Antifungal activity of plant essential oils and selected *Pseudomonas* strains against *Phomopsis theicola*

Mira Starović¹, Danijela Ristić⁴, Goran Aleksić⁴, Snežana Pavlović², Mehmet Musa Özcan³, Magdalena Knezević⁴ and Dragana Josić⁴

¹Institute for Plant Protection and Environment, Teodora Drajzera 9, 11040 Belgrade, Serbia
²Institute for Medicinal Plant Research “Dr Josif Pančić”, Tadeuša Košćuška 1, 11000 Belgrade, Serbia
³Department of Food Engineering, Faculty of Agriculture, Selçuk University, 42079 Konya, Turkey
⁴Institute of Soil Science, Teodora Drajzera 7, 11040 Belgrade, Serbia

*Corresponding author: algozan@sezampro.rs

Received: 1 April, 2017
Accepted: 23 May, 2017

SUMMARY

Development of natural plant protection products as an alternative to synthetic fungicides is of significant importance regarding the environment. This study was carried out with an objective to investigate *in vitro* antifungal activities of several essential oils extracted from oregano, basil, myrtle and Turkish pickling herb, and the plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria in the genus *Pseudomonas*, against the phytopathogenic fungus *Phomopsis theicola*. Microdilution methods were used to determine the minimum inhibitory concentrations (MIC) of selected antimicrobial essential oils (EOs). All EOs exhibited significant levels of antifungal activity against the tested fungal isolates. The oregano EO was found the most potent one (MIC – 5.5 μg/mL), followed by basil (MIC – 75.0 μg/mL), myrtle (MIC – 77.5 μg/mL) and Turkish pickling herb (MIC – 775 μg/mL). Inhibition of *Ph. theicola* mycelial growth was observed for all tested *Pseudomonas* spp. strains. K113 and L1 strains were highly effective and achieved more than 60% of fungal growth inhibition using the overnight culture and more than 57% inhibition by applying cell-free supernatants of both strains. A future field trial with K113 and L1 cultures and cell-free supernatants, containing extracellular metabolites toward *Ph. theicola*, will estimate their effectiveness and applicability as an alternative to chemical protection of apple trees.

**Keywords:** Essential oils; *Pseudomonas* spp; PGPR; *Phomopsis theicola*; Antifungal activity
INTRODUCTION

The genus *Phomopsis* (Sacc.) Bubák has a wide geographical distribution in the world, with over 800 species that occur as endophytes, saprotrophs and parasites in a very diverse range of host plants, including woody and herbaceous hosts. Pathogenic *Phomopsis* spp. can cause considerable economic losses in different crops and they are often associated with shoot blights, leaf spots, fruit rots, stem cankers, and dieback (Udayanga et al., 2011). Species of *Phomopsis* and their *Diaporthe* sexual states are very dangerous pathogens of young apple trees. *Phomopsis* spp. produce cankers and dieback shoot blight on apple trees, and it may take years before damage to internal wood is severe enough to kill a fruit tree. Stem canker and dieback are important factors that limit the longevity of apple trees and reduce their yield in Serbia. *Phomopsis* spp. have been described as a cause of dieback and canker in apple fruit growing regions of South Africa (Van Niekerk et al., 2004; Cloete et al., 2011).

*Diaporthe* canker is controlled by sanitation along with chemical treatment. Sprays of thiophanate-methyl, applied three times after petal fall (10, 20 and 30 days), are recommended to control the diseases on European pear in Japan. Apple cultivars vary in their susceptibility to *Diaporthe* canker. ‘Jonagold’ and ‘Jonatan’ are more susceptible than ‘Tsugaru’, ‘Starking Delicious’ and ‘Indo’ (Sutton et al., 2014).

Over the years, chemical pesticides have made a great contribution to efforts to control plant diseases. However, intensive applications of pesticides have resulted in a development of fungal resistance and extensive damage to the environment. Therefore, an eco-friendly alternative is required to preserve the quality and generate quantity of agricultural products.

Essential oils (EOs) of plant origin are one of the significant products of agriculture-based industry. They have a wide application in folk remedies but in recent years their potential antimicrobial activity has been increasingly recognized. Numerous studies have documented the antifungal properties of plant products (Carmo et al., 2008; Tavassoli et al., 2011). A few of them have confirmed their antifungal properties against fungal pathogens of fruit.

Plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria (PGPR) colonize plant roots and promote growth of diverse plant species. The PGPR include diverse genera but *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* are predominant (Podile & Kishore, 2006). Pathogen control capacity has been attributed to several substances produced by antagonistic rhizobacteria. The bacteria perform antagonistic activity toward pathogens using several mechanisms: synthesis of hydrolytic enzymes that can lyse pathogenic fungal cells; competition for nutrients; colonization of niches at the root surface or production of siderophores and antibiotics (Kamilova et al., 2005; Neeraja et al., 2010; Maksimov et al., 2011). Antibiotics that have diverse mechanisms of action, including the inhibition of synthesis of pathogen cell walls and interference with membrane structures of cells have been produced by antagonistic bacterial strains (Maksimov et al., 2011). Several indigenous *Pseudomonas* spp. from the rhizosphere of different plants have been confirmed as PGPRs in Serbia (Jošić et al., 2012; Pivić et al., 2015; Jošić et al., 2015).

The aim of this study was to investigate the possibility of biological control of the phytopathogenic fungus *Ph. theicola* using several essential oils and indigenous *Pseudomonas* spp. strains.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

**Antifungal activity of EOs**

The phytopathogenic fungus *Ph. theicola* was isolated from sunken canker tissue of apple trees cv. ‘Golden Delicious’ (Figure 1) in the locality Trstenik, Serbia (43° 37’ N, 21° 00’ E, and 164 m above the sea level). Essential oils (EOs) extracted by hydro-distillation from several medicinal plants: Turkish pickling herb (*Echinophora tenuifolia*), oregano (*Origanum vulgare*), basil (*Ocimum basilicum*) and myrtle (*Myrtus communis*) (Table 1), were used in antagonistic assays with a *Ph. theicola* isolate from the collection of the Institute for Plant Protection and Environment, Belgrade, Serbia (Figure 2).

| No | Essential oil            | Plant origin     | Origin   |
|----|--------------------------|------------------|----------|
| 1  | Turkish pickling herb    | *Echinophora tenuifolia* | Turkey   |
| 2  | Oregano                  | *Origanum vulgare* | Turkey   |
| 3  | Basil                    | *Ocimum basilicum* | Turkey   |
| 4  | Myrtle                   | *Myrtus communis*  | Turkey   |

Fungal spores were washed from the surface of potato dextrose agar (PDA) plates with sterile 0.85% saline containing 0.1% Tween 80 (v/v). The spore suspension was adjusted to a concentration of approximately $5.0 \times 10^4$ in a final volume of 100 μl per well.
Minimum inhibitory concentrations (MIC) were determined by microdilution method in 96 well microtiter plates (Daouk et al., 1995). Microtiter plates were incubated for 5 days at 28°C. The experiment was repeated four times. Fluconazole was used as a positive control. The lowest concentrations without visible growth were defined as the minimal concentrations which inhibited fungal growth (Figure 3).

Separation of minimal inhibitory concentration (MIC) means was carried out by Duncan’s multiple range tests. An analysis of variance was performed on MIC data for four EOs applied to Ph. theicola. Significance was evaluated at p<0.05. STATISTICA v.7 (StatSoft, Inc.) was used for statistical analyses.

**Antifungal activity of Pseudomonas spp.**

The assay for antagonism *in vitro* was performed on Waksman agar medium by dual culture method (Wolf et al., 2002). Overnight cultures (ONC) of bacteria were optimized to $10^7$ CFU mL$^{-1}$ and used for preparation of 3 fractions: cell-free supernatant (CFS), CFS treated with EDTA (ethylenediaminetetraacetic
acid disodium salt dehydrate) (CFS-EDTA) and heat-treated cell-free supernatant (HS-CFS). ONCs were centrifuged twice at 13000 rpm for 5 min., without and with filtration (filter tubes with microporous membrane 0.22 μm) (Merck Millipore Ltd.); one aliquot was treated with 1mM EDTA, while another aliquot was heated at 70°C for 30 min. Fungal mycelium was placed as a 6 mm plug in the center of each Petri dish, while bacteria (10 μL) were placed on its edges. Control variants contained only mycelia of Ph. theicola and the fungus with 1mM EDTA added instead of bacterial culture/fraction. The cultures were incubated at 25°C for 9 days. Morphological changes of Ph. theicola were observed in dual culture. The percentage inhibition (PI) of Ph. theicola growth was calculated using the following formula: PI=100 × (1-R2/R1), where R1 was the radial distance growth of the fungus in the control plate, and R2 was the radial distance growth of the fungus in bacterial treatment. All fungal inhibition assays were performed in four replicates and repeated three times.

RESULTS

Antifungal activity of EO

The results of the antimicrobial activity tests using microdilution method are summarized in Table 2. The EOs showed a wide range of antifungal activity against Ph. theicola. The oregano EO proved to be the most potent one (MIC – 5.5±0.5 μg/mL), then basil (MIC – 75±5.7 μg/mL), myrtle (MIC – 775±45.0 μg/mL) and Turkish pickling herb (MIC – 7750±4.5 μg/mL).

Among all oils tested, oregano proved to be the best inhibitor of the apple pathogen Ph. theicola, followed by basil EO.

Table 2. Antifungal activity of essential oils expressed as minimal inhibitory concentrations (μg/mL) to Ph. theicola

| Essential oils                      | MIC (μg/mL) |
|------------------------------------|-------------|
| Echinophora tenuifolia             | 7750.0 ± 4.5 a |
| Origanum vulgare                   | 5.5 ± 0.5 c  |
| Ocimum basilicum                   | 75.0 ± 5.7 bc |
| Myrtus communis                    | 775.0 ± 45.0 b |

Duncan’s multiple range tests (p<0.05)

Antifungal activity of Pseudomonas spp.

All tested Pseudomonas spp. strains showed inhibition of Ph. theicola growth (Table 3). Morphological abnormalities of Ph. theicola, such as mycelial deviations, were observed in a dual culture using different fractions of Pseudomonas spp. strains. All treatments of E65 strain, as well as the CFS-EDTA and HS-CFS of M1 and K113 caused mycelial deformation and color change from dark brown to dark green. The same effects were observed in the HS-CFS of L1 and CFS-EDTA of B25 strains.

Differences in the effectiveness of Pseudomonas spp. strains on Ph. theicola growth inhibition are shown in Figure 4. The percentage of growth inhibition ranged from 13.5 (HS-CFS of E65) to 62.5% (ONC of K113). The highest inhibition was observed in all three fractions of K113 strain, while the CFS-EDTA fraction of L1 strain was the more effective inhibitor than the same fraction of K113 strain.

Table 3. Ph. theicola growth (mm) affected by Pseudomonas spp. strains

| Ph. theicola  | Bacterial culture fraction | Pseudomonas spp. strain |
|---------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|
|               |                            | L1 | M1 | B25 | E65 | K113 |
| Control       | ONC a)                     | 19.5 ± 1.9* | 24.5 ± 1.3 | 27.5 ± 1.3 | 24.5 ± 1.7 | 18.8 ± 1.3 |
| 50 ± 0        | CFS b)                     | 21.2 ± 1.5 | 30.2 ± 0.5 | 28.2 ± 1.9 | 27.0 ± 0.8 | 20.5 ± 1.3 |
| Control-EDTA  | CFS-EDTA c)                | 30.2 ± 0.9 | 34.5 ± 1.3 | 35.0 ± 0.8 | 34.2 ± 1.5 | 32.8 ± 0.9 |
| 50 ± 0        | HS-CFS d)                  | 38.0 ± 1.1 | 38.5 ± 3.1 | 38.8 ± 1.3 | 43.2 ± 1.3 | 35.2 ± 0.9 |

*Values are means of three experiments, each with four replicates ± S.E
a) overnight cultures of bacteria
b) cell-free supernatant
c) CFS treated with EDTA
d) heat-treated cell-free supernatant
DISCUSSION

The results obtained in vitro could be useful from the practical point of view. Turkish pickling herb, oregano, basil and myrtle essential oils used in this study can be used in future field trial evaluation of the efficacy of control of \textit{Ph. theicola}.

The results of this study may serve as a guide for selecting essential oils and their concentrations in further in vivo trials aimed at fungicide development. The data obtained in the present work suggest that the selected essential oils originating from Turkey can be applied as inhibitors to prevent growth of phytopathogenic fungi. In accordance with numerous previous reports, oregano and basil oils originating from Serbia had been found to inhibit the growth of \textit{Phomopsis} species at concentrations of 70 \(\mu\)g/mL and 5950.00 \(\mu\)g/mL, respectively (Stević et al., 2014). Myrtle oil demonstrated bioactive properties, especially antifungal activity to \textit{Fusarium} sp., \textit{Drechslera} sp. and \textit{Macrophomina phaseolina} (Starović et al., 2016). Oregano oil was found to control \textit{Botrytis cinerea} and \textit{Monilinia laxa} growth on stone fruit and \textit{Phomopsis} sp. (Lopez-Reyes et al., 2013), while basil oil controlled \textit{Phomopsis} sp., \textit{Fusarium} spp., and \textit{Phoma} sp. (Stević et al., 2014) using concentrations of 750\(\mu\)g/mL and 5.1-7.65 mg/mL, respectively.

Morphological deformation of the phytopathogenic fungus \textit{Ph. theicola} was a significant feature of the activity of \textit{Pseudomonas} spp. strains tested in this study. \textit{Bacillus subtilis} that produces diffusible and volatile compounds had been reported earlier to induce structural deformations in phytopathogenic fungi (Chaurasia et al., 2005). Ethyl acetate extracts of \textit{P. aeruginosa} and \textit{B. subtilis} culture filtrates caused similar effects on the germination and morphology of \textit{Ph. azadirachtae} conidia (Girish et al., 2009).

In this study, the width of inhibition zones ranged from about 7 to 30 mm, which is similar to the results of Zalewska et al. (2004), who reported 8.6-23.5 mm inhibition zones of \textit{Ph. viticola} caused by different \textit{Pseudomonas} spp. A \textit{P. putida} strain caused inhibition of \textit{Ph. viticola} mycelial growth of 6-12 mm (Haggag et al., 2013), which is lower than the results for \textit{Ph. theicola} inhibition by \textit{Pseudomonas} spp. in this present study. The highest inhibition effect on \textit{Ph. theicola} growth was shown by K113, followed by L1 strain, exceeding 60% and 57% for ONC and CFS, while the lowest inhibition values were observed for the ONC of B25 strain (45%) and CFS of M1 (39.5%). PI value decreased with EDTA treatment of CFS (30-39.5%), as well as with heat treatment of CFS (13.5-29.5%), suggesting that all tested strains produced thermo-sensitive extracellular metabolites. These results are consistent with the report by Girish et al. (2009), where ethyl acetate extract of \textit{P. oleovorans} caused 42% of growth inhibition of \textit{Ph. azadirachtae}. The same authors reported that \textit{Ph. azadirachtae} inhibition by the same extract of \textit{P. aeruginosa} reached the maximal PI value.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure4.png}
\caption{Inhibition of \textit{Ph. theicola} growth achieved by \textit{Pseudomonas} spp. strains}
\end{figure}

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline
Strain & ONC & CFS & CFS-EDTA & HS-CFS & PI Value \\
\hline
L1 & 70 & 65 & 50 & 40 & 70 & 35 & 30 & 25 & 20 & 15 & 10 & 0 \\
M1 & 60 & 50 & 40 & 30 & 60 & 30 & 20 & 10 & 0 \\
B25 & 50 & 40 & 30 & 20 & 50 & 20 & 10 & 0 \\
E65 & 40 & 30 & 20 & 10 & 40 & 10 & 0 \\
K113 & 30 & 20 & 10 & 0 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\caption{Fungal growth inhibition (%)}
\end{table}
Biological control activity of *Pseudomonas* spp. and *Bacillus* sp. against several *Phomopsis* species have been reported. Srinivas et al. (2005) reported higher effectiveness of *P. fluorescens* than *T. harzianum* and fungicide treatments in reducing *Ph. vexans* infection and increasing brinjal seed germination, vigor index and field emergence. Combinations of two systemic fungicides and *P. aeruginosa* culture filtrate were effective in *in vitro* growth inhibition of *Ph. azadirachtae* and had no significant negative effect on neem seed germination (Girish et al., 2012). Patkowska and Blażewicz-Woźniak (2013) applied post-culture liquids of antagonistic bacteria *Pseudomonas* sp. P. 255 and *Bacillus* sp. B 73 to the surface of soybean seeds and limited plant infection with *Ph. sojae* and other fungi previously isolated from seeds. *P. putida*, the producer of fluorescent siderophore pseudobactin, was very effective as a biocontrol agent in reducing the dieback and *phomopsis* diseases of grapevine (Haggag et al., 2013). To the best of our knowledge, this is the first report on growth inhibition of *Ph. theicola* and biological control of this pathogen by indigenous *Pseudomonas* spp. in Serbia.

*Pseudomonas* spp. strains K113 and L1 were moderately effective in inhibiting *Ph. theicola* mycelial growth, showing more than 60% and 57% inhibition when ONC and CFS were used, respectively. Further assessments of *in vivo* effectiveness of K113 and L1 cultures in protecting apple from *Ph. theicola* will be useful for estimation of their applicability as an alternative to chemical protection.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENT**

This research was supported by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technological Development of the Republic of Serbia, project grants TR 31018 and III46007.

**REFERENCES**

Carmo, E.S., Lima, E.O., & Souza, E.L. (2008). The potential of *Origanum vulgare* L. essential oil in inhibiting the growth of the growth of some food-related *Aspergillus* species. *Brazilian Journal of Microbiology*, 39(2), 362-367.

Chaurasia, B., Pandey, A., Palni, L.M.S., Trivedi, P., Kumar, B., & Colvin, N. (2005). Diffusible and volatile compounds produced by an antagonistic *Bacillus subtilis* strain cause structural deformations in pathogenic fungi *in vitro*. *Microbiological Research*, 160(1), 75–81.

Cloete, M., Fourie, P.H., Damm, U., Crous, P.W., & Mostert, L. (2011). Fungi associated with die-back symptoms of apple and pear trees, a possible inoculum source of grapevine trunk disease pathogens. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea*, 50(S), 176-190.

Daouk, R.K., Dagher, S.M., & Sattout, E.J. (1995). Antifungal activity of the essential oil of *Origanum syriacum* L. *Journal of Food Protection*, 58(10), 1147-1149.

Girish, K., Bhat, S., & Raveesha, K. (2009). *In vitro* evaluation of antagonistic microorganisms for the control of die back of neem causal agent *Phomopsis azadirachtae*. *Journal of Plant Protection Research*, 49(4), 362-368. doi https://doi.org/10.2478/v10045-009-0056-7

Girish K., Shankara, Bhat, S. K. A., & Raveesha, K. A. (2012). Synergistic effect of combinations of fungicides and bacterial extracts against *Phomopsis azadirachtae* causing die-back of neem. *African Journal of Microbiology Research*, 6(2), 385-392. doi 10.5897/AJMR11.1154

Haggag, W.M., Saleh, M.A.E., Mostafa, I., & Adel, N. (2013). Mass production, fermentation, formulation of *Pseudomonas putida* for controlling of die back and *phomopsis* diseases on grapevine. *Advances in Bioscience & Biotechnology*, 4(6), 741-750.

Jošić, D., Ćirić, A., Soković, M., Stanojković-Sebić, A., Pivić, R., Lepšanović, Z., & Glamočlija, J. (2015). Antifungal activities of indigenous plant growth promoting *Pseudomonas* spp. from alfalfa and clover rhizosphere. *Frontiers in Life Science*, 8(2), 131-138.

Jošić, D., Protolipac, K., Starović, M., Stojanović, S., Pavlović, S., Miladinović, M., & Radović, S. (2012). Phenazines producing *Pseudomonas* isolates decrease *Alternaria tenuissima* growth, pathogenicity and disease incidence on cardoon. *Archives of Biological Sciences*, 64(4), 1495-1503.

Kamilova, F., Validov, S., Azarova, T., Mulders, I., & Lugtenberg, B. (2005). Enrichment for enhanced competitive plant root tip colonizers selects for a new class of biocontrol bacteria. *Environmental Microbiology*, 7(11), 1809-1817.

Lopez-Reyes, J.G., Spadaro, D., Pelle, A., Garibaldi, A., & Gullino, M.L. (2013). Efficacy of plant essential oils on postharvest control of rots by fungi on different stone fruits *in vivo*. *Journal of Food Protection*, 76(4), 631-639.

Maksimov, I.V., Abizgil’ dina, R.R., & Pusenkova, L.I. (2011). Plant growth promoting rhizobacteria as alternative to chemical crop protectors from pathogens. *Applied Biochemistry & Microbiology*, 47(4), 333-345.

Neeraja, C., Anil, K., Purushotham, P., Suma, K., Sarma, P., & Moerschbacher, B.M. (2010). Biotechnological approaches to develop bacterial chitinases as a bioshield against fungal diseases of plants. *Critical Reviews in Biotechnology*, 30(3), 231–241.

Parkowska, E., & Blażewicz-Woźniak, M. (2013). May the post-culture liquids of bacteria influence on soybean [Glycine max (L.) Merrill] healthiness? *Acta Scientiarum Polonorum Hortorum Cultus* 12(3), 171-182.
Antifungalana aktivnost biljnih etarskih ulja i odabranih sojeva Pseudomonas spp. na Phomopsis theicola

REZIME

U novije vreme intezivno se radi na razvoju bioloških sredstava za zaštitu bilja, koja bi se uvodila kao zamena za sintetičke fungicide. U ovom radu ispitivan je in vitro antifungalni uticaj nekih etarskih ulja (EU) i odabranih rizobakterija koje stimulisu rast biljaka iz roda Pseudomonas na fitopatogenu gljivu Phomopsis theicola. Minimalne inhibitorne koncentracije (MIC) etarskih ulja su određene mikrodilucionalnom metodom. Sva primenjena EU su ispoljila značajni antifungalni efekat na ispitivani izolat gljive. EU origana je ispoljilo najnižu MIC od 5.5±0.51 μg/mL, zatim ulje bosiljka od 75.0±5.7 μg/mL, mirte 775±45.0 μg/mL i turske kisele biljke od 7750±4.5 μg/mL. Proučavan je stepen inhibicije porasta micelije Ph. theicola primenom različitih sojeva Pseudomonas spp. sojevi K1 13 i L1 su ispoljili visoku efikasnost inhibicije od preko 60% primenom dvadesetčetvoročasovnih kultura i preko 57% primenom filtrata supernatanta. U narednim ogledima u polju primenom kulture i supernatanta K1 13 i L1, koji sadrže ekstracelularne metabolite, proceniće se njihova efikasnost i mogućnost korišćenja kao alternative hemijskim sredstvima u zaštiti jabuke od Ph. theicola.

Ključne reči: Etarska ulja; Pseudomonas spp; PGPR; Phomopsis theicola; Antifungalna aktivnost