Integration of a palliative approach into heart failure care: a European Society of Cardiology Heart Failure Association position paper

Loreena Hill1,*†, Tal Prager Geller2†, Resham Baruah3‡, James M. Beattie4†, Josiane Boyne5†, Noemi de Stoutz6, Giuseppe Di Stolfo7†, Ekaterini Lambrinou8†, Anne K. Skibelund6, Izabella Uchmanowicz9,10†, Frans H. Rutten11†, Jelena Čelutkienė12, Massimo Francesco Piepoli13,14, Ewa A. Jankowska15,16, Ovidiu Chioncel17,18, Tuvia Ben Gal19, Petar M. Seferovic20, Frank Ruschitzka21, Andrew J.S. Coats22, Anna Strömberg23†, and Tiny Jaarsma23,24†

Introduction

Over the last 30 years, the 5-year survival rate for patients with heart failure (HF) has improved by approximately 30% across all healthcare settings, predominantly related to advances in treatment for HF patients with a reduced ejection fraction (HFrEF). At present, there are no particularly effective treatment modalities for those exhibiting HF with a preserved ejection fraction (HFpEF), care being directed towards management of their symptoms and comorbid/antecedent conditions. Better survivorship is manifest...
in more elderly patients living longer with chronic HF,² a condition with a fluctuating and unpredictable disease trajectory associated with a severe symptom burden and poor quality of life.

Clinical guidelines and consensus papers advise the concurrent provision of palliative and supportive care alongside life-prolonging therapies in HF management.³–⁵ Palliative care as defined by the World Health Organization, is an approach that improves the quality of life of patients and families through the prevention and relief of suffering,⁶ focusing on expert assessment and management of symptoms, evaluation and support of informal caregivers, and the interdisciplinary coordination of continuing care.

Since the first position statement on palliative care by the Heart Failure Association (HFA) of the European Society of Cardiology (ESC) in 2009,⁴ palliative care in HF has been addressed in numerous conferences and workshops, the subject area supported by a growing body of research.⁷ Nevertheless, according to the HFA atlas, only 10 out of 42 European countries have designated palliative care units for patients with advanced HF, with the European Association of Palliative Care describing 8 countries as providing fully integrated palliative and cardiology services.⁸,⁹ Whilst many professionals recognize the importance of palliative care as part of everyday HF management, not all patients receive this support. Potential barriers include the intrinsic uncertainty of the HF trajectory, a lack of organizational resources, staff training and available time, and healthcare professionals (HCPs) perceiving palliative care as being of low priority.¹⁰–¹² In addition, there may be psychosocial, ethical and legal issues, sometimes involving patient and informal caregiver expectations, or related to deprescribing, anticipatory prescribing, deactivation of implanted devices, and the enactment of advanced directives and resuscitation policies.¹³,¹⁴ Acknowledging the worldwide diversity in legislation, cultural norms, professional education, role perception and resource availability, this paper offers day-to-day guidance for HCPs managing patients with HF. Furthermore, informed by insightful contributions from ESC Patient Forum representatives, it prioritizes features relevant to patients as service users. The overall aim of this document is to synthesize the available evidence and provide clinical guidance on integrating palliative and HF care. We highlight gaps in knowledge, and signpost areas for future research.

How to identify the need for a palliative approach?

Tools for patient-reported symptoms (online supplementary Table S1) may assist in identifying the need for a palliative approach. In addition, persistent severe impairment of quality of life, escalating symptoms and mood disturbance, may be regarded as indicators for assessment by a palliative care specialist.²⁰,²¹ The ‘I need help’ acronym²² includes key features helpful in identifying those who may be worthy of palliative care, in accordance with American and ESC guideline criteria and consensus statements.²³,²⁴ Several prognostic risk calculators are available and have been critically reviewed,²⁵–²⁷ although prognostication on an individual basis remains challenging. Clinical markers useful as prognostic indicators include the presence of right ventricular systolic and diastolic dysfunction,²⁸ persistent elevation of natriuretic peptide and cardiac troponin levels,²⁹,³⁰ and elevated pulmonary capillary wedge and right atrial pressures.³¹,³² While prognostic information, easily accessible in everyday practice, includes advanced age, progressive worsening of renal function, intolerance of disease-modifying agents,³³,³⁴ the presence of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease or diabetes, persisting hypotension, a markedly reduced ejection fraction, symptomatic classification as New York Heart Association (NYHA) III–IV,³⁵ anaemia and/or iron deficiency,³⁶ and an anorexia–cachexia syndrome.³⁷

What are the roles of families and informal caregivers?

Families and informal caregivers are crucial partners in the HF care team, their support influencing patients’ self-care and mental well-being, as well as prognosis, their involvement often changing and intensifying during clinical crises and the terminal phase (Figure 1). At the time of diagnosis, informal caregivers and family members may have to deal with emotional distress and a disruption of ‘normal’ life as they help the patient cope with loss of independence, social isolation, increasingly burdensome symptoms, and an awareness that death might be imminent.³⁸ They may often feel ‘hopeless or powerless’, with hospitalization events and post-discharge transitions from hospital to home particularly stressful periods.³⁹ In advanced disease, caregivers are often called upon to navigate the healthcare system, contribute to decisions regarding complex treatment options and deal with complicated pharmacological treatment regimes and devices. The HF Caregiver Questionnaire (HF-CQ) is a validated instrument, which may be used to assess caregiver burden and prompt appropriate support.⁴⁰

© 2020 The Authors. European Journal of Heart Failure published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of European Society of Cardiology.
What is advance care planning?

Advance care planning (ACP) is synonymous with anticipatory care planning and advance directives. These may include a living will, which in some jurisdictions is a legally binding document. Irrespective of age, nearly half of all patients with HF have some degree of cognitive impairment, emphasizing the need for early ACP and palliative care discussions. In addition, as the prevalence of dementia correlates with increased age, there is a widespread recognition of the need for dementia-specific palliative care strategies.

For many patients, the issues addressed within ACP tend to be limited to treatment choices if capacity is lost when close to death, often focused on cardiopulmonary resuscitation policies, the use of mechanical ventilation or artificial hydration/nutrition, or when a decision is required on the deactivation of an implantable cardioverter-defibrillator (ICD). Consideration for therapy withdrawal needs to take into account the patient’s physiological status, overall quality of life, cultural and spiritual beliefs, current or previously declared treatment preferences, setting these elements within the local legal jurisdiction. Potential benefits of ACP include reduced readmission rates, increased involvement in palliative care services, and through shared decision making with the patient and family, an increased probability of fulfilling their preferences for the place of care and death.

This paper takes a neutral stance and does not offer guidance on assisted suicide or euthanasia. However, it should be noted that both assisted suicide and/or active euthanasia are legal in some European countries.

How to effectively manage distressing symptoms

Over recent years the mode of death for HF patients has changed, fewer succumbing to sudden death. However, more than half still die from a cardiovascular cause. Many of these patients have interlinking comorbidities, therefore their final few months of life may be characterized by distressing, debilitating and refractory symptoms, arising from both cardiac and non-cardiac conditions, including cancer (Table 1). Patients are also subject to the practical, psychological and social consequences of chronic illness and dependency.
**Table 1: Assessment and management of prevalent symptoms**

| Symptoms and burden | Comorbidities to consider | Clinical assessment (include tools) | Clinical management |
|---------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------|
| Breathlessness      | Anaemia                   | IPOS, Borg or Likert scales.      | Non-pharmacology: Sitting upright, hand-held fans, relaxation techniques, breathing exercises |
|                     | COPD                      | Quality of life scores.           | Pharmacology: Optimal HF medical therapy. Consider benzodiazepines for anxiety and opiates (morphine). Little benefit of supplementary oxygen in advanced HF alone. |
|                     | CTEPH                     | BD-I-TDI                          |                                             |
|                     | ILD                       | NRS                               |                                             |
| Fluid retention     | CKD                       | Physical exam including weight    | Non-pharmacology: Support stockings/leg elevation. Long-term in-dwelling drains, e.g. PleurX™ for chronic pleural effusions and ascites |
| Affects >50% of hospice patients with HF | Pulmonary hypertension | Quality of life scores. | Pharmacology: Diuretic therapy – intravenous or subcutaneous within home or hospice. Tolvaptan for severe congestion and hyponatraemia. |
|                     | Cardiorenal syndrome      | Implantable or non-invasive       | Calcium-sensing inductor; levosimendan could be considered intermittently in the ambulatory setting. |
|                     |                           | intrathoracic impedance           |                                             |
|                     |                           | measurement or pulmonary pressure measurement devices, e.g. |                                             |
|                     |                           | OPTIVOLT®/CardioMEMS              |                                             |
|                     |                           | Portable lung ultrasound (V scan) |                                             |
| Thirst              | CKD                       | VAS                               | Non-pharmacology: Free fluids, artificial saliva, sucking ice chips, peppermint or buttermilk candies, chewing gum |
| 20–46% of the HF population | Fluid restriction | NRS                               | Pharmacology: Optimal HF and hypoglycaemic medical therapy |
|                     | Diuretic                  | Thirst Distress Scale             |                                             |
|                     | Anxiety                   |                                   |                                             |
|                     | Diabetes                  |                                   |                                             |
| Xerostomia          | Cancer                    | Saxen test                        | Non-pharmacology: Frequent oral hygiene, candies and suck ice cubes |
|                     | DM                        | NRS                               | Pharmacology: Artificial saliva as gel, topical spray, rinse, dissolving tablets |
|                     | Oral infection            | VAS                               | Non-pharmacology: Acupuncture, physical therapy, mindfulness-based stress reduction, exercise and music |
| Pain                | Musculoskeletal           | VAS                               | Pharmacology: Neurophic pain can be treated with non-opioid medications (anticonvulsants, antidepressants) and opioids. Tramadol, oxycodone, hydromorphone, and fentanyl provided orally, intravenous and transdermal |
| 90% of patients with NYHA class IV symptoms | Cardiac | McGill Pain | Non-pharmacology: Exercise, smoking cessation |
|                     | DM                        | Questionnaire (SF-MPQ)            | Pharmacology: Medication replacement if needed, e.g. change of beta-blocker, use of PDE-5 inhibitors (sildenafil, tadalafil, vardenafil). Caution with combining with nitrates. |
|                     | Organ failure             | Brief Pain Inventory (BPI)        |                          |
|                     | Hyponatraemia             |                                   | Women—advise topical vaginal oestrogen preparation. |
| Sexual dysfunction | DM                        | SHIM                              | Non-pharmacology: Removal/replacement of offending medications. Try individual dietary changes, avoid triggering smells, alternative or complementary medicine |
|                     | Medications for anxiety   | IIEF                              | Pharmacology: Metoclopramide (caution as may prolong QT), promethazine, prochlorperazine, ondansetron, benzodiazepines (caution as sedative) |
| and depression      | and depression            | QEQ                               |                                             |
|                     | Hypertension              | Brief Sexual Function Index for Women |                                             |
| Nausea and vomiting | Cancer                    | ESAS^24                           | Non-pharmacology: Physical activity, dietary changes |
| Prevalent at all stages of HF | DM | VAS | Pharmacology: Laxative, stool softeners, methylcellulose (when opioids are used), osmotic agents |
|                     | Organ failure             |                                   | Non-pharmacology: Exercise, dietary modifications/supplementations |
|                     | Hyponatraemia             |                                   | Pharmacology: Adjust drug dosage (diuretics, beta-blockers), address comorbidities (iron supplementation)^23,24 |
| Constipation        | Cancer                    | Bowel Function Index              | Non-pharmacology: Open communication, cardiac rehabilitation, exercise and psychological therapies, e.g. CBT |
|                     | DM                        |                                   | Pharmacology: SSRIs safe and relatively well tolerated in HF but limited evidence of efficacy. |
|                     | Depression                |                                   |                                             |
|                     | Advanced age              |                                   |                                             |
|                     | Dementia                  |                                   |                                             |
| Fatigue             | Iron deficient            | 6-min walking test                |                                             |
|                     | Anaemia                   | ESAS                              |                                             |
|                     | Dysthyroidism             | Borg scale                        |                                             |
|                     | Renal failure             | Dutch Fatigue Scale (DUPS)        |                                             |
|                     | COPD                      | Dutch Exertion Fatigue Scale (DEFS) |                                             |
|                     | Malnutrition              | Fatigue Severity                  |                                             |
|                     | Cancer                    | Scale                             |                                             |
| Depression/anxiety  | More than 50% of patients | PHQ-9                             | Non-pharmacology: Open communication, cardiac rehabilitation, exercise and psychological therapies, e.g. CBT |
|                     | 40–70% in hospitalized HF patients with NYHA III–IV symptoms | HADS | Pharmacology: SSRIs safe and relatively well tolerated in HF but limited evidence of efficacy^85–92 |
|                     | Poor spiritual well-being | Quick Inventory of Depressive Symptomatology |                                             |
|                     |                          | 7-item                            |                                             |
|                     |                          | Questionnaire on Generalized Anxiety Disorder (GAD-7) |                                             |
|                     |                          | PHQ-2                             |                                             |

BDI-TDI: Baseline Dyspnoea Index-Transitional Dyspnoea Index; CBT, cognitive-behavioural therapy; CKD, chronic kidney disease; COPD, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease; CTEPH, chronic thromboembolic pulmonary hypertension; DM, diabetes mellitus; ESAS, Edmonton Symptom Assessment Scale; HADS, Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale; HF, heart failure; IIEF, International Index of Erectile Function; ILD, interstitial lung disease; IPOS, Integrated Palliative Care Outcome Scale; NRS, Numerical Rating Scale; NYHA, New York Heart Association; PDE, phosphodiesterase; PHQ, Patient Health Questionnaire; QEQ, Quality of Erection Questionnaire; SHIM, Sexual Health Inventory for Men; SSRIs, selective serotonin reuptake inhibitor; VAS, visual analogue scale.
of living with a chronic progressive disease, or the side effects of medications.\textsuperscript{5,3,85,93} Symptoms can cluster, and whilst they can be mitigated to some extent, toward the end of life, they can seem overwhelming. For patients hospitalized due to decompensated HF symptoms, inotropic therapy may be considered\textsuperscript{3} with levosimendan proposed as appropriate for patients on beta-blocker therapy.\textsuperscript{68} For the HF cohort, robust evidence for many symptom control interventions are lacking, but this should not deter from pursuing on a trial basis.

Early intervention is required to maintain optimal physical functioning and psychological well-being as many patients with HF have reduced exercise tolerance and fatigue, which can detrimentally impact prognosis and quality of life.\textsuperscript{94,95} To achieve optimum clinical benefit from exercise, patients’ hydration status, electrolytes and dietary intake including supplements should be actively managed. Exercise-based cardiac rehabilitation is recommended for patients with relatively stable chronic HF (NYHA I–III).\textsuperscript{96,97} During a clinical crisis phase (Figure 1), patients’ tolerance of physical activity becomes extremely limited. Furthermore, for patients in the terminal phase of life, it is advised that physical therapy be restricted to maintaining a sense of balance, with passive limb exercises to prevent contractions. Involvement of a physiotherapist may be beneficial. (online supplementary Table S2 outlines HF phases and corresponding exercise prescription\textsuperscript{96–98}).

Frailty, cachexia and sarcopenia

Frailty, cachexia and sarcopenia are associated with the advanced stages of HF. Frailty, exhibited in a poor physiological reserve and increased vulnerability, is considered to be prevalent in about 45% of HF patients. However, the proportion affected is uncertain as no assessment tool has been specifically validated for the HF population.\textsuperscript{99,100} Cachexia and/or sarcopenia may be evident in 5–15% of patients with either HFrEF or HfPEF.\textsuperscript{101} Recognition varies within clinical practice, the first indicator often being a >5% involuntary non-oedematous weight loss over a period of 3–12 months. If diagnosed early, frailty, cachexia and sarcopenia may be attenuated through exercise and dietary interventions provided alongside optimal guideline-directed HF therapy.\textsuperscript{99,102,103}

Communication with patients, families, and informal caregivers

As demonstrated in Figure 1, the turbulent nature of the HF trajectory requires HCPs to revisit earlier decisions on therapy with their patients, recalibrating goals of care to ensure treatment policies remain appropriate to the phase of the condition. If the disease progresses inexorably, previously expected outcomes may have become unrealistic and now represent false hopes.\textsuperscript{104} Sensitive conversations demand protected space and good communication skills to avoid increasing patients’ and family members’ anxiety, undermining care plans and adversely impacting patient outcomes.\textsuperscript{105} To ensure continuity and prevent misunderstanding, discussions and decisions should be fully documented, regularly reviewed, and routinely communicated to all involved in the patient’s care. Although there is no standard formula for good communication, the following steps may be helpful (Table 2).

Despite a relatively light literature base, useful insights into effective approaches to end of life communication have been collated and reviewed.\textsuperscript{106,107} Professionals appear to benefit from formal communication skills training, particularly focusing on breaking bad news. Question prompt lists (QPL) are tools that can generate useful discussion during consultations and are readily accessible and easily adopted into routine practice. An example of a QPL designed for HF patients has been pilot tested.\textsuperscript{108} Basic considerations when advising patients and informal caregivers are provided (online supplementary Table S3).

Managing treatment expectations

Many patients with advanced HF maintain a sense of optimism, valuing quality but hoping through the provision of evidence-based drug, device or surgical options, that their lives will also be prolonged.\textsuperscript{1,5,109} Beliefs and hope for a positive outcome vary across international borders and cultures,\textsuperscript{110} and can be attributed to past experiences, unrealistic expectations of treatment benefits, and the availability of advanced technology and local expertise.\textsuperscript{111} Some patients may demonstrate a ‘protective denial’ of their poor prognosis, indicating they are not psychologically attuned to acknowledge the progressive nature of their disease or discuss end of life care.\textsuperscript{112} The continued pursuit of disease-modifying therapy should be balanced and integrated with a palliative approach.\textsuperscript{113,114} Due to the ambiguous disease trajectory, professionals may feel justifiably uncertain about an individual’s prognosis, and uncomfortable initiating difficult conversations early in the course of the disease.\textsuperscript{115–117} However, deferment runs the risk of information exchange being ‘too little and too late’.\textsuperscript{118}

Bereavement care

Bereavement is a universal experience, defined as the ‘situation of having recently lost a significant person through death’. Bereaved individuals may experience a range of debilitating physical and psychological responses,\textsuperscript{119} and these should be addressed by an assigned member of the MDT. For some, having experienced the significant suffering of a relative or friend, death may be viewed as a release. For others, bereavement is deep and protracted, and is characterized as complicated grief,\textsuperscript{120} perhaps not unexpected in those exposed to the sudden cardiac death of a loved one. Involvement of specialist palliative care may significantly support affected individuals.

How to provide palliative care

All professionals within the HF MDT are equipped, to some extent, in identifying clinical decline, initiating appropriate discussions, alleviating burdensome symptoms, negotiating supportive resources within the healthcare system, and providing some elements of palliative care.\textsuperscript{66,121,122} While the current empirical evidence base for the delivery of palliative care by HF professionals is limited, this
## Table 2 Communication strategies

| Initiating discussion: This includes establishing a rapport and supportive relationship with the patient and family, as the healthcare professional explores their general thoughts about preferences and expectations for treatment and care.  
Example: 'While I cannot cure your heart failure there are still many things that I can do for you. I want you to be able to speak openly with me, so I can best help you. No matter what happens, I can be here for you—you are not alone'.
| Clarifying prognosis: Be direct, yet caring, be truthful, but sustain hope, use simple everyday language.
|  Example: 'Most people with heart failure at your stage of the disease, continue to live well, but I cannot predict exactly for how long you will live. I certainly hope that you will do better than average, but you may do worse'.
| Identifying goals: Facilitate open discussion about desired treatment and care and targets to be achieved however small.
|  Example: 'I want to make sure we are always doing the things that might help you, and that we never do anything that either do not help you, or you would not want. So, I need to know what things are most important to you, given your illness. What things do you still wish to do?'
| Developing a treatment plan: This includes providing guidance to promote understanding of treatment and care options, making recommendations regarding their appropriateness, clarifying resuscitation orders and possible deactivation of devices, initiating further support, when indicated, and discussing how to act in case of a medical emergency.
|  Example: 'We have talked about your illness and your poor prognosis. You have told me about how you want to spend your final months. I also need to know your thoughts about the use of cardiopulmonary resuscitation'.

## Table 3 Possible triggers for the involvement of specialist palliative care for those with heart failure

| Refractory or complex symptoms  
When there is spiritual or existential distress  
Recurrent HF admissions  
Increasingly frequent appropriate ICD shocks  
When considering ICD deactivation or non-replacement  
Before LVAD implantation or transplant referral  
When initiating palliative inotropic therapy  
Declining functional status due to progressive HF or a comorbidity  
If patients and/or informal carers/surrogates disagree on goals of care  
If there is a request for assisted suicide |

HF, heart failure; ICD, implantable cardioverter-defibrillator; LVAD, left ventricular assist device.

approach has also been proposed as a sustainable model, supported by evidence that upskilling of specialist HF nurses reduces referral rates to specialist palliative care services. However, patients close to the end of life, may require specialist palliative care involvement. Table 3 provides some possible prompts when this should be considered.

Current models have a ‘shared care’ or collaborative approach, concentrating on the relief of physical, psychological, social and/or existential burdens, and improving quality of life and spiritual well-being. These are centred on MDT involvement with input from allied professionals, depending on individual patients’ needs. The process of integrating palliative care into HF management will be determined by national healthcare structures and local service configuration. To date, no dominant paradigm of HF palliative care has emerged, but several service models have been developed showing positive outcomes in dealing with the needs of hospital inpatients with incident acute or decompensated chronic HF, those transitioning to care in the community post discharge and home-based services directed at community-dwelling people living with chronic HF. The responsibilities of the team members within such MDTs should be defined, and it may be helpful to nominate a HCP to act as interlocutor between the patient/informal caregiver and service provider. For patients treated in independent hospices, it is important to ensure the availability of HF medication, and unrestricted access to the means and expertise of deactivating devices such as ICDs.

### How to deal with devices

The possible withdrawal of cardiovascular implantable electronic devices, either as standalone ICDs or those combined with cardiac resynchronization therapy (CRT-D), should be sensitively broached within a valid informed consent process pre-implantation, with further and more detailed discussions at regular intervals. However, patients, family members and HCPs often avoid this uncomfortable discourse, with the discussion dependent on patient and professional factors, such as triggered by the experience of a shock. Many reports document that ICD activity is often maintained in patients imminently dying despite guidelines having been formulated to facilitate ethically appropriate ICD deactivation. It is important that local protocols are in place to ensure the timely availability of equipment and adequately trained staff to facilitate both emergency suspension of defibrillator function by means of a magnet, and definitive deactivation by reprogramming, across all patient care settings, inclusive of community-based palliative care and primary care services. For CRT-D patients, only the shock function should be suspended, as interruption of CRT may increase symptom burden, a risk also inherent in the rarely indicated withdrawal of a permanent pacemaker implanted for bradycardia. Even after death, device...
deactivation is still necessary to prevent a shock risk to pathology or mortuary staff, and both ICDs and pacemakers require to be explanted prior to cremation.\textsuperscript{138}

In recent years, mechanical circulatory support (MCS) has emerged, notably in the form of left ventricular assist devices (LVADs), implanted as a bridge to decision making or recovery, a bridge to transplantation, or as destination therapy (DT-LVAD).\textsuperscript{139} Some patients are offered ‘preparedness planning’ prior to implantation of MCS, with exploration of their short- and long-term preferences for care,\textsuperscript{140} synergizing the complementary skill sets of primary care, cardiology and specialist palliative professionals.\textsuperscript{141,142} For DT-LVAD patients, the most common modes of death are multi-organ failure, stroke, or progressive HF,\textsuperscript{143} the terminal phase often occurring in a hospital intensive care unit. In the face of major complications, planned discontinuation of LVAD therapy might be indicated, death usually occurring within an hour of withdrawal.\textsuperscript{144} Brush et al.\textsuperscript{145} have drawn up a flow-chart illustrating one approach to end of life care for patients with DT-LVADs, and a number of decision aids and informational tools may assist patients and families facing such dilemmas.\textsuperscript{146,147}

Palliative care support should also be offered to those individuals who are deemed to be device ineligible or choose to forgo primary device implantation or replacement. Similar support is also applicable to those turned down for transcatheter aortic valve implantation,\textsuperscript{148} or MitraClip\textsuperscript{149} (Abbott Cardiovascular Systems, Abbott Park, IL, USA) for severe functional mitral regurgitation, the benefits of which are currently uncertain in the general HF population.\textsuperscript{149–151}

### How to ensure a good death

Whilst much of the ‘good death’ template has been founded on the cancer model, transferability to HF care is worthwhile, particularly within an elderly care setting.\textsuperscript{152} General principles of what characterizes a ‘good death’ have been developed (online supplementary Table S4).\textsuperscript{153–155} First and foremost is the need to recognize that the patient has reached their final days of life.\textsuperscript{156,157} An important and difficult aspect to discuss is the care setting in which patients wish to receive terminal care and ultimately die.\textsuperscript{158} It is well recognized that hospice care is underused by patients with HF, mainly accommodating people with cancer.\textsuperscript{9,12,62} Achievement of the preferred place of death is accepted as a quality indicator of good end of life care, which can be facilitated through involvement of palliative care.\textsuperscript{159,160} Most people prefer to die in their comfort zone at home, where they have a sense of control, familiarity, and are in the presence of family. Yet for some older adults, such home deaths are more difficult to achieve, requiring adaptations to facilitate a ‘hospital at home’ arrangement. Care at home can often entail reduced input from specialist services, with increased reliance on primary care physicians and community-based nurses. In cases of poor pain control or the need for an enhanced level of care beyond the capabilities of informal caregivers and primary care team, patients might opt to die in an institution.\textsuperscript{159,160} However, many hospital deaths may be inappropriate and avoidable, often preceded by multiple admissions featuring aggressive treatment protocols, disrupting care continuity, impacting the quality of remaining life, and ultimately a good death.\textsuperscript{158}

People close to the end of life should still expect to receive good care, this presumption founded on trust, confidence and hope, all of which may be tempered by their past and current subjective experiences of interacting with HCPs or the local healthcare system.\textsuperscript{161} Moreover, the reality and process of ‘dying’ is intensely personal, requiring time for people to deal with any unfinished business with family or friends, and finally reach a stage of acceptance.\textsuperscript{162}

### Table 4 Medications used for anticipatory prescribing

| Situation                  | Prescribe                                      |
|----------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| Shortness of breath        | Opioids (morphine, oxycodone)                  |
| Pain                       | Paracetamol, opioids (morphine, oxycodone)     |
| Nausea/vomiting            | Metoclopramide, ondansetron                    |
| Congestion and oedema      | Furosemide, bumetanide, torasemide, metolazone |
| Anxiety                    | Benzodiazepines (lorazepam, clonazepam)        |
| Preparing for palliative sedation | Midazolam                                      |
| Sore wounds level 1–2     | Dressings and preparations                     |

All medications should include oral/intravenous/subcutaneous routes of administration where possible.

### Anticipatory prescribing and deprescribing

Maintaining patient and family autonomy, preparing them for unpredictable situations and providing the necessary means for self-care are essential elements for successful care at home. One approach to promote this lies in ‘anticipatory prescribing’, namely writing prescriptions for medications that might be needed as a matter of urgency in the near/intermediate future. Having such medications (Table 4) readily accessible at home with detailed instructions for their use, can empower patients and caregivers in self-management until professional supervision is available. If the patient is at home, responsibility for such prescriptions may be with primary care physicians, HF specialist nurses or community-based nurse managers, in accordance with local governance arrangements. For patients in a hospital or hospice setting, the cardiologist or palliative care physician may undertake this responsibility. It is important that decisions are synchronized through the MDT process, offering access to a breadth of clinical expertise. For example, the sensation of dyspnoea is often clustered with anxiety. Opiates can be used for breathlessness, and benzodiazepines may be considered as an anxiolytic. However, even the short-term use of benzodiazepines can cause somnolence and increase the risk of falls, particularly in the elderly.
Medication deprescribing is a proactive, patient-centred approach, founded on a seamless revision of good prescribing principles, taking into consideration the context of patients changing goals of care, values, preferences and perceived life expectancy. Most scientific literature on drug discontinuation stems from the field of cancer and geriatric palliative care. There are a variety of reasons to deprescribe in the setting of inexorable HF progression: where treatment burden outweighs benefit, the risk of adverse drug reactions increases with polypharmacy, declining pharmacologic and metabolic efficacy, and poor patient adherence. Professionals may be reticent or experience resistance to the withdrawal of established and sometimes long prescribed drug therapies. Some prescriptions worthy of possible withdrawal include medications no longer conferring symptomatic benefit such as statins or antiplatelet therapies. Optimizing diuretic therapy and down-titrating beta-blockers may be considered in the face of worsening congestion. Similarly, symptomatic hypotension may require down-titration of both beta-blockers and renin–angiotensin–aldosterone system inhibitors.

During the deprescription process, professionals need to motivate change by engaging with and supporting patients and families. A potentially useful electronic resource on medication deprescribing is available, and may provide confidence and reassurance.

Who takes cares of the healthcare professional?

Healthcare professionals regularly handling life and death situations are particularly exposed to both clinical and ethical dilemmas which undermine their resilience, putting them at risk of moral distress and burnout. Emotional exhaustion, depersonalization and detachment can lead to declining empathy, with a lack of compassion hampering clinician–patient relationships and the quality of care delivery. Whilst these issues are more common in intensive care unit staff, HCPs involved with HF patients are not immune to such responses. Debriefing, mindfulness, and reflective practice can support the spirit and stamina of HF professionals. Additional options include the availability of safe spaces within MDTs, Schwartz rounds, and team meetings dedicated to mutual support.

Conclusions

Future recommendations and developing the evidence base

A palliative care approach should be introduced early in the care for patients with HF, focused on optimizing symptom control, and responsive to dynamic changes in goals of care, during different phases of the disease trajectory. Concrete proposals and advice include:

1. **Consider palliative care throughout the HF trajectory.** We recommend that all patients with HF should be considered for palliative care, regardless of stage of their illness. Patients in the advanced stages and those considered for MCS or heart transplantation should receive a palliative care consultation before such interventions as a matter of protocol. ACP should be considered for all patients with advanced HF (as outlined in Figure 1).

2. **Addressing needs and preferences for treatment.** For patients with HF, their families or informal caregivers, their supportive needs and preferences for treatment should be systematically taken into account, especially in the terminal phase. Tools and programmes that support patients and families engaging in such discussion and decision-making, including their views on palliative and end of life care, should be developed and implemented.

3. **Optimal symptom control as the focus of care.** Better assessment of palliative care needs supported by evidence-based validated PROMs is advised. Healthcare providers need to appreciate the importance of palliative care, and this should be highlighted and incorporated more definitively in the specialist HFA training curricula for both cardiologists and nurses.

4. **Specialist palliative care and a palliative care approach by all professionals.** Both should be considered within HF management, the latter predominately addressing symptom alleviation, ensuring treatment modalities are aligned with preferences for care, offering psychosocial support, and fostering care coordination. With regard to integration of a specialist palliative care MDT model, this requires a degree of operational flexibility to accommodate local variation in healthcare structures, available resources, and the spectrum of professional competences. We recommend that HF palliative care be the subject of further primary research, alongside future surveys, registries, and quality assurance initiatives on a pan-European basis.

5. **Preferences for treatment and care of patients, their families and caregivers.** These need to be taken into account and addressed more systematically throughout all stages of HF, but especially in the terminal phase. Tools and programmes that assist patients and families undertaking difficult discussions, and supporting shared decision-making on treatment options should be developed and implemented.

Supplementary Information

Additional supporting information may be found online in the Supporting Information section at the end of the article.

Acknowledgement

This paper has been supported by the Patient Forum of the European Society of Cardiology.

Conflict of interest: L.H. personal fees from Novartis; R.B. personal fees from Novartis, Boehringer; J.M.B. personal fees from Vyfor; G.D.S. grants from Italian Health Ministry, Daiichi Sankyo, Boston Scientific, Lusofarmaco and personal fees from Novartis; F.H.R. grants from Boehringer Ingelheim, Daiichi Sankyo, Pfizer, Bayer; J.ˇC. personal fees from Servier, Novartis, AstraZeneca, Boehringer Ingelheim, Amgen; O.C. grants from Servier, Novartis,
References

1. Jones NR, Roalf AK, Adoki I, Hobbs FD, Taylor CJ. Survival of patients with chronic heart failure in the community: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Eur J Heart Fail 2019;21:1306–1325.

2. Cesa F, Fonseca C, Mota T, Morais H, Matias F, de Sousa A, Oliveira A; EPICA Investigators. Prevalence of chronic heart failure in Southwestern Europe: the EPICA study. Eur J Heart Fail 2002;4:531–539.

3. Ponikowski P, Voors AA, Anker SD, Bueno H, Cleland JG, Coats AJ, Falk V, Gonzalez-Juanatey JR, Harjola VP, Jankowska EJ, Jessup M, Linde C, Nihoyannopoulos P, Parissis JT, Pieles B, Riley JP, Rosano GM, Ruilope LM, Ruschitzka F, Rutten FH, van der Meer P; ESC Scientific Document Group. 2016 ESC guidelines for the diagnosis and treatment of acute and chronic heart failure: The Task Force for the diagnosis and treatment of acute and chronic heart failure of the European Society of Cardiology (ESC). Developed with the special contribution of the Heart Failure Association (HFA) of the ESC. Eur J Heart Fail 2016;18:891–975.

4. Jaarsma T, Beattie JM, Ryder M, Rutten FH, McDonagh T, Mohacsi P, Murray SA, Grodzicki T, Berlacher K, Arnold RM, Reitschuler-Cross E, Teuteberg J, Teuteberg W. The EPICA study. Eur J Heart Fail 2009;11:333–443.

5. Sobanski P, Alt-Epping B, Currow D, Goodlin S, Grodzicki T, Hogg K, Jansen D, Johnson MJ, Krajnik M, Leget C, Martínez-Sellés M, Moroni M, Mueller PS, Ryder M, Simon ST, Stowe E, Larkin PJ. Palliative care for people living with heart failure – European Association for Palliative Care Task Force expert position statement. Cardiovasc Res 2019;16:12–27.

6. World Health Organization. WHO Definition of Palliative Care. 2015. www.who.int/cancer/palliative/definition/en/ (1 September 2019).

7. Saholllibey N, Kai Seng Lee C, Shirin A, Joseph P. The impact of palliative care on clinical and patient-centred outcomes in patients with advanced heart failure: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials. Eur J Heart Fail 2020;22:2340–2346.

8. Seferović PM, Jankowska E, Coats AJ, Falk V, Gonzelez-Juanatey JR, Harjola VP, Jankowska EA, Jessup M, Linde C, Nihoyannopoulos P, Parissis JT, Pieles B, Riley JP, Rosano GM, Ruilope LM, Ruschitzka F, Rutten FH, van der Meer P; ESC Scientific Document Group. 2016 ESC guidelines for the diagnosis and treatment of acute and chronic heart failure of the European Society of Cardiology (ESC). Developed with the special contribution of the Heart Failure Association (HFA) of the ESC. Eur J Heart Fail 2016;18:891–975.

9. Arias-Casais N, Garralda E, Rhee J, De Lima L, Pons Izquierdo J, Clark D, Jones NR, Roalfe AK, Adoki I, Hobbs FD, Taylor CJ. Survival of patients with heart failure treatment: a substudy of a randomised trial. BMJ Support Palliat Care 2019;9:e9010.

10. Ferrero P, Lacovoni A, Dell’Era E, Vaduganathan M, Gavazzi A, Senni M. Prognostic scores in heart failure – critical appraisal and practical use. Int J Cardiol 2015;188:1–9.

11. Homi J, Walsh D, Rivera N, Rybicki LA, Nelson KA, Legrand SB, Davis M, Naughton M, Gvozdan D, Pham H. Symptom evaluation in palliative medicine: patient report vs systematic assessment. Support Care Cancer 2006;14:444–453.

12. Tian J, Xue J, Hu X, Han Q, Zhang Y. CHF-PROM: validation of a patient-reported outcome measure for patients with chronic heart failure. Health Qual Life Outcomes 2018;16:51.

13. Van Diepen S, Katz JN, Albert NM, Henry TD, Jacobs AK, Kapur NK, Klici A, Menon V, Ohman EH, Sweitzer NK, Thiele H, Washam JB, Cohen MG; American Heart Association Council on Clinical Cardiology; Council on Cardiovascular and Stroke Nursing; Council on Quality of Care and Outcomes Research; and Mission: Lifeline. Contemporary management of cardiogenic shock: a scientific statement from the American Heart Association. Circulation 2017;136:e232–e268.

14. Deek H, Noureddine S, Newton PJ, Inglis SC, Macdonald PS, Davidson PM. A family-focused intervention for heart failure self-care: conceptual underpinnings of a culturally appropriate intervention. J Adv Nurs 2015;72:434–450.

15. Kogawa-Singer M, Blackhall LJ. Negotiating cross-cultural issues at the end of life: “You got to go where he lives”. JAMA Intern Med 2001;286:2993–3001.

16. Steinberg SM. Cultural and religious aspects of palliative care. Int J Crit Illn Inj Sci 2011:115–156.

17. Brusca E, Kuehn N, Miller MJ, Selmser P, Macmillian K. The Edmonton Symptom Assessment System (ESAS): a simple method for the assessment of palliative care patients. J Palliat Care 1991;7:6–9.

18. Kane PM, Davesson BA, Ryan K, Ellis-Smith CI, Mahon NG, McAdam B, McQuillan R, Tracey C, Howley C, O’Gara C, Raleigh C, Higginson I, Koffman J, Murtagh FE. BuildCARE. Feasibility and acceptability of a patient-reported outcome intervention in chronic heart failure. BMJ Support Palliat Care 2017;7:470–479.

19. Schildmann EK, Groeneweld EJ, Denzel J, Brown A, Bernhardt F, Bailey K, Guo P, Ransenthalcher C, Lovell N, Higginson IJ, Bausewein C, Murtagh FE. Discovering the hidden benefits of cognitive interviewing in two languages: the first phase of a validation study of the Integrated Palliative care Outcome Scale. Palliat Med 2016;30:599–610.

20. Olozani A, Guo P, Goddard A, Dunleavy L, Kane P, Murtagh FE. What are the main symptoms and concerns reported by patients with advanced heart failure? – a secondary analysis of the Palliative care Outcome Scale (POS) and Integrated Palliative care Outcome Scale (IPOS). Ann Palliat Med 2019;8:775–780.

21. Portenoy RK, Thaler HT, Kornblith AB, Lepore J, Friedlander-Klar H, Kyasu E, Sobei K, Coyle N, Kemeny N, Norton L, Scher H. The Memorial Symptom Assessment Scale: an instrument for the evaluation of symptom prevalence, characteristics and distress. Eur J Cancer 1994;30A:1326–1336.

22. Lokker MJ, Martinussen M, Vrijens B, Van Zuylen L, van der Heide A. The prevalence and associated distress of physical and psychological symptoms in patients with advanced heart failure attending a South African medical center. J Cardiovasc Nurs 2016;31:313–322.

23. Campbell RT, Petrie MC, Jackson CE, Jhund PS, Wright A, Gardner RS, Soneck P, Pozzi A, McSkimming P, MacConachie A, Finlay F, Davidson P, Denorv MA, Johnson MJ, Hogg KJ, McMurray JJ. Which patients with heart failure should receive specialist palliative care? Eur J Heart Fail 2018;20:1338–1347.

24. Green CP, Porter GB, Bresnanan DR, Sputrus JA. Development and evaluation of the Kansas City Cardiomyopathy Questionnaire: a new health status measure for heart failure. J Am Coll Cardiol 2000;35:1245–1255.

25. Sputrus JA, Jones PG. Development and validation of a short version of the Kansas City Cardiomyopathy Questionnaire. Curr Cardiovasc Quod Outcomes 2015;8:449–476.

26. Anderson F, Downing GM, Hill J, Casorso L, Larch N. Palliative Performance Scale (PPS): a new tool. Palliat Med 2005;19(5):336.

27. Anderson F, Downing GM, Hill J, Casorso L, Larch N. Palliative Performance Scale (PPS): a new tool. Palliat Med 2005;19(5):336.

28. Anderson F, Downing GM, Hill J, Casorso L, Larch N. Palliative Performance Scale (PPS): a new tool. Palliat Med 2005;19(5):336.

29. Lokker MJ, Martinussen M, Vrijens B, Van Zuylen L, van der Heide A. The prevalence and associated distress of physical and psychological symptoms in patients with advanced heart failure attending a South African medical center. J Cardiovasc Nurs 2016;31:313–322.

30. Campbell RT, Petrie MC, Jackson CE, Jhund PS, Wright A, Gardner RS, Soneck P, Pozzi A, McSkimming P, MacConachie A, Finlay F, Davidson P, Denorv MA, Johnson MJ, Hogg KJ, McMurray JJ. Which patients with heart failure should receive specialist palliative care? Eur J Heart Fail 2018;20:1338–1347.

31. Green CP, Porter GB, Bresnanan DR, Sputrus JA. Development and evaluation of the Kansas City Cardiomyopathy Questionnaire: a new health status measure for heart failure. J Am Coll Cardiol 2000;35:1245–1255.

32. Sputrus JA, Jones PG. Development and validation of a short version of the Kansas City Cardiomyopathy Questionnaire. Curr Cardiovasc Quod Outcomes 2015;8:449–476.

33. Anderson F, Downing GM, Hill J, Casorso L, Larch N. Palliative Performance Scale (PPS): a new tool. Palliat Med 2005;19(5):336.

34. Anderson F, Downing GM, Hill J, Casorso L, Larch N. Palliative Performance Scale (PPS): a new tool. Palliat Med 2005;19(5):336.

35. Anderson F, Downing GM, Hill J, Casorso L, Larch N. Palliative Performance Scale (PPS): a new tool. Palliat Med 2005;19(5):336.
37. Zangerl G, Zwisler A, Kiklenberg Berg S, Kristensen MS, Gronseth CN, Uddén J, Pedersen SS, Oldridge NB, Thygesen LC. Psychometric properties of HeartQoL, a core heart disease-specific health-related quality of life questionnaire, in Danish implantable cardioverter defibrillator recipients. Eur J Prev Cardiol 2018;25:142–149.

38. Baunwohl J. “I need help”: a mnemonic to aid timely referral in advanced heart failure. J Heart Lung Transplant 2017;36:593–594.

39. Crespo-Leiro MG, Metra M, Lund LH, Milicic D, Costanzo MR, Filipatos G, Gustafsson F, Tsiu S, Bagge-Cabarallo E, De Jonge N, Frigero M, Manrion D, Tanis H, Hulsman M, Nallbargt S, Potena L, Baurersachs J, Gikouziouta A, Ruhrparwar A, Ristic AD, Straburzynska-Migaj E, McDonagh T, Seferovic P, Ruszkita F. Advanced heart failure: a position statement of the Heart Failure Association of the European Society of Cardiology. Eur J Heart Fail 2018;20:1505–1535.

40. Yancy CW, Jessup M, Bozkurt B, Butler J, Casey DE Jr, Drazner MH, Fonarow GC, Geraci SA, Horwich T, Januzzi JL, Johnson MR, Kasper EK, Levy WC, Massoudi FA, McBride PE, McMurray JJ, Mitchell JE, Peterson PN, Riegel B, Sam F, Stevenson LW, Tang WH, Tsiu EJ, Wilkoff BL. American College of Cardiology Foundation; American Heart Association Task Force on Practice Guidelines. 2013 ACCF/AHA guideline for the management of heart failure: a report of the American College of Cardiology Foundation/American Heart Association Task Force on Practice Guidelines. Circulation 2013;128:e240–e327.

41. Levy WC, Mozaffarian D, Linker DT, Sudarshen SC, Anker SD, Croot AB, Asland I, Maggioni A, Burton P, Sullivan MD, Pits B, Poole-Wilson PA, Mann DL, Linker DT. The Seattle Heart Failure Model: prediction of survival in heart failure. Circulation 2006;113:1424–1433.

42. Pocock SJ, Arioz CA, McMurray JJ, Maggioni A, Kaber L, Squire IB, Swedberg K, Dobson J, Poppe KK, Whalley GA, Doughty RN: Meta-Analysis Global Group in Chronic Heart Failure. Predicting survival in heart failure: a risk score based on 39 372 patients from 30 studies. Eur Heart J 2013;34:1404–1413.

43. Ghiu S, Gavazzi A, Campana C, Inserra C, Klier C, Sebastiani R, Arbustini E, Recusani F, Tavazzi L. Independent and additive prognostic value of right ventricular function and pulmonary artery pressure in patients with chronic heart failure. J Am Coll Cardiol 2001;37:183–188.

44. Meluzin J, Spinarova L, Hude P, Krejcí J, Dusek L, Vitovec J, Panovsky R. Combined right ventricular systolic and diastolic dysfunction represents a strong determinant of poor prognosis in patients with symptomatic heart failure. Int J Cardiol 2005;105:164–173.

45. Del Carlo CH, O’Connor CM. Cardiac troponins in congestive heart failure. Am J Heart 1999;118:646–653.

46. Sahil K, Stienen S, Moons AH, Balke AL, van Pol PE, Kortz RA, Firth P, Koopmans RT, Voller L. European Association for Palliative Care (EAPC). White paper defining palliative care in older people with dementia: a Delphi study and recommendations from the European Association for Palliative Care. Palliat Med 2018;32:1539–1551.

47. Demeter KM, Hancock AD, Reade MC, Silvester W. The impact of advance care planning on end of life care in elderly patients: randomised controlled trial. BMJ 2010;340:c1345.

48. Jones J, Nowell CT, Sudore R, Aihwaula S, Bekelman DB. The future as a series of transitions: qualitative study of heart failure patients and their informal caregivers. J Gen Intern Med 2015;30:176–182.

49. Rutten FH, Heddena W, Daggelders G, Hoes A. Primary care with heart failure in the last year of their life. Fam Pract 2012;29:36–42.

50. Sho A, Lund J, Pundr P, Petrie M, Ciaccioni B, Barlera S, Cleland J, Dargie HJ, Granger CB, Kjekshus J, Kaber L, Latinin R, Maggioni AP, Packer M, Piot B, Solomon SD, Swedberg K, Tavazzi L, Wikstrand J, Zannad F, Zile MR, McMurray JJ. Declining risk of sudden death in heart failure. N Engl J Med 2017;377:41–51.

51. Chioncel O, Lainscak M, Seferovic P, Anker S, Crespo-Leiro MG, Harjola V, Parissis J, Laroche C, Piepoli MF, Fonseca C, Mebazaa A, Lund L, Ambrosio GA, Coats AJ, Ferrari R, Ruszhitska F, Maggioni AP, Filipatos G. Epidemiology and outcome years in patients with chronic heart failure and preserved, mid-range and reduced ejection fraction: an analysis of the ESC Heart Failure Long-Term Registry. Eur J Heart Fail 2017;19:1574–1585.

52. Kavaleratos D, Gellman LP, Tycon LE, Riegel B, Bekelman DB, Ikeljani DZ, Goldstein N, Kimmel SE, Bakitas MA, Arnold RM. Integration of palliative care in heart failure: rationale, evidence, and future priorities. J Am Coll Cardiol 2017;60:1919–1930.

53. Johnson MJ, McDonagh TA, Harkness A, McKay SE, Dargie HJ, Morphine for the relief of breathlessness in patients with chronic HF – a pilot study. Eur J Heart Fail 2002;4:753–756.

54. Mebazaa A, Motiejunaite J, Gayet E, Crespo-Leiro MG, Lund LH, Maggioni AP, Chioncel O, Akyami E, Harjola VP, Seferovic P, Laroche C, Juels MS, Roig E, Ruszhitska F, Filipatos G; ESC Heart Failure Long-Term Registry Investigators. Long-term safety of intravenous cardiovascular agents in acute heart failure: results from the European Society of Cardiology Heart Failure Long-Term Registry. Eur J Heart Fail 2018;20:312–314.

55. Herlihy JP, Loyalka P, Grananandh J, Gregorich DC, Dahlberg CG, Kar B, Delgado RM 3rd. PleurX catheter for the management of refractory pleural effusions in congestive heart failure. Tex Heart Int J 2009;3:38–43.

56. Dodson JA, Truong TT, Towle VA, Kerins G, Chaudhry SI. Cognitive impairment in older adults with heart failure: prevalence, documentation, and impact on outcomes. Am J Med 2013;126:120–126.

57. Harvey RJ, Skelton-Robinson M, Rosson MN. The prevalence and causes of dementia in people under the age of 65 years. J Neural Neurosurg Psychiatry 2003;74:1206–1209.

58. van der Steen JT, Radbruch L, Hertogh CM, de Boer ME, Hughes JC, Larkin P, Francke AL, Junger S, Gove D, Firth P, Koopmans RT, Volker L. European Association for Palliative Care (EAPC). White paper defining palliative care in older people with dementia: a Delphi study and recommendations from the European Association for Palliative Care. Palliat Med 2018;2:197–209.

59. Dunlay SM, Sweta KM, Mueller FS, Roger VL. Advance directives in community patients with heart failure. Cong Cardiovasc Qual Outcomes 2012;5:283–289.

60. Kernick LA, Hogg KJ, Millen RE, Murtagh J, Dajiha A, Johnson M. Does advanced care planning in addition to usual care reduce hospitalisation for patients with advanced heart failure: a systematic review and narrative synthesis. Palliat Med 2018;32:1539–1551.

61. Demeter KM, Hancock AD, Reade MC, Silvester W. The impact of advance care planning on end of life care in elderly patients: randomised controlled trial. BMJ 2010;340:c1345.
EM, Selfel AD, Stewart WJ; American Heart Association Council on Clinical Cardiology; Council on Cardiovascular Nursing; Council on Cardiovascular Surgery and Anesthesia; Council on Quality of Care and Outcomes Research. Sexual activity and cardiovascular disease: a scientific statement from the American Heart Association. Circulation 2012;125:1058–1072.

80. Rosen RC, Riley A, Wagner G, Osterloh JH, Kirkpatrick J, Mishra A. The International Index of Erectile Function (IIEF): a multidimensional scale for assessment of erectile dysfunction. Urology 1997;49:822–830.

81. Schwarz Ek, Kapur V, Bionat S, Rastogi S, Gupta R, Rosano S. The prevalence and clinical relevance of sexual dysfunction in women and men with chronic heart failure. Int J Impot Res 2008;20:85–91.

82. Coffin B, Causse C. Constipation assessment scales in adults: a literature review including the new Bowel Function Index. Expert Rev Gastroenterol Hepatol 2011;5:601–613.

83. Zhou X, Xu W, Xu Y, Qian Z. Iron supplementation improves cardiovascular outcomes in patients with heart failure. Am J Med 2019;137:955–963.

84. Charles-Edwards G, Amaral N, Steigh A, Ayis S, Cattinog B, McDonagh T, Monaghan M, Amin-Tousi G, Kemp GJ, Shah AM, Okonko DO. Effect of iron isonoside on skeletal muscle energetics in patients with chronic heart failure and iron deficiency. Circulation 2019;139:2386–2398.

85. Leeming A, Murray SA, Kendall M. The impact of advanced heart failure on social, psychological and existential aspects and personhood. Eur J Cardiovasc Nurs 2014;13:162–167.

86. Vein KT, Videbæk L, Schou M, Gustafsson F, Hald-Steffensen F, Hildebrandt PR. Danish Heart Failure Clinics Network. High mortality among heart failure patients treated with antidepressants. Int J Cardiol 2011;146:64–67.

87. Alhurani A, Decker RL, Aboel MA, Khalil A, Al Zaghal MH, Lee KS, Mudd-Martín G, Biddle MJ, Lennie TA, Moser DK. Association of the comorbid symptoms of depression and anxiety with all-cause mortality and cardiac rehospitalization in patients with heart failure. Psychosomatics 2015;56:371–380.

88. Angermann CE, Ertl G. Depression, anxiety, and cognitive impairment: comorbid mental health disorders in heart failure. Curr Heart Fail Rep 2018;15:398–410.

89. Flint KM, Fairclough DL, Sperduto JA, Bekelman DB. Does heart failure-specific health status identify patients with bothersome symptoms, depression, anxiety, and/or poorer spiritual well-being? Eur J Heart Fail 2015;19:233–241.

90. Kroonen K, Spitzer RL, Williams JB. The PHQ-R: validity of a brief depression severity measure. J Gen Intern Med 2001;16:606–613.

91. Cobano CM, Villela AC, Alves AM, Gaggin HK, Huffman JC. Depression and anxiety in heart failure: a review. Harv Rev Psychiatry 2018;26:175–184.

92. O’Connor CM, Jiang W, Kuchibhatla M, Silva SG, Cuffe MS, Callwood DD, Zakhray B, Stough WG, Arias RM, Rivelli SK, Krishnan R. SADHART-CHF Investigators. Safety and efficacy of sertraline for depression in patients with heart failure: results of the SADHART-CHF (Sertraline Against Depression and Heart Disease in Chronic Heart Failure) trial. Am J Cardiol 2010;106:692–699.

93. Breining, Heart Failure, Palliative Care: Partnership, RMPG, Guidance for the management of symptoms in adults with heart failure at the end of life. 2019. www.bhf.org.uk/for-professionals/healthcare-professionals/a-z-end-of-life-care/conditions/resources/heart-failure/heart-failure-end-of-life-care-guidance (13 March 2020).

94. Hirai DM, Musch T, Poole DC. Exercise training in chronic heart failure: improving skeletal muscle O2 transport and utilization. Am J Physiol Heart Circ Physiol 2015;309:H147–H159.

95. Upadhyay B, Haykowsky MJ, Eggebeen J, Kitzman DW. Exercise intolerance in patients with preserved ejection fraction: more than a heart problem. J Geriatr Cardiol 2015;12:294–304.

96. Piepoli MF, Conraads V, Corra U, Dickstein K, Francis DP, Jaarsma T, McMurray JJ, Pesleb B, Piozwicz E, Schmid JP, Anker SD, Solal AC, Filippatos GS, Anker SD, von Haehling S, Anker SD, Laino SC, Jaarsma T, Ponikowski P, Poplack-D. Exercise training in patients with ventricular assist devices: a review of the evidence and practical advice. A position paper from the Committee on Exercise Physiology and Training and the Committee of Advanced Heart Failure of the Heart Failure Association of the European Society of Cardiology. Eur J Heart Fail 2019;21:13–13.

97. Visale C, Jankowska E, Hill L, Piepoli M, Doehner W, Anker SD, Laino SC, Jaarsma T, Ponikowski P, Rosano GM, Seferovic P, Coats AJ. HFA-ESC position paper on frailty in patients with heart failure. Eur J Heart Fail 2019;21:1299–1305.

98. Denfeld QE, Winnows-Ko, Mudd JO, Geleet JM, Kurih S, Lee CS. The prevalence of frailty in heart failure: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Int J Cardiol 2017;234:283–289.

99. Bekfani T, Pellicioni P, Morris DA, Ebner N, Valentiona M, Steinbeck L, Wachter R, Elsner S, Sliuzik V, Scheifel JC, Sanokel D, Doehner W, Cledan JG, Laino SC, Anker SD, von Haehling S, Sarcond in patients with heart failure preserved ejection fraction: impact on muscle strength, exercise capacity and quality of life. Int J Cardiol 2016;222:41–46.

100. Vennikost G, Gaborvec B. Management of frailty at individual level—clinical management: systematic literature review. Zdr Vorst 2018;57:106–115.

101. Saitoh M, Isida J, Doehner W, von Haehling S, Anker SD, Coats AJ, Speric S, Jaarsma T, Cziko A. The prevalence of frailty in heart failure and muscle performance in heart failure: review update 2016. Int J Cardiol 2017;235:11–8.

102. Meyers DE, Goodlin SJ. End-of-life decisions and palliative care in advanced heart failure. Circ Ultrasound 2016;32:1148–1156.

103. Toongeberg A, Jaarsma T. Thoughts of patients about death and perceived health status in elderly patients with heart failure. Eur J Heart Fail 2008;10:608–613.

104. Balaban RB. A physician’s guide to talking about end-of-life care. J Gen Intern Med 2000;15:195–200.

105. Hjelmsro L, Strömberg A, Friedrichsen M, Sandgren A, Martensson J, Jaarsma T. End-of-life communication interventions: who do they target, how are they structured and do they work? Palliat Med 2016;29:3–16.

106. Balaban RB. A physician’s guide to talking about end-of-life care. J Gen Intern Med 2000;15:195–200.
120. Shear MK. Complicated grief. N Engl J Med 2015;372:153–160.

121. Gelfman LP, Kavalieratos D, Teuteberg WG, Lala A, Goldstein NE. Primary palliative care for heart failure: what is it? How do we implement it? Heart Fail Rev 2017;22:611–620.

122. Datta S, Verberckt CA, Hoye A, Janssen DJA, Johnson MJ. Multi-disciplinary palliative care in people with symptomatic heart failure: a systematic review and narrative synthesis. Palliat Med 2019:1–14.

123. Johnson MJ, MacCallum A, Butler J, Rogers A, Sam E, Fuller A, Beattie JM. Heart failure specialist nurses’ use of palliative care services: a comparison of surveys across England in 2005 and 2010. Eur J Cardiovasc Nurs 2012;11:190–196.

124. Ross WE, Krakauer EL, Farmer PE, Karanja V, Davis S, Crisp N, Rajagopal MR. The global nursing workforce: realising universal palliative care. Lancet 2020;397:327–338.

125. Diop MS, Rudolph JL, Zimmerman KL, Richter MA, Skarf LM. Palliative care interventions for patients with heart failure: a systematic review and meta-analysis. J Palliat Med 2017;20:84–92.

126. Gelfman LP, Bakitas M, Stevenson LW, Kirkpatrick JN, Goldstein NE. IMPACT-HF2 Working Group. The state of the science on integrating palliative care in heart failure. J Palliat Med 2017;20:392–403.

127. Sidebottom AC, Jorgenson A, Richards H, Kirven J, Sillah A. Inpatient palliative care for patients with acute heart failure: outcomes from a randomized trial. Palliat Med 2015;28:134–142.

128. Hopp FP, Zalesnij RJ, Waselewsky D, Burn J, Camp J, Welch RD, Levy P. Results of a hospital-based palliative care intervention for patients with an acute exacerbation of chronic heart failure. J Card Fail 2016;22:1033–1036.

129. Cornwell V, Ng AY, Lam PT, Ng JS, Ng NH. Sham MM. Effects of a transitional palliative care model on patients with end-stage heart failure: a randomised controlled trial. Heart. 2016;102:1100–1108.

130. Gandesbery B, Dobbie K, Gorodeski EZ. Outpatient palliative cardiology service embedded within a heart failure clinic: experiences with an emerging model of care. Am J Hosp Palliat Care 2018;35:635–639.

131. Fromme EK, Stewart TL, Jeppesen M, Tolle SV. Adverse experiences with implantable defibrillators in Oregon. Hosp Med. 2011;28:304–309.

132. Lum HD, Horney C, Koets D, Kutner JS, Maslott DD. Availability of heart failure medications in hospice care. Am J Hosp Palliat Care 2016;33:924–928.

133. Clark AM, Jaarsma T, Strachan P, Davidson PM, Jerke M, Beattie JM, Duncan AS, Novak MM, Skordilis DM, Van den Block L. Physiological variables in the last two weeks of life: an observational study. Eur J Cardiovasc Nurs 2011;10:694–705.

134. Kirkpatrick JN, Haygupta PJ, Goodlin SJ. Bundling informed consent and advance care planning in chronic cardiovascular disease: we need to talk. JAMA Intern Med 2015;175:5–6.

135. Beattie JM, Kirkpatrick JN, Patton KK, Eiser AR. Hardwired for life? Development – a tale of two trials. N Engl J Med 2018;379:2390–2396.

136. Goch M, Small N, Barnes S, Payne S, Searkman D. Older people's views of a good death in heart failure: implications for palliative care provision. Soc Sci Med 2008;67:1113–1121.

137. Jaarsma T, Stromberg A. Palliative care. In: Maisel A, Filipatos G (eds) Algorithms in heart failure. New Delhi: Jaypee Brothers Medical Publishers; 2016.

138. Smith R. A good death. BMJ 2000;320:129–130.

139. Henwood M. Debate of the Age Health and Care Study Group. The Future of Health and Care of Older People: The Best Is Yet to Come. London: Age Concern England; 1999.

140. Mitchell SL, Tena JM, Kiely DK, Shaffer ML, Jones RN, Prigerson HG, Volicer L, Givens JL, Hamel MB. The clinical course of advanced dementia. N Engl J Med 2009;361:1529–1538.

141. Taylor P, Crouch S, Howell DA, Dowding DW, Johnson MJ. Change in physiological variables in the last two weeks of life: an observational study of hospitalized adults with heart failure. J Pain Symptom Manage 2018;55:1335–1340.

142. Pivodic L, Pardon K, Morin L, Addington-Hall J, Michiess C, Cardenas-Turanzas M, Onwuteaka-Philipsen B, Naylor W, Ruiz Ramos M, Van den Block L, Wilson DM, Loucka M, Cikovic A, Rhee YJ, Tjoen J, Deliens L, Houtekier D, Cohen J. EURO IMPACT. Place of death in population dying from diseases indicative of palliative care need: a cross-national population-level study in 14 countries. J Epidemiol Community Health 2016;70:17–24.

143. Houtekier D, Cohen J, Van den Block L, Bossuyt N, Deliens L. Involvement of palliative care services strongly predicts place of death in Belgium. J Palliat Med 2013;16:1461–1468.

144. De Rood ML, Michiess C, Onwuteaka-Philipsen BD, Van Den Noortgate N, Van den Block L, Bonacchi A, Donker GA,Lozano Alonso JE, Moreels S, Deliens L, Francke AL; EURO IMPACT. Actual and preferred place of death of home-dwelling patients in four European countries: making sense of quality indicators. PLoS One 2014;9:e93762.

145. Waterworth S, Jorgensen D. It’s not just about heart failure – voices of older people in transition to dependence and death. Health Soc Care Community 2010;18:199–207.

146. Bregman L, Kubler-Ross and the re-visioning of death as loss: religious appro- priation and responses. J Pastoral Care Counsel 2019;73:4–8.

147. Scott IA, Hilmer SN, Reeve E, Potter K, Le Couteur D, Rigby D, Gnjidic D, Del Mar CB, Roughhead EE, Page A, Jansen J, Martin JH. Reducing inappropriate polypharmacy: the process of deprescribing. JAMA Intern Med 2015;175:827–834.

© 2020 The Authors. European Journal of Heart Failure published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of European Society of Cardiology.
164. Garfinkel D, Zur-Gil S, Ben-Israel J. The war against polypharmacy: a new cost-effective geriatric-palliative approach for improving drug therapy in disabled elderly people. *Isr Med Assoc J* 2007;9:430–434.
165. Bruyere Research Institute. Deprescribing App; 2020. http://deprescribing.org (6 February 2020).
166. Parola V, Coelho A, Cardoso D, Sandgren A, Apóstolo J. Prevalence of burnout in health professionals working in palliative care: a systematic review. *JBI Database System Rev Implement Rep* 2017;15:1905–1933.
167. Mills J, Wand T, Fraser JA. Palliative care professionals’ care and compassion for self and others: a narrative review. *Int J Palliat Nurs* 2017;23:219–229.
168. Gillman L, Adams J, Kovac R, Kilcullen A, House A, Doyle C. Strategies to promote coping and resilience in oncology and palliative care nurses caring for adult patients with malignancy: a comprehensive systematic review. *JBI Database System Rev Implement Rep* 2015;13:131–204.
169. Gibbs G. *Learning by Doing: A Guide to Teaching and Learning Methods*. Oxford: Further Education Unit at Oxford Polytechnic; 1988.