Oral Salmonella: Malaria Circumsporozoite Recombinants Induce Specific CD8+ Cytotoxic T Cells

By Anita Aggarwal,* Sanjai Kumar,§ Richard Jaffe,* David Hone,§ Mitchell Gross,‖ and Jerald Sadoff*  

From the *Department of Bacterial Diseases, Walter Reed Army Institute of Research, Washington, DC 20307; the ‖Laboratory of Parasitic Diseases, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, Maryland 20892; the §Center for Vaccine Development, University of Maryland School of Medicine, Baltimore, Maryland 21201; and the ‖Department of Molecular Genetics, Smith Kline and French Laboratories, Swedeland, Pennsylvania 19406

Summary

Oral immunization with an attenuated Salmonella typhimurium recombinant containing the full-length Plasmodium berghei circumsporozoite (CS) gene induces protective immunity against P. berghei sporozoite challenge in the absence of antibody. We found that this immunity was mediated through the induction of specific CD8+ T cells since in vivo elimination of CD8+ cells abrogated protection. In vitro studies revealed that this Salmonella–P. berghei CS recombinant induced class I–restricted CD8+ cytotoxic T cells that are directed against the P. berghei CS peptide epitope spanning amino acids 242–253. This is the same peptide that previously was identified as the target of cytotoxic T lymphocytes (CTL) induced by sporozoite immunization. Salmonella–P. falciparum CS recombinants were constructed that contained either the full-length CS gene or a repeatless gene consisting of CS flanking sequences. Both of these vaccines were able to induce CD8+ CTL directed against P. falciparum CS peptide 371–390, which is identical to the target of CTL induced by sporozoites and vaccinia CS recombinants. These results directly demonstrate the ability of an intracellular bacteria such as Salmonella to induce class I–restricted CD8+ CTL and illustrate the importance of CD8+ CTL in immunity to malaria.

Malaria occurs in hundreds of millions of people and kills one to two million children every year (reviewed in reference 1). A vaccine to prevent malaria is needed because control measures, including the use of antibiotics and insecticides, have been ineffective in most parts of the developing world. Under experimental conditions, humans have been protected from Plasmodium falciparum malaria by immunization with the bites of hundreds of infected mosquitoes that have been irradiated (2). Animals can also be immunized in this manner or by the direct injection of radiation-attenuated sporozoites (3). This protection is mediated in part by antibodies, some of which are directed against the repeat region of the circumsporozoite (CS) protein, which covers the sporozoite surface (4–7). Early animal experiments, however, also demonstrated that μ-suppressed mice, which lack B cells and circulating Igs, could be immunized with radiation-attenuated sporozoites, indicating that T cells alone are sufficient for sporozoite-induced immunity in mice (8). This cellular immunity is more potent than antibody against the repeat region of the circumsporozoite protein in terms of the numbers of sporozoites that can be protected against (9).

Recent work has shown that in some mouse strains after immunization with radiation-attenuated sporozoites, CD8+ T cells (cytotoxic/suppressors) are induced that are involved in protection against malaria. Protection can be eliminated by in vivo depletion of CD8+ T cells (10, 11). CTL from P. berghei–immunized mice recognize the CS protein on the surface of infected hepatocytes and eliminate these cells from the culture in a genetically restricted manner (12). P. falciparum sporozoites have been shown to induce circumsporozoite protein–specific CD8+ CTL (13), and the epitope these CTL are directed against has been mapped to amino acid position 370–391. More recently, cloned cytotoxic T cell lines directed against P. berghei CS protein (position 249–260) have been shown to passively transfer protection against challenge (14).

We have previously reported that an orally administered live attenuated Salmonella recombinant vaccine, which expressed the full-length P. berghei circumsporozoite antigen, protected mice against malaria (15). Because the protection was achieved in the absence of antibody, we postulated that cellular immune mechanisms were involved. We proposed that intracellular targeting of the Salmonella recombinant or-
ganisms led to expression of CS antigen on the cell surface in association with class I MHC molecules with the subsequent induction of specific CTL. To test this hypothesis, we constructed Salmonella typhimurium–P. berghei CS and S. typhimurium–P. falciparum CS recombinants, immunized mice, and tested for CS-specific CTL. We now report that orally administered Salmonella–CS recombinants induce CS-specific CTL. In vivo depletion experiments demonstrate that these CS-specific CTL are responsible for the protection against P. berghei.

Materials and Methods

**Plasmids.** pADE171 (16) was kindly provided by Dr. David Hone, University of Maryland (Baltimore, MD), and pMGB2 (15), plasmid AR15R-16 csp, and plasmid AR 58 repeatless/NS (Gross, M., D.Sylvester, G. Sathe, and T. Theisen, manuscript submitted for publication) were from the Department of Molecular Genetics, Smith Kline Laboratories (Swedeland, PA).

**Bacteria.** S. typhimurium LB 5010 r+ m1, S. typhimurium WR4024 trp R+ were the generous gifts of Dr. Louis Barron, Walter Reed Army Institute of Research (Washington, DC).

**Construction of Salmonella–P. berghei CS Recombinants.** The full-length CS gene of P. berghei strain NK65 was cloned in the StuI restriction site of the PB-based plasmid expression vector, pMG27 NSterm, as described elsewhere in detail (17, 18). In E. coli, pMGB2 expresses full-length CS protein with six additional amino acids at its NH2 terminus (Met, Asp, Pro, Trp, Arg, Lys). Plasmid pMG22 was purified (19) and transformed into Salmonella typhimurium WR 4024 trp R+. This strain is a derivative of WR4017, which was previously known as strain M206, an avirulent strain of P. berghei.

**Construction of Salmonella–P. falciparum CS Recombinants.** R16 CSP, containing 16 repeats of the CS repeat region fused to the full-length CS gene of P. falciparum, strain 7G8, and NS 1 81 repeatless fragment (RLF), containing the first 81 amino acids of influenza NS 1 protein fused to the CS gene containing no repeat sequences (RLF), were digested by BglII and SalI from plasmids AR 15R-16 csp and AR 58 repeatless/NS, respectively (Gross, M., D.Sylvester, G. Sathe, and T. Theisen, manuscript submitted for publication). The gel-purified inserts R16 CSP and NS 1 81 RLF were blunt-end ligated into the PstI site of plasmid pADE171 (16), which carries the his OGD region of S. typhimurium, resulting in plasmids containing the malaria gene flanked by S. typhimurium his OGD sequences (Fig. 1, Table 1). Plasmids pADE171 R16 and pADE171 RLF were purified and used to transform strain LB 5010, which is an r+ m1 S. typhimurium strain. Spececinocin-resistant colonies were examined for the expression of CS gene.

Plasmids pMG22, pADE171 R16, and pADE171 RLF were transformed into S. typhimurium WR4024 trp R+ by a modification (22) of standard methods (23). Transformants WR4024/pMG22 expressing P. berghei CS were identified by mAb 3.28 1 (24). Transformants WR4024/pADE171 R16 and WR4024/pADE171 RLF were examined for the expression of P. falciparum CS antigen using mAb 49.4D 9.1 and rabbit antirepeatless antibody 579.15, respectively. mAb 49.4D 9.1 (IgG) was made against the full-length CS gene by Dr. K. Esser, Walter Reed Army Institute of Research. Polyclonal rabbit sera raised against the CS repeatless molecule NS 1 8IRLF 9 was a kind gift of Dr. D.M. Gordon (Walter Reed Army Institute of Research).

**Immunization Protocol.** BALB/c (H2b) or B10. BR (H2b) female mice, 5–6 wk old, were immunized with Salmonella-P. berghei or Salmonella-P. falciparum CS recombinants, respectively. Mice were immunized orally with three doses of 104 Salmonella CS recombinants on alternate days. Salmonella were cultured from liver homogenates for up to 3 wk.

**Challenge.** 4 wk after primary immunization with Salmonella–P. berghei CS recombinants, mice were injected intravenously with 1,000 NK65 P. berghei sporozoites. Thin blood films were made every day beginning 5 d after challenge. Giemsa stained, and scanned for parasites in 50 oil immersion fields. Mice were considered protected if no parasites were detected by day 21 after challenge. Serum was collected from individual mice, and anti-CS antibody was detected using an ELISA (15).

**Depletion of T Lymphocytes.** Groups of BALB/c mice immunized either with WR 4024/pMGB2 or WR4024, or unimmunized mice, were depleted of CD8+ T cells or CD4+ T cells by the method of Weiss et al. (10). Briefly, 4 wk after the immunization, mice were injected intraperitoneally with 300 µg of anti-CD8 antibody anti-Lyt-2.2 hybridoma clone 19/178 (mouse IgG 2a) (25), or anti-CD4 antibody, anti-L3T4 clone GK 1.5 (rat IgG 2b) (26) for four successive days. These antibodies were purchased from Bioproducts for Science, Inc. (Madison, WI), and were kindly purified by Dr. Walter Weiss, Naval Medical Research Institute, Rockville, MD. 3 d after the last depletion dose, spleen cells from antibody-treated mice were stained with FITC-conjugated goat anti-mouse IgG2a or goat anti-rat IgG2b (Kierkegaard & Perry Laboratories, Inc., Gaithersburg, MD). Depletion was quantitated by microfluorometry (MF). Mice were challenged with 1,000 NK65 P. berghei sporozoites intravenously on the fourth day of depletion. These mice received additional injections of 300 µg of anti-CD8 or anti-CD4 antibody every third day for 21 d after challenge. A control group of mice received the same dose of a mouse IgG2a on the same schedule.

**CTL Assay for P. berghei Experiments.** The CTL assay was performed as described by Townsend et al. (27). Spleen cells from WR4024/pMGB2, WR4024, or sporozoite-immunized BALB/c mice (haplotype H-2b) were stimulated in vitro in the presence of various concentrations of the five different P. berghei CS peptides listed in Table 2. Cells were harvested after 5 d in culture, counted, and incubated for 6 h at E/T ratios from 2:1 to 50:1 with 5,000 51Cr-labeled P. berghei cells in the absence of peptide. Controls included incubation with 51Cr-labeled cells in the absence of peptide. After 6 h of incubation at 37°C, the plates were centrifuged, and 100 µl of supernatant was removed to measure chromium release. Percent lysis was determined as 100× (experimental cpm − medium control cpm)/ (detergent-released cpm − medium control cpm).

**CTL Assays for P. falciparum Experiments.** The methods used for cytotoxicity assays and to identify peptide target epitope(s) in P. falciparum CS protein were essentially the same as described by Kumar et al. (13). Spleen cells (5 x 106) from B10.BR (H2b) mice immunized orally with WR4024/pADE171 R16, WR4024/pADE171 RLF, or recombinant vaccinia (V-71) were incubated with 2 x 104 CS-transfected L cells or with 2 x 104 untransfected L cells. Cells were harvested after 6 d in culture, counted, and incubated for 6 h at various E/T ratios with 5,000 51Cr-labeled CS-transfected L cells or labeled untransfected L cells. Percent specific lysis was determined as described above.

To identify the CTL epitope, spleen cells from immunized mice were stimulated in vitro with CS-transfected L cells for 6 d. Putative CTL were then incubated with untransfected L cells at an E/T ratio of 40:1 for 6 h in the presence of various concentrations of
peptide 371–390 (DELDYENDIEKKMEKCSS). Peptide resi-
due 291–310 was used as control. Killing was measured in 100
μl of supernatant as described above.

To demonstrate that CS-specific CTL were CD8+ cells, CS-
specific CTL were incubated with anti-CD8 mAb (clone 19/178)
(25) followed by complement. Washed cells were then stained with
FITC-conjugated goat anti–mouse IgG2a, and depletion was quan-
titated by microfluorimetry. Cells were incubated with 5,000 35Cr-
labeled transfected L cells or untransfected L cells for 6 h at various
E/T ratios. The percent lysis of target cells by complement-treated
or CD8-depleted CTL was determined.

Results

For construction of Salmonella–P. berghei CS recombinants,
expression plasmid pMBG2 containing the full-length P. ber-
ghei CS gene was transformed into S. typhimurium WR4024,
an avirulent strain. Ampicillin-resistant transformants were
examined for the expression of the CS protein. One of the
transformants, WR4024/pMBG2, expressing P. berghei CS
protein, was selected for further studies (Table 1).

For construction of Salmonella–P. falciparum CS recom-
binants, plasmid pADE171 R.16 containing the full-length
P. falciparum CS gene and plasmid pADE171 RLF containing
the flanking regions without the repeats were constructed
(Fig. 1). The plasmids were transformed into S. Typhimurium
WR4024, and spectinomycin-resistant transformants were
examined for expression of CS antigens. Two of these trans-
formants were picked for further studies (Table 1).

Protection studies were performed by immunization of
BALB/c mice with Salmonella–P. berghei CS recombinants.
Mice were immunized orally with WR4024/pMBG2 or
WR4024 and were intravenously challenged 5 wk later with
1,000 P. berghei (NK65) infectious sporozoites. This immu-
nization provided protection in 55% of these animals, whereas
all of the unimmunized and 94% of the mice receiving the
WR4024 carrier strain were infected (Table 3). No antibody
in the serum of individual mice could be demonstrated against
recombinant CS protein using ELISA techniques (data not
shown). Mice immunized intravenously with 50,000 irradi-
ated sporozoites were fully protected.

To determine the role of CD8+ T cells in protection,
mice were depleted of CD8+ T cells by intraperitoneal in-
jections of anti-CD8 mAb 4 wk after immunization. This
procedure resulted in removal of >98% of the CD8+ T cells
from the spleens of these animals (data not shown). The deple-
tion was confirmed by surface phenotyping of CD8+ T cells
from the spleen by single-color indirect fluorescent staining
and monitored by microfluorimetry. Elimination of CD8+ T
cells abrogated the protection after immunization with the
Salmonella recombinant vaccine WR4024/pMBG2. Protection
was reduced from 55% to 5% (Table 3). CD8+ T cell–depleted control mice were all infected after challenge. Mice depleted of CD4 T cells did not lose their immunity
(data not shown). These results indicate that CD8+ T cells
are the mediators of protection induced by Salmonella recom-
binit vaccines. However, in contrast to immunity induced
by Salmonella recombinant vaccines, immunity achieved by
immunization with radiation-attenuated sporozoites could
not be eliminated even after complete depletion of CD8+ T
cells (Table 3).

To further characterize the CD8+ T cells induced by
Salmonella–P. berghei CS recombinant immunization, in vitro
cytotoxic T cell assays were performed. For these assays, we
used the methods of Townsend et al. (27), where target cells
are made by incubation of histocompatible cells with short
synthetic peptides that associate with class I molecules. We

Table 1. Salmonella-CS Recombinant Vaccines

| Immunogen     | Plasmid   | Gene            | Species   |
|---------------|-----------|-----------------|-----------|
| WR4024/pMBG2  | pMBG2     | Full-length CS  | P. berghei|
| WR4024/pADE171R.16 | pADE171 | Full-length CS  | P. falciparum|
| WR4024/pADE171RLF | pADE171 | Flanking regions | P. falciparum|
| WR4024        | None      | None            | Carrier   |

Table 2. Plasmodiumberghei CS Peptides

| Sequence                | Region             | Residue   |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-----------|
| ADAPEGKKNEKKEKIERNNN    | NH₂ terminus       | 69–78     |
| (DPPPPNPN)3             | Repeat             | 102–124   |
| NDDSYIPSAEKI            | COOH terminus      | 242–253   |
| SYIPSAEKILEFKQQRDSITEEWSQ| COOH terminus      | 245–270   |
| CFVKQIRDSITEEWSQCNVTCG   | COOH terminus      | 256–276   |
The spleen cells from mice immunized with WR4024/pMGB2 caused 24% specific lysis of P815 (H-2b) target cells incubated with peptide 242–253 at a concentration of 50 μg/ml and an E/T ratio of 40:1 (Fig. 2). Spleen cells from WR4024/pMGB2-immunized mice had no cytolitic activity without in vitro peptide stimulation. In vitro stimulated cells did not show activity if the target cells were not incubated with peptide 242–253. Spleen cells from unimmunized mice or mice immunized with the carrier Salmonella WR4024 and stimulated with the peptide 242–253 had <4% cytolitic activity, indicating that the CTL arose after immunization and were not due to in vitro peptide stimulation. Specific cytolitic activity of 34% was measured with peptide 242–253-stimulated spleen cells from mice immunized with radiation-attenuated sporozoites.

None of the other four peptides stimulated spleen cells from mice immunized either with Salmonella recombinants or radiation-attenuated sporozoites. These peptides also failed to generate P815 cell targets. There was no specific lysis of P815 cells after incubation with any of the five peptides at the concentration used, demonstrating that they were not directly toxic to cells. The CTL lytic activity generated by WR4024/pMGB2 immunization was genetically restricted. After stimulation of spleen cells with peptide 242–253, no specific lytic activity was observed when EL4(H-2b) cells incubated with the same peptide were used as targets.

We asked whether Salmonella recombinant vaccines could also induce CTL responses to the human malaria parasite *P. falciparum*. For this purpose, spleen cells from B10.BR(H-2k) mice immunized with WR4024/pADE171 R16, WR4024/pADE171 RLF, WR4024, or recombinant vaccinia (V-71) containing full-length *P. falciparum* CS gene were stimulated in vitro for 6 d with CS-transfected L cells (H-2k). These cells were then assessed for lytic activity against transfected or untransfected L cells. At an E/T ratio of 40:1, in three different sets of experiments, we observed 37 ± 2.2% specific killing of CS gene–transfected cells by CTL induced by WR4024/pADE171 R16 compared with 20 ± 2.2% specific killing of CS gene–transfected cells by CTL induced by WR4024/pADE171 R16.

![Figure 1](image1.png)

**Figure 1.** Construction of WR4024/pADE171 R16 and WR4024/pADE171 RLF. The plasmid containing R16 full-length or NS1 repeatless CS gene of *P. falciparum* was digested with BglII and Sall. The gel-purified insert was blunt-endligated into the PstI site of plasmid pADE171, which carries his OGD region of *Salmonella*, resulting in the plasmid containing CS gene flanked by *Salmonella* his OGD.

designed peptides from the *P. berghei* CS protein based on the sequence identified previously by Romero et al. (14) as a CTL target. Five different peptides from NH2 terminus, repeat region, and COOH terminus were used (Table 2). Spleen cells from mice immunized with either *Salmonella–P. berghei* CS recombinant WR4024/pMGB2, *S. typhimurium* carrier WR4024, or sporozoites were taken 4–10 wk after immunization. After in vitro stimulation with peptide for 6 d, the killing was measured by the 51Cr release.

**Table 3.** Protective Immunity Induced by *S. typhimurium* (WR4024) Transformed with a Plasmid Expressing Full-Length *P. berghei* CS Gene (WR4024/pMGB2)

| Immunogen       | Anti-CD8 antibody | No. infected/ no. challenged | Percent protection |
|-----------------|-------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|
| WR404           | –                 | 29/31                        | 6                  |
| WR4024          | +                 | 8/8                          | 0                  |
| WR4024/pMGB2    | –                 | 10/22                        | 55                 |
| WR4024/pMGB2    | +                 | 18/19                        | 5                  |
| None            | –                 | 30/30                        | 0                  |
| None            | +                 | 8/8                          | 0                  |
| Irradiated Spz  | –                 | 0/10                         | 100                |
| Irradiated Spz  | +                 | 0/10                         | 100                |

![Figure 2](image2.png)

**Figure 2.** Results of cytotoxic assays performed with P815 target cells and CTL in the presence of synthetic peptides. Spleen cells from mice immunized with *Salmonella–P. berghei* CS recombinant vaccine were stimulated in vitro for 6 d with 50 μg of peptide, and 6 d after in vitro stimulation cells were incubated with 3H-cr-labeled P815 cells in the presence of different peptides, and 3HCr release was measured. This experiment is representative of four independent experiments.
killing of untransfected L cells (p < 0.05). Likewise, at this E/T ratio, spleen cells from animals immunized with WR4024/pADE171 RLF killed 36 ± 3.1% of CS gene-transfected L cells compared with 20 ± 4% killing of untransfected L cells (p < 0.05). These CTL responses were comparable with those obtained after immunization with the recombinant vaccinia (Fig. 3). CTLs from mice immunized with the Salmonella carrier WR4024 gave 20 ± 4.5% 51Cr release.

To determine if the cytotoxic activity in the spleen cell cultures was due to CD8+ T cells, in vitro depletions were performed. Removal of CD8+ T cells from the cultures on the day of the CTL assay was confirmed by MF (data not shown). WR4024/pADE171 R16–induced CS-specific CTL, when treated with anti-CD8 mAb and complement, yielded only 5 ± 2.8% specific lysis of CS-specific target cells at an E/T ratio of 40:1 compared with specific lysis of target cells at an E/T ratio of 37 ± 2.2% (p < 0.05), when the cells were treated with complement alone (Fig. 4). WR4024/pADE171 RLF induced CTL with similar activity (12 ± 3.5 vs. 36 ± 3.1; p < 0.05). This demonstrated that the CS-specific cytotoxicity was mediated by CD8+ cells. Reductions in specific cytotoxicity by depletion of CD8+ T cells were similar for spleen cells from animals immunized with each of the three vaccines (Fig. 4).

Immunization of B10.BR mice with Salmonella also induced CTL that caused 20 ± 4.5% lysis of untransfected cells. This nonspecific effect was induced by both recombinants and the control Salmonella vaccine, and contrasts to the 7 ± 1.5% lysis seen with recombinant vaccinia-immunized mice (Fig. 3). After CD8 depletion, the lysis of untransfected cells by WR4024/pADE R16–induced CTL was reduced from 18 ± 2.8 to 4 ± 2% (p < 0.05), and killing by WR4024/pADE171 RLF–induced CTL was reduced from 16 ± 3.5 to 7 ± 1.5% (p < 0.05). These findings suggest that the majority of induced nonspecific cytotoxic T cells were CD8+ (Fig. 4).

To determine if the cytotoxic activity in the spleen cell cultures was due to CD8+ T cells, in vitro depletions were performed. Removal of CD8+ T cells from the cultures on the day of the CTL assay was confirmed by MF (data not shown). WR4024/pADE171 R16–induced CS-specific CTL, when treated with anti-CD8 mAb and complement, yielded only 5 ± 2.8% specific lysis of CS-specific target cells at an E/T ratio of 40:1 compared with specific lysis of target cells at an E/T ratio of 37 ± 2.2% (p < 0.05), when the cells were treated with complement alone (Fig. 4). WR4024/pADE171 RLF induced CTL with similar activity (12 ± 3.5 vs. 36 ± 3.1; p < 0.05). This demonstrated that the CS-specific cytotoxicity was mediated by CD8+ cells. Reductions in specific cytotoxicity by depletion of CD8+ T cells were similar for spleen cells from animals immunized with each of the three vaccines (Fig. 4).

Immunization of B10.BR mice with Salmonella also induced CTL that caused 20 ± 4.5% lysis of untransfected cells. This nonspecific effect was induced by both recombinants and the control Salmonella vaccine, and contrasts to the 7 ± 1.5% lysis seen with recombinant vaccinia-immunized mice (Fig. 3). After CD8 depletion, the lysis of untransfected cells by WR4024/pADE R16–induced CTL was reduced from 18 ± 2.8 to 4 ± 2% (p < 0.05), and killing by WR4024/pADE171 RLF–induced CTL was reduced from 16 ± 3.5 to 7 ± 1.5% (p < 0.05). These findings suggest that the majority of induced nonspecific cytotoxic T cells were CD8+ (Fig. 4).

To determine if the cytotoxic activity in the spleen cell cultures was due to CD8+ T cells, in vitro depletions were performed. Removal of CD8+ T cells from the cultures on the day of the CTL assay was confirmed by MF (data not shown). WR4024/pADE171 R16–induced CS-specific CTL, when treated with anti-CD8 mAb and complement, yielded only 5 ± 2.8% specific lysis of CS-specific target cells at an E/T ratio of 40:1 compared with specific lysis of target cells at an E/T ratio of 37 ± 2.2% (p < 0.05), when the cells were treated with complement alone (Fig. 4). WR4024/pADE171 RLF induced CTL with similar activity (12 ± 3.5 vs. 36 ± 3.1; p < 0.05). This demonstrated that the CS-specific cytotoxicity was mediated by CD8+ cells. Reductions in specific cytotoxicity by depletion of CD8+ T cells were similar for spleen cells from animals immunized with each of the three vaccines (Fig. 4).

To determine if the cytotoxic activity in the spleen cell cultures was due to CD8+ T cells, in vitro depletions were performed. Removal of CD8+ T cells from the cultures on the day of the CTL assay was confirmed by MF (data not shown). WR4024/pADE171 R16–induced CS-specific CTL, when treated with anti-CD8 mAb and complement, yielded only 5 ± 2.8% specific lysis of CS-specific target cells at an E/T ratio of 40:1 compared with specific lysis of target cells at an E/T ratio of 37 ± 2.2% (p < 0.05), when the cells were treated with complement alone (Fig. 4). WR4024/pADE171 RLF induced CTL with similar activity (12 ± 3.5 vs. 36 ± 3.1; p < 0.05). This demonstrated that the CS-specific cytotoxicity was mediated by CD8+ cells. Reductions in specific cytotoxicity by depletion of CD8+ T cells were similar for spleen cells from animals immunized with each of the three vaccines (Fig. 4).

To determine if the cytotoxic activity in the spleen cell cultures was due to CD8+ T cells, in vitro depletions were performed. Removal of CD8+ T cells from the cultures on the day of the CTL assay was confirmed by MF (data not shown). WR4024/pADE171 R16–induced CS-specific CTL, when treated with anti-CD8 mAb and complement, yielded only 5 ± 2.8% specific lysis of CS-specific target cells at an E/T ratio of 40:1 compared with specific lysis of target cells at an E/T ratio of 37 ± 2.2% (p < 0.05), when the cells were treated with complement alone (Fig. 4). WR4024/pADE171 RLF induced CTL with similar activity (12 ± 3.5 vs. 36 ± 3.1; p < 0.05). This demonstrated that the CS-specific cytotoxicity was mediated by CD8+ cells. Reductions in specific cytotoxicity by depletion of CD8+ T cells were similar for spleen cells from animals immunized with each of the three vaccines (Fig. 4).

Discussion
We have demonstrated that oral immunization of mice with attenuated S. typhimurium recombinants expressing full-length P. berghei CS gene or full-length or repeatless P. falciparum CS gene induce specific CD8+ CTL. We also provide evidence that these CS-specific CTL are responsible for the protection induced against P. berghei sporozoites after immunization of BALB/c mice with Salmonella recombinant vaccines.

Antibody-dependent cellular cytotoxicity has been shown after immunization of humans with S. typhi mutant strain
Salmonella Induces Protective Immunity against Malaria

Ty21a (28) or auxotrophic S. typhi 541Ty(Vi+) or 543Ty(Vi-) (29). The effector cells have been identified as a nonadherent T3+, T8-, T4+ lymphocyte (28). After immunization, delayed-type hypersensitivity responses to Salmonella carbohydrate antigens (30) and recombinant expressed proteins have been demonstrated (15, 31). Macrophage activation directly or through T cell-mediated mechanisms has also been seen after immunization or infection (32, 33). To our knowledge, induction of protective class I-restricted antigen-specific CD8+ CTL by immunization or infection with Salmonella has not, however, been previously reported.

After oral ingestion, attenuated Salmonella vaccines are soon translocated from the intestinal lumen to an intracellular location, primarily inside macrophages (30). Attenuated Salmonella carrier strains, such as S. typhimurium WR4024 used in this study and the the A mutant of S. dublin SL1438 used by us in other studies (34), have limited ability to multiply within macrophages but do survive for variable periods of time. The intracellular expression of recombinant malaria CS antigens is probably responsible for processing and presentation in association with class I antigen with the subsequent induction of CTL. Bacterial enzymes may play some role in degradation of the recombinant expressed protein before processing by intracellular enzymes, although we have no direct evidence for this possibility. The presence of Salmonella inside macrophages may also activate these macrophages and induce the release of cytokines thought to be important as differentiation factors for induction of CTL (35).

Until recently, it was generally thought that viruses were the only pathogens capable of presenting endogenous antigens on the surface of infected cells in association with class I molecules with the subsequent induction of CD8+ CTL. This view was challenged by the evidence for a protective role of CD8+ CTL induced by sporozoites in murine malaria (10, 11), induction of CTL in mice against P. falciparum CS by sporozoites (13), and the protective role of CD8+ T cells in immunity to Toxoplasma gondii (36). There is also evidence that protection against intracellular pathogens such as L. monocytogenes, M. tuberculosis, M. leprae, and others may in part be mediated through CD8+ T cells (37). Our findings directly prove that an intracellular bacteria such as S. typhimurium can induce specific CD8+ CTL and suggest that the antigen processing and presentation is probably not very different from that which occurs with vaccinia or sporozoites, since the recognized peptide and quantitative data are very similar.

Our finding that Salmonella-P. berghei CS recombinant-induced protection is mediated through specific CD8+ cytotoxic T cells further demonstrates the importance of CTL in immunity against malaria. This is consistent with the recent finding that CD8+ CTL clones directed against P. berghei CS by themselves are able to provide complete protection (14). These CTL clones were induced by immunization with radiation-attenuated sporozoites. The CTL we induced with Salmonella CS recombinants are directed against the same peptide in the CS sequence as the CTL clones defined by Romero et al. (14). Not all of the CTL clones found by Romero were able to protect. Our study demonstrates that at least some of the CTL induced by Salmonella-P. berghei CS recombinants are protective. To increase the number of protective CTL induced by oral immunization with Salmonella CS recombinants, we are inserting malarial genes into the bacterial chromosome in an attempt to stabilize and increase the expression of malaria gene products. We are also utilizing Salmonella auxotrophs as carrier strains, which are safe but more invasive than the attenuated S. typhimurium WR4024 we utilized in this study.

We were able to achieve CTL that gave similar levels of killing by immunization with Salmonella-P. falciparum CS recombinant vaccines that expressed the entire CS gene or a gene from which the central repeat region was deleted. Both of these recombinant constructs produced the malaria CS antigens as fusion proteins. The complete CS molecule is therefore not required for the in vivo induction of CD8+ CTL by Salmonella, and modification of the original gene by addition also does not interfere. Presentation of antigens in association with class I molecules is generally dependent on intracellular enzymatic cleavage to produce a peptide fragment that can bind to the class I molecule. Our findings suggest a possible method for determining the minimal structure from any given molecule that is necessary for such a process to occur. This could be done by cloning deletion fragments as fusion proteins into Salmonella and looking for the ability of these Salmonella recombinants to induce CTL.

We were able to determine the Salmonella-P. berghei CS recombinant–induced protection by depletion of CD8+ T cells. This contrasts with our inability to eliminate protection by this technique in BALB/c mice immunized with radiation-attenuated sporozoites. This result may be due to involvement of antibody, effector CD4+ T cells, other immune cell types or other sporozoite or preerythrocytic antigens in BALB/c immunity to P. berghei. Schofield et al. (11)
were able to eliminate sporozoite-induced protection in A/J mice by depletion of CD8+ T cells. This shows that the mechanism of radiation in attenuated sporozoite-induced immunity is dependent on the mouse haplotype. Although we were not able to eliminate sporozoite-induced protection in BALB/c mice, Weiss et al. (10) were able to accomplish this, but the parasite was *P. yoelii*.

A vaccine for malaria that overcomes the sequence variation in the CS CTL site as well as differences due to genetic restriction (13) will likely contain several different versions of the CS CTL site recognized by humans as well as other sporozoite and liver stage antigens important for CTL recognition. Such multivalent vaccines can be constructed in *Salmonella* because of the size of the bacterial genome and the flexibility of its manipulation. Because new *Salmonella* vaccine strains designed for human use are auxotrophs (38), which can only replicate in the body to a limited extent, they have been safe in studies of immunocompromised hosts (39, 40). This inherent safety plus their sensitivity to antibiotics is important for immunization of human populations that may have been exposed to HIV.

Our findings that recombinant *Salmonella* constructs provide some protection and induce CTL effector mechanisms similar to those induced by irradiated and live sporozoites provide a basis for further work on the development of oral vaccines against malaria. The CTL epitope, which has been identified in the CS protein of the human malaria parasite, *P. falciparum*, has only been shown to be recognized by primed mouse lymphocytes. Whether this peptide sequence is also recognized by human CTL is currently unknown. Immunization of humans with irradiation-attenuated sporozoites or possibly *Salmonella* recombinants may help answer this question. These findings suggest that live attenuated *Salmonella* recombinants may also be useful in the study of other diseases where CTL mediated immunity may be important.

We wish to thank Ms. Hazel Sidberry for excellent technical assistance, Dr. Carolyn Deal for synthesis of peptide 242–253, Ms. Lynett Smith for providing the *P. berghei* CS peptides, Dr. Bernard Moss for the vaccinia recombinant, and Drs. Louis Baron, and Louis Miller for advice and helpful suggestions.

Address correspondence to Jerald Sadoff, Walter Reed Army Institute of Research, Washington DC 20307.

Received for publication 15 March 1990 and in revised form 8 June 1990.

References

1. Miller, L.H., R.J. Howard, R. Carter, M.F. Good, V. Nussenzweig, and R.S. Nussenzweig. 1989. Research towards malaria vaccines. *Science (Wash. DC)*. 234:1349.
2. Clyde, D.F., V. McCarthy, R.M. Miller, and W.E. Woodward. 1975. Immunization of man against falciparum and vivax malaria by use of attenuated sporozoites. *Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg*. 24:397.
3. Nussenzweig, V., and R.S. Nussenzweig. 1986. Development of a sporozoite malaria vaccine. *Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg*. 35:678.
4. Nussenzweig, V., and R.S. Nussenzweig. 1989. Rationale for the development of an engineered sporozoite malaria vaccine. *Adv. Immunol*. 45:283.
5. Potoczniak, P., N. Yoshida, R.S. Nussenzweig, and V. Nussenzweig. 1980. Monovalent fragments (Fab) of monoclonal antibodies to a sporozoite surface antigen (Pb44) protect mice against malaria infection. *J. Exp. Med*. 151:1504.
6. Hollingdale, M.R., F. Zavala, R.S. Nussenzweig, and V. Nussenzweig. 1982. Antibodies to the protective antigen of *Plasmodium berghei* sporozoites prevent entry into culture cells. *J. Immunol*. 128:1929.
7. Charoenwit, Y., M.F. Lefc, L.F. Yuan, M. Selegah, and R.L. Beaudoin. 1987. Characterization of *P. yoelii* monoclonal antibodies directed against stage specific sporozoite antigen. *Infect. Immun*. 55:604.
8. Chen, D.H., R.E. Tigelaar, and E.I. Weinbaum. 1977. Immunity to sporozoite-induced malaria infection in mice. I. The effect of immunization of T and B cell deficient mice. *J. Immunol*. 118:1322.
9. Egan, J.E., J.L. Weber, W.R. Ballou, M.R. Hollingdale, W.R. Majarian, D.M. Gordon, W.L. Maloy, S.L. Hoffman, R.A. Wirtz, I. Schneider, G.R. Woullet, J.F. Young, and W.T. Hockmeyer. 1987. Efficacy of murine malaria sporozoite vacines: implication for human vaccine development. *Science (Wash. DC)*. 236:453.
10. Weiss, W.R., M. Segdah, R.L. Beaudoin, L.H. Miller, and M.F. Good. 1988. CD8+ T cells (cytotoxic/suppressor) are required for protection in mice immunized with malaria sporozoites. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*. 85:573.
11. Schofield, L., R. Villaquian, A. Ferreira, H. Schellekens, R.S. Nussenzweig, and V. Nussenzweig. 1987. Interferon, CD8+ T cells and antibodies are required for immunity to malaria sporozoites. *Nature (Lond.*). 330:664.
12. Hoffman, S.L., D. Isenbarger, G.W. Long, M. Sedegah, A. Szarfman, L. Waters, M.R. Hollingdale, P.H.V. Meide, D.S. Finbloom, and W.R. Ballou. 1989. Sporozoite vaccine induces genetically restricted T cell elimination of malaria from hepatoctyes. *Science (Wash. DC)*. 244:1078.
13. Kumar, S., L.H. Miller, I.A. Quakyi, D.B. Krister, R.A. Houghten, W.L. Maloy, B. Moss, J.A. Berzofsky, and M.F. Good. 1988. Cytotoxic T cell specific for the circumsporozoite protein of *Plasmodium falciparum*. *Nature (Lond.*). 334:258.
14. Romero, P., J.L. Maryanski, G. Corradin, R.S. Nussenzweig.
V. Nussenzweig, and F. Zavala. 1989. Cloned cytotoxic T cells recognize an epitope in the circumsporozoite protein and protect against malaria. *Nature (Lond).* 341:323.

15. Sadoff, J.C., W.R. Ballou, L.S. Baron, W.R. Majarian, R.N. Brey, W.T. Hockmeyer, J.F. Young, S.J. Cryz, J. Ou, G.H. Lowell, and J.D. Chulay. 1988. *Salmonella typhimurium* vaccine expressing circumsporozoite protein protects against malaria. *Science (Wash. DC).* 240:336.

16. Hone, D., S. Atteridge, L.V. den Bosch, and J. Hackett. 1988. A chromosomal integration system for stabilization of heterologous gene in *Salmonella* based vaccine strains. *Microb Pathol.* 5:407.

17. Weber, J.L., and W.T. Hockmeyer. 1985. Structure of the circumsporozoite protein gene in 18 strains of *Plasmodium falciparum*. *Mol. Biochem. Parasitol.* 15:305.

18. Gross, M., R.W. Sweet, G. Sathe, S. Yokoyama, O. Fasano, M. Goldfarb, M. Wigler, and M. Rosenberg. 1985. Purification and characterization of human H-ras protein expressed in *Escherichia coli*. *Mol. Cell. Biol.* 5:1015.

19. Birnboim, H.C., and J.Doly. 1979. A rapid alkaline extraction procedure for screening of recombinant plasmid. *DNA Nucleic Acids Res.* 7:1513.

20. Furness, G., and D. Rowley. 1956. Transduction of virulence within the species *Salmonella typhimurium*. *J. Gen. Microbiol.* 15:140.

21. Furness, G. 1958. Interaction between *Salmonella typhimurium* and phagocytic cells in culture. *J. Infect. Dis.* 103:272.

22. Ou, J., D.J. Kopecko, and L.S. Baron. 1986. Genetic transformation with large plasmids in *Escherichia coli*. In *Recent Advances in Chemotherapy*. Joji Ishigami, editor. University of Tokyo Press, Tokyo. 383–384.

23. Cohen, S.N., A.C.Y. Chang, and L. Hsu. 1972. Nonchromosomal antibiotic resistance in bacteria: Genetic transformation of *Escherichia coli* by R-factor DNA. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA.* 69:2110.

24. Sidberry, H., B. Kaufman, D.G. Wright, and J. Sadoff. 1985. Immunoenzymatic analysis by monoclonal antibodies of bacterial lipopolysaccharides after transfer to nitrocellulose. *J. Immunol. Methods.* 76:299.

25. Hammerling, G.J., U. Hammerling, and L. Flaherty. 1979. Qat-4 and Qat-5, new murine T cell antigens governed by the Tla region and identified by monoclonal antibodies. *J. Exp. Med.* 150:108.

26. Dialynas, D.P., Z.S. Quan, K.A. Wall, A. Piers, J. Quintans, M.R. Loken, M. Piers, and F. Fitch. 1983. Characterization of the murine T cell surface molecule, designated L3T4, identified by monoclonal antibody GK 1.5; similarity of L3T4 to the human Leu-3/T4 molecule. *J. Immunol.* 131:2445.

27. Townsend, A.R.M., J. Rothbard, F.M. Gotch, G. Bahadur, D. Wraith, and A.J. McMichael. 1986. The epitopes of influenza nucleoprotein recognized by cytotoxic T lymphocytes can be defined with short synthetic peptides. *Cell.* 44:959.

28. Tagliabue, A., L. Nencioni, A. Caffarena, L. Villa, D. Boraschi, C. Cazzola, and S. Cavalieri. 1985. Cellular immunity against *Salmonella typhi* after live oral vaccine. *Clin. Exp. Immunol.* 62:242.

29. Levine, M.M., D. Herrington, J.R. Murphy, J.G. Morris, G. Losonsky, B. Täll, A.A. Lindberg, S. Svenson, S. Baqar, and M.F. Edwards. 1987. Safety, infectivity, immunogenicity, and in vivo stability of two attenuated auxotrophic mutant strains of *Salmonella typhi*, 541Ty and 542Ty, as live oral vaccines in humans. 1986. *J. Clin. Invest.* 79:888.

30. Lindberg, A.A., and J.A. Robertson. 1983. *Salmonella typhimurium* infection in calves: Cell-mediated and humoral immune reactions before and after challenge with live virulent bacteria in calves given live or inactivated vaccines. *Infect. Immun.* 41:751.

31. Brown, A., C.E. Hromaeche, R. Demarco de Hromaeche, M. Winther, G. Dougan, D.J. Maskell, and B.A.D. Stocker. 1987. An attenuated *ana* *Salmonella typhimurium* vaccine elicits humoral and cellular immunity to cloned β-galactosidase in mice. *J. Infect. Dis.* 155:86.

32. Collins, F.M. 1974. Vaccines and cell-mediated immunity. *Bacteriol. Rev.* 38:371.

33. Schäfer, R., C.A. Nacy, and T.K. Eisenstein. 1988. Induction of activated macrophages in C3H/Hej mice by avirulent *Salmonella*. *J. Immunol.* 140:1638.

34. Sadoff, J.C., W.R. Ballou, L.S. Baron, J. Ou, W.R. Majarian, and R. Brey. 1988. Attenuated oral *Salmonella* vaccines expressing circumsporozoite antigen protect against malaria. In *Technological Advances in Vaccine Development*. Alan R. Liss, Inc., New York. 197–204.

35. Lafferty, K.J., L. Anders, and S.J. Prowse. 1980. Role of lymphokine and antigen in the control of specific T cell response. *Immunol. Rev.* 51:279.

36. Suzuki, Y., and J.S. Remington. 1988. Dual regulation of resistance against *Toxoplasma gondii* infection by Ly2* and Ly2.1*, L3T4* T cells in mice. *J. Immunol.* 40:2943.

37. Kaufman, S.H.E. 1988. CD8+ T lymphocytes in intracellular microbial infection. *Immunol. Today.* 9:1668.

38. Hoiseth, S.K., and B.A.D. Stocker. 1981. Aromatic-dependent *Salmonella typhimurium* are non virulent and effective as live oral vaccines. *Nature (Lond.)* 291:238.

39. Hoiseth, S.K. 1983. Aromatic deficient mutants as live *Salmonella* vaccines. Ph.D. Thesis, Stanford University, Stanford, CA.

40. Stocker, B.A.D., S.K. Hoiseth, and B.P. Smith. 1983. Aromatic dependent *Salmonella* species as live vaccines in mice and calves. *Dev. Biol. Stand.* 53:47.

1090 *Salmonella* Induces Protective Immunity against Malaria