The Effect of Street Vendors’ Activities in City Park on the Functions of Park as a Public Space

Boby Rahman, Aisa Noviani, Rizka Rosyadea
Urban and Regional Planning, Sultan Agung Islamic University, Semarang, Indonesia
bobyrahman@unissula.ac.id

Abstract. Park becomes an important element in a city development, according to its functions as an open space to support ecological, economic and social functions. One activity supporting a park in developing countries is the existence of street vendors. Such activity will result in troubles for many parties if it is not paid a good response to deal with. This study is aimed at examining the effect of street vendors on the functions of park as a public space. It used a qualitative methodology in addition to literature review analysis technique and content analysis to examine various case studies in big cities of Indonesia. The result is that street vendors’ activities have positive impacts on social and economy, but negative ones on ecology.

1. Introduction
Public space is the main aspect which must be available in the development of a city. It has an important role for urban areas, this is because the presence of public space is able to harmonize urban society lifestyles [1]. Public space is an open space which functions to accommodate activities of public society therein. Overall, the presence of public space can improve the quality of environment in urban areas. As a result, it can affect lifestyles, health and quality of life of the city dwellers, values and behavior, and become a major aspect of urban planning in the future. The existence of public space is expected to change people's life patterns for the better. For this reason, it is necessary to utilize the functions of public space. Street vendors develop in urban areas and concentrate on public areas [2]. One of the public areas often occupied by street vendors is for example, park.

The development of a city park needs to be arranged in such a way that it can provide a sense of amenities and security. A sense of security and amenities can be obtained if the arrangement of green open spaces is good [3]. In addition to the good arrangement of green open spaces, especially City Park planned by the government, a sense of security and amenity can also be obtained if there is a community role in maintaining the park’s environment, so that it can be utilized according to the park’s planning objectives. Good collaboration between the government and community can also have an impact on the age of a park, because if the park is well-maintained and utilized, it will last longer and be durable. On the other hand, if there is less cooperation in the maintenance of a park, it will be more easily damaged and does not work properly.

Dealing with the park maintenance, the presence of street vendors in a park area has impacts on the activities carried out in the park. On the other hand, it is necessary to review how the impacts that the street vendors’ activities have on the park functions, such as on ecological, social and cultural functions. By examining the impacts on several park functions, it is expected to provide the best recommendations for handling street vendors in the park.
2. Methodology
The design used in this study was multiple and parallel case study, in which several cases were observed simultaneously. This study made use of descriptive qualitative method. This is based on qualitative materials as well as secondary sources, including scientific articles, case studies and other literatures. [4] That case study is a suitable strategy when you want to analyze contemporary cases without manipulation of relevant behavior. Furthermore, case study is an investigative strategy to deeply explore a program, event, process, or individual who is bound in time and activity, by using various data collection methods in a limited period of time to collect detailed information [5]-[6]. To find answers to the research questions, we used specific actual situations.

![Figure 1. The Research Design](image)

Cases to be taken were ones occurring in the developing country, Indonesia. The cases taken have similarities in the middle of the city as well as in a mixed-use area, thus becoming a gathering place for citizens for various activities.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Street Vendors’ Activities and Functions of Park
3.1.1. Mentri Supeno Park in Semarang
Semarang is one of the developing cities in Central Java which has several urban green open spaces, such as Mentri Supeno Park or better known by the community as KB Park. As an active park, Mentri Supeno Park has various activities in it, including trading activities. The trading activities start from morning until evening. In the morning until late afternoon, many street vendors are scattered in the location around offices and schools with food commodities offered such as fried meatball and tofu, steamed fish dumpling, salad tofu and beverages, such as ice tea, fruit ice, and fruit juices while at night, the majority of vendors sell roasted corns on pedestrian areas. At certain occasions, such as during music concerts or exhibitions, the number of street vendors is increasing with various types of commodities [7], [8].

Mentri Supeno Park is an active park where various activities, such as plant exhibition, a place to hang out and relax, are available because street vendors of the park have effects on the functions of the city park. The impacts caused by street vendors depend on the types of goods being sold, for example, street vendors selling food and beverages will result in bad effects on the environment compared to those selling souvenirs or non-food items, including clothing etc., because the rubbish of food and beverages will be numerous and causing soil and air pollutions. Also, the smell from garbage heaps can damage the elements existing in the park, such as grass or plants. The impacts caused by vendors and sedentary vendors will also be different. The vendors will potentially leave more rubbish from one place to another because they move from one place to another, meanwhile the latter will leave rubbish regularly at one spot only [9].

3.1.2. Ahmad Yani Park, Gajah Mada Park, and Sri Deli Park in Medan
Studies were also conducted in Ahmad Yani Park, Gajah Mada Park, and Sri Deli Park in Medan. These parks are the ones crowded by people of Medan and street vendors activities can also be found there [10], [11]. Ahmad Yani Park functions as a hangout for routine sports and recreation activities by
students from educational foundations around the park, besides visitors of Elizabeth Hospital also use the park just to sit or chat. Ahmad Yani Park regularly organizes exhibitions of ornamental plants and pet activities which lead the number of park visitors to increase due to street vendors selling ornamental flowers. Because of its location close to public facilities, such as schools and hospitals, the number of visitors to Ahmad Yani Park is not affected by street vendors, besides selling ornamental plants but rather by the functions available around the park, that is, Elizabeth Hospital and Harapan School. Similar to Ahmad Yani Park, the number of visitors to Gajah Mada Park is not affected by street vendors' activities, because the activities in there remain alive despite a few numbers of street vendors on weekdays. Conversely, in Sri Deli Park, most people visit the park only to buy rujak (-fruit salad - snacks that are quite famous and only exist in that place) so that street vendors in Sri Deli Park greatly affect the number of park visitors. The majority of fruit salad buyers are visitors who prefer having a take-away food by drive-thru method; it is very rare for visitors who come to Sri Deli Park to take advantages of the park's functions properly. That is the reason why the number of visitors to Sri Deli Park greatly affects the functions of the park. In the park, Harapan School Students and Elizabeth Hospital visitors use the park for exercises or a break-time by having a chat among visitors; this makes the park function well in terms of social. Meanwhile, the fruit salad sellers in Sri Deli Park get an increasing income by selling the salad which is already well-known for its taste quality and can only be found in Sri Deli Park area, the activity is also a factor in increasing the number of Sri Deli park visitors.

3.1.3. Bungkul Park in Surabaya
The case study conducted in Bungkul Park area, Surabaya [12]–[16] which takes the theme of education, entertainment, and sports, this park has facilities which are complete enough to accommodate social-recreational activities in it as a public space. The diversity of existing facilities at Bungkul Park makes the diversity of activities which occurs, so as to increase the number of visitors to Bungkul Park, but frequently due to the diversity, it makes the park incompatible with the space functions. The number of park visitors will also be followed by the presence of many street vendors, especially at certain times, such as weekends. Street vendors sell in strategic areas and at the centers of activities or crowds so that it drags the intensity of visitors to come close and see the street vendors. The fact that street vendors randomly choose locations to sell forms irregular patterns due to their scrambling struggles for places to sell.

The existence of street vendors in Bungkul Park makes it more alive and crowded by visitors so that the economic income of sellers also increases. The existence of street vendors also affects social function of the park where there is an interaction between sellers and buyers as well as among buyers themselves who are doing activities in the park. In addition to that, it is necessary to arrange trading facilities, for example, by providing carts in order to be more neat and orderly so as to provide more spaces or access for park visitors to freely move about their activities.

3.2. The Effects of Street Vendors’ Activities on the Functions of the Park
Based on the results of theory and case study discussion, it can be seen that street vendors’ activities can have effects on the functions of a park. The existence of sedentary and semi-sedentary vendors generally leaves rubbish at one point, compared to that of mobile vendors who potentially leave more rubbish from one place to another, due to their nomadic nature. This certainly affects the functions of the park in terms of ecological and aesthetic functions, because the rubbish can cause odors and soil contamination, thereby reducing amenities, access and connectivity, utilization and social activities, and reducing the aesthetic beauty of the park. Whereas, in terms of groups of service users, generally upper class society plays roles as park visitors, while the middle and lower classes are majority as consumers because street vendors generally offer goods and services at relatively affordable prices. These groups of service users can affect social and economic functions; this is due to the intensity of social activities, types of activities, and the diversity of park utilization. From economic standpoint, there has been an increase in the number of diverse visitors of the park.
Street vendors generally tend to choose locations in the centers of crowd, because they find it easier to reach consumers. The scale of this service can affect social function, because it is related to the accessibility of the city park. If it has a good accessibility, it will encourage the utilization of public spaces by diverse users. Dealing with service times, street vendors adjust to consumer activities, where in the morning until afternoon, street vendors are scattered in locations around offices and schools. This can affect ecological function, because it is related to the irregular distribution patterns of street vendors' activities. This will cause traffic, air pollution caused by vehicle emissions, reducing amenities and disrupting road access. For trade types, street vendors tend to adjust to the location of activities which is visited by many people. This can affect social function, because trade type, such as traditional food can express local cultures. For more details, the following chart displays the effect of street vendors' activities in City Park on the functions of a park as a public space.

**Figure 2.** Result the effect of street vendors’ activities in city park on the functions of park as a public space

From figure 2, it can be seen that street vendors' activities which cause problems are those related to service characteristics and times. The effort of managing street vendors is required to make, such as providing street vendors with location to do their activities. This is aimed at maximizing the use of space in the park in accordance with its functions and existing activities. The arrangement of street circulation areas, parks, and street vendors affects the amenities of these activities. In addition, providing trading physical facilities, such as carts or overhaul tents is needed so that it looks neater and street vendors can bring their commodities with them when trading time is over, eventually the park remains clean from their activities. Besides, facilities supporting street vendors’ activities, such as sanitation, garbage bins and other recommendations to control their activities, should be provided so that the quality of the park environment is maintained. And lastly, the government needs to set policies related to the regulation on times when street vendors can do their activities as an effort to optimize the functions of park as a public space. This is aimed at preventing traffic jams and avoiding street access disruption around the park during busy hours.

### 4. Conclusions

From the results of discussion, it can be concluded that several conclusions about the effect of street vendors’ activities in city park on the functions of park as a public space, namely:
1. City park has several functions, including ecological function, social function, economic function and aesthetic function. Ecological function is related to the quality of a city park environment, where good environmental quality can be measured from the components of public space attributes, such as amenities, access and connectivity, utilization and social activities. Meanwhile, social function relates to the intensity of social activities, duration of activity, variation in the utilization (types of activities), and diversity the utilization of park. Furthermore, economic function refers to an increasing number of diverse visitors, either gender diversity, age, or other characteristics. Next, aesthetic function aims to increase amenities, beautify the city environment, stimulate the citizens’ creativity and productivity, form the beauty factors, and create a harmonious and balanced atmosphere between areas which either have been built or haven’t been built yet.

2. Street vendors’ activities are a part of city park service facilities. The existence of street vendors related to the nature of services and service times may have negative effects on the functions of city parks. On the other hand, the existence of street vendors is considered to be able to increase visitors to the parks and create an atmosphere of a city park area to be more alive.

3. Street vendors’ activities have negative effects on the functions of a park in terms of ecological and aesthetic functions. The activities related to the nature of services and service times can affect ecological function due to the presence of street vendors who generally leave rubbish either at one spot or from one place to another. Consequently, the rubbish causes odors and soil pollutions, reduces the amenities of park visitors, disrupts access and connectivity, and reduces the intensity of utilization and social activities in the park. In addition, dealing with the irregular distribution patterns of street vendors’ activities, this may cause traffic and air pollution caused by vehicle emissions, reduce amenities and disrupt road access around the park. In addition, the nature of service of street vendors’ activities can also have a negative effect on aesthetic function, that is, it reduces the beauty of the park and disrupts the amenities of the park visitors. Whereas, street vendors’ activities related to service users, service scales and types of trade can have positive effects on the functions of the park in terms of social and economic functions. This is because the intensity of social activities, types of activities, and the diversity of park utilization increase. In addition, social and economic functions are also related to urban park accessibility. If it has good accessibility, it will encourage the utilization of public spaces by diverse users. Consequently, the number of visitors to city parks increases.

References
[1] Kustianingrum D, Sukarya A K, Nugraha R A and Rachadi F 2013 Fungsi dan Aktifitas Taman Ganeshas Sebagai Ruang Publik di Kota Bandung Jurnal Reka Karsa 1(2) 1–14
[2] Graaff K and Ha N 2015 Street Vending in the Neoliberal City: A Global Perspective on the Practices and Policies of a Marginalized Economy (New York City: Berghahn Books) 2
[3] Etingingsih E 2016 Fungsi Taman Kota Sebagai Ruang Publik (Studi di Taman Merdeka Kota Metro) (Lampung City: Universitas Lampung) 80
[4] Yin K R 2002 Studi Kasus Design dan Metode (Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada) 2
[5] Creswell J W 2017 Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches (New York City: Sage Publications) 29
[6] Stake R 1995 The Art Of Case Studi Research (New York City: Sage Publications) 37
[7] Putri A R 2017 Pembentukan Ruang Aktivitas Pada Ruang Terbuka Publik Taman Menteri Supeno (Semarang City: Universitas Islam Sultan Agung) 61
[8] Marshalita H, Sari S R and Setyowati E 2018 Faktor – Faktor Yang Menyebabkan Terjadinya Perubahan Fungsi PURWARUPA 2(1) 59–66
[9] Putri A R, Yuliani E and Rahman B 2017 Pembentukan Ruang Aktivitas Sosial Pada Ruang Terbuka Publik Taman Menteri Supeno Jurnal Planologi 14(2) 135–149
[10] Putra N E, Lumbantoruan F D and Alamsyah B 2018 Konsep Penataan Urban Park sebagai Taman Komunitas di Kota Medan Jurnal Pembang. Perkota 6(1) 1–7
[11] Ginting S W 2004 Pengaruh Keberadaan Pedagang Kaki Lima Terhadap Jumlah Pengunjung Taman Kota di Kota Medan J. Tek. Simetrika 3(4) 1–10
[12] Puspasari R, Ernawati J and Suryasari N 2015 Pola Aktivitas Pada Ruang Publik Taman
Bungkul Surabaya J. Mhs. Jur Arsit 4(2) 17–24

[13] Yuliasari I 2016 Profil Pedagang Kaki Lima Dan Evaluasi Kebijakan SOSIO-E-KONS 8(2) 81–90

[14] Badi’ah M 2016 Taman Bungkul Tahun 2007-2015 AVATAR, e-Journal Pendidik. Sej 4(2) 452–467

[15] Tjahjoko A 2018 Urban Tourism for Taman Bungkul as Tourist Destination in Surabaya Hosp. Tour 1(1) 14–25

[16] Putra F A 2018 Keterkaitan Antara Kualitas Pedagang Kaki Lima Dengan Kualitas Taman di Taman Bungkul Kota Surabaya (Malang City : Universitas Brawijaya) 65