Antimicrobial Activity of Goat Colostrum against Bacterial Strains Causing Food Poisoning Diseases

Triana Setyawardani1*, Juni Sumarmono1, Heni Risqiati2 and Setya Agus Santosa

1Faculty of Animal Science, Jenderal Soedirman University, Purwokerto 53123, Central Java, Indonesia
2Department of Agriculture, Faculty of Animal Science and Agriculture, Diponegoro University, Semarang, Indonesia
*Corresponding author email: trianauunsoed@gmail.com

Abstract. The study was aimed to investigate the antimicrobial activity of bacterial isolates L.plantarum 3CT7 and 20CT8 from goat colostrum. The antimicrobial activity of cell-free supernatant was tested using a well-diffusion method on several indicators: temperature, time of storage, and pH. Antimicrobial activity was recorded in both isolates at pH 2.0; 4.0; 6.0 and 8.0, temperature at 0, 50 and 100°C, and in cold storage for 0, 15, 30, 45 and 60 days. L.plantarum 7CT3 and L.plantarum 20CT8 have a bigger zone of inhibition than that of Pseudomonas spp. as compared to other bacteria. Testing the cell-free activity was aimed to investigate the metabolite inhibition by L.plantarum. The isolates were capable of inhibiting all pathogenic bacteria in the experiment (S. thypimurium, E. coli, and S. aureus) as evidenced from the similar zone of inhibition from 15.83 to 16.06 mm. Isolates (L.plantarum 7CT3 dan 20CT8) exhibit inhibitory properties against S.thypimurium, S.aureus, Pseudomonas spp.. and L.monocytogenes at 0, 50 and 100°C. L.plantarum 7CT3 and L.plantarum 20CT8 exhibit antimicrobial activity during cold storage. Both isolates grown in the range of pH from 2 to 8 could inhibit S.thypimurium, E.coli, S. aureus and Pseudomonas spp. In general, the two isolates are the potential antimicrobial activity with broad ranges of pH, temperature and storage time.

Keywords: isolate, antimicrobial activity, temperature, pH, storage time

Abstrak. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui aktivitas antimikroba isolat bakteri L.plantarum 3CT7 dan 20CT8 dari kolostrum kambing. Aktivitas antimikroba dari supernat dirujuk sel diuji menggunakan metode difusi pada beberapa indikator yaitu : suhu, waktu penyimpanan, dan pH. Aktivitas antimikroba diamati pada kedua isolat tersebut pada pH 2,0; 4,0; 6,0 dan 8,0, suhu 0, 50 dan 100°C, dan pada penyimpanan dingin selama 0, 15, 30, 45 dan 60 hari. Isolat L.plantarum 7CT3 dan L.plantarum 20CT8 memiliki zona penghambatan lebih besar pada bakteri Pseudomonas spp. dibandingkan dengan bakteri uji lainnya. Pengujuan aktivitas bebas sel bertujuan untuk mengamati kemampuan daya hambat metabolit yang dihasilkan L.plantarum. Isolat yang diuji mampu menghambat semua bakteri patogen (S.thypimurium, E.coli, dan S.aureus) dan zona penghambatan yang diperoleh yaitu 15,83 sampai dengan 16,06 mm. Isolat (L.plantarum 7CT3 dan 20CT8) menunjukkan sifat penghambatan terhadap S.thypimurium, S.aureus, Pseudomonas spp.. dan L.monocytogenes pada suhu 0, 50 dan 100°C. Kedua isolat yaitu L.plantarum 7CT3 dan L.plantarum 20CT8 menunjukkan aktivitas antimikroba selama penyimpanan dingin. Kedua isolat yang tumbuh dalam kisaran pH dari 2 hingga 8 dapat menghambat S.thypimurium, E.coli, S.aureus dan Pseudomonas spp. Secara umum, kedua isolat tersebut berperan sebagai antimikroba potensial dengan rentang pH, suhu, dan waktu penyimpanan yang luas.

Kata kunci: isolat, aktivitas antimikroba, temperatur, pH, lama penyimpanan

Introduction

The major cause of poisoning in Indonesia during 2017 is instant foods. According to Indonesia Health Authority, the biggest poisoning case happened to women aged 15-34 years old, i.e. 163 cases. (Arisanti et al., 2018) reported that the major cause of food poisoning in Indonesia is pathogenic bacteria (Escherichia coli) from the consumed food product.

One of the measures to prevent food poisoning due to pathogenic bacteria is by using natural preservatives for food processing. Lactic acid bacteria (LAB) are well-recognized for their potential as natural food preservatives. Antimicrobial activity as the natural preservatives is harnessed during food processing and in the digestive tract. LAB produce metabolite with antimicrobial properties that prevent the growth and distribution of pathogenic bacteria and food spoilage. LAB produce lactic acid (Setyawardani et al., 2017) and other organic acids, hydrogen
peroxide and bacteriocin-like substances (Çadirci and Çitak, 2005).

LAB can be obtained from cow and goat colostrum. Previous study reported that cow colostrum exhibits antimicrobial activity against *E.coli, E.aerogenes, K.pneumonieae, B.subtilis* and *S.aureus*. Early presumption of natural preservatives is tested by measuring the inhibition of antimicrobial activity of LAB metabolites. The test was conducted using an agar well diffusion assay method (Khay et al., 2013) to measure the inhibitory properties against the growth, pH and temperature of the medium (Zouhir et al., 2011).

Metabolite obtained from goat colostrum LAB exhibits antimicrobial properties. Previous study indicated that the antimicrobial activities of LAB from goat milk were successful in inhibiting several gram-positive and gram-negative pathogenic bacteria (Setyawardani et al., 2017). Metabolite produced by goat colostrum LAB is predicted to have the excellent antimicrobial activity to be used as natural food preservatives for food material and food processing. Temperature, storage time, and pH are the key factors in food processing (Assefa et al., 2008).

The novelty of this study is the production of LAB metabolite from native Indonesian goat colostrum that exhibits an excellent antimicrobial activity as the candidate for natural food preservatives. The study aimed to investigate the inhibition of the antimicrobial activity of native Indonesian goat colostrum LAB based on different factors including temperature, storage time, and pH of the *L.plantarum* 3CT7 and *L.plantarum* 20CT8 isolates.

**Materials and Methods**

**Testing the Antimicrobial Inhibitory Properties**

*L.plantarum* 7CT3 and *L.plantarum* 20CT8 isolates were cultured in 10 MRSB media and incubated at 37°C for 20h until the media turned opaque which indicated the growth of bacteria. *L.plantarum* 7CT3 and 20CT8 isolates were collected and centrifuged at 7000 rpm speed for 20 minutes at 4°C. Cell-free supernatant was filtered using a 0.22 µm diameter membrane and neutralized. NaOH 1N was added to the supernatant to yield pH 5.8 – 6.2. Antimicrobial test was conducted using a well diffusion method.

**Antimicrobial Testing at Different Temperature**

The cell-free supernatant that was obtained from the previous step was tested for temperature durability. Antimicrobial durability was tested at 0, 50 and 100°C for 20 minutes. Inhibition was tested using a well diffusion method.

**Antimicrobial Durability Test at Different pH**

The cell-free supernatant of the two isolates was tested for durability at pH 2, 4, 6 and 8. The
pH of cell-free supernatant was adjusted according to treatment by adding 1N HCl and 1N NaOH. The test was conducted using a well diffusion method.

**Antimicrobial Test in Cold Storage**

A cold storage is pivotal in investigating microbial durability and activity at specific temperature and duration. Cell-free supernatant was stored for 0, 15, 30, 45 and 60 days at 4℃. The test was conducted using a well diffusion method.

**Data Analysis**

The obtained data was calculated to obtain the mean value and standard deviation. A further test was conducted using a Duncan’s Multiple Range Test (DMRT).

**Result and Discussion**

**Antimicrobial Activity of Crude Extract**

Table 1 shows that *L.plantarum* 7CT3 and *L.plantarum* 20CT8 have a bigger zone of inhibition in *Pseudomonas spp.* compared to other bacteria, indicating a significant difference (p<0.05). The smallest zone of inhibition in *L.plantarum* 7CT3 and *L.plantarum* 20CT8 isolates was *S.aureus*, measuring 13.00 and 13.67 mm, respectively. In general, both isolates showed inhibitory activity against pathogenic and spoilage bacteria. Antimicrobial activity of the isolates from *L.plantarum* 7CT3 and 20CT8 was produced from metabolite in form of acid. The acid lowered pH and lysed the indicator bacteria, namely *S.thyphimurium*, *E.coli*, *S.aureus*, and *Pseudomonas spp.* One of the inhibitory mechanisms was pH reduction by LAB metabolites, i.e. lactic acid and acetic acid (Tejero-Sariñena et al., 2012). The neutralizing process in the supernatant culture using alkali did not reduce the antimicrobial activity. It is evidenced that the metabolites yield were the potential candidates for bacteriocin. *L.plantarum* isolates are the group of Lactobacilli with a high production of acid that can lower pH faster than other isolates, such as *L.fermentum* (Tejero-Sariñena et al., 2012). The cell-free supernatant contains active metabolites which function as the initial indicator of bacteriocin (Hartmann et al., 2011).

Antimicrobial activity is generated by lactic acid and other organic acids (Teneva et al., 2017) (Teneva et al., 2017). *L.plantarum* TW 4 exhibits antimicrobial properties against some pathogenic and spoilage bacteria (Setyawardani et al., 2014). The inhibitory properties of *L.plantarum* against pathogenic and spoilage bacteria are organic acids which reduce pH value and created an inhibition zone. The organic acids produced by *L.plantarum* are mainly lactic acid. Some strains of *L.plantarum* are the potential natural preservatives for food industry, and therapy for microbial infection (Dinev et al., 2018).

**Antimicrobial Activity of Cell-Free**

Figure 1 shows that the mean inhibition zone created by *L.plantarum* 7CT3 and *L.plantarum* 20 CT8 is 12.94 to 18.67 mm. *L.plantarum* 7CT3 isolates shows a higher inhibition that that of *L.plantarum* 20 CT8 against pathogenic bacteria but not against spoilage bacteria (*Pseudomonas spp.*). The cell free activity was tested to observe the

| Indicator bacteria     | *L.plantarum* 7CT3 | *L.plantarum* 20CT8 |
|------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| *S. thyphimurium*      | 15.33±0.58 b       | 15.33±0.58 a       |
| *E. coli*              | 15.00 ±0.00 b      | 14.67±0.58 bc      |
| *S.aureus*             | 13.00±0.00 c       | 13.67±0.58 c       |
| *Pseudomonas spp.*     | 18.00±0.00 b       | 18.00±0.00 a       |
| *L.monocytogenes*      | 14.33±0.58 b       | 15.00±1.00 b       |

Values bearing different superscripts within column show significant difference (P<0.05)

Table 1. Inhibition zone diameter of *L.plantarum* crude extracts in different bacteria indicators
metabolite inhibition by \textit{L. plantarum}. The two isolates showed different inhibitory properties (P<0.05). \textit{L. plantarum} 7CT3 and \textit{L. plantarum} 20 CT8 show a higher inhibition against \textit{Pseudomonas spp.}, indicating a significant difference from the inhibition against pathogenic bacteria (P<0.05). \textit{L. plantarum} 7CT3 isolates had the lowest zone of inhibition in \textit{L. monocytogenes}, namely 14.17 mm. The isolates were capable of inhibiting all pathogenic bacteria in the experiment (\textit{S. thypimurium}, \textit{E. coli}, and \textit{S. aureus}) as evidenced from the similar zone of inhibition (P>0.05) from 15.83 to 16.06 mm. \textit{L. plantarum} 20 CT8 showed the smallest zone of inhibition against \textit{S. aureus} namely 12.94 mm which is not significantly different (P>0.05) from that of \textit{E. coli}. The isolates showed a relatively similar zone of inhibition against \textit{L. monocytogenes} and \textit{E. coli} except for \textit{S. thypimurium}.

The same isolates with different strains created different zones of inhibition. Previous study reported that the result of gene sequencing with 16S rRNA showed that isolates 7CT3 was included in \textit{L. plantarum} KCCM200656 and isolates 20CT8 was under \textit{L. plantarum} IMAU 40170.

Testing the cell-free activity was aimed to investigate the inhibitory properties of metabolites without the cell produced by \textit{L. plantarum}. The same isolate with different strains created different zones of inhibition. The previous study reported that 16S rRNA gene sequencing indicated that isolates 7CT3 were of \textit{L. plantarum} KCCM200656 and isolates 20CT8 were of \textit{L. plantarum} IMAU 40170 (Setyawardani, unpublished data).

\textbf{Antimicrobial Activity at Different Degrees of Temperature}

Table 2 shows that the two isolates (\textit{L. plantarum} 7CT3 dan 20CT8) exhibit inhibitory properties against \textit{S. thypimurium}, \textit{S. aureus}, \textit{Pseudomonas spp.} and \textit{L. monocytogenes} at 0, 50 and 100°C. The highest mean value of zone of inhibition in both isolates was observed in \textit{Pseudomonas spp.}. \textit{L. plantarum} 20CT8 isolates

### Table 2. Zone of inhibition of \textit{L. plantarum} isolates at different temperatures

| Indicator bacteria  | \textit{L. plantarum} 7CT3 | \textit{L. plantarum} 20CT8 |
|---------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
|                     | 0°C  | 50°C | 100°C | 0°C  | 50°C | 100°C |
| \textit{S. thypimurium} | 13.3±0.5^b | 12.3±0.5^c | 15.0±0.0^e | 1.3±1.5^e | 16.0±0.5^b | 17.7±1.1 |
| \textit{E. coli}     | 13.0±0.0^d | 0±0.0^d | 11.67±1.5^b | 16.0±0.0^bc | 16.0±0.0^b | 17±0.0 |
| \textit{S. aureus}   | 13.0±1.0^c | 12.3±0.5^c | 14.7±0.5^b | 17±0.0| 15.3±0.5b | 17.3±0.5 |
| \textit{Pseudomonas spp.} | 20.0±0.0^a | 15.7±0.0^a | 15.3±0.5^a | 15.0±0.0^b | 18.0±0.0^ab | 18.0±0.0 |
| \textit{L. monocytogenes} | 11.3±0.5^c | 13.3±0.5^c | 13.0±0.0^d | 15.0±0.0^bc | 15.3±0.5^a | 17.0±0.0 |

Values bearing different superscripts within column show significant difference (P<0.05)
was capable of inhibiting all bacteria in all degrees of temperature and exhibited a larger zone of inhibition than that of *L. plantarum* 7CT3. In the 0°C cold storage, both isolates could inhibit all the indicator bacteria. *L. plantarum* 7CT3 isolates showed the higher inhibitory properties against *Pseudomonas spp.* namely 20 mm, significantly different (P<0.05) from the other indicator bacteria. The lowest inhibition was 11.3 mm against *L. monocytogenes*. *L. plantarum* 7CT3 isolates showed a relatively similar inhibition against *S. thypimurium, E. coli* and *S. aureus*. *L. plantarum* 20CT8 isolates had a relatively similar inhibition against *E. coli, S. aureus, Pseudomonas spp.* and *L. monocytogenes*, while the lowest was against *S. thypimurium* with a significant difference (P<0.05).

*L. plantarum* 7CT3 heated at 50°C could inhibit other indicator bacteria except for *E. coli*. The isolates exhibited the highest inhibition (15.7 mm) against *Pseudomonas spp.*, significantly different (P<0.05) from other bacteria. At 50°C, *L. plantarum* 20CT8 isolates showed the higher mean of inhibition than that of *L. plantarum* 7CT3. Inhibitory properties of *L. plantarum* 20CT8 against *S. thypimurium, E. coli*, and *S. aureus* dan *L. monocytogenes* were not significantly different (P>0.05).

The two isolates could inhibit all bacteria during the experiment at 100°C. *L. plantarum* 7CT3 isolates could inhibit *S. thypimurium, S. aureus* and *Pseudomonas spp.* with a relatively similar zone of inhibition without significant difference (P>0.05). 20CT8 isolates showed a higher inhibition at 100°C compared to 50 and 0°C across the indicator bacteria. The antimicrobial activity of *L. plantarum* 20 CT8 isolates at 100°C was successful in inhibiting all indicator bacteria with a zone of inhibition of 17.4 mm.

Antimicrobial activity of *L. plantarum* 3CT7 dan 20CT8 isolates was stable at the temperature of 0; 50 and 100°C for 30 minutes, although the 3CT7 isolates could not inhibit *E. coli* at 50°C. It was in line with a previous study (Heredia-Castro et al., 2015) that *Lactobacillus* isolates from Mexican Cocido cheese produced bacteriocin-like substances against *S. aureus, L. innocua, E. coli* and *S. thypimurium* using diffusion method. The antimicrobe produced was stable at 65°C for 30 minutes and exhibited antimicrobial activity at pH between 2 and 8. It showed that bacteriocin produced from antimicrobial activity could be harnessed as the natural preservatives for pasteurized products, particularly dairy products (Heredia-Castro et al., 2015). Antimicrobe with the potential as bacteriocin showed durability in sterilization temperature of 121°C for 15 minutes (Kusmarwati et al., 2014) and could only serve as preservatives for high-temperature food processing. Antimicrobe that endures high temperature is the potential candidate for bacteriocin because bacteriocin is protein consisted of short peptides that remain stable under the heat and endures a wide range of pH value.

**Antimicrobial Activity during Cold Storage**

Table 3 shows that the isolates produced by both *L. plantarum* 7CT3 and *L. plantarum* 20CT8 show antimicrobial activity during cold storage. The isolates were stored at 5°C for 60 days and the test was conducted every 15 days. *L. plantarum* 7CT3 isolates had a relatively similar diameter across the indicator bacteria and not significantly different (P>0.05) from condition before storage. *L. plantarum* 20CT8 isolates had a higher inhibition against *Pseudomonas spp.* and significantly different against all other bacteria (P<0.05). During the 15-day cold storage, *L. plantarum* 7CT3 showed the highest inhibition against *Pseudomonas spp.* 17.78 mm and was significantly different (P<0.05) from other indicator bacteria. On the contrary, *L. plantarum* 20 CT8 did not show different inhibitory properties across indicator bacteria. During the 30-day storage, both *L. plantarum* 7CT3 and *L. plantarum* 20CT8 could inhibit all indicator bacteria and showed...
significant difference (P<0.05) in E.coli compared to the other bacteria. The highest inhibition was against E.coli (21.67 and 20.56 mm) and the lowest was L.monocytogenes (12.00 and 13.67 mm). During the 45-day storage, the isolates of both L.plantarum 7CT3 and plantarum 20CT8 showed the highest inhibition against Pseudomonas spp. 18 and 14.33 mm, respectively, and was significantly different from the other indicator bacteria. L.plantarum 20CT8 and L.plantarum 7CT3 isolates during the 60-day storage was not capable of inhibiting E.coli, but showed inhibitory properties against the other indicator bacteria. L.plantarum 20CT isolates showed the highest inhibition against S.aureus and was significantly different from other bacteria (P<0.05). In the cold storage, antimicrobial activity survived up to 60 days in L.plantarum isolates and most of the bacteria. It showed that antimicrobial activity in both isolates could inhibit the indicator bacteria for 60 days. E.coli could not be inhibited during 60-day of cold storage by L.plantarum 7CT3 isolates, but inhibited by 20CT8 isolates. Therefore, L.plantarum 7CT3 was more effective in inhibiting E.coli in cold storage for up to 6 days.

**Table 3. Zone of inhibition of L.plantarum 7CT3 and 20CT8 isolates during cold storage time**

| Isolates/Indicator bacteria          | Cold storage time (days) |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|
|                                      | 0           | 15          | 30           | 45           | 60           |
| **L.plantarum 7CT3**                 |              |             |              |              |
| S.thyphimurium                        | 16.78±0.58  | 12.56±0.96  | 16.11±2.55   | 11.31±1.15   | 12.33±0.58   |
| E.coli                               | 16.44±2.22  | 13.78±2.12  | 21.67±2.91   | 12.22±0.77   | 0.00±0.00    |
| S.aureus                             | 16.11±0.51  | 15.33±1.15  | 13.55±2.12   | 10.33±0.58   | 14.00±0.00   |
| Pseudomonas spp.p                    | 18.34±2.52  | 17.78±2.27  | 15.00±0.00   | 18.00±0.00   | 15.00±0.00   |
| L.monocytogenes                      | 15.33±0.58  | 15.00±0.00  | 12.00±0.00   | 13.33±0.58   | 13.00±0.00   |
| **L.plantarum 20CT8**                |              |             |              |              |
| S.thyphimurium                        | 16.78±1.26  | 14.89±0.58  | 16.33±2.08   | 11.83±0.93   | 13.67±1.15   |
| E.coli                               | 15.00±1.00  | 14.89±1.71  | 20.56±0.96   | 14.00±0.00   | 12.67±2.08   |
| S.aureus                             | 16.11±0.51  | 16.89±1.92  | 16.00±0.00   | 11.33±0.58   | 17.00±0.00   |
| Pseudomonas spp.p                    | 19.34±1.12  | 18.33±2.08  | 16.67±0.58   | 14.33±0.58   | 14.00±0.00   |
| L.monocytogenes                      | 15.33±0.58  | 17.33±0.58  | 13.67±0.58   | 10.67±0.58   | 13.00±0.00   |

Values bearing different superscripts within column, either L.plantarum 7CT3 or L.plantarum 20CT8, show significant differences (P<0.05).

**Antimicrobial Activity in Different pH Values**

Table 4 shows that both isolates grown in the range of pH from 2 to 8 could inhibit S. thyphimurium, E.coli, S.aureus and Pseudomonas spp. Both isolates did not show inhibition in pH 2. Media with pH 4 showed significantly different (P<0.05) zone of inhibition against the bacteria. L.plantarum 7CT3 isolates showed the highest inhibition against Pseudomonas spp. (17.78 mm) while L.plantarum 20CT8 had the highest inhibition against L.monocytogenes.

At pH 8, the highest and lowest average of L.plantarum 7CT3 isolates inhibition was against E.coli (15.67 mm) and Pseudomonas spp. (11.33 mm), respectively. In L.plantarum 20CT8 isolates, the highest and lowest average of inhibition was against Pseudomonas spp. (18 mm) and L.monocytogenes (12 mm), respectively. The highest mean inhibition in isolates 3CT7 was obtained in pH value 4, followed by pH 8. It indicated that both isolates are applicable to different ranges of pH value.

The changing antimicrobial activity was affected by different environmental condition, such as pH. Antimicrobial durability in a wide range of pH value will determine the metabolite application produced by LAB. Studies by Fayol-Messaoudi et al. (2005) and (Zacharoef and Lovitt, 2012) reported that antibacterial was more effective in absorbing the surface of the bacteria in pH < 5.0. Research showed that the antimicrobial properties survived in a wide range of pH values from 4 to 10 in all indicator bacteria. It was in line with Mezaini et al. (2009)
that antimicrobial activity could survive in pH between 4.0 and 8.0. Meanwhile, Pinto et al. (2009) stated that Pediococcus pentosaceus and E. faecium could maintain the antimicrobial activity in pH 2.0 to 8.0 before vanishing in pH 12. Antimicrobial activity in a wide range of pH will accommodate the application of the product.

**Conclusion**

Isolates *L. plantarum* 3CT7 and *L. plantarum* 8CT20 exhibit antimicrobial activities in a wide range of pH value (2.0-8.0); from low to high temperatures (0°C – 100°C), and under cold storage for 60 days. Both isolates are the potential natural preservatives.

**Acknowledgement**

The authors express their gratitude to the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education of Indonesia for the research grant under the scheme of Excellence Higher Education Institution Research 2017 No. 1633/UN23.14/PN.01.00/2018 and Contract/No. 1930/UN23.14/PN/2018.

**References**

Arisanti R.R., C. Indriani, and S.A. Wilopo. 2018. Kontribusi agen dan faktor penyebab kejadian luar biasa keracunan pangan di Indonesia: kajian sistematis. Berita Kedokteran Masyarakat 34: 99-106.

Assefa E., F. Beyene, and A. Santhanam. 2008. Effect of temperature and pH on the antimicrobial activity of inhibitory substances produced by lactic acid bacteria isolated from Ergo, an Ethiopian traditional fermented milk. African Journal of Microbiology Research 2: 229-234.

Çadirci B.H., and S. Çitak. 2005. A comparison of two methods used for measuring antagonistic activity of lactic acid bacteria. Pak. J. Nutr 4: 237-241.

Dinev T., G. Beev, M. Tzanova, S. Denev, D. Dermendzhieva, and A. Stoyanova. 2018. Antimicrobial activity of *Lactobacillus plantarum* against pathogenic and food spoilage microorganisms: a review. Bulgarian Journal of Veterinary Medicine 21.

Fayol-Messaoudi D., C.N. Berger, M.H. Coconnier-Polter, V. Lievin-Le Moal, and A.L. Servin. 2005. pH-, Lactic acid-, and non-lactic acid-dependent activities of probiotic *Lactobacilli* against *Salmonella enterica* Serovar Typhimurium. Appl Environ Microbiol 71: 6008-6013.

Hartmann H.A., T. Wilke, and R. Erdmann. 2011. Efficacy of bacteriocin-containing cell-free culture supernatants from lactic acid bacteria to control *Listeria monocytogenes*. International Journal of Food Microbiology 146: 237-241.

Heredia-Castro P.Y., J.I. Méndez-Romero, A. Hernández-Mendoza, E. Acedo-Félix, A.F. González-Córdova, and B. Vallejo-Cordoba. 2015. Antimicrobial activity and partial characterization of bacteriocin-like inhibitory substances produced by *Lactobacillus* spp. isolated from artisanal Mexican cheese. Journal of dairy science 98: 8285-8293.

Khay E.O., M. Idaomar, L. Castro, P. Bernárdez, N. Senhaji, and J. Abrini. 2013. Antimicrobial activities of the bacteriocin-like substances produced by lactic acid bacteria isolated from...
Moroccan dromedary milk. African Journal of Biotechnology 10: 10447-10455.
Kusmarwati A., F.R. Arief, and S. Haryati. 2014. Eksplorasi bakteriosin dari bakteri asam laktat asal rusip bangka dan kalimantan. Jurnal pascapanen dan bioteknologi kelautan dan perikanan 9: 29-40.
Mezaini A., N-E Chihib, A. Dilmi Bouras, N. Nedjar-Arroume, and J.P. Hornez. 2009. Antibacterial activity of some lactic acid bacteria isolated from an Algerian dairy product. Journal of environmental and public health: 1-6.
Pinto A.L., M. Fernandes, C. Pinto, H. Albano, F. Castilho, P. Teixeira, and P.A. Gibbs. 2009. Characterization of anti-Listeria bacteriocins isolated from shellfish: potential antimicrobials to control non-fermented seafood. International Journal of Food Microbiology 129: 50-58.
Setyawardani T., A.H.D. Rahardjo, and M. Sulistyoawati. 2017. Chemical Characteristics of Goat Cheese with Different Percentages of Mixed Indigenous Probiotic Culture during Ripening. Tropical Animal Science Journal 40: 55-62.
Setyawardani T., W.P. Rahayu, R.R.A. Maheswari, and N.S. Palupi. 2014. Antimicrobial activity and adhesion ability of indigenous lactic acid bacteria isolated from goat milk. International Food Research Journal 21: 959-964.
Tejero-Sariñena S., J. Barlow, A. Costabile, G.R. Gibson, and I. Rowland. 2012. In vitro evaluation of the antimicrobial activity of a range of probiotics against pathogens: Evidence for the effects of organic acids. Anaerobe 18: 530-538.
Tenev D., R. Denkova, B. Goranov, Z. Denkova, and G. Kostov. 2017. Antimicrobial activity of Lactobacillus plantarum strains against Salmonella pathogens. Ukrainian food journal 6: 125-133.
Zacharof MP, and RW Lovitt. 2012. Bacteriocins produced by lactic acid bacteria; a review article. APCBEE Procedia 2: 50-56.
Zouhir A., E. Kheadr, I. Fliss, and J.B. Hamida. 2011. Partial purification and characterization of two bacteriocin-like inhibitory substances produced by bifidobacteria. African Journal of Microbiology Research 5: 411-418.