Fasciola hepatica infection reduces Mycobacterium bovis burden and mycobacterial uptake and suppresses the pro-inflammatory response

L. GARZA-CUARTERO, 1 J. O’SULLIVAN, 1 A. BLANCO, 2 J. MCNAIR, 3 M. WELSH, 4 R. J. FLYNN, 5 D. WILLIAMS, 6 P. DIGGLE, 7 J. CASSIDY 1 & G. MULCAHY 1,2

1 School of Veterinary Medicine, University College Dublin, Dublin, Ireland, 2 Conway Institute, University College Dublin, Dublin, Ireland, 3 Veterinary Sciences Division, Agri-Food and Biosciences Institute, Belfast, UK, 4 CSO, SISAF, The Innovation Centre, Belfast, UK, 5 School of Veterinary Science, University of Nottingham, Nottingham, UK, 6 Institute of Infection and Global Health, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK, 7 Division of Medicine, Lancaster University, Lancaster, UK

SUMMARY
Bovine tuberculosis (BTB), caused by Mycobacterium bovis, has an annual incidence in cattle of 0.5% in the Republic of Ireland and 4.7% in the UK, despite long-standing eradication programmes being in place. Failure to achieve complete eradication is multifactorial, but the limitations of diagnostic tests are significant complicating factors. Previously, we have demonstrated that Fasciola hepatica infection, highly prevalent in these areas, induced reduced sensitivity of the standard diagnostic tests for BTB in animals co-infected with F. hepatica and M. bovis. This was accompanied by a reduced M. bovis-specific Th1 immune response. We hypothesized that these changes in co-infected animals would be accompanied by enhanced growth of M. bovis. However, we show here that mycobacterial burden in cattle is reduced in animals co-infected with F. hepatica. Furthermore, we demonstrate a lower mycobacterial recovery and uptake in blood monocyte-derived macrophages (MDM) from F. hepatica-infected cattle which is associated with suppression of pro-inflammatory cytokines and a switch to alternative activation of macrophages. However, the cell surface expression of TLR2 and CD14 in MDM from F. hepatica-infected cattle is increased. These findings reflecting the bystander effect of helminth-induced downregulation of pro-inflammatory responses provide insights to understand host-pathogen interactions in co-infection.

Keywords co-infection, Fasciola hepatica, monocyte-derived macrophages, Mycobacterium bovis, uptake

INTRODUCTION
The control of infectious diseases within populations, whether through vaccination programmes and/or identification and removal of infected individuals, is dependent on immune responsiveness to the pathogens concerned. Immune responsiveness to a particular pathogen within a population is subject to modulation by a multitude of factors including host genetics (1–3), reproductive cycles and the presence of co-infections (4). Such factors are easily controlled in experimental studies, but they may have a significant impact in the real world of naturally occurring infection (5–8). Parasitic helminths, ubiquitous in grazing livestock and common in humans in many parts of the world, typically use immunoregulatory strategies to achieve persistent infections, while reducing inflammatory pathology in the host (9,10). They also have the potential, through bystander immunoregulation, to alter the pathology and course of other infections in the same host (11–16). Here, we model some aspects of the interaction between a helminth and a bacterial pathogen, both of which cause economically important diseases of livestock.

The liver fluke, Fasciola hepatica, is a highly prevalent helminth parasite of farmed ruminants (17), estimated to cause annual losses of about €2.5 billion annually to the livestock industry worldwide. F. hepatica also affects a wide range of other mammals, including humans, with approximately 170 million people at risk of infection (18). Mycobacterium bovis, the causative agent of bovine tuberculosis (BTB), also has zoonotic implications; as an
estimate, 3.1% of human tuberculosis cases globally are caused by *M. bovis* (19). In some developed countries, eradication programmes have reduced or eliminated BTB. However, reservoirs of *M. bovis* in wildlife (20–22), together with the limitations of diagnostic tests (23), have made complete eradication difficult in others (24).

In previous studies, we have shown that two diagnostic tests used in BTB eradication schemes, the single intradermal comparative tuberculin test (SICCT) and the *in vitro* interferon (IFN)-γ assay, were between 50% and 80% less effective in detecting *M. bovis*-infected cattle when the animals were co-infected with *F. hepatica* (25,26), leading to a lower positive predictive value of the tests. This was also shown in a large-scale epidemiological study in England and Wales, where dairy herds with a high prevalence of *F. hepatica* infection had a lower number of BTB reactors (6). This reduced sensitivity of the diagnostic tests was hypothesized to be due to an immunosuppression induced by *F. hepatica* infection. A downregulation of the Th1 immune response in other coinfection models has been associated with an increase in bacterial loads (14–16,27). Thus, we proposed that these changes in *F. hepatica*-infected animals might also result in an increase in the *M. bovis* numbers in co-infected animals.

Previously, it has been shown that CD14 played a major role in phagocytosis of *M. bovis* BCG by macrophages, and optimal uptake required the presence of both CD14 and complement receptor 3 (CR3). In addition, co-expression of CD14 and TLR2 markedly enhanced uptake of BCG (28). Other studies have shown the importance of these receptors in mycobacterial phagocytosis (29,30) and immune responsiveness (31,32). Thus, given that expression of these receptors might vary after infection with helminths (33), we proposed that TLR2 and CD14 could be modified in macrophages from *F. hepatica*-infected cattle, leading to alterations in mycobacterial uptake and recovery from such macrophages. Next, we investigated the cytokine profile and the activation of macrophages *in vitro* after *F. hepatica* infection of cattle. Alternatively activated macrophages, known to develop in *F. hepatica* infections (34,35), are not efficient at bacterial phagocytosis (36). In addition, these alternatively activated macrophages are characterized by the production of Th2 and Treg cytokines and a reduced production of Th1 cytokines. Some of these pro-inflammatory cytokines such as IL-12, IL-1β and IL-6 directly affect IFN-γ production (37–39) and the immune response in the SICCT (40), the two standard tests for the diagnosis of BTB in Europe. Thus, we hypothesized that an alteration in the pro-inflammatory cytokine profile in MDM from *F. hepatica*-infected cattle could relate to a modified bacterial uptake as well as explaining the lower response to the diagnostic tests for BTB in animals co-infected with *M. bovis* and *F. hepatica*.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Experimental design**

For the co-infection experiments (experiments 1 and 2), male castrated Holstein–Friesian cattle aged between 3 and 7 weeks of age (12 animals for each experiment) were purchased from farms known to be TB-free, as determined by the official tuberculosis eradication programme in the UK, and where fasciolosis had not been reported. Animals were housed in Containment Level 3 (CL3) facilities at AFBI (Stormont, Belfast, UK) as described by Flynn et al. (26). Animals were then randomly divided into two groups and assigned to *M. bovis*-only-infected group (*n* = 6) or the *F. hepatica–M. bovis*-infected group (*n* = 6), in order to compare mycobacterial burden. Blood was collected weekly to measure IFN-γ production until week 14 (Experiment 1) and week 22 (Experiment 2).

For the *in vitro* experiment (Experiment 3), six male castrated Holstein–Friesian calves aged between 6 and 8 months of age were purchased from herds free of BTB and where *F. hepatica* infection was not reported. Animals were maintained under uniform housing conditions at University College Dublin (UCD) Lyons Research Farm (Newcastle, County Kildare, Ireland). All six animals were infected with *F. hepatica*, and mycobacterial recovery and uptake, TLR2 and CD14 receptor expression and cytokine production from MDM, compared prior to and after *F. hepatica* infection.

Experiments 1 and 2 were approved/licensed by the Animal Scientific Procedures Act 1986 (DHSPPS) under the scrutiny of the Animal Welfare and Ethical Review Body (AWERB), PPL2728, Agri-Food and Biosciences Institute, Belfast, UK. Experiment 3 was approved/licensed by the UCD Animal Research Ethics Committee/Health Products Regulatory Agency (AE18982/P023), University College Dublin, Ireland.

**Experimental *F. hepatica* infection of cattle**

In all experiments, to ensure that animals were free from *F. hepatica* infection before starting the study, animals were serologically screened by ELISA using recombinant mutant *F. hepatica* cathepsin L1 (rmFhCL1), as previously described (35), and by faecal egg examination. For *F. hepatica* infection, 150 *F. hepatica* metacercariae (Baldwin Aquatics, Oregon)), dispersed in 10 mL of dH2O, were administered orally via a syringe onto the back of the tongue. For confirmation of infection, numbers of parasites
in the liver of each animal in Experiment 1 (26) and Experiment 2 (Table S1) were recorded. In addition, specific antibody responses to *F. hepatica* infection were measured and no effect of *M. bovis* infection on such antibody levels to *F. hepatica* was observed in Experiment 1 (26) or Experiment 2 (data not shown). For Experiment 3, post-mortem examinations were not carried out, but seroconversion for *F. hepatica* infection using recombinant cathepsin-like 1 (rmFhCL1) by ELISA (Figure S1) was monitored as previously described (35).

**Bacterial strains and bacterial stocks**

In all three experiments, *Mycobacterium bovis* AF2122/97, a UK isolate, was used. For Experiment 3, in addition, the nonvirulent *M. bovis* BCG-GFP Pasteur was used. All the work involving virulent *M. bovis* was performed in a Biosafety Containment Level 3 (CL3) laboratory and conformed to guidelines on the use of Hazard Group 3 infectious organisms.

*M. bovis* was cultured in Middlebrook 7H9 medium (DifcoTM, Becton Dickinson) containing 10% Middlebrook albumin–dextrose–catalase (ADC) enrichment 5% BSA (Fisher Chemical), 111 mM glucose (GPR), 145.4 mM NaCl (Fluka BioChemika) and 10 mM sodium pyruvate (Sigma–Aldrich) at 37°C. Bacterial cultures were grown to logarithmic phase (O.D = 1). To achieve this, 1 mL of bacterial frozen aliquot was diluted in 4 mL of Middlebrook 7H9 medium in a 50-mL Falcon tube and incubated at 37°C in static conditions for 5 days. Then, cultures were scaled up by adding the 5 mL of bacterial culture to 45 mL of Middlebrook 7H9 medium into an Erlenmeyer flask (Corning) and incubated at 37°C for further 2 weeks.

**Experimental *M. bovis* infection of cattle**

For co-infection experiments (experiments 1 and 2), all animals were prescreened for immunological responses to the *M. bovis* antigens PPDA, PPDB, ESAT-6 and CFP-10 to ensure that there was no pre-existing exposure. All animals were housed in Containment Level 3 facilities under negative air pressure at AFBI Veterinary Sciences Division, Stormont. At 4 weeks post-*F. hepatica* infection, animals were exposed to low-dose aerosol challenge with *M. bovis* using a Madison chamber modified for use with cattle as previously described (41). The intended target infection dose was $5 \times 10^7$ colony-forming units (CFU) of *M. bovis* strain AF2122/99, which has been demonstrated to be infective in animals while mimicking the natural infection (42). Actual doses delivered were calculated by side-flow sampling from the Madison chambers, and there were no statistically significant differences between delivered doses between groups (See Table S2 of Supporting Information).

**IFN-γ test**

For the co-infection experiments (experiments 1 and 2), IFN-γ production was measured in whole blood cultures after stimulation with PPDB-PPDA and ESAT-6 antigens, using the Bovigam Kit as per manufacturer’s instructions.

**Post-mortem examination**

Fourteen (Experiment 1) or 22 (Experiment 2) weeks after *F. hepatica* infection, the animals were euthanized and samples from each lung lobe, right and left bronchial lymph nodes, along with hepatic and cervical lymph nodes, were collected. Lungs were palpated by hand and then sliced at 1-cm intervals to reveal any tuberculous tissue. Each tissue sample was dissected carefully to reveal lesions indicative of tuberculosis, which were counted and measured. Lesions or suspect lesions, together with the other tissues, were sliced into cubes measuring approximately 5 mm in diameter and sent for bacteriology for preparation of cultures (see details below) and for histology processing as previously described (43,44).

For confirmation of *F. hepatica* infection, each liver was carefully sliced at 1-cm intervals. The bile ducts were squeezed to extrude any contained fluke. After dissection, the cubes of liver tissue were placed inside two layers of muslin cloth, soaked in water and squeezed several times. The inside of the cloth was then rinsed in water to remove flukes. All flukes were fixed in formaldehyde for microscopic verification of fluke morphology and counting.

**Bacterial recovery from tissues**

For experiments 1 and 2, the cubed tissue samples were placed into double-thickness stomacher bags with between 4 and 15 mL PBS and homogenized in a stomacher at maximum speed for 2 min. Tissue homogenates were decanted into sterile universal bottles for inoculation into media for qualitative and quantitative cultures.

**Qualitative culture**

For qualitative culture, tissue homogenates were inoculated into the BACTEC MGIT 960 culture system and incubated for up to 56 days. Samples identified as positive by the BACTEC MGIT 960 system were stained using the Ziehl–Neelsen method for confirmation purposes. Samples containing typical acid-fast rods were presumed to be...
positive for *M. bovis* and analysed further by VNTR to identify the infection strain (AF2122/97).

Quantitative culture
For quantitative culture, tissue homogenates were decontaminated in 0.075% hexadecylpyridinium chloride (HPC). Hundred microlitres of this was serially diluted and inoculated in quadruplicate onto 7H11-OADC agar plates and incubated at 37°C for up to 6 weeks. *M. bovis* colonies were counted weekly from 3 weeks onwards and the average colony counts at 6 weeks post-inoculation used to calculate the total number of CFU per gram of sample. *M. bovis* colonies were initially identified on the basis of colony morphology and a selection of colonies was prepared for VNTR typing to confirm isolation of AF2122/97.

Isolation of monocyte-derived macrophages (MDM)

For Experiment 3, 300 mL of blood was collected per each of the 6 animals, into lithium heparin vacutainers (Cruinn Diagnostics), pre-*F. hepatica* infection and at 4, 8 and 10 weeks post-*F. hepatica* infection. Then, peripheral blood mononuclear cells (PBMC) were isolated by the density gradient centrifugation method using Histopaque (Sigma–Aldrich). Next, anti-CD14+ microbeads (Miltenyi Biotec) were used to isolate monocytes as per manufacturer’s instructions (detailed protocol in Supporting Information Page 17). Cell viability was checked with trypan blue (Sigma–Aldrich), and selected CD14+ cells were adjusted to 1 × 10^6 cells/mL in complete medium (RPMI-1640 [Bio-Sciences], 1% glutamine [Sigma–Aldrich], 1% nonessential amino acids [Sigma–Aldrich], 15% heat-inactivated foetal calf serum [Bio-Sciences], 1% penicillin–streptomycin [Sigma–Aldrich]) and plated in 12-, 24- or 96-well plates (Greiner), depending on the experiment.

MDM culture, stimulation and infection
For Experiment 3, plates were incubated for 7 days at 37°C, 5% CO₂ to allow the maturation of monocytes into macrophages as previously described (45). The culture medium was changed every 2–3 days. From Day 3 onwards, antibiotic-free medium was used. At Day 6, selected wells containing MDM were stimulated with *F. hepatica* antigen by adding 20 μg/mL of FhES. For FhES preparation, see Method S2 in Supporting Information. At Day 7, *M. bovis* or *M. bovis* BCG was added at a ratio of 1 : 1 (45) to selected wells containing either FhES or PBS and then incubated for a further 24 h. PBS was used as a negative control.

For flow cytometry experiments, at Day 7 PPDB (1 μg/mL) (kindly provided by Prof. Eamon Gormley, UCD) was added to selected wells, TLR2 as a positive control (46). In all the cases, at least 3 wells were used for each *in vitro* condition, with 3 unstimulated controls (PBS), 3 mycobacteria, 3 mycobacteria plus FhES and 3 FhES wells, per animal.

Confirmation of bacterial infection of MDM
Ziehl–Neelsen staining was used to confirm intracellular macrophage infection with *M. bovis* or *M. bovis* BCG (see Method S2 and Figure S2 in Supporting Information).

Bacterial recovery from MDM (CFU)
In Experiment 3, for bacterial recovery from MDM, mycobacterial colony-forming units (CFU) were calculated. When culturing *M. bovis*, agar plates were made using Middlebrook 7H11 medium (DifcoTM, Becton Dickinson) containing 10 μg of sodium pyruvate (Sigma–Aldrich) and 10% ADC. For BCG-GFP culture in agar, glycerol 1% (Sigma) was added instead of sodium pyruvate.

After removal of medium and extracellular bacteria from the 96-well plates, cells were lysed by the addition of 65 μL of 0.1% Triton X-100 (Sigma–Aldrich) for 5 min. Next, the lysates were serially diluted in Middlebrook 7H9 medium at concentrations from 10^{-2} to 10^{-6} before plating out in triplicate on agar plates. In parallel, 3 wells for each condition and animal were used to count the number of total macrophages in each well. After incubation of agar plates for 4 weeks, colony counts were performed and colony-forming units (CFU)/macrophage were calculated using the formula:

\[
\text{CFU per macrophage} = \frac{\text{average of CFU in 3 agar plates} \times 200 \, \mu\text{L} (\text{total volume of the dilution})/50 \, \mu\text{L} (\text{volume used to plate out bacteria}) \times 10^3 \, \text{(dilution factor)} \times 65 \, \mu\text{L} (\text{volume of lysis buffer added to the well})/20 \, \mu\text{L} (\text{volume used to do the dilution}) \times \text{number of macrophages in a well}}
\]

Bacterial uptake and receptor expression in MDM by flow cytometry
Quality control measures
In Experiment 3, titration of antibodies for flow cytometry was carried out by performing serial dilutions (1/20 to 1/10 000) and selecting the optimal concentration in pilot experiments. Instrument quality control was carried out using Cytometer Setup and Tracking Beads (BD CS&T beads), which were also used to standardize fluorescence
Data were analysed with Beckman Coulter Summit V4.03.02 Build 2451 software, and re-analysis was carried out with Summit and De Novo Software FCS Express 4 RUO. Data files were kept as FCS data files, compensation was not required, and the gating applied was carried out by including FMO controls which were the same cells as used in the experiment. Gating was applied by selecting target cells based on FSC vs. SSC plot, pulse width vs. FSC area, SSC line vs. SSC area and LD (live death cells) vs. FSC (Figure S3). The purity of monocyte-derived macrophages was 99% as indicated by CD14 labelling. The median of fluorescence intensities of each sample obtained was normalized to its own unstimulated control, resulting in a fold change value, so that BCG-stimulated samples were comparable with Pre-F.hep and Post-F.hep. For further information, see MIFlowCyt Standard in Document S1.

mRNA analysis of MDM

mRNA extraction and cDNA transcription

In Experiment 3, for RNA extraction, the EZNA Total RNA Kit 1 (OMEGA Bio-Tek) was used as per manufacturer’s instructions. For reverse transcription into cDNA, 500 ng of RNA was added to 12 μL of RNase-free water (Sigma–Aldrich), containing 1 μL of oligo DT (0.5 μg/μL) and 1 μL of 10 mM dNTP mix (Promega). A master mix containing 1 μL of Moloney murine leukaemia virus reverse transcriptase (MMLV-RT) (Biosciences), 4 μL of first-strand buffer (5×), 2 μL of 0.1 mM DTT and 1 μL of RNase OUT (40 U/μL) (Biosciences), per sample, was prepared. Nonenzyme controls (no MMLV) and a nontemplate control (RNase-free water) were also prepared. Once samples were incubated at 65°C for 5 min and at 4°C for 2 min, 8 μL of the master mix per vial was added. Samples were then incubated at 37°C for 50 min followed by 15 min at 70°C, and from then until the cDNA was fully transcribed, kept at 4°C. cDNA samples were stored at −20°C until further processing.

qPCR. For real-time qPCR, all samples and controls were included in duplicate. Non-template control and nonenzyme control cDNA template were included for each set of primers. Five nanograms of cDNA from each sample was added to the qPCR plate containing 10 μL of SYBR Green PCR (2×) (Applied Biosystems), 0.3 μL of the forward primer and 0.3 μL of the reverse primer, and these were adjusted to a final volume of 20 μL with RNase-free water. A standard qPCR program was used to run the reactions: 95°C for 1 min followed by 40 cycles of 95°C for 15 s and 60°C for 1 min. A dissociation step was included for all reactions.
to confirm the presence of a single PCR product of the expected size. Reference genes were established by carrying out a GenNorm analysis of 10 potential candidates for internal controls. Reference target stability was assessed across a set of 12 samples selected at random. Results were analysed using the GenNorm qbasePLUS software package (Biogazelle NV, Belgium) as described by Hellemans et al. (47). Analysis determined peptidyl-prolyl isomerase A (PPIA) to be the most stable target gene for our samples with an M (gene expression stability value) <0.02, and PPIA was included as internal control on all plates analysed. Intron-spanning primer was designed for arginase I, iNOS, IL-6 and TGF-β using the Primer3Plus package and synthesized commercially (Eurofins MWG Operon, Ebersberg, Germany) (48):

(Arg1_fwd_180: 5'-CCAAGGTTGTGGAGAAAAAC-3'; Arg1_rev_180: 5'-GATGTCCGTGAGCATCCA-3'),

(iNOS_fwd: 5'-AGAGACGGGGAGATCGGAAA-3'; iNOS_rev: 5'-CATGCAGAACCCTTGGGTG-3'),

(IL-6_fwd: 5'-ACGAAGAGAGCTCCATCTGC-3'; IL-6_rev: 5'-AATGGAGTGAAAGGCCTTGTG-3'),

(TGF-β_fwd: 5'-ACAATTCTGGCGCTACCTC-3'; TGF-β_rev: 5'-ATTTCCCTCTCTGGTACAG-3')

Nitric oxide and cytokine production

In Experiment 3, nitric oxide (NO) production in MDM supernatants was measured using the Griess reagent system (Promega), according to the manufacturer's instructions. IL-6, IL-1β and TGF-β were measured using the ELISA kits for Bovine IL-6 (Cat: ESS0029, Thermo Scientific), IL-1β (Cat: ESS0027, Thermo Scientific) and TGF-β (Cat: G7590, Promega Corporation), according to the manufacturer's instructions. IL-12 was measured using paired antibodies. A standard curve (Cat: RP0077B, Kingfisher Biotech) was included starting from 5000 ng/mL. The working volumes were 100 μL/well, washing steps were carried out with PBS-Tween three washes, and incubation times were 1 h at room temperature unless otherwise indicated. The capture antibody for IL-12 (MCA1782EL, AbD Serotec) was coated onto a 96-well plate (8 μg/mL) and incubated at RT overnight. After this, plates were washed and blocked using 1% BSA (Sigma–Aldrich) in PBS-T. After the addition of the samples and incubation, the detection antibody (MCA2173B, AbD Serotec) was added (5 μg/mL). For the next step, streptavidin-HRP (1:5000 dilution) (Invitrogen) was added and incubated for 45 min and subsequently washed 5 times. TMB was used to develop the colour under dark conditions for 15 min. Finally, the reaction was stopped by the addition of 1 N H2SO4 (Fisher Chemical), and the absorbance was read at 450 nm.

Statistical analysis

For co-infection studies (experiments 1 and 2), the response variable Y for each animal (CFU) was defined as $Y = \log(1 + \text{total CFU})$ where total CFU denotes the sum of bacterial CFU recovered from the left bronchial lymph node, the right bronchial lymph node, the caudal mediastinal lymph node, the cranial mediastinal lymph node and the cervical lymph node. The treatment effect is the difference between the mean of Y in animals co-infected vs. infected with M. bovis only. Data from experiments 1 and 2 were combined, and analysis was carried out by randomized block ANOVA, with ‘experiment’ as the blocking factor on two levels. Firstly, the hypothesis that fluke infection reduces mycobacterial load was tested. Secondly, we tested the hypothesis that in co-infected animals, fluke count was negatively associated with intensity of M. bovis infection. A simple linear regression analysis adjusted for ‘experiment’ as a blocking factor on two levels was used to determine the association between fluke count and M. bovis load and the number of M. bovis-positive tissues.

For Experiment 3, data were analysed using one-way ANOVA for comparison of more than 2 groups and t-test for comparison of 2 groups, using the software GraphPad Prism 5. For qPCR data, relative gene expression fold changes for each sample were calculated according to calibrated normalized relative quantities (CNRQ) utilizing the qbasePLUS package (Eurofins MWG Operon).

RESULTS

Effect of F. hepatica infection on bacterial load in cattle following aerosol challenge with M. bovis

For experiments 1 and 2, statistical analysis of bacterial burden revealed that although the numbers of bacteria recovered differed between the two experiments, there was no interaction between treatment (co-infected or M. bovis only infected) and experiment ($P = 0.657$). Combining the results of both experiments, the total M. bovis bacterial load was significantly lower in co-infected animals ($P = 0.0031$), allowing for a significant difference ($P = 0.017$) between experiments (Figure 1a). In Experiment 1, all animals were confirmed positive for M. bovis infection with either the qualitative or quantitative technique, with the exception of 1 animal in the co-infected group (26). In Experiment 2, all animals were confirmed positive in at least one tissue. The number of culture-positive tissues was lower in the co-infected group; however, this was not statistically significant (Figure 1b). We also compared the number of liver flukes and bacterial load between animals; however, there was no correlation (data not shown).

The distribution of infection identified through bacterial culture was similar in both the M. bovis and the co-
infected groups with the majority of bacteria recovered from the bronchial, mediastinal and cervical lymph nodes (Tables S3 and S4). A small number of additional isolates were recovered from lung tissues (Experiment 2) in which small (<1 cm in diameter) early-stage lesions were visible projecting from pleural surfaces with central cores of caseous necrosis. Overall, no qualitative or quantitative differences were observed in tuberculous lesions between the M. bovis-infected and F. hepatica–M. bovis-infected animals. In both treatment groups, after microscopical examination, lesions exhibited varying degrees of central caseation necrosis with contained foci of dystrophic mineralization. Necrotic cores were bounded by layers of closely apposed macrophages, macrophage giant cells and interspersed lymphocytes. This layer in turn was surrounded by bands of fibrosis. While there was some minor variation in the extent of these lesion components, there was no major difference in these features between the two groups (data not shown).

**Effect of F. hepatica infection on IFN-γ production in animals co-infected with M. bovis**

In co-infection experiments (experiments 1 and 2), IFN-γ production was measured in whole blood cultures after stimulation in vitro with PPDB-PPDA and ESAT-6. In Experiment 2, both groups responded with distinct increases in IFN-γ release after week 6 (2 weeks post-M. bovis infection) in response to PPDB-PPDA stimulation and these increases were sustained throughout the experimental period. In the group co-infected with F. hepatica and M. bovis, there was a noticeably reduced IFN-γ response being statistically significant at 7 and 20 weeks post-infection (P < 0.05) (Figure 2a). Similarly, co-infected animals showed a reduced IFN-γ production in response to ESAT-6 which was statistically significant at 7, 17 and 22 weeks post-infection (P < 0.05) (Figure 2b). These results are similar to those of Flynn et al. (26) (Experiment 1).

The effect of F. hepatica infection on mycobacterial recovery in monocyte-derived macrophages infected with M. bovis and M. bovis BCG in vitro

In parallel, we used an in vitro study (Experiment 3) to examine the effect of F. hepatica infection on bovine monocyte-derived macrophages (MDM) in response to M. bovis, M. bovis BCG-GFP and F. hepatica excretory/secretory antigen (FhES). First, acid-fast (ZN) staining was used to confirm mycobacterial infection of MDM (Figure S2). Next, cultures of mycobacteria in agar plates, obtained from lysed stimulated MDM were analysed. The

© 2016 The Authors. Parasite Immunology Published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd., Parasite Immunology, 38, 387–402
mean number of *M. bovis* recovered from cultures prior to *F. hepatica* infection was 6 colony-forming units (CFU) per macrophage, which decreased to 4 CFU per macrophage 10 week post-*F. hepatica* infection. At this time point, the numbers of *M. bovis* recovered from MDM co-stimulated with FhES decreased further to 2 CFU per macrophage, which was significantly different in comparison with before *F. hepatica* infection (*P* < 0.05) (Figure 3a). Four weeks post-*F. hepatica* infection, bacterial recovery tended to be lower than prior to *F. hepatica* infection also; however, differences were not statistically significant. In the same way as described for *M. bovis*, the nonvirulent BCG-GFP was cultured in agar plates. A reduction in the numbers of BCG-GFP recovered (CFU) was seen 10 weeks post-*F. hepatica* infection (*P* < 0.05); in this case, the addition of FhES did not alter these numbers (Figure 3b).

The Effect of *F. hepatica* Infection on Bacterial Uptake and TLR2–CD14 Expression in Macrophages Infected with BCG-GFP *in vitro*

Next, we used flow cytometry to investigate whether bacterial uptake and surface receptor expression in MDM would be modified by *F. hepatica* infection. At 8 weeks post-*F. hepatica* infection, the fluorescence intensity of BCG-GFP-infected MDM was shifted towards the left, indicating a reduction in fluorescence intensity (Figure 4a). However, the fluorescence intensity of TLR2 and CD14 receptors from BCG-GFP-infected MDM moved to the right after *F. hepatica* infection, indicating an increase in fluorescence intensity (Figure 4b, c).

Statistical analysis of the data from all animals showed that after *F. hepatica* infection, bacterial uptake was lower than before *F. hepatica* infection (*P* < 0.05) (Figure 4d).
On the contrary, TLR2 expression following *F. hepatica* infection was increased and statistically significant when MDM were restimulated with FhES in vitro (Figure 4e). In the case of CD14, its increased expression after *F. hepatica* infection was statistically significant (*P* < 0.05) regardless of the addition of FhES (Figure 4f). Nevertheless, these surface receptors and bacterial uptake did not show a statistically significant inverse correlation (data not shown).

**The effect of *F. hepatica* infection on macrophage activation and cytokine profile**

We hypothesized that reduced mycobacterial recovery after *F. hepatica* infection of cattle could be associated with an alteration in the activation of macrophages and their cytokine profile. To study such modification in macrophage phenotype, we measured arginase and nitric oxide production, markers of alternative and classical activation, respectively. MDM showed upregulated arginase I mRNA expression at 10 week after *F. hepatica* infection (*P* < 0.05) (Figure 5a). However, as expected, there was a downregulation in iNOS mRNA expression (fold change of 5500) (*P* < 0.05) and nitric oxide production (*P* < 0.01) in *M. bovis*-stimulated MDM after *F. hepatica* infection (Figure 5b, c). Next, we investigated the levels of a panel of cytokines. The levels of pro-inflammatory cytokines IL-1b, IL-12 and IL-6 were reduced after *F. hepatica* infection (*P* < 0.001, *P* < 0.01 and *P* < 0.05, respectively), whereas TGF-β was increased after *F. hepatica* infection (*P* < 0.05) (Figure 6).

**DISCUSSION**

We have previously described reduced responsiveness to *M. bovis* diagnostic tests (SICCT test and the IFN-γ test) in cattle co-infected with *F. hepatica* (26). However, to date, there has been no evidence to link this effect to bacterial load or disease dynamics. Given the substantial resources expended in national control programmes for bovine tuberculosis, which rely on those immunodiagnostic tests, any such interactions warrant further study.

Thus, one of our objectives was to study the effect of *F. hepatica* on bacterial load from *M. bovis*-infected animals. Helminth-mediated immunoregulation is a multifactorial phenomenon, with macrophage-mediated effects one of the principal facets involved. As macrophages are also key elements in the progress of and response to mycobacterial infections, we chose also to study changes in macrophages. Previous co-infection studies have shown that *Schistosoma mansoni* (27) and *Nippostrongylus brasiliensis* (14) co-infection in mice increased the bacterial burden and growth of *M. tuberculosis*, respectively. *F. hepatica* infection in cattle induced higher excretion rates in concurrent infection with *Salmonella Dublin* and more disseminated bacterial infection in the organs (15). Similarly, another study in mice showed that co-infection with *F. hepatica* and *Bordetella pertussis* delayed bacterial...
clearance in the co-infected groups (16). Thus, based on our previous (26) results demonstrating reduced Th1 responses, with reduction in \( M. \) bovis-induced IFN-\( \gamma \) production in animals co-infected with \( F. \) hepatica (Figure 2), we hypothesized that mycobacterial recovery and uptake would be enhanced in the presence of the helminth infection. In contrast, however, the opposite was observed, with reduced mycobacterial burden directly recorded from the tissues of co-infected animals (Figure 1). Our data also show that bacterial recovery from MDM infected with \( M. \) bovis in vitro was reduced after helminth infection (Figure 3). Additionally, given that \( F. \) hepatica ES antigen (FhES) is able to induce the production of Th2 and Treg cytokines as well as arginase (25,49), we suggested that FhES could further influence such mycobacterial uptake and survival. In this case, the addition of FhES to macrophages further decreased \( M. \) bovis survival (Figure 3a). However, when the nonvirulent \( M. \) bovis BCG was used for the experiments (Figure 3b and Figure 4d), the addition of FhES did not result in any further differences in bacterial uptake or recovery in comparison with the BCG-only-stimulated cells. This could be explained because \( M. \) bovis BCG uptake and growth is much lower than when \( M. \) bovis is used (45), so a subtle further difference added with FhES may not have been detected.

Nevertheless, the finding of lower mycobacterial uptake and recovery after \( F. \) hepatica infection of cattle is in line with some previous studies. It has been shown that rats co-infected with the nematode \textit{Litomosoides sigmodontis} and \( M. \) tuberculosis had lower bacterial loads than rats with \( M. \) tuberculosis infection only (50). Likewise, another study demonstrated that acute \textit{Nippostrongylus brasiliensis}
(Nb) infection in mice reduced early pulmonary mycobacterial colonization (11). Additionally, other studies have shown decreased M. tuberculosis–GFP uptake in human DC when they were pre-exposed to microfilaria (51). Next, we investigated a potential cause of this lowered bacterial uptake, the receptors TLR2 and CD14. TLR2 is one of the pathogen-recognition receptors (PRRs) on the surface of macrophages which recognize pathogen-associated molecular patterns (PAMPs) from mycobacteria (52,53). TLR2 together with its co-receptor CD14 has been associated with recognizing and triggering mycobacterial immune responses (31,32). Sendide et al. (2005) showed that in THP-1 and CHO cell lines, optimal M. bovis BCG uptake required the presence of both CD14 and complement receptor 3 (CR3) and co-expression of CD14 and TLR2 markedly enhanced such uptake (28). In bovine macrophages, Souza et al. (2007) demonstrated that mannose receptors and CD14 contributed to Mycobacterium avium phagocytosis (29). Blocking TLR2 receptors in bovine macrophages enhanced killing of Mycobacterium avium paratuberculosis by enabling phagosome maturation within the cell (30). Hence, we might have expected that lower bacterial uptake would be associated with reduced expression of TLR2 and CD14 after F. hepatica infection of animals. However, expression of TLR2 and CD14 was conserved or enhanced in F. hepatica-infected animals (Figure 4b, c, e, f). In agreement with those findings, however, other studies have also shown enhancement of TLR2 expression following helminth infection (33,54). For example, schistosome-specific phosphatidylserine (PS) activated TLR2 in dendritic cells (55). In another study, dendritic cells and B cells from Schistosoma mansoni infected patients with multiple sclerosis, stimulated with soluble egg Ag (SEA), resulted in significant TLR2 upregulation (33). Given this inverse correlation between TLR2–CD14 expression and bacterial uptake, we examined other mechanisms involved in lower mycobacterial uptake by macrophages in the context of F. hepatica infection. For this, we studied the activation phenotype of macrophages after F. hepatica infection. Our results show that M. bovis-stimulated MDM had upregulated mRNA expression of arginase I but downregulated mRNA expression of iNOS, which was associated with lowered production of nitric oxide (Figure 5). Previously, it has been demonstrated that F. hepatica infection and F. hepatica products elicit alternative activation of peritoneal macrophages (56) and of a ruminant macrophage cell line (34). These alternatively activated macrophages, known to develop in F. hepatica...
infections (34, 35), are not as efficient in phagocytosing bacteria as classically activated macrophages. For example, Varin et al. (2010) showed low uptake of Neisseria meningitidis after IL-4 and IL-13 stimulation of murine macrophages which was related to alternative activation of macrophages (36). As our study shows such phenotype switching after *F. hepatica* infection (Figure 5), alternative activation of macrophages could be the reason for a lower bacterial uptake. Additionally, another group found that *F. hepatica* fatty acid binding protein (FABP) induced alternative activation of human macrophages and reduced production of the pro-inflammatory cytokine IL-1β by MDM after LPS stimulation (57). Likewise, we have demonstrated a diminution in IL-1β in MDM stimulated with *M. bovis* after *F. hepatica* infection (Figure 6a). In mycobacterial infections, IL-1β has been described as essential for recruiting immune cells to the site of infection (58). In addition, IL-1β is involved in direct activation of...
humoral immune responses (59), antigen presentation, and expansion and recruitment of T cells to the skin, which in consequence promotes local inflammation in delayed-type hypersensitivity responses (40). As our data show that IL-1β production by M. bovis-infected MDM is reduced when animals are infected with F. hepatica, this could indicate that in co-infected animals, the responsiveness to the SICCT, which is based on a delayed-type hypersensitivity reaction, would be reduced. Moreover, IL-12 together with IL-1β is able to induce IFN-γ production in Th1 lymphocytes (37,38). As we have found that M. bovis-stimulated MDM produced less IL-12 after F. hepatica infection (Figure 6b), this could explain why blood cultures from co-infected animals with F. hepatica had lower IFN-γ production than those infected with M. bovis only (Figure 2) (25,26). Our results also show a reduction in IL-6 production by MDM after F. hepatica infection of cattle. Among the multiple functions of IL-6, it has been described to be a marker for M. tuberculosis infection in mouse peritoneal macrophages (60). In addition, IL-6 has been associated with inhibition of type I interferon, which is involved in disease progression (61) and with differentiation of T cells to the Th17 phenotype (62,63), which contributes to Th1 response expansion (64–66). A reduction in IL-6 production after F. hepatica infection, as shown in our study (Figure 6c, d), would potentially affect bacterial burden, and granuloma formation in M. bovis and BCG infections (64–66). On the other hand, our results show an increase of TGF-β in MDM after F. hepatica infection. This regulatory cytokine has been found to be produced in F. hepatica-infected cattle, in PBMC stimulated with F. hepatica LFH (liver fluke homogenate) (67). In another study, peritoneal macrophages from naïve mice produced TGF-β, IL-10 and arginase I after in vitro stimulation with F. hepatica ES as well as after F. hepatica infection of mice (68). In the context of F. hepatica and mycobacterial co-infection, TGF-β would downregulate the type 1 responses elicited against the bacterial infection. Indeed, a study with humans immunized with M. bovis BCG showed that concurrent helminth infection produced greater levels of TGF-β, which was associated with reduced response to the immunization, affecting vaccine efficacy (69).

In our studies, in summary, bovine MDM infected ex vivo with M. bovis showed strikingly reduced production of IL-6, IL-1β, IL-12 and NO after donor animals were infected with F. hepatica infection. As it has been shown that IFN-γ production in response to mycobacterial infection is dependent on IL-6, IL-1β and IL-12 (37,38,70,71), this could explain the reduced IFN-γ production observed when animals were infected with F. hepatica in the co-infection experiments (Figure 2) (25,26). Additionally, the fact that IL-1β promotes local inflammation in delayed-type hypersensitivity responses (40) indicates that a reduced production of IL-1β in F. hepatica-infected animals could cause a lowered SICCT test reaction in those animals (25,26). Based on these results, we propose that early in the course of M. bovis infection, alternatively activated macrophages limit the uptake of mycobacteria, setting the stage for a slower rate of bacterial proliferation and lesion development, leading to a reduced pro-inflammatory response. In fact, Atkinson et al. (2000) showed that production of TNF-α, IL-12, IL-6 and IL-10 by human MDM was dependent on the M. bovis BCG dose used, so that lowered bacterial dose reduced cytokine production (72). As macrophages produce cytokines upon stimulation (73), a reduced stimulus elicited by an inefficient phagocytosis (in our case lowered M. bovis uptake) could decrease a pro-inflammatory response (74). Therefore, we hypothesize that this immune downregulation may induce a latency-like state in co-infected animals, which would explain why cattle herds with high prevalence of fasciolosis would have lower reactivity in tests for BTB. This hypothesis is consistent with the data on an epidemiological scale shown by Claridge et al. (2012) who showed the under-ascertainment rate of BTB was about one-third in herds infected with F. hepatica (6).

Latent infections with M. tuberculosis in humans are extremely common, with some estimates indicating that up to one-third of the world’s population are latently infected (19), representing a reservoir from which clinically apparent infections can emerge, given appropriate environmental circumstances. Latent infection is characterized by asymptomatic, chronic infection, with lowered responsiveness to skin testing (75). Latent M. bovis infections in cattle have not been described. However, the presence of such infections in cattle is suggested by findings such as IFN-γ test (23,76) and skin test positivity (77,78) in animals that lack lesions at post-mortem; the positive culture of bacteria in animals without lesions (44,79); and IFN-γ positive and skin test negative animals, which later convert to positive, that have lesions at post-mortem examination (78). Studies on the influence of concurrent helminth infections on latent/active tuberculosis in humans have given contradictory results. Babu et al. (2009) observed a reduction in mycobacterial-specific TLR2 and TLR4 expression as well as a decrease in pro-inflammatory production in individuals with filariasis/TB in comparison with patients with TB only (8). However, subsequent studies by this group observed no alteration in the incidence of progression from latent to active tuberculosis in populations co-infected with gastrointestinal and/or filarial nematodes (80).

Such apparent paradoxes can be resolved by considering that helminth infection limits the pro-inflammatory environment, favouring a slower development of
mycobacteria, with reduced bacterial loads, but a higher diagnostic barrier for immune-based detection assays. This may ensure a strategy to maintain M. bovis in the population by increasing the reservoir of undetected infection. Therefore, these findings have significant implications for the control of bovine TB and especially for eradication programmes based on detection and slaughter of infected animals.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was supported by Science Foundation Ireland grant 09/IN.1/B2625. The authors are very grateful to Eddie Jordan and Frank Griffith for providing valuable assistance in sourcing and handling cattle in UCD Lyons Farm, to Dr Lynanne McCallan and David Corbett for their expertise with bacteriology and experimental infections in the co-infection experiments in AFBI and to Dr Dave Magee and Dr Claire Healy for their advice in the in vitro bacterial work in UCD. Alfonso Blanco acknowledges the assistance of the ISAC Scholars Program.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

LG carried out the design of the experiments and the experimental work and wrote the manuscript. JOS contributed to the design of experimental methodology and carried out the experimental work. AB designed and supervised the flow cytometry experiments. JMN and MW designed and carried out the co-infection studies. RF contributed to interpretation of the data and revision of the manuscript. DW and PD suggested and carried out the statistical analysis of bacterial recovery following in vivo experiments. JC analysed the pathology of the lesions. GM conceived the study, edited the manuscript and managed the collaborations. All authors contributed to the intellectual discussion and structure of the manuscript.

REFERENCES

1. Thompson-Crispi KA, Sargolzaei M, Ventura R, et al. A genome-wide association study of immune response traits in Canadian Holstein cattle. BMC Genom 2014; 15: 559.
2. Deshpande P, Lucas M & Gaudieri S. Analysis of Genetic Variation in Animals. Calisakam M, editor. InTech; 2012 [cited 2015 Mar 20]. Available from: http://www.intecopen.com/books/analysis-of-genetic-variation -in-animals/genetic-variation-of-host-immune-response-genes-and-their-effect-on-hepatitis- c-infection-and-treatment
3. Allen AR, Minozzi G, Glass EI, et al. Bovine tuberculosis: the genetic basis of host susceptibility. Proc Biol Sci 2010; 277: 2737–2745.
4. Garza-Cuartero L, Garcia-Campos A, Zimt A, et al. The worm turns: trematodes steering the course of co-infections. Vet Pathol 2018; 55: 385–392.
5. Li X-X & Zhou X-N. Co-infection of tuberculosis and parasitic diseases in humans: a systematic review. Parasit Vectors 2013; 6: 79.
6. Claridge J, Diggle P, McCann CM, et al. Fasciola hepatica is associated with the failure to detect bovine tuberculosis in dairy cattle. Nat Commun Nature Publishing Group, a division of Macmillan Publishers Limited. All Rights Reserved. 2012; 3: 853.
7. Thaugpen MC, Fuller SJ, Kazembe PN, et al. Associations between peripheral Plasmodium falciparum malaria parasitemia, human immunodeficiency virus, and concurrent helminthic infection among pregnant women in Malawi. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2011; 84: 379–385.
8. Babu S, Bhat SQ, Kumar NP, et al. Attenuation of toll-like receptor expression and function in latent tuberculosis by coexistent filarial infection with restoration following antifilarial chemotherapy. PLoS Negl Trop Dis 2009; 3: 489.
9. McSorley HJ & Maizels RM. Helminth infections and host immune regulation. Clin Microbiol Rev 2012; 25: 585–608.
10. Girgis NM, Gundra UM & Loke P. Immune regulation during helminth infections. Knoll LJ, editor. PLoS Pathog Public Library of Science; 2013; e1003250 Available from: http://dx.plos.org/10.1371/journal.ppat.1003250 Jan [cited 2014 May 8].
11. Du Plessis N, Kleyhans L, Thriart L, et al. Acute helminth infection enhances early macrophage mediated control of mycobacterial infection. Mucosal Immunol 2013; 6: 931–941.
12. Abruzzi A & Fried B. Coinfection of Schistosoma (Trematoda) with bacteria, protozoa and helminths. Adv Parasitol 2011; 77: 1–85.
13. Bucher K, Dietz K, Lackner P, et al. Schistosoma co-infection protects against brain pathology but does not prevent severe disease and death in a murine model of cerebral malaria. Int J Parasitol 2011; 41: 21–31.
14. Potian MC, Filler SJ, Kazembe PN, et al. Associations between peripheral Plasmodium falciparum malaria parasitemia, human immunodeficiency virus, and concurrent helminthic infection among pregnant women in Malawi. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2011; 84: 379–385.
15. Aitken MM, Jones PW, Hall GA, Hughes DL & Collis KA. Effects of experimental Salmonella dublin infection in cattle given Fasciola hepatica thirteen weeks previously. J Comp Pathol 1970;01/01 ed. 1978; 88: 75–84.
16. Brady MT, O’Neill SM, Dalton JP & Mills KH. Fasciola hepatica suppresses a protective Th1 response against Bordetella pertussis. Infect Immun 1999; 67: 5372–5378.
17. Selemetas N, Phelan P, O’Kieley P & Waal T de. Weather and soil type affect incidence of fasciolosis in dairy cow herds. Vet Rec BMJ Publishing Group Limited; 2014; 175: 371.
18. European Commission. Research – International Co-operation in Food, Agriculture and Biotechnology Research. 2012. Available from: http://ec.europa.eu/research/biosociety/ inco/projects/0047_en.html [cited 2012 Dec 19].
19. WHO. WHO | Tuberculosis. World Health Organization; 2014. Available from: http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs104/en/ [cited 2014 Oct 29].
20. Gilbert M, Mitchell A, Bourn D, Mawdsley J, Clifton-Hadley R & Wint W. Cattle movements and bovine tuberculosis in Great Britain. Nature 2005; 435: 491–496.
21. De laRua-Domenech R, Goodchild AT, Vordermeier HM, Hewinson RG, Chris tiansen KH & Clifton-Hadley RS. Antemortem diagnosis of tuberculosis in cattle: a review of the tuberculosis tests, gamma-interferon assay and other ancillary diagnostic techniques. Rev Vet Sci 2006; 81: 190–210.
22. Palmer MV, Thacker TC, Waters WR, Gortiázar C & Corner LAL. Mycobacterium bovis: A Model Pathogen at the Interface of Livestock, Wildlife, and Humans Vet Med Int 2012; 2012: 236–205.
23. Alvarez J, de Juan L, Bezos J, et al. Effect of paratuberculosis on the diagnosis of bovine tuberculosis in a cattle herd with a mixed infection using interferon-gamma detection assay. Vet Microbiol 2009; 135: 389–393.
Tominaga K, Yoshimoto T, Torigoe K, et al. IL-12 synergizes with IL-18 or IL-1beta for IFN-gamma production from human T cells. *Int Immunol* 2000; 12: 151–160.

Watford WT, Hissong BD, Bream JH, Kanno Y, Musl L & O'Shea JJ. Signaling by IL-12 and IL-23 and the immunoregulatory roles of STAT4. *Immunol Rev* 2004; 202: 139–156.

McLoughlin RM, Witowski J, Robson RL, et al. Interplay between IFN-gamma and IL-6 signaling governs neutrophil trafficking and apoptosis during acute inflammation. *J Clin Invest* 2003; 112: 598–607.

Nambu A, Nakae S & Iwakura Y. IL-1beta, but not IL-1alpha, is required for antigen-specific T cell activation and the induction of local inflammation in the delayed-type hypersensitivity responses. *Int Immunol* 2006; 18: 975–980.

Weiss DJ, Souza CD, Evanson OA, Sanders M & Rutherford M. Bovine monocyte TLR2 receptors differentially regulate the intracellular fate of Mycobacterium avium subsp. paratuberculosis. *Am J Vet Res* 2008; 69: 115–124.

Raby A-C, Holst B, Le Bouder E, et al. Targeting the TLR2 co-receptor CD14 with TLR2-derived peptides modulates immune responses to pathogens. *Sci Transl Med* 2013; 5: 185ra64.

Correale J & Farez M. Helminth antigens modulate innate immune responses in cells from multiple sclerosis patients through TLR2-dependent mechanisms. *J Immunol* 2009; 183: 5999–6012.

Flynn RJ, Irwin JA, Olivier M, Sekiya M, Dalton JP & Mulcahy G. Alternative activation of ruminant macrophages by Fasciola hepatica. *Vet Immunol Immunopathol* 2007; 120: 205–215.

Golden O, Flynn RJ, Read C, et al. Protection of cattle against a natural infection of Fasciola hepatica by vaccination with recombinant cathepsin L1 (rFhCL1). *Vaccine* 2010; 28: 5551–5557 2010/0706 ed.

Varin A, Mukhopadhyay S, Herbin G & Gordon S. Alternative activation of macrophages by IL-4 impairs phagocytosis of pathogens but potentiates microbial-induced signalling and cytokine secretion. *Blood American Society of Hematology* 2010; 115: 353–362.
pulmonary CD4+ T cell responses after vaccination and during Mycobacterium tuberculosis challenge. *Nat Immunol* 2007; 8: 369–377.

65 Wozniak TM, Ryan AA & Britton WJ. Interleukin-23 restores immunity to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* infection in IL-12p40-deficient mice and is not required for the development of IL-17-secreting T cell responses. *J Immunol* 2006; 177: 8684–8692.

66 Happel KI, Lockhart EA, Mason CM, et al. Pulmonary interleukin-23 gene delivery increases local T-cell immunity and controls growth of *Mycobacterium* tuberculosis in the lungs. *Infect Immun* 2005; 73: 5782–5788.

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco- 

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco- 

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.

68 Guascetti L, Serradell MC, Garro AP, Iaco-

67 Flynn RJ & Mulcahy G. The roles of IL-10 and TGF-beta in controlling IL-4 and IFN-gamma production during experimental *Fasciola hepatica* hepatic infection. *Int J Parasitol* 2008; 38: 1673–1680 2008/07/04 ed.