Association between common polymorphisms in IL-1 and TNFα and risk of peri-implant disease: A meta-analysis

Qiuchen Jin*, Fangjun Teng*, Zhigang Cheng

Department of Stomatolgy, The Central Hospital of Wuhan, Tongji Medical College, Huazhong University of Science and Technology, Wuhan, China

* These authors contributed equally to this work.
* czgar068@126.com

Abstract

Background
Pro-inflammatory cytokines interleukin-1 (IL-1) and tumor necrosis factor α (TNFα) play important roles in host immune response and bone metabolism during dental implant osseointegration. Whether the functional polymorphisms in IL-1α, IL-1β and TNFα were associated with peri-implant disease was unclear, and we performed the present meta-analysis for this purpose.

Methods
Eligible studies investigating IL-1α C-889T, IL-1β C+3954T and C-511T, TNFα G-308A, composite genotype of IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T for association with peri-implant disease, including peri-implantitis (PI), marginal bone loss (MBL) and implant failure/loss (IF/IL), were searched on several literature databases prior to April 30, 2021. Odds ratio (OR) and corresponding 95% confidence interval (CI) were calculated for each polymorphism in different genetic models and for composite genotype comparing carriers to non-carriers.

Results
Twenty-seven studies (1324 cases with peri-implant disease and 1808 controls with healthy implants) were included. There was significant correlation between IL-1α C-889T and peri-implant disease in all genetic models. IL-1β C+3954T was associated with peri-implant disease risk in allelic (OR = 1.66, 95%CI 1.17–2.35, p = 0.004) and dominant model (OR = 1.74, 95%CI 1.19–2.53, p = 0.004), and in subgroups of Asians, Caucasians, non-smokers, IF/IL and PI. TT genotype of IL-1β C-511T increased the risk of peri-implant disease (OR = 1.68, 95%CI 1.15–2.43, p = 0.007) and MBL (OR = 4.33, 95%CI 1.72–10.9, p = 0.002) compared to CC+CT genotypes. We did not observed a significant association between TNFα G-308A and peri-implant diseases in overall or subgroups analysis. Carriers of positive composite genotype of IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T had 1.95-fold (95%CI 1.35–2.80,
p<0.001) risk of peri-implant disease and 1.76-fold (95% CI 1.05–2.95, p = 0.032) risk of IF/IL than non-carriers.

**Conclusion**

Functional polymorphisms of IL-1α (C-889T), IL-1β (C+3954T, C-511T) and composite genotype of IL-1 can be used as predictive markers for peri-implant disease, whereas TNFα G-308A polymorphism was not associated with peri-implant disease.

**Introduction**

Dental implants have been widely used as an effective treatment for edentulous patients with an increasing success rate and 10-year survival rate of dental implants in recent years [1,2]. However, implant failure still occurs in around 1.9~3.6% of dental-implant subjects [3]. Multiple factors, such as peri-implant complications, smoking behavior, implant technique and material, systemic medical condition of patients, play important roles in implant failure [4–6]. Among these factors, peri-implant disease, including peri-implantitis, marginal bone loss and implant loosening, are common biological complications in implant failure [7]. Peri-implantitis is triggered by bacterium infection and found in almost one-third of patients and one-fifth of all implants after 2-year follow-up [8]. The inflammatory process disrupts the function of soft tissue and supporting bone tissue around osseointegrated oral implants, results in progressive bone loss, and finally causes implant loss or implant failure [9].

A clusterization phenomenon has been observed that over half of the overall implant failures occurred in only one-third of all patients [10], indicating an individual susceptibility to implant failure. The endogenous predisposition may be mediated by host innate immune response to bacterium infection and implants, which subsequently influences individual’s susceptibility to peri-implant disease [11].

Implants may stimulate macrophages to release interleukin-1 (IL-1) and tumor necrosis factor α (TNFα) which are known strong pro-inflammatory cytokines [12]. In physiological situations, moderate expression of IL-1 and TNFα is required for the maintenance of low-grade inflammation and normal implant osseointegration [13]. However, excessive production of these mediators may trigger stronger inflammation response, disrupt the balance of bone resorption required for dental implant osseointegration, and finally elevate the risk of peri-implantitis and implant failure [13]. This is supported by the findings that significantly higher levels of IL-1β and TNFα in the peri-implant crevicular fluid (PICF) are observed in patients with peri-implantitis than in healthy controls [14]. Thus, IL-1 and TNFα, two crucial pro-inflammatory cytokines mediating the inflammation process of peri-implantitis, are potential predictive markers for development of peri-implant disease.

The expression of IL-1 and TNFα may be regulated by several functionally relevant polymorphisms, including IL-1α C-889T (rs1800587), IL-1β C+3954T (formally C+3953T, rs1143634) and C-511T (rs16944), and TNFα G-308A (rs1800629). The mutant alleles of these polymorphisms were found to increase the transcriptional activity of corresponding genes, resulting in overexpression of pro-inflammatory cytokines [11]. For example, a 1.23-fold increase in transcriptional activity of IL-1α rs1800587 TT genotype was found over the CC genotype [15]. The serum level of IL-1β was significantly higher in carriers of rs16944 TT genotype than those of CC genotype [16]. The -308A allele transcript of TNFα had 2-fold greater level of transcriptional activity than -308G transcript [17]. In total, these
polymorphisms may modify the expression and production of IL-1 and TNFα, affect host immune response and susceptibility to inflammatory diseases. Previous studies demonstrated that TNFα G-308A [18,19], IL-1α C-889T [20] and IL-1β C+3954T [21] polymorphisms were associated with risk of chronic periodontitis. The association between these polymorphisms with susceptibility to implant failure, marginal bone loss and peri-implantitis have also been widely explored, which, however, yielded inconsistent results [22–24]. Most of these studies had a relatively small sample size and thus had insufficient statistic power to detect the genetic associations. Therefore, we performed a systematic review and meta-analysis, by quantitively synthesizing previous studies, for the association of common functional polymorphisms in IL-1 and TNFα with susceptibility to peri-implant disease.

Methods

Literature search strategy

We performed the present meta-analysis in accordance with Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analysis (PRISMA 2020) statement [25] (S1 Table). Literature databases including PubMed, EMBASE, Web of Science, Google Scholar, Chinese National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI), Wanfang and Chinese Biomedical Literature Database (CBM) were searched for candidate studies related to our research topic from inception to April 30, 2021. Since literature search in Google scholar yielded a large number of unrelated articles, we only identified the first 200 records, which were sorted by relevance, for eligibility for meta-analysis. The following terms and their combinations were used: “dental implant”, “implant loss”, “peri-implant bone loss”, “peri-implantitis”, “peri-implant disease”, “marginal bone loss”, “MBL” AND “interleukin”, “tumor necrosis factor”, “IL-1”, “TNF” AND “polymorphism”, “variant”, “SNP”, “variation”. The detailed search strategy and search result for each database were listed in S2 Table. Additional candidate studies were obtained by manually reviewing the reference list of eligible studies included in the meta-analysis.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria

Eligible studies should comply with these criteria: (1) Patients had one of the following peri-implant disease, including implant failure/loss (IF/IL), marginal bone loss (MBL) and peri-implantitis (PI), after dental implants while controls had successful or healthy implants; (2) Polymorphisms in IL-1α (C-889T, rs1800587), IL-1β (C+3954T, rs1143634; C-511T, rs16944), TNFα (G-308A, rs1800629), and composite IL-1 genotype (variant allele at both IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T sites) were studied; (3) Genotype and/or allele distributions of polymorphisms in both groups were provided. Reviews, case reports and studies without sufficient genotype data for meta-analysis were excluded. For studies with duplicated samples, the most recent one was included. Since the controls were those who also had dental implants due to various dental diseases, they were not healthy controls representing the general population. Thus, Hardy-Weinberg Equilibrium (HWE) was not required for the control group.

Quality assessment

We assessed the quality of included studies by using Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) for case-control study. Eight items with regard to “selection”, “comparability” and “exposure” categories were evaluated and a total of 9 stars were assigned. Any study with 7 or more stars according to NOS was considered as high-quality study.
Data extraction

Two independent researchers extracted the following information of each study: first author, publication year, country, ethnicity, peri-implant condition, mean age, percent of smokers, genotyping method, sample size, genotype and allele distributions in both groups. Discrepancies, if occurred, were resolved by a third researcher.

Statistical analysis

The meta-analysis was performed by using STATA 14.0 (StataCorp, TX, US). Between-study heterogeneity was assessed by \( I^2 \) and Q test. \( I^2 < 50\% \) and \( p \) value for Q test \( > 0.10 \) indicated no obvious heterogeneity, and a fixed-effect model was used for quantitative synthesis analysis. Otherwise, a random-effect model was used since there was substantial heterogeneity. For each polymorphism, the odds ratio (OR) and 95% confidence interval (95%CI) were calculated to assess its association strength with risk of peri-implant disease in four comparison models: allelic (variant allele vs. wildtype allele), dominant (homozygous + heterozygous variant vs. homozygous wildtype), recessive (homozygous variant vs. homozygous + heterozygous wildtype) and homozygote model (homozygous variant vs. homozygous wildtype). For the composite genotype of IL-1\( \alpha \) C-889T and IL-1\( \beta \) C+3954T, the OR for carriers vs. non-carriers were calculated. Subgroup analyses stratified by ethnicity (Asians, Caucasians), smoking status (non-smokers), peri-implant conditions (IF/IL, MBL, PI) were performed. Sensitivity analysis was also conducted by omitting one study at a time followed by pooling together the others. Publication bias was assessed by viewing the symmetry of funnel plot and Egger’s test. A \( p \) value \( < 0.05 \) was considered as statistical significance.

Results

Description of eligible studies

As shown by the flow diagram of literature search (Fig 1), a total of 27 studies with 1324 cases and 1808 controls were finally included in meta-analysis [22–24,26–49]. There were 10, 3 and 13 studies recruiting patients with IF/IL, MBL and PI, respectively, while Fernandes et al [29] enrolled participants with various peri-implant disease. Six studies included participants of Asian ancestry while the others included subjects of Caucasian ancestry. Three studies were published in Chinese language [47–49] and the others were in English. The sample size ranged from 28 to 369. As to smoking status, 3 studies reported higher smoking rates in peri-implantitis group than healthy implant group [28,43,47], 7 enrolled participants matched for smoking status [27,32,33,36,39,40,45], 9 were performed in non-smokers [24,26,31,35,37,38,41,44,48] and 1 in smokers [30], whereas 7 did not report the smoking status [22,23,29,34,42,46,49]. IL-1\( \alpha \) C-889T polymorphism was investigated in 10 studies, IL-1\( \beta \) C+3954T in 14 studies, IL-1\( \beta \) C-511T in 8 studies, TNF\( \alpha \) G-308A in 12 studies, and composite genotype of IL-1\( \alpha \) C-889T and IL-1\( \beta \) C+3954T in 7 studies. All studies were of high quality as they were awarded with 7 or more stars according to NOS. The characteristics of all eligible studies were summarized in Table 1, and the genotype data of each polymorphism was listed in S3–S7 Tables.

IL-1\( \alpha \) C-889T polymorphism

The association between IL-1\( \alpha \) C-889T and risk of peri-implant disease were investigated by 10 studies with 422 cases and 475 controls (Table 2). Meta-analysis using a fixed-effect model demonstrated that C-889T was associated with increased risk of peri-implant disease (T vs C: OR = 1.54, 95%CI 1.22–1.93, \( p < 0.001 \); TT+CT vs CC: OR = 1.63, 95%CI 1.23–2.17, \( p = 0.001 \);
TT vs CC+CT: OR = 1.65, 95%CI 1.03–2.65, p = 0.036; TT vs CC: OR = 1.92, 95%CI 1.18–3.10, p = 0.008; Fig 2). Carriers of TT or CT genotypes had higher risk of peri-implant disease in Asian populations (OR = 1.96, 95%CI 1.26–3.05, p = 0.008; Fig 2) and were more vulnerable to IF/IL (OR = 1.73, 95%CI 1.03–2.89, p = 0.037) compared with carriers of CC genotype.
IL-1β C+3954T polymorphism

Fourteen eligible studies comprising 628 cases and 821 controls were incorporated (Table 3). Overall analysis showed significant correlation between IL-1β C+3954T and peri-implant disease risk.
Table 2. Association between IL-1α C-899T polymorphism and susceptibility to peri-implant disease.

| Subgroup      | Allele model, T vs C | Dominant model, TT+CT vs CC | Recessive model, TT vs CC+CT | Homozygote model, TT vs CC |
|---------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
|               | No | OR (95%CI) | p   | I² (%) | No | OR (95%CI) | p | I² (%) | No | OR (95%CI) | p | I² (%) | No | OR (95%CI) | p | I² (%) |
| Overall       | 8  | 1.54 (1.22–1.93) | <0.001 | 38.9 | 10 | 1.63 (1.23–2.17) | 0.001 | 7.3 | 7  | 1.65 (1.03–2.65) | 0.036 | 3.2 | 7  | 1.92 (1.18–3.10) | 0.008 | 1.9 |
| Ethnicity     |    |            |         |      |    |            |      |     |    |            |      |     |    |            |      |     |
| Asian         | 3  | 1.59 (0.85–2.94) | 0.138 | 50.7 | 3  | 1.96 (1.26–3.05) | 0.003 | 25.0 | 2  | 2.25 (1.24–4.10) | 0.008 | 0  | 2  | 2.47 (1.33–4.59) | 0.003 | 0  |
| Caucasian     | 5  | 1.28 (0.93–1.76) | 0.134 | 16.0 | 7  | 1.44 (1.00–2.08) | 0.053 | 0  | 5  | 0.96 (0.43–2.12) | 0.915 | 0  | 5  | 1.17 (0.51–2.65) | 0.715 | 2.0 |
| Non-smokers   | 2  | 1.59 (0.70–3.60) | 0.264 | 73.1 | 2  | 1.70 (0.73–3.98) | 0.220 | 59.0 | 2  | 1.93 (1.11–3.37) | 0.020 | 7.9 | 2  | 2.14 (1.22–3.77) | 0.008 | 24.9 |
| Condition     |    |            |         |      |    |            |      |     |    |            |      |     |    |            |      |     |
| IF/IL         | 4  | 1.43 (0.96–2.13) | 0.077 | 23.5 | 4  | 1.73 (1.03–2.89) | 0.037 | 0  | 4  | 1.16 (0.47–2.81) | 0.751 | 0  | 4  | 1.42 (0.57–3.55) | 0.453 | 6.7 |
| MBL           | 2  | 1.05 (0.54–2.03) | 0.894 | 0    | 2  | 0.96 (0.36–2.53) | 0.933 | 0  | 1  | -          |      | -  | -  | -          |      | -  |
| PI            | 2  | 1.57 (0.73–3.38) | 0.246 | 81.2 | 3  | 1.39 (0.67–2.87) | 0.374 | 64.2 | 2  | 1.26 (0.28–5.61) | 0.761 | 62.2 | 2  | 1.49 (0.36–6.17) | 0.580 | 56.9 |

IF/IL: Implant failure/loss; MBL: Marginal bone loss; PI: Peri-implantitis; No: Number of studies; OR: Odds ratio.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0258138.t002

Fig 2. Forest plots of IL-1α C-889T polymorphism with peri-implant disease risk in allelic (A), dominant (B), recessive (C) and homozygote model (D).

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0258138.g002
disease (T vs C: OR = 1.66, 95%CI 1.17–2.35, p = 0.004, random-effect model; TT+CT vs CC: OR = 1.74, 95%CI 1.19–2.53, p = 0.004, random-effect model; TT vs CC: OR = 1.74, 95%CI 1.13–2.67, p = 0.012; Fig 3). Significant associations were also found in subgroups of Asians, Caucasians, non-smokers, IF/IL and PI.

**IL-1β C-511T polymorphism**

Meta-analysis pooling 8 studies with 317 cases and 415 controls together showed that TT genotype of IL-1β C-511T polymorphism conferred significantly higher risk to peri-implant disease (TT vs CC+CT: OR = 1.53, 95%CI 1.15–2.43, p = 0.007) while T allele and TT+CT genotypes were not associated with disease risk (Table 4, Fig 4). Subgroup analysis suggested that IL-1β C-511T was associated with risk of MBL in allelic (OR = 2.25, 95%CI 1.27–4.01), recessive (OR = 4.33, 95%CI 1.72–10.9) and homozygote (OR = 4.06, 95%CI 1.31–12.6) models.

**TNFα G-308A polymorphism**

As shown in Table 5, overall analysis incorporating 12 eligible studies with 748 cases and 990 controls demonstrated that TNFα G-308A was not associated with risk of peri-implant disease in all comparison models (Fig 5). Moreover, there were no significant correlations in subgroup analyses stratified by ethnicity, smoking status and peri-implant conditions.

**Composite genotype of IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T**

Seven studies comprising 241 cases and 283 controls were included, which were all of Caucasian ancestry. Carriers of composite genotype of IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T had a higher risk of peri-implant disease (OR = 1.95, 95%CI 1.35–2.80, p < 0.001, Fig 6) and IF/IL (OR = 1.76, 95%CI 1.05–2.95, p = 0.032, I² = 0) than non-carriers using a fixed-effect model. The composite genotype was not associated with peri-implantitis (OR = 2.31, 95%CI 0.65–8.16, p = 0.195, I² = 72.2%).

---

**Table 3. Association between IL-1β C+3954T polymorphism and susceptibility to peri-implant disease.**

| Subgroup | Allele model, T vs C | Dominant model, TT+CT vs CC | Recessive model, TT vs CC+CT | Homozygote model, TT vs CC |
|----------|----------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
|          | No | OR (95%CI) | p     | I² (%) | No | OR (95%CI) | p     | I² (%) | No | OR (95%CI) | p     | I² (%) |
| Overall  | 12 | 1.66 (1.17–2.35) | 0.004 | 54.2  | 14 | 1.74 (1.19–2.53) | 0.004 | 49.0  | 9  | 1.51 (0.99–2.30) | 0.056 | 8.9  | 9  | 1.74 (1.13–2.67) | 0.012 | 18.5 |
| Ethnicity |     |                        |       |       |                    |       |       |       |                     |       |       |                     |
| Asian    | 4  | 1.81 (1.29–2.54) | 0.001 | 0     | 4  | 1.84 (1.20–2.82) | 0.005 | 6.1   | 1  | - | - | - | 1 | - | - | - |
| Caucasian | 8  | 1.68 (1.05–2.68) | 0.030 | 66.1  | 10 | 1.80 (1.11–2.90) | 0.016 | 58.9  | 8  | 1.31 (0.70–2.46) | 0.397 | 14.6 | 8  | 1.56 (0.83–2.96) | 0.169 | 18.5 |
| Non-smokers | 4  | 1.70 (1.25–2.31) | 0.001 | 0     | 4  | 1.73 (1.16–2.56) | 0.007 | 4.1   | 3  | 1.68 (1.00–2.83) | 0.052 | 0     | 3  | 1.92 (1.12–3.28) | 0.017 | 0   |
| Condition |     |                        |       |       |                    |       |       |       |                     |       |       |                     |
| IF/IL    | 5  | 1.32 (0.98–1.78) | 0.070 | 42.5  | 5  | 1.45 (1.01–2.09) | 0.044 | 40.3  | 5  | 1.21 (0.51–2.88) | 0.667 | 0     | 5  | 1.41 (0.59–3.35) | 0.443 | 2.5 |
| MBL      | 2  | 2.33 (0.67–8.05) | 0.182 | 33.5  | 2  | 2.45 (0.69–8.74) | 0.168 | 39.4  | 0  | - | - | - | 0 | - | - | - |
| PI       | 5  | 1.87 (1.04–3.36) | 0.038 | 69.5  | 6  | 1.59 (0.85–2.98) | 0.149 | 64.6  | 4  | 1.61 (1.00–2.62) | 0.052 | 41.7  | 4  | 1.86 (1.13–3.05) | 0.014 | 46.2 |

IF/IL: Implant failure/loss; MBL: Marginal bone loss; PI: Peri-implantitis; No: Number of studies; OR: Odds ratio.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0258138.t003
Sensitivity analysis

Sensitivity analysis demonstrated that the pooled association of IL-1α C-889T with peri-implant disease was significantly affected by the study of He et al [26]. When we excluded this study, IL-1α C-889T was no longer associated with risk of peri-implant disease in all comparison models (T vs C: OR = 1.23, 95%CI 0.92–1.64, p = 0.160; TT+CT vs CC: OR = 1.37, 95%CI 0.97–1.92, p = 0.075; TT vs CC+CT: OR = 1.06, 95%CI 0.49–2.26, p = 0.889; TT vs CC: OR = 1.27, 95%CI 0.58–2.78, p = 0.557) by using a fixed-effect model (I² = 0).

Publication bias

The funnel plots of all polymorphisms under various comparison models were symmetric, and p values of Egger’s test were all >0.05 (S8 Table), indicating that there was no evidence of obvious publication bias.

Discussion

The present meta-analysis, by incorporating 3132 dental implant patients from 27 studies, demonstrated that functional polymorphisms in genes encoding pro-inflammatory IL-1α (C-889T, rs1800587), IL-1β (C+3954T, rs1143634; C-511T, rs16944) and the composite genotype...
Table 4. Association between IL-1β C-511T polymorphism and susceptibility to peri-implant disease.

| Subgroup            | Allele model, T vs C | Dominant model, TT+CT vs CC | Recessive model, TT vs CC+CT | Homozygote model, TT vs CC |
|---------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
|                     | No | OR (95%CI) | p  | I² (%) | No | OR (95%CI) | p  | I² (%) | No | OR (95%CI) | p  | I² (%) |
| Overall             | 8  | 1.21 (0.97–1.49) | 0.086 | 11.9 | 8  | 1.03 (0.75–1.43) | 0.840 | 0 | 8  | 1.68 (1.15–2.43) | 0.007 | 0 | 8  | 1.53 (0.99–2.36) | 0.056 | 0 |
| Ethnicity           |    |            |    |        |    |            |    |    |    |            |    |        |    |            |    |        |
| Asian               | 3  | 1.48 (1.00–2.19) | 0.053 | 49.9 | 3  | 1.23 (0.63–2.40) | 0.542 | 0 | 3  | 2.55 (0.95–6.83) | 0.062 | 50.8 | 3  | 2.1 (0.94–4.70) | 0.079 | 29.9 |
| Caucasian           | 5  | 1.11 (0.86–1.43) | 0.429 | 0 | 5  | 0.98 (0.68–1.42) | 0.914 | 0 | 5  | 1.42 (0.90–2.26) | 0.133 | 0 | 5  | 1.34 (0.79–2.24) | 0.275 | 0 |
| Non-smokers         | 3  | 0.96 (0.65–1.42) | 0.847 | 0 | 3  | 0.79 (0.42–1.45) | 0.429 | 0 | 3  | 1.21 (0.60–2.42) | 0.599 | 0 | 3  | 0.98 (0.43–2.23) | 0.961 | 0 |
| Condition           |    |            |    |        |    |            |    |    |    |            |    |        |    |            |    |        |
| IF/IL               | 3  | 1.13 (0.83–1.53) | 0.442 | 23.5 | 3  | 0.98 (0.63–1.54) | 0.940 | 28.2 | 3  | 1.43 (0.84–2.41) | 0.183 | 0 | 3  | 1.33 (0.73–2.41) | 0.348 | 0 |
| MBL                 | 2  | 2.25 (1.27–4.01) | 0.006 | 0 | 2  | 1.68 (0.65–4.39) | 0.281 | 0 | 2  | 4.33 (1.72–10.9) | 0.002 | 0 | 2  | 4.06 (1.31–12.6) | 0.015 | 0 |
| PI                  | 3  | 1.04 (0.73–1.49) | 0.832 | 0 | 3  | 0.95 (0.55–1.62) | 0.839 | 0 | 3  | 1.26 (0.64–2.50) | 0.505 | 0 | 3  | 1.19 (0.54–2.63) | 0.673 | 0 |

IF/IL: Implant failure/loss; MBL: Marginal bone loss; PI: Peri-implantitis; No: Number of studies; OR: Odds ratio.
Table 5. Association between TNFα G-308A polymorphism and susceptibility to peri-implant disease.

| Subgroup | Allele model, A vs G | Dominant model, AA+GA vs GG | Recessive model, AA vs GG+GA | Homozygote model, AA vs GG |
|----------|----------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
|          | OR (95%CI) p |
| Overall  | 10 | 1.32 (0.81–2.14) 0.267 81.9 | 12 | 1.76 (0.90–3.42) 0.098 84.5 | 9 | 1.11 (0.77–1.60) 0.569 0 | 9 | 1.09 (0.72–1.67) 0.672 0 |
| Ethnicity| Asian | 2 | 1.03 (0.50–2.10) 0.928 82.4 | 3 | 1.15 (0.40–3.30) 0.793 80.7 | 2 | 1.25 (0.78–2.02) 0.350 0 | 2 | 0.99 (0.37–2.66) 0.978 72.4 |
|          | Caucasian | 8 | 1.42 (0.76–2.60) 0.271 80.8 | 9 | 2.02 (0.93–4.39) 0.076 81.8 | 7 | 0.94 (0.53–1.65) 0.819 0 | 7 | 1.27 (0.61–2.65) 0.527 0 |
|          | Non-smokers | 5 | 1.81 (0.86–3.81) 0.116 80.6 | 5 | 1.96 (0.70–5.45) 0.198 86.0 | 4 | 1.50 (0.83–2.70) 0.176 0 | 4 | 1.68 (0.93–3.03) 0.087 0 |
| Condition| IF/IL | 4 | 1.16 (0.78–1.70) 0.464 12.7 | 4 | 1.20 (0.75–1.91) 0.439 26.0 | 3 | 1.39 (0.36–5.39) 0.631 0 | 3 | 1.63 (0.41–6.40) 0.484 0 |
|          | MBL | 0 | - - - - - | 1 | - - - - - | 0 | - - - - - | 0 | - - - - - |
|          | PI | 6 | 1.46 (0.72–2.96) 0.288 89.0 | 7 | 1.93 (0.73–5.13) 0.186 90.3 | 6 | 1.09 (0.75–1.59) 0.645 0 | 6 | 1.05 (0.68–1.64) 0.818 11.3 |

IF/IL: Implant failure/loss; MBL: Marginal bone loss; PI: Peri-implantitis; No: Number of studies; OR: Odds ratio.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0258138.t005
of the polymorphic sites were associated with susceptibility to peri-implant disease. However, the meta-analysis did not reveal an association between the functional polymorphism in another pro-inflammatory gene TNFα (G-308A, rs1800629) and the disease risk.

IL-1 is a pivotal inflammatory cytokine mediating immune response and bone metabolism in dental implants [50]. It plays a crucial role in osseointegration process by stimulating the production of prostaglandins (e.g. prostaglandin E2) associated with enhanced bone resorption as well as the production of matrix metalloproteinases (MMPs) that augment collagen degradation [51]. IL-1α and IL-1β are the most studied members of IL-1. PICF level of IL-1β was significantly elevated in peri-implantitis sites than in healthy implant sites [52]. Functional experiments showed that T alleles of IL-1α -889 site, IL-1β +3954 and -511 sites increased the transcriptional activity of corresponding genes [11], suggesting that they were risk alleles of peri-implant disease. A previous meta-analysis pooling together 13 eligible studies found that IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T were not associated with peri-implant disease [53]. On the contrary, the present meta-analysis, which included more recent studies and had the largest sample size, demonstrated that both polymorphisms were predictive markers for peri-implant disease. We also found positive associations of these polymorphisms with implant failure/loss and peri-implantitis. Moreover, our analysis yielded additional findings that TT genotype of IL-1β C-511T increased the risk of peri-implant disease and the polymorphism was a potential marker for marginal bone loss. Overall, the present meta-analysis provides new evidence for the predictive value of IL-1 gene functional polymorphisms in peri-implant diseases.

In addition to the genetic association of individual variant, we also investigated the composite genotype of IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T variants. Patients with risk alleles at both IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T sites had 1.95-fold risk of peri-implant disease and 1.76-fold risk of implant failure/loss than non-carriers. The effect size magnitude of composite genotype was larger than that of a single variant in dominant model.

Different from the mechanism of IL-1, TNFα stimulates bone resorption directly by promoting the differentiation and maturation of osteoclasts and enhancing their resorptive activity, or indirectly through interaction with receptor activation nuclear factor kappa-B (RANK) and its ligand (RANKL) [54]. The promoter G-308A polymorphism strongly modulates the transcriptional activity of TNF-α, of which the -308A allelic form has up to five-fold transcription level than the -308G form [16,55]. Increased production of TNF-α may trigger excessive osteoclastic bone resorption and promote the development of inflammatory bone diseases, such as rheumatoid arthritis and periodontal disease [54]. AA genotype of G-308A site was found to be associated with increased chronic and aggressive periodontitis risk [56]. Previous studies revealed that TNF-α level was significantly higher in PISF from peri-implantitis sites.
than that in healthy peri-implant tissue [57,58], indicating that TNF-α may be involved in the development of peri-implant disease. In two case-control studies, TNF-α G-308A polymorphism was associated with increased risk of peri-implantitis in dominant model (AA+GA vs GG), which was still significant after adjustment for smoking and positive history of periodontitis [28,31]. However, the other studies failed in finding positive relationship, and our meta-analysis revealed no significant association of G-308A with peri-implant disease or subgroups of IF/IL and peri-implantitis. The results of our meta-analysis incorporating more eligible studies was consistent with a previous one [59]. Whether TNF-α is absolutely required for osteoclastogenesis and bone resorption during dental implant osseointegration is still in debate [54]. The pathogenic role of TNF-α and predictive value of its functional polymorphisms for peri-implant disease need further investigation.

Smoking status is a well-known risk indicator for peri-implant disease [60]. Smoking and positive IL-1 genotype were found to have an synergistic effect resulting in more implant complications [61–63]. Thus, smoking status may be a confounding factor for the genetic associations. Only one study was performed in smokers, which showed no association between IL-1 polymorphisms and peri-implantitis [30]. We did not perform subgroup analysis of smokers due to insufficient data but conducted subgroup analysis in non-smokers for the first time. In non-smoking, dental implant patients, IL-1α C-899T and IL-1β C+3954T polymorphisms were both significantly associated with susceptibility to peri-implant disease, implying an independent role of these polymorphisms in the development of peri-implant disease.

Periodontitis is another risk factor of peri-implant disease [64]. The unbalanced distribution of periodontitis history between peri-implant disease and healthy implant groups may bias the genetic association. In three studies included in our meta-analysis, significantly higher rate of periodontitis history was found in patients with peri-implantitis compared to those with healthy implant [26,28,30]. Sensitivity analysis revealed that IL-1α C-889T was no longer associated with peri-implant disease risk after excluding the study of He et al [26].

Some limitations of our meta-analysis should be addressed. Firstly, our meta-analysis only provided overall estimates and subgroup analyses stratified by ethnicity and peri-disease condition, while the other confounding factors, such as history of periodontitis, smoking behavior and oral hygiene, were not taken into account because of unavailable data. Pooling analysis of patient-level data for confounding factors and genotypes will make it possible to explore the gene-environment interactions and shed light on the independent role of a single polymorphism in the development of peri-implant disease. Secondly, the term peri-implant disease is a heterogenous condition including several dental implant complications, each of which may have different pathogenic mechanism and is clinically defined under various inclusion/exclusion criteria between studies. This may contribute to the heterogeneity of our meta-analysis and the overall association estimates should be cautiously interpreted. Thirdly, the sample size was still relatively small, especially for analysis of IL-1α C-889T, IL-1β C-511T and composite genotype of IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T. More large-scale, prospective cohort studies are warranted in the future.

In conclusion, the present meta-analysis with the largest sample size demonstrates that IL-1α C-889T, IL-1β C+3954T and C-511T, and composite genotype of IL-1α C-889T and IL-1β C+3954T, but not TNFα G-308A, are potential predictive markers of peri-implant disease.

Supporting information
S1 Table. PRISMA 2020 checklist.
(DOCX)
S2 Table. Detailed search strategy.

(DOCX)

S3 Table. Genotype data for IL-1α C-899T in association with peri-implant disease.

(XLSX)

S4 Table. Genotype data for IL-1β C+3954T in association with peri-implant disease.

(XLSX)

S5 Table. Genotype data for IL-1β C-511T in association with peri-implant disease.

(XLSX)

S6 Table. Genotype data for TNFα G-308A in association with peri-implant disease.

(XLSX)

S7 Table. Composite genotype data of IL-1α C-899T and IL-1β C+3954T.

(XLSX)

S8 Table. Results of Egger’s test.

(DOCX)

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank Key Laboratory for Molecular Diagnosis of Hubei Province, The Central Hospital of Wuhan, Tongji Medical College, Huazhong University of Science and Technology.

Author Contributions

Conceptualization: Zhigang Cheng.

Data curation: Qiuchen Jin, Fangjun Teng.

Investigation: Qiuchen Jin, Fangjun Teng.

Supervision: Zhigang Cheng.

Writing – original draft: Qiuchen Jin, Fangjun Teng.

Writing – review & editing: Qiuchen Jin, Fangjun Teng, Zhigang Cheng.

References

1. Pjetursson BE, Thoma D, Jung R, Zwahlen M, Zembic A. A systematic review of the survival and complication rates of implant-supported fixed dental prostheses (FDPs) after a mean observation period of at least 5 years. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2012; 23 Suppl 6:22–38. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0501.2012.02546.x PMID: 23062125

2. Mertens C, Steveling HG, Stucce K, Pretzl B, Meyer-Baumr A. Fixed implant-retained rehabilitation of the edentulous maxilla: 11-year results of a prospective study. Clin Implant Dent Relat Res. 2012; 14(6):816–27. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1708-8208.2011.00434.x PMID: 22251485

3. Zhang F, Finkelstein J. The relationship between single nucleotide polymorphisms and dental implant loss: a scoping review. Clin Cosmet Investig Dent. 2019; 11:131–41. https://doi.org/10.2147/CCIDE.S207445 PMID: 31213926

4. Chappuis V, Avila-Ortiz G, Araujo MG, Monje A. Medication-related dental implant failure: Systematic review and meta-analysis. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2018; 29 Suppl 16:55–30. https://doi.org/10.1111/clar.13288 PMID: 30328197

5. Schimmel M, Srinivasan M, McKenna G, Muller F. Effect of advanced age and/or systemic medical conditions on dental implant survival and meta-analysis. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2018; 29 Suppl 16:311–30. https://doi.org/10.1111/clar.13288 PMID: 30328186
6. Hickin MP, Shariff JA, Jennette PJ, Finkelstein J, Papapanou PN. Incidence and Determinants of Dental Implant Failure: A Review of Electronic Health Records in a U.S. Dental School. J Dent Educ. 2017; 81(10):1233–42. https://doi.org/10.21815/JDE.017.080 PMID: 28966189

7. Dereka X, Mardas N, Chin S, Petrie A, Donos N. A systematic review on the association between genetic predisposition and dental implant biological complications. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2012; 23(7):775–88. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0501.2011.02329.x PMID: 22151432

8. Kordbacheh Changi K, Finkelstein J, Papapanou PN. Peri-implantitis prevalence, incidence rate, and risk factors: A study of electronic health records at a U.S. dental school. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2019; 30(4):306–14. https://doi.org/10.1111/clr.13416 PMID: 30768875

9. Roccuzzo A, Stahl I, Monje A, Sculean A, Salvi GE. Peri-Implantitis: A Clinical Update on Prevalence and Surgical Treatment Outcomes. J Clin Med. 2021; 10(5). https://doi.org/10.3390/jcm10051107 PMID: 33800894

10. Schwartz-Arad D, Laviv A, Levin L. Failure causes, timing, and cluster behavior: an 8-year study of dental implants. Implant Dent. 2008; 17(2):200–7. https://doi.org/10.1097/0b013e3181777906 PMID: 18545052

11. Eqquia Del Valle A, Lopez-Vicente J, Martinez-Conde R, Aguirre-Zorrano LA. Current understanding of genetic polymorphisms as biomarkers for risk of biological complications in implantology. J Clin Exp Dent. 2018; 10(10):e1029–e39. https://doi.org/10.4317/jced.55141 PMID: 30386510

12. Lasserre JF, Brecx MC, Toma S. Oral Microbes, Biofilms and Their Role in Periodontal and Peri-Implant Diseases. Materials (Basel). 2018; 11(10). https://doi.org/10.3390/ma11101802 PMID: 30248991

13. Chen X, Zhao Y. Genetic Involvement in Dental Implant Failure: Association With Polymorphisms of Genes Modulating Inflammatory Responses and Bone Metabolism. J Oral Implantol. 2019; 45(4):318–26. https://doi.org/10.1563/aoai-joi-D-18-00212 PMID: 31207194

14. Duarte PM, Serrao CR, Miranda TS, Zanatta LC, Bastos MF, Faveri M, et al. Could cytokine levels in the peri-implant crevicular fluid be used to distinguish between healthy implants and implants with peri-implantitis? A systematic review. J Periodontal Res. 2016; 51(6):689–98. https://doi.org/10.1111/jre.12354 PMID: 26774043

15. Dominici R, Cattaneo M, Malferrari G, Archi D, Mariani C, Grimaldi LM, et al. Cloning and functional analysis of the allelic polymorphism in the transcription regulatory region of interleukin-1 alpha. Immunogenetics. 2002; 54(2):82–6. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00251-002-0445-9 PMID: 12037600

16. Wang J, Shi YG, Wang GC, Dong SL, Yang DK, Zuo XX. The association between interleukin-1 gene cluster polymorphisms and their protein expression in Chinese Han patients with breast cancer. Mol Genet Genomic Med. 2019; 7(8):e804. https://doi.org/10.1002/mgg3.804 PMID: 31297985

17. Kroeger KM, Carville KS, Abraham LJ. The -308 tumor necrosis factor-alpha promoter polymorphism effects transcription. Mol Immunol. 1997; 34(5):97–106. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0161-5890(97)00052-7 PMID: 9293772

18. Shi LX, Zhang L, Zhang DL, Zhou JP, Jiang XJ, Jin YL, et al. Association between TNF-alpha G-308A (rs1800629) polymorphism and susceptibility to chronic periodontitis and type 2 diabetes mellitus: A meta-analysis. J Periodontal Res. 2021; 56(2):226–35. https://doi.org/10.1111/jre.12820 PMID: 33689092

19. XU L, Liu C, Zheng Y, Huang Y, Zhong Y, Zhao Z, et al. Association of TNF-alpha-308G/A, -238G/A, -1031T/C, -857C/T polymorphisms with periodontitis susceptibility: Evidence from a meta-analysis of 52 studies. Medicine (Baltimore). 2020; 99(36):e21851. https://doi.org/10.1097/MD.00000000000021851 PMID: 32899013

20. Feng X, Liu J. Association between IL-1A (-889C/T) polymorphism and susceptibility of chronic periodontitis: A meta-analysis. Gene. 2020; 729:144227. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gene.2019.144227 PMID: 31759990

21. da Silva FRP, Vasconcelos A, da Carvalho Franca LF, Di Lenardo D, Nascimento HMS, Vasconcelos DFP. Association between the rs1143634 polymorphism in interleukin-1B and chronic periodontitis: Results from a meta-analysis composed by 54 case/control studies. Genet. 2016; 688:97–106. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10733-016-0625-9 PMID: 27983069

22. Saremi L, Shafizadeh M, Esmaeilzadeh E, Ghaffari ME, Mahdavi MH, Amid R, et al. Assessment of IL-10, IL-1ss and TNF-alpha gene polymorphisms in patients with peri-implantitis and healthy controls. Mol Biol Rep. 2021; 48(3):2285–90. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11033-021-02653-9 PMID: 33689092

23. Vaz P, Gallas MM, Braga AC, Sampaio-Fernandes JC, Felino A, Tavares P. IL1 gene polymorphisms and unsuccessful dental implants. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2012; 23(12):1404–13. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0501.2011.02322.x PMID: 22092925

24. Campos MI, Santos MC, Treviño PC, Scarcel-Caminaga RM, Bezerra FJ, Line SR. Evaluation of the relationship between interleukin-1 gene cluster polymorphisms and early implant failure in non-smoking
patients. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2005; 16(2):194–201. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0501.2004.01091.x PMID: 15777329

25. Page MJ, McKenzie JE, Bossuyt PM, Boutron I, Hoffmann TC, Mulrow CD, et al. The PRISMA 2020 statement: an updated guideline for reporting systematic reviews. BMJ. 2021; 372:n71. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.n71 PMID: 33782057

26. He K, Jian F, He T, Tang H, Huang B, Wei N. Analysis of the association of TNF-α, IL-1α, and IL-1β polymorphisms with peri-implantitis in a Chinese non-smoking population. Clin Oral Investig. 2020; 24(2):693–9. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00784-019-02968-z PMID: 31127430

27. Broker RC, Doetzer AD, de Souza CM, Alvim-Pereira F, Alvim-Pereira CC, Trelivatto PC. Clinical aspects and polymorphisms in the LTA, TNFA, LTB genes and association with dental implant loss. Clin Implant Dent Relat Res. 2018; 20(6):954–61. https://doi.org/10.1111/cid.12677 PMID: 30334603

28. Petkovic-Curcin A, Zeljic K, Cikota-Aleksic B, Dakovic D, Tatic Z, Magic Z. Association of Cytokine Gene Polymorphism with Peri-implantitis Risk. Int J Oral Maxillofac Implants. 2017; 32(5):e241–e8. https://doi.org/10.11607/jomi.5814 PMID: 28906511

29. Sampaio Fernandes M, Vaz P, Braga AC, Sampaio Fernandes JC, Figueirai MH. The role of IL-1 gene polymorphisms (IL1A, IL1B, and IL1RN) as a risk factor in unsuccessful implants retaining overdentures. J Prosthodont Res. 2017; 61(4):439–49. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpro.2017.01.004 PMID: 28223139

30. Garcia-Delaney C, Sanchez-Garces MA, Figueiredo R, Sanchez-Torres A, Gay-Escoda C. Clinical significance of interleukin-1 genotype in smoking patients as a predictor of peri-implantitis: A case-control study. Med Oral Patol Oral Cir Bucal. 2015; 20(6):e737–43. https://doi.org/10.4317/medoral.20655 PMID: 26448434

31. Rakic M, Petkovic-Curcin A, Struijilxou X, Matic S, Stamatovic N, Vojvodic D. CD14 and TNFα single nucleotide polymorphisms are candidates for genetic biomarkers of peri-implantitis. Clin Oral Investig. 2015; 19(4):791–801. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00784-014-1313-3 PMID: 25217276

32. Cosyn J, Christiaens V, Koningsveld V, Coucke PJ, De Coster P, De Paepe A, et al. An Exploratory Case-Control Study on the Impact of IL-1 Gene Polymorphisms on Early Implant Failure. Clin Implant Dent Relat Res. 2016; 18(2):234–40. https://doi.org/10.1111/cid.12237 PMID: 25066406

33. Jacobi-Gresser E, Huesker K, Schutt S. Genetic and immunological markers predict titanium implant failure: a retrospective study. Int J Oral Maxillofac Surg. 2013; 42(4):537–43. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijom.2012.07.018 PMID: 22925444

34. Guroi C, Kazazoglu E, Dabakoglu B, Korachi M. A comparative study of the role of cytokine polymorphisms interleukin-10 and tumor necrosis factor alpha in susceptibility to implant failure and chronic periodontitis. Int J Oral Maxillofac Implants. 2011; 26(5):955–60. PMID: 22010076

35. Melo RF, Lopes BM, Shiblli JA, Marcantonio E Jr., Marcantonio RA, Galli GM. Interleukin-1beta and interleukin-6 expression and gene polymorphisms in subjects with peri-implant disease. Clin Implant Dent Relat Res. 2012; 14(6):905–14. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1708-8208.2010.00325.x PMID: 21414132

36. Dirschnabel AJ, Alvim-Pereira F, Alvim-Pereira CC, Bernardino JF, Rosa EA, Trelivatto PC. Analysis of the association of IL1B(C-511T) polymorphism with dental implant loss and the clustering phenomenon. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2011; 22(11):1235–41. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0501.2010.02080.x PMID: 21251078

37. Hamdy AA, Ebrahem MA. The effect of interleukin-1 allele 2 genotype (IL-1a(-889) and IL-1b(+3954)) on the individual’s susceptibility to peri-implantitis: case-control study. J Oral Implantol. 2011; 37(3):325–34. https://doi.org/10.1563/AAD-JOI-D-09-00117.1 PMID: 20594066

38. Cury PR, Horewicz VV, Ferrari DS, Brito R Jr., Sendyk WR, Duarte PM, et al. Evaluation of the effect of tumor necrosis factor-alpha genotype polymorphism on the risk of peri-implant disease. Int J Oral Maxillofac Implants. 2005; 20(6):1101–5. PMID: 20162115

39. Montes CC, Alvim-Pereira F, de Castilhos BB, Sakurai ML, Olandoski M, Trelivatto PC. Analysis of the association of IL1B (C-3954T) and IL1RN (intron 2) polymorphisms with dental implant loss in a Brazilian population. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2009; 20(2):208–17. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0501.2008.01629.x PMID: 19191798

40. Lin YH, Huang P, Lu X, Guan DH, Man Y, Wei N, et al. The relationship between IL-1 gene polymorphism and marginal bone loss around dental implants. J Oral Maxillofac Surg. 2007; 65(11):2340–4. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joms.2007.06.673 PMID: 17954336

41. Cury PR, Joly JC, Freitas N, Sendyk WR, Nunes FD, de Araujo NS. Effect of tumor necrosis factor-alpha gene polymorphism on peri-implant bone loss following prosthetic reconstruction. Implant Dent. 2007; 16(1):80–8. https://doi.org/10.1097/ID.0b013e31803277c1 PMID: 17356374

42. Lachmann S, Kummerle-Muller E, Axmann D, Scheideler L, Weber H, Haas R. Associations between peri-implant crevicular fluid volume, concentrations of crevicular inflammatory mediators, and
43. Laine ML, Leonhardt A, Roos-Jansaker AM, Pena AS, van Winkelhoff AJ, Winkel EG, et al. IL-1RN gene polymorphism is associated with peri-implantitis. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2006; 17(4):380–5. https://doi.org/10.10111/j.1600-0501.2006.01249.x PMID: 16907768

44. Campos MI, dos Santos MC, Trevilatto PC, Scarel-Caminaga RM, Bezerra FJ, Line SR. Early failure of Laine ML, Leonhardt A, Roos-Jansaker AM, Pena AS, van Winkelhoff AJ, Winkel EG, et al. IL-1RN gene polymorphism is associated with peri-implantitis. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2006; 17(4):380–5. https://doi.org/10.10111/j.1600-0501.2006.01249.x PMID: 16907768

44. Campos MI, dos Santos MC, Trevilatto PC, Scarel-Caminaga RM, Bezerra FJ, Line SR. Early failure of Laine ML, Leonhardt A, Roos-Jansaker AM, Pena AS, van Winkelhoff AJ, Winkel EG, et al. IL-1RN gene polymorphism is associated with peri-implantitis. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2006; 17(4):380–5. https://doi.org/10.10111/j.1600-0501.2006.01249.x PMID: 16907768

45. Shimpuku H, Nosaka Y, Kawamura T, Tachi Y, Shinohara M, Ohura K. Genetic polymorphisms of the interleukin-1 gene and early marginal bone loss around endosseous dental implants. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2003; 14(4):423–9. https://doi.org/10.1034/j.1600-0765.2002.00651.x PMID: 12869004

46. Rogers MA, Figliomeni L, Baluchova K, Tan AE, Davies G, Henry PJ, et al. Do interleukin-1 polymorphisms predict the development of periodontitis or the success of dental implants? J Periodontal Res. 2002; 37(1):37–41. https://doi.org/10.1034/j.1600-0765.2002.00651.x PMID: 11858158

47. Lu X, Lin YH, Li ZC. The relationship between TNFA-308 gene polymorphism and marginal bone loss around dental implants. J Dent Prevent Treatment, 2009, 17(1):17–20.

48. Liu Q, Huang JS, Cheng JJ, Liu TT. Relationship between implantitis and polymorphisms of the interleukin1-1B (+3954C/T, -511C/T) gene. Chin J Oral Implant, 2011, 16(3): 148–151.

49. Li CC, Yu PP, Fan C, Song JZ, Zhang CY. Investigation on the relationship between polymorphisms of TNF-α, IL-6 and peri-implantitis. Modern Med J Chin, 2017, 19(2): 1–5.

50. Tatakis DN. Interleukin-1 and bone metabolism: a review. J Periodontol. 1993; 64(5 Suppl):416–31. PMID: 8315564

51. Graves DT, Cochran D. The contribution of interleukin-1 and tumor necrosis factor to periodontal tissue destruction. J Periodontal 2003; 74(3):391–401. https://doi.org/10.1902/jop.2003.74.3.391 PMID: 12710761

52. Ghassib I, Chen Z, Zhu J, Wang HL. Use of IL-1 beta, IL-6, TNF-alpha, and MMP-8 biomarkers to distinguish peri-implant diseases: A systematic review and meta-analysis. Clin Implant Dent Relat Res. 2019; 21(1):190–207. https://doi.org/10.1111/cid.12694 PMID: 30508312

53. Liao J, Li C, Wang Y, Ten MH, Sun X, Tian A, et al. Meta-analysis of the association between common interleukin-1 polymorphisms and dental implant failure. Mol Biol Rep. 2014; 41(5):2789–98. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11033-014-3133-6 PMID: 24452718

54. Boyce BF, Li P, Yao Z, Zhang Q, Badell IR, Schwarz EM, et al. TNF-alpha gene promoter polymorphism and marginal bone loss around dental implants. J Dent Prevent Treatment, 2009, 17(1):17–20.

55. Abraham LJ, Kroeger KM. Impact of the -308 TNF promoter polymorphism on the transcriptional regulation of the TNF gene: relevance to disease. J Leukoc Biol. 1999; 66(4):562–6. https://doi.org/10.1002/jlb.66.4.562 PMID: 10534109

56. Ding C, Ji X, Chen X, Xu Y, Zhong L. TNF-alpha gene promoter polymorphisms contribute to periodontitis susceptibility: evidence from 46 studies. J Clin Periodontol. 2014; 41(6):748–59. https://doi.org/10.1111/jcpe.12279 PMID: 24905365

57. Ata-Ali J, Flichy-Fernandez AJ, Alegre-Domingo T, Ata-Ali F, Palacio J, Penarrocha-Diago M. Clinical, microbiological, and immunological aspects of healthy versus peri-implantitis tissue in full arch reconstruction patients: a prospective cross-sectional study. BMC Oral Health. 2015; 15:43. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12903-015-0031-9 PMID: 25883355

58. Duarte PM, de Mendoaca AC, Maximo MB, Santos VR, Bastos MF, Nociti FH. Effect of anti-infective mechanical therapy on clinical parameters and cytokine levels in human peri-implantitis diseases. J Periodontol. 2009; 80(2):234–43. https://doi.org/10.1902/jop.2009.070672 PMID: 19186963

59. Mo YY, Zeng XT, Wang H, Cen Y, Zhao Q, Wen X. Association between tumor necrosis factor-alpha G-308A polymorphism and dental peri-implant disease risk: A meta-analysis. Medicine (Baltimore). 2016; 95(35):e4425. https://doi.org/10.1097/MD.0000000000004425 PMID: 27583850

60. Lindhe J, Myelee J, Group DoEWoP. Peri-implant diseases: Consensus Report of the Sixth European Workshop on Periodontology. J Clin Periodontol. 2008; 35(8 Suppl):282–5. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-051X.2008.01283.x PMID: 18724855

61. Jansson H, Hamberg K, De Bury H, Bratthall G. Clinical consequences of IL-1 genotype on early implant failures in patients under periodontal maintenance. Clin Implant Dent Relat Res. 2005; 7(1):51–9. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1708-8208.2005.tb00047.x PMID: 15903175

62. Gruica B, Wang HY, Lang NP, Buser D. Impact of IL-1 genotype and smoking status on the prognosis of osseointegrated implants. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2004; 15(4):393–400. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0501.2004.01026.x PMID: 15248873
63. Feloutzis A, Lang NP, Tonetti MS, Burgin W, Bragger U, Buser D, et al. IL-1 gene polymorphism and smoking as risk factors for peri-implant bone loss in a well-maintained population. Clin Oral Implants Res. 2003; 14(1):10–7. https://doi.org/10.1034/j.1600-0501.2003.140102.x PMID: 12562360

64. Wen X, Liu R, Li G, Deng M, Liu L, Zeng XT, et al. History of periodontitis as a risk factor for long-term survival of dental implants: a meta-analysis. Int J Oral Maxillofac Implants. 2014; 29(6):1271–80. https://doi.org/10.11607/jomi.3544 PMID: 25397791