Effect of BTN162b2 and CoronaVac boosters on humoral and cellular immunity of individuals previously fully vaccinated with CoronaVac against SARS-CoV-2: A longitudinal study

Zeynep Ece Kuloğlu1,2 | Rojbin El1,2 | Gulen Guney-Eskenn2 | Yeşim Tok3 |
Zeynep Gülçe Talay1,2 | Tayfun Barlas2 | Mert Ahmet Kuskucu2,3 | Özgür Albayrak4 |
Özlem Doğan2,5 | Serap Şimşek Yavuz6 | Kenan Midilli3 | Önder Ergönü2,7 |
Füsun Can2,5

Abstract

Background: It is essential to know about immune response levels after booster doses of the two different types of vaccines, mRNA, and the inactivated, currently used against COVID-19. For this purpose, we aimed to determine the effects of BNT162b2 (BNT) and CoronaVac (CV) boosters on the humoral and cellular immunity of individuals who had two doses of CV vaccination.

Methods: The study was conducted in three centers (Koc University Hospital, Istanbul University Cerrahpasa Hospital, and Istanbul University, Istanbul Medical School Hospital) in Istanbul, Turkey. Individuals who had been previously immunized with two doses of CV and no history of COVID-19 were included. The baseline blood samples were collected 3–5 months after the second dose of CV. Follow-up blood samples were taken 1 and 3 months after administration of third doses of CV, or one dose of BNT boosters. Neutralizing antibody titers were measured by plaque reduction assay. The CD8+CD38+CD69+ and CD4+CD38+CD69+ T cells were stimulated predominantly in the third month of the BNT boosters.

Results: We found a 3.38-fold increase in neutralizing antibody geometric mean titers (NA GMT, 78.69) 1 month after BNT booster and maintained at the third month (NA GMT, 80). Nevertheless, in the CV booster group, significantly lower NA GMT than BNT after 1 month and 3 months were observed (21.44 and 28.44, respectively) (p < .001). In the ELISpot assay, IL-2 levels after BNT were higher than baseline and CV booster (p < .001) while IFN-γ levels were significantly higher than baseline (p < .001). The CD8+CD38+CD69+ and CD4+CD38+CD69+ T cells were stimulated predominantly in the third month of the BNT boosters.

Abbreviations: GMT, geometric mean titer; PBMCs, peripheral blood mononuclear cells; PRNT50, plaque reduction neutralization test; SFU, spot forming units.

Zeynep Ece Kuloğlu and Rojbin El performed equal work in the study.

© 2022 European Academy of Allergy and Clinical Immunology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd.
**Conclusion:** The neutralizing antibody levels after 3 months of the BNT booster were higher than the antibody levels after CV in fully vaccinated individuals. On the contrary, ratio of the effector T cells increased along with greater IFN-γ activation after BNT booster. By considering the waning immunity, we suggest a new booster dose with BNT for the countries that already had two doses of primary CV regimens.

**KEYWORDS**
SARS-CoV, T cells, vaccines

**GRAPHICAL ABSTRACT**
This study determines the effects of BNT162b2 (BNT) and CoronaVac (CV) boosters on the humoral and cellular immunity of individuals who had two doses of CV vaccination. The neutralizing antibody levels after 3 months of the BNT booster are higher than the antibody levels after CV in fully vaccinated individuals. The ratio of the effector T cells increases along with greater IFN-γ activation after BNT booster.

Abbreviations: GMT, geometric mean titer; PBMCs, peripheral blood mononuclear cells; PRNT50, plaque reduction neutralization test; SFU, spot-forming units

**1 | INTRODUCTION**

The worldwide use of effective and safe COVID-19 vaccines is still a high priority to control the pandemic and to reduce the burden of COVID-19. The vaccine type and vaccination schedule affect many of the cellular and molecular elements of innate and adaptive immune systems.

Estimation of the immune responses after SARS-CoV-2 vaccinations is one of the important parameters in order to predict the efficacy of booster vaccines. Therefore, testing the effectiveness of COVID-19 vaccines in different vaccination schedules is necessary as there are a variety of vaccine availabilities, worldwide. Following primary vaccination, antibody and T-cell responses have decreased over time. A booster dose being administered 6 months after the second dose of various vaccines significantly increased neutralizing antibody concentrations. The heterologous vaccine regimens were reported to stimulate neutralizing antibodies more than the homologous vaccine protocols.

In Turkey, the inactivated vaccine CoronaVac (Sinovac Life Sciences) was the first vaccine to receive approval by the Ministry of Health. Healthcare workers and individuals over the age of 65 were suggested two doses of CV administered 2 months apart in the initial phase of the vaccination program. After 6 months, the Ministry of Health of Turkey recommended a booster of BNT as an alternative option to the CV booster. In early studies of the CV, effectiveness after two-dose schedules was reported as 60%−90%. Nevertheless, these studies were performed approximately 6 weeks after the second dose. Six months after the second dose of CV, neutralizing antibody titers declined below the seropositivity cut-off value while a remarkable increase in the neutralizing antibody concentrations was observed with the administration of a third dose. However, our knowledge on the humoral and cellular immune responses obtained by BNT and CV boosters following two doses of primary CoronVac vaccination is still limited. In this study, we aimed to explore the neutralizing antibody and T-cell responses after the booster doses of CV and BNT following two doses of CV.
2 | MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1 | Study design and participants

The study was conducted in three centers (Koç University Hospital, Istanbul University Cerrahpasa Hospital, and Istanbul University, Istanbul Medical School Hospital) in Istanbul, Turkey. Individuals who had been previously immunized with two doses of CV, and no history of COVID-19 were included in the study. The baseline blood samples were collected 3–5 months after 2 doses of CV. Follow-up blood samples were taken after the first and third months of the third dose of CV or one dose of the BNT booster (Figure 1). Participants were continuously monitored for SARS-CoV-2 infection. Informed consent was obtained from all participants. This study was approved by the Institutional Review Board of Koç University under the number of 2021.151.IRB1.055.

A total of 52 individuals received two doses of CV, and whole blood samples were collected in heparin tubes 3–5 months after vaccination (n = 19 for 3 months, n = 26 for 4 months, n = 7 for 5 months.). One month after receiving the third dose booster, whole blood samples were collected from the same 52 individuals. (n = 42 for BNT and n = 10 for CV). Due to a change in vaccine recommendations based on the variant of concerns, some participants have received the 4th dose of BNT or CV vaccine, therefore, were excluded from the study. Consequently, six participants from the BNT booster group and four participants from the CoronaVac booster group were able to donate blood samples 3 months after the booster dose.

The peripheral blood mononuclear cells (PBMC) were isolated by Ficoll density gradient centrifugation method, and the cells were stored at the −80°C until use for flow cytometry and ELISpot assays. The sera were stored at the −80°C for neutralizing antibody tests.

2.2 | Immunological assays

Humoral and cellular immune responses were examined to compare the serum SARS-CoV-2 neutralizing antibody titers and T-cell reactivity in PBMC.

2.2.1 | Plaque reduction neutralization test (PRNT50): neutralizing antibody titers

A live SARS-CoV-2 Wuhan strain (B303) which was previously isolated from the SARS-CoV-2 RdRp PCR positive nasopharyngeal specimen of a patient admitted to Koc University Hospital was used for the plaque assay. The nasopharyngeal specimen was cultured on Vero E6 cells (ATCC CRL-1586) with DMEM High-Glucose (Gibco, 41966–029) supplemented with 10% Fetal bovine serum (FBS), (Gibco, 10500064), 1% Penicillin-Streptomycin, and Amphotericin B (Sigma, A2942) for 5 days. After observation of cytopathic effect, the growth of SARS-CoV-2 was confirmed by qRT-PCR using primer and Taqman probe targeting SARS-CoV-2 nucleocapsid. Viral titer (TCID50) of the SARS-CoV-2 isolate was determined by Spearman–Karber method. To sequence the virus, viral RNA was extracted with viral RNA isolation kit (QIAamp viral RNA), DNA library preparation was done using the Illumina TruSeq stranded total RNA kit, and the viral RNA was sequenced using Illumina MiniSeq

FIGURE 1 Design of the study
Streptomycin, and Amphotericin B (Sigma, A2942). Serum dilutions of 10% Fetal bovine serum (FBS), (Gibco, 10500064), 1% Penicillin-Streptomycin, and Amphotericin B (Sigma, A2942). Serum dilutions were used as controls. Samples were run using Attune Flow cytometer (Attune NxT Flow Cytometer). Ionomycin, CMV (423302), and DMSO were used as a positive control while DMSO was used as a negative control, eventually, CMV virus was used for cross-reaction. Tests were performed in duplicate.

### 2.2.2 | Flow cytometry for T-cell response

For T-cell assays, 2 x 10^6 PBMCs were seeded in RPMI 1640 media supplemented with 5% AB serum for the wells of the 96 well plates. T cells were activated by using a SARS-CoV-2 Spike protein-specific peptivator (PepTivator® SARS-CoV-2 Prot S research grade (6 nmol/peptide), (Miltenyi Biotec), and DMSO were used as a negative control, eventually, CMV virus was used for cross-reaction. Tests were performed in duplicate.

2.2.3 | ELISpot assay for T-cell response

The IFN-γ and IL-2 responses of T cells were measured with Fluorospot Assay (Abcam Fluorospot, ab48452) according to the manufacturer’s instructions. Plates were incubated for 30 s at room temperature with 35% ethanol and washed with DPBS 1X (BioWest, L0615-500). The capture antibodies were added and incubated overnight at +4°C. After washing with DPBS 1X, RPMI-1640 Medium (Sigma, R8758) containing 10% FBS cell culture media was added into the wells and incubated for 2 h at room temperature (RT). Plates were washed with DPBS 1X and 10^5 PBMCs were added into each well with appropriate concentration of SARS-CoV-2 S peptide activator (PepTivator® SARS-CoV-2 Prot S research grade (6 nmol/peptide, Miltenyi Biotec). Cells were incubated at 37°C in a CO2 incubator for 20 h and were washed 3 times using 1X DPBS containing 20% Tween-20 (P9416, Sigma). The FITC-labeled and biotinylated antibodies were added (for IFN-γ/IL-2 respectively) and incubated for 1 h and 30 min at RT. Following the wash step, FITC-green fluorescence conjugate/streptavidin-phycoerythrin solution (for IFN-γ/IL-2, respectively), was added to each well and incubated for 1 h at RT in the dark. The wash was repeated three times, and the residual buffer was removed using distilled water. After blot drying the plates, spots were read with GFP and RFP filters, under a dissection microscope (Leica M205 FA). The PMA/ionomycin was used as a positive control while DMSO was used as a negative control, eventually, CMV virus was used for cross-reaction. The tests were performed in duplicate.

### 2.3 | Statistical analysis

After obtaining sufficient longitudinal data, the statistical analysis of paired samples was performed by using a Wilcoxon signed rank test for the comparison of two dependent groups. For comparison of independent groups, for example, biontech vs. coronavac at first and 3 months, unpaired non-parametric test, Wilcoxon rank-sum (Mann-Whitney) test was performed. GraphPad Prism 8.0.2 Software was used for the analysis and visualization of the obtained data. In statistical analysis STATA 16v (USA) was used, and statistical significance was set as p < .05.

### 3 | RESULTS

The demographic characteristics of the participants were presented in Table 1.

#### 3.1 | Neutralizing antibody titers

Both vaccine boosters produced detectable neutralizing antibody titers (Figure 2A). Three to five months after two doses of CV, 40 out of 52 (76.92%) participants had neutralizing antibody levels above 1/20 with a GMT of 23.27 (range between <1/10 and 1/80). One month after booster administration, BNT booster induced significantly higher neutralizing antibody with GMT of 78.69 (ranging between 20 and 1280) compared with GMT of CV with 21.44 (ranging between 10 and 40; p < .001). In this period, all participants in the BNT and 7 out of 10 (70%) of CV receivers had neutralizing antibody levels of >1/20. Meanwhile, 98% of the BNT and 40% of the CV participants had antibody titers above the 1/30 threshold. In both groups, GMTs remained at similar levels in the third month (Figure 2A). The neutralizing antibody levels of each participant in the study period were presented in Figure 2B.
Reactivity and magnitude of CD4+ and CD8+ T-cell responses to the SARS-CoV-2 spike S peptide pool were studied. In the assessment of CD4+ cell and CD8+ cell ratios after stimulation with a mixture of spike peptides, there were no significant change in the magnitude of CD4+ and CD8+ T cells after BNT162b2 and CV boosters compared with baseline levels (Figure 3).

In the ELISpot assay, T cells showed significantly higher IFN-γ reactivity after BNT booster dose, with a median of 140 SFU per million PBMC (Range 5 SFU- 320 SFU) compared with baseline T-cell response (60 SFU/10^6 PBMC; p < .001). CV booster dose did not cause a significant change in IFN-γ reactivity of the T cells (80 SFU/10^6 PBMC) (p = .747). A month after BNT booster, the IL-2
reactivity of the T cells (60 SFU/10⁶ PBMC) were significantly higher than CV booster (median SFU 30/10⁶ PBMC, p < .05) and baseline levels (20 SFU/10⁶ PBMC; p < .001) (Figure 4).

Assessment of the effector T-cell response after COVID-19 vaccine booster doses was done by phenotyping S-specific CD4⁺ and CD8⁺ T cells. Representative gating was shown in Figure S1. One month after the BNT booster, both CD8⁺CD38⁺CD69⁺ T cells and CD4⁺CD38⁺CD69⁺ T cells were stimulated. There was no significant difference compared with baseline levels whereas a significant increase was detected at the third month. After 3 months, the proportion of CD8⁺CD38⁺CD69⁺ T cells increased from baseline of 1.160% to 3.130% (p = .031). Three months after the CV booster, CD4⁺CD38⁺CD69⁺ T cells increased from 4.37% of baseline to 10.20% (p = .12) and CD8⁺CD38⁺CD69⁺ T cells increased from 1.160% to 3.130% (p = .62) (Figure 5).

4 | DISCUSSION

The present study addresses the lack of knowledge on the immunogenicity of BNT and CoronaVac boosters after 2 doses of CV administration. We focused on neutralizing antibody and T-cell responses after 1 and 3 months elicited by BNT and CV boosters in fully vaccinated individuals with CV.

We found a 3.38-fold increase in neutralizing antibody titers (GMT 78.69) one month after the BNT booster, and antibody titers were found to be maintained after 3 months. (GMT 80). However, in the CV group, low GMTs after 1 month and 3 months (21.44 and 28.44) indicated the weak immunogenicity of the CV booster. For the protection of 50% of the individuals, a neutralizing antibody titer of 1/19 for BNT and 1/30 for CV was suggested as cut-off levels of protection.¹¹ All BNT booster receivers had antibody levels above the protection threshold of 1/19 after 3 months, but only 40% of donors had antibody titers above the 1/30 threshold in the CV group. High neutralizing antibody levels following 14 days after CV booster dose¹² and decreased neutralizing antibody levels after 28 days were reported.¹³ Moreover, a recent study from Turkey reported a marked increase in binding antibody response after BNT booster compared with a CoronaVac booster (104.8- vs. 8.7-fold, respectively). We found low neutralizing antibody levels at a prolonged time (1–3 months) after booster doses of CV. The concern about the weak immunogenicity would be increased by considering the reduced efficacy of vaccines against the Omicron variant.¹⁴,¹⁵ Current vaccine trials have focused on the stimulation of the neutralizing antibody against SARS-CoV-2, but CD4⁺ and CD8⁺ cells also might provide protection from severe disease and support resolution of COVID-19.¹⁶ In our cohort, the magnitude of post BNT booster responses was higher than the CV booster. We detected increased IFN-γ and IL-2 reactivity after the BNT booster, accompanied by an increase in CD8⁺CD38⁺CD69⁺ T cells. CV booster did not cause a significant change in IFN-γ reactivity of the T cells. In accordance with our results, the increased IFN-γ secreting T-cell responses were observed after the BNT booster while no increase was detected for the inactivated vaccine booster in fully Immunized healthy adults with inactivated vaccine. The ratio of CD4⁺CD38⁺CD69⁺ cells was also high in the third month of the
FIGURE 4  (A) IFN-γ response at baseline, 1 month, and 3 months after boosters. (B) IL-2 response at baseline, 1 month, and 3 months after boosters. (C) Changes in IFN-γ and IL-2 levels for each individual during a 3-month period. Dots represent T-cell ratios for individuals in the population. (*p < .001; **p < .05)
BNT booster. Effector T cells have short lifespan, the high ratio of CD4+ and CD8+ effector T cells in third month was possibly due to memory cell differentiation in the population. Robust CD8 and CD4 T-cell responses to BNT were reported in clinical studies.\textsuperscript{17,18} The induction of T-cell responses after CV vaccination was also reported by a study from Hong Kong.\textsuperscript{19} T-cell clones against other SARS-CoV-2 antigens such as N protein can also be stimulated with inactivated vaccines.\textsuperscript{20} The type of peptide pool used for activation might have affected the results of T-cell response measurements.\textsuperscript{21} In this study, rather than using peptides of the virus, we used S-pool, which might lead to the underestimation of the true magnitude of T-cell responses.

The strength of our study is being a longitudinal study and having a prominent advantage of being performed in Turkey, of where the primary vaccine schedule consisted of two CV doses. Main limitations of this study can be stated as having a low sample size to detect the statistical significance especially in the CoronaVac booster group. However, our results are in parallel with reported studies that evaluated anti-S antibody titers by ELISA in Turkey.\textsuperscript{22} Some of the participants were excluded from the study since they received their

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure5.png}
\caption{Ratio of CD8+CD38+CD69+ and CD4+CD38+CD69+ cells after BNT162b2 and CoronaVac boosters. (A) CD8+CD38+CD69+ cell ratio at baseline, 1 month, and 3 months after boosters. (B) CD4+CD38+CD69+ cell ratio at baseline, 1 month, and 3 months after boosters. (C) Changes in the ratio of CD8+CD38+CD69+ and CD4+CD38+CD69+ cells for each individual during a 3-month period. Dots represent T-cell ratios for individuals in the population. (*p < .05)}
\end{figure}
fourth doses after 2 months. Moreover, we could not cover the newly emerged Omicron variant, and this will be done in future studies.

Our study has implications for the countries that have used a two-dose regimen of CV. The neutralizing antibody levels after 3 months of the BNT booster were higher than the antibody levels after the CV booster. On the contrary, the ratio of the effector CD8+ and CD4+ T cells was increased along with greater IFN-γ activation after the BNT booster. Taking into consideration the waning immunity, we suggest a second booster dose with BNT for the individuals who already had BNT or CV boosters as their third doses following two doses of CV.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
Koc University Isbank Center for Infectious Diseases (KUISCID) funded the study.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST
The authors declare no conflict of interest in relation to this work.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTION
ZEK, RE, MK, YT, SSY, KM, and OE involved in Data and sample collection. ZEK, RE, GGE, TB, ZGT, YT, and FC involved in laboratory work. ZEK, RE, GGE, TB, OD, OE, and FC involved in data analysis. ZEK, RE, GGE, ZGT, OE, and FC involved in manuscript preparation.

ORCID
Gülen Guneş-Eskendeli https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3158-1587
Özgür Albayrak https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8760-1439
Önder Ergönlü https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1935-9235

REFERENCES
1. Naaber P, Tserel L, Kangro K, et al. Dynamics of antibody response to BNT162b2 vaccine after six months: a longitudinal prospective study. Lancet Reg Health Eur. 2021;10:100208.
2. Lim WW, Mak L, Leung GM, Cowling BJ, Peiris M. Comparative immunogenicity of mRNA and inactivated vaccines against COVID-19. Lancet Microbe. 2021;2(9):e423.
3. Barros-Martins J, Hammerschmidt SI, Cossmann A, et al. Immune responses against SARS-CoV-2 variants after heterologous and homologous ChAdOx1 nCoV-19/BNT162b2 vaccination. Nat Med. 2021;27(9):1525-1529.
4. Tanriover MD, Doganay HL, Akova M, et al. Efficacy and safety of an inactivated whole-virus SARS-CoV-2 vaccine (CoronaVac): interim results of a double-blind, randomised, placebo-controlled, phase 3 trial in Turkey. Lancet. 2021;398(10296):213-222.
5. Jara A, Undurraga EA, Gonzalez C, et al. Effectiveness of an inactivated SARS-CoV-2 vaccine in Chile. N Engl J Med. 2021;385(10):875-884.
6. Zhang Y, Zeng G, Pan H, et al. Safety, tolerability, and immunogenicity of an inactivated SARS-CoV-2 vaccine in healthy adults aged 18–59 years: a randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled, phase 1/2 clinical trial. Lancet Infect Dis. 2021;21(2):181-192.
7. Fuss UJ, Kanof ME, Smith PD, Zola H. Isolation of whole mononuclear cells from peripheral blood and cord blood. Curr Protoc Immunol. 2009;85(1):7.1.1-7.1.8.
8. Wang Z, Yang X, Zhong J, et al. Exposure to SARS-CoV-2 generates T-cell memory in the absence of a detectable viral infection. Nat Commun. 2021;12(1):1724.
9. Hamilton MA, Russo RC, Thurston RV. Trimmed Spearman-Karber method for estimating median lethal concentrations in toxicity bioassays. Environ Sci Toxicol. 1977;11(7):713-771.
10. Mendoza EJ, Manguiat K, Wood H, Drebolt M. Two detailed plaque assay protocols for the quantification of infectious SARS-CoV-2. Curr Protoc Microbiol. 2020;57(1):ecpmc105.
11. Khoury DS, Cromer D, Reynaldi A, et al. Neutralizing antibody levels are highly predictive of immune protection from symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infection. Nat Med. 2021;27(7):1205-1211.
12. Cao Y, Hao X, Wang X, et al. Humoral immunogenicity and reactivity of CoronaVac or ZF2001 booster after two doses of inactivated vaccine. Cell Res. 2022;32(1):107-109.
13. Wang K, Cao Y, Zhou Y, et al. A third dose of inactivated vaccine augments the potency, breadth, and duration of anamnestic responses against SARS-CoV-2. medRxiv. 2021. doi:10.1101/2021.09.02.212261735
14. Lu L, Mok BW, Chen LL, et al. Neutralization of SARS-CoV-2 Omicron variant by sera from BNT162b2 or Coronavac vaccine recipients. Clin Infect Dis. 2021;ciab1041. doi: 10.1093/cid/ciab1041.
15. Pérez-Then E, Lucas C, Monteiro VS, et al. Immunogenicity of heterologous BNT162b2 booster in fully vaccinated individuals with CoronaVac against SARS-CoV-2 variants Delta and Omicron: the Dominican Republic Experience. medRxiv. 2021. doi:10.1101.2021.12.27.21268459
16. Tan AT, Linster M, Tan CW, et al. Early induction of functional SARS-CoV-2-specific T cells associates with rapid viral clearance and mild disease in COVID-19 patients. Cell Rep. 2021;34(6):108728.
17. Sahin U, Muik A, Vogler I, et al. BNT162b2 vaccine induces neutralizing antibodies and poly-specific T cells in humans. Nature. 2021;595(7868):572-577.
18. Kanokudom S, Assawakosi S, Suntronwong N, et al. Safety and immunogenicity of the third booster dose with inactivated, viral vector, and mRNA COVID-19 vaccines in fully immunized healthy adults with inactivated vaccine. Vaccines (Basel). 2022;10(1):86.
19. Mok CKP, Cohen CA, Cheng SMS, et al. Comparison of the immunogenicity of BNT162b2 and CoronaVac COVID-19 vaccines in Hong Kong. Respircir. 2021;27(4):301-310.
20. Nguyen THO, Rowntree LC, Petersen J, et al. CD8(+) T cells specific for an immunodominant SARS-CoV-2 nucleocapsid epitope display high naive precursor frequency and TCR promiscuity. Immunity. 2021;54(5):1066-1082 e1065.
21. Prendeki M, Clarke C, Brown J, et al. Effect of previous SARS-CoV-2 infection on humoral and T-cell responses to single-dose BNT162b2 vaccine. Lancet. 2021;397(10280):1178-1181.
22. Yalcin TY, Topcu DI, Dogan O, et al. Immunogenicity after two doses of inactivated virus vaccine in healthcare workers with and without previous COVID-19 infection: prospective observational study. J Med Virol. 2022;94(1):279-286.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION
Additional supporting information may be found in the online version of the article at the publisher’s website.