Clinical and Rehabilitative Predictors of Peak Oxygen Uptake Following Cardiac Transplantation

Katelyn E. Uithoven 1,*, Joshua R. Smith 2, Jose R. Medina-Inojosa 2, Ray W. Squires 2, Erik H. Van Iterson 3 and Thomas P. Olson 2

1 School of Kinesiology, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN 55455, USA
2 Division of Preventive Cardiology, Department of Cardiovascular Medicine, Mayo Clinic, Rochester, MN 55905, USA; smith.joshua1@mayo.edu (J.R.S.); medinainojosa.jose@mayo.edu (J.R.M.-I.); squires.ray@mayo.edu (R.W.S.); olson.thomas2@mayo.edu (T.P.O.)
3 Section of Preventive Cardiology and Rehabilitation, Cleveland Clinic, Cleveland, OH 44195, USA; vanitee@ccf.org
* Correspondence: nyber131@umn.edu; Tel.: 763-486-2913

Received: 21 December 2018; Accepted: 16 January 2019; Published: 19 January 2019

Abstract: The measurement of peak oxygen uptake (VO\textsubscript{2peak}) is an important metric for evaluating cardiac transplantation (HTx) eligibility. However, it is unclear which factors (e.g., recipient demographics, clinical parameters, cardiac rehabilitation (CR) participation) influence VO\textsubscript{2peak} following HTx. Consecutive HTx patients with cardiopulmonary exercise testing (CPET) between 2007–2016 were included. VO\textsubscript{2peak} was measured from CPET standard protocol. Regression analyses determined predictors of the highest post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} (i.e., quartile 4: VO\textsubscript{2peak} > 20.1 mL/kg/min). One hundred-forty HTx patients (women: \( n = 41 \) (29%), age: 52 ± 12 years, body mass index (BMI): 27 ± 5 kg/m\(^2\)) were included. History of diabetes (Odds Ratio (OR): 0.17, 95% Confidence Interval (CI): 0.04–0.77, \( p = 0.021 \)), history of dyslipidemia (OR: 0.42, 95% CI: 0.19–0.93, \( p = 0.032 \)), BMI (OR: 0.90, 95% CI: 0.82–0.99, \( p = 0.022 \)), hemoglobin (OR: 1.29, 95% CI: 1.04–1.61, \( p = 0.020 \)), white blood cell count (OR: 0.81, 95% CI: 0.66–0.98, \( p = 0.033 \)), CR exercise sessions (OR: 1.10, 95% CI: 1.04–1.15, \( p < 0.001 \)), and pre-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} (OR: 1.17, 95% CI: 1.07–1.29, \( p = 0.001 \)) were significant predictors. Multivariate analysis showed CR exercise sessions (OR: 1.10, 95% CI: 1.03–1.16, \( p = 0.002 \)), and pre-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} (OR: 1.16, 95% CI: 1.04–1.30, \( p = 0.007 \)) were independently predictive of higher post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak}. Pre-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} and CR exercise sessions are predictive of a greater VO\textsubscript{2peak} following HTx. These data highlight the importance of CR exercise session attendance and pre-HTx fitness in predicting VO\textsubscript{2peak} post-HTx.

Keywords: peak oxygen uptake; cardiopulmonary exercise testing; cardiac rehabilitation; exercise capacity; postoperative care

1. Introduction

Peak oxygen uptake (VO\textsubscript{2peak}) is an important metric for cardiac transplantation (HTx) eligibility. The measurement of exercise capacity using VO\textsubscript{2peak} obtained from cardiopulmonary exercise testing (CPET) is one criteria used for determination of transplant eligibility; with a value of \( \leq 14 \text{ mL/kg/min} \) considered transplant eligible [1–5]. The association between higher VO\textsubscript{2peak} and reduced hospitalizations and mortality risk has been shown in both the heart failure (HF) and HTx population, with even modest improvements in VO\textsubscript{2peak} associated with improved outcomes [6–9]. Because of this, investigating demographic and clinical factors that are predictive of post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} has significant implications not only for functional capacity but also long-term survival.
Previous studies have investigated demographic and clinical determinants of VO2peak in various populations [10–18]. For example, the predictive influence of age, sex, and body mass index (BMI) on VO2peak has been shown in healthy populations [16,17]. In HTx patients, these variables have also been shown to be prominent predictors of post-HTx VO2peak along with chronotropic reserve, donor age, and time from HTx [11,13,14,18]. However, a limitation of these previous studies is the small sample sizes used (n = 60–95) [11,13,14,18]. In addition, recent work has indicated that participation in cardiac rehabilitation (CR) in HTx postoperative care has been shown to be related to improvements in VO2peak [15,19,20]; however, it is unclear if CR participation is predictive of a greater VO2peak following HTx.

Therefore, the purpose of this study was to investigate whether pre-HTx clinical characteristics and/or postoperative CR exercise session attendance provide utility in predicting VO2peak following HTx. Based on previous studies on the relationship between CR involvement and VO2peak [15,19,20], we hypothesize that CR will surpass other predictive factors of post-HTx VO2peak in HTx patients.

2. Experimental Section

2.1. Participants and Study Design

A retrospective, single-center study cohort design evaluated consecutive adult HTx patients who performed symptom-limited CPET prior to HTx (pre-HTx) and following HTx (post-HTx) between the years of 2007–2016. Demographic and clinical characteristics were obtained from an institutional database. Inclusion criteria included completion of pre-HTx CPET within 24 months prior to procedural date and post-HTX CPET within 1-year of HTx. Patients were excluded if they lacked CR exercise session data or had incomplete CPET data. Of the 204 HTx patients, 140 were analyzed in this study (Figure 1). This study was approved by the Mayo Clinic Institutional Review Board (IRB #15-007965) and followed research authorization protocol for the use of medical records as required by the state of Minnesota [21].

![Flowchart for patient inclusion and exclusion.](image)

**Figure 1.** Flowchart for patient inclusion and exclusion. Of the initially identified 204 HTx patients, 54 patients lacked a pre-HTx or post-HTx CPET, 2 patients had incomplete CPET data, and 8 patients were lacking CR exercise session data, resulting in 140 patients for study analysis. HTx, cardiac transplantation; CPET, cardiopulmonary exercise testing.

2.2. Clinical Characteristics

Clinical baseline information from the time of HTx procedural date was obtained via medical record extraction. Demographic data along with previous disease history, previous left ventricular assist device (LVAD), current laboratory measurements (i.e., hemoglobin, hematocrit, white blood cell count, and creatinine), indication for HTx (i.e., restrictive cardiomyopathy, dilated cardiomyopathy, hypertrophic cardiomyopathy, ischemic cardiomyopathy, or other), and pre-HTx medication status for the following: angiotensin-converting enzyme (ACE) inhibitor, amiodarone, aspirin, beta blocker, calcium channel blocker, and diuretic were extracted from the procedural sedation assessment at the time of HTx. For the purpose of monitoring data correctness, two investigators independently reviewed a random sampling of medical record charts.
2.3. Cardiac Rehabilitation Participation

Patients included in this study were referred for CR participation and attended at least one documented session following HTx. Medical records were examined to determine CR attendance specifically relating to postoperative HTx care versus CR for any cardiac-related event. As the initial visit for CR typically involves orientation procedures with little to no exercise involvement, this was not assessed in this study. Only those CR sessions with documented exercise participation were included for analysis. All exercise sessions were supervised throughout activity by clinical exercise physiologists with cardiologist oversight. During the course of CR participation patients performed 20–45 min of aerobic activity in a monitored setting, with the usual addition of strength training components for 10–15 min. In addition to CR attendance patients were encouraged to partake in light to moderate physical activity for at least 30 min on all days of the week. Guidance regarding nutrition, medication management, stress management, and depressive symptom management were all components of the comprehensive approach of the CR program. Social support was also provided in this environment as patients all engaged in group education/learning activities throughout CR.

2.4. Cardiopulmonary Exercise Testing Procedures

Clinical exercise physiologists conducted the clinically-indicated CPET with cardiologist oversight. An institutionally designed protocol was performed on a motorized treadmill (GE Case, Milwaukee, WI, USA) with workload increasing every 2 min until volitional fatigue [22,23]. Heart rhythm and heart rate (HR) were continuously monitored via 12-lead electrocardiogram during exercise and recovery. Prior to the start of exercise and at the last 30 s of each stage systolic blood pressure (SBP) and diastolic blood pressure (DBP) were measured via manual sphygmomanometry. Flow and gas exchange variables were measured during exercise using indirect calorimetry (MGC Diagnostics, St. Paul, MN, USA). Peak values were obtained by averaging the last 30 s of the CPET data collection. Measured gas exchange variables included VO$_{2\text{peak}}$, carbon dioxide production (VCO$_2$), minute ventilation (V$_E$), and respiratory exchange ratio (RER). The value of V$_E$/VCO$_2$ slope was determined from rest-peak values for V$_E$ and VCO$_2$ and %predicted VO$_{2\text{peak}}$ [24] was calculated. Peak values were chosen for V$_E$/VCO$_2$ slope as they have been shown to have superior prognostic value as opposed to the pre-ventilatory threshold slope equation [25]. Patients were monitored closely for development of significant dysrhythmia, electrocardiographic abnormalities, and/or abnormal blood pressure responses (e.g., symptomatic hypotension). Cardiac medications were not withheld prior to CPET to maximize patient safety and generalizability of the data.

2.5. Statistical Analysis

Data are reported as mean ± standard deviation (SD) or frequency (percentage) where applicable. Statistical analysis was conducted using SPSS (version 22.0, Chicago, IL, USA) and JMP (JMP, Cary, NC, USA). The Student’s t test was used to compare pre-HTx CPET variables to post-HTx CPET variables. As previously described [26,27], univariate binary regression analysis was used to assess individual predictors for the highest post-HTx VO$_{2\text{peak}}$ (i.e., quartile 4) based on VO$_{2\text{peak}}$ data presented herein. Quartile 4 = VO$_{2\text{peak}}$ > 20.1 mL/kg/min, quartile 3 = VO$_{2\text{peak}}$ > 17.4 mL/kg/min, quartile 2 = VO$_{2\text{peak}}$ > 14.3 mL/kg/min, and quartile 1 = VO$_{2\text{peak}}$ ≤ 14.3 mL/kg/min (total range = 24.5 mL/kg/min). A multivariate regression analysis was then performed including all significant univariate variables. Three additional adjustment analyses were conducted to account for potential factors involved in exercise capacity. Model 1 was adjusted for demographic influencers of exercise capacity (i.e., age and sex), Model 2 was adjusted for demographic and clinical influencers of exercise capacity (i.e., age, sex, BMI, history of diabetes, and hemoglobin), and Model 3 included all significant univariate predictors for multivariate analysis adjusted for age and sex. The receiver operating characteristic (ROC) curve model was assessed to establish the area under the curve (AUC) for predicting quartile 4 (i.e., the highest VO$_{2\text{peak}}$) and the cut-off for CR for maximal post-HTx VO$_{2\text{peak}}$ benefits. Least squares linear
regression analysis was performed between pre-HTx VO$_{2peak}$ and post-HTx VO$_{2peak}$, with reporting of the Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient (r) as an indicator of the strength of association between before and after measurements. For all analyses, statistical significance was set at an alpha level of $p < 0.05$.

3. Results

3.1. Patient Population and Clinical Characteristics

Demographic and clinical characteristics of the patients included are presented in Table 1. Of the 140 HTx patients analyzed in this study the mean age was 52 ± 12 years, mean BMI was 27 ± 5 kg/m$^2$, and $n = 41$ (29%) were women. All data shown in Table 1 was obtained from each patient within 24 months prior to procedural data. The mean number of CR sessions attended was 18 ± 9, with a range of 2–36 sessions.

Table 1. Recipient demographics and clinical characteristics.

|                  | n 140 |
|------------------|-------|
| Age (years)      | 52 ± 12 |
| Sex (Female)     | 41 (29) |
| Height (cm)      | 172 ± 14 |
| Weight (kg)      | 83 ± 19 |
| BSA (m$^2$)      | 2.0 ± 0.2 |
| BMI (kg/m$^2$)   | 27.1 ± 4.6 |
| History of Diabetes | 31 (22.1) |
| History of Smoking | 52 (37.1) |
| History of Dyslipidemia | 74 (52.9) |
| History of Hypertension | 63 (45) |
| Previous LVAD    | 27 (19.3) |
| Indication for Heart Transplant | |
| Restrictive Cardiomyopathy | 29 (20.7) |
| Dilated Cardiomyopathy | 53 (37.9) |
| Hypertrophic Cardiomyopathy | 8 (5.6) |
| Ischemic Cardiomyopathy | 25 (17.9) |
| Other             | 25 (17.9) |
| Labs              | |
| Hemoglobin (g/dL) | 12.0 ± 2.0 |
| Hematocrit (%)    | 36 ± 6 |
| White Blood Cell Count (10$^9$/L) | 7.5 ± 3.0 |
| Creatinine (mg/dL) | 1.4 ± 1.0 |
| Medications *     | |
| ACE Inhibitor     | 52 (37.1) |
| Amiodarone        | 12 (8.6) |
| Aspirin           | 65 (46.4) |
| Beta Blocker      | 103 (73.6) |
| Calcium Channel Blocker | 3 (2.1) |
| Diuretic          | 92 (65.7) |
| Number of CR Exercise Sessions | 18 ± 9 |

Note: BMI, body mass index; BSA, body surface area; CR, cardiac rehabilitation; LVAD, left ventricular assist device. All data are presented as mean ± standard deviation or frequency (percentage). *, medication distributions are prior to cardiac transplantation procedure; ACE, angiotensin converting enzyme.

3.2. Exercise Testing Data Prior to and Following Transplant

Peak exercise testing data for CPET pre-HTx versus post-HTx are shown in Table 2. All variables included show significant improvements from pre-HTx to post-HTx, with $V_E/VCO_2$ slope decreasing while all other variables increased. Notably, relative VO$_{2peak}$ increased substantially from pre- to post-HTx (12.9 ± 4.4 vs. 17.5 ± 4.6 mL/kg/min, $p < 0.001$). A significant positive correlation was
present between pre-HTx VO_{2peak} and post-HTx VO_{2peak} (Figure 2) \((r = 0.47, p < 0.01)\). Additionally, this correlation between pre and post-HTx VO_{2peak} was further analyzed with adjustment for the number of CR exercise sessions attended and remained significant \((p < 0.001)\).

### Table 2. Peak exercise testing values prior to and following cardiac transplantation.

|                      | Pre-HTx       | Post-HTx      | \(p\)-Value  |
|----------------------|---------------|---------------|--------------|
| n                    | 140           | 140           |              |
| Exercise time (min)  | 5.3 ± 1.7     | 6.7 ± 1.7     | <0.001       |
| METS                 | 4.9 ± 1.8     | 6.4 ± 1.8     | <0.001       |
| Absolute VO_{2peak} (L/min) | 1.1 ± 0.4     | 1.4 ± 0.4     | <0.001       |
| VO_{2peak} % Predicted (%) | 42 ± 14       | 58 ± 17       | <0.001       |
| Relative VO_{2peak} (mL/kg/min) | 12.9 ± 4.4    | 17.5 ± 4.7    | <0.001       |
| \(V_{E}/VCO_2\) slope | 42 ± 12       | 37 ± 6        | <0.001       |
| VCO_2 (L/min)        | 1.2 ± 0.5     | 1.7 ± 0.5     | <0.001       |
| RER                  | 1.15 ± 0.13   | 1.21 ± 0.12   | <0.001       |
| SBP (mmHg)           | 105 ± 25      | 145 ± 30      | <0.001       |
| DBP (mmHg)           | 60 ± 10       | 67 ± 11       | <0.001       |
| HR (bpm)             | 110 ± 21      | 125 ± 20      | <0.001       |

METS, metabolic equivalents; RER, respiratory exchange ratio; SBP, systolic blood pressure; DBP, diastolic blood pressure; HR, heart rate; VCO_2, production of carbon dioxide; \(V_{E}/VCO_2\) slope, ventilatory efficiency; VO_{2peak}, peak oxygen uptake.

**Figure 2.** Relationship between measurements of relative VO_{2peak} from pre-HTx to post-HTx. A significant positive correlation was present between pre-HTx VO_{2peak} and post-HTx VO_{2peak} \((r = 0.47, p < 0.01)\). Post-HTx: following cardiac transplantation; Pre-HTx: prior to cardiac transplantation; VO_{2peak}: peak oxygen uptake.

#### 3.3. Predictors of VO_{2peak}

Univariate regression analysis indicated that BMI, history of diabetes, history of dyslipidemia, hemoglobin, white blood cell count, CR exercise sessions, and pre-HTx VO_{2peak} were significant predictors of higher VO_{2peak} post-HTx (Table 3). The significance of pre-HTx VO_{2peak} and CR exercise sessions on post-HTx VO_{2peak} remained after adjustment for demographic influencers of exercise capacity (age and sex) as shown in Model 1, and adjustment for demographic and clinical influencers of exercise capacity (age, sex, BMI, history of diabetes, hemoglobin, peak HR, and HR recovery (HRR)) as shown in Model 2 (Table 4).
**Table 3. Univariate regression analysis for predictors of VO\textsubscript{2peak}**.

| Variable                              | OR     | 95% CI          | p-Value |
|---------------------------------------|--------|-----------------|---------|
| Age (years)                           | 0.978  | 0.949–1.009     | 0.170   |
| Sex (female)                          | 0.457  | 0.173–1.209     | 0.115   |
| BMI (kg/m\textsuperscript{2})         | 0.896  | 0.815–0.985     | 0.022   |
| History of Diabetes                   | 0.174  | 0.039–0.772     | 0.021   |
| History of Smoking                    | 0.805  | 0.354–1.831     | 0.605   |
| History of Hypertension               | 0.741  | 0.335–1.641     | 0.460   |
| History of Dyslipidemia               | 0.415  | 0.185–0.929     | 0.032   |
| History of LVAD                       | 1.171  | 0.446–3.076     | 0.748   |
| Beta Blocker Medication               | 0.642  | 0.275–1.499     | 0.306   |
| Indication for HTx                    |        |                 |         |
| Restrictive Cardiomyopathy            | 0.812  | 0.299–2.201     | 0.682   |
| Dilated Cardiomyopathy                | 0.920  | 0.409–2.066     | 0.840   |
| Hypertrophic Cardiomyopathy           | 2.040  | 0.461–9.035     | 0.348   |
| Ischemic Cardiomyopathy               | 0.565  | 0.179–1.782     | 0.330   |
| Other                                 | 1.694  | 0.655–4.380     | 0.277   |
| Labs                                  |        |                 |         |
| Hemoglobin (g/dL)                     | 1.294  | 1.041–1.608     | 0.020   |
| Hematocrit (%)                        | 1.063  | 0.985–1.146     | 0.015   |
| White Blood Cell Count (10\textsuperscript{9}/L) | 0.806  | 0.662–0.982     | 0.033   |
| Creatinine (mg/dL)                    | 0.402  | 0.155–1.039     | 0.060   |
| Pre-HTx CPET Data                     |        |                 |         |
| Peak SBP (mmHg)                       | 0.998  | 0.971–1.005     | 0.158   |
| Heart Rate Recovery (bpm)             | 1.021  | 0.987–1.056     | 0.225   |
| Relative VO\textsubscript{2peak} (mL/kg/min) | 1.174  | 1.070–1.289     | 0.001   |
| CR Exercise Sessions                  | 1.095  | 1.041–1.152     | <0.001  |

**Table 4. Adjusted and multivariate regression analysis for predictors of Post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak}**.

| Variable                              | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 |
|---------------------------------------|---------|---------|---------|
| OR   | 95% CI | p-Value | OR   | 95% CI | p-Value | OR   | 95% CI | p-Value |
| Age (years)                           | 0.968   | 0.932–1.006 | 0.094 | 0.970 | 0.933–1.009 | 0.130 | 0.962 | 0.922–1.004 | 0.077 |
| Sex (female)                          | 0.395   | 0.128–1.217 | 0.106 | 0.284 | 0.080–1.000 | 0.052 | 0.292 | 0.087–0.986 | 0.047 |
| BMI (kg/m\textsuperscript{2})         | 0.999   | 0.791–0.999  | 0.049 | 0.997 | 0.811–1.018 | 0.097 | 2.700 | 0.635–11.995 | 0.176 |
| History of Diabetes                   | 3.050   | 0.605–15.430 | 0.178 | 2.700 | 0.635–11.995 | 0.176 | 2.700 | 0.635–11.995 | 0.176 |
| History of Dyslipidemia               | 0.889   | 0.128–1.217 | 0.106 | 0.284 | 0.080–1.000 | 0.052 | 0.292 | 0.087–0.986 | 0.047 |
| Labs                                  |        |          | \_    |        |          | \_    |        |          |
| Hemoglobin (g/dL)                     | 1.294   | 1.041–1.608 | 0.020 | 1.045 | 0.829–1.31  | 0.710 | 2.700 | 0.635–11.995 | 0.176 |
| White Blood Cell Count (10\textsuperscript{9}/L) | 1.727   | 0.930–1.478 | 0.178 | 1.045 | 0.829–1.31  | 0.710 | 2.700 | 0.635–11.995 | 0.176 |
| Pre-HTx CPET Data                     |        |          | \_    |        |          | \_    |        |          |
| Peak SBP (mmHg)                       | 0.998   | 0.971–1.005 | 0.158 | 1.110 | 1.002–1.231 | 0.047 | 1.206 | 1.068–1.361 | 0.002 |
| Heart Rate Recovery (bpm)             | 1.021   | 0.987–1.056 | 0.225 | 0.979 | 0.951–1.007 | 0.147 | 0.979 | 0.951–1.007 | 0.147 |
| Relative VO\textsubscript{2peak} (mL/kg/min) | 1.095  | 1.042–1.167 | 0.001 | 1.095 | 1.037–1.157 | 0.001 | 1.103 | 1.042–1.167 | 0.001 |
| Peak HR (bpm)                         | 0.979   | 0.951–1.007 | 0.147 | 1.021 | 1.002–1.231 | 0.047 | 1.206 | 1.068–1.361 | 0.002 |
| HRR (bpm)                             | 1.008   | 0.959–1.059 | 0.764 | 1.021 | 1.002–1.231 | 0.047 | 1.206 | 1.068–1.361 | 0.002 |
| CR Exercise Sessions                  | 1.102   | 1.037–1.264 | <0.001 | 1.095 | 1.037–1.157 | 0.001 | 1.103 | 1.042–1.167 | 0.001 |

All significant univariate predictors were included into the multivariate regression analysis with adjustment for age and sex. This analysis (as shown in Model 3) indicated that CR exercise sessions and pre-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} were the independent predictors of higher post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} (Table 4). When CR exercise session attendance was divided into two groups by the median attendance of 18 sessions, those who attended ≥18 sessions had significantly higher post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} compared to those with <18 sessions attended (≥18 sessions: 18.8 ± 4.8 vs. <18 sessions: 16.4 ± 4.3, p < 0.01) (Figure 3).
value of 18 sessions was also determined to be an appropriate cutoff for CR attendance necessary to maximize benefits in post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} (AUC: 0.692, specificity: 0.549, sensitivity: 0.684, \(p < 0.001\)).

**Figure 2.** Relationship between measurements of relative VO\textsubscript{2peak} from pre-HTx to post-HTx. A significant positive correlation was present between pre-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} and post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} (\(r = 0.47, p < 0.01\)). Post-HTx: following cardiac transplantation; Pre-HTx: prior to cardiac transplantation; VO\textsubscript{2peak}: peak oxygen uptake.

**Figure 3.** Post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} based on median CR exercise session attendance. Those HTx patients who attended \(\geq 18\) CR exercise sessions had significantly higher post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} compared to those with <18 CR exercise sessions attended (\(\geq 18\) sessions: 18.8 \(\pm\) 4.8 vs. <18 sessions: 16.4 \(\pm\) 4.3, \(p < 0.01\)*, significantly higher than <18 CR sessions. CR: cardiac rehabilitation; Post-HTx: following cardiac transplantation; VO\textsubscript{2peak}: peak oxygen uptake.

### 4. Discussion

The purpose of this study was to determine whether pre-HTx clinical characteristics and/or postoperative participation in CR provide utility in predicting VO\textsubscript{2peak} following HTx. Pre-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} and the number of CR exercise sessions attended were the only variables predictive of greater VO\textsubscript{2peak} following HTx. These metrics independently predicted higher post-HTx VO\textsubscript{2peak} even after adjusting for other factors of exercise capacity, surpassing other significant univariate factors. Our data provide new evidence of the critical benefits of CR in improving functional capacity following HTx.

Previous work has evaluated potential predictors of VO\textsubscript{2peak} in various populations \([10–14,17,18,28,29]\). In healthy subjects the general characteristics of younger age, male sex, and training state have been shown to be associated with improved exercise capacity \([17]\). For those with cardiovascular disease (CVD), several studies measuring exercise capacity directly by VO\textsubscript{2peak} or indirectly using predicted METS have shown overall that age and baseline fitness are the strongest predictors of VO\textsubscript{2peak} \([10,28,29]\). The predictive quality of age also remains in the HTx population \([11,13,14]\). One of the first studies to evaluate predictors of VO\textsubscript{2peak} specifically for HTx patients found that chronotropic reserve, donor age, recipient age, and time from HTx were the most significant predictors of VO\textsubscript{2peak} post-HTx \([11]\).

This study, however, collected CPET data in the broad range of 1–100 months following HTx, which limits the specificity of temporal cardiopulmonary adaptation post-HTx. Although not significant in multivariate analysis, clinical history of diabetes and dyslipidemia were significant univariate predictors in this study, emphasizing the importance of multimorbidity management \([30–33]\). More recent studies in HTx patients have shown that the demographic components of sex, BMI, and age are prominent predictors of VO\textsubscript{2peak} \([13,14,18]\). Table 5 provides information on four specific studies particularly relevant to the findings of the current study examining predictors of VO\textsubscript{2peak} in HTx patients.
Table 5. Predictors of VO$_2$peak in heart transplant patients.

| Study Group           | n   | Age (yrs) | Predictors of VO$_2$peak                                                                 | Time from Transplant | Post-Transplant VO$_2$peak (mL/kg/min) |
|-----------------------|-----|-----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Douard et al. 1997 [11] | 85  | 52 ± 12   | Chronotropic reserve, time from transplantation, age of donor, age of patient           | 1–100 months        | 21.1 ± 6.0                            |
| Leung et al. 2003 [13]  | 95  | 48 ± 14   | Age, sex, height, and weight (alternatively, body mass index)                           | 12 months            | 19.9 ± 4.8                            |
| Nytroen et al. 2012 [18] | 51  | 52 ± 16   | Muscular exercise capacity and body fat                                                | 1–8 years            | Group 1: 23.1 ± 3.7; Group 2: 32.6 ± 4.4 |
| Carvalho et al. 2015 [14] | 60  | 48 ± 15   | Age, sex, body mass index, heart rate reserve, and left atrium diameter                | 64 ± 54 months       | unspecified                           |

Note: VO$_2$peak, peak oxygen uptake; yrs, years. All data are presented as mean ± standard deviation unless otherwise specified.

Although the findings of these studies concur with our study regarding the predictive quality of BMI, CR exercise session attendance and baseline fitness as assessed by pre-HTx VO$_2$peak were the only independent predictors of post-HTx VO$_2$peak. Baseline fitness levels have previously been shown to predict VO$_2$peak in CVD patients [28,29], yet this study is the first to show this relationship in HTx patients. A significant correlation was present between pre-HTx VO$_2$peak and post-HTx VO$_2$peak in our study, as those with the highest pre-HTx VO$_2$peak were more likely to have higher VO$_2$peak measurements following HTx. These results highlight the importance of maintaining or reaching a higher functional capacity leading up to HTx, as baseline values predict postoperative VO$_2$peak levels.

The predictive impact of CR involvement following HTx on achieving higher VO$_2$peak values was a unique component to this study. Our findings clearly demonstrate the importance of postoperative CR participation in improving functional capacity and implications of survival following HTx. Specifically following HTx, the benefits of CR involvement are widespread for this clinically unique population; including counteracting marked deconditioning and skeletal muscle weakness associated with end-stage HF, corticosteroid treatment, and surgical recovery [18,34–36]. Although the predictive quality of CR session attendance has not been previously reported, the increase in VO$_2$peak following CR in HTx patients is well-documented [15,19,20,37,38]. The importance of CR involvement on VO$_2$peak following HTx is critical, as it elicits significantly greater increases in VO$_2$peak compared to at-home therapy [37]. One such study reported an increase of 3.6 mL/kg/min in VO$_2$peak following a 12-week CR program after HTx [19]. Additionally, a recent review evaluating CR exercise in HTx patients that encompassed 10 randomized controlled trials with a total of 300 patients found that exercise capacity was, on average, 2.49 mL/kg/min higher for those who exercised [15]. Our study showed a mean increase of 4.6 mL/kg/min (equivalent to over 1.5 METS) from pre- to post-HTx, which has substantial meaning with regard to improved quality of life and survival. Further, those who attended >18 sessions demonstrated a post-HTx VO$_2$peak of 2.4 mL/kg/min higher than those who attended <18 sessions (i.e., 15% greater).

Studies in HF have found that an increased VO$_2$peak is associated with better outcomes (i.e., primary endpoints of all-cause hospitalizations and/or mortality) [6,7,39,40]. One such study found a 5% lower risk of all-cause mortality or hospitalization for every 6% increase in VO$_2$peak, thereby highlighting the importance of even seemingly small improvements in VO$_2$peak on long-term clinical outcomes [7]. It should be noted, however, that despite significant functional improvements observed following HTx, VO$_2$peak values still remain abnormal in HTx patients compared to age-matched control subjects [34,41,42]. Further understanding of the demographic, clinical, and rehabilitative components that predict post-HTx VO$_2$peak values offers greater insight into the complex cardiopulmonary and peripheral adaptations occurring following HTx.

It is important to recognize the retrospective observational nature of the present study design. Additional research in this area is encouraged to confirm these results in a prospective fashion. The distribution of post-HTx medications could potentially influence CPET measurements, therefore this should be taken into account as a limitation to the application of these results. Further, data
pertaining to donor information (e.g., donor age, donor sex) and surgical procedural notes (e.g., cold ischemic time) were unavailable for this study and may be important additional metrics to include in follow-up studies.

5. Conclusions

In summary, HTx patients demonstrated substantial improvements in VO$_{2peak}$ following HTx. The only factors that provided significant predictive value of higher post-HTx VO$_{2peak}$ values were CR exercise session attendance and pre-HTx VO$_{2peak}$, even after adjustment for other univariate predictors of post-HTx exercise capacity. These data demonstrate the influential role of sustaining and/or improving cardiorespiratory fitness leading up to and following HTx, specifically in the CR setting.

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I., E.H.V.I., T.P.O.; Methodology, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I., E.H.V.I., R.W.S., T.P.O.; Software, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I.; Validation, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I.; Formal Analysis, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I., T.P.O.; Investigation, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I., E.H.V.I., R.W.S., T.P.O.; Resources, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I., E.H.V.I., R.W.S., T.P.O.; Data Curation, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I., T.P.O.; Writing—Original Draft Preparation, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I., T.P.O.; Writing—Review and Editing, J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I., R.W., T.P.O.; Visualization, K.E.U., J.R.W.S., J.R.M.-I., R.W., T.P.O.; Supervision, J.R.W.S., T.P.O.; Project Administration, J.R.W.S., T.P.O.; Funding Acquisition, J.R.W.S., T.P.O.

Funding: This research was funded by the National Institutes of Health [HL-126638 to TPO] and American Heart Association [18POST3990251 to JRS].

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

1. Mancini, D.M.; Eisen, H.; Kussmaul, W.; Mull, R.; Edmunds, L.H., Jr.; Wilson, J.R. Value of peak exercise oxygen consumption for optimal timing of cardiac transplantation in ambulatory patients with heart failure. *Circulation* 1991, 83, 778–786. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
2. Elmariah, S.; Goldberg, L.R.; Allen, M.T.; Kao, A. Effects of gender on peak oxygen consumption and the timing of cardiac transplantation. *J. Am. Coll. Cardiol.* 2006, 47, 2237–2242. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
3. Ponikowski, P.; Voors, A.A.; Anker, S.D.; Bueno, H.; Costes, A.J.; Coats, A.J.; Falk, V.; Gonzalez-Juanatey, J.R.; Harjola, V.P.; Jankowska, E.A.; et al. 2016 ESC Guidelines for the diagnosis and treatment of acute and chronic heart failure. *Kardiol. Pol.* 2016, 74, 1037–1147. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
4. Mehran, M.; Canter, C.E.; Hannan, M.M.; Semigran, M.J.; Uber, P.A.; Baran, D.A.; Danziger-Isakov, L.; Kirklin, J.K.; Kirk, R.; Kushwaha, S.S.; et al. The 2016 International Society for Heart Lung Transplantation listing criteria for heart transplantation: A 10-year update. *J. Heart Lung Transplant.* 2016, 35, 1–23. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
5. Peterson, L.R.; Schechtman, K.B.; Ewald, G.A.; Geltman, E.M.; Meyer, T.; Kekeler, P.; Rogers, J.G. The effect of beta-adrenergic blockers on the prognostic value of peak exercise oxygen uptake in patients with heart failure. *J. Heart Lung Transplant.* 2003, 22, 70–77. [CrossRef]
6. Ketyeyian, S.J.; Patel, M.; Kraus, W.E.; Brawner, C.A.; McConnell, T.R.; Pina, I.L.; Leifer, E.S.; Fleg, J.L.; Blackburn, G.; Fonarow, G.C.; et al. Variables measured during cardiopulmonary exercise testing as predictors of mortality in chronic systolic heart failure. *J. Am. Coll. Cardiol.* 2016, 67, 780–789. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
7. Swank, A.M.; Horton, J.; Fleg, J.L.; Fonarow, G.C.; Ketyeyian, S.; Goldberg, L.; Wolfel, G.; Handberg, E.M.; Bensimhon, D.; Illiou, M.C.; et al. Modest increase in peak VO$_2$ is related to better clinical outcomes in chronic heart failure patients: Results from heart failure and a controlled trial to investigate outcomes of exercise training. *Circ. Heart Fail.* 2012, 5, 579–585. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
8. Kavanagh, T.; Mertens, D.J.; Shephard, R.J.; Beyene, J.; Kennedy, J.; Campbell, R.; Sawyer, P.; Yacoub, M. Long-term cardiorespiratory results of exercise training following cardiac transplantation. *Am. J. Cardiol.* 2003, 91, 190–194. [CrossRef]
9. Yardley, M.; Havik, O.E.; Grov, I.; Relbo, A.; Gullesland, L.; Nytoen, K. Peak oxygen uptake and self-reported physical health are strong predictors of long-term survival after heart transplantation. *Clin. Transplant.* 2016, 30, 161–169. [CrossRef]
10. Branco, C.F.; Viamonte, S.; Matos, C.; Magalhaes, S.; Cunha, I.; Barreira, A.; Fernandes, P.; Torres, S. Predictors of changes in functional capacity on a cardiac rehabilitation program. *Rev. Port. Cardiol.* **2016**, *35*, 215–224. [CrossRef]

11. Douard, H.; Parrens, E.; Billes, M.A.; Labbe, L.; Baudet, E.; Broustet, J.P. Predictive factors of maximal aerobic capacity after cardiac transplantation. *Eur. Heart J.* **1997**, *18*, 1823–1828. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

12. Hammond, H.K.; Kelly, T.L.; Frolenicher, V.F.; Pewen, W. Use of clinical data in predicting improvement in exercise capacity after cardiac rehabilitation. *J. Am. Coll. Cardiol.* **1985**, *6*, 19–26. [CrossRef]

13. Leung, T.C.; Ballman, K.V.; Allison, T.G.; Wagner, J.A.; Olson, L.J.; Frantz, R.P.; Edwards, B.S.; Dearani, J.A.; Daly, R.C.; McGregor, C.G.; et al. Clinical predictors of exercise capacity 1 year after cardiac transplantation. *J. Heart Lung Transplant.* **2003**, *22*, 16–27. [CrossRef]

14. Oliveira Carvalho, V.; Guimaraes, G.V.; Vieira, M.L.; Catai, A.M.; Oliveira-Carvalho, V.; Ayub-Ferreira, S.M.; Bocchi, E.A. Determinants of peak VO$_2$ in heart transplant recipients. *Rev. Bras. Cir. Cardiovasc.* **2015**, *30*, 9–15. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

15. Anderson, L.; Nguyen, T.T.; Dall, C.H.; Burgess, L.; Bridges, C.; Taylor, R.S. Exercise-based cardiac rehabilitation in heart transplant recipients. *Cochrane Database Syst. Rev.* **2017**, *4*, CD012264. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

16. Ogawa, T.; Spina, R.J.; Martin, W.H.; Kohrt, W.M.; Schechtman, K.B.; Holloszy, J.O.; Ehsani, A.A. Effects of aging, sex, and physical training on cardiovascular responses to exercise. *Circulation* **1992**, *86*, 494–503. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

17. Woo, J.S.; Derleth, C.; Stratton, J.R.; Levy, W.C. The influence of age, gender, and training on exercise efficiency. *J. Am. Coll. Cardiol.* **2006**, *47*, 1049–1057. [CrossRef]

18. Nytroen, K.; Rustad, L.A.; Gude, E.; Hallen, J.; Fiane, A.E.; Rolid, K.; Holm, I.; Aakhus, S.; Gullestad, L. Muscular exercise capacity and body fat predict VO$_2$(peak) in heart transplant recipients. *Eur. J. Prev. Cardiol.* **2014**, *21*, 21–29. [CrossRef]

19. Hsu, C.J.; Chen, S.Y.; Su, S.; Yang, M.C.; Lan, C.; Chou, N.K.; Hsu, R.B.; Lai, J.S.; Wang, S.S. The effect of early cardiac rehabilitation on health-related quality of life among heart transplant recipients and patients with coronary artery bypass graft surgery. *Transplant. Proc.* **2011**, *43*, 2714–2717. [CrossRef]

20. Rosenbaum, A.N.; Kremers, W.K.; Schirger, J.A.; Squires, R.W.; Allison, T.G.; Daly, R.C.; Kushwaha, S.S.; Edwards, B.S. Association between early cardiac rehabilitation and long-term survival in cardiac transplant recipients. *Mayo Clin. Proc.* **2016**, *91*, 149–156. [CrossRef]

21. Yawn, B.P.; Yawn, R.A.; Geier, G.R.; Xia, Z.; Jacobsen, S.J. The impact of requiring patient authorization for use of data in medical records research. *J. Fam. Pract.* **1998**, *47*, 361–365. [PubMed]

22. Squires, R.W.; Allison, T.G.; Johnson, B.D.; Gau, G.T. Non-physician supervision of cardiopulmonary exercise testing in chronic heart failure: Safety and results of a preliminary investigation. *J. Cardiopulm. Rehabil.* **1999**, *19*, 249–253. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

23. Larsen, C.M.; Ball, C.A.; Hebl, V.B.; Ong, K.C.; Siontis, K.C.; Olson, T.P.; Ackerman, M.J.; Ommen, S.R.; Allison, T.G.; Geske, J.B. Effect of body mass index on exercise capacity in patients with hypertrophic cardiomyopathy. *Am. J. Cardiol.* **2017**, *119*, 109–116. [CrossRef]

24. Myers, J.; Kaminsky, L.A.; Lima, R.; Christle, J.W.; Ashley, E.; Arena, R. A reference equation for normal exercise test time intervals in subjects with heart failure. *Eur. J. Cardiow. Prev. Rehabil.* **2003**, *10*, 463–468. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

25. Arena, R.; Humphrey, R.; Peberdy, M.A. Prognostic ability of $V_E/VCO_2$ slope calculations using different exercise test time intervals in subjects with heart failure. *Eur. J. Cardiow. Prev. Rehabil.* **2003**, *10*, 463–468. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

26. Francis, D.P.; Shamim, W.; Davies, L.C.; Piepoli, M.F.; Ponikowski, P.; Anker, S.D.; Coats, A.J. Cardiopulmonary exercise testing for prognosis in chronic heart failure: Continuous and independent prognostic value from $V_E/VCO_2$ slope and peak VO$_2$. *Eur. Heart J.* **2000**, *21*, 154–161. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

27. Smith, J.R.; Medina-Inojosa, J.R.; Layrisse, V.; Ommen, S.R.; Olson, T.P. Predictors of exercise capacity in patients with hypertrophic obstructive cardiomyopathy. *J. Clin. Med.* **2018**, *7*. [CrossRef]

28. Pierson, L.M.; Miller, L.E.; Herbert, W.G. Predicting exercise training outcome from cardiac rehabilitation. *J. Cardiopulm. Rehabil.* **2004**, *24*, 113–118. [CrossRef]
29. McKee, G.; Kerins, M.; Fitzgerald, G.; Spain, M.; Morrison, K. Factors that influence obesity, functional capacity, anxiety and depression outcomes following a Phase III cardiac rehabilitation programme. *J. Clin. Nurs.* 2013, 22, 2758–2767. [CrossRef]
30. Fang, Z.Y.; Sharman, J.; Prins, J.B.; Marwick, T.H. Determinants of exercise capacity in patients with type 2 diabetes. *Diabetes Care* 2005, 28, 1643–1648. [CrossRef]
31. Higgins, J.; Pflugfelder, P.W.; Kostuk, W.J. Increased morbidity in diabetic cardiac transplant recipients. *Can. J. Cardiol.* 2009, 25, e125–e129. [CrossRef]
32. Horwich, T.B.; Hamilton, M.A.; Maclellan, W.R.; Fonarow, G.C. Low serum total cholesterol is associated with marked increase in mortality in advanced heart failure. *J. Card Fail.* 2002, 8, 216–224. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
33. Rauchhaus, M.; Clark, A.L.; Doehner, W.; Davos, C.; Bolger, A.; Sharma, R.; Coats, A.J.; Anker, S.D. The relationship between cholesterol and survival in patients with chronic heart failure. *J. Am. Coll. Cardiol.* 2003, 42, 1933–1940. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
34. Tucker, W.J.; Beaudry, R.I.; Samuel, T.J.; Nelson, M.D.; Halle, M.; Baggish, A.L.; Haykowsky, M.J. Performance limitations in heart transplant recipients. *Exerc. Sport Sci. Rev.* 2018, 46, 144–151. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
35. Georgiadou, P.; Adamopoulos, S. Skeletal muscle abnormalities in chronic heart failure. *Curr. Heart Fail. Rep.* 2012, 9, 128–132. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
36. Lampert, E.; Mettauer, B.; Hoppeler, H.; Charloux, A.; Charpentier, A.; Lonsdorfer, J. Structure of skeletal muscle in heart transplant recipients. *J. Am. Coll. Cardiol.* 1996, 28, 980–984. [CrossRef]
37. Kobashigawa, J.A.; Leaf, D.A.; Lee, N.; Gleeson, M.P.; Liu, H.; Hamilton, M.A.; Moriguchi, J.D.; Kawata, N.; Einhorn, K.; Herlihy, E.; et al. A controlled trial of exercise rehabilitation after heart transplantation. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 1999, 340, 272–277. [CrossRef]
38. Daida, H.; Squires, R.W.; Allison, T.G.; Johnson, B.D.; Gau, G.T. Sequential assessment of exercise tolerance in heart transplantation compared with coronary artery bypass surgery after phase II cardiac rehabilitation. *Am. J. Cardiol.* 1996, 77, 696–700. [CrossRef]
39. Pina, I.L.; Bittner, V.; Clare, R.M.; Swank, A.; Kao, A.; Safford, R.; Nigam, A.; Barnard, D.; Walsh, M.N.; Ellis, S.J.; et al. Effects of exercise training on outcomes in women with heart failure: Analysis of HF-ACTION (Heart Failure-A Controlled Trial Investigating Outcomes of Exercise TraiNing) by sex. *JACC Heart Fail.* 2014, 2, 180–186. [CrossRef]
40. Sarullo, F.M.; Fazio, G.; Brunca, I.; Fasullo, S.; Paterna, S.; Licata, P.; Novo, G.; Novo, S.; Di Pasquale, P. Cardiopulmonary exercise testing in patients with chronic heart failure: Prognostic comparison from peak VO2 and VE/VCO2 Slope. *Open Cardiovasc. Med. J.* 2010, 4, 127–134. [CrossRef]
41. Givertz, M.M.; Hartley, L.H.; Colucci, W.S. Long-term sequential changes in exercise capacity and chronotropic responsiveness after cardiac transplantation. *Circulation* 1997, 96, 232–237. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
42. Kao, A.C.; Van Trigt, P., 3rd; Shaeffer-McCall, G.S.; Shaw, J.P.; Kuzil, B.B.; Page, R.D.; Higginbotham, M.B. Central and peripheral limitations to upright exercise in untrained cardiac transplant recipients. *Circulation* 1994, 89, 2605–2615. [CrossRef] [PubMed]