Rethinking tourism: Bali's failure

M Khamdevi1 and H Bott2

1 Ph.D. Program, Department of Urban Planning and Design, University of Stuttgart, Keplerstraße 11, Stuttgart 70174, Germany
2 International Center for Cultural and Technological Research, University of Stuttgart, Geschwister-Scholl-Str. 24, Stuttgart 70174, Germany

E-mail: m.khamdevi@gmail.com

Abstract. Bali is famous as the tourist destination in the world. Ironically, most of the people of Bali thought that tourism in Bali is a failure. The negative impact showed on modernization in South Bali, including Denpasar, Kuta, and Ubud. Cultural imperialism has shifted local culture in many aspects, especially the traditional houses and buildings. The climax of this problem is the development of Benoa Bay Reclamation, where the sacred location for the traditional ceremony will be built for new tourism development that offers pleasure and leisure. This raised hard protest from the people of Bali. They are also afraid that the Balinese cultural and natural environment will vanish. On the other hand, some movement of sustainable tourism in North Bali, that ran by the local community has also arisen. What is tourism? Is it only for pleasure and leisure only? This research will discuss the rethinking of tourism definition with Bali as a reflection case. The purpose of this paper is to find its right definition with qualitative methodology. A more sustainable tourism that more on local context would be a research result.

1. Introduction
According to the World Tourism Organization (WTO), that the international tourism has achieved revenues of the US $ 1,159 billion grew by 5% worldwide in 2013 and has reached 1.087 million arrivals. Indonesia owned high growth rates by 9,4% [1]. The travel and tourism demand from developing countries continues to increase, especially as a growing middle class of Asia and Latin America, who want and can travel in and out of their territory [2].

However, tourism in Indonesia is still less when compared with the countries of Southeast Asia. In the report of the World Economic Forum “The ASEAN Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 2013” Indonesia ranks 4th in the bottom of Singapore, Malaysia, and Thailand regarding of the highest number of tourists in ASEAN, ranked 12th in the Asia Pacific region and ranked 70th in the world. In the report of the World Economic Forum, Indonesia also ranked 6th for its excellent natural resources and ranked 38th for its cultural resources. Unfortunately, Indonesia ranked 125th for ensuring the environmentally sustainable development of the tourism sector [3].

The tourism in Indonesia is in the fifth place in 2013 as one of foreign exchange sources after Oil and Gas, Coal, Palm Oil and Processed Rubber. The increasing number of tourist arrivals reached 8.8 million, have an impact on the tourism foreign exchange earnings by the US $ 10.1 billion [4]. Bali Province had the highest number of tourist arrivals in Indonesia by 3.3 million and contributed 40% of national foreign exchange from tourism [5]. The economic growth in Bali Province is 6.65%. The
tourism industry had influenced approximately 65 percent of it on the island of Bali. Although its Gross Domestic Regional Product reached 99,555.74 billion rupiahs, ironically it has not prospered all the people of Bali evenly. The percentage of poor people in Bali reached 3.95%, mostly in villages[6]. Even though the tourist village in Bali started to develop, but its promotion is still carried out by the government without any support from private sectors[7].

The history of the development of tourism in Bali began in the 1920s, in which the Dutch Colonial introduced Bali as a tourist destination[8]. Now, Bali is famous as an international tourist destination in Indonesia. In this globalization era, Bali is experiencing problems, such as the destruction of the physical environment and the degradation of local wisdom. The tourism development has altered the natural and cultural landscape of Bali, especially paddy terraces and heritage spatial pattern[9]. Internationally, Bali's image also began to shift into more "cheesy." That is because of the tourist behavior. They came from various cultures and social classes. The act of rudeness, criminality, vandalism, and racism became cases[10].

During the period 1997 - 2011, around 436 hectares paddy fields have been converted every year or 0.5% per year for other industry sectors, like tourism and manufactures[11]. Agricultural land has now turned into buildings, villas, night clubs, and hotels. These developments do not only impact on the physical environment and agricultural production but also have an impact on flora and fauna as well][12][13]. The case of transfer of land ownership from the local people to foreign capital owners also become a problem. It donated negative impacts, such as pollution and environmental degradation and the widespread of "hidden tourists" that stole income in Bali[14].

Some Bali region, such as Kerobokan, Kuta, and Badung regency, now is the star of the expatriate community and Indonesian middle class to invest. The row of magnificent villas are built up at shore. The entertainment facilities such as cafes, discotheques and shop houses, salons, spas, shopping malls, boutiques and restaurants are also emerged[15]. Many tourism development does not consider the custom and culture in Bali, especially the Tri Hita Karana spatial concept about the relationship of a man with God, man with other man, and man with the environment. In addition, tourism development often interfere religious ceremonies and processions. These issues often caused problems and frictions. For example, a tourist attraction closed the beach area in Bali and closed functions of the beach, which often interfere religious ceremonies and processions. These issues often caused problems and frictions. For example, a tourist attraction closed the beach area in Bali and closed functions of the beach, which is a sacred place for Bali people to do Melasti ceremony in before the Nyepi Day[16]. Another example, the Lovina historic area and the Kalibukbuk Buddhist temple in Buleleng begins to saturate since the development of hotels and bars and discotheques nearby, so that the region lost its characteristics of sanctity and peace[17].

Suryawan has described, that the tourism in Bali has long been controlled by the power of global investment and has tended to be a living museum of art and culture that promises the glamorous life of the people of Bali[18]. His description is identical to Desmond's argument, that cultural tourism is just being a Staging Tourism, where people and their culture are just a public display of bodies—how they look, what they do, where they do it, who watches, and under what conditions. She then simulates cultural tourism with animal tourism at zoos, aquariums, and animal theme parks[19].

On the other hand, because Bali is an international tourist patron of Indonesia, then some tourism development in Indonesia try to imitate Bali tourism. For instance, tourism in Belitung island. One developer tries to convince tourists that Belitung is “Bali – Tong” and they build Balinese temple also. Another example is in Tanjung Lesung, the local government try to plant Balinese snake fruit there, and fail!

Because of these problems, we start to question what is tourism. Is it only for pleasure and leisure only? Is tourism in Bali a failure? This research will discuss the rethinking of tourism definition with Bali as a reflection case. The purpose of this paper is to find its right definition.

2. Method
This research uses the qualitative method with the descriptive approach by experiencing the tourism in Bali and interviewing the locals. The data will be in the form of words, pictures, and figures derived from the interview manuscripts, field notes, photographs and others. After that, all data will be analyzed
to get an overview of the phenomenon. The sampling is purposive, which will be selected based on specific considerations and purposes.

3. Results and Discussions

3.1. The impact of mass tourism in (South) Bali
Mass tourism gave impact on the natural, social, and cultural environment in Bali. As we know, tourism is economically contributed to global growth in developing countries, especially to small scale enterprises and the standard of living as well as a catalyst for community development[20]. However, tourism also creates negative effects in economic, social, cultural, and environmental life in the destination region [21].

3.1.1. The urbanized cities and villages.
Kuta and Denpasar became modern cities. The local culture became abandoned. The people began to forget their culture and embrace the modern (or western) culture. The traditional hierarchy of the balinese settlement; Tri Hita Karana, has shifted and changed so much. This two most visited cities now became densed and had heavy traffic jams as shown in Figure 1. Then suprisingly, that there are some stores sell javanese and batakese traditional house for villas in Denpasar and Kuta, that will change the face of Bali a lot.

Ubud city will catch up the failure of Kuta and Denpasar. In our memory, Ubud was a place with a lot of rice fields. But now, it become more like Kuta. The traffic is always heavy, usually on main street and intersections as shown in Figure 2. Cafes, restaurants, and shops are everywhere and they have modern style on their facade. Even though garbage bins are everywhere but some plastic garbages are on the street and in gutter as shown in Figure 2. Some compound houses became homestay with modern touch to meet the high standard of the hospitality and tourism industry. Some of the building walls made of brick masonry and some by combination between brick masonry and bamboo and wood. The homestay room was nice and the bathroom is inside with proper closet. They actually are the extension of guest space of the Balinese compound house as shown in Figure 3. The host of the homestay is so
friendly. The breakfast at the homestay was so western, so if tourist wants local culinary just go to Ubud Market at morning to find some local foods.

**Figure 3.** The Homestay as a result of the compound house spatial extension, Ubud - Bali

Nyu Kuning Village is placed in Ubud that should not be as tourism village but somehow became homestay, villas, cafes, and art galleries. Then, some traditional art performances sadly have only a few visitors. Perhaps, more and more tourist don't have any interest to see them anymore.

**Figure 4.** Gunung Kawi Temple and Besakih Temple, Bali

3.1.2. The impact of capitalization in tourist attractions.

Some tourist attractions of mass tourism in Bali, such as Gunung Kawi, Pura Besakih, Panglipuran Village and Elephant Cave always filled with many visitors as shown in Figure 4. However, some tourists have often experience unfriendly and unpleasant, especially in Pura Besakih. Some local tourists had to pay the entrance ticket as much as foreigners do. And then, both of them had been forced to pay an additional cost for maintenance and guide. The tour also is always so fast, that someone could not realize what he has seen. He would not enjoy it and came out the temple feeling very annoyed. It turns out, the tourism has changed people behavior to be so greedy.

Another mass tourism example is Panglipuran Village as shown in Figure 5. However, some of the houses have modern materials, as substitutes of woods and bamboos. There is also an old kitchen which has never been used again. The visitors could only enjoy the view, take pictures and selfies, and buy souvenirs. That is all. They don’t learn anything from this village and the people.
Figure 5. Panglipuran Village, Bali

Once, mass tourism has also affected on traditional space pattern in Tenganan Village. The main street of the village (Awangankauh), as a place of religious and traditional ceremonies, has shifted as street shops for selling handicrafts. Bale Banjar Tengah as customary building, now has functioned as a showroom of handicrafts. Jineng as crops storage is abandoned because most of the villagers now are not farmers [22]. Then, a concern to maintain the cultural built environment has raised. The local authorities worked together with Village Ecotourism Network (JED) to initiate a better tourism model for Desa Tenganan.

3.2. The emergence of sustainable tourism in Middle and North Bali

The impact issues of tourism has resulted a paradigm shift in tourism development; mass tourism model to alternative tourism model[23]; sustainable tourism. Sustainable tourism began to become an issue since the first national seminars and workshops conducted by the National Pact-Indonesian and WALHI in year 1995 in Bogor, West Java. In the year 1996 Bali Province had organized a National Workshop II, which established an Indonesian Ecotourism Society Forum (MEI). In 2002, Bali became as a spearhead of the ecotourism development in Indonesia [24].

Since the 1930s, villages for tourism in Bali had sprung up, like Tenganan Village, Manggis district, Karangasem regency [25]. Now, the government of Bali Province programs for the development of 100 villages more to increase the tourist destination, to spread the regional development evenly, and to stimulate the rural economy in Bali [26]. The villagers do themselves the mapping, the planning, the implementation, and the evaluation. When the tourists come, the local residents become a guide, not an employee of travel agents. For the sake of protecting the environment, its management also limits the number of the tourists who will come. Each location should not receive more than ten people per day [27].

3.2.1. The ecotourism of JED.

For instance is JED (Jaringan Ekowisata Desa / Village Ecotourism Network). At first, JED was functioned as community-based trade network of Bali villages, to promote their local crops and goods. But they have difficulties to promote their products because of the lack of network outside Bali. So, they added tourism as an entrance to find customers and to expand the network. Their initial goals are to promote local products and to preserve the natural and cultural environment. On the other hand, they concerned that the mass tourism in Bali gave an impact on nature and culture, especially what happened in Kuta and Ubud. JED has admitted that the tourism in Bali is a failure.
Pelaga Village and Tenganan Village are two villages that JED offers. Pelaga was one of Bali Aga villages and has its own houses, called Sakororas. However, the influence of Majapahit was strong, so they changed their them to follow the Nawa Sanga Mandala pattern, and the Sakororas houses became disappeared. However, Sakororas still found in Trunyan Village, one of the Bali Aga villages.

Mr. Gede also said that Sakororas is the origin house in Bali. Sakororas means 12 posts of the house, symbolized the 12 families in Bali. Sakororas was a single house, which every room are inside the house, even the kitchen and sanggah (the family temple). And then Majapahit arrived, and has spread the Nawa Sanga Mandala pattern. The single house of Sakororas expanded. First, the kitchen was located outside, and the sakororas became Bale Daja (the head family house). And then the Sanggah was located outside, and the rest (the house for juniors, the house for guest, and the Jineng (granary), etc.) was located in their position in Nawa Sanga Mandala pattern.

Pelaga Village is famous for their coffee as shown in Figure 6. Tourists can stay at the local family house. Well, the room is not highly standard for tourism and a little bit dusty. The bathroom is outside next to the kitchen. But at least the tourists could experience the natural air conditioning from the bamboo walls, moreover Pelaga is located on the highland. Every meals had always coffees and the foods tasted so good. The host are very friendly and we become one of the family members. We could interact and witness the daily life of the family; the children learned gamelan music instrument, the father worked in the rice field, and the mother cooked in the kitchen. We can also visited coffee plantations, the rice fields, and cattle for balinese cows. One thing that attracted tourists most that the villagers tried to preserve the balinese cows from extinction while producing organic fertilizer from cow manure and organic waste from the plantations and producing also methane gas from cow menure for energy to the villagers (especially for the kitchens). It looks like they try to be self sufficient and sustainable at the same time. It sounds like the cittaslow concept.

Tenganan is one of Bali Aga villages in Bali. Bali Aga or Bali Mula means that they are the early (origin) people before the Majapahit Kingdom from Java moved to Bali. So their compound houses are much different to the Nawa Sanga Mandala pattern. And they are not practicing Ngaben; cremation, but burial. They are worshipping Vishnu and Indra (Vaishnavism).
Tenganan village now is empty from the street vendors. Thanks to the new rules, that the villagers can only sell the souvenirs inside their house. That is a good thing so that tourists can enjoy the ambiance of Tenganan comfortably. Besides old temples and traditional settlements, we can enjoy some local slow food culinary, and visit some local small industries that produce local honey, woven fabric, and handicraft from roots as shown in Figure 7. But we cannot stay in the house to experience the local daily life, because of a restriction that does not allow strangers to spend the night in the village.

3.2.2. The community-based development in North Bali.
When we go north, the tourist should visit Taman Sari Resort and Spa, in Pemuteran. Taman Sari Resort and Spa is different from many resorts in Bali, because it managed by the local customary village in cooperation with local investor. The local investor is the former investor in Sanur, who has regrets to have a resort that damaged the nature and the culture of Bali. By working together with customary leaders of the village, he develop a resort that supposed to give good impact on local economics, nature, and culture. The development should follow restrictions from the customary laws and maintain natural and cultural environment. There are also some efforts to preserve coral reefs, to manage the resort waste, and to use green energy from sun and wind as shown in Figure 8. But the most successful is the coral reefs preservation.

![Figure 8. Taman Sari Resort and Spa, in Pemuteran, Bali](image)

Gede Kresna, one of indonesian famous architects from Bali that owned an architecture consultant called “Rumah Intaran” in North Bali. Gede Kresna has work in rural area and try to preserve local knowledge, not only the balinese houses, but also the culture. He tried to make a campaign to use reuseable building materials, local green products and packaging, that started from himself. Hopefully, this campaign will be viral and other people, especially the villagers, follow him, although it will take time.

Gede Kresna admitted that the tourism in Bali is a total failure ! It has damaged the natural and cultural environment. He suggested that the tourism should consider the local context; the culture, people and nature. Tourism should be returned to the community. He has advised, that once the village open to it, it will bring negative impacts on sensitive things, if the management does not follow the local context. So he suggested that the village should be independent and self sufficient first to avoid dependence on tourism. The local products should be the main economic sector, then tourism act as complement.

3.3. Tourism: experiencing
The impact of Mass tourism has led to shifts and changes in local culture. Due to Globalization, modernization has transmitted western culture [28]. On the other hand, the process of facilitating the consumption of local tradition and manufacturing tradition in many countries has increased [29]. Then AlSayyad discussed about "the end of tradition". Which means the death of its meaning and the use as a container of authenticity as a valuable heritage or preservation [30].

So, we need to find the right definition of tourism. As we know, Tourism in general definition is a theory, a practice and even a business of touring, traveling for pleasure and leisure [31][32]. However, tourism in a german word is "Erfahrung," meaning "experience," that derived from the verb "Fahren"
meaning "to travel" or "to make a journey" [33][34]. The word "experience" itself came from Latin word "Experentia" meaning "knowledge gained by repeated trials" or from word "Experiri" meaning "to try, test" [35].

In order for sustainable tourism, then the activities are not only passive (watching, observing, etc.), but also active which tourists involves in any recreational and educational activities, culturally and ecologically. The ecotourism could provide a more interactive experiences. So the tourists could participate in maintaining biodiversity and cultural structures, as well as helping the local economy and promoting the development of the visited land. Sustainable tourism as part of alternative options is suitable to be applied and intended as a low-impact on natural and cultural areas. A responsible ecotourism is expected to minimize the negative aspects of mass tourism on the environment and improve the cultural integrity of local community.

One of sustainable tourism is rural tourism, that can be determined as rural attractions and activities that take place in agricultural or non-urban areas. The rural tourism includes cultural heritage tourism, nature-based tourism, and agritourism [36]. That symbiosis of tourism gives a sense of identity, purpose and achievement to the local community [37]. In its management, rural tourism adopted community-based tourism (CBT) that concentrates on the participations of villagers in the tourism activities and the sharing of benefits among villagers [38]. Besides providing a variety of attractions, rural tourism also integrates them with accommodation and other support facilities that are adjusted to the cultural structure of local community [39]. Homestay program is intended to accommodate tourists in a village with a local family, allowing them to learn about the local lifestyle, culture, nature [40].

4. Conclusions
From Bali tourism case, we could learn that mass tourism could give negative impact, especially on the natural and cultural environment. However, we could also learn that people in Bali begin to change its tourism to more sustainable and community-based. From rapid development to slow development. Tourism is not all about pleasure and leisure but experiencing. Tourists could learn the culture and the daily life of the community, and respect their way of life. Tourists could also contribute to preserve the tangible and intangible heritage of the place. The profit of the tourism also goes directly to the community.

However, private sectors should glance the opportunities of sustainable community tourism as promotion package that could be offered to the tourists and encourage active participation of local communities. So that their living standards can raised as well.

References
[1] UNWTO 2014 UNWTO Tourism Highlights (Madrid: UNWTO)
[2] World Travel and Tourism Council 2014 Travel and Tourism: Economic Impact (London: WTTC)
[3] World Economic Forum 2013 Insight Report: The Travel and Tourism Competitiveness Report 2013 (Cologny: WEF)
[4] Andriani Dewi 2014 Penerimaan Devisa Pariwisata 2013 Tembus US$10 miliar (Jakarta: Bisnis Indonesia)
[5] Pradono Nalendra 2013 Dampak Pariwisata Pada Perekonomian di Bali (Jakarta: Marketeers)
[6] BPS Provinsi Bali 2014 Bali Dalam Angka 2014 (Denpasar: BPS Provinsi Bali)
[7] Jati Waskito Raharjo 2010 Revitalisasi Desa Wisata Bali (Denpasar: Bali Pos)
[8] Suryawan I Ngurah 2011 Teater GloBALIsme: Pariwisata, Interkoneksi Global, dan Nasib Manusia Bali (Jurnal Kajian Bali vol 1) no 1 (Bali: Universitas Udayana) p 152
[9] Lestari Desak P R 2012 Pembangunan Pariwisata Bali Memiliki Dampak Negatif Terhadap Lingkungan Fisik dan Tergerusnya Kearifan Lokal (Bali: Universitas Udayana)
[10] Marboen Ade 2014 Kawasan Kuta Bali makin "murahan" (Jakarta: Antara)
[11] BPS Provinsi Bali 2013 Bali Dalam Angka 2013 (Denpasar: BPS Provinsi Bali)
[12] Lestari Desak P R 2012 Pembangunan Pariwisata Bali Memiliki Dampak Negatif Terhadap Lingkungan Fisik dan Tergerusnya Kearifan Lokal (Bali: Universitas Udayana)

[13] Evita Sirtha and Sunartha 2012 Dampak Perkembangan Pembangunan Sarana Akomodasi Wisata Terhadap Pariwisata Berkelanjutan Di Bali E-Journal Universitas Udayana (Denpasar: Universitas Udayana) 2 (1) p 109

[14] Widyanto Dedy 2002 Lingkungan, Problem Pariwisata Bali (Denpasar: Bali Post)

[15] Suryawan I Ngurah 2011 Teater GloBALisme: Pariwisata, Interkoneksi Global, dan Nasib Manusia Bali Jurnal Kajian Bali (Bali: Universitas Udayana) 1 (1) p 152

[16] Lestari Desak P R 2012 Pembangunan Pariwisata Bali Memiliki Dampak Negatif Terhadap Lingkungan Fisik dan Tergerusnya Kearifan Lokal (Bali: Universitas Udayana)

[17] Asmara 2010 PKMM: Pengembangan Objek Wisata Bersejarah Situs Candi Budha Kalibukbuk (Singaraja: Undiksha)

[18] Suryawan I Ngurah 2011 Teater GloBALisme: Pariwisata, Interkoneksi Global, dan Nasib Manusia Bali (Jurnal Kajian Bali vol 1) no 1 (Bali: Universitas Udayana) p 152

[19] Desmond Jane C 1999 Staging Tourism: Bodies on Display from Waikiki to Sea World (Chicago: University of Chicago Press)

[20] Yahaya I and Rasid A R 2010 Homestay program and rural community development in Malaysia Journal of Ritsumeikan Social Sciences and Humanity (Kyoto: Ritsumeikan University) 2 (3) p 7

[21] Theobald William F 2005 Global Tourism (Burlington: Elsevier Science)

[22] Wedasmara 2005 Pengaruh Pariwisata Terhadap Pola Tata Ruang dan Bangunan Tradisional Bali, Studi Kasus: Kawasan Pariwisata Candidasa Karangasem, Bali (Semarang: Universitas Diponegoro)

[23] Parma I Putu Gede 2010 Kontribusi Pariwisata Alternatif Dalam Kaitannya Dengan Kearifan Lokal dan Keberlangsungan Lingkungan Alam Jurnal Media Komunikasi FIS (Buleleng: Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha) 9 (2) p 45

[24] Putra I Made A 2002 Pariwisata Budaya dan Alternatif Ekowisata (Denpasar: Bali Post)

[25] Jaya I Gede Astana 2008 Ekowisata, Mengawinkan Pariwisata dan Pertanian (Bali: Majalah Salam)

[26] Asdhiana I Made 2013 Bali Kembangkan 100 Desa Wisata (Jakarta: Kompas)

[27] Jaya I Gede Astana 2008 Ekowisata, Mengawinkan Pariwisata dan Pertanian (Bali: Majalah Salam)

[28] Hasan Mubashar 2011 The Concept of Globalization and How This Impacted on Contemporary Muslim Understanding of Ummah Journal of Globalization Studies (Volgograd: Uchitel Publishing House) 2 (2)

[29] Alsayyad Nezar 2001 Consuming Tradition, Manufacturing Heritage: Global Norms and Urban Forms in the Age of Tourism (London: Routledge)

[30] Alsayyad Nezar 2004 The End of Tradition? (London: Routledge)

[31] Leiper Neil 1979 The Framework of Tourism Towards A Definition Of Tourism, Tourist, And The Tourist Industry Annals of Tourism Research (Amsterdam: Elsevier) 6 (4) p 390

[32] MacDonald Gillian M E 1999 Unpacking Cultural Tourism (Canada: Simon Fraser University)

[33] Gilloch Graeme 1996 Myth and Metropolis: Walter Benjamin and the City (UK: Polity Press)

[34] Frie Roger A 2003 Understanding Experience: Psychotherapy and Postmodernism (London: Routledge)

[35] Muller Dieter K 2011 Polar Tourism: A Tool For Regional Development (Québec: Presses de l’Université du Québec)

[36] Irshad Humaira 2010 Rural Tourism - An Overview (Alberta: Government of Alberta)

[37] Boniface P and Fowler P J 1993 Heritage and Tourism: In the "Global Village" (London: Routledge)

[38] Suriya Komsan 2011 Impact of Community-based Tourism in a Village Economy in Thailand: An analysis with VCGE model (Istanbul: Proceedings of the EcoMod2011 Conference)
[39] Nuryanti Wiendu 1993 Concept, Perspective and Challenges *Laporan Konferensi Internasional Pariwisata Budaya* (Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press)

[40] Yahaya I and Rasid A R 2010 Homestay program and rural community development in Malaysia *Journal of Ritsumeikan Social Sciences and Humanity* (Kyoto: Ritsumeikan University) 2 (3) p 7