BM-MSCs differentiated to chondrocytes for treatment of full-thickness cartilage defect of the knee

CURRENT STATUS: UNDER REVIEW

Journal of Orthopaedic Surgery and Research  BMC

Rodrigo Mardones
hip and pelvis surgery centre CDMA

Alessio Giai Via
United Hospital

alessiogiaivia@hotmail.it
Corresponding Author
ORCiD: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5943-081X

Gennaro Pipino
University of Malta

Claudio Jofrè
Clinica Las Condes

Sara Muñoz
Clinica Las Condes

Edgar Narvaez
Clinica Las Condes

Nicola Maffulli
Universita degli Studi di Salerno Dipartimento di Medicina e Chirurgia

DOI: 10.21203/rs.3.rs-23865/v1

SUBJECT AREAS
Orthopedics Orthopedic Surgery

KEYWORDS
Mesenchymal stem cells, cartilage injury, articular cartilage, knee, collagen scaffold
Abstract

Background

Full-thickness articular cartilage injury of the knee is a major cause of disability. The aim of this study is to assess the results of patients treated with differentiated to chondrocytes bone marrow Mesenchymal Stem Cells (BM-MSCs) cultured on a collagen Type I/III (Chondro-Gide®) scaffold. The secondary aim was to confirm the absence of adverse events.

Methods

Fifteen patients (19 knees) with symptomatic full-thickness cartilage defects of the knee have been enrolled for the study. Bone marrow was harvested from the iliac crest, BM-MSCs were prepared, and expanded cells were grown in a standard medium or in a standard culture medium containing TGF-β. BM-MSCs differentiated to chondrocytes were seeded in a porcine collagen Type I/III scaffold (Chondro-Gide®), and cultured in TGF-β containing media. After 4 weeks, the membrane was sutured on the cartilage defect. All patients underwent plain radiographs of the knee (antero-posterior, lateral, and axial view of the patella), and MRI of the affected knee. The Oxford knee score, the Lysholm scale, and the VAS score were administered to all patients. At final follow-up a MRI for the study of articular cartilage was undertaken.

Results

The mean size of the cartilage lesions was 20 × 17 mm (range, 15 × 10 mm – 30 × 30 mm). At final follow-up, the median Oxford knee score and Lysholm scale scores significantly improved from 29 (range 12–39; SD 7,39) to 45 (range 24–48; SD 5,6) and from 55.5 (range 25–81; SD 17,7) to 94.5 (58–100; SD 10,8) respectively. Pain, according the VAS score, significantly improved. 60% of patients reported their satisfaction as excellent, 20% as good, 14% as fair, and 1 patient as poor.

Conclusion

The treatment of full-thickness chondral injuries of the knee with differentiated to chondrocytes BM-MSCs and Chondro-Gide® scaffold showed encouraging outcomes. Further studies involving more patients, and with longer follow-up, are required in order to evaluate the effectiveness of the treatment and the long-term results.

Introduction

Chondral injuries of the knee are a major cause of short- and long-term disability for active patients,
and their management is challenging. Articular cartilage, a highly organized tissue with considerable durability, has limited intrinsic healing capability. Cartilage injuries frequently result in knee pain, functional impairment and early osteoarthrosis. Currently, the treatment for end-stage degenerative knee joint pathology is arthroplasty. Surgery for symptomatic cartilage defects, including microfractures, osteotomies, or autologous osteochondral graft transplantation, aims to restore normal joint congruity and minimize further deterioration. However, the long-term results are often poor, therefore great interest arose on the development of regenerative medicine and tissue engineering approaches. Recently investigations have reported on the local implantation or intra-articular injection of concentrated bone marrow or adipose-derived MSCs, but the results are controversial.

We report the results of a novel treatment of full-thickness cartilage defects of the knee. Bone Marrow Mesenchymal Stem Cells (BM-MSCs) were harvested from the iliac crest, expanded in a laboratory facility, differentiated to chondrocytes on a collagen-based scaffold (Chondro-Gide®), and finally sutured on the cartilage defect of the knee. The primary aim of this study was to assess the mid-term results of such procedure. The secondary aim was to confirm the absence of adverse events. The working hypothesis is that the implantation of BM-MSCs differentiated to chondrocytes with a collagen scaffold significantly improved pain and function of patients with full thickness cartilage defects of the knee.

Materials And Methods
We retrospectively analysed the prospectively collected data of 15 patients who underwent surgery for articular cartilage defect of the knee between June 2012 and January 2015. All patients had signed a written consent, and the study was approved by the local Internal Review Board (IRB-Clinica Las Condes, Santiago de Chile, Chile).

Inclusion and exclusion criteria
The inclusion criteria were patients with symptomatic full-thickness cartilage defect of the knee, despite a minimum of 3 months of conservative treatments, a Kellgren-Lawrence OA grade 1 or 2, age
older than 18 years. The exclusion criteria were patients older than 50 years, knee instability, varus or valgus malalignment higher than 5°, previous intra-articular fractures. Patients with rheumatological conditions, chronic renal failure, previous joint infections, neoplasia, or psychiatric disorders were excluded. Patients who were not able to sign the informed consent or to follow the post-operatory instructions were not included into the study. Fifteen patients met the inclusion criteria.

**Patient assessment**

A detailed physical examination was conducted in all patients, who were examined by fully trained orthopaedic surgeons with a special interest in knee surgery. All patients underwent standard weight-bearing anterior-posterior (AP) plain radiographs, lateral views of the knee and axial view of the patella. An MRI confirmed the focal cartilage defect. Osteoarthritis of the knee was evaluated according Kellgren-Lawrence osteoarthrosis classification. The grade of the cartilage defect were classified according the Outerbridge classification. The Oxford knee score and the Tegner-Lyhsolm scoring scale were administered to all patients before surgery (T0) and final follow-up (T1).

According the Oxford knee score, scores lower than 19 were considered as poor outcomes, from 20 to 29 as fair, from 30 to 39 as good, and score equal or higher than 40 as excellent. Scores lower than 65 were considered as poor according the Tegner-Lyhsolm scoring scale, from 65 to 83 as fair, from 84 to 90 as good, and scores higher than 90 as excellent. The VAS score was also administered preoperatively and at each control. At final follow-up, an MRI was also performed. All patients were examined by a fellow who had not been involved in their original management.

**Isolation, expansion and characterization of BM-MSCs**

BM-MSCs were cultured from each of the 15 patients reported in the present investigation. Briefly, 40 mL of bone-marrow (BM) were aspirated from the iliac crest, and mononuclear cells were isolated from BM aspirates by density gradient centrifugation using LymphoprepTM (Stemcell Technologies, Cambridge, MA, USA). The BM mononuclear cells were then plated at a density of $3.5 \times 10^5$ cells per cm² in T225 flask with 40 mL of customized alpha modified Eagle medium (α-MEM) (GibcoInvitrogen,
USA) supplemented with 10% (v/v) Australian fetal bovine serum (FBS) (Corning, NY, USA) and 1% (v/v) penicillin-streptomycin (50 μg/mL) + amphotericin B (Pen-strep, Biological Industries, USA) and incubated at 37°C in humidified atmosphere containing 5% CO₂. After 48 hours, the nonadherent cells were washed off gently with Dulbecco’s phosphate-buffered saline (DPBS; Hyclone, USA), and the flasks were microscopically verified for fibroblast-like adherent cells. After 14 to 21 days, cells were trypsinized using 0.25% trypsin-EDTA (Biological Industries, USA) and passaged at 10,000 cells/cm² for another 7 to 12 days, followed by a final cell harvesting and counting to determine the final cell number before seeding them into the scaffold. In each step of harvesting, population doubling level (PDL) was calculated as followed: PDL = X + 3.322 (log Y – log I), where: X = initial population doubling level, I = Initial cell number seeded into the vessel and Y = final cell yield, or the number of cells at the end of the growth period (Supplementary Table1). For cell surface antigen analysis, cells were harvested, washed with cytometer buffer (PBS + 0.2% BSA + 0.01% sodium azide (all from Sigma-Aldrich), and incubated with the specific labelled antibodies in cytometer buffer for 20 minutes at 4°C. Antibodies for human cell surface antigens CD11b-AF488, CD29-PE, CD73-PE, CD90-FITC, CD105-PE, CD34-PE, CD19-PE, CD45-FITC and HLADR-PE were purchased from R&D Systems (Minneapolis, MN, USA). In all experiments, matching isotype antibodies were used as negative controls. Data were collected using a fluorescence-activated cell sorting (FACS)-Vantage-SE flow cytometry system running CellQuest software (BD). The fluorescence signals were collected using logarithmic amplification (BD Biosciences), and analyzed on Flowjo analysis software (FlowJo LLC, Ashland, Oregon, USA).

**In Vitro Chondrogenesis and Cell Seeding of BM-MSC into Scaffold.**

BM-MSCs from the 15 patients were seeded at a density of 1x10⁶ cells/cm² in 1 mL of standard culture medium per 4 x 5 cm piece of Chondro-Gide in non-tissue culture coated plates. After 30 min of incubation at 37°C to allow the cells adhere to the cell scaffolds, an additional 9 mL of standard culture medium was added. This was repeated for 3 days according to our cell seeding protocol. From day five, chondrogenic induction was started with chondrogenic induction medium containing α-MEM.
+ ITS premix (Sigma Aldrich), ascorbic acid (37.5 ug/mL) (Sigma Aldrich B4461) and TGF-β1 10 ng/mL (B&D, NY). Culture medium was replaced 3 times per week for 15 days. Histological analysis was performed to verify cell adhesion and glycosaminoglycans (GAG) deposition to the scaffold before surgery (Fig. 3).

**Surgical technique**

Under spinal anesthesia and with the patient supine, the lower limb was prepped and draped in the usual sterile fashion. A tourniquet was applied at the upper thigh, the lower limb exsanguinated, and the tourniquet inflated to 300 mmHg. A midline incision and a medial parapatellar arthrotomy were performed. The cartilage defect was identified, debrided, and the borders of the defect were regularized up to obtain a stable cartilage layer. The size of the defect was measured. After performing microfractures, the collagen matrix scaffold containing BM-MSCs differentiated to chondrocytes was sutured on the peripheral healthy cartilage using Prolene® (Ethicon) n.6.0 suture (Fig. 1). The tourniquet was deflated. The joint capsule was sutured. The wound was closed with subcuticular 2.0 Vicryl suture, and a sterile dressing was applied. All patients received intravenous controlled analgesia for 24-48 hours after surgery, and standard thromboembolic prophylaxis with low molecular weight heparin (LMWE) for 30 days.

**Postoperative protocol**

All patients received the same rehabilitation program. Walking with 2 crutches without weightbearing on the operated leg was indicated for 4 weeks. Passive motion of the knee was encouraged from the first post-operative day, and a continuous passive motion device was indicated twice a day for 4 weeks, for at least 20 minutes each (up to 1 hour). Isometric strengthening exercises of the quadriceps and gluteus muscles was performed. The patients were examined at 4 weeks after surgery, when progressive full weightbearing was indicated. The patients begun a walk training program, proprioceptive exercises and continue strengthening exercises. Patients were encouraged to walk without crutches as tolerated from the 6th post-operative week.

**Statistical analysis**

Descriptive statistics are presented as mean (±SD). Student’s t test for independent samples was
used to detect for differences between baseline and follow-up for each variable. To assess reliability and variability of the measures, we calculated the coefficient of variation (CV = SD/mean %). A p value <0.05 was considered statistically significant. Statistical analysis was performed by using SigmaPlot 11.0 software (Systat Software, Tulsa, OK, USA).

Results

**MSC and collagen membrane characterization**

Bone marrow aspirates with a mean volume of 42 ± 5 mL were collected from each of 15 patients. BM-MSCs were isolated by plastic adherence and expanded in tissue-culture flasks under GMPc culture conditions. Following cell isolation, BM-MSCs exhibited spindle fibroblast-like morphology in culture (Fig. 2), and they expressed classical MSCs surface markers, such as CD105, CD90 and CD73, in the absence of hematopoietic cell surface markers CD34 and CD45 (Fig.3). In each of 15 patients, the above phenotype was consistent, confirming the MSCs phenotype previously described.

According to our scaffold seeding protocol, 1x10^6 BM-MSCs with no more than P3 were seeded at day 1 on the porous side of the scaffold; the same quantity of cells was seeded on the smooth side of the scaffold on day 2, and on day 3, 1x10^6 cells were seeded again on the porous side of the scaffold. From day 5 on, chondrogenic medium with α-MEM + ITS premix (Sigma Aldrich BC6354), ascorbic acid (37.5 ug/mL) (Sigma Aldrich B4461) and TGF- β1 10 ng/mL (B&D, NY) was added, and changed every 2 days. On day 15 the scaffolds were harvested, fixed in 10% neutral buffered formalin for 24 hours, then processed and paraffin embedded for histological analysis (Fig.4). The cells showed a high rate conversion to chondrocytes, with a mean cell density attachment of 16% ± 3.6. The MSC differentiated to chondrocytes were more evident at the periphery of the scaffold with abundant GAG deposition on the complete scaffold, acknowledging that the MSC had differentiated to chondrocytes.

**Surgical findings and clinical outcomes**

Four patients had a bilateral cartilage injury of the knee, for a total of 19 knees. The mean size of the cartilage lesions was 20 x 17 mm (range, 15 x 10 mm - 30 x 30 mm). The characteristics of the patients and of the cartilage defects are shown in table I. The mean follow-up was 32 months (range, 12–46 months, S.D. 9 months). No patients were lost to follow-up.
Table I: Characteristics of the patients. The grade of the defect have been classify according the Outerbridge classification. MPFL: medial patella-femoral ligament; ACL: anterior cruciate ligament

| Patients | Age | BMI  | Follow-up (months) | Grade of the injury | Site of the defect | Width of the defect (mm) | Procedure                     |
|----------|-----|------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------|
| n.1      | 46  | 25.8 | 46                 | IV III              | Medial condyle    | 30 x 18 20 x 20          | No                            |
| n.2      | 37  | 32.4 | 45                 | IV IV               | Patella           | 35 x 30 35 x 30          | Knee arthroscopy, Microfra apparatus |
| n.3      | 25  | 28.3 | 46                 | IV                 | Patella Troclea   | 12 x 14                  | No                            |
| n.4      | 33  | 21   | 46                 | IV                 | Patella           | 15 x 15                  | No                            |
| n.5      | 33  | 24.8 | 36                 | III                | Medial condyle    | 26 x 30                  | Medial meniscectomy            |
| n.6      | 18  | 20.7 | 37                 | IV                 | Medial tibial plateau | 15 x 10                 | Arthroscopy                   |
| n.7      | 38  | 21.6 | 29                 | IV                 | Medial condyle    | 25 x 20                  | Knee arthroscopy, MPFL recons |
| n.8      | 34  | 27   | 30                 | IV                 | Patella Troclea   | 10 x 20 10 x 15          | MPFL reconstruction             |
| n.9      | 34  | 26.5 | 30                 | III                | Medial condyle    | 20 x 20                  | ACL recons                    |
| n.10     | 51  | 27.5 | 28                 | IV                 | Medial condyle    | 30 x 25                  | Knee arthroscopy, microf racture |
| n.11     | 40  | 23   | 18                 | IV IV               | Patella Troclea   | 30 x 20 20 x 20          | Knee arthroscopy, Open osteo |
| n.12     | 24  | 32.4 | 24                 | III                | Lateral condyle   | 20 x 15                  | Open wedge osteotomy           |
| n.12     | 24  | 32.4 | 27                 | IV                 | Lateral condyle   | 20 x 20                  | Open wedge osteotomy           |
| n.13     | 48  | 26   | 24                 | IV                 | Medial and lateral Patella’s facets | 30 x 9               | No                            |
| n.14     | 20  | 26   | 24                 | IV                 | Patella           | 10 x 15                  | No                            |
| n.15     | 32  | 25.9 | 24                 | IV                 | Lateral condyle   | 20 x 18                  | No                            |
Before treatment, the median Oxford knee score was 29 (mean 27.3; range 12-39; SD 7.38), and the median Tegner-Lysholm scoring scale was 55 (mean 55.9; range 25-81; SD 17.7). At final follow-up, the median Oxford knee score and Lysholm scale scores significantly improved to 45 (mean 43.3; range 28-48; SD 5.6) and 94.5 (mean 91.0; range 58-100; SD 10.8) respectively (P<0.01 for both). The VAS score showed a statistically significant improvement from its preoperative value to final follow-up. The median preoperatory VAS score was 4 at rest (mean VAS 3.8; range 2-6, S.D.1.37) and 7 (mean VAS 6.25; range 3-8, S.D.1.8) during working or sporting activities, while at final follow-up it had improved to a median of 0 at rest (mean VAS 0.5; range 0-3, S.D.1.09) and 1 during working or sporting activities (mean 1.6; range 0-5; SD 1.74) (p<0.01). With regards to overall satisfaction with the surgery, 60% of patients reported their satisfaction as excellent, 20% as good, 14% as fair, and 1 patient as poor. Most patients returned to practice sports; in particular one patients returned to run marathons, and another one returned to run mountain marathons. The latter patient reported mild discomfort and some swelling after competition.

One patient developed stiffness of the operated knee, and required manipulation under anesthesia and arthroscopic arthrolysis. No further complications were reported in this series, both in the short- and long-term. In particular, the final MRI control did not identify hypertrophy of the graft.

**Imaging findings**

At MRI at the final follow, the T2 cartilage maps showed a full thickness coverage of the defect in all patients. At the site of the repair, the T2 mapping showed the presence of a heterogeneous tissue, more similar to the near healthy cartilage (Fig. 5, Fig. 6, Fig. 7).

**Discussion**

Cartilage injuries of the knee are a common major cause of pain and disability, and they are difficult to manage. Given their histological features and the lack of blood supply, full-thickness defects have limited healing potential, and usually evolve to early osteoarthritis.\(^1\) Multiple therapeutic strategies have been used to manage cartilage injuries, including microfractures, scaffolds, regenerative therapies and combination techniques.\(^1,2\) However, the great variability of treatments, the relatively
small study sizes, the short-term follow-up of most of the studies, and the lack of level I studies make it difficult to identify a gold standard procedure. However, the large number of articles and reviews underline the interest on this topic.

Great interest has been invested on cell-based therapies to improve cartilage healing, and autologous chondrocytes implantation has produced good clinical outcomes. Good clinical and functional outcomes have been confirmed by clinical trials at 10 years follow-up for large (>4 cm²) full-thickness cartilage defects of the knee. However, the donor site morbidity, the need of two-steps surgery, the costs of the procedures, the loss of the original properties of the graft secondary to fibrous cartilage-like tissue formation are the most frequent drawbacks of this procedure. MSCs have recently been widely studied for regenerative medicine purposes. They are relatively simple to harvest and isolate, they are able to self-renew and differentiate into specialized cells, making MSCs a promising treatment option for a variety of clinical conditions.

Currently, three different MSCs transplantation protocols exist. The first consists in the aspiration and concentration of MSCs. Bone marrow (BM-MSCs) or adipose tissue (Ad-MSCs) are the most common sources of MSCs. Many different devices are available which allow to harvest and concentrate MSCs, obtaining a mixed cell population, including also erythrocytes, leukocytes, and endothelial cells. After preparation, MSCs can be seeded on a scaffold or injected into the joint. These products do not imply substantial cell manipulation, making their use easier and less expensive, because all the treatment can be performed in a single procedure. However, the amount of MSCs is usually lower compared to the other protocols, although this does not imply that it is less effective, with several clinical and histological studies showing the formation of cartilage-like tissue, and good results at short-term follow up.

The second protocol consists into harvest, isolation and expansion in vitro of MSCs, prior to implantation with a scaffold or by injection. The in vitro step allows to select a more homogeneous cells population. The number of cells administered to the patient is higher than the
previous method, and it can be precisely determined. However, this procedure requires two steps, and it is usually more expensive. Few clinical studies have been published on knee and hip defects, showing promising results regarding pain and functional scores. The authors recently published on 20 patients (29 hips) treated with hip arthroscopy for femoro-acetabular impingement (FAI) and focal cartilage injuries, or mild to moderate hip osteoarthrosis, followed by 3 intra-articular injections of expanded BM-MSCs (20x10^6 BM-MSCs) from 4 to 6 postoperative weeks. An improvement in VAS score and all functional scores in most of patients have been reported at 2 years follow-up. No major complications were reported, but transient hip pain was present in 6 patients. Other authors reported promising results on focal cartilage defects and osteoarthritis of the knee. However, many concerns related to the extensive in vitro cell manipulation still exist. Furthermore, strict laws exist on the in vitro cells manipulation, making more complex their use in vivo for clinical trials or clinical purposes.  

The last method consists in the isolation, expansion and pre-differentiation in vitro of MSCs. MSCs are seeded onto a scaffold, cultivated and pre-differentiated in vitro into chondrocytes for 2 to 4 weeks before implantation into the chondral defect. Pre-clinical studies showed promising results with the use of precultivated MSCs. In animals studies, Zscharnach et al and Marquasset al reported that precultivated MSCs produced better repair tissue compared to concentrated MSCs, both at 6 weeks and 1 year. Histological analysis showed better cells distribution, matrix production, and a superior International Cartilage Repair Society (ICRS) score compared to controls. Furthermore, no degradation of the repair tissue was observed up to 12 months.  

Even though many authors investigated the differentiation potentials of MSCs in vitro, several limitations have been encountered during their use in vivo. Both BM-MSCs transplantation and non-precultivated, or isolated and expanded MSCs transplantation, resulted in encouraging clinical outcomes, with the growth of hyaline-like cartilage based on imaging, arthroscopic and histological examination. However, there is still lack of evidence on the differentiation of MSCs into chondrocytes in clinical human studies. Pre-differentiated to chondrocytes MSCs showed very
encouraging result in animals, suggesting that they could be used in the treatment of osteochondral defects, but to our knowledge no clinical studies have been published. To our knowledge, therefore, this is the first human clinical study on the treatment of focal full-thickness cartilage injury of the knee with using differentiated to cartilage BM-MSCs (Fig 8).

Using pre-differentiated MSCs, we are able exploit many of the advantages of MSCs therapy. In particular, a high number of MSCs is available following expansion, and the stimulation of the chondrogenesis allows to increase the mechanical stability of the implant. This should improve outcome at long-term follow-up, compared to previous studies. We are aware that in the present study patients were followed for a little less than 3 years. Nevertheless, many patients had resumed sporting activities (running, spinning, and long-distance running) without problems or pain, and others referred no pain and no swelling of the operated knee at the final follow-up. About 80% of the patients were very satisfied or satisfied with the surgery, while only one patient, who had undergone multiple knee procedures, reporting to be unsatisfied. The need of a two-steps procedure, the long time between the harvesting of BM-MSCs and the final implantation of the scaffold (4 weeks), the higher risk of contamination compared to the one-step procedure, and the higher costs, are the most important limits of this procedure.

We are aware of the limitations of our study. The first is the small size of our cohort, 15 patients. The middle-term follow-up did not allow us to draw final conclusions on longer-term outcomes of these procedure. However, most of the studies published in literature have a follow-up shorter than 3 years. We point out that this is a preliminary study, and we aim to continue to follow them to publish a study with longer-follow-up. Also, there was no control group, but to our knowledge no published studies compared MSCs-therapy to controls or other techniques. Many patients had undergone previous knee surgeries, including microfractures, partial meniscectomy, ACL reconstruction, and medial patellofemoral ligament reconstruction. Our clinic is a tertiary referral centre for sports traumatology, accounting for the fact that some patients had been treated previously in others hospitals, than subsequently came to our attention.

Conclusion
Full-thickness cartilage injuries of the knee are major causes of pain and disability. Despite all the recent efforts, no procedure can guarantee success, and the published long term results of many procedures are not satisfactory. MSCs showed great potentials in the treatment of this complex pathology, even though the complexity of MSCs metabolism and their therapeutic effects does not allow to draw definitive conclusions. We report promising results using BM-MSCs differentiated to chondrocytes and collagen Type I/III scaffold for treatment of full-thickness chondral injuries of the knee. However, further studies involving more patients, and with longer follow-up are needed to evaluate the effectiveness of this treatment modality and its long-term results.

**Abbreviations**

MSCs: mesenchymal stem cells  
BM-MSCs: bone marrow-MSCs  
AD-MSCs: adipose derived-MSCs  
MPFL: medial patella-femoral ligament  
ACL: anterior cruciate ligament

**Declarations**

Ethics approval and consent to participate: The study was approved by the local Internal Review Board (IRB-Clinica Las Condes, Santiago de Chile, Chile).

Consent for publication: All patients had signed a written consent.

Availability of data and material: All data generated or analysed during this study are included in this published article [and its supplementary information files]. The datasets used and/or analysed during the current study are also available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

Competing interests: AGV, SM, GP and NM declare no competing interests. RM: Regenerative Cell Therapy Center Bioscell, Santiago de Chile. CJ: Regenerative Cell Therapy Center Bioscell, Santiago de Chile. EN: Regenerative Cell Therapy Center Bioscell. The Bioscell company had no role in the design or conduct of the study, in the analysis and interpretation of data, or in the preparation of the manuscript.

Funding: This study was not financially supported.
Authors' contributions: RM designed the study and performed all the surgeries. CMJ and EN cultured, differentiated the BM-MSCs to chondrocytes and prepared the scaffold. SM analyzed the X-ray and MRI images. RM and AGV examined the patients, AGV wrote the manuscript. RM, GP, NM supervised, reviewed and gave the final approbation to the manuscript

Acknowledgements: none

References
1 Sophia Fox AJ, Bedi A, Rodeo SA. The basic science of articular cartilage: structure, composition, and function. Sports Health. 2019;1:461-468. doi: 10.1177/1941738109350438.
2 Makris EA, Gomoll AH,. Malizos KN, Hu JC, Kyriacos A. Repair and tissue engineering techniques for articular cartilage. Nat Rev Rheumatol. 2015;11: 21–34. PMID: 25247412
3 Mithoefer K, McAdams T, Williams RJ, Kreuz PC, Mandelbaum BR. Clinical efficacy of the microfracture technique for articular cartilage repair in the knee: an evidence-based systematic analysis. Am J Sports Med. 2009; 37:2053-2063. doi: 10.1177/0363546508328414
4 Minas T, Von Keudell A, Bryant T, Gomoll AH. The John Insall Award: a minimum 10-year outcome study of autologous chondrocyte implantation. Clin Orthop Relat Res. 2014; 472:41–51. doi: 10.1007/s11999-013-3146-9.
5 Bentley G, Biant LC, Vijayan S, Macmull S, Skinner JA, Carrington RWJ. Minimum ten-year results of a prospective randomised study of autologous chondrocyte implantation versus mosaicplasty for symptomatic articular cartilage lesions of the knee. J Bone Joint Surg Br. 2012;94:504–509. doi: 10.1302/0301-620X.94B4.27495
6 Lopa S, Colombini A, Moretti M, de Girolamo L. Injectable mesenchymal stem cell-based treatments for knee osteoarthritis: from mechanisms of action to current clinical evidences. Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc. 2019 Jun;27(6):2003-2020. doi: 10.1007/s00167-018-5118-9.
7 Filardo G, Madry H, Jelic M, Roffi A, Cucchiarini M, Kon E. Mesenchymal stem cells for the treatment of cartilage lesions: from preclinical findings to clinical application in orthopaedics. Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc. 2013;21:1717–1729. PMID: 23306713
8 Kellgren JH, Lawrence JS. Radiological assessment of osteo-arthritis. Ann Rheum Dis.1957;16:494-
502. PMID: 13498604

9 Dawson J, Fitzpatrick R, Murray D, Carr A. A questionnaire on the perception of patients about total knee replacement. J Bone Joint Surg Br. 1998;80:63-69. PMID: 9460955

10 Tegner Y, Lysholm J. Rating system in the evaluation of knee ligament injuries. Clin Orthop relate research. 1985;198:43-49 PMID: 4028566

11 Mardones R, Jofré CM, Minguell JJ. Cell Therapy and Tissue Engineering Approaches for Cartilage Repair and/or Regeneration. Int J Stem Cells. 2015;8:48-53. PMID: 26019754

12 Magnussen RA, Dunn WR, Carey JL, Spindler KP. Treatment of Focal Articular Cartilage Defects in the Knee. A Systematic Review. Clin Orthop Relat Res.2008;466:952-962. PMID: 18196358

13 Borne TD, Adesida AB, Jomha NM. Mesenchymal stem cells in the treatment of traumatic articular cartilage defects: a comprehensive review. Arthritis Research & Therapy.2014;16:432. PMID: 25606595

14 Niemeyer P, Albrecht D, Andereya S, et al. Autologous chondrocyte implantation (ACI) for cartilage defects of the knee: A guideline by the working group “Clinical Tissue Regeneration” of the German Society of Orthopaedics and Trauma (DGOU). Knee. 2016;23:426–435. DOI: 10.1016/j.knee.2016.02.001

15 Peterson L, Minas T, Brittberg M, Nilsson A, Sjögren-Jansson E, Lindahl A. Two- to 9-year outcome after autologous chondrocyte transplantation of the knee. Clin Orthop Relat Res. 2000;374:212–234. PMID: 10818982

16 Giai Via A, McCarthy MB, de Girolamo L, Ragni E, Oliva, F, Maffulli N. Making Them Commit: Strategies to Influence Phenotypic Differentiation in Mesenchymal Stem Cells. Sports Med Arthrosc Rev. 2018;26:64–69. PMID: 29722765

17 Via AG, Frizziero A, Oliva F. Biological properties of mesenchymal stem cells from different sources. Muscles, Ligaments and Tendons Journal. 2012;2:154-162. PMID: 23738292

18 Yoshiya S, Dhawan A. Cartilage repair techniques in the knee: stem cell therapies. Curr Rev Musculoskelet Med. 2015;8:457-466. PMID: 26373771

19 Vangsness CT Jr, Farr J 2nd, Boyd J, Dellaero DT, Mills CR, LeRoux-Williams M. Adult human
mesenchymal stem cells delivered via intra-articular injection to the knee following partial medial meniscectomy: a randomized, double-blind, controlled study. J Bone Joint Surg Am. 2014;96:90–98.
PMID: 24430407

20 Gigante A, Calcagno S, Cecconi S, Ramazzotti D, Manzotti S, Enea D. Use of collagen scaffold and autologous bone marrow concentrate as a one-step cartilage repair in the knee: histological results of second-look biopsies at 1 year follow-up. Int J Immunopathol Pharmacol. 2011;24 (1 Suppl 2):69–72.
PMID: 21669141

21 Buda R, Vannini F, Cavallo M, Grigolo B, Cenacchi A, Giannini S. Osteochondral lesions of the knee: a new one-step repair technique with bone-marrow-derived cells. J Bone Joint Surg Am. 2010; 92:2–11.
PMID: 21123588

22 Fisher MB, Belkin NS, Milby AH, et al. Effects of Mesenchymal Stem Cell and Growth Factor Delivery on Cartilage Repair in a Mini-Pig Model. Cartilage. 2016;7:174-84. PMID: 27047640

23 Kasemkijwattana C, Hongeng S, Kesprayura S, Rungsinaporn V, Chaipinyo K, Chansiri K. Autologous bone marrow mesenchymal stem cells implantation for cartilage defects: two cases report. J Med Assoc Thai. 2011, 94:395–400. PMID: 21560849

24 Mardones R, Giai Via A, Jofrè C, Minguell J, Rodriguez C, Tomic A, Salineros M. Cell therapy for cartilage defects of the hip. Muscles, Ligaments and Tendons Journal. 2016;6:361-366. PMID: 28066741

25 Orozco L, Munar A, Soler R, et al. Treatment of knee osteoarthritis with autologous mesenchymal stem cells: two-year follow-up results. Transplantation. 2014;97:e66–e68. PMID: 24887752

26 Lamo-Espinosa JM, Mora G, Blanco JF et al. Intra-articular injection of two different doses of autologous bone marrow mesenchymal stem cells versus hyaluronic acid in the treatment of knee osteoarthritis: multicenter randomized controlled clinical trial (phase I/II). J Transl Med. 2016;14:246.
PMID: 27565858

27 Zscharnack M, Hepp P, Richter R, et al. Repair of chronic osteochondral defects using predifferentiated mesenchymal stem cells in an ovine model. Am J Sports Med. 2010, 38:1857-1869.
PMID: 20508078
28 Marquass B, Schulz R, Hepp P, et al. Matrix-associated implantation of predifferentiated mesenchymal stem cells versus articular chondrocytes: in vivo results of cartilage repair after 1 year. Am J Sports Med. 2011;39:1401-1412. PMID: 21527412

Figures
A 25 years old active male patient with patellar maltracking and patellofemoral pain syndrome, who has received 4 knee procedure before the final cartilage repair. The patient reported pain and swelling because of a large grade IV chondral injury of the patella. A) After a medial parapatellar arthrotomy, the patella was exposed and the cartilage defect identified. B) The cartilage defect was prepared and microfractures have been performed. C) The Chondro-Gide® scaffold containing BM-MSCs differentiated to chondrocytes was sutured with n.6.0 non-absorbable suture.
Figure 2

Representative images of cultured BM-MSCs in different states of confluence of two patients (A and B). On the left side the confluence is about 30-40%, while on the right confluence is about 80%, prior to trypsinization for use in subsequent experiments.
Figure 3

Representative histograms showing antigen expression in bone marrow-derived MSC. From left to right CD19, CD44, CD45, CD90, HLA-DR, CD29, CD73 CD105, CD73, CD34, CD105, CD11b. Black filled histogram: antigen expression; solid red line: auto-fluorescence control.
Histological analysis of BM-MSCs differentiated to chondrocytes in Chondro-Gide Scaffold. A) Complete scaffold stained with 2% toluidine blue showing GAG deposition, indicating the presence of hyaline cartilage producing chondrocytes. B) Section of collagen membrane showing cells adhered to the periphery of the scaffold. Circle indicates section in A.
A 46 years old man, with a grade IV cartilage injury of the lateral condyle and tibial plateau.

A) Preoperative plain radiographs. B) Preoperative MRI showing a grade IV cartilage injury of the lateral condyle (30 x 20 mm) and grade III-IV cartilage injury of the tibial plateau (20 x 20 mm). Microfractures have been performed at the tibial plateau. The wider defect of the femoral condyle has been repaired with the Chondro-Gide® scaffold and BM-MSCs differentiated to chondrocytes.
Figure 6

MRI of the same patient at 1 year follow-up. The T2 cartilage maps showed a full thickness coverage of the defect with a heterogeneous and irregular tissue. The superficial layer of the tissue seems to have a higher content of water, while the layer close to the subchondral bone shows a structure more similar to normal cartilage. There is no bone oedema in the area of the scaffold.
MRI post-surgery. Patient SPC: A: Sagittal fat-suppressed proton density-weighted image 3 month after treatment. The graft tissue if homogeneous filling the defect. Subcondral marrow edema, B: Coronal fat-suppressed proton density-weighted image 3 month after treatment. Graft tissue homogeneous filling the defect. There is subchondral bone marrow edema, C: Sagittal fat-suppressed proton density-weighted image 53 month after treatment. The repair site is now filled with a congruent articular surface. Normal signal of the cartilage. Persistent bone marrow, D: Coronal fat-suppressed proton density-weighted image 53 month after treatment. The repair site is now filled with a congruent articular surface. Persistent bone marrow oedema, and a focal irregularity in superficial layer are present. Patient CRC: E: Sagittal fat-suppressed proton density-weighted image 6 month after the index procedure. The graft tissue inhomogeneous fills the defect with overgrowth of repair cartilage. Subtle subchondral marrow edema, F: Coronal fat-suppressed proton density-weighted image 6 month after treatment. There is graft tissue in homogeneously filling the defect with overgrowth of the repaired cartilage. Subtle subchondral marrow edema, G: Sagittal fat-suppressed proton density-weighted image 15 month after treatment. The repair site shows evidence of progression of tissue incorporation and a congruent articular surface. There is no bone marrow oedema, H: Coronal fat-suppressed
proton density-weighted image 15 month after treatment. The repair site is now filled with incorporated tissue, and a congruent articular surface is evident. There is no bone marrow oedema.

Figure 8

A 32 years old patient with a grade IV cartilage injury of the lateral femoral condyle. A) a large grade IV defect has been identified, and the cartilage defect has been prepared. B) The Chondro-Gide® scaffold containing BM-MSCs differentiated to chondrocytes has been sutured onto the peripheral healthy cartilage with n.6.0 non-absorbable suture.