Role of (p)ppGpp in Viability and Biofilm Formation of *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* S8

Gang Li¹, Fang Xie¹, Yanhe Zhang¹, Janine T. Bossé², Paul R. Langford², Chunlai Wang¹*

¹ Division of Bacterial Diseases, State Key Laboratory of Veterinary Biotechnology, Harbin Veterinary Research Institute, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences, Harbin, China, ² Section of Paediatrics, Department of Medicine, Imperial College London, St. Mary’s Campus, London, United Kingdom

* chunlai.wang@hvri.ac.cn

Abstract

*Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* is a Gram-negative bacterium and the cause of porcine pleuropneumonia. When the bacterium encounters nutritional starvation, the *relA*-dependent (p)ppGpp-mediated stringent response is activated. The modified nucleotides guanosine 5’-diphosphate 3’-diphosphate (ppGpp) and guanosine 5’-triphosphate 3’-diphosphate (pppGpp) are known to be signaling molecules in other prokaryotes. Here, to investigate the role of (p)ppGpp in *A. pleuropneumoniae*, we created a mutant *A. pleuropneumoniae* strain, S8*ΔrelA*, which lacks the (p)ppGpp-synthesizing enzyme RelA, and investigated its phenotype in vitro. S8*ΔrelA* did not survive after stationary phase (starvation condition) and grew exclusively as non-extended cells. Compared to the wild-type (WT) strain, the S8*ΔrelA* mutant had an increased ability to form a biofilm. Transcriptional profiles of early stationary phase cultures revealed that a total of 405 bacterial genes were differentially expressed (including 380 up-regulated and 25 down-regulated genes) in S8*ΔrelA* as compared with the WT strain. Most of the up-regulated genes are involved in ribosomal structure and biogenesis, amino acid transport and metabolism, translation cell wall/membrane/envelope biogenesis. The data indicate that (p)ppGpp coordinates the growth, viability, morphology, biofilm formation and metabolic ability of *A. pleuropneumoniae* in starvation conditions. Furthermore, S8*ΔrelA* could not use certain sugars nor produce urease which has been associated with the virulence of *A. pleuropneumoniae*, suggesting that (p)ppGpp may directly or indirectly affect the pathogenesis of *A. pleuropneumoniae* during the infection process. In summary, (p)ppGpp signaling represents an essential component of the regulatory network governing stress adaptation and virulence in *A. pleuropneumoniae*.

Introduction

*Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* is a non-motile Gram-negative bacterium causing porcine pleuropneumonia, a highly contagious respiratory disease that is transmitted through aerosols...
or close contact with infected animals including asymptomatic carriers. This disease is often fatal and characterized by hemorrhagic, fibrinous and necrotic lung lesions; the clinical features ranging from acute to chronic, and it is an important cause of economic losses worldwide in the porcine industry [1].

The stringent response is a broadly conserved bacterial stress response that controls adaptation to nutrient deprivation, and is activated by a number of different starvation and stress signals. This response is used by bacteria to determine resource allocation for either reproductive or cell maintenance functions [2]. It is important for activation of survival strategies such as the stationary phase, sporulation and biofilm formation [3–5]. The central molecular signals of this response are the small molecules guanosine 5’-diphosphate 3’-diphosphate (ppGpp) and guanosine 5’-triphosphate 3’-diphosphate (pppGpp) (together termed (p)ppGpp) [6, 7]. To regulate the concentration of (p)ppGpp, some bacteria express RelA, which phosphorylates GDP or GTP to produce (p)ppGpp, or hydrolyzes (p)ppGpp back to GDP or GTP, to allow growth after nutrient restrictions are alleviated [7].

The stringent response is also utilized by many bacterial pathogens to regulate their virulence. Recently, a growing number of studies identified the stringent response as being important for both virulence and survival in harsh environments [8–11]. The complexity and multiplicity of the bacterial genes and regulatory pathways affected by the stringent response suggest that the relationship between the stringent response and virulence could be considerably more complex than expected and is perhaps unique for each pathogen [12].

*A. pleuropneumoniae* can adhere to cells of the lower respiratory tract in a process involving different adhesins and probably biofilm formation [13]. In this site, *A. pleuropneumoniae* causes tissue damage leading to clinical disease and mortality [13]. After successful adherence, *A. pleuropneumoniae* requires a variety of nutrients to sustain growth and exert its pathogenic effects. However, the lower respiratory tract is a nutrient-limited environment [14]. Subashchandrabose et al. [15] previously reported that most amino acids were present in lower concentrations in epithelial lining fluid compared to serum, and some amino acids (lysine and threonine) were present only at roughly 40 to 50% of the serum level.

Transition between growth in the upper respiratory tract and lung tissue subjects *A. pleuropneumoniae* to environmental stresses [16]. However, it is poorly understood how *A. pleuropneumoniae* can withstand such stresses. In particular, it is not yet known whether the stringent response has a role in stress adaption and/or is necessary for virulence traits of *A. pleuropneumoniae* within the porcine respiratory tract. In the present study, we have inactivated the relA gene (required for (p)ppGpp synthesis) in *A. pleuropneumoniae* strain S8 [17], and compared its growth, morphology, metabolic and enzyme activity, viability, ability to form biofilms, and transcriptome with its wild-type parent. The results suggest that (p)ppGpp directly or indirectly affects the pathogenesis of *A. pleuropneumoniae*.

**Materials and Methods**

**Bacterial strains, primers, plasmids and growth conditions**

The bacterial strains, primers and plasmids used in this study are described in Table 1. All *A. pleuropneumoniae* strains were cultured in Tryptic Soy Broth (TSB) or Tryptic Soy Agar (TSA) (Becton Dickinson, Franklin Lakes, NJ, USA) supplemented with 10 μg /ml NAD [18]. Selection of *A. pleuropneumoniae ΔrelA* transformants was achieved by the addition of chloramphenicol (5 μg/ml) to TSA. Complemented *A. pleuropneumoniae S8ΔrelA* HB was grown in a TSB supplemented with NAD (10 μg/ml), chloramphenicol (5 μg/ml) and kanamycin (50 μg/ml). For culture of *E. coli β2155 (ΔdapA)*, Luria-Bertani (LB) medium was
supplemented with 1 mM diaminopimelic acid (DAP) (Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, MO, USA) and, when required, chloramphenicol (30 μg/ml). All the bacteria were cultured at 37°C.

**Construction of a (p)ppGpp synthase deletion mutant and complemented strain**

The strategy used for inactivation of the relA gene in *A. pleuropneumoniae* was as described previously [23]. A 900-bp DNA fragment of relA (646 bp-1546 bp, encoding amino acid residues 216 to 516 of the RelA protein) was amplified from genomic DNA of *A. pleuropneumoniae* strain S8 with primers P1 and P2 (Table 1, Fig 1). The PCR product was cloned into the suicide plasmid pEMOC2 between sites SalI and NotI. The resulting insertional plasmid, pEMOC2-ΔrelA, was electroporated into *A. pleuropneumoniae* S8. Recombinants were selected on TSA plates containing chloramphenicol (5 μg/ml). The ΔrelA strain was verified to have the plasmid inserted into the relA locus by PCR using primers P3 and P4 and DNA sequencing of the resulting amplicon. To construct the complemented strain, full-length relA gene with its signal peptide sequence was amplified from S8 genomic DNA with primers P5 and P6 (Table 1, Fig 1). The PCR product was cloned between the EcoRI and the SacI sites of the shuttle vector pLS88. The recombinant plasmid, pLSrelA, was confirmed by DNA sequencing and electroporated into the S8ΔrelA strain. Transformants were selected on TSA plates containing kanamycin (50 μg/ml) and chloramphenicol (5 μg/ml). The complemented strain was confirmed by PCR and DNA sequencing of the ampiclon, and named S8HB.

| Strains | Description | Reference |
|---------|-------------|-----------|
| S-8 | *A. pleuropneumoniae* serovar 7 clinical isolate from the lung of a diseased pig in northern China | [17] |
| S-8ΔrelA | Inactivation of S8 (relA) by insertion mutant | This study |
| S-8HB | The complemented strain of *A. pleuropneumoniae* S8ΔrelA containing the relA gene | This study |
| E. coli β2155 | thrB1004 pro thi hsdS lacZ M15 (F' lacZ M15 lacI traD36 proA* proB* dap::erm (Em')) | [19] |

**Plasmids**

| Plasmids | Description | Reference |
|----------|-------------|-----------|
| pEMOC2 | Transconjugation vector based on pBluescript SK with mobRP4, a polycloning site, Cmr, and transcriptional fusion of the omlA promoter with the sacB gene | [20] |
| pLS88 | Broad-host-range shuttle vector from *Haemophilus ducreyi*; Strr Smr Kmr | [21] |
| pEMOC2-ΔrelA | 900 bp homologous fragment of relA cloned into pEMOC2 via SalI/NotI sites | This study |
| pLSrelA | pLS88 with a PCR-derived insert containing the relA gene | This study |

**Primer**

| Primers | Description | Reference |
|---------|-------------|-----------|
| P1 | 5’GTCGACATAAGTAAGCCGAACGGAGCCATC3’, Mutagenesis | This study |
| P2 | 5’GCGGCCGCTGGAACGCGAGAGTTATATCGCAAA3’, Mutagenesis | This study |
| P3 | 5’ATACCGCTTCGTCTTGTGTCGTCG3’, Confirmation of mutation, comprising bases 1684–1708 of the relA gene | This study |
| P4 | 5’CTTCAACCCCCAACCAGGACAAAAG3’, Confirmation of mutation, comprising bases 2803–2827 of the pEMOC2 plasmid | This study |
| P5 | 5’GAATTCCGACCGTCTACCTAATTGATA3’, Complement, 13 bp downstream of the stop codon of the relA gene | This study |
| P6 | 5’GAGCTCGAAATATTGACTGGTTT3’, Complement, 200 bp upstream of the start codon of the relA gene | This study |
| gyrA-F | 5’CAAGCGAATGCAGCTGTTTA3’ | [22] |
| gyrA-R | 5’CTGTGATGCGGATTGAGA3’ | [22] |
| recF-F | 5’TATGCGAGATCTGCGCA3’ | [22] |
| recF-R | 5’ATTAAAGCTGCCAGGAAC3’ | [22] |
| relA-F | 5’TGCAATGGTCACCAGATAACCTT3’ | This study |
| relA-R | 5’GAATGTCATCATCCTATATGAGC3’ | This study |

Table 1. Strains, plasmids and primers used in this study.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0141501.t001
Detection of intracellular (p)ppGpp

The production of (p)ppGpp in response to minimal medium was assayed as previously described [7]. The strains were grown over-night in TSB to early stationary phase (12 h), diluted back to an OD$_{600}$ of 0.2 with fresh TSB, and incubated in TSB for additional 2 h, at which point all strains had reached an OD$_{600}$ of 0.3. For nutrient deprivation, 2 ml of each culture were pelleted by centrifugation at 12,000 g for 5 min, and washed once with minimal medium (50 mM MOPS (morpholinepropanesulfonic acid) pH 7.4, 1 mM MgSO$_4$, 0.25 mM CaCl$_2$, 19 mM glutamic acid, and 0.004 mM biotin, 10 mg NAD) and resuspended in 250 μl of minimal medium, $^{32}$P (Perkin Elmer) was added to 100 μCi/ml, and the culture labeled for 1 h at 37°C. Fifty microliters of labeled culture were added to an equal volume of 2 M formic acid and placed on ice for at least 15 min. The mixture was centrifuged for 5 min at 16,000 g, and 3 μl of the supernatant were spotted directly onto polyethyleneimine (PEI) cellulose thin-layer chromatography plates (Sigma), dried, and developed in 1.5 M KH$_2$PO$_4$ for 2.5 h. Nucleotides were visualized by autoradiography [24].

Growth experiments

All strains (S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB) were first grown in 2 ml of TSB for 12 h and diluted with fresh TSB to OD$_{600}$ of 0.2. The diluted cultures were incubated at 37°C. The OD$_{600}$ was determined using an Eppendorf Biophotometer (Eppendorf, Hamburg, Germany) at various time points. The effect of relA on the viability of *A. pleuropneumoniae* was determined by counting the CFU of *A. pleuropneumoniae* at the indicated time points. One hundred microliter aliquots of culture were taken and serially diluted in TSB. After plating in duplicate on TSA plates containing relevant antibiotics and incubated at 37°C for 12 h, the CFU were counted. All experiments were repeated three times.

Scanning electron microscopy

The pellets of S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB were harvested by centrifugation at 10,000 g after growth in TSB broth for 6 h, 12 h, 24 h and 36 h at 37°C. The harvested cells were washed twice with 0.1 M PBS buffer (pH 7.2) and fixed overnight using 2.5% glutaraldehyde at 4°C. Subsequently,
fixed cells were washed three times with 0.1 M PBS (pH 7.2) and dehydrated using increasing concentrations of ethanol (i.e. washed once with each of 50%, 70%, 85%, 95%, and three times with 100%). The samples were subjected to critical point drying with CO₂ (BAL-TEC CPD030) and metal-spraying (BAL-TEC SCD005) apparatuses. Finally, the cell morphology of all three strains was compared by scanning electron microscope (Hitachi SU8010).

**Quantitative biofilm assay**

The microtiter plate biofilm assay is a static assay particularly useful for examining early events in biofilm formation [25]. Overnight cultures were diluted 100× with TSB, and 200 μl of the dilution added to the wells of a sterile 96-well microtiter plate (Costar 3599, Corning, NY, USA). After incubation for 36 h at 37°C, the wells were washed with 200 μl water to remove loosely adherent cells. Excess water was removed by inverting plates several times onto new paper towels. The wells were filled with 100 μl crystal violet (0.1%) and incubated for 2 min at room temperature. After removal of the crystal violet solution, the wells were washed with 200 μl water and dried in a 37°C incubator for 30 min. Subsequently, 100 μl ethanol (70%) was added to each well. Absorbance was measured at 590 nm.

**Confocal laser scanning microscopy**

The biofilm assay protocol mentioned above was used except that after washing off non-adherent bacteria, instead of adding crystal violet, 200 μl diluted LIVE/DEAD® BacLight™ Bacterial Viability Kit solution (Molecular Probes, Eugene, Oregon, USA) were added to stain the bacterial cells. Plates were incubated for 20 min at room temperature in the dark and washed with water. The wells were examined with a confocal microscope (TCS SP5, Leica Microsystems, Hamburg, Germany). SYTO 9 nucleic acid stain was excited at 488 nm and detected using a 520 nm filter. Propidium iodide was excited at 488 nm and detected using a 572 nm filter.

**Physiological and biochemical effects of (p)ppGpp**

All strains (S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB) were cultured on TSA plates overnight. Subsequently, bacteria were harvested using PBS, and centrifuged at 12,000 g for 5 min. Pellets were resuspended to an OD₆₀₀ of 0.2 in the suspension medium provided in the kit. The tests were performed using API identification systems, including API 50 CH, API 20 E, API 20 NE and API ZYM, following the manufacturer instructions (BioMerieux).

**RNA isolation and qRT-PCR**

Total RNA was isolated from A. pleuropneumoniae S8 and S8HB strains grown to early stationary phase (12 h) in TSB broth for analysis of relA expression. They were harvested by centrifugation at 10,000 g at 4°C and diluted back to an OD₆₀₀ of 1.0 with fresh TSB medium. The RNeasy kit (Qiagen) was used to isolate RNA. RNA concentrations were measured spectrophotometrically at 260/280 nm (IMPLEN, Germany). Complementary DNA (cDNA) was synthesized using the PrimeScript RT reagent kit with gDNA Eraser (TaKaRa, Japan) following the manufacturer’s instructions. Real-time PCR was performed using a Stratagene3000 system (Agilent Technologies, Germany). The reaction volume was 20 μl, containing 2 μl cDNA template, 10 μl 2μSYBR Green I (TaKaRa) and 0.8 μM of forward and reverse primers. PCR reactions were set up in triplicate. For all amplifications, the cycle conditions were 95°C for 2 min, followed by 40 cycles of 95°C for 15 s and 56°C for 1 min. This experiment was done with three biological replicates, and the average values were taken as the quantitative result. The gyrA and recF gene were used as internal control. Reaction mixtures lacking RNA were used as negative controls.
controls for each set of primers. The primers for amplifying cDNAs of \(\text{gyrA}, \text{recF}, \text{relA}\) are presented in Table 1. Relative expression values were calculated as \(2^{-\Delta\Delta Ct}\text{target} - \Delta\Delta Ct\text{reference}\), where \(\Delta Ct\) is the fractional threshold cycle \([22]\).

### RNA-sequencing analysis

Cultures of S8 and S8\(\Delta\text{relA}\) were grown to early-stationary-phase (12 h) in TSB. The cells were collected at 4°C, the RNeasy kit (Qiagen) was used to isolate RNA, and the Ribozero™ rRNA Removal Kit for Gram-negative bacteria (EPICENTRE Biotechnologies) used to remove rRNA. The remaining RNA was quantified and examined for protein and reagent contamination with a Nanodrop ND-1000 spectrophotometer (NanoDrop, Wilmington, DE, USA). RNA samples showing \(A_{260}/A_{280}\) ratio of 1.8–2.0, and \(A_{260}/A_{230}\) ratio above 1.5 were selected for analysis. A total of 20 μg of RNAs for both the S8 and S8\(\Delta\text{relA}\) strains were pooled for cDNA library construction.

Illumina sequencing was performed at the Beijing Genomics Institute (BGI)-Shenzhen in Shenzhen, China (http://www.genomics.cn/index) following the manufacturer’s instructions (Illumina, San Diego, CA). The cDNA libraries were constructed according to Illumina’s protocols and sequenced using the Illumina HiSeq 2000 platform. This experiment was done with three biological replicates.

### Differential expression analysis

The raw sequence reads were filtered using the Illumina pipeline. All of the low-quality reads, reads with adaptor contamination, and reads with only one copy were excluded from the analysis. The clean reads remaining were mapped to the reference sequence of \(\textit{A. pleuropneumoniae}\) S8 (Genbank accession No. ALYN00000000.1).

To identify the genes affected by deletion of relA, the libraries were compared. The number of reads for each coding region was determined, the number of total reads was normalized between the libraries and the ratio of S8 to S8\(\Delta\text{relA}\) reads was calculated. Differentially expressed genes were detected as previously described \([26]\), with a false discovery rate (FDR) threshold of 0.01 \([27]\). Differences with FDR \(\leq 0.001\) and \(\log_2\text{Ratio absolute value} \geq 1\) were set as the threshold for significant differences in gene expression.

The Blast2GO program was used to obtain GO annotations for molecular functions, biological processes and cellular component ontologies (http://www.geneontology.org). The Kyoto Encyclopedia of Genes and Genomes pathway database (http://www.genome.jp/kegg) was used for pathway assignments. The BlastN program (http://blast.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/) was used to compare sequences with the \(\textit{A. pleuropneumoniae}\) serovar 7 strain AP76 reference sequence (Genbank accession No. CP001091.1) for annotation.

### Statistical analysis

Basic statistical analyses were conducted with the SPSS software (SPSS, Inc., Chicago, IL, USA). The Student’s \(t\) test was used to determine the significance of the differences in the means between multiple experimental groups. The data were expressed as the mean \(+/-\) standard deviation, and values of \(P<0.05\) were considered to be significant.

### Results

#### Construction of an \(\textit{A. pleuropneumoniae}\) S8\(\Delta\text{relA}\) mutant and its complemented strain

The \(\text{relA}\) insertion mutant of \(\textit{A. pleuropneumoniae}\) S8, constructed with plasmid pEMOC2-\(\Delta\text{relA}\) (Fig 1), was confirmed by PCR and DNA sequencing, and designated as S8\(\Delta\text{relA}\).
Complementation of the S8ΔrelA mutant was achieved using the plasmid pLSrelA, with transformants selected on plates containing chloramphenicol and kanamycin. The complemented mutant was designated S8HB.

The ΔrelA mutant fails to produce (p)ppGpp under nutrient deprivation conditions

To determine whether the ΔrelA mutant produces (p)ppGpp, all strains were subjected to nutrient deprivation, a condition which had been shown to induce (p)ppGpp [10, 28–30]. S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB were incubated in minimal medium with 32P for 1 h. As shown in Fig 2, the S8 and S8HB strains accumulated significant amounts of (p)ppGpp upon exposure to this starvation stress. In contrast, there was almost no detectable level in the S8ΔrelA mutant extracts. Plate counts of parallel bacterial cultures after 1 h incubation in minimal medium showed that all three strains remained viable during the experiment; thus, the absence of (p)ppGpp production in the S8ΔrelA strain was not due to bacterial death. This result indicated that the relA gene product is indispensable for (p)ppGpp production in A. pleuropneumoniae S8, and disruption of the relA gene results in the absence of (p)ppGpp.

Lack of (p)ppGpp resulted in abnormal growth under nutrient limitation and decreased viability under starvation conditions

Having ascertained that deletion of relA affects the production of (p)ppGpp in A. pleuropneumoniae S8, and given the vital role of the stringent response in bacterial survival, we investigated the impact of (p)ppGpp on cell growth and viability. As shown in Fig 3, OD600 measurements indicated that S8ΔrelA grew slower than S8 when cultured in TSB. The growth pattern of S8HB was similar to that of S8ΔrelA, indicating lack of complementation of the slow-growth phenotype by the cloned relA gene. To test whether (p)ppGpp is required for

![Fig 2](image-url)

**Fig 2. Accumulation of (p)ppGpp in S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB.** Cells were labeled with [32P]-H2PO4-labelled in MOPS under starvation conditions, nucleotides were acid extracted, centrifuged, 32P-labeled nucleotides were resolved by polyethyleneimine coated TLC plates followed by autoradiography. (P)ppGpp separated by TLC are indicated. Strains used are: S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0141501.g002
viability, we determined cell counts for S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB cultured in TSB over 36 h. As shown in Fig 4, all strains exhibited a decline in viability from 6 h to 36 h. However, S8 exhibits a gradual decline in viable counts from 12 h to 36 h, whereas, S8ΔrelA and S8HB showed a rapid decline during late stationary phase; no viable cells were detected for either strain at 36 h. The results indicated that the relA gene expressed on plasmid pLSrelA was only able to partially restore growth of S8ΔrelA in TSB. However, it was unable to complement viability: the number of colonies decreased approximately seven orders of magnitude relative to the S8 strain. These results indicated that (p)ppGpp contributed to prolonged survival under conditions of nutrient limitation.

Cell morphology of A. pleuropneumoniae S8 is dependent on (p)ppGpp availability

While examining the role of (p)ppGpp in morphology, we found that the S8ΔrelA mutant grew as a homogeneous population of non-extended (i.e. short) rods from 12 to 36 h in liquid medium (Fig 5). The non-extended phenotype is in sharp contrast to S8, which grew as a population of significantly longer rods under the same growth conditions. The extended-rod phenotype was not restored by introduction pLSrelA.

Deletion of (p)ppGpp synthases affects the biofilm formation of A. pleuropneumoniae S8

We tested whether (p)ppGpp plays a role in biofilm formation by examining the biofilm-forming ability of S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB in polystyrene microtiter plates. As shown in Fig 6, S8 and S8ΔrelA produced minor and dense biofilms, respectively. Biofilm quantification was confirmed by confocal laser scanning microscopy (Fig 7). These results indicated that (p)ppGpp is involved in A. pleuropneumoniae biofilm production. The S8HB strain yielded less biofilm than S8ΔrelA, although it produced much more biofilm than WT S8 strain (Figs 6 and 7).
indicated that the relA gene could not complement the biofilm phenotype when expressed on plasmid pLSrelA.

Fig 4. The S8ΔrelA mutant has a stationary phase survival defect. S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB strains were grown by shaking under the same conditions at 37°C, and numbers of CFU ml⁻¹ were determined at different time points indicated. A representative assay of at least three experiments is shown. Error bars indicate the standard deviations of replicate plating.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0141501.g004

Fig 5. Scanning electron microscopy. SEM of S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB. Compared to the S8, cells of the S8ΔrelA mutant and S8HB are of shorter length and typical of WT cells grown in nutrient conditions.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0141501.g005
Metabolic effects of (p)ppGpp in *A. pleuropneumoniae* S8

To test whether the (p)ppGpp affects the metabolic ability, S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB were cultured in API identification systems. The S8 strain utilizes citrate and all the twelve carbon sources listed in Table 2, and it produces urease. However, S8ΔrelA neither uses those carbon sources as substrate, nor produces this enzyme. Introduction of pLSrelA into S8ΔrelA resulted in reversal to wild-type citrate utilization and production of urease, but the production of arginine dihydrolase was not restored (Table 2). No other differences in substrate utilization or enzyme production were seen between S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB.

Validation of expression level of *relA* in S8 and S8HB

To compare the expression levels of *relA* in S8 and S8HB, qRT-PCR analysis was performed three times for RNA extracts from the three biological replicates. Two internal reference genes were used to evaluate the expression level. The results indicated that the plasmid encoded *relA*...
gene had lower expression levels in S8HB than in S8 neither the glyA nor recF gene as reference gene (Fig 8).

Global gene expression in the early stationary phase is different in A. pleuropneumoniae S8 strain compared to the relA-deficient mutant

To study the effects of the effector molecule (p)ppGpp on a genome-wide scale, the transcriptomes of S8 and S8ΔrelA were compared by RNA-seq. The overwhelming majority of the differentially expressed genes in this strain were upregulated (94%). S1 Table shows the differentially expressed genes between S8 and its isogenic S8ΔrelA mutant. A total of 405 genes were found to be differentially expressed in the S8ΔrelA mutant. Among these, 380 genes were upregulated and 25 genes were downregulated compared to the WT S8. The differently expressed genes were annotated according to the COG database and are summarized in Fig 9. The most prominently upregulated transcription was in genes involved in amino acid transport and metabolism (45/405); cell wall/membrane/envelope biogenesis (45/405); translation,

| Characteristic           | S8                  | S8ΔrelA             | S8HB               |
|-------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--------------------|
| Presence of             |                     |                     |                    |
| Arginine dihydrolase    | +                   | –                   | –                  |
| Urease                  | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| Acid production from    |                     |                     |                    |
| D-ribose               | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| D-mannose              | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| D-lactose              | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| D-xylene               | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| D-galactose            | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| D-melezitose           | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| D-sucrose              | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| D-raffinose            | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| D-fructose             | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| D-maltose              | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| Mannitol               | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| Erythritol             | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| Citrate utilization    | +                   | –                   | +                  |
| Gelatin liquefaction   | +                   | –                   | +                  |

- negative result; +, positive result. All strains produced acid from D-glucose. None of these strains produced acid from Glycerol, β-methyl-D-xyloside, inositol, α-methyl-D-glucoside, esculin, inulin, glycogen, D-lyxose, α-methyl-D-mannoside, 5-keto-gluconate, L-sorbose, N-acetylglucosamine, salicin, D-melibiose, xylobiose, L-tagatose, L-arabinotol, D-arabinose, L-xylene, L-rhamnose, sorbitol, Amygdalin, D-cellobiose, D-gentiobiose, D-fucose, glucanone, L-arabinose, adonitol, dulcitol, D-arabinotol, arbutin, D-trehalose, starch, D-turanose, L-fucose, 2-keto-gluconate. None of these strains had Alkaline phosphatase, Leucine arylamidase, Chymotrypsin, N-acetylgalcosaminidase, Lysine decarboxylase, Acid phosphatase, β-glucuronidase, Ornithine decarboxylase, Lipid esterase(C8), Cystine arylamidase, α-glucosidase, β-fucosidase, Tryptophan deaminase, Lipid enzyme(C14), Trypsase, β-D-glucosidase. All strains had β-galactosidase, Esterase (C4), Valine arylamidase, α-mannosidase, Naphthol-as-bi-phosphate hydrolase, α-galactosidase. All strains were negative by Bile esculin test, H2S production, Indole test, VP test. All strains were positive by nitrate reduction and glucose ferment test.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0141501.t002

Table 2. Phenotypic characteristic that distinguish the strains of S8, S8ΔrelA and S8HB.
ribosomal structure and biogenesis (45/405); replication, recombination and repair (33/405); carbohydrate transport and metabolism (31/405); energy production and conversion (25/405); inorganic ion transport and metabolism (24/405). The genes coding for a global anaerobic regulator (APP7_0696, log2 = 1.04), dimethyl sulfoxide reductase (APP7_1734, log2 = 2.38), hemoglobin-binding protein (APP7_1103, log2 = 2.26), capsule polysaccharide export protein (APP7_1644, log2 = 2.01) and autotransporter serine protease (APP7_0385, log2 = 4.03), which are involved in persistence in the upper respiratory tract; the fimbrial biogenesis protein (APP7_0937, log2 = 2.96; APP7_0938, log2 = 1.38), tight adherence protein (APP7_1512, log2 = 2.39), which are involved in adhesion to the lower respiratory tract; the ATP-dependent protease (APP7_0400, log2 = 4.18; APP7_1329, log2 = 2.32), RTX toxin protein (APP7_1051, log2 = 1.76), which are involved in the induction of lesions and the ferric hydroxamate receptor (APP7_2103, log2 = 1.87; APP7_1452, log2 = 1.26), hemoglobin-binding protein A (APP7_1103, log2 = 2.26), iron (chelated) ABC transporter periplasmic-binding protein (APP7_0274, log2 = 1.56), which are involved in acquisition of essential nutrients, are all up-regulated. All of these genes have been characterized as virulence factors in *A. pleuropneumoniae* [2, 31–33].

**Discussion**

In a previous study by Lone *et al.* [34], genes involved in the stringent response were shown to be up-regulated in a *malT* mutant of *A. pleuropneumoniae* grown in porcine bronchoalviolar...
lavage fluid and it was suggested that that this response may play a role in pathogenesis of this bacterium. However, no further investigations were made regarding the roles of individual genes. In order to investigate the role of RelA, a stringent response regulatory protein responsible for synthesis of (p)ppGpp, in *A. pleuropneumoniae* physiology, we constructed a *relA* mutant of the serovar 7 clinical isolate S8 [17]. We confirmed the mutant, S8ΔrelA, to be deficient in (p)ppGpp production compared to the WT S8 strain when incubated in minimal medium (Fig 2), and complementation of the mutant by plasmid encoded *relA* (pLSrelA) was able to restore WT levels of (p)ppGpp under this growth condition.

The S8ΔrelA mutant had a reduced growth rate in TSB compared to S8 (Fig 3). This is consistent with previous studies describing *relA*-deficiency leading to growth limitation [35]. However, complementation with the *relA* gene (strain S8HB) only led to partial restoration of growth limitation, possibly due to differences in expression levels of *relA* from the plasmid. Indeed, qRT-PCR analysis of cultures grown in TSB for 12 h revealed that the expression level of *relA* in S8HB was less than in S8 (Fig 8), suggesting lower concentrations of (p)ppGpp in the complemented mutant under these conditions.

It was also found that the viability of S8ΔrelA decreased with prolonged culture in TSB compared to S8, i.e. it had a stationary phase growth defect. At the 24 h time point, the CFU of S8ΔrelA was seven orders of magnitude less compared to S8. No viable S8ΔrelA were recovered from the TSB cultures at 36 h when plated on TSA. Other studies have documented that the availability of (p)ppGpp affects bacterial survival, i.e. *relA* deficiency results in the death of the cells. For example, a *Bordetella pertussis* *relA*-deficient mutant also lost viability more rapidly than the wild-type [36]. In addition, (p)ppGpp is reported to be responsible for significant changes in gene expression, leading to cessation of growth and induction of specific stress

![Functional categories of *A. pleuropneumoniae* genes that changed their expression profile in the S8 and S8ΔrelA during stationary phase growth.](doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0141501.g009)
responses [12, 37–40]. Our results indicated that (p)ppGpp contributes to prolonged survival of *A. pleuropneumoniae* S8 under conditions of nutrient limitation.

In stationary phase in rich medium (TSB), S8 exhibited a change in morphology such that it produced prolonged rods and with an increase in volume (Fig 5), as has previously been seen in other bacteria [41]. Both, S8 Δ*relA* and S8HB had similar morphology to that of non-stationary phase S8 cells (i.e. short rods), even at 36 h in TSB. Transcriptome analysis showed that genes involved in cell wall/membrane/envelope biogenesis were up-regulated in S8 Δ*relA* compared to S8, consistent with the morphological changes observed.

More recently, (p)ppGpp has been reported to be involved in a number of non-stringent processes, including virulence, and biofilm formation [7, 36, 42]. Bacterial biofilm formation is a complex, multifactorial process requiring genes involved in adherence, metabolism, quorum sensing, and stress responses. When we tested the ability of S8, S8 Δ*relA* and S8HB to form biofilms, we found increased biofilm formation by S8 Δ*relA* compared to S8, suggesting that (p)ppGpp negatively regulates biofilm formation of *A. pleuropneumoniae* S8. These results are in contrast to those found with *Agrobacterium* [43], *Vibrio cholerae* [7], *E. coli* [44], *B. pertussis* [36], where (p)ppGpp promoted biofilm formation. The reasons for this apparent discrepancy are not clear. The transcriptome data revealed that the genes known to be important for the formation of biofilm (*pgaA* log2 = 2.73, *pgaB* log2 = 1.37, *pgaC* log2 = 2.64) were all up-regulated in S8 Δ*relA*. In *A. pleuropneumoniae*, biofilm formation has been shown to be part of the extracytoplasmic stress response, with genes of the *pga* operon positively regulated by σE [45]. In addition, σE regulates expression of numerous genes encoding proteins involved in stress response and in reparation and maintenance of the bacterial envelope, and is itself negatively regulated by the anti-sigma factor, RseA [45–47]. However, the *rseA* gene (APP7_0419) was up-regulated (log2 = 2.04) in S8 Δ*relA*, suggesting that σE was not the only regulator responsible for biofilm formation in the *relA* mutant.

The stringent response occurs when bacteria encounter nutrient-limited environment and initiates changes in gene regulation in order to maximize the utilization of available resources [30]. In contrast to the growth and morphology results obtained in growth in TSB broth, but in agreement with the detection of WT levels of (p)ppGpp in the S8HB strain when incubated in minimal medium, the metabolic defects (including changes in carbon source utilization and all biochemical characteristics except for arginine dihydrolase; Table 2) in S8 Δ*relA* were complemented in S8HB as determined by API analysis, which uses a minimal medium base for inoculation of the test strips. These results suggest that expression of *relA* from pLS*relA* may be higher in minimal medium than in late log phase in TSB.

Besides the differently expressed genes involved the metabolism, some virulence-related genes were also differently expressed (S1 Table). It has been shown that (p)ppGpp has a direct role in expression of virulence in other pathogenic bacteria [2, 31–33]. Some virulence factors involved in adhesion, acquisition of essential nutrients, induction of lesions, avoiding the host’s defense mechanism and persistence have been up-regulated in S8 Δ*relA*. These results suggest that the virulence of S8 Δ*relA* might be higher than S8, however further experiments are required to validate this.

The gene expression profiles for S8 and S8 Δ*relA* were also analysed to determine if any of the differentially regulated genes could explain the various phenotypes in the *relA* mutant. Some significantly differentially expressed transcripts were detected. Among these, the genes involved in ribosomal structure and biogenesis, amino acid transport and metabolism, and translation cell wall/membrane/envelope biogenesis were all up-regulated in the mutant. This is consistent with a previous report that cells entering stationary phase without (p)ppGpp production have a proteomic profile similar to that during growth [48]. This suggests that the transcriptional program of S8 Δ*relA* is geared towards exponential growth, and may be poorly
adapted to inducing systems that are required to withstand stress. Also, the (p)ppGpp deficient strain failed to suppress unnecessary gene expression under nutrient-limiting conditions, which may contribute to diminished survival. A balanced carbon flux is extremely important for viability of bacterial cells [14].

In conclusion, our results show that during stationary-phase growth in TSB, (p)ppGpp is critical for \textit{A. pleuropneumoniae} S8 to adapt to the nutrient-limiting conditions. Several phenotypes were changed owing to the deficiency of (p)ppGpp. By analyzing the transcriptome of a \textit{relA} mutant, we have demonstrated a set of genes that may be regulated by \textit{A. pleuropneumoniae} during adaptation to changing nutrient levels. Many differently expressed genes have been identified, and further study will clarify the role of selected genes in the pathogenesis of porcine pleuropneumonia. Some of the genes identified here may serve as new targets in drug and vaccine development.

Supporting Information

S1 Table. The differently expressed genes of S8\text{ΔrelA} compared to S8 by the deletion of the \textit{relA} gene. All the differently expressed genes were categorized according to the COG database.

(DOCX)

Acknowledgments

We thank Dr. Gerald-F. Gerlach (Institute for Microbiology, Department of Infectious Diseases, University of Veterinary Medicine Hannover, Germany) for the generous donation of \textit{E. coli} \textit{β2155 strain} and vector pEMOC2. We thank Dr. Zhai lei (China National Research Institute of Food & Fermentation industries) for technical assistance with the SEM experiments. We also thank Dr. Du cheng (State Key Laboratory of Veterinary Biotechnology, Harbin Veterinary Research Institute, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences, Harbin, China) for technical assistance with the qRT-PCR experiments.

Author Contributions

Conceived and designed the experiments: GL FX CLW. Performed the experiments: GL YHZ. Analyzed the data: GL YHZ. Contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools: YHZ. Wrote the paper: GL JTB PRL CLW.

References

1. Bosse JT, Janson H, Sheehan BJ, Beddek AJ, Rycroft AN, Kroll JS, et al. \textit{Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae}: pathobiology and pathogenesis of infection. Microbes Infect. 2002; 4(2):225–35. PMID: 11880056
2. Vogt SL, Green C, Stevens KM, Day B, Erickson DL, Woods DE, et al. The stringent response is essential for \textit{Pseudomonas aeruginosa} virulence in the rat lung agar bead and \textit{Drosophila melanogaster} feeding models of infection. Infect Immun. 2011; 79(10):4094–104. doi: 10.1128/IAI.00193-11 PMID: 21788391
3. Wexselblatt E, Oppenheimer-Shaanan Y, Kaspy I, London N, Schueler-Furman O, Yavin E, et al. Relacin, a novel antibacterial agent targeting the stringent response. PLoS Pathog. 2012; 8(9):e1002925. doi: 10.1371/journal.ppat.1002925 PMID: 23028324
4. Syal K, Maiti K, Naresh K, Chatterji D, Jayaraman N. Synthetic glycolipids and (p)ppGpp analogs: development of inhibitors for mycobacterial growth, biofilm and stringent response. Adv Exp Med Biol. 2015; 842:309–27. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-11280-0_20 PMID: 25408352
5. Jain V, Kumar M, Chatterji D. ppGpp: stringent response and survival. J Microbiol. 2006; 44(1):1–10. PMID: 16554711
6. Boutte CC, Crosson S. Bacterial lifestyle shapes stringent response activation. Trends Microbiol. 2013; 21(4):174–80. doi: 10.1016/j.tim.2013.01.002 PMID: 23419217
7. He H, Cooper JN, Mishra A, Raskin DM. Stringent response regulation of biofilm formation in *Vibrio cholerae*. J Bacteriol. 2012; 194(11):2962–72. doi: 10.1128/JB.00014-12 PMID: 22467780

8. Kazmierczak KM, Wayne KJ, Rechtsteiner A, Winkler ME. Roles of rel(Spn) in stringent response, global regulation and virulence of serotype 2 *Streptococcus pneumoniae* D39. Mol Microbiol. 2009; 72(3):590–611. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2958.2009.06669.x PMID: 19426208

9. Klinkenberg LG, Lee JH, Bishai WR, Karakousis PC. The stringent response is required for full virulence of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in guinea pigs. J Infect Dis. 2010; 202(9):1397–404. doi: 10.1086/656524 PMID: 20863231

10. Geiger T, Goerke C, Fritz M, Schafer T, Ohlsen K, Liebeke M, et al. Role of the (p)ppGpp synthase

11. McLennan MK, Ringoir DD, Frirdich E, Svensson SL, Wells DH, Jarrell H, et al. (p)ppGpp: still magical? Annu Rev Microbiol. 2008; 62:35

12. Potrykus K, Cashel M. (p)ppGpp: still magical? Annu Rev Microbiol. 2008; 62:35–51. doi: 10.1146/annurev.micro.62.081307.162903 PMID: 18454629

13. Chiers K, De Waele T, Pasmans F, Ducatelle R, Haesebrouck F. Virulence factors of *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* involved in colonization, persistence and induction of lesions in its porcine host. Vet Res. 2010; 41(5):65. doi: 10.1051/vetres/2010037 PMID: 20546697

14. Kiltgaard K, Friis C, Jensen TK, Angen O, Boye M. Transcriptional portrait of *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* during acute dengue—potential strategies for survival and persistence in the host. PLoS One. 2012; 7(4):e35549. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0035549 PMID: 22530048

15. Subashchandrabose S, LeVeque RM, Wagner TK, Kirkwood RN, Klupel M, Mulsik MH. Branched-chain amino acids are required for the survival and virulence of *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* in swine. Infect Immun. 2009; 77(11):4925–33. doi: 10.1128/IAI.00671-09 PMID: 19703979

16. Dom P, Haesebrouck F, Ducatelle R, Charlier G. In vivo association of *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* serotype 2 with the respiratory epithelium of pigs. Infect Immun. 1994; 62(4):1262–7. PMID: 7907578

17. Li G, Xie F, Zhang Y, Wang C. Draft genome sequence of *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* serotype 7 strain S-D. J Bacteriol. 2012; 194(23):6606–7. doi: 10.1128/JB.01650-12 PMID: 23144372

18. Xie F, Zhang Y, Li G, Zhou L, Liu S, Wang C. The ClpP protease is required for the stress tolerance and biofilm formation in *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae*. PLoS One. 2013; 8(1):e53600. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0053600 PMID: 23326465

19. Dehio C, Meyer M. Maintenance of broad-host-range incompatibility group P and group Q plasmids and transposition of Tn5 in *Bartonella henselae* following conjugal plasmid transfer from *Escherichia coli*. J Bacteriol. 1997; 179(2):538–40. PMID: 8990308

20. Baltes N, Tonpitak W, Hennig-Pauka I, Gruber AD, Gerlach GF. *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* serotype 7 siderophore receptor FluA is not required for virulence. FEMS Microbiol Lett. 2003; 220(1):41–8. doi: 10.1111/j.1128-4655.2002.tb06220.x

21. Willson PJ, Albritton WL, Slaney L, Setlow JK. Characterization of a multiple antibiotic resistance plasmid from *Haemophilus ducreyi*. Antimicrob Agents Chemother. 1989; 33(9):1627–30. PMID: 2684012

22. Nielsen KK, Boye M. Real-time quantitative reverse transcription-PCR analysis of expression stability of *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* housekeeping genes during in vitro growth under iron-depleted conditions. Appl Environ Microbiol. 2005; 71(6):2949–54. doi: 10.1128/AEM.71.6.2949–2954.2005 PMID: 15932989

23. Zhou Y, Li L, Chen Z, Yuan H, Chen H, Zhou R. Adhesion protein ApfA of *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* is required for pathogenesis and is a potential target for vaccine development. Clin Vaccine Immunol. 2013; 20(2):87–94. doi: 10.1128/CVI.00161-12 PMID: 23269417

24. Moueny K, Rader BA, Gaynor EC, Guilemmin K. The stringent response is required for *Helicobacter pylori* survival of stationary phase, exposure to acid, and aerobic shock. J Bacteriol. 2006; 188(15):5494–500. doi: 10.1128/JB.00366-06 PMID: 16855239

25. Labrie J, Pelletier-Jacques G, Deslandes V, Ramjeet M, Auger E, Nash JH, et al. Effects of growth conditions on biofilm formation by *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae*. Vet Res. 2010; 41(1):3. doi: 10.1051/vetres/2009051 PMID: 19737507

26. Audic S, Claverie JM. The significance of digital gene expression profiles. Genome Res. 1997; 7(10):986–95. PMID: 9331369

27. Reiner A, Yekutieli D, Benjamini Y. Identifying differentially expressed genes using false discovery rate controlling procedures. Bioinformatics. 2003; 19(3):368–75. PMID: 12584122

28. Gaca AO, Kajfasz JK, Miller JH, Liu K, Wang JD, Abranches J, et al. Basal levels of (p)ppGpp in *Enterococcus faecalis*: the magic beyond the stringent response. MBio. 2013; 4(5):e00646–13. doi: 10.1128/mBio.00646-13 PMID: 2406631
Das B, Pal RR, Bag S, Bhadra RK. Stringent response in *Vibrio cholerae*: genetic analysis of spoT gene function and identification of a novel (p)ppGpp synthetase gene. Mol Microbiol. 2009; 72(2):380–98. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2958.2009.06653.x PMID: 19298370

Traxler MF, Summers SM, Nguyen HT, Zacharia VM, Hightower GA, Smith JT, et al. The global, ppGpp-mediated stringent response to amino acid starvation in *Escherichia coli*. Mol Microbiol. 2008; 68(5):1128–48. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2958.2008.06229.x PMID: 18430135

Bowden SD, Eyres A, Chung JC, Monson RE, Thompson A, Salmond GP, et al. Virulence in *Pectobacterium atrosepticum* is regulated by a coincidence circuit involving quorum sensing and the stress alarmone, (p)ppGpp. Mol Microbiol. 2013; 90(3):457–71. doi: 10.1111/mmi.12369 PMID: 23957692

Chatnaparat T, Li Z, Korban SS, Zhao Y. The bacterial alarmone (p)ppGpp is required for virulence of *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. tomato and its survival on tomato. Mol Plant Microbe Interact. 2015. doi: 10.1094/MPMI-11-14-0378-R PMID: 25675257

Dalebroux ZD, Svensson SL, Gaynor EC, Swanson MS. ppGpp conjures bacterial virulence. Microbiol Mol Biol Rev. 2010; 74(2):171–99. doi: 10.1128/MMBR.00046-09 PMID: 20508246

Lone AG, Deslandes V, Nash JH, Jacques M, MacInnes JI. (p)ppGpp Affect *Actinobacillus pleuropneumoniae* Proteome. J Biol Chem. 2003; 278(2):968–74. doi: 10.1074/jbc.M209881200 PMID: 12421813