Social Media Research and the Impact of Graphic Design: a case study examining an Indonesian political campaign.

Fanny SUHENDRA*a, Nicole WRAGG*a, Carolyn BARNES*a

*a Swinburne University of Technology, Australia
*Corresponding author e-mail: fsuhendra@swin.edu.au
doi: https://doi.org/10.21606/drs.2020.265

Abstract: Outside imagery, graphic design is largely invisible to the academic fields most interested in communication campaigns, seeing negligible research conducted into its role within campaigns. In an era of social media and participatory culture, the blurring of the boundaries between producers, consumption and audiences through the phenomenon of ‘produsage’ can offer rich, contextualised insights into the impact of the designed aspects of campaigns. In examining Berakar Komunikasi’s online campaign supporting the 2014 and 2019 election bids of Indonesia’s President Jokowi Widodo, our paper explores how qualitative social media research offers fine-grained insights into the reception of campaigns. The paper raises questions about the siloed nature of research which neglects design’s relationship to cultural and social phenomena, underscoring the need for interdisciplinary research that brings an integrated framework of approaches and concepts to knowledge production where design is concerned.

Keywords: communication campaigns; graphic design; qualitative social media research; interdisciplinary research

1. Introduction

Graphic design is an integral element of campaigns, whether commercial, political or social. Yet relevant literature in the fields of social marketing, health promotion and political advertising overwhelmingly concentrates on the textual content of campaigns outside a small body of writing on campaign imagery such as illustrations and photographs. All other aspects of graphic design are seemingly invisible to writers in these fields, with the communicative contribution of graphic design through designer’s strategic choice and application of colours, logos, typefaces and typographic layouts disregarded. This neglect is understandable. Various writers argue, for example, that due to its abstract nature, typography is perceived as less evidently communicative than the pictorial content of graphic design (Crisp, 2012; Hagan,
2012; Trieb, 1989). Yet the considered application of typography in support of a campaign’s objectives and the communication context lies at the heart of the strategic role of graphic design within campaigns in seeking to influence audience attitudes and behaviour.

Current research into the impact of campaigns spans three main forms. First is quantitative survey research based on large data sets, including that focusing on variation of response between audience segments. Second is qualitative interview and focus group research with small numbers of audience members to examine responses to campaign messaging. Third is evaluative research investigating whether campaigns influence outcomes for target audiences and societies. In each case, teasing out the reception of campaigns is complex, their multiple elements creating an array of variables. However, any effort to be comprehensive here is challenged if the designed component of campaigns is not examined.

Although other disciplines might lead campaign development, graphic design is a process that underpins an entire campaign from conceptualisation through to strategic implementation. Adapting Van Der Waarde’s (2012) conceptualisation of the fundamental elements of graphic design to the creation of campaigns, Figure 1 characterises the three main dimensions of graphic design as spanning:

1. The selection and application of visual elements, including typographic elements, image elements (illustrations, photographs, symbols) and schematic elements (colours, line, borders), the main considerations being aesthetic impact and visual coherence.
2. The selection and application of visual strategies to support the campaign message and strategy, including branding and visual identity to ensure the campaign is identifiable and its textual and visual elements are aligned. In the case of online campaigns, this extends to the design of the behavioural and visual aspects of digital artefact (interaction design), which influence user engagement and experience.
3. Consideration of the target audience to align communication with their identity, needs and perspectives.

The literature of social marketing, health promotion and political advertising focuses on the analysis of campaign imagery, using various semiotic approaches such as visual rhetoric to examine the connotative and denotative function of images. These approaches ‘highlight the communicative dimensions of images’ in relation to higher socio-cultural and political meanings (Foss 2005, p. 145). Drake Reitan (2016, p. 507), however, stresses that in the case of graphic design, the object of analysis encompasses all ‘non-textual materials’, not only images. The collectivity of design elements that contextualise campaign illustrations and photographs is meaningful in its own right, its visual rhetoric being properly considered as an integrated whole within the wider campaign.
In discussing ways to research the role of graphic design in campaigns, this paper examines the phenomenon of produsage, a term coined by Axel Bruns (2006). Since the rise of the Internet and social media, the contemporary zeitgeist has been linked to the emergence of a ‘participatory culture’ in which former divisions between production, consumption and audiences have dissolved (Jenkins, 2006). Pre-empting and paralleling this phenomenon, since the late 1970s, participatory processes that engage people in design have been of growing importance in design practice and research under titles including participatory design, co-design, co-creation and design thinking (Smith, Bossen & Kanstrup, 2017). Contemporary campaigns have similarly sought to become highly participatory, being conducted online to maximise audience engagement and penetration, graphic design serving to add coherence and identity to the manifestation of a campaign across digital platforms, mass media and campaign ephemera.

Social media is seen to create dynamic new power relations between content providers and audience members. Bruns (2006, 2007, 2008) developed the concepts of ‘produser’ and ‘produsage’ to account for the new active role of everyday people in creating diverse digital content on the Internet, thus challenging former ideas of the ‘audience’ for media content. Specifically, Bruns (2006) sees the ‘produser’ phenomenon as resulting in ‘the collaborative and continuous building and extending of existing content in pursuit of further improvement (p. 2)’. As a new model of audienceship and content creation, Bruns and Schmidt (2011, p .5) ascribe four key features to produsage. Firstly, produsage is open to the broad community with barriers intentionally set as low as possible to encourage participation. Secondly, the open participatory nature of social media drives continual development of ‘unfinished artefacts’. Thirdly, leadership in the context of produsage is a direct result of the quality
of contributions, leadership being open to constant turnover. Fourthly, the media content tends to be thought of as ‘common property’, making status achieved through the interest of others the main currency, rather than financial rewards.

All four features are potentially significant to the role of the audience and graphic designers in campaigns. Produsage challenges the traditional view of designers as holding the power in communication, although the idea of an active audience disrupting such power precedes the phenomenon of convergent production and consumption in social media (e.g. Frascara, 2004). Figure 2 represents audience response as the final stage of design, this paper using the concept of produsage as a basis for examining audience engagement with design in campaigns.

![Three stages of the design process](image)

**Figure 2** Three stages of the design process.

To draw attention to the lack of understanding of the presence and purpose of graphic design in campaigns, the paper begins with a review of literature on relevant studies from social marketing and political advertising. After outlining the research design and methods, the paper’s main body is a detailed examination of the application of graphic design within the “Jokowi Tintin political campaign”, considering how the social media response to the campaign, via the phenomenon of produsage, can shed light on the role of graphic design in campaigns. The findings show that the nature and extent of produsage in response to a campaign can indicate that a campaign’s creative strategy has resonated with its audience. The paper ends with discussion and conclusions about the effect of disciplinary focus inhibiting research into graphic design’s diverse roles in everyday life.

**2. Campaign studies and visual content**

A review of social marketing and health promotion literature identifies a number of studies on the role of illustrations and photographs in campaigns (e.g. Clarke, Niederdeppe & Lundell 2012; Lagomarsino & Suggs 2018; Potter & Stapleton 2012; Springston & Champion 2004). These articles consider image choice, the semiotics of images and the correlation between campaign messaging and visual content (Wymer 2011). For example, Springston and
Champion’s (2004) review of breast cancer screening information examines preferences for colour and for photographic over cartoon-like images. In the political advertising literature, imagery is part of broader discussions around campaigns. For example, the communication of sentiment in political posters (Holtz-Batcha & Johansson, 2013), the dissemination of political advertising (Lee & Campbell, 2016) and the use of attack narratives in campaigns (Dermody & Hanmer-Lloyd’s, 2011). McVee and Carse (2016) examine the use of narrative construction and symbolism across verbal, visual and textual content to invoke fear and a need for urgent action. Gadarian (2014) explores the emotional effect of war imagery for persuasive purposes within political campaigns. Dumitrescu (2010) links non-verbal cues and photographic language to the expression of candidates’ attributes and party ‘persona’, while Visgo (2013) analyses its use in the expression of political ideology.

Roland Barthes’s (1977) theory of the rhetoric of the image is a common framework for the analysis of the meaning of images in campaigns. It is used to discuss imagery in political campaigns in relation to gender (Bauer & Carpinella, 2018), nationalism (White, 2016) and localism (Jacob & Munis, 2018), and the consistency of political messaging in campaigns across image and text (Dumitrescu, 2019; Hayek 2011; Teer-Tomaseli 2005; Visgo, 2013). Serazio (2017) discusses the importance of candidate branding, but without mentioning graphic design.

The 2008 presidential campaign of Barack Obama prompted more recognition of the role of graphic design in political campaigns (e.g. Franz & Ridout, 2010). Seidman (2010) compares the visual dimension of the Obama campaign to high-end consumer branding, noting the consistent application of high impact branding across all campaign collateral. Zavattaro (2010) attributes Obama’s political success to his positioning as a brand through the use of graphic design, this changing conventions in political advertising. Thomas (2010) sees the campaign’s consistent application of graphic design using familiar, US-themed elements as enhancing a sense of trust in Obama, while Billard (2016) argues that the range and online distribution of campaign materials allowed the public to engage with and disseminate the campaign.

Although graphic design is recognised for its role and impact in these articles, they include little analysis of the formalistic, symbolic and metaphorical elements of graphic design. An exception in the health promotion literature is Wressel et al. (2011), which examines design strategy for the UK ‘Saving Lives’ HIV awareness campaign in seeking to increase impact by “steer[ing] away from the traditional colours, typefaces, vocabulary, and style of previous public health campaigns” (p. 82). In the political advertising literature, Billard (2018) examines the contribution of typography in American presidential campaigns to establish candidate identity and campaign messaging. Billard (2016, p. 4584) notes, however, that the impact of graphic design in the Obama campaign has not raised interest among political advertising researchers in the strategic role of graphic design in past or present campaigns.
3. Social media and campaign engagement

Before the rise of social media, the study of campaigns focused on the role of television as the main, proven method for disseminating campaigns (Dauda, Norma & Hasan 2017; Niederdeppe et al. 2008; Pedrana et al. 2014). Recent studies discuss the role of social media as an affordable and effective medium for campaign delivery (Khawaja, Ali & Khan 2017) that provides political candidates with ‘closer and unfiltered’ access to voters (Fulgoni, Lipsman & Davidsen 2016, p. 242), enabling interactive communication (Hayek 2011, p. 145) while the range of social media platforms caters to voters’ preferred participation style, enhancing engagement (Goldstein & Ridout 2004; Kaid, Fernandes & Painter 2011). Seidman (2010) notes the impact of Shepard Fairey’s ‘Hope’ poster in demonstrating social media to be fertile ground for creating and sharing images to extend official campaigning.

The fields that study campaigns typically use controlled approaches such as focus group, interview and survey to measure the impact of campaign messaging (e.g. Borah, Fowler & Ridout 2018; Fernandes 2013; Phillips, Urbany & Reynolds 2008; Turner, Underhill & Kaid 2013). Recently, researchers have harnessed quantitative evaluative techniques such as Google Trends to examine the level of engagement and patterns of response to political advertising (e.g. Hopp & Vargo 2017; Housholder, Watson and Susan 2018; Sohal & Kaur 2018). Software packages can track the cursor location or clicks within websites to examine user attention, movement, dropout or navigation, although these methods are currently a blunt tool for analysing the role of graphic design in websites.

In pre-campaign studies, social media has been used to identify attitudes of target audiences (e.g. David et al. 2016). Social media equally offers researchers and practitioners access to the unsolicited responses of online audiences to campaign content. Snelson (2016) argues that qualitative analysis of social media data complements quantitative measures of engagement, providing scope to unravel the complexity of response to campaigns. The use of traditional research methods can disrupt ‘the ecology of [the participants’] social world by introducing [researcher’s] own subjectivity, beliefs, or interests’ (Roman & Apple 1990, p. 45). By contrast, social media data affords researchers access to naturalistic data. Diverse fields have made strong use of social media data, for example, Greene et al’s (2010) study of the use of Facebook by those with diabetes as an information seeking and support platform while Robards and Lincoln (2017) have analysed the use of Facebook Timeline by people in their twenties to craft ‘growing up’ stories.

4. Case selection and methods

The study informing this paper combined visual rhetoric analysis of designer-generated and audience-generated contributions to the ‘Jokowi-Tintin’ campaign with content analysis of social media comments about the campaign. We chose a campaign with a high component of illustrative graphics over those where the creative solution was based in typography and the formalistic elements of graphic design in order to examine conditions where the presence of graphic design would be hardest for non-designers to recognise.
4.1 Data sample
Between May 2014 and May 2019, the first author collected brand and interface designs and illustrations from the campaign’s official websites www.gulunglenganbajumu.com (2014) and www.karyaadalahdoa.id (2018–2019) and its Facebook and Instagram accounts (www.facebook.com/karyaadalahdoa; www.instagram.com/karyaadalahdoa). In total, 1319 images and around 3500 written comments were captured. The extent of data collected suggests the level of interest in a campaign, Van Dijck (2009) arguing that for every 100 people who visit a site, 89 view it, ten engage by commenting while one visitor is an active producer of online content. The visual content contributed by audience members is highly developed. Most written responses are brief, although they do feature an array of emoticons and repeated vowels and final letters in particular words, Calamur (2016) arguing that in short online communications these strategies replace body language and facial expressions to amplify the sense of a message.

4.2 Data analysis approach
The textual and visual data were coded and categorised based on the stages of thematic analysis set out by Braun and Clark (2013). Thematic analysis is a theoretically flexible process for identifying patterns of meaning and effect across data sets (Braun & Clarke, 2012; Clarke & Braun, 2017). Before coding began, the data was organised into two databases to allow for separate analysis of the visual and non-visual material; all data was then reviewed as a single body to gain a sense of its collective nature (Yin, 2011). During this process, first impressions of the data were recorded (Miles, Huberman & Saldana, 2014). Codes were assigned to words and phrases within the textual data and elements of the visual data to identify patterns of significance across the design phases of conceptualisation, implementation and audience response. Following Williams and Karahanna (2013), repeated coding cycles were undertaken, with relations between themes being explored visually using thematic coding schema to arrive at the final themes of stylistic and thematic appropriation, brand identity and visual consistency, Indonesian specificity and nostalgia, and produsage.

4.3 Case background
The creative agency Berakar Komunikasi initiated the ‘Jokowi-Tintin’ campaign in the last two months of the 2014 Indonesian Presidential election to support Joko Widodo’s presidential bid. Against the background of an acrimonious campaign, the agency’s key creatives Yoga Adhitriswa and Hari Prasetyo sought to mobilise Jokowi’s silent supporters to vote, voting being voluntary in Indonesia. Four Berakar employees worked on the campaign, Adhitriswa serving as its art director and copywriter, and Prasetyo as illustrator. Berakar Komunikasi reactivated the campaign for the May 2019 Presidential election in late 2018, titling this second phase ‘Creation is Prayer’. In addition, Berakar Komunikasi created a Facebook-based online platform called “Demokreatif” (See Figure 3), which enabled continued audience contribution of artwork supportive of Jokowi between the elections.
Where graphic design in Indonesian political campaigns is typically decontextualized and generic (Figure 4), creativity and sophisticated design strategies are central to the ‘Jokowi-Tintin’ campaign. The 2014 campaign was built on the illustration style and themes from the comic series *The Adventures of Tintin* (1929–1976), created by the Belgian cartoonist Hergé (1907-1983). Berakar Komunikasi seeded the 2014 campaign with 19 mock-Tintin book covers (Figure 5). The campaign became a viral sensation for its clever representation of Jokowi, via the persona of Tintin, as hardworking, honest and unaffected.
Within the 2014 and 2019 campaigns, the Berakar Komunikasi team both initiated campaign collateral and sought to foster produsage by providing templates and stickers to prompt audience contribution. In both instances, a group of audience members posted original contributions to create new adventures for Jokowi, reflecting Berakar Komunikasi’s rhetorical appropriation of popular culture. By the 2019 campaign, audience members and the campaign team were sharing creative authorship of the campaign as audience members extended the campaign’s themes beyond The Adventures of Tintin, the campaign’s graphic design elements maintaining coherence across the campaigns to weave audience- and campaign-generated content into one recognisable campaign.

5. Findings and discussion
The fields of political advertising, health promotion and social marketing see illustration and photography as the main media of visual communication in campaigns, where communication strategy within graphic design is grounded in a range of aesthetic and typographic elements. Even when operating at an unnoticed level, these frame the presentation and reception of illustrative graphics in addition to establishing campaign identity and experience. The following section provides an analysis of the communicative role of graphic design in the Jokowi-Tintin campaign to show audience response to be negotiated from within the matrix of graphic design.

5.1 Characterisation of Jokowi via appropriation
The core creative strategy of the Jokowi-Tintin campaign is the appropriation of the style and themes from the Tintin comics. Originally, the illustration-based campaign was developed to
overcome a lack of access to photographs of Jokowi, but associating Jokowi with Tintin had a clear logic. Tintin, a young reporter who travels the world with his dog Snowy, is an unlikely action hero who takes on bullies and fights for good through his quick thinking. Jokowi came to the 2014 Presidential election as a youthful figure in Indonesian politics with a reputation for tackling corruption and improving life for common people in his roles as Mayor of Surakarta and Governor of Jakarta. The Tintin comics are imbued with themes of adventure, geopolitics and identity (Dunnett, 2009). Hergé’s semi-realistic, ligne claire illustration style allows for detailed scene-setting to support narrative richness. The books act as a window to the wonders of the world for readers, also being laced with humour.

The Berakar Komunikasi creative team harnessed these qualities to suggest Jokowi’s promise as a president, showing the candidate venturing around the Indonesian archipelago interacting with the nation’s diverse peoples and cultures (Figure 6). On winning a Shorty Award for the campaign, the creative team explained that, “Depicting Jokowi as a people-oriented leader in light-hearted and idyllic campaign materials sought to enable audiences to express their support and amplify it enthusiastically. We sought to highlight Jokowi’s strengths ... his ‘rolled-up sleeves’ work attitude [alongside] Tintin’s character as a problem solver and action-oriented (Shortyawards 2017)”.

![Figure 6](image_url)

**Figure 6** 19 Images styled on covers for The Adventures of Tintin albums for 2014 ‘Jokowi-Tintin’ campaign.
5.2 Branding and visual identity

Appropriating the style and themes of the Tintin comics set the creative direction of the campaign, but graphic design provided brand identity and visual consistency, with purpose-designed logos, for example, being developed to brand the images. For the 2014 campaign, this was an illustrative logo showing Jokowi rolling up his sleeves ready for work (Figure 7). For the 2019 campaign, a simple, red and white logo bearing the name of the campaign identified campaign artwork (Figure 6). Formalistic elements of the campaign and typography were developed with both legibility and tone in mind. To increase clarity and keep the focus on imagery, campaign messages were positioned on the side of the screen. Where images incorporated typography, typographic choices were authentic to the comic style of the Tintin books while spoken text used the comic convention of speech balloons (Figure 8).

Such strategies departed dramatically from the usual typography in Indonesian presidential campaigns with its discordant mix of bold, all caps, sans serif fonts with lowercase serif fonts. By contrast, the novel stylistics of the Jokowi-Tintin campaigns projected political freshness, reflecting the advertising industry’s co-optation of fun for marketing purposes.

Figure 7  The 2014 and 2019 campaign logos.
Translation (left) “Roll up your sleeves, support Jokowi”
Translation (right) “Creation is Prayer”

Figure 8  Typography in the ‘Creation is Prayer’ campaign.
Translation (Left) “Jokowi: Are you ready for debate sir?, Amin: Yes”
Translation (Right) “Clean Law”
The focus of campaign activity was Facebook and Instagram, two platforms developed to accentuate images. The number of Indonesian Instagram users is the fourth highest worldwide, with around 60 million users (Statista, 2019). The level of audience-generated content in Indonesia is also high. The Berakar Komunikasi team fostered audience contribution and collaboration through readily accessible tools and materials, but their attention to branding and visual identity was important to how audience members would recognise and identify with the campaign on these otherwise generic platforms (Figure 9). Interaction and interface design on Facebook and Instagram were also integral to the scope for campaigns to extend into social media, integrating qualities of connectivity, intuitiveness, enablement and responsiveness into the experience of campaigns.

5.3 Indonesian specificity and nostalgia

Taylor (2009) updates Bourdieu’s idea of cultural capital to argue that people today have ‘omnivorous’ tastes that range across the high/low cultural divide, with ironic use of cultural references signifying coolness. The Tintin references are meaningful to urban Indonesians, especially Indonesia’s youth, who are well versed in Western popular culture. The campaign also included many references to daily life in Indonesia, these often tinged with nostalgia.
Evoking nostalgia is common in political campaigns, even resonating with generations who never experienced the original (Phau & Marchegiani, 2010). In depicting Jokowi as a modern day Tintin, the 2014 campaign framed the presidential aspirant as an appealing electoral choice for contemporary Indonesians, with references to aspects of everyday life in Indonesia injecting authenticity, familiarity and connection into the campaign. These include Jokowi’s family depicted in the style of the iconic Khong Guan Biscuit tin and an image of Jokowi seated in the ubiquitous red-rooster bowl of Indonesian street food sellers (Figure 10).

As with the Tintin illustrations, to further build relatability, campaign illustrations depict recognisable Indonesian gestures, scenes and traits, including characters with varied hair styles, skin tones and modes of dress. Reflecting Tintin’s amiable character, Jokowi is portrayed in the midst of the Indonesian people, comfortably interacting with ordinary Indonesians from all walks of life (Figure 11).

5.4 Campaign implementation and audience engagement
Both the 2014 and 2019 campaigns provided tools to prompt audience contributions. In 2019, this included high resolution digital cut outs of Jokowi to add to a selfie to simulate
meeting Jokowi, something unlikely given the vast Indonesian population and archipelago (Figure 12). The 2019 campaign extended to offline events which participants were encouraged to share online by tagging the campaign accounts to add to the growing body of visual material. Campaign events were oriented towards the young, an event with street culture activists on 24 March 2019 in North Jakarta featuring hip hop and skateboarding competitions (Naufalia, 2019). Jokowi masks and photo zones were established to maximise the flow of images to social media (Figure 13).

Figure 12  Audience-generated content created using the Jokowi stickers.

Figure 13  Jokowi’s mask and its application at offline events.
The campaign provided ‘how-to’ guides for drawing Jokowi and his running mate Ma’ruf Amin (Figure 14). These were little used, with audience members introducing a diversity of new themes and pop-culture references. Contributions upheld the creative strategy of using vignettes from the campaign trail, one post illustrating a comment from a Jokowi speech comparing the global trade war to Marvel’s *Infinity War* (Septiari, 2018). These contributions are both original and in keeping with the campaign’s creative strategy, branding and visual identity, highlighting the role of graphic design in the dissemination and reception of the campaign.

![Figure 14](image.png)

*Figure 14  ‘How-to’ guides for drawing Jokowi and Amin Ma’ruf.*

In particular, the consistent application of the downloadable campaign logo, accessed via the campaign website, linked the variety of posted images to the campaign, showing that contributors had absorbed the mechanics of branding and visual identity. As illustration styles and pop-culture references diversified in the 2019 campaign, the presence of the logo made campaign contributions consistently identifiable, affording contributors — many of them likely members of Indonesia’s creative community given the skill shown in the images — a real sense of contributing to the campaign. As audience members posted images outside the Tintin theme, the campaign reciprocated by adding other new characters, introducing both nostalgic and contemporary references to the campaign (Figure 15). Indicating that the public found the campaign accessible and compelling, people continued to post contributions between the 2014 and 2019 presidential campaigns despite there being no immediate motivation to do so.
5.5 Written commentary

The Jokowi-Tintin campaign generated significant audience response. By comparison to sophistication of the audience-generated images, most comments are brief, banal and often unintelligible, indicating no deep thought. A significant number, however, do express enthusiasm for the creative strategy rather than posting about Jokowi or the Presidential election:

@username: Hahaha Cooool... If only both sides can battle it out through art and creativity, it will be more interesting.
www.instagram.com/karyaadalahdoa, 22 September 2018

@username: Create more of these [posts], it’s goooood..
www.instagram.com/karyaadalahdoa, 28 October 2018

@username: So cool ihhh [expression of excitement], creative 🙏🙏🙏
www.instagram.com/karyaadalahdoa, 11 March 2019

Appreciation for the creative strategy even saw a supporter of Jokowi’s opponent, Prabowo Subianto, condemning the campaign for its focus on Jokowi:
The extent of comments fostered the sense of a ‘crowd’ looking at the campaign, the social media audience being highly effective in sharing, re-posting and inviting more social media friends to view the campaign, maintaining currency (Falasca, Dymek, & Grandien, 2018). The enthusiasm and respect for the campaign is exemplified in the number of instances where people ask, albeit in rhetorical ways, for permission to share campaign content:

@Username: Allow me to copy and paste your image in my facebook.
www.instagram.com/karyaadalahdoa, 5 November 2018

The introduction of corporate branding principles into politics alongside the polished visual treatment of professional graphic design agencies is not a neutral enterprise (Aiello, 2012). Moor defines branding as “more akin to a managerial technique or resource that seeks to use broadly ‘cultural’ … materials for a range of strategic ends” (2007, p. 88). Graphic design should thus be seen as “constitutive and structuring [of a campaign] in its own right,” a “highly selective and ideological endeavour” that “contributes to stylizing rather than simply strategically representing” its subject (Aiello 2012, p. 461). Berakar Komunikasi’s injection of visual branding and strategy into Indonesian politics via the Jokowi-Tintin campaign represents the aestheticization of political discourse in Indonesia, operationalising the agency’s knowledge of the preferences and persuasion points of the Indonesian public developed through its work in advertising and marketing.

The nature and extent of produsage in response to the campaign indicates the campaign’s creative strategy resonated with its audience. Over time, this formed a feedback loop between the campaign creators and audience leading to the diversification of both campaign content and style as set out in Figure 16. The tools to enable ready contribution were effective in fostering broad produsage, but our most significant finding is the evidence of the shared leadership of the campaign, this building the scope of and interest in the campaign in an organic way. Tracking this activity offers new ways to research the reception of campaigns, while the Jokowi-Tintin campaign demonstrates the critical role of graphic design in combining numerous elements into a cohesive campaign that encourages and enables audience contributions.
6. Conclusion

Understanding the impact of graphic design in campaigns is essential to citizen-involving initiatives in public health and safety. In political campaigns, it is important to understand how the designed aspects of campaigns intersect with the democratic ideal of free political participation. By comparison to quantitative research, qualitative research is fluid, contextual and probing, resulting in deep and richly detailed data. Visual research methods are of growing interest in the social sciences, but few researchers in the scholarship of campaigns currently recognise the diffuse presence of graphic design within the fabric of campaigns or have the design literacy to analyse it.

Currently, research into campaigns is fragmented into silos according to the disciplines most concerned with campaign content, the fields of health promotion, social marketing and political advertising bringing their distinct concepts and concerns to the examination of campaigns. This has rendered the role of graphic design invisible at worst, marginalised at
best, with negligible research happening from an informed perspective. Corazzo, Harland, Honnor and Rigley (2019) examine the challenge graphic design has experienced in building a research culture. They attribute this to “the absence of consensual nomenclature, lack of confidence and exemplars with practice-based graphic design research, the uncertain expectations of research audits, lack of venues for dissemination, heavy teaching loads and few established career pathways for research. (p. 2)” Although accepting this assessment, the promotion of graphic design as an intellectually distinct field of research is problematic when the presence of graphic design — as the lingua franca of countless human activities today and hence research questions — highlights the need for the integration of design research into many disciplines.

7. References
Adi, A., & Hidayat, A. (2018). Indonesia is Asia’s Biggest Instagram Market with 45mn Users. Retrieved from https://en.tempo.co/read/894655/indonesia-is-asias-biggest-instagram-market-with-45mn-users
Aiello, G. (2012). All Togetherness now: the recontextualization of branding and the stylization of diversity in EU public communication. Social Semiotics, 22(4), 459-486.
Barthes, R. (1977). Image, Music, Text. (S. Heath, Ed.). London: Fontana Press.
Bauer, N. M., & Carpinella, C. (2018). Visual Information and Candidate Evaluations: The Influence of Feminine and Masculine Images on Support for Female Candidates. Political Research Quarterly, 71(2), 395–407. https://doi.org/10.1177/10659129177738579
Billard, T. J. (2016). Fonts of Potential: Areas for Typographic Research in Political Communication. International Journal of Communication, 10. https://doi.org/1932-8036/20160005
Billard, T. J. (2018). Citizen typography and political brands in the 2016 US presidential election campaign. Marketing Theory, 18(3), 421–431. https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593118763982
Borah, P., Fowler, E., & Ridout, T. N. (2018). Television vs. YouTube: political advertising in the 2012 presidential election. Journal of Information Technology and Politics, 15(3), 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1080/19331681.2018.1476280
Braun, V., and Clarke, V. (2013). Successful qualitative research: a practical guide for beginners. London: Sage.
Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2012). Thematic analysis. In H. Cooper, P. M. Camic, D. L. Long, A. T. Panter, D. Rindskopf, & K. J. Sher (Eds.), APA handbook of research methods in psychology, Vol 2: Research designs: Quantitative, qualitative, neuropsychological, and biological. Washington, DC : American Psychological Association.
Bruns, A. (2007). “Produsage: Towards a Broader Framework for User-led Content Creation.” In Proceedings Creativity & Cognition 6, 99–106. New York: ACM Press.
Bruns, A. (2008). Blogs, Wikipedia, Second Life, and Beyond: From Production to Produsage. New York: Peter Lang.
Bruns, A., & Schmidt, J. H. (2011). Produsage: A closer look at continuing developments. New Review of Hypermedia and Multimedia, 17(1), 3–7. https://doi.org/10.1080/13614568.2011.563626
Calamur, K. (2016). Is Tintin Racist? Coming to Terms With the Checkered History of a Boyhood Hero. Retrieved June 10, 2018, from https://www.theatlantic.com/entertainment/archive/2016/06/tintin/485501/
Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2017). Thematic analysis. The Journal of Positive Psychology, 12(3), 297-298.
Clarke, C. E., Niederdeppe, J., & Lundell, H. C. (2012). Narratives and images used by public communication campaigns addressing social determinants of health and health disparities. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, 9*(12), 4254–4277. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph9124254

James Corazzo, C., Harland, R. G., Honnor, A. & Rigley, S. (2019). The Challenges for Graphic Design in Establishing an Academic Research Culture: Lessons from the Research Excellence Framework 2014. *The Design Journal, DOI: 10.1080/14606925.2019.1682446*

Crisp, D.G. (2012). *Graphic design in context: typography*. New York: Thames & Hudson.

Dauda, S., Norma, N., & Hasan, N. (2017). Aspirant’s Agendas and Party Ideology in Newspaper Political Ads in Nigeria. *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities, 25* (4), 1667–1688.

David, E., Zhitomirsky-Geffet, M., Koppel, M., & Uzan, H. (2016). Utilizing Facebook pages of the political parties to automatically predict the political orientation of Facebook users. *Online Information Review, 40*(5), 610–623. https://doi.org/10.1108/OIR-09-2015-0308

Dermody, J., & Hanmer-Lloyd, S. (2011). An introspective, retrospective, futurepective analysis of the attack advertising in the 2010 british general election. *Journal of Marketing Management, 27*(7–8), 739–764. https://doi.org/10.1080/0267257X.2011.587826

Drake Reitan, M. (2016). ‘A cloud burst erupts’: visual rhetoric and Los Angeles’ Grand Intervention, *Journal of Urban Design, 21*(6): 802-815.

Dumitrescu, D. (2010). *Know me, love me, fear me: The anatomy of candidate poster designs in the 2007 french legislative elections*. *Political Communication, 27*(1): 20–43. https://doi.org/10.1080/10584600903297117

Dunnett, O. (2009). Identity and geopolitics in Hergé’s Adventures of Tintin. *Social & Cultural Geography. 10*(5), 583-598.

Falasca, K., Dymek, M., & Grandien, C. (2017). Social media election campaigning: who is working for whom? A conceptual exploration of digital political labour. *Contemporary Social Science, 14*(1), 89–101. https://doi.org/10.1080/21582041.2017.1400089

Fernandes, J. (2013). Effects of Negative Political Advertising and Message Repetition on Candidate Evaluation. *Mass Communication and Society, 16*(2), 268–291. https://doi.org/10.1080/15205436.2012.672615

Foss, S. (2005). “Theory of Visual Rhetoric”. In K. Smith, S. Moriarty, G. Barbatsis and K. Kenny (Eds), *In Handbook of Visual Communication: Theory, Methods and Media*, (p.145). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Foss, S. (2009). *Rhetorical Criticism: Exploration and Practice* (4th ed.). Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.

Frascara, J. (2004). *Communication design: Principles, methods and practice*. New York: Allworth Press.

Franz, M. M., & Ridout, T. N. (2010). Political advertising and persuasion in the 2004 and 2008 presidential elections. *American Politics Research, 38*(2), 303–329. https://doi.org/10.1177/1532673X09353507

Fulgoni, G. M., Lipsman, A., & Davidsen, C. (2016). The Power of Political Advertising: Lessons for Practitioners How Data Analytics, Social Media, and Creative Strategies Shape U.S. Presidential Election Campaigns. *Journal of Advertising Research, 56*(3), 239. https://doi.org/10.2501/JAR-2016-034

Gadarian, S. K. (2014). Scary Pictures: How Terrorism Imagery Affects Voter Evaluations. *Political Communication, 31*(2), 282–302. https://doi.org/10.1080/10584609.2013.828136
Goldstein, K., & Ridout, T. N. (2004). Measuring the Effects of Televised Political Advertising in the United States. *Annual Review of Political Science, 7*(1), 205–226. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.polisci.7.012003.104820

Greene, J. A., Choudhry, N. K., Kilabuk, E., & Shrank, W. H. (2011). Online social networking by patients with diabetes: A qualitative evaluation of communication with Facebook. *Journal of General Internal Medicine, 26*(3), 287–292. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11606-010-1526-3

Hagan, S. M. (2012). The challenge of look and read: why illustration communicates meaning that text is not equipped to deliver. In C Ferreira (ed) *Conflia: international conference in illustration & animation*. Portugal: IPCA:107-124.

Hayek, L. (2011). Visual Communication in Election Campaigns: An Analysis of Election Posters in the 2008 Austrian National Election Campaign. *International Journal of the Image, 1*(3).

Holtz-bacha, C., & Johansson, B. (2013). Dimensions of negativity: Negative campaigning on election posters in Germany and Sweden, 4, 99–116. https://doi.org/10.1386/post.4.1-2.99

Housholder, E., Watson, B. R., & Lo Russo, S. (2018). Does Political Advertising Lead to Online Information Seeking. Real-World Test Using Google Search Data. *Journal of Broadcasting and Electronic Media, 62*(2), 337–353. https://doi.org/10.1080/08838151.2018.1451854

Hopp, T., & Vargo, C. J. (2017). Does negative campaign advertising stimulate uncivil communication on social media? Measuring audience response using big data. *Computers in Human Behavior, 68*, 368–377. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2016.11.034

Jacobs, N. F., & Munis, B. K. (2018). Place-Based Imagery and Voter Culture: Experimental Evidence on the Politics of Place. *Political Research Quarterly*. https://doi.org/10.1177/1065912918781035

Jenkins, H. (2006). *Convergence Culture: Where Old and New Media Collide*. New York: New York University Press.

Kaid, L. L., Fernandes, J., & Painter, D. (2011). Effects of political advertising in the 2008 presidential campaign. *American Behavioral Scientist, 55*(4), 437–456. https://doi.org/10.1177/0002764211398071

Khawaja, Z. ul abdin, Ali, K. I., & Khan, S. (2017). Using Facebook for Sexual Health Social Marketing in Conservative Asian Countries: A Systematic Examination. *Journal of Health Communication, 22*(2), 111–123. https://doi.org/10.1080/10810730.2016.1222031

Lagomarsino, M., & Suggs, L. S. (2018). Choosing Imagery in Advertising Healthy Food to Children: Are Cartoons the Most Effective Visual Strategy? *Journal of Advertising Research*, (February), 487–499. https://doi.org/10.2501/JAR-2018-003

Lee, B., & Campbell, V. (2016). Looking Out or Turning in? Organizational Ramifications of Online Political Posters on Facebook. *International Journal of Press/Politics, 21*(3), 313–337. https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161216645928

McVee, M. B., & Carse, C. (2016). A multimodal analysis of storyline in ‘The Chinese Professor’ political advertisement: narrative construction and positioning in economic hard times. *Visual Communication, 15*(4), 403–427. https://doi.org/10.1177/1470357216637752

Moor, L. (2007). *The rise of brands*, Oxford, Berg.

Naufalia, D. (2019). ONE STREET FESTIVAL - The Biggest Indonesian Street Culture Movement | Letter F. Retrieved August 3, 2019, from https://letterf.id/one-street-festival-the-biggest-indonesian-street-culture-movement/

Niederdeppe, J., Bu, Q. L., Borah, P., Kindig, D. A., & Robert, S. A. (2008). Message design strategies to raise public awareness of social determinants of health and population health disparities. *Milbank Quarterly, 86*(3), 481–513. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0009.2008.00530.x
Pedrana, A. E., Hellard, M. E., Higgs, P., Asselin, J., Batrouney, C., & Stoove, M. (2014). No drama: Key elements to the success of an HIV/STI-prevention mass-media campaign. *Qualitative Health Research, 24*(5), 695–705. https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732314529024

Phau, I., & Marchegiani, C. (2011). The value of historical nostalgia for marketing management. *Marketing Intelligence and Planning, 29*(2), 108–122. https://doi.org/10.1108/0263450111117575

Phillips, J. M., Urbany, J. E., & Reynolds, T. J. (2008). Confirmation and the Effects of Valenced Political Advertising: A Field Experiment. *Journal of Consumer Research, 34*(6), 794–806. https://doi.org/10.1086/523287

Potter, S. J., & Stapleton, J. G. (2012). Translating Sexual Assault Prevention from a College Campus to a United States Military Installation: Piloting the Know-Your-Power Bystander Social Marketing Campaign. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence, 27*(8), 1593–1621. https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260511425795

Robards, B., & Lincoln, S. (2017). Uncovering longitudinal life narratives: scrolling back on Facebook. *Qualitative Research, 17*(6), 715–730. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794117700707

Roman, L. G., & Apple, M. W. (1990). Is naturalism a move away from positivism? Materialist and feminist approaches to subjectivity in ethnographic research. In E. W. Eisner & A. Peshkin (Eds.), *Qualitative inquiry in education: The continuing debate* (pp. 38–73). New York: Teachers College Press.

Seidman, S. A. (2010). Barack Obama’s 2008 Campaign for the U.S. Presidency and Visual Design. *Journal of Visual Literacy, 29*(1), 1–27. https://doi.org/10.1080/23796529.2010.11674671

Serazio, M. (2017). Branding politics: Emotion, authenticity, and the marketing culture of American political communication. *Journal of Consumer Culture, 17*(2), 225–241. https://doi.org/10.1177/1469540515586868

Septiari, D. (2018). Trade war must not become “Infinity War”: Jokowi. Retrieved July 30, 2019, from https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2018/09/13/trade-wars-avengers-infinity-war-thanos-jokowi-world-economic-forum.html

Snelson, C. L. (2016). Qualitative and Mixed Methods Social Media Research: A Review of the Literature. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 15*(1), 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406915624574

Springston, J. K., & Champion, V. L. (2004). Public relations and cultural aesthetics: Designing health brochures. *Public Relations Review, 30*(4), 483–491. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2004.08.005

Statista. (2019). Countries with most Instagram users 2019. Retrieved December 9, 2019, from https://www.statista.com/statistics/578364/countries-with-most-instagram-users/

Taylor, T.D, (2009). Advertising and the conquest of culture. *Social Semiotics, 19*(4), 405–425.

Treib, M. 1989. Pictures, phonemes, and typography, in *Looking closer: critical writings on graphic design*, edited by M Bierut, W Drenttel, S Heller, & DK Holland. New York: Allworth: 81–82.
Turner, M. M., Underhill, J. C., & Kaid, L. L. (2013). Mood and Reactions to Political Advertising: A Test and Extension of the Hedonic Contingency Hypothesis. *Southern Communication Journal, 78*(1), 8–24. https://doi.org/10.1080/1041794X.2012.712194

Van Der Waarde, K., & Vroombout, M. (2012). Communication Design Education: Could Nine Reflections Be Sufficient? *Visible Language, 46*(1/2), 20.

van Dijck, J. (2009). ‘Users like you? Theorizing agency in user-generated content’, *Media Culture Society, 31* (1): 41-58.

Visgo, O. (2013). The visual construction of personal ethos in election posters. *The Poster, 4*(1&2), 31–57. https://doi.org/10.1386/post.4.1-2.31

Williams, C. K., & Karahanna, E. (2013). Causal explanation in the coordinating process: A critical realist case study of federated IT governance structures. *MIS Quarterly, 37*(3): 933-964.

White, L. (2016). “It’s time”: revolution and evolution in Australian political advertising. *Journal of Historical Research in Marketing, 8*(3), 375–395. https://doi.org/10.1108/JHRM-08-2015-0034

Wressell, A., Twaites, H., Taylor, S., Hartland, D., & Gove-humphries, T. (2011). Saving Lives through visual health communication : A multidisciplinary team approach. *Journal of Visual Communication in Medicine, 81*, 81–91.

Wymer, W. (2011). Developing more effective social marketing strategies. *Journal of Social Marketing, 1*(1), 17–31. https://doi.org/10.1108/20426761111104400

Yin, R. (2011). Qualitative Research from Start to Finish, New York, The Guilford Press.

Zavattaro, S. M. (2010). Brand Obama. *Administrative Theory & Praxis, 32*(1), 123–128. https://doi.org/10.2753/ATP1084-1806320108

---

About the Authors:

**Fanny Suhendra** is a PhD candidate at Swinburne University of Technology, her research is focused on graphic design role in effecting change in social and political settings through social media.

**Associate Professor Nicole Wragg** is the Chair of Communication & Digital Media Design at Swinburne University of Technology. Nicki’s research sits at the intersection of communication design, technology and design education. She applies an interdisciplinary and industry-engaged approach to examine how best to communicate a range of social issues.

**Associate Professor Carolyn Barnes** is Academic Director of Research Training in the School of Design, Swinburne University of Technology. Her research investigates the knowledge and power bound up in individuals and groups to address their needs and interests, including via co-design methods and the role of the designer-facilitator.
Appendix

Images Reference

Figure.1-3. Suhendra, F (2020). Various diagrams.

Figure.4 (left). Typical political campaign posters in Indonesia [Photograph]. (2018). Retrieved from https://www.ajnn.net/news/kampanye-dengan-baliho-sudah-ketinggalan-zaman/index.html

Figure.4 (right) Typical political campaign posters in Indonesia [Photograph]. (2018). Retrieved from https://www.merdeka.com/foto/politik/341365/20140325124811-nestapa-pepohonan-di-tangsel-jadi-korban-kampanye-caleg-001-nfi.html

Figure.5. Berakar Komunikasi (2015). The original 19 images for the 2014 ‘Jokowi-Tintin’ campaign [Image]. Retrieved from https://shortyawards.com/7th/the-story-of-jokowis-impromptu-walkabout-campaign

Figure.6. Berakar Komunikasi (2015). Adventure of Jokowi in Indonesia [Image]. Retrieved from https://shortyawards.com/7th/the-story-of-jokowis-impromptu-walkabout-campaign

Figure.7 (left) Berakar Komunikasi (2014). Jokowi-Tintin 2014 Logo [Image]. Retrieved from www.gulglingenbaju.com.

Figure.7 (right) Berakar Komunikasi (2018). Jokowi-Tintin 2019 Logo [Image]. Retrieved from www.karyaadalahdoa.id

Figure.8. Berakar Komunikasi (2019). Typography examples in “Creation is Prayer” campaign [Image]. Retrieved from https://www.instagram.com/p/BsuovHpAW8T/ and https://www.instagram.com/p/BsvCw0VA_IX/

Figure.9. Berakar Komunikasi (2019). Platform screenshots examples in “Creation is Prayer” campaign [Screenshots]. Retrieved from www.karyaadalahdoa.id, (www.twitter.com/karyaadalahdoa) (www.karyaadalahdoa.id)

Figure.10. Berakar Komunikasi (2019). References to daily life in the 2019 Campaign [Image]. Retrieved from https://www.instagram.com/p/BpJCxmYDkp_/ and https://www.instagram.com/p/Bulj3CaA-RI/

Figure.11. Berakar Komunikasi (2019). Jokowi interacting with everyday Indonesians [Screenshots]. Retrieved from https://www.instagram.com/p/BuBNYQ4A0EL/ and https://www.instagram.com/p/Bv1ZKfagvI0/

Figure.12. Berakar Komunikasi (2019). Collation of audience-generated using Jokowi stickers [Photographs]. Retrieved from www.instagram.com/karyaadalahdoa

Figure.13. Berakar Komunikasi (2019). Collation of audience-generated using Jokowi stickers [Photographs]. Retrieved from https://www.instagram.com/p/Bu1RMv7gOnL/, https://www.instagram.com/p/Bu1RMv7gOnL/

Figure.14. Berakar Komunikasi (2019). ‘How-to’ guides for drawing Jokowi and Amin [Image]. Retrieved from https://www.instagram.com/p/BtTDU2gfq_/ and https://www.instagram.com/p/BtTJB9LglVv/

Figure.15. Berakar Komunikasi (2019). Varied pop-culture reference in Creation is Prayer campaign [Image]. Retrieved from www.karyaadalahdoa.id