Thermal performance of multilayer insulation: A review

Suthesh P M 1*, Alex Chollackal 2

1 Graduate Student
Department of Mechanical Engineering, St. Joseph’s College of Engineering and Technology, Palai, Kerala, India

2 Assistant Professor
Department of Mechanical Engineering, St. Joseph’s College of Engineering and Technology, Palai, Kerala, India

*E-mail: sutheeshpm@gmail.com

Abstract: A multilayer insulation (MLI) is a passive thermal protection system used in cryogenics and space exploration programs as a thermal insulator. It is very thin and light weight. Due to less weight and higher thermal performance of MLI, it found application in space programs to store cryogenic liquid propellant. The effective thermal conductivity of MLI is in the order of $10^{-5}$ W/mK. The prediction of heat transfer in MLI is very complex due to the anisotropic conductivity and combination of radiation, gas conduction and solid conduction modes of heat transfer. This work is an attempt to gather some significant research outcome in MLI performance prediction and the factors to be considered while modeling the MLI.

Key words: multilayer insulation, thermal protection system, thermal control

1. Introduction
MLI was introduced in 1950’s. It consist of multiple foils made of Kapton or Mylar coated with a highly reflective metal placed parallel to each other and low thermal conductive spacers are arranged in between the foils to avoid direct contact with the foils[1]. Radiation, solid conduction and gas conduction are the significant modes of heat transfer in MLI. Multilayer insulations are capable of maintaining hundreds of temperature gradient across a thin insulation. The effective thickness of a typical MLI is within few millimeters. MLI found application in storage of cryogenic fluids storage used for space missions as propellant. It is also used in MRI scanning systems to produce high intensity magnetic fields with the help of superconductivity. It also known as a passive thermal control system used in satellites to maintain the temperature of electronic equipment within the working temperature limit.

The radiation heat from the outer space strikes on the first reflective layer where a part is reflected back to the environment, and the remaining radiation energy heats up the first layer of spacer. As the temperature of the layer increases, solid conduction, gas conduction and radiation takes place through the spacer material to the next foil. Thus the second foil temperature will increase. The second foil reflects some radiation back to the first foil and the remaining energy transfers to the third foil. This process continues up to the bottom layer.
2. Developments in MLI
In the area of multilayer thermal insulation, large quantity of investigation result is generated over the last few decades. Experimental, numerical as well as combined work is being carried out with probable statistics as given in Figure 1. This work is an attempt to review the research progress in the performance of multilayer thermal insulation.

2.1 Experimental investigations
Bapat et al [3] conducted an experimental investigation in different combinations of spacer and shield material and compared with numerical model. The result shows that the combination of aluminized Mylar of 12μm thick and glass fabric of 76.2μm thick is the best for MLI. Wei et al [8] experimentally investigated the effect of structure and shape of perforated MLI blanket. A new calorimeter with spherical top and bottom is compared with a cylindrical calorimeter and found that 13% excess heat flux is transferred in new calorimeter. It is due to the “edge effect” formed by deformation of MLI. Thus it is concluded that shape and structure will affect the performance of MLI. A steady state experimental investigation is carried out by Sun et al [9] to measure the effect of interstitial gas...
pressure (degraded vacuum). In this experiment argon, air, nitrogen and carbon-dioxide are used as the interstitial gas. The experiment is carried out at different heat transfer condition ranging from free molecular to continuum regime with gas pressure ranges from $10^{-3}$-10$^5$ Pa by using a nitrogen boil-off instrument. The temperature is also varied from 77K to 300K. The energy accommodation coefficient (EAC) introduced by Kogan is the energy exchange between gas and surface which depends on the factors such as surface roughness, gas properties etc. It is calculated for the test gas. Result reveals that the apparent thermal conductivity will be higher at the hot boundary region than the cold boundary and this increase with increase in magnitude of vacuum.

Wesley [13] tested several MLI specimens to find the optimal layer density in Kennedy space Centre, NASA. But the experimental result shows an increase in layer density than the numerical prediction. It is due to the predominance of radiation which is avoided in the model. It is also suggested to use lower layer density for mass and heat load optimization. Heat pipes (HP) are also used in the thermal control system of spacecraft and satellites. They are used to dissipate the heat generated in the satellite electronic components [12]. Taig et al [14] used a phase change Material along with heat pipe to enhance the heat transfer rate from the internal components of satellites.

Thomas et al [17] used a calorimeter cryostat which is capable of measuring MLI performance at different temperatures. The low temperature cryogenic fluid (LHe) is passed through the test cylinder and the specimen wrapped around it. Thermal performance of high vacuum multilayer insulation (HVMLI) reduces due the leakage of fluid stored in the tank (hydrogen gas is considered). Small amount of nitrogen and oxygen present in between the layers affect the effectiveness of insulation. Getters are used in such case to absorb the gas present in HVMLI. Jian et al [23] compared a composite getter of CuO & C with usually used materials to absorb H$_2$ gas. It is found that CuO & C getter is a cost effective way of absorbing H$_2$ gas.

Figure 3. Comparison of heat flux variation with temperature (Sun’s [9] and Fesmire’s [24] data) and their trend lines.

Fesmire [24] developed a layered composite with aerogel for insulation of non-vacuum application such as space vehicles, propulsion test stand and launch pad and for cryogenic fluid transportation in Kennedy space center, NASA. Johnson et al [29] tested the transmissivity of MLI at very low temperature (2K) by using a laser based measuring system. The laser system directly measure the transmittance of MLI and emittance of aluminium single layer foil. It is found that there is no transmittance of energy through the foil corresponds to 2K. A cylindrical calorimeter is used by Fesmire et al [30] to test six different type of MLI. Conclusion is that different combination of MLI is available and the selection of best MLI depends on the application and design of MLI. Table 1 shows a brief idea of experimental investigations in MLI.
Table 1. Experimental investigators in MLI

| Author  | Parameter analyzed | MLI material | Comments |
|---------|--------------------|--------------|----------|
| Bapat   | Number of layers and layer density | Few indigenous materials | Thermal conductivity of MLI increases with increase in layer number |
| Wei     | Shape and structure | Double-face aluminum-coated terylene film with fiber paper spacer | Edge effect caused by shape and size leads to reduction in performance of MLI |
| Sun     | Degradation of air | Aluminized Mylar foil with vegetal super-thin fibrous spacer | The effective thermal conductivity increases with temperature and vacuum level |
| Johnson | Optimal layer density | ~ | Low layer density will be suitable for thermal and mechanical load optimization. |
| Thomas  | Performance at different temperatures | Double aluminized Mylar with Polyester spacer | Heat load is calculated at different time intervals |
| Wang    | Getters | ~ | CuO & C is the cost effective getter |
| Johnson | Transmissivity of MLI | Aluminium single layer foil | Three is no energy transmission through MLI at 2K |

2.2 Numerical investigations

Bapat et al [2] formulated a numerical model with combined conduction, radiation and gas conduction to predict the performance of MLI with double aluminized Mylar reflective foil and glass fabric spacer. The gas conduction increased with increase in layer density due to the increase in effective thermal conductivity of the insulation.

McIntosh [4] developed a general equation for optimizing heat flux through MLI using a computer program. He used helium as the interstitial gas having a pressure of 1.33E-5 Pa. The radiation heat transfer through MLI is given by

\[ Q/A = \sigma (T_w^4 - T_c^4)/(1/\varepsilon_w + 1/\varepsilon_c - 1) \]

Where, \( \sigma \) = Stephan-Boltzmann constant = 5.675E(-8) W/m\(^2\)·K\(^4\)

\( T_w \) = temperature of the warm surface, K

\( T_c \) = temperature of the cold surface, K

\( \varepsilon_w \) & \( \varepsilon_c \) are the warm and cold surface emissivities

The gas conduction equation is given by

\[ H = C_1 P \alpha (T_w - T_c) \]

\[ k_g = C_1 P \alpha \]

Where, \( k_g \) = gas conduction, W/m\(^2\)·K

\( P \) = gas pressure, Pa

\( C_1 = [(\gamma + 1)/(\gamma - 1)][R/8\pi M T]^{1/2} \)

\( \alpha \) = accommodation coefficient

\( \gamma = C_p/C_v \)

\( R \) = gas constant, 8.31441 J/mol·K

\( M \) = molecular weight of gas, kg/mol

\( T \) = temperature of vacuum gauge, normally 300 K

The solid conduction equation is given by

\[ H = C_1 P \alpha (T_w - T_c) \]
ks = C2 \frac{f k}{\Delta X} \\
ks = \text{the solid conductivity per unit thickness, } \text{W/m}^2\text{K} \\
C2 = \text{an empirical constant} \\
f = \text{relative density of the separator compared to solid material} \\
k = \text{separator material thermal conductivity, } \text{W/mK} \\
\Delta X = \text{actual thickness of separator between reflectors, m}

These equations are capable of predicting the performance of MLI with a variety of materials by using a computer application like Microsoft Excel. The result concluded that higher layer density near the warm layer can create better performance.

Alifanov et al [10] calculated the thermal and radiative properties such as thermal conductance and emissivity by measuring the temperature and heat flux by inverse problem method. Mavromatidis et al [11] studied the effect of air gaps between wall and MLI. The test MLI is placed between two wooden walls maintaining a small gap. It is found that the thermal resistance is maximum when the air gap is 3cm. Gongan et al [16] designed a 3D model of lightweight thermal protection system (TPS). A corrugated core sandwiched panel is generated using ANSYS and is subjected to mechanical and thermal loads by using ANSYS parametric design language (APDL) codes. The APDL along with GCMMA algorithm is used for the optimization of minimum weight TPS. 37% lighter TPS is obtained after optimization. But the mechanical loads such as transverse load and in-plane mechanical compressive loads are not considered in the optimization procedure.

**Table 2. Numerical investigators in MLI**

| Author   | Model                                      | Comments                                                   |
|----------|--------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|
| Bapat [2] | Combined conduction, radiation and gas conduction | The gas conduction will increases with increase in layer density |
| McIntosh [4] | Conduction, radiation and gas conduction | The equation can be used for optimization by using a computer program |
| Alifanov [10] | Inverse problem method | Calculated the properties of MLI |
| Gongan [16] | 3D model of lightweight thermal protection system | 37% lighter TPS is created through optimization by APDL & GCMMA algorithm |
| Tigwu [20] | Conduction, radiation and gas conduction | Calculated 2D temperature distribution inside MLI. Increase in number of layer will increase the performance of MLI up to a limit. |
| Dye [22] | Discrete spacer | Low area to length ratio spacer reduces conduction heat transfer |
| Zhan[25] | Quasi steady state | Compared MLI and foam insulation |
| Xie [26] | Transient heat transfer | MLI with phase change material will increase its performance |

Tingwu et al [20] numerically investigated the influence of factors such as emissivity, thickness, density layout, location and number of the foils, the density of materials and the emissivity of foils. It has been found that the best performance is achieved at a particular number of layers (18 layers). If the number of layer increases the overall conductivity of the insulation increases due to the domination of highly conductive metallic foils. Dye et al [22] designed a wrapped MLI with new discrete spacers having low area to length ratio to reduce the conduction heat transfer.
Zhan et al [25] compared the thermal performance of form and MLI in a cryogenic liquid hydrogen tank. Quasi steady state model is used for the analysis process. MLI performance is higher than form at higher temperature where the radiation heat transfer is predominant. The performance of MLI can be improved by introducing the phase change material at the middle layer [26]. But the performance enhancement fails if the phase change material is at the bottom of the insulation.

Paola et al [27] developed a design criterion for increasing the effectiveness of multilayered wall insulation for building insulation. Table 2 shows a brief idea of numerical investigation in MLI.

2.3 Combined experimental and numerical investigations

Many researchers used combined numerical simulation and experimental works to verify and improve the accuracy in predicting the performance of MLI.

Krishnaprakas et al [5] compared the experimental data of heat flux with four empirical models such as conductance (h-effective-model), effective emittance (\(\varepsilon_{\text{eff}}\)-model), Conduction-radiation (CR-model) and Cunnington and Tien (CT-model). It has been concluded that the CT-model can be used to predict the heat flux accurately. Markus et al [6] studied the thermal performance of MLI with porous and fibrous materials which are capable of absorbing, emitting and scattering the radiation. Ohmori [7] introduced a dimensionless contact pressure, \(P^*\) in wrapped MLI which is independent of specific weight of foil and radius of cylinder. There is high dependence of MLI performance with the contact pressure.

| Author          | Numerical                              | Experimental                     | Comments                                      |
|-----------------|----------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|
| Krishnaprakas   | Thermal performance prediction by different models | Heat flux is determined           | Cunnington and Tien (CT) model can estimates heat flux accurately |
| [5]             |                                        |                                   |                                               |
| Huang           | Finite volume method & inverse problem method | Thermal conductivity is measured  | Slight variation between experimental and numerical data |
| [15]            |                                        |                                   |                                               |
| Haim            | Conductivity of nitrogen               | Thermal conductivity of spacer particle | Contribution of spacer particle in heat transfer is very low |
| [19]            |                                        |                                   |                                               |

Huang et al [15] generated a theoretical model with FVM for analyzing the behavior of high temperature MLI by using inverse problem method. The thermal conductivity of the material is experimentally calculated. The theoretical model shows 4% deviation from the experimental thermal conductivity. Takeshi et al [18] developed a new type of small discrete non-interlayer-contact spacer MLI (NICSMLI) made of polyetheretherketone (PEEK) for SPICA satellite. A/L (area to length ratio) of spacer is \(10^{-4}\)m. Haim et al [19] tested an annular MLI having stainless steel coaxial foils. 50\(\mu\)m spherical zirconia particle is used as the spacer material which is dispersed in between foils with nitrogen. The overall conductivity of annular MLI shows that the contribution of heat transfer through the particle is very low at vacuum condition.

Nast et al [21] tested MLI in large Dewar tanks. A simulation model is presented to measure the cryogenic fluid boil off and thermal conductivity of MLI. The test results are used for designing large propellant tanks for NASA. Wang et al [28] tested MLI with Dacron net and fiber cloth as spacer material with different layer density. The heat transfer rate will be comparatively large in fiber cloth than Dacron net due to the higher contact area in the cloth. Table 3 shows significant works of combined experimental and numerical investigation in MLI. Also, Figure 4 portrays the comparison of Nast [21] and Wang [28] data for variation of heat flux with temperature.
3. Conclusions
This review has provided concise summary of investigations on MLI. Based on the studies, MLI is an important insulating material in the field of cryogenic and space industry. The performance prediction of MLI with minimum error is a crucial step in the design of TPS for spacecraft. The performance of MLI is affected by many factors such as contact pressure, boundary temperature, interstitial gas and its pressure etc. Numerical models and simulation software are helpful in analyzing MLI. The experimental method does not match with the exact working condition of MLI in space, but the experimental data can be used to predict the performance of MLI. The use of MLI helps to reduce energy consumption for pumping of heat and heat removal.

4. References
[1] Meseguer J, Perez G and Sanz A 2012 Spacecraft thermal control (Cambridge : woodhead publishing limited) chapter 7 pp 111-118
[2] Bapat S L, Narayankhedkar K G and Lukose T R 1990 Experimental investigations of multilayer Insulation Cryogenics 1990 Vol 30
[3] Bapat S L, Narayankhedkar K G and Lukose T R 1990 Performance prediction of multilayer insulation Cryogenics Vol 30
[4] McIntosh G E Layer by layer mli calculation using a separated mode equation Cryogenic Technical SeWices Inc. pp 1683-1690
[5] Krishnaprakas C K, Badari N K and Pradip D 2000 Heat transfer correlations for multilayer insulation systems Cryogenics Vol 40 pp 431-435
[6] Markus S, Edgar R and Raymond Viskanta 2004 Studies on high-temperature multilayer thermal insulations IJHMT Volume 47 Issues 6–7 pp 1305-1312
[7] Ohmori T 2006 Thermal performance of multilayer insulation around a horizontal cylinder. Cryogenics 45 pp725–732
[8] Wei W, Xiangdong L, Rongshun W and Yang L 2009 Effects of structure and shape on thermal performance of Perforated Multi-Layer Insulation Blankets App Therm Engg 29 pp 1264–1266
[9] P J Sun, J Y Wu, P Zhang, L Xu and M L Jiang 2009 Experimental study of the influences of degraded vacuum on multilayer insulation blankets Cryogenics 49 pp 719–726
[10] O M Alifanov, A V Nenarokomov and V M Gonzalez 2009 Study of multilayer thermal
insulation by inverse problems method \textit{Acta Astronautica} 65 pp 1284–1291

[11] L E Mavromatidis, A Bykalyuk, Mohamed E M, P Michel and M Santamouris 2012 Numerical estimation of air gap’s influence on the insulating performance of multilayer thermal insulation, \textit{Building and Environment} 49 pp 227-237

[12] Philippe G, Qing M, Tao Y, Peter S, Laurent G, Pierre T and Jingtao L 2011 Thermal behavior of a cryogenic loop heat pipe for space application \textit{Cryogenics} 51 pp 420–428

[13] Wesley J 2012 Thermal analysis of low layer density multilayer insulation test results \textit{AIP Conference Proceedings} pp 1434- 1519

[14] Taig Y, Bum S, Jang J and Juhun R 2013 Numerical study of the spacecraft thermal control hardware combining solid–liquid phase change material and a heat pipe \textit{Aerospace Sci and Tech} 27 pp 10–16

[15] Huang C and Zhang Y 2014 Calculation of High-temperature Insulation Parameters and Heat Transfer Behaviors of Multilayer Insulation by Inverse Problems Method \textit{Chines journal of aeronautics} 27 pp 10-16

[16] Gongnan X, Qi W, Bengt and Weihong Z 2013 Thermodinamic optimization of lightweight thermal protection system under aerodynamic heating \textit{Appl Therm Engg} 59 pp 425-434

[17] Thomas F and Christoph H 2014 A calorimeter for measurements of multilayer insulation at variable cold temperature 25th International Cryo Engg Conference and the International Cryogenic Materials Conference. \textit{Physics Procedia} 67 pp 1062–1067

[18] Takeshi M, Ryuta H, Hiroyuki S, Masanori S and Tomoyuki H 2014 Development of a new multi-layer insulation blanket with non-interlayer-contact spacer for space cryogenic mission \textit{Cryogenics}

[19] Y Haim, Y Weiss and R Letan 2014 Effect of spacers on the thermal performance of an annular multi-layer Insulation \textit{Applied Thermal Engineering} 65 pp 418-421

[20] Tingwu J, Ruiping Z, BengtSunden and Gongnan X 2014 Investigation on thermal performance of high temperature multilayer insulations for hypersonic vehicles under aerodynamic heating condition \textit{Applied Thermal Engineering} 70 pp 957-965

[21] Nast T C, Frank D J and Feller J 2014 Multilayer insulation considerations for large propellant tanks \textit{Cryogenics}

[22] Dye S A, Tyler P N, Mills G L and Kopelove A B 2014 Wrapped multilayer insulation design and testing \textit{Cryogenics} 64 pp 100–104

[23] Jian W, Ying Z, Wei W, Shujun C and Rongshun W 2016 A new cost effective composite getter for application in high-vacuum-multilayer insulation tank \textit{Vacuum}

[24] J Fesmire 2015 Layered composite thermal insulation system for nonvacuum cryogenic Applications \textit{Cryogenics}

[25] Zhan L, Yanzhong L, Fushou X and Ke Z 2016 Thermal performance of foam/MLI for cryogenic liquid hydrogen tank during the ascent and on orbit perio \textit{Appl Therm Engg} 98 pp 430–439

[26] Tao Xie, Ya-Ling He and Zi Xiang Tong 2016 Analysis of insulation performance of multilayer thermal insulation doped with phase change material \textit{IJHMT} 102 pp 934–943

[27] Paola G, Claudia G, Luca E and Francesco A 2016 Design criteria for improving insulation effectiveness of multilayer walls \textit{IJHMT} 103 pp 349–359

[28] Wang, Huang Y, Li P, Sun P, Chen Z and Wu J 2016 Optimization of variable density multilayer insulation for cryogenic application and experimental validation \textit{Cryogenics} 80 pp 154–163

[29] Johnson W L, Van Dresar N T, Chato D J and Demers J R 2017 Transmissivity Testing of Multilayer Insulation at Cryogenic Temperatures \textit{Cryogenics}

[30] Fesmirea J E and Johnsonb W L 2018 Cylindrical cryogenic calorimeter testing of six types of multilayer insulation Systems, \textit{Cryogenics} 89 pp 58–75