Freshening increases the susceptibility to heat stress in intertidal mussels (*Mytilus edulis*) from the Arctic

Martin B. Nielsen1 | Trine K. Vogensen1 | Jakob Thyrring2,3,4,5 | Jesper G. Sørensen6 | Mikael K. Sejr1,3

1Department of Biology, Arctic Research Centre, Aarhus University, Aarhus C, Denmark; 2Department of Zoology, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada; 3Department of Bioscience, Marine Ecology, Aarhus University, Silkeborg, Denmark; 4British Antarctic Survey, Natural Environment Research Council, Cambridge, UK; 5Homerton College, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK and 6Department of Biology, Section for Genetics, Ecology and Evolution, Aarhus University, Aarhus C, Denmark

**Abstract**

1. Temperatures in the Arctic are increasing at a faster pace than at lower latitudes resulting in range expansion of boreal species. In Greenland, the warming also drives accelerating melt of the Greenland Ice Sheet resulting in more meltwater entering Greenland fjords in summer.

2. Our aim was to determine if increasing summer temperatures combined with lower salinity can induce the expression of stress-related proteins, for example, heat shock protein, in boreal intertidal mussels in Greenland, and whether low salinity reduces the upper thermal limit at which mortality occurs.

3. We conducted a mortality experiment, using 12 different combinations of salinity and air temperature treatments during a simulated tidal regime, and quantified the change in mRNA levels of five stress-related genes (*hsp24*, *hsp70*, *hsp90*, *sod* and *p38*) in surviving mussels to discern the level of sublethal stress.

4. Heat-induced mortality occurred in mussels exposed to an air temperature of 30°C and mortality was higher in treatments with lowered salinity (5 and 15‰), which confirms that low habitat salinity decreases the upper thermal limit of *Mytilus edulis*. The gene expression analysis supported the mortality results, with the highest gene expression found at combinations of high temperature and low salinity.

5. Combined with seasonal measurements of intertidal temperatures in Greenland, we suggest heat stress occurs in low salinity intertidal area, and that further lowered salinity in coastal water due to increased run-off can make intertidal bivalves more susceptible to summer heat stress. This study thus provides an example of how different impacts of climate warming can work synergistically to stress marine organisms.

**Keywords**

blue mussels, Greenland, heat shock proteins, littoral, multiple stressors, salinity, temperature, thermal stress
INTRODUCTION

The latest decade has been the warmest on record, and Arctic temperatures have risen at two times the global average (AMAP, 2019; Wassmann et al., 2011). Arctic warming accelerates the melting of glaciers, sea ice and the Greenland Ice Sheet, creating a feedback loop, as the ice and snow cover gradually loses its albedo effect. The Arctic coastline in general receives 11% of the world's riverine freshwater discharge, which combined with a decrease in Arctic sea ice extent results in an annual freshening of the Arctic ocean by 600 km³ of freshwater (Fichot et al., 2013; Rabe et al., 2014). Since the 1980s, the mass loss of the Greenland Ice Sheet has increased sixfold, equivalent to an average net mass loss of 280 Gt per year (Morlighem et al., 2017; Mouginot et al., 2019). Thus, in Greenland fjords, the input of freshwater from melting ice has been observed to cause decreasing salinity and form distinct salinity gradients (Middelboe et al., 2019; Sejr et al., 2017), where inner fjord surface water salinity can be as low as 5‰ (Meire et al., 2017; Sejr et al., 2014).

Marine heatwaves are also expected to increase in both frequency, duration and intensity, with the largest changes projected to occur in the Arctic (Frölicher et al., 2018). Marine heatwaves are extreme events caused by periods of warm weather resulting in elevated sea surface temperatures (Frölicher et al., 2018). The detrimental effects of marine heatwaves have previously been observed in the Mediterranean, during a heatwave in 2003, where mass mortality among benthic marine organisms was observed (Garrabou et al., 2009). Intertidal species are, furthermore, shifting poleward in response to heatwaves (Sanford et al., 2019). For example, the southern distribution edge of Mytilus edulis in North America has shifted northwards by 350 km in the past 50 years due to a high mortality in southern populations as a direct effect of increased temperatures (Jones et al., 2010), and a recent marine heatwave in the northeast Pacific triggered a range expansion of 37 intertidal species towards the Arctic (Sanford et al., 2019). The effect of air temperature on body temperature during low tide is modified by the physical surroundings of the local habitat. Sessile intertidal organisms, such as blue mussels (Mytilus sp.), are subjected to varying temperatures, depending on their position in the intertidal zone, the substrate slope, orientation relative to the sun and shading by kelp (Helmut et al., 2016; Kearney et al., 2014; Seed & Suchanek, 1992; Sejr et al., 2021). In some habitats, individuals may be sheltered during low tide, in crevices or between boulders, where the effects of heat have less of an impact. The small-scale habitat variability of intertidal shores results in mosaic patterns of heat exposure resulting in local cold- and hotspots (Helmut et al., 2006).

Blue mussels (Mytilus sp.) are freeze-tolerant conspicuous inhabitants in West Greenland fjords (Blicher et al., 2013; Thyrring et al., 2017; Thyrring, Juhl, et al., 2015). Blue mussels can survive subzero water temperatures (Thyrring, Rysgaard, et al., 2015), thus the northern distribution edge of intertidal blue mussels is constricted by extreme low aerial winter temperatures; blue mussels are only found in intertidal microhabitats that reduce exposure to extreme temperatures (Thyrring et al., 2017, 2020). However, with increased warming, the number of days below the lower lethal temperature limit for M. edulis has decreased by ~57% (Thyrring et al., 2017). A local and poleward range expansion of blue mussels due to increasing temperatures is therefore a plausible future scenario in Greenland. Still, the positive effect of fewer extreme low temperature events during winter may be counteracted by an increase in extreme high temperature events during summer. The upper air temperature inducing significant mortality in North American M. edulis populations is approximately 32°C, a temperature at which a high rate of mortality in a population occurs when several consecutive exposures occur (Jones et al., 2010). In Greenland, summer temperatures surpassing 36°C in the intertidal zone have previously been reported (Høgslund et al., 2014; Thyrring et al., 2017), making scenarios in which high temperature induces heat stress or even mortality plausible. The consequence of high temperature events for M. edulis in Greenland may be exacerbated by the lowered salinity of coastal waters due to increased ice melt. Decreased salinities change the shell production and mineral composition of M. edulis (Telesca et al., 2018, 2019), and reduce the growth rate as the costs of calcification are increased (Sanders et al., 2018). The growth of soft tissues is also reduced due to allocation of energy to osmoregulation and cell repair (Landes et al., 2015). An effect of combined temperature and salinity stress has already been established on other organisms. Diehl et al. (2020) showed that high temperature and low salinity in Arctic fjords have a negative impact on the physical and biochemical status of the Arctic brown seaweed Laminaria solindungula, and low salinity-high temperature stress has proven to increase mortality in Baltic blue mussels (Hiebenthal et al., 2012).

One physiological response to environmental stress is an increased production of stress-related proteins such as heat shock proteins. It is generally acknowledged that an upregulation of stress-responsive proteins occurs in M. edulis as a response to the cellular damage inflicted by high temperatures (Buckley et al., 2001; Jones et al., 2010; Lockwood et al., 2010; Paul Chapple et al., 1997). However, experiments have shown that the induction of stress-responsive proteins not only occurs when mussels are subjected to high temperatures, but also to low salinities (Hamer et al., 2004; Podlipaeva & Berger, 2012). This suggests that exposure to both low levels of salinity and high temperature simultaneously might have synergistic effects on the stress level applied to the organism, the expression of the heat shock response and mortality.

In this study, we test if summer temperatures in Greenland can induce mortality and/or expression of heat shock proteins in intertidal mussel and to what extend salinity influences the cellular stress response to high temperatures. To answer this question, we experimentally determined the air temperature that induces mortality and measured the stress protein expression level prior to mortality occurring in a full factorial combination of lowered salinity and high temperature exposures. To mimic natural conditions, animals were
exposed to repeated simulated tidal cycles, with high tide exposing subjects to controlled salinities and low tide exposing subjects to controlled air temperatures. Combined with in situ intertidal temperature measurements from data loggers, we discuss the potential influence of heat stress in *M. edulis* as an Arctic intertidal keystone species.

## 2 | MATERIALS AND METHODS

### 2.1 | Sampling

Blue mussels (*M. edulis*) were collected from a pure *M. edulis* population (Mathiesen et al., 2017) in the lower intertidal zone of a gravel beach in Kobbefjord south of Nuuk, Greenland (64°10′50.8″N, 51°32′28.1″W) on the 5 August 2019. A total of 700 mussels with a shell size range of 30–50 mm were collected, along with ~100 L of seawater. The mussels were kept in a cold storage room (5°C) and divided into four 10-L aquaria with a constant supply of air and a daily change of seawater for 3 days. The mussels were kept in a cooler box with wet towels and transported to holding facilities at Aarhus University. Upon arrival, mussels were divided into four aquariums with a constant supply of air and a daily change of seawater with a salinity of approximately 23‰, corresponding to the salinity at the collection site.

To estimate microhabitat-level air temperatures in the intertidal zone, we deployed five TidbiT Robomussel temperature loggers in different parts of Godthaabsfjord, Nuuk, approximately 1 year prior to our sampling (Helmuth et al., 2016). Due to ice scouring, only one functional logger was retrieved near Kapisillit in the inner part of the fjord (64°27′03″N, 50°19′03″W). The logger, which recorded air and water temperature, was placed in a mussel bed in the intertidal zone. Data were logged from the 8 June 2018 until the 1 August 2019, with a resolution of 30 min (Figure 1). The maximum intertidal air temperature recorded was 32.4°C while the lowest recorded air temperature was −11.7°C. The water temperature varied from 0 to 7°C.

**FIGURE 1** Microhabitat temperatures measured every 30th minute within the intertidal zone in Kapisillit, Godthaabsfjord, Greenland from June 2018 to August 2019

### 2.2 | Experimental design

We exposed mussels to experimental air temperatures of 5, 30, 33 and 36°C combined with salinities of 5‰, 15‰, 23‰, with 5°C and 23‰ representing control conditions. The highest experimental temperature was 0.6°C above the maximum observed temperature from the in situ logger (Figure 1), demonstrating the relevance of the 33°C laboratory experiment. Furthermore, short-term intertidal maximum temperatures of 36°C have been recorded elsewhere in Greenland (Thyrring et al., 2017). Surface salinity in inner fjords is often below 15‰ in summer (Sejr et al., 2014, 2021) and since large aggregations of mussels can be found in river mouths (Duarte et al., 2020), we consider the exposure to salinities of 5‰ to represent realistic albeit extreme conditions. Combined, the experimental conditions were designed to represent extreme current conditions, that are expected to influence a larger proportion of the mussel populations in Greenland and for increased duration in the future.

All collected mussels were subjected to a 1-week adjustment period after arrival in Aarhus, during which the mussels were exposed to air two times a day at 12-hr intervals for 1.5 hr each time, to simulate a semi-diurnal tide. The water and air temperature for the adjustment period was 5°C. The adjustment period was used to ensure that mussels had adjusted to the laboratory conditions prior to the actual experiment starting. No mortality among mussels occurred during the adjustment period. The mussels were fed every second day with 5 ml of algae solution (Shellfish diet 1800, Reed Mariculture). A total of 480 individuals with a shell length of 30–40 mm were selected and distributed into forty-eight 0.5-L buckets in which holes were drilled to allow water to pass through. The buckets each contained 10 mussels subjected to similar experimental treatments. Buckets were distributed to 12 aquaria (10 L), with four aquaria for each salinity regime (5‰, 15‰ and 23‰ [control]). The desired salinities were reached by diluting the 23‰ seawater with demineralized water and measuring the salinity with a digital refractometer.

The experiment began on the 17th August at 18.30 and ended 6 days later on the 23rd August at 06:30. A simulated semi-diurnal tide was created every 12th hour for 1.5 hr during the course of the experiment, by taking the buckets out of the water and placing them in thermal-controlled incubators at 5, 30, 33 and 36°C respectively. During the 6-day experimental period, specimens were subjected to a total of 12 cycles of 1.5-hr exposure to air temperatures. Subjecting the mussels to these air temperatures and the three salinities resulted in a total of 12 treatments. Each individual bucket containing 10 mussels was subjected to the same treatment for the entire course of the experiment, while each treatment had four replicate buckets, totaling 40 mussels per treatment. To document that each treatment was subjected to the desired temperatures over the course of the experiment, iButton temperature loggers (iButtonlink Technology) were placed in a random bucket from each temperature regime, where it measured the temperature every 10th minute for the duration of the experiment (Supporting Information Figures S1–S4). Prior to each temperature treatment, dead mussels were collected, the shell length was...
measured with a digital caliper and the time of death was noted. Once a day, during the temperature treatment, the water in all 12 aquaria was changed. A small amount (5 ml) of algae solution (Shellfish Diet 1800, Reed Mariculture) was added to each aquarium every second day to avoid starvation during the experiment.

After the last simulated low tide exposure, mussels were left overnight in aquaria after which the shell length of surviving mussels was measured, and gill tissue was dissected and instantly frozen using dry ice. Gill tissue samples were stored at −80°C and used for the following gene expression analysis. Mussels subjected to the 36°C treatment were excluded in the gene expression analysis, as the mortality in this treatment was ~100%.

### 2.3 | Gene expression analysis

We investigated gill tissue of *M. edulis* from nine treatments (full factorial design of the two factors: salinity (5‰, 15‰, 23‰) and temperature (5, 30, 33°C). We used six to nine individuals from each treatment (*N*<sub>tot</sub> = 65). RNA extraction was performed using the RNeasy Protect Mini kit (Qiagen) according to the manufacturer’s instructions. The resulting amount of total RNA was quantified (Invitrogen Qubit™ fluorometer) and cDNA was synthesized from 1,000 ng total RNA from each sample (Affinity Script cDNA Synthesis Kit, Agilent Technologies) according to the manufacturer's instructions, diluted to a concentration of 4 ng/µl and stored at −20°C. Gene expression of mussel gill tissue samples was quantified using real-time qPCR on a Stratagene MxPro - MX3005P qPCR system (AH Diagnostics) as described in Waagner et al. (2013). The genes tested were as follows; hsp70, hsp24, hsp90, p38 and sod (Table 1). Amplification plot and dissociation curves were inspected to identify occasional low-quality PCR runs (which were then discarded) and data were converted to linear R<sub>0</sub> values using DART-PCR v1.0 (Peirson, 2003). Gene expression data were normalized with NORMA-Gene (Heckmann et al., 2011).

### 2.4 | Statistics

All statistical analyses were conducted using R (R Core Team, 2020). A GLM with a binomial distribution and a logit link function was used to test for significant difference in mortality proportion with temperature and salinity as the dependent variables. A test for overdispersion was done by dividing the residual deviance with residual degrees of freedom.

A two-way ANOVA was used to test for significant differences in gene expression with temperature and the salinity as the dependent variables. Visual inspection of Q–Q plots and the residual distribution revealed that log transformation of the gene expression data adequately improved the distribution of the data to justify the ANOVA analyses. The level of significance in both mortality and gene expression was *p*-value < 0.05.

### 3 | RESULTS

#### 3.1 | Mortality experiment

We found a significant effect of salinity (*F<sub>1,44</sub> = 21.26, *p* < 0.001), temperature (*F<sub>1,44</sub> = 86.44, *p* < 0.001) and their interactions

| Gene                  | Expected target response | Primer sequence                                      | Reference                          |
|-----------------------|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| hsp90: Heat shock protein 90 kDa | Temperature | Forward primer: TCAGCAACAAAAAGTAAGCCGA
Reverse primer: TCGAGGGCTCTTCAAGCTG | (GenBank: JZ970419.1)
(Buckley et al., 2001) |
| sod: Superoxide dismutase | Oxidative stress | Forward primer: AGCTATCCCTGACTGGTCCC
Reverse primer: CATGGCCACACCTTTACCT | (GenBank: AJ581746.1)
(Mlouka et al., 2019; Regoli et al., 1997) |
| hsp70: Heat shock protein 70 kDa | Temperature/salinity | Forward primer: AACTGCTGAAGCGTATCTGGG
Reverse primer: CCTGCAATGAAACCAGCATCC | (Granger Joly de Boissel et al., 2017; Lockwood et al., 2010; Podlipaeva & Berger, 2012) |
| hsp24: Heat shock protein 24 kDa | Temperature/salinity | Forward primer: AGATGCACGTTCAGCTG
Reverse primer: TGCCGGGATAGTAAAGATTGCC | (Granger Joly de Boissel et al., 2017; Lockwood et al., 2010; Lockwood & Somero, 2011; Fields et al., 2012) |
| p38: Mitogen-activated protein kinases | Salinity | Forward primer: CATTGGACGGAATCTCTGAC
Reverse primer: GCACCTTCTGACGACACG | (Granger Joly de Boissel et al., 2017; Hamer, 2008) |
(F_{1.44} = 14.97, p < 0.001) on survival. Air exposure at high temperatures (33–36°C) and control salinity (23‰) produced a mean mortality of 2.5% and 92.5%, respectively, while no mortality occurred in the 5 and 30°C temperature treatments (Figure 2; Table S1). Thus, the upper thermal limit for Greenland *M. edulis* is approximately 36°C under common saline conditions. Low salinity (5‰) at the control temperature (5°C) resulted in 2.5% mortality (Figure 2); however, when subjected to temperatures ≥30°C and salinities <23‰ simultaneously, a negative correlation occurred. Most pronounced was the results from the lowest salinity treatment (5‰), showing an increase in mortality with increasing air temperatures (30, 33, 36°C) from 49% and 72.5% to 100%, suggesting a synergetic interaction between high air temperatures and low salinity conditions (Figure 2), which clearly depressed the upper thermal limit.

When mortality over time was examined (Figure 3), it became evident that exposure time also had an effect. The results showed that following four days of immersion and emersion cycles with air temperatures exceeding 33°C, a rapid increase in mussel mortality occurred (Figure 3c,d). At 36°C, the air temperature in itself was enough to induce mortality after only six 1.5-hr exposures (Figure 3d). The mortality at low salinities, especially 5‰ and 15‰ increased at a higher rate than at 23‰ (Figure 3c,d). These results suggest that, had the experiment been allowed to continue, a similar trend in temperature–salinity produced mortality could occur in treatments with lower levels of temperature- and salinity stress.

### 3.2 Gene expression analysis

Expression of heat shock proteins and other stress-responsive genes was clearly regulated by high temperatures, while the upper temperature at which production occurred was modified by salinity.

![Figure 2](image1.png) **Figure 2** Mean mortality (%) in blue mussels (*Mytilus edulis*) subjected to 12 cycles of 1.5-hr simulated low tide. Mussels were exposed to four different air temperatures (5, 30, 33 and 36°C) during simulated low tide. While submerged, the mussels were exposed to three different salinities (5‰ (○), 15‰ (△), 23‰ (●)) with a water temperature of 5°C. The experiment ran for six consecutive days. Error bars signify standard error

![Figure 3](image2.png) **Figure 3** Mortality (%) in blue mussels (*Mytilus edulis*) as a function of time (days). Mussel were exposed to four different temperatures during emersion (a: 5°C, b: 30°C, c: 33°C and d: 36°C) and three salinities during submersion (5‰ (○), 15‰ (△) and 23‰ (●)) in 5°C water. Exposure to experimental air temperatures during emersion was done 12 times each for a period of 1.5 hr. The experiment ran for six consecutive days. Mortality was monitored before each emersion treatment.

There was a significant difference in the expression of *hsp90, hsp70* and *hsp24* among temperature treatments (Table 2; Figure 4a–c), and low salinity furthermore significantly affected the gene expression of *hsp70* (Figure 4b). No significant interactions were found among the two variables for any of the investigated hsps (Table 2). The fold change in gene expression increases with increasing temperatures and decreasing salinities; however, there was a tendency towards a higher fold change at 15‰ at both 30 and 33°C (Figure 4). No significant differences were found in the expression of *sod* or *p38* (Table 2); however, our results show a clear tendency towards an
increased expression of both sod and p38 when high temperatures and low salinities co-occur (Figure 4d,e).

### 4 | DISCUSSION

The rocky intertidal zone is an important model system for marine ecologists and provides examples of the long-term impacts of a warming climate (Paine, 1966; Sorte et al., 2017). In the intertidal zone, mussels can be the dominant species and thus impact community and food web structure (Paine, 1974; Sorte et al., 2017). Therefore, identifying factors that directly impact mussels’ physiological responses to thermal stress increases our capacity to predict ecosystem-wide impacts of continued warming. In the Arctic, increasing temperatures are expected to benefit boreal species and allow them to expand northwards. For mussels, an Arctic range expansion has been observed (Berge et al., 2005) and their current northern intertidal limits have been attributed to mortality from freezing during winter low tides. However, it is predicted that blue mussels will increase in abundance and expand upwards in the

**TABLE 2** Results of the two-way ANOVA for the expression of genes (hsp70, hsp24, hsp90, p38 and sod) in blue mussels (M. edulis), subjected to 12 cycles of 1.5-hr emersion. Mussels were exposed to four different air temperatures (5, 30, 33 and 36°C) during a simulated low tide for six consecutive days. While submerged, the mussels were exposed to three different salinities (5‰, 15‰, 23‰) with a water temperature of 5°C. Data have been normalized and log transformed.

| Gene   | Source 1 | Source 2 | F value | Pr(>F) |
|--------|----------|----------|---------|--------|
| hsp90  | Salinity | 2        | 0.61    | 1.16   | 0.32   |
|        | Temperature | 2       | 6.28    | 11.95  | <0.001 |
|        | Salinity: temperature | 4 | 0.41    | 0.77   | 0.54   |
|        | Residuals      | 52      | 0.51    |         |        |
| sod    | Salinity | 2        | 1.78    | 1.66   | 0.19   |
|        | Temperature | 2       | 1.94    | 1.82   | 0.17   |
|        | Salinity: temperature | 4 | 1.58    | 1.48   | 0.22   |
|        | Residuals      | 54      | 1.06    |         |        |
| hsp70  | Salinity | 2        | 16.45   | 11.66  | <0.001 |
|        | Temperature | 2       | 66.55   | 47.16  | <0.001 |
|        | Salinity: temperature | 4 | 1.66    | 1.18   | 0.33   |
|        | Residuals      | 52      | 1.41    |         |        |
| hsp24  | Salinity | 2        | 6.79    | 2.00   | 0.15   |
|        | Temperature | 2       | 78.45   | 23.12  | <0.001 |
|        | Salinity: temperature | 4 | 3.703   | 1.09   | 0.37   |
|        | Residuals      | 55      | 3.39    |         |        |
| p38    | Salinity | 2        | 1.59    | 1.12   | 0.33   |
|        | Temperature | 2       | 2.90    | 2.05   | 0.14   |
|        | Salinity: temperature | 4 | 2.63    | 1.86   | 0.13   |
|        | Residuals      | 53      | 1.41    |         |        |

**FIGURE 4** Change in gene expression (fold change, FC) in blue mussels (Mytilus edulis) for genes hsp90 (a), sod (b), hsp70 (c), hsp24 (d) and p38 (e) in nine different treatments, consisting of three air temperatures during emersion (5, 30 and 33°C) and three salinities (5‰ (○), 15‰ (∆) and 23‰ (♦)) at 5°C during submersion. Fold change values are given relative to control treatment (5°C, 23‰). Error bars signify standard errors.
Intertidal zone as the number of days with temperatures below their lower thermal limit is decreasing (Thyrning et al., 2017). In this study, we wanted to test if the low salinity typically found in Greenland fjords during summer would make bivalves more susceptible to heat-induced mortality and induce increased expression of stress-related proteins to assess if increasing summer temperatures in Greenland could limit the distribution of mussels in the intertidal zone. Three main findings emerged: (a) low salinity increased mortality in mussels when exposed to high temperatures, (b) increased expression of heat shock proteins at air temperatures ≥30°C while one gene (hsp70) also responded to low salinity and (c) intertidal temperature data from Greenland suggest that lethal and sublethal heat stress can occur and is likely to be more frequent in the future.

4.1 Upper thermal limit and salinity

Intertidal *M. edulis* is highly resilient to thermal stress (Clark et al., 2021), but the current study shows that the upper thermal limit of *M. edulis* is modified by habitat salinity. Although the upper thermal limit of *M. edulis* in Greenland is approximately 36°C under control salinity conditions (when exposed for 1.5 hr diurnally), the upper thermal limit was significantly decreased when exposed to lower salinity conditions (Figure 2). Low salinity reduced both the air temperature at which mortality occurred and the exposure time required to induce mortality (Figure 3). Consecutive aerial exposures have been proven to reduce the thermal tolerance of blue mussels, indicating that repeated exposures to high temperatures induces a mortality response in blue mussels (Jones et al., 2009; Seuront et al., 2019; Sorte et al., 2019). This coincides well with our mortality results, in that mortality rapidly increases after multiple exposures to high temperature (Figure 3c,d).

An interactive effect of low salinity and high temperature has previously been reported in other organisms (Southworth et al., 2017). In *M. edulis*, the combined effect of both stressors decrease the survival of larvae, the shell formation and the general condition (Brenko & Calabrese, 1969; Hiebenthal et al., 2012). The present study is the first to demonstrate an interactive effect of low salinity and high aerial temperature on the mortality of *M. edulis*.

4.2 Expression of stress-responsive genes

The gene expression analysis demonstrates that low salinity affects the expression of heat shock proteins during high temperature stress. A significant increase in hsp24, hsp70 and hsp90 expression in response to high temperature was observed, while a significant increase in hsp70 was recorded at low salinity (Table 2). The significant upregulation of hsp70 production in response to both low salinity and high temperature proves it as a useful biomarker for measuring the combined effects of salinity and heat stress. In contrast, hsp24 and hsp90 seem to be less responsive to salinity effects and are therefore probably best suited to measure thermal stress alone.

The upregulation of heat shock proteins as a response to high temperature in *M. edulis* coincides well with previous studies, which also showed an increase in heat shock protein production in *Mytilus* mussels as a response to thermal stress (Buckley et al., 2001; Jones et al., 2010; Lockwood et al., 2010; Paul Chapple et al., 1997). The increase in hsp70 expression in response to low salinity supports previous results by both Hamer et al. (2004) and Podlipaeva and Berger (2012). Both found an increase in hsp70 when blue mussels were subjected to low levels of salinity, confirming that salinity stress inflicts cellular stress. Our results show that high temperature (33°C) and low salinity clearly increases the production of hsp70, suggesting an interaction between the two stressors, though this was not supported by the statistical analysis. However, this is an interesting observation, as other intertidal studies have found very little overlap in gene expressed from heat and salinity stress (Lockwood et al., 2010; Lockwood & Somero, 2011).

The non-significant increase in the expression of sod and p38 suggests an induction occurring as a response to unfavourable osmotic conditions (Hamer, 2008). The upregulation of stress-responsive genes at both salinity and temperature stress implies that the heat shock response is a mechanism used at a variety of unfavourable conditions, while in contrast, the minor induction of sod and p38 suggests that these mechanisms are more specific and are not upregulated when heat and salinity stress co-occur. The effect of low salinity on the expression of stress-responsive proteins (here particularly heat shock proteins) adds to the knowledge that these stress-responsive proteins not only respond to thermal stress but may be modified by other factors (Sørensen, 2010), which complicates the interpretation of expression in field collected organisms.

We do note that our data on gene expression represent a single time point, at the end of the 6-day experiment. Induction of stress-responsive genes can occur rapidly, particularly at the transcriptomic level investigated here. Similarly, associated downregulation upon return to benign conditions also happens rapidly (Buckley, 2006; Sørensen et al., 2005). It has also been demonstrated how dynamic, in time and space, the expression of heat shock proteins can be under field conditions, especially in the intertidal (Gracey et al., 2008). Thus, it is possible (and even likely) that mussels in our study have shown similar dynamics with some or all of the investigated genes showing transient upregulation in response to the stress of salinity or temperature changes. Furthermore, the signal detected in our study represents the response to a more chronic stress condition. Regardless, the detected upregulation of stress-responsive genes clearly indicates a proportional stress exposure.

4.3 Ecological impacts of heat stress in Greenland

Our experiment shows that several days of exposure to temperatures of at least 33°C is required to induce substantial mortality
in intertidal mussels. This does not appear to be a common occurrence in Greenland, and intertidal mussel will thus mostly experience sublethal effects of heat stress. However, it appears conditions in Greenland are approaching a threshold for inducing mortality, which suggest that continued warming will increase the likelihood of mussel mortality induced by Arctic heatwaves or alternatively, that other regions in the Arctic already have crossed this threshold.

The upregulation of heat shock proteins in *M. edulis* by low salinity during submersion may well happen in natural populations in Greenland. Loggers placed in the intertidal zone measured temperatures well above 30°C (Figure 1), coinciding with recordings from South Greenland (Høgslund et al., 2014), and intertidal temperatures exceeding 36°C have been measured further north on Disko Island (Thyrring et al., 2017). With the continued increase in meltwater run-off to Greenland fjords, a combination of high temperature events and low salinity can co-occur in intertidal mussel habitats, potentially skewing the distribution of *M. edulis* to protective microclimate where temperatures remain below the upper thermal limit.

Blue mussels are one of the most abundant macrozoobentonic species in Greenland’s intertidal (Thyrring et al., 2021), and the Godthaabsfjord supports populations of *M. edulis* in a wide range of salinities, and dense beds have been found in brackish lagoons and near river mouths where salinities are especially low (Duarte et al., 2020). A possible future scenario for the distribution of *M. edulis* in Greenland is a change in abundance from the innermost parts of fjords to the outermost, as temperatures further inland are higher than coastal temperatures, and the inner parts of fjords are the first to receive meltwater, thus having the lowest salinities (Meire et al., 2017). Such a distribution is already evident in Northwest Greenland, where *M. edulis* inhabits outer fjord habitats while *M. trossulus*, a congener known to be more tolerant of low salinities, inhabits inner fjord habitats (Wenne et al., 2016). In terms of abundance and distribution on a larger scale, higher temperatures may favour a northward shift as described by Thyrring et al. (2017), but a positive change in abundance due to fewer days below the lower thermal limit may be counteracted by the increase in days with temperatures surpassing the upper thermal limit (Thyrring et al., 2017). Thus, our study provides an important example of how two consequences of climate change combine synergistically to influence the thermal biology of a boreal species in the Arctic.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

This study is a contribution to the ‘De-icing Arctic Coasts’ project funded by DANCEA and ‘Face it’ funded by the EU H2020 Program (grant 869154). The authors thank Philippine Granger Joly de Boissel from the University of Prince Edward Island for sharing sequences used to design qPCR primers, and the Greenland Institute of Natural Resources for accommodation and fieldwork assistance. The travel to Greenland for M.B.N. and T.K.V. was supported by ‘William Demant Fonden’, ‘Familien Hede Nielsens Fond’ and ‘Selskabet for Arktisk Forskning og Teknologi (SAFT)’. J.T. was supported by the ‘The Independent Research Fund Denmark’ (case no. 7027-00060B), the ‘Aage V. Jensens Fond’ and by a ‘Marie Skłodowska-Curie Individual Fellowship (IF)’ under contract number 797387. J.G.S. acknowledge support from Aarhus Universitets Forskningsfond (Starting Grant: AUFF-E-2015-FLS-8-72).

**AUTHORS’ CONTRIBUTIONS**

This study is the product of the Master thesis of M.B.N. and T.K.V. who contributed equally and were supervised by M.K.S., J.G.S. and J.T.; The study was designed by M.K.S., J.G.S. and J.T.; M.B.N. and T.K.V. conducted the experiment, analysed the data, prepared the figures and wrote the first draft of the manuscript, which was subsequently improved with input from M.K.S., J.G.S. and J.T.

**DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT**

Data for this study are freely available through the zenodo repository and can be accessed at https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4454510 (Nielsen et al., 2021).

**ORCID**

Martin B. Nielsen https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5469-2792
Trine K. Vogensen https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9833-636X
Jakob Thyrring https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1029-3105
Jesper G. Sørensen https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9149-3626
Mikael K. Sejr https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8370-5791

**REFERENCES**

AMAP. (2019). AMAP Climate Change Update 2019: An Update to Key Findings of Snow, Water, Ice and Permafrost in the Arctic (SWIPA) 2017. Arctic Monitoring and Assessment Programme (AMAP). 12 pp.

Berge, J., Johnsen, G., Nilsen, F., Gulliksen, B., & Slagstad, D. (2005). Ocean temperature oscillations enable reappearance of blue mussels *Mytilus edulis* in Svalbard after a 1000 year absence. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 303, 167–175.

Blicher, M., Sejr, M., & Høgslund, S. (2013). Population structure of *Mytilus edulis* in the intertidal zone in a sub-Arctic fjord, SW Greenland. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 487, 89–100.

Brenko, M. H., & Calabrese, A. (1969). The combined effects of salinity and temperature on larvae of the mussel *Mytilus edulis*. Marine Biology, 4, 224–226.

Buckley, B. A. (2006). The cellular response to heat stress in the goby *Gillichthys mirabilis*: A cDNA microarray and protein-level analysis. Journal of Experimental Biology, 209, 2660–2677.

Buckley, B. A., Owen, M.-E., & Hofmann, G. E. (2001). Adjusting the thermostat: The threshold induction temperature for the heat-shock response in intertidal mussels (genus *Mytilus*) changes as a function of thermal history. Journal of Experimental Biology, 204, 3571–3579.

Clark, M. S., Peck, L. S., & Thyrring, J. (2021). Resilience in Greenland intertidal *Mytilus*: The hidden stress defense. Science of the Total Environment, 767, 144366.

Diehl, N., Karsten, U., & Bischof, K. (2020). Impacts of combined temperature and salinity stress on the endemic Arctic brown seaweed *Laminaria solidungula* J. Agardh. Polar Biology, 43, 647–656.

Duarte, C. M., Rodríguez-Navarro, A. B., Delgado-Huertas, A., & Krause-Jensen, D. (2020). Dense *Mytilus* beds along freshwater-influenced Greenland shores: Resistance to corrosive waters under high food supply. Estuaries and Coasts, 43, 387–395. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12237-019-00682-3

Fichot, C. G., Kaiser, K., Hooker, S. B., Amor, R. M. W., Babin, M., Bélanger, S., Walker, S. A., & Benner, R. (2013). Pan-Arctic distributions of continental runoff in the Arctic Ocean. *Scientific Reports*, 3, 1053.
Fields, P. A., Zuzow, M. J., & Tomanek, L. (2012). Proteomic responses of blue mussel (Mytilus) congeners to temperature acclimation. *Journal of Experimental Biology*, 215, 1106–1116.

Frölicher, T. L., Fischer, E. M., & Gruber, N. (2018). Marine heatwaves under global warming. *Nature*, 560, 360–364.

Garrabou, J., Coma, R., Bensoussan, N., Bally, M., Chevaldonné, P., Gigliano, M., Diaz, D., Harmelin, J. G., Gambi, M. C., Kersting, D. K., Ledoux, J. B., Lejeusne, C., Linares, C., Marschal, C., Pérez, T., Ribes, M., Romano, J. C., Serrano, E., Teixido, N., … Cerrano, C. (2009). Mass mortality in Northwestern Mediterranean rocky benthic communities: Effects of the 2003 heat wave. *Global Change Biology*, 15, 1090–1103.

Gracey, A. Y., Chaney, M. L., Boomhower, J. P., Tyburczy, W. R., Connor, W. H., Zardi, G. (2016). Long-term, high frequency in situ measurements of intertidal community composition along rocky shores in South-west England: A quantitative approach. *The Biological Bulletin*, 231, 289–298. https://doi.org/10.3354/ab00405

Heckmann, L.-H., Sørensen, P. B., Krogh, P., & Sørensen, J. G. (2011). NORMA-Gene: A simple and robust method for qPCR normalization based on target gene data. *BMC Bioinformatics*, 12, 250.

Helmut, B., Broitman, B. R., Blanchette, C. A., Gilman, S., Halpin, P., Harley, C. D. G., O’Donnell, M. J., Hofmann, G. E., Menge, B., & Strickland, D. (2006). Mosaic patterns of thermal stress in the rocky intertidal zone: Implications for climate change. *Ecological Monographs*, 76, 1–19.

Helmut, B., Choi, F., Matzel, A., Torossian, J. L., Morello, S. L., Mislan, K. A. S., Yamane, L., Strickland, D., Szathmary, P. L., Gilman, S. E., & Tockstein, A., Hibllsb, T. J., Burrows, M. T., Power, A. M., Gosling, E., Mieszowsk, N., Harley, C. D. G., Nishizaki, M., & Carrington, E., … Zardi, G. (2016). Long-term, high frequency in situ measurements of intertidal mussel bed temperatures using biomimetic sensors. *Scientific Data*, 3, 160087.

Hiebenthal, C., Philipp, E., Eisenhauer, A., & Wahl, M. (2012). Interactive effects of temperature and salinity on shell formation and general condition in Baltic Sea Mytilus edulis and Arctica islandica. *Aquatic Biology*, 14, 289–298. https://doi.org/10.3354/ab00405

Høgslund, S., Sejr, M. K., Viktor, J., Blicher, M. E., & Wegeberg, S. (2014). Intertidal community composition along rocky shores in South-west Greenland: A quantitative approach. *Polar Biology*, 37, 1549–1561. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00300-014-1541-7

Jones, S. J., Lima, F. P., & Wetley, D. S. (2010). Rising environmental temperatures and biogeography: Poleward range contraction of the blue mussel, Mytilus edulis L., in the western Atlantic. *Journal of Biogeography*, 37, 2243–2259.

Jones, S. J., Mieszowskowska, N., & Wetley, D. S. (2009). Linking thermal tolerances and biogeography: Mytilus edulis (L.) at its southern limit on the east coast of the United States. *The Biological Bulletin*, 217, 73–85.

Kearney, M. R., Isaac, A. P., & Porter, W. P. (2014). microclim: Global estimates of hourly microclimate based on long-term monthly climate averages. *Scientific Data*, 1, 140006. https://doi.org/10.1038/sdata.2014.6

Landes, A., Dolmer, P., Poulsen, L. K., Petersen, J. K., & Vismann, B. (2015). Growth and respiration in blue mussels (Mytilus spp) from different salinity regimes. *Journal of Shellfish Research*, 34, 373–382.

Lockwood, B. L., Sanders, J. G., & Somero, G. N. (2010). Transcriptomic responses to heat stress in invasive and native blue mussels (genus Mytilus): Molecular correlates of invasive success. *Journal of Experimental Biology*, 213, 3548–3558.

Lockwood, B. L., & Somero, G. N. (2011). Transcriptomic responses to salinity stress in invasive and native blue mussels (genus Mytilus). *Molecular Ecology*, 20, 517–529.

Paine, R. T. (1974). Intertidal community structure. *The Biological Bulletin*, 146, 93–120.

Paine, R. T. (1966). Food web complexity and species diversity. *The American Naturalist*, 100, 65–75.

Peirson, S. N. (2003). Experimental validation of novel and conventional approaches to quantitative real-time PCR data analysis. *Nucleic Acids Research*, 31, 73e–73.

Podlipaeva, Y. I., & Berger, V. Y. (2012). The effect of environmental salinity on the level of heat shock proteins in gill epithelium of Mytilus edulis L. mussel. *Cell and Tissue Biology*, 6, 498–502.

R Core Team. (2020). R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing.

Rabe, B., Karcher, M., Kauker, F., Schauer, U., Tool, J. M., Krishfield, R. A., Pisarev, S., Kikuchi, T., & Su, J. (2014). Arctic Ocean basin liquid freshwater storage trend 1992–2012. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 41, 961–968.

Regoli, F., Principato, G. B., Bertoli, E., Nigro, M., & Orlando, E. (1997). Biochemical characterization of the antioxidant system in the scallop Adamussium colbecki, a sentinel organism for monitoring the Antarctic environment. *Polar Biology*, 17, 251–258.

Sanders, T., Schmittmann, L., Nascimento-Schulze, J. C., & Melzner, F. (2018). High calcification costs limit mussel growth at low salinity. *Frontiers in Marine Science*, 5, 352.
Sanford, E., Sones, J. L., Garcia-Reyes, M., Goddard, J. H. R., & Largier, J. L. (2019). Widespread shifts in the coastal biota of northern California during the 2014–2016 marine heatwaves. *Scientific Reports*, 9, 4216.

Seed, R., & Suchanek, T. (1992). Population and community ecology of *Mytilus*. In *The mussel Mytilus: Ecology, physiology, genetics and culture* (pp. 87–169). Elsevier.

Sejr, M. K., Krause-Jensen, D., Dalsgaard, T., Ruiz-Halpern, S., Duarte, C. M., Middelboe, M., Glud, R. N., Bendtsen, J., Balsby, T. J. S., & Rysgaard, S. (2014). Seasonal dynamics of autotrophic and heterotrophic plankton metabolism and pCO2 in a subarctic Greenland fjord. *Limnology and Oceanography*, 59, 1764–1778.

Sejr, M. K., Mouritsen, K. N., Justesen, J., & Thyrring, J. (2010). Application of heat shock protein expression for detecting natural adaptation and exposure to stress in natural populations. *Current Zoology*, 56, 703–713.

Sejr, M. K., Nielsen, M. M., Kruhøffer, M., Justesen, J., & Loeschcke, V. (2005). Full genome gene expression analysis of the heat stress response in *Drosophila melanogaster*. *Cell Stress & Chaperones*, 10, 312.

Sorte, C. J. B., Bernatchez, G., Mislán, K. A. S., Pandori, L. L. M., Silbiger, N. J., & Wallingford, P. D. (2019). Thermal tolerance limits as indicators of current and future intertidal zonation patterns in a diverse mussel guild. *Marine Biology*, 166, 6.

Sorte, C. J. B., Davidson, V. E., Franklin, M. C., Benes, K. M., Doellman, M. M., Etter, R. J., Hannigan, R. E., Lubchenko, J., & Menge, B. A. (2017). Long-term declines in an intertidal foundation species parallel shifts in community composition. *Global Change Biology*, 23, 341–352.

Southworth, M., Long, M. C., & Mann, R. (2017). Oyster (*Crassostrea virginica* [Gmelin, 1791]) mortality at prolonged exposures to high temperature and low salinity. *Journal of Shellfish Research*, 36, 335–340.

Telesca, L., Michalek, K., Sanders, T., Peck, L. S., Thyrring, J., & Harper, E. M. (2018). Blue mussel shell shape plasticity and natural environments: A quantitative approach. *Scientific Reports*, 8, 2865.

Telesca, L., Peck, L. S., Sanders, T., Thyrring, J., Sejr, M. K., & Harper, E. M. (2019). Biominalization plasticity and environmental heterogeneity predict geographical resilience patterns of foundation species to future change. *Global Change Biology*, 25, 4179–4193.

Thyrring, J., Blicher, M., Sørensen, J., Wegeberg, S., & Sejr, M. (2017). Rising air temperatures will increase intertidal mussel abundance in the Arctic. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 584, 91–104.

Thyrring, J., Juhl, B. K., Holmstrup, M., Blicher, M. E., & Sejr, M. K. (2015). Does acute lead (Pb) contamination influence membrane fatty acid composition and freeze tolerance in intertidal blue mussels in arctic Greenland? *Ecotoxicology*, 24(9), 2036–2042. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10646-015-1539-0

Thyrring, J., Rysgaard, S., Blicher, M. E., & Sejr, M. K. (2015). Metabolic cold adaptation and aerobic performance of blue mussels (*Mytilus edulis*) along a temperature gradient into the High Arctic region. *Marine Biology*, 162, 235–243. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-014-2575-7

Thyrring, J., Tremblay, R., & Sejr, M. K. (2020). Local cold adaption increases the thermal window of temperate mussels in the Arctic. *Conservation Physiology*, 7(1), coz098.

Thyrring, J., Wegeberg, S., Blicher, M. E., Krause-Jensen, D., Høgslund, S., Olesen, B., Wiktor, J. Jr, Mouritsen, K. N., Peck, L. S., & Sejr, M. K. (2021). Latitudinal patterns in intertidal ecosystem structure in West Greenland suggest resilience to climate change. *bioRxiv*. https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.01.05.419028

Waagner, D., Holmstrup, M., Bayley, M., & Sorensen, J. G. (2013). Induced cold-tolerance mechanisms depend on duration of acclimation in the chill-sensitive *Folsomia candida* (Collembola). *Journal of Experimental Biology*, 216, 1991–2000.

Wassmann, P., Duarte, C. M., Agusti, S., & Sejr, M. K. (2011). Footprints of climate change in the Arctic marine ecosystem. *Global Change Biology*, 17, 1235–1249.

Wenne, R., Bach, L., Zbawicka, M., Strand, J., & McDonald, J. H. (2016). A first report on coexistence and hybridization of *Mytilus trossulus* and *M. edulis* mussels in Greenland. *Polar Biology*, 39, 343–355.

**SUPPORTING INFORMATION**

Additional supporting information may be found online in the Supporting Information section.