Early comparative analysis of functional outcome between open reduction and internal fixation and conservative treatment for closed, displaced, intra-articular fractures of the calcaneum, a randomised study

Rajib Kumar Das, A Dhar and AK Daolagupu

DOI: https://doi.org/10.22271/ortho.2020.v6.i2g.2080

Abstract
Background: Calcaneum fracture contributes to significant morbidity to the patients. Therefore debate continues regarding choice of its management, between open reduction internal fixation and closed treatment. The aim of this study was to compare the outcomes of open reduction and rigid internal fixation of displaced calcaneal fractures using locking plate with that of non-operative treatment.

Materials and Methods: Thirty patients with thirty-two displaced intra-articular calcaneal fractures were selected during July 2016 to June 2017 with taking inclusive and exclusive criteria into account and randomly allocated to surgical and non-surgical groups. First group of patients was treated with open reduction and internal fixation using reconstruction plate and screws through lateral extensile approach. Patients in second group were treated with closed reduction and cast immobilization using Omoto technique. The observations in both the groups were analyzed and compared.

Results: The significant difference between the outcomes of surgical treatment and nonsurgical method were noted. The fracture got united between 12-16 weeks and no case of non-union has reported. Few patients had reported with wound related complications and were managed with antibiotics and regular antiseptic dressings. The functional assessment of patients during follow ups has suggested that 87.5% patients of operated group has good to excellent outcome while 87.5% patients of conservatively managed patients has good to fair outcome.

Conclusion: Open reduction and internal fixation of close displaced calcaneal fractures in absence of severe osteoporosis, comminution, and co-existing morbidity may be the preferred method of treatment.

Keywords: Calcaneum fracture, intra-articular, internal fixation, bone plates, close reduction, omoto technique

Introduction
Calcaneal fractures were first described by Malgaigne in 1843. It is the commonest fractured tarsal bone (60% of all tarsal bones) and in 5-10% cases both calcaneum are fractured. It accounts approximately 2% of all fractures and 10% patients of calcaneum fracture has open injuries. Nearly 10% of calcaneum fractures are associated with injuries of spine, pelvis and hip. It is more common in male specially in industrial workers and age group of 21-45 years.

Material and Methods
A prospective randomized study was carried out on 30 patients with 32 displaced intra-articular calcaneum fracture(s) attending the Emergency and OPD of Orthopedics at Silchar Medical College and Hospital, Silchar, Assam from 1st July 2016 to 30th June 2017. Patients were divided into two groups operative (15 cases) and conservative (15 cases) according to randomization sequence. Patients in Group A were managed with ORIF while those in Group B were managed with closed reduction by ‘Omoto technique’ and below knee POP cast application. Immediate post-op/post-cast check x-rays were taken in both axial and lateral views. The correction of the deformity was checked and any displacements were noted.
Information on gender, age, mechanism of injury, side, fracture classification with associated injuries, etc. was recorded for these patients.

### Table 1: Inclusion and exclusion criteria’s taken in the present study

| Inclusion Criteria                                                                 | Exclusion Criteria                                                                 |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| • Patients who gave consent for study                                               | • Patients who did not give consent for study                                     |
| • Age > 18 years                                                                    | • History of drug or alcohol abuse                                                |
| • Fracture less than 3 weeks old                                                    | • Patient unlikely to cooperate or attend all schedule visits                    |
| • Fracture with displacement >2mm                                                   | • Patients with previous calcaneum pathology (infection; tumor; fracture)         |
| • Fracture with Sander’s type II, III & IV classification                           | • Open calcaneum fracture                                                        |
|                                                                                     | • Extra-articular calcaneum fractures                                              |
|                                                                                     | • Sander’s Type I calcaneum fractures                                              |
|                                                                                     | • Associated neurovascular injury                                                 |

**Surgical Procedure:** Standard lateral extensile approach to the calcaneum was used. Fracture was reduced, articular congruity was confirmed using c-arm imaging followed by fixation with calcaneal plate and locking cancellous screws. Wound was closed with application of drain.

**Post-operative care:** Limb was immobilized in below knee splint with the advice for active toes movements and elevation. Analgesics were given as per requirement. Antibiotics (intravenous/oral) were administered every 12 hourly till stitches were removed. Antisepctic wound dressing was done every alternate day. Early ROM exercise was encouraged.

**Closed reduction Technique (Oimoto technique)** ([5]): Patient was placed prone under sedation. One assistant supported the thigh while surgeon stands on the foot end of the patient and applied medial and lateral pressure of the heel. Then the surgeon gave a longitudinal traction in the line of leg. Heel varus or valgus was corrected and tuberosity was manipulated. Finally below knee POP cast was applied in standard neutral position of 90° angles between the foot and the tibia.

**Rehabilitation:** Post-cast pain and swelling were managed using anti-inflammatory analgesics and limb elevation along with advice to perform active toe movements from day one.

Cast was removed after 2 months and physiotherapy started. Partial weight bearing was started after 12 weeks and full weight bearing was allowed after 14-16 weeks in all conservatively treated cases.

In all operated cases partial weight bearing was started after 8-10 weeks and full weight bearing was allowed only after union and subsidence of pain at about 12 weeks.

**Follow-ups:** Patients were followed up at 3, 6, 9, 12 week time and then every 3 months.

**Parameters for evaluation:** The fracture was considered united when clinically there was no tenderness and subjective complaints (if any) were noted at every follow up.

- **Radiographic Assessment:** to assess consolidation or post reduction collapse and to note any displacement. The fracture was considered united when the fracture line was not visible and establishment of trabecular continuity between the two fragments on axial and lateral x-rays. All radiological parameters of outcome (Bohler’s angle, Gissane angle, height, width etc.) were noted at every follow up.

- **Functional Assessment:** The results were assessed using Ankle-Hindfoot Score ([5]). This takes the following items into consideration: intensity of pain; function, including restraint of activities and the need for support with an orthosis; maximum walking distance measured by blocks; abnormality of gait; sagittal mobility (flexion and extension); hindfoot mobility (inversion and eversion); the antero-posterior and varus-valgus stability of the ankle and hindfoot and the alignment of the foot and ankle. The scores for each item were added together, providing a total between 0 and 100.

**Statistical Analysis:** Statistical testing of data was done with statistical package of social science system version 22.0. Continuous variables were presented as mean±SD. Categorical variables are presented as absolute numbers and percentage. Paired t test was used for comparison of preoperative v/s post-operative and pre casting v/s post casting measurements while unpaired t-test was used for post-operative v/s post- manipulation measurements. *p*-values were calculated and differences between the two groups were considered significant if the *p*-value was less than 0.05. Pearson correlation coefficient was calculated for determining the correlation between radiological and functional outcome.

**Results**

All 30 patients were followed up successfully during the study period. Of these 26 patients were male and 4 patients were female (M:F= 6.5:1). In this study, the youngest patient was 19 years of age and the oldest was 75 years of age. The mean age at presentation was 30.7 ± 11.06 years. The maximum numbers of cases were between 21 to 30 years of age (33.33%). 2 patients had fracture on bilateral sides. The commonest mode of injury was fall from height in 90% cases, followed by RTA accounting for 10% of patients. There were total of 8 fractures of Sander’s Type II (25%), 18 (56.25%) fractures of Sander’s Type III and 6 (18.75%) of Sander’s Type IV fracture. There were 2 (6.67%) cases with associated spinal injury one at L1 vertebra and other at D12 vertebra. There was one case (3.33%) of fracture left superior and inferior pubic rami of pelvis. Both the cases of spinal injury were not associated with neurological deficit and were managed conservatively. The average time interval between trauma and surgery was 11.25 ± 1.78 days (range 9 to 14 days), while between trauma and cast application was 11.31 ±1.69 days (range 9 to 14 days). We had either operated or applied cast to all the cases after the wrinkle sign was positive.
Table 2: Duration of surgeries with their types as per Sander’s Classification

| Type Of Fracture (Sander’s Classification) | Duration Of Surgery (In Minutes) |
|-------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| TYPE II                                   | 81.25±6.25                       |
| TYPE III                                  | 85.56±7.16                       |
| TYPE IV                                   | 91.67±5.57                       |

We had achieved an increase in Bohler’s angle in both the groups post intervention. The Bohler’s angle improved from 5.94°±4.32° to 21.25°±4.84° in operative group and from 5.0°±5.63° to 19.38°±2.78° in manipulation group. The increase was significantly more after plate osteosynthesis than post-manipulation (p<0.05).

Both the methods used had resulted into decrease in Gissane’s angle. The Gissane’s angle changed from 153.75°±5.78° to 133.44°±3.82° in operative group and from 153.13°±6.43° to 143.75°±4.36° in manipulation group post intervention. The Gissane’s angle was decreased significantly after plate osteosynthesis than after manipulation (p<0.05).

The total calcaneal height in operative group improved from preoperative value of 3.64±0.22 cm to postoperative value of 4.29 ±0.18 cm. The total calcaneal height improved from 3.60±0.23 cm to 3.99 ±0.15 cm in conservative group. The calcaneal height was increased significantly after plate osteosynthesis than after manipulation (p<0.05).
4.21±0.13 cm to 3.84±0.10 cm in conservative group. The decrease in calcaneal width was significantly more after plate osteosynthesis than after manipulation (p<0.05).

The average time of union in operated cases was 13.75 ±1.44 weeks (range = 12 to 16 weeks) while in conservatively managed cases was 13.13 ±1.13 weeks (range = 12 to 16 weeks). Maximum number of fractures united between 12 to 14 weeks (93.75%) in both the groups. No case of nonunion was encountered in either group. The result was not statistically significant.

**Functional Evaluation by American Orthopaedic Foot Ankle Society (Aofas) Ankle-Hindfoot Score**

The functional outcome was assessed using AOFAS score at last follow up or minimum after 3 months.

Table 3: Functional outcome using AOFAS Ankle-Hindfoot Score

| Outcome | Aofas Score |
|---------|-------------|
| Excellent | 90 to 100 |
| Good    | 80 to 89   |
| Fair    | 70 to 79   |
| Bad     | below 69   |

Table 4: AOFAS Ankle-Hindfoot Score in different Sander’s Type in both groups

| Aofas Score | Sander’s Classification | Total |
|------------|-------------------------|-------|
| Operative Group | Type II | Type III | Type IV |
| 95±1       | 88.67±2.46             | 77.33±5.56 | 88.5±5.81 |
| Conservative Group | 84.25±1.25 | 77.11±4.96 | 70.0±5.33 | 77.56±5.80 |

On statistical analysis of post-operative and post-conservative AOFAS score, the result was statistically significant (p<0.05). The AOFAS score was increased significantly after plate osteosynthesis than after conservative management.

**Complication:** Superficial wound defect at the corner of skin incision site was observed in 2 cases of Sander’s Type III fracture and 1 case of Sander’s Type IV fracture (18.75%), managed with extended antibiotics and regular antiseptic dressings. Only 1(6.25%) case with Sander’s Type III fracture presented with severe defect of the soft tissue. There was wound edge necrosis with wound gaping and slough formation. Wound debridement and secondary suturing was done to manage the defect. The wound healed with extended intravenous antibiotics and regular antiseptic dressing. No case presented with severe soft tissue complication for which plate removal was required. Only one case presented with varus malunion (<10°) of the calcaneum but at last follow up the functional outcome was good. There was no case of post-operative loss of reduction, screw loosening or implant failure.

Among conservatively managed group 2 cases (12.5%) had reported with superficial skin necrosis which was healed by removal of cast, application of below knee slab with oral antibiotics and regular antiseptic dressings. Below knee cast was applied after wound healing. Four case presented with varus malunion (<10°) of the calcaneum and at last follow up, two of them presented with good functional outcome but two had poor functional outcome. Five patients developed heel pad problems.

No case presented with other complications like compartment syndrome, blisters, peroneal tendinitis, sural nerve hypoesthesia, tarsal tunnel syndrome, tendon dislocation and reflex sympathetic dystrophy in either group.
Clinical photographs after 6 months of follow-up

Conservative Patient (75 years Female with Sander’s Type III fracture)

Pre-manipulation x-ray

Immediate post-manipulation x-ray

3 weeks follow-up

3 months follow-up

3 wks follow-up

9 months follow-up
Fracture of the calcaneus are serious injuries, commonly affect young and active individuals, and are often associated with long term sequelae, permanent disability, a considerable reduction in quality of life, and high socio-economic costs. The majority of published series on operative treatment of calcaneal fractures have employed a lateral approach through which reduction of the calcaneal body and restoration of calcaneal height, length, and width was consistently reproducible, irrespective of the extent of comminution [7-29]. In the last decade, open reduction and internal plate fixation of displaced intra-articular calcaneal fractures has become a standard surgical method with low complication rate and better quality of life after the surgery. By implanting locking compression plates, the osteosynthesis becomes more stable, enables earlier weight bearing, and bone grafting is rarely necessary [30-33]. There has been lot of studies done to evaluate the effectiveness of surgical management of calcaneum fracture and to compare its effectiveness with conservative management. O’Farrell et al. [34] has shown that patients managed by surgery had a significantly more stable calcaneal height and width than the patients with conservative treatment. Cheng Long et al. [35] had found in their study that the mean time for calcaneum fracture to unite was 3.2 months which is comparable to the result of our study. Vaclav Rak et al. [36] confirmed correlation between the Böhler’s angle size and patient satisfaction. O’Farrell et al. [34] shows that non-surgically treated patients had a significantly higher mean Gissane’s angle than those surgically treated. Buckley et al. [37] and Hart et al. [38] and a lot of other authors, has confirmed the role of Böhler’s angle size as a predictive factor for subsequent late complications. The studies done by O’Farrell et al. [34], Buckley et al. [37], Ibrahim et al. [38] and Thordarson et al. [39] shows that soft tissue complications are more in operated cases and other complications like varus mal-union, heal pad problems, restriction of sub-talar joint movements are more in conservative cases. All these observations are similar and comparable with our study.

**Conclusion**

Open reduction and internal fixation with locking calcaneal plate gives a good functional outcome, even when bone grafts are not used manifested by restoring anatomical reconstruction of height, width, Bohler’s and Gissane’s angles of the calcaneum, and allowing early mobilization in comparison to conservative treatment. However larger study with longer duration of study is needed for evaluation.

**Reference**

1. Cotton FJ, Wilson LT. Fractures of the os calcis. Boston Med. J. 1908; 159:559-565.
2. Crosby LA, Fitzgibbons T. Intraarticular Calcaneal Fractures: Results of Closed Treatment. Clinical orthopaedics and related research. 1993; 290:47-54.
3. Melcher G, Degonda F, Leutenegger A, Ruedi T. Ten-year follow-up after operative treatment for intraarticular fractures of the calcaneus. Journal of Trauma and Acute Care Surgery. 1995; 38(5):713-6.
4. Soeur R, Remy R. Fractures of the calcaneus with displacement of the thalamic portion. Bone & Joint Journal. 1975; 57(4):413-21.
5. Omoto H, Nakamura K. Method for manual reduction of displaced intra-articular fracture of the calcaneus: technique, indications and limitations. Foot Ankle Int. Nov 2001; 22(11):874-9.
6. Kitaoka HB, Alexander JJ, Adelaar RS et al. Clinical rating systems for the ankle-hindfoot, midfoot, hallux, and lesser toes. Foot Ankle Int. 1994; 15:349-53.
7. Sanders R. Radiological evaluation and CT classification of calcaneal fractures. Disorders of the Foot and Ankle. M. Jahss, MD Editor. WB Saunders, Philadelphia, Penn. 1990.
8. Sanders R, Fortin PT, Walling AK. Subtalar Arthrodesis following Calcaneal Fracture. Journal of Orthopaedic Trauma. 1991; 5(2):245.
9. Thordarson DB, Krieger LE. Operative vs. nonoperative treatment of intra-articular fractures of the calcaneus: a prospective randomized trial. Foot & Ankle International. 1996; 17(1):2-9.
10. Sanders R. Intra-articular fractures of the calcaneus: present state of the art. Journal of orthopaedic trauma. 1992; 6(2):252-65.
11. Maxfield JE. Os calcis fractures: treatment by open reduction. Clin. Orthop. 1963; 30:91-99.
12. Zwipp H, Rammelt S, Barthel S. Fracture of the calcaneus. Unfallchirurg, 2005; 108:737-48.
13. Brauer CA, Manns BJ, Ko M, Donaldson C, Buckley R. An economic evaluation of operative compared with nonoperative management of displaced intra-articular calcaneal fractures. The Journal of Bone & Joint Surgery. 2005; 87(12):2741-9.
14. Lim Leung JP. Complication of intraarticular calcaneal fracture. Clin orthop. 2001; 391:7-16.
15. Rammelt S, Amlang M, Barthel S, Zwipp H. Minimally-invasive treatment of calcaneal fractures. Injury. 2004; 35(2):55-63.
16. Rammelt S, Zwipp H. Calcaneus fractures. Trauma. 2006; 8(3):197-212.
17. Jain V, Kumar R, Mandal DK. Osteosynthesis for intraarticular calcaneal fractures. J of Orthop Surg 2007; 15:144-8.
18. Zwipp H, Rammelt S, Barthel S. Calcaneal fractures-open reduction and internal fixation (ORIF). Injury. 2004; 35(2):46-54.
19. Buckley R. Letters to the Editor. J Orthop Trauma. 2002; 16:210-1.
20. Clare MP, Sanders RW. Open reduction and internal fixation with primary subtalar arthrodesis for Sanders type IV calcaneal fractures. Techniques in Foot & Ankle Surgery. 2004; 3(4):250-7.
21. Displaced Intraarticular Calcaneal Fractures. Prognostic Factors for Poor Outcome. AO Journal Club/Evidence from the Literature. Orthop Trauma Dir. 2003; 06:9-16.
22. Hart AJ, Eastwood DM. Displaced intra-articular fractures of the calcaneum: what is new? Trauma. 2003; 5(1):9-21.
23. Herscovici D, Widmaier J, Scaduto JM, Sanders RW, Walling A. Operative treatment of calcaneal fractures in elderly patients. J Bone Joint Surg Am. 2005; 87(6):1260-4.
24. Howard JL, Buckley R, McCormack R, Pate G, Leighton R, Petrie D et al. Complications following management of displaced intra-articular calcaneal fractures: a prospective randomized trial comparing open reduction internal fixation with nonoperative management. Journal of orthopaedic trauma. 2003; 17(4):241-9.
25. Kocis J, Stoklas J, Kalandra S, Cizmar I, Pilny J. Intra-articular fractures of calcaneus. Acta Chir Ort Traum Cech. 2006; 73:164-8.
26. Rak V, Bucek P, Ira D, Masek M. [Surgical treatment method of calcaneal intraarticular fractures]. Rozhledy v chirurgii: mesnicnik Ceskoslovenske chirurgicke spolecnosti. 2006; 85(6):311-7.
27. Rak V, Matonoha P, Otahal M, Masek MM. [Vascularization of the lateral heel in relation to extensive skin incisions in osteosynthesis of calcaneal fractures]. Rozhledy v chirurgii: mesnicnik Ceskoslovenske chirurgicke spolecnosti. 2007; 86(9):483-8.
28. Simpson RB. Fractures of the calcaneus. Curr Opin Orthop. 2007; 18:124-7.
29. Tufescu TV, Buckley R. Age, gender, work capability, and worker's compensation in patients with displaced intraarticular calcaneal fractures. Journal of orthopaedic trauma. 2001; 15(4):275-9.
30. Longino D, Buckley RE. Bone graft in the operative treatment of displaced intraarticular calcaneal fractures: is it helpful? Journal of orthopaedic trauma. 2001; 15(4):280-6.
31. Rammelt S, Zwipp H. Calcaneus fractures. Trauma. 2006; 8(3):197-212.
32. Zwipp H, Rammelt S, Barthel S. Calcaneal fractures-open reduction and internal fixation (ORIF). Injury. 2004; 35(2):46-54.
33. Simpson RB. Fractures of the calcaneus. Curr Opin Orthop. 2007; 18:124-7.
34. O'Farrell DA, O'Byrne JM, McCabe JP, Stephens MM. Fractures of the os calcis: improved results with internal fixation. Injury. 1993; 24(4):263-5.
35. Cheng Long, Yue Fang, Fu-Guo Huang et al. Sanders II–III calcaneal fractures fixed with locking plate in elderly patients. Chin J Traumatol. 2016; 19(3):164-167.
36. Operative treatment of intra-articular calcaneal fractures with calcaneal plates and its complications Vaclav Rak, Daniel Ira, Michal Masek (http://www.ijoonline.com on Wednesday, August 31, 2016, IP: 49.32.52.154)
37. Buckley R, Tough S, McCormack R, Pate G, Leighton R, Petrie D et al. Operative compared with nonoperative treatment of displaced intra-articular calcaneal fractures. J Bone Joint Surg Am. 2002; 84(10):1733-44.
38. Ibrahim T, Rowsell M, Rennie W, Brown AR, Taylor GJ, Gregg PJ. Displaced intra-articular calcaneal fractures: 15-year follow-up of a randomised controlled trial of conservative versus operative treatment. Injury. 2007; 38:848-855. doi: 10.1016/j.injury.2007.01.003.