Cytotoxic T Cells Deficient in Both Functional Fas Ligand and Perforin Show Residual Cytolytic Activity yet Lose Their Capacity to Induce Lethal Acute Graft-Versus-Host Disease

By Michel Y. Braun,* Bente Lowin,† Lars French,§ Hans Acha-Orbea,* and Jürg Tschopp†

From the *Ludwig Institute for Cancer Research and †Institute of Biochemistry, University of Lausanne, CH-1066 Epalinges; and ‡Department of Dermatology and Epithelium Network, University of Geneva Medical School, CH-1211 Geneva 4, Switzerland

Summary

Graft-versus-host disease (GVHD) is the main complication after allogeneic bone marrow transplantation. Although the tissue damage and subsequent patient mortality are clearly dependent on T lymphocytes present in the grafted inoculum, the lethal effector molecules are unknown. Here, we show that acute lethal GVHD, induced by the transfer of splenocytes from C57BL/6 mice into sensitive BALB/c recipients, is dependent on both perforin and Fas ligand (FasL)-mediated lytic pathways. When spleen cells from mutant mice lacking both effector molecules were transferred to sublethally irradiated allogeneic recipients, mice survived. Delayed mortality was observed with grafted cells deficient in only one lytic mediator. In contrast, protection from lethal acute GVHD in resistant mice was exclusively perforin dependent. Perforin–FasL-deficient T cells failed to lyse most target cells in vitro. However, they still efficiently killed tumor necrosis factor α-sensitive fibroblasts, demonstrating that cytotoxic T cells possess a third lytic pathway.

CTL are important cytolytic effector cells of the immune defense system against viruses and tumors (1). CD4+ and CD8+ CTL are also involved in autoimmunity and transplant rejection. The recent development of mice in which the gene for perforin is disrupted (2–4) has provided evidence for the existence of two separate lytic pathways: first, the formation of membrane pores by perforin released from intracellular stores (5) followed by the proteolytic action of granzymes that are coreleased with perforin and that induce apoptosis in the target cell (6); second, the triggering of the Fas (Apo-1)-induced apoptotic pathway by Fas ligand (FasL) exposed on the CTL surface (7). At present it appears that the two pathways account for all cytolytic activity of CTL. However, only a restricted number of target cells could be analyzed, since functional inactivation of the Fas pathway is achieved by the use of target cells from lpr mice, which express little or no Fas (8). Thus, it cannot be excluded that other lytic molecules such as TNF-α, which is detected on the surface of activated T lymphocytes (9), contribute to the cytotoxicity of CTL. For this reason we generated mice in which both perforin and FasL are nonfunctional, by crossing perforin knock-out mice with gld mice, which bear a mutation in the FasL gene leading to its functional inactivation (10). Our study now shows that CTL derived from these mice still display lytic activity on transformed fibroblast cell lines.

These double-mutant mice also offered the unique possibility to evaluate the role of perforin and FasL in GVHD. GVHD continues to be a major complication after allogeneic bone marrow transplantation (BMT) (11). An acute lethal form of GVHD is caused by activation of the host-reactive donor effector T cells (12). The major organs affected in GVHD are skin, liver, intestine, and lymphoid tissues (13, 14), and symptoms range from varying degrees of erythroderma, wasting, diarrhea, splenomegaly, and lymphadenopathy to death (14). The lytic mechanisms leading to lesion formation are only poorly understood and might involve, for acute GVHD, direct interactions between donor CTL and host target cells, or more indirect mechanisms mediated by interleukins released by the donor T cells (15). We therefore explored the possibility that perforin or FasL may play a role in the etiology of the lesions seen in GVHD.

Materials and Methods

Animals. Perforin-deficient (P−/−) gld/gld mice were generated by crossing perforin knock-out (C57BL/6 × 129)F3 mice (16) with C57BL/6 gld/gld mice (The Jackson Laboratory, Bar Harbor, ME) and by subsequent intercrossing of heterozygous F1 animals. To detect the FasL-gld mutation, mouse tail DNA was
PCR amplified using the following primers: 5'-CACTCAAG-GTCCATCCCTCTG-3' and 5'-ATATTCCTGGTGGCCCATGAT-3'. The amplification product was sequenced to detect the gld homozygotes (17, 18). Mice were screened for the defective perforin gene as described (16).

Flow Cytometric Analysis. Splenocytes from 6- and 16-wk-old mice were isolated and freed from red blood cells by 15-min incubation in an ice cold buffer containing 13 mM sodium bicarbonate, 156 mM ammonium chloride, and 127 μM EDTA, and then resuspended in PBS supplemented with 5% FCS and 0.02% NaN3. Splenocytes were stained with Tri-Color-conjugated anti-B220 antibodies and FITC-labeled anti-CD3 antibodies (CALTAG Laboratories, South San Francisco, CA) and analyzed using a FACScan® flow cytometer (Becton Dickinson Immunocytometric Systems, Mountain View, CA) using the Lysis II software.

Cytolytic Assays. Alloreactive cytotoxic T lymphocytes were generated in a 5-d mixed lymphocyte culture (16).Responder spleen cells (2.5 × 106/ml-1) were from adult 6-wk-old mice deficient for perforin, functional FasL (gld/gld), or both. All mice were of H-2b haplotype. Stimulators were irradiated spleen cells (2.5 × 106/ml-1, 3,000 rad) from either DBA/2 mice (H-2b) or C3H (H-2k) mice. Target cells were activated splenocytes from DBA/2 mice stimulated with ConA (4 μg/ml) for 3 d (2), A20.2J B cell lymphomas (H-2b), WEHI 164 fibrosarcomas (H-2b), and L929 (H-2k) fibrosarcomas, all obtained from American Type Culture Collection (Rockville, MD). Mouse embryonic fibroblasts (MEF) were isolated from 12 to 14-d-old C3H embryos as described (2). Cytotoxicity on targets of hematopoietic origin was assayed after 4 h for 51Cr release and DNA degradation (16). Adherent target cells were labeled with 51Cr for 12 h as described elsewhere (16), and 51Cr release was determined after a 20-h incubation. Recombinant mouse TNF-α was obtained from Dr. J. Browning, Biogen (Boston, MA).

Induction of GVHD. 6-wk-old female recipients were given a sublethal dose of Co irradiation (5 Gy; 1.2 Gy/min). Within 1 h, 40 × 106 of spleen cells isolated from female allogeneic donors were injected through the tail vein. Animals used in the study were BALB/c, C57BL/6, 129, (C57BL/6 × 129)F1, (C57BL/6 × 129)F1, and 129 (H-2k) mice. Target ceils were activated splenocytes from 6-wk-old female allogeneic donors (2.5 × 106/ml-1, 3,000 rad) from either DBA/2 mice (H-2d) or C57BL/6, C57BL/6, 129, (C57BL/6 × 129)F1, (C57BL/6 × 129)F1, and 129 mice. Rate of survival was recorded daily. Mice with the gld/gld mutation were used at 5–6 wk of age. A minimum of four recipient animals were used in each experimental group.

Results and Discussion

Mutant mice deficient for both perforin and functional FasL were generated by intercrossing P-/- mice (16) with gld/gld mice (19) lacking functional FasL (17, 18). Animals homozygous for both nonfunctional genes were viable. Flow immunocytometric analysis of the spleen cell population of young animals (6 wk old) showed a phenotype similar to that observed in normal mice (Fig. 1). With progressive age (from 8 wk old onward), however, these mice developed a more severe lymphadenopathy than the one previously described in gld/gld mice (19). Lymphoid organs of P-/-/gld/gld mice were massively enlarged. Spleens derived from 16-wk-old P-/-/gld/gld mice were on average seven times heavier than those from age-matched P-/- mice, or 3.5 times heavier than the corresponding organs from gld/gld mice (Lowin, B., and J. Tschopp, unpublished results). A predominant CD3+ B220+ CD4- CD8- population accumulated (Fig. 1) that resembled the T cell population found in gld/gld mice (19). This phenotype represented >50% of all splenocytes in 16-wk-old double-mutant mice (Fig. 1). A high proportion of T cells in P-/-/gld/gld mice expressed activation markers such as CD69 (data not shown), pointing to a chronic activation of the immune system. Most mice died at an age of 4–5 mo.

T cells from double mutant animals exhibited no lytic activity on several target cells tested. Whereas alloreactive T cells (H-2b) derived from 6-wk-old P-/- and gld/gld mice were able to kill ConA-stimulated allogeneic lymphoid cells (H-2b) as well as the B cell lymphoma A20, splenocytes from P-/-/gld/gld mice were completely inactive (Fig. 2). The differences in cytotoxicity are unlikely to be caused by large differences in the allogeneic reaction, since IFN-γ concentration in the supernatants of the respective mixed leukocyte reactions was similar (3,000 ± 500 U/ml supernatant). These data thus confirm that perforin- and Fas-dependent pathways are responsible for all detectable lytic activity against lymphoid targets in short term cytotoxicity assays (2-4, 20). Cytolytic activity was also tested in long-term (20 h) cytotoxicity assays against nonhematopoietic target cells, that is, the fibrosarcoma WEHI-164 (H-2b), L929 (H-2b), and MEF (H-2b). As shown in Fig. 3 a, MEF cells were not lysed in the absence
of both perforin and functional FasL, but surprisingly, killing of WEHI-164 and L929 was not significantly affected. The sensitivity pattern of target cells correlated with their respective susceptibility to TNF-α (Fig. 3 b), a cytokine mainly secreted by activated macrophages, NK cells, and some subpopulations of T cells (9). TNF-α has been shown in vitro to exhibit slow cytolytic activity (21), and in vivo, the production of TNF-α has been correlated with tissue injuries occurring in many immunopathological situations (22-24). This suggests that TNF-α-mediated cytotoxicity is at least in part responsible for the lytic activity remaining in P-/- and FasL-deficient animals. Other cytolytic molecules, such as lymphotoxins (9) or NK lysins (25), may also contribute to the residual cytotoxicity, since neutralizing anti–TNF-α antibodies only partially inhibited this activity (10–30% specific reduction).

GVHD remains the main complication after allogeneic BMT. Since the effector molecules leading to lesion formation are only poorly understood, we investigated the role of perforin- and Fas-mediated cytolytic pathways in a murine model of acute lethal GVHD whereby donor splenocytes from C57BL/6 or 129 (H-2b) mice are injected into sublethally irradiated allogeneic BALB/c (H-2a) mice (26).

Fig. 4 a shows that all BALB/c recipients injected with C57BL/6 or 129 spleen cells (40 × 10⁶) died within 7 d, whereas injection of spleen cells from P-/- or functional FasL--deficient mice delayed the onset of the disease (survival mean 17 and 24 d, respectively). In contrast, mice given cells from P-/-gld/gld animals were unaffected and survived (survival mean >50 d).
Whereas sublethally irradiated BALB/c mice die within 7 d when inoculated with normal C57BL/6 spleen cells (Fig. 4 a), irradiated C57BL/6 (or 129) recipients injected with the same number of BALB/c spleen cells survive and show no signs of illness (Fig. 4 b) (26, 27). Whether this difference of sensitivity reflects the ability of the C57BL/6 mice to eliminate potentially alloreactive BALB/c CTL from the graft or is caused by a low frequency of BALB/c anti-C57BL/6 CTL precursors in BALB/c splenocytes is not known. We therefore transferred normal BALB/c spleen cells into sublethally irradiated C57BL/6 recipients deficient for either perforin or functional FasL. BALB/c splenocytes failed to induce any symptoms of lethal GVHD in normal and gld/gld recipients (Fig. 4 b). In contrast, C57BL/6 recipients lacking functional perforin became susceptible to BALB/c splenocytes and died within 7–8 d. Thus, normal sublethally irradiated C57BL/6 recipients contain radioresistant cells that are able to suppress the effector function of BALB/c spleenocytes solely through a perforin-dependent pathway. The cell population responsible for this inhibition might include host antidonor radioresistant CTL, NK cells, or natural suppressor cells appearing after total body irradiation (27, 28).

In the murine model of lethal GVHD studied here, both perforin and FasL appear to play a crucial role in mortality. Other lytic effector molecules still detected in perforin−/− mice, such as liver, lung, or heart, whereas perforin, with no requirement for a specific receptor (35), may eventually destroy any organ.

Although both perforin- and Fas-dependent pathways are responsible for the mortality caused by acute GVHD in BALB/c mice, perforin-mediated cytotoxicity appears to be the only pathway required for the rejection of allogeneic spleen cells. P−/− mice still reject heart allografts (36), and thus effector mechanisms used to reject tissues and organs of different origin seem to differ.

GVHD remains a major barrier to a wider application of allogeneic BMT for a variety of diseases. Provided that the active role of FasL and perforin in the progression of acute GVHD can be illustrated in humans, the development of therapeutic strategies aimed at controlling the two cytolytic pathways during BMT may be an approach for decreasing the risk of GVHD.

We thank C. Mattman for technical assistance and F. Donaldson and C. Kamel for the careful reading of the manuscript.

This work was supported by a grant from the Swiss National Science Foundation (H. Acha-Orbea and J. Tschopp).

Address correspondence to Dr. Jürg Tschopp, Institute of Biochemistry, University of Lausanne, Ch. de Boveresses 155, 1066 Epalinges, Switzerland.

Received for publication 8 August 1995 and in revised form 6 October 1995.

References

1. Berke, G. 1995. The CTL's kiss of death. Cell. 81:9–12.
2. Lowin, B., M. Hahne, C. Mattmann, and J. Tschopp. 1994. Cytolytic T-cell cytotoxicity is mediated through perforin and Fas lytic pathways. Nature (Lond.). 370:650–652.
3. Kagi, D., F. Vignaux, B. Ledermann, K. Burki, V. Depraetere, S. Nagata, H. Hengartner, and P. Golstein. 1994. Fas and perforin pathways as major mechanisms of T cell-mediated cytotoxicity. Science (Wash. DC). 265:528–530.
4. Walah, C.M., M. Matloubian, C.C. Liu, R. Ueda, C.G. Kurahara, J.L. Christensen, M.T. Huang, J.D. Young, R. Ahmed, and W.R. Clark. 1994. Immune function in mice lacking the perforin gene. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 91:10854–10858.
5. Lowin, B., M.C. Peitsch, and J. Tschopp. 1995. Perforin and granzymes: crucial effector molecules in cytolytic T lymphocyte and natural killer cell-mediated cytotoxicity. Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol. 198:1–23.
6. Heusel, J.W., R.L. Wesselschmidt, S. Shresta, J.H. Russell, and T.J. Ley. 1994. Cytotoxic lymphocytes require granzyme-B for the rapid induction of DNA fragmentation and apoptosis in allogeneic target cells. Cell. 76:977–987.
7. Nagata, S., and P. Golstein. 1995. The Fas death factor. Science (Wash. DC). 267:1449–1456.
8. Watanabe, F.R., C.I. Brannan, N.G. Copeland, N.A. Jen-
kines, and S. Nagata. 1992. Lymphoproliferation disorder in mice explained by defects in Fas antigen that mediates apoptosis. *Nature (Lond.).* 356:314–317.

9. Ware, C.F., T.T. VanArsdale, P.D. Crowe, and J.L. Brown- ing. 1995. The ligands and receptors of the lymphotixin system. *Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol.* 126:175–217.

10. Nagata, S. 1994. Mutations in the Fas antigen gene in *lpr* mice. *Semin. Immunol.* 6:3–8.

11. Vogelsang, G.B., and A.D. Hess. 1994. Graft-versus-host disease: new directions for a persistent problem. *Blood.* 84:2061–2067.

12. Sprent, J. 1993. Direct and indirect mechanisms mediating apoptosis during HIV infection: contribution to in vivo CD4 T cell depletion. *Semin. Immunol.* 5:187–194.

13. Santos, G.W., G.W. Hess, and G.B. Vogelsang. 1985. Immunol. Rev. 88:169–192.

14. Ferrara, J.L., and H.J. Deeg. 1991. Graft-versus-host disease. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 324:667–674.

15. Ferrara, J.L. 1993. Cytokine dysregulation as a mechanism of graft versus host disease. *Curr. Opin. Immunol.* 5:794–799.

16. Lowin, B., F. Beermann, A. Schmidt, and J. Tschopp. 1994. A null mutation in the perforin gene impairs cytolytic T lymphocyte- and NK-mediated cytotoxicity. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA.* 91:11151–11157.

17. Takahashi, T., M. Tanaka, C.I. Brannan, N.A. Jenkins, N.G. Copeland, T. Suda, and S. Nagata. 1994. Generalized lymphoproliferative disease in mice, caused by a point mutation in the Fas ligand. *Cell.* 76:969–976.

18. Lynch, D.H., L.M. Watson, M.R. Alderson, P.R. Baum, R.E. Miller, T.W. Tough, M. Gibson, T. Davis-Smith, C.A. Smith, G. Hunter, et al. 1994. The mouse Fas-ligand gene is mutated in gld mice and is part of a TNF family gene cluster. *Immunity.* 1:131–136.

19. Roths, J.B., E.D. Murphy, and E.M. Eicher. 1984. A new mutation, gld, that produces lymphoproliferation and autoimmunity in C3H/HeJ mice. *J. Exp. Med.* 159:1–20.

20. Kojima, H., N. Shinohara, S. Hanaoka, Y. Someya-Shirota, Y. Takagaki, H. Ohno, T. Saito, T. Katayama, H. Yagita, K. Okamura, et al. 1994. Two distinct pathways of specific killing revealed by perforin mutant cytotoxic T cells. *Immunity.* 1:357–364.

21. Fiers, W. 1991. Tumor necrosis factor. Characterization at the molecular, cellular and in vivo level. *FEBS (Fed. Eur. Biochem. Soc.) Lett.* 285:199–212.

22. Waage, A., A. Haltensen, and T. Espevik. 1987. Association between tumour necrosis factor in serum and fatal outcome in patients with meningococcal disease. *Lancet.* i:355–357.

23. Piquet, P.F., G.E. Grau, B. Allot, and P. Vassalli. 1987. Tumor necrosis factor/cachectin is an effector of skin and gut lesions of the acute phase of graft-versus-host disease. *J. Exp. Med.* 166:1280–1289.

24. Grau, G.E., L.F. Fajardo, P.F. Piquet, B. Allot, P.H. Lambert, and P. Vassalli. 1987. Tumor necrosis factor (cachectin) as an essential mediator in murine cerebral malaria. *Science (Wash. DC).* 237:1210–1212.

25. Andersson, M., H. Gunne, B. Agerberth, H.G. Boman, T. Bergman, R. Sillar, H. Jörnvall, V. Mutt, B. Olson, H. Wigzell, et al. 1995. NK-lysin, a novel effector peptide of cytotoxic T and NK cells. Structure and cDNA cloning of the porcine form, induction by interleukin 2, antibacterial and tumor activity. *EMBO (Eur. Mol. Biol. Organ.).* J. 14:1615–1625.

26. Grebe, S.C., and J.W. Streilein. 1976. Graft-vs-host disease. *Adv. Immunol.* 22:119–221.

27. Bennett, M. 1987. Biology and genetics of hybrid resistance. *Adv. Immunol.* 41:333–445.

28. Dennenr, G., G. Knoblach, S. Suguwara, and B. Yankelevich. 1990. Evidence for differentiation of NK.1.1+ cells into cytotoxic T cells during acute rejection of allogeneic bone marrow grafts. *Immunogenetics.* 31:161–168.

29. Kagi, D., B. Ledermann, K. Kurki, P. Seiler, B. Odermatt, K.J. Olsen, E.R. Podack, R.M. Zinkernagel, and H. Hengartner. 1994. Cytotoxicity mediated by T cells and natural killer cells is greatly impaired in perforin-deficient mice. *Nature (Lond.).* 369:31–37.

30. Russell, J.H., B. Rush, C. Weaver, and R. Wang. 1993. Mature T cells of the autoimmune lpr/lpr mice have a defect in antigen-stimulated suicide. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA.* 90:4409–4413.

31. Ogasawara, J., F.R. Watanabe, M. Adachi, A. Matsuzawa, T. Kasuga, Y. Kitamura, N. Itoh, T. Suda, and S. Nagata. 1993. Lethal effect of the anti-Fas antibody in mice. *Nature (Lond.).* 364:806–809.

32. Chu, J.L., P. Ramos, A. Rosendorff, J. Nikolić-Žugić, E. Lacy, A. Matsuzawa, and K.B. Elkon. 1995. Massive upregulation of the Fas ligand in lpr and gld mice: implications for Fas regulation and the graft-versus-host disease-like wasting syndrome. *J. Exp. Med.* 181:393–398.

33. Watanabe, D., T. Suda, H. Hashimoto, and S. Nagata. 1995. Constitutive activation of the Fas ligand gene in mouse lymphoproliferative disorders. *EMBO (Eur. Mol. Biol. Organ.).* J. 14:12–18.

34. Theofilopoulos, A.N., R.S. Balderas, Y. Gozes, M.T. Aguado, I.M. Hang, P.R. Morrow, and E.J. Dixon. 1985. Association of lpr gene with graft-vs.-host disease-like syndrome. *J. Exp. Med.* 162:1–18.

35. Tschopp, J., S. Schafer, D. Masson, M.C. Peitsch, and C. Heusser. 1989. Phosphorylcholine acts as a Ca2+-dependent receptor molecule for lymphocyte perforin. *Nature (Lond.).* 337:272–274.

36. Schulz, M., H.J. Schuurman, J. Joergensen, C. Steiner, T. Merloo, D. Kág, H. Hengartner, R. Zinkernagel, M. Schreier, K. Bürki, and B. Ledermann. 1995. Acute rejection of vascular heart allografts by perforin deficient mice. *Eur. J. Immunol.* 25:474–480.