The Impact of English Language Dominance in Music Therapy Learning Resources on Indonesian Music Therapy Students’ Practice

Kezia Putri

1 Music Therapy, Conservatory of Music, Universitas Pelita Harapan, Indonesia
* keziakarnila@yahoo.com

Received 19 July 2021; Accepted 22 August 2022; Published 1 November 2022
Editors: Maren Metell, Hiroko Miyake, Andrew Dell'Antonio, Alyssa Hillary Zisk
Reviewers: Stuart Wood, Gustavo Gattino

Abstract

English remains one of the top global languages that is used to bridge language differences in various regions in the world. According to Szmigiera (2021), in 2020 there were approximately 1.35 billion English speakers around the world. English is one of the foreign languages often used by Indonesians to connect with people and explore knowledge from other countries. A few roles that the English language plays in Indonesia are supporting economic and business development, building international relations, supporting the education system, and others (Crystal, 1997). This is also the case with music therapy education in Indonesia. Ever since the beginning of the music therapy program at Universitas Pelita Harapan in Indonesia, the program coordinators were all educated through – and have taught the students in the university with – English-dominated education materials and resources. Despite its benefits, this also had posed an issue with a few students in the past due to the difference in their cultural and language background. Some of the students had struggled to comprehend the learning materials; this, in turn, affected their understanding of the practice. However, despite the struggles, some students had also reported the benefits of using English education materials. This study aims to: 1) reveal the impact of English-language resources on the students’ music therapy understandings and practice, and 2) evaluate whether there is a concrete action that can be taken to improve the system. Both will be explored through the perspective of the students. In this narrative inquiry study, ten Indonesian students from Universitas Pelita Harapan, Indonesia, were interviewed on their experiences of using English-language learning materials and resources, the impact on their practice, and their opinion on actions for improvements. This study hopes to raise the awareness of the wide impact that English-dominance in music therapy learning resources might impose.

Keywords: English dominance; learning materials; students; music therapy
Introduction

Personal Statement

As an Indonesian, my exposure to the English language started as early as kindergarten, and it became more intense when I entered Junior High School. I remember that almost all subjects were delivered in English. Just like some other families, we often compared our own culture to the Western culture and always thought that the grass is greener on the other side. Right after finishing up my undergraduate music therapy program in Indonesia, I decided to go to Canada for my Master’s degree. This is where my whole preconception of Western culture started to shift. I remember having to adapt to speaking English 24/7, writing English academic papers and feeling frustrated with these papers because even writing them in Bahasa Indonesia is difficult enough, and then I had to write in English. I had help from the university’s writing center and my friends, but I certainly remember the frustration. Long story short, after the graduation I returned to Indonesia and worked at an Indonesian local university as a lecturer and supervisor. Through working with students, I gained new insights on how the Western concept of music therapy affected the development of music therapy in Indonesia. The longer I spent time in this job, the more I realized that a lot of what I brought into this program might not be embracing diversity. Out of obliviousness, I might have imposed that the Western view of music therapy should have a greater power over other local views of music and medicine. This study was initiated when I had just taught in the university for about a year. I acknowledge my lack of understanding and knowledge of Indonesian traditional culture, and that all my music therapy knowledge was majorly influenced by Western practice. Therefore, I wanted to investigate the students’ perspective to see how the current music therapy education program that is also majorly influenced by western concept affected the students, clients, stakeholders, and others. I also would like to acknowledge the possibility that the students’ view on music therapy might have been majorly influenced by the perspective of their past and current lecturers and supervisors, including myself.

The Spread of English Language and its Roles

There are approximately 1.35 billion English speakers around the world in 2020 (Szmaciga, 2021). English remains one of the world’s most spoken languages. A global language implies that a language is geographically widespread and spoken by different language communities, making it possible for them to communicate despite language differences. Typically, a language is considered global because of the power that its country of origin and its people have, especially power in politics and the military. In his book, English as a Global Language, Crystal (1997) stated that in his opinion, the growth and spread of English language as a global language has become so great that it will continue to spread. As an Indonesian that lives in a more modern town of Jakarta, I believe English language had penetrated to most social elements, even to the most basic daily conversations.

The use of English as a global language in different countries can be found in several forms (Rohmah, 2005). English may be used as a second language (ESL) or as a foreign language (EFL). The status of the English language in a country depends on the start of the spread of English in each country. Kachru (1985) drew these forms in a model of three-layered circle, namely the Inner, Outer, and Expanding layers. The native speakers of English are in the Inner layer, ESL is in the Outer layer, and EFL is in the Expanding layer. Examples of countries that have adopted English as a second language are India, Singapore, and Malaysia. Countries that have adopted English as a foreign language include China, Russia, Egypt, Brazil, and Indonesia. However, Colebrook (1996) suggested that the terms
above may give an idea that the English-speaking countries are the subjects, and the rest are merely the spectators, if not the objects. Differences in forms of how English was perceived in these countries may imply the significance and proficiency of English language among its citizens.

As one of the global lingua franca, English has a role to bridge global diversity. Because of the massive number of languages that the world has, it is unlikely to rely on individuals as translators to ensure smooth communication. According to Lauder (2008), the role of English in many countries including Indonesia are: as a means of international communication in practically all fields or walks of life, a medium through which scientific knowledge can be shared, as a source of vocabulary for the development and modernization of a country, and to get to know native speakers of English and their culture. As much as English is appreciated as a bridging language, it is also important to acknowledge that at the same time, the use of English language in a few educational institutions in Indonesia may cause a more distinct societal hierarchy, and educational and cultural gap between different communities in Indonesia. The more frequent use of English in all layers of Indonesian society may create a sense of superiority and give more power towards English language, and a sense of awkwardness in using Indonesian language (Marsudi & Zahrok, 2015). If this continues, it may eventually result in over-glorifying English and the extinction of Indonesian national identity because Indonesian language may not have the chance to grow and develop properly.

**The Use of English Language in Higher & Continuing Education**

English is currently considered one of the means of global communication that prevent us from being isolated from the world that is developing and moving rapidly (Abdulhafidh, 2015). The majority of countries have realized the necessity of providing education in English language (Balan, 2011). It is no longer just a requirement at the level of local education, but also a requirement for global education. During the last few decades, the use of the English language in global academic publication has increased. This is done to give a wider impact globally to academicians in different countries. The increased use of the English language in international academic publication is followed by the increase of published authors from non-Anglo-Saxon countries.

Due to the increase of interest in using the English language in the Indonesian education system, the mastery of English by university lecturers and students is more important than ever. It is highly encouraged that lecturers are given proper English language training (Himawati, 2018), and that students are given proper English training at schools to prepare them to use university learning resources. According to a survey, Indonesian EFL university students who have more experience in English reading prior to their lessons in the university will have more motivation to read English-language literature such as scientific journals and books (Salikin et al., 2017). The students’ experience in English reading includes experiences in primary and secondary school English class, as well as their family habits. Family is our first learning environment. Therefore, it makes sense that a family’s predominant use of the English language in the home environment has the great potential to affect an individual’s level of comfort and confidence in using English. In the meantime, not all Indonesian students have the opportunity to learn English prior to university, and this could imply some limitation that these students might experience.

In a survey by Ifanti (2012), most of the Indonesian university EFL students in East Java claimed that they only read English literature for one hour each day or less; or they claimed that they do not often read English. Meanwhile, 64% of the respondents claimed that reading English literature in the university classes is difficult, and 68.5% of the respondents stated that they only read English literature because their lecturers required them to read this literature in class. Only 8% of the respondents claimed that they read
for leisure. On the other hand, when it comes to English writing motivation, Toba et al. (2019) stated that the Indonesian EFL students’ low motivation was impacted by the lack of practice, dislike in writing, anxiety, negative perception of writing, and inadequate teaching in English writing. All in all, the discussion implies that English language training — both in reading and writing — has a strong impact on tertiary students’ motivation in learning their subject.

In the broader community of music therapy, English is often used as the main language to bridge differences. In international conferences, trainings, and workshops for example, English is the most frequently used language. Without the ability to write, read, and comprehend English, one might have difficulty getting access to music therapy knowledge and research, and to reach a wider and more diverse group of readers, a researcher must write in English. Ikuno (2005), a Japanese music therapist, wrote that English is the language that she first learned music therapy in, despite of the differences in English and Japanese language processing. She acknowledged that there is a difference in the way that the Japanese process meaning in words and express themselves through verbal means. I resonate with her statement because I learned the concept of music and medicine through the Western music therapy concept first, before knowing about the Indonesian traditional concept of music and medicine. De Backer & Sutton (2004) spoke about De Backer’s experience of writing in Dutch and having a translator translating his work. Translators can only translate a work as much as their understanding of the material. In addition, different people will have different style of writing, and so the sound and prosody of the text might change when it is translated. Meanwhile, a non-English-speaking writer can only write in English as much as the English vocabularies that they know. There might be differences in grammar between the writer’s main language and English language.

**MT Practices and Education in Indonesia**

The practice of music therapy in Indonesia is mainly focused in Jakarta and its greater area. At first, the definition of music therapy that was used to define music therapy practice in Indonesia was based on the definition stated by the American Music Therapy Association. For the past few years, we have been trying to shift our foundation to base the term music therapy on the definition given by the World Federation of Music Therapy. In the earlier years, most of the work had been focused on children with special needs. In 2017 a music therapy clinic was established in a local hospital in the Tangerang area. Currently the Indonesian music therapy community does not have any association or legal standard of practice to base the practice. Therefore, even though applying the general definition and techniques of music therapy that is globally acknowledged is feasible, there is no legal foundation to determine what can or cannot be considered as music therapy in Indonesia.

Music therapy was first introduced in Indonesia in 2007 through the first training program that was established in Universitas Pelita Harapan. Up until this paper was written, the conservatory of music at Universitas Pelita Harapan remains the only accredited performing art faculty that offers a music therapy specialization in Indonesia. Throughout its journey, all past and current music therapy program coordinators have been the alumni of music therapy training programs in Europe and Anglo countries. Therefore, the foundations of the music therapy training program in Indonesia have followed the standards of practice that were used in these countries, with a few added modifications. All resources or literature were written in English, and due to the students’ varying English proficiency, lecturers needed to translate a few materials and use a mix of English language and Bahasa Indonesia when delivering materials in classes.
Method

The purpose of this study is to reveal the impact of English-language resources on the students' music therapy understandings and practice, and to evaluate whether there is a concrete action that can be taken to improve the music therapy education system in Indonesia. It is essential to make sure that the respondents' voices were heard through this study, and the essence of their experience, as well as its implication for the Indonesian music therapy education system is portrayed as is. Therefore, the narrative inquiry was chosen as a methodology for this study. In the narrative inquiry, the respondents' personal, lived stories are the main source of data (Holloway, 2008). In narrative inquiry, the researcher is interested in how their respondents make meaning out of their experience (Hadley & Edwards, 2016). We also cannot neglect the fact that the researcher and the respondents share a professional relationship within a training program. The narrative inquiry embraces the element of relationship between researcher and the respondents. After collecting the data, thematic analysis was used to process and analyze the data. The benefit of thematic analysis is that it provided the necessary flexibility, as well as enabling the researcher to analyze patterns within the data (Braun & Clarke, 2006) to achieve the objective of this study. The respondents were ten Indonesian music therapy students ranging from the third (six respondents) to fourth year (four respondents) students at the time that this study was being conducted. These students were chosen because they had their placement experiences at the time that this study was being conducted. Placement experience was a main inclusion criterion. This is because the experience will provide the students a perspective and better ability to judge whether the dominance of English Language in their learning materials had impacted their ability to work with Indonesian clients.

The students were first given a form to indicate their consent and to fill in their background information. The background information includes the students’ cohort and experience in learning English prior to university education. All respondents provided their consent for interview, and the documentation and presentation of their narrative in this study. Afterward, they were given a second form that consisted of a set of essay questions on their experience of using English music therapy learning resources in classes and during practice. They were also asked about their experience learning Indonesian traditional resources, such as traditional songs and traditional musical elements; and utilizing them in session. Aside from that, they were also asked about their opinion and experience on advocacy, cultural difference, and power in classes and practice. Following these forms, the students were all interviewed individually. Each interview was semi-structured, intended to confirm the details of their written narratives, and to ask for more examples of experience in practice. The interview was then transcribed and coded based on the topic that was discussed. Three common categories were documented in all respondents’ responses.

This study was acknowledged by the Universitas Pelita Harapan’s chair of center for research and community development (no. 052/LPPM-UPH/IV/2022). The study was considered low risk according to the practices accepted by the regulations in Indonesia and was exempted from ethical reviews.

Results

The first form yielded important basic information about the respondents. This information may provide us with an understanding of their environment. Three respondents live in West Jakarta, DKI Jakarta province; three respondents live in Tangerang, Banten province; one lives in Semarang, Central Java; one lives in a special region of Yogyakarta area; one lives in Pekanbaru, Riau; and one lives in Lubuklinggau,
South Sumatera (Figure 1). Of all ten respondents, eight respondents used Bahasa Indonesia to communicate daily with their family, and two respondents used Hokkien language. Aside from their main language, four of the respondents were also used to speaking Indonesian traditional languages such as Javanese, Melayu, and Minang at home, and one respondent stated that they use Chinese and English language at home. Eight out of ten respondents identify as Chinese Indonesians. Chinese Indonesians have generally been accepted and acknowledged as part of Indonesian society. However, it is important to note that the perspective of Chinese Indonesians might have been deeply influenced by many issues particularly in its relations with the general Indonesians (Ninawati et al., 2019). Since the Dutch colonial period and once again during the 1998 riot, Chinese Indonesians have experienced a certain rejection. This might have shaped the perspective of the Chinese Indonesians' respondents, or at least the environment that they grew up in. Regarding the respondents' education, eight of the respondents went to national standard secondary schools, one respondent went to a national plus standard secondary school, and one respondent went to an international standard school. Eight of the respondents went for an external English language course sometime during their school years. Only three of the respondents stated feeling confident about their English writing skill, and only half of the respondents stated feeling confident about their English reading skill. Seven respondents claimed that the English lesson they received at school somewhat prepared them to use English resources in the university.

Figure 1. The Demographic of the Respondents.

As mentioned before, the results of this study will be categorized into three main categories. These categories are: 1) The students' positive approval of English resources, 2) the hinderance encountered in class and practices due to using English learning resources, and 3) areas of improvement for the music therapy education system in Indonesia. Because this study aimed to present the respondents' responses in its most authentic form, I will be quoting their responses directly and grouping them based on the main categories and sub-categories. Almost all respondents provided their responses in Bahasa Indonesia. Therefore, the quotes in this English version paper were all translated to English.
The Students' Positive Approval of English Resources

In this section of the results, responses from all respondents will be presented in their main language (Bahasa Indonesia), and the English translation will be provided alongside the responses. This is to give the reader a perspective on the translation process.

The majority of the respondents claimed that the resources in Bahasa Indonesia does not look credible and comprehensive to them, because music therapy is still at an early stage of its development in Indonesia. Therefore, the presence of English literature and resources were claimed to be helpful and more believable to these respondents. It provided them with the knowledge that they needed. Not only that they trust the English literature more, but some respondents also claimed to trust educators that had been exposed to music therapy trainings overseas.

| Bahasa Indonesia                                                                 | English Translation                                                                 |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| “Belum pernah disuguhi ataupun mencari hingga menemukan sendiri sumber pembelajaran terapi musik berbahasa Indonesia yang kredibel dan lengkap, karena bidang tersebut masih dalam proses perkembangan tahap awal di Indonesia.” | “I have never been offered or search on my own, the music therapy learning resources written in Bahasa Indonesia, that is credible and comprehensive, because the development of this field is still considered at its early stage in Indonesia.” | Respondent 1 |
| “Terapi musik masih menggunakan banyak literatur dari luar karena bidang tersebut masih sangat minim di Indonesia, sehingga penyusunan materi pembelajaran yang diadaptasi dari luar negeri diharapkan untuk mendukung dan memajukan terapi musik di Indonesia.” | “Music Therapy still uses a lot of external literature because (the development of) this field is still minimal in Indonesia, therefore the structure of its learning materials were adapted from overseas, and (we’re) hoping that it can support and advance music therapy in Indonesia.” | Respondent 6 |
| “Saya sering membaca jurnal/studi kasus berbahasa Inggris untuk mendukung pembelajaran, dikarenakan masih minimnya penelitian tentang terapi musik dalam Bahasa Indonesia.” | “I often read journals/case studies written in English to support my learning activities, because of the lack of research on music therapy that is written in Bahasa Indonesia.” | Respondent 8 |
| “Aku pribadi nih ya, aku nggak tahu aku judgemental atau gimana tapi aku bakal pilih yang udah ter-expose sama budaya luar.” | “Personally, I don’t know if I’m being judgmental or whatever, but I will prefer those that had been exposed by the external (foreign) culture.” | Respondent 9 |
| “Sampai saat ini, saat saya mencari jurnal atau sumber informasi, saya lebih memilih sumber berbahasa Inggris atau sumber dari peneliti luar negeri dan mengutamakan penelitian yang berasal dari negara yang sudah berkembang, sebab informasi yang didapat terasa lebih akurat.” | “Until this day, when I searched for information, I prefer literature written in English, or resources written by foreign researchers and I will prioritize research that came from a developed country, because these information felt more accurate.” | Respondent 10 |
In Respondent 1’s responses, we could see that they used the word “disuguhi” (offered) when asked whether they had ever used literature that is written in Bahasa Indonesia. When I reflect at this choice of word, I was reminded that the students’ understanding on what credible music therapy resources look like might have been constructed on their lecturers’ perspective and education. Keep in mind that all past and present music therapy program coordinators in this university were all educated in European & US American based training programs. In Respondent 10’s response, they mentioned prioritizing research that “came from a developed country.” Even though this kind of research seems more “accurate,” its relatability to the situation in Indonesia should be questioned. Looking at these responses, perhaps an opportunity for the lecturers to introduce more Indonesian literature is needed. The fact that the concept of music therapy presented in this Indonesian literature might not be the conservative, Western concept of music therapy, could be a unique opportunity for students and lecturers to brainstorm together as they figure out the identity of Indonesian music therapy.

Respondents also feel that the content of the literature will be understood better in English since the concept of ‘music therapy’ that they knew originated from English-speaking individuals and countries. They prefer English literature for its details and precision in terminologies.

| Bahasa Indonesia                                                                 | English Translation                                                                 |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| “Bahasa Inggris, terutama dalam pembelajaran terapi musik, adalah bahasa awal yang digunakan para pencetus konsep dan teori terapi musik. Sistem bahasa ini sendiri sudah dibentuk sejak dahulu menggunakan bahasa Inggris, maka lebih baik jika terdapat kemampuan untuk memahami bahasa yang sama yang dipakai pencetus/pembangun sistem mula-mula.” |
| – Respondent 1                                                                   | “English, especially in music therapy training, is the language that was used by the pioneers of music therapy concepts and theory. The whole system had been formed with English language since the beginning, therefore it is better to have the ability to comprehend the same language that was used by the pioneers/creators of the system.” |
| “Tidak semua kata/kalimat dalam bahasa Inggris dapat diterjemahkan ke bahasa Indonesia secara langsung dengan tepat, contohnya kosakata coping strategy. Apabila tidak menguasai bahasa Inggris, maka akan bayak kosakata yang tidak dapat dimengerti, sehingga pengetahuan akan materi tidak dapat tersampaikan.” |
| – Respondent 3                                                                   | “Not all words/sentences in English can be directly translated into Bahasa Indonesia accurately, for example the term coping strategy. If we don’t understand English, there will be a lot of vocabularies that we cannot understand, therefore the content of the materials cannot be conveyed.” |
| “Beberapa kata/frasa bahasa Inggris juga memiliki makna yang lebih dalam dibandingkan dengan bahasa Indonesia… Dibanding dengan menggunakan bahasa Indonesia dengan arti yang kurang pas, saya jadi mampu memahami dan mengaplikasikan teknik tersebut sesuai artinya yang pas dengan baik… Contoh lain terdapat pada mindfulness, dimana mindfulness lebih mengacu pada ‘a mental state achieved by focusing one’s awareness on the present moment, while calmly acknowledging and accepting one’s feelings,” |
| –                                                                                   | “A few words/phrases in English also have deeper meaning than Bahasa Indonesia. Compared to using Bahasa Indonesia which can be inaccurate, I was capable of understanding and applying the techniques according to what it means properly… Another example is mindfulness, in which mindfulness refer to ‘a mental state achieved by focusing one’s awareness on the present moment, while calmly acknowledging and accepting one’s feelings,” |
awareness on the present moment, while calmly acknowledging and accepting one's feelings, thoughts, and bodily sensations, used as a therapeutic technique.' Jika diartikan dalam bahasa Indonesia, klien akan menganggap bahwa yang ia perlukan hanya relaksasi dan music listening tanpa berfokus pada elemen yang ada di dalam musik. Sebagai akibat, klien akan salah mengartikan instruksi sesuai dengan intervensi yang dilaksanakan.”

– Respondent 4

| thoughts and bodily sensations, used as a therapeutic technique.' When defined in Bahasa Indonesia, clients will consider that what needs to be done is relaxation and music listening, without focusing on the elements in the music. As a result, clients will misunderstand the instruction based on the intervention that was applied.”
| – Respondent 4

According to these responses, the students felt that because the concept of music therapy that they adopted was based on the Western concept, it’s reasonable to keep the clinical terminologies in English when applying it in advocacy or sessions. There were worries that when they attempted to translate it to Bahasa Indonesia, the meaning might change and that it might affect the clinical goals. It is a fact that Bahasa Indonesia is a developing language. Its use as the Indonesian national language was first declared in 1928, and it was not until 1988 that the first Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia (Bahasa Indonesia Dictionary) was written (Repelita, 2018). The use of English to describe clinical terminologies is therefore convenient. However, practitioners need to keep in mind that traditional Indonesian culture also has their ancient concept of music and medicine. Therefore, it is unfair to say that the Westerners are the only pioneers of music therapy concepts. It just happens that these respondents - just like me - were introduced first to the Western music therapy concept, and not the Indonesian traditional concept of music and medicine. Indonesians also need to remember that there is a need to use Bahasa Indonesia to provide an opportunity for Bahasa Indonesia to develop.

One respondent felt that using English literature in classes was an advantage for her because she was used to speaking English at home and in previous education levels.

I felt that it is an advantage for me since I graduated from an international school, and I am used to using English more than Indonesian. It is easier for me to understand and memorize.”

– Respondent 7

This is one example of how more students in Indonesia prefer to speak English and/or other foreign languages than Bahasa Indonesia. This is because of early, intense exposure to foreign language since early age, both in their family and especially, their school (Nufus, 2018). English is considered an important subject to be given in early education in Indonesia. Meanwhile, according to Hoff (2004) learning several languages at the same time will actually limit the number of words that a child can learn from each language being learned. This is perhaps the reason why students who had an early exposure to English would prefer to speak English due to lack of opportunity to develop their Bahasa Indonesia skills. According to Sari (2019), this lack of opportunity to develop their mother language will cause cultural confusion. In busier towns, especially in international-based private school for example, children are more exposed to English and Mandarin nursery rhymes and are encouraged to speak fully in English and Mandarin at school. A few clients that the respondents had to work with, preferred English music or songs, and this is commonly found in the busier town of Indonesia. Not all Indonesian clients have the appreciation for Indonesian traditional music. Therefore, learning English musical resources is also essential.
### Bahasa Indonesia | English Translation
--- | ---
“Selama praktik di lapangan, saya menemukan beberapa klien yang lebih fasih berbahasa Inggris. Salah satu contoh adalah Ketika saya melakukan praktik di sekolah internasional, yang menggunakan bahasa Inggris dan mayoritas pelajaran yang didapat murid adalah dalam bahasa Inggris. Saya harus menulis laporan, proposal, dan penjelasan terapi musik dengan menggunakan bahasa Inggris.” | “Throughout practicum, I found that some clients are more fluent in English language. For example, when I was doing practicum in an international school, which use English in its teaching and learning process. I have to write reports, proposal, and explain music therapy in English.”
– Respondent 3

“Ada beberapa anak-anak yang pas ditanya malah nggak tau gitu kayak pernah denger atau nggak, nggak gitu. Lagu anak-anak Indonesia, mereka mungkin nggak tahu itu.” | “There are a few children, that when asked whether they have heard Indonesian nursery rhymes, they said no, they have not. Indonesian children songs. They are not familiar.”
– Respondent 6

Just as the English language exposure towards young learners is thought to give many benefits, some of the respondents also spoke about gaining benefit from the use of English materials in university. The use of English literature and learning resources in classes allowed the respondents to improve their English reading and academic writing skills. They need this skill to gain more knowledge and experience, as well as to network and publicize their future findings or studies. Respondents felt that reading English resources not only gave them knowledge on music therapy and other cultures, but it also gave them a guide on how to write scientific papers so that it can be understood by different people in different locations, as well as the ability to be involved in international seminars or workshops.

### Bahasa Indonesia | English Translation
--- | ---
“… menjadi salah satu jembatan untuk pelajar jika ada sebuah kegiatan/seminar yang hanya menggunakan Bahasa Inggris. Mereka menjadi terbiasa Ketika mendengarkan materi karena sudah dibekali selama perkuliahan.” | “… it has become a bridge for learners when there is a seminar that used English Language. They are used to listening to the materials because they were equipped through university classes.”
– Respondent 2

“The use of materials in other language (non-English), cannot be accessed by a lot of people because it is not a universal language.” | “The benefit that I got is developing my ability when comprehending lengthy text in English language, as well as equipping me to learn how to summarize paragraph and utilizing it in Bahasa Indonesia properly and concisely […] the use of English language in music therapy learning increase my ability to understand difficult explanation, as well as widening my knowledge in vocabulary, and the use of
If we refer to the respondents’ background information, we could see that most of the respondents have had informal English lessons sometime during their school years, before they entered university. However, based on these responses it is safe to say that academic reading and writing in university requires a more advanced skill. Even though these respondents were exposed to English lessons at school and informal lessons, there is no way of knowing the effectiveness of these lessons. Nufus (2018) mentioned that English lessons in the Indonesian education system is not regulated by the government’s curriculum. Schools have the freedom to determine how they want to teach English to the students.

The next benefit was the most spoken about in the questionnaire and interviews. The respondents stated that reading English literature opens them to the opportunity to look at other country’s cultures, customs, and norms.

| Bahasa Indonesia | English Translation |
|------------------|---------------------|
| “... misalnya sistem Kesehatan atau tempat treatment di literatur, misalnya di jurnal gitu lagi bahas soal nursing home... oh nursing home diluar itu misalnya seperti ini gitu... pandangan baik itu... perawatan di nursing home yang diutarakan si penulis jurnal, udah jauh lebih baik sistemnya dan teratur penanganan... sementara kalau yang di Indonesia pas baca ‘loh kok kayaknya nggak...” | “For example, the healthcare system or treatment centers in the literature, in a journal was talking about a nursing home [...] oh, so that’s how nursing home in different countries are [...] it has positive association [...] the care that was given in the nursing home was much better and well-structured, meanwhile in Indonesia, it made me think to myself ‘oh why is it not like that?’ [...] far too different, so...” |
“Jadi orang-orang yang budaya barat jadi lebih ekspresif dan ekspresif dalam arti somehow mereka lebih terbuka untuk menjelaskan kayak ‘ini yang aku rasakan’ Ketika sesi terapi musik ada perasaan seperti ini, ada dorongan seperti ini, nggak selalu soal ‘oh iya tadianya sakit sekarang sembuh gitu’… sementara Ketika aku mikir kayak kalau misalnya di klien yang pernah aku temui di Indonesia, keliatannya mereka lebih pengen tahu gimana overall hasilnya, jadi ada peningkatan dalam hal apa nih akunya.”
– Respondent 1

“… satu jurnal ini partisipannya itu para tentara- tentara gitu, tentara Amerika gitu, jujur kurang relate karena disana dia state kalau tentara- tentara ini mengalami banyak trauma selama proses dia bekerja gitu, terus habis itu di-state juga kalau di Amerika itu tentara itu kaya gimana ya, pekerjaan yang terhormat gitu ya, yang dihargai, nah setauku sampai sejauh ini di Indonesia, tentara nggak terhormat gitu, maka orang orang yang melalui banyak hal traumatis gitu. Itu sih yang beda.”
– Respondent 3

“kalau join webinar luar negeri itu populasinya sangat-sangat beragam… bahkan mereka yang sebenarnya umurnya tu udah masuk ke dalam lansia aja juga banyak yang join dan banyak yang mau belajar… kalau di Indonesia mungkin ada beberapa cuma jarang yang aku lihat.”
– Respondent 6

“Saya mendapat sudut pandang yang berbeda saat membaca materi, terutama sudut pandang dari budaya penulis disertai konsiderasi yang mungkin muncul akibat budaya tersebut. Saya when they said music therapy in nursing home, I thought ‘I don’t think this is applicable in Pekanbaru’ […]”

“‘So western people seem more expressive, and expressive in a way that somehow they are more open to talk about ‘this is how I feel’. During music therapy sessions, there is this feeling, there is this urge, and it’s not always ‘I was sick and now I’m healed’ […] meanwhile when I thought of the clients I saw in Indonesia, they are more interested to know how is the result in general, is there any progress […]’
– Respondent 1

“[…] this one journal, the participants were soldiers. American soldiers. Honestly it is not relatable because it was stated that the soldiers there experienced trauma during their duty, and then it was also stated that soldiers are respectable and it’s honored. From what I know, in Indonesia, soldiers are not considered that way, they are not too respected that way. So when I read it, I thought, in Indonesia, people might not be too concerned about what our soldiers went through, while in this journal, it was stated that awareness in the soldier’s mental state is needed, because what they are going through might be traumatic. That’s the differences.”
– Respondent 3

“When I joined a webinar from different countries, the participants are very diverse […] there are some of them who can be considered seniors and they were in the webinar and a lot of them are willing to learn […] In Indonesia perhaps there are some, but I don’t see this a lot.”
– Respondent 6

“I perceived a different point of view when reading materials, especially from the writer’s cultural background, added with some consideration that might surface due to their
| Respondent 8 | Respondent 9 |
|--------------|---------------|
| jadi lebih terbuka terhadap perbedaan, serta membantu dalam segi professional” | “mungkin kalau di jurnal-jurnal, mungkin di barat gitu lebih open gitu, terus mungkin ada dari apa yang dibahas itu lebih kayak terbuka dan lebih rinci gitu, mungkin kalau di budaya sin ikan masih agak sedikit, ada beberapa hal yang sulit dibicarakan, tapi kalau di budaya mereka tuh kayak lebih open gitu pembahasannya…” |
| “mungkin kalau di jurnal-jurnal, mungkin di barat gitu lebih open, dan mungkin perbedaan yang aku temuin di sekitar gitu, masih banyak orang yang belum tau cara menangani (anak-anak berkebutuhan khusus) yang bener… seperti memarahi… menurut aku juga terpengaruh oleh kayak budaya disini juga… kayak misalnya orang tua sama anak masih ada jaraknya itu besar, sedangkan di budaya-budaya barat lebih setara gitu… jadi disini masih emang cenderung kelihatan senjangnya gitu.” | “In the western journals, they are more open, and from what was being discussed, it’s more open and detailed, that maybe in Indonesian culture, this can be tricky to talk about, but in their culture, the discussions are more open” |
| “[…] They know more and they are more educated and the way they handled things is more professional, and perhaps the differences that I found around me is that there are still a lot of people who don’t really know how to handle children with special needs properly […] like scolding them […] It’s also influenced by the local culture as well… Like for example there is still a big gap between parents and children, meanwhile in western culture it seems like it’s more equal […] here, we can see the gap.” | “Learning a language, means also learning its culture […] therefore consciously or not, there will be an impact.” |
| “As someone who lives in Asia, in Indonesia particularly, for years, I’m not that open-minded […] this is also what I saw with children/students in Indonesia. They tend to be more passive in class, didn’t have the courage to ask questions, or convey their thoughts, because they are afraid of their teacher’s responses […] When in fact there are a lot of ideas in their mind […] but overseas, they are encouraged to speak, and not being judged.” | “Kalau baca literatur dari sana (luar negeri) kayanya stigma itu nggak sekenceng di sini… lebih ke pribadi sih… kayak di keluarga gitu, kalau misalnya mereka lagi ngomongin ‘Eh, anak si ini tuh ternyata autis gitu… aduh emang iya aneh ya’… biasa orang indo kan kalau ngomong kayak gitu; tapi terus aku (karena sudah baca dari literatur luar negeri) culture itself. I was more open towards diversity and it helps me professionally” |
| “Kalau baca literatur dari sana (luar negeri) kayanya stigma itu nggak sekenceng di sini… lebih ke pribadi sih… kayak di keluarga gitu, kalau misalnya mereka lagi ngomongin ‘Eh, anak si ini tuh ternyata autis gitu… aduh emang iya aneh ya’… biasa orang indo kan kalau ngomong kayak gitu; tapi terus aku (karena sudah baca dari literatur luar negeri) | “When reading the literature from other countries, it seems like stigma is not as intense as in Indonesia […] personally, like in my family, for example they were talking about ‘oh this kid is actually autistic […] He’s weird right?’ […] the usual Indonesian, when speaking about this thing; but then because I’ve read the literature from other countries, it’s |

Putri. Voices 2022, 22(3). https://doi.org/10.15845/voices.v22i3.3375
kayak beda… kalau nomor satu sih itu, stigma. Nomor dua kalau baca-baca penelitian dari luar negeri tuh kayak, mereka hebat-hebat gitu sih ci, kayak mereka tuh kreatif banget dari sisi mana lagi sih yang bisa digali… itu motivasional banget sih.”
– Respondent 10

different. That’s first, stigma. Second, when reading literature from other countries, it’s like, they are amazing, like they are really creative, trying to look at different sides, and it’s really motivational.”
– Respondent 10

As Respondent 8 and 9 used the term “open” and “open-minded,” it is interesting how the students associated acceptance of non-Indonesian culture as open mindedness, because as Respondent 10 said, stigmas in Indonesia are more prominent. There seems to be a mismatch between what the students think is ideal and how their local culture is. Open mindedness is the ability to be receptive towards ideas and opinions that are different from our own. Having the privilege to study overseas, I can say that open-mindedness is not dependent on certain language or culture. However, I remember having this mindset before studying overseas. The question is, are these respondents only associating the term “open-minded” to non-Indonesian cultures, or are they also willing to associate the term with other Indonesian cultures that they might not have been exposed to?
For several respondents, knowing the different values and the open-mindedness that goes along with it gave them the boost of confidence to address some stigmas and stereotypes that they encountered in their environment. The knowledge that was gained through reading the literature and other resources written in English gave a few of the respondents the confidence to advocate about music therapy to certain stakeholders and professionals as well.

| Bahasa Indonesia                                                                 | English Translation                                                                 |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| “Saya belajar banyak dari sumber jurnal luar negeri… Saya jadi mampu menjelaskan kepada public mengenai pengertian dan pendapat akan self-harm itu sendiri. Karena saya sudah mempelajari berbagai jurnal dan sumber dari luar, saya dapat berbagi dan mematahkan stigma yang selama ini menghambat mereka untuk mengambil Langkah.” | “I learned a lot from foreign resources […]. It enables me to explain to the public about the definition and thoughts on self-harm. I have learned about it from multiple journals and foreign resources, and so I can share and break the stigma that has hindered them to take a step (to get help).” |
| – Respondent 3                                                                  | – Respondent 3                                                                        |

| Bahasa Indonesia                                                                 | English Translation                                                                 |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| “Kalau sama professional, misalnya neurologist, aku bisa sangkutin misalnya peran musik di bagian-bagian otak. Aku bisa tambahin udah ada research tentang apa jadi lebih ngeyakinin.” | “With other professionals, neurologist for example, I can talk about music and parts of the brain. I can add to it that there are convincing research/evidence.” |
| – Respondent 6                                                                  | – Respondent 6                                                                        |

| Bahasa Indonesia                                                                 | English Translation                                                                 |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| (mengenai orang tua yang masih memperlakukan anak berkebutuhan khusus dengan tidak tepat) “yang pasti sedih sih, kayak mungkin aku udah tau mana yang bener, terus yang seharusnya seperti apa menangani mereka… ada keinginan juga untuk memberikan edukasi itu.” | (about parent that still treat children with special needs inappropriately) “It saddened me, like I know which one is right, and how to work with them […] There is an urge to educate” |
| “mungkin karena ada dari aku dan pihak | “Maybe because the school and I work together harmoniously, we think the same way and they understand […] there I can help explain what |
Most Indonesians are highly religious, and a lot are superstitious. This shapes their perception of illness, disorders, and disabilities. Respondent 2 mentioned that people in their region consider the term “therapy” or “psychological intervention” as taboo. Respondent 10 mentioned that in a more rural area of their parents' town, going to the modern doctor for an illness is unacceptable. This may cause mistreatment and alienation of individuals with disabilities and illnesses. However, these facts do not imply that the Indonesian traditional concept of health does not acknowledge the importance of a holistic sense of health. They might just have different terminologies or language to communicate this. All in all, access to knowledge from other cultures provide the respondents the confidence to speak up and fight for the right and acceptance of individuals with disabilities or illnesses.

English had become a global language and so it was more of a bridge to knowledge of most parts of the world, and not just the Anglo countries. The use of a global language unifies people of different background. It provided a platform for people of different cultures to be heard and seen.

| Bahasa Indonesia | English Translation |
|------------------|---------------------|
| “Tidak semua penggunaan bahasa Inggris menunjukkan budaya penulis. Penggunaan bahasa Inggris dalam pembelajaran terapi musik bertujuan agar semua orang yang ingin belajar terapi musik dapat lebih memahami dengan bahasa Inggris yang memang sudah dianggap universal bagi kebanyakan orang di dunia. Hal ini dikarenakan banyak terapis musik muncul di tempat dimana bahasa Inggris bukan bahasa ibunya.” | “Not all use of English language in literature speak of the culture of the writer (being Western). The use of English in music therapy learning materials is meant so that it can help people who want to learn music therapy because English language is considered universal for most people in this world. This is because there are music therapists in places in which English is not their main language.” |
| – Respondent 5 | – Respondent 5 |

Lastly, in some areas of Indonesia, English language is not that strange. People in these areas usually mixed English terms with Bahasa Indonesia in their daily interaction. Therefore, sometimes it might sound awkward or odd to some of these respondents to use...
full Bahasa Indonesia. They also sometimes felt awkward to translate a few of known music therapy techniques to Bahasa Indonesia.

| Bahasa Indonesia                                                                 | English Translation                                                                 |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| “Maksudnya begini, misalkan ada yang kayak kita biasanya bahas, kayak penjelasan dalam Bahasa Indonesia itu kadang tuh jadi aneh. Ketika tiba-tiba bahasa pengantarnya pake bahasa Indonesia itu aneh.” | “I meant, for example, when we are talking about things in Bahasa Indonesia, sometimes it’s weird, when all of a sudden we use Bahasa Indonesia as language for instruction.” |
| “Aneh, Kayak song lyric discussion itu kan kayak keren gitu. Kalau di Indonesia, ‘diskusi lirik lagu’, apa itu… kayak gitu loh. Menulis lagu kurang gimana gitu. Kurang berasa terapi itu.” | “It’s weird, like song lyric discussion, it sounds cool. But in Bahasa Indonesia, ‘diskusi lirik lagu’, people might think, what is that?... ‘Menulis lagu’ (songwriting in Bahasa Indonesia) does not feel right. It doesn’t feel like it’s a therapy.” |
| “Bahasa Indonesia juga banyak banget kayak mereka puisi-puisi atau kata-kata yang sering dipakai orang-orang gitu kan, tapi tetep aja rasanya aneh itu. Rasanya kayak geli gitu kalau dengernya, makanya kita suka memperlakukan bahasa Inggris ini kayak pelarian itu lho biar nggak cringe.” | “Bahasa Indonesia has a lot of like poetic language, but it feels so weird. It’s feels cringy to hear, that’s why I feel like we sometimes use English as a hideout, so that it doesn’t feel so cringy.” |

Most of the respondents came from more modernized, globalized towns of Indonesia. In which, often times people that live in these towns mixed English terms or phrases in their daily Indonesian conversations. It is difficult to pinpoint the cause of this occurrence. As Respondent 5 put it, it is weird to suddenly use Bahasa Indonesia; mixing English terminologies in Bahasa Indonesia conversations has become a lingering element of these towns' culture. If we look at Respondent 9's response, they mentioned that the use of full proper Bahasa Indonesia sounded cringy to them, and based on respondent 5's response, translating some English therapeutic terminologies to Bahasa Indonesia might even diminish its meaning among some people. These responses implied the superiority that English and English speakers might have in different settings in Indonesia. It is interesting that the English terminology: ‘song lyric discussion,’ translated word by word to the exact same terminology in Bahasa Indonesia: ‘diskusi lirik lagu’ would give a different sense towards Respondent 5 and perhaps some other people. Somehow things that are said in English sounded more advanced.

**The Hinderance Encountered in Class and Practices Due to Using English Resources**

Despite the benefits, using English language materials and resources in the training program had caused some hinderance for a few of the respondents. Some respondents also conveyed the downside of familiarizing English terminologies and concepts in their practice and advocacy. The first hinderance was that using English resources had caused some difficulties, fear, shame, and negative self-thoughts in a few respondents. The unfamiliarity affects their self-esteem. Several respondents preferred to stay silent during classes or avoided reading literature that was written in English.
It is clear how English skills had imposed a power dynamic within the classrooms. In a classroom full of students with highly diverse English skill, lecturers need to be responsive and aware of the gaps, and bridge that gap with the willingness to listen to all students equally and create an open space for students of different backgrounds to have the courage and comfort to share their thoughts.

A few respondents reported that they encountered difficulties when reading English literature. They had to spend more time reading literature that were written in English because sometimes they needed to look for the meaning of certain vocabularies or tried to comprehend several challenging sentences or concepts. Some sentences also felt ambiguous to them.

| Bahasa Indonesia | English Translation |
|------------------|---------------------|
| “When I realized that almost all music therapy learning materials are written in English, I started feeling afraid, shame, and always think negatively because I’m lacking in English. Every time I was in class, I preferred to stay silent because I’m afraid I would make a mistake […] The impact that I felt personally was insecurity towards other classmates because I have limitation in English knowledge. Professionally, I don’t have the confidence because I was afraid that I would misinterpret something that has something to do with music therapy, when asked to explain to other professionals or community.” – Respondent 2 | “Awalnya saya menghindari jurnal berbahasa Inggris karena takut tidak dapat memahami isinya.” – Respondent 3 | “Initially I avoided English journals because I was afraid that I could not understand its content.” – Respondent 3 | “The hinderance was that there were a lot of foreign language that I have never used or never found before, there are sentences that are difficult to understand. I was feeling the struggle, and fear.” – Respondent 9 | “Kendala terdapat pada banyaknya kata-kata asing yang jarang digunakan atau belum pernah responden temukan, serta kalimat yang sangat sulit dicerita, kesulitan dan ketakutan saya rasakan.” – Respondent 9 | “Sumber-sumber berbahasa Inggris, khususnya jurnal, menimbulkan kesulitan dalam memahami materi pembelajaran.” – Respondent 1 | “English resources, especially journals, caused difficulties in understanding the learning content.” – Respondent 1 |
“There are some words that sounded ambiguous when translated from English to Bahasa Indonesia.”
– Respondent 2

“When the lecturer asked us to write a literature review from a new material, the struggle is to note some scientific terms and it will take a while to understand its meaning.”
– Respondent 4

“The challenge that was encountered was a longer time needed to read the journal because I have to read slower to understand, and it will take a while to look at the meaning of a word in a dictionary if there are words that are difficult to understand.”
– Respondent 8

“Sometimes there are terminologies that can’t be understood, and so I need to take a while to see its translation.”
– Respondent 10

When adapting the concept of music therapy from western perspective, this occurrence is inevitable. Respondents need longer time and more effort to grasp the content of a literature. The amount of time and energy that they need to understand a literature’s content might depend on, the style and clarity of writing, the topic of literature, the respondent’s varying English skills, and other factors.

In the previous section, some of the respondents had mentioned that a few terminologies might sound awkward, and it might even lose its meaning when translated to Bahasa Indonesia. Therefore, some of these respondents preferred not to translate. However, this might result in another issue. As not all Indonesians spoke English, there might be populations that will have difficulties understanding the untranslated words, sentence, or concept. This might further result in the inability to advocate for music therapy to certain populations in several areas in Indonesia.

| Bahasa Indonesia                                                                 | English Translation                                                                 |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| “Sumber berbahasa Inggris membiasakan penjelasan istilah-istilah tersebut dalam bahasa Inggris sehingga terkadang membuat saya sulit untuk menjelaskan bidang ini kepada orang awam di Indonesia.” | “English resources used English terminologies to explain things, and sometimes this caused me difficulties when trying to explain about this profession to the public in Indonesia.” |
| “kalau misalnya naik kendaraan umum, ditanya kuliatur jurusan apa, terus jadinya apa itu terapi musik… bener-bener bingung karena Taunya pengertian terapi musik yang ada di text book aja itu dan karena di text book juga bahasa Inggris terus banyak istilah-istilah yang mungkin pada saat itu aku sendiri juga masih” | “When I was in public transport, someone would ask me what’s my major, and so I had to explain what music therapy is […] I was really conflicted, because I only know the definition of music therapy based on what’s written in the textbook, and the text book used English, and maybe there are terminologies that at that time, I haven’t really understand. One time when I
cuman ya tau aja sekedar istilah tapi nggak benar- benar ngerti… Waktu itu pernah live di Instagram dan ada yang nonton tapi kayak kata- kata therapeutic gitu mereka benar-bener nggak bisa ngerti gitu maksud therapeutic itu gimana? Dan kalau misalnya aku diminta menjelaskan spesifik kata terapeutik itu gimana, sejurnyanya waktu itu agak bingung juga gimana terapeutik.”
– Respondent 1

“The knowledge that was obtained when learning things in English, could not be applied to the public well enough. There are some Indonesians that still have not understood music therapy properly, especially in the region where I live. The knowledge of music therapy is minimal. The majority of people in my region used traditional language and there is not a lot who speak Bahasa Indonesia. The material that I obtained at school, need to be further simplified.”
– Respondent 2

Respondent 2’s use of the word ‘simplify’ is interesting. This shows that some people, including Respondent 2, might associate English with advanced knowledge, and Bahasa Indonesia and Indonesian traditional languages are simpler. As mentioned in the earlier section, Bahasa Indonesia had only been used since 1928 as the national language. Therefore, compared to how long English language has been around, it is reasonable to say that English language seems more advanced. However, Respondent 2 also mentioned ‘Indonesian traditional languages,’ and traditional languages have existed longer than Bahasa Indonesia. Keeping in mind that language may signify our culture, could it be that it is not just a matter of advance vs. simple, and more about cultural and beliefs differences? Some terminologies are not relatable to a certain community because they may have different way of living.

When given a scenario of explaining music therapy to Indonesians in a more rural areas in Indonesia, the respondents either tend to say that they would directly go to a demonstration or became confused on how to explain and not going as detailed as when they would explain music therapy to medical professionals.

| Bahasa Indonesia | English Translation |
|------------------|---------------------|
| “Aku bakal jelasin kita melakukan kegiatan-kegiatan yang berhubungan dengan musik, misalnya kayak apa yang familiar buat dia pasti bermannyi, menari dengan musik, bergerak dengan musik, mendengar musik, untuk tujuan Kesehatan. Kayaknya aku bakal sekedar sebut untuk tujuan Kesehatan karena kalau lebih dalam mungkin mereka jadi buyar | “I will explain that we will be doing musical activities, such as things that are familiar, like singing, dancing, and listening to music, moving to music for health purpose. I will say simply that it’s for health purpose because if I go too deep, I will lose them […] I’m hoping that I don’t have to learn the language […] not that It’s not needed, but I prefer that they know other |
Looking at the responses, it is quite clear that the respondents feel more equipped to advocate for music therapy in a medical setting, and populations with more understanding of modern healthcare. This is understandable because currently, this is where the job prospect is at. However, we need to also start thinking about how we can also serve people in different settings and areas of Indonesia. Otherwise, this will look like the colonial era in Indonesia all over again where education and healthcare service were a privilege, and European healthcare providers were hesitant to serve certain native communities with the excuse of the ‘local community’s rejection’ (Bergen et al., 2019). Meanwhile, what happened was these European healthcare providers in the colonial era did not attempt to listen to the locals’ preferences and instead forced their own perspective of healthcare into these native communities. Let’s not let this repeat in the present days. This should start with the willingness to learn and understand the local cultures, as well as their language and communication style.

A few respondents have also reported that the word “therapy” does not exist in the traditional language that they knew.

| Bahasa Indonesia                                                                 | English Translation                                                                 |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| “Kalau bahasa daerahnya bahase linggau atau bahase cul… Nggak ada… biasanya kebanyakkan masyarakat disini bilangnya ngobat.” | “The traditional language here is called Bahase Linggau or Bahase Cul […] No there is none […] usually people used the term ‘ngobat’ (medicating/treatment).” |
| – Respondent 2                                                                   | – Respondent 2                                                                        |

Putri. Voices 2022, 22(3). [https://doi.org/10.15845/voices.v22i3.3375](https://doi.org/10.15845/voices.v22i3.3375)
These responses show either there really is no word in Indonesian traditional language that directly and exactly translate to the word ‘therapy,’ or these respondents were not too deeply involved in the local traditional culture that they are in. There could be other terminologies that although are not identical, could be more accepted by the native communities.

In the previous section a few respondents spoke of getting different perspective from other cultures that they found in literature written in English. Despite the benefits of these new perspectives, the respondents also conveyed some downsides to these cultural and value differences. Some of these values are not relatable to some of Indonesian values, making the examples they found inapplicable to some practices here.

| Bahasa Indonesia | English Translation |
|------------------|---------------------|
| “Bahasa Minang, di keluarga campur tapi mostly iya tetep pakai. (di Bahasa Minang) ngga ada. Terapi ya terapi. (direct translation) nya tidak ada.” | “Bahasa Minang, in my family we used both Bahasa Minang and English, but mostly yes we used Bahasa Minang. No there is none… therapy is terapi (an Indonesian term for therapy that was adapted from English). There is no direct translation.” |
| Respondent 3 | Respondent 3 |
| “Terapi itu apa ya… kayaknya juga terapi deh. Tapi turunan dari bahasa Inggris. Aku nggak ngerti.” | “What is therapy in Javanese […] I guess it’s also terapi. But it’s adapted from English. I don’t know.” |
| Respondent 5 | Respondent 5 |
| “Untuk kata terapi jujur masyarakat di daerah saya masih tabu kak dengar kata terapi… Hampir semua masyarakat daerah sini anggap bahwa terapi itu suatu hal yang aneh. Khususnya terapi untuk Kesehatan fisik mereka menganggap ngobat… Jadi kalau misalnya kita bilang mau terapi gitu ke psikolog atau psikiater, pasti langsung dianggap bahwa ada sesuatu yang aneh, dikaitkan dengan hal-hal mistis itu.” | “For the term therapy, honestly the people in my region still think that the word is taboo […] Almost all of the people here still think that therapy is an odd concept, especially therapy for mental health. They always link mental health to something mystical. If it’s therapy for physical health, they would say it as ‘ngobat’ (medicating). But if we say we are going to therapy, to a psychologist or psychiatrist, they will immediately think that something is weird, and will immediately relate it to something mystical.” |
| Respondent 2 | Respondent 2 |
| “mereka masih skeptis, masih kayak agak ragu gitu karena menurutku pressure di kota besar itu jauh lebih gede daripada di daerah, maksudnya yang kita rasain disini sama di daerah itu beda. Tantangannya beda, orang-orangnya juga beda, jadi pembicaraan mereka berbeda sama kita karena apa yang mereka lalui, beda. Kalau orang-orang di daerah itu mereka simply they don’t see the need to talk about mental health karena nggak relatable.” | “They are still skeptical. They are uncertain because I think the pressure in bigger cities are far greater than smaller regions like mine. I mean what we felt here in big cities and in smaller region is different, there are different struggles and challenge, the people are different, so what they talked about would be different, because what they went through is different than us in bigger city. People in smaller region, they simply don’t see the need to talk about mental health because it’s not relatable.” |
| Respondent 3 | Respondent 3 |
“… Kalau aku lihatnya yang lebih senior, mereka tuh agak susah dibilangin itu lho. Karena mereka udah hidup sekian puluh tahun dengan persepsi itu, ya susah untuk kita ganti. Superstition disini juga banyak, jadi ya superstitionnya itu yang menurut aku bikin jadi ada stigma juga itu lho.”
– Respondent 10

“[…] from what I saw, the seniors, they are the more challenging one to discuss with. Because they have lived for so long with their perception, so it’s difficult to change. The superstitions here is also often found, So superstitions can also be the cause of stigma.”
– Respondent 10

These responses showed that a mismatch between the respondents’ knowledge and the local culture could result in power imbalance. This could mean that the respondents can be seen as someone who is superior due to all the knowledge that they have, or because the knowledge that they have is not applicable in the local culture, they could be seen as someone with no significance. Either way, it is not exactly the ideal relationship dynamic that we want to have when advocating or practicing.

**Areas of Improvement for the MT Education System in Indonesia**

Aside from the discussion about their experiences, I also asked the respondents about what they think would be a feasible solution to increase the effectivity, efficiency, and inclusivity of the music therapy training program in Indonesia. Most of the respondents spoke of more use of Bahasa Indonesia in classes. They also talk about the need of more research that is written in Bahasa Indonesia. There is also a need for more in-class discussion on the practical application of the knowledge attained to adequately advocate for Indonesians.

| Bahasa Indonesia | English Translation |
|------------------|---------------------|
| “Semntara jurnal dan buku masih seluruhnya bersumber dari literatur berbahasa Inggris, dosen dapat memberikan penjelasan terkait terapi musik dalam bahasa Indonesia. Dosen dapat mendorong mahasiswa untuk berdiskusi di kelas terkait materi terapi musik dalam bahasa Indonesia. Memperbanyak diskusi atau materi terkait signifikansi bahasa dalam praktik terapi musik.” | “While journals and books are still written in English, lecturers can explain music therapy in Bahasa Indonesia. Lecturers can encourage students to discuss in class regarding music therapy materials in Bahasa Indonesia. More discussion or material regarding the significance of language in music therapy practice.” |
| – Respondent 1 | – Respondent 1 |
| “Referensi materi atau buku disediakan yang berbahasa Indonesia, yang ditulis oleh seseorang yang kredibel.” | “Provide references, materials, or books in Bahasa Indonesia, and is written by someone who is credible.” |
| – Respondent 3 | – Respondent 3 |
| “Belajar dari hal-hal yang dekat dengan diri atau hal-hal yang terjadi di sekitar dapat lebih memudahkan seseorang untuk memahami dan mengerti akan yang ingin disampaikan.” | “Learn from things that are close to us, or things around us can help us understand and learn what needs to be conveyed.” |
| – Respondent 5 | – Respondent 5 |
“Pembelajaran terapi musik tetap dapat dilakukan dalam bahasa Indonesia. Dosen juga dapat memberikan saran untuk mahasiswa mempelajari bahasa Inggris secara mandiri.”
– Respondent 6

| “Music therapy courses can be delivered in Bahasa Indonesia. Lecturers can provide suggestions for students to also improve their English skills.” |
| – Respondent 6 |
| “Perlu diperbanyak penelitian dan advokasi terapi musik dalam bahasa Indonesia. Budaya Indonesia juga bisa dilibatkan baik dalam sesi atau advokasi terapi musik.” |
| – Respondent 8 |
| “There is a need to increase the amount of research and advocacy of music therapy in Bahasa Indonesia. Indonesian culture can also be involved in practice or music therapy advocacy.” |
| – Respondent 8 |

**Discussion**

A part of the job as a music therapy lecturer in this Indonesian university is to network with a diverse group of professionals, as well as answering questions from the general publics. Sometimes I would get questions from random Indonesians on social media, inquiring about how they can train to be a music therapist and what is music therapy. Often times these people already have their own perspective of what music and medicine is. Again, out of obliviousness, I have this templated, unempathetic answer, the kind of answer that will immediately dim away that fiery enthusiasm to get acknowledged as a music therapist, or immediately dismiss the idea that Indonesian culture might have a different terminology and concept for music and medicine by quickly making the differentiation of ‘what is music therapy and what is not.’ This study enhances the uneasiness and tension within me, and that I feel like I have been an ‘automated answering machine’ all this time. Meanwhile, when I looked at my Indonesian colleagues and students, and how music therapy has started to flourish in several institutions, I cannot help but think of the opposite. I cannot sacrifice the integrity and credibility of this profession in Indonesia because clients’ safety needs to be protected and the power that the Western perspective has imposed can be clearly seen in most elements of healthcare and education system in Indonesia, not just in music therapy. To alter the foundation of music therapy drastically and swiftly in Indonesia is also risky for the development of the current Indonesian music therapists.

This research was aimed to let the voices of Indonesian music therapy students be heard by the international music therapy community. I wanted to understand the students’ experience and opinions in terms of the use of literature and learning resources that were written in English and the impact of these resources on their practice and advocacy. I was humbled by all respondents’ stories throughout this experience. Having only been teaching and getting to know the students for approximately a year prior to the start of this study, I was hoping that this study can be a start towards a better, and more inclusive music therapy education in Indonesia. I would like to restate that I acknowledge the possibility of the past and current lecturers’ influence, and my own influence towards the respondents’ answers. Some opinions that were conveyed by the respondents might be the result of other lecturers’ or my own teachings and opinions in class. This being said, I made sure to let the respondents know that their honest, and personal opinion and experience were highly appreciated.

As stated by Crystal (1997) on the major roles of the English language as global lingua franca, the use of English music therapy learning resources in the music therapy training program in Indonesia have also clearly affected the students in many ways. The global knowledge that the Indonesian students needed were satisfied through the presence of English as the global language that bridges diversities in this world. On some occasions, it
gave them the confidence and motivation to advocate for not only music therapy, but values of tolerance and inclusivity; and it also gave them the courage to break some stereotypes and stigmas that still occur in Indonesia. It also gave them the knowledge they need to advance the healthcare in Indonesia through music therapy. The knowledge and skills also allow them to connect with other students or music therapists from other countries, so that they can learn from each other.

Despite these benefits, the use of English learning resources in music therapy program still caused several issues. The use of a foreign language in an education setting may cause worries and even fear. The respondents who conveyed worries, fear, and insecurity towards the use of English learning materials in class, came from a more rural area of Indonesia, in which traditional language is still used more than Bahasa Indonesia. Even to those that live in a busier, and more advanced towns of Indonesia, still need extra time and efforts to comprehend the literature being used. A study that was done last year towards a group of high-school students in Eastern Java, Indonesia also presented similar themes of issues faced by these students when speaking in English (Farhani et al., 2020). Among these themes were: 1) grammar as a hinderance, 2) fear of others’ negative reaction, 3) low confidence when speaking publicly, and 4) anxiety.

Some of the respondents also commented that not all Indonesians could or would understand the terminologies that we learned in class. Some of them encountered people who are willing to listen but due to differences in language, these people cannot understand the terminologies that the respondents learned in class. Some of the respondents encountered people who could possibly understand the terminologies but could not relate to the knowledge or values that were implied when the respondents were trying to explain about music therapy and the value they learned. Based on the respondents answers it is safe to say that a more advanced knowledge that they attained through their music therapy training program does not mean that they will always have the confidence and the upper hand in a discussion or advocacy in their practical work. Literature that specifically talked about music therapy practice and advocacy in South-East Asia (e.g., Singh, 2021; Tan & Hsiao, 2017) need to be incorporated more in the training program.

A few respondents mentioned that the understanding and knowledge for general healthcare looks different in some areas that they lived in. Some people from these rural areas still identify ‘healing’ as something purely spiritual or religious-based. They cannot relate to the concept of therapy that we understood as modern music therapists or academics. This is not only due to the differences in beliefs and values, but also the intensity of daily stressors that they must deal with is different compared to many of us who live in busier towns. This means that there is a need for music therapists in Indonesia to learn about these communities’ cultures and values. We need to understand the role of music in their daily living and not try so hard to impose the knowledge that we attain from other cultures that we learned through English learning resources. For example, since the majority of Indonesian citizens are Muslims, it is essential that the students also look into how music is viewed in Islam, and how to work more effectively with their culture and belief (e.g., Elwafi, 2007, 2017). Another example would be to explore the role of music in the culture of different ethnic groups of Indonesia, such as how the Balinese used the Gamelan in the social life and religious rituals (e.g., Tenzer, 1991). There is also a need for us to look at how healthcare works in different Indonesian traditional cultures. For example, even though there might not be a direct and exact translation of the word therapy in the Javanese language, there are some substitutes that even though the concept could be slightly different, it will be more acceptable in this local traditional culture. These Javanese terminologies are *nenepi* – meaning to seclude ourselves and meditate for spiritual enrichment (Cahyokusumo, 2019), or *macapat* (ꦩꦺكار产出) – a form of songs and poetry that is often used to convey message and thoughts for every stage of life.
therefore we are more grounded in this life (Supadma, 2012). Perhaps a more inclusive and easily accessible music therapy training program could be one of the ways to ensure the richness of Indonesian music therapy practice. Through opening a wider access for people of different region in Indonesia, all music therapy practitioners could learn about different traditional cultures from one another.

Through this study, we can see that respondents’ access to English music therapy resources came with benefits and consequences, not only for respondents, but also for the public, clients, and wider music therapy community. There is no quick solution to this matter, as all options will have consequences. More studies need to be done as a follow up to this study. One thing that can be explored is specifically on the matter of advocacy and looking into ways of advocating music therapy especially in other regions of Indonesia. There is also a need to investigate how the traditional cultures in Indonesia utilize music in their daily living and their concept of healthcare, as well as the language they used to express their understanding of health. Perhaps there are a few discoveries that can enrich our knowledge in music therapy, or similarities in values or concepts. It is important to keep in mind that the intention of this study and future ones is not to – and should not – diminish or overthrow any systems or cultures, because based on the respondents’ answers it can be concluded that a certain flexibility and willingness to listen is what we need more to have a wider outreach in our own community. Figuring out the identity of Indonesian music therapy practice and training program will be like untangling a severely tangled string. The practice of music therapy in Indonesia is intertwined with other systems such as the general healthcare system and education system. And the influence of western perspective can also be clearly seen in these other systems, especially in major cities. Music therapy as an anti-oppressive practice recognizes the power imbalances in our society and its impacts to us all (Baines, 2013). Even though it is difficult, it does not mean that as music therapists we cannot and should not disagree with the healthcare system or education training programs that does not truly support the client's development and increased health. Perhaps that courage to stick with what is true, the willingness to believe, and to listen attentively to diversity is what is needed to shape the identity of music therapy practice in Indonesia.

**About the Author**

Kezia Putri is an Indonesian music therapist, as well as a lecturer at Universitas Pelita Harapan, Indonesia. She obtained her Bachelor’s degree in music - music therapy concentration in Indonesia, and later her Master of Music Therapy degree in Canada. She currently works with adults with mental health concerns, refugees, as well as seniors. Her interests include exploring the potential of Indonesian traditional music resources, as well as the concept of music and medicine within Indonesian traditional culture.
References

Abdulhafidh, E. (2015). *The Role of English in Present Day Higher Education*. 5th International Visible Conference On Educational Sciences, Iraq. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/311739707_The_Role_of_English_in_Present_Day_Higher_Education

Baines, S. (2013). Music therapy as an anti-oppressive practice. *The Arts in Psychotherapy, 40*(2013). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aip.2012.09.003

Balan, J. (2011). *English Global Dominance and the Other Languages of Higher Education & Research*. Columbia University.

Bergen, L. V., Hesselink, L., & Verhave, J. P. (2019). Gelanggang riset kedokteran di bumi Indonesia: Jurnal kedokteran Hindia-Belanda 1852–1942. Jakarta: Akademi Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology, 3*(2), 77–101. https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa

Cahyokusumo, R. D. S (2019). Komunikasi agama dan budaya laku nenepi. Perspektif sosiokultural. https://artikula.id/dimassigitcahyo/komunikasi-agama-dan-budaya-laku-nenepi/

Crystal, D. (1997). *English as a global language*. Cambridge University Press.

Colebrook, R. (1996). The literature of ELT a question of linguistic and cultural imperialism? In J. E. James (Ed.), *The Language-Culture Connection*. SEAMEO RELC

De Backer, J., & Sutton, J. (2004). Exploring the problem of English for the non-English speaker: Two voices in dialogue. *Voices: A World Forum for Music Therapy, 4*(1). https://doi.org/10.15845/voices.v4i1.142

Elwafi, P. (2007). Islam and music therapy; Controversy and beauty. Music Therapy Association of Kentucky, Louisville, Kentucky.

Elwafi, P. (2017). Muslim cultures. In A. Whitehead-Pleaux & X. Tan (Eds.), *Cultural intersections in music therapy: Music, health, and the person* (pp. 153–164). Barcelona Publishers.

Farhadi, A. R., Bainsasi, Y. N., & Handayani, A. (2020). English-speaking issues towards Indonesia senior high-school students. *Proceedings of Seminar Nasional Ilmu Pendidikan dan Multi Disiplin 3*. https://prosiding.esaunggul.ac.id/index.php/snip/article/download/63/70

Hadley, S., & Edwards, J. (2016). Narrative inquiry. In B. Wheeler & K. Murphy (Eds.), *Music Therapy Research* (pp. 1177–1200). Barcelona Publishers.

Himawati, U. (2018). English role as international language in education on university level. *Jurnal Linguistik Terapan dan Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, 5*(1). https://ejournal.unisnu.ac.id/JE/article/view/821

Hoff, E. (2004). *Language of development* (3rd ed.). Wadsworth Publishing Company, Inc. Holloway, I. (2008). *A-Z of qualitative research in healthcare*. Blackwell.

Iftanti, E. (2012). A survey of the English reading habits of EFL students in Indonesia. *TEFLIN journal, 23*(2). https://journal.teflin.org/index.php/journal/article/view/144

Ikuno, R. (2005). Development and prospect of music therapy in Japan. *Voices: A World Forum for Music Therapy, 5*(1). https://doi.org/10.15845/voices.v5i1.211

Kachru, B. B. (1985). Standards, codification, and sociolinguistic realism: the English language in the outer circle. In R. Quirk and H.G. Widdowson (Eds.), *English in the world: Teaching and learning the language and literature* (pp. 11–30). Cambridge
University Press.
Lauder, A. (2008). The status and function of English in Indonesia: A review of key factors. *Makara Sosial Humaniora*, 12(1), 9–20.
Marsudi, M. & Zahrok, S. (2015). Kesetiaan berbahasa Indonesia dipertanyakan di era globalisasi. *Makara Sosial Humaniora*, 8(1).
[http://dx.doi.org/10.12962/j24433527.v8i1.1245](http://dx.doi.org/10.12962/j24433527.v8i1.1245)
Ninawati, Setiawan, K. & Suparman, M. (2019). Chinese Indonesian cultural orientation analysis. Tarumanegara International Conference on the Applications of Social Sciences and Humanities (TICASH 2019).
Nufus, T. Z. (2018). Teaching English to young learners in Indonesia (Pros and cons). *English Language in Focus (ELIF)*, 1(1), 65–70. [https://doi.org/10.24853/elif.1.1.65-70](https://doi.org/10.24853/elif.1.1.65-70)
Repelita, T. (2018). Sejarah perkembangan Bahasa Indonesia ditinjau dari perspektif sejarah bangsa Indonesia. *Jurnal Artefak*, 5(1), 45–48. [https://doi.org/10.25157/ja.v5i1.1927](https://doi.org/10.25157/ja.v5i1.1927)
Rohmah, Z. (2005). English as a global language: Its historical past and its future. *Jurnal Bahasa dan Seni*, 33(1). [https://sastra.um.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2009/10/English-as-a-Global-Language-Its-Historical-Past-and-Its-Future-Zuliati-Rohmah.pdf](https://sastra.um.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2009/10/English-as-a-Global-Language-Its-Historical-Past-and-Its-Future-Zuliati-Rohmah.pdf)
Salikin et al. (2017). The Indonesian EFL learners’ motivation in reading. *English Language Teaching*, 10(5). [https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v10n5p81](https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v10n5p81)
Sari, A. P. (2019). The advantages and disadvantages of English learning for early childhood education in Indonesia. *Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra*, 8(1). [http://ejournal.uigm.ac.id/index.php/GE/article/view/955](http://ejournal.uigm.ac.id/index.php/GE/article/view/955)
Singh, P. (2021). Exploring current music therapy practices in India. *Voices: A World Forum for Music therapy*, 21(3). [https://doi.org/10.15845/voices.v21i3.3246](https://doi.org/10.15845/voices.v21i3.3246)
Supadma, S. H. (2012). Kumpulan lagu macapat populer. Yogyakarta: Garudhawaca
Szmigiera, M. (2021, March 30). *The most spoken languages worldwide 2021*. Statista. [https://www.statista.com/statistics/266808/the-most-spoken-languages-worldwide/](https://www.statista.com/statistics/266808/the-most-spoken-languages-worldwide/)
Tan & Hsiao. (2017). Eastern and Southeast Asian Culture. In A. Whitehead-Pleaux & X. Tan (Eds.), *Cultural intersections in music therapy: Music, health, and the person* (pp. 51–64). Barcelona Publishers.
Tenzer, M. (1991). *Balinese Music*. Periplus Edition.
Toba, R., Noor, W. N., & Sanu, L. O. (2019). The Current issues of Indonesian EFL students’ writing skills: Ability, problem, and reason in writing comparison and contrast essay. *Dinamika Ilmu*, 19(1). [https://doi.org/10.21093/di.v19i1.1506](https://doi.org/10.21093/di.v19i1.1506)

---

1 National Standard Secondary Schools are educational institutions that use only the standard that was determined by the Indonesian government as the foundation of their curriculum
2 National Plus Standard Secondary Schools are educational institutions that use standards that were determined by the Indonesian government, and other international education standard as the foundation of their curriculum
3 International Standard Schools were educational institutions that use exclusively non-Indonesian education standard as the foundation of their curriculum