Assessing Effectiveness of Research for Load Shedding in Power System

Raghu C. N.1, A. Manjunatha2
1Research Scholar, Jain University, Bangalore, India
2Principal, Sri Krishna institute of technology, Bangalore, India

ABSTRACT

The research on load shedding issues dates back to 1972 and till date many studies were introduced by the research community to address the issues. A closer review of existing techniques shows that still the effectiveness of load shedding schemes are not yet benchmarked and majority of the existing system just considers the techniques to be quite symptomatic to either frequency or voltage. With an evolution of smart grids, majority of the controlling features of power system and networks are governed by a computational model. However, till date not enough evidences of potential computational model has been seen that claims to have better balance between the load shedding schemes and quality of power system performance. Hence, we review some significant literatures and highlights the research gap with the existing techniques of load balancing that is meant for assisting the researcher to conclude after the selection process of existing system as a reference for future direction of study.

Copyright © 2017 Institute of Advanced Engineering and Science.
All rights reserved.

Corresponding Author:
Raghu C. N.,
Research Scholar,
Jain University,
Bangalore, India.
Email: raghuresearch13@gmail.com

1. INTRODUCTION

With the consistent rise of technological advancement in production field, there is a growing need of adequate power supply. It is required to increase the capacity of an electricity generation to be at par with the required number of active loads. To some extent, the existing smart grid system is capable of identifying such issues [1],[2]. However, the scene of trade-off between the power requirement and power availability is not same in all the countries. The impeding factors that controls the availability of the power supply are i) geographical location, ii) availability of conventional / non-conventional sources of power supply, iii) economic status of the country, and iv) level of urbanization [3]. In India, there are 28% of the renewable power plants and 72% of non-renewable power plants [4]. Majority of the sources of power supply are from coal, hydroelectricity, renewable energy source, natural gas, and oil [5]. As such sources are quite dependent on the natural geological factor as well as economic factor, the number of capacity plants and distributive generation points are quite limited. The fixed number of power generation plants can never cope up with increasing population and their discrete demands of power supply. The circumstances when the power demands cannot be fulfilled by the service provider can eventually lead to power system collapse, which is one of the irreversible processes of restoration [6]. A restoration process can be only effective and channelize if there is any form of mechanism to understand the pattern of load shedding process in predictive way. Hence, a better process of load shedding prediction can add some value added method in the direction of restoration process. When a grid carries a massive amount of power, it leads the transmission channels to fully utilize to highest level. At the same time, the availability of restricted generation reserves and
inadequacy of reactive power to cater up the load demands are quite evident. This phenomenon also leads to significant level of power outage as well as disturbances over the power system. Hence, one way to resist the power system breakdown is to perform load-shedding. According to theory and concept of distributed generation system, the role of system voltage as well as frequency is quite high in load shedding. It is essential to ensure stabilized voltage over the buses. The active power affects the frequency while reactive power affects the voltage [7]. Whenever there is a difference between the load demands and generated power, frequency is significantly affected. Such form of disturbances leads to degradation of the capacity of generation. Hence, load shedding is the best option to restore such frequency.

Similarly, when the demands of the reactive power cannot be met by the power system than it leads to unstabilized voltage. During such condition, capacitor banks are normally deployed to provide availability of reactive power. On the other hand, when such capacitor banks are not sufficient enough to restore the levels of voltage within their maximum and minimum limits, it switches to stage of load shedding. Hence, whenever there is any form of disturbances, it leads to degradation of the core grid system as well as negatively affects the quality of power system. Hence, load shedding is the only way to restore the power system. However, load shedding can also be performed by many techniques and each technique has their own advantages as well as pitfalls.

Therefore, the prime aim of this manuscript is to investigate the techniques of load shedding from research contribution viewpoint and explore the research gap in this area. Section 1.1 discusses about the background of the study followed by Section 1.2 discusses about the problem identification and Section 1.3 briefly discusses about the proposed system. Section 2 discusses essential of load-balancing schemes followed by Section 3 discussing about issues in load shedding. Section 4 discusses about the existing research studies carried out to address the problem associated with load shedding followed by brief discussion of research gap in Section 5. Section 6 summarizes the findings of this paper.

1.1. Background

This section gives the background of the study by generalizing the research contribution and existing techniques towards load-shedding. The most recent work done by Lu et al. [8] have fairly discussed about the review of the research efforts with respect to under-frequency load shedding schemes discussing 65 research papers published during 1971-2014.

From Figure 1, a closer look into review of work carried out Lu et al. [8] has covered samples of research paper with more paper discussion focused on year 2009 followed by the years 2005, 2012, and 2013. However, all these work discussion is only restricted to the under-frequency load shedding schemes. Similarly, a review of techniques pertaining to voltage factor was also published by Glavic [9] in 2011, where the review gives more theoretical insights on taxonomies of voltage instability detection techniques with an aid of 53 references ranging between the publication years of 1993-2011.

Review work on under-voltage schemes was also published by Verayiah [10] and Mozina [11]. Review of load shedding techniques has also been seen in the work carried out Lakra and Kirar [12] where a good and simple description of load shedding schemes can be found. Hence, we carry out further updation of the recent works with respect to different forms of techniques that has not been discussed or reviewed in the existing system. Therefore, the background study can be found to be more involved in identifying the techniques of load shedding with respect to voltage or frequency, and not much on other techniques. The next section highlights about the problem that has been identified in the existing system.
1.2. The Problem

The problems identified in the existing system are as follow:

- Although, there are majority of the existing techniques on the basis on under frequency and under voltage concept, but still it has not be discussed which is the best technique in this. As, in terms of reality, under-voltage load shedding schemes are always the last option and therefore priority has to be given to under-frequency based load shedding schemes. There are less evidence to highlight this trade-off.
- As per the discussion laid by Lakra [12], there are three types of load shedding schemes i.e. conventional, adaptive, and computational intelligent schemes. It was highlighted that there is not much involvement of large simulation studies in adaptive and computational intelligent-based schemes as compared to conventional scheme. However, reliability of outcomes are only proven if any techniques were evaluated on a larger scale with respect to benchmarking and evidence of computational complexity. The biggest problem here is very few of the existing techniques in research has proved the reliability of outcomes in this regards.
- Majority of the techniques that are designed based on under-frequency schemes of load shedding suffers from following problem: i) there is an inclusion of delay while evaluating gradient of frequency during the event of disturbance, and ii) there is no inclusion of load voltage in the schemes.
- The most frequently used under-frequency schemes is multiple pitfalls. Normally, such strategies have different performance with respect to small-scale domestic and large scale commercial usage. The significant issues with under-frequency based schemes are it causes unwanted breakdowns at significant cost of power system owing to its regular disconnections of load. This problem is solved using inertia-based schemes. But such schemes too non-adaptibility of inertia changes of the system.
- Another frequently used technique uses breaker interlocking system, which is one of the simple techniques of load shedding. It allows the circuit breaker to get associated with the breakers leading to tripping of load circuits. However, such schemes also suffers from significant problems e.g. i) alternation to existing power system using breakers is expensive affair, ii) doesn’t support dynamic system response as the breaker interlocking is pre-defined, iii) it doesn’t support multiple stages of load shedding schemes for curtaining the supply to the entire system, and iv) due to non-supportability of dynamic states, the system cannot prioritize the load to be shed.
- Existing system also deploys logic controllers to formulate load shedding but they are quite slower in generating response. They are also restricted to monitor only a part of power system in the network.

1.3. Proposed System

The prior Section 1.2 has discussed about the unsolved problems in existing techniques of load shedding. In the proposed system, we perform a theoretical study of the existing techniques which are
quite updated from the prior review papers by including more insights on different techniques and approaches used in load shedding schemes. First, we discuss the importance of load shedding scheme citing a current statistics of power consumption in our country India followed by issues associated with it. Then we review the existing technique of enhancing the load shedding scheme which are published more recently. We classify the discussion with respect to i) techniques using under-frequency load shedding schemes, ii) techniques using under-voltage load shedding scheme, iii) joint techniques of voltage and frequency, iv) optimization techniques to enhance the power system operation during load shedding, and v) miscellaneous techniques. Our discussion is a continuation of the work being carried out by Lu et al. [8], which is one of the recent review publication in the similar direction but the author have confined only on under-frequency techniques. We add more research paper on top of its findings with analysis of each paper with respect to problems being addressed, techniques applied, advantages of the adopted technique, and limitations.

2. ESSENTIAL OF LOADSHEDDING

According to the recent stats of World Bank, 2016, India consumes about 684.11 kWh power supply, which is highest in comparison to neighboring countries e.g. Pakistan (449.25 kWh) and Bangladesh (258.62 kWh) (Figure 2). This is a simple statistics to show the increasing power demands by the consumer markets. However increasing power demands compared to power supply causes failures of the power distribution system and only way to restore the state of supply is to perform load shedding [13]. This state of inequilibrium causes disturbances over the power system that leads to infrequent switching of the loads along with loss of generators. In such cases, the frequency factor is negatively affected due to the imbalance between the demand of power load and generated power supply. This problem occurs only when there are disturbances in the power system. Hence, in order to resists such form of disturbances, the power system must be restored to its natural state. This will mean that there is a need to restore the load in highly organized manner without negatively affecting the power system. One way to do this is to adopt the mechanism of load shedding.

Hence, load shedding can be defined as the process of temporary shutdown of the electrical power supply in order to meet the balance between dynamic power supply demand and prevention of power distribution system crash down [14]. The process of load shedding targets to eliminate the load from the system of power supply for the situation of inequilibrium between power demands and power availability. During load shedding, the system or the service providers switches off certain region of power supply in highly controller manner in order to restore the system stability. However, load shedding is highly technical term and should be confused with power conservation scheme. The prime difference is load shedding is done in order to prevent the power distribution system to collapse in situation of unavailability to meet the massive power demands, which is not in the case of power conservation techniques. The power conservation techniques adopts various equipment and devices that can significant conserve unwanted dissipation of power supply. Usage of non-conventional resources, automatic switching off the electrical devices in idle states, etc are some means to conserve power. Although conservation of power also leads to minimization of load on power distribution system, but it is never linked with similar cause of its usage aim. There are two specific states of load balancing as follows [15]:
2.1. Brownout-State
This state calls for minimizing the power demands on specific regions by periodic disconnection of feeders for relatively shorter interval.

2.2. Blackout-State
This state calls for reducing the power demands by completely cutting down the power supply for the entire region. Some common means and frequently used techniques of load shedding in majority of the countries are as follows:-
- **Minimizing Voltage Feeds**: The regulators are used to control the single feeds of voltage at power substations. This reduces the voltage supply but not current supply and can sustain for some time to resist blackouts. It is applicable only on low voltage networks.
- **Manually Disconnecting the Smaller Networks**: Sometime the service providers dissects the complete network into smaller network on the basis of priority of power supply usage. The lower prioritized smaller network (house, shops, etc) are then manually shut to restore the balance.
- **Scheduled-Based Power Cuts**: In many metropolitan and urban areas the providers declares the schedules of power cuts, which is called as scheduled power cuts. Normally, scheduled power cuts are meant to inform the users about the necessary backup during outage. However, there are many regions, where such declaration is not required as it doesn’t affect much. In such area, providers performs unscheduled power cuts.
  Although, such process creates inconvenience, but it has a long term benefits in restoring the balance between less availability of power and increasing demands of power.

3. ISSUES IN LOADSHEDDING
Although the process of load shedding is carried out for long-term benefits, but it is associated with some of the serious problems in the essential operation of power system. Following are the problems that surfaces owing to the process of load shedding in the power system.

3.1. Involuntary Switching Mechanism
In order to resists the negative affect of load shedding, majority of the users started adopting alternative solutions, which includes auto switching of electrical devices. There are various industries which connects service provider through circuits using high-speed reclosing mechanism. Normally, the service provider trips both the end of line during fault and the start the high speed closure. The problem is such non-synchronization of the reclosing mechanism with other components. It is very important to disconnect the power load before performing this re-closure mechanism in order to avoid irreversible damage to expensive machineries. This problem also leads to unsynchronized voltage supply, slowing the pace of machineries and equipment creating hidden damage on them.

3.2. Load on Motor
If the motor load on any one of the substation is very high, it poses a bigger issue for application that demands time coordination. Such motor tends to maintain similar voltage during the occurrence of tripping. However, in this situation, there is a degradation of frequencies causing the slowing down of the motor invoking damage to it. Usage of under-frequency relay of high speed may cause long lasting of slower degradation of voltage. This situation finally results in trip or undesirably lock out of breakers. The existing solution for this problem is to extend the operation of under-frequency relay to approximately 20 cycles. Another solution is to utilize the under-voltage cutoff in order to rectify the problems of load-shedding.

4. STUDIES ON EXISTING TECHNIQUES
This section discusses about the existing technique that has been introduced in last 5 years pertaining to load shedding techniques.

4.1. Techniques based on under voltage / Frequency Schemes
Usage of under-voltage load shedding is one of the frequently adopted techniques for addressing the issues of voltage instability. Arief [16] have presented a study that performs trajectory sensitivity analysis for improving the voltage stability factor. The study outcome shows an efficient sensitivity analysis. Similar direction of under-voltage scheme was also seen in the work done by Deng and Liu [17]. The technique derives the dynamic voltage using local estimations using centralized scheme by mathematical modelling.
Similarly, there are also studies that have focused on under-frequency load shedding scheme in power system. Mokari et al. [18] have introduced an adaptive technique along with load prioritization scheme. The scheme allows multiple ranges of load to be shed on the basis of types of an event. Joint study of voltage and frequency are also observed in couple of literatures. Study on under-frequency load shedding was also carried out by Bambaravanage et al. [19]. The technique also considers islanding mechanism for formulating dual condition of emergency load shedding scheme based on the power model practiced in Sri Lanka. The presented study implements grid disintegration scheme to evaluate the frequency response as well as voltage profile as an outcome. Studies towards addressing islanding mechanism was carried out by Ramavathu et al. [20]. The authors have also discussed a mechanism that assists in involuntary curtailing loads from the power system. Study towards under-frequency was also seen in the work carried out by Shahgholian and Salary [21], Gjukaj et al. [22] have presented a scheme that enhances the performance of the power system pertaining to load shedding scheme. It addresses the problem of under-frequency load shedding. Manson et al. [23] have presented a study for mitigating under frequency problems in load shedding by bridging a communication between centralized under-frequency components and protective relays. The authors have also used compensation of inertial and load tracking mechanism in modelling the power system. The technique has also considered multiple case studies of load-shedding schemes to access the outcome of their study. Zhang et al. [25] have formulated a study by considering stability factor for both voltage and frequency. The technique assists in identifying the location of load shedding along with equivalent information about the amount of load to be shed. The modelling is performed by evaluating swing in rotor movement, rate of change in frequency, amplitude of disturbance, location identification, etc. Joint study of voltage and frequency was also studied by Yang and Zhang [25]. The technique evaluated coupling effects to investigate the positive influence of characteristics of load and reactive power over coupling effects of frequency and voltage. Douglass et al. [26] have addressed the similar issues by developing a unique hybrid controller system. With an aid of simulation study, the technique uses a distributed network framework to investigate the controller performance. Amini and Alikhani et al. [27] have presented a technique that performs load balancing on islanded systems using frequency factor. The technique provides a lookup table based on two new parameters i.e. i) willing to pay parameter and ii) change in frequency rate parameter. The study outcome was evaluated with respect to simulation time, variance, and decline in frequency etc. Combinatorial method of under voltage and under frequency was also witnessed in the work carried out by Wang et al. [28]. The author have studied load balancing based on these two factors in order to investigate participation process of smart appliance tested in IEEE-39 bus system. Similar line of joint study of under voltage and under frequency was studied by Ye et al. [29].

4.2. Technique based on Optimization Schemes

Mageshvaran and Jayabarath [30] have presented an optimization technique in order to reduce the occurrences of load shedding. The authors have presented a bio-inspired algorithm addressing the issue of steady-state load shedding over various ranges of IEEE bus system. The study outcome was evaluated with respect to the real / reactive power and system losses over generated power. Study towards optimization technique was also emphasized by Kanimozhi et al. [31] have used evolutionary algorithm for minimizing the cumulative load shedding and increasing the voltage stability index. Experimented over wide range of variables (viz. contingency, heavy loading condition, base loading, etc.), the study outcome shows reduction of 30.70 MW loads. Meier et al. [32] have introduced a technique for addressing the joint problem of load shedding and islanding mechanism. The author have implemented a computational model for performing optimization of network during contingency. With an aid of Monte-Carlo simulation, the study outcome shows stabilized performance of power system during contingency. Study of under voltage optimization scheme of load shedding was carried out by Pandey and Titare [33] where the authors have introduced a computational model using differential evolution. Basically, the technique is based on stochastic principle to investigate the network stability factor. The contribution of this work is consideration of i) amount of load to be shed, ii) instance of load shedding, and iii) position of load shedding. The complete modelling of optimization is carried out using stability inequality and operating characteristics as constraints. Another unique study towards optimization problem was seen in the work being carried out by Khamis et al. [34]. The authors have considered quantity of load to be shed and linear voltage stability margin to formulate multi-objective optimization problem. The implemented technique also assists in prioritizing the load on multiple operating situation of power generation system. The work was especially focused on islanded system in order to resist the collapse of voltage. The optimization is performed using search-based technique and the study outcome was also compared with conventional optimization technique (e.g. genetic algorithm). Adoption of genetic algorithm as optimization technique was also witnessed in the work of Chawla and Kumar [35]. The study uses the technique to stabilize the voltage on severe contingency. The system also computes the margin load along with its sensitivity factor in order to check if it has met the stabilized condition. Applying genetic
algorithm, it attempts to minimize the unstabilized conditions in terms of fitness function. Usage of logical reasoning over the condition with less availability of inputs are also seen the existing studies. The study performed by Kaewmanee et al. [36] have adopted fuzzy logic for the purpose of optimization. The technique presented is basically a form of load shedding scheduling approach for the adverse situation of under frequency. The technique provides a table that can sort the relevant feeder using membership function in fuzzy logic. The study outcome was evaluated with respect to 11 cases of position of shedding and amount of load that was shed. Adoption of Fuzzy logic was also seen in the work done by Mokhlis et al. [37]. Similar adoption was also seen in the work of Mahapatro [38]. Kirar et al. [39] have carried out optimization technique over the load shedding scheme using Artificial Neural Network. The study outcome was compared with relay-based technique with respect to frequency factor, mechanical power, and electrical power. Similar direction of under-voltage optimization scheme was seen in the work done by Deng and Liu [17]. The technique derives the dynamic voltage using local estimations using centralized scheme by mathematical modelling. Particle Swarm Optimization was also seen in the work of Hagh and Galvani [40]. The author have adopted linear programming approach in order to reduce the extent of load balancing. The study outcome was analyzed with respect to 1-14 buses and its respective generated active power, reactive power, calculation time along with percentage of load shedding.

4.3. Miscellaneous Techniques

A completely different scale of work is carried out by Connell who have presented a technique that provides better tabulation of contingency. The technique uses Markov chain and uses sampling and counting operation. This technique could be quite fruitful in analysis of the load shedding behaviour. The study conducted by Wu et al. [41] uses multi-agents in order to retain better level of frequencies during islanding mechanism. The study have used distributed load shedding policy for identifying the global data with an aid of neighboring communication. The study uses mean consensus for this purpose. Adoption of multi-agents can be also seen in the work of Kohansal et al. [42]. A unique technique was introduced by Majidi et al. [43] called as intelligent scheme of load shedding. The study uses multiple condition viz. i) activation of distance relays, ii) monitoring the impedance factor, iii) conditioning of trip commands on specific interval. The technique basically identifies the critical lines and evaluate their dynamic behaviour. Sensitivity analysis is carried out for checking the outcomes along with discovering the cascading failures over the power systems. Zhao et al. [44] have presented a technique where the standard of IEC61850 is deployed for mapping the events generated at substations. Kim and Dobson [45] have presented a scheme where a standard DC load is used to represent a power system. The study outcome was assessed using probability over various load sheds over multiple levels. The paper was developed by Ajay-D-Vimal Raj [46] a new technique is presented to establish the best location and the best amount of load to be shed in categorize to stop the organization voltage from obtainable to the unstable. H. Bevrani et al. [47] a summary of the key problems and novel disputes on best LS production concerning the incorporation of storm turbine components into the power classifications.

Therefore, it can be seen that there are multiple forms of techniques that has been introduced in order to address the problem of load shedding. All the techniques that has been presented till date are majorly focused on either under voltage or under frequency constraints. There are also combined schemes based on voltage and frequency. Similarly, there are also good number of techniques that have adopted optimization principle of Artificial Neural Network, genetic algorithm, particle swarm optimization etc. Table 1 summarizes the significant work being carried out till date in order to evaluate the effectiveness and limitation of the existing studies towards load shedding.
Table 1. Summary of Existing Techniques

| Author               | Problem                               | Technique                                  | Advantage                                                                 | Limitation                                                                 |
|----------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Mageshvaran [30]     | Optimization in load shedding          | Bio-inspired algorithm, IEEE 14-30-57-118 bus | Better convergence behaviour                                              | -Not applicable to dynamic load-shedding                                   |
|                      |                                       |                                            |                                                                           | -Computationally complex process due to inclusion of iterations             |
| Arief [16]           | Under Voltage Load Shedding            | Trajectory Sensitivity, 14 IEEE bus         | Ensure better voltage stability                                           | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
|                      |                                       |                                            |                                                                           | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
| Kanimozhi et al. [30], Chawla and Kumar [35], Meier et al. [32] | Multi-objective optimization of voltage load shedding, islanding | Genetic Algorithm, IEEE 30-69 bus system                                      | Conservation of 30.70 MW of load                                             | -Algorithm complexity not computed                                         |
|                      |                                       | Policy switching, IEEE-39 bus               | Capable fo solving complex constraint during grid congestion              |                                                                           |
| Mokari et al. [18], Shahgholian and Salari [21] | Under-frequency Load shedding          | Adaptive approach, load prioritization, IEEE-14 bus system                  | Faster response time                                                       | -Not applicable to dynamic load-shedding                                    |
|                      |                                       |                                            |                                                                           |                                                                           |
| Zhang et al. [24]    | Under-frequency Load shedding          | Voltage & frequency sensitivity, IEEE-39 bus | Enhances voltage stability margin, minimize occurrence of breakdown       | -Comparative analysis not carried out                                       |
|                      |                                       |                                            |                                                                           |                                                                           |
| Wu et al. [41], Kohansal et al. [42]. Yang and Zhang [25] | Islanding, load shedding | Consensus theory, multi-agents             | Highly adaptable                                                          | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
|                      | Investigation of Coupling effect of Frequency & Voltage | Empirical approach, EPRI 36-bus system | Establishes relationship between load shedding and coupling effects | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
| Pandey and Titare [33] | Optimization of voltage stability | Differential evolution, Stochastic, IEEE-14 bus | Resist voltage collapse during breakdown | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
|                      |                                       |                                            |                                                                           | -Comparatively complex process due to inclusion of iterations               |
| Khamis et al. [34]   | Multi-objective optimization, load shedding, islanding | Backtracking search algorithm             | Better voltage stability compared to Genetic Algorithm                    | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
|                      | Scheduling load shedding               |                                            | Ensure high power efficiency                                              | -Accuracy depends upon rule set formulation                                |
|                      |                                       |                                            |                                                                           |                                                                           |
| Kaewmanee et al. [36], Mokhls et al. [37]. Mahapatro [38] | Autonomous Load shedding control | Fuzzy logic, IEEE-14 bus | Highly adaptable                                                          | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
|                      | Under-frequency load shedding          | Hybrid Load Controller                     | 12% minimization in load                                                  | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
|                      | Load shedding for industrial system    | Combining multiple load balancing scheme   | Stabilize power system                                                   | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
| Bambaravanage et al. [19], Kirar et al. [39] | Under-frequency load shedding | Artificial Neural Network | Better performance than relay-based method                               | -Less effective benchmarking                                               |
|                      |                                       |                                            |                                                                           |                                                                      |
| Majidi et al. [43]   | Identification of critical lines in load shedding | Intelligent Agents, IEEE 39-bus             | 78% reduction of cascading failures, 50% reduction in load shedding, & 59% reduction in islanding | -No applicable for dynamic load-shedding.                                  |
|                      |                                       |                                            | Cost-efficient scheme                                                     | -Computationally complex process due to iterative operations of relays    |
| Manson et al. [23]   | Under-frequency load shedding          | compensation of inertial and load tracking  | Simple simulation approach                                                | -No benchmarking                                                          |
|                      | Islanding, load shedding               | Change of frequency rate                    | Enhance voltage stability                                                 | -Less evidence to justify outcomes                                           |
|                      | Under-voltage load shedding            | Particle swarm optimization, IEEE-39 bus    |                                                                           | -No benchmarking                                                          |
| Deng and Liu [17]    | Under-frequency protection              | Adaptive design approach using frequency rate | Stabilized power system                                                  | -Computational complexity not studied, scalability analysis not performed|
|                      |                                       |                                            |                                                                           | -Should be evaluated with more contingency condition to prove its robustness |
| Gjukaj et al. [22]   | Load shedding                          | Particle Swarm optimization                 | Effective benchmarked work                                                |                                                                           |
|                      |                                       |                                            |                                                                           |                                                                           |
| Hagh and Galvani [40] | Load shedding                          | Standard blackout model, IEEE 300 bus        | Reduced load                                                             | -No benchmarking                                                          |

5. RESEARCH GAP

This section presents an explicit point of the research gap, which has been explored after reviewing the contribution of the existing system.
5.1. Few Benchmarked Studies on Load Balancing

The first IEEE journal for loadshedding was published in the year 1954 and till date there are presence of 531 journals and 1458 conference in IEEE. However, 98% of the research papers published till date are not found to have concrete benchmarking mechanism. Although, there are few studies with good performance comparative analysis, but majority of the research papers are found to discuss the individual outcomes and not the outcomes compared with some best model to show effectiveness. Because of this, it becomes challenging even to understand the best work till date with more reliability for future research continuation.

5.2. Less focus on Joint Operation of Frequency & Voltage

There are good numbers of research work towards under-frequency as well as for under-voltage schemes; however, the design is inclined more independently and less on joint operations. Although, there are many studies found using voltage and frequency parameters, but there was never a good balance found between voltage & frequency. Majority of the techniques uses pre-set rules for which applicability narrows down towards static scenario of load shedding and never on dynamic scenario. Hence, such mechanism of under-voltage and under-frequency scheme fails to provide enough flexibility in case of multiple situations of instabilities.

5.3. Unpractical Assumptions

A closer look into the existing technique of load shedding distribution assumes starting point to be individual load bus in IEEE bus system in terms of allocation. The biggest problem in this assumption is that in such cases it will select all the load buses and they will be enganged with sharing task of cumulative imbalance of power in absence of any specific selection process. Such assumption is actually not possible for sophisticated power system where there is huge number of load buses.

6. CONCLUSION

This paper gave some brief insight of the significance of the existing techniques of carrying out load shedding operation. It can quite understood from the adoption of techniques in existing literatures that with an inclusion of smart grid system and sophisticated distributive network of power supply, there is a significant impact on the power delivery over the transmission lines. Such phenomenon leads the grid to be quite dependent on the transmission network in order to supply resulting in magnified loss of reactive power during the tripping of transmission lines. Our review says that there are significant amount of work being carried out considering under-voltage and under-frequency based schemes of load shedding, but quite a less towards joint operation. There are also techniques of optimization of power system using particle swarm optimization, genetic algorithm, and neural network. However, even such optimization techniques are found to devoid of inclusion of both voltage and frequency factor at a same time. Optimization techniques using bio-inspired algorithm are often associated with inclusion of iterative computational steps. However, there was no discussion found in existing system how the existing optimization techniques overcomes such computational complexity. Hence, our future work will be in the direction of evolving up with a novel scheme of load balancing which is supported by computational modelling approach considering both voltage and frequency factor. We will also investigate better feasibility of novel optimization techniques which leads to provide a good balance between the load shedding schemes and quality of power system restoration process.

REFERENCES

[1] F. P. Stohansi, “Smart Grid: Integrating Renewable, Distributed & Efficient Energy,” Academic Press, 2012.
[2] S. Borlace, “Smart Grids: Infrastructure, Technology, and Solutions,” CRC Press, 2012.
[3] M. Pacione, “Urban Geography: A Global Perspective,” Routledge, 2009.
[4] L. Chandran, “The Potential of Renewable Energy Sources in the Energy Sector in India,” An Online Article of Electrical India, 2016.
[5] C. Dunn, “Today in Energy,” An Online Article from U.S. Energy Information Administration, 2016.
[6] W. Li, “Probabilistic Transmission System Planning,” John Wiley & Sons, 2011.
[7] S. Isser, “Electricity Restructuring in the United States,” Cambridge University Press, 2015.
[8] M. Lu, et al., “Under-Frequency Load Shedding (UFLS) Schemes – A Survey,” International Journal of Applied Engineering Research, vol/issue: 11(1), pp. 456-472, 2016.
[9] M. Glavic and T. V. Cutsem, “A short Survey of Methods for Voltage Instability Detection,” IEEE Power and Energy Society General Meeting, pp. 1-8, 2011.
[10] R. Verayiah, et al., “Review of Under-voltage Load Shedding Schemes in Power System Operation,” Przegląd Elektrotechniczny, 2014.
C. Mozina, “Undervoltage Load Shedding,” IEEE Power Systems Conference: Advanced Metering, Protection, Control, Communication, and Distributed Resources, pp. 39-54, 2007.

P. Lakra and M. Kirar, “Load Shedding techniques for System with Cogeneration: A Review,” Electrical and Electronics Engineering: An International Journal, vol/issue: 4(3), 2015.

Z. H. Li, et al., “Research on undervoltage problems and coordination strategies of prevention and Control in isolated receiving power grids,” Advances in Power and Energy Engineering, Taylor and Francis, 2016.

J. G. Liu, et al., “Fault Location and Service Restoration for Electrical Distribution Systems,” John Wiley & Sons, 2016.

M. Denny, “Lights On!: The Science of Power Generation,” JHU Press, 2013.

A. Arief, “Under Voltage Load Shedding Using Trajectory Sensitivity Analysis Considering Dynamic Loads,” Universal Journal of Electrical and Electronic Engineering, vol/issue: 2(3), pp. 118-123, 2014.

J. Deng and J. Liu, “A Study on a Centralized Under-Voltage Load Shedding Scheme Considering the Load Characteristics,” Elsevier-ScienceDirect, International Conference on Applied Physics and Industrial Engineering, Physics Procedia, vol. 24, pp. 481-489, 2012.

A. Mokari, et al., “An Improved Under-Frequency Load Shedding Scheme in Distribution Networks with Distributed Generation,” Journal of Operation and Automation in Power Engineering, vol/issue: 2(1), pp. 22-31, 2014.

T. Bambaravanage, et al., “A New Scheme of Under Frequency Load Shedding and Islanding Operation,” Annual Transactions of IESL, 2013.

S. N. Ramavathu, et al., “Islanding Scheme and Auto Load Shedding to Protect Power System,” International Journal of Computer Science and Electronic Engineering, vol. 4, 2013.

G. Shahgholian and M. E. Salay, “Effect of Load Shedding Strategy on Interconnected Power Systems Stability When a Blackout Occurs,” International Journal of Computer and Electrical Engineering, vol/issue: 4(2), 2012.

A. Gjukaj, et al., “Re-Design of Load Shedding Schemes of the Kosovo Power System,” World Academy of Science, International Scholarly and Scientific Research & Innovation, Engineering and Technology, vol. 5, 2011.

S. Manson, et al., “Case Study: An Adaptive Underfrequency Load-Shedding System,” IEEE Industry Applications Society 60th Annual Petroleum and Chemical Industry Conference, pp. 1-9, 2013.

Z. Zhang, et al., “Study on Emergency Load Shedding Based on Frequency and Voltage Stability,” International Journal of Control and Automation, vol/issue: 7(2), pp. 119-130, 2014.

H. Yang and B. Zhang, “The Coupling of Voltage and Frequency Response in Splitting Island and Its Effects on Load-shedding Relays, Energy and Power Engineering,” vol. 5, pp. 661-666, 2013.

P. J. Douglass, et al., “Design and Evaluation of Autonomous Hybrid Frequency-Voltage Sensitive Load Controller,” IEEE PES ISGT, 2013.

H. Amini and H. R. R. Alighani, “Using The Rate Of Change Of Frequency And Threshold Frequencies In Load Shedding In A DGFeD Islanded System,” International Journal of Engineering, 2013.

J. Wang, et al., “Intelligent Under Frequency and Under Voltage Load Shedding Method Based on the Active Participation of Smart Appliances,” in IEEE Transactions on Smart Grid, vol/issue: PP(99), pp. 1-1, 2015.

L. Ye, et al., “An adaptive load shedding method based on the underfrequency and undervoltage combined relay,” Control Conference (CCC), 34th Chinese, Hangzhou, pp. 9020-9024, 2015.

R. Maghshevan and T. Jayabarathi, “GSO based optimization of steady state load shedding in power systems to mitigate blackout during generation contingencies,” Ain Shams Engineering Journal, vol. 6, pp. 145-160, 2015.

R. Kanimozhi, et al., “Multi-objective approach for load shedding based on voltage stability index consideration,” Elsevier- Alexandria Engineering Journal, vol. 53, pp. 817–825, 2014.

R. Meier, et al., “A Policy Switching Approach to Consolidating Load Shedding and Islanding Protection Schemes,” arXiv, 2014.

B. Pandey and L. S. Titare, “Optimal Undervoltage Load Shedding in a Restructured Environment,” International Journal of Interdisciplinary Research and Innovations, vol/issue: 2(1), pp. 54-62, 2014.

A. Khamis, et al., “A load shedding scheme for DG integrated islanded power system utilizing backtracking search algorithm,” Ain Shams Engineering Journal, 2015.

P. Chawla and V. Kumar, “Optimal Load Shedding for Voltage Stability Enhancement by Genetic Algorithm,” International Journal of Applied Engineering Research, vol/issue: 7(11), 2012.

J. Kaewnmanee, et al., “Optimal Load Shedding in Power System using Fuzzy Decision Algorithm,” AORC-CIGRE technical Meeting, 2013.

H. Mokhils, et al., “A Fuzzy Based Under-Frequency Load Shedding Scheme for Islanded Distribution Network Connected with DG,” International Review of Electrical Engineering, 2012.

S. K. Mahapatro, “Load Shedding Strategy using Fuzzy Logic,” International Journal of Science and Research, 2012.

M. K. Kirar, et al., “Load Shedding Design for an Industrial Cogeneration System,” Electrical and Electronics Engineering: An International Journal, vol/issue: 2(2), 2013.

M. T. Hagh and S. Galvani, “Minimization of load shedding by sequential use of linear programming and particle swarm optimization,” Turkish Journal of Electrical Engineering & Computer Science, vol/issue: 19(4), 2011.

X. Wu, et al., “Multiagent-Based Distributed Load Shedding for Islanded Microgrids,” Energies, vol. 7, pp. 6050-6062, 2014.

M. Kohansal, et al., “A novel approach to frequency control in an islanded microgrid by load shedding scheduling,” IEEE Second Iranian Conference on Renewable Energy and Distributed Generation, Tehran, pp. 127-13, 2012.
Assessing Effectiveness of Research for Load Shedding in Power System (Raghu C. N.)

[43] M. Majidi, et al., “New design of intelligent load shedding algorithm based on critical line overloads to reduce network cascading failure risks,” *Turkish Journal of Electrical Engineering & Computer Sciences*, pp. 1-16, 2013.

[44] T. Zhao, et al., “Advanced Bus Transfer and Load Shedding Applications with IEC61850,” *IEEE 64th Annual Conference for Protective Relay Engineers*, pp. 239-245, 2011.

[45] J. Kim and I. Dobson, “Propagation of load shed in cascading line outages simulated by OPA,” *IEEE COMPENG*, 2010.

[46] P. Ajay, et al., “Optimum Load Sheding in Power System Strategies with Voltage Stability Indicators,” *Scientific Research*, pp. 12-21, 2010.

[47] H. Bevrani, et al., “Power system load shedding: Key issues and new perspectives,” *World Academy of Science, Engineering and Technology*, vol. 65, pp. 199-204, 2010.

**BIOGRAPHIES OF AUTHORS**

**Raghu C N** received his B.E degree in Electrical & Electronics Engineering from Adhichunchanagiri Institute of Technology in 2006 and MTech degree in Digital Electronics from Sri Siddhartha Institute of Technology Tumkur in 2011. He is currently an Associate professor in Electrical & Electronics Engineering department in R.R. Institute of technology Bangalore. And pursuing his Phd in Jain University. His research interests are Power systems security, Power system stability, Power quality etc. Email: raghuresearch13@gmail.com, Mob: 9844628735

**A Manjunatha** did his BE from Mysore University, ME in Power Systems from Bangalore University, and PhD from Dr.M.G.R University Chennai. He is currently working as principal at Sri Krishna institute of technology, Bangalore, Karnataka. He is currently guiding PhD and MSc engineering students in the area of power system operation and control, power system reliability evolution, power system deregulation and power quality. He is the life member of Indian Society for Technical Education also member of Institute of Engineers (India).