Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company’s public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.
A mathematical model to optimize the available control measures of COVID – 19

Isa Abdullahi Baba\textsuperscript{a,}\textsuperscript{*}, Bashir Ahmad Nasidi\textsuperscript{a}, Dumitru Baleanu\textsuperscript{b, c, d}, Sultan Hamed Saadi\textsuperscript{e}

\textsuperscript{a} Department of Mathematical Sciences, Bayero University Kano, Nigeria
\textsuperscript{b} Department of Mathematics, Cankaya University, Ankara, 06530, Turkey
\textsuperscript{c} Institute of Space Sciences, Bucharest, Romania
\textsuperscript{d} Department of Medical Research, China Medical University Hospital, Taichung, Taiwan
\textsuperscript{e} Department of Mathematics Near East University, Cyprus

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Keywords:
Covid-19
Optimal control
Pontryagin Maximum Principle (PMP)
Mathematical model
Existence of control
Stability analysis

A B S T R A C T

In the absence of valid medicine or vaccine for treating the pandemic Coronavirus (COVID-19) infection, other control strategies like; quarantine, social distancing, self-isolation, sanitation and use of personal protective equipment are effective tool used to prevent and curtail the spread of the disease. In this paper, we present a mathematical model to study the dynamics of COVID-19. We then formulate an optimal control problem with the aim to study the most effective control strategies to prevent the proliferation of the disease. The existence of an optimal control function is established and the Pontryagin maximum principle is applied for the characterization of the controller. The equilibrium solutions (DFE & endemic) are found to be locally asymptotically stable and subsequently the basic reproduction number is obtained. Numerical simulations are carried out to support the analytic results and to explicitly show the significance of the control. It is shown that Quarantine/isolating those infected with the disease is the best control measure at the moment.

1. Introduction

The highly contagious corona virus (COVID-19) infection that cause the current global pandemic was first identified in the late December, 2019 in Wuhan city, China (European Center for Disease Prevention and Control (ECDC)). It is significantly less severe than the other two corona viruses; Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS-COV) and Middle East Respiratory Syndrome (MERS-COV) that caused an outbreak in 2002 and 2008 respectively (1mg). Although the source of the virus is not yet known, but genetic investigation revealed that COVID-19 virus has the same genetic characteristics with SARS-COV which were likely to be originated from bats (European Center for Disease Prevention and Control (ECDC)).

The COVID-19 virus spread from infected human to healthy human through eyes, nose or mouth via a droplet produced of coughing, sneezing or contact with contaminated surfaces, object and equipment of personal use. After the incubation period of 2-14 days (1mg) the infection developed further to cause mild symptoms that include respiratory symptoms, fever, cough, and shortness of breath and breathing difficulties. In more severe cases, infection can cause pneumonia, SARS, kidney failure and even death (World Health Organization (WHO)).

Scientists have not yet developed a vaccine or medicine to cure the COVID-19 infection, but the standard recommendation to prevent the spread of the infection include; quarantine, social distancing, self-isolation, use of personal protective equipment (such as face mask, hand gloves, overall gown, e.t.c) regular hand washing using sanitizer, avoiding having contact with person showing the symptoms, reporting any suspected case, and compliance with orientation exercises.

However, many governments engaged in widely public orientation on distancing from public gathering that include social and religious, banning both the local and international trip except for an essential purpose, closing both public and private institutions that may attract large gathering, contact tracing and isolation of infected individuals, providing sanitizers at public domains like markets and car park, fumigating exercise, and to the large extent imposing stay at home curfew.

Since the inception of SIR epidemiological model by Kermack and Merckendric (Kermack and Mckendrick, 1991) in 1927, significant contributions in modeling human diseases and their controls have been offered, as such models of HIV-AIDS (Naik et al., 2020, Naik et al.,

\textsuperscript{*} Corresponding author.
\textit{E-mail address:} iababa.mth@buk.edu.ng (I.A. Baba).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecocom.2021.100930
Received 8 November 2020; Received in revised form 4 April 2021; Accepted 17 April 2021
Available online 11 May 2021
1476-945X/© 2021 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.
The impact of the ongoing global pandemic of COVID-19 epidemic in terms of morbidity, mortality and socio-economic aspects require urgent and effective control measures. However, to decline the apocalyptic proportion of such predicaments, mathematical model should be applied to determine the transmission dynamics and optimize the possible control measures (Naik et al., 2020, Yavuz and Bonyah, 1 July 2019, Naik et al., 2020, Naik et al., 2020, Yavuz and Ozdemir, 2020).

Optimal control is an effective mathematical tool to optimize the control problems arising in different field including epidemiology, aeronautic engineering, economics and finance, robotic, e.t.c. (Becerra, 2008).

In an effort to have a quick response about the situations, several contributions have been made as such: Mishra et al (Mishra et al., 2020) who considered asymptomatic and quarantine classes for SARS-COV2.

Sunhwa et al (Sunhwa and Ki, 2020), established deterministic mathematical model (SEIHR) to suit Korean outbreak, in which he estimated the reproduction number and the effect of preventive measures.

S. Zhao et al. (Zhao and Chen, 2020 March 11) developed a Susceptible, Un-quarantined infected, Quarantined infected, Confirmed infected (SUQC) model to characterized the dynamic od COVID-19 and explicitly parameterized the intervention effects of control measures.

In (Yang and Wang, 2020), C. Yang et al., proposed a new model to study the current outbreak COVID-19 in Wuhan, China. M. Tahir et al. (Tahir et al., 2019) developed mathematical model (for MERS) in form of nonlinear system of differential equations, in which he considered a camel to be the source of infection that spread the virus to infective human population, then human to human transmission, then to clinic center then to care center. However, they constructed the Lyapunov candidate function to investigate the local and global stability analysis of the equilibriums solution and subsequently obtained the basic reproduction number or roughly, a key parameter describing transmission the infection.

T. M Chen et al. (Chen et al., 2020) Developed a Bats-Hosts-Reservoir-People (BHRP) transmission network model for the potential transmission from the infection source (probably bats) to the human infection,which focus on calculating $R_0$.

Q. lin et al. (Lin et al.,) modeled (based on SEIR) the outbreak in Wuhan with individual reaction and governmental action (holiday extension, city lockdown, hospitalization and quarantine) in which they estimated the preliminary magnitude of different effect of individual reaction and governmental action.

M. A. Khan and A. Atangana (Khan and Atangana, February 2020) developed a fractional order model to study the brief interaction among the bats and unknown hosts, and then among people and infection reservoir. Their concern is on the origin of the virus; bats and sea food market.

Manyof the models in literature have a general shortcoming of not taking into consideration the time dependent control strategies. Some of these time dependent control strategies were studied (Yang and Wang, 2020; Tahir et al., 2019; Chen et al., 2020; Lin et al.; World Health Organization (WHO); Baleanu et al., September 2016; Qureshi and Yusuf, 2019; Qureshi and Yusuf, 2019; Qureshi and Yusuf, 2019).This type of control strategy can be used to suggest or design epidemic control programs (Baba et al., 2020; Akman et al., December 2018; Akman et al., December 2018).

To mimic the ongoing global pandemic of COVID-19, we modified the model by M. Tahir et al. in which we incorporated the susceptible human population. We also formulated anoptimal control problem subject to the model with the aim of minimizing the transmission in infected human population $h_i$, in human to transmission population $h_o$, in infected individuals to family members $F_m$, in patient to clinic center transmission population $P_i$, and in the patient to care center transmission population $C_i$.

In the absence of valid medicine or vaccine for treating the pandemic Coronavirus (COVID-19) infection, other control strategies like; quarantine, social distancing, self- isolation, sanitation and use of personal protective equipment are effective tool used to prevent and curtail the spread of the disease. The main contribution of this paper is incorporating these available control measures in the model as function of time and studying the end result if they were to be applied optimally.

The paper is arranged in the following order: chapter one gives an introduction, chapter two deals with the model formulation, chapter three studies the optimal control problem, chapter four discusses local stability analysis and the derivation of the reproduction number and lastly chapter five gives numerical simulation to support the analytic

---

**Figure 1.** schematic diagram describing the transmission dynamics of COVID-19.

---

**Table 1**

| Model Variables | Descriptions |
|-----------------|--------------|
| $h_i$ - $h_i(t)$ | Susceptible bats population |
| $l_i$ - $l_i(t)$ | Infected bats population |
| $h_h$ - $h_h(t)$ | Susceptible human population |
| $l_h$ - $l_h(t)$ | Infected human population |
| $h_o$ - $h_o(t)$ | Human to human transmission population |
| $F_m$ - $F_m(t)$ | Infected individual to family members |
| $P_i$ - $P_i(t)$ | Patient to clinic center transmission population |
| $C_i$ - $C_i(t)$ | Patient to care center transmission population |
| $Z$ - $Z(t)$ | Total model population |
Table 2
Model parameters and their descriptions.

| Model parameters | Description |
|------------------|-------------|
| μ_i, i = 1, 2, ..., 8 | Natural death rates in S, I, H, H_c, H_m, F, P_c, and C_c compartments |
| δ_i | Disease induced death in I |
| δ_b, i = 2, 3, ..., 5 | Disease induced death in S, I, H, H_m, F, P_c, and C_c compartments |
| λ_i | Birth rates of bats |
| λ_b | Birth rates of human |
| β_i, i = 1, 2, ..., 6 | Transmission rates |

result, and then the discussion follows.

2. Model formulation

With bats as the origin of the novel Covid-19 virus, it is assumed that the new born of bats are born into susceptible class S, at the rate λ_b, which joined the infectious class, at rate β_i. It is also assumed that the new born of humans are born into susceptible class S, which later became infectious I as a result of contact with infected bats at the rate β_i. Then the virus spreads from an infected human to human H_b, to a family member F_m, then to clinic center P_c and care center C_c at the rates β_1, β_2, β_3, and β_4 respectively. The dynamics of the model is illustrated in figure 1, and the meaning of parameters and variables are given in table 1 and 2 respectively.

The transmission dynamics can be described by the nonlinear system of the first order differential equations;

\[
\frac{dS(t)}{dt} = λ_b - μ_iS - β_1SH_t, \tag{1}
\]

\[
\frac{dH_t(t)}{dt} = β_1SH_t - (μ_i + δ_1)H_t - β_2SH_b, \tag{2}
\]

\[
\frac{dS_i(t)}{dt} = λ_b - μ_iS_i - β_2SH_b, \tag{3}
\]

\[
\frac{dH_b(t)}{dt} = β_2SH_b - (μ_i + δ_2)H_b - β_3SH_m, \tag{4}
\]

\[
\frac{dH_m(t)}{dt} = β_3SH_m - (μ_i + δ_3)H_m - β_4SH_c, \tag{5}
\]

\[
\frac{dF_m(t)}{dt} = β_4SH_c - (μ_i + δ_4)F_m - β_5SH_b, \tag{6}
\]

\[
\frac{dC_c(t)}{dt} = μ_iC_c - (μ_i + δ_b)C_c, \tag{7}
\]

Where,

\[
S(0) ≥ 0, I(0) ≥ 0, S_i(0) ≥ 0, I_i(0) ≥ 0, H_i(0) ≥ 0, F_m(0) ≥ 0, P_c(0) ≥ 0, C_c(0) ≥ 0.
\]

3. Optimal Control

In this chapter we give detail of the formation of the optimal control problem together with the analysis of the control function.

3.1. Formulation of Optimal Control Problem

The goal of the control strategies is to reduce or minimize the infected human population I_h, the human to human transmission population H_b, the infected individuals to family members F_m, patient to clinic center transmission population P_c, and the patient to care center transmission population C_c.

Let the control functions, u_1(t) be the rate of quarantine of infected individuals which assume to minimize the infected human I_h, u_2(t) be the rate of social distance which assume to minimize human to human transmission population H_b, u_3(t) be the rate of self-isolation which assume to minimize transmission to family member F_m, u_4(t) be the rate of sanitation which assume to minimize patient to clinic center transmission population P_c, and u_5(t) be the rate of use of personal protective equipment which is assumed to minimize patient to care center transmission population C_c.

The dynamics of control system can be described by the following system of nonlinear ODE;

\[
\frac{dS_i(t)}{dt} = λ_b - μ_iS_i - β_1SH_t, \tag{9}
\]

\[
\frac{dH_b(t)}{dt} = β_1SH_t - (μ_i + δ_1)H_t - β_2SH_b, \tag{10}
\]

\[
\frac{dS_i(t)}{dt} = λ_b - μ_iS_i - β_2SH_b, \tag{11}
\]

\[
\frac{dH_b(t)}{dt} = β_2SH_b - (μ_i + δ_3)H_b - β_3SH_m, \tag{12}
\]

\[
\frac{dH_m(t)}{dt} = β_3SH_m - (μ_i + δ_3)H_m - β_4SH_c, \tag{13}
\]

\[
\frac{dF_m(t)}{dt} = β_4SH_c - (μ_i + δ_4)F_m - β_5SH_b, \tag{14}
\]

\[
\frac{dC_c(t)}{dt} = μ_iC_c - (μ_i + δ_b)C_c, \tag{15}
\]

\[
\frac{dI(t)}{dt} = I(0), H_b(0) = H_m(0), F_m(0) = F_m(0), C_c(0) = C_c(0), P_c(0) = P_c(0). \tag{16}
\]

U_i(t), i = 1, 2, ..., 5 are defined on the closed interval [0, T]. The control functions u_1, ..., u_5 are bounded and Lebesgue integrable. The coefficients A_i, C_i (i = 1, 2, ..., 5) denote the corresponding weight constants which balance the cost elements on the basis of their size and importance in the parts of the objective functional. Our goal is to reduce the number of infectious population and the cost for implementing strategy.

The objective functional is defined as;

\[
J(u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5) = \int_0^T \left[ A_1I_h + A_2H_b + A_3F_m + A_4P_c + A_5C_c + C_1u_i^2(t) + C_2u_i^2(t) + C_3u_i^2(t) + C_4u_i^2(t) \right] dt. \tag{18}
\]

the goal is to find the optimal control U_i(t), i = 1, 2, ..., 5 such that,

\[
J(u_1^*, u_2^*, u_3^*, u_4^*, u_5^*) = \min_{(u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5)} J(u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5).
\]

where the constraint is \( \Gamma = \{ (u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5) \in L^1(0, T) | 0 \leq u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5 \leq 1 \} \). The existence, uniqueness and the characteristics will be discussed in the following subsection.

3.2. Existence of optimal solutions

Theorem 1. There exist optimal controls \((u_1^*, u_2^*, u_3^*, u_4^*, u_5^*) \in \Gamma \)
such that;
\[
J(u_1^*, u_2^*, u_3^*, u_4^*, u_5^*) = \min_{(u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5)} J(u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5),
\]
satisfy the control system (9)–(16) with the initial condition (17).

**Proof.** : This result will be yielded by the general discussion in \cite{Lin et al.} and the following Lemma.

**Lemma 1.** The control system (9)–(16) with the initial condition (17) satisfy the following conditions

i) \( \Gamma \) is non–empty and the interval \([0,1]\) is closed and convex.

ii) Let \( X = [S_0, I_0, S_0, H_0, H_0, F_0, P_0, C_0]^T, U = [u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5]^T \). Then the right–hand function of the control system (9)–(16) has the form \( \psi(X) + \phi(X)U \), where

\[
\psi(X) = [],
\]
\[
\phi(X) = .
\]

iii) \( L(X, U) = A_1u_1 + A_2u_2 + A_3F \)

\[
+ A_4p + A_5C + C_1u_2^2(t) + C_2u_3^2(t) + C_3u_2^2(t) + C_4u_5^2(t) + C_5u_3^2(t)
\]
is a convex function of \( U \) and satisfies \( \min \{c_1, c_2, c_3, c_4, c_5\} \|U\|_2^2 \). **Proof.** : It is clear that 1 and 2 are trivial and 3 comes from the positivity of the state variables.

### 3.3. Characterization of optimal control

The control goal is to search the optimal control function \( (u_1^*, u_2^*, u_3^*, u_4^*, u_5^*) \) such that,

\[
J(u_1^*, u_2^*, u_3^*, u_4^*, u_5^*) = \min_{(u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5)} J(u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5),
\]

reaches its minimum. The necessary condition for the optimal solution is given by Pontryagin’s maximum principle, which converts the optimal control (9)–(16) into a problem of minimizing the Hamiltonian function. Let us consider the Hamiltonian function given by;

\[
H = A_1\lambda_1 + A_2\lambda_2 + A_3F (25)
\]

\[
+ A_4p + A_5C + C_1u_2^2(t) + C_2u_3^2(t) + C_3u_2^2(t) + C_4u_5^2(t) + C_5u_3^2(t)
\]

where \( \lambda = (\lambda_1, \ldots, \lambda_{13})^T \) is the adjoint variable and \( w = (w_1, \ldots, w_5)^T \) is the relaxing variable. By Pontryagin’s maximum principle in \cite{Becerra, 2008} and the existence result for the optimal control, the following theorem is formulated.

**Theorem 2.** There exists an optimal control \( (u_1^*, u_2^*, u_3^*, u_4^*, u_5^*) \) and corresponding solutions \( S_0, I_0, S_0, H_0, H_0, F_0, P_0, C_0 \) which minimizes \( J(u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5) \) over \( \Gamma \). Furthermore, there exist adjoint functions \( \lambda_1(t), \ldots, \lambda_{15}(t) \) such that the adjoint equations:

\[
\dot{\lambda}_1 = \frac{\partial H}{\partial \lambda_1}, \ldots, \dot{\lambda}_{15} = -\frac{\partial H}{\partial \lambda_{15}},
\]

with the transversality conditions;

\[
\lambda_i(t) = 0, \quad i = 1, \ldots, 13,
\]

then the characteristic values \( u_1^*, u_2^*, u_3^*, u_4^*, u_5^* \) are given by;

\[
u_i(t) = \min \left\{ b, \max \left( 0, \frac{\lambda_i}{A_i} \right) \right\}.
\]

(19)

(20)
\[
\frac{dF_n(t)}{dt} = \beta_h H_n F_n - \left( \mu_h + \delta_h + \min \left\{ b, \max \left( 0, \frac{\delta_h}{A_h} F_n \right) \right\} \right) F_n - \beta_p P_n F_n, \\
\frac{dP_n(t)}{dt} = \beta_p P_n F_n - \left( \mu_p + \delta_p + \min \left\{ b, \max \left( 0, \frac{\delta_p}{A_p} P_n \right) \right\} \right) P_n - \beta_s S_n P_n, \\
\frac{dC_n(t)}{dt} = \beta_s S_n P_n - \left( \mu_s + \delta_s + \min \left\{ b, \max \left( 0, \frac{\delta_s}{A_s} C_n \right) \right\} \right) C_n.
\]

4. Stability Analysis

In this chapter we study boundedness of the solutions, obtain disease free and endemic equilibria, calculate the basic reproduction ratio and carry out local and global stability analysis of the equilibria.

4.1. Boundedness

**Theorem 3.** All positive solutions of the system have the ultimate upper bound in \( \mathbb{R}^8 \)

**Proof.** Let \( N = S_h + I_h + S_n + I_n + H_n + F_n + P_c + C_c \).

Then,

\[
\frac{dN}{dt} = \frac{dS_h}{dt} + \frac{dI_h}{dt} + \frac{dS_n}{dt} + \frac{dI_n}{dt} + \frac{dH_n}{dt} + \frac{dF_n}{dt} + \frac{dP_c}{dt} + \frac{dC_c}{dt}
\]

\( \leq \lambda_h - \mu_S S_h - \mu_I I_h - \mu_S S_n - \mu_I I_n - \mu_H H_n - \mu_F F_n - \mu_P P_c - \mu_C C_c \).

Let \( \mu := \min \{ \mu_i \}, i = 1, \ldots, 8 \).

Then,

\[
\frac{dN}{dt} \leq \lambda_h + \lambda_n + \mu N,
\]

which implies,

\[
N \leq \frac{\lambda_h + \lambda_n}{\mu} + ce^{-\mu t},
\]

and,

\[
\lim_{t \to \infty} N(t) \leq \frac{\lambda_h + \lambda_n}{\mu}.
\]

So, the biologically feasible region of the model is;

\[
\Omega = \left\{ (S_h, I_h, S_n, I_n, H_n, F_n, P_c, C_c) \in \mathbb{R}^8 \mid S_h + I_h + S_n + I_n + H_n + F_n + P_c + C_c \leq \frac{\lambda_h + \lambda_n}{\mu} \right\}.
\]

4.2. Equilibria

Disease free equilibrium \( E_0 \) is obtained by equating \( I_h, I_n, H_n, F_n, P_c, \) and \( C_c \) to zero. Hence we get;

\[
E_0 = (S_h^*, I_h^*, S_n^*, I_n^*, H_n^*, F_n^*, P_c^*, C_c^*) = \left( \frac{\lambda_h}{\mu_1}, \frac{\lambda_n}{\mu_1}, 0, 0, 0, 0, 0, 0 \right).
\]

The endemic equilibrium is obtained by taking all the variables to be different from zero, and solving the system simultaneously;

Solving (9)–(16),

\[
P^*_c = \left( \frac{\mu_h + \delta_h + \mu_1}{\beta_h} \right),
\]

\[
H_n^* = \left[ \frac{\mu_p + \delta_p + \mu_1}{\beta_p} \frac{\mu_h + \delta_h + \mu_1 + u_1}{\beta_h} \right],
\]

\[
S_h^*(\mu_1 - \mu_1 - \delta_1) - \mu_1 = 0,
\]

Putting (42) and (43) into (46) yield

\[
\beta_h \lambda_h \delta_h - \beta_1 \beta_2 \delta_1 \mu_1 - \mu_1 \beta_2 \mu_3 \beta_1 \mu_1 (\mu_2 + \delta_1) H_n^* + \beta_1 \beta_2 \delta_1 \mu_1 (\mu_2 + \delta_1) (\mu_1 \beta_2 + \mu_1 \beta_1) F_n^* = 0,
\]

\[
\beta_1 \beta_2 \mu_1 \left( 1 - \frac{1}{R_0} \right) + \beta_1 \beta_2 (\mu_2 - \delta_1) (\mu_2 + \delta_1) (\mu_1 \beta_2 + \mu_1 \beta_1) F_n^* = 0,
\]

4.3. Local Stability of Disease Free Equilibrium

\[
\frac{dS_h}{dt} = \lambda_h - \mu_S S_h - \mu_I I_h - \mu_S S_n - \mu_I I_n - \mu_H H_n - \mu_F F_n - \mu_P P_c - \mu_C C_c
\]

\[
\frac{dI_h}{dt} = \lambda_h - \mu_S S_h - \mu_I I_h - \mu_S S_n - \mu_I I_n - \mu_H H_n - \mu_F F_n - \mu_P P_c - \mu_C C_c
\]

\[
\frac{dS_n}{dt} = \lambda_n - \mu_S S_h - \mu_I I_h - \mu_S S_n - \mu_I I_n - \mu_H H_n - \mu_F F_n - \mu_P P_c - \mu_C C_c
\]

\[
\frac{dI_n}{dt} = \lambda_n - \mu_S S_h - \mu_I I_h - \mu_S S_n - \mu_I I_n - \mu_H H_n - \mu_F F_n - \mu_P P_c - \mu_C C_c
\]

\[
\frac{dH_n}{dt} = \lambda_h - \mu_S S_h - \mu_I I_h - \mu_S S_n - \mu_I I_n - \mu_H H_n - \mu_F F_n - \mu_P P_c - \mu_C C_c
\]

\[
\frac{dF_n}{dt} = \lambda_h - \mu_S S_h - \mu_I I_h - \mu_S S_n - \mu_I I_n - \mu_H H_n - \mu_F F_n - \mu_P P_c - \mu_C C_c
\]

\[
\frac{dP_c}{dt} = \lambda_h - \mu_S S_h - \mu_I I_h - \mu_S S_n - \mu_I I_n - \mu_H H_n - \mu_F F_n - \mu_P P_c - \mu_C C_c
\]

\[
\frac{dC_c}{dt} = \lambda_h - \mu_S S_h - \mu_I I_h - \mu_S S_n - \mu_I I_n - \mu_H H_n - \mu_F F_n - \mu_P P_c - \mu_C C_c
\]
4.3. Local Stability of the Equilibria

From equation (9) through (16) we obtained the Jacobian matrix

\[ J = \begin{bmatrix}
N_1 & -\beta_1 S_b & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
-\beta_1 J_b & N_2 & -\beta_2 J_b & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & -\beta_3 S_h & N_3 & -\beta_3 J_h & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & -\beta_4 H & N_4 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & -\beta_5 P & N_5 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & N_6 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & N_7 \\
\end{bmatrix} \]

where,

\[ N_1 = -\mu_1 - \beta_1 J_b, \quad N_2 = \beta_1 S_b - \mu_2 - \delta_2, \quad N_3 = -\mu_3 - \beta_3 J_b, \quad N_4 = -\mu_4 - \beta_4 H, \quad N_5 = -\mu_5 - \beta_5 P, \quad N_6 = -\mu_6, \quad N_7 = -\mu_7. \]

Theorem 4. The disease free equilibrium \( E_0 \) is locally asymptotically stable

Proof

\[ \det(J_{E_0} - KI) = 0, \]

we get the eigenvalues

\[ K_1 = -\mu_1, \]

\[ K_2 = \frac{\beta_1 \lambda_3}{\mu_1} - \mu_2 - \delta_2 - \beta_2 \lambda_3/\mu_1, \]

\[ K_3 = -\mu_3, \]

\[ K_4 = -\mu_4 - \delta_2, \]

\[ K_5 = -\mu_5 - \delta_3, \]

\[ K_6 = -\mu_6 - \delta_1, \]

\[ K_7 = -\mu_7 - \delta_2, \]

\[ K_8 = -\mu_8 - \delta_3. \]

\[ (50) \]

4.4. Basic Reproduction Number

For the DFE to be locally asymptotically stable, we need the eigenvalue \( K_2 < 0 \)

\[ \frac{\lambda_3}{\mu_1} - \mu_2 - \beta_2 \lambda_3/\mu_1 < 0. \]

Simplifying, we get

\[ \frac{\beta_1 \lambda_3 \mu_5}{\mu_1 (\mu_2 + \delta_2) + \beta_2 \lambda_3} < 0. \]

We let basic reproduction ratio \( R_0 \) to be \( R_0 < 1. \)

\[ R_0 = \frac{\beta_1 \lambda_3 \mu_5}{\mu_1 (\mu_2 + \delta_2) + \beta_2 \lambda_3} \]

Theorem 5. The endemic equilibrium \( \left( S_k, I_k, S_b, I_b, H_b, F_m, P_c, C_e \right) \) is stable if \( R_0 > 1. \)

Proof

Since all the equilibrium points in the endemic equilibrium depend on \( I_b^* \) then it suffices to investigate the stability or otherwise of \( I_b^* \)

Since \( I_b^* > 0 \), then from (46)

Either

\[ \frac{\lambda_3 - \lambda_4 + \mu_1}{\mu_2 + \delta_1} + \frac{\mu_5}{\beta_2} > \sqrt{\left( \frac{\lambda_3 - \lambda_4 + \mu_1}{\mu_2 + \delta_1} + \frac{\mu_5}{\beta_2} \right)^2 + \frac{4 \lambda_3 \mu_5}{\beta_2 (\mu_2 + \delta_1)} \left( 1 - \frac{1}{R_0} \right)} \]

\[ 0 > \left( 1 - \frac{1}{R_0} \right) \]

\[ R_0 < 1. \]

This may lead to a chance of \( I_b^* \) to be complex.

Or

\[ \sqrt{\left( \frac{\lambda_3 - \lambda_4 + \mu_1}{\mu_2 + \delta_1} + \frac{\mu_5}{\beta_2} \right)^2 + \frac{4 \lambda_3 \mu_5}{\beta_2 (\mu_2 + \delta_1)} \left( 1 - \frac{1}{R_0} \right)} > 0 \]

\[ \left( 1 - \frac{1}{R_0} \right) > 0 \]

\[ R_0 > 1. \]

Thus, only
4.5. Global Stability Analysis

Here we study global stability analysis of the equilibria.

**Theorem 6.** The disease free equilibrium is globally asymptotically stable if $Q > (\lambda_0 + \lambda_b)$.

**Proof**

Let the Lyapunov candidate function be

$$G(S_b, I_b, S_h, I_h, H_b, F_m, P_c, C_c) = \frac{1}{2}(S_b - S_b^*) + I_b + (S_h - S_h^*) + I_h + H_b + F_m + P_c + C_c,$$

Then

$$\frac{dG}{dt} = [(S_b - S_b^*) + I_b + (S_h - S_h^*) + I_h + H_b + F_m + P_c + C_c]\ [Q - (\lambda_0 + \lambda_b)].$$

Where,

$$Q = \mu I_b + \beta I_b I_h + \beta S_b I_h + \mu S_b + (\mu + \delta + \omega) I_b + (\mu + \delta + \omega) F_m + (\mu + \delta + \omega) P_c + (\mu + \delta + \omega) C_c.$$

Clearly

$$\frac{dG}{dt} = 0, \ [Q](\lambda_0 + \lambda_b).$$

**Theorem 7.** The endemic equilibrium is globally asymptotically stable if $W > \lambda_0 + \lambda_b$.

**Proof**

Let the Lyapunov candidate function be

$$V(S_b, I_b, S_h, I_h, H_b, F_m, P_c, C_c) = \frac{1}{2}(S_b - S_b^*) + (I_b - I_b^*) + (S_b - S_b^*) + (H_b - H_b^*) + (F_m - F_m^*) + (P_c - P_c^*) + (C_c - C_c^*).$$

Clearly the above function $V(S_b, I_b, S_h, I_h, H_b, F_m, P_c, C_c) \geq 0$, and

$$V(S_b, I_b, S_h, I_h, H_b, F_m, P_c, C_c) = 0 \ [Q = S_b^* + I_b^* + H_b^* + F_m^* + P_c^* + C_c^*].$$

The remaining result is

$$\frac{dV}{dt} = \left[\frac{dS_b}{dt} + \frac{dI_b}{dt} + \frac{dS_h}{dt} + \frac{dI_h}{dt} + \frac{dH_b}{dt} + \frac{dF_m}{dt} + \frac{dP_c}{dt} + \frac{dC_c}{dt}\right].$$

Substituting equation (9)–(16) in above we get
\[
\frac{dV}{dt} = -[(S_b - S_b^\ast) + (I_b - I_b^\ast) + (S_h - S_h^\ast) + (I_h - I_h^\ast) + (H_h - H_h^\ast) + (F_m - F_m^\ast) + (P_c - P_c^\ast) + (C_c - C_c^\ast)]W - (\lambda_b + \lambda_h).
\]

Where,
\[
W = \mu_1 S_b + (\mu_2 + \delta_1)I_b + \beta_2 S_h I_b + \mu_3 S_h + (\mu_4 + \delta_2 + u_1)I_h + (\mu_5 + \delta_3 + u_2)H_h + (\mu_6 + \delta_4 + u_3)F_m + (\mu_7 + \delta_5 + u_4)P_c + (\mu_8 + \delta_6 + u_5)C_c.
\]

Clearly
\[
\frac{dV}{dt} = 0, \text{ if } S_b = S_b^\ast, I_b = I_b^\ast, S_h = S_h^\ast, I_h = I_h^\ast, H_h = H_h^\ast, F_m = F_m^\ast, P_c = P_c^\ast, C_c = C_c^\ast.
\]

Hence the endemic equilibrium is globally asymptotically stable.

5. Numerical Simulation and Discussions

In this chapter, numerical simulations are carried out. Variable and parameter values in Table 3 and Table 4 were adopted from (Tahir et al., 2019).

The following can be observed from the graphs; Figure 2, when no any control measure is taken, it can clearly be seen that there will be epidemics. Figure 3, shows the dynamics of the optimal control functions. Figure 4, shows how effective these control measures can be when applied optimally. That is when infected individuals enter quarantine, people applied social distancing, family of infected individuals undergo self-isolation, sanitation is adopted for medical center individuals and use of personal protective equipment for care center individuals.

Although all these control measures can’t be applied at a time in some settings, Figure 5 shows that if all the measures will be taken except quarantining the infected individuals, there will still be epidemics. Lastly, from Figure 6, we can understand how important quarantine is, that if it can be applied optimally with time the epidemics will be
eliminated, even if all the remaining control measures were not applied.

6. Conclusion

In conclusion, this paper studies a model that consists of a system of eight non-linear ordinary differential equations. The model studies the dynamics of COVID-19. An optimal control problem was constructed with the aim to study the most effective control strategies to prevent the proliferation of the disease. The existence of an optimal control function was established and the Pontryagin maximum principle was applied for
the characterization of the controller. Two equilibrium solutions; disease free equilibrium (DFE) and endemic equilibrium (EE) were found. Local stability analysis was carried out, and it was established that both DFE and EE depends on the magnitude of a threshold quantity, basic reproduction ratio ($R_0$). DFE is locally asymptotically stable when $R_0 < 1$, whereas EE is locally asymptotically stable when $R_0 > 1$.

Numerical simulations were carried out to support the analytical results and to explicitly show the significance of the control measures. It was obtained that $R_0 = 2.73$ when no control measures taken. But when infected individuals enter quarantine, people applied social distancing, family of infected individuals undergo self-isolation, sanitation adopted for medical center individuals and personal protective equipment for care center individuals were used, then the pandemic will automatically be controlled. The significance of quarantine over the remaining control measures was also shown.

Author statement

This research is very important as per as the current pandemic is concerned. People are dying due to the pandemic. Policy makers need to design policies that will protect the citizens. We think this paper will give an insight into the various available measures that can be used to control the spread of the disease, and the significance of such measures.

Availability of data and material

We have no available data.

Funding

There is no funding to this research.

Authors Contribution

All authors of this research paper have directly participated in the planning, execution, or analysis of this study.

Declaration of Competing Interest

We have no complicit of interest.

Acknowledgment

We thank the reviewers for their valuable contributions.

References

Pontryagin maximum principle. Encyclopedia of mathematics. URL: http://www.encyclopediaofmath.org/index.php?title=Pontryagin-maximum-principle&oldid=38944.

1mg 1mg. Corona Ebook. Pdf available from: http://www.1mg.com/articles/coronavirus-all-your-questions-answered/.

Akman, Y.T., Arshad, S., Baleanu, D., December 2018. Optimal chemotherapy and immunotherapy schedules for a cancer obesity model with caputo time fractional derivative. Mathematical Methods in the Applied Sciences 18, 9390-9407.

Akman, Y.T., Arshad, S., Baleanu, D., December 2018. New observations on optimal cancer treatments for a fractional tumor growth model with and without singular kernel. Chaos Solitons and Fractals 117, 226–239.

Baba, I.A., Abdulkadir, R.A., Esmaili, P., 2020. Analysis of tuberculosis model with saturated incidence rate and optimal control. Physica A, April 2019 540, 122327.

Balcan, D., Joseph, C., Moghos, G., September 2016. Low – regret control for a fractional wave equation with incomplete data. Advances in Difference Equations 240.

Becería, V.M., 2008. Optimal control.scholarpedia 3 (1), 5354. https://doi.org/10.4249/scholarpedia.5354.

K. Berat K.M. Owolabi, K.S. Nisar. Analysis and dynamics of illicit drug use described by fractional derivative with Mittag-Leffler Kernel. Computers, materials and continua CMC, Vol. 65, no 3, pp. 1905-2020.

Chen, T., Rui, J., Wang, Q., et al., 2020. A mathematical model for simulating the phased-based transmissibility of a novel coronavirus. Infect Dis Poverty 9 (24). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40249-020-00640-5.

European Center for Disease Prevention and Control (ECDC), “disease background of COVID-19” available from: www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/2019-ncov-background-disease.

Kermack, W., Mckendrick, A., 1991. Contributions to the mathematical theory of epidemics. Bulletin of mathematical biology 53 (1-2), 33-55.

Khan, M.A., Atangana, A., February 2020. Modeling the dynamics of novel corona virus (2019 – nCov) with fractional derivative. Alexandria Engineering Journal.

Kumar, D., Singh, J., July 10, 2020. Fractional Calculus in Medical and Health Sciences. ISBN 978935751212 CRC Press.

Lin, Q, Jin, S, Zhao, D, Gao, W, Wang, L, Yang, D. He. A conceptual model for the Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) outbreak in Wuhan, China with individual reaction and governmental action.Vol. 93, p 211-216. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2020.02.058.

Mishra, A.M., Purohit, S.D., Sharma, Y.D., 2020. A nonlinear epidemiological model considering asymptomatic and quarantine classes for SARS-COV2 virus. Chaos, Solitons and Fractals 138, 109953. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chaos.2020.109953.

Naik, P.A, Owolabi, K.M., Yavuz, M., Zu, J., 2020. Chaotic dynamics of a fractional order HIV-1 model involving AIDS-related cancer cells. Chaos, Solitons & Fractals 140, 110272.

Naik, P.A, Owolabi, K.M., Yavuz, M., Zu, J., 2020. Chaos dynamics of fractional order HIV-1 model involving AIDS-related to cancer cells. Chaos, Solitons and Fractals 140, 110272.

Naik, P.A, Owolabi, K.M., Zu, J., 2020. Global dynamics of a fractional order model for the transmission of HIV epidemic with optimal control. Chaos, Solitons and Fractals 138, 109926.

Naik, P.A, Yavuz, M., Qureshi, S., et al., 2020. Modeling and analysis of COVID-19 epidemics with treatment in fractional derivatives using real data from Pakistan. Eur. Phys. J. Plus 135, 795.

Owolabi, K.M., Shikongo, A., 2020. Fractional operator method on a multi-mutation and intrinsic resistance model. Alexandria Engineering Journal 59 (4), 1999-2013.

Qureshi, S., Yusuf, A., 2019. Modeling chickenspox disease with fractional derivatives: From caputo to atangana-baleanu. Chaos, Solitons and Fractals 126, 111–118.

Qureshi, S., Yusuf, A., 2019. Mathematical modeling for the impacts of deforestation on wildlife species using Caputo differential operator. Chaos, Solitons and Fractals 126, 110272.

Qureshi, S., Yusuf, A., 2019. Fractional derivatives applied to MSEIR problems: Comparative study with real world data. European Physical Jornal Plus (171), 134.

Sunhwa, C.C., Ki, Moran, 2020. Estimating the reproductive number and the outbreak disease 2019 (COVID-19) outbreak in Wuhan, China with individual reaction and governmental action.Vol. 93, p 211-216. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2020.02.058.

Tahir, M., Shah, S.I.A., Zamzn, G., Khan, T., 2019. Stability behavior of mathematical model for the impacts of deforestation on schistosomiasis disease model. Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications 525, 373–393.

Yang, C., Wang, J., 2020. A mathematical for the novel Coronavirus epidemic in Wuhan. China.MathJBioEng 17 (3), 2708–2724. https://doi.org/10.3934/mbe.2020148.

Yavuz, M., Bonyah, E., 1 July 2019. New approaches to the fractional dynamics of schistosomiasis disease model. Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications 525, 373–393.

Yavuz, M., Ozdemir, N., 2020. Analysis of an epidemic spreading model with exponential decay law. Mathematical Sciences and Applications E-Notes 8 (1), 142-154.

Zhou, S., Chen, H., 2020 March 11. Modeling the epidemic dynamics and control of COVID-19 in China. J. Quant Biol 1-9. https://doi.org/10.1017/s40484-020-0199-0.