Low temperature plasma irradiation products of sodium lactate solution that induce cell death on U251SP glioblastoma cells were identified

Hiromasa Tanaka1,2, Yugo Hosoi2, Kenji Ishikawa3, Jun Yoshitake5, Takahiro Shibata3,4, Koji Uchida3,4,5, Hiroshi Hashizume6, Masaaki Mizuno7, Yasumasa Okazaki8, Shinya Toyokuni1,9, Kae Nakamura1,9, Hiroaki Kajiyama1,9, Fumitaka Kikkawa3,9 & Masaru Hori1

Low-temperature plasma is being widely used in the various fields of life science, such as medicine and agriculture. Plasma-activated solutions have been proposed as potential cancer therapeutic reagents. We previously reported that plasma-activated Ringer’s lactate solution exhibited selective cancer-killing effects, and that the plasma-treated L-sodium lactate in the solution was an anti-tumor factor; however, the components that are generated through the interactions between plasma and L-sodium lactate and the components responsible for the selective killing of cancer cells remain unidentified.

In this study, we quantified several major chemical products, such as pyruvate, formate, and acetate, in plasma-activated L-sodium lactate solution by nuclear magnetic resonance analysis. We further identified novel chemical products, such as glyoxylate and 2,3-dimethyltartrate, in the solution by direct infusion-electrospray ionization with tandem mass spectrometry analysis. We found that 2,3-dimethyltartrate exhibited cytotoxic effects in glioblastoma cells, but not in normal astrocytes. These findings shed light on the identities of the components that are responsible for the selective cytotoxic effect of plasma-activated solutions on cancer cells, and provide useful data for the potential development of cancer treatments using plasma-activated L-sodium lactate solution.

Low-temperature plasma (LTP) is being widely used in various fields, such as medicine and agriculture, which are now referred to as plasma medicine and plasma agriculture, respectively1–5. LTP acts on biological surfaces directly or indirectly through solutions6–9. We have previously reported that plasma-activated medium (PAM) exhibited anti-tumor effects on cancer cells10–16, and have developed plasma-activated Ringer’s lactate solution (PAL) for clinical applications17–20. Many in vitro and in vivo studies have demonstrated that both PAM and PAL exhibited anti-tumor effects. We recently reported that PAL induced macrophage infiltration in disseminated lesions in our mouse model of intraperitoneally disseminated ovarian cancer, and proposed an intraperitoneal washing therapy using PAL for the treatment of ovarian cancer20. We have also reported that PAL induced...
ferroptosis in malignant mesothelioma cells via lipid peroxidation mediated by lysosomal nitric oxide-derived oxidants. Although both PAM and PAL exhibited cytotoxic effects, the mechanisms of cell death appear to be different. For example, PAM induced oxidative stress-dependent cell death, while PAL induced oxidative stress-independent cell death in glioblastoma cells. Comprehensive understanding of the mechanisms is essential for the clinical application of plasma-activated solutions as cancer treatments.

Plasma–liquid interactions have been extensively studied. Since air contains nitrogen, oxygen, and water, short-lived radicals, such as OH and NO, and long-lived reactive species, which contain N, O, and H (reactive oxygen and nitrogen species (RONS)), are generated in the gaseous phase, and the main products from plasma–liquid interactions in plasma-activated solutions are hydrogen peroxide (H$_2$O$_2$), nitrite (NO$_2^-$), and nitrate (NO$_3^-$; Fig. 1a). We previously reported that hydrogen peroxide in PAM was partially responsible for the cytotoxicity, while nitrite was not responsible for the cytotoxicity at all; however, a synergetic effect between hydrogen peroxide and nitrite was observed. In addition, other unknown components in PAM are also responsible for the cytotoxicity. Culture medium contains about 30 components, including inorganic compounds, vitamins, and amino acids. Interactions between LTP and amino acids have been extensively studied. However, so far, most of the studies have examined the loss of function of amino acids as nutrients. For example, methionine in medium was oxidized by LTP treatment. Ringer's lactate solution contains sodium chloride, potassium chloride, calcium chloride, and L-sodium lactate, and we have previously reported that the reaction products between plasma and L-sodium lactate were anti-tumor factors in PAL. We have also reported that the concentration of hydrogen peroxide in PAL depends on the concentration of L-sodium lactate in irradiated Ringer's lactate solution. L-sodium lactate is an organic chemical, and the plasma treatment of L-sodium lactate is thought to cause chemical bonds to dissociate and associate; however, it remains a big mystery what components are generated by the interactions between plasma and L-sodium lactate, and what components are responsible for the selective killing of cancer cells by PAL.

In this study, we performed a nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR) analysis and mass spectrometry analysis to identify the components in PAL. We identified glyoxylate and 2,3-dimethylbutyrate, in addition to pyruvate,
acetate, and formate. 2,3-Dimethyltartrate exhibited selective killing of cancer cells, while glyoxylate killed both glioblastoma cells and normal astrocytes. These results suggest that 2,3-dimethyltartrate is a key factor that is responsible for the selective killing of cancer cells by PAL.

Results
The cytotoxic effect of the RONS in PAL on glioblastoma cells. We measured the concentrations of hydrogen peroxide and nitrite in PAL. We found that the concentration of hydrogen peroxide in the PAL was 750 μM and the concentration of nitrite in the PAL was 1166 μM (Fig. 1b). To eliminate the cytotoxic effect of hydrogen peroxide in PAL, we treated PAL with catalase (0.5 mg/ml in PAL) for 2 h before glioblastoma cells were treated with the PAL, and the hydrogen peroxide concentration was less than 50 nM after catalase treatment. We assessed the cytotoxic effect of each RONS in PAL by the MTS assay (Fig. 1c). We found that 1166 μM nitrite did not exhibit any cytotoxicity, while 750 μM hydrogen peroxide as well as PAL with catalase (hydrogen peroxide concentration of <50 nM) completely killed the glioblastoma cells (Fig. 1d). These results suggested that components other than RONS in PAL are responsible for the cytotoxicity of PAL.

NMR analysis of the components of plasma-treated L-sodium lactate solution. We previously reported that plasma-treated L-sodium lactate contained more acetyl (CH₃CO) and pyruvic acid-like groups (CH₃COCOOH) than untreated L-sodium lactate solution based on NMR analyses[7]. To investigate quantitative aspects of plasma-treated products, we performed ¹H NMR analyses with different plasma irradiation times (Fig. 2). Figure 2b shows the differences in the ¹H NMR peak patterns before and after plasma irradiation of L-sodium lactate solution (L-sodium lactate in deuterium oxide). Signals from formate, pyruvate, and acetate clearly increased after plasma irradiation. The peak area of signals from L-sodium lactate, which is proportional to the concentration of L-sodium lactate, was measured for different plasma irradiation times (Fig. 2c). When L-sodium lactate was irradiated with plasma for 5 min, 12% of the L-sodium lactate was consumed. Figure 2c shows the concentrations of formate, pyruvate, and acetate in plasma-treated L-sodium lactate solution with different irradiation times; after 15 min of plasma irradiation, the concentrations were 60 μM for formate, 250 μM for pyruvate, and 1500 μM for acetate.
Determination of the components of PAL using direct infusion-electrospray ionization (ESI) with tandem mass spectrometry (MS/MS). To determine the components of PAL, we performed direct infusion-ESI–MS/MS analysis (Fig. 3). We used 50% acetonitrile, 10 mM ammonium formate, and 0.1% formate for dissolution. As expected from the NMR results, acetate (m/z 59.0137), glyoxylate (m/z 72.9929), pyruvate (m/z 87.0088), and 2,3-dimethyltartrate (m/z 177.041) were identified in PAL (Figure S1 and Fig. 3b). In addition, glyoxylate (m/z 72.9929) and 2,3-dimethyltartrate (m/z 177.041) were also detected in PAL. Due to the detection limit of the MS/MS system (m/z < 50), formate was not detected in this experiment.

Anti-tumor effects of the products of plasma-treated L-sodium lactate. To investigate which products in PAL are responsible for the anti-tumor effects, we performed a cell viability assay (Fig. 4). 2,3-Dimethyltartrate is not commercially available, so we instead purchased the commercially available dimethyltartrate, in addition to the commercially available pyruvate, acetate, and formate, and used them for the cell viability assay. In addition, we purified 2,3-dimethyltartrate from plasma-activated L-sodium lactate solution by high-performance liquid chromatography (HPLC; Fig. 4a and Figure S2). L-sodium lactate was detected in the 12-to-13-min and 13-to-14-min fractions. 2,3-Dimethyltartrate was detected in the 13-to-14-min and 14-to-15-min fractions, so we purified 2,3-dimethyltartrate from the 14-to-15 min fraction (Figure S2).

Since L-sodium lactate is present in Ringer’s lactate solution (Lactec) at a concentration of 28 mM, we evaluated the cytotoxic effect of the purchased dimethyltartrate, pyruvate, acetate, and formate, and the purified 2,3-dimethyltartrate at the concentrations of 5, 10, and 20 mM on U251SP glioblastoma cells using the MTS assay (Fig. 4b). We found that pyruvate, acetate, formate, and dimethyltartrate had no cytotoxic effect on U251SP glioblastoma cells, while glyoxylate and 2,3-dimethyltartrate exhibited a cytotoxic effect on the cells. To investigate the tumor specificity of the cytotoxic effects of the compounds, we treated normal human astrocytes as well as U251SP glioblastoma cells with 5, 10, 15, and 20 mM of glyoxylate or 2,3-dimethyltartrate (Fig. 4c). Interestingly, 2,3-dimethyltartrate exhibited much higher cytotoxicity in U251SP glioblastoma cells than in normal astrocytes, while glyoxylate exhibited almost the same level of cytotoxicity in both U251SP glioblastoma cells and normal astrocytes. We further synthesized 2,3-dimethyltartrate by organic synthesis. We treated U251SP glioblastoma cells with 0.15625, 0.3125, 0.625, 1.25 or 2.5 mM of synthesized 2,3-dimethyltartrate in
Figure 4. Anti-tumor effect of each component of PAL. (a) Schematic of the purification procedure for 2,3-dimethyltartrate in plasma-activated L-sodium lactate solution. (b) The cell viability of U251SP glioblastoma cells treated with 5, 10, or 20 mM of pyruvate, acetate, dimethyltartrate, 2,3-dimethyltartrate, glyoxylate, or formate in culture medium. (c) Cell viability of U251SP glioblastoma cells and normal astrocytes treated with 5, 10, 15, or 20 mM of 2,3-dimethyltartrate or glyoxylate in culture medium. (d) The cell viability of U251SP glioblastoma cells treated with 0.15625, 0.3125, 0.625, 1.25, or 2.5 mM of synthesized 2,3-dimethyltartrate in Lactec.
Lactec (Fig. 4d). Interestingly, low concentration of 2,3-dimethyltartrate in Lactec (> 0.3125 mM) was enough to exhibit anti-tumor effect on U251SP glioblastoma cells while relatively high concentration of 2,3-dimethyltartrate in culture medium (> 10 mM) was needed (Fig. 4c). These results suggested that 2,3-dimethyltartrate in PAL is responsible for the selective killing of cancer cells by PAL.

To elucidate the mechanisms of cell death by 2,3-dimethyltartrate, we investigate the mitochondrial membrane potential using the JC-1 probe (Fig. 5). We treated U251SP glioblastoma cells with 5, 10, or 20 mM of the synthesized 2,3-dimethyltartrate in culture medium, and we stained with the fluorescence dye JC-1 and measured the fluorescence of red and green using the flow cytometry (Fig. 5a). Fluorescence ratio (Red/Green) decreased in 20 mM of 2,3-dimethyltartrate-treated U251SP cells (Fig. 5b). These results suggest that mitochondrial injury was induced by 2,3-dimethyltartrate.

Discussion

In this study, we characterized several organic chemicals that are produced from the plasma treatment of L-sodium lactate solution or Ringer’s lactate solution. Figure 6 summarizes the products in PAL. NMR and direct infusion-ESI–MS analyses revealed that acetate, pyruvate, and formate were produced through the reactions between LTP and L-sodium lactate (Figs. 2 and 3); however, these products did not exhibit any cytotoxicity on glioblastoma cells even at 20 mM (Fig. 4b). We estimated that the concentration of L-sodium lactate decreased by around 3 mM in Ringer’s lactate solution, which normally contains 28 mM L-sodium lactate, while the concentrations of acetate, pyruvate, and formate increased by about 500 μM, 150 μM, and 30 μM, respectively, after LTP treatment for 5 min (Fig. 2). In addition, direct infusion-ESI–MS/MS revealed that new products, namely, glyoxylate and 2,3-dimethyltartrate, were produced. When we treated Lactec with plasma for 5 min, 12% of L-sodium lactate was consumed (Fig. 2b), so we can estimate that the concentration of 2,3-dimethyltartrate in the PAL was less than 1.68 mM and the concentration of glyoxylate in the PAL was less than 3.36 mM. When we treated Lactec with plasma for 3 min, 9% of L-sodium lactate was consumed (Fig. 2b), so we can also estimate that the concentration of 2,3-dimethyltartrate in the PAL was less than 1.26 mM and the concentration of glyoxylate in the PAL was less than 2.52 mM. Glyoxylate serves as an intermediate in various metabolic pathways, although high concentrations of this metabolite are toxic to cells29. Indeed, glyoxylate exhibited cytotoxicity on both glioblastoma cells and normal astrocytes (Fig. 4c). To our knowledge, 2,3-dimethyltartrate has not been reported as a cytotoxic biochemical compound, and it is not commercially available for purchase. We purified 2,3-dimethyltartrate using ultra-performance liquid chromatography, and we demonstrated that the purified 2,3-dimethyltartrate in culture medium exhibited a cytotoxic effect on U251SP glioblastoma cells, but it did not exhibit a cytotoxic effect on normal astrocytes (Fig. 4c). These results suggest that 2,3-dimethyltartrate is responsible for the selective killing of cancer cells. Meanwhile, 20 mM of 2,3-dimethyltartrate in culture medium was used in these experiments, which might be higher concentration than one in PAL. We further treated U251SP glioblastoma cells with 2,3-dimethyltartrate in Lactec (Fig. 4d). Interestingly, more than 0.3125 mM of 2,3-dimethyltartrate in Lactec...
exhibited anti-tumor effects on the U251SP glioblastoma cells. These results suggest that 2,3-dimethyltartrate in PAL might be responsible for anti-tumor effects by PAL. Other components in PAL might also be responsible for the selective killing of cancer cells, and further experiments are needed to comprehensively understand the mechanisms of the specific anti-tumor effects of PAL.

We have previously reported that PAM induced oxidative stress-dependent cell death on U251SP glioblastoma cells, while PAL induced oxidative stress-independent cell death on them. In this study, we found that 2,3-dimethyltartrate which is a product of plasma-treated L-sodium lactate is a candidate of the anti-tumor factor in PAL. However, L-sodium lactate is not the component of culture medium. Other components in culture medium should be responsible for anti-tumor effects by PAM. In the future, such anti-tumor factors in PAL and PAM should be identified and some of them might be used for clinical applications. Towards such clinical applications, further experiments such as in vivo experiments and other types of cancer cells are needed.

Conclusion

LTP treatment causes the formation of organic chemicals derived from L-sodium lactate in PAL. We characterized several components in PAL, and found that pyruvate, acetate, and formate did not exhibit cytotoxicity against glioblastoma cells, glyoxylate exhibited cytotoxicity against both glioblastoma cells and normal astrocytes, and 2,3-dimethyltartrate exhibited cytotoxicity against glioblastoma cells, but not against normal astrocytes. These findings represent a major step towards unraveling the great mystery of how PAL causes the selective killing of cancer cells.

Materials and methods

Cell lines and cultures. U251SP glioblastoma cells were obtained from the Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Institute (New York, NY), and were grown in Dulbecco’s Modified Eagle Medium (Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, MO) supplemented with 10% fetal bovine serum and penicillin (100 U/ml)-streptomycin (100 μg/ml) in an atmosphere of 5% CO₂ at 37 °C. Human astrocytes (N7805100) were obtained from Thermo Fisher Scientific (Waltham, MA), and were grown in Gibco Astrocyte Medium in an atmosphere of 5% CO₂ at 37 °C.

Preparation of plasma-activated L-sodium lactate solution and PAL. Plasma-activated L-sodium lactate solution and PAL were prepared by treating the solutions with plasma as previously described. The plasma source was connected to 9 kV from a 60-Hz AC high-voltage power source with argon gas flowing at a rate of 2 standard liters per min. The distance between the plasma source and the samples was fixed at L = 3 mm.

Concentrations of hydrogen peroxide. The concentration of hydrogen peroxide was measured using the Amplex Red hydrogen peroxide/peroxidase assay kit (Thermo Fisher Scientific), and the peak fluorescence emission (excitation: 530 nm, emission: 560 nm) was monitored with a microplate reader (POWERSCAN HT, DS Pharma Biomedical, Kirkland, WA) as previously described.

Concentrations of nitrite. The concentration of nitrite was measured using the OxiSelect In Vitro Nitric Oxide (Nitrite/Nitrate) Assay Kit (Cell Biolabs Inc., San Diego, CA), and the peak fluorescence emission (excitation: 530 nm, emission: 560 nm) was monitored with a microplate reader (POWERSCAN HT, DS Pharma Biomedical, Kirkland, WA) as previously described.

Figure 6. Components in PAL identified by the NMR analysis and direct infusion-ESI–MS/MS analysis. Among the components of PAL, 2,3-dimethyltartrate exhibited selective cytotoxicity on cancer cells, glyoxylate exhibited cytotoxicity on both cancer and normal cells, and formate, pyruvate, and acetate did not exhibit any cytotoxicity on cells.
Cell viability assay. The effect of PAL on cell viability was measured using the Aqueous One Solution Cell Proliferation Assay kit (Promega, Madison, WI) according to the manufacturer's instructions. Absorbance was measured at 490 nm with a microplate reader (POWERSCAN HT, DS Pharma Biomedical) as previously described.

NMR analysis of plasma-activated L-sodium lactate solution. In a 60-mm dish, 28 mM L-sodium lactate in 8 ml D_2O was treated with plasma (L = 3 mm, 2.0 slm). The ^1H NMR spectra of untreated L-sodium lactate solution and plasma-activated L-sodium lactate solution were measured with a JNM-ECA600 spectrometer (JEOL RESONANCE, Tokyo, Japan) operated at 600 MHz for ^1H nuclei. The integral (area under the curve) of each product peak, which is proportional to the concentration of each product, was calculated and used to quantify the concentrations of the products.

Mitochondrial membrane potential assay. 100,000 U251 cells were seeded in a 12-well plate. On the following day, cells were treated with 5, 10, or 20 mM of synthesized 2,3-dimethyltartrate in DMEM for 6 h. Medium containing the synthesized 2,3-dimethyltartrate was replaced for 2 mM of JC-1 (DOJINDO LABORATORIES, Kumamoto, Japan), and incubated for 1 h at 37 °C in 5% CO_2. Cells were then harvested and analyzed by flow cytometry (BD FACSCanto II, BD Biosciences, NJ, USA) to determine the relative fluorescence intensities of red/green.

Statistical analysis. All data are presented as the mean ± standard deviation. Statistical analysis of differences between groups was performed using the Student's t test. A P value < 0.05 was considered to indicate a significant difference.

Data availability The data that support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

Received: 27 May 2021; Accepted: 2 September 2021
Published online: 16 September 2021

References
1. Keidar, M. et al. Cold atmospheric plasma in cancer therapy. Phys. Plasmas https://doi.org/10.1063/1.4801546 (2013).
2. Laroussi, M. Low-temperature plasmas for medicine?. IEEE Trans. Plasma Sci. 37, 714–725. https://doi.org/10.1109/Tps.2009.2017267 (2009).
3. Fridman, G. et al. Applied plasma medicine. Plasma Process. Polym. 5, 503–533. https://doi.org/10.1002/ppap.200700154 (2008).
4. von Woedtke, T., Metelmann, H. R. & Weltmann, K. D. Clinical plasma medicine: State and perspectives of in vivo application of cold atmospheric plasma. Contrib. Plasm Phys. 54, 104–117. https://doi.org/10.1002/cpp.201310068 (2014).
Acknowledgements
The authors would like to thank Professors Takayoshi Tsutsumi, Hiroki Kondo, and Makoto Sekine for fruitful discussions, and Yuko Katsumata for technical assistance at the Center for Low-temperature Plasma Sciences, Nagoya University, and Dr. Yu Maeda of the Research Center for Materials Science, Nagoya University, and Dr. Kentaro Taki of the Division for Medical Research Engineering, Nagoya University Graduate School of Medicine, for technical assistance. This work was partly supported by a Grant-in-Aid for Sp ecialy Promoted Research (No. 19H05462) and a Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (B) (No. 21H01072) from the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology of Japan as well as the Joint Usage/Research Program of the Center for Low-temperature Plasma Science, Nagoya University, and the Plasma Bio Consortium.

Author contributions
H.T., K.I., J. Y., T. S., K.U., M.M., S.T., H.K., F.K. and M.H. designed the research; H.T. and Y.H. conducted the experiments; H.T. wrote the main manuscript under the supervision of J.Y., T.S. and M.H.; H.T. analyzed and interpreted data. All authors joined discussions regarding the final draft of the manuscript.

Competing interests
The authors declare no competing interests.
