A quantitative genetic approach to assess the evolutionary potential of a coastal marine fish to ocean acidification

Alex J. Malvezzi, Christopher S. Murray, Kevin A. Feldheim, Joseph D. DiBattista, Dany Garant, Christopher J. Gobler, Demian D. Chapman and Hannes Baumann

1 School of Marine and Atmospheric Sciences, Stony Brook University, Stony Brook, NY, USA
2 Department of Marine Sciences, University of Connecticut, Groton, CT, USA
3 Pritzker Laboratory for Molecular Systematics and Evolution, Field Museum of Natural History, Chicago, IL, USA
4 Red Sea Research Center, King Abdullah University of Science and Technology, Thuwal, Saudi Arabia
5 Département de Biologie, Université de Sherbrooke, Sherbrooke, QC, Canada

Keywords
animal model, ASReml, Atlantic Silverside Menidia menidia, genotyping, heritability, microsatellites, pedigree analysis, survival.

Correspondence
Hannes Baumann, Department of Marine Sciences, University of Connecticut, Groton, CT 06340-6048, USA.
Tel.: +1 860 405 9297; fax: +1 860 405 9153; e-mail: hannes.baumann@uconn.edu

Received: 17 October 2014
Accepted: 15 January 2015
doi:10.1111/eva.12248

Abstract
Assessing the potential of marine organisms to adapt genetically to increasing oceanic CO₂ levels requires proxies such as heritability of fitness-related traits under ocean acidification (OA). We applied a quantitative genetic method to derive the first heritability estimate of survival under elevated CO₂ conditions in a metazoan. Specifically, we reared offspring, selected from a wild coastal fish population (Atlantic silverside, Menidia menidia), at high CO₂ conditions (~2300 μatm) from fertilization to 15 days posthatch, which significantly reduced survival compared to controls. Perished and surviving offspring were quantitatively sampled and genotyped along with their parents, using eight polymorphic microsatellite loci, to reconstruct a parent–offspring pedigree and estimate variance components. Genetically related individuals were phenotypically more similar (i.e., survived similarly long at elevated CO₂ conditions) than unrelated individuals, which translated into a significantly nonzero heritability (0.20 ± 0.07). The contribution of maternal effects was surprisingly small (0.05 ± 0.04) and nonsignificant. Survival among replicates was positively correlated with genetic diversity, particularly with observed heterozygosity. We conclude that early life survival of M. menidia under high CO₂ levels has a significant additive genetic component that could elicit an evolutionary response to OA, depending on the strength and direction of future selection.

Introduction
Ocean acidification (OA) has been recognized among the key anthropogenic processes threatening humanity and its environment (Rockstrom et al. 2009). Concerns about OA stem from (i) the certainty of continued oceanic CO₂ uptake with projected further atmospheric CO₂ increases and hence further declines in ocean pH and calcium carbonate saturation (Caldeira and Wickett 2003; Sabine et al. 2004; Bates et al. 2012) and (ii) from fast accumulating evidence that such predicted conditions affect many contemporary marine organisms in complex and often negative ways (Hendriks et al. 2010; Doney et al. 2012). High OA sensitivities, as inferred from reductions in survival, growth, and calcification rates under experimentally elevated CO₂ conditions, have been observed during the early life stages of calcifying marine invertebrates (Orr et al. 2005; Kleypas et al. 2006; Doney et al. 2009; Talmage and Gobler 2010), but also in offspring of some marine fishes. In the latter, documented adverse effects of high CO₂ exposure range from behavioral abnormalities (Munday et al. 2009, 2014; Dixon et al. 2010, 2014; Chivers et al. 2014) and tissue damage (Frommel et al. 2012b) to directly reduced growth and survival rates (Baumann et al. 2012; Chambers et al. 2014). Cumulatively, these findings imply that OA could profoundly alter marine ecosystems, likely to the detriment of humans (Branch et al. 2013; Bednaršek et al. 2014).

Detecting widespread CO₂ sensitivities in marine organisms, however, is only a first step in assessing OA’s
long-term ecological consequences (Pfister et al. 2014; Sunday et al. 2014). Although anthropogenic OA is likely unprecedented in both pace and magnitude (Caldeira and Wickett 2003), the predicted environmental shifts will still happen gradually over the next few hundred years, that is, within a few (e.g., whales, turtles, many sharks) or hundreds (e.g., many fish, mollusks) or hundred thousands of generations (single cell plankton). Hence, an equally important but much less understood question is to what extent organisms will adapt to acidifying oceans through natural selection of either extant or randomly arising genotypes of greater fitness. This knowledge gap is being increasingly recognized, and several approaches have so far been used to address it (Munday et al. 2013; Reusch 2013; Sunday et al. 2014).

One approach has been to demonstrate standing genetic variation in CO2 reaction norms within marine species or populations. For example, different strains of cyanobacteria from different oceanic regions show large variations in CO2-dependent nitrogen fixation rates, suggesting that some strains benefit from increasing CO2 more than others (Hutchins et al. 2013). Differentially adverse CO2 effects are also evident, for example, between strains of the coccolithophore *Emiliania huxleyi* (Langer et al. 2009), or genetically different oyster *Saccostrea glomerata* lines (Parker et al. 2011), sea urchin populations (Kelly et al. 2013), and Atlantic cod *Gadus morhua* populations (coastal Norway versus Baltic Sea, Frommel et al. 2012a,b). Such observations suggest that rising CO2 levels are gradually shifting the fitness landscape in the ocean, thus triggering changes in the genotypic composition of marine species, even in cases where little or no phenotypic change will be observed (Pespeni et al. 2013; Sunday et al. 2014).

A second type of approach is to assess evolutionary responses to OA *in vitro*. Lohbeck et al. (2012) found that adverse growth and calcification effects of high CO2 (1000 µatm) in single clones of *E. huxleyi* partially disappeared after rearing 500 asexual generations at high CO2 levels in the laboratory, suggesting a *de novo* evolutionary response. Unfortunately, such *in vitro* approaches are largely unfeasible in metazoans with substantially longer generation times. *In vitro* selection for OA-relevant genes was demonstrated via analysis of single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) in purple sea urchin *Strongylocentrotus purpuratus* larvae cultured under different CO2 levels (Pespeni et al. 2013). This revealed consistent shifts in allele frequencies predominantly within functional genomic groups associated with calcification and osmoregulatory control.

A third type of approach has been to infer the evolutionary potential of a trait by estimating its heritability $h^2$ (Charmantier and Garant 2005; Garant and Kruuk 2005; Sunday et al. 2014). Heritability is the proportion of a traits interindividual phenotypic variation that is not environmentally but genetically determined. Knowing a traits heritability is valuable, because together with the strength of selection (selection coefficient, singe-trait $S$), multiple traits $\beta$, the rate of evolutionary change $(\Delta Z)$ can be estimated with the breeders equation $(\Delta Z = h^2 S, \text{Falcorner and Mackay 1996}$). Thereby, highly heritable traits that come under strong selection will evolve rapidly within few generations, whereas low heritability combined with small selection differentials produce small or negligible evolutionary change (but see Merilä et al. 2001; Morriessy et al. 2010).

To experimentally estimate a traits heritability, mean phenotypic change $(\Delta Z)$ could be measured following selection over multiple generations, but as with experimental evolution, this is practical mostly for organisms with short generation times (days to weeks, Lohbeck et al. 2012). Alternatively, trait heritability can be quantified in single-generation experiments, provided the design allows the different components of phenotypic variance $(V_p)$ to be distinguished (Lynch and Walsh 1998; Sunday et al. 2014). This can be achieved by measuring $V_p$ in offspring of single mother × father (=dam × sire) crosses that are separately reared under standardized laboratory conditions. Unfortunately, this can necessitate an impractically large number of experimental vessels (e.g., Sunday et al. 2011: >1000), particularly if model species or later developmental stages demand larger rearing volumes (e.g., fish larvae) or if the genetic diversity of a wild population is to be represented (20+ spawners per sex, Conover and Present 1990; Buamann and Conover 2011a). Finally, heritability estimates associated with OA are most needed for life history traits (survival, growth, fecundity), which are most directly related to fitness (Mousseau and Roff 1987; Sunday et al. 2014).

Here we evaluate a quantitative genetic approach to estimate trait heritability during single-generation experiments that involve large numbers of spawners but without the onerous requirement of separate experimental units for each sire × dam combination. Instead, the approach relies on resolving genetic relationships between offspring and parents *post-mortem* by genotyping all individuals using microsatellite markers. Microsatellites are routinely used to assign parentage with high confidence, for example, in human paternity tests (Marshall et al. 1998) or studies of wild population genetics (Chapman et al. 2009; Feldheim et al. 2014). Here, the approach is applied to derive the first heritability estimate for larval survival under elevated CO2 conditions in a marine fish. We chose the Atlantic silverside (*Menidia menidia*), because (i) it is an ecologically important, annual forage fish along most of the western Atlantic coast, (ii) elevated CO2 levels have previously been shown to reduce early life survival in this and related species (Baumann et al. 2012; Murray et al. 2014), and (iii) the
required species-specific primers for 10 microsatellite loci were already available (Sbrocco and Barber 2011).

To explore the approach, we reared newly fertilized offspring from wild-caught parents at CO2 conditions projected for the average open ocean within the next 300 years (~2300 μatm, Caldeira and Wickett 2003), while quantitatively sampling all perished and surviving larvae for downstream genetic analyses. Thus, we determined ‘Days Survived at high CO2’ (hereafter: DS) and the genotype of each larva, which were used to construct and analyze a parent–offspring pedigree. We then tested the null hypothesis that genetically related offspring were no more phenotypically similar (i.e., survived similarly long) than unrelated offspring. Other genetic parameters such as observed heterozygosity or allelic richness were quantified for each replicate to examine the relationship between genetic diversity and offspring survival in high CO2 environments.

**Materials and methods**

**Parental collection and laboratory rearing**

We collected ripe, adult *M. menidia* at the beginning of the spawning season (25 April 2013) from a tidal salt marsh on the North shore of Long Island (Poquott, 40°58.12’N, 73°5.28’W). Males and females were caught with a 30 × 2 m beach seine, then transported to our laboratory facility (Flax Pond Marine Laboratory) and held overnight in separate temperature-controlled baths (200 L, 21°C). The next morning, 29 females were strip-spawned by gently squeezing their hydrated eggs into a large shallow container containing seawater-activated sperm of 42 males and a large sheet of window screen (1 mm mesh). Within 15 min, fertilized eggs attached to the screen via uncoiled chorionic filaments, in contrast to unfertilized eggs that could later be gently rinsed off. The window screen was randomly cut into many small pieces, and within 2 h after fertilization, 3–6 randomly selected pieces totaling 100 embryos were suspended into each of 10 replicate rearing containers (20 L) preset for the high CO2 treatment (~2300 μatm, Table 1). Another 100 embryos were placed into each of five control replicates (~460 μatm). The high CO2 treatment represents the maximum level predicted for the open ocean within the next 300 years (Caldeira and Wickett 2003), but also a seasonal condition occurring within many productive coastal habitats already today (Wallace et al. 2014). Control replicates were used to validate the assumption that high CO2 conditions indeed reduced offspring survival, as has been documented in previous studies on this and closely related species (Baumann et al. 2012; Murray et al. 2014). Throughout the experiment, temperature, salinity, and photoperiod were held constant at 24°C, 25 psu, and 15L:9D, respectively. Larvae hatched ~120 h postfertilization and were immediately provided with daily *ad libitum* rations of newly hatched brine shrimp nauplii, *Artemia salina*, (San Francisco strain; Brine Shrimp Direct, Inc. Ogden, UT, USA) until the end of the experiment.

**Seawater chemistry manipulation**

Seawater chemistry was modified and monitored throughout the experiment according to recommended best practices for OA research (Riebesell et al. 2010). We used a gas proportioning system (Cole Parmer® flowmeters on a multivariate frame, Cole Parmer, Vernon Hills, IL, USA) to deliver precise mixes of 5% ultra pure CO2 and air (air only for controls) directly to the bottom of each rearing container via air stones. Target pH for high CO2 (~2300 μatm, pH = 7.45) and control levels (~460 μatm, pH = 8.10) were monitored daily with an Orion ROSS Ultra pH/ATC Triode and Orion Star A121 pH portable meter, which were calibrated regularly using three-point National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) traceable pH references. In addition, discrete water samples were taken once from each replicate/treatment (borosilicate bottles, preserved with 200 μL HgCl2) and analyzed for dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC, mol kg seawater$^{-1}$) with an EGM-4 Environmental Gas Analyzer (for detailed descriptions see Talmage and Gobler 2010; Gobler et al. 2014). Actual levels of CO2 and total alkalinity were then calculated based on measured DIC, pH (NIST), temperature, salinity, and first and second dissociation constants of carbonic acid in seawater (Roy et al. 1993) using CO2SYS (http://cdiac.ornl.gov/ftp/co2sys/, Table 1).

**Estimation of ‘Days survived at high CO2’ (DS)**

To quantify DS for each hatched larva, the bottom of every high CO2 rearing container was gently siphoned twice daily, and all dead individuals were removed, recorded, and individually transferred to a tissue lysis solution (100 μL tissue lysis buffer + 12 μL proteinase K) for subsequent analysis.

**Table 1.** Carbon chemistry parameters during the experiment as determined from discrete water samples.

| Treatment | Replicates | pH (NIST) | pCO2 | Total dissolved inorganic carbon | Total alkalinity |
|-----------|------------|-----------|------|----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Control   | 5          | 8.11 ± 0.07 | 459 ± 73  | 2175 ± 126                      | 2262 ± 123      |
| High CO2  | 10         | 7.45 ± 0.04 | 2294 ± 134 | 2324 ± 166                      | 2235 ± 179      |
genomic DNA extraction. Frequent siphoning was critical, because fish larvae decompose beyond recognition within hours after death (at 24°C). The pattern of daily posthatch mortality was typical for early larval fish, with mortality peaking soon after hatch (1–4 dph), but then declining exponentially over the remaining days of the experiment (Fig. 1). After two consecutive days without any mortality (days 14 and 15 posthatch), the experiment was terminated and all surviving larvae (i.e., DS = 15) were individually transferred to tissue lysis solution for DNA extraction. To specifically evaluate the resistance of the population to elevated CO2, only hatched larvae of the 10 high CO2 replicates were sampled for genetic analyses. Unhatched embryos were recorded but not genotyped. To validate the assumption that high CO2 was a significant source of mortality in the experimental replicates, live larvae were counted on day 10 posthatch by gently scooping small groups into replacement containers.

DNA extraction and amplification

Adult spawner DNA was extracted from tail clips (15–35 mg) following the animal tissue protocol of Qiagen DNeasy® kits. Larval DNA (DS ranging from 1 to 15 dph) was extracted using a more cost-effective ‘salting out’ protocol (Sunnucks et al. 1996) that yielded useable DNA from larval silversides. Ten polymorphic microsatellite loci for *M. menidia* (Sbrocco and Barber 2011) were amplified for all parents and offspring in a 10 μL reaction containing 1× PCR buffer, 10× bovine serum albumin, 1.5–3.5 mM MgCl2 (Table 2), 0.12 mM dNTPs, 0.16 μM of the reverse primer and fluorescently labeled M13 primer (Schuelke 2000), 0.04 μM of the species-specific forward primer and 1 unit Taq polymerase, and 10–40 ng of genomic DNA. Thermal cycling consisted of 5 min at 94°C followed by 35 cycles of 94°C for 30 s, primer specific annealing temperature *(T_a*, Table 2) for 30 s and 72°C for 60 s with a final extension at 72°C for 10 min. Fluorescently labeled PCR products were electrophoresed on an ABI 3730 DNA analyzer along with an internal fluorescent ladder (LIZ-500; Applied Biosystems). Alleles were scored by a single analyst (AIM) using the software Peakscanner 1.0 (Applied Biosystems, Life Technologies, Grand Island, NY, USA). A subset of approximately 10% of genotypes was verified by a second analyst (KAF) using GENEMAPPER v4.0 (Applied Biosystems). One locus (Mm09) did not amplify and another one did not yield easily scored peaks (Mm119), hence only 8 of 10 loci were eventually used for parentage assignment and genetic analyses.

Genetic analyses

We used CERVUS 3.0 (www.fieldgenetics.com) to calculate summary statistics (e.g., number of occurrences of each allele at each locus) and assess the suitability of loci for parentage analysis (Table 2). CERVUS was then used to calculate the following four measures for each of the 10 high CO2 replicates: relative allelic richness (i.e., N_{Alleles, replicate}/N_{Alleles, total}), observed heterozygosity, number of dams, and number of sires. Linear regression was used to relate the four proxies to survival. Subsequently, CERVUS was used to assign individual offspring to candidate mothers and fathers. For each offspring tested, candidate parents were assigned with at least 95% confidence using exclusion probability first and the maximum likelihood score second (Marshall et al. 1998). Comparing each offspring to all parent genotypes, exclusion of candidate parents followed if

![Figure 1](https://example.com/figure1.png)

**Figure 1** *Menidia menidia*. Daily posthatch mortality at high pCO2 levels (2300 μatm) in each of 10 replicates (thin gray lines). The bold, black line depicts the total mortality across all replicates.

| Locus | T_a | MgCl2 | K | N | H_{CRES} | H_{Exp} | PIC |
|-------|-----|-------|---|---|----------|--------|-----|
| 002   | 56  | 2.5   | 18| 636 | 0.700    | 0.898  | 0.889 |
| 108   | 47  | 1.5   | 8 | 800 | 0.668    | 0.755  | 0.716 |
| 202   | 45  | 3.5   | 12| 759 | 0.768    | 0.783  | 0.753 |
| 204   | 42  | 3.5   | 16| 807 | 0.664    | 0.850  | 0.833 |
| 240   | 42  | 2     | 12| 789 | 0.791    | 0.811  | 0.787 |
| 248   | 51  | 1.5   | 10| 718 | 0.758    | 0.787  | 0.752 |
| 251   | 47  | 3     | 21| 757 | 0.682    | 0.858  | 0.844 |
| 272   | 44  | 3.5   | 19| 802 | 0.643    | 0.86   | 0.845 |

© 2015 The Authors. *Evolutionary Applications* published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd 8 (2015) 352–362
mismatches occurred at more than one locus. In total, 704 of 772 individuals (91%) were successfully assigned to parents, a success rate comparable to other studies on fish (75–95%; Estoup et al. 1998; Eldridge et al. 2002; Vandelute et al. 2004). Unassigned offspring, resulting from poor amplification at some loci, were excluded from further analyses. All females, but only 35 of 42 males, were assigned to offspring, likely because the sperm from seven males was not activated or the fertilized eggs were not selected for in the experiment.

Last, we ran a hierarchical set of univariate ‘animal models’ for the trait $DS$, using the restricted maximum likelihood (REML) software ASReml v3.0.5 ©VSN International Ltd, Wood Lane, Hemel Hempstead, UK. An ‘animal model’ is a mixed model (i.e., a form of linear regression with ‘fixed’ and ‘random’ effects as explanatory variables) that has been found advantageous for estimating phenotypic variance components in wild populations (Lynch and Walsh 1998; Kruuk 2004; Garant and Kruuk 2005; Thériault et al. 2007; Dibattista et al. 2009). For fixed effects, we only considered replicate ID (1–10), which corresponds to the experimental vessel, given that age (all individuals had the same day of fertilization) and sex (individuals sampled in their entirety) were not relevant factors. Replicate ID significantly influenced $DS$ ($df = 9$, $P < 0.001$, univariate general linear model SPSS; IBM) therefore all subsequent analyses included replicate ID as a fixed effect to remove its effect prior to the estimation of genetic parameters. We then estimated the heritability of $DS$ by testing three distinct models: (i) the base model including only the fixed effect, (ii) a model including the fixed effect and an additive genetic random effect ($a$, with variance $V_A$), and (iii) a model including the fixed effect, additive genetic random effect, and dam identity ($m$, with variance $V_M$) as a random effect. The components of total phenotypic variance in $DS$ ($V_{DS} = V_A + V_M + V_R$) were then used to calculate narrow sense heritability $h^2$ of $DS$ as the ratio of additive genetic variance to total phenotypic variance ($h^2 = V_A/V_{DS}$) and maternal effects $m^2$ of $DS$ as the ratio of maternal variance to total phenotypic variance ($m^2 = V_M/V_{DS}$). Statistical significance was assessed with likelihood-ratio tests [$LRT = -2 * (likelihood \ base \ model-likelihood \ model \ with \ random \ effects)$] tested against the chi-square distribution ($df = 1$).

**Results**

High $CO_2$ conditions in the experimental replicates significantly lowered average offspring survival by 34% compared to control replicates (10 dph survival ± SD: High $CO_2 = 46.1 ± 15.5\%$, Control: $69.6 ± 17.5\%$, $t$-test, $df = 13$, $t = 2.63$, $P = 0.02$, Fig. 2). In the experimental replicates, 843 of 1000 fertilized embryos hatched, and of these 336 dead and 436 surviving individuals were recovered throughout the experiment. The remaining 7.1% were unaccounted for, likely due to rapid decomposition between siphoning. We assumed that decomposition rates were independent of genotype and therefore did not bias our results.

Pedigree analysis revealed that the minimum number of sires per dam was one, resulting in one offspring (dead on day 7) produced from that pair. The maximum number of sires to fertilize a single dam’s eggs was 31, resulting in 115 offspring, of which 83 survived and 32 died (Fig. 3). Dams with the most offspring were also sired by the most males, and this increase in offspring number with sire number was exponential and greater for survivors than for perished offspring (Fig. 3). Survival among the 10 high $CO_2$ replicates ranged from 28% to 76%, with a mean (SD) survival of 46% (15%). Survival tended to increase with all four measures of genetic diversity (relative allelic richness, observed heterozygosity, number of dams, number of sires); however, the linear relationship was only significant for observed heterozygosity ($P = 0.025$, Fig. 4).

The estimated genetic variance components for $DS$ are presented in Table 3. Including genotype as an additive genetic random effect to the base model improved the model significantly ($LRT = 22.26$, $P < 0.001$). Adding maternal identity as a second random effect resulted in a small and nonsignificant model improvement ($LRT = 2.20$, $P = 0.14$).
P = 0.14). Hence, in the final model without maternal identity, the estimated total phenotypic variance (±SE) $V_{DS}$ was 29.15 ± 1.69, with an additive genetic variance $V_A$ of 5.72 ± 2.10 and thus a heritability of larval survival at high CO₂ of 0.20 ± 0.07.

**Discussion**

We used a quantitative genetic approach to estimate the heritability of fish survival during the early developmental stages at elevated CO₂ conditions. Our approach had three priorities, that is, using a (i) single-generation experiment with (ii) enough parents to approximate a wild population’s genetic diversity, while (iii) allowing all sire × dam crosses to be reared in a (replicated) common garden environment. We found that genetically related larvae were indeed phenotypically more similar (i.e., survived similarly long at elevated CO₂ conditions) than unrelated larvae, which translated into a significant component of additive genetic variance and a small but nonzero heritability of 0.20 ± 0.07. Compared to average larval survival at the controls (70%), elevated CO₂ conditions significantly reduced survival (to 46%, a 34% reduction) in addition to CO₂-unrelated mortality agents. Hence, our heritability estimate for survival under elevated CO₂ conditions should be considered a maximum, because it assumed that all mortality resulted from these conditions.

The small contribution of maternal effects was unexpected, given that early life history traits in marine organisms often reflect maternal traits and investment (Green 2008; Sunday et al. 2011; Gao and Munch 2013). A low likelihood of detecting maternal effects in this case might have been due to collecting all adults from the same site and rearing offspring in common garden environments at unrestricted food levels (Marshall and Uller 2007; Allan et al. 2008). We also detected a positive relationship between observed heterozygosity and early life survival at high CO₂ levels. Assuming that neutral genetic variation is a proxy for adaptive genetic variation, this finding highlights the importance of standing genetic variation for a population’s capacity to withstand environmental stress.

When evaluating the usefulness of our approach, its advantages (i.e., single-generation, genetic representation, common garden rearing) should be weighed against feasibility, cost, and time considerations. In most OA-sensitive organisms, CO₂-related mortality occurs during the earliest and thus smallest life stages (Dupont et al. 2008; Gobler et al. 2014), which rapidly decompose after death in experimental vessels. Hence, the requirement of individually sampling and genotyping all dying offspring may pose a challenge in species with smaller and more fragile offspring (e.g., mollusks, crustaceans) than newly hatched silverside larvae (∼5 mm SL, ∼2 mg wet weight; Baumann and Conover 2011b). In those cases, a potential solution might...
be to perform full factorial crosses and meticulously standardize the contribution of each cross to common rearing containers, which may then allow deducing the ‘dead’ from parental and survivor genotypes. In our case, meticulous siphoning resulted in near complete recovery (93%) of hatched individuals, and prior trials had ascertained that single larvae yield sufficient genomic material for amplification and genotyping (Malvezzi 2013). Whether this is feasible in other species has yet to be determined. We also assumed that a robust heritability estimate required approximately 1000 offspring and a good mixture of full siblings, half siblings, and unrelated individuals, which was feasible in this case by strip-spawning a large number of adults and using a large number of replicates (10 × 100 embryos). However, the costs associated with DNA extraction, amplification, and automated analysis of PCR products were approximately $10/individual (in 2013). Our approach was also time intensive, not the least because all experimental individuals (offspring + parents) had to be manually genotyped for each of nine polymorphic microsatellite loci via ABI-Analyzer scans [(total of 772 offspring + 71 parents)×9 loci = 7587 scans]. Adding to the time budget is the interpretation of genotypes and then evaluating intra- and inter-reader consistency.

In our final model (fixed + additive genetic random effect), the heritability estimate (±SE) for early life survival at high CO₂ levels was 0.20 ± 0.07, which is well within the range of narrow sense heritability reported for survival in fish in the literature (Mousseau and Roff 1987; Law 2000). For example, heritability of early life survival in Atlantic salmon under aquaculture conditions ranged between 0 and 0.34 (Standal and Gjerde 1987; Jonasson 1993), while estimates for juvenile brook trout were 0.16–0.51 (Robison and Luempert 1984). In a meta-analysis of over 1100 narrow sense heritability estimates across taxa (Mousseau and Roff 1987) reported that 50% of the estimates for life history traits (e.g., survival, growth, fecundity) ranged between 0.14 and 0.34 (mean = 0.27 ± 0.03, n = 79), in contrast to generally higher heritability values associated with morphological traits like length or weight (mean = 0.51 ± 0.02, n = 140). The current understand-

### Table 3. Variance component estimates for two univariate animal models predicting ‘days survived at high CO₂’ (DS) as a function of replicate ID (fixed effect) and genotype $x_i$.

| Model                  | Variance component | Estimate | Standard error |
|------------------------|--------------------|----------|----------------|
| $DS = ID + x_i + e_i$  | $V_{DS}$           | 29.145   | 1.685          |
|                        | $V_A$              | 5.716    | 2.102          |
|                        | $V_R$              | 23.428   | 1.925          |
| Heritability           | $h^2 = V_A/V_{DS}$ | 0.196    | 0.067          |

$V_{DS}$, total phenotypic variance of $DS$; $V_A$, additive genetic variance (genotype); $V_R$, residual variance.

Does this mean that $M$. menidia will adapt relatively rapidly to OA? We believe that this conclusion is not warranted yet, given the current lack of understanding regarding the strength and form of OA-induced selection in the wild (but see Bednaršek et al. 2014). In addition to heritability, rapid evolutionary change requires strong, uni-

![Figure 5](image-url)
directional selection. Conover and Munch (2002) found that strong artificial selection on *M. menidia* body size (only 10% of the largest/smallest adults were allowed to reproduce) resulted in a significant divergence between up- and down-selected lines within only four generations. Incidentally, the heritability of growth rate in this experiment was also 0.20. More recently, Brown et al. (2008) used this heritability estimate to model the rate of evolutionary change under more realistic selection differentials typical for commercial fisheries, reporting a comparable evolutionary change within 30 generations. OA-induced selection is surely weaker and not necessarily unidirectional. For example, exposure of newly fertilized embryos to 2300 µatm CO₂ in the current experiment reduced average survival by 34%. In reality, however, high CO₂ levels will not suddenly but gradually occur in the open ocean over the next three centuries. In addition, indirect effects or other environmental changes (e.g., temperature, oxygen, plankton production) might mitigate or even reverse OA-induced selection (Pfister et al. 2014), which is inherently difficult to predict. Lastly, recent findings suggest that *M. menidia* offspring are CO₂-sensitive only during some (early) parts of the spawning season, while becoming CO₂ tolerant later in the season, when elevated respiration rates increase CO₂ levels in tidal marsh spawning habitats (Murray et al. 2014; Baumann et al. 2015).Seasonally varying CO₂ sensitivities are likely a result of parent–offspring linkages known as transgenerational plasticity, and its probable ubiquity adds yet another dimension to the question of species’ evolutionary potential to OA (Salinas et al. 2013; Allan et al. 2014). One hypothesis is that coastal marine species such as *M. menidia* are adapted to highly variable CO₂ conditions through intra- and transgenerational plasticity (Reusch 2013; Crozier and Hutchings 2014), which could effectively stall selection and evolutionary adaptation until perhaps reaching a threshold with adverse consequences (a form of evolutionary trap, Schlaepfer et al. 2002). In summary, we found that larval *M. menidia* are negatively affected by high CO₂ levels and that early life survival has a significant additive genetic component that could elicit an evolutionary response if selection pressures in the wild resemble – at least in direction – the artificial conditions in the laboratory. While challenging, this constitutes one of the most important issues for future OA research to address (Merilä and Hendry 2014; Pfister et al. 2014; Sunday et al. 2014).

In addition to heritability, our quantitative genetic approach revealed links between phenotypic and genotypic differences among the 10 'replicates’ of this study. The strong statistical effect of replicate ID was most likely due to a nonrandom distribution of genotypes among experimental vessels, despite our meticulous efforts to randomize offspring at the beginning of the trial (Fig. 5). Small biotic (e.g., larval density) and/or abiotic differences between replicates might have been contributing factors, even though daily temperature and pH monitoring suggested no systematic differences in physiochemical conditions. However, between-replicate survival varied threefold (28–76%, mean = 46%), while genotyping revealed that the number of dams (16–23, NParents: 44–54), relative allelic richness (0.56–0.72), and observed heterozygosity (0.66–0.72) all varied substantially between replicates. The latter was significantly positively correlated to survival and explained almost 50% of the variation. All proxies for genetic variability were calculated across all individuals per replicate (regardless of dead and surviving), hence assuming that neutral (microsatellites) and adaptive genetic variability are correlated, our finding corroborates the notion that more genetic variability and a higher overall allelic richness among progeny positively affect survival (Ruzzante et al. 1996). This is consistent with studies showing diminished genetic variability in natural populations resulting in increased genetic bottlenecks, inbreeding, reductions in effective population size and the potential for reduced adaptability and productivity (Hauser et al. 2002; O’Leary et al. 2013).

Our work has emphasized the suitability of using a quantitative genetic approach to evaluate species evolutionary potential in the face of continuing OA. We believe that such estimates are of increasing interest to a research field that needs to address the questions of short- and long-term adaptability in marine organisms to allow a more realistic assessment of the OA threat.

**Acknowledgements**

We kindly acknowledge the assistance of Shannon O’Leary, Andrew Fields, and the staff of the Field Museum’s Pritzker Lab. M. Pespeni and one anonymous reviewer provided helpful comments to an earlier version of this manuscript. The National Science Foundation provided full funding for A.J.M. and C.S.M. and partial funding for H.B. and C.J.G. (NSF #1129622). C.J.G. was also partially funded by NOAA’s Ocean Acidification Program through award #NA12NOS4780148 from the National Centers for Coastal Ocean Science and the Chicago Community Trust.

**Data archiving statement**

The microsatellite source data for this study were uploaded to Dryad (http://datadryad.org, doi: 10.5061/dryad.bd6vs).

**Literature cited**

Allan, R. M., Y. M. Buckley, and D. J. Marshall 2008. Offspring size plasticity in response to intraspecific competition: an adaptive maternal effect across life-history stages. The American Naturalist 171:13.
Allan, B. J. M., G. M. Miller, M. I. McCormick, P. Domenici, and P. L. Munday 2014. Parental effects improve escape performance of juvenile reef fish in a high-CO$_2$ world. Proceedings of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences 281:20132179.

Bates, N. R., M. H. P. Best, K. Neely, R. Garley, A. G. Dickson, and R. J. Johnson 2012. Detecting anthropogenic carbon dioxide uptake and ocean acidification in the North Atlantic Ocean. Biogeosciences 9:2509–2522.

Baumann, H., and D. O. Conover 2011a. Adaptation to climate change: contrasting patterns of thermal-reaction-norm evolution in Pacific versus Atlantic silversides. Proceedings of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences 278:2265–2273.

Baumann, H., and D. O. Conover 2011b. Thermal reaction norms of growth in Atlantic and Pacific silverside fishes. doi: 10.1594/PAN-GAEA.773233. Pangaea Database.

Baumann, H., S. C. Talmage, and C. J. Gobler 2012. Reduced early life growth and survival in a fish in direct response to increased carbon dioxide. Nature Climate Change 2:38–41.

Baumann, H., R. Wallace, T. Tagliaferri, and C. J. Gobler 2015. Large natural pH, CO$_2$, and O$_2$ fluctuations in a temperate tidal salt marsh on diel, seasonal and interannual time scales. Estuaries and Coasts 38:220–231.

Bednaršek, N., R. A. Feely, J. C. P. Reum, B. Peterson, J. Menkel, S. R. Alin, and B. Hales 2014. Limacina helicina shell dissolution as an indicator of declining habitat suitability owing to ocean acidification in the California Current Ecosystem. Proceedings of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences 281:20140123.

Branch, T. A., B. M. DeJosef, L. J. Ray, and C. A. Wagner 2013. Impacts of ocean acidification on marine seafood. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 28:178–186.

Brown, C. J., A. J. Hobday, P. E. Ziegler, and D. C. Welsford 2008. Darwinian fisheries science needs to consider realistic fishing pressures over evolutionary time scales. Marine Ecology Progress Series 369:257–266.

Caldeira, K., and M. E. Wickett 2003. Anthropogenic carbon and ocean pH. Nature 425:365–365.

Chambers, R. C., A. C. Candelmo, E. A. Habeck, M. E. Poach, D. Wieczorek, K. R. Cooper, C. E. Greenfield et al. 2014. Ocean acidification effects in the early life-stages of summer flounder, Paralichthys dentatus. Biogeosciences 11:1613–1626.

Chapman, D. D., E. A. Babcock, S. H. Gruber, J. D. Dibattista, B. R. Franks, S. A. Kessel, T. Guttridge et al. 2009. Long-term natal site-fidelity by immature lemon sharks (Negaprion brevirostris) at a sub-tropical island. Molecular Ecology 18:3500–3507.

Charmantier, A., and D. Garant 2005. Environmental quality and evolutionary potential: lessons from wild populations. Proceedings of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences 272:1415–1425.

Chivers, D. P., M. I. McCormick, G. E. Nilsson, P. L. Munday, S.-A. Baumann, H., S. C. Talmage, and C. J. Gobler 2012. Reduced early life growth and survival in a fish in direct response to increased carbon dioxide. Nature Climate Change 2:38–41.

Chromis, H., and D. O. Conover 2011b. Thermal reaction norms of growth in Atlantic and Pacific silverside fishes. doi: 10.1594/PAN-GAEA.773233. Pangaea Database.

Chambers, R. C., A. C. Candelmo, E. A. Habeck, M. E. Poach, D. Wieczorek, K. R. Cooper, C. E. Greenfield et al. 2014. Ocean acidification effects in the early life-stages of summer flounder, Paralichthys dentatus. Biogeosciences 11:1613–1626.

Chapman, D. D., E. A. Babcock, S. H. Gruber, J. D. Dibattista, B. R. Franks, S. A. Kessel, T. Guttridge et al. 2009. Long-term natal site-fidelity by immature lemon sharks (Negaprion brevirostris) at a sub-tropical island. Molecular Ecology 18:3500–3507.

Charmantier, A., and D. Garant 2005. Environmental quality and evolutionary potential: lessons from wild populations. Proceedings of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences 272:1415–1425.

Chivers, D. P., M. I. McCormick, G. E. Nilsson, P. L. Munday, S.-A. Baumann, H., S. C. Talmage, and C. J. Gobler 2012. Reduced early life growth and survival in a fish in direct response to increased carbon dioxide. Nature Climate Change 2:38–41.

Chromis, H., and D. O. Conover 2011b. Thermal reaction norms of growth in Atlantic and Pacific silverside fishes. doi: 10.1594/PAN-GAEA.773233. Pangaea Database.

Chambers, R. C., A. C. Candelmo, E. A. Habeck, M. E. Poach, D. Wieczorek, K. R. Cooper, C. E. Greenfield et al. 2014. Ocean acidification effects in the early life-stages of summer flounder, Paralichthys dentatus. Biogeosciences 11:1613–1626.

Chapman, D. D., E. A. Babcock, S. H. Gruber, J. D. Dibattista, B. R. Franks, S. A. Kessel, T. Guttridge et al. 2009. Long-term natal site-fidelity by immature lemon sharks (Negaprion brevirostris) at a sub-tropical island. Molecular Ecology 18:3500–3507.

Charmantier, A., and D. Garant 2005. Environmental quality and evolutionary potential: lessons from wild populations. Proceedings of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences 272:1415–1425.

Chivers, D. P., M. I. McCormick, G. E. Nilsson, P. L. Munday, S.-A. Baumann, H., S. C. Talmage, and C. J. Gobler 2012. Reduced early life growth and survival in a fish in direct response to increased carbon dioxide. Nature Climate Change 2:38–41.
Evolutionary potential to OA in a fish

Munday, P. L., A. J. Cheal, D. L. Dixson, J. L. Rummer, and K. E. Fabri-
ciucis 2014. Behavioural impairment in reef fishes caused by ocean acidi-
fication at CO2 seeps. Nature Climate Change 4:487–492.

Murray, C. S., A. J. Malvèzzi, C. J. Gbler, and H. Baumann 2014. Off-
spring sensitivity to ocean acidification changes seasonally in a coastal
marine fish. Marine Ecology Progress Series 504:1–11.

O’Leary, S. J., L. A. Hice, K. A. Feldheim, M. G. Frisk, A. E. Mcelroy, M.
D. Fast, and D. D. Chapman 2013. Severe inbreeding and small effec-
tive number of breeders in a formerly abundant marine fish. PLoS
One 8:e66126.

Orr, J. C., V. J. Fabry, O. Aumont, L. Bopp, S. C. Doney, R. A. Feely, A.
Granadesikan et al. 2005. Anthropogenic ocean acidification over the
twenty-first century and its impact on calcifying organisms. Nature
437:681–686.

Parker, L., P. Ross, and W. O’Connor 2011. Populations of the Sydney
rock oyster, Saccostrea glomerata, vary in response to ocean acidific-
aton. Marine Biology 158:689–697.

Pespeni, M. H., E. Sanford, B. Gaylord, T. M. Hill, J. D. Hosfelt, H. K.
Jaris, M. Lavigne et al. 2013. Evolutionary change during experimen-
tal ocean acidification. Proceedings of the National Academy of
Sciences 110:6937–6942.

Pfister, C. A., A. J. Esbaugh, C. A. Frieder, H. Baumann, E. E. Bockmon,
M. M. White, B. R. Carter et al. 2014. Detecting the unexpected: a
research framework for ocean acidification. Environmental Science &
Technology 48:9982–9994.

Reusch, T. B. H. 2013. Climate change in the ocean: evolutionary versus
phenotypically plastic responses of marine animals and plants. Evolu-
tionary Applications 7:104–122.

Riebesell, U., V. J. Fabry, L. Hansson, and J. P. Gattuso. eds. 2013. Evolu-
tionary change during experimental ocean acidification. Proceed-
ings of the National Academy of Sciences 110:6937–6942.

Rockstrom, J., W. Steffen, K. Noone, A. Persson, F. S. Chapin, E. F. Lam-
tin, T. M. Lenton et al. 2009. A safe operating space for humanity.
Nature 461:472–475.

Roy, R. N., L. N. Roy, K. M. Vogel, C. Porter-Moore, T. Pearson, C. E.
Good, F. J. Millero et al. 1993. The dissociation constants of carbonic
acid in seawater at salinities 5 to 45 and temperatures 0 to 45°C. Mar-
ine Chemistry 44:249–267.

Ruzzante, D. E., C. T. Taggart, and D. Cook 1996. Spatial and temporal
variation in the genetic composition of a larval cod (Gadus morhua)
aggregation: cohort contribution and genetic stability. Canadian Jour-
nal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 53:2695–2705.

Sabine, C. L., R. A. Feely, N. Gruber, R. M. Key, K. Lee, J. L. Bullister, R.
Wanninkhof et al. 2004. The oceanic sink for anthropogenic CO2. Sci-
ence 305:367–371.

Salinas, S., S. C. Brown, M. Mangel, and S. B. Munch 2013. Non-genetic
inheritance and changing environments. Non-Genetic Inheritance
1:38–50.

Shrocko, E. J., and P. H. Barber 2011. Ten polymorphic microsatellite
loci for the Atlantic Silverside, Menidia menidia. Conservation Genet-
ics Resources 3:585–587.

Schlaepfer, M. A., M. C. Runge, and P. W. Sherman 2002. Ecological and
evolutionary traps. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 17:474–480.

Schuelke, M. 2000. An economic method for the fluorescent labeling of
PCR fragments. Nature Biotechnology 18:233–234.

Standal, M., and B. Gjerde 1987. Genetic variation in survival of Atlantic
salmon during the sea-rearing period. Aquaculture 66:197–207.

© 2015 The Authors. Evolutionary Applications published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd 8 (2015) 352–362

361
Sunday, J. M., R. N. Crim, C. D. G. Harley, and M. W. Hart 2011. Quantifying rates of evolutionary adaptation in response to ocean acidification. PLoS One 6:e22881.

Sunday, J. M., P. Calosi, S. Dupont, P. L. Munday, J. H. Stillman, and T. B. H. Reusch 2014. Evolution in an acidifying ocean. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 29:117–125.

Sunnucks, P., P. R. England, A. C. Taylor, and D. F. Hales 1996. Microsatellite and chromosome evolution of parthenogenetic Sitobion aphis in Australia. Genetics 144:747–756.

Talmage, S. C., and C. J. Gobler 2010. Effects of past, present, and future ocean carbon dioxide concentrations on the growth and survival of larval shellfish. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 107:17246–17251.

Thériault, V., D. Garant, L. Bernatchez, and J. J. Dodson 2007. Heritability of life-history tactics and genetic correlation with body size in a natural population of brook char (Salvelinus fontinalis). Journal of Evolutionary Biology 20:2266–2277.

Vandeputte, M., M. Kocour, S. Mauger, M. Dupont-Nivet, D. De Guerry, M. Rodina, D. Gela et al. 2004. Heritability estimates for growth-related traits using microsatellite parentage assignment in juvenile common carp (Cyprinus carpio L.). Aquaculture 235:223–236.

Wallace, R. B., H. Baumann, J. S. Grear, R. C. Aller, and C. J. Gobler 2014. Coastal ocean acidification: the other eutrophication problem. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science 148:1–13.