How Does Social Media Affect Money Politics Campaign Rejection in the 2020 Regional Head General Election Social Media? A Case Study of Indonesia

Misran¹(✉), Achmad Nurmandi¹, Dyah Mutiarin¹, Suswanta¹, and Salahudin²
¹ Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
misranalbari@gmail.com
² Department of Government Studies, Social and Political Science Faculty, Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, Malang, Indonesia

Abstract. The integrity of the regional head elections process in Indonesia has become a concern for the government and the Indonesian people. Thus, to realize regional head elections with integrity, the implementation must be free from various types of violations such as election malpractice. One of the election violations that often appear in every regional head election is the practice of money politics. This paper intends to explain the election supervisory body in preventing money politics in regional head election contestation. This research’s data sources included: website, Twitter, and previous research related to money politics. The data were obtained using the Ncapture feature in the Nvivo 12 plus where the Ncapture feature is a web browser extension developed to capture web content in the form of the website content, social media, and other document content such as scientific articles and a collection of opinions from observers about money politics in Indonesia. This paper reveals that social media is a new transformation for election supervisory bodies to disseminate and prevent money politics. The authors also need to emphasize that this time is money politics itself because democracy/general election parties in any part of the world require money/capital both by the organizers and election participants themselves, so a common understanding is needed. What and how money politics can be categorized as an action. Election violations and even fall into the category of election crimes. This paper is reviewed based on an analysis of scientific articles and each election organizer’s official Twitter accounts.

Keywords: Social media · Money politics · Local elections · Democracy

1 Introduction

The development of democratic processes in various parts of the world from time to time shows that free, transparent, and fair regional head elections are the foundation
for strengthening healthy democracy. According to one publication of the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (IDEA) in a book entitled Improving Electoral Practices: Case Studies and Practical Approaches, it fulfills this need for strengthening democracy. The election process must be based on two basic standards: credibility and integrity. Both the regional head elections organizers’ credibility and integrity are organizing the elections [1].

In realizing regional head elections with integrity, the process of organizing Regional head elections must be free from various kinds of violations in regional head Elections malpractice or what is also known as electoral malpractice. One form of election violations that often arises is the practice of money politics. This money politics affects the outcome of the regional head elections, determining the election results’ quality and integrity. If money politics continues, it is sure that people will feel the harmful effects. Democracy will only be a land for mediocre people, namely those who do not have sufficient achievements to gain power.

Another issue that the authors need to emphasize in his writing this time is money politics itself because democracy/general election parties in any part of the world require money/capital both by the organizers and election participants themselves, so a common understanding is needed. What and how can money politics be categorized as an action? Election violations fall into the category of election crimes. For example, during the campaign period, regional elections participants are given time and space to carry out open campaigns and large numbers of people. On the other hand, when the people come to the campaign venue, the election participants are given a sum of money. This condition is then called money politics activities.

Excellent and correct confirmation is needed from the above phenomena through the election organizer, namely the election supervisory board. The election supervisory board acts as a partner providing political education to the public by involving political parties to educate the public about preventing money politics from implementing clean and honest regional elections. This paper is prepared to explain the election oversight body in preventing money politics in elections through social media on Twitter accounts. Furthermore, this research has not studied much about social media use in preventing fraudulent practices, especially money politics.

2 Literature Review

2.1 Social Media

Social media is a modern technology application in which many features facilitate the interaction and communication between individuals (personal communication) and groups with groups (group communication) that take place across time and space [2]. Social Media’s emergence has further revolutionized digital platforms’ capacity to allow for constant interaction and cooperation, bringing their voices to the broader public. According to Cangara, “media is a tool or means used to convey messages from communicators to the public [3]. In Shirky’s view, social media provides ample space for everyone to convey their ideas and opinions to show their voice through social media [4]. It is generally assumed that social media plays a crucial role in disseminating political groups’ information and claims [5].
Through social media, communication and human interaction can occur at any time and anywhere, where everyone has access to build communication and interaction with all parties in various kinds of matters, including business affairs and socio-political affairs [4]. Social media is no longer only a virtual world but turns things of protest, criticism, and disappointment into the real world [6].

Even though social media is entirely given full freedom of opinion, the media also presents alternatives in shaping public opinion and a medium for interaction between parties and politicians and their constituents [7]. Social media has five essential aspects: public participation, openness, communication, community development, and connectivity between social media users [8]. These five aspects are an essential part of social media directly related to human life in various forms of affairs in this modern era.

Users can optimally manipulate themselves through social media through text, graphics, or audio-visual [6]. Social media platforms are used effectively by the community in several ways, such as through blogs and sharing educational videos, updates, and academic documents [9]. According to the latest social media statistics, more than 2 billion Facebook users, more than 300 million Twitter users, more than 500 million Google users, and more than 400 million [9]. The emergence of the internet and social media has allowed the enforcement of community norms to have a central role in upholding justice by expanding the enforcement tools available to the community and increasing these tools’ effectiveness [10]. Therefore, social media is an agent of political socialization in today’s society [11].

Research on the use of new media is growing. Likewise, the debate about new media’s effectiveness to support social change has yet to conclude at the academic level. However, as Radloff stated in the journal Feminist Africa Women Mobilized, the internet and other related tools can be useful for resistance, social mobilization, and development in the hands of people or organizations working for freedom and justice [12].

2.2 Local Elections

As an archipelagic country, Indonesia consists of 13,466 islands with 34 provinces divided into 416 districts and 96 cities with their own regional/autonomous government system. As a country with a democratic autonomous government system, holding the regional head/regional head elections manifests its democratic character [13]. 2015 is the first time Indonesia has held a new form of regional election simultaneously. The 2015 Regional Head Elections is indeed different from the previous regional head elections [10]. The simultaneous regional elections are certainly far different from the previous ones, where the elections were held during the COVID-19 pandemic. The regional election system was implemented simultaneously to condense electoral fraud [14]. This condition will lead to various speculations related to Regional Head Elections’ safety and prevention [15]. Mapping of shifts after political marketing was used in the 2015 regional head elections, based on information from the Election Supervisory Board (Banwaslu) [16]. The information states, election fraud cases have increased compared to last year’s election. On the other hand, there is increasing evidence that many regional elections are not under the second-order election approach [17].

Like general elections held based on the manifestation of the principle of equality before the law and equal opportunity in government (equal opportunity principle),
regional head elections is also a process of succession to the transition of a regional leader that involves the real role of the public or the people in sovereignty.

Regional Head Elections is an activity of a democratic process that cannot be separated from the implementation of elections because Regional Head Elections has output, namely political officials (elected official), not electing administrative officials (appointed official) [18]. In the context of democracy, the dynamics of politics and local governance like this will determine the face of Indonesian democracy nationally. Therefore, the simultaneous regional elections are also accessed for the public to participate more widely, gathering much trust in prospective candidates.

2.3 Money Politics

In general, money politics is a term that describes the use of money or other rewards to influence a person, group, or institution in making political decisions [19]. In general, money politics can be understood as electoral mobilization by giving money, gifts, or goods to voters to throw in the election. Money politics in elections requires many ways and stages. Among them is political dowry at the candidacy stage, vote-buying and selling at the campaign stage, and voting. This condition includes bribes to election administrators during the counting and recapitulation stages of votes to improvements in dispute resolution over election results.

Several studies refer to money politics in political distribution theory, divided into two forms [20]. First, specific money politics refers to a retail strategy for buying and selling votes (vote-buying). In terms of time, it is usually carried out before the election or what we know as “dawn attacks.” Sometimes prepay before election day. Sometimes postpaid after support is provided. Second, a more long-term, collective, and wholesale money policy strategy abuses programmatic policies such as social assistance or grants or electoral interests. The public does not realize the dangers of money politics in political life in the future. It is even considered mediocre, so there is no effort to avoid money politics [21]. Money politics is an instant medium where constituent votes can be bought [22].

In the administration of democracy, it is always dirty in harmful ways. Money politics is not only at the central government level but also reaches areas far from the center. It has been expected and done openly, such as infrastructure donations, road repairs, renovation of social facilities, or everyone getting money, so they have to participate in elections and vote [22]. The practice of money politics is common in Indonesian society.

Money is the source of society’s most needed power, which refers to every transaction or individual [23]. During elections throughout the country, it is complicated to avoid the practice of money politics. According to Hamid, who sees it from an economic perspective, money politics arises because of the reciprocal relationship between actors (parties, politicians, or intermediaries) and victims [24].

3 Method

The approach used in this research was a descriptive qualitative approach that described the phenomenon of the election supervisory body in preventing money politics in the
regional head general election contest. Descriptive analysis in this study used NVivo 12 plus software. This research’s data sources included: website, Twitter, and previous research related to money politics. The data were obtained using the Ncapture feature in the NVivo 12 plus where the N capture feature is a web browser extension developed to capture web content in the form of the website content, social media, and other document content such as scientific articles and a collection of opinions from observers about money politics. The NVivo 12 plus analysis used the Chart analysis feature, Word cloud, Cluster analysis, and Chart analysis. Cluster analysis was used to visualize and collect data/words with similarities and differences. This study looked at the similarities and differences in the tweets of organizational groups. Chart analysis was used for charts to study, process data in research, and answer analysis in the form of N capture; meanwhile, Word cloud analysis listed words or concepts that often appear in research files to visualize and collect data/words that have similarities and differences.

Table 1. Twitter accounts, websites, and media online

| Institution     | account | Websites                          | Media online                          |
|-----------------|---------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Bawaslu RI      | @Bawaslu RI | https://www.bawaslu.go.id/          | https://www.kompas.com/tag/website    |
|                 |         |                                   | www.detik.com, www.republikaonline.com, cnn.com |

This study aims to see the prevention of money politics in a regional head election. This study will answer two questions: RQ1: How does the Election Supervisory Agency use social media? RQ2: How are the Election Supervisory Agency and Regional Election Supervisory Agency related?

4 Result and Discussion

In the 21st century, social media is growing every day, and people use social media for personal and professional use. In Shirky’s view, social media provides ample space for everyone to convey their ideas and opinions to show their voice through social media [25]. According to Cangara, “media is a tool or means used to convey messages from communicators to the public [3]. Social media is no longer a virtual world, but it shifts protests, criticism, and disappointment into the real-world [6]. The use of Twitter in Indonesia has enormous potential. This situation shows a significant number, even the CEO of Twitter himself said that Indonesia plays a central role in business travel on Twitter [26]. Therefore, Twitter accounts have a part in the distribution era to accelerate information delivery to the public. Seeing this potential, the Election Supervisory Agency uses the Twitter account as a tool to socialize prevention of money politics.

Figure 1 shows the data from the Twitter account of @Bawaslu RI. The first tweet was done in January 2017. The most vulnerable time to tweet was April-March 2020. The @Bawaslu RI account’s tendency to post content was more frequently on the vulnerable
time between January-March and July-September 2020. If traced more deeply, June and December coincided with the Regional Heads Election. This situation affected the density of information provided by the election supervisory body through social media and one way for the Election Supervisory Agency to disseminate supervision to the public, also avoid money politics attacks and protect their voting rights. By socializing with the community, they were helped by updated information through social media on Twitter.

Furthermore, the foreign minister will see the extent to which the @Bawaslu RI accounts use social media based on frequently discussed topics. The authors used the word cloud feature found in NVivo 12 Plus software. Word cloud is included in the tag word application category, which is used to learn about the number and types of topics in the text body [27]. Besides, it used a tag cloud to describe text content that develops over time. Typically, this statistical overview is achieved by positively correlating the font size of the described tags with word frequency [27] (Fig. 2).

Based on the visualization of the word cloud results from the social media account @Bawaslu RI (see Fig. 3), placing the phrase Bawaslu, #Sahabatbawaslu, #Bawaslujagahakpilih, and #bawaslumengawasi as words that are often used in every tweet. At a glance, there are taglines #Sahabatbawaslu and #Bawaslumengawasi as words that have great visualization. Other words with a large enough visualization include #bawaslujagahakpilih, #bawasluterbuka, #Pilkada today, #Pemiluterpercaya, #cegahwasitindaki, and other terms. However, statistically, each story that has been visualized has a value according to how often the sentence appears in the tweet. The data for Word Frequency shows the words that dominate the delivery of information to @Bawaslu RI (see Fig. 3). According to the content and purpose of delivering the information, the classification becomes the movement’s variable to reject money politics. Content that dominates #Sahabatbawaslu, #Bawaslujagahakpilih, and #bawaslumengawasi (Table 2).

Table 1 displays the value of each visualized word from the @Bawaslu Ri account. Of the 100 words that were envisioned, the authors took the largest 20 words, which
How Does Social Media Affect Money Politics Campaign Rejection

Fig. 2. The topic of conversation on the Twitter account @Bawaslu RI

became the topic of conversation. The authors believe that the @Bawaslu RI account focuses more on reporting related to actual conditions, seen from several suitable words to describe this, such as #Sahabatbawaslu, #Bawaslamengawasi. Said, prevent, watch action confirming that the @Bawaslu RI account will often provide information via Twitter during the conditions leading up to the regional elections to avoid money politics practices.

Furthermore, the authors conducted a cluster analysis related to the @Bawaslu RI account using the word similarity feature. It is done to visualize the patterns in this study by classifying the sources of sharing similar words. It will be easier to determine an account’s information distribution pattern and simultaneously visualize the report’s interactions.

Based on the cluster results above, the @Bawaslu RI account’s information dissemination has words with other accounts. Where these accounts have the same duties and functions, namely preventing money politics. The tendency of the @Bawaslu RI account to be accountable with other accounts that are also part of the KPU, Komendagri, Electoral House, Dkpp Ri, Bawaslu Riau, Bawaslu Pangkep, Bawaslu Makassar, Bawaslu Central Java, Bawaslu East Jakarta, Bawaslu Banten, Bawaslu Tuban, Bawaslu South Jakarta, Bawaslu West Java. Besides, information about the @Bawaslu RI account spread to local media, namely News CNN Daily, Radielshinta.

The analysis of tweet intensity @Bawaslu RI provides educational information about harassment and monitoring related to election violations. In offering information, @Bawaslu RI links tweets with other accounts. The information provided by @Bawaslu RI is only brief information. The public must first access the report and website to get a complete feature. The authors believe that this method can maximize the information channels by @Bawaslu RI. However, on the one hand, connecting to other information channels to local media can speed up the distribution of the information provided.
Table 2. The frequency of the word @Bawaslu RI account

| Word                          | Length | Count |
|-------------------------------|--------|-------|
| Bawaslu                       | 7      | 2255  |
| #sahabatbawaslu               | 15     | 846   |
| #bawasljagahakpilih           | 20     | 229   |
| #bawaslumengawasi             | 17     | 585   |
| # bawasluterbuka              | 15     | 148   |
| Pilkada                       | 7      | 438   |
| #Pemiluterpercaya             | 16     | 112   |
| #pemilutepercaya              | 16     | 112   |
| #cegahawasitindaki            | 17     | 106   |
| #salamawas                    | 10     | 56    |
| pemungutan                    | 10     | 51    |
| awasi                         | 5      | 54    |
| mengawasi                     | 9      | 72    |
| laporan                       | 7      | 90    |
| demokrasi                     | 9      | 114   |
| dugaan                        | 6      | 53    |
| penyelesaian                  | 12     | 56    |
| @kpu                          | 4      | 113   |
| kampanye                      | 8      | 113   |
| politik                       | 7      | 165   |

Fig. 3. Account Connectivity and Interaction and Resist money politics
Social media characteristics, which tend to be instantaneous in obtaining information, are why people tend to be more interested in accessing information through social media. Furthermore, when people access information requiring entry on the website, it will increase community participation and add much information. Community involvement on social media platforms makes it possible for the government to use it as a policy basis [28].

In the analysis using the word cloud, the @Bawaslu RI account topic related to the condition of the Election Supervisory Agency. The topic stating that the Election Supervisory Agency oversees people’s voting rights to be purchased, and Regional Head Elections prevents and acts on social media, allowing the Election Supervisory Agency to socialize and educate and the effectiveness of their preparedness communication to follow up actions money politic. The authors argue that the Election Supervisory Agency has had the advantage and transformation in preventing and campaigning against money politics using social media. According to Brandt, Bendler, & Neumann, social media analysis can capture campaign patterns related to user elections and environmental involvement based on the discussion. In the cluster analysis, the @Bawaslu RI account has healthy patterns of interaction and communication with institutions. Like [29], social media allows for real-time interaction between government and society. Clarke also emphasizes that social media can also increase the effectiveness in overcoming the problem of practices that violate the rules in the elections [30]. The authors argue that ideally, communication carried out in social media is two-way, making it possible for the actors to exchange information, either the government to the community, or vice versa. This statement is in line with what Nabatchi stated regarding public communication [31]. He noted that two-way communication facilitates the two actors to be both givers and to receive information. Lee & Hoon also stated that two-way communication is the ideal model of public communication. Ideally, the distribution of information is not limited to other government accounts. It will be better if the information distribution also touches the community level to the bottom [32].

5 Conclusion

The efforts made by the Election Supervisory Agency (Bawaslu Ri) are one of the right ways in the current era of disruption and transformation. By leveraging on-going information and communication technology, election supervisors are needed to succeed in a brave world—especially social media, whose users are increasing all the time. The election supervisory agency has made a new transformation or breakthrough because it has used social media as a forum for socialization.

This paper contributes to the finding that social media is the easiest and most effective way to socialize money politics. Several findings were presented to prove that election supervisors succeeded in disseminating money politics through social media. Social media’s strength lies in the number of users and the short time to share. Accessers on social media, at one point, act as spectators, but at other times can convey information. The sharing method (share) allows everyone to expand the reach of information circulating in new media. Until finally, a large number can be achieved in a relatively short time. The invasion of hashtags, creative general election supervisory agency, and
many followers are several strategies to gather social media strength. This power has the potential to prevent money politics. This paper also contributes to the general election supervisory mapping network in the 2020 regional head election contest. The findings provide a new picture of general election supervisors’ development in disseminating the prevention of money politics. This paper describes the map of the Bawaslu Ri movement towards other institutions in preventing money politics.

This paper has limitations on the applied data analysis approach. Namely, data analysis has not described the triangulation analysis between qualitative and quantitative data. For this reason, the issue of money politics needs to be studied more deeply through mixed-method research that focuses on the study of the behavior of the political elite in each contestation and the implications of money politics for the future in Indonesia.

References

1. International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance, Improving Electoral Practices: Case Studies and Practical Approaches (2014)
2. Syahputra, I.: Expressions of hatred and the formation of spiral of anxiety on social media in Indonesia. Search (Malays.) 11(1), 95–112 (2019)
3. Ike, A.R., dan Maksudi, B.I.: The role of social media in the improvement of selected participation of students based on students in bogor regency, vol. 20, no. 2, pp. 154–161 (2018)
4. Rahmawati, D.: Media Sosial Dan Demokrasi Di Era Informasi. J. Vokasi Indones. 2(2), 3–4 (2016). https://doi.org/10.7454/jvi.v2i2.40
5. Outhwaite, W., Turner, S., Calderaro, A.: Social media and politics. In: The SAGE Handbook of Political Sociology: Two Volume Set, no. May, pp. 781–795 (2018). https://doi.org/10.4135/9781526416513.n46
6. Jauhari, M.: Media Sosial: Hiperealitas dan Simulacra Perkembangan Masyarakat Zaman Now dalam Pemikiran Jean Baudrillard. J. AL,’Adalah 20(1), 117–136 (2017)
7. Hasan, K.: Bahan ajar handout Komunikasi Politik NEW MEDIA DAN KOMUNIKASI POLITIK KONTEMPORER 1, p. 13 (2015)
8. Rossi, A., Lestari, T., Perdana, R.S., Fauzi, M.A.: Analisis Sentimen Tentang Opini Pilkada Dki 2017 Pada Dokumen Twitter Berbahasa Indonesia Menggunakan Naïve Bayes dan Pembobotan Emoji, vol. 1, no. 12 (2017)
9. Arshad, M., Akram, M.S.: International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning Social Media Adoption by the Academic Community: Theoretical Insights and Empirical Evidence From Developing Countries Social Media Adoption by the Academic Community: Theoretical Insights, vol. 19, no. 3 (2018)
10. Fish, G.: Social justice and social media: responding to the enforcement of justice by the internet community. Mich. Law Rev. (2017)
11. Octafitria, Y.: Media Sosial Sebagai Agen Sosialisasi Politik Pada Kaum Muda Yovita Octafitria. Indones. J. Sociol. Educ. Policy (2014)
12. Barus, R.K.: Pemberdayaan Perempuan melalui Media Sosial. Simbolika 1(2), 113–123 (2015). No. September
13. Sadiqi, F.: Morocco’s Emerging Democracy: The 2015 Local and Regional Elections, no. 83, pp. 0–4 (2015)
14. Amrizal, D.: Model Countermeasures of Golput (Election Abstainers) Based on Change of Voters’ Behavior in Simultaneous Regional Elections in Sumatera Utara, no. April 2018
15. Hilman, Y.A., Khoirurrosyidin, K., Lestarini, N.: Peta Politik Pemilukada Kabupaten Ponorogo 2020 di Tengah Pandemi Covid-19. Polit. J. Ilmu Polit. 2(2), 129–148 (2020). https://doi.org/10.15575/politicon.v2i2.8983

16. Coco, R.G., Guasch, C.M.: Demonstrations about the public transportation in Brazil: A different reading from the great Florianópolis case, in Santa Catarina State. Scr. November 2016. https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-84955569341&partnerID=40&md5=97ea31c66ce6129e273c46424889ca7

17. Cabeza, L.: ‘First-order thinking’ in second-order contests: a comparison of local, regional and European elections in Spain. Elect. Stud. 53, 29–38 (2018). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.electstud.2018.03.004

18. Chaniago, P.S.: Evaluasi Pilkada Pelaksanaan Pilkada Serentak Tahun 2015. Polit. Indones. Indones. Polit. Sci. Rev. 1(2), 196 (2016). https://doi.org/10.15294/jpi.v1i2.6585

19. Kusmanto, H.K., Prayitno, H.J., Ngali, A., Rahmawati, L.E.: Realisasi Kesantunan Berkomunikasi Pada Media Sosial Instagram @Jokowi: Studi Politikopragmatik. PARAFRASE J. Kaji. Kebahasaan Kesastraan 19(2), 119–130 (2019). https://doi.org/10.30996/parafrase.v19i2.2648

20. Muhtadi, B.: Politik Uang dan New Normal dalam Pemilu Paska-Orde Baru. Integritas J. Antikorupsi 5(1), 55–74 (2019). https://journal.kpk.go.id/index.php/integritas/article/view/413

21. Harianto, S., Rahardjo, M., Baru, B.M.: Politik Uang (Money Politic), Dan Pengaruhnya Terhadap Demokrasi Dalam Pemilihan Kepala Desa. J. Sos. 19(2018). https://unmermadiun.ac.id/ejurnal/index.php/sosial/article/view/362/565

22. Solihah, R.: Politik transaksional dalam pilkada serentak dan implikasinya bagi pemerintahan daerah di indonesia, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 97–109 (2016)

23. Mokodompis, S., Bukido, R., Salim, D.P., Makka, M.M.: Money politic in elections: islamic law perspective. J. Ilm. Al-Syir’ah 16(2), 126 (2018). https://doi.org/10.30984/jis.v16i2.708

24. Prpkn, P.S., Adi, A.S.: HUBUNGAN PENERIMAAN MONEY POLITIC DENGAN TINGKAT PARTISIPASI JATIKALEN KABUPATEN NGANJUK Keyword: Keywords: acceptance of money politics , the level of political participation (2016)

25. Wulan, I.K., Arief, Y.S., Kristiawati, K.: The relationship of mother behavior in breastfeeding with baby’s nutrition status aged 0–6 months. Eurasian J. Biosci. 14(1), 2507–2512 (2020). https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85093902030&partnerID=40&md5=16b9a999e71f504d6725a8dd8655117

26. Pratiwi, F.I.: The Role of Identity in Politics and Policy (Issue November). no. November (2019)

27. Heimerl, F., Lohmann, S., Lange, S., Ertl, T.: Word cloud explorer: text analytics based on word clouds. In: Proceedings of the Annual Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences, pp. 1833–1842 (2014). https://doi.org/10.1109/HICSS.2014.231

28. Nurmandi, A., et al.: To what extent is social media used in city government policymaking? Case studies in three asean cities. Public Policy Adm. 17(4), 600–618 (2018). https://doi.org/10.13165/VPA-18-17-4-08

29. Clarke, A., Margetts, H.: Governments and citizens getting to know each other? Open, closed, and big data in public management reform. Policy Internet 6(4), 393–417 (2014). https://doi.org/10.1002/1944-2866.POI377

30. Allen, R., Nakonechnyi, A., Benedetti, M.S.: Anna’s story: how a ukrainian orphan’s acquisition of second language transformed her life. J. Cogn. Educ. Psychol. 19(2), 107–119 (2020). https://doi.org/10.1891/JCEP-D-19-00044
31. Schmidthuber, L., Ingrams, A., Hilgers, D.: Government openness and public trust: the mediating role of democratic capacity. Public Adm. Rev. (2020). https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.13298

32. Kingston, K.L., Furneaux, C., de Zwaan, L., Alderman, L.: Avoiding the accountability ‘sham-ritual’: an agonistic approach to beneficiaries’ participation in evaluation within nonprofit organizations. Crit. Perspect. Account. (2020). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpa.2020.102261