RESEARCH ARTICLE

**Evaluation of possible biological control of *Fusarium concentricum* sp. using plant extracts and antagonistic species of microbes *in vitro* [version 2; peer review: 1 approved, 2 approved with reservations]**

Mohammed Faruk Hasan, Mohammed Asadul Islam, Biswanath Sikdar

Department of Genetic Engineering and Biotechnology, University of Rajshahi, Rajshahi, 6205, Bangladesh

---

**Abstract**

**Background:** *Fusarium concentricum* is one of the most devastating fungi responsible for fruit and vegetable crops rot worldwide. The present study was designed to find an ecofriendly control measure for pathogenic *Fusarium concentricum*, using suitable bioagents.

**Methods:** Medicinal plant extracts were evaluated for their antifungal activities against *Fusarium concentricum* using the poisoned food and serial dilution methods. Antagonistic potency of some nonpathogenic microbes was also assessed on *Fusarium concentricum* using the dual culture method.

**Results:** Highest inhibition of growth of *Fusarium concentricum* was observed with 68.1% (0.389 mg per 90 mm Petri plate) of mycelia on *Coccinia grandis* plant leaf extract, in comparison to the control grown with 100.0% (1.22 mg/dish). The tested plants extract showed MIC values ranges of 80-150 µg/ml on the isolated fungus. The highest inhibition of radial growth was observed using *Trichoderma viride* on *Fusarium concentricum* (46.01% inhibition).

**Conclusions:** The findings of present study would be benevolent for antifungal drug development to control *Fusarium concentricum* causing fruit and vegetable rot.

**Keywords**

*Fusarium* sp., Plants extract, Non-pathogenic microbes, Antagonisms, Biocontrol

---

This article is included in the [Plant Science gateway](https://doi.org/10.12688/f1000research.27098.1). Any reports and responses or comments on the article can be found at the end of the article.
Introduction

Fusarium species are a large genus of hyaline filamentous mold fungi, responsible for fruit and vegetable crop rot (Al-Najada & Gherbawy, 2015; Ziedan et al., 2018). Fusarium species are deeply invasive and can cause hematogenously disseminated infections with high mortality in neutropenic patients (Dignani & Anaissie, 2004). Numerous species of Fusarium contribute to yield loss and reduced quality to varying degrees by infection with some mycotoxins (O’Donnell et al., 2009). They also cause decay of various fruit in storage and postharvest conditions (Whiteside et al., 1988). The fruit rot caused by Fusarium incurs enormous yield losses and is often observed in fields and markets (Baria et al., 2015). The application of antagonistic agents and plant extracts in agriculture are becoming a major focus of plant protection research. Different preservatives or fungicide treatments are frequently applied to manage fruits diseases and decay, which is an alarming health concern (Munhuweyi et al., 2020). Since most chemical fungicides are highly toxic to humans and animals and they frequently cause water and soil pollution (Al-Najada & Gherbawy, 2015). Moreover, continuous and indiscriminate use is leading to the development of fungicide resistant strains of pathogens (Talinti et al., 2013). There are some previous reports on plants extract based controlling techniques in Fusarium fungi causing diseases for some crops and plants (Baria et al., 2015; Ziedan et al., 2018).

In Bangladesh, fruit rot is a destructive disease caused by Fusarium species on pre-harvest and postharvest fruits. To the best of our knowledge, there is no previous research on biological control of this pathogenic fungus. Therefore, the main objective of the study was to find an ecofriendly control system of Fusarium concentricum to decrease fruit and vegetable rot in Bangladesh.

Methods

Collection of Fusarium concentricum

A pure culture of Fusarium sp. was previously isolated and identified (Accession No. MT856371) from postharvest Citrus reticulata fruit rot (Hasan et al., 2020a). The culture was preserved at the Department of Genetic Engineering and Biotechnology, University of Rajshahi (Rajshahi, Bangladesh).

In vitro assessment of antifungal potential of selected plants

For antifungal activities screening, six healthy, mature medicinal plants, Allium sativum, Zingiber officinale, Coccinia grandis, Brassica juncea, Ocimum tenuiflorum and Hibiscus rosa-sinensis were collected from Mirzapur, Binodpur and Kajla village, Motihar, Rajshahi, Bangladesh.

Collected plants were washed with water to remove dust from the plants’ surface and dried in room temperature. Plant extract preparation and fractionation was performed according to the method by Kader et al. (2018). Different parts of selected plants- bulb of Allium sativum; rhizome of Zingiber officinale; leaves of Coccinia grandis, Brassica juncea, Ocimum tenuiflorum; and flowers of Hibiscus rosa-sinensis plants were cut into small species and ground by blender to form fine powder. The dried powder of the plants (100gm of each plant) were rinsed in methanol (500ml) using a conical flask, and were incubated in a shaking incubator with occasional shaking for fourteen days. The liquid contents were pressed through Markin cloth followed by filtration using Whatman no. 1 filter paper. Obtained filtered liquids were dehydrated in vacuo to leave a blackish and sticky mass. The extracts were collected in vials and preserved in a refrigerator at 4°C.

The inhibitory effect of different plant extracts was measured by following the poisoned food technique (Balamurugan, 2014). For this, 20µg of each plant extract was added to 20ml of potato dextrose agar (PDA) to fill a 90mm size Petri plate and mixed well. After solidification, seven day old 6 mm size fungal plug was placed in the center of the Petri plates. The Petri plates were incubated at 35°C for seven days in static condition.

Determination of minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC)

The required MIC values of selected plants extracts were measured through the serial dilution technique (Hussain et al., 2010). The extract of 1 gm of plant-based methanol leaves was dissolved into 1 ml methanol to obtain this same stock solution. Fungal suspension was taken into each test tube and added 50–150µg of plants extracts. The tested tubes were then incubated for 3 days. The progression of the isolated fungus was detected in tubes in which the strength of the substances was just below the inhibition level.

In vitro antagonistic test

For evaluation of antagonistic effects, six non-pathogenic pure microbe cultures, Escherichia coli (pathogenic), Rhizobium phaseoli, Rhizobium leguminosarum, Neofusicoccum mangifera, Trichoderma viride and Pestalotiopsis sp. were used against Fusarium concentricum. The pure microbe cultures were kindly provided by Dr. Md. Salah Uddin, Associate Professor and Director, Microbiology Lab., Department of Genetic Engineering and Biotechnology, University of Rajshahi, as the part of collaboration.

Antifungal activities of the selected plants have been included in introduction section. Uses and active constituents of the selected plants have been added in introduction section. Any further responses from the reviewers can be found at the end of the article.
To assess the antagonistic effects, the dual culture technique was used, as previously described (Vethavalli & Sudha, 2012). A mycelial disc of 6 mm diameter was cut from the periphery of both antagonist cultures and the test pathogen and placed on a Petri plate with PDA media. For the control, only the test pathogen was placed in the centre of a Petri plate. The Petri plates were incubated at 35°C in darkness.

Data analysis

The inhibition percentage of mycelial growth = \[(Gc-Gt)/Gc\] × 100; Where, Gc = Mycelial growth in terms of colony diameter in control set, Gt= Mycelial growth in terms of colony diameter in treatment set. The inhibition percentages of Fusarium species growth were calculated using the following formula: Inhibition percentage (%) =100× (dc– dt)/dc; Where, dc = radial growth of pathogen in control, dt = radial growth of pathogen in dual culture. Mean values were compared through least significant different test using SAS software, version 9.4M5 (SAS Inc., Cary, NC, USA). All the experiment and test were replicated thrice.

Results

In vitro screening of extracts presenting antifungal activity

All plant extracts showed a degree of growth inhibition of the tested fungus at the same concentrations. The highest inhibition of growth of the isolates was observed at 68.1% of mycelium on Coccinia grandis, which was followed by 64.1% on Allium sativum, in comparison to the control culture (100.0%). Hibiscus rosa-sinensis showed the lowest inhibition of mycelium with 29.6% against the fungal isolate in comparison to the control. The results are presented in Figure 1 and Figure 2.

Determination of minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC)

The tested plants extracts showed the MIC values ranges from 80-150µg/ml against the fungus Fusarium concentricum growth. Highest MIC value of isolated fungus was 80µg/ml on Coccinia grandis plant extract and lowest MIC value of isolated fungus was 150 µg/ml on Hibiscus rosa-sinensis plant extract (Figure 3).

In vitro antagonistic assay

The highest percentage inhibition of radial growth was observed with Trichoderma viride (46.01%) against Fusarium concentricum which was followed by 43.33% and 32.05% on Escherichia coli and Rhizobium phaseoli, respectively (Figure 4). The antagonistic agent Rhizobium leguminosarum did not show any inhibitory activity against the isolated fungus (Figure 4). The control group also did not show any inhibition of radial growth of Fusarium concentricum.

Discussion

Fruit rot caused by Fusarium species is very common in Bangladesh. The main objective of the present study was to study biological control measures for this fungus. Plant extracts are now a superior choice to control different plant pathogens, as reported by several previous studies (Hasan et al., 2020b; Kareem & Al-Araji, 2017; Parveen et al., 2014). In our study, we found that the plant extracts Allium sativum, Zingiber officinale, and Coccinia grandis have significant inhibitory effects on mycelial growth of Fusarium concentricum. Hosen & Shamsi (2019) also found significant antifungal activity using Allium sativum (53.85%), Ocimum sanctum (48.72%) and Zingiber officinale (49.35%) against Fusarium solani and F. oxysporum. Our current

---

**Figure 1.** Effect of different methanol plant extracts on percentage inhibition of mycelial growth of Fusarium concentricum. Mycelia were collected after seven days of incubation on potato dextrose agar at 35°C in darkness. 90 mm Petri plates were used to culture the tested fungus.
results were also supported by data from Khatun et al. (2020) and Kareem & Al-Araj (2017). In our present study, Coccinia grandis plant leave extract showed a promising MIC capability to control Fusarium concentricum fungus. Piper betle plant extracts showed a significant antifungal potency on Fusarium oxysporum (Gnanasekaran et al., 2015). For the confirmation of antagonist effects on the radial growth of the pathogen in dual culture have been previously reported by Akhtar et al. (2010). By contrast, Nasrin et al. (2018) reported 87% inhibition potency on mycelium growth of Fusarium oxysporum f. sp. lycopersici by Calotropis proceraan plant extract. In our study, Trichoderma viride, Escherichia coli, Rhizobium phaseoli and Alternaria sp. showed significant antagonistic activity against Fusarium concentricum. Trichoderma viride showed 45.88% growth inhibition on Fusarium merismoides fungi in a study by Hosen & Shamsi (2019), which support our present findings. Nasrin et al. (2018) also reported 82% inhibition radial growth by Trichoderma sp. against Fusarium oxyspo-
Figshare: Effects of different plants extract by methanol on inhibition percentages of mycelial growth of the Fusarium species, [https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13134953](https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13134953) (Hasan, 2020c).

Figshare: Effect of antagonistic agents on inhibition of mycelial growth of the Fusarium species, [https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13134962](https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13134962) (Hasan, 2020d).

Data are available under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International license](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

Acknowledgements
A previous version of this article is available on Figshare: [https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13012517](https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13012517) (Hasan, 2020e).

References

Akhtar J, Kumar V, Tiu KR, et al.: Integrated management of banded leaf and sheath blight disease of maize. *Plant Disease Research*. 2010; 25(1): 35–38.

---

**Reference Source**

---

Al-Najada AR, Gherbawy YA: Molecular Identification of Spoilage Fungi Isolated from Fruit and Vegetables and Their Control with Chitosan. *Food Biotechnol*. 2015; 29(2): 155–168.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

Balamarugaran S: *In vitro* antifungal activity of *Citrus aurantium* Linn plant extracts against phytopathogenic fungi *Macrophoma phaseolina*. *International Letters of Natural Sciences*. 2014: 13: 70–74.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

Baria TT, Patil RK, Patel JK: Ecotoxicity Management of Fusarium Fruit Rot of *Citrus*. *The Bioscan*. 2015; 10(4): 1807–1811.

**Reference Source**

---

Bashar MA, Chakma M: *In vitro* control of *Fusarium solani* and *F. oxysporum* the causative agent of brinjal wilt. *Dhaka Univ. J Biol Sci*. 2014; 23(1): 53–60.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

Dignani MC, Anaisse E: Human fusariosis. *Clin Microbiol Infect*. 2004; 10 Suppl 1: 67–75.

**PubMed Abstract | Publisher Full Text**

---

Gnanasekaran P, Sakulme SM, Panneerselvam A, et al.: *In vitro* Biological Control of *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *Cubense* by using Some Indian Medicinal Plants. *Int J Current Res and Review*. 2015; 3(11): 107–116.

**Reference Source**

---

Hasan M: Effect of plant extracts on inhibition of mycelial growth of the *Fusarium* species. *Figshare. Figure*. 2020a. [http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13096262](http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13096262)

Hasan M: Effect of antagonistic agents on inhibition of mycelial growth of the *Fusarium* species. *Figshare. Figure*. 2020b. [http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13096325](http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13096325)

Hasan M: Effects of different plants extract by methanol on inhibition percentages of mycelial growth of the *Fusarium* species. *Figshare. Dataset*. 2020c. [http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13134953.v1](http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13134953.v1)

Hasan M: Effect of antagonistic agents on inhibition of mycelial growth of the *Fusarium* species. *Figshare. Dataset*. 2020d. [http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13134962.v1](http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13134962.v1)

Hasan M: Evaluation of Possible Biological Control of *Fusarium* sp. by Plants Extract and Antagonistic Species *In Vitro*, *Figshare. Preprint*. 2020e. [http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13012517](http://www.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13012517)

Hasan MF, Islam MA, Sikdar B: First report on molecular identification of *Fusarium* species causing fruit rot of mandarin (*Citrus reticulata*) in Bangladesh (version 1; peer review: 1 approved). *F1000Res*. 2020a; 9: 1212.

**Publisher Full Text**

Hasan MF, Islam MA, Sikdar B: PCR and Sequencing Base Detection of Gummiosis Disease on *Citrus aurantium* Caused by *Leosipodioida theobromae* and Evaluation of Its Antagonisms. *J Adv Microbiol*. 2020b; 20(3): 77–90.

**Publisher Full Text**

Hosen MD, Shamsi S: *In vitro* antagonism of *Trichoderma virende* and *Aspergillus* spp. against a pathogenic seed borne fungus of sesame. *J Bangladesh Acad Sci*. 2019; 43(1): 17–23.

**Publisher Full Text**

Hussain A, Wahab S, Zarin I, et al.: Antibacterial Activity of the Leaves of *Coccinia indica* (W. and A) Wof India. *Advances in Biological Research*. 2010; 4(5): 241–248.

**Reference Source**

---

Kader SMA, Hasan M, Ahmed S, et al.: Antioxidant, Antibacterial and Cytotoxic activities of Ethanol extract and its different frictions of *Sterculia carotada* leaves. *Discovery Phytomedicine*. 2018; 5(3): 26–33.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

Kareem HJ, Al-Araji AM: Evaluation of *Trichoderma harzianum* Biological Control Against *Fusarium oxysporum* F. sp. *Melongenae*. *Journal of Science*. 2017; 58(4B): 2051–2060.

**Reference Source**

---

Khatoon MJ, Khaquezzaman KM, Naher MS, et al.: Management of *Fusarium* Wilt of Tomato by Botanicals and Biocontrol Agents and Their Effect on Yield. *Bangladesh J. Bio*. 2020; 49(1): 71–74.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

Muniruwey K, Mapi S, Sivakumar D: Extension of Avocado Fruit Postharvest Quality Using Non-Chemical Treatments. *Agronomy*. 2020; 10(2): 212.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

Nasrin L, Poddar S, Mahmud MR: Investigation of Potential Biological Control of *Fusarium oxysporum* Esp. *Lycopersici* by Plant Extracts, Antagonistic sp. and Chemical Elicitors *In Vitro*. *Fungal Genom Biol*. 2018; 8(1): 155.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

O’Donnell K, Sutton DA, Rinaldi MG, et al.: Novel multilocus sequence typing scheme reveals high genetic diversity of human pathogenic members of the *Fusarium incarnatum-F. equiseti* and *F. chlamydosporum* species complexes within the United States. *J Clin Microbiol*. 2009; 47(12): 3851–3861.

**PubMedAbstract | Publisher Full Text | Free Full Text**

---

Parveen S, Wani AH, Ganie AA, et al.: Antifungal activity of some plant extracts on some pathogenic fungi. *Archives of Phytopathology and Plant Protection*. 2014; 47(3): 279–284.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

Taffinta IY, Shehu K, Abdulganiyimu H, et al.: Isolation and Identification of Fungi Associated with the Spoilage of Sweet Orange (*Citrus Sinensis*) Fruits In Sokoto State. *Nigerian Journal of Basic and Applied Science*. 2013; 21(3): 193–6.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

Vethavalli S, Sudha SS: *In vitro* and in silico studies on biocontrol agent of bacterial strains against *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lycopersici*. *Research in Biotechnology*. 2012; 3(2): 22–31.

**Reference Source**

---

Whiteside J, Bennett J, Holtbladt K: *Usability engineering: our experience and evolution*. In: M. Helander (Ed.), *Handbook of human-computer interaction*. *New York, North Holland*, 1988; 791–817.

**Publisher Full Text**

---

Ziedan ESH, Khattab AA, Sahab AF: *New fungi causing postharvest spoilage of cucumber fruits and their molecular characterization in Egypt*. *J Plant Prot Res*. 2018; 58(4): 362–371.

**Publisher Full Text**
Open Peer Review

Current Peer Review Status: ✔️ ?? ?

Version 2

Reviewer Report 13 May 2022

https://doi.org/10.5256/f1000research.132272.r136047

© 2022 Amaresan N. This is an open access peer review report distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

✔️ Natarajan Amaresan
C. G. Bhakta Institute of Biotechnology, Uka Tarsadia University, Surat, Gujarat, India

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Reviewer Expertise: Microbial Diversity, Plant-Microbe interaction, Phytoremediation

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard.

Version 1

Reviewer Report 15 December 2021

https://doi.org/10.5256/f1000research.29932.r96967

© 2021 M. El-Zayat M. This is an open access peer review report distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

❓ Mustafa M. El-Zayat
Unit of Genetic Engineering and Biotechnology, Mansoura University, Mansoura, Egypt

This research dealt with an important topic in the safe control of the fungus Fusarium sp. that causes damage to many types of fruits without the use of chemicals that represent a danger to the environment and health.

- The author should indicate which species of Fusarium has been used.

- It is too difficult to extract 100 grams of the plant using only 500 ml methanol.
It has been mentioned that *E. coli* is not pathogenic while it is pathogenic strain.

The photos need to be somehow more clear because its resolution is low.

Is the work clearly and accurately presented and does it cite the current literature?
Yes

Is the study design appropriate and is the work technically sound?
Yes

Are sufficient details of methods and analysis provided to allow replication by others?
Partly

If applicable, is the statistical analysis and its interpretation appropriate?
No

Are all the source data underlying the results available to ensure full reproducibility?
Partly

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the results?
Yes

**Competing Interests:** No competing interests were disclosed.

**Reviewer Expertise:** Microbiology, Ecology, Nanotechnology, Phytochemistry, Fermentation technology

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard, however I have significant reservations, as outlined above.

Shaikh Jamal Uddin
Pharmacy Discipline, Life Science School, Khulna University, Khulna, Bangladesh

Authors presented the antifungal activity of some plant extract as a eco-friendly control measure for pathogenic *Fusarium* species using the poisoned food method. They found some plant extracts showed promising (>65%) inhibitory activity against *Fusarium* sp. and suggested to use as
bioagents to control fungal affected fruit and vegetable rot.

However, the authors can improve the article if they consider and revise the below points:
1. Authors did not mention any MIC values. It will be good if they included MIC values of each extracted.

2. In introduction section author might include a table on the selected plant with their traditional uses and list of active constituents.

3. In the discussion section, there is a lacking of discussion between antifungal activity of selected plant extracts and their traditional uses and reported phytoconstituents.

Is the work clearly and accurately presented and does it cite the current literature?
Yes

Is the study design appropriate and is the work technically sound?
Yes

Are sufficient details of methods and analysis provided to allow replication by others?
Yes

If applicable, is the statistical analysis and its interpretation appropriate?
Yes

Are all the source data underlying the results available to ensure full reproducibility?
Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the results?
Yes

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Reviewer Expertise: Pharmacological evaluation of ethnomedicinal plants, natural products chemistry and drug discovery

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard, however I have significant reservations, as outlined above.
Natarajan Amaresan
C. G. Bhakta Institute of Biotechnology, Uka Tarsadia University, Surat, Gujarat, India

The authors are reporting some interesting results which will be of significance to the readership however, the manuscript lacks indepth research.

The effect of the bacteria and botanical extracts should be tested in the pot studies for their effectiveness. In vitro studies alone will not warrant their suitability to be used as bioinoculants for management of pathogens.

Without the in vivo studies the work appears as shallow research. The authors may be encouraged to do pot studies and update the manuscript.

Is the work clearly and accurately presented and does it cite the current literature?
Yes

Is the study design appropriate and is the work technically sound?
Partly

Are sufficient details of methods and analysis provided to allow replication by others?
Partly

If applicable, is the statistical analysis and its interpretation appropriate?
Yes

Are all the source data underlying the results available to ensure full reproducibility?
Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the results?
Yes

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Reviewer Expertise: Microbial Diversity, Plant-Microbe interaction, Phytoremediation

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard, however I have significant reservations, as outlined above.
The benefits of publishing with F1000Research:

- Your article is published within days, with no editorial bias
- You can publish traditional articles, null/negative results, case reports, data notes and more
- The peer review process is transparent and collaborative
- Your article is indexed in PubMed after passing peer review
- Dedicated customer support at every stage

For pre-submission enquiries, contact research@f1000.com