Near-Future $p$CO$_2$ during the hot Mid Miocene Climatic Optimum

M. Steinthorsdottir$^{1,2}$, P. E. Jardine$^3$, and W. C. Rember$^4$

$^1$Department of Palaeobiology, Swedish Museum of Natural History, SE 104 05 Stockholm, Sweden, $^2$Bolin Centre for Climate Research, Stockholm University, SE 109 61 Stockholm, Sweden, $^3$Institute of Geology and Palaeontology, University of Münster, 48149 Münster, Germany, $^4$Department of Geological Sciences, University of Idaho, Moscow, Idaho 83844, USA.

Corresponding author: Margret Steinthorsdottir (margret.steinthorsdottir@nrm.se)

Key Points:

- Mid Miocene Climatic Optimum proxies record high temperatures at moderate $p$CO$_2$, this cannot be replicated with existing climate models
- Either previously published records underestimate $p$CO$_2$ or climate models are missing important feedbacks
- We reconstruct moderate $p$CO$_2$ of ~450–550 ppm, implying that Earth System sensitivity must have been elevated

This article has been accepted for publication and undergone full peer review but has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process which may lead to differences between this version and the Version of Record. Please cite this article as doi: 10.1029/2020PA003900

©2020 American Geophysical Union. All rights reserved.
Abstract

To improve future predictions of anthropogenic climate change, a better understanding of the relationship between global temperature and atmospheric concentrations of CO₂ ($p_{\text{CO}_2}$), or climate sensitivity, is urgently required. Analyzing proxy data from climate change episodes in the past is necessary to achieve this goal, with certain geologic periods, such as the mid Miocene Climatic Optimum (MCO), a transient period of global warming with global temperatures up to ~7°C higher than today, increasingly viewed as good analogues to future climate under present emission scenarios. However, a problem remains that climate models cannot reproduce MCO temperatures with less than ~800 ppm $p_{\text{CO}_2}$, while most previously published proxies record $p_{\text{CO}_2}$ < 450 ppm. Here, we reconstructed MCO $p_{\text{CO}_2}$ with a multi-taxon fossil leaf database from the well-dated MCO Lagerstätte deposits of Clarkia, Idaho, USA, using four current methods of $p_{\text{CO}_2}$ reconstructions. The methods are principally based on either stomatal densities, carbon isotopes, or a combination of both – thus offering independent results. The total of six reconstructions mostly record $p_{\text{CO}_2}$ of ~450–550 ppm. Although slightly higher than previously reconstructed $p_{\text{CO}_2}$, the discrepancy with the ~800 ppm required by climate models remains. We conclude that climate sensitivity was heightened during MCO, indicating that highly elevated temperatures can occur at relatively moderate $p_{\text{CO}_2}$. Ever higher climate sensitivity with rising temperatures should be very seriously considered in future predictions of climate change.
1 Introduction

1.1. The Mid Miocene Climatic Optimum

Projections of future climate predict that atmospheric CO$_2$ concentrations ($p$CO$_2$) will continue to increase due to human activity and reach at least 600 ppm by year 2100 under the ‘business as usual’ scenario (IPPC report, 2014). CO$_2$ is a principal greenhouse gas known to cause global climate change and computer simulations based on current understanding show that these high levels will result in a global temperature increase of at least 4°C, a significant increase which will be perilous to Earth’s biota and human societies (Sherwood & Huber, 2010). Yet there is still considerable uncertainty about the precise relationship between $p$CO$_2$ and the magnitude of temperature increase –i.e. Earth’s climate sensitivity– and in reality the warming effect could be stronger. One of the most advantageous ways to improve our understanding of this relationship is to look to the geological record, where conditions of past climate change are documented in data archives of rocks and fossils, with past greenhouse periods in particular offering unique perspectives on the response of the Earth system to elevated $p$CO$_2$. The Miocene period (~23–5 Ma) is of particular interest when comparing to present and near future conditions, because continental positions were quite similar to today and an increasingly ‘modern’ flora and fauna was evolving (see e.g. Flower & Kennett, 1994 and Steinthorsdottir et al., this issue for review). Within this period, the mid Miocene climatic optimum (MCO, ~16.9–14.7 Ma) is the youngest of several transient warm episodes with highly elevated temperatures and perturbations of the carbon cycle, superimposed on a pattern of long-term cooling through the Cenozoic, the past 66 million years of Earth history (Holbourn et al., 2015; Pound et al., 2012; Zachos et al., 2001; 2008). It has been suggested that the MCO was caused by CO$_2$ outgassing from the contemporaneous volcanic emplacement that resulted in the Columbia River Basalt Group (CRBG) (Barry et al., 2013; Kasbohm & Schoene, 2018). A new age model of CRBG emplacement narrows the time span
of active volcanism from \( \sim 2 \) Ma to just 750 ka, simultaneously correlating the onset of CRBG volcanism and the onset of the MCO to less than \( \sim 100 \) ka, supporting the hypothesis that CRBG volcanic emissions acted as the climatic forcing causing the MCO. A shorter duration of the CRBG emplacement would indicate a higher average \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) emission volume as well as higher transient peak \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) concentrations during volcanism (Kasbohm & Schoene, 2018).

A key research problem remains unsolved in relation to the MCO. Most proxy records indicate that atmospheric \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) was \(< 450 \) ppm during the MCO (sometimes much lower), which is close to the present and near-future \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) projections. This includes \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) reconstructed using the proxies paleosols (Breecker & Retallack, 2014; Ji et al., 2018; Retallack, 2009); alkenones (Zhang et al., 2013); marine boron isotopes (Badger et al., 2013; Foster et al., 2012; Greenop et al., 2014) and stomata (Grein et al., 2013; Royer, 2003; Royer et al., 2001), with only one stomatal proxy study reporting MCO \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) of up to \(~ 550 \) ppm (Kürschner et al., 2008). Early results based on *Metasequoia occidentalis* stomatal densities from the same Clarkia localities studied here (Royer, 2003; Royer et al., 2001) indicated low \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) of \(~ 310–315 \) ppm during MCO, whereas recalibration of the same data by Beerling et al., (2009) reported \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) to be at least 100 ppm higher, in the 400–500 ppm range.

Meanwhile, a host of terrestrial (Goldner et al., 2014; Pound et al., 2012) and marine (Lear et al., 2000; Zhang et al., 2013) paleoclimate archives demonstrate pervasive global warmth up to \(~ 7^\circ C \) above modern temperatures, unmatched since the Eocene when \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) was \( > 800 \) ppm. This problem is significant because no climate simulation has so far reproduced MCO warmth at less than \(~ 800 \) ppm, up to twice the reconstructed \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \), even after imposing multiple forcings (Goldner et al., 2014). These observations imply either that important positive feedbacks are missing from the climate models (which are the same ones used for simulating future climate) or that there is a lack of knowledge of past climate forcings. Two recent studies recalibrated previously published marine carbonate and boron isotope MCO
\( p\text{CO}_2 \) records, using new sensitivity analyses and laboratory experiments, and found \( p\text{CO}_2 \) levels near or exceeding 800 ppm (Sosdian et al., 2018; Stoll et al., 2019). However, these new results need to be further tested and do not explain the discrepancy with the results derived from terrestrial proxies.

Here, we present new multi-method, multi-taxon \( p\text{CO}_2 \) reconstructions based on fossil leaves from sedimentary deposits in Idaho, USA, dated to have been accumulated at the height of MCO warming. Our aim was to answer the question: was \( p\text{CO}_2 \) moderately or highly elevated during the MCO?

2 Materials and Methods

2.1. The Clarkia fossil Lagerstätte deposits

The Clarkia fossil Lagerstätte of northern Idaho, USA, is celebrated for its extraordinary preservation of fossils, in particular the fossil flora (Rember, 1991; Smiley & Rember, 1985a; Smiley et al., 1975). The Clarkia lacustrine sedimentary deposits belong to the Latah Formation and are exposed at several localities near the small town of Clarkia, Shoshone County in Idaho (Fig. 1). The sediments were deposited on the bed of a lake that formed suddenly when the Priest Rapids Member flow of the CRBG Wanapum Formation dammed the proto-St. Maries River to create the deep and elongated Miocene Clarkia Lake in the river valley (Fig. 1) (Smiley & Rember, 1985b; Yang et al., 1995). The lake was surrounded by dense vegetation, and the anoxic bottom conditions which developed in the lake allowed excellent preservation of the plant and animal material that was carried into the lake by wind and water, as well as of ash periodically blown in from nearby active volcanic sites (Ladderud et al., 2015; Rember, 1991; Smiley & Rember, 1985b; Wang et al., 2017). The sedimentary section consists mostly of finely laminated silt and clay and is divided into two
zones: an upper oxidized zone and a lower unoxidized zone of varying thickness throughout the basin, with the best-preserved compression leaf fossils found in the lower zone, and mostly lower-quality impression leaf fossils in the upper (Smiley et al., 1975). The sediments contain numerous ash beds, some of which have been correlated to tephra deposits of known ages, enabling the dating of the duration of the Clarkia Lake and deposition of the fossil beds to \(~16–15.5\)Ma, attesting that the bulk of CRBG volcanism took place prior to \(15.5\) Ma (Ladderud et al., 2015; Nash & Perkins, 2012). Recently, the exact dating of the Clarkia Lake sediment deposition has been narrowed down to \(~15.9\)Ma, using sanidine K/Ar and Ar/Ar dates (Geraghty, 2017), as well as U-Pb geochronology based on zircons (Kasbohm & Schoene, 2018), from volcanic ash deposits, intercalated with the basalt stratigraphy.

The Clarkia fossil flora is very diverse and abundant, including plentiful leaves as well as reproductive organs such as flowers, seeds, nuts, fruits and cones. The specimens are preserved essentially unaltered since burial in the unoxidized zone – retaining epidermal and mesophyll cellular detail, sometimes with the original autumn red or summer green chlorophyll coloring showing briefly upon exposure – whereas the oxidized zone preserves (sometimes exquisite) imprints only. The flora consists of numerous angiosperms, gymnosperms, as well as some ferns and bryophytes. The closest living plant relatives now occur in the southeastern USA and southern China, and the floral composition suggests that the temperate deciduous forest grew in a warm and humid climate, very different from northern Idaho today (Denk et al., 2011; Kvaček & Rember, 2000; Pinson et al., 2018; Rember, 1991; Smiley & Rember, 1981, 1985a; Smiley et al., 1975). This is independently supported by reconstructions of annual temperature and precipitation based on local contemporaneous paleosols (Hobbs & Totman Parrish, 2016).
The leaf fossils studied here derive from two localities in the unoxidized zone, the type locality and original discovery site P-33, cropping out at the ‘Fossil Bowl and racetrack’ locality, as well as P-37, located on the west fork of Emerald Creek (Fig. 1) (Rember, 1991; Smiley & Rember, 1975; 1985b). The full extent of the Clarkia sedimentary section is ~3700 cm at the more extensive site P-33, when calculated using common ash beds at both sites, with ~3200 cm stratigraphically logged in detail with drill cores at P-37 (Fig. 2) (Geraghty, 2017; Rember, 1991; Smiley & Rember, 1985b). P-37 crops out within the upper part of this range, to an approximate depth of 1400 cm. The P-33 outcrop is ~426 cm in extent and has been correlated using tephrostratigraphy to lie ~300 cm below the bottom of the P-37 outcrop, with the top at ~1700 cm depth in the drill core. However, the P-33 section is compressed to ~200 cm in the P-37 drill core (Geraghty, 2017). We therefore operate with two sedimentary logs for the outcrops, with the P-37 outcrop ranging 0–1400 cm and the P-33 outcrop ranging 0–426 cm (Fig. 2). Because of the different extent of the two sections, it is difficult to know the exact interval between P-37 and P-33, with the ~300 cm in the more compressed P-37 core being the minimum distance. The samples studied here derive from just above and below the pink ash bed at P-33 (Fig. 2), as well as from the top ~800 m at P-37.

2.2. Leaf sampling and analysis

Blocks of sediments were dug out of the cliff faces at each locality, and split open with knives to reveal fossil leaves, which were identified to lowest possible taxonomic level in the field and removed from the sediment surface (Fig. 3). Each leaf was stored individually between two acetate sheets, labelled with taxon and site information and stored in refrigerators prior to analysis. In the laboratory, the leaf cuticle abaxial surfaces were photographed at 200 × magnification to best capture the epidermal morphology, taking seven
evenly distributed photographs away from base, apex, midrib and margin (*sensu* Poole & Kürschner, 1999). The leaves were photographed untreated under an epifluorescent beam, using a Leica microscope with a mounted Leica camera (DF310 FX) and associated software (LAS v3.8). Images were then annotated with grids, delimiting areas of 300 × 300 µm, or 200 × 200 µm in the case of small (and thus many) cells, and all the stomata as well as the epidermal cells within each of on average five grids per leaf were counted. In addition, stomatal pore lengths and guard cell widths were measured on ten stomata per leaf, all using the free software ImageJ (1.46 h; http://imagej.nih.gov/ij). The leaves were also sampled for δ¹³C isotope analysis, which was performed at Iso-Analytical Limited laboratory in Crewe, Cheshire, UK. Finally, the leaves were stored individually in 5% HCl in plastic containers in the laboratory cold storage at the Swedish Museum of Natural History.

Following new protocols in paleo-εCO₂ reconstruction, only taxa represented by four or more specimens were included in the analyses (see e.g. Foster et al., 2017). P-33 offered the most abundant well-preserved leaves, in a total of five taxa: *Betula vera* (n=8), *B. fairii* (n=7), *Ostrya* sp. (n=4), *Quercus payettensis* (n=9) and Lauraceae (n=6). P-37 is represented by three taxa: *B. vera* (n=4), *B. fairii* (n=4), and *Q. payettensis* (n=18). Collected leaves within the genera *Betula* and *Quercus* that could not be identified to species level were excluded from the analyses. Lauraceae leaf and cuticle morphology however is very generalized and the leaves could not be assigned to lower taxonomic rank, which was also true for species within genus *Ostrya*. For sample images of the epidermal micromorphology of the studied leaves, detailed data on each individual leaf specimen, including stomatal density and index, measurements of pore length and guard cell width, as well as δ¹³C-isotope results, see supporting information Fig. S1 and Tables S1 to S4.
For MCO $pCO_2$ reconstruction based on Clarkia fossil leaves, we used three stomatal proxy methods as well as a stomata-independent carbon isotope-based method for comparison. The stomatal proxy methods are based on the inverse relationship that exists between leaf stomatal densities ($SD = N_{stomata/mm^2}$) of most woody plants and atmospheric $pCO_2$ (Woodward, 1987). The change in stomatal densities is the morphological expression of plants’ physiological response aiming to maximize water use efficiency, i.e. to minimize water loss through transpiration when CO$_2$ is abundantly available in the atmosphere. Stomatal plant leaf density can also be quantified as the stomatal index (SI), where both stomata and epidermal cells are counted within the annotated grids and SI calculated as $SI (%) = [SD / (SD + ED)] × 100$ (where $ED = N_{epidermal cells/mm^2}$). SI is less affected than SD by additional environmental and physiological factors besides $pCO_2$, such as irradiance levels, moisture and leaf expansion (Salisbury, 1927). The stomatal proxy methods are by now well-established in the paleoclimate literature, having been applied to a plethora of plant taxa from a wide variety of geological, ecological and climatological backgrounds to reconstruct paleo-$pCO_2$ from the Paleozoic until today, generally showing remarkable inter-method consistency (e.g. Barclay & Wing, 2016; Grein et al., 2013; Kürschner et al., 2008; Li et al., 2019; Londoño et al., 2018; Mays et al., 2015; McElwain & Steinthorsdottir, 2017; Milligan et al., 2019; Montañez et al., 2016; Reichgelt et al., 2016; Royer et al., 2001; Steinthorsdottir & Vajda, 2015; Steinthorsdottir et al., 2011, 2013, 2016a, 2016b, 2019a, 2019b; Tesfamichael et al., 2017; Wagner et al., 1996; Zhou et al., 2020) and are considered one of four most useful proxies for paleo-$pCO_2$ (Beerling & Royer, 2011).

Three methods of stomatal proxy paleo-$pCO_2$ reconstruction are currently in use: 1) the empirical stomatal ratio method, which utilizes the ratio between the SD, or more usually SI, of fossil plants and the SD or SI of extant nearest living relatives or equivalents (NLR or
NLE), grown in known (measured) \( p\)CO\(_2\), to estimate paleo-\( p\)CO\(_2\) (McElwain, 1998; McElwain & Chaloner, 1995); 2) the also empirical transfer function method, which uses herbarium and/or experimental datasets of NLR/NLE responses to variations in \( p\)CO\(_2\) to construct regression curves on which fossil SD or SI can be plotted to infer paleo-\( p\)CO\(_2\) (e.g. Barclay & Wing, 2016; Kürschner et al., 2008); and 3) mechanistic gas exchange modelling, which is taxon-independent and based on morphological and plant physiological measurements as well as input of additional parameters, such as leaf \( \delta^{13}\)C (e.g. Franks et al., 2014; Konrad et al., 2017). Here we used all three proxy methods – the stomatal ratio method with nine different NLE, four transfer functions and the Franks gas-exchange model – to obtain a robust \( p\)CO\(_2\) reconstruction for the MCO, as detailed below (see sections 2.3.1-2.3.3). To test the stomatal proxy results, we additionally applied a stomata-independent method – the C3 proxy which utilizes fossil plant’s stable carbon isotope discrimination (\( \Delta^{13}\)C) to reconstruct paleo-\( p\)CO\(_2\) (Schubert & Jahren, 2012; 2015, see section 2.3.4). For all four proxy methods confidence intervals were estimated using Monte Carlo error propagation (see section 2.3.5).

2.3.1. The stomatal ratio method

In the stomatal ratio method we employed the ratio between SI of the fossil plants and SI of the plant’s NLR or NLE, in relation to the ratio between the known \( p\)CO\(_2\) (modern, measured) and paleo-\( p\)CO\(_2\). The ratio between SI\(_{\text{modern}}/\) SI\(_{\text{fossil}}\) to \( p\)CO\(_2\)\(_{\text{fossil}}/\) \( p\)CO\(_2\)\(_{\text{modern}}\) is assumed to be 1:1 (McElwain, 1998) and the stomatal ratio calibration is expressed by the equation:

\[
p\text{CO}_2\text{paleo} = \frac{\text{SI}_{\text{NLE}}}{\text{SI}_{\text{fossil}}} \times \text{pCO}_2\text{modern}.
\]
We used several previously published SI-\(p\text{CO}_2\) couples for each of the major groups, including *B. pendula* and *B. luminifera* (Kürschner, 1997; Sun et al., 2012; Wagner, 1998; Wagner et al., 1996) for the Betulaceae (including *Betula vera*, *B. fairii* and *Ostrya sp.*). Of these, we consider *B. luminifera* to be the best NLE for the Betulaceae studied here, based on both morphology of the leaves and their ecological preference for temperate to subtropical climate (Sun et al., 2012). *B. pendula* is morphologically a good NLE, but prefers colder climate—however, we include it here to better capture variance in SI response within the genus. *B. luminifera* SI has been reported as 10.7% at 390 ppm \(p\text{CO}_2\) (Sun et al., 2012, their Fig. 5b), and *B. pendula* SI at 7–8.5% at 360 ppm \(p\text{CO}_2\) (Kürschner, 1997; Wagner, 1998; Wagner et al., 1996).

For \(p\text{CO}_2\) reconstruction based on Clarkia *Quercus payettensis*, we use published SI-\(p\text{CO}_2\) values based on the NLE species *Q. robur*, *Q. petra* and *Q. nigra* (Beerling & Chaloner, 1993; van Hoof et al., 2006; Wagner et al., 2005). A combined *Q. robur*/*Q. petra* dataset recorded SI of −19% at 280–300 ppm (van Hoof et al., 2006), with an independent *Q. robur* study recording SI of −21% at 345 ppm (Beerling & Chaloner, 1993). A third study recorded SI-\(p\text{CO}_2\) couples of 22% at 320 ppm and 19.5% at 360 ppm for *Q. nigra* (Wagner et al., 2005).

For the Lauraceae dataset, the four species *Litsea sebifera*, *L. fuscata*, *L. stocksii* and *Laurus nobilis* were chosen as NLE (Kürschner et al., 2008; McElwain, 1998). The three *Litsea* subtropical–tropical south-east Asian and Indo-Malaysian rainforest tree species are the better NLE for the Miocene Lauraceae studied here and have previously been used in the stomatal ratio method reconstructing paleo-\(p\text{CO}_2\) for the similarly warm Cenozoic interval the Eocene (McElwain, 1998; Steinthorsdottir et al., 2019a), with SI\text{NLE} being 19% for *L. glutinosa*, 18.3% for *L. fuscata* and 14.4% for *L. stocksii* at 360 ppm \(p\text{CO}_2\) (see McElwain, 1998). The evergreen Mediterranean species *L. nobilis* was originally assigned as NLE for
the extinct Neogene European species *Laurus abchasica* for a Miocene paleo-\( p\text{CO}_2 \) reconstruction (Kürschner et al., 2008; Kürschner & Kvaček, 2009), with SI\(_{\text{NLE}}\) of 16.37–20.32% at 300 ppm. It may not be the most fitting NLE for the North American Miocene Lauraceae studied here, but we chose to include it both in the stomatal ratio and transfer function methods for easier comparison to previously published Cenozoic \( p\text{CO}_2 \) values (Kürschner et al., 2008; Steinthorsdottir et al., 2016b, 2019a, 2019b), considering it essentially as a standardized Lauraceae. Stomatal Index data is provided in Table S1.

2.3.2. Transfer functions

For the Betulaceae group, we used two transfer functions, the first one based on *Betula luminifera* (Sun et al., 2012):

\[
p\text{CO}_2_{\text{paleo}} = (\text{SI} – 20.58)/–0.026
\]  

(3)

For comparison, we use a second transfer function based on a mixed database of *Betula pubescens* and *B. nana* (Finsinger & Wagner-Cremer, 2010):

\[
p\text{CO}_2_{\text{paleo}} = 10^{(2.8687 – (0.357 \times \log (\text{SI}_{\text{fossil}})))}
\]  

(4)

For *Q. payettensis*, we used a transfer function based on *Q. robur* (Garcia-Amorena et al., 2006).

\[
p\text{CO}_2_{\text{paleo}} = –6.25 \times (\text{SI}_{\text{fossil}} – 71.09)
\]  

(5)
For the Lauraceae dataset, we used the transfer function of Kürschner et al. (2008) constructed for Miocene extinct Lauraceae, based on the extant species *Laurus nobilis* calibrated from a set of historical herbarium leaves, with an added correction factor of 150 ppm, since the leaves systematically underestimated $pCO_2$ (see Kürschner et al., 2008 for details):

$$pCO_2_{\text{paleo}} = 10^{(3.173 - (0.5499 \times \log (SI_{\text{fossil}})))} + 150$$  \hspace{1cm} (6)

2.3.3. Gas-exchange modeling

The ‘Franks’ gas-exchange model (Franks et al., 2014) is based on the simple and thoroughly tested Farquhar model for C3 photosynthesis, where the rate of carbon assimilation equals the product of total leaf conductance to CO$_2$ and the concentration gradient of atmospheric-to-leaf-internal CO$_2$ (Farquhar & Sharkey, 1982). The carbon isotope discrimination during photosynthesis ($\Delta^{13}C$) is also used to reconstruct the ratio of leaf-internal-to-atmospheric $pCO_2$ ($c_i/c_a$) and is determined based on measurements of plant tissue carbon isotope composition ($\delta^{13}C$) as well as an estimate of paleo-atmospheric CO$_2$ $\delta^{13}C$ (here $-5.3$ ‰ for the MCO; Tipple et al., 2010). The Franks model thus consists of two interwoven principal equations which are solved iteratively for the two unknown factors paleo-photosynthetic rate and paleo-atmospheric $pCO_2$:

$$C_a = pCO_2_{\text{paleo}} = A_n / (g_{c(op)}(1 - c_i/c_a))$$  \hspace{1cm} (7)

where $A_n$ is the net rate of CO$_2$ assimilation by leaves ($\mu$mol m$^{-2}$ s$^{-1}$), $g_{c(op)}$ is the operational conductance to atmospheric CO$_2$ diffusion to photosynthesis sites within the leaf (mol m$^{-2}$ s$^{-1}$), which is determined by the stomatal dimension measurements: guard cell width and
stomatal pore length (GCW, PL). Key input parameters derive from stomatal morphology and carbon isotopic composition measurements on fossil leaf tissue, as well as from gas-exchange measurements on extant plants. The first of the iteratively solved equations is the Farquhar model, where total leaf conductance to $p\text{CO}_2$ is determined mostly by SD, GCW and PL. The second equation, derived from an expression for Ru-BP regeneration-limited photosynthesis (Farquhar et al., 1980), describes the long-term change in photosynthetic rate due to changing atmospheric CO$_2$ concentration relative to known values in a nearest living relative plant. For all other input parameters for the model we use the generic values recommended by Franks et al. (2014). This includes the angiosperm $A_n (=A_0)$, since it is based on measurements of modern and Miocene Betula and Quercus, which is highly appropriate for our database. Input data for the Franks model are provided in Table S2.

In a second separate run of the Franks model we use an updated s4 scaling (ratio of operating to maximum stomatal conductance) of 0.26 ± 0.11, based on a recently updated assessment of this across numerous woody angiosperm (Murray et al., 2019) (see Table S3 for input data). In a third run, we used a phylogenetic correction factor for plant tissue $\delta^{13}$C as suggested by Porter et al. (2017) which has recently been applied to the Franks model (Porter et al., 2019). This correction is intended to improve the convergence of $p\text{CO}_2$ estimates generated from different plant clades, and for angiosperms Porter et al. (2017) recommended a correction of $-2.31\%$ (see Table S4 for input data).

2.3.4. C3 plant proxy modelling

The empirical $p\text{CO}_2$ proxy model proposed by Schubert and Jahren (2012, 2015) is based on the relationship between $p\text{CO}_2$ and the stable carbon isotope discrimination ($\Delta^{13}$C) of plant
tissue; $\Delta^{13}C$ is then used to back-calculate the concentration of $CO_2$ in the past. The model is based on the observed hyperbolic relationship between $\Delta^{13}C$ and $pCO_2$:

$$\Delta^{13}C = \frac{(A)(B)(pCO_2 + C)}{[A + B \times (pCO_2 + C)]}$$ (8)

Where A, B and C are curve-fitting parameters (see Schubert & Jahren, 2012 for details). The equation was constructed based on only two angiosperm species but has since been updated (Cui & Schubert, 2016; Schubert & Jahren, 2015). Because absolute $\Delta^{13}C$ values are variable among plants grown in the same conditions, the C3 proxy is calculated using the change in $\Delta^{13}C$ relative to a reference time interval (Cui & Schubert, 2016; Schubert & Jahren, 2015). Here, we follow Schubert and Jahren (2015) and Cui and Schubert (2016) in using the Holocene average $pCO_2$ and $\Delta^{13}C$ as reference input conditions, using the values provided in Cui and Schubert (2016). The model has produced results that are in reasonably good agreement with other proxy methods (Cui & Schubert, 2016), but needs to be further constrained to avoid producing unrealistic (e.g. negative) $pCO_2$ values (Porter et al., 2019), or $pCO_2$ estimates with high uncertainty (Konrad et al., 2020; Lomax et al., 2019). In an independent validation of the C3 proxy, Lomax et al. (2019) demonstrated that due to the impact of moisture availability on $\Delta^{13}C$ $pCO_2$ was underestimated in dryer conditions; this effect was particularly pronounced at $pCO_2 \leq 1500$ ppm. The stronger control of moisture availability on $\Delta^{13}C$ relative to $pCO_2$ has also been noted in other studies (e.g., Kohn, 2016; Konrad et al., 2020; Schlanser et al., 2020). Since moisture availability is itself linked to factors such as precipitation, temperature and salinity (Lomax et al., 2019), these results suggest that a range of environmental parameters could independently influence $\Delta^{13}C$ and therefore estimated $pCO_2$. However, since the Clarkia paleoenvironment is not thought to have been strongly water-limited we include this proxy here as a comparison with the stomata-based $pCO_2$ estimates. $\delta^{13}C$ data is provided in Table S1.
2.3.5 Monte Carlo error propagation

Here, we have followed previous studies (e.g., Cui & Schubert, 2016; Franks et al., 2014; Royer et al., 2014) in using Monte Carlo error propagation to generate confidence intervals on the $p$CO$_2$ estimates. In this approach, rather than simply using the mean of measured parameters (e.g., SD or GCW) to calculate the variable of interest, distributions representing those parameters (usually normal distributions defined by the mean and standard deviation or standard error of the measurements and model coefficients) are repeatedly resampled and those values used in the proxy calculations (Cui & Schubert, 2016). This generates a distribution of $p$CO$_2$ estimates that are consistent with the error distributions of the initial measurements/coefficients. From this distribution the median can be taken as the $p$CO$_2$ estimate, and percentiles of the distribution used to define confidence intervals, typically the 16$^{th}$ and 84$^{th}$ percentiles to define a 68% confidence interval, or the 2.5$^{th}$ and 97.5$^{th}$ percentiles to define a 95% confidence interval (Cui & Schubert, 2016; Royer et al., 2014) (Tables S5 and S6).

For each proxy model run we used 10000 sets of randomly generated input values to calculate 10000 $p$CO$_2$ estimates. For the Franks model (Franks et al., 2014), the R code provided with the paper includes Monte Carlo error propagation, and returns the resampled $p$CO$_2$ estimates as well as a summary of the distributions and other calculated parameters. Monte Carlo error propagation was also employed by Cui and Schubert (2016) for the C3 proxy (Schubert & Jahren, 2012, 2015), and we follow the same approach here. For both the stomatal ratio and transfer function methods we have written new resampling routines in R (R Core Team, 2018) that incorporate the error in both the fossil and NLR/NLE SI measurements. For the transfer functions we use in this study, standard errors for the regression coefficients (intercept and slope) were not provided in the original publications, and so could not be incorporated into the Monte Carlo resampling. However, in both Sun et
al. (2012) and Kürschner et al., (2008) the underlying SI and $pCO_2$ data were provided. We therefore refit these regressions, extracted the model coefficient standard errors, and re-ran the Monte Carlo error propagation to provide a comparison with the results based on just the standard error of the SI measurements. The full results of these additional analyses are provided in Table S7. We have used standard errors rather than standard deviations to define the distributions for resampling, because this better captures repeated resampling of mean stomatal parameters from a statistical population, rather than the resampling of individual measurements that using standard deviations would simulate. After each Monte Carlo run we first removed any invalid $pCO_2$ estimates (i.e., those $< 0$ or $> 10^6$ ppm), and then used the 16th/84th and 2.5th/97.5th percentiles to define 68% and 95% confidence intervals around the median value (the 50th percentile, which typically closely approximates the $pCO_2$ estimate that would be produced by the proxy without Monte Carlo resampling). We calculated the median $pCO_2$ plus confidence intervals for each leaf specimen (Table S5), for each taxon within each locality (Table S6), and within each locality to provide overall within-locality $pCO_2$ estimates. In the main paper we report the within-taxon and within-locality $pCO_2$ estimates, using 95% confidence intervals because this is the usual confidence level employed to assess statistical significance and compare among estimated parameters. The specimen-level $pCO_2$ estimates are given in the supporting information, along with the 68% confidence intervals to provide a direct comparison with other studies (e.g. Cui & Schubert, 2016; Franks et al., 2014; Londoño et al., 2018; Porter et al., 2019; Tesfamichel et al., 2017) (see Tables S5 and S6). The R code, which includes the Monte Carlo input values, is provided in the supporting information.
3 Clarkia MCO pCO₂ reconstructions

In our quest to robustly reconstruct MCO pCO₂, we used a multi-taxon database of fossil leaves collected from a well-dated sedimentary section, and preformed multiple independent pCO₂ reconstructions – using the stomatal ratio method with 10 distinct SI-NLE pairs; four transfer functions; the Franks gas exchange model, both the original version and with two separate correction factors; as well as the C3 proxy. Using the selection of published NLE SI-pCO₂ relationships applied to our five taxa in the stomatal ratio method, this translates to a locality average pCO₂ of 476 ppm (within-taxon median range of 402–568 ppm) at P-37 and 539 ppm (within-taxon median range of 411–614 ppm) at P-33 (Table 1, Fig. 4). None of the Monte Carlo pCO₂ estimates were <0 or >10⁶ ppm.

The transfer function approach, using previously published transfer functions applied to our five taxa, records similar pCO₂ as the stomatal ratio method, although appreciably lower (Table 1). A median pCO₂ of 364 ppm is recorded at P-37 (within-taxon median range of 356–473 ppm and ~468 ppm (within-taxon median range of 370–490 ppm) at P-33 (Fig. 4). None of the Monte Carlo pCO₂ estimates were <0 or >10⁶ ppm. Additional Monte Carlo analyses on two of the transfer functions, incorporating standard errors on the regression coefficients as well as the SI measurements, suggest that the 95% confidence intervals reported here underestimate the true confidence intervals by 30–80% (further details are provided in Table S7).

Using the Franks model for pCO₂ reconstruction (Franks et al., 2014) in its original form with our chosen input parameters (see methods section and Table S2) the three taxa at P-37 record median pCO₂ ranging from ~456–491 ppm, with a locality median pCO₂ of 479 ppm. Median pCO₂ for the five taxa at P-33 ranges between a minimum of 364 ppm and a maximum of 609 ppm, with a locality median pCO₂ of 548 ppm (Table1, Fig. 4). None of the
Monte Carlo $pCO_2$ estimates were $<0$ or $>10^6$ ppm. Applying the ‘Murray correction’ (see methods, Table S3 and Murray et al., 2019) to the Franks model, a of median $pCO_2$ is recorded ranging from 389 ppm to 464 ppm at P-37 and 365 ppm to 554 ppm at P-33 (Table 1, Fig. 4). The locality medians recorded using the Murray correction factor are lower than for the original input ratio used in the Franks model, with $pCO_2$ of 405 ppm for P-37 and 480 ppm for P-33. The spread of $pCO_2$ estimates was larger than with the uncorrected Franks model, with 5 values $>10^6$ ppm and 5103 values $<0$ ppm; these were removed before the median and percentiles were calculated. When applying the ‘Porter correction’ (see methods, Table S4 and Porter et al., 2017) to the Franks model, significantly higher $pCO_2$ is recorded, with a range of 675–776 ppm and a locality median of 738 ppm at P-37, and 561–988 ppm, median 882 ppm at P-33 (Table 1, Fig. 4). As with the uncorrected Franks model, no invalid $pCO_2$ estimates were produced.

The C3 proxy, which is independent from stomatal parameters (see methods and Schubert & Jahren, 2012; 2015), records median within-taxon $pCO_2$ ranging from 471 ppm to 601 ppm at P-37, with a locality median of 529 ppm (Table 1, Fig. 4). At P-33, higher values of $pCO_2$ are recorded, between 575 ppm and 624 ppm, with a locality median of 603 ppm. The C3 proxy generated 8 $pCO_2$ estimates $>10^6$ ppm and 2811 estimates $<0$ ppm, which were removed prior to calculating the median and percentiles of the distribution.

Summarizing the results, an obvious pattern is that the majority of the $pCO_2$ reconstructions are considerably lower than the ~800 ppm believed to be necessary to reproduce MCO temperatures (Fig. 4, Goldner et al., 2014), even taken the errors into account, which are quite extensive for many of the proxies. Most median $pCO_2$ estimates
converge around close to 450–550 ppm. Another clear feature is that median \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) is consistently higher at P-33, the older locality, than it is at the younger locality P-37.

4 Discussion

The stomatal index and gas exchange based methods (with the exception of Franks + Porter) recorded remarkably similar \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \), as has previously been shown to be the case in numerous studies (see e.g. McElwain & Steinthorsdottir, 2017; Montañez et al., 2016; Steinthorsdottir et al., 2019a; Zhou et al., 2020). The transfer function approach on the other hand recorded consistently lower \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) than the other proxies, a phenomenon that has also been previously observed (Kürschner et al., 2008; Steinthorsdottir et al., 2016b, 2019a, 2019b). The stomata-independent C3 proxy recorded higher \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) on average than the stomata-dependent methods, but still sufficiently similar to be regarded as independently supporting the stomata proxy results (Fig. 4).

The 95% confidence intervals on our \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) estimates are derived from Monte Carlo error propagation. As such they represent an honest accounting of the errors on the measurements and model parameters that underpin the different proxies, and allow us to assess robustly how consistent our data are with different \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) scenarios. The stomatal ratio, transfer function and Franks model \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) estimates all have confidence intervals that either do not overlap, or overlap only slightly, with the 800 ppm \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) that is required by climate simulations to produce MCO temperatures (Goldner et al., 2014). Therefore, even with full error propagation the results from these proxies are not consistent with such highly elevated \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) levels. The Murray correction to the Franks model results in a skewed distribution with a long tail of high of \( p_{\text{CO}_2} \) estimates that extend well beyond 800 ppm (Fig. 4), despite having a lower median than the uncorrected Franks model. The right skewed distribution is
likely to be in part a result of the removal of the high number of negative \( pCO_2 \) estimates prior to calculating the distribution percentiles: of 61000 resamples (61 samples x 1000 Monte Carlo resamples) 5103 or 8.4\% were negative. Our results therefore suggest that applying the Murray correction to the Franks model amplifies the variability in the underlying measurements to the point where a high proportion of invalid \( pCO_2 \) values are produced and the final \( pCO_2 \) estimate has a low precision. The C3 proxy resulted in 2811 or 4.6\% negative resamples, and has an even more pronounced right skewed distribution that incorporates a range of unrealistic \( pCO_2 \) estimates for the mid-Miocene (i.e. up to \( \sim \)2600 ppm for site P-33, see Fig. 4). Such wide confidence intervals appear to be a general issue with the C3 proxy, when calculated relative to the Holocene reference and with Monte Carlo error propagation (Lomax et al., 2019). We therefore consider these high values to be properties of the underlying proxies, rather than reasonable \( pCO_2 \) expectations for the MCO, and suggest that further corrections may be required to increase the precision of these models.

The one exception to our \( pCO_2 \) proxy reconstructions is the Franks model with the Porter correction, which places \( pCO_2 \) at \( \sim \)800 ppm. While this is consistent with the modeled \( pCO_2 \) necessary to simulate MCO temperatures (Goldner et al., 2014), we consider these estimates to be erroneously high given the results from the other proxies, including those that are based solely on SI and therefore cannot be biased by \( \delta^{13}C \) measurements. This suggests that the correction to \( \delta^{13}C \) suggested by Porter et al. (2017) to account for phylogenetic offsets among major plants clades leads to overestimated \( pCO_2 \) when applied to angiosperms. As noted by Porter et al. (2017, 2019), this is a post-hoc correction that has been developed from plants grown in experimentally controlled, growth-room conditions, and it may be that these do not successfully translate across to plants that existed in natural habitats (Lomax et al., 2019). Our results also illustrate the general point that a correction to make \( pCO_2 \) estimates from different plant groups converge better does not necessarily mean that they will
converge at the right level. However, we fully acknowledge that our results only pertain to one plant clade (angiosperms) from one time and place, and that this does not rule out the need for such correction factors or contradict the values put forward by Porter et al. (2017) for gymnosperms or spore producing plants. For future studies it will be useful to investigate several different plant clades, including both spore and seed producing plants, from the same deposits, and compare pCO₂ estimates from multiple proxies (including those that do not rely on δ¹³C). This will allow phylogenetic δ¹³C offsets to be assessed in ‘natural’ conditions, and will enable a better understanding of how these offsets impact on multi-taxon pCO₂ reconstructions, both from taxa co-occurring in the same deposits and when individual measurements are compiled into long timeseries (e.g. Porter et al., 2019).

An interesting feature of the dataset is the consistent difference in pCO₂ recorded between the two localities, with higher pCO₂ recorded by all taxa and all proxies at the older P-33 compared to the younger P-37. Although this cannot be shown in a robust statistical sense and might be the result of random sampling variation, it is noteworthy that the offset is consistent across the different proxies (whether they use SI, δ¹³C, or both). The Clarkia Lake was formed when a CRBG flow, in connection with a volcanic eruption and thus CO₂ outgassing, dammed a valley river (Kasbohm & Schoene, 2017; Smiley & Rember, 1985b; Yang et al., 1995), and it is possible, perhaps even likely, that pCO₂ was indeed higher closer in time to this damming event, when P-33 sediments were being deposited. It would be highly beneficial to our understanding of Earth system processes to be able to record in detail the behavior of the carbon cycle during volcanic emplacement and further studies are under way at the Clarkia localities to construct more high-chronological resolution fossil leaf databases to test this.

Comparing the results presented here with previously published MCO pCO₂ records, most of which record pCO₂ around or even considerably lower than ~400–450 ppm during
the MCO (Badger et al., 2013; Beerling et al., 2009; Breecker & Retallack, 2014; Foster et al., 2012; Greenop et al., 2014; Grein et al., 2013; Ji et al., 2018; Retallack, 2009; Royer, 2003; Royer et al., 2001; Zhang et al., 2013), the new multi-method, multi-taxon Clarkia $pCO_2$ record slightly corrects these estimates upwards, supporting the results of Kürschner et al. (2008), who reported MCO $pCO_2$ of up to ~550 ppm. Considering the confidence intervals, MCO $pCO_2$ presented here may also have been lower (down to ~350 ppm), but given the mutually-supporting convergence of most of the proxies around median values of ~450–550 ppm, as well as the consistently high temperatures recorded by numerous proxies, we consider this higher interval to be a more likely scenario.

5 Conclusions

The multi-method, multi-taxon $pCO_2$ reconstruction presented here indicates that $pCO_2$ was moderately elevated at ~450–550 ppm during the MCO. These results are somewhat higher than most previously published $pCO_2$ records, which generally report $pCO_2$ <450 ppm (see Foster et al., 2017), but still considerably lower $pCO_2$ than climate modelling requires to reproduce MCO temperatures (Goldner et al., 2014). This indicates that climate sensitivity must have been elevated during the MCO, leading to highly elevated temperatures at moderately elevated $pCO_2$. With 415 ppm measured for the first time in spring 2019 (NOAA data at esrl.noaa.gov), and with no sign yet of decreasing emissions, we are fast approaching MCO-level $pCO_2$. The race is now on to improve our knowledge of the Earth system in order to understand whether such moderate levels of $pCO_2$ may also cause a devastating temperature increase of up to 7 °C in the (near?) future, and if so, take action to prevent it.
Acknowledgments, Samples, and Data

We thank H. K. Coxall and P. Pearson for assistance in the field, and C. Geraghty, W.M. Kürschner, C.A. E. Strömberg, B. Lomax and M. Huber for helpful discussions. Special thanks to M. J. Kohn for suggesting studying the Clarkia fossils to M. S. The fossil leaf database is stored at the Department of Palaeobiology, Swedish Museum of Natural History. All data and proxy model inputs are available in the supporting information and in the Bolin Centre for Climate Research (Stockholm University) database:

https://doi.org/10.17043/steinthorsdottir-2020

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

Badger, M. P. S., Lear, C. H., Pancost, R. D., Foster, G. L., Bailey, T. R., Leng, M. J., & Abels, H. A. (2013). CO₂ drawdown following the middle Miocene expansion of the Antarctic Ice Sheet. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 28, 42–53.

Barclay, R. S., & Wing, S. L. (2016). Improving the Ginkgo CO₂ barometer: implications for the early Cenozoic atmosphere. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 439, 158–171.

Beerling, D. J., & Chaloner, W. G. (1993). Evolutionary responses of stomatal density to global CO₂ change. Biological Journal of the Linnean Society, 48, 343–353.

Beerling, D. J., & Royer, D. L. (2011). Convergent Cenozoic CO₂ history. Nature Geoscience, 4, 418–420.

Beerling, D.J., Fox, A., & Anderson, C.W. (2009). Quantitative uncertainty analyses of ancient atmospheric CO₂ estimates from fossil leaves. American Journal of Science, 309, 775–787.
Barry, T. L., Kelley, S. P., Reidel, S. P., Camp, V. E., Self, S., Jarboe, N. A., Duncan, R. A., & Renne, P. R. (2013). Eruption chronology of the Columbia River Basalt Group. *Geological Society of America Special Papers, 497*, 45–66.

Breecker, D. O., & Retallack, G. J. (2014). Refining the pedogenic carbonate atmospheric CO2 proxy and application to Miocene CO2. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 406*, 1–8.

Cui, Y., & Schubert, B. A. (2016). Quantifying uncertainty of past pCO2 determined from changes in C3 plant carbon isotope fractionation. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 172*, 127–138.

Denk, T., Grímssson, F., Zetter, R., & Símonarson, L. A. (2011). Chapter 4. The Archaic Floras. In: Denk, T., Grímssson, F., Zetter, R., & Símonarson, L. A. Late Cainozoic Floras of Iceland. 15 Million Years of Vegetation and Climate History in the Northern North Atlantic. *Topics in Geobiology, 35*. Springer, Dordrecht, pp. 173–231.

Farquhar, G. D., & Sharkey, T. D. (1982). Stomatal conductance and photosynthesis. *American Review of Plant Physiology, 33*, 317–345.

Farquhar, G. D., von Caemmerer, & Berry, J. A. (1980). A biochemical model of photosynthetic CO2 assimilation in leaves of C3 species. *Planta, 149*, 78–80.

Finsinger, W., & Wagner-Cremer, F. (2010). Stomatal-based inference models for reconstruction of atmospheric CO2 concentration: a method assessment using a calibration and validation approach. *The Holocene, 19*, 757–764.

Flower, B. P., & Kennett, J. P. (1994). The middle Miocene climatic transition: East Antarctic ice sheet development, deep ocean circulation and global carbon cycling. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 108*, 537–555.
Foster, G. L., Lear, C. H., & Rae, J. W. B. (2012). The evolution of $p$CO$_2$, ice volume and climate during the Middle Miocene. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 341-344*, 243–254.

Foster, G. L., Royer, D. L., & Lunt, D. J. (2017). Future climate forcing potentially without precedent in the last 420 million years. *Nature Communications, 8*, 14845.

Franks, P. J., Royer, D. L., Beerling, D. J., Van de Water, P. K., Cantrill, D. J., Barbour, M. M., & Berry, J. A. (2014). New constraints on atmospheric CO$_2$ concentration for the Phanerozoic. *Geophysical Research Letters, 41*, 4685–4694.

García-Amorena, I., Wagner, F., van Hoof, T. B., & Gómez Manzaneque, F. (2006). Stomatal responses in deciduous oaks from southern Europe to the anthropogenic atmospheric CO$_2$; refining the stomatal-based CO$_2$ proxy. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology, 141*, 303–312.

Geraghty, C. S. (2017). Tephrochronology of the mid-Miocene Clarkia Lake sedimentary deposits. M.Sc. thesis. Washington State University. 97 pp.

Goldner, A., Herold, N., & Huber, M. (2014). The challenge of simulating the warmth of the mid-Miocene climatic optimum. *Climate of the Past, 10*, 523–536.

Greenop, R., Foster, G. L., Wilson, P. A., & Lear, C. H. (2014). Middle-Miocene climate instability associated with high-amplitude CO$_2$ variability. *Paleoceanography, 29*, 845–853.

Grein, M., Oehm, C., Konrad, W., Utescher, T., Kunzmann, L., & Roth-Nebelsick, A. (2013). Atmospheric CO$_2$ from the Late Oligocene to early Miocene based on photosynthesis data and fossil leaf characteristics. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 374*, 41–51.

Hobbs, K. M., & Totman Parrish, J. (2016). Miocene global change recorded in Columbia River basalt-hosted paleosols. *GSA Bulletin, 128*, 1543–1554.
Holbourn, A. E., Kuhnt, W., Kochhann, K. G. D., Andersen, N., & Meier, K. J. S. (2015). Global perturbation of the carbon cycle at the onset of the Miocene Climatic Optimum. Geology, 43, 123–126.

IPCC (2014). Climate Change 2014: Synthesis Report. Contribution of Working Groups I, II and III to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change [Core Writing Team, R.K. Pachauri and L.A. Meyer (eds.)]. IPCC, Geneva, Switzerland, 151 pp.

Ji, S., Nie, J., Lechler, A., Huntington, K. W., Heitmann, E. O., & Breecker, D. O. (2018). A symmetrical CO₂ peak and asymmetrical climate change during the middle Miocene. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 499, 134–144.

Kasbohm, J., & Schoene, B. (2018). Rapid eruption of the Columbia River flood basalt and correlation with the mid-Miocene climate optimum. Science Advances, 4, 1–8.

Kohn M. J. (2016). Carbon isotope discrimination in C3 land plants is independent of natural variations in pCO₂. Geochemical Perspectives Letters, 2, 35–43.

Konrad, W., Katul, G., Roth-Nebelsick, A., & Grein, M. (2017). A reduced order model to analytically infer atmospheric CO₂ concentration from stomatal and climate data. Advances in Water Resources, 104, 145–157.

Konrad, W., Royer, D. L., Franks, P. J., & Roth-Nebelsick, A. (2020). Quantitative critique of leaf-based paleo-CO₂ proxies: Consequences for their reliability and applicability. Geological Journal, 1-17. doi: https://doi.org/10.1002/gj.3807.

Kürschner, W. M. (1997). The anatomical diversity of recent and fossil leaves of the durmast oak (Quercus petraea Lieblein/ Q. pseudocastanea Goeppert) – implications for their use as biosensors of palaeoatmospheric CO₂ levels. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology, 96, 1–13.
Kürschner, W.M. & Kvaček, Z. (2009). Oligocene–Miocene CO$_2$ fluctuations, climatic and palaeofloristic trends inferred from fossil plant assemblages in central Europe. *Bulletin of Geosciences, 84*, 189–202.

Kürschner, W. M., Kvaček, Z., Dilcher, D. L. (2008). The impact of Miocene atmospheric carbon dioxide fluctuations on climate and the evolution of terrestrial ecosystems. *Proceedings of the National Academy of the Sciences of the United States of America, 105*, 449–453.

Kvaček Z., & Rember, W. C. (2000). Shared Miocene conifers of the Clarkia flora and Europe. *Acta Universitatis Carolinae Geologica, 44*, 75–85.

Ladderud, J. A., Wolff, J. A., Rember, W. C., & Brueseke, M. E. (2015). Volcanic ash layers in the Miocene Lake Clarkia beds: geochemistry, regional correlation, and the age of the Clarkia flora. *Northwest Science, 89*, 309–323.

Lear, C. H., Elderfield, H., & Wilson, P. A. (2000). Cenozoic deep-sea temperatures and global ice volumes from Mg/Ca in benthic foraminiferal calcite. *Science, 287*, 269–272.

Li, H., Yu, J., McElwain, J. C., Yiotis, C., & Chen, Z.-Q. (2019). Reconstruction of atmospheric CO$_2$ concentration during the late Changhsingian based on fossil conifers from the Dalong Formation in South China. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 519*, 37–48.

Lomax, B. H., Lake, J. A., Leng, M. J., & Jardine, P. E. (2019). An experimental evaluation of the use of Δ$^{13}$C as a proxy for palaeoatmospheric CO$_2$. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 247*, 162–174.

Londoño, L., Royer, D. L., Jaramillo, C., Escobar, J., Foster, D. A., Cárdenas-Rozo, A. L., & Wood, A. (2018). Early Miocene CO$_2$ estimates from a Neotropical fossil leaf assemblage exceed 400 ppm. *American Journal of Botany, 105*, 1929–1937.
Mays, C., Steinthorsdottir, M., & Stillwell, J. D. (2015). Climatic implications of Ginkgoites waarensis Douglas emend. from the south polar Tupuangi flora, Late Cretaceous (Cenomanian), Chatham Islands. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 438, 308–326.

McElwain, J. C. (1998). Do fossil plants signal palaeoatmospheric carbon dioxide concentration in the geological past? *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B*, 353, 83–96.

McElwain, J. C., & Chaloner, W. G. (1995). Stomatal Density and Index of Fossil Plants Track Atmospheric Carbon-Dioxide in the Paleozoic. *Annals of Botany*, 76, 389–395.

McElwain, J. C., & Steinthorsdottir, M. (2017). Palaeoecology, ploidy, palaeoatmospheric composition and developmental biology: A review of the multiple uses of fossil stomata. *Plant Physiology*, 174, 650–664.

Milligan, J. N., Royer, D. L., Franks, P. J., Upchurch, G. R., & McKee, M. L. (2019). No evidence for a large atmospheric CO₂ spike across the Cretaceous-Paleogene boundary. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 46, 3462–3472.

Montañez, I. P., McElwain, J. C., Poulsen, C. J., White, J. D., DiMichele, W. A., Wilson, J. P., Griggs, G., & Hren, M. T. (2016). Climate, pCO₂ and terrestrial carbon cycle linkages during late Palaeozoic glacial-interglacial cycles. *Nature Geoscience*, 9, 824–828.

Murray, M., Soh, W. K., Yiotis, C., Spicer, R. A., Lawson, T., & McElwain, J. C. (2019). Consistent relationship between field-measured stomatal conductance and theoretical maximum stomatal conductance in C3 woody angiosperms in four major biomes. *International Journal of Plant Sciences*, published online December 5th 2019.
Nash, B. P., & Perkins, M. E. (2012). Neogene fallout tuffs from the Yellowstone hotspot in the Columbia Plateau region, Oregon, Washington and Idaho, USA. *PLOS ONE* doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0044205

Pinson, J. B., Manchester, S. R., & Sessa, E. B. (2018). *Culcita remberti* sp. nov., an understory fern of Cytatheales from the Miocene of northern Idaho. *International Journal of Plant Science* 179, 635–639.

Poole, I., & Kürschner, W. M. (1999). Stomatal density and index: the practice. In Jones, T. P., Rowe, N. P. (Eds.), *Fossil Plants and Spores: Modern Techniques*. The Geological Society, London, pp. 257–260.

Porter, A. S., Yiotis, C., Montañez, I. P., & McElwain, J. C. (2017). Evolutionary differences in Δ13C detected between spore and seed bearing plants following exposure to a range of atmospheric O2:CO2 ratios; implications for palaeoatmosphere reconstruction. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 213, 517–533.

Porter, A. S., Evans-Fitz.Gerald, C., Yiotis, C., Montañez, I. P., & McElwain, J. C. (2019). Testing the accuracy of new palaeoatmospheric CO2 proxies based on plant stable carbon isotopic composition and stomatal traits in a range of simulated palaeoatmospheric O2:CO2 ratios. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 259, 69–90.

Pound, M., Haywood, A. M., Salzman, U., & Riding J. B. (2012). Global vegetation dynamics and latitudinal temperature gradients during the Mid to Late Miocene (15.97–5.33 Ma). *Earth-Science Review*, 112, 1–22

Reichgelt, T., Kennedy, E. M., Mildenhall, D. C., Conran, J. G., Greenwood, D. R., & Lee, D. E. (2013). Quantitative palaeoclimate estimates for Early Miocene southern New Zealand: evidence from Foulden Maar. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 378, 36–44.
Rember, W. C. (1991). Stratigraphy and paleobotany of Miocene lake sediments near Clarkia, Idaho. University of Idaho, Moscow. Ph.D. Dissertation.

Retallack, G. J. (2009). Greenhouse crises of the past 300 million years. *Geological Society of America Bulletin, 121*, 1441–1455.

Royer, D. L. (2003). Estimating latest Cretaceous and Tertiary atmospheric CO₂ from stomatal indices. In: Wing, S. L., Gingerich, P. D., Schmitz, B., Thomas, E. (Editors), Causes and Consequences of Globally Warm Climates in the Early Paleogene. *Geological Society of America Special Paper, 369*, 79–93.

Royer D. L., Wing, S. L., Beerling, D. J., Jolley, D. W., Koch, P. L., Hickey, L. J., & Berner, R. A. (2001). Paleobotanical evidence for near present-day levels of atmospheric CO₂ during part of the Tertiary. *Science, 292*, 2310–2313.

Salisbury, E. J. (1927). On the causes and ecological significance of stomatal frequency, with special reference to the woodland flora. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B, 216*, 1–65.

Schlanser, K., Diefendorf, A. F., Greenwood, D. R., Mueller, K. E., West, C. K., Lowe, A. J., et al. (2020). On geologic timescales, plant carbon isotope fractionation responds to precipitation similarly to modern plants and has a small negative correlation with pCO₂. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 270*, 264-281.

Schubert, B. A., & Jahren, A. H. (2012). The effect of atmospheric CO₂ concentration on carbon isotope fractionation in C3 land plants. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 96*, 29–43.

Schubert, B. A., & Jahren, A. H. (2015). Global increase in plant carbon isotope fractionation following the Last Glacial Maximum caused by increase in atmospheric pCO₂. *Geology, 43*, 435–438.
Sherwood, S. C., & Huber, M. (2010). An adaptability limit to climate change due to heat stress. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 107*, 9552–9555.

Smiley, C. J., Gray, J., & Huggins, M. (1975). Preservation of Miocene fossils in unoxidized lake deposits, Clarkia, Idaho. *Journal of Paleontology, 49*, 833–844.

Smiley, C. J., & Rember, W. C. (1979). Guidebook and roadlog to the St. Maries River (Clarkia) area of northern Idaho. *The Idaho Bureau of Mines and Geology Information Circular, 33*, 1–27.

Smiley, C. J., & Rember, W. C. (1981). Paleoecology of the Miocene Clarkia Lake (northern Idaho) and its environs. In J. Gray, A. J. Boucot, W. B.N. Berry, eds. *Communities of the past*. Stroudsburg, PA, Hutchinson & Ross.

Smiley, C. J., & Rember, W. C. (1985a). Composition of the Miocene Clarkia flora. In C. J. Smiley (ed.): *Late Cenozoic history of the Pacific Northwest*. Pacific Division of the American Association for the Advancement of Science, San Francisco. Pp. 95–112.

Smiley, C. J., & Rember, W. C. (1985b). Physical settings of the Miocene Clarkia fossil beds. In C. J. Smiley (ed.): *Late Cenozoic History of the Pacific Northwest*. Pacific Division of the American Association for the Advancement of Science, San Francisco. Pp. 11–31.

Sosdian, S. M., Greenop, R., Hain, M. P., Foster, G. L., Pearson, P. N., & Lear, C. H. (2018). Constraining the evolution of Neogene ocean carbonate chemistry using the boron isotope pH proxy. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 498*, 362–376.

Steinthorsdottir, M., Coxall, H. K., de Boer, A. M., Huber, M., Barbolini, N., Bradshaw, C., et al. (submitted). Miocene Climate and Biota – a Past for the Future. *Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology*, this issue.
Steinthorsdottir, M., & Vajda, V. (2015). Early Jurassic (Pliensbachian) CO₂ concentrations based on stomatal analysis of fossil conifer leaves from eastern Australia. *Gondwana Research*, 27, 932–939.

Steinthorsdottir, M., Jeram, A.J. & McElwain, J.C. (2011). Extremely elevated CO₂ concentrations at the Triassic/Jurassic boundary. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 308, 418–432.

Steinthorsdottir, M., Porter, A., Holohan, A., Kunzmann, L., Collinson, M. & McElwain, J.C. (2016a). Fossil plant stomata indicate decreasing atmospheric CO₂ prior to the Eocene-Oligocene boundary. *Climate of the Past*, 12, 439–454.

Steinthorsdottir, M., Vajda, V., & Pole, M. (2016b). Global trends of pCO₂ across the Cretaceous-Paleogene boundary supported by the first Southern Hemisphere stomatal proxy-based pCO₂ reconstruction. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 464, 143–152.

Steinthorsdottir, M., Vajda, V., & Pole, M. (2019a). Significant transient pCO₂ perturbation across the New Zealand Oligocene-Miocene transition recorded by fossil plants. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 515, 152–161.

Steinthorsdottir, M., Vajda, V., Pole, M., & Holdgate, G. (2019b). Moderate levels of Eocene pCO₂ indicated by fossil plant stomata. *Geology*, 47, 914–918.

Steinthorsdottir, M., Wohlfarth, B., Kylander, M. E., Blaauw, M., & Reimer, P. J. (2013). Stomatal proxy record of CO₂ concentrations from the Last Termination suggests an important role for CO₂ at climate change transitions. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 68, 43–58.

Stoll, D. K., Guitian, J., Hernandez-Almeida, I., Mejia, L. M., Phelps, S., Polissar, P., et al. (2019). Upregulation of phytoplankton carbon concentrating mechanisms during low
CO₂ glacial periods and implications for the phytoplankton $p$CO₂ proxy. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 208, 1-20.

Sun, B.-N., Ding, S.-T., Wu, J.-Y., Dong, C., Xie, S., & Lin, Z.-C. (2012). Carbon isotope and stomatal data of late Pliocene Betulaceae leaves from SW China: Implications for palaeoatmospheric CO₂-levels. *Turkish Journal of Earth Sciences*, 21, 237–250.

Tesfamichael, T., Jacobs, B., Tabor, N., Michel, L., Currano, E., Feseha, M., Barclay, R., Kappelman, J., & Schmitz, M. (2017). Settling the issue of “decoupling” between atmospheric carbon dioxide and global temperatures: [CO₂]$_{atm}$ reconstructions across the warming Paleogene-Neogene divide. *Geology*, 45, 999–1002.

Tipple, B. J., Meyers, S. R., & Pagani, M. (2010). Carbon isotope ratio of Cenozoic CO₂: A comparative evaluation of available geochemical proxies. *Paleoceanography*, 25, PA3202.

van Hoof, T. B., Kürschner, W. M., Wagner, F., & Visscher, H. (2006). Stomatal index response of *Quercus robur* and *Quercus petraea* to the anthropogenic CO₂ increase. *Plant Ecology*, 183, 237–243.

Wagner, F. (1998). The influence of environment on the stomatal frequency in *Betula*. Ph.D. Thesis, *LPP Contribution series*, 9. Utrecht University, The Netherlands, 102 pp.

Wagner, F., Below, R., DeKlerk, P., Dilcher, D. L., Joosten, H., Kürschner, W. M., & Visscher, H. (1996). A natural experiment on plant acclimation: Lifetime stomatal frequency response of an individual tree to annual atmospheric CO₂ increase. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 93, 11705–11708.

Wagner, F., Dilcher, D. L., Visscher, H. (2005). Stomatal frequency responses in hardwood-swat vegetation from Florida during a 60-year continuous CO₂ increase. *American Journal of Botany*, 92, 690–695.
Wang, H., Leng, Q., Liu, W., & Yang, H. (2017). A rapid lake-shallowing event terminated 
preservation of the Miocene Clarkia Fossil Konservat-Lagerstätte (Idaho, USA). 
*Geology, 45*, 239–242.

Woodward, F.I. (1987). Stomatal numbers are sensitive to increase in CO$_2$ from pre-industrial 
levels. *Nature, 327*, 617–618.

Yang, H., Smiley, C. J., Sprenke, K. F., Rember, W. C., & Knowles, C. R. (1995).  
Subsurface Evidence for a Rapid Formation of the Clarkia Miocene Lake in Northern 
Idaho. *Northwest Science, 69*, 52–59.

Zachos, J. C., Pagani, M., Sloan, L., Thomas, E., & Billups, K. (2001). Trends, rhythms and 
aberrations in global climate 65 Ma to present. *Science, 292*, 686–693.

Zachos, J. C., Dickens, G. R., & Zeebe, R. E. (2008). An early Cenozoic perspective on 
greenhouse warming and carbon-cycle dynamics. *Nature, 451*, 279–283.

Zhang, Y. G., Pagani, M., Bohaty, S. M., & DeConto, R. (2013). A 40-million-year history 
of atmospheric CO$_2$. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A, 371*, 
20130096.

Zhou, N., Wang, Y., Ya, L., Porter, A. S., Kürschner, W. M., Li, L., Lu, N., & McElwain, J. 
C. (2020). An inter-comparison study of three stomatal-proxy methods for CO$_2$ 
reconstruction applied to early Jurassic Ginkgoales plants. *Palaeogeography, 
Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 542*, 109547.
Table 1. $p$CO$_2$ reconstruction summary results for each taxon within each of the two Clarkia localities, derived from Monte Carlo error propagation. SD = stomatal density and SI = stomatal index. For each of the six proxies, the $p$CO$_2$ estimate is provided as well as the lower and upper bounds of a 95% confidence interval.

| Locality | Taxon       | SD (N/mm$^2$) | SI (%)  | Stomatal ratio | Transfer function | Franks model | Franks + Murray | Franks + Porter | C3 Proxy |
|----------|-------------|---------------|---------|----------------|-------------------|--------------|-----------------|----------------|----------|
| P-37     | B. vera     | 314$^{+41}_{-31}$ | 6.0$^{+1.6}_{-1.6}$ | 568            | 473               | 456           | 422             | 675             | 471      |
|          | B. fairii   | 401$^{+33}_{-33}$ | 8.5$^{+0.8}_{-1.0}$ | 402            | 402               | 491           | 464             | 776             | 601      |
|          | Q. payettensis | 816$^{+122}_{-122}$ | 14.3$^{+2.0}_{-2.0}$ | 474            | 356               | 481           | 389             | 739             | 526      |
| Locality:|             |               |         |                |                   |              |                 |                 |          |
| P-33     | B. vera     | 278$^{+66}_{-66}$ | 6.0$^{+1.0}_{-1.0}$ | 559            | 470               | 609           | 554             | 988             | 612      |
|          | B. fairii   | 314$^{+37}_{-37}$ | 6.3$^{+1.6}_{-1.6}$ | 566            | 473               | 564           | 528             | 920             | 624      |
|          | Ostrya sp.  | 311$^{+55}_{-55}$ | 6.0$^{+1.0}_{-1.0}$ | 614            | 488               | 537           | 498             | 830             | 577      |
|          | Q. payettensis | 760$^{+111}_{-111}$ | 12.0$^{+2.4}_{-2.4}$ | 560            | 370               | 535           | 430             | 870             | 609      |
|          | Lauraceae   | 723$^{+228}_{-228}$ | 14.5$^{+2.1}_{-2.1}$ | 411            | 490               | 364           | 365             | 561             | 575      |
| Locality:|             |               |         |                |                   |              |                 |                 |          |

©2020 American Geophysical Union. All rights reserved.
Figure 1. The Clarkia fossil lagerstätte deposits. A map of the Miocene Clarkia Lake, near the town of Clarkia, Idaho (yellow star), with the two fossil localities studied here, P-33 and P-37, marked with red hexagons. Adapted after Geraghty (2017), and Smiley and Rember (1975).
Figure 2. Stratigraphy of the Clarkia fossil lagerstätte deposits. The relative stratigraphic position of the sedimentary outcrops at localities P-33 and P-37 are indicated, as well as the P-37 core, establishing the depth of the section. Ash layers used for tephrostratigraphic correlation indicated with multi-colored lines. Adapted after Geraghty (2017).
Figure 3. Fossil leaves from Clarkia. Two fossil leaves demonstrating the exquisite preservation of the Clarkia flora. A) A Lauraceae leaf, newly excavated in the field, showing the original red autumn color, B) Ostrya sp. leaf specimen between two acetate sheets, ready for analysis in the laboratory.
Figure 4. Clarkia MCO $pCO_2$ reconstruction results plotted for each proxy method at both localities, P-37 and P-33. SR = stomatal ratio, TF = transfer functions. Error bars show the 95% confidence interval. Red dashed line at 800 ppm illustrates the $pCO_2$ necessary to reproduce MCO temperatures in climate models (Goldner et al., 2014). Most reconstructed median $pCO_2$ plot in the 450–550 ppm interval.