A Review of Qualitative Research of Perception and Experiences of Dementia Among Adults From Black, African, and Caribbean Background: What and Whom Are We Researching?

Moïse Roche, MSc, 1,* Paul Higgs, PhD, 1 Jesutofunmi Aworinde, MSc, 2 and Claudia Cooper, MD 1

1Division of Psychiatry, University College London, UK. 2Cicely Saunders Institute of Palliative Care, Policy & Rehabilitation, King's College London, UK.

*Address correspondence to: Moïse Roche, MSc, UCL Division of Psychiatry, 6th Floor, Wing A, Maple House, 149 Tottenham Court Road, London W1T 7BN, UK. E-mail: m.roche@ucl.ac.uk

Received: October 7, 2019; Editorial Decision Date: January 9, 2020

Decision Editor: Patricia C. Heyn, PhD

Abstract

Background and Objectives: Black, African, and Caribbean (BAC) families are disproportionately affected by dementia but engage less with services. Studies reporting their experiences of dementia have tended to aggregate people from diverse backgrounds, without considering the impact of this diversity, or researchers’ ethnicities. We investigated participants’ and researchers’ ethnic identities, exploring how this relates to findings.

Research Design and Methods: We searched electronic databases in September 2018, for qualitative studies exploring how participants of Black ethnicity understand and experience dementia and dementia care. We reported participants’ and researchers’ ethnicities, and meta-synthesized qualitative findings regarding how ethnicity influences experiences and understanding of dementia.

Results: Twenty-eight papers reported 25 studies; in United States (n = 17), United Kingdom (n = 7), and Netherlands (n = 1). 350/492 (71%) of participants were in U.S. studies and described as African American; participants in U.K. studies as Caribbean (n = 45), African/Caribbean (n = 44), African (n = 28), Black British (n = 7), or Indo-Caribbean (n = 1); and in Netherlands as Surinamese Creole (n = 17). 6/25 (24%) of studies reported involving recruiters/interviewers matching participants’ ethnicity; and 14/25 (56%) involved an author/advisor from a BAC background during analysis/procedures. We identified four themes: Dementia does not relate to me; Inappropriate and disrespectful services; Kinship and responsibility; Importance of religion.

Discussion and Implications: Studies were mostly from a U.S. African American perspective, by researchers who were not of BAC background. Themes of dementia diagnosis and services feeling less relevant to participants than the majority population resonated across studies. We caution against the racialization of these findings, which can apply to many differing minority groups.

Keywords: Ethnic discordance, Cultural nuance, Diversity and identity, Racial terminology issues

Addressing inequalities in access to dementia health and care services is a priority in research and practice and for racially and ethnically diverse families facing cognitive loss. A growing body of research has sought to do this, but classification systems in existing studies often inappropriately homogenize populations (Agyemang, Bhopal, &
Bypassed the quest for appropriate nomenclature and term “White” and its synonym “Caucasian” have largely been used (McKenzie & Crowcroft, 1996). While the understanding among research communities of the taxonomic used (McKenzie & Crowcroft, 1996). Some scientists have argued for phasing out “the color term Black” for concealing heterogeneity and being racially charged to favor more meaningful and detailed categories (Agyemang et al., 2005; Aspinall, 2011). For example, by using African as a prefix for other ethnic labels such as African Caribbean or African American. However, because many people who are presumed to share ethnic background do not identify as African or share common heritage, the issue of concealment of heterogeneity of some groups remains. This also introduces the issue of aggregating racially and ethnically differing people who identify as African. Population studies have found no clear preference or consensus for either “Black or African American” among the people directly affected by this terminology. There is however a seemingly universal recognition in the group representation of the term “Black,” and a global acceptance among populations as it is increasingly used in social trends and powerful campaigns such as “Black History Month” and “Black Lives Matter.” Given that people are diverse, and ethnicity is dynamic, often self-classified, sometimes presumed, and a source of continuing debate, it has become increasingly challenging to interpret the results of studies that use these labels to homogenize disparate groups of people into collectivities (Aspinall, 2002; Bhopal & Donaldson, 1998; Cole, 1993; Polenberg, 1980). Adding to the challenge are globalization and migration, eroding the boundaries that once “segmented” group culture. This review reflects on these challenges to synthesize the current literature regarding what is known about the people that studies have described as “Black” and those researching them, and how these participants have perceived and experienced dementia and its care options and whether there are “cultural” nuances that explain their interaction with this illness. Culture is a challenging and dynamic concept, which varies largely between societies and within social groups. It does not necessarily apply to everyone in a particular culture (Corin, 1995). It is also a dimension of ethnicity that is related to ideas of race in that they denote membership of a social group in which members share presumed and/or apparent similarities that distinguish them from other groups (Bradby, 1995; Zenner, 1996).

In this review, we used the idea of cultural nuance to denote what might have distinguished the population under review from other groups within specific societies. Our research questions were:

1. “How do BAC adults with dementia, their families, and other stakeholders perceive, understand, and experience dementia and dementia care services?”
2. “What do we know about the ethnic and cultural identity of the participants and researchers in the included studies?”
Methods
We conducted a review of qualitative literature using systematic procedures to answer our first research question mentioned above.

To address our second research question, we elicited from the included papers any ethnic and cultural description of (i) participants, (ii) researchers, and (iii) explicit report of including the perspective of a person with lived experience of the ethnic and culture being examined in analyses; and (iv) author contact details.

Search Strategy
The study main search strategy was concluded in September 2018 and updated in October 2019 by using the following electronic databases: PsychINFO, EMBASE, Medline/PubMed, Social Care Online, Web of Science, CINAHL, Cochrane, OpenGrey, Ethos, and Google Scholar. We developed our search terms in consultation with stakeholders who were carers of people with dementia and self-identified as Black British and Caribbean (n = 2) and Alzheimer’s Society representatives (n = 3). They were: “dementia,” “Alzheimer,” “Black,” “BME,” “BAME,” “ethnic,” “Culturally Diverse Communities,” “CALD” (Culturally and Linguistically Diverse). Each of these key words and phrases was used singly and in combination using the Boolean operator “AND” and “OR.” Our initial search terms included “African” and “Caribbean” which were removed as they did not yield any additional relevant studies. We augmented our electronic search with backward and forward reference searching of included articles and carried out manual searches in books (Khan et al., 2015; Torres, 2019). Once we concluded searching for all potential articles, a database alert system was designed to capture new publications. Four eligible studies were identified from the database alerts and all searches were concluded in October 2019.

Study Selection
Inclusion criteria
We included studies that responded to our research question and distinguished the views and experiences of dementia of BAC participants from those of other ethnic groups. We only included papers reporting qualitative research as this was the methodology that was appropriate to our research question. No restrictions were applied for dates of publication and locations. We only included studies in English and French. We excluded reviews, conference proceedings, and media articles.

Screening and data extraction
M. Roche and J. Aworinde screened titles and abstracts separately, in accordance with the inclusion criteria. Any discrepancies were resolved through discussion with the other authors. All papers judged relevant to the aims of the review were read in full and data extracted as shown in Table 2.

Quality assessment
We assessed the quality of included studies using CASP Qualitative Checklist Section A (CASP, 2018), which comprises six items, listed below:
1. Was there a clear statement of the aims of the research?
2. Is a qualitative methodology appropriate?
3. Was the research design appropriate to address the aims of the research?
4. Was the recruitment strategy appropriate to address the aims of the research?
5. Were the data collected in a way that addressed the research issue?
6. Has the relationship between researcher and participants been adequately considered?

We assigned a maximum of one point per item, with possible scores ranging from 0 (lowest quality) to 6 (highest quality) (see Table 1). We did not exclude low-quality studies as there is no consensus and limited evidence on how to approach exclusion of qualitative studies from reviews on the basis of quality (Campbell et al., 2012; Lawrence, Fossey, Ballard, Moniz-Cook, & Murray, 2012; Thomas & Harden, 2008).

Analysis
We were guided by Thomas and Harden (2008) recommendations on synthesizing qualitative research. Using thematic analysis, we analyzed key data from the result sections of included papers. By key data, we intended to include direct quotations from BAC participants, which we prioritized over researchers’ interpretations. M. Roche and J. Aworinde independently free-coded the extracted data line by line according to the review question using NVivo12. To begin, we coded data for each country separately to check for patterns of differences, which we did not find. We developed a coding framework. We looked for similarities and differences between codes to group them into themes, while creating new codes to capture the meanings of groups of initial codes. Finally, through iterative and reflexive processes of comparisons and interpretations, we inferred higher order meanings from our themes, which we captured in more abstract and analytical concepts about how people of BAC ethnicity understand and experience dementia and its care options.

We included in our analysis data from all participants described as Black, African, and Caribbean, combined with American, British, and French.

To determine extent to which studies were informed by BAC people, we first reviewed whether studies reported involving recruiters/interviewers and authors whose ethnicities matched those of participants. Where this
information was not available, we contacted corresponding authors to ask which members of the authorship team self-identified as being of BAC background. For papers we received no response, we searched Google, ResearchGate, and universities’ websites to which authors were affiliated to verify whether this information was available or determinable from their profiles. Where researchers’ biography did not specify their ethnicity, we made a determination based on appearance (skin color, facial features, hair texture). We reported this, after having considered carefully the ethics of making this judgment, given that presumed and/or assigned ethnicity, albeit widely used, can differ to self-identified ethnicity (Torres, 2019). We appreciate that this approach can be seen as problematic.

Table 1. Quality Assessment of Included Studies Using the Critical Appraisal Skills Programme—Qualitative Checklist—Section A—Validity

| Papers                          | Quality control |
|--------------------------------|-----------------|
|                                | 1   | 2   | 3   | 4*  | 5*  | 6*  | Total score |
| Adamson (2001)                 | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Adamson & Donovan (2005)       | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Lawrence et al. (2008)         | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Lawrence et al. (2011)         | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0   | 4.5          |
| Mukadam et al. (2011)          | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Berwald et al. (2016)          | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0   | 5            |
| Cheston et al. (2017)          | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Sterritt & Pokorny (1998)      | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0   | 0.5 | 3.5          |
| Fox et al. (1999)              | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Lampley-Dallas et al. (2001)   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 1   | 0.5 | 5            |
| Clutterbuck & Mahoney (2003)   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Belgrave et al. (2004)         | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 6            |
| Toth-Cohen (2004)              | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Jett (2006)                    | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0   | 0   | 3.5          |
| Gerdner et al. (2007)          | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0.5 | 4.5          |
| Vickrey et al. (2007)          | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 1   | 0.5 | 5            |
| Gerdner & Simpson (2009)       | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 6            |
| Hughes et al. (2009)           | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Stansbury, Harley, et al. (2010)| 1  | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0   | 4.5          |
| Stansbury, Marshall, et al. (2010)| 1 | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0   | 4.5          |
| Sullivan & Beard (2014)        | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Roberts et al. (2015)          | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Lindauer et al. (2016)         | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 6            |
| Potter et al. (2017)           | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| Moss et al. (2018)             | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 6            |
| Epps et al. (2019)             | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 0   | 4            |
| van Wezel et al. (2016)        | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 0.5 | 5.5          |
| van Wezel et al. (2018)        | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 1   | 0.5 | 5.5          |

Note: Partial point was given if studies did not match recruiter–participant ethnicity, for example, by making use of Black informant/recruiter/interviewer in addition to standard methodology or failed to address the potential influence on findings of the ethnic discordance between researcher and participant.
and culture are all contingent, combining both subjectivist and objectivist approaches (Brubaker, 2016); however, identifications of race and ethnicity also draw on commonplace assumptions which are readily socially understandable and are used in the framing of research questions in this area of research. We have used this later “general sense” of race and ethnicity, not as a scientific category but rather as a way of further interrogating our research data. Additionally, the authors of BAC ethnicity of this paper considered that on balance this methodology was preferable to drawing a likely erroneous conclusion that a person with lived experience of BAC ethnicity was not involved in analysis of a paper, if in publicly available data their appearance was clearly consistent with having this experience.

Our review team consisted of four researchers of different backgrounds. M. Roche self-identifies as French Black Caribbean; P. Higgs as White Irish; J. Aworinde as Black British of African descent; and C. Cooper as White British.

Results
Study Characteristics and Quality Appraisal
Figure 1 describes our search results. Table 1 shows the quality scores for each paper, which ranged between 3.5 and 6, with only four papers scoring full marks.

We included 28 papers about 25 studies conducted in United Kingdom (n = 7), United States (n = 17), and the Netherlands (n = 1). Study characteristics are described in Table 2. Seventeen papers were specific to people of BAC background with the majority from United States (n = 16) and one from United Kingdom. The majority of papers involved carers (n = 24), while only six articles included people with dementia and six involved members of the public. Three papers used a combination of observational with focus group methodology (Belgrave, Allen-Kelsey, Smith, & Flores, 2004) or interviews (Gerdner, Tripp-Reimer, & Simpson, 2007; Lindauer, Harvath, Berry, & Wros, 2016). The remaining papers used individual qualitative interviews or focus groups.

Ethnicity of participants
Only four papers provided a definition for the ethnic groups included (Adamson & Donovan, 2005; Fox, Hinton, & Levkoff, 1999; van Wezel et al., 2016, 2018). In total, the studies included elicited views from 492 people described as being of BAC ethnicity. Most (n = 350; 71%) were described as African American, in U.S.-based studies. In U.K. studies, participants were described as Caribbean (n = 45), as African/Caribbean (n = 44), African (n = 28), Black British (n = 7), or Indo-Caribbean (n = 1); and in the study from the Netherlands, participants were described as Surinamese Creole (n = 17). It was not possible to ascertain the number of participants of BAC ethnicity in two studies (Belgrave et al., 2004; Cheston et al., 2017). In the United Kingdom, where the origins of people of BAC ethnicity vary, only two studies reported participants’ background information (Berwald, Roche, Adelman, Mukadam, & Livingston, 2016; Lawrence, Samsi, Banerjee, Morgan, & Murray, 2011), with three not distinguishing African from Caribbean (Adamson, 2001; Adamson & Donovan, 2005; Mukadam, Cooper, Basit, & Livingston, 2011). In United States, most African Americans are African descents, but from various part of Africa and the World (Tishkoff et al., 2009); background details of participants were not provided in any of the studies.

Ethnicity of researchers
Arrangements to involve recruiters and/or interviewers with similar backgrounds as participants were reported in 6/25 (24%) of studies (Belgrave et al., 2004; Gerdner & Simpson, 2009; Gerdner et al., 2007; Lamplay-Dallas, Mold, & Flori, 2001; Lindauer et al., 2016; van Wezel et al., 2016, 2018; Vickrey et al., 2007). We obtained confirmation of authors’ ethnicities for 12/28 (43%) of papers. Our analysis of the authors listed on the papers included, showed that 11/25 (44%) of studies involved at least one author who self-identified or was considered likely to be of Black ethnicity (Belgrave et al., 2004; Berwald et al., 2016; Cheston et al., 2017; Cloutterbuck & Mahoney, 2003; Epps, Rose, & Ruth, 2019; Fox et al., 1999; Gerdner & Simpson, 2009; Gerdner et al., 2007; Hughes, Tyler, Danner, & Carter, 2009; Lamplay-Dallas et al., 2001; Moss et al., 2018; Stansbury, Harley, &
| Author & location | Aims | Total participants (any ethnicity) | Total Black participants and characteristics |
|-------------------|------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|
| Adamson (2001); United Kingdom | To explore awareness, recognition, and understanding of dementia | 30 | 18 carers BAC, SA 15F; 3M |
| Adamson & Donovan (2005); United Kingdom | To explore experiences of informal caring for older relative with dementia | 36 | 21 carers BAC, SA (1) |
| Lawrence et al. (2008); United Kingdom | To explore attitudes, experiences, and needs of carers of people with dementia | 32 | 10 carers BC, SA, WB 9F; 1M |
| Lawrence et al. (2011); United Kingdom | To explore attitudes, experiences, and beliefs of dementia | 30 PwD | 11 PwD BC, SA, WB 8F; 3M |
| Mukadam et al. (2011); United Kingdom | To explore beliefs and attitudes to help-seeking for dementia | 18 | 5 carers BA/BC, SA, W, Ao, Chi (1) |
| Berwald et al. (2016); United Kingdom | To identify barriers to help-seeking for memory problems | 50 | 42 members of the public BA, BC, BB, 1IndoC 4 PwD 4 carers 30F; 20M |
| Cheston et al. (2017); United Kingdom | To establish dementia experiences and needs of people BME | 48 (1) | 2 PwD BC, SA, Chi 8 carers (1) members of the public |
| Sterritt & Pokorny (1998); United States | To explore meaning of caregiving to AA caregivers of relatives with Alzheimer’s disease | 9 | 9 carers AA 9F |
| Fox et al. (1999); United States | How race and ethnicity matter in recognition, meaning, and responses to dementia in AA caregivers? | 10 | 10 carers AA (1) |
| Lampley-Dallas et al. (2001); United States | To assess perceived needs of AA caregivers of people with dementia and expectations of health care system | 13 | 13 carers AA 11F; 2M |
| Cloutterbuck & Mahoney (2003); United States | To explore perceptions and experiences of AA caregivers in getting dementia diagnosis for relatives | 7 | 7 carers AA 5F; 2M |
| Belgrave et al. (2004); United States | Explanations of Alzheimer’s disease from perspectives of AA carers and patients | 36 families | 41 carers AA (1) PwD |
| Toth-Cohen (2004); United States | To explore factors that may influence appraisal of upset in Black caregivers of people with dementia in response to relatives’ memory and behavior problems | 15 | 15 carers AA 12F; 3M |
| Jett (2006); United States | To discover the cultural and linguistic variations in the definition, recognition, explanation of, and response to, dementia as it is experienced in the AA community | 14 | 14 members of the public AA 13F; 1M |
| Gerdner et al. (2007); United States | To describe experience of AA caregiver understanding of chronic confusion and experience of family caregiving | 15 carers | 15 carers AA 11F; 4M |
| Vickrey et al. (2007); United States | To explore contrasts and commonalities in caregiving experiences across four racial/ethnic groups, and to obtain data to aid in designing future interventions to improve the quality of dementia care | 47 carers | 19 carers AA, W, His, Chi 34F; 13M |
| Gerdner & Simpson (2009); United States | To explore the primary concerns related the elder’s condition and access to and use of health and community services | 15 | 15 carers AA 11F; 4M |
Brown-Hughes, 2010; Stansbury, Marshall, Harley, & Nelson, 2010). Most of these (8/11) had a Black first or last author. Just over a quarter (3/11) considered the influence that their own ethnicity might have played in the formulation of the research outcome and reporting (Belgrave et al., 2004; Gerdner & Simpson, 2009; Moss et al., 2018). In total, just over half (14/25; 56%) of studies appeared to involve a Black person in the study procedures and analysis. While we accept that making racial and ethnic determination for those who did not reply to our request or who did not reveal this information could be regarded as problematic, this was necessary in order to highlight that current research knowledge of BAC perceptions and experience of dementia is largely approached and reported from an outsider’s perspective.
Themes

We identified four key themes that responded to our research question: “How do BAC adults with dementia or cognitive impairment, their families and other stakeholders perceive, understand, and experience dementia and dementia care services?”

These were: 1. Dementia does not relate to me, 2. Inappropriate and disrespectful services, 3. Kinship and responsibility, and 4. Importance of religion. All these themes were consistently present in papers conducted in the United Kingdom and United States where the majority of studies were conducted. Themes 2 and 4 were present in the Netherlands where only one study was conducted.

Dementia does not relate to me

Some people believed that dementia did not affect “Black people,” as they are not “seen” in the media and other outlets as a population at risk of developing the condition, or that it did not apply to their family:

When you talk about dementia... this is a White, old White people’s disease, it’s not seen as Black people have dementia. [BC man-UK] (Berwald et al., 2016)

I did not know, I was just talking about this with my brother before mama, I don’t think I had heard about it at all . . . ahh . . . I didn’t ask questions or nothing because it was not something that applied to me and my family, I did not really get into it before mama got it. [AA woman carer-USA] (Hughes et al., 2009)

Despite having heard of dementia people did not view it as a risk for their racial and ethnic group. This may indicate that people ascribe racial and ethnic attributes to illnesses based on how they are represented and whether they are encountered in their surroundings.

Inappropriate and disrespectful services

Services were viewed as constructed by and for White people, and even events that sought to be inclusive were often experienced as tokenistic occasions where ethnicity was objectified.

I spoke to someone because I said, “I don’t think Mummy’s whole needs are being met, with regards the cultural...” She’s happy, don’t get me wrong. And a few months ago, they did a Jamaican Day for her, but it was a Jamaican Day that involved all White people. Don’t get me wrong; they did their best; it was a great gesture. I appreciated it . . . but it would be great if someone within the system, the service ... that I could find someone of West Indian background who could just sit with Mummy, talk with Mummy, be there with her. [BC woman carer-UK] (Cheston et al., 2017)

...they didn’t help me at all when it came to keeping over his things. That was a constant fight the whole time I was there ... that was the most devastating thing ... I shaved and cut his hair for awhile then they finally started shaving him. . . Those were important to me. It might not have meant anything to them, but I would tell them, “This is all I have. This is my husband. This is my baby. This is my all, and I want you to treat him as such. Treat him like a human being. Don’t throw him off in his room and fail to come see about him . . . Don’t scold him, don’t ever scold him. And just treat him like a human being even though he can’t relate to you.” [AA woman carer-USA] (Lampley-Dallas et al., 2001)

Dissatisfaction with health and social care services was high and reports of positive experiences were rare. Staff members were often perceived as unhelpful, unprofessional, and rude.

Welfare workers are the rudest people in the world. ...People who work for the State are just rude. ...They had me characterized when I went in there....I would never want to be involved with [welfare department] again. I refuse to go back there for help ever again. [AA man carer-USA] (Fox et al., 1999)

We got this negative attitude from the doctor that led me to taking him out of that facility and looking for another one. And then there was another one and we ended up in another. [AA unclear-USA] (Cloutterbuck & Mahoney, 2003)

But sometimes you go to the doctor; they don’t even have time for you. As you go in they write something, you haven’t got time. [BC woman-UK] (Berwald et al., 2016)

Kinship and responsibility

Where formal services fell short, needs for support were often met by a high reliance on kin, including family, friend, community, and churches. Caring for a relative was valued as a cultural trait and viewed as an act of love, an altruistic expression of respect and reciprocation for earlier care received:

...but the way we were brought up is that you look after your own sort of thing. We’ve always done that, we never sort of think about it cause you think to yourself, “gosh what are people going to think, that I don’t care about her” you just do it automatically cause it’s part of our culture, more or less you know, you don’t think of it or any other way really.” [...] "You’ve got to remind yourself, well you know, it’s your mother, she gave up an awful lot for you, you know, it’s small enough to do for her I don’t think you can ever repay your mother for what she’s done, I don’t think you can—but you can go some way towards showing her that you do care about her and you do appreciate her and all the things she’s done I do it for my mother, out of sheer, because I love her and care...
for, care about her, not because of totally what she did. [BA/BC woman carer-UK] (Adamson & Donovan, 2005)

Look, where Surinamese people come from, the elderly are part of the family and stay part of it until they die. And whatever happens to them, whatever mental or physical condition they end up in later, the family should deal with it. Because they did the same for you when they were fit and strong. It’s a kind of repayment. [Surinamese Creole woman carer-NL] (van Wezel et al., 2016)

Well, I do it out of love. And the reward is that I do have her, even though she has this (disease). I wake up to her (in the house). [AA carer-USA] (Sterritt & Pokorny, 1998)

Even when this reliance on kin was onerous or costly, it transcended other obligations:

…I could never put my mother in a nursing home. I would just have to quit working before I’d put her in a nursing home. [AA carer-USA] (Gerdner & Simpson, 2009)

I’m there for her at any time at any, you know, which is really important, it’s not that you’re coming in, and out, and the time she needs someone, there won’t be anyone there, so I think I’m doing an excellent job for her ...some people would like to be independent to do some . . . try to do some things but you never know what they can do that will hurt them, really, so I think that when you are there throughout, it really helps. [BC woman carer-UK] (Lawrence, Murray, Samsi, & Banerjee, 2008)

There are moments when the care does weigh heavily on me. The moments when I see she is suffering, in particular. Those are tough. Not tough in the sense of physically tiring or whatever, not at all. It’s her suffering that weighs most heavily. [Surinamese Creole woman carer-NL] (van Wezel et al., 2016)

My brother sold his home ... and he moved here. So everybody’s trying to help. [AA carer-USA] (Lampley-Dallas et al., 2001)

Carers were willing to go through great lengths and endure considerable hardships to care for an older relative. It appeared that this was done out of love and respect and was not experienced as being burdensome in itself. although it was challenging for respondents to see their relative suffering, it was unclear from our data whether this level of caring was expected by the older relative receiving the care.

Importance of religion

Spirituality and faith were often part of the context in which people understood and experienced dementia, and a source of healing and strength:

Well I think it’s a duty, because I think the lord have given me that problem, because he sends us here and we have to do a job. [BA/BC woman carer-UK] (Adamson & Donovan, 2005)

Every morning when I wake up, I pray and I hope that she’s still there. I get a lot out of it. [Surinamese Creole woman carer-NL] (van Wezel et al., 2016)

I believe that you can be healed through faith, but you must have that faith yourself. I don’t think nobody else can pray and heal you unless you have faith. I believe you have to have that faith before the illness [cognitive impairment] comes on you because if you can’t remember, you can’t ask God for forgiveness and to give you faith. [AA carer-USA] (Gerdner et al., 2007)

“I just put my trust in the good Lord, and He’ll give you strength,” and “When I’m tired and frustrated, I pray to God to give me the strength to deal with her.” [AA carer-USA] (Sterritt & Pokorny, 1998)

We found that there were many references to religion and to god. This finding, however, might have been influenced by the researchers’ choice of a religion or spirituality research topic given that a number of the studies specifically explored or addressed religion.

Discussion

The focus of this review was to foreground nuance and “cultural” distinctiveness as well as the typicality of how BAC adults understand and experience dementia and dementia care services. To our knowledge, this is the first systematic review analyzing this topic and which takes the racial and ethnic context in which studies were conducted into consideration. We found that dementia in relation to ethnicity is largely researched within a context of ethnic discordance between participants and investigators. The terms used to describe the ethnic and cultural grouping of study populations vary across locations, which made synthesizing and interpreting study findings difficult. In light of these difficulties, we identified four key themes that carried cultural overtones and characterized how the people studies described as “Black” understood and experienced dementia.

It emerged from the data that the risk of developing dementia went unacknowledged because some people viewed it as an “old White people’s disease [as] it is not seen as Black people have dementia” (Berwald et al., 2016; Cheston et al., 2017). Such belief coheres with the lack of racial and ethnic diversity in public health resources and the media in the representation of dementia, which contrasts greatly with other chronic condition such as HIV where portrayal of African Americans prevails over other ethnic groups (Clarke, McLellan, & Hoffman-Goetz, 2006; Stevens & Hull, 2013). Generally, low dementia literacy
is correlated with ethnicity and reported to be prevalent in BAC populations and proposed as an explanation for beliefs that depart from the medical model of dementia (Ayalon & Areán, 2004; Mukadam et al., 2011; Mukadam, Waugh, Cooper, & Livingston, 2015; Werner, Goldstein, Karpas, Chan, & Lai, 2014; Werner, Mittelman, Goldstein, & Heinik, 2012). However, we did not find evidence of unusually low levels of dementia understanding in this review that had not been reported in other ethnic groups in studies conducted in France (Breining et al., 2014), Istanbul (Şahin et al., 2006), Ireland (McParland, Devine, Innes, & Gayle, 2012), and Australia (Bettens, Ownsworth, Hohaus, & McKendry, 2014). In fact, most participants included in this review had heard of dementia before being involved in a diagnosis process. Thus, ethnic affiliation does not appear to be a reliable factor in determining understanding of dementia.

We report consistently negative evaluation and experience of health and social care services, which contrasted to positive experiences of the care received from or provided by the immediate social network. Bad experiences, service provision inequalities, anticipated discrimination, structural disadvantages, mistrust, and poor patient–provider relationship all contributed to delays and discouragements in accessing resources. Formal support was often viewed as failing to provide adequate services to BAC families, even when tokenistic efforts attempted to conceal the lack of diversity and cultural adaptation of services. Previous studies have reported adverse experiences with health and social care services in minority ethnic groups as barriers to help-seeking for dementia (Berwald et al., 2016; Cloutterbuck & Mahoney, 2003; Hinton, Franz, & Friend, 2004). Acknowledging the “invisibility” of Black older people in dementia and social care services, others have called for policies prioritizing the development of appropriate services to meet the needs of this population (Moriarty, Sharif, & Robinson, 2011). To be effective, these policies will need to recognize that people of BAC ethnicity share strong family values and norms about the responsibility of the family to care, respect, and protect the older adults (Werner et al., 2014). Because family/close social network influence can act both as a facilitator and a deterrent to accessing services (Werner et al., 2014), service providers should look toward fostering collaboration with family members and building relationship with communities.

We also found that religiosity was important in understanding and managing dementia as people drew strength and support in prayer and religion. There were expectations of positive outcome, relief even healing from the burden of dementia in the association with God and their churches. Previous studies have shown similar strong endorsement of religious coping patterns and engagement with religion in dealing with memory problems in African Americans (Chatters, Taylor, Jackson, & Lincoln, 2008; Sullivan & Beard, 2014).

The reliance on kin for care, support, and respite was also an important aspect of managing dementia. BAC carers experience less emotional burden from caring for relative with dementia than their White counterparts, despite sharing similar physical health effects of caregiving (Covinsky et al., 2003; Roth, Haley, Owen, Clay, & Goode, 2001; Siegler, Brummett, Williams, Haney, & Dilworth-Anderson, 2010). They tend to find more satisfaction in their caregiver role than White caregivers (Sörensen & Pinquart, 2005). Work on anticipatory grief suggests that African American carers retain a strong emotional attachment to their relative right through the trajectory of dementia, whereas their White counterparts detach emotionally before their relative with dementia die (Ross & Dagley, 2009).

Taken together, these findings suggest that cultural characteristics may be a function of the differential evaluation of the caregiver role and religious endorsement, which likely can raise the threshold for coping with the burden of dementia. Understanding the importance of religiosity and family in BAC families may be critical in engaging with this group. In the United Kingdom, Black older adults are still invisible in dementia services despite multiple campaigns and advocacy activities (Moriarty et al., 2011; Truswell, 2013), which indicates that intervention procedures need to better target their efforts if they are to meet the needs of BAC older adults with dementia and their families.

**Implications**

If research and practice are to create truly effective culturally tailored interventions and services for minority ethnic populations, they must be able to describe and distinguish the ethnicity and cultural backgrounds of these populations. Until now, studies have tended to homogenize minority populations in their analyses and reporting which renders interpreting their findings challenging and often blurring cultural nuances. For example, in United Kingdom, the BME classification includes people who have various origins and cultures, such as African from different parts of the African continent and Caribbean from multiple islands. The BME label also includes South Asians (from Pakistan, India, Sri Lanka, and Bangladesh), White other than White British, and other minority populations. Classification devices and labels are useful in research as in practice, as they can help understand commonalities and differences and provide some indications of broad characteristics of the populations being discussed. However, they should not vitiate the need for background details and additional information about people as these are often more relevant and descriptive of individuals than predefined categories and labels. Both research and practice must exercise caution when considering study findings as they might not apply to all individuals included in a given group.

The large proportion of included studies was conducted by researchers who had little in common with participants. Just over half (56%) of studies investigating experiences of dementia of adults from BAC ethnicity appeared to consult or involve a person who self-identified as coming...
from a BAC background during the study procedures or analysis. There is much debate about the insider–outsider perspective in research, particularly in research into race and ethnicity, and the need for a recognition of the advantages and disadvantages of occupying either position, including the notion of the space between that challenges the dichotomy of insider versus outsider status (Beoku-Betts, 1994; Collins, 2002; Dwyer & Buckle, 2009; Flores, 2018; Serrant-Green, 2002). In conducting qualitative research it is essential to create and maintain a context in which participants feel comfortable enough to share freely with researchers and ensure actual or anticipated obstacles are kept to a minimum, whether it be about communication, language, cultural competence, and more (Bonner & Tolhurst, 2002). This matters because matching racial makeup between participant and investigator has positive effects on accuracy and relevance of findings as relational intimacy and understanding of group culture facilitate communication and comprehension of meanings and nuances (Bonner & Tolhurst, 2002; Botsford, 2015). Researchers should consider when investigating ethnicity in relation to dementia that participants often feel more comfortable and willing to speak to a researcher who share similar backgrounds as them. Clearly, there is much strength in fostering commonality and shared values between researcher and participant to gain easier access to richer quality data, which is an essential aspect in qualitative research.

Much of research about Black and other minority ethnic groups is conducted within a context that makes assumptions about racial and ethnic identities and categories. Furthermore, these assumptions are extended to attributes, characteristics, behaviors, and practices that are found in studies in this field. Such framing can implicitly or even explicitly determine the direction of research as well as have an impact on the presentation and interpretation of findings. This may occur even when other more important factors may be at play. Therefore, we would suggest that researchers need to be aware of the contextual nature of the categories that they are using in this field of study if their findings are going to be culturally, racially, or ethnically meaningful.

Dementia in relation to ethnicity has largely been studied in the context of help-seeking and within a biomedical model which have firmly situated people of BAC ethnicity in an unfavorable position. The majority of studies we included were conducted by research team members whose racial and ethnic profiles did not match those of the participants. In the light of the stark underrepresentation of BAC people in the research community, this is very telling that even most research about BAC experiences does not involve researchers from BAC background. Themes of dementia diagnosis and services feeling less relevant to participants than the majority population resonated across studies. We caution against racializing these findings, which may apply to many minority groups.

Funding
This research was supported by funding from Alzheimer’s Society (grant number 404 AS-PhD-17b-007).

Conflict of Interest
We have no conflict of interest to declare.

References
Adamson, J. (2001). Awareness and understanding of dementia in African/Caribbean and South Asian families. Health & Social Care in the Community, 9, 391–396. doi:10.1046/j.0966-0410.2001.00321.x
Adamson, J., & Donovan, J. (2005). “Normal disruption”: South Asian and African/Caribbean relatives caring for an older family member in the UK. Social Science & Medicine, 60, 37–48. doi:10.1016/j.socscimed.2004.05.002
Adelman, S., Blanchard, M., Rait, G., Leafy, G., & Livingston, G. (2011). Prevalence of dementia in African-Caribbean compared with UK-born White older people: Two-stage cross-sectional study. The British Journal of Psychiatry, 199, 119–125. doi:10.1192/bjp.bp.110.086405
Agymang, C., Bhopal, R., & Brujinzeel, M. (2005). Negro, Black, Black African, African Caribbean, African American or what? Labelling African origin populations in the health arena in the 21st century. Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health, 59, 1014–1018. doi:10.1136/jech.2005.035964
Aspinall, P. J. (2002). Collective terminology to describe the minority ethnic population the persistence of confusion and ambiguity in usage. Sociology, 36, 803–816. doi:10.1177/003803850203600401
Aspinall, P. J. (2011). The utility and validity for public health of ethnicity categorization in the 1991, 2001 and 2011 British Censuses. Public health, 125, 680–687. doi:10.1016/j.puhe.2011.05.001
Ayalon, L., & Areán, P. A. (2004). Knowledge of Alzheimer’s disease in four ethnic groups of older adults. International Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry, 19, 51–57. doi:10.1002/gps.1037
Belgrave, L. L., Allen-Kelsey, G. J., Smith, K. J., & Flores, M. C. (2004). Living with dementia: Lay definitions of Alzheimer’s disease among African American caregivers and sufferers. Symbolic Interaction, 27, 199–222. doi:10.1525/si.2004.27.2.199
Beoku-Betts, J. (1994). When black is not enough: Doing field research among Gullah women. NWSA Journal, 6, 413–433. www.jstor.org/stable/4316353
Berwald, S., Roche, M., Adelman, S., Mukadam, N., & Livingston, G. (2016). Black African and Caribbean British Communities’ perceptions of memory problems: “We don’t do dementia.”. PLoS One, 11, e0151878. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0151878
Bettens, G. F., Ownsworth, T., Hohaus, L., & McKendry, Y. (2014). Assessing accuracy of knowledge of cognitive effects of normal ageing and mild stage of Alzheimer’s disease. Aging & Mental Health, 18, 296–303. doi:10.1080/13607863.2013.827629
Bhopal, R., & Donaldson, L. (1998). White, European, Western, Caucasian, or what? Inappropriate labeling in research on race, ethnicity, and health. American Journal of Public Health, 88, 1303–1307. doi:10.2105/ajph.88.9.1303
Lampey-Dallas, V. T., Mold, J. W., & Flori, D. E. (2001). Perceived needs of African-American caregivers of elders with dementia. *Journal of the National Medical Association, 93*, 47–57.

Lawrence, V., Fossey, J., Ballard, C., Moniz-Cook, E., & Murray, J. (2012). Improving quality of life for people with dementia in care homes: Making psychosocial interventions work. *The British Journal of Psychiatry, 201*, 344–351. doi:10.1192/bjp.bp.111.104102

Lawrence, V., Murray, J., Samsi, K., & Banerjee, S. (2008). Attitudes and support needs of Black Caribbean, south Asian and White British carers of people with dementia in the UK. *The British Journal of Psychiatry, 193*, 240–246. doi:10.1192/bjp.bp.107.045187

Lawrence, V., Samsi, K., Banerjee, S., Morgan, C., & Murray, J. (2011). Threat to valued elements of life: The experience of dementia across three ethnic groups. *The Gerontologist, 51*, 39–50. doi:10.1093/geront/gnq073

Lindauer, A., Harvath, T. A., Berry, P. H., & Wros, P. (2016). The meanings African American caregivers ascribe to dementia-related changes: The paradox of hanging on to loss. *The Gerontologist, 56*, 733–742. doi:10.1093/geront/gnv023

Mayeda, E. R., Glymour, M. M., Quenselben, C. P., & Whitmer, R. A. (2016). Inequalities in dementia incidence between six racial and ethnic groups over 14 years. *Alzheimer's & Dementia, 12*, 216–224. doi:10.1016/j.jalz.2015.12.007

McKenzie, K., & Crowcroft, N. S. (1994). Race, ethnicity, culture, and science. *BMJ, 309*, 286–287. doi:10.1136/bmj.309.6950.286

McKenzie, K., & Crowcroft, N. S. (1996). Describing race, ethnicity, and culture in medical research. *BMJ, 312*, 1054. doi:10.1136/bmj.312.7038.1054

McParland, P., Devine, P., Innes, A., & Gayle, V. (2012). Dementia knowledge and attitudes of the general public in Northern Ireland: An analysis of national survey data. *International Psychogeriatrics, 24*, 1600–1613. doi:10.1017/S1041610212000658

Mehta, K. M., & Yeo, G. W. (2017). Systematic review of dementia prevalence and incidence in United States race/ethnic populations. *Alzheimer's & Dementia, 13*, 72–83. doi:10.1016/j.jalz.2016.06.2360

Moriarty, J., Sharif, N., & Robinson, J. (2011). Black and minority ethnic people with dementia and their access to support and services. London: Social Care Institute for Excellence.

Moss, K. O., Deutsch, N. L., Hollen, P. J., Rovnyak, V. G., Williams, I. C., & Rose, K. M. (2018). Understanding end-of-life decision-making terminology among African American older adults. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing, 44*, 33–40. doi:10.3928/00981831-20171002-02

Mukadam, N., Cooper, C., Basit, B., & Livingston, G. (2011). Why do ethnic elders present later to UK dementia services? A qualitative study. *International Psychogeriatrics, 23*, 1070–1077. doi:10.1017/S1041610211000214

Mukadam, N., Waugh, A., Cooper, C., & Livingston, G. (2015). What would encourage help-seeking for memory problems amongst South Asians? A qualitative study. *International Psychogeriatrics, 25*, e007990. doi:10.1177/1041610215007990

Ortman, J. M., Velkoff, V. A., & Hogan, H. (2014). *An aging nation: The older population in the United States*. Washington, DC: U.S. Census Bureau.

Pham, T. M., Petersen, I., Walters, K., Raine, R., Manthorpe, J., Mukadam, N., & Cooper, C. (2018). Trends in dementia diagnosis rates in UK ethnic groups: Analysis of UK primary care data. *Clinical Epidemiology, 10*, 949–960. doi:10.2147/CLEP.S12647

Polenberg, R. (1980). *One nation divisible: Class, race, and ethnicity in the United States since 1938* (Vol. 7). London: Penguin Books.

Porter, E. C., Roberto, K. A., Brossio, N., & Blieszner, R. (2017). Decisions, decisions: African American families’ responses to mild cognitive impairment. *Research on Aging, 39(4)*, 476–500. doi:10.1177/0160407516655581

Roberts, L. R., Schuh, H., Sherzai, D., Belliard, J. C., & Montgomery, S. B. (2015). Exploring experiences and perceptions of aging and cognitive decline across diverse racial and ethnic groups. *Gerontology and Geriatric Medicine, 1*, 2333721415596101. doi:10.1177/2333721415596101

Ross, A., & Dagley, J. C. (2009). An assessment of anticipatory grief as experienced by family caregivers of individuals with dementia. *Alzheimer's Care Today, 10*, 8–21. doi:10.1097/ACQ.0b013e3181979427a

Roth, D. L., Haley, W. E., Owen, J. E., Clay, O. J., & Goode, K. T. (2001). Latent growth models of the longitudinal effects of dementia caregiving: A comparison of African American and White family caregivers. *Psychology and Aging, 16*, 427–436. doi:10.1037/0882-7974.16.3.427

Şahin, H. A., Gurvit, I. H., Emre, M., Hanagasi, H. A., Bilgic, B., & Harmanci, H. (2006). The attitude of elderly lay people towards the symptoms of dementia. *International Psychogeriatrics, 18*, 251–258. doi:10.1017/S1041610205002784

Serrant-Green, L. (2002). Methodological issues for black researchers working in minority ethnicity. *Nurse Researcher, 9*, 4. doi:10.7748/nnr.9.3.4.s2

Siegler, I. C., Brummett, B. H., Williams, R. B., Haney, T. L., & Dilworth-Anderson, P. (2010). Caregiving, residence, race, and depressive symptoms. *Aging & Mental Health, 14*, 771–778. doi:10.1080/136078608021371325

Sörensen, S., & Pinquart, M. (2005). Racial and ethnic differences in the relationship of caregiving stressors, resources, and sociodemographic variables to caregiver depression and perceived physical health. *Aging & Mental Health, 9*, 482–495. doi:10.1080/13607860500142796

Stansbury, K. L., Harley, D. A., & Brown-Hughes, T. (2010). Exploring experiences and perceptions of aging and cognitive decline across diverse racial and ethnic groups. *Gerontology and Geriatric Medicine, 1*, 216–224. doi:10.1016/j.jalz.2015.12.007

Stevens, R., & Hull, S. J. (2013). The color of AIDS: An analysis of newspaper coverage of HIV/AIDS in the United States from 1992–2007. *Critical Arts, 27*, 352–369. doi:10.1080/02560046.2013.800668
Sullivan, S. C., & Beard, R. L. (2014). Faith and forgetfulness: The role of spiritual identity in preservation of self with Alzheimer’s. *Journal of Religion, Spirituality & Aging, 26*, 65–91. doi:10.1080/15528030.2013.811462

Thomas, J., & Harden, A. (2008). Methods for the thematic synthesis of qualitative research in systematic reviews. *BMC Medical Research Methodology, 8*, 45. doi:10.1186/1471-2288-8-45

Tishkoff, S. A., Reed, F. A., Friedlaender, F. R., Ehret, C., Ranciaro, A., Froment, A., … Williams, S. M. (2009). The genetic structure and history of Africans and African Americans. *Science, 324*, 1035–1044. doi:10.1126/science.1172257

Torres, S. (2019). *Ethnicity and old age: Expanding our imagination*. Bristol, UK: Policy Press. doi:10.2307/j.ctvfp63dx

Toth-Cohen, S. (2004). Factors influencing appraisal of upset in black caregivers of persons with Alzheimer disease and related dementias. *Alzheimer Disease & Associated Disorders, 18*(4), 247–255.

Truswell, D. (2013). Black, Asian and minority ethnic communities and dementia—where are we now. *Better Health Briefing, 30*. doi:10.4172/2161-0460.1000152

Tuerk, R., & Sauer, J. (2015). Dementia in a Black and minority ethnic population: Characteristics of presentation to an inner London memory service. *BJPsych Bulletin, 39*, 162–166. doi:10.1192/bp.bp.114.047753

van Wezel, N., Francke, A. L., Kayan-Acun, E., Ljm Devillé, W., van Grondelle, N. J., & Blom, M. M. (2016). Family care for immigrants with dementia: The perspectives of female family carers living in the Netherlands. *Dementia, 15*, 69–84. doi:10.1177/1471301215617703

van Wezel, N., Francke, A. L., Kayan Acun, E., Devillé, W. L., van Grondelle, N. J., & Blom, M. M. (2018). Explanatory models and openness about dementia in migrant communities: A qualitative study among female family carers. *Dementia, 17*, 840–857. doi:10.1177/1471301216655236

Vickrey, B. G., Strickland, T. L., Fitten, L., Adams, G. R., Ortiz, F., & Hays, R. D. (2007). Ethnic variations in dementia caregiving experiences: Insights from focus groups. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment, 15*, 233–249. doi:10.1300/J137v15n02_14

Werner, P., Goldstein, D., Karpas, D. S., Chan, L., & Lai, C. (2014). Help-seeking for dementia: A systematic review of the literature. *Alzheimer Disease and Associated Disorders, 28*, 299–310. doi:10.1097/WAD.0000000000000065

Werner, P., Mittelman, M. S., Goldstein, D., & Heinik, J. (2012). Family stigma and caregiver burden in Alzheimer’s disease. *The Gerontologist, 52*, 89–97. doi:10.1093/geront/gnr117

Zenner, W. (1996). Middlemen minorities. *Ethnicity* (pp. 179–186). Albany: State University of New York Press.