Recent Perspectives on the Mechanism of Recurrence After Ablation of Hepatocellular Carcinoma: A Mini-Review

Jianquan Yang1,2, Wen Guo3 and Man Lu1,2*

1 The School of Medicine, University of Electronic Science and Technology of China, Chengdu, China, 2 Department of Ultrasound Medical Center, Sichuan Cancer Hospital and Institute, Sichuan Cancer Center, School of Medicine, University of Electronic Science and Technology of China, Chengdu, China, 3 Institute of Materia Medica, North Sichuan Medical College, Nanchong, China

Hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) is one of the most common malignant tumors. Hepatectomy, liver transplantation, and ablation are the three radical treatments for early-stage hepatocellular carcinoma (ESHCC), but not all patients are fit for or can tolerate surgery; moreover, liver donors are limited. Therefore, ablation plays an important role in the treatment of ESHCC. However, some studies have shown that ablation has a higher local recurrence (LR) rate than hepatectomy and liver transplantation. The specific mechanism is unknown. The latest perspectives on the mechanism of recurrence after ablation of HCC were described and summarized. In this review, we discussed the possible mechanisms of recurrence after ablation of HCC, including epithelial–mesenchymal transition (EMT), activating autophagy, changes in non-coding RNA, and changes in the tumor microenvironment. A systematic and comprehensive understanding of the mechanism will contribute to the research and development of related treatment, combined with ablation to improve the therapeutic effect in patients with ESHCC.

Keywords: hepatocellular carcinoma, early stage, ablation, recurrence, mechanism

1 INTRODUCTION

HCC is a common malignant tumor in China, with the fourth-highest morbidity and the second-highest mortality rate (1, 2); thus, early diagnosis and treatment are important to improve survival, especially for patients with early-stage hepatocellular carcinoma (ESHCC). The main treatments for ESHCC are liver transplantation, hepatectomy, and ablation. Liver transplantation is one of the radical treatments, but there are some limitations such as the limited liver donors and postoperative...

Abbreviations: HCC, hepatocellular carcinoma; OS, overall survival; LR, local recurrence; RFA, radiofrequency ablation; HSE, heat-sink effect; MWA, microwave ablation; CA, cryoablation; IBAZ, ice ball ablation zone; IRE, irreversible electroporation; EMT, epithelial–mesenchymal transition; SHS, sublethal heat stress; MVD, microvessel density; CQ, chloroquine; IRFA, insufficient RFA; HCQ, hydroxychloroquine; lncRNA, long non-coding RNA; HSCs, hepatic stellate cells; POSTN, peristin; HSC-CM, hepatic stellate cell conditioned medium.
immune rejection (3). Child-Pugh A grade is required for liver function in HCC patients receiving hepatectomy. Most ESHCC patients have a history of hepatitis B or liver cirrhosis, and the liver reserve is poor, these patients are at high risk for hepatectomy (4). Ablation, as one of the three radical treatments for ESHCC, has the advantage of being minimally invasive and having limited impact on liver function; thus, inoperable ESHCC patients may choose radical treatment with ablation (5–7). Moreover, there was no difference in overall survival (OS) time between ablation and hepatectomy in ESHCC patients (8). However, some studies have shown that ablation has a higher local recurrence (LR) rate than hepatectomy (9, 10). The mechanism is still unclear. In recent years, many studies have explored the possible mechanism behind the higher LR rate in ESHCC after ablation. In this paper, recent perspectives were reviewed.

## 2 COMMONLY USED LOCAL ABLATION TREATMENT

### 2.1 Thermal Ablation

#### 2.1.1 Radiofrequency Ablation

Radiofrequency ablation (RFA) uses radiofrequency alternating current to generate heat between the percutaneous probe and the surrounding tissues, resulting in an increase in temperature between 60°C and 100°C, which is maintained for several minutes, leading to complete coagulative necrosis in the tumor and surrounding tissues (11, 12). RFA has become the main local ablation method for the treatment of ESHCC due to its advantages (it is safer, has less trauma, is less painful, has better tolerance, has fewer adverse reactions, and has quicker recovery) (13). However, the scope of coagulation necrosis caused by RFA is limited; the complete ablation rate of ESHCC with a diameter of more than 3 cm is significantly decreased; and the rate of LR is higher than surgical resection (14). Some studies have reported that RFA combined with transcatheter arterial chemoembolization (TACE) or other treatments could increase the ablation scope and therapeutic efficacy (15). In addition, several studies have reported that RFA combined with chemotherapy drugs or targeted drugs such as sorafenib can improve the therapeutic effect in HCC and prolong the survival time of patients (16). However, the thermal deposition effect [heat-sink effect (HSE); that is, the temperature of the ablation zone is decreased when tumors are located near blood vessels or bronchiae] reduces the efficacy of RFA. Therefore, when the tumor is near blood vessels or bronchiae (17, 18), the complete ablation rate of RFA will decrease (19). At the same time, RFA may cause skin cauterization, which is one of the major side effects of RFA (20).

#### 2.1.2 Microwave Ablation

Microwave ablation (MWA), another type of thermal ablation, aims to generate an electromagnetic field of 900–2,500 MHz through an antenna placed in the tumor. The electromagnetic field continuously realigns the polar molecules with inherent dipoles in the tissue with the oscillating electric field, and the rotation of the molecules increases their kinetic energy, thus increasing the temperature in the tissues (21, 22). As early as 2001, MWA has been used in the treatment of ESHCC, and several studies have confirmed that MWA has long-term efficacy and could effectively reduce adverse reactions (23, 24). With the continuous progress of MWA technology, MWA has been used from the initial treatment of small HCC to the combination with TACE in the treatment of large HCC and HCC in special areas, such as tumors near the gallbladder, gastrointestinal tract, large vessels, and hilum (24–27). MWA is an important treatment for ESHCC. Liang et al. have led many innovative studies on the treatment of ESHCC with MWA (28, 29) and have formulated the first guidelines on treating ESHCC via MWA (30), laying a theoretical foundation for clinicians to standardize the operation. Compared with RFA, MWA has a lower HSE rate (31, 32) and may result in fewer instances of skin burn (33). Most importantly, MWA has a larger ablation scope than RFA (34, 35), and research has shown that for HCCs that are 5–7 cm in diameter, the complete ablation rate of MWA is 80%, while that of RFA is only 24% (36).

### 2.2 Other Ablation Treatments

#### 2.2.1 Cryoablation

The goal of cryoablation (CA) is to form ice in the cells and maintain the temperature for a few minutes/cycles, eventually leading to cell death, with a lethal temperature range of −40 °C to −20 °C (37). Compared with RFA and MWA, CA has a lower incidence of pain (38). Due to the different theory of CA, an ice hockey ablation area (IBAZ) can be formed during ablation, which enables CA to monitor the scope and size of the ablation area in real time through imaging devices such as computed tomography (CT), magnetic resonance imaging (MRI), or ultrasound (39–41). However, about 1% of CA may induce hypothermic shock, some of which are fatal (42). In addition, the long-term efficacy of CA in HCC needs more follow-up data (43).

#### 2.2.2 Irreversible Electroporation

Irreversible electroporation (IRE) destroys the tissues and cell membranes by generating a non-thermal electric field on the ablation probe, thus changing the ion-driven homeostasis, resulting in cell death (44). The greatest advantage of IRE is that it can protect the bile ducts and blood vessels around the ablation area from ablation damage (45). Because IRE has a broad transition zone between surviving tissue and necrotic tissue, it may induce LR (46). Meanwhile, as a new form of ablation, the data on IRE’s applicability to other types of diseases and long-term efficacy are limited; thus, it needs more research to verify its therapeutic effect (47, 48).

Although there are many methods of local ablation, RFA and MWA, two forms of thermal ablation, are mainly used for ESHCC in the clinical setting. Next, we will discuss and summarize the mechanism of HCC recurrence caused by thermal ablation.
3 THE MECHANISM OF RECURRENT AFTER ABLATION OF HCC

3.1 EMT

Epithelial–mesenchymal transition (EMT) refers to the transformation of epithelial cells to mesenchymal cells, the molecules of which are remodelled, and phenotypic changes, including malignant tumor progression, enhance the ability of invasion and metastasis in epithelial-derived tumor cells (49). Molecular marker changes in EMT include losing the expression of epithelial markers such as E-cadherin, upregulation of mesenchymal cell markers such as N-cadherin and Vimentin, and the increasing transcriptional regulatory factors such as Snail, Slug, and Twist (50). To investigate whether EMT occurs in recurrence after ablation in HCC, Yoshida et al. simulated thermal ablation in vitro by sublethal heat stress (SHS); that is, hepatoma cells were placed in a water bath at 45°C and 55°C for 10 min, the morphology of the surviving tumor cells was spindle-like on the 5th day, and the expression of CD133, CK7, CK19, and Snail proteins increased, but returned to the baseline level on the 12th day (51). It showed that the surviving hepatoma cells after SHS are capable of EMT, and further research showed that SHS activated the Erk1/2 signal pathway; inhibiting the Erk1/2 pathway could inhibit the proliferation of hepatoma cells. Dong et al. found that SHS-treated hepatoma cells increased the expression of PCNA, N-cadherin, MMP-2, and MMP-9 through activating the Akt/ERK pathway. Furthermore, an animal experiment showed that the risk of lung metastasis was increased with insufficient ablation (52). One research, through an analysis of specimens from recurrent HCC in patients who have undergone ablation, showed that EMT-related markers TGF-β, Twist, and Snail-1 increased compared with patients without ablation. In order to further confirm the role of EMT in recurrence after thermal ablation of HCC, some researchers constructed an in situ incomplete HCC ablation in a xenograft mouse model and found that E-cadherin was downregulated while N-cadherin and β-catenin were upregulated, and that blocking β-catenin, a key protein of EMT, could reduce the EMT phenotype and metastasis in hepatoma cells (53). As a key protein of EMT, flotillin can activate the Akt/Wnt/β-catenin signal pathway to induce EMT and then enhance the ability of proliferation and invasion in residual hepatoma cells after SHS (54). As a key step to obtaining stronger invasion and metastasis, EMT has been confirmed in hepatoma cells, animal models, and samples from HCC patients, and some studies find some key proteins and important signal pathways leading to EMT (Table 1), which provide the direction for basic research and clinical treatment in the future.

3.2 Promoting Angiogenesis Through the HIF-1α/VEGF Signal Pathway

As an important regulator of hypoxic adaptive response, HIF-1α is highly expressed in hypoxic conditions but is maintained at a low concentration under normoxic conditions (55, 56). HIF-1α is usually more obvious in invasive tumors (56) and can be used as an independent predictor for poor prognosis in HCC (57). HIF-1α plays an important role in promoting proliferation, invasion, angiogenesis, and metastasis in tumors (58). Angiogenesis plays a key role in tumor formation and metastasis (59, 60). HIF-1α directly induces a large number of angiogenesis-related genes, such as the VEGF family. The VEGF family, including VEGFA, VEGFB, VEGFC, and VEGFD, are the strongest angiogenic factors expressed in a variety of tumors (61). Studies have shown that VEGF is highly expressed in HCC (62). The expression of VEGF in HCC tissues or serum implies the vascular invasion and metastasis of HCC, which leads to an increase in the recurrence of HCC after treatment and a decrease in the median survival time of patients (63–66). VEGF is the main regulatory factor of angiogenesis. Previous research has shown that VEGF is highly expressed in tumors, and anti-angiogenesis therapy with VEGF inhibitors can inhibit tumor growth (67). Since bevacizumab (Avastin) has been approved in 2004, Avastin has been shown to be effective against a variety of solid tumors, including HCC (68). After the breakthrough of immunotherapy in some solid tumors, studies have shown that immunotherapy plus anti-angiogenesis can further improve efficacy in HCC patients, and has become the first-line treatment for advanced HCC (69). Sorafenib, another anti-angiogenic drug, is used for advanced HCC, which could prolong survival time in patients with advanced HCC (70). A series of retrospective studies have shown that RFA combined with sorafenib can reduce the postoperative LR rate and improve the survival time of patients with HCC (71, 72). However, a randomized, placebo-controlled, double-blind Phase 3 trial showed that there was no significant difference in relapse-free survival time between sorafenib with RFA and RFA with placebo (73). Compared with parent cells, hepatoma cells treated with SHS increase the expression of HIF-1α and VEGF, and enhance angiogenesis, which can be eliminated by Avastin (74). Liu et al. found that hepatoma cells treated with SHS promoted proliferation by the overexpression of CaMKII/ERK-dependent VEGF. Similarly, in the ectopic liver cancer model, it also showed that HIF-1α, VEGF, and microvessel density (MVD) increased after insufficient ablation (75). Animal models confirm that incomplete ablation promotes angiogenesis through the HIF-1α/VEGF signal pathway leading to tumor invasion and metastasis (76). Tan et al. found that incomplete ablation led to the high expression of VEGFR1 and enhanced angiogenesis, and that targeting VEGFR1

| Researchers          | Experimental Methods   | Research Results                                                                 | Ref.   |
|----------------------|------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------|
| Yoshida et al.       | In vitro               | The expression of CD133, CK7, CK19, and Snail proteins increased.                | (51)   |
| Dong et al.          | In vitro               | The expression of PCNA, N-cadherin, MMP-2, and MMP-9 increased.                  | (52)   |
| Zheng et al.         | In vivo and patient’s surgical sample | EMT-related markers TGF-β, Twist, and Snail-1 increased.                        | (53)   |
| Zhang et al.         | In vitro               | Fettillins activated Akt/Wnt/β-catenin pathway to induce EMT.                    | (54)   |
could reduce the ability of proliferation and migration in hepatoma cells (77). Analysis of the samples of patients with recurrent HCC after ablation showed that the level of HIF-1α was higher than without RFA. Survival analysis showed that OS was shorter in patients with recurrence after RFA (78). A series of studies have revealed that promoting angiogenesis enrolls in the recurrence of HCC after ablation by activating the HIF-1α/VEGF signal pathway (Table 2). Anti-angiogenesis through targeted HIF-1α/VEGF pathway may be one of the ways to treat recurrence of HCC after ablation, but its clinical use needs more basic researches and clinical trials.

### 3.3 Activating Autophagy

Autophagy is a self-protective mechanism in cells, which can degrade cytoplasmic substances such as damaged organelles and proteins (79, 80). Recently, there is considerable evidence showing that autophagy plays a key role in many human diseases, including tumors. Inhibiting autophagy can prevent tumor progression (81). The level of LC3-II (a key autophagy marker) is positively correlated with poor prognosis in HCC (82). Chang et al. found that inhibition of autophagy reduced the survival of hepatoma cells (83). In addition, autophagy can help hepatoma cells survive under adverse conditions and promote invasion and migration (84). Peng et al. confirmed that autophagy induced by hypoxia led to resistance to chemotherapeutic drugs in hepatoma cells (85). Thompson et al. found that SHS-treated hepatoma cells activated the PI3K/mTOR/AKT pathway, an important signal pathway of autophagy, resulting in enhanced proliferation and invasion (86). Jondal et al. also showed that the ability of invasion was enhanced in hepatoma cells by SHS by activating the PI3K/mTOR/AKT pathway, and inhibition of the PI3K/mTOR pathway was an effective approach against invasion (87). Zhao et al. confirmed the role of autophagy in an ectopic animal model for the first time by incomplete ablation [insufficient RFA (IRFA)], which promoted proliferation and invasion in residual hepatoma cells. The autophagy inhibitor hydroxychloroquine (HCQ) can also significantly inhibit the growth of hepatoma cells (89). Autophagy is an important mechanism in the tumorigenesis and progression of malignant tumors; activating autophagy also exists in the recurrence of HCC after ablation (Table 3). In vitro and in vivo, it has been shown that autophagy inhibition can inhibit the progression of HCC after ablation.

### 3.4 Changes in Non-Coding RNA

Long-stranded non-coding RNA (lncRNA) is usually defined as a transcript with more than 200 nucleotides lacking the function of protein coding. In recent years, nevertheless, lncRNA has shown an important regulatory role in cancer biology, including immune response, tumorigenesis, cell development, and metabolism (90, 91). The expression of lncRNA was detected by a gene chip, and hundreds of lncRNA were abnormally expressed in HCC (Figure 1) (91). It was found that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA for expressing EMT and enhanced the invasiveness of SHS-treated hepatoma cells. The downregulation of miR-200C and miR-34a expression promoted EMT by reducing the expression of E-cadherin, which promoted proliferation and invasion in hepatoma cells. The expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated. Further studies showed that the expression of lncRNA and mRNA in hepatoma cells treated with SHS was significantly changed; about 558 lncRNA and 250 mRNA were upregulated, while 224 lncRNA and 1,031 mRNA were downregulated.
3.5 Changes in the Tumor Microenvironment

The mechanisms described above are all based on hepatoma cells. However, the tumor microenvironment (TME) also plays an important role in tumorigenesis and tumor progression. TME is rich in activated hepatic stellate cells (HSCs). Evidence shows that the activated HSCs promote hepatoma cells' proliferation, migration, and invasion (92–95). Periostin (POSTN) is a key protein that activates HSCs and is a perfect anti-fibrosis target (96). The high expression of POSTN can induce EMT and

![Figure 1](link-to-figure1)

**TABLE 4 |** TME changes in recurrence after ablation of HCC.

| Researchers | Experimental Methods | Research Results | Ref. |
|-------------|----------------------|-----------------|------|
| Zhang et al. | In vitro | POSTN played an important role in the recurrence of HCC after ablation. | (99) |
| Zhang et al. | In vitro | POSTN upregulated the stem cell characteristics in residual hepatoma cells by SHS. | (100) |
| Jiang et al. | In vitro | The matrix hardness and extracellular matrix type I collagen increased in residual hepatoma cells via SHS. | (101) |

![Figure 2](link-to-figure2)
promote proliferation in hepatoma cells (97) and can lead to a worse prognosis in patients with HCC (98). Zhang et al. exposed hepatoma cells to SHS and then cultured them with activated hepatic stellate cell conditioned medium (HSC-CM). Subsequently, there was enhanced invasion of residual hepatoma cells through HSC-CM secreting POSTN. It is proved that POSTN plays a vital role in the recurrence of HCC after ablation (99). It is further found that POSTN induced residual hepatoma cells by SHS, acquiring stem cell characteristics through activating the integrin β1/β3/β-catenin/TCF4/Nanog pathway (100). Zhang et al. also found that the matrix hardness and extracellular matrix type I collagen were involved in the malignant progression in residual hepatoma cells after SHS (101). ERK1/2 inhibitors can reverse ERK phosphorylation induced by extracellular matrix type I collagen (102). TME plays an important role in tumorigenesis and progression, and the researches have conducted a preliminary study on the role of TME in recurrence of HCC after ablation (Table 4), but more in-depth studies are needed to find vital proteins and signal pathways.

4 CONCLUSIONS
As a minimally invasive, safe, and effective treatment, ablation plays a major role in ESHCC. The mechanism of recurrence of HCC after ablation is mainly focused on EMT, angiogenesis, autophagy activation, and changes in the TME (Figure 2). Current perspectives do not fully elucidate the mechanism of recurrence of HCC after ablation. Most of the studies are in vivo, and some are in vitro. For the establishment of an incomplete tumor ablation model in vitro, most studies used simulated thermal ablation in vitro by SHS. Some scholars doubted whether this method could completely mimic the tumor environment. Furthermore, the temperature and time of the water bath are not the same in different experiments, thus lacking uniform standards (49). In the future, we hope to improve the research method in vitro and in vivo, revealing its distinct mechanism, and providing the theoretical basis for clinical transformation.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS
JQY and WG performed the data collection and analysis. JQY, WG, and ML were responsible for the data interpretation. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

FUNDING
This study was supported by funds from the National Key Research and Development Program (No. 2019YFF0196700).

REFERENCES
1. Zhou M, Wang H, Zeng X, Yin P, Zhu J, Chen W, et al. Mortality, Morbidity, and Risk Factors in China and its Provinces, 1990-2017: A Systematic Analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2017. Lancet (2019) 394(10204):1145–58. doi: 10.1016/s0140-6736(19)30427-1
2. Zheng RS, Sun KX, Zhang SW, Zeng HM, Zou XN, Chen R, et al. [Report of Cancer Epidemiology in China, 2015]. Zhonghua Zhong Liu Za Zhi (2019) 41(1):19–28. doi: 10.3760/cma.j.issn.0253-3766.2019.01.005
3. Fan J, Yang G8, Fu Z8, Peng ZH, Xia Q, Peng CH, et al. Liver Transplantation Outcomes in 1,078 Hepatocellular Carcinoma Patients: A Multi-Center Experience in Shanghai, China. J Cancer Res Clin Oncol (2009) 135(10):1403–12. doi: 10.1007/s00432-009-0584-6
4. Mohkam K, Dumont PN, Manichon AF, Jouvet JC, Bousset L, Merle P, et al. No-Touch Multibipolar Radiofrequency Ablation vs. Surgical Resection for Solitary Hepatocellular Carcinoma Ranging From 2 to 5 Cm. J Hepatol (2018) 68(6):1172–80. doi: 10.1016/j.jhep.2018.01.014
5. Heimbach JK, Kulik LM, Finn RS, Sirlin CB, Abecassis MM, Roberts LR, et al. AASLD Guidelines for the Treatment of Hepatocellular Carcinoma. Hepatology (2018) 67(1):358–80. doi: 10.1002/hep.29086
6. Salimi A, Turrini R, Lanzani G, Savio A, Anglani L. Efficacy of Radiofrequency Ablation of Hepatocellular Carcinoma Associated With Chronic Liver Disease Without Cirrhosis. Int J Med Sci (2008) 5(6):327–32. doi: 10.7150/ijms.5.327
7. Bruix J, Sherman M. Management of Hepatocellular Carcinoma: An Update. Hepatology (2011) 53(3):1020–2. doi: 10.1002/hep.24199
8. Fang Y, Chen W, Liang X, Li D, Lou H, Chen R, et al. Comparison of Long-Term Effectiveness and Complications of Radiofrequency Ablation With Hepatectomy for Small Hepatocellular Carcinoma. J Gastroenterol Hepatol (2014) 29(1):193–200. doi: 10.1111/jgh.12441
9. Lencioni R, Cioni D, Crocetti L, Franchini C, Pina CD, Lera J, et al. Early-Stage Hepatocellular Carcinoma in Patients With Cirrhosis: Long-Term Results of Percutaneous Image-Guided Radiofrequency Ablation. Radiology (2005) 234(3):961–7. doi: 10.1148/radiol.2343404350
10. Rozenblum N, Zeira E, Sciewicz V, Bulvik B, Gourevitch S, Yotvat H, et al. Oncogenesis: An “Off-Target” Effect of Radiofrequency Ablation. Radiology (2015) 276(2):426–32. doi: 10.1148/radiol.2015141695
11. Goldberg SN, Gazelle GS, Mueller PR. Thermal Ablation Therapy for Focal Malignancy: A Unified Approach to Underlying Principles, Techniques, and Diagnostic Imaging Guidance. AJR Am J Roentgenol (2000) 174(2):323–31. doi: 10.2214/ajr.174.2.1740323
12. McGahan JP, Gu WZ, Brock JM, Tesluk H, Jones CD. Hepatic Ablation Using Bipolar Radiofrequency Electrocautery. Acad Radiol (1996) 3(5):418–22. doi: 10.1016/s1076-6332(05)80677-4
13. Doyle A, Gorgen A, Muaddi H, Aravinthan AD, Issachar A, Mironov O, et al. Outcomes of Radiofrequency Ablation as First-Line Therapy for Hepatocellular Carcinoma Less Than 3 Cm in Potentially Transplantable Patients. J Hepatol (2019) 70(5):866–73. doi: 10.1016/j.jhep.2018.12.027
14. Mulier S, Ni Y, Jamart J, Ruers T, Marchal G, Michel L. Local Recurrence After Hepatic Radiofrequency Coagulation: Multivariate Meta-Analysis and Review of Contributing Factors. Ann Surg (2005) 242(2):158–71. doi: 10.1097/01.sla.0000171032.99149.fc
15. Zuo TY, Liu FY, Wang MQ, Chen XX. Transcatheter Arterial Chemoembolization Combined With Simultaneous Computed Tomography-Guided Radiofrequency Ablation for Large Hepatocellular Carcinomas. Chin Med J (Engl) (2017) 130(22):2666–73. doi: 10.4103/0366-6999.218002
16. Yang W, Lee JC, Chen MH, Zhang ZY, Bai XM, Yin SS, et al. Thermosensitive Liposomal Doxorubicin Plus Radiofrequency Ablation Increased Tumor Destruction and Improved Survival in Patients With Medium and Large Hepatocellular Carcinoma: A Randomized, Double-
34. Wright AS, Lee FTJr., Mahvi DM. Microwave Ablation for Hepatic Malignancy Adjacent to the Gallbladder. *Int J Hyperthermia* (2017) 33(3):11068–76. doi: 10.1039/c7nj02955a

35. Yin XY, Xie XY, Lu MD, XuHX, Xu ZF, Kuang M, et al. Percutaneous Thermal Ablation of Medium and Large Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Long-Term Outcome and Prognostic Factors. *Cancer* (2009) 115(9):1914–23. doi: 10.1002/cncr.24196

36. Livraghi T, Goldberg SN, Lazzaroni S, Meloni F, Ierase T, Solbiati L, et al. Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Radio-Frequency Ablation of Medium and Large Lesions. *RadioLOGY* (2000) 214(3):761–8. doi: 10.1148/radiology.214.3.r00mr2761

37. Gage BA, Baust J. Mechanisms of Tissue Injury in Cryosurgery. *Cryobiology* (1998) 37(3):171–86. doi: 10.1006/cryo.1998.2115

38. Permpongkosol S, Sulman A, Solomon SB, Gong GX, Kavoussi LR. Percutaneous Computerized Tomography Guided Renal Cyaoblation Using Local Anesthesia: Pain Assessment. *J Urol* (2006) 176(3):915–8. doi: 10.1016/j.juro.2006.04.035

39. Gilbert JC, Onik GM, Hodick WK, Rubinsky B. Real Time Ultrasonic Monitoring of Hepatic Cryosurgery. *Cryobiology* (1985) 22(4):319–30. doi: 10.1006/jcry.2003.03.047

40. Lee FTJr., Chosy SG, Littrup PJ, Warner TF, Kuhlman JE, Mahvi DM. CT-Monitored Percutaneous Cryoablation in a Pig Liver Model: Pilot Study. *Radiology* (1999) 211(3):687–92. doi: 10.1148/radiology.211.3.r99jn29687

41. Silverman SG, Sun MR, Tuncali K, Morrison P, vanSonnenberg E, Shankar S, et al. Three-Dimensional Assessment of MRI-Guided Percutaneous Cryotherapy of Liver Metastases. *AJR Am J Roentgenol* (2004) 183(3):707–12. doi: 10.2214/ajr.183.3.1832707

42. Seifert JK, Morris DL. World Survey on the Complications of Hepatic and Prostate Cryotherapy. *World J Surg* (1999) 23(2):109–13; discussion 113–4. doi: 10.1007/p100013173

43. Xu KC, Niu LZ, Zhou Q, Hu YZ, Guo DH, Liu ZP, et al. Sequential Use of Transarterial Chemoembolization and Percutaneous Cryosurgery for Hepatocellular Carcinoma. *World J Gastroenterol* (2009) 15(29):3664–9. doi: 10.3748/wjg.15.3664

44. Lee EW, Chen C, Prieto VE, Dry SM, Loh CT, Kee ST. Advanced Hepatic Ablation Technique for Creating Complete Cell Death: Irreversible Electroporation. *Radiology* (2010) 253(2):426–33. doi: 10.1148/radiol.10090337

45. Seror O. Ablative Therapies: Advantages and Disadvantages of Radiofrequency, Cryotherapy, Microwave and Electroporation Methods, or How to Choose the Right Method for an Individual Patient? *Diagn Interv Imaging* (2015) 96(6):617–24. doi: 10.1016/j.dii.2015.04.007

46. Cornelis FH, Durack JC, Kimm SY, Wimmer T, Coleman JA, Solomon SB, et al. A Comparative Study of Ablation Boundary Sharpness After Percutaneous Radiofrequency, Cryo-, Microwave, and Irreversible Electroporation Ablation in Normal Swine Liver and Kidneys. *Cardiovasc Intervent Radiol* (2017) 40(10):1600–8. doi: 10.1007/s00270-017-1692-3

47. Niessen C, Beyer LP, Pregler B, Dollinger M, Trabold B, Schlitt HJ, et al. Percutaneous Ablation of Hepatic Tumors Using Irreversible Electroporation: A Prospective Safety and Midterm Efficacy Study in 34 Patients. *J Vasc Interv Radiol* (2016) 27(4):480–6. doi: 10.1016/j.jvir.2015.12.025

48. Niessen C, Thumann S, Beyer L, Pregler B, Kramer J, Lang S, et al. Percutaneous Irreversible Electroporation: Long-Term Survival Analysis of 71 Patients With Inoperable Malignant Hepatic Tumors. *Sci Rep* (2017) 7:43687. doi: 10.1038/srep43687

49. Cheng J, Li M, Lv Y. Subhelath Heat Treatment Promotes Epithelial-Mesenchymal Transition and Enhances the Malignant Potential of Hepatocellular Carcinoma. *Hepatology* (2014) 59(4):1650. doi: 10.1002/hep.26260

50. Olea-Flores M, Zuñiga-Eulogio MD, Mendoza-Catalán MA, Rodríguez-Ruíz HA, Castañeda-Saucedo E, Ortúñoa-Pineda C, et al. Extracellular-Signal Regulated Kinase: A Central Molecule Driving Epithelial-Mesenchymal Transition in Cancer. *Int J Mol Sci* (2019) 20(12). doi: 10.3390/ijms20122885

51. Yoshida S, Kornek M, Ikenna N, Schmelzle M, Masuzaki R, Csizmadia E, et al. Three-Dimensional Assessment of MRI-Guided Percutaneous Cryotherapy of Liver Metastases. *AJR Am J Roentgenol* (2004) 183(3):707–12. doi: 10.2214/ajr.183.3.1832707

52. Dong S, Kong J, Kong F, Kong J, Gao J, Ke S, et al. Insufficient Radiofrequency Ablation Promotes Epithelial-Mesenchymal Transition of Hepatocellular Carcinoma Cells Through Akt and ERK Signaling Pathways. *J Transl Med* (2013) 11:273. doi: 10.1186/1479-8876-11-273
58. Vecchietti V, Casagrande C, Ferrari G, Severini Ricca G. New Aporphine.
59. Bao S, Wu Q, Sathornsumetee S, Hao Y, Li Z, Hjelmeland AB, et al. Stem.
60. Carmeliet P, Dor Y, Herbert JM, Fukumura D, Brusselmans K, Dewerchin.
61. Li T, Kang G, Wang T, Huang H. Tumor Angiogenesis and Anti-Angiogenic.
62. Kaseb AO, Hanbali A, Cotant M, Hassan MM, Wollner I, Philip PA.
63. Poon RT, Lau CP, Cheung ST, Yu WC, Fan ST. Quantitative Correlation of.
64. Zhang N, Wang L, Chai ZT, Zhu ZM, Zhu XD, Ma DN, et al. Incomplete.
65. Xiang ZL, Zeng ZC, Fan J, Tang ZY, Zeng HY, Gao DM. Gene Expression.
66. Zagzag D, Zhong H, Scalzitti JM, Laughner E, Simons JW, Semenza GL.
67. Kong J, Kong J, Pan B, Ke S, Dong S, Li X, et al. Insufficient Radiofrequency.
68. Meng YC, Lou XL, Yang LY, Li D, Hou YQ. Role of the Autophagy-Related.
69. Sun X, Zhang Q, Mei J, Yang Z, Chen M, Liang T. Real-World Efficiency of.
70. Rimassa L, Santoro A. Sorafenib Therapy in Advanced Hepatocellular.
71.Franzoni D, Santoro A. Sorafenib Therapy in Advanced Hepatocellular.
72. Zhu K, Huang J, Lai I, Huang W, Cai M, Zhou J, et al. Medium or Large.
73. Carmeliet P, Dor Y, Herbert JM, Fukumura D, Brusselmans K, Dewerchin.
74. Kong J, Kong J, Pan B, Ke S, Dong S, Li X, et al. Insufficient Radiofrequency.
75. Carmeliet P, Dor Y, Herbert JM, Fukumura D, Brusselmans K, Dewerchin.
76. Wu L, Fu Z, Zhou S, Gong J, Liu CA, Qiao Z, et al. HIF-1a and HIF-2a.
77. Kaseb AO, Hanbali A, Cotant M, Hassan MM, Wollner I, Philip PA.
78. Yamada S, Utsunomiya T, Morine Y, Imura S, Ikemoto T, Arakawa Y, et al.
79. Meng YC, Lou XL, Yang LY, Li D, Hou YQ. Role of the Autophagy-Related.
80. Yang S, Wang X, Continò G, Liesa M, Sahn E, Ying H, et al. Pancreatic.
81. Chakraborty A, Bhattacharyya S, Pathak A, Saha P. Neutrophil Extracellular.
82. Guo RP, Zhong C, Shi M, Zhang QW, Wei W, Zhang YQ, et al. Clinical Value.
83. Kong J, Kong J, Pan B, Ke S, Dong S, Li X, et al. Insufficient Radiofrequency.
84. Peng WX, Xiong EM, Ge L, Wan Y, Zhang CL, Du FY, et al. Egr-1.
85. Pinheiro C, Longatto-Filho A, Scapulatempo C, Ferreira L, Martins S, Pellerin L, et al. Increased Expression of Monocarboxylate Transporters 1, 2, and 4 in Colorectal Carcinomas. Virchows Arch (2008) 452(2):139–46. doi:10.1007/s00428-007-0558-5
86. Thompson SM, Callstrom MR, Jondal DE, Butters KA, Knudsen BE, Anderson JL, et al. Heat Stress-Induced PI3K/mTORC2-Dependent AKT
87. Zhang N, Wang L, Chai ZT, Zhu ZM, Zhu XD, Ma DN, et al. Insufficient Radiofrequency Ablation Enhances Invasiveness and Metastasis of Residual Cancer of Hepatocellular Carcinoma Cell HCCLM3 via Activating β-Catenin Signaling. PLoS One (2014) 9(12):e115949. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0115949
88. Yang et al. Perspectives on Recurrence After Ablation 59. Bao S, Wu Q, Sathornsumetee S, Hao Y, Li Z, Hjelmeland AB, et al. Stem.
89. Vecchietti V, Casagrande C, Ferrari G, Severini Ricca G. New Aporphine.
Signaling Is a Central Mediator of Hepatocellular Carcinoma Survival to Thermal Ablation Induced Heat Stress. PLoS One (2016) 11(9):e0162634.

87. Jondal DE, Thompson SM, Butters KA, Knudsen BE, Anderson JL, Carter RE, et al. Heat Stress and Hepatic Laser Thermal Ablation Induce Hepatocellular Carcinoma Growth: Role of PI3K/mTOR/akt Signaling. Radiology (2018) 288(3):730–8. doi: 10.1148/radiol.2018172944

88. Jondal DE, Thompson SM, Butters KA, Knudsen BE, Anderson JL, Carter RE, et al. Targeting Autophagy Enhances Heat Stress-Induced Apoptosis via the ATP-AMPK-mTOR Axis for Hepatocellular Carcinoma. Int J Hyperthermia (2019) 36(1):499–510. doi: 10.1080/02656736.2019.1600052

89. Schmitt AM, Chang HY. Long Noncoding RNAs in Cancer Pathways. Cancer Cell (2016) 29(4):452–63. doi: 10.1016/j.ccell.2016.03.010

90. Zhu J, Liu S, Ye F, Shen Y, Tie Y, Zhu J, et al. Insufficient Radiofrequency Ablation Promotes Proliferation of Residual Hepatocellular Carcinoma via Autophagy. Cancer Lett (2018) 421:73–81. doi: 10.1016/j.canlet.2018.02.024

91. Zhu J, Liu S, Ye F, Shen Y, Tie Y, Zhu J, et al. The Long Noncoding RNA TGF-β1 Promotes Tumorigenicity of Hepatocellular Carcinoma After Sublethal Heat Treatment. Sci Rep (2017) 7(1):2164. doi: 10.1038/s41598-017-0177-6

92. Zhu J, Ma M, Dong G, Yao RR, Li JH, Zheng QD, et al. Increased Matrix Stiffness Promotes Tumor Progression of Residual Hepatocellular Carcinoma After Insufficient Heat Treatment. Cancer Sci (2017) 108(9):1778–86. doi: 10.1111/cas.13322

93. Zhu J, Ma M, Lin XH, Liu HH, Chen J, Chen J, et al. Extracellular Matrix Collagen I Promotes the Tumor Progression of Residual Hepatocellular Carcinoma After Heat Treatment. BMC Cancer (2018) 18(1):901. doi: 10.1186/s12885-018-4820-9

Conflict of Interest: The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Publisher’s Note: All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

Copyright © 2022 Yang, Guo and Lu. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.