Membrane Filter Technique for Enumeration of Enterococci in Marine Waters

M. A. LEVIN,* J. R. FISCHER, AND V. J. CABELLI

National Marine Water Quality Laboratory, West Kingston, Rhode Island 02892

Received for publication 12 February 1975

A membrane filter procedure is described for the enumeration of enterococci in marine waters. The procedure utilizes a highly selective and somewhat differential primary isolation medium followed by an in situ substrate test for identifying colonies of those organisms capable of hydrolyzing esculin. The procedure (mE) was evaluated with known streptococci strains and field samples with regard to its accuracy, sensitivity, selectivity, specificity, precision, and comparability to existing methods. Essentially quantitative recovery was obtained with seawater-stressed cells of Streptococcus faecalis and S. faecium. Neither S. bovis, S. equinus, S. mitis, nor S. salivarius grew on the medium. The selectivity of the medium was such that a 10,000-fold reduction in background organisms was obtained relative to a medium which contained no inhibitors and was incubated at 35 C. About 90% of those typical colonies designated as enterococci confirmed as such and about 12% of the colonies not so designated were, in fact, identified as enterococci. Plate to plate variability across samples approximated that expected by chance alone. Verified recoveries of enterococci from natural samples by the mE procedure, on the average, exceeded those by the KF method by one order of magnitude.

Shortly after J. P. Laws and F. W. Andrewes first reported streptococci from the gastrointestinal tract, Houston noted that these organisms appeared to be characteristic of sewage and animal fecal wastes. He suggested that they were indicative of dangerous pollution because they are readily demonstrable in recently polluted waters and seemingly absent from waters above suspicion of contamination (18). Since that time, a volume of data has been accumulated categorically demonstrating that fecal streptococci are associated with the fecal wastes of man and lower animals and that they can be isolated from polluted water containing such wastes (14, 20). Nevertheless, this group of organisms has not been generally accepted as an indicator of fecal contamination for at least two reasons. First, coliforms and coliform biotypes have been a more attractive means of identifying fecal contamination because early workers found them easier to quantify and they are present in larger numbers in feces, sewage, and polluted waters. Second, there has been a good deal of confusion concerning the identity of the fecal streptococci, particularly as it relates to their ecological distribution. This is reflected in the fact that those streptococci which can be found in the feces of man and other warm-blooded animals have been referred to variously as enterococci, fecal streptococci and, more recently, group D streptococci. The composition of these three groups is shown in Fig. 1. It can be seen that two organisms not associated with humans, Streptococcus bovis and S. equinus, and two organisms associated with humans, but not exclusively with fecal wastes, S. mitis and S. salivarius, are included in one or more of the groups. Ideally, the indicator should be limited to the fewest number of species or biotypes which are most closely or exclusively associated with the fecal wastes of man, i.e., S. faecalis and S. faecium. Facile methods to do this have not been available. Hence, broader groups of streptococci have been used at times, because these were the biotypes recovered by the procedures available.

The taxonomy and distribution of this group of organisms has been reviewed by Hartman et al. (8), Kjellander (11), and revised recently in Bergey's Manual for Determinative Bacteriology, 8th ed. (2). Early attempts to quantify fecal streptococci relied on enrichment tube procedures associated with the use of the most probable number method. In 1940 Mallmann (15) suggested the use of azide lactose broth. This was later
modified by Mallmann and Seligmann (16) using Roth's basic azide dextrose medium, followed by a confirmation in ethyl violet azide broth as described by Litsky et al. (13). This procedure has been evaluated in marine waters (3). Hajna and Perry (7) developed the SF medium; and Winter and Sandholzer (23) described presumptive and confirmatory media which use sodium azide and/or high concentrations of NaCl as inhibitors.

The quantification of enterococci by a membrane filter procedure was first reported by Slanetz and Bartley in 1957 (21); and, in 1961, Kenner et al. (10) described the KF method for the enumeration of fecal streptococci. In 1966, Isenberg et al. (9) reported a plating procedure (PSE) for the quantification of group D streptococci. This medium offered increased recoveries and easier differentiation based on the use of the esculin reaction. The recoveries by these and other procedures have been compared by a number of workers (19, 22).

Impetus for the present investigation developed from a comparison of the KF methods and PSE medium (used in conjunction with membrane filtration) for the isolation of fecal streptococci from marine waters at beaches in the vicinity of New York City. In this preliminary investigation, it was observed that the confirmed recoveries of fecal streptococci by the modified PSE procedure exceeded those by the KF method by about one order of magnitude. However, the modified PSE procedure as used was deficient in that overgrowth by background microorganisms was a serious problem. The present report describes the evaluation of a procedure for the enumeration of enterococci designed to obviate the problems noted above. In addition, an attempt was made to make the method more specific, i.e., to eliminate the recovery of the viridans group (S. mitis, S. salivarius) and the two organisms exclusively associated with animal feces (S. equinus and S. bovis). The method (mE) was evaluated against the following criteria: (i) accuracy, recovery of at least 75% of the viable S. faecalis and S. faecium cells following a stress imposed by exposure to sea water for 48 h at 4°C; (ii) selectivity, the reduction of background organisms in naturally polluted waters by at least three orders of magnitude (1,000-fold); (iii) specificity, colonies designated as positive should verify as such at least 75% of the time, and no more than 10% of those designated as negative should verify as enterococci; (iv) precision, with field samples, the D² (4) value distribution approximates that estimated by chance; and (v) comparability, the accuracy and sensitivity of the method be equal to or greater than existing membrane filter methods.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Cultures and field samples. The recovery and accuracy studies were performed with cultures of S. faecalis, S. faecium, S. bovis, S. equinus, S. mitis, and S. salivarius provided by R. Facklam (Center for Disease Control, Atlanta, Ga.), and with a strain of S. faecalis isolated from New York Harbor. Suspensions of these organisms were prepared from brain-heart infusion broth (BHI, Difco) cultures incubated at 37°C for 20 h. After incubation, the organisms were washed three times in sterile phosphate-buffered saline (NaH₂PO₄, 0.58 g; Na₂HPO₄, 0.25 g; NaCl, 0.95 g; distilled water, 100 ml). Aliquots of the resultant suspensions were delivered into flasks of sea water passed through a 0.2-nm membrane filter. These were held at 4°C and sampled periodically by the mE method and a control procedure (spread plates on BHI agar) to determine the number of recoverable organisms.

Field samples were collected from marine and
estuarine waters in sterile containers held at 4 to 6 °C and assayed within 12 h of collection.

**Membrane filtration.** Appropriate volumes of the test suspensions or water samples used in evaluating the experimental medium were passed through membrane filters (47-mm diameter, 0.45-nm pore size). When the portion of the water sample to be filtered was less than 20 ml, it was brought to at least that volume with phosphate-buffered saline to wash residual organisms onto the membrane. The glass filter holders were sterilized for 2 min in an ultraviolet sterilizing apparatus (Millipore Filter Corp.). The membrane filters were obtained presterilized from the manufacturer.

**Recovery media: mE.** The formulae and methods of preparation of mE medium and the esculin-iron agar substrate used in the in situ esculin test are given in Table 1. After a basal medium containing peptone, sodium chloride, yeast extract, esculin, and ferric ammonium citrate was shown to quantitatively recover the organisms, a search for appropriate inhibitors was initiated. A number of candidates were screened for this purpose initially by using a modification of the gradient plate method of Szybalski as described by Levin and Cabelli (12). Nalidixic acid and sodium azide are used to inhibit gram-negative organisms and actidione to inhibit fungi. Triphenyl tetrazolium chloride in the concentration used colors the colonies, differentiates enterococci from other streptococci based upon its reduction, and has a slight inhibitory effect on some background microorganisms. Esulin is included to induce the enzyme catalyzing its hydrolysis. The mE plates are incubated for 48 h at 41 °C; the elevated incubation temperature also inhibits some of the indigenous microbial flora.

**In situ esculin substrate.** The hydrolysis of esculin is used in the characterization of enterococci. Initially, the esculin indicator system was included in the primary medium. This resulted in dark red colonies approximately 2 mm in diameter with black halos in the medium resulting from the reaction of cumarin with the ferric chloride. When more than 20 colonies were present, however, the zones coalesced, making it impossible to determine which of the colonies was positive. This problem was overcome by the use of an in situ test in which, after incubation, the membrane is transferred to an esculin-iron azar plate (Table 1). After 20 to 30 min at 41 °C, small black spots appear under the positive colonies, permitting enumeration of at least 50 enterococcus colonies per plate without problems of coalescence.

**Control media.** KP (Difco) and PSE (Pfizer) media were prepared and used following instructions from the manufacturers and Standard Methods for the Examination of Water and Wastewater (1). As noted earlier, the PSE medium was used in a membrane filter procedure.

**Verification of colonies.** Verification of colonies as enterococci was accomplished by using the bile-esculin medium of Schwan in combination with a modification of the procedure of Facklam and Moody (5), i.e., (i) growth at 45 °C in BHI broth; (ii) a negative catalase test; (iii) esculin hydrolysis; (iv) growth on 40% bile-blood agar; (v) an acid reaction in litmus milk; and (vi) a positive Gram stain.

### RESULTS

The accuracy of the mE method was determined by comparing the recoveries obtained by this procedure to those observed when eight species of streptococci were spread plated on BHI agar. The suspensions, whose initial cell densities varied between 10⁴ to 10⁶ per ml, were prepared in filtered estuarine water and held at 5 °C for periods up to 9 days. The average relative recovery of *S. faecalis* and *S. faecium* over the 9-day period was 102%; *S. bovis*, *S. equinus*, *S. mitis*, and *S. salivarius* recoveries were 0.0001% or less (Table 2).

The selectivity of the mE method was such that a 10,000-fold reduction in background organisms was obtained relative to that observed when the inhibitors were omitted from mE medium and the plates were incubated at 35 °C. This 99.99% reduction was obtained with samples whose initial background densities were 10⁴ to 10⁵ cells per 100 ml.

The specificity of the mE procedure was examined by determining (i) the percentage of typical colonies which did not verify as members of the enterococci group (false positives) and (ii) the percentage of other colonies, those which did not possess the typical colonial characteristics which, in fact, were enterococci (false negatives). The 2,231 colonies examined were isolates from polluted marine and estuarine water samples collected at six locations along the east coast of the United States. Most of the
isolates came from samples collected at beaches in the vicinity of New York City. In general, all the colonies on a given plate were examined. Ninety percent of the typical colonies and 11.7% of the other colonies were enterococci (Table 3). Neither S. bovis, S. equinus, S. mitis, nor S. salvarius were encountered.

The precision of the mE method was determined from $D^2$ values for assay variability calculated from the following equation as given by Eisenhart and Wilson (4): $D^2 = \frac{\Sigma X_1^2}{N} - (\Sigma Xi)^2/\Sigma Xi$, where $\Sigma Xi$ is the summation of the plate counts $X_1, X_2, \ldots X_n$, and $N$ (the number of replicate plates per sample) was 5. The $D^2$ values calculated from the examination of 15 polluted, marine, and estuarine water samples are displayed in Fig. 2 along with the expected $D^2$ control limits for $P = 0.005, 0.025$ and 0.5. In the event of excessive variability among the five replicate determinations (plates), hence, poor reliability of a single determination, the observed $D^2$ values should have exceeded the control limits more frequently than expected by chance alone. By chance alone, one $D^2$ value in 40 would have been expected to exceed the $P = 0.005$ limit. However, it can be seen that none of the values exceed the limits, and that they are evenly distributed around the $P = 0.5$ limit (Fig. 2).

Sixteen water samples collected from a variety of sources were assayed in parallel by the KP, PSE, and mE methods. Typical colonies as described for the various procedures were verified as stated in Materials and Methods. Thus, the data presented are derived from verified recoveries. As can be seen from Table 4, neither the PSE nor the KF recoveries approached those obtained with the mE method, although those by the PSE and KF methods did approximate each other. The average number of colonies on the filters in these 13 trials was 70, ranging from 9 to 110. In a second, more extensive set of trials, fecal streptococcus densities obtained by the KF method were compared

### Table 2. The recovery of stressed* fecal streptococci on mSD medium

| Organism       | % Recovery* after exposure (days) | 0    | 1    | 3    | 6    | 9    |
|----------------|----------------------------------|------|------|------|------|------|
| S. faecalis    |                                  | 107  | ND*  | 94   | 123  | 87   |
| S. faecium     |                                  | 102  | ND   | 126  | 73   | 109  |
| S. faecalis subsp. zymogenes |                  | 114  | ND   | 108  | 46   | 100  |
| S. faecalis    |                                  | 117  | ND   | 118  | ND   | 113  |

$^*$ Suspensions held in seawater at 5 C for number of days as indicated.

$^*$ Relative to recovery on BHI spread plates.

$^*$ Obtained in 1973 from R. Facklam as S. durans.

$^*$ No data.

### Table 3. Specificity of the mSD procedure for the enumeration of group D streptococci

| General sample location | No. of colonies and % verification | Typical colonies | No. of colonies and % verification | Other colonies |
|-------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|
|                         | No. examined | % False positive | No. examined | % False negative |
| Coney Island, N.Y.      | 1,225        | 11               | 107           | 18             |
| Riis Park, N.Y.         | 577          | 10               | 104           | 11             |
| Miami, Fla.             | 16           | 0*               | 16            | 0*             |
| Boston Harb., Mass.     | 59           | 3.0              | ND*           | ND             |
| Connecticut             | 67           | 4.0              | 20            | 0*             |
| Rhode Island            | 30           | 0*               | 10            | 0*             |
| Overall                 | 1,974        | 10.0             | 257           | 11.7           |

$^*$ No false-negative or positive colonies.

$^*$ No data.

![Fig. 2. Precision of the mSD procedure for enterococci as extended from dispersion of $D^2$ values.](image-url)
directly to those by the mE procedure (Table 5). In only three instances did the KF recoveries exceed the mE recoveries; on average, the mE recoveries were about 10 times greater than those by the KF procedure. The samples reported in Table 4 were obtained during the winter months and those reported in Table 5 were obtained in July and August.

**DISCUSSION**

The mE procedure has satisfied most of the predetermined criteria for a primary, selective-differential method for the enumeration of enterococci in marine waters. The only exception was the rate of false-negative colonies.

Essentially quantitative recovery of *S. faecalis* and *S. faecium* was obtained with unstressed and stressed cells. Although this approach is basically artificial in that the work was done with pure cultures rather than natural samples, it is not logistically feasible to perform such experiments with natural samples. *S. bouis* and *S. equinus* were not recovered in significant numbers of mE medium, nor were they isolated from natural samples. Therefore, it may be assumed that these two species, whose origin is animal feces, are not included in densities of enterococci as obtained by the mE procedure. Relative to other methods, this increases the specificity of the mE procedure for enterococci of human origin. However, *S. faecalis* and *S. faecium do occur in animal feces* (2). In addition, biotypes of *S. faecalis* have been reported (4, 15) as being associated with vegetation unpolluted with human fecal wastes and with insects. The former are differentiated by their ability to hydrolyze starch, a characteristic which could be performed as a subsequent in situ test.

The selectivity criterion for the evaluation of mE methods assumes that the marine recreational waters to be examined for enterococci generally would contain less than 10^4 background organisms per ml (those bacteria which grow in 48 h on the mE medium when the inhibitors are omitted and the plates are incubated at 35 C). The required 1,000-fold (99.9%) reduction in the level of these organisms, to be achieved by the combination of inhibitors and

**TABLE 4. Comparison of verified recoveries of group D streptococci by the mSD, PSE and KF methods**

| Location      | Trial | mE recovery (colonies/plate) | % mSD recoveries* by PSE | KF |
|---------------|-------|------------------------------|--------------------------|----|
| Providence River | 1     | 45                           | 82                       | 62 |
|               | 2     | 23                           | 70                       | 74 |
|               | 3     | 90                           | 68                       | 58 |
|               | 4     | 55                           | 78                       | 94 |
|               | 5     | 70                           | 49                       | 73 |
| Coney Island  | 1     | 110                          | 59                       | 61 |
|               | 2     | 82                           | 60                       | 77 |
|               | 3     | 21                           | 48                       | 67 |
| Boston Harbor | 1     | 89                           | 88                       | 75 |
|               | 2     | 97                           | 59                       | 70 |
|               | 3     | 73                           | 47                       | 73 |
| Miami         | 1     | 9                            | ND*                      | 66 |
|               | 2     | 107                          | ND*                      | 33 |
| Stonington    | 1     | 9                            | 39                       | 75 |
| Harbor        | New London | 1                                     | 61                       | 25 |
| Mystic Harbor | 1     | 85                           | 68                       | 9 |
| Avg           |       | 70                           | 60                       | 63 |

*Values obtained from the average of triplicate plate counts.

*No data because the PSE plates were overgrown with background organisms.

**TABLE 5. Comparison of verified recoveries of fecal streptococci and other organisms by the mSD and KF methods**

| Location      | Trial | Fecal streptococci | Other colonies |
|---------------|-------|---------------------|----------------|
|               |       | mSD | KF | mSD | KF |
| Coney Island  | N.Y.  | 1   | 38 | <1  | 54  |
|               |      | 2   | 38 | ND* | 35  |
|               |      | 3   | 270 | 6 | 190 | <1  |
|               |      | 4   | 660 | ND | TN  |
|               |      | 5   | 670 | ND | 240 |
|               |      | 6   | 310 | 20 | 430 | <10 |
|               |      | 7   | 70  | 4  | 123 | <1  |
|               |      | 8   | 7   | 1  | 4   | <1  |
|               |      | 9   | 70  | 4  | 70  | <1  |
|               |      | 10  | 1,510 | 6 | 310 | <1  |
| Rockaways     | N.Y.  | 1   | 170 | 12 | 940 | <1  |
|               |      | 2   | 230 | 17 | 1,990 | <1  |
|               |      | 3   | 440 | 8  | TN  | <1  |
|               |      | 4   | 51  | 5  | 450 | <1  |
|               |      | 5   | 25  | 61 | 56  | <10 |
|               |      | 6   | 49  | 62 | 24  | <10 |
|               |      | 7   | 31  | 2  | <1  |
|               |      | 8   | 16  | 8  | 127 | <1  |
|               |      | 9   | 22  | 5  | 100 | <1  |
|               |      | 10  | 47  | 2  | 53  | <1  |
|               |      | 11  | 36  | 8  | 2   | <1  |
|               |      | 12  | 12  | 57 | 89  | <1  |

*No data, confluent growth of background organisms.

*Too numerous to count.
the elevated incubation temperature, would result in 50 colonies per filter when a 50-ml water sample is assayed. The differential characteristics of the medium then should permit the detection of a single group enterococcus colony on such a filter. The actual reduction (99.99%) exceeded this requirement, thereby permitting the detection of group D streptococci in the presence of 500,000 background organisms deposited on the filter.

Although the rate of false-negative colonies (11.7%) slightly exceeded the specificity criterion (10%), the false-positive rate (10%) was markedly less than the specified limit (25%). Therefore, it may be assumed that verification of a number of typical and other colonies is necessary only when an operator is being trained. In the absence of verification, estimates of enterococci densities should be designated as presumptive. After verification, the estimates would be considered as confirmed.

The results demonstrate (Fig. 2) the precision (reproducibility) of the mE procedure. The plate to plate variability over the samples examined was that expected by chance alone; that is, the D² estimates distributed equally on both sides of the P = 0.5 limit of 3.2 and none exceeded the P = 0.025 limit.

The recovery efficiency of the mE method is comparable to, or better than, that by the KF method for the examination of enterococci in estuarine waters; in addition, it provides higher confirmed recoveries. The difference between recovery ratios (mE/KF) observed at Coney Island in the summer months (1.5; Table 4) and winter months (54; Table 5) may be a function of a seasonal variation (water temperature, rainfall). As noted previously, the method measures a more specific portion of the fecal streptococcus population and one that appears to be a close association with the fecal wastes of humans.

**LITERATURE CITED**

1. American Public Health Association. 1971. Standard methods for the examination of water and wastewater, 13th ed. p. 719. American Public Health Association, New York.
2. Buchanan, R. E., and N. E. Gibbons. 1974. Bergey's manual of determinative bacteriology, 8th ed., p. 490-509. Williams and Wilkins Co.
3. Buck, J. D. 1972. Selective detection of enterococci in marine waters. Am. J. Public Health 62:419-421.
4. Eisenhart, C., and P. W. Wilson. 1943 Statistical methods and control in bacteriology. Bacteriol. Rev. 7:57-137.
5. Facklam, R. R., and M. D. Moody. 1970. Presumptive identification of group D streptococci: the bile-esculin test. Appl. Microbiol. 20:245-250.
6. Geldreich, E., and B. A. Kenner. 1969. Concepts of fecal streptococci in stream pollution J. Water Pollut. Control Fed. Res. 41(Suppl.):R336-362.
7. Hajna, A. A., and B. A. Perry. 1943. Comparative study of presumptive and confirmatory media for bacteria of the coliform group and for fecal streptococci. Am. J. Public Health 33(5):550-556.
8. Hartman, P. A., G. W. Reinbold, and D. S. Saraswat. 1986. Indicator organisms—a review. I. Taxonomy of the fecal streptococci. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. 16:197-221.
9. Isenberg, H. D., D. Goldberg, and J. Sampson. 1970. Laboratory studies with a selective enterococcus medium. Appl. Microbiol. 20:433-436.
10. Kenner, R. A., H. F. Clark, and P. W. Kahler. 1960. Fecal streptococci. I. Cultivation and enumeration of streptococci in surface waters. Appl. Microbiol. 9:15-20.
11. Kjellander, J. 1960. Enteroc streptococci as indicators of fecal contamination of water. Acta Pathol. Microbiol. Scand. 48(Suppl.):136, 1-124.
12. Levin, M. A., and V. J. Cabelli. 1972. Membrane filter technique for enumeration of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. Appl. Microbiol. 24:864-870.
13. Litsky, W., W. L. Mallmann, and C. W. Fifield. 1953. A new medium for the detection of enterococci in water. Am. J. Public Health 43:873-879.
14. Litsky, W., W. L. Mallmann, and C. W. Fifield. 1955. Comparison of the most probable numbers of *Escherichia coli* and enterococci in river waters. Am. J. Public Health 45:1049-1053.
15. Mallmann, W. L. 1940. A new yardstick for measuring sewage pollution. Sewage Works J. 12:875-878.
16. Mallmann, W. L., and E. B. Seligmann, Jr. 1950. A comparative study of media for the detection of streptococci in water and sewage. Am. J. Public Health 40:286-289.
17. Papavasiliou, J. 1962. Species differentiation of group D streptococci. Appl. Microbiol. 10:65-69.
18. Prescott, S. C., A. C. Winslow, and M. H. Macrady. 1946. Water bacteriology, p. 207-212. John Wiley and Sons, New York.
19. Sabbaj, J. V., L. Sutter, and S. M. Finegold. 1971. Comparison of selective media for isolation of presumptive group D streptococci from human feces. Appl. Microbiol. 22:1008-1011.
20. Schwan, A. 1954. The use of a bile-esculin medium and of Maxted's technique of Lancefield grouping in the identification of enterococci (Group D streptococci). J. Clin. Pathol. 7:180-183.
21. Slanetz, L. W., and C. H. Bartley. 1957. Numbers of enterococci in water, sewage, and feces determined by the membrane filter technique with an improved medium. J. Bacteriol. 74:591-595.
22. Switzer, R. E., and J. B. Evans. 1974. Evaluation of selective media for enumeration of group D streptococci in bovine feces Appl. Microbiol. 28:1088-1087.
23. Winter, C. E., and L. A. Sandholzer. 1946. Recommended procedure for detecting the presence of enterococci. TLZ. U.S. Dept. of Interior, Fish, and Wildlife Service, Washington, D. C., November.