Work readiness scale for pharmacy interns and graduates: A cross-sectional study

Safa S. Almarzoky Abuhussain a, Mahmoud E. Elrggal a, Abdulaziz K. Salamatullah a, Assma A. Althobaity a, Amal F. Alotaibi b, Tahani M. Almeleebia b, Thamer A. Almangour c, Abdullah A. Alhifany a,b,*

a Department of Clinical Pharmacy, College of Pharmacy, Umm Al-Qura University, Makkah, Saudi Arabia
b Department of Clinical Pharmacy, College of Pharmacy, King Khalid University, Abha, Saudi Arabia
c Department of Clinical Pharmacy, College of Pharmacy, King Saud University, P.O. Box 2457, Riyadh, 11451, Saudi Arabia

Abstract

Introduction: As the number of unemployment among pharmacy graduates increases, the Saudi Ministry of Labor implemented extra measures to facilitate their training and hiring by the private sectors. Nevertheless, there is a paucity of data regarding pharmacy graduates’ work readiness (WR). Hence, we aim to assess their WR and identify predicting factors associated with WR among pharmacy graduates in Saudi Arabia.

Methods: A 46-item self-reported pre-validated anonymous work readiness scale (WRS) survey with a 5-point Likert scale was administered to pharmacy senior students and graduates using Qualtrics XM survey tool over the month of May 2020. The main outcome was to assess WRS for pharmacy interns and graduates and identify factors associated with work readiness.

Results: A total of 617 participants have participated in this survey, out of which 46.5% were freshly graduated pharmacists and 19.6% were pharmacy interns. Most participants (82.3%) were PharmD candidates or graduates. Around two-third of participants (63%) have successfully completed all survey items. The maximum points scored was 223 out of 230, and the median overall score was found to be 175. There was no significant association with gender, age, or type of university regarding overall scores. However, a statistically significant odds ratio was observed with PharmD program type and previous pharmaceutical marketing training (OR = 1.778, 95% CI = 1.143–2.765: OR = 0.618, 95% CI = 0.432–0.884, respectively).

Conclusion: The overall median score shows a good work readiness level among pharmacy students/graduates in Saudi Arabia; however, PharmD program graduates exposed to advance pharmacy training, including the pharmaceutical marketing experience, have higher work readiness odds than Bpharm graduates. Further studies involving other related perspectives, such as stakeholders, employers, and preceptors, would give a clear image of pharmacy graduates’ job readiness levels.

© 2021 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. on behalf of King Saud University. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

1. Introduction

Unemployment among newly graduated pharmacists in Saudi Arabia is rising, mainly due to the increased number of public and private pharmacy colleges, the saturation of job vacancies in the governmental sectors, and Saudi pharmacists’ challenges to join the private sector (Almaghaslah et al., 2019). In July 2020, the Saudi Ministry of Labor had ordered the Saudization of the pharmacy profession in the private sector to overcome the increasing unemployment rate among Saudi pharmacists (Alruthia et al., 2018). On the other hand, decision-makers are moving toward pushing universities to collaborate with different employers in the governmental and private sectors to create work-integrated
learning programs such as internships and summer training programs, all of which to prepare college students to acquire such skills while they are in school (Design, 2019).

Work readiness skills of fresh college graduates have been proven to be significant predicting factors for employability (Bridgstock et al., 2015; Cleary-Holdforth, 2007). Furthermore, employability rate has become one of the main methods to assess the performance and outcomes of pharmacy colleges in Saudi Arabia and around the world; hence, many universities have established communications with employers to incorporate job-market competencies within their curricula effectively (Romenti et al., 2012).

In the context of evaluating job readiness skills, a trusted tool that considers curriculum content, working environment, and interpersonal skills are essential. Deakin University has validated a work readiness scale that involves 64-item for health professions (Caballero et al., 2011). Walker et al. developed another scale in 2015 adapted to nursing graduates and other health professions (Walker et al., 2015).

Caballero's work readiness scale assesses four perspectives about graduates' work readiness, which include; work competence (WC), social intelligence (SI), organizational acumen (OA), and personal characteristics (PC) (Caballero et al., 2011).

There are a considerable gap in the literature regarding pharmacy school graduates' readiness skills, particularly with the expansion in the number of graduates every year, globally and in Saudi Arabia, which escalates the competition and hardens the recruitment criteria for the labor's interest market. This study aims to identify predicting factors associated with work readiness among pharmacy graduates in Saudi Arabia.

2. Methods

2.1. Study design

This survey-based observational study has recruited interns and graduates from 24 different pharmacy schools across Saudi Arabia. The institutional review board approved the study for ethical consideration. This study's primary objective was to recognize the work readiness level of pharmacy students and graduates across the country and the factors that may influence a higher or lower level of work readiness.

2.2. Instrument used

A 46-item anonymous survey was administered to pharmacy senior students and graduates using Qualtrics XM® survey tool. By completing the survey, participants were giving consent to participate in the study. No identifiable information was collected. The survey was distributed over the month of May 2020. Eligible participants were pharmacy graduates, interns, and fifth-year students of pharmacy colleges in Saudi Arabia. And the sample size was deemed appropriate if it reached more than 450, similar to Walker et al. study (Walker et al., 2015).

2.3. Survey tool

A pre-validated Work Readiness Scale (WRS) was used (Caballero et al., 2011). Some modifications were done by rephrasing or removing some items to make the survey more relevant to pharmacy students and graduates. A 5-point Likert scale was used, with higher scores representing a higher level of work readiness. The WRS represented four perspectives: personal characteristics, organizational acumen, work competence, and social intelligence.

High internal consistency was seen in the original WRS with an overall Cronbach alpha value of 0.96. The four factors described the Cronbach alpha value as follows, personal characteristics 0.93, organizational acumen 0.92, work competence 0.90, and social intelligence 0.88 (Caballero et al., 2011).

2.4. Analysis

Descriptive analyses were conducted on all participants' responses with missing or non-response removed from the denominator. A score for each of the four sections was reported, along with a total score for the whole survey. Responses from participants who completed all the items were first categorized as above average or below average based on the results' median, then assessed in the multiple logistic regression models for the primary outcomes. Any variable with a p-value of < 0.05 on univariate analysis has been incorporated into the model. To assess the final model, an Enter approach was used. The odds ratio of the final logistic model was reported if found significant.

Chi-square, t-test, or Mann Whitney rank sum as appropriate were used to assess categorical and continuous data, respectively. Statistical significance was defined at a p-value < 0.05.

All analyses were performed using IBM SPSS Statistics, version 20 (IBM Corp., Armonk, N.Y., USA).

3. Results

A total of 617 participants have participated in this survey; around half of the participants were females (305, 49.4%). Participants from governmental schools were 577 (93.5%), and 40 (6.5%) were from private pharmacy schools (Fig. 1). Most participants (82.3%) were either interns or graduates from PharmD programs. Only (17.7%) of our sample were either candidates or graduates from Bpharm programs. Around two-thirds of participants (63%) have completed all survey items. Out of the total number of participants who completed the survey, 61.4% were freshly graduated pharmacists, and 19.3% were pharmacy interns and the rest were still 5th-year students.

For those who completed the whole survey, the meantime for completing the entire survey was 19 min and 45 s and the median 11 min, suggesting a variation and abnormal response time between participants.

The maximum number of points scored was 223, and the median overall score was found to be 175. Regarding subcategories, the median score representing personal characteristics had the least subscore with 36 out of 50 points, while the highest median score was observed with the subcategory representing organizational
acumen with 41 out of 45 points. All data are presented in Tables 2–6.

The logistic regression model

The logistic regression model was done to determine the relationship between the overall score categories and background variables (age, gender, academic status, type of the university, studied program, and previous training in pharmaceutical companies). The model was statistically significant (p = 0.037). A statistically significant odds ratio (OR = 1.778, P = 0.011) was observed with program type and previous pharmaceutical company training, which means it is 1.778 times more likely for participants from a PharmD program to have a higher score than participants from a BPharm program. A statistically significant odds ratio (OR = 0.618, p = 0.088) was also found between not having pharmaceutical training and work readiness, which means participants who did not have any previous training in a pharmaceutical company were found to be 0.61 times less likely to score high in the work readiness tool versus those who had.

However, there was no significant association with gender (p = 0.575), age (p = 0.095), or type of university (p = 0.418) regarding overall scores.

![Fig. 1. Mean total score difference between different universities.](image)

Table 2
Scores of items for all participants.

| Item                          | Highest | Lowest | Mean (SD)   | Median |
|-------------------------------|---------|--------|-------------|--------|
| Social intelligence (SI)      | 60      | 25     | 49 ± 0.2    | 41     |
| Organizational acumen (OA)    | 45      | 20     | 40.86 ± 0.15 |        |
| Work competence (WC)          | 75      | 30     | 61.42 ± 0.34 |        |
| Personal characteristics (PC) | 50      | 25     | 36.49 ± 0.26 | 36     |

Table 3
Social intelligence survey items for all participants.

| Strongly disagree | Somewhat disagree | Neutral | Somewhat agree | Strongly agree | Item                                                                 |
|-------------------|-------------------|---------|----------------|---------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 7                 | 19                | 94      | 216            | 135           | People approach me for original ideas                                  |
| 9                 | 33                | 57      | 127            | 245           | Developing relationships with people is one of my strengths            |
| 2                 | 19                | 63      | 152            | 235           | Others would say I have an open and friendly approach                  |
| 2                 | 20                | 46      | 155            | 248           | I communicate effectively with different patients                      |
| 2                 | 26                | 64      | 182            | 197           | I find I am good at reading other people's body language              |
| 1                 | 8                 | 22      | 87             | 353           | There is a lot to learn from employees who have worked at an organization for years |
| 8                 | 11                | 28      | 133            | 291           | I can learn a lot from my colleagues                                  |
| 2                 | 10                | 27      | 142            | 290           | I recognize when I need to ask for help                               |
| 132               | 115               | 111     | 67             | 46            | Approaching senior people at work is a weakness for me                |
| N/A               | 5                 | 7       | 37             | 422           | It's important to respect my colleagues                               |
| 47                | 86                | 91      | 182            | 65            | I sometimes experience difficulty starting task                       |
| 28                | 39                | 102     | 142            | 160           | I feel confident to address interpersonal conflict in the workplace   |
4. Discussion

To date and to the authors’ knowledge, this is the first study that has assessed the work-readiness score and its associated factors among pharmacy graduates in Saudi Arabia. This study’s modified work-readiness assessment tool focused on four main domains: personal characteristics, organizational acumen, work competence, and social intelligence.

The overall median score shows a good work readiness level among pharmacy students/graduates. Our study population scored the highest in terms of organizational acumen and the least in personal characteristics. That might be due to personal and social desirability biases, where graduates tend to over-report good attitudes and under-report the less desirable attitudes (Walker et al., 2015). The personal characteristic domain has more undesirable items where participants preferred to disagree with them, resulting in a low score.

The majority of pharmacy schools in Saudi Arabia offer PharmD programs (Alhamoudi & Alnattah, 2018). Unlike BPharm, the PharmD program required students to have advanced pharmacy practice experiences (APPE) in their last year (Alhifany et al., 2020). This experience helped students to be ready for the real-life pharmacy profession. Upon completing the APPE, students should have developed self-confidence and required competencies to practice independently (Mead & Pilla, 2017; Taylor et al., 2015).

Marketing courses for pharmacists have been introduced early in the PharmD curriculum as well as dual PharmD/MBA programs are growing as the job market is shifting toward a service-based business model and the need for pharmacists with social and administrative skills are becoming more noticeable (Cook, 2003; Jacobs et al., 2017; Perepelkin, 2017).

Consistently, our study shows a statistically significant odds ratio for program type and previous pharmaceutical marketing training. PharmD program graduates exposed to advanced phar-
macy training, including the pharmaceutical marketing experience, have higher work readiness odds than Bpharm graduates.

Although studies have reported gender differences in regards to pharmacy practice competencies where females graduates tend to feel more ready than male graduates (McRobbie et al., 2006; Willis et al., 2009), our study shows no significant association exists between gender or age regarding the overall work readiness score. Interestingly, graduating from different universities and the type of university (public or private) has no impact on the overall WRS. This study has some limitations. Only sixty-three percent of the participants completed all the survey items. We also noticed variability in the time participants needed to complete the survey. The length of the survey with multiple domains and numerous items could have impacted the timing response and completion of the survey. Another main limitation of this study, it is only examined the WRS from the students’/graduates’ perspectives.

5. Conclusion

The overall median score shows a good work readiness level among pharmacy students/graduates in Saudi Arabia; however, PharmD program graduates exposed to advance pharmacy training, including the pharmaceutical marketing experience, have higher work readiness odds than Bpharm graduates. Further studies involving other related perspectives, such as stakeholders, employers, and preceptors, would give a clear image of pharmacy graduates’ job readiness levels.

Declaration of Competing Interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Acknowledgement

We would like to thank the Deanship of Scientific Research at Umm Al-Qura University for supporting this work by Grant Code:19-MED-1-01-0044. We also would like to thank King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia, for supporting this research project (RSP-2020/74).

Ethical approval

The study was approved by the regional institution review board.

Funding

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sector.

References

Alhamoudi, A., Alnaatrah, A., 2018. Pharmacy education in Saudi Arabia: The past, the present, and the future. Curr. Pharmaceut. Teaching & Learning, 10 (1), 54-60. doi: S1877-1297(16)30306-9 [pii]
Alhamoudi, A.A., Almalki, F.A., Alatawi, Y.M., Basindowh, L.A., Almajnoni, S.S., Elrggal, M.E., Alotaibi, A.F., Almarzoky Abuhussain, S.S., Almangour, T.A., 2020. Association between graduates’ factors and success rate on the Saudi Pharmacist Licensure Examination: A single-Institution cross-sectional study. Saudi Pharm. J. 28 (12), 1830–1833. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jspsj.2020.11.009.
Almghashash, A., Albayari, A., Asiri, R., Albugami, N., 2019. Pharmacy workforce in Saudi Arabia: Challenges and opportunities: A cross-sectional study. Int. J. Health Planning Manage. 34 (1). https://doi.org/10.1002/hpm.v34.110.1002/hpm.2674.
Alrutiba, Y., Alsenaidy, M.A., Albahia, H.K., Almuhasen, A., Alshehri, M., 2018. The status of licensed pharmacy workforce in Saudi Arabia: a 2030 economic vision perspective. Hum. Resour. Health 16 (1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12960-018-0294-8.
Bridgstock, R., Goldsmith, B., Rodgers, J., Hearn, G., 2015. Creative graduate pathways within and beyond the creative industries. In: Taylor & Francis. Caballero, C.L., Walker, A., Fuller-Tyszlewicz, M., 2011. The Work Readiness Scale (WRS): Developing a measure to assess work readiness in college graduates. J. Teaching Learning Graduate Employability 2 (2), 41–54.
Cleary-Holdforth, J., 2007. Student non-attendence in higher education: a phenomenon of student apathy or poor pedagogy. Level 3 5 (1), 2.
Cook, C.L., 2003. Marketing for pharmacists. Am. J. Pharm. Educ. 67 (1/4), 695.
Design, H. U. H. K. S. E. f. P., 2019. The labor market in Saudi Arabia: background, areas of progress, and insights for the future.
Jacobs, D.M., Daly, C.J., Tierney, S.-E., O’Brien, E., Fiebelkorn, K.D., 2017. Attitudes and perceptions of dual PharmD/MBA degree program students. Am. J. Pharm. Educ. 81 (4), 71. https://doi.org/10.5688/ajpe81471.
McRobbie, D., Fleming, G., Ortner, M., Bates, J., Davies, J.G., 2006. Evaluating skills and competencies of pre-registration pharmacists using objective structured clinical examinations (OSCEs). Pharmacy Education 6 (2), 133–138.
Mead, T., Pilla, D., 2017. Assessment of clinical and educational interventions that Advanced Pharmacy Practice Experience (APPE) students contributed to a family medicine residency program. Curr. Pharmaceut. Teaching & Learning, 9(3), 460-467. doi:S1877-1297(16)30136-8 [pii]
Perelpeklin, J., 2017. Implementation and evaluation of a marketing for pharmacists elective course. Pharmacy Educ. 17.
Romenti, S., Invernizzi, E., Biraghi, S., 2012. Engaging employers to develop quality pharmacy practice competencies where females graduates tend to feel more ready than Bpharm graduates. Further studies involving other related perspectives, such as stakeholders, employers, and preceptors, would give a clear image of pharmacy graduates’ job readiness levels.
References

Alhamoudi, A., Alnaatrah, A., 2018. Pharmacy education in Saudi Arabia: The past, the present, and the future. Curr. Pharmaceut. Teaching & Learning, 10 (1), 54-60. doi: S1877-1297(16)30306-9 [pii]
Alhamoudi, A.A., Almalki, F.A., Alatawi, Y.M., Basindowh, L.A., Almajnoni, S.S., Elrggal, M.E., Alotaibi, A.F., Almarzoky Abuhussain, S.S., Almangour, T.A., 2020. Association between graduates’ factors and success rate on the Saudi Pharmacist Licensure Examination: A single-Institution cross-sectional study. Saudi Pharm. J. 28 (12), 1830–1833. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jspsj.2020.11.009.
Almghashash, A., Albayari, A., Asiri, R., Albugami, N., 2019. Pharmacy workforce in Saudi Arabia: Challenges and opportunities: A cross-sectional study. Int. J. Health Planning Manage. 34 (1). https://doi.org/10.1002/hpm.v34.110.1002/hpm.2674.
Alrutiba, Y., Alsenaidy, M.A., Albahia, H.K., Almuhasen, A., Alshehri, M., 2018. The status of licensed pharmacy workforce in Saudi Arabia: a 2030 economic vision perspective. Hum. Resour. Health 16 (1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12960-018-0294-8.
Bridgstock, R., Goldsmith, B., Rodgers, J., Hearn, G., 2015. Creative graduate pathways within and beyond the creative industries. In: Taylor & Francis. Caballero, C.L., Walker, A., Fuller-Tyszlewicz, M., 2011. The Work Readiness Scale (WRS): Developing a measure to assess work readiness in college graduates. J. Teaching Learning Graduate Employability 2 (2), 41–54.
Cleary-Holdforth, J., 2007. Student non-attendence in higher education: a phenomenon of student apathy or poor pedagogy. Level 3 5 (1), 2.
Cook, C.L., 2003. Marketing for pharmacists. Am. J. Pharm. Educ. 67 (1/4), 695.
Design, H. U. H. K. S. E. f. P., 2019. The labor market in Saudi Arabia: background, areas of progress, and insights for the future.
Jacobs, D.M., Daly, C.J., Tierney, S.-E., O’Brien, E., Fiebelkorn, K.D., 2017. Attitudes and perceptions of dual PharmD/MBA degree program students. Am. J. Pharm. Educ. 81 (4), 71. https://doi.org/10.5688/ajpe81471.
McRobbie, D., Fleming, G., Ortner, M., Bates, J., Davies, J.G., 2006. Evaluating skills and competencies of pre-registration pharmacists using objective structured clinical examinations (OSCEs). Pharmacy Education 6 (2), 133–138.
Mead, T., Pilla, D., 2017. Assessment of clinical and educational interventions that Advanced Pharmacy Practice Experience (APPE) students contributed to a family medicine residency program. Curr. Pharmaceut. Teaching & Learning, 9(3), 460-467. doi:S1877-1297(16)30136-8 [pii]
Perelpeklin, J., 2017. Implementation and evaluation of a marketing for pharmacists elective course. Pharmacy Educ. 17.
Romenti, S., Invernizzi, E., Biraghi, S., 2012. Engaging employers to develop quality in higher education: the case of communication studies in Italy. Quality in Higher Education 18 (2), 205–220.
Taylor, C.T., Adams, A.J., Albert, E.L., Cardello, E.A., Clifford, K., Currie, J.D., Gonyeau, M., Nelson, S.P., Bradley-Baker, L.R., 2015. Report of the 2014–2015 professional affairs standing committee: producing practice-ready pharmacy graduates in an era of value-based health care. Am. J. Pharm. Educ. 79 (8), 512. https://doi.org/10.5688/ajpe798512.
Walker, A., Storey, K.M., Costa, B.M., Leung, R.K., 2015. Refinement and validation of the Work Readiness Scale for graduate nurses. Nurs. Outlook 63 (6), 632–638. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.outlook.2015.06.001.
Wills, S.C., Hassell, K., Seston, E.M., Hann, M., 2009. Using learning outcomes for undergraduate pharmacy education to assess final-year students’ perceptions of their preparedness for pharmacy practice. Int. J. Pharmacy Practice 17 (6), 351–358.