Ti$^{3+}$ in corundum traces crystal growth in a highly reduced magma

Beñat Oliveira1, William L. Griffin1,*, William L. Griffin1,*, Sarah E. M. Gain2, Martin Saunders2, Jeremy Shaw2, Vered Toledo3, Juan Carlos Afonso2 & Suzanne Y. O’Reilly1

Aggregates of corundum crystals with skeletal to hopper morphology occur in pyroclastic rocks erupted from Cretaceous basaltic volcanoes on Mt Carmel, N. Israel. The rapid growth of the crystals trapped volumes of the parental Al$_2$O$_3$-supersaturated melt; phenocrysts of tistarite (Ti$_2$O$_3$) in the trapped melts indicate crystallization at oxygen fugacities 6–7 log units below the Iron-Wüstite buffer ($f_{O_2} = \Delta IW - 6$ to $-7$), induced by fluxes of mantle-derived CH$_4$-H$_2$ fluids. Cathodoluminescence images reveal growth zoning within the individual crystals of the aggregates, related to the substitution of Ti$^{3+}$ in the corundum structure. Ti contents are $< 0.3$ wt% initially, then increase first linearly, then exponentially, toward adjacent melt pockets to reach values $> 2$ wt%. Numerical modelling indicates that the first skeletal crystals grew in an open system, from a moving magma. The subsequent linear increase in Ti reflects growth in a partially closed system, with decreasing porosity; the exponential increase in Ti close to melt pockets reflects closed-system growth, leading to dramatic increases in incompatible-element concentrations in the residual melts. We suggest that the corundum aggregates grew in melt/fluid conduits; diffusion modelling implies timescales of days to years before crystallization was terminated by explosive eruption. These processes probably operate in explosive volcanic systems in several tectonic settings.

The oxygen fugacity ($f_{O_2}$) of Earth’s upper mantle can be estimated from the mineral assemblages of mantle-derived xenoliths and of magmas derived by partial melting of the mantle$^{1,2}$. These estimates range from more oxidising than the quartz-fayalite-magnetite (QFM) buffer to near the iron-wüstite (IW) buffer. Recent advances using the Fe$^{3+}$/Fe$^{2+}$ ratios of mantle-derived garnets are adding finer detail, showing that the estimated $f_{O_2}$ of the subcontinental lithospheric mantle (SCLM) broadly decreases with depth relative to QFM, but rarely drops below the IW buffer$^{3,4}$. Several authors$^{5,6}$ have argued that the deeper levels of the mantle may be metal-saturated, and thus be buffered at or near IW. Under such conditions, any C–O–H fluid present will be dominated by CH$_4$ + H$_2$, and this appears to be confirmed by the discovery of inclusions of metallic phases + CH$_4$ + H$_2$ in diamonds derived from the deep upper mantle$^7$.

However, several lines of evidence indicate that volumes with much lower $f_{O_2}$ exist locally within the mantle. One is the common occurrence of moissanite (SiC) in kimberlites$^{8,9}$, which implies $f_{O_2}$ 6–8 orders of magnitude below the IW buffer$^{10}$. SiC and other phases indicative of very low $f_{O_2}$ (nitrides, silicides, carbides) have been reported from peridotites and chromitites in ophiolites from Tibet, Myanmar, and the Polar Urals$^{11–13}$. Some have argued that the SiC in kimberlites and ultramafic rocks formed by carboreduction at high temperature ($T$) near the surface$^{14}$ or by low-pressure ($P$), low-$T$ reduction during serpentinization$^{15}$. However, the occurrence of moissanite as inclusions in diamond$^{16}$, and the common association of SiC with Fe-Ti silicides$^{17}$ indicates that SiC can crystallize at high temperatures in the deep lithospheric mantle.

The occurrences in kimberlites and ophiolites are known almost entirely from mineral separates, providing little context for the phases of interest$^{18}$. This leaves the problems of how to produce such reducing conditions, the time scales on which they develop and survive and how to preserve the reduced assemblages from oxidation by the surrounding mantle$^{19,20}$. More insights into this problem are now coming from a suite of super-reduced mineral assemblages, crystallized from high-$T$ melts trapped in corundum aggregates (microxenoliths) ejected from Cretaceous volcanoes in northern Israel$^{21–24}$. These in situ assemblages illustrate the processes that can produce localized super-reducing conditions in the uppermost mantle.

In this report we show that high contents of Ti in corundum from this area reflect the substitution of Ti$^{3+}$ for Al$^{3+}$ under highly reducing conditions, and use the zoning patterns of Ti$^{3+}$ and other minor elements in corundum to constrain the crystallization processes and the nature of the environment in which these aggregates grew.

---

1ARC Centre of Excellence for Core to Crust Fluid Systems (CCFS) and GEMOC, Earth and Environmental Sciences, Macquarie University, Sydney, NSW 2109, Australia. 2Centre for Microscopy, Characterisation and Analysis, The University of Western Australia, Crawley, WA 6009, Australia. 3Shefa Gems (A.T.M.) Ltd., 4210602 Netanya, Israel. *email: bill.griffin@mq.edu.au
Background: geological setting and sampling

The material described here comes from Late Cretaceous pyroclastic basaltic volcanoes on Mount Carmel in Israel, and from related alluvial deposits, mainly in the Pliocene–Quaternary terrace gravels of the Kishon River (southern Galilee; Fig. SD-1). The volcanism was mainly explosive and has been ascribed to “hot-spot” or “plume-related” magmatism in an intraplate setting19. The eruptions continued over a period of ca 13 m.y. (98–85 Ma20,21), and over an area of at least 150 km², and the samples described here are derived from the tuffs of several eruptive centers, and associated alluvial deposits. Detailed descriptions of the geological setting have been provided by21–23.

Heavy-mineral concentrates from the Cretaceous tuffs have yielded Cr-diopside, olivine, orthopyroxene, garnet and chromite derived from garnet-spinel peridotitides and pyroxenites, as well as magacrystals of Mg-ilmenite, amphibole, zircon and diopside and less-common minerals such as moissanite (crystals to > 4 mm), rutile, hibonite and corundum21,23,24. In addition to gem-quality sapphire and ruby, the erupted material contains abundant xenocrysts of “Carmel Sapphire” up to 2.5 cm in diameter (> 30 carats).

Background: the Mt Carmel super-reduced assemblages

Back-scattered electron and cathodoluminescence (CL) images of Carmel Sapphires (Fig. 1) show that most samples are aggregates of crystals with skeletal to hopper forms, which have trapped pockets of their parental melts in a complex 3-dimensional network [17; Fig. SD2]. The melts are now preserved as Ca-Al-Si-O glasses (confirmed as amorphous by TEM analysis and Raman spectroscopy). Skeletal/hopper crystallization is typical of rapid growth from supersaturated melts. The mineral parageneses in the melt pockets allow a detailed reconstruction of the conditions under which the corundum crystallized. The appearance of dmisteinbergite (a polymorph of anorthite, identified by Raman spectroscopy) as a quench phase in the glasses defines the peritectic reaction corundum + melt → anorthite, requiring pressures > 0.9 GPa and T > 1400 °C22. High levels of Al-Ti substitution for Mg in spinels are consistent with temperatures ranging from ca 1500 °C to 1200 °C, as are the compositions of immiscible Fe-Ti-Si melts found in many melt pockets17,18. These conditions imply crystallization in the uppermost mantle, near the crust-mantle boundary beneath the area. The presence of glass suggests that crystallization was interrupted by entrainment in the rapidly ascending basaltic magmas; this was accompanied by extensive brecciation, the veins filled with a mixture of crystal fragments and amorphous carbon.

The first phase to crystallize from the trapped silicate melts typically is tistarite (Ti2O3), which requires O2 at least 7 log units below the IW buffer (ΔIW − 717). This O2 also is close to the stability limit of the assemblage SiO2 + C, which is consistent with the appearance of moissanite (SiC) as inclusions in the corundum. The tistarite is typically resorbed and overgrown by carmeltazite (ZrAl2Ti4O11 26; Fig. 2). Further reduction is implied by the presence of Ti2O3-bearing phases such as TiB2.

The melt pockets also contain a range of Fe-Ti-Si (P, Zr) alloys with globular forms indicating that they represent immiscible melts, which also crystallized abundant khamrabaeive (TiC) and lesser moissanite17.

We have previously suggested17,18 that the Al2O3-supersaturation required to produce the rapid crystallization of corundum was induced by progressive reaction between differentiated mafic melts and fluids dominated by CH4 + H2, derived from a metal-saturated mantle. This argument is supported by the abundance of carbon in the system, and the requirement for the presence of H2 to reach the lowest recorded values of O2 (ΔIW − 10, equivalent to the early solar nebula) in coarse-grained hibonite-grossite-vanadium xenoliths found in the same tuffs17,28.

Results

Compositional variation in corundum. A striking feature of the Carmel Sapphire is its intense cathodoluminescence (CL), which typically is a bright pink. The growth histories of the corundum crystals are recorded by striking variations in their CL patterns (Fig. 1). Comparison of CL images with electron back-scattered diffraction (EBSD) imaging shows that groups of two or more skeletal/hopper crystals can show subparallel axes, while individual multi-crystal domains can have a range of orientations (Fig. 1). The CL is progressively extinguished toward interstitial melt pockets or toward volumes of melt trapped within the cavities of skeletal crystals. Electron microprobe (EMP) analyses (Table SD1) show that the CL intensity is inversely correlated with the concentration of Ti, which ranges up to 2.5 wt%, or 0.56 at.%. Such high concentrations are unusual; most known corundum, including intensely coloured varieties, contains < 0.5 wt% Ti29.

UV-visible spectroscopy of the Carmel Sapphires shows that the CL intensity is related to Ti concentration and to the presence of Ti2+-bearing phases such as TiB2, TiO2, and Ti2O3. The CL intensity is typically resorbed and overgrown by carmeltazite (ZrAl2Ti4O11 26; Fig. 2). Further reduction is implied by the presence of Ti2O3-bearing phases such as TiB2. The melt pockets also contain a range of Fe-Ti-Si (P, Zr) alloys with globular forms indicating that they represent immiscible melts, which also crystallized abundant khamrabaeive (TiC) and lesser moissanite17.

We have previously suggested17,18 that the Al2O3-supersaturation required to produce the rapid crystallization of corundum was induced by progressive reaction between differentiated mafic melts and fluids dominated by CH4 + H2, derived from a metal-saturated mantle. This argument is supported by the abundance of carbon in the system, and the requirement for the presence of H2 to reach the lowest recorded values of O2 (ΔIW − 10, equivalent to the early solar nebula) in coarse-grained hibonite-grossite-vanadium xenoliths found in the same tuffs17,28.

The first phase to crystallize from the trapped silicate melts typically is tistarite (Ti2O3), which requires O2 at least 7 log units below the IW buffer (ΔIW − 717). This O2 also is close to the stability limit of the assemblage SiO2 + C, which is consistent with the appearance of moissanite (SiC) as inclusions in the corundum. The tistarite is typically resorbed and overgrown by carmeltazite (ZrAl2Ti4O11 26; Fig. 2). Further reduction is implied by the presence of Ti2O3-bearing phases such as TiB2.

The melt pockets also contain a range of Fe-Ti-Si (P, Zr) alloys with globular forms indicating that they represent immiscible melts, which also crystallized abundant khamrabaeive (TiC) and lesser moissanite17.

We have previously suggested17,18 that the Al2O3-supersaturation required to produce the rapid crystallization of corundum was induced by progressive reaction between differentiated mafic melts and fluids dominated by CH4 + H2, derived from a metal-saturated mantle. This argument is supported by the abundance of carbon in the system, and the requirement for the presence of H2 to reach the lowest recorded values of O2 (ΔIW − 10, equivalent to the early solar nebula) in coarse-grained hibonite-grossite-vanadium xenoliths found in the same tuffs17,28.

The first phase to crystallize from the trapped silicate melts typically is tistarite (Ti2O3), which requires O2 at least 7 log units below the IW buffer (ΔIW − 717). This O2 also is close to the stability limit of the assemblage SiO2 + C, which is consistent with the appearance of moissanite (SiC) as inclusions in the corundum. The tistarite is typically resorbed and overgrown by carmeltazite (ZrAl2Ti4O11 26; Fig. 2). Further reduction is implied by the presence of Ti2O3-bearing phases such as TiB2.

The melt pockets also contain a range of Fe-Ti-Si (P, Zr) alloys with globular forms indicating that they represent immiscible melts, which also crystallized abundant khamrabaeive (TiC) and lesser moissanite17.

We have previously suggested17,18 that the Al2O3-supersaturation required to produce the rapid crystallization of corundum was induced by progressive reaction between differentiated mafic melts and fluids dominated by CH4 + H2, derived from a metal-saturated mantle. This argument is supported by the abundance of carbon in the system, and the requirement for the presence of H2 to reach the lowest recorded values of O2 (ΔIW − 10, equivalent to the early solar nebula) in coarse-grained hibonite-grossite-vanadium xenoliths found in the same tuffs17,28.

The first phase to crystallize from the trapped silicate melts typically is tistarite (Ti2O3), which requires O2 at least 7 log units below the IW buffer (ΔIW − 717). This O2 also is close to the stability limit of the assemblage SiO2 + C, which is consistent with the appearance of moissanite (SiC) as inclusions in the corundum. The tistarite is typically resorbed and overgrown by carmeltazite (ZrAl2Ti4O11 26; Fig. 2). Further reduction is implied by the presence of Ti2O3-bearing phases such as TiB2.

The melt pockets also contain a range of Fe-Ti-Si (P, Zr) alloys with globular forms indicating that they represent immiscible melts, which also crystallized abundant khamrabaeive (TiC) and lesser moissanite17.

We have previously suggested17,18 that the Al2O3-supersaturation required to produce the rapid crystallization of corundum was induced by progressive reaction between differentiated mafic melts and fluids dominated by CH4 + H2, derived from a metal-saturated mantle. This argument is supported by the abundance of carbon in the system, and the requirement for the presence of H2 to reach the lowest recorded values of O2 (ΔIW − 10, equivalent to the early solar nebula) in coarse-grained hibonite-grossite-vanadium xenoliths found in the same tuffs17,28.

The first phase to crystallize from the trapped silicate melts typically is tistarite (Ti2O3), which requires O2 at least 7 log units below the IW buffer (ΔIW − 717). This O2 also is close to the stability limit of the assemblage SiO2 + C, which is consistent with the appearance of moissanite (SiC) as inclusions in the corundum. The tistarite is typically resorbed and overgrown by carmeltazite (ZrAl2Ti4O11 26; Fig. 2). Further reduction is implied by the presence of Ti2O3-bearing phases such as TiB2.

The melt pockets also contain a range of Fe-Ti-Si (P, Zr) alloys with globular forms indicating that they represent immiscible melts, which also crystallized abundant khamrabaeive (TiC) and lesser moissanite17.

We have previously suggested17,18 that the Al2O3-supersaturation required to produce the rapid crystallization of corundum was induced by progressive reaction between differentiated mafic melts and fluids dominated by CH4 + H2, derived from a metal-saturated mantle. This argument is supported by the abundance of carbon in the system, and the requirement for the presence of H2 to reach the lowest recorded values of O2 (ΔIW − 10, equivalent to the early solar nebula) in coarse-grained hibonite-grossite-vanadium xenoliths found in the same tuffs17,28.
Numerical modelling of zoning. To understand how the unusual zoning patterns in the corundum are related to crystallization from the Al₂O₃-supersaturated melts, and the implications of the zoning for the growth environment, we have carried out numerical modelling of the zoning.

In our numerical simulations we consider a crystallization scenario involving two distinct Ti reservoirs: a corundum phase undergoing one-dimensional crystal growth, and a percolating melt (Fig. 5). This is modelled assuming that (a) the grain boundary is locally in equilibrium with the surrounding melt (i.e. the Ti content in the fluid and solid rim are linked by the partition coefficient); (b) the concentration of Ti at any point in the interior of the corundum can be modified only by chemical diffusion; (c) the melt phase is compositionally homogeneous; and (d) the volume of the melt reservoir changes with time as a result of variations in melt inflow \( v_i \), melt outflow \( v_o \), and crystallization \( v_c \) (Fig. 5). These numerical simulations assume a constant crystallization rate of \( \alpha_c = 10^{-7} \text{ cm/s} \), consistent with the rapid annealing of skeletal crystals observed in experiments. Both inflow and outflow melt rates are considered to be proportional to the crystallization rate (i.e. \( v_o = \alpha_o v_c \) and \( v_i = \alpha_i v_c \), where \( \alpha_o \) and \( \alpha_i \) are two different proportionality constants). Diffusion coefficients are modelled according to the Arrhenius relation, with a fixed temperature of 1300 °C. The complete set of governing equations is given in the Appendix.

Under these assumptions, our numerical models show how the three different patterns observed in the Ti content within the corundum could be related to three different stages of a single crystallization process. Figure 6 compares results from our numerical model with corundum traverse 5-3 (Fig. 3).

Each of these three stages is characterized by a different set of \( \alpha_o \) and \( \alpha_i \) values. In the first stage, the observed nearly constant concentration of Ti within the corundum requires melts with constant Ti content to freely...
migrate through well-interconnected melt pathways (i.e., high values of melt inflow and outflow rates). In the second stage, the linear rise in Ti contents requires the free percolation of melts to be impeded (low rates of melt inflow and outflow). Figure 6a–d shows the effects on the corundum profiles of changing the main modelling parameters. Under specific conditions of initial melt abundance (~40% of melt), partition coefficient (K ~ 0.2), and melt inflow and outflow rates ($\alpha_o = 0.15$ and $\alpha_i = 0.75$), our model is able to reproduce the observed nearly-linear rise of Ti in the corundum toward the melt pocket (Fig. 6e). As the crystals grow, melt pathways become narrower, eventually resulting in the formation of closed melt pockets (i.e., no percolation/extraction of melts from the system, $\alpha_o = \alpha_i = 0$). In this third stage, the content of incompatible elements in the melt rises exponentially (Fig. 6e). The fact that the transitions between these three stages are preserved within single corundum crystals indicates that diffusion processes are negligible compared with crystallization rates. This is true even when considering the effect of varying temperature in the diffusion model (note the jump of two to three orders of magnitude in diffusivities in Fig. 4 in31 or when using four to five orders of magnitude faster diffusivities from32,33).

Diffusion modelling of a sharp concentration gradient using a wide range of diffusivities (Fig. 6f) suggests that the whole crystallization process recorded in the corundum crystals occurred within days or a few years. Likewise, the crystal growth rate used in our crystallization experiments results in timescales of days for complete crystallization. Therefore, both diffusion and crystallization numerical experiments align with the observed timescales for annealing of skeletal crystals in experiments30.

Discussion

Typical corundum megacrysts in alkali basalts contain <0.1 wt% Ti29, and this raises the question of why Ti clearly substitutes readily into the Carmel Sapphire. The obvious answer would be that Ti is in the trivalent state, as is implied by the appearance of Ti2O3 and SiC in the melt pockets. The Ti3+ ion is larger than Ti4+ (ionic radius 0.67 vs. 0.605 Å in octahedral coordination34); both are considerably larger than Al3+ (0.53 Å), but the Al site in corundum is relatively spacious ($<\text{Al-O}> = 1.912$ Å35–37), and substitution of Ti3+ does not require a charge-balance substitution.

Figure 2. Melt pocket in corundum, showing the typical paragenesis of tistarite (Ti2O3) and Carmeltazite (ZrAl2Ti4O11) in glass with quench crystals of dmisteinberge (CaAl2Si2O8).
Figure 3. Montage of EMP traverses discussed in text, with CL images showing locations.
The modelling provides insights into the processes that have led to such high levels of Ti\(^{3+}\) in the Mt Carmel corundum. The growth of aggregates of hopper/skeletal crystals is usually associated with nucleation on a substrate\(^{38,39}\). The rapid growth of skeletal or hopper crystals in a static situation would be expected to deplete the surrounding melt in compatible elements (in this case Al), while producing a zone enriched in incompatible elements. This would produce a zoning toward crystal rims enriched in Ti. The flat profiles of Ti vs distance in the early stages of corundum growth therefore suggest, on the contrary, that the melt was moving through the system rapidly enough to provide a continuous supply of “new” melt without significant enrichment in Ti, and still supersaturated in \(\text{Al}_2\text{O}_3\); i.e. this was an open system. The most probable scenario may involve crystallization beginning on the walls of melt/fluid conduits, and that the system could remain open as long as the branching crystalline aggregate had a relatively large ratio of connected, permeable cavities to solid corundum (ca 40:60; Fig. 6c).

The modelling indicates that the first inflection point in the plots of Ti profiles (Fig. 3) represents a point in the growth of a given grain when fluid flow began to be restricted by the intersection of corundum crystals, and the more slowly-moving melts began to concentrate Ti more rapidly as \(\text{Al}_2\text{O}_3\) was extracted. This inflection

![Figure 4. Plot of Ti vs. Mg (wt%, EMP data) in different grains of Carmel Sapphire; inset shows LAM-ICPMS data at lower concentrations.](image)

### Table 1.

|         | Glass\(^{*}\) | Cor-05 | Cor-04 | Cor-02 | Cor-06 | Ruby | Sapphire |
|---------|---------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|------|----------|
| wt\%    | EMP LA-ICPMS  | LA-ICPMS | LA-ICPMS | LA-ICPMS | LA-ICPMS | LA-ICPMS | LA-ICPMS |
| SiO\(_2\) | 47.1 Mg       | 122    | 381    | 305    | 320    | 9.6  | 88       | 92       |
| ZrO\(_2\) | 1.9 Si        | 1900   | 1770   | 1790   | 1670   | 1630 | 1480     | 131      |
| ThO\(_2\) | 0.3 Sc        | 2.0    | 5.0    | 5.2    | 5.8    | <0.1 | <0.1     |          |
| TiO\(_2\) | 3.0 Ti        | 3460   | 7390   | 5010   | 6140   | 16   | 280      | 248      |
| Al\(_2\)O\(_3\) | 24.4 V | 4.0    | 5.1    | 4.3    | 2.8    | 3.7  | 61       | 116      |
| La\(_2\)O\(_3\) | 0.4 Cr | 0.1    | 3.3    | 3.8    | 0.7    | 10,700 | 200      | 517      |
| Ce\(_2\)O\(_3\) | 1.8 Mn | <0.7   | <0.7   | <0.7   | <0.7   | <0.3 | 0.9      |          |
| MgO     | 5.2 Fe       | <20    | <20    | <20    | <20    | 16   | 7270     | 2225     |
| CaO     | 7.4 Co       | <0.1   | <0.1   | <0.1   | <0.1   | 0.02 | 0.1      |          |
| Na\(_2\)O | 0.4 Ca      | <0.5   | <0.5   | <0.5   | <0.5   | <0.1 | <0.06    |          |
| K\(_2\)O | 1.7 Zn       | <0.7   | 0.30   | 0.7    | 0.4    | 1.6  | 1.0      | 1.3      |
| SO\(_2\) | 1.6 Ga       | <0.2   | <0.2   | <0.2   | <0.2   | 35   | 155      | 66       |
| Sum     | 95.3 Zr      | 4.4    | 14     | 14     | 13     | 0.2  | 0.5      | 1.8      |

\(^{*}\) Mean of analyses of glass with no crystals other than tistarite.
point also corresponds to a change from skeletal crystallization to a smoother zoning, suggesting a decrease in the corundum growth rate.

The second inflection point in some traverses, where the Ti-vs-distance profile changes from linear to exponential, would reflect the isolation of individual melt pockets from the external melt flow. This point corresponds to inflections in the Ti/Mg correlation profiles (Fig. 4). The level of Ti at the inflection points around different melt pockets may reflect differences in the composition of the melt at the time of closure of each pocket (Fig. 6b,d) or slightly different ratios of cavities to solid corundum (Fig. 6c). The drop in the Ti/Mg ratios at this point probably reflects the crystallization of tistarite ($\text{Ti}_2\text{O}_3$) from the trapped melts, while phenocrysts of Mg-bearing phases are rare. It is also possible that the distribution coefficient $D_{\text{Ti} \text{cor/melt}}$ was changing with melt composition, but this is not required by the modelling.

The continued extraction of corundum from the trapped melt would lead to rapid concentration of incompatible elements (Ti, Zr, REE) in the residual melt, and in the coexisting corundum, and ultimately to the crystallization of a range of unusual minerals enriched in these elements\textsuperscript{17,18}. The contents of incompatible elements such as Ti, Zr and Ce in the glasses increase sharply with decreasing $\text{Al}_2\text{O}_3$ (Fig. SD-4). This is generally consistent with a progressive reduction in melt volume, concentrating incompatible elements due to the fractional crystallization (growth) of corundum. The degree to which individual elements increase during this last stage depends strongly on the crystallisation of phases such as carmeltazite ($\text{ZrAl}_2\text{Ti}_4\text{O}_{11}$); the concentration factors for elements such as Rb, Sr and HREE are relatively low (5–10) while concentrations of Th increase by a factor of >60 during this third stage of crystallisation.

Figure 7 maps the distribution of corundum crystallized during the different stages of growth, in a crystal aggregate cut approximately subparallel to the [0001] axes of most crystals. It shows the very open structure produced during open-system crystallisation, the progressive closure of the system produced by rapid growth, and the small volume of material crystallized in the closed system around each trapped melt pocket. The strong sense of directional growth in the CL zoning suggests growth from a substrate, either a “floor” or a “wall”, toward the moving melt/fluid.

The implied rapid growth of the corundum crystals, and the short-range diffusion profiles at sharp contacts between high- and low-Ti volumes (Fig. 3) suggest that the melt system crystallising the Carmel Sapphire was very short-lived, especially on a geological time-scale (Fig. 6f). It was terminated by explosive eruption, producing large-scale brecciation; shattered aggregates of corundum crystals are cut by numerous veins of amorphous carbon, providing further evidence of the vital role of reduced COH fluids in this system.

These conclusions are robust despite the uncertainties in the diffusion coefficients, which may vary 3–4 orders of magnitude between studies\textsuperscript{31}. Slow diffusivities of the order of $10^{-15}$ cm$^2$/s result in a time scale of few years, whereas a timescale of days is obtained when using faster diffusivities (e.g. $10^{-12}$ cm$^2$/s). However, when assuming an average corundum growth rate of $10^{-7}$ cm/s\textsuperscript{30}, our traverse modelling estimates that complete
crystallization is achieved in less than an hour. Therefore, if both processes (i.e. corundum crystal growth and diffusion of sharp concentration gradient) are to record the same timescale, these modelling results favour the use of faster diffusivities (of the order of $10^{-11}$ cm$^2$/s) or slightly slower crystal growth rates than the ones estimated in 14 (on the order of $10^{-9}$ cm/s).

It might be argued that reducing fluids cannot exist in the lithospheric mantle because they would be oxidized by contact with normal (FeO-bearing) mantle rocks. Our modelling indicates short time-scales and the potential coating of the walls of fluid conduits by early-crystallized phases (in this case corundum); both factors offer possible solutions to the problem of generating and preserving extreme local $fO_2$ heterogeneity in the mantle.

**Broader significance.** The discovery of tistarite (Ti$_2$O$_3$) in the Mt Carmel material was the first report of a terrestrial Ti$^{3+}$ mineral, and the Mt Carmel examples represent, to our knowledge, the first recognition of Ti$^{3+}$ substitution in natural corundum17. These are not simply interesting mineralogical curiosities; their terrestrial occurrence has a wider significance. As noted above, the $fO_2$-T conditions required to produce SiC and Ti$^{3+}$-bearing phases would not be expected to occur in Earth’s upper mantle. Their presence therefore suggests that mantle-derived melts may be accompanied by deep-seated CH$_4$–H$_2$ fluids; when concentrated in specific environments at shallower depths such fluids clearly can produce at least transient volumes of highly-reduced rocks. An important question is: how widespread are these processes, and what is their role in the global carbon cycle?

Xiong et al.40 have reviewed a number of examples of similar highly-reduced assemblages, briefly summarized here. In chromitites in ophiolites from Tibetan and Polar Urals, Ti-corundum occurs together with SiC, diamond, alloys and other phases indicative of low $fO_2$, many included in the corundum14. Explosive volcanic eruptions on the Kamchatka Peninsula carry a xenocryst assemblage that includes native Fe and Al, SiC and Ti-corundum40,41.
A corundum inclusion with 1.8 wt% Ti was found in a diamond from the Monastery Mine kimberlite (South Africa)\(^4^2\); other diamonds from this mine contain inclusions of SiC. Similarly, Otter and Gurney\(^4^3\) reported two corundum inclusions, with 0.7 and 1.2 wt% Ti, in diamonds from the Sloan kimberlite in Colorado, USA.

It therefore seems that localized volumes of highly-reduced mineral assemblages may commonly develop in the lithospheric mantle, through the introduction of mantle-derived, magma-transported CH\(_4\)--H\(_2\) fluids. The Mt Carmel example implies that these localized reduced volumes can be protected from oxidation by the surrounding mantle by crystallization of phases like corundum. The sampled Mt Carmel systems were transient, and destroyed by eruption of the host magma; others might survive where eruption did not occur. The interaction of such reduced fluids with the lithospheric mantle may also be the ultimate source of more oxidized metasomatic fluids dominated by CO\(_2\)+H\(_2\)O.

**Conclusions**

Numerical modelling of Ti\(^{3+}\) zoning patterns traces three stages of magmatic crystal growth in corundum aggregates ("Carmel Sapphire") found as xenoliths in Cretaceous pyroclastic rocks on Mt Carmel, N. Israel. (1) Crystallisation of skeletal/hopper crystals began on a substrate and continued in an open system (flowing melt) at \(f_{O_2} = ca \Delta IW-6\). (2) As further crystal growth reduced porosity and impeded fluid flow, Ti\(^{3+}\) concentrations in the corundum rose linearly. (3) Crystal growth finally isolated individual pockets of the melt in a 3D network, and Ti\(^{3+}\) concentrations in both melt and corundum rose exponentially as fractional crystallisation of corundum reduced melt volumes. Ti remained an incompatible element during crystallisation even when concentrations in corundum exceeded 2 wt%, as did other elements such as Mg, Zr and REE. Modelling of diffusion profiles at sharp contacts near melt pockets indicate that the entire crystallization process took place on timescales of days to years. The presence of glass in the melt pockets indicates that crystallization was ongoing immediately before the explosive eruption of the host magma; this may suggest a genetic connection between that magma and the CH\(_4\)--H\(_2\) dominated fluids responsible for the highly reduced conditions. Ti-bearing corundum may be used as an indicator of these conditions in the lithospheric mantle.

**Methods**

**Sampling.** The sampling methods used in the field and laboratory, designed to avoid external contamination, have been described in detail elsewhere\(^2^2\).

**Analytical techniques.** \textit{SEM, EMP.} Samples were mounted in epoxy blocks, polished and coated with carbon. A Zeiss EVO MA15 scanning electron microscope (SEM) at the Geochemical Analysis Unit (GAU), Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia\(^2^7,^2^8\) was used to capture Backscattered Electron (BSE) images. Energy Dispersive X-ray spectrometry (EDS) was used to map the elemental composition of the samples, and to analyze phases of interest. An accelerating voltage of 15 keV and a beam current of 1 nA was used.
Major and minor elements were determined by electron microprobe (EMP) using a CAMECA SX100 equipped with five wavelength-dispersive spectrometers at the Macquarie University GeoAnalytical (MQGA; formerly GAU), Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia. Analyses were performed using a focused beam (1–2 μm) with an accelerating voltage of 15 keV and a beam current of 20 nA. Standards were a suite of natural and synthetic minerals; specifically Al₂O₃ for Al, TiO₂ for Ti and MgO for Mg. Peak counting varied between 10 and 20 s, and background was counted for 5–10 s on either side of the peak. Oxygen and carbon were measured directly; matrix corrections were carried out by the ZAF software.

Major and minor elements also were determined by electron microprobe (EMP) using a JEOL 8530F electron microprobe equipped with five wavelength dispersive spectrometers at the Centre for Microscopy Characterisation and Analysis (CMCA), The University of Western Australia, Perth, Australia. Analyses were preformed using a fully focussed beam with an accelerating voltage of 15 keV, a beam current of 15 nA. Standards were a suite of natural and synthetic minerals. On-peak counting times were 30 s for all elements. X-ray intensity data was corrected for Time Dependent Intensity (TDI) loss (or gain) using a self-calibrated correction for Si ka, Ti ka, Mn ka, Na ka, K ka and mean atomic number (MAN) background corrections were used throughout. Unknown and standard intensities were corrected for deadtime. Oxygen was measured, matrix corrections and ZAF correction were applied throughout.

Trace element analysis. Trace elements were obtained using a Photon Machines Excite 193 nm ArF EXCI-MER laser system coupled to an Agilent 7700× ICP-MS at the GAU, Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia. Detailed method descriptions have been given by44. The ablation conditions included beam size (50 μm), pulse rate (5 Hz) and energy density (7.59 J/cm²). Ablation was performed in an HeEx II cell and helium was used as the carrier gas at a total flow rate of 0.825 L/min. Average analytical runs comprised of 20 analyses, 2 analyses of reference materials and 10 analyses of unknowns, bracketed by two analyses of NIST610 standard glass at the beginning and end of each run. Analyses consisted of 60 s of background and 120 s of ablation. Trace element concentrations were calculated from the raw signal data using the on-line software package GLITTER (http://www.mq.edu.au/GEMOC). GLITTER calculates the element concentrations and relevant isotopic ratios for each mass sweep and displays them as time-resolved data. This allows homogeneous segments of the signal to be selected for integration. GLITTER then corrects the integrated ratios for ablation-related fractionation and instrumental mass bias by calibration of each selected time segment against the identical time-segments of the standard glass (NIST610 using the GeoReM values). An appropriate major element was used as an internal standard to quantify trace element concentrations and the synthetic BC2 and NIST612 glasses were used as reference materials (GeoReM).

Transmission electron microscopy. FIB foils from the region of interest were prepared for TEM using a dual-beam FIB system (FEI Helios G3CX). High Angle Annular Dark Field Scanning Transmission Electron Microscopy (HAADF-STEM) imaging and element mapping were carried out using an FEI Titan G2 80-200 TEM/STEM with ChemiSTEM Technology operating at 200 kV at the Centre for Microscopy Characterisation and Analysis (CMCA), The University of Western Australia, Perth, Australia. The element maps were obtained by energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy using the Super-X detector on the Titan with a probe size ~ 1 nm and a probe current of ~ 0.25 nA. Total acquisition times of 20–30 min were used to obtain good signal-to-noise ratios. Electrofission was carried out using a field limiting aperture that selected an area approximately 400 nm in diameter.

Data availability
All data used in this paper are contained in the Supplementary Information.

Received: 31 July 2020; Accepted: 9 December 2020
Published online: 28 January 2021

References
1. Foley, S. F. A reappraisal of redox melting in the earth's mantle as a function of tectonic setting and time. J. Petrol. 52, 1363–1391 (2011).
2. Luth, R. W. & Stachel, T. The buffering capacity of lithospheric mantle: Implications for diamond formation. Control Mineral. Petrol. 168, 1083. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00410-014-1083-6 (2014).
3. Yaxley, G. M., Berry, A. J., Kamenetsky, V. S., Woodland, A. B. & Golovin, A. V. An oxygen fugacity profile through the Siberian Craton—Fe K-edge XANES determinations of Fe³⁺/Fe²⁺ in garnets in peridotite xenoliths from the Udachnaya East kimberlite. Lithos 140-141, 142–151 (2012).
4. Miller, W. G. R., Holland, T. J. B. & Gibson, S. A. Garnet and spinel oxybarometers: New internally consistent multi-equilibria models with applications to the oxidation state of the lithospheric mantle. J. Petrol. 57, 1199–1222 (2016).
5. Frost, D. J. & McCammon, C. A. The redox state of Earth's mantle. Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 36, 389–420 (2008).
6. Stagno, V., Ojwant, D. O., McCammon, C. A. & Frost, D. J. The oxidation state of the mantle and the extraction of carbon from Earth's interior. Nature 493, 84–88 (2013).
7. Smith, E. M. et al. Origin of big gem diamonds from metallic liquid in deep earth mantle. Science 354, 1403–1405 (2016).
8. Shiryaev, A. A., Griffin, W. L. & Stoyanov, E. Moissanite (SiC) from kimberlites: Polytypes, trace elements, inclusions and speculations on origin. Lithos 122, 152–164 (2011).
9. Trumbull, R. B. et al. The carbon isotope composition of natural SiC (moissanite) from the Earth's mantle: New discoveries from ophiolites. Lithos 113, 612–620 (2009).
10. Ulmer, G. C. et al. The redox stability of moissanite (SiC) compared with metal-metal oxide buffers at 1773 K and at pressures up to 90 kbar. N. Jb. Mineral. Abh. 172, 279–307 (1998).
11. Xu, X. et al. Origin of ultrahigh pressure and highly reduced minerals in podiform chromitites and associated mantle peridotites of the Luobusa ophiolite, Tibet. Gondwana Res. 27, 686–700 (2015).
12. Yang, J. S. et al. Diamonds, native elements and metal alloys from chromitites of the Ray-Iz ophiolite of the Polar Urals. *Gondwana Res.* **27**, 459–485 (2015).

13. Zhang, R. Y. et al. Discovery of in situ super-reducing, ultrahigh-pressure phases in the Luobusa ophiolitic chromitites, Tibet: New insights into the deep upper mantle and mantle transition zone. *Am. Mineral.* **101**, 1285–1294 (2016).

14. Shiriyaev, A. A. & Gaillard, F. Local redox buffering by carbon at low pressures and the formation of moissanite–natural SiC. *Eur. J. Mineral.* **26**, 53–59 (2014).

15. Schmidt, M. W., Gao, C., Golubkova, A., Rohrbach, A. & Connolly, J. A. D. Natural moissanite (SiC)—A low temperature mineral formed from highly fractionated ultra-reducing COH fluids. *Prog. Earth Planet. Sci.* **1**, 27 (2014).

16. Leung, I., Guo, W., Friedman, I. & Gleason, J. Natural occurrence of silicon carbide in a diamondiferous kimberlite from Fuxian. *Nature* **346**, 352–354 (1990).

17. Griffin, W. L. et al. First terrestrial occurrence of tistarite (Ti$_2$O$_3$): Ultra-low oxygen fugacity in the upper mantle beneath Mount Carmel, Israel. *Geology* **44**, 815–818 (2016).

18. Xiong, Q. et al. Super-reduced mineral assemblages in “ophiolithic” chromitites and peridotites: The view from Mt Carmel. *Eur. J. Mineral.* [https://doi.org/10.1127/ejm/2017/0029-2646] (2017).

19. Stein, M. & Hofmann, A. W. Fossil plume head beneath the Arabian lithosphere?. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **114**, 193–209 (1992).

20. Segev, A. A. 40Ar/39Ar and K-Ar geochronology of Berriasian-Hauterivian and Cenomanian tektomagmatic events in northern Israel: Implications for regional stratigraphy. *Cretaceous Res.* **30**, 810–828 (2009).

21. Apter, D. High pressure indicator minerals from the Rakefet Magmatic Complex (RMC), Mt. Carmel, Israel. In *Proceedings GSSA Kimberley Diamond Symposium*, Extended Abstract (2014).

22. Griffin, W. L. et al. Permainan to Quaternary magmatism beneath the Mt Carmel area, Israel: Zircons from volcanic rocks and associated alluvial deposits. *Lithos* **314–315**, 307–322 (2018).

23. Griffin, W. L. et al. Cr$_2$O$_3$ in corundum: Ultra-high contents under reducing conditions. *Am. Mineral.* [in Press] (2020).

24. Sass, E. Late Cretaceous volcanism in Mount Carmel, Israel. *Israel J. Earth Sci.* **29**, 8–24 (1980).

25. Goldsmith, J. R. The melting and breakdown reactions of anorthite at high pressures and temperatures. *Am. Mineral.* **65**, 272–284 (1980).

26. Griffin, W. L. et al. Carmeltazite, ZrAl$_2$Ti$_{13}$O$_{32}$, a new mineral trapped in corundum from volcanic rocks of Mt Carmel, northern Israel. *Minerals* **8**, 601–612 (2018).

27. Griffin, W. L. et al. A terrestrial magmatic hibonite-grossite-vanadium assemblage: Desilication and extreme reduction in a volcanic plumbing system, Mt Carmel, Israel. *Am. Mineral.* **104**, 207–217 (2019).

28. Griffin, W. L. et al. Extreme reduction: Mantle-derived oxide xenoliths from a hydrogen-rich environment. *Lithos* **358–359**, 105404 (2020).

29. Sutherland, F. L. et al. Gem-corundum megacrysts from east Australian basaltic fields: Trace elements, oxygen isotopes and origins. *Austral. J. Earth Sci.* **56**, 1003–1022 (2009).

30. Giuliani, L. et al. Evolution of textures, crystal size distributions and growth rates of plagioclase, clinopyroxene and spinel crystallized at variable cooling rates from a mid-ocean ridge basaltic melt. *Earth Sci. Rev.* **103**/165 (2020).

31. Cherkaoui, D. & Yan, L. Titanium diffusion in olivine. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **147**, 43–57 (2014).

32. Wallender, C., O’Neill, H. S. C. & Kamenetsky, K. S. Survival times of anomalous melt inclusions from element diffusion in olivine and chromite. *Nature* **447**, 303–306 (2007).

33. Spandler, C. & O’Neill, H. S. C. Diffusion and partition coefficients of minor and trace elements in San Carlos Olivine at 1,300 degrees C with some geochemical implications. *Contrib. Mineral. Petrol.* **159**, 791–818 (2010).

34. Shannon, R. D. Revised effective ionic radii and systematic studies of interatomic distances in halides and chalcogenides. *Acta Crystallogr., A* **32**, 751–767 (1976).

35. Kirfel, A. & Eichhorn, K. Accurate structure analysis with synchrotron radiation. The electron density in Al$_2$O$_3$ and Cu$_2$O. *Acta Crystallogr., A* **46**, 271–284 (1990).

36. Newnham, R. E. & de Haan, Y. M. Refinement of the alpha Al$_2$O$_3$, Ti$_2$O$_3$, V$_2$O$_5$ and Cr$_2$O$_3$ structures. *Zeitschrift fur Kristallographie* **117**, 235–237 (1962).

37. Stoyanov, E., Langenhorst, F. & Steinle-Neumann, G. The effect of valence state and site geometry on Ti L$_{2,3}$ and O K electron energy-loss spectra of Ti$_2$O$_3$ phases. *Am. Mineral.* **92**, 577–586 (2007).

38. Donaldson, C. H. Origin of some of the Rhum harriseite by segregation of intercumulus liquid. *Mineral. Mag.* **45**, 201–209 (1982).

39. Naslund, H. R. Supersaturation and crystal growth in the roof-zone of the Skaggaard magma chamber. *Contrib. Mineral. Petrol.* **86**, 89–93 (1984).

40. Karpov, G. A. et al. Diamonds and accessory minerals in products of the 2012–2013 Tolbachik fissure eruption. *J. Volcanol. Seismol.* **8**, 323–339 (2014).

41. Gordeev, E. I. et al. First results from the 2012–2013 Tolbachik Fissure Eruption. *Bull. Volcanol. Soc. Jpn.* **58**, 1–8 (2013).

42. Moore, R. O. & Gurney, J. J. Mineral inclusions in the Sloan diatremes, Colorado-Wyoming State Line kimberlite district, North America. In *Kimberlites and Related Rocks Vol. 2* (eds Ross, J. et al.) 1029–1041 (Blackwell Scientific, Cambridge, 1989).

43. Otter, M. L. & Gurney, J. J. Mineral inclusions in products of the 2012–2013 Tolbachik fissure eruption. *Bull. Volcanol. Soc. Jpn.* **58**, 1–8 (2013).

44. Jackson, S. E., Pearson, N. J., Griffin, W. L. & Belousova, E. A. The application of laser ablation-inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometry to in-situ U-Pb zircon geochronology. *Chem. Geol.* **211**, 47–69 (2004).

Acknowledgements

We thank referees Georg Zellmer and Gianluca Iezzi for constructive comments and suggestions. WLG and SYO’R acknowledge the research funds for the TARDIS Project provided by the ARC Centre of Excellence for Core to Crust Fluid Systems and geochemical laboratory support through NCRIS AuScope and NSW Government Research Attraction and Acceleration Program grants. The authors acknowledge the scientific and technical assistance of Microscopy Australia at the Centre for Microscopy, Characterization and Analysis, a facility funded by The University of Western Australia, and State and Commonwealth Governments. We thank Fernando Camara and Luca Birdini for useful discussions, especially on crystallographic issues. This study used instrumentation funded by ARC LIEF and DEST Systemic Infrastructure Grants, Macquarie University and industry. This is contribution 1533 from the ARC Centre of Excellence for Core to Crust Fluid Systems (http://www.ccfs.mq.edu.au) and 1406 from the GEMOC Key Centre (http://www.gemoc.mq.edu.au).

Author contributions

WLG, B.O., S.Y.O’R. and V.T. collaborated to design the project; V.T. led the field and laboratory teams that produced the sample material; S.E.M.G. and W.L.G. carried out the analytical work and basic interpretation;
S.E.M.G. and M.S. carried out the TEM studies; J.S. carried out the 3D-µCT work; B.O. did the numerical modelling with input from J.C.A.; W.L.G. and B.O. wrote the MS.

Competing interests
The authors declare no competing interests.

Additional information
Supplementary Information The online version contains supplementary material available at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-79739-4.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to W.L.G.

Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints.

Publisher’s note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article’s Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article’s Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

© The Author(s) 2021