Quotations from the Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā in Chapter 18 of the Prasannapadā

NIISAKU Yoshiaki

1. Introduction

It is common knowledge that in Candrakīrti’s Prasannapadā (PsP), Sūtra is quoted at the end of each chapter; in Chapter 18, the Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā (Aṣṭa) is quoted in large part. A critical text of the PsP Chapter 181) highlights the following issues in comparing the quotations of (a) the Aṣṭa in the Sanskrit text of the PsP (PsP Skt), (b) Sanskrit text of the Aṣṭa (Aṣṭa Skt), (c) the Aṣṭa in the Tibetan translation of the PsP (PsP Tib), (d) London manuscript of the Aṣṭa (Aṣṭa L),2) and (e) the Derge version of the Aṣṭa (Aṣṭa D):3)

(I) PsP Skt and PsP Tib are different. (II) PsP Skt and Aṣṭa Skt are different. (III) PsP Tib and Aṣṭa D are different. (IV) The abrupt locative absolute (below bold) is seen in the PsP Skt, but not in the PsP Tib.

2. Preliminary Studies and the Discussion in this Paper

Fumio Shōji revealed the following two lineages of the Tibetan translation of the Aṣṭa: Lineage B is influenced by the Abhisamayālamkāra, whereas lineage A is not.4)

Lineage A Phug brag No.840 (Fc), Toyo Bunko Zogai No.334 (K), London No.647 (L), Tokyo (Toyo Bunko) No.31 (T)

Lineages B Cone No.1001 (C), Derge No.12 (D), Phug brag No.838 (Fa), Phug brag No.839 (Fb), Lhasa No.11 (H), Narthang No.13 (N), Peking No.734 (P), Stog Palace No.15 (S), Urga No.12 (U)

According to Shōji, some sentences included in Lineage B are absent in Lineage A. More precisely, in Lineage B, there are some additional sentences along with the commentary in the Abhisamayālamkāra. In addition to the Tibetan translation of the Aṣṭa, Shōji presented the currently available Sanskrit text of the Aṣṭa Skt (Vidya 1960), which corresponds with Lineage B, and not Lineage A. He also discussed the Aṣṭa quoted in Chapter 20 of the PsP;
some sentences seen only in Lineage B are absent in both the Aṣṭa quoted in the PsP and Lineage A, therefore, the Aṣṭa quoted in the PsP corresponds with Lineage A.  

Based on above discussion, (II) (III) can be analyzed as follows: concerning (II), PsP Skt corresponds with Lineage A whereas Aṣṭa Skt corresponds with Lineage B; concerning (III), PsP Tib corresponds with Lineage A whereas Aṣṭa D corresponds with Lineage B.  

This paper aims to discuss (I) (IV) comparing (a) to (e) by focusing on the word “omission (Skt: yāvat, Tib: bar nas).” Based on Shōji’s studies, the lineages of (a)–(e) are categorized as follows: Lineage A (a) PsP Skt (c) PsP Tib (d) Aṣṭa; Lineage B (b) Aṣṭa Skt (e) Aṣṭa D  

3. Quotations from the Aṣṭa in Chapter 18 of the PsP  

(a) PsP Skt  

Text (1) ... yo buddhadharmebhyo vitiṣṭhate / sa saṃsāre carati // yaḥ saṃsāre carati / sa prajñāpāramitāyām na carati / na ca tām anuprāpnotīti // yāvat // (2) māreṇodake ’ntardhāpite / (3) athāasyaitad abhūt / yan ny ahah ātmanaḥ kāyaṃ viddhvā imāṃ prthivipradeśam rudhireṇa siñceyam // (PsP S 147.6–9; PsP L 380.1–4)  

*1 The underlined text is the portion that is different from that in the Aṣṭa Skt.  

*2 The bold text represents the portion that seems to be the summary of the situation.  

Translation (1) ... When he is turned away from the Buddha-dharmas, then he wanders in samsāra. And when he wanders in samsāra, then he does not course in perfect wisdom, then he cannot reach it. ... (yāvat) (2) When Māra had hidden the water. (3) He then thought to himself in this way: "Let me pierce my own body, and sprinkle this ground with [my] blood.”  

(b) Aṣṭa Skt  

Text (1) ... yo buddhadharmebhyo vitiṣṭhate sa saṃsāre carati / yaḥ saṃsāre carati sa na carati prajñāpāramitāyām / sa prajñāpāramitām nānuprāpnotīti // ... (Aṣṭa S 238.17–19) (2) atha khalu sadāprarudito bodhisattvo mahāsattvas tam prthivipradeśam sektukāmah / na codakaṃ samantāt paryeṣamāno ‘pi labhate yena tam prthivipradeśam siñcet / yathāpi nāma māreṇa pāpiyasā tat sarvam udakam antardhāpitam abhūt apy eva nāma asya sadāpraruditasya bodhisattvavyodakam alabhāmānasya cittaṃ khidyeta duḥkhadaurmanasyam ca bhavet cittasya vā anyathātvam bhavet yenāsya kuśālamūlasāntardhānām bhavet na vā pūjā bhrājeran //  

— 1138 —
Quotations from the *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā* in Chapter 18 of the *Prasannapadā* (Niisaku)

(3) atha khalu sadāpraruditasya bodhisattvasya mahāsattvasyaitad abhūt / yan na hāma ātmanāḥ kāyam viddhvā imaṃ prthivīpradeśaṃ rudhireṇa śīnceyam / (AṣṭaSkt 257.24–30)

*1 The wavy-lined text is the portion omitted with yāvat in the PsPskt.  
*2 The underlined text is the portion that is different from that in the PsPskt.*

**Translation**

(1) ... When he is turned away from the Buddha-dharmas, then he wanders in *samsāra*. And when he wanders in *samsāra*, then he does not course in perfect wisdom, then he cannot reach the perfection of wisdom.

(2) When the Bodhisattva Mahāsattrā Sadāprarudita wanted to sprinkle the ground, he could not find any water, by which he sprinkled the ground, though he searched all around. **For Māra, the Evil One, had hidden all the water.** And he did this so that Bodhisattva Mahāsattrā Sadāprarudita, if he could not find any water, should become [his] mind depressed, pained and despaired, or change [his] mind, with the result that his wholesome root would vanish, or the worship be dimmed.

(3) The Bodhisattva Mahāsattrā Sadāprarudita then thought to himself in this way: "Let me pierce my own body, and sprinkle the ground with [my] blood.

(c) PsP₉ᵗʰ

**Text**

(1) ... gang sangs rgyas kyi chos rnams las nyams par gyur pa de ni ’khor ba la spyod do // gang ’khor ba la spyod pa de ni shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa la mi spyod de / des shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa rjes su mi ’thob po zhes bya ba’i bar nas /

(2) chu de dag mi snang bar byas nas kun tu chu btsal na chu ma rnyed do //

(3) de nas byang chub sms dpa’ sms dpa’ chen po rtag tu ngus ’di snyam du sms te / bdag gi lus phug la khrag gis sa phyogs’di chag chag gdab po // (PsPs 177.10–16)

*1 The underlined text is the portion that is different from that in the Aṣṭaₗ and the Aṣṭa₉.*

**Translation**

... (2) [For Māra] had hidden the water, he could not find the water though he searched the water all around. ...

(d) Aṣṭa₉

**Text**

(1) ... gang sangs rgyas kyi chos rnams las nyams par ’gyur pa de’ ni ’khor ba la’ spyod do // gang ’khor ba la spyod⁴ pa de ni shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa rjesu mi ’thob bo // (Aṣṭaₗ 332a8–332b1)

(2) de nas byang chub sms dpa’ sms dpa’ chen po rtag tu ngus phyogs⁵ der chag chag gdab⁵ par ’dod na / bdud sdi gcan gyis chu de thams cad mi snang bar byas nas / ci nas byang chub sms dpa’ sms dpa’ chen po rtag tu ngu⁶ de chu ma’ rnyed nas / yid mi bda’ zhih sms sdu sgangal te / sms gzhan du gyur pa⁷ dang / dge ba’i rtsa ba nab par ’gyur ba dang / mchod pa de yang⁹ mi mdzes par
bya ba’i phyir chu de dag mi snang bar byas nas // kun tu chu btsal na¹⁰ chu¹¹ ma rnyed do //
(3) de nas byang chub sens dpa’ sens dpa’ chen po rtag tu ngu ’di snyam du sens te bdag gi lus phug la khrag gis sa¹² phyogs ’di chag chag gdab bo // (Aṣṭa₄, 358a8–358b4)

*1 The wavy-lined text is the portion that is omitted with bar nas in the PsP₉₅
*2 The underlined text is the portion that is different from that in the Aṣṭa₄.

Translation

... (2) When the Bodhisattva Mahāsattva Sadāprarudita wanted to sprinkle the ground, Māra, the Evil One, had hidden all the water. The Bodhisattva Mahāsattva Sadāprarudita, if he could not find the water, should become depressed and [his] mind despaired, or change his mind, with the result that his wholesome root would vanish, or the worship be dimmed. For such purpose, [for Māra] had hidden the water, he could not find the water though he searched the water all around. ...
serve that the text is entirely different. We may assume that the Aṣṭa in the (c) PsP\textsubscript{Tib} is the direct translation from the Aṣṭa in the PsP\textsubscript{Skt}; however, this is difficult to do so. Of course, although we cannot rule out the possibility that the Sanskrit manuscript on which PsP\textsubscript{Tib} based on is different from that on which the PsP\textsubscript{Skt} based on, it is not necessary to do so, since we cannot find many differences between (a) PsP\textsubscript{Skt} and (b) PsP\textsubscript{Tib} except for (2) Bold portion. The clue to solving this issue lies in the “cut-and-paste” method\textsuperscript{6)—insertion from an already translated text—, such as, Mūlamadhyamakakārikā (MMK) and its commentaries, etc..\textsuperscript{7}} Comparing (2) Bold portion in the (c) PsP\textsubscript{Tib}, (d) Aṣṭa\textsubscript{L}, and (e) Aṣṭa\textsubscript{D}, interestingly, we reveal that (2) Bold portion in (c) PsP\textsubscript{Tib} completely corresponds with (d) Aṣṭa\textsubscript{L}, whereas almost corresponds with (e) Aṣṭa\textsubscript{D}. This shows that the “cut-and-paste” method should be used in the case of the Aṣṭa too. Therefore, we may conclude that the Tibetan translator appropriately inserted Aṣṭa from an already translated text and omitted with bar nas properly. Furthermore, based on Shōji’s studies, we may assume that this quotation of the Aṣṭa belongs to Lineage A.

Second, I discuss (IV). We observe that (2) Bold portion (mārenodake ſntardhāpite) in the PsP\textsubscript{Skt} seems to have no problem in connecting with the following sentence; however, we cannot find the same text in the Aṣṭa\textsubscript{Skt}. This is not a result of the differences between Lineages A and B because this portion cannot be found in the Aṣṭa\textsubscript{L}, as well. This can be understood through the contents of (2) in the Aṣṭa\textsubscript{Skt}. The intention to quote the Aṣṭa in the PsP seems to highlight the Bodhisattva spirit of Sadāpurardita, and the after “omission” (yāvat) text represents what Bodhisattva Sadāpurardita thought to himself. In this context, it is necessary to provide a description of the situation. Therefore, to understand the context, composer of the Sanskrit text of the PsP provided an explanation of the situation, i.e., the summary of (2) in the Aṣṭa, with locative absolute. This seems to represent one feature of how the Aṣṭa is quoted in the Sanskrit text of the PsP.

5. Concluding Remarks

Comparing and analyzing the above quotations (a)—(e), I summarize the discussion in this paper as follows:

1. The Aṣṭa quoted in the Tibetan translation of the PsP is not a direct translation of the Aṣṭa in the Sanskrit text of the PsP; rather, it is an insertion from an already translated Tibetan translation of the Aṣṭa.
2. After yāvat, the composer of the Sanskrit text of the PsP seems to have inserted the summary of the situation.

Notes

1) My Ph.D. dissertation (Niisaku 2016) provides a critical text of the PsP Chapter 18.  
2) In this paper, the Asṭa_L is used as a representative of Lineage A.  
3) In this paper, the Asṭa_D is used as a representative of Lineage B.  
4) For Lineage A and B, see Shōji 2016b: 113–135.  
5) Cf. Shōji 2016b: 136–144.  
6) For the “cut-and-paste” method, see MacDonald 2015: 270ff.  
7) As is well known, Akira Saitō has discussed the translation processes of the MMK and its commentaries: When Klu'i rgyal mtshan translated MMK's commentaries, he initially translated Bhāviveka's Prajñāpradīpa (PP) by referring to Avalokitavrata's Prajñāpradīpaṭīkā (PPטר), and when he translated Aktobhayā (ABh) and Buddhapaṭīla Commentary (BP), he inserted the MMK from PP into ABh and BP. Cf. Saitō 1995. MacDonald 2015: 258–259 mentions a similar case for Yutiṣaṣṭikā and Yutiṣaṣṭikāvṛtti discussed by Cristina Scherrer-Schaub.

Abbreviations

Asṭa Asṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā. Asṭaśa Asṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā. Asṭasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitā. Ed. Paraśurāma Lakshmana Vaidya. Darbhanga: The Mithila Institute, 1960. AsṭaD Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā. D no.12. AsṭaL Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā. London Manuscript no.647, see also Shōji 2016a. om. omitted. MMK Mūlamadhyamakakārikā. PsP Prasannapadā. PsPN Prasannapadā of Candrakīrti. Mūlamadhyamakakārikās de Nāgārjuna avec la Prasannapadā Commentaire de Candrakīrti. Ed. Louis de La Vallée Poussin. St. Petersburg: Imperial Academy of Sciences, 1903–1913. Reprint, Tokyo: Meicho-Fukyu-kai, 1977. PsPNPrasannapadā of Candrakīrti, chapter 18. See Niisaku 2016.

Bibliography

Conze, Edward 1973. The perfection of wisdom in eight thousand lines & its verse summary, Four Seasons Foundation, San Francisco.

MacDonald, Anne. 2015. "Pragmatic Translating: The Case of Pa tshab Nyi ma grags." In Cultural Flows across the Western Himalaya, ed. Patrick Mc Allister et al., 249–278. Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.

Niisaku Yoshiaki 新作慶明. 2016. "Prasannapadā dai 18 shō 'ga (atoman) no kōsatsu' no kenkyū" 『プラサンナバダー』第18章「我（アートマン）の考察」の研究. PhD diss., The University of Tokyo.

Saitō Akira 斎藤明. 1995. "Problems in Translating the Mūlamadhyamakakārikā as Cited in its Commentaries." In Buddhist Translations: Problems and Perspectives, ed. Lama Doboom Tulk, 87–96. Delhi: Manohar.

Shōji Fumio 庄司史生. 2016a. Rondon shahon Kangyurusyoshū Tchibettogoyaku Hassenju-hannya no Kenkyū ロンドン写本カンギュル所収チベット語訳「八千頌般若」の研究. Tokyo: The Sankibō Busshorin.  
———. 2016b. Hassenju-hannya-kyō no keiseishiteki kenkyū 八千頌般若経の形成史的研究 [A Study on the Compilation Process of the Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā], The Sankibō Busshorin, Tokyo.

Key words Prasannapadā, Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā

(Lecturer, Musashino University, PhD)