Impact of private editor article citations to journal citation: a case of Indonesian accredited “A” journals

D Muriyatmoko¹* and H Setyaningrum²

¹ Departement of Informatics Engineering, Universitas Darusaalam Gontor, 63471 Siman Road Km.6, Siman, Ponorogo, East Java, Indonesia
² Departement of Agrotechnology, Universitas Darusaalam Gontor, 63471 Siman Road Km.6, Siman, Ponorogo, East Java, Indonesia

* dihin@unida.gontor.ac.id

Abstract. Journal citation is a key indicator of global acceptance and considered a factor in the Indonesian academic journal accreditation system. Indonesian Journals are categorized chronologically from high to low as A and B, which Google Scholar Citations (GSC) as one inputs during assessment. This current study aimed to determine an impact of an editor private article citation to accredited A journal citation, based on Google's scholar. The data collection was conducted in January 2018 through Google's scholar account and analyzed using linear regressions. The total twelve journals were accredited A which indicated highest quality nationally in management and article content. The data statistically analyzed of twelve journals were indicated that correlation such as factors was very delicate (Multiple R = 0.17 and R Square = 0.03). Editor individual articles were only 3% judging citations of journals, while remaining 97% was influenced by other factors. Citation of Editor particular articles have no significant effect on the number of their journal citations. The high-impact journal exclusively published based on their novelty and technical competence, and in the potential of article-level metrics. Key factor determined impact journal was quality, accuracy and authority of a journal. The editors had the impact indirectly through determined quality of article's journal.

1. Introduction

Scientific journal had become one significant factor for academic carriers in Indonesia. Authorities of Scientific Journals are hold by Ministry of Research Technology and Higher Education (Kemenristekdikti) under ARJUNA System. Based on ARJUNA eight components considered: naming, publisher, review management, article contents, type style, view performance, frequency, and distribution. Accredited journals are categorized on A and B based on the quality journal [1].

Citation is a reflection of dissemination and popularity a scientific journal. Its’ also correlated with quality of article and explicitly the author [2], [3]. ARJUNA system worked based on Google's scholar index citation (GSC). Time by time Google's scholar (GS) developed their scope significantly for indexing scientific journal. Otherwise, the articles are considered seriously GS [4]. No doubt much research explained the ability of GS as a reputable citation index [5]. Otherwise, it’s also a tool for collaborate with research between countries and academic institutions [6].

Editor is a key point in the quality of a scientific journal [7]. Based on ARJUNA system an editor should have expertise in such a major and also have a good index on their articles. The citation must be recorded from index institution such us Scopus and GS., Mostly tallest a journal level Indonesia. The
editors were having tallest citation in such an index institution. Since 2013 to 2017 ARJUNA had released 12 journals as a categorized which meant the highest reputable journals.

The basic idea behind this research was an intention to the author as chief editor of Fountain of Informatics Journal [8] and Gontor Agrotech Science Journal [9] for the journal quality in Indonesia. The Indonesian ISSN authority (PDII LIPI) was released 51,176 online ISSN, which 20,000 of them were journals [10]. Only 1682 journals were verified by Kemenristekdikti [11]. The objective of this research was to assess the impact of editor article citation to their journal citation based on GSC.

2. Methods
The journal A categorized was gathered from a decree of Kemenristekdikti since last five years (2013-2017) and website of Science and Technology Index (Sinta) [11]. The journals were tracked by their available website to get an editor information, including their article citation. Letter on, the journal and their editor together were tracked by GS profile to get there the citation index. All A categorized journals and their editor data citation were represented in table 1.

| No. | Years | Journals name                                      | Editor-in-chief citation | Journal citation |
|-----|-------|----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|------------------|
| 1   | 2017  | Al-Jami’ah: Journal of Islamic Studies             | 192                      | 359              |
| 2   | 2016  | Teflin Journal                                    | 263                      | 1110             |
| 3   | 2016  | Paramita                                           | 25                       | 106              |
| 4   | 2017  | Studia Islamika                                   | 4175                     | 898              |
| 5   | 2016  | Jurnal Manajemen Hutan Tropika                     | 73                       | 589              |
| 6   | 2013  | TELKOMNIKA                                        | 960                      | 3738             |
| 7   | 2013  | Journal of Indonesian Islam                        | 167                      | 238              |
| 8   | 2013  | Microbiology Indonesia                             | 410                      | 804              |
| 9   | 2017  | Journal of ICT Research and Applications           | 454                      | 335              |
| 10  | 2015  | Jurnal Respirologi Indonesia (JRI)                 | 3                        | 125              |
| 11  | 2014  | IJISM (Indonesia Journal Islam and Muslim Societies) | 289                     | 49               |
| 12  | 2017  | IJAIN (International Journal of Advances in Intelligent Informatics) | 1561                    | 47               |

The data were analyzed using Microsoft Excel 2016 (Microsoft Inc. USA). All collected data were tested using ANOVA for knowing the differences between all journal data citation and editor article citation. If there any significance difference, letter on analyzed by regression linear. The data was analyzed based on confidence level 5%, which placed a number of editor (in chief) paper citations as X factor and a number of journal citations as Y factor.

3. Results and discussion
A total 12 journals are listed (table 1) It consisted of various majors of science. The results showed (figure 1) that the increasing of editor (in chief) article citations not always followed by increased of their journal citation. The Studia Islamika (Islamic science scope) has the highest editor citation count (4175) while the journal citation’s counts are in the middle level (898). It’s indicated that the editor citation has no effect to journal citation. This condition is reflected not only in Studia Islamika but also IJAIN, IJISM, and Journal ICT Research and Application. Another side, Jurnal Respirologi Indonesia (medical scope) has the lowest citation editor count (3) with journal citations 125 counts. It’s indicate that editor private article is huge impact to journal citations. The same reflection in Jurnal Manajemen Hutan Tropika, Paramita, Teflin Journal, and TELKOMNIKA. This current result appears to be a bias correlation between editor citation and journal citations, and which one determined. However, many
authors[13]–[15] warned that impacts of individual editor article citations to journal citations are weak and to be analyzed very carefully to get real figure. The statistical analyzed represent in Table 2 - 5.

Categorized or accredited A journal in Indonesia is prestigious for academic publication. It’s reflected standard quality in scientific publication almost for all subject’s science. During the assessment, one point of subject count was editor, such us diversity editor and publication quality. By these standard point editors, especially editors in chief were played as a key for getting high count valuation. Good indications for editors were the article publication that has been cited by another author. The assessment of editor private articles to count of citation journals were critical to adequate real correlation between them. Regression Statistics analyzed showed there a correlation between editor article citation and a journal citation (R = 0.17) (Table 2). Editor article citations are only 3% affected to prevalence of and journal citation. Otherwise, 97% of journal citation are depended on another factor. Other hands the Editor article citations are weakly influenced to journal citation. This fact gives an evidence, that editor’s citation personally through GS are not significantly affected to journal citation.

Table 2. Regression statistics analyzed of 12 journals accredited A.

| Regression Statistics                  |       |
|--------------------------------------|-------|
| Multiple R                           | 0.178055839 |
| R Square                             | 0.031703882 |
| Adjusted R Square                    | -0.06512573 |
| Standard Error                       | 1053.246883 |
| Observations                         | 12    |

Result showing any correlation between editor and journal and give 3% impact to journal citation count. Editor even as key factor for management publication, by this case are have low impact for journal citations. The journal or article citations in GS are related to selected articles and background coverage of author. The selection of journal preference author are depend the quality, accuracy and authority of journal [16]. Otherwise, editors are influenced indirectly through their journal.

Another factors influencing journal GSC are visibility of such journal or article [6]. All Indonesian accredited “A” journals are open access which huge change to cite rather than closed journal.

Table 3. ANOVA (Analysis of Variant) analyzed of Indonesian 12 journals accredited A.

|                  | Regression | Residual | Total |
|------------------|------------|----------|-------|
| df               | 1          | 10       | 11    |
| SS               | 363215.7004 | 11093289.97 | 11456505.67 |
| MS               | 363215.7004 | 1109328.997 |      |
| F                | 0.327419279 |         |      |
| Significance F   | 0.579817975 |         |      |

ANOVAs give an impression, there is impact of the editor to journal citation. The impact actually was going positively and low rate (table 3). Following Guilford (1973) [17], the F values in 0.03 are little if any correlation.

Table 4. Value of Coefficients analyzed of 12 Indonesia journals accredited A.

|                | Intercept     | X (editor citations) |
|----------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Coefficients   | 589.6390754   | 0.154261677          |
| Standard Error | 359.9033175   | 0.269591332          |
| t Stat         | 1.638326313   | 0.572205627          |
| P-value        | 0.132392973   | 0.579817975          |
The regression coefficients showing positively link between editor and journal citation (table 4). The journal citation by mean will be increased as increasing of editor citation or more. High-impact journal publishes exclusively online and judge papers only based on their novelty and technical competence, and in the potential of article-level metrics to assess the scientific worth of papers and their authors[16]. The editors as top-level management journals are responsible to keep impacted through their business process. The coverage of journal and diversity of author is impacted to journal citations [6]. The authors are a key factor for reference's citations in article, by mean the preference of article impacted directly to citations.

Figure 1. GSC of Indonesia 12 journal accredited A in 2018.

GS as the index database was relatively new born rather than Scopus or web of science (WOS). GS covered all subjects of science not only natural science but also social science[18]. GS as an open system almost without any limitation are now most accessible scholar data based rather than Scopus or WOS, Thomson Reuters. However, some researcher warns for GS database containing errors in meta-data and duplicated article records, including error tracking in author names, dates and issues [4]. These critical points are happened for journal not only Indonesia but also most of the countries. In order to get accurate analysis, a journal manager should be monitored periodically over their GS profile. The profile of GSC count (figure1) gives the impression over GSC journal citation were not linear as well as private article editor citations. The editor of Studia Islamika has a journal highest count, but the journal citation itself was not as high as editor citations. The TELKOMNIKA has the highest count of citations, even the editor private articles are not linear as it is. This such condition was proof by statistical analyzed above as mean of regression results and ANOVA.
The volumes which identified as age of the journal are considered in citations for almost indexing institutions, including GS. Volumes are correlated with diversity of and accessibility for author. The age or volume (table 5) showing that Al Jami’ah, Journal of Islamic Studies was the oldest (55 volumes), but the GSC account was not tallest as well as TELKOMNIKA (11 volumes). This condition also gave a reason that the ages/volume not always supported the article citations in such conditions. As we know Al Jami’ah was Islamic scope, another side TELKOMNIKA mostly was telecommunication and electronic. However, author preferences are complicated when the scope in different issues.

Table 5. Volume and GSC count of Indonesian 12 Journal accredited A.

| No | Name of journal Accredited A          | Volume | GSC Count |
|----|---------------------------------------|--------|-----------|
| 1  | IJAIN (International Journal of Advances in Intelligent Informatics) | 3      | 47        |
| 2  | IJISM (Indonesia Journal Islam and Muslim Societies)             | 7      | 49        |
| 3  | Jurnal Respirologi Indonesia (JRI)                  | 9      | 125       |
| 4  | Journal of Indonesian Islam                  | 11     | 238       |
| 5  | Microbiology Indonesia                       | 11     | 804       |
| 6  | Journal of ICT Research and Applications     | 11     | 335       |
| 7  | TELKOMNIKA                                    | 16     | 3738      |
| 8  | Jurnal Manajemen Hutan Tropika               | 23     | 589       |
| 9  | Studia Islamika                              | 24     | 898       |
| 10 | Paramita                                     | 27     | 106       |
| 11 | Teflin Journal                               | 28     | 1110      |
| 12 | Al-Jami’ah: Journal of Islamic Studies       | 55     | 359       |

Determine the author/researcher preferences are the accurate way to get data, including GSC or another index database. The journal owners are suggested to be monitored periodically over GSC to eliminate huge meta data error.

The indicator of the citation impact of journals is the impact factor [13] which referred to WOS. The editor individual citation's impacts to journal citations through our analyzed are weak or impact indirectly. Otherwise, it’s not stand alone, factors considered to journal citations are volumes, scopes, quality, accuracy and authority.

4. Conclusion

The impact of the editor private journals to GSC journal are mostly few otherwise no correlations between them. The citations are related to such factors, including the quality, accuracy and authority provided by journal. The preferences of author are most considered as the main factor for increasing journal citations.

References

[1] Direktur Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi 2014 *Pedoman Akreditasi Terbitan Berkala Ilmiah* (Edisi Pert. Jakarta: Direktorat Penelitian dan Pengabdian kepada Masyarakat, Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi, Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan)

[2] P O Seglen 1997 Citations and journal impact factors: questionable indicators of research quality *Allergy* 52(11) pp. 1050–1056

[3] F W M G Muniz, R K Celeste, H J R Oballe and C K Rösing 2017 Citation Analysis and Trends in review articles in dentistry *J. Evid. Based Dent. Pract.*

[4] G Halevi, H Moed and J Bar-Ilan 2017 Suitability of Google Scholar as a source of scientific information and as a source of data for scientific evaluation Review of the Literature *J. Informetr.*11(3) pp. 823–834
[5] A Martin Martin, E Orduna Malea, A W Harzing and E D Lopez-Cozar 2017 Can we use Google Scholar to identify highly-cited documents? *J. Informetr.* **11**(1) pp. 152–163
[6] J L Ortega and I F Aguillo 2013 Institutional and country collaboration in an online service of scientific profiles: Google Scholar Citations *J. Informetr.* **7**(2) pp. 394–403
[7] J A Teixeira da Silva 2017 The ethics of peer and editorial requests for self-citation of their work and journal *Med. J. Armed Forces India* **73**(2) pp. 181–183
[8] D Muriyatmoko 2018 Editorial Team https://ejournal.unida.gontor.ac.id/index.php/FIJ.
[9] H Setyaningrum 2018 Editorial Team https://ejournal.unida.gontor.ac.id/index.php/agrotech/, 2018.
[10] Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia 2018 ISSN Online http://issn.lipi.go.id/.
[11] D P T R I Kementerian Riset Teknologi 2018 SINTA Science and Technology Index http://sinta.ristekdikti.go.id/journals
[12] Ditlitabmas Ditjen Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan 2018 Akreditasi Jurnal Nasional http://arjuna.ristekdikti.go.id/
[13] L Waltman 2016 A review of the literature on citation impact indicators *J. Informetr.* **10**(2) pp. 365–391
[14] J K Vanclay 2012 Impact Factor: outdated artefact or stepping-stone to journal certification?
[15] E Garfield 1972 Citation Analysis as a Tool in Journal Evaluation Author (s): Eugene Garfield Published by : American Association for the Advancement of Science Stable JSTOR for this.
[16] S Curry 2012 Sick of Impact Factors
[17] J P Guilford 1973 *Fundamental statistics in psychology and education* 5th edition (New York [etc.]: McGraw-Hill Book Company).
[18] M Levine Clark and J Kraus 2007 Finding Chemistry Information Using Google Scholar *Sci. Technol. Libr.* **27**(4) pp. 3–17