ABSTRACT

The Education System of our country, Bhutan has initiated for intersection of Geography and History curricula as Social Studies in lower classes for providing opportunities to explore students’ prior learning with historical and geographical content designed to support in acquisition goals of learning History and Geography as segregated subjects in higher classes. Such integration of subject is deemed as socio-cultural, geographical and historical knowledge are gathered and accumulated from home and community settings. Therefore, to instill concepts and facts in the children at early stage, bilingual educational instruction has felt very necessary for primary students so that they can grasp the essential and core concept of subjects to determine for enhancing their cultural and historical facts. This miniature action research will evaluate the outcome of using bilingualism as an educational instruction for imparting concept of social studies contents. The targeted population for this action research was grade VI children studying in Dangchu Primary School under Wangduephodrang Dzongkhag. This study will also explore the benefits of using bilingualism as an educational instruction for teaching social studies by adopting National Language (Dzongkha) as an alternative medium of instruction for explaining and discussing for clarifying contents in subject. The Scaffolding and Trans-language strategies were applied during the social studies teaching periods and positive results were recorded after the intervention strategies were used and the academic performance was drastically improved with intervention strategies and also encouraged students for more classroom participation and concepts were clarified. Bilingualism as medium of educational instructions proved to be the best teaching strategies to improve herself/herself in teaching in turn it enhances learning outcome of the students.
1. INTRODUCTION

Language is the medium of instructions for disseminating relevant knowledge, right information and appropriate content so that listener or recipients attain accurate and precise massages. The education system of our country demands English as medium of instruction based on the materials such as text books, supplementary readers and etc were prescribed in English except Dzongkha subject (National Language).

The English being second language in our country and adopted as medium of instruction in the classroom teaching, it hinders providing right content in the subject as most of the Dzongkha Terms is difficult to explain in English by the teachers and ultimately scores in Social Studies during exam is observed low performance [1-5]. To uplift the performance of the students in social studies by using Dzongkha also as medium instruction, this research is carried out to validate the impact of using Dzongkha as medium of instruction. Specifically, the education of an individual is measured broadly with the yardstick of language acquisition and ones’ ability to communicate in English. In USA were implemented only English as medium of Instruction and demotivated the bilingual learners. Many students Moreover, NCLB was implemented with English instructional approach where bilinguals were completely ignored as the schools discontinued their bilingual teaching methods in the name of implementing NCLB [6-10]. Contradictory, the education system in Bhutan required usage of bilingual as medium of Instruction to provide better and quality education.

Speaking more than one language, many argue, is necessary in today’s global world as this opens wider career and educational opportunities and facilitates cross cultural communication (Jaumont, [11]; among others). Thus, it is necessary for educational institutions to meet the multi-literacy needs of students especially in light of the strong influence from monolingual medium proponents and their work on academic English which often does not take minority languages into account at university levels. Rong [12] highlighted the challenge that educational institutions need to address.

The language of instruction is the medium through which knowledge is transmitted during the educational process. Because of this, the issue of what language the teachers use when giving lectures and what language is used to compile the text materials they adopt becomes a core issue in educational development for any multiethnic, multilingual country.

The understanding of subject content will be enhanced if teachers use bilingualism as medium of instruction in teaching social studies in the classroom. To authenticate the aims of improving social studies content, this action research is carried out.

1.1 Objectives of Study

a) To understand the quality of learning social studies by grade six children.
b) To analyze the reasons that hinders academic performance of social studies by grade six children.
c) To study the effectiveness of using bilingualism as medium of educational instruction to improve quality of learning Social Studies of the grade six children.

1.2 Action Research Questions

How can I improve teaching social studies in class VI?

a) Are bi-lingual instruction results good performance in social studies?
b) Why does social studies subject require bi-lingual instructions?
c) What are common learning difficulties faced by the grade six children in social studies?

2. RECONNAISSANCE

Grundy [13] has pointed out that reconnaissance often consists in going backwards and forwards for a while between reflections and collecting evidence (p13). Moreover, Maxwell [14] explained that reconnaissance consists of three parts such as situational analysis that analyze the situation in terms of a range of factors such as resources and practices; competences that describes the profile and competences of researcher; and Literature review that links with the previous work in this field and their findings. "Reconnaissance is preliminary information gathering. It consists of analysing the situation in
which the problem is identified, competence of the teacher researcher and participants, and relevant literature to produce research questions that will lead to improvement [15-17]. All the three components are interconnected to clarify, review and strengthen the formulation of AR questions. The three components are usually completed over the same period of time." (Royal Education Council) These three components of reconnaissance are discussed.

2.1 Situational Analysis

The researcher felt that Dangchu Primary School would the best sampling school since researcher is working in the same school. This school is located in the western part of the country wherein most people speak Dzongkha as their mother tongue and students are well acquainted with Dzongkha language. The school provides education from Pre-Primary till sixth grade following the national prescribed curriculum. The performance of social studies subjects in upper primary classes in Dangchu Primary School are found deteriorating and it has become questionable for academic achievement in social studies subject by the stakeholders. Growing number of students with poor perception of values and moral incorporate in social studies subject has become concern against the National goal of providing quality education [18,19]. The English is used as Medium of Instruction in almost all the subjects (Mathematics, Science, Social Studies) wherein that requires sufficient proficiency to capture true of subject for better performance in academic.

As per the Academic Learning Scorecard (ALS) record of the grade six students in the annual Examination 2021. The Social studies subjects has scored below average in written exam which was 42.4% and the ALS target set by the school for the academic year 2021 was 58%. The target set by the school was not achieved and was it failure from Teacher or students? If action research is not carried out by this time, the students of class in 2022 will land up in similar situation as ALS target is remained same (58%). Students were found difficulty in understanding medium of instruction since the school is located in semi-remote of the country wherein less exposure to Second language (English). The existing norms and curriculum policies in the school articulates social studies must be taught in English as medium of instruction. The diagram below shows ALS for grade VI in 2021. This diagram determines that the grade VI students are lagging behind in social studies performance.
Thus, the study is focused on how to improve learning and teaching of socials studies to achieve better result in 2022.

2.2 Competence

The researcher is almost two decades into teaching profession and 10 years as school leader which made the researchers more competent with thorough knowledge in education curriculum. I have gained skills to carry out such research during my master degree program. Similarly, various universities and ministry of Education have conducted training and workshop on action research for all the teachers across the country wherein I was one of the participants as well. I am novice to the classroom action research but I do have basic skills and knowledge to carry out research as stated above.

After analyzing social studies exam paper of 2021 and present test performance of the students, the researcher noticed that urgently required to be conducted study on poor performance of the students in social studies. The genuine interventions are required to uplift and improve performance of the students at early stage. Therefore, the researcher wanted to find certain way forward to enhance and improve teaching strategy of the researcher ultimately performance of the students will be lifted.

2.3 Literature Review

2.3.1 Bilingual as medium of educational instruction

It is significant to understand how bilingualism is currently viewed and its relationship to a medium of Educational instruction. Research in the 20th century indicates that speaking in more than one language confuses the learner (Baker & Wright, 2017) while on the other, students speaking and studying in more than one language are ‘smarter’, have more developed cognitive skills, and can better process information from the environment and thus show more of an ability for learning than that of monolinguals [20,21,22] (Baker & Wright, 2017). Thus, believed that students who speaks or understand more than one language are smarter and grasp accurate information faster than student with monolinguals.

Spolsky [23] had proposed a theory and model for bilingual educational instruction but at the same time highlighted its complexity and its dependency on certain factors and situations. However, the Bhutanese designed curriculum demands English as medium of Educational Instruction for teaching Social Studies and use of Dzongkha as one of medium of Instruction would enhance the academic performance in social studies subject.
Golash Boza [24] argues that a bilingual educational instruction has advantages over a monolingual educational instruction, and its advantages, especially for grasping and comprehending core content of subjects.

Many people think that someone capable of two or more languages has one load and cognitive barriers to students. However, this has no basis. On the contrary, research has found that bilingualism and creative thinking are related to one another. According to Baker and Jones (2009), based on psychological tests, it has been concluded that children who have bilingual skills are better at fluency, originality, flexibility, and thinking elaboration than those who only speak one language. High creativity is one factor that influences the development of high-level cognitive function in bilingualism [25]. This is because bilinguals have a wide range of words and a large selection of words. Then, in the cognitive shutter, another thing can be used as an EMI utility, namely metalinguistic awareness.

According to Ramirez et al. [26], metalinguistic awareness is the ability to separate oneself from the content of speech to reflect and manipulate language structure. Altman et al. (2018) discovered a relationship between vocabulary size and metalinguistic awareness skills in early learners. They discovered that when comparing bilingual learners from various dominance groups to monolingual learners, bilingual learners had more metalinguistic awareness. In this idea, one’s bilingual ability allows that person to be more sensitive in analyzing language. Their spontaneous of this will be higher than other students, especially in vocabulary learning. Hence, the use of EMI can affect a person’s language skills as well as bilingualism.

2.3.2 Policy on Bilingual as medium of Educational instruction

Dearden (2016) stated that to what degree bilingualism as the medium of instruction is effective has not been without debate. Recently, some studies have cautioned the fast-growing introduction of English as the medium of instruction (EMI) at all levels of education and in many countries worldwide. These studies point out that governmental language policies that ‘impose’ EMI seem to be ‘eradicating’ the national language and/or the minority languages and in turn the heritages and cultures of the country concerned. English as a lingua franca indirectly is challenging national languages as it quickly spreads as the global language for communication, markets and education worldwide [27,28]. Thus, bilingual education felt necessary to promote national language and better cognitive development. Some of the schools in our country has adopted language policy whereby only English will be accepted as medium of instruction in teaching subjects expect Dzongkha (National Language).

Recently, however, Dearden (2016 among others) noted that in a study carried out on 55 Western and Eastern countries that, although students and instructors favored English Medium of Instruction (EMI), more prevalent in private institutions though, they would prefer having the national language along with English and thus bilingual education.

Wiley [29] identified several language policy orientations which influence the selection of languages in schools. By viewing language policies in terms of the desired outcome – promotion, tolerance, restriction, or repression – we can anticipate the type of support there will be for student bilingualism and teacher preparation for language minority students. Restrictive- and repressive-oriented language policies both perceive minority languages as a problem. They differ by degree. Repressive language policy orientations were exemplified in the Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) schools in the United States which sanctioned the use of indigenous languages and fostered linguistic assimilation [29]. Restrictive language policies do not seek to eliminate the language, but they set sanctions on the use of minority language.

There are several insights into bi/multilingual education in postcolonial contexts which can be drawn from this vignette. First, the fact that more than half a century after Kenya’s independence, Kimbeere teaching and learning materials have not been developed is a microcosm of “mother tongue education quandary” [30] in postcolonial contexts in which “planning tends to be equated with policy-making alone, while implementation tends to be treated with lack of serious concern or even downright levity” [31].

In fact, no such policy has been implemented by the Government but certainly Language policy is required so that hesitation of using bilingual in the classroom teaching will be clarified. Therefore I saw the need for an empirical study on bilingual as medium of educational instruction in relation to primary schools.
2.3.3 Benefits of bilingual

Knowing two languages at an early age presents challenges for both the learner and the teacher. According to Pransiska (2017), various studies suggest that treating bilingual children provides many benefits and advantages. Various methods, methods and special attractions are applied so that learners can receive knowledge well from the teacher, especially applying new languages. According to Baker [32], there are several benefits that can be felt when knowing bilingual, including:

a. Cognitive Benefits

Bilingualism has been connected to a number of cognitive gains. Cognitive function refers to the brain's ability to obtain information. Individuals who are raised in a bilingual environment have better competence than only in one language [33]. In the cognitive aspects related to the brain's mechanism for obtaining information. Pointedly, being bilingual significantly from an early age changes the makeup of the human brain.

b. Social-Emotional

Benefits Children who know how to be bilingual make friends using their L2 because they can converse in more than one language. This can create new networks in a global world. Not only that, children also learn new cultures through another language. In other words, if someone learns a language, it means that they also learn the culture too. Children are bilingual, and it is easier to make friends than others in a cultural setting [34]. Hence, children have attitudes and respect for other cultures and groups as well.

c. Academic Benefits

Speaking more than one language can open up great opportunities for children to continue their education and provide a more proper education in the future. When they were introduced to English from the very beginning, especially in kindergarten, it brought positive things which could affect their lives in the future. As concluded by Jafar, the early years of young children are proven to be effective for bilinguals who are going to learn another language to engage in the language learning community (as cited in Pransiska, 2017). In even better education, most requirements are for at least one reason: at one stage, it was the language, especially the test of English, which was globalized and could not be denied. When children are introduced to L2, especially English, it will give positive things impact on a child's future [35]. Not only that, this too encourages students, especially at an early age, to learn two languages in preparation for future competition in the job market. Hence, to master a different L2 is a grip for children in the future.

3. SAMPLING

Only one section comprising of 14 students of grade six were selected for sampling of my study. The focus sampling is used for the purpose of study and to get authentic result. The participants' age ranges from 10 years to 13 years old. All selected participants are used for experimenting on analyzing the academic performance in social studies and to provide necessary interventions for improvement. The most of the children came from uneducated family and few from working class family. Therefore, the mixed family backgrounds often hindered understanding of the local word meaning translated in English where essence of concept is lost. The selected group of students are of ‘mixed ability grouping’.

4. TIME FRAME

This study was carried out from first week of May, 2022 to last week of July, 2022. It was designed based on the result analysis of 2021 and analyzing the class/ chapter/unit test answer scripts, finding the need of the children in grade six children. The table below shows the time frame of the study on analyzing social studies performance and way forward for improving the performance.

| Sl. No. | Activities | Timeline (From) | Timeline (To) | Status |
|---------|------------|----------------|---------------|--------|
| 1       | Analyzing result of 2021 social studies | May 1st | May 20 | Done |
| 2       | Data collection | May 23 | June 17 | Done |
| 3       | Pretest | 4th week of June | 1st week of July | Done |
| 4       | Error analysis | 1st week of July | 2nd week of July | Done |
| 5       | Lesson Intervention | 1st week of July after error | Done |

Table 1. Time frame of the AR study

Phuentsho; SAJSSE, 15(3): 45-59, 2022; Article no.SAJSSE.90454
5. METHODOLOGY

The classroom action research is one of the practical studies to create a school better performer through the collaboration of researchers, students, teachers and other related stakeholders. Such action research would enhance and encourage teachers to use strategies and methodologies generated from this research. The qualitative method is used in this research to find the quality of teaching strategies of social studies for grade six children and some of the strategies to be developed for further implementation. The researcher used this design to bring out the methods and strategies to improve the teaching after analyzing their standards. These methods are one of the best for the researchers to generate aimed and required for the research to have meaningful and measurable outcome.

![Concept map of the process of Action research](image)

6. RESEARCH INSTRUMENT

The Qualitative study is employed in this research process. The instruments used in this study are: result analysis to get clear picture of problem, pretest and posttest of content from social studies for intervention purposes. The focus group discussion was carried out with the students in two groups of seven members each to get better result of research. The pre-test and posttest are the reliable research instrument to have reality intervention methodology in teaching to improve academic performance in social studies. The researcher perceived with these many research instrument will truly generate good result from this action research which ultimately benefits teachers and students in their day to day learning teaching.

6.1 Analysis of Result

The social studies result for 2021 was thoroughly analyzed based on questions paper designed by the teachers for annual examination of 2021 academic year and lesson plan as well. The result analysis articulates that common error made in exam was mainly chapter/topics/concept having National Language (Dzongkha) terminology which basically explained and translated in English. It seems students are
unusual to grasp correct meaning of term. It also indicates that less marks were scored with open ended questions whereas most of the closed questions were answered.

6.2 Pretest and Posttest

Pre-test is a non-graded assessment tool used to determine pre-existing subject knowledge. Typically pre-tests are administered prior to a course to determine knowledge baseline, but here they are used to test students prior to topical material coverage throughout the course. While counterintuitive, the pre-tests cover material the student is not expected to know, but serve as a motivational tool and a road map for the students, resulting in improved academic performance. To examine understanding of the children, students are conducted pretest with variety of question types (both closed and open ended questions). They were assessed on the following question types 1) closed questions, 2) opened ended questions, 3) translated term in English. This pretest was conducted as the diagnostic test to analysis and find out performance of individual student. Based on pretest result analysis, the researcher came up with the intervention strategies of using bilingual as medium of educational instruction.

Finally, a posttest conducted is an assessment measure given to participants after they have received treatment as part of a research study. A pretest-posttest research design must provide participants with the same assessment measures before and after treatment in order to determine if any changes can be connected to the treatment. The posttest was conducted to find out children’s improvement in academic performance of social studies subject. The post test was conducted with the same questions as pretest. Pretest and posttest identify the current level of academic performance in social studies subject of the students and their improvement.

6.3 Focus Group Discussion

The researcher has discussion with focus group having two groups of seven members each. During the discussion, the researcher posed open ended questions about bilingual as medium of educational instruction in classroom teaching and the group response are noted. Later the researcher analysis answers provided by the group.

Cohen and Crabtree [36] have defined focus group discussion as an effective qualitative data collection tool, where a group of people with similar background are brought together to discuss and share their attitude, perception, perspective and satisfaction on a specific topic. Therefore, the FGD generated the factors which is effecting low performance in social studies subjects and it also provides clear picture to the researchers to intervene with appropriate teaching strategies. This data triangulates the children’s reason that hinders learning.

6.4. Questionnaires

The purpose of setting questionnaires is basically to acquire the real learning and understanding of the concept of social studies from the participants. The content of the questionnaires are purely on usage of medium of instruction either in English or Dzongkha so that students understand better in learning social studies subject. The focus participants are from class VI Total participants are as Table 2.

The gender ratio of participants is almost equally used to avoid gender responsiveness and the consent was sought from the subject teacher for participants to participate for collecting data through questionnaires. The questionnaires were focus mainly for uses of bilingualism as medium of educational instruction in teaching social in the class.

| Table 2. Total participants |
|----------------------------|
| Sl No | Class | Gender | Total |
|      |       | Boys   | Girls |
| 1    | VI    | 6      | 8     | 14    |

52
7. ACTION PROGRAM

Based on my personal experiences of teaching social studies subject and the error made by the students in their pretest and based on focus group discussion, the intervention strategies were adopted from literature review to be implemented to improve performance in social studies subject. Such adopted strategies will address the research question such as: What are the effective strategies to be adopted to improve academic performance in social studies? The intervention program were conducted from 1st week of July to third week of July, 2022.

7.1 Use of Bilingual (Both English and Dzongkha)

The teacher used both English and Dzongkha as medium of instruction in teaching social studies in grade VI. The students were given equal opportunity to speak and discuss both language during social studies period. Even digital presentation in the ICT lab were done in both and guest speakers were invited locally to share their views in related topics in National language.

7.2 Group Discussion Activities in Both Language

The group discussion activities were inspired as one of strategies to learn content in social studies though all the materials supplied by the Ministry are in English but students were allowed to discuss and share among their friends either in English or Dzongkha. During presentation the use of language was not restricted.

8. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The purpose of this study was to explore strategies to address low performance of social studies in the school. A number of themes have emerged from the study. The findings from the study have helped to broaden the strategies to be used to for teaching social studies subject in the classroom.

Jaumont (2018) stated that speaking or learning more than one language, many argue, is necessary in today’s global world as this opens wider career and educational opportunities and facilitates cross cultural communication. Similarly, this empirical study supports that if teacher explains and discuss content of the subject using more than one language, the student’s performance improves drastically.

8.1 Diagnostic Pretest, Questionnaire and Focus Group Discussion

The pre-test result indicates that the students have not done well as teacher used only English as medium of Instruction for explaining during classroom teaching. Teacher allowed student to have group discussion and class presentation in English. The pre-test was conducted based on ALS (Academic Learning scorecard) of year 2021. To intervene weakness, the strategies for learning teaching social studies were adopted.

The pre-test was conducted on the topic tradition and culture and implemented during the diagnostic test (pretest).

8.2 Misconception of Terminology Used in Dzongkha

Explanation of term used in text increases as the subject matters become specialized. In academic settings, academic texts may contain terminology rarely used in everyday life. At the tertiary level, a popular educational approach in teaching content knowledge is through bilingual. Using bilingual as a medium of instruction is to provide Excellency academic content. The instructors’ responsibilities are to find an appropriate method to promote meanings for readers (Krangler, Martin & Walker, 2005). Therefore, transmitting academic content through English is suggested to be implemented with explicit language or instructional supports [37] (Gibson, 1985).

Therefore, grade VI finds difficult to grasp Dzongkha terminologies used in the text but explanation is made in English by teachers. The Dzongkha Terminologies were not explained in 1st Language Dzongkha. Almost all the topic in social studies contains Dzongkha Terminologies which finds difficult to be explained in English. During intervention stage, the Dzongkha terminologies used in text were explained both in English and Dzongkha whereby posttest has better result. It indicates that using bilingual as medium instruction is very helpful understanding the content.
8.3 Analysis of Posttest

After the result analysis of pretest, researcher has adopted intervention strategies of explaining content of social studies subject both in Dzongkha and English as well. Students were allowed to discuss either in English or Dzongkha whichever they felt comfortable. Similarly, presentation in the class are allowed to present language of their choice. The posttest indicates that there were lots of improvement in the test as it happened due to encouragement of discussion and explanation in Dzongkha since all the students understand Dzongkha better than English.

The below comparison graph of pre-test and posttest (Fig. 4) shows that the students of grade VI have drastically improved in their test due to implementation of bilingual strategy.

8.4 Analysis of Questionnaire for Students

Questionnaires are defined as any text-based instrument that give survey participants a series of questions to answer or statements to respond to either by indicating a response by marking a page, writing a number or checking a box on paper or online, for example [38,39,40]. Similarly, to investigate the preferable or comfortable usage of Language by the students and competency of using English and Dzongkha language have been surveyed through questionnaires.

Gluck (2004) stated that a questionnaire is the main means of collecting quantitative primary data. A questionnaire enables quantitative data to be collected in a standardized way so that the data are internally consistent and coherent for analysis. Questionnaires should always have a definite purpose that is related to the objectives of the research, and it needs to be clear from the outset how the findings will be used.

I have also used questionnaire as one my instrument to collect data to have explicit information from the participants. The below graphs (Fig. 5) shows that students use maximum of Dzongkha in their daily communication. They too prefer to use Dzongkha as medium of instruction in learning and teaching social studies as per questionnaire collected.

The Fig. 6 indicates that most of the students prefer to use Dzongkha as medium of instruction while teaching and learning social studies. Out 14 students in grade VI 10 students prefer to communicate and learn better in Dzongkha as medium of educational instruction.

8.5 Focus Group Discussions Analysis

The Focus Group discussion helps the researcher to understand better about learner’s views of using bilingual as medium of Instruction in teaching social studies subject. The students do not enjoy teaching social studies in English as most of the social studies topics are in the context our country such religious facts, environmental issues, social issues, governmental systems and few topics related to globally. Some of the students shared following viewpoints.

![Fig. 4. Analysis of test](image-url)
Fig. 5. Daily communication

"I don't enjoy explaining social studies in English because it is boring, difficult, and lack of knowledge in English Term".

"I don’t feel like to attend class, since I am weak in English".

Therefore, they consider social studies is boring subject and consider themselves below satisfactory in terms of English competency. Most of the students express their views to explanation and discussion to be done both English and Dzongkha so that they understand better.

"I love to listen and discuss more when teacher gives opportunity to speak in Dzongkha."

"I can do well in exam if social studies terminologies are explain in both languages".

"It is very hard to express my views due to shortage of English Vocabulary".

When the researcher analyzed their feelings, the weaknesses are termed as difficulty in understanding social studies. They are vulnerable in deteriorating their standards of performance better academic due to barrier of language used in text and explanation made by teachers.

Some of the external forces to be considered in low performance of social studies lack of guidance and support from teachers, parents and
other stakeholders as this subject is term as minor. Some students shared that economic scarcity and problems faced in family matters that they do not get enough time to discuss with parents and other people and ultimately deprive of interests in studying. Some of the feelings shared are:

“All my family members speak Dzongkha at home”.

“My parents are not supporting me to study”

“The village people and parents explains in Dzongkha but when I come to class it is difficult for me to express in English.”

Students need support and guidance from external society to prop their learning and grasp concept of social studies locally or society available materials.

9. LIMITATIONS

This study was carried out only for grade six students of Dangchu Primary School and may not have 100% accuracy findings to have very effectiveness intervention strategies for improving learning and teaching social studies subject. This research also emphasized exploring the factors that hinders better performance in social studies subjects. The result and finding give positive feelings as everything did as per the procedure of research. However, there are some limitations to be noted to further strengthening the research.

1) The time constraint: The study carried out only a month long duration where intervention processes were not able to implement effectively and it was observed that for improvement in social studies academic performance, adequate duration is required to study across the content of social studies.

2) Sample Participants: The number of participants in this research is limited to 14 students of grade six and this finding cannot be generalized to all the grade in the school. Huge number of participants should be selected for better result and must also include student from different schools based on location (Urban and rural).

3) Authenticity of findings: The findings in the research may not be 100% accuracy due to lack of researcher’s competency and support from other agencies.

10. CONCLUSION

Action research can be used to bring about changes in an individual or in a community with the help of participation and collaboration. The action taken is based on direct results from the problem selected for study. The investment of time and energy by the participants provides a sense of ownership and connection to the process and outcomes. It is carried out in the problem area, in real life situation and provides immediate action for leading to the change in the existing situation. For better execution of the action research it is important to understand its process and the role of the researcher in the process.

This study provides insights into the teaching social studies using bilingualism in the school to achieve high academic performance in social studies. Although the findings cannot be generalized to all the Bhutanese students, other schools and teachers can make connections to their own context and support their students using bilingualism as medium of teaching instruction. Findings from this study suggest that student’s performance and learn better in by using both languages as educational instruction. Therefore, such finding calls for the attention of the Social studies teachers to take prompt and necessary actions. Teachers need to be aware that different students have different abilities. Considering the differences, teachers can help their students by exploring and explaining the kind of uses of both language as instruction. Findings from this study recommend some strategies that can help Bhutanese students overcome their difficulties in learning social studies.

Finally, to improve the standard of social studies learning in the schools, there is plenty of opportunities to conduct research by any stake holders.

11. RECOMMENDATION

11.1 Recommendations for Implementa-tion

1) This research was carried out to improve oneself and the teachers teaching social studies are recommended to use the strategies revealed in this study to improve academic performance of social studies.
2) Teachers teaching social studies are recommended to provide equal opportunities for students to use both languages in group discussion, presentation and explanation based on their comfortable language.

11.2 Recommendations for Future Research

To refine on this same research topic, the researcher would like to recommend future researchers as follows:

1. Future study samples could be much larger so that the major findings can be generalized to larger populations.
2. The participants in this study were from one school only with limited participants and future researcher could involve participants from urban and rural schools so that the findings can be compared.
3. To get more inclusive data, future studies should cover more number of primary schools.

CONSENT

As per international standard or university standard, Participants’ written consent has been collected and preserved by the author(s).

ETHICAL APPROVAL

As per international standard or university standard written ethical approval has been collected and preserved by the author(s).

COMPETING INTERESTS

Author has declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. May S. Justifying educational language rights. Review of Research in Education. 2014b;38(1):215–241.
2. Callahan R, Gándara P. (Eds.). The bilingual advantage: Language, literacy and the US labor market. Bristol: Multilingual Matters; 2014.
3. McField G, McField D. The consistent outcome of bilingual education programs: A meta-analysis of meta-analyses. In G. McField (Ed.), The miseducation of English learners (. Charlotte: Information Age Publishing. 2014;267–299.
4. Kinley K, Zander. The Usage of ICT for Teaching at a Bhutanese College. International Association of Technology, Education and Development (IATED); 2013.
5. Geography Curriculum Framework: Class PP-XII. Royal Education Council; 2018.
6. Ball J. Enhancing learning of children from diverse language backgrounds: Mother tongue-based bilingual or multilingual education in early years, Paris: UNESCO; 2010.
7. Chiaotoh BA. Official bilingualism and the construction of a Cameroonian national identity In George Echu & Augustin A. Ebongué (eds.) Fifty years of official language bilingualism in Cameroon (1961-2011): situation, stakes and perspectives, Paris: L’Harmattan. 2012; 65-85.
8. Obanya P. Learning in, with, and from the first language, PRAESA Occasional Papers. 19, Cape Town: PRAESA; 2004.
9. Department of Education. Order No. 16. Guidelines on the implementation of mother tongue based-multilingual education (MTB-MLE). February 17, 2012. Manila, Philippines; 2012.
10. Aquino LFY. The Effects of Bilingual Instructions on the Literacy Skills of Young Learners, University of the Philippines, Quezon City, Philippines; 2012:4. Available:http://blog.nus.edu.sg/eltwo/2012/06/14/the-effects-of-bilingual-instruction-on-the-literacy-skills-of-young-learners
11. Jaumont F. The bilingual revolution: The future of education is in two languages. TBR Books; 2017.
12. Rong R, Bibollet-Ruche F, Mulenga J, Allen S, Blackwell JL, Derdeyn CA. Role of V1V2 and other human immunodeficiency virus type 1 envelope domains in resistance to autologous neutralization during clade C infection. Journal of virology. 2007;81(3):1350-9.
13. Grundy SM. Atherogenic dyslipidemia: lipoprotein abnormalities and implications for therapy. The American journal of cardiology. 1995;75(6):458-52B.
14. Maxwell D, Van der Vorst R. Developing sustainable products and services. Journal of Cleaner production. 2003; 11(8): 883-95.
15. Raguenaud V. Bilingual by choice: Raising kids in two (or more!) languages. Nicholas Brealey Pub: Boston; 2009.

16. National Center on Cultural and Linguistic Responsiveness, “Exploring Cultural Concepts: Funds of Knowledge” (Washington, CD: NCCLR, 2019). Available: https://eclic.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/pdf/spring2spring-funds-of-knowledge-eng.pdf

17. American Council on the Teaching of Foreign Languages, “Standards Summary (Washington, DC: ACTFL, n.d.). Available: www.actfl.org/publications/all/wor Id-readinessstandards-learning-languages/standards-summary

18. Menken K. English learners left behind: Standardized testing as language policy. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters; 2008.

19. Tinio VL. ICT in Education: UN Development Programme; 2002. Available: http://www.eprmers.org on December 2009

20. Bartolotti J, Marian V. Language learning and control in monolinguals and bilinguals. Cognitive science. 2012;36(6):1129-47.

21. Bhattacharjee S. The language of reactive oxygen species signaling in plants. Journal of Botany. 2012;2012.

22. Dooly M. Constructing differences: A qualitative analysis of teachers’ perspectives on linguistic and cultural diversity. Linguistics and Education. 2007;18(2):142-66.

23. Spolsky B. Jewish religious multilingualism. In The Sociology of Language and Religion. Palgrave Macmillan, London; 2010:14-28.

24. Golash-Boza T. Does racial formation theory lack the conceptual tools to understand racism?. Ethnic and Racial Studies. 2013;36(6):994-9.

25. Bialystok E, Craik FI, Green DW, Gollan TH. Bilingual minds. Psychological science in the public interest. 2009;10(3):89-129.

26. Ramirez G, Chang H, Maloney EA, Levine SC, Beilock SL. On the relationship between math anxiety and math achievement in early elementary school: The role of problem solving strategies. Journal of experimental child psychology. 2016;141:83-100.

27. Cummins J. To what extent are Canadian second language policies evidence-based? Reflections on the intersections of research and policy. Frontiers in Psychology. 2014;5:358.

28. Hornberger NH, Link H. Translanguaging in today's classrooms: A biliteracy lens. Theory into practice. 2012;51(4): 239-247.

29. Wiley TG. Constructing and deconstructing "illegal" children. Journal of Language, Identity, and Education. 2013;12(3):167.

30. Mwaniki M. Mother tongue education in primary teacher education in Kenya: a language management critique of the quota system. Multilingual Education. 2014;4(1):1-7.

31. Bamgbose A. African language development and language planning. Social Dynamics. 1999;25(1):13-30.

32. Baker P. Using corpora in discourse analysis. A&C Black; 2006.

33. Pransiska T. Peningkatan kemampuan mendeskripsikan gambar dengan model induktif-kata bergambar pada siswa kelas II SD Negeri Tanen kecamatan Rejotangan kabupaten Tulungagung (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Negeri Malang); 2011.

34. King KA, Mackey A. The bilingual edge: Why, when, and how to teach your child a second language. New York: Collins; 2007.

35. Thordardottir E. The relationship between bilingual exposure and vocabulary development. International Journal of Bilingualism. 2011;15(4): 426-45.

36. Cohen DJ, Crabtree BF, Etz RS, Balasubramanian BA, Donahue KE, Leviton LC, Clark EC, Isaacson NF, Stange KC, Green LW. Fidelity versus flexibility: translating evidence-based research into practice. American Journal of Preventive Medicine. 2008;35(5): S381-9.

37. Gibson L. The mechanical behaviour of cancellous bone. Journal of biomechanics. 1985;18(5):317-28.

38. Brown S. Marketing-The retro revolution. Sage; 2001.

39. Maxwell TW. Action research for Bhutan. Rabsel the CERD Educational Journal. 2003:3:1-20.

40. Teacher Professional Support Division (TPSD). Enhancing teaching and learning practice through reflection. Thimphu: Ministry of Education; 2019.
APPENDICES

1. Pretest and posttest attached as annex:1
2. Consent letter as annex:2
3. Sample questionnaire as annex:3

Peer-review history:
The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/90454

© 2022 Phuentsho; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.