Octupolar versus Néel Order in Cubic $5d^2$ Double Perovskites
D. D. Maharaj, G. Sala, M. B. Stone, E. Kermarrec, C. Ritter, F. Fauth, C. A. Marjerrison, J. E. Greedan, A. Paramekanti, and B. D. Gaulin
Phys. Rev. Lett. 124, 087206 — Published 27 February 2020
DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.124.087206
Octupolar vs Néel Order in Cubic 5d² double perovskites

D. D. Maharaj, G. Sala, M. B. Stone, E. Kermarrec, C. Ritter, F. Fauth, C. A. Marjerrison, J. E. Greedan, A. Paramekanti, and B. D. Gaulin

1Department of Physics and Astronomy, McMaster University, Hamilton, ON L8S 4M1 Canada
2Neutron Scattering Division, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, Tennessee 37831, USA
3Laboratoire de Physique des Solides, CNRS, Univ. Paris-Sud, Université Paris-Saclay, 91405 Orsay Cedex, France
4Institut Laue-Langevin, Boîte Postale 156, 38042 Grenoble Cédex, France
5CELLS-ALBA Synchrotron, Carrer de la Llum 2-26, 08290 Cerdanyola del Vallès, Barcelona, Spain
6Brookhouse Institute for Materials Research, McMaster University, Hamilton, ON L8S 4M1 Canada
7Department of Chemistry and Chemical Biology, McMaster University, ON, L8S 4M1, Canada
8Department of Physics, University of Toronto, 60 St. George Street, Toronto, ON, M5S 1A7 Canada
9Canadian Institute for Advanced Research, 661 University Ave., Toronto, ON, M5G 1M1 Canada

(Dated: January 30, 2020)

We report time-of-flight neutron spectroscopy, and neutron and X-ray diffraction studies, of the 5d² double perovskite (DP) magnets, Ba₂MOsO₆ (M = Zn, Mg, Ca). These materials host antiferromagnetically coupled 5d² Os⁶⁺ ions decorating a face-centred cubic (FCC) lattice, and are found to remain cubic down to the lowest temperatures. They all exhibit thermodynamic anomalies consistent with a single phase transition at a temperature T*, and a gapped magnetic excitation spectrum with spectral weight concentrated at wavevectors typical of type-I antiferromagnetic orders. However, while muon spin resonance experiments show clear evidence for time-reversal symmetry breaking below T*, we observe no corresponding magnetic Bragg scattering signal. These results are shown to be consistent with ferro-octupolar symmetry breaking below T*, and are discussed in the context of other 5d DP magnets, and theories of exotic orders driven by multipolar interactions.

PACS numbers: 75.25.aj, 75.40.Gb, 75.70.Tj

Introduction — Ordered double perovskite (DP) magnets, with the chemical formula A₂BB'O₆, provide a fascinating avenue to study the interplay of geometric frustration with strong spin-orbit coupling (SOC) [1]. Here, B and B' sublattices individually form an FCC lattice of edge-sharing tetrahedra, an archetype for geometric frustration in three dimensions. Furthermore, the flexibility of the DP lattice to host heavy ions at the B' site allows the study of spin-orbit driven physics, as the strength of SOC scales ∼ Z², where Z is the atomic number of the magnetic ion [2]. This interplay of SOC and frustration in DPs is predicted to yield exotic ground states [3-4].

The single-particle t₂g levels in an octahedral crystal field are split by strong SOC, resulting in a quartet j = 3/2 ground state and a doublet j = 1/2 excited state. Famously, for a d⁸ electronic configuration, as occurs for Ir⁴⁺ or Ru³⁺, this results in a single j = 1/2 hole, leading to extreme quantum magnetism, and Kitaev exchange interactions in appropriate geometries [7-13]. On the other hand, ions with d⁴ and d⁵ configurations are respectively expected to form j = 3/2 or total J = 2 moments [3-6]. Theoretical studies incorporating intersite orbital repulsion between such ions argue for wide regimes of quadrupolar order on the FCC lattice [3-6] which may coexist with dipolar antiferromagnetic (AF) or valence bond orders [14]. Recent experiments on 5d¹ oxides, Ba₂NaOsO₆ with Os⁷⁺ [15] and Ba₂MgReO₆ with Re⁶⁺ [17], have found evidence for two transitions associated with these distinct broken symmetries: quadrupolar ordering at T_Q and onset of coexisting dipolar AF order below a lower transition temperature T_N.

In this Letter, we explore the case of d² ions on the B' site, with effective J = 2 moments. We report new magnetic neutron powder diffraction (NPD), inelastic neutron scattering (INS), and high angular resolution synchrotron X-ray diffraction (XRD) results on three cubic DPs: Ba₂MOsO₆, with M = Zn, Mg, Ca (respectively referred to henceforth as BZO, BMO, and BCO). In contrast to d¹ DPs, these materials display clear thermodynamic signatures of a single phase transition [18-20] at T* ∼ 30-50 K, which is associated with time-reversal symmetry breaking based on oscillations observed in zero field muon spin relaxation (ZF-µSR) [20]. Our INS results show strong, gapped, magnetic spectral weight at wavevectors typical of type-I AF order, but we detect no clear signature of an ordered AF moment in the diffraction data, leading us to place an upper limit between 0.13-0.06 µ_B per B' site. Furthermore, our NPD and XRD results show no deviation from cubic symmetry, thus ruling out quadrupolar order. We propose that these striking and unexpected results may be understood via the emergence of time-reversal symmetry breaking ferro-octupolar order below T*.

Multipolar orders have been extensively studied in heavy fermion f-electron compounds [21]. Examples include NpO₂ [22-25], where experiments suggest a primary rank-5 magnetic multipolar order driving secondary quadrupolar order, the “hidden order” state of URu₂Si₂...
and recent discoveries of quadrupolar and octupolar orders in PrX$_2$Al$_2$O$_7$ (X = Ti, V) [20, 21]. In stark contrast, multipolar orders in d-electron systems are less explored [15, 17, 32, 33]; our work appears to be the first reported candidate for d-orbital octupolar order.

BZO, BMO and BCO have been previously studied in powder form. In all three materials, NPD and XRD confirm that they remain in the cubic $Fm\bar 3m$ space group down to the lowest temperature. They all display Curie-Weiss-like magnetic susceptibilities ($\chi$) at high temperatures, with large AF Curie-Weiss constants ($\Theta_{CW} \sim 130$ K), and anomalies at $T^*$ in the form of a splitting between field-cooled and zero-field cooled results. They all exhibit peaks in their heat capacity, or in the related measure $d(\chi)/dT$, at $T^* \sim 50$ K (BMO, BCO) or $T^* \sim 30$ K (BZO), indicating a phase transition [18, 20]. These findings are summarized in Table I.

The entropy released up to $\sim 2T^*$ in all three materials appears to be $\sim R\ln(2)$ per mole, as explicitly shown for BZO and BMO in the Supplemental Material (SM) [35, 39]. This is much smaller than the $R\ln(5)$ expected for an effective $J = 2$ moment [18, 20], and it points to part of the entropy being quenched at $T \gg T^*$ (i.e., above $\sim 200$ K). This is in contrast to the $\sim R\ln(5)$ entropy released up to $\sim 2T_N$ for the tetragonal counterpart Sr$_2$MgOsO$_6$, which has a high Néel ordering temperature $T_N \sim 100$ K [37].

These three cubic samples have also been previously studied using $\mu$SR techniques [18, 20], and it is primarily on the basis of these zero longitudinal field $\mu$SR oscillations for $T < T^*$, indicative of a time-reversal broken state, that the transition at $T^*$ was associated with AF order. However, no magnetic neutron diffraction peaks could be identified in this earlier study at low temperatures, with a sensitivity to ordered moment of $\sim 0.7 \mu_B$. In the present work, we significantly improve on this bound, still finding no evidence of magnetic Bragg peaks.

The corresponding 5$d^3$ osmium-based DPs, both cubic Ba$_2$YOsO$_6$ and monoclinic Sr$_2$ScOsO$_6$ and La$_2$LiOsO$_6$, show clear Néel transitions to AF ordered states, with large ordered moments $\sim 1.7\mu_B$ [19, 25]. These observed ordered moments are reduced from the 3$\mu_B$ value expected for an orbitally-quenched moment, pointing to strong SOC effects, or covalency, or both. Nonetheless magnetic Bragg scattering at the (100) and (110) positions is easily observed, along with strong, gapped inelastic magnetic scattering centred at these two ordering wavevectors. Previously studied 5$d^2$ DPs such as monoclinic Sr$_2$MgOsO$_6$ and cubic Ba$_2$LuReO$_6$ (with Re$^{5+}$) also show transitions to Type I AF order, as seen via neutron diffraction, albeit with much smaller ordered moments, 0.6(2) and 0.34(4) $\mu_B$, respectively [37, 32].

Below we present our experimental findings on powder samples of the cubic systems, BZO, BMO and BCO. Details of experimental and analysis methods are in the SM [35], which includes Refs. [33, 37]. Our new NPD measurements on D20 [18] at the Institut Laue Langevin (ILL) have $\sim 10$ to 20 times more sensitivity to magnetic Bragg scattering as compared with previous NPD measurements taken at the C2 instrument of the Chalk River Laboratories. No magnetic Bragg scattering is observed at 10 K, factors of 3−5 below $T^*$ for any of these materials. We do however observe gapped, inelastic magnetic spectral weight centred on wavevectors characteristic of type-I AF order. We thus conclude that the dominant broken symmetry below $T^*$ in these three cubic DP $d^2$ magnets must involve multipolar ordering.

**Results** — Time-of-flight INS measurements from SEQUOIA [49] are shown in Fig. 1. Panels (a)-(c) show the INS spectra well below (top panel) and above $T^*$ for BZO, BMO, and BCO respectively. Panels (d)-(f) show cuts through this data as a function of energy, integrating all $|Q| < 1.15$ Å$^{-1}$ and as a function of temperature, again for BZO, BMO and BCO respectively.

The data sets for all three samples in Fig. 1 are similar, with gapped magnetic spectral weight at low $|Q|$'s, typical of the 100 (0.78 Å$^{-1}$) and 110 (1.1 Å$^{-1}$) Bragg positions. The full bandwidth of the magnetic excitation spectrum appears to be $\sim 6$ meV. From Fig. 1(b), (c), (e), and (f), this magnetic spectral weight overlaps in energy with strong phonon scattering near $\sim 18$ meV and 14 meV for BMO and BCO respectively. Even though our low $|Q|$-integration favours magnetic scattering at the expense of scattering from phonons, whose intensity tends to go like $|Q|^2$, we still pick up a sizeable contribution from this high phonon density of states (DOS), especially at high temperatures where the thermal population of the phonons is large. The observed redshift in the peak of the phonon DOS from $\sim 17$ meV in BMO to $\sim 14$ meV for BCO is expected since Ca$^{2+}$ is isoelectronic to Mg$^{2+}$ but heavier. While the Zn$^{2+}$ in BZO is heavier still than Ca$^{2+}$, it is not isoelectronic, instead possessing a filled 3$d$ shell. This might lead to its higher energy phonon.

As the high phonon DOS is well separated from the magnetic spectral weight in BZO, shown in Figs. 1(a) and 1(d), this is where the nature of the gapped magnetic scattering is most easily appreciated. The energy cuts in Fig. 1(d) clearly show a well developed gap of $\sim$
10 meV and a bandwidth of \( \sim 6 \) meV. This structure collapses by 25 K, where \( T^* = 30 \) K for BZO, at which point the gap has largely filled in and only a vestige of an overdamped spin excitation at \( \sim 10 \) meV remains. This is very similar to what occurs in the \( d^3 \) DPs on the approach to their \( T_{N_S} \), except that there is no obvious temperature dependent Bragg scattering at the 100 or 110 positions, as would be expected for type-I AF order.

The absence of evidence for magnetic Bragg scattering is seen in Fig. 2. Fig. 2a shows neutron diffraction data taken at \( T = 10 \) K, well below \( T^* = 30 \) K in BZO, using the D20 diffractometer at the ILL [48]. This data and the corresponding NPD data on BMO and BCO refine in the cubic \( Fm\bar{3}m \) space group at all temperatures measured. Figure 2b), c) and d) then show a subtraction of high temperature (50 K for BZO; 70 K for BMO and BCO) data sets from low temperature data sets for each of BZO, BCO, and BMO, respectively. A calculated neutron diffraction profile appropriate for a type-I AF structure below \( T^* \) is shown as the red line in Fig. 2b), c) and d), where the assumed ordered moment in the calculation is 0.06\( \mu_B \) for BZO (b), 0.11\( \mu_B \) for BMO (c), and 0.13\( \mu_B \) for BCO (d). Taking the case where the evidence against long range magnetic order below \( T^* \) is most stringent, BZO, we can eliminate conventional type-I AF order of magnetic dipoles with an ordered moment.

![FIG. 1](image1.png)

**FIG. 1.** (a) - (c): Neutron scattering intensity contour plots for BZO, BMO, and BCO shown as a function of energy transfer, \( E \) and momentum transfer \( |Q| \) at base temperature (top) and at \( T > T^* \) (bottom), respectively. Below \( T^* \), clear gapped magnetic inelastic spectral weight develops around (100) and (110) wavevectors (\( \sim 0.78 \) \( \text{\AA}^{-1} \)) and (110) (1.1 \( \text{\AA}^{-1} \)) in each case. (d) and (e): Low \( |Q| \) integrated cuts of the neutron scattering intensity as a function of energy transfer \( E \) as a function of temperature for BZO, BMO, and BCO, respectively. A gap in the magnetic excitation spectrum is clearly revealed for each compound for \( T < T^* \).

![FIG. 2](image2.png)

**FIG. 2.** (a) NPD measurements on BZO for \( T = 10 \) K with the experimental data set in black and the fit to the refined \( Fm\bar{3}m \) structure in red. (b) Subtraction of the 50 K data set from the 10 K data set. The red line shows the calculated magnetic diffraction pattern for BZO with an Os\(^{6+} \) ordered moment of 0.06\( \mu_B \), which we establish as the upper limit for an ordered dipole moment in BZO. Green fiducial lines indicate the locations of the magnetic peaks expected for type-I AF order. Panels (c) and (d) show the same comparison for BMO and BCO. These establish upper limits on an ordered Os\(^{6+} \) dipole moment of 0.11\( \mu_B \) and 0.13\( \mu_B \), respectively.
greater than \( \sim 0.06 \mu_B \). This upper limit for magnetic dipole order is a factor of \( \sim 12 \) more stringent than previous limits on magnetic Bragg scattering for this family of cubic DP materials. This upper bound for \( \mu_{ord} \) in BCO is \( \sim 35\% \) lower than the value, \( 0.2 \mu_B \), previously extracted from a comparison of the \( \mu\)SR internal fields of BCO and \( \text{Ba}_2\text{YRuO}_6 \) [18, 50].

Competing multipolar orders. — Our study shows all or most of the static \( 5d^2 \) moment of \( \text{Os}^{6+} \) in BZO, BMO and BCO is not visible to neutron diffraction below \( T^* \). Nonetheless, strong inelastic magnetic scattering is easily observed at all temperatures, and it is most clearly gapped at \( T \ll T^* \). One scenario to explain these results is that the ground state has dominant quadrupolar ordering, accompanied by weak dipolar ordering [3, 4, 6]. A quadrupolar ordering transition at \( T \gg T^* \) can partially quench the \( R \ln(5) \) entropy, with the residual \( \sim R \ln(2) \) entropy being quenched by AF dipolar ordering at \( T^* \) which breaks time-reversal symmetry. The quadrupolar order can also pin the direction of the ordered dipole moment, explaining the spin-gap, and if the ordered dipole moment is weak, it may escape detection in a NPD experiment. However, the orbital selection accompanying such a quadrupolar order would lower the crystal symmetry, at odds with our high resolution NPD data shown for BCO in Fig. 2(a). We have carried out even higher resolution XRD measurements on BCO, the family member which best exhibits undamped ZF-\( \mu\)SR oscillations. These measurements were conducted at the high angular resolution diffraction instrument \( BL04 - MSPD \), beamline 8 of the ALBA Synchrotron Light facility (Barcelona, Spain) [51]. The sensitivity of these measurements to possible weak splittings of the cubic Bragg peaks is \( \sim 10 \) times greater than the NPD measurements; see Fig. 3(a) inset. These XRD results, in Figs. 3(b)-(d), show no splitting or broadening of the cubic Bragg peaks, yielding an upper limit on local distortions \(< 0.1\% \) (see SM [55]). This confirms that BCO remains cubic even for \( T \ll T^* \), ruling out quadrupolar ordering. We contrast this with the \( 5d^1 \) osmate \( \text{Ba}_2\text{NaOsO}_6 \) which exhibits measurable \( \sim 0.5\%-0.7\% \) local distortions associated with quadrupolar ordering [52].

Here, we propose a distinct scenario, an octupolar ordered ground state, that provides the most promising vehicle to explain all the salient observations. For an effective \( J = 2 \) moment, a residual octahedral crystal field Hamiltonian is

\[
H_{\text{CEF}} = -V_{\text{eff}}(C_{40} + 5O_{44}),
\]

where the Steven’s operators (dropping constant terms) are

\[
O_{40} = 35J_z^4 - (30J(J + 1) - 25)J_z^2
\]

\[
O_{44} = \frac{1}{2}(J_x^4 + J_y^4).
\]

\( V_{\text{eff}} > 0 \) results in a non-Kramers ground state doublet and an excited triplet with a gap \( \Delta = 120V_{\text{eff}} \), as shown in Fig. 4 (details in SM [55]). This naturally accounts for partial entropy quenching for \( T \lesssim \Delta \), without a phase transition, with the residual \( R \ln(2) \) entropy being quenched by ordering within the doublet sector at \( T^* \). In the \( |J_z = m \rangle \) basis, the ground state wavefunctions are \( |\psi_{g,1}\rangle = |0\rangle \) and \( |\psi_{g,2}\rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(|2\rangle + |-2\rangle) \), with excited triplet wavefunctions \( |\psi_{e,\pm}\rangle = |\pm 1\rangle \) and \( |\psi_{e,0}\rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(|2\rangle - |-2\rangle) \). The ground state manifold has vanishing matrix elements for the dipole operators \( \vec{J} \), precluding dipolar order. However, \( \vec{J} \) can induce...
transitions into the excited triplet, accounting for the spin gap in INS. Defining pseudospin-1/2 operators $\vec{\tau}$ within the ground doublet, the quadrupolar operators are $(J_\alpha^2 - J_\beta^2) = 2\sqrt{3} r_\tau$, $(3J_\alpha^2 - J^2) \equiv -6 r_\tau$, while the octupolar operator $J_\alpha J_\beta J_\gamma \equiv -\sqrt{3} r_\gamma$ (overline denoting symmetrization). Octupolar order, with $\langle \tau_\gamma \rangle \neq 0$, leads to broken time-reversal symmetry below $T^*$ while preserving cubic symmetry. A mean field calculation with $\langle \tau_\gamma \rangle \neq 0$ qualitatively captures the observed entropy and magnetic susceptibility (see SM 53). Further implications of this proposal are studied in Ref. 53.

To conclude, the low temperature phases of the cubic 5$d^2$ DPs BZO, BMO, and BCO are best described arising from octupolar order within a non-Kramers ground state doublet. This exotic ground state appears to require the perfect FCC structure as non-cubic 5$d^2$ DPs, such as Sr$_2$MgOsO$_6$ 37, where the non-Kramers degeneracies are broken and AF exchange is stronger, display conventional AF ground states. Further structural studies, using dilatometry and total X-ray scattering on single crystals, and probes such as magnetostriction or Raman scattering 54, may provide smoking gun signatures of octupolar order in these 5$d^2$ materials.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported by the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada. It was also supported in part by the National Science Foundation under Grant No. PHYS-1066293 and the hospitality of the Aspen Center for Physics. We also acknowledge the hospitality of the Telluride Science Research Center. We gratefully acknowledge useful conversations with G. M. Luke and G. Chen. We are very grateful for the instrument and sample environment support provided during our inelastic neutron scattering measurements at SEQUOIA. The experiments which were performed at the Spallation Neutron Source at Oak Ridge National Laboratory was sponsored by the US Department of Energy, Office of the Basic Energy Sciences, Scientific User Facilities Division. The authors would also like to acknowledge ILL for beam time allocation experiment code 5-31-2577, doi:10.5291/ILL-DATA.5-31-2577. We acknowledge the BL04-MSPD staff of ALBA for the x-ray synchrotron powder diffraction data collection.

---

[1] W. Witszak-Krempa, G. Chen, Y. B. Kim, and L. Balents, Annual Review of Condensed Matter Physics 5, 57 (2014).
[2] K. V. Shanavas, Z. S. Popović, and S. Satpathy, Phys. Rev. B 90, 165108 (2014).
[3] G. Chen, R. Pereira, and L. Balents, Phys. Rev. B 82, 174440 (2010).
[4] G. Chen and L. Balents, Phys. Rev. B 84, 094420 (2011).
[5] C. Svoboda, M. Randeria, and N. Trivedi, Phys. Rev. B 95, 014409 (2017).
[6] C. Svoboda, M. Randeria, and N. Trivedi, arXiv e-prints, arXiv:1702.03199 (2017), arXiv:1702.03199 [cond-mat.str-el].
[7] J. c. v. Chaloupka, G. Jackeli, and G. Kahlullin, Phys. Rev. Lett. 105, 027204 (2010).
[8] Y. Singh, S. Manni, J. Reuther, T. Berlijn, R. Thomale, W. Ku, S. Trebst, and P. Gegenwart, Phys. Rev. Lett. 108, 127203 (2012).
[9] K. W. Plumb, J. P. Clancy, L. J. Sandilands, V. V. Shankar, Y. F. Hu, K. S. Burch, H.-Y. Kee, and J.-Y. Kim, Phys. Rev. B 90, 041112 (2014).
[10] S. Hwan Chun, J.-W. Kim, J. Kim, H. Zheng, C. C. Stouppos, C. D. Malliakas, J. F. Mitchell, K. Mehlawat, Y. Singh, Y. Choi, T. Gog, A. Al-Zein, M. M. Sala, M. Krisch, J. Chaloupka, G. Jackeli, G. Kahlullin, and B. J. Kim, Nature Physics 11, 462 EP (2015).
[11] A. Banerjee, C. A. Bridges, J. Q. Yan, A. A. Aczel, L. Li, M. B. Stone, G. E. Granroth, M. D. Lumsden, Y. Yin, J. Knolle, S. Bhattacharjee, D. L. Koviavzikhi, R. Moessner, D. A. Tennant, D. G. Mandrus, and S. E. Nagler, Nature Materials 15, 733 EP (2016).
[12] S. M. Winter, A. A. Tsurilin, M. Daghoffer, J. van den Brink, Y. Singh, P. Gegenwart, and R. Valenti, Journal of Physics: Condensed Matter 29, 493002 (2017).
[13] Y. Kasahara, T. Ohnishi, Y. Misuzuki, O. Tanaka, S. Ma, K. Sugii, N. Kurita, H. Tanaka, J. Nasu, Y. Motome, T. Shibauchi, and Y. Matsuda, Nature 559, 227 (2018).
[14] J. Romhányi, L. Balents, and G. Jackeli, Phys. Rev. Lett. 118, 217202 (2017).
[15] L. Liu, M. Song, W. Liu, A. P. Reyes, P. Kuhns, H. O. Lee, L. R. Fisher, and V. F. Mitrović, Nature Communications 8, 14407 EP (2017).
[16] W. Liu, R. Cong, E. García, A. Reyes, H. Lee, I. Fisher, and V. Mitrović, Physica B: Condensed Matter 536, 863 (2018).
[17] D. Hirai and Z. Hiroi, Journal of the Physical Society of Japan 88, 064712 (2019).
[18] C. M. Thompson, J. P. Carlo, R. Flacau, T. Aharen, I. A. Leahy, J. R. Polichemini, T. J. S. Munsie, T. Medina, G. M. Luke, J. Munever, S. Cheung, T. Goko, Y. J. Uemura, and J. E. Greedan, Journal of Physics: Condensed Matter 26, 306003 (2014).
[19] E. Kermarrec, C. A. Marjerrison, C. M. Thompson, D. D. Maharaj, K. Levin, S. Kroeker, G. E. Granroth, R. Flacau, Z. Yamani, J. E. Greedan, and B. D. Gaulin, Phys. Rev. B 91, 075133 (2015).
[20] C. A. Marjerrison, C. M. Thompson, A. Z. Sharmra, A. M. Hallas, M. N. Wilson, T. J. S. Munsie, R. Flacau, C. R. Wiebe, B. D. Gaulin, G. M. Luke, and J. E. Greedan, Phys. Rev. B 94, 134429 (2016).
[21] P. Santini, S. Carretta, G. Amoretti, R. Caciuffo, N. Magnani, and G. H. Lander, Rev. Mod. Phys. 81, 807 (2009).
[22] P. Santini and G. Amoretti, Phys. Rev. Lett. 85, 2188 (2000).
[23] J. A. Paixão, C. Detlefs, M. J. Longfield, R. Caciuffo, P. Santini, N. Bernhoft, J. Rebizant, and G. H. Lander, Phys. Rev. Lett. 89, 187202 (2002).
