False detection of rifampicin resistance using Xpert® MTB/RIF Ultra assay due to an A451V mutation in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*

Margaret M. Fitzgibbon¹,², Emma Roycroft¹,², Gerard Sheehan³,⁴, Anne-Marie Mc Laughlin⁵,⁶, Keith Ian Quintyne⁷, Elaine Brabazon⁷, Mary O’Meara⁸, Peter R. Flanagan¹,², A.-Louise Seagar⁹, Ian F. Laurensen⁹, Joseph Keane⁵,⁶ and Thomas R. Rogers ¹,²*

¹Irish Mycobacteria Reference Laboratory, St James's Hospital, Dublin, Ireland; ²Department of Clinical Microbiology, Trinity College Dublin, Ireland; ³Mater Misericordiae University Hospital, Dublin, Ireland; ⁴School of Medicine, University College Dublin, Ireland; ⁵Department of Respiratory Medicine, St James’s Hospital, Dublin, Ireland; ⁶Clinical Medicine, Trinity College Dublin, Dublin, Ireland; ⁷Department of Public Health North-East, Meath, Ireland; ⁸Department of Public Health East, Health Service Executive, Dublin, Ireland; ⁹Scottish Mycobacteria Reference Laboratory, Edinburgh, Scotland

*Corresponding author. E-mail: rogerstr@tcd.ie

Received 15 April 2021; accepted 22 June 2021

**Background:** In a 12 month period, three Irish-born adult cases with pulmonary TB were initially diagnosed by Xpert® MTB/RIF Ultra assay, which detected a rifampicin resistance-conferring mutation prompting treatment as potential MDR cases.

**Methods:** Further laboratory investigations on the cultured isolates included GenoType MTBDRplus assay, phenotypic drug susceptibility tests using the BD BACTEC MGIT culture system and MIC broth microdilution tests. Sequencing of the *rpoB* gene was performed using Sanger sequencing and WGS.

**Results:** Phenotypic drug susceptibility tests determined the isolates to be rifampicin susceptible. Molecular investigations identified an A451V (codon 532) mutation in the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* *rpoB* gene that has not previously been found to cause rifampicin resistance. Genome sequencing revealed that the three isolates’ genomes differed by ≤5 SNPs, indicating a high likelihood of recent transmission events. Furthermore, a cluster of six related *M. tuberculosis* isolates from our in-house typing database showed four were highly related; all were rifampicin susceptible and lacked this mutation.

**Conclusions:** False detection of rifampicin resistance, albeit rare, should be considered possible with Xpert® MTB/RIF Ultra assay, particularly in low TB incidence settings. Confirmatory sequencing methods should be performed to prevent the unnecessary use of second-line anti-tuberculous drugs.

**Introduction**

Subsequent to its endorsement by WHO in 2010 the Xpert® MTB/RIF assay, succeeded by the Xpert® MTB/RIF Ultra (Cepheid, Sunnyvale, CA, USA), became an established test for rapid diagnosis of pulmonary TB and detection of mutations within the 81bp *rpoB* gene rifampicin-resistance determining region (RRDR). When an RRDR mutation is detected using the Xpert® MTB/RIF Ultra assay, WHO guidelines recommend starting treatment with an MDR-TB regimen. However, in cases where the *rpoB* mutation is not associated with phenotypic rifampicin resistance, this could result in overuse of second-line anti-tuberculous drugs.

We report three cases of pulmonary TB where the Xpert® MTB/RIF Ultra assay result for rifampicin resistance mutation(s) led to initial therapy with an MDR-TB drug regimen. Subsequent confirmation of rifampicin susceptibility enabled a change in regimen to include rifampicin in two cases with successful completion of therapy. Treatment in the third case did not include rifampicin because of the patient’s underlying immunocompromise and lack of clarity at the time on the clinical relevance of the A451V mutation. Genome sequencing of a further six isolates associated with this cluster showed that four were closely related to the index isolates but lacked an A451V mutation. Further epidemiological investigations failed to identify a link between any of these cases.

**Materials and methods**

Three sputum samples that were processed as part of routine diagnostic testing in the Irish Mycobacteria Reference Laboratory (IMRL) in a 12 month period between 2018 and 2019 were included in this study.

© The Author(s) 2021. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of the British Society for Antimicrobial Chemotherapy. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted reuse, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.
The Xpert MTB/Rif Ultra assay was performed as per manufacturer’s instructions (Cepheid). The Xpert MTB/RIF Ultra v2 assay was used for sample 1 whereas Xpert MTB/RIF Ultra v3 assay was used for samples 2 and 3. All three sputum samples were cultured using the BACTEC MGIT 960 culture system according to the manufacturer’s instructions (Becton Dickinson and Company, NJ, USA).

A WHO-endorsed line-probe assay (LPA) for determining rifampicin and isoniazid resistance, GenoType MTBDRplus v2.0 (Bruker-Hain Diagnostics, Germany), was performed post-culture (median time to positivity 4 days, range 3–7 days). Species identification was performed with the GenoType MTBC assay (Bruker-Hain Diagnostics).

Phenotypic drug susceptibility testing (pDST) was performed using the BD BACTEC MGIT 960 culture system according to the manufacturer’s instructions. The Mycobacterium tuberculosis isolates were tested for susceptibility to first-line and second-line anti-tuberculous drugs at WHO-defined critical concentrations: rifampicin (1.0 mg/L), isoniazid (0.1 mg/L), ethambutol (5 mg/L), pyrazinamide (100 mg/L), moxifloxacin (0.25 mg/L), amikacin (1.0 mg/L), linezolid (1.0 mg/L) and clofazimine (1.0 mg/L). Additional testing to determine rifampicin MICs for each isolate was performed using a broth microdilution method, the Sensititre MYCOTB MIC Plate (TREK Diagnostic Systems, Cleveland, OH, USA) according to the manufacturer’s instructions. Identification of the rifampicin resistance mutation was performed using rpoB gene Sanger sequencing. Epidemiological typing was performed in house using a 24 locus MIRU-VNTR typing kit (GenoScreen, Lille, France). Phylogenetic lineages were assigned to each isolate using the MIRU-VNTRplus online tool. There were a further six M. tuberculosis isolates from the IMRL database, dating from 2010 to the present investigation, with an indistinguishable MIRU-VNTR genotype.

WGS was performed on the nine M. tuberculosis isolates using an Illumina high output MinSeq kit (Illumina, San Diego, CA, USA) according to the manufacturer’s instructions. SNP-based analysis was performed using the Mtbseq v1.0.4 pipeline.

Ethics statement

This outbreak was investigated by the local Departments of Public Health under statutory legislation and did not require ethics approval. Legal duties, organizational policies and good practices were observed in data handling and data processing for the study which was conducted by the authors to inform the statutory function of the Health Services Executive in Ireland to improve, promote and protect the health and welfare of the public (Section 7, Health Act 2004), in line with the General Data Protection Regulations and their application in Ireland. Legal duties, organizational policies and good practices were observed during the conduct of the study. This report was approved, prior to submission, by the Data Protection Officer at St James’s Hospital.

Table 1. Comparison of genotypic and phenotypic laboratory test results for M. tuberculosis isolates harbouring the A451V mutation

| Sample no. | Sample type | Xpert MTB/ Rif Ultra\(^a\), SMB probe with Tm shift | GenoType MTBDRplusv2.0\(^b\) | Rifampicin pDST |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | sputum | rpoB4A | WT1-8 present, not detected | S |<0.12 | A451V (A532V) |
| 2 | sputum | rpoB2, rpoB4A | WT8 absent, not detected | S |<0.12 | A451V (A532V) |
| 3 | sputum | rpoB2, rpoB4A | WT8 absent, not detected | S |0.25 | A451V (A532V) |

MUT, mutation/mutant; SMB, sloppy molecular beacon; Tm, melting temperature; S, susceptible.

\(^a\)Xpert MTB/RIF Ultra v2 assay used for sample 1; Ultra v3 assay used for samples 2 and 3.

\(^b\)Assay performed on M. tuberculosis recovered from each sample.

\(^c\)pDST performed using the BD BACTEC MGIT 960 culture system and tested at WHO-defined critical concentration of 1 mg/L rifampicin.

\(^d\)MIC determined by broth microdilution using TREK Sensititre MYCOTB MIC Plate.

\(^e\)rpoB mutation identified using Sanger sequencing, confirmed with WGS analysis.

Results

The laboratory data for the nine M. tuberculosis isolates were shown in Table 1. Xpert MTB/RIF Ultra detected M. tuberculosis complex DNA and a rifampicin resistance-associated mutation in the three respiratory samples. Sample 1 displayed slightly different Xpert results to Samples 2 and 3. The raw data from this test showed that probe rpoB4A was detected in all samples, with a second probe (rpoB2) observed in samples 2 and 3 (both WT and mutation melt curves detected). GenoType MTBDRplus LPA results were similar for samples 2 and 3 where rifampicin resistance was inferred from the banding pattern obtained due to lack of signal to one rpoB WT probe (WT8 probe not developed; no mutation probe developed). However, there was no indication of rifampicin resistance from the banding pattern obtained for sample 1 (all WT probes developed, no mutation probe developed). All three samples were confirmed as M. tuberculosis and pDST results showed susceptibility to all first- and second-line anti-TB drugs when tested at WHO-defined critical concentrations. Additional tests showed rifampicin susceptible MICs (shown in Table 1) for each isolate using a broth microdilution method. Sanger sequencing revealed an A451V (codon 532) rpoB gene mutation in all three isolates and was confirmed with WGS analysis.

MIRU-VNTR typing showed the three M. tuberculosis isolates were indistinguishable and belonged to Euro-American lineage 4 (MtbC 15-9 code: 3199-15). An analysis of all nine sequenced M. tuberculosis isolates showed that 16 SNPs separated the most distant of the isolates in this cohort while the majority (7/9), including the isolates from the three index cases, were no more than 6 SNPs apart from each other. Despite extensive Public Health...
investigations and review of each case and their contacts, no epidemiological links were identified. Two of the three TB cases with the A451V mutation lived in the same town (population 30,000), while the third case lived in the same province as these cases.

**Discussion**

WGS has recently become the gold standard for detecting TB transmission and identifying TB outbreaks. But in order to effectively translate WGS data, real-time epidemiological analysis is required. While this A451V mutation appears to be rare, no epidemiological links were identified between the three Irish-born adult cases harbouring this mutation. Furthermore, no epidemiological links could be established between the seven cases that were not part of a cluster.

WHO recommends Xpert® MTB/RIF Ultra and GenoType MTBDRplus v2.0 as initial tests to detect drug resistance prior to the initiation of appropriate therapeutic regimens. While these tests are rapid and highly sensitive, they are not considered highly specific for the diagnosis of rifampicin resistance in M. tuberculosis, so pDST remains the gold standard. However, phenotypic methods are time-consuming and are not without limitations. Therefore, WHO now recommends sequencing the entire rpoB gene to identify rifampicin resistance-associated mutations.

The A451V mutation being associated with an Xpert® MTB/RIF Ultra report of rifampicin resistance in a clinical sample has not been reported previously. There is one report of an M. tuberculosis isolate with an A451V mutation that was phenotypically susceptible to rifampicin, but its clinical relevance was not assessed. In previous reports where this mutation has been found in rifampicin-resistant strains there was an accompanying high-confidence rpoB gene mutation. Not all rpoB mutations have the same effect on rifampicin susceptibility and some have been described as ‘disputed mutations’. Recently, WHO has revised the rifampicin critical concentration for pDST using the BACTEC MGIT 960 system to capture these ‘disputed mutations’. The rifampicin critical concentration was lowered from 1.0 mg/L to 0.5 mg/L.

In recognizing the potential for discordance between identified rpoB gene mutations and phenotypic rifampicin susceptibility results a list of confidence-graded mutations associated with rifampicin resistance has been proposed; this does not include A451V. A publicly available list of mutations that do not confer phenotypic rifampicin resistance in M. tuberculosis is required and would be helpful to guide therapeutic decision-making.

The fact that novel, disputed or unknown variants could alter the melting curves of the Xpert® assay indicates that users should be aware of the possibility of false detection of rifampicin resistance, even though this is most likely a rare occurrence. In high TB burden countries, it may be appropriate to treat with an MDR regimen in cases where the Xpert® indicates rifampicin resistance. However, in countries where the TB burden is relatively low, the impact of false positive rifampicin resistance is more prominent and waiting for a confirmatory pDST result might be preferable.
The significance of disputed or novel mutations is still debatable as there is little knowledge of the consequences of infection with *M. tuberculosis* strains harbouring them. Furthermore, the frequency of these mutations is unknown as they are likely missed when only pDST is performed.

**Acknowledgements**

We wish to acknowledge Paolo Miotto from the Supra-National TB Reference Laboratory based in Milan (Emerging Pathogens Unit, IRCCS Ospedale San Raffaele) for contributing *rpoB* primer sequences. We would also like to thank the clinicians, nursing staff and laboratory scientists of the Irish Mycobacteria Reference Laboratory and Microbiology Department, Laboratory Medicine Directorate, St James’s Hospital, Dublin, Ireland for their respective contributions to this investigation.

**Funding**

This work was supported by the IMRL and partly funded by the Department of Clinical Microbiology, Trinity College Dublin, Ireland.

**Transparency declarations**

Thomas P. Rogers reports personal fees from Pfizer Healthcare Ireland; grant and personal fees from Gilead Sciences; advisory board fees and educational support from Menarini Pharma; and advisory board fees and personal fees from Gilead Sciences; advisory board fees and personal fees from Pfizer Healthcare Ireland; educational support from Mundi Pharma and Inserm, outside of the submitted work. All other authors: none to declare.

**References**

1. WHO. Automated Real-Time Nucleic Acid Amplification Technology for Rapid and Simultaneous Detection of Tuberculosis and Rifampicin Resistance: Xpert<sup>®</sup> MTB/RIF System: Policy Statement. 2011. https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/44586.
2. Chakravorty S, Simmons AM, Rowneki M et al. The new Xpert<sup>®</sup> MTB/RIF Ultra: improving detection of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and resistance to rifampin in an assay suitable for point-of-care testing. *mBio* 2017; 8: e00812–17.
3. WHO. Technical Manual for Drug Susceptibility Testing of Medicines Used in the Treatment of Tuberculosis. 2018. https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/275469.
4. WHO. The Use of Molecular Line Probe Assay for the Detection of Resistance to Isoniazid and Rifampicin: Policy Update. 2016. https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/250586.
5. Global Laboratory Initiative. Line Probe Assays for Drug Resistant TB Detection: Interpretation and Reporting Guide for Laboratory Staff and Clinicians. 2018. http://www.stoptb.org/wg/gli/assets/documents/LPA_test_web_ready.pdf.
6. Miotto P, Piana F, Penati V et al. Use of genotype MTBDR assay for molecular detection of rifampin and isoniazid resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* clinical strains isolated in Italy. *J Clin Microbiol* 2006; 44: 2485–91.
7. Supply P, Alix C, Lesjean S et al. Proposal for standardization of optimized mycobacterial interspersed repetitive unit-variable number tandem repeat typing of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *J Clin Microbiol* 2006; 44: 4498–510.
8. Weniger T, Krawczyk J, Supply P et al. MIRU-VNTRplus: a web tool for polyphasic genotyping of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex bacteria. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2010; 38: W326–31.
9. Alix-Béguec C, Homsden D, Weniger T et al. Evaluation and strategy for use of MIRU-VNTRplus, a multifunctional database for online analysis of genotyping data and phylogenetic identification of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex isolates. *J Clin Microbiol* 2008; 46: 2692–9.
10. Kohl TA, Utpatel C, Schleusener V et al. MTBseq: a comprehensive pipeline for whole genome sequence analysis of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex isolates. *Peer J* 2018; 6: e5895.
11. Walker TM, Ip CL, Harrell RH et al. Whole-genome sequencing to delineate *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* outbreaks: a retrospective observational study. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2013; 13: 137–46.
12. Meehan CJ, Moig GA, Kohl TA et al. Whole genome sequencing of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: current standards and open issues. *Nat Rev Microbiol* 2019; 17: 533–45.
13. Wang H-Y, Young U, Kim S et al. Detection of rifampicin-and isoniazid-resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* using the Quantamatrix multiplexed assay platform system. *Ann Lab Med* 2018; 38: 569–77.
14. Williamson DA, Roberts SA, Bower JE et al. Clinical failures associated with *rpoB* mutations in phenotypically occult multi-drug resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2012; 16: 216–20.
15. Miotto P, Cabbibe AM, Borroni E et al. Role of disputed mutations in the *rpoB* gene in interpretation of automated liquid MGIT culture results for rifampin susceptibility testing of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *J Clin Microbiol* 2018; 56: e01599–17.
16. WHO. Technical Report on Critical Concentrations for Drug Susceptibility Testing of Isoniazid and the Rifamycins (Rifampicin, Rifabutin and Rifapentine). 2021. https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/339275.
17. Miotto P, Tessaema B, Taglioni E et al. A standardised method for interpreting the association between mutations and phenotypic drug resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Eur Respir J* 2017; 50: 1701354.
18. Alix-Béguec C, Arandjelovic I, Bl L et al.; CRYPTIC Consortium and the 100,000 Genomes Project. Prediction of susceptibility to first line tuberculosis drugs by DNA sequencing. *N Engl J Med* 2018; 379: 1403–15.
19. Omar SV, Hilleman D, Pandey S et al. Systematic rifampicin resistance errors with Xpert<sup>®</sup> MTB/RIF Ultra: implications for regulation of genotypic assays. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2020; 24: 1307–11.
20. Hu P, Zhang H, Fleming J et al. Retrospective analysis of false-positive and disputed rifampin resistance Xpert<sup>®</sup> MTB/RIF assay results in clinical samples from a referral hospital in Hunan, China. *J Clin Microbiol* 2019; 57: e11707–18.