How to cite this article:
Ishak, K., Mahfudz, A. A., Basri, Y. Z., Mariyanti, T., & Zulhelmy (2020). Strengthening Halal Tourism Development in Riau Province in Indonesia. International Journal of Islamic Business, 5(2), 72-81.

STRENGTHENING HALAL TOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN RIAU PROVINCE IN INDONESIA

1Khodijah Ishak, 2Akhmad Afandi Mahfudz, 3Yuswar Zainul Basri,  
3Tatik Mariyanti, & 4Zulhelmy  
1STIE Syariah Bengkalis, Riau, Indonesia  
2Darussalam Gontor University, Indonesia  
3Trisakti University, Jakarta, Indonesia  
4Universitas Islam Riau, Pekanbaru, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: khodijahishak2@gmail.com

Received: 19 August 2020   Revised: 5 November 2020   Accepted: 23 December 2020   Published: 31 December 2020

ABSTRACT

This study explore and analyze the problems of halal tourism’s development in Riau Province with an Analytic Network Process (ANP) approach. The method used is the Analytic Network Process (ANP) which is a qualitative and quantitative method approach. The type of data that will be used in this research is the primary data and the form of the subject (self-report data). The samples used as respondents in this study were those who were considered experts in the field of halal tourism, namely the government in this case the ministry of tourism, tourism practitioners, regulators or perpetrators industrial activist in the field of tourism, Halal Product Guarantee Agency business and academics took by purposive sampling. The variables of this research are regulation, literacy, human resources, infrastructure, government policies, certification, government commitment, and socio-culture. The findings shows that the internal problems faced in the development of Halal tourism in Riau province based on the order of priority were infrastructure problems, regulatory issues, human resource problems, and literacy problems. Other findings indicate that the external problems faced are based on priority order, including government commitment issues, government policy issues, certification issues, and socio-cultural problems. The Managerial implications for halal tourism stakeholders in Riau province, especially the local government to pay attention to issues of infrastructure development, particularly access to places of halal tourism and have a strong commitment in developing halal tourism in the province.

Keywords: Analytic Network Approach, Halal Management, Halal Tourism, Internal-External Problems
INTRODUCTION

Indonesia makes tourism one of the priority sectors for national development. This sector is expected to be a leading sector and also capable of moving the industrial sectors other than agriculture, oil, and gas, and mining, as contained in the development plan of tourism in 2015-2019. Based on data from the Ministry of Tourism, recorded that in 2014 the number of foreign tourists was 9.4 million, in 2015 it was recorded at 10.4 million, in 2016 it was 11.5 million, in 2017 it increased quite significantly to 14.03 million, in 2018 it was recorded as much 15.8 million and it is expected that in 2019 it will reach 20 million people (Irma and Yani, 2019).

In the year 2016, the growth of Indonesia’s tourism sector is the fastest and become the largest economic sector both contributes her against foreign exchange after the oil palm industry reached USD 15 965 billion, while tourism reached USD 13.568 billion. In the year 2015, the tourism sector was in the fourth position which contributes to the exchange with the achievements of USD 12 225 billion under the Oil and Gas (USD 18 574 billion), Palm Oil (USD 16 427 billion), Coal (USD 14 717 Billion) (Wulf 2017). Based on the Global Islamic Economy, in the years 2017 and 2018, Indonesia was ranked fourth among the Islamic organization states in the halal tourism sector (www.Indonesia.go.id, 2019).

One of the efforts of the Ministry of Tourism to increase the number of domestic and foreign tourists selecting from several provinces that exist for halal tourism development programs that serve as the leading tourist destinations in Indonesia in 2018, (Wahidati and Sariulasiti, 2018). The regions are West Sumatera, Riau, Lampung, Banten, Jakarta, West Java, East Java, Makassar, and Lombok. For Sumatera, especially in Riau Province which has advantages in the culture-based tourism sector. Riau community culture very thick with typical Malay will be a breakthrough travel sector. Where several cultural events that have been held in several districts in Riau have been able to increase tourist visits, both local and foreign.

Besides, Riau is a province that has a majority Muslim population, ethnicity, and Malay culture. According to data from the Central Statistics Agency of Riau Province in 2018, Muslims in Riau province were 87.47%, while other religions such as Christianity 9.27%, Catholicism 1.01%, Hinduism 0.01%, Buddhism 2.18%, and Confucianism. 0.04% and the remaining 0.02% adhere to other beliefs (Riau, 2018). The number of Muslims that great the potential being exploited Riau in efforts to develop halal tourism. On the other hand, halal tourism also faces various challenges, especially in terms of regulations, literacy, human resources, infrastructure, demographics, and the allocation of costs incurred for traveling. This requires a deeper understanding of various parties in their development.

In QS Al-Mulk 15 Allah SWT says which means: He is the one who made the earth easy for you, so walk in all directions and eat part of His sustenance and only Him will you (return after) be resurrected. Allah SWT in Al-Qur’an has advised humans to make this earth a blessing so that humans will always have a sense of gratitude and get a lot of wisdom and lessons from the various events they encounter on their way.

Halal tourism is tourism which in its implementation refers to Islamic law, both accommodation, attractions, and tourist objects themselves, (Pratiwi, Dida & Sjafirah, 2018). Where in the development of the tourism sector concerns socio-cultural, economic, and political aspects (Spillane, 1994). This is in line with the provisions contained in Law Number 9 of 1990 concerning tourism which states that the implementation of tourism is aimed at increasing national income to improve the welfare and prosperity of the people, expand and equalize business opportunities and employment opportunities, encourage regional development, introduce Indonesian tourist objects and attractions. Also, according to Joyosuharto (1995) tourism development has three functions, namely: (1) increasing the economy; (2) maintaining the national identity and preservation of the function and quality of the environment, and (3) fostering a sense of love for the country and the nation.

The Industry of halal tourism in Riau Province is not easy, because halal tourism is a new phenomenon and in the world is still developing (Pratiwi, Dida and Sjafirah, 2018). In the Riau province that tourism industry have not been supported by adequate infrastructure, competency of human resources. Public literacy about halal tourism is still relatively low, and regulations have been set by the Governor of Riau No: 18 the year
2019 is not considered significant enough as evidenced by there are still many districts, sub-districts, and villages in Riau province that have not implemented halal tourism. Therefore requires a lot of preparedness, according to the ministry of tourism (2019) the most important for developing halal tourism, namely accessibility, amenities, and attractions. Besides, it must also be supported by professional human resources who know about Islamic shari'ah. The availability of quality and professional human resources tends to increase the development of tourism that it manages (Djakfar, 2017).

This research was conducted qualitatively to describe the essential issues related to the development of halal tourism and analyze some of the causes through the ANP approach. Research on the development of halal tourism is interesting and important to study because it reflects Islamic values.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Halal Tourism

Tourism is known in Arabic terms with the words "al-Siyahah, al-Rihlah, and al-Safar" (Baalbaki, 1995). Meanwhile, according to the mandate of the Fatwa of the National Syari'ah Council Number 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016, it is explained that what is meant by tourism is various kinds of tourism activities and is supported by various facilities and services provided by the community, businessmen, government and local governments (Fatwa DSN, 2016).

The word halal comes from the Arabic words halla, yahillu, hillan, wahalalan which have the meaning of being justified or permitted by the syar’i law. Has a meaning as something that is allowed or permitted by Allah (Al-Qordhawi, 1994). The word is the main source that is not only related to food or food products but also enters all aspects of life, such as banking and finance, cosmetics, employment, tourism, and others.

Besides, the word "halal" is a term that is very closely related to the life of Muslims, always associated with religious teachings and in the holy books of Muslims. The relation of the word "halal" has a meaning that is very diverse, among them the connotations in terms of food, earn a living, etc. Structurally, the two words are in a very unequal relationship in terms of the meaning structure, but if they are juxtaposed into a new equivalent form of phrases, then the term "halal tourism" can be a different meaning from before.

The terminology Bawazir (2013) defines a lawful journey and travel the entire process is in line with the values of the Islamic Shari'a, both start from the sole intention of worship and admire Allah creation, during the journey can worship smoothly and after until the destination of tourism, does not lead to things that are contrary to the Shari'ah, eating and drinking halal thayyibah, so that his return can increase our gratitude to Allah. Chookaew et al. (2014) interpreted halal tourism as an actualization of the Islamic concept where the values of halal and haram are the main benchmarks, this means that all aspects of tourism activities cannot be separated from the certification of things that must be a reference for every tourist actor.

Based on some of the literature above, halal tourism is a level of additional services for amenities, attractions, designated and provided accessibility services, to fulfill experience or knowledge for tourists who shame travel following the principles, Islamic principles and concepts as well as being friendly to Muslim tourists. Such as Muslim friendly hotels, halal food, Muslim friendly phone applications, Muslim friendly airports, halal holidays, halal tourism websites, halal health facilities and services, halal cruises, and halal swimwear (Battour, 2018).

Thus, halal tourism is a type of activity to create an extended service of conditions (excellent service conditions). And it does not eliminate all the elements contained in conventional tourism. The elements in conventional tourism will be maintained if they do not conflict with the values and principles of sharia.

Previous Research

Previous research that discusses issues and issues related to the development of halal tourism has been widely reviewed by many authors. The regulatory issue according to (Hamzana, 2018) evokes that the factors
affecting the standardization of halal tourism services are legal (laws), legal structures (law enforcement), facilities or supporting factors, community factors, and cultural factors. Meanwhile (Mudana, 2017) explained that the obstacles in the development of sustainable tourism include regulations. (La et al. 2015) also explained that one of the external factors that support and hinder tourism development is regulation.

Zalikha (2015) explains about the problem of literation related halal tourism that one of the challenges faced in tourism development is a lack of understanding of Islamic law. Additionally (Andi Triyawan, 2018) also explains that the development of halal tourism in Indonesia and is not sufficiently developed. The number of amenities or facilities that exist in tourism destinations is inadequate. Also, technology and public knowledge of tourism are still not very broad. Therefore, in developing halal tourism, literacy, regulation and high knowledge are needed so that business investment in the syari'ah sector can run well, (Yusuff, Mansor, and Hamed 2017).

Especially for the halal tourism industry, the existence of human resources is very much needed to oversee all program activities to match the spirit of the teachings of *maqashid al-shari'ah* in Islam. The more capable human resources are available, the potential tends to be the faster the development of tourism it manages. According to (Rosmiati, Handayani, and Widodo, 2018) there are also obstacles faced by local governments in developing tourism potential, namely the lack of quality of Human Resources. Therefore, increasing mastery of foreign languages, and technology has become an absolute requirement for human resources in Indonesia can compete at the global level, (Power et al., 2016). To support the development of halal tourism, competency of human resources are required to understand the requirements of Islam and technology, as explained in Qs Al-Baqarah verses 31-32.

Besides, in developing halal tourism, infrastructure must also be built. However, (Anon, 2016) states that one of the important factors in investment in the development of the tourism sector in the future, and modernization is very dependent on infrastructure. Also, the obstacles faced in tourism development are the lack of human resources, tourism facilities, and infrastructure (Martins, Paturusi, & Surya, 2017). There are four components to support the success of halal tourism, including travel service providers, transportation, whether or not the tour is attractive, to support through financial service providers, namely Islamic banks. The role of Islamic banks is very important in developing halal tourism. (Rusmahafi, 2015). In order for the development of the halal business sector to advance, its sustainability in the long term and run well, it is very important to do it with good governance in accordance with the framework of Islamic principles (Zaemah Zainuddin, 2016).

**Conceptual Framework**

This research conceptually explores & analyzes the problem of developing halal tourism with an ANP approach. This approach is focused on internal and external interest to formulate solutions to wellbeing (*maslahah*).
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The Analytic Network Process (ANP) is a tool of non-parametric and non-Bayesian qualitative methods in the decision-making process to provide a general framework, without assumptions about the independence of elements at various levels. The stages in the ANP method are as follows:

a. Model Construction
The ANP model construction is prepared based on theoretical and empirical review literature and provides questions to experts and practitioners of halal tourism as well as through in-depth interviews to examine the information more deeply to get the real problem.

b. Model Quantification
The quantification stage of the model uses questions in the ANP questionnaire in the form of pairwise comparisons between elements in the cluster to find out which of the two has the greater influence (more dominance) and how big the difference is through a numerical scale of 1-9. The data from the assessment results are then collected and inputted through the super decision software to be processed to produce priority and supermatrix forms of output. The results of each respondent will be inputted on a separate ANP network (Ascarya, 2011).
c. Synthesis and Analysis

1) Geometric Mean
To determine the results of individual assessments of respondents and determine the results of opinions in one group, an assessment was carried out by calculating the geometric mean (Saaty & Vargas, 2006). Questions in the form of comparisons (pairwise comparisons) of the respondents will be combined to form a consensus.

2) Rater Agreement
Rater Agreement is a measure that indicates the level of conformity (approval) of the respondent (R1-Rn) to a problem in one cluster. The tool used to measure the rater agreement is Kendall's Coefficient of Concordance (W:0 < W ≤ 1). W=1 indicates perfect conformity (Ascarya, 2010).

The relationship between the Analytic Network Process (ANP) method with this study is very subjective and the Analytic Network Process (ANP) remains to assess the subjectivity in this study. This method can understand the problem of phenomena about what is experienced by research subjects such as regulation, literacy, human resources, infrastructure, government policy, certification, government commitment, and certification, holistically and by way of descriptions in the form of words and language. In a special context that is natural and by utilizing various natural methods, (Moleong, 2007). Also, the Analytic Network Process (ANP) can parse the problems faced by stakeholders in Riau Province in developing halal tourism. The use of ANP in research is useful in simplifying a problem in research (Saaty, 2004). The ANP method can restructure complex problems into simpler ones. Besides being able to simplify problem-solving in research, ANP can also provide and determine priority problems faced by Riau province in the development of halal tourism.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Table 4.1:
Recapitulation of ANP Cluster Problem Processing Results

| ASPECT                  | PROBLEM                                      | GEOMEAN (%) |
|-------------------------|----------------------------------------------|-------------|
| INTERNAL PROBLEM        |                                              |             |
| REGULATION GM: 24,523%  | Lack Of Regent And Regional Regulations      | 43,532%     |
|                         | Implementation is not optimal                | 20,240%     |
|                         | Regulation Not Socialized                    | 30,851%     |
| LITERACY GM: 17,777%    | Low literacy of halal tourism                | 39,232%     |
|                         | Tourism actors are not standardized          | 33,996%     |
|                         | Low understanding of technology              | 23,073%     |
| HUMAN RESOURCES GM: 21,084% | Lack of Public Awareness of halal tourism | 27,362%     |
|                         | Lack of Vocational Education in the tourism’s segment | 29,111%     |
|                         | HR is still low                              | 39,540%     |
| INFRASTRUCTURE GM: 29,101% | Weak interconnection in remote areas       | 23,256%     |
|                         | Accessibility                                | 26,510%     |
The roots of the problems halal tourism development in Riau province were analyzed from two-dimensional namely internal and external factors. Be basic right Geometric Mean (GM) was counted, indicating the priority, and the root of the problem comes from internal factors (35.45%) and external factors (61.61%).

Aspects of priority problems originating from internal factors in sequence, the first is infrastructure problems (29.10%), followed by regulatory issues (24.52%), followed by HR problems (21.08%), and finally literacy problems (17.77%). For the infrastructure problem cluster, the most priority subproblem is accessibility (26.51%). For clusters of regulatory issues, the absence of regulations and regional regulations (43.53%) is the most priority problem. For the literacy problem cluster, low literacy about halal tourism (39.23%) is the most priority problem. For the human resources problem cluster, a low understanding of technology (39.54%) is the most priority problem.

In the external problem specification, the most priority is government commitment (31.16%), followed by government policy issues (25.70%), certification issues (23.52%) and the last priority is socio-culture problems (14.20%).

In the sub-cluster commitment of the government, the problem where some areas have not had tourism’s RIB (32.99%) is a matter of priority. In the government policy sub-cluster, regulatory issues (34.44%) are the most important problems. In the certification sub-cluster, the problem of human resources is not yet certified (26.96%). And finally, in the sub-cluster, the socio-cultural problem where culture has not been used as a tourist attraction (33.87%) is the main problem.

This research shows that the priority internal problem of this research is infrastructure. This is also supported by research by Devi and Firmansyah (2018) related to the development of the halal tourism sector in Indonesia where one of the factors that need to be considered in developing the halal tourism sector is the feasibility of infrastructure availability. The infrastructure in question includes several indicators including the availability of halal food, the availability of places of worship, the availability of
comfortable and clean toilets and the availability of water, the availability of facilities and services during the month of Ramadan, the absence of haram food provided, pleasant personal activities, good ethics of resources. people who work in the tourism sector shari’ah  and as easy transportation facilities and infrastructure.

Furthermore, according to Jaelani (2017), the infrastructure needed in developing sharia tourism is not limited to the availability of terminals or transportation services. The availability of halal restaurants, tour guides who have a good understanding of sharia tourism information, and the availability of facilities for worship are included in the sharia tourism infrastructure. Talib Hamid and Zulfakar (2015) also stated the same where one key to the success of tourism development especially halal tourism is some assets that can be dedicated from both government and private agencies to tourists and the public, such as transport. The existence of comfortable and proper public transportation can make it easier for tourists to reach available tourist attractions without being confused about renting individual transportation. The benefit is certainly not only felt by tourists only, but also for producers of tourism services providers shari’ah. One example is the existence of convenient and proper transportation infrastructure, so those producers can send their products from one place to another (Gubbins, 2003).

Therefore, halal tourism stakeholders in Riau province need to examine more deeply the infrastructure opportunities that can be built and developed in this region. Thus, the needs of tourists for comfortable and proper infrastructure can be completely fulfilled. The government also needs to facilitate trading activities through the feasibility of the availability of good infrastructure and transportation so that a wider range of trading activities can occur or in other words, local products can be marketed widely. It can also be a good investment opportunity for the government of Riau province to attract both local and foreign investment in expanding tourism shari’ah.

The issue of the government's commitment to developing halal tourism is an important enough finding of this research and is a top priority that needs serious attention. (Kurniansah and Wirawan, 2019) helped affirm to maximize the development of tourist attraction that exists, then the need for a commitment by the stakeholders such as local governments, private sector, and communities to develop a tourist attraction. It can be believed that the development of halal tourism is following the commitment of the central government in making halal tourism an alternative to conventional tourism in supporting economic growth in Indonesia (www.bi.go.id).

To achieve the development of halal tourism in Riau province, the support of all parties are needed. A synergy of cooperation between mutually supportive local governments. Talib, Hamid, and Zulfakar (2015) introduced critical success factors in terms of halal tourism supply chain management, including government support, infrastructure assets, information technology, resource management, collaborative relationships (synergy). Certification of halal and a system for tracking halal products from upstream to downstream are very important. Starts of material gain raw until delivered product into the hands of consumers. Critical success factors are closely related to the halal tourism ecosystem that can be built by the Riau government to realize halal tourism.

**CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATION**

**Conclusion**

The problem of developing halal tourism in Riau province is divided into two problem aspects, namely internal problems, and external problems. The internal problems faced in the development of halal tourism in Riau province are infrastructure problems. Infrastructure may include some indicators such as is the availability of accessibility towards tourism destinations and the availability of terminal/service transport, availability of telecommunications, availability of hotel shari’ah, availability of halal restaurants, availability of Islamic travel, tour leader, and availability of shopping center which applies the principles of shari’ah so that buyers feel comfortable and safe. The existence of adequate infrastructure has a positive multiplier impact on the economic sector for people in
tourist destinations so that this can improve community welfare and increase the number of traveler in Riau Province.

Meanwhile, the external problems faced in order of priority are government commitment issues. The government's commitment factor is an important topic in the development of halal tourism. To maximize the development of halal tourism in Riau province, there needs to be a commitment from stakeholders such as the local government, the private sector, and the community to develop tourist attractions in Riau province, namely by: providing supporting facilities at each tourist attraction location, making good road access, utilizing existing tourism resources to be developed, make regulations related to halal tourism. The existence of adequate and strong regulations can also be one of the keys to the implementation of halal tourism in Riau Province.

Implications

a. The Riau Provincial Government and/or the tourism stakeholders of Riau Province should focus on improving regional infrastructure, especially regional facilities, and infrastructure which support the interest of both local and wider tourists.

b. It is time for the Riau provincial government to synergize with academics and practitioners to educate and socialize about halal tourism to the public to increase public literacy about halal tourism. Education and socialization can also be given to the head region in the province of Riau, thus, the head of the region also has the vision, mission, and spirit together to develop the tourism potential of the area in the province of Riau.

c. There needs to be a strong political will from the local government in increasing the potential for halal tourism in Riau province.

Future research that will come is expected to examine the question of halal tourism development in other countries and other provinces. Researchers would come to add another variable that has not been described in this study the influence in the development of halal tourism, such as budgeting, special economic zones, and phasing travel, halal certification by using different measurements that have not been described in this study. Also, it is hoped that it can be more in analyzing the indicators that form the elements in the variables of regulation, literacy, human resources (HR), and infrastructure.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

REFERENCES

Ab Talib, M.S., Hamid, A.B.A., & Zulfakar, M. H. (2015). Halal supply chain critical success factors: a literature review. *Journal of Islamic Marketing, 57*, 24-26. Retrieved from https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/JIMA-07-2013-0049/full/html

Al-Qordhawi. (1994). *Al-halal wa al-halal fi al-islam*. Beirut: Dar Al-Ilm Almalayin.

Anom. (2016). Infrastructure as important determinant of tourism development in the countries of Southeast Europe. *Ecoforum Journal, 5*(1). Retrieved from http://www.ecoforumjournal.ro/index.php/eco/article/view/329

Ascarya. (2010). ANP: Pendekatan baru studi kualitatif. In Jakarta: Seminar Internasional Program Magister Akuntansi Fakultas Ekonomi dan Bisnis Universitas Trisakti.

Battour, M. (2018). Muslim travel behavior in halal tourism. *Mobilities, Tourism And Travel Behavior-Contexts and Boundaries, 3-16.*

Baalbaki, Rohi. (1995). *Almawardi a modern arab english dictionary*. Beirut: Dar Al-Ilm Almalayin.
Bawazir, Tahir. (2013). Panduan praktis wisata syaria’ah. Jakarta: Pustaka Al-Kautsar
Chookaw, Sureerat, et al. (2014). Increasing halal tourism potential at andaman gulf in Thailand for muslim country. *Journal of Economics, Business and Management, 3*(7), 739-741.
Devi, A., & Firmansyah. (2019). Developing halal travel and halal tourism to promote economic growth: a confirmatory analysis. *Journal of Islamic Monetary Economics and Finance, 5*(1), 193-214.
Djakfar, M. (2017). Guarding sharia economy in Indonesia optimization of contemporary ulama authority and local wisdom. *el-Harakah, 19*(2), 209-226. Retrieved from http://repository.unimalang.ac.id/3344/
Fatwa Dewan Syari’ah Nasional Nomor: 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 Tentang Pedoman Penyelenggaraan Pariwisata Berdasarkan Prinsip Syariah
Hamzana, A. A. (2018). Pelaksanaan standarisasi pelayanan pariwisata halal dalam pengembangan pariwisata di Nusa Tenggara Barat. *Pena Justisia: Media Komunikasi dan Kajian Hukum, 17*(2).
Irma, Ade & Fitri, Y. (2020). The development of Islamic economics based on halal tourism in Indonesia. *Proceeding International Seminar on Islamic Studies, Vol. 1, No. 1, (pp. 956-966).
Indonesia, P. (2019). Wisata Indonesia di mata dunia. Retrieved from https://www.indonesia.go.id/ragam/pariwisata/pariwisata/wisataindonesia-di-mata-dunia
Jaelani, A. (2017). Halal tourism industry in Indonesia: potential and prospects. Munich: Personal Repec.
Joyosuharto, S. (1995). Aspek ketersediaan dan tuntutan kebutuhan dalam pariwisata dalam dasar-dasar manajemen pariwisata adalah. Yogyakarta: Liberty.
Kementerian Pariwisata. (2019). Panduan penyelenggaraan pariwisata halal. Jakarta: Deputi Bidang Pengembangan Industri dan Kelembagaan Kementerian Pariwisata.
Kurniarsah, R., & Wirawan, I. G. N. P. D. (2019). Potensi daya tarik wisata kabupaten dompu Provinsi Nusa Tenggara Barat. *Media Bina Ilmiah, 13*(10), 1639-1648.
Martins, Z., Syamsul, A. P., & Ida, B. K. S. (2017). Peran pemerintah dalam pengembangan potensi pariwisata di area Branca Metiaut, Dili. *Jurnal Master Pariwisata (JUMPA). Retrieved from https://docs.unud.ac.id/index.php/jumpa/article/view/28466
Mudana, I Wayana. (2017). Pola pemberdayaan masyarakat pada daerah tujuan wisata bahari di Kabupaten Karangasem. *Soshum : Jurnal Sosial Dan Humaniora, 7*(3), 307-323.
Pratiwi, S. R., Susanne, D., & Nuryah, A.S. (2018). Strategi komunikasi dalam membangun awareness wisata halal di Kota Bandung. *Jurnal Kajian Komunikasi, 6*(1), 78-90. Retrieved from http://jurnal.unpad.ac.id/jkk/article/view/12985
Riau, BPS Provinsi. (2018). Profil kemiskinan di Provinsi Riau. *Berita Resmi Statistik.
Rusmahafi. (2015). Upaya peningkatan market share perbankan syariah melalui pariwisata syariah dalam menyambut masyarakat ekonomi ASEAN. Jakarta: UIN Jakarta.
Rosmiati, T. H., & Rohmad, W. (2018). Strategi pemerintah daerah dalam meningkatkan pendapatan asli daerah (PAD) melalui pengembangan potensi pariwisata Kabupaten Manggarai Barat. *Jurnal Civic Hukum, 3*(1), 75-91. Retrieved from http://202.52.52.22/index.php/jurnalcivichukum/article/view/7730
Saaty, T. L. (2004). Decisions making-the analytic hierarchy and network processes (AHP/ANP). *Journal of Systems Science and Systems Engineering, 13*(1), 1-35.
Saaty, T. L., & Luis G. V. (2006). Decision making with the analytic network process: economic, political, social and technological applications with benefits,opportunities, costs and risks. (1st ed.). New York: Springer.
Spillane, J. J. (1994). Ekonomi pariwisata: sejarah pariwisata dan prospeknya. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
Triyawan, A. (2018). Analysis of halal tourism development strategy in East Java Province. *Journal of Islamic Economics Lariba, 4*(1), 27-35.
Yusuff, N., Mansor, F., & Hamed, A. B. (2017). The measurement of Islamic unit trust investment decision in malaysia: an exploratory factor analysis. *International Journal of Islamic Business (IJB), 2*(1), 38-45.
Wahidati, L., & Sarinastiti, E. N. (2018). Perkembangan wisata halal di Jepang. *Jurnal Gama Societa, 1*(1), 9-19.
Zalikha. (2015). Peluang dan tantangan pelaksanaan wisata di Kota Sabang. *Jurnal Al Bayan, 22*(31).
Zainuddin, Z., & Nordin, N. (2016). Addressing governance issue in Islamic real estate investment (I-REITs): a case study for OIC country Malaysia. *International Journal of Islamic Business (IJIB)*, 1(1), 60-75.