The Moderating Effect of Job Satisfaction to Work Motivation and Employees’ Performance

Abdul Majid¹*, Mega Barokatul Fajri², Elvina Assadam³, Devi Febrianti⁴

¹,²,³,⁴ Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Muhammadiyah Lamongan, Lamongan

*Corresponding author:
Email: majidumla1@gmail.com

Abstract
Work satisfaction and motivation have been believed to directly connect to employee performance. These two indicators are potential to either decrease or increase the level of performance, how many items an employee can meet in an accordance with company terms. Employee with well-satisfaction may be motivated to show up their maximum performance while working, which consequently increase company performance or organization after all. This study aims to analyze job satisfaction in moderating the effect of work motivation on employee performance. This research uses a quantitative research approach by means of a survey research. The population of this study were all employees of Hotel Paradise Batu, so that the sampling used total sampling technique. Descriptive data and moderated regression were used as data analysis. The results show that work motivation has an effect on employee performance, work motivation and satisfaction have a positive and significant effect on employee performance, and job satisfaction moderates the interaction of work motivation and employee performance

Keywords: work satisfaction, work motivation, employee performance

I. INTRODUCTION
Performance improvement is something that is desired by both the company and all employees. Employers want their employees' performance to be good for the benefit of increasing work results and company profits. On the other hand, workers have an interest in self-development from job promotion. There are many factors that can affect employee or employee performance. The factors that affect performance according to Mathis & Jackson (2011) are the ability, motivation, support or encouragement received, the existence of the work done and the relationship with the organization or company. Bangun (2012) also states that employee performance is the level of achievement of a person's job based on job requirements or work standards which is the level expected for a particular job to be completed and continues to be compared with the goals or targets to be achieved or reached.

Running a company in the hospitality sector is required to continue to make improvements in various aspects, especially in the human resources sector. One of the companies engaged in hotel services is Hotel Paradise, located at Jalan Diponegoro 06,
Batu City. The company was founded in 2010 with a strategic location on the side of
the main road to Batu city, which is the right location for a stopover and overnight.
Hotel Batu Paradise has rooms with a total of 60 rooms and employees with a total of
45 people. Hotel Batu Paradise divides its room classes into five categories, namely
juna, superior, exclusive, royal and deluxe. The staff at this hotel are also divided into
several departments, namely the housekeeping, food and beverage, and the front office
department.

Performance improvement is not only influenced by motivation but also
influenced by the level of employee satisfaction, because satisfaction with supervision
also has a significant correlation with motivation where a manager provides treatment
and motivates workers through sharing efforts to increase job satisfaction. Job
satisfaction is an affective or emotional response in various aspects of a person's job
(Kreitner, R & Kinicki, 2014). Employee job satisfaction can be seen through a sense
of fairness and remuneration that workers deserve (compensation), job placement in
accordance with work skills, work atmosphere and environment, the nature of the
leader and the monotonous nature of the job.

There are some imperative studies related to this research. Irwansyah (2019)
explains that job satisfaction can moderate the effect of work motivation on employee
performance. Devi and Sulistywati's research (2018) also explain that job satisfaction
mediates in improving company performance. Not only that research, Nadhiroh (2019)
concludes that company performance is increasing, it is also necessary to increase
company work motivation, not only work motivation but job satisfaction as well, and it
becomes a moderator in improving company performance. Riskayani (2017) shares the
results of his research that job satisfaction can mediate employee performance.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

Work Motivation

Motivation is "an impulse need in an employee that needs to be met so that the
employee can adapt to his environment". Motivation can move employees to be able to
achieve goals (Mangkunegara, 2015). Employee performance will increase if there is
morale in employees and that enthusiasm arises when company leaders provide
motivation fairly and wisely both morally and materially. According to Wibowo
(2015) states that "Motivation is one of the causes or determinants of behavior. Indeed,
a behavior is a motivation to achieve goals ". Rivai (2015) is "An expertise in directing
employees and companies to want to work successfully, so that the desires of
employees and company goals are achieved at the same time. Motivation as energy to
generate impulses in oneself.

The company expects employees who are active and have the desire to achieve
optimal work results, not only capable and skilled. Motivation is a series of attitudes
that influence individuals to achieve specific things in accordance with individual
goals. This attitude can provide strength to encourage individuals to behave in
achieving goals. For a leader, motivation is an important tool in improving employee performance.

**Work Satisfaction**

Job satisfaction is an expression of a person's feelings or attitudes towards his job, to promotion opportunities, relationships with colleagues, supervision and feelings of satisfaction with the work itself (Titisi, 2014, p. 18). Job satisfaction reflects more on nature than behavior. According to Handoko (2014, p. 193) explains that job satisfaction is a pleasant emotional state when employees carry out their respective jobs.

Mangkunegara (2017) states that job satisfaction is a feeling that supports or does not support employees who are related to their work or their condition. Employees will feel satisfied at work if aspects of the job and aspects of themselves support, and vice versa if these aspects do not support the employees will feel dissatisfied. Robbins (2015, p. 149) describes five factors that can measure job satisfaction, including: First, satisfaction with salaries, employees want a wage system and promotion policies that they perceive are fair, unquestionable and in line with their expectations. Wages are said to be fair if they are based on job demands, individual skill levels and community wage standards. This is likely to result in employee satisfaction.

Second is satisfaction with promotion. Satisfaction will be able to develop through promotions. A person will be able to feel the possibility of being promoted or not. The process of promotion that is open or less open can also affect a person's level of satisfaction. The third is satisfaction with colleagues. This satisfaction will be obtained when conducting social interactions with colleagues. Colleagues who are clever and can support socially can affect the level of satisfaction at work. The fourth is satisfaction with superiors. A boss is someone who always gives orders or instructions in carrying out work. The way the boss leads or behaves can affect a person's satisfaction. The fifth is satisfaction with the job itself. Employees prefer jobs that provide opportunities for them to use their skills and abilities. Less challenging jobs create boredom, while challenging jobs can lead to frustration and feelings of failure. In moderate challenging conditions, most employees will experience pleasure.

**Employee Performance**

The term performance comes from the word Job Performance or Actual Performance (actual work performance or achievement achieved by a person). The definition of performance (work performance) is the quality and quantity of work achieved by an employee in carrying out his duties in accordance with the responsibilities assigned to him. Mangkunegara (2012, p. 67) says the definition of performance is: "The work results in quality and quantity achieved by an employee in carrying out his duties in accordance with the responsibilities given to him. Performance according to Wirawan (2015) is "output produced by functions or indicators of a job or a profession within a certain time". Meanwhile, according to
Marthis and Jackson (2006, p. 378) "Performance is basically what is done or not done by employees".

Performance measurement can only be made against real and measurable performance. If the performance cannot be measured then the performance cannot be managed. To be able to improve performance it is necessary to know what the current performance is like. If the deviation of performance can be measured then the performance can be improved. According to Wibowo (2007, p. 52) the right measurement can be done in a way. First, the quality of work, how far / well the process or results of carrying out the activity are close to perfection, in terms of conformity with the ideal way of carrying out an activity or meeting the objectives desired by an activity. Second, by looking at the quantity of work, labor: the amount produced, expressed in dollar value, the number of units, or the number of activity cycles that have been completed. Third, with the timeliness, how far / well an activity is completed, or the results produced, at the earliest desired time from the point of view of coordination with other outputs and maximizing the available time for other activities.

Hypothesis Development

The research framework draws the conceptual relation of each variable which is built to match the formula of research questions. This development is intended to make it easier for discussion related to the link between motivation for employee performance. It also shows how motivation as an independent variable contributes to job satisfaction and enlighten its role as a moderating variable to strengthen their influences on employee performance. Motivation relies on the theory of ERG Alderfer which consists of existence, networking and growing need. Robbins (2015) that is including quality, quantity, and punctuality becomes the main theory of employee performance. Meanwhile, work satisfaction is formulated based on the theory of Luthans (2012), which informs feeling satisfy on salary, promotion, coworker, and about their job. Simply, the following figure would present the design of research framework.

Fig 1. Conceptual Framework
According to Robbins & Judge (2017) motivation is the desire to do something and determine the ability to act to meet individual needs. With all these needs, someone is required to be more active and active in working, because with someone who has a higher motivation in doing his job, the performance of someone in the company will increase and the company's targets can be achieved.

This research is relevant to the research results of Ali et al (2016) which state that one of the factors that affect employee performance is the motivational factor, where motivation is a condition that moves a person to strive to achieve goals or achieve what they want. The results of this study are in line with Josep's (2015) research; Ghaffari & Nazri (2017); Sandhu et al (2017); Kuswati (2020); Ghaffari et al (2020) who show that motivation triggers an increase in company performance. This means that the company's performance will increase because of the motivation from within the company. So that the hypothesis that can be proposed in this study:

H1: Motivation has a significant effect on performance

The results of research conducted by Noermijiti & Primasari (2015); and Palar (2016) state that the results of motivation and satisfaction have a significant effect on improving company performance. Adam & Kamase's research results (2019) job satisfaction has a positive and significant effect on employee performance. Competence has a positive and insignificant effect on employee performance through job satisfaction. Then the significant motivation and positive influence on performance is mediated by job satisfaction. The results of this study are relevant to the research of Aryanta et al (2019); Pananrangin (2020) which also explains the results which show that motivation and satisfaction have a positive and significant effect on performance.

H2: Motivation and satisfaction have a significant effect on performance.

According to Wibowo (2015) motivation has a significant relationship with performance and satisfaction as a correlation, because satisfaction and supervision also have a significant relationship with motivation. The occurrence of job satisfaction is caused by work performance or performance so that more productive workers will get job satisfaction. Results of research conducted by Ardiaza & Noemijati (2017); Sugama (2017); and Otto (2018) explains that job satisfaction has an influence between motivation on company performance. The results of this study are relevant to the research results of Al-Musadieq et al (2018) which explain that company performance is increasing even though job satisfaction is the driving force for companies to increase. Thus, satisfaction has a positive effect on company performance. So that the hypothesis that can be proposed is.

H3: Satisfaction moderates the influence of motivation on performance.

III. METHODS

This research is a survey research, which looks directly at the location of the hotel and then distributes questionnaires to collect the data needed by researchers. The sample in this study were all employees of Hotel Paradise Batu as many as 45
respondents. Before the questionnaire was administered to the target sample, the instrument was piloted to 25 employees from another hotel which shared the same characteristics. Measurements in this study using a Likert scale by giving a questionnaire that there are five alternative choices ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree. The technique used in this research is using descriptive statistics to describe the data obtained in the field and using moderation regression analysis.

IV. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Descriptive Statistics

The statistical descriptive result of work motivation at Hotel Paradise Batu has an average value of 158.75, which is in the high category. This may imply that work motivation in hotels is high, because it is based on high encouragement for salary/wages, work safety and protection, relationships with direct superiors, and potential development for employees. High motivation encourages employees to work better.

The results of the statistical descriptive study as a whole on the job satisfaction variable reached an average value of 143.2. This score reflects the criteria for a sufficient gain. This condition indicates that the employee feels quite satisfied with the work done. This means that employees are quite satisfied with the salary or other financial components provided, quite satisfied with the opportunity for promotion, quite satisfied with social relations with colleagues at the hotel, quite satisfied with the work done, and quite satisfied with relationships with superiors.

Furthermore, the statistical descriptive results on employee performance, the value obtained is 99.67 and belongs to the low category where the low scores range from 81–116. This means that employee performance in the three departments, they are the front office department, housekeeping and food and beverage, is low. Low performance is indicated by the delay in completing work, the mismatch of work quality, and the inability of employees to achieve the quantity set by the hotel in serving guests.

Moderation of Regression Analysis

Moderated regression analysis is used to determine the effect of the independent variable on the dependent variable with the moderating variable. In this study, testing was conducted to analyze the effect of work motivation on employee performance with job satisfaction as a moderating variable. The moderating variable in the study is the interaction between the independent variables, namely the variables of work motivation and job satisfaction. The results of the test are:

| Variable                  | Coefficient Regression | t-count | Sig  |
|---------------------------|------------------------|---------|------|
| Work Motivation (X)       | 1,823                  | 8,414   | 0,000|
| Work Satisfaction (Z)     | 0,827                  | 3,680   | 0,001|

https://ijstm.inarah.co.id
The determination of R in this study was 0.714. That is, 71.4% of employee performance variables are explained by work motivation variables, job satisfaction, and the interaction between work motivation and job satisfaction, the remaining 28.6% is explained by other variables outside of this study. The value on the determination of R defines the role of the relationship between the independent variable and the dependent variable. In table 4.12, the value of R² is 50.7% while in table 4.13, this value reaches 71.4%. The increase in the percentage indicates that the addition of a moderating variable is useful for strengthening the equation of the relationship between work motivation and job satisfaction on employee performance. This is based on an increase in the percentage value of determination R² by 20.7% after the moderating variable is included in the equation. Thus, it can be explained that the job satisfaction variable is a moderator in the relationship between work motivation and employee performance.

V. CONCLUSION

Conclusion

Work motivation is a way for leaders to influence the behavior of their members to be able to work together in completing work more productively to achieve organizational goals (Hasibuan, 2016). Based on the results of the scale range analysis, the work motivation provided by the Batu Paradise hotel is high, this high motivation can further encourage employees to show good working morale, indicators of work motivation assessment are the need for existence, the need to establish relationships, the need for growth. Employee job satisfaction is an emotional reaction or the employee's perspective on the work done. Based on the results of the scale range analysis, job satisfaction at Batu Paradise Hotel is in the sufficient category. This means that so far employees have been quite satisfied with the salary given, promotional opportunities offered, cooperative colleagues, and feelings about work. This condition shows that employees 'expectations of the job with its implementation are quite appropriate, because companies tend to be able to fulfill employees' desires to encourage employees to complete work. This is also similar to the theory presented by (Sutrisno, 2016), which states that job satisfaction arises because of the desired expectations and the reality felt by employees. The results of the scale range analysis, employees reveal the results of a low scale range. This means that employees are often late in completing work. Front office employees performed poorly on service delivery, where they served more than 10 minutes per guest. Similar to front office employees, housekeeping employees also showed low work performance on
room cleaning. Referring to work standards, cleaning the room should be done before 20 minutes, but this is not done according to the standards set.

This incident was in accordance with the finding that a hotel visitor had submitted a complaint to the front office regarding the delay in cleaning the room. Furthermore, time ineffectiveness is also shown by employees of the food and beverage department, they are often late in serving food. This condition also supports what is described in the research discussion. The results of t test analysis on simple linear regression testing show that there is a positive relationship between work motivation and employee performance, and this positive relationship reveals that the higher the work motivation that is practiced at Batu Paradise Hotel, the higher the employee's performance will be.

The results of this study are similar to that of Joseph's (2015) research, the result is that work motivation has a positive and significant effect on employee performance. The company's ability to practice work motivation is able to monitor employee behavior independently, the impact is that employees will voluntarily show good work performance. The test results of multiple linear regression analysis show that simultaneously and partially the variables of work motivation and job satisfaction have a significant effect on employee performance in the Batu Paradise hotel. Simultaneous test shown in the F test results and partially shown in the t test. Increased work motivation and job satisfaction will also be followed by an increase in employee performance. The results of this study are supported by the results of research proposed by Noermijiti & Primasari (2015); Palar (2016); and Adam & Kamase (2019), which revealed that simultaneously the variables of work motivation and job satisfaction have a positive and significant effect on employee performance.

Based on the moderation test of the moderated regression analysis, it shows that job satisfaction moderates the effect of work motivation on employee performance. The moderating variable (the interaction between work motivation and job satisfaction variables) increases by 20.7% of the percentage of the relationship between work motivation, job satisfaction and employee performance. The result of linear regression analysis was 50.7%, whereas when the moderating variable was added, the percentage increased to 70.4%.

The results of this study indicate a positive and significant influence of job satisfaction variables on the influence of work motivation on employee performance at Paradise Batu Hotel. Mean that job satisfaction is to strengthen the relationship between work motivation and employee performance. If the interaction between work motivation and job satisfaction is higher, the employee's performance will also increase. The results of this study also support research conducted by Ardiaza & Noemijiti (2017); Otto (2018); and Al-Musadieq (2018).

Recommendation

Based on the results and discussion, the following conclusions can be drawn. First, the results of the descriptive statistical analysis show that employees of Hotel Paradise Batu have high work motivation, employees of Hotel Paradise Batu have
sufficient job satisfaction, and employee performance at Hotel Paradise Batu is low. The two results of moderation show that work motivation has a partial effect on employee performance at Hotel Paradise Batu, work motivation and job satisfaction simultaneously and partially affect employee performance at Hotel Paradise Batu. Job motivation, job satisfaction, and the interaction between work motivation and job satisfaction simultaneously and partially affect employee performance at Hotel Paradise Batu. And job satisfaction moderates the influence of work motivation and employee performance at Hotel Paradise Batu.

REFERENCES

[1] Adam, F & Kamase, J. (2019). The Effect Competence and Motivation to Satisfaction and Performance. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 8(3), 132–140.

[2] Al-Musadieq, R. M., Solimun, K., Fernandes, S. A. R., & A. (2018). The mediating effect of Work Motivation on the Influence of Job Design and Organizational Culture Against HR Performance. *Journal of Management Development*, 37(6), 452–469. https://doi.org/https://10.1108/jmd-07-20170239

[3] Ali, A., Bin, L. Z., Piang, H. J., & Ali, Z. (2016). The Impact of Motivation on The Employee Performance and Job Satisfaction in IT Park (Software House) Sector of Peshawar, Pakistan. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 6(9), 297–310.

[4] Ardiaz, F., Sudiro, A., & N. (2017). Pengaruh Motivasi Kerja dan Gaya Kepemimpinan Transformasional terhadap Kinerja Karyawan Dimediasi Kepuasan Kerja (Studi pada PT Bank Rakyat Indonesia (Persero) Tbk Kantor Cabang Malang Marthadinata). *Jurnal Bisnis Dan Manajemen*, 4(1), 10–23.

[5] Aryanta, I. K., Setiari, N. W., & Yasa, P. N. S. (2019). Influence of Motivation on Job Stress, Job Satisfaction and Job Performance at Alam Puri Villa Art Museum and Resort Denpasar. *Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Bisnis Jagaditha*, 6(2), 113–120. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22225/jj.6.2.1353.113-120

[6] Bangun, W. (2012). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Erlangga.

[7] Devi, P.S.C & Sulistyawati, E. (2018). Peran Customer Satisfaction Memediasi Pengaruh Online Trust terhadap Repurchase Intention pada Customer Florist Online di Kota Denpasar. *E-Jurnal Manajemen Unud*, 7(6), 2856–2886. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24843/EJMUNUD.2018.v7.i06.p1

[8] Ghaffari, S., Burgoyne, J. & Nazri, M. (2017). The Influence of Motivation on Job Performance: A Case Study at Universiti the Influence of Motivation on Job Performance: A Case Study at Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Australian. *Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences*, 11(4), 92–99.

[9] Ghaffari, S., Shah, I. Mad., & John, B. J. R. S. (2020). The Influence of Motivation on Job Performance: A Case Study at Universiti Teknologi Malaysia the Influence of Motivation on Job Performance: Universiti Teknologi Malaysia A Case Study at Australian. *Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences*, 11(4), 92–99.

[10] Handoko, T. H. (2014). *Manajemen* (Edisi 12). Yogyakarta: BPFE Yogyakarta.

[11] Hasibuan, M. S. P. (2016). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* (Edisi Revi). Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.

[12] Irwansyah. (2019). Pengaruh Kepuasan Kerja dalam Memoderasi Motivasi Kerja dan Penggajian Menurut Perspektif Islam terhadap Kinerja Karyawan PT. BNI Syariah Cabang Makassar. *Jurnal Ekonomi, Manajemen, Dan Akuntansi (Assets)*, 9(1), 49–65. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24252/v9i1.10127
[13] Joseph, O. B. (2015). The effect of employees’ motivation on organizational performance. *Journal of Public Administration and Policy Research.*, 7(4), 62–75. https://doi.org/10.5897/JPAPR2014.0300

[14] Kreitner, R & Kinicki, A. (2014). *Perilaku Organisasi* (Edisi 9). Jakarta: Salemba Empat.

[15] Kuswati, Y. (2020). The Effect of Motivation on Employee Performance. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute-Journal (BIRCI-Journal)*, 3(2), 995–1002. https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v3i2.928

[16] Luthans, F. (2012). *Organizational Behavior* (Edisi 7). New York: McGraw-Hill.

[17] Mangkunegara, A. A. P. (2012). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.

[18] Mangkunegara, A. A. P. (2015). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perusahaan* (Cetakan Ke). Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.

[19] Mangkunegara, A. A. P. (2017). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perusahaan*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.

[20] Mathis, L. R & Jackson, H. J. (2006). *Human Resource Management*. Ja: Salemba Empat.

[21] Mathis, L. R & Jackson, H. J. (2011). *Human Resource Management* (Edisi 10). Jakarta: Salemba Empat.

[22] Nadhiroh, U. (2019). Pengaruh Motivasi dan Kepuasan Kerja terhadap Kinerja Karyawan dengan Budaya Organisasi Sebagai Variabel Moderating pada Koperta Langgeng Mulyo Ngancar Kediri. *Develop*, 3(1), 61–77. https://doi.org/10.25139/dev.v3i1.1531

[23] Noermijiti & Primasari. (2015). The Effect of Job Stress and Job Motivation on Employees’ Performance Through Job Satisfaction (A study at PT. Jasa Marga (Persero) Tbk. Surabaya - Gempol branch). *Journal of Economics Business and Accountancy Ventura*, 18(2), 231–240.

[24] Otto. (2018). Moderating Effect of Organizational Citizenship Behavior on the Effect of Organizational Commitment, Transformational Leadership and Work Motivation on Employee Performance. *International Journal of Law and Management*, 60(4), 953–964. https://doi.org/10.1108/ijlma-03-2017-0026

[25] Palar, A. (2016). The Effect of Work Motivation and Jobsatisfaction on Employee Performance at Banksulutgo Tomohon. *Jurnal Bilingual Ilmiah Efisiensi*, 16(3), 562–572.

[26] Pananrangi, M., Lewangka, O & Sudirman, I. (2020). The Influence of Motivation and Job Satisfaction on Employee Performance in PT. Son Karella Mare. *Hasanuddin Journal of Applied Business and Entrepreneurship*, 3(2), 20–32. https://doi.org/10.26487/hjabe.v3i2.316

[27] Riskayani, N. (2017). Pengaruh Stres Kerja dan Motivasi terhadap Kinerja Pegawai Melalui Kepuasan Kerja. *Jurnal Riset Sains Dan Manajemen*, 1(2), 151–164. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.1174938

[28] Rivai, V. (2015). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia untuk Perusahaan*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.

[29] Robbins, S. & Judge, T. . (2017). *Organizational Behavior* (Edisi 13.). Jakarta: Salemba Empat.

[30] Robbins, S. (2015). *Perilaku Organisasi*. Jakarta: Salemba Empat.

[31] Sandhu, M. A., Ali, W., Iqbal, J., & Tufail, S, M. (2017). Effect of Employee Motivation on Employee Performance. *Journal of Business and Social Review in Emerging Economies*, 3(1), 91–102. https://doi.org/10.26710/jbsee.v3i1.182

[32] Sugama, I. D. G. Y. (2017). Pengaruh Stres Kerja dan Motivasi terhadap Kinerja Pegawai Melalui Kepuasan Kerja Sebagai Variabel Intervening Studi pada Unit Layanan Pengadaan (ULP) Provinsi Bali. *Jurnal Ekonomi & Bisnis*, 4(1), 11–26. https://doi.org/10.22225/jj.4.1.205.11-26

[33] Sutrisno, E. (2016). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Penerbit Kencana.
[34] Titisari, P. (2014). *Peranan Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB): dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Karyawan*. Jakarta: Mitra Wacana Media.

[35] Wibowo. (2007). *Manajemen Kinerja*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.

[36] Wibowo. (2015). *Perilaku dalam Organisasi* (Edisi Kedu). Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada.

[37] Wirawan. (2015). *Evaluasi Kinerja Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Salemba Empat.