AN ANALYSIS OF RECOUNT TEXT IN ENGLISH TEXTBOOKS USED BY TENTH GRADE STUDENTS

1Riana br. Sianipar, 1Dewi Sartika Sianturi, 1Sintia Anastasia Situmorang
1Perius Gulo, 2Erikson Saragih

1English Language Education, Faculty of Teachers Training and Education, Prima Indonesia University, Indonesia
2English Lecturer, Prima Indonesia University, Indonesia
Corresponding Author Email: sianiparria28@gmail.com

Abstract
This study was aimed at investigating the extent to which recount texts in two selected English textbooks meet the recount text criteria and to find out the similarities and differences of the recount texts between the two selected English textbooks. This study employed a descriptive qualitative method. The data in this study were four forms of recount texts taken from the two selected textbooks. Data analysis was done through analyzing, displaying, reducing, and drawing a conclusion. The data of this study include the generic structure, social objectives, and linguistic elements. The results of the analysis showed findings as follows: (1) four forms of the recount texts in the English textbooks have met the generic structure criteria, namely orientation, event, and reorientation; (2) one of the four recount texts fulfilled social goals; and (3) the four recount texts fulfilled the linguistic element. In short, the recount texts in English textbooks were similar to in terms of linguistic elements and type of process, while differences were found in terms of social goals and generic structure.

Keywords
Recount Text; Linguistic Elements; Generic Structure; Social and Social Purpose;

INTRODUCTION
English is an international language used in many countries. English is considered as an important language for everyone to learn because it is spoken around the world. In Indonesia, English has been learned by Indonesian learners from middle schools into university as their compulsory lesson and must be mastered by them (Haerazi, Vikasari, & Prayati, 2019). English has been spread globally and may always be used throughout the world. In the EFL/ESL context, English is learned in integrated learning of the four language skills. Because of this, English becomes a lingua franca and influences forms of language contact and communication (Mauranen, 2018). In Indonesia, English as a foreign language has been expressed in various written and spoken forms. It is in line with Martin-Anatias (2017) who states English usage is expressed inherently in language selection for individual or national identity.

To learn English, course-book developers create various learning materials for facilitating students to improve the four language skills. Some of them are in line with Susyetina (2019) who argue that children begin to learn from listening activities, speaking, reading, and finally writing activities. They perform the listening of hearing from the sounds of the language identifying, viewing and reacting to the meanings contained in the material to see (Ismiati & Pebriantika, 2020). Then, speaking activities are considered as the most complex skill because it covers many aspects of knowing pronunciation (listening), accuracy, fluency, grammar, and vocabulary (Salim, Terasne, & Narasima, 2020). Meanwhile, reading
is a style that is needed to know “the writer’s point of view about an issue, find the organizational pattern of paragraphs, and find general ideas quickly” (Azis, Nasir, & Ramadani, 2019; Haerazi & Irawan, 2020). The last skill considered as the most challenging skill is writing (Sitorus & Sipayung, 2018) because writing should involve the metacognition, cognition, culture, and psychological aspect during writing activities (Haerazi & Irawan, 2019). The product of writing activities includes texts.

Text can be interpreted as a lingual unit that is provided in writing or verbally with certain organizational arrangements to express contextual meaning (Hyland, 2007). Text is a sequence of words used to provide information to explain the meaning. In genre-based language teaching, many teachers provide their learners with different types of texts such as narrative text, report text, procedure text, and recount text to exercise to practice writing (Haerazi et al. 2019). In this study, researchers focus on analyzing the recount text. Recount text is presented in the earlier chapter of junior high school textbooks. This text is as opening text to be recognized by students to tell an event or experience in the past. The purpose of recount text is to be able to provide information that can entertain readers and listeners to know the topic or content of the discourse or story text (Knapp & Watkins, 2005).

This study is aimed at investigating the types of recount texts used by the two English textbooks to facilitate students to practice writing and reading. This study also aims to find out whether the text meets the criteria in accordance with the recount text generic structures. The researchers can be useful, in particular for students who have low writing skills and reading skills. In addition, the recount text types found in this study can be continued and modified by English teachers to help students improve their language skills. The novelty of this study relies on the kinds of recount texts which can be functioned to develop students’ knowledge about genres in English learning-teaching.

**Review of literature**

**English Materials Development**

In exploring what varieties of English should be taught, many English teachers develop and reconstruct their instructional materials because these are considered enable to influence students; attitudes and understanding of themselves, others, and society (Ndura, 2004; Tomlinson, 2008; Haerazi et al., 2018). The English coursebooks have a significant role to guide students to learn. Numerous studies pointed out the problematic aspects of English textbooks such as the use of American or British English form (Matsuda, 2003; Song, 2013), the extensive attention to English-native cultures (Shin, Eslami, & Chen, 2011), and teachers’ responses to and use of global textbooks (Canagarajah, 1993; Forman, 2014). More importantly, there has been limited discussion of key issues in relation to textbook content (Vinall & Shin, 2018). In this study, the crucial issue to help students improve their knowledge of genres is dealing with the type of genre which is the recount text used in English textbooks at tenth-grade students.

**Recount Texts**

This study discusses the analysis of recount texts in tenth-grade high school English books, the researcher also explains material that contains understanding, language features, generic structure and examples. Recount text is a text which lists and describes past experiences by retelling events in the order in which they happened in the chronological order (Knapp & Watskin, 2005). The purpose of a recount text is to retell events with the purpose of either informing or entertaining their audience (or both).

Recount text has several types of text that can be used for you to write. According to Sitorus and Sipayung (2018), various types of recount text can be seen from two aspects; First, in the personal recount. It is a recount text that serves to tell about the author's personal experience. The second can be seen in the factual recount. It is a recount text that serves to
present reports of events that actually happened, such as science experiment reports or police reports. The last, it can be seen in an imaginative recount. It is a type of recount text that serves to present an imaginative story (Mediska & Adnan, 2019). The language features of a recount text include that the language is written in the simple past tense, and the frequent use is made of connectives that link events in time, such as next, later, when, then, after, before, first.

| Orientation (Who, What, When, Where)          | Last summer, I had a fantastic holiday. I visited some great places. |
|-----------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Series of events                               | I went to the airport and was going to fly to Cleveland.            |
|                                               | Then, I went to Hollywood.                                          |
|                                               | After that, I went to New York City.                                |
| Reorientation (stating personal comments about the events) | The places made me feel at home, but I had to get to my real home. Next time, I would like to visit these places again. |

**RESEARCH METHOD**

**Research Design**

This study uses a descriptive qualitative method which is content analysis or document analysis (Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2014). This study emphasizes on elaborating messages in the English textbooks in detail. It also is focused on analyzing document which is in line with the recount text form of the English textbook. The researchers and some English teachers were the subjects of this study. The researcher analyzed two tenth-grade English books or textbooks at HKBP Sidorame Medan High School, Erlangga and Yudistira publishers. The focus of this research is to analyze the recount text chosen from two tenth grade English textbooks. The textbooks are chosen because it was used by applying the curriculum 2013.

**Research Instruments**

There are two kinds of instruments applied in this study. The primary instrument is the researcher. As the first instrument, the researchers scrutinized the data, starting from the data collection until the data report. As the main instrument, the roles of the researcher also cover planning, collecting, analyzing and reporting the research findings (Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2014). On the other hand, the secondary instrument was also used in this study. It was the checklist which can be employed to help researchers to identify and evaluate the data. It helps researchers to identify the types of recount texts, social values, and generic structures that are integrated into the textbooks.

**Data Analysis**

Qualitative data is the catch in the words of the research subjects. The sample used in this study is an English book. This study analyzes recount text material consisting of social goals, linguistic elements and generic structures which are in the English books of publishers Erlangga and Yudistira. The data were collected from an English textbook for the tenth-grade senior high school. The data were gathered based on the evaluation done by researchers and two English teachers using the checklists as the research instrument to gather the data. In the phase of reducing, the researcher classified some recount texts into some categories in line with the theories used in this study. Then, the results are discussed among researchers. Afterward, the results are consulted with some English teachers. The discussion happened and the researcher displays and decides the types of the recount text used in the two textbooks.
used by the tenth-grade students at HKBP SIDORAME MEDAN. The analysis was focused on the recount text structure, namely orientation, events, and reorientation. In addition

**RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

**Research Findings**

In terms of social objectives, three recount texts fulfill the criteria as recount texts. There are two social goals for recount text; to entertain the reader and tell someone's experience which is an action or activity. All texts from the two selected textbooks have fulfilled the first social goal. They can entertain readers and tell stories in the order of events (Gerrot & Wignel, 1996; Knapp & Watkins, 2005). For the second social purpose, three short stories have reached the criteria to tell the story of a person's experience in an act of struggle. Text 1 of Erlangga's publisher textbook has achieved social goals, to tell the story of heroism in fighting for a country, because characters, events, and places are not imaginary but real. In terms of generic structures, research shows that two texts do not meet the requirements of generic structures.

However, from the three recount texts, Text 2 of the Yudistira publisher Textbook has fulfilled the generic recount text structure, namely: orientation, events, Reorientation. In addition, Erlangga's textbook and Yudhistira's book publisher have fulfilled these elements. In the case of linguistic features, it is shown that the recount text from Erlangga Textbooks and Yudhistira Textbooks has used the linguistic features required by the Recount text such as the use of time links, certain participants, Past Tense, and the existence of material. From the analysis, it was found that the Recount text from the two textbooks gave similarities and differences. For similarity, it was found that all Recount texts originating from the Erlangga Text Book and Yudhistira Book were written from the perspective of a third person because all characters or participants have the right name (Halliday, 2004).

In addition, similarities between Erlangga Textbooks and Yudhistira Books can be found in the types of processes and linguistics of Recount texts. Descriptions are presented in the following table.

| Category   | Textbook 1 | Textbook 2 |
|------------|------------|------------|
| Material   | 1          | 1          | 1          |
| Relational | 1          | 1          | 1          |
| Behavioral | 1          | 1          | 1          |
| Existential| 1          | 1          | 1          |

Table 1 presents the similarity of the recount text found in Textbook 1 and Text book 2. As can be seen from the table above, it is clearly seen that all recount texts have provided the process required by the material. the process (Christie & Derewianka, 2010; Halliday, 2004; Gerot & Wignell, 1996). In addition to the processes required, there are also other process events such as relational and existential processes. Relational processes are processes of being (Halliday, 2004, Emilia, 2014) while existential processes are processes that represent experiences that show that something exists or happens (Halliday, 2004; Emilia, 2014). This existential process takes place in Orientation. The same thing happens with all Recount texts in two textbooks. In addition, the similarity of the Recount text between Textbook 1 and Text Book 2 can be found in the linguistic element as can be seen from the table below.
Table 2. The linguistic element of the recount text in textbooks

| Category            | Textbook 1 | Textbook 2 |
|---------------------|------------|------------|
| Noun                | ✓          | ✓          | ✓          |
| Past Tense          | ✓          | ✓          | ✓          |
| Time Connective     | ✓          | ✓          | ✓          |
| Action Verbs        | ✓          | ✓          | ✓          |
| Adverbs             | ✓          | ✓          | ✓          |

Table 2 reveals that all recount texts in textbook 1 and textbook 2 have achieved the results of all the criteria for linguistic elements. The recount text in the two selected textbooks has used a time link that shows the story written chronologically (Knapp & Watkins, 2005). This is related to the process that occurs in the text. As mentioned by Halliday (1994, quoted in Emilia, 2014, p. 150) which processes consist of five elements; participants, the process itself, and the circumstances. In addition, the recount text in the two selected textbooks has used past tense as a verb in each clause. Apart from similarities, there are also differences found in the recount text between Textbook 1 and Textbook 2. The recount text in the two selected textbooks is different in terms of generic structure and social goals. Generic structure analysis in the recount text of Text Book 1 and Book 2 is presented in the table below.

Table 3. The Generic Structure of Recount texts in Textbook 1 and Textbook 2

| Orientation | Events | Reorientation |
|-------------|--------|---------------|
| Text Book 1 |        |               |
| Text 1      | ✓      | -             | ✓            |
| Text 2      | ✓      | -             | ✓            |
| Text Book 2 |        |               |
| Text 3      | ✓      | ✓             | ✓            |

Table 3 shows the differences in recount text between the two selected English textbooks. From the table, it is shown that from the two recount texts listed in textbook 1 do not provide events but both do not reach the criteria. Meanwhile, in Textbook 2 there is one Recount text that reaches the criteria. Additionally, recount text in Textbook 1 and TextBook 2 differ in terms of social objectives. Analysis of the differences is presented in the following table.

Table 4. The Social purpose of Recount texts in Textbooks

| Purpose                | Textbook 1 | Textbook 2 |
|------------------------|------------|------------|
| To entertain the reader| ✓          | ✓          |
| To tell an imaginary story | -        | -          | ✓          |

Table 4 shows that the recount text in Textbook 1 and Book 2 has achieved the first goal of the recount text which is to entertain the reader (Knapp & Watkins, 2005). It was obtained from stories written chronologically and intended to tell stories in sequence. However, there is a recount text in Text Book 1 that does not achieve the second goal of the Recount text that tells an imaginary story. There are several criteria for recount texts identified as imaginary...
stories. It is seen from imaginative characters, events, and places. Because the characters Text 1 and 2 are real humans and do not show imaginative characters so Text 1 tells an imaginary story. description, it can be concluded that the recount text in Textbook 1 and Book 2 shows similarities and differences. The recount texts in Textbooks 1 and 2 are similar in terms of Types of Processes and Linguistic Elements. While differences in recount text in Textbook 1 and Book 2 are found in generic structures and social goals.

CONCLUSION

The findings of this study indicate that in certain cases, most of the recount texts from the two selected English textbooks have fulfilled the recount text criteria in terms of generic structure, social goals, and linguistic elements. The recount text between two textbooks also shows differences and similarities. The recount text in textbook 1 and textbook 2 is similar in terms of linguistic elements and type of process. However, the recount texts in textbooks 1 and 2 differ in terms of social objectives and generic structure because two of the three texts in Textbook 1 do not provide Resolution while textbook 2 has reached the criteria.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Our first gratitude goes to our supervisor and also an academic advisor. Researchers are deeply indebted to all my colleagues, for his guidance and patience during the process of this research. I would also like to thank them for having been willing to spare his time not only for giving suggestions, reading, and improving my manuscript but also for encouraging me to finish this research. Their expertise in English language teaching has helped me a lot in the writing process of this research study. Additionally, I am forever grateful for the useful knowledge shared by all the lecturers for their comments and suggestions in any part of this manuscript.

REFERENCES

Aprianoto, & Haerazi (2019). Development and assessment of an interculture-based instrument model in the teaching of speaking skills. *Universal Journal of Educational Research* 7(12) pp. 2796-2805. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2019.071230](https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2019.071230)

Arifaturrochmah, A. (2014). *An analysis of the students recount texts*. Bandung: Penerbit Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

Aziz, Z., Nasir, C., & Ramazani, R. (2019). Applying metacognitive strategies in comprehending English reading texts. *Celt: A Journal of Culture, English Language Teaching & Literature*, 19(1), 138-159. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.24167/celt.v19i1.1863](https://doi.org/10.24167/celt.v19i1.1863)

Canagarajah, A. S. (1993). American textbooks and Tamil students: Discerning ideological tensions in the ESL classroom. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 6(2), 143–156. [https://doi.org/10.1080/07908319309525145](https://doi.org/10.1080/07908319309525145)

Forman, R. (2014). How local teachers respond to the culture and language of a global English as a foreign language textbook. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 27(1), 72–88. [https://doi.org/10.1080/07908318.2013.868473](https://doi.org/10.1080/07908318.2013.868473)

Haerazi, H., Irwansyah, D., Juanda, J., & Azis, Y. A. (2018). Incorporating intercultural competences in developing English materials for writing classes. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 9(3), 540-547. [http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0903.13](http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0903.13)
Haerazi, H., May Vikasari, R., & Prayati, Z. (2019). The use of scientific-based approach in ELT class to improve students’ achievement and classroom interaction. Register Journal, 12(2), 157-180. https://doi.org/10.18326/rgt.v12i2.157-180

Haerazi, H., Prayati, Z., & Vikasari, R. M. (2019). Practicing contextual teaching and learning (CTL) approach to improve students’ reading comprehension in relation to motivation. English Review: Journal of English Education, 8(1), 139-146. https://doi.org/10.25134/erjee.v8i1.2011

Haerazi, H., & Irawan, L. A. (2019). Practicing genre-based language teaching model to improve students’ achievement of writing skills. IJELTAL (Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics), 4(1), 9-18. http://dx.doi.org/10.21093/ijeltal.v4i1.246

Haerazi, Irawan, Suadiyatno, & Hidayatullah. (2020). Triggering preservice teachers’ writing skills through genre-based instructional model viewed from creativity. International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education (IJERE), 9(1) DOI: http://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v9i1.20395

Haerazi, H., & Irawan, L. (2020). The effectiveness of ECOLA technique to improve reading comprehension in relation to motivation and self-efficacy. International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning (IJET), 15(01), pp. 61-76. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v15i01.11495

Hyland, K. (2007). Genre pedagogy: Language, literacy and L2 writing instruction. Journal of Second Language Writing, 16(3), 148–164. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jslw.2007.07.005

Horkheimer & Adorno, (2017). Instrumen Penelitian Kualitatif.Jakarta: Penerbit sosiologis.

Ismiati, I., & Pebriantika, E. (2020). Designing strategies for university students’ writing skill. JOLLT Journal of Languages and Language Teaching, 8(1), 8-19. DOI: https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v8i1.2210

Kurniawan Lanny, KennethW.Ament.. (2016). Talk Active Senior High School Year X.Bogor: Penerbit Yudhistira.

Knapp, P., & Watkins, M. (2005). Genre, text, grammar: Technologies for teaching and assessing writing. Sidney: UNSW Press

Martin-Anatias, N. (2018). Bahasa gado-gado: English in Indonesian popular texts. World Englishes Journal, 37(2) pp. 340-355. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1111/weng.12313

Matsuda, A. (2003). Incorporating world Englishes in teaching English as an international language. TESOL Quarterly, 37(4), 719–729. https://doi.org/10.2307/3588220

Mauranen, A. (2018). Second Language Acquisition, world Englishes, and English as a Lingua Franca (ELF). World Englishes Journal, 37(1) pp. 106-119. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1111/weng.12306

Mediska, G., & Adnan, A. (2019). Improving student’s speaking by using cocktail party technique in teaching recount text for senior high school students, Journal of English Language Teaching, 8(2) pp. 295-304

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J (2014). Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook. 3rd Edition. Los Angeles: Sage.

Ndura, E. (2004). ESL and cultural bias: An analysis of elementary through high school textbooks in the western United States of America. Language, Culture & Curriculum, 17(2), 143–153. https://doi.org/10.1080/07908310408666689
Salim, A., Terasne, T., & Narasima, L. (2020). Enhancing the students’ pronunciation using shadowing technique at senior high school students. *JOLLT Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 8(1), 20-28. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v8i1.2212](https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v8i1.2212)

Shin, J., Eslami, Z. R., & Chen, W. C. (2011). Presentation of local and international culture in current international English-language teaching textbooks. *Language, Culture & Curriculum*, 24(3), 253–268. [https://doi.org/10.1080/07908318.2011.614694](https://doi.org/10.1080/07908318.2011.614694)

Sitorus, G., & Sipayung, K. (2018). An Error Analysis of Using Phrases in Writing Recount Text at Tenth Grade in SMA Parulian 2 Medan. * Celt: A Journal of Culture, English Language Teaching & Literature*, 18(1), 79 - 88. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.24167/celt.v18i1.562](https://doi.org/10.24167/celt.v18i1.562)

Song, H. (2013). Deconstruction of cultural dominance in Korean EFL textbooks. *Intercultural Education*, 24(4), 382–390. [https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2013.809248](https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2013.809248)

Susyetina, A. (2019). Language preference of bilingual preschool children in articulating word-object relationships. *JOLLT Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 7(1), 21-37. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v7i1.1333](https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v7i1.1333)

Sutopo, A. H., & Arief, A. (2010). Terampil Mengolah Data Kualitatif dengan NVIVO. Jakarta: Penerbit Kencana Prenada Media Group retrieved from [http://statistikmu.blogspot.com/2018/03/statistik-tugas-1.html](http://statistikmu.blogspot.com/2018/03/statistik-tugas-1.html)

Tomlinson, B. (Ed.). (2008). *English language learning materials: A critical review*. London: Continuum.

Utami, W., Rohmah, Z., & Furaidah. (2016 ). *Bahasa Inggris/ Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan*. Edisi Revisi Jakarta: Pusat Kurikulum dan Perbukuan, Balitbang, Kemdikbud.

Vinall, K., & Shin, J. (2018): The construction of the tourist gaze in English textbooks in South Korea: exploring the tensions between internationalisation and nationalisation, *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 32(2) 173-190. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.1080/07908318.2018.1513022](https://doi.org/10.1080/07908318.2018.1513022)