103397682 |            | A0A0F8CHP8 |
| map1lc3a   | A0A18ANY3      |             |
| mindy3     | A0A146X619     |             |
| prkar2a    | H3D39         |             |
| rcn2       | A0A1A7WGQ0     |             |
| rsph1      | H25C39        |             |
| trim33     | G3NML3        |             |
| ublcp1     | Q4RRW7        |             |
| ufd1       | A0A146QYH4    |             |
| xrn2       | G3PDN6        |             |
| yod1       | A0A0F8AP91    |             |
| sh3glb2    | A0A087XGK3    |             |
| arhgdia    | A0A0F8AR61    |             |
| LOC103392079 |            | A0A146NUM7 |
| LOC103395384 |            | A0A146UX93 |
| ei5enifi1  | A0A146ZY27    |             |
| elavl2     | A0A1A8LH22    |             |
| aldh6a1    | H2M098        |             |
| LOC103386097 |            | H2MEF1     |

(continued on next page)
Table 3 (continued)

| Regulation    | Gene       | Protein        |
|---------------|------------|----------------|
| LOC107988558  | gpt        | H3CRT8         |
| LOC107988558  | LOC107988558 | H3CVU7         |
| zar1          | I3J4P9     |                |
| ybx2          | I3KRX0     |                |
| LOC103377398  | LOC103377398 | Q4RMZ0         |
| Up Genes      | LOC103383309 | A0A1A7WHV4    |
| Down Proteins | LOC103377896 | A0A1A8EVF9    |
| hspd1         | LOC103393907 | D9I8D0         |
| Down Genes    | LOC103393908 | D9I8D0         |
| Up Proteins   | LOC103376887 | E6ZII0         |

Notes.
Up and down refers to the expression in pseudomales compared with females.

enrichment. RNA degradation, spliceosome and metabolic pathways are the top three pathways female with high expression of DEP enrichment. However, regulation of DNA-templated transcription, elongation is the high expression of proteins in pseudomales enrich the most significant term. Protein processing in endoplasmic reticulum, PPAR signaling pathway and fatty acid biosynthesis were the top three pathways of the pseudomale highly expressed proteins.

**ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AND DECLARATIONS**

**Funding**
This study was financially supported by Central Public-interest Scientific Institution Basal Research Fund, CAFS (NO.2019A003) and the Special Scientific Research Funds for Central Non-profit Institutes, Chinese Academy of Fishery Sciences (2020TD24). The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

**Grant Disclosures**
The following grant information was disclosed by the authors:
Central Public-interest Scientific Institution Basal Research Fund, CAFS: NO.2019A003.
Special Scientific Research Funds for Central Non-profit Institutes, Chinese Academy of Fishery Sciences: 2020TD24.

**Competing Interests**
The authors declare there are no competing interests.

**Author Contributions**
- Zhan Ye performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.
- Weifeng Wang analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, and approved the final draft.
• Yaqun Zhang conceived and designed the experiments, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.
• Liping Wang and Yu Cui performed the experiments, prepared figures and/or tables, and approved the final draft.
• Hengde Li conceived and designed the experiments, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.

Animal Ethics
The following information was supplied relating to ethical approvals (i.e., approving body and any reference numbers):
  The Chinese Academy of Fishery Sciences provided full approval for this research.

DNA Deposition
The following information was supplied regarding the deposition of DNA sequences:
  The raw data of transcriptomes and proteomics obtained in this bioproject (PRJNA586726) are available at Genbank: SRR10492824, SRR10492825, SRR10492826, SRR10492827, SRR10492828, SRR10492829, SRR10492830, SRR10492831.

Data Availability
The following information was supplied regarding data availability:
  The data is available at Zenodo: Ye, Zhan. (2020). sex reversal transcriptomic analysis in Chinese tongue sole [Data set]. Zenodo. http://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3507269.

Supplemental Information
Supplemental information for this article can be found online at http://dx.doi.org/10.7717/peerj.8801#supplemental-information.

REFERENCES

Anatole G, Brian B, Petyuk VA, Luz O, Raffi H, Mungrue IN, Farber CR, Janet S, Kang HM, Nicholas F. 2011. Comparative analysis of proteome and transcriptome variation in mouse. *PLOS Genetics* 7:e1001393 DOI 10.1371/journal.pgen.1001393.

Becker K, Bluhm A, Casas-Vila N, Dinges N, Dejung M, Sayols S, Kreutz C, Roignant JY, Butter F, Legewie S. 2018. Quantifying post-transcriptional regulation in the development of *Drosophila melanogaster*. *Nature Communications* 9:4970 DOI 10.1038/s41467-018-07455-9.

Biason-Lauber A, Konrad D, Navratil F, Schoenle EJ. 2004. A WNT4 mutation associated with Müllerian-duct regression and virilization in a 46,XX woman. *The New England Journal of Medicine* 351:792–798 DOI 10.1056/NEJMo040533.

Carroll TJ, Park JS, Hayashi S, Majumdar A, McMahon AP. 2005. Wnt9b plays a central role in the regulation of mesenchymal to epithelial transitions underlying organogenesis of the mammalian urogenital system. *Developmental Cell* 9:283–292 DOI 10.1016/j.devcel.2005.05.016.
Chen S, Tian Y, Yang J, Shao C, Ji X, Zhai J, Liao X, Zhuang Z, Su P, Xu J. 2009. Artificial gynogenesis and sex determination in half-smooth tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*). *Marine Biotechnology* 11:243–251 DOI 10.1007/s10126-008-9139-0.

Christopher EK, Rex AH, Gary CA. 2004. Immunofluorescence reveals ubiquitination of retained distal cytoplasmic droplets on ejaculated porcine spermatozoa. *Journal of Andrology* 25:340–347 DOI 10.1002/j.1939-4640.2004.tb02798.x.

Cui Y, Wang W, Ma L, Jie J, Zhang Y, Wang H, Li H. 2018. New locus reveals the genetic architecture of sex reversal in the Chinese tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*). *Heredity* 121:319–326 DOI 10.1038/s41437-018-0126-6.

Cui Z, Liu Y, Wang W, Wang Q, Zhang N, Lin F, Wang N, Shao C, Dong Z, Li Y, Yang Y, Hu M, Li H, Gao F, Wei Z, Meng L, Liu Y, Wei M, Zhu Y, Guo H, Cheng C, Schartl M, Chen S. 2017. Genome editing reveals dmrt1 as an essential male sex-determining gene in Chinese tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*). *Scientific Reports* 7:42213 DOI 10.1038/srep42213.

Dong X, Chen S, Ji X. 2010. Molecular cloning and expression analysis of Dmrt3 gene in half-smooth tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*). *Journal of Fisheries of China* 34(4):531–539 DOI 10.3724/SP.J.1231.2010.06660.

Gao J, Wang X, Zou Z, Jia X, Wang Y, Zhang Z. 2014. Transcriptome analysis of the differences in gene expression between testis and ovary in green mud crab. *BMC Genomics* 15:585–600 DOI 10.1186/1471-2164-15-585.

Gygi SP, Rochon Y, Franza BR, Aebersold R. 1999. Correlation between protein abundance and mRNA expression levels on a genomic scale. *Genome Biology* 4:117 DOI 10.1186/gb-2003-4-9-117.

Hershko A, Ciechanover A. 1998. The ubiquitin system. *Annual Review of Biochemistry* 67:425–479 DOI 10.1146/annurev.biochem.67.1.425.

Jiang L, Li H. 2017. Single locus maintains large variation of sex reversal in half-smooth tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*). *G3: Genes Genomes Genetics* 7:583–589 DOI 10.1534/g3.116.036822.

Jordan BK, Mohammed M, Ching ST, Delot E, Chen XN, Dewing P, Swain A, Rao PN, Elejalde BR, Vilain E. 2001. Up-regulation of WNT-4 signaling and dosage-sensitive sex reversal in humans. *American Society of Human Genetics* 68:1102–1109 DOI 10.1086/320125.

Kramer A, Robles MS, Cox J, Mann M. 2014. In-vivo quantitative proteomics reveals a key contribution of post-transcriptional mechanisms to the circadian regulation of liver metabolism. *PLOS Genetics* 10:e1004047 DOI 10.1371/journal.pgen.1004047.
Li X, Zhang C, Gong T, Ni X, Li J, Zhan D, Liu M, Song L, Ding C, Xu J, Zheng B, Wang Y, Qin J. 2018. A time-resolved multi-omic atlas of the developing mouse stomach. *Nature Communications* 9:4910 DOI 10.1038/s41467-018-07463-9.

Li ZJ, Yang LJ, Wang J, Shi WC, Pawar RA, Liu YM, Xu CG, Cong WH, Hu QR, Lu TY. 2010. β-Actin is a useful internal control for tissue-specific gene expression studies using quantitative real-time PCR in the half-smooth tongue sole *Cynoglossus semilaevis* challenged with LPS or vibrio anguillarum. *Fish and Shellfish Immunology* 29:89–93 DOI 10.1016/j.fsi.2010.02.021.

Liu J, Liu X, Jin C, Du X, He Y, Zhang Q. 2019. Transcriptome profiling insights the feature of sex reversal induced by high temperature in tongue sole *Cynoglossus semilaevis*. *Frontiers in Genetics* 10:522 DOI 10.3389/fgene.2019.00522.

Liu Y, Chen SL, Gao FT, Meng L, Hu QM, Song WT, Shao CW, Lv WQ. 2014. SCAR-transformation of sex-specific SSR marker and its application in half-smooth tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*). *Journal of Agricultural Biotechnology* 22:787–792.

Livak KJ, Schmittgen TD. 2001. Analysis of relative gene expression data using real-time quantitative PCR and the 2−ΔΔCT method. *Methods* 25:402–408 DOI 10.1006/meth.2001.1262.

Lovercamp KW, Safranski TJ, Fischer KA, Manandhar G, Sutovsky M, Herring W, Sutovsky P. 2008. Arachidonate 15-lipoxygenase and ubiquitin as fertility markers in boars. *Theriogenology* 67:704–718 DOI 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2006.08.019.

Lyu Q, Hu J, Yang X, Liu X, Chen Y, Xiao L, Liu Y, Wang Q, Chen J, Huang M, Yu Z, Yang H, Shi H, Zhang Y, Zhao H. 2019. Expression profiles of dmrt and foxl during gonadal development and sex reversal induced by 17α-methyltestosterone in the orange-spotted grouper. *General and Comparative Endocrinology* 274:26–36 DOI 10.1016/j.ygcen.2018.12.014.

Muratori M, Marchiani S, Forli G, Baldi E. 2005. Sperm ubiquitination positively correlates to normal morphology in human semen. *Human Reproduction* 20:1035–1043 DOI 10.1093/humrep/deh678.

Ozanon C, Chouteau J, Sutovsky P. 2005. Clinical adaptation of the sperm tag immunoassay (SUTI): relationship of sperm ubiquitylation with sperm quality in gradient-purified semen samples from 93 men from a general infertility clinic population. *Human Reproduction* 20:2271–2278 DOI 10.1093/humrep/dei013.

Peter S, Evelyn N, Gerald S. 2002. Ubiquitin-dependent sperm quality control mechanism recognizes spermatozoa with DNA defects as revealed by dual ubiquitin–TUNEL assay. *Molecular Reproduction and Development* 61:406–413 DOI 10.1002/mrd.10101.

Peter S, Regina MT, Saima H, Miriam S. 2003. Differential ubiquitination of stallion sperm proteins: possible implications for infertility and reproductive seasonality. *Biology of Reproduction* 68:688–698 DOI 10.1095/biolreprod.102.005306.

Sheng Y, Chen B, Zhang L, Luo M, Cheng H, Zhou R. 2014. Identification of Dmrt genes and their up-regulation during gonad transformation in the swamp eel (*Monopterus albus*). *Molecular Biology Reports* 41:1237–1245 DOI 10.1007/s11033-013-2968-6.
Smith PK, Krohn RI, Hermanson GT, Mallia AK, Gartner FH, Provenzano MD, Fujimoto EK, Goekte NM, Olson BJ, Klenk DC. 1985. Measurement of protein using bicinchoninic acid. *Analytical Biochemistry* **150**:76–85 DOI 10.1016/0003-2697(85)90442-7.

Sutovsky P, Terada Y, Schatten G. 2001. Ubiquitin-based sperm assay for the diagnosis of male factor infertility. *Human Reproduction* **16**:250–258 DOI 10.1093/humrep/16.2.250.

Tian Y, Wang D, Xu Y, Chen S. 2011. Effects of rearing temperature on growth and sex determination in the half-smooth tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*). *Journal of Fisheries of China* **35**:176–182.

Uhlenhaut NH, Jakob S, Anlag K, Eisenberger T, Sekido R, Kress J, Treier A, Klugmann C, Klasen C, Holter NI, Riethmacher D, Schütz G, Cooney AJ, Badge RL, Treier M. 2009. Somatic sex reprogramming of adult ovaries to testes by FOXL2 ablation. *Cell* **139**:1130–1142 DOI 10.1016/j.cell.2009.11.021.

Wang D, Tian Y, Qi W, Wen H, Chen S. 2014. Effect of temperature on the growth and sex steroid concentration of the half-smooth tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*). *Journal of Fisheries of China* **38**:1828–1836.

Wang N, Wang R, Wang R, Chen S. 2018. Transcriptomics analysis revealing candidate networks and genes for the body size sexual dimorphism of Chinese tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*). *Functional & Integrative Genomics* **18**:327–339 DOI 10.1007/s10142-018-0595-y.

Wang P, Zheng M, Liu J, Liu Y, Lu J, Sun X. 2016. Sexually dimorphic gene expression associated with growth and reproduction of tongue sole (*Cynoglossus semilaevis*) revealed by brain transcriptome analysis. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences* **17**:1402 DOI 10.3390/ijms17091402.

Wang Q, Cui Z, Guo H, Zhang N, Xu W, Yang Y, Chen S. 2019. Functional analysis of the promoter of the dmrt1 gene in Chinese tongue sole, Cynoglossus semilaevis. *Journal of Oceanology and Limnology* **37**(4):1333–1341 DOI 10.1007/s00343-019-8182-1.

Wisniewski J, Zougman A, Nagaraj N, Mann M. 2009. Universal sample preparation method for proteome analysis. *Nature Methods* **6**:359–362 DOI 10.1038/NMETH.1322.

Xiao H, Zhang Y, Kim Y, Kim S, Kim JJ, Kim KM, Yoshizawa J, Fan LY, Cao CX, Wong DT. 2016. Differential proteomic analysis of human saliva using tandem mass tags quantification for gastric cancer detection. *Scientific Reports* **6**:22165 DOI 10.1038/srep22165.

Yamaguchi A, Lee KH, Fujimoto H, Kadamura K, Yasumoto S, Matsuyama M. 2006. Expression of the *Dmrt* gene and its roles in early gonadal development of the Japanese pufferfish Takifugu rubripes. *Comparative Biochemistry & Physiology Part D Genomics & Proteomics* **1**:59–68 DOI 10.1016/j.cbd.2005.08.003.

Zhang X, Guan G, Li M, Zhu F, Hong Y. 2016. Autosomal gsdf acts as a male sex initiator in the fish medaka. *Scientific Reports* **6**:19738 DOI 10.1038/srep19738.