Theory of low-power ultra-broadband terahertz sideband generation in bi-layer graphene

J.A. Crosse¹, Xiaodong Xu², Mark S. Sherwin³ & R.B. Liu¹

In a semiconductor illuminated by a strong terahertz (THz) field, optically excited electron–hole pairs can recombine to emit light in a broad frequency comb evenly spaced by twice the THz frequency. Such high-order THz sideband generation is of interest both as an example of extreme nonlinear optics and also as a method for ultrafast electro-optical modulation. So far, this phenomenon has only been observed with large field strengths (~10 kV cm⁻¹), an obstacle for technological applications. Here we predict that bi-layer graphene generates high-order sidebands at much weaker THz fields. We find that a THz field of strength 1 kV cm⁻¹ can produce a high-sideband spectrum of about 30 THz, 100 times broader than in GaAs. The sidebands are generated despite the absence of classical collisions, with the quantum coherence of the electron–hole pairs enabling recombination. These remarkable features lower the barrier to desktop electro-optical modulation at THz frequencies, facilitating ultrafast optical communications.
he optical modulation that occurs when an intense light field interacts with matter has a wide range of applications, from molecular imaging\textsuperscript{1,2} to soft X-ray generation\textsuperscript{3–5} and potential applications in all-optical signal processing. The well-known process of high-harmonic generation (HHG)\textsuperscript{6–9}—where the interaction of an optical field with an atom results in the emission light in a broad frequency comb evenly spaced by twice the optical field frequency—is an example of such a process.

HHG can be understood with a three-step model. In the first step, an electron is ionized from an atom by an intense field. In the second, the ionized electron is accelerated by the field along a closed orbit, returning to the ion at a later time with a higher energy. Finally, the electron recombines with the ion releasing a photon, which is an odd harmonic of the original field. One important feature of the process is its ‘non-perturbative’ nature, which results in a ‘plateau-like’ spectrum where the intensity of the harmonics remains approximately constant up to a cutoff of about 10\,kV cm\textsuperscript{-1}. This phenomenon is called the ‘perturbative’ plateau and is determined by the strength and angular frequency of the light field and $\omega$ the charge and mass of the driven electron, respectively. Hence, the harmonic strength decays away exponentially\textsuperscript{7–9}.

The similar process of high-order sideband generation (HSG) can occur in semiconductors\textsuperscript{10}. In HSG, a weak optical field promotes a valence band electron to the conduction band, creating an electron–hole pair. The pair is then driven in the band by an intense, terahertz (THz) frequency field. In analogy with HHG, the recombination of the electron–hole pair also produces light in a broad frequency comb (Fig. 1a). However, in this case, the resulting sidebands in the excitation field spectrum occur at even harmonics of the THz field. As with HHG, a ‘non-perturbative’ plateau occurs with a cutoff of $\Delta + 3.17U_p$ (where $\Delta$ is the detuning of laser from the band gap of the semiconductor and $U_p = \frac{e^2E_{THz}}{4\hbar m_o\omega}$ is the ponderomotive energy with $E_{THz}$ and $\omega$ the strength and angular frequency of the THz field and $m_o$ the electron-hole reduced mass). Such high-order THz sideband generation is not only of fundamental interest, as an example of extreme nonlinear optics in condensed matter systems, but also of technological importance as a mechanism for ultrafast electro-optical modulation—a crucial ingredient in Tbit s\textsuperscript{-1} rate optical communication. Hence, HSG has a wide range of potential applications but there is a serious technological challenge; HSG requires large THz field strengths. Current experimental observations of HSG have employed THz field amplitudes on the order of 10\,kV cm\textsuperscript{-1} (ref. 11) generated by a free-electron laser\textsuperscript{12,13}. The need for such large field strengths presents an obstacle to the use of HSG in optical devices.

Novel materials, such as graphene, offer a potential solution to this problem. The maximum modulation bandwidth is given by the maximum kinetic energy that can be obtained from the THz field by the electron–hole pair. This, in turn, is given by the work done on the electron–hole pair by the THz field, $\int E_{THz} v dt$, which is linearly proportional to their velocity, $v$. Electrons in graphene act like massless Dirac electrons and hence have a large initial velocity ($v_i \approx 10^6$\,ms\textsuperscript{-1}). Conversely, electrons in conventional parabolic band semiconductors have vanishing initial velocity near the band edge (although such velocities are available away from the band edge). Hence, graphene’s linear dispersion and ballistic electrons offer a significant energy gain, at least at low energies, over the parabolic bands of traditional semiconductor and, therefore, is a promising candidate material for HSG at the low-field intensities, which would be suitable for optical device design. In addition, graphene’s resonant transition at telecom frequencies\textsuperscript{14}, weak uniform absorptive loss\textsuperscript{15} and ultrafast optical response\textsuperscript{16} makes it an ideal candidate for optical communication applications. In fact, it has been demonstrated that graphene, owing to its ultrafast electrical response, is a promising material for ultrafast electro-optical modulation\textsuperscript{17}.

Here we report on the prediction that, although conversion efficiency is much lower, bi-layer graphene (BLG)\textsuperscript{18–20} produces a much broader bandwidth of modulation than conventional semiconductors and, specifically, BLG is a versatile system for HSG at telecommunication wavelength (1.55\,µm). We find that a THz field of strength 1\,kV cm\textsuperscript{-1} can produce an HSG spectrum of about 30\,THz in the telecom waveband, 100 times broader than in GaAs (or, equivalently, a comparable bandwidth in GaAs would require THz field intensities that are 100 times stronger). These remarkable features make it possible to realize HSG with a much weaker THz laser, which lowers the barrier to desktop electro-optical modulation at THz frequencies, facilitating ultrafast optical communication.

**Results**

**HSG in the absence of classical collisions.** The analysis of HSG in a conventional semiconductor is semi-classical; the sideband spectrum is found from the optical emission associated with the classical collision of electron–hole pairs that have been driven along closed trajectories (Fig. 1a). From a semi-classical perspective, however, HSG in graphene seems impossible. Optically excited electron–hole pairs, owing to their massless nature, act like photons in that their velocity is fixed at the Fermi velocity. The action of the THz field changes the momentum and energy of the electron and hole, but the velocity remains constant. As a result, the electron and hole separate at a constant rate and do not return to the same location (Fig. 1b) and, hence, no classical collisions occur. A similar issue is shared by electron–hole pairs excited well above the band edge. In this regime, the carriers, as with graphene, are created with a large initial velocity but, again, the THz field is usually not strong enough to reverse their direction of motion and classical collisions are absent. Recent work has shown that HSG can still be created in the absence of classical collisions if the coherence time of the electron–hole pairs is longer than half the THz period\textsuperscript{21} (also see Supplementary Note 1 and Supplementary Fig. 1). The long coherence time leads to broad electron and hole wavefunctions that can overlap significantly, even when the classical separation is non-zero. Hence, the electron and hole can still recombine to form sidebands even in the absence of classical collisions. As the semi-classical collisions are absent in graphene, it is this ‘quantum’ process that is the dominant mechanism of HSG in this material. Furthermore, the absence of the recollision condition means that the carriers can be accelerated by the THz field for the full half cycle and hence attain an energy that is greater than the $\Delta + 3.17U_p$ limit imposed by the necessity of classical recollision. Thus, this quantum coherence-induced sideband plateau is broader than the semi-classical plateau.

**HSG in BLG.** In the following study, the optical spectrum of a THz-driven electron–hole pair in biased BLG is investigated. We consider BLG, as opposed to monolayer graphene, as a bias field can be applied to the dual layer structure to open a gap at the Dirac point\textsuperscript{22} (Fig. 2a), which avoids excitations of many electron–hole pairs by the THz field (Schwinger instability\textsuperscript{23}), while still maintaining linear dispersion at the telecom frequencies. The low-energy band structure of BLG\textsuperscript{19,20} (also see Supplementary Note 2) displays four valley-degenerate bands, of which the two of lower energy, $E_r$ and $E_c$, are fully occupied valence bands and the two of higher energy, $E_v$ and $E_s$, are fully empty conduction bands (Fig. 2b). With a relatively low-intensity THz field and an excitation field in the C-band of the telecom
frequency range only one of the four possible transitions is significant. The major contribution to the spectrum comes from the \( E_v \rightarrow E_c \) transition (labelled (4) in Fig. 2b), where both the electron and hole are created in the linear-dispersion region. This is where the initial velocity is highest and hence where the maximum kinetic energy gain can be obtained. The other transitions (labelled (1–3) in Fig. 2b) contribute to a lesser extent to the HSG spectrum as either the electron or the hole is created in the parabolic-dispersion region or the optical excitation is off resonant or both (the HSG spectrum due to transitions 1 and 3 is narrower by approximately a factor of two and the HSG due to transition 2 is negligible). Thus, the maximum modulation is determined by \( E_v \rightarrow E_c \) transition alone.

We treat the THz-field as a continuous wave of the form, 
\[
F_{THz}(t) = F_{THz} \cos(\omega_{THz} t),
\]
which we take to be polarized in the \( x \)-direction. Similarly, the weak excitation field is taken to be a continuous wave, 
\[
F_{ex}(t) = F_{ex} e^{-i\omega_{ex} t}.
\]
The coupling of the THz field to the material is introduced via the time-dependent canonical momentum by the inclusion of the vector potential
\[
k \rightarrow \tilde{k}(t) = k + A_{THz}(t)
\]
with
\[
F_{THz} = -\frac{\partial A_{THz}}{\partial t}.
\]
If the excitation field is sufficiently weak, then one can work in the quasi-equilibrium regime, where the depletion of the valence band is

Figure 1 | Schematics of high-sideband generation in conventional semiconductors and in graphene. (a) In a conventional semiconductor, an electron–hole pair, created by a weak excitation field (1), is accelerated by an intense THz frequency field gaining energy. The electron and hole wavefunctions separate completely (2). The THz field drives the electron and hole back towards each other, recombining (3) and releasing a high-sideband photon (4). (b) In graphene, a weak excitation field excites an electron–hole pair (5), which is accelerated in opposite directions by the THz field (6). As the electron–hole pair has vanishing effective mass, the THz alters their energy and momentum but not their velocity. Hence, the electron and hole separate at the Fermi velocity. However, owing to the broad wavefunction of the electron and hole, there is still significant overlap at finite separations and, hence, recombination (and the release of a high-sideband photon) is possible even though the classical locations of the electron and hole do not coincde (7).
The dominant contribution is from the transition between the $E(4)$ and one off-resonant transition (2). These electron–hole pairs are then driven in the band, recombining to produce the optical sideband spectrum. The application of a bias field opens a gap at the Dirac point, converting BLG from a semi-metal to a semi-conductor. The 1.55 meV four hyperbolic bands are gapless at the Dirac point rendering the material a semi-metal. The 1.55 meV bands move towards the Dirac point they deviate from the parabolic bands can be expanded to

$$E_{\text{c}}[\hat{k}(t)] - E_{\text{c}}[\hat{k}(t)] \approx E_{\text{g}} + 2\hbar \nu_{\text{xc}} \cdot (\hat{k}(t) - k_{\text{ex}}). \tag{1}$$

The result is a band structure that resembles a shifted version of monolayer graphene with effective Fermi velocity, $\nu_{\text{xc}}$. Solving a restricted version of the classical equations of motion for such a system, one obtains a prediction for the plateau cutoffs of $4U_{\text{p,xc}}$ above and below the excitation frequency, with linear ponderomotive energy given by $U_{\text{p,xc}} = \frac{\nu_{\text{xc}} v_{\text{th}}}{c_{0}^2 \nu_{\text{th}}^2}$. The dashed black line in Fig. 3a shows the theoretical prediction of the cutoff. One observes good agreement over the full range of THz field strengths simulated. Similarly, the black arrows in Fig. 3b, c mark the theoretical cutoff given by the $4U_{\text{p,xc}}$ cutoff law. Figure 3b shows that at low field strengths the cutoff law is in good agreement with the numerical results. Figure 3c shows that although the cutoff law correctly predicts the high end cutoff, it over-estimates the low end cutoff. The reason for this is that as the bands move towards the Dirac point they deviate from the linear model of equation (1) and, hence, the electron and hole have lower velocities. This leads to the discrepancy observed in Fig. 3c.
Discussion

The advantages of BLG as a material for HSG can be seen by comparison with conventional semiconductors such as GaAs. In order to obtain a bandwidth of about 28 THz with a 1 THz frequency field, one would need a field strength of nearly 14 kV cm⁻¹ (that is, the required THz field intensity for GaAs is approximately 200 times stronger than for the BLG). Current experiments have used free electron lasers to produce such fields. In principle, such fields can be created in solid-state devices by careful microwave engineering. However, the field reduction offered by such fields can be created in solid-state devices by careful engineering of the material. Conversely, the GaAs ‘erbium window’, thus allowing broadband modulation at any frequency from O-band to U-band, not just the conventional C-band telecomm frequencies (including all standard band classifications outside the telecomm frequency waveband. Even materials with smaller band gaps (for example, silicon) usually need further engineering (either by alloying or via the creation of heterostructures) in order to create a device that is optimally tuned to a particular optical frequency. For exceptionally small band-gap semiconductors (such as InAs with energies of tens of meV), would be much faster than in transmission. In addition, the compact nature of the material and the fast response time of the effect would both be great advantages of a BLG modulator.

The results of this study suggest that biased BLG can provide ultra-broad HSG and, hence, ultrafast modulation of an optical field at THz field strengths low enough for table top sources to be used. These results open up the way for ultrafast, HSG-based, optical devices, which, coupled with the remarkable properties of BLG, marks a step towards realizing all optical broadband modulation and optical communication at the Tbit s⁻¹ rate.

Methods

Time-dependent Schrödinger equation. The electron–hole pair wavefunction, \( P_{\lambda\sigma}(k, t) = \langle \psi_{\lambda\sigma}(k, t) | \psi_{\lambda\sigma}(k, t) \rangle \), where \( \lambda \) and \( \sigma \) are the spin and valley indices, respectively, was computed using the time-dependent Schrödinger equation

\[
\frac{\hbar}{i} \frac{\partial}{\partial t} P_{\lambda\sigma}(k, t) = \Delta E[k(t)] P_{\lambda\sigma}(k, t) + i\hbar s[k(t)] \cdot F_{\text{THz}}(t),
\]

with

\[
\Delta E[k(t)] = E_2[k(t)] - E_1[k(t)] - \hbar \Omega_{\text{ex}} - i\Gamma + i\{A_{\sigma}(k(t)) + A_{\lambda}(k(t)) \} \cdot F_{\text{THz}}(t).
\]

Here, \( E_2[k(t)] \) and \( E_1[k(t)] \) are the instantaneous valence and conduction band energies, which can be derived using a tight-binding method with nearest neighbour hopping. The time-dependent canonical momentum is given by \( \mathbf{k}(t) = \mathbf{k} - \frac{\hbar}{i} \int dt' F_{\text{THz}}(t') \) and \( \mathbf{draul}(k(t)) = \epsilon(\mathbf{k}(t)) \nabla_{\mathbf{k}} \cdot \mathbf{k}(t) \) and \( \mathbf{A}(\mathbf{k}(t)) = \epsilon(\mathbf{k}(t)) \nabla_{\mathbf{k}} \mathbf{k}(t) \) are the interband dipole moment and Berry connection terms, the latter of which is required to preserve gauge invariance. As the driving of the electrons is linear (as opposed to closed orbits) the contribution of the Berry connection term is negligible (see Supplementary Note 5). \( \Gamma \) is a phenomenological dephasing rate that accounts for various relaxation mechanisms. For the sake of simplicity, we have not included the Coulomb interaction.

For optical device applications, one needs to consider the depth of the modulation. Again, the versatile properties of BLG are a bonus and a number of techniques can be employed to increase the amplitude of the sidebands. For example, employing waveguides to increase the interaction length between BLG and the laser, would increase the sideband amplitude and, hence, the modulation depth. Furthermore, owing to the small reflectance of BLG (< 0.1%) and the fact that the modulated light is emitted equally in the forward and backward directions, an enhanced modulation depth can be obtained by detection in reflection rather than in transmission. In addition, the compact nature of the process and the fast response time of the effect would both be great advantages of a BLG modulator.

The results of this study suggest that biased BLG can provide ultra-broad HSG and, hence, ultrafast modulation of an optical field at THz field strengths low enough for table top sources to be used. These results open up the way for ultrafast, HSG-based, optical devices, which, coupled with the remarkable properties of BLG, marks a step towards realizing all optical broadband modulation and optical communication at the Tbit s⁻¹ rate.

Figure 3 | Simulated data of the sideband spectrum of a THz-driven bi-layer graphene. (a) Contour plot of the sideband spectrum of THz-driven BLG for different THz field strengths. The colour map gives the logarithm of the normalized sideband amplitude \( \log_{10}(\mid \chi_{\lambda\sigma}(k, t) \mid) \). The dashed black lines give the theoretical sideband cutoffs, \( \pm 4\delta_{\text{ex}} \). (b) The sideband spectrum for a THz field of frequency 1 THz and strength of 1 kV cm⁻¹. (c) The sideband spectrum for a THz field of frequency 1 THz and strength 4 kV cm⁻¹. The arrows in (b) and (c) mark the location of the theoretical sideband cutoffs, \( \pm 4\delta_{\text{ex}} \).
References
1. Iatani, J. et al. Tomographic imaging of molecular orbitals. Nature 432, 867–871 (2004).
2. Baker, S. et al. Probing proton dynamics in molecules on an attosecond time scale. Science 312, 424–427 (2006).
3. Spielmann, C. H. et al. Generation of coherent x-rays in the water window using 5-femtosecond laser pulses. Science 278, 661–664 (1997).
4. Neutze, R., Wouts, R., van der Spoel, D., Weckert, E. & Hajdu, J. Potential for biomolecular imaging with femtosecond X-ray pulses. Nature 406, 752–757 (2000).
5. Dorney, B. et al. High harmonic generation in the relativistic limit. Nat. Phys. 2, 456–459 (2006).
6. Joachain, C. J., Kylstra, N. J. & Potvliege, R. M. Atoms in Intense Laser Fields (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2012).
7. Krause, J. L., Schafer, K. J. & Kulander, K. C. High-order harmonic generation from atoms and ions in the high intensity regime. Phys. Rev. Lett. 68, 3533–3538 (1992).
8. Corkum, P. B. Plasma perspective on strong-field multiphoton ionization. Phys. Rev. Lett. 71, 1994–1997 (1993).
9. Lewenstein, M., Balcou, P., Ivanov, M. Y., L'Huillier, A. & Corkum, P. B. Theory of high-harmonic generation by low-frequency laser fields. Phys. Rev. A 49, 2117–2132 (1994).
10. Liu, R.-B. & Zhu, B.-F. High-order THz-sideband generation in semiconductors. Proceedings of the 28th International Conference on the Physics of Semiconductors. AIP Conf. Proc. 893, 1455–1456 (2007).
11. Zak, S. N., Liu, R.-B. & Sherrin, M. Experimental observation of electron-hole recollisions. Nature 483, 580–583 (2012).
12. Stojanovic, N. & Drescher, M. Accelerator- and laser-based sources of high-field terahertz pulses. J. Phys. B At. Mol. Opt. Phys. 46, 192001 (2013).
13. Williams, G. P. Filling the THz gap – high power sources and applications. Rep. Prog. Phys. 69, 301–326 (2006).
14. Saito, R., Dresselhaus, G. & Dresselhaus, M. S. Physical Properties of Carbon Nanotubes (Imperial College Press, 1998).
15. Nair, R. R. et al. Fine structure constant defines visual transparency of graphene. Science 320, 1308 (2008).
16. Prechtel, L. et al. Time-resolved ultrafast photocurrents and terahertz generation in freely suspended graphene. Nat. Comm. 3, 646 (2012).
17. Liu, M. et al. A graphene-based broadband optical modulator. Nature 474, 64–67 (2011).
18. McCann, E. & Yoshino, M. The electronic properties of bi-layer graphene. Rep. Prog. Phys. 76, 056503 (2013).
19. McCann, E., Abergel, D. S. L. & Falko, V. I. Electrons in bi-layer graphene. Solid State Comm. 143, 110–115 (2007).
20. McCann, E., Abergel, D. S. L. & Falko, V. I. The low energy electronic band structure of bi-layer graphene. Eur. Phys. J. Special Topics 148, 91–103 (2007).
21. Crosse, J. A. & Liu, R.-B. Quantum coherence induced second plateau in high-sideband generation. Phys. Rev. B 89, 121202(R) (2014).
22. Zhang, Y. et al. Direct observation of a widely tuneable bandgap in bi-layer graphene. Nature 459, 820–823 (2009).
23. Allor, D., Cohen, T. D. & McGady, D. A. Schwinger mechanism and graphene. Phys. Rev. D 78, 096009 (2008).
24. Li, T. et al. Femtosecond population inversion and stimulated emission of dense Dirac fermions in graphene. Phys. Rev. Lett. 108, 167401 (2012).
25. Brida, D. et al. Ultrafast collinear scattering and carrier multiplication in graphene. Nat. Comm. 4, 887 (2013).
26. Ulstrup, S. et al. Ultrafast dynamics of massive Dirac fermions in bilayer graphene. Preprint at http://arxiv.org/abs/1403.0122 (2014).
27. Piscanec, S., Lazzeri, M., Mauri, F. & Ferrari, A. C. Optical phonons of graphene and nanotubes. Eur. Phys. J. Special Topics 148, 159–170 (2007).
28. Tomonichi, M. Cutting-edge terahertz technology. Nat. Phot. 1, 97–105 (2007).
29. Edwards, T. J. et al. Compound Source of continuously and widely-tuneable terahertz radiation. Opt. Exp. 14, 1582–1589 (2006).
30. Benicewicz, P. K. & Taylor, A. J. Scaling of terahertz radiation from large-aperture biased InP photodconductors. Opt. Lett. 18, 1332–1334 (1997).
31. Yang, F., Xu, X. & Liu, R.-B. Giant Faraday rotation induced by Berry phase in bilayer graphene under strong terahertz fields. New J. Phys. 16, 043014 (2014).

Acknowledgements
We acknowledge supports from Hong Kong Research Grants Council—General Research Fund Project 401512 and the Chinese University of Hong Kong Focused Investments Scheme. X.X. is supported by U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Basic Energy Sciences, Materials Sciences and Engineering Division Award (DE-SC0008145). M.S.S. is supported by Office of Naval Research grant number N00014-13-1-0806 and National Science Foundation Division of Materials Research grant number 1405964.

Author contributions
R.B.L. conceived the idea and supervised the project. R.B.L. and M.S.S. designed the device. J.A.C. carried out the theoretical study and numerical calculation. J.A.C. wrote the paper. All authors analysed the data and commented on the manuscript.

Additional information
Supplementary Information accompanies this paper at http://www.nature.com/naturecommunications

Competing financial interests: The authors declare no competing financial interests.

Reprints and permission information is available online at http://npg.nature.com/reprintsandpermissions/

How to cite this article: Crosse, J. A. et al. Theory of low power ultra-broadband terahertz sideband generation in bi-layer graphene. Nat. Commun. 5:4854 doi: 10.1038/ncomms5854 (2014).

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article’s Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in the credit line; if the material is not included under the Creative Commons license, users will need to obtain permission from the license holder to reproduce the material. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/