THE ANALYSIS OF STUDENTS’ ERROR IN USING RELATIVE CLAUSE

Stevyara Rismawathi Kusdianty
Department of English Education, University of Kuningan
Email: steyarahisma@gmail.com

APA Citation: Kusdianty, S. R. (2016). The analysis of students’ error in using relative clause. Indonesian EFL Journal, 2(1), 60-70

As for the errors caused by the influences of intralingual transfer or most of the students didn’t understand about the material, and interlingual transfer or the influences from their mother tongue in pronouncing and writing relative pronoun.

Keywords: error analysis, relative pronoun, students, report text

INTRODUCTION

In learning English, students often make errors in using relative clause. According to Azar (1999, p. 267), “relative clause or also called adjective clause is a dependent clause that modifies noun. It describes, identifies or gives further information about a noun.” Leech and Svartvik (2002, p. 383) add that “the main function of a relative clause is to modify a noun phrase.”

Further, Azar (1999) divides relative clause into two types. The first is relative pronoun that is used to connect dependent clause to independent clause. It includes who, whom, which, that, and whose. The second type is relative adverb that includes where and when. Where is used to modify a place and when is used to modify a noun of time.

Relative pronoun is a pronoun whose function is to connect sentences and to describe nouns (antecedent) that can be humans, things, animals or plants. According to Radden and Driven (2007, p. 178), “the function of relative pronouns is to mark the relative clause within the structure of a complex sentence.” It is also supported by Bao (2015) who states that relative pronoun is used to represent the person or thing in the main clause and each relative pronoun has its specific function. It means that each relative pronoun has different function. For example, “who” and “whom” are used for people, “that”...
Stevyara Rismawathi Kusdianty
The Analysis of Students’ Error in Using Relative Clause

is used for people and things, “which” is used for things, and “whose” is used for possessive adjective.

Wh-Relative pronoun consists of “who”, “whom”, “which” and “whose.” The use of those relative pronouns depends on what we are referring to. Leech and Svartvik (2002, p. 386) states that “Wh-relative pronoun are ‘who’, ‘whom’, ‘whose’ and ‘which’. They reflect the personal/non-personal gender of the antecedent.” Here are examples of using wh-relative pronoun:

(1) **Who & Whom for personal**

Relative pronoun who and whom is use to explain person antecedent of relative clause. Huddleston and Pullum (2005, p. 13) give an example about who relative pronoun:

_The secretary wrote to [all the members who were absent from the meeting]._

They explains that “The underline relative clause modifies members and combines with it to form the head nominal of the bracketed NP: members who were absent from the meeting.”

Regarding relative pronoun whom, Broukal (2004, p. 346) states that whom is very formal English. We use “whom” only in formal situation, such as when writing for a school and speaking in a speech. Here the example of using whom by Broukal (2004, p. 347):

_The pilot whom I know is young._

Main clause : _the pilot is young_
Adjective Clause : _whom I know_

He describes that an adjective clause derives after the noun it explained.

(2) **Which for non-personal**

Relative pronoun which is used for things (non-personal) antecedent (Azar, 1999, p. 268). Example:

_The film which I need is unobtainable._

The relative clause modifies film, and _film which I need_ forms the head nominal (Huddleston and Pullum, 2004, p. 183).

(3) **Whose for personal and non-personal**

According to Azar (1999, p. 274), “whose is used to show the possession. It carries the same meaning as other possessive pronouns used as adjectives: his, her, its and theirs.” Here is the example of using relative pronoun whose (Azar, 1999, p. 274):

_I know the man. His bicycle was stolen._
_I know the man whose bicycle was stolen._

Whose is linked to a noun: _his bicycle_ becomes _whose bicycle._

In learning English as foreign language, errors is common problem made by the students and it can’t be avoided. Thus, it is important to analyze the error since it can be an evaluation for the teacher himself. According to Brown (2000, p. 219), “error Analysis can keep us to closely focused on specific languages rather than viewing universal aspect of language.”

In addition, Corder (1982, p. 36) states that “errors are still classified on a superficial basis as errors of omission, errors of addition, errors of selection and errors of ordering.”

1. Errors of omission where some element is omitted which should be present.
2. Errors of addition where some element is present which should not be there.
3. Errors of selection where the wrong item has been chosen in place of the right one.
4. Errors of ordering where the elements presented are correct but wrong sequenced.

Furthermore, Brown (2000, p.224) declares four sources of error as follows:

1. Interlingual transfer
Interlingual transfer has meaningful source of error for all learners (Brown, 2000, p. 224). It means that the students who learn English as a foreign language have difficulties in their learning. Sometimes, it was influenced by their mother tongue.

2. Intralingual transfer
Richard (1973, p. 174) suggests that “intralingual error are those which reflect general characteristics of rule learning, such as faulty generalization, incomplete application of rules, and failure to learn condition after which rules apply.” It means that students sometimes make errors because of their understanding in language learning. Perhaps, it causes by the sources of language, especially in grammatical rules.

3. Context of learning
Context of learning refers to performance of teacher in the classroom. According to Brown (2000, p. 226), “context, for example, refers to the classroom with its teacher and its material in the case of untutored second language learning.” He adds that the students often make errors because the teacher doesn’t give clear explanation.

4. Communication strategies
Communication strategies is the teacher’s way in conveying the material to the students. Selinker (1972) in Corder (1982, p. 56) also states that “these errors were regarded as a by-product of the attempt of the learner to express his meaning in spontaneous speech with an inadequate grasp of the target language system.”

METHOD
The data are taken from students at class XI MIA I and XI MIA II in SMAN 1 Garawangi. The writer uses two techniques in collecting the data, namely observation and interview. In observation, the writer gives writing test especially fill in the blank form about the use of Relative Pronoun in Report text. Then, the writer collected the data and identified the use of Relative Pronoun from Report text. Interview is used to investigate the causes of students’ errors in applying relative pronoun. The interview consists of six questions. The interviewees are ten students with the lowest score of relative pronoun test in report text. The interview session was recorded, then the writer transcribes it by using meaning condensation method. According to Kvale (1996, p. 224), “Meaning condensation entails an abridgement of the meaning expressed by the interviewees into shorter formulation.”
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Students Errors in Using Relative Pronoun

Table 1. Students’ answer of Relative pronoun Test in Report Text

| No. | Name  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | Total |
|-----|-------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|-------|
| 1   | S1    | who| whom| Whom| which| who| whose| whom| Whom| whom| whose| 3     |
| 2   | S2    | whose| who| Whom| whom| Who| which| whom| whom| whom| whose| 3     |
| 3   | S3    | whose| who| Whom| whose| which| Whom| whom| whose| whom| whose| 3     |
| 4   | S4    | whose| who| Whom| whom| whom| Whom| whom| Who| whose| whose| 4     |
| 5   | S5    | which| whom| Which| whose| Who| Whom| whom| whose| whom| which| 4     |
| 6   | S6    | whose| whose| Whom| whom| whom| Whom| whom| Who| whom| whom| 4     |
| 7   | S7    | whose| which| Which| whom| whom| Whose| which| which| whose| whom| 3     |
| 8   | S8    | which| whose| Whom| whom| whose| Who| whom| which| whom| whom| 5     |
| 9   | S9    | which| who| Whom| whose| whom| Whom| which| Who| whose| whose| 3     |
| 10  | S10   | whose| who| Whom| whose| which| Whom| whom| Whom| whom| whom| 2     |
| 11  | S11   | which| who| Who| whom| who| whom| whose| who| whom| whom| 4     |
| 12  | S12   | whose| whom| Who| whom| who| whom| whose| which| whom| whom| 4     |
| 13  | S13   | whose| which| Who| which| whose| who| whom| who| whom| which| 2     |
| 14  | S14   | which| whom| Whose| whom| whom| which| whom| whose| whose| which| 4     |
| 15  | S15   | which| who| When| who| when| when| where| where| when| where| 1     |
| 16  | S16   | which| whom| Who| whom| whom| who| whom| whose| whom| whose| 3     |
| 17  | S17   | which| whose| Who| whose| whom| whose| whom| whom| whom| whom| 3     |
| 18  | S18   | whose| whom| Who| which| whose| whom| whom| which| whose| which| 1     |
| 19  | S19   | whose| Where| who| where| whom| where| where| whom| whose| 3     |
| 20  | S20   | which| who| Which| whose| which| whose| who| whom| which| whose| 3     |
| TOTAL| 10   | 18 | 14 | 11 | 14 | 16 | 9  | 17 | 13 | 13 |      | 63    |
1. **Rock music, _______ consists of electric guitar, acoustic bass guitar and drums, is favorite music of teenagers.**

   The right answer for this question is relative pronoun *which* because the antecedents of the sentence is Rock music and it belongs to non-personal (things) antecedent. In answering this question, there were 9 students (S2, S3, S4, S6, S7, S10, S12, S13 & S18) who used relative pronoun *whose*. Relative pronoun whose is used to explain possessive adjective in relative clause. Then, there was 1 student (S1) who used relative pronoun *who*.

   **S2** : Rock music, *whose* consists of electric guitar, acoustic bass guitar and drums, is favorite music of teenagers.

   **S1** : Rock music, *who* consists of electric guitar, acoustic bass guitar and drums, is favorite music of teenagers.

   **Correction** : Rock music, *which* consists of electric guitar, acoustic bass guitar and drums, is favorite music of teenagers.

   In conclusion, there were 10 errors in using relative pronoun *which* made by students at XI MIA I.

   **S2** : Rock and roll was the name given to the music *who* developed in the early 1950’s.

   **S1** : Rock and roll was the name given to the music *whom* developed in the early 1950’s.

   **S6** : Rock and roll was the name given to the music *whose* developed in the early 1950’s.

   **Correction** : Rock and roll was the name given to the music *which* developed in the early 1950’s.

   In conclusion, there were 18 errors in using relative pronoun *which* made by students at XI MIA I.

   **S14** : Alan freed, *whose* was born on December 1921, comes from Ohio.

   **Correction** : Alan freed, *who* was born on December 1921, comes from Ohio.

   Besides, there was 1 student who used relative when and where, it is false because it is relative adverb. In conclusion, there were 14 errors in used relative pronoun *whose*. Relative pronoun whose is used to explain possessive adjective in relative clause.

   **S2** : Alan freed, *whom* was born on December 1921, comes from Ohio.

   **S5** : Alan freed, *which* was born on December 1921, comes from Ohio.

   **S14** : Alan freed, *whose* was born on December 1921, comes from Ohio.

   **Correction** : Alan freed, *who* was born on December 1921, comes from Ohio.
using relative pronoun **who** made by students at XI MIA I.

4. **He is one of rock music's pioneer** ______ the people knows about.

   The right answer for this question is relative pronoun **whom** because him belongs to personal antecedent. It is as object of relative clause. In answering this question, there were 6 students (S3, S5, S9, S10, S17 & S20) who used relative pronoun whose. Relative pronoun whose is used to explain possessive adjective in relative clause. Then, there were 3 students (S1, S13 & S18) who used relative pronoun which. Relative pronoun which is used to explain non-personal (things) in relative clause. Then, there were 2 students (S15 & S19) who used relative pronoun who. Relative pronoun who is used to explain subject person in relative clause.

   **S3**
   
   : He is one of rock music's pioneer 
   **whose** the people knows about.

   **S1**
   
   : He is one of rock music's pioneer 
   **which** the people knows about.

   **S19**
   
   : He is one of rock music's pioneer 
   **who** the people knows about.

   **Correction**
   
   : He is one of rock music's pioneer 
   **whom** the people knows about.

   In conclusion, there were 11 errors in using relative pronoun **whom** made by students at XI MIA I.

5. **The rock singer __________ appears in 1950 is Elvis Presley.**

   The right answer for this question is relative pronoun **who** because the antecedents of the sentence is Elvis Presley and it belongs to person antecedent. It is as subject of relative clause. In answering this question, there were 6 students (S4, S6, S7, S9, S16 & S17) who used relative pronoun whom. Relative pronoun whom is used as object of relative clause. Then, there were 3 students (S3, S10 & S20) who used relative pronoun whose. Relative pronoun whose is used to explain non-personal (things) antecedent. And there were 3 student (S8, S13 & S18) who used relative pronoun whom. Relative pronoun is used to explain possessive adjective of relative clause. Besides, there was 1 student who used relative who and 1 student who used relative where, it was false because it belongs to relative adverb.

   **S4**
   
   : The rock singer **whom** appears in 1950 is Elvis Presley.

   **S3**
   
   : The rock singer **which** appears in 1950 is Elvis Presley.

   **S8**
   
   : The rock singer **whose** appears in 1950 is Elvis Presley.

   **Correction**
   
   : The rock singer **who** appears in 1950 is Elvis Presley.

   So, relative pronoun whom, which and whose cannot be used for number 5. In conclusion, there were 14 errors in using relative pronoun **who** made by students at XI MIA I.

6. **Elvis Presley, __________ rock songs is famous in the world, is called by the King of Rock and Roll.**

   The right answer for this question is relative pronoun **whose** because it showed the possessive adjective in relative clause. In answering this question, there were 8 students (S3, S4, S5, S6, S9, S10, S18 & S19) who used relative pronoun whom. Relative pronoun whom is used to explain object personal antecedent of relative clause. Then, there were 2 student (S2 & S14) who used relative pronoun which. Relative pronoun which is used to explain non-personal (things) antecedent of relative clause. And there were also 5 student (S8, S11, S12, S13 & S16) who used relative pronoun who. Relative pronoun who is used to explain subject personal antecedent of relative clause. Then, there was 1 student who used relative where.
S3: Elvis Presley, **whom** rock songs is famous in the world, is called by the King of Rock and Roll.

S2: Elvis Presley, **which** rock songs is famous in the world, is called by the King of Rock and Roll.

S8: Elvis Presley, **who** rock songs is famous in the world, is called by the King of Rock and Roll.

**Correction**: Elvis Presley, **whose** rock songs is famous in the world, is called by the King of Rock and Roll.

In conclusion, there were 16 errors in using relative pronoun **whose** made by students at XI MIA I.

7. *He is handsome rocker __________ the girls love in the world.*

The right answer for this question is relative pronoun **whom** because him belongs to object personal antecedent of relative clause. In answering this question, there were 2 students (S7 & S9) who used relative pronoun **which**. Relative pronoun which is used to explain non-personal (things) antecedent of relative clause. There were 4 student (S13, S17, S18 & S20) who used relative pronoun **who**. Relative pronoun who is used to explain subject personal antecedent of relative clause. Then, there was 1 student (S16) who used relative pronoun **whose**. Relative pronoun whose is used to explain possessive adjective of relative clause. Then, there was 1 student who used relative when and 1 student who used relative where.

S7: He is handsome rocker **which** the girls love in the world.

S13: He is handsome rocker **who** the girls love in the world.

S16: He is handsome rocker **whose** the girls love in the world.

**Correction**: He is handsome rocker **whom** the girls love in the world.

In conclusion, there were 9 errors in using relative pronoun **whom** made by students at XI MIA I.

8. *Then comes Bill Haley and The Comets, __________ come from United States are famous rock band.*

The right answer for this question is relative pronoun **who** because the antecedents of the sentence is Bill Haley and The comets and it belongs to personal antecedent. It is as subject of relative clause. In answering this question, there were 5 students (S1, S2, S7 S8 & S18) who used relative pronoun **which**. Relative pronoun which is used to explain non-personal (things) antecedent of relative clause. Then, there were 5 students (S3, S5, S11, S12 & S14) who used relative pronoun **whose**. Relative pronoun whose is used to explain possessive adjective of relative clause. And there were 5 student (S10, S13, S16, S17 & S20) who used relative pronoun **whom**. Relative pronoun whom is used to explain object personal antecedent of relative clause. Then, there were 2 students who used relative **where**.

S1: Then come Bill Haley and The Comets, **which** come from United States are famous rock band.

S3: Then comes Bill Haley and The Comets, **whose** come from United States are famous rock band.

S10: Then comes Bill Haley and The Comets, **whom** come from United States are famous rock band.

**Correction**: Then comes Bill Haley and The Comets, **who** come from United States are famous rock band.

In conclusion, there were 17 errors in using relative pronoun **who** made by students at XI MIA I.

9. *Nicky Astria, __________ we know is Indonesia rock musician successful sells album more than 250 tapes.*

The right answer for this question is relative pronoun **whom** because her belongs to object personal antecedent of relative clause. In answering this question, there were 7 students (S1, S4,
S7, S9, S14, S16 & S18) who used relative pronoun whose. Relative pronoun whose is used to explain possessive adjective of relative clause. There were 3 students (S11, S13 & S17) who used relative pronoun who. Relative pronoun who is used to explain subject personal antecedent of relative clause. Then, there were 2 students (S12 & S20) who used relative pronoun which. Relative pronoun which is used to explain non-personal (things) antecedent of relative clause. Then, there was 1 student who used relative when.

S1 : Nicky Astria, **whose** we know is Indonesia rock musician successful sells album more than 250 tapes.

S11 : Nicky Astria, **who** we know is Indonesia rock musician successful sells album more than 250 tapes.

S12 : Nicky Astria, **which** we know is Indonesia rock musician successful sells album more than 250 tapes.

**Correction** : Nicky Astria, **whom** we know is Indonesia rock musician successful sells album more than 250 tapes.

So, relative pronoun whose cannot be used for number 9.

In conclusion, there were 13 errors in using relative pronoun **whom** made by students at XI MIA I.

10. The lady rocker's album **whose** famous is Jarum Neraka.

The right answer for this question is relative pronoun whose because it shows the possessive adjective in relative clause. In answering this question, there were 7 students (S2, S6, S7, S8, S10, S12 & S17) who used relative pronoun whom. Relative pronoun whom is used to explain object personal antecedent of relative clause. There were 4 students (S5, S13, S14 & S18) who used relative pronoun which. Relative pronoun which is used to explain non-personal (things) antecedent of relative clause. Besides, there was 1 student who used relative when.

S2 : The lady rocker's album **whom** famous is Jarum Neraka.

S5 : The lady rocker's album **which** famous is Jarum Neraka.

**Correction** : The lady rocker's album **whose** famous is Jarum Neraka.

In conclusion, there were 14 errors in using relative pronoun **whose** made by students at XI MIA I.

**Table 2. Total of Frequency & Percentage Error Types in Using Relative Pronoun at Report Text made by XI MIA 1 & XI MIA 2**

| No | Relative Pronoun | Number of Item | Frequency of Error (MIA 1) | Frequency of Error (MIA 2) | Total Frequency of Error | Total Percentages |
|----|-----------------|---------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------|------------------|
| 1 | who             | 3             | 10                         | 4                           | 14                       | 31.1%            |
|    |                 | 5             | 7                          | 7                           | 14                       | 31.1%            |
|    |                 | 8             | 7                          | 10                          | 17                       | 37.8%            |
|    | total           | 3             | 24                         | 21                          | 45                       | 100%             |
| 2 | whom            | 4             | 5                          | 6                           | 11                       | 34.4%            |
|    |                 | 7             | 2                          | 6                           | 8                        | 25%              |
|    |                 | 9             | 4                          | 9                           | 13                       | 40.6%            |
|    | Total           | 3             | 11                         | 21                          | 32                       | 100%             |
### Causes of Students’ Error

The first caused of students’ error is interlingual transfer. Interlingual transfer is the influences of students’ mother tongue into the target language. It is one of error sources which often occurs in learning English as a foreign language. In this research, the students stated that Indonesian has influence on their errors in using relative pronoun. The result of interview question (item number 6) showed that there were 16 students (S3, S5, S6, S7, S8, S9, S10, S11, S12, S13, S14, S15, S17, S18, S19 & S20) or 80% who stated that interlingual transfer has influence on students’ error.

Researcher: Is there Indonesian influence of error in using relative pronoun? Mention the reason!

(Adakah pengaruh bahasa Indonesia dalam kesalahan menggunakan relative pronoun? Sebutkan alasannya!)

Students: Yes, actually I have difficulty in using whom and whose. And also, I feel confused to write whom and whose.

(Iya, sebenarnya saya memiliki kesulitan dalam mengucapkan whom dan whose. Dan juga, saya suka bingung untuk menulis whom dan whose).

From the explanation above, the writer concludes that there is an influence of interlingual transfer on students’ error in using relative pronoun.

The second causes of students’ error is intralingual transfer. Intralingual Transfer is students understanding in learning English. Intralingual transfer is one of error sources which cannot be avoided in learning English as a foreign language. The result of interview question (item number 1) showed that they were 20 students (S1, S2, S3, S4, S5, S6, S7, S8, S9, S10, S11, S12, S13, S14, S15, S17, S18, S19 & S20) or 100% who stated that relative pronoun material is difficult.

Researcher: What’s your opinion about material of Relative Pronoun?

Apa pendapatmu mengenai materi relative pronoun?)

Students: [It was] Difficult.

(Sulit)

From the result of interview’s question above, the students think that
The Analysis of Students’ Error in Using Relative Clause

relative pronoun material is difficult. It can be concluded that the students did not understand about relative pronoun material.

Then, from the result of interview question item number 2, there were 20 students (S1, S2, S3, S4, S5, S6, S7, S8, S9, S10, S11, S12, S13, S14, S15, S16, S17, S18, S19 & S20) or 100% who stated that the students did not understand about the use of relative pronoun, especially in the use of relative pronoun who, whom, and whose.

What are relative pronoun types that you think it is the most difficult all of them? Mention the reason!

Researcher: What type of relative pronoun that you this as the most difficult to be used? Give me the reason.

(Jenis relative pronoun manakah yang menurutmu paling sulit? Apa alasannya?)

Students: Relative pronoun who and whom. I am confused to differentiate the use of relative pronoun who and whom. Because it have function to explain person, but the position is different. Then, relative pronoun whose. I can’t distinguish possessive adjective. (Relative pronoun who dan whom. Saya bingung untuk membedakan penggunaan relative pronoun who dan whom. Karena itu kan memiliki fungsi untuk menjelaskan orang tapi posisinya berbeda. Dan relative pronoun whose. Saya tidak bisa menentukan kepemilikan itu seperti apa).

All of the students or 20 students (100%) stated that they didn’t understand about the use of some relative pronouns, especially in the use of relative pronoun who, whom, and whose. Relative pronoun who and whom is used to explain person antecedent of relative clause. But, relative pronoun who is used to explain subject person antecedent of relative clause. While, Relative pronoun whom is used to explain object person antecedent of relative clause. Besides, the students also cannot differentiate the use of relative pronoun whose. Relative pronoun whose is used to explain possessive adjective antecedent of relative clause, but they cannot actually distinguish possessive adjective itself.

From the explanation above, the writer concludes that there is an influence of intralingual transfer on students’ error in using relative pronoun.

CONCLUSION

The students made error in all the types of relative pronoun. First, relative pronoun whom with 45 errors or 33.6%. Then, relative pronoun whom with 32 errors or 23.9%. Next, relative pronoun which with 29 errors or 21.6%. The last, Relative pronoun whose with 28 errors or 20.9%. It happened because most of students did not understand about relative pronoun material and also the difficulties to pronounce and write relative pronoun itself. Besides, this research also found some causes of students’ errors in using relative pronoun. Those causes are interlanguage transfer and intralanguage transfer.

REFERENCES

Bao, X. (2015). Senior high school students’ error on the use of relative words. Canandian Centre of Science and Education, 8(3). Retrieved from http://www.ccsenet.org/journal/index.php/elt/article/download/45423/246. 137-154.

Broukal, M. (2004). Grammar form and function. New York: The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.

Brown, H. D. (2000). Principle of language teaching and learning (4th ed.). New York: Pearson Education.

Coles. (2003). English grammar simplified. Toronto: Coles Publishing Company.

Corder, S. P. (1982). Error analysis and interlanguage two. New York: Oxford University Press.
Kvale, S. (1996). *Interviews an introduction to qualitative research interviewing, method of analysis.* Thousand Oaks, Calf: SAGE Publication, Inc.

Leech, G & Svartvik, J. (2002). *A communicative grammar of English.* London: Pearson Education.

Radden, G & Dirven, R. (2007). *Cognitive English grammar.* Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Richard, J. C. (1973). A non-contrastive approach to error analysis. *Error Analysis Perspective on Second Language Acquisition, 25*(3), 172-188.