Enhancing acute flaccid paralysis surveillance through the use of pictorial surveillance reminder cards during supplementary immunization activities, December 2014: a survey in Jigawa State, Nigeria

Lilian Akudo Okeke1,*, Ndadilnasiya Waziri1, Saheed Gidado1, Joel Adegoke1, Aboyowa Edukugo1, Jibrin Idris1, Samuel Luka Abbot1, Belinda Vernyuy Uba1, Adefisoye Adewole1, Olufemi Ajumobi1, Patrick Nguku1, Oladayo Biya2, Lisa Esapa3, Omotayo Bolu4, Eric Wiesen3, Chima Ohuaibunwo4

1National Stop Transmission of Polio, African Field Epidemiology Network, Abuja, Nigeria, 2Nigeria Field Epidemiology and Laboratory Training Programme, African Field Epidemiology Network, Abuja, Nigeria, 3Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Global Immunization Division, Atlanta, United States, 4African Field Epidemiology Network, Kampala, Uganda

*Corresponding author
Lilian Akudo Okeke, African Field Epidemiology Network, Abuja, Nigeria. lokeke@afenet.net

Received: 03 Jul 2019 - Accepted: 17 Sep 2020 - Published: 12 Nov 2021
Domain: Polio eradication
Keywords: Acute flaccid paralysis, surveillance, immunization, reminder card, Nigeria, supplemental immunization activities
©Lilian Akudo Okeke et al. Pan African Medical Journal (ISSN: 1937-8688). This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution International 4.0 License (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.
Cite this article: Lilian Akudo Okeke et al. Enhancing acute flaccid paralysis surveillance through the use of pictorial surveillance reminder cards during supplementary immunization activities, December 2014: a survey in Jigawa State, Nigeria. Pan African Medical Journal. 2021;40(1):4. [doi: 10.11604/pamj.supp.2021.40.1.19647]

This article is published as part of the supplement National Stop Transmission of Polio (NSTOP) in Nigeria and its role in eradication of polio and control and prevention of other vaccine preventable diseases and malaria, 2012 - 2017: progress, impact and lessons learned, commissioned by Nigeria Stop Transmission of Polio Program, Richard Franka (US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, DC, United States).

Guest editors:
• Steve Wassilak, US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, GA, United States
• Richard Franka, US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, GA, United States
• Kwame Asamoah, US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, GA, United States
• Kathleen Wassnemuehler, US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, GA, United States

Contact:
• Richard Franka, US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, GA, United States
• Endie Waziri, National Stop Transmission of Polio Program, Abuja, Nigeria

Available online at: https://www.panafrican-med-journal.com/content/series/40/1/4/full

Abstract

Introduction: Acute flaccid paralysis (AFP) pictorial surveillance reminder cards (AFP cards) could aid AFP case identification during supplementary immunization activities (SIAs). We assessed the availability and utilization of AFP cards among vaccination teams during the December 2014 polio SIAs in Jigawa State, Nigeria.

Methods: We conducted a cross-sectional survey of a convenience sample of 95 vaccination team supervisors. We used a semi-structured interviewer-administered questionnaire to collect information on socio-demographics, knowledge of AFP cases, availability and utilization of the AFP cards for case identification and investigation and non-compliance resolution by vaccination teams. Univariate and bivariate analyses were performed using Epi Info version 3.5.1.

Results: Of the 95 supervisors interviewed, 86 (91%) reported that vaccinators properly displayed the AFP cards, 90 (95%) reported use of cards for AFP case identification, 88 (93%) reported use of cards to resolve non-compliance with polio vaccination and 77 (81%) reported use of cards to ask caregivers six key questions to prevent missed children. Fifty-eight (61%) supervisors knew the AFP case definition. A total of 21 possible AFP cases were identified by vaccination team members with the aid of the cards, of which 17 (81%) were referred to the nearest health facility.

Conclusion: The survey demonstrated usefulness of reminder cards for identification and follow-up of AFP cases. Based on these findings, use of AFP cards was implemented in all Nigerian States and similar cards were developed and implemented for measles surveillance during SIAs.
Introduction
Surveillance activities are critical to monitor disease trends, guide disease prevention programs and guide immediate outbreak response activities [1]. The key approach used to detect transmission of wild poliovirus (WPV) is active surveillance for acute flaccid paralysis (AFP) with laboratory testing of stool samples for the presence of poliovirus [2]. In Nigeria, the standard AFP surveillance network of surveillance officers at State and local government area (LGA) levels includes surveillance focal points at the health facility (HF) level and community informants at the settlement level. Persistent poliovirus transmission can remain undetected in populations with low population immunity if there are gaps in the surveillance system [3]. Surveillance officers are required to regularly contact HF focal points and clinicians in order to identify AFP cases. However, this active surveillance may not optimally detect all cases seen in facilities if there is poor knowledge of the AFP case definition, poor documentation of suspected AFP cases, inadequate clinician and community sensitization on AFP surveillance; or if it is not conducted due to inadequate funds for field visits, hard-to-reach populations, or the threat of violence in insecure areas [4]. These gaps can result in delayed detection of AFP cases and delayed implementation of supplementary immunization activities (SIAs) to interrupt transmission of poliovirus.

The National Stop Transmission of Polio (NSTOP) program provides technical and management support to the Polio Eradication Initiative (PEI) in Nigeria [5]. One of NSTOP’s core priorities is to strengthen AFP surveillance networks. Since its inception in August 2012, NSTOP has implemented activities to enhance AFP surveillance in all NSTOP-supported states [6]. These include community sensitization meetings on AFP case identification, conducting surveillance supervision to health facilities, and expanding AFP reporting networks by engaging community and special informants in underserved and security-compromised areas. In addition, a short message service (SMS)-based reporting system to improve AFP case reporting was implemented in Sokoto State [7]. In 2014, a polio field census of underserved populations in 209 LGAs across 17 high-risk states detected un-reported AFP cases [6].

Methods
Jigawa State in north-central Nigeria has an estimated population of 872,200 children younger than 5 years, the target age group for OPV during SIAs. It has 27 LGAs, of which eight (Babura, Birnin Kudu, Borno, Kaduna, Taraba, Yobe, Bauchi, Adamawa) have NSTOP staff embedded within the LGA immunization team.

Study design: a cross-sectional survey assessed whether AFP cards help identify possible AFP cases, extending the reach of surveillance during SIAs. These cards were tested during SIAs in December 2014. Study population: the house-to-house vaccination team included a team supervisor, a vaccinator, a recorder and a community leader. Women are usually selected as the vaccinator to allow access to houses during SIAs. These cards were tested during SIAs in December 2014. The survey population was the supervisors of vaccination teams deployed to select NSTOP-supported LGAs in Jigawa State. The supervisors observed interactions between vaccinators and caregivers.

Sampling technique: a ward and settlement known to have high rates of non-compliance to polio vaccination according to SIA administrative data were selected arbitrarily within each of the 27 LGAs. A convenience sample of 2-4 team supervisors was selected in each ward, totaling 95 team supervisors.

Data collection: using an interviewer-administered semi-structured questionnaire, data collected by the NSTOP LGA Officers (NSLOs) included socio-demographic information of vaccination team supervisors (age, sex, educational status and occupation), knowledge of AFP case definition, suspected AFP reporting process by vaccination teams, and perceptions of the utility of the AFP cards.

Data processing and analysis: data were entered and analyzed using Epi Info version 3.5.1 and Microsoft Excel to determine frequencies and proportions. Bivariate analyses were performed and Chi square test was used to determine significant association, with statistical significance placed at p value < 0.05.

Ethical consideration: ethical clearance was obtained from the Jigawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency (SPHCDA) board. Final approval to conduct this survey was obtained from the National Coordinator, NSTOP Program, African Field Epidemiology Network, Nigeria Country Office.

Results
Ninety-five team supervisors were enrolled in the survey. All team supervisors responded (100%). The mean age of respondents was 24 years (standard deviation 4.6 years). Ninety-three respondents were females (98%). Seventy-one (75%) had secondary level of education, and 25 (26%) were unemployed when there are no polio SIAs (Table 1).

Figure 1: NSTOP developed and printed AFP surveillance reminder card showing an AFP case on the front page and the 6 key questions at the back

Data were entered and analyzed using Epi Info version 3.5.1 and Microsoft Excel to determine frequencies and proportions. Bivariate analyses were performed and Chi square test was used to determine significant association, with statistical significance placed at p value < 0.05.

Ethical consideration: ethical clearance was obtained from the Jigawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency (SPHCDA) board. Final approval to conduct this survey was obtained from the National Coordinator, NSTOP Program, African Field Epidemiology Network, Nigeria Country Office.

Results
Ninety-five team supervisors were enrolled in the survey. All team supervisors responded (100%). The mean age of respondents was 24 years (standard deviation 4.6 years). Ninety-three respondents were females (98%). Seventy-one (75%) had secondary level of education, and 25 (26%) were unemployed when there are no polio SIAs (Table 1).

Of the 95 respondents, 86(91%) observed vaccinators wearing the pictorial AFP surveillance reminder cards around their neck, 77(81%) observed vaccinators using the cards to ask mothers and caregivers to support AFP case identification, conducting surveillance supervision to health facilities, and expanding AFP reporting networks by engaging community and special informants in underserved and security-compromised areas. In addition, a short message service (SMS)-based reporting system to improve AFP case reporting was implemented in Sokoto State [7]. In 2014, a polio field census of underserved populations in 209 LGAs across 17 high-risk states detected un-reported AFP cases [6].

Of the 95 respondents, 86(91%) observed vaccinators wearing the pictorial AFP surveillance reminder cards around their neck, 77(81%) observed vaccinators using the cards to ask mothers and caregivers to support AFP case identification, conducting surveillance supervision to health facilities, and expanding AFP reporting networks by engaging community and special informants in underserved and security-compromised areas.

Figure 1: NSTOP developed and printed AFP surveillance reminder card showing an AFP case on the front page and the 6 key questions at the back.
and 88 (93%) believed the cards aided in resolving issues of non-compliance (Table 3). A total of 21 possible AFP cases were identified using the vaccination team supervisors during the December 2014 SIAs; 17 (81%) of those were referred for investigation.

In bivariate analysis, the knowledge level of the supervisors about the AFP case definition was found not to be associated with age, sex, educational status and occupation of respondents. Their perception of the AFP surveillance reminder cards aiding in resolving non-compliance was found to be associated with their teams’ observed utilization of the cards during SIAs (p < 0.05) (Table 4).

**Table 1:** Socio-demographics characteristics of vaccination team supervisors in NSTOP-supported LGAs, during December Supplementary Immunization Activity, Jigawa State, Nigeria, 2014

| Characteristics          | Frequency | Percent |
|--------------------------|-----------|---------|
| Age group (years)        |           |         |
| ≤30                      | 88        | 92.6    |
| >30                      | 7         | 7.0     |
| Mean age 24 ± 4.6        |           | 4       |
| Sex                      |           |         |
| Female                   | 93        | 97.9    |
| Male                     | 2         | 2.1     |
| Educational status       |           |         |
| Secondary                | 71        | 74.7    |
| Tertiary                 | 24        | 25.3    |
| Occupational status      | 4         | 4.2     |
| Civil Servant            | 21        | 22.1    |
| Homemaker/Students       | 41        | 43.2    |
| Self employed            | 4         | 4.2     |
| Unemployed (when there are no polio SIAs) | 25 | 26.3 |

Abbreviations: NSTOP = National Stop Transmission of Polio, LGAs = Local Government Area, SIA = Supplementary Immunization Activity

**Table 2:** Supervisor-reported availability and utilization of AFP surveillance reminder cards among vaccinators during December Supplementary Immunization Activity, Jigawa State, Nigeria, 2014

| Observations                                                                 | Frequency | Percent |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|---------|
| Persons seen properly displaying AFP surveillance reminder cards (i.e. hung on a lanyard around the neck) | 86        | 90.5    |
| Used cards for AFP identification                                           | 90        | 94.7    |
| Used cards to resolve non-compliance with polio vaccination among caregivers | 88        | 92.6    |
| Used cards to ask the 6 key questions                                       | 77        | 81.1    |

Abbreviations: AFP = Acute Flaccid Paralysis, SIA = Supplementary Immunization Activity

**Table 3:** Knowledge and perception among Supplementary Immunization Activities team supervisors regarding AFP reminder cards during December SIAs, Jigawa State, Nigeria, 2014

| Characteristics                                                                 | Frequency | Percent |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|---------|
| Knowledge on AFP and pictorial AFP surveillance reminder cards                 |           |         |
| Knew AFP case definition                                                      | 58        | 61.1    |
| Knew the importance of enquiring for AFP cases                                | 86        | 90.5    |
| Knew the reasons for use of the AFP reminder cards                            | 84        | 88.4    |
| Knew to whom to report an AFP case                                            | 24        | 25.0    |
| Perception on the use of the pictorial AFP surveillance reminder cards         |           |         |
| Believed AFP reminder card is useful for AFP identification                   | 92        | 96.8    |
| Believed AFP reminder card aided in resolving non-compliance                  | 88        | 92.6    |

Abbreviations: AFP = Acute Flaccid Paralysis, SIA = Supplementary Immunization Activity

**Table 4:** Association between knowledge on AFP cases definition, perception of vaccination team supervisors on the use of AFP reminder cards and observed utilization of AFP cards during December SIAs, Jigawa State, Northern Nigeria, 2014

| Characteristics                                             | Observed use of AFP reminder cards | X²     | p value |
|-------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--------|--------|
| Knowledge on AFP and AFP reminder cards                     | Yes n (%)                         | No n (%)|        |
| Knew AFP case definition                                    | Yes 54 (60.9)                     | 36 (39.1)| 0.15   | 0.70   |
| Knew AFP case definition                                    | No 4 (80.0)                       | 1 (20.0) |        |        |
| Knew the importance of enquiring for suspected AFP cases     | Yes 82 (91.1)                     | 8 (8.9)  | 0.0017 | 0.97   |
| Knew the importance of enquiring for suspected AFP cases     | No 4 (80.0)                       | 1 (20.0) |        |        |
| Believed pictorial AFP reminder card is important            | Yes 88 (97.8)                     | 2 (2.2)  | 0.81   | 0.37   |
| Believed pictorial AFP reminder card is important            | No 4 (80.0)                       | 1 (20.0) |        |        |
| Believed pictorial AFP reminder card aided in resolving non-compliance | Yes 85 (94.4)                     | 5 (5.6)  | 3.96   | 0.04   |
| Believed pictorial AFP reminder card aided in resolving non-compliance | No 3 (60.0)                       | 2 (40.0) |        |        |

Abbreviations: AFP = Acute Flaccid Paralysis, SIA = Supplementary Immunization Activity

**Discussion**

Vaccinators can use a simple tool to conduct AFP surveillance during SIAs, thereby extending the reach of the surveillance system. During trainings for SIAs, vaccinators are instructed to ask about any recent events of paralysis to identify potential AFP cases that were not previously identified through the standard AFP reporting network. To our knowledge, the survey is the first to assess usefulness of reminder cards by house-to-house vaccination teams to strengthen AFP surveillance and improve uptake of OPV in initially non-compliant households. The survey revealed a gap in the team supervisors’ knowledge of the standard AFP case definition, which is key for AFP identification, even though the pictorial on the AFP reminder card may have aided in AFP identification. Although this survey found that pictorial AFP surveillance reminder cards could be useful for identification of possible AFP cases during SIAs, four possible AFP cases identified by the teams were not referred for investigation. This could have been due to limited knowledge to whom cases should be reported. This knowledge gap should be addressed by training vaccination teams on the need and means for referral of all AFP cases identified during the ward level training in preparation for the OPV campaign.

Our findings suggest that vaccinators utilizing the AFP card photo helps caregivers to see what AFP looks like and to appreciate the danger of non-vaccination. Our survey was conducted in settlements known to have high rates of non-compliance to polio vaccination. Supervisors reported unquantified non-compliance among caregivers during the December 2014 polio SIAs; supervisors’ responses indicated that an unquantified number of instances were resolved when teams showed the picture on the reminder cards to the caregivers and reinforcing the risks of non-vaccination.

Many studies have demonstrated that use of simple tools could improve reporting of AFP cases, other diseases and health interventions [7-9]. Datta et al., demonstrated that the use of Short Message Services (SMS) reminders could improve AFP reporting, and recommended that SMS could be adapted to improve AFP surveillance and reporting post-eradication in high-risk countries for poliovirus importation or emergence...
and circulation of vaccine-derived polioviruses [9]. Similarly, Guro et al. demonstrated that mobile phone messaging applications, such as SMS and Multimedia Message Service (MMS), could provide an important, inexpensive delivery medium for reminders for healthcare appointments [10]. A systematic literature review study, conducted by Rathbone and Prescott, 2017 demonstrated that the use of simple tools like mobile apps and SMS text messaging for physical and mental health interventions are promising and efficient [11]. During the smallpox eradication initiative, pictorial cards were used to aid surveillance.

This survey had many limitations. First, this survey was limited to one State and used a convenience sample of LGAs, wards, settlements and respondents. Second, the supervisors could have exaggerated the positive use of reminder cards for AFP case identification without actual observation. Third, there were inconsistencies in some of the responses (e.g., more supervisors indicated that they believed the reminder cards were useful for AFP identification than knew the reasons for use of the reminder cards). Fourth, we have no quantitative data on how many non-compliant households were persuaded to accept vaccination based on the use of reminder cards and therefore its value for this purpose. Lastly, some of the potential AFP cases identified may have been previously reported and investigated.

Conclusion

Our survey findings support the positive use of the AFP reminder cards during the December 2014 SIA. Based on identification of 17 potential AFP cases referred for investigation, there may be value in using the cards for extending the reach of the standard AFP surveillance system. Based on our findings, the use of AFP reminder card during SIAs was extended to all States in Nigeria. The card has been adapted for measles surveillance as well.

What is known about this topic

- Acute Flaccid Paralysis surveillance is one of the key strategies for polio eradication. There are limitations in AFP surveillance in areas of Nigeria.

What this study adds

- Pictorial AFP reminder card used during OPV vaccination campaigns could help reduce non-compliance to vaccination and potentially enhance surveillance of AFP.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

Authors’ contributions

All the authors contributed to this study and read and approved the final manuscript.

Acknowledgments

The authors thank all health workers, community members and care workers who contributed to this study. The authors also thank the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta (cooperative agreement number U2GPS0002728). This work was supported by the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health (U2GPS0002728) through the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta (cooperative agreement number U2GPS0002728). Our profound appreciation goes to the Nigeria Field Epidemiology and Laboratory Training Programme and unnamed CDC/GID staff. We also thank the Local Government Area Polio Eradication Initiative Teams of Kiyawa, Sule Tankarkan, Babura, Miga, Birnin Kudu, Gwaram and Maigatari for ensuring this survey was conducted.

References

1. Mulders MN, Serhan F, Goodson JL, Icenogle J, Johnson WB, Rota AP. Expansion of surveillance for vaccine-preventable diseases: building on the global polio laboratory network and the global measles and rubella laboratory network platforms. J Infect Dis. 2017;216(suppl 1):S324-30.
2. Abo HM, Etsano A, Shuaib F, Damisa E, Mkanda P, Gasasira A, Banda R et al. Progress toward polio surveillance in Nigeria. J Infect Dis. 2014;210 Suppl 1:S40-49.
3. Bolo O, Nnadi C, Damisa E, Braka F, Siddiq A, Roody Archer RW et al. Progress toward polio surveillance in Nigeria, January-December 2017. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2018;67(8):253-6.
4. Hamisu AW, Johnson TM, Craig K, Mkanda P, Banda R, Tegegne GS et al. Strategies for improving polio surveillance performance in the security-challenged Nigerian States of Adamawa, Borno, and Yobe during 2009-2014. J Infect Dis. 2016 May 1;213 Suppl 3(Suppl 3):S136-9.
5. Waziri NE, Oduabunwo CJ, Nguku PM, Ogbuanu UI, Gidado S, Biya O et al. Polio eradication in Nigeria and the role of the National Stop Transmission of Polio Program, 2012-2013. J Infect Dis. 2014;210 Suppl 1:S111-117.
6. Gidado SO, Oduabunwo C, Nguku PM, Ogbuanu UI, Waziri EN, Biya O et al. Outreach to Underserved Communities in Northern Nigeria, 2012-2013. J Infect Dis. 2014;210(suppl_1):S118-24.
7. Adegoke OJ, Takane M, Biya O, Ota M, Murele B, Mahoney F et al. Strengthening the Acute Flaccid Paralysis (AFP) surveillance component of the polio eradication initiative through Short Message Service (SMS) reminders; experience from Sokoto State, Nigeria 2014. J Immunol Sci. 2018 Jul 3;Suppl(10):68-74.
8. Vaz RG, Mkanda P, Nsibuga F, Ado M, Etsano A. Public health innovations on the way to interruption of poliovirus transmission in Nigeria. J Infect Dis. 2014;210 Suppl 1:S111-117.
9. Datta SS, Ropa B, Sui GP, Khattra R, Gopala Krishnan SSR, Okayasu H. Using short-message-service notification as a method to improve acute flaccid paralysis surveillance in Papua New Guinea. BMC Public Health. 2016 May 17;16:409.
10. Guroil-Urganci I, de Jongh T, Vodopiwe-Jamsek V, Atun R, Car J. Mobile phone messaging reminders for attendance at healthcare appointments. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. 2013 Dec 5;2013(12):CD007458.
11. Rathbone AL, Prescott J. The use of mobile apps and SMS messaging as physical and mental health interventions: systematic review. J Med Internet Res. 2017;19(8):e295.