Evaluation of Health Care Services Delivered to Syrian Refugees in a Tertiary Pediatrics Hospital Between 2013-2016

Ali Güngör1, Alkım Öden Akman1, Güneyt Karagöl1, Mücahit Koçoğlu1, Bahar Çubacı Çakır2, İlker Çetin3, Halil İbrahim Yakut3
1 Department of Pediatrics, University of Health Sciences, Ankara Child Health and Diseases Hematology Oncology Training and Research Hospital, Ankara, TURKEY.
2 Department of Social Pediatrics, University of Health Sciences, Ankara Child Health and Diseases Hematology Oncology Training and Research Hospital, Ankara
3 Department of Pediatric Cardiology, University of Health Sciences, Ankara Child Health and Diseases Hematology Oncology Training and Research Hospital, Ankara, TURKEY

Abstract
Objective Millions of Syrian had to abandon their country due to the civil war and took refuge in neighboring countries. This refugee crisis is affecting the countries that accept immigrants in terms of health care service, economical, political and social issues. We aim to evaluate, density of the Syrian refugees in outpatient and emergency services, inpatient services, specific interventions, and investigations ordered between 2013 and 2016.

Materials and Methods We tried to determine density of Syrian refugees among the patients who presented to the emergency department and outpatient clinics and the patients hospitalized in our hospital between 2013 and 2016. It was tried to determine the density of Syrian patients among the interventional procedures and specific investigations ordered in the pediatric sub-branches.

Results Approximately 13,538 Syrian refugees presented to our hospital for examination, investigations and treatment between 2013 and 2016. The number of Syrian refugees who presented to our hospital increased to 8,540 in 2016 from 265 in 2013. The percentage of Syrian refugees in the ECG, Cerebral MRI and CT, Rhythm Holter and EEG tests and the number of Syrian refugees in the total number has increased over the years over the years 2013-2016. The rate of Syrian refugees involved in the hospital invoice raised to 6.63% in 2016 from 1.05% in 2013.

Conclusion The crisis in Syria affects neighboring countries in many issues. Countries like Turkey which accept a large number of refugees should rearrange their health policies considering refugees. Further multicenter studies are needed to determine the impact of this immigration on health care system.

Keywords refugee; child; Health Care Services
INTRODUCTION
Millions of Syrian had to abandon their country due to the civil war that began in Syria in 2011. According to the United Nations data, 4 to 6 million Syrians have abandoned their country since 2011. The Syrian people who escaped from the conflicts have taken refugee, especially in Turkey; Lebanon, Jordan, Iraq and other neighboring countries. Turkey has declared to implement an “open door policy” for Syrian refugees and embraced the aggrieved people shortly after the civil war began. According to data of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, Turkey is the country which harbors the largest number of Syrian refugees.

This refugee crisis affects many countries, especially the countries that accept refugees, in terms of many health and care services, economic, political and social issues. Providing adequate health care services for refugees is a challenging issue for these countries in terms of economy and workload. Turkey, Lebanon and Jordan are the leading countries affected by this situation. Currently, 25% of the Lebanese population consists of Syrian refugees, and this crisis is now called the Syrian-Lebanese crisis in Lebanon.

The protection provided to the Syrians who took refugee in our country is the Temporary Protection according to the international literature. The Syrians who are taken to the status of “foreigners under temporary protection” by issuing and registering their ID card (foreign identification document) can benefit from several services including healthcare, education, temporary shelter and social aid.

Our country hosts more than 3 million Syrian refugees as of today, and it is known that so far, 25,919,750 outpatient services, 1,143,393 inpatient services, and 953,466 surgeries were carried out for the Syrian and Iraqi refugees. This increases both the health care costs of our country, and the workload of health workers.

More than half of the Syrian population that has migrated out of the country consists of women and children. Children are naturally the most affected by migration and war. While refugee children are exposed to many traumas such as war, violence, separation from family and abuse on one hand, their health is negatively affected and threatened by long-term migratory journeys, poor and inadequate nutrition, conditions with lack of hygiene and being deprived from preventive health services.

The aim of this study was to evaluate the prevalence of Syrian refugees in outpatient and emergency services, inpatient services, special interventions and the investigations ordered between 2013-2016.

MATERIAL and METHOD
This study was conducted as a descriptive cross-sectional study to determine the density of Syrian refugees among the total presentations in a tertiary pediatric hospital. All patients who presented to the emergency department and outpatient clinics of our hospital between 2013 and 2016 were scanned through the registration system, and the density of Syrian refugees among these patients was investigated. Among the interventional procedures and specific investigations ordered in the pediatric sub-branches between 2013 and 2016; the numbers of cerebral magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) and computed tomography (CT), electroencephalography (EEG), esophagogastroduodenoscopy (EGD), rhythm holter, echocardiography (ECO), bone marrow aspiration (BMA), bone marrow biopsy and liver biopsy were determined. We tried to determine the density of Syrian patients in these investigations and procedures. This study was approved by University of Health Sciences, Ankara Child Health and Diseases Hematology Oncology Training and Research Hospital Institutional Review Board (12/09/2017-28).
Statistical Analysis: The descriptive categorical variables are expressed as number (n) and percentage (%). The results were evaluated using the ‘Statistical Package for Social Sciences - SPSS 17’ (Chicago, USA) software.

RESULTS

Approximately 2,200,478 patients admitted to the emergency department and outpatient clinics of our hospital for examination, investigations and treatment between 2013 and 2016. About 13,538 (0.62%) of these patients were Syrian refugees. Of Syrian refugees, 30.9% presented to the emergency department and 69.1% to the outpatient clinics. Approximately 68,000 patients have been hospitalized in the inpatient clinics of our hospital with 0.82 (n=555) of them being Syrian refugees. The number of Syrian refugees who presented to our hospital increased to 8,540 in 2016 from 265 in 2013. Likewise, the number of Syrian refugees hospitalized in the inpatient services of our hospital raised to 492 in 2016 from 11 in 2013. A significant increase was found both in the number of Syrian patients who presented to our hospital, and the number of Syrian patients hospitalized in our hospital between 2013 and 2016. The number and rate of Syrian refugees’ presentations to our hospital between 2013-2016 are shown in Table 1.

Among the interventional procedures performed between 2013 and 2016 in pediatric sub-branches of our hospital; when the distribution of EGD, BMA, BMB and liver biopsy was examined, it was found that the number of Syrian refugees increased especially in 2015 and 2016. The distribution of Syrian refugees by the interventional procedures performed, and years is given in Table 2.

Among the procedures performed and investigations ordered between 2013 and 2016 in our hospital; cerebral MRI and CT, routine and sleep-activated EEG, rhythm holter, and echocardiography were included in this study. The number and rate of Syrian refugees in these procedures and investigations gradually increased between 2013 and 2016. While ECO was performed in 13 Syrian refugees in 2013, this number increased to 156 in 2016, and similarly the number of MRIs ordered for Syrian refugees raised to 128 in 2016 from only one in 2013. Table 3 shows the changes in the number and rate of Syrian refugees in

| Syrian Refugees | Total number of patients | Number of emergency service admission | Number of Polyclinic admission | Number of Inpatients |
|----------------|--------------------------|----------------------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------|
| 2013           | 265                      | 0.06                                   | 73                             | 0.06                 | 192                     | 0.06 | 11 | 0.08 |
| 2014           | 1297                     | 0.23                                   | 493                            | 0.40                 | 804                     | 0.19 | 5  | 0.03 |
| 2015           | 3436                     | 0.59                                   | 1235                           | 0.92                 | 2201                    | 0.49 | 47 | 0.27 |
| 2016           | 8540                     | 1.42                                   | 2380                           | 1.72                 | 6160                    | 1.33 | 492| 2.82 |

| Syrian Refugees | Esophagogastroduodenoscopy | Bone marrow aspiration | Bone marrow biopsy | Liver biopsy |
|----------------|-----------------------------|------------------------|-------------------|-------------|
| 2013           | -                           | 8                      | 2.20              | -           |
| 2014           | -                           | 8                      | 2.52              | 1           |
| 2015           | 4                           | 15                     | 4.27              | 4           |
| 2016           | 12                          | 33                     | 8.44              | 4           | 6.67 |
The total amount of invoices reported to the Social Security Institution by our hospital between 2013 and 2016 was approximately 221,551,752 Turkish liras (TL) (89,988,526 United States Dollar (USD)), with about 8,605,083 TL (3,495,159 USD) (3.88%) of this amount covered the health care services delivered to the Syrian refugees. The share of Syrian refugees in the annual invoice was 1.05% in 2013, while this rate increased to 6.63% in 2016. Similarly, health care costs for the Syrian refugees increased to approximately 4,260,110 TL (1,407,370 USD) in 2016 from about 465,865 TL (244,420 USD) in 2013. The costs of health care services that were delivered to the Syrian refugees increased over years, both in price and rate (Figure 1).

**DISCUSSION**

Millions of Syrian abandoned their country and took refuge in neighboring countries due to the civil war, which began in Syria. This migration that started in 2011, becomes gradually influential in countries that accept the refugees. Turkey, Lebanon and Jordan are the leading countries that host the largest number of refugees. One of the most important problems faced by countries that accept the refugees is health care services provided to the refugees. In a study conducted in Jordan, it was reported that the total expenditure of the Jordanian Ministry of Health for Syrian refugees between January 2013 and April 2013 was approximately 53 million USD, of which only 5 million USD of this amount was covered by the United Nations. This

**Table 3. Change in the number and rate of Syrian refugees in the investigations ordered between 2013-2016**

| Syrian refugees | ECO | Rhythm Holter | Routine EEG | Sleep Act. EEG | Cerebral CT | Cerebral MRI |
|-----------------|-----|---------------|-------------|---------------|-------------|--------------|
|                 | n (%) | n (%) | n (%) | n (%) | n (%) | n (%) |
| 2013            | 13 (0.10) | - | 1 (0.03) | - | 1 (3.85) | 1 (0.03) |
| 2014            | 43 (0.36) | 2 (0.13) | 11 (0.24) | - | 2 (7.69) | 14 (0.27) |
| 2015            | 86 (0.76) | 5 (0.34) | 16 (0.51) | 28 (0.73) | 7 (9.72) | 41 (0.92) |
| 2016            | 156 (1.2) | 5 (0.36) | 64 (1.47) | 91 (1.92) | 11 (11) | 128 (2.94) |

ECO: Echocardiography  EEG: Electroencephalography  CT: Computed Tomography  MRI: Magnetic Resonance Imaging

![Figure 1. Change in the share of Syrian refugees in the invoice of our hospital between 2013 and 2016](image-url)
negatively affected the budget of the Jordanian Ministry of Health, thus Jordanian economy. Likewise, Syrian refugees, who make up 25% of the Lebanese population, are adversely affecting economy and health care system of Lebanon. Our country has accepted the largest number of Syrian refugees. While the expenditure for Syrian refugees between April 2011 and November 2014 was 4.5 billion USD, today this amount is known to exceed 20 billion USD. Health care services constitute an important part of the expenditures.

Approximately 13,538 Syrian refugees presented to our hospital between 2013 and 2016 for examination, investigations and treatment. Of these patients, 555 received treatment on inpatient basis. The distribution of Syrian refugees among all patients admitted to our hospital increased gradually between 2013 and 2016. The number of Syrian refugees who received inpatient treatment increased significantly, especially in 2015 and 2016. Likewise, the number and rate of the Syrian refugees in EGD, BMA and liver biopsy, cerebral MRI and CT, rhythm holter and EEG examinations performed in our hospital between 2013 and 2016 increased gradually. While the amount of health care services delivered to Syrian refugees in our hospital was approximately 465,865 TL in 2013; this amount increased to 1,575,932 TL in 2014, 2,303,176 TL in 2015 and 4,260,110 TL in 2016. Health care services provided to Syrian refugees increased by about nine folds in 2016 compared to 2013. The reasons for the increase both in number and rate of Syrian refugees who presented to our hospital over the years can be explained as follows: First of all, Ankara where our hospital is located, is not a border province with Syria, thus the migration that started in 2011 was first felt at the border provinces and was then reflected on the other provinces of Turkey. Furthermore, since the Syrian refugees who settled in our country learned later that health care services provided for them were free of charge, the number of their visit to hospitals have increased by years. The registration of Syrian refugees has been carried out more regularly in recent years. The increased visits to pediatric hospitals by Syrian refugees in recent two or three years could be accepted normal because of the fact that the Syrian refugees who migrated to and settled in our country have children here. However, studies have found that the prevalence of preventive health care and vaccination was low among Syrian refugees. The reasons for this have been reported as financial concerns, language problems, and problems in the registration processes. We believe that increasing the accessibility of primary health care services to Syrian refugees will reduce the frequency of presentations to tertiary healthcare institutions such as our hospital.

As the limitations of this study; it was conducted in a single center, and all interventional procedures and investigations performed in our hospital were not included. After citizenship numbers have been issued for Syrian refugees, the registration process has become more robust, so there may be shortcomings in records, especially before 2014.

In conclusion, crisis in Syria is affecting neighboring countries in many issues. Countries that accept a large number of refugees such as Turkey need to reorganize their health policies accordingly. The Syrian refugee crisis should be governed at the global level with international organizations and countries to share the burden of refugee flows with the primary receiving countries.
1. Türk Cemiyeti Başkanlığı, Afet ve Acil Durum Yönetimi Başkanlığı, https://www.afad.gov.tr/upload/Node/3925/files/syrian-refugees-in-turkey-2013_baski_30_12_2013.pdf, [accessed 25.09.2018].

2. Syria Regional Refugee Response, Inter-agency Information Sharing Portal, http://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/regional.php [accessed 16.08.2018].

3. Orhan O. Suryoğlu Sığınmacıların Türkiye’ye Etkileri. Türkiye Ekonomik ve Sosyal Bilimler Yayıncı Web sitesi. http://tesev.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Suryo%C5%9F%C5%9F%C4%B1mc%C4%B1lar-%E7%C4%B1%C3%9F%E7%F5%B3%E7%9F%B6%E7%95%A4%E7%91%91.pdf [accessed 10.08.2018].

4. Zencir M, Dincas A. Suryoğlu Sığınmacılar ve Sağlıklı Hizmetler Raporu. Türk Tabipler Birliği Web sitesi. https://www.ttb.org.tr/kutuphane/signonmacilar_rpr.pdf [accessed 10.08.2018].

5. Korkmaz AÇ. Sığınmacıların Sağlık ve Hemşerilik Hizmetlerine Yönettik Sorunlar. Sağlık ve Hemşerilik Yenişetimi Dergisi. 2014;1:37-42.

6. Marshad MM, Hijawi MQ, Jerjes S, Elom A. Syrian refugees and Jordan’s health sector. Lancet 2013;382:206-207.

7. Doocy S, Ilyas E, Alhui-Zahraa L, Burton A, Burnham G. Health service access and utilization among Syrian refugees in Jordan. Int J Equity Health. 2016;15:108.

8. Blanchet K, Fouad FM, Phetni T. Syrian refugees in Lebanon: the search for universal health coverage. Confl Health 2016;10:12.

9. Refaat MM, Mohanna K. Syrian refugees in Lebanon: facts and solutions. Lancet 2013;382:763-764.

10. İçişleri Bakanlığı Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü, http://www.goc.gov.tr/cerik/3/gecis-koruyucu-manman-in-umarlarlari_609_534_1091 [accessed 13.08.2018].

11. Ekmojes P. Syrian Refugees, Health and Migration Legislation in Turkey. J Immigr Minor Health 2016;18:1434-1441.

12. Türk Tabipler Birliği, https://www.ttb.org.tr/kutuphane/signonmacilar_rpr.pdf. [accessed 13.08.2018].

13. Türk Cemiyeti Başkanlığı, Afet ve Acil Durum Yönetimi Başkanlığı, https://www.afad.gov.tr/upload/Node/2373/files/Suryo%C5%9F%C5%9F%C4%B1mc%C4%B1lar%C4%B1n_Yap%C4%B1lan_Yard%C4%B1mlar+6.pdf [accessed 11.08.2018].

14. Doner B, Oktara A, Kalmeci R. Syrian refugees in Turkey: Numbers and emotions. Lancet 2013;382:764.

15. Çevik S. Suryoğlu Türkiye’ye giden etkileri. Gümüşhane Üniversitesi Sağlık Bilimleri Dergisi 2016;5:80-83.

16. Williams B, Cassar C, Siggers G, Taylor S. Medical and social issues of child refugees in Europe. Arch Dis Child 2016;101: 839-842.

17. ISSOP Migration Working Group. ISSOP position statement on migrant child health. Child Care Health Dev 2017.

18. Bilakuo AO, Jayasekaran D, Burton A, Feuender G, Kinglor J, Amiri MA et al. Nutritional status of women and child refugees from Syria-Jordan, April-May 2014. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2014;63:638-639.

19. Kanukaya E, Çoşkun AM, Özerdoğan N, Yakt E. Suryoğlu Mültecilerin Dogorganizasyon Özellikleri ve Etkileşen Faktörler. Kursat S Bulu Çalıms. Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırma Dergisi 2017;10:417-428.

20. Aygün O, Gökdemir O, Balat U, Yaprak S, Güldal D. Bir Toplum Sağlığı Merkezi Ortaklığı İçin Sığınmacı ve Multiplikatör Verilen Birincinci Başvuruda Sağlık Hizmetlerinin Değerlendirilmesi. TİF/M6/PC 2016;10:6-12.

21. Kalkan O, Gülal M, Yatan I, Engindestiz F, Boku B, Mutlu M et al. Brazil’s Dilemaziği Yüzünden Başıyacak Edim Suryoğlu Göçmenler ile Temel Sağlık Durarlarının Değerlendirilmesi. In 17. Ulusal Halk Sağlığı Kongresi 2014, Edirne.