Insecticide Resistance of *Aedes albopictus* in Zhejiang Province, China

Juan Hou§, Qinmei Liu§, Jinna Wang, Yuyan Wu, Tianqi Li, Zhenyu Gong*

Zhejiang Provincial Center for Disease Control and Prevention, Hangzhou, Zhejiang, China.

SUMMARY From 2003 until 2018, a total of 12 outbreaks with 1,654 confirmed dengue cases have been reported in Zhejiang Province. The emergence of insecticide resistance in mosquitoes will affect the control of dengue. Our study aims to investigate the current situation of insecticide resistance of *Ae. albopictus* in Zhejiang Province and compares it with the situation in 2016. *Ae. albopictus* were collected from 12 Zhejiang Province cities in 2019. Resistance to three major categories of insecticides, including 8 commonly used insecticides, was evaluated according to the tube test protocol recommended by China CDC. *Ae. albopictus* in all cities, except Hangzhou, Wenzhou, Lishui and Shaoxing, showed decreased susceptibility to beta-cypermethrin, deltamethrin and permethrin. For malathion, 3 cities *Ae. albopictus* have developed resistance, 3 cities *Ae. albopictus* have decreased susceptibility. For propoxur, in 3 cities *Ae. albopictus* showed decreased susceptibility with mortality ranging from 94.24% to 96.67%. The resistance to alpha-cypermethrin, lambda-cyhalothrin and fenitrothion is rare in *Ae. albopictus* in that only Zhoushan's mosquitoes showed decreased susceptibility to alpha-cypermethrin. The resistance to beta-cypermethrin, deltamethrin and permethrin was significantly correlated with each other. Compared to the situation in 2016, the insecticide resistance of *Ae. albopictus* in Zhejiang Province has become more common in 2019. In the emergency preparedness for future mosquito-borne diseases, two things should be done: 1) the selection of insecticides should be made based on information from insecticide resistance surveillance 2) the use of insecticide should follow scientific guidance.

Keywords *Aedes albopictus*, insecticide resistance, mosquito-borne disease, dengue fever, Zhejiang Province

1. Introduction

*Aedes albopictus*, also known as Asian tiger mosquito, originates from South-East Asia and spreads to all continents except Antarctica, making it the most invasive mosquito in the world (1). It is widely distributed across different regions in China in that cases have been reported from warm south areas, such as Hainan Island and Guangdong Province, as well as cold north regions, like Tibet plateau and Shenyang Province(2). Zhejiang Province, located on the southeast coast of China, has a subtropical monsoon climate. The local natural resources, annual average temperature of 15~18°C, and abundant rainfall make it an ideal environment for mosquito's growth and reproduction. Although *Aedes aegypti* has not been discovered yet, *Ae. albopictus* has been discovered in many places in Zhejiang Province.

*Ae. albopictus*, as the secondary vector, plays an important role in transmission of dengue virus and Chikungunya virus (3-5). It may also be a potential vector of Zika virus (6-8). Of note, *Ae. albopictus* is the main vector of Aedes-borne disease in China and the sole vector in Zhejiang Province (9,10). With the expansion of *Ae. albopictus* distribution, the global health burden caused by Aedes-borne diseases is increasing. Taking dengue fever as an example, it is estimated that 50 million population in over 100 countries contract this disease every year, and about half of the world's population are at risk for contracting dengue virus (11-13). In China, dengue fever first emerged in the southeast coast of China (Fujian Province and Guangdong Province), and then spread to the southwest and central area (including Yunnan Province, Henan Province and Shandong Province) (14-16). It is estimated that dengue fever has influence on one billion Chinese residents' health (16). Dengue fever also severely threatens the population's health in Zhejiang Province and impedes social and economic development. From 2014 to now, autochthonous dengue outbreak happens in Zhejiang Province every year (17,18). In 2017, there was a large-scale dengue outbreak in Hangzhou City with 1,136...
cases confirmed \( (18) \). Also, in that same year there was a autochthonous Chikungunya outbreak in Zhejiang Province \( (19) \).

At present, for most mosquito-borne diseases, there is no effective vaccine or specific therapeutic drug available. Therefore, controlling mosquito vectors has become a paramount measure of the global mosquito-borne disease control strategy \( (20) \). Because of high efficacy and low cost for manufacture, chemical insecticides are used as the major tool in mosquito control (especially for mosquito-borne disease control). For example, during the outbreak of dengue in Guangzhou in 2014, a large amount of pyrethroids and temephos were used to control \( \text{Ae. albopictus} \) \( (21) \). Although the use of chemical insecticides can quickly reduce mosquito density, the improper use of insecticides \( (i.e., \) used at high frequency, excessive amount of insecticide used per time, and other incorrect use behaviors) will lead to selection pressure on mosquitoes, which induces insecticide resistance in the survivors \( (22) \). The emergence of insecticide resistance will make this mosquito control strategy ineffective and eventually lead to the resurgence of mosquito-borne diseases \( (23) \).

Therefore, to maximize the control effect on mosquitoes and delay their insecticide resistance development, it is crucial to guide people to use insecticides properly. And the guidance should be made on the basis of monitoring and evaluating the situation of insecticide resistance in mosquito species in Zhejiang Province. In this study, \( \text{Ae. Albopictus} \) were collected from 11 prefecture-level cities and Yiwu City of Zhejiang Province in 2019 and eight commonly used insecticides were included in insecticide resistance testing.

2. Materials and Methods

2.1. Mosquito collection and feeding

\( \text{Ae. albopictus} \) were collected from 11 prefecture-level cities (including Hangzhou, Ningbo, Quzhou, Wenzhou, Lishui, Jinhua, Taizhou, Huzhou, Zhoushan, Jiaxing and Shaoxing) and Yiwu City in Zhejiang Province. In order to obtain the resistance level of the whole city using a multi-point sampling method, the larvae of \( \text{Ae. albopictus} \) were collected from at least three localities in each city (Figure 1). Then larvae were raised with dechlorinated tap water and fed with mouse feed. The adults were identified as species by morphology. Adult mosquitoes were fed with 10% glucose water. \( \text{Ae. albopictus} \) were maintained in a controlled laboratory, where temperature was \( 27 \pm 2 ^\circ \text{C} \), relative humidity was \( 75 \pm 10\% \), and light: dark cycle was 14 h:10 h.

2.2. Insecticide-impregnated paper

According to frequency of use, three major categories of insecticides were selected for resistance bioassays (pyrethroids: \( \beta\text{-cypermethrin, deltamethrin, permethrin, alpha-cypermethrin, lambda-cyhalothrin; } \) organophosphates: \( \text{malathion, fenitrothion; carbamate: propoxur.} \)). The discriminating doses used in this study were offered by the staff of China CDC, based on the laboratory susceptible strain of \( \text{Ae. Albopictus} \). They also provided the insecticide-impregnated papers (0.4% \( \beta\text{-cypermethrin, } 0.1\% \) deltamethrin, 3% permethrin, 0.5% \text{malathion}, 0.05% \text{propoxur}, 1.4% \text{alpha-cypermethrin, } 0.2\% \text{fenitrothion, } 0.5\% \text{lambda-cyhalothrin} and control papers for this study.

2.3. Adult resistance bioassays

The bioassays were carried out in 2019, according to the tube test protocol recommended by China CDC. The temperature, humidity and light in the testing room were the same as those in the feeding room. Both test group and control group consisted of the F1 generation of non-blood fed female mosquitoes (3~5days old). For each insecticide test, the test group was exposed to insecticide-impregnated paper for one hour with three replicates. There were 12 control groups, each of which was repeated three times. After exposure, the mosquitoes were fed with 10% glucose water.

Mortality counts were conducted 24 hours after the end of the bioassay. Mosquitoes, which were unable to fly when they were given mechanical stimulation were considered dead. If the control mortality is \( \geq 5\% \) and \(< 20\% \), the mortality should be corrected by Abbott’s formula, as follows:

\[
\text{Corrected mortality} = \frac{100 \times (\% \text{observed mortality} - \% \text{control mortality})}{\% \text{control mortality}}
\]

If the mortality of control group was \( \geq 20\% \), the bioassay should be redone. Resistant status was classified into three categories by mortality rate: resistance if mortality \(< 90\% \), probable resistance if mortality was between 90 and 98\%, and susceptibility if mortality \( \geq 98\% \).

2.4. Statistical Analysis

The correlation of the mortality between different insecticides was analyzed by Pearson correlation. Statistical analyses were performed using SPSS (version 20.0) software and a value of \(< 0.05 \) was considered to be statistically significant.

3. Results

The mosquitoes in all cities, except Hangzhou and Wenzhou, showed a decreased susceptibility to the
developed resistance, while mosquitoes in Zhoushan, Jiaxing and Lishui have probable resistance. For propoxur, mosquitoes in Quzhou, Yiwu and Jinhua had probable resistance. For alpha-cypermethrin, lambda-cyhalothrin and fenitrothion, only mosquitoes in Zhoushan had developed probable resistance, while mosquitoes in other cities are all susceptible.

Table 2 shows the correlation of the mortality between different insecticides. The mortality of beta-cypermethrin was related with that of deltamethrin and permethrin, and the r was 0.834 (P < 0.001) and 0.864 (P < 0.001), respectively. The mortality of deltamethrin was significantly associated with that of permethrin and the r of 0.960 (P < 0.0001).

4. Discussion

As the increasing health burden caused by arboviral diseases, mosquito-borne disease has become a major international public health concern. Mosquito control is the key part of the global strategy for mosquito-borne disease prevention, and insecticides are the most critical component of this work. In the past, the use of insecticides (such as long-lasting insecticidal nets; indoor residual spraying; space spraying) has effectively reduced the incidence of mosquito-borne diseases and has saved millions of people (24). However, with the overuse of chemical insecticides, mosquitoes have developed resistance to protect their lives. The first case
of insecticide resistance in mosquitoes was reported in 1952, and later on similar cases were reported across the world (25-29). The emergence of resistance negatively influenced the control of mosquito-borne diseases (30-32) and promoted scientists to develop new insecticide-based methods (33). For example, insect-attractive targeted sugar baits are being developed to control mosquitoes (34-36). However, such methods will undergo the same pattern as previous tools did in that the method works out at the beginning, but the
effectiveness would decrease in a short time because mosquitoes develop resistance (33).

We investigated the *Ae. albopictus* adults' resistance to five commonly used insecticides in Zhejiang Province in 2016 (37). Generally, after insecticide exposure, a population with a mortality < 90% is considered to be resistant, a population with a mortality > 90% and < 98% is considered to be probably resistant, and a population with mortality > 98% is considered to be susceptible. According to this, for the three pyrethroids, only Shaoxing showed resistance for beta-cypermethrin in 2016. However, the number of cities in Zhejiang Province where mosquitoes are resistant to the three pyrethroids increased in 2019. For beta-cypermethrin tested for mosquitoes in Ningbo, Quzhou, Yiwu, Jinhua, Taizhou, and Jiaxing, the mortality in 2019 is lower than the rate in 2016, suggesting a decrease in mosquitoes' susceptibility to beta-cypermethrin. For deltamethrin tested for mosquitoes in Hangzhou, Ningbo, Quzhou, Yiwu, Taizhou, Huzhou, Zhoushan and Jiaxing, the mortality in 2019 is lower than the rate in 2016. In addition, for permethrin tested for mosquitoes in Quzhou, Yiwu, Taizhou, Huzhou, Zhoushan, the morality in 2019 is lower than the rate in 2016.

In 2019, mosquitoes in Yiwu and Taizhou newly developed resistance to beta-cypermethrin; mosquitoes in Yiwu, Quzhou and Zhoushan newly developed resistance to deltamethrin; and mosquitoes in Yiwu and Quzhou have developed resistance to permethrin. These results informed us that there are more cities in Zhejiang province in which mosquitoes develop insecticide resistance.

Different from pyrethroids resistance, malathion resistance in Zhejiang Province in 2019 has been mitigated, by comparison with the situation in 2016, only for Shaoxing, Taizhou and Quzhou, mosquitoes in these cities still show resistance to malathion. The resistance status of propoxur was similar to the status in 2016 that mosquitoes in most cities are still susceptible.

Notably, a relatively intense resistance to betacypermethrin, deltamethrin and permethrin was observed in mosquitoes in Yiwu and the mortality was 65.15%, 61.67% and 80%, respectively in 2019. Yiwu is the largest wholesale market for small commodities in the world in that about 15,000 foreign businessmen from more than 100 countries and regions reside here. Our surveillance data shows that the number of imported cases of dengue fever in Yiwu is the largest in Zhejiang Province. The annual number of imported cases from 2016 to 2019 was 9, 12, 12 and 35 respectively. The local government attaches great importance to mosquito-borne diseases. The government exterminates mosquitoes in each place where any mosquito-related cases were identified, and regularly organizes large-scale mosquito control campaigns. Beta cypermethrin, deltamethrin and permethrin are often used to kill mosquitoes and flies. Large scale and high frequency use of insecticides can lead to development of resistance, which may be the explanation for resistance of adult mosquitoes in Yiwu city.

In recent years, not only has *Ae. albopictus* in Zhejiang Province developed resistance to pyrethroids, but also has the indigenous house fly. We studied the resistance of house flies in 2011, 2014 and 2017, and found that the resistance to pyrethroids was very common (38). The increase of vector resistance may be attributed to large-scale use of chemical insecticides. With the increasing challenge of mosquito-borne diseases prevention and control, the frequency of using pyrethroids increased. Wei et al. investigated the resistance of *Ae. albopictus* in the early and late stages of emergency dengue fever control in Hangzhou in 2017, and found that after 3 months of wide-ranging use of insecticides, the resistance of *Ae. albopictus* to pyrethroids increased (39). Correlations among beta-cypermethrin, deltamethrin and permethrin suggested that cross resistance may exist between them.

Through this study, we found that the resistance of *Ae. Albopictus* in Zhejiang Province has increased significantly in the past three years, and there are several implications from the study results: 1) the local government and healthcare facilities should highlight the use of insecticides resistance surveillance; 2) the insecticides should be used in a more strategic and sustainable way to reduce insecticide resistance 3) scientific management of infectious disease vectors should be developed. Guo et al. constructed "mosquito-free village" in rural areas mainly by cultivating the health literacy of villagers to reduce mosquito breeding areas (40). The success of the "mosquito-free village" would significantly reduce the imported cases of dengue fever in Yiwu.

### Table 2. Correlation of mortality between different insecticides

|          | Beta-cypermethrin | Deltamethrin | Permethrin | Malathion | Propoxur |
|----------|------------------|--------------|------------|-----------|----------|
| r        | 0.834            | 0.864        | 0.004      | 0.511     | 0.990    |
| P        | 0.001            | 0.000        | 0.990      | 0.990     | 0.000    |
| p        | < 0.05           | < 0.05       | < 0.05     | < 0.05    | < 0.05   |

Notes: *p* < 0.05
construction suggests that we can control mosquito density at a lower level with less or no insecticides. Therefore, we are calling on the government and health institutions to use the environment management and environment modification method to create an environment not conducive to mosquitoes' survival. This activity should be affiliated with other measures, such as an anti-mosquito education program to prevent future mosquito-borne disease in Zhejiang Province.

In summary, our study found that mosquitoes in most cities had resistance or probable resistance to the three major categories of tested insecticides. For beta-cypermethrin and permethrin, 2 cities' mosquitoes have developed resistance, and 3 cities' mosquitoes have decreased susceptibility. For deltamethrin and malathion, 3 cities' mosquitoes have developed resistance, and 3 cities' mosquitoes have decreased susceptibility. Few cities' mosquitoes had resistance to alpha-cypermethrin, lambda-cyhalothrin and fenitrothion. In the future daily mosquito control, the government and health institutions should adopt a comprehensive management of mosquito control, which involves environment management, biocontrol, physical control, and chemical control. To more efficiently reduce the density of mosquitoes and lower the risk of mosquito-borne disease in Zhejiang Province, the next objective is to strengthen activities in eliminating mosquito breeding sites within this province. To achieve this, the government and health institutions should launch anti-mosquito campaigns to raise citizen awareness of mosquito control strategies and guide healthcare workers to use insecticides properly. In the emergency preparedness for future mosquito-borne diseases, two things should be done: 1) the selection of insecticides should be made based on information obtained from insecticide resistance surveillance 2) the use of insecticide should strictly follow scientific guidance.

Acknowledgements

This work was financially supported by grants from the State Project for Scientific & Technological Development of the 13th Five Year Plan (grant number: 2017ZX10303404). We thank Fengxia Meng and Chunchun Zhao from the China CDC for providing insecticide-impregnated papers with diagnostic doses and control papers. We also appreciate those who support this work: our colleagues from Center for Disease Control and Prevention of 11 prefecture-level cities and Yiwu city.

References

1. Benedict MQ, Levine RS, Hawley WA, Lounibos LP. Spread of the tiger: global risk of invasion by the mosquito Aedes albopictus. Vector Borne Zoonotic Dis. 2007; 7:76-85.
2. Liu Q. The sustainable control strategy and key technology of Aedes vector. Electronic Journal of Emerging Infectious Diseases. 2018; 3:75-79. (in Chinese)
3. Gratz NG. Critical review of the vector status of Aedes albopictus. Med Vet Entomol. 2004; 18:215-227.
4. Paupy C, Delatte H, Bagny L, Corbel V, Fontenille D. Aedes albopictus, an arbovirus vector: from the darkness to the light. Microbes Infect. 2009; 11:1177-1185.
5. Rezza G. Dengue and chikungunya: long-distance spread and outbreaks in naïve areas. Pathog Glob Health. 2014; 108:349-355.
6. Gardner LM, Chen N, Sarkar S. Global risk of Zika virus depends critically on vector status of Aedes albopictus. Lancet Infect Dis. 2016; 16:522-523.
7. McKenzie BA, Wilson AE, Zohdy S. Aedes albopictus is a competent vector of Zika virus: a meta-analysis. PLoS One. 2019; 14:e0216794-e0216794.
8. Wong P-SJ, Li M-zl, Chong C-S, Ng L-C, Tan C-H. Aedes (Stegomyia) albopictus (Skuse): a potential vector of Zika virus in Singapore. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2013; 7:e2348-e2348.
9. Guo Y-h, Wu H-x, Liu X-b, Yue Y-j, Ren D-s, Zhao N, Li G-c, Song X-p, Lu L, Liu Q-y. National vectors surveillance report on mosquitoes in China, 2018. Chin J Vector Biol & Control. 2019; 30:134-138. (in Chinese)
10. Wu Y, Gong ZY, Hou J, Guo S, Wang Jn, Ling F. Analysis of vector surveillance from 2011 to 2013 in Zhejiang province, China. Chin J Vector Biol & Control. 2015; 26:394-397. (in Chinese)
11. Bhatt S, Gething PW, Brady OJ, et al. The global distribution and burden of dengue. Nature. 2013; 496:504-507.
12. Brady OJ, Gething PW, Bhatt S, Messina JP, Brownstein JS, Hoen AG, Moyes CL, Farlow AW, Scott TW, Hay SI. Refining the global spatial limits of dengue virus transmission by evidence-based consensus. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2012; 6:e1760-e1760.
13. Messina JP, Brady OJ, Pigott DM, Brownstein JS, Hoen AG, Hay SI. A global compendium of human dengue virus occurrence. Sci Data. 2014; 1:140004.
14. Chen Q, Song W, Mu D, Li Y, Yin W, Li Z. Analysis on epidemiological characteristics of dengue fever in China, as of 31st August, 2017. Disease Surveillance. 2017; 32:801-804. (in Chinese)
15. Ning W, Lu L, Ren H, Liu Q. Spatial and Temporal Variations of Dengue Fever Epidemics in China from 2004 to 2013. Journal of Geo-Information Science. 2015; 17:614-621. (in Chinese)
16. Zhang F. The current situation of dengue fever in China. Electronic Journal of Emerging Infectious Diseases. 2018; 3:65-66. (in Chinese)
17. Ai L, Chen E, Jimin S, Jianguing R. Analysis on spatial and temporal clustering of dengue fever epidemic in Zhejiang,2004-2016. Disease Surveillance. 2019; 34:27-31. (in Chinese)
18. Yu H, Kong Q, Wang J, Qiu X, Wen Y, Yu X, Liu M, Wang H, Pan J, Sun Z. Multiple Lineages of Dengue Virus Serotype 2 Cosmopolitan Genotype Caused a Local Dengue Outbreak in Hangzhou, Zhejiang Province, China, in 2017. Sci Rep. 2019; 9:7345-7345.
19. Pan J, Fang C, Yan J, Yan H, Zhan B, Sun Y, Liu Y, Mao H, Cao G, Lv L, Zhang Y, Chen E. Chikungunya Fever Outbreak, Zhejiang Province, China, 2017. Emerg Infect Dis. 2019; 25:1589-1591.
20. Abramides GC, Roiz D, Guitart R, Quintana S, Giménez N. Control of the Asian tiger mosquito (Aedes albopictus) in
a firmly established area in Spain: risk factors and people's involvement. Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg. 2013; 107:706-714.

21. Su X, Guo Y, Deng J, Xu J, Zhou G, Zhou T, Li Y, Zhong D, Kong L, Wang X, Liu M, Wu K, Yan G, Chen X-G. Fast emerging insecticide resistance in Aedes albopictus in Guangzhou, China: Alarm to the dengue epidemic. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2019; 13:e0007665-e0007665.

22. Yavaşoğlu SI, Yaylagül EO, Akiner MM, Ülger C, Çağlar SS, Şimşek FM. Current insecticide resistance status in Anopheles sacharovi and Anopheles superpictus populations in former malaria endemic areas of Turkey. Acta Trop. 2019; 193:148-157.

23. Liu N. Insecticide resistance in mosquitoes: impact, mechanisms, and research directions. Annu Rev Entomol. 2015; 60:537-559.

24. Bhatt S, Weiss DJ, Cameron E, et al. The effect of malaria control on Plasmodium falciparum in Africa between 2000 and 2015. Nature. 2015; 526:207-211.

25. Bharati M, Rai P, Saha D. Insecticide resistance in mosquitoes: impact, mechanisms, and research directions. Annu Rev Entomol. 2015; 60:537-559.

26. Fotakis EA, Chaskopoulou A, Grigoraki L, Tsiamantas A, Skuse from sub-Himalayan districts of West Bengal, India. Acta Trop. 2019; 192:104-111.

27. Kamgang B, Marcombe S, Chandre F, Nchoutpouen D, 2000 and 2015. Nature. 2015; 526:207-211.

28. Chuaycharoensuk T, Juntarajumnong W, Boonyuan W, Cui F, Raymond M, Qiao C-L. Insecticide resistance of Aedes albopictus. Acta Trop. 2019; 193:148-157.

29. Catteruccia F. Malaria-carrying mosquitoes get a leg up on insecticides. Nature. 2020; 577:319-320.

30. Gu ZY, He J, Teng XD, Lan CJ, Shen RX, Wang YT, Zhang N, Dong YD, Zhao Y, Li CX. Efficacy of orally toxic sugar baits against contact-insecticide resistant culex quinquefasciatus. Acta Trop. 2020; 202:105256-105256.

31. Qualls MA, Müller GC, Revay EE, Allan SA, Arheart KL, Beier JC, Smith ML, Scott JM, Kravchenko VS. Evaluation of attractive toxic sugar bait (ATSB)-Barrier for control of vector and nuisance mosquitoes and its effect on non-target organisms in sub-tropical environments in Florida. Acta Trop. 2014; 131:104-110.

32. 2020. Released online in J-STAGE as advance publication June 27, 2020.

33. Address correspondence to: Zhenyu Gong, Zhejiang Provincial Center for Disease Control and Prevention, 3399 Binsheng Road, Binjiang District, Hangzhou 310051, Zhejiang Province, China. E-mail: gongzhenyu2020@163.com

34. Received May 26, 2020; Revised June 22, 2020; Accepted June 24, 2020.

35. ©These authors contributed equally to this work.