Alvarez, Beethoven

**Verse translation of Plautus into Brazilian Portuguese: iambic senarii and trochaic septenarii in Poenulus**

*Graeco-Latina Brunensia. 2020, vol. 25, iss. 1, pp. 5-17*

ISSN 1803-7402 (print); ISSN 2336-4424 (online)

Stable URL (DOI): [https://doi.org/10.5817/GLB2020-1-1](https://doi.org/10.5817/GLB2020-1-1)
Stable URL (handle): [https://hdl.handle.net/11222.digilib/142618](https://hdl.handle.net/11222.digilib/142618)
License: CC BY-SA 4.0 International
Access Date: 17. 02. 2024
Version: 20220831

Terms of use: Digital Library of the Faculty of Arts, Masaryk University provides access to digitized documents strictly for personal use, unless otherwise specified.
Verse translation of Plautus into Brazilian Portuguese: iambic senarii and trochaic septenarii in Poenulus

Beethoven Alvarez
(Fluminense Federal University)

Abstract
For modern readers and viewers, the theater of ancient Rome is like a puzzle with many missing pieces or pieces that are very difficult to fit together. Even so, against all odds, some crucial pieces have been preserved: the dramatic texts (only a few). These texts were the theatrical scripts for performances that people on holiday in Rome over 2,000 years ago watched at wood stages. And if, on the one hand, philology appears as the science that studies these “pieces” and tries to unravel how to solve the puzzle, on the other hand, translation studies may encourage us to draw a possible image that could fit into that puzzle screen. In this complicated game of creating a new picture, I propose an exercise to reimagine one of these texts. In this paper, I intend to present some outlines of my ongoing verse translation of the comedic play Poenulus by Plautus (c. 250–184 BCE) into Brazilian Portuguese. I will talk in particular about the translation of the iambic senarii into Alexandrine lines, arguing that we can follow the 19th-century Portuguese-speaking theatrical tradition of composing and translating comedies into Alexandrine lines. With respect to the trochaic septenarii, I will outline a proposal for translating it as a composed verse, which we can call bi-heptasyllable. To conclude, I will present a translation of Poen. 53–54 to address some issues and possibilities that a textual lacuna can bring regarding the title of the play and its translation.

Keywords
Roman comedy; translation studies; literary translation; Plautus; versification

This text is an expanded version of a paper given during the conference Titus Maccius Plautus: From Page to Stage at the University of Masaryk, Brno, on the November 14, 2019. I thank my colleagues who read and proofread this text entirely or partially, namely Carolina Paganine, Vanessa Hannes and Vitor Amaral. I’m also grateful to Daniela Urbanová and all staff and students of the Departments of Classical Studies and Theater Studies at Masaryk University who brilliantly organized the conference. I must thank Giuseppe Pezzini who provided me with the necessary time at the St Andrews University to finish my translation. Lastly, a special thanks to Jessica O’Leary, who proofread the final version of this paper and has made my English looks like English, and to the anonymous reviewers for their insightful comments and suggestions.
1. First words

To begin, I would say that for modern readers (as we are) and viewers (as we can be) the theater of ancient Rome is like a puzzle with many missing pieces or pieces that are very difficult to fit together. Sometimes it resembles those Pompeian frescoes or mosaics, very colorful and capably crafted, but full of blank spaces. Even though, with many lacunas and lost pieces, some very important pieces have been preserved: the dramatic texts itself (only a few indeed).

We are acquainted with twenty-six texts by Plautus (c. 250–184 BC) and Terence (c. 195/4–159 BC), which, together with hundreds of fragments, give us a good glimpse into what Romans saw on stage more than two thousand years ago, but these texts don’t answer all of our questions.

If, on the one hand, Philology appears as the science that studies these “pieces” and tries to unravel how to solve the puzzle, on the other hand, at the same time, we have Translation Studies, that may encourage us to draw a possible (maybe imaginary) image that could fit into that puzzle screen.

In that complicated game of creating a new picture, I propose reimagining one of these ancient theatrical texts. In particular, I intend to present some outlines of my ongoing translation in verse into Brazilian Portuguese of the comedic play Poenulus by Plautus. I do not have space to explore all the features of this translation project, so I will write more specifically about the iambic senarii and the trochaic septenarii.

For this, I will present a brief history of the translations of Plautus into Portuguese to show that Plautus is rarely translated in verse. I will talk about the nineteenth-century Portuguese-speaking theatrical tradition of composing and translating comedies in Alexandrine lines, which were regarded as ordinary lines, to argue – but not exhaustively – that we can follow that tradition to translate the iambic senarii of Plautus.

I will bring forward some passages from my translation to examine how I accomplish this, by highlighting the use of Alexandrine lines, in rhyming couplets for translating the senarii of the prologue, and unrhymed lines throughout the remainder of the play.

With respect to the trochaic septenarii, although very briefly, I will outline my proposal of translating it in a composed verse, which we can call bi-heptasyllable, since it is formed by two juxtaposed heptasyllables.

---

1 Substantial parts of this paper can be found in Portuguese in Alvarez (2019).
2 The image of Philology as a puzzle-solver appears often, see, for instance, Turner (2015: p. 152).
3 The Poenulus plot is complex and twofold. It combines parts of a recognition comedy with elements of a standard intrigue (a smart slave helps a free young man who is in love with a young woman, usually in a captive or slave condition, tricking the pimp who keeps her as property and preventing the union of the couple). In the case of Poenulus, our free young man is Agorastocles, who is in love with Adelphasium, a harlot, sister of Anterastilis, both slaves of the pimp Lycus. Milphio is the clever slave who helps his young master and, at the same time, does not miss the opportunity to mock his love affairs. Key comments on Poenulus are found in Gratwick (1968) and Moodie (2015).
4 I also supervise postgraduate students who pursue the same translation project. Heloize Moreira works with Terence’s Heauton Timorumenos and Renan Rodriguez is translating Plautus’s Aulularia.
To finish the paper, I will present a translation of *Poen.* 53–54 to address some issues and possibilities that a textual lacuna can bring us regarding the title of the play and its translation.

2. Brief history of translation of Plautus into Portuguese

The first translation of Plautus into Portuguese was undertaken rather belatedly at the end of the nineteenth century, in 1888, by João Cardoso de Meneses e Sousa (1827–1915), better known as Barão de (Baron of) Paranapiacaba (hereafter just Barão). Curiously, this translation was undertaken and published in Brazil (in Rio de Janeiro), not in Portugal, as one might expect.

We know through Barão’s testimony that it was the first Portuguese translation of Plautus: “It is, I believe, the first trial that has been made of Roman theater. Scarce are its literary virtues, but it represents a patient effort to translate into vernacular language the models of the ancient art.”

Oddly, after that effort, it was only in 1952, 64 years later, that another translation of Plautus appears in Portuguese: the well-known Agostinho da Silva’s prose translation of *Amphitruo*, *Aulularia*, *Captiui* and *Curculio*. After that publication, the twentieth century saw many translations of Plautus in prose, 24 in total, as can be seen with details in Table (1) at the end of this paper.

The “golden age” for the translation of Plautus into Portuguese was actually the beginning of the twenty-first century. In less than 20 years, there has already been 15 new translations, with this number likely to increase in the near future.

Among these, I would like to highlight the translation of *Amphitruo*, undertaken by Leandro Cardoso, in 2012. According to him, it is a translation “in verse that can recreate the metrical structures [of Latin]”.

Cardoso’s translation is the first attempt to resume a practice of translating Plautine comedy in verse, more than 120 years later after Barão’s endeavor.

---

5 For a more detailed history of Plautine translation in Brazil, see Rodriguez & Alvarez (2020, forthcoming).
6 Naudet made a list of translations of *Plauti comediae* into many languages from the beginning of the sixteenth century up to about 1830, including Spanish, Belgian and Danish, but did not make any mention of a Portuguese translation (Naudet 1832: pp. 638–641).
7 It is worth remembering that Brazil, since 1822 when it “won” its independence from Portugal, was, at that time, an Empire. Moreover, 1888 was just one year before the military coup which established the Republic of Brazil, a Republic which suffered at least more five coups in less than a century and endured one more in 2016.
8 Barão de Paranapiacaba (1888: p. 4).
9 It is important to draw attention to the fact that it was only in 2014 that we could read, in Portuguese, all the twenty Plautine plays when translations of *Trinummus* and *Mostellaria* were finally published (even today, we still do not have a translation of *Vidularia*).
10 Cardoso’s rhythmic translation, which seeks correspondence between Latin heavy syllables and stressed syllables in Portuguese, is very effective at transposing formal elements of the Latin lines. See Cardoso (2012: pp. 11–21). Using the same procedure, I know that soon will be published a Portuguese translation of Terence’s *Adelphoe*, by Rodrigo Gonçalves.
Here, I suppress a long discussion about literary translation by simply quoting Haroldo de Campos, a prolific and recognized Brazilian poet, translator and theorist of Translation Studies in order to state the importance of pursuing a poetic approach in transposing Plautine text:

What is essential [in translation] is not the reconstitution of the message, but the reconstitution of the sign system in which this message is embedded, of aesthetic information, not merely semantic information. That is why Walter Benjamin sustains that bad translation [...] is characterized by being the simple transmission of the message of the original, that is: ‘the inaccurate transmission of an unessential content’.\(^\text{11}\)

Trying to do just that, that is, translating Plautus in verse into Portuguese, but, this time, unlike Cardoso, who tried to create a kind of line whose metrical structure could emulate that of Latin, I propose to use our poetical and theatrical tradition to select some line forms as equivalent to those Latin lines. For that, I need to return to Barão’s translation.

3. The nineteenth-century Portuguese theater tradition

I quote Gonçalves & Flores (2014), who very clearly explain that:

“Barão de Paranapiacaba ... in his translation of Aulularia, [...] chose three basic models of rhythmic composition that come from the Portuguese poetic tradition: dodecassílabos [Alexandrines], decassílabos [decasyllables, equivalent to the iambic pentameter] and redondilhas maiores [a seven-syllable line from folk poetry, or an heptasyllable], all of them rhymed and alternating every scene.”\(^\text{12}\)

In (3.1) we can see the first twelve lines from Aulularia prologue in Barão’s translation and in (3.2) my English translation of it\(^\text{13}\) (in 3.3 and 3.4 I present De Melo’s Latin text and translation):

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|l|l|}
\hline
(3.1) Barão de Paranapiacaba’s 1888 translation & (3.2) English translation (of 3.1) \\
\hline
Para que não se estranhe o achar-me aqui presente, & Lest you be surprised to encounter me being here, \\
Eu vou dizer quem sou sucinta e brevemente. & I tell you who I am in a way that is clear. \\
Da casa, cujo umbral acabo de transpor; & From the house, whose threshold o’er there I’ve just came, \\
Eu sou o Deus do lar, o Nume guardador. & I’m the Keeper Deity, House God, Lar is my name. \\
Muitos anos já faz que em toda esta família & Since many, many years over all this family I keep \\
Exerço protetora e perenal vigília; & A protective vigil, constantly, with no sleep; \\
Sou Deus familiar de quem hoje ali mora, & I’m the familiar god of who lives there today, \\
Como fui de seu pai e avô paterno outrora. & And of father and of grandfather the same way. \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

\(^{11}\) Campos (1969: p. 100). About Campos and his ideas, in Polish, see Borowski (2012).

\(^{12}\) Gonçalves & Flores (2014: p. 152).

\(^{13}\) I will not discuss the English translation in detail, but I point out that I have tried to use Alexandrine lines, in rhymed couplets, to emulate the translated lines in Portuguese, so that English readers may have a better idea of how it works.
I would like to comment on the use of Alexandrine lines (the use of rhymes will be addressed later). The presence of the Portuguese decassílabos (the iambic pentameter equivalent) and redondilhas (the seven-syllable line) was common in poetry and in theater at that time, but the Alexandrine was an innovation.

Machado de Assis\(^{14}\) (1839–1908), the most acclaimed Brazilian author, wrote a short satirical play called *Deuses de Casaca* (*The Gods Who Wear Dress-Coats*) in 1866, and through his prologue (3.5 and 3.6) we can understand why the Alexandrine lines were used in a translation of Plautus:

\(^{14}\) A new and clever overall view of Machado’s oeuvre can be seen in Rocha (2015).
Assis also explains that he “made his gods speak in Alexandrine verse” because “it was the most appropriate” which is to say that they were appropriate to evoke the simple speech because they were regarded as ordinary lines.\textsuperscript{15}

So, I mostly borrow from here the idea of translating the Plautus’ iambic senarii in Alexandrine lines, since the iambic senarii are normally used in spoken passages without musical accompaniment and are considered to be closer to casual speech.\textsuperscript{16}

Translating iambic senarii into Alexandrine lines finds echo in English tradition according to Sonnenschein’s words: “The corresponding English metre [to iambic senarii] is the ‘Alexandrine’ [...] which is spoken of as long and slow in contrast to the five-foot iambic line commonly used in English blank verse.” (Sonnenschein 1902: p. 164).

\textbf{4. My current procedure: the iambic senarii of the prologue}\textsuperscript{17}

Below, I present the beginning of the \textit{Poenulus} prologue (lines 1–10) that I have translated in Alexandrine rhymed couplets as Barão and Assis have done before (4.1):

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{|l|l|}
\hline
(4.1) Portuguese translation & (4.2) English translation (of 4.1) \\
\hline
O Aquiles de Aristarco me apraz relembrar. & The tragedy \textit{Achilles} by Aristarchus I wish to remember here for taking my start by: \\
Daí dessa tragédia, o início vou tomar: & “Be silent, be quiet and all attention pay!
“Silenciai, e calai, e prestai toda atenção! & Hear those orders by the commander of”... the play; \\
Que ouçais vos ordena o General”... Histrião! & Sit down e’ery one in your seats so you aren’t beaten,
Sentem-se em seus lugares, todos bem tranqulos, & 5 those who have come hungry and those who’ve come “eaten”:
& who ate did very well, you are quite able,
o que veio faminto e o que veio comido: & although who already had food ready at home,
 quem comeu fez muitíssimo bem, foi sagaz, & just because of us, it’s stupidity havin’ come.
quem não comeu se farte de historinha em paz, & 10
mas quem tinha comida preparada em casa, & 5
é estupidez vir com fome por nossa causa. & 10
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{15} Assis (1866: p. viii). The quotation goes on: “This Alexandrine verse has its opponents, even among men of taste, but it is believed that it will eventually be estimated and cultivated by all Brazilian and Portuguese muses. This will be the victory of the efforts of the illustrious author of the ‘Epistles to the Empress’ ['Epístolas à Imperatriz', namely António Feliciano de Castilho] who so patiently and clearly has domesticated the Alexandrine verse in the language of Garrett and Gonzaga [i.e. Portuguese language].”

\textsuperscript{16} As Richlin also reminds us: “We do not really have enough evidence to understand fully how these meters were used, but the evidence suggests that there were three modes of utterance in the plays: speech, recitative, and song.” See Moore (1998, 2012), as well as Beare (1964: pp. 219–32) and Habinek (2005). A comprehensive account on the subject can be found in Moore (2012).

\textsuperscript{17} It is also important to mention that in my practice I often collate the translations of Gregoris into Spanish (López Gregoris 2010) and Brandão’s into Portuguese (Brandão 2009).
Beethoven Alvarez

**Verse translation of Plautus into Brazilian Portuguese: iambic senarii and trochaic septenarii ...**

| Latin text (ed. De Melo 2012) | De Melo’s translation |
|--------------------------------|-----------------------|
| Ἀχιλλείμι τῷ Αἰστραρχῷ συνεχίζω | I wish to rehearse the Achilles by Aristarchus; from there, from that tragedy, I’ll take my beginning: “be silent and be quiet and pay attention; you are ordered to listen by the commander of” ... actors; |
| ind’ mihi principium capiam, ex ea tragoedia, | 5 | (5) and both those who’ve come hungry and those who’ve come full should sit on their benches with goodwill. You who have eaten have behaved far more wisely. You who haven’t eaten, fill yourselves with tales: it’s great folly for a man who has something that he could eat (10) to come to sit without breakfast for our sake. |
| “sileteque et tacete atque animum aduortite, | 10 |
| audire iubet uos imperator” ... histricus, | |
| bonoque ut animo sedeant in subselliis | |
| et qui esurientes et qui saturi uenerint: | |
| qui edistis, multo fecistis sapientius, | |
| qui non edistis, saturi fie fabulis; | |
| nam quo paratum est quod edit, nostra gratia | |
| nimia est stultitia sessum impransum incedere. | |

I have explained why I use Alexandrine lines, but the use of rhyme (especially in couplets) might be controversial, as Amy Richlin (2005: p. 51) recalls:

“The meters are somewhat difficult to translate into English equivalents, though. And the plays were in meter almost throughout – though not rhymed; rhyme was not part of Roman poetry.” (my emphasis)

However, I consider that this latter statement is at least debatable. Following Eva Guggenheimer’s (1972) *Rhyme effects and rhyming figures: A comparative study of sound repetitions in the classics with emphasis on Latin poetry*, we now know that rhyme effects were part of the conventional repertory of figures of sound repetition in ancient poetry and, moreover, that they occur in regular patterns.

Furthermore, when thinking about translating Plautus for modern readers and viewers who can easily recognize rhymes as a poetical feature, I argue that we can employ rhyme to enhance the poetical ethos of the text.

Erich Segal in his well-known English translation of Plautus’s *Miles Gloriosus* and *Menaechmi* (in the prologue) uses rhymes as well. He explains: “I added them where they could have been used in analogous situations on the English-speaking stage. The prologues are an obvious example.” Janet Burroway has done the same in her translation of the prologue of *The Little Carthaginian*. Burroway’s translation dates back to 1970 and is known to have sought a poetic voice.

Thus, following *bonorum exemplum* (as Terence once wrote), I have translated all 128 lines of the *Poenulus* prologue in Alexandrine rhymed couplets.

But iambic senarii occur not only in prologues, they are also used in a number of

---

18 Richlin herself (2005: p. 51) translated “the songs in Iran Man into rhymed rap”. To which she added: “all I can say is that this kind of thing, though it seemed worth a try here, is funnier when you do not also have to translate Latin as closely as possible”.

19 Segal (1996: p. xli).

20 Burroway (1995: pp. 7–12).

21 Richlin (2005: p. 9).

22 See Alvarez (2019).
other passages. In *Poenuslus*, besides the prologue, many scenes were written in iambic senarii for a total of 715 lines.²³

I translate these spoken passages throughout the play in Alexandrine lines without rhymes, as we can see an example (4.5 and 4.6) in the next passage, lines 129–137:

| (4.5) Portuguese translation | (4.6) English translation (of 4.5) |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| AGO. São muitas, Milphio, as ordens que te dou, 130 | AGO. Many are, Milphio, the orders I give you, all of them uncertain, flaw’d, often meaningless, and you, always so smart, alert, always so right, perform them mindfully and with such brilliance. That’s why I must say for your own good that I owe you your freedom and thankfully thank you very much. MIL. The popular saying then comes in handy now. These soft words of yours are indeed just what they call monkey talk, lullaby, bullshit, just blah blah blah. |
| incertas, falhas, muitas vezes sem sentido, e você, sempre esperto, alerta, tão certo, as executa atento e com tanto esplendor. | |
| Por isso mesmo devo dizer que te devo a liberdade e, muito grato, um obrigado. 135 | |
| MIL. O dito popular vem a calhar agora. | |
| Essas palavras moles são o que se chama conversinha pra boi dormir, só bla-bla-blá. | |

I must point out that most of the time I try to keep or recreate several figures of speech, such as alliterations, repetitions, accumulations, parallelisms and homeoteleutons, and I also attempt to emulate word plays, puns and jokes so they may work without many explanations.

5. *Poenuslus* lines 359–364: trochaic septenarii

Regarding the trochaic septenarii, I will outline my proposal of translating it in a composed verse, which we can call bi-heptasyllable since it is formed by two juxtaposed heptasyllables.

In Portuguese, one heptasyllable is a verse also known as *redondilha maior*. Each *redondilha* is one hemistychium of this composed bi-heptasyllable. Depending on the type of caesura, or the end of the line, which can be feminine or masculine, each hemistychium can have 7 or 8 syllables, resulting in a long verse that varies between 14 and 16 syllables, as in:

²³ Lines 129–209, 410–503, 615–816, 930–1173, 1304–1397. If we count 1–128 (of the prologue), there are 843 iambic senarii, which means approximately 60% of the lines in *Poenuslus*. 
Verse translation of Plautus into Brazilian Portuguese: iambic senarii and trochaic septenarii …

Ai das Rainhas sem corte, das destronadas Rainhas! (Engénio de Castro)²⁴

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 (8) 9 10 11 12 13 14 15

In English, for example, a similar verse, with seven-and-a-half trochaic feet, has already been suggested as the equivalent of the trochaic septenarius by Sonnenschein (1902: p. 166):

Alma, roll those waters proudly, proudly roll them to the sea. (Richard Trench)

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 (8) 9 10 11 12 13 14 15

Using an heptasyllable to translate Plautus’s lines is not a complete innovation, since Barão has done it before, but the nineteenth-century translator did not create a real equivalent between the Portuguese seven-feet line and the septenarii as neither has sought isomorphism in terms of the quantity of lines.

In my translation, I have tried to ensure that bi-heptasyllables are only used to translate the trochaic septenarii and in a 1:1 proportion, as we can see in (5.1 and 5.2):

(5.1) Portuguese translation in bi-heptasyllables
AGO. Ok. ADE. Você não é justo | comigo, tudo era só ilusão,
promete mundos e fundos: | solta palavras aos ventos. 360
joure me libertar mil | vezes, não foi uma não:
te esperando fico aqui, | aumentando os sofrimentos,
e tuas promessas nada; | sirvo a mesma servidão.

(5.2) English translation (of 5.1) in trochaic septenarii (with spondeus in some feet)
AGO. Ók. ADE. Yóu are nót fáir, néver,| áll was fálsehood át the énd,
áye you prómise éarth and héaven: | bút it wás just wórds ín the wínds. 360
cóuntless tímes you’ve swóre to frée me, | yés, it wás not ónly ónce:
wáiting fór you Í’m a sérvant, | lónely Í’m incréase my páins,
ând your prómises wórth but nóthing; | hére I sérve still bóund in cháins.

(5.3) Latin text (ed. De Melo 2012)
AGO non faciam. ADE non aequos in me es, sed morare et male facis.
bene promittis multa ex multis: omnia in cassum cadunt. 360
liberare iurauisti me hau semel sed centiens:
dum te exspecto, neque ego usquam aliam mihi paraui copiam
neque istuc usquam appareit; ita nunc seruo nihilo minus.

(5.4) De Melo’s translation
AGO I won’t do so.
ADE (to Agorastocles) You aren’t fair towards me, but you waste my time and treat me badly.
(360) You make a lot of nice promises one after another; they all come to nothing. Not once,

²⁴ This line is quoted by Carvalho (1965). The same line is quoted by Chociay (1974) and Andrade (2014: p. 178). This means that this kind of line is somewhat rare in the Portuguese tradition. It is not within the scope of this paper to present a more detailed study on this observation, but I plan to do so on another occasion in the future.
but a hundred times you’ve sworn to free me. While I was waiting for you, I didn’t acquire any
other support for myself anywhere and your promise never materializes. So now I’m just as
much a slave as I was before.

It is noticeable that there are some rhymes in these lines (even in English). There are
almost 450 trochaic septenarii in the Poenulus, it would be monotonous and overly artifi-
cial if all these lines were rhymed, but for some moments I judged that rhymes could be
useful to elevate the emotional tone of certain passages. I do it here and there, but not
so often, because mostly what is important are the constraints of the line that impose
difficulties that per se can enhance poetic expressiveness.

6. The title: the little Punic?

Coming to the end of this paper, I would like to present my translation of Poen. 53–54,
a passage in which some editors see a lacuna (6.1 and the lacunar translation in 6.2).

Using the same puzzle metaphor from the beginning, I would like to highlight that I
myself have ventured into the practice of putting a new piece in that game and filled that
lacuna in the process (6.3 and 6.4):

| (6.1) Latin text (ed. De Melo 2012) | (6.2) De Melo’s translation |
|------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| Karχηδόνως uocatur haec comoedia; | This comedy is called Karchedonios; in Latin uncle |
| ***                               | porridge-eater Plautus ***. |
| latine Plautus patruos pultiphagonides. | 53 |

| (6.3) Portuguese translation | (6.4) English translation (of 6.3) |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Cartaginês, Karchedonios se chama, em grego, | The “Carthaginian Guy”, “Karchedonios” in Greek, 53 |
| a comédia: [não é isso nenhum segredo,] | is the comedy’s name: [and this is no secret!] 53t |
| mas o títio Plauto Gororoba [quis] | but uncle “Grub-Eater” Plautus [has been willing, 54 |
| que se chamasse então Poenulus,] em latim; | by the way, calls that play “Poenulus” in Latin, 54t |
| [não satisfeito, nosso sem-vergonha Alvarez | [not satisfied with it, our shameless Alvarez 54t1 |
| “Punicozinho” quer chamá-la em português.] | “Punicozinho”, yes, calls it in Português.] 54t2 |

[ ] Square brackets and numbered lines with -t denote translator inserts

In Latin, as we know, Poenulus is the diminutive of Poenus, which is an ethnonym that
designates the Western Phoenicians, who are people from Carthage, the biggest rival
city of Rome. But unlike Carthaginiensis, Carthaginian, the word Poenus can carry a de-
famatory and pejorative meaning.25

“Punicozinho” means in Portuguese “the little Punic”, or, with no perceptive dif-
fERENCE, “the little Carthaginian”, but, if instead of saying “punic-zinho”, as usual pronun-
ciation would require, one said “puni-cozinho”, it would create a very different possibility
of meaning, since “-cozinho” sounds in Portuguese like a vulgar word, “little asshole”.

25 A good approach on criticism about a possible anti-Punic (or not) attitude in Plautus treatment of the
Carthaginian character Hanno is Stamato (2012).
The adjective “púnico” (Punic) is not trivial, which should cause some difficulty to a reader less familiar with the history of Roman wars, but I believe that the sound effect caused by this -cozinho at the end of the word “Punicozinho” is clearly meant as a joke, which in English could sound like “the Little ‘Asshole’ Punic Guy” or, less vulgar and wittier, “The Little but Whole Punic”.\textsuperscript{26}

It is not to be imagined that this has recovered any trace of insult or defamatory insinuation (if there was any in the Latin play), neither does it occur to me that any other denomination could achieve that in Brazilian Portuguese; so I prefer the infamous joke to make people laugh, even though I might lose some friends along the way.

Appendix

Table (1)
The table below lists only first editions of each translation. Although it may contain any minor lapse or incompleteness, I believe that it can be a tool of great value for anyone interested in a history of the translation of Plautus. Books and dissertations listed here not necessarily appear in the bibliography section below since they are not quoted throughout the paper. For more details, see Rodriguez & Alvarez (2020, forthcoming).

| 1st ed | play       | translator                   | pt/br\textsuperscript{27} | description                                         |
|--------|------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|
| 19th century |
| 1888  | Aulularia  | Barão de Paranapiacaba       | br                        | verses in vernacular Portuguese                      |
| 20th century |
| 1952  | Amphitruo  | Agostinho da Silva           | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1952  | Aulularia  | Agostinho da Silva           | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1952  | Captiui    | Agostinho da Silva           | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1952  | Curculio   | Agostinho da Silva           | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1967  | Aulularia  | Aída Costa                   | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1968  | Miles Gloriosus | Carlos Alberto L. Fonseca | pt                        | prose                                               |
| 1975  | Menaechmi  | Diógenes de Araújo Netto and José Venâncio Ferreira | br | have not accessed |
| 1977  | Bacchides  | Newton Belleza               | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1978  | Amphitruo  | Carlos Alberto L. Fonseca   | pt                        | prose                                               |
| 1978  | Captiui    | Jaime Bruna                  | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1978  | Curculio   | Walter de Sousa Medeiros     | pt                        | prose                                               |
| 1978  | Curculio   | Jaime Bruna                  | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1978  | Menaechmi  | Jaime Bruna                  | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1978  | Miles Gloriosus | Jaime Bruna | br | prose |
| 1978  | Rudens     | Jaime Bruna                  | br                        | prose                                               |
| 1980  | Epidicus   | Walter de Sousa Medeiros     | pt                        | prose                                               |
| 1981  | Amphitruo  | Otávio T. de Brito           | br                        | have not accessed                                   |

\textsuperscript{26} I take “Punic Guy” from Richlin (2005: p. 4) and “but Whole” comes from a suggestion from Guilherme Duque, inspired by the title of an Ubisoft 2017 video game called \textit{South Park: The Fractured But Whole}.  

\textsuperscript{27} It denotes where the translation was published: (br) in Brazil and (pt) in Portugal.
Beethoven Alvarez

Verse translation of Plautus into Brazilian Portuguese: iambic senarii and trochaic septenarii ...

| 1st ed | play        | translator                        | pt/br | description                          |
|--------|-------------|----------------------------------|-------|--------------------------------------|
| 1983   | Menaechmi   | Carlos Alberto L. Fonseca        | pt    | prose                                |
| 1985   | Aulularia   | Walter de Medeiros               | pt    | prose                                |
| 1995   | Menaechmi   | José Dejalma Dezotti             | br    | prose (for dramatic reading)         |
| 1996   | Aulularia   | José Dejalma Dezotti             | br    | prose (for dramatic reading)         |
| 1999   | Miles Gloriosus | José Dejalma Dezotti          | br    | prose (for dramatic reading)         |
| 1999   | Miles Gloriosus | ?                                | pt    | have not accessed                    |
| 1999   | Persa       | Maria Isabel R Gonçalves         | pt    | prose                                |

21st century

| 2003   | Asinaria    | Aires Pereira do Couto           | pt    | prose                                |
| 2004   | Cistellaria | Aires Pereira do Couto           | pt    | prose (FESTEA)                       |
| 2006   | Captiui     | Helena Costa Toipa               | pt    | prose                                |
| 2006   | Casina      | Aires Pereira do Couto           | pt    | prose                                |
| 2006   | Stichus     | Isabella Tardin Cardoso           | br    | prose (from masters diss.)           |
| 2007   | Mercator    | Damares Barbosa Correia           | br    | prose (masters diss.)                |
| 2009   | Poenulus    | José Luís Brandão                | pt    | prose (FESTEA)                       |
| 2010   | Truculentus | Adriano Milho Cordeiro           | pt/br | prose (from masters diss.)           |
| 2012   | Amphitruo   | Leandro Cardoso                  | br    | rhythmic verses (masters diss.)      |
| 2013   | Amphitruo   | Lilian Nunes da Costa             | br    | prose (from masters diss.)           |
| 2013   | Casina      | Carol Rocha                      | br    | prose (from masters diss.)           |
| 2014   | Mostellaria | Reina Marisol Troca Pereira      | pt/br | prose                                |
| 2014   | Trinummus   | Reina Marisol Troca Pereira      | pt/br | prose                                |
| 2017   | Mercator    | Aires Pereira do Couto           | pt/br | prose                                |

Bibliography

Alvarez, B. B. (2019). Traduzindo Plauto em verso: o prólogo de Poenulus. In C. Paganine, & V. Hannes (Eds.), Tradução e Criação: Entrelançamentos. Campinas: Pontes.

Andrade, T. B. da C. (2014). A arte de Aristófanes: estudo poético e tradução d’As Rãs. Dissertação (Mestrado em Letras Clássicas). São Paulo: Universidade do Estado de São Paulo.

Assis, M. de (1866). Os deuses de casaca. Rio de Janeiro: Tipografia do Imperial Instituto Artístico. Barão de Paranapiacaba (Transl.). (1888). Plauto: A Marmita. Rio de Janeiro: Typographia Chrysalida.

Beare, W. (1964). The Roman Stage: A Short History of Latin Drama in the Time of the Republic (3rd ed.). London: Methuen.

Borowski, G. (2012). Transkreacja: myśl przekładowa Haroldo de Camposa. Przekładaniec, 26, 87–107.

Brandão, J. L. (Transl.). (2009). Plauto: O fulaninho de Cartago. Coimbra: CECH-FESTEA.

Burroway, J. (1995). The Little Carthaginian (Poenulus). In D. R. Slavitt, & P. Bovie (Eds.), Plautus: The Comedies (Vol. III). Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Campos, H. (1969). A Arte no Horizonte do Provável e Outros Ensaios. São Paulo: Perspectiva.

Cardoso, L. D. (2012). A Vez do Verso: Estudo e Tradução do Amphitruo, de Plauto. Dissertação (Mestrado em Letras) – Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras, UFPR. Paraná.

Carvalho, A. de (1965). Tratado de versificação portuguesa (2nd ed.). Lisboa: Portugália.

Chociay, R. (1974). Teoria do Verso. São Paulo: McGraw-Hill.
Beethoven Alvarez

Verse translation of Plautus into Brazilian Portuguese: iambic senarii and trochaic septenarii ...

De Melo, W. (Ed. & Transl.). (2012). *Plautus: The Little Carthaginian. Pseudolus. The Rope*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Gonçalves, R. T., & Flores, G. G. (2014). Polimetria Latina em Português. *Revista Letras*, 89, 147–172.

Gratwick, A. (1968). *The Poenulus of Plautus and its Attic original*. Thesis (Ph.D.). Oxford: University of Oxford.

Guggenheimer, E. H. (1972). *Rhyme Effects and Rhyming Figures: A comparative study of sound repetitions in the classics with emphasis on Latin poetry*. The Hague: Mouton.

Habinek, T. N. (2005). *The World of Roman Song: From Ritualized Speech to Social Order*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

López Gregoris, R. (Transl.). (2010). *Plauto: El ladino cartaginés*. Madrid: Cátedra.

Moodie, E. K. (2015). *Plautus’ Poenulus: a student commentary*. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press.

Moore, T. J. (1998). *Music and Structure in Roman Comedy*. *The American Journal of Philology*, 119(2), 245–273.

Moore, T. J. (2012). *Music in Roman Comedy*. Cambridge – New York: Cambridge University Press.

Naudet, J. (Ed.). (1832). *Plautus: Comoediae* (Vol. 3). Parisiis: Nicolaus Eligius Lemaire.

Richlin, A. (2005). *Rome and the mysterious Orient: three plays by Plautus*. California: University of California Press.

Rocha, J. C. de C. (2015). *Machado de Assis: Toward a Poetics of Emulation*. Michigan: Michigan State University Press.

Rodriguez, R. C., & Alvarez, B. B. (2020, forthcoming). Plauto brasileiro: Breve história das traduções da comédia latina de Plauto no Brasil. *Tradução em Revista*, 28 (accepted).

Segal, E. (Transl.). (1996). *Plautus: Four comedies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Sonnenschein, E. A. (1902). *Plautus: Rudens*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Stamato, P. (2012). *Reception of Hanno in Plautus’ Poenulus: Punic Right to Ascendency* [retrieved 18.04.2020 from https://www.academia.edu/3499524/Reception_of_Hanno_in_Plautus_Poenulus].

Turner, J. (2015). *Philology: The Forgotten Origins of the Modern Humanities*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

---

**Beethoven Alvarez** / balvarez@id.uff.br

Departamento de Letras Clássicas e Vernáculas

Universidade Federal Fluminense (UFF), Instituto de Letras

Campus do Gragoatá, Bloco C, Niterói, RJ, Brazil

---

This work can be used in accordance with the Creative Commons BY-SA 4.0 International license terms and conditions (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/legalcode). This does not apply to works or elements (such as image or photographs) that are used in the work under a contractual license or exception or limitation to relevant rights.
