Research Article

Meta-Analysis Study on Treatment of Children’s Attention Deficit Disorder with Hyperactivity

Jinlian Xue,1 Yuping Hao,2 Xiaohui Li,3 Renfang Guan,1 Yang Wang,2 Yanfang Li,2 and Hongni Tian2

1Central Hospital Rizhao, Rizhao, Shandong 100191, China
2Tongchuan People’s Hospital, Tongchuan, Shaanxi 727000, China
3TCM Hospital of Rizhao, Rizhao, Shandong 100191, China

Correspondence should be addressed to Yuping Hao; rtony508@students.noc.edu

Received 27 July 2021; Accepted 23 September 2021; Published 22 October 2021

Abstract

Attention deficit hyperactivity disorder is a common neurobehavioral disorder of school-age children, and its symptoms are characterized by attention deficit and hyperactivity impulse that are not commensurate with the level of development. The global prevalence of children with ADHD has risen to 10%, and the prevalence of children in China is about 6.26%. With the spread of ADHD symptoms in society and the increasing importance of people on them, many parents and teachers will overdiagnose and improperly intervene in children’s inattention and hyperactive behaviors in daily life. However, because it is difficult to diagnose the core symptoms of ADHD in the early stage, the diagnostic criteria of the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (Fifth Edition) have extended the age of onset of ADHD from 7 to 12 years. This indicates that some school-age children have not been diagnosed but still show symptoms of ADHD, and the symptoms are at risk of continuous development. Studies have shown that children with ADHD symptoms are prone to academic problems, poor peer relationships, and offensive behaviors. Their symptoms persist into adulthood and are more related to offensive crime and antisocial behavior [3, 4].
This article first introduces the treatment of children with ADHD, mainly from the two aspects of Western medicine and traditional Chinese medicine, including pathogenic factors and treatment methods. Then it introduces the nondrug treatment of ADHD. This article mainly introduces parental training and art therapy. Finally, a systematic review and meta-analysis of the treatment of ADHD are carried out.

2. The Treatment of Children with ADHD

2.1. Western Medicine Research on ADHD

2.1.1. The Pathogenic Factors and Pathogenesis of ADHD. The pathogenic factors of ADHD include genetics, neurophysiology, drug abuse during pregnancy, lead exposure, lack of early attachment, or childhood posttraumatic stress disorder. Genetic factors have always been considered to have an important relationship with the formation of ADHD [5, 6]. Family studies have confirmed the general recurrence of diseases with a high genetic component. Compared with foster parents, the incidence of inherited ADHD from reproductive parents can reach more than three times. However, the genetic basis of this disease is more likely to be provided by the father of a child with ADHD. Environmental factors also have a certain impact on the occurrence of ADHD. Compared with decades ago, the incidence of this disease has increased. Complications during pregnancy or childhood may play a role in the occurrence of this disease. During pregnancy, exposure to harmful chemicals in the uterus may lead to the occurrence of ADHD [7, 8]. These factors include but are not limited to smoking, drinking, prescription drugs, illegal medicines, and environmental pollutants, have been ubiquitous in the past four decades and pose a threat to women. Toxemia, eclampsia, fetal over-maturity, delivery time, fetal distress, low birth weight, prenatal hemorrhage, or poor maternal health can all cause ADHD. Severe marital conflicts, low socioeconomic levels, parents with criminal records, those in foster care, and social psychosocial disorders are all related to ADHD. Any psychological factor that affects an individual’s emotional health seems to play a role in the development and persistence of ADHD [9, 10].

2.1.2. Western Medicine Treatment of ADHD. At present, the research on the treatment of ADHD mainly focuses on drug treatment, with less emphasis on psychotherapy and psychosocial intervention and less research on complementary and alternative drugs. The generally accepted standard method for the treatment of ADHD is pharmaceutical intervention, and the first choice is medical stimulants, such as methylphenidate (MPH) and dexamphetamine sulfate, of which methylphenidate is used in a wider range. In many western countries, the drugs currently used to treat ADHD include stimulants (methylphenidate, mixed amphetamine hydrochloride, etc.), nonstimulants (atomoxetine, clonidine, guanfacine, etc.), and some antidepressants (bupropion, venlafaxine, reboxetine, amitriptyline, etc.) [11, 12].

In the past two decades, the number of ADHD patients has continued to increase. The long-term use of psychostimulants in children has been controversial. Due to the occurrence of side effects or lack of curative effect, poor compliance and treatment failure of patients generally occur. Therefore, other alternative treatment options are welcome [13]. In different surveys conducted around the world, the use rate of complementary and alternative medicines (CAM) in Florida is 12%, in Boston 54%, Perth, in Australia, 64%, and in Melbourne 64%. The utilization rate in Israel is 28%. A study pointed out that compared with adolescents without mental health problems, the use rate of CAM therapy in the former (28.9%) is more than twice that of the latter (11.6%). The parent interview preparation technique is shown in Figure 1.

The current literature reports many different complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) treatment methods, such as diet adjustment, physical therapy, massage, lifestyle changes, chiropractic treatment, acupuncture, and traditional Chinese medicine. There is evidence that they can effectively improve the treatment of ADHD symptoms. Complementary and alternative medicine therapies, including traditional Chinese medicine, are widely used worldwide because they have fewer side effects and are safer [14, 15].

2.2. ADHD in Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM)

2.2.1. The Etiology and Pathogenesis of ADHD. When a child is born with inadequacy, improper postpartum care, improper education, environmental influences, trauma or emotional disorders, and so on, it will cause the five internal organs to lose coordination, qi and blood disorder, and corresponding diseases. The diagnosis and treatment of ADHD by traditional Chinese medicine are based on the unique overall concept and syndrome differentiation in the basic theories of traditional Chinese medicine [16]. It collects the clinical information of the patient through observation, hearing, inquiry, and combination of four diagnoses, making an accurate diagnosis and formulating a corresponding treatment plan.

2.2.2. TCM Treatment of ADHD. The ultimate goal of TCM treatment of children with ADHD is to completely relieve it. The specific content is “when the patient is receiving or not receiving drug treatment, the clinical symptoms are reduced or disappeared, and the body’s function reaches the best state.” In other words, the standard for curative effect of traditional Chinese medicine treatment is that the core symptoms of ADHD are eliminated, the comorbidities are improved, and the children’s behavior, mood, social function, and quality of life are maximized. TCM treatment also aims to strengthen the body’s adaptability, eliminate endogenous and exogenous pathogenic factors, and eliminate the root cause of ADHD disease. At the same time, TCM
When treating children with ADHD, it is difficult to expect satisfying results only by relying on drug therapy; especially, the additional consequences caused by lack of attention, impulsive solutions, lack of systematic thinking, and inefficient anger handling mechanisms, distorted relationships, and other problems cannot be solved by medication. Therefore, not only medical treatment is needed, but we also need psychosocial treatment mechanisms. Commonly used psychotherapy methods include cognitive action therapy, parenting training, and so on.

2.3. Nondrug Treatment of ADHD. When treating children with ADHD, it is difficult to expect satisfying results only by relying on drug therapy; especially, the additional consequences caused by lack of attention, impulsive solutions, lack of systematic thinking, and inefficient anger handling mechanisms, distorted relationships, and other problems cannot be solved by medication. Therefore, not only medical treatment is needed, but we also need psychosocial treatment mechanisms. Commonly used psychotherapy methods include cognitive action therapy, parenting training, and so on.

2.3.1. Parenting Training. The dimensions and types of parental rearing styles are shown in Tables 1 and 2. Studies have shown that parental rearing style affects the symptoms of attention deficit and hyperactivity in school-age children. This is consistent with the results of previous ADHD studies. Active parenting methods increase the protective function of ADHD children, and negative parenting methods increase the symptoms and negative emotions of ADHD children. The results indicate that the authoritative parenting method is a more active and suitable parenting method for children with symptoms of attention deficit or hyperactivity, while the authoritarian parenting method can increase the symptoms of ADHD.

Studies have evaluated the parenting styles based on different reporters, and the results show the difference in the impact of parenting styles on ADHD between fathers and mothers. In the authoritative parenting style, only the authoritative parenting style evaluated by the mother as a protective factor negatively affects the symptoms of ADHD. Studies have found that the mother's self-evaluation authority score is significantly higher than that of his father's evaluation and that whether the mother evaluates herself or her husband's authoritative parenting style directly affects children's ADHD symptoms. There was no
significant difference between the father’s self-evaluated authority score and his mother’s authority score, and neither the father’s evaluation of himself nor his wife’s authoritative parenting style was related to ADHD symptoms. The relevant results of the study show that the authoritative parenting styles under all reporting forms are negatively correlated with ADHD symptoms, but the path analysis results show that the authoritative parenting style evaluated by the father does not affect ADHD symptoms. Therefore, some studies speculate that there is a possibility that fathers are not sensitive to the characteristics of authoritative parenting styles.

In addition, the results of children’s reports of parental rearing styles showed that only the mother’s authoritarian rearing styles positively affected ADHD symptoms. The mother’s authoritarian parenting style is closely related to the inattention and hyperactivity of children aged 3–18. Calkins, Dedmon, Gill, Lomax, and Johnson’s frustration research results also show that when mothers have too many intrusive behaviors and low sensitivity, young children have more negative emotions and show poor attention control ability. On the contrary, mother’s positive response and warm and supportive behaviors can promote children’s effort control and have a significant predictive effect on the later stage of children’s effort control. This may be because the mother is the child’s main caregiver and bears the main responsibility of nurturing in daily life. Parent-child interaction time is longer than that of the father. Autocratic mothers have more opportunities to pay attention to and control their children’s ADHD symptoms.

2.3.2. Art Therapy. The art therapy items are mainly shown in Table 3.

Art is more useful for children whose language is not smooth enough, and art activities can provide an interesting environment for the children. In such an environment, the child treats the treatment project as a game and naturally integrates it into his/her environment. Therefore, art therapy for children with ADHD is meaningful.

2.4. Recommendations for Prevention and Treatment of ADHD

2.4.1. Developing Localized Evidence-Based Guidelines. Treatment guidelines play a vital role in the prevention and treatment of ADHD. Evidence-based guidelines based on evidence-based methods have their own outstanding advantages. There are already many evidence-based treatment guidelines for other physiological diseases in China, and it is necessary and urgent to formulate evidence-based treatment guidelines for ADHD. Foreign mature evidence-based guidelines provide reference evidence and mature treatment plans, and their concepts of evidence-based and collaboration are more worthy of reference. In the future, when formulating evidence-based guidelines in our country, we should combine localized research evidence and consider patients’ personality characteristics and preferences to formulate localized evidence-based guidelines with scientific evidence, strong feasibility, and suitable for domestic conditions.

2.4.2. Paying More Attention to the Active Participation of Families. According to foreign evidence-based guidelines, family participation is one of the most important contributors to the treatment effect and an important link that must be considered in the treatment process. As the first environmental system for individuals, the family has attracted the attention of researchers due to its unique position. The four evidence-based guidelines retrieved in this study all focus on family preference for treatment methods and the influence of the parent-child relationship on treatment results. Moreover, a large number of studies have shown that treatment methods such as group parent training programs, PBT, and PTBM have good effects on the treatment of ADHD; even for patients with severe symptoms, family participation can also play a good auxiliary role. In the future, our country should pay more attention to the active participation of families in the formulation of treatment guidelines, consider the preferences of families and patients on treatment options, give full play to the positive impact of the parent-child relationship on treatment, and help families
better manage patients’ behaviors so that patients cooperate with treatment to the greatest extent possible.

2.4.3. Constructing a Multiparty ADHD Prevention System

The treatment of ADHD is a long-term, multiparty collaborative process. At present, our country still lacks information communication and multiparty cooperation. Compared with foreign countries, domestic schools have an insufficient investment in ADHD treatment. Teachers’ understanding of ADHD, adjustment of the teaching environment, curriculum settings, treatment referral, and other aspects need to be improved.

In the future, our country should build a multiparty ADHD prevention and treatment system, emphasizing family participation; formulating school intervention plans; attaching importance to social publicity, early detection, and early treatment; establishing a collaborative system of information exchange; and integrating family, school, and society into a system framework to participate in ADHD prevention and treatment.

3. Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

Research on the Treatment of Children ADHD

3.1. Research Methods. Search is conducted in six major databases; all search deadlines are until December 2020; search terms include Chinese medicine, herbal medicine, Chinese medicine (topic), attention deficit hyperactivity disorder (topic), hyperactivity, brain dysfunction, and random; and English search terms are traditional Chinese medicine, herbal medicine, attention deficit hyperactivity disorder, hyperactivity, and brain dysfunction. The collected data have been retrieved separately according to the characteristics of different databases. The technical route is shown in Figure 2.

3.2. Data Analysis. Data analysis mainly depends on heterogeneity detection.

d_i is the individual study statistic, Var(d_i) is the variance of the statistic, Q is the chi-square statistic, and df is the degree of freedom.

The heterogeneity detection formula is as follows:

\[ I^2 = \frac{Q - df}{Q} \]

\[ Q = \sum W_i(d_i - \overline{d})^2 = \sum W_i d_i^2 - \left(\frac{\sum (W_i - d_i)^2}{\sum W_i}\right) \]  

(1)

where \( W_i \) is the weight of each study, and the weight \( W_i \) of each \( i \)-th study is calculated as follows:

\[ W_i = \frac{1}{\text{Var}(d_i)} \]  

(2)

4. Analysis of Research Results

4.1. Literature Search and Screening. After searching six databases, 959 papers were retrieved; duplicates were removed; 75 were included after initial screening by reading the title and abstract; and 55 were further screened by reading the full text to exclude nonrandomized controlled trials and interventions that did not meet and duplicate studies. Finally, 20 papers were included, and the literature screening process is shown in Figure 3.

4.2. Efficacy and Safety Analysis Results

4.2.1. Improvement of Clinical Total Effective Rate. The meta-analysis results showed that a total of 24 studies were included comparing traditional Chinese medicine and western medicine, with large heterogeneity (\( I^2 = 70\% ; P = 0.0001 \)). Using a random effect model, the total clinical effectiveness of traditional Chinese medicine and western medicine was different. It is statistically significant (RR 1.27; 95\% CI 1.20, 1.34; \( I^2 = 70\% ; n = 18 \)). A total of 6 studies were included in the comparison of traditional Chinese medicine combined with western medicine and western medicine. The total clinical effective rate was compared, and the difference was statistically significant. Significance (RR 1.18; 95\% CI 1.09, 1.28; \( I^2 = 59\% ; n = 2 \)).

4.2.2. Publication Bias. The type of intervention included in the study was compared with traditional Chinese medicine and Ritalin, and the results are shown in Figure 4.

In summary, traditional Chinese medicine has advantages in the total clinical effective rate, Conners hyperactivity index score, and reduction of clinical adverse reactions in the treatment of ADHD, especially in promoting the improvement of its overall clinical effectiveness and reducing clinical adverse reactions. It is superior to the conventional drug Ritalin and has obvious advantages in the treatment of ADHD. However, the results of the study show that in terms of the comparison of the outcome of traditional Chinese medicine treatment and Ritalin treatment, the overall clinical effective rate of the overall outcome shows that Chinese medicine treatment is due to Ritalin. The Conners hyperactivity index score shows that there is no statistical difference in the efficacy of Chinese medicine treatment and Ritalin treatment; secondly, the overall methodological bias risk of the included study is higher.
20 articles were included in the META analysis
75 remaining articles after title and abstract screening
Exclusion of duplicate literature, remaining 652 articles
20 articles were included in the META analysis

**Figure 2: Technology roadmap.**

**Figure 3: Flowchart of literature screening.**

**Figure 4: Inverted funnel diagram.**
5. Conclusion

Traditional Chinese medicine treatment of ADHD has its own characteristics and advantages in terms of clinical total effective rate and hyperactivity index score. The overall clinical syndrome differentiation of treatment can be summarized as liver and kidney yin deficiency and liver yang partial prosperity. It should be noted that in this study, the conclusions mostly come from some small-sample studies with an uncertain risk of bias. The quantity and quality of the included literature, as well as the bias that may occur during the implementation of this study, can affect the quality of this meta-evaluation. However, this cannot be denied. The positive effect of the research, that is, the efficacy of the treatment of ADHD in children cannot be ignored. In the future, this research can be improved in the following aspects: (1) expand the search database, increase the sample size, and use more objective test indicators for literature screening; (2) expand the research object to make the research more meaningful; and (3) select high-quality literature; in the treatment process, the occurrence time, symptoms, duration, severity and disappearance time of adverse events should be determined and recorded in detail so as to obtain more effective scientific evidence.

Data Availability

The data underlying the results presented in the study are available within the manuscript.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare no potential conflicts of interest.

Authors’ Contributions

All authors have seen and approved the manuscript.

References

[1] K. Koonrungsesomboon and N. Koonrungsesomboon, “The effects of methylphenidate treatment on child growth in Thai children and adolescents with attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder,” Journal of Child and Adolescent Psychopharmacology, vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 189–197, 2020.

[2] J. Lee, A. Lee, J.-H. Kim et al., “Effect of omega-3 and Korean red ginseng on children with attention hyperactivity disorder: an open-label pilot study,” Clinical Psychopharmacology and Neuroscience, vol. 18, no. 1, pp. 75–80, 2020.

[3] S. Al-Dubai, Z. J. Alnakhli, and S. Almutari, “Assessment of burden on caregivers of children with attention deficit hyperactivity disorder in Al-Madinah Saudi Arabia,” International Journal of Medical Research and Health Sciences, vol. 9, no. 11, pp. 10–17, 2020.

[4] H. Roh and B. Kim, “A brief replication study comparing stimulants and non-stimulants for attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder treatment with a focus on the compliance, efficacy, and satisfaction,” Journal of the Korean Academy of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry, vol. 32, no. 1, pp. 10–16, 2021.

[5] J. B. Liu, Z. P. Xue, L. Lin, J.-C. Xu, Y.-M. Sun, and J.-P. Lu, “Moderated mediation analysis for symptoms of attention deficit/hyperactivity disorder with the symptoms of anxiety in children,” Chinese Journal of Contemporary Pediatrics, vol. 22, no. 7, pp. 768–773, 2020.

[6] B. Aca, A. Sp, and C. Ajddb, “Relative age and attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder: data from three epidemiological cohorts and a meta-analysis,” Journal of the American Academy of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry, vol. 59, no. 8, pp. 990–997, 2020.

[7] K. J. E. van Hulzen, C. J. Scholz, B. Franke et al., “Genetic overlap between attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder and bipolar disorder: evidence from genome-wide association study meta-analysis,” Biological Psychiatry, vol. 82, no. 9, pp. 634–641, 2017.

[8] M. Hoogman, J. Bralten, D. P. Hibar, M. Mennes, M. P. Zwiens, and L. S. J. Scherweren, “Subcortical brain volume differences in participants with attention deficit hyperactivity disorder in children and adults: a cross-sectional meta-analysis,” Lancet Psychiatry, vol. 4, no. 4, pp. 310–319, 2017.

[9] B. Ustun, L. A. Adler, C. Rudin et al., “The world health organization adult attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder self-report screening scale for DSM-5,” JAMA Psychiatry, vol. 74, no. 5, pp. 520–526, 2017.

[10] V. Ly, M. Bottelier, P. J. Hoekstra, A. Arias Vasquez, J. K. Buitelaar, and N. N. Rommelse, “Elimination diets’ efficacy and mechanisms in attention deficit hyperactivity disorder and autism spectrum disorder,” European Child and Adolescent Psychiatry, vol. 26, no. 9, pp. 1067–1079, 2017.

[11] Y. Rong, C.-J. Yang, Y. Jin, and Y. Wang, “Prevalence of attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder in individuals with autism spectrum disorder: a meta-analysis,” Research in Autism Spectrum Disorders, vol. 83, no. 3, Article ID 101759, 2021.

[12] L. Weyers, M. Zemp, and G. W. Alpers, “Impaired relationships in families of children with attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder (ADHD),” Zeitschrift für Psychiologie, vol. 227, no. 1, pp. 31–41, 2019.

[13] J. Elliott, A. Johnston, D. Husereau et al., “Pharmacologic treatment of attention deficit hyperactivity disorder in adults: a systematic review and network meta-analysis,” PLoS One, vol. 15, no. 10, Article ID e0240584, 2020.

[14] Z. Yu, “Impact of physical exercise on children with attention deficit hyperactivity disorders: evidence through a meta-analysis,” Medicine, vol. 98, no. 46, Article ID e17980, 2019.

[15] A. Y. Mikami, S. Normand, K. L. Hudec et al., “Treatment of friendship problems in children with attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder: initial results from a randomized clinical trial,” Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology, vol. 88, no. 10, pp. 871–885, 2020.

[16] S. M. Ziabakhsh, M. Sharifi, J. Fath Abadi, and V. Nejati, “The effect of neurofeedback on reduction symptoms of attention deficit and hyperactivity disorder: evidence from genome-wide association study meta-analysis,” Shenakht Journal of Psychology and Psychiatry, vol. 7, no. 2, pp. 64–78, 2020.