Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
COVID-19 vaccine uptake among Arkansas public K-12 school teachers and staff

Michael J. Cima a,*, Donald McCormick a, Austin Porter III a,b, Namvar Zohoori a,b, Scott Alsbrook a, José R. Romero a,c

a Arkansas Department of Health, 4815 West Markham Street, Little Rock, AR 72205, United States
b Fay W. Boozman College of Public Health, University of Arkansas for Medical Sciences, 4301 West Markham Street, Little Rock, AR 72205, United States
c Department of Pediatrics, University of Arkansas for Medical Sciences, 4301 West Markham Street Little Rock, AR 72205, United States

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Article history:
Received 16 June 2021
Received in revised form 31 January 2022
Accepted 28 July 2022
Available online 2 August 2022

Keywords:
COVID-19
Vaccine
K-12
Vaccine hesitancy

A B S T R A C T

In December 2020, the first coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) vaccines received emergency use authorization from the Food and Drug Administration (FDA). To strategically allocate the limited availability of COVID-19 vaccines, the Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices (ACIP) developed a phased approach for eligibility that prioritized certain population groups that were more vulnerable to infection and severe outcomes. Public K-12 teachers and staff were included in Phase 1b. The Arkansas Department of Health (ADH) sought to evaluate the uptake of COVID-19 vaccines within this priority group. In partnership with the Arkansas Department of Education (ADE), ADH received a list of 66,076 certified staff, classified staff, and teachers within the public K-12 school system. This list was matched to the state immunization registry via deterministic methods across three identifiers: first name, last name and date of birth. Uptake was assessed and the population was characterized using descriptive analyses. After 13 weeks of availability, 34,783 (51.2 %) of public K-12 teachers and staff had received at least one dose and 29,870 (44.0 %) had completed the series. School districts with the least robust uptake of COVID-19 vaccines tended to be in more rural areas, with some districts having less than 10 % of teachers and staff with at least one dose. The proportion of public K-12 teachers and staff with at least one dose of any COVID-19 vaccine grew quickly between January 18th and February 14th (4 % to 43 %) but has plateaued in the most recent seven weeks (45 % to 51 %). Although not directly measured, it is possible that vaccine hesitancy could be a factor in the attenuated uptake of COVID-19 vaccines within certain factions of the Arkansas public K-12 teacher and staff population. Overcoming vaccine hesitancy during the COVID-19 vaccine rollout will be critical in bringing an end to the pandemic.

© 2022 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

As of April 2021, three coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) vaccines produced by the pharmaceutical companies, Pfizer-BioNTech, Moderna and Johnson & Johnson (Janssen), have been granted Emergency Use Authorization (EUA) by the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) [1–3]. In the United States, COVID-19 vaccines are becoming increasingly available to adult and adolescent Americans [4]. However, during the early months of the vaccine rollout, availability was limited and earmarked for the most vulnerable individuals and other prioritized groups.

On December 1, 2020, the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention’s Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices (ACIP) released its initial recommendations on allocation of limited initial COVID-19 vaccine supplies to high-risk population groups designated Phase 1a. These recommendations targeted vaccinating healthcare personnel and residents of long-term care facilities [1]. On December 20, 2020, the ACIP released further guidance on additional priority population groups, aligning frontline essential workers and persons aged 75 years or older in Phase 1b, and persons aged 65 years and older, persons aged 16 to 64 years with high-risk medical conditions and essential workers not captured in 1b in Phase 1c. All other adults would be included in Phase 2 [5].

According to the ACIP recommendations, education personnel fall within the frontline essential worker group of Phase 1b [1]. Schools in Arkansas reopened for in-person instruction in August of 2020. Since then, more than 42,000 cases of COVID-19 have been identified among public kindergarten through 12th grade (K-12) school students, teachers, and staff. Teachers and staff alone...
account for more than 11,000 cases, 244 hospitalizations, and 24 deaths. These include all cases diagnosed among teachers and staff, including those that may not be related to the school setting [6]. On January 18, 2021, Arkansas opened vaccine availability to individuals 65 years and older as well as education personnel ahead of all other essential workers within Phase 1b [7]. Since this announcement, public K-12 school districts across the state have coordinated vaccine clinics for their teachers and staff with local pharmacies. On March 8, 2020, the current administration opened vaccination of teachers as a priority group through the Federal Retail Pharmacy Program (FRPP), further increasing accessibility of COVID-19 vaccines to education staff in Arkansas. At the time of analysis, vaccine has been available to this population for 13 weeks.

Many states are challenged by the data reported passively concerning characteristics of individuals who receive the COVID-19 vaccines. The Arkansas Department of Health (ADH) has proactively sought methods to improve the completeness of COVID-19 data within the state immunization registry by linking a multitude of internal datasets, and through collaborations with other state agencies. As a result, the ADH has developed the capability to analyze and monitor the progress of vaccination efforts among certain priority groups, including public school K-12 teachers. The objective of this paper is to provide a descriptive analysis on COVID-19 vaccine uptake among Arkansas’ public K-12 teachers and staff during the periods of initial state-wide and national prioritization of this group.

2. Materials and methods

Starting on January 18, 2021, all public K-12 teachers and staff were eligible for COVID-19 vaccines in 239 school districts in Arkansas. These individuals could access vaccination through onsite clinics, local pharmacies, hospitals, or other healthcare providers with vaccine supply. Additionally, from March 8, 2021 onward they could access vaccine through any of the pharmacies in the FRPP. This study only included public K-12 teachers and staff, and excluded private, charter, and college or university teachers and staff. Data for the latter groups were incomplete at the time of these analyses.

Arkansas utilizes an immunization registry that accepts data from other state agencies. ADH has linked a variety of datasets, from internal sources and through collaborations with other state agencies. As a result, the ADH has developed the capability to analyze and monitor the progress of vaccination efforts among certain priority groups, including public school K-12 teachers. The objective of this paper is to provide a descriptive analysis on COVID-19 vaccine uptake among Arkansas’ public K-12 teachers and staff during the periods of initial state-wide and national prioritization of this group.

3. Results

After 13 weeks of availability, a total of 34,783 (51.2 %) public K-12 teachers and staff had received at least one dose of any COVID-19 vaccine, and 29,870 (44.0 %) had completed the series. Those receiving at least one dose of a COVID-19 vaccine were predominantly women (n = 25,519, 73.4 %), white (n = 26,177, 75.3 %) and between the ages of 45 to 64 (n = 18,013, 51.8 %). Table 1 illustrates the complete demographic breakdown.

Table 2 shows COVID-19 vaccine uptake across the different education staff types. Certified staff, exclusive of certified teachers, had the highest proportion of individuals receiving at least one dose (n = 4,301, 66.5 %), followed by teachers (n = 18,497, 54.7 %) and classified staff (n = 11,985, 46.4 %). More than half of certified staff had completed the series. For groups listed previously, successful completion of an immunization series (2 doses for the Pfizer-BioNTech and Moderna vaccines and a single dose for the Johnson & Johnson vaccine) is significantly lower: 57.8 % (n = 3,735), 47.5 % (n = 16,034), and 39.1 % (n = 10,101), respectively.

The average proportion of teachers and staff vaccinated among the 239 public school districts in Arkansas was 48.4 % and varied

| Characteristic                          | No. (%)       |
|----------------------------------------|---------------|
| Gender                                 |               |
| Female                                 | 25,519 (73.4 %) |
| Male                                   | 7,767 (22.3 %) |
| Unknown                                | 1,497 (4.3 %)  |
| Race/Ethnicity                         |               |
| American Indian or Alaskan Native      | 68 (0.2 %)    |
| Asian                                  | 134 (0.4 %)   |
| Black or African American              | 4,186 (12.0 %) |
| Hispanic                               | 903 (2.6 %)   |
| Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander | 24 (0.1 %)  |
| Other                                  | 1,177 (3.4 %) |
| Unknown or Not Reported                | 3,017 (8.7 %) |
| White                                  | 26,177 (75.3 %) |
| Age Category                           |               |
| 18–24                                  | 785 (2.3 %)   |
| 25–44                                  | 13,567 (39.0 %) |
| 45–64                                  | 18,013 (51.8 %) |
| 65 and older                           | 2,415 (6.9 %) |
| Total                                  | 34,783 (100 %) |

Table 1: Characteristics of Arkansas teachers and staff who have received at least one dose of any COVID-19 vaccine (n = 34,783).
widely (5.9 % – 73.7 %) with at least one dose, and 41.3 % (3.0 % – 67.1 %) that have completed the series. The uppermost and bottommost school districts with respect to vaccine uptake by district are listed in Tables 3 and 4. There was a wide range in the proportion of teachers and staff with at least one dose of vaccine. Each of the school districts within the top ten range had over 60 % of teachers and staff with at least one dose of a COVID-19 vaccine. However, only the top four school districts achieved ≥ 70 % immunization of the staff with at least one dose. Conversely, only one of the school districts in the bottom ten range had more than 25 % of teachers and staff receiving at least one dose. Fig. 1 shows the distribution of the top ten and bottom ten school districts within the state. In general, public school districts in the bottom ten range tended to be located in more rural areas of Arkansas. Table 3 provides a demographic breakdown of teachers and staff with at least one dose in the uppermost and bottommost school districts with respect to overall uptake. Slight differences are observed with the bottommost districts having proportionally higher uptake among men, Black or African Americans and among individuals 45 years and older.

Fig. 2 shows the cumulative proportion of public K-12 teachers and staff that have received at least one dose and who have completed the series of any vaccine over time. The most rapid increase coincides with the initial announcement that the state would make teachers and staff eligible as a priority group within Phase 1b populations. Although the proportion of individuals with at least one dose continues to increase at the time of the preparation of this manuscript, it is doing so at a slower pace in the most recent seven weeks. Additionally, there is an absolute difference of 7 % between individuals with at least one dose and those who have completed the series at the most recent time interval. Included in this are 3,576 (10.3 %) individuals who have only one dose of the Pfizer-BioNTech or Moderna vaccine and are ≥ 42 days from their first dose.

4. Discussion

This analysis provides one of the first detailed analyses of COVID-19 vaccine uptake within specific priority groups and, to our knowledge, the first analysis of K-12 teachers and staff. In early March, the current administration announced that states should prioritize their teachers and staff for vaccination so that schools across the country could reopen. By this point, Arkansas had been vaccinating teachers and staff for six weeks following the announcement of the state’s partial transition to Phase 1b on January 18th. Increased access to vaccines through the FRPP, as a result of the administration’s prioritization, did not improve the rate of vaccine uptake in public K-12 teachers and staff. As of April 22, 2021, half of Arkansas public K-12 teachers and staff have received at least one dose, and 44 % have been fully immunized. This is in contrast to data recently published by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) that announced that nearly 80 % of teachers, school staff, and childcare workers nationwide had received at least one dose of a COVID-19 vaccine [10].

Most teachers and staff receiving at least one dose were women (73 %), white (75 %) and between the ages of 45 and 64 (52 %). This demographic breakdown is relatively consistent with the overall characteristics of public-school teachers across the country [11]. Certified staff, exclusive of certified teachers, had the highest proportion of individuals with at least one dose (67 %), followed by teachers (55 %), and classified staff (46 %). Classified staff typically include those which are not certified, such as bus drivers, cafeteria workers, and maintenance workers. In Arkansas, this group comprises 40 % of all public K-12 teachers and staff. The comparatively low uptake of COVID-19 vaccines cannot be directly explained by any one factor using these data. However, given that vaccine has been prioritized and available to this group for over three months, that accessibility was increased through onsite vaccination clinics that were widely available, and that local availability of vaccine
Fig. 1. Map of the top and bottom ten school districts with respect to the proportion of public K-12 teachers and staff who have received at least one dose of any COVID-19 vaccine.

Fig. 2. Cumulative proportion of public K-12 teachers and staff who have received at least one dose and who have completed the series of any COVID-19 vaccine by week.
has increased over time, hesitancy and/or health literacy could be significant factors in the lack of vaccine uptake.

Tables 3 and 4 provide the top and bottom ten school districts, out of 239 within the state, in terms of the proportion of teachers and staff with at least one vaccine dose and the respective demographic distribution. Fig. 1 shows their respective geographic locations. Six of the school districts listed in the top ten are located around population centers within the state. It is of note that the school districts within the bottom ten tended to be in more rural areas. Some of the school districts in the bottom ten had virtually no uptake of vaccine (less than 10% with at least one dose), despite the availability of onsite clinics. Additionally, the bottom ten school districts had slightly higher uptake among men, Black or African Americans, and older individuals relative to the top ten districts. There is clear evidence that Americans living in rural areas are hesitant to receive a COVID-19 vaccine, and previous studies have shown geographic clustering of nonCOVID-19 vaccine hesitancy [12–15]. Our data suggest congruency with those findings.

Fig. 2 illustrates the uptake of the vaccine over time. The proportion of teachers and staff with at least one dose increased rapidly between January 18th (date of announcement of transition to Phase 1b) and February 14th (4% to 43%), suggesting that a portion of the target population was motivated to be vaccinated. On the contrary, between February 28th and April 22nd, the proportion of teachers and staff taking the vaccine changed minimally, increasing slightly from 45% to 51% receiving at least one dose. This would indicate that lack of access to vaccine, improved or overcome through prioritization of teachers and staff by the FRPP, was not a major contributor to the lack of uptake. Again, pointing to vaccine hesitancy as a significant cause of the low vaccination rates. Over this period, vaccine allocation has consistently increased throughout Arkansas. As of April 22, 2021, Arkansas had administered 69% of its allotted vaccine supply. The stagnation in the proportion of teachers and staff with at least one dose coupled with the increasing vaccine supply could be yet another sign of considerable vaccine hesitancy. Data showing that individuals in the US are hesitant to receive any of the COVID-19 vaccines is growing [14,16]. This represents a profound public health messaging and intervention challenge. In recent years, vaccine hesitancy has been fueled by misinformation and disinformation and is more commonly associated with certain individual characteristics, including religious beliefs, sociodemographic characteristics, political affiliation, and geographic location [12,13]. This phenomenon appears to have become accentuated during the COVID-19 vaccine rollout.

Delaying second doses in a two-dose series represents yet another layer of complexity to the COVID-19 vaccine rollout. Data regarding individuals who delay receiving their second dose is scarce and ill-described. However, a recent report documented that nationally 3.4% of individuals that received vaccine in the initial 8 weeks of COVID-19 vaccine rollout had not received their 2nd vaccine dose within 42 days of the first [17]. Ten percent of Arkansas public teachers and staff that have received at least one dose have yet to complete their vaccination series within 42 days of their first dose, a rate nearly-three times higher than the national average. As vaccination campaigns progress, it will be prudent for states to adequately measure and understand factors which may inhibit individuals from completing their COVID-19 vaccination series.

The consequences of poor COVID-19 vaccine uptake among K-12 educators and staff are multiple. As states and school districts relax or do away with masking and physical distancing requirements, COVID-19-infected unvaccinated teachers and staff will pose a greater exposure risk to children. These exposures will undoubtedly result in quarantine of students, thus disrupting the educational experience. The 66,076 teachers and staff serve a student population of 473,861, which represents more than 85% of the school-aged children in Arkansas. Because COVID-19 vaccines are currently unavailable for use in children, exposure to unvaccinated infected teachers and staff can result in childhood illness, hospitalization, or even death. Exposure and quarantine of unvaccinated teachers will place further stress on the already short supply of educators, in particular, in rural areas of the country. Additionally, the threat of more contagious and possibly virulent COVID-19 variants is already cause for concern in the US. Unvaccinated teachers, staff and students will be the most vulnerable as these variants gain a foothold in states.

This study has several limitations. First, deterministic matching methods were used with three variables (e.g., first name, last name, and date of birth) to link teachers and staff to the immunization registry. Since patient identifiers were limited, information bias is possible in that some individuals may not have been correctly identified as having received a vaccine due to variations in name spelling or data entry errors. Also, data on vaccine administrations are reported passively from providers through a variety of mechanisms. Providers may not have been able to report data in a complete or timely fashion, which may have impacted the data linkage. Finally, it is possible that teachers and staff residing along state borders may have been vaccinated outside of Arkansas and would not be captured in the Arkansas registry. Immunization registry data is not currently shared between states for COVID-19 vaccinations. However, these factors would not be expected to affect the time trends observed in this analysis. Despite these limitations, these analyses provide an important initial glimpse at COVID-19 vaccine uptake within a priority group.

Conflict of Interest Disclosure

The authors report no conflicts of interest.

Declaration of Competing Interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

References

[1] Oliver SE, Gargano JW, Marin M, et al. The Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices' Interim Recommendation for Use of Pfizer-BioNTech COVID-19 Vaccine - United States, December 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2020;69(50):1922–4. https://doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm6950e2.
[2] Oliver SE, Gargano JW, Scobie H, et al. The Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices’ Interim Recommendation for Use of Janssen COVID-19 Vaccine - United States, February 2021. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 03 2021;70(9):329–33doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm7009e4.
[3] Oliver SE, Gargano JW, Marin M, et al. The Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices’ Interim Recommendation for Use of Moderna COVID-19 Vaccine - United States, December 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2021;69(5152):1653–6. https://doi.org/10.15585/mmwr. mm701552e1.
Wallace M WK, Gargano JW, et al. The Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices’ Interim Recommendation for Use of Pfizer-BioNTech COVID-19 Vaccine in Adolescents Aged 12–15 Years — United States, May 2021. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2021;ePub: 14 May 2021. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm7020e1

Dooling K, Marin M, Wallace M, et al. The Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices’ Updated Interim Recommendation for Allocation of COVID-19 Vaccine — United States, December 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2021;69(5152):1657–60. https://doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm695152e2

Biweekly School Report. 2021. https://www.healthy.arkansas.gov/programs-services/topics/covid-19-reports.

Governor Asa Hutchinson’s Weekly COVID-19 Update Press Briefing. 2021. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=y5gfGN8caHM.

SAS Institute Inc. 2013. SAS® 9.4 Statements: Reference. Version Version 9.4. https://www.R-project.org/

Nearly 80 percent of teachers, school staff, and childcare workers receive at least one shot of COVID-19 vaccine. 2021. https://www.cdc.gov/media/releases/2021/s0406-teachers-staff-vaccine.html.

National Center for Education Statistics. Digest of Education Statistics. 2019. https://nces.ed.gov/pubsearch/getpubcats.asp?id=091#061.

Omer SB, Salmon DA, Orenstein WA, deHart MP, Halsey N. Vaccine refusal, mandatory immunization, and the risks of vaccine-preventable diseases. N Engl J Med 2009;360(19):1981–8. https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa0806477.

Salmon DA, Dudley MZ, Glanz JM, Omer SB. Vaccine hesitancy: Causes, consequences, and a call to action. Vaccine 2015;33(Suppl 4):D66–71. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2015.09.035.

Khubchandani J, Sharma S, Price JH, Wiblishauser MJ, Sharma M, Webb FJ. COVID-19 Vaccination Hesitancy in the United States: A Rapid National Assessment. J Community Health. 04 2021;46(2):270-277. doi:10.1007/s10900-020-00958-x.

Murthy BP SN, Weller D, et al. Disparities in COVID-19 Vaccination Coverage Between Urban and Rural Counties — United States, December 14, 2020–April 10, 2021. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2021;ePub: 18 May 2021.doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm7020e3.

Wood S, Schulman K. Beyond Politics - Promoting Covid-19 Vaccination in the United States. N Engl J Med 2021;384(7):e23.

Kriss JL, Reynolds LE, Wang A, et al. COVID-19 Vaccine Second-Dose Completion and Interval Between First and Second Doses Among Vaccinated Persons - United States, December 14, 2020–February 14, 2021. MMWR Mortal Wkly Rep 2021;70(11):389-95. https://doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm7011e2.