Research

Evidence of structural genomic region recombination in Hepatitis C virus
Juan Cristina*1 and Rodney Colina1,2

Address: 1Laboratorio de Virología Molecular, Centro de Investigaciones nucleares, Facultad de Ciencias, Universidad de la República, Iguá 4225, 11400 Montevideo, Uruguay and 2Department of Biochemistry and McGill Cancer Center, McGill University, Montreal, Quebec, H3G 1Y6, Canada

Email: Juan Cristina* - cristina@cin.edu.uy; Rodney Colina - rcolina@cin.edu.uy

* Corresponding author

Abstract

Background/Aim: Hepatitis C virus (HCV) has been the subject of intense research and clinical investigation as its major role in human disease has emerged. Although homologous recombination has been demonstrated in many members of the family Flaviviridae, to which HCV belongs, there have been few studies reporting recombination on natural populations of HCV. Recombination break-points have been identified in non structural proteins of the HCV genome. Given the implications that recombination has for RNA virus evolution, it is clearly important to determine the extent to which recombination plays a role in HCV evolution. In order to gain insight into these matters, we have performed a phylogenetic analysis of 89 full-length HCV strains from all types and sub-types, isolated all over the world, in order to detect possible recombination events.

Method: Putative recombinant sequences were identified with the use of SimPlot program. Recombination events were confirmed by bootscanning, using putative recombinant sequence as a query.

Results: Two crossing over events were identified in the E1/E2 structural region of an intra-typic (1a/1c) recombinant strain.

Conclusion: Only one of 89 full-length strains studied resulted to be a recombinant HCV strain, revealing that homologous recombination does not play an extensive roll in HCV evolution. Nevertheless, this mechanism can not be denied as a source for generating genetic diversity in natural populations of HCV, since a new intra-typic recombinant strain was found. Moreover, the recombination break-points were found in the structural region of the HCV genome.

Background

Hepatitis C virus (HCV) is estimated to infect 170 million people worldwide and creates a huge disease burden from chronic, progressive liver disease [1]. HCV has become a major cause of liver cancer and one of the commonest indications of liver transplantation [2,3]. HCV has been classified in the family Flaviviridae, although it differs from other members of the family in many details of its genome organization from the original (vector-borne) members of the family [1]. Like most RNA viruses, HCV circulates in vivo as a complex population of different but closely related viral variants, commonly referred to as a quasispecies [4-7].
HCV is an enveloped virus with an RNA genome of approximately 9400 bp in length. Most of the genome forms a single open reading frame (ORF) that encodes three structural (core, E1, E2) and seven non-structural (p7, NS2-NS5B) proteins. Short untranslated regions at each end of the genome (5’NCR and 3’NCR) are required for replication of the genome. This process also requires a cis-acting replication element in the coding sequence of NS5B recently described [8]. Translation of the single ORF is dependent on an internal ribosomal entry site (IRES) in the 5’NCR, which interacts directly with the 40S ribosomal subunit during translation initiation [9].

Comparison of nucleotide sequences of variants recovered from different individuals and geographical regions has revealed the existence of at least six major genetic groups [1,10-12]. On the average over the complete genome, these differ in 30–35% of nucleotide sites. Each of the six major genetic groups of HCV contains a series of more closely related sub-types that typically differ from each other by 20–25% in nucleotide sequences [12].

Different genotypes and sub-types seem to correlate differently for susceptibility to treatment with interferon (IFN) monotherapy or IFN/ribavirin (RBV) combination therapy. Only 10–20% and 40–50% of individuals infected chronically with genotype 1 HCV on monotherapy and combination therapy, respectively, exhibit complete and permanent clearance of virus infection. These rates are much lower than the rates of 50 and 70–80% that are observed on treatment of HCV genotype 2 or 3 infections [3,13].

Until 1999, there was no evidence for recombination in members of the family Flaviviridae, although the possibility was considered [14-16]. Accordingly, the vast majority of work on members of this family, including vaccine studies and phylogenetic analyses in which genotypes were identified and sometimes correlated with disease severity, has rested on the implicit assumption that evolution in the family Flaviviridae is clonal, with diversity generated through the accumulation of mutational changes [17-19].

This assumption have shown to be invalid, as homologous recombination has been demonstrated in pestiviruses, (bovine viral diarrhoea virus) [20], flaviviruses (all four serotypes of dengue virus) [21-24], hepaciviruses (GB virus C/hepatitis G virus) [25], Japanese encephalitis or St Louis encephalitis virus [26].

Recombination plays a significant role in the evolution of RNA viruses by creating genetic variation. For example, the frequent recovery of poliovirus that result from recom-
bination has the potential to produce "escape mutants" in nature as well as in experiments [27].

Recombination has also been detected in other RNA viruses for which multivalent vaccines are in use or in trials [21,24,28]. The potential for recombination to produce new pathogenic hybrid strains needs to be carefully considered whenever vaccines are used or planned to control RNA viruses. Assumptions that recombination either does not take place or is unimportant in RNA viruses have a history of being proved wrong [24].

Recently, a natural intergenotypic recombinant (2k/1b) of HCV has been identified in Saint Petersburg (Russia) [29,30]. Phylogenetic analyses of HCV strains circulating in Peru, demonstrated the existence of natural intra-genotypic HCV recombinant strains (1a/1b) circulating in the Peruvian population [31].

Given the implications that recombination has for RNA virus evolution [24], it is clearly important to determine the extent to which recombination plays a role in HCV evolution.

Results

Phylogenetic profile analysis of full-length HCV strains

To gain insight into possible recombination events, a phylogenetic profile analysis was carried out using 89 full-length genome sequences from HCV isolates of all types and sub-types (for strain names, accession numbers and genotypes, see Table 1). This was done by the use of the SimPlot program [32]. Interestingly, when the analysis was carried out for strain D10749 (sub-type 1A), two different recombination points (detected at positions 1407 and 2050 of alignment) and two putative parental-like strains (AF511949, sub-type 1A and AY651061, sub-type 1C) are observed (see Fig. 1).

In order to confirm these results, the same sequences were used for a bootscanning study. The basic principle of bootscanning is that mosaicism is suggested when one observes high levels of phylogenetic relatedness between a query sequence and more than one reference sequence in different genomic regions [33]. When strain D10749 is used as a query, this is observed for this strain and the two putative parental-like strains previously detected (see Fig. 2). The same positions are also observed for the same recombination break-points detected in the similarity index study (see Figs. 1 and 2).

Profiles of synonymous and non-synonymous substitutions among parental-like and recombinant HCV strains

To gain insight into how the recombination events may have affected the mode of evolution of this HCV isolate, the variation in the rates of synonymous (i.e. no amino acid coding change) and nonsynonymous (i.e. changes in the amino acid coding assignment) substitutions among parental-like and the recombinant HCV strain were calculated for the genome region where the recombination break-points were detected. Synonymous distances are clearly significantly higher than nonsynonymous ones for most of genome region analyzed (see Fig. 3). As a consequence, the ratio of nonsynonymous-to-synonymous amino acid substitutions ($K_a/K_s$) is very low for most of this genomic region (see Fig. 3).

Interestingly, the rates of synonymous substitutions in AY651061–D10749 comparison are significantly lower in the region spanned by the recombination break-points, while significantly higher rates are obtained when AF511949–D10749 comparison is performed (see Fig. 3). The results of these studies show that even though recombination took place in the structural region of HCV genome, is has not produced a drastic change in the mode of evolution of the E1/E2 region, since the nonsynonymous substitution rate was maintained at very low rate (see Fig. 3). Thus, at least on this basis, the E1/E2 genomic region does not appear to have been perturbed by the recombination event.

Table 1: Full-length HCV sequences (Continued)

| Sequence | Genotype | Accession Number |
|----------|----------|-----------------|
| AY051292 | 1c | AY051292 |
| HC-G9 | 1c | D14853 |
| AY051292 | 1c | AY051292 |
| Khajai | 1c | AY651061 |
| pj6CF | 2a | AF177036 |
| MD2A-7 | 2a | AF238485 |
| JFH-1 | 2a | AB047639 |
| AY466460 | 2a | AY744660 |
| MD2B-1 | 2b | AF238486 |
| MD2b1-2 | 2b | AY232731 |
| HC-J8 | 2b | D10988 |
| JP1T971017 | 2b | AB030907 |
| BEBE1 | 2c | D50409 |
| VAT96 | 2k | AB031663 |
| HCVCENS1 | 3a | X76918 |
| CB | 3a | AF046866 |
| K3A | 3a | D28917 |
| HCVCENS1 | 3a | X76918 |
| NZL1 | 3a | D17763 |
| HCV-Tr | 3b | D49374 |
| JK049 | 3k | D63821 |
| ED43 | 4a | Y11604 |
| EUH1480 | 5a | Y13184 |
| SA13 | 5a | AF064490 |
| 6a33 | 6a | AY835726 |
| EUHK2 | 6a | Y13083 |
| THS80 | 6b | D84262 |
| VN235 | 6d | D84263 |
| JK046 | 6g | D63822 |
| VN004 | 6h | D84265 |
| VN405 | 6k | D84264 |
| KM45 | 6k | AY878650 |

(http://www.virologyj.com/content/31/53)
Figure 1

Phylogenetic profiles of HCV sequences. In (A) results from SimPlot analysis are shown. The y-axis gives the percentage of identity within a sliding window of 500 bp wide centered on the position plotted, with a step size between plots of 20 bp. Comparison of HCV strain D10749 with strains AF511949 (sub-type 1A), AY651061 (sub-type 1C) and D45172 (sub-type 2B) is shown. The red vertical lines show the recombination points at positions 1407 and 2050. In (B) a schematic representation of the HCV genome is shown. Structural and non-structural regions of the genome are indicated on the top of the figure. Nucleotide positions are shown by numbers on the upper part of the scheme. Amino acid codon positions are shown by numbers in the lower part of the scheme. No coding regions at the 5’ and 3’ of the genome are shown by a line. Coding region is shown by a yellow rectangle, showing the corresponding proteins by name. Recombination points are shown by red arrows.
Discussion

In the present study, analysis of full-length sequences from HCV strains of all types and sub-types provided the opportunity to test the role that recombination may play in HCV genetic diversity.

The results of this study revealed that recombination may not be extensive in HCV, since from 89 strains studied, recombination was observed in only one case. This is in agreement with the current methodology for HCV genotyping for the vast majority of the cases [10]. Nevertheless, the true frequency of recombination may be underestimated because although there is comparative important number of complete genomes sequences from common genotypes, such as 1b, most studies of HCV variability in high diversity areas are based on analysis of single sub-genomic regions, making detection of potential recombination events unlikely [10].

On the other hand, this study reveals that recombination can not be denied as an evolutionary mechanism for generating diversity in HCV (see Figs. 1 and 2). Moreover, an infectious HCV chimera comprising the complete open reading frame of sub-type 1b strain and the 5’- and 3’ non translated regions of a sub-type 1a strain has been constructed and is infectious in vivo [34]. A natural inter-genotype recombinant (2k/1b) has been identified in St. Petersburg, Russia [29,30] and a natural intra-typic recombinant (1a/1b) has been identified in Peru [31].

The recombination break-points for non-segmented positive-strand RNA viruses, such as polioviruses and other picornaviruses [35-37] as well as members of the family Flaviviridae, are often located in the part of the genome encoding non structural proteins. More recently, recombination break-points have been found in genes encoding structural proteins [38,39]. In the present study, we report recombination events in structural genes (E1/E2 region) between two different sub-types (1a/1c, see Figs. 1 and 2). Recombination may serve two opposite purposes: exploration of a new combination of genomic region from dif-

![Bootscanning of HCV sequences](image)

**Figure 2**

**Bootscanning of HCV sequences.** The y-axis gives the percentage of permuted trees using a sliding window of 500 bp wide centered on the position plotted, with a step size between plots of 20 bp. The rest same as Fig.I.A.
different origins or rescuing of viable genomes from debilitated parental genomes [40].

The recognition of recombination is important not only for unraveling the phylogenetic history of genes, but also for molecular phylogenetic inference. By ignoring the presence of recombination, phylogenetic analysis may be severely compromised [41,42]. For that reason, although recombination may not appear to be extensive in natural populations of HCV, this possibility should be taken into account as a mechanism of genetic variation for HCV.

The results of this study, as well as previous ones [29-31] provide evidence that not only does recombination occur in HCV, but that it occurs in natural populations. In the case of the recombinant described in this study, the distribution of non-synonymous substitutions showed very low rates, revealing that the E1/E2 region of this isolate might have not been perturbed by the recombination events (see Fig. 3). This may also be related to the fact that the differences in this region of the genome among sub-genotypes 1A and 1C, at least in the case of the isolates involved in these studies, are not particularly significant at the amino acid level in the genomic region where the recombination events have occurred.

**Conclusion**

Only one of 89 full-length strains studied resulted to be a recombinant HCV strain, revealing that homologous recombination does not play an extensive role in HCV evolution. A new intra-typic (1a/1c) recombinant strain was found. The recombination break-points were found in the structural (E1/E2) region of the HCV genome. Whether new HCV variants may appear, as a result of recombination events, remains to be established as well as if their fitness permits them to be selected in an HCV population.

**Methods**

**Sequences**

Full-length genome sequences from 89 HCV isolates where obtained by means of the use of the HCV LANL database [43]. For names, genotypes and accession numbers see Table 1. Sequences were aligned using the CLUSTAL W program [44].
Recombination analysis

Putative recombinant sequences were identified with the SimPlot program [32]. This program is based on a sliding window method and constitutes a way of graphically displaying the coherence of the sequence relationship over the entire length of a set of aligned homologous sequences. The window width and the step size were set to 500 bp and 20 bp, respectively.

Bootscanning [33] was carried out employing software from the SimPlot program [32], using putative recombinant sequence as a query. Mosaicism is suggested when high levels of phylogenetic relatedness between the query sequence and more than one reference sequence in different genomic regions is obtained.

Substitution rate analysis

The substitution rate along the open reading frame of the HCV genome, from position 1 to 2490 (relative to the first coding position of strain D10749), was measured using a sliding window method according to the procedure implemented by Alvarez-Valin [45]. Pairwise nucleotide distances (synonymous and nonsynonymous) within the entire length of a set of aligned homologous sequences. The window width and the step size were set to 500 bp and 20 bp, respectively.

Competing interests
The author(s) declare that they have no competing interests.

Authors’ contributions
JC and RC conceived, designed and performed the analysis. JC wrote the paper.

Acknowledgements
This work was supported by ICGEB, PAHO, and RELAB through Project CRP.LA/URU03-022 and International Atomic Energy Agency through project ARCAL 6050.

References

1. Simmonds P: Genetic diversity and evolution of hepatitis C virus 15 years on. J Gen Virol 2004, 85:3173-3188.
2. Hoofnagle JH: Course and outcome of hepatitis C. Hepatology 2003, 36:521-529.
3. Pawlotsky JM: The nature of interferon-alpha resistance in hepatitis C virus infection. Curr Opin Infect Dis 2003, 16:587-592.
4. Chambers TJ, Fan X, Droll DA, Hembrador E, Slater T, Nickells MW, Dustin LB, Dibisceglie AM: Quasispecies heterogeneity within the E1/E2 region as a pretreatment variable during pegylated interferon therapy of chronic hepatitis C virus infection. J Virol 2005, 79:3071-3083.
5. Laskus T, Wilkinson J, Gallegos-Orozco JF, Radkowski M, Adair DM, Nowicki M, Operskalski E, Buskell Z, Seeff LB, Vargas H, Rakela J: Analysis of hepatitis C virus quasispecies transmission and evolution in patients infected through blood transfusion. Gastroenterology 2004, 127:676-776.
6. Felu A, Gay E, Garcia-Retortillo M, Saiz JC, Foms X: Evolution of hepatitis C virus quasispecies immediately following liver transplantation. Liver Transpl 2004, 10:1131-1139.
7. Martell M, Esteban JL, Quer J, Genesca J, Weiner A, Esteban R, Guardia J, Gomez J: Hepatitis C virus (HCV) circulates as a population of different but closely related genotypes. J Virol 1992, 66:3225-3229.
8. You S, Stump DD, Branch AD, Rice CM: A cis-acting replication element in the sequence encoding the NS5B RNA-dependent RNA polymerase is required for hepatitis C virus RNA replication. J Virol 2004, 78:1352-1366.
9. Pestova TV, Shatsky NI, Fletcher SP, Jackson RJ, Hellen CU: A prokaryotic-like mode of cytoplasmic eukaryotic ribosome binding to the initiating codon during internal translation initiation of hepatitis C and classical swine fever virus RNAs. Genes Dev 1998, 12:6783.
10. Simmonds P, Bukh J, Combet C, Deleage G, Enomoto N, Feinstone S, Halfon P, Inchauspe G, Kuiken C, Maertens G, Mizokami M, Murphy DG, Okamoto H, Pawlotsky JM, Penin F, Sablon E, Shinn IT, Stuyver LJ, Thiel HJ, Viazov S, Weiner AJ, Widdess A: Consensus proposals for a unified system of nomenclature of hepatitis C virus genotypes. Hematology 2005, 42:962-973.
11. Simmonds P: The origin and evolution of hepatitis C viruses in humans. J Gen Virol 2001, 82:693-712.
12. Simmonds P, Holmes EC, Cha TA, Chan SW, McMinn F, Irvine B, Beard Y, Yap PL, Kolberg J: Classification of hepatitis C virus into six major genotypes and a series of subtypes by phylogenetic analysis of the NS5A region. J Virol 1993, 74:2391-2399.
13. Zeuzem S: Heterogenous virologic response rates to interferon-based therapy in patients with chronic hepatitis C: who responds less well? Ann Intern Med 2004, 140:370-381.
14. Blok J, McWilliam SM, Butler HC, Gibbs AJ, Weiller G: Comparison of a dengue-2 virus and its candidate vaccine derivative: sequence relationships with the Flaviviruses and other viruses. J Virol 1992, 67:593-590.
15. Kuno G: Factors influencing the transmission of dengue viruses. In Dengue and Dengue Haemorrhagic Fever Edited by: Gubler DJ, Kuno G. Wallingford, UK: CAB International; 1997.
16. Monath TP: Dengue: the risk to developing and developing countries. Prog Nati Acad Sci USA 1994, 91:2295-2400.
17. Chen WR, Tesh RB, Rico-Hesse R: Genetic variation of Japanese encephalitis virus in nature. J Gen Virol 1990, 71:2915-2922.
18. Lettmyer KC, Vaughn DW, Watts DM, Salas R, Villalobos de Chacon I, Ramos C, Rico-Hesse R: Dengue virus structural differences that correlate with pathogenesis. J Virol 1999, 73:4738-4747.
19. Rico-Hesse R: Molecular evolution and distribution of dengue viruses type 1 and 2 in nature. Virology 1990, 174:479-493.
20. Becher P, Oritsch M, Thiel H-J: RNA recombination between persisting pestivirus and a vaccine strain: generation of cytopathogenic virus and induction of lethal disease. J Virol 2001, 75:6256-6264.
21. Holmes EC, Worobey M, Rambaut A: Phylogenetic evidence for recombination in dengue virus. Mol Biol Evol 1999, 16:405-409.
22. Tolou H, Couissinier-Paris P, Durand JP, Mercier V, de Pina JJ: Evidence for recombination in natural populations of dengue virus type 1 based on the analysis of complete genome sequences. J Gen Virol 2001, 82:1283-1290.
23. Uzcategui NY, Camacho D, Comach G, Cuello de Uzcategui R, Holmes EC: The molecular epidemiology of dengue type 2 virus in Venezuela: evidence for in situ virus evolution and recombination. J Gen Virol 2001, 82:2945-2953.
24. Worobey M, Holmes EC: Evolutionary aspects of recombination in RNA viruses. J Gen Virol 1999, 80:2535-2543.
25. Worobey M, Holmes EC: Heterogeneity in recombination in GB virus C/hepatitis G virus. Mol Biol Evol 2001, 18:254-261.
26. Twiddy SS, Holmes EC: The extent of homologous recombination in members of the genus Flavivirus. J Gen Virol 2003, 84:839-840.
27. Kew OM, Nottay BK: Evolution of the oral polio vaccine strains in humans occurs by both mutation and intra-molecular recombination. In Modern Approaches to Vaccines Edited by: Chanock RM, Lerner RA. Cold Spring Harbor, NY: Cold Spring Har- bor Laboratory; 1984:357-363.
28. Suzuki Y, Gojobori T, Nakagomi O: Intragenic recombination in rotaviruses. FEBS Lett 1998, 427:183-187.
29. Kalinina O, Norder H, Magnius O: Full-length open reading frame of a recombinant hepatitis C virus strain from St.
30. Kalinina O, Norder H, Mukomolov S, Magnus LO: A natural intergenotypic recombinant of hepatitis C virus identified in St. Petersburg. J Virol 2004, 78:1853-1857.

31. Colina R, Casane D, Vasquez S, Garcia-Aguirre L, Chunga A, Romero H, Khan B, Cristina J: Evidence of intratypic recombinant in natural populations of hepatitis C virus. J Gen Virol 2004, 85:31-37.

32. Lole KS, Bollinger RC, Parnjape RS, Gadkari D, Kulkarni SS: Full-length human immunodeficiency virus type 1 genomes from subtype C-infected seroconverters in India, with evidence of intersubtype recombination. J Virol 1999, 73:152-160.

33. Salminen MO, Carr JK, Burke DS, McCutchan FE: Identification of breakpoints in intergenotypic recombinants of HIV type 1 by bootscanning. AIDS Res Hum Retroviruses 1995, 11:1423-1425.

34. Yagami M, St Claire M, Shapiro M, Emerson SU, Purcell H: Transviral of a chimeric cDNA clone of hepatitis C virus genotype 1b are infectious in vivo. Virology 1998, 244:161-172.

35. Santi J, Hyypia T, Kinnunen L, Salminen M: Evidence of recombination among enteroviruses. J Virol 1999, 73:8741-8749.

36. Guillot S, Caro V, Cuervo N, Korodkova E, Combiescu M: Natural genetic exchanges between vaccine and wild poliovirus strains in humans. J Virol 2000, 74:8434-8443.

37. Kew O, Morris-Glasgow V, Landaverde M, Burns C, Shaw J, Garib Z, Andre J, Blackman E, Freeman CJ, Jorba J, Sutter R, Tumbas G, Venczel L, Pedraza F, Shimizu H, Yoneyama T, Miyamura T, van Deventer HSJ, Weller PF: Outbreak of poliomyelitis in Hispaniola associated with circulating type 1 vaccine-derived poliovirus. Science 2002, 296:356-359.

38. Costa-Mattioli M, Ferre V, Casane D, Perez-Bercoff R, Coste-Burel M, Imbers-Marticorena BM, Andre EC, Bresollette-Bodin C, Billault S, Cristina J: Evidence of recombination in natural populations of hepatitis A virus. Virology 2003, 311:51-59.

39. Martin J, Samoilovich E, Dunn G, Lackenby A, Feldman E, Heath A, Smithies O, Cooper G, Yermalovich M, Minor PD: Isolation of an intertypic poliovirus capsid recombinant from a child with vaccine-associated paralytic poliomyelitis. J Virol 2002, 76:10921-10928.

40. Domingo E, Holland JJ: RNA virus mutations and fitness for survival. Annu Rev Microbiol 1997, 51:75-108.

41. Posada D, Crandall KA: Evaluation of methods for detecting recombination from DNA sequences: Computer simulations. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 2001, 98:13757-13762.

42. Schierup MH, Hein J: Consequences of recombination on traditional phylogenetic analysis. Genetics 2000, 156:879-891.

43. Kuiken C, Yusim K, Boykin L, Richardson R: The HCV Sequence Database. Bioinformatics 2001, 21:379-384.

44. Thompson JD, Higgins DG, Gibson TJ: CLUSTAL W: improving the sensitivity of progressive multiple sequence alignment through sequence weighting, position-specific gap penalties and weight matrix choice. Nucleic Acid Res 1994, 22:4673-4680.

45. Alvarez-Valin F, Tort JF, Bernardi G: Nonrandom spatial distribution of synonymous substitutions in the GP63 gene from Leishmania. Genetics 2000, 155:1683-1692.

46. Cameron JM: A method for estimating the numbers of synonymous and nonsynonymous substitutions per site. J Mol Evol 1995, 41:1152-1159.

47. Ina Y, Gojobori T: Statistical analysis of nucleotide sequences of the hemagglutinin gene of human influenza A viruses. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 1994, 91:8388-8392.

Page 8 of 8 (page number not for citation purposes)