On the presence of *Dipturus nidarosiensis* (Storm, 1881) in the Central Mediterranean area

Pierluigi Carbonara Corresp. 1, Rita Cannas 2, Marilena Donnaloia 1, Riccardo Melis 2, Cristina Porcu 2, Maria Teresa Spedicato 1, Walter Zupa 1, Maria Cristina Follesa 2

1 COISPA Tecnologia & Ricerca, Stazione Sperimentale per lo Studio delle Risorse del Mare, Bari, Italy
2 Department of Life and Environmental Sciences, University of Cagliari, Cagliari, Italy

Corresponding Author: Pierluigi Carbonara
Email address: carbonara@coispa.it

The Norwegian skate *Dipturus nidarosiensis* (Storm, 1881) has only recently been recorded in the western Mediterranean Sea along the coast of southern Sardinia, off Algeria and the Alboran Sea. The present study confirmed the presence of the species in the Central Mediterranean Sea by identifying morphometric, morphological features and molecular markers. Biological sampling was conducted from 2010 to 2016 on eight specimens collected through commercial landings, offshore observer programmes and scientific surveys in Adriatic and Ionian waters at depths between 320 and 720 m. The total lengths of the specimens (juveniles and adults) ranged from 268 to 1422 mm, and their body weights ranged from 44.5 to 12,540.0 g. They showed morphometric features that corresponded to those of Norwegian skates in the Northeast Atlantic and the Western Mediterranean. In previous analyses, molecular data were obtained by mitochondrial COI sequences. The haplotype network showed the occurrence of a common haplotype (Hap_1) shared by the individuals from areas in the North Atlantic, Sardinian, Algerian and Spanish Mediterranean Sea areas but not South Africa. The occurrence of individuals in different stages of life (i.e. juveniles, sub-adults and adults) and sexual development (immature and mature) suggested the presence of a species with a permanent reproductive allocation in the deep waters of the Mediterranean, which was exposed to a low level of fishing exploitation. Indeed, the deep depth distribution of the species could be the reason for the absence of information about this species in onshore or offshore fishery data collection programmes and scientific surveys.
On the presence of *Dipturus nidarosiensis* (Storm, 1881) in the Central Mediterranean area

Pierluigi Carbonara¹, Rita Cannas², Marilena Donnaloia¹, Riccardo Melis², Cristina Porcu², Maria Teresa Spedicato¹, Walter Zupa¹ and Maria Cristina Follesa²

¹ COISPA Tecnologia & Ricerca, Stazione Sperimentale per lo Studio delle Risorse del Mare, via dei Trulli 18-20, Bari (BA), 70126, Italy.
² Department of Life and Environmental Sciences, University of Cagliari, Cagliari, Italy, Via T. Fiorelli 1, Cagliari (CA), 09126, Italy.

Corresponding author:
Pierluigi Carbonara¹
via dei Trulli 18–20, Bari (BA), 70126, Italy
Email address: carbonara@coispa.it

Key words:
*Dipturus nidarosiensis*, Central Mediterranean, biodiversity skate, DNA barcoding,
ABSTRACT
The Norwegian skate *Dipturus nidarosiensis* (Storm, 1881) has only recently been recorded in the western Mediterranean Sea along the coast of southern Sardinia, off Algeria and the Alboran Sea. The present study confirmed the presence of the species in the Central Mediterranean Sea by identifying morphometric, morphological features and molecular markers. Biological sampling was conducted from 2010 to 2016 on eight specimens collected through commercial landings, offshore observer programmes and scientific surveys in Adriatic and Ionian waters at depths between 320 and 720 m. The total lengths of the specimens (juveniles and adults) ranged from 268 to 1422 mm, and their body weights ranged from 44.5 to 12,540.0 g. They showed morphometric features that corresponded to those of Norwegian skates in the Northeast Atlantic and the Western Mediterranean. In previous analyses, molecular data were obtained by mitochondrial COI sequences. The haplotype network showed the occurrence of a common haplotype (Hap_1) shared by the individuals from areas in the North Atlantic, Sardinian, Algerian and Spanish Mediterranean Sea areas but not South Africa. The occurrence of individuals in different stages of life (i.e. juveniles, sub-adults and adults) and sexual development (immature and mature) suggested the presence of a species with a permanent reproductive allocation in the deep waters of the Mediterranean, which was exposed to a low level of fishing exploitation. Indeed, the deep depth distribution of the species could be the reason for the absence of information about this species in onshore or offshore fishery data collection programmes and scientific surveys.

INTRODUCTION
Species discrimination is a challenging issue mainly because it is based only on morphological diagnoses. Indeed, species classification errors are frequent because of several factors, such as phenotypic plasticity, the presence of cryptic taxa, morphological changes linked to life stage and the high level of expertise required for this kind of analysis (Herbert et al., 2003a).

The misclassification of skates is common (e.g. Serena, 2005; Frodella et al., 2016; Iglésias et al., 2010). It has been estimated that approximately 50 known species are still only partially described or completely undescribed (Coulson et al., 2011). Consequently, in recent decades, DNA-based species discrimination has been applied (Herbert et al., 2003b) in an increasing number of cases (Spouge, 2016). The use of molecular markers, specifically the cytochrome c oxidase I gene (COI),
has proven to be very helpful on several occasions in the identification of ray and skate species in
the Mediterranean, Atlantic and other waters worldwide (Ball et al., 2016; Bineesh et al., 2017;
Cannas et al., 2010; Cariani et al., 2017; Cerutti-Pereyra et al., 2012; Coulson et al., 2011; Frodella
et al., 2016; Griffiths et al., 2013; Iglésias, Toulhoat & Sellos, 2010; Landi et al., 2014;
Lynghammar et al., 2014; Mabragana et al., 2011; Ordines et al., 2017; Ramirez-Amaro et al.,
2017; Serra-Pereira et al., 2011; Spies et al., 2006; Vargas-Caro et al., 2016; Vella, Vella &
Schembri, 2017; Ward et al., 2008; Ward et al., 2005).

In this context, skates (Rajidae) display conservative morphological traits both among and between
alive and fossil species (Valsecchi et al., 2005). Hence, for this particular taxonomic group, DNA
barcoding has been used to describe new species (e.g. Last & Séret, 2016), extirpation (e.g. Ball
et al., 2016) and species’ expansion range (e.g. Ordines et al., 2017). In particular, the
misclassification problem is particularly crucial in the genus Dipturus (Griffiths et al., 2010;
Iglésias et al., 2010). In the eastern Atlantic Ocean and in the Mediterranean Basin, such
misclassification includes Dipturus batis (Linnaeus, 1758), Dipturus oxyrinchus (Linnaeus, 1758)
and Dipturus nidarosiensis (Storm, 1881). There has been a high percentage of misclassification
in the fishery data reported for the French coast (Iglésias et al., 2010), mostly among the following
species: D. oxyrinchus, D. batis, D. nidarosiensis and Rostroraja alba (Lacepede, 1803). These
findings could have led to the underestimation of the risk of a dramatic decline and collapse of the
spawning stock (Griffiths et al., 2010; Iglésias et al., 2010). Hence, the risk of extinction of these
species might be higher than previously calculated (Iglésias et al., 2010).

D. nidarosiensis is one of the species that is often misclassified in both the Atlantic and the
Mediterranean Basin (Cannas et al., 2010; Follesa et al., 2011; Cariani et al., 2017; Ramirez-
Amaro et al., 2017). The geographical distribution of the Norwegian skate D. nidarosiensis is
known to occur along the northeast Atlantic, from Iceland, the Faroe Islands and northern Norway
to Madeira and northern Mauritania (Stehmann, 1990). This species is considered endemic in the
northeast Atlantic and the Bay of Biscay (Priede et al., 2010; Stehmann & Bürkel, 1984;
Rodríguez-Cabello et al., 2013). However, recently, it has been recorded in the western
Mediterranean Sea, along the southern Sardinia coast (Cannas et al., 2010; Follesa et al., 2012,
Cariani et al., 2017, Marongiu et al., 2017; Porcu et al., 2017), off Algeria (Cariani et al., 2017),
in the Alboran Sea (Ramírez-Amaro et al., 2017) and in the southern Adriatic and Ionian Seas (Cariani et al., 2017). The first catch of Norwegian skate specimens in western Mediterranean waters (2005) was reported to have occurred in Sardinia (Cannas et al., 2010); however, the records of the Alboran Sea are more recent (2012–2016; Ramírez-Amaro et al., 2017). The abovementioned authors hypothesised the ancient presence of the Norwegian skate, which had not been detected due to a misclassification between *D. nidarosiensis* and *D. batis* (Cannas et al., 2010).

In the IUCN Red List, the Norwegian skate *D. nidarosiensis* is listed as near-threatened (Stehmann et al., 2015); moreover, this species is rare in both the northeast Atlantic and the Mediterranean areas (Williams et al., 2008; Cannas et al., 2010). Moreover, because the Norwegian skate has biological characteristics that are similar to other elasmobranchs, such as low fecundity, slow growth and high length at first maturity (Follesa et al., 2012), it is particularly vulnerable to environmental and anthropogenic pressures. Until now, information about the life history of the Norwegian skate in the Mediterranean Basin has been limited and based only on specimens caught around Sardinia Island (i.e., the central-western Mediterranean) (Follesa et al., 2012).

The present study is the first, from morphological and genetic points of view, to describe and characterise the Norwegian skate specimens caught in the southern Adriatic Sea and the north-western Ionian Sea (Central Mediterranean Basin), where this species has never been reported (Marano et al., 2002; Sion et al., 2003; Sion et al., 2004; Zupa et al., 2010, Relini et al., 2000, 2010) until very recently (Cariani et al., 2017). This study provides further information about the geographical distribution and the life-history traits of this species. Morphological comparisons with specimens from Sardinian waters and the Alboran Sea are made to provide the correct classification of this species in the Mediterranean Basin (Cannas et al., 2010; Follesa et al., 2012; Ramírez-Amaro et al., 2017).

**METHODS**

**Sampling**

Samples of *D. nidarosiensis* were collected on land (e.g. market sampling) along the ports of the Apulia region and, from offshore observers (i.e. discard monitoring) in a fishery sampling
programme (Data Collection Framework [DCF]; EU Reg. 1543/2000, 1639/2001, 1581/2004, 199/2008 and 1004/2017) and from fisheries-independent scientific surveys (Mediterranean International Trawl Survey - MEDITS) (AAVV, 2017) (Fig. 1). In total, eight specimens were morphologically analysed and preserved in the deep freezer (-20 °C) at the COISPA Institute Laboratory. Morphology and colour analysis as well as morphometric measurements (nearest 1 mm) (Fig. 2), weights (the nearest 1 g) and meristic counts were performed following the previous descriptions of skate species (Ebert & Stehmann, 2013; Serena, 2005). All measurements and meristic counts are shown in Figure 2 and Table 1.

Sex and maturity were determined macroscopically, and the gonad weights were recorded to the nearest 0.1 g. Gonadal maturity was classified using the MEDITS maturity scale (AAVV, 2017; Follesa and Carbonara, 2019). The following results are shown in Table 2: Stage 1 (virgin immature); Stage 2 (maturing); Stage 3A (mature); Stage 3B (mature/extruding active); Stage 4A (resting); Stage 4B (regenerating).

**Genetic analyses**

Eight specimens were used in the genetic analysis, four of which were previously analysed by Cariani *et al.* (2017) (codes 1–4; Table 1) while the remaining four specimens (codes 5–8; Table 1) were analysed for the first time here.

The total genomic DNA was extracted from tissue samples using the salting-out protocol (Miller *et al.*, 1988). These samples (skin and white muscle) were collected from the ventral side of the pectoral fin (ca. 0.5 cm³ in size). The tissue samples were preserved in 80% ethanol at 4 °C.

The primers for the amplifications of the mitochondrial COI gene (COI-3 primer cocktail) were obtained from Ivanova *et al.* (2007). The PCR reactions were set up in a 25-µl reaction volume containing 2.5 µl of 10X Taq Buffer (Thermo Scientific), 2.5 µl of 2 mM dNTPs, 2.5 µl of 25 mM of MgCl₂, 0.1 µl of each (forward and reverse) 20 mM primers, 0.16 µl of Taq polymerase (Dream Taq® Thermo Scientific) and 1 µl of DNA (50–100ng). The amplification was based on the following cyclic parameters: 5 min at 94 °C for the initial denaturation, followed by 40 cycles of 30 sec at 94 °C, 40 sec at 53 °C for the annealing of primers, 50 sec at 72 °C for extension and
then 7 min at 72 °C for the final extension. The PCR products were outsourced to Macrogen Europe (Netherlands) for sequencing. The sequences were obtained in both directions and submitted to GenBank under accession number MG699904-07. The sequences were edited and aligned in MEGA v. 6 (Tamura et al., 2013) and then translated into aminoacidic sequences using the vertebrate genetic code to exclude the occurrence of codon stop and nuclear pseudogenes.

The number of haplotypes, haplotype diversity \( [hd] \), average number of nucleotide differences \( [k] \) and nucleotide diversity \( [\pi] \) were retrieved using DnaSP v. 5.1 (Librado & Rozas, 2009). Graphically, the haplotypes were arranged in a network with PopART (http://popart.otago.ac.nz) using the median-joining method (Bandelt, Forster & Röhl, 1999).

The sequences obtained in this study were compared to published COI sequences for the species from Mediterranean and eastern Atlantic Ocean individuals of the genus *Dipturus* (D. nidarosiensis, D. oxyrinchus, D. batis, D. cf flossada, D. cf intermedia), which are available in GenBank (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/genbank) and BOLD (http://www.boldsystems.org/). *Rostroraja alba* was used as the outgroup. The supplementary table (Table S1) provides the list and detailed information about the sequences used in the analyses. At least three sequences per species, such as *D. intermediate* and *D. flossada*, were used to a maximum of 42 sequences for *D. oxyrinchus*.

The relationships among haplotypes were investigated using two approaches: the Bayesian method using MrBayes v. 3.1 (Huelsenbeck & Ronquist, 2001; Ronquist & Huelsenbeck, 2003) and the neighbour-joining method in MEGA using Kimura 2-parameter genetic distances (K2P; Kimura, 1980) and a bootstrap test with 1,000 replicates. In MrBayes, the analyses were performed using two parallel runs of two million generations each, using four chains, sampling every 100 generations, a burn-in of 0.25, and saving branch lengths. The performance of the analyses was evaluated using Tracer v. 1.6 (Rambaut et al., 2014). The trees were visualised by MEGA.

**Ethical compliance**

All the Norwegian skate (*Dipturus nidarosiensis*) analysed in this study, which were drawn from commercial fishing activity (DCF; EU Reg. 1004/2017), did not fit the European Commission
recommendations (Directive 2010/63/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 September 2010) or Italian National Law (Decree Law n. 26 of 4 March 2014) regarding the protection of animals used for scientific experiments. Moreover, according to the welfare guidelines under the Decree Law n. 26 of 4 March 2014 (Italian Ministry of Health) and the protocol approved by the Committee on the Ethics of Animal Experiments of COISPA (Italian Ministry of Health 15/2015-UT), the specimens brought alive onboard during the scientific survey or the monitoring on the commercial fishing vessel should be killed using an overdose of anaesthetic. However, all the animals sampled in this study were already dead at the time of sampling: both the specimens sampled at the landing and on board (i.e., discard monitoring and scientific survey when the specimens were brought on board).

RESULTS

The Norwegian skate specimens were captured around the pit of Bari and in the northwest part of the Ionian Sea (Fig. 2) at depths ranging between 320 and 720 m. All measurements, meristic counts, sex and maturity are presented in Table 1. All specimens showed uniformly dark ventral sides, including the ampullary pores (Fig. 3). The disc was wider (WD 64.0–74.0% of TL) than it was long (LD 52.5–59.7% of TL), and it was covered uniformly by a darkish mucous on both sides (Fig. 3). The teeth were pointed in parallel rows in the males and in molar-like sets in pavement in the females (Fig. 4), with the numbers of tooth rows on the upper and lower jaws between 42–45 and 39–43, respectively. It appeared that the number of thorns on the tail increased with the length of the specimens, as shown in Table 1. Moreover, both the dorsal and ventral sides were prickly in the area of the snout (Fig. 5). Morphometric variability between the juveniles and adults was detected in the relationships between the Length Tail (Ltail)/Total Length and Distance interorbital (Dorb)/Total Length (Table 1). In terms of the percentage of TL, Ltail was longer in the juveniles at about half of the TL, and it was one-third of the TL in the sub-adults and adults (Fig. 2). On the contrary, the Dorb increased with the increasing of TL. Moreover, the juveniles did not show spines on the median line of the disc or on both lateral sides of the tail, which were present in the adults (Table 1).
The juveniles (maturity stage 1) were caught in shallow waters at depths between 320 and 377 m, whereas the sub-adult (maturity stage 2) and adult specimens (maturity stage 3A and 3B) were caught in depths ranging between 550 and 720 m. Furthermore, all samples caught during the MEDITS trawl survey were associated with a biocenosis typical of compact bathyal muds. In particular, the juveniles (specimens 5, 7 and 8; Table 1) caught at upper depths were found to be in association with a biocenosis characterised by tall sea pen *Funiculina quadrangularis* facies.

**Genetic analyses**

A 633 bp fragment of the COI gene was obtained from eight individuals from the South Adriatic and Ionian seas. The combination of these data with those available for *D. nidarosiensis* in other areas in the Mediterranean and the adjacent Atlantic Ocean provided the final alignment of 38 sequences and seven haplotypes (555 bp; Hd: 0.515; k: 0.586; π: 0.00106). The haplotype network (Fig. 6) showed the occurrence of a common haplotype (Hap_1) shared by 26 individuals from all investigated areas except South Africa. It also showed six additional haplotypes, four of which were exclusive to the Mediterranean (Hap_2-Hap_5), and two were exclusive to the Atlantic (Hap_6-Hap_7).

The phylogenetic analyses (Fig. 7) further confirmed the identification of the Ionian–Adriatic specimens as *D. nidarosiensis*. They were clustered in a strongly supported clade that was clearly distinguishable from the other species of *Dipturus* found in the Mediterranean and the eastern Atlantic Ocean. The sequences that were the most similar to *D. nidarosiensis* were those of *D. cf. flossada* (95% base pair similarity), and the least similar were those of *R. alba* (87.82% base pair similarity).

**DISCUSSION**

The results of the present study confirmed the presence of the Norwegian skate *Dipturus nidarosiensis* in the central Mediterranean Sea by identifying morphometric and morphological features and molecular markers. The morphological parameters described are in line with the data collected in Sardinian waters (Cannas *et al.*, 2010) and the Alboran Sea (Ramírez-Amaro *et al.*, 2017). In particular, the relationship between the morphometric measurements and total length...
was similar to the data reported in the Alboran Sea (Ramírez-Amaro et al., 2017). Specifically, the measurements of the juveniles from the Spanish area (Ramírez-Amaro et al., 2017) were in accordance with those of the Adriatic Basin. Furthermore, the high variability in Length Tail during the different stages of life seemed to be common to other Rajidae species, including *R. clavata*, *D. oxyrinchus* and *Amblyraja radiata* (Mnasri et al., 2009; Capapé et al., 2015; Templeman, 1987).

The genetic analysis of the mitochondrial gene COI made it possible to confirm the morphological identification of the Adriatic–Ionian samples as *D. nidarosiensis*. In particular, in this study, the molecular data revealed that the Mediterranean specimens of *D. nidarosiensis* (from Sardinia, Algeria and the Alboran Sea) shared COI mitochondrial haplotypes with the Atlantic specimens (see Table S1 for details). However, additional analyses based on more powerful markers (i.e. microsatellites and SNPs) and larger numbers of individuals are needed to investigate possible intraspecific differences and genetic connectivity among the different areas within the Mediterranean as well as between the latter and the Atlantic populations (Griffiths et al., 2011).

The *D. nidarosiensis* reported in this paper were captured mainly around the Bari Pit (maximum depth = 1,233 m) in an area between the western Italian coast and the eastern Montenegrin and Albanian coasts. This area is connected with the northern part of the Ionian Sea through the Otranto Channel, and it is part of a system of currents that exchange and mix deep water from the eastern part of the Mediterranean Sea and the northern part of the Adriatic Sea (Vilibic & Orlic, 2002). Although the capture locations of Norwegian skates are dispersed over 200 miles, all these areas are connected by deep-water currents (Artegiani et al., 1997). In the southern Adriatic and Ionian bathyal systems, there is an absence of barriers to gene flow in deep species as well as *Aristeus antennatus* (Marra et al., 2015). In the case of *A. antennatus*, it was previously hypothesised that the presence of the population could be structured into two layers: a deeper stock not affected by fishing, which preserves genetic homogeneity; and an upper stock living in the fishing ground. The larval dispersal, adult migration and continuous movements of individuals from deeper grounds to upper areas could explain their genetic homogeneity throughout the Adriatic and Ionian system (Marra et al., 2015). Similarly, the partial overlap between the Norwegian skate’s habitat
and fishing grounds in the Adriatic and Ionian Seas suggests that the Adriatic and Ionian *D. nidarosiensis* specimens are part of the same population.

The occurrence of the Norwegian skate in the southern Adriatic Sea and northern Ionian Sea sheds new light on the dispersion of this species in the Mediterranean Basin. In interviews with fishermen in the southern Adriatic, it emerged that the occurrence of this species, locally called “black monk”, is not unusual.

However, the presence of this species in the Mediterranean was unnoticed until 2010 (Cannas *et al*., 2010), which could be attributed to two main reasons. Firstly, it had been misclassified with others species of the *Dipturus* genus (Cannas *et al*., 2010) as well as for the French coast (Iglésias *et al*., 2010). Indeed, the presence of the *Dipturus* species is not recent (Griffits *et al*., 2011). In the southern Adriatic, catches of *D. oxyrinchus* were reported in 1994–1995 (Relini *et al*., 2000; Marano *et al*., 2003), and in the western Ionian, catches of *D. batis* and *D. oxyrinchus* were recorded in 1992 and 2000–2001, respectively (Relini *et al*., 2000; Sion *et al*., 2003). In the central-western part of the basin, *D. oxyrinchus* has been caught since the first surveys that were funded by the DCF in mid-1980 (Relini *et al*., 2000, 2010). Secondly, in the southern Adriatic, the bottom trawl fleet fishing grounds are concentrated on the shelf and the upper part of slope (Sabatella & Maninni, 2013). In the western Ionian, as in the other part of the basin, they are located mainly on the slope to a depth of 800 m (Russo *et al*., 2017). Hence, the catches of *D. nidarosiensis* characterised by a wider depth distribution (between 300 and 1,700 m) (Cannas *et al*., 2010; Follesa *et al*., 2012; Ramírez-Amaro *et al*., 2017) could be unrecorded. In the studied areas, the depth of the fishing activity only partially overlaps the deep distribution of the Norwegian skate. In addition, in the Mediterranean sites where *D. nidarosiensis* specimens were found, the seabed presents similar characteristics (e.g. canyons and slopes of high depths), which are favourable to this species but unfavourable to the trawling activity of both commercial (Sabatella & Maninni, 2013) and research vessels (AAVV, 2017).

The presence of maturing and mature males and females in early autumn (end of September/beginning of October) and summer, respectively, could support previous preliminary observations on the reproductive biology of the species in Sardinian waters (Follesa *et al*., 2012).
Furthermore, the collection of empty egg cases on the sea floor as well as individuals in the different life stages (embryos within egg case, juveniles, sub-adults and adults) of both sexes suggests the presence of a species with a permanent reproductive allocation in the Mediterranean Sea (Cannas et al., 2010; Follesa et al., 2012; Cariani et al., 2017, Porcu et al., 2017, Ramírez-Amaro et al., 2017).

Based on the data recorded, despite the few specimens analysed, the Norwegian skate showed that a bathymetric segregation of juveniles occurred only in the upper part of the slope, and sub-adults and adults occurred at lower depths, which was previously reported in Sardinian waters (Follesa et al., 2012). This deep segregation by the ontogenic phase was also observed in other species of skates, including *Raja clavata*, *R. asterias* and *Rhinoptera bonasus* (Rouzet, 1990; Ferrà et al., 2016; Fisher et al., 2013). In addition, the finding of Ionian and Adriatic *D. nidarosiensis* specimens on compact mud bottoms confirmed that the species prefers this type of sea bed, which was also observed by Follesa et al. (2012) in Sardinian waters. Moreover, the present study is the first to record the presence of juveniles in association with a biocenosis characterised by bathyal muds with tall sea pen *Funiculina quadrangularis* facies.

Nevertheless, several aspects of *D. nidarosiensis* remain poorly investigated. For this reason, it would be useful to continue the monitoring and sampling of this species in order to collect additional data to clarify aspects of its biology (e.g. reproduction and growth) and ecology (e.g. trophic relationship and geographical distribution).

**CONCLUSION**

The results obtained in this study confirm the presence of *Dipturus nidarosiensis* in the central Mediterranean Sea (southern Adriatic and northwest Ionian seas) and provide information about its geographical distribution, life-history and morphological traits in the Mediterranean Basin. Indeed, misclassification of the Mediterranean skate species has occurred frequently (Iglésias et al., 2010), resulting in the misinterpretation of several biological characteristics. The morphological data were similar to those recorded in Sardinia and Alboran Sea (Cannas et al., 2010; Ramírez-Amaro et al., 2017). Moreover, the morphological differences between juveniles and adults were highlighted in terms of morphological and meristic characteristics. The genetic
analysis conducted through the mitochondrial gene COI (Spouge, 2016) made it possible to confirm the morphological identification of the Adriatic–Ionian samples as *D. nidarosiensis*.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

The authors are grateful to the academic editor Dr. Antonina Dos Santos and three anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments and suggestions, which greatly helped to improve the manuscript.

**REFERENCES**

AAVV. 2017. MEDITS-Handbook. Version n.9, MEDITS Working Group : 106 pp. Available at: [http://www.sibm.it/MEDITS%202011/principaledownload.htm](http://www.sibm.it/MEDITS%202011/principaledownload.htm) (accessed 26 January 2018).

Artegiani A, Bregant D, Paschini E, Pinardi N, Raicich F, Russo A. 1997. The Adriatic Sea general circulation. Part I: air-sea interaction and water mass structure. *Journal of Physical Oceanography* 27:1492-1514. DOI: 10.1175/1520-0485(1997)027<1492:TASGCP>2.0.CO;2

Ball RE, Serra-Pereira B, Ellis J, Genner MJ, Iglésias S, Johnson AF, Jones CS, Leslie R, Lewis J, Mariani S, Menezes G, Neat F, Noble L R, Sims D W, Griffiths AM. 2016. Resolving taxonomic uncertainty in vulnerable elasmobranchs: are the Madeira skate (*Raja maderensis*) and the thornback ray (*Raja clavata*) distinct species? *Conservation Genetics* 17(3):565-576. DOI: 10.1007/s10592-015-0806-1.

Bandelt H-J, Forster P, Röhl A. 1999. Median-Joining Networks for Inferring Intraspecific Phylogenies. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* 6(1):37–48. DOI: 10.1093/oxfordjournals.molbev.a026036

Bineesh KK, Gopalakrishnan A, Akhilesh KV, Sajeela K A, Abdussamad EM, Pillai NGK, Basheer V S, Jena J K, Ward R D. 2017. DNA barcoding reveals species composition of sharks and rays in the Indian commercial fishery. *Mitochondrial DNA Part A DNA Mapping, Sequencing, and Analysis* 28(4):458-478. DOI: 10.3109/19401736.2015.1137900.

Cannas R, Follesa MC, Cabiddu S, Porcu C, Salvadori S, Iglesias S P, Deiana AM, Cau A. 2010. Molecular and morphological evidence of the occurrence of the Norwegian skate *Dipturus nidarosiensis* (Storm, 1881) in the Mediterranean Sea. *Marine Biology Research* 6(4):341-350. DOI: 10.1080/1745100903428496.

Capapé C, Ali M, Saad A, Alkuasairy H, Reynaud C. 2015. Atypical characteristics in the longnosed skate *Dipturus oxyrinchus* (Linnaeus, 1758) from the coast of Syria (Eastern Mediterranean). *Thalassia Salentina* 37: 71-80. DOI: 10.1285/i15910725v37p71

Cariani A, Messinetti S, Ferrari A, Arculeo M, Bonello J J, Bonnici L, Cannas R, Carbonara P, Cau A, Charilaou C, El Ouamari N, Fiorentino F, Follesa MC, Garofalo G, Golani D, Guariniero I, Hanner R, Hemida F, Kada O, Lo Brutto S, Mancusi C, Morey G, Schembri P J, Serena F, Sion L, Stagioni M, Tursi A, Vrgoc N, Steinke D, Tinti F. 2017. Improving the Conservation of
Mediterranean Chondrichthyans: The ELASMOMED DNA Barcode Reference Library. *PLoS One* 12(1):e0170244. DOI:10.1371/journal.pone.0170244.

Cerutti-Pereyra F, Meekan MG, Wei N W, O'Shea O, Bradshaw CJ, Austin CM. 2012. Identification of rays through DNA barcoding: an application for ecologists. *PLoS One* 7(6):e36479. DOI:10.1371/journal.pone.0036479.

Coulson M, Denti W, Van Guelpen L, Miri C, Kenchington E, Bentzen P. 2011. DNA barcoding of Canada's skates. *Molecular Ecology Resources* 11(6):968-978. DOI: 10.1111/j.1755-0998.2011.03034.x.

Ebert DA, Stehmann. MFW. 2013. Sharks, batoids, and chimaeras of the North Atlantic FAO Species Catalogue for Fishery Purposes. No. 7. Rome, FAO. 523 pp.

Ellis JR, Cruz-Martinez A, Rackham BD, Rogers SI. 2005. The distribution of chondrichthyan fishes around the British Isles and implications for conservation. *Journal of Northwest Atlantic Fishery Science*, 35:

Fisher RA, Call GC, Grubbs RD. 2013. Age, Growth, and Reproductive Biology of Cownose Rays in Chesapeake Bay. *Marine and Coastal Fisheries*, 5 (1): 224-235. DOI: 10.1080/19425120.2013.812587

Follesa MC, Porcu C, Cabiddu S, Mulas A, Deiana AM, Cau A. 2011. Deep-water fish assemblages in the central-western Mediterranean (south Sardinian deepwaters). *Journal of Applied Ichthyology* 27: 129–135. DOI: 10.1111/j.1439-0426.2010.01567.x.

Follesa MC, Cannas R, Cabiddu S, Cau Al, Mulas A, Porcu C, Cau A. 2012. Preliminary observations of the reproductive biology and diet for the Norwegian skate *Dipturus nidarosiensis* (Rajidae) from the Central Western Mediterranean Sea. *Cybium* 36(3): 473-477.

Follesa MC, Carbonara P. 2019. Atlas of the maturity stages of Mediterranean fishery resources. Studies and Reviews n. 99. Rome, FAO. 268 pp. Available at www.fao.org/3/CA2740EN/ca2740en.pdf

Frodella N, Cannas R, Velonà A, Carbonara P, Farrell E D, Fiorentino F, Follesa M C, Garofalo G, Hemida F, Mancusi C, Stagioni M, Ungaro N, Serena F, Tinti F, Cariani A. 2016. Population connectivity and phylogeography of the Mediterranean endemic skate *Raja polystigma* and evidence of its hybridization with the parapatric sibling *R. montagui*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 554:99-113. DOI: 10.3354/meps11799

Griffiths AM, Sims DW, Cotterell SP, El Nagar A, Ellis JR, Lynghammar A, McHugh M, Neat FC, Pade NG, Queiroz1 N, Serra-Pereira B, Rapp T, Wearmouth VJ, Genner MJ. 2010. Molecular markers reveal spatially segregated cryptic species in a critically endangered fish, the common skate (*Dipturus batis*) *Proceeding of the Royal Society B* 277: 1497–1503. DOI: 10.1098/rspb.2009.2111

Griffiths AM, Sims DW, Johnson A, Lynghammar A, McHugh M, Bakken T, Genner MJ. 2011. Levels of connectivity between longnose skate (*Dipturus oxyrinchus*) in the Mediterranean Sea
and the north-eastern Atlantic Ocean. *Conservation Genetics* 12:577-582. DOI: 10.1007/s10592-010-0127-3

Griffiths AM, Miller DD, Egan A, Fox J, Greenfield A, Mariani S. 2013. DNA barcoding unveils skate (Chondrichthyes: Rajidae) species diversity in 'ray' products sold across Ireland and the UK. *PeerJ* 1:e129. DOI:10.7717/peerj.129.

Huelsenbeck JP, Ronquist F. 2001. MRBAYES: Bayesian inference of phylogeny. *Bioinformatics* 17:754-755. DOI: 10.1093/bioinformatics/17.8.754

Iglesias SP, Toulhoat L, Sellos DY. 2010. Taxonomic confusion and market mislabelling of threatened skates: important consequences for their conservation status. *Aquatic Conservation-Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems* 20(3):319-333. DOI: 10.1002/aqc.1083.

Kimura M. 1980. A simple method for estimating evolutionary rates of base substitutions through comparative studies of nucleotide sequences. *Journal of Molecular Evolution* 16:111–120.

Landi M, Dimech M, Arculeo M, Biondo G, Martins R, Carneiro M, Carvalho G R, Brutto S L, Costa F O. 2014. DNA Barcoding for Species Assignment: The Case of Mediterranean Marine Fishes. *PLoS One* 9(9):e106135. DOI:10.1371/journal.pone.0106135.

Librado P, Rozas J. 2009. DnaSP v5: a software for comprehensive analysis of DNA polymorphism data Bioinformatics, 25, (11): 1451–1452. DOI: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btp187.

Lynghammar A, Christiansen J S, Griffiths A M, Fevolden S-E, Hop H, Bakken T. 2014. DNA barcoding of the northern Northeast Atlantic skates (Chondrichthyes, Rajiformes), with remarks on the widely distributed starry ray. *Zoologica Scripta* 43(5):485-495. DOI: 10.1111/zsc.12064.

Mabragana E, Martin Diaz de Astarloa J, Hanner R, Zhang J, Gonzalez Castro M. 2011. DNA Barcoding Identifies Argentine Fishes from Marine and Brackish Waters. *PLoS One* 6(12). DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0028655.

Marano CA, Manfrin Piccinetti G, Pasolini P, Tinti F, Ungaro N. 2002. Annotated checklist of the skates (Chondrichthyes, Rajidae) in the Adriatic Sea. *Biologia Marina Mediterranea* 10 (2): 856–862.

Marongiu MF., Porcu C, Bellodi A, Cannas R, Cau A, Cuccu D, Mulas A, Follesa M C. 2017. Temporal dynamics of demersal chondrichthyan species in the central western Mediterranean Sea: The case study in Sardinia Island. *Fisheries Research* 193:81–94. DOI: 10.1016/j.fishres.2017.04.001

Martin Diaz De Astarloa J, Mabragana E, Hanner R, Figueroa D E. 2008. Morphological and molecular evidence for a new species of longnose skate (Rajiformes: Rajidae: Dipturus) from Argentinean waters based on DNA barcoding. *Zootaxa* 1921:35-46. DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.184713.

Marra A, Mona S, Sà RM, D’Onghia G, Maiorano P. 2015. Population Genetic History of *Aristeus antennatus* (Crustacea: Decapoda) in the Western and Central Mediterranean Sea. *PLoS One* 10(5): e0128609. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0128609
Mnasri N, Boumaïza M, Ben Amor MM, Capapé C. 2009. Polychromatism in the thornback ray, *Raja clavata* (Chondrichthyes: Rajidae) off northern Tunisian coast (central Mediterranean). *Pan-American Journal of Aquatic Sciences* 4(4): 572-579.

Ordines F, Baro J, Ramírez-Amaro S, Serena F, Sobrino I. 2017. First substantiated record of *Raja asterias* Delaroche, 1809 (Elasmobranchii: Rajiformes: Rajidae) in the Gulf of Cádiz, Northeastern Atlantic. *Acta Ichthyologica et Piscatoria* 47(1):101-106. DOI: 10.3750/aiep/02161.

Porcu C, Marongiu MF, Bellodi A, Cannas R, Cau A, Melis R, Mulas A, Soldovilla G, Vacca L, Follesa MC. 2017. Morphological descriptions of the eggcases of skates (Rajidae) from the central-western Mediterranean, with notes on their distribution. *Helgoland Marine Research* 71:10. DOI: 10.1186/s10152-017-0490-2.

Priede I, Godbold JA, King NJ, Collins MA, Baile Y DM, Gordon JDM. 2010. Deep-sea demersal fish species richness in the Porcupine Seabight, NE Atlantic Ocean: global and regional patterns. *Marine Ecology* 31: 247-260. DOI: 10.1111/j.1439-0485.2009.00330.x

Rambaut A, Suchard MA, Xie D, Drummond AJ. 2014. Tracer v1.6, Available at [http://tree.bio.ed.ac.uk/software/tracer/](http://tree.bio.ed.ac.uk/software/tracer/) (accessed 26 January 2018).

Ramírez-Amaro S, Ordines F, Puerto M Á, García C, Ramon C, Terrasa B, Massuti E. 2017. New morphological and molecular evidence confirm the presence of the Norwegian skate *Dipturus nidarosiensis* (Storm, 1881) in the Mediterranean Sea and extend its distribution to the western basin. *Mediterranean Marine Science* 18(2):251-259. DOI: 10.12681/mms.1950.

Relini G, Biagi F, Serena F, Belluscio A, Spedicato M T, Rinelli P, Follesa MC, Piccinetti C, Ungaro N, Sion L, Levi D. 2000. I selaci pescati con lo strascico nei mari italiani. *Biologia Marina Mediterranea* 7 (1): 347-384.

Relini G, Mannini A, De Ranieri S, Bitetto I, Follesa MC, Gancitano V, Manfredi C, Casciaro L, Sion L. 2010. Chondrichthyes caught during the Medits surveys in Italian waters. *Biologia Marina Mediterranea* 17(1): 186-204.

Rodríguez-Cabello C, Pérez M, Sánchez F. 2013. New records of chondrichthyans species caught in the Cantabrian Sea (southern Bay of Biscay). *Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom* 93(07):1929-1939. DOI: 10.1017/s0025315413000271.

Ronquist, F. and J. P. Huelsenbeck. 2003. MrBayes 3: Bayesian phylogenetic inference under mixed models. *Bioinformatics* 19:1572-1574. DOI: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btg180

Rousset J. 1990. Population structure of Thornback Rays *Raja clavata* and their movements in the Bay of Douarnenez. *Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom* 70:261–268.

Russo T, Bitetto I, Carbonara P, Carlucci R, D’Andrea L, Facchini MT, Lembo G, Maiorano P, Sion L, Spedicato MT, Tursi A, Cataudella S. 2017. A Holistic Approach to Fishery Management: Evidence and Insights from a Central Mediterranean Case Study (Western Ionian Sea). *Frontiers in Marine Science* 4:193. DOI: 10.3389/fmars.2017.00193
Serena F. 2005. Field identification guide to the sharks and rays of the Mediterranean and Black Sea - FAO Species Identification Guide for Fishery Purposes. Rome: FAO 97p. Available at http://www.fao.org/docrep/009/y5945e/y5945e00.htm (accessed 26 January 2018).

Serra-Pereira B, Moura T, Griffiths A M, Serrano Gordo L, Figueiredo I. 2011. Molecular barcoding of skates (Chondrichthyes: Rajidae) from the southern Northeast Atlantic. Zoologica Scripta 40(1):76-84. DOI: 10.1111/j.1463-6409.2010.00461.x.

Sion L, Bozzano A, D’Onghia G, Capezzuto F, Panza M. 2004. Chondrichthyes species in deep waters of the Mediterranean Sea. Scientia Marina 68 (Suppl 3): 153–162.

Sion L, D’Onghia G, Tursi A, Matarrese A. 2003. Annotated check list of the skates (Chondrichthyes, Rajidae) in the North-Western Ionian Sea. Biologia Marina Mediterranea, 10 (2): 935–940.

Spies IB, Gaichas S, Stevenson DE, Orr JW, Canino MF. 2006. DNA-based identification of Alaska skates (Amblyraja, Bathyraja and Raja: Rajidae) using cytochrome c oxidase subunit I (coI) variation. Journal of Fish Biology 69:283-292. DOI:10.1111/j.1095-8649.2006.01286.x.

Spouge JL. 2016 Measurement of a Barcode’s Accuracy in Identifying Species. In: Trivedi S, Ansari A., Ghosh S., Rehman H. (eds) DNA Barcoding in Marine Perspectives. Springer, Cham.

Stehmann M, Bürkel DL. 1984. Rajidae. In: Whitehead PJ, Bauchot ML, Hureau JC, Tortonese E, ed. Fishes of the Northeastern Atlantic and Mediterranean. Paris: Unesco, 163-196.

Stehmann MFW, Ellis J, Walls R, Lynghammar A. 2015. Dipturus nidarosiensis The IUCN Red List of Threatened Species 2015: e.T161729A48927468. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2305/IUCN.UK.2015-1.RLTS.T161729A48927468.en. (accessed 25 February 2018)

Stehmann, M. 1990. Rajidae. In Quero, JC, Hureau, JC, Karrer, C, Post, A, Saldanha, L, (eds.) Check-list of the fishes of the eastern tropical Atlantic. Junta Nacional de Investigacao Cientifica e Tecnologica, Lisbon, Portugal. Vol. 1: 29-50

Templeman W. 1987. Length-weight relationship, Morphometric characteristics and Thorniness of Thorny skate (Raja radiata) from Northwest Atlantic. Journal of Northwest Atlantic Fishery Science 7:89-98.

Vargas-Caro C, Bustamante C, Lamilla J, Bennett M B, Ovenden J R. 2016. The phylogenetic position of the roughskin skate Dipturus trachyderma (Krefft & Stehmann, 1975) (Rajiformes, Rajidae) inferred from the mitochondrial genome. Mitochondrial DNA Part A DNA Mapping, Sequencing, and Analysis 27(4):2965-2966. DOI:10.3109/19401736.2015.1060462.

Vella A, Vella N, Schembri S. 2017. A molecular approach towards taxonomic identification of elasmobranch species from Maltese fisheries landings. Marine Genomics 36:17-23. DOI: 10.1016/j.margen.2017.08.008.

Vilibic I, Orlic M. 2002. Adriatic water masses, their rates of formation and transport through the Otranto Strait. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 16: 171-178. DOI: 10.1016/S0967-0637(02)00028-6
Ward RD, Holmes BH, White WT, Last PR. 2008. DNA barcoding Australasian chondrichthyans: results and potential uses in conservation. *Marine and Freshwater Research* 59(1):57-71. DOI: 10.1071/MF07148.

Ward RD, Zemlak TS, Innes BH, Last PR, Hebert PD. 2005. DNA barcoding Australia's fish species. *Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London Series B, Biological sciences* 360(1462):1847-57. DOI:10.1098/rstb.2005.1716.

Williams T, Helle K, Aschan M. 2008. The distribution of chondrichthyans along the northern coast of Norway. *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 65: 1161-1174. DOI: 10.1093/icesjms/fsn103

Zupa W, Donnaloia M, Gaudio P, Intini S, Carbonara P. 2010. Occurrence of Leucoraja fullonica (Linnaeus, 1758) in the south Adriatic Sea. *Biologia Marina Mediterranea* 17 (1): 260-261.
Figure 1

The geographical locations of the *D. nidarosiensis* catches

Spatial distribution of Norwegian skate *Dipturus nidarosiensis* caught during 2010–2016. The numbers correspond to the specimen codes reported in Table 1.
Figure 2

The morphometric measurements recorded for *D. nidarosiensis* specimens

Schematic representation of the morphometric measurements recorded for *Dipturus nidarosiensis* specimens caught in the central Mediterranean Sea. Dorsal view at left (A) and ventral view at right (B). Total Length (TL); Disc Length (DL); Pre 1° dorsal fin Length (L1P); Pre 2° dorsal fin Length (L2P); Preorbital or snout length (Sporb); Preoral Length (SP); Interorbital Length (Dorb); Internostril Length (Dnos), Disc Width (DW); Tail Length (Ltail).
Figure 3

Juvenile and adult specimens (dorsal-ventral view) of *D. nidarosiensis*

Juvenile (A: dorsal view; B: ventral view) and adult female (C: dorsal view; D: ventral view) of *Dipturus nidarosiensis*. Photo: Pierluigi Carbonara.
Figure 4

The mouth of female and male *D. nidarosiensis* specimens

Detail of the mouth of (A) female with molar-like teeth and (B) male with pointed teeth. Photo: Pierluigi Carbonara.
Figure 5

The snout of *D. nidarosiensis*

Detail of the snout (A) dorsal and (B) ventral side. Photo: Pierluigi Carbonara.
Figure 6

Median-Joining network of the COI haplotypes

Median-Joining network of the COI haplotypes. Each circle represents a haplotype, and the area of the circle is proportional to the haplotype frequency. All mutational steps are equal to 1 and are represented with a vertical line. Colours correspond to different areas of origin of the sequence (SAF = South Africa; ATL: Northeast Atlantic; ALB = Alboran Sea; ALG = Algeria; SAR = Sardinia; IAD = Ionian + Adriatic seas). Haplotype code correspondence is shown in Table S1.
Manuscript to be reviewed
Figure 7

Phylogenetic tree

Phylogenetic tree based on mitochondrial COI sequences. Bootstrap/posterior probability values >70 are shown next to the nodes for the Neighbour Joining and Bayesian methods, respectively. In red the clade were the Ionian-Adriatic sequences clustered.
Table 1 (on next page)

The morphometrics, meristics, sexes, maturity, depth, dates of capture and origins data are reported

Summary of data collected from commercial landings and scientific surveys, NA: not available.
| Code specimens | 1    | 2    | 3    | 4    | 5    | 6    | 7    | 8    |
|----------------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| Date           | 29/09/2010 | 31/07/2011 | 31/07/2011 | 06/10/2011 | 13/08/2014 | 13/08/2014 | 02/08/2015 | 01/08/2016 |
| Source         | Landing (Market) | Landing (Discards) | Landing (Discards) | Landing (Market) | MEDITS | MEDITS | MEDITS | MEDITS |
| Depth (m)      | 610  | 600  | 600  | 720  | 377  | 550  | 373  | 320  |

**Morphometric measurements (mm) – Percentage of total length (%)**

| Total Length (TL) | 1235 | 705 | 912 | 1194 | 269 | 1422 | 356 | 305 |
|-------------------|------|-----|-----|------|-----|------|-----|-----|
| Width Disc (WD)   | 855 - 69.2 | 511 – 72.5 | 653 – 71.6 | 884 – 74.0 | 186 – 69.1 | 1003 – 70.5 | 228 – 64.0 | 215 – 70.5 |
| Length Disc (LD)  | 720 - 58.3 | 415 – 58.9 | 524 – 57.5 | 713 – 59.7 | 146 – 54.3 | 842 – 59.2 | 187 – 52.5 | 172 – 56.4 |
| Length 1° dorsal fin (L1P) | 1020 - 82.6 | 560 – 79.3 | 723 – 79.3 | 977 – 81.8 | 206 – 76.6 | 1162 – 81.7 | 252 – 70.8 | 237 – 77.7 |
| Length 2° dorsal fin (L2P) | 1087 - 88 | 622 – 88.2 | 802 87.9 | 1049 – 87.9 | 229 – 85.1 | 1259 – 88.5 | 282 – 79.2 | 266 – 87.2 |
| Distance interorbital (Dorb) | 63 - 5.1 | 34 – 4.8 | 46 – 5 | 59 – 4.9 | 12 – 4.5 | 75 – 5.3 | 15 – 4.2 | 14 – 4.6 |
| Distance internosril (Dnos) | 99 - 8 | 55 – 7.8 | 74 – 8.1 | 98 – 8.2 | 19 – 7.1 | 114 – 8 | 25 – 7 | 20 – 6.6 |
| Snout preorbital Sporb (Sporb) | 246 - 19.9 | 141 – 20 | 181 – 19.8 | 242 – 20.3 | 51 – 18.9 | 286 – 20.1 | 67 – 18.8 | 63 – 20.7 |
| Snout preoral (SP) | 228 - 18.5 | 133 – 18.9 | 173 – 19 | 215 – 18 | 56 – 20.8 | 314 – 22.1 | 69 – 19.4 | 68 – 22.3 |
| Length Tail (Ltail) | 416 - 33.7 | 240 - 34 | 309 – 33.9 | 412 – 34.5 | 136 – 50.6 | 568 – 39.9 | 160 – 44.9 | 157 – 51.5 |

**Meristic counts (N°)**

| Thorns on median row disc | 20 | 12 | 12 | 15 | 0 | 19 | 0 | 0 |
|---------------------------|----|----|----|----|---|----|---|---|
| Median thorns on tail     | 32 | 18 | 23 | 33 | 9 | 35 | 10 | 11 |
| Lateral torn on tail      | 35 | 30 | 34 | 37 | 0 | 33 | 0 | 0 |
| Rows of teeth upper       | 44 | 45 | 43 | 44 | 44 | 45 | 42 | 42 |
| jaw                  | 42 | 43 | 41 | 42 | 42 | 43 | 39 | 39 |
|---------------------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| Rows of teeth lower jaw |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |
| Gill slits          | 5  | 5  | 5  | 5  | 5  | 5  | 5  | 5  |

| Weight (g)          |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |
|---------------------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| Total Weight        | 10043 | 1138 | 2596 | 9200 | 45 | 12540 | 105 | 75 |
| Gonad weight        | 60 | 1.9 | 6.9 | 400 | NA | 58 | NA | NA |
| Liver weight        | 560 | 44.4 | 133.6 | 495.7 | 1.4 | 62.7 | 1.8 | 1.6 |
| Gutted weight       | 8140 | 1023.1 | 2250.4 | 8580 | 39.6 | 11090 | 71.8 | 62.2 |

| Sex and Maturity    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |
|---------------------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| Sex                 | Male | Male | Male | Female | Female | Female | Male | Female |
| Maturity            | 3B | 3A | 3A | 3A | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 |
Table 2 (on next page)

The description of the maturity scale, used in this study

Maturity scale for the Elasmobranch oviparous species (AAVV, 2017; Follesa and Carbonara, 2019)
| STAGE | MATURATION STATE | REPRODUCTIVE APPARATUS ASPECT |
|-------|-----------------|-------------------------------|
|       | FEMALES          | MALES                         |
| 1     | IMMATURE/VIRGIN  | Ovaries barely discernible with small isodiametric follicles. Distal part of oviducts thick-walled and whitish. Oviducal glands not clearly visible. | Small and flaccid claspers not reaching the posterior edge of the pelvic fins. Spermducts not differentiated. Small and narrow testes. |
| 2     | MATURING         | Whitish and/or few yellow maturing follicles visible in the ovary. Distal part of oviducts (uteri) well developed but empty. Developing oviducal glands. | Clasper extending past the posterior edge of the pelvic fins. Spermducts well developed, and starting to meander. |
| 3A    | MATURE           | Ovaries with yellow follicles (large yolk follicles). Enlarged oviducal glands and distended oviducts. | Hard and ossified claspers extending well beyond the posterior edge of the pelvic fin. with internal structure is generally. Testes greatly enlarged. Spermducts meandering over almost their entire length. |
| 3B    | MATURE/EXTRUDING/ACTIVE | Ovaries walls transparent. White or yellow follicles. Large oviducal glands. Egg-cases more or less formed in the oviducts (Extruding Stage). | Clasper longer than tips of posterior pelvic fin lobes, skeleton hardened with axial cartilages hardened and pointed. Spermducts largely. Sperm flowing on pressure from cloaca (Active Stage). |
| 4A    | RESTING          | Ovaries walls transparent. White or yellow follicles. Enlarged oviducts, collapsed and empty. Reduced oviducal glands diameter. | Clasper longer than tips of posterior pelvic fin lobes, skeleton hardened with axial cartilages still hardened. Spermducts empty and flaccid. |
| 4B    | REGENERATING     | Ovaries full of small follicles similar to stage 2, enlarged oviducal glands and uteri | Clasper longer than tips of posterior pelvic fin lobes, skeleton hardened with axial cartilages still hardened. Spermducts empty and flaccid. |