Ocean temperatures through the Phanerozoic reassessed

Ethan L. Grossman1,* & Michael M. Joachimski2

The oxygen isotope compositions of carbonate and phosphatic fossils hold the key to understanding Earth-system evolution during the last 500 million years. Unfortunately, the validity and interpretation of this record remain unsettled. Our comprehensive compilation of Phanerozoic δ18O data for carbonate and phosphate fossils and microfossils (totaling 22,332 and 4615 analyses, respectively) shows rapid shifts best explained by temperature change. In calculating paleotemperatures, we apply a constant hydrosphere δ18O, correct seawater δ18O for ice volume and paleolatitude, and correct belemnite δ18O values for 18O enrichment. Similar paleotemperature trends for carbonates and phosphates confirm retention of original isotopic signatures. Average low-latitude (30° S–30° N) paleotemperatures for shallow environments decline from 42.0 ± 3.1 °C in the Early-to-Middle Ordovician to 35.6 ± 2.4 °C for the Late Ordovician through the Devonian, then fluctuate around 25.1 ± 3.5 °C from the Mississippian to today. The Early Triassic and Middle Cretaceous stand out as hothouse intervals. Correlations between atmospheric CO2 forcing and paleotemperature support CO2's role as a climate driver in the Paleozoic.

The 18O/16O ratios of biogenic carbonate and apatite are an essential proxy for paleotemperature and seawater δ18O. For decades, however, Earth scientists have debated the climate implications of the Phanerozoic 18O/16O record (reported as δ18O), which shows increasing values with decreasing age (e.g. Refs.1–4). The increase in biomineral δ18O toward the present has been interpreted three ways: (1) cooling of the Earth's oceans through time (e.g. Ref.5), (2) evolving crustal cycling manifested in an increase in seawater δ18O (δ18Osw; e.g. Refs.2,3), and (3) progressive sample diagenesis with age (e.g. Ref.6). Correct interpretation of this record is fundamental to understanding climate drivers, the limits of Earth's climate, and importantly, the evolution and thermal limits of metazoan life on geologic timescales.

To characterize and evaluate the Phanerozoic trend in biomineral δ18O and sea surface temperature (SST), we present a compilation of low-latitude (30° S–30° N) δ18O paleotemperatures for Phanerozoic carbonate and phosphate fossils and microfossils that, in contrast to earlier published records, corrects for the influence of ice volume and salinity (via paleolatitude relationships) on the δ18Osw of surface waters. Furthermore, for the first time we consider the impact of fractionation differences in belemnites7,8 to develop a 500-million-year paleo temperature curve that resolves the problem of anomalously cold paleotemperatures previously obtained for intervals in the Jurassic and Cretaceous. The compiled data reveal similar trends for carbonate and phosphate δ18O, providing evidence for signal preservation, and argue for extreme warmth in the early Paleozoic (30 to > 40 °C), comparable to that experienced at the end-Permian and earliest Triassic9,10.

Results

Phanerozoic oxygen isotope records. The carbonate δ18O record combines data for well-preserved planktonic foraminifera, mollusks, and brachiopods (Fig. 1B). The data for well-preserved carbonates (N = 11,893 of 22,332 total) and phosphates (N = 4,427 of 4615 total) are available in Appendices 1 and 2 and the StabisoDB database (http://stabisodb.org). Counts of δ18O analyses by stage, fossil group, and climate zone are in Appendix 3. The Locfit regressions (Locfit package in R version 3.6.2; smoothing factor α = 0.0511) combine data for the tropical (10° S–10° N) and tropical-subtropical (10–30° N and S latitude) climate zones. Distinctive features of the Phanerozoic record for carbonates include extremely low brachiopod δ18O values (~ −7.5‰ VPDB) for the Middle Ordovician, a latest Ordovician (Hirnantian) maximum (~ −3.6‰), an Early Devonian minimum (~ −5.9‰), a Middle Devonian maximum (~ −2.9‰), and a Late Devonian (Frasnian–Famennian) minimum

1Department of Geology and Geophysics, Texas A&M University, College Station, TX 77843, USA. 2GeoZentrum Nordbayern, Friedrich-Alexander Universität of Erlangen-Nürnberg (FAU), Schloßgarten 5, 91054 Erlangen, Germany. *email: e-grossman@tamu.edu
Average brachiopod values increase to a Mississippian maximum of −1.1‰ and fluctuate between −3.3 and −1.2‰ in the Pennsylvanian and Early Permian before decreasing into the Triassic (< −3‰), a period for which carbonate δ18O data are scarce. For the Jurassic and Cretaceous, periods for which belemnite data dominate, the δ18O record features high values in the Late Jurassic (−1.5‰, Oxfordian-Kimmeridgian) and Early Cretaceous (−2.2‰, Aptian), when the foraminiferal record begins. Values then decrease to an early Late Cretaceous minimum (−5.6‰, Turonian), followed by an irregular increase in the Neogene to modern values (−1.9 ± 0.3‰).

Key features in the conodont δ18O record (Fig. 1A) mimic those of the carbonate record. Conodont δ18O values increase from very low values in the Early Ordovician (<17‰ VSMOW) to higher values (19.0‰) in the Late Ordovician (Sandbian), followed by a minimum (17.5‰) in the earliest Silurian (Llandovery), a Wenlock maximum (18.5‰), and an Early Devonian minimum (17.1‰; Lochkovian). Values increase during the...
Early Devonian to a Middle Devonian maximum (~19.3‰) followed by a minimum (17.2‰) at the Frasnian-Famennian transition. After a Late Devonian high (18.3‰), values increase substantially during the Mississippian. Oxygen isotope compositions of Pennsylvanian conodonts from epicontinental (e.g., North America) and slope settings (South China) show considerable offset (~19.5‰ versus ~23‰ respectively) potentially due to lower salinities in shallow-water North American settings or deeper habitat depths of South China conodonts. The δ¹⁸O values decrease sharply from ~20.4 to ~17.7‰ across the Permian–Triassic boundary with low δ¹⁸O values persisting in the Early Triassic. In contrast to the Cambrian to Triassic conodont δ¹⁸O record, the Cenozoic fish δ¹⁸O record is of too low resolution to allow detailed interpretation. Direct comparison of stage averages (Fig. 2A) shows a strong correlation between carbonate and phosphate δ¹⁸O values ($R^2 = 0.667, \ p < 0.0001$). The slope of 0.85 is nearly identical to the slope (0.82) of "equilibrium" carbonate δ¹⁸O (% VPDB) versus phosphate.
Phanerozoic low-latitude temperatures. Paleozoic paleotemperatures based on carbonates and phosphates (Figs. 3, 4) show similar trends such as very high late Cambrian and Early to Middle Ordovician temperatures (> 40 °C), high early Late Ordovician through Devonian temperatures (32–40 °C), a dramatic decline of as much as 15 °C at the Devonian to Mississippian transition, and cooler temperatures in the Carboniferous and Permian (19–35 °C; Fig. 4). The records show disagreement at intervals in which brachiopods were derived from paleo-arid regions, where high δ¹⁸O ‰ values, underestimated by our model, result in underestimated isotopic temperatures. Examples include Tournaisian-Viséan data from Indiana (USA) and Kungurian-Roadian data.

Figure 3. δ¹⁸O paleotemperatures for phosphate and carbonate fossils and microfossils from low paleolatitudes (30° S to 30° N). Comparison of δ¹⁸O paleotemperature trends (Locfit regressions) for phosphate and carbonate fossils calculated using different corrections for seawater δ¹⁸O: (1) constant (ice-free, δ¹⁸O ‰ = −1.08‰ VSMOW), (2) ice volume corrected (IceV), and (3) ice volume and latitude corrected (IceV, lat). For greenhouse climates, the ice-free data (red dotted line) plot atop the ice volume corrected data (blue dotted lines). Aragonite fossils are corrected for aragonite-calcite fractionation (arag; −0.6‰) and belemnite data are corrected for ¹⁸O enrichment in belemnites (−1.5% where noted (bel)). Locfit regression for data uncorrected for ¹⁸O enrichment in belemnites shown as pink line. Gaps in curves are intervals with little or no data. TEXH temperatures shown for comparison. See Fig. 1 for key to period/subperiod bar at top.

δ¹⁸O (‰ VSMOW) over the temperature range 10 to 45 °C for the paleotemperature equations used, supporting the integrity of these records.
Figure 4. Comparison of oxygen isotope temperatures (E) with climate and tectonic proxy data. (A) Occurrence and latitudinal extent of glaciogenic sediments20; (B) estimated $\delta^{18}$Osw (this study); (C) atmospheric $pCO_2$21; (D) crustal accretion rate22 compared with combined phosphate and carbonate $\delta^{18}$O paleotemperature (low-latitude, Locfit regression and 5-yr averages); (E) Low-latitude phosphate and carbonate $\delta^{18}$O paleotemperatures calculated by correcting seawater $\delta^{18}$O for ice volume (iceV) and latitude (lat). Locfit regression ($\alpha = 0.05$) with 95% CI calculated for combined carbonate and phosphate $\delta^{18}$O paleotemperatures. Paleozoic clumped isotope paleotemperatures (clumped T) from Henkes et al.23 and Barney and Grossman24. Also shown are TEX86 paleotemperatures using the TEX86-SST calibration16,17. Geologic time scale abbreviations same as in Fig. 1. Warm events: La Landovery, Lo Lochkovian, FF Frasnian–Famennian, PT end-Permian and early Triassic, To Toarcian, CT Cenomanian–Turonian, PETM Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum, EECO Early Eocene Climatic Optimum.
from the Ural Mountains (Russia). Paleotemperature differences also occur because of differences in the distribution of sample ages. Whereas brachiopods provide a robust record of the Hirnantian Cool Event, conodont data are essentially absent. In contrast, the hothouse at the end-Permian and Early Triassic is well represented in conodont data but not in brachiopod data.

Simple linear regression of carbonate and phosphate $\delta^{18}$O paleotemperatures averaged for Paleozoic and Triassic stages (Fig. 2B, Supplementary Tables 1 and S1) yields an equation:

$$T_{\text{PCO}} = 1.05(\pm 0.14) T_{\text{CaCO}_3} - 4.8(\pm 4.3; R^2 = 0.6615, p < 0.0001).$$  

The strong correlation ($R^2 = 0.6615$) and slope near 1 are evidence that these materials retained their original isotopic signature. The ~4 °C average offset from the 1:1 line suggests higher paleotemperatures for the phosphate samples. This difference could reflect differences in aridity and the spatial and temporal distributions of specimens as mentioned above (e.g. Ref. [15]). Another contributing factor may be depth habitat. At some locations, nektonic conodonts may have lived shallower in the water column than benthic brachiopods. Lastly, differences in paleotemperature may indicate uncertainties in the paleotemperature equations. Applying the equation of Friedman and O’Neill for calcite decreases the temperature difference between Paleozoic stages from 3.6 to 2.0 °C. However, we use the Kim and O’Neill equation because it is more widely applied by the paleoclimate community. Combining the results for conodonts and brachiopods provides a continuous and comprehensive paleotemperature record for low latitudes (30° S–30° N; Fig. 4). Late Cambrian (Furongian) and Early to Middle Ordovician low-latitudes experienced the highest SSTs, 47 °C and between 35 and 47 °C, respectively. Late Ordovician to Devonian low-latitude SSTs were considerably cooler (32–40 °C). Cooler still were Carboniferous to modern low-latitude SSTs, which varied between 19 and 35 °C with relatively cool “icehouse” temperatures observed in the Carboniferous to Middle Permian (19–24 °C), Middle Jurassic to Early Cretaceous (18–27 °C), and late Eocene to modern times (23–25 °C). The late Permian to Middle Jurassic and Late Cretaceous to Eocene are recognized as warm climatic intervals (25–30 °C) with the Permian–Triassic transition, Early Triassic, and Cenomanian–Turonian standing out as hothouse intervals. The Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum (PETM), another very warm period, is not well represented in our oxygen isotope dataset due to insufficient data for shallow-dwelling organisms.

Discussion
The decrease in marine fossil $\delta^{18}$O with age, the trend expected with oxygen isotope exchange with meteoric water, has led some to question the preservation and efficacy of the original marine $\delta^{18}$O signal, especially with regard to the Paleozoic record. We address these concerns by restricting Paleozoic samples to the best-preserved material, brachiopod shell calcite and conodont apatite. Phosphate oxygen is more tightly bound in the crystal lattice than is calcite oxygen; in fact, apatite phosphate survives dissolution and recrystallization as trisiliverphosphate during sample preparation without altering its oxygen isotope composition. That both minerals yield similar $\delta^{18}$O trends through time (Figs. 2, 3) is evidence for preservation of primary signals. Additional evidence is comparable $\delta^{18}$O values for Pennsylvanian calcite versus aragonite and for Devonian conodont apatite experiencing minimal versus extensive heating.

As with previous studies, our $\delta^{18}$O results show an increase from very low late Cambrian through Middle Ordovician values toward higher $\delta^{18}$O values in the modern (Fig. 5). Not surprisingly, our paleotemperatures show many of the same relative changes as in previous studies, an expectation considering the overlap in data sources; however, substantial differences occur in absolute temperature with higher Early Paleozoic temperatures in our study and much lower Phanerozoic temperatures in other studies. These offsets reflect differences in (1) sample material (carbonates versus combined carbonates and phosphates), (2) screening approaches, (3) methods of estimating seawater $\delta^{18}$O, and (4) paleotemperature equations.

We start the discussion with Veizer and Prokoph’s seminal work because several studies adopt their data and interpretation (e.g., Refs. 22,23). With regard to sample material, the Veizer and Prokoph $\delta^{18}$O curve is based on data only from brachiopods and planktonic foraminifera and excludes data from phosphates (e.g., conodonts), belemnites, bivalves, and gastropods. Importantly, planktonic foraminifera can be readily recrystallized on the cold sea floor; specimens not characterized as glassy or excellently preserved can yield $\delta^{18}$O values 1‰ higher than glassy foraminifera. This in part accounts for very low paleotemperatures for the Cenozoic and Cretaceous. For example, Vérard and Veizer obtained average low-latitude paleo-SSTs of 10 °C for the Early Cretaceous (115–135 Ma), a time of greenhouse climate.

Another reason for unusually low paleotemperatures in Veizer and Prokoph and Vérard and Veizer is the assumption regarding seawater $\delta^{18}$O. Interpreting the $\delta^{18}$O trend as reflecting changes in seawater $\delta^{18}$O, they (1) fit a 2nd order regression to the trend, (2) adjust the equation to intersect $\delta^{18}$O of 0‰ VPDDB at 0 Ma (i.e., set Y-intercept at 0‰), and (3) use the regression to “correct” carbonate $\delta^{18}$O values for changes in $\delta^{18}$Osw. The effect of this treatment is to set modern low-latitude SST for the dataset at ~18.0 °C, more than 7.4 °C lower than the modern average (25.4 °C; https://psl.noaa.gov/data/gridded/data.cobe.html) for that study’s paleolatitude window (35° S to 35° N) and 6.5 °C lower than average tropical proxy temperatures for the Late Pleistocene (~24.5 °C). By comparison, for our study interval (30° S to 30° N) the temperature at 0 Ma is 23.5 °C, much closer to the modern and Late Pleistocene values. Veizer and Prokoph’s age correction of $\delta^{18}$Om compensates for the low mineral $\delta^{18}$O values for the Ordovician through Devonian, shifting biominal $\delta^{18}$O values +5 to +2‰ respectively, equivalent to 22 to 9 °C. A third consideration is the paleotemperature equation. Veizer and Prokoph and Mills et al. use a linear equation with a $\delta^{18}$O-temperature dependence of ~4 °C per ‰, significantly lower than that of other studies (~4.3 to ~4.8 °C per ‰; Grossman), resulting in paleotemperature underestimation at temperatures above ~25 °C. These factors contribute to these studies’ findings of equitable low-latitude paleotemperatures.
for Early Paleozoic oceans, and to the excessively cold temperatures of 10–12 °C for Pennsylvanian and early Permian oceans (325–295 Ma).

Another important Phanerozoic temperature curve is that of Song et al.29. This curve yields lower temperatures in the Paleozoic, early Mesozoic, and Cenozoic compared with ours (Fig. 5). These authors make use of phosphate δ18O data for the Paleozoic and carbonate δ18O data for the Mesozoic and Cenozoic, noting the better δ18O preservation of apatite compared with the calcite in Paleozoic fossils. These authors reject the hypothesis of increasing seawater δ18O in the Phanerozoic4 and instead assume a constant seawater δ18O of −1‰ VSMOW, representing ice-free conditions. The lower temperatures in Song et al.29 reflect (1) use of an ice-free seawater δ18O value during glacial conditions (an up to −6 °C effect; e.g., 10 °C temperatures for mid-Carboniferous), (2) lack of paleolatitude corrections for seawater δ18O (an effect of up to −5 °C for the subtropics), and (3) use of the phosphate-water paleothermometers of Lécuyer et al. (2013; an effect of up to −3.5 °C). We use the Pucéat et al.13 equation, which was produced in the same lab where the majority of Paleozoic phosphate samples were analyzed. Song et al.29 also includes samples for higher latitudes (up to ± 40°), which could lower paleotemperatures. However, in StabisoDB, phosphate samples from 30 to 40° paleolatitude only represent 7.5% of the samples between 0 and 40° paleolatitude, so this effect should be minor. Scotese et al.’s30 Phanerozoic temperature curve shows less extreme temperatures in the Early Paleozoic and late Cenozoic (Fig. 5). The curve uses a combination of isotopic data29 and paleotemperatures based on paleo-Köppen climate belts calibrated with modern Köppen belt temperature relations. While novel, this hybrid paleotemperature curve implicitly assumes modern temperature relations and thus may inject a uniformitarian bias into quantification of Earth’s temperature history. As discussed earlier, our Phanerozoic curve is the first to correct δ18Osw for paleolatitude and for 18O-enrichment in belemnites, which accounts for warmer proxy temperatures for the Jurassic compared with other isotopic studies.

Accepting that the Phanerozoic δ18O trend is not an artifact of diagenesis, the debate as to whether the trend reflects δ18Osw or temperature change distills to two endmember assumptions: (1) no long-term trend in seawater δ18O (e.g. Ref.36) and (2) no long-term trend in low-latitude SST3,4,27. In theory, the oxygen isotope history of seawater can be calculated from the rates and temperatures of oxygen exchange between the mantle, crustal reservoirs, and the ocean. Mass balance models have been used to argue for near-constant (e.g. Refs. 36–38) or increasing (e.g. Refs. 39,40) δ18Osw depending on the proportion of crustal oxygen exchange at high-temperature (which decreases δ18Osw) versus low-temperature (which decreases δ18Osw). Models that predict changes in δ18Osw through Earth history show trends that asymptotically approach modern values, consistent with minimal change in carbonate δ18O over the past ~350 myr (e.g. Ref. 40). One limitation of crustal exchange models is the large uncertainty in hydrothermal fluid fluxes. These fluxes are estimated based on the difference between modeled and measured (conductive) ocean heat flux41. However, uncertainty in the temperature of off-ridge hydrothermal fluids can lead to greater than ±50% uncertainty in hydrothermal flux and large uncertainty in the mineral–water 18O fractionation. A recent hypothesis is that Snowball-Earth sequestration of glacial ice might have resulted in 18O-enriched residual seawater that would re-equilibrate with ocean crust, lowering δ18Osw toward 0‰, followed by melting of 18O-depleted Snowball ice and lowering of global δ18Osw42. However, for this process to impact

Figure 5. Comparison of low-latitude Phanerozoic temperature curves from this study (30° S to 30° N), Song et al. (2019; 40° S to 40° N), Vérard and Veizer (2020; 35° S to 35° N), and Scotese et al.30 (“tropical”). Differences in curves reflect in part acceptance (this study; Song et al.29) or rejection22,30 of the buffered hydrosphere δ18O model1,13 which constrains global seawater δ18O between roughly −1 and 1‰ VSMOW. Geologic time scale abbreviations same as in Fig. 1. Dashed lines represent ±95% confidence interval for this study’s results.
the $\delta^{18}O$ of Cambrian and Ordovician oceans, large ice volumes with extremely low $\delta^{18}O$ would be required in a slushball Earth\textsuperscript{48}, an improbable scenario.

In summary, the different models for the temporal $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ trend each lead to extreme climate scenarios. Assumption of a crustally-buffered hydrosphere near $-1\%$ (VSMOW) leads to high paleotemperatures in the Early to Middle Ordovician ($>45\,\circ C$). In contrast, the Phanerozoic $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ trend of Veizer and Prokoph\textsuperscript{4} generates low-latitude $\delta^{18}O$ temperatures of $\sim 10\,\circ C$ for the Late Ordovician, Pennsylvaniaian, and Early Cretaceous (Fig. 3 of Ref.\textsuperscript{22}), temperatures incompatible with modern photozoan carbonate deposition mainly observed within the $>20\,\circ C$ winter water temperature isotherm\textsuperscript{45}.

Studies of the $\delta^{18}O$ of non-carbonate phases, clumped isotopes in carbonates, and fluid inclusions support arguments for relatively high seawater $\delta^{18}O$ and temperatures in the early Paleozoic. Hydrothermally-altered ophiolites\textsuperscript{31} and mudrocks\textsuperscript{32} yield constant $\delta^{18}O$ values through time, suggesting constant seawater $\delta^{18}O$ throughout the Phanerozoic. Moreover, magnetite veins in Moroccan ophiolites dated at 760 Ma indicate $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ values of $-1.3 \pm 1.0\%$\textsuperscript{46}. Further, $\delta^{18}O$ values of marine iron oxides from ooidal ironstones and other deposits spanning the last 2 billion years suggest lower $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ in the Proterozoic but "largely stable $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ in the Phanerozoic"\textsuperscript{47}. Clumped isotopes indicate high temperatures for the Ordovician and Silurian\textsuperscript{24}. For example, temperatures for Katian (~450 Ma) brachiopods and rugose corals from North America cluster around $37\,\circ C$, while minimum Hirnantian (~444 Ma) values range from 29 to 35 $\circ C$\textsuperscript{48}. These temperatures and associated $\delta^{18}O$ values suggest $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ values of $-0.5$ to $3.5\%$. Reexamination of Katian brachiopods using microanalytical techniques yields clumped isotope temperatures with a mode of $\sim 33\,\circ C$ (mean $= 35 \pm 2.8\,\circ C$) for a subtropical upwelling setting\textsuperscript{24}.

Another consideration in paleotemperature determination is paleoceanographic environment. The samples on which Paleozoic through Jurassic temperatures are based come from continental margins and epeiric seas, environments subjected to local runoff and restricted circulation. Local runoff can result in $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ values lower than those estimated here, but typically such samples are identifiable by the presence of euryhaline fauna\textsuperscript{56}. Restricted circulation, on the other hand, can lead to temperatures that average $2\,\circ C$ higher than open-ocean temperatures\textsuperscript{51; therefore, the Paleozoic and some Mesozoic temperatures reported in this study may be $2\,\circ C$ higher than those of the contemporaneous open ocean.

Extreme warmth comparable to the Late Ordovician to Devonian has been recorded in younger times in Earth history. For example, $\delta^{18}O$ measurements of end-Permian and Early Triassic conodonts yield temperatures of $\geq 36\,\circ C$\textsuperscript{10}. TEX$_{an}$ and $\delta^{18}O$ data for planktonic foraminifera suggest late Cenomanian-to-Turonian equatorial SSTs of $25\,\circ C$\textsuperscript{34}. Furthermore, multiple methods (TEX$_{an}$, SST calibration, Mg/Ca, $\Delta_{47}$) indicate tropical SSTs throughout the Eocene of 30 to 36 $\circ C$ for the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum (PETM), and $35$ to $37\,\circ C$ for the Early Eocene Climatic Optimum (EECO)\textsuperscript{41; Fig. 4}. Even higher TEX$_{an}$ SSTs of 40 to 45 $\circ C$ are reconstructed using the TEX$_{an}$ BAYSPEAR calibration\textsuperscript{42,43}. Thus, low-latitude SSTs of $35\,\circ C$ and warmer are not unique to the Early Paleozoic but occurred also during Mesozoic and Cenozoic warm intervals. Furthermore, these temperatures are close to tropical SST projected for the year 2100 if modern tropical seas (25–30$\,\circ C$) warm by more than 4$\,\circ C$\textsuperscript{42,43}, as predicted by the RCP 8.5 scenario.

Comparing low-latitude temperature to seafloor accretion rate\textsuperscript{22} allows us to examine the link between plate tectonics and climate. Seafloor accretion rate correlates significantly with low latitude temperature ($R^{2} = 0.47$, $p < 0.0001$; Supplementary Fig. S1, Supplementary Table S2), with warmer temperatures associated with faster spreading rates. This linkage is attributed to high rates of volcanic CO$_2$ degassing with higher rates of seafloor spreading and subduction\textsuperscript{40}.

Isotopic temperatures of $>40\,\circ C$ for the late Cambrian and Early Ordovician, which extend beyond the temperature tolerances of most modern multi-cellular Eukarya (e.g. Ref.\textsuperscript{56}), present a conundrum. Is our understanding of the physiology and behavior of early animals incomplete? If Early Ordovician fauna were limited only to taxa able to tolerate unusually high temperatures, this would further strengthen Ordovician cooling as an explanation for the dramatic increase in Ordovician diversity, the Great Ordovician Diversification Event (GOBE)\textsuperscript{57}. Furthermore, such cooling would raise the solubility of oxygen in seawater\textsuperscript{29} and, along with a posited increase in atmospheric oxygen levels, permit greater metabolic activity and predation\textsuperscript{58}, leading to paleoecological reorganization\textsuperscript{59}.

Our results can be used to examine the sensitivity of low-latitude temperatures to changes in pCO$_2$ (low-latitude Earth system sensitivity or ESS). Overall, paleotemperature exhibits a significant correlation ($R^{2} = 0.234$, $p = 0.0014$) with pCO$_2$, doubling based on the proxy record of Foster et al.\textsuperscript{21}; Supplementary Table S3; based on 10-myr Locfit averages). This relationship indicates a role of pCO$_2$ in controlling low-latitude Phanerozoic SST. For Phanerozoic climate, changes in solar radiation must be considered in addition to the radiative forcing controlled by pCO$_2$. To examine the relationship between changes in low-latitude temperature ($\Delta T_{LL}$) and changes in radiative forcing of pCO$_2$, and solar radiation ($\Delta S_{[CO2,SOL]}$), we convert pCO$_2$, doubling to radiative forcing by multiplying by 3.7 W m$^{-2}$, and correct for increasing solar radiation with time using the equation: $\Delta F_{sol} = -23$ W m$^{-2} \times 0.0000665 \times$ (age (myr)$^{-0.85}$). $\Delta S_{[CO2,SOL]}$ estimates yield significant correlations ($p < 0.0001$) with $\Delta T_{LL}$ for the Paleozoic but not for the Mesozoic and Cenozoic (Fig. 6). Royer\textsuperscript{51} also found a poor relationship between surface temperature and combined CO$_2$ and solar forcing for the Cenozoic and Mesozoic, noting that temperature data for the Mesozoic are sparse. Though not seen in our results based on limited planktonic foraminifera and macrofossil data, a strong relationship between Cenozoic temperatures and pCO$_2$ is seen in studies based on benthic foraminiferal $\delta^{18}O$\textsuperscript{60}.

Deming Model II (DMII) regression for the Paleozoic data generates the following relation:
DMII regression was chosen because of comparable uncertainty in both X and Y. This equation yields an Earth system sensitivity (ESS) value for Paleozoic low latitudes of 2.9 K W⁻¹ m² or 10.7 K per CO₂ doubling. This value is high compared with the range for 35–150 Ma based on an ensemble of climate model simulations (3.5 and 5.5 K)⁶³, especially considering that (1) the 0°–30° latitude band accounts for only half of Earth’s surface and (2) SST change will underestimate change in global surface temperature, especially during icehouse climate⁶¹,⁶⁴. On the other hand, the value is within those calculated for discrete time intervals in the Pliocene⁶¹. In comparing radiative forcing and temperature change, other studies of Earth system sensitivity have used simple linear regression (SLR), which considers only uncertainty in Y⁶¹,⁶⁵. SLR of our results yields the following equation for the Paleozoic:

\[ \Delta T_{LL} (°C) = 2.91 (±0.76) \cdot \Delta S_{[CO2, SOL]} + 7.5 (±1.5) \quad (R^2 = 0.538). \]  

(2)

Figure 6. Change in \( pCO_2 \) and solar radiative forcing (\( \Delta S_{[CO2,SOL]} \)) versus mean low-latitude (0–30°) paleotemperature (\( \Delta T_{LL} \)) for 10-myr intervals in the Cenozoic (orange), Mesozoic (green), and Paleozoic (blue-green). Filled symbols identify statistically significant relations (p < 0.05). Equations show Deming Model II regression (heavy dashed lines) and simple linear regression with associated uncertainty (gray dashed line with dotted uncertainty bands). Only Paleozoic data show a significant relationship.

\[ \Delta T_{LL} (°C) = 1.70 (±0.41) \cdot \Delta S_{[CO2, SOL]} + 6.4 (±1.2) \quad (R^2 = 0.538). \]  

(3)

This equation provides an ESS value of 1.7 W⁻¹ m² or 6.3 K per CO₂ doubling, similar to climate sensitivities determined for glaciated time⁶⁴. Justification for using simple linear regression instead of Model II regression is discussed in Smith⁶⁶ and centers on the objectives of the study. Since our objective is to “define some mutual, codependent “law” underlying the interaction between X [\( \Delta pCO_2 \) radiative forcing] and Y [\( \Delta SST \)]," and since the slope “will be used to interpret the pattern of change” (Smith⁶⁶, p. 482), we favor Model II regression. On the other hand, Smith⁶⁶ notes that “when an equation is used for prediction," SLR is the “method of choice”. More detailed examination of choice of regression model is beyond the scope of this paper but clearly merits future consideration.

Note that this treatment does not account for changes in paleogeography, sea level, land ice area, vegetation, non-CO₂ greenhouse gases, and aerosols, some of which also serve as feedback mechanisms; however, it does provide an estimate of ESS for the highest sustained CO₂ levels in the past 420 myr (> 2000 ppm) and the worst-case scenario levels for a couple of centuries into the future⁶⁶. Lastly, our finding that ESS was high in the Paleozoic compared with the Cenozoic supports studies suggesting higher ESS with higher CO₂ levels (e.g. Ref.⁶⁷).

Materials and methods
Details regarding samples and methods appear in Ref.¹. The compilation builds upon previous efforts (e.g. Refs.⁴,⁴⁷) and focuses on carbonate and phosphate fossils and microfossils that (1) are widely distributed in the sedimentary record, (2) are precipitated with quantitative δ¹⁸O fractionation relative to temperature, and (3) exhibit excellent preservation. Samples include mollusks, brachiopods, planktonic foraminifera, fish teeth, and conodonts.
The late Cambrian through Triassic record is based on brachiopod calcite and conodont phosphate. Thick brachiopods from cratons tend to show the best preservation and least scatter in their δ¹⁸O values (e.g. Refs. 5,18,20). Targeting best preserved shells with petrographic and cathodoluminescence microscopy, combined with analyses of microsamples (<100 µg), further reduces variability and allows for multiple analyses from a single shell. While our compilation includes all data, regressions for temporal trends and paleotemperature estimates only consider data from brachiopod shell that (1) is non-luminescent, (2) contains manganese contents <250 ppm, or (3) thick-shelled and from areas known for excellent preservation (e.g., Moscow Basin; see Ref. 6 for additional details). Biogenic apatite is less prone to diagenetic overprinting; however, the unknown habitat of conodonts may represent an uncertainty for interpretation of δ¹⁸O values. While brachiopods are benthic organisms, conodonts were active swimmers that could have lived in warm surface waters or deeper and thus colder parts of the water column. The comparison of oxygen isotope values of conodont taxa from sediments of different water depths gave equivocal results (e.g. Refs. 70,71).

Belemnite rostra, calcite deposits in the cephalopod’s posterior, are the most common material analyzed from Jurassic and Cretaceous sediments. These fossils typically have δ¹⁸O values higher than those of co-occurring bivalves, confounding paleotemperature studies. However, recent clumped isotope studies have revealed that belemnites precipitated in warmer waters than their δ¹⁸O values indicate, prompting researchers to conclude that belemnite guards are precipitated in true equilibrium with seawater, and that δ¹⁸O paleotemperature relations for other biominerals and laboratory precipitates do not represent true equilibrium 14. In our dataset, belemnites average 1.7 ± 0.5‰ (N = 19) and 1.1 ± 1.2‰ (N = 13) higher in δ¹⁸O compared with brachiopods and bivalves (Appendix 4). To account for this effect, we have applied a −1.5‰ correction to belemnite data as suggested by Vickers et al. 14.

Planktonic foraminiferal data provide paleotemperatures for Cretaceous through Cenozoic climate. Because planktonic foraminiferal tests commonly recrystallize with burial on the sea floor19, we only use data for planktonic foraminifera that exhibit exceptional preservation (e.g., “glassy,” “excellent”16,29). The δ¹⁸O data for aragonite samples, mostly of Cenozoic age, are normalized to calcite δ¹⁸O by subtracting 0.6‰22.

Analytical techniques. Analytical techniques are summarized in Grossman and Joachimski1 and Joachimski et al. 20 and presented in detail in the papers from which the data are derived. Briefly, carbonates of 0.05 to several milligrams are acidified with concentrated phosphoric acid and the CO₂ evolved is analyzed on an isotope ratio mass spectrometer. Isotopic data are reported in delta (δ) notation and reported versus PDB (Peedee belemnite) or VPDB (Vienna PDB). The latter refers to calibration to PDB using the NBS-19 calcite standard (δ¹⁸O = −2.20‰ versus PDB73,74 or the new carbonate standard, IAEA-603 (δ¹⁸O = −2.37‰). The precision for oxygen isotope analyses of CaCO₃ is typically ±0.05 to 0.10‰, which equates to roughly ±0.25 to ±0.5 °C at 25 °C12. Oxygen isotope analyses of biogenic apatite are either measured by (1) TC-EA IRMS (thermal-coupled elemental analyzer—iso-ratio mass spectrometry) on trisilverphosphate precipitated after dissolving calcium fluorapatite or (2) in situ by secondary ion mass spectrometry (SIMS). Whereas phosphate-bound oxygen is analyzed by TC-EA IRMS, total oxygen including phosphate-, carbonate- and hydroxyl-bound oxygen is determined by total carbon and oxygen analysis by isotope ratio mass spectrometry (TC-EA IRMS, total carbon and oxygen analysis by isotope ratio mass spectrometry) on trisilverphosphate precipitated after dissolving calcium fluorapatite or (2) in situ by secondary ion mass spectrometry (SIMS). Whereas phosphate-bound oxygen is analyzed by TC-EA IRMS, total oxygen including phosphate-, carbonate- and hydroxyl-bound oxygen is measured by SIMS with the δ¹⁸O offset between these methodologies not well constrained. We applied a correction of −0.6‰ to all SIMS δ¹⁸O data based on the comparison of SIMS and TC-EA IRMS data22.

Paleotemperature and seawater δ¹⁸O determinations. We use the Kim and O’Neill15 and Pucéat et al. 16 δ¹⁸O paleotemperature equations for calcite and phosphate, respectively. The δ¹⁸O of seawater (δ¹⁸Osw) for million-year intervals is based on estimates of the volume and δ¹⁸O of glacial ice (see Supplementary Materials, Supplementary Tables S4–S6). Ice volumes through time are binned into simple categories of ice-free, low, moderate, and high based on studies of glacial sediments and sea level (e.g. Refs. 76–79). For the δ¹⁸O of ice, we assume the 6‰ values for the West Antarctica (−41‰) and Greenland ice sheets (−34‰) for “moderate” and “low” ice volumes respectively (Supplementary Table S4–S6). The calculated values for mean δ¹⁸Osw range from −1.08‰ for the ice-free state to 0.45‰ for high ice volume (Pleistocene average; Supplementary Table S7). Lastly, δ¹⁸Osw was averaged for 1-myr steps using a 2-myr window to smooth the impact of assigned ice volume changes.

Paleolatitudinal correction. Paleolatitudes were reconstructed using the GPlates software80 with the Palaeomap41 rotation model. For paleolatitudinal corrections of δ¹⁸Osw during icehouse climates, we use the modern latitude-δ¹⁸O relationship of Roberts et al. 82 (Supplementary Fig. S2, Supplementary Table S8) derived from gridded data modeled in LeGrande and Schmidt83. Using data for the Southern Hemisphere, which are less scattered than northern values, the δ¹⁸Osw-latitude relation using the isotope-enabled ocean–atmosphere general circulation model (GCM) results of Ref. 82 (Supplementary Table S8) for the early Paleogene. The modeled δ¹⁸Osw values for 0–60° latitude in the southern hemisphere (from Fig. 1 of Ref. 82) give the equation:

$$\Delta^{18}O_{sw, Lat, Mod} = -0.650 \times 10^{-4} \lambda^2 + 3.363 \times 10^{-2} \lambda + 0.174 \ (R^2 = 0.951)$$

(4)

For hothouse climates, we generate the δ¹⁸Osw-latitude relation using the isotope-enabled ocean–atmosphere general circulation model (GCM) results of Ref. 82 (Supplementary Table S8) for the early Paleogene. The modeled δ¹⁸Osw values for 0–60° latitude in the southern hemisphere (from Fig. 1 of Ref. 82) give the equation:

$$\Delta^{18}O_{sw, Lat, Pg} = -4.944 \times 10^{-4} \lambda^2 + 2.492 \times 10^{-2} \lambda + 0.102 \ (R^2 = 0.932)$$

(5)

Latitudinal corrections for < 60° latitude (δ¹⁸Oswcorr) were proportioned based on the estimated δ¹⁸Oswcorr using the equation:
$$\Delta^{18}O_{\text{lat corr}} = \Delta^{18}O_{\text{sw, lat, Mod}} \frac{\delta^{18}O_{\text{sw, iceV}} - 1.08}{(0.45 - 1.08)} + \Delta^{18}O_{\text{sw, lat, PS}} \left( 1 - \frac{\delta^{18}O_{\text{sw, iceV}} - 1.08}{(0.45 - 1.08)} \right)$$ (6)

where $\delta^{18}O_{\text{sw, iceV}}$ is the ice volume correction for global seawater and 0.45%o is the icehouse endmember (average between glacial and interglacial states).

We bin our data into the following climate zones by paleolatitude: tropical (± 10°), tropical-subtropical (10°–30°), temperate (30°–50°), and subpolar–polar (50°–90°) using the maps from Scotese and Wright. These bins were selected based on the temperature gradients for the latest Cretaceous through Recent reported in Zhang et al. Over the time interval studied, spanning greenhouse and icehouse climates, paleotemperatures within 10° N or S are invariant with paleolatitude. Infections in latitudinal temperature gradients at 30° and 50° define boundaries for the next two bins. Lastly, stage-averaged paleotemperatures for the ± 10° and 10°–30° bins were found to be statistically similar ($\Delta T(10°–30° \text{ minus } 0°–10°) (°C) = -1.0 \pm 2.1(\text{2SE}) °C$) (N = 25) for carbonates and $-2.0 \pm 2.2$ (N = 25) for phosphates) and thus were combined. At latitudes higher than 30°, data become sparse. Further, the increased latitudinal temperature gradient at higher latitudes along with greater influence of $^{18}O$-depleted fresh water increases the uncertainty in paleotemperature determinations. Lastly, sample ages are based on the GTS2020 timescale.

Data availability
All data and Locfit regression tables used in this study are available in the Supplementary tables and auxiliary data files. The data are also available on the StabisoDB online database (http://stabisoDB.org).

Received: 1 November 2021; Accepted: 22 April 2022
Published online: 27 May 2022

References
1. Grossman, E. L. & Joachimski, M. M. In *The Geologic Time Scale 2020*, vol. 1 (eds. Gradstein, F. M., Ogg, J. G., Schmitz, M. D., & Ogg, G. M.) Ch. 10, 279–307 (Elsevier, 2020).
2. Perry, E. C. The oxygen isotope chemistry of ancient cherts. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 3, 62–000 (1967).
3. Veizer, J. et al. *Sr*/Sr, $^6$C and $^6$O evolution of Phanerozoic seawater. *Chem. Geol.* 161, 59–88 (1999).
4. Veizer, J. & Prokoph, A. Temperatures and oxygen isotopic composition of Phanerozoic oceans. *Earth Sci. Rev.* 146, 92–104. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2015.03.008 (2015).
5. Knauth, L. P. & Epstein, S. Hydrogen and oxygen isotope ratios in nodular and bedded cherts. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 40, 1095–1108. https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-7037(76)90051-X (1976).
6. Land, L. S. Oxygen and carbon isotope composition of Ordovician brachiopods—implication for coeval seawater—Comment. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 59, 2843–2844 (1995).
7. Bajnai, D. et al. Dual clumped isotope thermometry resolves kinetic biases in carbonate formation temperatures. *Nat. Commun.* 11, 4005. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-17501-0 (2020).
8. Vickers, M. L. et al. Unravelling Middel to Late Jurassic palaeocenographic and palaeoclimatic signals in the Hebrides Basin using belemnite clumped isotope thermometry. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 546, 116401. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2020.116401 (2020).
9. Joachimski, M. M. et al. Climate warming in the latest Permian and the Permian–Triassic mass extinction. *Geology* 40, 195–198. https://doi.org/10.1130/g32707.1 (2012).
10. Sun, Y. et al. Lethally hot temperatures during the Early Triassic greenhouse. *Science* 338, 366–370. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1234126 (2012).
11. Loader, C. Package 'locfit' version 1.5-9.4. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/locfit/locfit.pdf (2020).
12. Kim, S. T. & O’Neil, J. R. Equilibrium and nonequilibrium oxygen isotope effects in synthetic carbonates. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 61, 3461–3475 (1997).
13. Pučetá, E. et al. Revised phosphate-water fractionation equation reassessing paleotemperatures derived from biogenic apatite. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 298, 135–142. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2010.07.034 (2010).
14. Chuvashov, B. I. The main types of carbonate rocks of the Kungurian evaporite basin of the Urals. *Geol. Soc. Lond. Spec. Publ.* 22, 225–232. https://doi.org/10.1144/gsp.1986.022.01.22 (1986).
15. Grossman, E. L. et al. Glaciation, sideration, and carbon sequestration in the Perm-Carboniferous: The isotopic record from low latitudes. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 268, 222–233. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2008.03.033 (2008).
16. O’Brien, C. L. et al. Cretaceous sea-surface temperature evolution: Constraints from TEa,es and planktonic foraminiferal oxygen isotopes. *Earth Sci. Rev.* 172, 224–247. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2017.07.012 (2017).
17. Evans, D. et al. Eocene greenhouse climate revealed by coupled clumped isotope-Mg/Ca thermometry. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 115, 1174–1179. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1714744115 (2018).
18. Jones, L. A. & Eichenseer, K. Uneven spatial sampling distorts reconstructions of Phanerozoic seawater temperature. *Geology* 50, 238–242. https://doi.org/10.1130/geo2021-002.1 (2021).
19. Friedman, I. & O’Neil, J. R. In *Compilation of Stable Isotope Fractionation Factors of Geochemical Interest* vol. Chapter KK (U. S. Government Printing Office, 1977).
20. Cather, S. M., Dunbar, N. W., McDowell, F. W., McIntosh, W. C. & Scholle, P. A. Climate forcing by iron fertilization from repeated ignimbrite eruptions: The icehouse–silicic large igneous province (SLIP) hypothesis. *Geosphere* 5, 315–324. https://doi.org/10.1130/geo20088.1 (2009).
21. Foster, G. L., Royer, D. L. & Lunt, D. J. Future climate forcing potentially without precedent in the last 420 million years. *Nat. Commun.* 8, 14845. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-018 (2017).
22. Vérard, C. & Veizer, J. On plate tectonics and ocean temperatures. *Geology* 47, 881–885. https://doi.org/10.1130/g46376.1 (2019).
23. Henkes, G. A. et al. Temperature evolution and the oxygen isotope composition of Phanerozoic oceans from carbonated clumped isotope thermometry. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 490, 40–50. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2018.02.001 (2018).
24. Barney, B. B. & Grossman, E. L. Reassessment of ocean paleotemperatures during the Late Ordovician. *Geology* 50, 572–576 (2022).
25. Brand, U. Depositional analysis of the Breathitt Formation's marine horizons, Kentucky, USA: Trace elements and stable isotopes. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 65, 117–136. https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-9622(71)90068-6 (1977).
26. Joachimski, M. M. et al. Devonian climate and reef evolution: Insights from oxygen isotopes in apatite. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 284, 599–609. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2009.05.028 (2009).
27. Prokoph, A., Shields, G. A. & Veizer, J. Compilation and time-series analysis of a marine carbonate $^{18}O$, $^6$C, $^{34}S$ and $^{87}Sr/^{86}Sr$ database through Earth history. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* 87, 113–133. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2007.12.003 (2008).
41. Stein, C. A. & Stein, S. Constraints on hydrothermal heat flux through the oceanic lithosphere from global heat flow. J. Geophys. Res. Solid Earth 99, 3081–3095. https://doi.org/10.1029/94JB02222 (1994).

42. DeFries, W. F. The impact of Snowball Earth glaciation on ocean water δ18O values. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 554, 11661. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2020.116661 (2021).

43. James, N. P. & Clarke, J. A. D. Cool-Water Carbonates. (SEPM Society for Sediment. Geol., 1997).

44. Hodel, F. et al. Fossil black smoker yields oxygen isotopic composition of Neoproterozoic seawater. Nat. Commun. 9, 1435. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-018-03890-w (2018).

45. Galili, N. The geologic history of seawater oxygen isotopes from marine iron oxides. Science 365, 469–473. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aaw9247 (2019).

46. Bergmann, K. D. et al. A paired apatite and calcite clumped isotope thermometry approach to estimating Cambro-Ordovician seawater temperatures and isotopic composition. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 224, 18–41. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2017.11.015 (2018).

47. Finnegan, S. et al. The magnitude and duration of Late Ordovician–Early Silurian glaciation. Science 331, 903–906. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1200803 (2011).

48. Cummins, R. C., Finnegan, S., Fike, D. A., Eiler, J. M. & Fischer, W. W. Carbonate clumped isotope constraints on Silurian ocean temperature and seawater δ18O. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 140, 241–258. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2014.05.024 (2014).

49. Meng, E. et al. Ediacaran seawater temperature: Evidence from inclusions of Sinian halite. Precambrian Res. 184, 63–69. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.precamres.2010.10.004 (2011).

50. Roark, A. et al. Brachiopod geochemical records from across the Carboniferous seas of North America: Evidence for salinity gradients, stratification, and circulation patterns. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclim. Palaeoecol. 485, 136–153. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2017.06.009 (2017).

51. Judd, E. J., Bhattacharya, T. & Ivany, L. C. A dynamical framework for interpreting ancient sea surface temperatures. Geophys. Res. Lett. 47, e2020GL089044. https://doi.org/10.1029/2020GL089044 (2020).

52. Cramwinckel, M. J. et al. Synchronous tropical and polar temperature evolution in the Eocene. Nature 559, 382–386. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-018-0272-2 (2018).

53. Tierney, J. E. & Tingley, M. P. A Bayesian, spatially-varying calibration model for the TEX86 proxy. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 127, 83–106. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2013.11.026 (2014).

54. Bopp, L. et al. Multiple stressors of ocean ecosystems in the 21st century: Projections with CMIP5 models. Biogeosciences 10, 6225–6245. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-10-6225-2013 (2013).

55. IPCC. Climate Change 2021: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Sixth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. (Cambridge University Press, 2021).

56. Storch, D., Menzel, L., Frickenhaus, S. & Portier, H.-O. Climate sensitivity across marine domains of life: Limits to evolutionary adaptation shape species interactions. Glob. Change Biol. 20, 3059–3067. https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12645 (2014).

57. Trotter, J. A., Williams, I. S., Barnes, C. R., Lecuyer, C. & Nicoll, R. S. Did cooling oceans trigger Ordovician biodiversification? – Evidence from conodont thermometry. Science 321, 530–534. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1155814 (2008).

58. Edwards, C. T., Saltzman, M. R., Royer, D. L. & Fike, D. A. Oxygenation as a driver of the Great Ordovician Biodiversification Event. Nat. Geos. 10, 929–929. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-017-0006-3 (2017).

59. Servais, T. & Harper, D. A. T. The Great Ordovician Biodiversification Event (GOBE): Definition, concept and duration. Lethaia 51, 151–164. https://doi.org/10.1111/let.12259 (2018).

60. Sackmann, I. J., Bothroyd, A. I. & Kraemer, K. E. Our Sun. III. Present and future. Science 321, 217–231 (2008).

61. Royer, D. L. Climate sensitivity in the geologic past. Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 44, 277–293. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-earth-100815-024150 (2016).

62. Rae, J. W. et al. Atmospheric CO2 over the past 66 million years from marine archives. Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 49, 609–641 (2021).

63. Farmsworth, A. et al. Climate sensitivity on geological timescales controlled by nonlinear feedbacks and ocean circulation. Geophys. Res. Lett. 46, 9880–9889. https://doi.org/10.1029/2019GL083574 (2019).

64. Hansen, J. Earth’s atmosphere as the major source of oceanic CO2. Open Atmos. Sci. J. 2, 217–231 (2008).

65. Martinez-Boti, M. A. et al. Plato-Pleistocene climate sensitivity evaluated using high-resolution CO2 records. Nature 518, 49–54 (2015).

66. Smith, R. J. Use and misuse of the reduced major axis for line-fitting. Am. J. Phys. Anthropol. 140, 476–486 (2009).

67. Köhler, P., de Boer, B., von der Heydt, A. S., Stap, L. B. & van de Wal, R. S. W. On the state dependency of the equilibrium climate sensitivity during the last 5 million years. Clim. Past 11, 1801–1823. https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-11-1801-2015 (2015).

68. Compston, W. The carbon isotopic compositions of certain marine invertebrates and coals from the Australian Permian. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 18, 1 (1960).
69. Popp, B. N., Anderson, T. F. & Sandberg, P. A. Brachiopods as indicators of original isotopic compositions in some Paleozoic limestones. Geol. Soc. Am. Bull. 97, 1262–1269 (1986).
70. Joachimski, M. M., Alekseev, A. S., Grigoryyan, A. & Gatovsky, Y. A. Siberian Trap volcanoism, global warming and the Permian-Triassic mass extinction: New insights from Armenian Permian-Triassic sections. Geol. Soc. Am. Bull. 132, 427–443. https://doi.org/10.1130/0016-4672(2020).
71. Wheeleey, R. J., Jardine, P. E., Raine, R. J., Roemer, I. & Smith, M. P. Paleoecologic and paleoceanographic interpretation of δ¹⁸O variability in Lower Ordovician conodont species. Geology 46, 467–470. https://doi.org/10.1130/g40145.1 (2018).
72. Grossman, E. L. & Ku, T.-L. Oxygen and carbon isotope fractionation in biogenic aragonite: Temperature effects. Chem. Geol. Isotope Geos. 59, 59–74 (1986).
73. Coplen, T. B. et al. Ratios for light-element isotopes standardized for better interlaboratory comparison. Eos Trans. 77, 255 (1996).
74. Gonfiantini, R. Advisory group meeting on stable isotope reference samples for geochemical and hydrological investigations. International Atomic Energy Agency, Vienna, September 19–21, 1983. Report to the Director General, 77 (1984).
75. Trotter, J. A., Williams, C. R., Männik, P. & Simpson, A. New conodont δ¹⁸O records of Silurian climate change: Implications for environmental and biological events. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclim. Palaeoecol. 443, 34–48 (2016).
76. Fielding, C. R., Frank, T. D. & Isbell, J. L. In Geol. Soc. Amer. Special Papers (eds. Fielding, C. R., Frank, T. D., & Isbell, J. L.) 343–354 (2008).
77. Ghienne, J.-F. et al. A Cenozoic-style scenario for the end-Ordovician glaciation. Nat. Commun. 5, 4485. https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms4485 (2014).
78. Miller, K. G. et al. Cenozoic sea-level and cryospheric evolution from deep-sea geochemical and continental margin records. Sci. Adv. 6, eaaz1346. https://doi.org/10.1126/sciadv.aaz1346 (2020).
79. Montañez, I. P. & Poulsen, C. J. The Late Paleozoic ice age: An evolving paradigm. Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 41, 629–656. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-earth.031208.100118 (2013).
80. Muller, R. D. et al. GPlates: Building a virtual Earth through deep time. Geochim. Geophys. Geosyst. 19, 2243–2261 (2018).
81. Scotese, C. & Wright, N. M. PALEOMAP Paleodigital Elevation Models (PALEOMAP) for the Phanerozoic PALEOMAP Project. https://www.earthbyte.org/paleodem-resource-scotese-and-wright-2018 (2018).
82. Roberts, C. D., LeGrande, A. N. & Tripati, A. K. Sensitivity of seawater oxygen isotopes to climatic and tectonic boundary conditions in an early Paleogene simulation with GISS ModelE-R. Paleoccean. https://doi.org/10.1029/2010PA002025 (2011).
83. LeGrande, A. N. & Schmidt, G. A. Global gridded data set of the oxygen isotopic composition in seawater. Geophys. Res. Lett. https://doi.org/10.1029/2006GL026011 (2006).
84. Zhang, L., Hay, W. W., Wang, C. & Gu, X. The evolution of latitudinal temperature gradients from the latest Cretaceous through the Present. Earth-Sci. Rev. 189, 147–158. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2019.01.025 (2019).
85. Gradstein, F. M., Ogg, J. G., Schmitz, M. D. & Ogg, M. The Geologic Time Scale 2020 (Elsevier, 2020).

Acknowledgements
We thank Cristina Krause for assistance in developing and maintaining the StabisoDB database, Shuang Zhang for assistance with modern data compilation, Wolfgang Kiessling and Dana Royer for helpful discussion, and Kristin Bergmann and Jessica Tierney for reviews of an early version of the manuscript. The present manuscript was improved by thoughtful reviews by Lewis Jones and an anonymous reviewer. Support for this research was provided by the Michel T. Halbouty Chair in Geology (ELG) and the German Science Foundation (MMJ)—DFG Research Unit FOR 2332: Temperature-related stressors as a unifying principle in ancient Extinctions; Project Jo 219/16-1).

Author contributions
E.L.G. and M.M.J. are each responsible for conceptualization, methodology, investigation, and writing. E.L.G. is responsible for visualization.

Funding
Michel T. Halbouty Chair in Geology (ELG) German Science Foundation DFG Research Unit FOR 2332, Project Jo 219/15-2 (MMJ).

Competing interests
The authors declare no competing interests.

Additional information
Supplementary Information The online version contains supplementary material available at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-022-11493-1.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to E.L.G.

Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints.

Publisher’s note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article’s Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article’s Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

© The Author(s) 2022