RESEARCH PAPER

Multiple strategies to prevent oxidative stress in Arabidopsis plants lacking the malate valve enzyme NADP-malate dehydrogenase

Inga Hebbelmann1,*,†, Jennifer Selinski1,†, Corinna Wehmeyer1, Tatjana Goss1, Ingo Voss1, Paula Mulo2, Saijaliisa Kangasjärvi2, Eva-Mari Aro2, Marie-Luise Oelze3, Karl-Josef Dietz3, Adriano Nunes-Nesi4,‡, Phuc T. Do4, Alisdair R. Fernie4, Sai K. Tallia5, Agepati S. Raghavendra1,5, Vera Linke1 and Renate Scheibe1,§

1 Department of Plant Physiology, FB5, University of Osnabrueck, D-49069 Osnabrueck, Germany
2 Molecular Plant Biology, Department of Biochemistry and Food Chemistry, University of Turku, FIN-20014 Turku, Finland
3 Biochemistry and Physiology of Plants, University of Bielefeld, D-33501 Bielefeld, Germany
4 Max Planck Institute for Molecular Plant Physiology, Am Mühlenberg 1, D-14476 Potsdam-Golm, Germany
5 Department of Plant Sciences, School of Life Sciences, University of Hyderabad, Hyderabad 500 046, India

* Present address: Biology Department, Brookhaven National Laboratory, Upton, NY 11973, USA.
† These authors contributed equally to this work.
‡ Present address: Max-Planck Partner Group, Departamento de Biologia Vegetal, Universidade Federal de Viçosa, Viçosa, Minas Gerais, Brazil.
§ To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: scheibe@biologie.uni-osnabrueck.de

Received 12 May 2011; Revised 1 November 2011; Accepted 2 November 2011

Abstract

The nuclear-encoded chloroplast NADP-dependent malate dehydrogenase (NADP-MDH) is a key enzyme controlling the malate valve, to allow the indirect export of reducing equivalents. Arabidopsis thaliana (L.) Heynh. T-DNA insertion mutants of NADP-MDH were used to assess the role of the light-activated NADP-MDH in a typical C3 plant. Surprisingly, even when exposed to high-light conditions in short days, nadp-mdh knockout mutants were phenotypically indistinguishable from the wild type. The photosynthetic performance and typical antioxidative systems, such as the Beck–Halliwell–Asada pathway, were barely affected in the mutants in response to high-light treatment. The reactive oxygen species levels remained low, indicating the apparent absence of oxidative stress, in the mutants. Further analysis revealed a novel combination of compensatory mechanisms in order to maintain redox homeostasis in nadp-mdh plants under high-light conditions, particularly an increase in the NTRC/2-Cys peroxiredoxin (Prx) system in chloroplasts. There were indications of adjustments in extra-chloroplastic components of photorespiration and proline levels, which all could dissipate excess reducing equivalents, sustain photosynthesis, and prevent photoinhibition in nadp-mdh knockout plants. Such metabolic flexibility suggests that the malate valve acts in concert with other NADPH-consuming reactions to maintain a balanced redox state during photosynthesis under high-light stress in wild-type plants.

Key words: Malate valve, NADP-malate dehydrogenase, oxidative stress, poising mechanisms, redox homeostasis.

Introduction

Malate dehydrogenases catalise the reversible conversion of oxaloacetate to malate using either NAD/H or NADP/H as oxidant/reductant, respectively. Additionally, these enzymes can indirectly function as a pacemaker of the transport of...
reducing equivalents between subcellular compartments, in cooperation with the membrane-bound dicarboxylate transporters. NAD-dependent isoforms of MDH are present in mitochondria, peroxisomes, cytosol, and plastids. Chloroplasts additionally possess an NADP-malate dehydrogenase (NADP-MDH) with distinct regulatory properties. This nuclear-encoded NADP-MDH is the key enzyme of the malate valve (Scheibe, 2004). NADP-MDH converts oxaloacetate to malate using NADPH, facilitating the regeneration of the electron acceptor NADP⁺ in the chloroplasts, particularly when CO₂ assimilation is restricted.

The malate valve is suggested to balance the ATP/NADPH ratio of the chloroplast as required by changing metabolic demands (Scheibe, 2004). Export of reducing equivalents, however, needs to be well controlled in order to avoid any imbalance or depletion of chloroplast energy carriers. The reductive activation of NADP-MDH is inhibited when the NADP/NADPH ratio is high (Scheibe and Jacquot, 1983; Faske et al., 1995). The activation of NADP-MDH, and consequently the rate of malate export from the chloroplast, is high, only when there is a shortage of NADP⁺. The activation state of NADP-MDH changes within seconds to minutes, due to this post-translational regulatory mechanism. Thus, the enzyme appears to play an important role in the short-term adjustment of the stromal NADP(H) redox state in response to changing environmental conditions, so as to ensure the maintenance of redox homeostasis (Scheibe et al., 2005).

Knockout mutants of Arabidopsis thaliana (L.) Heynh. (napd-mdh) deficient in NADP-MDH activity were used to assess the role of the light-activated NADP-MDH in C₃ plants. Molecular and biochemical analyses of these plants grown in or transferred to challenging high-light (HL) conditions were conducted to understand potential compensatory mechanisms that counteract redox imbalances and oxidative stress. Amongst these systems are the NTRC/2-Cys peroxiredoxin (Prx) system in chloroplasts (Serrato et al., 2004; Pérez-Ruiz et al., 2006), other antioxidant enzymes and low molecular weight antioxidants in different cellular compartments (Foyer and Noctor, 2009), photorespiration (Wingler et al., 2000; Igamberdiev et al., 2001), and even the mitochondrial alternative oxidase (AOX) pathway (Yoshida et al., 2007; Strodtkötter et al., 2009). The detailed analysis presented here revealed that the napd-mdh mutants employed a combination of multiple strategies to counteract the oxidative stress, and protect the chloroplasts from photoinhibition under HL.

Materials and methods

Growth of plant material

Wild-type (WT) and transgenic Arabidopsis thaliana (L.) Heynh. (ecotype Columbia) plants were cultivated in a growth chamber in soil under short-day conditions with a 7.5 h daily light period, a light intensity of 50 μmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹, and a temperature of 20 °C. These conditions are defined as growth light (GL). To apply stress conditions, plants were exposed to HL (750 μmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹) for 7 h or for alternative periods as indicated. To analyse plant growth in early stages, single seeds were placed in pots in soil, and plants were grown under short-day conditions at a light intensity of 150 μmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹ for 5 weeks. Then the fresh and dry weight of the above-ground biomass was determined in 100 seedlings of each genotype.

For growth analyses, single seeds were planted in Petri dishes on agar. The nutrient medium described by Wilson et al. (1990) was used with some modifications. The medium contained 2.5 mM KCl, 1.25 mM KH₂PO₄, 1 mM MgSO₄, 2 mM CaCl₂, 80 μM Fe-EDTA, 24 μM H₃BO₃, 4 μM MnCl₂, 0.2 μM CuSO₄, 0.4 μM ZnSO₄, 0.6 μM Na₂MoO₄, and 0.8% agar pro analysed (Carl Roth, Karlsruhe, Germany). The pH was adjusted to 5.7 with KOH, and the medium was supplemented with 1.8 mM nitrate. For uniform germination, the plates were initially incubated for 2 d in the dark at 4 °C. Seedlings were grown under sterile conditions. After 4 weeks of growth under short-day conditions at 150 μmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹, the fresh weight of the total biomass was determined in 100 seedlings of each genotype.

Screen for nadp-mdh mutants

The Arabidopsis napd-mdh mutant lines At5g58330::tDNA-50 (Salk_012655) and At5g58330::tDNA-119 (Salk_063444) were obtained from the Arabidopsis Biological Resource Centre (http://www.arabidopsis.org/abrc). Homozygous knockout plants were identified by PCR for T-DNA insertion within the gene region of At5g58330. Genomic DNA was isolated from plant tissues by standard methods. The sequence information for the gene- and T-DNA-specific primers was taken from the Salk Institute (http://signal.salk.edu). The positions of the T-DNA insertion were confirmed by sequencing the PCR products.

Extraction of total RNA and northern blot analysis

For northern blot analysis, total RNA was isolated from frozen leaf material by using the Purescript RNA-extraction kit (Gentra Systems, Minneapolis, MN, USA). For RNA gel-blot hybridization, 10 μg of total RNA were denatured and separated on a 1.0% (w/v) agarose–2.5% (v/v) formaldehyde gel, transferred, and UV-cross-linked to a nylon membrane (Hybond-N, Amersham Biosciences, UK). Pre-hybridization and hybridization were performed at 65 °C in Church buffer medium [0.25 M sodium phosphate buffer, pH 7.2, 1 mM EDTA, 7% (w/v) SDS, and 1% bovine serum albumin (BSA)]. Hybridization was performed with an [α-³²P]dCTP-labelled NADP-MDH cDNA-specific probe (Ready-To-Go DNA-labelling beads, Amersham Biosciences, UK). Membranes were washed twice for 15 min at 65 °C in washing buffer [40 mM sodium phosphate buffer, pH 7.2, 1 mM EDTA, 0.5% (w/v) SDS, and 0.5% (w/v) BSA], then for 10 min at room temperature in washing buffer containing 1% (w/v) SDS. Finally, membranes were exposed to a Phosphor-Imager (GE Healthcare, Freiburg, Germany).

RT-PCR analysis

Non-competitive reverse transcription-PCR (RT-PCR) was performed essentially as described by Ahn (2002). cDNA was synthesized from 5 μg of total RNA using oligo(dT) as primer according to the manufacturer’s instructions (Fermentas ReverseTaid™ First Strand cDNA Synthesis Kit, Fermentas GmbH, St. Leon-Rot, Germany). For a 25 μl PCR, 1 μl of cDNA was used as template. The PCR settings were: first cycle at 95 °C for 5 min, then for the optimized number of cycles for each gene product 1 min at 95 °C, 1 min at 47–67 °C, and 1 min at 72°C, and a final extension at 72 °C for 5 min. Oligonucleotides that were used for the detection of the transcripts are listed in Supplementary Table S1 available at JXB online. The intensity of each band after electrophoresis was determined with the Quantity One software (BioRad, Munich, Germany).
Microarray analysis

*Arabidopsis thaliana* 24k oligonucleotide arrays (MGW Biotech; http://www.mwg-biotech.com; ArrayExpress database accession no. A-ATMX-2; http://www.ebi.ac.uk/arrayexpress) were used to study changes in nuclear gene expression. Leaf samples from the WT and nadp-mdh knockout plants grown under standard conditions and treated for 7 h with HL (750 µmol quanta m^-2 s^-1) were collected. Following total RNA isolation (Piippo et al., 2006), cDNA synthesis, sample labelling, array hybridization and scanning, as well as spot intensity quantification were performed as in Kangasjärvi et al. (2008). The expression data were normalized and analysed by using the tool R/BioConductor limma (Smyth et al., 2003).

Western blot analysis and immunodecoration

Equal amounts of soluble protein (50 µg per lane) were loaded on 12% discontinuous SDS–polyacrylamide gels using a vertical minigel system (Mini-Protean II, BioRad). The gel was blotted onto a nitrocellulose membrane. Immunodecoration was performed essentially as described in Greave et al. (1994). For the detection, polyclonal antisera against NADP-MDH from pea leaves (1:3000), against the 2-Cys Prx BAS1 from barley (to detect detection, polyclonal antisera against NADP-MDH from pea (NADP-GAPDH) were performed as in Baalmann et al. (2008) using 10 mg of total leaf protein and immunodetection with the substrate as recommended by the supplier (GE Healthcare).

The steady-state levels of the ascorbate peroxidase isoforms tAPX, sAPX, pAPX, and the cytosolic APXs (Asada 1999; Chew et al. 2003; Narendra et al., 2006) were analyzed using the anti-APX antibody from Agrisera (http://www.agrisera.com/en/artiklar/apx-ascorbate-peroxidase-html) as described in Kangasjärvi et al. (2008) using 10 µg of total leaf protein and immunodetection with Arabidopsis anti-APX antibody (Kangasjärvi et al., 2008) using a Phototope™-Star Detection Kit (New England Biolabs, Beverly, MA, USA; http://www.neb.com/).

Enzyme measurements in crude extracts

Leaves were cut from the plant, immediately transferred and pulverized in liquid nitrogen, and stored until use at −80°C. For extraction, buffers as required for the various assays were added to aliquot portions of the powder. The total activity of NADP-MDH was determined after exhaustive reduction with reduced dithiothreitol (DTT) and corrected for unspecific NAD-MDH activity as described by Scheibe and Stitt (1988). The total capacities of catalase and APX were determined in extracts as in Del Longo et al. (1993). The enzyme extractions and measurements of the activities of NADP-dependent glyceraldehyde-3-P dehydrogenase (NADP-GAPDH) were performed as in Baalmann et al. (1995), of non-phosphorylating GAPDH (NP-GAPDH) as in Rius et al. (2006), and of glycerol-3-P dehydrogenase (G3PDH) as in Shen et al. (2006).

Chlorophyll (Chl) fluorescence measurements

A portable photosynthesis system LI-6400XT (LI-COR Biosciences, Lincoln, NE, USA) was used to measure leaf Chl fluorescence in 800 µmol quanta m^-2 s^-1 actinic light (Table 2), while for measurements in 50 µmol quanta m^-2 s^-1 the closed FluorCam FC 800-C (Photon Systems Instruments, Brno, Czech Republic) was used. The intensity of the saturating pulse was 5000 µmol quanta m^-2 s^-1 with a duration of 800 ms. The dark adaption time was 20 min. Maximum quantum yield in dark-adapted leaves (Fm/Fo), the quantum yield of photosystem II (PSII; FII) and the quenching coefficients photochemical quenching (qP) and non-photochemical quenching (NPQ) were calculated according to Schreiber et al. (1986), Walker (1988), and Genty et al. (1989).

Photosynthetic and respiratory performance of mesophyll protoplasts

Mesophyll protoplasts were isolated from leaves of 11- to 12-week-old WT and nadp-mdh plants that had been maintained under the growth conditions as described above. Leaf sections without a midrib were freed of the lower epidermis mechanically with a forceps and subjected to enzymatic digestion with 1% (w/v) Cellulase Onozuka R-10 and 0.4% (w/v) Macerozyme R-10 (Yakult Pharmaceutical Industry, Tokyo, Japan) as described (Riazunnisa et al., 2007).

Rates of respiratory O2 uptake in the dark and of photosynthetic O2 evolution in the light by mesophyll protoplasts of WT and nadp-mdh mutants were monitored at 25°C using a Clark-type O2 electrode (Model DW2, Hansatech Ltd, King’s Lynn, UK). The reaction medium for both photosynthesis and respiration determination was 1 ml containing 0.65 M sorbitol, 1 mM CaCl2, 1 mM MgCl2, and 1 mM NaHCO3 in 10 mM HEPES-KOH, pH 7.5, and protoplasts equivalent to 10 µg Chl (Riazunnisa et al., 2007). Illumination with 750 µmol quanta m^-2 s^-1 was provided by a 35 mm slide projector (halogen lamp: Xenophot 24 V:150 W). The inhibitors [SHAM, salicylhydroxamic acid (SHAM), glycine hydroxamate (GHA), and aminoacetocitrile (AAN), all from Sigma-Aldrich Co., St Louis, MO, USA] were added to the reaction medium containing mesophyll protoplasts to obtain the required final concentration, and the protoplasts were pre-incubated in darkness at 25°C for 5 min before switching on the light. The normal level of O2 in air-equilibrated reaction medium was 410 nmol ml^-1. The reaction medium in the O2 electrode chamber was bubbled with N2, resulting in a marked decrease of O2 to 85 nmol ml^-1.

Metabolite analysis

Starch content in leaves was determined according to Batz et al. (1995). Malate was determined enzymatically with glutamate-oxaloacetate transaminase (GOT; Sigma-Aldrich Co.) in a coupling reaction as described in a protocol of R-Biopharm GmbH (Darmstadt, Germany). Specifically, 100 mg of *Arabidopsis* leaves were frozen in N2, ground to powder, resuspended in 1 ml of H2O, and incubated at 95°C for 8 min. The supernatant was used for the measurement in buffer containing 100 mM glycylglycine, 100 mM glutamate, 1 mM NAD+, and G0T (1 U ml^-1). The reaction was started by adding 1 U ml^-1 NAD-MDH (Sigma-Aldrich Co.). For proline determination, *Arabidopsis* leaves (500 mg) were frozen in N2, ground to powder, and 0.5 ml of 3% sulphosalicylic acid was added. After mixing and centrifugation, 0.5 ml of the supernatant was transferred to a new reaction tube, and proline concentrations were measured colorimetrically using the ninhydrin method (Bates et al., 1973). Global metabolite analysis was performed by gas chromatography–mass spectrometry (GC-MS) as described by Lisek et al. (2006).

Glutathione determination

The amounts of reduced and oxidized glutathione (GSH and GSSG, respectively) were determined using the Total Glutathione Detection Kit (Enzo Life Sciences, Lörrach, Germany). For each genotype and treatment, *Arabidopsis* leaves from five plants were frozen in N2 and then ground to powder, and 50 mg of the tissue was used to prepare the extract. For this, 1 ml of ice-cold 5% metaphosphoric acid was added to the powder and vortexed for 30 s. After centrifugation, 50 µl aliquots of supernatant each were used for total glutathione and oxidized glutathione, respectively. For the latter, samples were incubated with 2-vinylpyridine at room temperature for 1 h prior to the assay. The absorbance was recorded at 405 nm using a plate reader (SPECTRMax Plus 348, Molecular Devices, Sunnyvale, CA, USA) at 1 min intervals over
a 10 min period. For analysis of the data, the software SoftMax Pro 5.3 (Molecular Devices) was used.

Reactive oxygen species (ROS) determinations

H$_2$O$_2$ was quantified in leaf extracts prepared immediately after exposure to HL for 5 h, as described by Liu et al. (2010). The extract was diluted accordingly and then used for H$_2$O$_2$ determination with an Amplex Red Hydrogen Peroxide/Peroxidase Assay Kit (Molecular Probes, Eugene, OR, USA). The values were obtained from three samples, each from two plants, and the standard error was calculated. The data were analysed by analysis of variance (ANOVA), and means were compared using a Student’s t-test.

Chl and protein determination

To determine leaf Chl a and b contents, extraction, photometric measurements, and calculation were performed as described in Sims and Gamon (2002). The protein content in the soluble leaf extracts was estimated according to Bradford (1976), with BSA as the standard.

Results

Verification of NADP-MDH gene knockout in two independent lines of A. thaliana

Two independent nadp-mdh-T-DNA insertion lines were identified in Arabidopsis. The lines At5g58330:::tDNA-50 and At5g58330:::tDNA-119 harbour a T-DNA insertion at positions 54 200 and 55 324, respectively, of chromosome 5 (Fig. 1A). The combination of the NADP-MDH-specific primers 119LP and 119RP for line 119 allowed for amplification of the expected PCR product (1028 bp) on genomic DNA from the WT, but not on DNA from homozygous nadp-mdh knockout plants from line 119 (Supplementary Fig. S1A at JXB online). For line 50, the gene-specific primers 121 and 84 were used and the corresponding PCR product had a size of 1320 bp (Supplementary Fig. S1B). PCR products were amplified in reactions containing the T-DNA left border primer LBa1 and one gene-specific primer on DNA from both homozygous nadp-mdh mutant lines, but not on DNA from WT plants (Supplementary Fig. S1A, B). The PCR result and the sequencing of the PCR products confirmed that in both cases homozygous T-DNA plants had been obtained.

Both homozygous lines lacked the NADP-MDH transcript as indicated by northern blot analysis (Supplementary Fig. S2A at JXB online) and RT-PCR (data not shown), and were devoid of the NADP-MDH protein as demonstrated by western blot analysis (Supplementary Fig. S2B). NADP-MDH activity, when corrected for the unspecific activity with NADPH oxidation derived from NAD-MDH isoforms (Scheibe and Stitt, 1988), was also completely absent (data not shown). The results validated both insertion lines as full nadp-mdh knockout lines. Given that the two insertion lines exhibited identical phenotypes, further work was concentrated on line 50, but selected results were also confirmed using line 119.

Phenotypic appearance of nadp-mdh plants

The phenotype of nadp-mdh plants under standard growth conditions (GL: 50 μmol quanta m$^{-2}$ s$^{-1}$, short-day) on soil was indistinguishable from that of the WT (Fig. 1B). Likewise, Chl a, Chl b, and protein contents as well as fresh weight and water content were not significantly altered in the nadp-mdh plants (Table 1).

Cultivation of WT plants under stress conditions such as HL, low temperature, or fluctuating light stimulates expression of NADP-MDH, indicating the requirement for an increased capacity of the malate valve (Becker et al., 2006). In this study, nadp-mdh plants treated with either HL or low temperature also revealed an unaltered phenotype compared with the WT. The GL-acclimated nadp-mdh mutant plants that were transferred to HL for 1 week (Fig. 1C), as well as the plants that were cultivated under HL for the complete growth period (Fig. 1D, E), developed a WT-like phenotype. Even under the more variable climatic conditions of a greenhouse, the potted mutants developed like the WT (data not shown).

HL effects on ROS formation and antioxidative systems

Accumulation of NADPH in the nadp-mdh plants could stimulate the Mehler reaction and concomitantly increase ROS formation during HL conditions. In the mutants, a decreased level of ROS was apparent compared with the WT, in HL as well as GL (Fig. 2A). The reduced and oxidized glutathione increased in both the WT and mutants upon exposure to HL, but the redox state was unaffected by the lack of chloroplast NADP-MDH (Fig. 2B). The protein levels, transcript amounts, and activities of selected Beck–Halliwell–Asada pathway enzymes were examined in WT and nadp-mdh mutant plants. No difference could be detected in either protein levels of the various APX isoforms (Fig. 2D) or the total APX activity (Fig. 2E). Semi-quantitative RT-PCR analysis revealed a strong up-regulation of sAPX transcript and a slight up-regulation of tAPX, dehydroascorbate reductase (DHAR), monodehydroascorbate reductase (MDAR), and glutathione reductase (GR) after HL treatment (Fig. 2C; Supplementary Fig. S3 at JXB online).

To address the ascorbate-independent water–water cycle, the expression of NTRC and the various chloroplast Prx isoforms in leaves of WT and nadp-mdh plants was analysed, after 7 h HL. NTRC transcript and protein levels were increased in the nadp-mdh plants after 7 h of HL (Fig. 3A, B), as were the transcript levels of chloroplast 2-Cys Prx isoforms PrxIE and PrxQ (Fig. 3A), whereby the increase of the PrxA/B and PrxIEE transcripts was significant. In contrast to transcript regulation, the amount of 2-Cys PrxA/B protein (named BAS1; Baier and Dietz, 1997) was unchanged in both genotypes after HL treatment (Fig. 3C).

Transcriptome profiling revealed an increase in some transcripts, among the most prominent being a C3HC4 zinc finger RING-type protein (At4g26400), a WRKY-family (At4g31550), and a MYB-related (At4g01060) transcription factor (Supplementary Fig. S3 at JXB online). These transcription factors are also found to be increased in EXECUTER mutants where signalling from the chloroplast to the nucleus is affected (Lee et al., 2007).
Photosynthetic performance and photorespiratory components in WT and nadp-mdh plants under HL conditions

Photosynthetic CO₂ assimilation rates as a function of light intensities were quite similar in leaves of nadp-mdh and WT plants (data not shown). Chl fluorescence was used to monitor the redox state of PSII in WT and nadp-mdh plants after growth in moderate light (GL), after growth in HL (750 μmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹) for long-term acclimation, and during a HL treatment in the measurement (~20–30 min) after growth in GL for short-term acclimation. Under all conditions, no significant differences in the efficiency of
Table 1. Leaf characteristics of WT and nadp-mdh Arabidopsis plants

Arabidopsis plants were grown for 11 weeks under GL (50 μmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹), then the leaves were analyzed.

|                     | WT       | nadp-mdh |
|---------------------|----------|----------|
| Specific fresh weight (mg cm⁻²) | 18.09±1.14 | 17.93±1.10 |
| Water content (%)    | 92.49±0.31 | 92.11±0.41 |
| Chi a (μg cm⁻²)      | 5.21±1.34 | 5.56±1.66 |
| Chi b (μg cm⁻²)      | 2.10±0.55 | 2.2±0.59  |
| Protein (μg cm⁻²)    | 157.20±6.89 | 157.18±15.20 |
| Starch as glucose units (μmol mg⁻¹ Chl) | 27.35±0.37a | 27.49±2.20a |

* After 1 d of HL treatment.

Discussion

Flexibility in redox metabolism prevents phenotypic alterations in nadp-mdh plants

Experimental evidence and theoretical considerations suggest that the malate valve can counteract over-reduction of the photosynthetic electron transport chain (Scheibe, 2004). Therefore, it was surprising to observe the WT-like performance of nadp-mdh plants even when cultivated under HL conditions, for example with respect to photosynthetic performance and development (Table 1; Fig. 1). Obviously, these mutants do not use excess reducing equivalents in the Calvin cycle for CO₂ fixation and for biomass production as
evidenced by the identical CO2 assimilation rates of leaves, similar photosynthesis rates in isolated protoplasts (Fig. 4A), and unaltered levels of the photosynthetic products, sucrose and starch (Fig. 6, Table 1). An inhibitory effect on the growth rate was detected in antisense tobacco plants expressing <10% of WT amounts of NADP-MDH when grown under natural light conditions in a greenhouse (Faske et al., 1997). Overexpression of NADP-MDH
stimulated tobacco plant development until the pot size became limiting (Faske et al., 1997).

In this study, the photosynthetic electron transport was also broadly unaffected by altered NADPH+H⁺ oxidation.

Fig. 3. Transcript and protein levels of the NTRC and chloroplast Prx system. (A) Densitometric analysis of RT-PCR for NTRC, 2-Cys PrxA/B, PrxQ, and PrxIE in leaves of WT and nadp-mdh knockout plants after 7 h of HL treatment. Ubiquitin (UBQ) was used as the reference transcript. (B and C) Protein amounts of NTRC and 2-Cys Prx. Western blot and immunodetection using antiserum against NTRC and 2-Cys Prx were performed with extracts from WT and nadp-mdh knockout plants after 7 h of HL treatment. In the lower part, the Coomassie-stained band of the RubisCO large subunit (LSU) is shown as a loading control. Asterisks indicate that the differences ($P < 0.05$) between WT and nadp-mdh mutants are statistically significant as determined by the t-test.

Table 2. Photosynthetic parameters of WT and nadp-mdh Arabidopsis plants under GL and HL conditions

| Experiment<sup>a</sup> | 50/50 | 750/50 | 50/750 |
|------------------------|-------|--------|--------|
|                        | WT    | nadp-mdh | WT     | nadp-mdh | WT     | nadp-mdh |
| $F_{v}/F_{m}$          | 0.84±0.00 | 0.84±0.00 | 0.75±0.03 | 0.74±0.03 | 0.81±0.01 | 0.81±0.01 |
| qP                     | 0.80±0.04 | 0.82±0.01 | 0.86±0.04 | 0.88±0.02 | 0.32±0.02 | 0.31±0.03 |
| NPQ                    | 0.26±0.04 | 0.19±0.04 | 0.23±0.05 | 0.27±0.14 | 1.97±0.14 | 1.84±0.13 |
| $\Phi I$               | 0.64±0.01 | 0.66±0.01 | 0.61±0.01 | 0.62±0.04 | 0.17±0.02 | 0.16±0.01 |

<sup>a</sup> Each set of data in the three experiments was generated with a different combination of light intensities during pre-treatment and measurement for WT and mutant plants, e.g. 50/50: pre-treatment of the plants at 50 µmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹ measurement at 50 µmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹.
capacity as an electron acceptor in nadp-mdh plants (Table 2). Likewise, potato plants expressing minimal amounts of NADP-MDH (≤10% of the WT) are able to adjust photosynthesis and CO2 assimilation for unaffected performance, most probably by employing various energy-dissipating cycles at PSI and PSII (Laisk et al., 2007). Since there is no evidence for over-reduction at PSII even in the nadp-mdh A. thaliana plants under HL conditions (Table 2), it is expected that these mutants use compensatory strategies to protect themselves from excess reductant in chloroplasts and subsequent oxidative stress.

A set of diverse mechanisms can help to avoid development of oxidative damage (Noctor and Foyer, 1998; Niyogi, 2000; Scheibe et al., 2005; Hanke et al., 2009; Scheibe and Dietz, 2011). The analysis of the mutants, lacking nadp-mdh, revealed a novel combination of different mechanisms to cope with excess reducing equivalents as discussed below: (i) a stimulated NTRC/2-Cys Prx system; (ii) adjustments in photorespiratory metabolism; and (iii) possibly, proline biosynthesis.
ROS production and the importance of the NTRC/Prx-based antioxidative system

One might expect stimulated electron transfer to O₂, and thus increased ROS production and oxidative stress, in plants lacking the malate valve. Glutathione (GSH) and ascorbate are important to protect plants from oxidative damage (Noctor and Foyer, 1998; Mullineaux and Rausch, 2005), through the Beck–Halliwell–Asada pathway (Foyer and Halliwell, 1976) and in the GSH–glutaredoxin-type II Prx pathway (Tripathi et al., 2009). However, there were no marked changes in either glutathione (Fig. 2B) or ascorbate/DHA (Fig. 6). Expression of various enzymes of the Beck–Halliwell–Asada cycle in nadp-mdh plants was also unchanged, even in HL (Fig. 2C–E). This suggests that the ROS-scavenging systems, based on the ascorbate/glutathione and Beck–Halliwell–Asada pathway, are unaffected in nadp-mdh plants. However, the mutant plants showed increased levels of the NTRC/Prx system.
NADP-malate dehydrogenase knockout induces multiple strategies

Fig. 8. Seedling growth on agar under sterile conditions and on soil. (A) Sterilized seeds were placed on agar containing 1.8 mM nitrate as an N source, and seedlings were grown for 5 weeks under short-day conditions in sealed Petri dishes. The fresh weight of 100 seedlings of each genotype with standard deviations is given. (B) Seeds were grown in pots with soil, and the fresh weight of the above-ground biomass was determined for 100 seedlings of each genotype at 5 weeks of age. Asterisks indicate that the differences (P < 0.05) between WT and nadp-mdh mutants are statistically significant as determined by the t-test.

Besides the Beck–Halliwell–Asada pathway, the NTRC/Prx system quenches H$_2$O$_2$ in the chloroplast (König et al., 2002; Serrato et al., 2004; Pérez-Ruiz et al., 2006) and this peroxide detoxification cycle was named the ascorbate-independent or Prx-dependent water–water cycle (Dietz et al., 2006). Recent studies using knock-down plants show that the NTRC-dependent regeneration of 2-Cys Prx is more important than the thioredoxin-dependent one (Pulido et al., 2010). In nadp-mdh mutants under HL, 2-Cys Prx B and NTRC transcripts, as well as NTRC protein increased compared with WT plants (Fig. 3A, B). Data from Spinola et al. (2008) indicate that the NTRC system plays a specific role in eliminating ROS in the dark, and this point explains that stress treatment in the dark has more effect on Arabidopsis ntrc knockout lines than on WT plants (Pérez-Ruiz et al., 2006). In nadp-mdh plants too, the Prx-dependent water–water cycle appears to function as an alternative poising system that is increased to use up NADPH when malate cannot be formed (Fig. 9). Transcript profiling gave no additional clues as to which alternative pathways might have been up-regulated (Supplementary Fig. S3 at JXB online).

Adjustments in components of photorespiration, mitochondria, and proline biosynthesis may all compensate for the lack of malate valve

Despite being a major source of ROS, photorespiration is crucial for maintaining the redox state in plant cells (Foyer et al., 2009; Bauwe et al., 2010). Therefore, in nadp-mdh plants, the photorespiratory pathway may provide an alternative mechanism to transport excess reducing equivalents from the chloroplast to the mitochondrion, facilitating electron transfer to O$_2$ via the cytochrome c oxidase pathway or AOX (Fig. 9). Transcript profiling of mutant plants lacking NTRC had increased transcript levels for photorespiratory genes such as those coding for catalase, P-protein, and hydroxypropyruvate reductase, and showed multiple signs of metabolic imbalances (Lepistö et al., 2009). The marked decrease in photosynthesis of protoplasts under low oxygen (Fig. 4A), high expression of GDC (Figs. 4B, C), and a shift in the glycine-to-serine ratio (Fig. 6) suggest altered patterns in photorespiration of nadp-mdh mutants.

Inhibition of AOX or lack of the AOX1A isoform in mitochondria of transgenic plants is known to cause over-reduction of the photosynthetic electron transport chain in the light (Padmasreee and Raghavendra, 1999; Yoshida et al., 2007; Strodtkötter et al., 2009). The increase in protein and activity of AOX under HL and drought (Clifton et al., 2006; Giraud et al., 2008) suggest that AOX plays an important role in the consumption of excess reducing equivalents exported from the chloroplasts in light. Although the malate valve-dependent transport was disabled, the increase in AOX1A transcript levels in nadp-mdh mutants was similar to that in WT plants after HL treatment (Fig. 6C), indicating activation of alternative pathways for NADH re-oxidation in the mitochondria of both the WT and mutants. Interestingly, transgenic tomato plants with decreased mitochondrial MADH-NAO re-oxidation re-oxidation of mitochondria of both the WT and mutants. Interestingly, transgenic tomato plants with decreased mitochondrial MADH-NAO expression and AOX1A expression exhibit even enhanced photosynthetic performance (Nunes-Nesi et al., 2005), indicating the redundancy of some of the oxidative processes involved in optimizing photosynthesis. In double mutants expressing neither mitochondrial MDH isoform, photorespiration was increased (Tomaz et al., 2010).

Possible function of proline in nadp-mdh knockout plants

The increased proline contents of nadp-mdh mutants in HL (Figs 6, 7B) might represent a strategy of the plants to increase stress tolerance, since proline functions as a compatible solute in drought/salt stress (Hare et al., 1999) and stabilizes the redox status of the cell (Bellinger and Larher, 1987; Hare et al., 1999; Szabados and Savouré, 2009). Further experiments are needed to confirm that the accumulation of proline in the nadp-mdh mutants under HL can help to consume excess NADPH (Fig. 9).

Early seedling growth

A highly reproducible increase in biomass occurred in the mutant plants during early development when grown on soil, or on agar under sterile conditions with 1.8 mM nitrate
in minimal medium (Fig. 8). The compensatory responses in the nadph-mdh plants seem to become established early to achieve a metabolic pattern and altered redox state which are even beneficial under certain conditions.

**Conclusions**

The nadp-mdh mutants employ a combination of mechanisms to compensate for the lack of the malate valve function under HL conditions. Higher capacity of the NTRC system, along with increased expression of Prxs could facilitate balancing the NADP/NADPH ratio in the chloroplasts and sustain ROS scavenging. Adjustments in photosynthetic components might also reflect the need to dissipate excess reducing equivalents and prevent photoinhibition. Further experiments are required to establish the role of proline as a protective mechanism against oxidative stress in nadp-mdh mutants. It is suggested that ROS may act as a ‘prime’ to trigger changes initially in chloroplasts and then in other compartments of plant cells, resulting in acclimation of nadp-mdh plants.

**Supplementary data**

Supplementary data are available at JXB online.

**Figure S1.** PCR analyses for proof of homozygous T-DNA insertion and NADP-MDH gene knockout.

**Figure S2.** Northern blot (A) and western blot with immunodecoration (B) to document the NADP-MDH (At5g58330) gene knockout in the lines 119 (Salk_063444) and 50 (Salk_012655).

**Figure S3.** Heatmap showing up- and down-regulated genes in the HL-treated (7 h at 1000 μmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹) nadp-mdh versus WT plants grown for 5 weeks under 100 μmol quanta m⁻² s⁻¹, 8/16 h light/dark rhythm. Results from three independent experiments with | log₂(expression ratio) | > 1 and P-value <0.06 are shown. The analysis was run in R/BioConductor using topTable and heatmap.2 functions.

**Table S1.** Oligonucleotides used for RT-PCR.

**Table S2.** Relative metabolite content in WT and nadp-mdh mutants grown under low light (GL) and exposed to HL for 7 h.

**Acknowledgements**

This study was financially supported by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft to V.L. and R.S. (EM166/1), grants from the Department of Science and Technology-Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst (DAAD, to A.S.R. and R.S.), the DAAD-Finland program (to R.S. and E.-M.A.), and by a DFG-Mercator Visiting Professorship to A.S.R. Funds were also received from the Academy of Finland to E.-M.A. (118637, 8133293), P.M. (130075), and S.K. (130595). The authors thank Dr Francisco Javier Cejudo (Sevilla) for the gift of anti-NTRC serum as well as probes for NTRC, and Dr Eevi Rintamäki for the antibody against Arabidopsis APXs. We thank Professor Hermann Bauwe (Rostock) for probes and antisera against GDC (P-protein). We also thank Guiseppe Forlani (Ferrara, Italy) for providing P5C, and Dietmar Funck (Konstanz, Germany) for advice concerning proline metabolic enzyme measurements. Thanks are due to Silke Walter for expert technical assistance. We also thank Heike Wolf-Wibbelmann and Kirsten Jäger for cultivating the plants, and

![Fig. 9. Overview of compensatory pathways which prevent over-reduction and overenergization of the chloroplast in nadp-mdh knockout mutants. The pathways which are stimulated in mutants are all shown by red arrows, normal pathways in black, and suppressed routes in grey. See text for further description.](image-url)
References

Ahn JH. 2002. Noncompetitive RT-PCR. In: Weigel D, Glazebrook J, eds. Arabidopsis. A laboratory manual. Cold Spring Harbor, NY: Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press, 174–176.

Asada K. 1999. The water–water cycle in chloroplasts: scavenging of active oxygens and dissipation of excess photons. Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology 50, 601–639.

Baalmann E, Backhausen JE, Vetter S, Scheibe R. 1995. Reductive modification and non-reductive activation of purified spinach chloroplast NADP-glyceraldehyde 3-phosphate dehydrogenase. Archives of Biochemistry and Biophysics 324, 201–208.

Baier M, Dietz KJ. 1997. The plant 2-Cys peroxiredoxin BAS1 is a nuclear-encoded chloroplast protein: its expression-related, phylogenetic origin, and implications for its specific physiological function in plants. The Plant Journal 12, 179–190.

Bates LS, Waldren RP, Teare ID. 1973. Rapid determination of free proline for water-stress studies. Plant and Soil 39, 205–207.

Batz O, Scheibe R, Neuhaus HE. 1995. Purification of chloroplasts from fruits of green-pepper (Capsicum annuum L.) and characterization of starch synthesis. Evidence for a functional hexose-phosphate translocator. Planta 196, 50–57.

Bauwe H, Hagemann M, Fernie AR. 2010. Photospiration: players, partners and origin. Trends in Plant Science 15, 330–336.

Becker B, Holtgrefe S, Jung S, Wunrau C, Kandlbinder A, Baier M, Dietz K-J, Backhausen JE, Scheibe R. 2006. Influence of the photoperiod on redox regulation and stress responses in Arabidopsis thaliana (H.-Heynh.) plants under long- and short-day conditions. Planta 224, 380–393.

Bellinger Y, Larher F. 1987. Proline accumulation in higher plants: a redox buffer? Plant Physiology 6, 23–27.

Bradford MM. 1976. Rapid and sensitive method for quantitation of microgram quantities of protein utilizing the principle of protein–dye binding. Analytical Biochemistry 72, 248–254.

Chew O, Whelan J, Millar AH. 2003. Molecular definition of the ascorbate–glutathione cycle in Arabidopsis mitochondria reveals dual targeting of antioxidant defenses in plants. Journal of Biological Chemistry 278, 46869–46877.

Clifton R, Millar AH, Whelan J. 2006. Alternative oxidases in Arabidopsis: a comparative analysis of differential expression in the gene family provides new insights into function of non-phosphorylating bypasses. Biochimica et Biophysica Acta 1757, 730–741.

Del Longo OT, González CA, Pastori GM, Trippi VS. 1993. Antioxidant defences under hypoxic and hyperosmotic conditions in leaves of two lines of maize with differential sensitivity to drought. Plant and Cell Physiology 34, 1023–1028.

Dietz KJ, Jacob S, Oelze ML, Laxa M, Tognetti V, de Miranda SMN, Baier M, Finkemeier I. 2006. The function of peroxiredoxins in plant organelle redox metabolism. Journal of Experimental Botany 57, 1697–1709.

Faske M, Backhausen JE, Sendker M, Singer-Bayrle M, Scheibe R, von Schawaen A. 1997. Transgenic tobacco plants expressing pea chloroplast Nmdh cDNA in sense and antisense orientation: effects on NADP-malate dehydrogenase level, stability of transformants, and plant growth. Plant Physiology 115, 705–715.

Faske M, Holtgrefe S, Ocheretina O, Meister M, Backhausen JE, Scheibe R. 1995. Redox equilibria between the regulatory thiols of light/dark-modulated chloroplast enzymes and dithiothreitol: fine-tuning by metabolites. Biochimica et Biophysica Acta 1247, 135–142.

Foyer CH, Halliwell B. 1976. The presence of glutathione and glutathione reductase in chloroplasts: a proposed role in ascorbic acid metabolism. Planta 133, 21–25.

Foyer CH, Noctor G. 2009. Redox regulation in photosynthetic organisms: signalling, acclimation, and practical implications. Antioxidants and Redox Signaling 11, 861–905.

Foyer CH, Bloom AJ, Queval G, Noctor G. 2009. Photosynthetic metabolism: genes, mutants, energetics, and redox signaling. Annual Review of Plant Biology 60, 455–484.

Genty B, Briantais J-M, Baker NR. 1989. The relationship between the quantum yield of photosynthetic electron transport and quenching of chlorophyll fluorescence. Biochimica et Biophysica Acta 990, 87–92.

Giraud E, Ho LH, Clifton R, et al. 2008. The absence of ALTERNATIVE OXIDASE1a in Arabidopsis results in acute sensitivity to combined light and drought stress. Plant Physiology 147, 595–610.

Gravee K, von Schaewen A, Scheibe R. 1994. Purification, characterization, and cDNA sequence of glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase from potato (Solanum tuberosum L.). The Plant Journal 5, 353–361.

Hanke GT, Holtgrefe S, König N, Strodtkötter I, Voss I, Scheibe R. 2009. Use of transgenic plants to uncover strategies for maintenance of redox-homeostasis during photosynthesis. In: Jacquot J-P, ed. Advances in botanical research: oxidative stress and redox regulation in plants, Vol. 52. New York: Academic Press, 207–251.

Hare PD, Cress WA, van Staden J. 1999. Proline synthesis and degradation: a model system for elucidating stress-related signal transduction. Journal of Experimental Botany 50, 413–434.

Igamberdiev AU, Bykova NV, Lea PJ, Gardestrom P. 2001. The role of photorespiration in redox and energy balance of photosynthetic plant cells: a study with a barley mutant deficient in glycine decarboxylase. Physiologia Plantarum 111, 427–438.

Kangasjärvi S, Lepistö A, Hännikäinen K, Piippo M, Luomala E-M, Aro E-M, Rintamäki E. 2008. Diverse roles of chloroplast stromal and thylakoid-bound ascorbate peroxidases in plant stress responses. Biochemical Journal 412, 275–285.

König J, Baier M, Horling F, Kahmann U, Harris G, Schümann P, Dietz KJ. 2002. The plant-specific function of 2-Cys peroxiredoxin-mediated detoxification of peroxides in the redox-hierarchy of photosynthetic electron flux. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 99, 5738–5743.

Laisk A, Eichelmann H, Oja V, Talts E, Scheibe R. 2007. Rates and roles of cyclic and alternative electron flow in leaves. Plant and Cell Physiology 48, 1575–1588.
Lee KP, Kim C, Landgraf F, Apel K. 2007. EXECUTER1- and EXECUTER2-dependent transfer of stress-related signals from the plastid to the nucleus of Arabidopsis thaliana. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 104, 10270–10275.

Lepistö Å, Kangasjärvi S, Luomala E-M, Brader G, Sipari N, Keränen M, Keinänen M, Rintamäki E. 2009. Chloroplast NADPH-thioredoxin reductase interacts with photoperiodic development in Arabidopsis. Plant Physiology 149, 1261–1276.

Lisec J, Schauer N, Kopka J, Willmitzer L, Fernie AR. 2006. Gas chromatography–mass spectrometry-based metabolite profiling in plants. Nature Protocols 1, 387–396.

Liu Y, Ye N, Liu R, Chen M, Zhang J. 2010. H2O2 mediates the regulation of ABA catabolism and GA biosynthesis in Arabidopsis seed dormancy and germination. Journal of Experimental Botany 61, 2979–2990.

Mullineaux PM, Rausch T. 2005. Glutathione, photosynthesis and the redox regulation of stress-responsive gene expression. Photosynthesis Research 86, 459–474.

Narendra S, Venkataramani S, Shen G, Wang J, Pasapula V, Lin Y, Kornyeyev D, Holaday AS, Zhang H. 2006. The Arabidopsis ascorbate peroxidase 3 is a peroxisomal membrane-bound antioxidant enzyme and is dispensable for Arabidopsis growth and development. Journal of Experimental Botany 57, 3033–3042.

Niyogi KK. 2000. Safety valves for photosynthesis. Current Opinion in Plant Biology 3, 455–460.

Noctor G, Foyer CH. 1998. Ascorbate and glutathione: keeping active oxygen under control. Annual Review in Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology 49, 249–279.

Nunes-Nesi A, Carrari F, Lytovchenko A, Smith AMO, Loureiro ME, Ratcliffe I, Sweetlove LJ, Fernie AR. 2005. Enhanced photosynthetic performance and growth as a consequence of decreasing mitochondrial malate dehydrogenase activity in transgenic tomato plants. Plant Physiology 137, 611–622.

Padmasree K, Raghavendra AS. 1999. Response of photosynthetic carbon assimilation in mesophyll protoplasts to restriction on mitochondrial oxidative metabolism: metabolites related to the redox status and sucrose biosynthesis. Photosynthesis Research 62, 231–239.

Pérez-Ruiz JM, Spinola MC, Kirchsteiger K, Moreno J, Sahrawy M, Cejudo FJ. 2006. Rice NTRC is a high-efficiency redox system for chloroplast protection against oxidative damage. The Plant Cell 18, 2356–2368.

Piippo M, Allahverdiyeva Y, Paakkarinen V, Suoranta U-M, Battchkova N, Aro E-M. 2006. Chloroplast-mediated regulation of nuclear genes in Arabidopsis thaliana in the absence of light stress. Physiological Genomics 25, 142–152.

Pulido P, Spinola MC, Kirchsteiger K, Guinea M, Pascual MB, Sahrawy M, Sandalio LM, Dietz KJ, González M, Cejudo FC. 2010. Functional analysis of the pathways for 2-Cys peroxiredoxin in Arabidopsis thaliana chloroplasts. Journal of Experimental Botany 61, 4043–4054.

Riazunnissa K, Padmavathi L, Scheibe R, Raghavendra AS. 2007. Preparation of Arabidopsis mesophyll protoplasts with high rates of photosynthesis. Physiologia Plantarum 129, 679–686.

Rius SP, Casati P, Iglesias AA, Gomez-Casati DF. 2006. Characterization of an Arabidopsis thaliana mutant lacking a cytosolic non-phosphorylating glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase. Plant Molecular Biology 61, 945–957.

Scheibe R. 2004. Malate valves to balance cellular energy supply. Physiologia Plantarum 120, 21–26.

Scheibe R, Backhausen JE, Emmerlich V, Holtgrefe S. 2005. Strategies to maintain redox homeostasis during photosynthesis under changing conditions. Journal of Experimental Botany 56, 1481–1489.

Scheibe R, Dietz KJ. 2011. Reduction–oxidation network for flexible adjustment of cellular metabolism in photoautotrophic cells. Plant, Cell and Environment (in press).

Scheibe R, Jacquot JP. 1983. NADP regulates the light activation of NADP-dependent malate dehydrogenase. Planta 157, 548–553.

Scheibe R, Stitt M. 1988. Comparison of NADP-malate dehydrogenase activation, Q4 reduction and O2 evolution in spinach leaves. Plant Physiology and Biochemistry 26, 473–481.

Schreiber U, Schliwa U, Bilger W. 1986. Continuous recording of photochemical and nonphotochemical chlorophyll fluorescence quenching with a new type of modulation fluorometer. Photosynthesis Research 10, 51–62.

Serrato AJ, Pérez-Ruiz JM, Spinola MC, Cejudo FJ. 2004. A novel NADPH thioredoxin reductase, localized in the chloroplast, which deficiency causes hypersensitivity to abiotic stress in Arabidopsis thaliana. Journal of Biological Chemistry 279, 43821–43827.

Shen W, Wei Y, Dauk M, Tan Y, Taylor DC, Selvaraj G, Zou J. 2006. Involvement of a glycerol-3-phosphate dehydrogenase in modulating the NADH/NAD+ ratio provides evidence of a mitochondrial glycerol-3-phosphate shuttle in Arabidopsis. The Plant Cell 18, 422–441.

Sims DA, Gamon JA. 2002. Relationship between leaf pigment content and spectral reflectance across a wide range of species, leaf structures and developmental stages. Remote Sensing of Environment 81, 337–354.

Smyth GK, Yang YH, Speed T. 2003. Statistical issues in cDNA microarray data analysis. Methods in Molecular Biology 224, 111–136.

Spinola MC, Perez-Ruiz JM, Pulido P, Kirchsteiger K, Guinea M, Gonzalez M, Cejudo FJ. 2008. NTRC new ways of using NADPH in the chloroplast. Physiologia Plantarum 133, 516–524.

Strodtkötter I, Padmasree K, Dinakar C, et al. 2009. Induction of the AOX1D isoform of alternative oxidase in A. thaliana T-DNA insertion lines lacking isoform AOX1A is insufficient to optimize photosynthesis when treated with antimycin A. Molecular Plant 2, 284–297.

Szabados L, Savouré A. 2009. Proline: a multifunctional amino acid. Trends in Plant Science 15, 89–97.

Tomaz T, Bagard M, Pracharoenwattana I, Lindén P, Lee CP, Carroll AJ, Ströner E, Smith SM, Gardeström P, Millar AH. 2010. Mitochondrial malate dehydrogenase lowers leaf respiration and alters photorespiration and plant growth in Arabidopsis. Plant Physiology 154, 1143–1157.

Tripathi BN, Bhatt I, Dietz KJ. 2009. Peroxiredoxins: a less studied component of hydrogen peroxide detoxification in photosynthetic organisms. Protoplasma 235, 3–15.
Walker D. 1988. *The use of the oxygen electrode and fluorescent probes in simple measurements of photosynthesis*. Sheffield: Oxygraphics Ltd.

Wingler A, Lea PJ, Quick WP, Leegood RC. 2000. Photorespiration: metabolic pathways and their role in stress protection. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* **355**, 1517–1529.

Wilson AK, Pickett FB, Turner JC, Estelle M. 1990. A dominant mutation in Arabidopsis confers resistance to auxin, ethylene and abscisic acid. *Molecular Genetics and Genomics* **222**, 377–383.

Yoshida K, Terashima I, Noguchi K. 2007. Up-regulation of mitochondrial alternative oxidase concomitant with chloroplast over-reduction by excess light. *Plant and Cell Physiology* **48**, 606–614.